



Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)

The National Assembly for Wales
(The Official Record)

Dydd Iau 13 Rhagfyr 2001

Thursday 13 December 2001

Cynnwys
Contents

- 3 Cwestiynau ar Lywodraeth Leol i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau
Questions on Local Government to the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities
- 14 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd
Questions to the Minister for Environment
- 25 Datganiad ar Fuddsoddi drwy Bartneriaethau yng Nghymru
Statement on Investment through Partnerships in Wales
- 40 Pwyntiau o Drefn
Points of Order
- 44 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Mynediad i Gefn Gwlad (Fforymau Mynediad Lleol) (Cymru) 2001
Approval of the Countryside Access (Local Access Forums) (Wales) Regulations 2001
- 44 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Mynediad i Gefn Gwlad (Mapiau Drafft) (Cymru) 2001
Approval of the Countryside Access (Draft Maps) (Wales) Regulations 2001
- 56 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Diogelu'r Amgylchedd (Cyfyngu ar y Defnydd ar Beledi Plwm) (Cymru) 2001
Approval of the Environmental Protection (Restriction on use of Leadshot) (Wales) Regulations 2001
- 63 Y Strategaeth Datblygu Economaidd Genedlaethol
The National Economic Development Strategy
- 103 Dadl Fer: Pwy sy'n Llywodraethu Cymru?
Short Debate: Who is Governing Wales?

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 9.05 a.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 9.05 a.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Cwestiynau ar Lywodraeth Leol i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau
Questions on Local Government to the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities

Y Llywydd: Trosglwyddwyd cwestiwn 1 (OAQ14674) ar gyfer ateb ysgrifenedig. **The Presiding Officer:** Question 1 (OAQ14674) has been transferred for written answer.

Ymgynghori â'r Cyhoedd
Public Consultation

Q2 Janet Davies: Does the Minister monitor the effectiveness of local authorities in fulfilling their role of consulting with the public before taking major decisions? (OAQ14664)

C2 Janet Davies: A yw'r Gweinidog yn monitro pa mor effeithiol y mae awdurdodau lleol yn cyflawni eu rôl o ymgynghori â'r cyhoedd cyn gwneud penderfyniadau mawr? (OAQ14664)

The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart): Local authorities consult with their electorates on many issues, although not all consultations are undertaken under the Assembly's direction.

Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart): Mae awdurdodau lleol yn ymgynghori â'u hetholwyr ar lawer o faterion, ond ni chynhelir pob ymgynghoriad o dan gyfarwyddyd y Cynulliad.

Janet Davies: The Government of Wales's ability to effectively ensure that local government's superior hitting power does not mean that it has a greater ability to put the case for its favoured method of local government restructuring than other groups in the local authority areas, is crucial. What steps have you taken to ensure that the Government of Wales can demonstrate accountability and propriety, if the new structure proves to be lacking in those qualities?

Janet Davies: Mae'n hanfodol fod gan Lywodraeth Cymru y gallu i sicrhau i bob diben nad yw dylanwad di-ail llywodraeth leol yn golygu ei bod yn haws iddi roi'r ddadl o blaid ei dewis dull o ailstrwythuro llywodraeth leol na grwpiau eraill yn ardaloedd awdurdodau lleol. Pa gamau a gymerwyd gennych i sicrhau y gall Llywodraeth Cymru arddangos atebolrwydd a phriodoldeb, os nad yw'r strwythur newydd yn meddu ar y nodweddion hyn?

Edwina Hart: I hope that the consultation process undertaken by all Welsh local authorities will be of the highest standard. In response to a question from William Graham on matters raised in Committee, I am reviewing all the consultations undertaken by Welsh local government and I will present a report on that to the Local Government and Housing Committee. If I have any concerns, they will appear in that report.

Edwina Hart: Gobeithiaf y bydd y broses ymgynghori a gynhelir gan bob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru o'r safon uchaf. Mewn ymateb i gwestiwn gan William Graham ar faterion a godwyd yn y Pwyllgor, yr wyf yn adolygu'r holl ymgynghoriadau a gynhelir gan lywodraeth leol Cymru a byddaf yn cyflwyno adroddiad ar hynny i'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai. Os bydd gennyf unrhyw bryderon, byddant yn ymddangos yn yr adroddiad hwnnw.

Glyn Davies: Do you think that local governments should be required to contact all people in their areas before they award themselves massive wage increases?

Glyn Davies: A gredwch y dylai fod yn ofynnol i lywodraethau lleol gysylltu â'r holl bobl yn eu hardaloedd cyn iddynt ddyfarnu cynnydd sylweddol yn eu cyflogau eu hunain.

Edwina Hart: I am not certain to what you are alluding in terms of wage increases. There is some discussion currently about councillors' allowances, and I hope to be issuing guidance on that issue in the new year.

Edwina Hart: Nid wyf yn siŵr beth ydych yn cyfeirio ato o ran cynnydd mewn cyflogau. Mae trafodaethau ar lwfansau cynghorwyr yn mynd rhagddynt, a gobeithiaf y byddaf yn rhoi canllawiau ar y mater hwnnw yn y flwyddyn newydd.

Tom Middlehurst: Do you agree that local government is well able to deal with the issues confronting its communities? It has a long history; it survived the worst effects of Thatcherism, it maintained a base in our communities and sustained them through those dark days of severe cuts in public expenditure. Is this not another example of the opposition parties' tendency to want to extend command and control here over the democratically elected authorities of Wales?

Tom Middlehurst: A gytunwch fod llywodraeth leol yn gymwys iawn i ymdrin â'r materion sy'n wynebu cymunedau? Mae ganddo hanes hir; goroesodd effeithiau gwaethaf Thatcheriaeth, cadwodd sylfaen yn ein cymunedau a'u cynnal drwy'r cyfnodau o doriadau difrifol mewn gwariant cyhoeddus. Onid yw hyn yn enghraifft arall o duedd y gwrthbleidiau i chwenychu am ymestyn rheolaeth y Cynulliad dros awdurdodau Cymru a etholwyd yn ddemocrataidd?

Edwina Hart: Yes.

Edwina Hart: Ydyw.

Rosemary Butler: Following on from Glyn Davies's oblique statement, do you not agree that some local authorities in Wales have excellent means of communicating with their constituents? Consider what is happening in Newport, with its neighbourhood committees, citizens panels and a whole range of other matters; what the authority is doing is exceptional.

Rosemary Butler: Yn dilyn lled-sylw Glyn Davies, oni chytunwch fod gan rai awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru ffordd ragorol o gyfathrebu gyda'u hetholwyr? Ystyriwch yr hyn sy'n digwydd yng Nghasnewydd, gyda'i bwyllgorau cymdogaethol, paneli dinasyddion ac ystod eang o faterion eraill; mae'r hyn y mae'r awdurdod yn ei wneud yn eithriadol.

Edwina Hart: I am aware of the exemplary arrangements in Newport for consultation with the local public. It is important that local authorities learn best practice from each other in the matter of public consultation.

Edwina Hart: Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r trefniadau rhagorol yng Nghasnewydd i ymgynghori â'r cyhoedd yn lleol. Mae'n bwysig bod awdurdodau lleol yn rhannu arfer gorau o ran ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus.

Glyn Davies: Point of order.

Glyn Davies: Pwynt o drefn.

The Presiding Officer: Order. I will take points of order arising from questions to Ministers after questions.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Derbyniaf bwyntiau o drefn sy'n codi o gwestiynau i Weinidogion ar ôl y cwestiynau.

Yr Astudiaeth Gwmpasu The Scoping Study

Q3 Mick Bates: Will the Minister report on the progress of the scoping study on

C3 Mick Bates: A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi adroddiad ar hynt yr astudiaeth gwmpasu o

community councils? (OAQ14668)

Edwina Hart: The terms of the scoping study are currently being revised in line with the Local Government and Housing Committee's comments. We will soon put the contract for the study out for tender.

Mick Bates: Will you consider allocating extra financial resources to community councils to deliver some services locally?

Edwina Hart: This matter will arise from the scoping study when we see which community councils wish to undertake further functions. I sometimes receive requests from community councils along the lines that you outlined. It is a matter for them to reach some sort of agreement with the principal council in this respect, or there would have to be a transfer of resources. This will emerge from the scoping study when we see to what extent community councils want to undertake services. However, that must be with the agreement of the principal authority.

Jonathan Morgan: Community councils play a vital role; they are often the first point of contact for local people who want to become involved in decisions taken by authorities, such as planning matters. Does the Government at Westminster or here have any opportunities to increase the number of community councils in Wales to further that point of democracy and thus facilitate people's involvement in decisions?

Edwina Hart: When local communities decide that they would like a community council, I welcome that. We will assist in any way possible if communities want additional community councils. We must recognise that it is a matter for the communities to decide what representation they want.

gyngorau cymuned? (OAQ14668)

Edwina Hart: Mae cylch gorchwyl yr astudiaeth gwmpasu'n cael eu diwygio yn unol â sylwadau'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai. Byddwn yn gosod y contract ar gyfer yr astudiaeth ar dendr yn fuan.

Mick Bates: A ystyriwch ddyrannu adnoddau ariannol ychwanegol i gyngorau cymuned i ddarparu rhai gwasanaethau'n lleol?

Edwina Hart: Bydd y mater hwn yn codi o'r astudiaeth gwmpasu pan welwn pa gyngorau cymuned sy'n dymuno ymgymryd â rhagor o swyddogaethau. Weithiau daw ceisiadau i law gan gyngorau cymuned yn debyg i'r rhai a amlinellwyd gennych. Mater iddynt hwy yw dod i ryw fath o gytundeb gyda'r prif gyngor yn y cyswllt hwn, neu byddai angen trosglwyddo adnoddau. Daw hyn i'r amlwg yn yr astudiaeth gwmpasu pan fyddwn yn gweld i ba raddau y mae cyngorau cymuned am ymgymryd â gwasanaethau. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i'r prif awdurdod gytuno ar hynny.

Jonathan Morgan: Mae cyngorau cymuned yn chwarae rôl hanfodol; yn aml hwy yw'r pwynt cyswllt cyntaf i bobl leol sy'n dymuno cymryd rhan mewn penderfyniadau a wneir gan awdurdodau, megis materion cynllunio. A oes gan y Llywodraeth yn San Steffan neu yma unrhyw gyfleoedd i gynyddu nifer y cyngorau cymuned yng Nghymru i ehangu'r math hwnnw o ddemocratiaeth a thrwy hynny eu gwneud yn haws i bobl gymryd rhan mewn penderfyniadau?

Edwina Hart: Pan fydd cymunedau lleol yn penderfynu eu bod yn dymuno cael cyngor cymuned, croesawaf hynny. Byddwn yn rhoi pob cymorth posibl i gymunedau sy'n dymuno cael cyngorau cymuned ychwanegol. Rhaid inni gydnabod mai cymunedau sydd i benderfynu pa gynrychiolaeth a ddymunant.

Safonau Moesegol Llywodraeth Leol Cymru The Ethical Standards of Welsh Local Government

Q4 Richard Edwards: What steps is the Minister taking to ensure that the public can

C4 Richard Edwards: Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i sicrhau y gall y

have confidence in the ethical standards of Welsh local government? (OAQ14689)

Edwina Hart: On 21 June, the Assembly approved the regulations that will put in place a new and robust ethical framework for local government in Wales. We will continue to work in partnership with local government, with the assistance of the independent local government ombudsman from the Commission for Local Administration in Wales, to ensure that this framework is properly implemented and understood.

Richard Edwards: I do not want to seem parochial, but, given the Stalinist disposition of a so-called independent-dominated council which shall remain nameless, does the Minister share my concern that should the local authority in question adopt the leader and cabinet option as its new political arrangement, as it fully intends to do, then, unless the scrutiny mechanism is sufficiently robust to withstand the independent group dicta—and I do not have any confidence that it is—the political ethos of the authority will sink even further?

Edwina Hart: It is important to recognise the important role of scrutiny within the legislative framework. It is essential that councillors involved in scrutiny are fully supported. Local government officers are responsible for ensuring that scrutiny functions can be undertaken properly. Over the next year, when this all comes into force, I will be minded to examine the effectiveness of the scrutiny undertaken in local government. It is essential that councillors have everything they need to assist them in their scrutiny role.

Janet Ryder: The purpose of the ethical standard is to create public confidence in local government again. Do you also agree that we need to be confident that those bodies representing local government are independent and not dominated by one party? Are you concerned that a group like the Welsh Local Government Association seems to be becoming so identified with the Labour Party that it gives your party the advice:

cyhoedd deimlo'n hyderus â safonau moesegol llywodraeth leol Cymru? (OAQ14689)

Edwina Hart: Ar 21 Mehefin, cymeradwyodd y Cynulliad y rheoliadau a fydd yn sefydlu fframwaith moesegol newydd a chadarn ar gyfer llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru. Byddwn yn parhau i weithio mewn partneriaeth â llywodraeth leol, gyda chymorth yr ombwdsmon llywodraeth leol annibynnol o'r Comisiwn dros Weinyddu Lleol yng Nghymru, i sicrhau y caiff y fframwaith hwn ei weithredu a'i ddeall yn briodol.

Richard Edwards: Nid wyf am swnio'n blwyfol, ond, o ystyried natur Stalinaidd cyngor yr honnir iddo gael ei reoli'n annibynnol, na chaiff mo'i enwi, a yw'r Gweinidog yn rhannu fy mhryder y bydd ethos gwleidyddol yr awdurdod yn dirywio ymhellach os bydd yr awdurdod lleol dan sylw yn mabwysiadu'r opsiwn arweinydd a chabinet fel ei drefniant gwleidyddol newydd, yn ôl ei fwriad, oni bai bod y system graffu yn ddigon cadarn i wrthsefyll gorchmynion y grŵp annibynnol, ac nid wyf yn hyderus y bydd hynny'n digwydd?

Edwina Hart: Mae'n bwysig nodi rôl bwysig y gwaith o graffu o fewn y fframwaith deddfwriaethol. Mae'n hanfodol y caiff cynghorwyr sy'n ymgymryd â gwaith craffu eu cefnogi'n llawn. Mae swyddogion llywodraeth leol yn gyfrifol am sicrhau y caiff swyddogaethau craffu eu cyflawni'n briodol. Dros y flwyddyn nesaf, pan ddaw hyn i gyd yn weithredol, byddaf yn ystyried archwilio effeithiolrwydd y gwaith craffu a wna llywodraeth leol. Mae'n hanfodol bod gan gynghorwyr bopeth sydd ei angen arnynt i'w cynorthwyo yn y gwaith o graffu.

Janet Ryder: Pwrpas y safon foesegol yw ailennyn hyder y cyhoedd mewn llywodraeth leol. A gytunwch hefyd fod angen inni fod yn hyderus bod y cyrff hynny sy'n cynrychioli llywodraeth leol yn annibynnol ac na chânt eu rheoli gan un blaid? A ydych yn pryderu bod grŵp fel Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru y uniaethu gymaint â'r Blaid Lafur, yn ôl pob golwg, fel ei fod yn rhoi'r cyngor hwn i'ch plaid:

‘that you should seek to build into a protocol a mechanism to prevent pre-emptive policy strikes by Labour-elected representatives of one tier of government’

—that is, the Assembly—

—hynny yw, y Cynulliad—

‘that undermines Labour representatives of another tier of government’

that is usually local government—

llywodraeth leol yw hynny fel arfer—

The Presiding Officer: Order. I do not favour quotations during questions. Supplementaries should be sharp and terse, as indeed should answers.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid wyf o blaid dyfyniadau yn ystod cwestiynau. Dylai cwestiynau atodol fod yn gynnil, fel yr atebion.

Alun Cairns: Will the Minister advise the Assembly on why the model is so different in England, where a standards board has been established? If a standards board is needed anywhere in the United Kingdom, it is probably most needed in Wales.

Alun Cairns: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddweud wrth y Cynulliad pam fod y model mor wahanol yn Lloegr, lle sefydlwyd bwrdd safonau? Os oes angen bwrdd safonau unrhyw le yn y Deyrnas Unedig, mae’n debyg mai yng Nghymru y mae ei angen fwyaf.

Edwina Hart: That remark was below the belt, when you think of the high quality of representation provided by councillors at a local level. Serving councillors in this Chamber would refute the suggestion that standards in Wales are terrible. We chose a Welsh solution in Wales, and that is what devolution is about.

Edwina Hart: Yr oedd y sylw hwnnw’n annheilwng, pan feddyliwch am ansawdd uchel y gynrychiolaeth a ddarperir gan gynghorwyr lleol. Byddai cynghorwyr sy’n gwasanaethu yn y Siambr hwn yn gwrthbrofi’r awgrym fod safonau yng Nghymru yn warthus. Dewiswyd ateb Cymreig yng Nghymru. Dyna ddiben datganoli.

Effaith Datblygiadau Newydd ar Ariannu Llywodraeth Leol The Impact of New Developments on Local Government Funding

Q5 Pauline Jarman: What discussions has the Minister had with her Cabinet colleagues regarding the impact of new developments on local government funding? (OAQ14662) [R]

C5 Pauline Jarman: Pa drafodaethau y mae’r Gweinidog wedi’u cynnal gyda’i chyd-Aelodau yn y Cabinet am effaith datblygiadau newydd ar ariannu llywodraeth leol? (OAQ14662) [R]

Edwina Hart: I meet my Cabinet colleagues regularly and discuss a number of matters in relation to this.

Edwina Hart: Byddaf yn cwrdd â’r cyd-Aelodau yn y Cabinet yn rheolaidd ac yn trafod nifer o faterion mewn perthynas â hyn.

Pauline Jarman: Is the Minister aware that after it has adjusted for new burdens in social services, her widely-quoted 6.7 per cent increase in revenue funding for local government is misleading the public? The reality is that after appropriate allowances have been made for the introduction of initiatives such as concessionary travel and other unavoidable increases such as pay and inflation, and, in particular, ensuring our

Pauline Jarman: A yw’r Gweinidog yn ymwybodol, ar ôl addasu i ymdopi â beichiau newydd mewn gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, bod ei chynnydd o 6.7 y cant mewn arian refeniw i lywodraeth leol y bu cymaint o sôn amdano, yn camarwain y cyhoedd? Y gwir amdani yw ar ôl ystyried cynlluniau fel consesiynau teithio a chodiadau anochel eraill fel cyflog a chwyddiant, ac, yn arbennig, sicrhau y caiff ein gwasanaeth

education service is funded properly, most other local government services will struggle to achieve even a standstill budget in real terms next year.

Edwina Hart: I do not accept your final sentence. There is room for real growth in the local government settlement. Representations on the other issues were made to me at the Consultative Forum on Finance. I take those representations into account and examine the overall local government settlement in the light of those comments.

William Graham: Have you received indication from the Westminster Government of any future adjustments to the Assembly's budget, due to levels of proposed council tax on non-domestic rate increases?

Edwina Hart: I am not aware of having received anything yet. However, I will check with my office and write to you if I have received anything.

9:15 a.m.

Modelau Llywodraethu Models of Governance

Q6 Jonathan Morgan: Will the Minister make a statement on models of governance as outlined in the Local Government Act 2000? (OAQ14709)

Edwina Hart: Section 11 of the Local Government Act 2000 introduces three forms of executive structure, which may be operated by county or county borough councils. These are the elected mayor and cabinet model, the leader and cabinet model, and the elected mayor and council manager model. Sections 31 and 32 of the Act also enable the Assembly to allow the fourth option of a structure involving a politically balanced board. All models include provision for scrutiny of the executive or board.

Jonathan Morgan: Local authorities have been involved in a consultation process. I am most familiar with the consultation process

addysg ei ariannu'n briodol, bydd y rhan fwyaf o wasanaethau llywodraeth leol eraill yn brwydro i sicrhau bod ganddynt o leiaf yr un gyllideb mewn termau real y flwyddyn nesaf â'u cyllideb eleni.

Edwina Hart: Ni dderbyniaf eich brawddeg olaf. Mae lle i dwf gwirioneddol yn setliad llywodraeth leol. Cefais sylwadau ar y materion eraill yn y Fforwm Ymgynghorol ar Gyllid. Ystyriaif y sylwadau hynny ac archwiliaf setliad cyffredinol llywodraeth leol yng ngoleuni'r sylwadau hynny.

William Graham: A gawsoch arwydd gan Lywodraeth San Steffan o unrhyw addasiadau yn y dyfodol i gyllideb y Cynulliad, oherwydd cynnydd arfaethedig yn lefelau'r dreth gyngor ar gyfradd annomestig?

Edwina Hart: Nid wyf yn ymwybodol bod unrhyw beth wedi dod i law eto. Fodd bynnag, byddaf yn gofyn i'm swyddfa ac yn ysgrifennu atoch os byddaf wedi derbyn unrhyw beth.

C6 Jonathan Morgan; A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y modelau llywodraethu a amlinellir yn Neddf Llywodraeth Leol 2000? (OAQ14709)

Edwina Hart: Mae adran 11 Deddf Llywodraeth Leol 2000 yn cyflwyno tri math o strwythur gweithredol, y gellir ei weithredu gan gyngor sir neu gyngor bwrdeistref sirol, sef model y maer etholedig a chabinet, model arweinydd a chabinet, a model maer etholedig a rheolwr y cyngor. Mae Adrannau 31 a 32 y Ddeddf hefyd yn galluogi'r Cynulliad i ganiatáu pedwerydd opsiwn, sef strwythur sy'n cynnwys bwrdd â chydbwysedd gwleidyddol. Mae'r holl fodelau'n cynnwys darpariaeth ar gyfer craffu ar y weithrediaeth neu'r bwrdd.

Jonathan Morgan: Mae'r awdurdodau lleol wedi cymryd rhan mewn proses ymgynghori. Yr wyf fwyaf cyfarwydd â'r broses

being initiated in Cardiff. The model of consultation used was mainly to advertise the options in the local authority's own published newspaper, which, to my mind, is hardly wide consultation. Does the Minister share my concern that consultation should include public meetings, more public consultation with local authority members and the people whom they represent, and not merely consultation through a published rag?

Edwina Hart: I do not want to be drawn on the quality of any publication. However, if local authorities take the initiative to produce publications for the electorate, that is good, because it allows information to be disseminated. I understand that the publication also advertises jobs and issues of that nature. It is a useful means of communication. You have written to me, Jonathan, regarding your concerns on the consultation methods being used in Cardiff, which you consider to be inadequate. I have received feedback from my officials, who are liaising with the council. We have looked at the exercise and feel that it is comparable with the consultation exercises undertaken by most authorities in Wales.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: A fyddai'r Gweinidog yn derbyn, o ran llywodraethu llywodraeth leol, bod Gwerth Gorau yn golygu'r gwerth gorau i lywodraeth leol o fewn ffiniau llywodraeth leol?

Edwina Hart: As you indicate, we must be clear about the meaning of Best Value. Best Value is the way that local authorities can provide services and, ultimately it is what is best for the council tax payer. We must be clear about what it means.

ymgyngori sy'n mynd rhagddi yng Nghaerdydd. Defnyddiwyd model yr ymgynghoriad yn bennaf i hysbysebu'r opsiynau ym mhapur newydd yr awdurdod lleol ei hun, nad yw, yn fy marn i, yn ymgynghoriad eang. A yw'r Gweinidog yn rhannu fy mhryder y dylai ymgynghoriad gynnwys cyfarfodydd cyhoeddus, mwy o ymgynghori cyhoeddus gydag aelodau awdurdodau lleol a'r bobl y maent yn eu cynrychioli, ac nid dim ond ymgynghoriad drwy gylchgrawn?

Edwina Hart: Nid wyf am wneud sylwadau ar ansawdd unrhyw gyhoeddiad. Fodd bynnag, os bydd awdurdodau lleol yn penderfynu cynhyrchu cyhoeddiadau ar gyfer etholwyr, mae hynny'n beth da, oherwydd mae'n caniatáu i wybodaeth gael ei lledaenu. Deallaf fod y cyhoeddiad hefyd yn hysbysebu swyddi a materion o'r fath. Mae'n ffordd ddefnyddiol o gyfathrebu. Ysgrifenasoch ataf, Jonathan, ynghylch eich pryderon ar y dulliau ymgynghori a ddefnyddir yng Nghaerdydd, sy'n annigonol yn eich barn chi. Derbyniais adborth gan fy swyddogion, sy'n cysylltu â'r cyngor. Edrychwyd ar yr ymarfer a theimlwyd ei fod yn debyg i ymarferion ymgynghori a gynhelir gan y rhan fwyaf o awdurdodau yng Nghymru.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Would the Minister accept that, in terms of local government governance, Best Value means the best value for local government within local government boundaries?

Edwina Hart: Fel y nodwyd gennych, rhaid inni fod yn glir ynghylch ystyr Gwerth Gorau. Gwerth Gorau yw'r ffordd y gall awdurdodau lleol ddarparu gwasanaethau ac, yn y pen draw dyna yw'r hyn sydd orau ar gyfer talwyr y dreth gyngor. Rhaid inni fod yn glir ynghylch beth mae hyn yn ei olygu.

Gwerthu Tân Gwyllt Selling Fireworks

Q7 Geraint Davies: What discussions has the Minister had with local authorities regarding their role in preventing the sale of fireworks to customers who are under the age of 18? (OAQ14700)

C7 Geraint Davies: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cynnal gydag awdurdodau lleol am eu rôl o ran sicrhau nad oes tân gwyllt yn cael eu gwerthu i gwsmeriaid dan 18 oed? (OAQ14700)

I declare an interest as a member of Rhondda

Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o Gyngor

Cynon Taff County Borough Council.

Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf.

Edwina Hart: I have not had any direct discussions with local authorities on this. The Department of Trade and Industry is responsible for policy on the prohibition of supply of fireworks. There are regulations prohibiting the supply of fireworks to anyone apparently under the age of 18. The DTI is also in charge of the fireworks safety campaign.

Edwina Hart: Ni chefais unrhyw drafodaethau uniongyrchol gydag awdurdodau lleol ar hyn. Yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant sy'n gyfrifol am bolisiâu ar wahardd cyflenwi tân gwyllt. Ceir rheoliadau sy'n gwahardd cyflenwi tân gwyllt i unrhyw un yr ymddengys ei fod o dan 18 oed. Yr Adran honno sydd yn gyfrifol hefyd am yr ymgyrch diogelwch tân gwyllt.

Geraint Davies: Does the Minister recognise that improper use of fireworks is antisocial, dangerous, and causes much distress to people? One problem is the sale of fireworks to people under the age of 18. Will she encourage local authorities to promote the use of cards, such as validation cards, so that fireworks are only sold to people over the age of 18?

Geraint Davies: A yw'r Gweinidog yn cydnabod bod defnydd amhriodol o dân gwyllt yn anghymdeithasol, yn beryglus, ac yn achosi llawer o ofid i bobl? Un broblem yw gwerthu tân gwyllt i bobl o dan 18 oed. A fydd yn annog awdurdodau lleol i hybu defnyddio cardiau, fel cardiau dilysu, fel mai dim ond i bobl dros 18 oed y caiff tân gwyllt eu gwerthu?

Edwina Hart: I agree about the distress that fireworks can cause as people let them off and, of course, what can happen in those circumstances. I will take this matter up with the Welsh Local Government Association.

Edwina Hart: Cytunaf ynghylch y gofid y gall tân gwyllt ei achosi wrth i bobl eu tanio ac, wrth gwrs, yr hyn y gall ddigwydd yn yr amgylchiadau hynny. Byddaf yn codi'r mater hwn gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru.

Rheolau Gofyniad Benthycar Sector Cyhoeddus Public Sector Borrowing Requirement Rules

Q8 Janet Davies: What recent discussions has the Minister had with Westminster colleagues on the public sector borrowing requirement rules, and their effects on local government spending on social housing? (OAQ14675)

C8 Janet Davies: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael yn ddiweddar â'i chydweithwyr yn San Steffan am reolau gofyniad benthycar sector cyhoeddus, a'u heffeithiau ar wariant llywodraeth leol ar dai cymdeithasol? (OAQ14675)

Edwina Hart: As you know, I have written formally, on three occasions, to the Chief Secretary to the Treasury seeking a change to the public sector borrowing requirement rules. A change would allow local authorities to borrow to carry out repairs and improvements to houses. The latest approach was in the summer, as I reported to Plenary on 12 July, and this was rejected.

Edwina Hart: Fel y gwyddoch, yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu'n ffurfiol, ar dri achlysur, at Brif Ysgrifennydd y Trysorlys yn ceisio newid rheolau gofyniad benthycar sector cyhoeddus. Byddai newid yn galluogi i awdurdodau lleol fenthycu i drwsio a gwella cyflwr tai. Y tro diwethaf oedd yn yr haf, fel y nodais yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 12 Gorffennaf, a gwrthodwyd y cais hwnnw.

Janet Davies: Minister, in the face of that rejection, are your Westminster colleagues prepared to come to Wales to explain face to face to tenants their refusal to adopt a financial system which is in place in other European countries? That system would

Janet Davies: Weinidog, o ystyried y gwrthodiad hwnnw, a yw eich cyd-aelodau yn San Steffan yn barod i ddod i Gymru i esbonio wyneb yn wyneb i denantiaid eu penderfyniad i beidio â mabwysiadu system ariannol sydd mewn grym mewn gwledydd

enable tenants in Wales to improve their houses to modern standards, without the Government here having to wriggle through an administrative minefield.

Edwina Hart: I do not feel that I must wriggle through anything. Ultimately, it is important that we recognise that the Westminster Government has only recently been re-elected with a massive majority. Therefore, I conclude that people are happy with policy direction. I do not want to comment further than that.

Alun Cairns: Bearing in mind the high-taxing habit of Welsh local government, does the Minister agree that increasing the capacity to borrow would jeopardise the opportunity for low taxes? Does she not feel that it would be more constructive, in terms of social housing policy, for local authorities to work constructively with housing associations and the private sector?

Edwina Hart: Local authorities already work constructively with the private sector and with housing associations. It is important that you compare council tax figures across the border when considering Welsh authorities. Welsh authorities are certainly not profligate, and this is not a back-door method of getting excessive amounts of money.

John Griffiths: With regard to our correspondence on the prefabricated housing redevelopment scheme in Newport, and efforts to equalise the treatment given to tenants with that given to owners, has there been any progress in achieving fairer treatment for tenants?

Edwina Hart: I am pleased with the developments on the new prefabricated housing. They have been wonderful in terms of the homes provided. Equality of treatment for tenants is still on the agenda and I am examining the issue.

Ewropeaidd eraill? Byddai'r system honno'n galluogi tenantiaid yng Nghymru i wella eu tai i safonau modern, heb i'r Llywodraeth yma orfod stryffaglio drwy beryglon gweinyddol.

Edwina Hart: Ni theimlaf fod rhaid imi stryffaglio drwy unrhyw beth. Yn y pen draw, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cydnabod mai dim ond yn ddiweddar yr ail-etholwyd Llywodraeth San Steffan gyda mwyafrif anferth. Felly, dof i'r casgliad bod pobl yn fodlon â chyfeiriad y polisi. Nid wyf am wneud sylw pellach na hynny.

Alun Cairns: O ystyried tueddiad llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru i godi trethi uchel, a gytuna'r Gweinidog y byddai cynyddu'r capasiti i fentyca yn rhoi'r cyfle i gael trethi isel yn y fantol? Onid yw'n teimlo y byddai'n fwy adeiladol, o ran polisi tai cymdeithasol, i awdurdodau lleol weithio'n adeiladol gyda chymdeithasau tai a'r sector preifat?

Edwina Hart: Mae awdurdodau lleol eisoes yn gweithio'n adeiladol gyda'r sector preifat a chyda chymdeithasau tai. Mae'n bwysig eich bod yn cymharu ffigurau treth gyngor dros y ffin wrth ystyried awdurdodau yng Nghymru. Yn sicr nid yw awdurdodau Cymru yn afradlon, ac nid dull ystrywgar o gael symiau gormodol o arian ydyw.

John Griffiths: O ran ein gohebiaeth ar y cynllun ailddatblygu tai parod yng Nghasnewydd, a'n hymdrechion i sicrhau bod tenantiaid yn cael eu trin yn yr un ffordd â pherchnogion, a fu unrhyw gynnydd wrth sicrhau bod tenantiaid yn cael eu trin yn gyfartal?

Edwina Hart: Yr wyf yn fodlon ar y datblygiadau ar y tai parod newydd. Buont yn wych o ran y cartrefi a ddarparwyd. Mae trin tenantiaid yn gyfartal yn dal i fod ar yr agenda ac yr wyf yn archwilio'r mater.

Gosod a Chynnal Larymau Mwg Installing and Maintaining Smoke Alarms

Q9 Jocelyn Davies: What measures has the Minister taken to educate householders on the importance of installing and maintaining smoke alarms? (OAQ14693)

Edwina Hart: At a national level, responsibility for promoting fire awareness rests with the Department of Transport, Local Government and the Regions which works with the National Community Fire Safety Centre in promoting the smoke alarm campaign launched in September 2001. That highlighted the importance of a working smoke alarm.

Earlier this year I set up the community fire safety working group to examine, among other matters, the scope for widespread adoption in Wales of hard-wired smoke detectors in social housing. The working group has submitted its report, which was considered by the Local Government and Housing Committee on 7 November. Several recommendations were made, including a target for all social housing to have hard-wired detectors by the end of 2005. I will consider that for inclusion in a new programme for 2002-03 to be taken forward in the new year.

Jocelyn Davies: I am sure that you agree that a major problem with smoke alarms is that, if they are not hard-wired, people take the batteries out of them, which renders them useless. Sometimes people are unable to replace the batteries, especially when the alarms are placed on high ceilings. How will you promote the benefits of the hard-wired systems, and what resources will you make available for that?

Edwina Hart: The report considered the recommendation that social housing in Wales be fitted with hard-wired alarms by 2005. We have made £3 million available to take forward the report's recommendations. I am in constant discussion with the fire services in Wales—I will meet them next week—to consider what further work we can do on this issue, which I know has general support across all parties in the National Assembly.

Gwenda Thomas: Are you aware that the Mid and West Wales Fire Authority has a

C9 Jocelyn Davies: Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cymryd i addysgu deiliaid tai am bwysigrwydd gosod a chynnal larymau mwg? (OAQ14693)

Edwina Hart: Ar lefel genedlaethol, yr Adran Drafnidiaeth, Llywodraeth Leol a'r Rhanbarthau sy'n gyfrifol am hybu ymwybyddiaeth tân. Mae'n gweithio gyda'r Ganolfan Diogelwch Tân Cymunedol Genedlaethol wrth hybu'r ymgyrch larymau mwg a lansiwyd ym Medi 2001. Amlygodd hynny bwysigrwydd larwm tân sy'n gweithio.

Yn gynharach eleni sefydlais y gweithgor diogelwch tân cymunedol i archwilio, ymysg materion eraill, y posibilrwydd o fabwysiadu synwryddion mwg gwifredig mewn tai cymdeithasol yng Nghymru. Mae'r gweithgor wedi cyflwyno ei adroddiad, a ystyriwyd gan y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai ar 7 Tachwedd. Gwnaethpwyd sawl argymhelliad, yn cynnwys targed y dylai'r holl dai cymdeithasol gael synwryddion gwifredig erbyn diwedd 2005. Byddaf yn ystyried cynnwys hynny mewn rhaglen newydd ar gyfer 2002-03 i'w datblygu yn y flwyddyn newydd.

Jocelyn Davies: Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn cytuno mai un o brif broblemau larymau mwg yw, os nad ydynt yn rhai gwifredig, fod pobl yn dueddol o dynnu'r batris, sy'n eu gwneud yn ddiwerth. Weithiau ni fydd pobl yn gallu gosod batris newydd, yn enwedig pan fo'r larymau wedi'u gosod ar nenfydau uchel. Sut yr hyrwyddwch fanteision systemau gwifredig, a pha adnoddau fydd ar gael ar gyfer hynny?

Edwina Hart: Ystyriodd yr adroddiad yr argymhelliad y dylid gosod larymau gwifredig mewn tai cymdeithasol yng Nghymru erbyn 2005. Mae £3 miliwn ar gael i ddatblygu argymhellion yr adroddiad. Caf drafodaethau cyson â'r gwasanaethau tân yng Nghymru—byddaf yn cwrdd â hwy yr wythnos nesaf—i ystyried pa waith pellach y gallwn ei wneud ar y mater hwn, y gwn ei fod yn cael cefnogaeth gyffredinol yr holl bleidiau yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

Gwenda Thomas: A ydych yn ymwybodol bod gan Awdurdod Tân Canolbarth a

scheme to install longlife-battery smoke alarms in the homes of vulnerable people—the elderly and disabled—and to replace shortlife-battery alarms? Although that is not as good as providing hard-wired alarms, it is a step forward. I understand that the life of this battery is very long indeed.

Edwina Hart: I am aware of the Mid and West Wales Fire Authority's excellent work in this regard. The initiatives that all fire authorities take on this are most welcome. Ideally, I would like to consider the hard-wired option for the future. The difficulty, even with longlife batteries, is that they sometimes do not get replaced. Sometimes people take batteries out of a fire alarm and put it into a toy or some other appliance.

Gorllewin Cymru gynllun i osod larymau mwg batri oes hir yn nhai pobl diamddiffyn—yr henoed a phobl anabl—yn lle larymau batri oes fer? Er nad yw hyn cystal â darparu larymau gwifredig, mae'n gam ymlaen. Deallaf fod y batri hwn yn parhau'n hir iawn.

Edwina Hart: Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o waith rhagorol Awdurdod Tân Canolbarth Gorllewin Cymru yn y cyswllt hwn. Rhaid croesawu'r mentrau a sefydlir gan bob awdurdod tân ar hyn. Yn ddelfrydol, hoffwn ystyried yr opsiwn gwifredig ar gyfer y dyfodol. Yr anhawster, hyd yn oed gyda batris oes hir, yw na chaiff batris newydd eu gosod yn eu lle bob amser. Weithiau bydd pobl yn tynnu batris o larwm tân ac yn ei roi mewn tegau neu offeryn arall.

Adnewyddu Tai Cyngor Renovating Council Housing

Q10 Janet Ryder: Will the Minister make a statement on the funding available to local authorities for the renovation of council housing? (OAQ14680)

C10 Janet Ryder: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar yr arian sydd ar gael i awdurdodau lleol i adnewyddu tai cyngor? (OAQ14680)

Edwina Hart: We are obviously increasing housing capital budgets over the next three years and it is for local authorities to decide how the bulk of those resources are used. They should consider all options for improving their housing stock to the new Welsh housing quality standard referred to in the national housing strategy.

Edwina Hart: Mae'n amlwg ein bod yn cynyddu cyllidebau cyfalaf tai dros y tair blynedd nesaf a lle awdurdodau lleol yw penderfynu sut y caiff y rhan fwyaf o'r adnoddau hyn eu defnyddio. Dylent ystyried pob opsiwn ar gyfer gwella eu stoc tai yn unol â safon ansawdd newydd tai Cymru y cyfeiriwyd ati yn y strategaeth tai genedlaethol.

Janet Ryder: If an authority decides to transfer its stock and to set up a new registered social landlord in an area where there are existing registered social landlords, how will you ensure a level playing field so that all landlords have equal access to being able to build new houses, and one group is not favoured above another?

Janet Ryder: Os bydd awdurdod yn penderfynu trosglwyddo ei stoc a sefydlu landlord cymdeithasol cofrestredig mewn ardal lle ceir landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig eisoes, sut y byddwch yn sicrhau chwarae teg fel y bydd gan bob landlord yr un cyfle i adeiladu tai newydd, ac na chaiff un grŵp ei ffafrio'n fwy nag un arall?

Edwina Hart: You are referring to the total transfer of the stock, I assume. I will consider those issues in the round.

Edwina Hart: Cymeraf eich bod yn cyfeirio at drosglwyddo'r stoc gyfan. Byddaf yn ystyried y materion hynny yn eu holl agweddau.

9:25 a.m.

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd Questions to the Minister for Environment

The Presiding Officer: Question 1 (OAQ14630) has been transferred for written answer. **Y Llywydd:** Trosglwyddwyd Cwestiwn 1 (OAQ14630) i gael ateb ysgrifenedig.

Cyffordd 45 yr M4 Junction 45 of the M4

Q2 Gwenda Thomas: Will the Minister give an update on the progress of work being carried out on junction 45 of the M4? (OAQ14636)

C2 Gwenda Thomas: A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf ynghylch y gwaith sy'n cael ei gynnal ar gyffordd 45 yr M4? OAQ14636)

The Minister for Environment (Sue Essex): Improvements at junction 45 form an integral part of the council's transport grant bid for the Swansea bay bus priority package. An increase in cost has been caused by a revision of the original proposals, which seek to meet additional objectives to those of the accepted bus corridor package. The proposals include placing signals at the junction, which should have consequential benefits for queues at each approach to the junction. This bid is being considered and I expect to make an announcement on it in January.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd (Sue Essex): Mae'r gwelliannau ar gyffordd 45 yn rhan hanfodol o gais y cyngor am grant trafniadaeth ar gyfer pecyn blaenoriaeth bws bae Abertawe. Cafwyd cynnydd yn y gost o ganlyniad i ddiwygio'r cynigion gwreiddiol, sy'n ceisio bodloni amcanion ychwanegol i rai y pecyn coridor bws a dderbyniwyd. Mae'r cynigion yn cynnwys gosod arwyddion yn y gyffordd, a ddylai leihau tagfeydd wrth bob mynediad i'r gyffordd. Mae'r cais hwn yn cael ei ystyried a disgwyliaf wneud datganiad arno ym mis Ionawr.

Gwenda Thomas: Delays at junction 45 can add significantly to journey times. Do you agree that uncongested access to the M4 at this junction is vital for the regeneration of the upper Swansea and Amman valleys, and for the full benefit of the A4067 to be realised?

Gwenda Thomas: Gall tagfeydd ar gyffordd 45 gynyddu amseroedd teithiau'n sylweddol. A gytunwch fod mynediad rhwydd i'r M4 yn y gyffordd hon yn hanfodol i adfywio pen uchaf Cwmtawe a Chwmaman, ac er mwyn manteisio i'r eithaf ar yr A4067?

Sue Essex: Thank you, Gwenda, for making representations to me on behalf of the communities concerned. It is hoped that there will be signalling improvements at that junction which will benefit the north and south sides of the M4 and the communities that you represent.

Sue Essex: Diolch, Gwenda, am roi sylwadau imi ar ran y cymunedau dan sylw. Y gobaith yw y bydd gwell arwyddion ar y gyffordd honno a fydd o fudd i ochrau gogleddol a deheuol yr M4 a'r cymunedau yr ydych yn eu cynrychioli.

Alun Cairns: Junction 45 was the main subject of discussion by members of the public at a South West Wales Regional Committee meeting over a year ago. Why has it taken so long to consider formal proposals? Why do we have to wait until January for a formal statement, rather than accepting that traffic signals are needed at that junction? At

Alun Cairns: Cyffordd 45 oedd prif bwnc trafod aelodau'r cyhoedd mewn cyfarfod o Bwyllgor Rhanbarth De Orllewin Cymru dros flwyddyn yn ôl. Pam y cymerodd gymaint o amser i ystyried cynigion ffurfiol? Pam bod yn rhaid inni aros tan fis Ionawr am ddatganiad ffurfiol, yn hytrach na derbyn bod angen arwyddion traffig ar y gyffordd honno?

present, it is an inhibitor to inward investment.

Sue Essex: It is December, and January is just around the corner, so I do not think that you have to wait very long. That might have escaped your notice. I am aware of the situation, as Gwenda has kept me informed. People who know about traffic engineering know that you must plan for each situation carefully, because if you put a set of proposals in one place without thinking in an integrated way, you often cause unforeseen problems. This is seen as part of the corridor package put forward by the local council, and it has to be thought through properly. That is what has been done, and we will be making an announcement on that in January.

Val Lloyd: I declare an interest as a member of Swansea City and County Council. I am delighted with your response, Sue, because it is a vital junction to both Gwenda's constituency and mine. You have indicated the range of changes to be made there, and why they have taken some time to come about. However, the changes are vital for Swansea valley to reap the benefits of investment. It is important that we allow the South West Wales Integrated Transport Consortium bus priority package to go forward. Will you give me a more detailed estimate of when the work will be completed?

Sue Essex: That scheme is one of the transport grant bids, and I remind all Members that we have transport grant bids from all parts of Wales. They are all seen as important for their communities. We have supported the Swansea bus corridor project in the past, and I will be making an announcement in January. You are right to point out that community accessibility is important if people are to be able to access training and work. That underlies our transport strategy, in terms of both the framework and transport grant programmes.

Ar hyn o bryd, mae'n atal mewnfuddsoddiad.

Sue Essex: Mae'n fis Rhagfyr, ac mae bron yn fis Ionawr, felly ni chredaf fod yn rhaid ichi aros yn hir iawn. Efallai nad ydych wedi sylwi ar hynny. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r sefyllfa, gan fod Gwenda wedi rhoi gwybod i mi. Mae pobl sy'n arbenigo ym maes peirianwaith traffig yn gwybod bod yn rhaid ichi gynllunio ar gyfer pob sefyllfa'n ofalus, oherwydd os byddwch yn gweithredu set o gynigion mewn un man heb feddwl mewn modd integredig, yn aml byddwch yn achosi problemau nas rhagwelwyd. Gwelir hyn fel rhan o becyn y coridor a gyflwynwyd gan y cyngor lleol, a rhaid ystyried hyn yn llawn. Dyna'r hyn a wnaed, a byddwn yn gwneud cyhoeddiad ar hynny ym mis Ionawr.

Val Lloyd: Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o Gyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe. Yr wyf wrth fy modd â'ch ymateb, Sue, oherwydd mae'n gyffordd hanfodol i etholaeth Gwenda a'm hetholaeth i. Nodasoch yr ystod o newidiadau y dylid eu gwneud yno, a pham y cymerwyd peth amser i'w gweithredu. Fodd bynnag, mae'r newidiadau'n hanfodol i Gwmtawe fanteisio ar fuddsoddiad. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn caniatáu i becyn blaenoriaeth bws Consortiwm Trafnidiaeth Integredig De Orllewin Cymru gael ei dderbyn. A roddwch amcangyfrif mwy manwl imi pryd y cwblheir y gwaith?

Sue Essex: Mae'r cynllun hwnnw yn un o'r ceisiadau am grant trafndiaeth, a hoffwn atgoffa'r holl Aelodau bod ceisiadau am grant trafndiaeth yn dod o bob rhan o Gymru. Ystyrir bod pob un ohonynt yn bwysig i'w cymunedau. Yr ydym wedi cefnogi prosiect coridor bws Abertawe yn y gorffennol, a byddaf yn gwneud cyhoeddiad ym mis Ionawr. Yr ydych yn gywir wrth nodi bod hygyrchedd cymunedol yn bwysig er mwyn i bobl gael mynediad i hyfforddiant a gwaith. Mae hynny'n sail i'n strategaeth drafnidiaeth, o ran y fframwaith a'r rhaglenni grant trafndiaeth.

Gwasanaeth Rheilffordd rhwng Caerdydd a Chaergybi
Rail Service between Cardiff and Holyhead

C3 Owen John Thomas: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael yn ddiweddar gyda'r cyrff perthnasol ynghylch datblygu'r gwasanaeth rheilffordd rhwng Caerdydd a Chaergybi? (OAQ14659)

Sue Essex: I have regular meetings with the Strategic Rail Authority about developing rail services in Wales, including the provision of north-south train services. Since May 2000, the Welsh Assembly Government has provided funding for a direct train service—Peter Law began that—between Cardiff and Holyhead, via Wrexham. Under current arrangements, that service will continue until May 2002.

Owen John Thomas: Yr wyf yn anffodlon â'r sefyllfa, gan fod dyheadau a fynegwyd dros ddwy flynedd a hanner yn ôl heb eu gwreiddu hyd yma. A oes modd i chi symud ymlaen yn gynt, neu a yw dylanwad WAG yn rhy wantan ar Lywodraeth San Steffan a'r Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol?

Sue Essex: All Members realise that we have no direct responsibility for railways. Therefore, I cannot promise something that I cannot deliver. We have supported the railway line to north-east Wales, which people do use. I use it when I travel to north Wales, and it is used by other Members, such as Karen Sinclair and Ann Jones, with whom I have sat on occasion. We have supported the Wales and Borders franchise. In fact, it is due to the National Assembly for Wales's presence, and the importance that we have given to that issue, that the franchise has been created and is currently being developed in shadow form.

We have presented a series of aspirations to the Strategic Rail Authority to improve services across Wales. The SRA will decide on those, but it has listened closely to us. Members of the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee know that Chris Austin from the SRA has attended Committee meetings frequently. We support

Q3 Owen John Thomas: What discussions has the Minister had recently with the relevant bodies concerning development of the rail service between Cardiff and Holyhead? (OAQ14659)

Sue Essex: Caf gyfarfodydd rheolaidd â'r Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol ynghylch datblygu gwasanaethau rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru, yn cynnwys darpariaeth gwasanaethau trên rhwng y gogledd a'r de. Ers mis Mai 2000, mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi darparu arian ar gyfer gwasanaeth trên uniongyrchol—Peter Law a ddechreuodd hynny—rhwng Caerdydd a Chaergybi, drwy Wrexham. O dan y trefniadau presennol, bydd y gwasanaeth hwnnw'n parhau tan fis Mai 2002.

Owen John Thomas: I am unhappy with this situation, as aspirations expressed over two and a half years ago have not yet been realised. Could you move things along quicker, or is the WAG's influence over the Westminster Government and the Strategic Rail Authority too feeble?

Sue Essex: Mae'r holl Aelodau'n sylweddoli nad oes gennym gyfrifoldeb uniongyrchol dros reilffyrdd. Felly, ni allaf addo rhywbeth na allaf ei gyflawni. Yr ydym wedi cefnogi'r llinell reilffordd i ogledd-ddwyrain Cymru, y mae pobl yn ei defnyddio. Byddaf yn ei defnyddio wrth deithio i ogledd Cymru, ac mae Aelodau eraill yn ei defnyddio, fel Karen Sinclair ac Ann Jones, yr wyf wedi cyd-deithio â hwy ar sawl achlysur. Yr ydym wedi cefnogi masnachfaint Wales and Borders. Yn wir, oherwydd presenoldeb Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, a'r pwysigrwydd a roddwyd gennym i'r mater hwnnw, crëwyd y fasnachfaint ac y mae'n cael ei datblygu ar ffurf gysgodol.

Yr ydym wedi cyflwyno cyfres o ddyheadau i'r Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol i wella gwasanaethau ledled Cymru. Yr Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol a fydd yn penderfynu ar y rhain, ond mae wedi gwrandao'n astud arnom. Gŵyr aelodau Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth fod Chris Austin o'r Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd

improvements to the rail service across Wales. However, we have made representations on the north-south line and are considering how we can support that service beyond May 2002.

Peter Law: I congratulate the Minister on her excellent work to enhance the rail service in Wales, in particular by using it herself. Yesterday, she used the rail service to Rhondda with other Environment, Planning and Transport Committee members. What action is she taking now to support the excellent scheme for the reopening of the passenger rail service between Cardiff and Ebbw Vale and Abertyleri in my constituency which will benefit Blaenau Gwent, Caerphilly, Newport, and also Cardiff? We look forward to her support for that scheme in future.

Sue Essex: We took a pleasant trip to look at the line between Cardiff and the steel works in Ebbw Vale. I was encouraged by the state of the line as it was in a better condition than we had thought. We went to Ebbw Vale with members and officials from Blaenau Gwent County Borough Council and others to consider how that line could work and the communities that it would benefit. Close discussions between our officials and those conducting the value for money studies are taking place. I hope that we will have a conclusive report from those studies soon so that Peter Law's wish can be progressed further.

Glyn Davies: Do you accept that improving links between north and south Wales, whether by rail or road, can play a significant part in nation-building in Wales? It will also alleviate the feelings of disappointment that exist in north, mid and west Wales that the Cardiff-centric nature of this Government is damaging the Assembly.

The Presiding Officer: Order. The question is not about Cardiff centrism, but about railway connections, which are not centred in Cardiff.

Strategol wedi mynychu cyfarfodydd y Pwyllgor yn aml. Cefnogwn welliannau i'r gwasanaeth rheilffyrdd ledled Cymru. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wedi cyflwyno sylwadau ar y llinell rhwng y Gogledd a'r De ac yr ydym yn ystyried sut y gallwn gefnogi'r gwasanaeth hwnnw ar ôl mis Mai 2002.

Peter Law: Llongyfarchaf y Gweinidog ar ei gwaith rhagorol i wella'r gwasanaeth rheilffordd yng Nghymru, yn enwedig drwy ei ddefnyddio ei hun. Ddoe, defnyddiodd y gwasanaeth rheilffordd i deithio i'r Rhondda gydag aelodau eraill Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth. Pa gamau y mae'n eu cymryd yn awr i gefnogi'r cynllun rhagorol ar gyfer ailagor y gwasanaeth rheilffyrdd teithwyr rhwng Caerdydd a Glyn Ebwy ac Abertyleri yn fy etholaeth a fydd o fudd i Flaenau Gwent, Caerffili, Casnewydd, a hefyd Caerdydd? Edrychwn ymlaen at gael ei chefnogaeth i'r cynllun hwnnw yn y dyfodol.

Sue Essex: Aethom ar daith bleserus i edrych ar y llinell rhwng Caerdydd a'r gwaith dur yng Nglyn Ebwy. Fe'm calonogwyd gan gyflwr y llinell gan ei bod mewn gwell cyflwr na'r hyn a dybiwyd. Aethom i Lyn Ebwy gydag aelodau a swyddogion o Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Blaenau Gwent ac eraill i ystyried y ffordd y gallai'r llinell honno weithio a'r cymunedau a fyddai'n elwa ohoni. Cynhelir trafodaethau manwl rhwng ein swyddogion a'r rhai hynny sy'n gwneud yr astudiaethau gwerth am arian. Gobeithiaf y bydd gennym adroddiad terfynol o'r astudiaethau hynny'n fuan fel y gellir hyrwyddo dymuniad Peter Law ymhellach.

Glyn Davies: A dderbyniwch y gall gwella cysylltiadau rhwng y Gogledd a'r De, boed hynny yn gysylltiadau ffyrdd neu'n rheilffyrdd, chwarae rhan sylweddol yn y gwaith o adeiladu Cymru fel cenedl? Bydd hefyd yn lleddfu'r siom sy'n bodoli yng ngogledd, canolbarth a gorllewin Cymru bod pwyslais y Llywodraeth hon ar Gaerdydd yn gwneud drwg i'r Cynulliad.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid ynghylch canolbleidiaeth Caerdydd y mae'r cwestiwn, ond ynghylch cysylltiadau rheilffyrdd, nad dynt wedi'u canoli yng Nghaerdydd.

Sue Essex: The need to improve north-south links was behind Peter Law's innovative move to support that rail link, which we have continued to support. The Assembly played its part in that development. A wider myth that people like to spread is that people in north Wales think that the Assembly is Cardiff-centric. That is not my impression. I wish to make that point because it is important. I visit north Wales frequently, as do my Cabinet colleagues, and people in north Wales feel that we have taken their concerns to heart. I have seen real improvements in north Wales as a result of the transport budget. The myth is being dispelled by practical policies and investment in north Wales.

Alun Pugh: I also travel to north Wales frequently, Sue, and even with clapped-out trains running on obsolete infrastructures, it is perfectly possible to travel on a train from north to south Wales in three and a half hours. Will you press Wales and Borders to provide a semi-fast morning service to allow north Wales residents to travel to the capital for a day's work or leisure? It is not acceptable that a strategic Welsh service doubles up as a train that stops in Cheshire and Shropshire.

Sue Essex: A difficulty that train operating companies face is that many lines throughout Wales and the borders carry strategic passengers—such as Alun, hotfoot from north Wales to enjoy another wonderful week at the National Assembly—as well as people who use them for shorter journeys which they consider to be important. Tension exists between the use of stopping-trains and through-trains. Other Assembly Members also feel strongly about this issue. We are concerned about this. The Committee may wish to invite Chris Gibb, the current managing director of Wales and Borders Trains, I believe, to talk about how the franchise, or the shadow franchise to give it its proper name, is currently operating. I have spoken about this with Richard Edwards, who accompanied me on the train to Treorchy yesterday—we also went to

Sue Essex: Yr angen i wella cysylltiadau rhwng y Gogledd a'r De oedd y tu ôl i ymgais dyfeisgar Peter Law i gefnogi'r cyswllt rheilffordd hwnnw, yr ydym wedi parhau i'w gefnogi. Chwaraeodd y Cynulliad ei ran yn y datblygiad hwnnw. Chwedl ehangach y mae pobl yn hoffi ei lledaenu yw bod pobl yng ngogledd Cymru'n credu bod y Cynulliad yn canolbwyntio gormod ar Gaerdydd. Nid dyna'r argraff a gaf i. Hoffwn wneud y pwynt hwnnw oherwydd mae'n bwysig. Byddaf yn ymweld â'r Gogledd yn aml, fel fy nghyd-Aelodau yn y Cabinet, ac mae pobl yn y Gogledd yn teimlo ein bod wedi ystyried eu barn. Gwelais welliannau gwirioneddol yng ngogledd Cymru o ganlyniad i'r gyllideb trafndiaeth. Caiff y chwedl ei chwalu gan bolisiau ymarferol a buddsoddiadau yn y Gogledd.

Alun Pugh: Byddaf innau'n teithio i'r Gogledd yn aml, Sue, a hyd yn oed gyda threnau sydd wedi gweld eu dyddiau gorau sy'n rhedeg ar seilwaith sydd ar ddarfod, mae'n hollol bosibl teithio ar drên o'r gogledd i'r de mewn tair awr a hanner. A wenwch chi bwysu ar Wales and Borders i ddarparu gwasanaeth gymharol gyflym yn y bore i alluogi pobl yn y gogledd i deithio i'r brifddinas i weithio am y diwrnod neu ar gyfer hamdden? Nid yw'n dderbyniol i wasanaeth strategol yng Nghymru fod yn drên hefyd sy'n stopio yn Swydd Gaer a Swydd Amwythig.

Sue Essex: Un anhawster y gall cwmnïau trenau ei wynebu yw bod llawer o linellau drwy Gymru a'r gororau'n cludo teithwyr strategol—fel Alun, ar frys o'r Gogledd i fwynhau wythnos wych arall yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol—yn ogystal â phobl sy'n eu defnyddio ar gyfer teithiau byrrach sy'n bwysig iddynt hwy. Mae tensiwn yn bodoli rhwng defnyddio trenau araf a threnau uniongyrchol. Mae Aelodau eraill o'r Cynulliad hefyd yn teimlo'n gryf ynghylch y mater hwn. Yr ydym yn pryderu ynghylch hyn. Efallai y dymunai'r Pwyllgor wahodd Chris Gibb, rheolwr gyfarwyddwr presennol Wales and Borders Trains, fe gredaf, i siarad am sut y mae'r fasnachfaint, neu'r fasnachfaint gysgodol i roi'r enw cywir arni, yn gweithredu ar hyn o bryd. Yr wyf wedi siarad am hyn gyda Richard Edwards, a gyd-deithiodd gyda mi ar y trên i Dreorci ddoe—

Treherbert, just for the ride.

aethom i Dreherbert hefyd, jyst am dro.

9:35 a.m.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Yr oeddwn yn rhyfeddu i'ch clywed yn dweud bod pobl y Gogledd yn hapus â'r newidiadau sydd wedi'u gwneud i'r gwasanaeth. Nid wyf wedi cyfarfod ag unrhyw unigolyn o'r Gogledd sydd yn hapus â'r gwasanaeth trenau rhwng Caerdybi a Chaerdydd. Efallai eich bod wedi cael profiad o deithio ar y trenau hyn yn achlysurol, ond a ydych wedi cael y profiad o sefyll bob cam o Crewe i Gaerdydd oherwydd bod y trenau weithiau yn orlawn? A ydych wedi teithio o Gaerdydd i Crewe, a chyrraedd Crewe ddau funud yn hwyr a gweld eich trê'n yn gadael yr orsaf i Gaerdybi? A ydych wedi gweld pa mor amhosibl yw hi i Aelodau Cynulliad y Gogledd deithio adref yn gyfleus ar ddydd Iau a theithio yn ôl i lawr ar ddydd Llun? A dderbyniwch fod ffordd bell i fynd i wella'r gwasanaeth rhwng Caerdybi a Chaerdydd? A wnewch chi, ar ran Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ymdyngeddu y bydd y cwmni newydd o dan fasnachfaint Cymru a'r Gororau yn addo darparu gwell gwasanaeth o hyn ymlaen.

Sue Essex: If you had listened to me carefully, I did not say that people in north Wales were happy with the service. They clearly are not. Alun, Eleanor, Karen and Ann represent north Wales constituencies and use this service frequently. They frequently express their dissatisfaction. What I said was that I was combating the myth that people in north Wales have been completely disenfranchised and ignored. This idea that we are Cardiff-centric and are not concerned about north Wales is not true. That was the answer to the question.

On railways, of course I am not happy, but, as I said, I am not responsible for them. We are looking for additional powers because that is what we want. That came out of the Committee report. I want to have greater influence and powers, with other Members, over transport. It is one of my frustrations. However, we are doing our best with the powers and resources that we have to influence the decisions of others. I am

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): I was astonished to hear you say that people in north Wales are happy with the changes that have been made to the service. I have not met a single soul from north Wales who is happy with the train service from Holyhead to Cardiff. You may have travelled on these trains occasionally, but have you been forced to stand every step of the way from Crewe to Cardiff because these trains are sometimes packed? Have you travelled from Cardiff to Crewe, and arrived in Crewe two minutes late only to see your train leaving the station for Holyhead? Do you know how impossible it is for north Wales Assembly Members to travel home conveniently on a Thursday and return on a Monday? Do you accept that there is a long way to go to improve the service between Cardiff and Holyhead? Will you, on behalf of the Assembly Government, ensure that the new company operating under the Wales and Borders franchise commits itself to improving the service without delay?

Sue Essex: Pe byddech wedi gwranddo yn astud arnaf, ni ddywedais fod pobl yn y Gogledd yn fodlon â'r gwasanaeth. Mae'n amlwg nad ydynt. Mae Alun, Eleanor, Karen ac Ann yn cynrychioli etholaethau yn y Gogledd ac yn defnyddio'r gwasanaeth hwn yn rheolaidd. Maent yn datgan eu hanfodlonrwydd yn aml. Yr hyn a ddywedais yw fy mod yn mynd i'r afael â'r chwedl fod pobl yn y Gogledd wedi'u difreinio a'u hanwybyddu. Nid yw'r syniad hwn ein bod yn canolbwyntio ar Gaerdydd ac nad ydym yn pryderu ynghylch y Gogledd yn wir. Dyna oedd yr ateb i'r cwestiwn.

O ran rheilffyrdd, wrth gwrs nid wyf yn hapus, ond, fel y dywedais, nid wyf yn gyfrifol amdanynt. Yr ydym yn chwilio am bwerau ychwanegol oherwydd mai dyna'r hyn yr ydym am ei gael. Daeth hynny i'r amlwg yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor. Yr wyf am gael mwy o ddylanwad a phwerau, gydag Aelodau eraill, dros drafnidiaeth. Dyma un o'm rhwystredigaethau. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn gwneud ein gorau gyda'r pwerau a'r

pleased to say that up to now the SRA has listened and responded. It is because of the fact that it was driven here in Wales that the franchise is coming up—do not forget that.

I vividly remember the north-south connections on that route. A couple of weeks ago, I ran from the train to the Holyhead train. I just about made it, and I know how tight it was. The Committee has expressed real concerns about timetabling. This has gone forward to Wales and Borders and the other train operators. I have spoken to Chris Green of Virgin trains, and we are doing our utmost to influence this to get better performance. That is what people want. The fact that Assembly Members use the trains, and are advocates for the trains, and respond to their constituents, is a strong force in a democratic situation.

Eleanor Burnham: I welcome your continued pressure. However, do you agree that we should ensure that the Holyhead train does not go out of Wales to Crewe and stops throughout Shropshire for the lucky people there, as Alun said? It should come through Wrexham to allow us to have a decent connection, rather than feel as if we live in Timbuktu. The other day, for instance, in Shrewsbury, I just about managed to catch the train because the Cardiff train was once again delayed. I understand that the infrastructure is the problem in this case. It is apparently the continued problem of points in the Chester region that is causing grave anxiety. We need a joined-up service. I was embarrassed, as I said to you previously, when I met the director of Tetra Pak, which now has its headquarters in Wrexham, where it has relocated from London. Surely, a global company of that magnitude, local people, and us regular travellers, deserve a much-improved service.

Sue Essex: I agree. It is not only Assembly Members who deserve an improved service, but members of the public, business people and people going about their daily lives.

adnoddau sydd gennym i ddylanwadu ar benderfyniadau pobl eraill. Mae'n bleser gennyf ddweud fod yr Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol hyd yn hyn wedi gwranddo ac wedi ymateb. Mae hyn oherwydd y ffaith yr ymgyrchwyd ar ei gyfer yma yng Nghymru a bod y fasnachfaint yn dod i ben—cofiwch hynny.

Cofiaf yn glir y cysylltiadau rhwng y Gogledd a'r De ar y llwybr hwnnw. Bythefnos yn ôl, rhedais o'r trê'n i drên Caergybi. Cyrhaeddais heb amser i'w sbario, a gwn pa mor agos yr oeddwn i golli'r trê'n. Mae'r Pwyllgor wedi mynegi pryderon gwirioneddol ynghylch amserlennu. Cyflwynwyd hyn i Wales and Borders a'r cwmnïau trê'n eraill. Siaradais â Chris Green o Virgin trains, ac yr ydym yn gwneud ein gorau i ddylanwadu ar hyn er mwyn cael perfformiad gwell. Dyna sydd ei eisiau ar bobl. Mae'r ffaith bod Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn defnyddio'r trenau, a'u bod yn cefnogi'r trenau, ac yn ymateb i'w hetholwyr, yn rym cryf mewn sefyllfa ddemocrataidd.

Eleanor Burnham: Croesawaf eich pwysau parhaus. Fodd bynnag, a gytunwch y dylem sicrhau nad yw trê'n Caergybi'n gadael Cymru i fynd i Crewe ac yn stopio drwy Swydd Amwythig ar gyfer y bobl ffodus yno, fel y dywedodd Alun? Dylai ddod drwy Wrecsam i'n galluogi i gael cysylltiad da, yn hytrach na theimlo ein bod yn byw yn Timbuktu. Y diwrnod o'r blaen, er enghraifft, yn yr Amwythig, bûm yn ddigon ffodus o ddal y trê'n oherwydd bod trê'n Caerdydd yn hwyr unwaith eto. Deallaf mai'r seilwaith yw'r broblem yn yr achos hwn. Yn ôl pob sôn, y broblem barhaus o bwyntiau yn rhanbarth Caer sy'n achosi pryder mawr. Mae angen gwasanaeth cysylltiedig arnom. Yr oedd gennyf gywilydd, fel y dywedais wrthyf yn flaenorol, pan gyfarfûm â chyfarwyddwr Tetra Pak, y lleolir ei bencadlys yn Wrecsam bellach, ar ôl ail-leoli o Lundain. Wrth gwrs, mae cwmni byd-eang o'r maint hwnnw, pobl leol, a ninnau'r teithwyr rheolaidd, yn haeddu gwasanaeth llawer gwell.

Sue Essex: Cytunaf. Nid Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn unig sy'n haeddu gwasanaeth gwell, ond aelodau'r cyhoedd, pobl fusnes a phobl yn eu hymwneud bob dydd. Mae tasg

There is a huge mountain to climb as regards the railways. We have frequently had this discussion. For a long time—a whole generation or two—people thought that the railways were not the way forward and that, in future, we would be a car-orientated society. People use and need their cars. However, we also desperately need trains for two important reasons. Travelling by rail enables people to get out of their cars and have a comfortable journey. It also contributes towards the country's economic image, which has been undervalued. We want to be a modern and progressive country and attract business people to Wales. Many of those business people will depend on the railways.

anferth o'n blaenau o ran y rheilffyrdd. Cawsom y drafodaeth hon yn aml. Am beth amser—cenhedlaeth gyfan neu ddwy—cre dai pobl nad y rheilffyrdd oedd y ffordd ymlaen ac, yn y dyfodol, y byddem yn gymdeithas a fyddai'n teithio mewn car. Mae pobl yn defnyddio'u ceir ac mae eu hangen arnynt. Fodd bynnag, mae angen trenau arnom yn ddirfawr am ddau reswm pwysig. Mae teithio ar reilffordd yn galluogi pobl i adael eu ceir a chael taith gyfforddus. Mae hefyd yn cyfrannu tuag at ddelwedd economaidd y wlad, na chafodd ei gwerthfawrogi'n ddigonol. Yr ydym am fod yn wlad fodern a blaengar a denu pobl fusnes i Gymru. Bydd llawer o'r bobl fusnes hynny'n dibynnu ar y rheilffyrdd.

The Presiding Officer: Question 4 (OAQ14642) has been withdrawn.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd Cwestiwn 4 (OAQ14642) yn ôl.

Mesurau Arafu Traffig yn Rhaeadr Traffic Calming Measures in Rhayader

Q5 The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): What representations has the Minister had for traffic calming measures in Rhayader? (OAQ14642)

C5 Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): Pa sylwadau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael ynghylch mesurau arafu traffig yn Rhaeadr? (OAQ14642)

Sue Essex: Representations have been made by the Rhayader and District Chamber of Trade, Rhayader Town Council, Kirsty Williams AM and Nicholas Bourne AM.

Sue Essex: Gwnaed sylwadau gan Siambr Fasnach Rhaeadr a'r Cylch, Cyngor Tref Rhaeadr, Kirsty Williams AC a Nicholas Bourne AC.

Nick Bourne: Minister, we have corresponded on this matter. In Brecon and Radnorshire—second only to a relief road in Talgarth—the issue of traffic in Rhayader is a real concern, particularly where the A44 and the A470 intercept. There is a need for clear signalling of priorities to slow down the traffic and to let people know where the priorities lie. It is not clear at the moment. We must also look at the speed limits as you go north-east out of Rhayader on the Llangurig to Aberystwyth road. I have also expressed concern on that matter. The Babbie report states a need for a relief road. Can you give us assurance that these matters are being considered—particularly the first two, as they can be dealt with in the short and medium term?

Nick Bourne: Weini dog, yr ydym wedi gohebu ar y mater hwn. Ym Mrycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed—dim ond yn ail i ffordd liniaru yn Nhalgarth—mae mater traffig yn Rhaeadr yn achos pryder mawr, yn enwedig lle mae'r A44 a'r A470 yn rhyngdorri. Mae angen arwyddion clir o'r blaenoriaethau i arafu'r traffig a rhoi gwybod i bobl pwy sydd â blaenoriaeth. Nid yw'n glir ar hyn o bryd. Hefyd rhaid inni edrych ar y cyfyngiadau cyflymder wrth deithio i'r gogledd-ddwyrain allan o Raeadr ar y ffordd o Langurig i Aberystwyth. Yr wyf hefyd wedi datgan pryder ar y mater hwnnw. Mae adroddiad Babbie yn nodi angen am ffordd osgoi. A allwch roi sicrwydd bod y materion hyn yn cael eu hystyried—yn enwedig y ddau gyntaf, oherwydd gellir ymdrin â hwy yn y tymor byr a chanolig?

Sue Essex: Recent speed surveys have shown

Sue Essex: Dangosodd arolygon cyflymder

that compliance with the speed limit at the southern end of the town is not good. Therefore, the Mid-Wales Trunk Road Agency has been instructed to install enhanced signing and road markings at that location within this financial year. We are addressing that issue. The northern end of the town's infrastructure, and, as you said, the A470 road, have been included in the Bactie report, as some Assembly Members will know. That will be taken into account in the review of trunk roads.

diweddar nad yw llawer yn cydymffurfio â'r cyfyngiad cyflymder ar ochr ddeheuol y dref yn dda. Felly, gorchmynnwyd Asiantaeth Priffyrdd Canolbarth Cymru i osod arwyddion a marciau ffordd gwell yn y lleoliad hwnnw o fewn y flwyddyn ariannol hon. Yr ydym yn mynd i'r afael â'r mater hwnnw. Cafodd ochr ogleddol seilwaith y dref, ac, fel y dywedasoch, ffordd yr A470, eu cynnwys yn adroddiad Bactie, fel y gŵyr rhai o Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Caiff hynny ei ystyried wrth adolygu'r cefnffyrdd.

Cyfreithiau a Rheoliadau Cynllunio Planning Laws and Regulations

Q6 John Griffiths: Will the Minister make a statement on the importance of planning laws and regulations to the future of Wales? (OAQ14702)

C6 John Griffiths: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar bwysigrwydd cyfreithiau a rheoliadau cynllunio i ddyfodol Cymru? (OAQ14702)

Sue Essex: An effective and efficient land-use planning system is essential to help us meet the future economic, social and environmental needs of Wales. We are committed to preparing the Wales spatial plan, which will provide a framework for change. In March 2002 we will publish 'Planning Policy Wales'. This will replace existing guidance and set out the Assembly's land-use planning policies for Wales. They will be used by local authorities preparing development plans and will also be a material consideration in decisions about planning applications.

Sue Essex: Mae system cynllunio defnydd o dir effeithiol ac effeithlon yn hanfodol i'n helpu i ddiwallu anghenion economaidd, cymdeithasol ac amgylcheddol Cymru yn y dyfodol. Yr ydym yn ymrwymedig i baratoi cynllun gofodol Cymru, a fydd yn darparu fframwaith ar gyfer newid. Ym mis Mawrth 2002 byddwn yn cyhoeddi 'Polisi Cynllunio Cymru'. Bydd hyn yn disodli canllawiau presennol ac yn gosod polisiau cynllunio defnydd o dir y Cynulliad ar gyfer Cymru. Cânt eu defnyddio gan awdurdodau lleol sy'n paratoi cynlluniau datblygu a hefyd byddant yn ystyriaeth berthnasol mewn penderfyniadau ar geisiadau cynllunio.

John Griffiths: Do you agree that Wales would benefit greatly from a new planning system that promotes sustainable development and quality of life and achieves greater certainty and speed of decision-making?

John Griffiths: A gytunwch y byddai Cymru'n elwa'n fawr ar system gynllunio newydd sy'n hybu datblygu cynaliadwy ac ansawdd bywyd ac sy'n gwneud penderfyniadau yn fwy sicr a chyflym?

Sue Essex: 'Planning Policy Wales', which will be finalised in March when we hope to print it, puts sustainable development at the core. It is a made-in-Wales solution because we are drafting the planning guidance differently from England. It will be a comprehensive, integrated approach to planning guidance, reflecting our duty under section 121 of the Act. I think that everyone who has seen the draft is happy about that.

Sue Essex: Mae 'Polisi Cynllunio Cymru', a gaiff ei gwblhau ym mis Mawrth pan fyddwn yn gobeithio ei argraffu, yn pwysleisio datblygu cynaliadwy. Mae'n ateb a luniwyd yng Nghymru oherwydd ein bod yn drafftio'r canllaw cynllunio yn wahanol i Loegr. Bydd yn ymagwedd gynhwysfawr, integredig tuag at ganllaw cynllunio, sy'n adlewyrchu ein dyletswydd o dan adran 121 y Ddeddf. Credaf fod pawb sydd wedi gweld y drafft yn fodlon ar hynny.

It also contains guidance for business, if that is what you refer to, John. Trying to provide a more effective, efficient and speedier planning decision-making system depends on getting the planning guidance updated, local authorities having up-to-date unitary development plans, and ensuring that planning application are dealt with more speedily. You may know that the UK Government has launched a Green Paper for England. We will do something similar in Wales, which will pick up on some of the issues you raised.

William Graham: Will you give a commitment to undertaking a review of the procedures used by local authorities in granting themselves planning permission?

Sue Essex: We will be considering that in our consultation.

The Presiding Officer: Question 7 (OAQ14654) has been withdrawn.

9:45 a.m.

Gwasanaeth Rheilffordd rhwng Caerdydd a'r Cymoedd Rail Service between Cardiff and the Valleys

C8 Owen John Thomas: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael yn ddiweddar gyda'r cyrff perthnasol ynghylch datblygu'r gwasanaeth rheilffordd rhwng Caerdydd a'r Cymoedd? (OAQ14658)

Sue Essex: I have regular meetings with the Strategic Rail Authority, and my officials have also met the pre-qualified bidders for the Wales and Borders franchise to press the case for improved rail services between Cardiff and the Valleys and throughout Wales.

Owen John Thomas: What steps are you taking to promote the development of the rail service between Cardiff and the Valleys by introducing a hybrid light rail system, in consultation with the relevant local authorities, the SRA and interested rail companies?

Mae hefyd yn cynnwys canllaw ar gyfer busnes, os mai dyna'r hyn yr ydych yn cyfeirio ato, John. Mae ceisio darparu system gwneud penderfyniadau fwy effeithiol, effeithlon a chyflymach yn dibynnu ar ddiweddarau'r canllaw cynllunio, rhoi'r cynlluniau datblygu unedol diweddaraf i'r awdurdodau lleol, a sicrhau yr ymdrinnir â cheisiadau cynllunio yn gynt. Gwyddoch efallai fod Llywodraeth y DU wedi lansio Papur Gwyrdd ar gyfer Lloegr. Byddwn yn gwneud rhywbeth tebyg yng Nghymru, a fydd yn mynd i'r afael â rhai o'r materion a godwyd gennych.

William Graham: A wnewch ymrwymiad i gynnal adolygiad o'r gweithdrefnau a ddefnyddir gan awdurdodau lleol wrth roi caniatâd cynllunio iddynt eu hunain?

Sue Essex: Byddwn yn ystyried hynny yn ein hymgyngoriad.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd Cwestiwn 7 (OAQ14654) yn ôl.

Q8 Owen John Thomas: What discussions has the Minister had recently with the relevant bodies concerning development of the rail service between Cardiff and the Valleys? (OAQ14658)

Sue Essex: Caf gyfarfodydd rheolaidd â'r Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol, ac mae fy swyddogion hefyd wedi cyfarfod â'r ymgeiswyr â chymwysterau blaenorol ar gyfer masnachfaint Wales and Borders i bwysu am wasanaethau rheilffyrdd gwell rhwng Caerdydd a'r Cymoedd a ledled Cymru.

Owen John Thomas: Pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd i hybu datblygiad y gwasanaeth rheilffyrdd rhwng Caerdydd a'r Cymoedd drwy gyflwyno system reilffordd ysgafn hybrid, wrth ymgynghori â'r awdurdodau lleol perthnasol, yr Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol a chwmnïau rheilffyrdd â diddordeb?

Sue Essex: We have not been putting our efforts into introducing a hybrid light rail system in the Valleys. I thought that, given previous discussions on this, Members were more supportive of a heavy-duty rail system. That is our priority and that of our partners in the South Wales Integrated Fast Transit consortium. We have been pushing Railtrack on this issue, and we have allocated money for enhancements to Queen Street station, so that there is better capacity. That is crucial for the Valleys service. If the enhancements are made, the infrastructure capacity can be doubled. We have been working with local authorities to develop improved services for the Valleys. The train on which Richard Edwards and I travelled yesterday had benefited in terms of capacity from the SRA's rail passenger partnership fund. Discussions on improvement to services are ongoing between the SWIFT consortium of local authorities and other local authorities and operators. I believe that that is the way forward for the Valleys, and that view has been strongly expressed by Valley authorities and others involved.

Jonathan Morgan: One exciting proposal by Cardiff City and County Council is the development of the rail network within Cardiff—that is, linking up the networks on the east and west of the city. Will the Minister join me in congratulating the authority in pursuing this proposal and urge it to implement the proposals as quickly as possible?

Sue Essex: I am glad that Jonathan recognises that the county council is pursuing an integrated transport development policy. The council has recognised that it needs to improve transport corridors on both sides of the city. However, neither the council nor the Assembly are the overriding authorities in terms of rail. At the end of the day, whether the systems are implemented depends on the owners and the train operating companies. However, this sends out an important message. Other local authorities across Wales are pursuing similar proposals. One important example is the Vale of Glamorgan Council, which recognises that the future lies in

Sue Essex: Ni fuom yn gweithio i gyflwyno system reilffordd ysgafn hybrid yn y Cymoedd. Credais, o ystyried y trafodaethau blaenorol ar hyn, fod yr Aelodau'n fwy cefnogol i system reilffordd gwaith trwm. Dyna'n blaenoriaeth ni a blaenoriaeth ein partneriaid yng nghonsortium Cludiant Cyflym Integredig De Cymru. Buom yn rhoi pwysau ar Railtrack ynghylch y mater hwn, a dyrannwyd arian ar gyfer gwelliannau i orsaf Stryd y Frenhines, er mwyn sicrhau gwell capasiti. Mae hynny'n hanfodol ar gyfer gwasanaethau'r Cymoedd. Os cyflawnir y gwelliannau, gellir dyblu capasiti'r seilwaith. Buom yn cydweithio ag awdurdodau lleol i ddatblygu gwasanaethau gwell ar gyfer y Cymoedd. Yr oedd y trê'n y teithiodd Richard Edwards a minnau arno ddoe wedi elwa o ran capasiti ar gronfa bartneriaeth teithwyr rheilffordd yr Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol. Mae trafodaethau ar wella gwasanaethau yn mynd rhagddynt rhwng consortium SWIFT o awdurdodau lleol ac awdurdodau a gweithredwyr lleol eraill. Credaf mai dyma'r ffordd ymlaen ar gyfer y Cymoedd, a datganwyd y farn honno'n glir gan awdurdodau'r Cymoedd ac eraill sy'n gysylltiedig â hyn.

Jonathan Morgan: Un cynnig cyffrous gan Gyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd yw datblygiad y rhwydwaith rheilffordd o fewn Caerdydd—hynny yw, cysylltu rhwydweithiau ar ochrau dwyreiniol a gorllewinol y ddinas. A fydd y Gweinidog yn ymuno â mi wrth longyfarch yr awdurdod ar ymhel â'r cynnig hwn a'i annog i weithredu'r cynigion cyn gynted â phosibl?

Sue Essex: Yr wyf yn falch bod Jonathan yn cydnabod bod y cyngor sir yn ymhel â pholisi datblygu trafndiaeth integredig. Mae'r cyngor wedi cydnabod bod angen iddo wella coridorau trafndiaeth ar ddwy ochr y ddinas. Fodd bynnag, nid y cyngor na'r Cynulliad yw'r awdurdodau pwysicaf o ran rheilffyrdd. Yn y pen draw, mae pa un a weithredir y systemau yn dibynnu ar y perchnogion a'r cwmnïau trenau. Fodd bynnag, mae hyn yn cyfleu neges bwysig. Mae awdurdodau lleol eraill ledled Cymru yn ymhel â chynigion tebyg. Un enghraifft bwysig yw Cyngor Bro Morgannwg, sy'n cydnabod mai gwasanaethau rheilffyrdd gwell yw'r ffordd

improved rail services. I look forward to seeing the Vale of Glamorgan passenger line opening within two years.

ymlaen. Edrychaf ymlaen at weld llinell reilffordd i deithwyr Bro Morgannwg yn agor ymhen dwy flynedd.

Datganiad ar Fuddsoddi drwy Bartneriaethau yng Nghymru Statement on Investment through Partnerships in Wales

The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart): In the summer of 2000, I invited representatives from both the public and private sectors to contribute to a consultation on the development of public private partnerships and the private finance initiative in Wales. The consultation period ended on 27 July 2001 and I am pleased to report its conclusions to the Assembly. This builds on my statement to Members on 5 December 2000.

The views of the consultees varied, with a range of different perspectives; but a number of common themes emerged. All respondents made positive and helpful comments on how the Assembly should develop and support the operation of PPP and PFI projects in Wales.

The defining feature of the arrangements that we are considering is that the private sector agrees to invest in, and then retain, ownership of a facility that is used for the provision of a public service.

A few respondents remain opposed to any such arrangements as a matter of principle. I have considered these responses but conclude that the Assembly Government should not forsake all such arrangements on that basis. This conclusion is based on the two following propositions.

First, insofar as the rest of the United Kingdom finances part of its investment in public services through PFI and therefore from outside the public expenditure block allocated to the Assembly, we must either mirror this form of investment or accept that Wales will have a lower level of investment.

Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chysylltiadau (Edwina Hart): Yn ystod haf 2000, gwahoddais gynrychiolwyr o'r sectorau cyhoeddus a phreifat i gyfrannu mewn ymgynghoriad ar ddatblygu partneriaethau cyhoeddus preifat a'r fenter cyllid preifat (PFI) yng Nghymru. Daeth y cyfnod ymgynghori i ben ar 27 Gorffennaf 2001 ac mae'n bleser gennyf gyflwyno adroddiad ar ei gasgliadau i'r Cynulliad. Mae hyn yn ychwanegu at fy natganiad i'r Aelodau ar 5 Rhagfyr 2000.

Yr oedd sylwadau'r rhai yr ymgynghorwyd â hwy'n amrywio, a chafwyd amrywiaeth eang o wahanol safbwyntiau; ond daeth nifer o themâu cyffredin i'r amlwg. Gwnaeth pob ymatebydd sylwadau cadarnhaol a defnyddiol ar sut y dylai'r Cynulliad ddatblygu a chefnogi'r gwaith o weithredu prosiectau partneriaeth cyhoeddus-preifat a PFI yng Nghymru.

Prif nodwedd y trefniadau a ystyrir gennym yw bod y sector preifat yn cytuno i fuddsoddi mewn cyfleuster a ddefnyddir i ddarparu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus a chadw perchenogaeth drosto.

Mae rhai o'r ymatebwyr yn anghytuno o hyd ag unrhyw drefniant o'r fath fel mater o egwyddor. Yr wyf wedi ystyried yr ymatebion hyn ond yr wyf o'r farn na ddylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad anwybyddu pob trefniant o'r fath ar y sail honno. Mae'r casgliad hwn yn seiliedig ar y ddau gynnig canlynol.

Yn gyntaf, gan fod gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig yn ariannu rhan o'i buddsoddiad mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus drwy PFI ac felly y tu allan i'r bloc gwariant cyhoeddus a ddyrannwyd i'r Cynulliad, rhaid inni naill ai ddilyn y math hwn o fuddsoddiad neu dderbyn y bydd gan Gymru lefel is o fuddsoddiad.

Secondly, where cases remain in which the private sector has particular experience and skills in the development and management of capital assets, we should develop close partnerships with business in order to use those skills in serving the public.

Most respondents recognised the need to take advantage of these arrangements on a pragmatic basis.

In developing the Government's response to the consultation, I wish to put before the Assembly the following principles for our employment of PPP and PFI. All such arrangements should be governed by the public interest in the quality of public services; the relationship with the private sector should be based on partnerships which improve services rather than arrangements to access finance only; the interests of employees should at least be maintained; and the partnerships between people who work together to serve the public should be enhanced rather than diminished. I am looking for a way forward which combines such principles with pragmatism. In developing this 'Welsh way', I have given specific consideration to the process of creating effective partnerships, employment issues, and the development of a strategic framework across Wales.

I will start with the concerns surrounding the bureaucracy of PFI, which has undoubtedly caused frustration, delay and unnecessary cost. The relatively small scale of Wales should allow the development of a close and effective relationship between Assembly staff, those working in other public sector organisations, and those who work in business. While this helps, there are still issues to address, and procedures to improve.

The complexity of the capital finance regulations in local government is viewed as a hurdle in the procurement process. A review group is already considering simplifying the regulations where possible in advance of any proposals to move to a prudential borrowing system, of which we are all supportive.

Yn ail, pan fo achosion lle mae gan y sector preifat brofiad a sgiliau penodol wrth ddatblygu a rheoli asedion cyfalaf, dylem ddatblygu partneriaethau agos gyda busnes er mwyn defnyddio'r sgiliau hynny wrth wasanaethu'r cyhoedd.

Cydnabu'r rhan fwyaf o'r ymatebwyr yr angen i fanteisio ar y trefniadau hynny ar sail pragmatig.

Wrth ddatblygu ymateb y Llywodraeth i'r ymgynghoriad, hoffwn gyflwyno'r egwyddorion canlynol gerbron y Cynulliad ar gyfer defnyddio partneriaeth cyhoeddus-preifat a PFI. Dylid rheoli pob trefniant o'r fath yn ôl budd y cyhoedd yn ansawdd y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus; dylai'r berthynas gyda'r sector preifat fod yn seiliedig ar bartneriaethau sy'n gwella gwasanaethau yn hytrach na threfniadau i sicrhau arian yn unig; dylid cynnal buddiannau cyflogaeth o leiaf; a dylid gwella'r bartneriaeth rhwng pobl sy'n cydweithio â'i gilydd i wasanaethu'r cyhoedd yn hytrach na'i gwanhau. Yr wyf yn chwilio am ffordd ymlaen sy'n cyfuno egwyddorion o'r fath gyda phragmatiaeth. Wrth ddatblygu'r 'ffordd Gymreig' hon, rhoddais ystyriaeth benodol i'r broses o greu partneriaethau effeithiol, materion cyflogaeth a datblygu fframwaith strategol ledled Cymru.

Dechreuaf drwy sôn am y pryderon sy'n gysylltiedig â biwrocratiaeth PFI, sy'n bendant wedi achosi rhwystredigaeth, oedi a chost ddiangen. Dylai graddfa gymharol fach Cymru alluogi i berthynas agos ac effeithiol ddatblygu rhwng staff y Cynulliad, y rhai sy'n gweithio mewn sefydliadau sector cyhoeddus eraill, a'r rhai sy'n gweithio ym myd busnes. Tra bydd hyn yn helpu, bydd materion eraill i'w trafod o hyd, a gweithdrefnau i'w gwella.

Mae natur gymhleth rheoliadau cyllid cyfalaf mewn llywodraeth leol yn cael ei ystyried yn rhwystr yn y broses gaffael. Mae grŵp adolygu eisoes yn ystyried symleiddio'r rheoliadau lle y bo'n bosibl cyn gwneud unrhyw gynigion er mwyn symud ymlaen i system fenthyg ddarbodus, yr ydym oll yn ei chefnogi.

We will continue to work with other bodies who have developed, and who are developing, a standard framework and contract documentation for effectively managing PFI procurement. Increased analysis of project information and further clarification is needed on the potential source of funds for projects.

The National Assembly's private finance unit website is now live, and provides information about existing projects in Wales, as well as useful links to other websites, Assembly papers, and a number of frequently asked questions. I also intend to improve the co-ordination of resources within the Assembly devoted to PPP and PFI, to provide an improved service to customers.

Nevertheless, however we improve the procedures, there is an inevitable bureaucratic cost implicit in the construction of these partnerships. Therefore, I am inclined to find ways of funding smaller capital projects through conventional means and developing the necessary partnerships for private finance where the scale of the project is substantial.

Scale will be a criterion in considering the private finance option; but not the sole criterion. There will always be capital projects of varying scale which are essential in serving the needs of the public; but which are unattractive to private investors. If the private sector has a particular contribution to make in a relatively small project we will not fail to consider the merit of private finance. PFI has always been a small but important part of public sector capital investment, and this will remain the case. We must continue to be prepared to finance a large part of our capital investment through conventional means.

Much has been made of my recent announcement to finance two new community hospitals through conventional means. The significance of those announcements is that I continue to take a flexible and pragmatic approach to capital finance in which public investment will

Byddwn yn parhau i weithio gyda chyrrff eraill sydd wedi datblygu, ac sydd wrthi yn datblygu, fframwaith safonol a dogfennaeth contractio ar gyfer rheoli proses gaffael PFI yn effeithiol. Mae angen dadansoddi gwybodaeth prosiect ymhellach ac mae angen mwy o eglurhad ar y ffynonellau ariannu posibl ar gyfer prosiectau.

Mae gwefan uned gyllid breifat y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn weithredol erbyn hyn, ac mae'n darparu gwybodaeth am brosiectau sy'n bodoli eisoes yng Nghymru, yn ogystal â chysylltiadau defnyddiol â gwefannau eraill, papurau'r Cynulliad, a nifer o gwestiynau a ofynnir yn aml. Bwriadaf hefyd wella'r broses o gydgyssylltu adnoddau o fewn y Cynulliad sy'n ymrwymedig i bartneriaeth cyhoeddus-preifat a PFI, er mwyn darparu gwasanaeth gwell i gwsmeriaid.

Er hynny, pa fodd bynnag y gwellwn y gweithdrefnau, bydd cost fiwrocraataidd anochel ynghlwm wrth y broses o adeiladu'r partneriaethau hyn. Felly, yr wyf yn dueddol o chwilio am ffyrdd eraill o ariannu prosiectau cyfalaf bach drwy ddulliau confensiynol a datblygu'r partneriaethau angenrheidiol ar gyfer cyllid preifat pan fo'r prosiect yn un sylweddol.

Bydd maint yn faen prawf wrth ystyried yr opsiwn cyllid preifat; ond nid dyma fydd yr unig faen prawf. Bydd yna brosiectau cyfalaf o wahanol faint bob amser sy'n hanfodol wrth wasanaethu anghenion y cyhoedd; ond nad ydynt yn ddeniadol i fuddsoddwyr preifat. Os oes gan y sector preifat gyfraniad arbennig i'w wneud mewn prosiect cymharol fach ni fyddwn yn peidio ag ystyried gwerth cyllid preifat. Mae PFI wedi bod yn rhan fach ond pwysig o fuddsoddiad cyfalaf y sector cyhoeddus erioed, a bydd hynny'n parhau. Rhaid inni barhau i fod yn barod i ariannu rhan fawr o'n buddsoddiad cyfalaf drwy ddulliau confensiynol.

Rhodddwyd sylw mawr i'm cyhoeddiad diweddar i ariannu dau ysbyty cymunedol newydd drwy ddulliau confensiynol. Arwyddocâd y cyhoeddiadau hynny yw fy mod yn parhau i fabwysiadu ymagwedd hyblyg a phragmatig tuag at gyllid cyfalaf lle bydd buddsoddiad cyhoeddus yn parhau i fod

continue to be a prominent feature. These two important hospitals proved to be more conducive to conventional rather than private finance for reasons of location, land values and scale. They are illustrations of why we must retain our capacity for public finance. Nevertheless, there will be other projects, sometimes large-scale, when private finance will be appropriate. We must continue to combine principles with pragmatism.

Staff transfer issues rightly continue to be prominent in discussions surrounding PPP and PFI. I have been keen to listen to concerns expressed by the trade unions in this consultation process. The Assembly does not intend to privatise public services; rather, it seeks to deliver those services by the most efficient and effective means available under the direction of the relevant public body. The public sector will continue—as always—to work in partnership with the private sector. We aim to maintain the public sector ethos, which we value, in all public services. It should be recognised that the work of most public sector staff is related to the provision of a service rather than the management of a facility. In most cases of private finance the question of the transfer of staff from public sector employment does not arise.

As previously announced, we would not expect clinical, professional, or front-line staff, such as doctors, nurses and teachers to transfer to the private sector as part of any PPP or PFI project in Wales. I want to ensure that the concept of the clinical team in this context is not defined by status. We will aim to redefine that which makes up the clinical team so that staff such as porters, cooks, and cleaners would not transfer to private sector employment but would remain employees of the national health service. Where the transfer of staff is considered, the criteria will be whether it adds to the quality of the service to be provided. The law requires that any staff transferred as a result of a PFI or PPP scheme, do so on their existing terms and conditions. However, in the partnerships that I wish to see developed in Wales, I will be looking for more in the way of enhancing

yn nodwedd amlwg. Mae'r ddau ysbyty pwysig hyn wedi ffafrio dulliau ariannu confensiynol yn hytrach na phreifat am resymau lleoliad, gwerth tir a maint. Maent yn dangos pam bod yn rhaid inni gadw ein capasiti ar gyfer arian cyhoeddus. Er hynny, bydd prosiectau eraill, ar raddfa fwy weithiau, pan fydd cyllid preifat yn briodol ar eu cyfer. Rhaid inni barhau i gyfuno egwyddorion gyda phragmatiaeth.

Mae materion trosglwyddo staff yn parhau i fod yn bwnc amlwg mewn trafodaethau ar bartneriaeth cyhoeddus-preifat a PFI. Bûm yn awyddus i glywed pryderon a fynegwyd gan yr undebau llafur yn y broses ymgynghori hon. Nid yw'r Cynulliad yn bwriadu preifateiddio gwasanaethau cyhoeddus; yn hytrach, ceisia gyflwyno'r gwasanaethau hynny yn y ffordd fwyaf effeithlon ac effeithiol sydd ar gael o dan gyfarwyddyd y corff cyhoeddus perthnasol. Bydd y sector preifat yn parhau—fel bob amser—i weithio mewn partneriaeth â'r sector preifat. Anelwn at gynnal ethos y sector cyhoeddus, sy'n werthfawr inni, ym mhob gwasanaeth cyhoeddus. Dylid cydnabod bod gwaith y rhan fwyaf o staff y sector cyhoeddus yn ymwneud â darparu gwasanaeth yn hytrach na rheoli cyfleuster. Yn y rhan fwyaf o achosion o gyllid preifat, nid yw'r cwestiwn o drosglwyddo staff o gyflogaeth gyda'r sector cyhoeddus yn codi.

Fel y cyhoeddwyd yn flaenorol, ni fyddem yn disgwyl i staff arbenigol, proffesiynol, na staff rheng flaen, fel meddygon, nyrsys ac athrawon drosglwyddo i'r sector preifat fel rhan o unrhyw brosiect partneriaeth cyhoeddus-preifat neu PFI yng Nghymru. Yr wyf am sicrhau na chaiff y cysyniad o dîm clinigol ei ddiffinio yn ôl statws yn y cyd-destun hwn. Anelwn at ail-ddiffinio'r hyn sy'n gwneud tîm clinigol er mwyn sicrhau nad yw staff fel porthorion, cogyddion a glanhawyr yn trosglwyddo i gyflogaeth gyda'r sector preifat ond yn parhau i fod yn gyflogeion y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Pan fo angen ystyried trosglwyddo staff, y meini prawf fydd gweld a yw'n ychwanegu gwerth at ansawdd y gwasanaeth i'w ddarparu. Mae'r gyfraith yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i staff, pan gânt eu trosglwyddo o ganlyniad i gynllun PFI neu bartneriaethau cyhoeddus-

the opportunities for, and development of, staff who may be transferred than that of baseline. Finally, on the matter of staff transfer, I stress that we cannot redefine contracts that are already in place. Our objective is to ensure that existing arrangements continue to serve the public well.

9:55 a.m.

It is evident in the responses received that PPP and PFI projects need to be seen as part of a strategic framework for investment in Wales. These arrangements fall into disrepute when they are seen as an ad hoc response to lack of capital finance. A strategic framework will ensure level playing fields throughout the public sector. This will take time to achieve. We will build upon the asset management plans now being prepared across the public sector in Wales. On this basis, the Government intends to develop a capital investment strategy to inform decisions throughout the public sector. Public bodies that anticipate using PPP and PFI have expressed a demand for a predictable framework which allows them to plan for the long term. The private sector has an equivalent need for some understanding of the likely flow of projects over a period of time.

Within the strategic framework we will continue to give consideration to the potential for projects which might cross over different services, different organisations and different geographical areas. Such projects are a feature of the joined-up government to which we aspire. Nevertheless, they are complex and we should not predict that they will become commonplace. As previously indicated, I anticipate that future use of PFI will normally be for relatively large projects, in the national health service or local government, where concern for public interest can be matched with a need for commercial viability. Within the proposed

preifat, wneud hynny ar eu telerau a'u hamodau cyfredol. Fodd bynnag, yn y partneriaethau y dymunwn eu datblygu yng Nghymru, byddaf yn chwilio am ffordd a fyddai'n gwella cyfleoedd a datblygiad staff a allai gael eu trosglwyddo yn hytrach na gwaelodlin. Yn olaf, ar fater trosglwyddo staff, pwysleisiaf na allwn ail-ddiffinio contractau sydd eisoes mewn grym. Ein hamcan yw sicrhau bod trefniadau sy'n bodoli eisoes yn parhau i wasanaethu'r cyhoedd yn dda.

Mae'n amlwg yn yr ymatebion a dderbyniwyd bod angen i brosiectau partneriaeth cyhoeddus-preifat a PFI gael eu hystyried yn rhan o fframwaith strategol ar gyfer buddsoddiad yng Nghymru. Bydd y trefniadau hyn yn colli bri pan gânt eu hystyried fel ymateb ad hoc i brinder cyllid cyfalaf. Bydd fframwaith strategol yn sicrhau amodau tebyg i bawb drwy'r sector cyhoeddus. Bydd angen amser i gyflawni hyn. Adeiladwn ar y cynlluniau rheoli asedion sy'n cael eu paratoi ar hyn o bryd ar draws y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Ar y sail honno, mae'r Llywodraeth yn bwriadu datblygu strategaeth buddsoddi cyfalaf i lywio penderfyniadau drwy'r sector cyhoeddus. Mae cyrff cyhoeddus sy'n rhagweld y byddant yn defnyddio partneriaeth cyhoeddus-preifat a PFI eisoes wedi galw am fframwaith rhagweladwy sy'n eu galluogi i gynllunio ar gyfer yr hirdymor. Mae gan y sector preifat angen tebyg o ran deall y llif tebygol o brosiectau dros gyfnod o amser.

O fewn y fframwaith strategol byddwn yn parhau i roi ystyriaeth i bosibiliadau prosiectau sy'n croesi ar draws gwahanol wasanaethau, gwahanol sefydliadau a gwahanol ardaloedd daearyddol. Mae prosiectau o'r fath yn nodwedd o lywodraeth gydgyssylltiedig yr ydym oll yn anelu at ei chyflawni. Er hynny, maent yn gymhleth ac ni ddylem ragweld y dônt yn gyffredin. Fel y nodwyd eisoes, rhagwelaf y defnyddir PFI yn y dyfodol fel rhan o brosiectau cymharol fawr, yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol neu mewn llywodraeth leol, pan fo'n bosibl cyfateb pryder am fudd y cyhoedd at angen am ymarferoldeb masnachol. O fewn y

strategic framework, we need to develop the means by which these projects can be identified. With the Minister for Health and Social Services, and the Welsh Local Government Association, I will consider how this can be achieved.

I thank those organisations in the public and private sectors, and the individuals, who took time to contribute to this process. I look forward to developing the Assembly's relationship with all parties in order to achieve our common goals for Wales.

To conclude, the time has come to give a distinctive identity to PPP and PFI, to reflect the responses to this consultation. Our approach in Wales is about investing through partnership, and it needs to be given a Welsh perspective. Therefore, in the future, PPP and PFI will be investment through partnership in Wales.

Janet Ryder: Thank you, Minister, for outlining, at last, the Welsh direction in terms of financing capital works in Wales. As you have made clear, you are looking for a combination of small-scale conventional financing and PFI to finance large-scale investments.

In your statement, you said that you are still looking for a way forward which combines the principles that you have outlined. Will you tell us what timescale you are setting for that? Will it form the bidding guidance for future rounds? When you have put all that information together in coherent PFI strategy guidance for Wales, will you allow a debate on the issue, rather than a statement?

To return to the use of large-scale PFI projects, will you outline what you mean by large-scale? What is the difference between small-scale and large-scale? We have learned from the use of PFI in Scotland, particularly in the health sector, that it has led to downsizing. That is not what the health service needs at present. At a time when the health service needs more beds, more doctors and more nurses, downsizing is not the answer. Therefore, if we are to offer PFI on a

fframwaith strategol a gynigir, mae angen inni ddatblygu ffordd o nodi'r prosiectau hyn. Byddaf yn ystyried sut y gellir cyflawni hyn gyda'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus a Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru.

Diolchaf i'r sefydliadau hynny yn y sectorau cyhoeddus a phreifat, a'r unigolion, a roddodd o'u hamser i gyfrannu i'r broses hon. Edrychaf ymlaen at ddatblygu perthynas y Cynulliad gyda phob plaid er mwyn cyflawni ein nodau cyffredin ar gyfer Cymru.

I gloi, mae'n amser inni roi hunaniaeth benodol i bartneriaeth cyhoeddus-preifat a PFI, i adlewyrchu'r ymatebion i'r ymgynghoriad hwn. Mae a wnelo ein hymagwedd yng Nghymru â buddsoddi drwy bartneriaeth, ac mae angen rhoi safbwynt Gymreig iddi. Felly, yn y dyfodol, buddsoddir partneriaeth cyhoeddus-preifat a PFI drwy bartneriaeth yng Nghymru.

Janet Ryder: Diolch ichi, Weinidog, am amlinellu, o'r diwedd, gyfeiriad Cymru yn nhermau arian cyfalaf yng Nghymru. Fel yr esboniwyd gennych, yr ydych yn chwilio am gyfuniad o arian confensiynol ar raddfa fach a PFI i ariannu buddsoddiadau ar raddfa fawr.

Yn eich datganiad, dywedasoeh eich bod yn parhau i chwilio am ffordd ymlaen sy'n cyfuno'r egwyddorion a bwysleisiwyd gennych. A ddywedwch wrthym pa amserlen a bennwyd gennych ar gyfer hynny? A fydd yn llunio canllawiau ar gyfer gwneud cais yn rowndiau'r dyfodol? Pan fyddwch wedi casglu'r holl wybodaeth hon mewn canllawiau strategaeth PFI cydlynol ar gyfer Cymru, a ganiatewch inni gynnal dadl ar y mater, yn hytrach na datganiad?

Gan droi unwaith eto at y defnydd o brosiectau PFI ar raddfa fawr, a wnewch chi amlinellu beth yw eich diffiniad o raddfa fawr? Beth yw'r gwahaniaeth rhwng graddfa fach a graddfa fawr? Yr ydym wedi dysgu o'r defnydd a wneir o PFI yn yr Alban, yn arbennig yn y sector iechyd, fod hyn wedi arwain at gwtogi. Nid dyna sydd ei angen ar y gwasanaeth iechyd ar hyn o bryd. Ar adeg pan fo angen mwy o welyau, mwy o feddygon a mwy o nyrsys ar y gwasanaeth

large scale in the health service, it is important that we know exactly what you mean by that.

In addition, if we are going to use PFI, it effectively means that, in order to pay for the projects, we will be ring-fencing ever increasing proportions of public revenue in payments guaranteed to private corporations for decades to come. Do you agree that there is no fiscal or economic case for the use of PFI and PPP? That comes through in your statement. I do not think that you are personally happy with the use of PFI, and perhaps you are being forced into it. Your statement suggests that the Treasury in London is forcing people down a path that they do not want to follow and which is not part of any policy. What arguments and discussions have you had with your colleagues in Westminster about this?

I welcome the statement's reference to developing a prudential borrowing requirement and giving councils the ability to finance their own building work. I know that you are aware that councils are asking when you will start the bidding rounds. You have not made that announcement. You have said that you will use PFI, but will you tell us when you will announce another bidding round to allow councils to apply?

On public services, I am sure that you are aware that no country has ever delivered universal services on the back of for-profit providers. It has been done through the public sector. Your statement makes it clear that you expect services to be offered under the control of the public sector. Will you confirm whether that means that your Government is committed to the continuation and development of public services delivered by public bodies?

Edwina Hart: Your last statement is extraordinary. We are committed to public services. It was socialist governments that ensured the existence of public services throughout the country. You must recognise that this has been a genuine consultation

iechyd, nid cwtogi yw'r ateb. Felly, os ydym am gynnig PFI ar raddfa fawr yn y gwasanaeth iechyd, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn gwybod yn union beth yw ystyr hynny.

Yn ogystal, os ydym am ddefnyddio PFI, mae'n golygu mewn gwirionedd, y byddwn, er mwyn talu am y prosiectau, yn clustnodi cyfrannau cynyddol o refeniw cyhoeddus mewn taliadau wedi'u gwarantu i gorfforaethau preifat am ddegawdau i ddod. A gytunwch nad oes achos ariannol nac economaidd dros ddefnyddio PFI a phartneriaeth cyhoeddus-preifat? Daw hynny i'r amlwg yn eich datganiad. Ni chredaf eich bod yn fodlon yn bersonol ar y defnydd o PFI, ac efallai y cewch eich gorfodi i wneud hynny. Awgryma eich datganiad fod y Trysorlys yn Llundain yn gorfodi pobl i ddilyn llwybr nad ydynt am ei ddilyn ac nad yw'n rhan o unrhyw bolisi. Pa ddadleuon a thrafodaethau a gawsoch gyda'ch cyd-Aelodau yn San Steffan parthed hyn?

Croesawaf y cyfeiriad yn y datganiad at ddatblygu gofyniad benthyca darbodus a rhoi'r gallu i gynghorau ariannu eu gwaith adeiladu eu hunain. Gwn eich bod yn ymwybodol fod cynghorau'n gofyn pryd y byddwch yn dechrau'r rowndiau gwneud cais. Ni wnaethoch y cyhoeddiad hwnnw. Dywedaso'ch y byddwch yn defnyddio PFI, ond a ddywedwch wrthym pryd y byddwch yn cyhoeddi rownd gwneud cais arall er mwyn galluogi cynghorau i wneud cais?

O ran gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol nad oes yr un wlad erioed wedi cyflwyno gwasanaethau cyffredinol ar gefn darparwyr er mwyn elw. Gwnaed hynny drwy'r sector cyhoeddus. Mae eich datganiad yn esbonio'n glir eich bod yn disgwyl i wasanaethau gael eu cynnig o dan reolaeth y sector preifat. A wnewch chi gadarnhau a yw hynny'n golygu bod eich Llywodraeth yn ymrwymedig i'r broses o barhau a datblygu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a gyflwynir gan gyrff cyhoeddus?

Edwina Hart: Mae eich datganiad diwethaf yn anhygoel. Yr ydym yn ymrwymedig i wasanaethau cyhoeddus. Y llywodraethau sosialaidd a sicraodd fodolaeth gwasanaethau cyhoeddus drwy'r wlad gyfan. Rhaid ichi gydnabod y bu hon yn broses

process. You say that no-one wants PFI. That is not the case. PFI has been welcomed into innovative projects in Scotland, England and certainly in Wales. Projects such as dualling the A55 and the Chepstow community hospital are examples of where PFI has worked in Wales.

I have indicated that I will discuss future bidding rounds for PFI credits and the range of projects that might qualify with the Welsh Local Government Association in the future. I will start that process in the new year. It is important that, in terms of PFI credit bidding rounds, I have early discussions with local government about the type of projects it envisages will be encompassed and what funds will be needed. As I have outlined today, PFI is not privatisation by the backdoor. It is about reallocating tasks to sectors that are best able to deliver them. There will be an increasing emphasis, as I have indicated, on partnership, and I envisage that privately financed schemes will continue to be needed where there are clear and demonstrable advantages for public benefit. This is a pragmatic approach. The financing of projects through PFI is only undertaken if PFI can demonstrate value-for-money savings against the public sector comparator. The public sector comparator is revisited throughout the procurement process to ensure continued value for money.

On the point about the Treasury, we must abide by the Treasury's definition of public expenditure. PFI projects must be off-balance sheet for the public sector or they would be classed as capital expenditure, and provision would then need to be found from within the Assembly's budget. That is the reality and why I have made this policy statement today, indicating the direction in which we are moving. I would welcome any future debate on this issue, if Members so wish, and I will raise this point with the Minister for Assembly Business when we have concluded the details of the partnership arrangement.

Christine Chapman: On staff transfers, I welcome your commitment to include ancillary staff in the notion of a clinical team. This is an excellent move because staff,

ymgyngori ddilys. Dywedasoch nad oes unrhyw un eisiau PFI. Nid yw hynny'n wir. Croesawyd PFI mewn prosiectau arloesol yn yr Alban, yn Lloegr ac yn sicr yng Nghymru. Mae prosiectau fel gwneud yr A55 yn ffordd ddeuol ac ysbyty cymunedol Cas-gwent yn enghreifftiau o PFI yn llwyddo yng Nghymru.

Dywedais y byddwn yn trafod rowndiau gwneud cais yn y dyfodol ar gyfer credydau PFI a'r amrywiaeth o brosiectau a allai fod yn gymwys gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru yn y dyfodol. Dechreuaf y broses honno y flwyddyn nesaf. Mae'n bwysig, yn nhermau rowndiau gwneud cais credyd PFI, fy mod yn cynnal trafodaethau cynnar gyda llywodraeth leol ar y math o brosiectau y maent yn rhagweld a gwmpesir a faint o arian fydd ei angen. Fel yr amlinellais heddiw, nid yw PFI yn ffordd o breifateiddio drwy'r drws cefn. Mae a wnelo ag ail-ddyrannu tasgau i sectorau sydd yn y sefyllfa orau i'w cyflwyno. Bydd pwyslais cynyddol, fel y dywedais, ar bartneriaeth, a rhagwelaf y bydd cynlluniau a ariennir yn breifat yn angenrheidiol lle bynnag y bydd manteision clir ac amlwg y byddant yn fanteisiol i'r cyhoedd. Mae hon yn ymagwedd bragmatig. Dim ond os gall PFI arddangos arbedion gwerth am arian yn erbyn cymharydd sector preifat yr ariennir prosiectau drwy PFI. Ailystyrir y cymharydd sector preifat trwy gydol y broses gaffael er mwyn sicrhau gwerth am arian parhaus.

O ran y pwynt am y Trysorlys, rhaid inni ddilyn diffiniad y Trysorlys o wariant cyhoeddus. Rhaid i brosiectau PFI fod oddi ar y fantolen ar gyfer y sector cyhoeddus neu fe'u dosberthir fel gwariant cyfalaf, a byddai angen canfod darpariaeth o fewn cyllideb y Cynulliad. Dyna yw'r sefyllfa a pham y gwneuthum y datganiad polisi hwn heddiw, yn nodi i ba gyfeiriad yr ydym yn symud. Croesawaf unrhyw ddadl yn y dyfodol ar y mater hwn, os bydd yr Aelodau'n dymuno hynny, a chodaf y pwynt hwn gyda'r Trefnydd pan fyddwn wedi cwblhau manylion y trefniant partneriaeth.

Christine Chapman: O ran trosglwyddo staff, croesawaf eich ymrwymiad i gynnwys staff ategol yn y syniad o dîm clinigol. Mae hwn yn syniad gwych oherwydd gallai staff,

understandably, may feel demotivated if they believe that their roles are undervalued. If we are to build a first-class NHS in Wales, we need committed, enthusiastic staff. I also welcome the fact that you have involved the trade unions in the consultation process. Will you give an assurance that you will continue to keep these lines of communication open, so that the trade unions' stated commitment to quality improvement and innovation in public services can be maximised?

Edwina Hart: I will meet the Wales Trades Union Congress this afternoon to discuss PFI and partnership arrangements. I am pleased with what we are doing in terms of staff. We must recognise that public sector staff are crucial to the delivery of services. You have the administration's assurance that we will be keeping in close contact with the trade unions regarding many of these emerging issues. In Wales, the union line is sometimes slightly different to that seen in England. UNISON has reached an agreement in England with Alan Milburn, the Secretary of State for Health, on some PFI projects; examples, such as Queen Mary's Hospital in Roehampton have provided another way forward. In Wales, however, I am committed to what I have said in my statement today.

10:05 a.m.

Alun Cairns: I am grateful to the Minister for her statement, the central theme of which is pragmatism. That would be welcomed. The Minister is in a difficult position in that she is prepared to be pragmatic in line with the UK Government's policy, but this must conflict with the ideological approaches taken by so many of her ministerial colleagues, particularly those in the big-spending departments of health and education. Will the Minister confirm where her ministerial colleagues stand, particularly on these points? Are they happy with adopting PFI in their departments, and are they comfortable with her statement? Perhaps the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning is absent because she cannot face the statement made by the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities on the private

yn ddealladwy, deimlo diffyg cymhelliant os nad ydynt yn credu bod eu rolau'n cael eu gwerthfawrogi. Os ydym am greu NHS o'r radd flaenaf yng Nghymru, mae angen staff ymrwymedig a brwdfrydig arnom. Croesawaf hefyd y ffaith eich bod wedi cynnwys yr undebau llafur yn y broses ymgynghori. A roddwch sicrwydd y byddwch yn parhau i gadw'r llinellau cyfathrebu hyn yn agored, fel y gellir manteisio i'r eithaf ar ymrwymiad undebau llafur i wella ansawdd ac arloesedd yn y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus?

Edwina Hart: Byddaf yn cwrdd â Chynghrair Undebau Llafur Cymru y prynhawn yma i drafod PFI a'r trefniadau partneriaeth. Yr wyf yn fodlon ar yr hyn a wnawn o ran staff. Rhaid inni gydnabod bod staff y sector cyhoeddus yn hanfodol i'r broses o gyflwyno gwasanaethau. Mae gennych sicrwydd y weinyddiaeth y byddwn yn cadw mewn cysylltiad agos ag undebau llafur o ran y materion hyn a ddaw i'r amlwg. Yng Nghymru, mae safbwynt yr undebau ychydig yn wahanol weithiau i'r un yn Lloegr. Mae UNSAIN wedi sicrhau cytundeb yn Lloegr gydag Alan Milburn, y Gweinidog Gwladol dros Iechyd, ar rai prosiectau PFI; mae enghreifftiau, fel Ysbyty'r Frenhines Mary yn Roehampton wedi darparu ffordd arall ymlaen. Yng Nghymru, fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn ymrwymedig i'r hyn a ddywedais yn fy natganiad heddiw.

Alun Cairns: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am ei datganiad, gyda phragmatiaeth yn thema ganolog iddo. Mae hynny i'w groesawu. Mae'r Gweinidog mewn sefyllfa anodd am ei bod yn barod i fod yn bragmatig yn unol â pholisi Llywodraeth y DU, ond rhaid bod hyn yn gwrthdaro â'r ymagweddau ideolegol a fabwysiedir gan lawer o'i chyd-Aelodau gweinidogol, yn arbennig y rhai yn yr adrannau â gwariant uchel, sef iechyd ac addysg. A wnaiff y Gweinidog gadarnhau safbwynt ei chyd-Aelodau gweinidogol, yn arbennig o ran y pwyntiau hyn? A ydynt yn fodlon mabwysiadu PFI yn eu hadrannau hwy, ac a ydynt yn gyfforddus gyda'i datganiad? Efallai fod y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn absennol am na all wynebu'r ffaith bod datganiad yn cael

finance initiative.

In relation to specific issues, the Minister mentioned that she wants to be pragmatic, but she also mentioned that PFI plays a small but important part in public service delivery. How is this being pragmatic? The Minister goes on to say that PFI will be used predominantly in large-scale projects, rather than being developed in small-scale projects. That does not correspond to the pragmatic approach mentioned in the Minister's statement. Should the objective not be to encourage investment—whether it be from the public or private sector—to improve our public services, rather than ruling out PFI for smaller-scale projects, and maintaining it for larger-scale initiatives only?

Much was made of the two new, conventionally-funded hospitals. Again, this does not demonstrate the pragmatism that the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities is prepared to show, but shows the ideological attitude of the Minister for Health and Social Services.

I welcome the statement made in relation to the complexities of the capital finance regulations, and look forward to the potential streamlining of this aspect of the regulations. Will the Minister reassure us that they will be open and transparent?

Furthermore, in terms of staff transfer, the Minister says that she plans to widen the objective of maintaining staff within the public sector. Again, this does not strike me as corresponding to the central theme of pragmatism that the Minister is seeking to present. Will she make the transfer option available if staff are offered better opportunities for career development in the private sector, and if this more effective in the enhancement of public services?

Finally, does the Minister feel undermined in any way by the dealings of the Secretary of

ei wneud gan y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau ar y fenter cyllid preifat.

O ran materion penodol, crybwyllodd y Gweinidog ei bod am fod yn bragmatig, ond soniodd hefyd fod PFI yn chwarae rhan fach ond pwysig yn y broses o gyflwyno gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Ym mha ffordd y mae hynny'n bragmatig? Aeth yn ei blaen i ddweud y defnyddir PFI mewn prosiectau ar raddfa fawr yn bennaf, yn hytrach na chael eu datblygu mewn prosiectau ar raddfa fach. Nid yw hynny'n cyfateb â'r ymagwedd bragmatig a grybwyllwyd yn natganiad y Gweinidog. Oni ddylai'r prif amcan ymwneud ag annog buddsoddiad—boed hynny gan y sector cyhoeddus neu breifat—i wella ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, yn hytrach na gwrthod PFI ar gyfer prosiectau ar raddfa lai a'i chadw ar gyfer mentrau ar raddfa fwy yn unig?

Rhodddwyd llawer o sylw i'r ddau ysbyty newydd, a ariennir mewn ffordd gonfensiynol. Unwaith eto, nid yw hyn yn arddangos y bragmatiaeth y mae'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau yn barod i'w harddangos, ond mae yn dangos agwedd ideolegol y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol.

Croesawaf y datganiad a wnaed mewn perthynas â natur gymhleth y rheoliadau cyllid cyfalaf ac edrychaf ymlaen at y posibilrwydd o symleiddio'r agwedd hon ar y rheoliadau. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ein sicrhau y byddant yn agored a thryloyw?

At hynny, o ran trosglwyddo staff, dywedodd y Gweinidog ei bod yn bwriadu ehangu'r amcan o gadw staff o fewn y sector cyhoeddus. Eto, nid yw hyn yn ymddangos i mi fel rhywbeth sy'n cyfateb â'r thema ganolog o bragmatiaeth y mae'r Gweinidog yn ceisio ei chyflwyno. A wnaiff sicrhau bod yr opsiwn trosglwyddo ar gael os cynigir cyfleoedd gwell i staff ddatblygu eu gyrfa yn y sector preifat, ac os bydd hynny'n fwy effeithiol o ran gwella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus?

Yn olaf, a yw'r Gweinidog yn credu ei bod wedi'i thanseilio mewn unrhyw ffordd gan

State for Transport, Local Government and the Regions with Railtrack, which has undermined private sector confidence in liaising with the administration?

Although the strategic framework is to be welcomed, when will the next bidding round—as Janet Ryder highlighted—be opened? Will you also set targets for private sector investment? If so, will you say specifically how much health and education should expect to gain from private sector investment to enhance public services for the people of Wales?

Edwina Hart: I am not minded to consider the target notions for private sector investment. As for being undermined by Stephen Byers, I always feel undermined by Railtrack when I am running late on the train service between Swansea and Cardiff. We must recognise that central Government's views on Railtrack correspond to the views of the ordinary public, who are desperate to improve the situation.

On the capital finance regulations, I welcome your comments. We must also take a pragmatic approach within this area, and there will be transparency in terms of when those regulations will apply—that is important. I am pragmatic and I want to take the dogma out of these discussions. That is why this statement is about partnership and recognising the views of the people who work in the public sector. The private sector's views about streamlining the situation with regard to PFI projects have been taken into account in my statement.

With regard to the Cabinet's position, this is a Cabinet statement. I assure you that all Ministers have signed up to it. The fact that I was able to announce the building of two new hospitals shows how pragmatic we are. When there is funding available, when there has been underspend and when there have been savings within budgets, we can fund capital projects that will benefit the whole of Wales. That is a pragmatic approach. There is logic throughout this statement on how we have

ymwneud y Gweinidog Gwladol dros Drafnidiaeth, Llywodraeth Leol a'r Rhanbarthau â Railtrack, sydd wedi tanseilio hyder y sector preifat o ran cysylltu â'r weinyddiaeth?

Er y dylid croesawu'r fframwaith strategol, pryd bydd y rownd gwneud cais nesaf—fel y pwysleisiodd Janet Ryder—yn agor? A wnewch chi hefyd bennu targedau ar gyfer buddsoddi yn y sector preifat? Os felly, a wnewch chi sôn yn benodol am faint y dylai'r adran iechyd ac addysg ddisgwyl ei gael o fuddsoddi yn y sector preifat er mwyn gwella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ar gyfer pobl Cymru?

Edwina Hart: Nid yw'n fwrriad gennyf ystyried yr amcanion targed ar gyfer buddsoddi yn y sector preifat. O ran cael fy nhanseilio gan Stephen Byers, yr wyf bob amser yn teimlo fy mod wedi cael fy nhanseilio gan Railtrack pan fydd y trên yn hwyr rhwng Abertawe a Chaerdydd. Rhaid inni gydnabod bod safbwyntiau'r Llywodraeth ganolog ar Railtrack yn cyfateb â safbwyntiau'r aelodau cyffredin o'r cyhoedd, sydd yn awyddus iawn i weld y sefyllfa'n gwella.

O ran y rheoliadau arian cyfalaf, croesawaf eich sylwadau. Rhaid inni fabwysiadu ymagwedd bragmatig hefyd o fewn y maes hwn, a bydd trylowyder o ran pryd y bydd y rheoliadau hynny'n berthnasol—mae hynny'n bwysig. Yr wyf yn bragmatig ac yr wyf am ddileu'r dogma o'r trafodaethau hyn. Dyna pam mae'r datganiad hwn yn ymwneud â phartneriaeth a chydabod safbwyntiau pobl sy'n gweithio yn y sector cyhoeddus. Yr wyf wedi ystyried safbwyntiau'r sector preifat ar fater symleiddio'r sefyllfa o ran prosiectau PFI yn fy natganiad.

O ran safbwynt y Cabinet, mae hwn yn ddatganiad gan y Cabinet. Yr wyf am eich sicrhau bod pob Gweinidog yn cytuno ag ef. Mae'r ffaith imi allu cyhoeddi y byddai dau ysbyty newydd yn cael eu hadeiladu yn dangos pa mor bragmatig yr ydym. Pan fo arian ar gael, pan fu tanwariant a lle bu arbedion o fewn cyllidebau, gallwn ariannu prosiectau cyfalaf a fydd yn fanteisiol i Gymru gyfan. Mae honno'n ymagwedd bragmatig. Ceir rhesymeg drwy gydol y

dealt with the private sector's concerns, the trade unions' concerns, political concerns and people's long-term concerns about the value-for-money from PFI 30 years from now. I must deal with that. When we talk about PFI, we must recognise, Alun, that there have been some small-scale projects, particularly in the health service. Equipment has been provided for the health service and it has not had to ask us for anything because it has been within delegated limit schemes. However, in terms of large and small scale, some of the big road projects will not be delivered by conventional means. We must consider PFI. The public and everybody else is signed up to considering that.

It is important to recognise that this is an ongoing process. I wish I could give more details of timescales, but I want to try to take all the parties along with me. I want the private sector to have the confidence to invest. I want all Assembly Members to be confident that we are developing a Welsh way, which is pragmatic and fair.

Tom Middlehurst: I welcome your fulsome recognition of staff's important contribution to the public sector in Wales. I also welcome your commitment to maintaining good employment practice and pay and conditions in any future delivery arrangement. Whatever misgivings there may be about the use of PFI and PPP in Wales, you are right not to close the option as that may disadvantage Wales. However, as a consequence of your public commitment this morning, will you ensure that early consultation will be an essential prerequisite in any formal process for any proposed PFI or PPP initiative in the public sector in Wales?

Edwina Hart: It is important that there is full consultation at an early stage. In the past, prior to the Assembly, there were too many discussions behind closed doors about how we would deliver some of these arrangements. Staff, particularly in the public sector, have been enormously concerned about that. We must have an open-book

datganiad hwn ar sut yr ydym wedi delio â phryderon y sector preifat, pryderon yr undebau llafur, pryderon gwleidyddol a phryderon hirdymor pobl ynglŷn â gwerth am arian o dan PFI ymhen 30 o flynyddoedd. Rhaid inni ddelio â hynny. Wrth drafod PFI, rhaid inni gydnabod, Alun, y gwelwyd rhywfaint o brosiectau ar raddfa fach, yn arbennig yn y gwasanaeth iechyd. Darparwyd offer ar gyfer y gwasanaeth iechyd ac nid yw wedi gofyn inni am unrhyw beth am ei fod wedi'i gyfyngu i gynlluniau a ddirprwywyd. Fodd bynnag, yn nhermau graddfa fawr a graddfa fach, ni chyflwynir rhai o'r projectau mawr drwy ddulliau confensiynol. Rhaid inni ystyried PFI. Addawodd y cyhoedd a phawb arall y byddent yn ystyried hynny.

Mae'n bwysig cydnabod mai proses barhaus yw hon. Byddwn yn hoffi gallu rhoi mwy o fanylion am yr amserlenni, ond yr wyf am sicrhau cefnogaeth pob plaid ar y mater hwn. Yr wyf am i'r sector preifat gael yr hyder i fuddsoddi. Yr wyf am i holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad fod yn hyderus ein bod yn datblygu ffordd Gymreig, sy'n bragmatig ac yn deg.

Tom Middlehurst: Croesawaf eich cydnabyddiaeth hael o gyfraniad pwysig staff i'r sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Croesawaf hefyd eich ymrwymiad i gynnal arfer cyflogaeth da a chyflog ac amodau da mewn unrhyw drefniant cyflwyno yn y dyfodol. Beth bynnag fo'r amheuan ynglŷn â defnyddio PFI a partneriaethau cyhoeddus-preifat yng Nghymru, mae'n briodol nad ydych yn cau'r opsiwn oherwydd gallai hynny fod yn anfanteisiol i Gymru. Fodd bynnag, o ganlyniad i'ch ymrwymiad cyhoeddus y bore yma, a sicrhewch y bydd ymgynghoriad cynnar yn hanfodol mewn unrhyw broses ffurfiol ar gyfer unrhyw fenter PFI neu bartneriaeth cyhoeddus-preifat arfaethedig yn y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru?

Edwina Hart: Mae'n bwysig y ceir ymgynghoriad llawn a chynnar. Yn y gorffennol, cyn y Cynulliad, cynhaliwyd gormod o drafodaethau y tu ôl i ddrysau caeedig ynglŷn â'r ffordd y byddem yn cyflwyno rhai o'r trefniadau hyn. Mae staff, yn arbennig yn y sector cyhoeddus, wedi bod yn bryderus iawn ynglŷn â hynny. Rhaid inni

approach on all of these issues so that people are aware of the basis for decisions, especially if they impact on them as employed individuals. However, I am keen that we have an extended team, particularly in health, where teams have been of major concern. That will comfort people. We are talking about people who deliver the services. We are not talking about who manages the office block; we are talking about the people on the wards that patients want to see. It is important to get that balance right.

Dafydd Wigley: A yw'n gywir i gasglu o'r datganiad mai un o oblygiadau fformiwla Barnett yw y bydd Cymru ar ei cholled o ran lefelau buddsoddi o fewn ein gwlad, oni bai ein bod yn defnyddio PFI? Os felly, onid yw fformiwla Barnett yn caethiwo'r Cynulliad rhag dilyn y patrwm buddsoddi cyhoeddus y mae mwyafrif enfawr awdurdodau lleol Cymru a chyrff statudol eraill yn dymuno'i weld, sef arian cyhoeddus yn talu am asedau cyhoeddus sydd yn gwasanaethu'r cyhoedd? Onid dadl arall yw hon i newid fformiwla Barnett am fformiwla sydd yn seiliedig ar yr angen am fuddsoddi cyfalaf, gymaint â'r angen am wasanaethau cyfredol?

Edwina Hart: I thought that you would raise the issue of the Barnett formula in the context of the PFI discussion. There are issues surrounding needs assessment. If we considered needs assessment, we would have to guarantee that we would come out high in terms of any changes in funding arrangements from central Government. There are key issues on how the Treasury regards borrowing. That impacts on us directly as I indicated earlier. If I did not follow that line, there would be implications in terms of the Welsh block and how I would use those resources. Hence this pragmatic approach, taking into account central Government's line on fiscal policy and how we can work within those parameters to ensure we maximise the potential for public investment in public services, as I have done with the two new hospitals, and the school in Blaenau Gwent.

fabwysiadu ymagwedd llyfr agored tuag at yr holl faterion hyn fel bod pobl yn ymwybodol o sail y penderfyniadau, yn arbennig os ydynt yn effeithio arnynt hwy fel unigolion cyflogedig. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn awyddus inni gael tîm estynedig, yn arbennig ym maes iechyd, lle mae'r timau wedi peri pryder mawr. Bydd hynny'n tawelu meddyliau pobl. Yr ydym yn sôn am bobl sy'n darparu'r gwasanaethau. Nid ydym yn sôn am bwy sy'n rheoli'r bloc o swyddfeydd, yr ydym yn sôn am y bobl hynny ar y wardiau y mae cleifion am eu gweld. Mae'n bwysig sicrhau'r cydbwysedd cywir.

Dafydd Wigley: Should we infer from this statement that one of the implications of the Barnett formula is that Wales will be left behind in terms of investment within our own country unless we use PFI? If so, does the Barnett formula prevent the Assembly from following the pattern of public investment followed by the vast majority of local authorities and other statutory bodies in Wales, namely that public money be used to pay for public assets that serve the public? Is this not another argument for replacing the Barnett formula with a formula based on the need for capital investment as much as the existing need for services?

Edwina Hart: Yr oeddwn yn meddwl y byddech yn codi'r mater o fformiwla Barnett yng nghyd-destun y drafodaeth ar PFI. Mae yna faterion sy'n gysylltiedig ag asesiad o anghenion. Pe byddem yn ystyried asesiad o anghenion, byddai'n rhaid inni sicrhau y byddem yn llwyddo yn nhermau unrhyw newidiadau i'r trefniadau ariannu gan y Llywodraeth ganolog. Mae yna faterion allweddol i'w trafod o ran sut mae'r Trysorlys yn ystyried benthyca. Caiff hynny effaith uniongyrchol arnom fel y soniais yn gynharach. Pe na byddwn yn dilyn hynny, byddai goblygiadau yn nhermau'r bloc Cymreig a sut y byddwn yn defnyddio'r adnoddau hynny. Dyna pam y mabwysiedir yr ymagwedd bragmatig hon, sy'n ystyried safbwynt y Llywodraeth ganolog ar bolisi ariannol a sut y gallwn weithio o fewn y paramedrau hynny i sicrhau ein bod yn manteisio i'r eithaf ar botensial buddsoddiad cyhoeddus mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, fel y gwneuthum gyda'r ddau ysbyty newydd a'r ysgol ym Mlaenau Gwent.

10:15 a.m.

Obviously this issue of the private finance initiative is complex. There is no doubt that when the history books are written, there will be diverse opinions on the value of PFI and public-private partnerships. I still have an open mind on some of these issues, but it is essential that we have an appropriate mix. My statement is aiming towards that.

Peter Black: I welcome this statement. The Minister's common-sense approach certainly reflects our financial position. It is also the approach that needs to be taken to get the balance right between public and private investment. I also particularly welcome the recognition that employees' interests are paramount. We must not lose out on investment on vital capital projects by not going down this route, given the Treasury's stance on this issue and that we must mirror the forms of investment that the Treasury puts out, or else we will lose out.

I also welcome the direct finance for smaller capital projects to avoid disproportionate bureaucratic costs. Do you agree that Plaid Cymru's anxiety to have a new bidding round for PFI indicates that it also recognises your position as being sensible and logical, and that, when it comes to the crunch, it supports PFI for major projects? Do you also agree that if we are to ultimately achieve a level playing field on this issue, we need to convince the Treasury to reform the public sector borrowing requirement?

Edwina Hart: Yes, that issue will require discussion with the Treasury, and an examination of their fiscal policy in that area.

I am pleased with your comments about small-scale projects. There is an emerging consensus that small projects are less likely to represent value-for-money under PFI because they do not have the economies of scale for private-sector innovation. The cost of putting the PFI framework in place is then less economic. It is important that that line is drawn.

Yn amlwg, mae menter cyllid preifat yn fater cymhleth. Yn ddiau, pan ysgrifennir y llyfrau hanes, bydd barn amrywiol am werth PFI a phartneriaethau cyhoeddus-preifat. Mae gennyf feddwl agored o hyd ar rai o'r materion hyn, ond mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn sicrhau cymysgedd briodol. Mae fy natganiad yn anelu at hynny.

Peter Black: Croesawaf y datganiad hwn. Mae ymagwedd synnwyr cyffredin y Gweinidog yn adlewyrchu ein sefyllfa ariannol i'r dim. Yr ymagwedd hon sydd ei hangen hefyd i sicrhau'r cydbwysedd cywir rhwng buddsoddiad cyhoeddus a phreifat. Croesawaf yn benodol y gydnabyddiaeth fod buddiannau gweithwyr yn hollbwysig. Ni ddylem golli'r cyfle i fuddsoddi mewn prosiectau cyfalaf hanfodol drwy beidio â dilyn y llwybr hwn, o gofio safbwynt y Trysorlys ar y mater hwn ac y dylem adleisio'r dulliau buddsoddi a bennir gan y Trysorlys, neu byddwn ar ein colled fel arall.

Croesawaf hefyd yr arian uniongyrchol ar gyfer prosiectau cyfalaf llai er mwyn osgoi costau biwrocraataidd anghyfartal. A gytunwch fod pryder Plaid Cymru ynglŷn â'r cylch newydd i wneud cais ar gyfer PFI yn dangos ei bod hefyd yn cydnabod fod eich safbwynt yn synhwyrol a rhesymegol, a'i bod, pan ddaw hi i'r pen, yn cefnogi PFI ar gyfer prosiectau mawr? A gytunwch hefyd, pe byddem yn sicrhau amodau tebyg i bawb ar y mater hwn, y byddai'n rhaid inni argyhoeddi'r Trysorlys i ddiwygio gofyniad benthyca'r sector cyhoeddus?

Edwina Hart: Ydw, bydd angen trafod y mater hwnnw gyda'r Trysorlys, ac archwilio eu polisi ariannol yn y maes hwnnw.

Yr wyf yn falch o glywed eich sylwadau ynglŷn â phrosiectau ar raddfa fach. Daw consensws i'r amlwg fod prosiectau bach yn llai tebygol o gynrychioli gwerth am arian o dan PFI am nad oes ganddynt y darbodusrwydd maint ar gyfer arloesedd yn y sector preifat. Felly, mae cost llunio fframwaith PFI yn llai economaidd. Mae'n bwysig tynnu'r llinell honno.

The issue of where people stand is quite interesting. I think it was Sir Harry Jones who addressed the Local Government and Housing Committee on behalf of the Welsh Local Government Association, and indicated that this was a pragmatic issue for the WLGA in terms of bidding rounds for PFI. It is important to recognise that, although people are suspicious of PFI—particularly in Wales—and people in the local authorities in the wider public sector say that they are not happy about it, it is interesting that people are adaptable when it comes to having investment into their road or school, as long as they think that the arguments about value-for-money are well made.

Peter Law: I compliment the Minister on her pragmatic approach, which is different in Wales, as compared to Scotland and England. The Government is to be complimented on that. However the old saying, ‘casting pearls before swine’ comes to mind when you consider the Conservatives’ reaction to anything the Minister says on these matters. Also, of course, Plaid Cymru is always the first in when there is no other option but PFI. It is easy to criticise. The PFI option needs to be kept for particular projects in some areas, as the Minister said. However, I am pleased that she is doing it differently here. She is taking a balanced approach and ensuring that our workers are of equal value, whatever their status. They are all front-line professionals and they are all valued in the service. Under past Conservative Governments they were thrown out to the wolves and some of them lost their jobs.

The Presiding Officer: Order. It might be helpful if you came to your question.

Peter Law: Diolch, Lywydd, mae’n Nadolig, wedi’r cwbl.

Y Llywydd: Nid yn y fan hon.

Peter Law: Will the Minister assure me that she will continue to publicly emphasise the value of all our public sector staff, and that she will work with the trade unions in Wales to ensure an effective partnership where these type of developments take place?

Mae gweld beth yw safbwynt pawb yn eithaf diddorol. Credaf mai Syr Harry Jones a anerchodd y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai ar ran Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, a awgrymodd fod hyn yn fater pragmatig i’r Gymdeithas o ran cylchoedd gwneud cais ar gyfer PFI. Mae’n bwysig cydnabod, er bod gan bobl amheuan ynglŷn â PFI—yn arbennig yng Nghymru—a bod pobl yn yr awdurdodau lleol yn y sector cyhoeddus ehangach yn dweud nad ydynt yn fodlon ar y sefyllfa, ei bod yn ddiddorol gweld y gall pobl addasu pan fo’n fater o fuddsoddi yn eu ffordd neu ysgol hwy, cyhyd a’u bod yn credu y cyflwynwyd dadleuon da dros werth am arian.

Peter Law: Cymeradwyaf y Gweinidog ar ei hymagwedd bragmatig, sy’n wahanol yng Nghymru, o’i chymharu â’r Alban a Lloegr. Dylid cymeradwyo’r Llywodraeth am hynny. Fodd bynnag, daw’r hen ddywediad ‘taflu perlau o flaen moch’ i’r cof pan ystyriwch ymateb y Ceidwadwyr i unrhyw beth a ddywed y Gweinidog ar y materion hyn. Hefyd, wrth gwrs, mae Plaid Cymru yn barod iawn ei thafod pan nad oes unrhyw opsiwn arall ond PFI. Mae’n hawdd barnu. Mae angen cadw’r opsiwn PFI ar gyfer prosiectau penodol mewn rhai ardaloedd, fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn falch o weld ei bod yn gwneud hynny’n wahanol yma. Mae’n mabwysiadu ymagwedd gytbwys ac yn sicrhau bod ein gweithwyr o werth cyfartal, beth bynnag fo’u statws. Maent yn bobl broffesiynol yn y rheng flaen, ac yn werthfawr i’r gwasanaeth. O dan Lywodraethau Ceidwadol yn y gorffennol cawsant eu taflu i’r bleiddiaid a cholodd rhai ohonynt eu swyddi.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Efallai y byddai’n ddefnyddiol ichi ofyn eich cwestiwn.

Peter Law: Thank you, Presiding Officer, it is Christmas, after all.

The Presiding Officer: Not here.

Peter Law: A wnaiff y Gweinidog fy sicrhau y bydd yn parhau i bwysleisio’n gyhoeddus werth ein holl staff yn y sector cyhoeddus, ac y bydd yn gweithio gyda’r undebau llafur yng Nghymru i sicrhau partneriaeth effeithiol pan gynhelir y math hwn o ddatblygiad?

Edwina Hart: I can give that assurance. However, the trade unions must also understand that we must be pragmatic with regard to how we get money into the public sector for necessary investment. It takes two to tango on some of these issues.

Brian Gibbons: I warmly welcome your statement. It is in line with the evidence which shows that PFI represents value for money, particularly in terms of roads and prisons, but is more problematic in health and education. You are taking an evidence-based and pragmatic approach. However, I would like to follow up Peter's point about staffing. In the health and social care service, we have the principle of having one staff. What Peter said about valuing those staff is important. Some staff will, unfortunately, have to transfer to PFI. How are you disposed towards matters such as TUPE plus, which you did not mention in your statement?

Edwina Hart: I am disposed to look at what I am allowed to look at in terms of how we deal with matters in future PFI projects. The fact that Jane Hutt was able to extend the categories of staff has been useful. I confirmed that in my statement today. It is increasingly likely that we will have to consider some of these wider issues in that context, because it is important that staff recognise that they are valued as part of a team. If a member of staff is part of the team—not the team that I illustrated in terms of hospital porters, and cleaners—which unfortunately must transfer, we must ensure that they transfer on the best terms available.

Edwina Hart: Gallaf roi'r sicrwydd hwnnw i chi. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i'r undebau llafur ddeall hefyd bod yn rhaid inni fod yn bragmatig o ran sut y caiff arian ei drosglwyddo i'r sector cyhoeddus ar gyfer buddsoddiad angenrheidiol. Mae angen rhannu'r cyfrifoldebau ar rai o'r materion hyn.

Brian Gibbons: Croesawaf eich datganiad yn fawr. Mae'n unol â'r dystiolaeth sy'n dangos fod PFI yn cynrychioli gwerth am arian, yn arbennig o ran ffyrdd a charchardai, ond mae'n peri mwy o broblemau ym meysydd iechyd ac addysg. Yr ydych yn mabwysiadu ymagwedd sy'n seiliedig ar dystiolaeth ac sy'n bragmatig. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn drafod pwynt Peter ynglŷn â staffio. Yn y gwasanaeth iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol, mae gennym yr egwyddor o gael un staff. Mae'r hyn a ddywedodd Peter ynglŷn â gwerthfawrogi'r staff hynny yn bwysig. Bydd yn rhaid i rai aelodau o staff, yn anffodus, drosglwyddo i PFI. A ydych yn dueddol o ffafrio materion fel TUPE plus, na thrafodwyd yn eich datganiad?

Edwina Hart: Yr wyf yn dueddol o edrych ar yr hyn y caniateir imi edrych arno o ran sut y byddwn yn delio â materion mewn prosiectau PFI yn y dyfodol. Mae'r ffaith bod Jane Hutt wedi gallu ymestyn y categorïau staff wedi bod yn ddefnyddiol. Cadarnhawyd hynny yn fy natganiad heddiw. Mae'n edrych yn llawer mwy tebygol y bydd rhaid inni ystyried rhai o'r materion ehangach yn y cyddestun hwnnw, oherwydd mae'n bwysig bod staff yn cydnabod y cânt eu gwerthfawrogi fel rhan o dîm. Os yw aelod o staff yn rhan o'r tîm—nid y tîm a ddisgrifiais o ran porthorion ysbyty, a glanhawyr—y mae'n rhaid ei drosglwyddo yn anffodus, rhaid inni sicrhau y cânt eu trosglwyddo ar y telerau gorau sydd ar gael.

Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order

Nick Bourne: Point of order. I gave you notice of this point of order earlier, Llywydd. I raise it under Standing Order No. 6.26 on oral questions and also under Standing Orders Nos. 5 and 6 on the names to be

Nick Bourne: Pwynt o drefn. Rhoddais rhybudd o'r pwynt hwn o drefn ichi yn gynharach Lywydd. Codaf ef o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.26 ar gwestiynau llafar ac hefyd o dan Reolau Sefydlog Rhif. 5 a 6 ar yr

applied to the Government of Wales. You will recall that in questions to the First Minister on Tuesday, I indicated—after the First Minister suggested that I was adopting the term ‘Welsh Assembly Government’—that I had been required to include that term by the Table Office. You said that the Table Office did not make such instructions. I subsequently received an apology from the Clerk to the National Assembly, for which I am grateful. It stated:

‘I have investigated what happened in your case, and I confirm that you did not receive the advice which you should have received. Consequently the term ‘Welsh Assembly Government’ was included in your question at the insistence of the Table Office. This should not have happened.’

Despite the best efforts of the Labour chief whip to gag WAG, I understand that about 70 per cent of the Labour Party is unhappy with this title. May we bury it for good and ensure that we use the term ‘Government of Wales’ and use ‘National Assembly for Wales’ to describe the Plenary sessions?

The Presiding Officer: I am grateful to the leader of the Welsh Conservatives for putting that on record. I confirm that it is correct. On making further inquiries, following my interjection on Tuesday, we discovered that what happened was as described by the leader of the Welsh Conservatives. I am glad that he accepts the apology. I am still considering the ruling that I intend to give on the use of the term ‘Welsh Assembly Government’. In the interim, as I made plain to the leader of the opposition last week, Members are free to use the terms ‘Government of Wales’, ‘Welsh Assembly Government’, ‘Cabinet’, ‘administration’, ‘Government’ and, no doubt, other terms, as they think appropriate, as long as the meaning is clear in the context. The Table Office will not attempt to standardise these terms. Indeed, that might be difficult. I notice, for example, that an official Westminster Government document this week refers to the ‘Assembly for Wales’, which is perhaps another term. In the Table Office’s defence, the question tabled by the leader of the Welsh Conservatives was received before the office fully appreciated the practice. We are now confident that the

enwau i’w rhoi i Lywodraeth Cymru. Byddwch yn cofio imi nodi yn y cwestiynau i’r Prif Weinidog ddydd Mawrth—ar ôl i’r Prif Weinidog awgrymu fy mod yn mabwysiadu’r term ‘Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru’—fod y Swyddfa Gyflwyno wedi mynnu fy mod yn cynnwys y term. Dywedasoeh na wnaeth y Swyddfa Gyflwyno roi cyfarwyddiadau o’r fath. Yn dilyn hynny derbyniais ymddiheuriad oddi wrth Glerec y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar amdano. Dywed:

Er gwaethaf ymdrechion prif chwip Llafur i roi pen ar drafod y WAG, deallaf fod tua 70 y cant o’r Blaid Lafur yn anhapus gyda’r enw hwn. A allwn ei gladdu am byth a sicrhau ein bod yn defnyddio yr enw ‘Llywodraeth Cymru’ a defnyddio ‘Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru’ i ddisgrifio’r Cyfarfodydd Llawn.

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru am sicrhau bod hyn yn cael ei gofnodi. Cadarnhaf ei fod yn gywir. Ar ôl gwneud ymholiadau pellach, yn dilyn fy ymyriad ddydd Mawrth, canfuwyd gennym fod yr hyn a ddigwyddodd yn union fel y’i disgrifiwyd gan arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru. Yr wyf yn falch ei fod yn derbyn yr ymddiheuriad. Yr wyf yn parhau i ystyried y dyfarniad y bwriadaf ei roi ar y defnydd o’r enw ‘Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru’. Yn y cyfamser, fel yr eglurais i arweinydd yr wrthblaid yr wythnos diwethaf, mae rhyddid i’r Aelodau ddefnyddio’r enwau ‘Llywodraeth Cymru’, ‘Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru’, ‘Cabinet’, ‘gweinyddiaeth’, ‘Llywodraeth’, ac yn ddiamau, enwau eraill, fel y gwelant yn dda, yn ôl yr hyn sy’n briodol iddynt, cyhyd â bod yr ystyr yn glir yn ei gyd-destun. Ni fydd y Swyddfa Gyflwyno yn gwneud ymdrech i safoni’r enwau hyn. Yn wir, gallai hynny fod yn anodd. Sylwaf, er enghraifft, bod dogfen swyddogol gan Lywodraeth San Steffan yr wythnos hon yn cyfeirio at ‘Cynulliad Cymru’ sydd efallai’n enw arall. I amddiffyn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno, derbyniwyd y cwestiwn a gyflwynwyd gan arweinydd

practice I have outlined will be followed.

Ceidwadwyr Cymru cyn i'r swyddfa ddeall beth oedd yr arfer yn llawn. Yr ydym bellach yn hyderus y dilynir yr arfer a amlinellwyd gennym.

10:25 a.m.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Point of order. Presiding Officer, you will recall that I raised a point of order on Tuesday after the Minister for Assembly Business's business statement, regarding his long reply to Alun Pugh's question. You will recall that Alun's question had nothing to do with current or future business, but with what had happened a fortnight ago, when I asked the Minister for Assembly Business a question about how we had spent our time in Plenary. I ask you to look at Standing Order No. 5.4, which states how Plenary time should be used. I will read briefly from the relevant part of that Standing Order:

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Pwynt o drefn, Lywydd. Cofiwch i mi godi pwynt o drefn ddydd Mawrth, ar ôl datganiad busnes y Trefnydd ynghylch ei ateb hir i gwestiwn Alun Pugh. Cofiwch nad oedd gan gwestiwn Alun ddim oll i'w wneud â busnes cyfredol nac i'r dyfodol, ond gyda'r hyn a ddigwyddodd bythefnos yn ôl, pan ofynnais i gwestiwn i'r Trefnydd ynglŷn â'r modd y defnyddiwyd yr amser gennym yn y Cyfarfod Llawn. Gofynnaf i chi edrych ar Reol Sefydlog Rhif 5.4, sy'n datgan sut y dylai amser y Cyfarfod llawn gael ei ddefnyddio. Darllenaf yn fyr o ran berthnasol y Rheol Sefydlog honno:

'the Presiding Officer may allow the Assembly Business Secretary to propose that the statement be adopted, and one Member from each political group to speak briefly in response.'

'gall y Llywydd ganiatáu i'r Trefnydd gynnig mabwysiadu'r datganiad, ac i un Aelod o bob grŵp gwleidyddol ymateb yn gryno i hynny.'

It appears to me that that should mean speaking in response to that statement, rather than to what happened previously. The Minister for Assembly Business is then entitled to reply and you put the proposition to a vote. If one considers Alun Pugh's question and the response of the Minister for Assembly Business on Tuesday, that did not relate to the current week's business, but to what had happened a fortnight previously. The point of order, Presiding Officer, is on whether the exchange between Alun Pugh and the Minister was in order. If it was not, would you consider asking the Minister for Assembly Business to raise this issue in Business Committee? If he wishes to widen the scope of the current Standing Order, we would be willing to agree to that to allow a more robust and lengthy exchange on the business statement.

Ymddengys i mi y dylai hynny olygu siarad mewn ymateb i'r datganiad hwnnw, yn hytrach nag ymateb i'r hyn a ddigwyddodd yn flaenorol. Mae hawl wedyn gan y Trefnydd i roi ateb ac yna rhoddir y cynnig i bleidlais. Os ystyriwn gwestiwn Alun Pugh a'r ymateb gan y Trefnydd ddydd Mawrth, nid oedd hwnnw'n ymwneud â busnes yr wythnos gyfredol, ond yn hytrach â'r hyn â ddigwyddodd bythefnos cyn hynny. Y pwynt o drefn, Lywydd, yw a oedd yr holi a'r ateb rhwng Alun Pugh a'r Gweinidog mewn trefn. Os nad oedd, a fydddech yn ystyried gofyn i'r Trefnydd i godi'r mater yn y Pwyllgor Busnes? Os yw'n dymuno ymestyn cwmphas y Rheol Sefydlog gyfredol yna byddem yn barod i gytuno i hynny i ganiatáu dadl hwy a chadarnach ar y datganiad busnes.

The Presiding Officer: I am grateful to the leader of the opposition for giving me notice of this point of order, which has enabled me to read, not only Standing Order No. 5.4, but also Standing Order No. 5.4a, which is more

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i arweinydd yr wrthblaid am roi rhybudd o'r pwynt hwn o drefn, sydd wedi fy ngalluogi i ddarllen, nid yn unig Reol Sefydlog Rhif 5.4, ond hefyd Reol Sefydlog Rhif 5.4a, sydd yn

relevant to what happened on Tuesday. That Standing Order is invoked where there is no objection to the business statement and offers the opportunity to comment on it. As the leader of the opposition and other Members will know, I have encouraged Members at all times to use all possible opportunities to raise issues, so that they are not raised as points of order, but in the proper position under Standing Orders. This Standing Order provides an opportunity to do that. Standing Order No. 5.4a states that where there is no objection to the business statement:

‘the Presiding Officer shall allow one Member from each political group to comment briefly’.

—not to ask a question, but ‘to comment briefly’. However, that comment may be interrogative, if I can put it that way. Standing Order No. 5.4a continues:

‘to comment briefly on the Assembly Business Secretary’s statement and then allow the Assembly Business Secretary to reply.’

As the leader of the opposition indicated, I have taken a broad view of this Standing Order. On reflection, I may have allowed too much latitude on Tuesday, but I welcome the leader of the opposition’s willingness to consider a loosening up of the Standing Order. However, if Ministers intend to make statements rather than brief comments, I would prefer those statements to be made under Standing Order No. 6.9—[ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘Hear, hear.’]

Order. I do not need to hear signs of Christmas joy on these comments. They embarrass me because it then appears that I am siding with the opposition against the Government, and I would do nothing of the kind.

Alun Pugh: Further to that point of order, I am grateful for your allowing me to speak, Llywydd, given that I have been named. The leader of Plaid Cymru’s comments were not entirely accurate. I clearly recall that I

fwy perthnasol i’r hyn a ddigwyddodd ddydd Mawrth. Gweithredir y Rheol Sefydlog honno pan na fydd unrhyw wrthwynebiad i’r datganiad busnes a rhydd gyfle i wneud sylwadau arno. Fel y gŵyr arweinydd yr wrthblaid ac Aelodau eraill, yr wyf wedi annog yr Aelodau ar bob adeg i ddefnyddio pob cyfle posibl i godi materion, er mwyn osgoi iddynt gael eu codi fel pwyntiau o drefn, ond yn y lle cywir o dan y Rheolau Sefydlog. Darpara’r Rheol Sefydlog hon gyfle i wneud hynny. Datgana Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 5.4a lle na cheir unrhyw wrthwynebiad i’r datganiad busnes:

‘bydd y Llywydd yn caniatáu i un Aelod o bob grŵp gwleidyddol gyflwyno sylwadau cryno’.

—nid i ofyn cwestiwn, ond i ‘gyflwyno sylwadau cryno’. Fodd bynnag, gall y sylw hwnnw fod yn holiadol, os gallaf ei roi felly. Â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 5.4a ymlaen:

‘[c]yflwyno sylwadau cryno ar ddatganiad y Trefnydd a wedyn yn caniatáu i’r Trefnydd ymateb.’

Fel y nododd arweinydd yr wrthblaid, yr wyf wedi cymryd golwg gyffredinol ar y Rheol Sefydlog. O ystyried, efallai fy mod wedi caniatáu gormod o raff ddydd Mawrth, ond croesawaf barodrwydd arweinydd yr wrthblaid i ystyried llacio peth ar y Rheol Sefydlog. Fodd bynnag, os yw’n fwriad gan Weinidogion i wneud datganiadau yn hytrach na sylwadau byr, byddai’n well gennyf i’r datganiadau hynny gael eu gwneud o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.9—[AELODAU’R CYNULLIAD: ‘Clywch, clywch.’]

Trefn. Nid wyf yn dymuno clywed arwyddion o lawenydd y Nadolig ar y sylwadau hyn. Maent yn peri embaras i mi gan ei bod wedyn yn ymddangos fy mod yn ochri gyda’r wrthblaid yn erbyn y Llywodraeth, ac ni fuaswn yn gwneud unrhyw beth o’r fath.

Alun Pugh: Ymhellach i’r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am ganiatáu i mi siarad, Lywydd, gan i mi gael fy enwi. Nid oedd sylwadau arweinydd Plaid Cymru yn gwbl gywir. Cofiaf yn glir i mi ddiolch i’r

thanked the Trefnydd for allowing a statement to be issued on Sellafield. Its activities are of major concern to my constituents, and all the people living on the north Wales coast. Once again, Plaid Cymru is being obsessed with process rather than real issues.

The Presiding Officer: Order. That is not a point of order. I am happy to say that I am not obsessed with Plaid Cymru—*[Interruption.]* Order. I know that it is Christmas, but I do not want this to get out of hand.

I repeat the point that where substantial statements arise in the imagination of the Minister for Assembly Business, or indeed any other Minister, I would prefer them to be made under Standing Order No. 6.9 so that Members can question them. As the leader of the opposition indicated, I suggest that the Business Committee reconsider how we can best use this space for Members to raise issues on Assembly business.

Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Mynediad i Gefn Gwlad (Fforymau Mynediad Lleol) (Cymru) 2001 a Rheoliadau Mynediad i Gefn Gwlad (Mapiau Drafft) (Cymru) 2001

Approval of the Countryside Access (Local Access Forums) (Wales) Regulations 2001 and the Countryside Access (Draft Maps) (Wales) Regulations 2001

The Minister for Environment (Sue Essex): I propose that

the National Assembly considers the principle of the Countryside Access (Local Access Forums) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 20 November 2001. (NDM897)

I propose that

the National Assembly:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the Countryside Access (Local Access Forums) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 27 November 2001; and

Trefnydd am ganiatáu i ddatganiad gael ei roi ar Sellafield. Mae ei weithgareddau o bwys mawr i'm etholwyr, a phawb sy'n byw ar hyd arfordir y gogledd. Unwaith eto mae gan Plaid Cymru obsesiwn gyda phroses yn hytrach nag â phynciau gwirioneddol.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid pwynt o drefn mo hwn. Yr wyf yn hapus i ddweud nad oes gennyf obsesiwn â Phlaid Cymru—*[Torri ar draws]* Trefn. Gwn ei bod yn Nadolig, ond nid wyf am i hyn fynd dros ben llestri.

Ailadroddaf y pwynt—lle bo datganiadau o bwys yn codi yn nychymyg y Trefnydd, neu yn wir unrhyw Weinidog arall, byddai'n well gennyf iddynt gael eu rhoi o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.9 fel y gall yr Aelodau eu cwestiynu. Fel y gwnaeth arweinydd yr wrthblaid ddynodi, awgrymaf fod y Pwyllgor Busnes yn ailystyried sut y gallwn wneud y defnydd gorau o'r lle hwn i'r Aelodau godi materion ar fusnes y Cynulliad.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd (Sue Essex): Cynigïaf fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Mynediad i Gefn Gwlad (Fforymau Mynediad Lleol) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Tachwedd 2001. (NDM897)

Cynigïaf fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5, mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Mynediad i Gefn Gwlad (Fforymau Mynediad Lleol) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Tachwedd 2001; ac

2. approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 20 November 2001 and the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office on 3 December 2001. (NDM898)

I propose that

the National Assembly considers the principle of the Countryside Access (Draft Maps) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 20 November 2001. (NDM899)

I propose that

the National Assembly

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the Countryside Access (Draft Maps) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 27 November 2001; and

2. approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 20 November 2001 and the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office on 3 December 2001. (NDM900)

I hope that you have received the background note that was distributed to all AMs on progress on the implementation of the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000 and that you found it useful. It provides the context for how these regulations will be progressed.

These regulations are important foundation stones in the implementation of the access provisions of the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000 in Wales. Progress on implementing the Act's provisions in Wales is set out in the note that I mentioned. The Countryside Council for Wales has arranged an exhibition on the access land mapping process, which is the subject of one of the regulations we consider today. That exhibition will be held in Committee room 4, and I hope that Members will be able to attend it.

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Tachwedd 2001, a'r memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 3 Rhagfyr 2001. (NDM898)

Cynigiaf fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Mynediad i Gefn Gwlad (Mapiau Drafft) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Tachwedd 2001. (NDM899)

Cynigiaf fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5, mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Mynediad i Gefn Gwlad (Mapiau Drafft) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Tachwedd 2001; ac

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Tachwedd 2001, a'r memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 3 Rhagfyr 2001. (NDM900)

Gobeithiaf eich bod wedi derbyn y nodyn cefndir a ddosbarthwyd i bob AC ar y datblygiadau ar weithredu Deddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000 a'ch bod yn ei weld yn ddefnyddiol. Mae'n darparu'r cyd-destun ar gyfer datblygu'r rheoliadau hyn.

Mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn gerrig sylfaen pwysig i weithredu darpariaethau mynediad Deddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000 yng Nghymru. Amlinellir y datblygiad ar weithredu darpariaethau'r Ddeddf yng Nghymru yn y nodyn a grybwyllais. Trefnodd Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru arddangosfa ar broses fapio'r tir mynediad, sydd yn destun un o'r rheoliadau a ystyrir gennym heddiw. Cynhelir yr arddangosfa yn ystafell Bwyllgora 4 a gobeithiaf y bydd yr Aelodau yn gallu ei mynychu.

The access provisions under the Act, which I hope will come into full effect by 2005, will provide access to up to 400,000 hectares of land. That is an area bigger than the three national parks of Wales. I hope that people will understand the significance of that figure. In terms of improved access, there now are better opportunities for tourism and other leisure-based businesses.

On economic benefits, during the foot and mouth disease outbreak access was revealed to be an important aspect of the rural economy and this legislation, properly and sensitively implemented, will provide a significant opportunity to maximise access to the beautiful countryside of Wales. A survey by the University of Wales, Aberystwyth last year estimated that walking in Wales generates expenditure of over £100 million per year and sustains over 4,000 jobs. These figures speak for themselves and also indicate the potential additional economic benefits of new access to areas.

On mapping regulations, so that everyone is clear what land is subject to the new right of access, sections four and five of the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000 require the CCW to draw up draft maps of open country and registered common land. These maps must be published for consultation and the CCW must consider any representations received. Following that, the maps must be published in provisional form and appeals considered before they are produced in a final form. Therefore, there are three stages to this process: drafting the maps, publishing them provisionally, and then finally.

The regulations before us today govern the first stage in the process, namely the production of and consultation on the draft maps. The latter stages will need to be covered by further regulations, which will come forward next year. The regulations specify key matters such as the scale of the draft maps, how they are to be published for consultation—in printed and electronic form—the handling of representations received, and the notification of changes made as a result. To ensure that everyone

Bydd y darpariaethau mynediad yn y Ddeddf, y gobeithiaf y dont i weithrediad llawn erbyn 2005, yn darparu mynediad i hyd at 400,000 hectar o dir. Mae hynny'n fwy na thri pharc cenedlaethol Cymru. Gobeithiaf y bydd pobl yn deall arwyddocâd y ffigur hwn. O ran gwella mynediad, y mae bellach well cyfleoedd ar gyfer twristiaeth a busnesau eraill sy'n seiliedig ar hamdden.

O ran manteision economaidd, yn ystod argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau amlygwyd fod mynediad yn agwedd bwysig ar yr economi wledig a bydd y ddeddfwriaeth hon, o'i rhoi ar waith yn gywir ac yn sensitif, yn darparu cyfle arwyddocaol i sicrhau'r mynediad gorau posibl i gefn gwlad hardd Cymru. Mewn arolwg gan Brifysgol Cymru, Aberystwyth y llynedd, amcangyfrifiwyd fod cerdded yng Nghymru yn creu gwariant o dros £100 miliwn y flwyddyn ac yn cynnal dros 4,000 o swyddi. Mae'r ffigurau hyn yn siarad drostynt eu hunain a hefyd dangosant y manteision economaidd ychwanegol sy'n bosibl drwy fynediad newydd i ardaloedd.

O ran rheoliadau mapio, fel bod pawb yn gwybod pa dir y mae'r hawl yn berthnasol iddo, mae adrannau pedwar a phump o Ddeddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000 yn mynnu bod Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru yn paratoi mapiau drafft o dir agored a thir comin cofrestredig. Rhaid i'r mapiau hyn gael eu cyhoeddi ar gyfer ymgynghoriad a rhaid i'r cyngor ystyried unrhyw sylwadau a gyflwynir. Yn dilyn hynny, bydd yn rhaid cyhoeddi'r mapiau ar ffurf dros dro ac ystyried apeliadau cyn iddynt gael eu cynhyrchu yn eu ffurf derfynol. Felly, mae tri cham i'r broses: drafftio'r mapiau, eu cyhoeddi dros dro ac yna'n derfynol.

Mae'r rheoliadau sydd ger ein bron heddiw yn rheoli'r cam cyntaf yn y broses, sef cynhyrchu'r mapiau drafft ac ymgynghori arnynt. Bydd angen i'r camau olaf gael eu cwmpasu gan reoliadau pellach, a gyflwynir y flwyddyn nesaf. Noda'r rheoliadau faterion allweddol penodol megis graddfeydd mapiau drafft, y ffurf y cânt eu cyhoeddi ar gyfer ymgynghori—mewn ffurf argraffedig ac electronig—delio â'r sylwadau a ddaw i law, a hysbysu'r newidiadau a wneir o ganlyniad i hynny. Er mwyn sicrhau bod pawb sydd â

with an interest is aware of the draft maps, the regulations contain important consultation requirements, including the provision of copies of maps, free of charge, to those with a direct interest.

Those of you who have followed debates over the past two and a half years since the Assembly's establishment, will know that I am keen on local access forums, not just in terms of open access, but because they are important mechanisms for bringing people together. The other regulations that we consider today concern local access forums. Section 94 of the Act requires local highway authorities and national parks to establish local access forums for their area, in line with the regulations approved by the Assembly. The forums will be advisory bodies with a specific remit to advise local authorities and national parks on the improvement of local access opportunities, including implementation of the Act's new access provisions. The CCW has already helped to establish several informal forums in Wales which are demonstrating their worth in ensuring that the views of recreational users, landowners and farmers are heard and taken into account. That will be important if the potential benefit of the new access provisions to the local communities is to be maximised and conflict minimised.

10:35 a.m.

The regulations set down the minimum appointment and authorisation requirements for these forums. The key provisions are as follows. Joint forums may be set up where relevant authorities agree that there are practical reasons on the ground why that should be done across borders. A limit is placed on the overall number of members so that forums do not become unwieldy; they must be able to operate properly. Forum meetings will be open to the public. Forum members will be able to claim reasonable travelling and other expenses, including, importantly, childcare costs. Appointing authorities will need to advertise the setting up of a local forum and invite expressions of interest, and appointing authorities must seek to ensure a balance in membership between

diddordeb yn ymwybodol o'r mapiau drafft, mae'r rheoliadau yn cynnwys gofynion ymgynghori pwysig, gan gynnwys darparu copïau o fapiau, am ddim, i'r rheini a chanddynt ddiddordeb uniongyrchol.

Bydd y rhai ohonoch sydd wedi bod yn dilyn dadleuon dros y ddwy flynedd a hanner diwethaf ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad, yn gwybod fy mod yn frwd o blaid fforymau mynediad lleol, nid yn unig o ran mynediad agored, ond oherwydd eu bod yn ddulliau pwysig i ddwyn pobl ynghyd. Mae'r rheoliadau eraill a ystyrir gennym heddiw yn ymwneud â fforymau mynediad lleol. Mae Adran 94 y Ddeddf yn gofyn i awdurdodau priffyrdd lleol a pharciau cenedlaethol sefydlu fforymau mynediad lleol i'w hardaloedd, yn unol â'r rheoliadau a gymeradwywyd gan y Cynulliad. Bydd y fforymau yn gyrff ymgynghorol gyda chylch gwaith penodol i gynghori awdurdodau lleol a pharciau cenedlaethol ar wella cyfleoedd mynediad lleol, gan gynnwys gweithredu darpariaethau mynediad newydd y Ddeddf. Mae Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru eisoes wedi helpu i sefydlu nifer o fforymau anffurfiol yng Nghymru sydd yn dangos eu gwerth drwy sicrhau bod barn defnyddwyr hamdden, tîrfeddianwyr a ffermwyr yn cael eu clywed ac yn cael eu hystyried. Bydd hynny'n bwysig er mwyn manteisio'n llawn ar fudd posibl y darpariaethau mynediad newydd i'r cymunedau lleol ac i sicrhau cyn lleied ag y bo modd o wrthdaro.

Mae'r rheoliadau yn pennu isafswm gofynion penodi ac awdurdodi ar gyfer y fforymau hyn. Dyma'r darpariaethau allweddol. Gellir sefydlu fforymau ar y cyd pan fydd awdurdodau perthnasol yn cytuno fod rhesymau ymarferol dros wneud hynny ar draws ffiniau. Gosodir cyfyngiad ar nifer yr aelodau fel na fydd y fforymau yn anhylaw; rhaid iddynt allu gweithredu'n iawn. Bydd cyfarfodydd y fforymau yn agored i'r cyhoedd. Bydd aelodau'r fforymau yn gallu hawlio costau teithio rhesymol a chostau eraill, gan gynnwys costau gofal plant, sy'n beth pwysig. Bydd angen i awdurdodau sy'n penodi hysbysebu sefydlu fforwm lleol a gwahodd mynegiadau o ddiddordeb, a dylai awdurdodau penodi geisio sicrhau cydbwysedd o ran aelodaeth rhwng

user interest and those managing the land, as well as a gender balance.

We have taken costs and the need for additional resources into account. The costs of preparing the maps of accessed land and of establishing local access forums have been taken into account in the resources allocated by the Assembly to the relevant authorities. The Countryside Council for Wales, the local authorities and the national parks have received additional funding.

These regulations have been framed with costs in mind and with a proportionate approach. Both regulations have been subject to extensive public consultation in Wales. All Assembly Members were invited to submit comments and the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee has been closely involved. The views and comments received have been taken into account and improvements made as a result.

In conclusion, I am keen that we grasp the opportunities provided in the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000 to maximise access opportunities in Wales. It will benefit users, farmers and rural communities alike. These two regulations are essential first steps in the process and I commend them to Members.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I'r rhai ohonom a ddilynodd Lladin yn yr ysgol, 'fora' yw'r lluosog am 'forum' ac nid 'forums', fel y mae gweision sifil yn mynnu cyfeirio atynt.

Sue Essex: What is wrong with 'forums'?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yn y Gymraeg, Sue, mae ystyr arbennig i'r gair 'fforymau', sef 'beinciau' neu 'feinciau pren'. Felly, byddai'n syniad da defnyddio'r term Lladin cywir, 'fora'.

Mae'r pwyllgorau lleol hyn yn hollbwysig os yr ydym am gyflwyno mynediad i gefn gwlad mewn ffordd fydd yn dderbyniol i bawb. Yr oedd Cymru ar y blaen i Loegr o ran cyflwyno'r ddeddfwriaeth hon a sefydlu'r *fora* lleol. A ddywed y Gweinidog wrthyf beth yw'r sefyllfa ar hyn o bryd a faint o

diddordeb defnyddwyr a'r rhai sy'n rheoli'r tir, yn ogystal â chydbwysedd rhwng y ddau ryw.

Rhoesom ystyriaeth i'r costau a'r angen am adnoddau ychwanegol. Rhoddwyd ystyriaeth i gostau paratoi mapiau o dir y cafwyd mynediad iddo ac i sefydlu fforymau mynediad lleol yn yr adnoddau a ddosrannwyd gan y Cynulliad i'r awdurdodau perthnasol. Derbyniodd Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru, yr awdurdodau lleol a'r parciau cenedlaethol gyllid ychwanegol.

Paratowyd y rheoliadau hyn gan gofio'r costau a chydag ymagwedd gymedrol. Bu'r ddau reoliad yn destun ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus eang yng Nghymru. Gwahoddyd pob Aelod Cynulliad i roi sylwadau a chafodd Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth gryn fewnbyn iddo. Rhoddwyd ystyriaeth i'r farn a'r sylwadau a dderbyniwyd ac o ganlyniad gwnaethpwyd gwelliannau.

I gloi, yr wyf yn awyddus ein bod yn dal ar y cyfleoedd a geir yn Neddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000 i wella cyfleoedd mynediad i'r graddau mwyaf posibl yng Nghymru. Bydd yn fanteisiol i ddefnyddwyr, ffermwyr a chymunedau gwledig fel ei gilydd. Mae'r ddau reoliad yn gamau cyntaf hanfodol yn y broses ac fe'u cymeradwyaf i'r Aelodau.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Those of us who studied Latin at school will know that 'fora' is the plural of 'forum' rather than 'forums', as civil servants insist on referring to them.

Sue Essex: Beth sydd o'i le ar 'forums'?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: In Welsh, Sue, the word 'fforymau' has a particular meaning, namely 'benches' or 'wooden benches'. Therefore, it would be a good idea to use the correct Latin term, 'fora'.

These local committees are vital if we are to give access to the countryside in a way that is acceptable to everyone. Wales was ahead of England in introducing this legislation and establishing the local fora. Will the Minister tell me what the current situation is and what resources are being invested to ensure that

adnoddau a roddir i sicrhau bod y *fora* hyn yn gweithredu'n effeithiol? Y mae Aelodau Plaid Cymru yn credu bod y *fora* hyn yn hanfodol er mwyn sicrhau y cyflwynir y ddeddfwriaeth hon mewn ffordd nad yw'n achosi gwrthdaro yng nghefn gwlad.

Bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol y bu peth gwrthwynebiad i'r ddeddfwriaeth a byddwn yn falch o wybod y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn sicrhau bod adnoddau digonol ar gael i alluogi'r *fora* i weithredu'n effeithiol ac y caiff y ddeddfwriaeth ei chyflwyno mewn ffordd a fydd o fudd i gefn gwlad. Y mae modd o gyflwyno'r ddeddfwriaeth hon a fydd yn sicrhau y bydd cefn gwlad yn elwa ohoni. Y mae'r *fora*'n hanfodol i sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd.

Alun Pugh: Last Sunday, I walked to the summit of Cadair Berwyn. The hills above Llandrillo are superb for walking. While the summit of Snowdon, our highest mountain, is graced by a slum designed by Clough Williams-Ellis on an off day, the summit pillar of Cadair Berwyn stands alone. It was a superb day and you could see for over 50 miles. You could even differentiate between Castell y Gwynt and the summit of Glyder Fach. However, the Berwyn mountains do not have a good rights of way network. A large board informed me that I was on a permitted path, which could be withdrawn at any time. Access to our high mountains should be a legal right and I will enthusiastically vote for these regulations. Anyone with an interest in access knows that the right to walk and climb has been hard won. The Kinder mass trespass of 1932 led to the jailing of people whose only crime was to want some fresh air after a week's work in Manchester factories.

This is landmark legislation, which, like the national minimum wage and the removal of hereditary peers, extends the rights of ordinary people. As with all progressive legislation, the Tories bitterly opposed it. I ask them now to accept that this is popular legislation in Wales, to drop their 'get off my land' mantra and to join us in celebrating the right of access to our mountains and moors

these *fora* operate effectively? Plaid Cymru Members believe that these *fora* are vital if this legislation is to be introduced in such a way as not to cause conflict in rural areas.

The Minister will be aware that there has been some opposition to the legislation and I was glad to hear that the Government of Wales will ensure that sufficient resources are in place to enable the *fora* to operate effectively and this legislation to be introduced in a way that benefits rural areas. This legislation could be implemented in a way that will ensure that it benefits rural areas. The *fora* are vital to ensuring that that happens.

Alun Pugh: Ddydd Sul diwethaf, cerddais i gopa Cadair Berwyn. Mae'r brynau uwchlaw Llandrillo yn ardderchog i gerdded arnynt. Tra bod copa'r Wyddfa, ein mynydd uchaf, wedi ei addurno â hofel a gynlluniwyd gan Clough Williams-Ellis ar ddiwrnod pan nad oedd ar ei orau, mae piler copa Cadair Berwyn yn sefyll ar ei ben ei hun. Yr oedd yn ddiwrnod ardderchog ac yr oedd modd gweld i bellter o dros 50 milltir. Yr oedd modd gwahaniaethu rhwng Castell y Gwynt a chopa'r Glyder Fach. Fodd bynnag, nid oes gan fynyddoedd y Berwyn rwydwaith hawliau tramwy da. Fe'm hysbyswyd gan hysbyswrdd mawr fy mod ar lwybr a ganiateid, ond y gellid ei ddileu ar unrhyw adeg. Dylai mynediad i'n mynyddoedd uchaf fod yn hawl gyfreithiol a phleidleisiaf yn frwd dros y rheoliadau hyn. Gŵyr unrhyw un sydd â diddordeb mewn mynediad fod yr hawl i gerdded a dringo wedi ei hennill drwy ddycnwch mawr. Arweiniodd tresbas torfol Kinder ym 1932 at garcharu pobl a'u hunig drosedd oedd dymuno cael ychydig o awyr iach ar ôl wythnos o waith yn ffatrïoedd Manceinion.

Mae'r ddeddfwriaeth hon yn bwysig, sydd fel yr isafswm cyflog cenedlaethol a chael gwared ar yr arglwyddi etifeddol, yn ymestyn hawliau pobl gyffredin. Fel gyda phob deddfwriaeth flaengar, gwrthwynebwyd ef yn ffyrnig gan y Torïaid. Gofynnaf iddynt yn awr dderbyn bod hon yn ddeddfwriaeth boblogaidd yng Nghymru, i gefnu ar eu mantra 'cadwch draw o'm tir' ac i ymuno â

and the boost that it will bring to the tourist industry.

Glyn Davies: I find dealing with this issue difficult. I remain fundamentally opposed to the principle that underpins this Act. Alun Pugh challenged me directly and I accept his challenge. The Conservatives have never been against access. We oppose the compulsory nature of this access and the fact that it takes property rights without properly paying for them, particularly when the Assembly's Tir Gofal scheme allows voluntary access, which is taking place in a well managed way, across huge areas of Wales. This Act is an obnoxious piece of legislation, but we accept that it is becoming law. However, the legislation that we are dealing with today implements part of the Act in such a way as is likely to be helpful and to improve it. I am, therefore, inclined to support it.

Access fora are crucial. When a despicable Act like this comes into force, we want to reduce conflict as far as possible. The fora will do that and I encourage everybody to become involved in what they do. Secondly, we must have accurate maps. I am not sure whether I missed a point made by the Minister, but I want all these maps to be sent to the landowners involved. When events like this happen, which are important to people, they often do not look at the information when they should. I hope that the Minister will tell us whether all of the affected landowners will receive copies of these maps. I put on record that while we are prepared to support any means of making this Act more acceptable, we will never accept the principles that underlie the confiscatory nature of this Act.

Eleanor Burnham: I attended the Berwyn forum in Llangollen the other evening. It was interesting. The local maps were on display and I was heartened by the comments and the positive attitude displayed towards these matters, because this is a good move. The only issue that struck me was that we must ensure that there are sufficient resources for wardens. The issue of dog fouling and minimising the spread of parasites or other

ni i ddathlu hawl mynediad i'n mynyddoedd a'n gweunydd a'r hwb a rydd i'n diwydiant twristiaeth.

Glyn Davies: Mae delio â'r pwnc hwn yn anodd imi. Yr wyf yn parhau i wrthwynebu'r egwyddor sy'n sylfaen i'r Ddeddf hon. Heriodd Alun Pugh fi yn uniongyrchol a derbyniaf yr her. Nid yw'r Ceidwadwyr erioed wedi bod yn erbyn mynediad. Gwrthwynebwn natur orfodol y mynediad hwn a'r ffaith ei fod yn meddiannu hawliau eiddo heb dalu'n iawn amdanynt, yn enwedig pan fo cynllun Tir Gofal y Cynulliad yn caniatáu mynediad gwirfoddol, sy'n digwydd mewn dull a reolir yn dda, ar draws ardaloedd eang o Gymru. Mae'r Ddeddf hon yn ddarn o ddeddfwriaeth ffiaidd, ond derbyniwn ei bod yn dod i rym. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ddeddfwriaeth y deliwn â hi heddiw yn gweithredu rhan o'r Ddeddf yn y fath fodd a fydd yn debyg o fod o gymorth a'i gwella. Felly, tueddaf at ei chefnogi.

Mae ffora yn hollbwysig. Pan fo Deddf warthus fel hon yn dod i rym, yr ydym am leihau gwrthdaro i'r graddau mwyaf posibl. Bydd y ffora yn gwneud hynny ac anogaf bawb i ymroi i'r hyn a wnânt. Yn ail, rhaid i ni gael mapiau cywir. Nid wyf yn siŵr a fu imi fethu pwynt a wnaethpwyd gan y Gweinidog, ond yr wyf am i'r mapiau hyn i gyd gael eu hanfon at y tîrfeddianwyr perthnasol. Gyda digwyddiadau fel hyn, sy'n bwysig i bobl, yn aml nid edrychant ar y wybodaeth pan ddylent wneud. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn dweud wrthym a fydd yr holl dirfeddianwyr y mae hyn yn effeithio arnynt yn derbyn copïau o'r mapiau hyn. Carwn gofnodi tra'n bod yn barod i gefnogi unrhyw ddull i wneud y Ddeddf hon yn fwy derbyniol, ni fyddwn fyth yn derbyn yr egwyddorion sy'n sail i natur atafaelol y Ddeddf hon.

Eleanor Burnham: Mynychais fforwm y Berwyn yn Llangollen y noson o'r blaen. Yr oedd yn ddiddorol. Yr oedd y mapiau lleol yn cael eu harddangos ac fe'm calonogwyd gan y sylwadau a'r agwedd gadarnhaol a ddangoswyd tuag at y materion hyn, oherwydd mae hyn yn gam da. Yr unig beth â'm trawodd oedd yr angen i sicrhau bod adnoddau digonol i wardeniaid. Cyfeiriwyd yn y cyfarfod at fater baw cŵn a lleihau

things that dogs might carry was mentioned in the meeting. The Liberal Democrats believe in the principle that local issues are best dealt with at a local level. These fora will be at a very local level, and we endorse that philosophy.

While we recognise that farmers and ramblers will not agree on everything, these fora will enable problems to be resolved amicably. We support the idea of informing the public via the internet when certain paths will be temporarily closed, for economic reasons for example. That was mentioned at the Berwyn forum. Using modern technology to solve tensions in the countryside is particularly welcomed and can hopefully help correct the romantic stereotype that the countryside is a quaint, old-fashioned place rather than a modern enterprising area where communities embrace change and have a future as well as a past. In short, this is another example of the partnership Government improving the lives of the people of Wales democratically and openly. The Liberal Democrats have given the Assembly the stability that we all knew it needed.

The Minsiter for Environment (Sue Essex): I begin by thanking Rhodri Glyn Thomas for initiating his comments with a strategic and fundamental point, as he always does. [*Laughter.*] He is always astutely analytical in his comments. Forums—I could have a long debate on that, but as someone who failed my Latin with a grade 9 at O-level, I am not sure if I am equipped for it—is the word used in the legislation, so who are we to argue? It is not about wooden benches, though I thank you for that Welsh word; it is about a fundamental aspect of the Act.

10:45 a.m.

In terms of budgets, those of you who looked closely at the financial settlement last year will remember that we substantially increased the baseline budget of local authorities and national parks to implement this Act. I hope that we were generous and we have equipped local authorities and others to do the job.

ymestyniad parasitiaid neu bethau eraill y gall cŵn eu cario. Cred y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn yr egwyddor mai'r lefel leol yw'r lle gorau i drafod materion lleol. Bydd y ffora hyn yn digwydd ar lefel leol iawn, a chefnogwn yr athroniaeth honno.

Tra'n bod yn cydnabod na fydd ffermwyr a cherddwyr yn cytuno ar bopeth, bydd y ffora hyn yn caniatáu i broblemau gael eu datrys yn gyfeillgar. Cefnogwn y syniad o roi gwybod i'r cyhoedd drwy'r rhyngwrwyd pan gaeir rhai llwybrau arbennig dros dro, am resymau economaidd er enghraifft. Soniwyd am hyn yn fforwm y Berwyn. Croesewir yn arbennig y defnydd o dechnoleg fodern i ddatrys tensiynau yng nghefn gwlad a gall, gobeithio, gywiro'r stereoteip rhamantus o gefn gwlad fel lle hen ffasiwn yn hytrach nag ardal o fentergaredd fodern lle bydd cymunedau'n cofleidio newid a bod dyfodol iddynt yn ogystal â gorffennol. Yn fyr, mae hon yn enghraifft arall o'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth yn gwella bywydau pobl Cymru yn ddemocrataidd ac agored. Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wedi rhoi'r sefydlogrwydd i'r Cynulliad yr oeddem ni i gyd yn gwybod fod ei angen arno.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd (Sue Essex): Dechreuaf drwy ddiolch i Rhodri Glyn Thomas am agor ei sylwadau â phwynt strategol a sylfaenol fel y bydd yn gwneud bob amser. [*Chwerthin.*] Mae yn ddadansoddol graff yn ei sylwadau. Fforymau—gallwn gael dadl ar hynny, ond fel rhywun â fethodd ei Lladin â gradd 9 yn lefel O, nid wyf yn siŵr a oes gennyf y cymhwyster i wneud—yw'r gair a ddefnyddir yn y ddeddfwriaeth, felly pwy ydym ni i ddadlau? Nid yw'n ymwneud â meinciau pren, ond er hynny diolchaf i chi am y gair Cymraeg; mae'n ymwneud ag agwedd sylfaenol ar y Ddeddf.

O ran cyllidebau, fe gofia'r rhai hynny ohonoch a edrychodd yn fanwl ar y setliad ariannol y llynedd ein bod wedi cynyddu cyllideb gwaelodlin awdurdodau lleol a pharciau cenedlaethol yn sylweddol i weithredu'r Ddeddf hon. Yr wyf yn gobeithio inni fod yn hael a'n bod wedi rhoi'r arfau i

That covers wardens and other work necessary in relation to the Act. However, we will keep the matter under close review, in consultation with national parks and local authorities. It is estimated that a forum will cost between £3,000 and £4,000 a year. We do not know that for certain, but it will be monitored. However, we do not imagine that it will be costly to run.

I thank Glyn for his constructive comments. We must recognise that there is a fundamental difference of attitude between his party and mine. It is a principle. I know that you and Alun will never agree on it. However, I, and members of my party and others, support the principle strongly. It is a philosophy in which we believe. Having said that, it is important that we take everyone on board as far as possible and, as Eleanor said, the local access forums are a way of doing that. We will not resolve all conflicts, but talking and working things through together in practice—which we do well in Wales—will help to achieve greater understanding and perhaps minimise conflicts.

In terms of notification, individuals will not be notified. This will be widely publicised in local newspapers and the farming press. We hope for considerable co-operation. I am sure that that will be forthcoming from the farming unions and other key organisations. Notification will be placed in public libraries and in *Gwlad*—the National Assembly newsletter for farmers—and statutory local authority consultees will also be notified. If my memory serves me right, there is a three-month period for people to respond. I hope that, during that time, through all these methods, people with a direct interest will understand what is happening.

In terms of maps, Wales has led the way. I was a member of CCW at the time, and we always believed that putting on paper—and now using electronic means—clear information about open access was the way forward, to remove ambiguities and the basis of conflict. That work is ongoing, and I am

awdurdodau lleol ac eraill gyflawni'u gwaith. Mae hyn yn cwmpasu wardeniaid a gwaith arall mewn perthynas â'r Ddeddf. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn dal i adolygu'r mater yn fanwl, mewn ymgynghoriad â pharciau cenedlaethol ac awdurdodau lleol. Amcangyfrifir y bydd fforwm yn costio rhwng £3,000 a £4,000 y flwyddyn. Ni wyddom hynny i sicrwydd, ond caiff ei fonitro. Fodd bynnag, nid ydym yn dychmygu y bydd yn gostus i'w weithredu.

Diolchaf i Glyn am ei sylwadau adeiladol. Rhaid inni gydnabod fod gwahaniaeth sylfaenol mewn agwedd rhwng ei blaid ef a fy mhlaid i. Egwyddor ydyw. Yr wyf yn sylweddoli na wnewch chi ag Alun gytuno fyth arni. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf fi, ac aelodau o fy mhlaid ac eraill, yn cefnogi'r egwyddor yn gadarn iawn. Mae'n athroniaeth y credwn ynddi. Ar ôl dweud hynny, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cynnwys pawb i'r graddau mwyaf posibl, ac, fel y dywedodd Eleanor, mae'r fforymau mynediad lleol yn ffordd o wneud hynny. Ni lwyddwn i ddatrys pob gwrthdaro, ond gan siarad a gweithio ar bethau gyda'n gilydd yn ymarferol—rhywbeth a wnawn yn dda yng Nghymru—byddwn yn helpu i gyrraedd gwell dealltwriaeth ac efallai gadw gwrthdaro i'r lleiafswm.

O ran rhoi gwybod i bobl, ni fydd unigolion yn cael eu hysbysu. Bydd hyn yn cael cyhoeddusrwydd eang yn y papurau lleol a'r wasg ffermio. Yr ydym yn gobeithio am gryn gydweithrediad. Yr wyf yn siŵr y ceir hynny gan undebau'r ffermwyr a chyrrff allweddol eraill. Bydd hysbysiad yn cael ei osod mewn llyfrgelloedd cyhoeddus ac yn *Gwlad*—cylchlythyr y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i ffermwyr—a bydd awdurdodau lleol yr ymgynghorir â hwy yn statudol hefyd yn cael eu hysbysu. Os cofiaf yn iawn y mae gan bobl dri mis i ymateb. Gobeithiaf, yn ystod yr amser hwnnw, drwy'r holl ddulliau hyn, y bydd pobl sydd â diddordeb uniongyrchol yn deall beth sy'n digwydd.

O ran y mapiau, mae Cymru wedi arwain y ffordd. Yr oeddwn yn aelod o Gyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru ar y pryd, ac yr oeddem wedi credu o'r dechrau mai rhoi gwybodaeth glir ar bapur—a nawr gan ddefnyddio dulliau electronig—am fynediad agored oedd y ffordd ymlaen, i gael gwared ar

pleased with the progress. It will take considerable time, and it will be rolled out in stages across Wales. If we can involve people and get them to work together, then I hope that the number of appeals will be minimised. Regulations dealing with appeals will be introduced in the future.

gamddealltwriaeth a sail gwrthdaro. Mae'r gwaith hwnnw yn parhau, ac yr wyf yn fodlon gyda'r cynnydd. Cymer gryn amser a bydd yn cael ei gyflwyno i bob rhan o Gymru fesul cam. Os gallwn gael pobl i weithio gyda'i gilydd, yna gobeithiaf y bydd nifer yr apeliadau yn gostwng. Bydd rheoliadau yn ymwneud ag apeliadau yn cael eu cyflwyno yn y dyfodol agos.

The Presiding Officer: We will now vote on the principle of the first Order.

Y Llywydd: Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar egwyddor y Gorchymyn cyntaf.

*Cynnig: O blaid 39, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 39, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Richards, Rod
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

The Presiding Officer: We will now vote on **Y Llywydd:** Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar the approval of the first Order. gymeradwyo'r Gorchymyn cyntaf.

Cynnig: O blaid 38, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion: For 38, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Richards, Rod
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion carried.

The Presiding Officer: We will now vote on **Y Llywydd:** Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar the principle of the second Order. egwyddor yr ail Orchymyn

Cynnig: O blaid 36, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion: For 36, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor

Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Gareth
Lewis, Huw
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Richards, Rod
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

The Presiding Officer: We will now vote on **Y Llywydd:** Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar
the approval of the second Order. gymeradwyo'r ail Orchymyn.

*Cynnig: O blaid 40, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 40, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane

Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Richards, Rod
 Ryder, Janet
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Diogelu'r Amgylchedd (Cyfyngu ar y Defnydd ar
 Beledi Plwm)(Cymru) 2001
 Approval of the Environmental Protection (Restriction on use of Lead Shot)
 (Wales) Regulations 2001**

The Minister for Environment (Sue Essex): I propose that

the National Assembly

considers the principle of the Environmental Protection (Restriction on use of Lead Shot) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 20 November 2001. (NDM901)

I propose that

the National Assembly

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the Environmental Protection (Restriction on use of Lead Shot) (Wales) Regulations 2001 laid in the Table Office on 27 November 2001; and

2. approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 20 November 2001 and the memorandum of corrections, laid in the Table Office on 3 December 2001, and the

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd (Sue Essex): Cynigiaf fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol

yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Diogelu'r Amgylchedd (Cyfyngu ar y Defnydd ar Beledi Plwm) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Tachwedd 2001. (NDM901)

Cynigiaf fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5, mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Diogelu'r Amgylchedd (Cyfyngu ar y Defnydd ar Beledi Plwm) (Cymru) 2001 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Tachwedd 2001; ac

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Tachwedd 2001, a'r memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 3 Rhagfyr 2001, a'r

regulatory appraisal, laid in the Table Office on 20 November 2001. (NDM902)

To continue this morning's countryside theme, these lead shot regulations have gone through the Legislation Committee and I am pleased to propose them. They will help to reduce the threat of lead poisoning in water birds and will help Wales meet an international commitment to phase out the use of lead shot over wetlands, while not unduly restricting the sport of wild fowling or shooting generally. Lead is universally recognised as a poison; decades of research into its toxic effects have shown that lead can affect the development, reproduction and survival of animals and humans. This has led to strict controls on the introduction of lead in the general environment by a reduction in its use in paint and petrol as well as in angling and shooting sports. Lead shot has been identified as posing a particular threat to waterfowl through poisoning. Where spent lead shot is deposited on wetland foreshores, water birds habitually take in grit to aid their digestion and can take in pellets with the grit. The lead in the spent shot remains in the affected bird's gut and builds up until the bird eventually dies from lead poisoning.

The UK has an international commitment, under the African-Eurasian Migratory (Water Bird) Agreement, to endeavour to phase out the use of lead shot over wetlands. UK authorities have a practical commitment to meeting that obligation. As long ago as 1992, the then Department of Environment, Transport and the Regions set up a working group—the lead poisoning in waterfowl working group—to develop strategies to address the problem. The then Welsh Office was represented on that working group, as were shooting organisations. In 1995, the working group supported a voluntary two-year phasing out of lead-shot use over UK wetlands. This approach was adopted to enable non-toxic alternatives to lead shot, acceptable to shooters, to be developed.

Shortly before devolution, a GB-wide

arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Tachwedd 2001. (NDM902)

I barhau â thema cefn gwlad y bore yma, mae rheoliadau peledi plwm wedi cael eu pasio gan y Pwyllgor Deddfwriaeth ac yr wyf yn falch o'u cynnig. Byddant yn helpu i leihau bygythiad gwenwyn plwm mewn adar dŵr ac yn helpu Cymru i gwrdd ag ymrwymiad rhyngwladol i ddileu'r defnydd o beledi plwm ar wlyptiroedd yn raddol tra'n osgoi cyfyngu'n ormodol ar hela adar gwyllt neu saethu'n gyffredinol. Cydnabyddir yn fyd eang fod plwm yn wenwyn; dangosodd degawdau o ymchwil i'w effeithiau gwenwynig fod plwm yn gallu cael effaith ar ddatblygiad, atgynhyrchiad a goroesiad anifeiliaid a phobl. Arweiniodd hyn at reolau llym ar gyflwyno plwm i'r amgylchedd drwy leihau'r defnydd a wneir ohono mewn paent a phetrol yn ogystal ag mewn pysgota a saethu. Canfuwyd fod peledi plwm yn fygythiad arbennig i adar y dŵr drwy wenwyno. Lle mae peledi plwm a ddefnyddiwyd wedi'u gadael ar flaendraethau gwlyptiroedd, bydd adar y dŵr yn gyson yn bwyta graean i'w helpu i dreulio a gallant lyncu peledi gyda'r graean. Mae'r plwm yn y peledi yn aros yng ngholuddyn yr aderyn yr effeithiwyd arno ac yn crynhoi hyd nes y bydd yr aderyn yn y diwedd yn marw o wenwyn plwm.

Mae gan y DU ymrwymiad rhyngwladol, o dan Gytundeb (Adar Dŵr) Mudol Affrica-Ewrasia, i geisio dileu'r defnydd yn raddol o beledi plwm a ddefnyddir ar wlyptiroedd. Mae gan awdurdodau'r DU ymrwymiad ymarferol i fodloni'r rhwymedigaeth honno. Mor bell yn ôl â 1992 sefydlodd Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau ar y pryd weithgor—gweithgor gwenwyn plwm mewn adar dŵr—i ddatblygu strategaethau i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem. Cynrychiolid y Swyddfa Gymreig ar y pryd ar y gweithgor hwnnw ynghyd â mudiadau saethu. Yn 1995, cefnogodd y gweithgor ddileu'r defnydd o beledi plwm ar draws gwlyptiroedd y DU yn raddol dros gyfnod o ddwy flynedd. Mabwysiadwyd y dull hwn o weithredu er mwyn rhoi amser i ddeunydd saethu gwahanol di-wenwyn a fyddai'n dderbyniol i saethwyr gael ei ddatblygu.

Ychydig cyn datganoli, cynhaliwyd

consultation was carried out on a draft statutory instrument to prohibit the use of lead shot over certain wetlands. A statutory instrument was subsequently introduced in England only. Following devolution, it is for the Assembly to determine the most appropriate approach to the problem of lead-shot ingestion in Wales.

Consultation has revealed strong feelings on the issue. Conservation bodies, such as the Royal Society for the Protection of Birds, advocate a total ban on lead shot, while the Countryside Council for Wales, advising in its statutory capacity, aspires to a general reduction in the level of man-made lead entering the environment. Bodies representing shooting, farming and country business organisations consider a total ban to be an unnecessary and disproportionate response.

I am concerned that the National Assembly's response be proportionate. We have given this matter much consideration. Assembly officials held a meeting with interested organisations in July 2000, and undertook a further consultation in spring 2001. The contributions made at the meeting, and the responses to the consultation, have reassured me that the statutory instrument before you today is both reasonable and proportionate in its conservation objectives and its effects on business and individual shooters.

The regulations are similar to those in place in England, thus minimising the potential for inconsistency or misunderstanding in border areas. However, they are better targeted than the existing regulations in England. In conclusion, although there is little direct evidence on the number of birds killed by lead-shot ingestion in Wales, there is no doubt that lead is toxic to birds and that water birds are at risk from lead poisoning by ingesting spent lead pellets. Given the international commitment to phasing out the use of lead shot pellets over wetland areas, and given the Assembly's duty to promote and enhance biological diversity, the statutory restrictions on the use of lead shot are appropriate. The statutory instrument has been drafted following significant

ymgyngoriad Prydain gyfan ar offeryn statudol drafft i wahardd defnyddio peledi plwm ar rai gwlyptiroedd arbennig. Cyflwynwyd offeryn statudol ar ôl hynny yn Lloegr yn unig. Yn dilyn datganoli rhaid i'r Cynulliad benderfynu ar yr ymagwedd fwyaf priodol i broblem llyncu peledi plwm yng Nghymru.

Dangosodd ymgyngoriad fod teimladau cryf ynglŷn â'r pwnc. Mae cyrff cadwraethol megis y Gymdeithas Frenhinol er Gwarchod Adar, yn annog gwaharddiad llwyr ar beledi plwm, tra bod Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru, wrth gynghori yn ei rôl ymgyngorol, yn dymuno gweld lleihad cyffredinol yn y lefel o beledi plwm a gynhyrchwyd gan ddydd sydd yn cyrraedd yr amgylchedd. Mae cyrff sy'n cynrychioli mudiadau saethu, ffermio a busnesau gwledig yn ystyried fod gwaharddiad llwyr yn ymateb dianghenraid a gormodol.

Yr wyf yn dymuno i ymateb y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol fod yn un cymesur. Rhoesom ystyriaeth drwyadl i hyn. Cynhaliodd swyddogion y Cynulliad gyfarfod gyda mudiadau sydd â diddordeb yng Ngorffennaf 2000, ac ymgwymerwyd ag ymgyngoriad pellach yng ngwanwyn 2001. Fe'm sicrhawyd gan y cyfraniadau a wnaethpwyd yn y cyfarfod, a'r ymatebion i'r ymgyngoriad, fod yr offeryn statudol sydd o'ch blaen heddiw yn rhesymol a chymesur yn ei amcanion cadwraeth a'i effaith ar fusnes a saethwyr unigol.

Mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn debyg i'r rhai sydd ar waith yn Lloegr, felly maent yn lleihau'r perygl o ran anghysonderau ac annealltwriaeth ar y gororau. Fodd bynnag, fe'u targedwyd yn well na'r rheoliadau sydd eisoes yn bod yn Lloegr. I gloi, er mai ychydig o dystiolaeth uniongyrchol sydd am nifer yr adar a laddwyd dwy lyncu peledi plwm yng Nghymru, nid oes amheuaeth fod plwm yn wenwynig i adar a bod adar dŵr mewn perygl o gael gwenwyn plwm drwy lyncu peledi plwm sydd wedi eu defnyddio. O gofio'r ymrwymiad rhyngwladol i ddileu'r defnydd o beledi plwm mewn ardaloedd gwlyptiroedd yn raddol, ac o gofio dyletswydd y Cynulliad i hyrwyddo a gwella amrywiaeth fiolegol, mae'r gwaharddiadau statudol ar y defnydd o beledi plwm yn

consultation with interested parties and has the support of the majority of affected bodies. It is the most sensible and proportionate response to the issue of lead poisoning of waterfowl by spent lead gun shot.

briodol. Drafftiwyd yr offeryn statudol yn dilyn ymgynghoriad sylweddol gyda mudiadau sydd â diddordeb ac mae'n derbyn cefnogaeth y mwyafrif o gyrff yr effeithir arnynt. Hwn yw'r ymateb mwyaf synhwyrol a chymesur i bwnc gwenwyn plwm mewn adar dŵr o ganlyniad i beledi saethu sydd wedi eu defnyddio.

10:55 a.m.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Mae hwn yn fater hynod o gymhleth gan ein bod mewn perygl o fod mewn sefyllfa lle y bydd yn anghyfreithlon i saethu hwyiaid â pheledi plwm tra y gellir saethu pob math o anifeiliaid eraill â pheledi plwm. Mae angen cysondeb o ran deddfwriaeth o'r fath. Hoffem wybod pa ymchwil yn union sydd wedi'i chyflawni yng Nghymru i hyn, oherwydd nad ydwyf yn ymwybodol o'r fath ymchwil. Fe wnaeth y Gweinidog nifer o ddatganiadau ynglŷn ag effeithiau saethu â pheledi plwm, ond ni chyfeiriodd at unrhyw ymchwil penodol sydd wedi'i gyflawni yng Nghymru.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: This is an unusually complex issue since we may find ourselves in the position whereby it will be illegal to shoot ducks with lead pellets while all manner of other animals may be shot with lead pellets. This type of legislation must be consistent. We would like to know exactly what research has been undertaken into this matter in Wales, because I am not aware of any such research. The Minister made a number of statements regarding the effects of shooting with lead shot, but she did not refer to any specific research that has been undertaken in Wales.

O ran cwestiwn penodol, hoffem wybod pwy yn union yw'r personau awdurdodedig hyn y mae'n cyfeirio atynt. A yw'r Gweinidog yn cyfeirio at yr heddlu ym mhwynt 22, neu a oes diffiniad ehangach i bersonau awdurdodedig?

In terms of a specific question, we would like to know exactly who are these authorised persons to which she refers. Is the Minister referring to the police in point 22, or is there a wider definition of authorised persons?

Glyn Davies: We are dealing yet again, as Rhodri Glyn Thomas said, with a complex issue. On the one hand is a traditional countryside practice of importance to the rural economy, and on the other hand are the interests of wildlife. Both issues are important to the Conservative Party and to me. If I was certain in my own mind that introducing this legislation was important for wildlife interests, I would be in favour of it. However, I do not believe—despite what the Minister told us—that that evidence is in place. I do not think that proper research has been undertaken. The toxicity of lead is clear and were wildfowl to eat lead on a significant scale, it would do them damage. However, when you are introducing legislation such as this, you must have proper evidence and proper research. This Bill is being introduced for a specific period of time. During this

Glyn Davies: Yr ydym yn delio unwaith eto, fel y dywedodd Rhodri Glyn Thomas, â phwnc cymhleth. Ar yr un llaw mae arfer traddodiadol gwledig o bwys i'r economi leol, ac ar y llaw arall mae buddiannau'r bywyd gwyllt. Mae'r ddeubeth yn bwysig i'r Blaid Geidwadol ac i minnau. Pe bawn i yn sicr yn fy meddwl fy hun y byddai cyflwyno'r ddeddfwriaeth hyn yn bwysig i fuddiannau bywyd gwyllt, byddwn o'i blaid. Fodd bynnag, ni chredaf—er gwaethaf yr hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog wrthym—fod y dystiolaeth yn bod. Nid wyf yn meddwl bod ymchwil cywir wedi cael ei gynnal. Mae natur docsig plwm yn amlwg a phe bai adar dŵr yn bwyta plwm ar raddfa sylweddol, byddai'n gwneud niwed iddynt. Fodd bynnag, pan fyddwch yn cyflwyno deddfwriaeth o'r fath, rhaid i chi gael tystiolaeth gywir ac ymchwil gywir. Mae'r

period, whatever it may be, I hope that the Minister will ask the Countryside Council for Wales to undertake real research to investigate whether there is any evidence that wildfowl are being poisoned and killed due to the presence of lead shot. If that were the case, I would feel comfortable in supporting these regulations. In the absence of such evidence, I am not.

Eleanor Burnham: While the Liberal Democrats welcome any regulations that will protect wild birds' welfare, we also have some concerns about the real research that has been undertaken. I understand that the effects of the new type of shot might be even worse for animal welfare as animals are not hit and killed directly. Given the extra costs, we would be grateful if the Minister could consider giving financial resources to community councils so that they can deliver services locally. For example, lead shot cartridges cost 11p each while their tungsten equivalents will cost 50p each. That is of concern.

I am pleased to see clause 28—called the 'sunset clause'—which will become a feature of the legislation so that, after five years, there will be a review. However, as I said, we welcome regulations that seek to protect wild birds' welfare.

Lorraine Barrett: The easiest thing to do in this matter would be to ban shooting altogether. I cannot imagine why anyone would want to shoot ducks and birds. However, given that that is not a reality, I would prefer to see a total ban on lead shot. At least this goes some way towards dealing with a dangerous situation.

The Minister for Environment (Sue Essex): Lead shot is lead shot whether it is in Wales or England. This regulation follows years of research into this issue. I have just spoken with Ron Davies, and he told me of research undertaken way back by both government and shooting organisations. That

Mesur hwn yn cael ei gyflwyno am gyfnod penodol o amser. Yn ystod y cyfnod hwn, pa mor hir bynnag y bo, gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn gofyn i Gyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru i ymgymryd ag ymchwil i ymchwilio a oes yna dystiolaeth bod adar gwyllt yn cael eu gwenwyno a'u lladd oherwydd presenoldeb peledi plwm. Pe bai hynny'n cael ei brofi byddwn yn teimlo'n dawel fy meddwl i gefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn. Yn absenoldeb tystiolaeth o'r fath, nid wyf yn gefnogol.

Eleanor Burnham: Tra bod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn croesawu unrhyw reoliadau a fydd yn amddiffyn lles adar gwyllt, y mae gennym rai pryderon ynghylch yr ymchwil real a gynhaliwyd. Deallaf y gallai effaith y math newydd o beledi fod hyd yn oed yn waeth i les anifeiliaid gan nad yw anifeiliaid yn cael eu taro a'u lladd yn uniongyrchol. O gofio'r costau ychwanegol, byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe bai'r Gweinidog yn barod i ystyried rhoi adnoddau ariannol i gynghorau cymuned fel eu bod yn gallu cyflwyno gwasanaethau'n lleol. Er enghraifft, mae cetrys peledi plwm yn costio 11c yr un tra bod y rhai tungsten cyfatebol yn costio 50c yr un. Mae hynny'n bryder.

Y mae'n dda gennyf weld cymal 28—a elwir yn 'gymal y machlud'—a fydd yn dod yn nodwedd o'r ddeddfwriaeth fel y bydd adolygiad yn cael ei gynnal, ar ôl pum mlynedd. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais, croesawn reoliadau sy'n ymgymryd at warchod lles adar gwyllt.

Lorraine Barrett: Y peth hawsaf i'w wneud yn y mater hwn fyddai gwahardd saethu'n gyfangwbl. Ni allaf ddychmygu pam y dylai unrhyw un fod yn awyddus i saethu hwyaid ac adar. Fodd bynnag, o gofio nad yw hyn yn realiti, byddai'n well gennyf weld gwaharddiad llwyr ar beledi plwm. O leiaf mae hyn yn mynd beth o'r ffordd tuag at ddelio â sefyllfa beryglus.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd (Sue Essex): Peledi plwm yw peledi plwm pa un a ydynt yng Nghymru neu Loegr. Mae'r rheoliad hwn yn dilyn blynyddoedd o ymchwil i'r pwnc hwn. Yr wyf newydd siarad â Ron Davies, ac mi ddywedodd wrthyf am ymchwil a wnaed ym mhell yn y

is why we have the international obligation. This has not just appeared out of the blue. We have taken a considerable amount of time over this, working with different organisations. There has been a long and proper consultation process over this and we consider these regulations to be a proportionate response. This will be a situation whereby however much you try, there will not be agreement. People have conflicting views. However, I think that everyone would agree—from whatever side they come—that we have tried hard to develop a solution that is considered and proportionate to the situation. We will continue to review this over the next few years, Glyn. The CCW and others will continue to look at how these regulations work. I accept Lorraine's point, but the most concern is for those birds that occupy the wetland areas. This is a good starting point and I hope that you will support it.

gorffennol gan y llywodraeth yn ogystal â'r cyrff saethu. Dyna pahan y mae gennym y rhwymedigaeth ryngwladol. Nid ymddangosodd hwnnw o'r awyr. Treuliasom dipyn o amser gyda hwn gan weithio gyda chyrff gwahanol. Cafwyd proses ymgynhori hir a chywir ynglŷn â hyn ac ystyriwn fod y rheoliadau hyn yn ymateb cymesur. Mae hon yn sefyllfa, pa mor galed bynnag yr ymdrechwn, a fydd yn amhosibl cael cytundeb yn ei chylch. Fodd bynnag, credaf fod pawb yn cytuno—o ba ochr bynnag y dowch—ein bod wedi ymdrechu'n galed i ddatblygu ateb sydd yn ystyrllon a chymesur â'r sefyllfa. Byddwn yn parhau i adolygu hyn, Glyn, dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf. Bydd Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru ac eraill yn parhau i edrych ar y ffordd y mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn gweithio. Derbyniaf bwynt Lorraine, ond mae'r pryder mwyaf dros yr adar sy'n byw yn ardaloedd y gwlyptir. Mae hyn yn ddechrau da a gobeithiaf y gwnewch ei gefnogi.

Y Llywydd: Galwaf am bleidlais ar egwyddor y Gorchymyn.

The Presiding Officer: I call for a vote on the principle of the Order.

Cynnig: O blaid 36, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.

Motion: For 36, Abstain 0, Against 5.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, Val
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Graham, William
Morgan, Jonathan
Richards, Rod

Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Y Llywydd: Galwaf am bleidlais ar **The Presiding Officer:** I call for a vote on
gymeradwyo'r Gorchymyn. the approval of the Order.

*Cynnig: O blaid 34, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 6.
Motion: For 34, Abstain 0, Against 6.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Gareth
Lloyd, Val
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Middlehurst, Tom
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Graham, William
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Richards, Rod

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 11.01 a.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 11.01 a.m.*

Y Strategaeth Datblygu Economaidd Genedlaethol The National Economic Development Strategy

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1, 3, 4, 5 and 7 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, and amendments 6, 8, 9, 10 and 11 in the name of Jonathan Morgan. I have decided not to select amendment 2, which appears on today's agenda.

Many Members have expressed a desire to speak and only under exceptional circumstances do I limit speakers to three minutes, therefore I do not propose to do so this morning. Speakers will have five minutes, but I warn them that I will be using the red button as soon as the five minutes are up.

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): I propose that

the National Assembly:

1. *approves the national economic development strategy published as 'A Winning Wales';*
2. *notes the intention of the Welsh Assembly Government to implement the strategy in conjunction with its partners;*
3. *agrees to review the strategy at regular intervals;*
4. *notes the intention of the Welsh Assembly Government to publish the progress made with the strategy. (NDM903)*

I will try to be brief, but this debate is important because we, as the Welsh Assembly Government, are presenting our national economic development strategy, 'A Winning Wales', to the Assembly to seek its approval. The strategy was developed in the light of the recent successful consultation exercise in which around 40 responses were received. The February draft of the strategy was discussed with our stakeholders in the task and finish group and the business partnership council.

This strategy attempts to raise the skills of the

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 3, 4, 5 a 7 yn enw Jocelyn Davies a gwelliannau 6, 8, 9, 10 ac 11 yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Yr wyf wedi penderfynu beidio â dethol gwelliant 2, sy'n ymddangos ar agenda heddiw.

Mae sawl Aelod wedi mynegi dymuniad i siarad a dim ond o dan amgylchiadau eithriadol y cyfyngaf siaradwyr i dair munud, felly ni fwriadaf wneud hynny y bore yma. Bydd gan y siaradwyr bum munud, ond fe'u rhybuddiaf y byddaf yn defnyddio'r botwm coch cyn gynted ag y daw'r pum munud i ben.

Prif Weinidog Cymru (Rhodri Morgan): Cynigiau fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol

1. *yn cymeradwyo'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol a gyhoeddwyd dan y teitl 'Cymru ar ei Hennill';*
2. *yn nodi bwriad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i weithredu'r strategaeth ar y cyd â'i phartneriaid;*
3. *yn cytuno i adolygu'r strategaeth yn rheolaidd;*
4. *yn nodi bwriad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gyhoeddi manylion ynghylch hynnt y strategaeth. (NDM903)*

Ceisias fod yn fyr, ond mae'r ddadl hon yn bwysig gan ein bod, fel Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, yn cyflwyno ein strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol, 'Cymru ar ei Hennill', i'r Cynulliad i geisio ei gymeradwyaeth. Datblygwyd y strategaeth yng ngoleuni'r ymarfer ymgynghori llwyddiannus diweddar lle y cafwyd tua 40 o ymatebion. Trafodwyd drafft mis Chwefror o'r strategaeth gyda'n rhanddeiliaid yn y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen a'r cyngor partneriaeth busnes.

Ymdrecha'r strategaeth hon i wella sgiliau

people of Wales to fill top-notch jobs while, at the same time, creating top-notch jobs to match those raised skills. It may not seem to be rocket science, but it is rarely attempted. Only the Irish Republic has attempted and succeeded to do so during the past decade, which provided inspiration for the strategy before us today. Implementation of the strategy requires the same national unity of purpose that Ireland achieved in the 1980s and early 1990s. It came almost out of the despair of the high-debt crisis and the basket-case national public finances when the phrase 'we are going to hell in a handcart together' was commonly heard in the pubs of Dublin, Cork and Limerick. We also want to make full use of Objective 1 funding and the additional above-Barnett formula funding that we received last July.

'A Winning Wales' is a 10-year strategy for the transformation of the Welsh economy, which means that Wales has to re-invent itself economically for the second time in 25 years. Twenty-five years ago, the coal mining industry virtually disappeared over a brief period of 10 years as a major provider of employment—as did the steel industry, although steel did not disappear in terms of production. We had to provide assembly-line jobs urgently, which 25 years later are migrating out of Wales to low-wage areas in eastern Europe that are on the launch-pad for full entry into the European Union over the next three or four years.

Therefore, we have to develop the Welsh economy into a knowledge-based economy. To facilitate our economic growth, we need to use the four main drivers identified by the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development as the key ways of shifting the economy from its current position to another plain of higher growth. Those four main drivers are innovation, enterprise and entrepreneurship, people and their skills, and information and communications technology. Despite the rather interesting phenomenon of the last two months, when unemployment has gently drifted downwards in Wales while rising in England, we know that there is a great deal that is wrong with the Welsh economy. It has many weaknesses: we suffer

pobl Cymru i lenwi swyddi penigamp tra'n creu swyddi penigamp yr un pryd i gyfateb â'r sgiliau gwell hynny. Efallai nad yw'n gymhleth, ond anaml y rhoddir cynnig arni. Dim ond Gweriniaeth Iwerddon sydd wedi ymdrechu a llwyddo i wneud hynny yn y degawd diwethaf, a ddarparodd yr ysbrydoliaeth ar gyfer y strategaeth ger ein bron heddiw. Mae gweithredu'r strategaeth yn galw am yr un undod pwrpas cenedlaethol a gyflawnodd Iwerddon yn yr 1980au a dechrau'r 1990au. Deilliodd o anobaith yr argyfwng dyledion uchel a'r arian cyhoeddus cenedlaethol cwbl ddiffygiol pan glywyd yr ymadrodd '*we are going to hell in a handcart together*' yn gyson yn nhafarndai Dulyn, Cork a Limerick. Yr ydym hefyd am ddefnyddio arian Amcan 1 i'r eithaf a'r arian ychwanegol yn uwch na fformiwla Barnett a gawsom fis Gorffennaf diwethaf.

Mae 'Cymru ar ei Hennill' yn strategaeth 10 mlynedd i drawsffurfio economi Cymru, sy'n golygu bod yn rhaid i Gymru ailddyfeisio ei hun yn economaidd am yr ail dro mewn 25 mlynedd. Bum mlynedd ar hugain yn ôl, diflannodd y diwydiant glo bron yn gyfan gwbl dros gyfnod byr o 10 mlynedd fel prif ddarparwr cyflogaeth—fel y gwnaeth y diwydiant dur, er na ddiflannodd dur o ran cynhyrchiant. Bu'n rhaid inni ddarparu swyddi llinell gydosod ar frys, sydd 25 mlynedd yn ddiweddarach yn symud o Gymru i ardaloedd cyflogau isel yn nwyrain Ewrop a fydd yn cael eu derbyn yn llawn i'r Undeb Ewropeaidd dros y tair i'r pedair blynedd nesaf.

Felly, rhaid inni ddatblygu economi Cymru yn economi wedi'i seilio ar wybodaeth. Er mwyn hwyluso ein twf economaidd, mae angen inni ddefnyddio'r pedair prif elfen a nodwyd gan y Gymdeithas Cydweithrediad a Datblygiad Economaidd fel y ffyrdd allweddol o symud yr economi o'i sefyllfa bresennol i lefel arall o dwf uwch. Y pedwar prif hyrwyddwr hyn yw arloesedd, menter a mentergarwch, pobl a'u sgiliau, a thechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu. Er gwaethaf ffenomenon diddorol braidd y ddau fis diwethaf, pan fu gostyngiad graddol mewn diweithdra yng Nghymru ond cynnydd yn Lloegr, gwyddom fod llawer iawn o'i le ar economi Cymru. Mae ganddo lawer o wendidau: dioddefwn o syndrom ffatrioedd

from branch factory syndrome; a smaller number of businesses per head of population than the British average; a lack of company headquarters, and research and development functions in Wales; and a low participation rate in the economy—some 5 per cent fewer in the working age group participate in the economy. We must put those aspects right.

11:05 a.m.

'A Winning Wales' sets out to do that with clear objectives, specific targets and an action plan for the Assembly Government and its stakeholders, such as partners in local government, the business community and the trade unions. It is fully costed, including the baselines, which contribute either directly or indirectly to economic development through the economic development budget; a large part of the education and lifelong learning budget—not including schools; it also includes a large part of the agriculture budget—but not the direct payments to farmers—and large parts of the transport budget. That is how we define the box in which economic development functions in the Assembly and that gives us this figure of £15 billion over the 10-year period.

The strategy, therefore, is a combination of improvements to existing programmes and new initiatives when they are appropriate. The actions set out will be regularly reviewed and updated to keep the document fresh. This is not a Soviet style five-year plan, which says specifically what the production in steel or electricity will be in five-years' time. It is a strategy about spending public money in a smarter way to achieve the objective of transforming Welsh economic performance to roughly 40 to 50 per cent of the kind of levels that Ireland has since its sudden leap forward, when it had the benefit of Objective 1 money. Ireland, of course, received more money than Wales: it received money for the whole country rather than for two-thirds from which Wales is now benefiting.

While the economy of Wales has many positive features and significant opportunities

cangen; nifer llai o fusnesau fesul pen y boblogaeth na'r cyfartaledd Prydeinig; prinder pencadlysoedd cwmnïau, a swyddogaethau ymchwil a datblygu yng Nghymru; a chyfradd gyfranogi isel yn yr economi—mae tua 5 y cant yn llai yn y grŵp oed gweithio yn cyfranogi yn yr economi. Rhaid inni unioni'r agweddau hynny.

Bwriad 'Cymru ar ei Hennill' yw gwneud hynny gydag amcanion clir, targedau penodol a chynllun gweithredu ar gyfer Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'i rhanddeiliaid, megisartneriaid mewn llywodraeth leol, y gymuned fusnes a'r undebau llafur. Mae wedi ei chostio'n llawn, gan gynnwys y gwaelodlinau, sy'n cyfrannu naill ai'n uniongyrchol neu'n anuniongyrchol at ddatblygu economaidd drwy'r gyllideb datblygu economaidd; rhan fawr o'r gyllideb addysg a dysgu gydol oes—ac eithrio ysoglion; mae hefyd yn cynnwys rhan fawr o'r gyllideb amaethyddiaeth—ond nid y taliadau uniongyrchol i ffermwyr—a rhannau mawr o'r gyllideb trafniadaeth. Dyna sut y diffiniwn y blwch lle mae datblygu economaidd yn gweithredu yn y Cynulliad a rhydd hynny ffigur inni o £15 biliwn dros gyfnod o 10 mlynedd.

Mae'r strategaeth felly, yn gyfuniad o welliannau i raglenni presennol a mentrau newydd pan eu bod yn briodol. Caiff y gweithrediadau a nodir eu hadolygu'n rheolaidd a'u diweddaru i sicrhau bod y ddogfen yn gyfredol. Nid cynllun pum mlynedd Sofietaidd ei ffurf ydyw, sy'n nodi'n benodol beth fydd y cynhyrchiant mewn dur neu drydan ymhen pum mlynedd. Mae'n strategaeth sydd a wnelo â gwario arian cyhoeddus mewn ffordd fwy craff i gyflawni'r amcan o drawsffurfio perfformiad economaidd Cymru i tua 40 i 50 y cant o'r math o lefelau sydd gan Iwerddon ers iddi gymryd cam sydyn ymlaen, pan oedd yn elwa ar arian Amcan 1. Wrth gwrs, cafodd Iwerddon fwy o arian na Chymru: cafodd arian ar gyfer y wlad gyfan yn hytrach nag ar gyfer dwy ran o dair y mae Cymru yn awr ar elwa arno.

Er bod gan economi Cymru sawl nodwedd bwysig a chyfleoedd arwyddocaol i

for development, there is no question that this is a big job. We know, for instance that, regarding the low participation rate in the economy, women tend to participate less in Wales than in other countries. Therefore, we must put that right and remove any inhibitions on women participating in the workforce—most obviously to provide better childcare. We also know that men over 50, especially in the south Wales valleys, tend to participate at a low level in the economy. It may be a one-off consequence of the decline of the coal mining industry. We do not yet know, but it shows up clearly in the figures, and we must do something about it. We also know that we have the wrong industrial and occupational structure to give us high-value added jobs, and we must put that right. We have the lowest proportion of people in professional, administrative, technical and scientific occupations of any part of the UK. We must put that right.

There have been some wonderful signs over the past year, such as Unilever deciding to locate a large part of its European headquarters in Ewloe. However, we need more company headquarters, and research and development headquarters, to relocate to Wales, or we need to grow more of our own businesses—in which case, the company headquarters and research and development functions would automatically be in Wales—to put right that abnormality about the Welsh economy.

Geraint Davies: You mentioned the Valleys. No doubt you are aware that there are many indigenous multi-media businesses in the Rhondda and surrounding Valleys, including the recently named top 100 entrepreneurs in Wales, who were severely hampered by the lack of broadband facilities in the Valleys and are actively considering relocating elsewhere. What will you do about that?

The First Minister: Part of the strategy is to improve broadband provision throughout Wales. You will be aware, Geraint, from British Telecom's comments earlier this week, that it claims that there is a problem of take-up as well as supply. We must put that

ddatblygu, mae hon, yn ddiaw, yn dasg enfawr. Gwyddom, er enghraifft, o ran y gyfradd gyfranogi isel yn yr economi, bod merched yn tueddu i gyfranogi llai yng Nghymru nag mewn gwledydd eraill. Felly, rhaid inni unioni hynny a dileu unrhyw waharddiadau ar ferched yn cyfranogi yn y gweithlu—yn fwyaf amlwg er mwyn darparu gwell gofal plant. Gwyddom hefyd fod dynion dros 50 oed, yn enwedig yng nghymoedd y de, yn tueddu i gymryd rhan ar lefel isel yn yr economi. Efallai mai canlyniad uniongyrchol y dirywiad yn y diwydiant glo yw hyn. Ni wyddom eto ond dengys yn glir yn y ffigurau, a rhaid inni wneud rhywbeth yn ei gylch. Gwyddom hefyd fod y strwythur diwydiannol a galwedigaethol anghywir gennym i roi swyddi gwerth ychwanegol uchel inni, a rhaid unioni hynny. Mae'r gyfran isaf o bobl mewn galwedigaethau proffesiynol, gweinyddol, technegol a gwyddonol gennym o unrhyw ran o'r DU. Rhaid inni unioni hynny.

Bu rhai arwyddion gwyach dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, fel Unilever yn penderfynu lleoli rhan fawr o'i bencadlys Ewropeaidd yn Ewlo. Fodd bynnag, mae angen i fwy o bencadlysoedd cwmnïau, a phencadlysoedd ymchwil a datblygu, adleoli i Gymru, neu mae angen inni gynhyrchu mwy o'n busnesau ein hunain—os felly, byddai swyddogaethau'r pencadlysoedd cwmnïau a'r swyddogaethau ymchwil a datblygu yn awtomatig yng Nghymru—i unioni'r annormaledd ynglŷn ag economi Cymru.

Geraint Davies: Gwnaethoch sôn am y Cymoedd. Yn ddiaw, yr ydych yn ymwybodol bod llawer o fusnesau amlygfrwng cynhenid yn y Rhondda a'r Cymoedd o'i hamgylch, gan gynnwys y 100 entrepreneur uchaf yng Nghymru a enwyd yn ddiweddar, a gafodd eu rhwystro'n ddifrifol gan y prinder cyfleusterau band llydan yn y Cymoedd ac sy'n ystyried adleoli i rywle arall. Beth a wnewch chi ynglŷn â hyn?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Rhan o'r strategaeth yw gwella darpariaeth band llydan ledled Cymru. Fe fyddwch yn ymwybodol, Geraint, o sylwadau British Telecom yn gynharach yr wythnos hon, ei fod yn honni bod problem gyda'r gyfradd dderbyn yn ogystal â

right to marry the supply to the demand. It is not as simple as saying that there should be more broadband provision, it is how it is packaged, and its accessibility: how close to the exchange one must be to be able to access it. It is also about competition and price. It is not as simple as saying that there is not enough broadband provision. However, we accept—and I mentioned earlier that that was one of the four specified drivers in the OECD list—that it is part of our job to make Wales the best business environment in the world. You cannot do that if you do not have almost universal broadband provision. However, you must also sell it hard to people to make them take it up.

In setting a fresh direction for Wales, we also want to promote Wales as a green business location, encouraging businesses to adopt environmental best practice and taking advantage of green business opportunities. I am pleased that Forum for the Future has given 'A Winning Wales' a warm endorsement on the sustainability front.

We also want to establish a greater profile for Wales in the world by attracting high-value, sustainable investment to Wales, assisting Welsh businesses to find new markets, adopting a more focused tourism strategy and attracting far more foreign students to study in Welsh universities. That can have a beneficial effect in creating a warmth towards Wales when they are in key positions back in their home countries 10, 20 or 30 years later.

I will deal with the amendments when I reply. However, in closing my initial remarks, we believe that 'A Winning Wales' will provide the framework for driving the Welsh economy into the twenty-first century by improving the transport infrastructure in Wales and developing a sustainable, integrated transport network; creating strong communities by encouraging community regeneration from the bottom up; developing the social economy, encouraging participation and the rollout of regional

chyflenwi. Rhaid inni unioni hynny er mwyn cyfuno'r cyflenwad i'r galw. Nid yw mor syml â dweud y dylai fod mwy o ddarpariaeth band llydan, yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw'r modd y caiff ei becynnu, a'i hygyrchedd: pa mor agos at y gyfnewidfa y mae'n rhaid i rywun fod i allu manteisio arno. Mae a wnelo hefyd â chystadleuaeth a phris. Nid yw mor syml â dweud nad oes digon o ddarpariaeth band llydan. Fodd bynnag, derbyniwn—a soniais yn gynharach mai dyna oedd un o'r pedair elfen benodol yn rhestr y Gymdeithas Cydweithrediad a Datblygiad Economaidd—ei fod yn rhan o'n gwaith i greu'r amgylchedd busnes gorau yn y byd yng Nghymru. Ni allwch wneud hynny os nad oes gennych ddarpariaeth band llydan gyffredinol. Fodd bynnag, rhaid ichi hefyd ymdrechu'n galed i'w werthu er mwyn i bobl ei ddefnyddio.

Wrth osod cyfeiriad newydd i Gymru, yr ydym hefyd am hyrwyddo Cymru fel lleoliad busnes gwyrdd, gan annog busnesau i fabwysiadu arfer gorau amgylcheddol a manteisio ar gyfleoedd busnes gwyrdd. Yr wyf yn falch bod Fforwm i'r Dyfodol wedi rhoi cymeradwyaeth gynnes i 'Cymru ar ei Hennill' o ran cynaliadwyedd.

Yr ydym hefyd am sefydlu proffil uwch i Gymru yn y byd drwy ddenu buddsoddiad gwerth uchel, cynaliadwy i Gymru, helpu busnesau Cymru i ddod o hyd i farchnadoedd newydd, mabwysiadu strategaeth twristiaeth fwy penodol a denu mwy o fyfyrwyr dramor i astudio mewn prifysgolion yng Nghymru. Gall hynny fod yn fuddiol drwy greu ymdeimlad o gynhesrwydd tuag at Gymru pan fyddant mewn swyddi allweddol yn eu gwledydd eu hunain 10, 20 neu 30 mlynedd yn ddiweddarach.

Byddaf yn delio â'r gwelliannau pan fyddaf yn ymateb. Fodd bynnag, wrth ddod â'm sylwadau cychwynnol i ben, credwn y bydd 'Cymru ar ei Hennill' yn darparu'r fframwaith ar gyfer datblygu economi Cymru yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain drwy wella'r seilwaith trafnidiaeth yng Nghymru a datblygu rhwydwaith trafnidiaeth integredig, cynaliadwy; creu cymunedau cryf drwy annog adfywio cymunedol o'r gwaelod i fyny; datblygu'r economi gymdeithasol, annog cyfranogiad a chyflwyno strategaethau

regeneration strategies; and supporting rural Wales by developing income and employment opportunities for young people, implementing our strategy for the future of Welsh farming, and searching for specific niche markets for Welsh farming.

I realise that it is ambitious. Many things must go right for us to be able to achieve that target of 90 per cent of UK average GDP per capita, and the 135,000 rise in total jobs in Wales, of which 20,000 would be additional jobs in finance and business services. The Government's job is to ensure that what must go right, does go right. We are committed to implementing it, in conjunction with our stakeholders and partners. We are confident of success if we can generate that sense of national unity. That is why I move the motion with pleasure and pride this morning.

Phil Williams: I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

Amendment 1: in point 1, replace 'approves' with 'notes'.

I propose amendment 3. Add at the end of point 1:

but contrasts:

i. the aim of spreading prosperity more evenly with the refusal to set regional targets;

ii. the aim of developing a knowledge-based economy with the low priority given to higher education in the budget so that the shortfall of spending per student in comparison to England and Scotland is increasing;

iii. the aim of providing world-class electronic communications with a small budget allocated to broadband infrastructure;

iv. the aim of encouraging clean energy development with the practice that has blocked most major wind and bio fuel projects in Wales over the past two years;

adfywio rhanbarthol; a chefnogi Cymru wledig drwy ddatblygu cyfleoedd ar gyfer incwm a chyflogaeth i bobl ifanc, gweithredu ein strategaeth ar gyfer dyfodol y diwydiant ffermio yng Nghymru, a chwilio am farchnadoedd arbenigol penodol ar gyfer diwydiant ffermio Cymru.

Sylweddolaf fod hynny'n uchelgeisiol. Rhaid i sawl peth fynd o'n plaid er mwyn inni allu cyflawni'r targed hwnnw o 90 y cant o CMC cyfartalog y pen y DU, a'r cynnydd o 135,000 yn nifer y swyddi yng Nghymru, y byddai 20,000 ohonynt yn swyddi ychwanegol mewn gwasanaethau cyllid a busnes. Gwaith y Llywodraeth yw sicrhau bod yr hyn sy'n gorfod mynd yn iawn, yn mynd yn iawn mewn gwirionedd. Yr ydym yn ymrwymedig i'w weithredu, mewn cydweithrediad â'n rhanddeiliaid a'n partneriaid. Yr ydym yn hyderus y gwnawn lwyddo os gallwn gynhyrchu'r ymdeimlad o undod cenedlaethol. Dyna pam y cynigiau y cynnig gyda phleser a balchder y bore yma.

Phil Williams: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

Gwelliant 1: ym mhwynt 1, rhoi 'nodi' yn lle 'cymeradwyo'.

Cynigiau welliant 3. Ychwanegu ar ddiwedd pwynt 1:

ond yn cyferbynnu:

i. y nod o ledaenu ffyniant yn decach gyda'r penderfyniad i wrthod gosod targedau rhanbarthol;

ii. y nod o ddatblygu economi yn seiliedig ar wybodaeth gyda'r flaenoriaeth isel a roddwyd i addysg uwch yn y gyllideb fel bod y diffyg o ran gwariant fesul myfyriwr, o'i gymharu â Lloegr a'r Alban, yn cynyddu;

iii. y nod o ddarparu system gyfathrebu electronig gyda'r gorau yn y byd gyda'r gyllideb fach a ddyrannwyd i'r seilwaith band llydan;

iv. y nod o annog datblygu ynni glân gyda'r arfer sydd wedi rhwystro'r rhan fwyaf o brosiectau gwynt a bio-danwydd mawr yng Nghymru yn ystod y ddwy flynedd diwethaf;

v. the aim of maximising state aid derogations with the failure to obtain effective operating aids for industry in the Objective 1 regions of Wales.

I propose amendment 4. In points 2 and 4 replace 'Welsh Assembly Government' with 'Government of Wales'.

I propose amendment 5. Add at the end of point 2:

but regrets the failure of the Government to implement the recommendations of the Economic Development Committee to establish an economic policy board.

I propose amendment 7. Add at the end of point 3:

and hopes that an improved version of the strategy will be completed in time for the mid-term evaluation of the Objective 1 programme.

Tri chynnig i Gymro.

This is the third economic strategy that the Assembly Government has published. Let us start with the good news: it is an improvement on the other two—it could hardly be worse—and it avoids the silly mistakes of the February version. That document should never have been issued in its raw, uncorrected version. We welcome the aspirations in this new document: the commitment to bringing prosperity to the whole population; raise employment to the UK average; build a knowledge-based economy; provide world-class electronic communications; promote renewable energy; diversify the rural economy, and provide:

'the best business environment in the world.'

Wonderful—I agree with every word, almost all of which was in my manifesto in 1999.

Unfortunately, there are deep contradictions between aspiration and policy. First, you cannot have prosperity in all parts of Wales without a regional strategy. An analysis of

v. y nod o ddefnyddio i'r eithaf y rhanddirymiaidau cymorth gwladol gyda'r methiant i gael cymorth gweithredol effeithiol ar gyfer diwydiant yn rhanbarth Amcan 1 Cymru.

Cynigiau welliant 4. Ym mhwyntiau 2 a 4 rhoi 'Llywodraeth Cymru' yn lle 'Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'.

Cynigiau welliant 5. Ychwanegu ar ddiwedd pwynt 2:

ond yn gresynu at fethiant y Llywodraeth i weithredu argymhellion y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd i sefydlu bwrdd polisi economaidd.

Cynigiau welliant 7. Ychwanegu ar ddiwedd pwynt 3:

ac yn gobeithio y bydd fersiwn well o'r strategaeth yn cael ei chwblhau erbyn gwerthusiad canol-tymor rhaglen Amcan 1.

Three tries for a Welshman.

Dyma'r drydedd strategaeth economaidd y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ei chyhoeddi. Gadewch inni ddechrau gyda'r newyddion da: mae'n welliant ar y ddwy arall—prin y gallai fod yn waeth—ac mae'n osgoi'r camgymeriadau gwirion a oedd yn fersiwn mis Chwefror. Ni ddylai'r ddogfen honno fod wedi cael ei chyhoeddi ar ei ffurf grai, heb ei chywiro. Croesawn y dyheadau yn y ddogfen newydd hon: yr ymrwymiad i ddod â ffyniant i'r boblogaeth gyfan; codi cyflogaeth i gyfartaledd y DU; adeiladu economi ar sail gwybodaeth; darparu cysylltiadau electronig o'r radd flaenaf; hyrwyddo ynni adnewyddadwy; arallgyfeirio'r economi wledig, a darparu:

'yr amgylchedd busnes gorau yn y byd.'

Gwych—cytunaf â phob gair, ac yr oedd y cyfan bron yn fy manifesto yn 1999.

Yn anffodus, mae gwrthddywediadau dwfn rhwng dyhead a pholisi. Yn gyntaf, ni allwch gael ffyniant ym mhob rhan o Gymru heb strategaeth ranbarthol. Mae dadansoddiad o

the different needs and assets of the distinct economic regions is an essential part of a real strategy, but in 'A Winning Wales' this regional dimension is ignored. There is nothing in this for Gwynedd, Ynys Môn, Pembrokeshire, Carmarthenshire, Swansea bay, and—above all—nothing for the Valleys.

The Government replies that you cannot force industry to move to remote parts of Wales. That is obvious. However, neither can you force industry to come to Wales in the first place. If you accept the Government's argument, there would be no point in setting a target for Wales as a whole. Our strategy must be based on creating the appropriate combination of education and infrastructure to persuade companies that Wales is an ideal place for investment. If you can do that for Wales as a whole, you can do it for each of the regions. After two and a half years, has the Government still not done its homework on regional strategy, or has it no serious commitment to bring prosperity to the Valleys and the west? Does it reject regional targets because it has no intention of targeting the necessary extra resources to meet those targets?

11:15 a.m.

Mention of resources leads me to the second deep contradiction between this document and reality—reality being the budget adopted a few weeks ago. The £15 billion which has been referred to does not include any significant extra money to change the position we have been in for the past few years. It includes the Objective 1 and the existing forward-look budgets. However, what is the point of talking about the crucial role of education, especially higher education, if we have an education budget that starts with less money per head than England and Scotland, and then proposes a rate of increase well below the rest of the UK and yet delivers a faster rate of growth? Why fantasise about 'world-class electronic communications' and then allocate what is clearly an inadequate total sum for broadband infrastructure, which will not deliver broadband to the population of Wales in the next few years? The same applies to public

anghenion ac asedion gwahanol y rhanbarthau economaidd penodol yn rhan hanfodol o strategaeth wirioneddol, ond yn 'Cymru ar ei Hennill' anwybyddir y dimensiwn rhanbarthol hwn. Nid oes dim yn hyn ar gyfer Gwynedd, Ynys Môn, Sir Benfro, Sir Gaerfyrddin, bae Abertawe, ac—yn anad dim—dim ar gyfer y Cymoedd.

Ateb y Llywodraeth yw na allwch orfodi diwydiant i symud i rannau pellennig o Gymru. Mae hynny'n amlwg. Fodd bynnag, ni allwch ychwaith orfodi diwydiant i ddod i Gymru yn y lle cyntaf. Os derbyniwch ddadl y Llywodraeth, ni fyddai diben gosod targed i Gymru gyfan. Rhaid seilio ein strategaeth ar greu'r cyfuniad priodol o addysg a seilwaith i berswadio cwmnïau bod Cymru yn lle delfrydol ar gyfer buddsoddi. Os gallwch wneud hynny ar gyfer Cymru gyfan, gallwch ei wneud ar gyfer pob rhanbarth. Ar ôl dwy flynedd a hanner, a yw'r Llywodraeth yn dal heb fod wedi gwneud ei gwaith cartref ar strategaeth ranbarthol, neu efallai nad oes ganddi unrhyw ymrwymiad difrifol i ddod â ffyniant i'r Cymoedd ac i'r gorllewin? A yw'n gwrthod targedau rhanbarthol gan nad yw'n fwriad ganddi i dargedu'r adnoddau ychwanegol angenrheidiol i gyrraedd y targedau hynny?

Mae sôn am adnoddau yn fy arwain at yr ail wrthddywediad dwfn rhwng y ddogfen hon a realiti—realiti yw'r gyllideb a fabwysiadwyd ychydig wythnosau yn ôl. Nid yw'r £15 biliwn y cyfeiriwyd ato yn cynnwys unrhyw arian ychwanegol sylweddol i newid y sefyllfa y buom ynnddi ers yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf. Mae'n cynnwys cyllideb Amcan 1 a'r cyllidebau blaengynllunio presennol. Fodd bynnag, beth yw diben sôn am rôl holl bwysig addysg, yn enwedig addysg uwch, os oes gennym gyllideb addysg sy'n dechrau gyda llai o arian y pen na Lloegr a'r Alban, ac yna'n cynnig cyfradd cynyddu ymhell islaw gweddill y DU ac eto'n cyflawni cyfradd twf gyflymach? Pam breuddwydio am 'gysylltiadau electronig o'r radd flaenaf' ac yna dyrannu'r hyn sydd yn amlwg yn swm annigonol ar gyfer seilwaith band llydan, na fydd yn cyflwyno band llydan i boblogaeth Cymru yn yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf?

transport.

There is also a contradiction—which I hope will be resolved soon—between the welcome commitment to renewable energy and the fact that most proposals for renewable energy projects in Wales have been blocked by this Government. It is ironic that the one project that has won approval is the one that the Assembly Government could not block.

Some of these contradictions could have been properly resolved in Committee, but the Economic Development Committee has not been involved in preparing the final version of the strategy. That is punishment for members from all parties for being absolutely right in our judgment on the February draft. The final contradiction is between the rhetoric of partnership and the Assembly Government's determination to press ahead without involving its partners. Real partnership was the secret of Ireland's social partnership, which produced its development plan. If we are copying Ireland, I cannot understand why the economic policy board has been rejected. This is, therefore, 100 per cent Labour strategy, and it bears the hallmark of this Government, namely a contradiction between aspiration and reality. By international standards, in comparison with the Irish development plan, even by the standards of this Government, it is a shoddy piece of work.

Brian Gibbons *rose*—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You have run out of time, Phil, therefore you cannot take an intervention.

Alun Cairns: I propose the following amendments in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Amendment 6: at the end of point 2 add:

but regrets that actions contained in the document do not link specifically to the targets and outcomes.

I propose amendment 8. At the end of point 3 add:

Mae'r un peth yn wir am drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus.

Mae gwrthddywediad hefyd—a gaiff ei ddatrys yn fuan gobeithio—rhwng yr ymrwymiad clodwiw i ynni adnewyddadwy a'r ffaith bod y rhan fwyaf o gynigion ar gyfer prosiectau ynni adnewyddadwy yng Nghymru wedi eu rhwystro gan y Llywodraeth hon. Mae'n eironig mai'r un prosiect a enillodd gymeradwyaeth yw'r un na allai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ei rwystro.

Gellid bod wedi datrys rhai o'r gwrthddywediadau hyn yn y Pwyllgor, ond ni fu'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn ymwneud â pharatoi fersiwn terfynol y strategaeth. Dyna'r gosb i aelodau o bob plaid am fod yn hollol gywir yn ein barn ar ddrafft mis Chwefror. Y gwrthddywediad terfynol yw'r un rhwng rhethreg partneriaeth a phenderfyniad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i fwrw ati heb gynnwys ei phartneriaid. Partneriaeth wirioneddol oedd cyfrinach partneriaeth gymdeithasol Iwerddon, a gynhyrchodd ei chynllun datblygu. Os ydym yn efelychu Iwerddon, ni allaf ddeall pam y gwrthodwyd y bwrdd polisi economaidd. Dyma felly, strategaeth Llafur 100 y cant, ac mae nod amgen y Llywodraeth arni, sef gwrthddywediad rhwng dyhead a realiti. Yn ôl safonau rhyngwladol, mewn cymhariaeth â chynllun datblygu Iwerddon, hyd yn oed yn ôl safonau'r Llywodraeth hon, mae'n ddarn o waith eilradd.

Brian Gibbons *a gododd*—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Daeth eich amser i ben, Phil, felly ni allwch dderbyn ymyriad.

Alun Cairns: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Gwelliant 6: ar ddiwedd pwynt 2 ychwanegu:

ond yn gresynu nad yw'r camau yn y ddogfen yn cysylltu'n benodol â'r targedau a'r canlyniadau.

Cynigiau welliant 8. Ychwanegu ar ddiwedd pwynt 3:

and calls for an economic policy board, as recommended in the Economic Development Committee's review of business support, to conduct this duty and to publish annually the progress made against the strategy and targets.

I propose amendment 9. Add at the end of point 4:

annually against the targets listed in the document.

I propose amendment 10. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

notes that the growth target of Welsh gross domestic product per person to rise from 80 per cent to 90 per cent of the UK average over the next decade is unlikely to be achieved unless there is a significant increase in resources available for economic development purposes.

I propose amendment 11. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the proposed economic research advisory panel to report within 12 months to the National Assembly on the likelihood of the Welsh Assembly Government of achieving its GDP growth target through 'A Winning Wales' under planned resources.

The journey of the national economic development strategy has been somewhat tortuous since the establishment of the Assembly. This was the very first document that the Economic Development Committee discussed during the first few weeks of the Assembly, almost three years ago. It is hard to believe that, after all this time, the administration has finally presented its final draft. At the outset, there was an intention for all parties to work together and even to offer a joint paper. Unfortunately, the mutual respect and cross-party support broke down when the Minister refused to accept the cross-party recommendations last February. As a result, in spite of a Labour/Liberal majority on the Committee, it refused to endorse the paper, but it respected the Minister's right to proceed with the consultation. He said at the time that there was a great urgency, because the consultation

ac yn galw am fwrdd polisi economaidd, fel yr argymhellir yn adolgyiad y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd o gymorth busnes, i gyflawni'r ddyletswydd hon ac i gyhoeddi'n flynyddol pa gamau a gymerwyd ar sail y strategaeth a thargedau.

Cynigiau welliant 9. Ychwanegu ar ddiwedd pwynt 4:

yn flynyddol yn erbyn y targedau a restrir yn y ddogfen.

Cynigiau welliant 10. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn nodi ei bod yn annhebygol y bydd cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth Cymru fesul person yn codi 80 y cant i'r targed o 90 y cant o gyfartaledd y DU yn ystod y degawd nesaf oni bai fod cynnydd sylweddol yn yr adnoddau sydd ar gael at ddibenion datblygu economiadd.

Cynigiau welliant 11. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar y panel ymgynghorol ar ymchwil economaidd arfaethedig i adrodd cyn pen 12 mis i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar ba mor debygol yw Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o gyrraedd ei tharged GDP trwy 'Cymru ar ei Hennill' gyda'r adnoddau a gynlluniwyd.

Bu hynt y strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol rywffaint yn drofaus ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad. Hon oedd y ddogfen gyntaf i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ei thrafod yn ystod ychydig wythnosau cyntaf y Cynulliad, bron dair blynedd yn ôl. Mae'n anodd credu, ar ôl yr holl amser hwn, bod y weinyddiaeth o'r diwedd wedi cyflwyno ei drafft terfynol. Ar y dechrau, yr oedd bwriad i bob plaid gydweithio a hyd yn oed gynnig papur ar y cyd. Yn anffodus, chwalodd y parch o'r ddwy ochr a'r gefnogaeth drawsbleidiol pan wrthododd y Gweinidog dderbyn yr argymhellion trawsbleidiol fis Chwefror diwethaf. O ganlyniad, er gwaethaf mwyafrif Llafur/Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ar y Pwyllgor, gwrthododd gymeradwyo'r papur, ond parchodd hawl y Gweinidog i fwrw ymlaen â'r ymgynghori. Dywedodd ar y pryd fod brys mawr, gan fod angen cwblhau'r ymgynghoriad erbyn yr hydref er

needed to be completed by the autumn to be able to bid into the budget round. We had already waited two years for a strategy at that time and felt that a further two months would not have made much difference. The Minister rejected our calls because of the so-called tight timescale.

You will not be surprised to hear that the strategy was criticised widely and ridiculed by many organisations. So much so, that the consultation period in the summer was extended, in spite of the tight timescale. After the formal consultation ended on 6 July, the critical responses were so overwhelming that the new Minister for Economic Development was forced to delay the process yet again, and publish another version for consultation. So much for the tight timescale and the budget round bidding.

This has finally led to today's strategy and today's debate. The verdict: on the positive side, it flows better than previous publications; on the negative side, it flows in completely the wrong direction. The document has failed to recognise the fundamental flaws that existed in all versions. The first flaw relates to the targets, which are wholly unrealistic in comparison with the resources that the Minister is offering. That was the cross-party view some eight months ago. At that time, we thought that to move from 83 per cent of UK average GDP per capita to 90 per cent in 10 years, with the level of resources available, removed the strategy's credibility. During the long delays that I mentioned, statistical revisions have lowered Wales's GDP per capita starting point from 83 per cent to 80 per cent of the UK average GDP per capita—I am not blaming the administration for that, it is simply a revision. However, the Minister has failed to account for that and to recognise that the gap is even greater. To achieve 90 per cent of the UK average GDP per capita is even more impossible than it was previously. Furthermore, despite worldwide economic uncertainties and the probability of a global recession, the Minister still believes that we can achieve 90 per cent of the UK average GDP per capita based on no significant change in the available resources. The draft document presents a figure of £15 billion

mwyn gallu rhoi cynnig yn y cylch cyllideb. Yr oeddem eisoes wedi aros dwy flynedd am strategaeth ar y pryd a theimlwyd na fyddai dau fis arall wedi gwneud llawer o wahaniaeth. Gwrthododd y Gweinidog ein galwadau oherwydd yr amserlen dynn fel y'i gelwir.

Ni fyddwch yn synnu i glywed bod y strategaeth wedi ei beirniadu'n helaeth ac i lawer o sefydliadau wneud hwyl am ei phen. Gymaint felly, fel yr ymestynnwyd y cyfnod ymgynghori yn yr haf, er gwaethaf yr amserlen dynn. Ar ôl i'r ymgynghori ffurfiol ddod i ben ar 6 Gorffennaf, yr oedd cymaint o ymatebion beirniadol fel y bu'n rhaid i'r Gweinidog newydd dros Ddatblygu Economaidd oedi'r broses unwaith eto, a chyhoeddi fersiwn arall ar gyfer ymgynghori. Beth a ddigwyddodd i'r amserlen dynn a'r cynigion yn y cylch cyllideb.

Yn y pen draw, arweiniodd hyn at strategaeth heddiw a dadl heddiw. Y ddedfryd: ar yr ochr gadarnhaol, mae'n llifo'n well na chyhoeddiadau blaenorol; ar yr ochr negyddol, mae'n llifo i'r cyfeiriad anghywir yn gyfan gwbl. Methodd y ddogfen â chydabod y diffygion sylfaenol a fodolai ym mhob fersiwn. Mae'r diffyg cyntaf yn ymwneud â'r targedau, sydd yn hollol afrealistig o'u cymharu â'r adnoddau y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cynnig. Dyna oedd y farn drawsbleidiol tua wyth mis yn ôl. Ar y pryd, yr oeddem o'r farn bod symud o 83 y cant o CMC y pen o gyfartaledd y DU i 90 y cant ymhen 10 mlynedd, gyda'r adnoddau oedd ar gael, yn chwalu hygredd y strategaeth. Yn ystod yr oedi hir y soniais amdano, mae diwygiadau ystadegol wedi gostwng CMC y pen yng Nghymru o fan cychwyn o 83 y cant i 80 y cant o CMC y pen o gyfartaledd y DU—ni feiaf y weinyddiaeth am hynny, diwygiad yn syml ydyw. Fodd bynnag, methodd y Gweinidog â rhoi cyfrif ar gyfer hynny a methodd â chydabod bod y bwllch hyd yn oed yn fwy. Mae ceisio cyflawni 90 y cant o CMC y pen o gyfartaledd y DU hyd yn oed yn fwy amhosibl nag yr oedd yn flaenorol. At hynny, er gwaethaf ansicrwydd economaidd byd-eang, a thebygolrwydd dirwasgiad byd-eang, cred y Gweinidog o hyd y gallwn gyflawni 90 y cant o CMC y pen o gyfartaledd y DU yn seiliedig ar ddim newid sylweddol yn yr adnoddau sydd ar

allocated to develop the economy, which is misleading. The transport budget and the economy budget are included within that £15 billion. I do not know why we do not add to that the £2 billion or £3 billion that is spent on health, because without a healthy workforce you cannot have economic development. Let us put the block grant together and claim that that is going towards the national economic development strategy.

What do the experts say? The latest economic forecasts show that the Minister is whistling in the wind. All have revised economic projections downwards yet again. The movement between the spring and autumn forecasts are significant. Worryingly, they all predict that the Welsh economy will grow slower than in the rest of the UK. Business Strategies Limited, one of the three key economic forecasters, suggests that, this year, our economy will almost enter recession and grow by only 0.1 per cent, whereas the UK economy will grow by 2.2 per cent. That being the case, by next year, we will be worse off than we already are. Wales's GDP per capita will be lower than 80 per cent of the UK average, again creating a gap that is more difficult to close. No doubt, the Minister will seek to dismiss these points. However, I hope that on this occasion, he will address the economic reality rather than resort to derogatory personal comments, as he has done in the past.

I note that my time is running out. This document does not address the needs of business in terms of transport demands or practical issues such as dualling the A40, a fast-link road to the motorway and information and communications technology improvements across Wales. 'Cymru Ar-lein', as it has been presented—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Your five minutes is up, Alun.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): I want to begin from a different perspective,

gael. Mae'r ffigur o £15 biliwn yn y ddogfen ddrafft, a ddyrennir i ddatblygu'r economi, yn gamarweiniol. Cynhwysir y gyllideb ar gyfer trafnidiaeth a'r gyllideb ar gyfer yr economi o fewn y £15 biliwn hwnnw. Ni wn pam nad ychwanegwn hynny at y £2 biliwn neu'r £3 biliwn a warir ar iechyd, oherwydd heb weithlu iach ni allwch sicrhau datblygiad economaidd. Gadewch inni roi'r grant bloc at ei gilydd, a thaeu ei fod yn mynd tuag at y strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol.

Beth a ddywed yr arbenigwyr? Dengys y rhagolygon economaidd diweddaraf fod y Gweinidog â'i ben yn y cymylau. Maent i gyd wedi diwygio'r rhagamcanion economaidd tuag at i lawr unwaith eto. Mae'r symudiad rhwng rhagolygon y gwanwyn a'r hydref yn arwyddocaol. Yr hyn sy'n peri gofid yw bod pob un ohonynt yn rhagweld y bydd economi Cymru yn tyfu'n arafach nag yng ngweddill y DU. Awgryma Strategaethau Busnes Cyfyngedig, un o'r tri chwmni rhagolygon economaidd allweddol, y daw ein heonomi, eleni, o fewn trwch blewyn i ddirwasgiad ac na fydd yn tyfu mwy na 0.1 y cant, ond y bydd economi'r DU yn tyfu 2.2 y cant. Os felly, erbyn y flwyddyn nesaf, byddwn yn waeth ein byd yn ariannol nag yr ydym ar hyn o bryd. Bydd CMC Cymru y pen yn is na 80 y cant o gyfartaledd y DU, gan greu bwlech unwaith eto sy'n anos ei gau. Yn ddiau, bydd y Gweinidog yn ceisio anwybyddu'r pwyntiau hyn. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiaf y bydd, ar yr achlysur hwn, yn ymdrin â'r realiti economaidd yn hytrach na throi at sylwadau personol bychanol, fel y gwnaeth yn y gorffennol.

Nodaf fod fy amser yn dod i ben. Nid yw'r ddogfen hon yn ymdrin ag anghenion busnes o ran galwadau trafnidiaeth neu faterion ymarferol fel deuoli ffordd yr A40, ffordd gyswllt gyflym i'r draffordd a gwelliannau technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu ledled Cymru. Mae 'Cymru Ar-lein', fel y'i cyflwynwyd—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Daeth eich pum munud i ben, Alun.

Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): Yr wyf am ddechrau o safbwynt gwahanol,

which is that we should be confident. When it was created, the National Assembly took on the role of wanting to deliver on issues for the people of Wales, not just for the economic future, but across life in Wales. This strategy should be scrutinised closely, and that has happened. However, there comes a point when scrutiny for the good of public policy lapses into navel-gazing, a spiral of cynicism and pettiness that can undermine the confidence which is necessary for us to fulfil our aspirations and visions for the future.

By launching 'A Winning Wales', we must believe that we can, and will, win. Consider how far the nation has come. This strategy points the way to economic success in the period up to 2010. Consider the situation five years ago when we were still being ruled by a Conservative Secretary of State for Wales, and the structural fund programmes in Wales were excluded from the Barnett block. Consider where we have reached in five years. The dream of devolution, which the Conservative Party opposed, could not have become a reality then, however, it has now. Objective 1 resources have been won for west Wales and the Valleys, Two-thirds of the country—west Wales and the Valleys—are an Objective 1 area and we have resources for them. The Barnett—

Alun Cairns: Will you give way?

Michael German: I will finish in a moment. I will speak for a little while longer. The Barnett block, which could not be breached in the past, has now been breached in order to ensure additional expenditure cover for match funds.

Alun Cairns: Will you give way?

Michael German: I will in a moment. The National Assembly has created Finance Wales, our first development bank. There are those who do not believe that we can achieve the step change needed in the Welsh economy to achieve 90 per cent of UK average GDP per capita—a feat that would only require 40 per cent of the recent Irish

sef y dylem fod yn hyderus. Pan gafodd ei greu, ymgwymerodd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol â'r rôl o ddymuno cyflwyno ar faterion i bobl Cymru, nid er mwyn y dyfodol economaidd yn unig, ond ar draws bywyd yng Nghymru. Dylid craffu'n ofalus ar y strategaeth hon a dyna sydd wedi digwydd. Fodd bynnag, daw amser pan fydd craffu er budd polisi cyhoeddus yn llithro i fogailsyllu, cynnydd graddol mewn siniciaeth a bychander a all danseilio'r hyder sydd ei angen arnom i gyflawni ein dyheadau a'n gweledigaethau ar gyfer y dyfodol.

Drwy lansio 'Cymru ar ei Hennill', rhaid inni gredu y gallwn, ac y gwnawn, ennill. Ystyriwch gymaint y mae'r genedl wedi datblygu. Mae'r strategaeth hon yn dangos y ffordd i lwyddiant economaidd yn y cyfnod hyd at 2010. Ystyriwch y sefyllfa bum mlynedd yn ôl pan oeddem yn cael ein llywodraethu o hyd gan Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Ceidwadol, a'r rhaglenni cronfeydd strwythurol yng Nghymru yn cael eu heithrio o floc Barnett. Ystyriwch ble yr ydym wedi cyrraedd mewn pum mlynedd. Ni allai'r freuddwyd datganoli, a wrthwynebwyd gan y Blaid Geidwadol, fod wedi dod yn realiti bryd hynny, fodd bynnag, mae wedi erbyn hyn. Enillwyd adnoddau Amcan 1 ar gyfer gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd. Mae dwy ran o dair o'r wlad—gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd—yn ardal Amcan 1 ac mae gennym adnoddau ar eu cyfer. Bydd bloc Barnett—

Alun Cairns: A ildiwch?

Michael German: Byddaf yn gorffen mewn munud. Siaradaf am ychydig o amser yn fwy. Erbyn hyn mae bloc Barnett, na ellid ei dorri yn y gorffennol, wedi ei dorri er mwyn sicrhau gwariant ychwanegol ar gyfer arian cyfatebol.

Alun Cairns: A ildiwch?

Michael German: Ildiaf mewn munud. Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol wedi creu Cyllid Cymru, ein banc datblygu cyntaf. Mae yna rai na chredant y gallwn gyflawni'r newid graddol sydd ei angen yn economi Cymru i gyflawni 90 y cant o CMC y pen o gyfartaledd y DU—camp na fyddai'n galw am fwy na 40 y cant o gyfradd twf ddiweddar

growth rate.

Iwerddon.

11:25 a.m.

Alun Cairns *rose*—

Michael German: Alun Cairns wants to intervene. Presumably, he wants to ask why we are including everything in the big budget.

Alun Cairns: That is loosely related to my intervention. However, you said a moment ago that there were sufficient resources for Objective 1 in terms of match funding. If that is the case, why did you support the motion of no confidence against the former First Minister?

Michael German: I am afraid that you did not listen, Alun. I will repeat the words to ensure that you understand them: ‘to ensure additional public expenditure cover for match funding’. That is different from what you said. However, you talked about the importance of transport, and then complained about the transport budget being included in the £15 billion. Those two statements are entirely at odds with each other. Presumably that is your direction—

Alun Cairns *rose*—

Michael German: I will not give way again. Among the doubters—and we have heard one—many of them have stood for election in the Assembly. There are those in the Assembly who believe that we can do nothing without additional powers. My party’s position on both these issues is consistent. We want more powers for Wales and more public investment. To win more, we are ready to roll up our sleeves and fight for it. That is why my party believes that replacing the Barnett formula with a needs-based formula would bring additional public expenditure to Wales. However, to fail to strive for significant improvements in Welsh economic and social life and utilising the resources at our disposal now would be a betrayal of Welsh political aspirations and of the people who elected us.

I am proud of this partnership strategy, ‘A Winning Wales’, because it includes so many

Alun Cairns *a gododd*—

Michael German: Mae Alun Cairns am ymyrryd. Mae’n debyg ei fod am ofyn pam ein bod yn cynnwys popeth yn y gyllideb fawr.

Alun Cairns: Mae hynny’n ymwneud yn fras â’r hymyriad. Fodd bynnag, dywedasoeh eiliad yn ôl fod digon o adnoddau ar gyfer Amcan 1 o ran arian cyfatebol. Os felly, pam na wnaethoch gefnogi’r cynnig o ddiffyg hyder yn erbyn cyn Brif Weinidog Cymru?

Michael German: Mae’n ddrwg gennyf na wrandawsoch, Alun. Ailadroddaf y geiriau i sicrhau eich bod yn eu deall: ‘er mwyn sicrhau gwariant ychwanegol ar gyfer arian cyfatebol’. Mae hynny’n wahanol i’r hyn a ddywedasoeh chi. Fodd bynnag, gwnaethoch sôn am bwysigrwydd trafndiaeth, a chwyno wedyn am y gyllideb trafndiaeth yn cael ei chynnwys yn y £15 biliwn. Mae’r ddau ddatganiad hynny yn hollol groes i’w gilydd. Mae’n debyg mai dyna’ch cyfarwyddyd—

Alun Cairns *a gododd*—

Michael German: Nid ildiaf eto. Ymhlith yr amheuwyr—a chlywsom un—mae llawer wedi sefyll fel ymgeiswyr yn y Cynulliad. Mae rhai yn y Cynulliad sy’n credu na allwn wneud dim heb bwerau ychwanegol. Mae safbwynt fy mhlaidd ar y ddau fater hyn yn gyson. Yr ydym am gael mwy o bwerau i Gymru a mwy o fuddsoddiad cyhoeddus. Er mwyn ennill mwy, yr ydym eisoes yn torchi llewys ac yn ymladd amdano. Dyna pam y cred fy mhlaidd y byddai disodli fformiwla Barnett a derbyn fformiwla ar sail anghenion yn dod â gwariant cyhoeddus ychwanegol i Gymru. Fodd bynnag, byddai methu ag ymdrechu i wneud gwelliannau sylweddol i fywyd economaidd a chymdeithasol Cymru gan ddefnyddio’r adnoddau sydd ar gael inni yn awr yn bradychu dyheadau gwleidyddol Cymru a’r bobl a’n hetholwyd.

Yr wyf yn falch o’r strategaeth bartneriaeth hon, ‘Cymru ar ei Hennill’, gan ei bod yn

of the policy developments that were originally flagged up in the partnership agreement, including new support for enterprise, greater emphasis on growth sectors and clusters such as the social economy, renewables, tourism and agri-groups. It includes a commitment to promoting innovation across industrial sectors, and enhanced business and academic collaboration. It places an emphasis on community development and empowerment, ensuring that improved competitiveness and inclusion go hand in hand. The strategy includes a commitment to regenerating the rural economy, including Farming Connect. I am pleased that we have the new enterprise support scheme, which rolls out a single menu of support finance for Welsh companies, making and creating a new business environment for all parts of Wales, which puts us ahead of anywhere else in the United Kingdom. That is the development that we must take forward. The regional targets are clearly stated in the Objective 1, 2 and 3 programmes. We can offer better regional state aid in west Wales and the Valleys now than 97 per cent of the rest of the UK. We must be confident. Our Welsh Development Agency is the envy of much of the UK and Europe. We already have £15 billion at our disposal to help transform the Welsh economy. That is why it is time to start believing in ourselves and make the best of what we have with confidence.

Dafydd Wigley: Fy mhryder i yw mai datganiad o ddyhead yw hwn. Mae'n glodwiw ein bod yn amcanu at 135,000 o swyddi newydd, ond ffigur ar bapur yw hwnnw, ac nid yw'n werth dim oni bai bod cynllun pwrpasol i droi'r ffigur hwnnw yn realiti. Os ydym am lwyddo, mae'n hanfodol cydweithio fel tîm mewn partneriaeth go iawn. Fel y dywedodd Phil Williams, sefydlu'r bartneriaeth yn 1987 oedd sail llwyddiant Iwerddon.

Ofnaf dros y misoedd diwethaf ein bod wedi gwneud niwed mawr i'r bartneriaeth rhwng busnes, yr undebau llafur a'r Llywodraeth yng Nghymru. Mae busnes fwyfwy o'r farn nad yw'r Llywodraeth yng Nghymru yn cymryd unrhyw sylw ohono. Yr wyf wedi

cynnwys cymaint o'r datblygiadau polisi a gyflwynwyd yn wreiddiol yn y cytundeb partneriaeth, gan gynnwys cefnogaeth newydd i fenter, mwy o bwyslais ar sectorau a chlystyrau twf fel yr economi gymdeithasol, deunyddiau adnewyddadwy, twristiaeth a grwpiau amaeth. Mae'n cynnwys ymrwymiad i hyrwyddo arloesedd ar draws sectorau diwydiannol, a chydweithredu gwell rhwng y sector busnes a'r byd academiaidd. Mae'n rhoi pwyslais ar ddatblygu a rhoi grym i gymunedau, gan sicrhau bod gwell cystadleugarwch a chynhwysedd yn mynd law yn llaw. Mae'r strategaeth yn cynnwys ymrwymiad i adfywio'r economi wledig, gan gynnwys Cyswllt Ffermio. Yr wyf yn falch fod y cynllun cymorth menter newydd gennym, sy'n cyflwyno un ddewislen o arian cymorth i gwmnïau Cymru, gan wneud a chreu amgylchedd busnes newydd ar gyfer pob rhan o Gymru, sy'n ein rhoi ar y blaen i unrhyw ran arall o'r Deyrnas Unedig. Dyna'r datblygiad y mae'n rhaid inni weithredu arno. Nodir y targedau rhanbarthol yn glir yn rhaglenni Amcan 1, 2 a 3. Erbyn hyn, gallwn gynnig gwell cymorth gwladol rhanbarthol yng ngorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd na 97 y cant o weddill y DU. Rhaid inni fod yn hyderus. Mae llawer o'r DU ac Ewrop yn genfigennus o Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru. Eisoes mae gennym £15 biliwn i'n helpu i drawsnewid economi Cymru. Dyna pam ei bod yn bryd inni ddechrau credu yn ein hunain a gwneud y gorau o'r hyn sydd gennym â hyder.

Dafydd Wigley: My concern is that this is a statement of aspiration. It is commendable that we are aiming for 135,000 new jobs, but this is a figure on paper and it is worthless unless there is a tailor-made plan to turn that figure into reality. If we are to succeed, it is essential that we work as a team and in true partnership. As Phil Williams said, the success in Ireland was based on the establishment of its 1987 partnership.

I fear that, over the past months, we have done great harm to the partnership between business, the trade unions and the Government in Wales. Business is increasingly of the opinion that the Government in Wales takes no notice of it. I

gweld yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd sut y mae'r Llywodraeth yn diystyru dymuniad unfrydol y Pwyllgor i sefydlu bwrdd polisi economaidd i Gymru. Os mai i'r graddau hynny y mae'r Llywodraeth yn gwranddo, ni fydd yn llwyddo i greu'r unoliaeth angenrheidiol.

Os ydym am gyrraedd y nod, rhaid cael targedu daearyddol manylach yn oherwydd bod perygl y bydd y swyddi i gyd ar hyd coridor yr M4. Mae'n bwysig targedu sectorau er mwyn sicrhau bod y sgiliau angenrheidiol yn cael eu darparu yn y lle iawn. Rhaid hefyd targedu'r cwmnïau y ceisiwn gydweithredu â hwy.

O'r 144,000 busnes yng Nghymru, nid yw 100,000 yn cyflogi unrhyw weithwyr. Mae'r potensial mwyaf ar gyfer tyfiant ymhlith y 15,000 busnes sydd yn awr yn cyflogi rhwng pump a 250 o weithwyr. Dyna gyfanswm o ryw 270,000 o weithwyr. Amcangyfrifodd yr Athro Dylan Jones-Evans, o Brifysgol Cymru, Bangor, y gellid creu rhyw 27,000 o swyddi newydd yn y grŵp hwnnw o gwmnïau dros gyfnod o dair blynedd, os y targedwn yn gywir ac y darparwn bobl i weithio'n agos gyda'r cwmnïau i facsimeiddio'r tyfiant posibl. Nid oes gair am hynny yn y strategaeth.

Mae angen adnoddau ariannol i gyrraedd y nod, ond nid oes arian ychwanegol i'w gael yn y strategaeth. Mae'n gamarweiniol i ddweud bod yr arian ar gyfer Amcan 1 yn ddigon i dalu'r arian cyfatebol. Nid yw'n ddigon i dalu'r anghenion am ganiatâd gwario ar arian Ewrop yn unig. Heb yr adnoddau, ni chaiff hyn ei wireddu.

Mae angen y celfi i ddylanwadu ar fusnesau i ddatblygu a buddsoddi yn y lleoedd iawn. Addawodd Llywodraeth y glymblaid y byddai'n gweithio i gael pecyn o amrywiadau ariannol i helpu cyflawni hynny. Mae cyrff megis Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach wedi galw am y fath becyn. Ar wahân i'r hawl i amrywio treth stamp, sy'n effeithio mwy ar brisiau tai nag ar greu gwaith, nid oes unrhyw arwydd bod y Llywodraeth wedi llwyddo i argyhoeddi'r Trysorlys am bwysigrwydd y mater hwn.

Nid cynllun yw hwn ond rhestr ddyheadau.

have seen in the Economic Development Committee how the Government disregards the Committee's unanimous wish to establish an economic policy board for Wales. If that is the extent to which the Government listens, then it cannot create that necessary unity.

If we want to meet the objective, we must have more detailed geographical targeting because there is a danger that the jobs will all be along the M4 corridor. It is important to target sectors to ensure that the necessary skills are provided in the right place. We must also target the companies with which we are trying to co-operate.

Of the 144,000 businesses in Wales, 100,000 do not employ any staff. The greatest potential for growth is among the 15,000 businesses that currently employ between five and 250 workers. That is a total of about 270,000 workers. Professor Dylan Jones-Evans of the University of Wales, Bangor has estimated that around 27,000 new jobs could be created in that group of companies over a period of three years, if we target effectively and provide people to work closely with the companies to maximise the potential growth. No mention is made of that in the strategy.

We need financial resources to hit that target, but the strategy provides no additional money. It is misleading to say that money provided for Objective 1 is sufficient to cover match funding. It is not enough to meet the needs of expenditure on European money alone. Without the resources, this will not be realised.

We need the tools to enable us to influence businesses to develop and invest in the right places. The coalition Government has promised to work towards a package of fiscal variations to achieve that. Bodies such as the Federation of Small Businesses have called for such a package. Apart from the right to vary stamp duty, which affects house prices more than job creation, there is no sign that the Government has managed to convince the Treasury of the importance of this issue.

This is not a plan but a wish list. The wishes

Dyheadau digon clodwiw, ond nid oes sicrwydd y byddwn yn llwyddo i'w cael. Mae fel rhestr plentyn at Siôn Corn. Ofnaf y byddwn yn disgwyl yn hir i'r Nadolig economaidd gyrraedd pobl Cymru.

Ron Davies: I agree with Alun Cairns that the process over the last two and a half years has hardly been satisfactory, I am sorry. What we have before us is a document that does not fulfil the aspirations that we had when we started on the process. We were looking for something more inspirational than we have now.

Having said that, there is much to be welcomed in the revised strategy. We have a commitment to financial services, a desire to test programmes for sustainability, and recognition that our unique geographical and physical assets make a substantial contribution to the economic success of Wales.

There are a range of good initiatives such as Finance Wales, 'Cymru Ar-lein—Online for a Better Wales' and the economic research advisory panel. They are all welcomed and are essential, but I am not sure that this plan is coherent or credible.

In previous debates, I have expressed my concern at the over-ambitious targets—principally for our gross domestic product. The target of Wales achieving 90 per cent of the UK average GDP by 2010 is a remnant of the old national economic development strategy document. It is no more achievable now than it was then. It is not a lack of ambition for Wales that makes me question that target, but a determination to see that we have a credible strategy that does not mislead people with false promises. Mark Lee, a Hollywood scriptwriter, once stated that

'ambition without knowledge is like a boat on dry land'.

We need to set targets based on the available knowledge. The hard knowledge that we have at present does not suggest that the

are commendable, but there is no certainty that we will succeed in achieving them. It is like a child's list to Father Christmas. I am afraid that the people of Wales will be waiting some time before they celebrate the economic Christmas.

Ron Davies: Cytunaf ag Alun Cairns na fu'r broses dros y ddwy flynedd a hanner diwethaf yn foddhaol, mae'n ddrwg gennyf. Yr hyn sydd gennym o'n blaen yw dogfen nad yw'n cyflawni'r dyheadau a oedd gennym pan ddechreuasom ar y broses. Yr oeddem yn edrych am rywbeth mwy ysbrydoledig na'r hyn sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd.

Ar ôl dweud hynny, mae llawer i'w groesawu yn y strategaeth ddiwygiedig. Mae gennym ymrwymiad i wasanaethau ariannol, dymuniad i brofi rhaglenni ar gyfer cynaliadwyedd, a chydnyddiaeth bod ein hasedion daearyddol a ffisegol unigryw yn gwneud cyfraniad sylweddol i lwyddiant economaidd Cymru.

Mae ystod o fentrau da fel Cyllid Cymru, 'Cymru Ar-lein—Online for a Better Wales' a'r panel ymgynghorol ar ymchwil economaidd. Croesewir y rhain i gyd ac maent yn hanfodol, ond nid wyf yn siŵr bod y cynllun hwn yn gydlynol nac yn gredadwy.

Mewn dadleuon blaenorol, mynegais fy mhryder ynglŷn â thargedau goruchelgeisiol—yn bennaf ar gyfer ein cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth. Mae'r targed i Gymru, sef cyflawni 90 y cant o CMC o gyfartaledd y DU erbyn 2010, yn rhywbeth sydd wedi goroesi o'r hen ddogfen strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol. Nid yw'n fwy cyflawnadwy yn awr nag yr oedd bryd hynny. Nid diffyg uchelgais i Gymru yw'r hyn sy'n gwneud imi gwestiynu'r targed hwnnw, ond penderfyniad i weld bod gennym strategaeth yn awr sy'n gredadwy ac nad yw'n camarwain pobl gydag addewidion ffug. Dywedodd Mark Lee, sgriptiwr o Hollywood, unwaith fod

Mae angen inni osod targedau sy'n seiliedig ar y wybodaeth sydd ar gael. Nid yw'r wybodaeth bendant sydd gennym ar hyn o

targets are realistic or achievable.

Alun Cairns: Will you give way?

Ron Davies: I will make this point and then give way to you. In its latest economic report, the Welsh economy research unit at Cardiff University has revised its forecasted change in GDP for 2001 downwards by almost 1 per cent from this time last year. Its prediction for the next two years indicates that the gap between us and the rest of the UK will widen. It was reported in Monday's *South Wales Echo* that Assembly officials conceded a week ago that we have missed the GDP target for 2000. That is not a promising start.

Last month, Robert Huggins and Associates compiled a report showing Wales at the bottom of its table of UK regional competitiveness, marking a 1.04 per cent drop from last year. Even the Assembly's principal source of economic forecasting, Cambridge Econometrics, predicts that the highest annual increase in GDP over the next four years will be no more than 2.8 per cent. That is the knowledge on which we must operate.

Last week, in his pre-budget statement, the Chancellor of the Exchequer forecast that the UK economy will grow by 2.25 per cent per annum. If that growth is maintained, to reach our targets for 2010, the Welsh economy will have to out-perform that of the UK overall, growing by almost 4 per cent each year, every year for over a decade. That has not been achieved during the whole of the last century. We have a modest collection of supply-side measures. However, there is nothing in this strategy in terms of policy or resources that will allow us to achieve anything like that objective.

11:35 a.m.

Alun Cairns: Given the tight timescale, I am grateful to you for giving way. Your comments, particularly about the targets and the lack of strategy, are pretty damning. Can I assume that you will vote against the motion,

bryd yn awgrymu bod y targedau yn realistig nac yn gyflawnadwy.

Alun Cairns: A ildiwch?

Ron Davies: Gwnaf y pwynt hwn ac yna fe ildiaf i chi. Yn ei hadroddiad economaidd diwethaf, diwygiodd uned ymchwil economaidd Cymru ym Mhrifysgol Caerdydd y newid yr oedd yn ei ragweld mewn CMC ar gyfer 2001 tuag at i lawr bron 1 y cant o'i gymharu â'r adeg hon y llynedd. Mae'n rhagweld y bydd y gagendor rhyngom ni a gweddill y DU dros y ddwy flynedd nesaf yn lleddu. Cofnodwyd yn y *South Wales Echo* ddydd Llun bod swyddogion y Cynulliad wythnos yn ôl wedi cyfaddef inni fethu'r targed CMC ar gyfer 2000. Nid yw hynny'n gychwyn addawol.

Fis diwethaf, lluniodd Robert Huggins and Associates adroddiad yn dangos bod Cymru ar waelod ei dabl o ran cystadleugarwch rhanbarthol y DU, sef gostyngiad o 1.04 y cant ers y llynedd. Mae hyd yn oed prif ffynhonnell y Cynulliad o ragolygon economaidd, Cambridge Econometrics, yn rhagweld na fydd y cynnydd blynyddol mwyaf mewn CMC dros y pedair blynedd nesaf yn fwy na 2.8 y cant. Dyna'r wybodaeth y mae'n rhaid inni weithredu arni.

Wythnos diwethaf, yn ei ddatganiad cyn y gyllideb, rhagwelodd Canghellor y Trysorlys y bydd economi'r DU yn tyfu 2.25 y cant y flwyddyn. Er mwyn cynnal y twf hwnnw, a chyrraedd ein targedau ar gyfer 2010, bydd yn rhaid i economi Cymru gyflawni'n well na'r DU yn gyffredinol, gan dyfu bron 4 y cant bob blwyddyn, a phob blwyddyn am fwy na degawd. Ni chyflawnwyd hynny yn ystod y ganrif ddiwethaf ar ei hyd. Mae gennym gasgliad cyffredin o fesurau ar yr ochr gyflenwi. Fodd bynnag, nid oes dim yn y strategaeth hon o ran polisi neu adnoddau a fydd yn caniatáu inni gyflawni unrhyw beth tebyg i'r amcan hwnnw.

Alun Cairns: O gofio'r amserlen dynn, yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am ildio. Mae eich sylwadau, yn benodol ynglŷn â'r targedau a'r diffyg strategaeth, yn eithaf damniol. A allaf gymryd yn ganiataol y byddwch yn

or will your party loyalty override your economic credentials?

Ron Davies: I hope that I will have injury time for that intervention, Deputy Presiding Officer. I say to Alun that it is Christmas, it is the season of goodwill and at such a time, most people will do anything for some peace and quiet. Your question reminds me of Father Christmas. Most of us think that the idea of Father Christmas is pretty good, and though we do not take it seriously or really believe in it, we do not want to tell the children in case we upset them. My view of the national economic development strategy document is like Father Christmas in that respect. [*Laughter*]

Based on current information, it is likely that the gap between Wales and the rest of the UK will widen rather than diminish. We should be developing an economic and political strategy that recognises that. We need a strategy that includes the reform of the public expenditure financing system in Wales, which reflects our country's real economic and social needs, not merely our percentage share of the UK population. We do not have a document that is sufficiently radical, innovative or provides distinctively Welsh ideas and programmes. Much of what we are doing is following the same themes and strategies being adopted in other regions with similar economic problems, such as Yorkshire, Humberside, north-east England and the west Midlands. Following that same strategy will make it more difficult for us to achieve the central objective of closing the gap between the rest of the UK and ourselves. We do not have the programme that we need. What we have is a report, and a strategy that is interesting and well motivated but not adequate for the task in hand.

Glyn Davies: I note the final delivery of the national economic development strategy, albeit after a much extended and much troubled gestation period. As may be widely thought, it is a rather ugly baby, but at least it is here and there is no doubt who the father is. This is Rhodri Morgan's economic

pleidleisio yn erbyn y cynnig, neu a fydd teyrngarwch at eich plaid yn diystyru eich cymwysterau economaidd?

Ron Davies: Gobeithiaf y caf amser ychwanegol ar gyfer yr ymyriad hwnnw, Ddirprwy Lywydd. Dywedaf wrth Alun mai'r Nadolig ydyw, tymor ewyllys da, ac ar adeg felly, gwna'r rhan fwyaf o bobl unrhyw beth i gael ychydig heddwch a llonydd. Mae eich cwestiwn yn fy atgoffa o Siôn Corn. I'r rhan fwyaf ohonom mae Siôn Corn yn syniad eithaf da, ac er na chymernw ef o ddifrif neu er na chredwn ynddo mewn gwirionedd, nid ydym am ddweud wrth y plant rhag ofn y siomwn hwy. Mae fy marn ar y ddogfen strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol yn debyg i Siôn Corn yn hynny o beth. [*Chwerthin*]

Yn seiliedig ar wybodaeth gyfredol, mae'n debygol y bydd y gagendor rhwng Cymru a gweddill y DU yn lledu yn hytrach na lleihau. Dylem fod yn datblygu strategaeth economaidd a gwleidyddol sy'n cydnabod hynny. Mae angen strategaeth arnom sy'n cynnwys diwygio'r system ariannu gwariant cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, sy'n adlewyrchu anghenion economaidd a chymdeithasol gwirioneddol ein gwlad, nid ein cyfran ganrannol o boblogaeth y DU yn unig. Nid oes gennym ddogfen sy'n ddigon radical, arloesol nac un sy'n darparu syniadau a rhaglenni sy'n benodol Gymreig. Mae llawer o'r hyn a wnawn yn dilyn yr un themâu a strategaethau a fabwysiedir mewn rhanbarthau eraill â phroblemau economaidd tebyg, fel Swydd Efrog, Humberside, gogledd ddwyrain Lloegr a gorllewin Canolbarth Lloegr. Bydd dilyn yr un strategaeth yn ei gwneud yn anos inni gyflawni'r amcan canolog o gau'r gagendor rhwng gweddill y DU a ni ein hunain. Nid oes gennym y rhaglen sydd ei hangen arnom. Yr hyn sydd gennym yw adroddiad, a strategaeth sy'n ddiddorol a brwdfrydig ond sy'n annigonol ar gyfer y dasg o'n blaenau.

Glyn Davies: Nodaf gyflwyniad terfynol y strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol, er y bu cyfnod datblygu estynedig a blinderus iawn. Fel y credir yn gyffredinol, mae'n fabi hyll braidd, ond o leiaf mae yma ac nid oes unrhyw amheuaeth pwy yw'r tad. Dyma strategaeth datblygu

development strategy. Some members of the Economic Development Committee are unhappy that their advice has been ignored. I have read of one Member—possibly two—who was so upset that he or she is thinking of retiring from the whole nasty business of politics. However, in a way, I am rather pleased. I am pleased that the economic development strategy does not have the Committee's endorsement. This is, therefore, Rhodri Morgan's strategy. It is something against which to measure this man of so many parts.

There is a serious problem with this strategy. Never let it be said that I am not in favour of ambitious targets. The Conservatives' target is to win enough seats in the 2003 election to form the next Government of Wales, or indeed, 'Government of the Welsh Assembly' as the First Minister said today. In future we must read 'GoWA'. Therefore 'GoWA slower with Labour' will be our campaign slogan. Many of you will think that our target is overambitious, but it is not nearly as ambitious as the targets for GDP per capita in this national economic development strategy document.

Gareth Jones: A ydych hefyd yn dweud eich bod yn credu yn Siôn Corn? [*Chwerthin*]

Glyn Davies: Ydwyf, yr wyf yn credu yn Siôn Corn.

There is as much chance of achieving the targets as there is of the First Minister voting for Alun Cairns in the Assembly Member of the year competition. This is the fundamental flaw with the national economic development strategy, the whole basis of the document is incredible. In part, this is because the targets assume that the Welsh economy will perform on a scale equivalent to the gold rush, but more so because there are no significant additional resources in the document to achieve that.

Last week, I was much taken by a speech delivered by Brian Gibbons. He spoke with his customary elegance, which us Conservatives are beginning to enjoy hearing from our seats. Brian is developing into one of the great Irish chunterers of modern politics. He put generous spin on the

economiaidd Rhodri Morgan. Mae rhai aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn anfodlon i'w cyngor gael ei anwybyddu. Darllenais am un Aelod—dau o bosibl—a oedd wedi cynhyrfu cymaint fel ei fod ef neu hi yn ystyried ymddeol o fusnes ffaidd gwleidyddiaeth. Fodd bynnag, mewn ffordd, yr wyf yn eithaf balch. Yr wyf yn falch nad yw'r Pwyllgor wedi cymeradwyo'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd. Felly, strategaeth Rhodri Morgan yw hon. Mae'n rhywbeth y gellir mesur y dyn amryddawn hwn yn ei erbyn.

Mae problem ddifrifol gyda'r strategaeth hon. Peidied byth â dweud nad wyf o blaid targedau uchelgeisiol. Targed y Ceidwadwyr yw ennill digon o seddau yn etholiad 2003 i ffurfio Llywodraeth nesaf Cymru, neu yn wir 'Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru' fel y dywedodd Prif Weinidog Cymru heddiw. Yn y dyfodol rhaid inni ddarllen 'GoWA'. Felly 'GoWA slower with Labour' fydd slogan ein hymgyrch. Bydd llawer ohonoch yn credu bod ein targed yn rhy uchelgeisiol, ond nid yw mor uchelgeisiol â'r targedau ar gyfer CMC y pen yn y ddogfen strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol hon.

Gareth Jones: Are you saying that you believe in Father Christmas too? [*Laughter*]

Glyn Davies: Yes, I do believe in Father Christmas.

Mae cymaint o gyfle i gyflawni'r targedau ag sydd o gael y Prif Weinidog i bleidleisio dros Alun Cairns yng nghystadleuaeth Aelod Cynulliad y flwyddyn. Dyma'r diffyg sylfaenol yn y strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol. Mae sail gyfan y ddogfen yn anhygoel. Yn rhannol, mae hyn am fod y targedau yn cymryd yn ganiataol y bydd economi Cymru yn cyflawni ar raddfa debyg i'r rhuthr am aur, ond yn fwy felly gan nad oes adnoddau ychwanegol sylweddol yn y ddogfen i gyflawni hynny.

Yr wythnos diwethaf, fe'm plesiyd gan araith a draddodwyd gan Brian Gibbons. Siaradodd gyda'i wychder arferol, yr ydym ni y Ceidwadwyr yn dechrau mwynhau ei glywed o'n seddau. Mae Brian yn datblygu i fod yn un o'r grwgnachwyr mawr Gwyddelig mewn gwleidyddiaeth fodern. Rhoddodd sbin

economic achievement of Labour, and claimed economic advance here in absolute terms, rather than the comparative terms underpinning the national economic development strategy document. I question the validity of Brian's claims, but I agree with his shrewd diagnosis that there is nothing in the national economic development strategy to justify the incredible GDP targets. The First Minister would do well to listen to his doctor.

Many elements of the strategy may be sensible, but with these GDP targets included, the whole document lacks integrity. It is a boat on dry land.

I am also concerned about the economic future of rural Wales, on which the First Minister touched. When the Development Board for Rural Wales was abolished, I was deeply depressed because of my personal involvement. I remember the first time I walked past its building in the Royal Welsh Show ground and saw it plastered with WDA posters. I felt such bitterness. The reason I was depressed was my belief that there would no longer be a champion for rural Wales, and so it has turned out.

There is no body to give rural Wales the real advantage that it needs. I am particularly worried about Powys. There is potential for that area to be squeezed. To the east, are the accessible Midlands, and to the west, is the Objective 1 area, supported by our new programme. Only last week, the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language told the Culture Committee that there are no extra costs in providing sports facilities in rural areas. When somebody says something so daft, it is not possible to reason with them. It was not even a civil service prompt.

I am not asking for regional targets, which in my view would make the national strategy too inflexible. However, I am asking the Economic Development Minister to accept that rural Wales needs special help. The part of Wales that I have spent most of my adult life trying to make a little more economically

hael ar gyflawniad economaidd Llafur, a honnodd ddatblygiadau economaidd yma mewn termau absoliwt, yn hytrach na'r termau cymharol sy'n ategu dogfen strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol. Cwestiynaf ddilyrwydd honiadau Brian, ond cytunaf â'i ddiagnosis craff nad oes unrhyw beth yn y strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol i gyfiawnhau'r targedau CMC anhygoel. Byddai'n dda pe bai Prif Weinidog Cymru yn gwrandao ar ei feddyg.

Efallai bod sawl elfen o'r strategaeth yn synhwyrol, ond drwy gynnwys y targedau CMC hyn, mae diffyg integreidd i'r ddogfen gyfan. Cwch ar dir sych ydyw.

Pryderaf hefyd ynglŷn â dyfodol economaidd Cymru wledig, y soniodd Prif Weinidog Cymru amdano. Pan ddiddymwyd Bwrdd Datblygu Cymru Wledig, yr oeddwn yn isel iawn fy ysbryd oherwydd fy ymrwymiad personol. Cofiaf y tro cyntaf imi gerdded heibio ei adeilad ar faes Sioe Frenhinol Cymru a gweld y waliau'n blastr o bosteri WDA. Teimlais y fath chwerwder. Y rheswm dros deimlo'n isel oedd fy nghred na fyddai rhywun bellach ar gael i bledio achos Cymru wledig, ac felly y bu.

Nid oes unrhyw gorff i roi'r fantais wirioneddol sydd ei hangen ar Gymru wledig. Pryderaf yn benodol am Bowys. Mae'n bosibl i'r ardal honno gael ei gwasgu. I'r dwyrain, mae Canolbarth Lloegr sy'n hawdd ei gyrraedd, ac i'r gorllewin, mae ardal Amcan 1, wedi ei chefnogi gan ein rhaglen newydd. Dim ond yr wythnos diwethaf, dywedodd y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg wrth y Pwyllgor Diwylliant nad oes costau ychwanegol wrth ddarparu cyfleusterau chwaraeon mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Pan ddywed rhywun rywbeth mor wirion, nid yw'n bosibl rhesymu â hwy. Nid oedd hyd yn oed yn awgrym gan y gwasanaeth sifil.

Nid wyf yn gofyn am dargedau rhanbarthol a fyddai, yn fy marn i, yn gwneud y strategaeth genedlaethol yn rhy anhyblyg. Fodd bynnag, gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd dderbyn bod angen cymorth arbennig ar Gymru wledig. Mae'r rhan o Gymru yr wyf wedi treulio y rhan fwyaf o'm

attractive is being left out on a limb, and I do not like it. Any national economic development strategy should address that point if it is to stand any chance of being seen as truly national.

Christine Chapman: Getting the economy right will be the Assembly's key test, and as such I welcome the debate on this strategy today. The targets and aspirations are clear, but if this strategy is to work, it is vital that there is concerted effort to take a joined-up approach to the economy.

As such, I was pleased that 'A Winning Wales' and 'The Learning Country' strategies were launched jointly some months ago. We know that an economic strategy will not work if it does not also include issues of appropriate training, skills, and access to the labour market for all of Wales's citizens.

A key aspect of the strategy is entrepreneurship. I welcome the fact that yesterday, we received an update on the entrepreneurship action plan in the Economic Development Committee.

If Wales is to prosper, we must take a proactive approach. We are doing that. We are talking about a cultural shift in the way that people think, across the board from the private to the public sector. Let us not lose sight of the fact that Wales has a wealth of talent, but our problem has been that we tended to lose our talent elsewhere. We must consider that issue.

I want this strategy to be successful because it encourages a clear expectation from all our agencies to create the best conditions for individuals, companies and communities to prosper. We know that several welcome developments have happened recently. I mention Finance Wales, Objective 1's flagship project, which will help and support many small businesses. It has been warmly welcomed by the private sector.

However, there are challenges too. We must

bywyd fel oedolyn yn ceisio ei gwneud yn fwy deniadol yn economaidd yn cael ei gadael ar ei phen ei hun, ac nid wyf yn hoffi hynny. Dylai unrhyw strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol ymdrin â'r pwynt hwnnw os yw i lwyddo i gael ei hystyried yn wirioneddol genedlaethol.

Christine Chapman: Llwyddiant economaidd fydd prawf allweddol y Cynulliad, ac fel y cyfryw croesawaf y ddadl ar y strategaeth heddiw. Mae'r targedau a'r dyheadau yn glir, ond er mwyn i'r strategaeth hon weithio, mae'n rhaid gwneud ymdrech fawr i fabwysiadu ymagwedd gydgysylltiedig.

Fel y cyfryw, yr oeddwn yn falch bod strategaethau 'Cymru ar ei Hennill' a'r 'Wlad sy'n Dysgu' wedi eu lansio ar y cyd rai misoedd yn ôl. Gwyddom na fydd strategaeth economaidd yn gweithio os nad yw hefyd yn cynnwys materion hyfforddiant priodol, sgiliau, a mynediad i'r farchnad lafur i bob un o ddinasyddion Cymru.

Agwedd allweddol ar y strategaeth yw entrepreneuriaeth. Croesawaf y ffaith inni dderbyn diweddariad ddoe ar y cynllun gweithredu entrepreneuriaeth yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd.

Er mwyn i Gymru ffynnu, rhaid inni fabwysiadu ymagwedd ragweithredol. Yr ydym yn gwneud hynny. Sôn yr ydym am newid diwylliannol yn y ffordd y mae pobl yn meddwl, dros ystod eang, o'r sector preifat i'r sector cyhoeddus. Ni ddylem golli golwg ar y ffaith bod gan Gymru gyfoeth o dalentau, ond yr ydym wedi tueddu i golli ein talentau i rywle arall. Rhaid inni ystyried y mater hwnnw.

Yr wyf am i'r strategaeth hon fod yn llwyddiannus oherwydd ei bod yn annog disgwyliad clir gan bob un o'n hasiantaethau i greu'r amodau gorau fel y gall unigolion, cwmnïau a chymunedau ffynnu. Gwyddom fod sawl datblygiad calonogol wedi bod yn ddiweddar. Soniaf am Gyllid Cymru, prif brosiect Amcan 1, a fydd yn helpu ac yn cefnogi llawer o fusnesau bach. Fe'i croesawyd yn frwd gan y sector preifat.

Fodd bynnag, mae heriau hefyd. Rhaid inni

have good, continuing communication, so that all parts of Wales, however peripheral can be fully aware of the range of services.

gael cysylltiadau da, parhaus, fel y gall pob rhan o Gymru, pa mor bellennig bynnag y mae, fod yn llwyr ymwybodol o'r ystod o wasanaethau.

On Objective 1—referred to in the document—we should note that Wales is now doing well with nearly a quarter of the funds committed. We are ahead of the other Objective 1 areas in the UK. I disagree slightly with Ron. We are implementing Objective 1 in a Welsh way. We have looked at other Objective 1 areas in the UK, but we are trying to implement it in a Welsh way. That is important, given that devolution has occurred.

O ran Amcan 1—y cyfeiriwyd ati yn y ddogfen—dylem nodi fod Cymru yn gwneud yn dda yn awr gyda bron chwarter o'r arian wedi ei neilltuo. Yr ydym ar y blaen i ardaloedd Amcan 1 eraill yn y DU. Anghytunaf ychydig â Ron. Gweithredwn Amcan 1 mewn ffordd Gymreig. Yr ydym wedi edrych ar ardaloedd Amcan 1 eraill yn y DU, ond ceisiwn ei gweithredu mewn ffordd Gymreig. Mae hynny'n bwysig, o gofio bod datganoli wedi digwydd.

11:45 a.m.

The projects are now bedding down and many people are benefiting from Objective 1, either by having jobs that have been created through Objective 1 or by being trained in the skills that are necessary if we want to create a dynamic economy. There are excellent examples throughout Wales of collaborative working with the private sector and higher education. I urge as many Assembly Members as possible to visit those excellent projects.

Mae'r prosiectau wedi ymsefydlu erbyn hyn ac mae llawer o bobl yn elwa ar Amcan 1, naill ai drwy gael swyddi a grëwyd drwy Amcan 1 neu drwy gael eu hyfforddi yn y sgiliau sydd eu hangen os ydym i greu economi ddeinamig. Mae enghreifftiau rhagorol ledled Cymru o gydweithio â'r sector preifat ac addysg uwch. Anogaf gymaint o Aelodau'r Cynulliad â phosibl i ymweld â'r prosiectau rhagorol hynny.

Encouraging the notion of working in partnership is crucial for Objective 1. This theme runs through 'A Winning Wales'. It was, possibly, not as evident in previous European programmes. As I said, we are trying to do things differently with Objective 1.

Mae annog y syniad o weithio mewn partneriaeth yn holl bwysig i Amcan 1. Rhed y thema hon drwy 'Cymru ar ei Hennill'. Nid oedd mor amlwg, o bosibl, mewn rhaglenni Ewropeaidd blaenorol. Fel y dywedais, yr ydym yn ceisio gwneud pethau'n wahanol gydag Amcan 1.

If we are to have a dynamic, sustainable economy, we must realise that ideas must flow from all directions and from all sectors. 'A Winning Wales' will help to unleash these ideas. More importantly, it will give practical support to do so and to help to turn Wales into a prosperous country. We must all start to implement this strategy.

Os ydym i gael economi ddeinamig, gynaliadwy, rhaid inni sylweddoli bod syniadau yn gorfod llifo o bob cyfeiriad ac o bob sector. Bydd 'Cymru ar ei Hennill' yn helpu i ryddhau'r syniadau hynny. Yn bwysicaf, bydd yn rhoi cymorth ymarferol i wneud hynny ac yn helpu i droi Cymru yn wlad ffyniannus. Rhaid i bob un ohonom ddechrau gweithredu'r strategaeth hon.

Pauline Jarman: I will mainly focus on the needs of the Valleys—an area that was ignored in the Government's strategy. However, before turning to that vitally important area, I will briefly consider the implications of the references to education

Pauline Jarman: Canolbwyntiaf yn bennaf ar anghenion y Cymoedd—ardal a anwybyddwyd yn strategaeth y Llywodraeth. Fodd bynnag, cyn troi at yr ardal holl bwysig honno, ystyriaf yn fras oblygiadau'r cyfeiriadau at faterion addysg a hyfforddiant

and training issues in the Government's strategy. As a party, we welcome the prominence given to education and training and the commitment to a knowledge-based, science-driven economy. That is why we pushed for additional resources to be allocated to the education budget instead of the economic development budget. However, our views on this were not taken on board. It is a fatal weakness in the Government's plans that the education budget in Wales is set to rise at a much slower rate than in England. During the last financial year, Wales's education budget was increased by 6.8 per cent, compared to an increase of 8.3 per cent in England. The budget for 2002-03 will not bridge this funding gap.

It is a worry and, indeed, a contradiction that the Government's overall strategy emphasises education and skills but that the spending gap per student in Wales in comparison to England and Scotland remains. This demonstrates the lack of synergy between various Assembly documents and strategies.

I will now discuss the Valleys. Any national economic development strategy for Wales must aim to provide sufficient jobs to guarantee full career opportunities for the whole population, if each region of Wales is to benefit. Spatial targeting for areas of deprivation such as the Valleys is essential if we are to spread economic prosperity throughout Wales. The Assembly should encourage its sponsored bodies to embrace spatial targeting as part of their programmes.

The acute problems of our Valley communities are well known. The official unemployment level in each Valley authority is significantly higher than the average for the UK. The true level, however, is much higher as so many of the over-50 population are registered as having long-term illnesses or being disabled. Gross domestic product per head is only 62 per cent of the European average. This means that the Valleys are among the poorest areas in the European Union. Life expectancy is five years less than the EU average and we have the highest proportion of unfit housing in Wales. One in three people have no academic qualifications

yn strategaeth y Llywodraeth. Fel plaid, croesawn yr amlygrwydd a roddir i addysg a hyfforddiant a'r ymrwymiad i economi ar sail gwybodaeth, wedi ei llywio gan wyddoniaeth. Dyna pam y pwyswyd am adnoddau ychwanegol ar gyfer y gyllideb addysg yn lle'r gyllideb datblygu economaidd. Fodd bynnag, nid ystyriwyd ein safbwyntiau ar hyn. Mae'n wendid dybryd yng nghynlluniau'r Llywodraeth bod disgwyl i'r gyllideb addysg yng Nghymru gynyddu ar gyfradd arafach o lawer na Lloegr. Yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol ddiwethaf, cynyddwyd cyllideb addysg Cymru 6.8 y cant, o'i chymharu â chynnydd o 8.3 y cant yn Lloegr. Ni fydd y gyllideb ar gyfer 2002-03 yn pontio'r bwlch ariannol hwn.

Mae'n ofid, ac yn wir, yn wrthddywediad bod strategaeth gyffredinol y Llywodraeth yn pwysleisio addysg a sgiliau ond bod y bwlch gwario ar gyfer pob myfyriwr yng Nghymru o'i gymharu â Lloegr a'r Alban yn parhau o hyd. Mae hyn yn arddangos diffyg synergedd rhwng dogfennau a strategaethau amrywiol y Cynulliad.

Trafodaf y Cymoedd yn awr. Rhaid i unrhyw strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol i Gymru anelu at ddarparu digon o swyddi i warantu cyfleoedd gyrfaoedd llawn i'r boblogaeth gyfan, os yw pob rhanbarth o Gymru i elwa ar hyn. Mae targedu gofodol ar gyfer ardaloedd o amddifadedd fel y Cymoedd yn hanfodol os ydym i ledaenu ffyniant economaidd ledled Cymru. Dylai'r Cynulliad annog ei gyrff noddedig i ymgorffori targedu gofodol fel rhan o'u rhaglenni.

Mae problemau enbyd ein cymunedau yn y Cymoedd yn dra hysbys. Mae'r lefel diweithdra swyddogol ym mhob un o awdurdodau'r Cymoedd yn sylweddol uwch na'r cyfartaledd ar gyfer y DU. Fodd bynnag, mae'r lefel wirioneddol yn uwch o lawer gan fod cymaint o'r boblogaeth dros 50 oed wedi'u cofrestru fel rhai sydd â salwch hirdymor neu sy'n anabl. Dim ond 62 y cant o gyfartaledd Ewrop yw'r cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen. Golyga hynny fod y Cymoedd ymhlith yr ardaloedd tlotaf yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Mae disgwyliad einioes bum mlynedd yn llai na chyfartaledd yr UE ac yng Nghymru mae'r gyfran uchaf o

and the transport system is wholly inadequate.

Various initiatives have failed to get to grip with the real issues. Of the various initiatives currently in operation, the majority are general programmes that do not concentrate wholly on regenerating the Valleys. The launch of New Labour's Valleys First group recently was a cheap publicity stunt by a party whose policies continue to be generated towards boosting the prosperous regions of south-east England. In contrast, Plaid Cymru is developing a comprehensive and co-ordinated policy strategy that can be implemented on day one of a Plaid Cymru Government in the National Assembly.

The potential offered by Valleys communities is enormous. I firmly believe that releasing this potential is the key to the economic progress of Wales as a whole. Plaid Cymru has consistently called for a review of the many different strategies that have attempted but failed to tackle the acute problems of the Valleys. There is currently confusion and duplication of work. The number of initiatives must be reduced and simplified. There must be simpler approaches to the funding maze. For example, funding could be brought together in one pot, with adequate resources over a long period of time. We could also remove the need for groups to bid for money.

As the Valleys' needs are so great and the problems so acute, one integrated strategy is needed to regenerate those communities. This strategy must ensure polycentric development. Therefore, a coherent plan for locating employment opportunities must be adopted and an appropriate public transport system must be developed. If properly used, Communities First could help to address some of the problems of deprived communities. However, it must have an all-round, holistic approach. It must not be just another programme to answer the communities' needs in one particular field. It must cover all areas of deprivation.

I declare an interest as the leader of Rhondda

dai anaddas. Nid oes gan un o bob tri pherson unrhyw gymwysterau academaidd ac mae'r system drafndiaeth yn hollol annigonol.

Mae mentrau amrywiol wedi methu â mynd i'r afael â'r gwir faterion. O'r mentrau amrywiol sydd ar waith ar hyn o bryd, rhaglenni cyffredinol yw'r rhan fwyaf nad ydym yn canolbwyntio'n llwyr ar adfywio'r Cymoedd. Yr oedd lansio grŵp y Cymoedd yn Gyntaf Llafur Newydd yn ddiweddar yn sbloet hysbysebu gwael gan blaid y mae ei pholisiau yn parhau i gael eu llunio i hybu rhanbarthau ffyniannus de ddwyrain Lloegr. I'r gwrthwyneb, mae Plaid Cymru yn datblygu strategaeth polisi gydgysylltiedig y gellir ei gweithredu ar ddiwrnod cyntaf Llywodraeth Plaid Cymru yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

Mae'r potensial a gynigir gan gymunedau'r Cymoedd yn enfawr. Credaf yn bendant mai rhyddhau'r potensial hwn yw'r allwedd i gynnydd economaidd Cymru gyfan. Mae Plaid Cymru wedi galw'n gyson am adolygiad o'r llu o strategaethau gwahanol sydd wedi ymdrechu ond wedi methu â mynd i'r afael â phroblemau enbyd y Cymoedd. Ar hyn o bryd ceir dryswch a dyblygir gwaith. Rhaid lleihau nifer y mentrau a'u symleiddio. Rhaid cael ymagweddau symlach tuag at y ddrysfariannu. Er enghraifft, gellid rhoi'r arian i gyd mewn un gronfa, gyda digon o adnoddau dros gyfnod hir o amser. Gallem hefyd ddileu'r angen i grwpiau wneud cais am arian.

Gan fod anghenion y Cymoedd gymaint a'r problemau mor enbyd, mae angen un strategaeth integredig i adfywio'r cymunedau hynny. Rhaid i'r strategaeth hon sicrhau datblygiad lluosganolog. Felly, rhaid mabwysiadu cynllun cydlynol ar gyfer lleoli cyfleoedd cyflogaeth a rhaid datblygu system trafndiaeth gyhoeddus briodol. O'i defnyddio'n briodol, gallai Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf helpu i fynd i'r afael â rhai o broblemau cymunedau difreintiedig. Fodd bynnag, rhaid iddi fabwysiadu ymagwedd gyffredinol, gyfannol. Rhaid iddi beidio â bod yn rhaglen arall i ateb anghenion cymunedau mewn un maes penodol. Rhaid iddi gwmpasu pob ardal ddifreintiedig.

Datganaf fuddiant fel arweinydd Cyngor

Cynon Taff County Borough Council. The council's Communities First bid includes an innovative element which has now been taken on board by the National Assembly for adoption across Wales, namely the establishment of one central development fund for use by all groups who are to benefit from Communities First funding. This is a good example of how simplifying and streamlining the funding can be of benefit to every community in Wales.

I am disappointed that the acute needs of Valleys communities have been ignored in the Government's strategy.

Brian Gibbons: Phil Williams is right to say that partnership was crucial to the economic development of the Irish Republic. The Conservatives will never be able to get on that bandwagon because they do not believe in that type of politics. However, I do not think that Phil is right to say that there was an economic development board in Ireland at any stage. Now, even though there are several partnership bodies in Ireland, there is no particular partnership body akin to the economic development board to which Phil referred in his initial contribution.

This is an improved document, although I do not think that it represents the seismic change that the opposition parties would like. I welcome the shift towards an emphasis on increasing the number of well-paid jobs, rather than seeking to narrow the gap within the UK. To a certain extent, narrowing the gap within the UK is nit-picking, particularly as the UK economy, and even the Welsh economy, is out-performing that of the other G7 countries, the Euro zone and the member-countries of the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development in terms of levels of unemployment, inflation and GDP growth. Even within the UK, the December round of statistics from the Office of National Statistics show that there has been a decline of 7,000 claimant counts in Wales. This means that Wales, on the International Labour Organisation count, now has the fifth lowest level of unemployment of the 12 regions of England and Wales. Over the last year, using the ILO count again, Wales has the second highest reduction in the level of unemployment in England and Wales.

Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf. Mae cais y cyngor ar gyfer Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf yn cynnwys elfen arloesol a ystyriwyd gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i'w mabwysiadu ledled Cymru, sef sefydlu un gronfa ddatblygu ganolog i'w defnyddio gan bob grŵp sydd i elwa ar arian Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf. Mae hon yn enghraifft dda o'r modd y gall symleiddio a rhesymoli'r arian fod yn fuddiol i bob cymuned yng Nghymru.

Yr wyf yn siomedig bod anghenion enbyd cymunedau'r Cymoedd wedi eu hanwybyddu o fewn strategaeth y Llywodraeth.

Brian Gibbons: Mae Phil Williams yn iawn i ddweud bod y bartneriaeth yn holl bwysig i ddatblygiad economaidd Gweriniaeth Iwerddon. Ni fydd y Ceidwadwyr byth yn gallu ymuno â hwy gan nad ydynt yn credu yn y math hwnnw o wleidyddiaeth. Fodd bynnag, ni chredaf fod Phil yn iawn i ddweud bod bwrdd datblygu economaidd wedi bod yn Iwerddon ar unrhyw adeg. Yn awr, er bod sawl corff partneriaeth yn Iwerddon, nid oes un corff partneriaeth penodol sy'n debyg i'r bwrdd datblygu economaidd y cyfeiriodd Phil ato yn ei gyfraniad cychwynnol.

Mae hon yn ddogfen well, er na chredaf ei bod yn cynrychioli'r newid seismig y byddai pleidiau'r gwrthbleidiau yn hoffi ei weld. Croesawaf y cam tuag at bwyslais ar gynyddu nifer y swyddi â chyflogau da, yn hytrach na cheisio cau'r gagendor o fewn y DU. I ryw raddau, hollti blew yw cau'r gagendor o fewn y DU, yn arbennig gan fod economi'r DU, a hyd yn oed economi Cymru yn cyflawni'n well na gwledydd eraill y G7, parth yr Ewro a'r gwledydd sy'n aelodau o'r Sefydliad dros Gydweithrediad a Datblygiad Economaidd o ran lefelau diweithdra, chwyddiant a thwf CMC. Hyd yn oed o fewn y DU, dengys y cylch o ystadegau gan y Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol ym mis Rhagfyr fod 7,000 yn llai o hawlwyd yng Nghymru. Golyga hyn fod gan Gymru, o ran y Sefydliad Llafur Rhyngwladol, y pumed lefel isaf o ddiweithdra ymhlith y 12 rhanbarth yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, gan ddefnyddio cyfrif y Sefydliad Llafur Rhyngwladol eto, mae gan Gymru yr ail ostyngiad mwyaf yn y lefel diweithdra yng Nghymru a Lloegr.

We are seeing good economic performance— Gwelwn berfformiad economaidd da—

Alun Cairns *rose*—

Brian Gibbons: I will not give way. A total of 10,000 additional jobs have been created in Wales over the last 12 months. Given that, I do not think that the target of creating 135,000 jobs, as outlined in this document, is anything like as woefully ambitious as Ron Davies would have us believe. We have created 10,000 jobs even though we have suffered problems with manufacturing, the strong pound, foot and mouth disease, the general decline in the US and the international economy and the aftermath of the events of September 11. This record of achievement, in the face of severe and adverse objective economic conditions, should give us some confidence that our ambitious target may be achieved.

I am slightly disappointed with the lack of emphasis on manufacturing in the document. One great advantage of manufacturing in Wales is that it is a relatively well-paid, high technology-gearred sector of our economy. More importantly from the point of tackling economic inactivity, manufacturing industry is more easily moved towards the areas of economic inactivity such as the Valleys than industries such as the service industry. The service industry, by and large, must go where the population with disposable income is based, and I do not think that that will readily solve the problems in Wales, where the levels of economic inactivity are greatest. However, some elements of the service sector are amenable to dealing with the levels of economic inactivity in our areas of greatest need, namely the public sector. We have forgotten, to a large extent, over the last few years, that the public sector is a port and source of job creation. Fortuitously, particularly for the public sector, the areas where it needs to be concentrating its activities are the very areas where economic inactivity is lowest. In other words, we need strong public services in the most socially and economically deprived parts of Wales. If we place greater emphasis on promoting the public sector as a source of job creation, we may be able to create critical economic mass in those communities, which may kick start

Alun Cairns *a gododd*—

Brian Gibbons: Nid ildiaf. Crëwyd cyfanswm o 10,000 o swyddi ychwanegol yng Nghymru dros y 12 mis diwethaf. O gofio hynny, ni chredaf fod y targed o greu 135,000 o swyddi, fel yr amlinellwyd yn y ddogfen hon, mor druenus o uchelgeisiol ag y byddai Ron Davies yn dymuno inni ei gredu. Yr ydym wedi creu 10,000 o swyddi er inni gael problemau ym maes gweithgynhyrchu, y bunt gref, clwy'r traed a'r genau, y dirywiad cyffredinol yn yr UD a'r economi ryngwladol a'r sefyllfa yn sgîl digwyddiadau Medi 11. Dylai'r cofnod hwn o gyflawniad, yn wyneb amodau economaidd gwrthrychol difrifol ac andwyol, roi rhywfaint o hyder inni y gallwn gyrraedd ein targed uchelgeisiol.

Yr wyf ychydig yn siomedig gyda'r diffyg pwyslais ar weithgynhyrchu yn y ddogfen. Un fantais fawr sydd gan y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru yw ei fod mewn sector o'n heconomi lle mae'r cyflogau yn eithaf da, gyda'r pwyslais ar dechnoleg fodern. Yn bwysicach o safbwynt mynd i'r afael ag anweithgarwch economaidd, gellir symud y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu yn haws i ardaloedd o anweithgarwch economaidd fel y Cymoedd yn hytrach na diwydiannau fel y diwydiant gwasanaethu. Rhaid i'r diwydiant gwasanaethu, i raddau helaeth, fynd i'r manau lle y mae pobl ag incwm i'w wario yn byw, ac ni chredaf y bydd hynny'n datrys y problemau yn hawdd yng Nghymru, lle mae lefelau anweithgarwch economaidd yn uwch. Fodd bynnag, gall elfennau o'r sector gwasanaethu delio â lefelau anweithgarwch economaidd yn ein hardaloedd lle mae'r angen mwyaf, sef y sector cyhoeddus. Yr ydym wedi anghofio, i raddau helaeth, dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf, bod y sector cyhoeddus yn borth ac yn ffynhonnell ar gyfer creu swyddi. Yn ffodus, yn arbennig i'r sector cyhoeddus, yr ardaloedd lle mae angen iddo ganolbwyntio ei weithgareddau ynddynt yw'r union ardaloedd lle mae anweithgarwch economaidd ar ei isaf. Mewn geiriau eraill, mae angen gwasanaethau cyhoeddus cryf yn y rhannau mwyaf

sustainable renewal.

Finally, as part of the public sector's job creation exercise, the Assembly should give more consideration to devolving its central administrative tasks to the more economically deprived regions of Wales. If we adopt this more holistic strategy, we will achieve these ambitious targets.

11:55 a.m.

William Graham: I welcome many points in this document, particularly—and I hope that the Minister will take this on board—the help given to small and medium-sized enterprises. That is a way forward for Wales, particularly if we focus on the growth of indigenous businesses. Those two items are made clear in the document and are vital for the future.

Will you publicise to greater effect the training grants that are available? Various businesses receive the papers, but they do not focus the imagination on the purpose of these grants. They do not just provide a day off in the week; their purpose is to provide an opportunity to gain more information to develop the job and to improve the entire business operation.

I also ask the Minister to re-negotiate with the Treasury, because I detect the dead hand of the Treasury yet again in respect of the lack of research and development grants and operating aids in general. Research and development is particularly important in all sectors of the economy. In Wales, there are only about 20 firms of which it can truly be said that they have an effective research and development unit. This has led to significant job losses in my part of the world, with Park Davies, a major pharmaceutical firm, losing its manufacturing base because intense competition forced it out of its particular part of the market. If it had had a research and development unit, it would have been able to

difreintiedig yn gymdeithasol ac yn economaidd yng Nghymru. Os rhoddwn fwy o bwyslais ar hyrwyddo'r sector cyhoeddus fel ffynhonnell o greu swyddi, efallai y gallwn greu mas critigol economaidd yn y cymunedau hynny, a all gychwyn ar broses o adnewyddu cynaliadwy.

I gloi, fel rhan o ymarfer creu swyddi yn y sector cyhoeddus, dylai'r Cynulliad roi mwy o ystyriaeth i ddatganoli ei dasgau gweinyddol canolog i'r rhanbarthau o Gymru sy'n fwy difreintiedig yn economaidd. Os mabwysiadwn y strategaeth fwy cyfannol hon, byddwn yn cyflawni'r targedau uchelgeisiol hyn.

William Graham: Croesawaf lawer o bwyntiau yn y ddogfen hon, yn arbennig—a gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn ystyried hyn—yr help a roddir i fentrau bach a chanolig eu maint. Mae hynny'n ffordd ymlaen i Gymru, yn arbennig os canolbwyntiwn ar dwf busnesau cynhenid. Eglurir y ddwy eitem honno yn y ddogfen ac maent yn holl bwysig i'r dyfodol.

A wnewch chi roi gwell cyhoeddusrwydd i'r grantiau hyfforddi sydd ar gael? Mae amryw o fusnesau yn cael y papurau, ond nid ydynt yn canolbwyntio'r dychymyg ar ddiben y grantiau hyn. Nid diwrnod i ffwrdd o'r gwaith bob wythnos yn unig a ddarparant; eu diben yw rhoi cyfle i gael mwy o wybodaeth i ddatblygu'r swydd a gwella'r gweithrediad busnes yn gyfan gwbl.

Gofynnaf eto i'r Gweinidog ailnegodi gyda'r Trysorlys, oherwydd synhwyrac law farw y Trysorlys unwaith eto mewn perthynas â'r diffyg ymchwil a'r grantiau datblygu a'r cymhorthion gweithredu yn gyffredinol. Mae ymchwil a datblygu yn holl bwysig ym mhob sector o'r economi. Yng Nghymru, dim ond tua 20 o gwmnïau sydd ag uned ymchwil a datblygu effeithiol. Mae hyn wedi arwain at golledion swyddi mawr yn fy rhan i o'r byd, gyda Park Davies, sy'n gwmni fferyllol amlwg, yn colli ei ganolfan weithgynhyrchu gan fod cystadleuaeth ffyrnig wedi ei wthio allan o'i ran benodol ef o'r farchnad. Pe bai uned ymchwil a datblygu wedi bod ganddo, byddai wedi gallu cystadlu ar sail fyd-eang.

compete on a worldwide basis. I ask that the Minister takes this on board, particularly, when negotiating with the Treasury.

Finally, I commend what Ron Davies said about Father Christmas. I happen to believe in him; after all, he is a particularly good entrepreneur with an amazing supply chain and unbelievable transport links.

John Griffiths: Much is beyond the control of the Government—any government, anywhere—when it comes to economic development, but there is also much that the Government can do to set the right framework, for example, within which business and enterprise can flourish. I will touch on three areas: responding to change, transport and macroeconomics.

In responding to change in employment, we must seek to hang on to the jobs we have, while diversifying and creating new jobs. When crises arise, such as that in the steel industry, the response must be urgent and comprehensive. Representing a steel constituency, I know that the Assembly Government's response is just that, in ensuring that the relevant agencies work closely together, getting redundant workers into jobs and training, providing general advice, assistance and support. The sub-regional regeneration strategy in south-east Wales has already achieved an impressive example of bodies working together, with the Assembly Government, consultants, local authorities and relevant agencies offering a model for a wide, constructive view, leaving parochialism behind. It is referred to in 'A Winning Wales' as a model that may be rolled out across Wales. It is joined-up, strategic, regional regeneration—a model for the future.

On transport, it is important to spread prosperity across Wales. To facilitate that for west Wales and the Valleys, we must urgently address the traffic congestion on the M4 around Newport, which has long been identified as a major problem. It is a nettle that must be grasped urgently. On macroeconomics, one aspect that casts a long shadow over 'A Winning Wales' is the euro. The partnership between the Labour-led

Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ystyried hyn, yn arbennig felly wrth negodi gyda'r Trysorlys.

I gloi, cymeradwyaf yr hyn a ddywedodd Ron Davies am Siôn Corn. Yr wyf yn digwydd credu ynddo; wedi'r cyfan, mae'n entrepreneur arbennig o dda gyda chadwyn gyflenwi ryfeddol a chysylltiadau trafndiaeth anghredadwy.

John Griffiths: Mae llawer y tu hwnt i reolaeth y Llywodraeth— unrhyw lywodraeth, unrhyw le—pan ddaw i ddatblygu economaidd, ond mae llawer hefyd y gall y Llywodraeth ei wneud i osod y fframwaith cywir, er enghraifft, y gall busnes a menter ffynnu oddi mewn iddo. Soniaf yn fras am dri maes: ymateb i newid, trafndiaeth a macroeconomeg.

Wrth ymateb i newid mewn cyflogaeth, rhaid inni geisio dal ein gafael ar y swyddi sydd gennym, tra'n arallgyfeirio a chreu swyddi newydd. Pan gyfyd argyfwng, fel yr un yn y diwydiant dur, rhaid i'r ymateb fod yn un brys a chynhwysfawr. A minnau'n cynrychioli etholaeth ddur, gwn mai dyna yw ymateb Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, sef sicrhau bod yr asiantaethau perthnasol yn cydweithio'n agos, yn cael swyddi a hyfforddiant i weithwyr a ddiswyddwyd, a darparu cyngor, cymorth a chefnogaeth gyffredinol. Mae'r strategaeth adfywio is-ranbarthol yn y de ddwyrain eisoes wedi creu enghraifft drawiadol o gyrff yn cydweithio, gyda Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ymgynghorwyr, awdurdodau lleol ac asiantaethau perthnasol yn cynnig model ar gyfer barn eang, adeiladol, gan adael plwyfoldeb ar ôl. Cyfeirir ati yn 'Cymru ar ei Hennill' fel model y gellir ei gyflwyno ledled Cymru. Mae'n adfywiad cydgysylltiedig, strategol, rhanbarthol—model i'r dyfodol.

O ran trafndiaeth, mae'n bwysig lledaenu ffyniant ledled Cymru. I hwyluso hynny ar gyfer gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd, rhaid inni ymdrin ar frys â'r tagfeydd traffig ar yr M4 o amgylch Casnewydd, a nodwyd ers amser fel problem fawr. Mae'n rhaid mynd i'r afael â hyn ar frys. O ran macroeconomeg, un agwedd sy'n bwrw cysgod hir dros 'Cymru ar ei Hennill' yw'r ewro. Mae'r bartneriaeth rhwng Llywodraeth y Cynulliad

Assembly Government and the UK Labour Government has delivered impressive economic benefits for Wales such as high employment and low inflation and interest rates. That success should be built upon by early entry into the euro. That would have particular advantages for Wales, given our greater dependence on manufacturing. It is clear that 'A Winning Wales' will be fundamentally affected by what happens with the euro. Wales will be greatly assisted by the UK embracing the euro and being positive and enthusiastic about the European Union in general.

Alun Cairns *rose*—

John Griffiths: I am sorry, Alun, there is no time to give way.

The sooner we join the euro, the better. In conclusion, we hear echoes of 'A Winning Wales' all over the world. Countries across the globe aim for a knowledge-based economy, moving up the value chain, improved infrastructure, education and training, enterprise and innovation. More effective implementation will give Wales a competitive advantage. That will be the acid test. 'A Winning Wales' is an impressive and comprehensive strategy. Let us get on with it wholeheartedly, with a positive attitude, with enthusiasm, energy and commitment.

The First Minister: Thank you to everyone who has contributed to this debate. I will recommend rejection of all the amendments. There is a psychology at work here of wanting to stand on the sidelines, which is evident in the amendments which say 'note' rather than 'approve'. We need the Assembly's approval today if we are to get this strategy off to the right start and get the right message across. We need to build the same unity of national purpose that Ireland had 10 years ago, which has taken it from being a basket case to one of the great boom areas of Europe, if not the world.

Sub-regional targets were mentioned several times. Phil mentioned different areas of Wales that would be left out. Pauline also mentioned the Valleys. The strategy's clear

o dan arweiniad Llafur a Llywodraeth Lafur y DU wedi cyflawni buddiannau economaidd trawiadol i Gymru fel cyflogaeth uchel a chwyddiant a chyfraddau llog isel. Dylid adeiladu ar y llwyddiant hwnnw drwy ymuno'n gynnar â'r ewro. Byddai i hynny fanteision penodol i Gymru, o gofio ein bod yn dibynnu mwy ar weithgynhyrchu. Mae'n glir y bydd yr hyn sy'n digwydd gyda'r ewro yn effeithio'n sylfaenol ar 'Cymru ar ei Hennill'. Cynorthwyir Cymru yn fawr drwy gael y DU i ymgorffori'r ewro a bod yn gadarnhaol a brwdfrydig ynglŷn â'r Undeb Ewropeaidd yn gyffredinol.

Alun Cairns *a gododd*—

John Griffiths: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Alun, nid oes amser i ildio.

Gyntaf yn y byd yr ymunwn â'r ewro, gorau oll. I gloi, clywn adleisiau o 'Cymru ar ei Hennill' ledled y byd. Mae gwledydd ar draws y byd yn anelu at economi ar sail gwybodaeth, gan symud i fyny'r gadwyn gwerthoedd, gwella seilwaith, addysg a hyfforddiant, menter ac arloesedd. Bydd gweithredu'n fwy effeithiol yn rhoi mantais gystadleuol i Gymru. Dyna fydd y prawf asid. Mae 'Cymru ar ei Hennill' yn strategaeth drawiadol a chynhwysfawr. Gadewch inni fynd ymlaen â'r gwaith yn galonnog, gydag agwedd gadarnhaol a brwdfrydedd, egni ac ymrwymiad.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Diolch i bawb a gyfrannodd at y ddadl hon. Argymhellaf wrthod pob un o'r gwelliannau. Mae seicoleg ar waith yma sef ein bod yn dymuno sefyll ar y cyrion, sy'n amlwg yn y gwelliannau sy'n dweud 'nodi' yn hytrach na 'cymeradwyo'. Mae angen cymeradwyaeth y Cynulliad heddiw os ydym i roi cychwyn da i'r strategaeth a chyfleu'r neges gywir. Mae angen inni greu'r un undod o ddiben cenedlaethol a oedd gan Iwerddon 10 mlynedd yn ôl, sydd wedi newid o fod yn wlad gwbl ddiffygiol i fod yn un o ardaloedd ffyniant mawr Ewrop, os nad y byd.

Soniwyd am dargedau is-ranbarthol sawl gwaith. Soniodd Phil am ardaloedd gwahanol o Gymru a fyddai'n cael eu hepgor. Soniodd Pauline hefyd am y Cymoedd. Bwriad amlwg

intent is to play catch-up twice over. Wales should catch up with the rest of the UK, while the lagging areas of Wales will catch up with the average areas of Wales. However, you cannot go for hard targets of this kind. It is like trying to cut up a bowl of chicken soup into slices. You cannot do it because of the number of micro-decisions that are made by businesses in Wales and businesses moving into Wales. You cannot determine that on that level. However, the intent is clear. The areas that have furthest to catch up are the ones that we will assist the most. The spirit is there, and I ask you to come along with us on that front without setting hard, sub-regional targets such as the ones in your press release, Phil, on the strategy that you are preparing. It is too hard a way of doing it.

Ron, your definition of what this should achieve is not an economic development strategy but a Barnett formula revision strategy. That is different territory and is not the purpose of this plan. That is an argument that must be dealt with in its own right, but it is not for the economic development strategy.

Dafydd, yr oedd yn annheg ac yn gamarweiniol dweud bod partneriaeth wedi cael ergyd drom am na dderbyniodd y weinyddiaeth argymhelliad y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd i sefydlu bwrdd polisi economaidd. Derbyniwyd un o'r ddau argymhelliad yn y maes hwnnw sef sefydlu panel cyngor ymchwil ar yr economi, ond nid y llall. Os yw dyn yn ennill 50 y cant o'r hyn y gofynnodd amdano, nid yw hynny'n golygu bod popeth wedi'i wrthod. Yr oedd hanner yr hyn a argymhellwyd wedi ei dderbyn a'r hanner arall heb ei dderbyn, a hynny am wahanol resymau. Yr oedd yr amser yn anghywir ar ôl ailstrwythuro Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, a dim ond wyth mis ar ôl sefydlu ELWa fel corff newydd, a newid mawr arall yn y ffordd y mae ELWa yn gweithio i ddod yn Ebrill 2002. Felly nid oedd yn amser da i sefydlu corff a fyddai'n strwythur arall ar ben y strwythurau presennol, sydd eu hunain yn rhai newydd.

y strategaeth yw chwarae gêm dal i fyny ddwy waith. Dylai Cymru ddal i fyny gyda gweddill y DU, tra bydd ardaloedd o Gymru sy'n llusgo'u traed yn dal i fyny gydag ardaloedd cyfartalog Cymru. Fodd bynnag, ni allwch osod targedau anodd fel hyn. Mae fel ceisio torri bowlen o gawl cyw iâr yn ddarnau. Ni allwch wneud hynny oherwydd nifer y penderfyniadau bychain a wneir gan fusnesau yng Nghymru a busnesau sy'n symud i Gymru. Ni allwch benderfynu hynny ar y lefel honno. Fodd bynnag, mae'r bwriad yn un amlwg. Yr ardaloedd sydd â'r gwaith mwyaf o ddal i fyny yw'r rhai y byddwn yn eu cynorthwyo fwyaf. Mae'r ysbryd yno, a gofynnaf ichi gytuno â ni ar y safbwynt hwnnw heb osod targedau anodd, is-ranbarthol fel y rhai yn eich datganiad i'r wasg, Phil, ar y strategaeth yr ydych yn ei pharatoi. Mae'n ffordd rhy anodd o'i gwneud.

Ron, nid strategaeth datblygu economaidd yw eich diffiniad o beth y dylai hyn ei gyflawni ond strategaeth diwygio fformiwlâ Barnett. Mae'n faes gwahanol ac nid dyma ddiben y cynllun hwn. Mae honno'n ddadl y mae'n rhaid delio â hi yn ei rhinwedd ei hun, ond nid yw'n un ar gyfer y strategaeth datblygu economaidd.

Dafydd, it was unfair and misleading to say that partnership had taken a heavy blow as a result of the administration's refusal to accept the Economic Development Committee's recommendation to establish an economic policy board. We accepted one of the two recommendations in that area, namely to establish an advisory panel on the economy, but not the other. If one is granted 50 per cent of what is asked for, that does not mean that everything has been rejected. Half of what was recommended was accepted and the other half was not. There were many reasons for that. The time was not right after the restructuring of the Welsh Development Agency, and only eight months after establishing ELWa as a new body with another huge change in the way that ELWa works to come in April 2002. Therefore it was not a good time to establish a body that would add another structure on top of the present structures, which were themselves new.

12:05 p.m.

Brian Gibbons made other points about manufacturing. Manufacturing is important. It is one of the great unknowns, if I can put it like that. Until we know whether the pound will join the euro, and at what rate, it is difficult to say how much of the revival of the Welsh economy will be based on manufacturing, including company headquarters and research and development establishments in manufacturing on the one side, and financial and business services on the other. It is the great unknown, and that has an impact on many of the other amendments.

This is a living document and will be subject to revision. That revision will not necessarily be after five years, as I think Jonathan was suggesting, but at any time when you can determine one of the great current unknowns. When you know whether the pound will join the euro, and at what rate, then you can make adjustments in a fair bit of time as to whether you see a greater future for manufacturing and a smaller necessity for going in for financial and business services. That is part of the problem that we face in dealing with this and with any other 10-year strategy. This is not a plan. It is not structured as an old Soviet-style plan. It is a strategy. That is why I recommend rejecting all the amendments. Please support this, because it is too important to play party politics with the future economic prosperity of Wales.

Gwnaeth Brian Gibbons bwyntiau eraill am weithgynhyrchu. Mae gweithgynhyrchu yn bwysig. Mae'n un o'r pethau mawr anhysbys, os gallaf ei eirio felly. Hyd nes y gwyddom a fydd y bunt yn ymuno â'r ewro, ac ar ba gyfradd, mae'n anodd dweud faint o waith adfywio economi Cymru fydd yn seiliedig ar weithgynhyrchu, gan gynnwys pencadlysoedd cwmnïau a sefydliadau ymchwil a datblygu ym maes gweithgynhyrchu ar y naill law a gwasanaethau ariannol a busnes ar y llaw arall. Dyma'r maes anhysbys mawr, a chaiff hynny effaith ar lawer o'r gwelliannau eraill.

Mae hon yn ddogfen fyw a gaiff ei diwygio. Ni ddiwygir o reidrwydd ar ôl pum mlynedd, fel yr oedd Jonathan, fe gredaf, yn ei awgrymu, ond ar unrhyw adeg pan allwch benderfynu ar un o'r pethau anhysbys mawr presennol. Pan fyddwch yn gwybod a fydd y bunt yn ymuno â'r ewro, ac ar ba gyfradd, yna gallwch wneud addasiadau mewn tipyn o amser o ran a welwch ddyfodol gwell i weithgynhyrchu a llai o reidrwydd dros fynd am wasanaethau ariannol a busnes. Mae hynny'n rhan o'r broblem a wynebwn wrth ddelio â hyn a chydag unrhyw strategaeth 10 mlynedd arall. Nid cynllun yw hwn. Nid yw wedi ei strwythuro fel yr hen gynlluniau Sofietaidd. Strategaeth ydyw. Dyna pam yr argymhellaf ein bod yn gwrthod pob un o'r gwelliannau. Cefnogwch hyn oherwydd ei bod yn fater rhy bwysig i chwarae gwleidyddiaeth gyda ffyniant economaidd Cymru y dyfodol.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 1: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue

Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

Ni ddetholwyd gwelliant 2.
 Amendment 2 not selected.

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 14, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 34.
 Amendment 3: For 14, Abstain 0, Against 34.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Dafis, Cynog
 Davies, Geraint
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lloyd, David
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Butler, Rosemary
 Cairns, Alun
 Chapman, Christine
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Ron
 Edwards, Richard
 Essex, Sue
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 4: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 19, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 5: For 19, Abstain 1, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann

Williams, Phil

Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelod canlynol:
The following Member abstained:

Davies, Janet

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 6, Ymatal 14, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 6: For 6, Abstain 14, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Graham, William
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn

Lloyd, David
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 19, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 28.
 Amendment 7: For 19, Abstain 1, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
 Cairns, Alun
 Dafis, Cynog
 Davies, Geraint
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Graham, William
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Ron
 Edwards, Richard
 Essex, Sue
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelod canlynol:
 The following Member abstained:

Davies, Janet

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 8: O blaid 7, Ymatal 13, Yn erbyn 28.
 Amendment 8: For 7, Abstain 13, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Geraint
 Davies, Glyn
 Graham, William
 Melding, David

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine

Morgan, Jonathan

Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Ron
 Edwards, Richard
 Essex, Sue
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
 The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lloyd, David
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 9: O blaid 6, Ymatal 14, Yn erbyn 28.
 Amendment 9: For 6, Abstain 14, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Glyn
 Graham, William
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Ron
 Edwards, Richard
 Essex, Sue
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane

Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.

Gwelliant 10: O blaid 6, Ymatal 14, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 10: For 6, Abstain 14, Against 28.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Graham, William
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen

Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 11: O blaid 6, Ymatal 14, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 11: For 6, Abstain 14, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Graham, William
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Jarman, Pauline

Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 28, Ymatal 14, Yn erbyn 6.
Motion: For 28, Abstain 14, Against 6.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Graham, William
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Dadl Fer Short Debate

Pwy sy'n Llywodraethu Cymru? Who is Governing Wales?

Helen Mary Jones: I feel immensely privileged and extremely lucky to be presenting this, the last debate of our Assembly session for 2001. I have agreed to give Nick Bourne a minute of my time, should time allow.

I have chosen to take as my theme a topic that has exercised us much as an Assembly this term—the nature, the performance, and even the name of the Government of Wales. Some have suggested that this is of more interest to us than it is to the public. However, the correspondence and communication that I receive suggests otherwise. The people of Wales care deeply about how they are governed. While Wales is clearly better governed than it was in the bad old pre-devolution days, the kindest possible end-of-term report could not give the Government of Wales more than a ‘must do better’.

In a purely technical sense, the answer to the question, ‘who is governing Wales?’, is many people—the Westminster Government, the Government of Wales and, of course, local authorities. However, who should be governing Wales? Who should be taking the lead, and who should be setting the agenda? That is the administration’s job, to lead local government, to fight Wales’s corner in Westminster and, further, to inspire and unite the nation. At present, that is not happening.

We have a First Minister who refuses to accept that he needs to do his job on a full time basis. I know that the Government of Wales and the First Minister are bored with this point. They cannot be more bored than I am with it. However, I am afraid that we will continue to raise it until it is put right. Quite apart from all the practical difficulties—we

Helen Mary Jones: Mae'n ffrainc ac yn anrhydedd imi gael cyflwyno hon, sef dadl olaf sesiwn y Cynulliad ar gyfer 2001. Cytunais roi munud o'm hamser i Nick Bourne, os bydd amser yn caniatáu.

Dewisais thema sydd wedi bod yn bwnc trafod amlwg inni fel Cynulliad y tymor hwn—sef natur, perfformiad, ac hyd yn oed enw Llywodraeth Cymru. Awgrymodd rhai ei bod yn fwy diddorol i ni nag i'r cyhoedd. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ohebiaeth a'r cysylltiadau a dderbyniaf yn awgrymu fel arall. Mae pobl Cymru yn poeni'n fawr am y ffordd y cânt eu llywodraethu. Er bod Cymru'n cael ei llywodraethu'n well nag yn yr hen ddyddiau drwg cyn datganoli, ni allai'r adroddiad diwedd tymor mwyaf caredig ddweud mwy na 'rhaid gwneud yn well' i Lywodraeth Cymru.

Yn gwbl dechnegol, yr ateb i'r cwestiwn 'pwy sy'n llywodraethu Cymru?', yw llawer o bobl—Llywodraeth San Steffan, Llywodraeth Cymru ac, wrth gwrs, yr awdurdodau lleol. Fodd bynnag, pwy ddylai fod yn llywodraethu Cymru? Pwy ddylai fod wrth y llyw, a phwy ddylai fod yn gosod yr agenda? Dyna swyddogaeth y weinyddiaeth, sef tywys llywodraeth leol, brwydro o blaid Cymru yn San Steffan ac, at hynny, ysbrydoli ac uno'r genedl. Ar hyn o bryd, ni ddigwydd hynny.

Mae gennym Brif Weinidog sy'n gwrthod derbyn fod angen iddo wneud ei waith yn llawn amser. Gwn fod Llywodraeth Cymru a'r Prif Weinidog wedi diflasu â'r pwynt hwn. Ni allant fod wedi diflasu mwy na minnau. Fodd bynnag, mae arnaf ofn y parhawn i'w godi hyd nes iddo gael ei unioni. Yn ogystal â'r holl anawsterau ymarferol—

heard today about the problems with the national economic development strategy, to give but one example—I am concerned about what message this situation conveys about Wales as a nation. I can think of no other nation on earth whose prime minister feels that the job of leading her or his nation can be done on a part-time basis. Wales deserves a national leader who is single-minded and has his or her eye on the ball; not a multi-tasker juggling too many balls in the air at once. If the First Minister had his eye on the ball, he would perhaps be better placed to deal with the Government at Westminster.

12:15 p.m.

Some of us recall, at the time of the Assembly elections, being promised great things as a result of the close relationship that would exist between a Labour administration here and in London. I think that the words ‘fruitful partnership’ were used. What we have is Westminster setting the agenda and the Government of Wales being forced, for example, to bring forward its half-baked health reform proposals long before they were ready, because of the Westminster timetable. The Government of Wales has also failed to gain Westminster time for simple measures of symbolic significance, such as making St David’s Day a public holiday, or to achieve desperately needed extra power, for example over the railways.

Part of the blame for this shambles lies with the confused, flawed and ultimately unsustainable constitutional settlement. It is little wonder that people remain seriously confused about who is governing Wales, when headteachers can receive, on the same day, two sets of guidance based on the same primary legislative—one from the Government of Wales, and one from Whitehall—particularly when people think that education is a fully devolved matter. That is not the direct fault of the Government of Wales, but it is at fault—with certain honourable exceptions—for refusing to take a leading role in sorting out the mess.

I turn to the relationship with local government. It is beyond doubt that the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities is among the strongest

clywsom heddiw am y problemau gyda'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol, i enwi ond un—poenaf am y neges y mae'r sefyllfa hon yn ei chyfleu am Gymru fel cenedl. Ni allaf feddwl am un genedl arall ar wyneb y ddaear y mae ei phrif weinidog o'r fam y gellir arwain ei genedl yn rhan amser. Haedda Gymru arweinydd cenedlaethol sydd â'i feddwl ar y dasg a'i lygad ar y bêl; nid aml-dasgwr sy'n jyglo gormod o beli ar yr un pryd. Pe byddai'r Prif Weinidog â'i lygad ar y bêl, mae'n bosibl y byddai mewn gwell sefyllfa i ddelio â'r Llywodraeth yn San Steffan.

Bydd rhai ohonom yn cofio, ar adeg etholiadau'r Cynulliad, yr addewid o bethau mawr a ddeuai o'r berthynas agos a fyddai'n bodoli rhwng gweinyddiaeth Lafur yma ac yn Llundain. Credaf i'r geiriau ‘partneriaeth gynhyrchiol’ gael eu defnyddio. Yr hyn sydd gennym yw San Steffan yn gosod yr agenda a Llywodraeth Cymru yn cael ei gorfodi, er enghraifft, i gyflwyno ei chynigion diwygio iechyd hanner-pan ymhell cyn iddynt fod yn barod, oherwydd amserlen San Steffan. Methodd Llywodraeth Cymru hefyd ag ennill amser San Steffan ar gyfer mesurau syml o arwyddocâd symbolaidd, fel datgan Dydd Gŵyl Dewi yn ŵyl gyhoeddus, neu gael y pŵer ychwanegol y mae ei fawr angen, er enghraifft dros y rheilffyrdd.

Gellir rhoi rhan o'r bai am y llanast hwn ar y setliad cyfansoddiadol dryslyd, gwallus ac yn y pen draw, anghynaliadwy. Nid oes rhyfedd bod pobl yn dal yn ddryslyd ynghylch pwy sy'n llywodraethu Cymru, pan y gall penaethiaid ysgolion, ar yr un diwrnod, gael dwy gyfres o ganllawiau yn seiliedig ar yr un ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol—un gan Lywodraeth Cymru, ac un gan San Steffan—yn arbennig pan fo pobl yn credu bod addysg yn fater sydd wedi'i ddatganoli'n llwyr. Nid bai Llywodraeth Cymru mo hynny yn uniongyrchol, ond mae bai arni—gyda rhai eithriadau anrhydeddus—am wrthod cymryd yr awenau wrth ddatrys y llanast.

Trof at y berthynas â llywodraeth leol. Nid oes amheuaeth bod y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau ymhlith y cymeriadau cryfaf yn y byd gwleidyddol yng

characters in Welsh political life today. However, there remains a doubt about the Government's willingness to take on the powerful, entrenched vested interests in some areas of local government. What, for example, is being done in the face of allegations about serious wrongdoing at Flintshire County Council. I, for one, would welcome a few more 'policy pre-emptive strikes'—to quote Russell Goodway's correspondence with Harry Jones—from this Government in relation to local government policy. The Government speaks of partnership with local government. That is fine; nobody can argue with that concept. Any government of Wales would need a positive working relationship with local government. However, in a balanced diet of Welsh political life, we need the salt of leadership as well as the apple pie of partnership.

That brings me to the subject of consultation—this Government's other great buzzword. Consultation is a vital tool of democratic government. However, it has its flaws and limitations. It lays policy makers open to the risk of being influenced by those best placed to respond to consultation, who are all too often powerful groups and individuals. It is also possible to over-consult, to clog up the wheels of decision-making, leading to endless delays. Consultation is for the big issues, and there are times when politicians should lead as well as listen. At present, the Government is consulting the nation to death—for heaven's sake, will you get on and do some governing?

Then there are the stupid, unnecessary mistakes that bring the whole Assembly into disrepute. We have a ridiculously long summer recess. What on earth can justify a three-month break? Members of the Scottish Parliament, who are members of British political parties, also need to attend the party conferences. However, they manage their business so that they can do that while the Scottish Parliament continues to sit. There is no reason on earth why we could not do the same, except perhaps that this Government cannot manage its business sensibly and coherently. Debates are pulled at the last minute, with apparently little consultation

Nghymru heddiw. Fodd bynnag, erys rhywfaint o amheuaeth ynghylch parodrwydd y Llywodraeth i gymryd cyfrifoldeb dros y buddiannau grymus, breintiedig sydd wedi hen sefydlu o fewn rhai meysydd o lywodraeth leol. Er enghraifft, beth a wneir yn wyneb honiadau ynghylch camymddygiad difrifol yng Nghyngor Sir y Fflint. Byddwn i, yn bersonol, yn croesawu mwy o '*policy pre-emptive strikes*'—a dyfynnu gohebiaeth Russell Goodway â Harry Jones—gan y Llywodraeth hon o ran polisi llywodraeth leol. Sonia'r Llywodraeth am bartneriaeth gyda llywodraeth leol. Mae hynny'n iawn; ni ellir dadlau yn erbyn y cysyniad hwnnw. Byddai angen perthynas waith gadarnhaol gyda llywodraeth leol ar unrhyw lywodraeth Cymru. Fodd bynnag, o fewn deiet cytbwys o fywyd gwleidyddol Cymru, mae angen halen arweinyddiaeth yn ogystal â melysfwyd partneriaeth.

Daw hynny â mi at ymgynghori—gair allweddol arall y Llywodraeth hon. Mae ymgynghori yn arf hanfodol i lywodraeth ddemocrataidd. Fodd bynnag, mae iddo ei wendidau a'i gyfyngiadau. Mae perygl i'r gwneuthurwyr polisi gael eu dylanwadu gan y rhai sydd yn y sefyllfa orau i ymateb i ymgynghori, sydd yn rhy aml yn grwpiau ac unigolion pwerus. Mae hefyd yn bosibl ymgynghori'n ormodol, gan atal olwynion y broses o wneud penderfyniadau, ac arwain at oedi diddiwedd. Ar faterion mawr y dylid ymgynghori, ac mae yna adegau lle y dylai'r gwleidyddion arwain yn ogystal â gwranddo. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r Llywodraeth byth a beunydd yn ymgynghori â'r genedl—er mwyn y nefoedd, ewch ati i lywodraethu.

Wedyn ceir y camgymeriadau gwirion, diangen sy'n rhoi enw gwael i'r Cynulliad cyfan. Cawn doriad haf sy'n chwerthinllyd o hir. Beth ar y ddaear all gyfiawnhau toriad o dri mis? Mae Aelodau Senedd yr Alban, sy'n aelodau o bleidiau Prydeinig, hefyd yn gorfod mynychu cynadleddau'r pleidiau. Fodd bynnag, llwyddant i reoli eu busnes er mwyn iddynt allu gwneud hynny tra bod Senedd yr Alban yn dal i eistedd. Nid oes rheswm ar wyneb y ddaear pam na allem ni wneud yr un peth, heblaw efallai na all y Llywodraeth hon reoli ei busnes yn synhwyrol ac yn gydlynus. Diddymir dadleuon ar y funud olaf, heb lawer o

with the Ministers concerned; little Plenary time is spent actually making decisions; and important matters are dealt with far too often in statements and not debates.

We have recently had the amazing WAG fiasco. What kind of government pays £7,000 to consultants to come up with a name that makes it a laughing stock? It has contributed a great deal to the national sense of humour during this festive season. The WAG jokes are legion. Some of my favourites include the description of Edwina Hart as 'wag on heels', a combined reference to her sartorial elegance and her status as a driving force in Welsh politics, and Sue Essex as a 'wag on train'—a tribute to her commitment to public transport. As a possessor of more than one chin myself, I draw the line at 'chin-wag' for Carwyn Jones. That is a little unkind, and I prefer the highly descriptive 'welly wag'. To be serious, this name fails to differentiate between the Government of Wales and the National Assembly as a whole. It excludes and distresses the 30 per cent of people who live in Wales who do not regard themselves to be ethnically Welsh but want to be included as citizens. It makes a laughing stock not only of this Government, but of the Assembly. Do I regard the situation as hopeless? No. We must remember that the Assembly has achieved a great deal, for example, the establishment of the Children's Commissioner for Wales, the reform of post-16 education and training and the opening up of the financial books. Much of that, however, was achieved during the days of creative cross-party tension before the establishment of a coalition that has provided stagnation rather than stability and looks increasingly as if its basis is grubby personal self-interest and not policy or principle.

This Government must recapture a vision and re-establish its credibility. A crucial step in that direction would be to bring its Cabinet up to full strength. So, for its end-of-term mark it gets a three out of 10, with concern noted about its deteriorating performance, a 'must do better' and, possibly, detention. To be serious, Wales needs dynamic, energetic,

ymgyngori â'r Gweinidogion perthnasol, yn ôl pob tebyg; prin yw'r amser a dreulir yn y Cyfarfodydd Llawn yn gwneud penderfyniadau; ac yn llawer rhy aml caiff materion pwysig eu trin mewn datganiadau yn hytrach na dadleuon.

Yn ddiweddar gwelsom y ffiasgo WAG anhygoel. Pa fath o lywodraeth sy'n talu £7,000 i ymgynghorwyr feddwl am enw sy'n ei throi'n destun sbort? Mae wedi cyfrannu'n fawr at hiwmor cenedlaethol yn ystod y cyfnod tymhorol hwn. Mae'r jôcs WAG yn ddirifedi. Ymhlith fy ffefrynnau mae'r disgrifiad o Edwina Hart fel '*wag on heels*', cyfeiriad cyfun at ei cheinder teilwrol a'i statws fel grym arweiniol ym maes gwleidyddiaeth Cymru, a Sue Essex fel 'wag ar drên'—teyrnged i'w hymroddiad i drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus. Fel rhywun sy'n berchen ar fwy nag un ên fy hun, nid wyf mor hoff o '*chin-wag*' ar gyfer Carwyn Jones. Mae hynny braidd yn gas, ac mae'n well gennyf y term hynod ddisgrifiadol '*welly wag*'. O ddifrif, nid yw'r enw hwn yn gwahaniaethu rhwng Llywodraeth Cymru a'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol cyfan. Mae'n eithrio ac yn peri gofid i'r 30 y cant o bobl sy'n byw yng Nghymru nad ydynt yn ystyried eu bod yn ethnig Gymreig ond sydd am gael eu cynnwys fel dinasyddion. Nid yn unig y mae'n troi'r Llywodraeth hon yn destun sbort, ond hefyd y Cynulliad. A wyf o'r farn fod y sefyllfa yn anobeithiol? Nac ydwyf. Rhaid inni gofio bod y Cynulliad wedi cyflawni llawer, er enghraifft, sefydlu Comisiynydd Plant i Gymru, diwygio addysg a hyfforddiant ôl-16 ac agor y llyfrau ariannol. Fodd bynnag, cyflawnwyd llawer o hynny yng nghyfnod y tensiwn trawsbleidiol creadigol cyn sefydlu'r glymblaid sydd wedi darparu marweidd-dra yn hytrach na sefydlogrwydd. Mae'n edrych yn gynyddol debyg mai hunan-ddiddordeb personol budr sy'n sail iddi yn hytrach na pholisi neu egwyddor.

Rhaid i'r Llywodraeth hon ailafael mewn gweledigaeth ac ailsefydlu ei hygredd. Byddai atgyfnerthu ei Chabinet i'w lawn gryfder yn gam hanfodol i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw. Felly, caiff dri allan o 10 am ei farc diwedd tymor, gan nodi pryder ynghylch y gostyngiad yn ei pherfformiad, a 'rhaid gwneud yn well' ac, o bosibl, ei chadw ar ôl

full-time leadership. Raise your game, if you can. If you do not, the people of Wales will judge you in 2003 and hand your privilege and your power to the Party of Wales. We would know what to do with it.

Nick Bourne: I am grateful to Helen Mary Jones for allowing me a minute to speak. I do not want to focus particularly on the Rhodri *dau* jobs issue as that is well worn, but the administration needs to address it with their Liberal allies—all of whom are currently missing from the Chamber. I will talk about our current position, having read Lord Morris of Aberavon's lecture—a good lecture—which says that, certainly in the first year, we did not exercise the powers that we have. That does not reflect in particular on the Government; it applies to us all.

Only one or two of 200 statutory instruments were amended in the Assembly's first year. That indicates that we are not using our current powers. The administration needs to examine that in terms of how we address business. However, everybody has a role in that. We are nowhere near to saying that we should have primary powers or taxation powers, and Helen Mary did not dwell on those issues. However, we do need to consider some of the functions that could be devolved to the Assembly. That has never been a standstill position. It is ludicrous that S4C's funding is still determined at Westminster and that such issues are dealt with by the Secretary of State for Culture, Media and Sport at Westminster; that does not make sense given that we now have a devolved administration here. I also find it laughable that windfarm operators need only to ensure that a proposed windfarm has more than a 50-megawatt capacity to ensure that Westminster takes the decision on it rather than the National Assembly. A Scottish Minister from Westminster came to Wales and determined on the windfarm at Cefn Croes. Functional issues need to be considered.

oriau ysgol. O ddifrif, mae angen arweinyddiaeth lawn amser, ddeinamig ac egniol ar Gymru. Anelwch yn uwch, os gallwch. Os na wnewch hynny, bydd pobl Cymru yn eich barnu yn 2003 ac yn trosglwyddo eich braint a'ch grym i Blaid Cymru. Byddem ni yn gwybod sut i'w defnyddio.

Nick Bourne: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Helen Mary Jones am ganiatáu munud imi siarad. Nid wyf am ganolbwyntio'n arbennig ar Rhodri ddwy swydd gan ein bod wedi alaru ar y pwnc, ond mae angen i'r weinyddiaeth ymdrin ag ef gyda'i chyd-Aelodau Rhyddfrydol—nad yw'r un ohonynt yn y Siambr ar hyn o bryd. Siaradaf am ein sefyllfa bresennol, ar ôl darllen darlith yr Arglwydd Morris o Aberafan—darlith dda—sy'n datgan, yn bendant yn ystod y flwyddyn gyntaf, na ddefnyddiwyd y pwerau sydd gennym. Nid yw hynny'n adlewyrchu'n benodol ar y Llywodraeth; mae'n berthnasol i bob un ohonom.

Dim ond un neu ddau o'r 200 o offerynnau statudol a ddiwygiwyd yn ystod blwyddyn gyntaf y Cynulliad. Dengys hynny nad ydym yn defnyddio ein pwerau cyfredol. Mae angen i'r weinyddiaeth ystyried hynny o ran ein ffordd o ymdrin â busnes. Fodd bynnag, mae gan bawb ran i'w chwarae yn hynny o beth. Nid ydym yn agos at ddweud y dylai fod gennym bwerau sylfaenol neu bwerau codi treth, ac nid ymhelaethodd Helen Mary ar y materion hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni ystyried rhai o'r swyddogaethau y gellid eu datganoli i'r Cynulliad. Ni fu hynny'n sefyllfa i sefyll yn ei hunfan erioed. Mae'n anhygoel bod yr arian a ddyrennir i S4C yn dal i gael ei bennu yn San Steffan ac mai'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Ddiwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon yn San Steffan sy'n ymdrin â materion o'r fath, nid yw hynny'n gwneud synnwyr nawr fod gennym weinyddiaeth ddatganoledig yma. Mae'n chwerthinllyd imi hefyd mai'r cwbl sydd angen i weithredwyr ffermydd gwynt ei wneud i sicrhau mai San Steffan sy'n gwneud y penderfyniad perthnasol arnynt yn hytrach na'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yw sicrhau bod gan fferm wynt arfaethedig gapasiti o fwy na 50-megawatt. Daeth Gweinidog Albanaid o San Steffan i Gymru i benderfynu ar y fferm wynt yng Nghefn Croes. Mae angen ystyried

materion swyddogaethol.

The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies): This is the last debate of this term before the Christmas recess. I will run the risk of providing a serious answer to the question now before the Assembly; certainly one more serious than the serial constitutional navel-gazing usually offered up by Plaid Cymru and offered up by Helen Mary today. Once again, Plaid Cymru is treating us to its obsession with the Assembly's processes, not its policies. However, I welcome Nick Bourne's more thoughtful contribution to the debate. The answer to today's questions, 'Who is governing Wales?' and 'Who governs Wales?', is simple—the people of Wales govern Wales. As Peter Law reminded us in a debate earlier this week, they lend us the power that goes with government. The Welsh people are much more sophisticated than the knockabout stuff offered by Plaid Cymru today suggests. The people of Wales have calculated that their interests are best served if they share that power widely among the different spheres of government throughout Wales. As Helen Mary pointed out, there are different levels of government throughout Wales. One factor that distinguishes Wales from England is our strong sense of ourselves and of having different communities. People in those communities want the issues affecting them to be resolved by their representatives.

In addition, the 22 local authorities of Wales are important political institutions. Welsh people choose to divest much of their natural power to this level of decision-making.

12:25 p.m.

In May 1999, a narrow majority of people in Wales chose to share some of their power in a new tier of democratic Government: the Assembly. We are developing this tier of Government. We are learning to use our extensive powers, as Nick Bourne and Lord Morris have said. We are building our capacity for developing public policy in Wales; a capacity that we did not have previously. However, if we want to maintain the people of Wales's consent for this tier of

Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Hon yw dadl olaf y tymor hwn cyn toriad y Nadolig. Mentraf drwy ddarparu ateb difrifol i'r cwestiwn yn awr ger bron y Cynulliad; yn bendant un mwy difrifol na'r atebion bogailsyllol cyfansoddiadol di-rif a gynigir fel arfer gan Blaid Cymru ac a gynigiwyd gan Helen Mary heddiw. Unwaith eto, mae Plaid Cymru yn cyflwyno ei hobsesiwn gyda phrosesau'r Cynulliad, yn hytrach na'i bolisiau. Fodd bynnag, croesawaf gyfraniad mwy ystyrlon Nick Bourne i'r ddadl. Mae'r ateb i gwestiwn heddiw 'Pwy sy'n llywodraethu Cymru?' yn syml—pobl Cymru sy'n llywodraethu Cymru. Fel y'n hatgoffwyd gan Peter Law mewn dadl yn gynharach yr wythnos hon, hwy sy'n rhoi'r pŵer inni sy'n mynd law yn llaw â llywodraeth. Mae pobl Cymru yn llawer mwy soffistigedig na'r hyn a awgrymir gan y sylwadau bant-â-hi a gynigiwyd gan Blaid Cymru heddiw. Mae pobl Cymru wedi dod i'r casgliad mai drwy rannu'r pŵer hwnnw yn gyffredinol ymhlith y gwahanol elfennau o'r llywodraeth ledled Cymru y gwasanaethir eu buddiannau orau. Fel y nododd Helen Mary, mae yna wahanol lefelau o lywodraeth ledled Cymru. Un ffactor sy'n gwahaniaethu Cymru a Lloegr yw ein hymdeimlad cryf ohonom ni ein hunain a jbod gennym wahanol gymunedau. Mae pobl yn y cymunedau hynny am i'w cynrychiolwyr ddatrys y materion sy'n effeithio arnynt hwy.

Yn ogystal, mae'r 22 o awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru yn sefydliadau gwleidyddol pwysig. Mae pobl Cymru yn dewis rhoi llawer o'u pŵer naturiol hwy i'r lefel hon o wneud penderfyniadau.

Ym Mai 1999, dewisodd lleiafrif bach o bobl yng Nghymru i rannu rhywfaint o'u pŵer â haenen newydd o Lywodraeth ddemocrataidd: y Cynulliad. Yr ydym wrthi'n datblygu'r haenen hon o Lywodraeth. Yr ydym yn dysgu i ddefnyddio ein pwerau helaeth, fel y dywedodd Nick Bourne a'r Arglwydd Morris. Yr ydym yn cynyddu ein gallu i ddatblygu polisi cyhoeddus yng Nghymru; gallu nad oedd gennym cyn hynny. Fodd bynnag, os ydym am gynnal

Government, we must concentrate on what we can and are doing instead of worrying obsessively about what we think that we cannot achieve within the current constitutional settlement.

In the first year of the Assembly's existence, we had a minority administration. According to Phil Williams, that was the period he enjoyed most as an Assembly Member—I wonder why. Disillusionment obviously set in for him when a majority administration was formed as a result of the partnership between my party and the Welsh Liberal Democrats. Under that partnership, and with Rhodri Morgan's effective leadership, we have been able to deliver on what we have achieved in the Assembly's early days. These achievements include getting Objective 1 status for the south Wales Valleys and the communities that I represent, and the rural areas of north and west Wales. Plaid Cymru said that we would never get it; we did. Plaid Cymru said that we would never get the necessary increased money from the Treasury; we did. Plaid Cymru said that we could not spend that money; we are. The Conservatives, when they had the chance, were not up to it. Plaid Cymru could not do it. We are doing it. No wonder Phil Williams is disillusioned.

I am also convinced that the people of Wales will continue to want to place some of their sovereignty in a tier of government for the United Kingdom. The role of that tier has changed and will continue to change; but it will remain significant. It is part of our sense of us as a people, part of our identity. Increasingly, the peoples of Europe are choosing to share sovereignty with different forms of European governance, including regional government. I believe that over time, that will develop further, but always with limits. There will be an opportunity early in the new year for the Assembly to be part of the debate in Wales on European governance. We now have the maturity to add value to that debate.

From travelling throughout Wales, my

caniatâd pobl Cymru i'r haenen hon o Lywodraeth, rhaid inni ganolbwyntio ar yr hyn y gallwn ei wneud a'r hyn a wnawn yn hytrach na phoeni'n obsesiynol am yr hyn y credwn na allwn ei gyflawni o fewn y setliad cyfansoddiadol cyfredol.

Yn ystod blwyddyn gyntaf y Cynulliad, gweinyddiaeth leiafrifol oedd gennym. Yn ôl Phil Williams, dyna'r cyfnod y mwynhaodd fwyaf fel Aelod Cynulliad—tybed pam. Mae'n amlwg iddo gael ei ddadurthio wrth i weinyddiaeth fwyafrif gael ei sefydlu o ganlyniad i'r bartneriaeth rhwng fy mhlaid i a Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru. O dan y bartneriaeth honno, a chydag arweinyddiaeth effeithiol Rhodri Morgan, llwyddasom i gyflwyno ar yr hyn a gyflawnwyd gennym yn nyddiau cynnar y Cynulliad. Ymhlith y cyflawniadau hyn yr oedd sicrhau statws Amcan 1 i Gymoedd y De a'r cymunedau a gynrychiolir gennyf, ac ardaloedd gwledig y Gogledd a'r Gorllewin. Dywedodd Plaid Cymru na fyddem fyth yn llwyddo i'w sicrhau; ond fe wnaethom. Dywedodd Plaid Cymru na fyddem fyth yn cael y cynnydd ariannol angenrheidiol gan y Trysorlys; fe wnaethom. Dywedodd Plaid Cymru na allem wario'r arian hwnnw; yr ydym. Ni lwyddodd y Ceidwadwyr, pan gawsant y cyfle, i wneud hynny. Ni allai Plaid Cymru lwyddo i wneud hynny. Yr ydym ni yn gwneud hynny. Does ryfedd bod Phil Williams wedi'i ddadurthio.

Yr wyf hefyd yn argyhoeddedig y bydd pobl Cymru yn parhau i fod am roi rhywfaint o'u sofraniaeth mewn haenen o lywodraeth i'r Deyrnas Unedig. Mae swyddogaeth yr haenen honno wedi newid a bydd yn parhau i newid; ond erys yn arwyddocaol. Mae'n rhan o'n hymdeimlad ohonom ni ein hunain fel cenedl, yn rhan o'n hunaniaeth. Yn gynyddol, mae pobloedd Ewrop yn dewis rhannu sofraniaeth â gwahanol ffurfiau ar lywodraethedd Ewropeaidd, gan gynnwys llywodraeth ranbarthol. Credaf, dros amser, y caiff hynny ei ddatblygu ymhellach, ond bob amser o fewn terfynau. Bydd cyfle ar ddechrau'r flwyddyn newydd i'r Cynulliad fod yn rhan o'r ddadl yng Nghymru ar lywodraethedd Ewropeaidd. Erbyn hyn mae'r aeddfedrwydd gennym i ychwanegu gwerth at y ddadl honno.

O deithio drwy Gymru, fy mhrofiad yw bod

experience is that people have a real feel for the complexity of plural, multi-tiered government and are broadly content to share power in that way. There are different political traditions in Wales and the UK. The tradition of the Conservative and Unionist Party is different from that which I have been describing. That party takes a more classical view—in my opinion, an anachronistic and simplistic one—of the nineteenth-century concept of the nation state. Rather than the sovereignty of the people, it refers to sovereignty of the state or of Parliament. The Tories continue to use the language of the nation state grudgingly, although I acknowledge Nick Bourne and his colleagues' efforts in moving the debate forward.

Glyn Davies: This is the last day of the Assembly term and I am greatly enjoying your speech. However, do you accept that we have moved on from the century you mentioned? In the Assembly today, our only real criticism of the Government on this issue is that it is not being inventive enough in using the powers in the constitutional settlement, in defining what secondary legislation is and in delivering real power through secondary legislation. We criticise the lack of ambition on serious issues.

Andrew Davies: I do not agree. Members of your party and mine had a private conversation about that issue last night. Lord Morris's comments may have applied a year ago but I do not think that they apply now. We are learning to use our powers and we are increasingly being more imaginative in the use of our secondary powers. We are also influencing primary legislation at Westminster. I still feel strongly that the cart is being put before the horse. We need that policy-making context and culture in Wales before we can seek to influence legislation in terms of developing our powers further.

Many still think in terms of the nation state giving some of its powers to Europe, Wales or even Merthyr Tydfil. That is a constitutional fiction. All forms of government get their power from the people,

gan bobl ddealltwriaeth wirioneddol o gymhlethdod llywodraeth luosog, aml-haen a'u bod yn gymharol fodlon rhannu pŵer yn y fath fodd. Ceir gwahanol draddodiadau gwleidyddol yng Nghymru a'r DU. Mae traddodiad y Blaid Geidwadol ac Unoliaethol yn wahanol i'r un y bŵm yn ei ddisgrifio. Mae barn y blaid honno yn fwy clasurol—yn fy marn i, yn farn anacronistig ac yn or-sym—o gysyniad y bedwaredd ganrif ar bymtheg o'r genedl-wladwriaeth. Yn hytrach na sofraniaeth y bobl, cyfeiria at sofraniaeth y wladwriaeth neu'r Senedd. Mae'r Toriaid yn gyndyn o hyd i ddefnyddio iaith y genedl-wladwriaeth, er fy mod yn cydnabod ymdrechion Nick Bourne a'i gyd-Aelodau wrth ddatblygu'r drafodaeth.

Glyn Davies: Dyma ddiwrnod olaf tymor y Cynulliad ac yr wyf yn mwynhau eich araith yn fawr. Fodd bynnag, a dderbyniwch ein bod wedi datblygu o'r ganrif y soniasoch amdani? Yn y Cynulliad heddiw, ein hunig feirniadaeth wirioneddol o'r Llywodraeth ynglŷn â'r mater hwn oedd nad yw'n ddigon dyfeisgar wrth ddefnyddio'r pwerau yn y setliad cyfansoddiadol, wrth ddiffinio deddfwriaeth eilaidd ac wrth gyflwyno pŵer gwirioneddol drwy ddeddfwriaeth eilaidd. Beirniadwn y diffyg uchelgais ar faterion difrifol.

Andrew Davies: Ni chytunaf. Cafodd aelodau o'm plaid i ac aelodau o'ch plaid chi sgwrs breifat ar y pwnc hwnnw neithiwr. Yr oedd sylwadau'r Arglwydd Morris, o bosibl, yn berthnasol flwyddyn yn ôl, ond ni chredaf eu bod yn berthnasol erbyn hyn. Yr ydym yn dysgu i ddefnyddio ein pwerau ac yr ydym yn gynyddol yn fwy dychmygus wrth ddefnyddio ein pwerau eilaidd. Yr ydym hefyd yn dylanwadu ar ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol yn San Steffan. Yr wyf yn dal yn gryf o'r farn ein bod yn rhoi'r drol o flaen y ceffyl. Mae angen y cyd-destun a'r diwylliant hynny o wneud polisi yng Nghymru cyn y gallwn geisio dylanwadu ar ddeddfwriaeth yn nhermau datblygu ein pwerau ymhellach.

Mae llawer yn meddwl o hyd yn nhermau'r genedl-wladwriaeth yn rhoi rhai o'i phwerau i Ewrop, Cymru neu hyd yn oed Ferthyr Tudful. Ffuglen gyfansoddiadol yw hynny. Gan y bobl y caiff pob math o lywodraeth eu

not from the state. However, just as the Tories make a fetish out of the British state, so Plaid Cymru makes a fetish of our nation of Wales. It is interesting that Plaid Cymru's constitutional navel gazing does not reflect the views of the people of Wales, who are broad-minded and outward looking and want to relate to people at a wide variety of levels. The people of Wales are confident of their Welshness. They enjoy their identity but are not in any way obsessed by it.

What about Plaid Cymru? The rest of us will, I am sure, be spending Christmas singing carols, pulling crackers and eating mince pies. I can imagine that Plaid Cymru members will be spending their Christmas frowning their brows and answering the following questions: Who is governing Wales? Who are we? Why are we here? What is it all about? If I were a member of Plaid Cymru, I might ask myself the same questions. When I listen to Plaid Cymru having those internal debates, I am reminded of some fundamentalist sect—a cross between the Muppets and the Munsters—who has emerged blinking into modern civilisation, but is still obsessed with the beliefs and values laid down by its founding fathers in the 1920s and 1930s.

Ieuan promised us greater clarity on the question of independence and after Plaid Cymru's constitutional conference, we now have it. I quote from *Triban Coch*, the online journal that allegedly represents the left-wing faction in Plaid Cymru. It states:

'Following a close vote of 57% to 43%, it was decided that Plaid Cymru no longer believed in self-government in Wales but believed instead in promoting Wales with "a view to attaining full national status". No other party in the world has this as their aim. Leading the way some called it; ignoring reality others stated. Draw your own conclusion.'

Exactly. That is the authentic voice of Plaid Cymru. There you have it—greater clarity. If only Phil Williams and Cynog Dafis could agree on what they mean by that.

These mock-philosophical questions have as much relevance to the lives of the people of Wales as Plaid Cymru examining its navel in the privacy of its boudoir. What has it got to say on the issues that matter to the people of Wales? Again, I quote from *Triban Coch*:

pŵer, nid gan y wladwriaeth. Fodd bynnag, yn yr un ffordd ag y mae'r Torïaid yn gwneud eilun o'r wladwriaeth Brydeinig, felly y gwna Plaid Cymru eilun o Gymru. Mae'n ddiddorol nad yw sylwadau bogailsylliol cyfansoddiadol Plaid Cymru yn adlewyrchu safbwyntiau pobl Cymru, sy'n eangfrydig ac yn flaengar ac sydd am uniaethu â phobl ar amrywiaeth eang o lefelau. Mae gan bobl Cymru hyder yn eu Cymreictod. Mwynhânt eu hunaniaeth ond nid yw yn obsesiwn ganddynt o gwbl.

Beth am Blaid Cymru? Mae'n siŵr y bydd y gweddill ohonom yn treulio'r Nadolig yn canu carolau, tynnu cracers a bwyta mins peis. Gallaf ddychmygu y bydd aelodau Plaid Cymru yn treulio eu Nadolig hwy yn rhychu eu talcenni ac yn ateb y cwestiynau canlynol: Pwy sy'n llywodraethu Cymru? Pwy ydym ni? Pam yr ydym yma? Â beth a wnelo hyn oll? Pe bawn i yn aelod o Blaid Cymru, mae'n bosibl y gofynnwn yr un cwestiynau. Wrth wrando ar Blaid Cymru yn cynnal y dadleuon mewnol hynny, caf fy atgoffa o ryw sect ffundamentalaid—cyfuniad o'r Muppets a'r Munsters—sydd wedi dod, dan amrantu, i wareiddiad cyfoes, ond sy'n parhau'n gaeth i'r credoau a'r gwerthoedd a osodwyd gan ei sylfaenwyr yn y 1920au a'r 1930au.

Addawodd Ieuan fwy o eglurder inni o ran annibyniaeth ac yn dilyn cynhadledd gyfansoddiadol Plaid Cymru, yr ydym wedi'i gael. Dyfynnaf o *Triban Coch*, y cyfnodolyn ar-lein sy'n honni ei fod yn cynrychioli carfan adain chwith Plaid Cymru. Noda:

'Following a close vote of 57% to 43%, it was decided that Plaid Cymru no longer believed in self-government in Wales but believed instead in promoting Wales with "a view to attaining full national status". No other party in the world has this as their aim. Leading the way some called it; ignoring reality others stated. Draw your own conclusion.'

Yn union. Dyna lais gwirioneddol Plaid Cymru. Dyna chi—gwell eglurder. Trueni na allai Phil Williams a Cynog Dafis gytuno ar ystyr hynny.

Mae'r cwestiynau ffug-athronyddol hyn yr un mor berthnasol i fywydau pobl Cymru â Phlaid Cymru yn archwilio ei bogel ym mhreifatrwydd ei boudoir. Beth sydd ganddi i'w ddweud ar y materion sy'n bwysig i bobl Cymru? Eto, dyfynnaf o *Triban Coch*:

‘For the first time in the party’s history, a commitment to the Welsh language is now explicit in our aims. Yet no mention is made of eradicating poverty, full employment, demilitarisation or peace!’

I could not have expressed it better myself. *Triban Coch* allegedly represents the left wing of Plaid Cymru. However, I note that its initial sponsors include Elin Jones, Geraint Davies, Pauline Jarman and Rhodri Glyn Thomas. Left wing? As Professor Joad may have said on the old *Brains Trust*, it depends what you mean by left wing. At least Helen Mary Jones—and I pay tribute to her—has the good sense not to be included in this nonsense, especially when you read that at Plaid’s constitutional conference:

Nid allwn fod wedi’i mynegi’n well fy hun. Mae *Triban Coch* yn honni ei fod yn cynrychioli adain chwith Plaid Cymru. Fodd bynnag, nodaf fod ei noddwyr cychwynnol yn cynnwys Elin Jones, Geraint Davies, Pauline Jarman a Rhodri Glyn Thomas. Adain chwith? Fel y dywedodd yr Athro Joad o bosibl ar yr hen *Brains Trust*, mae’n dibynnu beth a olygwch wrth adain chwith. O leiaf mae gan Helen Mary Jones—a thalaf deyrnged iddi—y synnwyr i beidio â chael ei chynnwys yn y lol hon, yn arbennig o ddarllen yng nghynhadledd gyfansoddiadol Plaid:

‘The party also took a backward step in failing to promote the role of women in the party. An amendment that abolished the equal representation of women on area committees and the National Council, was surprisingly passed.’

There you have it in a nutshell—saying one thing, but doing another. Where have we heard that before?

Dyna’n union sy’n digwydd—dweud un peth, ond gwneud rhywbeth arall. Ym mhle y clywsom hynny o’r blaen?

When Plaid Cymru Assembly Members meet together, as they occasionally must, they find that they do not have much in common. I quote from Sean O’Casey’s, *Juno and the Paycock*, when Joxer Daly, after a few drinks it must be said, starts philosophising by himself and asks:

Pan fydd Aelodau Cynulliad Plaid Cymru yn dod at ei gilydd, fel y mae’n rhaid eu bod yn gwneud o bryd i’w gilydd, gwelant nad oes ganddynt lawer yn gyffredin. Dyfynnaf o *Juno and the Paycock* gan Sean O’Casey, wrth i Joxer Daly, ar ôl diod neu ddau, mae’n rhaid dweud, ddechrau athronyddu wrtho’i hun gan ofyn:

‘Ah, what is t’moon, what is t’stars?’

In the corner of Bar 38 at lunchtime, I can just imagine that you can hear Ieuan Wyn Jones asking, ‘What is independence?’ To Owen John Thomas, it is a town in Missouri in the United States; to Helen Mary it is not taking any notice of him; to Rhodri Glyn Thomas it is a non-conformist denomination; to Dafydd Wigley it is no longer having to listen to Ieuan Wyn; to Brian Hancock, it is lending 10 pence to Ieuan, if he wants.

Yng nghornel Bar 38 amser cinio, dychmygaf y gallwch glywed Ieuan Wyn Jones yn gofyn, ‘Beth yw annibyniaeth?’ I Owen John Thomas, tref ydyw yn Missouri yn yr Unol Daleithiau; i Helen Mary, peidio â chymryd sylw ohono ydyw; i Rhodri Glyn Thomas, enwad anghydfurfiol ydyw; i Dafydd Wigley, peidio â gorfod gwrando ar Ieuan Wyn bellach ydyw; i Brian Hancock, rhoi benthyg 10 ceiniog i Ieuan ydyw, os bydd am wneud hynny.

Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales believes in bilingualism, as I quoted earlier. That is why it is called Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales. If Plaid were to apply the principle of

Cred Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales mewn dwyieithrwydd, fel y dyfynnais yn gynt. Dyna pam y’i gelwir yn Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales. Pe cymhwysai Plaid

bilingualism to all matters it would also apply to personal names. I am not a Welsh speaker, but I was told the other day that the English translation of Ieuan Wyn's name is 'Jimmy White'. However, that is as far as the similarity goes. The main difference between Ieuan Wyn and Jimmy White is that Ieuan Wyn has not got a cue.

Instead of worrying about who governs Wales, Plaid Cymru would be better off trying to sort out the internal mess it is in and which makes it such an ineffective force inside the Assembly—as the Liberal Democrat amendment to a motion the other day clearly stated.

Let me finish where I began. The Assembly, and all other levels of Government in Wales, belongs to the people who put us here. That is why bringing government closer to the people is such an important theme in the work of the Welsh Assembly Government. That is why our health reforms, for example, are motivated by the determination to turn the rhetoric of community participation into reality. It takes a confident administration to reach out and distribute power beyond its boundaries. That is what we have in the Welsh Assembly Government. That is our purpose—governing in Wales and for Wales.

12:35 p.m.

Deputy Presiding Officer, may I wish everyone—including, of course, Plaid Cymru Members—a happy Christmas and a prosperous new year, a scenario that will be much more likely under Labour than any other party. I do not know about you, but I am ready for my mince pies.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Although we will not meet in Plenary again until the new year, Committee meetings continue, and we will no doubt see each other next week. I echo what Andrew has just said: the Presiding Officer and myself wish you a peaceful Christmas and a happy new year. That brings today's proceedings to a close.

egwyddor dwyieithrwydd i bob mater byddai hefyd yn berthnasol i enwau personol. Nid wyf yn siarad Cymraeg ond dywedwyd wrthyf rai diwrnodau yn ôl mai'r cyfieithiad Saesneg o enw Ieuan Wyn yw 'Jimmy White'. Fodd bynnag, dyna'r unig debygrwydd. Y prif wahaniaeth rhwng Ieuan Wyn a Jimmy White yw nad oes gan Ieuan Wyn giw.

Yn lle poeni ynghylch pwy sy'n llywodraethu Cymru, byddai'n well i Blaid Cymru geisio rhoi trefn ar ei llanast mewnol sy'n ei gwneud yn rym mor aneffeithiol o fewn y Cynulliad—fel y nododd gwelliant y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol i gynnig rai diwrnodau yn ôl yn glir.

Gadewch imi orffen lle y dechreuais. Mae'r Cynulliad, a phob lefel arall o Lywodraeth yng Nghymru, yn eiddo i'r bobl a'n rhoddodd yma. Dyna pam mae dod â llywodraeth yn agosach at y bobl yn thema mor bwysig yng ngwaith Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Dyna pam, er enghraifft, mae ein diwygiadau iechyd wedi'u sbarduno gan y penderfyniad i droi'r rhethreg o gyfranogiad cymunedol yn realiti. Mae ymestyn a dyrannu pŵer y tu hwnt i'w ffiniau yn gofyn am weinyddiaeth hyderus. Dyna sydd gennym yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Dyna ein diben—llywodraethu yng Nghymru ac er budd Cymru.

Dirprwy Lywydd, hoffwn ddymuno Nadolig Llawn a blwyddyn newydd lewyrchus i bawb—gan gynnwys, wrth gwrs, Aelodau Plaid Cymru—sefyllfa a fydd yn llawer mwy tebygol o dan Lafur nag unrhyw blaid arall. Ni wn amdanoch chi, ond yr wyf i'n barod am fy mins peis.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Er na fyddwn yn cyfarfod mewn Cyfarfod Llawn eto yn awr tan y flwyddyn newydd, bydd cyfarfodydd y Pwyllgorau yn parhau, a byddwn yn siŵr o weld ein gilydd yr wythnos nesaf. Hoffwn adleisio'r hyn y mae Andrew newydd ei ddweud: hoffai'r Llywydd a minnau ddymuno Nadolig heddychlon a blwyddyn newydd dda ichi. Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 12.36 p.m.
The meeting ended at 12.36 p.m.