



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales
(The Official Record)**

Dydd Mawrth 14 Mai 2002

Tuesday 14 May 2002

Cynnwys
Contents

3	Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru <i>Questions to the First Minister</i>
24	Datganiad Busnes <i>Business Statement</i>
26	Pwynt o Drefn <i>Point of Order</i>
28	Adroddiad Blynyddol Prif Arolygydd Addysg a Hyfforddiant yng Nghymru Ei Mawrhydi <i>The Annual Report of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education and Training in Wales</i>
64	Pwynt o Drefn <i>Point of Order</i>
64	Cynnig Trefniadol <i>Procedural Motion</i>
65	Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Y Blaid Geidwadol): Dyfodol y Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol <i>Minority Party Debate (The Conservative Party): The Future of the National Health Service</i>

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been
included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair*

Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru Questions to the First Minister

Gosod Cydraddoldeb yn y Brif Ffrwd Mainstreaming Equality

Q1 Christine Chapman: Will the First Minister make a statement on his role as co-ordinator of cross-cutting themes regarding the challenges faced by the south Wales Valleys in mainstreaming equality? (OAQ17510)

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): It is a challenge because there has been a huge shift in employment and the social attitudes that go with it. When mining was our dominant industry, men were the breadwinners and women the homemakers. Today, there are not many more men in work than there are women, and this has brought social stresses and strains. The work that the Welsh European Funding Office is undertaking on Objective 1 in the south Wales Valleys indicates how a programme that is intended to raise gross domestic product can be run on the basis of equality, thereby mainstreaming equality.

Christine Chapman: Do you agree that deprivation in the south Wales Valleys is one of the biggest barriers to establishing equality with more affluent areas of Wales? The statistics are stark: for example, life expectancy varies by five years, with the greatest life expectancy in areas such as Ceredigion, and the shortest in areas such as the Cynon Valley. Will you outline what steps the Labour-led Welsh Assembly Government has taken to tackle inequality in the Valleys?

The First Minister: You are right about the health inequalities, and the Townsend report highlights these. During this period of rapidly rising health expenditure, we will attempt to close the gap and help those areas with the poorest health to catch up with those with the best health. Some areas will gain more than others, but nobody will lose out. It will not be

C1 Christine Chapman: A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar ei rôl fel cydlynnydd themâu trawsbynciol, yng nghydestun yr heriau sy'n wynebu Cymoedd de Cymru wrth osod cydraddoldeb yn y brif ffrwd? (OAQ17510)

Prif Weinidog Cymru (Rhodri Morgan): Y mae'n her oherwydd bu symudiad mawr mewn cyflogaeth a'r agweddau cymdeithasol cysylltiedig. Pan oedd y pyllau glo yn eu hanterth fel prif ddiwydiant Cymru, dynion fyddai'n ennill yr arian a menywod fyddai'n gofalu am y cartref. Erbyn heddiw, nid oes llawer mwy o ddynion nag o fenywod mewn gwaith, ac mae hyn wedi dod â straen a thyndra cymdeithasol yn ei sgîl. Mae'r gwaith y mae Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru'n ei wneud ar Amcan 1 yng Nghymoedd y De'n dangos sut y gall rhaglen y bwriedir iddi godi'r cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth gael ei rhedeg ar sail cydraddoldeb, gan osod cydraddoldeb felly yn y brif ffrwd.

Christine Chapman: A gytunwch fod amddifadedd yng Nghymoedd y De'n un o'r rhwystrau mwyaf i sicrhau cydraddoldeb gyda rhannau mwy cefnog o Gymru? Mae'r ystadegau'n llwm: er enghraifft, mae disgwyliad oes yn amrywio o bum mlynedd, gyda'r disgwyliad oes hwyaf mewn ardaloedd fel Ceredigion, a'r byrraf mewn ardaloedd fel Cwm Cynon. A wnewch chi amlinellu pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru dan arweiniad Llafur wedi'u cymryd i fynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldeb yn y Cymoedd?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr ydych yn gywir am yr anghydraddoldebau iechyd, ac mae adroddiad Townsend yn tanlinellu'r rhain. Yn ystod y cyfnod hwn o gynyddu gwariant ar iechyd yn gyflym, ceisiwn gau'r bwloch a helpu'r ardaloedd hynny sydd â'r iechyd gwaethaf i ddal i fyny gyda'r ardaloedd â'r iechyd gorau. Bydd rhai ardaloedd yn ennill

easy to do because some of the inequalities stem from our industrial heritage, to which I referred earlier. It may be another generation before the health problems caused by coal mining, and other aspects of our industrial past, disappear from the statistics.

Geraint Davies: You will be aware that the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000 clearly indicates that all local authorities and public bodies should prepare a race equality scheme by 1 June 2002. Will you join me in congratulating Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough Council, of which I am a member—and I declare an interest in that regard—on its race equality scheme, which is currently out for widespread consultation, and is on target for completion by the agreed date? Can you tell us what steps you have taken to ensure that all other local authorities will be complying with the requirements? Can you tell us what the National Assembly Government—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae'r cwestiwn hwn braidd yn hir. I am trying to ensure shorter, sharper questions and answers.

The First Minister: I am sure that the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000 will be complied with, and that all public bodies in Wales, including all local authorities and the Assembly, will have published schemes by 31 May.

David Melding: The voluntary sector often plays a key role in promoting social inclusion. Is it not important that we stress to local authorities and the business partners who engage with the Assembly that the voluntary sector must be taken seriously?

The First Minister: Yes. I have said many times that the voluntary sector is one of the great wonders of Wales, and one of its greatest riches. That may reflect the fact that, until three years ago, we did not have the devolved democratic institutions that we have today. As a result, the voluntary sector tended

mwy nag eraill, ond ni fydd neb yn colli. Ni fydd yn hawdd gwneud hyn oherwydd deillia rhai o'r anghydraddoldebau o'n hetifeddiaeth ddiwydiannol, y cyfeiriais ati'n gynharach. Efallai y bydd yn rhaid aros cenedlaeth arall cyn i'r problemau iechyd a achoswyd gan y pyllau glo, a chan agweddau eraill ar ein gorffennol diwydiannol, ddiflannu o'r ystadegau.

Geraint Davies: Byddwch yn ymwybodol fod Deddf Cysylltiadau Hiliol (Diwygio) 2000 yn datgan yn glir y dylai pob awdurdod lleol a chorff cyhoeddus baratoi cynllun cydraddoldeb hiliol erbyn 1 Mehefin 2002. A wnewch chi ymuno â mi i longyfarch Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf, cyngor yr wyf fi'n aelod ohono—a datganaf fuddiant yn hynny o beth—ar ei gynllun cydraddoldeb hiliol, sydd wedi'i ddsbarthu'n eang ar gyfer ymgynghori ar hyn o bryd, ac sydd ar y ffordd i gael ei gwblhau erbyn y dyddiad a bennwyd? A allwch chi ddweud wrthym pa gamau a gymerwyd gennych i sicrhau y bydd pob awdurdod lleol arall yn cydymffurfio â'r gofynion? A allwch chi ddweud wrthym beth mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru—

The Presiding Officer: Order. This question is rather long. Yr wyf yn ceisio sicrhau cwestiynau ac atebion byrrach a mwy cryno.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr wyf yn siŵr y cydymffurfir â Deddf Cysylltiadau Hiliol (Diwygio) 2000, ac y bydd pob corff cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys pob awdurdod lleol a'r Cynulliad, wedi cyhoeddi cynlluniau erbyn 31 Mai.

David Melding: Mae'r sector gwirfoddol yn aml yn chwarae rôl allweddol wrth hybu cynhwysiant cymdeithasol. Onid yw'n bwysig inni bwysleisio wrth awdurdodau lleol a'r partneriaid busnes sy'n gweithio gyda'r Cynulliad fod yn rhaid cymryd y sector gwirfoddol o ddifrif?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ydyw. Yr wyf wedi dweud lawer gwaith mai'r sector gwirfoddol yw un o ryfeddodau mawr Cymru, ac un o'i thrysorau pennaf. Efallai fod hynny'n adlewyrchu'r ffaith nad oedd gennym, tan dair blynedd yn ôl, y sefydliadau democrataidd datganoledig sydd gennym

to flower particularly strongly in Wales to fill that gap, if you like. However, we do not want the voluntary sector to think it is no longer valued now that we have devolution. We intend to work with the voluntary sector to ensure that its strengths are built upon, not eroded.

heddiw. O ganlyniad, tueddai'r sector gwirfoddol i flodeuo'n arbennig o gryf yng Nghymru i lenwi'r bwlch hwnnw, os mynnwch. Er hynny, nid oes arnom eisiau i'r sector gwirfoddol feddwl na chaiff ei werthfawrogi bellach gan fod datganoli wedi digwydd. Bwriadwn weithio gyda'r sector gwirfoddol i sicrhau yr adeiledir ar ei gryfderau, nid eu herydu.

Cysylltiadau Trafnidiaeth yng Ngogledd Cymru Transport Links in North Wales

Q2 Eleanor Burnham: What is being done to promote north Wales in terms of transport links to attract economic investment? (OAQ17506)

C2 Eleanor Burnham: Beth sy'n cael ei wneud i hyrwyddo gogledd Cymru, yn nhermau cysylltiadau trafndiaeth, er mwyn denu buddsoddi economaidd? (OAQ17506)

The First Minister: A great deal, Eleanor, in particular the Wrexham industrial access road, which was approved by Sue Essex a year ago. That is a £16.5 million scheme, which will not be completed until 2005. However, you are probably aware that converting the A5156 road, which runs up to the industrial estate, into a dual carriageway, is already underway. That programme will be completed in three years time.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Llawer iawn, Eleanor, yn enwedig ffordd fynediad ddiwydiannol Wrecsam, a gymeradwywyd gan Sue Essex flwyddyn yn ôl. Cynllun £16.5 miliwn yw hwnnw, ac ni fydd wedi'i orffen tan 2005. Fodd bynnag, mae'n debyg eich bod yn ymwybodol fod gwaith eisoes ar droed i ddeuoli ffordd yr A5156, sy'n arwain at y stad ddiwydiannol. Cwblheir y rhaglen honno ymhen tair blynedd.

Eleanor Burnham: I commend that. Improving access to the Wrexham industrial site is overdue because there have been fatalities. However, do you not agree that we must ensure a top-quality railway infrastructure, and that we must transfer freight off the roads and onto rail? Do you condemn today's article in *The Western Mail*, which quotes the Institute of Directors, and appears to advocate—

Eleanor Burnham: Cymeradwyaf hynny. Mae'n hen bryd gwella mynediad i safle diwydiannol Wrecsam oherwydd cafodd pobl eu lladd yno. Fodd bynnag, oni chytunwch fod rhaid inni sicrhau isadeiledd rheilffyrdd o'r radd flaenaf, a bod rhaid trosglwyddo cludiant nwyddau o'r ffyrdd i'r rheilffyrdd? A gondemniwch erthygl heddiw yn *The Western Mail*, sy'n dyfynnu Sefydliad y Cyfarwyddwyr, ac sydd fel pe bai'n dadlau dros—

The Presiding Officer: Order. This is a rather long supplementary.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Dyma gwestiwn atodol hir braidd.

Eleanor Burnham: Finally, Llywydd—

Eleanor Burnham: Yn olaf, Lywydd—

The Presiding Officer: Order. There can be no 'finally'. This is meant to be a supplementary question, not questions.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Ni ellir cael 'yn olaf'. Cwestiwn atodol yw hwn i fod, nid cwestiynau.

The First Minister: I have briefly read the report about the Institute of Directors' study and I did not agree with it. We are pushing this forward in the right way. For instance, in the area of the railhead and other connections

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr wyf wedi bras-ddarllen yr adroddiad am astudiaeth Sefydliad y Cyfarwyddwyr ac ni chytunais ag ef. Yr ydym yn bwrw ymlaen yn y ffordd iawn. Er enghraifft, yn ardal pen y reilffordd

to the port of Mostyn, in another part of north-east Wales, there is a balance between improved rail and road access in order to capitalise on the investment in the new port of Mostyn.

Gareth Jones: Faint o arian sydd wedi ei wario ar y rheilffyrdd yng ngogledd Cymru yn ddiweddar ac a yw'r swm hwnnw'n ddigonol ar gyfer sicrhau safonau diogelwch derbyniol?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Bydd yn rhaid i mi ysgrifennu atoch, Gareth, i ateb cwestiwn mor fanwl â hynny. Nid yw'n bosibl i mi ateb cwestiwn felly heb dderbyn rybudd ymlaen llaw, ond byddaf fi neu Sue Essex, ar fy rhan, yn ysgrifennu atoch.

Alun Pugh: Many railway stations in north Wales are in a poor state of repair and at night they can be intimidating places. Will you ask the Strategic Rail Authority to stress safe and clean stations in future bids?

The First Minister: This subject has come up in my meetings with Railtrack. We want to ensure that railway stations in Wales are not seen as discouraging or threatening in any way, particularly when it is dark in winter. Otherwise, passenger numbers will never increase. That is a major issue in some parts of Wales. Richard Bowker, Chairman of the SRA, was sympathetic.

Peter Rogers: You already mentioned Mostyn Dock, but the other large port in north Wales is Holyhead, which can be accessed via the A55 over the Menai bridges. What are you doing to get freight that travels along that road onto rail?

The First Minister: Peter, you will know about Stena Line's proposal, which the business assets infrastructure partnership of the Wales European Funding Office is considering whether it can support. It is a £12 million scheme. It is big but Stena Line may make a strong case for that proposed investment, which would modernise the access into the port of Holyhead. That would

a chysylltiadau eraill â phorthladd Mostyn, mewn rhan arall o ogledd-ddwyrain Cymru, ceir cydbwysedd rhwng gwelliannau i'r rheilffyrdd a'r ffyrdd er mwyn elwa ar y buddsoddiad ym mhorthladd newydd Mostyn.

Gareth Jones: How much money has been spent on the railways in north Wales recently and is that sum sufficient to ensure acceptable safety standards?

The First Minister: I will have to write to you with the answer to such a detailed question, Gareth. I cannot answer such a question without forewarning, but I, or Sue Essex, on my behalf, will write to you.

Alun Pugh: Mae cyflwr llawer o orsafoedd rheilffordd yn y Gogledd yn wael, ac yn y nos gallant fod yn fannau bygythiol. A ofynnwch i'r Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol bwysleisio gorsafoedd diogel a glân mewn cynigion yn y dyfodol?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae'r pwnc hwnnw wedi codi yn fy nghyfarfodydd gyda Railtrack. Mae arnom eisiau sicrhau na welir gorsafoedd rheilffordd yng Nghymru fel lleoedd annifyr neu fygythiol mewn unrhyw fodd, yn enwedig pan fo'n dywyll yn y gaeaf. Mae hon yn broblem fawr mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru. Yr oedd Richard Bowker, Cadeirydd yr Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol, yn cydymdeimlo.

Peter Rogers: Yr ydych eisoes wedi sôn am Ddoc Mostyn, ond Caergybi yw'r porthladd mawr arall yn y Gogledd, a gellir mynd yno ar hyd yr A55 dros bontydd Menai. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i drosglwyddo cludiant nwyddau ar hyd y ffordd honno i'r rheilffyrdd?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Peter, mae'n debyg y gwyddoch am gynnig Stena Line, y mae partneriaeth isadeiledd asedau busnes Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru yn ystyried a yw'n bosibl iddo ei gefnogi. Mae'n gynllun £12 miliwn. Mae'n fawr, ond gall Stena Line gyflwyno achos cryf dros y buddsoddiad arfaethedig hwnnw, a fyddai'n moderneiddio'r fynedfa i borthladd Caergybi.

be welcomed by the general public and freight carriers moving through that port.

Croesewid hynny gan y cyhoedd yn gyffredinol a chlodwyr nwyddau sy'n defnyddio'r porthladd hwnnw.

2:10 p.m.

Effaith Cyllideb y Deyrnas Unedig ar Wariant Cyhoeddus yng Nghymru
Effect of the United Kingdom Budget on Public Services in Wales

Q3 The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): What discussions has the First Minister had with the Secretary of State for Wales on the effects of the UK budget on public services in Wales? (OAQ17495)

C3 Ieuan Wyn Jones: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cael gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru i drafod effaith cyllideb y Deyrnas Unedig ar wariant cyhoeddus yng Nghymru? (OAQ17495)

The First Minister: I regularly meet the Secretary of State for Wales to discuss matters relating to the budget, including the excellent impact of the budget on Wales and the increased expenditure available to spend on health.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Byddaf yn cyfarfod yn rheolaidd ag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru i drafod materion yn ymwneud â'r gyllideb, gan gynnwys effaith ardderchog y gyllideb ar Gymru a'r arian ychwanegol sydd ar gael i'w wario ar iechyd.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: We have asked you many questions on that, but you have not yet been able to provide us with figures on spending on the NHS in Wales as a result of the budget. I will ask you another question. Paul Murphy said recently that investment must go hand-in-hand with reforming the public services. The interpretation placed on 'reform' is that of greater commercial involvement in public services. Do you agree with that interpretation, and, if so, what does commercial involvement mean?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Yr ydym wedi gofyn llawer o gwestiynau ichi ynglŷn â hynny, ond nid ydych eto wedi gallu darparu ffigurau inni ar wariant ar y GIG yng Nghymru o ganlyniad i'r gyllideb. Gofynnaf gwestiwn arall ichi. Dywedodd Paul Murphy yn ddiweddar fod yn rhaid i fuddsoddi fynd law yn llaw â diwygio'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Y dehongliad o 'ddiwygio' yw sicrhau mwy o ymwneud masnachol â gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. A ydych yn cytuno â'r dehongliad hwnnw, ac, os felly, beth mae ymwneud masnachol yn ei olygu?

The First Minister: That is your interpretation, not mine. On not having figures on the NHS, the same is true in England. I understand that Alan Milburn referred to health rather than the NHS, as we have done in Wales.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Eich dehongliad chi yw hwnnw, nid f'un i. Ynghylch peidio â chael ffigurau am y GIG, mae'r un peth yn wir yn Lloegr. Deallaf fod Alan Milburn wedi cyfeirio at iechyd yn hytrach na'r GIG, fel y gwnaethom ninnau yng Nghymru.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: You should look at Alan Milburn's figures again because he said that an extra 7.5 per cent will be spent on the NHS in England between now and 2007, but perhaps I will return to that. On reforming public services and the meaning of greater commercial involvement, Paul Murphy has warned you; he stated:

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Dylech edrych ar ffigurau Alan Milburn eto oherwydd dywedodd y caiff 7.5 y cant yn ychwanegol ei wario ar y GIG yn Lloegr rhwng yn awr a 2007, ond efallai y dof yn ôl at hynny. Ar ddiwygio gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ac ystyr ymwneud masnachol, mae Paul Murphy wedi'ch rhybuddio; fe ddywedodd:

'We certainly cannot hide behind devolution and pretend that it is only the English who have to face up to difficulties or that our services in Wales are perfect.'

What are you hiding behind, First Minister? To what is Paul Murphy referring? Does he not want to see greater commercial involvement in the NHS in Wales?

The First Minister: There is no challenge by the Secretary of State, to use your peculiar language. You mentioned 'the interpretation' earlier, but that is your interpretation. If you mean that it is the Secretary of State's interpretation, I am baffled as to why you did not say so. I presumed that the interpretation was yours. There is no challenge by Paul Murphy. It is up to the Assembly and its Government to put forward budget proposals on how to spend the additional money that comes our way. That is an extra £128 million in April 2003. That will rise to an additional £1.8 billion in 2007-08. That is extremely good news for us in terms of the availability of money to spend on health. As I said earlier, our interpretation of 'health' includes expenditure in allied fields, and can include spending on the care sector today to avoid having to spend on the cure sector later. Anyone who disagrees with that principle does not understand how budgeting works.

The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): I will refer you to budget increases generally, and trying to ensure that Wales receives its fair share as compared with England, particularly in terms of the education budget. I am concerned that we are not protecting the amounts that are being set aside for education in Wales as compared with England. You will know that education spending per pupil is falling behind in Wales as compared with England. There are some fine aspirations in 'Plan for Wales 2001' for giving children a flying start, tackling absenteeism and dealing with crumbling school buildings, but Wales is giving significantly less now per pupil than England. What are you doing to address that?

The First Minister: We are not falling behind England in terms of expenditure per pupil. You said that I would know that, but I do not know that because it is not the case.

Nick Bourne: I will refer you to your own

Beth yr ydych yn cuddio y tu ôl iddo, Brif Weinidog? At beth y mae Paul Murphy yn cyfeirio? Onid oes arno eisiau gweld mwy o ymwneud masnachol â'r GIG yng Nghymru?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid oes dim her gan yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol, â defnyddio'ch iaith ryfedd chi. Soniasoch am 'y dehongliad' yn gynharach, ond eich dehongliad chi yw hwnnw. Os mai'r hyn yr ydych yn ei feddwl yw mai dehongliad yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol ydyw, ni allaf ddeall pam na ddywedasoch hynny. Tybiais mai eich dehongliad chi ydoedd. Nid oes unrhyw her gan Paul Murphy. Mater i'r Cynulliad a'i Lywodraeth yw cyflwyno cynigion ar sut i wario'r arian ychwanegol a ddaw inni yn y gyllideb. Mae hynny'n £128 miliwn ychwanegol yn Ebrill 2003. Bydd hwnnw'n codi i £1.8 biliwn ychwanegol yn 2007-08. Mae hynny'n newyddion eithriadol o dda inni o ran bod arian ar gael inni ei wario ar iechyd. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, mae'n dehongliad ni o 'iechyd' yn cynnwys gwariant mewn meysydd perthnasol, a gall gynnwys gwario ar y sector gofal heddiw er mwyn osgoi gorfod gwario ar y sector iacháu yfory. Os oes unrhyw un yn anghytuno â'r egwyddor honno nid yw'n deall sut mae cyllidebau'n gweithio.

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): Cyfeiriaf at godiadau cyllideb yn gyffredinol, ac at geisio sicrhau bod Cymru'n cael ei chyfran deg o gymharu â Lloegr, yn enwedig yng nghyd-destun y gyllideb addysg. Yr wyf yn bryderus nad ydym yn gwarchod y symiau a neilltuir i addysg yng Nghymru o gymharu â Lloegr. Byddwch yn gwybod bod gwariant ar addysg fesul disgybl ar ei hôl hi yng Nghymru o gymharu â Lloegr. Mae rhai dyheadau gwych yn 'Cynllun i Gymru 2001' ym ymwneud â rhoi cychwyn da i blant, mynd i'r afael ag absenoliaeth a delio ag adeiladau ysgol sy'n dadfeilio, ond mae Cymru bellach yn gwario llai o lawer fesul disgybl nag a wna Lloegr. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud ynglŷn â hynny?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid ydym ar ei hôl hi o ran gwariant fesul disgybl. Dywedasoch y byddwn i'n gwybod hynny, ond nid wyf yn gwybod hynny oherwydd nid felly y mae.

Nick Bourne: Fe'ch cyfeiriaf at ffigurau eich

Government's figures. Figures published in November 2001 by the National Assembly for Wales local government finance statistics unit show that spending per pupil in Wales was £3,118 and £3,243 in England. The gap in the previous year was £40, this year it is over £100. Those are your Government's figures. If you were not aware of them, you should have been. In my constituency, the schools along the border, particularly in Presteigne, look across and see much more being spent on schools in England than in Wales. Your figures bear that out. What are you doing about it?

The First Minister: The problem is that the grass always looks greener on the other side of the border. Many headteachers in England, Cheshire and Shropshire will look across the border to Wales and think how wonderful it is that we have abolished key stage 1 tests, so that teachers can get on with teaching the children, rather than going along with a great deal of the additional bureaucracy involved in those tests. The issue of expenditure per pupil and whether there is a gap, or whether we are catching up on it, must be considered in light of how those figures are collected. Those figures indicate clearly that, with the exception of certain metropolitan areas, such as London and Merseyside in particular, to which we have no equivalent in Wales, the expenditure per head in Wales would be high on any league table.

Llywodraeth eich hun. Dengys ffigurau a gyhoeddwyd yn Nhachwedd 2001 gan uned ystadegau cyllid llywodraeth leol Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru fod gwariant fesul disgybl yn £3,118 yng Nghymru a £3,243 yn Lloegr. Yr oedd y bwlch yn y flwyddyn flaenorol yn £40, ac eleni mae dros £100. Ffigurau eich Llywodraeth chi yw'r rheini. Os nad oeddech yn ymwybodol ohonynt, dylasech fod. Yn f'etholaeth i, mae ysgolion ar hyd y ffin, yn enwedig yn Llanandras, yn edrych dros y ffin honno ac yn gweld llawer mwy'n cael ei wario ar ysgolion yn Lloegr nag yng Nghymru. Mae'ch ffigurau chi'n cadarnhau hynny. Beth yr ydych chi'n ei wneud yn ei gylch?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Y broblem yw bod y glaswellt bob amser yn edrych yn wyrddach ar ochr arall y ffin. Bydd llawer o brifathrawon yn Lloegr, yn Swydd Gaer a Swydd Amwythig, yn edrych dros y ffin ar Gymru ac yn meddwl mor wych ydyw ein bod wedi diddymu profion cyfnod allweddol 1, fel y gall athrawon fwrw iddi i ddysgu'r plant, yn hytrach nag ymwneud â'r holl fiwrocratiaeth ychwanegol sydd ynghlwm wrth y profion hynny. Rhaid ystyried cwestiwn gwariant fesul disgybl a ph'run ai y mae bwlch, neu a ydym yn llwyddo i'w gau, yng ngoleuni'r modd y cesglir y ffigurau hynny. Mae'r ffigurau hynny'n dangos yn glir y byddai'r gwariant y pen yng Nghymru, a hepgor rhai ardaloedd metropolitanaid, fel Llundain a Glannau Mersi, nad oes gennym ardaloedd tebyg iddynt yng Nghymru, yn uchel mewn unrhyw dabl cynghrair.

Effaith Polisiâu'r Llywodraeth ar Orllewin De Cymru Effect of Government Policies on South Wales West

Q4 Janet Davies: Will the First Minister make a statement on how his Government's policies have affected the people of South Wales West in the last six months? (OAQ17497)

The First Minister: I draw your attention to two major projects that have been announced in the past six months, which will be of longstanding benefit to South Wales West and to Wales as a whole. One is the Port Talbot research centre as a successor body to the Corus Welsh research centre, when it finally closes and most of its staff switch to

C4 Janet Davies: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar sut mae polisiâu ei Lywodraeth wedi effeithio ar bobl Gorllewin De Cymru yn ystod y chwe mis diwethaf? (OAQ17497)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Tynnaf eich sylw at ddau brosiect mawr a gyhoeddwyd yn y chwe mis diwethaf, a fydd er budd parhaol i Orllewin De Cymru ac i Gymru gyfan. Un yw canolfan ymchwil Port Talbot fel olynydd i ganolfan ymchwil Corus yng Nghymru, pan gaeir honno'n derfynol gan symud y rhan fwyaf o'i staff i Rotherham. Darparwyd grant

Rotherham. A £5 million grant was made available to the Welsh Development Agency to buy the centre from Corus, and that is now proceeding. It will be called the ECM² centre and will become a general centre of excellence for manufacturing in Wales and elsewhere. Finally, £6 million has been invested in the Swansea Clinical School to provide a second major campus to train a much increased intake of medical students, which will provide a great deal more doctors for the Welsh health service in a few years' time.

Janet Davies: I wish to pursue the issue of policy on railways in South Wales West. I express my horror at the Potters Bar train crash and my sympathy for the people and the families involved. The main and local railways in South Wales West are at the end of the line in Railtrack terms and we must consider whether they receive adequate finance to maintain safe conditions. Will you lobby the UK Government again for a strategic rail authority for Wales to raise the profile of maintenance and renewal of track, electrics and the crossings in South Wales West?

The First Minister: I have not heard anybody propose a SRA for Wales, and I would not support such a proposal. I am not sure what the relationship is between the sympathy that you expressed—which I share—for the victims of the accident at Potters Bar and your other points. I do not know whether you have anecdotal evidence of a particular problem with regard to safety on the railways in Wales. If you do, you could write to me or to the relevant authorities who will be considering point safety following the Potters Bar tragedy.

Alun Cairns: Is it not the case that the Government's policies on South Wales West have been disastrous for the people who live in that region? The people of Swansea East have had an incinerator imposed upon them; the people of Gower and Porthcawl are having their sand taken away because of the Cabinet's lack of action; and there is now a threat that children's medical services could be taken from Swansea and centralised in Cardiff. Is this the effect of your policies—

o £5 miliwn i Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru i brynu'r ganolfan oddi wrth Corus, ac mae hynny'n digwydd yn awr. Fe'i gelwir yn ganolfan ECM² a bydd yn datblygu'n ganolfan ragoriaeth gyffredinol ar gyfer gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru a thu hwnt. Yn olaf, buddsoddwyd £6 miliwn yn Ysgol Glinigol Abertawe i ddarparu campws mawr arall i hyfforddi llawer mwy o fyfyrwyr meddygaeth, a fydd yn darparu llawer mwy o feddygon i wasanaeth iechyd Cymru ymhen ychydig flynyddoedd.

Janet Davies: Hoffwn godi mater y polisi ar reilffyrdd yng Ngorllewin De Cymru. Mynegaf fy arswyd ynghylch damwain drên Potters Bar a chydymdeimlaf â'r bobl a'r teuluoedd yr effeithiwyd arnynt. Mae'r prif reilffyrdd a'r rheilffyrdd lleol yng Ngorllewin De Cymru ar ben y lein yn nhermau Railtrack a rhaid inni ystyried a gânt ddigon o gyllid i gynnal diogelwch. A wnewch chi lobio Llywodraeth y DU eto am awdurdod rheilffyrdd strategol i Gymru i godi proffil gwaith cynnal a chadw ac adnewyddu cledrau, a gwaith trydanol a chroesfannau yng Ngorllewin De Cymru?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid wyf wedi clywed neb yn cynnig y dylai Cymru gael awdurdod rheilffyrdd strategol, ac ni fyddwn yn cefnogi cynnig o'r fath. Nid wyf yn siŵr beth yw'r berthynas rhwng y cydymdeimlad a fynegwyd gennych—a rennir gennyf fi—â'r rhai a ddioddefodd y ddamwain yn Potters Bar a'ch pwyntiau eraill. Ni wn a ydych wedi clywed sôn am dystiolaeth o broblem arbennig ynghylch diogelwch ar y rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru. Os ydych, gallech ysgrifennu ataf fi neu at yr awdurdodau perthnasol a fydd yn ystyried diogelwch pwyntiau yn dilyn trychineb Potters Bar.

Alun Cairns: Onid yw'n wir fod polisiâu'r Llywodraeth ar gyfer Gorrlewin De Cymru wedi bod yn drychinebus i drigolion y rhanbarth hwnnw? Bu raid i bobl Dwyrain Abertawe dderbyn llosgydd; mae tywod pobl Gŵyr a Phorthcawl yn cael ei gymryd i ffwrdd oherwydd diffyg gweithredu gan y Cabinet; ac yn awr mae bygythiad y gellid cymryd gwasanaethau meddygol plant o Abertawe a'u canoli yng Nghaerdydd. Ai dyma effaith eich polisiâu—[*Torri ar draws.*]

[*Interruption.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order. That question was in order because it is a general question about South Wales West. Members should be able to ask their questions when they are in order.

The First Minister: I am not sure whether those were Assembly policy matters, but Alun always likes to pretend that he is the Charles Atlas of the beaches kicking the sand in the eyes of the Welsh Assembly Government. However, the Assembly is not removing the sand. This is the first time that I have ever been accused of removing the sand from the beaches of Gower—[*Interruption.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order. It is also appropriate that the First Minister is heard in relative silence.

The First Minister: A Specialised Health Service Commission for Wales report into tertiary children's services is not Welsh Assembly Government policy. A consortium of the five health authorities in Wales made these recommendations. They are now out to consultation and difficult decisions must be made, but they are not Welsh Assembly Government policy. The five health authorities, including the one which represents South Wales West, made those recommendations. Dyfed Powys Health Authority is leading this exercise, so I do not know why you attempt to attribute everything to the Assembly Government, unless you are such a downright Tory that everything you can think of to criticise, or anything that has caused any problems in South Wales West or caused a headline in the *South Wales Evening Post*, must be the Assembly's fault. Alun, look at the facts.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr oedd y cwestiwn hwnnw mewn trefn oherwydd mae'n gwestiwn cyffredinol am Orllewin De Cymru. Dylai Aelodau gael gofyn eu cwestiynau pan fyddant mewn trefn.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid wyf yn siŵr ai materion yn ymwneud â pholisïau'r Cynulliad oedd y rheini, ond mae Alun bob amser yn hoffi cymryd arno mai ef yw Charles Atlas y traethau'n cicio'r tywod i lygaid Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Fodd bynnag, nid y Cynulliad sy'n symud y tywod. Dyma'r tro cyntaf erioed imi gael fy nghyhuddo o gymryd y tywod o draethau Gŵyr—[*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae'n briodol hefyd i'r Prif Weinidog gael ei glywed mewn distawrwydd cymharol.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid polisi Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yw adroddiad gan y Comisiwn Gwasanaeth Iechyd Arbenigol i Gymru ar wasanaethau trydyddol i blant. Consortiwm o'r pum awdurdod iechyd yng Nghymru a wnaeth yr argymhellion hynny. Maent yn destun ymgynghoriad ar hyn o bryd a rhaid gwneud penderfyniadau anodd, ond nid polisi Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru mohonynt. Y pum awdurdod iechyd, gan gynnwys yr un sy'n cynrychioli Gorllewin De Cymru, a wnaeth yr argymhellion hynny. Awdurdod Iechyd Dyfed Powys sy'n arwain yr ymarfer hwn, felly ni wn pam yr ydych yn ceisio priodoli popeth i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, oni bai eich bod yn gymaint o Dori rhonc nes bod unrhyw beth y gallwch feddwl amdano i'w feirniadu, neu unrhyw beth sydd wedi achosi problemau yng Ngorllewin De Cymru neu wedi arwain at bennawd yn y *South Wales Evening Post*, yn rhwym o fod yn fai'r Cynulliad. Alun, edrychwch ar y ffeithiau.

2:20 p.m.

Mesurau i Fynd i'r Afael â Throseddau ar y Stryd Initiatives on Tackling Street Crime

Q5 William Graham: What discussions has the First Minister held with the Secretary of State for Wales, concerning the Prime

C5 William Graham: Pa drafodaethau y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi'u cael gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, mewn

Minister's initiatives on tackling street crime throughout Wales? (OAQ17509)

The First Minister: You will be pleased to hear that none of the 10 police force areas that were regarded as having such serious problems of street crime that they would come under the wing of the Prime Minister's special street crime initiative were in Wales. We should be proud that we do not have a force area in Wales where the problems are sufficiently serious to justify that special action. We all recognise that crime is an important issue but sometimes the fear of crime is greater than the crime itself. Sometimes crime can fall, but people think that it is getting worse. As a result they do not go out at night and they allow the streets to be taken over by miscreants and deviants. That is an unhealthy consequence of the fear of crime being more serious than crime itself.

William Graham: Do you support the Prime Minister's proposals to put a permanent police presence in problem schools to tackle truancy and bad behaviour? Do you support his plans to withdraw benefits or to jail parents whose children repeatedly fail to attend school? Will you commit yourself to pledge that street crime will be brought under control within five months?

The First Minister: That raises the issue of Wales's place in that national newspaper agenda and the Prime Minister's national initiative. Recent coverage of these issues does not necessarily relate to Wales. Generally, we do not have the sort of problems that tend to peak in the biggest metropolitan areas that run, roughly speaking, from Bristol to Newcastle, via London, Birmingham and other big cities such as Manchester, Liverpool and so on. I agree that Bristol and Liverpool are close to the Welsh border and there is some spill-over crime from those cities into Wales. That is unquestionable. However, most of the issues you referred to concern the biggest metropolitan areas and the new phenomenon of mobile phone theft, which constitutes 50 per cent of violent crime on the streets of London. We do not seem to be afflicted by

perthynas â mesurau Prif Weinidog y DU i fynd i'r afael â throseddau ar strydoedd Cymru? (OAQ17509)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Byddwch yn falch o glywed, o 10 ardal yr heddluoedd y barnwyd fod ganddynt broblemau mor ddifrifol gyda throseddau ar y stryd nes y deuent dan adain mesur arbennig Prif Weinidog y DU i ddelio â throseddau ar y stryd, nad oedd yr un ohonynt yng Nghymru. Dylem ymfalchïo nad oes gennym ardal yng Nghymru lle mae'r problemau'n ddigon difrifol i gyfiawnhau'r gweithredu arbennig hwnnw. Yr ydym i gyd yn cydnabod fod troseddu'n fater pwysig, ond weithiau mae bod ag ofn troseddau yn waeth na'r troseddu ei hun. Weithiau gall nifer troseddau gwmpo, ond bydd pobl yn meddwl bod y sefyllfa'n gwaethygu. O ganlyniad, nid ânt allan yn y nos a gadawant i'r strydoedd gael eu meddiannu gan droseddwyr a dihirod. Dyna ganlyniad afiach pan fo ofn y trosedd yn fwy difrifol na'r troseddu ei hun.

William Graham: A gefnogwch gynigion Prif Weinidog y DU i roi heddwision mewn ysgolion problemus yn barhaol i fynd i'r afael â thriwantiaeth ac ymddygiad gwael? A gefnogwch ei gynlluniau i atal budd-daliadau neu i garcharu rhieni y mae eu plant yn absennol o'r ysgol dro ar ôl tro? A wnewch chi ymrwmo i addo y deuir â throseddu ar y stryd dan reolaeth o fewn pum mis?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae hynny'n codi cwestiwn ynghylch lle Cymru yn agenda'r papurau newydd Prydeinig a mesurau cenedlaethol y Prif Weinidog. Nid yw'r sylw diweddar i'r materion hyn o reidrwydd yn berthnasol i Gymru. Yn gyffredinol, nid oes gennym y math o broblemau sy'n tueddu i fod ar eu gwaethaf yn yr ardaloedd metropolitaidd sy'n rhedeg, yn fras, o Fryste i Newcastle, drwy Lundain, Birmingham a dinasoedd mawr eraill fel Manceinion, Lerpwl ac ati. Cytunaf fod Bryste a Lerpwl yn agos at ororau Cymru a bod rhywfaint o droseddu'n gorlifo o'r dinasoedd hynny i mewn i Gymru. Nid oes dwywaith am hynny. Serch hynny, mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r materion y cyfeiriasoch chi atynt yn ymwneud â'r ardaloedd metropolitaidd mwyaf a'r ffenomen newydd o ddwyn ffonau symudol, sydd i

the problem to the same degree in any of our urban or rural areas.

Kirsty Williams: If the First Minister wants to adopt a more realistic and relevant approach to street crime in Wales than that proposed by the Westminster Government, will he and his Cabinet colleagues provide financial assistance to Llandrindod High School's alternative curriculum, which is an innovative way to help prevent street crime in Llandrindod Wells, and gives potential offenders a fresh start?

The First Minister: Again, this refers to action that should be taken in an area such as Llandrindod Wells to deal with street crime and the action that should be taken in schools in Wales. I imagine that that excludes the necessity for police to be present at schools, but it could happen in a few schools. Similarly, in terms of dealing with truancy, I will not say that the force of the law will not be brought to bear in individual cases in Wales, as it was in Oxfordshire, if the same circumstances applied. However, we must be aware that we should not create a climate of fear of crime because that only gives the streets away to criminals when we want to reclaim them for citizens.

gyfrif am 50 y cant o droseddu treisgar ar strydoedd Llundain. Nid yw'n ymddangos bod y broblem yn ein taro ni i'r un graddau yn unrhyw un o'n hardaloedd trefol na gwledig.

Kirsty Williams: Os yw Prif Weinidog Cymru am ymateb mewn dull mwy realistig a pherthnasol i droseddau ar y stryd yng Nghymru na'r dull a gynigir gan Lywodraeth San Steffan, a wnaiff ef a gweddill aelodau'r Cabinet ddarparu cymorth ariannol i gwricwllwm amgen Ysgol Uwchradd Llandrindod, sy'n ffordd arloesol o helpu atal troseddu ar y strydoedd yn Llandrindod, ac sy'n cynnig cyfle i ddarpar droseddwr ychwyn o'r newydd?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Eto, mae hyn yn cyfeirio at yr hyn y dylid ei wneud mewn ardal fel Llandrindod i ddelio â throseddau ar y stryd a'r hyn y dylid ei wneud mewn ysgolion yng Nghymru. Dychmygaf nad yw hynny'n galw am i'r heddlu fod yn bresennol mewn ysgolion, ond gallai ddigwydd mewn ambell ysgol. Yn yr un modd, o ran delio â thriwantiaeth, ni ddywedaf na fyddai grym y gyfraith yn cael ei ddefnyddio mewn achosion unigol yng Nghymru, fel a ddigwyddodd yn Swydd Rhydychen, pe bai'r un amgylchiadau'n bodoli. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni fod yn ymwybodol na ddylem greu hinsawdd o ofn troseddau oherwydd ni wna hynny ddim ond ildio'r strydoedd i droseddwr pan fo angen inni eu hawlio'n ôl i ddinasyddion.

Ymateb i 'Mynd i'r Afael â Thenantiaid Gwrthgymdeithasol' Response to 'Tackling Anti-social Tenants'

Q6 Brian Gibbons: Will the Welsh Assembly Government respond to the UK Government's consultation document, 'Tackling Anti-Social Tenants'? (OAQ17499)

The First Minister: Councils and other social landlords in Wales must respond to this document. That is why we sent it to them. This is one of the grey areas, post devolution, where a document was originally sent out to social landlords, including local authorities, only in England. However, because there were possible implications for primary legislation, we thought that it would

C6 Brian Gibbons: A fydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ymateb i ddogfen ymgynghorol Llywodraeth y DU, 'Mynd i'r afael â Thenantiaid Gwrthgymdeithasol'? (OAQ17499)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Rhaid i gynghorau a landlordiaid cymdeithasol eraill yng Nghymru ymateb i'r ddogfen hon. Dyna pam y bu inni ei hanfon atynt. Mae hon yn un o'r manau llwyd hynny, wedi datganoli, lle cafodd dogfen ei hanfon allan yn wreiddiol at landlordiaid cymdeithasol, gan gynnwys awdurdodau lleol, yn Lloegr yn unig. Fodd bynnag, oherwydd bod goblygiadau posibl o

be appropriate to send it out to local authorities and housing associations in Wales.

Brian Gibbons: Will the Welsh Assembly Government consider responding to the consultation process, with particular reference to anti-social tenants in private residences? In many settled communities in Wales where there is low-cost housing, private landlords buy up properties and place anti-social tenants in those areas. They change settled communities into communities with great social disharmony. We need to emphasise strongly that this is not just a problem for social landlords, but that private landlords also have a major responsibility.

The First Minister: That takes the issue a little wider. However, this is the sequence of events: we published our document in March 2001 on the law as it applies to the rights of landlords and councils to evict anti-social tenants, or to bring to bear the measures to deal with anti-social landlords in order to correct their behaviour. The Westminster Government, through the Department for Transport, Local Government and the Regions, has now issued a similar document in England. However, we have issued it on its behalf in Wales because of the possible primary legislation implications.

There is a special problem with private accommodation in areas such as Rhyl, where large, former seaside boarding houses can be bought and easily converted into cheap accommodation for large numbers of tenants, many of whom will not have a connection with the area and will find it difficult to fit in. We are trying to address that problem also.

Janet Ryder: Creating noise pollution at night is among the most anti-social behaviours that a neighbour can inflict on another. Will the Government recommend that county councils use their power to confiscate musical equipment from those who persist in upsetting their neighbours?

The First Minister: I understand that

ran deddfwriaeth sylfaenol, tybiasom y byddai'n briodol ei hanfon allan at awdurdodau lleol a chymdeithasau tai yng Nghymru.

Brian Gibbons: A wnaiff Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ystyried ymateb i'r broses ymgynghori, gan gyfeirio'n arbennig at denantiaid gwrthgymdeithasol mewn tai preifat? Mewn llawer o gymunedau sefydlog yng Nghymru lle ceir tai rhad, bydd landlordiaid preifat yn prynu eiddo ac yn gosod tenantiaid gwrthgymdeithasol yn yr ardaloedd hynny. Maent yn troi cymunedau sefydlog yn gymunedau lle ceir anghytgord cymdeithasol mawr. Mae angen pwysleisio'n gryf nad problem i landlordiaid cymdeithasol yn unig yw hon, ond bod gan landlordiaid preifat gyfrifoldeb mawr hefyd.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae hynny'n mynd â'r cwestiwn ychydig ymhellach. Fodd bynnag, dyma drefn digwyddiadau: ym Mawrth 2001 cyhoeddasom ein dogfen ar y gyfraith fel y mae'n berthnasol i hawliau landlordiaid a chynghorau i droi tenantiaid gwrthgymdeithasol o'u cartrefi, neu i weithredu'r mesurau i ddelio â landlordiaid gwrthgymdeithasol er mwyn cywiro'u hymddygiad. Mae Llywodraeth San Steffan, drwy'r Adran Drafnidiaeth, Llywodraeth Leol a'r Rhanbarthau, bellach wedi cyhoeddi dogfen debyg yn Lloegr. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wedi'i chyhoeddi ar ei rhan yng Nghymru oherwydd y goblygiadau posibl o ran deddfwriaeth sylfaenol.

Mae problem arbennig gyda llety preifat mewn ardaloedd fel y Rhyl, lle gellir prynu hen dai lletya mawr ar lan y môr a'u haddasu'n hawdd i greu llety rhad i niferoedd mawr o denantiaid, llawer ohonynt heb gysylltiad â'r ardal, a fydd yn ei chael yn anodd ymdoddi i'r ardal. Yr ydym yn ceisio rhoi sylw i'r broblem honno hefyd.

Janet Ryder: Mae creu llygredd sŵn yn y nos ymhlith yr ymddygiadau mwyaf gwrthgymdeithasol y gall cymydog ei orfodi ar eraill. A wnaiff y Llywodraeth argymhell bod cynghorau sir yn defnyddio'u pwerau i atafaelu offer cerddoriaeth oddi wrth bobl sy'n mynnu tarfu ar eu cymdgonion o hyd?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Deallaf y gall

councils can take that action. That issue is covered, I believe, in 'The Law: An Adequate Response to Anti-social Behaviour?', which we published in March 2001. There is a question mark in the title but some local authorities, for example Cardiff County Council, have already used the power to evict tenants for playing music too loudly. I do not know about confiscation powers. However, I will look into the matter and write to you.

William Graham: Will the First Minister commit the Welsh Assembly Government to the principle that being a good neighbour does pay? Will he recognise that registered social landlords and housing charities report that most of their time is spent dealing with rent arrears, disruptive neighbours and people who do not look after their property? Will he also recommend that the UK Prime Minister's initiative on targeting benefit should be extended to those who persist in anti-social behaviour?

The First Minister: This is a difficult issue, because no social landlord estate is easy to run. Problems always arise, especially when a high concentration of people are collected together in an area that is new to them and are defined by the housing and social problems that cause them to be located together. When too many people with too many problems are located in the same street or neighbourhood, it is unfair to that neighbourhood that the problems and difficulties have not been spread around more sensibly. We must establish best practice in terms of conciliation techniques and involving people in resolving neighbourhood issues before they face eviction or the confiscation of musical equipment. We must ensure that all involved in running a social landlord estate, whether councils or housing associations, know what the best practice is and put it into action.

cynghorau weithredu yn y modd hwnnw. Deliwyd â'r mater hwnnw, mi gredaf, yn 'Y Gyfraith: Ymateb Digonol i Ymddygiad Gwrthgymdeithasol?', a gyhoeddwyd gennym ym Mawrth 2001. Mae marc cwestiwn yn y teitl ond mae rhai awdurdodau lleol, er enghraifft Cyngor Sir Caerdydd, eisoes wedi defnyddio'r hawl i droi tenantiaid allan am chwarae cerddoriaeth yn rhy uchel. Ni wn am hawliau atafaelu, ond edrychaf i mewn i'r mater ac ysgrifennu atoch.

William Graham: A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ymrwymo Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i'r egwyddor y daw budd i berson o fod yn gymydog da? A wnaiff gydnabod fod landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig ac elusennau tai'n dweud y treulir y rhan fwyaf o'u hamser yn delio ag ôl-ddyledion rhent, cymdogion trafferthus a phobl yn esgeuluso'u heiddo? A wnaiff argymhell hefyd y dylai mesur Prif Weinidog y DU ar dargedu budd-dal gael ei ymestyn i'r rheini sy'n ymddwyn yn wrthgymdeithasol dro ar ôl tro?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae hwn yn fater anodd, oherwydd nid yw stad unrhyw landlord cymdeithasol yn hawdd i'w rheoli. Ceir problemau o hyd, yn enwedig pan fo nifer fawr o bobl wedi'u casglu ynghyd mewn ardal sy'n newydd iddynt a phan gânt eu categorio yn ôl y problemau tai a chymdeithasol a achosodd iddynt gael eu lleoli gyda'i gilydd. Pan geir gormod o bobl gyda gormod o broblemau yn yr un stryd neu gymdogaeth, mae'n annheg i'r gymdogaeth honno nad yw'r problemau a'r trafferthion wedi'u gwasgaru'n gallach. Rhaid inni sefydlu arfer gorau o ran technegau cymodi a chael pobl i ddatrys problemau cymdogaeth cyn iddynt wynebu cael eu troi allan neu golli offer cerddorol. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod pawb sy'n ymwneud â rhedeg stad landlord cymdeithasol, boed um gynghorau neu gymdeithasau tai, yn gwybod beth yw'r arfer gorau ac yn ei weithredu.

Cyfraniad Rygbi Cymru at Ffyniant Economaidd Cymru Contribution of Welsh Rugby to the Economic Prosperity of Wales

Q7 Phil Williams: Will the First Minister make a statement on how the overall success of Welsh rugby contributes to the economic prosperity of Wales? (OAQ17512)

C7 Phil Williams: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar sut y mae llwyddiant rygbi Cymru yn gyffredinol yn cyfrannu at ffyniant economaidd Cymru? (OAQ17512)

The First Minister: Anecdotal evidence suggests that it reflects well on productivity in the workplace. I do not think that anyone would contest the fact that success on the rugby field has a major impact on raising Wales's profile abroad.

Phil Williams: The history of Welsh rugby shows that the golden periods are associated with periods of economic expansion and the fallow periods with relative economic decline, with economic success being the prime driver. Do you agree with Brian Morgan, among others, that the present state of Welsh rugby is linked with the still widening gap in gross domestic product per capita between Wales and the other five nations? Do you, therefore, agree that the best contribution that the Assembly Government could make to Welsh rugby is to show far greater competence in pursuing a convincing economic development strategy?

The First Minister: I have been in politics since 1987. During the early years of my political career, which were in the middle of the 18 years of continuous Tory Government, I would point out that the last time Labour was in office, during the late 1970s, Wales won four triple crowns in succession. The lack of success must be somehow connected to economic decline and the disappearance of many heavy industrial jobs that tended to produce the hard-core forwards in the front five. Likewise, the decline in the birth rate in Wales meant that there were no longer jobs for the sportsmasters who tended to provide the fast running backs who, with the coal miners and steelworkers, made up a strong Welsh rugby team. That world has gone and rugby is now a professional sport. I have recently raised issues about how Welsh rugby can face the professional era. Do we do that as well as Australia, New Zealand, France and England, which currently dominate rugby? I do not think that we do.

2:30 p.m.

John Griffiths: Do you agree that, if we are

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Awgryma tystiolaeth anecdotaidd ei fod yn cael effaith dda ar gynhyrchiant yn y gweithle. Ni thybiais y byddai neb yn gwadu'r ffaith fod llwyddiant ar y cae rygbi wedi cael effaith fawr ar godi proffil Cymru dramor.

Phil Williams: Dengys hanes rygbi Cymru fod y cyfnodau euraidd yn gysylltiedig â chyfnodau o ehangu economaidd, a'r cyfnodau llai disglair yn gysylltiedig â dirywiad economaidd cymharol, ac mai llwyddiant economaidd yw'r prif gymhelliant. A ydych yn cytuno â Brian Morgan, ymhlith eraill, fod cyflwr presennol rygbi Cymru'n gysylltiedig â'r bwlch sy'n lledu o hyd yn y cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen rhwng Cymru a'r pum gwlad arall? A gytunwch, felly, mai'r cyfraniad gorau y gallai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ei wneud i rygbi Cymru yw arddangos llawer mwy o allu wrth lunio strategaeth ddatblygu economaidd argyhoeddiadol?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr wyf yn gwleidyddia ers 1987. Yn ystod blynyddoedd cynnar fy ngyrfa wleidyddol, a oedd yng nghanol y 18 mlynedd o Lywodraeth Dori'aid ddi-dor, arferwn nodi bod Cymru, yn ystod cyfnod diwethaf Llafur mewn llywodraeth, yn ystod y 1970au hwyr, wedi ennill pedair coron driphlyg yn olynol. Mae'n rhaid fod y diffyg llwyddiant yn gysylltiedig rywsut â dirywiad economaidd a diflaniad llawer o swyddi diwydiannol trwm a dueddai i gynhyrchu'r blaenwyr caled yn y pump blaen. Yn yr un modd, golygodd y cwmp yn y gyfradd enedigaethau yng Nghymru nad oedd swyddi mwyach i'r athrawon chwaraeon a dueddai i ddarparu'r cefnwyr chwim a gyfunai gyda'r glowyr a'r gweithwyr dur i wneud tîm rygbi Cymreig cryf. Mae'r byd hwnnw wedi mynd ac mae rygbi bellach yn gêm broffesiynol. Yr wyf wedi codi cwestiynau'n ddiweddar ynghylch sut y gall rygbi Cymru wynebu'r oes broffesiynol. A ydym ni'n gwneud hynny gystal ag Awstralia, Seland Newydd, Ffrainc a Lloegr, sydd yn dominyddu rygbi ar hyn o bryd? Ni chredaf ein bod ni.

John Griffiths: A ydych yn cytuno, os am

to return to success in Welsh rugby in the modern professional era, we need a streamlined, professional executive to run the game in Wales?

The First Minister: That comment was made in *The Western Mail* this morning by Les Williams, a former senior member of the Welsh Rugby Union committee. He said that the time of committees is over and that it is time to delegate the job to a small inner cabinet of full-timers on the commercial and financial side, to ensure sponsorship and to ensure that assets, such as the strong passion for Welsh rugby and the Millennium Stadium, make money rather than lose it, as they do now.

Glyn Davies: Rhannaf eich diddordeb mewn rygbi a llwyddiant tîm rygbi Cymru. Fodd bynnag, a dderbyniwch fod mwy o bobl yng Nghymru yn chwarae, gwyllo, ac yn darllen am bêl-droed, nag unrhyw gêm arall yng Nghymru? A gytunwch y dylai eich polisiau gydnabod hynny a helpu'r economi ar yr un pryd?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Credaf fod pysgota yn fwy poblogaidd na phêl-droed a rygbi ymhlith pobl Cymru o ran nifer y bobl sydd yn cymryd rhan. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddai neb yn gwadu effaith rygbi ar ein proffil ac ar ysbryd y genedl. Mae perfformiad y crysau cochion yn erbyn Lloegr yn enwedig, ac wrth geisio ennill, ac weithiau ennill, y goron driphlyg a'r gamp lawn, yn cael mwy o effaith ar Gymru nag unrhyw gamp arall lle y cynrychiolir Cymru.

sicrhau llwyddiant rygbi Cymru eto yn yr oes broffesiynol fodern, fod angen corff effeithlon, proffesiynol i redeg y gêm yng Nghymru?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Gwnaethpwyd y sylw hwnnw yn y *Western Mail* y bore yma gan Les Williams, cyn aelod hŷn ar bwyllgor Undeb Rygbi Cymru. Dywedodd fod oes y pwyllgorau ar ben a'i bod yn bryd dirprwyo'r gwaith i gabinet mewnol bach o bobl lawn-amser ar yr ochr fasnachol ac ariannol, i sicrhau nawdd ac i sicrhau bod asedau, fel yr angerdd cryf dros rygbi Cymru a Stadiwm y Mileniwm, yn gwneud arian yn hytrach na'i golli, fel y gwnânt ar hyn o bryd.

Glyn Davies: I share your interest in rugby and the success of the Welsh rugby team. However, do you accept that more people in Wales play, watch, and read about football, than any other sport in Wales? Do you agree that your policies should acknowledge that and help the economy at the same time?

The First Minister: I believe that fishing is more popular than football or rugby among Welsh people in terms of the number of participants. However, rugby's effect on our nation's profile and spirit is undeniable. The team's performances against England particularly, and its occasionally successful campaign for the triple crown and the grand slam, have more of an effect on Wales than any other sporting events where Wales is represented.

Amcan 1 Objective 1

C8 Dafydd Wigley: A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn fodlon fod arian Amcan 1 yn cael ei wario mewn modd a fydd yn cynyddu cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen o fewn tiriogaeth Amcan 1 Cymru yn sylweddol? (OAQ17511)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr wyf yn hyderus y bydd hynny'n digwydd. Mae pob rheswm i gredu bod y camau a gymerwyd hyd yn hyn, a'r mwy na £300 miliwn sydd wedi ei ymrwymo i brosiectau gwahanol, yn cael effaith sylweddol ar CMC y pen yn ardal

Q8 Dafydd Wigley: Is the First Minister satisfied that Objective 1 funding is being spent in a way that will substantially increase gross domestic product per capita in the Welsh Objective 1 area? (OAQ17511)

The First Minister: I am confident that that will happen. There is every reason to believe that the steps taken so far, and the more than £300 million that has been committed to different projects, will have a significant effect on GDP per capita in the Welsh

Amcan 1 Cymru.

Dafydd Wigley: Nid wyf yn pwyso am i arian Amcan 1 fynd i glybiau rygbi yn yr ardal honno. Mae llawer o fusnesau yn teimlo nad ydynt wedi cael y fantais uniongyrchol o Amcan 1 yr oeddent wedi eu harwain i gredu y byddent yn ei chael. Sut y byddwch yn sicrhau y bydd gweddill arian Amcan 1 yn mynd at y busnesau hynny a all gynyddu cyflogaeth ac incwm y pen yng Nghymru?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Y geiriau allweddol yw 'uniongyrchol', ac 'wedi eu harwain i gredu'. Nid oes unrhyw ddyn busnes na chwmmi yng Nghymru wedi cael eu harwain gan y Llywodraeth i ddisgwyl y byddent yn cael mynediad uniongyrchol i adnoddau Amcan 1. Byddent yn ei gael yn anuniongyrchol drwy sefydliadau megis Cyllid Cymru, y banc a sefydlwyd i hybu tyfiant mentrau bach a chanolig eu maint yng Nghymru. Yr ydym wedi bod yn galw am sefydlu'r banc hwn ers degawdau, ac mae gennym yn awr drwy nawdd Amcan 1. Drwy fynd at Gyllid Cymru gall busnesau gael y benthyciadau a'r buddsoddiadau a fydd yn cael yr effaith yr ydych am ei weld—a rhannaf eich dymuniad—o helpu'r busnesau hynny sydd yn asgwrn cefn economi Cymru i dyfu ac felly gynyddu CMC y pen yn ardal Amcan 1 Cymru.

Mick Bates: It is all very well to increase GDP per head, but we can also involve more people in economic activity, particularly women. What measures do you have to increase the number of people involved in economic activity?

The First Minister: Supply side initiatives can increase the activity rate. The biggest increase in activity rate occurs when demand increases. If the demand exists, people come into the labour force. However, some do not because they cannot. Childcare restricts the participation of single parents, who are mostly women. Sometimes there are skill or literacy and numeracy problems that prevent people getting jobs. The old jobs down the pits, on the bins, and in supermarkets, which did not require literacy and numeracy skills, have gone. We are trying to remove those supply side barriers, jointly with the UK

Objective 1 area.

Dafydd Wigley: I am not asking for Objective 1 money for rugby clubs in that area. Many businesses do not feel that they have seen the direct benefits from Objective 1 that they were led to expect. How will you ensure that the remainder of the Objective 1 funding goes to those businesses that can increase employment and income per capita in Wales?

The First Minister: The key words are 'direct', and 'led to expect'. No businessman or company in Wales has been led by the Government to expect that they would have direct access to Objective 1 funding. They would get it indirectly, through organisations such as Finance Wales, the bank that was established to promote the growth of small and medium-sized enterprises in Wales. We have been calling for the establishment of this bank for years, and we now have it thanks to Objective 1 backing. By going to Finance Wales, businesses can access the loans and investments that will have the desired effect that you referred to—and I share your desire—of helping the businesses that are the backbone of the Welsh economy to grow and thus increase GDP per capita in the Welsh Objective 1 area.

Mick Bates: Un peth yw cynyddu CMC y pen, ond gallwn hefyd sicrhau bod mwy o bobl yn ymwneud â gweithgaredd economaidd, yn enwedig merched. Pa fesurau sydd gennych i gynyddu'r nifer o bobl sy'n ymwneud â gweithgaredd economaidd?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Gall mentrau'r ochr gyflenwi gynyddu cyfradd gweithgaredd. Ceir y cynnydd mwyaf yng nghyfradd gweithgaredd pan gynydda'r galw. Os yw'r galw yno, daw pobl i mewn i'r llafurlu. Fodd bynnag, ni ddaw rhai oherwydd na allant. Mae gofal plant yn cyfyngu ar allu rhieni sengl i gymryd rhan, a'r rheini ar y cyfan yn ferched. Weithiau mae problemau sgiliau neu llythrennedd neu rifedd sy'n atal pobl rhag cael swyddi. Mae'r hen swyddi yn y pwll, ar y biniau, ac mewn archfarchnadoedd, lle nad oedd angen sgiliau llythrennedd a rhifedd, wedi mynd. Yr ydym yn ceisio dileu'r

Government, which has a major role to play through the Department of Work and Pensions.

David Davies: Do you agree that we must raise the standard of living and GDP across Wales? Many areas outside the Objective 1 area are suffering, such as my constituency, Monmouth, which has been hit by flooding, foot and mouth disease and outrageous rises in council taxes. Many of my constituents, represented by the Monmouth Women's Institute, are in the public gallery and would like to know what the Assembly will do for Monmouth.

The Presiding Officer: Order. This question is on Objective 1 areas.

The First Minister: There are universal measures, such as the Assembly investment grant, which apply in both Objective 1 areas and the rest of Wales. I am sure that your constituents, and those in business and those going into business in your constituency, will make good use of them.

rhwystrau hynny i'r ochr gyflenwi, ar y cyd â Llywodraeth y DU, sydd â rhan bwysig i'w chwarae drwy'r Adran Waith a Phensiynau.

David Davies: A gytunwch fod yn rhaid inni godi'r safon byw a'r CMC ledled Cymru? Mae llawer o ardaloedd y tu allan i'r ardal Amcan 1 yn dioddef, fel fy etholaeth i, Mynwy, sydd wedi cael ei tharo gan lifogydd, clwy'r traed a'r genau a chodiadau gwarthus yn y dreth gyngor. Mae llawer o'm hetholwyr yn yr oriel gyhoeddus, ar ran Sefydliad y Merched, Trefynwy, a hoffent wybod beth a wnaiff y Cynulliad dros Fynwy.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Cwestiwn ar ardaloedd Amcan 1 yw hwn.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Y mae mesurau cyffredinol, fel grant buddsoddi'r Cynulliad, sydd yn weithredol yn yr ardaloedd Amcan 1 ac yng ngweddill Cymru. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnaiff eich etholwyr, a'r rheini sydd mewn busnes ac yn mynd i mewn i fusnes yn eich etholaeth, yn gwneud defnydd da ohonynt.

Cael Gwared ar Hiliaeth Sefydliadol yn y Broses o Lunio Polisiâu Elimination of Institutionalised Racism in Policy-making

Q9 Helen Mary Jones: Will the First Minister make a statement on the elimination of institutionalised racism in policy-making in the National Assembly Government? (OAQ17502)

The First Minister: This allows me to repeat what I said in answer to Geraint's earlier round-the-houses question. Every public body in Wales must publish a race equality scheme by 31 May. We will certainly do so. The race equality scheme will incorporate measures to eliminate institutionalised racism.

Helen Mary Jones: Communities across Wales have been shocked by the case of racial harassment against Mrs Lodge of Cynghordy, which has forced her and her husband to leave their home. I am sure you will join me in expressing the Assembly's shock and our sincere sympathy with Mr and Mrs Lodge. Do you agree that this highlights the need to mainstream strong anti-racist

C9 Helen Mary Jones: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ynghylch cael gwared ar hiliaeth sefydliadol yn y broses o lunio polisiâu yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru? (OAQ17502)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae hyn yn caniatáu imi ailadrodd yr hyn a ddywedais wrth ateb cwestiwn hirwyntog Geraint yn gynharach. Rhaid i bob corff cyhoeddus yng Nghymru gyhoeddi cynllun cydraddoldeb hiliol erbyn 31 Mai. Byddwn ni'n gwneud hynny yn sicr. Bydd y cynllun cydraddoldeb hiliol yn ymgorffori mesurau i ddileu hiliaeth sefydliadol.

Helen Mary Jones: Brawychwyd cymunedau ledled Cymru gan yr achos o aflonyddu hiliol yn erbyn Mrs Lodge o Gynghordy, sydd wedi'i gorfodi hi a'i gŵr i adael eu cartref. Yr wyf yn siŵr yr ymunwch â mi i fynegi braw y Cynulliad a'n cydymdeimlad diffuant â Mr a Mrs Lodge. A gytunwch fod hyn yn tanlinellu'r angen i osod gweithredu gwrth-hiliol cryf yn y brif

action into all policy matters, especially in communities with relatively few ethnic minority citizens? Do you also agree that this is particularly important in schools and education so that young people in Wales grow up with a proper understanding that racism is unacceptable?

The First Minister: I am sure that all Members agree with those sentiments; I certainly do. Indeed, I wrote to Mr and Mrs Lodge last summer, when this issue first arose. I was shocked to hear of it then and I am more shocked now that the family's morale and belief that they can continue to live in Wales as a mixed-race couple in the farming area of the upper Tawe valley has been so worn down. I am shocked that the death threats, the daubing of swastikas and other incidents have continued and I shall write to Mr and Mrs Lodge again to see whether we can do more to reassure Mrs Lodge that she is welcome in Wales. I do not know why I should have to say that, as she was born in Aberystwyth. However, she has had problems in feeling welcome in her home country. It is terrible that people believe that mixed-race couples in Wales will, for some reason, be discriminated against. None of us would want to let that continue while we have a bone left in our bodies.

The Presiding Officer: I call Gwenda Thomas.

Gwenda Thomas: I will pass, Presiding Officer, as my question was along the lines of Helen Mary Jones's supplementary question.

David Melding: Those of us involved in public appointments continue to be disappointed by the lack of candidates from ethnic minorities. What can we do to encourage such people to put their names forward, as often, they would be excellent candidates?

The First Minister: That is a matter for political parties rather than the Assembly. In the run up to next year's Assembly election and the local government elections the following year, everybody should ensure that

ffrwd ym mhob mater polisi, yn enwedig mewn cymunedau sydd â chymharol ychydig ddinasyddion o leiafrifoedd ethnig? A gytunwch hefyd fod hyn yn arbennig o bwysig mewn ysgolion ac addysg fel y bydd pobl ifanc yng Nghymru'n tyfu gyda dealltwriaeth iawn fod hiliaeth yn annerbyniol?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr wyf yn siŵr fod pob Aelod yn cytuno â'r geiriau hynny; yn sicr yr wyf fi'n cytuno. Yn wir, ysgrifennais at Mr a Mrs Lodge yr haf diwethaf, pan gododd y mater hwn gyntaf. Cefais fraw o glywed amdano bryd hynny ac yr wyf wedi dychryn mwy erbyn hyn fod ysbryd y teulu a'u cred y gallant ddal i fyw yng Nghymru fel pâr cymysghil yn ardal ffermio pen uchaf Cwm Tawe wedi cael y fath ergydion. Yr wyf yn arswydo bod y bygythiadau einioes, y peintio swasticas a digwyddiadau eraill wedi parhau, a byddaf yn ysgrifennu at Mr a Mrs Lodge eto i weld a allwn wneud rhagor i sicrhau Mrs Lodge fod croeso iddi yng Nghymru. Ni wn pam y dylai fod yn rhaid imi ddweud hynny, gan y cafodd ei geni yn Aberystwyth. Fodd bynnag, mae hi wedi ei chael yn anodd i deimlo bod croeso iddi yn ei mamwlad. Mae'n ofnadwy fod pobl yn credu y gwahaniaethir yn erbyn parau cymysghil yng Nghymru, am ryw reswm. Ni fyddai ar neb ohonom eisiau gadael i hynny barhau tra bo gennym asgwrn ar ôl yn ein cyrff.

Y Llywydd: Galwaf ar Gwenda Thomas.

Gwenda Thomas: Fe wnaif fi basio, Lywydd, oherwydd yr oedd fy nghwestiwn yn dilyn yr un trywydd â chwestiwn atodol Helen Mary Jones.

David Melding: Mae'r rheini ohonom sy'n ymwneud â phenodiadau cyhoeddus yn dal i gael ein siomi gan ddiffyg ymgeiswyr o leiafrifoedd ethnig. Beth allwn ni ei wneud i annog pobl o'r fath i'w henwebu eu hunain, gan y byddent, yn aml, yn ymgeiswyr rhagorol?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mater i bleidiau gwleidyddol yw hynny yn hytrach na'r Cynulliad. Yn y cyfnod sy'n arwain at etholiad y Cynulliad y flwyddyn nesaf ac etholiadau llywodraeth leol y flwyddyn

any psychological or actual barriers to selecting candidates from the black and ethnic minorities be removed throughout civic life in Wales. People from the black and ethnic minorities would then see faces similar to their own when attending council or Assembly meetings. I will meet Gurbux Singh, the chairman of the Commission for Racial Equality, on Friday to discuss these and other issues relating to race and community relations.

Lorraine Barrett: Will you join me in condemning recent outrageous letters in the *South Wales Echo* criticising the Minister for Health and Social Services' funding of free eye health checks for people with certain disabilities and illnesses, and for those from certain ethnic backgrounds? Some people have used this to attack people from black and ethnic minorities.

The First Minister: That is sad but entirely predictable. You just knew that that would happen. Members of black and ethnic minorities are particularly prone to certain types of diseases, such as eye diseases and, I believe, diabetes. When you devise a scheme that addresses that particular need or susceptibility, you know that some brain-dead, green ink letter writer will write to the *Echo* or another paper saying 'There they go, favouring the black and ethnic minorities again. Us white folks don't get a chance, do we?' or something along those British National Party type lines. They do not realise that this is because there is a particular problem of genetic susceptibility among people of black and ethnic minorities. They do not want to realise that, so they ignore it and think that they are clever because they write a letter. All they are doing is falling into the old BNP trap of believing that, if you do anything for black and ethnic minorities, you are ignoring the demands and requirements of the white majority.

2:40 p.m.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ymuno â mi i gydnabod dewrder Mrs Lodge drwy wrthsefyll gwleidyddiaeth annymunol ac annerbyniol y BNP? A wnaiff

ddilynol, rhaid i bawb sicrhau y tynnir unrhyw rwystrau seicolegol neu wirioneddol sy'n atal dewis ymgeiswyr o leiafrifoedd du ac ethnig ym mhob rhan o fywyd dinesig yng Nghymru. Wedyn byddai pobl o leiafrifoedd du ac ethnig yn gweld wynebau tebyg i'w rhai hwy wrth fynychu cyfarfodydd cyngor neu rai'r Cynulliad. Byddaf yn cyfarfod â Gurbux Singh, cadeirydd y Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb Hiliol, ddydd Gwener i drafod hyn a materion eraill yn ymwneud â chysylltiadau hiliol a chymunedol.

Lorraine Barrett: A wnewch chi ymuno â mi i gondemnio llythyrau gwarthus diweddar yn y *South Wales Echo* yn beirniadu'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol am ariannu profion llygaid am ddim i bobl ag anabledd neu salwch penodol, ac i rai o gefndir ethnig arbennig? Mae rhai pobl wedi defnyddio hyn i ymosod ar bobl o leiafrifoedd du ac ethnig.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae hynny'n drist ond yn gwbl ragweladwy. Gallech ragweld y byddai hynny'n digwydd. Mae aelodau lleiafrifoedd du ac ethnig yn arbennig o dueddol o gael mathau arbennig o afiechyd, fel clefydau ar y llygaid, a'r clefyd siwgr, mi gredaf. Pan ddyfeisiwch gynllun sy'n rhoi sylw i'r angen neu'r duedd arbennig honno, gwyddoch y bydd rhyw lythyrwr inc gwyrdd, heb ddim yn ei ben, yn ysgrifennu at yr *Echo* neu bapur arall a dweud 'Dyna nhw, yn ffafrio'r lleiafrifoedd du ac ethnig eto. Chawn ni bobl wyn ddim cyfle, na chawn?' neu rywbeth ar y llinellau BNPaidd hynny. Nid ydynt yn sylweddoli bod hyn oherwydd bod problem arbennig o duedd enetig ymysg pobl o leiafrifoedd du ac ethnig. Nid oes arnynt eisiau sylweddoli hynny, felly fe'i hanwybyddant a meddwl eu bod yn glyfar am eu bod yn ysgrifennu llythyr. Y cwbl y maent yn ei wneud yw syrthio i fagl y BNP o gredu os y gwnewch chi unrhyw beth dros y lleiafrifoedd du ac ethnig eich bod yn anwybyddu hawliau a gofynion y mwyafrif gwyn.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Will the First Minister join me in acknowledging Mrs Lodge's courage in resisting the offensive and unacceptable politics of the BNP? Will

hefyd gytuno bod yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd iddi yn anghydnaws â chymdogaeth gynhesol, groesawgar Dyffryn Tywi?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid wyf yn adnabod uchelderau Dyffryn Tywi gystal â Rhodri Glyn ond bwm yno ddwsinau o weithiau. Sylwais bob tro bod y gymuned yn gymdogol. Mae hyn yn syndod ac nid wyf yn siŵr a yw'r rhai sydd yn anfon y bygythiadau o farwolaeth drwy'r post ac yn gosod swasticas ar eiddo'r teulu Lodge yn bobl leol. Ni wn pwy sy'n gyfrifol, ond, yn sicr, mae'n groes i'n traddodiad o groesawu pobl i Gymru.

Eleanor Burnham: Do you agree that the National Assembly's Committee on Equality of Opportunity and the work it is undertaking under Edwina Hart's chairmanship sends strong messages to the media and other institutions throughout Wales?

The First Minister: The work of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity under Edwina Hart's chairmanship is important. Edwina will meet Gurbux Singh with me on Friday because she chairs the Committee and equality of opportunity is part of her portfolio. It is important that the Assembly and its Government strongly promotes our continued commitment to equality of opportunity.

Cynog Dafis: Ategap y sylwadau a wnaed eisoes. Mae angen damsang ar y math hwn o ymddygiad gan eithafwyr hiliol. Pa drafodaethau a gafodd y Prif Weinidog gyda'r heddlu ynghylch dod o hyd i'r rhai a anfonodd llythyrau bygythiol er mwyn iddynt ddeall bod yr ymddygiad hwn yn annerbyniol?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr wyf yn cytuno â'ch safbwynt. Nid wyf yn hoff o ddefnyddio'r gair 'damsang' mewn perthynas â gwleidyddiaeth ond mae ei angen weithiau. Mae'ch defnydd o'r gair yn briodol yn y cyd-destun hwn.

O ran yr hyn a ddigwyddodd yr haf diwethaf pan gododd y mater hwn gyntaf, ysgrifennais at y teulu i fynegi fy atgasedd tuag at yr hyn a ddigwyddodd. Bydd yn rhaid gwneud

he also agree that what has happened to her is not in keeping with the close-knit and welcoming neighbourhood of the Towy Valley?

The First Minister: I am not as familiar with the upper reaches of the Towy Valley as Rhodri Glyn, but I have been there dozens of times. I noticed the neighbourliness of the community on each occasion. This is a shock and I am not sure whether those sending death threats through the post and daubing swastikas on the Lodge family's property are local people. I do not know who is responsible, but it is certainly contrary to our tradition of welcoming people to Wales.

Eleanor Burnham: A gytunwch fod Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, a'r gwaith a wna dan gadeiryddiaeth Edwina Hart, yn anfon negeseuon cryf i'r cyfryngau a sefydliadau eraill ledled Cymru?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae gwaith y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal dan gadeiryddiaeth Edwina Hart yn bwysig. Bydd Edwina yn cwrdd â Gurbux Singh gyda mi ddydd Gwener am mai hi yw cadeirydd y Pwyllgor a bod cyfle cyfartal yn rhan o'i phortffolio. Mae'n bwysig fod y Cynulliad a'i Lywodraeth yn hyrwyddo'n gryf ein hymrwymiad parhaus i gyfle cyfartal.

Cynog Dafis: I endorse the comments that have already been made. This kind of behaviour by racist extremists must be stamped out. What discussions has the First Minister had with the police regarding the discovery of those responsible for sending the threatening letters, so that they are left in no doubt that this behaviour is unacceptable?

The First Minister: I agree with you. I am not fond of using the phrase 'to stamp out' in a political context but it is occasionally appropriate. It is appropriate in this context.

As regards what happened last summer when this matter first arose, I wrote to the family to express my revulsion at what had happened. We will have to inquire about what the police

ymholiadau ynghylch yr hyn a wnaeth yr heddlu a pha syniadau a oedd ganddynt ynghylch pwy sydd yn ymddwyn mor gas, ac a allant gael gafael ar y bobl a oedd yn gyfrifol a chymryd y camau cyfreithiol angenrheidiol.

have done and what ideas they have about who is behaving in such a hateful way, and whether they could catch those people responsible and take the necessary legal steps.

Llwyddiant Polisiâu'r Llywodraeth yng Nghanol De Cymru Success of Government Policies in South Wales Central

C10 Owen John Thomas: Sut mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn mesur llwyddiant ei pholisiâu ar draws Canol De Cymru? (OAQ17494)

Q10 Owen John Thomas: How does the Assembly Government measure the success of its policies across South Wales Central? (OAQ17494)

The First Minister: We believe in continuously monitoring and evaluating the impact of all our programmes to ensure that they are having the desired effect in improving services and conditions for people in Wales, including in South Wales Central. We evaluated the People in Communities programme before changing it to the Communities First programme. Likewise, in terms of improving the relationship between the Valleys and the South Wales Central coast—there is a symbiotic relationship between the Valleys and the coast—when we introduce improved railway communications through the £10 million scheme to remove the bottleneck north of Queen Street, and when a suitable time has passed, we will evaluate it.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Credwn mewn monitro a gwerthuso effaith pob un o'n rhaglenni yn barhaus er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn cael yr effaith a fwriadwyd i wella gwasanaethau ac amodau i bobl yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys Canol De Cymru. Gwerthuswyd y rhaglen Pobl mewn Cymunedau cyn ei newid i'r rhaglen Cymunedau'n Gyntaf. Yn yr un modd, o ran gwella'r berthynas rhwng y Cymoedd ac arfordir Canol De Cymru—mae perthynas symbiotig rhwng y Cymoedd a'r arfordir—pan gyflwynwn well cysylltiadau rheilffordd drwy'r cynllun £10 miliwn i atal tagfeydd i'r gogledd o Heol y Frenhines, a phan fydd amser addas wedi mynd heibio, byddwn yn ei werthuso.

Owen John Thomas: Mewn manau ceir lefelau annerbyniol o afiechyd hirdymor, cyfartaledd afresymol o blant yn gadael yr ysgol heb gymwysterau ac economi sy'n gwegian ar ymyl y dibyn. Pam na wnewch chi wynebu'r realiti a chanolbwyntio ar gynllunio polisiâu rhanbarthol er mwyn codi safonau byw yn yr ardaloedd hyn?

Owen John Thomas: In places there are unacceptable levels of long-term ill health, an unreasonable percentage of children leaving school without qualifications and an economy teetering on the brink. Why will you not face the reality and focus on regional policies in order to raise the standard of living in these areas?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae adroddiad Townsend yn cynnwys argymhellion o'r fath, sef i gynyddu'r gwariant ar iechyd a mesurau sy'n gysylltiedig ag iechyd cyhoeddus, yn enwedig yn yr ardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig. Ni fydd hynny ar draul yr ardaloedd mwy breintiedig, gan y byddant yn cael cynnydd o 5 y cant tra bo'r ardaloedd llai breintiedig yn cael cynnydd o 10 y cant, neu rywbeth felly. Os ydych yn ystyried yr hyn sydd yn digwydd o ran argymhellion adroddiad Townsend, mae pobl wedi gofyn a fydd hyn

The First Minister: The Townsend report contains such recommendations, namely to increase expenditure on health and measures that are linked to public health, especially in the most deprived areas. That will not be at the expense of less deprived areas as they will receive an increase of 5 per cent while the more deprived areas will receive an increase of around 10 per cent. If you consider what is happening in terms of the recommendations of the Townsend report, people have asked whether it will mean that

yn golygu y bydd un ardal awdurdod iechyd yn gorfod sybsideiddio ardal arall. Mae angen gwahaniaethu rhwng awdurdodau iechyd o ran y ffordd y mae eu hadnoddau'n llifo, er mwyn sicrhau bod mwy ohonynt yn cyrraedd ardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig yr awdurdodau hynny.

Jonathan Morgan: Recent figures show that Welsh competitiveness, in terms of knowledge-based business development, has declined from 90.7 per cent to 89.8 per cent of the UK average, with Cardiff at 56 per cent. In terms of ensuring the development of Wales's capital city, what will the Government do in order to reverse this worrying decline?

The First Minister: It is a worry. I believe that you are referring to a report by Robert Huggins Associates, which is one of the new breed of consultancies that use a different method of calculating an index of competitiveness. We are not sure how longstanding the index will be, because it is a reasonably new tool of statistical analysis. However, we are concerned, and are trying to ensure that we fully participate in the knowledge economy, given that, historically, Wales has not had a knowledge economy. We were hewers of wood and drawers of water; we dug coal and made steel. In Cardiff, coal trimmers on the docks would shovel coal into ships—there was no knowledge economy at all in Wales. Trying to cut ourselves a stake in the knowledge economy of the future involves a massive transformation of the economy. We are now at a staging post in that process.

one health authority area will have to subsidise another. We need to differentiate between health authorities in terms of the way in which their resources are channelled, in order to ensure that more resources reach the more deprived areas within those authorities.

Jonathan Morgan: Dengys ffigurau diweddar fod cystadleurwydd Cymru, yn nhermau datblygiad busnesau seiliedig ar wybodaeth, wedi gostwng o 90.7 y cant i 89.8 y cant o gyfartaledd y DU, a bod Caerdydd ar 56 y cant. O ran sicrhau datblygiad ein prifddinas, beth a wnaiff y Llywodraeth er mwyn gwrthdroi'r gostyngiad hwn, sy'n destun gofid?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Y mae'n ofid. Credaf eich bod yn cyfeirio at adroddiad gan Robert Huggins Associates, un o'r brid newydd o gwmnïau ymgynghori sy'n defnyddio dull gwahanol o gyfrifo mynegai cystadleurwydd. Nid ydym yn sicr pa mor hirhoedlog fydd y mynegai, oherwydd mae'n offeryn dadansoddi ystadegol cymharol newydd. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn pryderu, ac yn ceisio sicrhau y byddwn yn cymryd rhan lawn yn yr economi wybodaeth, o ystyried, yn hanesyddol, na fu gan Gymru economi wybodaeth. Cymynwyr coed a gwelynwyr dŵr oeddem; cloddiem am lo a chynhyrchem ddur. Yng Nghaerdydd, byddai naddwyr glo ar y dociau'n rhoio glo i longau—nid oedd economi wybodaeth o gwbl yng Nghymru. Mae ceisio sicrhau cyfran i ni'n hunain yn economi wybodaeth y dyfodol yn golygu gweddnewid yr economi'n aruthrol. Yr ydym bellach ar arosfan yn y broses honno.

Datganiad Busnes Business Statement

The Minister for Rural Affairs and Assembly Business (Carwyn Jones): Members will wish to be aware that there are some minor changes to this week's business. In terms of today's business, and following discussion in the Business Committee this morning, I will propose a procedural motion under Standing Order No. 6.10 later this afternoon to move today's debate on sustainable development to Tuesday, 21 May.

Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig a Threfnydd y Cynulliad (Carwyn Jones): Bydd Aelodau'n dymuno bod yn ymwybodol fod rhai mân newidiadau i fusnes yr wythnos hon. O ran busnes heddiw, ac yn dilyn trafodaeth yn y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, byddaf yn cynnig cynnig trefniadol dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.10 yn ddiweddarach y prynhawn yma i symud dadl heddiw ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy i ddydd Mawrth, 21

Jane Hutt's scheduled statement on Health Professions Wales on Thursday has been deferred to Thursday, 23 May. The Business Committee discussed this morning my draft business statement for the next three weeks, as shown on the Chamberweb under supporting documents. Finally, the Deputy Presiding Officer determined, under Standing Order No. 22.5, that the following items of legislation need not be referred to Subject Committees for extended consideration: the Animal By-Products (Identification) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2002; the Education (School Day and School Year) (Amendment) (No.2) (Wales) Regulations 2002; and the Health and Social Care Act 2001 (Commencement No.2) (Wales) Order 2002.

The Presiding Officer: Are there any objections to the business statement? I see that there are none. Are there any comments on the business statement?

Janet Ryder: A month ago, I asked you to schedule a debate in Government time on the White Paper on the Police Reform Bill. I notice that it has not been included in the forward look. When will a debate on this subject be held?

Carwyn Jones: The matter has been raised with me in another place, and I will discuss it further with Cabinet colleagues. The matter will be reported back to the appropriate forum on Tuesday.

Alun Cairns: Does the Minister intend to ask the Minister for Health and Social Services to table a question—a statement, rather—on the report of the Specialised Health Services Commission for Wales? There seems to be some confusion about the consultation it is pursuing in relation to the recent report.

Carwyn Jones: I have no intention of demanding that the Minister for Health and Social Services table a question. I understand that the Health and Social Services Committee will meet tomorrow, when members will be able to pursue this matter further. No doubt they will wish to know what the Minister's intention is with regard to

Mai. Gohiriwyd datganiad bwriedig Jane Hutt ar Broffesiynau Iechyd Cymru o ddydd Iau hyd ddydd Iau, 23 Mai. Trafododd y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma fy natganiad busnes drafft am y tair wythnos nesaf, fel a ddangosir ar we'r Siambr dan ddogfennau ategol. Yn olaf, penderfynodd y Dirprwy Lywydd, dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.5, nad oedd angen cyfeirio'r eitemau deddfwriaeth canlynol i Bwyllgorau Pwnc am ystyriaeth estynedig: Rheoliadau Sgîl-gynhyrchion Anifeiliaid (Adnabod) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2002; Rheoliadau Addysg (Y Diwrnod Ysgol a'r Flwyddyn Ysgol) (Diwygio) (Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2002; a Gorchymyn Deddf Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol 2001 (Cychwyniad Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2002.

Y Llywydd: A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiadau i'r datganiad busnes? Gwelaf nad oes. A oes unrhyw sylwadau ar y datganiad busnes?

Janet Ryder: Fis yn ôl, gofynnais ichi drefnu dadl yn amser y Llywodraeth ar y Papur Gwyn ar Fesur Diwygio'r Heddlu. Sylwaf nad yw wedi'i chynnwys yn y rhagolwg. Pa bryd y cynhelir dadl ar y pwnc hwn?

Carwyn Jones: Codwyd y mater gyda mi mewn man arall, ac fe'i trafodaf ymhellach gyda chyd-aelodau yn y Cabinet. Adroddir yn ôl ar y mater i'r fforwm priodol ddydd Mawrth.

Alun Cairns: A ydyw'r Gweinidog yn bwriadu gofyn i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol gyflwyno cwestiwn—datganiad, yn hytrach—ar adroddiad Comisiwn Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol Cymru? Mae'n ymddangos bod rhywfaint o ddryswch ynghylch yr ymgynghori y mae'n ei wneud ar yr adroddiad diweddar.

Carwyn Jones: Nid oes gennyf unrhyw fwiad i fynnu bod y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn cyflwyno cwestiwn. Deallaf y bydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn cyfarfod yfory, pryd y bydd aelodau'n gallu dilyn y mater hwn ymhellach. Mae'n siŵr y byddant yn dymuno gwybod beth yw bwriad y

making a statement, if at all, in the future.

Gweinidog ynghylch gwneud datganiad, os o gwbl, yn y dyfodol.

*Derbyniwyd y datganiad busnes.
Business statement adopted.*

2:50 p.m.

Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

Phil Williams: I raise a point of order under Standing Order No. 17 on Members' access to documents. I will refer to the code of practice on the provision of information to Assembly Members and the protocol for relationships between Assembly Members and Assembly staff. Clause 1.3 of the code resolves that

'staff will aim to provide Members with the relevant, accurate and timely information in order for Members to carry out their duties'.

Clause 3.3 of the protocol resolves that staff

'contribute to the provision of information and briefing to the Assembly and its committees'.

I maintain that the automatic block on Assembly staff e-mailing Members to provide 'relevant, accurate and timely information' in connection with Committee work is a serious breach of the code and the protocol.

I recently attended a sub-committee as a representative of the National Assembly. All other members of the sub-committee—Assembly staff, representatives of the social partners and the voluntary sector—had received the committee papers. I, as an elected Member of the Assembly, had not received them, because the secretary was not allowed to e-mail them to me. I maintain that the block on e-mails imposed by the Government of Wales has put me at a specific disadvantage in carrying out my duties as an AM.

Lawyers will examine the multiple meanings of every word in the code and protocol, especially the references to specific requests

Phil Williams: Codaf bwynt o drefn dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 17 ar hawl Aelodau i weld dogfennau. Cyfeiriaf at y cod ymarfer ar ddarparu gwybodaeth i Aelodau'r Cynulliad a'r protocol ar gysylltiadau rhwng Aelodau'r Cynulliad a staff y Cynulliad. Dywed cymal 1.3 y cod:

'bydd staff yn anelu at gynnig gwybodaeth berthnasol, manwl a phrydlon i Aelodau er mwyn iddynt allu gwneud eu dyletswyddau'.

Dywed cymal 3.3 y protocol fod staff

'yn rhoi gwybodaeth ac yn briffio'r Cynulliad a'i bwyllgorau'.

Daliaf fod y rhwystr awtomatig i staff y Cynulliad e-bostio Aelodau i ddarparu 'gwybodaeth berthnasol, manwl a phrydlon' sy'n gysylltiedig â gwaith Pwyllgor yn achos difrifol o dorri'r cod a'r protocol.

Yn ddiweddar mynychais is-bwyllgor fel cynrychiolydd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Yr oedd holl aelodau eraill yr is-bwyllgor—staff y Cynulliad, cynrychiolwyr y partneriaid cymdeithasol a'r sector gwirfoddol—wedi derbyn papurau'r pwyllgor. Yr oeddwn i, fel Aelod etholedig o'r Cynulliad, heb eu derbyn, oherwydd ni châi'r ysgrifennydd eu e-bostio ataf. Daliaf fod y rhwystr ar e-byst a osodwyd gan Lywodraeth Cymru wedi fy ngosod dan anfantais benodol wrth gyflawni fy nyletswyddau fel AC.

Bydd cyfreithwyr yn archwilio ystyron lluosog pob gair yn y cod a'r protocol, yn enwedig y cyfeiriadau at geisiadau penodol

and to Committees. However, physicists are even more precise than lawyers are on the unambiguous use of language, and I cannot see how the block on Assembly staff sending relevant and timely documents to Assembly Members is anything other than a breach of the code and the protocol. It is certainly in conflict with the functioning of the Assembly as a corporate body, and I ask you to rule on this, Presiding Officer.

Alun Cairns: Further to that point of order, I support Phil Williams's comments. I have found myself in a similar position. The Wales European Funding Office was pursuing a private sector Objective 1 bid, but its private sector division was unable to e-mail the necessary information to me; it had to fax it. If I were an ordinary member of the public, the Wales European Funding Office could have e-mailed me. However, because I am an Assembly Member, my e-mail address is barred from receiving e-mail from that department of the Wales European Funding Office, which prevented me from carrying out my duties.

The Presiding Officer: Order. This is not a matter directly for me, as Members will appreciate. The Government conducts its business in a manner appropriate to the protocol, and I would not, for one moment, seek to make a judgment between lawyers and physicists. However, Phil Williams should receive the same service as generally afforded to members of Assembly Committees. The Government should try to ensure that the principle that applies in the protocol to Assembly business, relating to our Committees, should generally apply to Members' conduct of business. In my view, neither Phil Williams nor Alun Cairns should receive information later than other members of any body, in which you play a part, who are not Assembly Members.

The Minister for Rural Affairs and Assembly Business (Carwyn Jones): I emphasise that there is no automatic block. There is a way of accessing and sending material via another route. A block exists to prevent material from being sent by mistake via e-mail, because in the past, confidential material was sent in error to several Assembly Members and members of staff

ac at Bwyllgorau. Fodd bynnag, mae ffisegwyr yn fwy manwl gywir na chyfreithwyr, hyd yn oed, ar ddefnyddio iaith ddiawys, ac ni allaf weld sut y gall y rhwystr i staff y Cynulliad anfon dogfennau perthnasol ac amserol at Aelodau'r Cynulliad fod yn ddim llai na thorri'r cod a'r protocol. Mae'n sicr yn gwrthdaro â gweithrediad y Cynulliad fel corff corfforaethol, a gofynnaf ichi ddyfarnu ar hyn, Lywydd.

Alun Cairns: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, ategaf sylwadau Phil Williams. Cefais i fy hun mewn sefyllfa debyg. Yr oedd Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru'n trafod cais Amcan 1 yn y sector preifat, ond nid oedd ei hadran sector preifat yn gallu e-bostio'r wybodaeth angenrheidiol ataf; bu raid iddi ei ffacsio. Pe bawn i'n aelod cyffredin o'r cyhoedd, gallasai Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru fy e-bostio. Fodd bynnag, gan fy mod yn Aelod o'r Cynulliad, mae fy nghyfeiriad e-bost wedi'i rwystro rhag derbyn e-bost oddi wrth yr adran honno o Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru, a'm rhwystrodd i rhag cyflawni fy nyletswyddau.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid mater i mi'n uniongyrchol yw hwn, fel y sylweddola'r Aelodau. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn cynnal ei busnes mewn modd sy'n briodol i'r protocol, ac ni fyddwn i am eiliad yn ceisio dyfarnu rhwng cyfreithwyr a ffisegwyr. Er hynny, dylai Phil Williams gael yr un gwasanaeth ag a gynigir yn gyffredinol i aelodau Pwyllgorau'r Cynulliad. Dylai'r Llywodraeth geisio sicrhau bod yr egwyddor yn y protocol sy'n ymwneud â busnes y Cynulliad, mewn perthynas â'n Pwyllgorau ni, yn ymwneud yn gyffredinol â busnes a gynhelir gan Aelodau. Yn fy marn i, ni ddylai Phil Williams nac Alun Cairns dderbyn gwybodaeth yn hwyrach nag aelodau eraill o unrhyw gorff, y cymerwch ran ynddo, nad ydynt yn Aelodau o'r Cynulliad.

Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig a Threfnydd y Cynulliad (Carwyn Jones): Pwysleisiaf nad oes rhwystr awtomatig. Y mae dull o dderbyn ac anfon deunydd drwy ffordd arall. Mae rhwystr yn bodoli er mwyn atal deunydd rhag cael ei anfon drwy gamgymeriad drwy'r e-bost, oherwydd yn y gorffennol, anfonwyd deunydd cyfrinachol drwy gamgymeriad at sawl Aelod o'r

who were not at that time entitled to see the material. However, there is no automatic block on information being supplied to Members *per se*. The bodies that should have supplied the information to the Members who complain should have been able to do so using another route—but certainly via e-mail.

Phil Williams: Further to this point of order, as chair of the information technology sub-group, I wish to state that several methods have been proposed, which would automatically and reliably prevent e-mails from going astray. Those proposals were not accepted, and therefore, I reject the answer of the Minister for Rural Affairs and Assembly Business. Creating a totally foolproof system is not a technical difficulty.

The Presiding Officer: Order. I therefore suggest that, in the context of the review and development of our electronic services, which is currently proceeding, we review this matter further. If there are technological solutions, they should always be pursued.

Peter Rogers: Further to that point of order, and in reply to Carwyn, there is a delay in the Agriculture Department contacting Members with regard to constituency matters, which puts an unfair time-lag on resolving problems.

The Presiding Officer: Order. That does not relate to the point of order raised by Phil Williams. I am well aware, Peter Rogers, that you have pursued issues involving the Agriculture Department by all possible means, and that you have been industrious in ensuring that your constituents' views are always heard by that department.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 2.53 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 2.53 p.m.*

**Adroddiad Blynyddol Prif Arolygydd Addysg ac Hyfforddiant yng Nghymru
Ei Mawrhydi
The Annual Report of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education and Training
in Wales**

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1, 5 a 6 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, and amendments 2, 3 and 4

Cynulliad ac aelodau staff nad oedd ganddynt yr hawl ar y pryd i weld y deunydd. Fodd bynnag, nid oes rhwystr awtomatig ar gyflenwi gwybodaeth i Aelodau *per se*. Dylasai'r cyrff a oedd i fod i gyflenwi'r wybodaeth i'r Aelodau sy'n cwyno bod wedi gallu gwneud hynny drwy ddefnyddio ffordd arall—ond yn sicr drwy e-bost.

Phil Williams: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwn, fel cadeirydd yr is-grŵp technoleg gwybodaeth, hoffwn ddatgan y cynigiwyd sawl dull, a fyddai'n atal e-byst rhag mynd ar gyfeiliorn mewn modd awtomatig a dibynadwy. Ni dderbyniwyd y cynigion hynny, ac felly, gwrthodaf ateb y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig a Threfnydd y Cynulliad. Nid yw creu system gwbl ddi-feth yn anhawster technegol.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Awgrymaf felly ein bod yn adolygu'r mater hwn ymhellach yng nghyd-destun y gwaith sydd ar y gweill ar hyn o bryd o ran adolygu a datblygu'n gwasanaethau electronig. Os oes atebion technegol, dylid eu dilyn bob amser.

Peter Rogers: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, ac fel ateb i Carwyn, ceir oedi wrth i'r Adran Amaeth gysylltu ag Aelodau ynghylch materion etholaeth, sydd yn golygu oedi annheg cyn datrys problemau.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid oes a wnelo hynny â'r pwynt o drefn a godwyd gan Phil Williams. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol iawn, Peter Rogers, eich bod wedi mynd ar ôl materion sy'n ymwneud â'r Adran Amaeth drwy bob modd posibl, a'ch bod wedi gweithio'n ddiwyd i sicrhau bod yr adran honno'n clywed sylwadau'ch etholwyr bob amser.

in the name of Jonathan Morgan.

Morgan.

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Datblygu Economaidd (Jane Davidson): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly:

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol

1. notes the 2000-01 annual report of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education and Training in Wales, which was laid in Table Office on 15 February 2002;

1. yn nodi adroddiad blynyddol 2000-01 Prif Arolygydd Addysg a Hyfforddiant yng Nghymru Ei Mawrhydi a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 15 Chwefror 2002;

2. recognises the contribution made by the annual report to the realisation of the Welsh Assembly Government's strategy for education and lifelong learning set out in 'The Learning Country'. (NDM1050)

2. yn cydnabod y cyfraniad a wnaed gan yr adroddiad blynyddol tuag at gyflawni strategaeth Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer addysg a dysgu gydol oes a nodwyd yn 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu'. (NDM1050)

I draw Members' attention to the 2000-01 annual report of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education and Training in Wales, which was published on 15 February. The report draws on findings from the inspection of provision for learners in almost every aspect of education and training and therefore plays a key role in adding to the body of evidence on the standard and quality of education and training in Wales, which supports policy development. I am pleased that the report concludes once again that standard of education and training has risen across all sectors.

Tynnaf sylw'r Aelodau at adroddiad blynyddol Prif Arolygydd Ei Mawrhydi ar Addysg a Hyfforddiant yng Nghymru am 2000-01, a gyhoeddwyd ar 15 Chwefror. Mae'r adroddiad yn dyfynnu canfyddiadau a wnaed wrth arolygu'r ddarpariaeth i ddysgwyr ymron bob agwedd ar addysg a hyfforddiant ac felly mae'n chwarae rhan allweddol wrth ychwanegu at y corff tystiolaeth ar safon ac ansawdd addysg a hyfforddiant yng Nghymru, sy'n cynnal datblygiad polisi. Yr wyf yn falch fod yr adroddiad yn dod i'r casgliad unwaith eto fod safon addysg a hyfforddiant wedi codi ar draws pob sector.

Primary and secondary schools have continued to build upon the improvements achieved in recent years, and I am particularly pleased to see that, for the first time, pupils in primary schools are achieving good or very good standards in over 50 per cent of classes inspected. Given that this figure was 30 per cent only five years ago, it is an immensely significant achievement. There is still much to be done to raise this figure and to reduce the number of classes where standards are seen as only satisfactory but overall there is real evidence that the attention given in primary schools to good quality in-service training for teachers, and the increased emphasis on developing pupil skills in reading, writing and numeracy, are producing results.

Mae ysgolion cynradd ac uwchradd wedi parhau i adeiladu ar y gwelliannau a gyflawnwyd dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf, ac yr wyf yn arbennig o falch o weld, am y tro cyntaf, fod disgyblion mewn ysgolion cynradd yn sicrhau safonau da neu dda iawn mewn dros 50 y cant o'r dosbarthiadau a arolygwyd. O gofio mai 30 y cant oedd y ffigur hwn gwa bum mlynedd yn ôl, mae'n gamp arwyddocaol dros ben. Mae llawer i'w wneud o hyd i godi'r ffigur hwn ac i leihau nifer y dosbarthiadau lle gwelir mai dim ond boddhaol yw'r safonau, ond, ar y cyfan, mae tystiolaeth wirioneddol fod y sylw a roddwyd mewn ysgolion cynradd i hyfforddiant mewn swydd o ansawdd da i athrawon, a'r pwyslais cynyddol ar ddatblygu sgiliau disgyblion mewn darllen, ysgrifennu a rhifedd, yn dod â chanlyniadau da.

The picture in secondary schools also

Mae'r darlun mewn ysgolion uwchradd yn

continues to be bright. The report confirmed that the steady progress made over the past six years has been maintained, and that pupils are achieving good or very good standards in almost 50 per cent of classes. However, although standards of attainment have risen in all schools over the last 10 years, the gap between the best and the least well performing schools has not changed. I will look to the report of the task group on narrowing that gap to provide key pointers on what needs to be done to help schools lift their performance and enrich the learning experience of young people.

Similarly, the piloting of the Welsh baccalaureate from September 2003 will help to build upon the excellent work already undertaken in schools and colleges on developing the whole person, and will further improve the inclusion, retention, completion and achievement of our 16 to 19-year-olds.

I am encouraged to note the attention the report afforded to the good work being undertaken by schools, through effective partnerships under our unique extending entitlement agenda, to support young people who show signs of losing interest in learning. By working with agencies such as the youth service, schools are increasingly considering innovative ways of encouraging young people to maintain their interest in learning. This is important in addressing disaffection and engendering a recognition of the importance of progression and learning throughout life.

Turning to the post-16 sector, I was pleased to see that there has been a significant increase in the percentage of further education institutions with provision assessed as grade 1, that is, good, with some outstanding features. Further education institutions have continued to drive up the percentage of provision assessed as outstanding and have all but eliminated provision that was considered to have significant shortcomings.

With regard to work-based training, many young people achieve a good range of qualifications, including national vocational

parhau'n ddisglair hefyd. Cadarnhaodd yr adroddiad fod y cynnydd cyson a wnaethpwyd dros y chwe blynedd diwethaf wedi'i gynnal, a bod disgyblion yn cyrraedd safonau da neu dda iawn mewn bron 50 y cant o ddsbarthiadau. Fodd bynnag, er bod safonau cyrhaeddiad wedi codi ym mhob ysgol dros y 10 mlynedd diwethaf, ni fu newid yn y bwlch rhwng yr ysgolion gorau a'r rhai sy'n perfformio waethaf. Disgwyliaf i adroddiad y grŵp tasg ar gulhau'r bwlch hwnnw roi arwyddion pendant o'r hyn y mae angen ei wneud i helpu ysgolion i godi'u perfformiad a chyfoethogi profiad dysgu pobl ifanc.

Yn yr un modd, bydd peilota'r fagloriaeth Gymreig o fis Medi 2003 yn gymorth i adeiladu ar y gwaith rhagorol a wneir eisoes mewn ysgolion a cholegau ar ddatblygu'r person cyfan, ac yn golygu gwelliant pellach o ran cynhwysiant, cofusrwydd, cwblhad a chyflawniad ein pobl ifanc 16 i 19 mlwydd oed.

Calonogol i mi yw nodi'r sylw a roddodd yr adroddiad i'r gwaith da a wneir gan ysgolion, drwy bartneriaethau effeithiol dan ein hagenda unigryw i ymestyn hawl, i gefnogi pobl ifanc sy'n dangos arwyddion o golli diddordeb mewn dysgu. Drwy weithio gydag asiantaethau fel y gwasanaeth ieuencid, mae ysgolion fwyfwy yn ystyried ffyrdd blaengar i annog pobl ifanc i gadw eu diddordeb mewn dysgu. Mae hyn yn bwysig o ran mynd i'r afael â dadrithiad a meithrin cydnabyddiaeth o bwysigrwydd symud ymlaen a dysgu drwy gydol oes.

A throi at y sector ôl-16, yr oeddwn yn falch o weld y bu cynnydd arwyddocaol yn y ganran o sefydliadau addysg bellach yr aseswyd eu darpariaeth yn radd 1, hynny yw, da, gyda rhai nodweddion eithriadol. Mae sefydliadau addysg bellach wedi parhau i gynyddu'r ganran o ddarpariaeth yr aseswyd ei bod yn eithriadol, ac maent fwy na heb wedi dileu unrhyw ddarpariaeth yr ystyriwyd fod diffygion arwyddocaol yn perthyn iddi.

Ynglŷn â hyfforddiant seiliedig mewn gwaith, bydd llawer o bobl ifanc yn ennill amrediad da o gymwysterau, gan gynnwys

qualifications, technical certificates, and key skills through work-based provision. The chief inspector's report confirms that much of this is of a good standard. However, there is evidence that the percentage of programmes where standards are poor is still far too high. Education and Learning Wales will have an increasing role in this context, having taken on the responsibility from April this year for funding all post-16 provision.

Overall, there is no doubt that providers are getting better at measuring their achievements and identifying areas for improvement in all sectors of education and training, with greater emphasis on key skills acquisition. The good progress made is testimony to the professionalism and dedication of all those involved in the delivery of education, and the hard work and commitment of learners across Wales.

On the amendments, I set out, in the annual remit that I provide for the chief inspector, areas of work where Estyn's advice and guidance is required to inform the review and development of our strategy for education and training for that year. It is misleading to imply, as amendment 1 suggests, that Estyn's purpose is to provide an assessment of the effectiveness of the Government's strategy for education and lifelong learning, not least because our strategy was announced in September 2001, after the end of the period covered by the report.

3:00 p.m.

In terms of the Government's overall strategy, it must be recognised that the evidence compiled by Estyn can only play a role in the assessment of progress. In particular, the inspectorate's remit does not embrace all aspects of education and training. For example, Estyn has a limited role in higher education. Therefore, although the chief inspector's report is a valuable evidence-based contribution to realising our strategy for education and lifelong learning, it is only one element. I cannot support amendment 1.

Jonathan Morgan's amendment 2 underlines the fact that the independent and impartial

cymwysterau galwedigaethol cenedlaethol, tystysgrifau technegol, a sgiliau allweddol drwy ddarpariaeth seiliedig mewn gwaith. Mae adroddiad y prif arolygydd yn cadarnhau bod llawer o hyn o safon dda. Er hynny, y mae tystiolaeth fod y ganran o raglenni lle mae'r safonau'n wael yn dal i fod yn llawer rhy uchel. Bydd gan Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru rôl gynyddol yn y cyd-destun hwn, a hwythau wedi ymgymryd â'r cyfrifoldeb o fis Ebrill eleni am ariannu pob darpariaeth ôl-16.

Yn gyffredinol, nid oes unrhyw amheuaeth nad yw darparwyr yn mynd yn well am fesur eu cyflawniadau a nodi manau lle gellir gwella ym mhob sector ym myd addysg a hyfforddiant, gyda mwy o bwyslais ar ennill sgiliau allweddol. Mae'r gwaith da a gyflawnwyd yn dysteb i broffesiynoldeb ac ymroddiad pawb sy'n ymwneud â chyflwyno addysg, a gwaith caled ac ymrwymiad dysgwyr ledled Cymru.

Ar y gwelliannau, amlinellaf, yn y cylch gwaith blynyddol a ddarparaf i'r prif arolygydd, feysydd gwaith lle mae angen cyngor ac arweiniad Estyn i hysbysu'r gwaith o adolygu a datblygu'n strategaeth ar gyfer addysg a hyfforddiant ar gyfer y flwyddyn honno. Mae'n gamarweiniol awgrymu, fel a wneir yng ngwelliant 1, mai pwrpas Estyn yw darparu asesiad o effeithiolrwydd strategaeth y Llywodraeth ar gyfer addysg a dysgu gydol oes, nid yn lleiaf oherwydd y cyhoeddwyd ein strategaeth ym Medi 2001, wedi diwedd y cyfnod sydd dan sylw yn yr adroddiad.

O ran strategaeth gyffredinol y Llywodraeth, rhaid cydnabod na all y dystiolaeth a gasglwyd gan Estyn ddim ond chwarae rôl yn y gwaith o asesu cynnydd. Yn enwedig, nid yw cylch gorchwyl yr arolygwyr yn cynnwys pob agwedd ar addysg a hyfforddiant. Er enghraifft, rôl gyfyngedig sydd gan Estyn mewn addysg uwch. Felly, er bod adroddiad y prif arolygydd yn gyfraniad gwerthfawr, seiliedig ar dystiolaeth, tuag at wireddu'n strategaeth ar gyfer addysgu a dysgu gydol oes, dim ond un elfen ydyw. Ni allaf gefnogi gwelliant 1.

Mae gwelliant 2 gan Jonathan Morgan yn tanlinellu'r ffaith fod y cyngor annibynnol a

advice provided by the inspectorate plays a key role in informing the development of our strategy. I have the utmost regard for the quality of the advice provided by Estyn. In addition, feedback from Estyn's recent consultation on the new inspection framework confirms that education and training providers across the board have a similar regard for the professionalism and commitment of the chief inspector and her staff. I will therefore be happy to support amendment 2.

The approach taken in amendment 3 is consistent with the importance assigned in 'The Learning Country' to inspection as a key instrument in promoting a culture of continuous improvement. There is evidence that many education and training providers already have a robust approach to self-evaluation and planning for improvement. In addition, I know that many providers use tools such as the European Foundation for Quality Management business excellence model and Investors in People to drive improvement programmes. Estyn has a key role in this regard. I anticipate that, with the introduction of the new inspection framework, all education and training sectors will have continuous improvement systems in place by 2004. I will therefore support amendment 3.

On amendment 4, it is not our policy to throw a spotlight on the small number of schools that require special measures—that is, in common parlance, to name and shame. Our main focus is on working with local education authorities and schools to vigorously address the areas for improvement identified, and this is proving successful. I cannot support amendment 4.

Amendment 5, as drafted, does not square with the findings in the chief inspector's report. For example, on social inclusion, the report confirms that a range of good work is being undertaken in schools to support young people who show signs of losing interest in learning. Through effective partnerships, which are taken forward under the Extending Entitlement agenda, schools are increasingly considering how to encourage young people to maintain their interest in learning.

diduedd a ddarperir gan yr arolygwyr yn chwarae rôl allweddol wrth hysbysu datblygiad ein strategaeth. Mae gennyf y parch mwyaf at ansawdd y cyngor a ddarperir gan Estyn. Yn ogystal, mae adborth o ymgynghoriad diweddar Estyn ar y fframwaith arolygu newydd yn cadarnhau bod gan ddarparwyr addysg a hyfforddiant yn gyffredinol feddwl yr un mor uchel o broffesiynoldeb ac ymrwymiad y prif arolygydd a'i staff. Byddaf yn falch o gefnogi gwelliant 2 felly.

Mae meddylfryd gwelliant 3 yn gyson â'r pwysigrwydd a roddir yn 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu' i arolygaeth fel offeryn allweddol i hyrwyddo diwylliant o wella parhaus. Mae tystiolaeth fod llawer o ddarparwyr addysg a hyfforddiant eisoes yn bwrw ati o ddifrif gyda hunan-werthuso a chynllunio ar gyfer gwella. Ar ben hynny, gwn fod llawer o ddarparwyr yn defnyddio arfau megis model rhagoriaeth busnes y Sefydliad Ewropeaidd er Rheoli Ansawdd a Buddsoddwyr mewn Pobl i yrru rhaglenni gwella ymlaen. Mae gan Estyn rôl allweddol yn hyn o beth. Rhagwelaf, gyda chyflwyno'r fframwaith arolygu newydd, y bydd gan bob sector addysg a hyfforddiant systemau gwella parhaus wedi'u sefydlu erbyn 2004. Cefnogaf welliant 3 felly.

Ar welliant 4, nid yw'n bolisi gennym daflu sbotolau ar y nifer fechan o ysgolion sydd angen mesurau arbennig—hynny yw, o'i roi mewn iaith bob dydd, i enwi a chodi cywilydd. Yr ydym yn canolbwyntio'n bennaf ar weithio gydag awdurdodau addysg lleol ac ysgolion i fynd ati o ddifrif i roi sylw i'r meysydd lle gwelwyd fod angen gwella, ac mae hyn yn profi'n llwyddiannus. Ni allaf gefnogi gwelliant 4.

Nid yw gwelliant 5, fel y'i drafftiwyd, yn gyson â'r canfyddiadau yn adroddiad y prif arolygydd. Er enghraifft, ar gynhwysiant cymdeithasol, cadarnha'r adroddiad fod amrediad o waith da'n digwydd mewn ysgolion i gefnogi pobl ifanc sy'n dangos arwyddion o gollu diddordeb mewn dysgu. Drwy bartneriaethau effeithiol, a gludir ymlaen dan agenda Ymestyn Hawliau, mae ysgolion yn ystyried fwyfwy sut i annog pobl ifanc i gynnal eu diddordeb mewn dysgu.

Sustainability is a part of learning in all schools, both in specialist subjects and in subjects such as personal and social education. Its position will be further reinforced if, as I anticipate, PSE is made a mandatory element of the basic curriculum following advice from the Qualifications, Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales.

In addition, the report confirms that providers are becoming more aware of equal opportunity issues in terms of disability, language, gender and the needs of ethnic minorities. There is willingness and determination to identify and address issues at all levels. There will always be room for improvement, and 'The Learning Country', which was published in September 200, after this report, sets out our commitment to address issues that are at the heart of the Assembly's plans for a better Wales. Therefore I cannot agree with or support amendment 5.

Our strategy is clear on all the issues included in Jocelyn's amendment 6. As set out in 'The Learning Country', we are committed to supporting all learners to acquire key skills. They are an important component in equipping people for employment and managing their learning throughout life. We continue to make a significant investment in information and communications technology in schools, with £40 million available through local authorities over the past three years and an additional £8.4 million available in this year's grants for education support and training programme. That programme has helped to raise awareness of the importance of ICT and is starting to have an impact in raising standards. We are also investing £9.9 million this year to provide every school in Wales with interactive whiteboards and multimedia equipment as part of the Assembly's broadband strategy.

On accommodation, the chief inspector's report notes that, in most instances, accommodation in schools is of good quality. However, you and I know that accommodation remains unsatisfactory in many areas. For that reason, we made the commitment that all schools should be in good physical shape by 2010. To this end, we

Mae cynaliadwyedd yn rhan o'r dysgu ym mhob ysgol, a hynny yn y pynciau arbenigol ac mewn pynciau fel addysg bersonol a chymdeithasol fel ei gilydd. Atgyfnerthir ei bwysigrwydd ymhellach os, fel y rhagwelaf, y gwneir ABCh yn elfen orfodol o'r cwricwlwm sylfaenol yn dilyn cyngor gan Awdurdod Cymwysterau, Cwricwlwm ac Asesu Cymru.

Yn ogystal, mae'r adroddiad yn cadarnhau bod darparwyr yn dod yn fwy ymwybodol o faterion cyfle cyfartal yn nhermau anabledd, iaith, rhyw ac anghenion lleiafrifoedd ethnig. Mae parodrwydd a phenderfyniad i nodi a mynd i'r afael â materion ar bob lefel. Bydd lle i wella o hyd, ac mae 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu', a gyhoeddwyd ym Medi 2001, ar ôl yr adroddiad hwn, yn amlinellu ein hymrwymiad i fynd i'r afael â materion sydd wrth galon cynlluniau'r Cynulliad am Gymru well. Felly ni allaf gefnogi na chytuno â gwelliant 5.

Mae ein strategaeth yn glir ar yr holl faterion sydd wedi'u cynnwys yng ngwelliant 6 gan Jocelyn. Fel yr amlinellwyd yn 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu', yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i gefnogi pob dysgwr i gael y sgiliau allweddol. Maent yn gydran bwysig i arfogi pobl ar gyfer cyflogaeth a rheoli eu dysgu drwy gydol oes. Parhawn i fuddsoddi'n sylweddol mewn technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu mewn ysgolion, gyda £40 miliwn ar gael drwy awdurdodau lleol dros y tair blynedd diwethaf ac £8.4 miliwn yn ychwanegol ar gael yn rhaglen grantiau cynnal addysg a hyfforddiant eleni. Mae'r rhaglen honno wedi helpu i godi ymwybyddiaeth o bwysigrwydd TGCh ac mae'n dechrau gwneud argraff ar godi safonau. Yr ydym hefyd yn buddsoddi £9.9 miliwn eleni i ddarparu byrddau gwyn rhyngweithiol ac offer aml-gyfrwng i bob ysgol yng Nghymru fel rhan o strategaeth band llydan y Cynulliad.

Ar adeiladau, noda adroddiad y prif arolygydd fod adeiladau ysgolion, yn y rhan fwyaf o achosion, o ansawdd da. Er hynny, gwyddoch chi a mi fod yr adeiladau'n parhau'n anfoddfaol mewn sawl ardal. Am y rheswm hwnnw, gwnaethom yr ymrwymiad y dylai pob ysgol fod mewn cyflwr da erbyn 2010. I'r perwyl hwn, yr ydym yn darparu

are making over £100 million available each year until 2004 to local authorities—with £107 million this year—in the expectation that expenditure of at least a similar annual rate will continue throughout the decade to improve school stock.

As underlined in ‘The Learning Country’, the Curriculum Cymreig is an important element of the education of all young people. The most recent Estyn survey confirmed that most schools—

Dafydd Wigley: Soniodd y Gweinidog am adnoddau ychwanegol a gaiff eu darparu ar gyfer adeiladau ysgolion. A yw'n derbyn bod angen rhoi sylw arbennig i gyflwr rhai ysgolion arbennig, megis Ysgol Pendalar yng Nghaernarfon, ac a fydd yn cymryd sylw neilltuol o'r pwyntiau a gaiff eu cyflwyno iddi am yr angen am adnoddau i sicrhau y caiff y rhai sydd fwyaf angen help yn ein cymdeithas eu dysgu mewn amgylchiadau priodol yn eu hysgolion?

Jane Davidson: I will, because local authorities are required to produce a conditions survey, which considers the condition of their stock and how to prioritise according to need. Therefore, I anticipate that every local authority in Wales will prioritise in using their funds, and ours, to improve the school estate.

As underlined in ‘The Learning Country’, the Curriculum Cymreig is an important element in the education of all young people. The most recent Estyn survey confirmed that most schools already support a range of extra curricular activities to support the Curriculum Cymreig and provide a distinctly Welsh school ethos. I want schools to work with local education authorities to build on this by acting on the findings and good practice set out in Estyn's study.

Our strategy is clear. Regarding links to the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee, it has already had the opportunity to discuss the findings of the Chief Inspector's annual report with her. The plan is on Estyn's website. The remit is reported to Committee and takes account of shortcomings identified in previous reports. To suggest that its

dros £100 miliwn bob blwyddyn tan 2004 i awdurdodau lleol—£107 miliwn eleni—gan ddisgwyl y bydd gwariant ar raddfa flynyddol debyg, o leiaf, yn parhau drwy gydol y degawd i wella'r stoc ysgolion.

Fel a danlinellwyd yn ‘Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu’, mae'r Cwricwlwm Cymreig yn elfen bwysig o addysg pob person ifanc. Cadarnhaodd arolwg diweddar gan Estyn fod y rhan fwyaf o ysgolion—

Dafydd Wigley: The Minister mentioned additional resources that will be provided for school buildings. Does she accept that particular attention needs to be paid to the condition of some special needs schools, such as Pendalar School in Caernarfon, and will she pay particular attention to the points made to her about the need for resources to ensure that the most vulnerable children in our communities are taught in schools that are adequate and fit for that purpose?

Jane Davidson: Gwnaf, oherwydd mae'n ofynnol i awdurdodau lleol lunio arolwg amodau, sy'n ystyried cyflwr eu stoc a sut i flaenoriaethu yn ôl yr angen. Felly, rhagwela y bydd pob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru'n pennu blaenoriaethau ar gyfer defnyddio'u harian, a'n harian ni, i wella'r ystâd ysgolion.

Fel a danlinellwyd yn ‘Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu’, mae'r Cwricwlwm Cymreig yn elfen bwysig yn addysg pob person ifanc. Cadarnhaodd arolwg diweddaraf Estyn bod y rhan fwyaf o ysgolion eisoes yn cynnal amrediad o weithgareddau allgyrsiol i ategu'r Cwricwlwm Cymreig a rhoi naws Gymreig arbennig i'r ysgol. Mae arnaf eisiau i ysgolion weithio gydag awdurdodau addysg lleol i adeiladu ar hyn drwy weithredu ar y canfyddiadau a'r arferion da a amlinellir yn arolwg Estyn.

Mae'n strategaeth yn glir. O ran cysylltiadau â'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, cafodd hwnnw'r cyfle eisoes i drafod canfyddiadau adroddiad blynyddol y Prif Arolygydd gyda hi. Mae'r cynllun ar wefan Estyn. Adroddir y cylech gwaith wrth y Pwyllgor gan gymryd i ystyriaeth y diffygion a nodwyd mewn adroddiadau blaenorol.

considerations should be limited, as suggested in Jocelyn Davies's amendment 6, would diminish the value of this and future reports. I therefore cannot support that amendment.

The analysis confirms that we have much to be proud of. However, the picture is not all rosy. As might be expected, progress is not uniform and I am committed to continuing to use the evidence base in taking our agenda forward.

Helen Mary Jones: I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 1: delete point 2 and insert new point:

recognises the importance of the evidence contained in the annual report in assessing the effectiveness of the Government of Wales's strategy for education and lifelong learning.

I propose amendment 5. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

recognises the progress made by schools across Wales, but notes with disappointment that many of the aspirations of the Government of Wales, in relation to the key themes of social inclusion, equal opportunities and sustainability, are not currently being fulfilled, according to the evidence provided in the annual report.

I propose amendment 6. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Government of Wales to present a report to the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee outlining how recurring weaknesses identified in the report will be addressed, including:

a) *key skills in information and communications technology;*

b) *the delivery of the Curriculum Cymreig in relation to science, mathematics, and design and technology;*

c) *the physical condition of special schools and units, in particular pupil referral units.*

Byddai awgrymu y dylid cyfyngu ar ei ystyriaethau, fel a wna gwelliant 6 gan Jocelyn Davies, yn lleihau gwerth yr adroddiad hwn a rhai yn y dyfodol. Ni allaf gefnogi'r gwelliant hwnnw felly.

Mae'r dadansoddiad yn cadarnhau bod gennym lawer i fod yn falch ohono. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r darlun yn dda i gyd. Fel y gellid disgwyl, nid yw'r gwelliant yn unffurf ac yr wyf wedi ymrwymo i ddefnyddio'r sylfaen dystiolaeth i symud ein hagenda ymlaen.

Helen Mary Jones: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 1: dileu pwynt 2 a rhoi'r pwynt newydd yn ei le:

yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd y dystiolaeth sydd yn yr adroddiad blynyddol o ran asesu pam mor effeithiol yw strategaeth Llywodraeth Cymru ar gyfer addysg a dysgu gydol oes.

Cynigiau welliant 5. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn cydnabod y cynnydd a wnaed gan ysgolion ledled Cymru ond yn nodi â siom nad yw llawer o ddyheadau Llywodraeth Cymru o ran themâu allweddol cynhwysiant cymdeithasol, cyfle cyfartal a chynaliadwyedd yn cael eu gwireddu ar hyn o bryd, yn ôl y dystiolaeth a geir yn yr adroddiad blynyddol.

Cynigiau welliant 6. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i gyflwyno adroddiad i'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn amlinellu sut y bwriedir mynd i'r afael â'r gwendidau cyson a nodir yn yr adroddiad, gan gynnwys:

a) *sgiliau allweddol mewn technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu;*

b) *sut y cyflwynir y Cwricwlwm Cymreig mewn perthynas â gwyddoniaeth, mathemateg, a dylunio a thechnoleg;*

c) *cyflwr adeiladau ysgolion ac unedau arbennig, yn benodol unedau cyfeirio*

disgyblion.

I will concentrate on what the Government of Wales should do with the evidence presented in the report rather than on Estyn itself. Point 2 in the Government's motion refers to the contribution made by the annual report to the realisation of the National Assembly Government's strategy for education and lifelong learning. However, it does not tell us what that contribution is. Amendment 1 seeks to correct this by clarifying that the contribution is an assessment tool. No-one is claiming that the evidence collected through Estyn reports is comprehensive or that it can possibly be used as the only tool to measure the effectiveness of National Assembly Government policy. Cynog Dafis will say later in this debate how Plaid Cymru believes Estyn's effectiveness might be improved. This report gives a useful snapshot, clearly illustrating certain aspects of performance, and what is improving and what is not. This is a useful tool at a national level to assess whether the aspirations of 'The Learning Country' are being achieved and how this evidence should be used. We tabled this amendment to seek to improve and clarify the motion. I am disappointed, although sadly not surprised in these times of anti-inclusion, that the Minister has chosen not to support it.

As the Minister has rightly said, the evidence in this report suggests that schools and other education institutions have made real and substantial progress in improving the education that they provide. However, year on year, there are issues on which little progress is made. For example, reading the report—and I must have been reading a different report to the Minister—I was struck by the lack of reference to the Assembly's key theme of sustainable development, which is almost non-existent outside the narrow sphere of environmental education. This may reflect a problem with regard to Estyn's ability to understand and measure action in relation to this key theme, it may reflect a lack of understanding and delivery in educational institutions or it may do both. However, it is of grave concern, as is social inclusion and promoting equality, which the National Assembly Government must address

Canolbwyntiaf ar yr hyn y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru ei wneud gyda'r dystiolaeth a gyflwynir yn yr adroddiad yn hytrach nag ar Estyn ei hun. Mae pwynt 2 yng nghynnig y Llywodraeth yn cyfeirio at y cyfraniad a wnaed gan yr adroddiad blynyddol tuag at gyflawni strategaeth Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer addysg a dysgu gydol oes. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n dweud wrthym beth yw'r cyfraniad hwnnw. Mae gwelliant 1 yn ceisio cywiro hyn drwy egluro mai arf asesu yw'r cyfraniad. Nid oes neb yn honni bod y dystiolaeth a gesglir drwy adroddiadau Estyn yn gynhwysfawr nac y gellir ei defnyddio fel yr unig arf i fesur effeithiolrwydd polisi Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Bydd Cynog Dafis yn dweud yn ddiweddarach yn y ddatl hon sut y cred Plaid Cymru y gellid gwella effeithiolrwydd Estyn. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn rhoi darlun sydyn, defnyddiol, gan oleuo rhai agweddau o'r perfformiad yn glir, a dangos beth sydd a beth nad ydyw'n gwella. Mae hyn yn arf defnyddiol ar lefel genedlaethol i asesu a ydym yn cyflawni dyheadau 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu' a sut y dylid defnyddio'r dystiolaeth hon. Yr ydym wedi cyflwyno'r gwelliant hwn i geisio gwella ac eglurhau'r cynnig. Yr wyf yn siomedig, er nad wedi fy synnu, ysywaeth, yn yr oes wrth-gynhwysol hon, fod y Gweinidog wedi dewis peidio â'i gefnogi.

Fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog yn gywir, awgryma'r dystiolaeth yn yr adroddiad hwn fod ysgolion a sefydliadau addysgol eraill wedi cymryd camau gwirioneddol a sylweddol ymlaen i wella'r addysg a ddarparant. Er hynny, flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn, mae materion na symudir ymlaen fawr ddim arnynt. Er enghraifft, o ddarllen yr adroddiad—ac mae'n rhaid fy mod wedi darllen adroddiad gwahanol i'r Gweinidog—fe'm trawyd gan y diffyg cyfeirio at thema allweddol y Cynulliad o ddatblygu cynaliadwy, nad yw prin yn bodoli y tu allan i fyd cyfyng addysg amgylcheddol. Efallai fod hyn yn adlewyrchu problem ynghylch gallu Estyn i ddeall a mesur gweithredu cysylltiedig â'r thema allweddol hon, efallai ei fod yn adlewyrchu diffyg dealltwriaeth a chyflwyniad mewn sefydliadau addysgol, neu efallai ei fod yn gwneud y ddau beth. Fodd bynnag, mae'n destun pryder mawr, fel y

urgently. 'The Learning Country' reminds us of the Assembly's commitment to tackling social disadvantage and promoting equal opportunities. This annual report draws attention to some good practice, as the Minister has rightly said, but it also draws attention to some serious weaknesses. For example, the extremely poor physical conditions in which some people with special needs are still taught and the ongoing problems with integrating some pupils with special needs into mainstream provision.

mae cynhwysiant cymdeithasol a hyrwyddo cydraddoldeb, y mae'n rhaid i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru roi sylw iddynt ar fyrder. Mae 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu' yn ein hatgoffa o ymrwymiad y Cynulliad i fynd i'r afael ag amddifadedd cymdeithasol a hybu cyfle cyfartal. Mae'r adroddiad blynyddol hwn yn tynnu sylw at rai arferion da, fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog yn gywir, ond mae hefyd yn tynnu sylw at rai gwendidau difrifol. Er enghraifft, yr amodau eithriadol o wael y mae rhai pobl ag anghenion arbennig yn dal i gael eu dysgu ynddynt, a'r problemau parhaus gydag integreiddio rhai disgyblion ag anghenion arbennig i ddarpariaeth y brif ffrwd.

3:10 p.m.

Dafydd Wigley: Is Helen aware of the circumstances in Ysgol Pendalar, which was designed for 40 pupils with special needs when it opened in the 1970s? It now has over 70 pupils and there is no room to move because goods are stored in the classroom, which is highly dangerous. Does this not reflect on our failure to provide adequate special needs education buildings in Wales?

Dafydd Wigley: A ydyw Helen yn ymwybodol o'r amgylchiadau yn Ysgol Pendalar, a ddyluniwyd ar gyfer 40 o ddisgyblion ag anghenion arbennig pan y'i hagarwyd yn y 1970au? Erbyn hyn mae ganddi dros 70 o ddisgyblion ac nid oes lle i symud oherwydd bod nwyddau wedi'u storio yn yr ystafell ddosbarth, sydd yn beryglus dros ben. Onid yw hyn yn enghraifft o'n methiant i ddarparu adeiladau digonol ar gyfer addysg anghenion arbennig yng Nghymru?

Helen Mary Jones: Yes, it does, and according to Estyn's report it is typical of some, though not all, of the schools that were inspected. We need action and investment to address that problem urgently.

Helen Mary Jones: Ydyw, y mae, ac yn ôl adroddiad Estyn mae'n nodweddiadol o rai, er nad pob un, o'r ysgolion a arolygwyd. Mae angen gweithredu a buddsoddi i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem honno ar fyrder.

The ongoing problems of non-attendance are highlighted. In the light of recent events that were discussed during questions to the First Minister, we are concerned about Estyn's view that:

Tynnir sylw at broblemau parhaus triwantiaeth. Yng ngolau digwyddiadau diweddar a drafodwyd yn ystod cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog, yr ydym yn pryderu ynghylch barn Estyn, sef:

'Schools with few pupils from ethnic minority groups often do not pay enough attention to racial problems.'

'Yn aml, nid yw'r ysgolion hynny â nifer fach o ddisgyblion o grwpiau ethnig lleiafrifol yn talu digon o sylw i broblemau hiliol.'

That is a serious failure to respond to the Assembly's policy that was developed in response to the Stephen Lawrence inquiry's recommendations. In response to my question earlier today, the First Minister acknowledged the seriousness of that issue,

Dyna fethiant difrifol i ymateb i bolisi'r Cynulliad a ddatblygwyd mewn ymateb i argymhellion ymchwiliad Stephen Lawrence. Wrth ateb fy nghwestiwn yn gynharach heddiw, cydnabu Prif Weinidog Cymru ddifrifoldeb y mater hwnnw, ond mae angen

but we need action to address it on a national level, which is why we tabled amendment 5. The amendment acknowledges progress, but expresses the Assembly's concern about failures to deliver on the three key themes with which the whole Assembly should be concerned. I am disappointed that the Minister appears to be refusing to acknowledge the seriousness of some of these problems, but we have to accept the Minister's right not to support the amendment if she so chooses.

Amendment 6 draws attention to issues of continuing concern to which we would have appreciated a Government of Wales response. I have already mentioned the poor physical state of special schools and units. The aspirations in 'The Learning Country' regarding information and communications technology will not be met while:

'very few schools have good plans to teach pupils to use ICT confidently and effectively.'

That needs to be tackled urgently and it requires national leadership. I am also concerned about some aspects of the Curriculum Cymreig, namely science, mathematics and design. Those need particular attention before the development of a full national curriculum of Wales, which will come about shortly. I am sorry that the Minister has chosen not to respond to these matters in Committee. As opposition Members, we will clearly take every available opportunity to return to these matters and other issues of serious concern such as the dismal and deteriorating performance in teaching Welsh as a second language at key stage 4.

There is no doubt that the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning is a class act. The Assembly Government has developed some good, proudly Welsh policies. As someone who always believes that policy should be proudly Welsh, it warms my heart when I hear the Minister use that phrase. Ultimately, however, class acts are judged on how they deliver the punch line. The punch line of policy is delivery on the ground. The Minister needs to

gweithredu i wneud rhywbeth amdano ar lefel genedlaethol, a dyna pam y cyflwynasom welliant 5. Mae'r gwelliant yn cydnabod y symudwyd ymlaen, ond yn mynegi pryder y Cynulliad ynglŷn â methiannau i gyflawni ar y tair thema allweddol y dylai'r Cynulliad cyfan fod yn ymboeni amdanynt. Yr wyf yn siomedig fod y Gweinidog fel pe bai'n gwrthod cydnabod difrifoldeb rhai o'r problemau hyn, ond rhaid inni dderbyn hawl y Gweinidog i beidio â chefnogi'r gwelliant os dewisa wneud hynny.

Mae gwelliant 6 yn tynnu sylw at faterion sy'n parhau i beri pryder ac y buasem wedi gwerthfawrogi ymateb gan Lywodraeth Cymru iddynt. Yr wyf wedi sôn eisoes am gyflwr ffisegol gwael ysgolion ac unedau arbennig. Nid atebir y dyheadau yn 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu' ynghylch technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu tra mai:

'ychydig iawn o ysgolion sydd â chynlluniau da ar gyfer addysgu disgyblion i ddefnyddio TGCh yn hyderus ac yn effeithiol.'

Mae angen mynd i'r afael â hynny ar fyrder ac mae'n galw am arweiniad cenedlaethol. Yr wyf yn bryderus hefyd ynghylch rhai agweddau ar y Cwricwlwm Cymreig, sef gwyddoniaeth, mathemateg a dylunio. Mae angen rhoi sylw arbennig i'r rheini cyn datblygu cwricwlwm cenedlaethol llawn i Gymru, a ddaw cyn bo hir. Mae'n flin gennyf fod y Gweinidog wedi dewis peidio ag ymateb i'r materion hyn yn y Pwyllgor. Fel Aelodau'r wrthblaid, byddwn yn amlwg yn cymryd pob cyfle sydd ar gael i ddychwelyd at y materion hyn a materion eraill o bryder difrifol fel y perfformiad tila a dirywiol ym maes dysgu Cymraeg fel ail iaith yng nghyfnod allweddol 4.

Nid oes amheuaeth bod y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn berfformwraig o safon. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi datblygu polisiau da, rhai Cymreig a balch. Fel un sy'n credu bob amser y dylai polisi fod yn Gymreig a balch, mae'n cynhesu fy nghalon pan glywaf y Gweinidog yn defnyddio'r ymadrodd hwnnw. Yn y pen draw, fodd bynnag, bernir perfformwyr o safon yn ôl sut y cyflwynant yr ergyd. Ergyd polisi yw ei gweithrediad ar

acknowledge that, on the evidence of this report, there are punch line problems in her act; she needs to address them. Otherwise all the best educational policies in the world on paper will be about as much use—to coin a phrase—as breastfeeding on a maternity ward.

Jonathan Morgan: I propose the following amendments. Amendment 2: add a new point:

recognises the significant contribution of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector and her staff.

I propose amendment 3. Add a new point:

acknowledges the value and relevance of school inspections in identifying priorities for improvement.

I propose amendment 4. Add a new point:

notes the achievements of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector and her staff in maintaining standards by identifying successful as well as unsuccessful schools.

I declare an interest as a school governor in Cardiff. I welcome this report, particularly Estyn's work, and the work of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector, Susan Lewis, and her staff. We need to recognise the work of inspectors and the role and value of inspection. It can be a thankless task for the inspectors and those who undertake a significant amount of work on our behalf as policy makers. We should thank them.

I am pleased that the Government will support two out of three of my amendments. That is not bad for an afternoon's work, and I am rather surprised with that success rate. The Government's view on opposition amendments may be taking a slight turn. I am grateful to Jane Davidson for saying that she will support those two amendments.

lawr gwlad. Mae angen i'r Gweinidog gydnabod, ar dystiolaeth yr adroddiad hwn, fod problemau gyda'r ergydion yn ei pherfformiad; mae angen iddi wneud rhywbeth amdanynt. Fel arall, bydd yr holl bolisiau addysgol gorau yn y byd ar bapur mor ddefnyddiol—os goddefir yr ymadrodd—â bwydo o'r fron ar ward mamolaeth.

Jonathan Morgan: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol. Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu pwynt newydd:

yn cydnabod cyfraniad sylweddol Prif Arolygydd Ei Mawrhydi a'i staff.

Cynigiau welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd:

yn cydnabod gwerth a pherthnasedd arolygiadau mewn ysgolion o ran nodi pa welliannau y dylid rhoi blaenoriaeth iddynt.

Cynigiau welliant 4. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd:

yn nodi'r hyn a gyflawnwyd gan Brif Arolygydd Ei Mawrhydi a'i staff o safbwynt cynnal safonau drwy enwi ysgolion llwyddiannus yn ogystal â rhai aflwyddiannus.

Datganaf fuddiant fel llywodraethwr ysgol yng Nghaerdydd. Croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn, yn enwedig waith Estyn, a gwaith Prif Arolygydd Ei Mawrhydi, Susan Lewis, a'i staff. Mae angen cydnabod gwaith arolygwyr a rôl a gwerth arolygu. Gall fod yn dasg ddiddiolch i'r arolygwyr a'r rhai sydd yn gwneud gwaith sylweddol ar ein rhan ni fel llunwyr polisi. Dylem ddiolch iddynt.

Yr wyf yn falch fod y Llywodraeth am gefnogi dau o'm tri gwelliant. Nid yw hynny'n ddrwg am waith prynhawn, ac yr wyf wedi fy synnu braidd gyda'r gyfradd lwyddiant honno. Efallai fod y ffordd yr edrycha'r Llywodraeth ar welliannau gan y gwrthbleidiau yn dechrau troi fymryn. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Jane Davidson am ddweud y gwnaiff hi gefnogi'r ddau welliant hynny.

It is good news that standards have risen again. As the Minister stated, standards are good or very good in the majority of schools. The number of people leaving school with no qualifications has also declined. The report contains much good news. It shows that schools are working, it underlines the value of education and the hard work that takes place in the education system in Wales and highlights the role of teachers, headteachers and governors. The report also illustrates the responsibilities and pressures that we put on individuals and the terrific results that are produced from each year. We should celebrate the role of our teachers and schools—they do a tremendous job throughout Wales.

3:20 p.m.

I will refer to several issues. The first issue is the curriculum and standards achieved in languages. Like Helen Mary Jones, I will also refer to Welsh as a second language at key stage 4, which proved to be an interesting part of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee's review of the Welsh language. The statistics for Welsh as a second language at key stage 4 for this year are more worrying than in previous years. In 1999-2000, 48 per cent of achievements at key stage 4 were satisfactory, and 13 per cent poor. That statistic had declined by the academic year 2000-01, with 47 per cent of achievements satisfactory—a 1 per cent drop—and 18 per cent poor.

We need to consider these statistics in relation to modern foreign languages, as their position is slightly worse. The report's statistics for modern foreign languages at sixth form indicate that in 1999-2000, 64 per cent of achievements were satisfactory and 24 per cent were poor. However, in the academic year 2000-01, 50 per cent of achievements were regarded as satisfactory and 43 per cent were regarded as poor. We must consider these figures in several contexts. It displays a worrying trend of decline in language learning and teaching. It underlines the importance of the Welsh language review, not only in the context of teaching the Welsh language but, perhaps,

Newyddion da yw bod safonau wedi codi eto. Fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, mae safonau'n dda neu'n dda iawn yn y rhan fwyaf o ysgolion. Mae'r nifer o bobl sy'n gadael yr ysgol heb ddim cymwysterau wedi gostwng hefyd. Mae'r adroddiad yn cynnwys llawer o newyddion da. Mae'n dangos fod ysgolion yn gweithio, mae'n tanlinellu gwerth addysg a'r gwaith caled sy'n digwydd yn y system addysg yng Nghymru ac yn pwysleisio rôl athrawon, prifathrawon a llywodraethwyr. Mae'r adroddiad hefyd yn dangos y cyfrifoldebau a'r pwysau a roddwn ni ar unigolion a'r canlyniadau gwych a gynhyrchir bob blwyddyn. Dylem ddathlu rôl ein hathrawon a'n hysgolion—gwnânt waith ardderchog ledled Cymru.

Cyfeirïaf at sawl mater. Y mater cyntaf yw'r cwricwlwm a'r safonau a gyrhaeddwyd mewn ieithoedd. Fel Helen Mary Jones, cyfeirïaf innau hefyd at y Gymraeg fel ail iaith yng nghyfnod allweddol 4, a brofodd yn rhan ddiddorol o adolygiad y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes o'r iaith Gymraeg. Mae'r ystadegau ar gyfer y Gymraeg fel ail iaith yng nghyfnod allweddol 4 am eleni yn peri mwy o bryder nag mewn blynyddoedd blaenorol. Yn 1999-2000, yr oedd 48 y cant o'r cyflawniadau yng nghyfnod allweddol 4 yn foddhaol, ac 13 y cant yn wael. Yr oedd yr ystadegyn hwnnw wedi dirywio erbyn y flwyddyn academiaidd 2000-01, gyda 47 y cant o'r cyflawniadau'n foddhaol—cwymp o 1 y cant—a 18 y cant yn wael.

Mae angen inni ystyried yr ystadegau hyn mewn perthynas â ieithoedd tramor modern, gan fod eu sefyllfa hwy ychydig yn waeth. Mae ystadegau'r adroddiad am ieithoedd tramor modern yn y chweched dosbarth yn dangos yn 1999-2000, fod 64 y cant o'r cyflawniadau'n foddhaol a 24 y cant yn wael. Fodd bynnag, yn y flwyddyn academiaidd 2000-01, barnwyd fod 50 y cant o'r cyflawniadau'n foddhaol a barnwyd bod 43 y cant yn wael. Rhaid inni ystyried y ffigurau hyn mewn sawl cyd-destun. Mae'n dangos tuedd anffodus o ddirywiad mewn dysgu ac addysgu iaith. Mae'n tanlinellu pwysigrwydd yr adolygiad o'r iaith Gymraeg, nid yn unig yng nghyd-destun dysgu'r Gymraeg ond,

languages in general. We are not assisting those who want to learn languages in schools. How languages are taught is an issue, even to those who are keen to learn languages, let alone to those who do not.

Secondly, in terms of discipline, the worrying decline in pupil behaviour in schools is a barrier to many who are considering joining the teaching profession, and is forcing staff to consider their positions. Exclusion is not the right way of ensuring good pupil behaviour; we should reconsider that approach. The report states on page 60 that we ask teachers to do too much. Teachers are there to teach but we ask them to be social workers, care workers, care minders, police officers, and judge and jury. They do much more than teach pupils in schools. We must consider teachers' role because educating children is difficult enough without the difficult work of maintaining standards and discipline.

Finally, I will consider the school's role. I welcome the fact that Estyn notes the valuable role played by parents, community groups and faith groups in building strong and healthy schools. That theme runs throughout the report, and it is welcome. There are strengths and weaknesses in this report. It also highlights potential dangers, the lack of progress on some key skills, the concern over teacher recruitment; the backward direction in which language learning is moving, and the concern about funding because some schools are facing budget deficits. The Government needs to act on that.

Mick Bates: I declare an interest as a registered teacher. As a teacher, I experienced a school inspection, which was a positive experience on the whole, in an era of co-operation and supportive advisory services. In recent years, I have observed the effects of a different inspection system, which has increased stress levels to surpass those experienced in an election. The National Union of Teachers reported in April 2002 that:

efallai, ieithoedd yn gyffredinol. Nid ydym yn helpu'r rheini sydd eisiau dysgu ieithoedd mewn ysgolion. Mae'r modd y dysgir ieithoedd yn broblem, hyd yn oed i rai sy'n eiddgar i ddysgu ieithoedd, heb sôn am y rhai llai brwd.

Yn ail, yn nhermau disgyblaeth, mae'r dirywiad yn ymddygiad disgyblion mewn ysgolion yn destun pryder ac yn rhwystr i lawer sy'n ystyried ymuno â'r proffesiwn dysgu, ac yn gorfodi staff i ystyried eu sefyllfa. Nid diarddel disgyblion yw'r ffordd iawn i sicrhau ymddygiad da gan ddisgyblion; dylem ailystyried y dull hwnnw o weithredu. Dywed yr adroddiad ar dudalen 60 ein bod yn gofyn i athrawon wneud gormod. Mae athrawon yno i ddysgu ond gofynnwn iddynt fod yn weithwyr cymdeithasol, yn weithwyr gofal, yn warchodwyr gofal, yn swyddogion heddlu, ac yn farnwr a rheithgor. Gwnânt lawer mwy na dysgu disgyblion mewn ysgolion. Rhaid inni ystyried rôl athrawon oherwydd mae addysgu plant yn ddigon anodd heb y gwaith anodd o gynnal safonau a disgyblaeth.

Yn olaf, ystyriaf rôl yr ysgol. Croesawaf y ffaith fod Estyn yn nodi'r rôl werthfawr a chwaraeir gan rieni, grwpiau cymunedol a grwpiau crefyddol wrth adeiladu ysgolion cryf ac iach. Rhed y thema honno drwy'r adroddiad cyfan, ac mae i'w chroesawu. Mae cryfderau a gwendidau yn yr adroddiad hwn. Mae hefyd yn amlygu peryglon posibl, y diffyg symud ymlaen ar rai sgiliau allweddol, y pryder ynghylch recriwtio athrawon, y symud tuag yn ôl sy'n digwydd ym maes dysgu ieithoedd, a'r pryder ynghylch arian am fod rhai ysgolion yn wynebu diffygion cyllideb. Mae angen i'r Llywodraeth weithredu ar hynny.

Mick Bates: Datganaf fuddiant fel athro cofrestredig. Fel athro, cefais i brofiad o arolwg ysgol, a oedd yn brofiad cadarnhaol ar y cyfan, mewn oes o gydweithrediad a gwasanaethau cynghori cefnogol. Mewn blynyddoedd diweddar, yr wyf wedi sylwi ar effeithiau system arolygu wahanol, sydd wedi cynyddu lefelau straen i lefel uwch na'r hyn a brofir mewn etholiad. Adroddodd Undeb Cenedlaethol yr Athrawon yn Ebrill 2002:

‘Complaints are also growing about the internal management of Estyn—autocratic leadership with little or no attempt at team-building, no effective communication and co-operation between the higher echelons of management and other staff and a disregard for the Welsh ethos’.

I am not sure if this is a true reflection of Estyn’s performance, or a perception that is highlighted by the frustration in the profession after years of underinvestment. However, it demands an improvement in communication and style. The information in the report offers a valuable contribution to our understanding of Welsh education. I am sure that we are all aware of the tremendous work undertaken in the classroom and in the community by the many volunteers who have become governors over the years since the Education Reform Act 1988.

The annual report also notes a rise in standards across all sectors, with an increase in co-operation between schools, further education institutions, training providers, and youth services. We have seen the standard and quality of training and education improve throughout 2000-01. For under fives, there was a good and improving picture. There were better standards in primary and secondary schools. In further education there was outstanding work. Standards in adult and community courses were generally good. About 60 per cent of teaching and training in all sectors was good and very good, with another 35 per cent being satisfactory. We congratulate all those who work in the classroom; the results are fully justified. The report also notes staff shortages, particularly in primary schools and for specific subjects, particularly through the medium of Welsh. Further education institutions need to keep up with the growing number of pupils who have studied through the medium of Welsh in secondary schools. Therefore, that provision needs to be addressed.

I will focus on an observation in the report that in primary schools, generally, pupils do not know enough about the diversity of society, and that many secondary schools do not do enough to promote pupils’ understanding and spiritual development. I refer to page 37, which notes that schools

Nid wyf yn siŵr a yw hyn yn adlewyrchiad cywir o berfformiad Estyn, neu’n ganfyddiad a amlygir gan y rhwystredigaeth yn y proffesiwn wedi blynyddoedd o danfuddsoddi. Fodd bynnag, mae’n mynnu gwelliant o ran cyfathrebu ac arddull. Mae’r wybodaeth yn yr adroddiad yn cynnig cyfraniad gwerthfawr at ein dealltwriaeth o addysg Gymreig. Yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod i gyd yn ymwybodol o’r gwaith aruthrol a wneir yn yr ystafell ddosbarth ac yn y gymuned gan y llu o wirfoddolwyr a aeth yn llywodraethwyr dros y blynyddoedd ers Deddf Diwygio Addysg 1988.

Mae’r adroddiad blynyddol yn nodi hefyd fod safonau wedi codi ar draws pob sector, gyda mwy o gydweithredu rhwng ysgolion, sefydliadau addysg bellach, darparwyr hyfforddiant, a gwasanaethau ieuenctid. Yr ydym wedi gweld gwella safon ac ansawdd hyfforddiant ac addysg drwy gydol 2000-01. I blant dan bump, yr oedd y darlun yn dda ac yn gwella. Cafwyd safonau gwell mewn ysgolion cynradd ac uwchradd. Mewn addysg bellach cafwyd gwaith eithriadol o dda. Yr oedd safonau mewn cyrsiau oedolion a chymunedol yn gyffredinol dda. Yr oedd tua 60 y cant o’r dysgu a’r hyfforddi ym mhob sector yn dda ac yn dda iawn, gyda 35 y cant arall yn foddhaol. Llongyfarchwn bawb sy’n gweithio yn yr ystafell ddosbarth; mae’r canlyniadau’n gwbl haeddiannol. Mae’r adroddiad hefyd yn nodi prinderau staff, yn enwedig mewn ysgolion cynradd ac ar gyfer pynciau penodol, yn enwedig drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Mae angen i sefydliadau addysg bellach sicrhau y darparant ar gyfer y nifer cynyddol o ddisgyblion sydd wedi astudio drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg mewn ysgolion uwchradd. Felly, mae angen gwneud rhywbeth am y ddarpariaeth honno.

Canolbwyntiaf ar sylw yn yr adroddiad nad yw disgyblion mewn ysgolion cynradd, yn gyffredinol, yn gwybod digon am amrywiaeth cymdeithas, ac nad yw llawer o ysgolion uwchradd yn gwneud digon i hyrwyddo dealltwriaeth a datblygiad ysbrydol disgyblion. Cyfeiriaf at dudalen 37,

need extra guidance and that in-service training must be provided on health and sex education, learning to be a good citizen, racial equality, developing pupils' spiritual awareness across the curriculum, and listening effectively to the problems and concerns of pupils.

As the traditional values of a community evolve, it is increasingly important that our schools reflect the diversity of faith and culture in our local and global community. I am pleased that the Council for Education in World Citizenship has launched 'Towards Citizenship', an on-line resource for secondary schools. I know that you are aware, Minister, of the work undertaken by the Royal Society for the Protection of Birds and Oxfam, which reflects a growing concern for developing sustainable development in the curriculum. Education on sustainable development requires pupils to do more than gain facts and figures related to aspects of the environment, economy and society. It involves studying local and global issues, and investigating what motivates people to participate in a democratic society and seek sustainable lifestyles. It is only through this mechanism that we can reduce racial tension and bring greater understanding to all our communities. I appreciate that work is being undertaken in this field to bring a greater profile to sustainability issues. I am anxious to see us answer that criticism in the report. I look forward to progress in this area, as this would help reduce pupil dissatisfaction.

Peter Rogers: On underinvestment, are you proud of the Lib/Lab coalition, which has left schools in my area unable to afford building repairs or books, and even having to put up with mice in the classrooms?

Mick Bates: I do not need to remind you that that has not happened in the last two years. It is a cumulative effect of many years of underinvestment.

Peter Rogers: Why do you not address that?

sy'n nodi bod ar ysgolion angen arweiniad ychwanegol a bod yn rhaid darparu hyfforddiant mewn swydd ar addysg iechyd a rhyw, dysgu bod yn ddinesydd da, cydraddoldeb hiliol, datblygu ymwybyddiaeth ysbrydol disgyblion ar draws y cwricwlwm, a gwranddo'n effeithiol ar broblemau a phryderon disgyblion.

Wrth i werthoedd traddodiadol cymuned esblygu, mae'n fwyfwy pwysig bod ein hysgolion yn adlewyrchu'r amrywiaeth ffydd a diwylliant yn ein cymuned leol a byd-eang. Yr wyf yn falch fod y Cyngor Addysg mewn Dinasyddiaeth Ryngwladol wedi lansio 'Tuag at Ddinasyddiaeth', adnodd ar-lein i ysgolion uwchradd. Gwn eich bod yn ymwybodol, Weinidog, o'r gwaith a wnaed gan y Gymdeithas Frenhinol er Gwarchod Adar ac Oxfam, sy'n adlewyrchu awydd cynyddol i ddatblygu gwaith ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy yn y cwricwlwm. Mae addysg ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy yn gofyn bod disgyblion yn gwneud mwy na hel ffeithiau a ffigurau cysylltiedig ag agweddau ar yr amgylchedd, economi a chymdeithas. Mae'n golygu astudio materion lleol a byd-eang, ac ymchwilio i'r hyn sy'n symbylu pobl i gyfranogi mewn cymdeithas ddemocrataidd a cheisio ffyrdd o fyw cynaliadwy. Dim ond drwy'r mecanwaith hwn y gallwn leihau tensiwn hiliol a dod â mwy o ddealltwriaeth i'n cymunedau i gyd. Sylweddolaf fod gwaith yn cael ei wneud yn y maes hwn i roi proffil uwch i faterion cynaliadwyedd. Yr wyf yn awyddus i'n gweld yn ateb y feirniadaeth honno yn yr adroddiad. Edrychaf ymlaen at gyflawni rhywbeth yn y maes hwn, gan y byddai hyn yn helpu i leihau anniddigrwydd ymhlith disgyblion.

Peter Rogers: O ran tanfuddsoddi, a ydych yn falch o'r glymblaid Lafur/Ryddfrydol, sydd wedi gadael ysgolion yn fy ardal i yn methu fforddio atgyweirio adeiladau na phrynu llyfrau, a hyd yn oed yn gorfod dioddef llygod yn yr ystafelloedd dosbarth?

Mick Bates: Nid oes angen imi eich atgoffa nad yn y ddwy flynedd ddiwethaf y digwyddodd hynny. Effaith gynyddol blynyddoedd lawer o danfuddsoddi ydyw.

Peter Rogers: Pam na wnewch chi rywbeth am hynny?

Mick Bates: There is money in the budget, and you know that.

We will not be satisfied with matters as they stand and we will always seek improvement. The annual report will help us to do that, but it is far from the damning indictment of Welsh education that Plaid Cymru seems to want it to be. It is a rational assessment of where we are today, and the conclusion is that Welsh education is far better than Plaid Cymru would have us believe. Significant improvements have been made, are being made and will be made in the future.

Gareth Jones: Mwynheuais gyfraniad Mick Bates tan y frawddeg olaf. Yn gyntaf, llongyfarchaf y proffesiwn. I ddyfynnu'r prif arolygydd, 'mae safonau addysg wedi codi eleni'. Mae'r llwyddiannau amlwg yn deyrnged i'r rheini sydd yn gweithio ym myd addysg a hyfforddiant, ac yn glod i waith disgyblion a myfyrwyr. Ategaf hynny. Fodd bynnag, o ddarllen yr adroddiad, mae rhywun yn pryderu wrth sylweddoli bod rhai gwendidau yn amlygu'u hunain yn flynyddol ac yn debygol o wneud hynny i'r dyfodol maith oni wneir ymdrech arbennig i'w gwella neu eu diddymu unwaith ac am byth.

Fe'n hatgoffir gan adroddiad y prif arolygydd am y cynnydd a wnaed tuag at gyflawni uchelgais y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol o wneud Cymru'n wlad o ddysgu gydol oes. Golyga hynny y dylai'r cynnydd fod yn seiliedig ar egwyddorion hollbwysig y Cynulliad, sef cyfle cyfartal, datblygu cynaliadwy, cynhwysiant cymdeithasol a dwyieithrwydd. Nid elfennau ychwanegol yw'r rhain, ond egwyddorion sydd yn sylfaen i bob cynllun, gweithgarwch a chyrraeddian addysgol. Dylent fod yn rhan annatod o'r system. O ddarllen y darganfyddiadau a'r casgliadau, buan y gwelwn nad yw ein sefydliadau, hyd yn hyn, wedi mynd i'r afael â mewoli'r egwyddorion pwysig hyn yn eu cyfundrefn. Rhaid cydnabod bod peth cynnydd, ond nid yw'n ddigon.

Rhoddaf ychydig o enghreifftiau o'r gwendidau amlwg hyn sydd i'w gweld mewn gwahanol adrannau yn yr adroddiad, sydd yn dangos sut y maent yn milwrio'n erbyn yr

Mick Bates: Mae arian yn y gyllideb, a gwyddoch hynny.

Ni fyddwn yn fodlon ar bethau fel y maent a byddwn yn ceisio gwella o hyd. Bydd yr adroddiad blynyddol yn ein helpu i wneud hynny, ond mae ymhell o fod y cyhuddiad damniol yn erbyn addysg Cymru y mae Plaid Cymru fel petaent yn dymuno iddo fod. Mae'n asesiad rhesymol o ble'r ydym heddiw, a'r casgliad yw bod addysg Cymru'n llawer gwell nag yr hoffai Plaid Cymru inni gredu. Mae gwelliannau arwyddocaol wedi'u gwneud, yn cael eu gwneud ac am gael eu gwneud yn y dyfodol.

Gareth Jones: I enjoyed Mick Bates's contribution until the last sentence. First, I congratulate the profession. To quote the chief inspector, 'the standards of education have risen this year'. The obvious successes are a tribute to those working in education and training and are a credit to the work of the pupils and students. I endorse that. However, I was concerned that the report identified problems that are recurring annually and are likely to do so for years to come unless a great effort is made to solve them once and for all.

In her report, the chief inspector reminds us of the progress made towards achieving the National Assembly's goal of making Wales a country of lifelong learning. That means that progress should be based on the Assembly's underlying principles, namely, equality of opportunity, sustainable development, social inclusion and bilingualism. These are not additional elements, but the founding principles of every plan, activity and educational attainment. They should be integral to the system. In reading the findings and conclusions, we find that our institutions, to date, have failed to enact these important principles within their systems. It must be acknowledged that there is some progress, but it is not enough.

I will give some examples of these obvious deficiencies that are identified in various sections of the report, which show how they militate against these underlying principles.

egwyddorion hollbwysig hyn. Mae gwahaniaeth amlwg rhwng perfformiad a chyrraedd bechgyn a merched. Mae gwahaniaeth mewn safonau a pherfformiad rhwng ysgolion a rhwng awdurdodau addysg lleol. Mae gwahaniaethau o ysgol i ysgol a choleg i goleg o ran dysgu sgiliau allweddol a dysgu'r iaith Gymraeg, ac mae diffyg adnoddau a chyfleoedd i ddysgu trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Mae gwendid amlwg o ran y gostyngiad ymhlith nifer y myfyrwyr sy'n dysgu ieithoedd tramor modern. Mae pryder nad yw rhai pobl ifanc yn credu bod profiadau ysgol yn berthnasol iddynt, a cheir allgáu cymdeithasol yn sgîl hynny. Nodir y diffygion hyn i gyd yn yr adroddiad. Mae diffyg amlwg yn y modd y mae un o bob chwech ysgol uwchradd yn darparu ar gyfer y Cwricwlwm Cymreig, ac eu dull o ymdrin â phroblemau hiliol.

Mae cyfyngiadau ar fabwysiadu a mewnloli datblygu cynaliadwy ac mae cyfleoedd anghyfartal rhwng ysgolion mewn perthynas â thechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu. Mae peth ffordd eto i fynd i wella ansawdd arweinyddiaeth a rheolaeth mewn rhai ysgolion, ac mae hyn ynghlwm â chynnydd araf yn y nifer sydd yn ennill cymhwyster arweinyddiaeth—y cymhwyster proffesiynol cenedlaethol ar gyfer prifathrawiaeth. Os na allwn gynorthwyo a pherffeithio arweinyddiaeth yn ein hysgolion, ni chyflawnwn yr amcanion a osodir. Mae beirniadu hallt ar gynlluniau strategol awdurdodau addysg. Dywedir yn ddiflwyn ar dafod nad yw rhai cynlluniau rhai awdurdodau addysg yn cyfeirio at brif agweddau agenda cynhwysiant cymdeithasol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Bydd yn amhosibl i'r negeseuon hollbwysig hyn gyrraedd ein sefydliadau oni bai fod trefn i hynny ddigwydd. Mae hynny'n fy mhoeni.

Mae'r adroddiad yn frith o enghreifftiau sydd yn fy arwain i feddwl nad yw rhai o'n sefydliadau ni ar hyn o bryd yn gweithredu ar y donfedd y byddem yn ei disgwyl. Mae'r adroddiad yn profi bod llawer mwy i'w wneud i godi ymwybyddiaeth o'r hyn y mae'r Cynulliad am ei weld o ran sicrhau cydlynedd a chyd-ddealltwriaeth o'n prif egwyddorion a'n hamcanion. Nid yw'n

There is an obvious difference between the performance and attainment levels of boys and girls. There are differences in standards of performance between schools and between local education authorities. There are differences from school to school and from college to college with regard to the teaching of key skills and the Welsh language. There is also a lack of Welsh-medium resources and opportunity to learn through the medium of Welsh. There is an obvious weakness with regard to the decline in students studying modern foreign languages. There is concern that some young people do not believe that school experiences are relevant to them, which leads to social exclusion. All of these deficiencies are noted in the report. There are obvious problems in the way that one in every six secondary schools is providing for the Curriculum Cymreig, and in the way that they deal with racial problems.

There are restrictions on adopting and internalising sustainable development and there are disparate opportunities among schools with regard to information and communication technology. There is still some way to go to improve the quality of leadership and management in schools, and this is linked to the slow increase in the number of people gaining the leadership qualification—the national professional qualification for headship. If we cannot support and perfect leadership in our schools, we will not achieve the goals that have been set. There is harsh criticism of the LEAs' strategic plans. It is stated bluntly that some of the LEA plans make no reference to the main aspects of the National Assembly's social inclusion agenda. It will be impossible for these crucial messages to reach our institutions unless there is a conduit for them. That worries me.

The report is littered with examples that lead me to believe that some of our institutions are not currently operating on the wavelength that we would expect. The report proves that there is much more to be done to raise awareness of what the Assembly wishes to see in terms of securing cohesion and mutual understanding of our main principles and aims. These problems will not

golygu ychwanegu neu newid yma ac acw, ond newid diwylliant rhai o'n sefydliadau.

be solved by a little tweaking here and there, but by a change of culture in some of our institutions.

3:30 p.m.

Mae'n ofynnol ar Lywodraeth Cymru i roi sylw buan i'r gwendid hwn. Os ydyw o ddifrif ynglŷn â newid, rhaid creu hinsawdd ffafriol i wneud hynny. Nid yw'r hinsawdd bresennol yn ffafriol i fewnoli'r egwyddorion pwysig hyn, ac mae'n golled nid yn unig i'r unigolyn, ond i ni fel cenedl. Dylid cyflwyno strategaeth amlwg yn fuan i unioni'r sefyllfa. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn derbyn bod cyd-destun ehangach yn seiliedig ar yr egwyddorion hyn. Gwelsom gynnydd, ac mae lle i longyfarch, ond, yn ôl yr adroddiad hwn, nid yw'r negeseuon hollbwysig yn cael eu clywed. Mae'n amlwg bod rhaid ystyried hyn yn fuan, neu byddwn yn parhau i weld yr un gwendidau yn flynyddol.

It is incumbent upon the Government of Wales to give urgent attention to this weakness. If it is serious about change, it must create a favourable climate in which to bring it about. The current climate is not conducive to the internalisation of these important principles, and we will lose out, not only as individuals, but as a nation. A clear strategy should be brought forward soon to rectify the situation. I hope that the Minister will accept that there is a wider context based on these principles. Progress has been made and there is cause for congratulation, but, according to this report, the crucial messages are not hitting home. It is obvious that this needs to be addressed soon, or we will continue to see the same weaknesses from one year to the next.

Christine Chapman: I declare an interest as a qualified teacher, a youth worker, careers adviser and a member of the Institute of Careers Guidance.

Christine Chapman: Datganaf fuddiant fel athrawes drwyddedig, gweithwraig ieuenctid, cynghorydd gyrfa ac aelod o'r Sefydliad Arweiniad Gyrfaol.

I welcome this report and the progress made in raising standards in education and training in Wales and in promoting social inclusion. I commend Estyn for its work.

Croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn a'r camau ymlaen a gymerwyd i godi safonau addysg a hyfforddiant yng Nghymru ac i hyrwyddo cynhwysiant cymdeithasol. Cymeradwyaf Estyn ar ei waith.

I am pleased that the role of careers education and guidance is shown to be central to discussion on promoting social inclusion and quality education and training. We should not underestimate the importance of careers companies to the development of young people, who, let us be fair, at an uncertain and vulnerable time of their lives, are confronted with a plethora of choices and distractions.

Yr wyf yn falch y nodwyd bod rôl addysg ac arweiniad gyrfaol yn ganolog i drafodaeth ar hyrwyddo cynhwysiant cymdeithasol ac addysg a hyfforddiant o ansawdd da. Ni ddylem ddibrisio pwysigrwydd cwmnïau gyrfaol i ddatblygiad pobl ifanc, sydd, a bod yn deg, ar adeg ansicr a bregus yn eu bywydau, yn gorfod wynebu peth wmbredd o ddewisiadau a gwrthdynciadau.

The careers service has a long history; it celebrated its hundredth birthday in March. The service has responded successfully to changes made by various Governments, reflecting the changing social, economic and educational developments. I am aware that, over the past 100 years, many prominent figures, such as Winston Churchill, Ernest Bevin, William Beveridge, Neil Kinnock,

Mae gan y gwasanaeth gyrfaedd hanes hir; fe ddathlodd ei ganfed pen-blwydd ym Mawrth. Mae'r gwasanaeth wedi ymateb yn llwyddiannus i newidiadau a wnaed gan wahanol Lywodraethau, gan adlewyrchu'r datblygiadau cymdeithasol, economaidd ac addysgol newidiol. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol fod llawer o enwau blaenllaw dros y 100 mlynedd diwethaf, fel Winston Churchill,

Tony Blair and the late Barbara Castle, to name but a few, have been involved in moving forward the debate on careers guidance. During the service's history, there have been differing theories of careers guidance, but the arguments have been more about how it should be provided and who should be responsible for it than about the need for and the benefits of such guidance.

We know that challenges remain. Estyn has shown the challenges in the system, and research has drawn attention to inconsistencies. However, it is good that we are highlighting inconsistencies and weaknesses, as they must be acknowledged before they can be put right. The creation of Careers Wales by the Assembly has been a huge step forward, and its work in giving a greater profile to the need for quality careers education and guidance for all ages is to be commended.

With regard to social inclusion, I am pleased that we are making headway in tackling youth disaffection. It is pleasing to see education, health and social services and the police working together holistically to combat this problem. We should not underestimate the importance of tackling the root causes of disaffection at an early age, so that problems are dealt with as they arise, not stored up for the future. If you live in a poor area like the Valleys, you are more at risk of teenage pregnancy and sustained ill-health, including mental illness, and there is a higher suicide risk. In this regard, I raise the problems of Chequers Youth Facility, which is a flagship youth project that carries out excellent work in my constituency. The project is at risk because of funding uncertainties. I have written to the Minister about this, and I ask that the Assembly does everything possible to ensure the project's future.

Alun Cairns: I will tailor my comments to special needs education and pupil referral units. I declare an interest in that my wife is an education lawyer who occasionally provides casework support in relation to

Ernest Bevin, William Beveridge, Neil Kinnock, Tony Blair a'r ddiweddar Barbara Castle, i enwi ond ychydig, wedi cyfrannu at symud y ddadl yn ei blaen ar gyfarwyddyd gyrfaol. Yn ystod hanes y gwasanaeth, bu gwahanol ddamcaniaethau ynghylch cyfarwyddyd gyrfaol, ond bu'r dadleuon yn fwy ynghylch sut y dylid ei ddarparu a phwy ddylai fod yn gyfrifol amdano nag ynghylch yr angen am y fath gyfarwyddyd a'i fanteision.

Gwyddom fod sawl her yn aros. Mae Estyn wedi dangos sawl her yn y system, ac yn sgîl ymchwil tynnwyd, sylw at anghysonderau. Fodd bynnag, mae'n dda ein bod yn amlygu anghysonderau a gwendidau, gan fod yn rhaid eu cydnabod cyn y gellir eu cywiro. Bu creu Gyrfa Cymru gan y Cynulliad yn gam enfawr ymlaen, a dylid cymeradwyo ei waith yn rhoi proffil uwch i'r angen am addysg a chyfarwyddyd gyrfaol o ansawdd da i bob oed.

O ran cynhwysiant cymdeithasol, yr wyf yn falch ein bod yn symud ymlaen i fynd i'r afael â dadrithiad ymysg ieuencid. Da yw gweld addysg, iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a'r heddlu'n cydweithio'n holltaidd i ymladd y broblem hon. Ni ddylem fychanu pwysigrwydd mynd i'r afael ag achosion gwaelodol dadrithiad yn ifanc, er mwyn delio â phroblemau wrth iddynt godi, yn hytrach na'u storio ar gyfer y dyfodol. Os ydych yn byw mewn ardal dlawd fel y Cymoedd, mae mwy o berygl ichi fynd yn feichiog yn eich ardegau a dioddef afiechyd yn barhaus, gan gynnwys salwch meddwl, ac mae risg uwch o hunanladdiad. Yn hyn o beth, soniaf am broblemau Cyfleuster Ieuencid Chequers, sef prosiect ieuencid blaengar sy'n gwneud gwaith ardderchog yn fy etholaeth. Mae'r prosiect mewn perygl oherwydd ansicrwydd ynglŷn â'i gyllid. Yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at y Gweinidog ynghylch hyn, a gofynnaf am i'r Cynulliad wneud popeth posibl i sicrhau dyfodol y prosiect.

Alun Cairns: Teilwriaf fy sylwadau i addysg anghenion arbennig ac unedau cyfeirio disgyblion. Datganaf fuddiant gan fod fy ngwraig yn gyfreithwraig addysg sydd weithiau'n darparu cefnogaeth gwaith achos

special needs cases.

I recognise the role of special needs schools and their teachers, along with the pupil referral units. The Estyn report contains many positive points: teaching standards are good, books and equipment are more than adequate to meet needs, and the management of schools is improving. I will take one negative quotation from the report. I appreciate that I cite it in isolation, which could lead to its being interpreted out of context. The report states that these schools

‘do not have a clear role in the local education authority’s provision’.

That implies that some schools are left to their own devices. I accept that that might be unfair, but I want to expand on it a little and draw some anecdotal evidence to the Minister’s attention.

Several constituency cases have come to my attention recently, highlighting that local education authorities’ broader plans are failing their special needs pupils and pupils in referral units. Evidence suggests that demand for special needs education exceeds the supply. Even if demand in certain counties does not exceed supply, some special needs pupils must travel considerable distances to receive the education that fulfils their true needs. As a result, too many parents resort to legal action to gain the special needs education that they believe their children need. Legal action costs a great deal to the local education authority. However, the potential longer-term costs to society of denying a child with special needs a proper education are even greater.

The report highlights that the likelihood of pupils with special educational needs or in pupil referral units becoming young offenders and causing longer-term social costs is far greater than for other pupils. Therefore, although local education authorities may perceive such educational

mewn perthynas ag achosion anghenion arbennig.

Cydnabyddaf rôl ysgolion anghenion arbennig a’u hathrawon, ynghyd â’r unedau cyfeirio disgyblion. Mae adroddiad Estyn yn cynnwys nifer o bwyntiau positif: mae safonau dysgu’n dda, mae llyfrau ac offer yn fwy na digonol i ddiwallu anghenion, ac mae rheolaeth ysgolion yn gwella. Codaf un dyfyniad negyddol o’r adroddiad. Sylweddolaf fy mod yn ei ddyfynnu ar ei ben ei hun, a allai arwain at ei ddehongli allan o’i gyd-destun. Noda’r adroddiad nad oes gan yr ysgolion hyn

‘swyddogaeth glir yn narpariaeth yr awdurdodau addysg lleol’.

Mae hynny’n awgrymu y caiff rhai ysgolion eu gadael i ddilyn eu trywydd eu hunain. Derbyniaf efallai fod hynny’n annheg, ond hoffwn ymhelaethu ychydig arno a thynnu sylw’r Gweinidog at ychydig o dystiolaeth anecdotaidd.

Daeth sawl achos yn yr etholaeth i’r sylw’n ddiweddar, yn amlygu’r ffaith fod cynlluniau ehangach awdurdodau addysg lleol yn methu eu disgyblion ag anghenion arbennig a disgyblion mewn unedau cyfeirio. Awgryma dystiolaeth fod y galw am addysg anghenion arbennig yn fwy na’r cyflenwad. Hyd yn oed os nad yw’r galw’n fwy na’r cyflenwad mewn rhai siroedd, mae’n rhaid i rai disgyblion ag anghenion arbennig deithio pellteroedd sylweddol i gael yr addysg sy’n bodloni eu hanghenion gwirioneddol. O ganlyniad, rhaid i ormod o rieni droi at y gyfraith i sicrhau’r addysg anghenion arbennig y credant y mae ar eu plant ei hangen. Mae achosion cyfreithiol yn costio’n ddrud i’r awdurdod addysg lleol. Fodd bynnag, mae’r costau posibl dros y tymor hwy i gymdeithas o wrthod rhoi addysg briodol i blentyn ag anghenion arbennig yn fwy fyth.

Mae’r adroddiad yn tanlinellu bod disgyblion ag anghenion addysgol arbennig neu mewn unedau cyfeirio yn llawer mwy tebygol o fynd yn droseddwr ifanc ac achosi costau cymdeithasol hirdymor nag ydyw disgyblion eraill. Felly, er y gall awdurdodau addysg lleol weld darpariaeth addysgol o’r fath fel

provision as an additional cost, the longer-term cost to society is far greater. I do not suggest that the problem is simple; what society saves in the long term will be much greater than costs saved by local authorities in the short term. However, I am sure that there is a link. If the obligations of a child's special needs education are not met, the costs—not only through the social responsibilities that I have highlighted, but also the longer-term cost of litigation—return to the local education authority. A local education authority's claim of lack of resources is no defence in law.

My second point relates to statementing. Again, I offer anecdotal evidence of where requirements of the statement have not been fulfilled, which also leaves local education authorities open to litigation later. It would be interesting to know whether the Minister has information on this, or whether she could commission research into finding out how many court cases a local education authority is fighting now in comparison to 20 or 30 years ago—or whichever period the Minister considers appropriate.

Why is a statement that has been commissioned in one local authority area not transferable to another? If a pupil moves to another local authority area, why does the statement not go with the pupil, if it is based on his or her needs? A pupil moving home generates greater costs to the new local education authority, which must go through the same statementing process, often taking up considerable time. The long and drawn-out debates and discussions surrounding statementing potentially create a greater cost to the child, because he or she does not receive the necessary special education during that time.

Cynog Dafis: Datganaf fuddiant fel athro cofrestredig. Cyfeiriodd fy nghyd-Aelodau, Gareth Jones a Helen Mary Jones, at rai o ganfyddiadau a chasgliadau Estyn. Cyfeiriai innau at y broses adolygu y mae Estyn yn gyfrifol am ei rhedeg a'i goruchwyllo, ac at briodoldeb y broses honno. Mae lle i bryderu ynghylch y broses, ac mae lle i gwestiynu yn gyntaf, a yw'n rhoi gwerth am arian i'r Cynulliad ac, yn ail, a yw'r wybodaeth y mae'r broses yn ei chasglu am yr hyn sy'n

cost ychwanegol, mae'r gost yn y tymor hwy i gymdeithas yn llawer mwy. Nid wyf yn awgrymu bod y broblem yn syml; bydd yr hyn a arbeda cymdeithas yn y tymor hir yn llawer mwy na'r costau a arbedir gan awdurdodau lleol yn y tymor byr. Er hynny, yr wyf yn siŵr bod cysylltiad. Os nad atebir gofynion addysg anghenion arbennig plentyn, daw'r costau—nid yn unig drwy'r cyfrifoldebau cymdeithasol a danlinellais, ond hefyd gost mynd i gyfraith yn y tymor hwy—yn ôl i'r awdurdod addysg lleol. Nid yw haerriad awdurdod addysg lleol o ddiffyg adnoddau yn amddiffyniad yn ôl y gyfraith.

Mae a wnelo fy ail bwynt â datganiadau ar blant. Eto, cynigiai dystiolaeth anecdotaidd o achosion lle na chyflawnwyd gofynion y datganiad, sydd hefyd yn gadael awdurdodau addysg lleol yn agored i'w herlyn yn ddiweddarach. Byddai'n ddiddorol gwybod a oes gan y Gweinidog wybodaeth ar hyn, neu a allai hi gomisiynu ymchwil i ganfod sawl achos llys y mae awdurdod addysg lleol yn ei ymladd yn awr o gymharu ag 20 neu 30 mlynedd yn ôl—neu ba bynnag gyfnod a fo'n briodol ym marn y Gweinidog.

Pam nad yw datganiad a gomisiynwyd yn ardal un awdurdod lleol ddim yn drosglwyddadwy i un arall? Os symuda disgybl i ardal awdurdod lleol arall, pam nad yw'r datganiad yn mynd gyda'r disgybl, os yw'n seiliedig ar ei anghenion? Mae disgybl sy'n symud cartref yn creu mwy o gostau i'r awdurdod addysg lleol newydd, sy'n gorfod mynd drwy'r un broses o lunio datganiad, gan gymryd cryn amser yn aml. Gall y dadleuon a'r trafodaethau hirwyntog ynglŷn â'r datganiad o bosibl greu cost fwy i'r plentyn, gan na fydd yn cael yr addysg arbennig angenrheidiol yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw.

Cynog Dafis: I declare an interest as a registered teacher. My colleagues, Gareth Jones and Helen Mary Jones, referred to some of Estyn's findings and conclusions. I will refer to the inspection process that Estyn is responsible for running and supervising, and to the suitability of that process. There is room for concern about the process, and to question first, whether it provides the Assembly with value for money and, secondly, whether the information that the

digwydd mewn ysgolion yn ddigonol ac yn gynhyrchiol.

process collects about what happens in schools is sufficient and productive.

3:40 p.m.

Pwysleisiaf nad beirniadaeth o Estyn fel y cyfryw yw hyn. Mae lle i longyfarch y prif arolygydd a'i thîm ar sut y maent wedi ymdopi â'r ystod ehangach o gyrff y mae Estyn yn gorfod eu harolygu erbyn hyn: awdurdodau addysg lleol, colegau addysg bellach, darparwyr hyfforddiant, Gyrfa Cymru, darparwyr hyfforddiant cychwynnol athrawon, ac yn y blaen. Dyna ystod eang o waith. Beirniadol ydwyf o'r broses y mae Estyn yn gorfod ei gweithredu, sef polisïau arolygu ysgolion Llywodraeth Cymru a Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Gyfunol. Cofiwch mai dyfais y Ceidwadwyr yw'r system gyfredol.

I emphasise that this is not a criticism of Estyn per se. There is room to congratulate the chief inspector and her team on how they have coped with the wider range of organisations that Estyn now has to inspect: local education authorities, colleges of further education, training providers, Careers Wales, providers of initial teacher training, and so on. That represents a wide range of work. I am critical, however, of the process that Estyn is required to implement, that is, the Government of Wales and the United Kingdom Government's school inspection policies. Remember that the current system is the brainchild of the Conservatives.

Y ffaith sylfaenol i'w chofio yw mai ychydig o ymweld ag ysgolion y mae arolygwyr Estyn yn ei wneud erbyn hyn. Mae hynny'n destun gofid ac mae gwir berygl bod arolygwyr Estyn yn tueddu colli cyswllt â'r hyn sy'n digwydd mewn ysgolion. Contractwyr annibynnol sy'n gwneud y gwaith arolygu erbyn hyn.

The basic fact to be kept in mind is that Estyn's inspectors now carry out few school visits. That is a cause for concern and there is a genuine risk that Estyn inspectors are tending to lose touch with what is happening in schools. The inspection work is now carried out by independent contractors.

Yr wyf wedi clywed pryderon mawr ynghylch trylwyredd proffesiynol gwaith rhai o'r contractwyr hyn. Clywais am enghreifftiau o dimau arolygu'n cyfarfod â'i gilydd am y tro cyntaf ar fore cyntaf yr arolygiad. Nid yw'r arolygiadau hynny yn cymryd mwy na deuddydd weithiau, ac yn y fath gyfnod cwta—deuddydd bob chwe blynedd—maent yn gorfod dod i gasgliadau ynghylch llawer o bethau, gan gynnwys 11 pwnc y Cwricwlwm cenedlaethol.

I have heard major concerns expressed about the professional thoroughness of some of these contractors' work. I have heard of examples of inspection teams meeting each other for the first time on the first morning of the inspection. Sometimes those inspections are completed in two days, and in such a short period—two days every six years—they must come to conclusions about many issues, including the 11 core curriculum subjects.

Clywais awgrym arall bod gwrthgymhelliant i dimau arolygwyr i ddod o hyd i wendidau sylfaenol. Os yw adroddiad yn awgrymu bod angen mesurau arbennig ar ysgol, mae'n rhaid anfon arolygwyr Estyn i wirio. Mae hynny'n deg ond mae'n cymryd amser, wrth gwrs, ac yn y cyfnod hwnnw, nid yw'r tîm a wnaeth yr adolygiad yn cael ei dalu. Mae'r sawl sydd wedi darllen nifer o adroddiadau arolygwyr efallai wedi sylwi ar ba mor hynod o unffurf a fformiwlaig y maent: 45 o'r gwersi addysg grefyddol yn dda, 35 yn foddhaol, ac yn y blaen. Mae'r dull o

I have heard another suggestion that there is a disincentive for inspection teams to identify fundamental weaknesses. If a report suggests that a school needs special measures, Estyn inspectors must be sent in to check. That is fair enough but, of course, it takes time and during that period the team that carried out the inspection is not paid. Those who have read a number of inspection reports will perhaps have noticed how remarkably uniform and formulaic they are: 45 religious education lessons are of a high standard, 35 are satisfactory, and so on. The narrative style

ddisgrifio yn fformiwlâig.

Pwysleisiaf nad wyf yn amau cywirdeb nac, ar un ystyr, ddefnyddioldeb y wybodaeth a geir gan Estyn. Dadlau'r wyf ei bod yn ail-law, yn tueddu i fod yn arwynebol ac yn colli llawer o'r hyn sy'n digwydd mewn gwirionedd mewn ysgolion.

Mae'r gost am hyn i gyd yn sylweddol. Mae cyllideb eleni yn rhoi £4.6 miliwn ar gyfer y rhaglen arolygiadau ar ben £4.7 miliwn am gyflogau staff Estyn, sy'n cynnwys yr arolygwyr eu hunain. Mae cost hefyd o ran amser a phryder i athrawon wrth iddynt fynd drwy'r broses fiwrocraidaidd am fisoedd lawer o baratoi ar gyfer arolygiad. Mae'n anodd rhoi pris ar hynny, ond mae'n rhaid ei fod yn gost sylweddol.

Mae Plaid Cymru yn credu bod angen ailystyried y system arolygu yn sylfaenol. Byddwn yn cyhoeddi ein hargymhellion cyn hir. Am y tro, awgrymaf rai egwyddorion. Yn gyntaf, dylai arolygwyr Estyn eu hunain dreulio llawer mwy o amser yn y dosbarth—nid yn yr ysgol yn unig—yn samplu, yn casglu gwybodaeth law-gyntaf, ac yn deall yr hyn sy'n digwydd mewn gwirionedd. Yn ail, mae angen llawer mwy o bwyslais yn ein system i gyd ar wasanaethu a chynghori athrawon, ac mae eisiau trosglwyddo adnoddau i'r perwyl hwnnw. Mae'n glir bod y gwasanaeth ymgynghori yn ddifrifol wan mewn nifer o awdurdodau addysg ac wedi gwaethygu ers aildrefnu llywodraeth leol. Hefyd, mae gan yr awdurdodau lleol gyfrifoldeb am fonitro'r hyn sy'n digwydd mewn ysgolion, a dylid mynnu bod timau ar waith i wneud hynny'n iawn. Mae pryder ynghylch gallu'r awdurdodau lleol i wneud y gwaith hwnnw. Gallai arolygwyr Estyn chwarae rhan bwysig wrth gefnogi'r broses honno.

Mae angen canolbwyntio ymdrech ac adnoddau ar yr ysgolion sydd â phroblemau a gadael llonydd i'r rhai sy'n llwyddo i frwr ymlaen â'u gwaith, yn lle ymweld â phob ysgol bob chwe blynedd ar rota hollol fecanistig. O wneud hyn yn iawn, gellid trosglwyddo'r dull presennol o dendro

is formulaic.

I reiterate that I do not doubt the accuracy or, in one sense, the usefulness of the information that Estyn provides. I am, however, arguing that it is second-hand, tends to be superficial and it does not pick up on a great deal of what actually happens in schools.

This is an expensive process. This year's budget provides £4.6 million for the inspection programme on top of £4.7 million for the salaries of Estyn's staff, which includes the inspectors themselves. There is also a human cost. Teachers face anxiety and are forced to sacrifice a great deal of time in preparing for the bureaucratic process of inspection over many months. It is difficult to put a price on that, but it must be a substantial cost.

Plaid Cymru believes that the inspection system needs to be fundamentally reappraised. We will publish our recommendations shortly. In the meantime, I will suggest some principles. First, Estyn inspectors themselves should spend much more time in the classroom—not just in the schools—sampling, collecting first-hand information, and understanding what actually goes on. Secondly, a much greater emphasis is needed in our system as a whole on providing teachers with service and advice, and resources need to be transferred to that end. It is clear that the advisory service is extremely weak in a number of education authorities and that they have become worse since local government reorganisation. Also, local authorities have responsibility for monitoring what happens in schools, and we should insist that teams are in place to do that work properly. There is a concern surrounding the local authorities' ability to carry out that work. Estyn inspectors could have an important role in supporting that process.

Effort and resources need to be concentrated on those schools that have problems, and those who are succeeding in taking their work forward need to be left in peace, instead of every school being visited on an entirely mechanistic six-yearly rota. If this were done properly, the present system of competitive

cystadleuol gan gontractwyr preifat i fin sbwriel hanes. Byddai'n arbed adnoddau ac yn creu system fwy cadarnhaol a chynhyrchiol i ysgolion.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You need to wind up now, Cynog.

Cynog Dafis: Byddai'n fuddiol i bawb.

Eleanor Burnham: I declare an interest as a peripatetic social inclusion adviser on the compact plus scheme run by the training and enterprise councils throughout north-east Wales. In that role, I was involved with Ysgol Maes Garmon during an Estyn inspection. I was impressed by the inspectors' positive recognition of the teachers' hard work and dedication at that school, and their constructive approach. In my advisory role, I was told that curriculum rigidity had been a cause of social inclusion. I am particularly concerned about social inclusion because there are so many aspects of a school's curriculum that can still be improved. We must not rest on our laurels. Many constituents come to me, complaining that not enough is being invested in education, despite the great strides of the last 18 months, which have made a significant impact, as the Estyn report highlights. However, having inherited a system in decline, with chronic underinvestment, we must make a great effort to heed Estyn's recommendations and do the best for the education of our children.

Pauline Jarman: I declare an interest as a member of Rhondda Cynon Taff local education authority. I will concentrate on the social inclusion points in the report. The report gives us an opportunity to assess to what extent the Assembly administration is succeeding in embedding its cross-cutting themes in the education service. One of those themes relates to tackling social disadvantage, particularly in the most deprived areas. While recognising that this is a considerable task, and not quickly attainable, the report nonetheless contains evidence and suggestions that much more remains to be done. The report states that youth centres are in a poor state, indicating that lack of provision of such facilities further conspires against those who are already

tendering by private contractors could be consigned to the dustbin of history. It would save resources and create a more positive and productive system for schools.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae angen ichi ddirwyn i ben yn awr, Cynog.

Cynog Dafis: Everyone would benefit.

Eleanor Burnham: Datganaf fuddiant fel ymgynghorydd bro ar gynhwysiant cymdeithasol ar y cynllun compact a mwy a redir gan y cynghorau hyfforddi a menter ar draws y gogledd-ddwyrain. Yn y rôl honno bûm yn ymwneud ag Ysgol Maes Garmon yn ystod arolwg gan Estyn. Cefais argraff dda o gydnabyddiaeth gadarnhaol yr arolygwyr o waith caled ac ymroddiad yr athrawon yn yr ysgol honno, a'r ffordd adeiladol yr aethant ati. Yn fy rôl gynghori dywedwyd wrthyf fod anhyblygrwydd y cwricwlwm wedi arwain at gynhwysiant cymdeithasol. Mae cynhwysiant cymdeithasol o bwys arbennig i mi oherwydd mae cymaint o agweddau ar gwricwlwm ysgol y gellir eu gwella o hyd. Rhaid inni beidio â gorffwys ar ein rhwyfau. Daw llawer o etholwyr ataf i gwyno na fuddsoddir digon mewn addysg, er gwaethaf camau breision y 18 mis diwethaf, a gafodd effaith arwyddocaol, fel y pwysleisia adroddiad Estyn. Er hynny, wedi etifeddu system a oedd ar i lawr, â thanfuddsoddi'n rhemp, rhaid inni wneud ymdrech fawr i roi sylw i argymhellion Estyn a gwneud y gorau er mwyn addysg ein plant.

Pauline Jarman: Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o awdurdod addysg lleol Rhondda Cynon Taf. Canolbwyntiaf ar y pwyntiau yn yr adroddiad sy'n ymwneud â chynhwysiant cymdeithasol. Rhydd yr adroddiad gyfle inni asesu i ba raddau y mae gweinyddiaeth y Cynulliad yn llwyddo i fewnoli ei themâu trawsbynciol yn y gwasanaeth addysg. Un o'r themâu hynny yw mynd i'r afael ag amddifadedd cymdeithasol—yn yr ardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig yn arbennig. Gan gydnabod fod hon yn dasg sylweddol, ac nid yn un y gellir ei chyflawni'n hawdd, mae'r adroddiad serch hynny'n cynnwys tystiolaeth ac awgrymiadau fod llawer mwy i'w wneud o hyd. Dywed yr adroddiad fod canolfannau ieuenctid mewn cyflwr gwael, gan nodi bod diffyg darpariaeth cyfleusterau o'r fath yn

socially disadvantaged.

On special educational needs provision, the report states that pupils in SEN units often do not have the opportunity to participate in the overall work and life of the school. This is crucial, and the administration must make a positive difference in this, if its commitment to tackle social disadvantage is to be realised.

Truancy levels are higher in Wales than elsewhere in the UK, as highlighted recently in the press. It is not a coincidence therefore that economic inactivity among young people in Wales has rocketed during the past 12 months. There was an increase of 114 per cent in economically inactive men aged 18 to 24 during the past 12 months and a 52 per cent increase in economically inactive women of the same age. I hope the Minister will take note of these remarks and inform us what she intends to do to address these serious social inclusion issues.

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): Estyn provides independent and sound advice that supports the development of our agenda. As Cynog said, Estyn provides dependable and productive evidence, and everything in today's debate shows that the evidence is dependable and productive. It is dependable because it is delivered independently of the Assembly Government and is not politically led. It is productive because it then leads to the remit letter that I, as Minister, send to Estyn the following year, to Estyn's own plan, and to its contribution to the Committee.

If the Assembly Government had not addressed Helen Mary's points since the report's publication, covering 2000-01, then I would hold up my hand. However, every shortcoming that the report identified has been acknowledged, either by seeking further evidence or by inclusion in, 'The Learning Country', our strategy for education and lifelong learning until 2010. It is all there, because we rely on that evidence base.

cynllwynio ymhellach yn erbyn rhai sydd eisoes dan anfantais gymdeithasol.

Ar ddarpariaeth anghenion addysgol arbennig, dywed yr adroddiad fod unedau AAA yn aml heb gael cyfle i gyfranogi yng ngwaith a bywyd cyffredinol yr ysgol. Mae hyn yn allweddol, a rhaid i'r weinyddiaeth wneud gwahaniaeth positif yn hyn, os am wireddu'i hymrwymiad i fynd i'r afael ag anfantais gymdeithasol.

Mae lefelau triwantiaeth yn uwch yng Nghymru nag yng ngweddill y DU, fel a amlygwyd yn ddiweddar yn y wasg. Nid cyddigwyddiad felly yw bod segurdd economaidd ymhlith pobl ifanc yng Nghymru wedi saethu i fyny yn ystod y 12 mis diwethaf. Bu cynnydd o 114 y cant mewn dynion economaidd segur 18 i 24 oed yn y 12 mis diwethaf a chynnydd o 52 y cant mewn menywod economaidd segur yr un oed. Gobeithiaf y gwnaiff y Gweinidog nodi'r sylwadau hyn a rhoi gwybod inni beth y bwriada ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â'r materion difrifol hyn o ran cynhwysiant cymdeithasol.

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Mae Estyn yn darparu cyngor annibynnol a chadarn sy'n ategu datblygiad ein hagenda. Fel y dywedodd Cynog, mae Estyn yn darparu tystiolaeth ddibynadwy a chynhyrchiol, a dengys popeth yn ein dadl heddiw fod y dystiolaeth yn ddibynadwy ac yn gynhyrchiol. Mae'n ddibynadwy oherwydd y'i rhoddir yn annibynnol ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a heb ogwydd gwleidyddol. Mae'n gynhyrchiol am ei fod yn arwain at y llythyr cylch gwaith a anfonaf fi, fel Gweinidog, at Estyn y flwyddyn ddilynol, ac yn arwain at gynllun Estyn ei hun ac at ei gyfraniad i'r Pwyllgor.

Pe na bai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ateb pwyntiau Helen Mary ers cyhoeddi'r adroddiad, sy'n ymdrin â 2000-01, yna byddwn yn dal fy nwylo i fyny. Fodd bynnag, mae pob diffyg a amlygodd yr adroddiad wedi'i gydnabod, un ai drwy geisio tystiolaeth bellach neu drwy ei gynnwys yn ein strategaeth, 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu' ar gyfer addysg a dysgu gydol oes tan 2010. Mae i gyd yno, oherwydd yr ydym yn dibynnu ar y sylfaen dystiolaeth honno.

3:50 p.m.

Lorraine Barrett: Are you confident that the initiatives and the funding that you have put in place over the last year or so, such as Extending Entitlement and information and communication technology centres will make a difference, particularly with regard to youth workers? The paragraph on youth work in the report shows that there are some inadequacies. I am convinced, as are you, I am sure, that the extra resources that you have provided will make a difference by the next time a report on this subject is published.

Jane Davidson: I will comment on Pauline Jarman's point on youth centres. They are mentioned in the report because we asked Estyn to consider them before we introduced Extending Entitlement. It was important for us to get the right kind of evidence base in terms of facilities on the ground. That provides us with audit information, which then informs you when you put on your local authority hat and decide how you will take that forward inside local government.

Owen John Thomas: Nid oes fawr o sôn yn yr adroddiad nac yn eich araith am fiwrocratiaeth. Pe siaradech ag athrawon—fel rhywun sydd wedi dysgu am 30 mlynedd ac yn briod ag athrawes, yr wyf yn siarad â llawer ohonynt—eu cwyn cyffredinol yw bod gormod o fiwrocratiaeth, ei bod yn cynyddu a bod hynny yn amharu ar amser yr athrawon i baratoi gwaith, i weithio yn y rheng flaen ac i farcio'r gwaith gyda'r nos. Beth ydych yn ei wneud i asesu faint o amser sy'n cael ei dreulio ar fiwrocratiaeth a'r materion sy'n amharu ar y broses? A ydych yn fodlon torri i lawr ar fiwrocratiaeth gan mai dyma gwyn mwyaf athrawon heddiw? Mae'n amharu ar addysg heb os nac onibai.

Jane Davidson: You may have been absent when I introduced our report on bureaucratic burdens last year, which outlined the steps that the Assembly Government will take on this issue. The report by the schoolteachers' review body on teachers' workload was published recently and consultation on how to take the recommendations forward will

Lorraine Barrett: A ydych yn hyderus y bydd y mentrau a'r cyllid a sefydlwyd gennych yn y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, fel Ymestyn Hawliau a chanolfannau technoleg gwytodaeth a chyfathrebu, yn gwneud gwahaniaeth, yn enwedig o safbwynt gweithwyr ieuenctid? Mae'r paragraff ar waith ieuenctid yn yr adroddiad yn dangos bod ambell agwedd annigonol. Yr wyf yn argyhoeddedig, fel chithau, yr wyf yn siŵr, y bydd yr adnoddau ychwanegol yr ydych wedi'u darparu yn gwneud gwahaniaeth erbyn y tro nesaf y cyhoeddir adroddiad ar y pwnc hwn.

Jane Davidson: Gwnaf sylw ar bwnt Pauline Jarman ar ganolfannau ieuenctid. Sonnir amdanynt yn yr adroddiad oherwydd inni ofyn i Estyn eu hystyried cyn inni gyflwyno Ymestyn Hawliau. Yr oedd yn bwysig inni gael y math iawn o sylfaen dystiolaeth yn nhermau cyfleusterau ar y llawr. Mae hynny'n rhoi gwybodaeth archwilio inni, sydd wedyn yn eich hysbysu pan wisgwch eich het awdurdod lleol a phenderfynnu sut yr ewch â hynny yn ei flaen o fewn llywodraeth leol.

Owen John Thomas: Bureaucracy is barely mentioned in the report or your speech. If you talk to teachers—as someone who taught for 30 years and is married to a teacher, I have spoken to many—their general complaint is that there is too much bureaucracy, that it is increasing and that limits the time teachers have to prepare work, to work at the chalk face and to mark the work in the evening. What are you doing to assess how much time is spent on bureaucracy and issues that interfere with the process? Are you willing to cut down on bureaucracy, as this is the main complaint of teachers today? It undoubtedly disrupts education.

Jane Davidson: Efallai nad oeddech yma pan gyflwynais ein hadroddiad ar feichiau biwrocrataidd y llynedd, a ddangosodd y camau y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn eu cymryd ar y mater hwn. Cyhoeddwyd adroddiad y corff adolygu athrawon ysgol ar faich gwaith athrawon yn ddiweddar, ac ymgynghorir ynghylch sut i weithredu ar yr

take place in July and in the autumn. We have also provided an additional £1,000 to every school in Wales to consider administrative burdens. We have set up a gate-keeping group and we are committed to decreasing bureaucracy in Wales. It is important that we operate according to the evidence base.

Owen John Thomas: Ble mae'r dystiolaeth yn yr adroddiad?

Jane Davidson: That report covers 2000-01. We announced our report on bureaucratic burdens in August 2001.

I made a statement on ICT to the Assembly only a fortnight ago. Evidence coming forward to the Committee indicates that learning Welsh as a second language at key stage 4 is extremely unpopular with young people. However, the Estyn report does not note any unsatisfactory classes. Three per cent are very good and 64 per cent are good. I am glad that Jonathan focused on celebrating the role of teachers and schools and that he highlighted the issue of languages, which we addressed in our strategy, Languages Count.

Mick Bates and Cynog spoke about setting up a better inspection framework. Estyn consulted on this issue in 2001. It is taking forward the proposals to consider a new inspection framework for 2004. Perhaps when Plaid Cymru considers its own proposals, it might consider the positive response given to how Estyn is taking forward the differential approach of inspections in relation to the quality of provision, which I am glad that Plaid Cymru now supports.

I was interested to hear Mick say that Welsh education is better than Plaid Cymru, or Helen Mary Jones, would have us believe. I agree. Even according to the words of the independent chief inspector, standards in Welsh education and training have risen. I used her words in my opening speech. Throughout the system, in primary and secondary schools, the number of young people leaving school without any qualifications has declined. There has been a

argymhellion ym mis Gorffennaf ac yn yr hydref. Yr ydym hefyd wedi darparu £1,000 ychwanegol i bob ysgol yng Nghymru i ystyried beichiau gweinyddol. Yr ydym wedi sefydlu grŵp porthora ac yr ydym wedi ymrwmo i leihau biwrocraatiaeth yng Nghymru. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn gweithredu'n unol â'r sylfaen dystiolaeth.

Owen John Thomas: Where is the evidence in the report?

Jane Davidson: Mae'r adroddiad hwnnw'n ymdrin â 2000-01. Cyhoeddasom ein hadroddiad ar feichiau biwrocraidaidd yn Awst 2001.

Gwneuthum ddatganiad ar TGCh i'r Cynulliad gwta bythefnos yn ôl. Mae dystiolaeth sy'n dod ymlaen i'r Pwyllgor yn dangos fod dysgu Cymraeg fel ail iaith yng nghyfnod allweddol 4 yn eithriadol o amhoblogaidd ymysg pobl ifanc. Er hynny, nid yw adroddiad Estyn yn nodi unrhyw ddsbarthiadau anfoddhaol. Mae 3 y cant yn dda iawn a 64 y cant yn dda. Yr wyf yn falch fod Jonathan wedi canolbwyntio ar ddatlu rôl athrawon ac ysgolion a'i fod wedi tynnu sylw at fater ieithoedd, a gafodd sylw yn ein strategaeth, Mae Ieithoedd yn Cyfrif.

Siaradodd Mick Bates a Cynog am sefydlu gwell fframwaith arolygu. Ymgynghorodd Estyn ar y mater hwn yn 2001. Mae'n bwrw ymlaen â'r cynigion i ystyried fframwaith arolygu newydd ar gyfer 2004. Efallai pan ystyria Plaid Cymru ei chynigion ei hun, y gallai ystyried yr ymateb cadarnhaol a roddwyd i sut y mae Estyn yn mynd ymlaen â'r ffordd wahaniaethol o wneud arolygon mewn perthynas ag ansawdd y ddarpariaeth, rhywbeth yr wyf yn falch bod Plaid Cymru bellach yn ei gefnogi.

Diddorol oedd clywed Mick yn dweud bod addysg Cymru'n well nag yr hoffai Plaid Cymru, neu Helen Mary Jones, inni gredu. Cytunaf. Hyd yn oed yn ôl geiriau'r prif arolygydd annibynnol, mae safonau mewn addysg a hyfforddiant yng Nghymru wedi codi. Defnyddiais ei geiriau yn fy araith agoriadol. Drwy'r system gyfan, mewn ysgolion cynradd ac uwchradd, mae'r nifer o bobl ifanc sy'n gadael yr ysgol heb ddim cymwysterau wedi lleihau. Bu cynnydd

large percentage increase in the numbers in further education. Youth work projects are achieving a great deal and standards in adult and community courses are generally good. Many trainees contribute effectively on work-based training schemes. The major successes are a tribute to all who work in education and training, whether as managers or teachers in a supporting role and they are a great credit to the work of the learners themselves. Those are the words of the chief inspector, which I strongly endorse.

I agree with Gareth Jones on the broad agenda on some of the Assembly's key pillar statements because this report only covers the second year of the Assembly's work. Therefore, schools and all education providers were still coming to terms with our sustainable development and equal opportunities agendas. I hope that you have seen that move forward.

Finally, on special needs, the new code of practice and the whole agenda of 'The Learning Country' identify the concerns that you have raised. We are keen for the statementing process to operate effectively so that every child in Wales has access to excellent education. I will continue to rely on Estyn and others to give us the correct advice on taking this forward.

Helen Mary Jones: Point of order. I seek your guidance, Deputy Presiding Officer, on declarations of interest. Like others who have contributed to this debate, I am a qualified teacher, but I have not earned money as such since 1997. Do you advise us to make those declarations, or do you consider them to be cumbersome, as do I? I note that other colleagues declared an interest and I would not want to vote on this matter without making a similar declaration, if it is appropriate.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: It is wise for you to declare it, but it is a matter for you. Do other Members wish to declare an interest?

Lorraine Barrett, Mick Bates, Alun Cairns, Christine Chapman, Geraint Davies, Jane Davidson, Michael German, Christine Gwyther, Gareth Jones, Helen

canrannol mawr yn y niferoedd mewn addysg bellach. Mae prosiectau gwaith ieuenctid yn cyflawni llawer iawn ac mae safonau mewn cyrsiau oedolion a chymunedol yn gyffredinol dda. Bydd llawer o hyfforddeion yn cyfrannu'n effeithiol ar gynlluniau hyfforddi mewn gwaith. Mae'r llwyddiannau mawr yn deyrnged i bawb sy'n gweithio ym maes addysg a hyfforddiant, boed fel rheolwyr neu athrawon mewn rôl gefnogol, ag maent yn gredyd mawr i waith y dysgwyr eu hunain. Dyna eiriau'r prif arolygydd, ac fe'u hategaf yn gryf.

Cytunaf â Gareth Jones ar yr agenda gyffredinol ar rai o ddatganiadau'r Cynulliad ar egwyddorion allweddol oherwydd nid yw'r adroddiad hwn ond yn ymdrin ag ail flwyddyn y Cynulliad wrth ei waith. Felly, yr oedd ysgolion a darparwyr addysg yn dal i ddod i delerau â'n hagenda'u ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy a chyfle cyfartal. Gobeithiaf eich bod wedi gweld hynny'n symud ymlaen.

Yn olaf, ar anghenion arbennig, mae'r cod ymarfer newydd a holl agenda'r 'Wlad sy'n Dysgu' yn nodi'r pryderon a godwyd gennych. Yr ydym yn awyddus i'r broses ddatganiadau weithio'n effeithiol fel bod cyfle i bob plentyn yng Nghymru gael addysg ragorol. Daliaf i ddibynnu ar Estyn ac eraill i roi'r cyngor cywir inni ynghylch symud hyn ymlaen.

Helen Mary Jones: Pwynt o drefn. Ceisiaf eich arweiniad, Ddirprwy Lywydd, ar ddatganiadau buddiant. Fel eraill a gyfrannodd at y ddatl hon, yr wyf yn athrawes drwyddedig, ond nid wyf wedi ennill arian fel y cyfryw er 1977. A ydych yn ein cynghori i wneud y datganiadau hynny, ynteu a ystyriwch, fel fi, eu bod yn drwsgl? Nodaf fod aelodau eraill wedi datgan buddiant ac ni fyddwn eisiau pleidleisio ar y mater hwn heb wneud datganiad tebyg, os ydyw'n briodol.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae'n ddoeth ichi ei ddatgan, ond mater i chi ydyw. A oes ar Aelodau eraill eisiau datgan buddiant?

Lorraine Barrett, Mick Bates, Alun Cairns, Christine Chapman, Geraint Davies, Jane Davidson, Michael German, Christine Gwyther, Gareth Jones, Helen

Mary Jones, Jenny Randerson, Janet Ryder, Rhodri Glyn Thomas and Owen John Thomas *rose—*

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Further to that point of order, my situation is different. My wife is an educational advisor with Pembrokeshire County Council, therefore I presume that I should declare an interest on her behalf.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That will be recorded.

Alun Pugh: Further to that point of order, I declare an interest, as I have a postgraduate qualification in further education.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That is not a declaration of interest.

Gareth Jones: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, ychwanegaf fy mod yn aelod o Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy yn ogystal â bod yn athro cofrestredig.

Janet Ryder: Further to that point of order, my husband is also a registered teacher.

Helen Mary Jones: Further to that point of order, I am happy to say that there are numerous teachers in my family. I ask you, Deputy Presiding Officer and the Presiding Officer, to reconsider this issue of declarations because it will be impossible for us to debate education if we all have to declare interests, however tenuous, every time we do so?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That is self-evident, but it is a matter for the Committee on Standards of Conduct. I will ask the Committee to consider this; I do not want anymore time wasting.

David Davies: Point of order. This is all getting a bit ridiculous and out of hand. I have taught PR to 10-year-olds. Do I have to declare an interest every time I talk about education?

Michael German: Proportional representation?

Mary Jones, Jenny Randerson, Janet Ryder, Rhodri Glyn Thomas ac Owen John Thomas *a gododd—*

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, mae fy sefyllfa i'n wahanol. Mae fy ngwraig yn ymgynghorydd addysg gyda Chyngor Sir Penfro, felly tybiaf y dylwn ddatgan buddiant ar ei rhan hi.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Caiff hynny ei gofnodi.

Alun Pugh: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, datganaf innau fuddiant, gan fod gennyf gymhwyster ôl-radd mewn addysg bellach

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Nid datganiad buddiant yw hynny.

Gareth Jones: Further to that point of order, I add that I am a member of Conwy County Borough Council and a registered teacher.

Janet Ryder: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, mae fy ngŵr innau'n athro cofrestredig.

Helen Mary Jones: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, mae'n dda gennyf ddweud bod nifer o athrawon yn fy nheulu. Gofynnaf i chi, Ddirprwy Lywydd a'r Llywydd, ailystyried y mater hwn o ddatganiadau oherwydd bydd yn amhosibl inni drafod addysg os oes raid inni i gyd ddatgan buddiannau, ni waeth pa mor ansylweddol, bob tro y gwnawn hynny.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae hynny'n hunan-amlwg, ond mater i'r Pwyllgor ar Safonau Ymddygiad ydyw. Gofynnaf i'r Pwyllgor ystyried hyn; nid oes arnaf eisiau gwastraffu dim rhagor o amser.

David Davies: Pwynt o drefn. Mae hyn i gyd yn mynd braidd yn wirion ac allan o reolaeth. Yr wyf fi wedi dysgu PR i blant dengmlwydd oed. Oes raid imi ddatgan buddiant bob tro y siaradaf am addysg?

Michael German: Cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol?

David Davies: Yes, not public relations—I leave that to the Liberal Democrats.

David Davies: Ie, nid cysylltiadau cyhoeddus—gadawaf hynny i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: These are matters for the judgment of individual Members. If Members wish to stand up, I will hear any point of order on declarations of interests. Are there any others?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Materion er doethineb Aelodau unigol yw'r rhain. Os dymuna Aelodau sefyll ar eu traed, gwrandawaf ar unrhyw bwynt o drefn ar ddatganiadau buddiannau. A oes ychwaneg?

Owen John Thomas: I declare an interest as a registered teacher. My wife, two sisters and my brother-in-law are also teachers.

Owen John Thomas: Datganaf fuddiant fel athro cofrestredig. Mae fy ngwraig, dwy chwaer a'm brawd-yng-nghyfraith yn athrawon hefyd.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That will be recorded. I will ask the Committee on Standards of Conduct to revisit this matter.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Cofnodir hynny. Gofynnaf i'r Pwyllgor ar Safonau Ymddygiad edrych eto ar y mater hwn.

Gwelliant 1: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.

Amendment 1: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 29.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

Gwelliant 2: O blaid 37, Ymatal 14, Yn erbyn 0.

Amendment 2: For 37, Abstain 14, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Rogers, Peter
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 35, Ymatal 2, Yn erbyn 15.
Amendment 3: For 35, Abstain 2, Against 15.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:

The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Ron
 Essex, Sue
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Halford, Alison
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Rogers, Peter
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
 The following Members abstained:

Davies, Jocelyn
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 7, Ymatal 15, Yn erbyn 29.
 Amendment 4: For 7, Abstain 15, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
 Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Graham, William
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Rogers, Peter

The following Members voted against:

Dafis, Cynog
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Geraint
 Davies, Janet
 Evans, Delyth
 Hancock, Brian
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Lloyd, David
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Essex, Sue
 Evans, Delyth
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Griffiths, John

Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 15, Ymatal 7, Yn erbyn 30.
Amendment 5: For 15, Abstain 7, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter

Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Graham, William
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.
Amendment 6: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

4:00 p.m.

Amended motion:

the National Assembly:

1. notes the 2000-01 annual report of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education and Training in Wales, which was laid in Table Office on 15 February 2002;

2. recognises the contribution made by the annual report to the realisation of the Welsh Assembly Government's strategy for education and lifelong learning set out in 'The Learning Country';

3. recognises the significant contribution of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector and her staff;

4. acknowledges the value and relevance of school inspections in identifying priorities for improvement.

Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol

1. yn nodi adroddiad blynyddol 2000-01 Prif Arolygydd Addysg a Hyfforddiant yng Nghymru Ei Mawrhydi a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 15 Chwefror 2002;

2. yn cydnabod y cyfraniad a wnaed gan yr adroddiad blynyddol tuag at gyflawni strategaeth Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer addysg a dysgu gydol oes a nodwyd yn 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu';

3. yn cydnabod cyfraniad sylweddol Prif Arolygydd Ei Mawrhydi a'i staff;

4. yn cydnabod gwerth a pherthnasedd arolygiadau mewn ysgolion o ran nodi pa welliannau y dylid rhoi blaenoriaeth iddynt.

Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 37, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 15.

Amended motion: For 37, Abstain 0, Against 15.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Randerson, Jenny
Rogers, Peter
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.
Amended motion carried.*

Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

Gareth Jones: Pwynt o drefn. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf ond y mae'r pwynt yn ymwneud â datgan buddiannau. Mae fy mab a'm merch yn athrawon.

Gareth Jones: Point of order. I apologise, but the point relates to the declaration of interests. My son and daughter are teachers.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That will be recorded.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Cofnodir hynny.

Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion

The Minister for Rural Affairs and Assembly Business (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig a Threfnydd y Cynulliad (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales, under Standing Order No. 6.10, postpones the debate on sustainable development and reschedules it for next Tuesday, 21 May.

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.10, yn gohirio'r ddadl ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy ac yn trefnu i'w chynnal ddydd Mawrth nesaf, 21 Mai.

*Cynnig: O blaid 46, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 46, Abstain 1, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Griffiths, John

Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Rogers, Peter
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelod canlynol:
 The following Member abstained:

Hancock, Brian

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Y Blaid Geidwadol) Minority Party Debate (The Conservative Party)

Dyfodol y Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol The Future of the National Health Service

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1, 2, 3 and 5 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, and amendment 4 in the name of Carwyn Jones. Several Members wish to contribute to this debate, therefore, if there are no interventions, Members will have five minutes only in which to speak.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2, 3 a 5 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, a gwelliant 4, yn enw Carwyn Jones. Mae sawl Aelod yn dymuno cyfrannu at y ddadl, felly, os nad oes dim ymyriadau, caiff Aelodau bum munud yn unig i siarad.

David Melding: I propose that

the National Assembly

1. acknowledges that future increases in NHS expenditure in Wales must be used effectively to deliver a world-class service that is responsive to patient need;

2. that NHS Wales would benefit from a growing independent and private sector that

David Melding: Cynigiaf fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:

1. yn cydnabod bod yn rhaid defnyddio unrhyw gynnydd yn y dyfodol yng ngwariant y GIG yng Nghymru yn effeithiol i ddarparu gwasanaeth o safon fyd-eang sy'n ymateb i anghenion cleifion;

2. yn credu y byddai GIG Cymru yn elwa ar sector annibynnol a phreifat sy'n tyfu ac sy'n

is used in partnership to deliver NHS services;

3. acknowledges that patients must be treated within a reasonable time if higher public expenditure on the NHS is to maintain the support of taxpayers;

4. believes that priority must be given to increasing the number of hospital consultants, GPs, nurses, therapists and other key front-line staff if waiting times are to be reduced;

5. calls for higher capital expenditure within NHS Wales, which will improve both patient care and the working conditions of staff;

6. affirms the fundamental principle of the NHS to provide universal healthcare free at the point of need. (NDM1049)

I will first refer to the amendments. We are happy to support amendments 1 and 2. Amendments 3 and 4 do not recognise the potential contribution of the independent sector, therefore we will not support them. We will also support amendment 5.

I am sure that everyone agrees that the NHS is one of our finest traditions. It is truly humane to recognise the right of every citizen to receive quality healthcare. That was an outstanding principle to advance in 1948, just as it is an outstanding principle to reaffirm in 2002. There is no doubt that the people of Wales fully support the ethos, values and objectives of the national health service. In trying to improve the health service, we have the support of the electorate, taxpayers and, indeed, the whole of the people of Wales. That is why we have taken this opportunity to discuss the NHS and how it could be improved. We need to regenerate the NHS. We live in a modern, rapidly changing society with astonishing technological advances that open up all sorts of opportunities in terms of medical advances and give rise to new treatments that can improve the quality of life in a way that even our grandparents would have found astonishing. These are good problems to have, but they are also challenges and must be faced directly.

cael eu defnyddio mewn partneriaeth i gyflwyno gwasanaethau'r GIG;

3. yn cydnabod bod yn rhaid i gleifion gael eu trin o fewn amser rhesymol os yw trethdalwyr yn mynd i barhau i gefnogi mwy o wariant cyhoeddus ar y GIG;

4. yn credu bod yn rhaid rhoi blaenoriaeth i gynyddu nifer yr ymgynghorwyr ysbyty, meddygon teulu, nyrsys, therapyddion a staff allweddol eraill ar y llinell flaen os yw amseroedd aros yn mynd i gael eu cwtogi;

5. yn galw am fwy o wariant cyfalaf o fewn GIG Cymru, a fydd yn gwella'r gofal y mae cleifion yn ei gael ac amodau gwaith staff;

6. yn cadarnhau'r egwyddor sylfaenol y dylai'r GIG ddarparu gofal iechyd i bawb am ddim pan fo'i angen. (NDM1049)

Cyfeiriaf at y gwelliannau yn gyntaf. Yr ydym yn hapus i gefnogi gwelliannau 1 a 2. Nid yw gwelliannau 3 a 4 yn cydnabod cyfraniad potensial y sector annibynnol, felly ni wnawn eu cefnogi. Cefnogwn welliant 5 hefyd.

Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytuna pawb mai'r GIG yw un o'n traddodiadau gorau. Mae'n wirioneddol ddyngarol cydnabod hawl pob dinesydd i gael gofal iechyd o ansawdd da. Yr oedd hynny'n egwyddor eithriadol i'w chynnig yn 1948, yn union fel y mae'n egwyddor eithriadol i'w hailgadarnhau yn 2002. Nid oes unrhyw amheuaeth nad yw pobl Cymru'n llwyr gefnogi ethos, gwerthoedd ac amcanion y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Wrth geisio gwella'r gwasanaeth iechyd, mae gennym gefnogaeth yr etholwyr, trethdalwyr ac, yn wir, holl bobl Cymru. Dyna pam y cymerasom y cyfle hwn i drafod y GIG a sut y gellid ei wella. Mae angen adfywio'r GIG. Yr ydym yn byw mewn cymdeithas fodern sy'n newid yn gyflym gyda datblygiadau technolegol anhygoel sy'n agor pob math o gyfleoedd o ran datblygiadau meddygol ac yn esgor ar driniaethau newydd a all wella ansawdd bywyd mewn modd a fyddai'n synnu'n neiniau a'n teidiau hyd yn oed. Mae'r rhain yn broblemau da i'w cael, ond maent yn cynnig her hefyd a rhaid eu hwynebu'n uniongyrchol.

Despite the fact that people support the NHS and its principles, people are fairly dissatisfied with the health service. If you compare statistics across Europe, you will find that Britain records about 40 per cent dissatisfaction at any one time. That is much higher than the figures recorded in Germany, France or—to take a smaller country with which to compare Wales—Finland. I know that the Minister recently visited Finland and was impressed by its cardiac care programmes. This dissatisfaction is a problem. However, we should not forget that, while people are, in the abstract, unhappy with the quality of healthcare, when they are asked about a health service they have received, satisfaction rates are high. That is because they are then talking about a particular consultation with a GP, a visit to the practice nurse, an appointment with a consultant or a successful operation that transformed their life. We must remember the positive and not dwell needlessly on the negative in a way that undermines morale and the belief that the NHS is fit for today's population, which wants the service to be improved so that it becomes ever better in future.

There are stark facts that we must accept. Since 1997, the amount of money spent on the NHS has increased considerably, it has increased more than it did under the previous Government, although it also increased health spending considerably. After inflation is removed from the picture, we have seen an increase of about 30 per cent. That is a lot of money. However, patient treatments have remained static. The figure fluctuates, but there are about 2 to 3 per cent more patient treatments now than in 1997, when we spent 30 per cent less on healthcare. We must address that. Where is this money going? Why is it not resulting in more patient treatments?

4:10 p.m.

We must also accept that secondary care, that is, the care provided in hospitals, is under considerable strain, and does not enjoy the success that is routinely achieved in the primary sector. The primary sector faces its

Er gwaethaf y ffaith fod pobl yn cefnogi'r GIG a'i egwyddorion, mae pobl yn eithaf anfodlon â'r gwasanaeth iechyd. Os cymharwch ystadegau ar draws Ewrop, fe welwch fod Prydain yn cofnodi rhyw 40 y cant o anfodlonrwydd ar unrhyw un adeg. Mae hynny'n llawer uwch na'r ffigurau a gofnodir yn yr Almaen, Ffrainc neu—i gymryd gwlad lai y gellir cymharu Cymru â hi—y Ffindir. Gwn yr ymwelodd y Gweinidog â'r Ffindir yn ddiweddar a chael argraff dda o'i rhaglenni gofal y galon. Mae'r anfodlonrwydd hwn yn broblem. Er hynny, ni ddylem anghofio, tra bo pobl yn anhapus, o safbwynt haniaethol, ag ansawdd gofal iechyd, pan ofynnir iddynt ynglŷn â'r gwasanaeth iechyd a gawsant hwy, mae'r cyfraddau bodlondeb yn uchel. Mae hynny oherwydd eu bod yn sôn wedyn am ymgynghoriad arbennig â meddyg teulu, ymweliad â nyrs practis, apwyntiad ag ymgynghorydd neu driniaeth lwyddiannus a achubodd eu bywyd. Rhaid inni gofio'r cadarnhaol a pheidio ag oedi'n ddiangen gyda'r negyddol mewn modd sy'n tanseilio ysbryd a'r gred bod y GIG yn addas ar gyfer poblogaeth heddiw, sydd eisiau i'r gwasanaeth gael ei wella fel y bydd hyd yn oed yn well yn y dyfodol.

Y mae ffeithiau moel y mae'n rhaid inni eu derbyn. Er 1997, bu cynnydd sylweddol yn yr arian a werir ar y GIG, cynnydd mwy nag a gafwyd dan y Llywodraeth flaenorol, er iddi hithau gynyddu gwariant ar iechyd yn sylweddol. Wedi tynnu chwyddiant o'r darlun, gwelsom gynnydd o 30 y cant. Mae hynny'n arian mawr. Er hynny, mae triniaethau i gleifion wedi aros yn eu hunfan. Amrywia'r ffigur, ond ceir rhyw 2 i 3 y cant yn fwy o driniaethau i gleifion yn awr nag yn 1997, pan oeddem yn gwario 30 y cant yn llai ar ofal iechyd. Rhaid rhoi sylw i hynny. I ble mae'r arian yma'n mynd? Pam nad ydyw'n arwain at fwy o driniaethau i gleifion?

Rhaid inni dderbyn bod gofal eilaidd, hynny yw, y gofal a ddarperir mewn ysbytai, dan straen sylweddol, ac nad yw'n mwynhau'r llwyddiant a geir fel mater o drefn yn y sector gofal sylfaenol. Wyneba'r sector sylfaenol

own challenges, particularly relating to the number of staff. GPs constantly tell us that the time that they can spend in consultation with their patients is too short, and, therefore, we need more GPs to increase the length of consultations. However, comparative data provided by the World Health Organisation shows that Britain is always in the top 5 in delivering primary healthcare; this is not the case at secondary level, and we must analyse that.

Brian Gibbons: You graciously conceded that activity rates, and so on, have increased since 1997. However, on your question about where the money goes, I am sure that you will agree that this is not just a problem for the health service in Wales, but also for the health service in England, France, Germany, the United States, and almost every country currently investing in health. The issue of where the money is going is a universal problem; it is not unique to Wales.

David Melding: I am not naïve enough to believe that there is a perfect health system out there. I am not offering some cheap counsel of perfection. An increase in spending of 30 per cent does not mean a 30 per cent increase in patient treatments, and there are good reasons for that. However, a 2 or 3 per cent increase in patient treatments is a poor response; we could have anticipated an increase of between 10 and 15 per cent. However, I am not saying that you could have achieved a 30 per cent increase in patient treatment; that would be unrealistic.

On the hospital sector, I remind the Labour Party of some of its key manifesto pledges. This is not to humiliate the party, because this demonstrates the problems of the secondary sector. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Go on.'] Other Members may want to make more partisan points later. In 1999, in seeking to be elected to the National Assembly in great numbers—which it did not quite achieve, although it is the largest party, so it had reasonable success, and, I concede, more success than the Conservative Party did—the Labour Party made two key promises on waiting lists: that, by the end of this Assembly term, no-one would wait more than 18 months for in-patient treatment nor more

ambell her ei hun, yn enwedig o ran nifer y staff. Dywed meddygon teulu wrthym o hyd bod yr amser y gallant ei dreulio mewn ymgynghoriad gyda'u cleifion yn rhy fyr, ac, felly, mae angen mwy o feddygon i gynyddu hyd ymgynghoriadau. Er hynny, dengys data cymharol a ddarperir gan Fudiad Iechyd y Byd bod Prydain bob amser yn y 5 uchaf o ran darparu gofal iechyd sylfaenol; nid yw hynny'n wir ar lefel eilaidd, a rhaid inni ddadansoddi hynny.

Brian Gibbons: Gwnaethoch gyfaddef yn raslon fod cyfraddau gweithgaredd, ac ati, wedi cynyddu er 1997. Fodd bynnag, ar eich cwestiwn ynghylch ble mae'r arian yn mynd, yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch nad problem i'r gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru yn unig yw hon, ond hefyd i'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn Lloegr, Ffrainc, yr Almaen, yr Unol Daleithiau, a bron bob gwlad sy'n buddsoddi mewn iechyd ar hyn o bryd. Problem gyffredinol yw i ble mae'r arian yn mynd; nid yw'n gwestiwn unigryw i Gymru.

David Melding: Nid wyf yn ddigon naif i gredu bod system iechyd perffaith allan yn rhywle. Nid wyf yn cynnig rhyw gyngor delfrydol rhad. Nid yw cynnydd 30 y cant mewn gwariant yn golygu cynnydd 30 y cant yn nhriniaethau cleifion, ac mae rhesymau da dros hynny. Er hynny, mae cynnydd 2 i 3 y cant yn nhriniaethau cleifion yn ymateb gwael; gallasem ddisgwyl cynnydd rhwng 10 a 15 y cant. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn dweud y gallesid sicrhau cynnydd 30 y cant yn nhriniaethau cleifion; byddai hynny'n afrealistig.

Ar y sector ysbytai, atgoffaf y Blaid Lafur am rai o'i haddewidion maniffesto allweddol. Nid er mwyn bychanu'r blaid y gwnaf hyn, oherwydd dengys hyn broblemau'r sector eilaidd. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'Ewch amdani.'] Efallai y bydd Aelodau eraill yn dymuno gwneud pwyntiau mwy pleidiol wedyn. Yn 1999, wrth geisio cael eu hethol i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol mewn niferoedd mawr—rhywbeth na lwyddodd yn hollol i'w gyflawni, er mai hi yw'r blaid fwyaf, felly cafodd lwyddiant rhesymol, ac, addefaf, mwy o lwyddiant nag a gafodd y Blaid Geidwadol—gwnaeth y Blaid Lafur ddau addewid allweddol ynghylch rhestrau aros: na fyddai neb, erbyn diwedd tymor y

than six months for an out-patient appointment. Both lists have increased massively, and the Labour Party will not be able to tell the people of Wales that it has fulfilled these manifesto pledges. Part of the problem was that the difficulties that were just around the corner were not anticipated effectively. I am not saying that the Labour Party made these promises in bad faith; but they will certainly not be achieved.

We must also concede that there is a persistent problem with the quality of elective treatment given to patients in the NHS. In international comparisons, we do well on accident and emergency services—when you get the service, it is outstanding—but we routinely keep people waiting years for surgery, which, although minor, can have a life-transforming effect. People in France and Germany do not wait. They get that treatment within a reasonable time, allowing for administrative processes.

Peter Law: I am interested in the fundamental question of whether the Conservative Party believes in the national health service. What you are saying is all well and good, and I am sure that you believe in the national health service, but is it not true that there is a split in the Conservative Party over the national health service? David Davies is on record as supporting the American Medicare service; he said so on Radio Wales in April. Liam Fox has said that he wants to break the link between healthcare and the NHS in Britain. You are trying to hide that split.

David Melding: Yes and no. I now turn to the reform needed in the national health service—

David Davies: Does Peter Law accept that I support the provision of publicly-funded healthcare for anyone who cannot afford it, and does he also accept that it is unacceptable for Members to make such partisan points about what people have said, without being fully aware of the facts? Can we be confident that he knows what he is talking about in any policy area?

Cynulliad hwn, yn aros mwy na 18 mis am driniaeth claf mewnol na mwy na chwe mis am apwyntiad claf allanol. Mae'r ddwy restr wedi tyfu'n aruthrol, ac ni fydd y Blaid Lafur yn gallu dweud wrth bobl Cymru iddi gadw'r addewidion maniffesto hyn. Rhan o'r broblem oedd na ragwelwyd yn effeithiol yr anawsterau a oedd i ddod. Nid wyf yn dweud y gwnaeth y Blaid Lafur yr addewidion hyn heb fwriadu eu cadw; ond yn sicr ni chyflawnir hwynt.

Rhaid inni dderbyn hefyd bod problem barhaus gydag ansawdd triniaeth ddewisol a roddir i gleifion yn y GIG. Mewn cymariaethau rhyngwladol, gwnawn yn dda ar wasanaethau damwain ac argyfwng—pan gewch y gwasanaeth, mae'n eithriadol o dda—ond fel mater o drefn cedwir pobl i aros am flynyddoedd am lawdriniaeth a all, er yn fach, gael effaith sy'n trawsnewid bywyd. Nid yw pobl yn Ffrainc a'r Almaen yn aros. Cânt y driniaeth honno o fewn amser rhesymol, â chaniatáu am y broses weinyddol.

Peter Law: Mae gennyf ddiddordeb yn y cwestiwn sylfaenol a ydyw'r Blaid Geidwadol yn credu yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Mae popeth yn dda yn yr hyn yr ydych chi'n ei ddweud, ac yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod chi'n credu yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol, ond onid yw'n wir fod rhwyg yn y Blaid Geidwadol dros y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol? Mae David Davies ar gofnod yn cefnogi gwasanaeth Medicare America; dywedodd hynny ar Radio Wales ym mis Ebrill. Mae Liam Fox wedi dweud bod arno eisiau torri'r cysylltiad rhwng gofal iechyd a'r GIG ym Mhrydain. Yr ydych yn ceisio cuddio'r rhwyg honno.

David Melding: Ydwyf a nac ydwyf. Trof yn awr at y diwygio sydd ei angen ar y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol—

David Davies: A ydyw Peter Law yn derbyn fy mod yn cefnogi darpariaeth gofal iechyd y telir amdano ag arian cyhoeddus i'r sawl na all ei fforddio, ac a ydyw'n derbyn hefyd ei bod yn annerbyniol i Aelodau wneud pwyntiau mor bleidiol ynghylch yr hyn a ddywedodd pobl, heb fod yn gwbl ymwybodol o'r ffeithiau? A allwn ni fod yn hyderus ei fod yn gwybod am beth y mae'n

sôn mewn unrhyw faes polisi?

David Melding: It is a grave offence when it is committed against a Member who is so calm in his judgment and unwilling to make cheap political points—we leave that to the Labour Party. I know that your commitment to the NHS, David, is absolute.

We need a reformed NHS that can survive in the twenty-first century. We should celebrate the fact that we still want a national health service, despite the fact that medicine has been transformed and patients' expectations are, rightly, greater than they were fifty years ago. However, people are still committed to the NHS model, and that is good. However, we must recognise that much of the NHS appears, at times, to be an unresponsive state monopoly. We do not want that; we want it to focus on the patient and improving patient care.

Politicians are too involved in the day-to-day running of the NHS, and we need to put a stop to that. There are probably too many health commissioning organisations at present, and there will certainly be too many by next April, when we will have local health boards as mini health authorities. The independent sector is not recognised enough and is not used to its full potential. All these matters must be addressed in order for us to reform the NHS effectively.

Staffing is key to health improvement. The figures are stark. To keep pace with the NHS plans in Scotland and England, we would need, by 2004, 375 extra consultants, 100 more GPs, 1,000 more nurses, and 325 more therapists. These targets were set nearly two years ago in Scotland and England, yet the Minister has delayed setting targets in Wales time and again. Since 1999, we have increased front-line staff by 3 per cent, but administrative staff have increased by three times as much. We need effective administrative staff and world-class managers—I do not deprecate that—but we also need more front-line staff, and we must make that a priority.

David Melding: Mae'n dramgwyydd difrifol pan y'i gwneir yn erbyn Aelod sydd mor dawel yn ei farn ac mor amharod i wneud pwyntiau gwleidyddol rhad—gadawn hynny i'r Blaid Lafur. Gwn fod eich ymrwymiad i'r GIG, David, yn llwyr.

Mae arnom angen GIG diwygiedig a all fyw yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Dylem ddathlu'r ffaith fod arnom eisiau gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol o hyd, er gwaethaf y ffaith fod meddygaeth wedi'i gweddnewid a bod disgwyliadau cleifion, yn gwbl gyfiawn, yn fwy nag yr oeddent hanner can mlynedd yn ôl. Er hynny, mae pobl yn dal i ymrwymo i fodel y GIG, a da hynny. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gydnabod bod llawer o'r GIG yn ymddangos, ar brydiau, fel monopoli gwladwriaethol diymateb. Nid oes arnom eisiau hynny; mae arnom eisiau iddo ganolbwyntio ar y claf ac ar wella gofal cleifion.

Mae gan wleidyddion ormod o lais yn rheolaeth feunyddiol y GIG, ac mae angen rhoi terfyn ar hynny. Mae'n debyg fod gormod o gyrff comisiynu iechyd ar hyn o bryd, ac yn sicr bydd gormod erbyn mis Ebrill nesaf, pryd y bydd gennym fyrddau iechyd lleol fel mân awdurdodau iechyd. Nid oes digon o gydnabyddiaeth i'r sector annibynnol ac ni chaiff ei ddefnyddio i'w lawn botensial. Rhaid delio â'r materion hyn i gyd er mwyn inni ddiwygio'r GIG yn effeithiol.

Mae staffio'n allweddol i wella iechyd. Mae'r ffigurau'n llwm. Er mwyn cadw i fyny â chynlluniau'r GIG yn yr Alban a Lloegr, byddai arnom angen, erbyn 2004, 375 o ymgynghorwyr ychwanegol, 100 yn fwy o feddygon teulu, 1,000 yn fwy o nyrsys, a 325 yn fwy o therapyddion. Gosodwyd y targedau hyn bron ddwy flynedd yn ôl yn yr Alban a Lloegr, eto mae'r Gweinidog wedi oedi gosod targedau yng Nghymru dro ar ôl tro. Oddi ar 1999, yr ydym wedi cynyddu staff y rheng flaen 3 y cant, ond cynyddodd nifer y staff gweinyddol dair gwaith gymaint. Mae angen staff gweinyddol effeithiol a rheolwyr o safon byd—nid wyf yn dibrisio hynny—ond mae angen mwy o staff rheng flaen hefyd, a rhaid inni wneud hynny'n

flaenoriaeth.

Many political parties here are cautious about the independent sector. You should cast aside your ingrained political prejudice, and accept that an effective partnership with the independent sector can be developed to improve the delivery of NHS services. It will give patients more choice, and it will allow some comparison in a system that relies heavily on a state monopoly service. Those measures would improve and safeguard the NHS, and increase its productivity. This is clearly recognised in Europe, where, even in the models similar to the NHS, there is a much larger independent sector element.

Finally, the Minister must address the question of audit. She has been accused of dithering. I am not sure that that is fair. However, a new commission for healthcare audit and inspection has been announced in England, and there is doubt as to whether or not it should be an England and Wales body. The Secretary of State for Wales seemed to indicate that it would be, but the Minister has not yet made a statement on it. We want clarification. We should not be afraid of effective auditing; it would assist us in improving the health service. We need to reassure people that we will have as robust a system in Wales as in England, whether it is an England and Wales system, or a Welsh system. Whatever it is, it must be independent and robust.

In conclusion, on behalf of the Welsh Conservatives, I reaffirm our commitment to the ideals of the national health service. It is worth saving. It is already an exceptionally successful service at primary care level, and it can again be a world-beater at hospital level, and if we reform it properly, the people of Wales will be grateful.

4:20 p.m.

David Lloyd: Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 1: ychwanegu pwynt 1 newydd ac ail rifo'r pwyntiau sy'n weddill yn unol â hynny:

1. yn ailddatgan ei ymrwymiad i GIG yng Nghymru sy'n cael ei ariannu'n gyfan gwbl

Mae llawer o bleidiau gwleidyddol yma'n ochelgar o'r sector annibynnol. Dylech roi heibio'ch rhagfarn wleidyddol reddfol, a derbyn y gellir datblygu partneriaeth effeithiol gyda'r sector annibynnol i wella cyflwyniad gwasanaethau'r GIG. Bydd yn rhoi mwy o ddewis i gleifion, ac yn caniatáu elfen o gymharu mewn cyfundrefn sy'n dibynnu'n drwm ar wasanaeth monopoli'r wladwriaeth. Byddai'r mesurau hynny'n gwella ac yn diogelu'r GIG, ac yn cynyddu'i gynhyrchiant. Gwelir hyn yn glir yn Ewrop, lle, hyd yn oed yn y modelau sy'n debyg i'r GIG, ceir elfen lawer mwy o'r sector annibynnol.

Yn olaf, rhaid i'r Gweinidog edrych ar gwestiwn archwilio. Fe'i cyhuddwyd o dindroi. Nid wyf yn siŵr fod hynny'n deg. Fodd bynnag, cyhoeddwyd comisiwn archwilio ac arolygu gofal iechyd newydd yn Lloegr, ac mae amheuaeth a ddylai fod yn gorff i Gymru a Lloegr ai peidio. Yr oedd Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru fel petai'n dweud y byddai, ond nid yw'r Gweinidog wedi gwneud datganiad ar hynny eto. Mae arnom eisiau eglurhad. Ni ddylem ofni archwilio effeithiol; byddai'n ein helpu i wella'r gwasanaeth iechyd. Mae angen rhoi sicrwydd i bobl y bydd gennym system mor gadarn yng Nghymru ag yn Lloegr, boed honno'n system i Gymru a Lloegr, neu'n system i Gymru. Beth bynnag y bo, rhaid iddi fod yn annibynnol a chryf.

I gloi, ar ran Ceidwadwyr Cymru, ailgadarnhaf ein hymrwymiad i ddelfrydau'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Mae'n werth ei achub. Mae eisoes yn wasanaeth eithriadol o lwyddiannus ar lefel gofal sylfaenol, a gall fod ymhlith goreuon y byd eto ar lefel ysbytai, ac os y'i diwygiwn yn iawn, bydd pobl Cymru'n ddiolchgar.

David Lloyd: I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 1: add as a new point 1 and renumber remaining points accordingly:

1. reaffirms its commitment to a fully publicly-funded NHS in Wales.

ag arian cyhoeddus.

Cynigiau welliant 2. Ychwanegu ar ddiwedd pwynt 1.

I propose amendment 2. Add at end of point 1:

, gan sicrhau bod yr un gwasanaethau ar gael i gleifion ni waeth ble y maent yn byw.

, ensuring that all patients get equal access to services regardless of where they live.

Cynigiau welliant 3. Dileu pwynt 2 ac ail rifo'r pwyntiau sy'n weddill yn unol â hynny.

I propose amendment 3. Delete point 2 and renumber remaining points accordingly.

Cynigiau welliant 5. Ychwanegu ar ddechrau pwynt 4:

I propose amendment 5. Add at the start of point 4:

yn nodi bod y GIG yng Nghymru yn gwario dros £25 miliwn y flwyddyn ar staff dros dro am na lwyddir i lenwi swyddi gwag a hefyd.

notes that the NHS Wales spends over £25 million a year on temporary staff because of the failure to fill vacancies and further.

Datganaf fuddiant fel meddyg teulu a chyngorydd sir, ac, yng nghyd-destun trafodaethau heddiw, datganaf hefyd fod fy ngwraig yn feddyg teulu.

I declare an interest as a general practitioner and county councillor, and, in the context of today's discussions, I also declare that my wife is a GP.

Croesawn y ddadl hon. Mae iechyd yn bwnc sydd wedi'i ddatganoli; anghofiwn hynny weithiau. Mae gan Gymru yr ystadegau iechyd gwaethaf yn y DU. Mae pobl Cymru yn disgwyl i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad wneud gwahaniaeth i'r gwasanaeth iechyd. Er mwyn cyflawni hynny, rhaid ystyried Cymru yn ei chyfanrwydd a bod yn barod i newid y meddylfryd presennol. Golyga hynny ddatblygu a darparu gwasanaethau arbenigol yng Nghymru. Ni ddylem ffosileiddio'r hyn a ddarparwyd ar hyd y blynyddoedd. Mae'n amlwg fod hynny wedi methu. Mae'r ystadegau iechyd echrydus hyn yn dyst i hynny. Mae angen cynllunio gwasanaeth iechyd pwrpasol i Gymru gyfan er mwyn gwella mynediad cleifion i driniaethau yn y wlad hon ac i adeiladu ar ein hysgolion clinigol a meddygol, drwy ddatblygu arbenigedd er mwyn sicrhau y byddant yn ffynnu. Rhaid hefyd sicrhau gwasanaeth iechyd sydd wedi'i ariannu gan drethiant cyffredinol. Yn naturiol, byddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant 4 yn enw Carwyn Jones i'r perwyl hwnnw.

We welcome this debate. Health is a devolved issue; we forget that at times. Wales has the worst UK health statistics. The people of Wales expect the Assembly Government to make a difference to the health service. To achieve that, we must consider the whole of Wales and change the current mind-set. That would involve developing and providing specialist services in Wales. We should not fossilise the provision that has been made available over the years. It is obvious that that has failed. The terrible health statistics prove that. We need to plan a health service for the whole of Wales in order to improve patients' access to treatment in this country and to build on our clinical and medical schools, by developing expertise to ensure that they flourish. We must also ensure that the health service is funded from general taxation. Naturally, we will support amendment 4 in the name of Carwyn Jones to that end.

One determinant of health outcomes is access to treatment. How well you do depends on how near you are to specialist treatment. In that context, it is disappointing to note some of the recommendations of the recent Specialised Health Services Commission for

Un ffactor sy'n penderfynu canlyniadau iechyd yw mynediad at driniaeth. Mae pa mor dda a wnewch chi yn dibynnu ar ba mor agos yr ydych at driniaeth arbenigol. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, mae'n siomedig nodi rhai o argymhellion adroddiad diweddar

Wales report on children's services.

Comisiwn Cymru dros Wasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol ar wasanaethau plant.

Huw Lewis: I am interested to hear that Plaid Cymru supports the principle of funding the NHS through general taxation, but that does not square with its basic policy of self-government for Wales. I have asked the National Assembly Library to calculate the difference between taxation taken in Wales and taxation spent in Wales. There is a shortfall of £5 billion. Where would Plaid Cymru find the money to fund the NHS in a self-governing Wales?

Huw Lewis: Diddorol yw clywed bod Plaid Cymru'n cefnogi'r egwyddor o dalu am y GIG drwy drethiant cyffredinol, ond nid yw hynny'n gyson â'i pholisi sylfaenol o hunanlywodraeth i Gymru. Yr wyf wedi gofyn i Lyfrgell y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gyfrifo'r gwahaniaeth rhwng trethiant a gymerir yng Nghymru a threthiant a werir yng Nghymru. Mae'r swm £5 biliwn yn fyr. O ble y câi Plaid Cymru yr arian i dalu am y GIG mewn Cymru hunanlywodraethol?

David Lloyd: Here we go again: we will be poor under Plaid Cymru. You may not have realised, Huw, that we are poor now. The UK is Europe's second richest economy, yet two-thirds of Wales is among Europe's poorest regions, which is why we qualify for Objective 1 funding. Since 1997, child poverty and health inequalities have increased. If you are happy with the current situation, so be it, but I am not.

David Lloyd: Dyma ni eto: byddwn yn dlawd dan Blaid Cymru. Efallai nad ydych wedi sylwi, Huw, ein bod yn dlawd yn awr. Gan y DU y mae ail economi cyfoethocaf Ewrop, eto mae Cymru ymhlith rhanbarthau tlotaf Ewrop, sef y rheswm pam ein bod yn gymwys i dderbyn arian Amcan 1. Oddi ar 1997, mae tlodi plant ac anghydraddoldebau iechyd wedi cynyddu. Os ydych chi'n hapus â'r sefyllfa, dyna ni, ond nid wyf fi.

David Davies: Are you saying that it was better under the Conservatives than under Labour?

David Davies: A ydych yn dweud bod pethau'n well dan y Ceidwadwyr na than Lafur?

David Lloyd: I will not join your fantasy world. Time does not permit me to list all the deficiencies that the Tory party left us in terms of the NHS in Wales.

David Lloyd: Ni wnaf ymuno â'ch byd ffantasi. Nid yw amser yn caniatáu imi restru'r holl ddiffygion a adawodd y blaid Doriaidd inni yn nhermau'r GIG yng Nghymru.

I return to the SHSCW report on children's services and access to care. Its recommendation to move paediatric neuro-surgery from Swansea to Cardiff has caused outrage among clinicians and parents in Swansea and south-west Wales. We need to build on the Swansea Clinical School that opened only last September, and develop and enhance specialisms, not take them away and undermine the medical school's development.

Dychwelaf at adroddiad Comisiwn Cymru dros Wasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol ar wasanaethau plant a mynediad i ofal. Mae ei argymhellad i symud llawdriniaeth nerfol i blant o Abertawe i Gaerdydd wedi achosi dieter ymhlith clinigwyr a rhieni yn Abertawe a'r De-orllewin. Mae angen adeiladu ar Ysgol Glinigol Abertawe a agorodd mor ddiweddar â mis Medi diwethaf, a datblygu a gwella meysydd arbenigedd, nid mynd â hwy i ffwrdd a thanseilio datblygiad yr ysgol feddygol.

Kirsty Williams: You have already referred to the SHSCW report and its recommendations with regard to renal services moving from Cardiff to Bristol. Are you advocating a strategic approach, or are you just watching your back in your own

Kirsty Williams: Yr ydych eisoes wedi cyfeirio at adroddiad y comisiwn a'i argymhellion o ran symud gwasanaethau arenol o Gaerdydd i Fryste. A ydych yn dadlau dros weithredu strategol ynteu ai dim ond gwyllo'ch cefn yn eich etholaeth eich

constituency?

David Lloyd: Time does not permit me to adequately critique that. However, as regards watching one's back, we heard a great deal about maternity services in east Radnorshire last week.

Issues such as access to medical treatment must be tackled if we are to improve the health of our people. The new GP contract is key. The proposed ideas appear to offer an innovative framework that will put primary care at the forefront of the NHS in Wales. We must remember that 90 per cent of patients are treated solely in the community. Innovative treatments, which we would all like to see in primary care, can happen given the new flexibilities proposed in the new GP contract. However, it will take significant resources. We are talking money, technology, nurses, physiotherapists, doctors and general practitioners in primary care to deliver the new GP contract. Organising and delivering this innovative care will be a significant challenge to the new local health boards, when they are only just being set up. Wales cannot be left behind in the timetable of implementation of the UK GP contract, or the recruitment of primary care staff will suffer.

To close, in deleting point 2 concerning the private sector, I recognise that the crisis in residential and nursing home care in the private and independent sector must be addressed by increased fees levels. I confine my criticism in the time remaining to private medicine, which some people still see as helping out the NHS. In fact, the relationship between private and NHS medicine is akin to that of parasite and host. Top consultants and nurses are cherry-picked to work privately. Their zillions of years of expensive education and training—from lowly medical student, to junior and senior house officer, to registrar, to consultant—is paid for by the NHS, and funded by the state. When staff move to the private sector, it provides no compensation at all for the NHS.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You

hun yr ydych?

David Lloyd: Nid yw amser yn caniatáu imi feirniadu hynny'n ddigonol. Fodd bynnag, o ran gwyllo'ch cefn, clywsom lawer iawn am wasanaethau mamolaeth yn nwyrain Sir Faesyfed yr wythnos diwethaf.

Rhaid mynd i'r afael â materion fel mynediad at driniaeth feddygol os ydym am wella iechyd ein pobl. Mae'r contract meddygon teulu newydd yn allweddol. Mae'r syniadau a gynigir fel pe baent yn cynnig fframwaith arloesol a fydd yn gosod gofal sylfaenol ar flaen y GIG yng Nghymru. Rhaid cofio y caiff 90 y cant o gleifion eu trin yn y gymuned yn unig. Gall triniaethau arloesol, yr hoffai pawb ohonom eu gweld mewn gofal sylfaenol, ddigwydd diolch i'r hyblygrwydd newydd a gynigir yn y contract meddygon teulu newydd. Fodd bynnag, fe gymer adnoddau arwyddocaol. Yr ydym yn sôn am arian, technoleg, nyrsys, ffisiotherapyddion, meddygon ysbyty a meddygon teulu mewn gofal sylfaenol i gyflawni'r contract meddygon teulu newydd. Bydd trefnu a chyflwyno'r gofal arloesol hwn yn her sylweddol i'r byrddau iechyd lleol newydd, a hwythau ddim ond yn cael eu sefydlu yn awr. Ni all Cymru gael ei gadael ar ôl yn amserlen weithredu contract meddygon teulu'r DU, neu bydd hynny'n amharu ar recriwtio staff gofal sylfaenol.

I gloi, wrth ddileu pwynt 2 ynglŷn â'r sector preifat, sylweddolaf fod yn rhaid datrys yr argyfwng mewn gofal cartrefi nyrsio a phreswyl yn y sector preifat ac annibynnol drwy godi ffioedd uwch. Cyfyngaf fy meirniadaeth yn yr amser sydd ar ôl i feddygaeth breifat, sydd o hyd yn llygaid rhai pobl yn rhoi help llaw i'r GIG. Mewn gwirionedd, mae'r berthynas rhwng meddygaeth breifat a'r GIG yn debyg i berthynas parasit a'i gynhaliwr. Caiff yr ymgynghorwyr a'r nyrsys gorau eu dethol i weithio'n breifat. Telir am eu holl flynyddoedd o addysg a hyfforddiant drud—o fyfyrwr meddygol isel, i feddyg tŷ iau a hŷn, i gofrestrydd, i ymgynghorydd—gan y GIG, a'u noddi gan y wladwriaeth. Pan symuda staff i'r sector preifat, nid oes unrhyw dâl digolledu o gwbl i'r GIG.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae angen ichi

need to wind up, Dai.

David Lloyd: Private consultants, who also work for the NHS, gain their reputations among referring GPs through their NHS work.

David Melding *rose*—

David Lloyd: No, I will not give way.

If private consultants did all their work in the private sector, GPs would not know of them and they would not receive any referrals. No mention has been made of issues concerning the use of NHS facilities for private work.

I gloi, mae sialens anferthol yn wynebu'r Gweinidog i drefnu ac ariannu gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol i Gymru sy'n cwrdd ag anghenion pobl yn eu cymunedau. Rhaid mynd i'r afael â hyn yn awr, i wyrdroi annhegwch ac anghyfiawnder degawdau lawer.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): I propose amendment 4 in the name of Carwyn Jones. Delete point 2 and add in its place:

2. endorses the conclusions of the Wanless report in relation to a properly resourced and renewed national health service, in which funding is most efficiently and equitably provided through general taxation.

John Griffiths: This is an historic opportunity for the health service in Wales to move forward. Significant increases in funding will be available following the announcement in Gordon Brown's budget, which will give us an opportunity to try to strike the right balance between front-line services and preventative healthcare.

On front-line services, I went to the accident and emergency department of the Royal Gwent Hospital last Friday night, to shadow a night shift on what is traditionally one of the busiest nights of the week. Staff had to cope with the sorts of things that we all know

ddirwyn i ben, Dai.

David Lloyd: Mae ymgynghorwyr preifat, sy'n gweithio hefyd i'r GIG, yn ennill eu henw da ymysg meddygon teulu sy'n cyfeirio cleifion atynt, drwy eu gwaith i'r GIG.

David Melding *a gododd*—

David Lloyd: Na, ni wnaif ildio.

Pe bai ymgynghorwyr preifat yn gwneud eu gwaith i gyd yn y sector preifat, ni fyddai meddygon teulu'n gwybod amdanynt ac ni chyfeirid unrhyw gleifion atynt. Ni chafwyd unrhyw sôn am faterion cysylltiedig â defnyddio cyfleusterau'r GIG ar gyfer gwaith preifat.

To close, an enormous challenge faces the Minister in organising and financing a national health service for Wales that meets the needs of people in their communities. This must be tackled now, to reverse many decades of inequity and injustice.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Cynigiad welliant 4 yn enw Carwyn Jones. Dileu pwynt 2 a rhoi'r canlynol yn ei le:

2. yn cymeradwyo casgliadau adroddiad Wanless mewn perthynas â gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol sy'n cael yr adnoddau priodol ac sy'n cael ei adfywio, lle mae cyllid ar ei gyfer yn cael ei ddarparu yn y ffordd fwyaf effeithlon a theg trwy drethiant cyffredinol.

John Griffiths: Dyma gyfle hanesyddol i'r gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru symud ymlaen. Bydd symiau ychwanegol sylweddol o arian ar gael yn dilyn y cyhoeddiad yng nghyllideb Gordon Brown, a fydd yn rhoi cyfle inni geisio taro'r cydbwysedd iawn rhwng gwasanaethau rheng flaen a gofal iechyd ataliol.

Ynghylch gwasanaethau rheng flaen, euthum i adran ddamweiniau ac argyfwng Ysbyty Brenhinol Gwent nos Wener ddiwethaf, i gysgodi shift nos ar noson sydd yn draddodiadol gyda'r prysuraf yn yr wythnos. Roedd yn rhaid i staff ymdopi â'r math o

are thrown at them in such circumstances, much of it arising from drunken assaults, drug problems, unfortunate people with mental health problems, overdoses, as well as emergency medical conditions. As ever, the dedication and hard work of our NHS staff impressed me, as they coped with the great pressures and frustrations involved in their work.

Given the letters that all Assembly Members receive on health matters, we are aware of the need to inject resources into front-line services—staffing and capacity building in general. We know, from our postbags and AM surgeries, of the immediate pressures and the waiting times that people endure. We must radically improve the resources given to front-line services.

4:30 p.m.

Janet Ryder: John talks about resourcing front-line services. I am sure that he is aware that the Operational Research in Health Ltd report into the ambulance service in Wales showed a deficit of over £6 million in the money needed to enable it to meet its 999 call targets. Do you not think that we should fund that service properly, instead of giving it only £1 million?

John Griffiths: We are giving considerably more than that, Janet. However, my comments are on the generality of the situation, the pressures on the NHS and the need for a step change, which Gordon Brown's budget will allow for. It is the partnership between the Assembly and the UK Labour Government that makes it possible.

On the need to improve these services, staff training is extremely important. I am glad that Jane Hutt has made many announcements—I hope that there are more to come—in this context, not least of which I hope will be on the Gwent clinical school. As I have said many times, substantial contributions have been made by the Royal Gwent hospital in training medical students

bethau yr ydym i gyd yn gwybod fod yn rhaid iddynt eu hwynebu yn yr amgylchiadau hyn, llawer yn deillio o ymosodiadau meddw, problemau cyffuriau, anffodusion â phroblemau iechyd meddwl, gorddosiau, yn ogystal ag amodau meddygol argyfyngus. Fel arfer, gwnaeth ymroddiad a gwaith caled ein staff GIG argraff arnaf, wrth iddynt ymdopi â'r pwysau a'r rhwystredigaethau mawr sy'n rhan o'u gwaith.

O gofio'r llythyrau a dderbynia holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar faterion iechyd, yr ydym yn ymwybodol o'r angen i chwistrellu adnoddau i mewn i wasanaethau rheng flaen—staffio ac adeiladu capasiti yn gyffredinol. Gwyddom, o'n bagiau post a'n cymorthfeydd AC, am y pwysau uniongyrchol a'r amserau aros y mae pobl yn eu dioddef. Rhaid inni wella'n sylfaenol yr adnoddau a roddir i wasanaethau rheng flaen.

Janet Ryder: Mae John yn sôn am adnoddau i wasanaethau rheng flaen. Yr wyf yn siŵr ei fod yn ymwybodol fod adroddiad Operational Research in Health Ltd ar y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yng Nghymru wedi dangos diffyg o £6 miliwn yn yr arian y mae arno'i angen i'w alluogi i gyrraedd ei dargedau ateb galwadau 999. Onid ydych yn meddwl y dylem ariannu'r gwasanaeth hwnnw'n iawn, yn hytrach na dim ond rhoi £1 filiwn iddo?

John Griffiths: Yr ydym yn rhoi cryn dipyn yn fwy na hynny, Janet. Serch hynny, mae a wnelo fy sylwadau i â chyffredinoledd y sefyllfa, y pwysau ar y GIG a'r angen am newid fesul cam, a ganiateir gan gyllideb Gordon Brown. Y bartneriaeth rhwng y Cynulliad a Llywodraeth Lafur y DU sy'n gwneud hyn yn bosibl.

Ynglŷn â'r angen i wella'r gwasanaethau hyn, mae hyfforddi staff yn eithriadol o bwysig. Yr wyf yn falch fod Jane Hutt wedi gwneud llawer o gyhoeddiadau—gobeithio bod mwy i ddod—yn y cyd-destun hwn, nid lleiaf, gobeithio, am ysgol glinigol Gwent. Fel y dywedais lawer gwaith, gwnaeth Ysbyty Brenhinol Gwent gyfraniadau sylweddol drwy hyfforddi myfyrwyr

that can be built on by the Gwent clinical school. There is much to offer. On top-line research in Wales, the capacity at the Royal Gwent hospital, as far as stomach cancer is concerned, is internationally recognised. More resources would be usefully employed there, as I have mentioned in the past. It is internationally recognised that survival rates and the quality of provision at the Royal Gwent hospital are good with regard to stomach cancer.

We need to balance provision to take account of this historic opportunity with the use of funding in a wider sense to aid preventative healthcare, and to perhaps consider issues such as housing, which is important for health, and social deprivation in general; Jane always makes these connections. Health education is also important. We are all familiar with the messages about exercise, not smoking, drinking alcohol only in moderation, eating a high-fibre, low-fat diet, and so on. However, unfortunately these messages are not always well accepted and acted upon. There is much to do therefore on health education. We know that our most deprived communities, for understandable reasons, are not always as receptive to these messages as they might be, so there is much work to be done. People are not receptive to messages if it is a struggle to exist from week to week. We must recognise that and help those communities.

There are examples across the world of good health education programmes. In north Karelia in Finland, the local health project has received considerable attention recently. Through drastically reducing smoking and improving diets, north Karelia has seen a 75 per cent reduction in deaths from heart disease for the working-age population over some 23 years. That shows what can be done. We must ensure that we learn from best practice and from similar programmes, and act on that in Wales, making whatever improvements are possible, although no two countries are the same. This is an historic opportunity. I hope that we ensure that we capitalise on it.

William Graham: As many Members will concur, whenever we receive letters

meddygaeth, a gall ysgol glinigol Gwent adeiladu ar hynny. Mae llawer i'w gynnig. O ran ymchwil lefel uchaf yng Nghymru, mae'r gallu yn Ysbyty Brenhinol Gwent, ym maes cancer y stumog, wedi'i gydnabod yn rhyngwladol. Gellid defnyddio mwy o adnoddau yn fuddiol yno, fel y soniais yn y gorffennol. Cydnabyddir yn rhyngwladol fod cyfraddau goroesi ac ansawdd y ddarpariaeth yn Ysbyty Brenhinol Gwent yn dda o safbwynt cancer y stumog.

Mae angen cydbwyso'r ddarpariaeth i fanteisio ar y cyfle hanesyddol hwn gan ddefnyddio cyllid mewn ystyr ehangach i helpu gofal iechyd ataliol, ac efallai ystyried materion fel tai, sydd yn bwysig i iechyd, ac amddifadedd cymdeithasol yn gyffredinol; mae Jane wastad yn gwneud y cysylltiadau hyn. Mae addysg iechyd yn bwysig hefyd. Yr ydym i gyd yn gyfarwydd â'r negeseuon am ymarfer, peidio ag ysmegu, cymedroldeb wrth yfed alcohol, bwyta deiet uchel mewn ffibr ac isel mewn braster, ac ati. Fodd bynnag, yn anffodus ni chaiff y negeseuon hyn eu derbyn a'u rhoi ar waith bob amser. Mae llawer i'w wneud felly gydag addysg iechyd. Gwyddom nad yw'n cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig, am resymau dealladwy, bob amser mor barod i dderbyn y negeseuon hyn ag y gallent fod, felly mae llawer o waith i'w wneud. Nid yw pobl yn agored i dderbyn negeseuon os ydyw'n ymdrech i fyw o wythnos i wythnos. Rhaid inni gydnabod hynny a helpu'r cymunedau hyn.

Ceir enghreifftiau dros y byd o raglenni addysg iechyd da. Yng ngogledd Karelia yn y Ffindir, cafodd y prosiect iechyd lleol gryn sylw'n ddiweddar. Trwy gwtogi'n sylweddol ar ysmegu a gwella deiet, gwelodd gogledd Karelia ostyngiad o 75 y cant mewn marwolaethau o glefyd y galon ymysg y boblogaeth oed gweithio dros ryw 23 o flynyddoedd. Mae hynny'n dangos beth y gellir ei wneud. Rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn dysgu oddi wrth arfer gorau a rhaglenni tebyg, ac yn gweithredu ar hynny yng Nghymru, gan wneud pa bynnag welliannau sy'n bosibl, er nad oes yr un dwy wlad yr un peth. Dyma gyfle hanesyddol. Gobeithio y sicrhawn ein bod yn manteisio arno.

William Graham: Fel y cytuna llawer o Aelodau, pryd bynnag y derbyniwn lythyrau

regarding medical problems, we are inevitably faced with complaints about inordinately long waiting times, particularly for orthopaedics. It is therefore worthwhile to consult with the people who deal with this professionally, as to what remedies they might suggest could be used in our health service in Wales. Does the Minister agree, without reservation, that three clinics a day should be introduced at once, from 8.30 a.m. until 12.00 p.m., from 12.30 p.m. until 4.00 p.m., and from 4.30 p.m. until 8.00 p.m.? This would increase out-patient throughput by 50 per cent without needing a single extra facility.

We have already heard how much extra funding will be available for in-patient services. Why not therefore move all the long-term bed blockers by immediate transfer to local authority and privately-owned residential homes? The cost is high, but nothing like the cost of keeping people in hospital. Similarly, we could arrange for properly equipped nursing homes to take all patients who do not need specialised nursing for rehabilitation four or five days after their operations. We should consider perhaps carrying out all-night operating lists with suitably drafted staff. After all, the national health service must be the only multi-million pound business in the world that runs on a 40-hour week. It has enormous capital costs, including equipment, and it is wasting away. We could clear all in-patient waiting lists with a huge initiative using private nursing homes.

Ann Jones: Were that realised, do you envisage that consultants who work in the private sector would return to the NHS, and give that time free of charge to the NHS so that operations could be performed during the evening?

William Graham: I would only insist that they serve out their contracted time.

Ann Jones: Which is it?

William Graham: The contract agreed between the NHS, the consultant and—

yn glŷn â phroblemau meddygol, yn anochel ceir cwynion am amserau aros llawer rhy hir, yn enwedig am driniaeth orthopedig. Mae'n werth chweil, felly, ymgynghori â'r bobl sy'n ymdrin â hyn yn broffesiynol, ynghylch pa feddyginiaethau yr awgrymant y gellid eu defnyddio yn ein gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru. A ydyw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno, yn ddiamod, y dylid cyflwyno tri chlinig y dydd ar unwaith, o 8.30 y bore tan hanner dydd, o 12.30 y prynhawn tan 4.00 y prynhawn, ac o 4.30 tan 8.00 yr hwyr? Byddai hyn yn cynyddu triniaethau cleifion allanol 50 y cant heb fod angen un cyfleuster ychwanegol.

Clywsom eisoes faint o arian ychwanegol fydd ar gael ar gyfer gwasanaethau cleifion mewnol. Pam felly na ddylid symud yr holl rai sy'n llanw gwely dros dymor hir drwy eu trosglwyddo'n syth i gartrefi preswyl preifat a chartrefi awdurdodau lleol? Mae'r gost yn uchel, ond nid yw'n ddim byd tebyg i gost cadw pobl yn yr ysbyty. Yn yr un modd, gallem drefnu i gartrefi nyrsio â'r cyfleusterau priodol gymryd yr holl gleifion nad oes arnynt angen nyrsio arbennig i ymadfer bedwar neu bum diwrnod ar ôl eu llawdriniaethau. Dylem ystyried efallai gyflawni rhestrau llawdriniaeth drwy'r nos gyda staff addas wedi'u drafftio i wneud y gwaith. Wedi'r cwbl, mae'n rhaid mai'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yw'r unig fusnes gwerth miliynau o bunnoedd yn y byd sy'n rhedeg ar wythnos 40 awr. Mae ganddo gostau cyfalaf anferth, gan gynnwys offer, ac mae'n dihoeni. Gallem glirio'r holl restrau aros i gleifion mewnol gyda menter anferth yn defnyddio cartrefi nyrsio preifat.

Ann Jones: Pe gwireddid hynny, a ragwelwch y byddai ymgynghorwyr sy'n gweithio yn y sector preifat yn dychwelyd i'r GIG, a rhoi'r amser hwnnw'n rhad ac am ddim i'r GIG fel y gellid cyflawni llawdriniaethau yn ystod y nos?

William Graham: Ni fyddwn ond yn mynnu eu bod yn gweithio'r amser sydd yn eu contract.

Ann Jones: Sef?

William Graham: Y contract a gytunwyd rhwng y GIG, yr ymgynghorydd a—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. We cannot have conversations going on all over the place.

William Graham: I raised the position of audits with the Minister the other day. Audits no longer take place in clinical working time. Everyone gets paid for a non-clinical session to do this, at a different time for each person. When the whole hospital stops to undertake a simultaneous audit, one day a month on a rolling basis, no operations are performed except in emergency situations. This current arrangement effectively costs the NHS a day's work per month, or 5 per cent of the possible total.

Let us consider ambulance trips to and from hospital. Many of these are little more than a taxi service. That could, perhaps, be more closely investigated to see that clinical priorities are maintained. Also, could we commit some of this new money to increasing the numbers of nursing staff, which has already been described—particularly radiographers and technicians who need an immediate pay increase? Why not run MRI and CT scanners all night? There is no excuse for wasting equipment on that basis.

Peter Law: Given this fountain of innovation, why did the Conservatives not implement any of these ideas during their 18 years in power? They were as relevant then as they are now.

William Graham: I am delighted with that question. Our trust system was approaching that with adequate flexibility—[*Interruption.*]

It seems a farce that national insurance contributions will almost destroy the increase afforded to social services. It is an insult for social services to be penalised like this by the Minister.

Kirsty Williams: I do not believe that any Member could disagree with much of the basic premise of the Conservative group's motion, or David Melding's measured

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Ni allwn gael sgysiau'n digwydd dros bob man.

William Graham: Codais gwestiwn archwiliadau gyda'r Gweinidog y dydd o'r blaen. Ni fydd archwilio'n digwydd mwyach mewn amser gweithio clinigol. Caiff pawb ei dalu am sesiwn anghlinigol i wneud hyn, ar amser gwahanol i bawb. Pan ddaw'r ysbty cyfan i stop i wneud archwiliad cydamserol, ar un diwrnod y mis ar sail dreigl, ni wneir dim llawdriniaethau ac eithrio mewn sefyllfaoedd o argyfwng. Mae'r drefn gyfredol hon i bob pwrpas yn costio diwrnod o waith y mis i'r GIG, neu 5 y cant o'r cyfanswm posibl.

Ystyriwn deithiau ambiwlans i'r ysbty ac oddi yno. Nid yw llawer o'r rhain yn fawr mwy na gwasanaeth tacsî. Gellid, efallai, edrych i mewn i hynny'n agosach i sicrhau y cynhelir blaenoriaethau clinigol. Hefyd, a allem ymrwymo rhywfaint o'r arian newydd hwn i gynyddu niferoedd staff nyrsio, a ddisgrifiwyd eisoes—yn arbennig radiograffwyr a thechnegwyr sydd angen codiad cyflog ar unwaith? Beth am redeg sganwyr MRI a CT drwy'r nos? Nid oes dim esgus dros wastraffu offer fel hyn.

Peter Law: Yn wyneb y ffynnon hon o arloesedd, pam na weithredodd y Ceidwadwyr ddim o'r syniadau hyn yn ystod eu 18 mlynedd mewn grym? Yr oeddent mor berthnasol bryd hynny ag y maent yn awr.

William Graham: Yr wyf wrth fy modd â'r cwestiwn hwnnw. Yr oedd ein system ymddiriedolaethau ni'n nesáu at hynny gyda hyblygrwydd digonol—[*Torri ar draws.*]

Mae'n ymddangos yn chwerthinllyd y bydd cyfraniadau yswiriant gwladol bron yn dileu'r cynnydd a roddir i wasanaethau cymdeithasol. Mae'n sarhad i'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol gael eu cosbi fel hyn gan y Gweinidog.

Kirsty Williams: Ni chredaf y gallai unrhyw Aelod anghytuno â llawer o ragosodiad sylfaenol cynnig y grŵp Ceidwadol, nac â chyflwyniad pwylllog David Melding ohono.

presentation of it. That leads me to the million dollar question of why David Melding is a member of the Conservative Party and not of one of the other parties represented here. He certainly is a breed apart from the rest of his colleagues, at least until he raises the issue of private sector involvement—to which we will return later, David.

David's points on staff recruitment are vital and remain a challenge to the National Assembly for Wales. They are intrinsically bound to the Conservative Party's points on capital investment in the system. However, an important factor in the recruitment and retention of staff in the NHS is the availability of a supportive environment, and the opportunity to work in such an environment. We cannot expect consultants to practise alone any more. It is not good for them personally, nor is it good for the delivery of good quality care. We cannot expect other professionals in the service to work in isolated conditions, miles away from colleagues undertaking similar work. It is not good for basic patient care if that is allowed to continue. Potentially long out-of-hours duties and the requirement to travel great distances to deliver care undermine the Assembly's attempts to recruit and retain staff. We must create a caring environment for a caring profession in a way that truly values their contribution and is flexible enough to meet the needs of the individual. We must also grasp the nettle of organising service delivery and tackle the issue raised by David of where the money goes. Dr Gibbons is right that this problem is not confined to Wales. However, we cannot ignore it, Brian. I would welcome an early opportunity, through the Health and Social Services Committee, to investigate the blockages that are frustrating the Government in Wales in delivering a better healthcare system for our citizens. Undoubtedly, extra money is available, but that is not delivering the increases in services that we want and expect to see on the ground.

4:40 p.m.

Brian Gibbons: The Wanless report has attempted to address some of these problems,

Mae hynny'n fy arwain at y cwestiwn miliwn doler, sef pam mae David Melding yn aelod o'r Blaid Geidwadol ac nid o un o'r pleidiau eraill a gynrychiolir yma. Mae'n sicr yn frîd ar wahân i weddill ei gyd-Aelodau, o leiaf hyd nes cwyd gwestiwn cyfraniad y sector preifat—y deuw'n yn ôl ato'n ddiweddarach, David.

Mae pwyntiau David ar recriwtio staff yn hanfodol ac yn dal i fod yn her i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Maent ynghlwm yn annatod wrth bwyntiau'r Blaid Geidwadol ar fuddsoddi cyfalaf yn y system. Fodd bynnag, ffactor pwysig i recriwtio a chadw staff yn y GIG yw bod amgylchedd cefnogol ar gael, a chyfle i weithio mewn amgylchedd o'r fath. Ni allwn ddisgwyl i ymgynghorwyr weithio ar eu pen eu hunain mwyach. Nid yw'n dda iddynt hwy'n bersonol, nac yn dda i sicrhau gofal o ansawdd da. Ni allwn ddisgwyl i weithwyr proffesiynol eraill yn y gwasanaeth weithio mewn amodau ynysig, filltiroedd i ffwrdd oddi wrth gydwethwyr sy'n gwneud gwaith tebyg. Nid yw'n llesol i ofal cleifion sylfaenol os caniateir i hynny barhau. Mae'r posibilrwydd o weithio oriau hir y tu allan i'r oriau gwaith arferol a'r gofyniad i deithio'n bell i ddarparu gofal yn tanseilio ymdrechion y Cynulliad i recriwtio a chadw staff. Rhaid inni greu amgylchedd gofalgwr i broffesiwn sy'n gofalu mewn modd sy'n gwirioneddol werthfawrogi eu cyfraniad ac sy'n ddigon hyblyg i ateb anghenion yr unigolyn. Rhaid inni hefyd wasgu'r danadl o drefnu cyflwyniad y gwasanaeth a mynd i'r afael â'r cwestiwn a godwyd gan David ynghylch ble yr â'r arian. Mae Dr Gibbons yn iawn nad yw'r broblem hon yn gyfyngedig i Gymru. Er hynny, ni allwn ei hanwybyddu, Brian. Croesawn gyfle cynnar, drwy'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, i ymchwilio i'r tagfeydd sydd yn rhwystro'r Llywodraeth yng Nghymru rhag darparu system gofal iechyd gwell i'n dinasyddion. Yn sicr, mae arian ychwanegol ar gael, ond nid yw hynny'n sicrhau'r gwasanaethau mwy y mae arnom eu heisiau ac y disgwyliwn eu gweld ar lawr gwlad.

Brian Gibbons: Mae adroddiad Wanless wedi ceisio ymdrin â rhai o'r problemau hyn,

highlighting the fact that they relate to buildings and lack of staff and equipment. It is not rocket science, but it takes more than a couple of years to train extra staff; it takes virtually a decade to bring them on line. When William Graham asks why these issues are not being tackled now, it is simply because there was no investment in training when his party was in power. I am sorry, William, but it is as simple as that—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. This intervention is supposed to be to Kirsty Williams, not to William Graham. You will find it much harder to catch my eye in future if you make interventions to people other than the Member speaking at the time.

Kirsty Williams: Brian is right to look back at the Conservatives Party's record on NHS staff recruitment. It is true—you cannot deny it, and David Melding would accept this—that there was a cut in nursing training places and there was a lack of workforce planning. However, there is no point harking back to that time, as it does not help the patients who are waiting today, although it is a fact that you cannot deny—

David Davies: Will you give way?

Kirsty Williams: No, because I will run out of time.

Whatever the proposals for private sector involvement—whether that be through procurement schemes or the management of provision of services—we need to test the appropriateness of its use. Will the private sector ensure enhanced equity and quality and will it be good value for money? Will it be sustainable and sufficiently flexible in the medium to long term? Can it help maintain and foster the public service ethos? We need to judge individual circumstances against those tests.

Finally, the most important test is whether it will avoid the exploitation of staff and provide for the development of a committed and skilled workforce in the NHS. If those tests are applied and the private sector proves to be more satisfactory than the public sector,

gan danlinellu'r ffaith bod a wnelont ag adeiladau a diffyg staff ac offer. Nid gwyddoniaeth rocedi mohoni, ond mae'n cymryd mwy na blwyddyn neu ddwy i hyfforddi staff ychwanegol; mae'n cymryd degawd, fwy neu lai, i'w cyflwyno. Pan ofynna William Graham pam nad yw'r materion hyn yn cael eu datrys yn awr, y rheswm syml yw nad oedd dim buddsoddiad mewn hyfforddi pan oedd ei blaid ef mewn grym. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, William, ond mae mor syml â hynny—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Ymyriad i Kirsty Williams yw hwn i fod, nid i William Graham. Fe'i cewch yn llawer anoddach dal fy llygad yn y dyfodol os gwnewch ymyriadau i bobl ar wahân i'r Aelod sy'n siarad ar y pryd.

Kirsty Williams: Mae Brian yn iawn i edrych yn ôl ar record y Blaid Geidwadol ar recriwtio staff i'r GIG. Mae'n wir—ni allwch ei wadu, a byddai David Melding yn derbyn hyn—y cwtogwyd lleoedd hyfforddi i nyrsys ac y bu diffyg cynllunio gweithlu. Fodd bynnag, nid oes pwynt rhygnu ymlaen am yr adeg honno, gan nad yw hynny'n helpu'r cleifion sydd yn disgwyl heddiw, er ei bod yn ffaith ddiymwad—

David Davies: A wnewch chi ildio?

Kirsty Williams: Na wnaif, oherwydd byddaf yn rhedeg allan o amser.

Beth bynnag yw'r cynigion ar gyfer cyfranogiad y sector preifat—boed hynny drwy gynlluniau prynu neu reoli darpariaeth gwasanaethau—mae angen profi priodoldeb ei ddefnyddio. A fydd y sector preifat yn sicrhau mwy o degwch ac ansawdd ac a fydd yn rhoi gwerth da am yr arian? A fydd yn gynaliadwy ac yn ddigon hyblyg yn y tymor canolig i hir? A all helpu cynnal a meithrin ethos gwasanaeth cyhoeddus? Mae angen barnu amgylchiadau unigol yn erbyn y profion hynny.

Yn olaf, y prawf pwysicaf yw a fydd yn osgoi ecsbloetio staff ac yn darparu ar gyfer datblygu gweithlu ymroddedig a medrus yn y GIG. Os defnyddir y profion hynny a chanfod bod y sector preifat yn fwy boddhaol na'r sector cyhoeddus, nid yw'r cwestiwn o elw'n

the question of profit is simply not relevant—it is about that particular service. However, to date, the current assessment methods do not provide a fair comparison between public and private sector service deliveries, nor is it adequate at the moment. That undermines the Conservatives' and New Labour's claim of pragmatism on these issues because there is no fair way of judging the schemes against each other.

As a Liberal Democrat, I am proud of our record as a party; we have consistently called for increased funding for the NHS over the years. We did so during the Conservative years and again during the early years of the Labour Government. I am proud that we were honest enough to tell the electorate, during last year's general election, that taxes would have to rise to pay for the NHS when the Labour Party was not prepared to do so. The situation is now rectifying itself. I welcome the increased resources that the NHS in Wales will receive, but I regret that we will have to pay back £12 million a year in national insurance contributions to achieve that investment.

The Labour Party in London has missed an opportunity. The European Observatory on Healthcare Systems, in conjunction with the World Bank, identified that general taxation was the best way of providing for a healthcare method in Wales. It searched Europe and did not find a better way of providing it, which puts Liam Fox's grand tour of Europe into disrepute. It has identified taxation as the best and only way of providing an equitable and fair way of financing a health service. No-one in this Chamber can get away from that.

Nick Bourne: It is good to be treated to an exercise in 'the Liberal Democrats—the wilderness years' and how, for the last 80 to 90 years, they have consistently called for more money to be spent. That is easy when you do not have the responsibility of exercising power. On Kirsty's attack on David Melding, I have known him for a long time and there is nothing in his speech or motion with which any true Conservative would disagree. We are the party that has put

berthnasol o gwbl—y gwasanaeth arbennig hwnnw sy'n bwysig. Fodd bynnag, hyd yma, nid yw'r dulliau asesu cyfredol yn rhoi cymhariaeth deg rhwng y modd y cyflwynir gwasanaethau gan y sector cyhoeddus a'r sector preifat, ac nid yw ychwaith yn ddigonol ar hyn o bryd. Mae hynny'n tanseilio haerid y Ceidwadwyr a Llafur Newydd o bragmatiaeth ar y materion hyn oherwydd nid oes ffordd deg o faru'r cynlluniau yn erbyn ei gilydd.

Fel Democrat Rhyddfrydol, yr wyf yn falch o'n record fel plaid; yr ydym wedi galw'n gyson am fwy o arian i'r GIG dros y blynyddoedd. Gwnaethom hynny yn ystod blynyddoedd y Ceidwadwyr ac eto yn ystod blynyddoedd cynnar y Llywodraeth Lafur. Yr wyf yn falch y buom yn ddigon gonest i ddweud wrth yr etholwyr, yn ystod etholiad cyffredinol y llynedd, y byddai'n rhaid i drethi godi i dalu am y GIG, pan nad oedd y Blaid Lafur yn barod i wneud hynny. Mae'r sefyllfa'n ei chywiro'i hun yn awr. Croesawaf yr adnoddau ychwanegol a gaiff y GIG yng Nghymru, ond gresynaf y bydd yn rhaid inni dalu £12 miliwn y flwyddyn yn ôl mewn cyfraniadau yswiriant gwladol er mwyn sicrhau'r buddsoddiad hwnnw.

Mae'r Blaid Lafur yn Llundain wedi colli cyfle. Nododd yr Arsyllfa Ewropeaidd ar Systemau Gofal Iechyd, ar y cyd â Banc y Byd, mai trethiant cyffredinol oedd y ffordd orau i ddarparu ar gyfer dull gofal iechyd yng Nghymru. Chwilioedd Ewrop ac ni ddarganfu ffordd well o'i ddarparu, sydd yn dwyn anfri ar daith fawr Liam Fox o gwmpas Ewrop. Nododd mai trethiant oedd y ffordd orau a'r unig ffordd i ddarparu dull cyfiawn a theg o ariannu gwasanaeth iechyd. Ni all neb yn y Siambr hon ddianc rhag hynny.

Nick Bourne: Mae'n dda cael y pleser o wrando ar 'Y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol—blynyddoedd y diffeithwch' a'r modd y maent, am yr 80 i 90 mlynedd diwethaf, wedi galw'n gyson am i ragor o arian gael ei wario. Mae hynny'n hawdd pan nad oes gennyh y cyfrifoldeb o arfer grym. O ran ymosodiad Kirsty ar David Melding, yr wyf fi yn ei adnabod ers talwm ac nid oes dim byd yn ei araith na'i gynnig y byddai unrhyw wir Geidwadwr yn anghytuno ag ef. Ni yw'r

more into the NHS year-on-year over the last 18 years. That, in fairness, has been continued under this Government, but we are talking about outcomes.

Kirsty Williams: You must have misunderstood. I was not attacking Mr Melding. I was commending his performance today and asking, as is often asked throughout Wales, why he finds himself a member of your party. You are lucky to have him.

Nick Bourne: I agree with your last comment. However, do not live in hope of David joining your bunch, because we have nothing but contempt for how you sold out for a mess of pottage—what was initially two seats in the Cabinet, but is now one seat with an understudy waiting in the wings, and long may he wait there.

Jonathan Morgan: Perhaps the Liberal Democrats should spend more time asking why so many of their colleagues are returning to the Conservative fold, such as Councillor Heather Douglas of Cardiff.

Peter Law: They will take anybody.

Jonathan Morgan: Even you, Peter.

Nick Bourne: We would not wish that on Peter. I return to the motion and to this serious issue. The Government is spending more on healthcare. However, although it has increased spending by 30 per cent, there has only been a 3 per cent increase in the activity rate, and we must focus on that.

There is a problem with waiting lists. William referred to orthopaedic waiting lists, and all Members know from their constituency postbags that these are a serious problem. Hip replacement waiting lists are a problem in Brecon and Radnorshire, as Kirsty Williams knows. However, there is a more serious problem with bypass surgery. We currently have a two-tier system, which I abhor. Those who can afford to go private do

blaid sydd wedi rhoi mwy i mewn i'r GIG flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn dros y 18 mlynedd diwethaf. Mae hynny, er tegwch, wedi parhau dan y Llywodraeth hon, ond yr ydym yn sôn am ganlyniadau.

Kirsty Williams: Mae'n rhaid eich bod wedi camddeall. Nid oeddwn yn ymosod ar Mr Melding. Yr oeddwn yn cymeradwyo'i berfformiad heddiw ac yn holi, fel a holir yn aml drwy Gymru, pam y mae'n ei gael ei hun yn aelod o'ch plaid chi. Yr ydych yn ffodus i'w gael.

Nick Bourne: Cytunaf â'ch sylw diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, peidiwch â byw mewn gobaith y gwnaiff David ymuno â'ch ciwed chi, oherwydd nid oes gennym ddim ond dirmyg at y modd y bu i chi werthu'ch enaid am ddysglaid o botes—yr hyn a oedd ar y dechrau yn ddwy sedd yn y Cabinet, ond sydd bellach yn un sedd gydag eilydd yn disgwyl ei dro, a boed iddo ddisgwyl yno'n hir.

Jonathan Morgan: Efallai y dylai'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol dreulio mwy o amser yn holi pam y mae cynifer o'u cyd-aelodau'n dychwelyd i gorlan y Ceidwadwyr, fel y Cynghorydd Heather Douglas yng Nghaerdydd.

Peter Law: Fe gymerant hwy unrhyw un.

Jonathan Morgan: Hyd yn oed chi, Peter.

Nick Bourne: Ni fyddem yn dymuno hynny i Peter. Dychwelaf at y cynnig ac at y mater difrifol hwn. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn gwario mwy ar ofal iechyd. Fodd bynnag, er iddi gynyddu gwariant 30 y cant, dim ond cynnydd o 3 y cant a gafwyd yn y gyfradd weithgaredd, a rhaid inni ganolbwytio ar hynny.

Mae problem gyda rhestrau aros. Cyfeiriodd William at restrau aros orthopedig, a gŵyr pob Aelod o fagiau post eu hetholaethau fod y rhain yn broblem ddifrifol. Mae rhestrau aros am glun newydd yn broblem ym Mrycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed, fel y gŵyr Kirsty Williams. Fodd bynnag, mae problem fwy difrifol gyda llawfeddygaeth ddargyfeiriol. Mae gennym system ddwy haen ar hyn o bryd, sy'n wrthun i mi. Gall y

so, and they receive the lifesaving treatment or their hip replacement operation. Those who cannot afford to go private must linger on the waiting list. That situation is at the heart of our motion.

I do not understand those who criticise the Conservative Party for drawing European comparisons. There is no waiting list problem in Germany or in France. We should admit that we have lessons to learn from other countries.

Peter Black: Is it not the case that, if Liam Fox had his way, the two-tier system would be made worse? More people would have to pay for NHS care and more consultants would be distracted from their duties to provide that care.

Nick Bourne: That is not the case. The Conservative Party is committed to a fully-funded public system for all who need it. If you read their comments, you would see that Liam Fox and Iain Duncan Smith are at the forefront of that commitment. That has been central to Conservative belief for at least half a century, and it is certainly central to my belief.

Another problem, which has already been mentioned, is that people in hospitals cannot move into residential care, partly because many homes are having to close. We must consider this problem in the round, as it involves both the health and social services budgets. I hope that the Minister will address that. Funding residential care is a problem, particularly in the independent sector. We are losing residential home places, which exacerbates bedblocking in hospitals and means that we can treat fewer patients. That could easily be cured with an injection of cash into the social services budget. I hope that the Minister will address that.

I disagree to an extent with David on primary care. Although it is largely true that there is no problem with the primary care sector, there is a problem in attracting doctors to some rural areas. I was told in a telephone conversation half an hour ago that there is a

rheini a all fforddio mynd yn breifat wneud hynny, a chânt y driniaeth achub bywyd neu glun newydd. Rhaid i'r rheini na all fforddio mynd yn breifat gicio'u sodlau ar y rhestr aros. Mae'r sefyllfa honno wrth galon ein cynnig.

Nid wyf yn deall y rheini sy'n beirniadu'r Blaid Geidwadol am wneud cymariaethau ag Ewrop. Nid oes problem â rhestrau aros yn yr Almaen nac yn Ffrainc. Dylem gyfaddef fod gennym wersi i'w dysgu oddi wrth wledydd eraill.

Peter Black: Onid yw'n wir, pe câi Liam Fox ei ffordd, y gwneid y system ddwy haen yn waeth? Byddai'n rhaid i fwy o bobl dalu am ofal y GIG a châi mwy o ymgynghorwyr eu llygad-dynnu oddi wrth eu dyletswyddau i ddarparu'r gofal hwnnw.

Nick Bourne: Nid yw hynny'n wir. Mae'r Blaid Geidwadol wedi ymrwymo i system gyhoeddus wedi'i hariannu'n llawn i bawb sydd ei hangen. Pe darllenech eu sylwadau, fe welech fod Liam Fox ac Iain Duncan Smith ar flaen y gad gyda'r ymrwymiad hwnnw. Bu hynny'n ganolog i gred y Ceidwadwyr ers o leiaf hanner canrif, ac yn sicr mae'n ganolog i'm cred i.

Problem arall, a grybwyllwyd eisoes, yw na all pobl mewn ysbytai symud i ofal preswyl, yn rhannol am fod llawer o gartrefi'n gorfod cau. Rhaid inni ystyried y broblem hon yn ei holl agweddau, gan ei bod yn ymwneud â chyllidebau iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ill dau. Gobeithiaf y gwnaiff y Gweinidog roi sylw i hynny. Mae ariannu gofal preswyl yn broblem, yn enwedig yn y sector annibynnol. Yr ydym yn colli lleoedd mewn cartrefi preswyl, sy'n gwaethygu'r sefyllfa gyda gwelyau mewn ysbytai ac yn golygu y gallwn drin llai o gleifion. Gellid datrys hynny'n hawdd gyda chwistrelliad o arian i gyllideb y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Gobeithiaf y gwnaiff y Gweinidog roi sylw i hynny.

Anghytunaf i raddau â David ar ofal sylfaenol. Er ei bod yn wir i raddau helaeth nad oes problem gyda'r sector gofal sylfaenol, y mae problem o ran denu meddygon i rai ardaloedd gwledig. Dywedwyd wrthyf mewn sgwrs ffôn hanner

two to three-week wait to see a general practitioner in Hay-on-Wye. Therefore, there are problems with the primary care sector in rural Wales.

Although these problems cannot be solved easily, the Minister could announce constructive measures in relation to the social services budget, for example, that would allow us to treat more patients and save more lives.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I hope that Nick's succinctness will be mirrored by other speakers, as time is limited.

Peter Law: I cannot understand why this important debate appears as a Conservative debate; I suppose that they were opportunistic, as they usually are. However, we have no misapprehensions. Everyone knows that the Labour Party is the party of the national health service. The Labour Party founded the NHS and it will be safe with us. We do not need lessons from the Tories on that. They have been non-believers in the NHS for a long time. We know from what we hear from their ranks that they are divided on the NHS, although David Melding tried to gloss that over. David is an honourable person, and it was nice to hear Kirsty's tribute to him. It appears that David and Kirsty have a mutual admiration society. However, I would not begin to trust the political charlatans of the Assembly with a priceless public asset such as the national health service. When they were in command, we remember that they were poor on innovation, poor on strategy and extremely poor on compassion. Nick Bourne says that he wants a health service that serves everyone. Those are empty words, as they always have been from the Tories. Whenever they were in charge, the poor people were penalised.

4:50 p.m.

David Melding: Thank you for insulting me. I was getting worried about the plaudits that I was receiving from various political parties. You criticise our management of the NHS and the health reforms that we initiated. Do you feel uncomfortable now that Alan Milburn has said that money must follow the

awr yn ôl fod yn rhaid aros dwy i dair wythnos cyn gweld meddyg teulu yn y Gelli Gandryll. Felly, y mae problemau gyda'r sector gofal sylfaenol yn y Gymru wledig.

Er na ellir datrys y problemau hyn yn hawdd, gallai'r Gweinidog gyhoeddi mesurau adeiladol mewn perthynas â chyllideb y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, er enghraifft, a fyddai'n caniatáu inni drin mwy o gleifion ac achub mwy o fywydau.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Gobeithiaf y caiff crynoder Nick ei adlewyrchu gan siaradwyr eraill, gan fod amser yn brin.

Peter Law: Ni allaf ddeall pam y mae'r ddadl bwysig hon yn ymddangos fel dadl Geidwadol; mae'n debyg eu bod yn bachu ar gyfle, fel arfer. Fodd bynnag, nid oes gennym unrhyw gamargraffiadau. Gŵyr pawb mai'r Blaid Lafur yw plaid y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Y Blaid Lafur a sylfaenodd y GIG a bydd yn ddiogel gyda ni. Nid oes arnom angen gwersi gan y Toriaid am hynny. Maent hwy'n anghredinwyr yn y GIG ers amser maith. Gwyddom o'r hyn a glywn yn eu rhengoedd eu bod yn rhanedig ar y GIG, er y ceisiodd David Melding wneud yn fach o hynny. Mae David yn berson anrhydeddus, a da oedd clywed teyrnged Kirsty iddo. Mae'n debyg fod gan David a Kirsty gymdeithas werthfawrogi'i gilydd. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddwn yn dechrau ymddiried yn ymhonwyr gwleidyddol y Cynulliad i ofalu am ased cyhoeddus amhrisiadwy fel y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Pan oeddent mewn grym, cofiwn eu bod yn wan o ran arloesedd, yn wan o ran strategaeth ac yn eithriadol o wan o ran tosturi. Dywed Nick Bourne fod arno eisiau gwasanaeth iechyd sy'n gwasanaethu pawb. Geiriau gwag yw'r rheini, fel y buont bob amser gan y Toriaid. Pryd bynnag y buont mewn grym, cosbwyd y bobl dlawd.

David Melding: Diolch am fy sarhau. Yr oeddwn yn dechrau poeni am y clod yr oeddwn yn ei gael gan y gwahanol bleidiau. Yr ydych yn beirniadu'n rheolaeth o'r GIG a'r diwygiadau a gychwynasom ym maes iechyd. A ydych yn teimlo'n anghysurus yn awr bod Alan Milburn wedi dweud bod yn

patient? That was a fundamental principle of our NHS reforms, and your party is now repeating it.

Peter Law: The Conservative Party does not have any credibility in terms of the NHS. We all remember how you administered it. I pay tribute to the Chancellor of the Exchequer, Gordon Brown, whose announcement represented the best piece of socialism that I have seen from the Labour Government since 1997. This is socialism in action, and we now have long-term funding to ensure a strong future for the national health service.

Kirsty Williams: Do you agree that it would have been a stronger socialist principle had the new investment in the health service been achieved through income tax, based on a person's ability to pay, rather than it being based on national insurance, which affects everyone, including those who are less able to afford it?

Peter Law: I welcome the fact that it is achieved by tax because it is a break from tradition. It will be in the interests of NHS patients and the companies that contribute towards it to ensure a healthier workforce. We will see a record investment of billions of pounds in the NHS over the next five years, and I am proud of that. We must get to grips with the NHS and recognise that it is a victim of its own success. It is subject to great technological advances. People are living longer, and I am pleased about that; however, that comes at a price. We must catch up with it, which we have not been able to do in the past.

We must ensure that adequate audit is built into the system. The Minister has not been dithering on this issue. She has been consulting on it in the right and responsible way. She will tell us how she intends to develop this in future following sound consideration.

Our NHS is a world-beater and we must ensure that it stays that way. I agree with some of the universal points made today. We need more beds. We cannot address the problems without more beds. We also need more staff to support those beds. We should all agree on that, and I hope that we have an

rhaid i arian ddilyn y claf? Dyna un o egwyddorion sylfaenol ein diwygiadau ni, ac mae'ch plaid chi'n awr yn ei ailadrodd.

Peter Law: Nid oes gan y Blaid Geidwadol unrhyw hygredd o ran y GIG. Yr ydym i gyd yn cofio sut y gwnaethoch ei weinyddu. Talaf deyrnged i Ganghellor y Trysorlys, Gordon Brown, am gyhoeddiad a oedd yr esiampl orau o sosialaeth a welais gan y Llywodraeth Lafur er 1997. Dyma sosialaeth ar waith, ac yn awr mae gennym gyllid tymor hir i sicrhau dyfodol cryf i'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol.

Kirsty Williams: A gytunwch y buasai'n egwyddor sosialaidd gryfach pe bai'r buddsoddiad newydd yn y gwasanaeth iechyd wedi'i sicrhau drwy dreth incwm, yn seiliedig ar allu rhywun i dalu, yn hytrach na'i seilio ar yswiriant gwladol, sy'n effeithio ar bawb, gan gynnwys y rhai hynny sy'n llai abl i'w fforddio?

Peter Law: Croesawaf y ffaith ei fod wedi'i sicrhau drwy dreth oherwydd ei bod yn torri oddi wrth draddodiad. Bydd er budd i gleifion y GIG a'i cwmnïau sy'n cyfrannu tuag ato sicrhau gweithlu iachach. Gwelwn fuddsoddiad mwy nag erioed, sef biliynau o bunnoedd, yn y GIG yn y pum mlynedd nesaf, ac yr wyf yn falch o hynny. Rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â'r GIG a sylweddoli ei fod yn dioddef effaith ei lwyddiant ei hun. Mae datblygiadau technolegol mawr yn effeithio arno. Mae pobl yn byw'n hŷn, ac yr wyf yn falch am hynny; ond daw hynny ar bris. Rhaid inni ei oddiweddyd, rhywbeth nad ydym wedi gallu'i wneud yn y gorffennol.

Rhaid inni sicrhau yr adeiledir trefn archwilio ddigonol i mewn i'r system. Nid yw'r Gweinidog wedi tin-droi ar y mater hwn. Mae wedi ymgynghori arno yn y ffordd iawn a chyfrifol. Fe ddywed wrthym sut y bwriada ddatblygu hyn yn y dyfodol ar ôl ystyriaeth ofalus.

Mae ein GIG y gorau yn y byd a rhaid inni sicrhau yr erys felly. Cytunaf â rhai o'r pwyntiau cyffredinol a wnaed heddiw. Mae angen mwy o welyau. Ni allwn ddatrys y broblem heb fwy o welyau. Mae angen mwy o staff hefyd i gynnal y gwelyau hynny. Dylem i gyd gytuno ar hynny, a gobeithiaf y

opportunity to do so in future.

Kirsty Williams mentioned the loss of renal services to Bristol. I want those services to return to Wales as soon as possible. Having to travel to Bristol for treatment and stay there overnight causes trauma and inconvenience to many of our constituents. I am sure that the Minister will consider that issue.

The speech and language therapy problem gets worse every day. We must improve this service, as it involves the future of our young children. Those children will be cursed for the rest of their lives if we do not address the problem of speech and language therapy. In February, there were 1,700 children waiting for first assessment appointments in the former Gwent area. That cannot be right. There were 300 in my constituency and about 500 in Newport. I hope that the Minister will pursue this issue given the new funding allocation.

Alun Cairns: It is often said that the Assembly Government, and the Assembly in general, will be judged on whether it manages to transform the economy. However, bearing in mind that the Assembly is the machine that delivers public services in Wales and that the NHS is one of the most important public services, the performance of the NHS will be a test of the Assembly and, more importantly, of the Assembly Government. Peter Law claims that the Labour Party is the party of the NHS. Since the NHS was established in 1948, the Conservative Government has been in Government much longer than the Labour Party. The NHS flourished throughout that period, including the 18 years—

David Davies: The 18 golden years.

Alun Cairns: Yes, including the 18 golden years of Conservative government. Our investment in the health service during that time was way above inflation. I will develop my debate about Labour's commitment later. Let the Assembly Government be judged in 12 months' time on healthcare quality and waiting times.

cawn gyfle i wneud hynny yn y dyfodol.

Soniodd Kirsty Williams am golli gwasanaethau arenol i Fryste. Mae arnaf i eisiau cael y gwasanaethau hynny'n ôl i Gymru cyn gynted ag y bo modd. Mae gorfod teithio i Fryste am driniaeth ac aros dros nos yn achosi gofid ac anghyfleustra i lawer o'n hetholwyr. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnaiff y Gweinidog ystyried y mater hwn.

Mae'r broblem therapi lleferydd ac iaith yn gwaethgu bob dydd. Rhaid inni wella'r gwasanaeth hwn, gan ei fod yn ymwneud â dyfodol ein plant ifanc. Bydd y plant hynny wedi'u melltithio am weddill eu hoes os nad awn i'r afael â phroblem therapi lleferydd ac iaith. Yn Chwefror, yr oedd 1,700 o blant yn aros am apwyntiadau asesiad cyntaf yn hen ardal Gwent. Ni all hynny fod yn iawn. Yr oedd 300 yn f'etholaeth i a rhyw 500 yng Nghasnewydd. Gobeithiaf yr aiff y Gweinidog ar ôl y mater hwn yn sgîl cael y dyraniad cyllid newydd.

Alun Cairns: Dywedir yn aml y caiff Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, a'r Cynulliad yn gyffredinol, ei barnu wrth ei llwyddiant yn gweddnewid yr economi. Er hynny, o gofio mai'r Cynulliad yw'r peiriant sy'n cyflwyno gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru ac mai'r GIG yw un o'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus pwysicaf, bydd perfformiad y GIG yn brawf ar y Cynulliad ac, yn bwysicach, ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Honna Peter Law mai'r Blaid Lafur yw plaid y GIG. Ers sefydlu'r GIG yn 1948, bu'r Llywodraeth Geidwadol mewn grym yn llawer hwy na'r Blaid Lafur. Ffynnai'r GIG drwy gydol y cyfnod hwnnw, gan gynnwys y 18 mlynedd—

David Davies: Y 18 mlynedd euraid.

Alun Cairns: Ie, gan gynnwys y 18 mlynedd euraid o lywodraeth Geidwadol. Yr oedd ein buddsoddiad yn y gwasanaeth iechyd yn ystod yr adeg honno yn llawer uwch na chwyddiant. Datblygaf fy nadl am ymrwymiad Llafur wedyn. Gadewch i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad gael ei barnu ymhen 12 mis wrth ansawdd gofal iechyd ac amserau aros.

David Melding, who made an excellent contribution in proposing the motion, was a little too kind in many ways. However, I do not blame David for that; he has a kind and generous nature. He reminded us of the Labour Party's Assembly election manifesto pledges. It is worth taking one step back. The Labour Party's commitment at the 1997 general election was to cut waiting lists by 5,000 as a first step. If that was the first step, it must be the first step backwards because it has not made progress on healthcare delivery and waiting list performance since 1999. As David Melding said, Labour's manifesto for the Assembly elections stated that no-one would wait longer than 18 months for inpatient treatment. However, the number of people waiting longer than that has increased by 62 per cent. It also stated that no-one would wait longer than 6 months for outpatient treatment, but that number has increased by 167 per cent.

John Griffiths said that this was a historic occasion for the health service because of the large sums of investment in the NHS. We recognise and welcome that investment. We supported the Government when it was announced in the Chamber. However, it is a historic occasion for a different reason, as we have the worst health statistics on record since 1948, as Peter Law referred to some time ago. It is fair to say—

Brian Gibbons: On the strength of that, can we assume that the Conservative Party in the House of Commons will vote for the necessary extra expenditure?

Alun Cairns: I am glad that Brian Gibbons asked that question, as I will discuss that later.

Statistics can usually prove anything. As I studied statistics and statistical techniques briefly, I looked at the figures to try to find a way in which the Assembly Government and the Minister for Health and Social Services could put a positive glow on the current health statistics. However, all the key measures show large increases—1,116 per cent in one case—since the Assembly Government came to power. That is the acid

Yr oedd David Melding, a wnaeth gyfraniad ardderchog wrth gynnig y cynnig, ychydig yn rhy garedig mewn sawl ffordd. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn gweld bai ar David am hynny; mae ganddo natur garedig a haelionus. Atgoffodd ni am addewidion maniffesto Llafur ar gyfer etholiad y Cynulliad. Mae'n werth cymryd un cam yn ôl. Ymrwymiad y Blaid Lafur yn etholiad cyffredinol 1997 oedd cwtogi 5,000 oddi ar restrau aros fel cam cyntaf. Os hwnnw oedd y cam cyntaf, mae'n rhaid mai'r cam cyntaf tuag yn ôl ydyw oherwydd na symudwyd ymlaen o ran darparu gofal iechyd a pherfformiad rhestrau aros ers 1999. Fel y dywedodd David Melding, datganodd maniffesto Llafur ar gyfer etholiadau'r Cynulliad na fyddai neb yn aros mwy na 18 mis am driniaeth claf mewnol. Er hynny, mae'r nifer o bobl sy'n aros yn hwy na hynny wedi cynyddu 62 y cant. Datganodd hefyd na fyddai neb yn aros mwy na 6 mis am driniaeth claf allanol, ond cynyddodd y nifer honno 167 y cant.

Dywedodd John Griffiths fod hwn yn achlysur hanesyddol i'r gwasanaeth iechyd oherwydd y symiau mawr a fuddsoddir yn y GIG. Yr ydym yn cydnabod ac yn croesawu'r buddsoddiad hwnnw. Bu inni gefnogi'r Llywodraeth pan y'i cyhoeddwyd yn y Siambr. Fodd bynnag, mae'n achlysur hanesyddol am reswm arall, gan fod gennym yr ystadegau iechyd gwaethaf ar gofnod ers 1948, fel y soniodd Peter Law ychydig yn ôl. Mae'n deg dweud—

Brian Gibbons: Ar sail hynny, a allwn ddisgwyl y bydd y Blaid Geidwadol yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin yn pleidleisio dros y gwariant ychwanegol angenrheidiol?

Alun Cairns: Yr wyf yn falch bod Brian Gibbons wedi gofyn y cwestiwn hwnnw, gan y byddaf yn trafod hynny toc.

Gall ystadegau brofi unrhyw beth fel arfer. Gan i mi astudio ystadegau a thechnegau ystadegol un tro, edrychais ar y ffigurau i geisio dod o hyd i ffordd y gallai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol roi sglein cadarnhaol ar yr ystadegau iechyd cyfredol. Fodd bynnag, mae pob mesuriad allweddol yn dangos codiadau mawr—1,116 y cant mewn un achos—ers i Lywodraeth y

test on which the people will be invited to vote in the Assembly elections in 12 months' time.

Ann Jones: You said that you studied the statistics. Do you agree that activity rates have also increased and that 24,000 more inpatients and 86,000 more outpatients were treated in 2001 than in previous years? Therefore, more people are accessing the health service, which is free. If the consultants would give up their private time, we would have higher rates and shorter waiting times.

Alun Cairns: I recognise that activity rates and the number of operations have increased. That brings me to Brian Gibbons's point. There seems to be a competition between the Labour Party, the Liberal Democrats and Plaid Cymru about who should claim credit for the extra taxes that are being paid. Although spending over and above inflation on the NHS has increased by 25 per cent, the number of operations have only increased by 2 per cent, as David Melding highlighted. Therefore, the answer to the problem is not to throw more money at the health service but to restructure it and make effective use of resources—

Peter Law *rose*—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Alun Cairns is winding up.

Alun Cairns: You cannot increase spending by 25 per cent and only increase the number of operations by 2 per cent.

The state of the economy and the health service will be the ultimate test of devolution. However, there is another test. The purpose of devolution was to bring decision-making closer to the people. The latest report by the Specialised Health Service Commission for Wales, which seeks to move services to Cardiff from other parts of Wales, is in abject disregard of the purposes and principles of devolution. I hope that the Minister will use this opportunity to tell us whether SHSCW's proposals are open to public consultation, so that the public, Assembly Members and health authorities can all participate.

Cynulliad ddod i rym. Dyna'r ffon fesur y gwahoddir pobl i bleidleisio yn ei hól yn etholiadau'r Cynulliad ymhen 12 mis.

Ann Jones: Dywedasoch eich bod wedi astudio'r ystadegau. A gyfunwch fod cyfraddau gweithgaredd wedi cynyddu hefyd ac y triniwyd 24,000 yn fwy o gleifion mewnol ac 86,000 yn fwy o gleifion allanol yn 2001 nag yn y blynyddoedd cynt? Felly, mae mwy o bobl yn defnyddio'r gwasanaeth iechyd, a hynny am ddim. Petai'r ymgynghorwyr yn ildio'u hamser preifat, caem gyfraddau uwch ac amserau aros byrrach.

Alun Cairns: Sylweddolaf fod cyfraddau gweithgaredd a nifer y llawdriniaethau wedi codi. Daw hynny â mi at bwynt Brian Gibbons. Mae'n ymddangos bod cystadleuaeth rhwng y Blaid Lafur, y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a Phlaid Cymru ynghylch pwy ddylai hawlio'r clod am y trethi ychwanegol a delir. Er bod gwariant uwchben chwyddiant ar y GIG wedi codi 25 y cant, nid yw nifer y llawdriniaethau ond wedi codi 2 y cant, fel y dywedodd David Melding. Felly, yr ateb i'r broblem yw nid taflu mwy o arian at y gwasanaeth iechyd, ond ei ailstrwythuro a defnyddio adnoddau'n effeithiol—

Peter Law *a gododd*—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae Alun Cairns yn dirwyn i ben.

Alun Cairns: Ni allwch gynyddu gwariant 25 y cant a dim ond cynyddu 2 y cant ar nifer y llawdriniaethau.

Cyflwr yr economi a'r gwasanaeth iechyd fydd y prawf eithaf ar ddatganoli. Fodd bynnag, y mae prawf arall. Pwrpas datganoli oedd dod â'r broses wneud penderfyniadau'n nes at y bobl. Mae'r adroddiad diweddaraf gan y Comisiwn Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol Cymru, sy'n ceisio symud gwasanaethau i Gaerdydd o rannau eraill o Gymru, yn mynd yn gwbl groes i ddibenion ac egwyddorion datganoli. Gobeithio y defnyddia'r Gweinidog y cyfle hwn i ddweud wrthym a yw cynigion y comisiwn yn agored i ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus, fel y gall y cyhoedd, Aelodau'r Cynulliad ac

awdurdodau iechyd i gyd gymryd rhan.

5:00 p.m.

Geraint Davies: I declare an interest as a pharmacist, a county borough councillor and as someone whose family has used the health service extensively during the last few weeks. The service that we received was excellent, and I am grateful to all staff concerned. However, we cannot take the NHS for granted. When it works, it is the best health service in the world. Our job, as politicians, is to enable it to work, which means ensuring that it is properly resourced.

Geraint Davies: Datganaf fuddiant fel fferyllydd, cynghorydd bwrdeistref sirol ac fel rhywun y defnyddiodd ei deulu y gwasanaeth iechyd yn helaeth yn ystod yr ychydig wythnosau diwethaf. Yr oedd y gwasanaeth a gawsom yn rhagorol, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r holl staff perthnasol. Fodd bynnag, ni allwn gymryd y GIG yn ganiataol. Pan yw'n gweithio, dyma'r gwasanaeth iechyd gorau yn y byd. Ein gwaith ni, fel gwleidyddion, yw sicrhau y gall weithio, sy'n golygu sicrhau ei fod yn cael adnoddau priodol.

Plaid Cymru welcomes the announcement of increased Government spending; it is much needed. However, where is that money going? Are we to believe Paul Murphy, the Secretary of State for Wales, who says that it will go to the health service, or the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities who says that she has not yet decided where it will go? Which party line is the official version? One thing is certain: all of the money should go to the health service. The Welsh national health service needs it all, or standards will fall even further behind those in England.

Mae Plaid Cymru'n croesawu'r cyhoeddiad bod y Llywodraeth am wario mwy; mae mawr angen hynny. Fodd bynnag, i ble mae'r arian hwnnw'n mynd? A ydym i fod i gredu Paul Murphy, Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, sy'n dweud yr aiff i'r gwasanaeth iechyd, ynteu'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau, sy'n dweud nad yw wedi penderfynu eto i ble yr aiff? Pa bolisi plaid yw'r fersiwn swyddogol? Un peth sy'n sicr: dylai'r arian i gyd fynd i'r gwasanaeth iechyd. Mae angen y cyfan ar wasanaeth iechyd gwladol Cymru, neu bydd safonau'n syrthio ymhellach fyth ar ôl rhai Lloegr.

Wales is already falling behind in several specialisms. For example, since the national service framework for cardiac services was established in England, 30 catheterisation laboratories have been established there, and none in Wales. Such services are desperately needed throughout Wales. Rhondda Cynon Taff, an area that includes my constituency, has the highest number of heart disease sufferers in the country, but does not have angiogram facilities. Patients are referred to the University Hospital of Wales in the Heath, Cardiff, or to Morrision Hospital, Swansea. It is currently possible to treat eight patients from Rhondda Cynon Taff in that hospital. It should be able to treat 15 to 20, yet not even eight are usually treated: there are cancellations because the beds are not ring-fenced. It is a travesty, and causes tremendous anxiety to the patients concerned.

Mae Cymru eisoes ar ei hôl hi mewn sawl arbenigedd. Er enghraifft, ers sefydlu'r fframwaith gwasanaeth gwladol ar gyfer gwasanaethau'r galon yn Lloegr, sefydlwyd 30 o labordai cathetreiddio yno, a dim un yng Nghymru. Mae angen dirfawr am y fath wasanaethau ar hyd a lled Cymru. Yn Rhondda Cynon Taf, ardal sy'n cynnwys f'etholaeth i, ceir y nifer uchaf o ddiodefwyr o glefyd y galon yn y wlad, ond nid oes cyfleusterau angiogram yno. Cyfeirir cleifion i Ysbyty Prifysgol Cymru yn y Mynydd Bychan, Caerdydd, neu i Ysbyty Treforys, Abertawe. Ar hyn o bryd mae modd trin wyth o gleifion o Rondra Cynon Taf yn yr ysbyty hwnnw. Dylai allu trin 15 i 20, eto ni fydd hyd yn oed wyth yn cael triniaeth fel arfer: ni wneir rhai triniaethau am nad yw'r gwelyau wedi'u neilltuo i'r diben hwnnw. Mae'n warth, ac yn achosi pryder aruthrol i'r cleifion dan sylw.

The present eight-month waiting list for treatment would be much longer were it not for recent initiatives to reduce waiting times, namely using beds in private hospitals at enormous expense. That is a waste of resources. It would be far better to invest in services at district general hospital level, which Plaid Cymru called for 18 months ago.

The £25 million spent on temporary staff is another terrible waste of money, which also has a bad effect on the morale of permanent staff. The quality of patient care must be questioned when there is no continuity of staff. The cost of training a nurse is £30,000, and we should protect that investment. We should have flexible ways of working. More part-time work, job-share, and childcare provision should be offered. We should also make a greater effort to attract nurses back to their profession.

I therefore ask you to support amendment 5. I also ask you to support amendment 1, which calls for a publicly-funded health service, and amendment 3. I look forward to the opening of the new hospital in the Rhondda. It comes after a 20-year fight, and I am particularly pleased that it is to be publicly funded. That also follows a long fight that included the trade unions, and I congratulate them.

Ann Jones: Do you therefore pay tribute to Jane Hutt and the Labour-led Assembly, which funded the money for the Rhondda hospital out of the public purse? As you said, it follows a 20-year fight, and most of those years were under Tory rule.

Geraint Davies: Until the announcement, Labour was most avid to build it under a private finance initiative but, because of a campaign that included the trade union movement, you saw the sense of abandoning that plan. In doing so, you maintained the working conditions of the staff, their pension rights, and so on. Also the hospital was built sooner and there were more beds than originally planned. We need yet more, but that was an obvious benefit. You were persuaded by the arguments put forward by me and the trade union movement in favour

Byddai'r rhestr aros wyth mis bresennol am driniaeth yn llawer hwy oni bai am fentrau diweddar i leihau amserau aros, sef defnyddio gwelyau mewn ysbytai preifat ar gost aruthrol. Gwastraff adnoddau yw hynny. Byddai'n llawer gwell buddsoddi mewn gwasanaethau ar lefel ysbyty cyffredinol dosbarth, fel y galwodd Plaid Cymru amdano 18 mis yn ôl.

Mae'r £25 miliwn a wariwyd ar staff dros-dro yn wastraff arian ofnadwy hefyd, sydd hefyd yn effeithio'n wael ar ysbryd y staff parhaol. Rhaid cwestiynu ansawdd gofal cleifion pan nad oes dilyniant staff. £30,000 yw cost hyfforddi nyrs, a dylem warchod y buddsoddiad hwnnw. Dylem arddel ffyrdd hyblyg o weithio. Dylid cynnig mwy o waith rhan-amser, rhannu swyddi, a darpariaeth gofal plant. Dylem hefyd wneud mwy o ymdrech i ddenu nyrsys yn ôl i'w proffesiwn.

Gofynnaf felly ichi gefnogi gwelliant 5. Gofynnaf hefyd ichi gefnogi gwelliant 1, sy'n galw am wasanaeth iechyd wedi'i ariannu'n gyhoeddus, a gwelliant 3. Edrychaf ymlaen at weld agor yr ysbyty newydd yn y Rhondda. Daw wedi brwydr 20 mlynedd, ac yr wyf yn arbennig o falch y caiff ei ariannu'n gyhoeddus. Mae hynny hefyd yn dilyn brwydr hir gyda'r undebau llafur yn ei chanol hi, a llongyfarchaf hwy.

Ann Jones: A ydych felly'n talu teyrnged i Jane Hutt a'r Cynulliad dan arweiniad Llafur, a dalodd yr arian am ysbyty'r Rhondda o'r pwrs cyhoeddus? Fel y dywedasoch, mae'n dilyn brwydr 20 mlynedd, ac yr oedd y rhan fwyaf o'r blynyddoedd hynny dan reolaeth y Torïaid.

Geraint Davies: Tan y cyhoeddiad, yr oedd Llafur yn frwd iawn dros ei adeiladu drwy fenter cyllid preifat ond, oherwydd ymgyrch a oedd yn cynnwys y mudiad undebau llafur, gwelsoch mai callach fyddai rhoi heibio'r cynllun hwnnw. Wrth wneud hynny, bu ichi gynnal amodau gwaith y staff, eu hawliau pensiwn, ac ati. Adeiladwyd yr ysbyty'n gynt, hefyd, ac yr oedd mwy o welyau nag a gynlluniwyd yn wreiddiol. Mae angen mwy eto, ond yr oedd hynny'n fantais amlwg. Fe'ch perswadiwyd gan y dadleuon a gynigiwyd gennyf fi a'r mudiad undebau

of publicly-funded hospitals. The people of the Valleys and the whole of Wales know that private funding, as promoted by the Conservatives and New Labour, is the road to disaster. Health services should be supported by general taxation; it is too important to leave to the whim of the private sector and market forces.

David Davies: We have heard much today from Labour Members about how well the NHS is doing and how much extra money has gone into it. The reality, however, is reflected in letters such as this, which I received recently from a constituent. He went to see a doctor in June 2001 and was told that he would be put on a waiting list. He was led to believe by the contents of a letter, which he subsequently discovered was composed by a committee, that he would be assessed within a few days. Three months later he had heard nothing and he was then told that he would have to wait 8 months. A year later, he still has not been seen. It is an unacceptable situation, which is repeated thousands of times. I am sure that all Assembly Members have had similar letters.

My greatest concern is that the NHS seems to be losing its way, concentrating on a politically obsessed agenda. I noticed that the NHS in my constituency recently organised a conference to combat race inequality in the NHS. Of course, we all want to combat race inequality—it is unacceptable—but we do not need a conference to deal with it. I do not think that the NHS is a racist organisation but, if there is racism, there are laws to deal with it. Taking front-line staff away to sit in a hot hall all day drinking coffee and eating biscuits, instead of dealing with waiting lists, is unacceptable to black, white and Asian people who would rather see better hospital treatment.

There is an NHS equality unit that costs hundreds of thousands of pounds a year to run. What do these people do all day? Is there inequality in the NHS? I do not think that there is, particularly, but if there is, there are laws to deal with it. Yet these people get hundreds of thousands of pounds a year, and

llafur o blaid ysbytai cyllid cyhoeddus. Gŵyr pobl y Cymoedd a Chymru gyfan mai'r ffordd i ddistryw yw cyllid preifat, fel y'i hyrwyddir gan y Ceidwadwyr a Llafur Newydd. Dylai'r gwasanaethau iechyd gael eu cynnal gan drethiant cyffredinol; mae'n rhy bwysig i'w adael i fympwy'r sector preifat a grymoedd y farchnad.

David Davies: Clywsom lawer heddiw gan Aelodau Llafur ynghylch mor dda y mae'r GIG yn gwneud a faint o arian ychwanegol sydd wedi mynd i mewn iddo. Gwelir y gwir sefyllfa, fodd bynnag, mewn llythyrau fel hwn, a ddaeth yn ddiweddar oddi wrth etholwr. Aeth i weld meddyg ym Mehefin 2001 a dywedwyd wrtho y câi ei roi ar restr aros. Fe'i harweiniwyd i gredu gan gynnwys y llythyr, y darganfu wedyn iddo gael ei gyfansoddi gan bwyllgor, y câi ei asesu o fewn ychydig ddyddiau. Dri mis yn ddiweddarach nid oedd wedi clywed dim ac yna dywedwyd wrtho y byddai'n rhaid iddo aros 8 mis. Flwyddyn yn ddiweddarach, mae'n dal heb gael ei weld. Mae'n sefyllfa annerbyniol, a ailadroddir filoedd o weithiau. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad wedi cael llythyrau tebyg.

Fy mhryder mwyaf yw bod y GIG fel pe bai'n colli ei ffordd, gan ganolbwyntio ar agenda sydd wedi gwirioni ar wleidyddiaeth. Sylwais fod y GIG yn f'etholaeth yn ddiweddar wedi trefnu cynhadledd i wrthwynebu anghydraddoldeb hiliol yn y GIG. Wrth gwrs, mae ar bawb ohonom eisiau gwrthwynebu anghydraddoldeb hiliol—mae'n annerbyniol—ond nid oes arnom angen cynhadledd i ddelio ag ef. Nid wyf yn credu bod y GIG yn sefydliad hiliol ond, os oes hiliaeth, mae deddfau i ddelio â hi. Mae tynnu staff rheng flaen i ffwrdd i eistedd mewn neuadd boeth drwy'r dydd yn yfed coffi a bwyta bisgedi, yn lle delio â rhestrau aros, yn annerbyniol i bobl ddu, wyn ac Asiaidd y byddai'n well ganddynt weld gwell triniaeth ysbyty.

Mae uned gydraddoldeb yn y GIG sy'n costio cannoedd o filoedd o bunnoedd y flwyddyn i'w rhedeg. Beth mae'r bobl hyn yn ei wneud drwy'r dydd? A oes anghydraddoldeb yn y GIG? Nid wyf yn credu bod, yn arbennig, ond os oes, mae deddfau i ddelio â hynny. Eto, caiff y bobl hyn gannoedd o filoedd o

to do what? I do not know.

Michael German If you do not know what they do, why are you criticising them?

David Davies: I will answer that question in a minute.

Brian Gibbons: Unfortunately, if you read the literature—such as the work carried out by Dr Aneez Esmail and colleagues which was published in the *British Medical Journal*—you will see that there is much empirical evidence of systematic discrimination against elements in the workforce. We also know that there is discrimination in terms of access to procedures such as coronary artery bypass. We need to tackle that inequality and discrimination in the health service.

David Davies: The implication that NHS workers are racist, be they doctors, nurses or other staff, is unacceptable. It goes against all those wonderful people whom I know in the NHS.

Why has the advertising budget for the NHS in Wales alone increased from £281,000 in 1999-2000 to £665,000? Well over £500,000 is being put, not into dealing with waiting lists and NHS patients, but into the hands of the advertising agencies. That is unacceptable, when waiting lists are in such a dire state. The NHS is not dealing properly with people such as my constituent, Mr Dodd. All we get from this Government is publicity stunts, conferences, and political correctness. What we need is an injection of common sense.

5:10 p.m.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): I am grateful to David Melding for using his time to promote a constructive debate. Apart from a few points, your motion could have been written by Nye Bevan, the Labour architect of the national health service. It has been an interesting debate. I am pleased to see that our Welsh

bunnoedd y flwyddyn, ac i wneud beth? Ni wn.

Michael German: Os na wyddoch beth y maent yn ei wneud, pam yr ydych yn eu beirniadu?

David Davies: Atebaf y cwestiwn hwnnw mewn munud.

Brian Gibbons: Yn anffodus, os darllenwch y llenyddiaeth—fel y gwaith a wnaed gan Dr Aneez Esmail a'i gydweithwyr a gyhoeddwyd yn y *British Medical Journal*—fe welwch fod llawer o dystiolaeth gyffredinol o wahaniaethu systemataidd yn erbyn elfennau yn y gweithlu. Gwyddom hefyd fod gwahaniaethu o ran mynediad i gael triniaeth megis dargyfeirio rhydweiliau'r galon. Mae angen mynd i'r afael â'r anghydraddoldeb a'r gwahaniaethu hwnnw yn y gwasanaeth iechyd.

David Davies: Mae'r awgrym bod gweithwyr y GIG yn hiliol, boed hwy'n feddygon, yn nyrsys neu'n staff arall, yn annerbyniol. Mae'n mynd yn erbyn yr holl bobl fendigedig hynny yr wyf fi'n eu hadnabod yn y GIG.

Pam y mae'r gyllideb hysbysebu i'r GIG yng Nghymru yn unig wedi codi o £281,000 yn 1999-2000 i £665,000? Mae ymhell dros £500,000 yn cael ei roi, nid i ddelio â rhestrau aros a chleifion y GIG, ond i ddwylo'r asiantaethau hysbysebu. Mae hynny'n annerbyniol, pan fo rhestrau aros mewn cyflwr mor enbyd. Nid yw'r GIG yn delio'n iawn â phobl fel f'etholwr i, Mr Dodd. Y cyfan a gawn gan y Llywodraeth hon yw styntiau cyhoeddusrwydd, cynadleddau a chywirdeb gwleidyddol. Beth sydd ei angen yw chwistrelliad o synnwyr cyffredin.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i David Melding am ddefnyddio'i amser i hyrwyddo dadl adeiladol. Ar wahân i ambell bwynt, gallasai'ch cynnig bod wedi'i ysgrifennu gan Aneurin Bevan, pensaer y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol i Lafur. Bu'n ddadl ddiddorol. Yr wyf yn falch o weld bod

Conservative colleagues share our vision of the NHS that we are developing in Wales: an effective, responsive service that is free to all at the point of delivery. As you said, David, the people of Wales support the ethos, values and principles of the health service. You also acknowledged the unprecedented increase in health spending since Labour came into power in 1997. I am interested in how the creaks and differences in your party started to emerge. Alun Cairns said that the answer is not to throw more money at the NHS. Do you support your colleague David Melding in welcoming the extra money that is coming through as a result of the Labour Government over the past five years?

Alun Cairns: We are happy to support the extra funding and investment for the health service, but, given a 25 per cent increase in funding, we expect to see the rate of operations increase by more than 2 per cent. We will continue to support increased investment, provided that effective use of those resources is guaranteed.

Jane Hutt: I was also surprised that David Davies chose to use his precious time to attack the work on equalities, which is so important, and which I know that his colleague David Melding supports.

It is important, Nick and Alun, to recognise the increase in activity rates because, as Ann Jones has said, there are now 20,000 more in-patients, 86,000 more out-patients, and 70,000 more people seen at accident and emergency departments—and that is in just one year. Surely you recognise the efforts of a dedicated, worthwhile staff?

Nick Bourne: I bring you back to the issue that seems to divide the Assembly, namely, effectiveness. You became Secretary for Health and Social Services in the National Assembly in 1999, and pledged to bring the out-patient and in-patient waiting lists down. They have gone up almost month on month, and are now much higher than when you came into office. This is the crux of the matter. We do not dispute that extra money has gone into the system, we dispute the

ein cyd-Aelodau Ceidwadol yn rhannu'n gweledigaeth o'r GIG yr ydym yn ei adeiladu yng Nghymru: gwasanaeth effeithiol, ymatebol sydd am ddim i bawb yn y pwynt derbyn. Fel y dywedasoch, David, mae pobl Cymru'n cefnogi ethos, gwerthoedd ac egwyddorion y gwasanaeth iechyd. Gwnaethoch gydnabod hefyd y cynnydd digynsail mewn gwariant ar iechyd er i Lafur ddod i rym yn 1997. Diddorol oedd gweld y rhaniadau a'r gwahaniaethau yn eich plaid yn dechrau ymddangos. Dywedodd Alun Cairns mai'r ateb yw peidio â thafllu mwy o arian at y GIG. A ydych yn cefnogi'ch cyd-Aelod David Melding sy'n croesawu'r arian ychwanegol sy'n dod trwodd o ganlyniad i'r Llywodraeth Lafur dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf?

Alun Cairns: Yr ydym yn hapus i gefnogi'r cyllid a'r buddsoddiad ychwanegol i'r gwasanaeth iechyd, ond, o weld cynnydd o 25 y cant yn y cyllid, disgwylfem weld y gyfradd lawdriniaethau'n codi mwy na 2 y cant. Byddwn yn parhau i gefnogi mwy o fuddsoddi, ar yr amod y gwarentir defnydd effeithiol o'r adnoddau hynny.

Jane Hutt: Synnais hefyd fod David Davies wedi dewis defnyddio'i amser gwerthfawr i ymosod ar y gwaith ar gydraddoldeb, sydd mor bwysig, ac y gwn fod ei gyd-Aelod David Melding o'i blaid.

Mae'n bwysig, Nick ac Alun, cydnabod y cynnydd mewn cyfraddau gweithgaredd oherwydd, fel y dywedodd Ann Jones, bellach mae 20,000 yn fwy o gleifion mewnol, 86,000 yn fwy o gleifion allanol, a 70,000 yn fwy o bobl a welir mewn adrannau damwain ac argyfwng—a hynny ddim ond mewn un flwyddyn. Onid ydych yn cydnabod ymdrechion staff ymroddgar, gwerth chweil?

Nick Bourne: Deuaf â chi'n ôl at y mater sydd fel petai'n rhannu'r Cynulliad, sef effeithiolrwydd. Daethoch yn Ysgrifennydd Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn 1999, gydag addewid i gwtogi'r rhestrau aros i gleifion allanol a mewnol. Maent wedi mynd i fyny bron fis ar fis, ac yn llawer uwch yn awr na phan ddaethoch i'ch swydd. Dyma graidd y mater. Ni wadwn fod arian ychwanegol wedi mynd i mewn i'r system, gwadu'r canlyniad a

outcome and, in my speech, I asked if you would consider that, and make a commitment on the social services budget. Will you admit that you have not achieved the goal that you set yourself when you came into office?

Jane Hutt: I am talking about effectiveness. You know that, as Minister for Health and Social Services, I am committed to improving patient care by shortening waiting times for treatment. That is why we moved from a waiting list to a waiting times strategy, and Brian Gibbons's work to implement that means that no-one waits for more than 12 months for heart surgery. We achieved that target for the benefit of the people of Wales.

We reject point 2 of the motion, on increased use of the private sector, because we do not want to divert resources and attention into the private sector. We must ensure that we steer away from a two-tier system. We do not want it, and there is no need for it in Wales. We have seen a significant fall in waiting times for orthopaedic and cataract treatment, and, since the Assembly Government took responsibility for the NHS in Wales, we have seen changes as a result of our coronary heart disease national service framework.

Geraint Davies: Do you agree that using private hospitals to reduce the waiting lists was a waste of money and that it would have been better spent on our NHS district general hospitals?

Jane Hutt: We have a small private sector in Wales, and we work in partnership where possible. However, we differ from the Conservative Party in that our priority is additional resources for the NHS. An extra £1 billion has already been invested, and the £1.8 billion that will be invested over the next five years should go into expanding the NHS. That is why I cannot support point 2 of the motion, on the private sector.

Many of William's suggestions are being taken forward. On Nick's point about investment in social care, the Derek Wanless

wnawn, ac, yn fy araith, gofynnais a fydddech yn ystyried hynny, a gwneud ymrwymiad ar y gyllideb gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. A wnewch chi gyfaddef nad ydych wedi cyrraedd y nod a osodasoch ichi'ch hun pan ddaethoch i'ch swydd?

Jane Hutt: Yr wyf yn sôn am effeithiolrwydd. Gwyddoch fy mod, fel Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, wedi ymrwymo i wella gofal cleifion drwy gwtogi rhestrau aros am driniaeth. Dyna pam y symudasom oddi wrth strategaeth restrau aros at amserau aros, ac mae gwaith Brian Gibbons i weithredu hynny'n golygu nad oes neb yn aros am fwy na 12 mis am lawdriniaeth ar y galon. Cyflawnasom y targed hwnnw er budd pobl Cymru.

Gwrthodwn bwynt 2 y cynnig, ar ddefnydd cynyddol o'r sector preifat, oherwydd nad oes arnom eisiau gwro adnoddau a sylw i mewn i'r sector preifat. Rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn symud i ffwrdd oddi wrth system ddwy haen. Nid oes arnom ei heisiau, ac nid oes angen amdani yng Nghymru. Gwelsom gwmp arwyddocaol mewn amserau aros am driniaeth orthopedig a charact, ac, ers i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad gymryd cyfrifoldeb am y GIG yng Nghymru, gwelsom newidiadau o ganlyniad i'n fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer clefyd coronaidd y galon.

Geraint Davies: A gytunwch mai gwastraff arian oedd defnyddio ysbytai preifat i leihau'r rhestrau aros ac y buasai'n well ei wario ar ein hysbytai dosbarth cyffredinol dan y GIG?

Jane Hutt: Mae gennym sector preifat bychan yng Nghymru, a gweithiwn mewn partneriaeth lle bo modd. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn wahanol i'r Blaid Geidwadol gan mai adnoddau ychwanegol i'r GIG yw'n blaenoriaeth ni. Eisoedd buddsoddwyd £1 biliwn yn ychwanegol, a dylai'r £1.8 biliwn a fuddsoddir dros y pum mlynedd nesaf fynd tuag at ehangu'r GIG. Dyna pam na allaf gefnogi pwynt 2 y cynnig, ar y sector preifat.

Mae llawer o awgrymiadau William yn cael eu gweithredu. Ar bwynt Nick ynglŷn â buddsoddi mewn gofal cymdeithasol,

report clearly recognised the need to expand the relationship between health and social care, and that is why I invested an extra £17 million in local government. That was directly funded through taxation in our budget. It will relieve pressure on the care sector, and enable local government to deliver better joined-up health and social care. That will tackle the pressures to which you are right to refer, Nick, in terms of delayed transfers of care from hospital.

On the other key points in the motion, there is no doubt that increasing front-line staff is a high priority for the NHS, and we are seeing success in this. Between September 2000 and September 2001, we recruited 440 more nurses, 62 more consultants, and 52 more senior doctors. That was all achieved in one year, as a result of the extra funding.

Christine Chapman: It is difficult sometimes for the public to comprehend the statistics. When you visit an area such as Cynon Valley, where, as you know, there is a desperate need for GPs and other NHS staff, it is heartening to hear health professionals acknowledge that, since the Assembly's establishment, there are more GPs and more investment in the Cynon Valley. We know that much remains to be done, but it is good to hear success being acknowledged.

Jane Hutt: That also leads to an increase in morale. It is important, Dai, that we look to the GP contract and the fact that it fits in with our primary care strategy and the forthcoming action plan that will drive up standards and tackle inequalities in our poorest communities, such as Cynon Valley.

Alun Cairns: Given the Minister's comments about the increased numbers of nurses and consultants recruited, how does she reconcile that with the fact that there are 974 nursing vacancies, which is almost unchanged from March 2001, and an increase in consultant vacancies, which are up to 112, also based on March 2001 figures?

Jane Hutt: This ties in with our reason for not supporting Plaid Cymru's amendment 5

cydnabu adroddiad Derek Wanless yn glir fod angen ehangu'r berthynas rhwng iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol, a dyna pam y buddsoddais £17 miliwn yn ychwanegol mewn llywodraeth leol. Ariannwyd hynny'n uniongyrchol drwy drethiant yn ein cyllideb. Bydd yn codi'r pwysau ar y sector gofal, ac yn galluogi llywodraeth leol i gyflwyno gwell gofal cymdeithasol a iechyd cydlynol. Bydd hynny'n delio â'r pwysau yr ydych yn gywir i gyfeirio atynt, Nick, o safbwynt oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal o'r ysbyty.

Ar y pwyntiau allweddol eraill yn y cynnig, nid oes amheuaeth fod cynyddu staff rheng flaen yn flaenoriaeth uchel i'r GIG, ac yr ydym yn gweld llwyddiant yn hyn. Rhwng Medi 2000 a Medi 2001, recriwtiwyd 440 yn fwy o nyrsys, 62 yn rhagor o ymgynghorwyr, a 52 yn rhagor o feddygon hŷn. Cyflawnwyd hynny i gyd mewn un flwyddyn, o ganlyniad i'r cyllid ychwanegol.

Christine Chapman: Mae'n anodd weithiau i'r cyhoedd amgyffred yr ystadegau. Pan ymwelwch ag ardal fel Cwm Cynon, lle, fel y gwyrddoch, mae angen dirfawr am feddygon teulu a staff iechyd eraill, mae'n galonogol clywed gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol yn cydnabod bod mwy o feddygon teulu a mwy o fuddsoddiad yng Nghwm Cynon ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad. Gwyddom fod llawer i'w wneud o hyd, ond mae'n dda clywed bod llwyddiant yn cael ei gydnabod.

Jane Hutt: Mae hynny'n arwain hefyd at godi morâl. Mae'n bwysig, Dai, ein bod yn edrych ar ein contract meddygon teulu a'r ffaith ei fod yn cyd-fynd â'n strategaeth gofal sylfaenol a'r cynllun gweithredu sydd i ddod, a fydd yn codi safonau ac yn mynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau yn ein cymunedau tlotaf, fel Cwm Cynon.

Alun Cairns: Yn wyneb sylwadau'r Gweinidog am y niferoedd uwch o nyrsys ac ymgynghorwyr a recriwtiwyd, sut mae hi'n cysoni hynny gyda'r ffaith fod 974 o swyddi gwag i nyrsys, sydd heb newid bron ddim er mis Mawrth 2001, a chynnydd mewn swyddi gwag i ymgynghorwyr, i fyny i 112, hefyd yn seiliedig ar ffigurau Mawrth 2001?

Jane Hutt: Mae hyn yn clymu i mewn i'n rheswm dros beidio â chefnogi gwelliant 5

and Geraint's comments on the cost of temporary staff. Why focus on the number of vacancies? It is true of all sectors that, if you have an expanding workforce, you will have vacancies. I am sure that you recognise that that is the case within the private sector. We are tackling the number of nursing vacancies through our return-to-practice courses and by ensuring extra flexibility in terms of childcare and family-friendly policies that enable nurses to return to work.

Gareth Jones: Cyfeiriodd fy nghyd-Aelod, Geraint Davies, at y ffaith bod pobl yn y Rhondda yn gorfod teithio i Gaerdydd neu Abertawe i gael angiogram. O ran cynlluniau staffio, pryd fydd pobl gogledd Cymru yn gallu cael angiogram yng Nghymru yn hytrach nag ym Manceinion neu Lerpwl? A oes gennych gynlluniau i sicrhau bod pobl Cymru yn derbyn triniaeth yng Nghymru?

Jane Hutt: You will know that we launched the coronary heart disease national service framework last year. We have taken a great stride in reducing waiting times for heart operations. Next week, I will make a statement on that framework and report on progress.

Increasing the number of trainees is as crucial as increasing the number of NHS front-line staff. It is a matter of planning ahead. You have recognised that we have 600 more trainee nurses this year as a result of the additional investment in training places for nurses. That is across the board.

David referred to workforce targets. He will be aware of the workforce targets discussed in the Health and Social Services Committee in November, based on need and planning. We agreed that we would have to validate the figures and, on 27 June, we will discuss the workforce targets. These will include the important speech and language therapists to which Peter referred. The Conservative Government never undertook workforce planning. This is the first time that it has been undertaken for the whole workforce, based on projections and need.

Plaid Cymru a sylwadau Geraint ar gost staff dros-dro. Pam canolbwyntio ar nifer y swyddi gwag? Mae'n wir am bob sector, os oes gennych weithlu sy'n ehangu, y bydd gennych swyddi gwag. Yr wyf yn siŵr y sylweddolwch mai felly y mae hi yn y sector preifat. Yr ydym yn mynd i'r afael â'r nifer o swyddi nyrsio gwag drwy gyrsgiau dychwelyd-i-ymarfer a thrwy sicrhau hyblygrwydd o ran gofal plant a pholisïau caredig i deuluoedd sy'n galluogi nyrsys i ddod yn ôl i weithio.

Gareth Jones: My colleague, Geraint Davies, referred to the fact that people in Rhondda must travel to Cardiff or Swansea for angiograms. In terms of staff planning, when will it be possible for the people of north Wales to have angiograms in Wales rather than in Manchester or Liverpool? Do you have any proposals to ensure that the people of Wales can be treated in Wales?

Jane Hutt: Byddwch yn gwybod ein bod wedi lansio fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer clefyd coronaidd y galon y llynedd. Yr ydym wedi cymryd cam mawr i leihau amserau aros am lawdriniaeth ar y galon. Yr wythnos nesaf, gwnaf ddatganiad ar y fframwaith hwnnw ac adroddiad ar ei hynt.

Mae cynyddu nifer yr hyfforddeion yr un mor hanfodol â chynyddu nifer staff rheng flaen y GIG. Mater o gynllunio ymlaen ydyw. Yr ydych wedi cydnabod fod gennym 600 yn fwy o nyrsys dan hyfforddiant eleni o ganlyniad i'r buddsoddiad ychwanegol mewn lleoedd hyfforddi i nyrsys. Mae hynny ar draws y bwrdd.

Cyfeiriodd David at dargedau gweithlu. Bydd yn ymwybodol o'r targedau gweithlu a drafodwyd yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ym mis Tachwedd, yn seiliedig ar angen a chynllunio. Cytunasom y byddai'n rhaid inni ddilysu'r ffigurau, ac, ar 27 Mehefin, trafodwn y targedau gweithlu. Bydd y rhain yn cynnwys y therapyddion lleferydd ac iaith pwysig y cyfeiriodd Peter atynt. Nid ymgymerodd y Llywodraeth Geidwadol erioed â chynllunio gweithlu. Dyma'r tro cyntaf iddo ddigwydd ar gyfer y gweithlu cyfan, yn seiliedig ar ragamcanion ac angen.

I agree with David about the importance of capital expenditure. We did not have a capital programme when I became Minister for Health and Social Services three years ago. We now have more than £300 million in an ongoing capital programme. It received a massive injection of £40 million earlier this year to buy CT and MRI scanners and to provide x-ray rooms and equipment, and Janet, £3.6 million went directly into new equipment and vehicles for the ambulance service.

In terms of Plaid Cymru's amendments 1 and 3, as Ann said, we would not have a publicly-funded hospital in Rhondda if it had not been for a Labour Minister for Health and Social Services taking that decision to address the issue. I support the need for a public capital programme. We are providing a national health service based on access and excellence.

5:20 p.m.

On Dai and Alun's points about the Specialised Health Service Commission for Wales, that commission was set up by health authorities, and the report will be consulted upon.

Finally, and most importantly, our amendment 4 replaces point 2 with an endorsement of Derek Wanless's report, which calls for a properly resourced and renewed NHS. The Wanless report clearly states that additional resources and radical reform are vital—neither will succeed without the other. I believe that we all share that view and agree with that conclusion, so I hope that Members will support amendment 4. Our public funding system is efficient and equitable. Our reforms in Wales fit in with those conclusions—greater public involvement, decentralisation with our local health boards, better information technology, and a larger and more flexible workforce. We are achieving more in the effective integration of health and social care with our reforms in Wales, as well as improving the health and wellbeing of the people of Wales.

Cytunaf â David ynglŷn â phwysigrwydd gwariant cyfalaf. Nid oedd gennym raglen gyfalaf pan ddeuthum yn Weinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol dair blynedd yn ôl. Bellach mae gennym dros £300 miliwn mewn rhaglen gyfalaf barhaus. Cafodd chwistrelliad enfawr o £40 miliwn yn gynharach eleni i brynu sganwyr CT ac MRI ac i ddarparu ystafelloedd ac offer pelydr-x, a Janet, aeth £3.6 miliwn yn uniongyrchol i mewn i offer a cherbydau newydd i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans.

O ran gwelliannau 1 a 3 Plaid Cymru, fel y dywedodd Ann, ni fyddai gennym ysbyty ar gyllid cyhoeddus yn y Rhondda oni bai am Weinidog Llafur dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn gwneud y penderfyniad hwnnw i wneud rhywbeth amdano. Cefnogaf yr angen am raglen gyfalaf cyhoeddus. Yr ydym yn darparu gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol seiliedig ar fynediad a rhagoriaeth.

Ar bwyntiau Dai ac Alun ynghylch y Comisiwn Gwasanaeth Iechyd Arbenigol Cymru, sefydlwyd y comisiwn hwnnw gan awdurdodau iechyd, ac ymgynghorir ar yr adroddiad.

Yn olaf, ac yn bwysicaf oll, mae ein gwelliant 4 yn disodli pwynt 2 ag ategiad o adroddiad Derek Wanless, sy'n galw am i'r GIG gael ei adnewyddu a chael adnoddau priodol. Mae adroddiad Wanless yn datgan yn glir fod adnoddau ychwanegol a diwygio radicalaidd yn hanfodol—ni wnaiff y naill lwyddo heb y llall. Credaf ein bod i gyd yn rhannu'r farn honno ac yn cytuno â'r casgliad hwnnw, felly gobeithiaf y gwnaiff yr Aelodau gefnogi gwelliant 4. Mae ein system ariannu cyhoeddus yn effeithlon a theg. Mae ein diwygiadau yng Nghymru yn cyd-fynd â'r casgliadau hynny—mwy o gyfranogiad cyhoeddus, datganoli gyda'n byrddau iechyd lleol, gwell technoleg gwybodaeth, a gweithlu mwy o faint a mwy hyblyg. Yr ydym yn cyflawni mwy wrth integreiddio iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yn effeithiol gyda'n diwygiadau yng Nghymru, yn ogystal â gwella iechyd a lles pobl Cymru.

David Melding: I will only be able to refer to a few of the contributions, but I will try to refer to at least one from each political party. Dai Lloyd made a destructive point. He used a particularly pernicious metaphor when he described NHS consultants as parasites because their NHS contracts also allow them, in certain cases, to work in private practice. We expect consultants to honour their NHS contracts. We should not shackle them further and say that they cannot seek to practice elsewhere. Your party thinks like the old-fashioned brutal state socialism that we used to see in eastern Europe: you think that you own the people that you educate and train. That is a horrible concept, and one reason why I reject it is because I am a Conservative and we will have no truck with such views.

David Lloyd: You are not interested in fair play either, then. After the NHS has spent years and millions of pounds training these consultants, the private sector picks them off without recompense. It should be adequately reflected in the premiums paid. Then we would see what the true cost of private healthcare is in this country.

David Melding: You have just reiterated your highly pernicious view. Someone who has been trained in the NHS and has worked as a houseman and a junior doctor could have been in the NHS for over 25 years. You then deny them private practice because you feel that they are being pernicious or parasitical. That is a remarkable view.

David Lloyd *rose—*

David Melding: I will not give way again. Kirsty asked why I am a Conservative. This may be peripheral to this debate but, although I admittedly draw more on Burke and Oakeshott than on Dicey and Keith Joseph, I am a Conservative because I believe in free enterprise and personal responsibility. While I am proselytising, as Kirsty did, I agree with Churchill that Lloyd George was one of this country's better conservative Prime Ministers.

David Melding: Ni fyddaf ond yn gallu cyfeirio at ychydig o'r cyfraniadau, ond ceisiaf gyfeirio at o leiaf un gan bob plaid wleidyddol. Gwnaeth Dai Lloyd bwynt dinistriol. Defnyddiodd drosiad arbennig o niweidiol pan ddisgrifiodd ymgynghorwyr y GIG fel parasitiaid oherwydd bod eu contractau â'r GIG yn caniatáu iddynt, mewn rhai achosion, weithio mewn practis preifat hefyd. Disgwylw'n i gontractwyr anrhydeddu eu contractau â'r GIG. Ni ddylem eu caethiwo ymhellach a dweud na chânt geisio ymarfer mewn mannau eraill. Mae syniadau'ch plaid chi'n debyg i'r sosialaeth wladwriaethol gïaidd hen ffasiwn yr arferem ei gweld yn nwyrain Ewrop: yr ydych yn meddwl mai chi biau'r bobl a addysgwch ac a hyfforddwch. Mae hynny'n gysyniad ffiائد, ac un rheswm pam y'i gwrthodaf yw am fy mod yn Geidwadwr ac nid oes arnom eisïau dim i'w wneud â'r fath syniadau.

David Lloyd: Nid oes gennych ddiddordeb mewn chwarae teg ychwaith, felly. Wedi i'r GIG dreulio blynyddoedd a gwario miliynau o bunnoedd yn hyfforddi'r ymgynghorwyr hyn, mae'r sector preifat yn eu cipio heb dalu iawn. Dylai gael ei adlewyrchu'n ddigonol yn y premiymau a delir. Wedyn caem weld beth yw gwir gost gofal iechyd preifat yn y wlad hon.

David Melding: Yr ydych newydd ailddatgan eich barn hynod o niweidiol. Gallai rhywun sydd wedi'i hyfforddi yn y GIG ac wedi gweithio fel meddyg tŷ a meddyg iau fod wedi bod yn y GIG am dros 25 mlynedd. Yr ydych chi wedyn am wadu iddynt gael ymarfer yn breifat oherwydd y teimlwch eu bod yn niweidiol neu'n barasitaidd. Mae honno'n farn hynod.

David Lloyd *a gododd—*

David Melding: Ni wnaf ildio eto. Gofynnodd Kirsty pam fy mod yn Geidwadwr. Efallai fod hyn yn ymylol i'r ddadl hon ond, er fy mod yn addef fy mod yn fwy o edmygydd Burke ac Oakeshott na Dicey a Keith Joseph, yr wyf yn Geidwadwr am fy mod yn credu mewn menter rydd a chyfrifoldeb personol. Tra fy mod yn pregethu, fel y gwnaeth Kirsty, cytunaf â Churchill fod Lloyd George yn un o'r Prif Weinidigion ceidwadol gorau a gafodd y

wlad hon.

Peter Law made an excellent point about speech therapists. I know that Gwent is particularly badly served. We heard in the Health and Social Services Committee of the case of a nine-year-old child with Down's syndrome who had only received one hour of speech therapy from the state sector. That is unacceptable.

Gwnaeth Peter Law bwynt ardderchog am therapyddion lleferydd. Gwn fod y gwasanaeth i Went yn arbennig o wael. Clywsom yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol am achos plentyn syndrom Down naw mlwydd oed nad oedd ond wedi cael un awr o therapi lleferydd gan sector y wladwriaeth. Mae hynny'n annerbyniol.

Brian Gibbons was being naughty when he bowled a vicious bouncer at one of our tail-enders, asking questions of Alun Cairns about funding mechanisms. *[Interruption.]* A tail-ender in terms of health, of course. I am now in trouble for my florid metaphor.

Yr oedd Brian Gibbons yn camfihafio pan fowliodd bêl ffyrnig at un o'n batwyr olaf, gan holi Alun Cairns am fecanweithiau ariannu. *[Torri ar draws.]* Batiwr olaf yn nhermau iechyd, wrth gwrs. Yr wyf yn awr mewn helynt oherwydd fy nhrosiad blodeuog.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. We must bring this debate to a close.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn, mae'n rhaid inni ddwyn y drafodaeth hon i ben.

David Melding: We need extra resources, which should be funded from taxation, in my view. It would take much to persuade me that we could move away from that principle.

David Melding: Mae arnom angen adnoddau ychwanegol, y dylid eu hariannu drwy drethiant, yn fy marn i. Byddai'n cymryd llawer i'm perswadio y gallem symud i ffwrdd oddi wrth yr egwyddor honno.

Ann Jones *rose*—

Ann Jones *a gododd*—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. David Melding is in overtime so he cannot give way.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae David Melding mewn goramser felly ni all ildio.

David Melding: However, in the interests of intellectual curiosity, we should consider funding. People want a state-funded health service and we are committed to that. However, people also want a reformed and effective system. I am pleased that Jane made a positive contribution to the debate and acknowledged that it was well motivated. I am not sure whether Nye Bevan could have framed it, but you paid me a remarkable compliment. I still think that you lack innovation in not embracing using the independent sector to deliver NHS services. That is what we are after. You say that you are committed to increasing front-line staff; I do not doubt that you are, but the workforce targets have been delayed and you tend to hide behind the fact that we have increased training targets. That is also the case in Scotland and England, but they have also set

David Melding: Er hynny, er mwyn chwilfrydedd deallusol, dylem ystyried yr ariannu. Mae ar bobl eisiau gwasanaeth iechyd a ariennir gan y wladwriaeth ac yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae ar bobl hefyd eisiau gwasanaeth diwygiedig ac effeithiol. Yr wyf yn falch fod Jane wedi gwneud cyfraniad cadarnhaol i'r ddadl ac wedi cydnabod fod y cymhelliad yn dda. Nid wyf yn siŵr a fuasai Aneurin Bevan wedi gallu ei fframio, ond rhoesoch deyrnged hynod imi. Yr wyf yn dal i feddwl eich bod yn dangos diffyg blaengarwch wrth beidio â chofleidio defnyddio'r sector annibynnol i gyflwyno gwasanaethau'r GIG. Dyna beth yr ydym ni ar ei ôl. Dywedwch eich bod wedi ymrwymo i gynyddu staff y rheng flaen; nid wyf yn amau eich bod, ond bu oedi gyda thargedau'r gweithlu a thueddwch i guddio y tu ôl i'r ffaith ein bod wedi cynyddu targedau

targets for front-line staff. In addition, the outline targets that you have set are for 2010, not 2004-06. We are still waiting for you to come forward with a more medium-term target.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. We have exceeded the time normally allowed for these debates. That should not be taken as a precedent, but this is an important issue and I hope that Members will understand why I allowed the debate to exceed the normal time limit.

hyfforddi. Mae hynny'n wir yn yr Alban a Lloegr hefyd, ond maent hwy wedi pennu targedau ar gyfer staff rheng flaen hefyd. Yn ogystal, mae'r targedau amlinellol a osodwyd gennych chi yn rhai ar gyfer 2010, nid 2004-06. Yr ydym yn dal i aros ichi ddod ymlaen â tharged mwy tymorganolig.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Yr ydym wedi mynd dros yr amser a ganiateir fel arfer ar gyfer y dadleuon hyn. Ni ddylid cymryd hynny fel cynsail, ond mae hwn yn fater pwysig a gobeithiaf y gwnaiff Aelodau ddeall pam yr wyf wedi caniatáu i'r ddadl fynd heibio'r terfyn amser arferol.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 1: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 2: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine

Dafis, Cynog
 Davies, David
 Davies, Geraint
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Graham, William
 Hancock, Brian
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Rogers, Peter
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Chapman, Christine
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Ron
 Essex, Sue
 Evans, Delyth
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Halford, Alison
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 14, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 36.
 Amendment 3: For 14, Abstain 0, Against 36.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Dafis, Cynog
 Davies, Geraint
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Hancock, Brian
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lloyd, David
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Chapman, Christine
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Ron
 Essex, Sue
 Evans, Delyth
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Halford, Alison
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Jonathan

Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Rogers, Peter
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 7.
Amendment 4: For 43, Abstain 0, Against 7.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Graham, William
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

Gwelliant 5: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.

Amendment 5: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 29.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

Amended motion:

the National Assembly

1. acknowledges that future increases in NHS expenditure in Wales must be used effectively to deliver a world-class service that is responsive to patient need;

2. endorses the conclusions of the Wanless report in relation to a properly resourced and renewed national health service, in which funding is most efficiently and equitably provided through general taxation;

3. acknowledges that patients must be treated within a reasonable time if higher public expenditure on the NHS is to maintain the support of taxpayers;

Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:

1. yn cydnabod bod yn rhaid defnyddio unrhyw gynnydd yn y dyfodol yng ngwariant y GIG yng Nghymru yn effeithiol i ddarparu gwasanaeth o safon fyd-eang sy'n ymateb i anghenion cleifion;

2. yn cymeradwyo casgliadau adroddiad Wanless mewn perthynas â gwasanaeth ieched gwladol sy'n cael yr adnoddau priodol ac sy'n cael ei adfywio, lle mae cyllid ar ei gyfer yn cael ei ddarparu yn y ffordd fwyaf effeithlon a theg trwy drethiant cyffredinol;

3. yn cydnabod bod yn rhaid i gleifion gael eu trin o fewn amser rhesymol os yw trethdalwyr yn mynd i barhau i gefnogi mwy o wariant cyhoeddus ar y GIG;

- | | |
|---|--|
| <p>4. <i>believes that priority must be given to increasing the number of hospital consultants, GPs, nurses, therapists and other key front-line staff if waiting times are to be reduced;</i></p> <p>5. <i>calls for higher capital expenditure within NHS Wales, which will improve both patient care and the working conditions of staff;</i></p> <p>6. <i>affirms the fundamental principle of the NHS to provide universal healthcare free at the point of need.</i></p> | <p>4. <i>yn credu bod yn rhaid rhoi blaenoriaeth i gynyddu nifer yr ymgynghorwyr ysbyty, meddygon teulu, nyrsys, therapyddion a staff allweddol eraill ar y llinell flaen os yw amseroedd aros yn mynd i gael eu cwtdgi;</i></p> <p>5. <i>yn galw am fwy o wariant cyfalaf o fewn GIG Cymru, a fydd yn gwella'r gofal y mae cleifion yn ei gael ac amodau gwaith staff;</i></p> <p>6. <i>yn cadarnhau'r egwyddor sylfaenol y dylai'r GIG ddarparu gofal iechyd i bawb am ddim pan fo 'i angen.</i></p> |
|---|--|

*Cynnig wedi 'i ddiwygio: O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amended motion: For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Rogers, Peter

Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.
Amended motion carried.*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â
today's proceedings to a close. chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.26 p.m.
The session ended at 5.26 p.m.*