



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales
(The Official Record)**

Dydd Mawrth 21 Mai 2002

Tuesday 21 May 2002

Cynnwys
Contents

- 3 Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru
Questions to the First Minister
- 23 Datganiad ar Fframwaith Gwasanaeth Cenedlaethol Clefyd Coronaidd y Galon
Statement on the Coronary Heart Disease National Service Framework
- 37 Datganiad ar Adolygiad o'r Flwyddyn Gyntaf o Fynediad am Ddim i Amgueddfeydd
Cenedlaethol Cymru
*Statement on the Review of the First Year of Free Admission to Welsh National
Museums*
- 52 Datganiad Busnes
Business Statement
- 53 Pwyntiau o Drefn
Points of Order
- 55 Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion
Composite Motion: Approval of Orders
- 57 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Gwerthuso Athrawon Ysgol (Cymru) a Rheoliadau
Llywodraethu Ysgolion (Cylch Gwaith) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2002
*Approval of the School Teacher Appraisal (Wales) Regulations 2002 and the School
Government (Terms of Reference) (Amendment)(Wales) Regulations 2002*
- 71 Datblygu Cynaliadwy
Sustainable Development

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been
included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru Questions to the First Minister

Blaenoriaethau'r Cabinet ar gyfer y Tri Mis Nesaf Cabinet Priorities for the Next Three Months

Q1 Janet Davies: Will the First Minister make a statement on his Cabinet's priorities for the next three months? (OAQ17737)

C1 Janet Davies: A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar flaenoriaethau ei Gabinet ar gyfer y tri mis nesaf? (OAQ17737)

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): The priorities of the Cabinet for the next three months will be to concentrate on negotiating an excellent settlement in the 2002 spending review, which will carry us through the next three financial years, starting on 1 April 2003.

Prif Weinidog Cymru (Rhodri Morgan): Blaenoriaethau'r Cabinet am y tri mis nesaf fydd canolbwyntio ar negodi cytundeb ardderchog yn adolygiad gwariant 2002, a fydd yn ein cario drwodd i'r tair blynedd ariannol nesaf, gan ddechrau ar 1 Ebrill 2003.

Janet Davies: In what ways do your priorities differ from the UK Cabinet's priorities for Wales?

Janet Davies: Ym mha ffyrdd y mae'ch blaenoriaethau'n wahanol i flaenoriaethau Cabinet y DU ar gyfer Cymru?

The First Minister: Do you want the all-day, half-day, one hour or five-minute lecture? Which version will the Presiding Officer allow? To concentrate on education, we have abolished league tables and key stage 1 tests, and provided free school milk for the under-sevens. That is enough to be going on with.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: A oes arnoch eisiau'r ddarlith diwrnod llawn, hanner diwrnod, awr ynteu pum munud? Pa fersiwn y gwnaiff y Llywydd ei ganiatáu? A chanolbwyntio ar addysg, yr ydym wedi diddymu cynghreiriau ysgolion a phroffion cyfnod allweddol 1, ac wedi darparu llaeth am ddim i blant dan saith. Mae hynny'n ddigon am y tro.

Alun Pugh: Do your priorities include building a *péage* John Birt to run parallel to the A470, or do you believe that the formidable problems of travelling from the north to the south of our nation are best addressed through mechanisms such as the single rail franchise, rather than pouring concrete from Llandudno Junction to the capital?

Alun Pugh: A ydyw'ch blaenoriaethau'n cynnwys adeiladu *péage* John Birtaidd i redeg yn gyfochrog â'r A470, ynteu a gredwch mai'r ffordd orau i ddatrys problemau dyrys teithio o ogledd ein cenedl i'r de yw drwy fecanweithiau fel y fasnachfaint rheilffyrdd sengl, yn hytrach na thywallt concrit o Gyffordd Llandudno i'r brifddinas?

The First Minister: The question of what director generals of the BBC or BBC Wales do when they leave their posts is interesting. I have noted with interest what John Birt has been doing as a member of the upper house since leaving his post as director general of the BBC. I have also noted what Geraint Talfan Davies has been doing since he ceased

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae cwestiwn beth a wnaiff cyfarwyddwyr cyffredinol y BBC neu BBC Cymru pan adawant eu swyddi yn ddiddorol. Yr wyf wedi nodi gyda diddordeb beth y bu John Birt yn ei wneud fel aelod o'r tŷ uchaf ers gadael ei swydd fel cyfarwyddwr cyffredinol y BBC. Yr wyf wedi nodi hefyd beth y bu Geraint Talfan Davies yn ei wneud

to be controller of BBC Wales in helping to set up Glas Cymru and in his efforts to chair and take forward Welsh National Opera. I could commend Geraint Talfan Davies's constructive use of his post-director general time to Lord Birt as an object lesson in what to do when you cease to hold a position of major power within the BBC.

The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): Will you consider prioritising the improvement of communication between your Cabinet and the Wales Office? At present there is a total lack of communication. Last week your Labour Government proposed a motion that included a provision to fund free personal care for the elderly. Shortly afterwards, this was described as pathetic by an aide to the Secretary of State for Wales. Apparently, you did not inform the Secretary of State of the motion, and the aide said that it was symptomatic of your irresponsible approach to politics. At first, your Government and the Wales Office refused to comment on the issue. It was not until later that the Wales Office apologised, or was willing to explain. Does this embarrassing debacle not leave your administration seriously undermined?

The First Minister: Not at all. Paul Murphy and I spoke about this on Friday, and Paul Murphy also spoke to Jane Hutt about it. No-one who knows Paul will be surprised that his aide's words were not his words, and they were not authorised or approved by him; had that happened, it would have been totally out of character. Despite this one-off example of a breakdown in communication, my relationship with the Secretary of State is exceedingly good, and that partnership has delivered real benefits for the people of Wales—not least the excellent spending review that we achieved in the summer of 2000. The important issue is whether or not we can achieve that again in this summer's spending review.

Nick Bourne: We note your desire to get onto what you perceive to be safer ground. Will you confirm that you had not previously

ers rhoi'r gorau i fod yn rheolwr BBC Cymru o ran helpu i sefydlu Glas Cymru a'i ymdrechion wrth gadeirio Cwmni Opera Cenedlaethol Cymru a symud y corff hwnnw yn ei flaen. Hoffwn gymeradwyo defnydd adeiladol Geraint Talfan Davies o'i amser ers bod yn gyfarwyddwr cyffredinol i'r Arglwydd Birt fel enghraifft dda o beth i'w wneud pan rowch y gorau i ddal swydd o rym mawr yn y BBC.

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): A wnewch chi ystyried rhoi blaenoriaeth i wella cyfathrebu rhwng eich Cabinet a Swyddfa Cymru? Ar hyn o bryd nid oes dim cyfathrebu o gwbl. Yr wythnos diwethaf cynigiodd eich Llywodraeth Lafur gynnig a oedd yn cynnwys darpariaeth i ariannu gofal personol am ddim i'r henoed. Ychydig wedyn, disgrifiwyd hyn fel gweithred bathetig gan gynorthwy-ydd i Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru. Mae'n debyg nad oeddech wedi hysbysu'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol am y cynnig, a dywedodd y cynorthwy-ydd fod hynny'n nodweddiadol o'ch ffordd anghyfrifol o wleidyddia. I ddechrau, gwrthododd eich Llywodraeth a Swyddfa Cymru wneud sylw ar y mater. Nid tan yn ddiweddarach y bu i Swyddfa Cymru ymddiheuro a bod yn barod i egluro. Onid yw'r traed moch hwn yn tanseilio'ch gweinyddiaeth yn ddifrifol?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ddim o gwbl. Siaradodd Paul Murphy a mi am hyn ddydd Gwener, a siaradodd Paul Murphy â Jane Hutt amdano hefyd. Ni fydd neb sy'n adnabod Paul yn synnu nad ei eiriau ef oedd geiriau ei gynorthwy-ydd, ac nad oeddent wedi'u hawdurdodi na'u cymeradwyo ganddo; pe bai hynny wedi digwydd, buasai allan o gymeriad yn llwyr. Er gwaethaf yr enghraifft unigryw hon o fethiant i gyfathrebu, mae fy mherthynas i â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yn eithriadol o dda, ac mae'r bartneriaeth honno wedi dod â manteision gwirioneddol i bobl Cymru—nid yn lleiaf yr adolygiad ardderchog o wariant a gawsom yn haf 2000. Y cwestiwn pwysig yw a allwn gyflawni hynny eto yn yr adolygiad o wariant yr haf yma.

Nick Bourne: Nodwn eich dymuniad i symud i'r hyn a ystyriwch yn dir mwy diogel. A wnewch chi gadarnhau nad oeddech wedi

spoken to the Secretary of State for Wales, or the Wales Office, about this resolution? Will you also confirm that Paul Murphy was slow to come forward to retract or contradict his special adviser's statements? You say that they were not his words, but why was he unwilling to make any statement about it for 36 hours? I ask again, what are you doing to improve relations between the Labour-led—as you keep telling us—Government of Wales and the Secretary of State for Wales in London? What lessons can be learnt? Does not such a lack of contact—which we know to be true—seriously undermine the administration?

The First Minister: Unfortunately, Nick, despite repetition, you are unsuccessfully attempting to make a mountain out of a molehill. A one-off example of this kind—and the figure is not 36 hours; it is not even 24 hours—is quite ridiculous. It was about 22 hours, at most, before the first contact was made. Where did you get 36 hours? You should sue the school that taught you mathematics.

Nick Bourne: I accept 22 hours.

The First Minister: Well, how do you get 36 hours, Nick? Why do you throw out these figures without checking them? Do you think that 36 is the same as 22, which is the absolute maximum? You obviously think that figures do not matter at all. Your respect for these facts is like your respect for facts in general; you do not seem to be able to cope with being corrected. Why do you not apologise for getting your figures wrong, or do you not care about them at all? The important point is what the people of Wales are talking about; they are not discussing this issue at all because the Secretary of State has drawn a line under it and said that it was a one-off. He regarded it as a regrettable incident. It is of no consequence to the excellent relationship and partnership built up over the past two years between the Secretary of State and myself, and which will continue into the future, long after you are an irrelevant footnote in Wales's history.

siarad ymlaen llaw ag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, na Swyddfa Cymru, am y penderfyniad hwn? A wnewch chi gadarnhau hefyd fod Paul Murphy'n hwyrfrydig i ddod ymlaen i dynnu'n ôl neu wrth-ddweud datganiadau ei gynghorydd arbennig? Dywedwch nad ei eiriau ef oeddent, ond pam yr oedd yn anffodlon gwneud unrhyw ddatganiad am y mater am 36 awr? Gofynnaf eto, beth yr ydych chi'n ei wneud i wella'r berthynas rhwng Llywodraeth Cymru dan arweiniad Llafur—fel y dywedwch wrthym o hyd—ac Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru yn Llundain? Pa wersi y gellir eu dysgu? Onid yw diffyg cysylltiad o'r fath—y gwyddom ei fod yn wir—yn tanseilio'r weinyddiaeth o ddifrif?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yn anffodus, Nick, er gwaethaf ailadrodd, yr ydych yn ymgeisio'n aflwyddiannus i greu mynydd o dwmpath morgrug. Mae enghraifft unigryw fel hyn—ac nid 36 awr yw'r ffigur; nid yw hyd yn oed yn 24 awr—yn gwbl chwerthinllyd. Tua 22 awr oedd wedi mynd heibio, fan bellaf, cyn y gwnaed y cyswllt cyntaf. O ble y cawsoch y 36 awr? Dylech fynd â'r ysgol a ddysgodd fathemateg ichi i gyfraith.

Nick Bourne: Derbyniaf 22 awr.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Wel, sut y cawsoch chi 36 awr, Nick? Pam yr ydych yn crybwyll ffigurau heb eu gwirio? A ydych yn meddwl bod 36 yr un peth â 22, sef y ffigur mwyaf posibl? Mae'n amlwg eich bod yn meddwl nad yw ffigurau'n bwysig o gwbl. Mae'ch parch at y ffeithiau hyn yn debyg i'ch parch at ffeithiau'n gyffredinol; nid ydych fel pe baech yn gallu ymdopi â chael eich cywiro. Pam nad ymddiheurwch am gawlio'ch ffigurau, ynteu a oes dim ots gennyh ond amdanant o gwbl? Y pwynt pwysig yw beth y mae pobl Cymru'n siarad amdano; nid ydynt yn trafod y mater hwn o gwbl oherwydd rhoddodd yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol derfyn arno a dweud mai achos unigryw ydoedd. Edrychai ef ar y peth fel digwyddiad anffodus. Nid yw'n mennu dim ar y berthynas a'r bartneriaeth wych a adeiladwyd dros y ddwy flynedd diwethaf rhwng yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol a mi, ac a fydd yn parhau i'r dyfodol, ymhell wedi i chi fynd yn droednodyn amherthnasol yn hanes

Cymru.

**Diwygio Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus yng Nghymru
Reforming Public Services in Wales**

Q2 The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): What discussions has the First Minister had with the Secretary of State for Wales regarding reforming public services in Wales? (OAQ17728)

The First Minister: I meet the Secretary of State for Wales regularly to discuss a variety of issues relating to Wales, including the future of our public services.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I refer you back to our exchanges last week, which are relevant to my points this week. You said that Alan Milburn had said that he would not use all of the increase allowed by Gordon Brown on spending on the national health service in England. I checked, and he is doing so: he is spending an additional 7.5 per cent on the NHS in England between now and 2007. My second point was on Paul Murphy's use of the word 'reform' in relation to public services. I put it to you that that meant greater commercialisation and you said that that was my interpretation of his words. I have also checked that, and the 10 Downing Street website quotes Alan Milburn as saying that reform means the greater use of private provision in the health service where that can be proved to be value for money. Will you revise your answer of last week? If so, will you follow this edict from No. 10?

The First Minister: I have no intention of revising my reply of last week. It is our policy that is important. We do not have a policy of believing that greater commercialisation benefits the national health service. That does not exclude the use of private finance here and there. However, there is no dogmatic attitude that that is the best way forward for the health service. You will know from our recent hospital building programme that hospitals such as the new St David's hospital and the hospital at Baglan

C2 Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi eu cael gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ar ddiwygio gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru? (OAQ17728)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Byddaf yn cyfarfod ag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru'n rheolaidd i drafod amrywiaeth o faterion perthnasol i Gymru, gan gynnwys dyfodol ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Cyfeiriaf yn ôl at ein dadl yr wythnos diwethaf, sy'n berthnasol i'm pwyntiau yr wythnos hon. Dywedasoeh fod Alan Milburn wedi dweud na fyddai'n defnyddio'r cyfan o'r cynnydd a ganiatawyd gan Gordon Brown ar wariant ar y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yn Lloegr. Edrychais, ac y mae'n gwneud hynny: mae'n gwario 7.5 y cant yn ychwanegol ar y GIG yn Lloegr rhwng yn awr a 2007. Yr oedd a wnelo fy ail bwynt â defnydd Paul Murphy o'r gair 'diwygio' mewn perthynas â gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Cynigiais i chi mai mwy o fasnacheiddio oedd ystyr hynny a dywedasoeh chi mai fy nehongliad i o'i eiriau oedd hynny. Yr wyf wedi gwirio hynny hefyd, ac mae gwefan 10 Downing Street yn dyfynnu Alan Milburn drwy ddweud bod diwygio'n golygu mwy o ddefnydd o ddarpariaeth breifat yn y gwasanaeth iechyd lle gellir profi bod hynny'n rhoi gwerth am arian. A wnewch chi ailystyried yr ateb a roesoeh yr wythnos diwethaf? Os felly, a ddilynwch y cyfarwyddyd hwn o Rif 10?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid oes gennyf ddim bwriad i ailystyried yr ateb a roddais yr wythnos diwethaf. Ein polisi ni sy'n bwysig. Nid oes gennym bolisi o gredu bod mwy o fasnacheiddio'n fanteisiol i'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Nid yw hynny'n golygu na ellir defnyddio cyllid preifat yma ac acw. Fodd bynnag, nid oes agwedd ddogmataidd mai dyna'r ffordd orau ymlaen i'n gwasanaeth iechyd. Byddwch yn gwybod o'n rhaglen adeiladu ysbytai ddiweddar fod ysbytai fel ysbyty newydd Dewi Sant a'r

are being built using private finance initiative money. You will also be aware of proposals to build hospitals in the Rhondda and at Porthmadog using what you might call traditional public finance methods. We will continue to take a pragmatic approach on deciding when private or public finance is the appropriate way forward for individual health service projects.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Your reply clearly shows that you are now on a collision course with Paul Murphy and the Prime Minister. That is the whole point of this debate. You have portrayed yourself as being in a cosy partnership with the UK Government, but you are now clearly indicating that you will break that partnership over the reform of public services. This brings us to Mr McMenemy's crucial response to you last week. He described the vote in Plenary as pathetic and irresponsible. However you gloss over that, or try to say that Paul Murphy has said that it was a one-off, it shows the Westminster mindset with regard to the National Assembly. Did you insist that Mr Murphy sack Mr McMenemy for using such words, or are you satisfied with his rather pathetic response to you?

The First Minister: The discipline of his staff is a matter for Paul Murphy, just as discipline of my staff is a matter for me. Surely you are not suggesting that I can order UK Government Ministers to discipline or dismiss their staff? That is not a matter for me in employment law. Now that the Secretary of State has spoken publicly and on the record in relation to the briefing that was given to the press by his aide, it is the end of the matter. As far as I am concerned, it is closed, because the Secretary of State made an extremely strong statement on the incident.

Kirsty Williams: The Assembly's will was clear on Thursday, as was the commitment of Jane Hutt, the Minister for Health and Social Services, that if the Westminster Government could not be persuaded, as the Scottish and

ysbyty ym Maglan yn cael eu hadeiladu gan ddefnyddio arian y fenter cyllid preifat. Byddwch yn ymwybodol hefyd o gynlluniau i adeiladu ysbytai yn y Rhondda ac ym Mhorthmadog gan ddefnyddio'r hyn y gallech eu galw'n ddulliau cyllid cyhoeddus traddodiadol. Byddwn yn parhau i weithredu'n ymarferol wrth benderfynu ai defnyddio cyllid preifat ynteu cyllid cyhoeddus yw'r ffordd briodol ymlaen i brosiectau unigol y gwasanaeth iechyd.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Mae'ch ateb yn dangos yn glir eich bod bellach ar lwybr gwrthdaro gyda Paul Murphy a'r Prif Weinidog. Dyna holl bwynt y ddadl hon. Yr ydych wedi'ch portreadu'ch hun fel pe baech mewn partneriaeth glyd gyda Llywodraeth y DU, ond yr ydych yn awr yn dangos yn glir y gwnewch dorri'r bartneriaeth honno dros fater diwygio gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Daw hynny â ni at ymateb allweddol Mr McMenemy ichi'r wythnos diwethaf. Disgrifiodd ef y bleidlais yn y Cyfarfod Llawn fel un bathetig ac anghyfrifol. Sut bynnag y ceisiwch liwio hynny, neu geisio dweud bod Paul Murphy wedi dweud mai digwyddiad unigryw ydoedd, y mae'n dangos meddylfryd San Steffan tuag at y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. A wnaethoch fynnu bod Mr Murphy'n diswyddo Mr McMenemy am ddefnyddio'r fath eiriau, ynteu a ydych yn fodlon ar ei ymateb braidd yn bathetig ef i chi?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mater i Paul Murphy yw disgyblaeth ei staff, yn union fel mai mater i mi yw disgyblaeth fy staff i. Go brin eich bod yn awgrymu y gallaf fi orchymyn Gweinidogion Llywodraeth y DU i ddisgyblu neu ddiswyddo eu staff? Nid mater i mi dan gyfraith cyflogaeth yw hynny. Gan fod yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol bellach wedi siarad ar goedd ynglŷn â'r datganiad ei gynorthwy-ydd i'r wasg, dyna ddiwedd y mater. O'm safbwynt i, mae'r mater wedi dod i ben, oherwydd gwnaeth yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol ddatganiad eithriadol o gryf ar y digwyddiad hwnnw.

Kirsty Williams: Yr oedd ewyllys y Cynulliad yn glir ddydd Iau, fel yr oedd ymrwymiad Jane Hutt, y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, sef os na ellid darbwyllio Llywodraeth San Steffan,

Welsh Labour Parties have been, of the benefits of free personal care, you would seek legislative powers to introduce it in Wales. When will these discussions begin, in order to implement the Assembly's will as stated last Thursday?

The First Minister: I will write to you about that because I am not certain whether Jane Hutt has written yet. That correspondence is certainly on its way, in line with the older persons' strategy advisory group's recommendations and the Assembly's vote.

2:10 p.m.

Grantiau Dysgu Learning Grants

C3 Cynog Dafis: Pa drafodaethau a gafodd y Prif Weinidog gyda'r Gweinidog Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ynghylch effaith cyflwyno grantiau dysgu i fyfyrwyr mewn addysg bellach? (OAQ17732)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae'r Cabinet wedi trafod grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad ar sawl achlysur.

Cynog Dafis: A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn ymwybodol y bydd cyflwyno grantiau dysgu i fyfyrwyr addysg bellach yn golygu gostwng lefel y cymorth i rai o'r myfyrwyr sydd o dan yr anfantais fwyaf? Uchafswm y grant dysgu yw £1,500 y flwyddyn, ac mae myfyrwyr o dan anfantais arbennig yn gallu cael uchafswm o £2,500. Mae perygl hefyd y bydd gohirio talu'r grant yn peri problemau sylweddol i rai myfyrwyr sy'n gallu cael grantiau mynediad wrth fynd i goleg addysg bellach. A yw hyn yn enghraifft o'r sbin sy'n fwy na'r sylwedd yn natganiadau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad? Beth yn union yw eich bwriad chi a'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn hynny o beth?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae'r cwestiynau yr ydych wedi'u codi yn eithaf perthnasol. Maent wedi codi yn ystod y trafodaethau rhwng colegau—colegau addysg bellach yn enwedig—a'r Llywodraeth ynglŷn â sut yr ymdrinnir â'r flwyddyn arbrofol gyntaf sy'n dechrau ym Medi 2002. Yr ydym wedi rhoi

fel y darbwyllwyd y Blaid Lafur yn yr Alban a Chymru, o fanteision gofal personol am ddim, y byddech yn ceisio grym deddfwriaethol i'w gyflwyno yng Nghymru. Pa bryd y dechreuau'r trafodaethau hyn, er mwyn gweithredu ewyllys y Cynulliad fel y'i mynegwyd ddydd lau diwethaf?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Fe ysgrifennaf atoch ynglŷn â hynny oherwydd nid wyf yn siŵr a ydyw Jane Hutt wedi ysgrifennu eto. Mae'r ohebiaeth honno'n sicr ar ei ffordd, yn unol ag argymhellion y grŵp cynghori ar y strategaeth i bobl hŷn a phleidlais y Cynulliad.

Q3 Cynog Dafis: What discussions has the First Minister had with the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning regarding the effect of issuing learning grants to further education students. (OAQ17732)

The First Minister: The Cabinet has discussed Assembly learning grants on several occasions.

Cynog Dafis: Is the First Minister aware that issuing learning grants to further education students will mean a reduction in the level of support for some of the most disadvantaged students? The learning grant ceiling is £1,500 per annum and particularly disadvantaged students can access a maximum of £2,500. There is also a risk that deferring payment of the grant will cause considerable problems for some students who can claim access grants when they enter further education colleges. Is this an example of spin over substance in the Assembly Government's statements? What exactly do you and the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning intend to do on this issue?

The First Minister: The questions that you raised are quite pertinent. They were raised during the discussions between colleges—especially colleges of further education—and the Government concerning how to deal with the first pilot year, which will start in September 2002. We have given colleges the

hawl i golegau gadw rheolaeth ariannol dros y cronfeydd caledi a mynediad y buoch yn cyfeirio atynt. Yr ydym yn disgwyl gallu cysoni popeth i grant dysgu'r Cynulliad y flwyddyn ganlynol. Felly, bydd y grantiau hynny yn parhau i gael eu talu drwy'r colegau ar sail caledi a mynediad.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): What progress is being made on negotiations with the Government in London on the Assembly's desire to see an end to tuition fees, as recommended by the Rees commission? Will you give an assurance that Whitehall will be pressed hard to give us a firm decision prior to the deadline for the submission of bids from the National Assembly for primary legislation? If Whitehall is not prepared to give the powers on an United Kingdom basis, will you seek those powers for Wales?

The First Minister: That was our understanding, based on the expectation that Estelle Morris's review, as the Secretary of State for Education and Skills, would be finished earlier than now seems likely. That review is ongoing and we understand that it is on course to finish the work this year. We would need to consider the question of legislative powers and discretion for us to deal with this matter in the light of the review's findings. We continue to hope that, in line with the Rees report's recommendations, the Department for Education and Skills comes to the same conclusions, and that responsibility for tuition fees will be devolved. However, at the moment it is a non-devolved issue.

Jonathan Morgan: The Rees report's recommendation was to abolish up-front tuition fees and introduce tuition fees at the end of an undergraduate degree course. Is it the Government of Wales's policy now to oppose all forms of tuition fees, or do you favour keeping fees at the end of the course, as recommended by the Rees report?

The First Minister: I accept the correction. I should have used the term 'up-front' because people use the phrases 'tuition fees', 'up-front tuition fees', and sometimes 'graduate tax' to describe tuition fees that are not up-

right to retain financial control over the hardship and access funds to which you referred. We expect to be able to synchronise all elements into an Assembly learning grant in the following year. Therefore, those grants will still be paid through the colleges on the basis of hardship and access.

Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): Pa gynnydd a wnaed ar negodiadau gyda'r Llywodraeth yn Llundain ynghylch awydd y Cynulliad i ddileu ffioedd dysgu, fel a argymhellwyd gan gomisiwn Rees? A wnewch chi roi sicrwydd y pwysir yn galed ar Whitehall i roi penderfyniad pendant inni cyn y dyddiad olaf y gall y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gyflwyno ceisiadau am ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol? Os nad yw Whitehall yn barod i roi'r pwerau ar sail y Deyrnas Unedig gyfan, a geiswch chi'r pwerau hynny i Gymru?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Dyna oedd ein dealltwriaeth, ar sail y disgwyliad y byddai adolygiad Estelle Morris, yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Addysg a Sgiliau, wedi'i orffen yn gynt nag sydd bellach yn debygol. Mae'r adolygiad hwnnw'n parhau a deallwn y disgwylir gorffen y gwaith eleni. Bydd angen inni ystyried cwestiwn hawliau deddfu a disgresiwn inni ddelio â'r mater hwn yng ngoleuni canfyddiadau'r adolygiad hwnnw. Daliwn i obeithio y daw'r Adran Addysg a Sgiliau i'r un casgliadau, yn unol ag argymhellion adroddiad Rees, ac y datganolir y cyfrifoldeb am ffioedd dysgu. Fodd bynnag, ar hyn o bryd mae'n fater nas datganolwyd.

Jonathan Morgan: Argymhelliad adroddiad Rees oedd dileu ffioedd dysgu o flaen llaw a chyflwyno ffioedd dysgu ar ddiwedd cwrs gradd i israddedigion. Ai polisi Llywodraeth Cymru erbyn hyn yw gwrthwynebu pob ffurf ar ffioedd dysgu, ynteu a ydych o blaid cadw ffioedd ar ddiwedd y cwrs, yn unol ag argymhellion adroddiad Rees?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Derbyniaf y cywiriad. Dylaswn fod wedi defnyddio'r term 'o flaen llaw' oherwydd bydd pobl yn defnyddio'r ymadroddion 'ffioedd dysgu', 'ffioedd dysgu o flaen llaw', ac weithiau

front, following the Cubie report in Scotland and the Rees report in Wales. However, I entirely accept the spirit of your correction.

‘treth graddedigion’ i ddisgrifio ffioedd dysgu na thelir ymlaen llaw, yn dilyn adroddiad Cubie yn yr Alban ac adroddiad Rees yng Nghymru. Er hynny, derbynïaf ysbryd eich cywiriad yn gyfan gwbl.

The Presiding Officer: Question 4 (OAQ17721) has been transferred for written answer.

Y Llywydd: Trosglwyddwyd cwestiwn 4 (OAQ17721) i’w ateb yn ysgrifenedig.

Gwella Safon Byw Pobl Gogledd Cymru Improving the Standard of Living for the People of North Wales

Q5 Janet Ryder: Will the First Minister make a statement on how his Government’s policies have contributed to improving the standard of living for the people of north Wales? (OAQ17718)

C5 Janet Ryder: A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar sut mae polisïau ei lywodraeth wedi cyfrannu at wella safon byw pobl gogledd Cymru? (OAQ17718)

The First Minister: I am grateful for the opportunity to comment on the standard of living of the people of north Wales. Record figures for regional selective assistance were agreed last year. There can be a two-year time lag—or sometimes more—before those grants are activated, as companies progress with the investment arising from them. In light of the fact that around 30 per cent of the population of north Wales lives outside tier one and two areas, such as Wrexham and parts of Deeside, it is relevant that we have also introduced the Assembly investment grant for small and medium-sized firms. That grant covers all of north Wales regardless of whether businesses are located in tiers one and two or in the white areas outside.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle i roi sylw ar safon byw pobl y Gogledd. Cytunwyd ar ffigurau uwch nag erioed ar gyfer cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol y llynedd. Gall fod oedi o ddwy flynedd—neu fwy weithiau—cyn y gwelir effaith y grantiau hynny, wrth i gwmnïau weithio gyda’r buddsoddiad a ddaw o ganlyniad iddynt. Yn wyneb y ffaith bod tua 30 y cant o boblogaeth y Gogledd yn byw y tu allan i ardaloedd haen un a dau, fel Wrecsam a rhannau o Lannau Dyfrdwy, y mae’n berthnasol ein bod hefyd wedi cyflwyno grant buddsoddi’r Cynulliad i gwmnïau bach a chanolig eu maint. Mae’r grant hwnnw ar gyfer y Gogledd i gyd, pa un a yw busnesau wedi’u lleoli mewn ardaloedd haen un a dau neu yn yr ardaloedd gwyn y tu allan.

Janet Ryder: Independent reports by Cambridge Econometrics and Oxford Economic Forecasting predict a widening gap between the gross domestic product per head of Wales and that of England. This year and the next, they predict that Wales’s GDP, which is already behind that of England, will fall even further behind. How will the policies of your Government reverse that trend and stop Wales falling further behind England?

Janet Ryder: Mae adroddiadau annibynnol gan Cambridge Econometrics ac Oxford Economic Forecasting yn proffwydo bwlch cynyddol rhwng y cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen yng Nghymru ac yn Lloegr. Eleni a’r flwyddyn nesaf, proffwydant y bydd CMC Cymru, sydd eisoes y tu ôl i un Lloegr, yn cwmpo ymhellach yn ôl eto. Sut y gwnaiff polisïau eich Llywodraeth wrthdroi’r duedd honno ac atal Cymru rhag syrthio’n bellach y tu ôl i Loegr?

The First Minister: In a way, my answer to your initial question also answers your supplementary. Although those companies are estimable in terms of business

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mewn ffordd, mae fy ateb i’ch cwestiwn cyntaf yn ateb eich cwestiwn atodol hefyd. Er bod y cwmnïau hynny’n deilwng o safbwynt rhagolygon

forecasting, they forecast on the basis of trends as they understand them. They do not usually take into account the impact of Government measures, such as the investment grant that I mentioned. In other words, you would expect to see some pay-off two or three years down the line following record agreements of regional selective assistance and the introduction of a new scheme to cover non-assisted areas. Economic forecasting groups do not always take those facts on board; they do not have the techniques to do so.

Mick Bates: Another policy that has been delivered by our partnership Government is free entry to national galleries in Wales. Has the First Minister—[*Interruption.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order. I will not allow bawling during questions.

Mick Bates: Has the First Minister noted Plaid Cymru's new thinking on free access to public galleries? Will he assure the Assembly and the public in our gallery—which is free to enter—that he has no plans to adopt Plaid Cymru's policy to make entry to galleries the privilege of only those who can afford it?

The Presiding Officer: Order. The initial question referred to north Wales; your supplementary does not.

Potensial Economaidd Maes Awyr Rhyngwladol Caerdydd Economic Potential of Cardiff International Airport

C6 Owen John Thomas: A yw'r Cabinet wedi trafod adroddiad y gweithgor a ffurfiwyd y llynedd i ystyried potensial economaidd Maes Awyr Rhyngwladol Caerdydd? (OAQ17724)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid yw'r Cabinet wedi trafod adroddiad y gweithgor, ond cyflwynwyd y drafft i Sue Essex a minnau, ac wedi hynny, i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Cafodd y Pwyllgor drafodaeth adeiladol ynghylch casgliadau'r gweithgor ar 30 Ionawr, ac ar hyn o bryd mae'r gweithgor wrthi'n cwblhau'r adroddiad. Deallaf y bydd

busnes, gwnânt eu rhagolygon ar sail tueddiadau yn ôl eu dealltwriaeth hwy ohonynt. Ni fyddant fel arfer yn ystyried effaith mesurau'r Llywodraeth, fel y grant buddsoddi y soniais amdano. Mewn geiriau eraill, byddech yn disgwyl gweld rhyw fudd ymhên dwy neu dair blynedd yn dilyn cytundebau cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol uwch nag erioed a chyflwyno cynllun newydd i ofalu am ardaloedd nas cynorthwyr. Ni fydd grwpiau sy'n gwneud rhagolygon economaidd bob amser yn ystyried y ffeithiau hyn; nid oes ganddynt y technegau i wneud hynny.

Mick Bates: Polisi arall a gyflawnwyd gan ein Llywodraeth bartneriaeth yw mynediad am ddim i orielau cenedlaethol yng Nghymru. A ydyw Prif Weinidog—[*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Ni chaniatâf floeddio yn ystod cwestiynau.

Mick Bates: A ydyw Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi nodi meddylfryd newydd Plaid Cymru ar fynediad am ddim i orielau cyhoeddus? A wnaiff sicrhau'r Cynulliad a'r cyhoedd yn ein horiel ni—lle caniateir mynediad am ddim—nad oes ganddo unrhyw gynlluniau i fabwysiadu polisi Plaid Cymru mai dim ond y rheini a all ei fforddio a gaiff y fraint o gael mynediad i orielau?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Cyfeiriai'r cwestiwn gwreiddiol at y Gogledd; ni wna'ch cwestiwn atodol hynny.

Q6 Owen John Thomas: Has the Cabinet discussed the report produced by the working group, established last year, to consider the economic potential of Cardiff International Airport? (OAQ17724)

The First Minister: The Cabinet has not discussed the group's report, but the draft was submitted to Sue Essex and myself and subsequently to the Economic Development Committee. The Committee had a constructive discussion on the group's findings on 30 January, and the group is currently finalising its report. I understand

yn cael ei gyflwyno i Sue Essex ac Andrew Davies yn fuan.

Owen John Thomas: Mae'n amlwg fod yn rhaid codi CMC y pen a gwella apêl de-ddwyrain Cymru er mwyn cynyddu nifer y teithiau busnes a nifer y twristiaid tramor sydd yn defnyddio maes awyr Caerdydd. A gytunwch fod angen cynllun economaidd rhanbarthol er mwyn hyrwyddo datblygiad yr ardal ac, yn sgîl hynny, y defnydd o'r maes awyr?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Trafodwyd y materion hyn yng nghyfarfod Pwyllgor Rhanbarth y De-ddwyrain ddydd Gwener diwethaf yn y maes awyr yn Rhws. Codwyd nifer o bwyntiau ynghylch cost hedfan o Gaerdydd i Glasgow, Belfast, Aberdeen a Chaeredin o'i gymharu â Bryste, a faint o feysydd awyr ychwanegol y byddai modd eu cyrraedd drwy sefydlu gwasanaethau cyson o Gaerdydd.

Mae sibrydion ar led bod y maes awyr am gael ei symud o Rhws i waith dur Llanwern. Mae rhai o Aelodau Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi hynny. Mae'n bwysig ystyried yr hyn yr ydym am ei wneud gyda Maes Awyr Rhyngwladol Caerdydd. Yr ydym eisiau cynlluniau ymarferol i ddenu mwy o wasanaethau rheolaidd o'r maes awyr i feysydd awyr pwysig eraill ym Mhrydain ac yn Ewrop.

2:20 p.m.

David Melding: The draft report recommended that the airport should be accessed via a trunk road. Given the developments that are likely at RAF St Athan nearby, do you agree that it is high time that we put this airport access road on the forward trunk road programme instead of axing it as your Minister for Environment did last month?

The First Minister: It has not been axed. It is still in preparation in terms of the Vale of Glamorgan Council's designs for the road and the Culverhouse Cross interchange. We have not seen the council's final proposals. The general tone of discussions with airport management and members of the public in Rhoose last Friday in the South East Wales

that it will soon be submitted to Sue Essex and Andrew Davies.

Owen John Thomas: It is clear that we need to increase the GDP per capita and make south-east Wales more appealing in order to increase the number of business flights and the number of foreign tourists who use Cardiff airport. Do you agree that we need a regional economic plan to promote the development of the area and, as a result, the use of the airport?

The First Minister: These matters were discussed in the South East Wales Regional Committee meeting last Friday in the airport at Rhoose. Many points were raised on the cost of flying from Cardiff to Glasgow, Belfast, Aberdeen and Edinburgh as compared with Bristol, and how many additional airports could be reached by establishing frequent services from Cardiff.

There is a rumour doing the rounds that the airport is to be moved from Rhoose to Llanwern steelworks. Some Plaid Cymru Members support that. It is important to consider what we intend to do with Cardiff International Airport. We need practical plans to attract more scheduled services from the airport to other important airports in Britain and Europe.

David Melding: Argymhellodd yr adroddiad drafft y dylai fod cefnffordd i'r maes awyr. Yn wyneb y datblygiadau sy'n debygol yn safle cyfagos y Llu Awyr Brenhinol yn Sain Tathan, a gytunwch ei bod yn hen bryd inni roi'r ffordd fynediad hon i'r maes awyr ar raglen cefnffyrdd y dyfodol yn hytrach na dileu'r cynllun fel y gwnaeth eich Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd y mis diwethaf?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid yw wedi dod dan y fwyell. Mae'n dal ar y gweill fel rhan o gynlluniau Cyngor Bro Morgannwg ar gyfer y ffordd a chyfnewidfa Croes Cwrlwys. Nid ydym wedi gweld cynigion terfynol y cyngor. Yr oedd naws gyffredinol y trafodaethau gyda rheolwyr y maes awyr ac aelodau'r cyhoedd yn y Rhws ddydd Gwener diwethaf

Regional Committee meeting was different to what you are now suggesting, David. Road access to Bristol airport is also bad and no better than it is to Cardiff airport. It is not the road access that is making the difference in terms of the greater growth of traffic, services and scheduled flights from Bristol in comparison with Cardiff; something in the local economy is making the difference. The message, which came over clearly from members of the public and the airport management, is 'Don't overdo the issue of the road access'.

ym Mhwyllgor Rhanbarthol y De-ddwyrain yn wahanol i'r hyn yr ydych chi'n ei awgrymu'n awr, David. Mae'r ffyrdd i faes awyr Bryste'n wael hefyd, heb fod yn ddim gwell na'r rheini i faes awyr Caerdydd. Nid y ffyrdd mynediad sy'n gwneud y gwahaniaeth o ran y twf mwy mewn traffig, gwasanaethau a'r rhaglen hedfan o Fryste o'i gymharu â Chaerdydd; rhywbeth yn yr economi leol sy'n gwneud y gwahaniaeth. Y neges, a ddaeth yn glir oddi wrth aelodau'r cyhoedd a rheolwyr y maes awyr, yw 'Peidiwch â gorbwysleisio problem y ffyrdd mynediad'.

Patrymau Cyflogaeth yng Ngogledd Cymru (Tueddiadau Diweddar) **Employment Patterns in North Wales (Recent Trends)**

C7 Gareth Jones: Yn rhinwedd ei rôl fel cydlynnydd polisi ar gyfer y Gogledd, a wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar unrhyw dueddiadau diweddar mewn patrymau cyflogaeth yng ngogledd Cymru? (OAQ17736)

Q7 Gareth Jones: In his role as policy coordinator for north Wales, will the First Minister make a statement on any recent trends in employment patterns in north Wales? (OAQ17736)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae'r data diweddaraf ar farchnad lafur y Gogledd yn dangos bod 71 y cant o bobl o oed gweithio mewn gwaith neu wedi'u cofrestru'n ddi-waith ac yn barod i weithio. Mae hynny ddau bwynt canran yn uwch na chyfartaledd Cymru gyfan. Mae rhai ardaloedd o Gymru yn llawer uwch na hynny: yn Sir y Fflint mae dros 82.6 y cant mewn cyflogaeth neu wedi'u cofrestru'n ddi-waith. Dyna'r ganran uchaf yng Nghymru o bell ffordd.

The First Minister: The latest data on the labour market in north Wales shows that 71 per cent of people of working age are in work or registered as unemployed and are available for work. That is two percentage points higher than the average for the whole of Wales. There are some areas in Wales that are much higher than that: in Flintshire, 82.6 per cent are in employment or registered as unemployed. That is the highest percentage in Wales by a long chalk.

Gareth Jones: Mae ystadegau'r 10 mlynedd diwethaf ar gyflogaeth yng Nghonwy yn dangos tueddiadau difrifol gyda gostyngiad o dros 50 y cant mewn swyddi gweithgynhyrchu ac 20 y cant mewn swyddi yn y sector gwastai ac arlwyo. Ac eithrio adeiladu, nid oes fawr o gynnydd yn y sectorau eraill. Mae'n drist felly mai yng Nghonwy y ceir y cyflog wythnosol cyfartalog isaf ym Mhrydain. Am ba hyd yr ydych chi a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol am ganiatáu i'r sefyllfa hon barhau?

Gareth Jones: The employment statistics for the last 10 years in Conwy highlight worrying trends with a decrease of over 50 per cent in manufacturing jobs and 20 per cent in jobs in the hotel and catering sector. With the exception of construction, there is little increase in the other sectors. It is sad therefore that Conwy has the lowest average weekly wage in Britain. For how long will you and the Liberal Democrats allow this situation to continue?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Byddwch yn ymwybodol, Gareth, fod y Llywodraeth Lafur wedi cyflwyno isafswm cyflog statudol am y tro cyntaf erioed yn hanes Prydain. Mae wedi codi'r isafswm hwnnw ddwywaith, sydd yn bwysig i bobl sydd mewn gwaith

The First Minister: You will be aware, Gareth, that the Labour Government introduced the statutory minimum wage for the first time ever in Britain. It has raised that minimum twice, which is important to people who are in work but on a low wage in areas

ond ar y lefel gyflog isaf mewn ardaloedd fel Conwy sydd yn dibynnu ar ddiwydiannau sydd yn draddodiadol yn tueddu i dalu cyflogau is na'r cyfartaledd. Yr ydym yn gweithio ar amrywio'r economi i achub swyddi, fel y gobeithiwn ei wneud yn Alcoa yn Nolgarrog cyn bo hir—ni allwn fod yn bendant, ond gobeithiwn fod dyfodol i Ddolgarrog—ac yn cyflwyno arian Amcan 1, sydd yn cael effaith fawr er na fydd yn talu'i ffordd yn y tymor byr. O ran amrywio economi Conwy mae Amcan 1 yn dangos dyfodol addawol dros ben.

Ann Jones: Will the First Minister join me in applauding the fact that the latest unemployment figures show that the number of unemployed people in the Vale of Clwyd has fallen by over 20 per cent in the last 12 months and by 50 per cent since May 1997? Does he agree with me that this huge drop in unemployment is due to Labour policy to build a strong economy, to help people into work through the New Deal and to make work pay through the minimum wage and the working families tax credit?

The First Minister: It is a combination of those factors. All sorts of threats were made that, if the minimum wage were introduced, it would be areas such as the Vale of Clwyd and elsewhere in north Wales where there is much low wage employment in the care sector and the tourism sector, that would tend to lose jobs rather than gain income from the rise in the minimum wage. All those dire threats from parties, some of which are represented here, did not turn out to be true. The minimum wage has been good, not bad, for employment. That is a credit to how the minimum wage was brought in, in consultation with employers and the trade unions, and the other measures that came in with it, such as the working families tax credit, to which you correctly pointed.

Peter Rogers: In our debate on holding a Plenary session in north Wales, the Minister for Rural Affairs and Assembly Business said that the partnership agreement had turned around Anglesey's economy. Are you confident that he knows what he is talking about in light of the fact that Anglesey has the second highest unemployment rate in Wales and the serious concerns of the WDA

such as Conwy that depend on industries that traditionally have tended to pay lower than average wages. We are working on diversifying the economy to save jobs, as we hope to do in Alcoa, Dolgarrog, before long—we cannot be certain, but we hope that there is a future for Dolgarrog—and are introducing Objective 1 money, which is having a great effect although it may not become apparent in the short term. As regards diversifying the economy of Conwy, Objective 1 points to a very promising future.

Ann Jones: A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ymuno â mi i gymeradwyo'r ffaith bod y ffigurau diweithdra diweddaraf yn dangos bod nifer y di-waith yn Nyffryn Clwyd wedi disgyn dros 20 y cant yn y 12 mis diwethaf a 50 y cant ers Mai 1997? A ydyw'n cytuno â mi fod y cwmp enfawr hwn mewn diweithdra yn ganlyniad polisi Llafur o adeiladu economi cryf, helpu pobl i gael hyd i waith drwy'r Fargen Newydd a gwneud i waith dalu drwy'r isafswm cyflog a'r credyd treth i deuluoedd sy'n gweithio?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae'n gyfuniad o'r ffactorau hynny i gyd. Gwnaethpwyd pob math o fygythiadau, pe cyflwynid yr isafswm cyflog, mai ardaloedd fel Dyffryn Clwyd a rhannau eraill o'r Gogledd lle ceir llawer o swyddi â chyflogau isel yn y sector gofal a'r sector twristiaeth, a fyddai'n tueddu i gollu swyddi yn hytrach nag ennill incwm o'r codiad yn yr isafswm cyflog. Ni ddaeth yr holl fygythiadau enbyd hynny gan bleidiau, y mae rhai ohonynt wedi'u cynrychioli yma, yn wir. Bu'r isafswm cyflog yn dda i gyflogaeth, nid yn ddrwg. Mae hynny'n glod i'r modd y cyflwynwyd yr isafswm cyflog, gan ymgynghori â chyflogwyr a'r undebau llafur, ac i'r mesurau eraill a gyflwynwyd gydag ef, fel y credyd treth i deuluoedd sy'n gweithio, yr oeddech yn iawn i dynnu sylw ato.

Peter Rogers: Yn ein dadl ar gynnal Cyfarfod Llawn yn y Gogledd, dywedodd y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig a Threfnydd y Cynulliad fod y cytundeb partneriaeth wedi gwyrdroi economi Ynys Môn. A ydych yn hyderus ei fod yn gwybod am beth y mae'n sôn, yng ngolau'r ffaith bod gan Ynys Môn y gyfradd ddiweithdra ail uchaf yng Nghymru a phryderon Awdurdod

in attracting businesses into the area?

Datblygu Cymru o ran denu busnesau i'r ardal?

The First Minister: When you consider what has happened to unemployment over the past 12 to 24 months, there has been some convergence. In other words, the areas with the highest unemployment have had the biggest falls in unemployment, and the areas with the lowest unemployment have tended to have quite small falls in unemployment. One of them, Newport, for obvious reasons relating to the steelworks, has seen a rise in unemployment. Unemployment fell by 1.2 per cent in Anglesey. That is probably one of the biggest falls in Wales. However, it does not mean that there is still not a long way to go to get Anglesey's unemployment rate down to the Welsh average.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Pan ystyriwch beth sydd wedi digwydd i ddiweithdra dros y flwyddyn i ddwy ddiwethaf, bu rhywfaint o gydgyfeiriant. Mewn geiriau eraill, gwelodd yr ardaloedd â'r diweithdra uchaf y cwmp mwyaf mewn diweithdra, a thueddodd yr ardaloedd â'r diweithdra isaf i weld cwmp gymharol fach mewn diweithdra. Mae un ohonynt, Casnewydd, am resymau amlwg yn ymwneud â'r gwaith dur, wedi gweld cynnydd mewn diweithdra. Cwmpodd diweithdra 1.2 y cant yn Ynys Môn. Dyna gwmp gyda'r mwyaf yng Nghymru, mae'n debyg. Er hynny, nid yw'n golygu nad oes ffordd bell i fynd o hyd i gael cyfradd ddiweithdra Ynys Môn i lawr i gyfartaledd Cymru.

Gwasanaethau a Ariennir gan y Cynulliad Assembly-funded Services

Q8 Peter Black: What action is the First Minister taking to ensure that Assembly-funded services benefit all parts of Wales equally? (OAQ17722)

C8 Peter Black: Pa gamau y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru yn eu cymryd i sicrhau bod gwasanaethau a ariennir gan y Cynulliad o les i bob rhan o Gymru yn ddiwahân? (OAQ17722)

The First Minister: By a judicious combination of universal measures, such as the six weeks free personal care after patients return home from hospital, for example, which is not means tested, and free bus travel for elderly persons and people with disabilities. Those are not means-tested or targeted, and are available universally. That is combined with some targeted policies, such as the Assembly learning grants. They are means-tested grants to encourage people into further and higher education, especially those who traditionally did not go on to something close to full-time further education let alone higher education. Those are means-tested and are targeted at the poorest areas and the poorest families differentially, because there is a case for means-testing and targeting in those policies. However, it does not mean that they do not benefit the whole of Wales. It would benefit the whole of Wales enormously if we could raise the proportion of people going on to higher education or to full-time further education.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Drwy gyfuniad call o fesurau cyffredinol, fel y chwe wythnos o ofal personol am ddim pan ddaw cleifion adref o'r ysbty, er enghraifft, nad oes prawf moddion ar ei gyfer, a theithio ar fws am ddim i'r henoed a phobl ag anableddau. Nid oes prawf moddion ar y rheiny, ac maent ar gael i bawb. Cyfunir hynny â rhai polisiau sydd wedi'u targedu, fel grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad. Grant ynghlwm wrth brawf moddion yw'r rhain, i ddenu pobl at addysg bellach ac uwch, yn enwedig bobl na fyddai'n draddodiadol yn mynd ymlaen i unrhyw beth tebyg i addysg bellach amser llawn, heb sôn am addysg uwch. Mae prawf moddion ar y rhain ac fe'u targedir at yr ardaloedd tlotaf a'r teuluoedd tlotaf yn wahaniaethol, oherwydd mae achos dros brofion moddion a thargedu yn y polisiau hynny. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n golygu nad ydynt o fudd i Gymru gyfan. Byddai'n fantais fawr i Gymru gyfan pe gallem godi'r gyfran o bobl sy'n mynd ymlaen i addysg uwch neu i addysg bellach amser llawn.

Peter Black: Those policies are welcome. Are you aware of the huge concern in south-west Wales at the proposal to move paediatric neurosurgery to Cardiff? Given the proposed Cardiff children's hospital, in particular, there is concern that further services will follow from Singleton and Morriston hospitals to Cardiff. What can you and the Government do to account for that concern, and to ensure that that flow of services does not happen?

The First Minister: At this stage we are dealing with a consultation exercise by the five health authorities in Wales, led by Dyfed Powys Health Authority in this case, to consider the future of tertiary services for children. The definition of tertiary services is those services that you do not expect to find in your local district general hospital, but expect to find in the highly specialist hospitals—perhaps not quite at the level of Great Ormond Street Children's Hospital in London. The exact definition of which hospitals in Wales—and it may only be one—would carry the burden of providing those tertiary services that you do not find in your local hospital, but which you do not expect to have to go to Great Ormond Street for, is difficult. When the consultation is over we will get the report and Jane Hutt will have some difficult decisions to make. The views that have been expressed already, here and in local newspapers in areas served by other hospitals, will no doubt be taken into account.

Glyn Davies: A dderbyniwch fod prosiectau fel Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru yn peri i rannau o Gymru deimlo nad yw eich Llywodraeth yn deg i bob rhan o Gymru? A dderbyniwch hefyd y byddai mwy o fuddsoddiad yn isadeiledd trafniadaeth y Canolbarth yn mynd yn bell i gynyddu cefnogaeth i'r Cynulliad ym mhob rhan o Gymru?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw'r ffordd yr ydych yn gosod eich blaenoriaethau er mwyn sicrhau y cânt eu gweld i fod yn deg i bob rhan o Gymru, i bob sector o'r economi a phob rhan o gymdeithas. Gallwch bob tro enwi prosiect a dweud bod hwnnw yn dangos bod ffafriaeth tuag at un

Peter Black: Croesewir y polisiâu hynny. A ydych yn ymwybodol o'r pryder enfawr yn y De-orllewin ynghylch y cynnig i symud llawdriniaeth nerfol i blant i Gaerdydd? Ac ystyried yr ysbyty plant arfaethedig i Gaerdydd, yn arbennig, mae pryder y bydd gwasanaethau eraill yn dilyn o ysbytai Singleton a Threforys i Gaerdydd. Beth allwch chi a'r Llywodraeth ei wneud i ateb y pryder hwnnw, ac i sicrhau na ddigwydd y llifeiriant gwasanaethau hwnnw?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ar hyn o bryd yr ydym yn delio ag ymarfer ymgynghori gan y pum awdurdod iechyd yng Nghymru, dan arweiniad Awdurdod Iechyd Dyfed Powys yn yr achos hwn, i ystyried dyfodol gwasanaethau trydyddol i blant. Diffiniad gwasanaethau trydyddol yw'r gwasanaethau hynny na ddisgwyliwch eu cael yn eich ysbyty cyffredinol dosbarth lleol, ond y disgwyliwch eu cael yn yr ysbytai arbenigol iawn—efallai nad yn union ar lefel Ysbyty Plant Great Ormond Street yn Llundain. Mae'n anodd diffinio'n union pa ysbytai yng Nghymru—ac efallai mai dim ond un sydd—a fyddai'n cario baich darparu'r gwasanaethau trydyddol hynny nad ydynt ar gael yn eich ysbyty lleol, ond nad ydych yn disgwyl gorfod mynd i Great Ormond Street amdanynt. Pan fydd yr ymgynghori ar ben fe gawn yr adroddiad a bydd gan Jane Hutt benderfyniadau anodd i'w gwneud. Mae'n sicr y rhoddir ystyriaeth i'r sylwadau a fynegwyd yn barod, yma ac mewn papurau newydd lleol yn yr ardaloedd a wasanaethir gan yr ysbytai.

Glyn Davies: Do you accept that projects such as the Wales Millennium Centre cause parts of Wales to feel that your Government is not being fair to every part of Wales? Do you also accept that more investment in the transport infrastructure of mid Wales would go a long way to increasing support for the Assembly in all parts of Wales?

The First Minister: The important thing is the way that you set your priorities to ensure that they are seen as being fair to every part of Wales, to every sector of the economy and every part of society. You can always highlight a project and say that that shows favouritism towards one area or one sector of

ardal neu un sector o'r economi neu'r gymdeithas. Rhaid ystyried pob prosiect a'i leoliad. Rhaid ystyried a gaiff gormod o brosiectau eu datblygu mewn un ardal o Gymru neu a ydynt yn tueddu i gael eu lleoli heb ffafriaeth yn y man gorau ar gyfer y prosiect dan sylw. Ni chredaf fod neb erioed wedi ceisio dadlau bod rhywle arall yng Nghymru, heblaw am y safle presennol, y gellid lleoli Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru.

the economy or society. We must consider all projects and their locations. We must consider whether too many projects are located in one area of Wales or whether they tend to be located without favouritism on the best location for a specific project. I do not believe that anyone has ever tried to argue that there is another site in Wales, apart from the current site, where the Wales Millennium Centre could be located.

2:30 p.m.

Strategaeth ar gyfer Pobl Hŷn Strategy for Older People

Q9 Geraint Davies: Will the First Minister make a statement on the strategy for older people? (OAQ17733)

C9 Geraint Davies: A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar y strategaeth ar gyfer pobl hŷn? (OAQ17733)

The First Minister: Developing the strategy for older people was an immense exercise involving the advisory group on older people, chaired by Brian Gibbons, the Deputy Minister for Health. An advisory group was established to develop the strategy so that it was free to make recommendations in line with the opinion of the stakeholders, who were represented in the group. The strategy was given a thorough airing and an interesting debate was held on the content in Plenary on 16 May, which came to some interesting conclusions.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr oedd datblygu'r strategaeth ar gyfer pobl hŷn yn ymarferiad eang a oedd yn cynnwys y grŵp cynghori ar bobl hŷn, dan gadeiryddiaeth Brian Gibbons, y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Iechyd. Sefydlwyd grŵp cynghori i ddatblygu'r strategaeth fel y byddai'n rhydd i wneud argymhellion yn unol â barn y rhanddeiliaid, a gynrychiolid yn y grŵp. Gwyntyllwyd y strategaeth yn drwyadl a chafwyd dadl ddiddorol ar y cynnwys yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 16 Mai, a ddaeth i rai casgliadau diddorol.

Geraint Davies: Following the Assembly's resolution last week to press the UK Government to provide free personal care for the elderly, will the First Minister confirm that this is in fact the Assembly Government's policy and that he will pursue it vigorously?

Geraint Davies: Yn dilyn penderfyniad y Cynulliad yr wythnos diwethaf i bwysu ar Lywodraeth y DU i ddarparu gofal personol am ddim i'r henoed, a wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru gadarnhau mai dyma yn wir yw polisi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ac yr aiff ati'n egniol i fwrw ymlaen ag ef?

The First Minister: Yes. Once matters such as this have been resolved by an Assembly vote, they become policy, which we are obliged to pursue with the UK Government when it is not a devolved matter and we do not have the powers, or to enact when we have the powers. That is true for every Assembly resolution passed.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Gwnaf. Unwaith y bydd materion fel hyn wedi'u penderfynu drwy bleidlais yn y Cynulliad, maent yn bolisi, y mae'n ddyletswydd arnom i'w ddilyn gyda Llywodraeth y DU pan nad yw'n fater datganoledig a phan nad yw'r pwerau gennym, neu i'w weithredu pan fo'r pwerau gennym. Mae hynny'n wir am bob penderfyniad a wneir gan y Cynulliad.

Brian Gibbons: You will be aware that the strategy, while urging that we make representations to the UK Government,

Brian Gibbons: Byddwch yn ymwybodol fod y strategaeth, wrth ein hannog i bwysu ar Lywodraeth y DU, wedi pwysleisio bod gofal

highlighted that free personal care was one of a range of issues that were important to older people in Wales. Do you agree that it is important that we address the full range of priorities rather than just focusing on one narrow area?

The First Minister: I think that the group made 110 recommendations, only two of which dealt with personal care. We have implemented the six weeks' free personal care plan because, if the first six weeks of care after returning from hospital is free, it does not affect a patient's eligibility to receive attendance allowance, as it does not enter the equation. The issue of the claw back of allowance is raised after the six-week period and the advisory group was conscious of that. That is why the group wanted to deal with the issue on an England and Wales basis under different legislation. I am conscious of the terms in which the resolution was made last week. It was in line with the recommendations of the older persons' strategy advisory group, which considered it thoroughly. We must give it credit for that.

William Graham: Will the First Minister explain how this strategy for older people could be visualised as 'an irresponsible approach to politics'?

The First Minister: That is not a proper description of the approach of the older persons' strategy advisory group. It made its recommendations, although I was not present, and Brian chaired the group, but I do not think that he overinfluenced its discussions. Knowing the stakeholders, I am sure that they had their own opinions and that they were forcibly aired during the advisory group's discussions. That is how the group came to its measured and considered conclusions. I will not comment further on last Thursday's debate as the Secretary of State for Wales's strong statement has drawn a line under it.

personol am ddim yn un o amrediad o faterion a oedd yn bwysig i bobl hŷn yng Nghymru. A gytunwch ei bod yn bwysig ein bod yn rhoi sylw i'r amrediad llawn o flaenoriaethau yn hytrach na chanolbwyntio ar un maes cul yn unig?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr wyf yn meddwl i'r grŵp wneud 110 o argymhellion, gyda dim ond dau ohonynt yn ymwneud â gofal personol. Yr ydym wedi gweithredu'r cynllun gofal personol am ddim am chwe wythnos oherwydd, os yw'r chwe wythnos cyntaf o ofal ar ôl dod allan o'r ysbyty am ddim, nid yw'n effeithio ar hawl y claf i gael lwfans gweini, gan nad yw'n rhan o'r hafaliad. Gellir adfachu lwfans ar ôl y cyfnod chwe wythnos ac yr oedd y grŵp cynghori yn ymwybodol o hynny. Dyna pam yr oedd ar y grŵp eisiau delio â'r mater ar sail Cymru a Lloegr dan ddeddfwriaeth wahanol. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o delerau'r penderfyniad a wnaethpwyd yr wythnos diwethaf. Yr oedd yn unol ag argymhellion y grŵp cynghori ar y strategaeth ar gyfer pobl hŷn, a'i hystyriodd yn fanwl. Rhaid inni roi clod iddo am hynny.

William Graham: A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru egluro sut y gellid gweld y strategaeth hon ar gyfer pobl hŷn fel agwedd anghyfrifol at wleidyddiaeth?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid yw hynny'n ddisgrifiad priodol o ddull y grŵp cynghori ar y strategaeth ar gyfer pobl hŷn. Gwnaeth ei argymhellion, er nad oeddwn i'n bresennol, a Brian a gadeiriodd y grŵp, ond nid wyf yn meddwl iddo ef orddylanwadu ar drafodaethau'r grŵp. O adnabod y rhanddeiliaid, yr wyf yn siŵr y bu ganddynt eu safbwyntiau eu hunain ac iddynt eu lleisio'n gryf yn ystod trafodaethau'r grŵp cynghori. Dyna sut y daeth y grŵp at ei gasgliadau pwylllog ac ystyriol. Ni roddaf sylw pellach ar ddadl dydd Iau diwethaf gan fod datganiad cryf Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru wedi tynnu llinell oddi tani.

Adeilad Newydd y Cynulliad (Cynnydd y Cynlluniau) New Assembly Building (Progress of Plans)

Q10 Jonathan Morgan: Will the First Minister make a statement on the current progress of plans to build the new Assembly building? (OAQ17719)

C10 Jonathan Morgan: A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar y cynnydd, hyd yma, o ran y cynlluniau i godi adeilad newydd y Cynulliad? (OAQ17719)

The First Minister: Schal International Management Ltd was the successful tenderer for the multi-disciplinary project management appointment and it was notified of its successful bid on 16 May.

Jonathan Morgan: The most recent estimated cost of the new Assembly building of which I am aware is around £40 million. This project has been delayed several times and the Assembly Government's announcement last week demonstrates again that the project will be delayed even further. Given these delays and the additional costs, what is now the estimated total cost of the new Assembly building?

The First Minister: I have no estimated cost of the new Assembly building. The figure of £40 million is not familiar to me. I will check it with the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities. However, I do not believe that any estimates have been announced recently. One reason for appointing Schal is that it can guide the Assembly towards obtaining a fixed price contract and further information. I am sure that the Conservatives would get that information if they wanted to join the project steering group. That invitation remains open to the Conservative group, but it likes to stay on the outside and then claim that it has heard these figures from somewhere. However, I do not recognise those figures.

Dafydd Wigley: Gobeithiaf y bydd y gwaith ar yr adeilad newydd yn symud ymlaen yn fuan. Mae'r twll du wrth ochr yr adeilad hwn yn gywilydd, yn enwedig gan fod gwaith ar Ganolfan Mileniwm Cymru yn mynd yn ei flaen. A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddod â chostau ger ein bron? Mae angen amcangyfrif o'r gost ychwanegol i'r Cynulliad ar ôl terfynu contract Richard Rogers a'r hyn y bydd y Cynulliad yn ei arbed o dan contract newydd.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae dau gam hollbwysig i'r broses o sefydlu contract adeiladu. Cyhoeddwyd y cam cyntaf yr wythnos diwethaf, sef apwyntio ymgynghorydd a fydd yn rheoli'r contract ar ein rhan, fel ein bod yn cael ein hamddiffyn

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Schal International Management Cyf oedd y tendrwr llwyddiannus am y swydd rheoli prosiect aml-ddisgyblaeth a chafodd wybod am lwyddiant ei gais ar 16 Mai.

Jonathan Morgan: Oddeutu £40 miliwn yw'r amcangyfrif diweddaraf y gwn i amdano o gost adeilad newydd y Cynulliad. Gohiriwyd y prosiect hwn sawl gwaith ac mae cyhoeddiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yr wythnos diwethaf yn dangos eto y bydd oedi ymhellach byth. Yn wyneb yr oedi hwn a'r costau ychwanegol, beth yn awr yw'r amcangyfrif o gyfanswm cost adeilad newydd y Cynulliad?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid oes gennyf amcangyfrif o gost adeilad newydd y Cynulliad. Nid yw'r ffigur £40 miliwn yn gyfarwydd i mi. Rhaid imi ei wirio gyda'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau. Fodd bynnag, ni chredaf fod unrhyw amcangyfrifon wedi'u cyhoeddi'n ddiweddar. Un rheswm dros benodi Schal yw y gall dywys y Cynulliad tuag at gael contract pris sefydlog a gwybodaeth bellach. Yr wyf yn siŵr y câi'r Ceidwadwyr y wybodaeth honno pe dymunent ymuno â grŵp llywio'r prosiect. Mae'r gwahoddiad hwnnw'n dal yn agored i'r grŵp Ceidwadol, ond mae'n well ganddo aros ar y tu allan ac wedyn honni ei fod wedi clywed y ffigurau hyn o rywle. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf fi'n adnabod y ffigurau hynny.

Dafydd Wigley: I hope that work on the new building will go ahead soon. The black hole at the side of this building is an embarrassment, particularly now that work on the Wales Millennium Centre is proceeding. Will the First Minister give us some costs? An estimate is needed of the additional cost to the Assembly following the termination of the Richard Rogers contract, and what the Assembly will save under a new contract.

The First Minister: There are two important steps in drawing up a construction contract. We announced the first step last week, with the appointment of the consultant who will manage the contract on our behalf, so that we are protected from any overexpenditure on

rhag unrhyw orwario ar y contract adeiladu. Hysbysebwr y contract adeiladu cyn bo hir ledled Ewrop yn y modd arferol, a disgwyliwn i'r contract gael ei osod ychydig cyn y Nadolig ac i'r contractwyr ddychwelyd i'r safle yn ystod chwarter cyntaf y flwyddyn nesaf. Disgwylir y bydd yr adeilad yn agor ar gyfer busnes yn chwarter cyntaf 2005.

the building contract. The building contract will soon be advertised throughout Europe in the usual manner, and we expect the contract to be draw up before Christmas and the contractors to return to the site during the first quarter of next year. We hope that the building will be open for business in the first quarter of 2005.

Dosbarthiad Rhanbarthol Eitemau yn y Gyllideb na Ellir eu Nodi **Regional Distribution of Non-identifiable Items**

Q11 Phil Williams: What discussions has the First Minister had with the Secretary of State for Wales to ensure that the regional distribution of the non-identifiable items on the budget are taken into account in all future spending reviews? (OAQ17727)

C11 Phil Williams: Pa drafodaethau y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi'u cael gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru i sicrhau bod ystyriaeth yn cael ei rhoi, ym mhob adolygiad o wariant yn y dyfodol, i ddsbarthiad rhanbarthol yr eitemau yn y gyllideb na ellir eu nodi? (OAQ17727)

The First Minister: I meet with the Secretary of State for Wales regularly, but, as far as I can remember, this subject has only arisen on one occasion. It is an important issue, but the largest component in terms of non-identifiable expenditure is defence expenditure. Wales fares poorly, relative to its population size of 5 per cent of the UK population. We only get 1 to 1.5 per cent of defence orders. We do not do so badly in terms of base expenditure because of the importance of the RAF and DARA plants such as Sealand in north-east Wales and St Athan, 20 miles west of here. There have been much more positive and significant trends recently. General Dynamics UK Ltd has set up its centre of excellence for digitisation on the site of the former coal mine at Oakdale through the Bowman contract. We are becoming known throughout the Ministry of Defence as a centre of excellence for digitisation. That is all the rage in terms of the setting of new technology defence contracts from now on.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Byddaf yn cyfarfod ag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru yn rheolaidd, ond, hyd y cofiaf, dim ond un waith y mae'r pwnc hwn wedi codi. Mae'n fater pwysig, ond gwariant amddiffyn yw'r gydran fwyaf o ran gwariant na ellir ei nodi. Mae Cymru'n dod allan ohoni'n wael mewn perthynas â maint ei phoblogaeth, sef 5 y cant o boblogaeth y DU. Dim ond rhyw 1 i 1.5 y cant o archebion amddiffyn a gawn ni. Nid ydym yn gwneud cyn waethed o ran gwariant sylfaenol oherwydd pwysigrwydd gweithfeydd yr RAF a DARA fel Sealand yn y Gogledd-ddwyrain a Sain Tathan, 20 milltir i'r gorllewin o'r fan yma. Bu tueddiadau llawer mwy cadarnhaol ac arwyddocaol yn ddiweddar. Mae General Dynamics UK Cyf wedi sefydlu'u canolfan ragoriaeth ar gyfer digideiddio ar safle'r hen bwl glo yn Oakdale drwy gcontract Bowman. Mae'r Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn gyfan yn dechrau dod i'n hadnabod fel canolfan ragoriaeth ar gyfer digideiddio. Dyna sy'n mynd â hi o ran gosod contractau amddiffyn technoleg newydd o hyn ymlaen.

Phil Williams: I am sure that the Secretary of State for Wales is aware that the shortfall in spending per head in Wales on defence contracts, but also on Government funded research and development and on the costs of Government itself, almost exactly balances any extra spending per head on items covered by the Barnett formula. Do you agree that to discuss the National Assembly's future

Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn siŵr fod Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru yn ymwybodol fod y diffyg mewn gwariant y pen yng Nghymru ar gcontractau amddiffyn, ond hefyd ar ymchwil a datblygu a ariennir gan y Llywodraeth ac ar gostau'r Llywodraeth ei hun, bron yn gwrthbwyso'n union unrhyw wariant y pen ychwanegol ar eitemau a ddaw dan fformiwla Barnett. A

budget without reference to the huge imbalance in the non-identifiables is unfair to Wales, and for politicians to quote spending per head, without including all Government spending, sells Wales short and is dishonest?

The First Minister: You refer to this question of a shortfall in defence expenditure. It is a difficult concept. That is how defence spending has developed in this country. There is a high concentration of bases in the south-east of England, the north-west of England and the south-west of England, from Salisbury Plain through to Plymouth and all the big defence contractors, such as BAE Systems and the Devonport dockyard. You cannot say that that is a shortfall of defence expenditure. You can try to put it right. We now have General Dynamics UK Ltd and the digitisation centres of excellence. Baroness Symons, who used to be a Minister of State in the Ministry of Defence but is now a Department of Trade and Industry Minister, was pleased to be shown around Cogent, an excellent Bowman sub-contractor in Newport, and likewise General Dynamics UK Ltd, although we did not have the opportunity to visit Oakdale on the day.

David Davies: There are many examples of non-identifiable spending, as Phil Williams said, such as defence spending, Government research, and Government buildings. Advertising is another example. The UK Government has spent millions of pounds on the services of advertising agencies in London. Will you congratulate your Cabinet because it spotted that tendency and has decided to compensate for the disparity and unfairness as regards advertising agencies in Wales by taking millions of pounds from public service budgets, such as education and health, and pouring it into the advertising agencies of Cardiff bay?

2:40 p.m.

The First Minister: Will you write to me about that matter, David, because I can see that you are extremely exercised about it?

gytunwch fod trafod cyllideb y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar gyfer y dyfodol heb gyfeirio at yr anghydbwysedd enfawr yn yr eitemau na ellir eu nodi yn annheg i Gymru, a bod i wleidyddion ddyfynnu gwariant y pen, heb gynnwys pob gwariant gan y Llywodraeth, yn annheg â Chymru ac yn anonest?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Cyfeiriwch at y cwestiwn hwn o ddiffyg gwario ar amddiffyn. Mae'n gysyniad anodd. Dyna'r ffordd y mae gwariant ar amddiffyn wedi datblygu yn y wlad hon. Ceir crynodiad uchel o ganolfannau yn ne-ddwyrain Lloegr, gogledd-orllewin Lloegr a de-orllewin Lloegr, o Salisbury Plain hyd at Plymouth a'r holl contractwyr amddiffyn mawr, fel BAE Systems a iard ddociau Devonport. Ni allwch ddweud bod hynny'n ddiffyg gwariant ar amddiffyn. Gallwch geisio'i gywiro. Yn awr mae gennym General Dynamics UK Cyf a'r canolfannau rhagoriaeth digideiddio. Yr oedd y Farwnes Symons, a arferai fod yn Weinidog Gwladol yn y Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn ond sydd bellach yn Weinidog yn yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant, yn falch o gael ei dangos o amgylch Cogent, is-gontractwr rhagorol i Bowman yng Nghasnewydd, a General Dynamics UK Cyf yn yr un modd, er na chawsom y cyfle i ymweld ag Oakdale ar y dydd.

David Davies: Y mae llawer o enghreifftiau o wariant na ellir ei nodi, fel y dywedodd Phil Williams, fel gwariant amddiffyn, ymchwil y Llywodraeth, ac adeiladau'r Llywodraeth. Mae hysbysebu'n enghraifft arall. Mae Llywodraeth y DU wedi gwario miliynau o bunnoedd ar wasanaethau asiantaethau hysbysebu yn Llundain. A wnewch chi longyfarch eich Cabinet oherwydd fe sylwodd ar y duedd honno a phenderfynodd wneud iawn am yr anghyfartaledd a'r annhegwch o safbwynt asiantaethau hysbysebu yng Nghymru drwy dynnu miliynau o bunnoedd o gyllidebau gwasanaeth cyhoeddus, fel addysg a iechyd, a'u harllwys i mewn i asiantaethau hysbysebu bae Caerdydd?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: A wnewch chi ysgrifennu ataf ynglŷn â'r mater hwnnw, David, oherwydd gallaf weld eich bod yn

However, I am not sure what you are talking about, although you will undoubtedly tell me.

The point about defence is important. Three quarters, if not more, of the total of non-identifiable expenditure, is spent on defence and foreign policy. It is difficult to ensure that that is parcelled out by region and make it appear that, if Wales receives 5 per cent of the total, 5 per cent of defence orders and 5 per cent of military bases go to Wales. You must locate your military bases and place your defence orders where it makes the most sense. There is a historical pattern, which we cannot do much about. When we can do something, as with General Dynamics UK Ltd, we are doing it.

poeni'n arw yn ei gylch? Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn siŵr beth yr ydych yn siarad amdano, ond mae'n siŵr y dywedwch wrthyf.

Mae'r pwynt am amddiffyn yn bwysig. Caiff tri chwarter, os nad mwy, o gyfanswm y gwariant na ellir ei nodi, ei wario ar amddiffyn a pholisi tramor. Mae'n anodd sicrhau y caiff ei ddsbarthu fesul rhanbarth a gwneud iddi ymddangos, os caiff Cymru 5 y cant o'r cyfanswm, yr aiff 5 y cant o archebion amddiffyn a 5 y cant o ganolfannau milwrol i Gymru. Rhaid ichi leoli eich canolfannau milwrol a gosod eich archebion amddiffyn yn y man lle mae'n gwneud mwyaf o synnwyr. Mae yma batrwm hanesyddol, na allwn wneud llawer amdano. Pan allwn wneud rhywbeth, fel gyda General Dynamics UK Ltd, fe'i gwnawn.

Hyrwyddo Materion Trawsbynciol Promoting Cross-cutting Themes

C12 Glyn Davies: A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar sut mae ei Lywodraeth yn hyrwyddo materion trawsbynciol? (OAQ17731)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yn rhinwedd fy rôl fel cydlynnydd materion trawsbynciol, yr wyf fi'n sicrhau bod y tair thema ffurfiol sef cynhwysiant cymdeithasol, datblygu cynaliadwy, a chyfle cyfartal yn cael eu hyrwyddo yn ein holl bolisïau.

Glyn Davies: A gredwch y dylai hyrwyddo'r Gymraeg fod yn fater trawsbynciol hefyd?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: I raddau helaeth, y mae. Mae'r rhwydwaith o bolisïau sydd yn ymwneud â phlant, o ran eu hiechyd, eu haddysg, eu hiaith, eu dyfodol a'u treftadaeth, ynghyd â pha ran y bydd plant yn chwarae yn ein dyfodol, yn hollbwysig i'r Cabinet a'n polisïau. Wedi'r cyfan, plant yw ein dyfodol.

John Griffiths: In promoting cross-cutting issues, do you agree that we should recognise examples of good practice in education? Hartridge High School, in my constituency, is an example. It is situated in one of the 100 most deprived wards in Wales, as classified

Q12 Glyn Davies: Will the First Minister make a statement on how his Government promotes cross-cutting issues? (OAQ17731)

The First Minister: In my role as co-ordinator of cross-cutting issues, I ensure that the three formal cross-cutting themes of social inclusion, sustainable development and equality of opportunity are promoted across all of our policies.

Glyn Davies: Do you believe that promoting the Welsh language should also be a cross-cutting issue?

The First Minister: It is, to a large extent. The network of policies involving children, in terms of their health, their education, their language, their future, their heritage, as well as the role that children will play in our future, is important to the Cabinet and its policies. After all, children are our future.

John Griffiths: Wrth hyrwyddo materion trawsbynciol, a gytunwch y dylem gydnabod enghreifftiau o arfer da mewn addysg? Mae Ysgol Uwchradd Hartridge, yn f'etholaeth i, yn enghraifft. Mae wedi'i lleoli yn un o'r 100 ward fwyaf difreintiedig yng Nghymru, fel

for Communities First purposes. It has a football academy, which makes cross-cutting links between education, sport and social inclusion. Last week, the school's under 19s team became the first Welsh side to win the English Schools Football Association Under 19s Individual School Cup in the competition's 40-year history. They came back from two goals down to win by three goals to two at Liverpool's Anfield ground.

The First Minister: I must compliment Hartridge High School. That is an outstanding sporting achievement. I compliment the school's structure and its close links with Newport County Football Club, and with Newport Rugby Club, which gives the school a multi-sport basis. That is proving attractive to help children who might otherwise have left early without qualifications to stay on at school. I also remind you that, 40 years ago, when the Charles and Allchurch brothers were youngsters, Swansea schools used to win the Football Association Youth Cup every year. They did so for six years on the trot and mostly beat Manchester United youth team.

Y Llywydd: Diolch i'r Prif Weinidog am ei atgofion.

Datganiad ar Fframwaith Gwasanaeth Cenedlaethol Clefyd Coronaidd y Galon Statement on the Coronary Heart Disease National Service Framework

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): As you are aware, I launched the coronary heart disease national service framework, 'Tackling Coronary Heart Disease in Wales: Implementing Through Evidence' in the Assembly in July last year. This is an update on its progress.

Heart disease is the major cause of death in Wales, resulting in between 7,500 to 8,000 deaths each year with around 20 per cent of the adult population requiring treatment. Many more are at risk. Therefore, tackling coronary heart disease remains one of the Welsh Assembly Government's top priorities. As the biggest killer it is being

y'u nodir i ddibenion Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf. Mae ganddi academi bêl-droed, sy'n gwneud cysylltiadau trawsbynciol rhwng addysg, chwaraeon a chynhwysiant cymdeithasol. Yr wythnos diwethaf, tîm dan-19 yr ysgol oedd y tîm cyntaf o Gymru i ennill Cwpan Ysgolion Unigol Dan 19 Cymdeithas Bêl-droed Ysgolion Lloegr yn hanes 40 mlynedd y gystadleuaeth. Daethant yn ôl o ddwy gôl i lawr i ennill o dair gôl i ddwy ar faes Anfield yn Lerpwl.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Rhaid imi longyfarch Ysgol Uwchradd Hartridge. Dyna gamp arbennig ym myd chwaraeon. Cymeradwyaf strwythur yr ysgol a'i chysylltiadau agos â Chlwb Pêl-droed Sir Casnewydd, ac â Chlwb Rygbi Casnewydd, sy'n rhoi sylfaen aml-chwaraeon i'r ysgol. Mae hynny'n profi'n atyniad i helpu plant a fuasai fel arall efallai wedi gadael yn gynnar heb gymwysterau, i aros ymlaen yn yr ysgol. Fe'ch atgoffaf hefyd yr arferai ysgolion Abertawe, 40 mlynedd yn ôl, pan oedd y brodyr Charles ac Allchurch yn blant, ennill Cwpan Ieuencid y Gymdeithas Bêl-droed bob blwyddyn. Gwnaethant hynny am chwe blynedd o'r bron gan guro tîm ieuencid Manchester United gan amlaf.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, First Minister, for your reminiscences.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Fel y gwyddoch, fe lansiais y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer clefyd coronaidd y galon, 'Trechu Clefyd Coronaidd y Galon yng Nghymru: Cynllun Cyflawni Drwy Dystiolaeth' yn y Cynulliad ym mis Gorffennaf y llynedd. Dyma'r newyddion diweddaraf ar gynnydd y fframwaith.

Clefyd y galon yw prif achos marwolaeth yng Nghymru, gan achosi rhwng 7,500 ac 8,000 o farwolaethau bob blwyddyn a pheri bod angen triniaeth ar ryw 20 y cant o'r boblogaeth oedolion. Mae risg i lawer mwy. Felly, mae mynd i'r afael â chlefyd coronaidd y galon yn dal i fod yn un o flaenoriaethau pennaf Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Fel y

tackled from all angles, from prevention and managing those at risk through to diagnosis, treatment and finally rehabilitation. The coronary heart disease national service framework is being implemented across Wales and is the key to driving up standards and improving the quality and availability of services for the population of Wales. A substantial amount of investment is going into supporting the progressive implementation of the NSF from both central Government and health authorities.

During a recent visit to Morriston Hospital's cardiac unit, I was pleased to announce that the Welsh Assembly Government's target of reducing waiting times for heart surgery to no longer than 12 months was met by March 2002. As a measure of my commitment, I made £2 million available in 2001-02 to achieve the target, and, to ensure that it is maintained, capacity is being increased at Morriston Hospital and the University Hospital of Wales to carry out additional heart operations in the current financial year.

A key national service framework milestone for 2002-03 is to bring down waiting times for angiography, which is a diagnostic test for heart disease, to no longer than six months by next March. I am pleased to announce that I am making an additional £900,000 available to the Specialised Health Services Commission for Wales to ensure delivery of both coronary heart disease waiting times targets. We will need to look carefully at the strategic development of angiography services across Wales and at the role of district general hospitals in that provision. This is clear and tangible evidence of my commitment to reducing waiting times for the diagnosis and treatment of those with coronary heart disease in Wales.

Last year, £3 million in capital funding was made available to improve equipment and facilities for diagnosing and treating coronary heart disease and cancer. Two significant projects funded from this were a new coronary care unit at Nevill Hall Hospital and a new cardiology day unit at the University Hospital of Wales. This year, that funding will be increased to £5 million.

lladdwr mwyaf, ceisir ymdrin ag ef o bob ongl, o atal a rheoli'r rhai sydd mewn perygl i ddiagnosis, triniaeth ac, yn olaf, ymadferiad. Caiff y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer clefyd coronaidd y galon ei weithredu ar draws Cymru a dyma'r allwedd i godi safonau a gwella ansawdd gwasanaethau a sicrhau eu bod ar gael i boblogaeth Cymru. Buddsoddir swm sylweddol i gefnogi gweithrediad cynyddol y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol gan y Llywodraeth ganolog ac awdurdodau iechyd.

Yn ystod ymweliad diweddar ag uned y galon yn Ysbyty Treforys, yr oeddwn yn falch o gyhoeddi bod targed Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o leihau amserau aros am lawdriniaeth y galon i ddim mwy na 12 mis wedi'i gyrraedd erbyn Mawrth 2002. Fel mesur o'm hymrwymiad, sicrheais fod £2 filiwn ar gael yn 2001-02 i gyrraedd y targed, ac, er mwyn sicrhau y caiff ei gynnal, cynyddir y capasiti yn Ysbyty Treforys ac Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru i wneud llawdriniaethau calon ychwanegol yn y flwyddyn ariannol gyfredol.

Carreg filltir allweddol yn y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer 2002-03 yw gostwng amserau aros am angiograffeg, sef prawf diagnostig am glefyd y galon, i ddim mwy na chwe mis erbyn mis Mawrth nesaf. Mae'n dda gennyf gyhoeddi fy mod yn darparu £900,000 yn ychwanegol i Gomisiwn Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol Cymru i sicrhau y cyrhaeddir y ddau darged o ran amserau aros i rai â chlefyd coronaidd y galon. Bydd angen inni edrych yn ofalus ar ddatblygiad strategol gwasanaethau angiograffeg ledled Cymru ac ar rôl ysbytai cyffredinol dosbarth yn y ddarpariaeth honno. Mae hyn yn dystiolaeth glir a chadarn o f'ymrwymiad i leihau amserau aros am ddiagnosis a thriniaeth i rai â chlefyd coronaidd y galon yng Nghymru.

Y llynedd, darparwyd £3 miliwn mewn arian cyfalaf i wella offer a chyfleusterau ar gyfer canfod a thrin clefyd coronaidd y galon a chanser. Dau brosiect arwyddocaol a ariannwyd o hyn oedd uned gofal coronaidd newydd yn Ysbyty Nevill Hall ac uned gardioleg ddydd newydd yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru. Eleni, cynyddir y cyllid hwnnw i £5 miliwn.

The implementation of the national service framework is being reinforced further by our inequalities in health fund, which is being geared entirely to the prevention of heart disease. The fund has been particularly successful in its aim of stimulating and supporting new local action to address inequalities in health and the factors that cause them, including inequities in access to health services. I expect the £10.5 million being made available through the new opportunities fund to be targeted directly at supporting the national service framework's implementation and at improving prevention, diagnosis, treatment and rehabilitation of people suffering and at risk from coronary heart disease.

Three clinical networks for coronary heart disease services are now being developed to ensure that all those involved in the care of those with, or at risk from, this disease work together efficiently and effectively to deliver high quality services to the standards set out in the national service framework. Networks will be required to produce local service development plans. These plans will build upon those developed by health authorities last year and will demonstrate the action being taken, in the short and long term, to meet the national service framework milestones, analyse and address the workforce and financial implications and provide a means of monitoring and performance managing progress.

At a national level, we are establishing an all-Wales multidisciplinary group to oversee and co-ordinate activity, and this will be in place by the end of this year. In the meantime, in recognition of the need to develop the three networks, we have established an interim coronary heart disease services co-ordinating group, and announced the appointment of a dedicated national service framework programme co-ordinator. There will be direct clinical input at both network and national level, and we will also appoint a director of coronary heart disease services who will support the professional advice in the strategic development of these services.

Atgyfnerthir gweithrediad y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ymhellach drwy'n cronfa anghydraddoldebau iechyd, sy'n cael ei chyfeirio'n llwyr at atal clefyd y galon. Bu'r gronfa'n arbennig o lwyddiannus yn ei nod o ysgogi a chefnogi gweithredu lleol newydd i fynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau ym maes iechyd a'r ffactorau sy'n eu hachosi, gan gynnwys anghydraddoldeb mynediad at wasanaethau iechyd. Disgwyliaf i'r £10.5 miliwn a ddarperir drwy'r gronfa cyfleoedd newydd gael ei dargedu'n uniongyrchol at gefnogi gweithrediad y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ac at wella mesurau atal, canfod, trin ac ymadfer i bobl sy'n dioddef ac mewn perygl o ddioddef clefyd coronaidd y galon.

Mae tri rhwydwaith clinigol ar gyfer gwasanaethau clefyd coronaidd y galon yn cael eu datblygu'n awr i sicrhau bod pawb sy'n ymwneud â gofalu am rai sy'n dioddef neu mewn perygl o ddioddef y clefyd hwn yn cydweithio'n effeithlon ac effeithiol i ddarparu gwasanaethau o ansawdd uchel yn unol â'r safonau a amlinellir yn y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol. Bydd angen i rwydweithiau lunio cynlluniau datblygu gwasanaethau lleol. Bydd y cynlluniau hyn yn adeiladu ar y rhai a ddatblygwyd gan awdurdodau iechyd y llynedd ac yn dangos yr hyn sy'n cael ei wneud, yn y tymor byr a hir, i gyrraedd cerrig milltir y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol, dadansoddi a mynd i'r afael â'r goblygiadau ariannol ac o safbwynt gweithlu, a darparu modd o fonitro a rheoli perfformiad y cynnydd a wneir.

Ar lefel genedlaethol, yr ydym yn sefydlu grŵp aml-ddisgyblaeth dros Gymru gyfan i oruchwylio a chydgysylltu gweithgaredd, a bydd hwn yn ei le erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn. Yn y cyfamser, gan gydnabod yr angen i ddatblygu'r tri rhwydwaith, yr ydym wedi sefydlu grŵp cydgysylltu gwasanaethau clefyd coronaidd y galon dros-dro, ac wedi cyhoeddi penodiad cydgysylltydd rhaglenni'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol. Bydd mewnbyn clinigol uniongyrchol ar lefel rhwydwaith a chenedlaethol, a byddwn hefyd yn penodi cyfarwyddwr gwasanaethau clefyd coronaidd y galon a fydd yn cefnogi'r cyngor proffesiynol yn natblygiad strategol y gwasanaethau hyn.

As Members may know, I recently visited the North Karelia area of Finland, which, like Wales, is in receipt of Objective 1 funding. The aim of the project funded was to reduce the exceptionally high death rate from heart disease. As a result, by 1995, the annual death rate from heart disease among people of working age had fallen by 75 per cent, compared with that before the project. A remarkable decline has taken place in smoking among men, there have been major changes in people's diets and cholesterol and blood pressure levels have fallen.

We are also supporting national heart week by holding an awareness-raising event in Cardiff bay on 13 June, in partnership with the British Heart Foundation, the British Cardiac Patients Association and Fitness Wales. The focus will be on the prevention of heart disease and the need to reduce health inequalities in this area. The event will also be the occasion to announce the results of the health screening of Assembly Members and their staff, undertaken in June last year.

Our strategy for tackling heart disease is long term. There has been progress but there is a lot more work to be done. We must ensure that we tackle the causes of heart disease and that the services and treatments are readily available for those who need them. What I have said today demonstrates that this is what we are doing, and I remain fully committed to continuing these efforts in working towards attaining high standards and improving outcomes for patients.

2:50 p.m.

David Lloyd: I declare my usual interest as a general practitioner. The huge impact of heart disease is obvious to us all, with 19 per cent more heart disease deaths in Wales than in England. Alarming, service development and funding for treating heart disease in Wales lags behind other countries. The coronary heart disease national service framework is welcome: I welcomed it last year when it first appeared. However, any

Fel y gŵyr Aelodau efallai, ymwelais yn ddiweddar ag ardal Gogledd Karelia yn y Ffindir, sydd, fel Cymru, yn derbyn arian Amcan 1. Nod y prosiect a ariennid oedd lleihau'r gyfradd farwolaethau eithriadol o uchel o glefyd y galon. O ganlyniad, erbyn 1995, yr oedd cyfradd flynyddol marwolaethau o glefyd y galon ymysg pobl o oed gweithio wedi cwmpo 75 y cant, o'i gymharu â'r gyfradd cyn y prosiect. Bu lleihad hynod mewn ysmegu ymhlith dynion, bu newidiadau mawr yn arferion bwyta pobl ac mae lefelau colesterol a phwysau gwaed wedi cwmpo.

Yr ydym hefyd yn cefnogi wythnos genedlaethol y galon drwy gynnal digwyddiad codi ymwybyddiaeth ym mae Caerdydd ar 13 Mehefin, mewn partneriaeth â Sefydliad Prydeinig y Galon, Cymdeithas Cleifion Cardiac Prydain a Ffitrwydd Cymru. Canolbwyntir ar atal clefyd y galon a'r angen i leihau anghydraddoldebau iechyd yn y maes hwn. Y digwyddiad hwn fydd yr achlysur hefyd lle cyhoeddir canlyniadau sgrinio iechyd Aelodau'r Cynulliad a'u staff, a wnaethpwyd ym Mehefin y llynedd.

Strategaeth hirdymor sydd gennym ar gyfer mynd i'r afael â chlefyd y galon. Gwnaethpwyd cynnydd ond mae llawer mwy o waith i'w wneud. Rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn mynd i'r afael ag achosion clefyd y galon a bod y gwasanaethau a'r triniaethau ar gael yn rhwydd i'r sawl sydd eu hangen. Mae'r hyn yr wyf wedi'i ddweud heddiw yn dangos mai dyma beth yr ydym yn ei wneud, ac yr wyf yn dal yn gwbl ymrwymedig i barhau gyda'r ymdrechion hyn i weithio tuag at sicrhau safonau uchel a gwella canlyniadau i gleifion.

David Lloyd: Datganaf fy muddiant arferol fel meddyg teulu. Mae effaith anferth clefyd y galon yn amlwg inni i gyd, gyda 19 y cant yn fwy o farwolaethau o glefyd y galon yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr. Yn frawychus, mae datblygiad gwasanaethau a chyllid ar gyfer trin clefyd y galon yng Nghymru yn llusgo ar ôl gwledydd eraill. Mae'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer clefyd coronaidd y galon i'w groesawu: fe'i

framework needs substantial resources to realise it. In that context, some questions arise today. The first concerns smoking as regards prevention of heart disease. Smoking is a major cause of ischaemic heart disease. Will the Minister give us the latest figures on smoking rates in Wales? Are they going down as a result of this recent input?

How much extra money will be earmarked in today's announcement for additional ambulances and staff to improve ambulance response times, particularly in rural areas? A key target in this framework is the pain to needle time, dependant on ambulance response times, especially in rural areas.

I also want to discuss additional resourcing for the drugs outlined in this framework. The cholesterol lowering drugs, statins, if given to all those who justify their use in Wales, would cost an additional £200 to £300 million in Wales alone. That is the extent of our present drug budget. Of course 80 per cent of people who at present need statins would not need them if they stopped smoking.

On primary care, what flexibilities do GP practices have to employ more data inputting staff, which is an inherent part of this national service framework? Most pressure in the coronary heart disease national service framework is on secondary care, as we have heard over the last few days. Will the Minister outline how much money is allocated and what she is doing to increase the number of angiography centres throughout Wales? What is the Minister's latest assessment of the number of additional full time cardiologists needed in Wales to fulfil the obligation of this coronary heart disease national service framework?

Jane Hutt: On your first question about smoking, you will know that we are investing £2 million in our smoking cessation schemes. A great deal of that is

croesewais y llynedd pan ymddangosodd gyntaf. Fodd bynnag, mae ar unrhyw fframwaith angen adnoddau sylweddol i'w wireddu. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, cyfyd rhai cwestiynau heddiw. Mae a wnelo'r cyntaf ag ysmegu o safbwynt atal clefyd y galon. Mae ysmegu'n brif ffactor sy'n achosi diwaeddedd y galon. A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r ffigurau diweddaraf inni ar gyfraddau ysmegu yng Nghymru? A ydynt yn mynd i lawr o ganlyniad i'r mewnbwn diweddar hwn?

Faint o arian ychwanegol a glustnodir yng nghyhoeddiad heddiw ar gyfer ambiwlansiau a staff ychwanegol i wella amserau ymateb ambiwlansiau, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd gwledig? Targed allweddol yn y fframwaith hwn yw'r amser o'r boen i'r nodwydd, sy'n dibynnu ar amserau ymateb ambiwlansiau, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd gwledig.

Mae arnaf eisiau trafod sicrhau adnoddau ychwanegol ar gyfer y cyffuriau a amlinellir yn y fframwaith hwn hefyd. Byddai'r cyffuriau gostwng colesterol, statinau, pe rhoddid hwy i bawb sy'n cyfiawnhau eu defnyddio yng Nghymru, yn costio £200 i £300 miliwn ychwanegol yng Nghymru'n unig. Dyna hyd a lled ein cyllideb gyffuriau bresennol. Wrth gwrs, ni fyddai ar 80 y cant o'r bobl sydd angen statinau ar hyn o bryd eu hangen pe rhoddent y gorau i ysmegu.

Ynghylch gofal sylfaenol, pa hyblygrwydd sydd gan bractisau meddygon teulu i gyflogi mwy o staff cofnodi data, sy'n rhan annatod o'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol? Ar ofal eilaidd y mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r pwysau yn fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol clefyd coronaidd y galon, fel y clywsom dros yr ychydig ddyddiau diwethaf. A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu faint o arian sydd wedi'i ddyrannu a beth y mae hi'n ei wneud i gynyddu nifer y canolfannau angiograffeg drwy Gymru? Beth yw asesiad diweddaraf y Gweinidog o'r nifer o gardiolegwyr llawn-amser ychwanegol sydd eu hangen yng Nghymru i gyflawni dyletswydd y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol hwn ar gyfer clefyd coronaidd y galon?

Jane Hutt: Ar eich cwestiwn cyntaf ynglŷn ag ysmegu, fe wyddoch ein bod yn buddsoddi £2 filiwn yn ein cynlluniau rhoi'r gorau i ysmegu. Mae llawer iawn o hynny wedi'i

targeted at our young people and our most disadvantaged communities where smoking rates are high. We know from the Chief Medical Officer's most recent report that we are seeing encouraging reductions in the smoking levels of our young people. Our free helpline has been successful for young people and adults who want to quit smoking and in February this year, 1,000 young people called that line because they were influenced by the media advertising that we have been promoting, which shows the dangers of smoking to young people. We know that the focus of our health inequalities fund across Wales is targeting the issues that encourage people to develop healthy lifestyles. That was one of the key campaigns in North Karelia in Finland.

In terms of ambulance services, you know that the Assembly has invested £3.6 million capital into the ambulance trust as a result of the capital renewal programmes last autumn. A great deal of that money has been invested in new equipment and rapid response vehicles. When I recently opened the new ambulance station at Merthyr Tydfil, the British Heart Foundation's presence was welcome. It is working with the ambulance trust and other emergency services to provide defibrillators to ensure that there is a team approach in terms of prevention of heart disease and being there with the right equipment and drugs to tackle it. In terms of our investment into our national service framework and into coronary care services in Wales, I have announced £900,000 additional money today to help the Specialist Health Services Commission for Wales reach the goal of no-one having to wait for more than six months for that all-important diagnostic test, the angiogram, and to ensure that it works across the board with our tertiary centres at the University Hospital of Wales, Morriston Hospital and the Manchester Royal Infirmary, and with district general hospitals, so that the most appropriate investment is made in an attempt to achieve that important target.

A new cardiology day unit at the University Hospital of Wales, which will be completed later this year, will have a substantial impact

dargeddu at ein pobl ifanc a'n cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig lle mae cyfraddau ysmegu'n uchel. Gwyddom oddi wrth adroddiad diweddaraf y Prif Swyddog Meddygol ein bod yn gweld gostyngiadau calonogol yn lefelau ysmegu ein pobl ifanc. Mae ein llinell gymorth rad ac am ddim wedi bod yn llwyddiannus i bobl ifanc ac oedolion sydd eisiau rhoi'r gorau i ysmegu, ac ym mis Chwefror eleni, galwodd 1,000 o bobl ifanc y llinell honno oherwydd y dylanwadwyd arnynt gan yr hysbysebion ar y cyfryngau a hyrwyddwyd gennym, sy'n dangos peryglon ysmegu i bobl ifanc. Gwyddom mai nod ein cronfa anghydraddoldebau iechyd ar draws Cymru yw targedu'r materion sy'n annog pobl i ddatblygu ffyrdd iach o fyw. Dyna oedd un o'r ymgyrchoedd allweddol yng Ngogledd Karelia yn y Ffindir.

O ran y gwasanaethau ambiwlans, gwyddoch fod y Cynulliad wedi buddsoddi cyfalaf o £3.6 miliwn yn yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans o ganlyniad i'r rhaglen adnewyddu cyfalaf yr hydref diwethaf. Buddsoddwyd llawer iawn o'r arian hwnnw mewn offer newydd a cherbydau ymateb cyflym. Pan agorais yr orsaf ambiwlansiau newydd yn ddiweddar ym Merthyr Tudful, da oedd gweld presenoldeb Sefydliad Prydeinig y Galon. Mae'n gweithio gyda'r ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans a gwasanaethau argyfwng eraill i ddarparu diffibrilwyr i sicrhau agwedd tîm tuag at atal clefyd y galon, a bod yno gyda'r offer a'r cyffuriau cywir i fynd i'r afael ag ef. O safbwynt ein buddsoddiad yn ein fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ac mewn gwasanaethau gofal coronaidd yng Nghymru, yr wyf wedi cyhoeddi £900,000 o arian ychwanegol heddiw i helpu Comisiwn Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbennig Cymru i gyrraedd y nod o sicrhau nad oes raid i neb aros am fwy na chwe mis am y prawf diagnostig hollbwysig hwnnw, yr angiogram, a sicrhau ei fod yn gweithio ar draws y bwrdd gyda'n canolfannau trydyddol yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru, Ysbyty Treforys ac Ysbyty Brenhinol Manceinion, a chyda'r ysbytai cyffredinol dosbarth, fel y gwneir y buddsoddiad mwyaf priodol mewn ymgais i gyrraedd y targed pwysig hwnnw.

Caiff uned gardioleg ddydd newydd yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru, a gwblheir yn ddiweddarach eleni, effaith sylweddol ar y

on the ability to access and increase throughput in terms of angiography. The extra £5 million in capital will allow 600 more operations to be undertaken at Morriston Hospital and the University Hospital of Wales. This is in line with the milestone set for the coronary heart disease national service framework. The primary care action plan will help steer the way forward in terms of supporting GPs. In terms of drugs, and the uptake of important new drugs available to tackle coronary heart disease, we spent £94 million on drugs last year, which is £10 million more than the previous year. We have identified that almost a third of that money was required for drugs to tackle cardiovascular disease. The increase in drugs spending is already coming through. In terms of the national service framework's five standards, the primary care sector has a key role to play and is actively involved in the health inequalities fund.

Finally, this year, for the first time ever, our workforce planning has been based on need and the national service framework. We have 19 specialist cardiology registrars and will have 11 specialist cardiothoracic registrars. We need to ensure that those specialist registrars stay in Wales and that we achieve our workforce plans.

Christine Chapman: While I welcome the programmes you announced last year for my constituency to develop better lifestyles and to reduce the problems of heart disease, do you agree that smoking must be tackled aggressively? The older generation, which was perhaps the victim of ruthless tobacco advertising, possibly in the 1940s, is now suffering the consequences of chronic ill-health. I am pleased that you mentioned the younger generation, as it is a possible target. However, I am concerned about the older generation, as it is now suffering.

I am interested in your visit to Finland, and I commend you. What assurances can you give that, like the North Karelia region, we will keep up the pressure to encourage people to give up smoking? Will you ensure that most support is targeted towards our

gallu i gael mynediad at angiograffeg a chynnyddu'r nifer sy'n manteisio ar y gwasanaeth. Bydd y £5 miliwn ychwanegol o gyfalaf yn caniatáu gwneud 600 yn fwy o lawdriniaethau yn Ysbyty Treforys ac Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru. Mae hyn yn unol â'r garreg filltir a bennwyd ar gyfer fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol clefyd coronaidd y galon. Bydd y cynllun gweithredu gofal sylfaenol yn helpu i lywio'r ffordd ymlaen o ran cefnogi meddygon teulu. O ran cyffuriau, a derbyniad y cyffuriau newydd pwysig sydd ar gael i drin clefyd coronaidd y galon, gwariasom £94 miliwn ar gyffuriau y llynedd, sef £10 miliwn yn fwy na'r flwyddyn gynt. Yr ydym wedi nodi bod angen bron i draean o'r arian hwnnw ar gyfer cyffuriau i drin afiechyd cardiofasgwlaidd. Mae'r cynnydd mewn gwariant ar gyffuriau eisoes yn dod drwodd. O ran pum safon y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol, mae gan y sector gofal sylfaenol rôl allweddol i'w chwarae ac mae'n ymwneud yn weithredol â'r gronfa anghydraddoldebau iechyd.

Yn olaf, eleni, am y tro cyntaf, yr ydym wedi cynllunio'n gweithlu ar sail angen a'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol. Mae gennym 19 cofrestrydd cardioleg arbenigol a bydd gennym 11 cofrestrydd cardiothorasig arbenigol. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod y cofrestryddion arbenigol hynny'n aros yng Nghymru a'n bod yn cyflawni'n cynlluniau gweithlu.

Christine Chapman: Er fy mod yn croesawu'r rhaglenni a gyhoeddwyd gennych y llynedd i fy etholaeth i ddatblygu gwell ffyrdd o fyw a lleihau problemau clefyd y galon, a gytunwch fod yn rhaid ymladd yn galed yn erbyn ysmegu? Mae'r genhedlaeth hŷn, a oedd efallai'n ysglyfaeth i hysbysebu didostur ar dybaco, o bosibl yn y 1940au, erbyn hyn yn dioddef canlyniadau afiechyd cronig. Yr wyf yn falch ichi grybwyll y to iau, gan eu bod hwy'n darged bosibl. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn bryderus am y to hŷn, gan mai hwy sydd yn dioddef yn awr.

Mae gennyf ddiddordeb yn eich ymweliad â'r Ffindir, ac fe'ch cymeradwyaf. Pa sicrwydd allwch chi ei roi y gwnawn ni, fel rhanbarth Gogledd Karelia, ddal i bwysu i annog pobl i roi'r gorau i ysmegu? A wnewch chi sicrhau y targedir y cymorth mwyaf at ein cymunedau

most deprived and poorest communities, such as those within Rhondda Cynon Taff, where smoking rates are the highest in Wales?

Jane Hutt: I am sure that many Members would agree that the UK Government's ban on tobacco advertising is welcome and will have a huge impact, even though it is long overdue. We can learn from local projects to encourage people to stop smoking the most effective way of getting the message across. Targeting young people, raising awareness about the effects of smoking on health and physical appearance, and encouraging them to give up, paid dividends, as a large number of young people responded. For the younger generation, there are smokebugs clubs, smoke-free classrooms and tobacco action groups in schools. We must acknowledge, even though it is invisible, the tremendous work being undertaken in schools and communities, which is now linked to the health inequalities fund.

It took 30 years to achieve the 75 per cent reduction in the death rate from heart disease in North Karelia. It involved a reduction in smoking as well as a change of diet and lifestyle. This cultural change took some time to achieve. There are lessons that we can learn and follow in terms of how to prevent heart disease. We can start with our children, by selling fruit and milk in tuck shops instead of pop and crisps. Our Government's free milk policy also benefits children.

We are making a difference, but it is critical to concentrate our health inequalities fund on those communities with the worst level of heart disease, while recognising that they need access to treatment as well as prevention and smoking cessation messages.

3:00 p.m.

David Melding: Minister, when you launched the national service framework last July, you delayed two key targets. One was the original target of providing cardiac bypass surgery within three months by 2005. However, you then launched a new target for that to be met by 2007. I criticised that at the

total a mwyaf difreintiedig, fel y rheini yn Rhondda Cynon Taf, lle mae'r cyfraddau ysmegu yr uchaf yng Nghymru?

Jane Hutt: Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunai llawer o Aelodau fod gwaharddiad Llywodraeth y DU ar hysbysebu tybaco i'w groesawu ac y caiff effaith aruthrol, er mor hir-ddisgwyliedig. Gallwn ddysgu oddi wrth brosiectau lleol i annog pobl i roi'r gorau i ysmegu beth yw'r ffordd fwyaf effeithiol o drosglwyddo'r neges. Targedwyd pobl ifanc, gan godi ymwybyddiaeth am effeithiau ysmegu ar iechyd a golwg gorfforol, a'u hannog i roi'r gorau iddi, ac fe dalodd hynny ar ei ganfed, gan i lawer o bobl ifanc ymateb. I'r genhedlaeth iau, ceir clybiau bygiau baco, ystafelloedd dosbarth di-fwg a grwpiau gweithredu ar dybaco mewn ysgolion. Rhaid inni gydnabod, er na ellir ei weld, y gwaith gwych sy'n cael ei wneud mewn ysgolion a chymunedau, sydd bellach wedi'i gysylltu â'r gronfa anghydraddoldebau iechyd.

Cymerodd 30 mlynedd i gyrraedd y 75 y cant o leihad yn y gyfradd farwolaethau o glefyd y galon yng Ngogledd Karelia. Golygodd gwtogi ar ysmegu yn ogystal â newid arferion bwyta a ffordd o fyw. Cymerodd y newid diwylliannol hwn beth amser i'w gyflawni. Mae gwersi y gallwn eu dysgu a'u dilyn o ran sut i atal clefyd y galon. Gallwn ddechrau gyda'n plant, drwy werthu ffrwythau a llaeth mewn siopau ysgol yn lle pop a chreision. Mae polisi llaeth am ddim ein Llywodraeth yn llesol i blant hefyd.

Yr ydym yn gwneud gwahaniaeth, ond mae'n hollbwysig canolbwyntio'n cronfa anghydraddoldebau iechyd ar y cymunedau hynny lle ceir y lefel waethaf o glefyd y galon, gan gydnabod fod arnynt angen mynediad at driniaeth yn ogystal â negeseuon atal a rhoi'r gorau i ysmegu.

David Melding: Weinidog, pan fu ichi lansio'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol fis Gorffennaf diwethaf, bu ichi oedi ar ddau darged allweddol. Un oedd y targed gwreiddiol o ddarparu llawdriniaeth ddargyfeiriol i'r galon o fewn tri mis erbyn 2005. Fodd bynnag, wedyn bu ichi lansio

time and I repeat my criticism now. The greatest weakness in your strategy is that, in Wales, the clock for waiting times starts when a patient sees a consultant, but in England, it starts when a patient first visits a general practitioner. When Wales eventually works toward the three-month target for bypass surgery, that target will be absolute in England; it will either have been met or not. There will no wriggling away. Patients either wait a maximum of three months or they do not. In Wales, you could claim that that target is met, despite patients waiting six months before even seeing a consultant—their three-month waiting time clock will not have started ticking. When will you address this discrepancy, and when will we have the same measures as in England? We need such measures to hold you to account.

Secondly, you must address the issue of more staff. The service has told you this week that it needs twice as many cardiologists. What is your response? Is that what it will take in the medium-term to implement such a strategy? We need to have numbers soon, because the health service in England and Scotland is recruiting staff, and we fear that we may be slipping behind. We also need more than the odd £900,000 for new equipment. We need an extensive policy so that people are not kept waiting for diagnostic tests, but have them quickly. The service is pressing you for a response.

Finally, we need to get real about smoking cessation. We all agree that we need to do more; it is probably the policy with the greatest impact on improving public health. In England, each health authority must come up with a policy for smoking cessation, and must promote smoking cessation clinics in the primary sector. Is that our policy? I do not know. You are targeting different things. When can we tell GPs that they must hold smoking cessation clinics as a matter of routine?

Jane Hutt: All staff working at the sharp end of the service are pleased that tackling heart

targed newydd i gyrraedd y nod hwnnw erbyn 2007. Beirniadais hynny ar y pryd ac ailadroddaf fy meirniadaeth yn awr. Y gwendid mwyaf yn eich strategaeth yw bod y cloc amser aros yng Nghymru'n cychwyn pan fydd y claf yn gweld ymgynghorydd, ond yn Lloegr mae'n cychwyn pan fydd claf yn ymweld â'i feddyg teulu am y tro cyntaf. Pan fydd Cymru o'r diwedd yn gweithio tuag at y targed tri mis am lawdriniaeth ddargyfeiriol, bydd y targed hwnnw'n absoliwt yn Lloegr; bydd un ai wedi ei gyrraedd neu beidio. Ni fydd modd gwingo allan o'r peth. Bydd cleifion un ai'n aros dri mis fan bellaf neu beidio. Yng Nghymru, gallech honni bod y targed yn cael ei gyrraedd, er bod cleifion yn aros chwe mis cyn gweld ymgynghorydd—ni fydd eu cloc amser aros tri mis wedi dechrau tician. Pa bryd y rhowch chi sylw i'r anghysonder hwn, a pha bryd y cawn yr un mesurau ag yn Lloegr? Mae angen mesurau o'r fath i'ch dal i gyfrif.

Yn ail, rhaid ichi roi sylw i'r angen am fwy o staff. Mae'r gwasanaeth wedi dweud wrthyhych yr wythnos hon fod angen dwy waith gymaint o gardiolegwyr. Beth yw'ch ymateb? Ai dyna a gymer yn y tymor canolig i weithredu strategaeth o'r fath? Mae arnom angen cael y niferoedd yn fuan, oherwydd mae'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn Lloegr a'r Alban yn recriwtio staff, ac ofnwn y gallem fod yn disgyn ar ôl. Mae arnom angen mwy nag ambell £900,000 ar gyfer offer newydd, hefyd. Mae angen polisi eang fel na chedwir pobl i aros am brofion diagnostig, ond y cânt hwy'n gyflym. Mae'r gwasanaeth yn pwysu arnoch am ymateb.

Yn olaf, mae angen inni wynebu'r gwir ynghylch rhoi'r gorau i ysmegu. Mae pawb yn cytuno bod angen gwneud mwy; dyma'r polisi, mae'n debyg, a gaiff yr effaith fwyaf ar wella iechyd y cyhoedd. Yn Lloegr, mae'n rhaid i bob awdurdod iechyd lunio polisi ar gyfer rhoi'r gorau i ysmegu, a rhaid hybu clinigau rhoi'r gorau i ysmegu yn y sector gofal sylfaenol. Ai dyna'n polisi ni? Ni wn. Yr ydych yn targedu gwahanol bethau. Pa bryd y gallwn ni ddweud wrth feddygon teulu fod yn rhaid iddynt gynnal clinigau rhoi'r gorau i ysmegu fel mater o drefn?

Jane Hutt: Mae'r holl staff sy'n gweithio yn rheng flaen y gwasanaeth yn falch fod mynd

disease is a top priority for the Assembly. The Welsh Assembly Government's investment has resulted in our reaching the first milestone that we set ourselves in the national service framework—that nobody would be waiting more than 12 months for heart surgery by March 2002.

David Melding: How long did they have to wait to see a consultant?

The Presiding Officer: Order. You have had several supplementary questions. I will not allow bawling even from a gentleman such as you.

Jane Hutt: That was achieved as a result of that extra £2 million put into Morrision Hospital and the University Hospital of Wales. That extra investment is already agreed—and I will lower my voice, because we do not have to shout about this. It will ensure that we can increase the number of operations performed to an additional 600. I visited the cardiac unit at Morrision Hospital and saw its new operating theatre, new intensive care beds, new higher dependency unit beds, and I met the surgeons who feel that they are making progress. They do not want to send patients to Hammersmith; they want to ensure that people can have heart surgery in Wales.

The next milestone is ensuring that nobody waits more than six months for that all-important diagnostic test: the angiogram. We have debated this many times in the Assembly, both in Committee meetings and in the Chamber. To that end, I have announced £900,000 additional to the investment already put into the coronary heart disease national service framework. The Specialised Health Services Commission for Wales will work with the cardiac centres at Morrision, UHW, Manchester and the district general hospitals in Wales to consider the most appropriate way to meet that target, so that no-one waits more than six months for an angiogram.

You have omitted the other announcements which are important to what you say, David,

i'r afael â chlefyd y galon yn flaenoriaeth uchaf i'r Cynulliad. Mae buddsoddiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi golygu ein bod wedi cyrraedd y garreg filltir gyntaf y bu inni osod inni'n hunain yn y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol—sef na fyddai neb yn aros mwy na 12 mis am lawdriniaeth ar y galon erbyn mis Mawrth 2002.

David Melding: Am ba mor hir y bu raid iddynt aros i weld ymgynghorydd?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr ydych wedi cael nifer o gwestiynau atodol. Ni chaniatâf floeddio, hyd yn oed gan ŵr bonheddig fel chi.

Jane Hutt: Sicrhawyd hynny o ganlyniad i'r £2 filiwn ychwanegol a roddwyd i Ysbyty Treforys ac Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru. Mae'r buddsoddiad ychwanegol hwnnw eisoes wedi'i gytuno—a gostyngaf fy llais, oherwydd nid oes raid inni weiddi am hyn. Bydd yn sicrhau y gallwn gynyddu nifer y llawdriniaethau a gyflawnir i 600 yn ychwanegol. Ymwelais â'r uned gardioleg yn Ysbyty Treforys a gwelais ei theatr lawfeddygaeth newydd, gwelyau gofal dwys newydd, gwelyau newydd yn yr uned dibyniaeth uwch, a chwrddais â'r llawfeddygon sy'n teimlo eu bod yn camu ymlaen. Nid ydynt am anfon cleifion i Hammersmith; maent am sicrhau y gall pobl gael llawdriniaeth ar y galon yng Nghymru.

Y garreg filltir nesaf yw sicrhau nad oes neb yn aros mwy na chwe mis am y prawf diagnostig hollbwysig hwnnw: yr angiogram. Yr ydym wedi trafod hyn lawer gwaith yn y Cynulliad, mewn cyfarfodydd Pwyllgor ac yn y Siambr. I'r perwyl hwnnw, yr wyf wedi cyhoeddi £900,000 ar ben y buddsoddiad a wnaed eisoes yn y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer clefyd coronaidd y galon. Bydd Comisiwn Gwasanaeth Iechyd Arbenigol Cymru yn gweithio gyda chanolfannau'r galon yn Nhreforys, Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru, Manceinion a'r ysbytai cyffredinol dosbarth yng Nghymru i ystyried y ffordd fwyaf priodol o gyrraedd y targed hwnnw, fel na fydd neb yn aros mwy na chwe mis am angiogram.

Yr ydych wedi anghofio'r cyhoeddiadau eraill sy'n bwysig i'r hyn yr ydych yn ei

including the fact that we are setting up three clinical networks to ensure locally-driven services. It is all-important to have a Welsh Assembly Government clinical director responsible for driving the coronary heart disease national service framework. That is what staff want to hear about how we will deliver the services—

Jonathan Morgan: Answer the question.

Jane Hutt: I am answering the question. It is not for you, Jonathan, but for Dafydd to preside over the Assembly.

The Presiding Officer: Order. Thank you, Minister. I was about to intervene and indicate to Jonathan Morgan that we should not have any more interruptions from the Conservatives on this matter.

Jane Hutt: The issue of smoking, and ensuring that we get the right solutions at local level involves working with young people—and GPs—and examining the range of smoking cessation schemes in Wales, which are delivering, and show that young people are turning their backs on smoking. We also need incentives to ensure that young people have access to the counselling that is now available. The Quit and Win competition was successful and many people stopped smoking. We want to encourage and congratulate those people in Wales who have given up smoking, often despite extreme provocation, difficulty and pressure.

We are making progress, but we must recognise that, as politicians, we do not need to shout about this, except to shout in favour of placing tackling heart disease at the top of our agendas. The people of Wales want to hear about that, not politicians squabbling about it. They want the investment that I am making to ensure that we meet those milestones. We must listen to the clinicians at the top of the ladder who know what it is to deliver these services in Wales. We must also listen to the specialist registrars who want to stay in Wales, provided we can give them the environment, the backing and the support in terms of cardiologist places throughout Wales. We will do that through our

ddweud, David, gan gynnwys y ffaith ein bod yn sefydlu tri rhwydwaith clinigol i sicrhau gwasanaethau a arweinir yn lleol. Mae'n hollbwysig cael cyfarwyddwr clinigol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gyfrifol am arwain fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol clefyd coronaidd y galon. Dyna beth y mae staff am glywed ynghylch y modd y darparwn y gwasanaethau—

Jonathan Morgan: Atebwch y cwestiwn.

Jane Hutt: Yr wyf yn ateb y cwestiwn. Mater i Dafydd, ac nid i chi, Jonathan, yw llywyddu dros y Cynulliad.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Diolch, Weinidog. Yr oeddwn ar fin torri i mewn a dweud wrth Jonathan Morgan na ddylai'r Ceidwadwyr ymyrryd ymhellach ar y mater hwn.

Jane Hutt: Mae ysmegu, a sicrhau ein bod yn cael yr atebion iawn ar lefel leol, yn golygu gweithio gyda phobl ifanc—a meddygon teulu—ac archwilio'r amrediad o gynlluniau rhoi'r gorau i ysmegu yng Nghymru sy'n llwyddo, a dangos bod pobl ifanc yn cefnu ar ysmegu. Mae angen cymhellion hefyd i sicrhau y gall pobl ifanc fanteisio ar y cwnsela sydd bellach ar gael. Yr oedd y gystadleuaeth Rhoi'r Gorau ac Ennill yn llwyddiannus a llwyddodd llawer o bobl i roi'r gorau i ysmegu. Mae arnom eisiau annog a llongyfarch y bobl hynny yng Nghymru a roddodd y gorau i ysmegu, yn aml er gwaethaf pryfocio, anhawster a phwysau eithriadol.

Yr ydym yn symud ymlaen, ond rhaid inni gydnabod nad oes angen i ni, fel gwleidyddion, weiddi am hyn, ac eithrio gweiddi o blaid gosod mynd i'r afael â chlefyd y galon ar ben ein hagenda. Mae ar bobl Cymru eisiau clywed am hynny, yn hytrach na chlywed gwleidyddion yn ceccu amdano. Mae arnynt eisiau'r buddsoddiad yr wyf yn ei wneud er mwyn sicrhau y cyrhaeddwn y cerrig milltir hynny. Rhaid inni wrando ar y clinigwyr ar ben yr ysgol sy'n gwybod beth mae darparu'r gwasanaethau hynny yng Nghymru'n ei olygu. Rhaid inni wrando hefyd ar y cofrestryddion arbenigol sydd eisiau aros yng Nghymru, ar yr amod y gallwn roi iddynt yr

workforce plans.

Kirsty Williams: Thank you for your statement. You plan to increase capacity in the acute and tertiary sectors. However, since the publication of the national service framework, have you undertaken an evaluation of the demands that it will place upon GPs in the primary care sector? Does primary care have the capacity to deal with its requirement under the national service framework?

Also, how will you, as Minister, balance the need for acute interventions with the need to develop preventative work and significant rehabilitation services? Do you agree that such work is vital to improve coronary health in Wales? It is not appropriate for people to dismiss investment in prevention and rehabilitation work. I am aware of at least one health authority that has spent its entire allocation for tackling heart disease on acute services alone, rather than preventative and rehabilitation work. We need a balance.

In accepting that smoking cessation is the most effective action possible to prevent not only coronary heart disease but a host of other chronic illnesses, will you discuss with your House of Lords colleagues whether they will support Liberal Democrat Lord Clement-Jones's Bill, which seeks to ban advertising and promotion of tobacco products? Will you also seek to give the National Assembly for Wales the power, if the Bill is not implemented on a UK-basis, to make Wales a smoke-free zone, as a lasting legacy to your commitment to tackling coronary heart disease?

Jane Hutt: I endorse your comments on rehabilitation. In terms of primary care, one of the leading lights among our general practitioners in Wales, Dr Will Roberts from Anglesey, will chair the Ynys Môn health board. He took a group to Finland recently and returned with missionary zeal to set up Calon Lân Gwynedd. The thrust of his conviction is the screening of Ynys Môn's

amgylchedd, y gefnogaeth a'r cymorth yn nhermau swyddi i gardiolegwyr ledled Cymru. Gwnawn hynny drwy'n cynlluniau gweithlu.

Kirsty Williams: Diolch am eich datganiad. Yr ydych yn bwriadu cynyddu capasiti yn y sectorau aciwt a thrydyddol. Fodd bynnag, ers cyhoeddi'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol, a ydych wedi arfarnu'r galwadau a wna ar feddygon teulu yn y sector gofal sylfaenol? A oes gan y sector gofal sylfaenol y capasiti i ddelio â'r hyn sy'n ofynnol ganddo dan y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol?

Hefyd, sut y gwnewch chi, fel Gweinidog, gydbwysu'r angen am ymyriadau aciwt gyda'r angen i ddatblygu gwaith ataliol a gwasanaethau ymadfer arwyddocaol? A gytunwch fod y fath waith yn hanfodol i wella iechyd coronaidd yng Nghymru? Nid yw'n briodol wftio buddsoddi mewn gwaith ataliol ac ymadfer. Gwn am o leiaf un awdurdod iechyd a wariodd y cyfan o'i ddyraniad ar gyfer mynd i'r afael â chlefyd y galon ar wasanaethau aciwt yn unig, yn hytrach nag ar waith ataliol ac ymadfer. Mae angen cydbwysedd.

O dderbyn mai rhoi'r gorau i ysmegu yw'r ffordd fwyaf effeithiol bosibl i atal nid yn unig glefyd coronaidd y galon ond lluo o afiechydon cronig eraill, a wnewch chi drafod gyda'ch cyfeillion yn Nhŷ'r Arglwyddi a wnânt gefnogi Mesur yr Arglwydd Democraidd Rhyddfrydol Clement-Jones, sy'n ceisio gwahardd hysbysebu a hyrwyddo cynhyrchion tybaco? A geisiwch chi hefyd roi'r hawl i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, os na weithredir y Mesur ledled y DU, wneud Cymru'n ardal ddi-fwg, fel gwaddol barhaol i'ch ymrwymiad i fynd i'r afael â chlefyd coronaidd y galon?

Jane Hutt: Atef eich sylwadau ar ymadfer. O ran gofal sylfaenol, bydd un o'r ceffylau blaen o blith ein meddygon teulu yng Nghymru, Dr Wil Roberts o Ynys Môn, yn cadeirio bwrdd iechyd Ynys Môn. Aeth ef â grŵp i'r Ffindir yn ddiweddar a daeth yn ôl yn llawn sêl genhadol i sefydlu Calon Lân Gwynedd. Ergyd ei argyhoeddiad yw sgrinio poblogaeth Ynys Môn a sicrhau y cânt

population and ensuring that they have access to rehabilitation services. Many projects under the health inequalities fund, which are funded directly by the Assembly, link prevention and rehabilitation. Many of the cardiac services rehabilitation units across Wales are doing fantastic work. Many of you will know patients who are benefiting from that cardiac rehabilitation. The £10.5 million from the new opportunities fund, which I mentioned in my statement, will be geared towards diagnosis, prevention and rehabilitation. It is key that that is part of our five standards and the national service framework's 30 actions. We must support our primary care community. I have already mentioned the increase in spending on drugs that we have identified and that a proportion of that is as a result of the drugs prescribed to tackle cardiovascular disease. We must ensure, in response to Dai's earlier point, that we give them the tools and the support to deliver the national service framework. That has been in discussion way before we launched the national service framework last year.

3:10 p.m.

I have spoken of my support for the ban on tobacco advertising, which is key. We applaud the UK Government for taking that forward. I have arranged to meet Yvette Cooper to talk about the proposed approved code of conduct in terms of workplace smoking, as well as these issues that also relate to the UK legislative framework. We must have a debate in Wales in terms of encouraging and enabling people to give up smoking, and this debate must be heard.

Elin Jones: Mae'r fframwaith hwn yn gofyn am gardiolegydd llawn amser ymhob ysbyty cyffredinol. Ar hyn o bryd yn ysbyty Bronglais mae'r gardiolegydd yn rhan amser ac yn gweithio fel ymgynghorydd clefyd siwgrw hefyd. Mae hyn, yn ôl llythyr a dderbyniais yn ddiweddar oddi wrth y coleg brenhinol, yn beryglus ac yn gyfan gwbl annigonol. A ydych felly yn bwriadu rhyddhau arian ar gyfer ysbyty fel Bronglais i allu cyflogi gardiolegydd llawn amser?

fynediad at wasanaethau ymadfer. Mae llawer o brosiectau dan y gronfa anghydraddoldebau iechyd, a noddir yn uniongyrchol gan y Cynulliad, yn cysylltu atal ac ymadfer. Mae llawer o unedau ymadfer y gwasanaethau cardiaidd ar draws Cymru'n gwneud gwaith gwyb. Bydd llawer ohonoch yn adnabod cleifion sy'n elwa ar yr ymadferiad cardiaidd hwnnw. Caiff y £10.5 miliwn o'r gronfa cyfleoedd newydd, a grybwyllais yn fy natganiad, ei gyfeirio tuag at ganfod, atal ac ymadfer. Mae'n allweddol fod hynny'n rhan o'n pum safon ac o 30 gweithred y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol. Rhaid inni gefnogi ein cymuned gofal sylfaenol. Yr wyf eisoes wedi sôn am y cynnydd mewn gwariant ar gyffuriau yr ydym wedi'i nodi a bod cyfran o hynny o ganlyniad i'r cyffuriau a ragnodwyd i drin afiechyd cardiofasgwlaidd. Rhaid inni sicrhau, i ateb pwynt cynharach Dai, y rhoddwn yr arfau a'r gefnogaeth iddynt weithredu'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol. Bu hynny dan drafodaeth ymhell cyn inni lansio'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol y llynedd.

Yr wyf wedi sôn fy mod yn cefnogi gwahardd hysbysebu tybaco, sydd yn allweddol. Cymeradwywn Lywodraeth y DU am fynd â hynny yn ei flaen. Yr wyf wedi trefnu i gyfarfod ag Yvette Cooper i siarad am y côd ymddygiad y bwriedir ei gymeradwyo ynghylch ysmegu yn y gweithle, yn ogystal â'r materion hyn y mae a wnelont hefyd â fframwaith deddfwriaethol y DU. Rhaid inni gael dadl yng Nghymru ynghylch annog a galluogi pobl i roi'r gorau i ysmegu, a rhaid i'r ddadl hon gael ei chlywed.

Elin Jones: This framework demands a full-time cardiologist in every general hospital. At present in Bronglais hospital the cardiologist is part-time and also acts as a diabetes consultant. This is, according to a letter that I received recently from the royal college, dangerous and utterly inadequate. Therefore, do you intend to provide funding to enable a hospital such as Bronglais to employ a full-time cardiologist?

Jane Hutt: I have already described the process in terms of our workforce planning. We will discuss this in the Health and Social Services Committee on 27 June. We have asked every trust to put forward their needs in terms of additional workforce, which includes consultants, health visitors and nurses in every trust, community and hospital setting. We must then ensure that we not only have the targets and plans for our new expanding workforce, but also the training facilities, and that we encourage our specialist registrars in Wales, and additional funding for those specialist registrars, to apply for posts as cardiologists in our district general hospitals. I have also referred to the important development of three clinical networks across Wales—the cardiac clinical network. It is very much along the route that we are taking with cancer services to ensure that services across Wales are provided in a collaborative network. It is key, not just for south-east Wales and the more urban areas of Wales, but for rural Wales, that they have that support of clinical networks. That must also be backed, not just in terms of support for specialists working at the sharp end, but also in terms of access to equipment and to the diagnostic facilities that I announced in terms of extra investment today.

The Presiding Officer: We are out of time for this statement, but I will call one more Government and one more opposition Member, provided that they are brief.

Ann Jones: I welcome this statement, but will press you a little further, Minister. To ensure that we tackle heart disease it is vital that we consider treating it in its wider sense. You have referred to diagnosis and prevention treatment. Do you agree that fitting pacemakers for some abnormal heart rhythms is an important part of modern treatment in tackling heart disease? Can you look at the position—

The Presiding Officer: Order. I asked you to be brief. We are out of time. Please ask one question.

Jane Hutt: Yr wyf eisoes wedi disgrifio'r broses yn nhermau'n cynlluniau gweithlu. Byddwn yn trafod hyn yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar 27 Mehefin. Yr ydym wedi gofyn i bob ymddiriedolaeth gyflwyno'u hanghenion o ran gweithlu ychwanegol, sy'n cynnwys ymgynghorwyr, ymwelwyr iechyd a nyrsys ymhob lleoliad ysbyty, cymuned ac ymddiriedolaeth. Rhaid inni wedyn sicrhau bod gennym nid yn unig y targedau a'r cynlluniau ar gyfer ein gweithlu newydd cynyddol, ond hefyd y cyfleusterau hyfforddi, ac yr anogwn ein cofrestryddion arbenigol yng Nghymru, ac arian ychwanegol ar gyfer y cofrestryddion arbenigol hynny, i ymgeisio am swyddi fel cardiolegwyr yn ein hysbytai cyffredinol dosbarth. Cyfeiriais hefyd at ddatblygiad pwysig tri rhwydwaith clinigol ar draws Cymru—y rhwydwaith clinigol cardiaidd. Mae'n dilyn yr un llwybr i bob pwrpas ag a gymerwn gyda gwasanaethau canser i sicrhau y darperir gwasanaethau ar draws Cymru mewn rhwydwaith cydweithiol. Mae'n allweddol, nid yn unig i'r De-ddwyrain ac ardaloedd mwy trefol Cymru, ond i'r Gymru wledig, y cânt y rhwydweithiau clinigol hynny'n gefn iddynt. Rhaid cefnogi hynny hefyd, nid dim ond o ran cefnogaeth i arbenigwyr sy'n gweithio yn y rheng flaen, ond hefyd o ran mynediad at offer ac at y cyfleusterau diagnostig a gyhoeddais yn nhermau buddsoddiad ychwanegol heddiw.

Y Llywydd: Y mae amser ar ben i'r datganiad hwn, ond galwaf un Aelod arall dros y Llywodraeth ac un o'r gwrthbleidiau, ar yr amod y byddant yn gryno.

Ann Jones: Croesawaf y datganiad hwn, ond fe'ch pwysaf ychydig ymhellach, Weinidog. Er mwyn sicrhau yr awn i'r afael â chlefyd y galon mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn ystyried ei drin yn ei ystyr ehangaf. Cyfeiriasoch at driniaeth canfod ac atal. A gytunwch fod gosod rheoliaduron ar gyfer rhai rhythmiau calon annormal yn rhan bwysig o driniaeth fodern wrth ymdrin â chlefyd y galon? A allwch edrych ar sefyllfa—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Gofynnais ichi fod yn gryno. Mae ein hamser ar ben. Gofynnwch un cwestiwn, os gwelwch yn dda.

Jane Hutt: We must consider the whole range of heart disease, and the national service framework's five standards do that. In terms of fitting pacemakers, the Specialist Health Services Commission for Wales will consider service provision in the autumn.

Jane Hutt: Rhaid inni ystyried holl amrediad clefyd y galon, ac mae pum safon y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol yn gwneud hynny. O ran gosod rheoliaduron, bydd Comisiwn Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol Cymru'n ystyried y gwasanaeth a ddarperir yn yr hydref.

Peter Rogers: A few weeks ago I asked you a question about prescribing xyban to help people stop smoking. This produces fantastic results; I know of someone who stopped smoking in four weeks. Many of us have recently attended presentations, and it was a media response—

Peter Rogers: Ychydig wythnosau'n ôl gofynnais gwestiwn ichi ynglŷn â rhagnodi xyban i helpu pobl i roi'r gorau i ysmegu. Mae hyn yn rhoi canlyniadau gwych; gwn am rywun a roddodd y gorau i ysmegu ymhen pedair wythnos. Mae llawer ohonom wedi mynychu cyflwyniadau'n ddiweddar, ac ymateb y cyfryngau—

The Presiding Officer: Order. There is only time for a brief question.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid oes ond amser ar gyfer cwestiwn byr.

Jane Hutt: We have had to carefully consider the clinical trials, but we are now more confident in terms of taking that forward.

Jane Hutt: Yr ydym wedi gorfod ystyried y profion clinigol yn ofalus, ond yr ydym yn awr yn fwy hyderus o ran symud ymlaen â hynny.

Datganiad ar Adolygiad o'r Flwyddyn Gyntaf o Fynediad am Ddim i Amgueddfeydd Cenedlaethol Cymru Statement on the Review of the First Year of Free Admission to Welsh National Museums

The Presiding Officer: I remind Members of our clearly established convention on statements. I call one spokesperson from each party group and then, if there is time available—and I hope that there always will be—I call other Members to contribute briefly. This convention does not seem to have sunk in yet, but it has been agreed several times in Business Committee.

Y Llywydd: Atgoffaf yr Aelodau am ein confensiwn sydd wedi'i sefydlu'n glir ar ddatganiadau. Galwaf ar un llefarydd o bob grŵp plaid ac wedyn, os bydd amser ar gael—a gobeithiaf bob amser y bydd—galwaf ar Aelodau eraill i gyfrannu'n fyr. Mae'n ymddangos nad yw'r confensiwn hwn yn hysbys eto, ond cytunwyd arno sawl gwaith yn y Pwyllgor Busnes.

The Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language (Jenny Randerson): It has been over a year since the Welsh Assembly Government provided additional funding to the National Museums and Galleries of Wales to enable it to offer every visitor free admission to its eight sites in Wales. The free entry policy has been a resounding success. Visitor numbers have risen beyond all expectations; overall visitor figures at the eight sites have risen by almost 90 per cent.

Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Iaith Gymraeg (Jenny Randerson): Aeth dros flwyddyn heibio ers i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ddarparu cyllid ychwanegol i Amgueddfeydd ac Orielau Cenedlaethol Cymru i alluogi iddynt gynnig mynediad am ddim i bob ymwelydd i'w hwyth safle yng Nghymru. Bu'r polisi mynediad am ddim yn llwyddiant ysgubol. Cododd niferoedd ymwelwyr y tu hwnt i bob disgwyl; cododd cyfanswm yr ymwelwyr â'r wyth safle bron 90 y cant.

Two sites in particular have seen an Gwelodd dau safle yn arbennig gynnydd

exceptional increase in visitor numbers, namely, the Museum of Welsh Life in St Fagans, where numbers have risen by 115 per cent, and the Welsh Slate Museum in Llanberis, which has seen an increase of 168 per cent. It is fitting that both of these marvellous museums won major prizes in a recent Wales Tourist Board competition. I have visited both sites during the past year and I know that the 'wow factor' award won by St Fagans, and the 'sense of place' award won by the Welsh Slate Museum are fully deserved.

Free admission has meant that people and families from all walks of life are now able to see, enjoy and learn from the wonderful diversity of our national collections. The barrier of paying for admission has been removed, and has helped instil the habit of visiting local museums, along with other heritage sites, in many of these new visitors. The introduction of free admission from 1 April 2001 put Wales ahead of the game, as English national museums did not follow suit until 1 December—seven months later. The timing of the introduction, at the start of the foot and mouth disease epidemic, meant that it gave a much needed fillip to our tourism industry.

I must mention the dedication of the museum staff, who have coped magnificently with the massive increase in visitor numbers, and all that that entails. I am pleased to report that the museums' shops had a bumper year, and saw takings rise as a result of increased visitor numbers.

Some have misgivings about the benefits of free admission to the wider tourism industry in Wales, and feel that visitors have preferred to visit national museum sites, because they are free, to the detriment of privately owned attractions. I appreciate this point of view, but it is my firm belief that, in time, free admission to the national museums will benefit all heritage and tourism attractions in Wales. It is important to note that several local authorities also offer free admission to their museums, and that the number of authorities with free entry schemes has increased over the past year. The national

eithriadol yn niferoedd yr ymwelwyr, sef Amgueddfa Werin Cymru yn Sain Ffagan, lle cododd y niferoedd 115 y cant, ac Amgueddfa Lechi Cymru yn Llanberis, a welodd gynnydd o 168 y cant. Mae'n addas fod y ddwy amgueddfa fendigedig hyn wedi ennill gwobrau pwysig mewn cystadleuaeth ddiweddar gan Fwrdd Croeso Cymru. Yr wyf wedi ymweld â'r ddau safle yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf a gwn fod y wobwr 'ffactor waw' a enillwyd gan Sain Ffagan, a'r wobwr 'naws am le' a enillwyd gan yr Amgueddfa Lechi, yn gwbl haeddiannol.

Golygodd mynediad am ddim y gall pobl a theuluoedd o bob cefndir bellach weld, mwynhau a dysgu oddi wrth amrywiaeth ryfeddol ein casgliadau cenedlaethol. Dilëwyd rhwystr talu am fynediad, a helpodd hynny sefydlu'r arferiad o ymweld ag amgueddfeydd lleol, ynghyd â safleoedd treftadaeth eraill, i lawer o'r ymwelwyr newydd hyn. Wrth gyflwyno mynediad am ddim o 1 Ebrill 2001 achubodd Cymru y blaen ar amgueddfeydd cenedlaethol Lloegr, na ddilynodd yr esiampl tan 1 Rhagfyr—saith mis yn ddiweddarach. Golygodd amseriad y cyflwyniad, ar ddechrau haint clwy'r traed a'r genau, ei fod wedi rhoi hwb yr oedd dirfawr angen amdano ar ein diwydiant ymwelwyr.

Rhaid imi grybwyll ymroddiad staff yr amgueddfeydd, a ymdopodd yn wych â'r cynnydd enfawr mewn niferoedd ymwelwyr, a phopeth y mae hynny'n ei olygu. Yr wyf yn falch o adrodd y cafodd siopau'r amgueddfeydd flwyddyn lwyddiannus iawn, a gwelsant eu helw'n codi yn sgîl y cynnydd yn niferoedd yr ymwelwyr.

Mae rhai'n amau manteision mynediad am ddim i'r diwydiant ymwelwyr ehangach yng Nghymru, ac yn teimlo bod ymwelwyr wedi dewis ymweld â safleoedd yr amgueddfa genedlaethol, am eu bod am ddim, a hynny ar draul atyniadau a redir yn breifat. Gwerthfawrogaf y safbwynt hwnnw, ond credaf yn bendant y bydd mynediad am ddim i'r amgueddfeydd cenedlaethol, ymhen amser, yn dod ag elw i'r holl atyniadau treftadaeth a thwristiaeth yng Nghymru. Mae'n bwysig nodi bod llawer o awdurdodau lleol yn cynnig mynediad am ddim i'w hamgueddfeydd hwythau, a bod nifer yr

museum is also taking steps to help spread the benefits of free admission, and is currently working with the Wales Tourist Board and the Wales Association of Visitor Attractions to help to put together initiatives that will boost the Welsh tourism industry as a whole.

The national museum is also working with local museums to enable more objects from its collections to be seen and enjoyed at local museums and galleries throughout Wales. As facilities at many local museums and galleries are not up to the standard needed to display some important items, the Welsh Assembly Government has pledged £50,000 a year to help upgrade and refurbish facilities at local museums.

Last week, I had the pleasure of launching this partnership project at Wrexham County Borough Museum, which is one of three venues chosen to pilot the scheme in the first year, along with Oriel Ynys Môn in Anglesey, and Brecknock Museum in Powys. Sharing the Treasures—Cyfoeth Cymru Gyfan is a partnership project between the national museum, the Council of Museums in Wales and local museums and galleries. I am pleased that the Welsh Assembly Government's investment will lead to many more items from the national collection being shown at venues throughout Wales.

3:20 p.m.

I am confident that free entry will continue to have a key role in promoting Wales and the Welsh tourism industry. The national museum is not sitting on its laurels. It has several exciting new developments under way this year, which my culture strategy, 'Creative Future:Cymru Greadigol', fully supports, and which I am sure will help to maintain the high number of visitors to the eight sites. At the National Mining Museum of Wales, Big Pit, work is under way, with the help of lottery funding, to refurbish the

awdurdodau a chanddynt gynlluniau mynediad am ddim wedi cynyddu dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Mae'r amgueddfa genedlaethol yn cymryd camau hefyd i helpu gwasgaru buddiannau mynediad am ddim, ac yn gweithio ar hyn o bryd gyda Bwrdd Croeso Cymru a Chymdeithas Atyniadau Ymwelwyr Cymru i helpu sefydlu mentrau a fydd yn hybu'r diwydiant ymwelwyr yng Nghymru yn gyffredinol.

Mae'r amgueddfa genedlaethol hefyd yn gweithio gydag amgueddfeydd lleol i alluogi i fwy o eitemau o'i chasgliadau gael eu gweld a'u mwynhau mewn amgueddfeydd ac orielau lleol ledled Cymru. Gan nad yw'r cyfleusterau mewn llawer o amgueddfeydd ac orielau lleol o'r safon uchel angenrheidiol i arddangos rhai eitemau pwysig, mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi addo £50,000 y flwyddyn i helpu uwchraddio ac ailwampio cyfleusterau mewn amgueddfeydd lleol.

Yr wythnos diwethaf, cefais y pleser o lansio'r prosiect partneriaeth hwn yn Amgueddfa Bwrdeistref Sirol Wrecsam, sy'n un o'r tri lleoliad a ddewiswyd i beilotar cynllun yn y flwyddyn gyntaf, ynghyd ag Oriel Ynys Môn, ac Amgueddfa Brycheiniog ym Mhowys. Prosiect partneriaeth yw Cyfoeth Cymru Gyfan—Sharing the Treasures rhwng yr amgueddfa genedlaethol, Cyngor Amgueddfeydd Cymru ac amgueddfeydd ac orielau lleol. Yr wyf yn falch y bydd buddsoddiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn arwain at arddangos llawer mwy o eitemau o'r casgliad cenedlaethol mewn lleoliadau ar hyd a lled Cymru.

Yr wyf yn hyderus y bydd mynediad am ddim yn dal i chwarae rôl bwysig yn hybu Cymru a'r diwydiant ymwelwyr yng Nghymru. Nid yw'r amgueddfa genedlaethol yn gorffwys ar ei rhwyfau. Mae ganddi lawer o ddatblygiadau newydd cyffrous ar y gweill eleni, a gefnogir yn llawn gan fy strategaeth ddiwylliant, 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol', ac yr wyf yn sicr y bydd yn help i gynnal y niferoedd uchel o ymwelwyr â'r wyth safle. Yn Amgueddfa Lofaol Genedlaethol Cymru, Pwll Mawr, mae

pithead buildings, to provide better interpretation displays and to enhance visitor facilities at the mine.

The Museum of the Welsh Woollen Industry, which I had the great pleasure of visiting recently, is undergoing a major restoration of its listed mill buildings and enhancement of facilities for educational and regular visitors. The site will reopen for business in the spring of 2003.

The national museum is also engaged, in partnership with the City and County of Swansea, in developing the national waterfront museum in Swansea marina. A bid for stage 2 funding was recently submitted to the heritage lottery fund. The Assembly Government is supporting the project with a grant of up to £6 million, and I wish the project partners every success.

I am also pleased to announce that a new home has been identified for the national museum's collection of paintings by Graham Sutherland. The Pembrokeshire Coast National Park, in conjunction with local partners, has offered land in St David's for the building of a new gallery in which to display the collection. I am delighted that these paintings will return to a venue in Pembrokeshire, as the artist found much inspiration there.

All in all, free entry has been a wonderful gift to the people of Wales. It has helped put us on the map, given everyone the freedom to visit the national collections of Wales as often as they wish and brought the history of Wales alive for many people from Wales and elsewhere.

I am proud of this Welsh Assembly Government initiative and I commend it to Assembly Members.

Owen John Thomas: I welcome the astounding increases in attendance figures at the eight sites of the National Museums and Galleries of Wales and the access that it brings to families that would otherwise not be able to attend them, allowing them to see the wonderful treasures that are exhibited. That is important. I also look forward to the new

gwaith ar droed, gyda chymorth arian loteri, i adnewyddu adeiladau pen y pwll, i ddarparu arddangosiadau dehongli gwell ac i wella'r cyfleusterau i ymwelwyr yn y pwll.

Yn Amgueddfa Diwydiant Gwlân Cymru, y cefais y pleser mawr o ymweld â hi'n ddiweddar, mae gwaith adfer mawr ar droed ar ei hadeiladau melin rhestredig, ynghyd â gwella cyfleusterau ar gyfer ymwelwyr addysgol a rheolaidd. Bydd y safle'n ailagor i fusnes yng ngwanwyn 2003.

Mae'r amgueddfa genedlaethol hefyd wrthi, mewn partneriaeth â Dinas a Sir Abertawe, yn datblygu amgueddfa genedlaethol y glannau ym marina Abertawe. Cyflwynwyd cais am gyllid cam 2 yn ddiweddar i gronfa dreftadaeth y loteri. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cefnogi'r prosiect gyda grant o hyd at £6 miliwn, a dymunaf bob llwyddiant i bartneriaid y prosiect.

Yr wyf yn falch o gyhoeddi hefyd fod cartref newydd wedi'i ddarganfod i gasgliad yr amgueddfa genedlaethol o beintiadau gan Graham Sutherland. Mae Parc Cenedlaethol Arfordir Penfro, ynghyd â phartneriaid lleol, wedi cynnig tir yn Nhyddewi ar gyfer adeiladu oriel newydd i arddangos y casgliad ynddo. Yr wyf wrth fy modd y bydd y peintiadau hyn yn dychwelyd i ganolfan yn Sir Benfro, gan i'r arlunydd gael cymaint o ysbrydoliaeth yno.

Yn gyffredinol, bu mynediad am ddim yn rhodd fendigedig i bobl Cymru. Helpodd ein rhoi ar y map, rhoddodd y rhyddid i bawb ymweld â chasgliadau cenedlaethol Cymru cyn amlod ag y dymunant a daeth â hanes Cymru'n fyw i lawer o Gymry ac eraill.

Yr wyf yn falch o'r fenter hon gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ac fe'i cymeradwyaf i Aelodau'r Cynulliad.

Owen John Thomas: Croesawaf y codiadau rhyfeddol yn y ffigurau ymwelwyr yn wyth safle Amgueddfeydd ac Orielaau Cenedlaethol Cymru a'r mynediad a ganiateir i deuluoedd na fyddai fel arall yn gallu eu mynychu, gan ganiatáu iddynt weld y trysorau bendigedig a arddangosir. Mae hynny'n bwysig. Edrychaf ymlaen hefyd at y mentrau newydd i hybu

initiatives to boost Welsh tourism in co-operation with the national museum. Plaid Cymru has always believed that developing cultural tourism has great potential to develop Wales economically and in other ways. We are also long-time supporters of exhibits being circulated throughout Wales. I am glad to see that that is now underway. All parts of Wales will benefit from that, as cultural tourism is an important element in tourism.

I look forward to seeing the Sutherland collection in its purpose-built gallery in St David's when it is completed. It is a pity that I will not be able to see it when I visit the Eisteddfod there in August. I also welcome the developments in other areas. Projects are moving forward, which is good.

I hope that staffing levels have been increased in the museums to reflect the increase in business. Do you have information on that matter?

I would also like you to assess the effects of the tremendous and welcome increase in numbers, especially at St Fagans and at the National Slate Museum in Llanberis. Some people fear that the fabric of the museums, namely the pathways and exhibits, could be in danger because of the volume of visitors. The increase in numbers is good, but we must ensure that the contents of the museums and galleries are treasured. I would be interested in your comments on that issue.

Finally, I do not think that concern for other local museums is negative. We should carry out an assessment, which would not be expensive, to discover the volume of visitors in those museums since free admission was introduced in the national museum.

Jenny Randerson: It is important to emphasise that, last year, the national museum had over 2,000 exhibits on loan throughout Wales and beyond at over 100 locations. The new partnership scheme is designed to open that up even further, and to open up some of the more precious exhibits that could not be loaned before. The Sutherland gallery will take a few years to be built, and funding issues have to be resolved.

twristiaeth Cymru mewn cydweithrediad â'r amgueddfa genedlaethol. Daliodd Plaid Cymru erioed fod datblygu twristiaeth ddiwylliannol yn cynnig potensial mawr i ddatblygu Cymru'n economaidd ac mewn ffyrdd eraill. Yr ydym hefyd ers amser maith wedi cefnogi cylchredeg eitemau arddangos o gwmpas Cymru. Yr wyf yn falch o weld fod hynny bellach yn digwydd. Bydd pob rhan o Gymru ar ei hennill o hynny, gan fod twristiaeth ddiwylliannol yn elfen bwysig mewn twristiaeth.

Edrychaf ymlaen at weld casgliad Sutherland yn ei oriel bwrpasol yn Nhyddewi pan fydd honno wedi'i chwblhau. Mae'n biti na fyddaf yn gallu ei gweld pan ymwelaf â'r Eisteddfod yno ym mis Awst. Croesawaf y datblygiadau mewn ardaloedd eraill hefyd. Mae prosiectau'n symud ymlaen, sydd yn beth da.

Gobeithiaf fod lefelau staffio wedi'u cynyddu yn yr amgueddfeydd i adlewyrchu'r cynnydd mewn busnes. A oes gennych wybodaeth ar hynny?

Hoffwn hefyd ichi asesu effeithiau'r cynnydd aruthrol, sydd i'w groesawu, yn y niferoedd, yn enwedig yn Sain Ffagan a'r Amgueddfa Lechi Genedlaethol yn Llanberis. Mae rhai yn ofni y gallai ffabrig yr amgueddfeydd, sef y llwybrau a'r eitemau a ddangosir, gael ei difrodi oherwydd y nifer o ymwelwyr. Mae'r cynnydd yn dda, ond rhaid sicrhau y cedwir cynnwys yr amgueddfeydd a'r orielau. Byddai gennyf ddiddordeb yn eich sylwadau ar y mater hwnnw.

Yn olaf, ni chredaf mai peth negyddol yw pryderu am amgueddfeydd eraill. Dylem wneud asesiad, na fyddai'n ddud, i ganfod niferoedd yr ymwelwyr yn yr amgueddfeydd hynny ers cyflwyno mynediad am ddim yn yr amgueddfa genedlaethol.

Jenny Randerson: Mae'n bwysig pwysleisio fod gan yr amgueddfa genedlaethol y llynedd dros 2,000 o eitemau ar fenthyg mewn dros 100 o leoliadau ar hyd a lled Cymru a thu hwnt. Bwriedir i'r cynllun partneriaeth newydd agor hynny allan ymhellach, a chaniatáu rhoi benthyg rhai o'r arddangosion mwy gwerthfawr na ellid eu benthyca o'r blaen. Cymer ychydig o flynyddoedd i adeiladu oriel Sutherland, ac mae angen

datrys materion ariannu.

Staffing levels have had to be adjusted, along with the approach to staffing. An increase in staff was anticipated, but the level of increased visitors fluctuates significantly from one site to the next, and it was not possible to anticipate the extent of the staff increase needed. One could have predicted that the Museum of Welsh Life at St Fagans would be popular and would require a great increase in staff, but the success of the Welsh Slate Museum at Llanberis—which is a wonderful museum—was even greater than we had anticipated, given the fact that it was achieved during the time when foot and mouth disease affected that area. Maintenance and conservation have had to be increased in certain areas. It is an indication of the expertise and dedication of museum staff that these matters have been on their mind throughout the last year as they have adjusted to the new scheme.

Given that the scheme has been in place for a year, I agree that it is now time to assess its impact and effect on other museums. However, it is a moving picture because at the beginning of last week, I was at a museum in Torfaen, which announced another free entry scheme. It would be helpful to consider the impact of those schemes alongside the national museum scheme.

Ron Davies: We all welcome this policy, which has a huge impact in terms of free access for the people of Wales as well as for visitors coming to Wales to share and explore our national heritage. However, the policy will impact on other visitor attractions, as well as museums. I will give two examples to illustrate my point. In the private sector, Dan-yr-Ogof Showcaves are in direct competition with the Big Pit, which now enjoys the advantage of free admission. However, Dan-yr-Ogof still has to charge visitors substantial fees, not least to meet the owner's responsibilities of having to maintain a site of special scientific interest. In my constituency, Llancaiach Fawr Manor is an important visitor attraction that incorporates elements of a museum and is in direct competition with St Fagans. In the latter case, there is free admission, but in the case of Llancaiach Fawr

Bu raid addasu lefelau staffio, ynghyd â'r agwedd at staffio. Disgwyliwyd cynnydd mewn staff, ond mae lefel yr ymwelwyr ychwanegol yn amrywio'n sylweddol o un safle i'r nesaf, ac nid oedd modd rhagweld faint o gynnydd staff y byddai ei angen. Gallesid rhagweld y byddai Amgueddfa Werin Cymru yn Sain Ffagan yn boblogaidd ac y byddai angen cynnydd mawr yn ei staff, ond yr oedd llwyddiant Amgueddfa Lechi Cymru yn Llanberis—sy'n amgueddfa fendigedig—yn fwy nag yr oeddem wedi ei ragweld hyd yn oed, o ystyried y ffaith y digwyddodd yn ystod y cyfnod pan oedd effaith clwy'r traed a'r genau ar yr ardal honno. Bu raid cynyddu gwaith cynnal a chadwraeth mewn rhai manau. Arwydd o arbenigedd ac ymroddiad staff yr amgueddfa yw bod y materion hyn wedi bod ar eu meddyliau drwy gydol y flwyddyn ddiwethaf wrth iddynt ymaddasu i'r cynllun newydd.

Gan fod y cynllun bellach ar waith ers blwyddyn, cytunaf ei bod yn awr yn bryd asesu ei effaith ar amgueddfeydd eraill. Er hynny, mae'n ddarlun symudol oherwydd ddechrau'r wythnos diwethaf, yr oeddwn mewn amgueddfa yn Nhorfaen, a gyhoeddodd gynllun mynediad am ddim arall. Byddai'n fuddiol ystyried effaith y cynlluniau hynny ochr yn ochr â chynllun yr amgueddfa genedlaethol.

Ron Davies: Yr ydym i gyd yn croesawu'r polisi hwn, sy'n cael effaith enfawr yn nhermau mynediad am ddim i bobl Cymru yn ogystal ag i ymwelwyr a ddaw i Gymru i rannu ac ymchwilio i'n treftadaeth genedlaethol. Fodd bynnag, bydd y polisi'n effeithio ar atyniadau eraill i ymwelwyr, yn ogystal ag amgueddfeydd. Rhoddaf ddwy enghraifft i danlinellu fy mhwynt. Yn y sector preifat, mae Ogofâu Dan-yr-Ogof mewn cystadleuaeth uniongyrchol â'r Pwll Mawr, sydd bellach yn mwynhau mantais mynediad am ddim. Fodd bynnag, mae Dan-yr-Ogof yn dal i orfod codi tâl sylweddol ar ymwelwyr, nid yn lleiaf i gwrdd â chyfrifoldebau'r perchennog o orfod cynnal safle o ddiddordeb gwyddonol arbennig. Yn fy etholaeth i, mae Maenordy Llancaiach Fawr yn atyniad pwysig i ymwelwyr sy'n ymgorffori elfennau o amgueddfa ac sydd

Manor, the local authority has to charge in order to meet its overheads and to keep the facility running.

I appreciate that the Minister said that she would keep the policy under review and consider the impact on other museums, but will she ensure that she works with the Wales Tourist Board, the private sector and local authorities to evaluate the impact of this policy on other visitor attractions, not only museums? If necessary, will she keep her mind open to ensure that she is prepared to introduce other measures of support if the policy is proved to be having damaging effects on other attractions?

Jenny Randerson: Recognising that there could be such an impact is a realistic way of approaching it. However, it is not a reason for not introducing free admission, because these are our national treasures and many of them were given to the nation as bequests and gifts. We have an obligation to display them and make them as accessible as possible. However, I am aware of the concerns of the owner of Dan-yr-Ogof Showcaves. He wrote to me within a week or two of free admission being introduced, suggesting that it had a negative impact on his visitor numbers. We must consider other issues that affect visitor numbers, because figures may have been clouded by foot and mouth disease. A year on, we can take a cooler look at them.

3:30 p.m.

I am also aware of the situation with regard to Llancaiach Fawr. As I said in my statement, the national museum is working closely with other attractions to ensure a joint approach. It is interesting to note that in Llanberis, before the introduction of free entry, a great deal of work was undertaken on joint ticketing and marketing schemes by a group of attractions competing for custom. They have maximised the amount of visitors that they could attract by working together. The national museum is taking that approach where possible. There is great scope for

mewn cystadleuaeth uniongyrchol â Sain Ffagan. I'r olaf, ceir mynediad am ddim, ond yn achos Llancaiach Fawr mae'n rhaid i'r awdurdod lleol godi tâl er mwyn talu'i orbenion a chadw'r cyfleuster i fynd.

Gwerthfawrogaf ddatganiad y Gweinidog y gwnaiff barhau i arolygu'r polisi ac ystyried yr effaith ar amgueddfeydd eraill, ond a wnaiff hi sicrhau y gweithia gyda Bwrdd Croeso Cymru, y sector preifat a'r awdurdodau lleol i fesur effaith y polisi hwn ar atyniadau eraill i ymwelwyr, nid amgueddfeydd yn unig? Os bydd angen, a wnaiff hi gadw meddwl agored i sicrhau ei bod yn barod i gyflwyno mesurau cefnogi eraill os profir bod y polisi'n cael effeithiau niweidiol ar atyniadau eraill?

Jenny Randerson: Mae cydnabod y gallai fod effaith o'r fath yn ffordd realistig o fynd o'i chwmpas. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n rheswm dros beidio â chyflwyno mynediad am ddim, oherwydd ein trysorau cenedlaethol yw'r rhain, a rhoddwyd llawer ohonynt i'r genedl fel cymynroddion a rhoddion. Mae gennym ddyletswydd i'w harddangos a hynny mor agored ag sy'n bosibl. Er hynny, yr wyf yn ymwybodol o bryderon perchennog Ogofâu Dan-yr-Ogof. Ysgrifennodd ataf o fewn wythnos neu ddwy i gyflwyno mynediad am ddim, gan awgrymu ei fod wedi cael effaith negyddol ar ei niferoedd ymwelwyr. Rhaid inni ystyried materion eraill sy'n effeithio ar niferoedd ymwelwyr, oherwydd gallai'r ffigurau fod wedi'u cymylu gan glwy'r traed a'r genau. Flwyddyn yn ddiweddarach, gallwn edrych arnynt mewn gwaed oerach.

Yr wyf yn ymwybodol hefyd o'r sefyllfa ynghylch Llancaiach Fawr. Fel y dywedais yn fy natganiad, mae'r amgueddfa genedlaethol yn gweithio'n agos gydag atyniadau eraill i sicrhau dull o weithredu ar y cyd. Mae'n ddiddorol nodi yn Llanberis, cyn y cyflwynwyd mynediad am ddim, y gwnaethpwyd llawer o waith ar gynlluniau cyd-farchnata a thocynnau cyfun gan grŵp o atyniadau a oedd yn cystadlu am fusnes. Maent wedi sicrhau'r niferoedd mwyaf posibl o gwsmeriaid drwy gydweithio. Mae'r amgueddfa genedlaethol yn mabwysiadu'r

looking at this in more depth.

Glyn Davies: I welcome your statement, but I will not pretend that I did not have reservations about this new policy when Tom Middlehurst announced it, even though I supported it. I still have reservations today, although I continue to be in favour of the policy. Like others, I welcome the successes; it is good news that Tom Middlehurst can be proud of his objectives being met. I am sure that he is quite full of himself, which he has every right to be.

One of my reservations has already been mentioned by Owen John Thomas and Ron Davies, namely the effect of free entry to museums and galleries on private sector attractions. The Andrew Logan museum in my village of Berriew has to charge for admission, and we all know of Dan-yr-Ogof Showcaves, which is part of the Mid and West Wales constituency and has been a matter of concern to us for some time.

The second matter that I will address is that of the integrity of entry numbers. Once you move away from a charging policy, you must be certain that when you talk about entry numbers, you know exactly what they are, and I ask you how you will monitor this. If you are not charging, it is easy to find different ways of assessing numbers. You must come up with a specific way of doing that. There is also the issue of responding to the market. When there is no admission fee, there is a danger of not having to worry about being dynamic in terms of attracting people and in terms of the exhibits on display.

Generally, this policy is a good one because it makes it easier for young people and families to take an interest in culture at an early age. Culture has always been important in Wales. Throughout history, all matters cultural have coursed through the veins of the people of Wales and today they are still underpinned by our language and its great festivals. We should be proud of that. I am pleased that the national characteristic of Wales continues.

Jenny Randerson: It is easy to forget that many local museums in Wales have had free

ymagwedd honno lle bo modd. Mae llawer o le i edrych ar hyn mewn mwy o ddyfnder.

Glyn Davies: Croesawaf eich datganiad, ond ni wnaif esgus nad oedd gennyf amheuron am y polisi newydd hwn pan gyhoeddodd Tom Middlehurst ef, er imi ei gefnogi. Mae gennyf amheuron heddiw o hyd, er fy mod yn dal o blaid y polisi. Fel eraill, croesawaf y llwyddiannau; mae'n newyddion da y gall Tom Middlehurst fod yn falch y cyflawnwyd ei amcanion. Yr wyf yn siŵr ei fod yn llawn ohono'i hun, ac mae ganddo bob hawl i fod.

Mae un o f'amheuron eisoes wedi'i grybwyll gan Owen John Thomas a Ron Davies, sef effaith mynediad am ddim i amgueddfeydd ac orielau ar atyniadau'r sector preifat. Mae'n rhaid i amgueddfa Andrew Logan yn fy mhentref i, Aberriw, godi tâl mynediad, a gwyddom oll am Ogofâu Dan-yr-Ogof, sy'n rhan o etholaeth y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin ac a fu'n destun pryder inni ers tro.

Yr ail fater a godaf yw cywirdeb niferoedd mynediad. Unwaith y symudwch i ffordd oddi wrth bolisi codi tâl, rhaid ichi fod yn sicr pan siaradwch am niferoedd mynediad, eich bod yn gwybod yn union beth ydynt, a gofynnaf ichi sut y gwnewch fonitro hyn. Os nad ydych yn codi tâl, mae'n hawdd dod o hyd i wahanol ffyrdd o asesu niferoedd. Rhaid ichi bennu ffordd benodol o wneud hynny. Cyfyd cwestiwn ymateb i'r farchnad hefyd. Pan nad oes tâl mynediad, mae perygl o beidio gorfod poeni am fod yn ddeinamig o ran denu pobl ac o ran yr eitemau a arddangosir.

Yn gyffredinol, polisi da yw hwn am ei fod yn ei gwneud hi'n haws i bobl ifanc a theuluoedd ymddiddori mewn diwylliant yn gynnar yn eu hoes. Bu diwylliant yn bwysig erioed yng Nghymru. Drwy gydol ein hanes, llifodd 'y pethe' drwy wythiennau'r Cymry a heddiw fe'u cynhelir o hyd gan ein hiaith a'n gwyliau mawr. Dylem fod yn falch o hynny. Yr wyf fi'n falch fod nodwedd genedlaethol Cymru'n parhau.

Jenny Randerson: Mae'n hawdd anghofio bod llawer o amgueddfeydd lleol yng

admission for a long time—indeed have probably always had it. The museum in Newport is one example, but it is only one of a significant number. Many also have free schemes for local people. To my knowledge, we have never discussed concerns about the impact of free admission to local museums on other attractions. We must consider this in terms of a tradition of free entry. I was concerned when entry charges were introduced for the national museum and many of its sites around 20 years ago, which led to a vast and overnight decline in visitor numbers.

I understand your point about visitor numbers. The requirements of public funding mean that we now have good methods of ensuring that entry numbers are accurate. There are many other reasons why you must keep accurate statistics. However, in the last year, I bore that in mind because we must be accurate on this scheme's implications. However, I do understand your point: I would not call it being responsive to the market, in terms of museums, but it is important that they remain up to date. The way that funding is now given, the terms of the national museums' remit letter and the terms on which funding is given to the Council of Museums in Wales mean that there is a strong, detailed emphasis on updating and providing money for that. I mentioned in my statement that the national museum does that sort of work already at Big Pit, the Swansea maritime museum and the Museum of the Welsh Woollen Industry, which are examples of where much attention has been given to the latest and best museum techniques. When you visit museums throughout the world, you realise that we have a tremendous tradition of excellent museums in the UK.

Peter Black: I also welcome today's statement and the huge success of free admission for museums and in raising their profile across Wales. When this policy was introduced, my wife worked for the National Museums and Galleries of Wales, and I know that it was a huge challenge for many museum staff. From my observations over the last year, they met that challenge with great enthusiasm and dedication. They rose to

Nghymru wedi rhoi mynediad am ddim ers tro byd—erioed, mae'n debyg. Un enghraifft yw'r amgueddfa yng Nghasnewydd, ond dim ond un o nifer sylweddol. Mae gan lawer gynlluniau am ddim i bobl leol hefyd. Hyd y gwn i, nid ydym erioed wedi trafod pryderon ynghylch effaith mynediad am ddim i amgueddfeydd lleol ac atyniadau eraill. Rhaid inni ystyried hyn yn nhermau traddodiad o roi mynediad am ddim. Yr oeddwn yn bryderus pan gyflwynwyd tâl mynediad i'r amgueddfa genedlaethol a llawer o'i safleoedd ryw 20 mlynedd yn ôl, a arweiniodd at gwmp enfawr yn niferoedd yr ymwelwyr dros nos.

Deallaf eich pwynt ynglŷn â niferoedd ymwelwyr. Mae gofynion ariannu cyhoeddus yn golygu fod gennym erbyn hyn ddulliau da o sicrhau bod niferoedd mynediad yn gywir. Mae sawl rheswm arall pam y mae'n rhaid cadw ystadegau cywir. Beth bynnag, yn y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, cedwais hynny mewn cof oherwydd mae'n rhaid inni fod yn gywir ynghylch goblygiadau'r cynllun hwn. Er hynny, yr wyf yn deall eich pwynt: ni fyddwn yn ei alw'n fod yn ymatebol i'r farchnad, o ran amgueddfeydd, ond y mae'n bwysig eu bod yn cadw gyda'r amserau. Mae'r modd y rhoddir cyllid yn awr, telerau llythyr cylch gwaith yr amgueddfa genedlaethol a thelerau rhoi cyllid i Gyngor Amgueddfeydd Cymru yn golygu bod pwyslais cryf a manwl ar ddiweddarau a darparu arian ar gyfer hynny. Soniais yn fy natganiad fod yr amgueddfa genedlaethol yn gwneud y math hwnnw o waith yn barod yn y Pwll Mawr, amgueddfa'r glannau yn Abertawe ac Amgueddfa Diwydiant Gwlân Cymru, sy'n enghreifftiau lle rhoddwyd sylw mawr i'r technegau amgueddfa diweddaraf a gorau. O ymweld ag amgueddfeydd drwy'r byd, sylweddolir bod gennym andros o draddodiad o amgueddfeydd gwych yn y DU.

Peter Black: Croesawaf innau ddatganiad heddiw a llwyddiant ysgubol mynediad am ddim i amgueddfeydd ac o ran codi eu proffil ar draws Cymru. Pan gyflwynwyd y polisi hwn, gweithiai fy ngwraig i Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cymru, a gwn y bu'n her enfawr i lawer o staff yr amgueddfeydd. O'r hyn a sylwais i dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, atebwyd yr her honno â brwdfrydedd ac ymroddiad mawr. Wynebwyd yr her yn yr un

the challenge in the same way that the Welsh public and visitors to Wales rose to the challenge of raising the profile of Welsh museums and ensuring that they are more widely and comprehensively used than before.

I know that in introducing this policy you built on the commitment in the Labour manifesto to ensure free access for all children, and the wider commitment in the Liberal Democrat manifesto. This is partnership in action, through the partnership Government and partnership agreement, led by a Liberal Democrat Minister.

I also welcome the investment in local museums that you announced as part of this statement. My colleague Kirsty Williams is particularly pleased at the money that is going to the Brecknock Museum in Powys. We should seek to encourage further investment in local museums because they have to compete with free admission to national museums. This policy is particularly important because it enables children and adults from all social backgrounds to freely appreciate, enjoy and learn from the national treasures of Wales. Wales has a rich cultural heritage and it is right that everyone should be able to access it.

Jenny Randerson: You are right to draw attention to the change of thinking that was required of national museum staff. I paid tribute to them in my statement but it is worth emphasising the point that the people who work in museums have had to take a new approach, partly because of vastly increased numbers and partly because there were visitors who were not used to visiting museums and the rules on care and so on; there has been an educational aspect. When I talk to people who work for the museum, it is clear that although it has been a difficult year for some in terms of much harder work than might have been anticipated, they have risen to the challenge magnificently and have done a tremendous job.

modd ag y wynebodd y cyhoedd yng Nghymru ac ymwelwyr â'r wlad yr her o godi proffil amgueddfeydd Cymru a sicrhau y cânt eu defnyddio'n helaethach ac yn fwy cynhwysfawr na chynt.

Wrth gyflwyno'r polisi hwn, gwn ichi adeiladu ar yr ymrwymiad ym maniffesto Llafur i sicrhau mynediad am ddim i blant, a'r ymrwymiad ehangach ym maniffesto'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Dyma bartneriaeth ar waith, drwy'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth a'r cytundeb partneriaeth, dan arweiniad Gweinidog Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol.

Croesawaf hefyd y buddsoddiad mewn amgueddfeydd lleol a gyhoeddwyd gennych fel rhan o'r datganiad hwn. Mae fy nghyd-Aelod Kirsty Williams yn arbennig o falch gyda'r arian ar gyfer Amgueddfa Brycheiniog ym Mhowys. Dylem geisio annog buddsoddi pellach mewn amgueddfeydd lleol oherwydd mae'n rhaid iddynt gystadlu â mynediad am ddim i amgueddfeydd cenedlaethol. Mae'r polisi hwn yn arbennig o bwysig am ei fod yn caniatáu rhwydd hant i blant ac oedolion o bob cefndir cymdeithasol werthfawrogi, mwynhau a dysgu oddi wrth drysorau cenedlaethol Cymru. Mae gan Gymru dreftadaeth ddiwylliannol gyfoethog ac mae'n iawn y dylai pawb allu cael mynediad ati.

Jenny Randerson: Yr ydych yn iawn i dynnu sylw at y newid meddylfryd yr oedd galw amdano gan staff yr amgueddfa genedlaethol. Telais deyrnged iddynt yn fy natganiad ond mae'n werth pwysleisio'r pwynt fod y bobl sy'n gweithio mewn amgueddfeydd wedi gorfod mynd ati mewn ffordd newydd, yn rhannol oherwydd niferoedd llawer iawn mwy ac yn rhannol oherwydd y ceid ymwelwyr nad oedd wedi arfer ymweld ag amgueddfeydd ac â'r rheolau ynghylch gofal ac ati; bu agwedd addysgol i'r gwaith. Pan siaradaf â phobl sy'n gweithio i'r amgueddfa, mae'n amlwg er y bu'n flwyddyn anodd i rai o ran gwaith llawer caletach na'r disgwyl, eu bod wedi ymateb yn wych i'r her ac wedi gwneud gwaith campus.

When I became Minister, I aimed at introducing a charge of £1 per head, but changes in the budget enabled us to give free admission, which I did with vast speed. That was also difficult for the museums, which had less than a month to adjust. We were seven months ahead of England introducing the same policy, and that was helpful in terms of the problems we were having as a nation with foot and mouth disease.

3:40 p.m.

We chose the sites for the new partnership carefully, with the location of national museum sites in mind. Brecknock Museum in Brecon, Oriel Ynys Môn in Anglesey and Wrexham County Borough Museum were chosen because they did not have large national museum sites close to them. People in those areas do not have the sort of access to the national museum enjoyed by those who live in Cardiff and Newport, and, in future, Swansea.

Jonathan Morgan: I congratulate, with a genuine sense of cross-party goodwill, the former Secretary for Post 16 Education and Training, Tom Middlehurst, who was responsible for initiating this policy in the first instance. As a member of the former Post 16 Education and Training Committee, I remember this policy being announced in Committee.

I make an observation and a suggestion that you may wish to consider. The Government's raft of policy announcements and congratulations are often about giving something for free: free access to museums, free bus passes, free school milk, free this, free that. It is easy to do something for nothing. Real innovation comes from creating something exciting with a limited resource. I believe that it would be exciting and innovative to announce a new—

The Presiding Officer: Order. You are in danger of making a speech.

Jonathan Morgan: I will be quick. It would be innovative, particularly in the run-up to Cardiff's Cultural Capital of Europe 2008

Pan ddeuthum yn Weinidog, anelais at gyflwyno tâl o £1 y pen, ond galluogodd newidiadau yn y gyllideb inni roi mynediad am ddim, rhywbeth a wneuthum yn gyflym iawn. Yr oedd hynny hefyd yn anodd i'r amgueddfeydd, a gafodd lai na mis i ymaddasu. Yr oeddem saith mis ar y blaen i Loegr yn cyflwyno'r polisi, ac yr oedd hynny'n fuddiol o safbwynt y problemau a wynebem fel cenedl gyda chlwy'r traed a'r genau.

Dewiswyd y safleoedd ar gyfer y bartneriaeth newydd yn ofalus, gan feddwl am leoliad safleoedd yr amgueddfa genedlaethol. Dewiswyd Amgueddfa Brycheiniog yn Aberhonddu, Oriel Ynys Môn ac Amgueddfa Bwrdeistref Sirol Wrecsam oherwydd nad oedd ganddynt safleoedd mawr yr amgueddfa genedlaethol yn agos atynt. Nid oes gan bobl yn yr ardaloedd hynny y math o fynediad i'r amgueddfa genedlaethol a fwynheir gan drigolion Caerdydd a Chasnewydd ac, yn y dyfodol, Abertawe.

Jonathan Morgan: Llongyfarchaf, gyda gwir deimlad o ewyllys da trawsbleidiol, y cyn-Ysgrifennydd Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16, Tom Middlehurst, a oedd yn gyfrifol am gychwyn y polisi hwn yn y lle cyntaf. Fel aelod o'r hen Bwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16, cofiaf y polisi hwn yn cael ei gyhoeddi yn y Pwyllgor.

Gwnaf sylw ac awgrym yr hoffech ei ystyried efallai. Mae a wnelo llu cyhoeddiadau polisi a llongyfarchiadau'r Llywodraeth yn aml â rhoi rhywbeth am ddim: mynediad am ddim i amgueddfeydd, tocynnau bws am ddim, llaeth ysgol am ddim, hyn a'r llall yn rhad ac am ddim. Mae'n hawdd gwneud rhywbeth am ddim. Daw gwir arloesedd o greu rhywbeth cyffrous gydag adnoddau cyfyngedig. Credaf y byddai'n gyffrous ac yn arloesol cyhoeddi—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr ydych mewn perygl o wneud araith.

Jonathan Morgan: Byddaf yn gyflym. Byddai'n arloesol, yn enwedig yn y cyfnod yn arwain at gais Caerdydd am fod yn

bid, to announce a national art gallery for Wales. Will the Minister consider this in any of her future visions?

Jenny Randerson: On your last point, as you know, the national museum is about to embark on the second phase of its consultation on the future of national art, and I assume that your question was inspired by *The Western Mail* today. On the previous point, the idea that it is easy to do something for nothing is simplistic. We have not approached this in a something-for-nothing fashion; this has been a significant investment by the Welsh Assembly Government. Tom Middlehurst may be concerned about the fact that he has a Conservative fan club. We must remember that the Tories introduced charges for museums 20 years ago, leading to a dramatic drop-off in visitor numbers.

Lorraine Barrett: I welcome this policy, as do all Members. At last, thanks to Gordon Brown's budgets, we have righted the wrong in Wales and England. Will you do all that you can with the partners involved to ensure that galleries and museums help other attractions to promote their facilities, for example, by providing leaflets promoting attractions within a certain radius, so that everyone is working together—

The Presiding Officer: Order. I must be even-handed in stopping people.

Jenny Randerson: I am working with the national museum to ensure that that partnership works in practice, and it may be appropriate to discuss the matter when the national museum comes before the Culture Committee, of which you are a member.

Dafydd Wigley: Pwy bynnag sydd yn gyfrifol—Tom Middlehurst neu Jenny Randerson—mae hyn yn newyddion da, ac yr ydym yn ei groesawu. A wnewch chi ymuno â mi i longyfarch Dafydd Roberts a'i dîm yn Llanberis ar y cynnydd aruthrol yn nifer yr ymwelwyr yno? A wnewch chi sicrhau y bydd adnoddau ar gael i leoedd fel Llanberis sydd yn dangos potensial aruthrol? Byddai

Brifddinas Diwylliant Ewrop 2008, cyhoeddi oriel gelf genedlaethol i Gymru. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ystyried hyn yn unrhyw un o'i gweledigaethau i'r dyfodol?

Jenny Randerson: Ar eich pwynt olaf, fel y gwyddoch, mae'r amgueddfa genedlaethol ar fin cychwyn ar ail gam ei hymgyngoriad ar ddyfodol celf genedlaethol, a thybiaf yr ysbrydolwyd eich cwestiwn gan *The Western Mail* heddiw. Ar y pwynt blaenorol, mae'r syniad ei bod yn hawdd gwneud rhywbeth am ddim yn or-syml. Nid ydym wedi mynd at hyn mewn ysbryd rhywbeth-am-ddim; bu hyn yn fuddsoddiad arwyddocaol gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Efallai y bydd Tom Middlehurst yn poeni am y ffaith bod ganddo glwb cefnogwyr Ceidwadol. Rhaid inni gofio y cyflwynodd y Torïaid daliadau am fynediad i amgueddfeydd 20 mlynedd yn ôl, gan arwain at gwmp drammatig mewn niferoedd ymwelwyr.

Lorraine Barrett: Croesawaf y polisi hwn, fel y gwna pob Aelod. O'r diwedd, diolch i gyllidebau Gordon Brown, yr ydym wedi unioni'r cam yng Nghymru a Lloegr. A wnewch chi bopeth a allwch gyda'r partneriaid perthnasol i sicrhau bod oriellau ac amgueddfeydd yn helpu atyniadau eraill i hyrwyddo'u cyfleusterau, er enghraifft, drwy ddarparu taflenni'n hyrwyddo atyniadau o fewn radiws penodol, fel bod pawb yn cydweithio—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Rhaid imi ddangos chwarae teg wrth dewi pobl.

Jenny Randerson: Yr wyf yn gweithio gyda'r amgueddfa genedlaethol i sicrhau bod y bartneriaeth honno'n gweithio'n ymarferol, ac efallai y bydd yn briodol trafod y mater pan ddaw'r amgueddfa genedlaethol gerbron y Pwyllgor Diwylliant, yr ydych chi'n aelod ohono.

Dafydd Wigley: Whoever is responsible—be it Tom Middlehurst or Jenny Randerson—this is good news, and we welcome it. Will you join me in congratulating Dafydd Roberts and his team in Llanberis on the massive increase in visitor numbers there? Will you ensure that resources are made available for places such as Llanberis, which show great potential? More investment would

mwy o fuddsoddi yno yn golygu hyd yn oed mwy o ymwelwyr.

Jenny Randerson: I join you in congratulating Dafydd Roberts. He and his team have done a tremendous job there. They have risen to the challenge. I have made it clear that theirs is a great success story and that their partnership with the whole group of visitor attractions in the area is also a great success story. I know that the national museum has invested considerable resources there recently, which is probably the key to their success in part.

Delyth Evans: I welcome the overwhelming success of this important policy. I would have thought that even Peter Black would have had the sense not to try to claim credit for what is a key United Kingdom Labour Government manifesto commitment. However, there are clearly no depths to which some people will not stoop. The Minister has already mentioned the Museum of the Welsh Woollen Industry at Dre-fach Felindre, near Llandysul. As you know, Minister, there has been a 35 per cent increase in visitor numbers to that museum since the policy was introduced. You will be aware that this site in Dre-fach has an important role in terms of supporting the west Wales economy. I have two questions—

The Presiding Officer: Order. You can only ask one question.

Delyth Evans: Has any assessment been made of the financial contribution of the free admissions policy to regions such as west Wales, and, if not, would you consider carrying out such an assessment?

Jenny Randerson: It will be made, Delyth, in the context of considering the overall impact of the free admissions policy.

Nick Bourne: I welcome the statement. All Assembly Members backed the policy. Perhaps we could share plaudits, rather than take cheap shots like those made earlier. All Assembly Members backed the policy. That is a matter of record. However, there are certain anomalies—Dan-yr-Ogof Showcaves have been mentioned. I was surprised to hear

attract even more visitors.

Jenny Randerson: Ymunaf â chi i longyfarch Dafydd Roberts. Gwnaeth ef a'i dîm waith aruthrol yn y fan honno. Maent wedi codi i wynebu'r her. Yr wyf wedi dweud yn glir mai stori lwyddiant fawr yw eu stori hwy a bod eu partneriaeth gyda'r grŵp cyfan o atyniadau i ymwelwyr yn yr ardal yn stori lwyddiant fawr hefyd. Gwn fod yr amgueddfa genedlaethol wedi buddsoddi adnoddau sylweddol yno'n ddiweddar, sydd, mae'n debyg, yn allwedd i'w llwyddiant yn rhannol.

Delyth Evans: Croesawaf lwyddiant ysgubol y polisi pwysig hwn. Buaswn wedi meddwl y buasai gan hyd yn oed Peter Black y synnwyr i beidio â cheisio hawlio clod am rywbeth sydd yn ymrwymiad maniffesto allweddol gan Lywodraeth Lafur y Deyrnas Unedig. Er hynny, mae'n amlwg y gwnaiff rhai pobl ymostwng i unrhyw ddyfnderau. Mae'r Gweinidog eisoes wedi sôn am Amgueddfa Diwydiant Gwlân Cymru yn y Dre-fach Felindre, ger Llandysul. Fel y gwyddoch, Weinidog, bu cynnydd o 35 y cant yn niferoedd ymwelwyr â'r amgueddfa honno ers cyflwyno'r polisi. Byddwch yn ymwybodol fod gan y safle hwn yn y Dre-fach rôl bwysig o ran cynnal economi'r Gorllewin. Mae gennyf ddau gwestiwn—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Dim ond un cwestiwn y cewch ei ofyn.

Delyth Evans: A oes unrhyw asesiad wedi'i wneud o gyfraniad ariannol y polisi mynediad am ddim i ranbarthau fel y Gorllewin, ac, os nad oes, a fydddech yn ystyried gwneud asesiad o'r fath?

Jenny Randerson: Fe'i gwneir, Delyth, yng nghyd-destun ystyried effaith gyffredinol y polisi mynediad am ddim.

Nick Bourne: Croesawaf y datganiad. Cefnogodd holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad y polisi. Efallai y dylem rannu'r clod, yn hytrach na thanio ergydion rhad fel y rheini a wnaed yn gynharach. Cefnogodd holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad y polisi. Mae hynny ar gofnod. Er hynny, y mae rhai anghysonderau—soniwyd am Ogofâu Dan-yr-Ogof. Fe'm synnwyd o

the First Minister ask the Liberal Democrats what the owner's politics were. It never occurred to me to ask him when he came to consult me in surgery: it is not relevant. However, the issue needs to be addressed. You are well aware of it, Minister, because I have addressed it to you. I urge you to consider measures to alleviate the problems faced by certain attractions—I say certain attractions, because if a family has a choice between going to the Big Pit or Dan-yr-Ogof Showcaves, they will go to the Big Pit. How will we tackle that particular problem? That should be the next stage. Let us have some vision and drive this forward. Also, what is going to happen with our national gallery?

Jenny Randerson: The choice between Big Pit and Dan-yr-Ogof Showcaves is hardly a choice that people face most days, as they are completely different attractions. The only common feature is that you go underground. They are not in the same place and do not represent the same sector. It is important that Members deal with the impact on other attractions in general rather than a specific example. There is much work to be done in looking at the general impact.

Tom Middlehurst: I acknowledge the free admission policy's huge success. I have enjoyed visiting many of the sites, such as Llanberis, the Big Pit, the national museum and St Fagans. We have a treasure trove of information and educational material to be used by all the people of Wales and beyond. Last week, I had the privilege of taking the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee to Blaenavon. The world heritage site has huge significance for us in Wales. Across the valley is the Big Pit, with free admission, which is an issue that we must address. Will you consider how we can ensure that the opportunities offered by the Blaenavon world heritage site are fully exploited and that the whole experience of those important sites that we have inherited through our industrial history can be enjoyed?

Jenny Randerson: You pinpoint an interesting issue, Tom, which has not previously been mentioned. Blaenavon is

glywed Prif Weinidog Cymru yn holi'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol beth oedd gwleidyddiaeth y perchennog. Ni feddyliais am ofyn iddo pan ddaeth i ymgynghori â mi yn fy nghynghorfa: nid yw'n berthnasol. Fodd bynnag, mae angen ystyried y mater. Yr ydych yn ymwybodol iawn ohono, Weinidog, gan imi ei godi gyda chi. Fe'ch anogaf i ystyried mesurau i liniaru'r problemau a wynebir gan rai atyniadau—dywedaf rai atyniadau, oherwydd os bydd gan deulu ddewis o fynd i'r Pwll Mawr neu Ogofâu Dan-yr-Ogof, ânt i'r Pwll Mawr. Sut yr awn i'r afael â'r broblem arbennig honno? Dyna ddylai'r cam nesaf fod. Gadewch inni gael gweledigaeth a gyrru hyn yn ei flaen. Hefyd, beth sy'n mynd i ddigwydd gyda'n horiel genedlaethol?

Jenny Randerson: Go brin fod pobl yn wynebu'r dewis rhwng Pwll Mawr ac Ogofâu Dan-yr-Ogof yn aml, gan eu bod yn atyniadau cwbl wahanol. Yr unig nodwedd gyffredin yw eich bod yn mynd dan y ddaear. Nid ydynt yn yr un lle ac ni chynrychiolant yr un sector. Mae'n bwysig fod Aelodau'n delio â'r effaith ar atyniadau eraill yn gyffredinol yn hytrach nag enghraifft benodol. Mae llawer o waith i'w wneud o ran edrych ar yr effaith gyffredinol.

Tom Middlehurst: Cydnabyddaf lwyddiant aruthrol y polisi mynediad am ddim. Yr wyf wedi mwynhau ymweld â llawer o'r safleoedd, fel Llanberis, y Pwll Mawr, yr amgueddfa genedlaethol a Sain Ffagan. Mae gennym drysorfa o wybodaeth a deunydd addysgol i'w defnyddio gan holl bobl Cymru a thu hwnt. Yr wythnos diwethaf, cefais y fraint o fynd â Phwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth i Flaenafon. Mae gan y safle treftadaeth byd arwyddocâd enfawr i ni yng Nghymru. Ar draws y cwm mae'r Pwll Mawr, gyda mynediad am ddim, sy'n fater y mae'n rhaid inni ei ystyried. A wnewch chi feddwl sut y gallwn sicrhau y gwneir y mwyaf o'r cyfleoedd a gynigir gan safle treftadaeth byd Blaenafon ac y gellir mwynhau profiad cyflawn y safleoedd pwysig hyn a etifeddwyd gennym drwy'n hanes diwydiannol?

Jenny Randerson: Yr ydych yn rhoi'ch bys ar fater diddorol, Tom, na soniwyd amdano o'r blaen. Mae Blaenafon ym mhorthffolio

within Sue Essex's ministerial portfolio. Working across portfolios is important to ensure that that kind of partnership takes place. The tourism aspect has been mentioned this afternoon. That is an economic development issue, on which I have worked closely with economic development Ministers.

3:50 p.m.

Geraint Davies: I am sure that you agree that we should encourage young people to consider taking up a career in the museums and galleries of Wales. Unfortunately, the museum in Cardiff is unable to offer work experience opportunities for school pupils. What action have you taken to remedy this unsatisfactory situation?

Jenny Randerson: I am aware of that; the reason is that Government indemnity does not cover the national museum. My officials are working with all possible speed to resolve this issue because it is important that young people have the opportunity to work in a museum setting.

Rosemary Butler: I start by declaring an interest, as I have the great privilege of being the Chair of the board of the new national waterfront museum in Swansea. I thank the Minister for Culture, Sports and the Welsh Language and the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities for their help on that project.

I am disappointed to hear about competition between museums. Visiting museums can be a life-enhancing experience; it is a joy to take children to them. I suggest that we have co-operation. Owen John Thomas made a point about cultural tourism. Wales should be one of the richest tourism areas in the world in terms of what it has to offer in that regard. I suggest that, instead of competition, we make Wales a cultural co-operative of the world.

Jenny Randerson: It is important that we raise our sights. Co-operation is the key. People do not only visit a museum once, and then tire of doing so—or at least they should not. If you visit one museum, it should spur

gweinidogol Sue Essex. Mae gweithio ar draws portffolios yn bwysig er mwyn sicrhau bod y math hwnnw o bartneriaeth yn digwydd. Crybwyllwyd yr agwedd dwristiaeth y prynhawn yma. Mater datblygu economaidd yw hwnnw, yr wyf wedi cydweithio'n agos arno gyda Gweinidogion datblygu economaidd.

Geraint Davies: Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch y dylem annog pobl ifanc i ystyried ymgymryd â gyrfa yn amgueddfeydd ac orielau Cymru. Yn anffodus, ni all yr amgueddfa yng Nghaerdydd gynnig cyfleoedd profiad gwaith i ddisgyblion ysgol. Beth yr ydych wedi'i wneud i wella'r sefyllfa anfodddhaol hon?

Jenny Randerson: Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o hynny; y rheswm yw nad yw yswiriant y Llywodraeth yn ymestyn dros yr amgueddfa genedlaethol. Mae fy swyddogion yn gweithio cyn gynted ag y gallant i ddatrys y mater hwn oherwydd mae'n bwysig y caiff pobl ifanc gyfle i weithio mewn amgueddfa.

Rosemary Butler: Dechreuaf drwy ddatgan buddiant, gan imi gael y fraint fawr o fod yn Gadeirydd bwrdd amgueddfa newydd y glannau yn Abertawe. Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Iaith Gymraeg a'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau am eu cymorth ar y prosiect hwnnw.

Yr wyf yn siomedig o glywed am gystadleuaeth rhwng amgueddfeydd. Gall ymweld ag amgueddfeydd gyfoethogi bywydau; mae'n bleser mynd â phlant iddynt. Awgrymaf y dylem gydweithredu. Gwnaeth Owen John Thomas bwynt am dwristiaeth ddiwylliannol. Dylai Cymru fod yn un o'r ardaloedd twristiaeth cyfoethocaf yn y byd o ran yr hyn sydd ganddi i'w gynnig yn hynny o beth. Awgrymaf, yn lle cael cystadleuaeth, ein bod yn gwneud Cymru'n ganolfan gydweithredol ddiwylliannol i'r byd.

Jenny Randerson: Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn codi'n golygon. Cydweithredu yw'r allwedd. Ni fydd pobl yn ymweld ag amgueddfa unwaith yn unig, ac wedyn yn blino ar wneud—neu o leiaf ni ddylai hynny

you to visit another. Going back to my roots as an economics teacher, if you visit a site where you do not have to pay, you will have money left in your pocket to visit another where you have to pay. That is why this scheme is important to all our attractions and our entire tourism sector.

The Presiding Officer: As Members will have noticed, I extended the time for that statement by five minutes because, like many of our museums, it seemed to be getting more interesting towards the end.

ddigwydd. Os ymwelwch ag un amgueddfa, dylai hynny'ch ysgogi i ymweld ag un arall. Â mynd yn ôl at fy ngwreiddiau fel athrawes economeg, os ymwelwch â safle lle nad oes raid ichi dalu, bydd gennych arian ar ôl yn eich poced i ymweld ag un arall lle mae'n rhaid talu. Dyna pam y mae'r cynllun hwn yn bwysig i'n holl atyniadau a'n sector twristiaeth cyfan.

Y Llywydd: Fel y sylwa'r Aelodau, ychwanegais bum munud at yr amser a roddwyd i'r datganiad hwnnw oherwydd, fel llawer o'n hamgueddfeydd, yr oedd fel pe bai'n mynd yn fwy diddorol tua'r diwedd.

Datganiad Busnes Business Statement

The Minister for Rural Affairs and Assembly Business (Carwyn Jones): I cannot guarantee that this business statement will get more interesting towards the end.

Members will wish to be aware that there is a minor change to this week's business. On Thursday, we will not propose the motion to approve the Meat (Hazard Analysis and Critical Control Points) Regulations 2002; that will take place on 30 May. This morning, the Business Committee discussed my draft business statement for the next three weeks as shown on the Chamberweb under supporting documents. The Deputy Presiding Officer determined under Standing Order No. 22.5 that the following items of legislation need not be referred to Subject Committees for extended consideration: the Town and Country Planning (Fees for Applications and Deemed Applications) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2002; the Town and Country Planning (General Development Procedure) (Amendment) (Wales) Order 2002 and the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) (Amendment) (Wales) Order 2002.

Alun Pugh: Despite the efforts of the Sports Council for Wales, it is much easier to represent your country if you happen to live near Cardiff. Will you schedule a statement from the Minister for Culture, Sports and the Welsh Language on these practices? Wales is a small nation and it will not achieve sporting

Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig a Threfnydd y Cynulliad (Carwyn Jones): Ni allaf warantu yr aiff y datganiad busnes hwn yn fwy diddorol tua'r diwedd.

Bydd Aelodau'n dymuno gwybod fod mân newid i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Ddydd Iau, ni fyddwn yn cynnig y cynnig i gymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cig (Dadansoddi Peryglon a Phwynt Rheoli Critigol) 2002; gwneir hynny ar 30 Mai. Y bore yma, trafododd y Pwyllgor Busnes fy natganiad busnes drafft am y tair wythnos nesaf fel a ddangosir ar we'r Siambr dan ddogfennau ategol. Penderfynodd y Dirprwy Lywydd dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.5 nad oedd angen cyfeirio'r eitemau deddfwriaeth canlynol i Bwyllgorau Pwnc ar gyfer ystyriaeth estynedig: Rheoliadau Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Ffioedd ar gyfer Ceisiadau a Cheisiadau Tybiedig) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2002; Gorchymyn Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Gweithdrefn Datblygu Cyffredinol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2002 a Gorchymyn Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Datblygu Cyffredinol a Ganiateir) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2002.

Alun Pugh: Er gwaethaf ymdrechion Cyngor Chwaraeon Cymru, mae'n llawer haws cynrychioli'ch gwlad os digwyddwch fyw ger Caerdydd. A wnewch chi drefnu datganiad gan y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg ar yr arferion hyn? Cenedl fechan yw Cymru ac ni wnaiff

excellence unless we harness all the talents available.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwbodol o gais y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig i drafod y rheoliadau enseffalopathi sbyngffurf trosglwyddadwy cyn iddo eu cyflwyno i'r Cynulliad. A wnaiff barchu barn a dymuniad aelodau'r Pwyllgor a rhoi cyfle i ni drafod y rheoliadau hyn?

Jonathan Morgan: Will the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning consider making a statement on today's announcement by the Secretary of State for Education and Skills on schools exclusion policy? Children will now be permanently excluded from school if they are found to have committed a drug-related offence. Does that relate specifically to Wales and how will it fit in with the Government's current policies on school exclusions?

Carwyn Jones: On Alun Pugh's and Jonathan Morgan's points, both the relevant Ministers are present in the Chamber and will have heard what has been said. I will discuss the best way of moving matters forward with them.

Ynglŷn â phwynt Rhodri Glyn, efallai nad yw'n berthnasol i'r Pwyllgor Busnes nac i fusnes y Siambr, ond mae llythyr wedi'i anfon heddiw at Glyn Davies, Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor, yn dweud beth fydd y ffordd ymlaen o ran barn y Llywodraeth am hyn.

*Derbyniwyd y datganiad busnes.
Business statement adopted.*

Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order

Nick Bourne: Point of order. This relates to a matter that I touched upon during questions to the First Minister but it also clearly has an impact on the National Assembly. It relates to comments made by the special adviser to Paul Murphy about the conduct of business in the Assembly. It causes concern to Assembly Members when a democratically passed

lwyddo rhagori ym myd chwaraeon oni harneisiwn yr holl dalentau sydd ar gael.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: The Minister will be aware of the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee's request to discuss the transmissible spongiform encephalopathies regulations before he presents them to the Assembly. Will he respect the views and wishes of Committee members and give us the opportunity to discuss these regulations?

Jonathan Morgan: A wnaiff y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ystyried gwneud datganiad ar y cyhoeddiad heddiw gan yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Addysg a Sgiliau ar bolisi gwahardd o ysgolion? Bellach caiff plant eu gwahardd yn barhaol o'r ysgol os darganfyddir eu bod wedi cyflawni trosedd cysylltiedig â chyffuriau. A yw hynny'n ymwneud yn benodol â Chymru, a sut y gwnaiff gydorwedd â pholisïau cyfredol y Llywodraeth ar wahardd o'r ysgol?

Carwyn Jones: Ar bwyntiau Alun Pugh a Jonathan Morgan, mae'r ddau Weinidog perthnasol yn bresennol yn y Siambr a byddant wedi clywed yr hyn a ddywedwyd. Trafodaf y ffordd orau o symud materion ymlaen â hwy.

Concerning Rhodri Glyn's point, which may not be relevant to the Business Committee or business in the Chamber, a letter has been sent today to Glyn Davies, the Committee Chair, outlining the way forward, in terms of the Government's position on this.

Nick Bourne: Pwynt o drefn. Mae a wnelo hyn â mater y cyfeiriais ato yn ystod cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru ond mae hefyd yn amlwg yn effeithio ar y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Mae'n ymwneud â sylwadau a wnaethpwyd gan gynghorydd arbennig Paul Murphy ynghylch gweithrediad busnes yn y Cynulliad. Mae'n achos pryder i Aelodau'r

resolution is described, on record, as 'pathetic', and as being symptomatic of an irresponsible approach to politics. How do you view that, Llywydd? What does it do for relations between the Assembly and Westminster? There are concordats in place and it may be appropriate to comment about the functioning of those concordats.

The Presiding Officer: This is not directly a matter for me. The relationship between Westminster and the National Assembly is evolving. The Secretary of State for Wales's position is specified in our constitution in that he is an attender and, perhaps, an ex officio member of the Assembly in that sense—although he is clearly not an elected Member—as is the Parliamentary Under-Secretary of State at the Wales Office. It behoves all who attend the Assembly to respect this institution.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Pwynt o drefn. Mae'n debyg eich bod yn cofio, Lywydd, i'r Prif Weinidog wneud datganiad, flwyddyn yn ôl i yfory, am adroddiad Bentley Jennison a awgrymai fod Cyd-Bwyllgor Addysg Cymru yn trosglwyddo'r papurau perthnasol i'r heddlu. A ydych wedi cael cais gan y Prif Weinidog i wneud datganiad o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.8 iddo ddweud wrth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol beth yn union yw sefyllfa ei Gabinet bellach? Mae wyth aelod yn y Cabinet yn awr er bod naw cyn i Mike German adael y Cabinet. Credaf, gan fod blwyddyn wedi mynd heibio ers i'r papurau gael eu cyflwyno i'r heddlu, y byddai'n fuddiol i'r Cynulliad gael gwybod beth yn union yw'r sefyllfa. Pan gyflwynodd y Prif Weinidog ei ddatganiad i'r Cynulliad, flwyddyn yn ôl, dywedodd:

'Bydd yr heddlu yn ffordd llawer cynt a gwell o roi terfyn ar y materion hyn.'

Flwyddyn yn ddiweddarach, credaf fod cyfrifoldeb ar y Prif Weinidog i ddweud wrthym pryd y mae'n disgwyl y bydd yn gallu enwi aelod arall o'i Gabinet. Mae'n fater difrifol nad yw'r sefyllfa wedi'i datrys mewn blwyddyn.

Cynulliad pan ddisgrifir, ar ddu a gwyn, benderfyniad a basiwyd yn ddemocrataidd fel un 'pathetig', ac fel un sy'n nodweddiadol o agwedd anghyfrifol at wleidyddiaeth. Beth yw'ch barn chi ar hynny, Lywydd? Beth mae'n ei wneud dros y berthynas rhwng y Cynulliad a San Steffan? Mae concordatiau wedi'u sefydlu ac efallai y byddai'n briodol rhoi sylw ar y modd y gweithreda'r concordatiau hyn.

Y Llywodraeth: Nid yw hwn yn fater i mi'n uniongyrchol. Mae'r berthynas rhwng San Steffan a'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn esblygu. Mae gan Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru le yn ein cyfansoddiad fel mynychwr ac, efallai, aelod o'r Cynulliad yn rhinwedd ei swydd yn yr ystyr hwnnw—er, yn amlwg, nad yn Aelod etholedig—fel y mae'r is-Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Seneddol yn Swyddfa Cymru. Dylai pawb sy'n mynychu'r Cynulliad barchu'r sefydliad hwn.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Point of order. You will probably recall, Presiding Officer, that the First Minister made a statement a year ago tomorrow about the Bentley Jennison report that implied that the Welsh Joint Education Committee was transferring the relevant papers to the police. Has the First Minister approached you with a view to making a statement under Standing Order No. 6.8 to inform the National Assembly what exactly the position of his Cabinet is at present? The Cabinet now consists of eight members, although there were nine before Mike German stood down. I believe, as a year has passed since the papers were handed over to the police, that it would be beneficial for the Assembly to be informed about the exact state of play. When the First Minister gave his statement to the Assembly, a year ago, he said:

'The police route represents a far swifter and better vehicle for bringing these matters to a conclusion.'

A year on, I believe that the First Minister has a responsibility to tell us when he expects to be able to name another member of his Cabinet. The fact that this matter has not been resolved in a year gives real cause for concern.

Jonathan Morgan: Further to that point of order, Presiding Officer, the Welsh Conservative Party would certainly offer its full support to the First Minister if he were to make a statement to Plenary to clarify the current position with respect to the former Deputy First Minister. From the perspective of education, we were all concerned last year about the impact on the Welsh Joint Education Committee and much reference was made to a cloud hanging over that institution. A cloud still hangs over the Assembly, with the First Minister wanting to keep a seat free in Cabinet for the former Deputy First Minister, if he is cleared of the charges that have been laid before him. Therefore we would support a statement from the First Minister.

Kirsty Williams: Further to that point of order, I think that Jonathan Morgan needs to reflect on those comments about charges being laid before a Member. As far as I am aware no charges have been laid before any Member of the National Assembly and he needs to retract those words.

4:00 p.m.

The Presiding Officer: I do not believe that anything that was said was contrary to our Standing Orders, but I will review the record. As regards the substantive point, Cabinet Ministers can come to the Assembly and make a statement whenever they wish. I am sure that they will do so when they are able and willing, on this and on other issues.

Jonathan Morgan: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, Lywydd, byddai Plaid Geidwadol Cymru'n sicr yn cynnig ei chefnogaeth lawn i Brif Weinidog Cymru pe gwnâi ddatganiad i'r Cyfarfod Llawn i egluro'r sefyllfa bresennol ynglŷn â'r cyn Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog. O safbwynt addysg, yr oeddem i gyd yn bryderus y llynedd am yr effaith ar Gyd-Bwyllgor Addysg Cymru a chyfeiriwyd yn helaeth at gwmwl yn hofran dros y sefydliad hwnnw. Mae cwmwl yn dal i hofran dros y Cynulliad, a'r Prif Weinidog yn dal i ddimuno cadw sedd wag yn y Cabinet i'r cyn Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog, os ceir ef yn ddi-euog o'r cyhuddiadau a wnaed yn ei erbyn. Felly byddem yn cefnogi datganiad gan Brif Weinidog Cymru.

Kirsty Williams: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, credaf fod angen i Jonathan Morgan feddwl am y sylwadau hynny ynghylch cyhuddiadau yn erbyn Aelod. Hyd y gwn i, nid oes unrhyw gyhuddiadau wedi'u gwneud yn erbyn unrhyw Aelod o'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ac mae angen iddo dynnu'r geiriau hynny'n ôl.

Y Llywydd: Ni chredaf fod dim a ddywedwyd yn groes i'n Rheolau Sefydlog, ond edrychaf ar y cofnod. Ynglŷn â'r pwynt yn ei sylwedd, gall Gweinidogion Cabinet ddod i'r Cynulliad a gwneud datganiad pryd bynnag y mynnont. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnânt hynny pan fyddant yn abl ac yn fodlon, ar y mater hwn ac eraill.

Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion Composite Motion: Approval of Orders

Y Llywydd: O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn.

The Presiding Officer: Under Standing Order No. 22.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig a Threfnydd y Cynulliad (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiad fod

The Minister for Rural Affairs and Assembly Business (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25:

the National Assembly, acting under Standing Order No. 22.25:

- | | |
|--|--|
| <p>1. yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Addysg (Gwybodaeth Ysgolion) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2002 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 16 Ebrill 2002; ac</p> <p>2. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw faterion sy'n destun pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft Rheoliadau Addysg (Gwybodaeth Ysgolion) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 30 Ebrill 2002;</p> <p>3. yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Adroddiadau Blynyddol Llywodraethwyr Ysgol (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2002 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 16 Ebrill 2002; ac</p> <p>4. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw faterion sy'n destun pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Adroddiadau Blynyddol Llywodraethwyr Ysgol (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 30 Ebrill 2002. (NDM1055)</p> | <p>1. approves the Education (School Information) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2002 laid in the Table Office on 16 April 2002; and</p> <p>2. considers the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order the Education (School Information) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2002, laid in the Table Office on 30 April 2002;</p> <p>3. approves the School Governors' Annual Reports (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2002 laid in the Table Office on 16 April 2002; and</p> <p>4. considers the report of the Legislation Committee, which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order the School Governors' Annual Reports (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2002, laid in the Table Office on 30 April 2002. (NDM1055)</p> |
|--|--|

Cynnig: O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion: For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary

Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Rogers, Peter
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Kirsty
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Gwerthuso Athrawon Ysgol (Cymru) a Rheoliadau
 Llywodraethu Ysgolion (Cylch Gwaith) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2002
 Approval of the School Teacher Appraisal (Wales) Regulations 2002 and the
 School Government (Terms of Reference) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations
 2002**

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I propose that **Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly considers the principle of the School Teacher Appraisal (Wales) Regulations 2002 laid in the Table Office on 16 April 2002. (NDM1058)

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Gwerthuso Athrawon Ysgol (Cymru) 2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 16 Ebrill 2002. (NDM1058)

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee, which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the School Teacher Appraisal (Wales) Regulations 2002, laid in the Table Office on 30 April 2002;

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5, mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Gwerthuso Athrawon Ysgol (Cymru) 2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 30 Ebrill 2002;

2. approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 16 April 2002 and the regulatory appraisal laid in Table Office on 16 April 2002. (NDM1059)

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 16 Ebrill 2002 a'r arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 16 Ebrill 2002. (NDM1059)

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly considers the y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried

principle of the School Government (Terms of Reference) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2002 laid in the Table Office on 16 April 2002. (NDM1056)

I propose that

the National Assembly:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the School Government (Terms of Reference) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2002, laid in the Table Office on 30 April 2002;

2. approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 16 April 2002 and the regulatory appraisal, laid in Table Office on 16 April 2002. (NDM1057)

I ask the National Assembly for Wales to approve the drafts of the School Teacher Appraisal (Wales) Regulations 2002, which will replace the existing Education (School Teacher Appraisal) (Wales) Regulations 1999, and the School Government (Terms of Reference) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2002.

These regulations are being introduced to support the proposals on performance management for teachers that I announced, following consultation, on 12 October 2001. Performance management, or teacher appraisal, is a system of annual performance review that involves professional dialogue on aims and achievements between teachers and their team leaders and headteachers and their governing body. Existing regulations already provide for the appraisal of the performance of school teachers in Wales. These new regulations amend the current system to introduce an annual performance management cycle for all teachers with performance objectives set at the outset of the cycle, monitoring during the cycle and a performance review at the end. Together, they aim to provide a regulatory framework within which all schools in Wales would operate and which will provide a clearer procedure for assessing teachers'

egwyddor Rheoliadau Llywodraethu Ysgolion (Cylch Gwaith) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2002 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 16 Ebrill 2002. (NDM1056)

Cynigiau fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5, mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Llywodraethu Ysgolion (Cylch Gwaith) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 30 Ebrill 2002;

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 16 Ebrill 2002 a'r arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 16 Ebrill 2002. (NDM1057)

Gofynnaf i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru gymeradwyo drafftiau Rheoliadau Gwerthuso Athrawon Ysgol (Cymru) 2002, a fydd yn cymryd lle'r Rheoliadau Addysg (Gwerthuso Athrawon Ysgol) (Cymru) 1999 presennol, a Rheoliadau Llywodraethu Ysgolion (Cylch Gwaith) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2002.

Cyflwynir y rheoliadau hyn i gefnogi'r cynigion ar reoli perfformiad i athrawon a gyhoeddais, wedi ymgynghori, ar 12 Hydref 2001. Mae rheoli perfformiad, neu werthuso athrawon, yn system o adolygu perfformiad blynyddol sy'n cynnwys deialog broffesiynol am amcanion a chyflawniadau rhwng athrawon a'u harweinwyr tîm a'u prifathrawon a'u corff llywodraethol. Mae rheoliadau sy'n bodoli eisoes yn darparu ar gyfer gwerthuso perfformiad athrawon ysgol yng Nghymru. Mae'r rheoliadau newydd hyn yn diwygio'r system gyfredol i gyflwyno cylch rheoli perfformiad blynyddol i bob athro neu athrawes, gan osod amcanion perfformiad ar ddechrau'r cylch, monitro yn ystod y cylch ac adolygu perfformiad ar y diwedd. Gyda'i gilydd, eu nod yw darparu fframwaith rheoleiddiol y byddai pob ysgol yng Nghymru yn gweithredu o'i mewn ac a fydd yn darparu gweithdrefn gliriach ar gyfer asesu perfformiad athrawon ynglŷn â

performance in relation to agreed priorities and objectives. The regulations aim to ensure that all schools have performance management policies and procedures in place which are consistent in their approach. The regulations clearly define the steps required to formulate a performance management policy, the role of the appraiser and the timing of the appraisal cycle and will help to ensure that there is a consistent approach to objective setting for all teachers. The new system should help teachers improve their effectiveness for their own benefit and for the benefit of the children whom they teach. The introduction of a formal annual performance review will help ensure that training and professional development needs are identified and that steps are taken to meet them consistently and regularly. It will support teachers in taking responsibility for their own development, and teachers who need help in identifying weaknesses and the steps needed for improved performance will benefit from a better appraisal system.

I want the new performance management system to be implemented properly and consistently throughout Wales. We have been working with local education authorities' consortia on planning for and delivering the training required to achieve this aim. Training will be provided for all headteachers and for governors' representatives from all maintained schools in Wales and will be funded centrally. We will also fund the training of the performance management consultants and advisers who will be assisting schools to set up the performance management arrangements.

The regulations have been subject to consultation on the policy and detail with a wide range of bodies that have an interest in the teaching profession and the wider education sector. My report to the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee on 9 May 2001 included details of the consultation on the draft regulations and my report to the Committee on 17 October 2001 included a note on the outcome of the consultation and how I proposed to take it forward. All comments have been taken into account in drawing up the final draft that is before you now. I hope that the Assembly will vote unanimously in favour of the motions.

blaenoriaethau ac amcanion y cytunwyd arnynt. Nod y rheoliadau yw sicrhau bod gan bob ysgol bolisiau a gweithdrefnau rheoli perfformiad ar waith sy'n gyson eu hagwedd. Mae'r rheoliadau'n diffinio'n glir y camau angenrheidiol wrth ffurfio polisi rheoli perfformiad, rôl y gwerthuswr ac amseriad y cylch gwerthuso, a byddant yn helpu i sicrhau cysondeb wrth osod amcanion ar gyfer athrawon ym mhobman. Dylai'r system newydd helpu athrawon i wella'u heffeithiolrwydd er eu budd eu hunain ac er budd y plant a ddysgant. Bydd cyflwyno adolygiad perfformiad blynyddol ffurfiol yn gymorth i sicrhau y nodir anghenion hyfforddi a datblygu proffesiynol ac y cymerir camau i'w hateb yn gyson ac yn rheolaidd. Bydd yn cefnogi athrawon wrth iddynt gymryd gyfrifoldeb am eu datblygiad eu hunain, a bydd athrawon sydd angen cymorth i nodi gwendidau a'r camau angenrheidiol i wella'u perfformiad yn elwa ar system werthuso well.

Mae arnaf eisiau i'r system reoli perfformiad gael ei gweithredu'n iawn ac yn gyson drwy Gymru gyfan. Yr ydym wedi bod yn cydweithio â chonsortia awdurdodau addysg lleol ar gynllunio a chyflwyno'r hyfforddiant angenrheidiol i gyrraedd y nod hwn. Darperir hyfforddiant i'r holl brifathrawon ac i gynrychiolwyr llywodraethwyr o bob ysgol a gynhelir yng Nghymru ac fe'i hariennir yn ganolog. Byddwn hefyd yn ariannu hyfforddiant i'r ymgynghorwyr a chynghorwyr rheoli perfformiad a fydd yn helpu ysgolion i sefydlu'r trefniadau rheoli perfformiad.

Cyn llunio'r rheoliadau hyn ymgynghorwyd ar y polisi a'r manylion ag amrediad eang o gyrff sydd â diddordeb yn y proffesiwn dysgu a'r sector addysg ehangach. Yr oedd fy adroddiad i'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ar 9 Mai 2001 yn cynnwys manylion yr ymgynghoriad ar y rheoliadau drafft ac yr oedd fy adroddiad i'r Pwyllgor ar 17 Hydref 2001 yn cynnwys nodyn ar ganlyniad yr ymgynghori a sut y bwriadwn fynd â'r mater ymlaen. Cymerwyd pob sylw i ystyriaeth wrth lunio'r drafft terfynol sydd ger eich bron yn awr. Gobeithiaf y pleidleisia'r Cynulliad yn unfrydol o blaid y cynigion.

The Presiding Officer: Before I call Helen Mary Jones to speak, perhaps I should clarify that although the Minister has proposed the motions on both regulations, I was given to understand that these would be debated separately.

Helen Mary Jones: I declare an interest as a registered teacher. Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales will support these regulations, as we broadly supported the principles and procedures in the performance management guidance notes issued last year. Effective and supportive appraisal is a vital part of all individuals' professional life, as it can raise standards in institutions and, as the Minister has rightly said, provide support for professional development. All teachers have a right to be part of such an effective appraisal system.

We will support the regulations, but I have some questions and concerns, which I hope that the Minister will address. It is widely acknowledged that the appraisal system for teachers introduced in 1991 was not a success. A major factor identified by the profession for this failure was lack of resources, particularly in terms of time. The Minister has mentioned additional training and resources. However, if appraisers are to make accurate assessments of performance, they will, for example, need the time to observe teachers teaching. Without that, there is a serious risk that the appraisal may deteriorate into nothing more than a paper exercise, particularly in larger institutions.

The regulatory appraisal attached to these regulations suggests that little extra work will be needed in

'good schools already implementing existing regulations.'

However, evidence suggests, and the Estyn report states, that there are still many schools that have not yet been able to adopt best practice, particularly in terms of observing lessons as part of appraisal. I hope that the Minister will acknowledge today that the funding needed to properly implement this

Y Llywydd: Cyn imi alw ar Helen Mary Jones i siarad, efallai y dylwn egluro, er bod y Gweinidog wedi cynnig y cynigion ar y ddwy set o reoliadau, y cefais i ar ddeall y câi'r rhain eu trafod ar wahân.

Helen Mary Jones: Datganaf fuddiant fel athrawes drwyddedig. Bydd Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn, gan inni gefnogi'n fras yr egwyddorion a'r gweithdrefnau yn y nodiadau canllaw ar reoli perfformiad a gyhoeddwyd y llynedd. Mae gwerthuso effeithiol a chefnogol yn rhan hanfodol o fywyd proffesiynol pob unigolyn, gan y gall godi safonau mewn sefydliadau ac, fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog yn gywir, darparu cefnogaeth ar gyfer datblygiad proffesiynol. Mae gan bob athro ac athrawes hawl i fod yn rhan o system werthuso effeithiol o'r fath.

Cefnogwn y rheoliadau, ond mae gennyf rai cwestiynau a phryderon, y gobeithiaf y gwnaiff y Gweinidog eu hateb. Cydnabyddir yn gyffredinol nad oedd y system werthuso a gyflwynwyd i athrawon yn 1991 yn llwyddiant. Elfen bwysig a nodwyd gan y proffesiwn am y methiant hwn oedd diffyg adnoddau, yn enwedig o ran amser. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi crybwyll hyfforddiant ac adnoddau ychwanegol. Fodd bynnag, os yw gwerthuswyr am wneud asesiadau cywir o berfformiad, bydd arnynt, er enghraifft, angen yr amser i wyllo athrawon yn dysgu. Heb hynny, mae perygl difrifol y gall y gwerthuso ddirywio i fod yn ddim mwy nag ymarfer ar bapur, yn enwedig mewn sefydliadau mwy.

Awgryma'r gwerthusiad rheoleiddiol sydd ynghlwm wrth y rheoliadau hyn mai ychydig o waith ychwanegol y bydd ei angen mewn

'ysgolion da sydd eisoes yn gweithredu'r rheoliadau presennol.'

Fodd bynnag, awgryma tystiolaeth, a dywed adroddiad Estyn, fod llawer o ysgolion o hyd sydd heb allu mabwysiadu arferion gorau, yn enwedig o ran arsylwi gwersi fel rhan o werthuso. Gobeithiaf y gwnaiff y Gweinidog gydnabod heddiw y gall y cyllid sydd ei angen i weithredu'r system hon yn iawn yn

system may well exceed what the regulatory appraisals suggest and that she will commit herself to fully meeting those extra costs, because it will not be possible for schools or local education authorities to do that.

A key role of any appraisal system is to identify training needs and development opportunities, as the Minister has said. I am concerned about the apparent lack of clarity regarding the relationship between the appraisal system and continuous professional development. They are part of the same process, but I would like to hear more from the Minister on how the appraisal system will link into continuous professional development and what input the General Teaching Council of Wales will have in the appraisal system regarding, for example, what should be appraised.

It is vital that this appraisal system does not fail. Without proper resourcing, that is a real risk. Will the Minister update the Assembly on the progress of her discussions with the Welsh Local Government Association, which were mentioned in the regulatory appraisal, about the extra costs that local authorities are likely to face in relation to extending their advisory services to enable the appraisal scheme to operate effectively? The Minister mentioned this in her introduction, but can she tell us how much these extra costs are likely to be and whether she can commit to meeting them fully? Are the costs budgeted for or will other areas of budget have to be cut in order to meet them?

Jonathan Morgan: The Welsh Conservative Party will vote in favour of the regulations, although we have continuously expressed many reservations in relation to performance management and the system used by the Government to assess teachers and to assess whether they are competent enough to progress through the pay spine. We have many concerns, for example, in relation to the fact that headteachers, particularly in primary schools, who have huge burdens already will require sufficient time to undertake the duties that will be imposed on them in this regard.

wir fod yn fwy na'r hyn a awgryma'r gwerthusiadau rheoleiddiol, ac y gwnaiff hi ymrwymo i dalu'r costau ychwanegol hynny'n llawn, oherwydd na fydd yn bosibl i ysgolion nac awdurdodau addysg lleol wneud hynny.

Rôl allweddol unrhyw system werthuso yw nodi anghenion hyfforddi a chyfleoedd datblygu, fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog. Yr wyf yn bryderus ynghylch y diffyg eglurder ymddangosiadol ynghylch y berthynas rhwng y system werthuso a datblygiad proffesiynol parhaus. Maent yn rhan o'r un broses, ond hoffwn glywed mwy gan y Gweinidog ynghylch sut y bydd y system werthuso'n cysylltu â datblygiad proffesiynol parhaus a pha fewnbwn a fydd gan Gyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol Cymru yn y system werthuso o safbwynt, er enghraifft, beth y dylid ei werthuso.

Mae'n hanfodol na fydd y system werthuso hon yn methu. Heb adnoddau priodol, mae hynny'n berygl go iawn. A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i'r Cynulliad am hynt ei thrafodaethau â Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, a grybwyllwyd yn y gwerthusiad rheoleiddio, ynglŷn â'r costau ychwanegol y mae awdurdodau lleol yn debygol o'u hwynebu er mwyn ehangu eu gwasanaethau cynghori i alluogi'r cynllun gwerthuso i weithio'n effeithiol? Soniodd y Gweinidog am hyn yn ei chyflwyniad, ond a all hi ddweud wrthym faint fydd y costau ychwanegol hyn yn ôl pob tebyg ac a all ymrwymo i'w talu'n llawn? A yw'r costau wedi'u cyllidebu ynteu a fydd yn rhaid cwtogi rhannau eraill o'r gyllideb er mwyn eu talu?

Jonathan Morgan: Bydd Plaid Geidwadol Cymru'n pleidleisio o blaid y rheoliadau, er ein bod yn gyson wedi mynegi llawer o amheuon ynghylch rheoli perfformiad a'r system a ddefnyddir gan y Llywodraeth i asesu athrawon ac i asesu a ydynt yn ddigon cymwys i fynd ymlaen drwy'r golofn gyflogau. Mae gennym llawer o bryderon, er enghraifft, ynglŷn â'r ffaith y bydd ar brifathrawon, yn enwedig mewn ysgolion cynradd, sydd eisoes dan faich anferth, angen digon o amser i gyflawni'r dyletswyddau a osodir arnynt yn hyn o beth.

Many of the headteachers throughout Wales observing the passing of these regulations today will do so with some fear of the bureaucratic burdens that will be placed on them and on teachers and governors. Since my appointment as a primary school governor, I can fully appreciate the enormous burdens that we place on school governors. These regulations will add to their workload and that should be considered. Any future developments in this direction should take into account the workload placed on those who are volunteers.

Headteachers will also fear the budgetary process—in Cardiff, some schools are facing deficits of up to £49,000 in the current financial year—and budget increases that are not sufficient because they must also cover the additional costs of teachers' pay. Some headteachers know that some local education authorities have not passed on the increases in education expenditure because of the bureaucratic costs that they must cover in terms of administering performance management. Many schools face a bleak few months until the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning examines the position in Wales. I know that many schools face large deficits and huge bureaucratic burdens and that some local education authorities now claim that they do not have the money to cover the costs of this scheme. I hope that the Minister takes that into account when she examines the scheme in coming months.

4:10 p.m.

Mick Bates: The Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome the intention to provide a fair and consistent system, and I doubt whether anyone would disagree with that. However, we are concerned about issues referred to by previous speakers—and these are raised accurately and clearly in the regulatory appraisal—in relation to the burden placed on headteachers, particularly in primary schools.

While a day's training is provided, and headteachers will have funding enabling

Bydd llawer o'r prifathrawon drwy Gymru, wrth weld pasio'r rheoliadau hyn heddiw, yn teimlo rhywfaint o ofn am y beichiau biwrocraidd a osodir arnynt ac ar athrawon a llywodraethwyr. Ers fy mhenodi'n llywodraethwr ysgol gynradd, gallaf werthfawrogi'n llawn y beichiau anferth a roddwn ar lywodraethwyr ysgol. Bydd y rheoliadau hyn yn ychwanegu at eu baich gwaith a dylid ystyried hynny. Dylai unrhyw ddatblygiadau i'r cyfeiriad hwn yn y dyfodol ystyried y baich gwaith a osodir ar wirfoddolwyr.

Bydd prifathrawon yn ofni'r broses gyllidebol hefyd—yng Nghaerdydd, mae rhai ysgolion yn wynebu diffygion o hyd at £49,000 yn y flwyddyn ariannol gyfredol—a chodiadau i'w cyllideb na fyddant yn ddigonol oherwydd fod yn rhaid iddynt dalu costau ychwanegol cyflogau athrawon hefyd. Gŵyr rhai prifathrawon fod rhai awdurdodau addysg lleol heb basio'r codiadau gwariant addysg ymlaen oherwydd y costau biwrocraidd y mae'n rhaid iddynt eu hwynebu o ran gweinyddu rheoli perfformiad. Mae llawer o ysgolion yn wynebu ychydig fisoedd llwm hyd nes bydd y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn archwilio'r sefyllfa yng Nghymru. Gwn fod llawer o ysgolion yn wynebu diffygion mawr a beichiau biwrocraidd enfawr a bod rhai awdurdodau addysg lleol yn honni'n awr nad oes ganddynt yr arian i dalu costau'r cynllun hwn. Gobeithiaf y gwnaiff y Gweinidog ystyried hynny pan fydd yn arolygu'r cynllun yn y misoedd a ddaw.

Mick Bates: Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n croesawu'r bwriad i ddarparu system deg a chyson, ac amheuaif a fyddai neb yn anghytuno â hynny. Er hynny, yr ydym yn bryderus am faterion y cyfeiriwyd atynt gan siaradwyr blaenorol—a chodir y rhain yn gywir ac yn glir yn y gwerthusiad rheoleiddiol—ynghylch y baich a roddir ar brifathrawon, yn enwedig mewn ysgolion cynradd.

Er y darperir diwrnod o hyfforddiant, a chaiff prifathrawon gyllid i'w galluogi i hyfforddi'u

them to train their own staff for two days, will the Minister address the issue of how each teacher's appraisal will be undertaken by each headteacher? Too often the imposition of additional burdens result in a headteacher rushing around using spare time during the school day to undertake an important process. The outcome of this appraisal will be used to inform headteachers on pay decisions. I have a terrible vision of headteachers having to undertake full appraisals of teachers between lessons, or at lunchtime. Will you consider issuing guidelines and funding to allow appraisals to take place in the proper surroundings? They should not be held during the pressure of a school day, which is a terrible imposition, but outside that time. Perhaps a further day of training are undertaken, so that such appraisals could be held in comfortable surroundings. Real conclusions and assistance could be on offer to teachers on the results of their appraisals.

Finally, I focus particularly on funding issues. Paragraph 17 of the regulatory appraisal states that it is difficult to undertake a review of the costs for operating and maintaining the new performance regulations. The Minister may have to return at some stage with a report on the use of this funding, and whether there is a shortfall. The monitoring process and reporting back will be important for us to assess the financial burden on authorities, which we must ultimately meet.

The Presiding Officer: Before I call the Minister to reply, perhaps I should clear up any confusion. Where two items of legislation are to be debated together in future—I know that we have done this in the past—that should be subject to discussion in the Business Committee. Perhaps we could then be advised of that. I suggest that the Business Committee should look at this issue to establish a clearer principle for the future.

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I apologise if there was no dialogue between our offices on debating these items of legislation together.

staff eu hunain am ddau ddiwrnod, a ddywed y Gweinidog sut y gwerthusir pob athro gan bob prifathro? Yn rhy aml bydd gosod beichiau ychwanegol yn golygu bod prifathrawon yn rhuthro o gwmpas yn defnyddio'u hamser rhydd yn ystod y diwrnod ysgol er mwyn ymgymryd â phroses bwysig. Defnyddir canlyniad y gwerthuso hwn i roi gwybodaeth y gall prifathrawon seilio penderfyniadau cyflog arni. Mae gennyf weledigaeth ofnadwy o brifathrawon yn gorfod gwneud gwerthusiadau llawn o athrawon rhwng gwersi, neu yn yr awr ginio. A wnewch chi ystyried cyhoeddi canllawiau a chyllid i ganiatáu gwneud gwerthusiadau yn yr amgylchiadau priodol? Ni ddylid eu cynnal yn ystod helbul diwrnod gwaith, sy'n faich ofnadwy, ond y tu allan i'r amser hwnnw. Efallai y gellid cynnal diwrnod hyfforddi ychwanegol, fel y gellid gwneud yr asesiadau hyn mewn amgylchedd cyfforddus. Gallai casgliadau gwirioneddol a chymorth gael ei gynnig i athrawon ar sail eu gwerthusiad.

Yn olaf, canolbwyntiaf yn arbennig ar faterion ariannu. Dywed paragraff 17 o'r gwerthusiad rheoleiddiol ei bod yn anodd gwneud adolygiad o gostau gweithredu a chynnal y rheoliadau perfformiad newydd. Efallai y bydd yn rhaid i'r Gweinidog ddod yn ôl ryw bryd gydag adroddiad ar y defnydd a wneir o'r cyllid hwn, ac a oes diffyg. Bydd y broses fonitro ac adrodd yn ôl yn bwysig i ni er mwyn asesu'r baich ariannol ar yr awdurdodau, y bydd yn rhaid inni ei dalu yn y pen draw.

Y Llywydd: Cyn imi alw ar y Gweinidog i ateb, efallai y dylwn glirio unrhyw ddrwsych. Lle mae dwy eitem o ddeddfwriaeth i'w trafod gyda'i gilydd yn y dyfodol—gwn ein bod wedi gwneud hyn yn y gorffennol—dylai hynny fod yn amodol ar drafodaeth yn y Pwyllgor Busnes. Efallai wedyn y caem wybod am hynny. Awgrymaf y dylai'r Pwyllgor Busnes edrych ar y mater hwn er mwyn sefydlu egwyddor gliriach ar gyfer y dyfodol.

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Ymddiheuraf os na fu deialog rhwng ein swyddfeydd ynghylch trafod y ddwy eitem ddeddfwriaeth hyn gyda'i gilydd.

Picking up Members' points—

The Presiding Officer: Order. My office was made aware of that during the morning, but I was not made aware that there was agreement among the parties on that. When I asked whether it had been agreed in Business Committee, I was told that it had not been. I abide by what was agreed in Business Committee.

Jane Davidson: Thank you, Llywydd. In terms of Members' points, I emphasise that much time has been taken to prepare these performance management arrangements. They started when Rosemary Butler was Minister, seeking to find the appropriate means of getting consistent performance management arrangements in schools. Schools are already obliged to have them, but they have not been consistent across Wales, as the regulatory appraisal clearly shows. We wanted to ensure that we had consistent arrangements, so that we could adequately monitor them through the Assembly.

We have committed to fund the development of these arrangements fully this year. Our current assessment is that that may cost around £3.7 million, which is what is in the budget to deal with it. However, we have made that commitment and, in a sense, until we do the work with the schools, we will not know how much of that money is needed for these arrangements.

On Mick's reference to paragraph 17 of the regulatory appraisal, the second sentence points out that several schools have arrangements in place at present and we would need to see how they would take those arrangements forward. We are fully funding this and working with the LEAs to deliver it. I am pleased about the positive dialogue with our union colleagues on this matter. The National Association of Schoolmasters and Union of Women Teachers will speak at this Friday's education conference in terms of the performance management arrangement in England. It differs from ours, as we have a wider definition of pupil progress, an aspect that received all-party support in the Assembly.

I godi pwyntiau'r Aelodau—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Cafodd fy swyddfa i wybod am hynny yn ystod y bore, ond nid oeddwn yn ymwybodol fod cytundeb rhwng y pleidiau ar hynny. Pan ofynnais a ydoedd wedi'i gytuno yn y Pwyllgor Busnes, dywedwyd wrthyf nad ydoedd. Glynaf at yr hyn a gytunwyd yn y Pwyllgor Busnes.

Jane Davidson: Diolch, Lywydd. O ran pwyntiau'r Aelodau, pwysleisias y cymerwyd llawer o amser i baratoi'r trefniadau rheoli perfformiad hyn. Dechreuwyd ar y gwaith pan oedd Rosemary Butler yn Weinidog, i geisio canfod y modd priodol i gael trefniadau rheoli perfformiad mewn ysgolion. Mae eisoes yn ofynnol i ysgolion eu cael, ond nid ydynt wedi bod yn gyson ar draws Cymru, fel y dengys y gwerthusiad rheoleiddiol yn glir. Yr oedd arnom eisiau sicrhau bod gennym drefniadau cyson, fel y gallem eu monitro'n ddigonol drwy'r Cynulliad.

Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i ariannu datblygiad y trefniadau hyn yn llawn eleni. Ein hasesiad cyfredol yw y gallai hynny gostio o gwmpas £3.7 miliwn, sef yr hyn sydd yn y gyllideb i ddelio ag ef. Beth bynnag, yr ydym wedi gwneud yr ymrwymiad hwnnw ac, mewn ystyr, hyd nes y gwnawn y gwaith gyda'r ysgolion, ni fyddwn yn gwybod faint o'r arian hwnnw sydd ei angen ar gyfer y trefniadau hyn.

Ynghylch cyfeiriad Mick at baragraff 17 o'r gwerthusiad rheoleiddiol, noda'r ail frawddeg fod gan nifer o ysgolion drefniadau ar hyn o bryd ac y byddai angen inni weld sut y byddent yn gweithredu'r trefniadau hynny. Yr ydym yn ariannu hyn yn llawn ac yn gweithio gyda'r AALlau i'w weithredu. Yr wyf yn falch am y ddeialog gadarnhaol gyda'n cyfeillion undebol ynglŷn â'r mater hwn. Bydd Cymdeithas Genedlaethol yr Ysgolfeistri ac Undeb yr Athrawesau'n siarad yn y gynhadledd addysg dydd Gwener yma am y trefniant rheoli perfformiad yn Lloegr. Mae'n wahanol i'n trefn ni, gan fod gennym ddiffiniad ehangach o gynnydd disgyblion, agwedd a gafodd gefnogaeth y pleidiau i gyd yn y Cynulliad.

We must ensure that the three inset days that we put in place will not be the only training for this. Schemes should be in place by November this year, according to the timetable. The regulations will be active from September. Then comes the headteachers' appraisal and training, with full appraisal regulations and delivery across Wales by October 2004. This is, therefore, two years in development.

Helen Mary Jones: You mentioned that governor training will be available. How will you ensure that governors avail themselves of those training opportunities? It is a key factor in the appraisal scheme that the governors must understand it as well as the professional staff. The perception in the profession is that such understanding is patchy. It may be particularly difficult for junior school governors to find the time to attend. Does the Minister agree that the governor training should be delivered in bite-size pieces so that people can attend it, and that there is a clear expectation that, when they make professional judgments on people's professional behaviour, they have the information and skills to do so fully?

Jane Davidson: That is the kind of training that is needed this year with the support of the LEAs. We have varied the governing body role from that of our colleagues in England in that England is considering advice from private sector companies, while we work in an advisory role with the local authorities. That has worked well for us during the threshold arrangements. That is what is happening at present. Schools will have their frameworks in place in the autumn term. They will then proceed on a timetable that I have already announced to the Committee, and Wales will be fully covered by October 2004.

I am grateful to Members for endorsing the important link between professional development and performance appraisal. It would be inappropriate to operate outside the regulations in giving the GTC a role in professional appraisal, but there will be close links to the continuing professional

Rhaid inni sicrhau nad y tridiau o hyfforddiant mewn swydd a sefydlwn fydd yr unig hyfforddiant ar gyfer hyn. Dylai cynlluniau fod yn barod erbyn Tachwedd eleni, yn ôl yr amserlen. Bydd y rheoliadau'n weithredol o fis Medi. Wedyn bydd angen gwerthuso a hyfforddi prifathrawon, gyda'r rheoliadau gwerthuso llawn a'r gweithredu ar draws Cymru'n digwydd erbyn mis Hydref 2004. Cymer hyn ddwy flynedd, felly, i'w ddatblygu.

Helen Mary Jones: Dywedasoeh y bydd hyfforddiant ar gael i lywodraethwyr. Sut y gwnewch chi sicrhau bod llywodraethwyr yn manteisio ar y cyfleoedd hyfforddi hynny? Mae'n ffactor allweddol yn y cynllun gwerthuso bod yn rhaid i'r llywodraethwyr ei ddeall gystal â'r staff proffesiynol. Y canfyddiad yn y proffesiwn yw mai bratiog yw'r ddealltwriaeth honno. Fe all fod yn arbennig o anodd i lywodraethwyr ysgolion cynradd ganfod amser i fynychu. A gytuna'r Gweinidog y dylid darparu'r hyfforddiant i lywodraethwyr fesul tamaid fel y gall pobl ei fynychu, a bod disgwyliad clir, pan ffurfiant farn broffesiynol ar ymddygiad proffesiynol pobl, bod ganddynt y wybodaeth a'r sgiliau i wneud hynny'n llawn?

Jane Davidson: Dyna'r math o hyfforddiant sydd ei angen eleni gyda chefnogaeth yr AALLau. Yr ydym wedi amrywio rôl y corff llywodraethol oddi wrth yr hyn a wneir yn Lloegr, gan fod Lloegr yn ystyried cyngor gan gwmnïau yn y sector preifat, tra'n bod ni'n gweithio mewn rôl gynghori gyda'r awdurdodau lleol. Mae hynny wedi gweithio'n dda i ni yn ystod y trefniadau trothwy. Dyna sydd yn digwydd ar hyn o bryd. Bydd ysgolion wedi sefydlu'u fframweithiau erbyn tymor yr hydref. Wedyn symudant ymlaen yn ôl amserlen yr wyf eisoes wedi'i chyhoeddi i'r Pwyllgor, a bydd Cymru'n gwbl weithredol erbyn mis Hydref 2004.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Aelodau am ategu'r cysylltiad pwysig rhwng datblygiad proffesiynol a gwerthuso perfformiad. Byddai'n amhriodol gweithredu y tu allan i'r rheoliadau a rhoi rôl i'r Cyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol mewn gwerthuso proffesiynol, ond bydd cysylltiadau agos â'r datblygiad

development available to the teacher. Again, the arrangements in Wales, which have been welcomed by the Assembly, are that continuing professional development will operate across the teaching profession in Wales, instead of just in two years as in England. That enables us to tie in performance management cycles and continuing professional development opportunities with each other.

The School Government (Terms of Reference) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2002 lay out the principles for the governing bodies. The governing bodies will only be involved in the appraisal of headteachers in terms of setting up specific governors to deal with that matter. Governors Wales will be working with governing bodies, as well as the LEAs, on delivering that responsibility. All Members would welcome the fact that we have a superbly qualified teaching force. We must now ensure that we tie professional development to performance appraisal to allow people to develop during their career progression. I commend the motions to you.

Janet Ryder: Point of order. I declare an interest as my husband and I are registered teachers. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh no'.]

The Presiding Officer: Order. Members should not groan at this declaration of interest. I draw your attention to section 72 of the Government of Wales Act 1998, which makes clear that Members should declare an interest before taking part in any Assembly proceedings. I have sought extensive legal advice on this matter and I am advised that 'taking part in proceedings' means not simply speaking in proceedings, as set out in the annex to Standing Order No. 4, but includes voting too. As I have said, there is some legal authority for this view. I am seeking further legal advice on this matter. I will then ensure that it is referred to the Committee on Standards of Conduct. In the meantime, I advise Members to err on the side of caution. Non-declaration of interest in our rather stringent regime could constitute a criminal offence. We wish to ensure that the Assembly continues to be an open institution in which

proffesiynol parhaus sydd ar gael i athrawon. Eto, y trefniadau yng Nghymru, a groesawyd gan y Cynulliad, yw y bydd datblygiad proffesiynol parhaus yn gweithredu ar draws y proffesiwn dysgu yng Nghymru, yn hytrach na dim ond mewn dwy flynedd fel yn Lloegr. Golyga hynny y gallwn glymu cylchoedd rheoli perfformiad a chyfleoedd datblygu proffesiynol parhaus i mewn gyda'i gilydd.

Mae Rheoliadau Llywodraethu Ysgolion (Cylch Gwaith) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2002 yn amlinellu'r egwyddorion i'r cyrff llywodraethol. Yr unig ymwneud fydd gan y cyrff llywodraethol â gwerthuso prifathrawon fydd o ran sefydlu llywodraethwyr penodol i ddelio â'r mater hwnnw. Bydd Llywodraethwyr Cymru yn gweithio gyda chyrff llywodraethol, yn ogystal â'r AALLau, ar weithredu'r cyfrifoldeb hwnnw. Byddai pob Aelod yn croesawu'r ffaith bod gennym weithlu dysgu sydd â chymwysterau gwych. Yn awr rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn cydglymu datblygiad proffesiynol â gwerthuso perfformiad i ganiatáu i bobl ddatblygu yn ystod eu gyrfaedd. Cymeradwyaf y cynigion ichi.

Janet Ryder: Pwynt o drefn. Datganaf fuddiant gan fod fy ngŵr a mi'n athrawon trwyddedig. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O, na'.]

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Ni ddylai Aelodau ochneidio ar y datganiad buddiant hwn. Tynnaf eich sylw at adran 72 Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, sy'n datgan yn glir y dylai Aelodau ddatgan buddiant cyn cymryd rhan mewn unrhyw rai o drafodion y Cynulliad. Yr wyf wedi ceisio cyngor cyfreithiol helaeth ar y mater hwn ac fe'm cynghorir bod 'cymryd rhan mewn trafodion' yn golygu nid dim ond siarad mewn trafodaethau, fel a amlinellir yn yr atodiad i Reol Sefydlog Rhif 4, ond ei fod yn cynnwys pleidleisio hefyd. Fel y dywedais, y mae rhywfaint o awdurdod cyfreithiol i'r farn hon. Yr wyf yn ceisio cyngor cyfreithiol pellach ar y mater hwn. Fe sicrhaf wedyn y caiff ei gyfeirio i'r Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad. Yn y cyfamser, cynghoraf Aelodau i fod yn or-ofalus os rhywbeth. Gallai peidio â datgan buddiant yn ein trefn led gaeth fod yn drosedd. Dymunwn sicrhau bod y Cynulliad

Members always display integrity. On the other hand, I recognise the indignity of having a kind of Mexican wave in terms of Members standing to declare an interest in debates. That is the current position. I now call for other declarations of interest relating to this matter before we vote on the motions.

4:20 p.m.

Dafydd Wigley: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, o ystyried y rhan ganolog y mae'r Llywydd yn ei chwarae yn y materion hyn, a ddylai hefyd ddatgan ei fuddiannau?

Y Llywydd: Rhaid i mi gael barn gyfreithiol ymhellach ar y mater hwnnw. Yn ffurfiol, yr hyn a nodir yng nghofrestr buddiannau'r Aelodau yw datganiad o fuddiant. Yr ydym i gyd wedi cofrestru'n briodol.

David Davies: Further to that point of order, and on a serious matter, I have never declared my previous occupation, which was in transport and shipping. Should I do so every time I speak in a transport debate? I am not in receipt of any payments now, nor have I been since the establishment of the Assembly.

The Presiding Officer: The annex to Standing Order No. 4 refers specifically to 'a registered interest'. If you have registered such an interest then, clearly, you must declare it. If you wish to discuss your personal circumstances I am happy to do that. In the meantime, will Members who wish to declare an interest please do so by standing.

Lorraine Barrett, Mick Bates, Peter Black, Christine Chapman, David Davies, Geraint Davies, Janet Davies, Sue Essex, Michael German, William Graham, John Griffiths, Christine Gwyther, Gareth Jones, Huw Lewis, David Lloyd, David Melding, Jonathan Morgan, Jenny Randerson, Janet Ryder, Owen John Thomas, Rhodri Glyn Thomas, Dafydd Wigley *rose*—

Y Llywydd: Galwaf am bleidlais ar egwyddor y Rheoliadau Gwerthuso

yn parhau i fod yn sefydliad agored lle bydd Aelodau bob amser yn dangos gonestrwydd. Ar y llaw arall, cydnabyddaf fod diffyg urddas mewn cael rhyw fath o don Fecsicanaidd o Aelodau'n sefyll i ddatgan buddiant mewn dadleuon. Dyna'r sefyllfa bresennol. Galwaf yn awr am ddatganiadau buddiant eraill yng nghyswllt y mater hwn cyn inni bleidleisio ar y cynigion.

Dafydd Wigley: Further to that point of order, given the central role that the Presiding Officer plays in these matters, should he not also declare his interests?

The Presiding Officer: I must seek further legal advice on that matter. Formally, a declaration of interest is that which is noted in the register of Members' interests. We have all registered appropriately.

David Davies: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, ac ar fater difrifol, nid wyf erioed wedi datgan fy hen alwedigaeth, sef mewn trafndiaeth a llongau. A ddylwn wneud hynny bob tro y siaradaf mewn dadl ar drafndiaeth? Nid wyf yn derbyn unrhyw daliadau yn awr, nac ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad.

Y Llywydd: Cyfeiria'r atodiad i Reol Sefydlog Rhif 4 yn benodol at 'fuddiant cofrestredig'. Os ydych wedi cofrestru'r cyfryw fuddiant yna, yn amlwg, rhaid ichi ei ddatgan. Os hoffech drafod eich amgylchiadau personol yr wyf yn fodlon gwneud hynny. Yn y cyfamser, a wnaiff Aelodau sy'n dymuno datgan buddiant wneud hynny drwy sefyll, os gwelwch yn dda.

Lorraine Barrett, Mick Bates, Peter Black, Christine Chapman, David Davies, Geraint Davies, Janet Davies, Sue Essex, Michael German, William Graham, John Griffiths, Christine Gwyther, Gareth Jones, Huw Lewis, David Lloyd, David Melding, Jonathan Morgan, Jenny Randerson, Janet Ryder, Owen John Thomas, Rhodri Glyn Thomas, Dafydd Wigley *a gododd*—

The Presiding Officer: I call for a vote on the principle of the School Teacher Appraisal

Athrawon Ysgol (Cymru) 2002.

(Wales) Regulations 2002.

Cynnig: O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion: For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion carried.

Y Llywydd: Galwaf am bleidlais ar gymeradwyo'r rheoliadau cyntaf.

The Presiding Officer: I call for a vote on the approval of the first regulations.

Cynnig: O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion: For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Y Llywydd: Galwaf am bleidlais ar egwyddor y Rheoliadau Llywodraethu Ysgolion (Cylch Gwaith) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2002.
The Presiding Officer: I call for a vote on the principle of the School Government (Terms of Reference) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2002.

*Cynnig: O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Y Llywydd: Galwaf am bleidlais ar **The Presiding Officer:** I call for a vote on
gymeradwyo'r ail reoliadau. the approval of the second regulations.

*Cynnig: O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.26 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.26 p.m.*

Datblygu Cynaliadwy Sustainable Development

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1 and 3 in the name of Jonathan Morgan, and amendments 2, 4, 5, 6
Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 3 yn enw Jonathan Morgan a gwelliannau 2, 4, 5, 6 a 7 yn enw Jocelyn

and 7 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

Davies.

The Minister for Environment (Sue Essex): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd (Sue Essex): Cynigïaf fod

the National Assembly:

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:

1. welcomes the significant progress being made towards sustainable development in Wales, and acknowledges the important contribution made by the Assembly's partners and outside organisations;

1. yn croesawu'r cynnydd sylweddol sy'n cael ei wneud tuag at ddatblygu cynaliadwy yng Nghymru, ac yn cydnabod cyfraniad pwysig partneriaid y Cynulliad a mudiadau o'r tu allan;

2. recognises the importance of mainstreaming sustainable development in the work of the Welsh Assembly Government as reported in 'Deciding to Live Differently' and 'How We are Learning to Live Differently';

2. yn cydnabod pa mor bwysig yw sicrhau bod datblygu cynaliadwy yn dod yn rhan ganolog o waith Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru fel a nodwyd yn 'Penderfynu Byw'n Wahanol' a 'Sut Ydym yn Dysgu Byw'n Wahanol';

3. supports a positive Welsh contribution to the world summit on sustainable development in Johannesburg in late August/early September; and

3. yn cefnogi cyfraniad positif o du Cymru i uwch-gynhadledd y byd ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy yn Johannesburg ddiwedd Awst/ddechrau Medi; ac

4. calls on the Minister for Environment to prepare a revised and updated sustainable development action plan. (NDM1051)

4. yn galw ar i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd baratoi cynllun gweithredu datblygu cynaliadwy diwygiedig a mwy diweddar. (NDM1051)

I am glad to be able to start this important debate. It is a legal requirement of the Government of Wales Act 1998 that we provide progress reports, and we are complying with Standing Order No. 6.5 in doing so. However, the motion is about much more than compliance with the legal requirements. I hope that we can celebrate—I use the word advisedly—the progress that we have achieved in Wales over the last three years.

Yr wyf yn falch o allu cychwyn y ddadl bwysig hon. Mae'n ofyniad cyfreithiol dan Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 ein bod yn darparu adroddiadau ar yr hyn a gyflawnwyd, ac yr ydym yn cydymffurfio â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.5 wrth wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae a wnelo'r cynnig â llawer mwy na chydymffurfio â'r gofynion cyfreithiol. Gobeithiaf y gallwn ddathlu—defnyddiaf y gair yn fwriadol—yr hyn yr ydym wedi'i gyflawni yng Nghymru yn y tair blynedd diwethaf.

I put on record my thanks to everyone involved in the progress of sustainable development, both inside and outside the National Assembly for Wales. Over the past three years, many people have become involved in a variety of ways. It has been rewarding to meet those people and to consider ourselves part of one big movement for progress in Wales. Let us consider our situation three years ago. We had a legal duty to fulfil. There was no domestic or international role model for us to follow, no

Cofnodaf fy niolch i bawb sy'n ymwneud â symud datblygu cynaliadwy ymlaen, o fewn Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ac oddi allan. Yn y tair blynedd diwethaf, mae llawer o bobl wedi dechrau ymwneud â hyn mewn amryw ffyrdd. Bu'n dda cyfarfod y bobl hynny ac ystyried ein hunain yn rhan o un mudiad mawr dros gynnydd yng Nghymru. Gadewch inni ystyried ein sefyllfa dair blynedd yn ôl. Yr oedd gennym ddyletswydd gyfreithiol i'w chyflawni. Nid oedd esiampl yn y wlad hon nac yn rhyngwladol inni ei

off-the-peg scheme or solution. We have been on our own in this. In some ways, that has been a strength. There were fears that the sustainable development duty would handicap Wales. Three years on, we have a scheme, an adopted action plan, which we are implementing, and we are mainstreaming sustainable development in policies and actions. Interestingly, others now see the Assembly as a pioneer and a leader; I do not think that we expected that three years ago. The sustainable development duty in the legislation is now seen as an advantage, not a handicap. It is important to say that.

In the early days, there were some fears about whether we would be able to mainstream sustainable development. We have been at pains to say that this is not just about the environment, although much of the push originally came from people involved in environmental action. We have attempted to mainstream sustainable development across subjects and agencies. In particular, we have used the integration tool developed by Forum for the Future, the UK's leading sustainable development charity; it is being incorporated into several Assembly divisions and, I hope, its use is being spread among Assembly sponsored public bodies and other organisations that we hope will find it relevant.

Some key principles have underlined the way in which we have worked. We have tried to work openly, operating with as many people as possible. The recent conference and major events show that. We have also sought to work in genuine partnership—it is a much used word, but it is crucial for sustainable development—with organisations such as Oxfam Cymru.

We have tried to reach out to groups perhaps not traditionally approached by Government, such as the Women's Institute—I praise its recent report on sustainable development—and we have also tried to share policy development. I hope that we have shown, and not only in principle, that we need to work, and have worked, innovatively.

dilyn, dim cynllun nac ateb oddi-ar-y-peg. Yr ydym wedi bod ar ein pennau'n hunain yn hyn. Mewn rhai ffyrdd, bu hynny'n gryfder. Yr oedd ofnau y byddai'r ddyletswydd datblygu cynaliadwy'n llesteirio Cymru. Dair blynedd yn ddiweddarach, mae gennym gynllun, cynllun gweithredu mabwysiedig, yr ydym yn ei weithredu, ac yr ydym yn cynnwys datblygu cynaliadwy ym mhreif ffrwd ein polisiau a'n gweithredoedd. Yn ddi-ddorol, mae eraill erbyn hyn yn gweld y Cynulliad fel arloesydd ac arweinydd; nid wyf yn meddwl ein bod wedi disgwyl hynny dair blynedd yn ôl. Gwelir y ddyletswydd datblygu cynaliadwy yn y ddeddfwriaeth fel mantais erbyn hyn, nid anfantais. Mae'n bwysig dweud hynny.

Yn y dyddiau cynnar, yr oedd ofnau ynghylch a fyddem yn gallu gosod datblygu cynaliadwy yn y brif ffrwd. Yr ydym wedi mynd ati i ddweud nad mater amgylcheddol yn unig yw hwn, er y daeth llawer o'r gwthio gwreiddiol gan bobl oedd yn ymwneud â gweithredu amgylcheddol. Yr ydym wedi ceisio cynnwys datblygu cynaliadwy yn y brif ffrwd ar draws pynciau ac asiantaethau. Yn arbennig, yr ydym wedi defnyddio'r arf integreiddio a ddatblygwyd gan Forum for the Future, prif elusen datblygu cynaliadwy'r DU; caiff ei ymgorffori mewn amryw o is-adrannau'r Cynulliad a, gobeithio, lledaenir ei ddefnydd ymysg cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad a sefydliadau eraill y gobeithiwn y bydd yn berthnasol iddynt.

Mae rhai egwyddorion allweddol wedi tanlinellu'r ffordd yr ydym wedi gweithio. Yr ydym wedi ceisio gweithio'n agored, gan weithredu gyda chymaint o bobl ag oedd yn bosibl. Mae'r gynhadledd a'r digwyddiadau mawr diweddar yn dangos hynny. Yr ydym hefyd wedi ceisio gweithio mewn gwir bartneriaeth—mae'n air a ddefnyddir yn aml, ond mae'n allweddol i ddatblygu cynaliadwy—gyda chyrrff fel Oxfam Cymru.

Yr ydym wedi ceisio estyn allan at grwpiau na fyddai Llywodraeth yn estyn allan atynt yn draddodiadol, efallai, fel Sefydliad y Merched—canmolaf ei adroddiad diweddar ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy—ac yr ydym wedi ceisio rhannu datblygiad polisi. Gobeithiaf ein bod wedi dangos, ac nid mewn egwyddor yn unig, fod angen inni weithio, a'n bod wedi

gweithio, mewn ffordd newydd.

We also needed to mainstream sustainable development within the Assembly Government and beyond. The Cabinet sub-committee, under the chairmanship of the First Minister, has been critical to this. We meet regularly, and have identified opportunities for better policy co-ordination and joined-up implementation. We have also pulled in organisations to help us in that process. The United Kingdom's Sustainable Development Commission has identified this as good practice and it has been adopted by the Scottish Executive.

I am establishing a cross-party Assembly working group on sustainable development. Over the last three years, a great deal has united the political groups on this issue and we have tried to work together. The working group is due to meet for the first time next week, and I hope that we will be able to use it as a sounding board and a source of ideas as we move towards the first statutory reconsideration of the sustainable development scheme in 2003.

4:30 p.m.

I am pleased that my colleague, Jane Davidson, is developing ideas in education with the help of an advisory panel. Most of the focus has been on supporting sustainable development in schools, particularly in relation to the curriculum, but the wider sustainable development education agenda is also being considered.

We have been keen to draw in wider knowledge and experience from outside the Assembly that will help us and others. With my encouragement, Rod Aspinwall, the Welsh member of the UK Sustainable Development Commission, has drawn together a group of individuals representing different interests in Wales. This group will shortly issue a prospectus for an independent sustainable development forum. How the forum will be established, and with what remit, will depend on the response from Welsh society to this prospectus, but the group is keen to press on. This will be an innovative piece of work.

Yr oedd angen cynnwys datblygu cynaliadwy ym mhreif ffrwd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a thu hwnt hefyd. Bu is-bwyllgor y Cabinet, dan gadeiryddiaeth Prif Weinidog Cymru, yn hanfodol i hyn. Cyfarfyddwn yn rheolaidd, ac yr ydym wedi nodi cyfleoedd ar gyfer gwell cydgysylltu polisi a gweithredu cydlynol. Yr ydym hefyd wedi tynnu cyrff i mewn i'n helpu yn y broses honno. Mae Comisiwn Datblygu Cynaliadwy'r Deyrnas Unedig wedi nodi hyn fel arfer da ac fe'i mabwysiadwyd gan Weithrediaeth yr Alban.

Yr wyf yn sefydlu gweithgor trawsbleidiol ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy yn y Cynulliad. Dros y tair blynedd diwethaf, mae llawer iawn o bethau wedi uno'r grwpiau gwleidyddol ar y mater hwn ac yr ydym wedi ceisio gweithio gyda'n gilydd. Bydd y gweithgor yn cyfarfod am y tro cyntaf yr wythnos nesaf, a gobeithiaf y gallwn ei ddefnyddio fel corff i ymateb i syniadau ac i gyflwyno syniadau wrth inni symud tuag at ailystyriaeth statudol gyntaf y cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy yn 2003.

Yr wyf yn falch fod fy nghyd-Aelod, Jane Davidson, yn datblygu syniadau ar gyfer addysg gyda chymorth panel ymgynghorol. Bu'r rhan fwyaf o'r ffocws ar gefnogi datblygu cynaliadwy mewn ysgolion, yn arbennig o ran y cwricwlwm, ond mae'r agenda addysg datblygu cynaliadwy ehangach yn cael ei hystyried hefyd.

Buom yn awyddus i dynnu gwybodaeth a phrofiad oddi allan i'r Cynulliad a fydd yn ein helpu ni ac eraill. Gyda f'anogaeth i, mae Rod Aspinwall, aelod Cymru ar Gomisiwn Datblygu Cynaliadwy y DU, wedi tynnu grŵp o unigolion ynghyd i gynrychioli gwahanol fuddiannau yng Nghymru. Bydd y grŵp hwn cyn hir yn cyhoeddi prospectws ar gyfer fforwm datblygu cynaliadwy annibynnol. Bydd sut y sefydlir y fforwm, a chyda pha gylch gorchwyl, yn dibynnu ar yr ymateb gan y gymdeithas Gymreig i'r prospectws hwn, ond mae'r grŵp yn awyddus i fwrw iddi. Bydd hyn yn ddarn arloesol o waith.

To tap into good practice at UK level, we are fully involved with the Sustainable Development Commission. It met in Cardiff two weeks ago, and had discussions with the First Minister, officials and me. It supports our comprehensive and structured approach to sustainable development.

Looking further afield, we are expecting clearance on funding from the European Commission to set up an active network of regions that will exchange and develop good practice, and strengthen links between like-minded Governments and institutions across Europe. I believe that our level of government in Wales is crucial to turning sustainable development theory into practice, and we are acknowledged to be leading on this issue.

We are taking forward preparations for the world summit on sustainable development through the conference I mentioned a moment ago. It was an excellent conference. More than 400 people attended—including some Assembly Members—which was way beyond our expectations. We had workshops on 11 topics that are likely to come up in the world summit in Johannesburg, and the proceedings will be summarised and made available on the web. This will form part of our portfolio for the summit. We will also be able to point to the proceedings of last October's equally successful business and environment conference, our European network, our sustainable development scheme, the strategic policies that support it, and the reports on our first two years' work, which I am commending to you today.

I will run through some of the key changes—this is not an exclusive list. Structurally, we need to mainstream sustainable development in core Welsh Assembly Government policies. In my portfolio, we are doing that in relation to waste, planning and transport. The new planning guidance document has sustainable development at its core, and we have recently issued a paper on transport policies. We also hope to extend this mainstreaming to Assembly sponsored public bodies. The Welsh Development Agency's sustainable

Er mwyn manteisio ar arferion da ar lefel y DU, yr ydym mewn cysylltiad llawn â'r Comisiwn Datblygu Cynaliadwy. Cyfarfu yng Nghaerdydd bythefnos yn ôl, a chafodd drafodaethau gyda'r Prif Weinidog, swyddogion a mi. Mae'n cefnogi'n dull gweithredu cynhwysfawr a strwythuredig tuag at ddatblygu cynaliadwy.

O edrych ymhellach, yr ydym yn disgwyl i'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd glirio cyllid i sefydlu rhwydwaith gweithredol o ranbarthau a fydd yn cyfnewid ac yn datblygu arferion da, gan gryfhau cysylltiadau rhwng Llywodraethau a sefydliadau o feddylfryd tebyg ledled Ewrop. Credaf fod ein lefel ni o lywodraeth yng Nghymru yn hanfodol i droi damcaniaeth datblygu cynaliadwy yn arfer, a chydabyddir ein bod ar flaen y gad yn y mater hwn.

Yr ydym yn symud ymlaen â pharatoadau ar gyfer uwch-gynhadledd y byd ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy drwy'r gynhadledd a grybwyllais eiliad yn ôl. Yr oedd yn gynhadledd ragorol. Daeth dros 400 o bobl yno—gan gynnwys rhai Aelodau Cynulliad—a oedd yn llawer mwy na'n disgwyliadau. Cawsom weithdai ar 11 pwnc sy'n debygol o godi yn uwch-gynhadledd y byd yn Johannesburg, a bydd crynodeb o'r trafodion ar gael ar y we. Bydd hyn yn rhan o'n portffolio ar gyfer yr uwch-gynhadledd. Byddwn hefyd yn gallu pwyntio at drafodion y gynhadledd fusnes ac amgylchedd a fu yr un mor llwyddiannus fis Hydref diwethaf, ein rhwydwaith Ewropeaidd, ein cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy, y polisiau strategol sy'n ei gynnal, a'r adroddiadau ar ein gwaith dros ein dwy flynedd cyntaf, yr wyf yn eu cymeradwyo ichi heddiw.

Af drwy ychydig o'r newidiadau allweddol—nid yw hon yn rhestr gaeedig. Yn strwythurol, mae angen inni sefydlu datblygu cynaliadwy ym mhrif ffrwd polisiau craidd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Yn fy mhortffolio, yr ydym yn gwneud hynny o ran gwastraff, cynllunio a thrafnidiaeth. Mae datblygu cynaliadwy wrth graidd y ddogfen newydd ar ganllawiau cynllunio, ac yn ddiweddar cyhoeddusom bapur ar bolisiau trafndiaeth. Gobeithiwn estyn y broses brif ffrwd hon i gyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y

development policy is important, and the chief executives of ASPBs will meet shortly to see how they too can mainstream sustainable development. It will not be easy, and we must face up to the challenges; this is a different way of developing policies, decisions and programmes. However, we have started to make incremental changes, and it is important that we acknowledge that, as well as the fact that—and I would not want to hide behind it—we still have a way to go.

To consider practical projects on the ground, the environmental development fund for national parks and areas of natural outstanding beauty is resulting in good, practical schemes that will be relevant to the environment and social and economic aspects of those communities. I have been impressed, in the practical examples I have seen, by the tie-in between the environment, sustainability, and local jobs. That link is stronger than I ever imagined it would be.

Environment Wales is also funding some excellent schemes, such as the Radnor Support Project, a charity that works with adults with learning difficulties, developing environmental schemes in the local community. The Coed Craig Ruperra Woodland Project is a 153-acre site of ancient woodland, not too far from here. Environment Wales is grant-aiding this project to establish a trust to develop the site as a multi-benefit woodland, providing a diversity of wildlife habitats. There is a whole range of schemes going on within local communities.

On the European scale, the European regional development funding of the innovative actions programme—

Janet Ryder: I have listened carefully to your speech, and you have talked much about applying sustainability to the environment. Do you agree that sustainability must also apply to society and communities? The family unit, however it is constituted, is the basis of most communities. Therefore, do you not think that we should develop policies to

Cynulliad. Mae polisi Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy yn bwysig, a bydd prif weithredwyr y CCNC yn cwrdd yn fuan i weld sut y gallant hwythau ddod â datblygu cynaliadwy i mewn i'r brif ffrwd. Ni fydd yn hawdd, a bydd raid inni wynebu'r heriau; mae hon yn ffordd wahanol o ddatblygu polisiau, penderfyniadau a rhaglenni. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wedi dechrau gwneud newidiadau graddol, ac mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cydnabod hynny, yn ogystal â'r ffaith—ac ni fyddwn yn dymuno cuddio'r tu ôl i hyn—bod gennym beth ffordd i fynd o hyd.

O ran prosiectau ymarferol ar lawr gwlad, mae'r gronfa ddatblygu amgylcheddol i barciau cenedlaethol ac ardaloedd o harddwch naturiol eithriadol yn esgor ar gynlluniau ymarferol da a fydd yn berthnasol i'r amgylchedd ac agweddau cymdeithasol ac economaidd y cymunedau hynny. Cefais argraff dda, yn yr enghreifftiau ymarferol a welais i, o'r modd y clymir buddiannau'r amgylchedd, cynaliadwyedd a swyddi lleol. Mae'r cysylltiad hwnnw'n gryfach nag y dychmygais erioed y byddai.

Mae Amgylchedd Cymru hefyd yn ariannu rhai cynlluniau rhagorol, fel Prosiect Cefnogi Maesyfed, elusen sy'n gweithio gydag oedolion ag anawsterau dysgu, gan ddatblygu cynlluniau amgylcheddol yn y gymuned leol. Mae Prosiect Coetir Coed Craig Rhiw'r Perrai yn safle 153 erw o goetir hynafol, heb fod nepell oddi yma. Mae Amgylchedd Cymru'n rhoi cymhorthdal i'r prosiect hwn i sefydlu ymddiriedolaeth i ddatblygu'r safle fel coetir aml-fudd, yn darparu amrywiaeth o gynefinoedd bywyd gwyllt. Mae amrediad cyfan o gynlluniau ar droed o fewn cymunedau lleol.

Ar y raddfa Ewropeaidd, mae cyllid datblygu rhanbarthol Ewrop i'r rhaglen weithredoedd arloesol—

Janet Ryder: Yr wyf wedi gwranddo'n astud ar eich araith, ac yr ydych wedi siarad llawer am gymhwyso cynaliadwyedd i'r amgylchedd. A gytunwch fod yn rhaid cymhwyso cynaliadwyedd i gymdeithas a chymunedau hefyd? Yr uned deuluol, sut bynnag y'i cyfansoddir, yw sail y rhan fwyaf o gymunedau. Felly, oni chredwch y dylem

sustain and develop the family unit?

Sue Essex: I have said much about communities and society. I mentioned our work with Oxfam and other key organisations, and I have just mentioned work with adults with learning difficulties. Many solutions could be achieved at the family unit level, particularly through education and schools. However, it would be presumptuous to think that all aspects of sustainable development only relate to the nuclear family. This is about engaging people in whatever household they choose to live. As you said, the message can be conveyed at community level. One example of that is the work of the Women's Institute, through which women are working with their communities and families.

I return to the innovative actions programme. I will highlight the key programmes, as they represent the economic angle of this. The WDA is working with small and medium-sized enterprises on exploiting future sustainable technologies. This has huge potential in Wales, and new schemes are being introduced virtually every week by which sustainable technology can boost local industry. The University of Wales, Bangor is helping organisations in north Wales to develop sustainably. The Countryside Council for Wales is developing the award-winning LANDMAP project. Cardiff Business School is also working on sustainable development. These programmes, which illustrate what Wales can deliver in terms of new ideas and new innovative action to support the scheme, are being recognised at an European level.

There is much more that we can do, working with Assembly sponsored public bodies and our partners. I must also mention the work of the Wales Council for Voluntary Action. We must acknowledge the work of the voluntary sector across Wales. There are great examples of enthusiasm and activity, and it does people credit.

I now turn to the amendments. Amendment 1 in the name of Jonathan Morgan is insulting and churlish. It does not acknowledge the

ddatblygu polisïau i gynnal a datblygu'r uned deuluol?

Sue Essex: Yr wyf wedi dweud llawer am gymunedau a chymdeithas. Crybwyllais ein gwaith gydag Oxfam a sefydliadau allweddol eraill, ac yr wyf newydd grybwyll gwaith gydag oedolion ag anawsterau dysgu. Gellid cael llawer o atebion ar lefel yr uned deuluol, yn enwedig drwy addysg ac ysgolion. Er hynny, rhyfygus fyddai meddwl bod holl agweddau datblygu cynaliadwy yn berthnasol i'r teulu niwclear yn unig. Mae a wnelo hyn ag ennill pobl, pa bynnag gartref y dewisant fyw ynddo. Fel y dywedaso, gellir cyfleu'r neges ar lefel cymuned. Un enghraifft o hynny yw gwaith Sefydliad y Merched, sy'n gyfrwng i ferched weithio gyda'u cymunedau a'u teuluoedd.

Trof yn ôl at y rhaglen weithrediadau arloesol. Tynnaf sylw at y rhaglenni allweddol, gan mai hwy sy'n cynrychioli agwedd economaidd hyn. Mae'r WDA yn gweithio gyda busnesau bach a chanolig ar ddefnyddio technolegau cynaliadwy'r dyfodol. Mae potensial enfawr i hynny yng Nghymru, a chyflwynir cynlluniau newydd bron yn wythnosol lle gall technoleg gynaliadwy hybu diwydiant lleol. Mae Prifysgol Cymru, Bangor yn helpu cyrff yn y Gogledd i ddatblygu'n gynaliadwy. Mae Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru yn datblygu'r prosiect LANDMAP sydd wedi ennill gwobrau. Mae Ysgol Fusnes Caerdydd hithau'n gweithio ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Mae'r rhaglenni hyn, sy'n dangos beth y gall Cymru ei gyflawni o ran syniadau newydd a gweithredu arloesol newydd i gefnogi'r cynllun, wedi'u cydnabod ar lefel Ewropeaidd.

Mae llawer mwy y gallwn ei wneud, gan weithio gyda chyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad a'n partneriaid. Rhaid imi sôn hefyd am waith Cyngor Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Cymru. Rhaid inni gydnabod gwaith y sector gwirfoddol ar draws Cymru. Mae enghreifftiau gwych o frwdfrydedd a gweithgaredd, ac mae'n glod i bobl.

Trof yn awr at y gwelliannau. Mae gwelliant 1 yn enw Jonathan Morgan yn sarhaus a difoes. Nid yw'n cydnabod y camau ymlaen a

progress that the Assembly has made, nor the great progress made by our partners and other organisations. Proposing to delete that recognition from the motion is insulting to the people who have worked so hard on this.

Jocelyn Davies's amendment 2 rightly considers practical improvements in the environment and in the quality of people's lives, but I would hate that to stand on its own. I will not support amendment 2, because our approach must recognise our international obligations. It is not just about actions that we can take here; but actions that we can take for other people across the world, through leading by example, sharing experience and influencing others.

On amendment 4 on incineration and landfill developments, the way forward is clearly set out in our planning guidance on waste and the waste hierarchy. That details the way forward for local authorities to make decisions.

I am happy to support amendment 5, which refers to the world summit in Johannesburg. On amendment 6, on the use of the rate of retention of young people as an indicator, I am pleased with the principle behind this. It is a good idea. However, there is a problem with the wording of the amendment and I cannot support this because we are considering the development of a series of indicators. However, you have my commitment that we will consider including this as an indicator. I am happy to consult with you on that, as it is a good idea in principle and one that we can progress.

Similarly, on a low-carbon economy, we are doing much on this. Simply accepting amendment 7 as it is phrased, without considering its implications, would not be the way forward. We can work that into the policies in 'A Winning Wales' and other policies.

I thank everyone who has been involved in developing the work and for the progress to date. I am pleased that we have achieved so much consensus inside and outside the Assembly. I look forward to hearing

gymerwyd gan y Cynulliad, na'r camau mawr a gymerwyd gan ein partneriaid a chyrrff eraill. Mae cynnig dileu'r gydnabyddiaeth honno o'r cynnig yn sarhad i'r bobl sydd wedi gweithio mor galed ar hyn.

Mae gwelliant 2 gan Jocelyn Davies yn ystyried, yn ddigon teg, welliannau ymarferol i'r amgylchedd ac i ansawdd bywydau pobl, ond byddai'n gas gennyf i hwnnw sefyll ar ei ben ei hun. Ni chefnogaf welliant 2, oherwydd rhaid i'n dull gweithredu gydnabod ein dyletswyddau rhyngwladol. Nid beth y gallwn ei wneud yma yw'r unig gwestiwn; ond beth y gallwn ei wneud dros bobl eraill dros y byd, wrth arwain drwy esiampl, rhannu profiad a dylanwadu ar eraill.

Ar welliant 4 ar ddatblygiadau llosgi a thirlenwi, mae'r ffordd ymlaen wedi'i hamlinellu'n glir yn ein canllawiau cynllunio ar wastraff a'r hierarchaeth gwastraff. Mae'r rheini'n nodi'r ffordd ymlaen i'r awdurdodau lleol wneud penderfyniadau.

Yr wyf yn hapus i gefnogi gwelliant 5, sy'n cyfeirio at uwch-gynhadledd y byd yn Johannesburg. O ran gwelliant 6, ar ddefnyddio nifer y bobl ifanc sy'n aros yn eu cymunedau fel dangosydd, yr wyf yn hoffi'r egwyddor y tu ôl i hyn. Mae'n syniad da. Fodd bynnag, y mae problem gyda geiriad y gwelliant ac ni allaf gefnogi hynny oherwydd yr ydym yn ystyried datblygu cyfres o ddangosyddion. Fodd bynnag, cewch fy ymrwymiad yr ystyriwn gynnwys hwn fel dangosydd. Yr wyf yn hapus i ymgynghori â chi ar hynny, gan ei fod yn syniad da mewn egwyddor ac yn un y gallwn fynd ymlaen ag ef.

Yn yr un modd, o ran economi carbon isel, yr ydym yn gwneud llawer ar hynny. Nid dim ond derbyn gwelliant 7 fel y mae wedi'i eirio, heb ystyried ei oblygiadau, fyddai'r ffordd ymlaen. Gallwn weithio hynny i mewn i'r polisiau a geir yn 'Cymru'n Ennill' a pholisiau eraill.

Diolchaf i bawb a fu'n ymwneud â datblygu'r gwaith ac am yr hyn a gyflawnwyd hyd yma. Yr wyf yn falch ein bod wedi sicrhau cymaint o gonsensws y tu mewn a'r tu allan i'r Cynulliad. Edrychaf ymlaen at glywed

contributions to the debate.

cyfraniadau at y ddadl.

4:40 p.m.

David Davies: I propose the following amendments in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Amendment 1: delete point 1.

David Davies: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Gwelliant 1: dileu pwynt 1.

I propose amendment 3. In point 2, delete:

Cynigiau welliant 3. Ym mhwynt 2 dileu:

as reported in 'Deciding to Live Differently' and 'How We are Learning to Live Differently'.

fel y nodwyd yn 'Penderfynu Byw'n Wahanol' a 'Sut Ydym yn Dysgu Byw'n Wahanol'.

The problem with the current use of the term 'sustainable development' is that it is too wide. The point that an earlier speaker tried to make about bringing families into this underlines the point. I could have discussed just about any topic under the sun this afternoon. I could have had fun with politically incorrect subjects such as asylum seekers or gay rights, and brought them all in under the broad heading of socially sustainable development. However, I will not do that, because if this term is to have any meaning at all we must concentrate on environmental matters.

Y broblem gyda'r defnydd cyfredol o'r term 'datblygu cynaliadwy' yw ei fod yn rhy eang. Tanlinellir hynny gan y pwynt y ceisiodd siaradwr cynharach ei wneud ynghylch dod â theuluoedd i mewn i hyn. Gallaswn innau drafod unrhyw bwn dan haul, fwy neu lai, y prynhawn yma. Gallaswn gael sbort gyda phynciau sy'n wleidyddol anghywir fel ceiswyr lloches neu hawliau hoyw, a dod â hwy i gyd i mewn dan bennawd bras datblygu cymdeithasol gynaliadwy. Fodd bynnag, ni wna hynny, oherwydd os yw'r term hwn i gael unrhyw ystyr o gwbl rhaid inni ganolbwyntio ar faterion amgylcheddol.

It would be possible, for example, if you considered the airport—

Byddai'n bosibl, er enghraifft, pe ystyriech y maes awyr—

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Dywedwch y byddwch yn cyfyngu eich sylwadau i faterion amgylcheddol. Gobeithiaf nad ydych yn awgrymu bod cynaliadwyedd yn ymwneud â'r amgylchedd yn unig. Dangosodd pwynt Janet Ryder yn glir bod yn rhaid inni greu cymunedau, economi, system addysg a system iechyd cynaliadwy. Dyna yw ystyr cynaliadwyedd. Mae'r hyn yr ydych yn ei ddadlau yn gwbl anghynaliadwy gan eich bod yn ceisio cyfyngu hyn i'r amgylchedd yn unig.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: You say that you will restrict your comments to environmental matters. I hope that you are not suggesting that sustainability is solely an environmental issue. Janet Ryder's point demonstrated clearly the need to create sustainable communities, a sustainable economy, and a sustainable education and health system. That is the meaning of sustainability. What you are arguing is totally unsustainable in that you are trying to restrict this to the environment alone.

David Davies: Ni chytunaf. Er enghraifft, os ydych yn cefnogi ffordd gyswllt newydd rhwng maes awyr Caerdydd a'r M4, byddai'n bosibl ichi ddweud eich bod o'i blaid oherwydd ei fod yn bwysig o safbwynt datblygu economaidd cynaliadwy. Fodd bynnag, os na chytunwch â'r syniad, byddai'n bosibl ichi ddweud nad yw'n cyd-fynd â datblygu cynaliadwy amgylcheddol. Dyna'r broblem.

David Davies: I disagree. For example, if you support a new link road between Cardiff airport and the M4, it would be possible for you to say that you are in favour of it because it is important from the point of view of sustainable economic development. However, if you disagree with the idea, it would be possible for you to say that it is not an environmentally sustainable development. That is the problem.

That is why the use of the term ‘sustainable development’ should be applied primarily to environmental considerations.

The issues that I will mention, which are crucial to sustainable development, are flooding, energy, waste management, and a decent transport policy. On flooding, the more we encourage developers to artificially increase the spread of flooding by building on or near floodplains, the more problems we will cause in terms of sustainable development. The new planning guidance that the Minister has just brought forward gives more credence to advice from the Environment Agency. If it recommends against a certain development, local authorities are meant to take that into account. However, local authorities are not obliged to take it into account, so it is still possible for developments to go ahead in inappropriate areas. If we are to incorporate sustainable development into planning policies, then as well as having a well-funded flood defence scheme, we must give much more credence to the advice of bodies such as the Environment Agency. We also need better co-ordination between all those with an interest in developments in floodplain areas.

The whole issue comes down to planning. Surely that is what sustainable development is all about—whether a development is sustainable or not. If you build one house in a national park, is it sustainable? If you allow one house to be built, somebody else might want to build one and 1,000 houses could be built, which will not be sustainable.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Bydd yn cymryd cryn amser imi geisio esbonio ichi beth yn union yw ystyr cynaliadwyedd. Mae’n ymddangos eich bod yn ceisio ychwanegu cynaliadwyedd at yr hyn sydd yn bodoli eisoes. Rhaid i gynaliadwyedd fod yn greiddiol ac yn ganolog. Ni allwch ychwanegu cynaliadwyedd i’r hyn sydd yn digwydd eisoes a cheisio dadlau eich bod yn cefnogi datblygu cynaliadwy.

David Davies: At present, you can argue that any issue relates to sustainable development. That should not be the case. We must tightly

Dyna pam y dylid defnyddio’r term ‘datblygu cynaliadwy’ yn bennaf ar gyfer ystyriaethau amgylcheddol.

Y materion a grybwyllaf fi, sy’n allweddol i ddatblygu cynaliadwy, yw llifogydd, ynni, rheoli gwastraff, a pholisi trafndiaeth gweddus. Ar lifogydd, po fwyaf yr anogwn ddatblygwyr i gynyddu lledaeniad llifogydd yn annaturiol drwy adeiladu ar orlifdiroedd neu’n agos atynt, y mwyaf o broblemau a achoswn yn nhermau datblygu cynaliadwy. Mae’r canllawiau cynllunio newydd y mae’r Gweinidog newydd eu cyflwyno’n rhoi mwy o goel i gyngor gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd. Os argymhella honno yn erbyn datblygiad arbennig, mae awdurdodau lleol i fod i gymryd hynny i ystyriaeth. Fodd bynnag, nid oes raid i awdurdodau lleol ei gymryd i ystyriaeth, felly mae’n dal i fod yn bosibl i ddatblygiadau fynd ymlaen mewn ardaloedd amhriodol. Os ydym am ymgorffori datblygu cynaliadwy mewn polisiau cynllunio, yna, yn ogystal â chael cynllun amddiffyn rhag llifogydd, wedi’i ariannu’n dda, rhaid inni roi llawer mwy o goel i gyngor cyrff fel Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd. Mae angen gwell cydgyssylltu hefyd rhwng pawb sydd â diddordeb mewn datblygiadau mewn ardaloedd gorlifdir.

Daw’r holl fater i lawr i gynllunio. Onid dyna holl ystyr datblygu cynaliadwy—a yw datblygiad yn gynaliadwy ai peidio? Os adeiladwch un tŷ mewn parc cenedlaethol, a ydyw’n gynaliadwy? Os caniatewch i un tŷ gael ei adeiladu, efallai y bydd ar rywun arall eisiau adeiladu un, a gellid adeiladu 1,000 o dai, na fyddai’n gynaliadwy.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: It will take quite a while for me to try to explain to you the exact meaning of sustainability. It appears that you are trying to bolt sustainability on to existing practices. Sustainability must be intrinsic and central. You cannot bolt sustainability on to what already occurs and claim to support sustainable development.

David Davies: Ar hyn o bryd, gallwch ddadlau fod unrhyw fater yn ymwneud â datblygu cynaliadwy. Ni ddylai fod felly.

define what sustainable development is. It should be restricted, more or less, to planning and environmental issues. If you do not agree, that is fair enough.

If we consider current planning issues there is a problem in that we allow inappropriate developments on greenfield sites. Part of the problem is that it is difficult to develop brownfield sites because of the cost, so development takes place in greenfield areas. Once those greenfield areas have been concreted over they are concreted over for good. We need to incorporate sustainable development into planning and flood defence policies.

I will also briefly mention waste. We have one of the worst records in Europe on waste disposal. Members of the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee have already seen evidence of the huge problems caused by landfill. We also know that there are, quite rightly, genuine concerns about incineration. Britain has one of the worst records in the whole of Europe for recycling or re-using waste. Recent figures from the House of Commons show that we manage to recycle around 9.5 per cent of our waste, as opposed to 44 per cent in Austria and 45 per cent in Germany. If we are to meet the European landfill directive by 2003, which we are committed to doing—it will cost millions of pounds every week if we do not—we need to do much more to bring sustainable development into waste strategies.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Will you wind up, please?

Alison Halford *rose*—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. He is winding up; it is too late to make an intervention.

David Davies: There is not much to celebrate at the moment. We do not have a good record in this area. However, I do not think that we should lay the blame for that at Sue Essex's door. Policies must come not only from the Welsh Assembly Government but also from

Rhaid inni ddiffinio'n fanwl beth yw datblygu cynaliadwy. Dylid ei gyfyngu, fwy neu lai, i faterion cynllunio ac amgylcheddol. Os nad ydych yn cytuno, mae hynny'n ddigon teg.

Os ystyriwn faterion cynllunio cyfredol, y mae problem, sef ein bod yn caniatáu datblygiadau amhriodol ar safleoedd tir glas. Rhan o'r broblem yw ei bod yn anodd datblygu safleoedd tir llwyd oherwydd y gost, felly datblygir mewn ardaloedd tir glas. Unwaith y byddir wedi concritio dros yr ardaloedd tir glas hynny byddant dan goncrit am byth. Mae angen inni ymgorffori datblygu cynaliadwy mewn polisiau cynllunio ac amddiffyn rhag llifogydd.

Soniaf yn fyr am wastraff hefyd. Mae gennym record gyda'r gwaethaf yn Ewrop ar waredu gwastraff. Mae aelodau Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth eisoes wedi gweld tystiolaeth o'r problemau enfawr a achosir gan dirlenwi. Gwyddom hefyd fod pryderon cyfiawn, yn ddigon teg, ynghylch llosgi. Mae gan Brydain record gyda'r gwaethaf drwy Ewrop gyfan am ailgylchu neu aildefnyddio gwastraff. Dengys ffigurau diweddar o Dŷ'r Cyffredin ein bod yn llwyddo i ailgylchu oddeutu 9.5 y cant o'n gwastraff, o'i gymharu â 44 y cant yn Awstria a 45 y cant yn yr Almaen. Os ydym am gyflawni'r cyfarwyddyd tirlenwi Ewropeaidd erbyn 2003, fel yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i'w wneud—bydd yn costio miliynau o bunnoedd yr wythnos os na wnawn—mae angen inni wneud llawer mwy i ddod â datblygu cynaliadwy i mewn i strategaethau gwastraff.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. A wnewch chi ddirwyn i ben, os gwelwch yn dda?

Alison Halford *a gododd*—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae'n dirwyn i ben; mae'n rhy hwyr i ymyrryd.

David Davies: Nid oes llawer i'w ddathlu ar hyn o bryd. Nid oes gennym record dda yn y maes hwn. Er hynny, nid wyf yn meddwl y dylem roi'r bai am hynny wrth ddrws Sue Essex. Rhaid i bolisiau ddod nid yn unig gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ond hefyd gan

central Government. These policies must recognise sustainable development and concentrate more on environmental and planning considerations than trying to make sustainable development mean everything.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu ar ddiwedd pwynt 1:

ond yn cydnabod mai trwy welliannau ymarferol i'r amgylchedd ac i ansawdd bywydau pobl y bydd ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth i ddatblygu cynaliadwy yn cael ei farnu.

Cynigiau welliant 4. Ychwanegu ar ddiwedd pwynt 2:

ond yn cydnabod bod llawer iawn eto i'w wneud o ran datblygu strategaeth ar wastraff lle ceir rhagdybiaeth yn y polisiau cynllunio yn erbyn datblygu mwy o losgyddion a safleoedd tirlenwi.

Cynigiau welliant 5. Ychwanegu ar ddiwedd pwynt 3 ar ôl 'Medi':

ac yn croesawu'r ffaith bod Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi cyhoeddi mai ef fydd yn cynrychioli Cymru yn uwch-gynhadledd y byd.

Cynigiau welliant 6. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn cefnogi'r syniad o gynnwys dangosydd sy'n nodi faint o bobl ifanc sy'n aros yn eu cymunedau.

Cynigiau welliant 7. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn datgan y dylai'r newid yn yr hinsawdd fod yn ystyriaeth o bwys yng nghynllunio y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ac yn galw am ddynodi creu economi carbon isel yn un o amcanion allweddol polisi datblygu economaidd yng Nghymru.

Ceisiau lywio'r ddadl hon yn ôl at ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Nid wyf yn siŵr at beth yr oedd David yn cyfeirio, ond yn sicr, nid datblygu

y Llywodraeth ganolog. Rhaid i'r polisiau hyn gydnabod datblygu cynaliadwy a chanolbwyntio mwy ar ystyriaethau amgylcheddol a chynllunio nag ar geisio gwneud i ddatblygu cynaliadwy olygu popeth.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 2: insert at end of point 1:

but recognises that the Government's commitment to sustainable development will be judged by practical improvements in the environment and the quality of people's lives.

I propose amendment 4. Insert at the end of point 2:

but acknowledges that there is still a great deal to be achieved in developing a waste strategy that introduces a planning presumption against further incineration and landfill developments

I propose amendment 5. Insert at end of point 3, after 'September':

and welcomes the First Minister's announcement that he will be representing Wales at the world summit.

I propose amendment 6. Add as a new point at end of motion:

supports the inclusion of the rate of retention of young people in their own communities as an indicator.

I propose amendment 7. Add as a new point at the end of motion:

asserts that climate change should be a major consideration in the National Assembly's scheme, and calls for the creation of a low-carbon economy to be designated as a key objective for Welsh economic development policy.

I will try to steer this debate back to sustainable development. I am not certain as to what David was referring, but it certainly

cynaliadwy oedd hynny. Bydd fy nghyfraniad yn un byr, gan fod tri Aelod arall o grŵp Plaid Cymru am siarad ar y pwnc hwn, sydd yn dangos ein hymrwymiad i ddatblygu cynaliadwy a'n cred y dylai fod yn ganolog i holl bolisiau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

Ni fyddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant 1 yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Nid yw'n cydnabod y gwaith a wnaethpwyd gan bartneriaid y Llywodraeth a mudiadau eraill i hyrwyddo'r agenda hon a'i symud ymlaen. Croesawn y cynnydd sylweddol a wnaethpwyd hyd yn hyn, o ganlyniad i welliannau a gynigiwyd gan Plaid Cymru. Dyna pam y sefydlwyd tîm datblygu cynaliadwy yn uned bolisi strategol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, a dyna pam yr ydym wedi derbyn cymorthdaliadau Ewropeaidd.

Mae gwelliant 2 Plaid Cymru yn nodi ei bod yn ofynnol i'r Llywodraeth gyflwyno mesurau penodol, cyfrifadwy. Ar hyn o bryd, geiriau teg sydd gennym ynghylch yr hyn y mae'r Gweinidog yn bwriadu ei wneud. Yr wyf yn gwybod am ymrwymiad Sue Essex i'r maes hwn, ond rhaid inni gael tystiolaeth bod datblygu cynaliadwy yn bwnc trawsbynciol a llorweddol yn y Cynulliad a bod camau penodol yn cael eu cymryd. Nid yw datblygu cynaliadwy i'w weld yn y cynlluniau datblygu economaidd. Nid yw i'w weld o ran cynnal gwasanaethau cynaliadwy. Yr ydym wedi bod yn trafod y gwasanaeth iechyd. Pa fwradau sydd gan y Llywodraeth i ddod â gwasanaeth iechyd cynaliadwy i Gymru? Beth am gymunedau cynaliadwy a'r pwyntiau eraill a godwyd gan Janet Ryder?

Yr wyf yn falch fod y Llywodraeth yn cefnogi gwelliant 5. Croesawn y ffaith y bydd Rhodri Morgan yn arwain y ddirprwyaeth i Johannesburg. Mae hynny'n arwydd o'r pwys a roddir gan y Llywodraeth ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy ac mae'n anfon neges bwysig i wledydd eraill.

Ar welliant 6, yr wyf yn falch o eiriau'r Gweinidog ynglŷn â'r dangosydd. Mae hynny'n bwysig. Mae all-lifiad pobl ifanc o'n cymunedau yn tanseilio cynaliadwyedd y cymunedau hynny. Yr wyf yn falch bod y Gweinidog wedi ymrwymo i ystyried hynny a gobeithiaf y bydd yn cyflwyno mesurau

was not sustainable development. My contribution will be brief because three other Members of the Plaid Cymru group will speak on this subject, which shows our commitment to sustainable development and our belief that it should be central to all of the National Assembly's policies.

We will not support amendment 1 in the name of Jonathan Morgan. It does not acknowledge the work done by Government partners and other organisations in promoting this agenda and moving it forward. We welcome the significant progress made so far, which has come about as a result of amendments tabled by Plaid Cymru. That is why a sustainable development team was established as part of the Welsh Assembly Government's strategic policy unit and why we have been receiving European grants.

Plaid Cymru's amendment 2 notes that the Government must introduce specific and quantifiable measures. At the moment, we only have the Minister's word about what she intends to do. I know of Sue Essex's commitment to this issue, but we need to see evidence that sustainable development is a cross-cutting and horizontal theme in the Assembly and that specific steps are being taken. Sustainable development is not included in economic development plans. It is not mentioned in the context of sustainable services. We have been discussing the health service. Does the Government intend to provide a sustainable health service in Wales? What about sustainable communities, and the other points raised by Janet Ryder?

I am glad that the Government supports amendment 5. We welcome the fact that Rhodri Morgan will lead the deputation in Johannesburg. That is a sign of how seriously the Government takes sustainable development and it sends an important message to other countries.

On amendment 6, I was glad to hear the Minister's comments on the indicator. That is important. The migration of young people from our communities is undermining the sustainability of those communities. I am glad that the Minister is committed to considering that matter and I hope that robust measures

cadarn.

Mae'r cyfeiriadau yng ngwelliant 7 at yr hinsawdd ac at economi carbon isel yn rhai pwysig a gobeithiaf y bydd y Llywodraeth yn symud i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw.

Yr ydym yn barod i fod yn adeiladol a chadarnhaol. Yr ydym yn barod i gydnabod y cynnydd a wnaethpwyd eisoes. Yr ydym yn disgwyl gweld arwyddion pendant. Rhaid i'r Llywodraeth hon dderbyn mai wrth eu gweithredoedd yn hytrach na'u geiriau y cânt eu barnu yn yr achos hwn.

Christine Gwyther: I thank Sue for the statement on progress to date. She clearly outlined where we are and where we need to get to in terms of delivering on sustainable development. Unlike David Davies, I recognise that there are several softer elements to sustainable development. We are delivering many policies that will sustain our people and communities; free bus travel for pensioners and people with disabilities is an obvious example. Assembly learning grants will also benefit many disadvantaged students and enable them to make a real contribution to their communities.

4:50 p.m.

I also thank Sue for opening up the mucky end of sustainable development to Assembly scrutiny. It is important to do so openly. She stated that we need to make a big improvement in waste management. As Members, we know how unpopular the siting of waste management facilities can be. It must be part of the remit of the Cabinet's sub-committee on sustainable development to support Sue Essex in reaching her waste target. It should work with local government to identify sites, with industry to ensure that only the cleanest and best technologies are used, and with communities to ensure that they are on board with any plans.

Three years ago, the first consultation paper on sustainable development, 'Learning to Live Differently', was well received by non-governmental organisations, local authorities and many individuals. However, the response

will be introduced.

The references in amendment 7 to the climate and to the low-carbon economy are important and I hope that the Government moves in that direction.

We are willing to be constructive and positive. We are willing to acknowledge the progress that has already been made. We expect to see definite signs. This Government must accept that it will be judged by its actions rather than its words in this case.

Christine Gwyther: Diolchaf i Sue am y datganiad ar yr hyn a gyflawnwyd hyd yma. Amlinellodd yn glir ble'r ydym yn sefyll a ble y mae angen inni gyrraedd o ran cyflawni ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Yn wahanol i David Davies, yr wyf yn cydnabod fod llawer o elfennau meddalach i ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Yr ydym yn cyflawni llawer o bolisiau a fydd yn cynnal ein pobl a'n cymunedau; mae teithio am ddim ar fysus i bensynwyr a phobl ag anabledau yn enghraifft amlwg. Bydd grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad hefyd yn rhoi budd i lawer o fyfyrwyr difreintiedig ac yn eu galluogi i wneud gwir gyfraniad i'w cymunedau.

Diolchaf i Sue hefyd am agor pen budr datblygu cynaliadwy i'w archwilio gan y Cynulliad. Mae'n bwysig gwneud hynny'n agored. Dywedodd fod angen inni sicrhau gwelliant mawr mewn rheoli gwastraff. Fel Aelodau, gwyddom mor amhoblogaidd y gall lleoliad cyfleusterau rheoli gwastraff fod. Rhaid i gylch gorchwyl is-bwyllgor y Cabinet ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy gynnwys cefnogi Sue Essex i gyrraedd ei tharged o ran gwastraff. Dylai weithio gyda llywodraeth leol i nodi safleoedd, gyda diwydiant i sicrhau mai dim ond y technolegau glanaf a'r gorau a ddefnyddir, a chyda chymunedau i sicrhau eu bod hwy ar ein hochr mewn unrhyw gynlluniau.

Dair blynedd yn ôl, cafodd y papur ymgynghorol cyntaf ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy, 'Dysgu Byw'n Wahanol', dderbyniad da gan gyrff anllywodraethol, awdurdodau lleol a llawer o unigolion. Er

level from community groups was disappointing, with only about seven groups responding. At the time, I thought that it was due to a lack of a committee or forum. I am pleased that there will now be a forum and a cross-party group, and I intend to be part of the group. It will raise awareness of our commitment and of how we are achieving our goals. It will also raise questions and set standards.

People need to be given a lead: the environment development fund is providing it. One of the most important strengths of the EDF is that it is able to take calculated risks. That allows the operating partners to be more imaginative, which leads to greater rewards. That can be vital in terms of new technology, for instance, with the power tidal project in Pembrokeshire. Without EDF funding, that project would have run aground. Now that the prototype has been built and is in operation, everyone is interested, including the WDA and Assembly officials; everyone wants a slice of the action now—it was not always so.

It is a sobering thought that a project of potentially international importance has relied on local, experimental funding. This project did not fall through the funding net. Projects that are not based within the Pembrokeshire national park will not be so lucky. Pembrokeshire Coast National Park has already run out of money to finance next year's EDF projects; I believe that it will be asking the Minister for more funding. I hope that she will be able to provide it in the short term, but more importantly, that she will consider rolling out this risk-associated fund to cover the whole of Wales. We cannot afford to let geographical circumstances hold back projects that could enable us to live differently. That is the whole premise of our sustainable development strategy.

Janet Davies: Plaid Cymru supports moves to make sustainable development a mainstream part of the Assembly Government's work, as highlighted in recent reports. Our amendments are intended to strengthen the motion and to give it a sharper focus. I am sorry that the Government will

hynny, siomedig oedd lefel yr ymateb gan grwpiau cymunedol, gyda dim ond rhyw saith grŵp yn ymateb. Ar y pryd, tybiais fod hynny oherwydd diffyg pwyllgor neu fforwm. Yr wyf yn falch y ceir fforwm a grŵp trawsbleidiol yn awr, a bwriadaf fod yn rhan o'r grŵp. Bydd yn codi ymwybyddiaeth o'n hymrwymiad ac o'r modd yr ydym yn cyflawni'n targedau. Bydd hefyd yn codi cwestiynau ac yn gosod safonau.

Mae angen rhoi arweiniad i bobl: mae cronfa ddatblygu'r amgylchedd yn ei roi. Un o gryfderau pwysicaf y gronfa ddatblygu yw y gall fentro'n ofalus. Mae hynny'n caniatáu i'rartneriaid gweithredol ddangos mwy o ddychymyg, sy'n arwain at ganlyniadau gwell. Gall hynny fod yn allweddol o ran technoleg newydd, er enghraifft, gyda phrosiect ynni'r llanw yn Sir Benfro. Heb gyllid y gronfa ddatblygu, buasai'r prosiect hwnnw wedi methu. Yn awr bod y prototeip wedi'i adeiladu ac yn gweithio, mae gan bawb ddiddordeb, gan gynnwys y WDA a swyddogion y Cynulliad; mae pawb eisiau bod yn gysylltiedig â hyn yn awr—nid oedd felly bob amser.

Syniad sobreiddiol yw bod prosiect a allai fod o bwysigrwydd rhyngwladol wedi dibynnu ar gyllid arbrofol, lleol. Ni syrthiodd y prosiect hwn drwy'r rhwyd ariannu. Ni fydd prosiectau sydd y tu allan i barc cenedlaethol Sir Benfro mor ffodus. Mae Parc Cenedlaethol Arfordir Sir Benfro wedi rhedeg allan o arian yn barod i ariannu prosiectau cronfa ddatblygu'r amgylchedd y flwyddyn nesaf; credaf y bydd yn gofyn i'r Gweinidog am ragor o gyllid. Gobeithiaf y bydd hi'n gallu ei ddarparu yn y tymor byr, ond yn bwysicach, y gwnaiff ystyried ymestyn y gronfa risg-gysylltiedig hon i weddill Cymru. Ni allwn fforddio gadael i amgylchiadau daearyddol lesteirio prosiectau a allai ganiatáu inni fyw yn wahanol. Dyna holl sail ein strategaeth ddatblygu cynaliadwy.

Janet Davies: Mae Plaid Cymru'n cefnogi symudiadau i osod datblygu cynaliadwy ym mhrif ffrwd gwaith Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, fel a amlygwyd mewn adroddiadau diweddar. Bwriad ein gwelliannau yw cryfhau'r cynnig a rhoi ffocws miniocach iddo. Mae'n flin gennyf mai dim ond un ohonynt y gwnaiff y

only support one of them. I will speak to three of those amendments.

Amendment 4 raises the issue of waste strategy, which is one of the major challenges to sustainable development, as other speakers have already stated. In a debate on climate change in Plenary on 10 May 2000, the National Assembly resolved to implement an all-Wales waste strategy, which included the following characteristic:

‘a planning presumption to be introduced against further incineration and landfill developments in Wales in the interest of sustainability’.

‘Planning Policy Wales’, published in March this year, does not reflect that resolution. The fact that this is implied in the hierarchy of waste disposal lacks the necessary backing of specific strategies, guidelines and advice. It also lacks focus. It should be an integrated part of planning policy. Incineration should never be considered for the disposal of household waste unless the most comprehensive recycling process is in place.

Amendment 7 asks for climate change to be a major consideration and the creation of a low-carbon economy to be designated as a key objective of economic development policy. That is not easy to achieve. ‘How We are Learning to Live Differently’ refers to establishing the Carbon Trust in this country last October. This issue needs to be spelt out clearly.

Recent reports claim that Severn Trent Water is calling for a large new reservoir in Powys, on the grounds that the Birmingham conurbation will run short of water due to climate change. If nothing else, that indicates the sweeping changes to our lifestyle that are implicit in many of the forecast changes. However, little can be more drastic than being forced to leave your home for it to be permanently flooded. The Environment Agency’s annual report for 2000-01 states that severe autumnal flooding is a foretaste of global warming, with threats to low-lying coastal and flood plain areas. Funding flood barriers is one thing, but surely it would be

Llywodraeth ei gefnogi. Siaradaf ar dri o'r gwelliannau hynny.

Mae gwelliant 4 yn codi cwestiwn strategaeth gwastraff, sy'n un o'r prif heriau i ddatblygu cynaliadwy, fel y dywedodd siaradwyr eraill eisoes. Mewn dadl ar newid hinsawdd yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 10 Mai 2000, penderfynodd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol weithredu strategaeth gwastraff i Gymru gyfan, a oedd yn cynnwys y nodwedd ganlynol:

‘cyflwyno rhagdybiaeth yn erbyn rhoi caniatâd cynllunio i losgi gwastraff a datblygiadau claddu pellach yng Nghymru er lles cynaliadwyedd’.

Nid yw ‘Polisi Cynllunio Cymru’, a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Mawrth eleni, yn adlewyrchu'r penderfyniad hwnnw. Mae'r ffaith bod hyn yn ymhlyg yn hierarchaeth gwaredu gwastraff yn diystyru'r angen am gefnogaeth strategaethau penodol, canllawiau a chynghor. Mae hefyd yn ddi-ffocws. Dylai fod yn rhan annatod o bolisi cynllunio. Ni ddylid byth ystyried llosgi ar gyfer gwaredu gwastraff tŷ oni bai fod y broses ailgylchu fwyaf cynhwysfawr wedi'i sefydlu.

Gofynna gwelliant 7 am i newid hinsawdd fod yn brif ystyriaeth, ac am ddynodi creu economi carbon isel fel amcan allweddol polisi datblygu economaidd. Nid yw hynny'n hawdd i'w wneud. Cyfeiria ‘Sut yr Ydym yn Dysgu Byw'n Wahanol’ at sefydlu'r Ymddiriedolaeth Carbon yn y wlad hon fis Hydref diwethaf. Mae angen pwysleisio'r mater hwn yn gwbl eglur.

Yn ôl adroddiadau diweddar mae Dŵr Hafren Trent yn galw am gronfa newydd fawr ym Mhowys, oherwydd y bydd Birmingham a'i chyffiniau'n rhedeg yn brin o ddŵr yn sgîl newid hinsawdd. Os nad dim byd arall, mae hynny'n dangos y newidiadau ysgubol i'n ffordd o fyw sydd ymhlyg yn llawer o'r newidiadau a ragwelir. Fodd bynnag, ni all fawr ddim fod yn fwy drastig na chael eich gorfodi i adael eich cartref i hwnnw gael ei fodd i am byth. Noda adroddiad blynyddol Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd am 2000-01 fod llyfogydd hydrefol difrifol yn rhagflas o gynhesu byd-eang, a bod ardaloedd gorliffdir ac arfordirol isel dan fygythiad. Un peth yw

better to stop the need for flood barriers in the first place? Our slight reduction in greenhouse gas emissions since 1990 is welcome. However, it is insufficient in the face of a need for a substantial reduction. The extra money available to put energy-saving measures in place is crucial and long awaited.

I recognise that tackling any of these issues is difficult. They are complex, but lack of progress is frustrating. I remember reading Rachel Carson's *The Silent Spring* 40 years ago—progress since then has been snail-like.

Turning to the world summit on sustainable development in Johannesburg, which the Minister mentioned, I understand that the First Minister will be part of the UK delegation. Will he highlight the extreme need for rich countries to open their markets to exports from the poorer countries, so that they can earn their fair share of global trade, and for industrialised countries to stop dumping highly subsidised agricultural products in those countries?

Another matter that the Minister mentioned was the Cabinet sub-committee on sustainable development. I noticed that the minutes are not published within six weeks of the meeting. Is it possible to have an update either in Plenary or in Committee within a week of each meeting?

Sustainable development is far too important for anything less than an all-out effort by the Assembly, working with others. Any changes needed to our lifestyles are small compared to what could be forced upon future generations should we fail. The definition of sustainable development was raised this afternoon; the Assembly has already agreed on the definition following the January 2000 consultation report on sustainable development.

Mick Bates: I am proud and pleased that the Assembly is in the vanguard of promoting sustainable development. As far as I am aware, we are the only Government in

ariannu atalfeydd llifogydd, ond siawns na fyddai'n well dileu'r angen am atalfeydd llifogydd yn y lle cyntaf? Croesewir ein gostyngiad bach mewn allyriadau nwyon tŷ gwydr ers 1990. Fodd bynnag, mae'n annigonol yn wyneb yr angen am ostyngiad sylweddol. Mae'r arian ychwanegol sydd ar gael i sefydlu mesurau arbed ynni yn allweddol ac yn hir-ddisgwyliedig.

Yr wyf yn cydnabod fod mynd i'r afael ag unrhyw un o'r materion hyn yn anodd. Maent yn gymhleth, ond mae diffyg cynnydd yn perihwystredigaeth. Cofiaf ddarlenn *The Silent Spring* gan Rachel Carson 40 mlynedd yn ôl—ers hynny symudwyd ymlaen ar gyflymdra malwen.

A throi at uwch-gynhadledd y byd ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy yn Johannesburg, a grybwyllwyd gan y Gweinidog, deallaf y bydd Prif Weinidog Cymru yn rhan o ddirprwyaeth y DU. A wnaiff dynnu sylw at yr angen dirfawr i'r gwledydd cyfoethog agor eu marchnadoedd i allforion o'r gwledydd tlotach, fel y gallant hwythau ennill eu cyfran deg o fasnach y byd, ac i'r gwledydd diwydiannol roi'r gorau i arllwys cynhyrchion amaethyddol a sybsideiddwyd yn drwm i mewn i'r gwledydd hynny?

Mater arall a grybwyllodd y Gweinidog oedd is-bwyllgor y Cabinet ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Sylwais na chyhoeddir y cofnodion o fewn chwe wythnos i'r cyfarfod. A oes modd cael diweddariad un ai yn y Cyfarfod Llawn neu mewn Pwyllgor o fewn wythnos i bob cyfarfod?

Mae datblygu cynaliadwy yn llawer rhy bwysig i'r Cynulliad wneud dim llai nag ymdrechu ei orau glas, gan gydweithio ag eraill. Mae unrhyw newidiadau sydd eu hangen i'n ffordd o fyw yn fach o gymharu â'r hyn a allai gael ei orfodi ar genedlaethau'r dyfodol os methwn. Codwyd diffiniad datblygu cynaliadwy y prynhawn yma, mae'r Cynulliad eisoes wedi cytuno ar y diffiniad yn dilyn adroddiad ymgynghorol Ionawr 2000 ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy.

Mick Bates: Yr wyf yn falch ac yn hapus fod y Cynulliad ar flaen y gad o ran hyrwyddo datblygu cynaliadwy. Hyd y gwn i, ni yw'r unig Lywodraeth yn Ewrop a chanddi

Europe that has a statutory duty to promote sustainable development in the exercise of functions. The Assembly's sustainable development scheme was passed unanimously by all parties on 16 October 2000, and I welcomed it as a landmark document. It is excellent—a sustainable foundation for all our developments.

I congratulate those who drafted that document, and those who continue to assist by the production of the vision, as set out in the action plan. We all want to see delivery. It is not easy to deliver in these areas, and there is no quick fix. The use of a sustainable development integration toolkit is critical to delivery. Integration of work practices to break down the silo mentality remains central to the implementation of our ideals of sustainable development. For example, for far too long our perception of growth has always been economic. In Wales, we are making real progress in understanding that social, cultural and environmental indicators are fundamental to improving the quality of life of people in Wales.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I agree with everything that you have said, and I welcome your words. I am surprised that you have talked for over a minute and a half without claiming any credit for the partnership agreement.

Mick Bates: I trust that Members have noted the time that has just been wasted.

The process of integration must be subject to continuous monitoring and evaluation. I will focus my comments on these and in particular on renewable energy—the move we want to see to produce a low carbon economy. A crucial process must be undertaken to win the hearts and minds of people and to build a consensus that sustainable development is fundamental to providing a low carbon economy. We must enable people to see the benefits across all areas. When we talk of climate change, we know that this can be stopped or slowed greatly by reducing carbon in the atmosphere. That means ensuring that we develop renewable energy. Cross-cutting thinking is vital to producing our renewable energy targets, as advocated by the Economic

ddyletswydd statudol i hyrwyddo datblygu cynaliadwy wrth gyflawni'i swyddogaethau. Pasiwyd cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy y Cynulliad yn unfrydol gan bob plaid ar 16 Hydref 2000, ac fe'i croesewais fel dogfen a oedd yn garreg filltir. Mae'n ardderchog—yn sylfaen gynaliadwy i'n holl ddatblygiadau.

Llongyfarchaf y rhai a ddrafftiodd y ddogfen honno, a'r rhai sy'n dal i gynorthwyo drwy gynhyrchu'r weledigaeth, fel a amlinellir yn y cynllun gweithredu. Mae arnom i gyd eisiau gweld cyflawni. Nid yw'n hawdd cyflawni yn y meysydd hyn, ac nid oes ateb cyflym. Mae defnyddio pecyn integreiddio datblygu cynaliadwy yn allweddol i gyflawniad. Mae integreiddio arferion gwaith i chwalu'r meddylfryd seilo yn dal i fod yn ganolog i'n delfrydau datblygu cynaliadwy. Er enghraifft, am rhy hir o lawer bu ein syniad o dwf bob amser yn economaidd. Yng Nghymru, yr ydym yn symud ymlaen tuag at ddeall fod dangosyddion cymdeithasol, diwylliannol ac amgylcheddol yn hanfodol i wella ansawdd bywyd pobl yng Nghymru.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Cytunaf â phopeth a ddywedasoch, a chroesawaf eich geiriau. Yr wyf yn synnu eich bod wedi siarad am dros funud a hanner heb hawlio unrhyw glod am y cytundeb partneriaeth.

Mick Bates: Hyderaf y bydd yr Aelodau'n nodi'r amser a wastraffwyd yn awr.

Rhaid i'r broses integreiddio fod yn amodol ar fonitro a gwerthuso parhaus. Canolbwytiaf fy sylwadau ar hyn ac yn enwedig ar ynni adnewyddadwy—y symudiad y mae arnom eisiau ei weld i greu economi carbon isel. Rhaid ymgymryd â phroses hanfodol i ennill calonnau a meddyliau pobl ac i adeiladu consensws fod datblygu cynaliadwy yn sylfaenol i ddarparu economi carbon isel. Rhaid inni alluogi pobl i weld y manteision ar draws pob maes. Pan siaradwn am newid hinsawdd, gwyddom y gellir atal hyn neu ei arafu'n fawr drwy leihau carbon yn yr atmosffer. Golyga hyn sicrhau ein bod yn datblygu ynni adnewyddadwy. Mae meddwl trawsbynciol yn hollbwysig i gynhyrchu ein targedau ynni adnewyddadwy, fel a argymhellwyd gan y

Development Committee. It is no good to support renewable energy in principle, but oppose individual projects. Renewable energy developments must be sited sensitively. That is why we urgently need clear policy and planning guidance. I hope in response that we can hear how far we are from producing TAN8.

5:00 p.m.

Two weeks ago, we heard how committed the Scottish Executive is to renewable energy development at a National Assembly sustainable energy group meeting. Their chief civil servant and a member of the Scottish Parliament stated that they were prepared to overrule their statutory environmental advisers, if necessary, to develop this important industry. It is important that developers also persuade people of the benefits of these schemes and not simply impose them from above on communities. In this accountable age, people demand explanations and want to be part of the planning process. While windpower will be a major contributor, we must not overlook the enormous potential of biomass, solar and hydro energy and energy from waste. There are many businesses here in Wales that can provide the technology and the infrastructure, but we must encourage more exemplar projects.

Gareth Jones: Cytunaf â chi. Yr ydym i gyd yn gweld rhinweddau datblygu cynaliadwy, a gwelwn hynny fel gwardigaeth. Fodd bynnag, pan soniwch am newid agweddau a meddyliau, sut ydych chi, fel rhan o'r Llywodraeth, yn mynd i'r afael â hynny ac yn mynd i lwyddo yn y maes hwnnw? Edrychwch o'ch cwmpas yn y Siambr hon. Mae anghytuno ymysg Aelodau ar beth yw datblygu cynaliadwy. Mae'n rhaid cychwyn yma, cyn gorfodi'r waredigaeth sydd ei hangen ar bobl y tu allan i'r Cynulliad.

Mick Bates: I admit that the challenge to change people's mindset is enormous. I will end my contribution by stating three other challenges, which we must meet. As I have said, we need exemplar projects in this field. It is a wide and complex field, ranging from Communities First programmes to health

Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Nid yw'n dda i ddim cefnogi ynni adnewyddadwy mewn egwyddor, ond gwrthwynebu prosiectau unigol. Rhaid i ddatblygiadau ynni adnewyddadwy gael eu lleoli'n sensitif. Dyna pam y mae angen canllawiau cynllunio a pholisi clir ar fyrder. Gobeithiaf y cawn glywed yn yr ymateb pa mor bell yr ydym oddi wrth gynhyrchu TAN8.

Bythefnos yn ôl, clywsom gymaint yw ymrwymiad Gweithrediaeth yr Alban i ddatblygu ynni adnewyddadwy yng nghyfarfod grŵp ynni cynaliadwy y Cynulliad. Dywedodd eu prif was sifil ac aelod o Senedd yr Alban eu bod yn barod i fynd yn groes i'w cynghorwyr amgylcheddol statudol, pe bai angen, i ddatblygu'r diwydiant pwysig hwn. Mae'n bwysig fod datblygwyr hefyd yn darbwyllo pobl o fanteision y cynlluniau hyn ac nid dim ond yn eu gorfodi ar gymunedau oddi fry. Yn yr oes atebol hon, mae pobl yn mynnu esboniadau ac yn awyddus i fod yn rhan o'r broses gynllunio. Tra bydd ynni gwynt yn gyfrannwr mawr, rhaid peidio ag anghofio potensial aruthrol biomas, ynni haul a dŵr ac ynni o wastraff. Mae llawer o fusnesau yma yng Nghymru a all ddarparu'r dechnoleg a'r isadeiledd, ond rhaid inni annog mwy o brosiectau enghreifftiol.

Gareth Jones: I agree with you. We all see the virtues of sustainable development, and we see it as salvation. However, when you talk about changing minds and attitudes, how will you, as part of the Government, go about achieving these changes? Look around this Chamber. There is disagreement among Members on what sustainable development is. The work must begin here, before forcing the salvation that people outside the Assembly need.

Mick Bates: Cyfaddefaf fod yr her i newid meddyliau pobl yn enfawr. Gorffennaf fy nghyfraniad drwy ddatgan tair her arall y mae'n rhaid inni eu hateb. Fel y dywedais, mae angen prosiectau enghreifftiol yn y maes hwn. Mae'n faes eang a chymhleth, yn amrywio o raglenni Rhoi Cymunedau'n

improvement programmes to renewable energy strategies. The challenge is enormous. As you know, the National Assembly sustainable energy group has been set up, which has been an important part of the process of changing people's minds and breaking down barriers. There are examples from all over Europe of how Governments, through commitment, change policies, and through that process, people's minds, to create a better world.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You must wind up now, Mick.

Mick Bates: In producing these strategies, I am impatient to see outcomes. However, there are big challenges, and I will end with three of them. First, a challenge to the Assembly itself. Let us take the example of sustainable—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Do not give any more examples, just the three challenges because you have overrun quite a bit.

Mick Bates: Can we have a hydrogen or a liquified petroleum gas bus to carry people between Cardiff bay and Cathays Park? Can we make our new Chamber an example to the world? Can we have a turbine in Cardiff bay? Finally, let us see all our public bodies providing information in their annual reports about what proportion of food is purchased locally. I commend this report. It is a concept in which I believe passionately. I want Wales to be the world's best example of sustainable development promotion.

Cynog Dafis: Mae gennyf ychydig bwyntiau ar welliant 7 ynghylch newid yn yr hinsawdd ac economi carbon isel, gan ddilyn sylwadau Mick Bates, ac ar welliant 6 ynghylch cadw pobl ifanc yn eu cymunedau fel dangosydd o gynaliadwyedd.

Ynglŷn â gwelliant 7, bydd y pwysau i ostwng allyriadau carbon dros y blynyddoedd a'r degawdau nesaf yn parhau, er gwaethaf ymdrechion George Bush a chwmnïau olew megis Exxon i rwystro hynny. Bydd hyn yn ei dro yn gyrru newid technolegol, gan arwain at greu tanwydd newydd ac ati. John

Gyntaf i raglenni gwella iechyd i strategaethau ynni adnewyddadwy. Mae'r her yn aruthrol. Fel y gwyddoch, sefydlwyd grŵp ynni adnewyddadwy'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, a fu'n rhan bwysig o'r broses o newid meddyliau pobl a chwalu rhagfuriau. Ceir enghreifftiau ledled Ewrop o sut y gall Llywodraethau, drwy ymroddiad, newid polisïau, a thrwy'r broses honno, newid meddyliau pobl, i greu byd gwell.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Rhaid ichi ddirwyn i ben yn awr, Mick.

Mick Bates: Wrth lunio'r strategaethau hyn, yr wyf ar binnau eisiau gweld canlyniadau. Fodd bynnag, mae sawl her fawr, a diweddf drwy enwi tair ohonynt. Yn gyntaf, her i'r Cynulliad ei hun. Cymerwn enghraifft cludiant cynaliadwy—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Peidiwch â rhoi rhagor o enghreifftiau, dim ond y tair her oherwydd yr ydych wedi mynd gryn dipyn dros yr amser.

Mick Bates: A allwn gael bws hydrogen neu nwy petroliwm hylifedig i gludo pobl rhwng bae Caerdydd a Pharc Cathays? A allwn wneud ein Siambr newydd yn esiampl i'r byd? A allwn gael tyrbîn ym mae Caerdydd? Yn olaf, gadewch inni weld ein cyrff cyhoeddus i gyd yn darparu gwybodaeth yn eu hadroddiadau blynyddol ynghylch pa gyfran o fwyd a brynir yn lleol. Cymeradwyaf yr adroddiad hwn. Mae'n gysyniad y credaf yn angerddol ynddo. Mae arnaf eisiau i Gymru fod yr esiampl gorau yn y byd o hyrwyddo datblygu cynaliadwy.

Cynog Dafis: I have a few points on amendment 7 following on from Mick Bates's comments on climate change and a low-carbon economy, and on amendment 6 about retaining young people in their communities as an indicator of sustainability.

On amendment 7, the pressure to reduce carbon emissions in future years and decades will continue, despite the efforts of George Bush and oil companies such as Exxon to prevent this from happening. In turn, this will drive technological changes, leading to the creation of new fuels and so on. John

Houghton, pan oedd gerbron y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, a awgrymodd y dylai Cymru anelu at gael economi carbon isel oherwydd bod gennym ffynonellau posibl enfawr o ynni adnewyddadwy, ac oherwydd y gallai hynny ein rhoi ar flaen y gad o ran datblygiad technolegau arloesol gan roi mantais economaidd inni o ganlyniad.

Mae trydydd rheswm yr hoffwn sôn amdano hefyd. Yr ydym yn byw mewn gwlad o anheddau bach a chanolig eu maint sydd yn wasgaredig. Byddai gwella perfformiad economaidd bron yn sicr yn golygu cynnydd yn symudolled pobl a nwyddau, ar waethaf ymdrechion i greu darpariaeth amgen. Oni bai ein bod yn datblygu tanwydd carbon isel—yn ôl arbenigwyr, mae hydrogen yn bosibilrwydd real iawn dros yr 20 mlynedd nesaf—bydd gwrthdaro rhwng ein hawydd i greu economi lwyddiannus ar y naill law a'n hymrwymiad i ddatblygu cynaliadwy ar y llall. A oes gwaith yn cael ei wneud ar danwydd? Cefnogaf awgrym Mick Bates y dylai'r bws sy'n mynd o'r adeilad hwn i Barc Cathays ddefnyddio nwy petroliwm hylifedig neu, yn well byth, hydrogen.

Mae'r gwelliant hwn hefyd yn tynnu sylw at ynni adnewyddadwy, gyda gwynt ar dir ac ar fôr yn arwain y gad. Gadewch inni fod yn onest ynglŷn â hyn—mae angen mwy o ddatblygiad ym maes ynni gwynt ar dir ac ar fôr. Mae siomiant chwerw yn y diwydiant ar hyn o bryd o ganlyniad i record y Llywodraeth a record y Gweinidog ar hynny. Bydd angen dyblu ymdrechion i adfer y sefyllfa.

Cefnogaf sylwadau Christine Gwyther ar gronfa datblygu cynaliadwy y parciau cenedlaethol. Gwn fod prosiect biomas yn Sir Benfro wedi methu oherwydd arafwch proses Amcan 1. Mae'n drueni bod cynllun o'r fath wedi methu.

Trof at welliant 6 sy'n sôn am ddangosyddion. Mae cytuno ar ddangosyddion heblaw cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth a thwf economaidd confensiynol yn fusnes cymhleth. Yr wyf o'r farn fod sicrhau llwyddiant y rheini'n bwysig os ydym am greu dyfodol cenedlaethol hyderus i Gymru. Serch hynny, mae'n bosibl

Houghton, at a meeting of the Economic Development Committee, suggested that Wales should aim towards creating a low-carbon economy because of the country's huge potential sources of renewable energy, and because it could allow us to lead the way in the development of innovative technologies that would result in economic benefit.

There is also a third reason that I would like to mention. We live in a country of scattered small and medium-sized dwellings. Improving economic performance would almost certainly mean an increase in the mobility of people and commodities, despite efforts to create alternative provision. Unless we develop low-carbon fuels—according to experts, hydrogen will be a very real possibility over the next 20 years—a conflict could arise between our desire to create a successful economy on the one hand and our commitment to sustainable development on the other. Is work being undertaken on fuels? I support Mick Bates's suggestion that the bus that travels from this building to Cathays Park should use liquefied petroleum gas or, even better, hydrogen.

This amendment also draws attention to renewable energy, with offshore and onshore wind leading the way. Let us be honest about this—we need more onshore and offshore wind power development. The industry is very disappointed at present with the record of the Government and the Minister in this respect. Efforts will need to be redoubled to rectify the situation.

I support Christine Gwyther's comments on the national parks' sustainable development fund. I know that the biomass project in Pembrokeshire failed as a result of the protracted nature of the Objective 1 process. It is regrettable that such a scheme failed.

I turn to amendment 6, which refers to indicators. Agreeing on indicators other than gross domestic product and conventional economic growth is a complex business. In my opinion, ensuring their success is important if we are to create a confident national future for Wales. However, it is possible to increase GDP while, at the same

cynyddu CMC tra bod ansawdd bywyd yn gwaethygu ac allgáu cymdeithasol yn cynyddu. Nid oes dim o'i le ar y 12 dangosydd sydd gennym, ond y mae un ar goll, sef yr un a grybwyllir yng ngwelliant 6. Yr hyn fydd yn mesur yn glir ein llwyddiant i gyfuno ffyniant economaidd ac ansawdd bywyd fydd ein gallu i ddenu ein pobl ifanc i aros yn eu rhanbarthau eu hunain neu o leiaf yng Nghymru. O ystyried y peth o chwith, mae cadw cyfran uwch o lawer o'n pobl ifanc yng Nghymru yn hanfodol ar gyfer ein bywiogrwydd economaidd, cymdeithasol, diwylliannol ac ieithyddol a'n hunaniaeth genedlaethol. Gadewch inni ddatgan hynny yn ddfloesgni.

Gydol yr ugeinfed ganrif, a'r ail hanner yn enwedig, sef rhan helaeth fy mywyd i, parhaodd y patrwm yng Nghymru o allforio'r ifanc a'r rhai sy'n economaidd weithgar, yn enwedig y mwyaf galluog a chymwysedig, ar raddfa aruthrol. Mae hyn wedi nychu ein bywyd cymunedol a chenedlaethol. Nid yw cymunedau a gwlad gyfan sy'n dioddef syndrom o'r fath yn gynaliadwy. Mae gwreiddiau'r syndrom yn ddwfn ac yn gymhleth; maent yn economaidd ac yn ymagweddol. Byddai newid y duedd yn golygu gweithredu ar sawl ffrynt: datblygu economaidd priodol; cyngor gyrfaol; datblygu strategaeth marchnad lafur; creu llwybrau gyrfaol cyffrous yng Nghymru; a hyrwyddo bywyd diwylliannol cyffrous. Y cam cyntaf yw cydnabod yr angen, a golyga hynny ei gynnwys yn ein strategaeth datblygu cynaliadwy fel un o brif ddangosyddion llwyddiant.

5:10 p.m.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You need to wind up now, Cynog.

Cynog Dafis: Bu trafod yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf ar ymfudiad yng Nghymru. Bu'r drafodaeth ar adegau yn ddefnyddiol ac, ar adegau eraill, yn salw. Yr hyn sydd yn drueni yw bod y drafodaeth wedi canolbwyntio ar fewnfudiad yn hytrach nag ar allfudiad. Felly mae angen newid natur y drafodaeth. Yr wyf yn falch bod y Gweinidog yn cefnogi ysbryd y gwelliant hwn, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar iddi am hynny.

time, seeing deterioration in quality of life and increasing social exclusion. There is nothing wrong with the current 12 indicators, but there is one missing, namely that referred to in amendment 6. One thing that will give a clear measure of our success in combining economic prosperity and quality of life will be our ability to retain our young people in their own regions or at least in Wales. If we consider this from a different perspective, retaining a much higher proportion of our young people in Wales is crucial our economic, social, cultural and linguistic vibrancy and to our national identity. Let us state that unequivocally.

Throughout the twentieth century, particularly the second half, which represents the greater part of my lifetime, the pattern of exporting young people and the economically active from Wales, particularly the ablest and most qualified, has continued apace. This has undermined our community and national life. Communities and an entire country that suffer such a syndrome are unsustainable. The roots of this syndrome are deeply embedded and complex; they are economic and attitudinal. Changing this tendency would require action on several fronts: appropriate economic development; careers advice; developing a labour market strategy; creating exciting career paths in Wales; and promoting a vibrant cultural life. The first step is recognising the need, which necessitates its inclusion in our sustainable development strategy as one of the main indicators of success.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae angen ichi ddirwyn i ben yn awr, Cynog.

Cynog Dafis: There has been discussion over the past year about migration in Wales. The discussion has been useful at times and futile at others, poor. It is a pity that it has concentrated on in-migration rather than out-migration. Therefore, the nature of the discussion needs to be changed. I am pleased that the Minister supports the spirit of this amendment, and I am grateful to her for that.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You may have one more sentence.

Cynog Dafis: Hyderaf y bydd modd cynnwys hyn fel dangosydd, ac y bydd cyfle i'r gweithgor trawsbleidiol drafod y pwynt yn ei gyfarfod cyntaf yr wythnos nesaf.

Alison Halford: I congratulate the Minister for Environment and the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee for the National Assembly's exciting sustainable policies. I support the motion. Sustainability has developed from a concept, via consultation, into a scheme, action plan and delivery. We are on the threshold of a new era—with 'Deciding to Live Differently', 'Learning to Live Differently', 'How we are Learning to Live Differently'. With opportunities like these, I want to herald advances in my constituency, and I will discuss that shortly.

I need not rehearse the arguments for sustainability, but who would now contest the Brundtland principles that sustainability must be our overarching goal? I welcome the Wales ecological footprint and the statistical monitoring of our 12 adopted indicators in 'How we are Learning to Live Differently'. Coupled with a scheme and action plan, these are assurance of progress. We are planning and developing the means, and indeed, beginning to live differently in Wales.

What about Flintshire? Scanning the 12 indicators, we see that climate change and renewable energy are crucial. We know that carbon sequestration alone will not curb carbon dioxide-induced global warming. The Mold based firm Celtic Offshore Wind Ltd is familiar to us, and certainly to you, Cynog. It has been running awareness consultation meetings in north Wales on its Rhyl flats offshore wind generation scheme. This exciting project will initially generate 1.5 per cent of Wales's energy needs, rising soon to 2.5 per cent. Having just four similar sites will meet our target of using 10 per cent renewable energy by 2010, and even more. I support this and similar initiatives. The prognosis is remarkable: similar sites under 1 per cent of the UK's coastal seabed would

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Cewch un frawddeg arall.

Cynog Dafis: I trust that it will be possible to include this as an indicator, and that the cross-party working group will have an opportunity to discuss it at its first meeting next week.

Alison Halford: Llongyfarchaf y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd a Phwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth am bolisiau cynaliadwy cyffrous y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Cefnogaf y cynnig. Datblygodd cynaliadwyedd o gysyniad, drwy ymgynghoriad, i gynllun, cynllun gweithredu a chyflawniad. Yr ydym ar drothwy oes newydd—gyda 'Penderfynu Byw'n Wahanol', 'Dysgu Byw'n Wahanol', 'Sut yr Ydym yn Dysgu Byw'n Wahanol'. Gyda chyfleoedd fel y rhain, hoffwn gyhoeddi camau ymlaen yn fy etholaeth, a thrafodaf hynny cyn hir.

Nid oes angen imi ailadrodd y dadleuon dros gynaliadwyedd, ond pwy yn awr a ddadleuai yn erbyn egwyddorion Brundtland mai cynaliadwyedd ddylai fod ein nod cyffredin? Croesawaf ôl troed ecolegol Cymru a'r monitro ystadegol ar ein 12 dangosydd mabwysiedig yn 'Sut yr ydym yn Dysgu Byw'n Wahanol'. Ochr yn ochr â chynllun a chynllun gweithredu, dyma sicrwydd ein bod yn symud ymlaen. Yr ydym yn cynllunio ac yn datblygu'r modd, ac, yn wir, yn dechrau byw'n wahanol yng Nghymru.

Beth am Sir y Fflint? O fwrw golwg dros y 12 dangosydd, gwelwn fod newid hinsawdd ac ynni adnewyddadwy yn allweddol. Gwyddom na wnaiff atafaelu carbon ar ei ben ei hun ffrwyno cynhesu byd-eang dan ysgogaeth carbon deuocsid. Mae'r cwmmi o'r Wyddgrug, Celtic Offshore Wind Ltd, yn gyfarwydd inni, ac yn sicr i chi, Cynog. Bu'n cynnal cyfarfodydd ymgynghori ar ymwybyddiaeth yn y Gogledd ar ei gynllun cynhyrchu ynni gwynt ar y môr ar draethellau'r Rhyl. Bydd y prosiect cyffrous hwn yn cynhyrchu 1.5 y cant o anghenion ynni Cymru ar y dechrau, gan godi'n fuan i 2.5 y cant. Bydd cael dim ond pedwar safle tebyg yn taro'n targed o ddefnyddio 10 y cant o ynni adnewyddadwy erbyn 2010, a mwy eto. Cefnogaf hyn a mentrau tebyg. Mae'r

allow us to generate, by renewable means, 40 per cent of Britain's energy by 2030, involving some 24,000 turbines. Do not be frightened by these figures; technology is growing apace and capacity for neater units is close. However, the 20 to 25-year lifespan is a concern but, provided Crown estates will renew leases, the system can deliver us from a large part of our fossil fuel dependency. Lease renewal is a matter I would urge the Minister for Environment and the First Minister to pursue through appropriate channels.

Flintshire's economic development is being given a major boost at the Shotton Paper Company's new plant through increased paper recycling. It is possible to achieve 100 per cent recycling. The First Minister and Sue Essex deserve support for assisting this project. It is Tom Middlehurst's responsibility, as it is in his constituency, to expand the possibilities of this exciting new initiative. I congratulate the company for its support of Young Reporters for the Environment, which is an important awareness and ideas driver. Also in Flint, NuLife Glass will extract lead from scrapped television and personal computer monitors, and it is geared up to handle four tonnes of glass a day. This is a timely development that will remove hazardous waste from all the wrong places. The company employs 15 people, and is another example of how profit can come from environmental protection.

Finally, another even more futuristic waste disposal with lower air quality impact is the recycling of tyres by pyrolysis, developed by a constituent of mine. It is in its early stages, but it can produce high quality products, including oil and black carbon. If anybody wants to know what black carbon is, I will tell you later—it is rather complicated. The Wales Environmental Trust backs the project; Michael Meacher is interested, and Flintshire County Council is examining it. It is important. It has the prospect of just 44 units dealing with the 750 to 850 tonnes of tyres that currently clog Europe's landfill sites. Air quality is an issue that is being addressed.

argoelion yn hynod: byddai safleoedd tebyg dan 1 y cant o wely môr glannau'r DU yn caniatáu inni gynhyrchu, drwy ddulliau adnewyddadwy, 40 y cant o ynni Prydain erbyn 2030, gan ddefnyddio rhyw 24,000 o dyrbinau. Peidiwch â gadael i'r ffigurau hyn eich dychryn; mae technoleg yn tyfu yn gyflym ac mae'r gallu i greu unedau twtiach yn agos. Er hynny, mae'r hyd oes o 20 i 25 mlynedd yn destun pryder ond, os gwnaiff stadau'r Goron adnewyddu prydlesi, gall y system ein gwared rhag rhan fawr o'n dibyniaeth ar danwydd ffosil. Mae adnewyddu'r prydlesi'n fater y byddwn yn annog y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd a Phrif Weinidog Cymru i fynd ar ei ôl drwy'r sianeli priodol.

Caiff datblygiad economaidd Sir y Fflint hwb mawr yn ffatri newydd Shotton Paper Company drwy fwy o ailgylchu papur. Mae modd sicrhau ailgylchu 100 y cant. Mae'r Prif Weinidog a Sue Essex yn haeddu cefnogaeth am gynorthwyo'r prosiect hwn. Cyfrifoldeb Tom Middlehurst, gan mai yn ei etholaeth ef y mae, yw ehangu posibiliadau'r fenter newydd gyffrous hon. Llongyfarchaf y cwmni am ei gefnogaeth i fenter Young Reporters for the Environment, sy'n hyrwyddwr ymwybyddiaeth a syniadau pwysig. Hefyd yn y Fflint, bydd NuLife Glass yn tynnu plwm o hen sgriniau teledu a chyfrifiaduron, a gall ddelio â hyd at bedair tunnell o wydr y dydd. Dyma ddatblygiad amserol a fydd yn tynnu gwastraff peryglus o leoedd anaddas. Mae'r cwmni'n cyflogi 15 o bobl, ac mae'n enghraifft arall o'r modd y gellir gwneud elw o warchod yr amgylchedd.

Yn olaf, dull arall sydd fwy fyth o flaen yr oes o waredu gwastraff gan effeithio llai ar ansawdd aer yw ailgylchu teiars drwy byrolysis, a ddatblygwyd gan un o fy etholwyr. Mae'n ddyddiau cynnar arno, ond gall gynhyrchu cynnyrch o ansawdd da, gan gynnwys olew a charbon du. Os oes unrhyw un eisiau gwybod beth yw carbon du, fe ddywedaf wrthyhych wedyn—mae'n gymhleth, braidd. Mae Ymddiriedolaeth Amgylcheddol Cymru'n cefnogi'r prosiect; mae gan Michael Meacher ddiddordeb, ac mae Cyngor Sir y Fflint yn edrych arno. Mae'n bwysig. Mae'n argoeli y gallai 44 uned yn unig ddelio â'r oddeutu 750 i 850 tunnell o deiars sydd ar

hyn o bryd yn llenwi safleoedd tirlenwi Ewrop. Mae ansawdd aer yn fater sy'n cael sylw.

I am sad that we have heard some rather negative comments from Plaid Cymru. Sue Essex and the Assembly are leading the way on sustainability and I support what Sue is doing and congratulate her and her Committee.

Phil Williams: Like motherhood and apple pie—or mam and Welsh cakes, as Professor Gwyn Alf Williams used to say—everybody supports sustainable development. However, pious declarations and statutory obligations are no good unless we define our goals and make real, measurable progress. We can certainly measure carbon dioxide. Earlier in the year, John Houghton spoke to the Economic Development Committee. As co-chair of the science committee of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change, he is undoubtedly the most important Welshman alive. The stark warning that I have heard him repeat over the past 20 years is at last accepted by all reputable scientists and all responsible governments. A large reduction in carbon dioxide emission is the most important measure of sustainability and should have been the key feature of our economic policy for the past three years. We are at last carrying out an energy study. Wales is rich in non-polluting energy, from wind, hydro, tides, biomass and the sun, and there is no technical problem in generating the energy that we need from renewable sources at competitive prices. This would create many new jobs in Wales. All we need is the courage to decide which combination is best. The only barrier is a lack of political will.

During the Assembly's first three years, Wales has lost its leading position in this field with many projects held up. The long awaited technical advice note on renewable energy has been postponed time and time again, just like this debate. In a sustainable Wales it will be equally important to conserve energy. Much higher standards for house insulation are an urgent priority. It is

Yr wyf yn drist ein bod wedi clywed sylwadau braidd yn negyddol gan Blaid Cymru. Mae Sue Essex a'r Cynulliad yn arwain y ffordd ar gynaliadwyedd a chefnogaf yr hyn y mae Sue'n ei wneud a llongyfarchaf hi a'i Phwyllgor.

Phil Williams: Fel mamolaeth a theisen afalau—neu mam a phice ar y maen, fel y dywedai'r Athro Gwyn Alf Williams—mae pawb o blaid datblygu cynaliadwy. Fodd bynnag, nid yw datganiadau duwiol a dyletswyddau statudol yn dda i ddim oni ddiffiniwn ein targedau a chymryd camau mesuradwy, gwirioneddol ymlaen. Yn sicr gallwn fesur carbon deuocsid. Yn gynharach yn y flwyddyn, siaradodd John Houghton â'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Fel cydgadeirydd pwyllgor gwyddoniaeth y Panel Rhynglywodraethol ar Newid yn yr Hinsawdd, ef yn ddi-os yw'r Cymro pwysicaf yn fyw. Mae'r rhybudd llym a glywais dro ar ôl tro ganddo dros yr 20 mlynedd diwethaf wedi'i dderbyn o'r diwedd gan bob gwyddonydd o fri a phob llywodraeth gyfrifol. Gostyngiad mawr mewn allyriadau carbon deuocsid yw'r mesur pwysicaf o gynaliadwyedd a dyma ddylasai fod yn nodwedd allweddol ein polisi economaidd am y tair blynedd diwethaf. Yr ydym o'r diwedd yn gwneud astudiaeth ynni. Mae Cymru'n gyfoethog o ynni di-lygredd, yn wynt, dŵr, llanw, biomas a'r haul, ac nid oes problem dechnegol inni gynhyrchu'r ynni sydd ei angen arnom o ffynonellau adnewyddadwy ar brisiau cystadleuol. Byddai hyn yn creu llawer o swyddi newydd yng Nghymru. Y cwbl sydd arnom ei angen yw'r dewrder i benderfynu pa gyfuniad yw'r gorau. Yr unig rwystr yw diffyg ewyllys wleidyddol.

Yn ystod tair blynedd cyntaf y Cynulliad, colodd Cymru ei lle blaenllaw yn y maes hwn wrth i lawer o brosiectau gael eu dal yn ôl. Cafodd y nodyn cyngor technegol hir-ddisgwyliedig ar ynni adnewyddadwy ei ohirio dro ar ôl tro, yn union fel y ddadl hon. Mewn Cymru gynaliadwy bydd yr un mor bwysig arbed ynni. Mae safonau llawer uwch ar gyfer ynysu tai yn flaenoriaeth frys. Siom

disappointing how few BREEAM excellent buildings there are in Wales, even in the public sector, and even on our energy park. On Baglan Energy Park we should be concerned at how the moratorium on gas power stations was ended. Unless gas power stations are associated with a full combined heat and power programme to use the waste heat, they create an unnecessary and unacceptable level of greenhouse emission, yet a gas powered station is being built in Baglan with no plans for CHP. It is sad that our often proclaimed energy park is so unsustainable.

It would be pointless to tackle energy and do nothing about transport. Those of us committed to sustainable development have a vision of using broadband video communication to eliminate car journeys to and from meetings. Three years ago we were in a strong position to do this, with optic fibre in place linking our telephone exchanges. Again little has happened over three years. We have had three years of statements and declarations and tiny sums of money while we fall further behind. Full sustainable development is a big idea, but it needs a Government that can make big decisions. I may be impatient, but the cost of delay is frustrating.

I will end with one big idea for the future—I hope that the Government will take it. A Swansea scientist, William Grove, invented fuel cells that can drive cars, buses and lorries with hydrogen as fuel producing zero carbon dioxide. This will happen. Would it not be appropriate if Ford could be persuaded to develop a Swansea invention at its factory in Bridgend? Sustainable development is an exciting and big challenge and the rewards could be enormous. I plead with the Government to be bold. The Minister and I are both ex-academics and we are always in danger of being perfectionists and of wanting every last bit of information, but the issue is urgent. If the Government is to show a real commitment to sustainable development, we want to see measurable progress and the vision that transforms our shared principles into sustained economic prosperity.

yw bod cyn lleied o adeiladau rhagorol BREEAM yng Nghymru, hyd yn oed yn y sector cyhoeddus, a hyd yn oed yn ein parc ynni ni. Ym Mharc Ynni Baglan dylem fod yn pryderu ynghylch y modd y terfynwyd y moratoriwm ar orsafoedd pŵer nwy. Os na chysylltir gorsafoedd pŵer nwy â rhaglen gwres a phŵer cyfunedig lawn i ddefnyddio'r gwres gwastraff, byddant yn creu lefel ddiangen ac annerbyniol o nwyon tŷ gwydr, eto mae gorsaf bŵer nwy'n cael ei hadeiladu ym Maglan heb gynlluniau ar gyfer gwres a phŵer cyfunedig. Mae'n drist fod ein parc ynni a ganmolir yn aml mor anghyaliadwy.

Byddai'n ddibwynt mynd i'r afael ag ynni a gwneud dim am drafnidiaeth. Mae gan y rheini ohonom sydd ag ymrwymiad i ddatblygu cynaliadwy weledigaeth o ddefnyddio cyfathrebu fideo band llydan i ddileu siwrneiau car yn ôl ac ymlaen i gyfarfodydd. Dair blynedd yn ôl yr oeddem mewn safle cryf i wneud hyn, gyda ffibr optig wedi'i osod i gysylltu'n cyfnewidfeydd ffôn. Eto, nid oes fawr ddim wedi digwydd dros dair blynedd. Cawsom dair blynedd o ddatganiadau a chyhoeddiadau a symiau pitw o arian tra cwmpwn ymhellach ar ôl. Mae datblygu cynaliadwy llawn yn syniad mawr, ond mae angen Llywodraeth a all wneud penderfyniadau mawr. Efallai fy mod yn ddiamynedd, ond mae cost yr oedi'n peri rhwystredigaeth.

Diweddaf gydag un syniad ar gyfer y dyfodol—gobeithiaf y gwnaiff y Llywodraeth ei gymryd. Dyfeisiodd gwyddonydd o Abertawe, William Grove, gelloedd tanwydd a all yrru ceir, bysus a lorïau ar hydrogen heb gynhyrchu dim carbon deuocsid. Mae hyn am ddigwydd. Oni fyddai'n briodol pe gellid perswadio Ford i ddatblygu dyfais o Abertawe yn ei ffatri ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr? Mae datblygu cynaliadwy yn her gyffrous a mawr a gallai'r enillion fod yn enfawr. Erfyniaf ar y Llywodraeth i fod yn eofn. Mae'r Gweinidog a mi ill dau'n gyn-academyddion ac yr ydym bob amser mewn perygl o fod yn berffeithwyr ac o fod eisiau pob tamaid olaf o wybodaeth, ond mae hwn yn fater brys. Os yw'r Llywodraeth am ddangos gwir ymrwymiad i ddatblygu cynaliadwy, mae arnom eisiau gweld cynnydd y gellir ei fesur, a gweledigaeth fydd yn trawsnewid yr egwyddorion a rannwn yn

ffyniant economaidd parhaus.

5:20 p.m.

Glyn Davies: Like Phil Williams, we are probably all in favour of the principle of sustainable development, irrespective of whether it is defined as Alison Halford's Brundtland declaration or in other ways, as have been referred to by Members. It is difficult for the principle to be manifested as detailed, specific proposals, but that is what we must do if it is not going to be the pious declaration that Phil referred to, and if it is not going to be just words. That was David Davies's point.

This issue was of particular interest to me this week, as I prepared to contribute to a fringe meeting at the Conservative spring conference to be held in Llandudno at the weekend—I thought that Members might want to know about that.

David Melding: It is a sell-out.

Glyn Davies: I am looking forward to seeing the sustainable development action plans of all Assembly sponsored public bodies. I hope that they will be more than just words and strategies and that they will relate to specific and hard principles. If the Countryside Council for Wales's plan is published by next weekend it will be useful for me, as I prepare for my fringe meeting.

There are many politically difficult aspects to this issue, which is why I will not criticise the Minister or Government today. Today we have seen much news coverage of a typically difficult proposal: the tax on supermarket plastic bags. It is an important subject and I am in favour of that measure. However, it is also an encouragement for the Chancellor of the Exchequer to introduce a new tax and there has never been a Chancellor in history so adept at creating new taxes. It is a heavy political price to pay to be seen to be encouraging Gordon Brown, but I believe that we must support that proposal, to give but one example.

Glyn Davies: Fel Phil Williams, mae'n debyg ein bod i gyd o blaid yr egwyddor o ddatblygu cynaliadwy, dim ots os y'i diffinnir yn ôl datganiad Brundtland Alison Halford neu mewn ffyrdd eraill, fel y crybwyllodd Aelodau. Mae'n anodd troi'r egwyddor yn gynigion penodol, manwl, ond dyna sy'n rhaid inni ei wneud os nad yw am fod y datganiad duwiol y cyfeiriodd Phil ato, ac os yw am fod yn fwy na geiriau'n unig. Dyna oedd pwynt David Davies.

Yr oedd y mater hwn o ddiddordeb arbennig i mi yr wythnos hon, wrth imi baratoi i gyfrannu i gyfarfod ymylol yng nghynhadledd wanwyn y Ceidwadwyr a gynhelir yn Llandudno y penwythnos hwn—meddyliais efallai yr hoffai'r Aelodau wybod am honno.

David Melding: Mae'r tocynnau i gyd wedi'u gwerthu.

Glyn Davies: Yr wyf yn edrych ymlaen at weld cynlluniau gweithredu datblygu cynaliadwy yr holl gyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad. Gobeithiaf y byddant yn fwy na dim ond geiriau a strategaethau ac y byddant yn ymwneud ag egwyddorion caled a phenodol. Os cyhoeddir cynllun y Cyngor Cefn Gwlad erbyn y penwythnos nesaf bydd yn ddefnyddiol i mi, wrth imi baratoi ar gyfer fy nghyfarfod ymylol.

Mae llawer o agweddau gwleidyddol anodd i'r mater hwn, a dyna pam na feirniadaf y Gweinidog na'r Llywodraeth heddiw. Heddiw yr ydym wedi gweld llawer o sôn ar y newyddion am gynnig sy'n nodweddiadol anodd: codi treth ar fagiau plastig uwchfarchnadoedd. Mae'n destun pwysig ac yr wyf o blaid y cam hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, mae'n anogaeth hefyd i Ganghellor y Trysorlys gyflwyno treth newydd ac ni fu Canghellor erioed mewn hanes mor fedrus am greu trethi newydd. Mae'n bris gwleidyddol trwm i'w dalu, cael fy ngweld yn annog Gordon Brown, ond credaf fod rhaid inni gefnogi'r cynnig hwnnw, â rhoi dim ond un enghraifft.

Flooding, which was mentioned earlier, is another important area. Most of the discussions seem to centre on flood defence and how we deal with some of the obvious problems. However, the only sustainable way of dealing with the problem is to deal with the retention of water inland for longer periods and to change land use. That will be difficult and expensive. However, unless we do that, our sustainable development principles will not have much meaning.

Another difficult issue that we must face is waste disposal, and if we are to make any progress it is vital that we have a step change in the level of recycling and in how we encourage people to produce less waste. The Assembly has been established for three years, and although much progress has been made—I will not pretend differently—the trends in the increase of waste mean that, unless we have significant proposals, we will not get ahead of this problem.

I will mention the Tir Gofal scheme, which is important to me. That agri-environment scheme is a crucial part of sustainable development, and is supported by all Members. It started in a significant way in the early 1990s, probably, with schemes such as Tir Cymen and environmentally sensitive areas. Tir Gofal was introduced by Ron Davies, when he was Secretary of State for Wales. However, a point had to come when the whole agriculture industry in Wales realised that this was to be the way forward. That happened last year, albeit in difficult circumstances. There is no doubt that the scheme is seen as a hugely exciting opportunity. However, it means that vastly increased resources are needed if we are to take advantage of this opportunity. Our current funding of Tir Gofal is not adequate to meet our requirements. This scheme will suffer. Sustainable development will never be a cost-free option. It will always require much political courage and responsibility on behalf of opposition parties. However, first and foremost, it will require political courage by the Government here and in Westminster. Schemes that make a real difference must be introduced. It will not be easy. I hope that, as a Member of an opposition party—temporarily—I can respond positively to your

Mae llifogydd, a grybwyllwyd yn gynharach, yn faes pwysig arall. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o drafodaethau fel pe baent yn canolbwyntio ar amddiffyn rhag llifogydd a sut i ddelio â rhai o'r problemau amlwg. Fodd bynnag, yr unig ffordd gynaliadwy o ddelio â'r broblem yw delio â chwestiwn dal dŵr ar dir am gyfnodau hwy a newid defnydd tir. Bydd hynny'n anodd ac yn ddrud. Fodd bynnag, oni wnawn hynny, ni fydd llawer o ystyr i'n hegwyddorion datblygu cynaliadwy.

Mater anodd arall y mae'n rhaid inni ei wynebu yw gwaredu gwastraff, ac os ydym am symud ymlaen o gwbl mae'n hollbwysig inni gael newid cam yn y lefel ailgylchu a'r modd yr anogwn bobl i gynhyrchu llai o wastraff. Mae'r Cynulliad wedi'i sefydlu ers tair blynedd, ac er bod llawer wedi'i gyflawni—ni chymeraf arnaf fel arall—golyga'r tueddiadau yng nghynnydd gwastraff na threchwn y broblem hon oni chawn gynigion sylweddol.

Crybwyllaf gynllun Tir Gofal, sy'n bwysig i mi. Mae'r cynllun amaeth-amgylchedd hwnnw'n rhan allweddol o ddatblygu cynaliadwy, ac mae pob Aelod yn ei gefnogi. Dechreuodd mewn ffordd arwyddocaol yn y 1990au cynnar, mae'n debyg, gyda chynlluniau fel Tir Cymen ac ardaloedd amgylcheddol sensitif. Cyflwynwyd Tir Gofal gan Ron Davies, pan oedd yn Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd yn rhaid i bwynt ddod pryd y byddai'r diwydiant amaethyddol cyfan yng Nghymru'n sylweddoli mai hon fyddai'r ffordd ymlaen. Digwyddodd hyn y llynedd, er mewn amgylchiadau anodd. Nid oes dim amheuaeth na welir y cynllun fel cyfle hynod o gyffrous. Fodd bynnag, mae'n golygu fod angen llawer iawn mwy o adnoddau os ydym am fanteisio ar y cyfle hwn. Nid yw'r cyllid a roddwn i Tir Gofal ar hyn o bryd yn ddigonol i ateb ein gofynion. Bydd y cynllun hwn yn dioddef. Ni fydd datblygu cynaliadwy byth yn opsiwn di-gost. Bydd bob amser yn galw am gyfrifoldeb a dewrder gwleidyddol gan y gwrthbleidiau. Fodd bynnag, yn anad dim, bydd yn galw am ddewrder gwleidyddol gan y Llywodraeth yma ac yn San Steffan. Rhaid cyflwyno cynlluniau a wnaiff wahaniaeth go iawn. Ni fydd yn hawdd. Gobeithiaf, fel Aelod o wrthblaid—dros dro—y gallaf

proposals.

The Minister for Environment (Sue Essex): I have been told that I have one minute and 45 seconds to save the planet, or to respond to the debate. I will pick up on a few details—I cannot respond to everything—before moving on to general points. The minutes of the Cabinet sub-committee should be available six weeks after each meeting, but it depends on when the sub-committee meets to ratify them. We discussed sustainable development and health on Monday, Rhodri Glyn, so we are considering those issues across the board. Christine Gwyther gave a good plug for EDF funding. I accept that; it has created excellent schemes. I accept that we must take risks at times, and we have seen the benefit of that. Christine mentioned the tidal power scheme, which is a renewable form of energy. This is not just about one form of renewable energy. We must consider what opportunities we have and use the best resources that we have in Wales to bring that forward.

Phil raised many points. On buildings, the Design Commission for Wales and Rethink Construction can come together to consider new building forms and styles that will deliver sustainable development. That is an advantage that we must develop in Wales.

The overall point that I wish to make relates to Glyn's point about political courage: I will take him at his word that it is a duty on the opposition parties, as well as the Government. We have put extra money into Tir Gofal—it is a born-in-Wales scheme that has proved itself. It is important that we pursue that. However, the issue is wider than that. As someone said during a recent debate on renewable energy, it is not an overriding viewpoint. That is not the way forward. We must bring people together to work through the difficult decisions that must be made now. There are still tensions between economic development and sustainable development, as Members have suggested. We must face those tensions and try to make the decisions more transparent and easier to address.

ymateb yn gadarnhaol i'ch cynigion.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd (Sue Essex): Dywedwyd wrthyf fod gennyf un munud a 45 eiliad i achub y blaned, neu i ymateb i'r ddadl. Codaf ambell un o'r manylion—ni allaf ymateb i bopeth—cyn symud ymlaen at bwyntiau cyffredinol. Dylai cofnodion is-bwyllgor y Cabinet fod ar gael chwe wythnos wedi pob cyfarfod, ond mae'n dibynnu pa bryd y cyferfydd yr is-bwyllgor i'w cadarnhau. Trafodasom ddatblygu cynaliadwy a iechyd ddydd Llun, Rhodri Glyn, felly yr ydym yn ystyried y materion hynny ar draws y bwrdd. Rhoddodd Christine Gwyther hys-bys da i gyllid cronfa ddatblygu'r amgylchedd. Derbyniaf hynny; mae wedi creu cynlluniau rhagorol. Derbyniaf fod yn rhaid mentro weithiau, ac yr ydym wedi gweld manteision hynny. Soniodd Christine am y cynllun ynni'r llanw, sy'n ffurf adnewyddadwy o ynni. Nid trafod un ffurf o ynni adnewyddadwy yn unig a wnawn. Rhaid inni ystyried pa gyfleoedd sydd gennym a defnyddio'r adnoddau gorau sydd gennym yng Nghymru i ddwyn hynny ymlaen.

Cododd Phil sawl pwynt. Ar adeiladau, gall Comisiwn Dylunio Cymru a chynllun Ailfeddwl am Adeiladu ddod at ei gilydd i ystyried ffurfiau ac arddulliau adeiladu newydd a fydd yn cyflawni datblygiad cynaliadwy. Dyna fantais y mae'n rhaid inni ei datblygu yng Nghymru.

Mae a wnelo'r pwynt cyffredinol y dymunaf ei wneud â phwynt Glyn am ddewrder gwleidyddol: cymeraf ei air ei fod yn ddyletswydd ar y gwrthbleidiau, yn ogystal â'r Llywodraeth. Yr ydym wedi rhoi arian ychwanegol i mewn i Tir Gofal—mae'n gynllun a wnaethpwyd yng Nghymru, sydd wedi profi'i hun. Mae'n bwysig inni fynd ar ôl hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'r mater yn ehangach na hynny. Fel y dywedodd rhywun yn ystod dadl ddiweddar ar ynni adnewyddadwy, nid yw'n safbwynt sy'n drech na phopeth arall. Nid dyna'r ffordd ymlaen. Rhaid inni ddod â phobl ynghyd i weithio drwy'r penderfyniadau anodd y mae'n rhaid eu gwneud yn awr. Mae tensiynau o hyd rhwng datblygu economaidd a datblygu cynaliadwy, fel yr awgrymodd Aelodau. Rhaid inni wynebu'r tensiynau

hynny a cheisio gwneud penderfyniadau'n fwy tryloyw ac yn haws delio â hwy.

I thank everyone who participated in the debate. I commend the motion and I look forward to delivering a further three years or more of sustainable development in Wales.

Diolchaf i bawb a gymerodd ran yn y ddadl. Cymeradwyaf y cynnig ac edrychaf ymlaen at gyflawni tair blynedd neu fwy eto o ddatblygu cynaliadwy yng Nghymru.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: We will now move to a vote. If amendment 1 is carried, amendment 2 will fall.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Symudwn yn awr at bleidlais. Os derbynir gwelliant 1, bydd gwelliant 2 yn syrthio.

Gwelliant 1: O blaid 7, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 42.

Amendment 1: For 7, Abstain 0, Against 42.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Graham, William
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty
Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 2: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Hancock, Brian
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 7, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 42.
Amendment 3: For 7, Abstain 0, Against 42.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Graham, William
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison

Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty
Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

5:30 p.m.

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 14, Ymatal 7, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 4: For 14, Abstain 7, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Hancock, Brian
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick

Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Graham, William
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 5: For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 6: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Hancock, Brian
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 14, Ymatal 7, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 7: For 14, Abstain 7, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Hancock, Brian
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane

Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
 The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick
 Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Graham, William
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Rogers, Peter

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

Amended motion:

Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:

the National Assembly:

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:

1. welcomes the significant progress being made towards sustainable development in Wales, and acknowledges the important contribution made by the Assembly's partners and outside organisations;

1. yn croesawu'r cynnydd sylweddol sy'n cael ei wneud tuag at ddatblygu cynaliadwy yng Nghymru, ac yn cydnabod cyfraniad pwysig partneriaid y Cynulliad a mudiadau o'r tu allan;

2. recognises the importance of mainstreaming sustainable development in the work of the Welsh Assembly Government as reported in 'Deciding to Live Differently' and 'How We are Learning to Live Differently';

2. yn cydnabod pa mor bwysig yw sicrhau bod datblygu cynaliadwy yn dod yn rhan ganolog o waith Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru fel a nodwyd yn 'Penderfynu Byw'n Wahanol' a 'Sut Ydym yn Dysgu Byw'n Wahanol';

3. supports a positive Welsh contribution to the world summit on sustainable development in Johannesburg in late August/early September and welcomes the First Minister's announcement that he will be representing Wales at the world summit; and

3. yn cefnogi cyfraniad positif o du Cymru i uwch-gynhadledd y byd ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy yn Johannesburg ddiwedd Awst/ddechrau Medi ac yn croesawu'r ffaith bod Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi cyhoeddi mai ef fydd yn cynrychioli Cymru yn uwch-gynhadledd y byd; ac

4. calls on the Minister for Environment to prepare a revised and updated sustainable development action plan.

4. yn galw ar i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd baratoi cynllun gweithredu datblygu cynaliadwy diwygiedig a mwy diweddar.

Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Amended motion: For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.
Amended motion carried.*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings today's proceedings to a close. **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.32 p.m.
The session ended at 5.32 p.m.*

