



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales
(The Official Record)**

Dydd Mawrth 19 Mawrth 2002

Tuesday 19 March 2002

Cynnwys
Contents

- 3 Anerchiad gan yr Anrhydeddus Peter Caruana QC, Prif Weinidog Gibraltar
Address by the Honourable Peter Caruana QC, Chief Minister of Gibraltar
- 6 Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru
Questions to the First Minister
- 27 Datganiad Busnes
Business Statement
- 28 Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion
Composite Motion: Approval of Orders
- 30 Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Llywodraeth Leol (Dangosyddion Perfformiad Gwerth
Gorau) (Cymru) 2002
*Approval of the Local Government (Best Value Performance Indicators) (Wales)
Order 2002*
- 40 Pwyntiau o Drefn
Points of Order
- 41 Gwasanaethau Gofal Dydd i Blant Dan Wyth
Day-care Services for Children Under Eight
- 58 Cymeradwyo Deddfwriaeth sy'n Gysylltiedig â Gwasanaethau Gofal Dydd i Blant
Dan Wyth
Approval of Legislation Associated with Day-care Services for Children Under Eight
- 59 Adolygiad Pum Mlynedd o Gyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru
Quinquennial Review of the Countryside Council for Wales
- 77 Cynigion Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer Mesurau
Welsh Assembly Government Proposals for Bills

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been
included.*

Anerchiad gan yr Anrhydeddus Peter Caruana QC, Prif Weinidog Gibraltar
Address by the Honourable Peter Caruana QC, Chief Minister of Gibraltar

Y Llywydd: Mae'n bleser gennyf estyn croeso ffurfiol a chynnes i'r ddirprwyaeth o Gibraltar ar ei hymweliad swyddogol â'r Cynulliad, ac yn arbennig i'r Anrhydeddus Peter Caruana QC, y Prif Weinidog.

Chief Minister, I invite you to address Assembly Members.

The Chief Minister: Presiding Officer, First Minister, Ministers and Members, it is a great pleasure as Chief Minister of Gibraltar to address you this afternoon. I have been told that I must finish by 2 p.m., so it is a great privilege to have 10 minutes of your time.

I bring you greetings from your sister British parliament in Gibraltar—the House of Assembly. Many Members have already met some of our parliamentarians at Commonwealth Parliamentary Association meetings. You will be able to meet them again shortly, as we are sending a full delegation to the regional meeting to be held here in Cardiff, in this Assembly, in a few weeks' time.

I will give a quick, broad brush of Gibraltar for those of you who may not know our history. We are one of the United Kingdom's remaining 13 overseas territories. We have been British since 1704, nearly 300 years ago. I am happy to report that the people of Gibraltar overwhelmingly—not to say unanimously—wish it to remain so for all time. The 1969 constitution given to us by the British Parliament establishes a separate jurisdiction for political, governmental and administrative purposes. We have a Parliament, which is smaller than this Assembly, with 17 members, 15 of whom are elected. In the Parliament, we pass our own laws, and transpose all European Union obligations into the laws of Gibraltar. We have elections once every four years, and the party with the majority not only wins control of the Parliament, it also forms the Government. At present, I lead that party. We have a peculiar electoral system, which means that the winning party only gets a majority of one seat, regardless of the size of

The Presiding Officer: It is my pleasure to formally and warmly welcome the delegation from Gibraltar on its official visit to the Assembly, and especially the Honourable Peter Caruana QC, the Chief Minister.

Brif Weinidog, fe'ch gwahoddaf i annerch Aelodau'r Cynulliad.

Y Prif Weinidog: Lywydd, Prif Weinidog, Gweinidogion ac Aelodau, mae'n bleser mawr i mi fel Prif Weinidog Gibraltar eich annerch y prynhawn yma. Dywedwyd wrthyf fod rhaid imi orffen erbyn 2 p.m., felly mae'n frainnt mawr cael 10 munud o'ch amser.

Deuaf â chyfarchion ichi oddi wrth eich chwaer senedd Brydeinig yn Gibraltar—y Tŷ Ymgynnull. Mae llawer o'r Aelodau eisoes wedi cwrdd â rhai o'n seneddwr yng nghyfarfodydd Cymdeithas Seneddol y Gymanwlad. Cewch gwrdd â hwy eto cyn bo hir, gan y byddwn yn anfon dirprwyaeth lawn i'r cyfarfod rhanbarthol a gynhelir yma yng Nghaerdydd, yn y Cynulliad hwn, ymhen ychydig wythnosau.

Rhoddaf fraslun sydyn o Gibraltar i'r rhai ohonoch sydd efallai heb wybod ein hanes. Yr ydym yn un o'r 13 tiriogaeth dramor sy'n weddill gan y Deyrnas Unedig. Yr ydym yn Brydeinig er 1704, bron 300 o flynyddoedd yn ôl. Mae'n dda gennyf ddweud fod mwyafrif llethol pobl Gibraltar—os nad pob un copa walltog—yn dymuno iddi aros felly hyd byth. Mae cyfansoddiad 1969, a roddwyd inni gan Senedd Prydain, yn sefydlu awdurdodaeth ar wahân at ddibenion gwleidyddol, llywodraethol a gweinyddol. Mae gennym Senedd, sy'n llai na'r Cynulliad hwn, gyda 17 o aelodau, 15 ohonynt yn etholedig. Yn y Senedd, pasiwn ein deddfau ein hunain, gan drawsosod holl rwymedigaethau'r Undeb Ewropeaidd i ddeddfau Gibraltar. Cynhaliwn etholiadau un waith bob pedair blynedd, a bydd y blaid a enillodd fwyafrif yn ennill rheolaeth ar y Senedd, a hefyd yn ffurfio'r Llywodraeth. Ar hyn o bryd, fi yw arweinydd y blaid honno. Mae gennym system etholiadol od, sy'n golygu mai dim ond mwyafrif o un sedd a

the electoral majority. For those of you who are party leaders, I do not recommend it; it is difficult to keep discipline and good order when any one of your members can hold you to ransom.

The Government of Gibraltar, in the executive sense, and the Parliament of Gibraltar, in the legislative sense, have a large measure of legislative and executive rights. It extends to all matters with the exception of defence, external affairs and internal security—the police. We pay for the police force, but it is operationally accountable to the British Governor in Gibraltar. Other than that, we have complete control of our fiscal and economic policy, all public expenditure, and policies in education, health, social security, social services, transport and the environment—everything that is not internal security, defence or external affairs. We are economically self-sufficient; we do not receive any budgetary aid from the UK. To give you a rough idea, Gibraltar is 8 sq km, and has a population of 30,000 people. We have an economically active labour force of 15,000 people. The Government's revenue budget is £175 million, and its expenditure is just over £155 million. From those figures, you see that we operate to regular annual budget surpluses, from which we fund our own capital investment programme.

We are an Objective 2 region of the European Community, which means that we receive an element of European Union Objective 2 funding—I think that we received £6 million from the current programme. We are a small but self-governing place with our own Parliament, Government, civil service, judiciary, police force and customs and excise, all of which follow the Westminster and British model. You are welcome to visit us to establish for yourselves that Gibraltar truly is a piece of Britain in the Mediterranean sun.

However, there is a Chinese saying, 'may you live in interesting times', which is meant as a curse. We are, indeed, living in interesting times. Like all colonial peoples, we believe in the right to self-determination,

gaiff y blaid fuddugol, ni waeth beth fo maint y mwyafrif etholiadol. I'r rheini ohonoch sydd yn arweinwyr plaid, nid wyf yn argymhell y drefn hon; mae'n anodd cadw disgyblaeth a threfn dda pan all unrhyw un o'ch aelodau eich dal yn wystl.

Mae gan Lywodraeth Gibraltar, yn yr ystyr gweithredol, a Senedd Gibraltar, yn yr ystyr deddfwriaethol, gryn dipyn o hawliau deddfwriaethol a gweithredol. Maent yn cynnwys popeth ac eithrio amddiffyn, materion allanol a gwarchodaeth fewnol—yr heddlu. Talwn am yr heddlu, ond mae'n weithrediadol atebol i'r Llywodraethwr Prydeinig yn Gibraltar. Ar wahân i hynny, mae gennym reolaeth lwyr dros ein polisi ariannol ac economaidd, pob gwariant cyhoeddus, a pholisïau ym meysydd addysg, iechyd, nawdd cymdeithasol, gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, trafniadaeth a'r amgylchedd—popeth ar wahân i warchodaeth fewnol, amddiffyn a materion allanol. Yr ydym yn economaidd hunan-gynhaliol; ni dderbyniwn gymorth cyllidol oddi wrth y DU. I roi syniad bras ichi, mae Gibraltar yn 8 km sgwâr, a chanddi boblogaeth o 30,000 o bobl. Mae gennym weithlu economaidd weithredol o 15,000 o bobl. Mae cyllideb refeniw'r Llywodraeth yn £175 miliwn, a'i wariant ychydig dros £155 miliwn. O'r ffigurau hynny, fe welwch ein bod yn creu gwarged blynyddol rheolaidd yn y gyllideb, ac o hynny byddwn yn talu am ein rhaglen fuddsoddi cyfalaf ein hunain.

Yr ydym yn rhanbarth Amcan 2 yn y Gymuned Ewropeaidd, felly cawn elfen o gyllid Amcan 2 yr Undeb Ewropeaidd—credaf inni dderbyn £6 miliwn o'r rhaglen gyfredol. Lle bach ond hunan-lywodraethol ydym, gyda'n Senedd, ein Llywodraeth, ein gwasanaeth sifil, ein barnwriaeth, ein heddlu a'n tollau tramor a chartref ein hunain, i gyd ar fodel San Steffan a Phrydain. Mae croeso ichi ymweld â ni i weld drosoch eich hunain fod Gibraltar yn wir yn ddarn o Brydain yn haul y Canoldir.

Er hynny, mae gan y Tsieineaidd ddywediad, 'boed ichi fyw mewn amserau diddorol', a fwriedir fel melltit. Yr ydym, yn wir, yn byw mewn amserau diddorol. Fel pobloedd gwladychol ym mhobman, credwn yn yr

to decide our own future. We wish to exercise that right to choose to retain our British sovereignty, and to retain our close, constitutional links with the United Kingdom. Spain, on the other hand, believes that it is still possible to restore the map of Europe to what it was 297 years ago, and claims the sovereignty of Gibraltar. There is an interesting anecdote in that respect: of the last 1,300 years, Gibraltar has been British for 297 years, Spanish for 242, and Moorish for the 900 or so years before that. Spain did not exist 1,300 years ago, so Gibraltar has been British for longer than it has ever been Spanish. Notwithstanding, Spain maintains a claim to obtain the sovereignty of Gibraltar—a claim that it prosecutes with some aggression. For example, there are border restrictions; air and ferry links between Gibraltar and Spain are not allowed; only 30,000 of our telephone numbers can be accessed from the Spanish telephone network; sporting links are not allowed, with Gibraltar barred from joining international sporting federations, and so on. It is a behavioural pattern that you would not expect to find between two places that are both part of the European Community.

We are not adverse to engaging Spain in a process of dialogue—indeed, we welcome it. However, we must be clear that we do so not to surrender or barter away our sovereignty, or our rights to decide on our own future, but simply to establish a normal, European-style relationship of co-operation, mutual respect, friendship and bridge-building. We do not accept that we should pay with any part of our British sovereignty for the things to which we believe we are entitled as Europeans. Yesterday, we had a demonstration in Gibraltar attended by 25,000 people. That does not sound much to you, but 25,000 people means our entire able-bodied population. The purpose of the demonstration was to signal to the Foreign and Commonwealth Office in London that we are willing to participate in reasonable dialogue, but please do not make sovereignty concessions to Spain which will remain on the table despite their rejection by the people of Gibraltar—which will happen as certain as night follows day—in a referendum. We do not mind having our views tested in a

hawl i ymreolaeth, i benderfynu'n dyfodol ein hunain. Dymunwn arfer yr hawl honno i ddewis cadw'n sofraniaeth Brydeinig, a chadw'n perthynas agos, gyfansoddiadol gyda'r Deyrnas Unedig. Cred Sbaen, ar y llaw arall, fod modd o hyd i adfer map Ewrop i'r hyn ydoedd 297 o flynyddoedd yn ôl, ac mae'n hawlio sofraniaeth dros Gibraltar. Mae hanesyn difyr yn hynny o beth: o'r 1,300 o flynyddoedd diwethaf, bu Gibraltar yn Brydeinig am 297 o flynyddoedd, yn Sbaenaidd am 242, ac yn Fwraidd am yr oddeutu 900 mlynedd cyn hynny. Nid oedd Sbaen yn bodoli 1,300 o flynyddoedd yn ôl, felly mae Gibraltar wedi bod yn Brydeinig am fwy o amser nag y bu'n Sbaenaidd erioed. Er hynny, mae Sbaen yn dal i geisio hawlio sofraniaeth dros Gibraltar—hawliad y mae'n ei gyrchu'n dra ymosodol. Er enghraifft, mae cyfyngiadau ar y ffin; ni chaniateir cysylltiadau awyr a fferi rhwng Gibraltar a Sbaen; dim ond 30,000 o'n rhifau ffôn y gellir eu galw o rwydwaith ffôn Sbaen; ni chaniateir cysylltiadau ym myd chwaraeon, ac ni chaiff Gibraltar ymuno â chyrff chwaraeon rhyngwladol, ac yn y blaen. Mae'n batrwm ymddygiad na ddisgwyliech ei weld rhwng dau le sydd ill dau'n rhan o Gymuned Ewrop.

Nid oes gennym wrthwynebiad i ymuno â Sbaen mewn proses o ddeialog—yn wir, croesawn hynny. Ond rhaid inni fod yn glir y gwnawn hynny nid er mwyn ildio na gwerthu'n sofraniaeth, na'n hawliau i benderfynu ar ein dyfodol ein hun, ond yn syml er mwyn sefydlu perthynas normal, Ewropeaidd ei naws, o gydweithredu, cyfeillgarwch a chodi pontydd. Nid ydym yn derbyn y dylem dalu gydag unrhyw ran o'n sofraniaeth Brydeinig am y pethau y credwn y mae gennym hawl iddynt fel Ewropeaid. Ddoe, cawsom wrthdystiad yn Gibraltar gyda 25,000 o bobl yn bresennol. Nid yw hynny'n swnio'n llawer i chi, ond 25,000 o bobl yw'r cyfan o'n poblogaeth gorfforol abl. Pwrpas y gwrthdystiad oedd cyhoeddi i'r Swyddfa Dramor a Chymanwlad yn Llundain ein bod yn fodlon cymryd rhan mewn deialog resymol, ond peidiwch da chi â rhoi consesiynau sofraniaeth i Sbaen a fydd yn aros ar y bwrdd er i bobl Gibraltar eu gwrthod—a fydd yn digwydd cyn sicred ag y mae nos yn dilyn dydd—mewn refferendwm. Nid ydym yn gwrthwynebu profi'n barn

referendum. However, once we have expressed our views, they must be respected, and nothing which is adverse to the wishes of the people of Gibraltar with regard to British sovereignty, which compromises our rights or our sovereignty, or which legitimises the Spanish sovereignty claim over Gibraltar, should survive that rejection.

Presiding Officer, I have been given the 30-second warning. I know that it is regarded as a near-hanging offence for invited speakers to overstep their mark. I am grateful for the opportunity to address you, and for the measure of support that some Members have already expressed. Members of our House of Assembly, from both the Government and opposition benches, look forward to meeting as many as possible of your Assembly Members during the forthcoming regional meeting of the Commonwealth Parliamentary Association. Thank you. [*Applause.*]

mewn refferendwm. Fodd bynnag, unwaith y byddwn wedi mynegi'n barn, rhaid ei pharchu, ac ni ddylai dim sy'n groes i ddymuniadau pobl Gibraltar parthed sofraniaeth Brydeinig, sy'n cyfaddawdu'n hawliau neu'n sofraniaeth, neu sy'n cyfreithloni hawliad sofraniaeth Sbaen dros Gibraltar, gael goroesi'r gwrthodiad hwnnw.

Lywydd, cefais y rhybudd 30 eiliad. Gwn yr ystyri'r ei bod bron yn drosedd grogi i siaradwyr gwadd fynd dros eu hamser. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle i'ch annerch, ac am hynny o gefnogaeth a fynegwyd eisoes gan rai Aelodau. Mae Aelodau'n Tŷ Ymgynnull ni, ar feinciau'r Llywodraeth a'r wrthblaid fel ei gilydd, yn edrych ymlaen at gyfarfod â chynifer ag sy'n bosibl o'ch Aelodau Cynulliad yn ystod y cyfarfod rhanbarthol sydd i ddod o Gymdeithas Seneddol y Gymanwlad. Diolch. [*Cymeradwyaeth.*]

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru Questions to the First Minister

Y Llywydd: Mae cwestiwn 1 (OAQ16430) wedi'i dynnu yn ôl.

The Presiding Officer: Question 1 (OAQ16430) has been withdrawn.

Hybu Buddsoddiad yng Nghymru Promoting Investment in Wales

Q2 Jocelyn Davies: What assessment has been made of the effect of Assembly policies in promoting investment to all sectors of Wales? (OAQ16412)

C2 Jocelyn Davies: Pa asesiad a wnaed o effaith polisiau'r Cynulliad ar hybu buddsoddiad ym mhob sector yng Nghymru? (OAQ16412)

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): We promote investment in all areas of Wales, but preference is given to the two thirds of Wales in the Objective 1, or tier 1, area. Further preference is given to the 9 per cent of Wales in the tier 2 area. That is why I was pleased that the European Semiconductor Manufacturing Ltd plant in Newport—the only semiconductor plant in Wales—was saved yesterday with the assistance of an Assembly Government grant. It will be bought by International Rectifier of Swansea.

Prif Weinidog Cymru (Rhodri Morgan): Yr ydym yn hybu buddsoddiad ym mhob ardal yng Nghymru, ond rhoddir blaenoriaeth i'r ddau draean o Gymru sydd yn yr ardal Amcan 1, neu haen 1. Rhoddir blaenoriaeth yn ogystal i'r 9 y cant o Gymru sydd yn yr ardal haen 2. Dyna pam yr oeddwn yn falch y cafodd ffatri cwmni European Semiconductor Manufacturing Cyf yng Nghasnewydd—yr unig ffatri led-ddargludyddion yng Nghymru—ei hachub ddoe gyda chymorth grant gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Caiff ei phrynu gan International Rectifier o Abertawe.

I was also pleased to visit Bangor last Friday, where I was able to celebrate the building and opening of a major new mail order warehouse for The Book People. It will provide 180 jobs at the other end of Wales, with an additional 250 seasonal jobs between September and Christmas. I could go on, but it will be better to discover the extent of Jocelyn's happiness at this flow of investment into all parts of Wales.

Jocelyn Davies: Do you agree with Mike German's assessment of the situation, laid out in his recent article in *The House Magazine*, which claims that three quarters of your Government's policies are in fact Liberal Democrat ideas?

The First Minister: I sympathise with Jocelyn's unsuccessful struggle to ensure that her supplementary was relevant to the original question. I should remind her of other areas where we have succeeded in bringing investment to all sectors of Wales. She will, perhaps, join me in congratulating Biotrace International plc, Bridgend, in winning the *Financial Times* award for the best technology public limited company in the whole of the United Kingdom. It beat a shortlist of four—all of which were Welsh. She will also, perhaps, join me in congratulating BHP Billiton—a major multinational company—which has decided to move the vast bulk of its head office from London to Flint. She may also, as she lives in that area, be willing to manifest her happiness at the fact that General Dynamics UK Ltd has decided to move its operational and research and development headquarters to the Oakdale Business Park. I am sure that she would be happy to realise that that is a flow of top quality investment to all parts of Wales, but with an emphasis on Objective 1 areas.

Kirsty Williams: With regard to the Liberal Democrat idea of a tier 3 fund for Wales, when will it be launched, and how many businesses in my constituency of Brecon and Radnorshire do you anticipate will be helped?

The First Minister: I am glad that you raised that point because there is no part of Wales

Yr oeddwn yn falch hefyd o ymweld â Bangor ddydd Gwener diwethaf, lle gallais ddatlu adeiladu ac agor warws archebion post mawr newydd i gwmni The Book People. Bydd yn darparu 180 o swyddi ym mhen arall Cymru, gyda 250 o swyddi tymhorol ar ben hynny rhwng mis Medi a'r Nadolig. Gallwn fynd ymlaen, ond bydd yn well canfod beth yw maint llawenydd Jocelyn gyda'r llif o fuddsoddiad i bob rhan o Gymru.

Jocelyn Davies: A ydych yn cytuno ag asesiad Mike German o'r sefyllfa, a amlinellwyd yn ei erthygl ddiweddar yn *The House Magazine*, sy'n honni mai syniadau'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol mewn gwirionedd yw tri chwarter polisïau'ch Llywodraeth chi?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Cydymdeimlaf ag ymdrech aflwyddiannus Jocelyn i sicrhau bod ei chwestiwn atodol yn berthnasol i'r cwestiwn gwreiddiol. Dylwn ei hatgoffa am ardaloedd eraill lle'r ydym wedi llwyddo i ddod â buddsoddiad i bob sector yng Nghymru. Efallai y gwnaiff ymuno â mi i longyfarch Biotrace International ccc, Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr, ar ennill gwobr y *Financial Times* i'r cwmni cyfyngedig cyhoeddus gorau ym maes technoleg drwy'r Deyrnas Unedig gyfan. Fe gurodd restr fer o bedwar—pob un ohonynt o Gymru. Efallai hefyd y gwnaiff ymuno â mi i longyfarch BHP Billiton—cwmni rhyngwladol mawr—sydd wedi penderfynu symud y rhan helaeth o'i brif swyddfa o Lundain i'r Fflint. Efallai hefyd, gan ei bod yn byw yn yr ardal honno, y bydd yn fodlon mynegi'i llawenydd ynghylch y ffaith fod General Dynamics UK Cyf wedi penderfynu symud ei bencadlys gweithredol ac ymchwil a datblygu i Barc Busnes Oakdale. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'n hapus i sylweddoli bod hynny'n llif o fuddsoddiad o'r radd flaenaf i bob rhan o Gymru, ond gyda phwyslais ar ardaloedd Amcan 1.

Kirsty Williams: Ynghylch syniad y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol am gronfa haen 3 i Gymru, pa bryd y caiff honno ei lansio, a sawl busnes yn fy etholaeth i, sef Brycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed, a gaiff eu helpu, yn ôl a ragwelwch chi?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr wyf yn falch ichi godi'r pwynt hwnnw oherwydd nid oes yr un

that does not benefit from Assembly policies. In an area such as Powys, most of which, geographically speaking, you represent, along with your Liberal Democrat colleague, Mick Bates, the issue of what you do for the so-called white areas, which are not eligible for tier 1 or tier 2 funding, is important. I am pleased that we are close to an agreement on an Assembly investment grant for small and medium-sized enterprises in those areas. This will be of great benefit to them, as they sometimes feel left out because they are not eligible for tier 1 or tier 2 funding.

Rosemary Butler: You are aware of our disappointment in Newport, with the loss of a number of jobs over the last couple of years, and I am pleased with your efforts to ensure that International Rectifier takes over the ESM plant. Can you give an assurance that International Rectifier is a better employer than ESM, which treated its employees in an abominable manner? I look forward to having proper discussions with International Rectifier to ensure that the future of as many jobs as possible is secure at the plant in Newport.

The First Minister: ESM had been through an extraordinarily difficult time—I do not believe that I am exaggerating in saying that there has been something close to a holocaust in the semiconductor industry worldwide. We have only one semiconductor plant in Wales, into which we have put enormous effort to ensure that it is retained. We originally assisted it during the management buy-out from its former receivers, following its Hong Kong ownership. That was important. We anticipate that several hundred additional jobs will be created at the ESM plant—I understand that close to 400 additional jobs will be created on top of the 260 jobs that were effectively saved by yesterday's announcement, which I am sure we all welcome.

William Graham: Will you outline changes in manufacturing and service industry investment in Wales, and how Assembly policies assist communities to adapt to these changes?

rhan o Gymru nad yw'n elwa ar bolisiau'r Cynulliad. Mewn ardal fel Powys, yr ydych chi'n cynrychioli'r rhan fwyaf ohoni, mewn termau daearyddol, ynghyd â'ch cyd-aelod o Ddemocrat Rhyddfrydol, Mick Bates, mae'r cwestiwn beth a wnewch chi i'r ardaloedd gwyn, fel y'u gelwir, sef yr ardaloedd nad ydynt yn gymwys ar gyfer cyllid haen 1 na haen 2, yn bwysig. Yr wyf yn falch ein bod yn nesáu at gytundeb ar grant buddsoddi gan y Cynulliad i fentrau bach a chanolig yn yr ardaloedd hynny. Bydd hyn o fudd mawr iddynt, gan eu bod weithiau'n teimlo eu bod ar eu colled am nad ydynt yn gymwys i gael arian haen 1 na haen 2.

Rosemary Butler: Yr ydych yn ymwybodol o'n siom yng Nghasnewydd, yn sgîl colli nifer o swyddi yn y flwyddyn neu ddwy ddiwethaf, ac yr wyf wedi fy mhlesio gyda'ch ymdrechion i sicrhau bod International Rectifier yn cymryd ffatri ESM. A allwch roi sicrwydd fod International Rectifier yn well cyflogwr nag ESM, a driniodd ei weithwyr yn wael ofnadwy? Edrychaf ymlaen at gael trafodaethau iawn gydag International Rectifier i sicrhau bod dyfodol cynifer o swyddi ag sy'n bosibl yn ddiogel yn y ffatri yng Nghasnewydd.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr oedd ESM wedi bod drwy amser eithriadol o anodd—ni chredaf fy mod yn gor-ddweud pan ddywedaf y cafwyd rhywbeth agos at alanas yn y diwydiant lled-ddargludyddion ar draws y byd. Dim ond un ffatri led-ddargludyddion sydd gennym yng Nghymru, ac yr ydym wedi ymdrechu'n aruthrol i geisio sicrhau ein bod yn ei chadw. Rhoesom gymorth iddi'n wreiddiol pan oedd y rheolwyr yn ei phrynu oddi wrth ei derbynwyr blaenorol, wedi iddi fod ym meddiant cwmni o Hong Kong. Yr oedd hynny'n bwysig. Rhagwelwn y caiff rhai cannoedd o swyddi ychwanegol eu creu yn ffatri ESM—deallaf y creir yn agos at 400 o swyddi ychwanegol ar ben y 260 o swyddi a achubwyd i bob pwrpas gan gyhoeddiad ddoe, ac yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod i gyd yn croesawu hynny.

William Graham: A wnewch chi amlinellu newidiadau yn y buddsoddiad yn y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu a gwasanaeth yng Nghymru, a sut y mae polisiau'r Cynulliad yn helpu cymunedau i ymaddasu i'r newidiadau

hyn?

The First Minister: There are two essential components to this, and one is that you treat service industries *pari passu*, as having the same status as manufacturing, in recognition of the way in which the economy is changing. It is impossible, in advanced western economies such as Great Britain, to maintain the same proportion of employment in manufacturing, because it gains its additional tonnage output by improved productivity rather than by creating extra jobs. Therefore, jobs growth will come from the service industries. I mentioned The Book People, the e-mail and mail order warehouse in Bangor; it is a service industry project that we treated as a manufacturing project for grant purposes. Within manufacturing, you move up the value chain in the type of products produced, and in the fact that you also get the head office and the research and development departments. That is why I was also pleased to mention the General Dynamics plant. BHP Billiton is another excellent service industry project whose head office is moving from London to Flint, bringing with it the high wages and high spending power that you would expect. That is part of the change in the economy; we are staying well abreast of that change.

John Griffiths: As far as the steel sector is concerned, following the recently announced sale of its aluminium operations, which will free up money for investment, will you join me in urging Corus to continue to invest in its operation in Wales to aid recovery from the recent cutbacks?

The First Minister: It is way down the track, but we will certainly do that when Corus has the money. It announced yesterday that it was to put the aluminium division up for sale—it has not sold it yet. It is hoping to get close to £1 billion for it. Some of the money will go towards debt reduction, but we will be pressing the company to invest. If you do not invest in steel, you die.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae dwy gydran hanfodol i hyn, ac un yw eich bod yn trin diwydiannau gwasanaeth yn gydradd, gyda'r un statws â diwydiannau gweithgynhyrchu, gan gydnabod y ffordd y mae'r economi'n newid. Mae'n amhosibl, mewn economi orllewinol ddatblygedig fel un Prydain Fawr, cynnal yr un gyfran o gyflogaeth mewn gweithgynhyrchu, oherwydd mae diwydiant yn sicrhau cynnydd yn y tunelli y mae'n eu cynhyrchu drwy wella cynhyrchedd yn hytrach na thrwy greu swyddi ychwanegol. O'r diwydiannau gwasanaeth y daw twf swyddi, felly. Soniais am gwmi The Book People, y warws archebion post ac e-bost ym Mangor; dyna brosiect diwydiant gwasanaeth a driniwyd gennym ni fel prosiect gweithgynhyrchu at ddibenion grant. O fewn gweithgynhyrchu, symudwch i fyny'r gadwyn werth yn y math o gynhyrchion a gynhyrchir, ac yn y ffaith y cewch y brif swyddfa a'r adrannau ymchwil a datblygu hefyd. Dyna pam yr oeddwn yn falch o sôn am ffatri General Dynamics hefyd. Mae BHP Billiton yn brosiect diwydiant gwasanaeth ardderchog arall sy'n symud ei brif swyddfa o Lundain i'r Fflint, gan ddod â'r cyflogau uchel a'r grym gwario uchel a ddisgwylicch gyda hi. Dyna ran o'r newid yn yr economi; yr ydym yn cydgerdded â'r newid hwnnw.

John Griffiths: O ran y sector dur, yn dilyn y bwriad a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar i werthu ei waith alwminiwm er mwyn rhyddhau arian ar gyfer buddsoddi, a wnewch chi ymuno â mi i annog Corus i barhau i fuddsoddi yn ei waith yng Nghymru i gynorthwyo adferiad yn sgîl y toriadau diweddar?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae hynny ymhell i ffwrdd, ond yn sicr fe wnawn ni hynny pan fydd yr arian gan Corus. Cyhoeddodd ddoe ei fod yn bwriadu rhoi'r adran alwminiwm ar werth—nid yw wedi ei gwerthu eto. Mae'n gobeithio cael yn agos at £1 biliwn amdani. Aiff rhywfaint o'r arian at leihau dyledion, ond byddwn yn pwyso ar y cwmni i fuddsoddi. Os na fuddsoddwch mewn dur, mae ar ben arnoch.

Blaenoriaethau Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ar gyfer y Chwe Mis Nesaf
Priorities of the National Assembly for Wales for the Next Six Months

Q3 Lynne Neagle: Will the First Minister make a statement on discussions he has had with the Secretary of State for Wales regarding the priorities of the National Assembly for Wales for the next six months? (OAQ16426)

First Minister: I will mention some of my discussions with the Secretary of State for Wales on how we intend to implement the changes to the health service. You will be aware, Lynne, that the Assembly approved the Townsend report in a debate last week, and it will be implemented from 1 April 2003. However, over the next 12 months, much effort will go into the planning that is needed for its implementation. Furthermore, you will be aware of our new targets for health delivery: there will be a maximum waiting list of four months for cataract surgery, 12 months for cardiac surgery, and 18 months for orthopaedic surgery.

Lynne Neagle: Following other Members' remarks, do you agree that giving even more support to manufacturing industry in Wales should be one of the top priorities for the Assembly and for the UK Government over the next six months? Given the problems that areas such as Torfaen and the whole of the former Gwent face as a result of job losses in Corus and other companies, will you outline how the administration will be supporting manufacturing industry to stay in the area? How will you be helping those people made redundant to access training and new work?

2:10 p.m.

The First Minister: We will do that through a proactive use of regional selective assistance and the Welsh Development Agency's ability to construct tailor-made factory premises via the property development grant. It is the package that can be put together that really makes the difference. By our use of regional selective assistance and the WDA's use of the property development grant, we attracted The Book

C3 Lynne Neagle: A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar y trafodaethau y mae wedi'u cael gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynghylch blaenoriaethau Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ar gyfer y chwe mis nesaf? (OAQ16426)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Fe grybwyllaf rai o'm trafodaethau gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynghylch sut y bwriadwn weithredu'r newidiadau i'r gwasanaeth iechyd. Fe wyddoch, Lynne, fod y Cynulliad wedi cymeradwyo adroddiad Townsend mewn dadl yr wythnos diwethaf, ac y'i gweithredir o 1 Ebrill 2003. Fodd bynnag, dros y 12 mis nesaf, gwneir llawer o ymdrech ar y cynllunio sy'n angenrheidiol ar gyfer ei roi ar waith. Yn ogystal, gwyddoch am ein targedau newydd ar gyfer gwasanaethau iechyd: bydd rhestr aros o bedwar mis fan bellaf am lawdriniaeth i gataract, 12 mis am lawdriniaeth ar y galon, a 18 mis am lawdriniaeth orthopedig.

Lynne Neagle: Yn dilyn sylwadau Aelodau eraill, a ydych yn cytuno mai un o'r blaenoriaethau pennaf i'r Cynulliad ac i Lywodraeth y DU dros y chwe mis nesaf ddylai fod rhoi mwy fyth o gefnogaeth i'r diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru? Gyda'r problemau y mae ardaloedd fel Torfaen a'r cyfan o'r hen Went yn eu hwynebu o ganlyniad i golli swyddi yn Corus a chwmnïau eraill, a wnewch chi amlinellu sut y bydd y weinyddiaeth yn cefnogi'r diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu i'w gadw yn yr ardal? Sut fyddwch chi'n helpu'r bobl hynny a roddwyd ar y clwt i gael hyfforddiant a gwaith newydd?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Fe wnawn hynny drwy ddefnydd rhagweithiol o gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol, a thrwy allu Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru i adeiladu ffatrioedd pwrpasol drwy'r grant datblygu eiddo. Y pecyn y gellir ei roi at ei gilydd yw'r peth sy'n gwneud y gwahaniaeth mewn gwirionedd. Trwy'n defnydd ni o gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol a defnydd yr Awdurdod Datblygu o'r grant datblygu eiddo,

People to Bangor. The same principle will apply in Torfaen or in south-east Wales or in any of the areas worst hit by the Corus job losses announced in February last year. That is the key. I am sure that we will have more success in bringing manufacturing industry in, or as often happens now following takeovers, where the newly merged company has 15 plants in seven different countries and wants to rationalise over a two-year period to having seven plants in four countries, we must ensure that Wales is one of the countries that has a plant and not one of the ones left out as that post-merger rationalisation process progresses. That is where proactive use of RSA to safeguard jobs can be as valuable as the provision of RSA for creating new jobs.

David Davies: Will you be discussing with the Secretary of State for Wales why one of the top priorities for the National Assembly at present is spending £20 million on a science-fiction style monorail, which will convey people from the Assembly building to Cardiff county hall across the road? If building funfair rides is a priority, would it not be better to send your Cabinet off on an awayday to Alton Towers and spend that £20 million on schools, hospitals and proper transport facilities for people throughout Wales?

The First Minister: I did not know that you were a transport expert, David. What new skill do you have that ensures that you are right and that the transport experts that we are using are completely wrong? It was a one-sided, hysterical and completely over-the-top remark. When the pilot project is completed for the ULTra advanced technology vehicle, if it works it may find a place in city transport mass transit systems around the world; if it does not work, then it will not. We are funding a pilot project. If you do not fund pilot projects you do not do anything for the first time. A mark of a good Conservative, David, is someone who believes you should never do anything for the first time. We would not have invented the wheel if you had

llwyddasom i ddenu The Book People i Fangor. Bydd yr un egwyddor yn wir yn Nhorfaen neu yn y De-ddwyrain neu yn unrhyw un o'r ardaloedd yr effeithiwyd arnynt waethaf gan golledion swyddi Corus a gyhoeddwyd yn Chwefror y llynedd. Dyna'r allwedd. Yr wyf yn siŵr y cawn ragor o lwyddiant yn denu diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu, neu, fel sy'n digwydd yn aml yn awr wedi i gwmni gael ei gymryd drosodd, lle bo gan y cwmni cyfunedig newydd 15 o ffatrioedd mewn saith gwlad wahanol a bod arno eisiau rhesymoli dros gyfnod o ddwy flynedd i gael saith ffatri mewn pedair gwlad, rhaid inni sicrhau bod Cymru'n un o'r gwledydd a gaiff ffatri ac nid yn un o'r rhai a gaiff eu gadael ar ôl wrth i'r broses resymoli ôl-gyfuno honno fynd yn ei blaen. Dyna lle gall defnyddio cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol mewn modd rhagweithiol i ddiogelu swyddi fod yr un mor werthfawr â'i ddefnyddio i greu swyddi newydd.

David Davies: A fyddwch yn trafod gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru pam mai un o'r prif flaenoriaethau i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar hyn o bryd yw gwario £20 miliwn ar monoreilffordd sy'n perthyn i fyd ffuglen wyddonol, er mwyn cludo pobl o adeilad y Cynulliad i neuadd sir Caerdydd dros y ffordd? Os yw adeiladu reidiau ffair yn flaenoriaeth, oni fyddai'n well anfon eich Cabinet am ddiwrnod i Alton Towers a gwario'r £20 miliwn hynny ar ysgolion, ysbytai a chyfleusterau cludiant iawn i bobl ar hyd a lled Cymru?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ni wyddwn eich bod yn arbenigwr ar drafnidiaeth, David. Pa allu newydd sydd gennych sy'n sicrhau mai chi sy'n iawn a bod yr arbenigwyr trafnidiaeth a ddefnyddir gennym ni yn gwbl anghywir? Yr oedd eich sylw'n unochrog, yn orffwyll ac yn gwbl dros ben llestri. Pan gwblheir y prosiect peilot ar gyfer y cerbyd technoleg uwch ULTra, os bydd yn gweithio efallai y caiff le mewn systemau cludiant torfol dinasoedd ledled y byd; os na fydd yn gweithio, dyna ben arni. Yr ydym yn ariannu prosiect peilot. Os nad ariannwch chi brosiectau peilot ni wnewch chi ddim byd am y tro cyntaf. Arwydd o Geidwadwr da, David, yw rhywun sy'n credu na ddylech byth wneud dim byd am y tro cyntaf. Ni fyddem wedi dyfeisio'r

that attitude in the Stone Age, which is no doubt where you would like us to return.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Pan ddewch yn ôl o Alton Towers, a wnewch chi dreulio ychydig amser yn trafod gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru yr arolwg a gyhoeddwyd gan Sefydliad y Rheolwyr sy'n dangos bod economi Cymru mewn cyflwr bregus? Mae'n ceisio ymateb i argyfyngau megis yr hyn a ddigwyddodd ar ôl y gyflafan yn Efrog Newydd ar 11 Medi. O ystyried bod economi Cymru wedi cael dwy ergyd sylweddol y llynedd, nid yn unig effaith y gyflafan honno, ond hefyd argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau, a allwch ddweud wrthym ba gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cymru a Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Gyfunol yn eu cymryd i sicrhau y bydd economi Cymru yn gallu ymateb i argyfyngau tebyg yn llawer gwell yn y dyfodol?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae pawb yn derbyn bod cynllun adfywio Cymru wledig, y bu i ni ei lunio ar ôl clwy'r traed a'r genau, gystal—os nad yn well—na chynlluniau tebyg a gyflwynwyd yn yr Alban ac yn Lloegr. Ni chlywais neb yng Nghymru wledig yn cwyno ynghylch natur y cynllun hwnnw sy'n helpu gwahanol sectorau economi wledig Cymru—sef amaethyddiaeth, twristiaeth a busnesau bach eraill—i atgyfodi ar ôl sioc clwy'r traed a'r genau a'r hyn a ddigwyddodd ar 11 Medi.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Surely you accept, First Minister, that the joint impact of both of these disasters on the Welsh economy was immense. Are you really asking us to accept that the proposals that you drafted were the answer to that and that the Welsh economy will be in a better position to overcome those difficulties in the future? We must ensure now that we are in a position to spread prosperity throughout the whole of Wales. Will you reconsider your rejection of the Plaid Cymru proposals on regional targets for job creation? Is it not the case that we must now ensure that devolution benefits and engages all regions of Wales? Would that not be an easy answer for you to give to Huw Lewis, who now complains that you are more interested in petty palace politics than in

olwyn pe bai'r agwedd honno i'w gweld yn Oes y Cerrig, a dyna'n ddi-os lle yr hoffech inni ddychwelyd.

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): When you return from Alton Towers, will you spend a little time discussing with the Secretary of State for Wales the review that was published by the Institute of Management which shows that the Welsh economy is vulnerable? It strives to react to crises such as the repercussions of the 11 September atrocity in New York. Given that the Welsh economy suffered two damaging blows last year, not only that atrocity, but also the foot and mouth disease crisis, can you tell us what steps the Government of Wales and the UK Government are taking to ensure that the Welsh economy will be able to react more effectively to similar crises in the future?

The First Minister: Everyone accepts that the regeneration plan for rural Wales, which we drafted after the foot and mouth disease outbreak, is as good—if not better—than similar plans introduced in Scotland and in England. I have not heard anyone in rural Wales complaining about the nature of that plan which is helping the different sectors of the rural economy in Wales—namely agriculture, tourism and other small businesses—to rebuild after the impact of foot and mouth disease and the events of 11 September.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Siawns nad ydych yn derbyn, Brif Weinidog, fod cyd-ffaith y ddwy drychineb hynny ar economi Cymru yn aruthrol. A ydych mewn gwirionedd yn gofyn inni dderbyn fod y cynigion a ddrafftiwyd gennych yn ateb i hynny ac y bydd economi Cymru mewn sefyllfa well i oresgyn yr anawsterau hyn yn y dyfodol? Rhaid inni sicrhau yn awr ein bod mewn sefyllfa i ledaenu ffyniant drwy Gymru gyfan. A wnewch chi ailystyried eich penderfyniad i wrthod cynigion Plaid Cymru ar dargedau rhanbarthol ar gyfer creu swyddi? Onid yw'n wir fod yn rhaid inni bellach sicrhau bod datganoli'n rhoi budd a llais i holl ranbarthau Cymru? Oni fyddai hynny'n ateb hawdd ichi ei roi i Huw Lewis, sy'n cwyno'n awr fod gennych fwy o

eradicating poverty in Wales?

The First Minister: Never believe what you read in the press, Ieuan. On the first part of your question, which was a repetition of the first part of your previous question, are we talking about different reports here? I thought that you were talking about rural Wales and tourism and whether we were badly affected by foot and mouth disease and 11 September with regard to tourism. As regards the overall impact on the Welsh economy, it is true that 11 September had a devastating short-term impact on the aerospace industry. It is remarkable how management, unions and the community in general has pulled together to help the aerospace industry through that crisis, which is expected to last until the beginning of 2004. They have done remarkably well to create an atmosphere—to which you have not contributed—to readiness to spring forward in 2004 when we face the up-turn and the resumption of aircraft ordering.

You always trot out regional targets, Ieuan, as though it were the easy answer to everything. I always assumed that Plaid Cymru's interest in regional targets was so that you could say different things to different people in different parts of Wales. You could then say that you were for the Valleys when you were in the Valleys and for rural Wales when in rural Wales. As I said in an earlier reply, we give our top priority to Objective 1 Wales. That is two thirds of Wales. Then, we give a further priority to Objective 2, or tier 2, Wales, giving a further 9 per cent, which makes 74 per cent. That is the strongest package in terms of pumping money into industry anywhere in the UK at the moment. It is also the strongest package seen in Wales since the height of the pit closures in the mid-1960s, 35 years ago.

ddiddordeb mewn mân wleidyddia ymysg arweinwyr nag mewn dileu tlodi yng Nghymru?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Peidiwch byth â chredu'r hyn a ddarllenwch yn y wasg, Ieuan. Ynghylch rhan gyntaf eich cwestiwn, a oedd yn ailbobiad o ran gyntaf eich cwestiwn blaenorol, a ydym yn sôn am adroddiadau gwahanol yma? Yr oeddwn yn meddwl eich bod yn sôn am y Gymru wledig a thwristiaeth ac effaith clwy'r traed a'r genau ac 11 Medi ar dwristiaeth. O ran yr effaith gyffredinol ar economi Cymru, mae'n wir fod 11 Medi wedi cael effaith ddinistriol yn y tymor byr ar y diwydiant aerofod. Mae'r modd y llwyddodd y rheolwyr, yr undebau a'r gymuned yn gyffredinol i gyd-dynnu i helpu'r diwydiant aerofod drwy'r argyfwng hwnnw, y disgwylir iddo bara tan ddechrau 2004, yn hynod. Maent wedi gwneud yn arbennig o dda i greu awyrgylch—nad ydych chi wedi cyfrannu ato—o barodrwydd i neidio ymlaen yn 2004 pan fydd pethau ar i fyny a phan aildechreuir archebu awyrennau.

Yr ydych bob amser yn adrodd pader targedau rhanbarthol, Ieuan, fel pe bai'n ateb hawdd i bopeth. Yr oeddwn bob amser wedi tybio mai'r rheswm dros ddiddordeb Plaid Cymru mewn targedau rhanbarthol oedd fel y gallech ddweud gwahanol bethau wrth wahanol bobl mewn gwahanol rannau o Gymru. Wedyn gallech ddweud eich bod o blaid y Cymoedd pan fyddech yn y Cymoedd ac o blaid cefn gwlad pan fyddech yn y wlad. Fel y dywedais mewn ateb cynharach, rhoddwn ein blaenoriaeth uchaf i Gymru Amcan 1. Mae hynny'n ddwy ran o dair o Gymru. Wedyn, rhoddwn flaenoriaeth bellach i Gymru Amcan 2, neu haen 2, sef 9 y cant arall, sy'n gwneud 74 y cant. Dyna'r pecyn cryfaf yn nhermau pwmpio arian i mewn i ddiwydiant yn unman yn y DU ar hyn o bryd. Dyna hefyd y pecyn cryfaf a welwyd yng Nghymru ers pan oedd y rhaglen i gau'r pyllau glo yn ei hanterth yng nghanol y 1960au, 35 mlynedd yn ôl.

De-Orllewin Cymru South-West Wales

C4 David Lloyd: A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar sut mae polisïau ei

Q4 David Lloyd: Will the First Minister make a statement on how his Government's

lywodraeth yn effeithio ar dde-orllewin Cymru? (OAQ16429)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Byddem yn awyddus i ganolbwyntio, y prynhawn yma, ar fater y technïams. Polisi newydd sbon a ddyfeisiwyd yn y De-orllewin gan Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru ac eraill ydyw. Dechreuodd yn Abertawe, ac mae'r technïum cyntaf yn fwy o lwyddiant nag y gellid bod wedi breuddwydio. Yn awr, cyflwynir y syniad ymhellach, gyda technïum arall yn Llandeilo. Bydd un arall ym Mhen-bre a Dafen, gydag un arall wedyn ar gyfer sectorau pwysig megis ynni ym Maglan. Dyna gyfraniad mawr y De-orllewin i ddyfodol ein heconomi dros y chwarter canrif nesaf.

David Lloyd: I bwysu arnoch ymhellach, beth a wnewch i ddenu mwy o swyddi i ardal Abertawe yn benodol o hyn ymlaen? A gytunwch â Huw Lewis fod angen gwneud llawer mwy i fynd i'r afael â thlodi yn y De? Un ffordd o wneud hynny yw cael targedau rhanbarthol penodol i gynyddu swyddi mewn rhanbarthau lle mae eu hangen.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr ydym wedi gwneud llawer drwy roi £5.6 miliwn ychwanegol i'r WDA yn chwarter olaf y flwyddyn ariannol hon fel y gall fuddsoddi ymhellach ym mhrosiect Pentref Arloesedd Porth Tawe. Mae'r fath syniad wrth wraidd yr hyn a wnawn. Mae'r hyn a gyflawnwn yn bwysicach o lawer na thargedau, neu'r hyn yr ydych yn siarad ac yn ysgrifennu amdano. Yr hyn yr ydych yn ei wneud yw'r prawf, a gallwn ddangos ein bod wedi buddsoddi llawer yn Abertawe: £9 miliwn yn yr ysgol glinigol newydd, £10 miliwn—fe gredaf—yn y pwll nofio cenedlaethol newydd, grant o oddeutu £13 miliwn i ganolfan siopa newydd Castle Keys, ac ati. Ni fyddai'n rhesymol i unrhyw un yn Abertawe gwyno nad ydym wedi cymryd y camau yr ydych yn sôn amdanynt i greu llewyrch newydd yn Abertawe a'r cylch.

Alun Cairns: Yr ydych wedi sôn eisoes am International Rectifier, sydd wedi cyhoeddi safle newydd yng Nghasnewydd. Fodd bynnag, a ydych yn pryderu mai dim ond 100 o swyddi a grewyd ar safle International Rectifier yn Abertawe pan fo'r cwmni wedi addo creu 500 o swyddi? Gan bod 'Cymru'n

policies affect south-west Wales? (OAQ16429)

The First Minister: We would be keen to focus, this afternoon, on technïams. It is a brand new policy that was devised in south-west Wales by the Welsh Development Agency and others. It started in Swansea, and the first technïum is a greater success than could ever have been imagined. Now, the idea is being rolled out further, with another technïum at Llandeilo. There will be another at Pembrey and Dafen, with another later for important sectors such as energy at Baglan. That is south-west Wales's great contribution to the future of our economy over the next quarter century.

David Lloyd: To press you further, what will you do to attract more jobs to the Swansea area specifically from now on? Do you agree with Huw Lewis that much more must be done to tackle poverty in south Wales? One way to do that is to set specific regional targets to increase jobs in regions where they are needed.

The First Minister: We have done a great deal by providing an additional £5.6 million to the WDA in the last quarter of this financial year so that it can invest more extensively in the Port Tawe Innovation Village. Such ideas are at the heart of what we do. Our achievements are far more important than targets, or what you speak or write about. Actions speak louder than words, and we can show that we have invested a great deal in Swansea: £9 million in the new clinical school, £10 million—I believe—in the new national swimming pool, a grant of around £13 million for the new Castle Keys shopping centre, and so on. It would not be reasonable for anyone in Swansea to complain that we have not taken the steps that you mention to create new prosperity in Swansea and the surrounding area.

Alun Cairns: You have already mentioned International Rectifier, which has announced a new site at Newport. However, are you concerned that only 100 jobs have been created on the International Rectifier site in Swansea when the company promised to create 500 jobs? As 'A Winning Wales'

Ennill' yn sôn am sefydlu clystyrau, a ydych yn credu y byddai'n syniad da denu International Rectifier i sefydlu ail ffatri yn Abertawe er mwyn creu clwstwr ychwanegol yno?

2:20 p.m.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Dyna ymateb hollol afresymol a thruenus i newyddion da ein bod wedi gallu achub swyddi a oedd ar fin diflannu yng Nghasnewydd. Yr oedd y cwmni yn nwylo'r derbynnydd ac wedi mynd yn llanast. Yr ydym wedi achub y swyddi ac mae addewid y caiff tua 400 o swyddi ychwanegol eu creu yng Nghasnewydd. O ran ffatri International Rectifier ym Mhenllergaer, y mae cynlluniau'r cwmni yn bwrw yn eu blaen. Dywed ei fod am gyrraedd y nod o greu 500 o swyddi o fewn pum mlynedd. Y mae'n hollol sicr y gall gyrraedd y nod. Felly, nid wyf yn deall eich problem, Alun, o ran newyddion da i economi Cymru.

mentions setting up clusters, do you think that it would be a good idea to attract International Rectifier to establish a second factory in Swansea in order to create an additional cluster there?

The First Minister: That is a totally unreasonable and pitiful response to the good news that we have been able to save jobs which were about to be lost in Newport. The company was in administration and had become a shambles. We have saved the jobs and there is a promise that around 400 additional jobs will be created in Newport. Regarding the International Rectifier factory at Penllergaer, the company's plans are going ahead. It says that it will achieve its target of creating 500 jobs within five years. It is absolutely sure that it can achieve the target. Therefore, I do not understand your problem, Alun, regarding good news for the Welsh economy.

Cysylltiadau â Gwledydd a Rhanbarthau yn Ewrop Links with Nations and Regions in Europe

Q5 Peter Black: What is being done to improve Wales's links with nations and regions in Europe with similar interests? (OAQ16424)

The First Minister: We have links with the statutory element of Europe's emerging constitution, namely the Committee of the Regions, and we are also members of other bodies, which one can choose to join—it would be unwise to join them all because you could not find enough people to sit on them. Nevertheless, we have chosen to join the Conference of Peripheral and Maritime Regions. The Assembly is also a member of the group of regions with legislative powers in Europe. Between now and the next intergovernmental conference—which may choose to rewrite the treaties governing Europe—the regions' position will be under the spotlight as part of the subsidiarity agenda. That agenda will consider what Europe, member states and regional tier Governments, such as ours, should be doing. That will be determined in early 2004 and we must ensure that we have a voice.

C5 Peter Black: Beth sy'n cael ei wneud i wella cysylltiadau Cymru â gwledydd a rhanbarthau yn Ewrop sydd â diddordebau cyffelyb? (OAQ16424)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae gennym gysylltiadau gyda'r elfen statudol yng nghyfansoddiad gwledydd bach Ewrop, sef Pwyllgor y Rhanbarthau, ac yr ydym yn aelodau hefyd o gyrff eraill, y gellir dewis ymuno â hwy—byddai'n annoeth ymuno â phob un ohonynt oherwydd ni allech gael digon o bobl i eistedd arnynt. Serch hynny, yr ydym wedi dewis ymuno â Chynhadledd y Rhanbarthau Ymylol ac Arforol. Mae'r Cynulliad hefyd yn aelod o'r grŵp o ranbarthau sydd â phwerau deddfu yn Ewrop. O hyn tan y gynhadledd rynglywodraethol nesaf—a all ddewis ailysgrifennu'r cytundebau ar reolaeth Ewrop—bydd sefyllfa'r rhanbarthau dan y chwyddwydr fel rhan o'r agenda ddatganoli. Bydd y rhaglen honno'n ystyried beth y dylai Ewrop, yr aelod wladwriaethau a Llywodraethau haen ranbarthol, fel ein hun ni, fod yn ei wneud. Penderfynir ar hynny yn gynnar yn 2004 a rhaid inni sicrhau bod gennym lais.

Peter Black: Do you think that Wales and the United Kingdom have much to learn about the federal structures of many European countries, particularly Germany? Will you be asking the commission on Assembly powers to consider those structures to see if there are any lessons that we can learn?

The First Minister: We can only learn up to a point. We have far more in common with Spain than with Germany. The German post-war constitution—written by our best constitutional lawyers—is a uniform, across-the-board, federal and land government constitution. Spain is more similar to us in the fact that it has an unwritten constitution which moves forward slowly every five or 10 years. Parts of Spain have more devolution than others, which is much more similar to devolution in the United Kingdom. The Spanish constitution recognises the special position of Catalunya, the Basque Country and Galicia as the unwritten British constitution recognises Scotland, Wales and Northern Ireland. I see more parallels with Spain than with Germany.

Elin Jones: A gytunwch, felly, â'r sylwadau a wnaeth Prif Weinidog Gibraltar y prynhawn yma, y dylai'r holl bobloedd trefedigaethol fwynhau'r hawl i benderfynu drostynt eu hunain? Os felly, a anghytunwch yn sylfaenol â sylwadau anhygoel Eluned Morgan dros y penwythnos mai pleidiau asgell dde gwladwriaeth Sbaen a ddylai benderfynu ar lais cryfach i Gymru yn Ewrop y dyfodol? Beth yw eich safbwynt chi ar y mater hwn? A gredwch mai pobl Cymru a ddylai benderfynu ar ddyfodol cyfansoddiadol y wlad neu a ddylai gwladwriaethau hunanol yr Undeb Ewropeaidd benderfynu?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Deallaf ddrwgdeimlad Elin tuag at Eluned Morgan, gan mai hi a sicrhodd ddyfarniad y comisiwn nad oes statws annibynnol i'w gael o fewn Ewrop. Credais y byddai hynny yn achosi ymateb o ryw fath gan Aelodau Plaid Cymru. Fodd bynnag, o ran democratiaeth, yr ydym yn gweithio o fewn ein cyfundrefn,

Peter Black: A ydych yn meddwl bod gan Gymru a'r Deyrnas Unedig lawer i'w ddsygu ynghylch strwythurau ffederal llawer o wledydd Ewrop, a'r Almaen yn enwedig? A fyddwch yn gofyn i'r comisiwn ar bwerau'r Cynulliad ystyried y strwythurau hynny i weld a oes unrhyw wersi y gallwn eu dysgu?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Dim ond at ryw bwynt y gallwn ddsygu. Mae gennym lawer mwy yn gyffredin â Sbaen nag â'r Almaen. Mae cyfansoddiad yr Almaen ers y rhyfel—a ysgrifennwyd gan ein cyfreithwyr cyfansoddiadol gorau—yn gyfansoddiad unffurf, ar draws y bwrdd, ffederal sy'n llywodraethu'r tir. Mae Sbaen yn debycach i ni o ran y ffaith fod ganddi gyfansoddiad anysgrifenedig sy'n symud ymlaen yn araf bob pum mlynedd neu 10. Mae gan rai rhannau o Sbaen fwy o ddatganoli nag eraill, sydd yn llawer tebycach i ddatganoli yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae cyfansoddiad Sbaen yn cydnabod sefyllfa arbennig Catalunya, Gwlad y Basg a Galicia fel y mae cyfansoddiad anysgrifenedig Prydain yn cydnabod yr Alban, Cymru a Gogledd Iwerddon. Gwelaf fwy yn gyffredin gyda Sbaen na chyda'r Almaen.

Elin Jones: Do you therefore agree with the comments made by the Chief Minister of Gibraltar earlier this afternoon that all colonial peoples should enjoy the right to self-determination? If so, do you fundamentally disagree with Eluned Morgan's absurd comments over the weekend that right-wing parties within the Spanish state should decide whether Wales should be given a stronger voice in the Europe of the future? Where do you stand on this issue? Do you believe that the people of Wales should decide on the constitutional future of the country or should the selfish states of the European Union do so?

The First Minister: I understand Elin's ill-feeling towards Eluned Morgan, since she secured the commission's judgment that full national status within Europe is not recognised. I expected that to draw some sort of response from Plaid Cymru Members. However, regarding democracy, we are working within our system, which has several

sydd yn fanteisiol mewn sawl ffordd gan ei bod mor hyblyg. Er bod datganoli wedi bodoli yn Sbaen ers chwarter canrif, ers marwolaeth Franco, nid oes gan arweinwyr Cataluny, Gwlad y Basg a Galicia yr hawl i fynychu cyfarfodydd Cyngor y Gweinidogion yn Ewrop. Cawsom yr hawl honno oherwydd bod gan y Cynulliad gyfansoddiad hyblyg heb ei ysgrifennu a chan fod cydweithrediad rhwngom a Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Gyfunol. Felly, mae'n anodd cymharu yr hyn na allwch ei wneud yn Sbaen â'r hyn y llwyddasom i'w wneud yn llawer cyflymach na'r disgwyl ar ôl sefydlu'r Cynulliad.

advantages as it is so flexible. Although devolution has been a reality in Spain for a quarter of a century, since Franco's death, the leaders of Catalunya, the Basque Country and Galicia do not have the right to attend meetings of the European Council of Ministers. We were given that right because the Assembly has a flexible unwritten constitution and because there is co-operation between us and the UK Government. Therefore, it is difficult to compare what you cannot do in Spain with what we have achieved much quicker than anticipated after the inception of the Assembly.

Papur Gwyn y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd ar Lywodraethu European Commission White Paper on Governance

Q6 Brian Hancock: Will the First Minister give an update following his response to the European Commission White Paper on Governance? (OAQ16423)

C6 Brian Hancock: A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru roi'r newyddion diweddaraf yn dilyn ei ymateb i Bapur Gwyn y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd ar Lywodraethu? (OAQ16423)

The First Minister: I have not yet responded; we have until 30 March and I am waiting until after tomorrow's meeting of the Committee on European and External Affairs. We will then finalise the response because, although it will be issued by the Assembly Government, I want it to be as consensus-based as possible, because we put much work into involving the other parties in the Assembly and also the other stakeholders following the forum in Llandudno. There was good representation there from Welsh local government and from the voluntary sector. I would like it to be sent on behalf of Wales as a whole, not under some narrower definition.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid wyf wedi ymateb eto; mae gennym hyd 30 Mawrth ac yr wyf yn aros tan ar ôl cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd ac Allanol yfory. Wedyn fe luniwn yr ymateb terfynol oherwydd, er mai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad fydd yn ei gyhoeddi, mae arnaf eisiau iddo fod yn seiliedig ar gonsensws gymaint ag sy'n bosibl, oherwydd gwnaethom lawer o waith i gynnwys y pleidiau eraill yn y Cynulliad ynghyd â'r cyfranogion eraill yn dilyn y fforwm yn Llandudno. Cafwyd cynrychiolaeth dda yno o lywodraeth leol yng Nghymru a'r sector gwirfoddol. Hoffwn iddo gael ei anfon ar ran Cymru gyfan, nid drwy ddefnyddio diffiniad culach.

Brian Hancock: In relation to the possibility of tripartite contracts, which is referred to in the White Paper, are you aware of regions already preparing proposals for pilot schemes to be launched this year? What action do you intend to take to ensure that projects from Wales will be among the successful applications for pilot schemes?

Brian Hancock: O ran posibilrwydd cytundebau tridarn, y cyfeirir ato yn y Papur Gwyn, a ydych yn ymwybodol bod rhanbarthau eisoes yn paratoi cynigion ar gyfer cynlluniau peilot i'w lansio eleni? Beth y bwriadwch ei wneud i sicrhau y bydd prosiectau o Gymru ymhlith y ceisiadau llwyddiannus am gynlluniau peilot?

The First Minister: We discussed that subject with Jérôme Vignon, who is Commission President Prodi's special envoy and assistant and who wrote the White Paper on Governance. He was with us in Llandudno and we were able to have a meeting with him

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Gwnaethom drafod y pwnc hwnnw gyda Jérôme Vignon, a ysgrifennodd y Papur Gwyn ar Lywodraethu ac sydd yn gennad arbennig a chynorthwy-ydd i Lywydd y Comisiwn, Romano Prodi. Yr oedd Jérôme Vignon gyda

to define what a pilot project would look like and in which areas he would welcome proposals from Wales. We are working on those now.

Mick Bates: I have always been concerned about the aspects of this review concerning better regulations. What can the Assembly do to ensure that Welsh small businesses are not adversely affected by European legislation?

The First Minister: There was an agreement at last weekend's Barcelona summit for a lighter touch on regulation. We look forward to that reduced red tape, now that it has been agreed by the 15 prime ministers and foreign ministers who were at the Barcelona summit. Let us see that being put into action over the next 12 months.

Jonathan Morgan: Do you agree that the future governance of the European Union is an integral part of the whole debate on Europe and its future direction? Do you also agree that Britain should lead the way as part of the European Union and not sit on the sidelines, as some former Conservative Prime Ministers would have us do?

The First Minister: You can hardly expect me to disagree with that, Jonathan. I leap on that question with great alacrity and commend your views, whatever some of your colleagues might think of them. I agree; you cannot stand on the sidelines. You must be constructively involved with Europe. I do not want to see the return of handbag diplomacy in Europe; it does not work.

Y Llywydd: Mae cwstiwn 7 (OAQ16413) wedi'i dynnu'n ôl.

ni yn Llandudno a llwyddasom i gael cyfarfod gydag ef i ddiffinio sut beth fyddai prosiect peilot ac ym mha feysydd y byddai ef yn croesawu cynigion o Gymru. Yr ydym yn gweithio ar y rheini'n awr.

Mick Bates: Yr wyf wedi bod yn bryderus erioed ynghylch yr agweddau ar yr adolygiad hwn sy'n ymwneud â gwell rheoliadau. Beth all y Cynulliad ei wneud i sicrhau nad effeithir yn andwyol ar fusnesau bychain yng Nghymru gan ddeddfwriaeth Ewrop?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Cafwyd cytundeb yn uwch-gynhadledd y penwythnos diwethaf yn Barcelona i beidio ag ymdrin â rheoliadau â llaw mor gadarn. Edrychwn ymlaen at y lleihad hwnnw mewn biwrocratiaeth, gan ei fod bellach wedi'i gytuno gan y 15 o brif weinidogion a gweinidogion tramor a fynychodd uwch-gynhadledd Barcelona. Gobeithiwn weld hynny'n cael ei weithredu yn y 12 mis nesaf.

Jonathan Morgan: A ydych yn cytuno bod y modd y llywodraethir yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yn y dyfodol yn rhan annatod o'r holl ddadl ar Ewrop a'i chyfeiriad i'r dyfodol? A ydych yn cytuno hefyd y dylai Prydain arwain y ffordd fel rhan o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd ac nid eistedd ar yr ymylon, fel yr hoffai ambell gyn Brif Weinidog Ceidwadol inni wneud?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Prin y gallwch ddisgwyl imi anghytuno â hynny, Jonathan. Neidiaf ar y cwestiwn hwnnw gydag awch mawr a chymeradwyaf eich sylwadau, beth bynnag fo barn rhai o'ch cyd-Aelodau arnynt. Cytunaf; ni ellir sefyll ar yr ymylon. Rhaid ymwneud yn adeiladol ag Ewrop. Nid oes arnaf fi eisiau gweld diplomyddiaeth bagiau llaw yn dychwelyd yn Ewrop; nid yw'n gweithio.

The Presiding Officer: Question 7 (OAQ16413) has been withdrawn.

Cynhadledd ar Ddyfodol Ewrop Convention on the Future of Europe

Q8 Geraint Davies: What meetings has the First Minister had with the UK Minister for Europe on representing the views of the Assembly in the Convention on the Future of

C8 Geraint Davies: Pa gyfarfodydd y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi'u cael gyda Gweinidog y DU dros Ewrop ynghylch cynrychioli safbwyntiau'r Cynulliad yn y

Europe? (OAQ16421)

The First Minister: A meeting with the UK Minister for Europe is scheduled for next month where we will discuss a range of issues. The convention will be a main issue of discussion at that meeting.

Geraint Davies: Will you explain how Peter Hain, the UK Minister for Europe, can represent the Assembly's views, when they might not be in line with those of the UK Government? Do you not think that Wales's interests would be far better served by having direct representation, like Scotland, which has two seats on that convention, so that we could have a direct, strong voice for the people of Wales at the highest level of European structure?

The First Minister: That question would be fine, if it was not wrong. Scotland does not have direct representation on the convention. No region or regional tier government has direct representation. I understand to whom you refer. There is a member of the Committee of the Regions who represents the rainbow group of Members of the European Parliament. That member was not chosen by Scotland, but by the rainbow group. In the same way, Peter Hain represents the UK Government. Naturally, the Scot concerned will have a Scottish perspective and Peter Hain will have a Welsh perspective. However, those are not their prime representative duties, and they were not chosen by those countries. The rainbow group chose its member of the Committee of the Regions. That member has observer status, and cannot vote. I also understand that one other person has come through from the local government bodies, again, not representing Scotland. Plaid Cymru harps on, as ever, about Scotland having this and Wales not having that, but I am afraid that it is misleading people in Wales, as always. These people represent a much bigger constituency than Scotland. That is no different from Peter Hain having a Welsh perspective, although he is present as the UK Government Minister for Europe.

Gynhadledd ar Ddyfodol Ewrop? (OAQ16421)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae cyfarfod gyda Gweinidog y DU dros Ewrop wedi'i drefnu ar gyfer y mis nesaf lle byddwn yn trafod gwahanol bethau. Bydd y gynhadledd yn brif destun trafod yn y cyfarfod hwnnw.

Geraint Davies: A wnewch chi esbonio sut y gall Peter Hain, Gweinidog y DU dros Ewrop, gynrychioli barn y Cynulliad, gan y bydd efallai'n wahanol i farn Llywodraeth y DU? Onid ydych yn meddwl y byddai buddiannau Cymru'n cael eu gwasanaethu'n llawer gwell o gael cynrychiolaeth uniongyrchol, fel yr Alban, sydd â dwy sedd yn y gynhadledd honno, fel y gallem ninnau gael llais cryf, uniongyrchol dros bobl Cymru ar lefel uchaf y strwythur Ewropeaidd?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Byddai'r cwestiwn hwnnw'n un da, pe na bai'n anghywir. Nid oes gan yr Alban gynrychiolaeth uniongyrchol yn y gynhadledd. Nid oes gan unrhyw ranbarth na llywodraeth haen ranbarthol gynrychiolaeth uniongyrchol. Deallaf at bwy yr ydych yn cyfeirio. Mae aelod o Bwyllgor y Rhanbarthau yn cynrychioli'r grŵp ambleidiol o Aelodau Senedd Ewrop. Nid yr Alban a ddewisodd yr aelod hwnnw, ond y grŵp ambleidiol. Yn yr un modd, mae Peter Hain yn cynrychioli Llywodraeth y DU. Yn naturiol, bydd gan yr Albanwr dan sylw safbwynt Albanaidd a bydd gan Peter Hain safbwynt Cymreig. Er hynny, nid dyna'u prif ddyletswyddau fel cynrychiolwyr, ac ni chawsant eu dewis gan y gwledydd hynny. Y grŵp ambleidiol a ddewisodd eu haelod hwy ar Bwyllgor y Rhanbarthau. Mae gan yr aelod hwnnw statws sylwedydd, ac ni chaiff bleidleisio. Deallaf hefyd fod un person arall wedi dod o'r cyrff llywodraeth leol, ond nid i gynrychioli'r Alban. Mae Plaid Cymru'n rhygnu ymlaen, fel arfer, fod yr Alban yn cael hyn a Chymru heb gael y llall, ond mae gennyf ofn eu bod yn camarwain pobl Cymru, fel arfer. Mae'r bobl hyn yn cynrychioli etholaeth lawer mwy na'r Alban. Nid yw hynny'n ddim gwahanol i'r ffaith bod gan Peter Hain safbwynt Cymreig, er ei fod yn bresennol fel Gweinidog Llywodraeth y DU dros Ewrop.

2:30 p.m.

Glyn Davies: Many believe that the convention on the future of Europe could degenerate into chaos because of the domineering approach of its chair. Do you agree that to create some order, it would be good to lay down some ground rules? I am sure that all Conservative Party leaders—past and present—would agree. Do you think that, on behalf of the Assembly we should say now that we are not in favour of extending qualified majority voting?

The First Minister: I do not know whether you are confusing Giscard d'Estang and Margaret Thatcher in your references. You should be aware that the convention is not a decision-making body. It will run up to the inter-governmental conference in early 2004 and will try to tap into the feelings of the citizens of Europe, pre-enlargement and in all its different variegated areas. It is trying to guess what Europe will be like after enlargement in terms of what the role of subsidiarity should be in a post-enlargement 27-state Europe. How do you run Europe when you have got 27 member states? What does Europe do? What will the member states do and what will regional tier governments and local government finish up doing after that?

The convention has a rolling programme of engagements, which may or may not take place outside Brussels; it may come to Wales. We do not know how that will work. However, decisions will be made at the inter-governmental conference in early 2004, which will include an entirely different cast of characters, namely the prime ministers and foreign ministers of member states, which, presumably, will still amount to 15.

On having different rules on qualified majority voting, many issues that you probably agree with Glyn, such as further liberalisation of energy, telecommunications and financial markets, were agreed on in Barcelona two or three days ago, based on an extension of qualified majority voting. Your party would probably agree with that.

Glyn Davies: Mae llawer yn credu y gallai'r gynhadledd ar ddyfodol Ewrop droi'n anhrefn oherwydd agwedd dra-arglwyddiaethol ei chadeirydd. A ydych yn cytuno y byddai'n beth da, er mwyn creu rhywfaint o drefn, sefydlu rhai rheolau sylfaenol? Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai holl arweinwyr y Blaid Geidwadol—ddoe a heddiw—yn cytuno. A ydych yn meddwl y dylem ddatgan yn awr, ar ran y Cynulliad, nad ydym o blaid ymestyn pleidleisio mwyafrifol amodol?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ni wn a ydych yn cymysgu rhwng Giscard d'Estang a Margaret Thatcher yn yr hyn a ddywedwch. Dylech wybod nad corff sy'n gwneud penderfyniadau yw'r gynhadledd. Bydd yn gweithio hyd at y gynhadledd ryng-lywodraethol ym misoedd cyntaf 2004 ac yn ceisio barn dinasyddion Ewrop, cyn yr ehangu, ac yn ei holl wahanol ardaloedd amrywiol. Mae'n ceisio dyfalu sut le fydd Ewrop wedi'r ehangu, o ran beth ddylai rôl is-reolaeth fod mewn Ewrop o 27 gwladwriaeth wedi'r ehangu. Sut mae gweinyddu Ewrop sy'n cynnwys 27 o aelod-wladwriaethau? Beth mae Ewrop yn ei wneud? Beth fydd yr aelod-wladwriaethau'n ei wneud a beth fydd y llywodraethau haen ranbarthol a llywodraeth leol yn ei wneud ar ôl hynny?

Mae gan y gynhadledd raglen dreigl o gyfarfodydd, a allai ddigwydd y tu allan i Frwsel; fe allai ddod i Gymru. Ni wyddwn sut y bydd hynny'n gweithio. Fodd bynnag, gwneir penderfyniadau yn y gynhadledd ryng-lywodraethol ym misoedd cyntaf 2004, a fydd yn cynnwys cast cwbl wahanol o gymeriadau, sef prif weinidogion a gweinidogion tramor yr aelod-wladwriaethau, a fydd, gallwn dybio, yn gyfanswm o 15 o hyd.

O ran cael rheolau gwahanol ar bleidleisio mwyafrifol amodol, cytunwyd ar lawer o faterion yr ydych chi, Glyn, mae'n debyg, yn cytuno â hwy, megis rhyddhau marchnadoedd ariannol, ynni a thelathrebu ymhellach, yn Barcelona ddeuddydd neu dri yn ôl, ar sail estyniad o system bleidleisio mwyafrifol amodol. Mae'n debyg y

byddai'ch plaid yn cytuno â hynny.

Cysylltiadau â Gwledydd Eraill **Links with Other Countries**

Q9 Christine Gwyther: With regard to his responsibility for relations between Wales and the rest of the world, will the First Minister give an update on the development of Assembly links with other countries? (OAQ16416)

The First Minister: I will not mention Europe again, because I have covered that in my answer to Peter Black. Outside Europe, over the last year, I have signed a memorandum of understanding with the Government of the Chubut province in Argentina, with which we have such close historic links. Similarly, the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning signed an agreement with Cuba based on co-operation in higher education. The Premier of Queensland will visit us later this year following the visit of his education minister, Anna Bligh, earlier in the year. A highly successful Wales weekend in New York two weekends ago to celebrate St David's Day, gave me the opportunity to build on our links with America and to further our plans for setting up a series of Wales international centres, the first of which, we hope, will open in New York in the final quarter of the year.

Christine Gwyther: You will not be surprised to know that I want to concentrate on export initiatives. WalesTrade International's record is impressive and I agree that ministerial visits are great for morale and awareness raising. However, do you think that we could do more if we looked outside the box in terms of export initiatives? Will you support the work being done by individual companies such as Ledwood Construction Ltd in my constituency, which is developing links with companies overseas and encouraging other local firms to join it?

The First Minister: I was interested to visit Ledwood Construction Ltd with you. As you say, it thinks outside the box in terms of what pay-off it can get over the next 10 years. It is

C9 Christine Gwyther: O ran ei gyfrifoldeb dros y berthynas rhwng Cymru a gweddill y byd, a wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru roi'r newyddion diweddaraf ar hynt yr ymdrechion i ddatblygu cysylltiadau rhwng y Cynulliad a gwledydd eraill? (OAQ16416)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ni soniaf am Ewrop eto, oherwydd yr wyf wedi trafod hynny yn fy ateb i Peter Black. Y tu allan i Ewrop, yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, yr wyf wedi llofnodi memorandwm cyd-ddealltwriaeth gyda Llywodraeth talaith y Chubut yn yr Ariannin, y mae gennym ni gysylltiadau hanesyddol agos iawn â hwy. Yn yr un modd, llofnododd y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes gytundeb gyda Chiwba yn seiliedig ar gydweithredu mewn addysg uwch. Bydd Prif Weinidog Queensland yn ymweld â ni'n ddiweddarach eleni yn dilyn ymweliad ei weinidog addysg, Anna Bligh, yn gynharach yn y flwyddyn. Mewn penwythnos Cymreig hynod o lwyddiannus yn Efrog Newydd ddau benwythnos yn ôl i ddatlu Dydd Gŵyl Dewi, cefais y cyfle i ddatblygu ein cysylltiadau ag America a hyrwyddo'n cynlluniau i sefydlu cyfres o ganolfannau Cymru rhyngwladol, a gobeithiwn y bydd y gyntaf ohonynt yn agor yn Efrog Newydd yn chwarter olaf y flwyddyn.

Christine Gwyther: Ni fyddwch yn synnu fy mod i am ganolbwyntio ar fentrau allforio. Mae record WalesTrade International yn dda a chytunaf fod ymweliadau gan weinidogion yn wych ar gyfer codi ymwybyddiaeth ac ysbryd. Er hynny, ydych chi'n meddwl y gallem ni wneud mwy pe edrychem y tu allan i'r blwch yng nghyd-destun mentrau allforio? A wnewch chi gefnogi'r gwaith a wneir gan gwmnïau unigol fel Ledwood Construction Cyf yn fy etholaeth i, sy'n datblygu cysylltiadau â chwmnïau tramor ac yn annog cwmnïau lleol eraill i ymuno ag ef?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Profiad diddorol oedd ymweld â Ledwood Construction Cyf gyda chi. Fel y dywedaso, mae'n meddwl y tu allan i'r blwch o ran beth y gall ei gael

organising a method by which the future managers of plants, or people who will be ordering public sector goods in middle-eastern countries will receive much of their vocational education in Wales or will have followed a Welsh-orientated programme. They are then much more likely to order from Wales because they are used to the Welsh way of doing things. That was a well-known principle in Britain, but it had worn thin over the last 20 years. However, reintroducing that principle, as Ledwood Construction Ltd now proposes in co-operation with at least one country in the middle east, is an original way of exporting goods today, tomorrow and for generations to come.

Helen Mary Jones: You will be aware that your colleague—or whatever he is—Mike German, has tabled a written question to you about the location of other Wales international centres, in addition to Hong Kong, Tokyo, San Francisco and New York. Would it be too much of a breach of what I think your colleague, Huw Lewis, called your ‘palace politics’ for you to let us know whether you think Mike German might be on the lookout for another international job?

The First Minister: That went down like a lead balloon, did it not? We have no proposals to go beyond the list that you correctly quoted.

Rod Richards: Are you holding secret negotiations with Hong Kong?

The First Minister: I think that I know what you, in your usual straightforward manner, are referring to. However, I cannot comment on internal matters pertaining to a party to which I do not belong, have never belonged, and have no intention of ever belonging.

dros y 10 mlynedd nesaf. Mae'n llunio system lle bydd rheolwyr ffatrioedd yn y dyfodol, neu bobl fydd yn archebu nwyddau'r sector cyhoeddus yng ngwledydd y dwyrain canol, yn cael llawer o'u haddysg alwedigaethol yng Nghymru neu yn dilyn rhaglen â gogwydd Cymreig. Wedyn byddant yn llawer mwy tebygol o archebu o Gymru am eu bod wedi arfer â'r ffordd Gymreig o wneud pethau. Yr oedd hynny'n egwyddor gyfarwydd ym Mhrydain, ond yr oedd wedi mynd yn dreuliedig braidd yn yr 20 mlynedd diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, mae ailgyflwyno'r egwyddor honno, fel y mae Ledwood Construction Cyf yn awgrymu yn awr gydag o leiaf un wlad yn y dwyrain canol, yn ffordd wreiddiol o allforio nwyddau heddiw, yfory ac am genedlaethau i ddod.

Helen Mary Jones: Byddwch yn ymwybodol fod eich cyd-Aelod—neu beth bynnag ydyw—Mike German, wedi cyflwyno cwestiwn ysgrifenedig ichi ynghylch lleoliad canolfannau rhyngwladol eraill Cymru, ar wahân i Hong Kong, Tokyo, San Francisco ac Efrog Newydd. A fyddai'n ormod o ymadawiad oddi wrth yr hyn a alwyd gan eich cyd-Aelod, Huw Lewis, mi gredaf, yn ‘fân wleidydda ymysg arweinwyr’ ichi roi gwybod inni a ydych yn meddwl bod Mike German yn chwilio am swydd rhyngwladol arall?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Aeth hynny i lawr yn dda, onid do? Nid oes gennym ddim cynlluniau i fynd ymhellach na'r rhestr a ddyfynnwyd yn gywir gennych.

Rod Richards: A ydych yn cynnal trafodaethau dirgel gyda Hong Kong?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Credaf fy mod yn gwybod beth yr ydych chi, yn eich dull uniongyrchol arferol, yn cyfeirio ato. Fodd bynnag, ni allaf gyfeirio at faterion mewnol plaid nad wyf yn aelod ohoni, na fŷm i erioed yn aelod ohoni, ac nad oes gennyf ddim bwriad bod yn aelod ohoni byth.

Cod y Gweinidogion Ministerial Code

Q10 Pauline Jarman: Does the First Minister have any plans to frequently review the Ministerial Code? (OAQ16422)

C10 Pauline Jarman: A oes gan Brif Weinidog Cymru unrhyw gynlluniau i adolygu Cod y Gweinidogion yn rheolaidd?

(OAQ16422)

The First Minister: No.**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nac oes.

Pauline Jarman: On page 1 of the Ministerial Code, you claim that the code is based on the seven Nolan principles of public life. One of those principles is honesty. Can you remind us of the other six?

Pauline Jarman: Ar dudalen 1 Cod y Gweinidogion, haerwch fod y cod yn seiliedig ar saith egwyddor Nolan ar gyfer bywyd cyhoeddus. Gonestrwydd yw un o'r egwyddorion hynny. A allwch ein hatgoffa beth yw'r chwech arall?

The First Minister: I am trying to see where they are on page 1 of the code. They are not on page 1 of my code, but perhaps I am wrong. I remember that transparency is one of them, but I would not like to put myself forward these days as an expert on quiz questions such as the one that you have just asked.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr wyf yn ceisio gweld ble y maent ar dudalen 1 y cod. Nid ydynt ar dudalen 1 fy nghod i, ond efallai fy mod yn anghywir. Cofiaf mai tryloywder yw un ohonynt, ond ni hoffwn gynnig fy hun bellach fel arbenigwr ar gwestiynau cwis yn debyg i'r un a ofynnwyd gennych chi yn awr.

Alun Cairns: As you have a Cardiff-centric Cabinet, are you confident that every decision that you have made affecting Cardiff has involved another Minister from outside the Cardiff area, and if not, will you review those decisions?

Alun Cairns: Gan fod gennych Gabinet Caerdydd-ganoledig, a ydych yn hyderus fod pob penderfyniad o'ch eiddo sy'n effeithio ar Gaerdydd wedi'i wneud gyda chyfraniad Gweinidog arall o'r tu allan i ardal Caerdydd, ac, os na, a wnewch chi adolygu'r penderfyniadau hynny?

The First Minister: I do not think that either Swansea or Bridgend are regarded as parts of Cardiff, unless you have some strange road maps by which you navigate around Wales, Alun. I am confident that we have adhered to the Ministerial Code, as far as I am aware, in every respect and in every decision since I became First Minister.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid wyf yn meddwl y cyfrifir Abertawe na Phen-y-bont ar Ogwr yn rhannau o Gaerdydd, oni bai fod gennych chi ryw fapiau ffyrdd rhyfedd i ganfod eich ffordd o gwmpas Cymru, Alun. Yr wyf yn hyderus ein bod wedi glynu at God y Gweinidogion, hyd y gwn i, ym mhob ystyr ac ym mhob penderfyniad ers i mi ddod yn Brif Weinidog.

System Cyfiawnder Troseddol Criminal Justice System

Q11 John Griffiths: Will the First Minister make a statement on discussions he has held with the Secretary of State concerning the criminal justice system? (OAQ16409)

C11 John Griffiths: A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar drafodaethau gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol ynghylch y system cyfiawnder troseddol? (OAQ16409)

The First Minister: This is not a matter that comes up often in discussions with the Secretary of State, simply because affairs relating to the Home Office and to the Lord Chancellor's Department, such as the courts and so forth, are not devolved to the Assembly. However, when we have discussions—and it is relatively rarely—on issues such as trying to ensure that sentencing

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid yw hynny'n fater sy'n codi yn aml mewn trafodaethau gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol, yn syml oherwydd nad yw materion y Swyddfa Gartref ac Adran yr Arglwydd Ganghellor, megis y llysoedd ac ati, wedi'u datganoli i'r Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, pan gawn drafodaethau—ac mae'n gymharol brin—ar faterion fel ceisio sicrhau bod polisi dedfrydu

policy and court services are effective, and where there is a fringe element of Assembly responsibility, such as youth justice, we try to ensure that we consider effectiveness in terms of outcomes and continuing to see a reduction in crime. Crime has reduced sharply in Wales by some 16.5 per cent, I believe, since 1997. It has also fallen over the last 12 months, although obviously not by 16.5 per cent.

John Griffiths: In that regard, and to aid crime reduction in Wales, will you give full support to the Home Office's recent imaginative proposals? These include weekend prisons and non-custodial alternatives to prison to tackle the UK's terrible record of imprisoning more of its people than almost any other country in Europe.

The First Minister: I agree, if what you mean is that Britain must make a choice of whether it goes down the American road of imprisoning huge numbers of males, in particular, between the ages of 15 and 30. I do not think that there is any other European country that is even contemplating going down that road. I was pleased to see David Blunkett's constructive proposals to that effect.

Cynog Dafis: Byddwch yn gwybod bod camweinyddu cyfiawnder wedi digwydd nifer o weithiau yn dilyn ymchwiliadau gan Heddlu De Cymru. Carcharwyd nifer o bobl ar gam—yn achos Michael O'Brien, am 11 mlynedd. Mae pryder yn parhau ynglŷn â'r enghreifftiau hyn. Mae galw am ymchwiliad cyhoeddus. A gefnogwch yr alwad honno?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid mater i mi yw cefnogi galwadau ar faterion sydd heb eu datganoli. Mae'n eithaf anodd i Brif Weinidog Cymru ddelio â materion sydd yn parhau yn gyfrifoldeb i San Steffan a'r Gweinidog Cartref. Yr wyf yn eithaf cyfarwydd â'r achos hwn gan mai yn fy etholaeth i y llofruddiwyd Philip Saunders. Yr oeddwn yn ei adnabod yn eithaf da oherwydd arferwn brynu papurau newydd o'i stondin. Gweithiodd Alun Michael a minnau, fel yr Aelodau Seneddol a oedd yn gyfrifol

a gwasanaethau'r llysoedd yn effeithiol, a lle mae elfen ymylol o gyfrifoldeb gan y Cynulliad, megis cyfiawnder ieuenctid, ceisiwn sicrhau ein bod yn ystyried effeithiolrwydd yng ngyd-destun canlyniadau a pharhau i weld troseddau'n prinhau. Mae nifer y troseddau yng Nghymru wedi gostwng yn sylweddol, rhyw 16.5 y cant, mi gredaf, ers 1997. Mae wedi cwmpo dros y 12 mis diwethaf hefyd, er nad o 16.5 y cant, yn amlwg.

John Griffiths: Yn hynny o beth, ac i helpu i leihau troseddau yng Nghymru, a roddwch gefnogaeth lawn i gynigion dychmygus diweddar y Swyddfa Gartref? Mae'r rhain yn cynnwys carchardai penwythnos ac opsiynau eraill yn lle carcharu, er mwyn mynd i'r afael â record ofnadwy'r DU o garcharu mwy o'i phobl na bron unrhyw wlad arall yn Ewrop.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Cytunaf, os mai'r hyn a olygwch yw fod yn rhaid i Brydain ddewis a ydyw am ddilyn y trywydd Americanaidd o garcharu niferoedd enfawr o ddynion, yn enwedig, rhwng 15 a 30 mlwydd oed. Nid wyf yn meddwl bod unrhyw wlad Ewropeaidd arall hyd yn oed yn ystyried dilyn y trywydd hwnnw. Yr oedd yn dda gennyf weld cynigion adeiladol David Blunkett i'r perwyl hwnnw.

Cynog Dafis: You will be aware that miscarriages of justice have occurred on several occasions following inquiries by South Wales Police. Several people have been wrongly imprisoned—in the case of Michael O'Brien, for 11 years. There is continuing concern about these examples. There have been calls for a public inquiry. Do you support those calls?

The First Minister: It is not a matter for me to support requests on non-devolved matters. It is quite difficult, as First Minister, to deal with issues that remain within the remit of Westminster and the Home Secretary. I am quite familiar with this case because Philip Saunders was murdered in my constituency. I knew him quite well as I used to buy newspapers from his stand. Alun Michael and I, as the Members of Parliament responsible for the area and people in question, worked hard to ensure justice for the victim and his

am yr ardal a'r bobl dan sylw, yn eithaf caled i sicrhau cyfiawnder i'r person a lofruddiwyd a'i deulu, ynghyd ag ymchwilio i'r apêl gan Michael O'Brien, Ellis Sherwood a Darren Hall. Bu inni ystyried y pwysau y gellid ei ddwyn gennym i sicrhau adolygiad gan y Bwrdd Adolygu Cyfiawnder Troseddol. Digwyddodd hynny yn y pen draw, ac yr oeddwn yn falch iddynt gael eu rhyddhau o'r carchar, er fy mod yn drist eu bod wedi gorfod treulio cymaint o amser yno yn y lle cyntaf.

family, as well as making inquiries into the appeal by Michael O'Brien, Ellis Sherwood and Darren Hall. We considered what pressure we could bring to bear to ensure a review by the Criminal Justice Review Board. That took place eventually, and I was pleased that the three were released from prison, while at the same time, but also saddened by the fact that they had been imprisoned for so long in the first place.

2:40 p.m.

Ymweliad ag Etholaeth Ogwr Visit to the Ogmere Constituency

Q12 Janice Gregory: Does the First Minister have any plans to visit the Ogmere constituency to highlight the delivery of Assembly policies? (OAQ16415)

C12 Janice Gregory: A oes gan Brif Weinidog Cymru unrhyw gynlluniau i ymweld ag etholaeth Ogwr i dynnu sylw at gyflwyno polisiau'r Cynulliad? (OAQ16415)

The First Minister: As you have probably read in the press, I made an unscheduled visit to your constituency on Sunday, stopping as the nearest motorist to an accident that happened close to the McArthur Glenn retail outlet. It could have been nasty but, luckily, no-one was seriously injured. I take this opportunity to compliment the emergency services in the Bridgend area, as they arrived at the scene within five minutes of the 999 call and dealt with the accident promptly and efficiently. It reminded me of how dependent we are on the emergency services turning up when needed, particularly as there could have been many deaths and serious injuries.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Fel yr ydych wedi darllen yn y wasg, mae'n debyg, bu imi ymweld yn annisgwyl â'ch etholaeth chi ddydd Sul, pan stopiais yn rhinwedd y ffaith mai fi oedd y modurwr agosaf at ddamwain a ddigwyddodd yn agos at ganolfan siopa McArthur Glenn. Gallai'r ddamwain wedi bod fod yn ddrwg ond, wrth lwc, nid anafwyd neb yn ddifrifol. Manteisiaf ar y cyfle hwn i ganmol y gwasanaethau argyfwng yn ardal Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr, gan iddynt gyrraedd y fan o fewn pum munud i'r alwad 999 a delio â'r ddamwain yn gyflym ac effeithlon. Fe'm hatgoffwyd o ba mor ddibynnol yr ydym ar i'r gwasanaethau argyfwng ddod atom pan fo'u hangen, yn enwedig gan y gallasai fod llawer wedi marw ac wedi'u hanafu'n ddifrifol.

Janice Gregory: I commend you on your citizenship, and agree with you about the services that we rely so heavily upon.

Janice Gregory: Yr wyf yn cymeradwyo'ch dinasyddiaeth dda, ac yn cytuno â chi ynglŷn â'r gwasanaethau y dibynnwn gymaint arnynt.

The Assembly has many good initiatives, but I am concerned that the people of Wales are not sure what is available to them. I am sure that you are aware of Bridgend County Borough Council's excellent policy of free bus passes for pensioners. Some confusion was caused with regard to this, and I am glad that the local authority leader apologised

Mae gan y Cynulliad lawer o gynlluniau da, ond yr wyf yn bryderus nad yw pobl Cymru'n siŵr beth sydd ar gael iddynt. Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol o bolisi ardderchog Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr o roi tocynnau bws rhad ac am ddim i bensiynwyr. Achoswyd peth dryswch ynglŷn â hyn, ac yr wyf yn falch fod

publicly to people who were taken ill while waiting for their bus passes. The Welsh Assembly Government is leading an excellent campaign for free bus passes. However, will you ensure that similar efforts are made with other Assembly policies so that people in need are fully aware of what is on offer to them?

The First Minister: That is an important point. Whenever you introduce a new initiative, you must estimate the demand for the service and work out how it will be delivered, but you can sometimes be knocked over in the rush. You do your very best to guess how many people will apply and how many days or weeks it will take, or how long they will have to queue, to get the free bus pass—which will be introduced in 10 days' time—or whatever it may be. It is still hard to estimate the best delivery method, but we must improve our record on that because we do not want another episode of over-lengthy queuing to access the benefits of Assembly Government policy.

Janet Davies: It is good to know that hospital services in Bridgend can compensate for the local council's deficiencies. Will you visit the top of the Ogmere Valley to compare the lack of action in deprived coalfield communities with Gwynedd Council's action in the slate valleys?

The First Minister: I do not know what you were referring to in your comparison—which I am sure was neutral in terms of party politics—between Gwynedd and the Bridgend borough. There are three Communities First areas in Ogmere, which aim to bridge the gap between the more affluent south and the more deprived north of the constituency. Likewise, we are keen to see money invested in Maesteg or Pontycymer. I had the pleasure of launching a major project that will bring new jobs to Maesteg as a result of the takeover of the Revlon facility by the South African company, COSi. Those jobs will be in addition to the ones created by Lloyds TSB in

arweinydd yr awdurdod lleol wedi ymddiheuro'n gyhoeddus i bobl a drawyd yn wael wrth aros am eu tocynnau bws. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn arwain ymgyrch ardderchog dros docynnau bws di-dâl. Fodd bynnag, a wnewch chi sicrhau y gwneir ymdrechion tebyg gyda pholisiau eraill o eiddo'r Cynulliad fel y bydd pobl anghenus yn gwbl ymwybodol o'r hyn sydd ar gael iddynt?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae hynny'n bwynt pwysig. Wrth gyflwyno cynllun newydd, rhaid amcangyfrif y galw am y gwasanaeth a phenderfynu ar y ffordd orau i'w ddarparu, ond weithiau gallwch gael eich taro i lawr yn y rhuthr amdanynt. Byddwch yn gwneud eich gorau glas i ddyfalu faint o bobl fydd yn gwneud cais a sawl diwrnod neu wythnos a gymer, neu am ba hyd y bydd raid iddynt sefyll mewn rhes, i gael y tocyn di-dâl—a gyflwynir ymhen deng niwrnod—neu beth bynnag. Mae'n dal i fod yn anodd amcangyfrif y dull gorau o'i ddarparu, ond rhaid inni wella'n record ar hynny oherwydd nid oes arnom eisiau digwyddiad arall lle mae gofyn i bobl sefyll mewn rhes am amser rhy faith er mwyn manteisio ar un o bolisiau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Janet Davies: Mae'n braf gwybod y gall gwasanaethau'r ysbyty ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr wneud iawn am ddiffygion y cyngor lleol. A wnewch chi ymweld â phen uchaf Cwm Ogwr i gymharu'r diffyg gweithredu yng nghymunedau difreintiedig y maes glo â'r modd y mae Cyngor Gwynedd yn gweithredu yn ardaloedd y llechi?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ni wn at beth yr oeddech yn cyfeirio yn eich cymhariaeth—a oedd yn niwtral, yr wyf yn siŵr, o ran gwleidyddiaeth plaid—rhwng Gwynedd a bwrdeistref Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr. Mae tair ardal Cymunedau'n Gyntaf yn Ogwr, a'u nod yw pontio'r bwlch yn yr etholaeth rhwng cyfoeth y de a thlodi'r gogledd. Yn yr un modd, yr ydym yn awyddus i weld buddsoddi ym Maesteg neu Bontycymer. Cefais y pleser o lansio prosiect mawr a ddaw â swyddi newydd i Faesteg yn sgîl dyfodiad y cwmni o Dde Affrica, COSi, i gymryd y ffatri Revlon. Bydd y swyddi hyn yn ychwanegol at y rhai a grëwyd gan Lloyds TSB yn ardal Pen-coed yn ne'r etholaeth.

the Pencoed area in the south of the constituency.

Datganiad Busnes Business Statement

The Minister for Rural Affairs and Assembly Business (Carwyn Jones): Before I turn to the business statement for the next three weeks, I wish to inform Members of a change to this week's business, which was discussed in Business Committee this morning. During Thursday's Plenary, with your permission, Llywydd, the no named day motion tabled last Thursday will be proposed, to elect Members to various Committees following recent reorganisation. Other business is as scheduled.

As for the three weeks following the Easter recess, the Business Committee this morning discussed my draft business statement as shown on the Chamberweb under supporting documents. I have added an item for 18 April: a revision to Standing Orders relating to questions to the House Committee. Finally, Llywydd, the Deputy Presiding Officer determined under Standing Order No. 22.5, that the following items of legislation need not be referred to Subject Committees for extended consideration: the Education Development Plans (Wales) Regulations 2002; the Care Standards Act 2000 (Extension of Meaning of 'Social Care Worker') Regulations 2002; and the Care Standards Act 2000 (Commencement No.9) (Wales) Order 2002.

Helen Mary Jones: Bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol bod y ddau undeb sydd yn cynrychioli prifathrawon yng Nghymru yn ystyried cynnal pleidlais ar hyn o bryd ar weithredu diwydiannol oherwydd yr argyfwng sydd yn wynebu ysgolion wrth geisio ariannu'r codiadau cyflog a ddaw yn sgîl y system rheoli perfformiad. A ydych yn fodlon trefnu dadl yn amser y Llywodraeth, fel mater o frys, yn syth ar ôl y toriad, i ystyried y sefyllfa beryglus hon sydd, yn ôl y prifathrawon, yn peryglu morâl staff ysgolion yn ddifrifol, ynghyd â dyfodol ein plant?

Alun Pugh: Has the leader of the Welsh

Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig a Threfnydd y Cynulliad (Carwyn Jones): Cyn troi at y datganiad busnes am y tair wythnos nesaf, hoffwn hysbysu'r Aelodau am newid i fusnes yr wythnos hon, a drafodwyd yn y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma. Yn ystod Cyfarfod Llawn dydd Iau, gyda'ch caniatâd, Lywydd, cynigir y cynnig heb ddyddiad trafod a gyflwynwyd ddydd Iau diwethaf, i ethol Aelodau i amryfal Bwyllgorau yn dilyn yr ad-drefnu diweddar. Mae'r busnes arall fel a drefnwyd.

O ran y tair wythnos wedi gwyliau'r Pasg, y bore yma trafododd y Pwyllgor Busnes fy natganiad busnes drafft fel y'i gwelir ar we'r Siambr dan ddogfennau ategol. Yr wyf wedi ychwanegu eitem ar gyfer 18 Ebrill: diwygio'r Rheolau Sefydlog parthed cwestiynau i Bwyllgor y Tŷ. Yn olaf, Lywydd, penderfynodd y Dirprwy Lywydd, dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.5, nad oedd angen cyfeirio'r eitemau canlynol o ddeddfwriaeth i Bwyllgorau Pwnc i'w hystyried yn faith: Rheoliadau Cynlluniau Datblygu Addysg (Cymru) 2002; Rheoliadau Deddf Safonau Gofal 2000 (Ehangu Ystyr 'Gweithiwr Gofal Cymdeithasol') 2002; a Gorchymyn Deddf Safonau Gofal 2000 (Cychwyn Rhif 9) (Cymru) 2002.

Helen Mary Jones: The Minister will be aware that the two unions representing headteachers in Wales are currently considering a ballot on industrial action because of the crisis facing schools in trying to finance the pay increases awarded as a result of the performance management system. Are you willing to arrange a debate on this urgent issue in Government time, immediately after the recess, to address this dangerous situation which, according to headteachers, is a serious threat to staff morale within schools, and to our children's futures?

Alun Pugh: A ddaeth arweinydd

Conservatives approached you to request that the Assembly's Plenary business be scheduled around his busy diary? If he is not here on Thursday, will you consider setting up an all-party search committee?

David Melding: Will you allocate Government time so that the issue of publishing Members' allowances can at last be debated on the Plenary floor? Last year, two-thirds of Members chose to publish their allowances, but we should have a system where the public can automatically view these figures in an annual report that, I believe, should be published by the Presiding Office. It is about time that the Assembly made an important decision in Plenary on this matter of great public interest.

The Presiding Officer: Before the Minister replies, although I am sure that he needs no help from me, I remind Members that he has no responsibility for the presence or absence of the leader of the Welsh Conservatives.

Carwyn Jones: Fortunately not, Llywydd.

I ateb pwynt Helen Mary Jones yn gyntaf, os oes galw am ddatl ar y mater a gododd, byddai'n werth ei drafod yn y Pwyllgor Busnes—dylai Plaid Cymru ystyried hynny. Nid oes modd imi ddweud yn union beth fydd yn digwydd yn y Pwyllgor hwnnw, ond os yw pobl am gael datl ar y pwnc hwn, y Pwyllgor fyddai'r fforwm i ofyn am hynny, yn fy marn i. Mae'r un peth yn berthnasol i David Melding. Os oes cais am ddatl ar y pwnc a gododd, dylid ei drafod yn y Pwyllgor Busnes.

On Alun Pugh's point, unfortunately, the search party's budget is a little short of cash. Therefore, Alun, you will have to volunteer to do it yourself.

Ceidwadwyr Cymru atoch i ofyn am gael trefnu busnes Cyfarfod Llawn y Cynulliad o amgylch ei ddyddiadur prysur? Os na fydd ef yma ddydd Iau, a wnewch chi ystyried sefydlu pwyllgor chwilio amlbleidiol?

David Melding: A wnewch chi drefnu amser er mwyn trafod, o'r diwedd, ar lawr y Siambr mewn Cyfarfod Llawn, gwestiwn cyhoeddi lwfansau Aelodau, a hynny yn amser y Llywodraeth? Y llynedd, dewisodd dau draean o Aelodau gyhoeddi'u lwfansau, ond dylem gael system lle gall y cyhoedd weld y ffigurau hyn yn awtomatig mewn adroddiad blynyddol y dylid, gredaf fi, ei gyhoeddi gan Swyddfa'r Llywydd. Mae'n hen bryd i'r Cynulliad wneud penderfyniad pwysig mewn Cyfarfod Llawn ar y mater hwn sydd o gryn ddiddordeb cyhoeddus.

Y Llywydd: Cyn i'r Gweinidog ateb, er fy mod yn siŵr nad oes arno angen dim cymorth oddi wrthyf fi, hoffwn atgoffa'r Aelodau nad oes ganddo ef ddim cyfrifoldeb dros bresenoldeb neu absenoldeb arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru.

Carwyn Jones: Nac oes, yn ffodus, Lywydd.

First, to respond to Helen Mary Jones's point, if there is a call for a debate on the matter she raised, it would be worth discussing it in the Business Committee—that is for Plaid Cymru to consider. I cannot say exactly what will happen in that Committee, but if people wanted to debate that subject, the Committee would be the appropriate forum in which to ask for it, in my opinion. The same applies to David Melding. If there is a request for a debate on the subject he raised, it should be discussed in the Business Committee.

Ar bwynt Alun Pugh, yn anffodus, mae cyllideb y parti chwilio ychydig yn brin o arian. Felly, Alun, bydd yn rhaid i chi wirfoddoli i'w wneud eich hun.

*Derbyniwyd y datganiad busnes.
Business statement adopted.*

Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion Composite Motion: Approval of Orders

Y Llywydd: O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif **The Presiding Officer:** Under Standing

22.25, nid yw'r cynnig hwn yn destun dadl.

Order No. 22.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig a Threfnydd y Cynulliad (Carwyn Jones):
Cynigiaf fod

The Minister for Rural Affairs and Assembly Business (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25:

the National Assembly, acting under Standing Order No. 22.25:

1. yn cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Cartrefi Cynnes ac Arbed Ynni 2000 (Cychwyn) (Cymru) 2002 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 12 Chwefror 2002; ac

1. approves the Warm Homes and Energy Conservation Act 2000 (Commencement) (Wales) Order 2002 laid in the Table Office on 12 February 2002;

2. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw faterion sy'n destun pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Deddf Cartrefi Cynnes ac Arbed Ynni 2000 (Cychwyn) (Cymru) 2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Chwefror 2002, a'r arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 12 Mawrth 2002;

2. considers the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Warm Homes and Energy Conservation Act 2000 (Commencement) (Wales) Order 2002, laid in the Table Office on 27 February 2002, and the regulatory appraisal laid in Table Office on 12 March 2002;

3. yn cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Tai (Hawl i Brynu) (Blaenoriaeth Arwystlon) (Cymru) 2002 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 12 Chwefror 2002; ac

3. approves the Housing (Right to Buy) (Priority of Charges) (Wales) Order 2002 laid in the Table Office on 12 February 2002; and

4. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw faterion sy'n destun pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Tai (Hawl i Brynu) (Blaenoriaeth Arwystlon) (Cymru) 2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Chwefror 2002. (NDM996)

4. considers the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Housing (Right to Buy) (Priority of Charges) (Wales) Order 2002, laid in the Table Office on 27 February 2002. (NDM996)

Cynnig: O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion: For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue

Evans, Delyth
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Halford, Alison
 Hancock, Brian
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Randerson, Jenny
 Richards, Rod
 Ryder, Janet
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Kirsty
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Llywodraeth Leol (Dangosyddion Perfformiad
 Gwerth Gorau) (Cymru) 2002**
**Approval of the Local Government (Best Value Performance Indicators) (Wales)
 Order 2002**

The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart): I propose that
Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly:

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:

considers the principle of the Local Government (Best Value Performance Indicators) (Wales) Order 2002, laid in the Table Office on 12 February 2002. (NDM992)

yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Llywodraeth Leol (Dangosyddion Perfformiad Gwerth Gorau) (Cymru) 2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 12 Chwefror 2002. (NDM992)

I also propose that

Cynigiau hefyd fod

the National Assembly:

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:

1. considers the report of the Legislation

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau

Committee which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the Local Government (Best Value Performance Indicators) (Wales) Order 2002, laid in the Table Office on 27 February 2002; and

2. approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 12 February 2002 and the Memorandum of Corrections laid in the Table Office on 11 March 2002. (NDM991)

This motion arises from the relationship that exists in Wales between the Assembly and local government, and demonstrates the way in which they work together to improve public services. Under the Local Government Act 1999, local authorities are required to instil a culture of continuous improvement in the provision of local services. They are required to report past performance and set targets for the future year against statutory performance indicators. Following the stocktake, the Partnership Council endorsed a radical new approach to implementing the Best Value legislation in the form of the Wales programme for improvements. Under this framework, the statutory indicators will continue to play an important role in measuring the improvements in performance across the full range of services provided by local authorities. The performance indicators help us to assess the annual improvement in services provided. They also provide us with a basis for comparison with authorities throughout Wales and, where applicable, with English authorities.

2:50 p.m.

This Order will replace the Best Value Performance Indicator (Wales) Order 2001 passed by the Assembly last March, which set indicators for 2001-02. At that time, the Assembly streamlined the set of indicators from 172 in 2000 to 86 in 2001, significantly reducing the burden on local authorities. This Order specifies 89 indicators, which includes 11 that will be reported to Whitehall departments as well as those to the Assembly. There is a new indicator on biodiversity and,

nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog 11.5, mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Llywodraeth Leol (Dangosyddion Perfformiad Gwerth Gorau) (Cymru) 2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Chwefror 2002; ac

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 12 Chwefror 2002 a'r Memorandwm Cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Mawrth 2002. (NDM991)

Cyfyd y cynnig hwn o'r berthynas sy'n bodoli yng Nghymru rhwng y Cynulliad a llywodraeth leol, ac mae'n dangos y modd y maent yn cydweithio i wella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Dan Ddeddf Llywodraeth Leol 1999, mae'n ofynnol i awdurdodau lleol fagu diwylliant o wella parhaus yn narpariaeth gwasanaethau lleol. Mae'n ofynnol iddynt adrodd ar berfformiad y gorffennol a gosod targedau ar gyfer y flwyddyn sydd i ddod yn erbyn dangosyddion perfformiad statudol. Wedi'r adroddiad cloriannu, cymeradwyodd y Cyngor Partneriaeth ffordd newydd radical o fynd ati i weithredu'r ddeddfwriaeth Gwerth Gorau ar ffurf y rhaglen welliannau i Gymru. Dan y fframwaith hwn, bydd y dangosyddion statudol yn parhau i chwarae rôl bwysig o ran mesur y gwelliannau mewn perfformiad ar draws yr amrediad cyfan o wasanaethau a ddarperir gan awdurdodau lleol. Mae'r dangosyddion perfformiad yn ein helpu i asesu'r gwelliant blynyddol yn y gwasanaethau a ddarperir. Maent hefyd yn darparu sail inni ar gyfer cymharu ag awdurdodau ledled Cymru ac, lle bo'n berthnasol, ag awdurdodau yn Lloegr.

Bydd y Gorchymyn hwn yn disodli Gorchymyn Dangosydd Perfformiad Gwerth Gorau (Cymru) 2001, a basiwyd gan y Cynulliad fis Mawrth diwethaf, ac a bennodd ddangosyddion ar gyfer 2001-02. Bryd hynny, taclusodd y Cynulliad y set o ddangosyddion o 172 yn 2000 i 86 yn 2001, gan leihau'n sylweddol y baich ar awdurdodau lleol. Mae'r Gorchymyn hwn yn pennu 89 dangosydd, sy'n cynnwys 11 a adroddir i adrannau Whitehall yn ogystal â'r

to reduce the duplication of information by collection, all policy agreements have been incorporated. This provides the consolidation requested by the authorities. It also establishes a consistent set of performance indicators with more focus on outcomes, which is more effective in measuring continuous improvement and less burdensome for all concerned.

However, it will not stop there. The performance improvement group which was formerly known as the Best Value project group will take forward a comprehensive review of the performance management framework within local government. It will of course include consideration of these performance indicators. We want the modernisation agenda to succeed and that means evaluating what we do to ensure that it is working. The review will include the requirements placed on local authorities to establish effective performance management frameworks. This is one of the many commitments contained in my recent policy statement, 'Freedom and Responsibility'. That statement and this Order show how the partnership between the Assembly and its key partner organisations can work to develop policy reflecting Welsh circumstances. I commend the motions.

Janet Ryder: The Government's extensive stocktake of the implementation of the Local Government (Best Value Principles) Act 1999 is welcome. The system needs an overhaul and drastic change. The programme for improvement goes some way to improving the situation. It should be noted that the improvement programme realises that Best Value audits led to bureaucratic processes that undermined the commitment, energy and creativity needed to make real improvements in the provision of services. That bureaucracy was slowly clogging up the systems of many local authorities. The previous Best Value regime was not inclusive. I hope that the improvements will succeed in ensuring that elected members, partner organisations and members of the public are much more engaged in the system.

rhai i'r Cynulliad. Mae dangosydd newydd ar fioamrywiaeth ac, i leihau dyblygu gwybodaeth wrth gasglu, ymgorfforwyd pob cytundeb polisi. Mae hyn yn rhoi'r atgyfnerthiad y gofynnodd yr awdurdodau amdano. Mae hefyd yn sefydlu set gyson o ddangosyddion perfformiad gyda mwy o ffocws ar ganlyniadau, sy'n fwy effeithiol o ran mesur gwellhad parhaus ac yn llai beichus i bawb.

Fodd bynnag, nid dyna'r pen draw. Bydd y grŵp gwella perfformiad a elwid gynt yn grŵp prosiect Gwerth Gorau yn mynd ymlaen ag adolygiad cynhwysfawr o'r fframwaith rheoli perfformiad o fewn llywodraeth leol. Wrth reswm bydd yn cynnwys ystyriaeth o'r dangosyddion perfformiad hyn. Mae arnom eisiau i'r rhaglen foderneiddio lwyddo, a golyga hynny arfarnu'r hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud i sicrhau ei fod yn gweithio. Bydd yr adolygiad yn cynnwys y gofynion a osodir ar awdurdodau lleol i sefydlu fframweithiau rheoli perfformiad effeithiol. Dyma un o'r nifer o ymrwymadau a gynhwyswyd yn fy natganiad polisi diweddar, 'Rhyddid a Chyfrifoldeb'. Mae'r datganiad hwnnw a'r Gorchymyn hwn yn dangos sut y gall y bartneriaeth rhwng y Cynulliad a'r cyrff allweddol sy'n bartneriaid iddo weithio i ddatblygu polisi sy'n adlewyrchu amgylchiadau Cymru. Cymeradwyaf y cynigion.

Janet Ryder: Mae adroddiad cloriannu helaeth y Llywodraeth ar weithrediad Deddf Llywodraeth Leol (Egwyddorion Gwerth Gorau) 1999 i'w groesawu. Mae angen ailwampio'r system a'i newid yn llwyr. Mae'r rhaglen wella'n mynd ryw gymaint o'r ffordd i wella'r sefyllfa. Dylid nodi bod y rhaglen wella'n sylweddoli bod yr archwiliadau Gwerth Gorau wedi arwain at brosesau biwrocraidd a danseiliodd yr ymroddiad, yr egni a'r creadigrwydd y mae eu hangen i wneud gwelliannau gwirioneddol yn narpariaeth gwasanaethau. Yr oedd y fiwrocraeth honno'n araf dagu systemau sawl awdurdod lleol. Nid oedd y drefn flaenorol ar gyfer Gwerth Gorau yn un gynhwysol. Gobeithiaf y bydd y gwelliannau'n llwyddo i sicrhau y caiff aelodau etholedig, cyrff partner ac aelodau'r cyhoedd lawer mwy o ran yn y system.

Authorities have complained frequently that it has not been possible to have a dialogue with the inspectorate. I hope that the improvement programme addresses this. A dialogue between the authorities and the inspectorate is essential if we are going to see communities benefiting from external audits. Since the inspection and audit regime will be overhauled, we must ensure that the principle of fair and independent external challenge in local authorities' services is upheld. Ultimately, it is the taxpayers who suffer if external checks are muted or disregarded. Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough Council is a good example of a local authority implementing good practice or Best Value working with the auditors and following a partnership approach. Previously the authority was in a parlous financial state: no accounts were signed off; performance management arrangements were severely underdeveloped; and there were grave concerns about the quality of service provision. There has been a transformation in recent years in Rhondda Cynon Taff, with the authority and the District Audit working together to resolve its difficulties. The transformation would not have happened so quickly without the partnership between the authority and the auditor.

The Presiding Officer: Order. Are you giving way to Christine Chapman?

Janet Ryder: Very quickly.

Christine Chapman: While we are all pleased that Rhondda Cynon Taff is doing well, do you think that it is also being helped by the extra money that this Labour-led Assembly is providing?

Janet Ryder: Certainly, there is extra money, but it is being well spent by a Plaid Cymru council; it is well accounted for and produces good, positive results.

We have all heard concerns over the last two years that Best Value demotivates staff. Addressing these problems is a key challenge in preparing a new audit approach. We must develop an inspection regime that does not shy away from robust and independent

Mae awdurdodau wedi cwyno'n aml na fu'n bosibl cynnal deialog gyda'r arolygaeth. Gobeithiaf fod y rhaglen wella yn gwneud rhywbeth am hyn. Rhaid wrth ddeialog rhwng yr awdurdodau a'r arolygaeth os ydym am weld cymunedau'n elwa ar archwiliadau allanol. Gan y bydd y drefn arolygu ac archwilio'n cael ei hailwampio, rhaid inni sicrhau y cedwir yr egwyddor o her allanol deg ac annibynnol yng ngwasanaethau awdurdodau lleol. Yn y pen draw, y trethdalwyr sy'n dioddef os caiff archwiliadau allanol eu mygu neu eu diystyru. Mae Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf yn enghraifft dda o awdurdod lleol sy'n gweithredu ymarfer da neu Werth Gorau gan weithio gyda'r archwiliwyr a mynd ati mewn partneriaeth. Gynt, yr oedd yr awdurdod mewn cyflwr ariannol bregus: nid oedd unrhyw gyfrifon wedi'u llofnodi; yr oedd trefniadau rheoli perfformiad heb eu datblygu'n ddigonol o bell ffordd; ac yr oedd pryderon mawr ynghylch ansawdd y ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau. Bu gweddnewidiad yn Rhondda Cynon Taf dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf, gyda'r awdurdod a'r Archwiliwr Dosbarth yn cydweithio i ddatrys ei anawsterau. Ni fuasai'r gweddnewidiad wedi digwydd mor gyflym heb y bartneriaeth rhwng yr awdurdod a'r archwiliwr.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. A ydych chi'n ildio i Christine Chapman?

Janet Ryder: Yn gyflym iawn.

Christine Chapman: Er ein bod i gyd yn falch fod Rhondda Cynon Taf yn gwneud yn dda, a dybiwch ei fod yn cael ei helpu hefyd gan yr arian ychwanegol y mae'r Cynulliad hwn, dan arweiniad Llafur, yn ei ddarparu?

Janet Ryder: Yn sicr, ceir arian ychwanegol, ond mae'n cael ei wario'n dda gan gyngor Plaid Cymru; mae cyfrif da amdano ac mae'n cynhyrchu canlyniadau cadarnhaol, da.

Yr ydym i gyd wedi clywed pryderon yn ystod y ddwy flynedd ddiwethaf fod Gwerth Gorau'n gwanhau cymhelliant staff. Mae ateb y problemau hyn yn her allweddol wrth baratoi dull newydd o archwilio. Rhaid inni ddatblygu trefn arolygu nad yw'n ymgilio

challenges, while also engaging service providers in a partnership approach to improving delivery.

Unfortunately, Best Value—or competitive tendering, which it has replaced—is usually defined in monetary terms. This frequently led to councils accepting the lowest tenders, which has not always provided the real ‘best value’ to the communities that they serve. This Order deals with management structures, but we must always remember that Best Value had a wide-reaching effect, especially when counties used their purchasing powers. Purchasing power must be used for the benefit of communities by utilising local firms and produce.

Will the Minister further clarify the future Best Value programmes for the police and the fire authorities? According to the statutory instrument, the new procedure will only apply to local authorities and national parks. Does that mean that the police and the fire authorities will operate under the previous Best Value procedures? Will having two Best Value regimes existing side by side in Wales cause any confusion, especially when local authorities must work in such close partnership with those other authorities on subjects like community safety? If a Best Value review of community safety programmes were held, which regime would you follow: that being developed in Wales or that still applying in England? If we are to achieve clarity, surely all public bodies undertaking Best Value inspections and complying with Best Value must observe the same procedure?

Brian Gibbons: I am pleased to hear Janet Ryder’s greatest hits. She did the same number in a gig at Swansea’s Grand Theatre, but it was probably worth repeating.

I welcome this motion because it highlights the importance of transparency in the performance of local authorities in Wales, particularly high-spending authorities such as Rhondda Cynon Taff, Merthyr Tydfil and so

oddi wrth her gadarn ac annibynnol, gan gynnwys darparwyr gwasanaethau hefyd mewn partneriaeth wrth fynd ati i wella’r modd y darperir gwasanaethau.

Yn anffodus, fel arfer diffinnir Gwerth Gorau—neu dendro cystadleuol, a ddisodlwyd ganddo—mewn termau ariannol. Arweiniodd hyn yn aml at sefyllfa lle byddai cynghorau’n derbyn y tendrau isaf, a hynny weithiau heb ddarparu’r ‘gwerth gorau’ mewn gwirionedd i’r cymunedau a wasanaethant. Mae’r Gorchymyn hwn yn delio â strwythurau rheoli, ond rhaid inni gofio bob amser y cafodd Gwerth Gorau effaith bellgyrhaeddol, yn enwedig pan ddefnyddiai siroedd eu pwerau prynu. Rhaid defnyddio pŵer prynu er lles cymunedau drwy ddefnyddio cwmnïau a chynnyrch lleol.

A wnaiff y Gweinidog egluro ymhellach y rhaglenni Gwerth Gorau ar gyfer y dyfodol i’r awdurdodau heddlu a thân? Yn ôl yr offeryn statudol, ni fydd y drefn newydd ond yn berthnasol i awdurdodau lleol a pharciau cenedlaethol. A yw hynny’n golygu y bydd yr heddlu a’r awdurdodau tân yn gweithredu dan y gweithdrefnau Gwerth Gorau blaenorol? A fydd dwy drefn Gwerth Gorau yn bodoli ochr yn ochr yng Nghymru yn achosi dryswch, yn enwedig pan fo raid i awdurdodau lleol weithio mewn partneriaeth mor agos gyda’r awdurdodau eraill hynny ar bynciau fel diogelwch cymunedol? Pe cynhelid adolygiad Gwerth Gorau ar raglenni diogelwch cymunedol, pa drefn fydddech chi’n ei dilyn: yr un sy’n cael ei datblygu yng Nghymru ynteu honno sydd yn dal yn weithredol yn Lloegr? Os ydym am gael eglurder, onid oes rhaid i bob corff cyhoeddus sy’n ymgymryd ag archwiliadau Gwerth Gorau ac yn cydymffurfio â Gwerth Gorau ddilyn yr un weithdrefn?

Brian Gibbons: Mae’n dda gennyf glywed goreuon Janet Ryder. Rhoddodd yr un perfformiad mewn sioe yn Theatr y Grand, Abertawe, ond mae’n debyg ei fod yn werth ei ailadrodd.

Croesawaf y cynnig hwn gan ei fod yn tanlinellu pwysigrwydd tryloywder ym mherfformiad awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru, yn enwedig awdurdodau sy’n gwario llawer fel Rhondda Cynon Taf,

forth. It is only through such a transparent process that we can see that high-spending authorities in Wales are not inefficient or extravagant, but are performing well. My own local authority in Neath—

David Davies: If it is the case that they are performing so well, why is it that year after year they are spending over and above their standard spending assessments, and failing to come before the Assembly to explain to us why they do so? Is it not the case that Blaenau Gwent is well known throughout Wales as Blaenau Bent and that the Labour councillors of Rhondda Cynon Taff were known as robbing cunning Taffies? I could go on, but the fact remains that in some councils, corruption has been endemic for years, and the people of areas such as Monmouthshire have been forking out to pay for it.

Brian Gibbons: By your own words we will judge you, David.

My local authority, Neath Port Talbot, has been high-performing consistently on all parameters, both those used by the Audit Commission and those outlined in previous performance indicators. The answer to David's question is that these authorities are high-spending because of their social and economic needs.

Janet Ryder *rose*—

Brian Gibbons: They are not properly resourced through the revenue support grant, and until such time as we get—

The Presiding Officer: Order. He is not giving way.

Brian Gibbons: I do not mind giving way.

Janet Ryder: I just want to point out that you have branded Rhondda Cynon Taff a high-spending authority, which is good. It is spending on the services that are needed and yet delivering them on one of the lowest council tax rates in Wales.

Brian Gibbons: I do not think that it has one of the lowest council tax rates in Wales. I do

Merthyr Tudful ac ati. Dim ond drwy broses dryloyw y gallwn weld nad yw awdurdodau sy'n gwario llawer yng Nghymru ddim yn aneffeithlon nac yn afradus, ond eu bod yn perfformio'n dda. Mae fy awdurdod lleol i yng Nghastell Nedd—

David Davies: Os ydyw'n wir eu bod yn perfformio mor dda, pam y maent flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn yn gwario mwy na'u hasesiadau gwariant safonol, ac yn methu dod ger bron y Cynulliad i egluro inni pam y gwnânt hynny? Onid yw'n wir fod Blaenau Gwent yn cael ei adnabod drwy Gymru fel Blaenau Bent ac yr adwaenid cynghorwyr Llafur Rhondda Cynon Taf fel '*robbing cunning Taffies*'? Gallwn fynd ymlaen, ond erys y ffaith fod llygredd wedi bod yn rhemp mewn rhai cynghorau ers blynyddoedd, a bod pobl ardaloedd fel Sir Fynwy wedi gorfod talu'r pris.

Brian Gibbons: Yn ôl eich geiriau eich hun y'ch barnwn, David.

Mae f'awdurdod lleol i, Castell-nedd Port Talbot, wedi bod yn perfformio'n gyson dda ar bob paramedr, y rhai a ddefnyddir gan y Comisiwn Archwilio a'r rhai a amlinellwyd mewn dangosyddion perfformiad blaenorol. Yr ateb i gwestiwn David yw bod yr awdurdodau hyn yn gwario llawer oherwydd eu hanghenion cymdeithasol ac economaidd.

Janet Ryder *a gododd*—

Brian Gibbons: Nid ydynt yn cael adnoddau digonol drwy'r grant cynnal refeniw, a hyd nes y cawn ni—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid yw'n ildio.

Brian Gibbons: Nid oes ots gennyf ildio.

Janet Ryder: Dim ond eisiau nodi yr wyf eich bod wedi galw Rhondda Cynon Taf yn awdurdod sy'n gwario llawer, sydd yn beth da. Mae'n gwario ar y gwasanaethau sydd eu hangen ac eto'n eu darparu ar un o gyfraddau isaf y dreth yngor yng Nghymru.

Brian Gibbons: Ni chredaf fod ganddo un o gyfraddau isaf y dreth yngor yng Nghymru.

not have the figures before me, but of the highest-spending authorities in Wales, Rhondda Cynon Taff is around number 7 or 8. That is neither wrong nor surprising in view of the social and economic needs of these authorities. Until we address the issue of the revenue support grant, efficient and effective local authorities will continue to face these difficulties. By having indicators like these, we can see that our local authorities are performing well while trying to address difficult social and economic problems.

William Graham: I declare an interest as a councillor for the city of Newport. We welcome this reduction in Best Value performance indicators, and hope that the regime will now improve somewhat. Many local authorities and their employees were concerned when it was announced that the Audit Commission was to be responsible for these performance indicators. We hope that it will now provide a much more supportive line for local government and that where failures are identified, greater support and training will be offered.

3:00 p.m.

It is important that the morale of local government officials should be maintained and improved wherever possible. That is how to drive up standards. We are greatly impressed that the Minister has listened to representations made throughout local government in Wales. We agree that the number of performance indicators should be reduced, and not before time.

Eleanor Burnham: The Liberal Democrats welcome these proposals as a good example of how the Liberal Democrat/Labour partnership Government is easing the burden of Best Value on local councils, by reducing the number of performance indicators on which they must report.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas *rose*—

Eleanor Burnham: When linked to the new programme for improvement in Wales, we will lead the way in the UK in seeking to

Nid yw'r ffigurau gennyf o'm blaen, ond o'r awdurdodau sy'n gwario fwyaf yng Nghymru, mae Rhondda Cynon Taf oddeutu rhif 7 neu 8. Nid yw hynny nac yn ddrwg nac yn syndod o gofio anghenion cymdeithasol ac economaidd yr awdurdodau hyn. Hyd nes yr awn i'r afael â chwestiwn y grant cynnal refeniw, bydd awdurdodau lleol effeithlon ac effeithiol yn dal i wynebu'r anawsterau hyn. Drwy gael dangosyddion fel hyn, gallwn weld fod ein hawdurdodau lleol yn perfformio'n dda tra'n ceisio mynd i'r afael â phroblemau cymdeithasol ac economaidd dyrys.

William Graham: Datganaf fuddiant fel cynghorydd dros ddinas Casnewydd. Yr ydym yn croesawu'r lleihad hwn mewn dangosyddion perfformiad Gwerth Gorau, ac yn gobeithio y gwnaiff y drefn wella rhywfaint yn awr. Yr oedd sawl awdurdod lleol a'u gweithwyr yn bryderus pan gyhoeddwyd bod y Comisiwn Archwilio i fod yn gyfrifol am y dangosyddion perfformiad hyn. Gobeithiwn y bydd yn awr yn llawer mwy cefnogol i lywodraeth leol, ac y cynigir mwy o gefnogaeth a hyfforddiant lle nodir methiannau.

Mae'n bwysig y dylid cynnal a gwella morâl swyddogion llywodraeth leol lle bynnag y bo modd. Dyna'r ffordd i godi safonau. Yr ydym yn edmygu'n fawr fod y Gweinidog wedi gwrandao ar sylwadau a wnaed gan lywodraeth leol ledled Cymru. Cytunwn y dylid lleihau nifer y dangosyddion perfformiad hyn, ac nid cyn pryd.

Eleanor Burnham: Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn croesawu'r cynigion hyn fel enghraifft dda o'r modd y mae Llywodraeth bartneriaeth y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol/Llafur yn ysgafnhau baich Gwerth Gorau ar gynghorau lleol, drwy leihau'r nifer o ddangosyddion perfformiad y mae'n rhaid iddynt adrodd arnynt.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas *a gododd*—

Eleanor Burnham: O'u cysylltu â'r rhaglen newydd ar gyfer gwella yng Nghymru, fe arweiniwn y ffordd yn y DU wrth geisio

improve the way that councils perform, and reducing the burden of bureaucracy previously imposed by the—[ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘Give way.’]

The Presiding Officer: Order. If Members do not wish to give way, that is a matter for them.

Eleanor Burnham: These changes show—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Eisteddwch i lawr, Rhodri.

Eleanor Burnham: These changes show, once again, the value of devolution in finding Welsh solutions to the problems faced by Welsh local government.

The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart): I am glad that there is a general consensus on the Order before us today. I thank William for his comments. We have listened intently to the comments of Welsh local government on all the issues. We did not want the Best Value regime to become a business industry, which is what it was becoming.

I am also mindful of Janet Ryder’s points on the importance of the role of local authority members and their involvement in discussions with the Best Value inspectorate. The inspectorate is there to improve matters, not to implement a regime that does not benefit local council tax payers.

Responsibility for the police and fire authorities is not devolved. However, I have been concerned about bringing the performance indicators together for some time. I will hold further discussions on this.

Finally, I say to David Davies that I will stand up and defend any local authority—irrespective of its politics—if I think that it is doing a good job. That is my job as Minister for Local Government. Local authorities battle against many difficult issues. Poverty is endemic in some authority areas, and they struggle constantly against falling pupil rolls, even falling population, and a formula that sometimes does not reflect their needs. Your

gwella’r ffordd y mae cynghorau’n perfformio, a lleihau’r baich biwrocraidd a osodwyd gynt gan y—[AELODAU’R CYNULLIAD: ‘Ildiwch.’]

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Os nad yw Aelodau’n dymuno ildio, mater iddynt hwy yw hynny.

Eleanor Burnham: Mae’r newidiadau hyn yn dangos—

The Presiding Officer: Order. Sit down, Rhodri.

Eleanor Burnham: Mae’r newidiadau hyn yn dangos, unwaith eto, werth datganoli o ran canfod atebion Cymreig i’r problemau a wynebir gan lywodraeth leol yng Nghymru.

Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart): Yr wyf yn falch fod consensws cyffredinol ar y Gorchymyn sydd ger ein bron heddiw. Diolchaf i William am ei sylwadau. Yr ydym wedi gwrando’n astud ar sylwadau llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru ar yr holl faterion. Nid oedd arnom eisiau i’r drefn Gwerth Gorau fynd yn ddiwydiant busnes, a dyna oedd yn digwydd.

Yr wyf hefyd yn cadw mewn cof bwyntiau Janet Ryder ar bwysigrwydd rôl aelodau awdurdodau lleol a’u hymwneud â thrafodaethau gyda’r arolygaeth Gwerth Gorau. Mae’r arolygaeth yno er mwyn gwella pethau, nid i weithredu trefn nad yw’n rhoi budd i’r rhai sy’n talu’r dreth gyngor.

Nid yw’r cyfrifoldeb dros yr awdurdodau tân a’r heddlu wedi’i ddatganoli. Er hynny, bwm yn ystyried dod â’r dangosyddion perfformiad at ei gilydd ers tro. Fe gynhaliad drafodaethau pellach ar hyn.

Yn olaf, dywedaf wrth David Davies y gwnaf sefyll ac amddiffyn unrhyw awdurdod lleol—beth bynnag fo’i wleidyddiaeth—os tybiaf ei fod yn gwneud gwaith da. Dyna fy ngwaith fel Gweinidog dros Lywodraeth Leol. Mae awdurdodau lleol yn brwydro yn erbyn llawer o faterion anodd. Mae tloidi’n rhemp yn ardaloedd rhai awdurdodau, a cheir un ymdrech barhaus yn erbyn cwmp yn niferoedd disgyblion, hyd yn oed gwmp yn

comments in this Chamber regarding Blaenau Gwent were absolutely outrageous.

David Davies *rose*—

Edwina Hart: You need to recognise—

Alun Cairns and **Jonathan Morgan** *rose*—

The Presiding Officer: Order. The Minister is not giving way.

Edwina Hart: You need to recognise that the majority of councillors across Wales are decent, hardworking human beings, who put themselves out to help their constituents. I will not have you making such comments about authorities when you have no proof. Local authorities work hard for the communities they represent, and for you to tar councillors in that way is a disgrace and an abuse of Assembly procedure.

I commend the motion to Members.

Y Llywydd: Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar egyddor y Gorchymyn.

y boblogaeth, a fformiwla nad yw'n adlewyrchu'u hanghenion weithiau. Yr oedd eich sylwadau yn y Siambr hon ynghylch Blaenau Gwent yn gwbl warthus.

David Davies *a gododd*—

Edwina Hart: Mae angen ichi sylweddoli—

Alun Cairns a **Jonathan Morgan** *a gododd*—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid yw'r Gweinidog yn ildio.

Edwina Hart: Mae angen ichi sylweddoli bod y rhan fwyaf o gynghorwyr ar hyd a lled Cymru yn bobl dda, weithgar, sy'n mynd i drafferth i helpu'u hetholwyr. Ni wnaif dderbyn sylwadau o'r fath gennyh am awdurdodau heb fod prawf gennyh. Mae awdurdodau lleol yn gweithio'n galed dros y cymunedau a gynrychiolant, ac mae'r modd y ceisiasoch chi bardduo cynghorwyr fel yna yn gywilydd ac yn gamddefnydd o drefn y Cynulliad.

Cymeradwyaf y cynnig i'r Aelodau.

The Presiding Officer: We will now vote on the principle of the Order.

*Cynnig: O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 44, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian

Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Richards, Rod
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion carried.

Y Llywydd: Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar **The Presiding Officer:** We will now vote on
gymeradwyo'r Gorchymyn. the approval of the Order.

Cynnig: O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion: For 44, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David

Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Richards, Rod
 Ryder, Janet
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order

Rod Richards: Point of order. I seek your guidance on the rights of the socially excluded independent Members in this Chamber. During the business statement, you called Alun Pugh and David Melding to speak, but I was unable to participate in that exchange. When a group leader—a re-appointed one—is absent, will you consider, Llywydd, calling somebody who was elected?

The Presiding Officer: All Members are equal, regardless of their group. Under Standing Order No. 5.4:

‘the Presiding Officer may allow the Assembly Business Secretary to propose that the statement be adopted, and one Member from each political group to speak briefly in response’.

Similarly, if there is no objection to the statement, I can:

‘allow one Member from each political group to comment briefly on the Assembly Business Secretary’s statement’.

I am bound by this Standing Order.

Janet Ryder: Point of order. I should have declared an interest as a member of Rhuthin town council before the last vote; other members of the group need to do the same.

Rod Richards: Pwynt o drefn. Hoffwn eich arweiniad ar hawliau'r Aelodau annibynnol sydd wedi'u hallgáu yn gymdeithasol yn y Siambr hon. Yn ystod y datganiad busnes, gwnaethoch alw ar Alun Pugh a David Melding i siarad, ond ni chefais i gymryd rhan yn y drafodaeth honno. Pan fydd arweinydd grŵp—un a ailbenodwyd—yn absennol, a wnewch chi ystyried, Lywydd, alw ar rywun a etholwyd?

Y Llywydd: Mae pob Aelod yn gyfartal, i ba grŵp bynnag y perthynant. Dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 5.4:

‘gall y Llywydd ganiatáu i'r Trefnydd gynnig mabwysiadu'r datganiad, ac i un Aelod o bob grŵp gwleidyddol ymateb yn gryno i hynny’.

Yn yr un modd, os nad oes gwrthwynebiad i'r datganiad, gallaf:

‘[g]aniatáu i un Aelod o bob grŵp gwleidyddol gyflwyno sylwadau cryno ar ddatganiad y Trefnydd’.

Yr wyf wedi fy rhwymo gan y Rheol Sefydlog hon.

Janet Ryder: Pwynt o drefn. Dylaswn fod wedi datgan buddiant fel aelod o gyngor tref Rhuthun cyn y bleidlais ddiwethaf; mae angen i aelodau eraill o'r grŵp wneud yr un

Can you clarify whether we must declare such interests every time there is a vote affecting local government?

The Presiding Officer: Yes, you must.

Owen John Thomas: Pwynt o drefn. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â sylwadau David Davies, a'i gyfeiriad at aelodau'r cyn-gyngor Llafur yn y Rhondda fel '*robbing cunning Taffies*'. Ni chredaf fod hynny'n dderbyniol, Lywydd. Beth yw eich barn chi?

Y Llywydd: Byddaf yn edrych ar Gofnod y Trafodion, ac yn dychwelyd at hyn.

David Davies: Further to that point of order, I used that term because—I believe—the councillors were known colloquially as 'robbing cunning Taffies'. That is a simple matter of fact and something that—

The Presiding Officer: Order. I will examine the Record of Proceedings. There are no further points of order on this matter.

Peter Black: Point of order. I must also declare an interest as a member of the City and County of Swansea Council. However, I understood that the previous ruling on this matter was that we only needed to declare such interests if we contributed to the debate.

The Presiding Officer: There was no previous ruling on this matter; advice was given to Members on the declaration of interests. That advice was that Members should declare such interests in each proceeding of the Assembly when relevant business is before us. If Members would like further advice on this matter, I am sure that we can provide a note.

modd. A allwch egluro a oes raid inni ddatgan y cyfryw fuddiannau bob tro y ceir pleidlais sy'n effeithio ar lywodraeth leol?

Y Llywydd: Oes, mae'n rhaid.

Owen John Thomas: Point of order. This relates to David Davies's comments, and his referring to the members of the former Labour council in the Rhondda as 'robbing cunning Taffies'. I do not believe that that is acceptable, Llywydd. What is your opinion?

The Presiding Officer: I will examine the Record of Proceedings, and revisit this matter.

David Davies: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, defnyddiais y term hwnnw oherwydd—mi gredaf—yr adwaenid y cynghorwyr ar lafar gwlad fel '*robbing cunning Taffies*'. Mater syml o ffaith yw hynny a rhywbeth y—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Byddaf yn edrych ar Gofnod y Trafodion. Nid oes pwyntiau o drefn pellach ar y mater hwn.

Peter Black: Pwynt o drefn. Rhaid i minnau ddatgan buddiant fel aelod o Gyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe. Fodd bynnag, deallais mai'r dyfarniad blaenorol ar y mater hwn oedd mai dim ond os y cyfrannem at y drafodaeth yr oedd angen inni ddatgan buddiannau o'r fath.

Y Llywydd: Nid oedd unrhyw ddyfarniad blaenorol ar y mater hwn; rhoddwyd cyngor i'r Aelodau ar ddatgan buddiannau. Y cyngor hwnnw oedd y dylai'r Aelodau ddatgan y cyfryw fuddiannau ym mhob cyfarfod o'r Cynulliad pan fydd busnes perthnasol ger ein bron. Os hoffai Aelodau gael cyngor pellach ar y mater hwn, yr wyf yn siŵr y gallwn ddarparu nodyn.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.06 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.06 p.m.*

Gwasanaethau Gofal Dydd i Blant Dan Wyth Day-care Services for Children Under Eight

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1 and 2 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 and 2 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): I propose that

the National Assembly:

1. welcomes the regulations and national minimum standards for child minders and day-care services for children under eight, which will underpin the work of the Care Standards Inspectorate from April this year; and

2. notes that the regulations are designed to introduce stronger protection for children placed in these day-care services, and an improvement in the quality of their care. (NDM995)

I am pleased that we were able to find time today to debate the regulations on child minding and day care. The Assembly is treading a different path from England in this area. Across the border, the Care Standards Commission will regulate children's homes, while children's day care is the responsibility of Ofsted. I considered it important that the Care Standards Inspectorate should regulate all care settings for children. This will ensure consistency and coherence. That is reflected in the regulations before us, and in the accompanying standards that I have circulated to inform our debate, which have been formally notified to Members in accordance with Standing Order No. 27.

The regulations will govern the provision of child minding and day care for children under eight years old. They will apply to child minders and services such as day nurseries, playgroups and out-of-school care. The regulations create specific statutory duties for registered providers and will cover issues such as staffing, fitness of premises and the fitness of the registered provider. The accompanying national minimum standards complement the specific requirements of the regulations.

The regulations and standards have been developed in close consultation with the key provider groups and other children's organisations, such as the National Childminding Association, Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin, the Wales Pre-school Playgroups

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Cynigiaf fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:

1. yn croesawu'r rheoliadau a'r safonau gofynnol cenedlaethol ar gyfer gwarchodwyr a gwasanaethau gofal dydd i blant dan 8 oed, a fydd yn sail i waith yr Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal o fis Ebrill eleni; ac

2. yn nodi bod y rheoliadau wedi'u cynllunio i roi amddiffyn cryfach i'r plant a roddir dan ofal y gwasanaethau gofal dydd hyn, ac i wella safon y gofal a gânt. (NDM995)

Yr wyf yn falch inni allu canfod amser heddiw i drafod y rheoliadau ar warchod plant a gofal dydd. Mae'r Cynulliad yn troedio llwybr gwahanol i Loegr yn y maes hwn. Dros y ffin, bydd y Comisiwn Safonau Gofal yn rheoleiddio cartrefi plant, tra bod gofal dydd i blant yn gyfrifoldeb Ofsted. Bernais i ei bod yn bwysig y dylai'r Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal reoleiddio pob lleoliad gofal i blant. Bydd hyn yn sicrhau cysondeb a chydlynid. Adlewyrchir hynny yn y rheoliadau sydd ger ein bron, ac yn y safonau cyfatebol yr wyf wedi'u hanfon at bawb i roi gwybodaeth gefndirol i'n dadl, safonau yr hysbyswyd Aelodau yn ffurfiol amdanynt, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 27.

Bydd y rheoliadau'n ymdrin â darpariaeth gwarchod a gofal dydd i blant dan wyth mlwydd oed. Byddant yn berthnasol i warchodwyr plant a gwasanaethau fel meithrinfeydd dydd, grwpiau chwarae a gofal y tu allan i'r ysgol. Mae'r rheoliadau'n creu dyletswyddau statudol penodol i ddarparwyr cofrestredig a byddant yn ymdrin â materion fel staffio, addasrwydd adeiladau ac addasrwydd y darparwr cofrestredig. Mae'r safonau gofynnol cenedlaethol a geir gyda hwy'n ategu gofynion penodol y rheoliadau.

Datblygwyd y rheoliadau a'r safonau mewn ymgynghoriad agos â'r grwpiau darparu allweddol a sefydliadau plant eraill, megis y Gymdeithas Genedlaethol Gwarchod Plant, Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin, Cymdeithas Cylchoedd Chwarae Cyn-Ysgol Cymru, Plant

Association, Children in Wales and Play Wales. yng Nghymru a Chwarae Cymru.

The consultation responses and the subsequent meetings illustrated the commitment of the sector to high standards in childcare and a good degree of consensus on the content. All the representative groups were concerned that staff in the sector should be properly qualified, and the Assembly Government will work with early years development and childcare partnerships and others to ensure an increase in the proportion of staff with appropriate qualifications.

I accept that there is a challenge in training care staff up to level 3 qualifications for leaders, and level 2 for other staff. While this standard is widely reached in many places, it is not expected that it will be reached immediately everywhere. Inspectors will use discretion in recognising predecessor qualifications and in discussing an action plan with each provider, where necessary. This is an issue that will be kept under review as the childcare strategy, budget decisions and practice in the sector all develop.

I announced last year that newly registered child minders will receive a start-up grant from April this year. I can confirm today that the level will be a minimum of £300 per childminder across Wales. There will be local discretion to award higher grants in particular cases. I want to see the decline in the number of child minders reversed, and these grants will assist with that.

3:10 p.m

I have also decided not to set inspection fees for child minders or for sessional care such as playgroups and out-of-school clubs. Full day-care services will experience only modest increases in their fees. This initiative allied to the new start-up grant for child minders is warmly supported by the sector. Families must be assured that the quality of care that they can expect will meet national minimum standards enforced across Wales. This will become a reality from 1 April 2002, when the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales starts its work. I emphasise that child protection will be at the centre of these standards and that smacking will not be allowed by any

Yr oedd yr ymatebion i'r ymgynghoriad a'r cyfarfodydd wedi hynny'n dangos ymrwymiad y sector i safonau uchel mewn gofal plant a chryn radd o gonsensws ar y cynnwys. Yr oedd pob grŵp cynrychioli'n awyddus i staff yn y sector fod â'r cymwysterau priodol, a bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gweithio gyda phartneriaethau datblygiad blynyddoedd cynnar a gofal plant ac eraill i sicrhau cynnydd yn y ganran o staff sydd â'r cymwysterau priodol.

Derbyniaf fod her ynghlwm wrth hyfforddi staff gofal hyd at gymwysterau lefel 3 i arweinwyr, a lefel 2 i staff eraill. Tra chyrhaeddir y safon hon yn gyffredin mewn sawl lle, ni ddisgwylir y cyrhaeddir hi yn syth ym mhobman. Bydd arolygwyr yn defnyddio doethineb wrth gydnabod cymwysterau rhagflaenorol ac wrth drafod cynllun gweithredu gyda phob darparwr, lle bo angen. Dyma fater a gedwir dan sylw wrth i'r strategaeth gofal plant, penderfyniadau cyllideb ac arferion y sector ddatblygu.

Cyhoeddais y llynedd y bydd gwarchodwyr plant sydd newydd gofrestru'n cael grant cychwyn o fis Ebrill eleni. Gallaf gadarnhau heddiw y bydd lefel y grant o leiaf £300 y gwarchodwr ledled Cymru. Bydd disgresiwn lleol i roi grantiau uwch mewn achosion penodol. Mae arnaf eisiau gweld gwrthdroi'r cwmp yn y nifer o warchodwyr, a bydd y grantiau hyn yn helpu gyda hynny.

Yr wyf hefyd wedi penderfynu peidio â gosod ffioedd arolygu i warchodwyr plant nac am ofal sesiynol fel grwpiau chwarae a chlybiau y tu allan i'r ysgol. Bydd gwasanaethau gofal dydd llawn yn profi cynnydd bach yn unig yn eu ffioedd. Mae cefnogaeth wresog i'r fenter hon, ochr yn ochr â'r grant cychwyn newydd i warchodwyr plant, gan y sector. Rhaid rhoi sicrwydd i deuluoedd y bydd yr ansawdd gofal y gallant ei ddisgwyl yn cyrraedd safonau gofynnol cenedlaethol a bennir ar draws Cymru. Gwireddir hyn o 1 Ebrill 2002, pryd y dechreu Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru ei gwaith. Pwysleisiaf y bydd diogelu

registered childminder or in any other day-care setting. All of our attention should be devoted to ensuring that children's experiences in day care are safe, enriching and rewarding.

I now turn to the amendments. Although I sympathise with the thinking behind them, they are not appropriate in this context. Amendment 1, which calls for improved training and support for providers, covers action that is already in hand with our childcare action plan, which will be published shortly. The Assembly Government has increased funding to early years development and childcare partnerships. They were allocated £2.4 million this year and they will receive £3.8 million next year. We will consult shortly on proposed regulations to place a duty on local authorities to provide training for childcare providers. This consultation will include the cost implications for such a duty. The Assembly Government is also discussing the training needs of the whole care workforce with Education and Learning Wales.

The appropriate time to discuss priorities for long-term funding, to which amendment 2 refers, is when we debate the Assembly budget, not when considering these regulations. To conclude, this is the first time that such a consistent approach to regulation has been possible in Wales. It will clearly signal to families and childcare providers what we, as an Assembly, mean by minimum standards and what will, in turn, drive up the quality of how our children are looked after.

Helen Mary Jones: I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 1: add a new point at the end of the motion:

notes that these regulations and national minimum standards must be underpinned by improved support and training for child minders and day-care service providers.

I propose amendment 2. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

plant wrth galon y safonau hyn ac na chaniateir smacio gan unrhyw warchodwr plant cofrestredig nac mewn unrhyw leoliad gofal dydd arall. Dylid rhoi ein sylw i gyd i sicrhau bod profiadau plant mewn gofal dydd yn ddiogel, llesol a buddiol.

Trof yn awr at y gwelliannau. Er fy mod yn cydymdeimlo â'r meddwl y tu ôl iddynt, nid ydynt yn briodol yn y cyd-destun hwn. Mae gwelliant 1, sy'n galw am well hyfforddiant a chefnogaeth i ddarparwyr, yn ymwneud â gweithredu sydd eisoes mewn llaw gyda'n cynllun gweithredu ar ofal plant, a gyhoeddir yn fuan. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cynyddu'r cyllid i bartneriaethau datblygiad blynyddoedd cynnar a gofal plant. Dyranwyd £2.4 miliwn iddynt eleni a chânt £3.8 miliwn y flwyddyn nesaf. Byddwn yn ymgynghori cyn hir ar reoliadau arfaethedig i osod dyletswydd ar awdurdodau lleol i ddarparu hyfforddiant i ddarparwyr gofal plant. Bydd yr ymgynghoriad hwn yn cynnwys goblygiadau cost dyletswydd o'r fath. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad hefyd yn trafod anghenion hyfforddiant y gweithlu gofal cyfan gyda Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru.

Yr amser priodol i drafod blaenoriaethau ar gyfer ariannu tymor hir, y mae gwelliant 2 yn cyfeirio atynt, yw pan drafodwn gyllideb y Cynulliad, nid pan fyddwn yn ystyried y rheoliadau hyn. I gloi, dyma'r tro cyntaf i agwedd mor gyson at reoleiddio fod yn bosibl yng Nghymru. Bydd yn rhoi arwydd clir i deuluoedd a darparwyr gofal plant beth a olygwn ni, fel Cynulliad, wrth safonau gofynnol a beth fydd, yn ei dro, yn gwella ansawdd y gofal a roddir i'n plant.

Helen Mary Jones: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 1: ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn nodi bod yn rhaid ategu'r rheoliadau a'r safonau gofynnol cenedlaethol hyn drwy roi gwell hyfforddiant a chefnogaeth i warchodwyr plant a darparwyr gwasanaethau gofal dydd.

Cynigiau welliant 2. Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

notes that substantial additional public funding will be required in the long term to ensure both the implementation of best practise in childcare and access to good quality childcare for economically disadvantaged families.

Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales welcomes these regulations. They have, of course, been discussed on several occasions during their preparation in the Health and Social Services Committee. The Minister for Health and Social Services's willingness to take a different and, I believe, more progressive path than that chosen by colleagues in Westminster is welcome. Personally, I particularly welcome the regulation prohibiting physical punishment in childcare settings, to which I will return in a moment. The grant, which the Minister has announced today, to enable child minders to set up, is also welcome as is the sensible approach to charging for inspection, which was a matter of concern to people within the sector.

I will turn briefly to the amendments. We are disappointed that the Minister will not support them, although, knowing her approach to this matter over many years, I accept what she said about the spirit of the amendments. We believe that training and support are vital issues; they should be highlighted in a full Plenary debate. I, and many parents here, have reason to be extremely grateful to the excellent childcare workers in Wales, but they are also among the most undervalued and underpaid staff in society. We will often pay a much lower rate for childcare than for the services of those who mend our cars. What does that say about our priorities as a society? We contend that we cannot expect childcare staff to meet the higher standards, rightly required of them, without support and training. Although we recognise that there is intention to provide it, we would like for that intention to be backed by full Plenary support.

On amendment 2, I accept what the Minister said about increased funding. However, it is important to have a focused debate on childcare and on the long-term future of this

yn nodi y bydd angen mwy o lawer o arian cyhoeddus yn y tymor hir er mwyn sicrhau bod yr arferion gorau ym maes gofal plant yn cael eu rhoi ar waith ac er mwyn sicrhau bod gofal plant o ansawdd da ar gael i deuluoedd sydd o dan anfantais economaidd.

Mae Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales yn croesawu'r rheoliadau hyn. Fe'u trafodwyd, wrth gwrs, ar sawl achlysur wrth eu paratoi yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Mae parodrwydd y Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i gymryd llwybr gwahanol ac, yn fy marn i, fwy blaengar na hwnnw a ddewiswyd gan gyd-aelodau yn San Steffan i'w groesawu. Yn bersonol, croesawaf yn arbennig y rheoliad sydd yn gwahardd cosbi corfforol mewn lleoliadau gofal plant, a dychwelaf at hynny mewn munud. Mae'r grant a gyhoeddodd y Gweinidog heddiw, i alluogi gwarchodwyr plant i ymsefydlu, i'w groesawu hefyd, a hefyd yr agwedd gall tuag at godi ffioedd am arolygu, a oedd yn destun pryder i bobl yn y sector.

Trof yn fyr at y gwelliannau. Yr ydym yn siomedig na wnaiff y Gweinidog eu cefnogi, er, o wybod am ei hagwedd hi at y mater hwn dros flynyddoedd lawer, derbynias yr hyn a ddywedodd ynghylch ysbryd y gwelliannau. Credwn fod hyfforddiant a chefnogaeth yn faterion hanfodol; dylid eu tanlinellu mewn dadl yn y Cynulliad llawn. Mae gennyf fi, a llawer o rieni yma, reswm i fod yn eithriadol o ddiolchgar i'r gweithwyr gofal plant ardderchog yng Nghymru, ond y maent hefyd ymhlith y staff a werthfawrogir leiaf ac y telir leiaf iddynt yn ein cymdeithas. Byddwn yn aml yn talu cyfradd lawer is am ofal plant nag a wnawn am wasanaethau'r sawl sy'n trwsio ein ceir. Beth mae hynny'n ei ddweud am ein blaenoriaethau fel cymdeithas? Dadlewn na allwn ddisgwyl i staff gofal plant gyrraedd y safonau uwch a fynnir ganddynt, yn ddigon teg, heb gefnogaeth a hyfforddiant. Er ein bod yn sylweddoli bod bwriad i'w darparu, hoffem i'r bwriad hwnnw gael ei gefnogi gan benderfyniad y Cynulliad Llawn.

Ar welliant 2, derbynias yr hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog am gynnydd yn y cyllid. Serch hynny, mae'n bwysig cael dadl ganolbwyntiol ar ofal plant ac ar ddyfodol y

issue in the context of these regulations, as well as pursuing it when we discuss the budget. The Government of Wales has indeed made extensive additional investment, and that is welcome. However, most of that money is initiative funding to kick-start new provision, and some of it is for under privileged communities. That is welcome. However, it is not the answer in the long term. As the Minister will know, good childcare facilities have been established in some of our more deprived communities, only to fail after the three-year support funding was withdrawn, because parents using that childcare simply were not, and never will be, able to meet the full commercial cost of childcare in the near future. If we are to ensure the highest quality childcare in poorer communities that need it most, and if we are to ensure that families who most need childcare are able to access it, then we will have to bite the bullet and consider the European model of funding childcare provision across the board. I realise that that is controversial and that the cost could be enormous but, if the Minister is not prepared to support the amendment today, I urge her to consider the need, in some cases, for long-term state funding of childcare provision.

I welcome the Government of Wales's progressive attitude to physical punishment. It must be good news that parents in Wales cannot tell child minders to hit their children, although parents in England will be allowed to continue to do so. I use the word 'hit' advisedly. Does the Minister share my hope that Westminster will follow her progressive example on this? I congratulate her for implementing it. However, while parents in Wales cannot instruct child minders to hit their children, they are still allowed to do so themselves. Does the Minister believe, as I do—and I only expect her to give a personal view given that it is not a devolved matter—that physical punishment could be made unlawful in a manner that does not unnecessarily demonise parents? Does she regret, as I do, that the Assembly lacks the power to make that decision, given the decision that, I hope, we will make in a few minutes? We would hopefully be prepared to

mater hwn yn y tymor hir yng nghyd-destun y rheoliadau hyn, yn ogystal â mynd ar ei ôl pan drafodwn y gyllideb. Mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn wir wedi gwneud buddsoddiad ychwanegol helaeth, a chroesewir hynny. Ond arian cychwyn yw'r rhan fwyaf o'r arian hynny i roi hwb cychwynol i ddarpariaeth newydd, ac mae rhywfaint ohono ar gyfer cymunedau difreintiedig. Croesewir hynny. Fodd bynnag, nid dyna'r ateb yn y tymor hir. Fel y gŵyr y Gweinidog, sefydlwyd cyfleusterau gofal plant yn rhai o'n cymunedau mwy difreintiedig o'r blaen, dim ond iddynt fethu wedi i'r cyllid cefnogi tair blynedd gael ei dynnu'n ôl, oherwydd yn syml nad oedd y rhieni a ddefnyddiai'r gofal plant hwnnw, ac na fyddant byth, yn abl i dalu cost fasnachol lawn gofal plant yn y dyfodol agos. Os ydym am sicrhau gofal plant o'r ansawdd gorau yn y cymunedau tlotaf sydd ei angen fwyaf, ac os ydym am sicrhau bod teuluoedd sydd â'r angen mwyaf am ofal plant yn gallu ei gael, bydd yn rhaid inni fynd amdani ac ystyried y model Ewropeaidd o dalu am ddarpariaeth gofal plant ar draws y bwrdd. Sylweddolaf fod hynny'n ddadleuol ac y gallai'r gost fod yn enfawr ond, os nad yw'r Gweinidog yn barod i gefnogi'r gwelliant heddiw, fe'i hanogaf i ystyried yr angen, mewn rhai achosion, am ariannu darpariaeth gofal plant dros dymor hir gan y wladwriaeth.

Yr wyf yn croesawu agwedd flaengar Llywodraeth Cymru tuag at gosb gorfforol. Rhaid mai newyddion da yw na all rhieni yng Nghymru ddweud wrth warchodwyr am daro'u plant, er y bydd rhieni yn Lloegr yn parhau i allu gwneud hynny. Defnyddiaf y gair 'taro' yn fwriadol. A ydyw'r Gweinidog yn rhannu fy ngobaith y bydd San Steffan yn dilyn ei hesiampl flaengar yn hyn o beth? Yr wyf yn ei llongyfarch am weithredu hyn. Fodd bynnag, er na all rhieni yng Nghymru ddweud wrth warchodwyr am daro'u plant, maent yn gallu gwneud hynny eu hunain. A ydyw'r Gweinidog yn credu, fel y credaf fi—ac nid wyf ond yn disgwyl iddi roi barn bersonol gan nad yw hyn yn fater a ddatganolwyd—y gellid anghyfreithloni cosbi corfforol mewn modd nad yw'n demoneiddio rhieni'n ddiangen? A ydyw hi'n gresynu, fel y gwnaf fi, nad oes gan y Cynulliad y grym i wneud y penderfyniad hwnnw, yn wyneb y penderfyniad a wnawn,

take a progressive line on the abuse of children, as we take a progressive line on the domestic abuse of women. Will she support me in calling on the Government of Wales to reconsider the issue? I urge the Assembly to support the amendments and the motion.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I remind Members that the next item, which is legislation associated with this debate, will be addressed under Standing Order No. 22.25, and therefore will not be subject to a debate. If Members wish to debate anything pertaining to that, they may so do in this debate.

Christine Chapman: I welcome these new regulations that explicitly ban the use or threat of physical punishment against children cared for by child minders in Wales. We know that many organisations are watching this debate closely. They support these regulations and see them as a positive step towards giving babies and toddlers the same protection from physical punishment as they enjoy in the school setting. We are one step ahead of England on this and I look forward to it following suit.

However, there is a need to go further, as outlined in my recent short debate, entitled 'Hitting People is Wrong and Children are People Too'. I know that some Members attended that debate, and I was pleased to see cross-party support for it. We should seek to remove the legal defence of reasonable chastisement to give children full protection from physical punishment in any circumstances, including the home. However, we should also ensure that legislation encompasses public awareness and support for parents to find and accept alternative non-violent methods. There are already many good working examples of this in Wales, for which there is a need. Recently, I was extremely distressed and shocked to see a photograph of a six-week-old baby who had been slapped by her mother because she thought that the baby needed to learn how to behave properly, even at that age. Parents need support and a clear lead from the Assembly and elsewhere. I agree with Helen Mary; this is not about demonising parents

gobeithio, ymhen munud neu ddau? Byddem, gobeithio, yn barod i fod yn flaengar ar fater cam-drin plant, fel yr ydym yn flaengar ar gam-drin menywod yn y cartref. A wnaiff hi gefnogi fy ngalwad ar i Lywodraeth Cymru ailystyried y mater? Anogaf y Cynulliad i gefnogi'r gwelliannau a'r cynnig.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Atgoffaf yr Aelodau yr ymdrinnir â'r eitem nesaf, sef deddfwriaeth gysylltiedig â'r ddadl hon, dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25, ac felly na fydd yn destun dadl. Os dymuna Aelodau drafod unrhyw beth perthnasol i hynny, cânt wneud hynny yn ystod y ddadl hon.

Christine Chapman: Croesawaf y rheoliadau newydd hyn sy'n gwahardd yn benodol ddefnyddio neu fygwth cosb gorfforol yn erbyn plant y gofelir amdanynt gan warchodwyr yng Nghymru. Gwyddom fod llawer o gyrff yn gwyllo'r ddadl hon yn fanwl. Maent yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn ac yn eu gweld fel cam cadarnhaol tuag at roi i fabanod a phlant bach yr un warchodaeth rhag cosb gorfforol ag a gânt yn yr ysgol. Yr ydym un cam ar y blaen i Loegr ar hyn ac edrychaf ymlaen at weld y wlad honno'n dilyn ein hesiampl.

Fodd bynnag, mae angen mynd ymhellach, fel yr amlinellais yn fy nadl fer ddiweddar, dan y pennawd 'Nid yw Curo Pobl yn Iawn ac mae Plant yn Bobl Hefyd'. Gwn i rai Aelodau fynychu'r ddadl honno, ac yr oeddwn yn falch o weld cefnogaeth ar draws y pleidiau iddi. Dylem geisio dileu amddiffyniad cyfreithiol cystwyo rhesymol i roi gwarchodaeth lawn i blant rhag cosb gorfforol ym mhob sefyllfa, gan gynnwys gartref. Ond dylem sicrhau hefyd y bydd unrhyw ddeddfwriaeth yn cynnwys codi ymwybyddiaeth y cyhoedd a chefnogi rhieni i ganfod a derbyn dulliau eraill di-drais. Mae sawl enghraifft weithiol dda o hyn eisoes yng Nghymru, ac mae eu hangen. Yn ddiweddar, cefais ysgytwad a braw mawr o weld llun o faban chwe wythnos oed a gawsai glusten gan ei mam am fod honno'n meddwl bod angen i'r baban ddysgu sut i ymddwyn yn iawn, hyd yn oed mor ifanc â hynny. Mae ar rieni angen cefnogaeth ac arweiniad clir gan y Cynulliad ac eraill. Cytunaf â Helen Mary; nid mater o ddemoneiddio rhieni yw hyn, ond

but about giving them support.

It is also about human rights—the child’s rights. The UK Government has signed the UN convention on the rights of the child, which clearly states that children have a right not to be hit. I also remind Members that the UK is now out of step with many other countries. Eleven countries have banned hitting children. Sweden is a good example. It abolished corporal punishment over 20 years ago, and contrary to concerns about a rise in the prosecution of parents who hit children, that was not the case. Public attitudes are now shifting.

UK opinion polls conducted a few weeks ago showed that the majority of parents would favour a ban if they felt that they would not be prosecuted for so-called trivial offences. Again recent polls have shown that almost all children disagree with the physical punishment of children. Hitting is not an effective punishment—it does not work. A great deal of research bears that fact out. It can be physically and emotionally damaging. It sends a message to children that violence is acceptable. Is it acceptable in twenty-first century Wales?

3:20 p.m.

There is a growing campaign to ban the physical punishment of children. I recently visited Westminster with the Children are Unbeatable Alliance, and I was pleased that six Welsh Members of Parliament have already joined the campaign. Although I welcome today’s regulations, I hope that they will provide a building block for further development.

David Melding: The Welsh Conservative Party welcomes the regulations before us. They relate to care settings and the care workforce. I realise that the previous speaker feels deeply about these issues, but I am not sure that it is terribly helpful to confuse the rights of parents and the use of parental discipline with this subject. I agree with her comments in principle, but this debate is about the social care workforce, particularly the section that delivers care to children

rhoi cefnogaeth iddynt.

Mae a wnelo hyn hefyd â hawliau dynol—hawliau’r plentyn. Mae Llywodraeth y DU wedi llofnodi cytundeb y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar hawliau’r plentyn, sy’n datgan yn glir fod gan blant hawl i beidio â chael eu taro. Atgoffaf yr Aelodau hefyd fod y DU bellach yn wahanol i lawer o wledydd eraill. Mae 11 o wledydd wedi gwahardd taro plant. Mae Sweden yn enghraifft dda. Gwaharddwyd cosbi corfforol yn y wlad honno dros 20 mlynedd yn ôl, ac yn groes i bryderon y byddai mwy o erlyn rhieni am daro’u plant, nid felly y bu. Mae agweddau’r cyhoedd yn symud yn awr.

Dangosodd polau piniwn a gynhaliwyd yn y DU ychydig o wythnosau’n ôl y byddai’r rhan fwyaf o rieni o blaid gwaharddiad pe teimlent na chaent eu herlyn am yr hyn a elwid yn droseddau dibwys. Eto, dangosodd polau diweddar fod plant bron i gyd yn anghytuno â chosbi plant yn gorfforol. Nid yw taro’n gosb effeithiol—nid yw’n gweithio. Mae llawer iawn o ymchwil yn cadarnhau’r ffaith honno. Gall fod yn gorfforol ac emosiynol niweidiol. Mae’n anfon neges i blant fod trais yn dderbyniol. A ydyw’n dderbyniol yng Nghymru’r unfed ganrif ar hugain?

Mae ymgyrch cynyddol i wahardd cosbi plant yn gorfforol. Yn ddiweddar euthum i San Steffan gyda’r Gynghrair ‘Sdim Curo ar Blant, ac yr oeddwn yn falch bod chwe Aelod Seneddol Cymreig eisoes wedi ymuno â’r ymgyrch. Er fy mod yn croesawu rheoliadau heddiw, gobeithiaf y byddant yn sylfaen i ddatblygiad pellach.

David Melding: Mae Plaid Geidwadol Cymru yn croesawu’r rheoliadau ger ein bron. Maent yn ymwneud â lleoliadau gofal a’r gweithlu gofal. Sylweddolaf fod y siaradwr diwethaf yn teimlo’n ddwys am y materion hyn, ond nid wyf yn siŵr ei bod yn ofnadwy o ddefnyddiol cymysgu’r pwnc hwn â hawliau rhieni a’u defnydd o ddisgyblaeth. Cytunaf â’i sylwadau mewn egwyddor, ond dadl yw hon am y gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol, yn enwedig yr adran sy’n

under eight. We should focus on that.

We need minimum national standards. It is important that we have a different way of regulating these in Wales, which will be more integrated and coherent and easier to monitor and inspect. I congratulate the Minister on proposing a slightly different route to the one that will be used in England. It is vital to have a well-trained and professional workforce. It is appropriate to list in the regulations what care workers and those who are looking after children cannot do. We should remember that we want a highly trained workforce that is so professional it will automatically behave in the child's best interest and to the highest possible standards.

This sector has been under-regulated and ignored in the past, yet all the evidence suggests that more parents will be reliant on care services for younger children. That is part of what happens in the workforce, encouraging people to work as much as possible and have a source of income. It is important that parents who want to return to work and contribute towards the economy can be sure that they will have appropriate care for their children. In all of this, the guiding light for us is putting child protection first. What happens to children in the early years of their development is profoundly important. It has a magnifying effect throughout later life and into adult life. Happy and wholesome experiences at a young age will give that child confidence and encourage its development.

I turn to physical punishment specifically in terms of care or school settings. It would be perverse for us to say this afternoon that physical punishment is rightly banned from all schools and that children over five in the state sector cannot be physically punished, even though young children in playgroups, or whatever care setting, can. Clearly, that is not coherent and we must end the use of corporal punishment in all care and educational settings. I strongly support that principle.

Kirsty Williams: I welcome these standards

darparu gofal i blant dan wyth. Dylem ganolbwyntio ar hynny.

Mae angen safonau cenedlaethol gofynnol arnom. Mae'n bwysig bod gennym ffordd wahanol o reoleiddio'r rhain yng Nghymru, a fydd yn fwy integredig a chydlynol ac yn haws ei monitro a'i harolygu. Yr wyf yn llongyfarch y Gweinidog am gynnig ffordd ychydig yn wahanol i'r un a ddefnyddir yn Lloegr. Mae'n hollbwysig bod y gweithlu'n broffesiynol ac wedi'i hyfforddi'n dda. Mae'n briodol rhestru yn y rheoliadau beth na all gweithwyr gofal a'r rhai sy'n gofalu am blant ei wneud. Dylem gofio bod arnom eisiau gweithlu wedi'i hyfforddi'n dda, sydd mor broffesiynol fel y bydd yn otomatig yn ymddwyn er budd gorau'r plentyn ac i'r safonau uchaf posibl.

Cafodd y sector hwn ei dan-reoleiddio a'i anwybyddu yn y gorffennol, eto mae'r holl dystiolaeth yn awgrymu y bydd mwy o rieni'n dibynnu ar wasanaethau gofal i blant iau. Mae hynny'n rhan o'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn y gweithlu, sef annog pobl i weithio cymaint ag sy'n bosibl a bod â ffynhonnell incwm. Mae'n bwysig i rieni sy'n dymuno dychwelyd i'r gwaith a chyfrannu tuag at yr economi allu bod yn siŵr y bydd ganddynt ofal priodol i'w plant. Yn hyn i gyd, y golau sy'n ein harwain yw ein bod yn rhoi diogelwch plant yn gyntaf. Mae'r hyn sy'n digwydd i blant ym mlynnyddoedd cynnar eu datblygiad yn aruthrol o bwysig. Caiff effaith chwyddhaol drwy gydol bywyd wedyn ac i fywyd fel oedolyn. Bydd profiadau hapus ac iach yn blentyn ifanc yn rhoi hyder i'r plentyn hwnnw ac yn hybu ei ddatblygiad.

Trof at gosb gorfforol yn benodol mewn lleoliadau gofal neu mewn ysgolion. Gwrthuni ar ein rhan fyddai dweud y prynhawn yma fod cosbi corfforol wedi'i wahardd yn gyfiawn o bob ysgol ac na cheir cosbi plant dros bump yn sector y wladwriaeth yn gorfforol, er y gellir cosbi plant ifanc mewn grwpiau chwarae, neu ba lleoliad gofal bynnag. Yn amlwg, nid yw hynny'n gydlynol a rhaid inni roi terfyn ar ddefnyddio cosb gorfforol ym mhob lleoliad gofal ac addysgol. Cefnogaf yr egwyddor honno'n gryf.

Kirsty Williams: Croesawaf y safonau hyn

on behalf of the Liberal Democrats. We have consistently supported the implementation of the Care Standards Act 2000. Childcare can be a complex and fraught issue, as I know personally. Knowing that your child is being cared for in a safe environment is crucial for parents and carers. I welcome the implementation of all-Wales standards and the administration's realisation that the new regulatory framework needs to be devised in a way that is similar to current regimes to avoid unnecessary confusion for providers who are already in the sector. Emphasis on staff development and training is also welcome as is the common-sense approach that will be applied to the implementation of challenging targets for qualification.

Start-up grants for child minders are welcome. I congratulate you, Minister. I wrote to you a year ago on this matter, and am delighted that you have taken this forward. However, I am concerned that there is still much to be done to encourage people to enter this sector to provide the numerous childcare places that society needs. It is of great concern to me, as chairman of the Objective 3 programme monitoring committee, that priority 5, which is designed to break down the barriers that prevent people from entering the workforce, is one of the priorities and measures for which there is severe under-bidding under Objective 3 proposals. I welcome the move on behalf of the commission to broaden the parameters of this priority to allow the providers of childcare to establish child minding schemes. However, we still have a long way to go to ensure that the necessary number of childcare places are available throughout Wales.

I concur with Helen Mary Jones and Christine Chapman's remarks on corporal punishment. Part 3, paragraph 9 of the regulations is particularly welcome, as are the regulations that spell out what is expected on behalf of a childcare establishment with regard to reporting complaints. Those of you who follow events in mid Wales will be all too aware of the disturbing recent case regarding the closing down of a childcare establishment and the subsequent trial. What emerged from that was the need for clear standards of what is expected of childcare providers, and rules to follow in case of a

ar ran y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Yr ydym yn gyson wedi cefnogi gweithrediad Deddf Safonau Gofal 2000. Gall gofal plant fod yn bwnc cymhleth a dyrys, fel y gwn i'n bersonol. Mae gwybod bod eich plentyn yn cael gofal mewn sefyllfa diogel yn hollbwysig i rieni a gofalwyr. Croesawaf y ffaith bod safonau i Gymru gyfan yn cael eu gweithredu a bod y weinyddiaeth yn sylweddoli bod angen dyfeisio'r fframwaith rheoleiddiol newydd mewn modd sy'n debyg i systemau cyfredol er mwyn osgoi dryswch diangen i ddarparwyr sydd eisoes yn y sector. Mae'r pwyslais ar ddatblygu a hyfforddi staff i'w groesawu hefyd, a hefyd yr agwedd synnwyr-cyffredin a gymerir wrth bennu targedau heriol o ran cymwysterau.

Croesewir grantiau cychwyn i warchodwyr plant. Yr wyf yn eich llongyfarch, Weinidog. Ysgrifennais atoch flwyddyn yn ôl ar y mater hwn, ac yr wyf wrth fy modd eich bod wedi mynd â hyn ymlaen. Er hynny, yr wyf yn bryderus bod llawer i'w wneud o hyd i annog pobl i ddod i mewn i'r sector hwn i ddarparu'r lleoedd gofal plant niferus y mae eu hangen ar gymdeithas. Mae'n destun pryder mawr i mi, fel cadeirydd pwyllgor monitro rhaglen Amcan 3, fod blaenoriaeth 5, a'i bwriad yw cael gwared â'r anawsterau sy'n rhwystro pobl rhag ymuno â'r gweithlu, ymhlith y blaenoriaethau y bu diffyg dybryd o geisiadau amdanynt dan gynigion Amcan 3. Croesawaf y symudiad ar ran y comisiwn i ehangu paramedrau'r flaenoriaeth hon i ganiatáu i ddarparwyr gofal plant sefydlu cynlluniau gwarchod plant. Fodd bynnag, mae gennym ffordd bell i fynd o hyd i sicrhau bod y nifer angenrheidiol o lefydd gofal plant ar gael ledled Cymru.

Yr wyf yn cytuno â sylwadau Helen Mary Jones a Christine Chapman ynghylch cosbi corfforol. Mae Rhan 3, paragraff 9 y rheoliadau i'w groesawu'n arbennig, a hefyd y rheoliadau sy'n egluro'r hyn a ddisgwylir ar ran sefydliad gofal plant o ran adrodd am gwynion. Bydd y rhai ohonoch sy'n dilyn digwyddiadau yn y Canolbarth yn gwybod yn rhy dda am yr achos annymunol diweddar ynghylch cau sefydliad gofal plant a'r achos llys wedyn. Amlygodd hynny yr angen am safonau clir ynghylch yr hyn a ddisgwylir gan ddarparwyr gofal plant, a rheolau i'w dilyn os ceir cwyn.

complaint.

I turn to part 4, paragraph 12 of these regulations, which deals with police checks. It is right that persons employed in this field should be subject to police checks. However, I have grave concerns regarding the administration of these checks. The Criminal Records Bureau is already behind schedule in taking up its responsibilities in this area, and there are real concerns that the delays already experienced in getting police checks will become worse when the bureau takes over these responsibilities. Delays in obtaining police checks can pose real problems for employees. There are examples of people who have offered an individual a job and have had to wait up to 6 months before they have clearance from the police that that person is suitable to work with children. We cannot expect people to wait for six months before they can take up employment. This affects not only childcare providers but also people who care for children in residential, respite and educational settings. The Amy Gehring case threw up the issue of ensuring that appropriate checks are made. I would be grateful to hear your views, Minister, on how, in ensuring that we comply with part 4, paragraph 12 of the regulations, police checks are carried out speedily.

Pauline Jarman: I declare an interest as a member of Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough Council. I welcome the regulations covering the suitability of registered persons for the purpose of childcare, together with those relating to the promotion of welfare and other arrangements for the protection of children. Like other Members, I welcome the fact that the regulations will mean that corporal punishment can neither be used nor threatened against children while in the care of a registered person.

I will further develop the arguments in favour of amendments 1 and 2, and their relevance insofar as the application of these regulations is concerned. As far as the social economy of Wales is concerned, and the funding and availability of quality childcare throughout the nation, this should be addressed as a matter of urgency if we are to maximise

Trof at ran 4, paragraff 12 y rheoliadau hyn, sy'n ymdrin ag archwiliadau gan yr heddlu. Mae'n briodol y dylai pobl a gyflogir yn y maes hwn gael eu harchwilio gan yr heddlu. Fodd bynnag, mae gennyf bryderon difrifol ynghylch sut y gweinyddir yr archwiliadau hyn. Mae'r Swyddfa Cofnodion Troseddol eisoes ar ei hôl hi yn ymgymryd â'i gyfrifoldebau yn hyn o beth, ac mae gwir bryderon y bydd yr oedi a gafwyd eisoes wrth gael archwiliadau heddlu yn mynd yn waeth pan ymgymera'r swyddfa â'r cyfrifoldebau hyn. Gall oedi cyn cael archwiliad heddlu fod yn broblem wirioneddol i weithwyr. Ceir enghreifftiau o bobl a gynigiodd swydd i unigolyn ac wedyn bu'n rhaid aros hyd at chwe mis cyn cael gair gan yr heddlu'n clirio'r person hwnnw i weithio gyda phlant. Ni allwn ddisgwyl i bobl aros am chwe mis cyn y gallant ddechrau gweithio mewn swydd. Mae hyn yn effeithio nid yn unig ar ddarparwyr gofal plant ond hefyd ar bobl sydd yn gofalu am blant mewn lleoliadau preswyl, seibiant ac addysgol. Amlygodd achos Amy Gehring yr angen i sicrhau y gwneir yr archwiliadau priodol. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar cael clywed eich barn, Weinidog, ynghylch sut, wrth sicrhau ein bod yn cydymffurfio â rhan 4, paragraff 12 y rheoliadau, y gwneir archwiliadau heddlu yn gyflym.

Pauline Jarman: Yr wyf yn datgan buddiant fel aelod o Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf. Croesawaf y rheoliadau ynglŷn ag addasrwydd pobl gofrestredig i bwrpas gofal plant, ynghyd â'r rhai sy'n ymwneud â hyrwyddo lles a threfniadau eraill ar gyfer diogelu plant. Fel Aelodau eraill, croesawaf y ffaith y bydd y rheoliadau'n golygu na ellir defnyddio na bygwth cosb gorfforol yn erbyn plant tra bônt yng ngofal person cofrestredig.

Yr wyf am ddatblygu ymhellach y dadleuon o blaid gwelliannau 1 a 2, a'u perthnasedd o ran defnyddio'r rheoliadau hyn. O safbwynt economi cymdeithasol Cymru, a'r angen i sicrhau a thalu am ofal plant o ansawdd da drwy'r wlad i gyd, dylid mynd i'r afael â hyn ar fyrder os ydym am wneud y gorau o'n buddsoddiad mewn addysg, hyfforddiant a

investment in education, training and economic development, especially in areas of deprivation and isolation. We all accept that childcare provision is not only underdeveloped in most parts of Wales, but also that where it is available, it is generally expensive. Subsidised childcare places enabling access to employment or learning are almost non-existent in some parts of Wales. Socially excluded groups, such as teenage parents and women in disadvantaged communities, need to be targeted. More affordable or free childcare will encourage more women into learning and employment.

3:30 p.m.

Taking childcare into vulnerable communities, simultaneously with learning opportunities, will remove many of the social and geographical barriers to learning opportunities for the parent and the child. Young children of adult learners, and those who return to education, need to be provided with high quality provision that will enhance their life changes. Many children of disadvantaged parents should be given equal access to early years' settings, and therefore contributing to the eradication of child poverty and cycles of disadvantage. The cost of childcare stops many women in Wales from attaining qualifications, skills and employment. Some barriers to provision of childcare need to be addressed. In many cases, the provision needs to be on a small scale, and based on local, community-run initiatives linked with informal and formal outreach learning initiatives. Childcare training opportunities need to be delivered in disadvantaged local communities. We need to sponsor or assist childcare places for women accessing adult learning opportunities and we also need to increase the availability of affordable, good-quality childcare for working parents. These services need to be available through the medium of Welsh and English. The nation needs an ambitious, innovative neighbourhood childcare strategy. I am aware of such a project in my local authority area. It is a £2.5 million, three-year programme developed by the early years partnership to deliver many initiatives that are desperately needed to deliver quality childcare. However, that is unique in Wales. I

datblygu economaidd, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig ac anghysbell. Derbyniwn i gyd nid yn unig fod darpariaeth gofal plant heb ei datblygu'n llawn yn y rhan fwyaf o Gymru, ond hefyd, lle mae ar gael, ei bod ar y cyfan yn ddrud. Mae lleoedd gofal plant wedi'u sybsideiddio, sydd yn galluogi mynediad at gyflogaeth neu addysg, bron yn gwbl absennol mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru. Mae angen targedu grwpiau sydd wedi'u dieithrio'n gymdeithasol, fel rhieni yn eu harddegau a menywod mewn cymunedau difreintiedig. Bydd gofal plant rhatach neu am ddim yn annog mwy o fenywod i fyd dysgu a gwaith.

Wrth fynd â gofal plant i mewn i gymunedau bregus, ochr yn ochr â chyfleoedd dysgu, chwelir llawer o'r rhwystrau cymdeithasol a daearyddol rhag i'r rhiant a'r plentyn gael cyfleoedd dysgu. Mae angen i blant ifanc oedolion sy'n dysgu neu sy'n dychwelyd i fyd addysg, gael darpariaeth o ansawdd da a fydd yn gwella'u cyfleoedd mewn bywyd. Dylai llawer o blant i rieni difreintiedig gael mynediad cyfartal i leoliadau blynyddoedd cynnar, gan gyfrannu drwy hynny at ddileu tloedi plant a chylchoedd anfantais. Mae cost gofal plant yn rhwystro llawer o fenywod yng Nghymru rhag ennill cymwysterau, sgiliau a gwaith. Mae angen mynd i'r afael â rhai rhwystrau i ddarparu gofal plant. Mewn amryw o achosion, mae angen i'r ddarpariaeth fod ar raddfa fach, ac ar sail mentrau lleol, wedi'u rhedeg gan y gymuned, ynghlwm wrth fentrau dysgu anffurfiol a ffurfiol yn y gymuned. Mae angen sicrhau cyfleoedd hyfforddiant gofal plant mewn cymunedau lleol difreintiedig. Mae angen inni noddi neu gynorthwyo lleoedd gofal plant i fenywod sy'n manteisio ar gyfleoedd addysg oedolion ac mae angen hefyd inni sicrhau bod mwy o ofal plant o ansawdd da, y gellir ei fforddio, ar gael i rieni sy'n gweithio. Mae angen i'r gwasanaethau hyn fod ar gael drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg a'r Saesneg. Mae ar y genedl angen strategaeth gofal plant cymdogol uchelgeisiol, arloesol. Gwn am brosiect o'r fath yn ardal fy awdurdod lleol i. Mae'n rhaglen £2.5 miliwn, tair blynedd a ddatblygwyd gan y bartneriaeth blynyddoedd cynnar i weithredu sawl cynllun y mae dirfawr angen amdanynt i sicrhau gofal plant

wholeheartedly support the regulations that the Minister has placed before us today.

Karen Sinclair: I welcome the regulations for childcare minimum standards. However, I am concerned about the rigid format of the regulations for child minders in their own homes. So that we do not intimidate or frighten child minders with paper work, could we ensure that registration staff help child minders meet the criteria in a supportive and sympathetic manner? Otherwise, I fear that we could lose child minders for bureaucratic reasons. In rural parts of my constituency, child minders are the main providers of childcare.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): Thank you for that positive debate. I, like you, consider childcare—which includes child minders, out-of-school clubs, day nurseries, playgroups, cylchoedd meithrin and open access play areas—to be a key part of the Assembly Government's programme to support children. That includes all the children in Wales, as Helen Mary, Pauline, Christine and Karen have said, and particularly those who are most disadvantaged. That is why we have announced that our financial support to childcare is delivered within that unified grant. I am sure that local authorities will make full use of it because they back the unified grant, which includes Childcare, Sure Start and the children and youth partnership fund. We are dramatically increasing the resources for childcare this year and the next—

Brian Hancock: Have you had discussions with your colleague, the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, because there is concern that single parents, in particular, cannot work full time, cannot get full benefits, and child minding services are not available to them. If they look after their children full time, they cannot receive education? If they attend evening classes, they need childcare. If they earn too much money, they lose their education and then they miss out on lifelong learning. Have you

o safon. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny'n unigryw yng Nghymru. Cefnogaf yn llwyr y rheoliadau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u gosod ger ein bron heddiw.

Karen Sinclair: Croesawaf y rheoliadau ar gyfer safonau gofynnol o ran gofal plant. Er hynny, yr wyf yn bryderus ynghylch ffurf anhyblyg y rheoliadau ar gyfer gwarchodwyr plant yn eu cartrefi eu hunain. Er mwyn peidio â gorlethu na dychryn gwarchodwyr gyda gwaith papur, a allem ni sicrhau bod staff cofrestru'n helpu'r gwarchodwyr i fodloni'r meini prawf mewn modd cefnogol a chydymdeimladol? Fel arall, ofnaf y gallem golli gwarchodwyr am resymau biwrocraidd. Yn y rhannau gwledig o'm hetholaeth i, gwarchodwyr yw prif ddarparwyr gofal plant.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Diolch ichi am y ddadl gadarnhaol honno. Yr wyf fi, fel chi, o'r farn bod gofal plant—a hynny'n cynnwys gwarchodwyr, clybiau allan-o'r-ysgol, meithrinfeydd dydd, grwpiau chwarae, cylchoedd meithrin a mannau chwarae mynediad agored—yn rhan allweddol o raglen Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i gynnal plant. Mae hynny'n cynnwys holl blant Cymru, fel y dywedodd Helen Mary, Pauline, Christine a Karen, ac yn enwedig y rhai sy'n fwyaf difreintiedig. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi cyhoeddi y rhoddir ein cymorth ariannol i ofal plant o fewn y grant unedig hwnnw. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnaiff awdurdodau lleol ddefnydd llawn ohono, oherwydd eu bod yn cefnogi'r grant unedig, sy'n cynnwys Gofal Plant, Cychwyn Cadarn a chronfa'r bartneriaeth plant ac ieuentid. Yr ydym yn cynyddu'n ddramatig yr adnoddau ar gyfer gofal plant eleni a'r flwyddyn—

Brian Hancock: A ydych wedi trafod â'ch cyd-aelod, y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, oherwydd bod pryder fod rhieni senl, yn enwedig, yn methu gweithio'n llawn-amser, yn methu cael buddaliadau llawn, ac nad yw gwasanaethau gwarchod plant ar gael iddynt? Os edrychant ar ôl eu plant yn llawn-amser, ni allant gael addysg. Os mynychant ddosbarthiadau nos, bydd arnynt angen gofal plant. Os enilliant ormod o arian, fe gollant eu haddysg a cholli allan wedyn ar addysg gydol oes. A gawsoch

had any discussions to consider this in more detail?

Jane Hutt: That is part of the childcare action plan, which we debated before Christmas and which we will debate again in May. The childcare action plan takes on board the social, educational and lifelong learning opportunities and considers them from the child's perspective. It also considers the abilities and opportunities of communities and parents. We must recognise that this issue is about childcare. We are talking about regulations today, Brian.

I want to return to comment on points that Assembly Members have made. As David said, child protection and quality of care are of prime importance. If we fund new childcare provision, we must ensure that children are being cared for in a protective environment that meets national minimum standards. That is why the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales, which is coming into force in the next week or so, will be so important in ensuring that we have that consistency.

Helen Mary, I welcome your positive comments on the regulations and the important role that they will play. I have already responded to your amendments in terms of our developments on training and improving the funding for the early years and childcare partnerships. They are taking issues forward across Wales. Kirsty's point about using the European funding stream is also being addressed in our childcare action plan. We have time to drive that forward, and I look forward to Members' support when it is debated.

Through the new opportunities fund we have created over 11,000 new out-of-school childcare places in Wales, and we have amended the guidance in relation to that fund to ensure that it can support those communities that need longer-term sustainability. David made the point that it is also vital that we have a professional and well-trained workforce.

Many Members have addressed my decision to outlaw smacking in day-care settings. It is important that the Assembly returns to that

unrhyw drafodaethau i ystyried hyn yn fanylach?

Jane Hutt: Mae hynny'n rhan o'r cynllun gweithredu ar ofal plant, y cawsom ddadl arno cyn y Nadolig ac a fydd yn destun dadl eto ym mis Mai. Mae'r cynllun gweithredu gofal plant yn cwmpasu'r cyfleoedd cymdeithasol, addysgol a dysgu gydol oes ac yn eu hystyried o safbwynt y plentyn. Mae'n ystyried hefyd galluoedd a chyfleoedd cymunedau a rhieni. Rhaid inni gydnabod mai mater yn ymwneud â gofal plant yw hyn. Yr ydym yn sôn am reoliadau heddiw, Brian.

Hoffwn ddod yn ôl i roi sylwadau ar bwyntiau a wnaeth Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Fel y dywedodd David, mae diogelu plant ac ansawdd gofal o'r pwysigrwydd mwyaf. Os am dalu am ddarpariaeth gofal plant newydd, rhaid inni sicrhau y gofelir am blant mewn amgylchedd gwarchodol sy'n cyrraedd safonau gofynnol cenedlaethol. Dyna pam y bydd Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru, a ddaw i rym o fewn yr wythnos neu ddwy nesaf, mor bwysig er mwyn sicrhau'r cysondeb hwnnw.

Helen Mary, croesawaf eich sylwadau cadarnhaol am y rheoliadau a'r rôl bwysig a chwaraeant. Yr wyf eisoes wedi ymateb i'ch gwelliannau o ran ein datblygiadau ar hyfforddiant a gwella'r cyllid i'r partneriaethau blynyddoedd cynnar a gofal plant. Maent yn symud pethau ymlaen ledled Cymru. Mae pwynt Kirsty ynghylch defnyddio'r ffrwd nawdd Ewropeaidd hefyd yn cael sylw yn ein cynllun gweithredu gofal plant. Mae gennym amser i yrru hynny yn ei flaen, ac edrychaf ymlaen at gael cefnogaeth yr Aelodau pan gawn ddadl arno.

Drwy'r gronfa cyfleoedd newydd yr ydym wedi creu dros 11,000 o leoedd gofal plant newydd y tu allan i'r ysgol yng Nghymru, ac yr ydym wedi newid canllawiau'r gronfa honno i sicrhau y gall gefnogi'r cymunedau hynny sydd angen cynaliadwyedd dros dymor hwy. Gwnaeth David y pwynt ei bod yn hanfodol hefyd inni fod â gweithlu proffesiynol sydd wedi'i hyfforddi'n dda.

Mae llawer o Aelodau wedi cyfeirio at fy mhenderfyniad i anghyfreithloni taro plant mewn lleoliadau gofal dydd. Mae'n bwysig

issue because concerns have deepened following Christine Chapman's short debate on protecting children from physical punishment. I have met with representatives of the Children are Unbeatable campaign and I think that Assembly Members need to be briefed further on this. I made my personal views clear in that short debate that we must move forward with positive parenting, to enable parents in Wales to see the alternatives to physical punishment. We are now investing, through Children in Wales, in a positive parenting plan, working with the national parenting and family foundation in England. Therefore, we are taking this forward because of the concerns expressed. Members will recall that we probably did not make the most of the opportunity when we were consulted on this issue some two or three years ago. We need to take it forward. You are right to say, David, that we need to consider more carefully all contexts and settings where care is offered outside of parental care and care in the home.

Kirsty made an important point about police checks and the fact that the Criminal Records Bureau is being established and will implement those checks more quickly. However, the regulations make provision for staff to start work in advance of the completion of checks, provided that they are not left in unsupervised contact with children. That is key until the Criminal Records Bureau is running as it should do.

Karen, you talked about the importance of encouraging child minders and asked whether they would see the regulations as being a burden on them. That is why I have removed regulatory fees and why we have a £300 start-up grant for child minders. We need to turn that around. Child minding is a source of employment, particularly for women, and we must ensure that they are supported through our early years and childcare partnerships and that they are not isolated but rather supported through the National Childminding Association. The Assembly has given its backing to the association, as the national body taking forward childminding. It has struggled for development support for many years in all our communities, particularly in

i'r Cynulliad ddod yn ôl at hyn oherwydd mae pryderon wedi dwysáu ers dadl fer Christine Chapman ar ddiogelu plant rhag cosb gorfforol. Yr wyf wedi cwrdd â chynrychiolwyr yr ymgyrch 'Sdim Curo ar Blant a chredaf fod angen rhoi gwybodaeth bellach i Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar hyn. Datganais fy marn bersonol yn glir yn y ddadl fer honno fod yn rhaid inni symud ymlaen gyda magu cadarnhaol, i alluogi rhieni yng Nghymru i weld y dewisiadau eraill yn lle cosb gorfforol. Yr ydym yn buddsoddi yn awr, drwy Blant yng Nghymru, mewn cynllun rhieni cadarnhaol, gan gydweithio â sefydliad cenedlaethol rhieni a theuluoedd yn Lloegr. Felly, yr ydym yn mynd ymlaen â hyn oherwydd y pryderon a fynegwyd. Bydd yr Aelodau'n cofio inni efallai fethu gwneud y gorau o'r cyfle pan ymgynghorwyd â ni ar y mater hwn ryw ddwy neu dair blynedd yn ôl. Mae angen inni fynd ag ef ymlaen. Yr ydych yn iawn, David, pan ddywedwch fod angen inni ystyried yn fwy gofalus bob cyd-destun a sefyllfa lle cynigir gofal y tu allan i ofal y rhieni a gofal yn y cartref.

Gwnaeth Kirsty bwynt pwysig ynghylch archwiliadau heddlu a'r ffaith bod Swyddfa Cofnodion Troseddol yn cael ei sefydlu a fydd yn gwneud yr archwiliadau hynny'n gynt. Fodd bynnag, mae'r rheoliadau'n darparu i staff gael dechrau gweithio cyn i'r archwiliadau gael eu cwblhau, ar yr amod na adewir hwy gyda phlant heb oruchwyliath. Dyna'r allwedd hyd nes bydd y Swyddfa Cofnodion Troseddol yn gweithio fel y dylai.

Karen, gwnaethoch chi sôn am bwysigrwydd annog gwarchodwyr plant a gofyn a fyddent hwy'n gweld y rheoliadau fel baich arnynt. Dyna pam yr wyf wedi dileu ffioedd rheoleiddio a pham y mae gennym grant cychwyn o £300 i warchodwyr. Mae angen inni droi hynny o gwmpas. Mae gwarchod plant yn ffynhonnell gwaith, yn enwedig i fenywod, a rhaid inni sicrhau y cânt eu cefnogi drwy'n partneriaethau blynyddoedd cynnar a gofal plant ac na chânt eu hynysu ond yn hytrach eu cefnogi drwy'r Gymdeithas Warchod Plant Genedlaethol. Mae'r Cynulliad wedi rhoi ei gefnogaeth i'r gymdeithas, fel y corff cenedlaethol sy'n mynd â gwarchod plant yn ei flaen. Mae wedi ymdrechu dros gefnogaeth am ddatblygu ers

rural areas such as yours, Karen.

blynyddoedd lawer yn ein cymunedau i gyd, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd gwledig fel eich un chi, Karen.

Through this debate we have acknowledged the importance of the care standards inspectorate and the role it will play in protecting children in Wales. These regulations will take us forward. They will also take us forward in terms of the Welsh way of supporting and protecting our children. Out of that, and out of the issues that you raised, we will have a robust debate when we discuss the childcare action plan in May. That will cover many of the broader issues that you have brought forward in today's debate.

Drwy gydol y ddadl hon yr ydym wedi cydnabod pwysigrwydd yr Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal a'r rôl y bydd yn chwarae o ran diogelu plant yng Nghymru. Bydd y rheoliadau hyn yn mynd â ni ymlaen. Byddant hefyd yn mynd â ni ymlaen o ran y ffordd Gymreig o gynnal a diogelu'n plant. Ar sail hynny, ac ar sail y materion a godwyd gennych chi, cawn ddadl fywiog pan drafodwn y cynllun gweithredu gofal plant ym Mai. Bydd honno'n ymdrin â llawer o'r materion ehangach a gyflwynwyd gennych yn y ddadl heddiw.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 19, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 31.
Amendment 1: For 19, Abstain 0, Against 31.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

3:40 p.m.

Gwelliant 2: O blaid 19, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 31.

Amendment 2: For 19, Abstain 0, Against 31.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice

Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Halford, Alison
 Hancock, Brian
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Kirsty
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Deddfwriaeth sy'n Gysylltiedig â Gwasanaethau Gofal Dydd i
 Blant Dan Wyth
 Approval of Legislation Associated with Day-care Services for Children Under
 Eight**

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Under Standing Order No. 22.25, this motion is not subject to debate. **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25, nid yw'r cynnig hwn yn destun dadl.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): I propose that **Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly, acting under Standing Order No. 22.25, approves: *y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25, yn cymeradwyo:*

1. the Childminding and Day Care (Wales) Regulations 2002 laid in the Table Office on 11 March 2002; and *1. Rheoliadau Gwarchod Plant a Gofal Dydd (Cymru) 2002 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Mawrth 2002; ac*

2. the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 11 March 2002. (NDM994) *2. yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Mawrth 2002. (NDM994)*

Cynnig: O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion: For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

**Adolygiad Pum Mlynedd o Gyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru
Quinquennial Review of the Countryside Council for Wales**

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol selected amendment 1 in the name of gwelliant 1 yn enw Jonathan Morgan, a

Jonathan Morgan, and amendments 3, 4 and 5 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. I have not selected amendment 2 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

gwelliannau 3, 4 a 5 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Nid wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 2 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

The Minister for Environment (Sue Essex):
I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd (Sue Essex): Cynigiad fod

the National Assembly welcomes the completion of the quinquennial review of the Countryside Council for Wales and the Welsh Assembly Government's response to the review's recommendations. (NDM993)

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn croesawu cwblhau'r adolygiad pum mlynedd o Gyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru ac ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i argymhellion yr adolygiad. (NDM993)

This motion endorses the Cabinet's response to the quinquennial review of the Countryside Council for Wales. Quinquennial reviews are carried out in two stages: the first considers whether or not there is a continuing need for the functions of the organisation and whether the current organisational framework is the most appropriate; and the second reviews the strategic effectiveness and, if appropriate, options for improvement. The completion of this review marks another step towards the Welsh Assembly Government's commitment to undertaking a review of all executive Assembly sponsored public bodies by 2003-04.

Mae'r cynnig hwn yn ategu ymateb y Cabinet i'r adolygiad pum mlynedd o Gyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru. Gwneir adolygiadau pum mlynedd mewn dau gam: mae'r cyntaf yn ystyried a oes angen parhaus ai peidio am swyddogaethau'r corff ac ai'r fframwaith trefniadaethol cyfredol yw'r mwyaf priodol; ac mae'r ail yn adolygu'r effeithiolrwydd strategol ac, os yw'n briodol, dewisiadau ar gyfer gwella. Mae cwblhau'r adolygiad yn gam arall tuag at gyflawni ymrwymiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wneud adolygiad o bob corff cyhoeddus gweithredol a noddir gan y Cynulliad erbyn 2003-04.

The review was carried out in two stages by Ian Thomas of the Assembly's finance department. I thank him for his work, which has produced the comprehensive reports before us. The review involved wide consultation with stakeholders, partners and interested partners, and draft reports have already been shared and discussed with members of the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee. I thank Committee members for their involvement and consideration of those reports. The review has rightly recognised the achievements of the Countryside Council for Wales and the continuing need for the body in the future, while also recognising some areas where there is scope for improvement.

Gwnaethpwyd yr adolygiad mewn dau gam gan Ian Thomas o adran gyllid y Cynulliad. Diolchaf iddo am ei waith, a esgorodd ar yr adroddiadau cynhwysfawr ger ein bron. Yr oedd yr adolygiad yn golygu ymgynghori'n eang gyda chyfranogwyr, partneriaid a phartion â diddordeb, ac eisoes cafodd adroddiadau drafft eu rhannu a'u trafod ag aelodau Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth. Diolchaf i aelodau'r Pwyllgor am eu gwaith yn ystyried yr adroddiadau hynny. Mae'r adolygiad yn haeddiannol wedi cydnabod yr hyn a gyflawnodd Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru a'r angen parhaus am y corff yn y dyfodol, tra'n cydnabod ar yr un pryd fod lle i wella mewn rhai meysydd.

Attached to the motion is a paper that lists the main recommendations in the stage 2 report and the Welsh Assembly Government's response to each. The Environment, Planning and Transport Committee has already considered the reports' recommendations. We accept the recommendation of the stage 1

Ynglwm wrth y cynnig mae papur sy'n rhestru'r prif argymhellion yn yr adroddiad ail gam ac ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i bob un. Mae Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth eisoes wedi ystyried argymhellion yr adroddiadau. Derbyniwn argymhelliad

report that the council should be retained as an ASPB, at least for the next five years. However, we will want to reconsider the arrangements for the delivery of environmental functions in the medium to long term. The 49 recommendations are mainly related to areas such as strategic planning, performance information, monitoring by council members, internal and external communications, and the relationship between the council and the Assembly, and indeed the council and other bodies with an environmental interest.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: You mention the relationship between the council and other environmental bodies. Will you consider the responsibilities of the council and the Environment Agency during this review, to see where they overlap and where there is potential for working together to offer a better and more effective service?

Sue Essex: As someone who sat on the Committee, you will remember that we raised those points as the review progressed. This is now the final document complete with recommendations. One aspect is the relationship with other organisations, as you rightly say. The Environment Agency is one of those organisations. As I mentioned earlier, we are perhaps looking at an even closer relationship in the medium and long term.

The main recommendations concern the need for the council to develop further how it engages with partners—which is the point that you raised, Rhodri—the need to improve its internal communications to aid staff motivation, and the development of a stronger corporate culture within the council. Other important issues raised in the report include the need to promote equal opportunities and to further integrate sustainable development into its work; ways in which members' roles can be strengthened; and better reporting on key targets and so on. All these matters are being addressed by the council in conjunction with the Welsh Assembly Government and other partners, as appropriate.

On equal opportunities, I am pleased that the council is undertaking a review of

adroddiad cam 1 y dylid cadw'r cyngor fel corff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad, o leiaf am y pum mlynedd nesaf. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn dymuno ailystyried y trefniadau ar gyfer cyflawni swyddogaethau amgylcheddol yn y tymor canolig i hir. Mae'r 49 o argymhellion yn ymwneud yn bennaf â meysydd fel cynllunio strategol, gwybodaeth perfformiad, monitro gan aelodau'r cyngor, cyfathrebu mewnol ac allanol, a'r berthynas rhwng y cyngor a'r Cynulliad, ac yn wir rhwng y cyngor a chyrff eraill â diddordeb amgylcheddol.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yr ydych yn sôn am y berthynas rhwng y cyngor a chyrff amgylcheddol eraill. A fyddwch chi'n ystyried cyfrifoldebau'r cyngor ac Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn ystod yr adolygiad hwn, i weld ble maent yn gorgyffwrdd a ble y mae potensial ar gyfer cydweithio i gynnig gwasanaeth gwell a mwy effeithiol?

Sue Essex: Fel rhywun a eisteddodd ar y Pwyllgor, byddwch yn cofio inni godi'r pwyntiau hynny wrth i'r adolygiad fynd rhagddo. Hon yn awr yw'r ddogfen derfynol ynghyd ag argymhellion. Un agwedd yw'r berthynas â chyrff eraill, fel y dywedwch yn gywir. Mae Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn un o'r cyrff hynny. Fel y soniais yn gynharach, yr ydym efallai'n edrych ar berthynas agosach fyth yn y tymor canolig i hir.

Mae'r prif argymhellion yn ymwneud â'r angen i'r cyngor i ddatblygu ymhellach y ffordd y mae'n cydweithio gyda phartneriaid—sef y pwynt a godoch chi, Rhodri—yr angen i wella'i gyfathrebu mewnol i helpu symbylu staff, a datblygiad diwylliant corfforaethol cryfach o fewn y cyngor. Y materion pwysig eraill a godwyd yn yr adroddiad yw'r angen i hyrwyddo cyfle cyfartal ac i gynnwys mwy o ddatblygu cynaliadwy yn ei waith; ffyrdd y gellir cryfhau rôl aelodau; a chael adroddiadau gwell ar dargedau allweddol; ac ati. Mae'r materion hyn i gyd yn cael sylw gan y cyngor ar y cyd â Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a phartneriaid eraill, yn ôl fel y bo'n briodol.

Ar gyfle cyfartal, yr wyf yn falch bod y cyngor yn ymgymryd ag adolygiad o'i bolisi

recruitment policy and that new equal opportunity monitoring systems will be put in place this coming year. The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities recently agreed the council's revised pay remit for 2001-02 to 2003-04, and I am sure that this will make an important contribution to equal opportunities and staff morale. An action plan has been drawn up jointly by Welsh Assembly Government officials and the council to implement the recommendations. I have recently discussed and agreed this with the chair and chief executive of CCW, and members of the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee have also seen the action plan. It will be published shortly and I will monitor its progress closely, as will the council and officials.

Post-devolution, we are securing close integration between the council and the Assembly. It is important to remember that, since devolution, we are trying to pull the work and the objectives of the Assembly sponsored public bodies together with those of the Assembly itself. Working relationships are good, and it is important that I, as Minister, play an important part in developing this relationship. I have already initiated a series of visits to the council's area offices. It will be a good opportunity for me to sit down, meet the staff, and discuss their jobs and how we see future development. I hope to complete this in the forthcoming month. I also intend to establish formal annual meetings with council members to discuss progress. I am encouraged by how the council has become an integral part of Team Wales, and by its involvement in the delivery of many of the Assembly's key policy objectives, for example, its role in areas such as the rural recovery plan.

I publicly express my thanks to John Lloyd Jones, as chair, to council members and to staff at CCW for their positive engagement with the review at each stage. Reviews such as this are never easy for the organisations concerned. I emphasise that, and sincerely thank everyone involved for their positive contribution.

I do not support Jonathan Morgan's

recriwtio ac y sefydlir systemau monitro cyfle cyfartal newydd yn y flwyddyn nesaf yma. Cytunodd y Gweinidog Cyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau yn ddiweddar ar system gyflogau ddiwygiedig y cyngor am 2001-02 i 2003-04, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnaiff hyn gyfraniad pwysig at gyfle cyfartal a morâl y staff. Lluniwyd cynllun gweithredu ar y cyd gan swyddogion Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'r cyngor i weithredu'r argymhellion. Yr wyf wedi trafod a chytuno ar hyn yn ddiweddar gyda chadeirydd a phrif weithredwr y Cyngor Cefn Gwlad, ac mae aelodau Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth hefyd wedi gweld y cynllun gweithredu. Fe'i cyhoeddir yn fuan a byddaf yn monitro'i hynt yn agos, fel y gwna'r cyngor a'r swyddogion.

Ers datganoli, yr ydym yn sicrhau integreiddio agos rhwng y cyngor a'r Cynulliad. Mae'n bwysig cofio ein bod, ers datganoli, yn ceisio tynnu gwaith ac amcanion y cyrff cyhoeddus a noddur gan y Cynulliad ynghyd â gwaith ac amcanion y Cynulliad ei hun. Mae perthynas waith dda gennym, ac mae'n bwysig fy mod i, fel Gweinidog, yn chwarae rhan bwysig yn natblygiad y berthynas hon. Yr wyf eisoes wedi cychwyn cyfres o ymweliadau â swyddfeydd ardal y cyngor. Bydd yn gyfle da imi eistedd i lawr, cyfarfod â'r staff, a thrafod eu swyddi a sut y gwelwn bethau'n datblygu yn y dyfodol. Gobeithiaf gwblhau hyn yn y mis sy'n dod. Bwriadaf hefyd sefydlu cyfarfodydd blynyddol ffurfiol gydag aelodau'r cyngor i drafod datblygiadau. Caf fy nghalonogi gan y ffordd y mae'r cyngor wedi dod yn rhan annatod o Dîm Cymru, a chan ei waith yn cyflawni nifer o amcanion polisi allweddol y Cynulliad, er enghraifft, ei rôl mewn meysydd fel y cynllun adfer gwledig.

Mynegaf fy niolch yn gyhoeddus i John Lloyd Jones, y cadeirydd, i aelodau'r cyngor ac i'r staff yn y Cyngor Cefn Gwlad am eu hagwedd gadarnhaol at yr adolygiad ymhob cam. Nid yw adolygiadau fel hyn byth yn hawdd i'r cyrff dan sylw. Pwysleisiaf hynny, a diolchaf yn ddiffuant i bawb a gymerodd ran am eu cyfraniad cadarnhaol

Nid wyf yn cefnogi gwelliant I gan Jonathan

amendment 1. The report acknowledges CCW's achievements, but identifies areas where further improvements can be made, which is to be welcomed. I also do not support amendment 3 in Jocelyn's name. The Welsh Assembly Government has made a commitment to look at this in the medium term. This is covered in the action plan. Any major changes to current arrangements would require detailed planning as well as primary legislation. I do not accept that there are anomalies in relation to the Assembly's powers and other environmental bodies in Wales. I do not support amendment 4 in Jocelyn's name; a binding duty would require a change in statute. For information, the Environmental Protection Act 1990 established CCW's purposes and role. However, I agreed last spring, in an Assembly debate, that sustainable development should be integrated at the heart of ASPB policy development. The end result is the same, though the means of achieving it would differ. The Assembly's recent remit letter required CCW to have regard to sustainable development. The Assembly's sustainable development action plan requires ASPBs to submit a plan to the Assembly setting out how they propose to integrate sustainable development into their work. CCW is already working on its sustainable development action plan, and this is one of its key performance targets for 2002-03. I do not support amendment 5 in Jocelyn Davies's name. This is not against development; each case must be examined on its merits.

Finally, the review provides the basis for us to send a strong message of support for the work undertaken by the Countryside Council for Wales. It is integral to our plans and hopes for Wales.

David Davies: I propose the following amendment in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Amendment 1: in line 1 delete 'welcomes' and replace with 'notes'.

This is not, by and large, a terribly glamorous

Morgan. Mae'r adroddiad yn cydnabod yr hyn a gyflawnodd y Cyngor Cefn Gwlad, ond yn nodi meysydd lle gellir gwneud gwelliannau pellach, sydd i'w groesawu. Nid wyf ychwaith yn cefnogi gwelliant 3 yn enw Jocelyn. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ymrwymo i edrych ar hyn yn y tymor canolig. Mae hyn wedi'i gynnwys yn y cynllun gweithredu. Byddai unrhyw newidiadau mawr i'r trefniadau cyfredol yn gofyn am gynllunio manwl yn ogystal â deddfwriaeth sylfaenol. Nid wyf yn derbyn fod yna anghysonderau mewn perthynas â phwerau'r Cynulliad a chyrrff amgylcheddol eraill yng Nghymru. Nid wyf yn cefnogi gwelliant 4 yn enw Jocelyn; byddai dyletswydd rhwymol yn galw am newid yn y statud. Er gwybodaeth, sefydlwyd dibenion a rôl y Cyngor Cefn Gwlad gan Ddeddf Gwarchod yr Amgylchedd 1990. Serch hynny, cytunais y gwanwyn diwethaf, mewn dadl yn y Cynulliad, y dylid integreiddio datblygu cynaliadwy wrth graidd datblygiad y polisi ar gyrrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad. Mae'r canlyniad yn y diwedd yr un fath, er y byddai'r modd y'i cyflawnid yn wahanol. Yr oedd llythyr cylch gorchwyl diweddar y Cynulliad yn mynnu y dylai'r Cyngor Cefn Gwlad ystyried datblygu cynaliadwy. Mae cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy y Cynulliad yn gofyn bod cyrrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad yn cyflwyno cynllun i'r Cynulliad yn amlinellu sut y bwriadant integreiddio datblygu cynaliadwy i mewn i'w gwaith. Mae'r Cyngor Cefn Gwlad eisoes yn gweithio ar ei gynllun gweithredu datblygu cynaliadwy, a dyma un o'i brif dargedau perfformiad am 2002-03. Nid wyf yn cefnogi gwelliant 5 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Nid yw hyn yn erbyn datblygiad; rhaid edrych ar bob achos yn ôl ei deilyngdod.

Yn olaf, mae'r adolygiad yn darparu'r sail inni anfon neges gryf o gefnogaeth i'r gwaith a wneir gan Gyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru. Mae'n annatod i'n cynlluniau a'n gobeithion ar gyfer Cymru.

David Davies: Cynigiad y gwelliant canlynol yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Gwelliant 1: dileu'r gair 'croesawu' a rhoi 'nodi' yn ei le.

Nid yw'r swydd hon, ar y cyfan, yn arbennig

job, but I was delighted the other day to receive an invitation to the premiere of 'Arthur's Dyke'. You may wonder what this has to do with the Countryside Council for Wales—the film was shot almost entirely, if not wholly, in Wales. From the opening sequence to the final shots we see nothing but the glories of the countryside of this part of Wales. If anyone has not seen that film, I recommend it. It will be one of the best advertisements ever for the Welsh countryside and is entirely free. The council had a hand in that. The film-makers were made to feel welcome by all of the bodies with which they came into contact. We are extremely lucky to live in such a beautiful place, which is why we need bodies such as CCW to protect the natural environment.

3:50 p.m.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas made a fair point. I cannot remember his exact words, but I think he indicated that there are a plethora of bodies like CCW. He referred to the Environment Agency Wales and the fact that there is, to some extent, an overlap and duplication of their work. I recently visited the docks in Mostyn, where it was made clear to me that having to consult around 13 environmental bodies before work could go ahead on the new ferry service almost caused the project to fail. We have to guard carefully against an excess of red tape and paperwork. No-one would suggest that CCW should be wound down or merged, but there is concern that its work overlaps with that of other environmental bodies.

Not much time was put aside for this debate today. It would be difficult to go through such a large report in detail in a couple of minutes. However, section 7 of the report worries me most because CCW must be seen primarily as an independent, consultative body offering free advice to the Government. It seems to me that that independence could now be under threat particularly if, as outlined in section 7.3.7, CCW will be expected to ensure that policies are compatible with those of the Assembly. That goes to the core of what CCW is about; is it

o hudolus, ond yr oeddwn wrth fy modd y dydd o'r blaen i dderbyn gwahoddiad i ddangosiad cyntaf 'Arthur's Dyke'. Efallai eich bod yn meddwl tybed beth sydd a wnelo hyn â Chyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru—saethwyd y ffilm bron yn gyfan, os nad yn gyfan gwbl, yng Nghymru. O'r dilyniant cyntaf i'r lluniau olaf y cwbl a welwn yw gogoniannau cefn gwlad yn y rhan hon o Gymru. Os oes rhywun heb weld y ffilm, yr wyf yn ei chymeradwyo. Bydd yn un o'r hysbysebion gorau erioed i gefn gwlad Cymru ac mae'n rhad ac am ddim. Bu gan y cyngor ran yn hynny. Cafodd y criw ffilmio groeso gan yr holl gyrff y daethant i gysylltiad â hwy. Yr ydym yn eithriadol o ffodus o fyw mewn lle mor brydferth, a dyna pam mae angen cyrff fel y Cyngor Cefn Gwlad i warchod yr amgylchedd naturiol.

Gwnaeth Rhodri Glyn Thomas bwynt teg. Ni chofiaf ei union eiriau, ond yr wyf yn meddwl iddo nodi bod lluo o gyrff fel y Cyngor Cefn Gwlad. Cyfeiriodd at Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd Cymru a'r ffaith fod yna, i ryw raddau, orgyffwrdd a dyblygu yn eu gwaith. Yn ddiweddar ymwelais â'r dociau ym Mostyn, lle dywedwyd wrthyf yn blwmp ac yn blaen fod gorfod ymgynghori â rhyw 13 o gyrff amgylcheddol cyn y gellid mynd ymlaen â'r gwaith ar y gwasanaeth fferi newydd bron wedi achosi i'r prosiect fethu. Rhaid inni wylion ofalus rhag gormodedd o dâp coch a gwaith papur. Ni fyddai neb yn awgrymu y dylid dirwyn y Cyngor Cefn Gwlad i ben neu ei gyfuno â chorff arall, ond y mae pryder fod ei waith yn gorgyffwrdd â gwaith cyrff amgylcheddol eraill.

Ni neilltuwyd llawer o amser ar gyfer y ddadl hon heddiw. Byddai'n anodd mynd drwy adroddiad mor fawr yn fanwl mewn ychydig o funudau. Fodd bynnag, adran 7 yn yr adroddiad sy'n peri'r pryder mwyaf i mi oherwydd mae'n rhaid i'r Cyngor Cefn Gwlad gael ei weld yn bennaf fel corff annibynnol, ymgynghorol sy'n cynnig cyngor am ddim i'r Llywodraeth. Mae'n ymddangos i mi y gallai'r annibyniaeth honno fod dan fygythiad yn enwedig os, fel amlinellir yn adran 7.3.7, y disgwylir i'r cyngor sicrhau bod ei bolisiau'n gydnaws â pholisiau'r

there to communicate independent advice to the Government and other interested bodies on environmental matters, or is it there to communicate the Assembly's policies? I urge Members to read the section of the report that reveals a worrying desire to exert more political control over CCW, which could fatally undermine its purpose.

There are already more than enough spin-doctors and communications advisers in the Cabinet, so I urge the Minister not to make CCW another arm of the Government's spin machine but to uphold its independence and ensure that it continues to offer an unbiased opinion on all environmental matters.

Janet Davies: I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 3: add as a new paragraph:

calls on the Government to address the long-term future of environmental bodies in Wales, including the Countryside Council for Wales, with a view to addressing anomalies in relation to the Assembly's powers over these bodies and any potential duplication or confusion of function.

I propose amendment 4. Add as a new paragraph:

calls on the Government to direct the Countryside Council for Wales to exercise its duties in such a way that promotes sustainable development according to section 21 of the Government of Wales Act 1998.

I propose amendment 5. Add as a new paragraph:

calls on the Government to direct the Countryside Council for Wales to interpret its responsibility for the landscape in such a way as to permit appropriate development.

The Countryside Council for Wales is an important organisation in terms of the delivery of many of the Assembly's targets. It is crucial to safeguard the long-term conservation of habitats that give life to many

Cynulliad. Mae hynny'n mynd at graidd bodolaeth y Cyngor Cefn Gwlad; a ydyw yno i roi cyngor annibynnol i'r Llywodraeth a chyrrff eraill sydd â diddordeb ar faterion amgylcheddol, ynteu a ydyw yno i gyfleu polisiau'r Cynulliad? Anogaf yr Aelodau i ddarllen y rhan o'r adroddiad sy'n dangos awydd anffodus i arfer mwy o reolaeth wleidyddol dros y Cyngor Cefn Gwlad, a allai danseilio'i bwrpas yn angheuol.

Mae mwy na digon o sbin-ddoctoriaid ac ymgynghorwyr cyfathrebu yn barod yn y Cabinet, felly anogaf y Gweinidog i beidio â throï'r Cyngor Cefn Gwlad yn fraich arall i beiriant sbin y Llywodraeth ond yn hytrach i gynnal ei annibyniaeth a sicrhau ei fod yn parhau i gynnig barn ddiudedd ar bob cwestiwn amgylcheddol.

Janet Davies: Cynigïaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 3: ychwanegu fel paragraff newydd:

yn galw ar y Llywodraeth i fynd i'r afael â dyfodol tymor hir cyrrff amgylcheddol yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru, gyda golwg ar fynd i'r afael ag anghysonderau o safbwynt pwerau'r Cynulliad dros y cyrrff hyn, yn ogystal ag unrhyw ddyblygu posibl neu ddrysych ynghylch eu swyddogaethau.

Cynigïaf welliant 4. Ychwanegu fel paragraff newydd:

yn galw ar y Llywodraeth i gyfarwyddo Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru i arfer ei ddyletswyddau mewn ffordd sy'n hyrwyddo datblygiad cynaliadwy yn unol ag adran 21 o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998.

Cynigïaf welliant 5. Ychwanegu fel paragraff newydd:

yn galw ar y Llywodraeth i gyfarwyddo Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru i ddehongli ei gyfrifoldeb dros y dirwedd mewn ffordd sy'n caniatáu datblygiadau priodol.

Mae Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru yn gorff pwysig o ran cyflawni llawer o dargedau'r Cynulliad. Mae'n hollbwysig o ran diogelu gwarchodaeth tymor hir i gynefinoedd sy'n rhoi bywyd i lawer o anifeiliaid a

animals and plants, and crucial in terms of the conservation and improvement of the landscapes and seascapes of Wales. The council has an important part to play in those, as well as in the sustainable development of the economy and society of rural areas and in the education and dissemination of information on the countryside. Therefore, as the Minister said, this is an important report. We need to ensure that CCW is working as effectively as possible. Many good things have been said about it in this report, although, it is clearly under a great deal of pressure, particularly following the allocation of new duties in recent years.

In considering the various recommendations, some of them stand out as being fundamental, and I look to the Government to help the council to address those issues. While I intend to refer to some of the weaknesses in the report, I do so in the context of the many strengths that exist. For example, its corporate governance is in place and is working and it is meeting its statutory responsibilities. However, I was concerned that the review found a lack of focus and confusion between its objectives and aims. The plethora of statements is unlikely to be unique to this particular Assembly sponsored public body, given the number of papers and studies that have been produced over the past few years. The proposal to use the council's vision statement to represent its core values makes much sense.

There is concern about the lack of communication between senior staff and others. That is a sign of the organisational structure creaking rather than problems relating to individual staff members. The balance between scientific work, establishing new sites of special scientific interest and nature reserves, and education and public information, may be slightly out of sync. Clearly, the balance will be subjective, and it must be carefully considered.

Brian Hancock: Do you agree that the Countryside Council for Wales should have a more balanced view of the environment and appropriate development, so that schemes

phlanhigion, ac yn hollbwysig yn nhermau cadw a gwella tirweddau a morweddau Cymru. Mae gan y cyngor ran bwysig i'w chwarae yn y rheini, yn ogystal ag yn natblygiad cynaliadwy economi a chymdeithas ardaloedd gwledig ac o ran addysgu a lledaenu gwybodaeth am gefn gwlad. Felly, fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, mae hwn yn adroddiad pwysig. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod y Cyngor Cefn Gwlad yn gweithio mor effeithiol ag sy'n bosibl. Dywedwyd llawer o bethau da amdano yn yr adroddiad hwn, er, yn amlwg, mae dan lawer iawn o bwysau, yn enwedig wedi i ddyletswyddau newydd gael eu rhoi iddo yn y blynyddoedd diweddar.

Wrth ystyried y gwahanol argymhellion, mae rhai ohonynt yn sefyll allan fel rhai sylfaenol, ac edrychaf at y Llywodraeth i helpu'r cyngor i fynd i'r afael â'r materion hynny. Er fy mod yn bwriadu cyfeirio at rai o'r gwendidau yn yr adroddiad, gwnaf hynny yng nghyd-destun y cryfderau lawer sy'n bodoli. Er enghraifft, mae ei reolaeth gorfforaethol wedi'i osod i'w le ac yn gweithio ac mae'n cyflawni'i gyfrifoldebau statudol. Er hynny, testun pryder imi oedd bod yr adolygiad wedi canfod diffyg ffocws a dryswch rhwng ei nod a'i amcanion. Mae'r lliaws o ddatganiadau'n annhebygol o fod yn unigryw i'r corff cyhoeddus arbennig hwn, o gofio'r nifer o bapurau ac astudiaethau a gynhyrchwyd dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf. Mae'r cynnig i ddefnyddio datganiad gweledigaeth y cyngor i gynrychioli'i werthoedd craidd yn gwneud llawer o synnwyr.

Mae pryder ynghylch y diffyg cyfathrebu rhwng staff uwch ac eraill. Arwydd yw hynny o wegian yn y strwythur trefniadaethol yn hytrach na phroblemau gydag aelodau staff unigol. Efallai fod ychydig o anghydbwysedd rhwng gwaith gwyddonol, sefydlu safleoedd o ddiddordeb gwyddonol arbennig a gwarchodfeydd natur newydd, ac addysg a gwybodaeth i'r cyhoedd. Yn amlwg, peth goddrychol fydd y cydbwysedd, a rhaid ei ystyried yn ofalus.

Brian Hancock: A ydych yn cytuno y dylai Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru edrych yn fwy cytbwys ar yr amgylchedd a datblygiad priodol, fel y gall cynlluniau sy'n cynnal

that sustain flora, fauna and the landscape can be promoted by carefully produced economic development, and vice versa?

Janet Davies: Yes. Nobody could disagree with that.

Finally, as already mentioned, questions on the constitutional position of CCW, its structural suitability for its work and its relationship with bodies doing similar work, are not resolved in the review. David Davies referred to paragraph 7.3.7; paragraph 7.3.5 on the issue of non-devolved responsibilities is also important. There is an ambiguity. The council is funded by the National Assembly to carry out functions on its behalf, but it also carries out non-devolved conservation duties for the UK Government. That must lead to tensions and conflicts of interest. For example, does CCW get equal consultation with the English body on UK issues? Does the UK Government pay for the duties that CCW carries out on its behalf? I am not sure that it does. The review produces evidence on that, but it does not resolve the matter. Again, the possibility of merging functions with the Environment Agency and Forestry Enterprise has been raised, but is then dismissed for at least five years. It is important that we keep an eye on this because the way that the Government works in Wales increasingly diverges from how the UK Government works. Pragmatism will dictate new methods of delivery, and a merger of these bodies into environmental body for Wales, will eventually be essential. I ask that we begin work on this, because to leave it until matters become critical will be too late.

Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales would like to see primary legislation moved to enable such structural change for CCW, the Environment Agency and Forestry Enterprise. We ask the Government of Wales to give serious consideration to this proposal. I am disappointed that the Minister feels unable to support any of our amendments, but

bywyd gwyllt a'r tirwedd gael eu hyrwyddo drwy ddatblygiad economaidd a lunnir gyda gofal, ac i'r gwrthwyneb?

Janet Davies: Ydw. Ni allai neb anghytuno â hynny.

Yn olaf, fel y soniwyd eisoes, nid yw'r adolygiad yn ateb cwestiynau ynghylch safle cyfansoddiadol y Cyngor Cefn Gwlad, ei addasrwydd strwythurol i'w waith a'i berthynas gyda chyrff sy'n gwneud gwaith tebyg. Cyfeiriodd David Davies at baragraff 7.3.7; mae paragraff 7.3.5 ar fater cyfrifoldebau na ddatganolwyd yn bwysig hefyd. Mae yma anghysondeb. Caiff y cyngor ei ariannu gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i gyflawni swyddogaethau ar ei ran, ond mae hefyd yn cyflawni dyletswyddau cadwraeth sydd heb eu datganoli ar ran Llywodraeth y DU. Mae'n anorfod fod hynny'n arwain at densiynau a gwrthdrawiadau buddiannau. Er enghraifft, a ymgynghorir â Chyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru yn gydradd â'r corff Seisnig ar faterion y DU? A yw Llywodraeth y DU yn talu am y dyletswyddau a gyflawnir gan Gyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru ar ei rhan? Nid wyf yn siŵr ei bod. Mae'r adolygiad yn rhoi tystiolaeth ar hynny, ond nid yw'n datrys y mater. Eto, codwyd y posibilrwydd o gyfuno swyddogaethau gydag Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd a Menter Coedwigaeth, ond wedyn fe'i gwrthodir am o leiaf bum mlynedd. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cadw llygad ar hyn wrth i'r ffordd y mae'r Llywodraeth yn gweithio yng Nghymru symud i ffwrdd fwyfwy oddi wrth y ffordd y mae Llywodraeth y DU yn gweithio. Bydd pragmatiaeth yn dweud fod yn rhaid wrth ddulliau newydd o gyflawni pethau, a bydd cyfuno'r cyrff hyn yn un corff amgylcheddol i Gymru yn hanfodol yn y pen draw. Gofynnaf am inni ddechrau gweithio ar hyn, oherwydd os gadewir hi nes bydd pethau wedi mynd yn dyngedfennol, bydd yn rhy hwyr.

Hoffai Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales weld cynnig deddfwriaeth sylfaenol i alluogi newid strwythurol o'r fath i'r Cyngor Cefn Gwlad, Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd a Menter Coedwigaeth. Gofynnwn i Lywodraeth Cymru roi ystyriaeth ddifrifol i'r cynnig hwn. Yr wyf yn siomedig fod y Gweinidog yn teimlo na all gefnogi unrhyw un o'n

they are genuinely meant and felt. We believe that they would enhance the council's effectiveness.

Eleanor Burnham: The Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome this review because, in the past, the Welsh countryside has been neglected. It was regarded as the poor relation. As part of the Government, the Welsh Liberal Democrats appreciate that we have been given the opportunity to pay the countryside the attention that has been long overdue. The benefits will give the countryside what it deserves, and will reverse a generation of neglect.

As a party, we are committed to the countryside. Rural communities in Wales have always been important to us. We are more than aware of how foot and mouth disease, for instance, affected our countryside socially and economically. Since the outbreak, the number of people visiting the Welsh countryside has dropped dramatically. We are devoted to increasing the number of people who use and enjoy our countryside and we must work alongside CCW to achieve this.

The council has a wide remit and wide-ranging powers to facilitate sustainable development and experimental initiatives. However, more could be done within its current responsibilities to assist the three national park authorities. In recent years, there has not been much evidence of research or experimental projects, as a clearly identifiable national body no longer exists to represent countryside interests in Wales. Questions have recently been raised, for example, about the council's response to large-scale wind farm applications. Its role is to give independent advice within its remit—no more and no less. No spatial considerations were built into the non-fossil fuel obligation regulations, but the forthcoming spatial plan should help smooth the waters and assist work on Technical Advice Note (Wales) 8. When will this be complete?

4:00 p.m.

We also need a rural champion. At present,

gwelliannau, ond mae'r meddwl a'r teimlad y tu ôl iddynt yn ddiffuant. Credwn y byddent yn gwella effeithiolrwydd y cyngor.

Eleanor Burnham: Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymreig yn croesawu'r adolygiad hwn oherwydd, yn y gorffennol, esgeuluswyd cefn gwlad Cymru. Ystyrir mai'r perthynas tlawd ydoedd. Fel rhan o'r Llywodraeth, mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymreig yn sylweddoli y cawsom y cyfle i roi i gefn gwlad y sylw a fu'n ddyledus iddo ers tro byd. Bydd y manteision yn rhoi ei haeddiant i gefn gwlad, ac yn gwrth-droi cenedlaeth o esgeulustod.

Fel plaid, mae gennym ymroddiad i gefn gwlad. Bu cymunedau gwledig yng Nghymru yn bwysig i ni erioed. Yr ydym yn fwy nag ymwybodol o'r modd yr effeithiodd clwy'r traed a'r genau, er enghraifft, ar ein cefn gwlad yn gymdeithasol ac yn economaidd. Ers i'r clefyd daro, bu cwmp dramatig yn nifer y bobl a ddaw i ymweld â chefn gwlad Cymru. Yr ydym yn selog dros gynyddu nifer y bobl sy'n defnyddio ac yn mwynhau'n cefn gwlad a rhaid inni gydweithio ochr yn ochr a'r Cyngor Cefn Gwlad i sicrhau hyn.

Mae gan y cyngor gylch gorchwyl eang a phwerau eang eu cwmpas i hwyluso datblygiad cynaliadwy a mentrau arbrofol. Er hynny, gellid gwneud mwy o fewn ei gyfrifoldebau cyfredol i helpu'r tri awdurdod parc cenedlaethol. Yn y blynyddoedd diweddar, ni fu llawer o dystiolaeth o brosiectau ymchwil neu arbrofol, gan nad oes corff cenedlaethol hawdd ei adnabod gennym mwyach i gynrychioli buddiannau cefn gwlad yng Nghymru. Codwyd cwestiynau'n ddiweddar, er enghraifft, am ymateb y cyngor i geisiadau am ffermydd gwynt mawr. Ei rôl yw rhoi cyngor annibynnol o fewn ei gylch gorchwyl—dim mwy a dim llai. Nid oedd dim ystyriaethau gofodol wedi'u cynnwys yn y rheoliadau dyletswydd tanwydd anffosiledig, ond dylai'r cynllun gofodol sydd ar ddod helpu i dawelu'r dyfroedd a chynorthwyo gwaith ar Nodyn Cyngor Technegol (Cymru) 8. Pa bryd y bydd hyn wedi'i gwblhau?

Mae arnom angen lladmeredd dros gefn

CCW tends to act too narrowly compared with its range of responsibilities. Do you accept, for instance, that rural Wales has perhaps lost its rural leader—the Development Board for Rural Wales—and that the Agriculture and Rural Affairs Committee should undertake the rural proofing of all policies?

Phil Williams: This will be a rare occasion because I am about to praise the Conservatives. Establishing the Countryside Council for Wales was a surprise decision by the Government in 1990. It was especially surprising, given the apoplectic fury of the gerentocracy of British science, in fiercely opposing the suggestion that control of the Welsh countryside could be entrusted to Cardiff, even under the stewardship of a Tory Secretary of State. They could have assumed, of course, that a Conservative administration would set the guidelines and choose the council members to ensure that CCW did not automatically represent the real interests of Wales. One factor that reconciled me some years ago to support the limited version of devolution represented by this Assembly, was the terms of reference and composition of the quangos that were appointed between 1979 and 1997. Setting the guidelines for Assembly sponsored public bodies and appointing the boards are important Assembly functions. CCW is an important example because one of the Assembly's unique features is its statutory obligation to promote sustainable development. We would automatically expect a countryside council for Wales to have a total statutory commitment to full sustainable development in the countryside. Therefore, I am intrigued by this report's wording, which describes CCW as wrestling with how it can embrace the sustainable development agenda more fully. We should probe that reference.

The problem with sustainable development is that it covers economic, community and environmental sustainability. Too many people decide that one of these factors is paramount. In the past, I have attacked those who only consider economic sustainability. I

gwlad hefyd. Ar hyn o bryd, tuedda'r Cyngor Cefn Gwlad i weithredu'n rhy gul o gymharu â'i amrediad o gyfrifoldebau. A ydych yn derbyn, er enghraifft, fod y Gymru wledig efallai wedi colli ei arweinydd gwledig—sef Bwrdd Datblygu Cymru Wledig—ac y dylai'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Materion Gwledig ymgymryd â phrofi pob polisi o safbwynt gwledig?

Phil Williams: Bydd hyn yn achlysur prin oherwydd yr wyf am ganmol y Ceidwadwyr. Yr oedd sefydlu Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru yn benderfyniad annisgwyl gan y Llywodraeth yn 1990. Yr oedd yn syndod arbennig, o gofio cynddaredd gwyllt hynafreolwyr gwyddoniaeth Prydain, wrth wrthwynebu'n ffyrnig yr awgrym y gellid ymddiried rheolaeth cefn gwlad Cymru i Gaerdydd, hyd yn oed dan stiwardiaeth Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Toriaidd. Gallasant fod wedi tybio, wrth gwrs, y byddai gweinyddiaeth Geidwadol yn gosod y canllawiau ac yn dewis yr aelodau i'r cyngor i sicrhau na fyddai Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru o reidrwydd yn cynrychioli gwir fuddiannau Cymru. Un ffactor a'm darbwylodd rai blynyddoedd yn ôl i gefnogi'r fersiwn cyfyngedig o ddatganoli a gynrychiolir gan y Cynulliad hwn, oedd cylch gorchwyl a chyfansoddiad y cwangos a benodwyd rhwng 1979 a 1997. Mae gosod y canllawiau ar gyfer cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad a phenodi'r byrddau'n swyddogaethau pwysig i'r Cynulliad. Mae'r Cyngor Cefn Gwlad yn enghraifft bwysig, oherwydd un o nodweddion unigryw'r Cynulliad yw ei ddyletswydd statudol i hyrwyddo datblygu cynaliadwy. Byddem yn disgwyl yn otomatig i gyngor cefn gwlad dros Gymru fod ag ymrwymiad statudol llwyr i ddatblygu cynaliadwy llawn yng nghefn gwlad. Felly, mae geiriad yr adroddiad hwn yn tynnu fy llygad, lle disgrifia sut mae'r Cyngor Cefn Gwlad yn ymgodymu â chwestiwn sut y gall goleddu'r agenda datblygu cynaliadwy'n llawnach. Dylem edrych i mewn i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw.

Y broblem gyda datblygu cynaliadwy yw ei fod yn cynnwys cynaliadwyedd economaidd, cymunedol ac amgylcheddol. Bydd gormod o bobl yn penderfynu fod un o'r ffactorau hynny yn bwysicach na'r lleill. Yn y gorffennol, yr wyf fi wedi ymosod ar y rheini

am equally critical of those who only consider environmental sustainability and often do so with a narrow definition of environment. Nobody can possibly promote countryside sustainability without fully considering the economic and social health of the living communities that make up the countryside. When we study CCW's statutory duties, it is no wonder that it is wrestling and that it has difficulties. There is a clear gulf between what CCW has a statutory obligation to do—which unfortunately means that it often gives advice that blocks proposals—and what I know many CCW members want to do, namely to promote exemplar schemes. For example, it appears that, in the past, CCW seems to have come into the limelight because of its obsession with its duty to advise on landscapes and its opposition to renewable energy development, that would not only contribute to the mitigation of climate change but would also bring extra income to the rural economy. However, it is merely implementing its statutory duties and using creative skill to interpret those statutes to produce what promises to be a positive and encouraging spatial plan. If the Assembly leaves those statutory duties unchanged, and if we do not give clear lead on the definition of rich landscape to allow appropriate definition, we will have failed.

I was disappointed that the Government has rejected the amendments. The Government could surely sometimes consider positive amendments that we table. It is ironic that the superb quality of our landscape is the result of the economic and social activities of those living communities that are now under threat. I am old enough, and I always play on this, to have seen how monoculture in farming, the massive application of petrochemicals and the regimented extension of conifer afforestation have, in my lifetime, transformed the landscape of large areas of Wales. The refugee from the conurbation naively thinks that it is unspoilt nature. CCW must be given a remit that allows a balanced, proactive approach. I must say that recent CCW submissions to the Economic Development Committee show signs of a

sydd yn ystyried cynaliadwyedd economaidd a dim arall. Yr wyf yr un mor feirniadol o'r rhai nad ydynt ond yn ystyried cynaliadwyedd amgylcheddol, a hynny'n aml â diffiniad cul o amgylchedd. Ni all neb hyrwyddo cynaliadwyedd cefn gwlad heb ystyried yn llawn iechyd economaidd a chymdeithasol y cymunedau byw sy'n ffurfio cefn gwlad. Pan astudiwn ddyletswyddau statudol y cyngor, nid oes ryfedd ei fod yn ymgodymu a bod ganddo drafferthion. Mae gagendor clir rhwng yr hyn y mae gan y cyngor ddyletswydd statudol i'w wneud—sydd ysywaeth yn golygu ei fod yn aml yn rhoi cyngor sy'n rhwystro cynigion—a'r hyn y gwn yr hoffai llawer o aelodau'r cyngor ei wneud, sef hyrwyddo cynlluniau sy'n gosod esiampl. Er enghraifft, mae'n ymddangos yn y gorffennol bod y cyngor wedi dod i'r amlwg oherwydd ei obsesiwn â'i ddyletswydd i roi cyngor ar dirweddau a'i wrthwynebiad i ddatblygiad ynni adnewyddadwy, a fyddai nid yn unig yn cyfrannu at liniaru newid hinsawdd ond hefyd yn dod ag incwm ychwanegol i'r economi wledig. Fodd bynnag, dim ond gweithredu'i ddyletswyddau statudol a defnyddio gallu creadigol y mae i ddehongli'r statudau hynny i gynhyrchu'r hyn sydd yn addo bod yn gynllun gofodol cadarnhaol a chalonogol. Os gedy'r Cynulliad y ddyletswyddau statudol hynny heb eu newid, ac os na roddwn arweiniad clir ar y diffiniad o dirwedd cyfoethog i ganiatáu diffiniad priodol, byddwn wedi methu.

Yr oeddwn yn siomedig fod y Llywodraeth wedi gwrthod y gwelliannau. Siawns na allai'r Llywodraeth weithiau ystyried gwelliannau cadarnhaol a gyflwynir gennym. Mae'n eironig fod ansawdd gwych ein tirwedd yn ganlyniad gweithgareddau economaidd a chymdeithasol y cymunedau byw hynny sydd yn awr dan fygythiad. Yr wyf fi'n ddigon hen, a byddaf bob amser yn chwarae ar hyn, i fod wedi gweld sut mae ffermio ungnwd, defnydd aruthrol o betrogemegau ac ehangiad gwastrodol coedwigaeth gonifferaidd wedi trawsnewid tirwedd rhannau helaeth o Gymru yn fy oes i. Mae'r ffoadur o'r ddinas yn meddwl yn naif mai dyma natur heb ei ddifetha. Rhaid rhoi cylch gwaith i'r cyngor fydd yn caniatáu iddo fynd ati mewn ffordd gytbwys, rhagweithiol. Rhaid imi ddweud fod cyflwyniadau

new approach.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Please wind up now.

Phil Williams: Recognising that onshore and offshore wind offers the greatest potential to meet Wales's target and the fact that CCW is willing to enter positively into dialogue is welcome, but we must ensure that this balanced approach is permanently enshrined in the guidelines.

The Minister for Environment (Sue Essex): I will begin by responding to Members' contributions. David Davies made a point about the plethora of bodies and the changes. He was part of the Committee and I distinctly remember all the discussions. I take Janet's point, because Helen Mary made a point about the long-term policy, and I understand your party's attitude to that. The Committee agreed that over the next five years the way forward is to make those changes outlined in the report and then consider the structural changes to which Members have alluded.

David generously said that CCW gives us free advice; we pay for that advice. It is money well spent, but we fund CCW to do the work that we ask of it. That is the point of the remit letter.

David Davies: When I said free advice, I admit that that may have been misleading: I did not mean that the advice was not without cost, but that it was freely given and that it was meant to be impartial. Also, I am aware of the discussions; I have not disagreed. You will notice that our amendment only proposes to change the motion to 'notes'. I am merely saying that we should be aware of it.

Sue Essex: We will take that definition of 'free' then: they give us impartial advice.

diweddar y cyngor i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn dangos arwyddion o ymagwedd newydd.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. A wnewch chi ddirwyn i ben yn awr, os gwelwch yn dda?

Phil Williams: Mae cydnabod mai gwynt ar y tir a'r môr sy'n cynnig y potensial mwyaf i gyrraedd targed Cymru a'r ffaith fod y cyngor yn barod i ymuno'n gadarnhaol mewn deialog yn rhywbeth a groesewir, ond rhaid inni sicrhau y caiff yr agwedd gytbwys hon ei chorffori'n barhaol yn y canllawiau.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd (Sue Essex): Dechreuaf drwy ymateb i gyfraniadau'r Aelodau. Gwnaeth David Davies bwynt am y llu o gyrff a'r newidiadau. Yr oedd ef yn rhan o'r Pwyllgor a chofiaf yr holl drafodaethau yn eglur. Derbyniaf bwynt Janet, oherwydd gwnaeth Helen Mary bwynt am y polisi tymor hir, a deallaf agwedd eich plaid tuag at hynny. Cytunodd y Pwyllgor mai'r ffordd ymlaen dros y pum mlynedd nesaf yw gwneud y newidiadau hynny a amlinellwyd yn yr adroddiad ac wedyn ystyried y newidiadau strwythurol y cyfeiriodd yr Aelodau atynt.

Dywedodd David yn garedig fod y Cyngor Cefn Gwlad yn rhoi cyngor am ddim inni; yr ydym yn talu am y cyngor hwnnw. Mae'n arian wedi'i wario'n dda, ond yr ydym yn ariannu'r cyngor i wneud y gwaith y gofynnwn iddo'i wneud. Dyna ddiben y llythyr cylch gwaith.

David Davies: Pan soniais am gyngor am ddim, yr wyf yn cyfaddef efallai fod hynny'n gamarweiniol: nid oeddwn yn meddwl bod y cyngor wedi'i roi heb gost, ond ei fod wedi'i roi'n rhydd a'i fod i fod yn amhleidiol. Hefyd, yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r trafodaethau; nid wyf wedi anghytuno. Fe sylwch nad yw ein gwelliant ond yn cynnig newid y geiriad i 'nodi'. Dim ond dweud yr wyf y dylem fod yn ymwybodol ohono.

Sue Essex: Cymerwn y diffiniad hwnnw o 'am ddim' felly: maent yn rhoi cyngor amhleidiol inni.

I assure you that there is no political interference. Remembering the good old days when John Redwood was Secretary of State for Wales, we know what political interference was. However, it is important—and I say this carefully—that we harmonise post-devolution aims and objectives because we need integration. Otherwise it sends out different messages to the people that we deal with.

Before turning to Janet Davies's comments, I welcome her as the new Plaid Cymru spokesperson on the environment. I am sure that she will enjoy the Committee meetings; it is a good forum. I thank her for her thoughtful comments, many of which will be followed up in implementing the report's recommendations. Of course there is tension; there are tensions in any organisation because objectives, on occasion, pull against each other. Managing those tensions and reaching a viewpoint often takes skill.

On Brian Hancock's intervention, I know what he was getting at, because Phil then followed it up. However, if you think that there is no economic value in flora and fauna, you have a one-track mind and a set view that economic value means windfarms only.

Brian Hancock *rose—*

Sue Essex: No, I will not give way. I understand your viewpoint on this but we have learned that there is real economic value in flora and fauna, as well as the scientific value, in terms of the landscape. One point of sustainable development is opening our eyes to those other opportunities.

I thank Phil for some of his points because I know that he sincerely believes many of them.

Brian Hancock *rose—*

Sue Essex: Sorry, Brian, let me finish this because I know I am running out of time.

Yr wyf yn eich sicrhau nad oes dim ymyrraeth wleidyddol. O gofio'r hen ddyddiau da pan oedd John Redwood yn Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Gymru, gwyddom beth oedd ymyrraeth wleidyddol. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig—a dywedaf hyn yn ofalus—ein bod yn cysoni nodau ac amcanion wedi datganoli oherwydd mae angen integreiddiad. Fel arall anfonir negeseuon gwahanol allan i'r bobl yr ydym yn delio â hwynt.

Cyn troi at sylwadau Janet Davies, croesawaf hi fel llefarydd newydd Plaid Cymru ar yr amgylchedd. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnaiff hi fwynhau cyfarfodydd y Pwyllgor; mae'n fforwm da. Diolch iddi am ei sylwadau meddylgar, y gweithredir ar lawer ohonynt pan weithredir argymhellion yr adroddiad. Wrth gwrs bod tensiwn; mae tensiynau mewn unrhyw gorff oherwydd bydd amcanion, weithiau, yn tynnu'n groes i'w gilydd. Mae angen medrusrwydd yn aml i reoli'r tensiynau hynny a chyrraedd safbwynt.

Ar ymyriad Brian Hancock, gwn beth yr oedd yn cyfeirio ato, oherwydd aeth Phil ar ei ôl wedyn. Fodd bynnag, os ydych yn meddwl nad oes dim gwerth economaidd mewn bywyd gwyllt, mae gennych feddwl un trac a syniadau set fod gwerth economaidd yn golygu ffermydd gwynt yn unig.

Brian Hancock *a gododd—*

Sue Essex: Na, ni wnaf ildio. Deallaf eich safbwynt ar hyn ond yr ydym wedi dysgu fod gwir werth economaidd i fywyd gwyllt, yn ogystal â'r gwerth gwyddonol, yn nhermau'r tirwedd. Un o ddibenion datblygu cynaliadwy yw agor ein llygaid i'r cyfleoedd eraill hynny.

Diolchaf i Phil am rai o'i bwyntiau oherwydd gwn ei fod yn credu llawer ohonynt yn ddiffuant.

Brian Hancock *a gododd—*

Sue Essex: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Brian, gadewch imi orffen hyn oherwydd yr wyf yn gwybod fy mod yn mynd yn brin o amser.

However, we always comes back to your running problem, which is the conflict between what many, but not all, in your party want in terms of onshore renewable energy developments, particularly windfarms, and the views of others who feel that the value of the landscape and what it provides needs serious consideration. That forms the basis of the advice that CCW gives us. There is no conflict in that. How it behaves does not create a difficulty. We are all working through the commitment to sustainable development. It is not just a matter of including in statutory legislation. As I explained, it would need primary legislation. So we are not sitting back and saying that that will have to wait for several years, if and when it comes. We are trying to work through some of the difficult points together. That is the message we should be conveying. As you rightly said, it relates to our approach—instead of sitting on different sides of the fence and arguing, we must try to work through the difficult options. That is the answer for Wales. I commend the motion to Members.

4:10 p.m.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 6, Ymatal 15, Yn erbyn 30.
Amendment 1: For 6, Abstain 15, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Graham, William
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Richards, Rod

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne

Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

Ni ddetholwyd gwelliant 2.
Amendment 2 was not selected.

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 36.
Amendment 3: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 36.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan

Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Richards, Rod
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.
 Amendment 4: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Cairns, Alun
 Dafis, Cynog
 Davies, David
 Davies, Geraint
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Graham, William
 Hancock, Brian
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Richards, Rod
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Ron
 Essex, Sue
 Evans, Delyth
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Halford, Alison
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.
 Amendment 5: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Cairns, Alun
 Dafis, Cynog
 Davies, David
 Davies, Geraint
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Graham, William
 Hancock, Brian

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Ron

Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Richards, Rod
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

Essex, Sue
 Evans, Delyth
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Halford, Alison
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 36, Ymatal 15, Yn erbyn 0.
 Motion: For 36, Abstain 15, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Butler, Rosemary
 Cairns, Alun
 Chapman, Christine
 Davies, David
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Ron
 Essex, Sue
 Evans, Delyth
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Halford, Alison
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Richards, Rod
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda

Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Cynigion Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer Mesurau Welsh Assembly Government Proposals for Bills

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6 and 7 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6 a 7 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Cynigiaf fod

The First Minister: I propose that

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol (gan weithredu dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 31.9):

the National Assembly (acting under Standing Order No. 31.9):

1. yn cefnogi cynigion y Cabinet ar gyfer Mesurau yn y sesiwn Seneddol nesaf fel y'u nodwyd yn y ddogfen a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Mawrth 2002; ac

1. endorses the Cabinet's proposals for Bills in the next Parliamentary session as set out in the document laid in the Table Office on 11 March 2002; and

2. yn gofyn i'r Cabinet drafod y cynigion hyn â Llywodraeth y DU, a phwyso am ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol sy'n adlewyrchu anghenion penodol Cymru ac yn parchu rôl y Cynulliad. (NDM997)

2. requests the Cabinet to pursue these proposals with the UK Government, and to press for primary legislation which reflects the particular needs of Wales and respects the role of the Assembly. (NDM997)

Rhydd ein Rheolau Sefydlog gyfle inni, yn ystod mis Mawrth bob blwyddyn, i drafod a dadlau'r cynigion ar gyfer deddfwriaeth sylfaenol i Gymru. Mae'r ddadl hon, felly, yn bwysig ac yn rhan allweddol o'r setliad, yn unol â Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. Mae hyn hefyd yn tanlinellu pa mor effeithiol yw'r bartneriaeth rhyngom ni, fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, Paul Murphy, ac â Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Gyfunol, wrth inni

Our Standing Orders afford us the opportunity, in March each year, to discuss and debate proposals for primary legislation for Wales. This debate, therefore, is important and a key part of the settlement, in accordance with the Government of Wales Act 1998. This also underlines how effective the partnership that we as the Assembly Government have with the Secretary of State for Wales, Paul Murphy, and with the United Kingdom Government, as we strive to deliver

geisio darparu gwasanaethau gwell i bobl Cymru. Mae'r bartneriaeth wedi gweithio ar ran Cymru—ar ein cyfer ni i gyd—a chredaf iddi weithio'n arbennig o dda yng nghydestun creu deddfwriaeth newydd.

Since devolution, we have enjoyed more primary legislation specifically for Wales than at any time in recorded history. Prior to devolution, a Bill specifically for Wales would, on average, be proposed every five years, or perhaps, depending on how you measure it, every six years. It is now almost one per year, which is a 500 per cent increase in the frequency of Bills passed on our behalf. This relates to Wales-only legislation. However, it is not the only route, of course.

The Learning and Skills Bill, for which Tom Middlehurst was responsible on behalf of the Assembly, included a major, 30-clause chunk, as I remember, relating specifically to Wales. Even though it was not a separate Welsh Bill, it had much the same effect as such a Bill might have had. The same could be said about the legislation to establish the new Care Standards Inspectorate and the fresh arrangements for youth services.

Mae hyn yn dangos pa mor effeithiol yr ydym yn awr, gan fod gan Gymru ei chorff ei hun, ei llais ei hun a'i ffordd ei hun o ymdrin â hyn.

I turn to the legislative proposals. They comprise an education proposal that would give additional force to the vision set out—

David Melding: The point about discrete and specific Welsh Bills is important. Will you list the specific measures that have been achieved since the establishment of the devolved Assembly?

The First Minister: Yes; we have had the Children's Commissioner for Wales Bill, and the NHS Bill currently before Parliament in draft form. It has been indicated that the final version of the latter will be available as of the Queen's Speech. This amounts to two Bills in three years, compared with about six in the previous 40 or 50 years. Before the Welsh Sunday Closing Act of 1881, there were, as I

better services for the people of Wales. The partnership has worked for Wales—for us all—and I believe that it has worked exceptionally well in the context of creating new legislation.

Ers datganoli, yr ydym wedi mwynhau mwy o ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol yn benodol i Gymru nag ar unrhyw adeg yn hanes sydd wedi'i gofnodi. Cyn datganoli, câi Mesur penodol i Gymru ei gynig, ar gyfartaledd, bob pum mlynedd, neu efallai, yn dibynnu ar eich dull o fesur, bob chwe blynedd. Erbyn hyn mae bron yn un y flwyddyn, sy'n gynydd o 500 y cant yn amllder Mesurau a gaiff eu pasio ar ein rhan. Mae a wnelo hyn â deddfwriaeth sydd i Gymru'n unig. Fodd bynnag, nid dyna'r unig ffordd, wrth gwrs.

Yr oedd y Mesur Dysgu a Sgiliau, yr oedd Tom Middlehurst yn gyfrifol amdano ar ran y Cynulliad, yn cynnwys talp mawr, 30 cymal, yn ôl a gofiau, yn ymwneud yn benodol â Chymru. Er nad oedd yn Fesur Cymreig ar wahân, yr oedd iddo'r un effaith i bob pwrpas ag a gawsai Mesur o'r fath. Gellid dweud yr un peth am y ddeddfwriaeth i sefydlu'r Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal newydd a'r trefniadau newydd ar gyfer gwasanaethau ieuencid.

This shows how effective we are now that Wales has its own body, its own voice and its own way of dealing with this.

Trof at y cynigion deddfwriaethol. Maent yn cynnwys cynnig ar addysg a fyddai'n rhoi mwy o rym i'r weledigaeth a amlinellwyd—

David Melding: Mae'r pwynt am Fesurau Cymreig penodol ar wahân yn un pwysig. A wnewch chi restru'r mesurau penodol a sicrhawyd ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad datganoledig?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Gwnaf; cawsom Fesur Comisiynydd Plant Cymru, a Mesur y GIG sydd ger bron y Senedd yn ei ffurf ddrafft ar hyn o bryd. Cawsom wybod y bydd fersiwn terfynol yr olaf ar gael yn dilyn Araith y Frenhines. Dyna ddau Fesur mewn tair blynedd, o gymharu â rhyw chwech yn y 40 neu 50 mlynedd blaenorol. Cyn Deddf Gymreig Cau'r Tafarnau ar y Sul 1881, nid

understand it, no Wales-only Bills for almost 300 years. I do not know what comparison you want to work on, David, but there has been a 500 per cent improvement, and we intend to improve on that further. It would be good if we could eventually achieve two Bills per year, along with some minor tidying-up measures.

It is important to remember that we are in competition with Government departments. We are not a Government department; we are a body in our own right. However, we compete with Government departments in the same way that the former Welsh Office would have done. Whereas it used to compete and fail to bring forward measures—or it did not have any measures that it considered to be worth bringing forward—we, inevitably, because of the nature of this body, are generating more legislation and are therefore competing with the Home Office, and other bodies, to get that legislation passed.

Rod Richards: I am concerned about what the First Minister has just said. He is already forecasting that Wales will have, or will need, two Bills, or two Acts of its own in years to come. Is this not government gone mad? Is this not self-justification for government?

The First Minister: Rod, you have to make a guess in these circumstances, do you not? Most Government departments will seek to include one measure in each Queen's Speech. They will not always be lucky but, sometimes, as the Home Office has managed this year, they will have four measures in the Queen's Speech. We must guess what we are competing with when we try to bring forward legislation. We can also look to the Scottish Parliament to see how many Bills it passes in an average year. It is a bit early to tell what an average year is as yet because it, like us, has only been in existence for two and three quarter years. However, it has been passing about 10 measures a year. We must try to work out what is a reasonable share for us in terms of primary legislation. When there are 25 Bills in a typical Queen's Speech, should we be looking to include one or two Bills, or one major Bill and one small, tidying-up measure?

oedd, yn ôl a ddeallaf fi, ddim Mesurau i Gymru'n unig am ymron i 300 mlynedd. Ni wn yn ôl pa gymhariaeth yr ydych eisiau gweithio, David, ond cafwyd gwelliant o 500 y cant, a bwriadwn wella hynny ymhellach. Byddai'n dda pe gallem maes o law sicrhau dau Fesur y flwyddyn, ynghyd â rhai mân fesurau tacluso.

Mae'n bwysig cofio ein bod mewn cystadleuaeth ag adrannau'r Llywodraeth. Nid adran o'r Llywodraeth mohonom ni; yr ydym yn gorff ar wahân. Er hynny, cystadlwn ag adrannau'r Llywodraeth yn yr un modd ag y gwnâi'r hen Swyddfa Gymreig. Lle byddai hi'n arfer cystadlu a methu dod â mesurau ymlaen—neu nad oedd ganddi unrhyw fesurau yr ystyriai ei bod yn werth dod â hwy ymlaen—yr ydym ni, yn anorfod, oherwydd natur y corff hwn, yn cynhyrchu mwy o ddeddfwriaeth ac felly'n cystadlu â'r Swyddfa Gartref, a chyrrff eraill, i gael pasio'r ddeddfwriaeth honno.

Rod Richards: Yr wyf yn bryderus ynghylch yr hyn y mae'r Prif Weinidog newydd ei ddweud. Mae'n proffwydo yn barod y caiff Cymru, neu y bydd arni angen, ddau Fesur, neu ddwy Ddeddf iddi'i hun yn y blynyddoedd a ddaw. Onid llywodraeth wedi mynd o'i chof yw hyn? Onid hunan-gyfiawnhad dros lywodraethu yw hyn?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Rod, mae'n rhaid bwrw amcan yn yr amgylchiadau hyn, onid oes? Bydd y rhan fwyaf o adrannau'n ceisio cynnwys un mesur ymhob Araith y Frenhines. Ni fyddant yn lwcus bob tro ond, weithiau, fel y llwyddodd y Swyddfa Gartref eleni, cânt bedwar mesur yn Araith y Frenhines. Rhaid inni ddyfalu beth yr ydym yn cystadlu yn ei erbyn pan geisiwn ddod â deddfwriaeth ymlaen. Gallwn hefyd edrych tua Senedd yr Alban i weld sawl Mesur mae hithau'n eu pasio mewn blwyddyn arferol. Mae ychydig yn gynnar i ddweud beth yw blwyddyn arferol hyd yma, oherwydd, fel ni, dim ond ers dwy flynedd a thri chwarter y mae mewn bodolaeth. Fodd bynnag, mae wedi bod yn pasio rhyw 10 mesur y flwyddyn. Rhaid inni geisio gweithio allan beth sy'n gyfran resymol i ni yn nhermau deddfwriaeth sylfaenol. Pan geir 25 Mesur mewn Araith nodweddiadol gan y Frenhines, a ddylem fod yn edrych i gynnwys un neu

ddau Fesur, ynteu un Mesur mawr ac un mesur bach, i dacluso pethau?

Rod Richards: I think that the First Minister may have missed the point I was trying to make: why do we always need more legislation? He is forecasting more legislation of a type that he cannot even possibly begin to outline or foresee.

Rod Richards: Credaf efallai fod y Prif Weinidog wedi colli'r pwynt yr oeddwn yn ceisio'i wneud: pam mae angen mwy o ddeddfwriaeth arnom o hyd? Mae'n proffwydo mwy o ddeddfwriaeth o fath nad oes posiblirwydd, hyd yn oed, iddo allu dechrau ei hamlinellu na'i rhagweld.

The First Minister: If you had only sat down and been a little less impatient you would have realised that we are putting forward six Bills. They will not be included in the first year. If you do not agree with legislation, I do not know why you stood to be elected to the National Assembly in the first place. Why did you also become a Member of Parliament, when one of the jobs is to work in the House of Commons legislation factory? You may also have had responsibility for bringing forward Bills when you were a Minister. That is one of the jobs. You do it when it is needed, not for its own sake. The issue then arises of how do we compete against the big Whitehall battalions to ensure that we manage to bring forward our share of legislation. To say that legislation is perhaps not a good idea after all, makes me think that you should have followed a different career in the first place, Rod.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Pe baech chi ond wedi eistedd i lawr a bod ychydig yn fwy amyneddgar buasech wedi sylweddoli ein bod yn rhoi chwe Mesur ger bron. Ni chânt eu cynnwys yn y flwyddyn gyntaf. Os nad ydych yn cytuno â deddfwriaeth, ni wn pam y gwnaethoch sefyll i gael eich ethol i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn y lle cyntaf. Pam hefyd yr aethoch yn Aelod Seneddol, pan mai un o'r tasgau yw gweithio yn ffatri ddeddfau Tŷ'r Cyffredin? Efallai hefyd y bu gennyh gyfrifoldeb dros ddod â Mesurau ymlaen pan oeddech chi'n Weinidog. Dyna un o'r dyletswyddau. Fe'i gwnewch pan fydd angen, nid er ei fwyn ei hun. Wedyn cyfyd y cwestiwn sut yr ydym yn cystadlu â bataliynau mawr Whitehall i sicrhau y llwyddwn i ddod â'n cyfran deg o ddeddfwriaeth ymlaen. I chi ddweud efallai nad ydyw deddfwriaeth yn syniad da wedi'r cwbl, mae'n gwneud i mi feddwl y dylasech fod wedi dilyn gyrfa wahanol yn y lle cyntaf, Rod.

Of the Bills before us, the education proposals are undoubtedly the biggest, because they give additional force to the vision set out in 'The Learning Country' and in our recent statement on higher education. The land use planning proposals will follow a recent consultation on improving the system in Wales, under the heading 'Planning: Delivering for Wales'. As it has already been mentioned, we have not listed our approval in principle for the primary legislation to enact our fundamental reforms of the NHS, which is currently before the Houses of Parliament. There are some other tidying-up measures, such as the Audit Bill to unify the Welsh audit functions along the lines that have already been carried out in Scotland and Northern Ireland, and the Housing Ombudsman Bill to extend the existing functions of the ombudsman to the housing

O'r Mesurau ger ein bron, y cynigion ar addysg, yn ddi-os, yw'r mwyaf, gan eu bod yn rhoi grym ychwanegol i'r weledigaeth a amlinellwyd yn 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu' ac yn ein datganiad diweddar ar addysg uwch. Bydd y cynigion cynllunio ar gyfer defnydd tir yn dilyn ymgynghoriad diweddar ar wella'r drefn yng Nghymru, dan y pennawd 'Cynllunio: Cyflawni dros Gymru'. Fel a grybwyllwyd eisoes, nid ydym wedi rhestru ein cymeradwyaeth mewn egwyddor i'r ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol i weithredu'n diwygiadau sylfaenol i'r GIG, sydd ar hyn o bryd ger bron y Senedd. Mae ambell fesur tacluso arall, megis y Mesur Archwilio i unoli swyddogaethau archwilio Cymru ar hyd y llinellau a ddilynwyd eisoes yn yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon, a'r Mesur Ombwdsmon Tai i ymestyn swyddogaethau presennol yr ombwdsmon i'r sector tai, fel y gall

sector, so that it can act as a regulator of complaints in the case of registered social landlords.

4:20 p.m.

There is also legislation to address two specific Welsh legislative issues. The first is the management of common land. It may not be a big issue, and it certainly is not a big issue in England, and will never be subject to legislation there. It is a much bigger issue in Wales. This is a classic example of where we need the House of Commons' legislative facilities to pass a Bill on a specific Welsh problem, namely overgrazing on our commons. That does not seem to occur outside Wales to such a degree that would cause people to consider legislation necessary.

The second issue is the termination of the requirement to hold regular ballots on Sunday opening. I do not know whether anyone else here, like me, ought to declare an interest, as Sunday is the only day that I ever have a drink in a pub. Perhaps it is also worth noting that, had the original Welsh Sunday Closing Act of 1881 not been passed by the indefatigable John Roberts—the Liberal MP and great temperance figure who developed the suburb of Everton in Liverpool—and had he not established the principle of Wales-only legislation after 300 years without such legislation, we might not be here today. If this proposal is passed, we would arrive at a situation of no further legislation on Sunday opening, which would terminate the requirement on local authorities to consider holding a ballot. Also, as part of the partnership Government's commitments, we are again putting forward proposals to make St David's Day a bank holiday, and on the Passenger Transport Bill to give us similar powers to those already enjoyed in England in relation to rail and other forms of public transport.

On the amendments—

Owen John Thomas: Darllenaf yn *The Western Mail* heddiw fod y Rhyddfrydwyr yn hawlio'r clod eto am ymgyrchu dros wneud Dydd Gŵyl Dewi yn ŵyl genedlaethol, yn

weithredu fel rheoleiddiwr cwynion yn achos landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig.

Mae deddfwriaeth hefyd i fynd i'r afael â dau fater deddfwriaethol penodol i Gymru. Y cyntaf yw rheoli tir comin. Efallai nad yw'n fater mawr, ac yn sicr nid yw'n fater mawr yn Lloegr, ac ni fydd byth yn destun deddfwriaeth yn y wlad honno. Mae'n fater llawer mwy yng Nghymru. Dyma enghraifft glasurrol o fan lle mae arnom angen cyfleusterau deddfwriaethol Tŷ'r Cyffredin i basio Mesur ar broblem benodol i Gymru, sef gorbori ar ein tiroedd comin. Nid yw hynny fel petai'n digwydd y tu allan i Gymru i'r fath raddau a fyddai'n achosi i bobl ystyried fod angen deddfwriaeth.

Yr ail fater yw rhoi diwedd ar y gofyniad i gynnal pleidleisiau rheolaidd ar agor ar y Sul. Ni wn a ddylai unrhyw un arall yma, fel fi, ddatgan buddiant, gan mai dydd Sul yw'r unig ddiwrnod y caf fi ddiod mewn tafarn. Efallai ei bod yn werth nodi hefyd, pe na bai'r Ddeddf Gymreig wreiddiol i Gau'r Tafarnau ar y Sul wedi'i phasio yn 1881 gan y diflino John Roberts—yr AS Rhyddfrydol a'r dirwestwr mawr a ddatblygodd faestref Everton yn Lerpwl—a phe na bai yntau wedi sefydlu'r egwyddor o ddeddfwriaeth i Gymru'n unig ar ôl 300 mlynedd heb ddeddfwriaeth o'r fath, efallai na fyddem yma heddiw. Os caiff y cynnig hwn ei basio, byddem yn cyrraedd sefyllfa lle na fyddai dim mwy o ddeddfu ar agor ar y Sul, a fyddai hefyd yn rhoi terfyn ar y gofyniad ar awdurdodau lleol i ystyried cynnal pleidlais. Hefyd, fel rhan o ymrwymadau'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth, yr ydym eto'n cyflwyno cynigion i wneud dydd Gŵyl Dewi'n ŵyl banc, ac ar y Mesur Cludiant i Deithwyr i roi pwerau tebyg i ni i'r rhai a fwynheir eisoes yn Lloegr mewn perthynas â chludiant cyhoeddus ar y rheilffyrdd a ffurfiau eraill ar drafnidiaeth.

Ar y gwelliannau—

Owen John Thomas: I read in *The Western Mail* today that the Liberal Democrats are again taking the plaudits for campaigning for St David's Day to be made a national

ogystal ag am y Mesur Trafnidiaeth. Fodd bynnag, Plaid Cymru a roddodd gynnig gerbron y Cynulliad i wneud Dydd Gŵyl Dewi yn ŵyl genedlaethol. Gwrthwynebodd Peter Black ein hymdrechion yn y cyn Bwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a'r Amgylchedd i gael mwy o ddweud i Gymru o ran cludiant—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. This is an intervention. You must finish.

Owen John Thomas: Y cwestiwn yw, pam nad ydych wedi cynnwys rhywbeth yn y cynnig hwn, Rhodri, a fyddai'n sicrhau y caiff buddiannau Cymru sylw pan fydd Tŷ'r Cyffredin yn ystyried y Mesur Cyfathrebu? Mae'n bwysig, heb gynrychiolaeth Ofcom, eich bod yn mynd ar drywydd hynny, neu bydd Cymru yn colli allan.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr wyf yn flin imi roi'r cyfle ichi wastraffu munud o fy amser i. Yr oedd eich ymyriad yn hollol ddbwynt. Nid ydych yn deall y broses ddeddfwriaethol o gwbl, mae arnaf ofn.

On Plaid Cymru's amendment 1, it is wrong to simply imply that you can have legislation to be nice to the public sector without any mention as to what you are referring in this regard. Likewise, on amendment 2, we have major powers in legislation—

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Will you take an intervention?

The First Minister: No, you should have told Owen John Thomas to shut up a minute or two earlier. Amendment 2 mentions legislation to meet housing needs. Significant legislation on categories of homelessness has already been achieved. Our national housing strategy, which does not require legislation, is being turned into an action plan for implementation. Therefore we will not support that amendment.

Amendment 3 deals with tuition fees. We strongly urge central Government to dispense with tuition fees and to go for the graduate tax. I have always been committed to establishing a graduate tax in place of tuition

holiday, as well as for the Transport Bill. However, it was Plaid Cymru that put the motion before the Assembly to make St David's Day a national holiday. Peter Black opposed our efforts in the former Local Government and Environment Committee to get more say for Wales on transport—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Ymyriad yw hwn. Rhaid ichi orffen.

Owen John Thomas: The question is, why have you not included anything in this motion, Rhodri, to ensure that attention is given to Wales's interests when the House of Commons considers the Communications Bill? It is important, without Ofcom's representation, that you follow that up, or Wales will lose out.

The First Minister: I am sorry that I gave you the chance to waste a minute of my time. Your intervention was completely pointless. You do not understand the legislative process at all, I am afraid.

Ar welliant 1 gan Plaid Cymru, mae'n anghywir awgrymu'n syml y gallwch gael deddfwriaeth i fod yn glên gyda'r sector cyhoeddus heb unrhyw sôn am beth yr ydych yn cyfeirio ato yn hyn o beth. Yn yr un modd, ar welliant 2, mae gennym bwerau mawr mewn deddfwriaeth—

Ieuan Wyn Jones: A gymerwch chi ymyriad?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Na wna, dylasech fod wedi dweud wrth Owen John Thomas am gau ei ben funud neu ddau yn ôl. Mae gwelliant 2 yn sôn am ddeddfwriaeth i ateb anghenion tai. Eisoed sicrhawyd deddfwriaeth arwyddocaol ar gategorïau o ddigartrefedd. Mae'n strategaeth dai genedlaethol, nad oed angen deddfwriaeth ar ei chyfer, yn cael ei throï'n gynllun gweithredu ar gyfer ei rhoi ar waith. Felly ni wnawn gefnogi'r gwelliant hwnnw.

Mae gwelliant 3 yn ymdrin â ffioedd dysgu. Yr ydym yn annog y Llywodraeth ganolog yn gryf i wneud i ffwrdd â ffioedd dysgu a mynd am y dreth i raddedigion. Yr wyf fi bob amser wedi bod yn ymroddedig i sefydlu

fees. Jane Davidson has taken up this matter with Margaret Hodge, following the publication of the Rees report. I hope that we will not require further action on this matter, because it is premature while the review is ongoing. We can consider it again if the Department for Education and Skills review comes out the wrong way, when we can ask for it to be devolved to us, or for some other such course of action. I do not want to cross too many bridges before we come to them. We will have many chances to consider that issue again. We do not support that amendment on the grounds that it is premature while the DfES review is ongoing.

It is not clear what amendment 4 seeks to do by encouraging joint working between local authorities and other organisations.

4:30 p.m.

Mick Bates: Will you clarify your comments on amendment 3? It seems to me that you made a commitment to propose a Bill to abolish tuition fees in Wales, which is a big step in terms of how we could move the agenda forward. I congratulate you on your willingness to do that and to stand up for Welsh students.

The First Minister: I have made it clear since 1997 that I am not in favour of tuition fees. I have always thought that a graduate tax is a much better solution to the funding problem. The Department for Education and Skills is conducting a review and we are hopeful of its outcome. If it goes the wrong way, we will continue to press for the abolition of tuition fees, either by devolving the issue to the Assembly, or by using another means of persuasion.

Jonathan Morgan *rose*—

The First Minister: I have been speaking for 12 minutes already, Jonathan.

I propose that we reject amendment 3 on the basis that it is premature, and also reject the proposals in amendment 4 for local government joint working.

treth graddedigion yn lle ffioedd dysgu. Mae Jane Davidson wedi codi'r mater hwn gyda Margaret Hodge, yn dilyn cyhoeddi adroddiad Rees. Gobeithiaf na fyddwn yn galw am weithredu pellach ar y mater hwn, oherwydd mae'n gynamserol tra bo'r adolygiad ar droed. Gallwn ei ystyried eto os na fydd canlyniad adolygiad yr Adran Addysg a Sgiliau wrth ein bodd, pryd y gallwn ofyn am iddo gael ei ddatganoli i ni, neu am ryw ffordd arall o weithredu. Nid oes arnaf eisiau croesi gormod o bontydd cyn inni ddod atynt. Cawn sawl cyfle eto i ystyried y mater hwnnw. Nid ydym yn cefnogi'r gwelliant hwnnw am y rheswm ei fod yn gynamserol tra mae adolygiad yr Adran Addysg a Sgiliau ar y gweill.

Nid yw'n glir beth y mae gwelliant 4 yn ceisio'i wneud drwy annog cydweithio rhwng awdurdodau lleol a chyrff eraill.

Mick Bates: A wnewch chi egluro'ch sylwadau ar welliant 3? Mae'n ymddangos i mi y gwnaethoch ymrwymiad i gynnig Mesur i ddileu ffioedd dysgu yng Nghymru, sydd yn gam mawr yn nhermau sut y gallem symud yr agenda ymlaen. Yr wyf yn eich llongyfarch ar eich parodrwydd i wneud hynny ac i sefyll dros fyfyrwyr Cymru.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr wyf wedi datgan yn glir ers 1997 nad ydwyf o blaid ffioedd dysgu. Yr wyf fi wastad wedi meddwl bod treth ar raddedigion yn ateb llawer gwell i'r broblem ariannu. Mae'r Adran Addysg a Sgiliau yn cynnal adolygiad ac yr ydym yn obeithiol ynglŷn â'i ganlyniad. Os aiff y ffordd anghywir, byddwn yn parhau i bwysio am ddileu ffioedd dysgu, un ai drwy ddatganoli'r mater i'r Cynulliad, neu drwy ddefnyddio modd arall o berswâd.

Jonathan Morgan *a gododd*—

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr wyf wedi siarad am 12 munud yn barod, Jonathan.

Cynigiaf ein bod yn gwrthod gwelliant 3 am ei fod yn gynamserol, ac y gwrthodwn hefyd y cynigion yng ngwelliant 4 am gydweithio â llywodraeth leol.

I turn to amendment 5. The Environment Agency was discussed earlier by Sue Essex. The cost of separating the Environment Agency Wales from its English counterpart is not worth considering, particularly as a financial and policy review has just rejected that course of action. On amendment 6, we can return to the issue of legislation on the Welsh language following the outcome of the Culture Committee's Welsh language review. It would be wrong to include that now.

On amendment 7, a proposal regarding St David's Day is included in our bid. Plaid Cymru, in preparing this amendment, must surely have taken into account the development on 15 March, when the Government said that it intends to adopt the private Bill proposed by the Liberal Democrats' House of Lords health spokesman, Lord Clement-Jones, as a Government Bill. We hope to see the Queen's signature on that Bill in July. Amendment 7 is therefore unnecessary. I commend these proposals to Members.

Peter Black: Point of order.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Does it arise directly from what the First Minister said?

Peter Black: It arises from the last 12-minute contribution. A few minutes ago, Owen John Thomas made an allegation that I opposed the proposal to make St David's Day a public holiday. I have never taken that stance. I ask you, Deputy Presiding Officer, to give him an opportunity to withdraw that allegation. [*Interruption.*]

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I did not hear an allegation, I am sorry. However, you may always seek to catch my eye in order to make any elucidation or statement that you wish, Peter.

Peter Black: I have just done that.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I know, I allowed you to do it when I should not have.

Trof at welliant 5. Trafodwyd Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn gynharach gan Sue Essex. Nid yw cost gwahanu Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd Cymru oddi wrth y corff cyfatebol yn Lloegr yn werth ei hystyried, yn enwedig gan fod adolygiad cyllid a pholisi newydd wrthod y dewis hwnnw ar gyfer gweithredu. Ar welliant 6, gallwn ddod yn ôl at fater deddfu ar yr iaith Gymraeg yn dilyn canlyniad adolygiad y Pwyllgor Diwylliant ar y Gymraeg. Anghywir fyddai cynnwys hynny yn awr.

Ar welliant 7, mae cynnig ynglŷn â Dydd Gŵyl Dewi wedi'i gynnwys yn ein cais. Mae'n rhaid fod Plaid Cymru, wrth baratoi'r gwelliant hwn, wedi ystyried y datblygiad ar 15 Mawrth, pryd y dywedodd y Llywodraeth ei bod yn bwriadu mabwysiadu'r Mesur preifat a gynigiwyd gan lefarydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ar ieched yn Nhŷ'r Arglwyddi, yr Arglwydd Clement-Jones, fel Mesur Llywodraeth. Gobeithiwn weld llofnod y Frenhines ar y Mesur hwnnw ym mis Gorffennaf. Mae gwelliant 7 yn ddiangen, felly. Cymeradwyaf y cynigion hyn i'r Aelodau.

Peter Black: Pwynt o drefn.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: A ydyw'n codi'n uniongyrchol o'r hyn a ddywedodd Prif Weinidog Cymru?

Peter Black: Mae'n codi o'r cyfraniad 12 munud diwethaf. Ychydig funudau yn ôl, honnodd Owen John Thomas fy mod i wedi gwrthwynebu'r cynnig i wneud Dydd Gŵyl Dewi'n ŵyl gyhoeddus. Nid wyf erioed wedi cymryd y safbwynt hwnnw. Gofynnaf i chi, Ddirprwy Lywydd, roi cyfle iddo dynnu'r honiad hwnnw'n ôl. [*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Ni chlywais i honiad, mae'n ddrwg gennyf. Fodd bynnag, mae croeso ichi geisio dal fy llygad er mwyn rhoi unrhyw eglurhad neu ddatganiad a fyynnwch, Peter.

Peter Black: Yr wyf newydd wneud hynny.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mi wn, gadewais i chi wneud hynny pan na ddylaswn.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 1: ar ôl 'Mawrth 2002' ym mhwynt 1, ychwanegu:

, ac yn galw ar y Llywodraeth i roi cynnig arall gerbron ar gyfer Mesur Gweithwyr y Sector Cyhoeddus, er mwyn amddiffyn buddiannau pobl sy'n gweithio yn y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd.

Cynigiau welliant 2. Ar ôl 'Mawrth 2002' ym mhwynt 1, ychwanegu:

, ac yn galw ar y Llywodraeth i roi cynnig arall gerbron ar gyfer Mesur Tai (Cymru), er mwyn diwallu anghenion penodol Cymru o ran tai.

Cynigiau welliant 3. Ar ôl 'Mawrth 2002' ym mhwynt 1, ychwanegu:

, ac yn galw ar y Llywodraeth i roi cynnig ychwanegol gerbron ar gyfer deddfwriaeth i ddileu ffioedd dysgu ym maes addysg uwch.

Cynigiau welliant 4. Ar ôl 'Mawrth 2002' ym mhwynt 1, ychwanegu:

, ac yn galw ar y Llywodraeth i roi cynnig ychwanegol gerbron ar gyfer deddfwriaeth sy'n rhoi pwerau cyffredinol i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gyfarwyddo awdurdodau lleol i weithio gyda'i gilydd er mwyn cyrraedd nodau penodol.

Cynigiau welliant 5. Ar ôl 'Mawrth 2002' ym mhwynt 1, ychwanegu:

, ac yn galw ar y Llywodraeth i roi cynnig ychwanegol gerbron ar gyfer deddfwriaeth sy'n ymwneud ag asiantaethau amgylcheddol yng Nghymru: a fydd yn datganoli swyddogaethau Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ac yn golygu y gellir integreiddio'r cyrff cyhoeddus amgylcheddol a noddir gan y Cynulliad yn un corff.

Cynigiau welliant 6. Ar ôl 'Mawrth 2002' ym mhwynt 1, ychwanegu:

, ac yn galw ar y Llywodraeth i roi cynnig ychwanegol gerbron ar gyfer deddfwriaeth i gryfhau sefyllfa'r iaith Gymraeg.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 1: add after 'March 2002' in point 1:

, and calls upon the Government to make an additional proposal for a Public Sector Workers Bill, to protect the interests of people currently working in the public sector in Wales.

I propose amendment 2. Add after 'March 2002' in point 1:

, and calls upon the Government to make an additional proposal for a Housing (Wales) Bill, to meet the particular housing needs of Wales.

I propose amendment 3. Add after 'March 2002' in point 1:

, and calls upon the Government to make an additional proposal for legislation to abolish tuition fees in higher education.

I propose amendment 4. Add after 'March 2002' in point 1:

, and calls upon the Government to make an additional proposal for legislation giving the National Assembly general powers to direct local authorities to work together to achieve specific aims.

I propose amendment 5. Add after 'March 2002' in point 1:

, and calls upon the Government to make an additional proposal for legislation pertaining to environment agencies in Wales: devolving the functions of the Environment Agency to the National Assembly and enabling the integration of environmental Assembly sponsored public bodies within one body.

I propose amendment 6. Add after 'March 2002' in point 1:

, and calls upon the Government to make a further proposal for legislation to strengthen the position of the Welsh language.

Cynigiau welliant 7. Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn nodi â siom nad yw Llywodraeth y DU wedi gweithredu penderfyniad unfrydol y Cynulliad o blaid gwneud Dydd Gŵyl Dewi yn ŵyl y banc yng Nghymru, ac nad yw wedi gwahardd hysbysebu tybaco yng Nghymru.

Gwrandewais â chryn ddiddordeb ar sylwadau'r Prif Weinidog ar ein gwelliannau ac ar ei ffordd ddeheuig o osgoi datgelu ei farn arnynt. Yn anffodus, bydd yr anhawster a brofw'n wrth geisio cael y Prif Weinidog i roi ei farn ar unrhyw beth—ar wahân i'r ffaith ei fod am gadw Mike German yn y Cabinet—yn rhan o fy nghyfraniad.

Hwn fydd cyfle olaf y Llywodraeth hon i ddylanwadu ar Araith y Frenhines. Erbyn Araith y Frenhines yn 2003, bydd gennym Lywodraeth newydd yn y Cynulliad. Felly mae cynnwys y cynnig ger ein bron heddiw yn dweud llawer am gyfeiriad a phwyslais y Llywodraeth bresennol. Mae'r hyn a gynhwyswyd yn rhaglen y Llywodraeth yr un mor arwyddocaol â'r hyn a hepgorwyd.

Gŵyr pawb mai'r Mesur cyntaf y byddai grŵp Plaid Cymru am ei gyflwyno i San Steffan fyddai Mesur i gael senedd ddeddfwriaethol i Gymru. Pe baem yn disgwyl i Lywodraeth bresennol y Cynulliad wneud hynny, mae'n amlwg mai disgwyl y byddem ni. A beth am y comisiwn annibynnol a sefydlwyd gan y glymblaid? Os bydd yn debyg i'r ymchwiliad i ddulliau pleidleisio llywodraeth leol, nid ydym am roi gormod o ffydd yn y broses. Caiff canlyniad yr ymchwiliad hwnnw ei gyhoeddi'n fuan ac, yn ôl adroddiadau yn y wasg, bydd yn argymhell cynllun pleidlais sengl drosglwyddadwy ar gyfer etholiadau lleol. Serch hynny, mae'r Llywodraeth hon wedi cyfaddef, fwy neu lai, na fydd newid yn y dull presennol o bleidleisio cyn etholiadau 2003, ac felly ni fydd wedi ei sefydlu erbyn etholiadau lleol 2004.

Mae'n rhyfedd, felly, nad oes sôn yn y cynnig hwn am fwiad y Llywodraeth i

I propose amendment 7. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

notes with disappointment the inaction of the UK Government to give effect to the National Assembly's unanimous resolution in favour of making St David's Day a bank holiday in Wales and the failure to prohibit tobacco advertising in Wales.

I listened with great interest to the First Minister's comments on our amendments and the adroit way in which he avoided giving his opinion. Unfortunately, the difficulty we experience in trying to get the First Minister to express his opinion on anything—with the exception of the fact that he wants to keep Mike German in the Cabinet—will form part of my contribution.

This is the present Government's final opportunity to influence the Queen's Speech. By the time we come to the Queen's Speech in 2003, we will have a new Assembly Government. Therefore, the contents of today's motion reveals a great deal about the present Government's direction and emphasis. What is included in the Government's programme is just as significant as what has been omitted.

Everyone knows that the first Bill that the Plaid Cymru group would wish to propose to Westminster would be a Bill seeking a legislative parliament for Wales. If we were to wait for the present Assembly Government to do that, it is clear that we would have to wait a long time. And what about the independent commission established by the coalition? If it is anything like the investigation into voting methods for local government, the process will do little to inspire confidence among us. The result of that investigation will be published shortly and, according to press reports, it will recommend a single transferable vote scheme for local elections. However, this Government has, to all intents and purposes, admitted that the current voting methods will not be changed before the 2003 elections, and that the new system therefore will not be in place for the 2004 local elections.

It is strange, therefore, that there is no mention in this motion of the Government's

ddeddfu i newid y system bleidleisio. Pan fyddwch yn gofyn i'r Prif Weinidog am ei safbwynt ar y mater hwnnw, ni chewch ateb. Yn yr un ffordd, ni wyddom beth yw ei safbwynt ar faterion eraill a godwyd y prynhawn yma. Beth yw ei safbwynt ar gael senedd ddeddfwriaethol? Ni wyddom. Felly, pan fydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn cytuno â'r Prif Weinidog ar sefydlu ymchwiliad annibynnol neu gomisiwn annibynnol, y perygl yw na fydd unrhyw weithredu ar yr argymhellion a wneir.

One important issue that we all face these days is the threat to our public services. The First Minister should realise that the demand for legislation to protect those currently working in the public services has not originated from Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales, but from the trade union movement. The threat to those workers has been mentioned by John Monks, the general secretary of the UK's Trades Union Congress. Those of us who believe in the public service ethos, value those who work in our public services. However, their rights, as the First Minister must know, are constantly being eroded. Tony Blair, the UK Prime Minister, tried to erode them even further last week on the European stage. His disgraceful cosyng up to Silvio Berlusconi was described by John Monks in words that would be ruled out of order by the Deputy Presiding Officer if I were to repeat them. Tony Blair presented plans to reduce workers rights to the worst level in Europe, rather than aspiring to the best. John Monks described him as one of the most right-wing leaders in Europe. For example, the UK Government does not want Welsh steelworkers to have the same rights as the Dutch; it wants the Dutch to be reduced to the same level as the United Kingdom—that is, the same as the approach adopted by previous Conservative administrations.

We have seen that public sector workers in Wales feel angry at the refusal of the Labour Governments at Westminster and Cardiff bay to help them. Benefits Agency workers came to the Assembly with their grievances and Labour turned a deaf ear to their pleas. Postal workers came to see us at the Assembly

intention to legislate to change the voting system. When you ask the First Minister for his viewpoint on that issue, you will not get an answer. By the same token, we do not know his view on other matters raised this afternoon. What is his opinion on having a legislative parliament? We do not know. Therefore, when the Liberal Democrats agree with the First Minister on establishing an independent investigation or an independent commission, the danger is that any recommendations made will be ignored.

Un mater pwysig a wynebwn i gyd y dyddiau hyn yw'r bygythiad i'n gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Dylai'r Prif Weinidog sylweddoli nad oddi wrth Blaid Cymru—The Party of Wales y tarddodd y galw am ddeddfwriaeth i warchod y rhai sy'n gweithio ar hyn o bryd yn y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, ond oddi wrth y mudiad undebau llafur. Soniwyd am y bygythiad i'r gweithwyr hynny gan John Monks, ysgrifennydd cyffredinol Cyngres Undebau Llafur y DU. Mae'r rheini ohonom sy'n credu yn ethos gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yn gwerthfawrogi'r rhai sy'n gweithio yn ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Ond mae eu hawliau, fel y gŵyr y Prif Weinidog, mae'n rhaid, yn cael eu herydu'n gyson. Ceisiodd Tony Blair, Prif Weinidog y DU, eu herydu ymhellach fyth yr wythnos ddiwethaf ar y llwyfan Ewropeaidd. Disgrifiwyd ei ymgreinio gwarthus i Silvio Berlusconi gan John Monks mewn geiriau y byddai'r Dirprwy Lywydd yn fy ngheryddu amdanynt pe bawn yn eu hailadrodd. Cyflwynodd Tony Blair gynlluniau i leihau hawliau gweithwyr i'r lefel waethaf yn Ewrop, yn hytrach nag anelu at fod y gorau. Disgrifiodd John Monks ef fel un o'r arweinwyr mwyaf adain-dde yn Ewrop. Er enghraifft, nid oes ar Lywodraeth y DU eisiau i weithwyr dur Cymru gael yr un hawliau â'r Iseldirwyr; mae eisiau i'r Iseldirwyr ddod i lawr i'r un lefel â'r Deyrnas Unedig—hynny yw, yr un agwedd ag a gymerwyd gan lywodraethau Ceidwadol yn y gorffennol.

Yr ydym wedi gweld bod gweithwyr sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru'n teimlo'n flin am wrthodiad y Llywodraethau Llafur yn San Steffan a bae Caerdydd i'w helpu. Daeth gweithwyr yr Asiantaeth Fudd-daliadau i'r Cynulliad gyda'u cwynion a throdd Llafur glust fyddar i'w ple. Daeth gweithwyr post

because they had been bitterly disappointed by the response they had received from Labour. Again—in case the First Minister missed it—John Monks has called for the UK Government to protect the rights of public sector workers who have been transferred to the private sector. Their working conditions and pension rights are particularly vulnerable because the current Transfer of Undertakings (Protection of Employment) Regulations 1981 does not offer sufficient protection.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You cannot see him, Ieuan, but are you giving way to Huw Lewis?

Huw Lewis: Thank you for giving way, Ieuan. While you are expressing your concern for trade unionism, can you tell us how many of your party's Assembly Members have bothered to join a trade union? Also, would a Plaid Cymru Government, if such a thing comes to pass, have any plans to introduce legislation to separate Wales from the rest of the UK?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You need to wind up, Ieuan.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I have an intervention to reply to.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: You have some injury time.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: That was an interesting intervention from Huw on the day he has criticised, not Plaid Cymru, but his own First Minister for his failure to defend the public sector. I suggest that he reads again the second page of today's *Welsh Mirror*, where he makes that attack more forcefully than I ever could.

Although the First Minister often tells us that he has some sympathy with our amendments, he always finds the odd dot or comma that he can disagree with and therefore say that he cannot support the amendment. All we are asking the National Assembly Government to do today is back the spirit of this amendment that would give a clear signal to those working in the public sector that the Government of Wales is behind them. John

i'n gweld ni yn y Cynulliad oherwydd yr oeddent wedi'u siomi'n aruthrol gan yr ymateb a gawsant gan Lafur. Eto—rhag ofn i'r Prif Weinidog ei golli—mae John Monks wedi galw am i Lywodraeth y DU warchod hawliau gweithwyr sector cyhoeddus a drosglwyddwyd i'r sector preifat. Mae eu hamodau gwaith a'u hawliau pensiwn yn arbennig o fregus gan nad yw'r Rheoliadau Trosglwyddo Ymgymeriadau (Gwarchod Cyflogaeth) 1981 yn cynnig gwarchodaeth ddigonol.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Ni allwch ei weld, Ieuan, ond a wnewch chi ildio i Huw Lewis?

Huw Lewis: Diolch am ildio, Ieuan. Tra'ch bod chi'n mynegi'ch pryder dros undebaeth lafur, a allwch ddweud wrthym sawl un o Aelodau Cynulliad eich plaid sydd wedi trafferthu ymuno ag undeb llafur? Hefyd, a fyddai gan Lywodraeth Plaid Cymru, os digwydd y fath beth, unrhyw gynlluniau i gyflwyno deddfwriaeth i wahanu Cymru oddi wrth weddill y DU?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae angen ichi ddirwyn i ben, Ieuan.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Mae gennyf ymyriad i ymateb iddo.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae gennych ychydig o amser ychwanegol.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Yr oedd hwnnw'n ymyriad diddorol gan Huw ar y diwrnod y mae wedi beirniadu, nid Plaid Cymru, ond ei Brif Weinidog ei hun am fethu ag amddiffyn y sector cyhoeddus. Awgrymaf ei fod yn ailddarllen tudalen dau *Welsh Mirror* heddiw, lle gwna ef yr ymosodiad hwnnw'n llawer mwy grymus nag a allwn i fyth.

Er bod y Prif Weinidog yn dweud wrthym yn aml fod ganddo beth cydymdeimlad â'n gwelliannau, mae bob amser yn dod o hyd i ambell ddot neu goma y gall anghytuno ag ef a dweud felly na all gefnogi'r gwelliant. Y cyfan yr ydym yn gofyn i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ei wneud heddiw yw cefnogi ysbryd y gwelliant hwn a fyddai'n rhoi arwydd clir i weithwyr yn y sector cyhoeddus fod Llywodraeth Cymru y tu cefn

Monks has told the UK Government that it will see the support of public sector workers haemorrhage away at the next general election; unless Labour Assembly Members support public sector workers, they will also see their votes haemorrhage away in 2003.

John Griffiths: I welcome these suggested inclusions in Westminster's future primary legislation. I agree with the First Minister that this is a step forward in several specific Welsh Bills, because it is a recognition of devolution and enables us to take forward our aims and objectives in Wales. It is a big step forward, but it is fair to say that we need further improvement and we will continue to build on it as we develop further.

On the specific Bills, the suggestion that we include a Bill to make St David's Day a bank holiday in Wales, as we have discussed many times here, is welcome. It should be an additional bank holiday, and in making it so, we would be showing how we are able to achieve practical benefits for Wales as a result of devolution. We could link that into—

Janet Ryder *rose*—

John Griffiths: In a moment, Janet.

We could link that into a greater celebration of Welsh culture, which the Assembly could effect by ensuring that schools, for example, step up their St David's Day celebrations. There are fears that it might, in fact, have the opposite effect, but the Assembly could ensure that that was not the case and it would be valuable for Wales in improving morale and allowing that greater celebration of culture.

Janet Ryder: We have seen how the Irish celebrate St Patrick's Day, in Ireland and beyond. Do you agree that if we could replicate that for St David's Day, it would be a valuable way of increasing knowledge of Wales and of selling Wales? We should be using this as a platform on which to sell Wales to the rest of the world.

iddynt. Mae John Monks wedi dweud wrth Lywodraeth y DU y gwêl gefnogaeth gweithwyr y sector cyhoeddus yn llifo i ffwrdd yn yr etholiad cyffredinol nesaf; os na fydd Aelodau Llafur y Cynulliad yn cefnogi gweithwyr y sector cyhoeddus, fe welant hwythau eu pleidleisiau ar drai yn 2003.

John Griffiths: Croesawaf yr awgrymiadau hyn i'w cynnwys yn neddfwriaeth sylfaenol San Steffan yn y dyfodol. Cytunaf â'r Prif Weinidog fod hwn yn gam ymlaen mewn sawl Mesur Cymreig penodol, oherwydd mae'n cydnabod datganoli ac yn ein galluogi i fynd ymlaen â'n nod a'n hamcanion yng Nghymru. Mae'n gam mawr ymlaen, ond mae'n deg dweud fod angen gwella ymhellach ac fe wnawn barhau i adeiladu arno wrth inni ddatblygu ymhellach.

Ar y Mesurau penodol, mae'r awgrym ein bod yn cynnwys Mesur i wneud Dydd Gŵyl Dewi yn ŵyl banc yng Nghymru, fel a drafodwyd gennym yma sawl gwaith, yn un i'w groesawu. Dylai fod yn ŵyl banc ychwanegol, ac wrth sicrhau hynny, byddem yn dangos sut yr ydym yn gallu sicrhau manteision ymarferol i Gymru o ganlyniad i ddatganoli. Gallem gysylltu hynny â—

Janet Ryder *a gododd*—

John Griffiths: Mewn munud, Janet.

Gallem gysylltu hynny â dathliad mwy o ddiwylliant Cymru, y gallai'r Cynulliad ei drefnu drwy sicrhau bod ysgolion, er enghraifft, yn gwneud mwy o'u dathliadau Gŵyl Ddewi. Y mae ofnau y gallai, mewn gwirionedd, gael yr effaith hollol groes, ond gallai'r Cynulliad sicrhau na ddigwyddai hynny a byddai'n werthfawr i Gymru o ran gwella morâl a chaniatáu'r dathliad mwy hwnnw o ddiwylliant.

Janet Ryder: Yr ydym wedi gweld sut y mae'r Gwyddelod yn dathlu Gŵyl Sant Padrig, yn Iwerddon a thu hwnt. A ydych yn cytuno pe gallem ddyblygu hynny ar gyfer Gŵyl Ddewi, y byddai'n ffordd werthfawr o gynyddu gwybodaeth am Gymru ac o werthu Cymru? Dylem fod yn defnyddio hyn fel llwyfan ar gyfer gwerthu Cymru i weddill y byd.

John Griffiths: I agree, Janet. Ireland has had great success in marketing itself. An example of that is how it uses St Patrick's Day celebrations to effectively sell Ireland across the world. We could learn a lot from that. We would have greater opportunities to do so if we went down this road.

Turning to the Education Bill and Assembly learning grants, these are vital for Wales. They make a political statement about the Government of Wales and its ambitions for ensuring that we address the need to widen access to higher education in Wales. We know that there is much to do because, unfortunately, Wales suffers considerable socio-economic disadvantage, and we must attract students, including mature students, from relatively deprived backgrounds and communities. Assembly learning grants would be an effective mechanism in going some way towards ensuring that that happens.

Finally, the Passenger Transport Bill is necessary. We need the organisational structures for the Assembly to be able to take forward public transport in Wales. We must have powers of direction over the Strategic Rail Authority. This has come home to me locally in trying to extend the Ebbw Vale passenger rail link from Cardiff to incorporate Newport. The Strategic Rail Authority is crucial—it gives strategic direction and proposals on which Railtrack must act. We have been confronted by many alleged difficulties in extending this passenger rail link to Newport, and if the Assembly had greater powers of direction over the SRA, it would help to ensure that the rightful ambitions of Ebbw Vale and Newport to establish this passenger rail link were realised. It would be extremely important for the Assembly's ambitions to have a properly integrated transport system in Wales, and I welcome the ambition to take the Bill forward on that basis.

David Melding: Listening to the First Minister, you would think that we have just been through some magnificent new-deal

John Griffiths: Yr wyf yn cytuno, Janet. Mae Iwerddon wedi cael llwyddiant mawr yn marchnata'i hun. Enghraifft o hynny yw'r modd y defnyddia ddathliadau Gŵyl Sant Padrig i werthu Iwerddon dros y byd. Gallem ddysgu llawer oddi wrth hynny. Byddai gennym well cyfleoedd i wneud hynny o fynd i lawr y ffordd hon.

A throi at y Mesur Addysg a grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad, mae'r rhain yn hanfodol i Gymru. Gwnânt ddatganiad gwleidyddol am Lywodraeth Cymru a'i huchelgeisiau i sicrhau ein bod yn edrych ar yr angen i ehangu mynediad i addysg uwch yng Nghymru. Gwyddom fod llawer i'w wneud oherwydd, yn anffodus, mae Cymru'n dioddef cryn anfantais economaidd-gymdeithasol, a rhaid inni ddenu myfyrwyr, gan gynnwys myfyrwyr aeddfed, o gefndiroedd a chymunedau cymharol ddifreintiedig. Byddai grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad yn fecanwaith effeithiol i fynd rywfaint o'r ffordd tuag at sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd.

Yn olaf, mae'r Mesur Cludiant i Deithwyr yn angenrheidiol. Mae arnom angen y strwythurau trefniadol i'r Cynulliad allu symud ymlaen â chludiant cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Rhaid inni gael pwerau cyfarwyddo dros yr Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol. Yr wyf wedi gweld hyn yn lleol wrth geisio estyn y gwasanaeth rheilffordd i deithwyr i Lyn Ebwy o Gaerdydd i gynnwys Casnewydd. Mae'r Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol yn hollbwysig—mae'n rhoi cyfarwyddyd a chynigion strategol y mae'n rhaid i Railtrack weithredu arnynt. Yr ydym wedi wynebu llawer o anawsterau honedig wrth geisio estyn y gwasanaeth trên hwn i Gasnewydd, a phe bai gan y Cynulliad fwy o bwerau cyfarwyddo dros yr awdurdod, byddai'n helpu i sicrhau y gwiredid dyheadau cyfiawn Glyn Ebwy a Chasnewydd am sefydlu'r cysylltiad rheilffordd hwn. Byddai'n eithriadol o bwysig i uchelgais y Cynulliad gael system drafnidiaeth integredig go iawn yng Nghymru, a chroesawaf yr uchelgais i fynd â'r Mesur yn ei flaen ar y sail honno.

David Melding: O wrando ar y Prif Weinidog, gallech feddwl ein bod newydd fod drwy ryw sefyllfa bargaen-newydd wych,

scenario where we have been showered by Wales-only Bills, transforming Wales's legislative system. The Justinian of our age sits there boasting about this massive increase in the amount of specific Welsh legislation during the last three years compared with the previous 600 years. I gently asked him to tell us what the Bills and Acts were. He came up with the Children's Commissioner Act—a truly worthy measure, which I fully supported—and the NHS (Wales) Bill. That is a draft bill that has still not been published. We will probably have gone through the first four-year term of the Assembly with just one Welsh-specific Act on the statute book. I do not know if that is a massive shift in how our constitutional arrangements are undertaken—I am yet to be persuaded. Members of the Cabinet are muttering among themselves—they should listen to how they have conducted the legislative programme.

4:40 p.m.

Let us consider the NHS (Wales) Bill. When it was announced by the First Minister, he boasted that he had secured it and that it was a vital part of the Queen's Speech that preserved our right to be able to legislate specifically for Welsh health reform. The Minister for Health and Social Services told us in June that the NHS (Wales) Bill would be used to deliver the radical changes proposed for the NHS—the most radical since the early 1970s. Within six weeks, the Minister for Health and Social Services had been humiliated and was forced to write to members of the Health and Social Services Committee stating that the Cabinet had been told that those reforms would have to be passed on an England and Wales Bill, and that the original NHS (Wales) Bill would be truncated and delayed, and would now only deal with community health councils. Community health councils are important, but when you talk about establishing a new structure for the commissioning of health services in Wales, this is pretty small beer compared with massive organisational changes. The First Minister has the cheek to stand at that podium and tell us that there has been an historical shift in how this country is governed. That is absolute nonsense and he

lle mae Mesurau i Gymru-yn-unig wedi'u pentyrru arnom, gan drawsnewid system ddeddfwriaethol Cymru. Mae Iwstinian ein hoes ni'n eistedd yn y fan honno'n brolio am y cynnydd enfawr hwn yn y ddeddfwriaeth benodol i Gymru yn ystod y tair blynedd diwethaf o gymharu â'r 600 mlynedd cyn hynny. Gofynnais yn fwyn iddo ddweud wrthym beth oedd y Mesurau a'r Deddfau hyn. Enwodd y Ddeddf Comisiynydd Plant—mesur gwirioneddol werth chweil, a gefnogais yn llawn—a Mesur GIG (Cymru). Mesur drafft yw hwnnw sydd yn dal heb ei gyhoeddi. Mae'n debyg y byddwn wedi mynd drwy dymor pedair blynedd cyntaf y Cynulliad gyda dim ond un Ddeddf benodol i Gymru ar y llyfr statud. Ni wn a yw hynny'n symudiad mawr yn y modd y gwneir ein trefniadau cyfansoddiadol—nid wyf wedi fy mherswadio eto. Mae aelodau'r Cabinet yn mwmian ymysg ei gilydd—dylent wrando ar sut y maent wedi rhedeg y rhaglen ddeddfwriaethol.

Gadewch inni ystyried Mesur GIG (Cymru). Pan y'i cyhoeddwyd gan y Prif Weinidog, broliodd mai ef oedd wedi ei sicrhau ac y byddai'n rhan allweddol o Araith y Frenhines a gadwai'n hawl ni i allu deddfu'n benodol ar gyfer diwygio iechyd yng Nghymru. Dywedodd y Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wrthym ym Mehefin y defnyddid Mesur GIG (Cymru) i gyflawni'r newidiadau radicalaidd a gynigid i'r GIG—y mwyaf radicalaidd ers y 1970au cynnar. O fewn chwe wythnos, yr oedd crib y Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wedi'i thorri ac fe'i gorfodwyd i ysgrifennu at aelodau'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn datgan y dywedwyd wrth y Cabinet y byddai'n rhaid pasio'r diwygiadau hynny ar Fesur i Gymru a Lloegr, ac y câ'r Mesur GIG (Cymru) gwreiddiol ei docio a'i ohirio, ac na fyddai bellach ond yn delio â chynghorau iechyd cymuned. Mae cynghorau iechyd cymuned yn bwysig, ond pan siaradwch am sefydlu strwythur newydd ar gyfer comisiynu gwasanaethau iechyd yng Nghymru, mae hyn yn eithaf tila o gymharu â newidiadau trefniadol enfawr. Mae gan y Prif Weinidog yr hyfdra i sefyll wrth y podiwm acw a dweud wrthym y bu symudiad hanesyddol yn

should be subjected to the most withering criticism for it.

The original intention was to publish drafts of a series of major Bills dealing with Wales. Therefore, if there were major public service changes, for example, in education and health, a Wales-only Bill would be published in draft. That would balance the form of executive devolution given to Wales, but not to Scotland and Northern Ireland, that gives us a minimal level of influence over primary legislation, and would afford us a level of pre-legislative scrutiny in the process. We would get the draft Bill, discuss it and it would then enter the formal legislative process in Parliament. None of these draft Bills have been proposed. Why is health and education now being dealt with in an England and Wales measure? Why has it not been separated out and dealt with in a Wales-only Bill? The answer is simple. The moment you deal with education on a Wales basis, you must also deal with it on an England basis. It is obvious that the Cabinet in London has told the Assembly Cabinet that such a constitutional precedent cannot be set and that it must continue to legislate through England and Wales measures. You have not convinced your colleagues or the Secretary of State for Wales, far less the Prime Minister.

Rod Richards: Do you recall the period when the former Secretary of State for Wales, Ron Davies, was taking the Government of Wales Bill through Parliament? Do you recall him saying time and time again that any Bills affecting Wales would be discussed here in the proposed Assembly, before a second reading in the House of Commons?

David Melding: I am grateful to my friend for making that point. Clearly, since devolution was put into effect, how Wales deals with primary legislation has not been altered to account for the fact that we have an Assembly that should influence primary legislation even though it cannot control it directly. It is instructive to consider what the First Minister bids for. I do not want to be dismissive of these measures, but some of them are hardly the meat and drink of the legislative programme, and they would not

y modd y llywodraethir y wlad hon. Nonsens pur yw hynny a dylid ei feirniadu'n hallt o'r herwydd.

Y bwriad gwreiddiol oedd cyhoeddi drafftiau o gyfres o Fesurau mawr yn delio â Chymru. Felly, pe bai newidiadau mawr mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, er enghraifft, ym myd addysg a iechyd, cyhoeddid Mesur i Gymru'n unig ar ffurf drafft. Byddai hynny'n cydbwysu'r ffurf ar ddatganoli gweithredol a roddwyd i Gymru, ond nid i'r Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon, sy'n rhoi'r lefel isaf o ddylanwad inni dros ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol, a lefel o arolygaeth cyn-deddfu inni yn y broses. Byddem yn cael y Mesur drafft, yn ei drafod ac wedyn byddai'n mynd i'r broses ddeddfu ffurfiol yn y Senedd. Nid oes dim un o'r Mesurau drafft hyn wedi'u cynnig. Pam y mae iechyd ac addysg bellach wedi'u cynnwys mewn mesur i Gymru a Lloegr? Pam nad yw wedi'i wahanu a'i drafod mewn Mesur i Gymru'n unig? Mae'r ateb yn syml. Y munud y dechreuwch ddelio ag addysg o safbwynt Cymru, rhaid ichi ddelio â hi hefyd o safbwynt Lloegr. Mae'n amlwg bod y Cabinet yn Llundain wedi dweud wrth Gabinet y Cynulliad na ellir gosod cysail gyfansoddiadol o'r fath a bod yn rhaid iddo barhau i ddeddfu drwy fesurau i Gymru a Lloegr. Nid ydych wedi darbwyllo'ch cyd-aelodau nac Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, I lai fyth Brif Weinidog y DU.

Rod Richards: A ydych yn cofio'r cyfnod pan oedd cyn Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, Ron Davies, yn mynd â Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru drwy'r Senedd? A gofiwch ef yn dweud dro ar ôl tro y câi unrhyw Fesurau a effeithiai ar Gymru eu trafod yma yn y Cynulliad arfaethedig, cyn cael ail ddarlleniad yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin?

David Melding: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'm cyfaill am wneud y pwynt hwnnw. Yn amlwg, ers i ddatganoli ddod i rym, nid yw'r modd y mae Cymru'n delio â deddfwriaeth sylfaenol wedi'i newid i adlewyrchu'r ffaith fod gennym Gynulliad a ddylai ddylanwadu ar ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol hyd yn oed er na all ei rheoli'n uniongyrchol. Mae'n ddiddorol ystyried beth y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru yn gofyn amdano. Nid oes arnaf eisiau wfftio'r mesurau hyn, ond go brin bod rhai ohonynt yn faterion deddfwriaethol o bwys mawr, ac

really affect the day-to-day lives of the people of Wales. For instance, Sunday opening is an important area to clean up, I grant you, and making St David's Day a public holiday would bring an important benefit. However, as far as governing our public services is concerned, they are of limited significance.

The two massive changes currently proceeding through Parliament relate to health and education, which are included in measures covering both England and Wales. The Minister for Health and Social Services had the good grace to concede to a full debate on the Bill on health reform in the Health and Social Services Committee and then in Plenary, and I thank her for that. At least she responded to criticism she received. However, the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning does not even consider it to be appropriate for the Assembly to discuss the Education Bill.

Mick Bates: Neither does your party.

David Melding: She had the cheek to tell me that it was just a skeleton measure, drafted in such a way as to give us maximum influence over secondary matters, and therefore we did not need to debate the issue before it was done and dusted in Parliament. I asked her just to read the Bill. I do not know if she has done that yet, but she had not done it at the time.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You need to wind up, David.

David Melding: I asked her to read the section that deals with the curriculum. There are 20 pages of clauses on the English curriculum and 20 pages of clauses on the Welsh curriculum, all drafted in the same style. Yet our Minister has the cheek to tell us that the drafting system is now different, and therefore we have maximum room for manoeuvre in terms of secondary legislation. We have none of that. You have gagged this Assembly, Minister. You want to get your measures through on the quiet, with minimum scrutiny. It is a disgrace to the lot of you. You need to learn some lessons on constitutional law.

ni fyddent mewn gwirionedd yn effeithio ar fywydau beunyddiol pobl Cymru. Er enghraifft, mae agor ar y Sul yn faes y mae'n bwysig ei dacluso, yr wyf yn cydnabod hynny, a byddai gwneud Dydd Gŵyl Dewi'n ŵyl gyhoeddus yn dod â budd pwysig. Fodd bynnag, yn nhermau rheoli'n gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, cyfyngedig yw eu harwyddocâd.

Mae'r ddau newid anferth sy'n mynd drwy'r Senedd ar hyn o bryd yn ymwneud â iechyd ac addysg, ac wedi'u cynnwys mewn mesurau ar gyfer Cymru a Lloegr ynghyd. Bu'r Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn ddigon graslon i ganiatáu dadl lawn ar y Mesur diwygio iechyd yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ac wedyn mewn Cyfarfod Llawn, a diolchaf iddi am hynny. O leiaf fe ymatebodd i'r feirniadaeth a gawsai. Ond nid yw'r Gweinidog Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes hyd yn oed o'r farn ei bod yn briodol i'r Cynulliad drafod y Mesur Addysg.

Mick Bates: Nid yw'ch plaid chithau chwaith.

David Melding: Yr oedd ganddi'r wyneb i ddweud wrthyf mai dim ond mesur sgerbwd ydoedd, wedi'i ddrafftio yn y fath fodd fel ag i roi'r dylanwad mwyaf posibl inni dros faterion eilaidd, ac felly nad oedd angen inni drafod y mater cyn i'r Senedd gau pen y mwdwl arno. Gofynnais iddi o leiaf ddarllen y Mesur. Ni wn a ydyw wedi gwneud hynny eto, ond nid oedd hi wedi gwneud ar y pryd.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae angen ichi ddirwyn i ben, David.

David Melding: Gofynnais iddi ddarllen yr adran sy'n ymwneud â'r cwricwlwm. Mae yno 20 tudalen o gymalau ar gwricwlwm Lloegr ac 20 tudalen o gymalau ar gwricwlwm Cymru, i gyd wedi'u drafftio yn yr un arddull. Eto, mae gan ein Gweinidog yr wyneb i ddweud wrthym fod y system ddrafftio'n wahanol yn awr, ac felly bod gennym ddigonedd o le i symud yn nhermau is-ddeddfwriaeth. Nid oes gennym ddim o hynny. Yr ydych wedi mygu llais y Cynulliad hwn, Weinidog. Mae arnoch eisiau gyrru'ch mesurau drwodd yn ddistaw bach, heb nemor ddim arolygu. Mae'n warth arnoch chi i gyd. Mae angen ichi ddysgu gwers neu ddwy

mewn cyfraith gyfansoddiadol.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): I will respond to David in a while, because—
[*Interruption.*]

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order.

Michael German: If nothing else, David Melding has made a powerful case for giving the Assembly primary legislative powers, which I welcome. I also ought to declare an interest as an occasional Sunday drinker, as the First Minister suggested that all those seeing this measure go through should do.

The Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome the Cabinet's proposals for primary legislation. We particularly welcome the resubmission of the Bill to make St David's Day a national public holiday. We also warmly welcome the Passenger Transport Bill, which will reflect the content of the partnership agreement, where it states that we will:

'explore the case for the establishment of a Welsh Passenger Transport Authority to improve and better integrate transport throughout Wales'.

In addition, the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee's policy review of public transport recommended the development of proposals for organisational change, including passenger transport authority options. The Passenger Transport Bill also proposes to implement another partnership agreement initiative, namely to seek powers of direction over the Strategic Rail Authority. The Committee's review also confirmed that that should be done.

Owen John Thomas: Will you take an intervention?

Michael German: I will in a moment. We look forward to the UK Government accepting as many of these Bills as possible. However, the range of the Cabinet proposals makes it clear to me, and to the Liberal Democrats, that the Assembly needs to have primary legislative choices, and David made

Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): Gwnaf ymateb i David toc, oherwydd—
[*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn.

Michael German: Os nad dim byd arall, mae David Melding wedi gwneud achos cryf dros roi pwerau deddfu sylfaenol i'r Cynulliad, rhywbeth yr wyf fi'n ei groesawu. Dylwn innau ddatgan buddiant fel yfwr achlysurol ar y Sul, fel yr awgrymodd y Prif Weinidog y dylai pawb sy'n anfon y mesur hwn drwodd.

Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn croesawu cynigion y Cabinet dros ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol. Yr ydym yn croesawu'n arbennig ailgyflwyniad y Mesur i wneud Dydd Gŵyl Dewi'n ŵyl gyhoeddus genedlaethol. Rhoddwn groeso gwresog hefyd i'r Mesur Cludiant i Deithwyr, a fydd yn adlewyrchu cynnwys y cytundeb partneriaeth, lle dywedir y byddwn yn:

'edrych yn fanwl ar yr achos o blaid sefydlu Awdurdod Trafnidiaeth Teithwyr i Gymru i wella ac integreiddio trafndiaeth yn well ledled Cymru'.

Yn ogystal, argymhellodd adolygiad polisi Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth ar gludiant cyhoeddus y dylid datblygu cynigion ar gyfer newid trefniadaethol, gan gynnwys dewisiadau a olygai sefydlu awdurdod cludiant teithwyr. Mae'r Mesur Cludiant i Deithwyr hefyd yn cynnig gweithredu menter cytundeb partneriaeth arall, sef ceisio pwerau cyfarwyddo dros yr Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol. Cadarnhaodd adolygiad y Pwyllgor hefyd y dylid gwneud hynny.

Owen John Thomas: A gymerwch chi ymyriad?

Michael German: Gwnaf mewn munud. Edrychwn ymlaen at weld Llywodraeth y DU yn derbyn cymaint o'r Mesurau hyn ag sy'n bosibl. Fodd bynnag, mae amrediad cynigion y Cabinet yn dangos yn glir i mi, ac i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, bod angen i'r Cynulliad gael dewisiadau deddfu sylfaenol,

a powerful argument for that. Many of the policies before us would carry a majority in this Chamber, yet we cannot implement them because we do not have the power to do so. David has made a *prima facie* case for that argument to be put before the independent commission on powers. I look forward to the Conservatives drafting and presenting their proposals, in the same tone, to the commission when it is set up.

Owen John Thomas: I am glad that you have taken the road to Damascus as regards the passenger transport authority for Wales. When I raised the matter in the former Local Government and Environment Committee, your colleague, Peter Black, said that he would not vote in favour of it. He said that he would not go down the Owen John Thomas road because he knew my agenda, and therefore opposed it. I am pleased, Michael, to see all your party behind you now.

Michael German: I am grateful to you for reminding us of who built the road to Damascus. I will send you a copy of the partnership agreement to read.

I am surprised by some of Ieuan's comments, and I want to refer to his view that we should act pre-emptively on the basis of a press report on what the commission on local government electoral arrangements in Wales will say. I hope that what the press is reporting as being the case will be the case, but what is reported here is the Bills that are being put forward for the current round—

Ieuan Wyn Jones *rose*—

4:50 p.m.

Michael German: Just one moment, I will finish this sentence, Ieuan.

The Assembly is, in fact, adding the end of conclusions to Bills that have been put forward this year. There will be opportunities, after the commission has reported, to put forward those points of view. We would expect to have them reported back to us in the Assembly for discussion and debate before 2003.

a gwnaeth David ddadl gref dros hynny. Byddai llawer o'r polisiau ger ein bron yn cario mwyafrif yn y Siambr hon, eto ni allwn eu gweithredu oherwydd nad oes gennym y grym i wneud hynny. Mae David wedi gwneud achos ar yr olwg gyntaf dros roi'r ddadl honno ger bron y comisiwn annibynnol ar bwerau. Edrychaf ymlaen at weld y Ceidwadwyr yn drafftio ac yn cyflwyno'u cynigion, yn yr un oslef, i'r comisiwn pan gaiff ei sefydlu.

Owen John Thomas: Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi cymryd y ffordd i Ddamascus parthed yr awdurdod cludiant teithwyr i Gymru. Pan godais y mater yn yr hen Bwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a'r Amgylchedd, dywedodd eich cyd-aelod, Peter Black, na fyddai'n pleidleisio o'i blaid. Dywedodd nad âi i lawr ffordd Owen John Thomas oherwydd gwyddai beth oedd fy agenda, ac yr oedd yn ei erbyn o'r herwydd. Mae'n dda gennyf, Michael, weld eich plaid i gyd y tu cefn ichi'n awr.

Michael German: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am ein hatgoffa pwy adeiladodd y ffordd i Ddamascus. Anfonaf gopi atoch o'r cytundeb partneriaeth i'w ddarllen.

Yr wyf yn synnu at rai o sylwadau Ieuan, a hoffwn gyfeirio at ei farn y dylem daro'n gyntaf ar sail adroddiad yn y wasg ar yr hyn a fydd gan y comisiwn ar drefniadau etholiadol llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru i'w ddweud. Gobeithiaf mai'r hyn y mae'r wasg yn ei adrodd fydd yn wir, ond yr hyn sy'n cael ei adrodd yma yw'r Mesurau sy'n cael eu rhoi ger bron ar gyfer y cylch cyfredol—

Ieuan Wyn Jones *a gododd*—

Michael German: Un funud, yr wyf am orffen y frawddeg hon, Ieuan.

Mae'r Cynulliad, mewn gwirionedd, yn ychwanegu diwedd casgliadau i Fesurau a roddwyd ger bron eleni. Bydd cyfleoedd, wedi i'r comisiwn adrodd yn ôl, i gyflwyno'r safbwyntiau hynny. Byddem yn disgwyl iddynt gael eu hadrodd yn ôl i ni yn y Cynulliad er trafodaeth a dadl cyn 2003.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Mike, do you expect that, when that commission reports back and makes its recommendations, the partnership Government will not only act on them, but will ensure that those proposals are in place for the local government elections in 2004?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Mike, a ydych yn disgwyl, pan gawn adroddiad ac argymhellion yn ôl gan y comisiwn hwnnw, y bydd y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth nid yn unig yn gweithredu arnynt, ond yn sicrhau y bydd y cynigion hynny yn eu lle ar gyfer etholiadau llywodraeth leol yn 2004?

Michael German: I would seek to support the independent commission's review and to ensure that the policies it promotes will be adopted. It is wrong to pre-empt a report on the basis of a press report. The timetable for these matters, as you know, will include the independent commission review followed by a proposal to Parliament, and so the cycle will roll. You will know, having been a Member of Parliament for such a long time, of the speed with which Westminster moves as it follows the parliamentary routine and proceeds. I hope that the independent commission's report concludes in the way that you suggest. I hope that we will be able to progress that through in the following year.

Michael German: Byddwn i'n ceisio cefnogi adolygiad y comisiwn annibynnol a sicrhau y mabwysiedir y polisiau y bydd yn eu hyrwyddo. Ni ddylid achub y blaen ar adroddiad ar sail adroddiad yn y wasg. Bydd yr amserlen ar gyfer y materion hyn, fel y gwyddoch, yn cynnwys adolygiad y comisiwn annibynnol ac wedyn gynnig i'r Senedd, ac felly bydd y cylch yn troi. Fe wyddoch, a chithau wedi bod yn Aelod Seneddol am gymaint o amser, am gyflymder symudiadau San Steffan wrth ddilyn y drefn seneddol a symud ymlaen. Gobeithiaf y bydd adroddiad y comisiwn annibynnol yn dod i'r casgliad a awgrymwech chi. Gobeithiaf y byddwn yn gallu symud hynny drwodd yn y flwyddyn ddilynol.

I hope that we will get our St David's Day Bill through Parliament in the next year. I fail to see why, when it has already been put forward once on behalf of the Government, Plaid Cymru is asking for it yet again, as it is doing about tobacco advertising. I am sure, as the First Minister noted, that we are in favour of banning tobacco advertising throughout the UK because, unfortunately, advertising does not stop at the border. Television or press advertising spans the border. My colleague, Tim Clement-Jones, promoted the Tobacco Advertising and Promotion Bill. That has now been successfully steered through the House of Lords, and the Westminster Government has committed to it. I hope that colleagues from all parties will support the Bill when it is debated on the floor of the House of Commons, in order to take it further.

Gobeithiaf y llwyddwn i gael ein Mesur Dydd Gŵyl Dewi Sant drwy'r Senedd yn y flwyddyn nesaf. Yr wyf yn methu gweld pam, a'r Mesur eisoes wedi'i gynnig un waith ar ran y Llywodraeth, y mae Plaid Cymru yn gofyn amdano eto fyth, fel y mae'n gwneud gyda hysbysebion tybaco. Yr wyf yn siŵr, fel y nododd y Prif Weinidog, ein bod o blaid gwahardd hysbysebu tybaco drwy'r DU gyfan oherwydd, yn anffodus, nid yw hysbysebu'n peidio wrth y ffin. Mae hysbysebion y teledu a'r wasg yn croesi ffiniau. Fy nghyd-aelod Tim Clement-Jones a hyrwyddodd y Mesur Hysbysebu a Hyrwyddo Tybaco. Mae hwnnw bellach wedi'i lywio'n llwyddiannus drwy Dŷ'r Arglwyddi, ac mae Llywodraeth San Steffan wedi ymrwymo iddo. Gobeithiaf y bydd cyd-aelodau o bob plaid yn cefnogi'r Mesur pan gaiff ei drafod ar lawr Tŷ'r Cyffredin, er mwyn mynd ag ef ymhellach.

It is the easiest job in the world to construct a list of Bills for debate. However, unfortunately, the amendments to today's motion will have no effect. We must turn to the difference between ourselves, as a governing party, and the party—[PLAID

Y peth hawsaf yn y byd yw llunio rhestr o Fesurau i'w trafod. Ond yn anffodus, ni chaiff y gwelliannau i gynnig heddiw ddim effaith. Rhaid inni droi at y gwahaniaeth rhyngom ni, fel plaid lywodraethol, a'r plaid—[AELODAU PLAID CYMRU: 'O']

CYMRU MEMBERS: ‘Oh’.] You may have noticed that some of Plaid Cymru’s amendments are not carried because it is not a governing party. The difference is of course—[ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘Ah’.]

Peter Law *rose*—

Michael German: I am not giving way. [*Interruption.*]

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You must wind up, Mike.

Michael German: While Plaid Cymru is chattering for Wales, some parties are arguing Wales’s corner at Westminster. I include David Melding’s party in that, as it will now argue prominently for more legislative powers to be given to the National Assembly. I am grateful for that. I hope that all Members from all parties, particularly those from the Conservative Party who believe in looking forward, will put their case forward in the proper manner to the powers commission, when it is established, so that we can consider Bills as a matter of measure. We can all do that, rather than having to go cap in hand to Westminster every time we want to contribute to the legislative process.

Helen Mary Jones: I will address two specific issues. First, I support the Government’s proposal with regard to the Passenger Transport Bill and the powers of direction over the Strategic Rail Authority. This is a Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales policy, of course. I would therefore like to join in the burgeoning Liberal Democrat tradition of taking credit for something that this Government has finally got right. This was also a priority for the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee in its review of public transport. In that context, I am delighted that the differences between the Minister with responsibility for transport, who always sought power to direct the SRA, and the First Minister, who has told Plenary on more than one occasion that additional powers over rail were irrelevant, seem to have been resolved, and that this is now a priority for the Government of Wales.

Efallai ichi sylwi na chaiff rhai o welliannau Plaid Cymru eu cario oherwydd nad yw’n blaid lywodraethol. Y gwahaniaeth, wrth gwrs, yw—[AELODAU’R CYNULLIAD: ‘A’.]

Peter Law *a gododd*—

Michael German: Nid wyf yn ildio. [*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Rhaid ichi ddirwyn i ben, Mike.

Michael German: Tra bo Plaid Cymru’n clebran dros Gymru, mae rhai pleidiau’n dadlau achos Cymru yn San Steffan. Yr wyf yn cynnwys plaid David Melding yn hynny, gan y bydd yn awr yn dadlau’n flaenllaw dros roi mwy o bwerau deddfu i’r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am hynny. Gobeithiaf y bydd pob Aelod o bob plaid, yn enwedig y rheini o’r Blaid Geidwadol sy’n credu mewn edrych ymlaen, yn cyflwyno’u hachos yn y ffordd briodol i’r comisiwn pwerau, pan y’i sefydlir, fel y gallwn ystyried Mesurau fel peth arferol. Gallwn i gyd wneud hynny, yn hytrach na gorfod mynd â’n cap yn ein llaw i San Steffan bob tro y bydd arnom eisiau cyfrannu at y broses ddeddfwriaethol.

Helen Mary Jones: Deliaf â dau fater penodol. Yn gyntaf, cefnogaf gynnig y Llywodraeth ynghylch y Mesur Cludiant i Deithwyr a’r pwerau cyfarwyddo dros yr Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol. Dyma bolisi Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales, wrth gwrs. Hoffwn felly ymuno yn nhraddodiad cynyddol y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol o gymryd y clod am rywbeth y mae’r Llywodraeth hon o’r diwedd wedi’i wneud yn iawn. Yr oedd hyn yn flaenoriaeth hefyd i Bwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth yn ei adolygiad o gludiant cyhoeddus. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, yr wyf ar ben fy nigon ei bod yn ymddangos y datryswyd y gwahaniaethau rhwng y Gweinidog â chyfrifoldeb am drafndiaeth, a fu’n chwennych grym i gyfarwyddo’r Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd o’r cychwyn, a’r Prif Weinidog, a ddywedodd fwy nag un waith wrth y Cyfarfod Llawn fod pwerau ychwanegol dros y rheilffyrdd yn amherthnasol, a bod hyn bellach yn

flaenoriaeth i Lywodraeth Cymru.

Secondly, I will comment on amendment 3. The Assembly will be aware that the Rees report recommended the abolition of tuition fees. Plaid Cymru did not necessarily support the second part of that recommendation, which suggested that they be replaced with a graduate tax, but that is not the matter for debate today. What is a matter for debate is how much serious attention the Government of Wales is prepared to give to tackling student poverty in Wales. Of course, the reintroduction of grants is welcome, but according to the Rees report, it is only half the cake. Despite what we have been told this afternoon about the Minister's advocacy on this matter, there is little sign that the UK Government's review of student funding will deliver any meaningful change within any kind of reasonable timescale. Indeed the National Union of Students believes that this issue has been:

'shunted off the Government's to-do list altogether.'

The Assembly cannot be prepared to tolerate this situation without comment, even in the short term. Eleven Welsh Labour Members of Parliament have already signed an early day motion in the House of Commons calling for the abolition of tuition fees. I urge the Government of Wales to support their colleagues on that and to do the same now. If we are to believe the NUS, and it must know, the Assembly Government's advocacy, if it is taking place, is falling on deaf ears at Westminster. Welsh students, living on £13 per week below Government official poverty levels cannot wait for Westminster to get its act together. The Government should seek devolved power over tuition fees now so that we can abolish them here. If student hardship is a priority for this Government, it should be a priority in its proposals for Bills. If the proposed Sunday Licensing Bill—and I declare myself as someone who does not drink in pubs on Sunday because I am at home with my family—is perceived by this Government as a higher priority than abolishing tuition fees, then, frankly the situation would be laughable if it were not so serious and if students were not leaving Welsh colleges every week because they

Yn ail, gwnaf sylw ar welliant 3. Bydd y Cynulliad yn ymwybodol fod adroddiad Rees wedi argymhell diddymu ffioedd dysgu. Nid oedd Plaid Cymru o reidrwydd yn cefnogi ail ran yr argymhelliad hwnnw, a awgrymai osod treth i raddedigion yn eu lle, ond nid dyna bwnc y ddadl heddiw. Yr hyn sydd yn bwnc dadl yw faint o sylw difrifol y mae Llywodraeth Cymru'n barod i'w roi i fynd i'r afael â thlodi myfyrwyr yng Nghymru. Wrth gwrs, croesewir y bwriad i ddod â grantiau'n ôl, ond yn ôl adroddiad Rees, dim ond hanner y deisen yw hyn. Er gwaethaf yr hyn a ddywedwyd wrthym y prynhawn yma am eiriolaeth y Gweinidog ar y mater hwn, nid oes fawr o arwydd y bydd adolygiad Llywodraeth y DU ar gyllid myfyrwyr yn esgor ar unrhyw newid ystyrllon o fewn unrhyw fath o amserlen resymol. Yn wir, mae Undeb Cenedlaethol y Myfyrwyr (NUS) yn credu bod y mater hwn wedi cael:

'ei wthio oddi ar restr y Llywodraeth o "bethau i'w gwneud" yn gyfan gwbl.'

Ni all y Cynulliad fod yn barod i ddiodeff y sefyllfa hon heb wneud sylw, hyd yn oed yn y tymor byr. Mae 11 o Aelodau Seneddol Llafur Cymreig eisoes wedi llofnodi cynnig cynnar-yn-y-dydd yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin yn galw am ddiddymu ffioedd dysgu. Anogaf Lywodraeth Cymru i gefnogi'u cyd-aelodau ar hynny a gwneud yr un peth yn awr. Os ydym i gredu'r NUS, a rhaid eu bod hwy'n gwybod, mae eiriolaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, os ydyw'n digwydd, yn syrthio ar glustiau byddar yn San Steffan. Ni all myfyrwyr Cymru, a hwythau'n byw ar £13 yr wythnos islaw lefelau tlodi swyddogol y Llywodraeth, aros i San Steffan roi trefn ar ei bethau. Dylai'r Llywodraeth geisio pŵer datganoledig dros ffioedd dysgu yn awr fel y gallwn ni eu diddymu yma. Os yw caledi myfyrwyr yn flaenoriaeth i'r Llywodraeth hon, dylai fod yn flaenoriaeth yn ei chynigion am Fesurau. Os yw'r Mesur Trwyddedau Sul arfaethedig—a datganaf fy hun fel un nad yw'n yfed mewn tafarnau ar y Sul oherwydd fy mod gartref gyda'm teulu—yn flaenoriaeth uwch yn llygaid y Llywodraeth hon na diddymu ffioedd dysgu, yna, a dweud y gwir yn blaen, byddai'r sefyllfa'n chwethinllyd pe na bai mor ddifrifol a phe na bai myfyrwyr

cannot afford to stay there.

This absurd auction could be avoided if the Assembly had proper primary legislative powers. However, as the leader of the opposition has rightly indicated, there is little point in asking this Government for those powers given that its members cannot decide on this issue among themselves. In the meantime, tuition fees should be a priority. It is a priority for our students, and it should be a priority for us if we are to create a truly learning country. I urge this Assembly to support all the amendments. Let us have a meaningful legislative programme.

Peter Law: I am grateful for the opportunity to say a few words on this important subject. I just listened with incredulity—today's share of incredulity—to the leader of the Liberal Democrats when he called out to Plaid Cymru that its amendments did not get their support because they are the party of Government. He has a short memory because only last week, Plaid Cymru got their support when they ditched Rhodri and the other Labour Ministers. That is what the Liberal Democrats are like. I have told you before that you cannot trust them. Therefore, that is an example for you, Mike.

Let us talk about these proposals. The First Minister is putting forward common sense Bills. A great deal of work has been undertaken in the last three years and we are now tidying up measures. I remember the problems with the Sunday Licensing Bill because that came under my responsibilities; it is an anachronism that needs to be resolved. There is also the issue of the Housing Ombudsman Bill, which some may have missed. The fact is that—

Helen Mary Jones: I am glad that you are being so positive about the Government's proposals, but given that you represent the poorest constituency in Wales, do you agree with Huw Lewis that the Government of Wales is not giving enough priority to tackling poverty? Do you agree with me that we could tackle student poverty by abolishing

yn gadael colegau Cymru bob wythnos am na allant fforddio aros yno.

Gellid osgoi'r ocsiwn hurt hwn pe bai gan y Cynulliad bwerau deddfu sylfaenol go iawn. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedodd arweinydd yr wrthblaid yn gwbl gywir, nid oes fawr o bwynt gofyn i'r Llywodraeth hon am y pwerau hyn os na all ei haelodau benderfynu ar y mater hwn ymysg ei gilydd. Yn y cyfamser, dylai ffioedd dysgu fod yn flaenoriaeth. Mae'n flaenoriaeth i'n myfyrwyr, a dylai fod yn flaenoriaeth i ni os ydym am greu gwir wlad sy'n dysgu. Anogaf y Cynulliad i gefnogi'r gwelliannau i gyd. Gadewch inni gael rhaglen ddeddfwriaethol ystyrlon.

Peter Law: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle i ddweud ychydig o eiriau ar y pwnc pwysig hwn. Yr wyf newydd wrando mewn anghredinedd—cyfran heddiw o anghredinedd—ar arweinydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol pan waeddodd ar Blaid Cymru na chafodd eu gwelliannau hwy eu cefnogaeth am mai hwy yw'r blaid mewn Llywodraeth. Mae ganddo gof byr oherwydd dim ond yr wythnos ddiwethaf, cafodd Plaid Cymru eu cefnogaeth pan droesant eu cefn ar Rhodri a'r Gweinidogion Llafur eraill. Dyna sut rai ydyw'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Yr wyf wedi dweud wrthyfch o'r blaen na allwch ymddiried ynddynt. Felly, dyna enghraifft ichi, Mike.

Gadewch inni siarad am y cynigion hyn. Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn cynnig Mesurau synnwyr cyffredin ger bron. Gwnaethpwyd llawer iawn o waith yn y tair blynedd diwethaf ac yr ydym yn awr yn tacluso'r mesurau. Cofiaf y problemau gyda Mesur Trwyddedau Sul oherwydd deuai hwnnw dan fy nghyfrifoldebau i; mae'n anacroniaeth sydd angen ei datrys. Mae gennym hefyd fater y Mesur Ombwdsmon Tai, y gall fod rhai ohonoch wedi'i gollu. Y ffaith yw fod—

Helen Mary Jones: Yr wyf yn falch eich bod yn siarad mor gadarnhaol am gynigion y Llywodraeth, ond gan eich bod yn cynrychioli'r etholaeth dlotaf yng Nghymru, a ydych yn cytuno â Huw Lewis nad yw Llywodraeth Cymru'n rhoi digon o flaenoriaeth i fynd i'r afael â thlodi? A ydych yn cytuno â mi y gallem wneud rhywbeth am

tuition fees?

Peter Law: I agree with Huw Lewis, and compliment him for his comments. Most of the problem with the Government is the Liberal Democrats that it tows behind it, but we will come to them in a moment. Let me finish my speech; you would not want to be robbed.

We should be addressing the Housing Ombudsman Bill. I have reservations about whether this power should go to the local government ombudsman, who is already responsible for the local government standards commission. An ombudsman should be appointed to deal with these complaints because they are currently coming to the Assembly and are being dealt with by the Minister. There could be a 25 per cent increase in work relating to this. An independent person is needed to deal with that and it is right that the First Minister proposes it. The other measures are obviously right: the St David's Day Bill, the Education Bill, the Audit Bill—which makes sense—and the Passenger Transport Authority Bill. Many of us have much sympathy with the passenger transport authority cause and will be pleased to see it moving forward. It is important, immaterial of partnership agreements, because it makes common sense. Therefore, what the First Minister proposes is definitely in Wales's interest.

I turn now to some of the other things that we have heard. I listen carefully to the Liberal Democrats in the Chamber every week. Sometimes I wonder whether we should be thanking them for the air and the sunshine, because that is about the only thing that Mick Bates does not tell us is in the partnership agreement. I do not know how we managed before 2000. The Liberal Democrat Party, which is the most parasitic party in Welsh politics, and which always tries to find the back door into power, is trying to do it again with the electoral commission. Some people seem to have prior knowledge about what it might report. It might report in favour of a single transferable vote system, but we will have to wait and see—that would be a cosy arrangement. As far as the Labour Party is

dlodi myfyrwyr drwy ddiddymu ffioedd dysgu?

Peter Law: Yr wyf yn cytuno â Huw Lewis, ac yn ei gymeradwyo am ei sylwadau. Y rhan fwyaf o'r broblem gyda'r Llywodraeth yw'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol y mae'n eu llusgo ar ei hôl, ond fe ddeuwn atynt hwy mewn munud. Gadewch imi orffen fy araith; ni fydddech eisiau cael colled.

Dylem fod yn edrych ar y Mesur Ombwdsmon Tai. Mae gennyf amheuan a ddylai'r grym hwn fynd i ddwylo'r ombwdsmon llywodraeth leol, sydd eisoes yn gyfrifol am y comisiwn safonau llywodraeth leol. Dylid penodi ombwdsmon i ddelio â'r cwynion hyn oherwydd maent yn dod i'r Cynulliad ar hyn o bryd ac mae'r Gweinidog yn ymdrin â hwy. Gallai fod cynnydd o 25 y cant mewn gwaith yn ymwneud â hyn. Mae angen rhywun annibynnol i ddelio â hynny ac mae'n iawn fod y Prif Weinidog yn cynnig hynny. Mae'r mesurau eraill yn amlwg yn iawn: Mesur Dydd Gŵyl Dewi Sant, y Mesur Addysg, y Mesur Archwilio—sy'n gwneud synnwyr—a Mesur yr Awdurdod Cludiant i Deithwyr. Mae gan lawer ohonom gydymdeimlad mawr â'r achos dros awdurdod cludiant teithwyr a byddwn yn falch o'i weld yn symud ymlaen. Mae'n bwysig, waeth beth fo'r cytundebau partneriaeth, oherwydd mae'n gwneud synnwyr cyffredin. Felly mae'r hyn y mae'r Prif Weinidog yn ei gynnig yn bendant er budd Cymru.

Trof yn awr at rai o'r pethau eraill a glywsom. Gwrandawaf yn astud ar y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn y Siambr bob wythnos. Weithiau meddyliaf tybed a ddylem ddiolch iddynt am yr awyr a'r heulwen, oherwydd dyna oddeutu'r unig beth nad yw Mick Bates yn dweud wrthym ei fod yn y cytundeb partneriaeth. Ni wn sut y daethom i ben cyn 2000. Mae Plaid y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, sef y blaid fwyaf parasitaidd yng ngwleidyddiaeth Cymru, ac sydd bob amser yn ceisio canfod y drws cefn i goridorau grym, yn ceisio gwneud hynny eto gyda'r comisiwn etholiadol. Mae'n ymddangos fod gan rai pobl wybodaeth flaenorol ynghylch beth allai fod yn ei adroddiad. Gallai adrodd o blaid system un bleidlais drosglwyddadwy, ond bydd yn rhaid

concerned—

Rod Richards: Does Peter agree with Liberal Democrats in mid-Wales, and in particular with Mick Bates, that the Liberal Democrats provide the backbone of this Government?

Peter Law: The Liberal Democrats provide the toerags of this Government, and do not forget it. Many of the Labour Party's beliefs and principles have been thrown out of the window because of this awful little cosy arrangement in the Assembly, as far as the Liberal Democrats are concerned. They think that their electoral commission in local government will help them to get back into power by the back door. We will see. The Liberal Democrats in the Assembly are irrelevant when it comes to the UK Labour Government, which, thankfully, has the primary legislative powers with regard to whether that will happen.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: The Welsh Labour group in the Assembly will be asked to vote on the independent commission's recommendations on local government reform. Mike German has told us that he expects STV to be in place by the local government elections of 2004. Do you think that that will happen?

Peter Law: I do not think that that will happen. My party has never agreed to this policy or been consulted on it, as it was not consulted about the unholy alliance with the Liberal Democrats. Therefore, there is a long way to go before any recommendations go from the Assembly to London. However, thankfully, the UK Labour Government will have the final word and I do not believe that it will support such a move.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Peter, during your contribution, you used the word 'toerag'. I do not think that it is out of order, but I am not sure what it means. The Liberal Democrats took it in good heart. However, I remind the Assembly that we should not use such words in future. I hope that Members

inni aros a gweld—byddai hynny'n drefniant cysurus. O ran y Blaid Lafur—

Rod Richards: A ydyw Peter yn cytuno â'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn y Canolbarth, ac yn enwedig â Mick Bates, mai'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol sy'n darparu asgwrn cefn y Llywodraeth hon?

Peter Law: Y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yw'r chwain yn y Llywodraeth hon, a pheidied ag anghofio hynny. Mae llawer o gredoau ac egwyddorion y Blaid Lafur wedi'u taflu allan drwy'r ffenestr oherwydd y trefniant bach clyd uffernol hwn yn y Cynulliad, o safbwynt y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Maent yn meddwl y bydd eu comisiwn etholiadol mewn llywodraeth leol yn gymorth iddynt ddod yn ôl i rym drwy'r drws cefn. Cawn weld. Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn y Cynulliad yn amherthnasol yn llygaid Llywodraeth Lafur y DU, lle mae'r pwerau deddfwriaethol sylfaenol, diolch i'r drefn, i benderfynu a ddigwydd hynny ai peidio.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Bydd gofyn i'r grŵp Llafur Cymreig yn y Cynulliad bleidleisio ar argymhellion y comisiwn annibynnol ar ddiwygio llywodraeth leol. Mae Mike German wedi dweud wrthym ei fod yn disgwyl i'r un bleidlais drosglwyddadwy fod yn weithredol erbyn etholiadau llywodraeth leol 2004. A ydych chi'n meddwl y gwnaiff hynny ddigwydd?

Peter Law: Nid wyf yn meddwl y gwnaiff hynny ddigwydd. Ni chytunodd fy mhlaid i â'r polisi hwn erioed ac nid ymgynghorwyd â ni yn ei gylch, yn yr un modd ag y lluniwyd y glymblaid anfad hon gyda'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol heb ymgynghori â ni. Felly, mae ffordd bell i fynd cyn yr aiff unrhyw argymhellion o'r Cynulliad i Lundain. Fodd bynnag, diolch i'r drefn, gan Lywodraeth Lafur y DU y bydd y gair olaf ac ni chredaf y gwnaiff gefnogi symudiad o'r fath.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Peter, yn ystod eich cyfraniad, defnyddiasoch y gair 'toerag'. Nid wyf yn meddwl ei fod allan o drefn, ond nid wyf yn siŵr beth yw ei ystyr. Cymerodd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yr ymadrodd yn siriol. Er hynny, atgoffaf y Cynulliad na ddylem ddefnyddio geiriau o'r fath yn y

will bear that in mind.

Dafydd Wigley: Onid yw'n gwbl annioddefol ein bod yn gorfod mynd ar ein gliniau i erfyn am ychydig friwsion o ddeddfwriaeth o Lundain pan ddylem fod yn ei phasio yma yn y Siambr hon? Os yw hynny'n wir am y rhan fwyaf o bynciau, y mae'n arbennig o wir am yr iaith Gymraeg. Gwnaf gais i gynnwys yr angen am ddeddf iaith fel rhan o'r rhaglen. Mae gwelliant 6 yn cyfeirio at hynny. Gofynnaf am hynny am sawl rheswm. Yn gyntaf, mae'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant eisoes yn ymgymryd ag arolwg iaith. Caiff yr adroddiad ei gyhoeddi cyn yr haf, fel y dywedodd y Prif Weinidog. Gwnaed amryw o argymhellion gan dystion yn galw am ddeddfu. Er y derbynnaf na chânt oll eu cynnwys—ni chaiff rhai yn sicr eu cynnwys—byddai'n anhygoel pe na baem yn derbyn rhai ohonynt. Dyna pam y mae angen pennawd deddf iaith yn y rhaglen sydd gerbron. Ar wahân i'r arolwg, mae angen newid y ddeddf bresennol er mwyn sicrhau mai yn y Cynulliad y gwneir newidiadau yn y dyfodol. O bob pwnc, dyma'r pwnc y dylai Aelodau a etholwyd o Gymru benderfynu arno ac nid pwyllgorau yn Llundain â mwyafrif o aelodau o'r tu allan i Gymru.

5:00 p.m.

Gellid gwneud hynny trwy roi i'r Cynulliad bwerau Harri VIII, fel a wnaed eisoes yng nghyd-destun y WDA, er mwyn inni allu diwygio Deddf 1993 drwy Orchymyn. Mae teitl hir y Ddeddf yn ddigon eang i ganiatáu inni wneud hynny. Byddai cael deddf seml ag un cymal, er mwyn ychwanegu cymal at Ddeddf 1993, yn galluogi'r Cynulliad i wneud y mân newidiadau achlysurol yr ydym eu heisiau wrth ymdrin â'r iaith Gymraeg. Tybiaf fod cefnogaeth i hynny o bob rhan o'r Siambr.

Yr wyf am sôn am y newidiadau deddfwriaethol yr hoffem eu gweld yn rhan o'r rhaglen sydd ger bron. Yn gyntaf, mae angen sefydlu'n glir statws y Gymraeg, fel bod y Gymraeg a'r Saesneg yn gydradd fel ieithoedd swyddogol. Yn ail, mae angen gwarchod hawl unigolion i dderbyn pob gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yn eu dewis iaith, gan

dyfodol. Gobeithiaf y gwnaiff yr Aelodau gadw hynny mewn cof.

Dafydd Wigley: Is it not utterly intolerable that we must go on our knees to beg for some crumbs of legislation from London when we should be passing it here in this Chamber? If that is true of most subjects, it is particularly true about the Welsh language. I urge you to include the need for a language act as part of the programme. Amendment 6 makes reference to that. I do so for many reasons. First, the Culture Committee is already conducting a review of the Welsh language. The report will be published before the summer, as the First Minister said. Many of the witnesses who have appeared before us have recommended legislation. While I accept that they cannot all be included—some of them certainly will not be included—it would be incredible if we did not accept some of them. That is why a language act heading is needed in the programme that is before us. Apart from the review, the existing act needs to be amended to ensure that any future changes are made by the Assembly. Of all issues, this is the issue that Members elected from Wales should decide upon rather than committees in London where the majority of members are elected from outside Wales.

That could be done by giving the Assembly Henry VIII powers, as has already been done in the context of the WDA, so that we could amend the 1993 Act by means of an Order. The Act's long title is wide-ranging enough to allow us to do that. Securing a simple single-clause act, to add an additional clause to the 1993 Act, would enable the Assembly to make the occasional minor changes that it wishes to make when dealing with the Welsh language. I presume that there is support for that from all sides of the Chamber.

I now turn to the legislative changes that we would like to see as part of the programme before us. First, the status of the Welsh language must be clearly defined, so that English and Welsh have equal status as official languages. Secondly, we must protect the right of individuals to receive all public services in the language of their choice,

gynnwys y cyfleustodau a breifateiddiwyd a chwmnïau trafndiaeth. Mae amheuaeth ynglyn â'r mater hwnnw. Yn drydydd, dylid darparu rheithgorau Cymraeg eu hiaith pan fydd diffynnydd yn dewis tystio yn Gymraeg. Mae barnwyr a bargyfreithwyr yng Nghymru yn galw am hyn, ac mae'n hen bryd iddo ddigwydd. Yn bedwerydd, dylid cryfhau pwerau a chyfrifoldeb Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg i hyrwyddo cynllunio iaith fel proses, ac i ddilyn trywydd y cynlluniau hynny a sicrhau bod cyrff yn eu gweithredu ac yn cadw atynt. Nid yw pwerau'r bwrdd yn ddigonol ar hyn o bryd, ond efallai y dylid ei droi yn gomisiwn statudol a chanddo bwerau statudol.

Pwysleisiaf hefyd yr angen i sicrhau hawl unigolion i siarad â'i gilydd yn Gymraeg yn y gweithle. Yn amlwg, mae ansicrwydd ynglŷn â hyn ac mae angen deddfu ar y mater. Hefyd, mae angen diwygio deddfau eraill, megis deddfau cynllunio, i reoleiddio datblygiad tai haf lle y gallent fod yn fygythiad i'r iaith Gymraeg. Felly, mae angen deddfwriaeth yn ymwneud â'r iaith o dan benawdau eraill.

Mae angen deddfu i gyflawni hyn oll, ac erfyniaf ar y Llywodraeth i gydnabod hynny ac i wneud darpariaeth yn y rhaglen y mae'n ei rhoi gerbron.

Cynog Dafis: Er bod gwelliannau 4 a 5 yn ymwneud â materion gwahanol, mae cysylltiad rhyngddynt, sef yr angen am batrwm o sefydliadau cyhoeddus sy'n diwallu anghenion Cymru. Yr ydym wedi etifeddu patrwm o'r cyfnod cyn datganoli, a dylem fod yn barod i'w newid. Gallai hyn fod yn rhan o'r broses o leihau nifer y cyrff cyhoeddus anetholedig, sef coelcerth y cwangos nas cafwyd.

Mae gwelliant 4 yn ymwneud â llywodraeth leol, nid cwangos. Mae llawer yn credu nad yw patrwm presenol llywodraeth leol yn gwbl addas ar gyfer ein hanghenion. Clywsom Lorraine Barrett yn dweud ei bod yn gresynu at y ffaith ein bod wedi colli'r hen wyth sir bwerau. Byddai llawer yn amenio hynny. Dywedent hefyd mai pwrpas yr ad-drefnu diweddaraf o dan y Toriaid oedd cael gwared ar yr hen siroedd am eu bod yn rhy bwerau. Rhan o agenda ganoli y Llywodraeth

including the privatised utilities and the transport companies. There is doubt surrounding this matter. Thirdly, Welsh-speaking juries should be convened when a defendant chooses to testify in Welsh. Judges and barristers in Wales are calling for this, and it is high time for it to happen. Fourthly, the powers and responsibilities of the Welsh Language Board should be broadened to promote language planning as a process, and to monitor language schemes and ensure that bodies are implementing and fulfilling their obligations within those schemes. The board's powers are insufficient at present, and it may be time to turn it into a statutory commission with statutory powers.

I also stress the need to secure the right of individuals to converse in Welsh in the workplace. Clearly, there is uncertainty in this area and legislation is needed to deal with it. We also need to amend other acts, such as planning acts, to regulate the development of holiday homes where they could pose a threat to the Welsh language. Therefore, legislation concerning the language is needed under different headings.

We need legislation to deliver all this, and I implore the Government to acknowledge that, and to make provision in the programme that it presents.

Cynog Dafis: Even though amendments 4 and 5 address different matters, there is a link between them, namely the need for a pattern of public bodies to meet the needs of Wales. We have inherited a pattern from the pre-devolution period, and we should be prepared to change it. This could be a part of the process of reducing the number of unelected public bodies—the bonfire of the quangos that never transpired.

Amendment 4 concerns local government, rather than quangos. Many people believe that the current system of local government is inappropriate to our requirements. We heard Lorraine Barrett remark that she regrets the loss of the eight powerful counties. Many would concur with that. They would also say that the purpose of the last re-organisation under the Tories was to abolish the old counties because they were too powerful. That was part of the Tory Government's

Dorfaidd oedd hynny. Bydd yn rhaid inni fynd ati rywbryd i ad-drefnu llywodraeth leol eto, ond nid oes neb eisiau taclo'r mater yn awr. Byddai datgymalu'r systemau a'r strwythurau sydd ar waith i ddarparu gwasanaethau ar hyn o bryd yn wastraffus ac yn niweidiol mor fuan ar ôl y tro diwethaf. Bydd Aelodau'n cofio mai'r bwriad adeg yr ad-drefnu diwethaf oedd cael llawer o gydweithio ar draws ffiniau siroedd, gyda byrddau ar y cyd, awdurdodau arweiniol ac ati. I raddau, mae hynny wedi newid, ond nid hanner digon. Mae siroedd yn rhy aml yn ystyried eu lles plwyfol eu hunain yn hytrach na'r lles cyffredinol. Mae hynny'n rhwym o ddigwydd lle bo cydweithredu yn hollol wirfoddol. Enghraifft berffaith yw'r consortia cymunedol ar gyfer addysg a hyfforddiant. Rhagwelwyd sefydlu oddeutu 15 ohonynt ar y mwyaf, ond mae gennym 21 erbyn hyn, sy'n ormod. Enghraifft arall yw'r byrddau iechyd lleol newydd. Mae 22 ohonynt, sy'n llawer gormod. Mae adnoddau'n cael eu llyncu gan fiwrocratiaeth y broses.

Mae teimlad cyffredinol bod y gwasanaeth cynghori athrawon wedi dioddef am yr un rheswm. Hefyd, mae agweddau ar ein gwasanaethau cymdeithasol sydd wedi dioddef oherwydd colli'r hen siroedd.

Mae gwelliant 4 yn cynnig ffordd hollol ymarferol ymlaen. Mae'r syniad wedi dod o'r Mesur Addysg sy'n mynd drwy'r Senedd ar hyn o bryd.

5:10 p.m.

Mae cymalau 185 hyd 188 y Mesur hwnnw yn rhoi hawl i'r Cynulliad gyfarwyddo unrhyw awdurdodau addysg lleol yng Nghymru i wneud trefniadau ar y cyd ar gyfer anghenion addysgol arbennig—mae hynny'n synhwyrol ac yn ffrwyth profiad chwerw o fethiant, fel y cafodd y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes wybod sawl mis yn ôl. Os oes modd gwneud hynny ar gyfer anghenion addysgol arbennig, pam nad ar gyfer agweddau eraill ar addysg? Pam nad yn fwy cyffredinol? Byddai pryd ac i ba bwrpasau y defnyddid y pŵer yn destun trafod gan lywodraeth leol drwy'r Cyngor Partneriaeth. Nid oes rhaid iddo fod yn beth awdurdodus a gormesol, ond mae'n iawn i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a Llywodraeth

centralisation agenda. It will be necessary at some point to re-organise local government again, but no-one wants to tackle the matter now. Disassembling the systems and structures that currently deliver services would be wasteful and damaging so soon after the last time. Members will recall that the intention at the time of the last re-organisation was to ensure a great deal of collaboration across county boundaries, with joint boards, lead authorities, and so on. To a certain extent, that has changed, but nowhere near enough. Counties too often put their own parochial interests before the greater good. That is bound to happen where collaboration is entirely voluntary. A perfect example is the community consortia for education and training. It was foreseen that a maximum of 15 would be established, but we now have 21, which is too many. Another example is the new local health boards. There are 22 of them, which is far too many. Resources are being swallowed up by the bureaucracy involved in the process.

There is a general feeling that the teachers' advisory service has suffered for the same reason. Also, there are aspects of our social services that have suffered as a consequence of abolishing the old counties.

Amendment 4 offers a completely practical way forward. The idea came from the Education Bill currently passing through Parliament.

In that Bill, clauses 185 to 188 give the Assembly the right to direct any local education authorities in Wales to make joint arrangements for special educational needs—that is sensible and is the result of the bitter experience of failure, as the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee discovered some months ago. If this can be done with special educational needs, why not with other aspects of education? Why not more generally? When and to what ends this power would be used would be the subject of discussion by local government through the Partnership Council. It would not have to be authoritarian or oppressive, but the National Assembly and the Government of Wales should have that sort of generic right. Full

Cymru gael hawl cyffredinol o'r math hwnnw. Byddai hawliau deddfu llawn, sy'n anochel yn hwyr neu'n hwyrach, yn rhoi'r hawl hwnnw i'r Cynulliad beth bynnag, felly, cystal inni gael yr hawliau hynny o dan y trefniant presennol. Synnaf, felly, fod agwedd y Prif Weinidog tuag at y gwelliant hwn, sydd yn synhwyrol ac sydd yn ein galluogi i ddefnyddio'r system bresennol hyd yn oed yn fwy effeithiol, mor ddiraddiol.

Mae gwelliant 5 yn cyfeirio at y cyrff cyhoeddus amgylcheddol, y cafwyd trafodaeth eisoes arnynt. Dylai fod asiantaeth amgylcheddol annibynnol i Gymru; nid oes amheuaeth am hynny. Dadleuais dros hynny wrth i Ddeddf yr Amgylchedd 1995 fynd drwy'r Senedd, ac yr oedd unrhyw ddadleuon yn erbyn hynny ar y pryd yn ddi-sail. Mae'n bryd cywirio'r diffyg hwn. A allwn gyfiawnhau tri chwango amgylcheddol—Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru a'r Comisiwn Coedwigaeth—mewn gwlad mor fach â Chymru? A oes arnom eu hangen? A allwn eu fforddio? Oni fyddai modd iddynt gyflawni eu swyddogaethau, sef hyrwyddo datblygu cynaliadwy, yn fwy effeithiol mewn un corff integredig?

Ni fyddai cymeradwyo gwelliant 5 yn rhwymo'r Cynulliad i gefnogi polisi o'r fath; byddai ond yn rhoi'r hawl i'r Cynulliad weithredu felly, pe dymunai. Eto, byddai pwerau deddfu llawn, yn anochel, yn rhoi hawliau fel hyn inni. Fodd bynnag, dengys y gwelliant sut mae modd gweithredu heb hawliau deddfu llawn o fewn y setliad presennol. Dylem chwilio am bob cyfle i rymuso'r Cynulliad drwy'r system—

Rod Richards: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Aelod am ildio. Yn gyntaf, mae yn llygad ei le ynglŷn ag ad-drefnu 1996, ac mae hefyd yn iawn i ddweud mai'r bwriad ar y pryd oedd i'r awdurdodau lleol gyd-weithio. Fodd bynnag, nid felly y bu. A yw'n cytuno mai'r rheswm na wireddwyd breuddwyd y Llywodraeth ddiwethaf oedd ystyfnigrwydd yr awdurdodau lleol ar y pryd? Oni dderbynnir y gwelliant hwn, cawn yr un ystyfnigrwydd ynglŷn ag iechyd ac addysg yn y dyfodol.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Cynog

legislative powers, which are inevitable sooner or later, would give us that right, so we may as well have those rights within the present system. I am surprised, therefore, that the First Minister's attitude towards this amendment, which is sensible and which enables us to use the present system even more effectively, is so derogatory.

Amendment 5 refers to the environmental public bodies, which have already been discussed. There should be an independent environment agency for Wales; there is no doubt about that. I argued for it when the Environment Act 1995 was proceeding through Parliament, and any arguments against it at the time were unsubstantiated. It is time to put this right. Can we justify three environmental quangos—the Environment Agency, the Countryside Council for Wales, and the Forestry Commission—in a country as small as Wales? Do we need them? Can we afford them? Could not their functions, namely the promotion of sustainable development, be undertaken more effectively within one integrated body?

Passing amendment 5 would not commit the Assembly to supporting such a policy; it would only give the Assembly the right to act in such a way should it so wish. Again, full legislative powers would inevitably give us those rights. However, the amendment shows how we could act without full legislative powers within the current settlement. We should look for every opportunity to empower the Assembly through the system—

Rod Richards: I am grateful to the Member for giving way. First, he is absolutely correct about the 1996 re-organisation, and he is also right to say that the intention at the time was for local authorities to collaborate. However, that did not happen. Does he agree that the reason that the previous Government's dream was not realised was because of the local authorities' intransigence at the time? Unless this amendment is passed, we will have the same stubbornness with health and education in the future.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Cynog Dafis, mae'n

Dafis, you must wind up.

Cynog Dafis: Nid ystyfnigrwydd, ond natur ddynol. Mae pobl yn naturiol yn gwarchod eu sefydliadau eu hunain, ac mae cydweithio ar draws ffiniau yn gallu bod yn iawn i un awdurdod, ond nid i'r llall. Dyna pam fod yn rhaid cael rhyw bŵer goruchwyliol.

Mae'r gwelliannau hyn, yn fy marn i, yn synnwyr cyffredin. Maent yn gadarnhaol, a gobeithiaf y bydd y Prif Weinidog yn ystyried rhoi cefnogaeth iddynt.

The First Minister: I shall get through as many points as possible in the four minutes available to me. First, Ieuan, the question of ethos and the public sector is supported across the Assembly. I fear Plaid Cymru is trying to claim—as no single party can do—that it is more in favour of the public sector ethos than Labour. When Plaid Cymru is put in a position of power, such as in local government, it embraces private finance initiative contracts. If a Plaid Cymru council wants a school, it builds a school under PFI because it is the only show in town. We have done the same with NHS projects such as the Baglan Hospital and the St David's Hospital because PFI was the only show in town. Do not try to put yourself forward as the only providers of warm words to public sector workers—it is not appropriate to do that.

In reply to John Griffiths, you are right about the Strategic Rail Authority, we must be able to get at it to ensure that it can complete its schemes on time so that we can achieve our ambitious proposals for reopening passenger railway lines such as the Ebbw Vale to Cardiff line—ensuring that it is extended to Newport—and the Vale of Glamorgan line. There are problems, and we need enhanced powers. That is why passenger transport power is on the list of legislative proposals that we hope to get through the Westminster legislative mill.

David Melding was hugely over-egging the pudding by trying to disprove mathematically the big increase in Welsh legislation. There have only been two Queen's Speeches since the Assembly was established—the

rhaid ichi ddirwyn i ben.

Cynog Dafis: It was not intransigence, but human nature. People will naturally guard their own institutions, and cross-border collaboration can suit one authority but not another. That is why it is essential to have some kind of supervisory power.

These amendments, in my opinion, are common sense. They are positive, and I hope that the First Minister will consider supporting them.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Fe af drwy gynifer o bwyntiau ag y gallaf o fewn y pedwar munud sydd ar gael imi. Yn gyntaf, Ieuan, mae'r cwestiwn o ethos a'r sector cyhoeddus wedi'i gefnogi ar draws y Cynulliad. Mae arnaf ofn fod Plaid Cymru'n ceisio hawlio—fel na all yr un blaid unigol—ei bod yn fwy o blaid ethos y sector cyhoeddus na Llafur. Pan roddir Plaid Cymru mewn sefyllfa o rym, fel mewn llywodraeth leol, mae'n coleddu contractau menter cyllid preifat. Os oes ar gyngor Plaid Cymru eisiau ysgol, fe gwyd ysgol dan fenter cyllid preifat gan mai dyna'r unig sioe yn y dref. Yr ydym ni wedi gwneud yr un peth gyda phrosiectau GIG megis Ysbyty Baglan ac Ysbyty Dewi Sant am mai cyllid preifat oedd yr unig sioe yn y dref. Peidiwch â cheisio portreadu eich hun fel yr unig un sydd â geiriau cynnes i weithwyr y sector cyhoeddus—nid yw'n briodol gwneud hynny.

I ateb John Griffiths, yr ydych yn gywir ynglŷn â'r Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol, rhaid inni allu mynd ato er mwyn sicrhau y gall gyflawni'i gynlluniau mewn pryd fel y gallwn gyflawni'n cynigion uchelgeisiol ar gyfer ailagor rheilffyrdd teithwyr fel lein Glyn Ebwy i Gaerdydd—gan sicrhau y caiff ei hymestyn i Gasnewydd—a lein Bro Morgannwg. Mae problemau, ac mae arnom angen mwy o bwerau. Dyna pam mae pŵer dros gludiant teithwyr ar y rhestr o gynigion deddfwriaethol y gobeithiwn eu rhoi drwy felin deddfwriaethol San Steffan.

Yr oedd David Melding yn gor-ddweud yn aruthrol wrth geisio gwrthbrofi'n fathemategol y cynnydd mawr mewn deddfwriaeth Gymreig. Dim ond dwy Araith y Frenhines a fu ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad—

Assembly was established in July 1999, so it was too late in the legislative process to get much into the November 1999 Queen's Speech. Our propositions for powers were put to the test in the Queen's Speech in 2000 and in 2001. That is why I said that we have had two Bills in two and a half years. It is true that one Bill is in draft form, and we have learned an interesting lesson from that. Sometimes, Westminster will offer to take half a Bill, to do it quickly, in order to establish the principle—which is what happened with the Children's Commissioner—and to do the other half, because it is not covered by the long title, as a Wales-only Bill the following year. It was similar with the NHS Bill. We thought that we could get the whole thing done together, but we were offered a deal. Some of the administrative measures were taken out a year early, so that they would be applicable from April 2003, but other measures were taken through the draft Bill procedure.

Does any Member disagree with the draft Bill procedure? As far as I know, everyone says that we should do more Bills in draft to ensure proper consultation and to take evidence from witnesses—namely the stakeholders—to improve the quality of legislation. We all know how appalling the quality of legislation has been in the past as a result of not having the capacity to deal with evidence from stakeholders and other witnesses who are directly affected. That entails a year's delay. However, we welcome that delay because it is for a good purpose; to improve the quality of the legislation. David Melding's points were not fair, and I still maintain that the figure of 500 per cent improvement is mathematically demonstrable.

Helen Mary Jones referred to the National Union of Students and to student poverty. It was an interesting contribution. However, you should recognise that Jane Davidson has been talking to the NUS; she met with its representatives last week. She will also be visiting all higher education institutions in Wales. They are pleased with how we are pursuing the higher education agenda, including the new Assembly learning grants. If we were to pursue the abolition of tuition

sefydlwyd y Cynulliad yng Ngorffennaf 1999, felly yr oedd yn rhy hwyr yn y broses ddeddfwriaethol i gael llawer i mewn i Araith y Frenhines yn Nhachwedd 1999. Rhoddwyd ein cynigion am bwerau ar brawf yn Araith y Frenhines yn 2000 a 2001. Dyna pam y dywedais ein bod wedi cael dau Fesur mewn dwy flynedd a hanner. Mae'n wir fod un Mesur ar ffurf drafft, ac yr ydym wedi dysgu gwrs ddiddorol oddi wrth hynny. Weithiau, bydd San Steffan yn cynnig cymryd hanner Mesur, a'i wneud yn gyflym, er mwyn sefydlu'r egwyddor—sef yr hyn a ddigwyddodd gyda'r Comisiynydd Plant—a gwneud yr ail hanner, am nad yw wedi'i gynnwys dan y teitl hir, fel Mesur i Gymru'n unig yn y flwyddyn ganlynol. Yr oedd yn debyg gyda Mesur y GIG. Yr oeddem wedi meddwl y gallem wneud y peth cyfan gyda'i gilydd, ond cynigiwyd bargaen inni. Tynnwyd rhai o'r mesurau gweinyddol allan flwyddyn yn gynnar, fel y byddent yn weithredol o Ebrill 2003, ond aethpwyd â mesurau eraill drwy drefn y Mesur drafft.

A oes unrhyw Aelod yn anghytuno â threfn y Mesur drafft? Hyd y gwn i, dywed pawb y dylem wneud mwy o Fesurau ar ffurf drafft er mwyn sicrhau yr ymgynghorir yn iawn ac i gymryd tystiolaeth gan dystion—sef y cyfranogwyr—i wella ansawdd deddfwriaeth. Gwyddom i gyd mor echrydus y bu ansawdd deddfwriaeth yn y gorffennol oherwydd nad oedd modd delio â thystiolaeth gan gyfranogwyr a thystion eraill yr effeithiwyd arnynt yn uniongyrchol. Golyga hynny flwyddyn o oedi. Fodd bynnag, croesawn yr oedi hwnnw gan ei fod at bwrpas da, sef gwella ansawdd y deddfwriaeth. Nid oedd pwyntiau David Melding yn deg, ac yr wyf yn dal i haeru fod y ffigur o 500 y cant o welliant yn un y gellir ei brofi'n fathemategol.

Cyfeiriodd Helen Mary Jones at Undeb Cenedlaethol y Myfyrwyr ac at dlodi myfyrwyr. Yr oedd yn gyfraniad diddorol. Fodd bynnag, dylech sylweddoli bod Jane Davidson wedi bod yn siarad â'r NUS; cyfarfu â'u cynrychiolwyr yr wythnos ddiwethaf. Bydd yn ymweld hefyd â phob sefydliad addysg uwch yng Nghymru. Maent yn falch gyda'r modd yr ydym yn mynd ati gydag agenda addysg uwch, yn cynnwys grantiau dysgu newydd y Cynulliad. Pe baem

fees, I am sure that they would be even more delighted, but we will cross that bridge when we come to it.

Gareth Jones *rose*—

The First Minister: I do not have time to give way. I am trying to cover many speeches on this issue.

I am grateful to Peter Law for his contribution and for his support in saying that these are common-sense measures. I do not agree with some of his other points of view, but he dealt with the fact that these are common-sense measures—

Gareth Jones *rose*—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I do not think that he is giving way, Gareth.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Trof at gyfraniad Dafydd Wigley ar Ddeddf Iaith.

Gareth Jones *rose*—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Are you giving way?

The First Minister: No, I do not have time. I wish I could, but it is not possible.

Yr wyf am ddelio â phwyntiau Dafydd. Mae arolwg yn cael ei gynnal ar hyn o bryd. Yn ôl Dafydd, mae'r dystiolaeth eisoes yn dangos bod angen Mesur newydd. Nid yw hynny'n glir hyd yn hyn ac, yn ôl y cyngor a gefais i, mae'r arolwg wedi dangos eich bod yn gallu gwneud llawer heb ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol, drwy ymestyn y grym sydd gennym eisoes. O ran y pwynt pwysicaf a gododd Dafydd, sef a oes modd defnyddio pwerau'r ddeddfwriaeth bresennol a Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg i sicrhau bod cyrff cyhoeddus yn dilyn cynlluniau iaith ac ati, mae Jenny Randerson ar fin derbyn y cyngor cyfreithiol ac fe glywch am hynny yn y Pwyllgor cyn diwedd yr arolwg. Felly nid yw hynny'n profi bod angen deddfu o'r newydd. Ond, os oes angen, mae gennym feddyliau agored.

yn mynd ati i ddiddymu ffioedd dysgu, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddent yn hapusach fyth, ond fe groeswn y bont honno pan ddeuwn ati.

Gareth Jones *a gododd*—

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid oes gennyf amser i ildio. Yr wyf yn ceisio ateb sawl araith ar y mater hwn.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Peter Law am ei gyfraniad ac am ei gefnogaeth yn dweud mai mesurau synnwyr cyffredin yw'r rhain. Nid wyf yn cytuno â rhai o'i safbwyntiau eraill, ond fe ddeliodd â'r ffaith mai mesurau synnwyr cyffredin yw'r rhain—

Gareth Jones *a gododd*—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Ni chredaf ei fod yn ildio, Gareth.

The First Minister: I turn to Dafydd Wigley's contribution on a Welsh Language Act.

Gareth Jones *a gododd*—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. A ydych chi'n ildio?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nac ydwyf, nid oes gennyf amser. Hoffwn pe medrwn, ond nid yw'n bosibl.

I want to deal with Dafydd's points. A review is currently under way. According to Dafydd, the evidence already shows that we need a new Bill. That is not yet clear, and according to the advice that I was given, the review demonstrates that you can do a great deal without primary legislation by extending the power that we already have. On the most important point that Dafydd raised, of whether there is a way of using the powers of the current legislation and the Welsh Language Board to ensure that public bodies adhere to Welsh language schemes and so on, the legal advice is on its way to Jenny Randerson and you will hear of it in the Committee before the end of the review. Therefore, it does not prove the need for new legislation. However, if the need arises, we are open-minded on this.

O ran pwyntiau Cynog, nid oes angen deddfwriaeth i'n galluogi i roi gorchmynion i lywodraeth leol. Dylem fod yn cydweithio ag awdurdodau lleol, yn eu cefnogi a'u perswadio i wneud yr hyn yr ydym am iddynt ei wneud yn hytrach na'u gorchymyn.

Cynog Dafis *a gododd—*

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Dyna ddiwedd fy araith. Nid oedd gennyf lawer o amser i siarad. Gallwn drafod y pwyntiau hyn eto.

On Cynog's points, there is no need for legislation to allow us to direct local government. We should be working with local authorities, supporting them and persuading them to do what we want them to do rather than directing them.

Cynog Dafis *rose—*

The First Minister: That is the end of my speech. I did not have much time in which to speak. We can discuss these points again.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 16, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 38.
Amendment 1: For 16, Abstain 1, Against 38.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Richards, Rod
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelod canlynol:
The following Member abstained:

Davies, Glyn

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 39.
Amendment 2: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 39.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Richards, Rod
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 33.
Amendment 3: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 33.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane

Hancock, Brian
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Richards, Rod
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

Davies, Andrew
 Davies, David
 Davies, Ron
 Essex, Sue
 Evans, Delyth
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Halford, Alison
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 17, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 38.
 Amendment 4: For 17, Abstain 0, Against 38.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Dafis, Cynog
 Davies, Geraint
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Hancock, Brian
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lloyd, David
 Richards, Rod
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Butler, Rosemary
 Cairns, Alun
 Chapman, Christine
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Ron
 Essex, Sue
 Evans, Delyth
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Halford, Alison
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David

Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 39.
 Amendment 5: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 39.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Dafis, Cynog
 Davies, Geraint
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Hancock, Brian
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lloyd, David
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Butler, Rosemary
 Cairns, Alun
 Chapman, Christine
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Ron
 Essex, Sue
 Evans, Delyth
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Halford, Alison
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Richards, Rod
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 16, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 38.
 Amendment 6: For 16, Abstain 1, Against 38.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelod canlynol:
The following Member abstained:

Richards, Rod

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 18, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 34.
Amendment 7: For 18, Abstain 1, Against 34.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron

Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Richards, Rod
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelod canlynol:
The following Member abstained:

Davies, Glyn

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.

Cynnig: O blaid 41, Ymatal 12, Yn erbyn 1.
Motion: For 41, Abstain 12, Against 1.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelod canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Member voted against:

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty
Williams, Phil

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Graham, William
Hancock, Brian
Jones, Gareth
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Richards, Rod

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â
today's proceedings to a close. chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.23 p.m.
The session ended at 5.23 p.m.*