



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mawrth 4 Rhagfyr 2001**

**Tuesday 4 December 2001**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

3	Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru <i>Questions to the First Minister</i>
22	Datganiad ar Strategaeth Diwylliant i Gymru <i>Statement on a Culture Strategy for Wales</i>
34	Datganiad Busnes <i>Business Statement</i>
35	Pwyntiau o Drefn <i>Points of Order</i>
40	Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion <i>Composite Motion: Approval of Orders</i>
42	Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cyfraniadau Ardrethu Annomestig (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2001 <i>Approval of the Non Domestic Rating Contributions (Wales) (Amendment)</i> <i>Regulations 2001</i>
52	Gofal Plant <i>Childcare</i>
78	Cymeradwyo Adroddiad Grant Arbennig (Rhif 16) (Cymru) 2001 a Chymeradwyo Adroddiad Grant Arbennig (Rhif 16A) (Cymru) 2001 <i>Approval of Special Grant Report (No. 16) (Wales) 2001 and Approval of Special</i> <i>Grant Report (No. 16A) (Wales) 2001</i>
85	Cod y Gweinidogion <i>The Ministerial Code</i>

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were  
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been  
included*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

### **Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru Questions to the First Minister**

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 1 **The Presiding Officer:** Question 1  
(OAQ14408) yn ôl. (OAQ14408) has been withdrawn.

#### **Dadleuon yn San Steffan ar faterion o fewn Pwerau Deddfwriaethol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol**

#### **Debates in Westminster within the National Assembly's Legislative Powers**

**C2 Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Pa systemau sydd ar waith i dynnu sylw'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol at drafodaethau a gynhelir yn San Steffan ar faterion sydd o fewn pwerau deddfwriaethol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol? (OAQ14435)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru (Rhodri Morgan):** Mae awdurdodau'r Senedd yn rhoi dwywaith gymaint o rybudd â'r hyn a roddwyd yn ystod gyrfaoedd seneddol Ieuan a minnau. Erbyn hyn, yn hytrach nag wythnos o rybudd o'r hyn sydd ar y gweill o ran busnes y Senedd, rhoddir pythefnos. Mewn perthynas â'r Mesurau a gyhoeddwyd yn Araith y Frenhines, yr ydym ni fel gweinyddiaeth yn derbyn amcangyfrifon y weinyddiaeth yn San Steffan o ran gweithredu'r Mesurau hynny.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Fe wyddoch mai un o'r dadleuon pwysicaf yn Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Gyfunol ar hyn o bryd yw dyfodol y gwasanaeth iechyd. Trafodir sut i gyllido'r gwasanaeth hwnnw i'r dyfodol ar y naill law, a'r strwythur newydd ar ei gyfer ar y llall. A ydych yn rhannu fy mhryder ynglŷn â'r negeseuon croes a roddir gan Tony Blair a Gordon Brown? Mae'r Canghellor yn dweud bod angen rhoi cyfran uwch o'r incwm cenedlaethol i'r gwasanaeth iechyd, ond mae'n gwrthod derbyn yr angen i godi treth incwm neu ehangu treth ar werth. Dywedodd y Prif Weinidog ei fod o blaid codi lefel gwariant i gyfateb â'r gorau yn Ewrop, ond tynnodd yr ymrwymiad hwnnw yn ôl mewn erthygl papur newydd dros y Sul. Beth yw eich barn chi? A ydych yn gweld yr angen i wledydd Prydain godi lefel y gwariant ar iechyd i gyfateb â chynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y gorau yn Ewrop?

**Q2 The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** What mechanisms are in place to alert the National Assembly to debates taking place in Westminster on issues which are within the National Assembly's legislative powers? (OAQ14435)

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** Parliamentary authorities give twice as much notice as they used to give during Ieuan's and my parliamentary careers. Nowadays, rather than a week's notice of parliamentary business, a fortnight is given. In relation to the Bills announced in the Queen's Speech, we as an administration receive the Westminster administration's estimates with regard to their implementation.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** You know that one of the most important debates taking place within the United Kingdom Government at present is the debate on the future of the health service. Future funding of the service is debated on one hand, while the new structure for doing so is debated on the other. Do you share my concern about the conflicting messages given by Tony Blair and Gordon Brown? The Chancellor says that a higher percentage of national income needs to be spent on the health service, but refuses to accept the need to raise income tax levels or expand value added tax. The Prime Minister said that he supported raising the level of spending to correspond with the best in Europe, but withdrew that commitment in a newspaper article over the weekend. What is your view? Do you believe that the percentage of GDP spent on the health service in Britain should be increased to

correspond to the highest spending levels in Europe?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae Cymru ar y lefel honno eisoes. Mae gofyn i chi edrych ar fathemateg y sefyllfa. [*Chwerthin.*] Yr ydym eisoes yn gwario 8 y cant o'r CMC ar iechyd. Y pwynt pwysig yw'r broses o ymgynghori â'r Cynulliad ynglŷn â'r cwestiwn mawr hwn. Yr wyf yn derbyn pwynt Ieuan mai dyma'r cwestiwn pwysicaf sy'n wynebu'r holl awdurdodau democrataidd sy'n gwasanaethu poblogaeth y Deyrnas Gyfunol. Yn adroddiad Wanless ar ddyfodol y gwasanaeth iechyd—a oedd ym meddiant Gordon Brown wrth iddo roi ei ddatganiad rhag-gyllidebol i'r Senedd wythnos i heddiw—nodir y cynhelir proses ymgynghori gyda'r Cynulliad dros y pedwar mis nesaf. Felly, bydd gennym gyfle i chwarae ein rhan yn y ddadl hollbwysig hon.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Fe'ch sicrhaf fy mod yn gwybod am fathemateg y sefyllfa hon, a'm bod yn gallu gwneud fy ngwaith cartref. Fe'ch atgoffaf o'r hyn a ddywedasoeh wrth Sefydliad Bevan ddoe, sef bod Cymru ar hyn o bryd yn gwario'r un cyfartaledd â gweddill Ewrop, ond nad yw'r gwariant yn agos at lefel gwariant uchaf gwledydd Ewrop. A ydych yn dweud bod gwariant Cymru ar yr un lefel â gwariant Ffrainc a'r Almaen ar hyn o bryd? Mae angen i chi ymddiheuro am eich ateb cyntaf.

Ar yr ail bwynt, os yw Gordon Brown yn dweud bod angen codi lefel y gwariant ar y gwasanaeth iechyd, sut y gellir gwneud hynny os nad ydych wedi penderfynu sut i godi'r arian drwy drethi? A ydych yn credu, yn eich calon, fod modd codi lefel y gwariant i gyfateb â'r gorau yn Ewrop heb godi trethi personol?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid oes unrhyw aelod o'r Llywodraeth yn Llundain wedi gwneud addewid i godi lefel gwariant ar y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol i lefel uchel gwariant gwledydd gorau Ewrop. Cyfartaledd gwariant Ewrop yw'r hyn y bu pobl yn siarad amdano. Os nad ydych wedi sylwi ar hynny, mae'n amlwg eich bod yn darllen y papur dydd Sul anghywir. Er ei bod yn anodd cael cytundeb ar yr ystadegau, gan nad ydynt yn cael eu casglu ar yr un sail ym mhob gwlad,

**The First Minister:** Wales is already at that level. You need to look at the mathematics of this. [*Laughter.*] We already spend 8 per cent of GDP on health. The important point is the process of consultation with the Assembly on this important question. I accept Ieuan's statement that this is the most important question facing all democratic bodies serving the population of the United Kingdom. In the Wanless report on the future of the health service—which Gordon Brown had received before he gave his pre-budget statement to Parliament a week ago—it is clearly noted that a consultation process will be undertaken with the Assembly over the next four months. Therefore, we will have the opportunity to play our part in this crucial debate.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I assure you that I know of the mathematics involved, and that I am able to do my homework. I remind you of what you told the Bevan Foundation yesterday, that Wales at present spends the European average, but that the expenditure is nowhere near the highest spending levels in Europe. Are you saying that current expenditure in Wales is at the same level as that in France and Germany? You should apologise for your first answer.

On the second point, if Gordon Brown says that the level of spending on the health service needs to be increased, how can that be done if you have not yet decided how to raise that money through taxation? Do you believe, in your heart of hearts, that it is possible to raise the level of spending to correspond to the best in Europe without raising the level of personal taxation?

**The First Minister:** No member of the Government in London has promised to raise the level of national health service spending to the highest spending level in Europe. People have been referring to the European average. If you have not realised that, it is clear that you are reading the wrong Sunday newspaper. Even though it is difficult to reach agreement on statistics, as they are not collated on the same basis in every country, we understand that the average is 8 per cent,

deallwn mai 8 y cant yw'r cyfartaledd, a bod Cymru eisoes ar y lefel honno. Felly, mae angen bod yn ofalus yn y ddadl hon. Y peth pwysig yw bod gennym yr hawl i gael ein cynnwys yn yr ymgynghori ar ddyfodol y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Bydd y broses honno yn mynd rhagddi dros y tri neu bedwar mis nesaf. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwn yn cael dadl ar hynny yn y Cynulliad wrth i'r broses aeddfedu.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 3 (OAQ14415) yn ôl.

and that Wales is already at that level. Therefore, care needs to be taken in this debate. The important point is that we have the right to be included in the consultation on the future of the national health service. That process will be ongoing for the next three or four months. I am sure that we will have a debate on this issue in the Assembly as the process matures.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 3 (OAQ14415) has been withdrawn.

### **Gwella Dylanwad y Cynulliad yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd Enhancing the Assembly's Influence within the European Union**

**Q4 John Griffiths:** What strategy will be followed to enhance the Assembly's presence and influence within the European Union? (OAQ14423)

**The First Minister:** The Assembly's presence in the European Union develops continuously. We saw some good developments last week, with Jane Davidson taking part in a European Youth Council delegation, where our youth policies and structures were commented upon as being among the best in Europe in bringing young people into civic society processes. Andrew Davies also led the UK delegation in the joint conference with Commissioner Liikanen on e-government. Tomorrow, the Committee on European Affairs will hold a meeting in Brussels. Therefore, I believe that we are making our presence felt to a greater degree than was previously the case.

**John Griffiths:** I believe that that is undoubtedly true. The story so far is encouraging regarding the Assembly's increasing role within the European Union. What will be the impact of the recently launched INTERREG 3A programme where £40 million will be spent in west Wales and the east of Ireland?

**The First Minister:** The INTERREG programme was originally intended to cover land border areas, so when Wales and Ireland became part of it, three or four years ago, it was thought that it would be an odd programme with 90 miles of sea between both countries. However, it was remarkably

**C4 John Griffiths:** Pa strategaeth a gaiff ei dilyn i wella presenoldeb a dylanwad y Cynulliad yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd? (OAQ14423)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae presenoldeb y Cynulliad o fewn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yn datblygu'n barhaus. Gwelsom ddatblygiadau da yr wythnos diwethaf, gyda Jane Davidson yn cymryd rhan mewn dirprwyaeth i Gyngor Ieuenctid Ewropeaidd, lle nodwyd bod ein polisiau a'n strwythurau ieuenctid ymysg y gorau yn Ewrop wrth ddwyn pobl ifanc i mewn i weithdrefnau dinesig. Arweiniodd Andrew Davies hefyd ddirprwyaeth y DU yn y gyd-gynhadledd â Chomisynydd Liikanen ar e-lywodraeth. Yfory, bydd y Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd yn cynnal cyfarfod ym Mrwsel. Felly, credaf ein bod yn amlygu ein hunain i raddau mwy na'r hyn a oedd yn digwydd yn flaenorol.

**John Griffiths:** Credaf fod hyn yn sicr yn wir. Mae rôl gynyddol y Cynulliad o fewn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yn galonogol hyd yn hyn. Beth fydd effaith y rhaglen INTERREG 3A a lanswyd yn ddiweddar lle y caiff £40 miliwn ei wario yng ngorllewin Cymru a dwyrain Iwerddon?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Bwriadwyd yn wreiddiol i raglen INTERREG gwmpasu ardaloedd oedd ar y ffin rhwng dwy wlad, felly pan ddaeth Cymru ac Iwerddon yn rhan ohoni, dair neu bedair blynedd yn ôl, yr oedd teimlad y byddai'n rhaglen ryfedd iawn gyda 90 milltir o fôr rhwng y ddwy wlad. Fodd

successful and was complimented by the relevant European Commission directorate. That is one reason why the EU was so keen to establish another INTERREG programme, which was approved last Friday—namely INTERREG 3A. I am keen for that programme to continue. When you think of INTERREG, do not think of it as funding for big capital projects. It deals with training and people, and does not involve paying for large items of capital equipment or highways or port infrastructure, even though that might seem obvious. It is about joint training projects for the people of the east of Ireland and west Wales, north and south.

bynag, yr oedd yn arbennig o lwyddiannus, ac fe'i canmolwyd gan gyfarwyddiaeth briodol y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd. Dyna un rheswm fod yr UE mor awyddus i sefydlu rhaglen INTERREG arall, a gymeradwywyd ddydd Gwener diwethaf—sef INTERREG 3A. Yr wyf yn awyddus i'r rhaglen honno barhau. Wrth feddwl am INTERREG, peidiwch â meddwl amdani fel cyllid ar gyfer prosiectau cyfalaf mawr. Mae'n ymdrin â hyfforddiant a phobl, ac nid yw'n ymwneud â thalu am eitemau cyfalaf mawr na phriffyrdd na seilwaith porthladdoedd, er bod hynny yn ymddangos yn amlwg efallai. Mae'n ymwneud â phrosiectau hyfforddiant ar y cyd ar gyfer pobl dwyrain Iwerddon a gorllewin Cymru, yn y gogledd a'r de.

2:10 p.m.

**Phil Williams:** In your recent letter to the Conference of European Regions with Legislative Powers, you wrote,

**Phil Williams:** Yn eich llythyr diweddar at Gynhadledd Rhanbarthau Ewrop sydd â Phwerau Deddfwriaethol, ysgrifenasoch,

'We have no ambitions for direct appeal to the court of justice'

Why does Scotland have a strong ambition to have such rights, and, as you point out in your letter, a legitimate ambition for other regions in Europe, but not for Wales? Is this part of a general lack of ambition for Wales, or is it the result of pressure from London?

Pam bod gan yr Alban awydd cryf i gael hawliau o'r fath, ac, fel y nodwch yn eich llythyr, uchelgais ddilys ar gyfer rhanbarthau eraill o fewn Ewrop, ond nid i Gymru? A yw hyn yn rhan o ddiffyg uchelgais cyffredinol dros Gymru, neu a yw o ganlyniad i bwysau o Lundain?

**The First Minister:** That is conspiracy-theory thinking. That was entirely our decision, as the issue is not relevant to Welsh circumstances. In the meeting that I was able to attend—the first meeting in Barcelona—you could see the almost obsessive determination of some of the other regions. I had no comment on that. They want the right—which is in the written constitutions of countries such as Germany, Spain and Belgium—to be able to go direct to the European Court of Justice. We have said that that is not our main interest. Our main interest is developing the horizontal tiers. We can talk to other regional governments operating at our tier to help to influence the debate upwards via the UK government, and horizontally with the other governments operating at a regional tier in other European countries. We do not need access to the European Court of Justice, and it would not

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Meddylfryd cynllwyniadol yw hynny. Ein penderfyniad ni yn unig oedd hynny, gan nad yw'r mater yn berthnasol i amgylchiadau Cymru. Yn y cyfarfod yr oedd yn bosibl imi i ei fynychu—y cyfarfod cyntaf yn Barcelona—gallech weld y penderfyniad obsesiynol bron oedd gan rai o'r rhanbarthau eraill. Nid oedd gennyf sylw ar hynny. Maent am gael yr hawl—sydd o fewn cyfansoddiad ysgrifenedig gwledydd megis yr Almaen, Sbaen a Gwlad Belg—i allu mynd yn uniongyrchol at Lys Cyfiawnder Ewrop. Dywedasom nad dyma yw ein prif faes diddordeb. Ein prif ddiddordeb yw datblygu'r haenau llorweddol. Gallwn siarad â llywodraethau rhanbarthau eraill sy'n gweithredu ar ein haen ni i helpu i ddylanwadu ar y ddadl ar yr haen uwch drwy lywodraeth y DU, ac yn llorweddol gyda llywodraethau eraill sy'n gweithredu ar haen

be appropriate in a country without a written constitution.

ranbarthol mewn gwledydd Ewropeaidd eraill. Nid oes angen inni gael mynediad at Lys Cyfiawnder Ewrop, ac ni fyddai'n briodol mewn gwlad sydd heb gyfansoddiad ysgrifenedig.

### **Cydlynu Polisi i Wella Seilwaith Economaidd a Chymdeithasol Cefn Gwlad Cymru Co-ordination of Policy to Improve Rural Economic and Social Infrastructure**

**Q5 Eleanor Burnham:** Will the First Minister make a statement on how he is co-ordinating the Assembly's policies to improve the economic and social infrastructure of rural areas in Wales? (OAQ14414)

**C5 Eleanor Burnham:** A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad am y ffordd y mae'n cydlynu polisiau'r Cynulliad i wella seilwaith economaidd a chymdeithasol ardaloedd cefn gwlad Cymru? (OAQ14414)

**The First Minister:** I co-ordinate policy for the Welsh Assembly Government and my Ministers lead on matters in their individual portfolios.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Fi fydd yn cydlynu polisi ar gyfer Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'm Gweinidogion fydd yn arwain ar faterion o fewn eu portffolios unigol.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I am particularly concerned, as are many of my constituents in north Wales, about the lack of information and communications technology infrastructure, broadband and other issues, some of which are too technical for me to mention. This is causing general concern among small businesses. One constituent came to see me yesterday about linking up with Denmark. Apparently, the Danish want to invest in Wales, but we do not have the facilities or the infrastructure. Will you give an assurance that you will press for access to such facilities?

**Eleanor Burnham:** Fy mhryder pennaf, fel llawer o'm hetholwyr yng ngogledd Cymru, yw'r diffyg seilwaith gwybodaeth a thechnoleg cyfathrebu, bandllydan a materion eraill y mae rhai ohonynt yn rhy dechnegol imi eu crybwyll. Mae hyn yn achos cryn bryder ymysg busnesau bach. Daeth un o'm hetholwyr i'm gweld ddoe ynglŷn â chysylltu â Denmarc. Yn ôl pob tebyg, mae'r Daniaid am fuddsoddi yng Nghymru, ond nid oes gennym y cyfleusterau na'r seilwaith. A wnewch chi sicrhau y byddwch yn pwysu am fynediad at gyfleusterau o'r fath?

**The First Minister:** We are lagging behind Scandinavian countries in providing rural areas, and if I am honest, probably urban areas also, with access to broadband. It is critical that European subsidised programmes, such as Llwybr/Pathway—created under the previous European regional development fund, Objective 5b, which covers most of the small towns of rural Wales in a figure of eight, from north-east Wales to Haverfordwest, Carmarthen and back again—have done a good job in providing at least the basic backbone system. The problem is its price, as it is not competitive, and the fact that there does not seem to be the lively demand for broadband here that there is in Scandinavia. The Assembly has taken the matter on board and has responded

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr ydym ar ei hôl hi o gymharu â gwledydd Llychlyn o ran darparu bandllydan mewn ardaloedd gwledig, ac mewn ardaloedd trefol hefyd a bod yn onest. Mae'n hanfodol bod rhaglenni a noddur gan Ewrop, megis Llwybr/ Pathway—a grëwyd o dan y gyn-gronfa ddatblygu ranbarthol Ewropeaidd, Amcan 5b, sy'n cwmpasu y rhan fwyaf o drefi bach Cymru wledig mewn ffigur wyth, o ogledd-ddwyrain Cymru i Hwlfordd, Caerfyrddin ac yn ôl—wedi gwneud gwaith da wrth ddarparu'r system gynhaliol sylfaenol o leiaf. Y drafferth yw'r pris, gan nad yw'n gystadleuol, a'r ffaith nad yw'n ymddangos bod galw mawr yma am fandllydan fel sydd yn Llychlyn. Mae'r Cynulliad wedi ystyried y mater ac wedi ymateb yn gadarnhaol. Yr

positively. We own a fibre-optic link buried under the A55, which we were asked to make available to small and medium-sized enterprises in north Wales. We are in the process of doing that.

**Gareth Jones:** A ydych o ddifrif yn pryderu am y bwllch digidol cynyddol ac amlwg sydd yn ymddangos yng Nghymru, a rhwng Cymru a gwledydd eraill Ewrop? A ydych yn bwriadu diddymu neu leihau'r bwllch digidol hwn, neu ai dyhead ydyw yn unig?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Dyhead yw wrth gwrs, sydd hefyd yn fwriad. Yr wyf eisoes wedi rhoi enghraifft y cebl ffibr optig a gladdwyd o dan yr A55, a sut yr ydym yn caniatâu i fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yng Nghymru ei ddefnyddio i helpu wrth ddatblygu'r cyfleusterau sydd ar gael ar hyn o bryd a hynny ar delerau mwy rhesymol na beth y gellid ei ofyn, oherwydd y gystadleuaeth bosibl rhwng British Telecom a pherchennog y cebl hwn yn y dyfodol. Wrth wneud hyn, dangoswn mai mwy na dyhead ydyw; mae'n ddyhead sy'n troi'n realiti.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** During the past week, the administration announced a bonanza of quangos for the NHS, and you, after expensive consultation, decided that the Government of Wales would call itself the 'Welsh Assembly Government'. Throughout, you continue to hold the two most important jobs in Welsh politics. I notice that in the *South Wales Echo*, even your own party is telling you to sort it out. Peter Law says that it is time you gave up one of these vital jobs. Would this not be in Wales's interest? You could then focus on the problems of rural Wales, such as the foot and mouth disease crisis and the continuing problem with compensating farmers and businesses, the closure of rural post offices, problems with dental provision and the health service. Is it not time to sort it out, as Peter Law said?

**The First Minister:** I am sure that we all share Peter's ambition that there should be an additional Liberal Democrat in the Cabinet.

ydym yn berchen ar gyswllt ffibr optig a gladdwyd o dan yr A55, a gofynnwyd inni ganiatâu i fentrau bach a chanolig eu maint yn y Gogledd ei ddefnyddio. Yr ydym ar fin gwneud hynny.

**Gareth Jones:** Are you seriously concerned about the widening digital divide which is becoming apparent in Wales, and between Wales and other European countries? Do you intend to eradicate or narrow this digital divide, or is that just an aspiration?

**The First Minister:** It is of course an aspiration, which is also an intention. I have already given the example of the fibre-optic cable which is buried under the A55, and how we are making this available to small and medium-sized businesses in Wales to help develop the facilities currently available, and on more reasonable terms than those that could be set, because of the likely competition between British Telecom and the future owner of this cable. In doing this, we are showing that this is more than an aspiration; it is an aspiration that is becoming a reality.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Yn ystod yr wythnos diwethaf, cyhoeddodd y weinyddiaeth doreth o gwangos ar gyfer yr NHS, a phenderfynasoch chi, ar ôl ymgynghoriad costus, y byddai Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei galw ei hun yn 'Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'. Drwy hyn i gyd, yr ydych wedi dal y ddwy swydd bwysicaf yng ngwleidyddiaeth Cymru. Sylwais yn y *South Wales Echo* fod hyd yn oed eich plaid eich hun yn dweud wrthyhch am gael trefn arno. Dywed Peter Law ei bod yn bryd i chi roi'r gorau i un o'r swyddi pwysig hynny. Oni fyddai hynny o fudd i Gymru? Gallech wedyn ganolbwyntio ar drafferthion cefn gwlad Cymru, megis argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau, a phroblemau parhaus digolledu ffermwyr a busnesau, cau swyddfeydd post yng nghefn gwlad, problemau yn ymwneud â darpariaeth ddeintyddol a'r gwasanaeth iechyd. Onid yw'n bryd rhoi trefn arno, fel y dywedodd Peter Law?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf yn siŵr fod pawb ohonom yn rhannu uchelgais Peter y dylid cael Democrat Rhyddfrydol arall yn y



[*Laughter.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order.

**The First Minister:** I am surprised, Nick, that in your list of what has happened during the past week as regards rural Wales, you did not mention that Wales is now free from foot and mouth disease. Was that not worth mentioning? You listed about 10 different issues and you chose not to mention that Wales is now foot and mouth disease free. What is your problem in accepting good news? I do not understand. Christmas is coming but you still cannot recognise good news. You try to give a comprehensive list of everything that has happened over the past fortnight, but you do not recognise that Wales is now foot and mouth disease free. What is the matter with you?

**Nick Bourne:** It is not for anything that you are the chief wag. If you are willing to take the credit for eradicating foot and mouth disease, I presume that you also want the blame for starting it. It is nothing to do with the Government that the foot and mouth disease crisis has ended, as your own advisers said. If it had not been for the Government, we would only have had half the number of problems associated with foot and mouth disease. These are serious issues. We are all pleased that the foot and mouth disease crisis has ended. However, do you not acknowledge that it is time to focus on the end of foot and mouth disease and consider the issues of compensation? Instead of becoming obsessed with naval gazing and allowing Blairite focus groups to advise on what to call this place, it is time that you gave up one of the two most vital jobs in Welsh politics, instead of propping up the Liberal Democrats. Incidentally, Peter Law did not want another Liberal Democrat in the Cabinet, he wanted someone else. Is it not time that you focused on the issues that matter to Wales?

**The First Minister:** What matters to Wales is the ending of the foot and mouth disease crisis. I am pleased that you were willing to say that publicly. I am not sure why you could not say it before. However, you have

Cabinet. [*Chwerthin.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Fe'm synnwyd, Nick, nad ydych ar eich rhestr o'r hyn a ddigwyddodd yng nghefn gwlad Cymru yn ystod yr wythnos diwethaf, wedi sôn fod Cymru bellach yn rhydd o glwy'r traed a'r genau. Onid oedd hynny yn werth ei grybwyll? Rhestrwyd tua 10 mater gwahanol a dewisasoch beidio â sôn bod Cymru bellach yn rhydd o glwy'r traed a'r genau. Beth yw eich problem ynglŷn â derbyn newyddion da? Nid wyf yn deall. Mae'r Nadolig yn nesáu, ond ni allwch gydnabod newyddion da. Ceisiwch roi rhestr gynhwysfawr o'r cyfan a ddigwyddodd dros y bythefnos ddiwethaf, ond nid ydych yn cydnabod fod Cymru bellach yn rhydd o glwy'r traed a'r genau. Beth sy'n bod arnoch?

**Nick Bourne:** Nid yw'n syndod mai chi yw'r prif wag. Os ydych yn fodlon hawlio'r clod am gael gward â chlwy'r traed a'r genau, tybiaf eich bod hefyd am ysgwyddo'r bai am ei ddechrau. Nid oes a wnelo'r ffaith fod clwy'r traed a'r genau wedi dod i ben ddim â'r Llywodraeth, fel y dywedodd eich cynghorwyr eich hun. Oni bai am y Llywodraeth, byddem wedi haneru'r problemau oedd yn gysylltiedig â chlwy'r traed a'r genau. Maent yn faterion difrifol. Yr ydym oll yn falch fod argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau wedi dod i ben. Fodd bynnag, onid ydych yn cydnabod ei bod yn bryd canolbwyntio ar ddiwedd clwy'r traed a'r genau ac ystyried materion digolledu? Yn hytrach na gwirioni ar hunan-werthuso a galluogi grwpiau ffocws Blairaidd i roi cyngor ar yr hyn y dylid galw'r lle hwn, mae'n bryd ichi roi'r gorau i un o ddwy swydd bwysicaf gwleidyddiaeth Cymru yn lle cynnal y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Gyda llaw, nid Democrat Rhyddfrydol arall oedd Peter Law am ei gael yn y Cabinet, ond rhywun arall. Onid yw'n bryd ichi ganolbwyntio ar y materion sy'n bwysig i Gymru?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr hyn sy'n bwysig i Gymru yw diwedd argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau. Yr wyf yn falch eich bod yn fodlon dweud hynny yn gyhoeddus. Nid wyf yn siŵr pam nad oeddech yn fodlon dweud hynny yn

now included that in your so-called comprehensive list of all that was wrong. You could not bring yourself to mention one major issue that was right. However, I am glad that I dragged it out of you, because the people of Wales will finally have heard you say, 'Yes, there was some good news for rural Wales, namely that Wales is now foot and mouth disease free'.

**Nick Bourne:** No credit to you, Rhodri. Christmas is coming and it is all down to you.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives has asked two supplementary questions. I do not care whether it is Christmas or not.

gynharach. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych bellach wedi cynnwys hynny ar eich rhestr gynhwysfawr honedig o bopeth a aeth o'i le. Ni allech gyfeirio at un mater pwysig sy'n gadarnhaol. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn falch fy mod wedi eich gorfodi i'w nodi, gan y bydd pobl Cymru o'r diwedd wedi eich clywed yn dweud, 'Oedd, yr oedd ychydig o newyddion da i Gymru wledig, sef bod Cymru bellach yn rhydd o glwy'r traed a'r genau.'

**Nick Bourne:** A dim clod ichi, Rhodri. Mae'r Nadolig yn nesau, a chi sy'n gyfrifol am y cyfan oll.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru wedi gofyn dau gwestiwn atodol. Nid oes ots gennyf a yw'n Nadolig ai peidio.

### **Cyfarfodydd ynghylch De Ddwyrain Cymru Meetings Concerning South-east Wales**

**Q6 William Graham:** Will the First Minister detail meetings he has recently held with the Secretary of State for Wales concerning south-east Wales? (OAQ14431)

**C6 William Graham:** A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru roi manylion am y cyfarfodydd a gynhaliodd yn ddiweddar gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynghylch De Ddwyrain Cymru? (OAQ14431)

**The First Minister:** I discuss matters relating to south-east Wales with the Secretary of State for Wales, along with a wide range of Welsh and UK issues. We discuss matters relating to south-east Wales, as it contains almost half the population of Wales.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Byddaf yn trafod materion sy'n ymwneud â De Ddwyrain Cymru gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, ynghyd ag ystod eang o faterion sy'n ymwneud â Chymru a'r DU. Byddwn yn trafod materion yn ymwneud â De Ddwyrain Cymru gan ei fod yn cynnwys bron i hanner poblogaeth Cymru.

**William Graham:** You will be aware of the threat, yet again, of job losses in the aluminium industry in Rogerstone. If our worst fears are realised, will you redouble your efforts with the Secretary of State in pressing the Chancellor for additional funding?

**William Graham:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r bygythiad, unwaith eto, o ddiswyddiadau yn y diwydiant alwminiwm yn y Tŷ-du. Os digwydd hynny, a wnewch, ar y cyd â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol, bwysu o'r newydd ar y Canghellor am arian ychwanegol?

**The First Minister:** Yes. We were given this news officially about an hour ago, although it is not definite yet, because it is subject to consultation. However, it is sad that following the redundancies, which took place some 12 months ago in Rogerstone in the major Alcan rolling mills, the company is now contemplating a further 300

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Gwnaf. Rhoddwyd y newyddion hwn yn swyddogol inni rhyw awr yn ôl, er nad yw'n bendant ar hyn o bryd, gan fod ymgynghori yn mynd rhagddo. Fodd bynnag, mae'n drist yn dilyn y diswyddiadau a ddigwyddodd 12 mis yn ôl yn y Tŷ-du ym mhrif felinau rowlio Alcan, fod y cwmni bellach yn ystyried diswyddo 300 o weithwyr

redundancies in the second and fourth quarter of the coming year, virtually halving the number of jobs at the Alcan chief rolling mills. That is sad. If it is as bad as that and, after negotiations, half the jobs disappear during the next 12 months and there is no upturn in the aluminium industry then we will take urgent action to cover that eventuality.

**Rosemary Butler:** What may happen at Alcan is sad, particularly since the workforce has been so productive and co-operative over the years. When you next speak to the Secretary of State for Wales, will you discuss the importance of an M4 relief road for Newport and west Wales?

2:20 p.m.

**The First Minister:** I am glad that we can join in trying to ensure that the right short, medium and long-term measures will be made available to assist the Rogerstone and Newport areas if the 90-day notice period, which begins this afternoon, does not produce any change in the company's plans or an upturn in the industry, or if the losses continue at the Rogerstone plant.

The long-term future of the M4 relief road is a more complex issue because the project requires colossal expenditure and there is a huge environmental controversy relating to the road's route. We would also want to explore other forms of traffic alleviation to see if they would solve the problem of preventing Newport and the Brynglas tunnels, especially, blocking east-west transport between the areas west of the tunnels and the Severn Bridge, and Welsh industry's main markets in England.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 7 (OAQ14431) yn ôl.

eraill yn ystod ail a phedwerydd chwarter y flwyddyn nesaf, gan fwy neu lai haneru'r swyddi ym mhrif felinau rowlio Alcan. Mae hynny'n drist. Os bydd mor ddrwg â hynny, a bod hanner y swyddi yn diflannu dros y 12 mis nesaf, wedi trafodaethau, ac nad oes cynnydd yn y diwydiant alwminiwm byddwn yn cymryd camau brys i fynd i'r afael â hynny.

**Rosemary Butler:** Mae'r hyn a allai ddigwydd yn Alcan yn drist, yn arbennig gan fod y gweithlu wedi bod mor gynhyrchiol a chydweithredol dros y blyneddoddedd. Y tro nesaf y byddwch yn siarad ag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, a drafodwch bwysigrwydd ffordd liniaru i'r M4 ar gyfer Casnewydd a gorllewin Cymru?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf yn falch y gallwn ymuno i geisio sicrhau y bydd y mesurau byrdymor, canolig a hirdymor cywir ar gael i gynorthwyo ardaloedd y Tŷ-du a Chasnewydd os na fydd y cynnod rhybudd 90-diwrnod, sy'n dechrau heddiw, yn arwain at unrhyw newidiadau yng nghynlluniau'r cwmni na chynnydd yn y diwydiant, neu os yw'r colledion yn parhau yng ngwaith y Tŷ-du.

Mae dyfodol hirdymor ffordd liniaru i'r M4 yn fater mwy cymhleth am fod angen gwariant anferth ar y prosiect ac mae dadl amgylcheddol enfawr ynghylch llwybr y ffordd. Byddem hefyd am archwilio mathau eraill o liniaru traffig i weld a fyddent yn ateb y broblem o atal twnelau Casnewydd a Brynglas, yn benodol, rhag rhwystro trafnidiaeth rhwng y dwyrain a'r gorllewin rhwng yr ardaloedd i'r gorllewin o'r twnelau a Phont Hafren a phrif farchnadoedd diwydiant Cymru yn Lloegr.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 7 (OAQ14431) has been withdrawn.

### **Cadeiryddion Pwyllgorau Ewropeaidd y Deyrnas Unedig Chairs of UK European Committees**

**C8 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad am y rhan a chwaraeodd yng nghyfarfod diwethaf Cadeiryddion pwyllgorau Ewropeaidd y DU

**Q8 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Will the First Minister make a statement on his involvement in the last meeting of the Chairs of UK European committees held in

a gynhaliwyd ym Mrwsel? (OAQ14434)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ar 29 Hydref, cadeiriais drydydd cyfarfod Cadeiryddion Pwyllgorau Ewropeaidd y Deyrnas Unedig. Cynrychiolwyd holl bwyllgorau'r Deyrnas Unedig yn y cyfarfod, gan gynnwys rhai Tŷ'r Cyffredin a Thŷ'r Arglwyddi, ac yr oedd yn gyfle gwerthfawr i ni i gyd, yn ein ffyrdd gwahanol, drafod gwaith y gwahanol bwyllgorau ac i archwilio'r cyfleoedd i weithredu ar y cyd. Byddaf yn gwneud datganiad llawnach ar y cyfarfod hwnnw gerbron y Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd yfory.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr wyf yn falch o glywed iddo fod yn gyfarfod gwerthfawr ac y trafodwyd materion pwysig. A wnaiff Rhodri—gan dderbyn y bydd yn gwneud datganiad llawn yfory—rannu gyda'r Aelodau na fydd yn bresennol ym Mrwsel unrhyw argymhellion penodol a drafodwyd yn y pwyllgor hwnnw i sicrhau bod sefydliadau datganoledig fel y Cynulliad yn gallu dylanwadu ar safbwynt y Deyrnas Unedig ar faterion Ewropeaidd pan ei fod yn berthnasol i ni? A drefnwyd unrhyw beth felly?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Byddai'r mater hwnnw yn ehangach na'r prif bwnc a oedd o dan ystyriaeth yn y cyfarfod a gawsom ym Mrwsel ar 29 Hydref, sef y dulliau gwahanol o graffu gwaith y llywodraethau gwahanol. Fodd bynnag, trafodasom Bapur Gwyn Romano Prodi ar lywodraethu hefyd, felly, byddwn yn trafod sut y bydd y Cynulliad yn ymateb i'r mater hwnnw a sut i ddod â'n modd o lywodraethu yn agosach at bobl Ewrop. Dyna flaenoriaeth Romano Prodi ac ni chredaf na fyddai yr un Aelod o'r Cynulliad yn rhannu'r flaenoriaeth honno.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I notice from that meeting's agenda that enlargement was going to be discussed. The Assembly has a clear strategy for dealing with enlargement issues. Will you indicate how our enlargement strategy compares to that of Scotland?

**The First Minister:** How both countries search for suitable partners among the regions or smaller independent countries that intend to join Europe over the next three or

Brussels? (OAQ14434)

**The First Minister:** On 29 October, I chaired the third meeting of the Chairs of the European Committees of the United Kingdom. All of the UK committees were represented at the meeting, including those of the House of Commons and the House of Lords, and it provided a valuable opportunity for us all, in our different ways, to discuss the work of the different committees and to explore opportunities for co-operative action. I will be making a fuller statement on that meeting to the Committee on European Affairs tomorrow.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I am pleased to hear that it was a constructive meeting and that important issues were discussed. While I accept the fact that he will make a full statement tomorrow, will Rhodri share with those of us who will not be present in Brussels any specific recommendations discussed within that committee to ensure that devolved institutions such as the Assembly can influence the UK's position on European issues when it is relevant to us? Have any such arrangements been made?

**The First Minister:** That matter would be broader than the main subject under consideration in our meeting in Brussels on 29 October, namely the different ways of scrutinising the work of the various governments. However, we also discussed Romano Prodi's White Paper on governance, therefore, we will be discussing how the Assembly will respond to that issue and how to bring our means of governance closer to the people of Europe. That is Romano Prodi's priority and I doubt that a single Assembly Member would disagree.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Sylwaf, o ddarllen yr agenda, fod y cyfarfod hwnnw yn bwriadu trafod ehangu. Mae gan y Cynulliad strategaeth glir ar gyfer ymdrin â materion ehangu. A eglurwch sut mae ein strategaeth ehangu yn cymharu ag un yr Alban?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Bydd y ffordd y bydd y ddwy wlad yn chwilio am bartneriaid addas o blith y rhanbarthau neu'r gwledydd annibynnol llai eraill sy'n bwriadu ymuno ag

four years will be fairly similar. Scotland and Wales will try to ensure that a sensible choice is made for them and the partners that they choose in terms of political advancement, economic gain, political compatibility, what they can learn from each other and whether or not there is private sector backing from Scotland or Wales in those parts of eastern or southern Europe already. All those issues will be considered before it is finally decided where we, at the regional tier of government, can best assist the process of enlargement, from the point of view of enlargement itself and that of Wales, or Scotland.

Ewrop dros y tair neu'r pedair blynedd nesaf yn weddol debyg. Bydd yr Alban a Chymru yn ceisio sicrhau y gwneir dewis synhwyrol ar eu cyfer a'r partneriaid y byddant yn eu dewis o ran datblygu gwleidyddol, budd economaidd, cysondeb gwleidyddol, yr hyn y gallant ei ddysgu oddi wrth ei gilydd ac a oes cefnogaeth sector preifat ai peidio o'r Alban neu Gymru yn y rhannau hynny o ddwyrain neu dde Ewrop eisoes. Ystyrir yr holl faterion hynny cyn penderfynu'n derfynol lle y gallwn ni, ar haen lywodraeth ranbarthol, gynnig y cymorth gorau i'r broses o ehangu, er lles ehangu ynddo'i hun, ac er lles Cymru, neu'r Alban.

### Iawndal i Gyn-lowyr Compensation for Ex-miners

**C9 Geraint Davies:** Pa gamau a gymerwyd o ran rhoi iawndal i gyn-lowyr a'u teuluoedd yn dilyn trafodaethau diweddar Prif Weinidog Cymru gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru a'r Prif Weinidog? (OAQ14411)

**Q9 Geraint Davies:** What progress has been made towards securing compensation for ex-miners and their families following the First Minister's recent discussion with the Secretary of State for Wales and the Prime Minister? (OAQ14411)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf yn parhau i weithio'n agos gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ar y mater hwn a chyda'r Gweinidog Gwladol dros Ddiwydiant, Ynni a'r Amgylchedd, Brian Wilson—sy'n gyfrifol am y mater hwn—ac mae'r ddau ohonynt wedi ymrwymo'n gryf i leihau unrhyw oedi o ran taliadau a sicrhau bod y cynllun iawndal i gyn-lowyr a'u gweddwon yn gweithio'n effeithiol.

**The First Minister:** I continue to work closely with the Secretary of State for Wales on this matter and with the Minister of State for Industry, Energy and the Environment, Brian Wilson—who is responsible for this—and both have made a strong commitment to reducing delays in payments and to ensure that the compensation scheme for former miners and their widows works effectively.

**Geraint Davies:** Efallai eich bod yn ymwybodol o ddatganiad diweddar Brian Wilson, pan ddisgrifiodd y cynllun iawndal i lowyr fel cynllun heb derfyn, sef cynllun heb ddyddiad terfynol ar gyfer ceisiadau newydd. A ydych yn synnu, felly, fel y gwneuthum i, o ddeall i'r Llywodraeth ddweud, mewn gwrandawriad yn yr Uchel Lys ddydd Gwener diwethaf, iddi bwyso am ddyddiad terfynol i geisiadau? A soniwyd am hyn yn eich trafodaethau diweddar? A ydych yn cytuno mai dyma'r enghraifft ddiweddaraf o ymddygiad cwbl sarhaus Llafur Newydd o ran hawliau cyn-lowyr a'u teuluoedd?

**Geraint Davies:** You may be aware of Brian Wilson's recent statement when he described the miners' compensation scheme as being non-terminating, which means that it does not have a final date for new applications. Are you, therefore, surprised, as I was, to learn that the Government stated, in a High Court hearing last Friday, that it had pressed for a final date for claims? Was that mentioned in your recent discussions? Do you agree that this is the most recent example of New Labour's utterly dismissive attitude towards the rights of former miners and their families?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ni chredaf fod hynny'n hollol deg pan ystyriwch fod £100 miliwn wedi'i dalu yn yr achosion y

**The First Minister:** I do not think that that is entirely fair when you consider that £100 million has been paid out in the cases which

cytunwyd arnynt hyd yn hyn. Derbyniaf mai rhyw 10 y cant o'r ceisiadau a ddaw o bosibl gerbron llys barn yw hynny, ond cytunwyd eisoes ar £100 miliwn â chyn-lowyr neu eu gweddwon yng Nghymru. Nid wyf yn gyfarwydd â'r hyn a ddigwyddodd yn y llys ddydd Gwener diwethaf. Mae'r mater hwn yn unigryw. Er i chi feddwl amdano fel y Llywodraeth yn gweinyddu, nid gweinyddu y mae yn y cyd-destun hwn, ond cynrychioli un ochr mewn achos llys. Felly y mae'r hyn y mae cyfreithwyr y Llywodraeth yn ei ddweud yn rhan o drafodion llys barn. Nid wyf yn gyfarwydd â hynny, ac nid oes neb wedi siarad â mi ynglŷn â dyddiad terfynol gwneud cais newydd.

**Brian Gibbons:** Do you agree that the original closing date for claims on miners' compensation was last February? However, in an attempt to ensure that all miners got justice, the Government abandoned that date and ensured that hundreds of extra claimants have been able to get fair play and get into the compensation system. Contrary to what Geraint says, the Government is doing everything to enable every possible eligible applicant to make a claim.

**The First Minister:** If we could invent respiratory consultants and pluck them off trees like coconuts off a palm, I am sure that we would have made faster progress. However, it is an awful problem in that there is a limited number of qualified respiratory consultants who can carry out the full medical assessments. You can go so far with spirometry technicians, but if it goes to a full medical assessment, you must have respiratory consultants. There are only a few of them and, unfortunately, it takes 10 to 15 years to train them. We have asked retired consultants to come back into service to help speed up the process but that has not been wholly successful.

The other significant point is that there is a particular problem in Wales in that far fewer miners in Wales have opted for the interim settlement. Miners have a perfect right to do that. This is not a criticism of miners in Wales, or their solicitors, but 84 per cent of miners in England have gone for the

have been settled thus far. I accept that that constitutes some 10 per cent of the cases that may go before a court of law, but payment of £100 million has been agreed with former miners or their widows already in Wales. I am not familiar with what happened in court last Friday. This matter is unique. Although you may think of it as the Government administering, it is not administering in this context, but representing one side in a court case. Therefore, what the Government's lawyers say is part of the proceedings in a court of law. I am not familiar with that, and nobody has spoken to me regarding a final date for making new claims.

**Brian Gibbons:** A gytunwch mai'r dyddiad cau gwreiddiol ar gyfer hawlio iawndal i löwyr oedd mis Chwefror diwethaf? Fodd bynnag, er mwyn ceisio sicrhau cyfiawnder i bob glöwr, penderfynodd y Llywodraeth ymestyn y dyddiad hwnnw gan sicrhau y gallai cannoedd o ymgeiswyr eraill gael chwarae teg a chael mynediad i'r system iawndal. Yn groes i'r hyn a ddywed Geraint, mae'r Llywodraeth yn gwneud popeth o fewn ei gallu i alluogi pob ymgeisydd cymwys i wneud cais.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Pe baem yn gallu creu ymgynghorwyr anadlu a'u hel megis cnau coco oddi ar goeden, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddem wedi symud ymlaen yn gyflymach. Fodd bynnag, mae'n broblem anodd gan mai ychydig iawn o ymgynghorwyr anadlu cymwys a all gynnal yr asesiadau meddygol llawn. Gallwch ddefnyddio technegwyr sbirometreg i raddau, ond pan fo angen asesiad meddygol llawn, mae angen ymgynghorwyr anadlu arnoch. Ychydig iawn ohonynt sydd, ac yn anffodus, mae'n cymryd 10 i 15 mlynedd i'w hyfforddi. Yr ydym wedi gofyn i ymgynghorwyr sydd wedi ymddeol ddod yn ôl i wasanaethu er mwyn cyflymu'r broses ond ni fu hynny yn hollol lwyddiannus.

Y pwynt arwyddocaol arall yw bod problem arbennig yng Nghymru gan fod llawer llai o löwyr yng Nghymru wedi dewis y setliad dros dro. Mae gan löwyr hawl i wneud hynny. Nid yw hynny yn feirniadaeth ar löwyr yng Nghymru, na'u cyfreithwyr, ond mae 84 y cant o löwyr yn Lloegr wedi mynd

expedited claim, and only 64 per cent in Wales. That may be because pneumoconiosis and silicosis is worse in Wales, because the harder the coal the higher the incidence of pneumoconiosis. I am not sure about that, but there is clearly a particular problem in Wales because far fewer miners are willing to go for the expedited claim settlement.

am y cais cyflym, a dim ond 64 y cant yng Nghymru. Efallai mai'r rheswm am hynny yw bod clefyd y llwch a silicosis ar ei waethaf yng Nghymru, oherwydd po galetaf y glo, y mwyaf niferus yw'r achosion o glefyd y llwch. Nid wyf yn siŵr o hynny, ond mae problem arbennig yng Nghymru gan fod llai o lowyr yn fodlon mynd am setliad cyflym.

### **Rhannu Pwerau rhwng San Steffan a'r Cynulliad** **The Division of Powers between Westminster and the Assembly**

**Q10 Nick Bourne:** What discussions has the First Minister had with his Westminster colleagues about improving the clarity of the division of powers between Her Majesty's Government in Westminster and the National Assembly for Wales? (OAQ14422)

**C10 Nick Bourne:** Pa drafodaethau y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi'u cael gyda'i gydweithwyr yn San Steffan ynghylch ei gwneud yn fwy clir sut y mae'r pwerau wedi eu rhannu rhwng Llywodraeth Ei Mawrhydi yn San Steffan a Chynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru? (OAQ14422)

**The First Minister:** I have frequent discussions with UK Government colleagues about new functions for the Assembly. This issue arose last week in answer to Ieuan Wyn Jones's question regarding animal health powers. I am not sure whether that is what is behind your question. I believe that the powers should be set out as clearly as possible. If there are areas where you do not think it is clear, I would be pleased to consider what you have to say.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Caf drafodaethau rheolaidd â chyd-Aelodau yn Llywodraeth y DU ynglŷn â swyddogaethau newydd i'r Cynulliad. Cododd y mater hwn yr wythnos diwethaf wrth ateb cwestiwn Ieuan Wyn Jones ar bwerau yn ymwneud â iechyd anifeiliaid. Nid wyf yn siŵr ai dyna sydd y tu ôl i'ch cwestiwn. Credaf y dylai'r pwerau gael eu gosod mor eglur â phosibl. Os oes manau lle nad yw'r pwerau'n glir, yn eich barn chi, byddwn yn fwy na pharod i ystyried yr hyn sydd gennych i'w ddweud.

**Nick Bourne:** My question is more concerned with the clarity of the existing position, rather than any shift of functions. There are certain areas where the distinction is blurred; I am thinking of closed-circuit television cameras, asylum seekers, agricultural matters and, to an extent, post offices. There is confusion among Assembly Members and the public. It would be helpful to all concerned if it were possible to elucidate the division in a list or by other means.

**Nick Bourne:** Mae fy nghwestiwn yn ymwneud fwy ag eglurder y sefyllfa bresennol, yn hytrach na newid mewn swyddogaethau. Ceir rhai manau lle mae'r gwahaniaethau yn aneglur; cyfeiriaf at gamerâu teledu cylch cyfyng, ceiswyr lloches, materion amaethyddol, ac i raddau, swyddfeydd post. Mae dryswch ymysg Aelodau'r Cynulliad a'r cyhoedd. Byddai'n ddefnyddiol i bawb pe bai'n bosibl egluro'r rhaniad mewn rhestr neu drwy ddull arall.

2:30 p.m.

**The First Minister:** I will make the necessary arrangements to ensure that all Members of the Assembly receive an updated list of devolved and non-devolved powers, and those where there could be grey areas.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Gwnaf y trefniadau angenrheidiol i sicrhau y bydd pob Aelod o'r Cynulliad yn derbyn rhestr ddiweddar o'r holl bwerau datganoledig a'r rhai nas datganolwyd, a'r rhai a allai fod yn aneglur.

**Richard Edwards:** What discussions have you had with the Secretary of State for Wales about the implications for Wales of the new Terrorism Bill? Do you share my concern that aside from the humanitarian questions, Wales will become less safe rather than safer because of this Bill?

**The First Minister:** The new Terrorism Bill contains some sections that I think you, like me, would welcome, namely the extension to cover incitement to hatred on religious, racial or other grounds. That is generally welcome. Many people feel strongly about the fact that the Government, when dealing with perhaps a dozen people at the most, has to get an exemption from the European Convention on Human Rights. There is no alternative way to deal with a dangerous person who happens to come from a dangerous country. That person cannot be deported to that country, and is therefore left walking the streets or has to be detained without trial. Clearly, that is contrary to the European Convention on Human Rights. However, there is a legal device for doing this which the Government is using. I realise that many people may be unhappy with that, although such an approach only applies to a small number of people and when the Government sees no alternative to doing so.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** We all welcome the good news that Wales is now free from foot and mouth disease. It is right that we celebrate that on the day that the winter fair is held at Llanelwedd. I am sure that we all wish them well. Given that animal health is not a devolved matter, will you now make urgent representations to the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs on two matters? First, on the 21-day restriction on the movement of animals, do you accept that if this rule remains in place for another 12 months, there will not be a single agricultural show in Wales next year? Farmers will not be able to take their cattle and sheep to the shows because they will not be able to move them from the show. Secondly, if our livestock markets reopened, farmers would not be able to remove their animals at the end of the day's sale. Will you ask DEFRA to be more flexible in its approach to this? Do you

**Richard Edwards:** Pa drafodaethau a gawsoch gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynglŷn ag effaith y Mesur Terfysgaeth newydd ar Gymru? Heblaw am y cwestiynau dyngarol, a rannwch fy mhryderon y daw Cymru yn llai diogel yn hytrach na mwy diogel oherwydd y Mesur hwn?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae'r Mesur Terfysgaeth newydd yn cynnwys rhai adrannau y tybiaf y byddwch chi, fel finnau, yn eu croesawu, sef yr estyniad i gynnwys annog atgasedd ar sail crefydd, hil neu sail arall. Caiff hynny'n gyffredinol ei groesawu. Mae llawer o bobl yn teimlo'n gryf am y ffaith fod y Llywodraeth, wrth ymdrin â thua deuddeg o bobl ar y mwyaf, yn gorfod cael ei heithrio o'r Confensiwn Ewropeaidd ar Hawliau Dynol. Nid oes ffordd arall o ymdrin ag unigolyn peryglus sy'n digwydd bod yn dod o wlad beryglus. Ni ellir anfon yr unigolyn hwnnw yn ôl i'r wlad honno, felly caiff ei adael i grwydro'r strydoedd neu rhaid ei gadw dan glo heb brawf. Mae hynny yn amlwg yn groes i'r Confensiwn Ewropeaidd ar Hawliau Dynol. Fodd bynnag, ceir dyfais gyfreithiol a ddefnyddir gan y Llywodraeth i wneud hyn. Sylweddolaf fod llawer o bobl o bosibl yn anfodlon â hynny, er mai dim ond yn achos nifer fechan o bobl y defnyddir y dull hwn a hynny dim ond pan nad oes gan y Llywodraeth ddewis arall.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Mae pob un ohonom yn croesawu'r newyddion da bod Cymru'n rhydd o glwy'r traed a'r genau. Mae'n deg inni ddathlu hynny ar y diwrnod y cynhelir y ffair aeaf yn Llanelwedd. Yr wyf yn siŵr fod pawb ohonom yn dymuno'n dda iddynt. O gofio nad yw iechyd anifeiliaid yn fater sydd wedi ei ddatganoli, a wnewch chi yn awr sylwadau ar fyrder i Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig (DEFRA) ar ddau fater? Yn gyntaf, yn ymwneud â'r cyfyngiadau 21-diwrnod ar symud anifeiliaid, a dderbyniwch na chynhelir yr un sioe amaethyddol yng Nghymru y flwyddyn nesaf os bydd y rheol hon yn parhau'n weithredol am 12 mis arall? Ni fydd ffermwyr yn gallu cludo eu gwartheg a'u defaid i sioeau gan na fyddant yn gallu eu cludo oddi yno. Yn ail, pe bai ein marchnadoedd da byw yn ailagor, ni allai ffermwyr gludo eu hanifeiliaid oddi yno ar ddiwedd arwerthiant y dydd. A



agree that the best news for Welsh farmers would be a relaxation of this rule so that the market place can operate again?

**The First Minister:** Thank you for giving me notice of your question because it is a highly technical issue and I would have been at a loss to answer promptly had you not notified me. You are right to raise the matter of licensing; it is an animal health issue, responsibility for which is not devolved to the Assembly although it would be if we were to succeed with our request on that front. It is a matter for DEFRA. We are aware of it for the reasons you mentioned and we share your concerns. Carwyn Jones has already raised the issue with Margaret Beckett and Alun Michael. They will be reviewing the regime early in the new year and I hope that things will return to normal soon.

ofynnwch i DEFRA fod yn fwy hyblyg yn ei ymagwedd at hyn? A gredwch mai'r newyddion gorau i ffermwyr Cymru fyddai llacio'r rheol hon fel y gall y farchnad weithredu unwaith eto?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Diolch ichi am fy rhybuddio o'ch cwestiwn gan ei fod yn fater technegol iawn a byddwn wedi methu â'i ateb yn brydlon heb rybudd. Yr ydych yn gywir i godi'r mater o drwyddedu; mae'n fater sy'n ymwneud â iechyd anifeiliaid, cyfrifoldeb sydd heb gael ei ddatganoli i'r Cynulliad er y digwyddai hynny pe baem yn llwyddo yn ein cais i'r perwyl hwnnw. Mater i DEFRA ydyw. Yr ydym yn ymwybodol ohono oherwydd y rhesymau a grybwyllwyd gennych a rhannwn eich pryderon. Mae Carwyn Jones eisoes wedi codi'r mater gyda Margaret Beckett ac Alun Michael. Byddant yn adolygu'r drefn yn gynnar yn y flwyddyn newydd a gobeithiaf y bydd pethau'n dychwelyd i'r arfer cyn bo hir.

#### **Heddwision Ychwanegol Extra Police Officers**

**Q11 David Davies:** What discussions has the First Minister had with the Secretary of State for Wales about the recruitment of extra police officers for Wales? (OAQ14421)

**The First Minister:** The four Welsh police forces have been allocated money for 422 recruits from the crime-fighting fund up to 2002-03. They recruited 163 officers in 2000-01 and qualified for £2.3 million in crime-fighting fund grant. These new recruits are over and above the force's previous recruitment plans.

**David Davies:** Do you agree that police forces in Wales do an excellent job, particularly in Gwent? Do you further agree that recruitment is not helped when certain irresponsible sections of the media decide to publicise unfounded and unfair allegations against individual police officers?

**The First Minister:** I am not aware of such unfounded allegations against police officers, but I accept the principle behind your

**C11 David Davies:** Pa drafodaethau y mae Prif weinidog Cymru wedi eu cael gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynghylch recriwtio heddwision ychwanegol ar gyfer Cymru? (OAQ14421)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae pedair ardal yr heddlu yng Nghymru wedi derbyn arian i recriwtio 422 o heddwision o'r gronfa ymladd troseddau hyd at 2002-03. Recriwtiwyd 163 o heddwision yn 2000-1 a sicrhawyd grant o £2.3 miliwn ar gyfer ymladd troseddau. Mae nifer y recriwtiaid newydd hynny'n rhagori ar gynlluniau recriwtio blaenorol yr heddlu.

**David Davies:** A gytunwch fod yr heddluoedd yng Nghymru yn gwneud gwaith gwyach, yn arbennig yng Ngwent? A gytunwch hefyd nad yw'r ffaith bod rhai rhannau anghyfrifol o'r cyfryngau yn penderfynu cyhoeddi cyhoeddiadau di-sail ac annheg yn erbyn heddwision unigol yn helpu'r ymgyrch recriwtio?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o gyhuddiadau di-sail o'r fath yn erbyn heddwision, ond derbyniaf yr

question that if someone makes unfounded allegations, they should be subject to the rigours of the law in some cases. However, it can be difficult sometimes for individuals to take legal action to clear their names. If this is a recent matter concerning Wales, please write to me about it and I will take it up with the Home Secretary.

**Alun Pugh:** In your discussions with the Secretary of State for Wales will you emphasise the need for these welcome 400-plus extra officers to be deployed on the streets of Wales rather than in headquarters? North Wales is fortunate because it does not experience many serious crimes, but street crime and anti-social behaviour is a major concern in my constituency.

**The First Minister:** You make that point frequently. Those of us who visit north Wales on official political engagements do not see this anti-social behaviour, because we are not there, in certain streets, late on a Friday or Saturday night when boozy behaviour spills over to criminal behaviour and so forth. I accept your point. This is part of the how the Government is allocating additional officers. The aim is to civilianise and automate jobs in headquarters so that police are freed up and have more time to be bobbies on the beat, or fighting crime, rather than involved in infernal paperwork. Unfortunately, that is part of a culture about which doctors, teachers, policemen and other frontline public servants have complained for some time. They must be given the tools and the support to do the job. There is no need for police officers to do jobs that can be civilianised or that machines and IT can do far better.

**Owen John Thomas:** A ydych wedi cael trafodaethau ar ran Llywodraeth Cymru â'r Gweinidog perthnasol yn San Steffan, ynglŷn â gwneud y newidiadau angenrheidiol i ganiatáu i Heddlu De Cymru gael mwy o arian i gyflogi rhagor o staff i ymdopi â'r galwadau sy'n deillio o'r cynnydd yn nifer yr achlysuron arbennig a gynhelir yng

egwyddor sy'n sail i'ch cwestiwn sef, os bydd rhywun yn gwneud honiadau di-sail, dylent fod yn agored i lynder y gyfraith mewn rhai achosion. Fodd bynnag, gall fod yn anodd weithiau i unigolion gymryd camau cyfreithiol i brofi eu bod yn ddiueog. Os yw hyn yn fater sydd wedi codi'n ddiweddar yng Nghymru, ysgrifennwch ataf yn ei gylch a chodaf y mater gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref.

**Alun Pugh:** Yn eich trafodaethau gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru a wnewch chi bwysleisio bod angen lleoli'r 400 o heddweision ychwanegol hyn a mwy ar strydoedd Cymru yn hytrach na mewn pencadlysoedd? Mae gogledd Cymru'n ffodus am na chyflawnir llawer o droseddau difrifol yno, ond mae troseddau ar y stryd ac ymddygiad gwrth-gymdeithasol yn peri pryder mawr yn fy etholaeth.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr ydych yn gwneud y pwynt hwn yn aml. Nid yw'r rhai hynny ohonom sy'n ymweld â'r Gogledd ar gyfer ymrwymadau gwleidyddol swyddogol yn gweld yr ymddygiad gwrth-gymdeithasol hwn, am nad ydym yno, ar rai strydoedd penodol, yn hwyr ar nos Wener neu nos Sadwrn pan fo ymddygiad meddwol yn troi yn ymddygiad troseddol ac ati. Derbynïaf eich pwynt. Mae hyn yn rhan o broses y Llywodraeth o leoli heddweision ychwanegol. Y nod yw sifileiddio ac awtomeiddio swyddi mewn pencadlysoedd fel y caiff heddlu eu rhyddhau i dreulio mwy o amser yn cerdded y strydoedd, neu'n ymladd troseddau, yn hytrach na gorfod gwneud gwaith papur diddiwedd. Yn anffodus, mae hyn yn rhan o'r diwylliant y bu meddygon, athrawon, heddweision a gweision sifil rheng flaen eraill yn cwyno amdano gyhyd. Rhaid inni roi'r offer a'r cymorth iddynt wneud y gwaith. Nid oes angen i heddweision wneud swyddi y gellir eu sifileiddio neu y gall peiriannau a TG eu gwneud yn llawer gwell.

**Owen John Thomas:** Have you had discussions on behalf of the Government of Wales with the relevant Minister in Westminster about making the necessary changes to fund South Wales Police in employing more staff to deal with the calls resulting from the increase in the number of special events held in Cardiff?

Nghaerdydd?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yn anffodus, mae gennyf ffigurau ar bob un o'r heddluoedd ar wahân i Heddlu De Cymru. Felly, ysgrifennaf atoch ynglŷn â sut i roi hwb pellach i'r adnoddau ariannol a dynol a fydd ar gael i Heddlu De Cymru.

**The First Minister:** Unfortunately, I have figures on all the police forces apart from South Wales Police. Therefore, I will write to you on how we can give more of a boost to the financial and human resources available to South Wales Police.

### **Perthynas â Gogledd Iwerddon Relations with Northern Ireland**

**Q12 Pauline Jarman:** Will the First Minister make a statement on how he plans to promote closer relations with Northern Ireland, in order to improve Wales's image? (OAQ14409)

**C12 Pauline Jarman:** A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ynghylch sut y mae'n bwriadu hybu perthynas agosach gyda Gogledd Iwerddon, er mwyn gwella delwedd Cymru? (OAQ14409)

**The First Minister:** I was with David Trimble on Friday at the meeting of the British-Irish Council. The last thing that I did before leaving the post British-Irish Council lunch was to wish him the best of luck at the following day's Ulster Unionist council meeting. Of course, it was not causally connected with my wishing him good luck, but he won a fairly remarkable victory at the Ulster Unionist council. Northern Ireland is now perhaps better placed than it has been for several years to play a full part in the British-Irish Council and in the new devolved geography of the United Kingdom. I was pleased to see that, as well as the good working relationship with Mark Durkan, the new SDLP Deputy First Minister, and also with Ministers from some of the minor parties.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr oeddwn gyda David Trimble ddydd Gwener yng nghyfarfod y Cyngor Prydeinig-Gwyddelig. Y peth diwethaf a wneuthum cyn gadael y cinio yn dilyn cyfarfod y Cyngor Prydeinig-Gwyddelig oedd dymuno'n dda iddo yng nghyfarfod Unoliaethwyr Ulster y diwrnod canlynol. Wrth gwrs, nid oedd cyswllt rhwng fy nymuniad da a'r ffaith iddo ennill buddugoliaeth eithaf rhyfeddol yng nghyngor Unoliaethwyr Ulster. Efallai fod Gogledd Iwerddon mewn sefyllfa well yn awr nag y bu ers sawl blwyddyn i chwarae rhan lawn yn y Cyngor Prydeinig-Gwyddelig, ac yn naearyddiaeth datganoledig newydd y Deyrnas Unedig. Yr oeddwn yn falch o weld hynny, ynghyd â'r berthynas waith dda â Mark Durkan, Dirprwy Brif Weinidog newydd yr SDLP, a'r berthynas â Gweinidogion o rai o'r pleidiau llai.

**Pauline Jarman:** In light of those remarks, have you commissioned, or do you intend to commission, any research on how best to positively promote and develop trade and cultural understanding between Wales and Northern Ireland?

**Pauline Jarman:** Yng ngoleuni'r sylwadau hynny, a ydych wedi comisiynu, neu a fwriadwch gomisiynu, unrhyw ymchwil i'r ffordd orau o hybu a datblygu masnach a dealltwriaeth ddiwylliannol rhwng Cymru a Gogledd Iwerddon?

**The First Minister:** The British-Irish Council—in the light of the current situation in Northern Ireland and following the sad death of Donald Dewar, which caused one meeting to be cancelled—can now become an umbrella within which issues such as trade relations and cultural relationships between Wales and Northern Ireland can be progressed. For geographical reasons, our

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Gall y Cyngor Prydeinig-Gwyddelig—o ystyried sefyllfa bresennol Gogledd Iwerddon ac yn dilyn marwolaeth drist Donald Dewar, a achosodd i un cyfarfod gael ei ohirio—weithredu fel ymbarél yn awr lle y gellir datblygu materion fel cysylltiadau masnach a pherthynas ddiwylliannol rhwng Cymru a Gogledd Iwerddon. Am resymau daearyddol, bydd ein

relations with the Irish Republic will be closer than with Northern Ireland, in the same way that Scotland will have a closer relationship with Northern Ireland than with the Irish Republic. That is how the geography pushes you. However, it is important that we realise, in terms of air services, trade and investment, and our problems in the aerospace industries, that we have much in common. Northern Ireland is strong in the aerospace industries and is suffering from redundancies at present at Bombardier Aerospace Short Bros. We must face the fact that Wales and Northern Ireland are at the bottom of the league, along with north-east England, in terms of GDP per head.

**William Graham:** In view of your replies, would it be an idea to ask the First Minister of the Northern Ireland Assembly, or the Northern Ireland Minister of Enterprise, Trade and Investment, to attend the Assembly?

**The First Minister:** I do not have a problem with that. I would be pleased for them to attend an appropriate Plenary session or Committee meeting.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Pan fyddwch yn trafod nesaf ag aelodau o Lywodraeth Gogledd Iwerddon, a godwch gwestiwn ymbelydredd yn deillio o Sellafield? Yr ydych, mae'n amlwg, yn ymwybodol o deimlad cryf yng Ngweriniaeth yr Iwerddon ynglŷn â hyn, a'r teimlad cryf ar hyd arfordir y Gogledd. A oes lle i ni gydweithio i geisio sicrhau y caiff yr ymbelydredd hwn ei gadw i'r lefel isaf posibl?

2:40 p.m.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cododd y cwestiwn hwnnw ar ymylon cyfarfod Cyngor Prydain-Iwerddon ddydd Gwener diwethaf. Mae hwn yn fwy o bwnc llosg yn Ynys Manaw nag yn unman arall—yr un darn o dir yr oeddech chi wedi ei anghofio, Dafydd. Mae yng nghanol gogledd Môr Iwerddon. Gellir fwy na thebyg gweld Sellafield yn y nos o fynyddoedd uchaf Ynys Manaw. Os oes ymbelydredd yn mynd i mewn i'r môr, neu yn cael ei gario yn y gwynt, mae Ynys Manaw, arfordir deheuol

perthynas â Gweriniaeth Iwerddon yn agosach na'n perthynas â Gogledd Iwerddon, ac yn yr un modd bydd gan yr Alban berthynas agosach â Gogledd Iwerddon na â Gweriniaeth Iwerddon. Dyna'r ffordd y mae daearyddiaeth yn eich llywio. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig inni sylweddoli, yn nhermau gwasanaethau awyr, masnach a buddsoddi ynghyd â'n problemau yn y diwydiannau aerofod, fod gennym lawer yn gyffredin. Mae'r diwydiannau aerofod yn chwarae rhan amlwg yng Ngogledd Iwerddon ac mae'n wynebu diswyddiadau ar hyn o bryd yn Bombardier Aerospace Short Bros. Rhaid inni wynebu'r ffaith bod Cymru a Gogledd Iwerddon ar waelod y gynghrair, ynghyd â gogledd-ddwyrain Lloegr, yn nhermau CMC y pen.

**William Graham:** Yng ngoleuni eich atebion, a fyddai'n syniad gofyn i Brif Weinidog Cynulliad Gogledd Iwerddon, neu Weinidog Gogledd Iwerddon dros Fenter, Masnach a Buddsoddi ddod i'r Cynulliad?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid oes gennyf broblem â hynny. Byddwn yn fwy na pharod iddynt fynychu Cyfarfod Llawn priodol neu gyfarfod Pwyllgor.

**Dafydd Wigley:** When you next have discussions with members of the Northern Ireland Government, will you raise the question of radiation emanating from Sellafield? You are obviously aware of the strong feeling in the Irish Republic about this, and the strong feeling along the north Wales coast. Is there scope for us to work together to try to ensure that this radiation is kept to a minimum?

**The First Minister:** That question was raised on the fringes of the British-Irish Council meeting last Friday. It is a more controversial issue in the Isle of Man than anywhere else—the one place that you had forgotten, Dafydd. It is in the centre of the north of the Irish Sea. Sellafield is probably visible at night from some of the Isle of Man's highest mountains. If radiation goes into the sea or is carried on the wind, the Isle of Man, the south coast of Scotland, Northern Ireland, the Republic of

yr Alban, Gogledd Iwerddon, Gweriniaeth Iwerddon, gogledd Cymru ac arfordir gogledd-orllewinol Lloegr i gyd yn y llinell danio.

Ireland, north Wales and the north-west coast of England are all in the firing line.

### **Papur Gwyn Ewrop ar Lywodraethu European White Paper on Governance**

**Q13 Phil Williams:** Will the First Minister make a statement on his involvement in a network of regions and nations looking into the implications of the European White Paper on governance? (OAQ14432)

**The First Minister:** I was invited to attend a meeting in the Emilia-Romagna region of Italy to look at governance from this regional tier of government. I know that we do not call ourselves a region, but we operate at the regional tier. I was unable to attend the meeting, but I was represented by an official—the head of the Wales European Centre Assembly office. The regions involved are drawn from Italy, Germany, the UK, Greece, Belgium, France and Sweden, and I have since exchanged correspondence with President Errani of Emilia-Romagna, agreeing that Wales should be represented on a working group to take matters forward. That will be followed by a political level meeting, which is intended to take place in March 2002.

**Phil Williams:** Your answer to my previous supplementary question surprised me because I assumed that the Government of Wales Act 1998, with royal assent, constitutes a definition of powers to this Assembly. However, if you are certain that a direct appeal to the European Court of Justice is not relevant to Wales, but is relevant to other regions, can we assume that your representative at Liège voted in favour of the resolution towards the reinforced role of the regions?

**The First Minister:** Some of the most powerful regions in Europe want access to the European Court of Justice because they would like to contest some of their budgetary settlements. Many of them are the richest regions in Europe and do not like the idea of paying an extra tax into a common pot that can then be used to subsidise the weaker

**C13 Phil Williams:** A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad am y rhan a chwaraeodd mewn rhwydwaith o ranbarthau a chenhedloedd a fu'n ystyried goblygiadau Papur Gwyn Ewrop ar lywodraethu? (OAQ14432)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Fe'm gwahoddwyd i fynychu cyfarfod yn rhanbarth Emilia-Romagna yn yr Eidal i edrych ar sut y mae'r haen ranbarthol hon o'r llywodraeth yn rheoli ei hun. Gwn nad ydym yn galw ein hunain yn rhanbarth, ond gweithredwn ar haen ranbarthol. Nid oeddwn yn gallu bod yn bresennol, ond cefais fy nghynrychioli gan swyddog—pennaeth swyddfa Canolfan Ewropeaidd Cymru'r Cynulliad. Daw'r rhanbarthau dan sylw o'r Eidal, yr Almaen, y DU, Groeg, Gwlad Belg, Ffrainc a Sweden, ac yr wyf wedi gohebu bellach gyda Llywydd Errani o Emilia-Romagna, yn cytuno y dylai Cymru gael ei chynrychioli ar weithgor er mwyn gweithredu ar faterion. Bydd cyfarfod ar lefel wleidyddol yn dilyn hyn, a bwriedir ei gynnal ym mis Mawrth 2002.

**Phil Williams:** Cefais fy synnu gan eich ateb i'm cwestiwn ategol blaenorol oherwydd tybiais fod Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, gyda chydysyniad brenhinol, yn ddiffiniad o bwerau i'r Cynulliad hwn. Fodd bynnag, os ydych yn sicr nad yw apêl uniongyrchol i'r Llys Cyfiawnder Ewropeaidd yn berthnasol i Gymru, ond yn berthnasol i ranbarthau eraill, a allwn dybio y pleidleisiodd eich cynrychiolydd yn Liège o blaid y penderfyniad i atgyfnerthu'r rhanbarthau?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae rhai o'r rhanbarthau mwyaf pwerus yn Ewrop am gael mynediad i'r Llys Cyfiawnder Ewropeaidd oherwydd hoffent herio rhai o'u penderfyniadau cyllidebol. Rhanbarthau cyfoethocaf Ewrop yw llawer ohonynt ac nid ydynt yn hoffi'r syniad o dalu treth ychwanegol i un gronfa gyffredin y gellid ei

regions in their particular member state. We are not in that position and will not be for a long time. We must be clear that we understand what is meant when certain regions say that they do not want to subsidise the south in the case of the northern Italian regions or the north or east in the case of some of the richer German regions such as Baden-Württemberg. It is not in our interest to agree with the idea that a strong region that is above the average in gross domestic product per head can contest the redistributed mechanism that their Government—as they would say—imposes on them.

defnyddio wedyn i roi nawdd i ranbarthau tlotach yn eu haelod-wladwriaeth arbennig hwy. Nid ydym yn y sefyllfa hon ac ni fyddwn am beth amser i ddod. Rhaid inni egluro ein bod yn deall yr hyn a olygir pan ddywed rhanbarthau penodol nad ydynt am roi nawdd i'r de yn achos rhanbarthau gogledd yr Eidal nac i'r gogledd neu'r dwyrain yn achos rhai o ranbarthau cyfoethocaf yr Almaen fel Baden-Württemberg. Nid yw'n fuddiol inni gytuno â'r syniad y gall rhanbarth gref sy'n well na'r cyfartaledd o ran cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen herio'r weithdrefn ail-ddosbarthu y mae eu Llywodraeth—yn eu geiriau hwy—yn ei gorfodi arnynt.

### **Datganiad ar Strategaeth Diwylliant i Gymru Statement on a Culture Strategy for Wales**

**The Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language (Jenny Randerson):** I am delighted to bring you up to date today on the development of my culture strategy, 'Creative Future/Cymru Creadigol'. I plan to launch it formally in the new year and am sure that it provides an excellent framework and action plan for the development of culture in Wales. The strategy was developed in partnership with the Culture Committee, following public consultation via the National Assembly website, and with members of Cymru'n Creu, who will have a major role to play in its implementation. I took the strategy to the Culture Committee on 21 November and I was pleased by the warm reception it received. It is an excellent example of Ministers and Committees working together to produce results. The strategy has six main themes to guide the work of our cultural bodies. The key priorities are young people, communities, cultural diversity, the creative industries, emphasis on evidence-based policy making and the development of our professional arts and artists. Culture is vital to Wales's image and economy. These priorities reflect the overarching priorities of the National Assembly and show that cultural development is cross-cutting. This strategy touches every Assembly portfolio, and I am pleased that my Cabinet colleagues fully endorse it. I need to clarify that although the strategy refers to sport and the Welsh

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg (Jenny Randerson):** Yr wyf wrth fy modd i'ch diweddarau heddiw ar ddatblygiad fy strategaeth diwylliant, 'Creative Future/Cymru Creadigol'. Mae'n fwriad gennyf i'w lansio'n ffurfiol yn y flwyddyn newydd ac yr wyf yn siŵr ei fod yn rhoi fframwaith a chynllun gweithredu rhagorol ar gyfer datblygiad diwylliant yng Nghymru. Datblygwyd y strategaeth ar y cyd gyda'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant, yn dilyn ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus drwy wefan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a gyda aelodau Cymru'n Creu, a fydd yn cael rôl bwysig i'w chwarae yn ei gweithredu. Euthum â'r strategaeth i'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant ar 21 Tachwedd ac yr oeddwn yn falch o'r derbyniad gwresog a gafodd. Mae'n enghraifft ardderchog o Weinidogion a Phwyllgorau'n cydweithio i gynhyrchu canlyniadau. Mae gan y strategaeth chwe phrif thema i lywio gwaith ein cyrff diwylliannol. Y blaenoriaethau allweddol yw pobl ifanc, cymunedau, amrywiaeth diwylliannol, y diwydiannau creadigol, pwyslais ar lunio polisïau sy'n seiliedig ar dystiolaeth a datblygiad ein celfyddydau a'n hartistiaid proffesiynol. Mae diwylliant yn holl bwysig i ddelwedd Cymru a'i heconomi. Adlewyrcha'r blaenoriaethau hyn flaenoriaethau rhychwantol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a dangosant fod datblygiad diwylliannol yn fater trawsbynciol. Cyffyrdda'r strategaeth hon ar bob un o

language, it does not deal with them in detail as the Committee's work on them is ongoing.

Local authorities have a vital role to play in the development of culture in their areas and I would like them to engage more fully in cultural development. There will be a cost. However, I am sure that authorities—in light of their annual revenue settlement—will want to plan in order to play a full part in developing cultural life, participation and excellence. I have asked the cultural Assembly sponsored public bodies to work with local authorities to develop productive relationships for the benefit of all the people of Wales.

The strategy has seven detailed action plans. These plans build upon the recommendations in 'A Culture in Common', but they go further. This is a 10-year strategy. Each action plan contains a combination of actions, which will be implemented in the short term, as well as outline projects that will be developed in the medium and longer term. For example, I will be developing a youth arts fund to encourage all young people, not only those in schools, to be more involved in cultural activities. There are also exciting plans for the development of the film industry in Wales. A Wales Screen Commission is in place, and there are plans for a film fund. I also want to help the creative industries become an even more important sector in our economy. I hope to do this by helping to encourage the skills needed for artistic and business success; by being more aware of the information we need from the industry to help formulate policies, and by providing more opportunities for young people and communities to participate in and get access to culture experiences.

I want to use cultural development to raise awareness of Wales on the world stage. In order to do this we must develop cultural tourism, and nurture the best artistic talent in Wales in the performing arts, in literature and

bortffolios y Cynulliad ac yr wyf yn falch fod fy nghyd-Aelodau yn y Cabinet yn ei chefnogi'n llwyr. Rhaid i mi egluro, er bod y strategaeth yn cyfeirio at chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg, nid yw'n delio â hwy yn fanwl gan fod gwaith y Pwyllgor arnynt hwy yn parhau.

Mae gan awdurdodau lleol rôl allweddol i'w chwarae yn natblygiad diwylliant yn eu hardaloedd a byddwn yn dymuno iddynt ymwneud yn llawer mwy â datblygiad diwylliannol. Mi fydd cost. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd awdurdodau—yn wyneb eu setliad refeniw blynyddol—yn dymuno cynllunio er mwyn chwarae rhan lawn mewn datblygu bywyd diwylliannol, cyfranogiad a rhagoriaeth. Gofynnais i gyrff cyhoeddus a noddur gan y Cynulliad i weithio gydag awdurdodau lleol i ddatblygu perthynas gynhyrchiol er budd holl bobl Cymru.

Mae gan y strategaeth saith cynllun gweithredu manwl. Adeilada'r cynlluniau hyn ar yr argymhellion a gynhwysir yn 'Diwylliant Cytûn', ond ânt ymhellach. Strategaeth 10-mllynedd yw hon. Ym mhob un o'r cynlluniau gweithredu, ceir cyfuniad o weithrediadau yn gweithredu yn y tymor byr, ynghyd â phrosiectau amlinellol a fydd yn cael eu datblygu yn y tymor canolog a thros gyfnod hwy. Er enghraifft, byddaf yn datblygu cronfa gelf ieuenctid i annog pawb ifanc, nid rhai sydd yn yr ysgol yn unig i ymwneud mwy â gweithgareddau diwylliannol. Ceir hefyd gynlluniau cyffrous ar gyfer datblygiad y diwydiant ffilm yng Nghymru. Sefydlwyd Comisiwn Sgrîn Cymru, ac mae cynlluniau ar gyfer cronfa ffilm. Yr wyf hefyd am helpu'r diwydiannau creadigol i fod yn sector bwysicach fyth yn ein heconomi. Gobeithiaf wneud hyn drwy helpu i hyrwyddo'r sgiliau sydd eu hangen i lwyddo yn artistig ac mewn busnes; drwy fod yn fwy ymwybodol o'r wybodaeth sydd ei hangen arnom oddi wrth y diwydiant i'n helpu i ffurfio polisïau, a thrwy ddarparu rhagor o gyfleoedd i bobl ifanc a chymunedau gyfranogi mewn profiadau diwylliannol a chael mynediad iddynt.

Yr wyf am ddefnyddio datblygiad diwylliannol i godi ymwybyddiaeth o Gymru ar lwyfan y byd. Er mwyn gwneud hyn rhaid inni ddatblygu twristiaeth ddiwylliannol, a meithrin y talent artistig gorau yng Nghymru

in the visual arts. We must support and develop national remit companies, the Welsh National Opera, Clwyd Theatr Cymru and Diversions Dance Company. For their part, they must develop their community base.

There are many other initiatives but I will not list them this afternoon. If Members wish to know more, the strategy has been published on the intranet.

The strategy's financial implications are crucial. I will be discussing funding with the bodies taking the action plans forward during each successive budget planning round, and also as part of the corporate planning process. The speed at which the plans are implemented will ultimately depend on the annual budgets announced by the Finance Minister.

We are already off to a flying start with the excellent provision for the arts in the budget for next year. I discussed my priorities with the Arts Council of Wales yesterday. I will meet the other ASPBs that will be involved in delivering the strategy's action plans.

In conclusion, it is important that this strategy is not regarded as an unchangeable blueprint for the future. It must be a living, evolving document if we are able to make the most of our cultural potential. I look forward to striving to meet the challenges and achieve the opportunities that developing the strategy presents us.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I am responding on behalf of Glyn Davies who is attending the winter fair in Llanelwedd. I will refer to a number of points made in the statement. First, you referred to the development of our professional arts and artists. I know that many of the organisations will want to see how this strategy will be realised. The last few years have not been easy for a number of our leading companies that have tried to develop the professional arts in Wales, and support Wales abroad. Realising a strategy means funding and other forms of assistance.

yn y celfyddydau perfformio, mewn llenyddiaeth ac yn y celfyddydau gweledol. Rhaid inni gefnogi a datblygu cwmnïau sydd â chylch gwaith cenedlaethol, Cwmni Opera Cenedlaethol Cymru, Clwyd Theatr Cymru a Chwmni Dawns Diversions. O'u rhan hwythau, rhaid iddynt ddatblygu eu sylfaen gymunedol.

Mae llawer o fentrau eraill ond ni wnaf eu rhestru'r prynhawn yma. Os carai Aelodau wybod rhagor, cyhoeddwyd y strategaeth ar y fewnrwyd.

Mae goblygiadau ariannol y strategaeth yn dyngedfennol. Byddaf yn trafod ariannu gyda'r cyrff a fydd yn rhoi'r gweithredu ar waith yn ystod pob un o'r cyfnodau cynllunio cyllideb, ac hefyd fel rhan o'r broses cynllunio corfforaethol. Bydd cyflymder gweithredu'r cynlluniau yn y diwedd yn dibynnu ar y cyllidebau blynyddol a gyhoeddir gan y Gweinidog Cyllid.

Yr ydym wedi dechrau'n dda iawn yn barod gyda'r ddarpariaeth ardderchog yn y gyllideb celfyddydau y flwyddyn nesaf. Trafodais fy mlaenoriaethau gyda Chyngor Celfyddydau Cymru ddoe. Byddaf yn cwrdd â'r cyrff cyhoeddus eraill a noddur gan y Cynulliad fydd â rhan mewn cyflwyno cynlluniau gweithredu'r strategaeth.

I gloi, mae'n bwysig nad yw'r strategaeth hon yn cael ei gweld fel patrwm digyfnewid ar gyfer y dyfodol. Rhaid iddi fod yn ddogfen fyw, esblygol er mwyn inni i wneud y gorau o'n potensial diwylliannol. Edrychaf ymlaen i ymdrechu i gwrdd â'r heriau a gwireddu'r cyfleoedd y mae datblygu'r strategaeth yn eu cynnig inni.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yr wyf yn ymateb ar ran Glyn Davies sy'n mynychu'r ffair aeaf yn Llanelwedd. Cyfeiriai at nifer o bwytiau a wneir yn y datganiad. Yn gyntaf, gwnaethoch gyfeirio at ddatblygu'n celfyddydau a'r artistiaid proffesiynol. Gwn fod llawer o'r cyrff am weld sut y caiff y strategaeth hon ei gwireddu. Ni fu'r blynyddoedd diweddar yn hawdd i lawer o'n cwmnïau blaenaf sydd wedi ceisio datblygu'r celfyddydau proffesiynol yng Nghymru, a chefnogi Cymru dramor. Mae gwireddu strategaeth yn golygu arian a mathau eraill o gymorth.



In terms of the role of local authorities, can you indicate—if not now, then perhaps in written form—which local authorities are up to scratch in their provision of strategic direction in their areas, and which are lacking? Until recently, Cardiff City and County Council, for example, was no further forward in developing its arts strategy for the city. Unless local authorities are proactively involved in developing that strategic direction for arts and culture it is difficult to engage with them.

2:50 p.m.

I welcome your plans to develop a youth arts fund to encourage young people in Wales. When you consider how many talented artists Wales has in a variety of cultural fields—the huge number of musicians, artists, those who are brilliant vocally and instrumentally, the Welsh National Opera, the BBC National Chorus of Wales and so on—compared with the population of the country, we are successful. I regard this as a considerable investment. I am sure that we all welcome this assistance to schools and young people to develop their skills.

You said that we would develop our national remit companies and encourage them to develop their community base. I remind the Minister that Clwyd Theatr Cymru attempted to do that with its mobile theatre, but was prevented by the Arts Council of Wales's inability to match-fund private sector money secured by Clwyd Theatr Cymru for that purpose.

Finally, with regard to the national art gallery, or rather—the lack of such a gallery—it should be included in any strategy for the development of art or culture in Wales. We have some 800 pieces of work gathering dust in basements that are not on public display. We feel strongly that the Assembly should consider the prospect of a national art gallery for Wales.

**Jenny Randerson:** In terms of professional arts and artists, the strategy is thorough and it

Mewn perthynas â rôl awdurdodau lleol, a allwch nodi—os nad yn awr, yna efallai yn ysgrifenedig—pa awdurdodau lleol sy'n cwrdd â'r gofyn mewn rhoi cyfeiriad strategol yn eu hardaloedd a pha rai sy'n ddiffygiol? Tan yn ddiweddar, nid oedd Cyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd, er enghraifft, yn nes at y lan mewn datblygu ei strategaeth gelfyddydau ar gyfer y ddinas. Oni fydd awdurdodau lleol yn ymhél yn weithredol mewn datblygu'r cyfeiriad strategol hwnnw i'r celfyddydau a diwylliant bydd yn anodd ymwneud â hwy.

Croesawaf eich cynlluniau i ddatblygu cronfa celfyddydau ieuenctid i gefnogi pobl ifanc yng Nghymru. Pan fyddwch chi'n ystyried faint o artistiaid dawnus sydd gan Gymru mewn amrywiaeth o feysydd diwylliannol—y nifer fawr o gerddorion, arlunwyr, y rheini sy'n ddawnus iawn yn lleisiol ac yn offerynnol, Cwmni Opera Cenedlaethol Cymru, Corws Cenedlaethol Cymru'r BBC ac yn y blaen—o gymharu â phoblogaeth y wlad, yr ydym yn llwyddiannus. Ystyriaf hyn yn fuddsoddiad sylweddol. Yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod ni'n croesawu'r gefnogaeth hon i ysgolion a phobl ifanc i ddatblygu eu sgiliau.

Dywedasoch y byddem yn datblygu'n cwmnïau sydd â chylch gwaith cenedlaethol a'u hannog i ddatblygu eu sylfaen gymunedol. Atgoffaf y Gweinidog i Theatr Clwyd Cymru geisio gwneud hynny gyda'i theatr teithiol, ond fe'i rhwystrwyd gan anallu Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru i roi arian cyfatebol i'r arian sector preifat y llwyddodd Theatr Clwyd Cymru ei gael i'r diben hwnnw.

I gloi, gyda golwg ar yr oriel gelf genedlaethol, neu'n hytrach—ddiffyg oriel o'r fath—dylai gael ei chynnwys mewn unrhyw strategaeth ar gyfer datblygu celf neu ddiwylliant yng Nghymru. Mae gennym rhyw 800 darn o waith sy'n casglu llwch mewn seleri nad ydynt yn cael eu harddangos yn gyhoeddus. Teimlwn yn gryf y dylai'r Cynulliad ystyried y posibilrwydd o gael oriel gelf genedlaethol i Gymru.

**Jenny Randerson:** O ran celf ac artistiaid proffesiynol, mae'r strategaeth yn drwyadl ac

includes much that will indicate a much firmer basis for their development, going way beyond the simple provision of extra money. However, there is a proposal for bursaries; the arts council is currently developing a scheme to promote them. It already provides bursaries, but it will improve the provision of bursaries not only for young people but also for a range of artists from all disciplines. It also includes a craft strategy that will lead to the development of professional crafts throughout Wales. Interesting developments for dance are proposed and there is emphasis throughout on training needs. You will find much for professional artists of all sorts.

In terms of local authority figures, I wish it were as easy as writing you a letter setting out the situation. One good way to track the position, as we see it emerging over time, would be through the best value exercise. However, one of the problems is that local authorities package arts and cultural projects in different ways in different departments, as they are entitled to do. How they shape their organisation is a matter for them. That is one reason why there is such emphasis on the need for more evidence, as it is difficult to make comparisons. However, I reassure you that Cardiff City and County Council is well advanced in producing an arts strategy, along with the arts council. There are, however, excellent examples of good practice: for example, Swansea and its museums and art gallery; Newport museum with its free entry; and the contribution of Denbighshire—I have just had a meeting with the authority—to the Llangollen International Eisteddfod. In excluding other local authorities I do not say that they are examples of bad practice, I am simply giving some examples of good contributions, which we need to build up on.

I appreciate your comments on the youth arts fund. In relation to Clwyd Theatr Cymru, the Arts Council of Wales and I have held discussions with its staff and Flintshire County Council officials, and firm proposals are underway to ensure that Clwyd Theatr Cymru's funding is on a firmer footing in

mae'n cynnwys llawer sy'n dynodi sylfaen lawer cadarnach i'w datblygiad, gan fynd lawer ymhellach na darparu arian ychwanegol yn unig. Fodd bynnag cafwyd cynnig i gael ysgoloriaethau; mae cyngor y celfyddydau yn datblygu cynllun ar hyn o bryd i'w hyrwyddo. Eisoes mae'n rhoi ysgoloriaethau, ond bydd yn gwella'r ffordd y caiff yr ysgoloriaethau eu darparu nid yn unig ar gyfer pobl ifanc ond hefyd i amrediad o artistiaid o bob disgyblaeth. Cynhwysa hefyd strategaeth grefft a fydd yn arwain at ddatblygiad y crefftau proffesiynol ar draws Cymru. Arfaethir datblygiadau diddorol ar gyfer dawnys ac mae pwyslais drwyddi ar anghenion hyfforddi. Cewch hyd i lawer ar gyfer artistiaid proffesiynol o bob math.

O ran ffigurau awdurdodau lleol, carwn pe bai gyn hawsed ag ysgrifennu llythyr atoch yn amlinellu'r sefyllfa. Un dull da o gadw golwg ar y sefyllfa, fel y gwelwn hi yn datblygu dros gyfnod, fyddai drwy ymarferiad gwerth gorau. Fodd bynnag, un o'r problemau yw bod awdurdodau yn pecynnu prosiectau celf a diwylliannol mewn ffyrdd gwahanol ac mewn adrannau gwahanol, fel y mae rhyddid ganddynt i wneud. Mater iddynt hwy yw sut maent yn trefnu eu corff. Dyma un rheswm pam y mae'r fath bwyslais ar yr angen am ragor o dystiolaeth, gan ei bod yn anodd gwneud cymariaethau. Serch hynny, gallaf eich sicrhau fod Cyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd yn bell ar y ffordd i gynhyrchu strategaeth celf ar y cyd gyda Chyngor y Celfyddydau. Y mae, fodd bynnag, enghreifftiau ardderchog o arfer da: er enghraifft, Abertawe a'i hamgueddfeydd a'i horiel gelf; amgueddfa Casnewydd gyda'i mynediad am ddim; a chyfraniad Sir Ddinbych—yr wyf newydd gael cyfarfod gydag Eisteddfod Ryngwladol Llangollen. Nid wyf wrth eithrio awdurdodau eraill yn dweud eu bod yn esiamplau o arfer gwael, rhoi rhai enghreifftiau'n unig yr ydwyf i o gyfraniadau da, y mae angen inni adeiladu arnynt.

Gwerthfawrogaf eich sylwadau ar y gronfa celf ieuenctid. Ynglŷn a Theatr Clwyd Cymru, cynhaliodd Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru a minnau drafodaethau gyda'i staff a, swyddogion Cyngor Sir y Fflint, ac mae cynigion pendant ar y gweill i sicrhau bod ariannu Theatr Clwyd Cymru ar sylfaen

future.

On the national art gallery, as you know—I say this every time I answer questions—we are halfway through a consultation process, but the strategy makes plenty of references to the need for improving displays of visual art.

**Tom Middlehurst:** Alison Halford and I, and other Members for north Wales, welcome your comments on the future, and the Welsh national performing arts companies' important contribution to cultural life in Wales, not least their contribution to creating a positive image of Wales abroad.

I welcome your commitment, Minister. Do you agree with Jonathan Morgan and me that it is important to support successful strategies that are being pursued by the flagship companies? For example, Clwyd Theatr Cymru's mobile tour has attracted substantial new audiences, which would not otherwise have been touched by drama and theatre. It deserves to be recognised and supported for that new initiative.

Regarding the work of the new Wales Screen Commission, will you do all that you can in your discussions with the Welsh Local Government Association, to ensure that Welsh local authorities are aware of the important opportunities available to take advantage of the potential for developing film and screen work in our communities?

**Jenny Randerson:** I hope that Members for north Wales will have read the strategy as a whole and will have seen the many references to north Wales, and to the importance of developing artistic and cultural experience throughout Wales. I value the role of the national remit companies. We will not achieve our aim of putting Wales on the world cultural stage unless we make the best of our national remit companies.

However, you will have noticed that I said in my statement that they must also contribute to their communities, and you are referring to that. Clwyd Theatr Cymru made a good practice of touring in the community, and it is such community activity—and other shades

gadarnach yn y dyfodol.

Ynglŷn â'r oriel gelf genedlaethol, fel y gwyddoch—yr wyf yn dweud hyn bob tro yr wyf yn ateb cwestiynau—yr ydym hanner ffordd drwy broses ymgynghori, ond mae'r strategaeth yn cyfeirio'n aml at yr angen i wella dangosiadau celf weledol.

**Tom Middlehurst:** Croesawa Alison Halford a minnau, ac Aelodau eraill o'r Gogledd, eich sylwadau am y dyfodol, a chyfraniad pwysig cwmnïau celfyddydau perfformio cenedlaethol i fywyd diwylliannol Cymru, yn enwedig eu cyfraniad i greu delwedd gadarnhaol i Gymru dramor.

Croesawaf eich ymrwymiad, Weinidog. A ydych yn cytuno â Jonathan Morgan a minnau ei bod yn bwysig cefnogi strategaethau llwyddiannus sy'n cael eu dilyn gan y cwmnïau blaengar? Er enghraifft, denodd taith Theatr Clwyd Cymru gynulleidfaoedd newydd sylweddol, na fyddent fel arall wedi dod i gysylltiad â drama a'r theatr. Haedda gael ei chydabod a'i chefnogi am y fenter newydd honno.

Ynglŷn â gwaith y Comisiwn Sgrîn Cymru newydd, a wnewch chi bopeth yn eich gallu yn eich trafodaethau gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, i sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol Cymru'n ymwybodol o'r cyfleoedd pwysig sydd ar gael i fanteisio ar y potensial i ddatblygu gwaith ffilm a sgrîn yn ein cymunedau?

**Jenny Randerson:** Gobeithiaf fod Aelodau'r Gogledd wedi darllen y strategaeth yn ei chyfanrwydd ac wedi gweld y cyfeiriadau mynych at y Gogledd, ac at bwysigrwydd datblygu'r profiad artistig a diwylliannol ar draws Cymru. Gwerthfawrogaf rôl y cwmnïau â chylch gwaith cenedlaethol. Ni chyflawnwn ein nod o roi Cymru ar lwyfan diwylliannol y byd oni wnawn y defnydd gorau o'n cwmnïau cylch gwaith cenedlaethol.

Fodd bynnag, byddwch wedi sylwi i mi ddweud yn fy natganiad fod yn rhaid iddynt hwy gyfrannu tuag at eu cymunedau, ac yr ydych yn cyfeirio at hynny. Gwnaeth Theatr Clwyd Cymru hi'n arfer da i deithio yn y gymuned, a gweithgaredd cymunedol o'r

of it—that we must encourage. The Welsh National Opera is doing a great deal, and under its stabilisation process will be obliged to do more to spread information and enjoyment of opera throughout Welsh communities.

To briefly explain the all-Wales Screen Commission, the idea is that there will be three regional screen commissions feeding into it. That has the advantage of giving us an all-Wales brand, especially when promoting Wales abroad as a venue for filming. At the same time, we will not lose local knowledge and expertise. Many local authorities throughout Wales are committed to participating in this and developing it anew. The regional system has been up and running to a certain extent already, but this gives us exciting new opportunities.

**Owen John Thomas:** Yr wyf yn falch mai un o swyddogaethau'r Gweinidog yw hyrwyddo'r iaith Gymraeg. Darllenais yn ei datganiad i'r wasg y bore yma ei bod yn beirniadu Plaid Cymru am beidio â meddwl am syniadau ffres ar gyfer y Gymraeg. Mae'n eironig, felly, fod ei datganiad yn uniaith Saesneg. Mae'n llawer anos imi ei ddarllen yn Saesneg a gwneud sylwadau yn y Gymraeg. Dylech fod yn driw i'ch swydd, a hyrwyddo'r iaith Gymraeg, gan sicrhau bod datganiadau eithaf byr—fel hwn sydd yn llai na 1,000 o eiriau—yn yr iaith Gymraeg, yn ogystal â'r Saesneg.

Er hynny, croesawaf brif themâu'r datganiad: y pwyslais ar bobl ifanc, ar gymunedau, ar amrywiaeth ddiwylliannol, ar ddiwylliant creadigol, a'r gydnabyddiaeth o bwysigrwydd diwylliant i ddelwedd Cymru. Mae Plaid Cymru wedi credu erioed bod hyrwyddo delwedd Cymru ledled y byd yn bwysig. Yr wyf yn falch bod y Gweinidog wedi dilyn y thema honno. Yr oedd hyn hefyd yn rhan annatod o 'Diwylliant Cytûn', sydd yn cynnwys cryn dipyn o syniadaeth Plaid Cymru.

3:00 p.m.

Nodaf fod y Gymraeg yn cael ei hadolygu ar hyn o bryd, ac yr adolygir chwaraeon yn nes ymlaen. Felly ni chafodd argymhellion yn ymwneud â'r pynciau hynny eu cynnwys yn

fath—a gweddau eraill arno—sy'n rhaid inni eu hyrwyddo. Mae Cwmni Opera Cenedlaethol Cymru'n gwneud llawer, ac o dan ei broses sefydlogi bydd rheidrwydd arno i wneud rhagor i ledaenu gwybodaeth a mwynhad ynglŷn ag opera ar draws Cymru.

I esbonio'r Comisiwn Sgrîn i Gymru gyfan yn fyr, y syniad yw cael tri chomisiwn sgrîn rhanbarthol yn bwydo iddo. Mantais hynny yw y bydd yn rhoi brand Cymru gyfan inni, yn arbennig tra'n hyrwyddo Cymru dramor fel lleoliad ffilmio. Ar yr un pryd, ni fyddwn yn colli gwybodaeth ac arbenigedd lleol. Mae llawer o awdurdodau lleol ar draws Cymru wedi ymrwymo i gyfranogi o hyn a'i ddatblygu o'r newydd. Bu'r system ranbarthol yn gweithredu i ryw raddau'n barod, ond mae hyn yn rhoi cyfleoedd cyffrous newydd inni.

**Owen John Thomas:** I am pleased that one of the Minister's duties is to promote the Welsh language. I read her criticism of Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales for not thinking of fresh ideas for the Welsh language in her press statement this morning. It is ironic, therefore, that her statement was only available in English. It is much harder for me to read it in English and to comment in Welsh. You should be true to your office, and promote the Welsh language, by ensuring that such brief statements—this is fewer than 1,000 words—are available in Welsh as well as English.

However, I welcome the main themes of the statement: the emphasis on young people, on communities, on cultural diversity, on creative culture, and the recognition of the importance of culture to the image of Wales. Plaid Cymru has always believed that promoting the image of Wales throughout the world is important. I am pleased that the Minister has developed that theme. This was also an integral part of 'A Culture in Common', which draws heavily on Plaid Cymru's ideology.

I note that the Welsh language is currently under review, and that sport will be reviewed in the near future. Therefore, recommendations relating to those subjects

y strategaeth. Croesawaf yr anogaeth i awdurdodau lleol gydwethio'n agosach gyda chyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad—unwaith eto yn unol ag un o argymhellion 'Diwylliant Cytûn'—er mwyn dod â lles i bobl Cymru. Yr wyf yn falch y pwysleisir yr angen a'r bwriad i sefydlu cronfa celfyddydau i ieuenctid. Mae hynny'n bwysig. Ceir cyfeiriad hefyd at ffilm. Bu Gŵyl Ffilm Ryngwladol Cymru yr wythnos diwethaf yn llwyddiant ysgubol. Gwn fod y Gweinidog a nifer o Aelodau wedi mwynhau ffilmiau a ddangoswyd yng Nghaerdydd. Daw hyn â chlod i Gymru, a dangosir i'r byd fod ein cenedl fach—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Gofynnwch gwestiwn, os gwelwch yn dda.

**Owen John Thomas:** Mae gennyf dda gwestiwn. Yn gyntaf, yr ydych yn dweud nad yw'r strategaeth wedi ei chyllido. Onid yw'n bwysig ichi wneud hynny, hyd yn oed pe bai'n rhaid ichi ei haddasu fel bod ychydig yn cael ei gyflawni eleni ac ychydig y flwyddyn nesaf? Heb gyllid, mae'r strategaeth yn debyg i restr o ddyheadau. Mae angen gwell na hynny arnom. Yn ail, yr ydym wedi bod yn aros yn amyneddgar am ddatganiad ar ddyfodol Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ble y mae'r cwestiwn?

**Owen John Thomas:** A gawn y datganiad hwnnw heddiw?

**Jenny Randerson:** On the point about the Welsh version of the statement, it was prepared to allow sufficient time for translation. It has been translated, and I apologise that, due to an electronic blip, it is not available. I hope that someone is working at present to ensure that the Welsh version is made available.

You made several statements in support of the strategy. In terms of Wales's image abroad, it is important to note that I have placed much more emphasis on this in the strategy than in 'A Culture in Common'. It is an important crossover between Welsh culture and the Welsh economy. It is essential that we build on that in a big way.

were not contained in the strategy. I welcome the encouragement to local authorities to co-operate more closely with Assembly sponsored public bodies—again in line with a recommendation contained in 'A Culture in Common'—in order to bring benefit to the people of Wales. I am pleased that emphasis is placed on the need and intention to establish a youth arts fund. That is important. Reference is also made to film. Last week's International Film Festival Wales was a great success. I know that the Minister and several Members enjoyed films shown in Cardiff. This brings kudos to Wales, and shows the world that our small nation—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Please ask a question.

**Owen John Thomas:** I have two questions. First, you say that you have not costed the strategy. Is it not important that you do so, even if it has to be altered so that some things are achieved this year and others next year? Without costings, the strategy appears to be a wish list. We need better than that. Secondly, we have been waiting patiently for a statement on the future of the Wales Millennium Centre.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Where is the question?

**Owen John Thomas:** Can we have that statement today?

**Jenny Randerson:** Ar fater fersiwn Cymraeg y datganiad, cafodd ei baratoi i roi amser digonol i'w gyfieithu. Cafodd ei gyfieithu, ac ymddiheuraf, oherwydd nam electronig, nad yw ar gael. Gobeithiaf fod rhywun yn gweithio ar hyn o bryd i sicrhau bod y fersiwn Cymraeg yn cael ei ddarparu.

Gwnaethoch sawl datganiad a oedd yn cefnogi'r strategaeth. O ran delwedd Cymru dramor, mae'n bwysig sylwi fy mod wedi gosod llawer rhagor o bwyslais ar hyn yn y strategaeth nag yn 'Diwylliant Cytûn'. Mae'n groesfa bwysig rhwng diwylliant Cymru ac economi Cymru. Mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn adeiladu'n sylweddol ar hynny.

You mentioned the International Film Festival Wales. It is not only international in name. One evening the French ambassador attended, and was enthusiastic about the fact that a French film was being shown. This is an important part of establishing cultural links and Wales's image abroad.

The one substantive question that I can answer relates to costing. This has, in part, been costed into the budget of ASPBs and other organisations responsible for delivery of the budget next year. Every item has been considered in terms of feasibility and financial implications. However, you will be aware that as you consider items to be delivered further in the future, costings can be less certain. Therefore, it is not my intention to provide costings that would be unrealistic in the long term.

In terms of the Wales Millennium Centre, it is now a matter of the final discussions and decision-making process.

**Peter Law:** I welcome the Minister's statement, which, in my opinion, is good. I compliment her, and the Culture Committee for supporting her. However, what will the strategy mean for places such as my constituency in Blaenau Gwent? For instance, I have been trying for three months to find out from the Arts Council of Wales which cultural opportunities it has steered there. The council does not answer questions; Members should be interested to know that.

Blaenau Gwent has a population of 80,000 but only one cinema, which was run by the local authority. Apart from the excellent local amateur companies, the area is effectively a cultural desert. For this strategy to make a difference, the 43 per cent of people in my community who do not have access to cars or to a passenger rail service, must see cultural and entertainment opportunities being provided on the ground. The opportunities that other people take for granted are never seen in Blaenau Gwent.

What will this strategy mean to Valleys communities such as Blaenau Gwent? Can

Gwnaethoch sôn am Wyl Ffilm Ryngwladol Cymru. Nid mewn enw'n unig y mae'n rhyngwladol. Un noson fe'i mynychwyd gan lysgennad Ffrainc, ac yr oedd yn frwdfrydig oherwydd y dangosid ffilm o Ffrainc. Mae hyn yn rhan bwysig o sefydlu cysylltiadau diwylliannol a delwedd Cymru dramor.

Mae'r un cwestiwn sylweddol y medraf ei ateb yn ymwneud â chostio. Costiwyd hwn, yn rhannol, yng nghyllideb y cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad a chyrrff eraill sy'n gyfrifol am gyflwyno'r gyllideb y flwyddyn nesaf. Ystyriwyd pob eitem o ran ei dichonolrwydd a'i goblygiadau ariannol. Fodd bynnag, byddwch yn ymwybodol gan eich bod yn ystyried eitemau sydd i'w cyflwyno ymhellach i'r dyfodol, gall y costio fod yn llai sicr. Felly, nid yw'n fwriad gennyf i ddarparu costio a fyddai'n afreal yn y tymor hir.

O ran Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru, mae yn awr yn fater trafodaethau terfynol a'r broses gwneud penderfyniadau.

**Peter Law:** Croesawaf ddatganiad y Gweinidog, sydd yn fy marn i, yn un da. Canmolaf hi, a'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant am ei chefnogi. Er hynny, beth fydd y strategaeth hon yn ei olygu i fannau megis fy etholaeth i ym Mlaenau Gwent? Er enghraifft, bwm am dri mis yn ceisio cael gwybod gan Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru am gyfleoedd diwylliannol y mae wedi eu cyfeirio yno. Nid yw'r cyngor yn ateb cwestiynau; dylai'r Aelodau ymddiddori yn hynny.

Mae gan Flaenau Gwent boblogaeth o 80,000 ond un sinema yn unig, a arferai gael ei chynnal gan yr awdurdod lleol. Ar wahân i gwmniau amatur lleol ardderchog, mae'r ardal i bob pwrpas yn ddiffeithwch diwylliannol. Os yw'r strategaeth hon i wneud gwahaniaeth, rhaid i'r 43 y cant o'r bobl yn fy nghymuned, sydd heb feddu ar geir na mynediad i wasanaeth rheilffordd, weld cyfleoedd diwylliannol ac adloniant yn cael eu darparu yn yr ardal. Nid yw'r cyfleoedd sy'n cael eu cymryd yn ganiataol gan bobl eraill fyth i'w gweld ym Mlaenau Gwent.

Beth fydd y strategaeth hon yn ei olygu i gymunedau'r Cymoedd megis Blaenau

we expect more desperately-needed cultural provisions to be directed into these communities, especially in view of the fact that the Minister is ploughing £25 million into the Wales Millennium Centre—with which I totally disagree? Will the Valleys communities be included in this strategy as we all hope that they will be?

**Jenny Randerson:** Yesterday, I attended an extravaganza at Llancaiach Fawr manor organised by the lottery distributors under their awards for all scheme and other bigger schemes. Yesterday's meeting was aimed at encouraging organisations from five Valleys communities—there will be series of meetings—to apply for funding. A considerable amount of lottery funding has been spent in the Valleys—although not in every community, but it is still a considerable amount. For example, the arts council's fund, Arts for All, has done well in the Valleys.

To a certain extent, we must consider lottery spending carefully. You draw attention to the high profile big grants, which have not only been allocated in Cardiff. When these big grants are calculated as an average per head, the level of spending looks good. These big grants have also been allocated to other areas, such as Ceredigion. They make it seem as if small organisations in an area do well from lottery funding. That is not always the case because big grants can hide the fact that lesser amounts are not available to smaller organisations. I would be happy to write to you, Peter, with further details on the amounts of money that have been allocated to your constituency from various lottery funds.

**David Davies:** The South Wales Film Commission has the highest turnover in Wales and is supported by 11 of the 14 local authorities within its area. I understand that an important meeting will be held on Thursday at which Sgrîn will discuss the strategy that you have just outlined. However, the South Wales Film Commission is being prevented from attending that meeting. Will you investigate this state of affairs and ensure that Sgrîn treats the South

Gwent? A fedrwn ni ddisgwyl gweld rhagor o ddarpariaeth ddiwylliannol, sydd ei mawr angen yn cael ei chyfeirio i'r cymunedau hyn, yn enwedig gyda golwg ar y ffaith bod y Gweinidog yn arllwys £25 miliwn—yr wyf fi'n anghytuno'n llwyr â hi—i fewn i Ganolfan Mileniwm Cymru? A fydd cymunedau'r Cymoedd yn cael eu cynnwys yn y strategaeth hon fel yr ydym ni i gyd yn ei obeithio?

**Jenny Randerson:** Ddoe, mynychais sioe ryfeddol ym maenordy Llancaiach Fawr a drefnwyd gan ddosranwyr y loteri o dan eu cynllun arian i bawb a chynlluniau mawr eraill. Anelwyd cyfarfod ddoe at annog cyrff o bump o gymunedau'r cymoedd—bydd cyfres o gyfarfodydd—i wneud ceisiadau am arian. Gwariwyd cryn swm o arian y loteri yn y Cymoedd—er nad ym mhob cymuned, ond y mae'n dal i fod yn swm sylweddol. Er enghraifft, gwnaeth cronfa cyngor y celfyddydau, Celfyddydau i Bawb yn dda yn y Cymoedd.

I ryw raddau, rhaid inni ystyried gwariant loteri yn ofalus. Tynnwch sylw at y cymorthdaliadau proffil uchel a ddosrannwyd nid yn unig i Gaerdydd. Pan fydd y cymorthdaliadau mawr hyn yn cael eu hamcangyfrif ar gyfartaledd yn ôl y pen, mae maint y gwariant yn ymddangos yn dda. Dosrannwyd y cymorthdaliadau mawr hyn i ardaloedd eraill megis Ceredigion. Gwnânt iddi ymddangos fel pe bai cyrff bychain mewn ardal yn gwneud yn dda o arian y loteri. Nid dyna'r sefyllfa bob amser, oherwydd gall cymorthdaliadau mawr gelu'r ffaith nad yw symiau is ar gael i gyrff llai. Byddwn yn fwy na pharod i ysgrifennu atoch, Peter, gyda manylion pellach am y symiau o arian a ddosrannwyd i'ch etholaeth o wahanol gronfeydd y loteri.

**David Davies:** Comisiwn Ffilm De Cymru sydd â'r trosliant uchaf yng Nghymru, ac fe'i cefnogir gan 11 o'r 14 awdurdod lleol yn ei ardal. Deallaf fod cyfarfod pwysig i'w gynnal ddydd Iau lle bydd Sgrîn yn trafod y strategaeth yr ydych newydd ei hamlinellu. Fodd bynnag, atelir Comisiwn Ffilm De Cymru rhag mynychu'r cyfarfod hwnnw. A wnewch chi ymchwilio i'r sefyllfa hon, a sicrhau bod Sgrîn yn trin Comisiwn Ffilm De Cymru yn gwrtais ac yn deg? Credir yn

Wales Film Commission with courtesy and fairness? It is widely perceived that that does not happen at the moment and that there is a danger that we will lose the local knowledge and expertise, which, as you said in your earlier comments, are so important.

**Jenny Randerson:** I am aware of the problems associated with involving the South Wales Film Commission in the new all-Wales body. However, I have seen the correspondence on this matter and I am fully aware of what has been happening. I assure you, David, that this matter has been dealt with the utmost courtesy and consideration and that every opportunity has been extended to the film commission. However, there was a slight inaccuracy in your comments. Eleven of the 14 local authorities do not provide funding for the film commission. I believe it would be helpful if I wrote to you about it.

**David Davies:** I said support not fund.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order.

**Jenny Randerson:** I will write to you about this issue because 11 of the 14 local authorities do not provide funding.

**David Davies:** I said support.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I have a historic interest in this matter, but I am not biased. I am trying to keep order.

3:10 p.m.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Fel pob siaradwr heddiw, croesawaf y strategaeth hon a'r cydweithio a fu rhwng y Pwyllgor a'r Gweinidog, a'r ffaith bod y Gweinidog wedi ymateb mor gadarnhaol i sylwadau'r Pwyllgor.

Mae gennyf ddau gwestiwn. Cyfeiriwch yn y strategaeth, Jenny, at 'Diwylliant Cytûn', a soniwch am y ffaith eich bod yn datblygu hwnnw dros 10 mlynedd. Athroniaeth sylfaenol y ddogfen honno oedd yr angen i symbylu a hyrwyddo diwylliant ar lawr daear. Mae hynny'n newid sylfaenol o'r hyn sydd wedi cael ei noddi a'i gefnogi yn y gorffennol. A oes ymrwymiad ariannol i

gyffredinol nad yw hyn yn digwydd ar hyn o bryd a bod perygl inni golli'r wybodaeth a'r arbenigedd lleol, sydd, fel y soniasoch yn eich sylwadau cynharach, mor bwysig.

**Jenny Randerson:** Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r problemau sy'n gysylltiedig â chynnwys Comisiwn Ffilm De Cymru yn y corff newydd i Gymru gyfan. Er hyn gwelais yr ohebiaeth ynglŷn â'r mater hwn ac yr wyf yn llwyr ymwybodol o'r hyn sy'n digwydd. Fe'ch sicrhaf, David, fod Sgrin wedi delio â'r mater hwn â'r cwrteisi a'r ystyriaeth fwyaf a bod pob cyfle wedi cael ei estyn i'r comisiwn ffilm. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd camgymeriad bach yn eich sylwadau. Nid yw 11 o'r 14 awdurdod lleol yn rhoi arian i'r comisiwn ffilm. Credaf y byddai'n ddefnyddiol pe bawn yn ysgrifennu atoch ynglŷn â hyn.

**David Davies:** Cefnogi a ddywedais i nid ariannu.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn.

**Jenny Randerson:** Ysgrifennaf atoch ynglŷn â'r mater hwn oherwydd nid yw 11 o'r 14 awdurdod lleol yn rhoi arian.

**David Davies:** Cefnogi ddywedais i.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae gennyf ddiddordeb hanesyddol yn y mater hwn, ond nid oes gennyf ragfarn. Yr wyf yn ceisio cadw trefn.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Like all today's speakers, I welcome this strategy, the co-operation that has taken place between the Committee and the Minister, and the fact that the Minister responded so positively to the Committee's comments.

I have two questions. You refer in the strategy, Jenny, to 'A Culture in Common', and mention that you are developing that over 10 years. The fundamental philosophy of that document was the need to stimulate and promote culture at grass-roots level. That is a fundamental shift from what has been sponsored and supported in the past. Is there a financial commitment to ensure that there is



sicrhau bod cysylltiad rhwng yr hyn sy'n digwydd ar lawr daear, pan ddaw pobl at ei gilydd i greu diwylliant, a'r prosiectau mawr yr ydym i gyd mor falch ohonynt yng Nghymru?

Mae fy ail gwestiwn yn cyfeirio at un o'r meysydd hynny, sef dawnn glasur. A oes lle i fale o fewn y strategaeth, o gofio bod gennym gwmi yng Nghymru—Ballet Russe—sydd yn gosod y safonau uchaf posibl ar gyfer dawnn glasur, ac sy'n hyfforddi pobl ifanc i gymryd rhan yn y ffurf honno ar ddawns?

**Jenny Randerson:** On developing culture at grass-roots level, next year's budget will have a strong emphasis on the importance of developing grass-roots cultural excellence and grass-roots cultural activity. As you will be aware, the financial commitment is spelt out in the remit letter. It is important that we see culture as a continuum and accept that you cannot have the best unless you encourage those starting out, and that those at the community level are encouraged by seeing and hearing the best. That must be linked together.

On dance, the strategy accepts the financial reality of the cost of establishing a classical ballet company, which is akin to establishing an opera company. That would be a considerable endeavour now, if we were to do it from scratch. Of course there is a place for classical dance in Wales. I am aware of Ballet Russe. I have been to see and visit it. Only yesterday, I was told of an excellent development whereby it has teamed up with the Welsh College of Music and Drama—which is considering the development of dance within its portfolio of courses—to work on sets and staging and so on. That is of benefit to Ballet Russe and is an excellent example of co-operation and partnership between an educational institution and an on-the-ground arts activity, which is incredibly popular. Ballet Russe tours Wales and has good audiences.

a link between what happens at grass-roots level, when people come together to create culture, and the flagship projects of which we are all so proud in Wales?

My second question refers to one of those areas, namely classical dance. Is there room for ballet within the strategy, bearing in mind that we have a company in Wales—Ballet Russe—which sets the highest possible standards for classical dance, and trains young people to participate in that form of dance?

**Jenny Randerson:** Ynglŷn â datblygu diwylliant ar lawr gwlad, bydd pwyslais cryf yng nghyllideb y flwyddyn nesaf ar bwysigrwydd datblygu rhagoriaeth ddiwylliannol ar lawr gwlad a gweithgaredd diwylliannol ar lawr gwlad. Fel yr ydych yn ymwybodol, amlinellir yr ymrwymiad ariannol yn y llythyr cylch gwaith. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn gweld diwylliant fel continwmm a derbyn nad allwch chi gael y gorau oni wnewch chi annog y rhai sy'n dechrau arni, a bod y rheini sy'n y gymuned yn cael eu hannog drwy weld a chlywed y gorau. Rhaid i'r peth hwn fod yn un.

O ran dawnn, mae'r strategaeth yn derbyn realiti ariannol sefydlu cwmni balé clasur, sy'n gyfystyr â sefydlu cwmni opera. Byddai hynny'n ymdrech sylweddol yn awr, pe baem yn ei gwneud o'r cychwyn. Wrth gwrs bod lle i ddawns glasur yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r Ballet Russe. Ymwelais â hi a'i gweld. Ddoe ddiwethaf, hysbyswyd fi am ddatblygiad ardderchog lle mae wedi ymuno â Choleg Cerdd a Drama Cymru—sy'n ystyried datblygu dawnn o fewn ei phortffolio cyrsiau—i weithio ar setiau a llwyfannu ac ati. Mae hyn o fudd i'r Ballet Russe ac mae'n enghraifft ardderchog o gydweithrediad a phartneriaeth rhwng sefydliad addysgol a gweithgaredd ar lawr gwlad sy'n eithriadol boblogaidd. Teithia Ballet Russe dros Gymru ac mae'n cael cynulleidfaoedd da.

## **Datganiad Busnes Business Statement**

**The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies):** Before I turn to the business statement for the next three weeks, I inform Members of changes to this week's business. On Thursday, 6 December, the motion to approve Special Grant Report No. 9 on unaccompanied asylum-seeking children has been rescheduled for Tuesday, 8 January. Also, on Thursday, Carwyn Jones will make a statement on the Farming Futures strategy.

**Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies):** Cyn imi droi at y datganiad busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf, hysbysaf yr Aelodau o newidiadau i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Ar ddydd Iau, 6 Rhagfyr, ad-drefnwyd y cynnig i gymeradwyo Adroddiad Grant Arbennig Rhif 9 ar blant sy'n ceisio lloches ar eu pennau eu hunain ar gyfer dydd Mawrth, 8 Ionawr. Hefyd, ddydd Iau, bydd Carwyn Jones yn gwneud datganiad ar y strategaeth Dyfodol Ffermio.

To turn to the business for the next three weeks, the Business Committee agreed at its meeting this morning business for the next three weeks as shown on the Chamberweb under supporting documents. The Deputy Presiding Officer determined under Standing Order No. 22.5 that the Poultry Meat, Farmed Game Bird Meat and Rabbit Meat (Hygiene and Inspection) (Amendment) (Wales) (Regulations) 2001, need not be referred to a Subject Committee for consideration. A copy of this statement will be posted to the intranet and internet as usual.

Gan droi at fusnes y tair wythnos nesaf, cytunodd y Pwyllgor Busnes yn ei gyfarfod y bore yma â'r busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y dangosir ar we'r Siambr o dan ddogfennau ategol. Penderfynodd y Dirprwy Lywydd o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.5 nad oedd angen cyfeirio Cig Dofednod, Cig Adar Hela wedi'u Ffermio a Chig Cwningod (Hy lendid ac Archwilio) (Gwelliant) (Cymru) (Rheoliadau) 2001 i Bwyllgor Pwnc i'w ystyried. Caiff copi o'r datganiad hwn ei gyhoeddi ar y fewnwyd a'r rhyngwyd fel arfer.

**The Presiding Officer:** There are no objections to the business statement.

**Y Llywydd:** Nid oes unrhyw wrthwynebiadau i'r datganiad busnes.

A oes unrhyw sylwadau ar y datganiad busnes?

Are there any comments on the business statement?

**Dafydd Wigley:** A wnaiff Andrew Davies, dros y cyfnod nesaf, ac fel mater o frys, chwilio am amser mewn Cyfarfod Llawn i drafod anghenion tai Cymru, yn arbennig yr argyfwng tai yng nghefn gwlad? Gofynnaf hyn yn sgîl cyflwyno Mesur yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin ddydd Gwener diwethaf, sef Mesur Tai (Cymru) 2001, a gafodd ei siarad allan. Yr oedd yn Fesur hynod bwysig a fyddai wedi darparu pwerau ychwanegol i'r Cynulliad i fynd i'r afael â'r argyfwng tai, ar hyd llinellau y mae ei gyd-Weinidogion—yn ogystal â ni—wedi cytuno arnynt. Os nad oes amser ar gael yn San Steffan i drafod materion o bwys mawr i gefn gwlad Cymru, sut y gall y Cynulliad wneud y gwaith hwn y mae Llundain yn anfodlon ei wneud ar ein rhan?

**Dafydd Wigley:** Will Andrew Davies, over the ensuing period, and as a matter of urgency, look for time in Plenary to discuss housing needs in Wales, particularly the housing crisis in rural areas? I ask this in the wake of a Bill being introduced last Friday in the House of Commons, the Housing (Wales) Bill 2001, which was talked out. It was an exceptionally important Bill, which would have provided additional powers for the Assembly to tackle the housing crisis along the lines that his fellow Ministers—and ourselves—had agreed upon. If time is not available in Westminster to debate issues of great importance to rural Wales, how can the Assembly do the work that London is unwilling to do on our behalf?

**Jonathan Morgan:** My comment relates to a request that I made previously in Business Committee. I requested that the First Minister make a statement on Cabinet portfolios, in particular the economic development portfolio, before Christmas. We were told in July that the current arrangement was a temporary measure, as we were heading into the summer recess period. We are now heading into the Christmas recess period and, before long, the Government of Wales will have redefined the concept of what is deemed to be temporary.

Peter Law states in today's *South Wales Echo*:

'You cannot run the Government of Wales with one empty Cabinet seat.'

In light of his comments, and in light of the growing disquiet of Members in your own party, is it not time for the First Minister to make an urgent statement before the Christmas recess?

**Alun Pugh:** Will you consider scheduling a statement on the effects on health on the north Wales coast arising from the activities at Sellafield, sometime in the new year?

**The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies):** I will take Jonathan's point first. Neither the First Minister nor I have anything further to add to the statement that he made in July on the economic development portfolio.

I will discuss Dafydd's point on housing with my colleague, Edwina Hart, and I will come back to Dafydd and to the Business Committee on that issue. Similarly, I will discuss Alun's point with my ministerial colleague, Jane Hutt, and respond appropriately.

### Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order

**Nick Bourne:** Point of order. This relates to all our Standing Orders. I seek guidance from you, Presiding Officer, in relation to business in the Assembly Chamber and to Cabinet documents, on the appropriate term to be

**Jonathan Morgan:** Mae fy sylw yn ymwneud â chais a wneuthum yn flaenorol yn y Pwyllgor Busnes. Gofynnais i Brif Weinidog Cymru wneud datganiad ar bortffolios y Cabinet, yn arbennig y portffolio datblygu economaidd, cyn y Nadolig. Dywedwyd wrthym ym mis Gorffennaf mai mesur dros dro oedd y trefniant presennol, oherwydd yr oeddem ar fin torri ar gyfer yr haf. Yr ydym yn awr ar fin torri ar gyfer y Nadolig a, chyn bo hir, bydd Llywodraeth Cymru wedi ailddiffinio beth sydd dros dro.

Dywed Peter Law yn y *South Wales Echo* heddiw:

Yng ngoleuni ei sylwadau, ac yn ngoleuni'r anesmwythyd cynyddol ymhlith Aelodau eich plaid eich hun, onid yw'n bryd i Brif Weinidog Cymru wneud datganiad brys cyn toriad y Nadolig?

**Alun Pugh:** A wnewch chi ystyried trefnu datganiad ar yr effeithiau ar iechyd ar hyd arfordir y Gogledd yn sgîl y gweithgareddau yn Sellafield, rywbryd yn y flwyddyn newydd?

**Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies):** Ymdriniaf â phwynt Jonathan yn gyntaf. Nid oes gan Brif Weinidog Cymru na minnau unrhyw beth pellach i'w ychwanegu at y datganiad a wnaeth ym mis Gorffennaf ar y portffolio datblygu economaidd.

Trafodaf bwynt Dafydd ar dai gyda'm cyd-Aelod, Edwina Hart, a deuaf yn ôl at Dafydd ac at y Pwyllgor Busnes ynglŷn â'r mater hwnnw. Yn yr un modd, trafodaf bwynt Alun gyda'm cyd-Aelod gweinidogol, Jane Hutt, ac ymatebaf yn briodol.

**Nick Bourne:** Pwynt o drefn. Mae a wnelo hyn â'n holl Reolau Sefydlog. Ceisiaf arweiniad gennyh, Lywydd, mewn perthynas â busnes yn Siambr y Cynulliad ac â dogfennau'r Cabinet, ar y term priodol i'w

used in Plenary sessions to describe the administration. In particular, is it in order for me and my party to continue to refer to the administration as the Government of Wales, and to refer to the Plenary session as the National Assembly, or as the Assembly? It is sad that the First Minister felt it necessary, when he could not make a decision himself, and did not want the Assembly Review of Procedure Committee to do so, to go out to an expensive consultation with a Blairite focus group and then announce that the administration was to be called the Welsh Assembly Government, rather than the Government of Wales, which is the term more commonly used. Will we have a vote in Plenary on the preferred title in the fullness of time, when appropriate?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, mae hyn yn eithriadol o bwysig. Fy nealltwriaeth i oedd bod y term hwn wedi ei dderbyn a'i greu er mwyn eglurder. Beth sydd yn digwydd i hynny, felly, pan ddefnyddir term ar lafar i ddisgrifio Llywodraeth Cymru sydd yn wahanol i'r term swyddogol a ddefnyddir mewn dogfennau swyddogol ac mewn papurau a osodwyd yn y sefydliad hwn?

This is important in terms of clarification. What exactly do we call the Government of Wales? When is a WAG a wag, and when does a wag become WAG-less? If a WAG is not a wag, is it still a WAG?

**Rod Richards:** Further to that point of order, I fail to see what all the fuss is about. The word 'wag' derives from the Old English word 'waghalter', meaning rascal. I think that it suits them perfectly.

3:20 p.m.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This is a point of order that I regard seriously. I have been asked to rule on the use of the term 'Welsh Assembly Government'. I made reference to this on 20 November when I said that what was in the Government of Wales Act 1998 'should be used at all times'. On 27 November, I said that I would return to this matter and consider it further. I have now done so. My responsibility extends only to

ddefnyddio yn y Cyfarfodydd Llawn i ddisgrifio'r weinyddiaeth. Yn arbennig felly, a yw mewn trefn i mi a'm plaid barhau i gyfeirio at y weinyddiaeth fel Llywodraeth Cymru, ac i gyfeirio at y Cyfarfod Llawn fel y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, neu fel y Cynulliad? Mae'n drist bod Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi teimlo'r angen, pan na allai wneud penderfyniad ei hun, ac nad oedd am i Bwyllgor Adolygu Gweithdrefn y Cynulliad wneud hynny, i gomisiynu ymgynghoriad costus â grŵp ffocws Blairaidd ac yna gyhoeddi mai'r enw ar y weinyddiaeth fyddai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, yn hytrach na Llywodraeth Cymru, sef y term a ddefnyddir yn fwy cyffredinol. A fyddwn yn pleidleisio yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar y teitl gorau yng nghyflawnder amser, pan fo'n briodol?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Further to that point of order, this is exceptionally important. My understanding was that this term had been coined and adopted for the sake of clarity. What happens, therefore, when a term that is used in the vernacular to describe the Government of Wales is different from the official term used in official documents and papers laid in this institution?

Mae hwn yn bwysig o ran egluro. Beth yn union a alwn Lywodraeth Cymru? Pryd mae WAG yn wag, a phryd daw wag yn ddi-wag? Os nad yw WAG yn wag, a yw'n dal i fod yn WAG?

**Rod Richards:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, ni allaf weld pam bod angen gwneud môr a mynydd o hyn. Deillia'r gair 'wag' o'r hen air Saesneg 'waghalter', sy'n golygu dihiryn. Credaf ei fod yn gweddu iddynt i'r dim.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae hwn yn bwynt o drefn a ystyriaeth yn ddifrifol. Gofynnwyd imi ddyfarnu ar y defnydd o'r term 'Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'. Cyfeiriais at hyn ar 20 Tachwedd pan ddywedais y dylid bob amser ddefnyddio'r hyn sydd yn Neddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. Ar 27 Tachwedd, dywedais y byddwn yn dychwelyd at y mater hwn a'i ystyried ymhellach. Yr wyf wedi gwneud hynny yn awr. Dim ond y defnydd o

the use of terms in Plenary and Committee proceedings and in relevant papers, as the leader of the Welsh Conservatives pointed out. In my consideration of this, my advisers kindly drew my attention to Section 56 (2) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, which requires that the executive committee established by the Act

dermau yn nhrefodion y Cyfarfod Llawn a'r Pwyllgorau ac mewn papurau perthnasol, fel y nododd arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru, yr wyf yn gyfrifol amdanynt. Wrth ystyried hyn, tynnodd fy ymgynghorwyr fy sylw at Adran 56(2) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, sy'n ei gwneud yn ofynnol i'r pwyllgor gweithredol a sefydlwyd gan y Ddeddf

'shall be known by such title as the standing orders may provide'.

The Standing Orders, in reference to interpretation, say that

Dywed y Rheolau Sefydlog, wrth gyfeirio at ddehongli

"Assembly Cabinet" means the executive committee established under section 56(1) of the Act'.

In view of this, I am now seeking legal advice on the purport of the words 'shall be known' in the Act. I will report to the Assembly when I receive this advice.

Yng ngoleuni hyn, yr wyf yn awr yn ceisio cyngor cyfreithiol ar ystyr y geiriau '*shall be known*' yn y Ddeddf. Cyflwynaf adroddiad i'r Cynulliad pan dderbyniaf y cyngor hwn.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Further to that point of order—

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn—

**The Presiding Officer:** There cannot be anything further to that point of order.

**Y Llywydd:** Ni all fod unrhyw beth ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Further clarification is obviously necessary. However, in the meantime, would it be out of order for us to call the Government, 'the Government of Wales'?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Mae'n amlwg bod angen eglurhad pellach. Fodd bynnag, yn y cyfamser, a fyddai allan o drefn inni alw'r Llywodraeth yn 'Llywodraeth Cymru'?

**The Presiding Officer:** No.

**Y Llywydd:** Na fyddai.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Point of order. I raise this under Standing Order Nos. 2.7 and 6.12A. It relates to this afternoon's debate to approve the Ministerial Code. As your office is aware, we attempted to table amendments to the motion for debate. We were informed that we are unable to amend a document that is subject to the Cabinet only. I understand that the First Minister, in accordance with Standing Order No. 2.7, commissioned the document and that it is submitted to the Assembly for approval only. I seek guidance as to whether there is provision in Standing Orders to allow the National Assembly for Wales to amend a document placed before it for consideration. Our consideration of this item this afternoon is made a mockery when the National Assembly for Wales is neither consulted nor in a position to make

**Jonathan Morgan:** Pwynt o drefn. Codaf hyn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhifau 2.7 a 6.12A. Mae a wnelo â dadl y prynhawn yma i gymeradwyo'r Cod y Gweinidogion. Fel y gŵyr eich swyddfa, ceisiasom gyflwyno gwelliannau i'r cynnig ar gyfer dadl. Fe'n hysbyswyd nad oeddem yn gallu diwygio dogfen sy'n berthnasol i'r Cabinet yn unig. Deallaf fod Prif Weinidog Cymru, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 2.7, wedi comisiynu'r ddogfen ac wedi ei chyflwyno i'r Cynulliad i'w chymeradwyo yn unig. Ceisiaf arweiniad ar ba un a oes darpariaeth yn y Rheolau Sefydlog i ganiatáu i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ddiwygio dogfen ger ei fron i'w hystyried. Mae'n hystyriaeth ni o'r eitem hon y prynhawn yma yn destun sbort oherwydd nid ymgynghorir â Chynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ac nid yw mewn sefyllfa ychwaith i

meaningful amendments to a document which, in our view, is quite flawed. We should be allowed to make document-specific amendments to a document-specific motion. While I accept your ruling today, perhaps we need to amend Standing Orders, so that if we receive such documents from the ministerial team in future, the Assembly, as the final authority, can amend those documents.

**The Presiding Officer:** The Ministerial Code cannot be amended. However, a motion relating to the debating of the code can be amended. Therefore, I was pleased to see that, through the no named day motion you tabled today, you were able to present your amendments, if not in a form that can be debated today, at least in a form that Members can refer to. I was pleased to discuss this with you, as your party's business manager, and with the leader of the Welsh Conservatives. I am satisfied that the Table Office acted properly in this case. We have lessons to learn about communication and our ability to undertake full scrutiny. However, I am satisfied that the way in which we have proceeded in this matter is in line with Standing Orders. If you wish to amend Standing Orders, I am sure that, in your new-found position on the Business Committee, you will pursue this with your usual vigour.

I have a long list of points of order from the Welsh Conservatives.

**David Davies:** Point of Order. In July this year, I asked the Minister for Health and Social Services this written question:

'Will the Minister give details of waiting times for knee replacement operations prior to and following recently announced increases in funding?'

The answer stated that:

'Details of waiting times are generally collected centrally at speciality level only, not for specific procedures.'

wneud gwelliannau ystyrion i ddogfen sydd, yn ein barn ni, yn eithaf gwallus. Dylid gadael inni wneud gwelliannau sy'n ymwneud yn benodol â dogfennau i gynnig sy'n ymwneud yn benodol â dogfennau. Er fy mod yn derbyn eich dyfarniad heddiw, efallai fod angen inni ddiwygio'r Rheolau Sefydlog, ac os cawn ddogfennau o'r fath gan y tîm gweinidogol yn y dyfodol, gall y Cynulliad, fel yr awdurdod terfynol, ddiwygio'r dogfennau hynny.

**Y Llywydd:** Ni ellir diwygio Cod y Gweinidogion. Fodd bynnag, gellir diwygio cynnig sy'n ymwneud â chynnal dadl ar y cod. Felly, yr oeddwn yn falch o weld, drwy'r cynnig heb ddyddiad trafod a gyflwynwyd gennych heddiw, eich bod yn gallu cyflwyno eich gwelliannau, os nad ar ffurf y gellir cynnal dadl arni heddiw, o leiaf ar ffurf y gall yr Aelodau gyfeirio ati. Yr oeddwn yn falch o drafod hyn gyda chi, fel trefnydd eich plaid, a chydag arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru. Yr wyf yn fodlon bod y Swyddfa Gyflwyno wedi gweithredu'n briodol yn yr achos hwn. Mae gennym wersi i'w dysgu ynglŷn â chyfathrebu a'n gallu i gynnal proses graffu lawn. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn fodlon bod y ffordd y bwriwyd ymlaen â'r mater hwn yn unol â Rheolau Sefydlog. Os hoffech ddiwygio'r Rheolau Sefydlog, yr wyf yn siŵr y bwriwch ymlaen â hyn gyda'ch brwdfrydedd arferol, yn eich rôl newydd ar y Pwyllgor Busnes.

Mae gennyf restr hir o bwyntiau o drefn gan Geidwadwyr Cymru.

**David Davies:** Pwynt o drefn. Ym mis Gorffennaf eleni, gofynnais y cwestiwn ysgrifenedig hwn i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol:

'A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi manylion am yr amseroedd aros ar gyfer llawdriniaethau am newid pennau gliniau cyn y cynnydd mewn cyllid a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar ac wedi hynny?'

Yr ateb oedd:

'Fel arfer cesglir manylion amseroedd aros yn ôl arbenigedd yn unig, nid yn ôl y gweithdrefnau penodol.'

In other words, I was told that I could not obtain statistics for knee and hip operations, only for orthopaedics. It came to my attention that these statistics were, in fact, available. They are published on the health of Wales information service's website. It is possible to obtain statistics on waiting times for knee and hip replacement surgery.

I have been given an incomplete answer to a written question. I have a right to expect a full answer. Was the Minister aware that these statistics were available? If she was not, it throws into doubt her ability to do her job. If she was aware of them, why was I not directed to the website in the answer to that question?

Mae hawl gennym, fel Aelodau'r Cynulliad, i gael atebion llawn i'n cwestiynau ni.

**The Presiding Officer:** The content of ministerial replies, as I have said on several occasions, is not a matter for me. All exchanges of information between officials, Ministers and Members are governed by our Code of Practice on the Provision of Information to Members, which we adopted early on in our life as an Assembly. It is not for me to comment on whether or not Ministers spell out in detail information which is available in other forms. If you can obtain the information yourself, it shows that you exercise initiative as a Member.

**William Graham:** Point of order. I raise this under Standing Order No. 6.3. It refers to Jocelyn Davies's question 7 to the First Minister on Tuesday 27 November. In response to that question regarding the date of the next Assembly election, the First Minister replied that:

'the Government of Wales Act 1998 requires the date of the next Assembly elections to be 1 May 2003, so there is nothing to discuss.'

Will the First Minister clarify that part I, section 3 of the Act, on the timing of ordinary elections, states that the Secretary of State for Wales may vary the date by up to a month on either side? I am sure that the First Minister would welcome the opportunity to clarify that, for the Assembly's guidance and for the information of the public.

Mewn geiriau eraill, dywedwyd wrthyf na allem gael ystadegau ar gyfer llawdriniaethau ar bengliniau a chluniau, dim ond ar gyfer orthopedeg. Daeth i'm sylw fod yr ystadegau hyn ar gael, mewn gwirionedd. Fe'u cyhoeddir ar wefan gwasanaeth gwybodaeth iechyd Cymru. Mae'n bosibl cael ystadegau ar amserau aros ar gyfer llawdriniaeth i osod pengliniau a chluniau newydd.

Cefais ateb anghyflawn i gwestiwn ysgrifenedig. Mae gennyf yr hawl i ddisgwyl ateb llawn. A oedd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol bod yr ystadegau hyn ar gael? Os nad oedd, mae'n bwrw amheuaeth ar ei gallu i wneud ei gwaith. Os oedd yn ymwybodol ohonynt, pan na chefais fy nghyfeirio i'r wefan mewn ateb i'r cwestiwn hwnnw?

We have a right, as Assembly Members, to receive full answers to our questions.

**Y Llywydd:** Nid yw cynnwys atebion gweinidogol, fel y dywedais lawer gwaith, yn fater i mi. Rheolir pob darn o wybodaeth a gyfnewidir rhwng swyddogion, Gweinidogion a'r Aelodau gan ein Cod Ymarfer ar Ddarparu Gwybodaeth i'r Aelodau, a fabwysiadwyd gennym yn gynnar yn hanes y Cynulliad. Nid fy lle i yw rhoi sylwadau ar ba un a yw Gweinidogion yn nodi'n fanwl y wybodaeth sydd ar gael ar ffurfiau eraill. Os gallwch gael y wybodaeth eich hun, mae'n dangos eich bod yn ymarfer blaengaredd fel Aelod.

**William Graham:** Pwynt o drefn. Codaf hyn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.3. Cyfeiria at gwestiwn 7 Jocelyn Davies i Brif Weinidog Cymru ddydd Mawrth 27 Tachwedd. Mewn ymateb i'r cwestiwn hwnnw o ran dyddiad etholiad nesaf y Cynulliad, atebodd y Prif Weinidog:

A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru egluro fod rhan I, adran 3 o'r Ddeddf, ar amseriad etholiadau cyffredinol, yn nodi y gall Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru amrywio'r dyddiad hyd at fis yn fwy neu'n llai? Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'r Prif Weinidog yn croesawu'r cyfle i egluro hynny, er mwyn arwain y Cynulliad a rhoi gwybodaeth i'r

cyhoedd.

**The Presiding Officer:** I have not had an opportunity to consult that section of the Act in detail or to refresh my memory of the debate on it. However, it is a matter for the First Minister. I am sure that he has heard your comments and, no doubt, he will write to you and clarify the matter at the earliest possible opportunity.

**Nick Bourne:** Point of order. I raise this under Standing Order No. 6.26 in relation to oral questions. When I posed a question to the First Minister last week, he assured me of a response on why there was no target for cancer treatment in the NHS plan for Wales. I have not received an answer to what is, after all, an urgent and important question. Is he in a position to provide a response now or does he want to do so later?

**The Presiding Officer:** That is not a matter for me, but for the First Minister. You have raised the issue and the First Minister has heard that.

**Nick Bourne:** It is urgent and important.

**The Presiding Officer:** The First Minister is indicating that he does not want to respond now in Plenary. Clearly, he will respond to you at some stage in the future.

**Y Llywydd:** Ni chefais gyfle i edrych yn fanwl ar yr adran honno o'r Ddeddf nac i gofio'r ddadl arni. Fodd bynnag, mater i Brif Weinidog Cymru ydyw. Yr wyf yn siŵr iddo glywed eich sylwadau ac yn ddiaw, pan ddaw'r cyfle cyntaf, bydd yn ysgrifennu atoch i egluro'r mater.

**Nick Bourne:** Pwynt o drefn. Codais hyn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.26 mewn perthynas â chwestiynau llafar. Pan ofynnais gwestiwn i'r Prif Weinidog yr wythnos diwethaf, rhoddodd sicrwydd imi y byddai'n rhoi ateb i egluro pam nad oedd unrhyw darged ar gyfer triniaeth canser yng nghynllun yr NHS i Gymru. Ni chefais ateb i'r hyn sydd, wedi'r cyfan, yn gwestiwn brys a phwysig. A yw'n bosibl iddo ateb yn awr neu a yw am wneud hynny'n ddiweddarach?

**Y Llywydd:** Nid yw hyn yn fater imi, ond i Brif Weinidog Cymru. Yr ydych wedi codi'r mater ac mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi clywed.

**Nick Bourne:** Mae'n fater brys a phwysig.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae Prif Weinidog Cymru yn nodi nad yw am ymateb yn awr yn y Cyfarfod Llawn. Yn amlwg, bydd yn ymateb i chi rywbryd yn y dyfodol.

### **Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion Composite Motion: Approval of Orders**

**The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies):** I propose that

*the National Assembly, acting under Standing Order No. 22.25, approves:*

*1. the Education (Qualifications, Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales) (Conferment of Function) Order 2001 laid in the Table Office on 6 November 2001;*

*considers the report of the Legislation Committee, which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order the Education (Qualifications, Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales) (Conferment*

**Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies):** Cynigiad fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, o dan Reol Sefydlog 22.25, yn cymeradwyo:*

*1. Gorchymyn Addysg (Awdurdod Cymwysterau, Cwricwlwm ac Asesu Cymru) (Rhoi Swyddogaeth) 2001 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Tachwedd 2001; ac*

*yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw fater sy'n destun pryder yn y gorchymyn drafft Gorchymyn Addysg (Awdurdod Cymwysterau, Cwricwlwm ac Asesu Cymru) (Rhoi*



*of Function) Order 2001, laid in the Table Office on 20 November 2001;*

*2. the Education (External Qualifications) (Description of Tests) (Wales) Regulations 2001 laid in the Table Office on 6 November 2001;*

*considers the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order the Education (External Qualifications) (Description of Tests) (Wales) Regulations 2001 laid in the Table Office on 20 November 2001;*

*3. the Colours in Food (Amendment) Wales Regulations 2001 laid in the Table Office on 6 November 2001; and*

*considers the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order the Colours in Food (Amendment) Wales Regulations 2001 laid in the Table Office on 20 November 2001. (NDM874)*

**Y Llywydd:** O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn, felly, galwaf am bleidlais.

3:30 p.m.

*Cynnig: O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian

*Swyddogaeth) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Tachwedd 2001*

*2. Rheoliadau Addysg (Cymwysterau Allanol) (Disgrifiadau o Brofion) (Cymru) 2001 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Tachwedd 2001; ac*

*yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw fater sy'n destun pryder yn y gorchymyn drafft Rheoliadau Addysg (Cymwysterau Allanol) (Disgrifiadau o Brofion) (Cymru) 2001 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Tachwedd 2001*

*3. Rheoliadau Lliwiau mewn Bwyd (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2001 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Tachwedd 2001; ac*

*yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw fater sy'n destun pryder yn y gorchymyn drafft Rheoliadau Lliwiau mewn Bwyd (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2001 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Tachwedd 2001. (NDM874)*

**The Presiding Officer:** Under Standing Order No. 22.25, this motion is not subject to debate, therefore, I call for a vote.

Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Richards, Rod  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Wigley, Dafydd

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cyfraniadau Ardrethu Annomestig (Cymru) (Diwygio)  
 2001  
 Approval of the Non-Domestic Rating Contributions (Wales) (Amendment)  
 Regulations 2001**

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Jonathan Morgan to the first motion. **Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Jonathan Morgan i'r cynnig cyntaf.

**The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart):** I propose that **Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly considers the principle of the Non-Domestic Rating Contributions (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 6 November 2001. (NDM875)* *y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor y Rheoliadau Cyfraniadau Ardrethu Annomestig (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Tachwedd 2001. (NDM875)*

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the Non-Domestic Rating* *1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5, mewn perthynas â'r gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Cyfraniadau Ardrethu*

*Contributions (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 20 November 2001; and*

2. *approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 6 November 2001. (NDM876)*

Councils are required to pay non-domestic rating contributions to the Assembly in respect of the rates that they collect from businesses in their areas. Rates are paid into the national non-domestic rating pool, from which they are redistributed to councils on the basis of adult population.

The rules for calculating these contributions are contained in the Non-Domestic Rating Contributions (Wales) Regulations 1992. Amendments are made annually to certain elements of the regulations to ensure that the basis for councils' contributions remain accurate. These amending regulations are needed to enable councils to correctly calculate their non-domestic rating contributions for 2002-03.

**Janet Davies:** I raise the issue of pollution by certain businesses that pay national non-domestic rates. You may consider this to be a small issue, but it is costly to local authorities. As I understand, the rates are divided evenly between local authorities on a population basis. Will you ensure that local authorities get due recognition for the costs of monitoring and policing pollution, either through this rate or through the standard spending indicators arrangement?

**Edwina Hart:** I will consider that.

These regulations make three changes, two of which are purely technical. The first is a revised estimate of the impact of successful appeals on rateable values and the second a revised set of adult population figures that councils use to recalculate, where necessary, their provisional contributions to the pool. The most significant change, however, is to reduce councils' contributions to the cost of discretionary rate relief from 25 per cent to 10 per cent. This means that councils will be able to give more help to small businesses at no extra cost to council tax payers. It is designed to encourage councils to give more

*Annwmestig (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Tachwedd 2001; ac*

2. *yn cymeradwyo gwneud y Gorchymyn yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Tachwedd 2001. (NDM876)*

Mae'n ofynnol i gynghorau dalu cyfraniadau ardrethu annwmestig i'r Cynulliad o ran y trethi a gasglant oddi wrth fusnesau yn eu hardaloedd. Telir y trethi i mewn i'r gronfa ardrethu annwmestig genedlaethol, lle y cânt eu dosbarthu i gynghorau ar sail poblogaeth oedolion.

Mae'r rheolau ar gyfer cyfrifo'r cyfraniadau hyn yn Rheoliadau Cyfraniadau Ardrethu Annwmestig (Cymru) 1992. Gwneir gwelliannau yn flynyddol i rai elfennau o'r rheoliadau er mwyn sicrhau bod sail gywir, barhaus ar gyfer cyfraniadau cynghorau. Mae angen y rheoliadau diwygio hyn i alluogi cynghorau i gyfrifo'n gywir eu cyfraniadau ardrethu annwmestig ar gyfer 2002-03.

**Janet Davies:** Codaf fater llygredd gan fusnesau penodol sy'n talu trethi annwmestig cenedlaethol. Efallai mai mater bach yw hwn yn eich barn chi, ond mae'n gostus i awdurdodau lleol. Fel y deallaf, rhennir y trethi yn gyfartal rhwng awdurdodau lleol ar sail poblogaeth. A wnewch chi sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol yn cael cydnabyddiaeth haeddiannol am gostau monitro a phlisma llygredd, naill ai drwy'r dreth hon neu drwy'r trefniant dangosyddion gwariant safonol?

**Edwina Hart:** Ystyriaf hynny.

Gwna'r rheoliadau hyn dri newid, ac mae dau yn dechnegol eu natur. Y cyntaf yw amcangyfrif diwygiedig o effaith apeliadau llwyddiannus ar werthoedd trethadwy a'r ail yw cyfres ddiwygiedig o ffigurau poblogaeth oedolion a ddefnyddir gan gynghorau i ailgyfrifo, lle bo angen, eu cyfraniadau dros dro i'r gronfa. Y newid mwyaf arwyddocaol, fodd bynnag, yw lleihau cyfraniadau cynghorau i gost rhyddhad trethi dewisol o 25 y cant i 10 y cant. Golyga hyn y bydd cynghorau yn gallu rhoi mwy o help i fusnesau bach heb unrhyw gost ychwnegol i dalwyr y dreth gyngor. Fe'i cynllunnir i

discretionary relief, particularly to small, rural businesses. I am also keen for councils to help small community-based sports clubs with their rate bills.

The extra cost of granting more relief will be met by the Welsh non-domestic rates pool. In this respect, I do not support Jonathan Morgan's amendment. I cannot guarantee that Her Majesty's Treasury will not, at some point in the future, seek to penalise the Assembly for this change in policy. I will consider the position if and when that happens.

This is a small step in delivering our commitment to regenerating rural communities and to help small businesses in general. After Christmas, I will bring forward legislation to ensure that many more small businesses providing key services to our rural communities benefit from large reductions in their rates bills.

These regulations are routine and largely technical in nature. There are no financial implications for businesses, apart from for the small businesses that will see a reduction in their bills as a result of receiving discretionary relief from the local council. I ask Members to support the motion.

**William Graham:** I propose amendment 1 in the name of Jonathan Morgan to the first motion. At the end of the motion add:

*notes the possibility that HM Treasury may reduce the Assembly assigned budget and instructs the Minister to ensure that front line services in Wales will not be affected.*

These regulations are the realisation of an announcement made by the Minister on 28 February. They aim to reduce councils' contributions to the cost of providing discretionary rate relief by altering the percentage share of the contributions made by the Assembly and the 22 unitary authorities.

These regulations increase the National Assembly's contribution to the national non-domestic rating pool from 75 per cent to 90

annog cynghorau i roi mwy o ryddhad dewisol, yn arbennig i fusnesau bach gwledig. Yr wyf yn awyddus hefyd i gynghorau helpu clybiau chwaraeon cymunedol bach gyda'u biliau treth.

Telir cost ychwanegol caniatáu mwy o ryddhad o gronfa ardrethu annomestig Cymru. Yn hyn o beth, ni chefnogaf welliant Jonathan Morgan. Ni allaf warantu na fydd Trysorlys Ei Mawrhydi, ar ryw adeg yn y dyfodol, yn ceisio cosbi'r Cynulliad am y newid hwn mewn polisi. Ystyriaf y sefyllfa os a phryd y bydd yn digwydd.

Cam bach yw hwn wrth gyflawni ein hymrwymiad i adfywio cymunedau gwledig a helpu busnesau bach yn gyffredinol. Ar ôl y Nadolig, byddaf yn cyflwyno deddfwriaeth i sicrhau bod llawer mwy o fusnesau bach sy'n darparu gwasanaethau allweddol i'n cymunedau gwledig yn elwa ar ostyngiadau mawr yn eu biliau treth.

Mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn rhai cyffredin ac yn dechnegol eu natur i raddau helaeth. Nid oes unrhyw oblygiadau ariannol i fusnesau, ar wahân i'r busnesau bach a fydd yn gweld gostyngiad yn eu biliau o ganlyniad i gael rhyddhad dewisol gan y cyngor lleol. Gofynnaf i'r Aelodau gefnogi'r cynnig.

**William Graham:** Cynigiau welliant 1 yn enw Jonathan Morgan i'r cynnig cyntaf. Ar ddiwedd y cynnig ychwanegwch:

*yn nodi'r posibilrwydd y bydd Trysorlys Ei Mawrhydi yn lleihau'r gyllideb a ddyrennir i'r Cynulliad ac yn cyfarwyddo'r Gweinidog i sicrhau na fydd hyn yn effeithio ar wasanaethau rheng flaen yng Nghymru.*

Mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn gwireddu cyhoeddiad a wnaed gan y Gweinidog ar 28 Chwefror. Anelant at leihau cyfraniadau cynghorau i gost darparu rhyddhad trethi dewisol drwy newid cyfran ganrannol y cyfraniadau a wneir gan y Cynulliad a'r 22 o awdurdodau unedol.

Mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn cynyddu cyfraniad y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i'r gronfa ardrethu annomestig genedlaethol o 75 y cant i 90 y

per cent. This translates into a reduction from 25 per cent to 10 per cent in the amount contributed by local authorities. This means that, for the same impact on council tax, councils will be able to give more relief to existing recipients or grant new relief to businesses that do not currently receive relief.

The Minister expects that there will be additional costs from reducing the councils' contributions. This additional cost has been estimated to be no more than £1.5 million a year. However, we must remember that, this time last year, the Minister assured us that the estimated increase in council tax in Wales would be kept to 3 per cent.

There is further speculation about any decrease in income to the non-domestic rating pool being offset by an increase in revenue support grant from the Exchequer, which will allow the overall funding for local government to remain the same. The Assembly's Financial Planning Division has explained that there will be no further increases to the estimated additional financial implications for the Assembly, unless the Treasury decides to exercise its right, under the statement of funding policy, to reduce the Assembly's assigned budget by an amount equal to the additional cash requirement.

This amendment seeks to address the circumstance of the Treasury exercising this right. We require the Minister to ensure that frontline services in Wales will not be affected, and we want an assurance that no increased demands will be made on Welsh businesses, especially as these regulations were introduced to assist businesses, not penalise them.

**Peter Black:** I welcome these proposals, which are a part of the pledge in the partnership agreement to help small rural businesses, such as post offices and shops. The extension of the rural rate relief scheme to include other businesses, such as petrol stations, chemists and pubs is out to consultation and should be implemented in time for the new financial year.

We are all aware of the difficult year that rural businesses have faced. The impact of foot and mouth disease was devastating for

cant. Golyga hyn ostyngiad o 25 y cant i 10 y cant yn y swm a gyfrennir gan awdurdodau lleol. Mae hyn yn golygu y gall cynghorau roi mwy o ryddhad i dderbynwyr presennol neu ganiatáu rhyddhad newydd i fusnesau nad ydynt yn cael rhyddhad ar hyn o bryd, a hynny heb effeithio ar y dreth gyngor.

Mae'r Gweinidog yn disgwyl y bydd costau ychwanegol o leihau cyfraniadau cynghorau. Amcangyfrifwyd nad yw'r gost ychwanegol hwn yn fwy na £1.5 miliwn y flwyddyn. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gofio i'r Gweinidog, yr adeg hon y llynedd, ein sicrhau y byddai'r cynnydd amcangyfrifedig yn y dreth gyngor yng Nghymru yn cael ei gadw i 3 y cant.

Mae mwy o ddyfalu y caiff unrhyw ostyngiad mewn incwm i'r gronfa ardrethu annomestig ei wrthbwyso gan gynnydd mewn grant cynnal refeniw gan y Trysorlys, a fydd yn caniatáu i'r arian cyffredinol ar gyfer llywodraeth leol aros yr un peth. Eglurodd Isadrann Cynllunio Ariannol y Cynulliad na fydd mwy o gynnydd i'r goblygiadau ariannol ychwanegol amcangyfrifedig ar gyfer y Cynulliad, oni phenderfyna'r Trysorlys arfer ei hawl, o dan y datganiad o bolisi ariannu, i leihau cyllideb y Cynulliad a neilltuwyd gan swm sy'n gyfartal â'r gofyniad ariannol ychwanegol.

Ceisia'r gwelliant hwn ymdrin â hawl y Trysorlys i arfer yr hawl hon. Gofynnwn i'r Gweinidog sicrhau nad effeithir ar wasanaethau rheng flaen yng Nghymru, a hoffem gael sicrwydd na roddir unrhyw bwysau cynyddol ar fusnesau Cymru, yn enwedig gan i'r rheoliadau hyn gael eu cyflwyno i helpu busnesau, nid i'w cosbi.

**Peter Black:** Croesawaf y cynigion hyn, sy'n rhan o'r addewid yn y cytundeb partneriaeth i helpu busnesau bach gwledig, fel swyddfeydd post a siopau. Cynhelir ymgynghoriad ar hyn o bryd ar fater ymestyn y cynllun rhyddhad trethi gwledig i gynnwys busnesau eraill, fel gorsafoddd petrol, fferyllfeydd a thafarndai a dylai fod ar waith erbyn y flwyddyn ariannol newydd.

Mae pob un ohonom yn ymwybodol o'r flwyddyn anodd a wynebwyd gan fusnesau gwledig. Bu effaith clwy'r traed a'r genau yn

many parts of Wales. The support already given to these areas by the National Assembly in the form of rate relief and the rural support package, amounting to £65 million, of which £60 million is new money, is therefore welcome. Today's measure is another piece in the larger jigsaw that represents our help for these areas.

The role of small businesses, such as post offices, in a rural area is much more significant than in a city or large town. The closure of a post office can have a devastating affect on any community, whether it is urban or rural. It is a fact that one in 12 post offices in Wales have closed between 1997 and 2001. Such closures should, if possible, be avoided.

There is evidence that, although councils can claim back 75 per cent of the rate relief that they give to small businesses, the fact that they must pay the remaining 25 per cent from their own resources can make them reluctant to go that extra step and promote the rural rate relief scheme widely, up to the full amount. They may also apply fairly strict criteria that can exclude some businesses from getting that extra 25 per cent. That outcome is undesirable.

Therefore, I hope that the implementation of a 90 per cent reimbursement of costs will lead to other businesses being included in this scheme, in addition to the 25,000 that already benefit from it—the 25,000 who get additional rate relief, if they do not already get the full amount. Councils in rural areas, who are also hard-pressed as a result of the foot and mouth disease outbreak, will welcome this change.

I note the Conservatives' amendment, and the fact that the Tories often make much noise about rural areas. This measure shows that while they shout, the administration gets on with the job. Their amendment, however, is extraordinary. Of course, we cannot predict the Treasury's reaction to these measures, but that is not a reason to try to deny rural areas the benefits of this extra investment until there is certainty, as this amendment implies. It shows that the Conservatives, for all their

drychinebus i sawl rhan o Gymru. Croesewir y gefnogaeth felly a roddwyd eisoes i'r ardaloedd hyn gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar ffurf rhyddhad trethi a'r pecyn cymorth gwledig, sy'n gwneud cyfanswm o £65 miliwn, y mae £60 miliwn ohono yn arian newydd. Mae mesur heddiw yn ddarn arall yn y jig-so mwy sy'n cynrychioli ein cymorth ar gyfer yr ardaloedd hyn.

Mae rôl busnesau bach, fel swyddfeydd post, mewn ardal wledig yn fwy o lawer nag yw mewn dinas neu dref fawr. Gall cau swyddfa bost gael effaith andwyol ar unrhyw gymuned, boed yn drefol neu'n wledig. Mae'n ffaith bod un o bob 12 swyddfa bost yng Nghymru wedi cau rhwng 1997 a 2001. Dylid osgoi achosion fel hyn o gau os yw'n bosibl.

Rhaid i gynghorau, er y gallant adhawlio 75 y cant o'r rhyddhad trethi a roddant i fusnesau bach, dalu'r 25 y cant sy'n weddill o'u hadnoddau eu hunain a cheir tystiolaeth y gall hyn eu gwneud yn amharod i fynd y cam ychwanegol hwnnw a hyrwyddo'r cynllun rhyddhad trethi gwledig yn eang, hyd at y swm llawn. Gall hynny fod yn gymwys i feini prawf eithaf llym hefyd a all eithrio rhai busnesau rhag cael y 25 y cant ychwanegol hwnnw. Nid yw'r canlyniad hwn yn ddymunol.

Felly, gobeithiaf y bydd gweithredu'r cynllun i ad-dalu 90 y cant o'r costau yn arwain at gynnwys busnesau eraill yn y cynllun hwn, yn ogystal â'r 25,000 sydd eisoes yn elwa arno—y 25,000 sy'n cael rhyddhad trethi ychwanegol, os nad ydynt eisoes yn cael y swm llawn. Bydd cynghorau mewn ardaloedd gwledig, sydd o dan bwysau hefyd o ganlyniad i glwy'r traed a'r genau, yn croesawu'r newid hwn.

Nodaf welliant y Ceidwadwyr, a'r ffaith bod y Torïaid yn aml yn swnian am ardaloedd gwledig. Dengys y mesur hwn fod y weinyddiaeth yn mynd ymlaen â'r gwaith, tra eu bod hwy yn cadw swm. Fodd bynnag, mae eu gwelliant yn rhyfedd. Wrth gwrs, ni allwn ragweld ymateb y Trysorlys i'r mesurau hyn, ond nid yw hynny'n rheswm i geisio gwrthod manteision y buddsoddiad ychwanegol hwn i ardaloedd gwledig, hyd nes y bydd sicrwydd, fel yr awgryma'r gwelliant hwn. Dengys nad

shouting and screaming, do not have a clue about what to do for rural areas.

**Janet Ryder:** Previous speakers have outlined why Plaid Cymru will also welcome today's motion. Any support that can be given to businesses, whether in urban or rural areas, is welcome in the present financial circumstances. As Peter Black said, this is particularly needed to help rural areas after the foot and mouth disease crisis. However, we always seem to be coming round to having to offer grants and help with business rates. Do you not think, Minister, that it is time that we undertook a thorough review of the business rate system? It is founded on a system developed over 50 years ago and it does not bear any relevance to today's business. It was founded at a time when town centres were the best places in which to set up your business, where there was a great deal of footfall outside the shop. Now we have seen the development of out-of-town shopping centres, which offer what people originally went to the town centres for: you can park outside your out-of-town shopping centre, go straight into the shop, conduct all your business there and go home. However, the business rating system is weighted against having a town-centre shop, where you cannot park outside and go straight in to conduct your business: you must park in a car park, and walk to the shops. We are not getting to grips with taxing those out-of-town shopping centres in the way that we should. We do not have a fair business rate system.

3:40 p.m.

Minister, you talked about introducing a paper on the financing of local government. Business rates are crucial to that. Will you undertake in that paper to conduct a thorough review of the business rate system? We welcome today's regulations, but it is time for a thorough review of the business rate system in Wales and your paper should make strong recommendations to the Westminster Government about the kind of business rate system that we want to see introduced.

oes gan y Ceidwadwyr, er eu holl weiddi a sgrechian, unrhyw syniad ynglŷn â'r hyn y dylid ei wneud i ardaloedd gwledig.

**Janet Ryder:** Mae siaradwyr blaenorol wedi amlinellu pam y bydd Plaid Cymru yn croesawu cynnig heddiw. Croesewir unrhyw gefnogaeth y gellir ei rhoi i fusnesau, boed hynny mewn ardaloedd trefol neu wledig, o dan yr amgylchiadau ariannol presennol. Fel y dywedodd Peter Black, mae angen hwn yn arbennig i helpu ardaloedd gwledig ar ôl argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau. Fodd bynnag, ymddengys ein bod byth a beunydd yn gorfod cynnig grantiau a help gyda threthi busnes. Oni chredwch, Weinidog, ei bod yn bryd inni gynnal adolygiad trwyadl o'r system trethi busnes? Fe'i seilir ar system a ddatblygwyd dros 50 mlynedd yn ôl ac nid yw'n berthnasol i fusnes heddiw o gwbl. Fe'i sefydlwyd ar adeg pan oedd canolfannau trefi yn cael eu hystyried fel y mannau gorau i sefydlu eich busnes, pan oedd sŵn traed i'w glywed yn gyson y tu allan i'r siop. Erbyn hyn gwelsom ddatblygiad canolfannau siopa ar gyrion trefi, sy'n cynnig y pethau yr aeth pobl yn wreiddiol i ganolfannau trefi i'w cael: gallwch barcio y tu allan i'ch canolfan siopa sydd ar gyrion y dref, gallwch fynd i mewn i'r siop ar unwaith, cynnal eich busnes yno a mynd adref. Fodd bynnag, mae'r system trethi busnes yn erbyn cael siop ynghanol y dref, lle na allwch barcio y tu allan a mynd i mewn i'r siop ar unwaith i gynnal eich busnes: rhaid ichi barcio mewn maes parcio a cherdded i'r siopau. Nid awn i'r afael â threthu'r canolfannau siopa hynny sydd ar gyrion trefi fel y dylem. Nid oes gennym system trethi busnes deg.

Weinidog, gwnaethoch sôn am gyflwyno papur ar ariannu llywodraeth leol. Mae trethi busnes yn rhan holl bwysig o hynny. A wnewch chi addo yn y papur hwnnw i gynnal adolygiad trwyadl o'r system trethi busnes? Croesawn reoliadau heddiw, ond mae'n bryd cynnal adolygiad trwyadl o'r system trethi busnes yng Nghymru a dylai eich papur wneud argymhellion cryf i Lywodraeth San Steffan ynglŷn â'r math o system trethi busnes yr hoffem ei gweld yn cael ei chyflwyno.

**Edwina Hart:** I am aware, as Janet indicated, that Plaid Cymru has called for a wide-scale review of business rates. It wants to see a radical overhaul of the present system. However, I am unclear—as are businesses—about what exactly it wants to see in its place. Could it be a tax based on profit? I am sure that would be welcomed by businesses in Wales.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Will the Minister give way?

**Edwina Hart:** It is important that the fundamental business rate system is working well. The uniformed business rate provides—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The Minister is not giving way.

**Edwina Hart:** The uniformed business rate provides Welsh business with the certainty and flexibility that it needs to plan ahead. The legislation protects businesses from excessive increases in rates bills by limited annual rates of inflation. We all want to see businesses succeeding in Wales for the benefit of the people of Wales. There have been no radical calls from businesses on these issues. I am considering a wide range of options that would help us to achieve our aims of building stronger and more productive relationships between local government and business communities in Wales. I am aware of businesses' concerns on the business rates issue and I have no intention of changing anything that would harm the competitiveness of Welsh companies. That is the key area for us all.

I turn to William's comments. You could have been more charitable, William. It is a good news story with regard to what we are doing for rural businesses. It is important to recognise that reducing councils' contribution to the cost of a rise in discretionary rate relief will result in additional costs for the non-domestic rate pool. I stress that. We estimate those costs, as you indicated, at £1.5 million. Any decrease in income to the non-domestic rating pool will be offset by an increase in the revenue support grant from the Treasury. I

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf yn ymwybodol, fel y nododd Janet, fod Plaid Cymru wedi galw am adolygiad eang ei gwmpas o drethi busnes. Mae am weld y system bresennol yn cael ei diwygio'n radical. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn ansicr—fel y mae busnesau—yn glŷn â beth yn union y mae am ei weld yn ei lle. A allai fod yn dreth yn seiliedig ar elw? Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai busnesau yng Nghymru yn croesawu hynny.

**Dafydd Wigley:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ildio?

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'n bwysig bod y system trethi busnes sylfaenol yn gweithio'n dda. Darpara'r dreth fusnes unffurf—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw'r Gweinidog yn ildio.

**Edwina Hart:** Darpara'r dreth fusnes unffurf y sicrwydd a'r hyblygrwydd sydd eu hangen ar fusnesau Cymru er mwyn iddynt gynllunio ymlaen llaw. Mae'r ddeddfwriaeth yn diogelu busnesau rhag cynnydd gormodol mewn biliau trethi drwy gyfraddau chwyddiant blynyddol cyfyngedig. Yr ydym oll am weld busnesau yn llwyddo yng Nghymru er budd pobl Cymru. Ni fu unrhyw alwadau radical gan fusnesau ar y materion hyn. Yr wyf yn ystyried ystod eang o opsiynau a fyddai'n ein helpu i gyflawni ein nodau o greu cysylltiadau cryfach a mwy cynhyrchiol rhwng llywodraeth leol a chymunedau busnes yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o bryderon busnesau ar y mater trethi busnes ac nid yw'n fwriad gennyf newid unrhyw beth a fyddai'n amharu ar natur gystadleuol cwmnïau Cymru. Dyna'r maes allweddol i bob un ohonom.

Trof yn awr at sylwadau William. Gallech fod wedi bod yn fwy hael, William. Mae'n stori am newyddion da o ran yr hyn a wnawn i fusnesau gwledig. Mae'n bwysig cydnabod y bydd lleihau cyfraniad cynghorau at gost cynnydd mewn rhyddhad trethi dewisol yn arwain at gostau ychwanegol i'r gronfa ardrethu annomestig. Pwysleisiaf hynny. Amcangyfrifwn mai £1.5 miliwn yw'r costau hynny, fel y nodwyd gennyh. Caiff unrhyw ostyngiad mewn incwm i'r gronfa ardrethu annomestig ei wrthbwyso gan gynnydd yn y



am not particularly worried about that course of action. If the Treasury decides to exercise its rights under the funding policy, I must recognise that I did this for the right reasons—to help and assist rural businesses.

We must also consider council tax payers. Will they be expected to cover any of the cost of relief given to businesses? The legislation governing the use of discretionary rate relief requires that it should be targeted at businesses that provide vital services to rural communities—that point was made by Peter Black—or that have wider community benefits. It is right that some of the costs are met locally and the Welsh Local Government Association shares that view. However, I will consider Janet Davies's earlier point about the cost issues that might be associated with that.

Today's announcement is good news. It shows the administration's commitment to rural businesses and it is important that the Assembly endorses all these regulations.

**Y Llywydd:** Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar welliant 1 i egwyddor y Gorchymyn yn enw Jonathan Morgan.

grant cynnal refeniw o'r Trysorlys. Ni phryderaf ryw lawer ynglŷn â hynny. Os penderfyna'r Trysorlys arfer ei hawliau o dan y polisi ariannu, rhaid imi gydnabod imi wneud hynny am y rhesymau cywir—i helpu a chynorthwyo busnesau gwledig.

Rhaid inni hefyd ystyried talwyr y dreth gyngor. A ddisgwylir iddynt dalu unrhyw ran o'r gost rhyddhad a roddir i fusnesau? Mae'r ddeddfwriaeth sy'n rheoli'r defnydd o ryddhad trethi dewisol yn mynnu y dylai gael ei anelu at fusnesau sy'n darparu gwasanaethau hanfodol i gymunedau gwledig—gwnaed y pwynt hwnnw gan Peter Black—neu y dylai fod â manteision ehangach i'r gymuned. Mae'n iawn bod rhai o'r costau yn cael eu talu'n lleol ac mae Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru yn rhannu'r farn honno. Fodd bynnag, ystyriaf bwynt cynharach Janet Davies am y materion cost a allai fod yn gysylltiedig â hynny.

Mae cyhoeddiad heddiw yn newyddion da. Dengys ymrwymiad y weinyddiaeth i fusnesau gwledig ac mae'n bwysig bod y Cynulliad yn cymeradwyo pob un o'r rheoliadau hyn.

**The Presiding Officer:** We will now vote on amendment 1 to the principle of the Order in the name of Jonathan Morgan.

*Gwelliant: O blaid 18, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
Amendment: For 18, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Graham, William  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Melding, David  
Pugh, Alun  
Richards, Rod  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn

Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated*

**Y Llywydd:** Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar **The Presiding Officer:** We will now vote on  
egwyddor y Gorchymyn. the principle of the Order.

*Cynnig: O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Richards, Rod  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Y Llywydd:** Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar y cynnig  
i gymeradwyo'r Gorchymyn.

**The Presiding Officer:** We will now vote on  
the motion to approve the Order.

*Cynnig: O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Richards, Rod  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.45 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.45 p.m.*

## **Gofal Plant Childcare**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1, 2, 3 and 4 in the name of Jocelyn Davies and amendment 5 in the name of Jonathan Morgan.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2, 3 a 4 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, a gwelliant 5 yn enw Jonathan Morgan.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly welcomes the report of the national childcare strategy taskforce and notes that the Minister for Health and Social Services will produce an action plan by the end of February 2002. (NDM877)*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn croesawu adroddiad tasglu'r strategaeth genedlaethol gofal plant ac yn nodi y bydd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn cyhoeddi cynllun gweithredu erbyn diwedd Chwefror 2002. (NDM877)*

This debate offers us the chance to begin a new phase of childcare in Wales. The Government's 1998 Green Paper, 'The National Childcare Strategy in Wales', was an important step forward. Great strides have been made in taking that forward. However, the time has come for a fresh approach that particularly considers the needs of children in our disadvantaged communities, and maximises the impact of the funding streams available in Wales. That is why I established the childcare taskforce earlier this year.

Mae'r ddadl hon yn cynnig cyfle inni ddechrau ar gam newydd o ofal plant yng Nghymru. Yr oedd Papur Gwyrdd 1998 y Llywodraeth, 'Strategaeth Genedlaethol Gofal Plant Cymru', yn ddatblygiad pwysig. Gwnaethpwyd camau mawr i ddatblygu hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bryd cael ymagwedd newydd sy'n ystyried yn benodol anghenion plant yn ein cymunedau sydd o dan yr anfantais fwyaf, ac sy'n manteisio i'r eithaf ar effaith y llifoedd ariannu sydd ar gael yng Nghymru. Dyna pam y sefydlais y tasglu gofal plant yn gynharach eleni.

The five chapters in the taskforce's report were developed independently of the Assembly by a range of experts, and I thank them for their contribution. The Welsh Assembly Government's policy will be set out in the action plan, informed by the taskforce report and this debate. The report is valuable in setting out the broad agenda that we must take forward. Our policy can also build on the Health and Social Services Committee's discussions on this report.

Datblygwyd y pum pennod yn adroddiad y tasglu yn annibynnol ar y Cynulliad gan amrywiaeth o arbenigwyr, a diolchaf iddynt am eu cyfraniad. Caiff polisi Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ei nodi yn y cynllun gweithredu, ar sail adroddiad y tasglu a'r ddadl hon. Mae'r adroddiad yn werthfawr wrth nodi'r agenda eang y mae'n rhaid inni ei datblygu. Gall ein polisi adeiladu ar drafodaethau'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar yr adroddiad hwn hefyd.

I want a childcare policy that will put children's needs and experiences at its centre. Childcare is a vital part of our objective to give children the best possible start in life. Providing opportunities for play is a key factor. If we can assist with the costs of

Yr wyf am gael polisi gofal plant a fydd yn canolbwyntio ar anghenion a phrofiadau plant. Mae gofal plant yn rhan hanfodol o'n hamcan i sicrhau y caiff plant y dechrau gorau posibl mewn bywyd. Mae rhoi cyfleoedd chwarae yn un o'r ffactorau

childcare where communities face poverty, then we are tackling the inequalities of opportunity that children in those areas may face. At the same time, we may be offering parents greater opportunities to learn and work.

The 'made in Wales' approach is to see childcare strategy fully linked with our other programmes for children and young people. As the first chapter of the report says, one way to unify childcare with our other policies is through the development of integrated children's centres. These centres could bring together services provided through early years education, Sure Start, open access play, and a variety of family support services. We will start to see the programme roll out over the next two years. I hope that the new opportunities fund will contribute capital funding to suitable centre proposals. That is because we were able to negotiate specific Welsh directions for the third round of new opportunities funding. Another aspect of this integrating agenda is to simplify funding regimes and administration, ensure that local plans for children are integrated while maintaining the best focus of the particular programmes. I will make a further announcement on this early in the new year.

However, in focusing on the child we are not forgetting the economic context of childcare. Affordable, quality childcare, along with forms of support for carers, enables individuals and communities to be in work or training, balancing family and other commitments as they choose. Employers must support their staff to help them find that balance in their lives. We must also recognise that the childcare workforce has a significant economic impact. We can create a virtuous economic circle in which childcare is at the heart of community regeneration. These ideas were explored in part in chapter 2 of the report, but I have asked Chwarae Teg and the Welsh Development Agency to provide further advice and produce a supplementary report on this important issue.

allweddol. Os gallwn roi cymorth i dalu costau gofal plant lle bo cymunedau yn wynebu tlodi, yna awn i'r afael â'r anghydraddoldebau o ran cyfle a wynebir gan blant yn yr ardaloedd hynny. Ar yr un pryd, mae'n bosibl y byddwn yn cynnig mwy o gyfleoedd i rieni ddysgu a gweithio.

Yr ymagwedd a luniwyd yng Nghymru yw sicrhau y caiff y strategaeth gofal plant ei chysylltu'n llawn â'n rhaglenni eraill ar gyfer plant a phobl ifanc. Fel y dywed pennod gyntaf yr adroddiad, un ffordd o uno gofal plant â'n polisiau eraill yw drwy ddatblygu canolfannau plant integredig. Gallai'r canolfannau hyn ddod â'r gwasanaethau a ddarperir drwy addysg y blynyddoedd cynnar, Cychwyn Cadarn, chwarae mynediad agored ac amrywiaeth o wasanaethau cynnal teuluoedd ynghyd. Bydd y rhaglen yn dechrau cael ei chyflwyno dros y ddwy flynedd nesaf. Gobeithiaf y bydd y gronfa cyfleoedd newydd yn cyfrannu arian cyfalaf i gynigion addas o ran canolfannau. Y rheswm dros hynny yw y gallem negodi cyfeiriadau penodol Cymru ar gyfer trydydd cylch y gronfa cyfleoedd newydd. Agwedd arall ar yr agenda integreiddio hon yw symleiddio cyfundrefnau cyllid a dulliau gweinyddu cyllid, gan sicrhau bod cynlluniau lleol ar gyfer plant wedi'u hintegreiddio tra'n cadw canolbwynt gorau y rhaglenni arbennig. Gwnaf gyhoeddiad arall ar hyn ar ddechrau'r flyyddyn nesaf.

Fodd bynnag, wrth ganolbwyntio ar y plentyn, nid anghofiwn am gyd-destun economaidd gofal plant. Mae gofal plant fforddiadwy o safon, ynghyd â mathau eraill o gymorth i ofalwyr, yn galluogi unigolion a chymunedau i fod mewn gwaith neu i gael hyfforddiant, gan sicrhau cydbwysedd rhwng eu teuluoedd ac ymrwymadau eraill fel y dewisant. Rhaid i gyflogwyr roi cymorth i'w staff i'w helpu i sicrhau'r cydbwysedd hwnnw yn eu bywydau. Rhaid inni gydnabod hefyd y caiff y gweithlu gofal plant effaith fawr ar yr economi. Gallwn greu cylch economaidd rhinweddol lle bo gofal plant wrth wraidd gwaith adfywio cymunedol. Archwiliwyd y syniadau hyn yn rhannol ym mhennod 2 yr adroddiad, ond yr wyf wedi gofyn i Chwarae Teg ac Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru roi cyngor pellach a llunio adroddiad atodol ar y mater pwysig hwn.

Despite the potential economic and social impact of the childcare workforce, it is clear that this vital resource is undervalued. An important means of raising the status of childcare is to make it more of a profession. In preparing our action plan, we will hold discussions with Education and Learning Wales, and the representative bodies in childcare, so that we can define an initiative to address this fragmentation.

The new care standards inspectorate for Wales will also play a vital role in underpinning the quality of all daycare for under-eights. We are working closely with national childcare organisations to get the regulations and standards right. However, I am pleased to announce today that, when we consult on fees to be charged by the inspectorate, we will propose that no fee should be charged for registration or inspection of childminders, or where less than four hours of care per day is provided, including playgroups and after-school clubs. We will also introduce start-up grants to attract new registrations by childminders.

Chapter 4 of the report discusses the needs of the local early years development and childcare partnerships. A substantial increase in resources is going to these partnerships. In the current financial year, we distributed £1.4 million to the partnerships, supplemented in-year with a further £1 million. We decided to distribute £3.8 million to the partnerships next year so that they can plan ahead, knowing that they will start the next financial year with an increase of more than 250 per cent over the position at the start of this year. In return, we expect a big step forward from this funding in each locality, such as start-up grants for new childminders, new information services, better provision for training, more encouragement to families to take up the working families tax credit and, where appropriate, direct support to ensure the survival of play groups which face difficulties in sustaining themselves. We will issue guidance for those partnerships for the next financial year after Christmas.

Er gwaethaf effaith economaidd a chymdeithasol bosibl y gweithlu gofal plant, mae'n amlwg na chaiff yr adnodd hanfodol hwn ei werthfawrogi'n ddigonol. Ffordd bwysig o godi statws gofal plant yw ei ystyried yn fwy o broffesiwn. Wrth baratoi ein cynllun gweithredu, byddwn yn cynnal trafodaethau â Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru, a'r cyrff eraill sy'n cynrychioli gofal plant, fel y gallwn ddiffinio menter i ymdrin â'r rhwyg hwn.

Bydd arolygiaeth safonau gofal Cymru newydd hefyd yn chwarae rhan hanfodol wrth atgyfnerthu ansawdd pob math o ofal dydd i blant o dan wyth oed. Cydweithiwn yn agos â sefydliadau gofal plant cenedlaethol i sicrhau bod y rheoliadau a'r safonau yn gywir. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bleser gennyf gyhoeddi heddiw y byddwn yn cynnig, pan ymgynghorwn ar y ffioedd i'w codi gan yr arolygiaeth, na ddylid codi tâl am gofrestru nac am arolygu gwarchodwyr plant, nac ychwaith lle y darperir llai na phedair awr o ofal y diwrnod, gan gynnwys cylchoedd chwarae a chlybiau ar ôl yr ysgol. Byddwn hefyd yn cyhoeddi grantiau cychwyn i ddenu gwarchodwyr plant newydd i gofrestru.

Mae pennod 4 yr adroddiad yn trafod anghenion partneriaethau lleol datblygu blynyddoedd cynnar a gofal plant. Neilltuir mwy o adnoddau ar gyfer y partneriaethau hyn. Yn y flwyddyn ariannol bresennol, dosbarthwyd £1.4 miliwn i'r partneriaethau, ac ychwanegwyd £1 filiwn arall at y swm hwnnw yn ystod y flwyddyn. Penderfynasom ddsbarthu £3.8 miliwn i'r partneriaethau y flwyddyn nesaf fel y gallant gynllunio ar gyfer y dyfodol, gan wybod y bydd mwy na 250 y cant yn fwy ganddynt ar ddechrau'r flwyddyn ariannol nesaf nag yr oedd ganddynt ar ddechrau'r flwyddyn hon. Yn gyfnewid am hynny, disgwyliwn ddatblygiad mawr yn sgîl yr arian hwn ym mhob ardal, megis grantiau cychwyn i warchodwyr plant newydd, gwasanaethau gwybodaeth newydd, darpariaeth well o ran hyfforddiant, gwaith i annog mwy o deuluoedd i wneud cais am y credyd treth i deuluoedd sy'n gweithio a, lle y bo'n briodol, cymorth uniongyrchol i sicrhau bod y cylchoedd chwarae sy'n cael anhawster i gynnal eu hunain yn parhau. Byddwn yn cyhoeddi canllawiau ar gyfer y

partneriaethau hynny ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf ar ôl y Nadolig.

3:50 p.m.

I was recently pleased to report the establishment of a new organisation to support out-of-school clubs called 'Clybiau Plant Cymru/Kids' Clubs Network', which came into being on 1 October. It comprises the development workers formerly based in Chwarae Teg and is backed by a consortium of the major interests in childcare. The Assembly's contract with the organisation runs until 2004.

The report's final chapter considers how we can maximise the use of all the potential streams of funding, which includes Assembly funding. There are substantial European structural fund opportunities for childcare, and match funding from the new opportunities fund can also be used.

I will now discuss the amendments. I will not support amendment 1. I do not disagree with the spirit of much of what it contains, but, it is premature to bring a series of points before the Assembly that do not relate to the taskforce's report, which we are discussing, but rather to the administration's action plan which has not been published. I am happy to support amendment 2, which calls for that action plan to be brought back for Plenary debate, and to aim for a March date for that debate, although the precise timing depends upon other business pressures in the Chamber which I cannot control. I support the other amendments. Amendments 3 and 5 are in line with my intentions for the action plan, and amendment 4, regarding the legislative framework, reflects the practice of the Assembly Government.

To conclude, I look forward to hearing Members' contributions on those important issues. By holding this debate, substantially increasing the resources available, and drawing in the expertise from the taskforce to enable us to make the right decisions in our action plan, we are raising the status of our childcare strategy and keeping children's needs at the centre of our policy making in

Yr oedd yn bleser gennyf nodi yn ddiweddar i sefydliad newydd gael ei sefydlu i roi cymorth i glybiau y tu allan i oriau ysgol o'r enw 'Clybiau Plant Cymru/Kids' Clubs Network', a sefydlwyd ar 1 Hydref. Mae'n cynnwys y gweithwyr datblygu a weithiodd yn flaenorol gyda Chwarae Teg ac fe'i cefnogir gan gonsortium o'r prif gyrff sydd â diddordeb mewn gofal plant. Mae cytundeb y Cynulliad gyda'r sefydliad yn parhau tan 2004.

Mae pennod olaf yr adroddiad yn ystyried sut y gallwn wneud y defnydd gorau o bob un o'r llifoedd ariannu posibl, sy'n cynnwys arian gan y Cynulliad. Ceir cyfleoedd sylweddol o ran cronfeydd strwythurol Ewrop ar gyfer gofal plant, a gellir defnyddio arian cyfatebol o'r gronfa cyfleoedd newydd hefyd.

Trafodaf y gwelliannau yn awr. Ni chefnogaf welliant 1. Nid anghytunaf â naws llawer o'r hyn y mae'n ei gynnwys, ond mae'n rhy gynnar i gyflwyno cyfres o bwyntiau gerbron y Cynulliad nad ydynt yn ymwneud ag adroddiad y tasglu, yr ydym yn ei drafod, ond sy'n ymwneud â chynllun gweithredu'r weinyddiaeth sydd heb ei gyhoeddi. Yr wyf yn barod i gefnogi gwelliant 2, sy'n galw am gynnal dadl mewn Cyfarfod Llawn ar y cynllun gweithredu hwnnw, ac i anelu at gynnal y ddadl honno ym mis Mawrth, er bod y dyddiad penodol yn dibynnu ar faterion busnes eraill o bwys yn y Siambr na allaf eu rheoli. Cefnogaf y gwelliannau eraill. Mae gwelliannau 3 a 5 yn cydymffurfio â'm bwriad o ran y cynllun gweithredu, ac mae gwelliant 4, o ran y fframwaith deddfwriaethol, yn adlewyrchu arfer Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

I gloi, edrychaf ymlaen at glywed cyfraniadau'r Aelodau ar y materion pwysig hynny. Drwy gynnal y ddadl hon, drwy gynyddu'n sylweddol yr adnoddau sydd ar gael, a thrwy ddefnyddio arbenigedd y tasglu i'n galluogi i wneud y penderfyniadau cywir yn ein cynllun gweithredu, yr ydym yn codi statws ein strategaeth gofal plant ac yn sicrhau bod anghenion plant wrth wraidd ein

Wales.

gwaith o lunio polisiau yng Nghymru.

**Gareth Jones:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 1: ychwanegwch ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

**Gareth Jones:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 1: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*yn galw ar y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i gynnwys yn y cynllun gweithredu hwn:*

*calls on the Minister for Health and Social Services to include within this action plan:*

1. cynlluniau i recriwtio a hyfforddi gweithwyr gofal plant proffesiynol;

1. plans for the recruitment and training of childcare professionals;

2. mesurau i gryfhau rôl partneriaethau datblygu blynyddoedd cynnar a gofal plant;

2. measures to strengthen the role of the early years development and childcare partnerships;

3. mesurau i gryfhau gallu'r Is-Adran Plant a Theuluoedd;

3. measures to strengthen the capabilities of the Children and Families Division;

4. cynlluniau i hyrwyddo darparu gofal plant trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg;

4. plans for promoting childcare provision through the medium of Welsh;

5. cynlluniau i gefnogi a datblygu rôl y sector gwirfoddol o safbwynt darparu gofal plant.

5. plans for supporting and developing the role of the voluntary sector in providing childcare.

Cynigiaf welliant 2. Ychwanegwch bwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

I propose amendment 2. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*yn galw hefyd ar y Gweinidog i gynnal trafodaeth ar y cynllun gweithredu hwn mewn Cyfarfod Llawn ym mis Mawrth 2002.*

*further calls on the Minister to bring this action plan for discussion in Plenary session in March 2002.*

Cynigiaf welliant 3. Ychwanegwch bwynt ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

I propose amendment 3. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*yn galw ar y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, ynghyd â'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau, i ddatblygu model cyllido digonol, cynaliadwy a thymor hir ar gyfer y strategaeth, gan fynd i'r afael â fforddiadwyedd gofal plant, sy'n fater allweddol.*

*calls on the Minister for Health and Social Services, with the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities, to develop a long-term, adequate, sustainable funding model for the strategy, addressing the key issue of the affordability of childcare.*

Cynigiaf welliant 4. Ychwanegwch bwynt ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

I propose amendment 4. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*yn galw ar y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i gydweithio'n agos â Llywodraeth y DU i sicrhau'r fframwaith ddeddfwriaethol gorau posibl ar gyfer hyrwyddo lles plant ifanc.*

*calls on the Minister for Health and Social Services to work closely with the UK Government to ensure the best possible primary legislative framework for the promotion of the wellbeing of young children.*



Yn ddiaw, mae'r tasglu wedi tynnu sylw at faterion o bwys sylfaenol yn yr adroddiad hwn sy'n tanlinellu'r trafferthion a'r rhwystrau sy'n bodoli ym maes gofal plant. Mae'n datgan yn glir bod yr ymagwedd bresennol yn dioddef gan ei bod wedi ei seilio ar un o'r lefelau ariannu isaf yn Ewrop—ariannu sy'n annigonol, yn fympwyol, yn anwastad ac annibynadwy. Nodir hynny i gyd yn yr adroddiad.

Mae'r pwyslais diwylliannol a thraddodiadol ar swyddogaethau a chyfrifoldebau dynion a merched hefyd wedi cyfyngu ar dwf gofal dydd amser llawn, ac mae'r costau wedi bod yn broblem, ac eithrio i barau proffesiynol. Mae hynny yn mynd yn erbyn egwyddor cyfle cyfartal ac yn amlygu'r diffygion mewn perthynas â'r mater hwnnw. Mae hynny hefyd wedi arwain at ddibyniaeth fawr ar y sector gwirfoddol ac, yng Nghymru yn enwedig, at ddibyniaeth ar aelodau o'r teulu.

Mae'r cyfeiriad yn yr adroddiad at yr amrywiaeth o wasanaethau a ddatblygwyd, ond heb lawer o ddewis gwirioneddol i rieni, yn un digalon, yn enwedig o sylweddoli bod yr amrywiaeth hwn yn achosi i blant bach cyn oed ysgol gael eu symud o bared i bost yn ystod yr amser pan y maent yn effro. Mae hynny bron yn ymylu ar greulondeb ac yn codi'r mater o hawliau plant. Byddai'r fath beth yn cael ei ystyried yn gwbl annerbyniol yn ystod y cyfnod cynradd neu uwchradd.

Nid oes diben manylu ymhellach ar ddiffygion y system bresennol; maent yn ddigon amlwg yn yr adroddiad. Mae'n amlwg hefyd na allwn ganiatáu i'r system bresennol, sy'n anhrefnus o amrywiol gyda'i dimensiynau preifat, cyhoeddus a gwirfoddol, barhau. Yn wir, mae'r diffyg cydlynedd presennol yn fygythiad i fodolaeth rhai cyrff sydd wedi arloesi yn y maes megis cylchoedd meithrin a grwpiau chwarae. Mae hynny yn ei dro yn fygythiad uniongyrchol i hyfywedd a datblygiad yr iaith Gymraeg mewn rhai cymunedau.

Mae gofynion hyfforddi hefyd yn amrywio'n fawr. Yn gyffredinol, mae cyflogau isel wedi gwneud i lawer—gan gynnwys rhieni—feddwl nad oes angen llawer o sgiliau i weithio fel gofalwr. Mae'r holl faes, felly, yn

The task force has undoubtedly drawn attention to fundamentally important matters in this report which underline the difficulties and the obstacles that exist in childcare. It clearly shows that the present approach is suffering as a result of one of the lowest funding levels in Europe—funding which is insufficient, arbitrary, patchy and unpredictable. That is all noted in the report.

The cultural and traditional emphasis on the functions and responsibilities of men and women has also limited the growth of full-time day care, and the costs have been a problem, with the exception of professional couples. That flies in the face of the principle of equal opportunities and highlights the deficiencies in relation to that issue. That has also led to a great dependency on the voluntary sector and, in Wales especially, a dependency on family members.

The reference in the report to the diversity of the services developed, but without offering much in the way of choice for parents, is disheartening, particularly when that diversity causes young children of pre-school age to be moved from pillar to post during their waking hours. That could almost be deemed cruel and it raises the issue of children's rights. That would be deemed unacceptable during the primary or secondary stage.

There is no point in further highlighting the present system's deficiencies; they are quite clearly noted in the report. It is also clear that we cannot allow the present system, which is chaotically diverse in its private, public and voluntary dimensions, to continue. In fact, the present lack of co-ordination threatens the existence of some bodies that have been innovative in the field, such as nursery and play groups. That, in turn, directly threatens the viability and the development of the Welsh language in some communities.

The training requirements also vary greatly. In general, low salaries have led many—including parents—to believe that few skills are needed to work as a carer. Therefore, the image of the whole sector suffers as a result

dioddef oherwydd y canfyddiad a'r ddelwedd wael honno.

Serch hynny, cyfeiria'r adroddiad at arferion da, a gwaith dychmygus ac effeithiol mewn rhai canolfannau. Yr her fydd ceisio lledaenu'r arferion da hyn drwy Gymru gyfan. Dylem ddiolch i'r unigolion a'r mudiadau sydd yn sylweddoli maint y dasg, ac sydd yn ymlafnio er mwyn y plant ac eraill sydd yn eu gofal.

Yn yr un modd, byddai'n annheg beirniadu gweinyddiaeth y Cynulliad am y gwendidau amlwg y cyfeirir atynt yn yr adroddiad. Mae'n sefyllfa a etifeddwyd ac sydd wedi datblygu dros gyfnod maith. Serch hynny, mae'n amlwg bod rhaid gwella'r sefylla, ac mae'r galwad am arweiniad y Cynulliad yn growy. Profir Llywodraeth Cymru pan ddaw i roi'r cynllun gweithredu y bwriedir ei gyflwyno ar waith ar ddiwedd mis Chwefror 2002.

Y mae'n annheg i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg feirniadu Plaid Cymru yn y cyfamser ar gynnwys ein gwelliannau. Mae'r adroddiad yn tanlinellu cymaint o wendidau a diffygion presennol y gwasanaeth, byddai wedi bod yn amhosibl cynnig gweliant i ymateb i bob un o'r problemau hyn. Cofiw'n hefyd mai dim ond rhan o'r darlun sydd yma. Deallaf gan y Gweinidog y byddwn fel Aelodau yn cael cyfle i drafod y cynllun gweithredu mewn Cyfarfod Llawn. Croesawaf hynny, gan y cawn gyfle bryd hynny, gobeithiaf Jane, i gynnig gwelliannau a syniadau pellach ar y maes pwysig hwn.

Mae gwelliannau Plaid Cymru-The Party of Wales yn deillio'n uniongyrchol o'r adroddiad ac yn atgoffa'r Llywodraeth o'r galw am weledigaeth, strategaeth ac arweiniad—galw sydd yn britho'r adroddiad hwn. Yn hytrach na chwyno am ddiffyg cyfraniad Plaid Cymru, cawn weld yr hyn sydd gan y Llywodraeth—gan gynnwys y Rhyddfrydwyr Democratiadd—i'w gynnig yn y cynllun, a chroesawaf y cyfle i drafod hynny.

Y tro hwn, mae'n rhaid inni gytuno â gweliant y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig—gweliant 5 yn enw Jonathan Morgan—sydd yn

of that perception.

However, the report refers to good practice, and the imaginative and effective work carried out in some centres. The challenge will be to spread this good practice throughout Wales. We should thank those individuals and organisations who realise the size of the task, and who labour for the sake of children and others in their care.

By the same token, it would be unfair to criticise the Assembly's administration for the obvious weaknesses to which the report refers. It is an inherited situation which has developed over a long period. Despite this, it is clear that the situation must be improved, and the call for leadership from the Assembly is clear. The Welsh Government will be tested when it implements the action plan as intended at the end of February 2002.

It is unfair of the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language to criticise Plaid Cymru in the meantime for the content of our amendments. The report underlines so many weaknesses and areas where the service is lacking at present, that it would have been impossible to propose an amendment to address every one of these problems. We should also remember that we only have a part of the picture here. I understand from the Minister that we as Members will have the chance to discuss the action plan in Plenary. I welcome that as we will have a chance then, I hope Jane, to propose amendments and further ideas on this important subject.

The Plaid Cymru-The Party of Wales amendments are directly derived from the report and remind the Government of the call for vision, strategy and leadership—a call that is seen throughout this report. Rather than complaining about Plaid Cymru's lack of contribution, we shall see what the Government—including the Liberal Democrats—has to offer in the plan, and I welcome the chance to discuss this.

This time, we must agree with the Welsh Conservatives' amendment—amendment 5 in the name of Jonathan Morgan—which

cydnabod pwysigrwydd gweithlu sydd wedi'i hyfforddi'n dda, ac sydd wedi'i reoli'n effeithiol. Yn ymhlyg yn hynny mae cost, a chymeraf yn ganiataol y byddai Jonathan yn gefnogol i fuddsoddiad ariannol i wireddu hynny, ac y byddai am weld buddsoddiad o'r fath.

I gloi, wrth i'r Llywodraeth ystyried ei strategaeth, gofynnaf iddi ystyried yr anghenion hyn mewn dull integredig. Mae dogfen 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu' a Mesur Addysg y Llywodraeth yn agor drysau i ni yng Nghymru fod yn feiddgar ac yn chwyldroadol, ac i ddatblygu, er enghraifft, gynlluniau economiadd trawsbynciol yn ein cymunedau.

Y mae hwn yn faes pwysig—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Wind up now, please, Gareth.

**Gareth Jones:** Yr ydym wedi cydnabod gwendidau yn yr adroddiad, a gobeithiaf y bydd y cynllun yn caniatáu inni symud ymlaen a gwella'r sefyllfa yn y maes pwysig hwn.

**David Melding:** I propose amendment 5 in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Insert a new point at the end of the motion:

*recognises the importance of a well-trained and properly regulated childcare workforce.*

The Welsh Conservative Party is pleased to commend this draft strategy. It is still work in progress, but the Minister must respond to it and I am pleased to hear that we will get a chance to debate the strategy again in Plenary.

It is important that we have guaranteed minimum standards in this sector as childcare is important now, and it will be increasingly important for many parents in the future as they become more economically active and rely on childcare provision.

We have heard that at present there is usually little choice in childcare for parents.

recognises the importance of a well-trained and well-managed workforce. There is a cost implicit in this, and I take it for granted that Jonathan Morgan will be supportive to, and will want to see, financial investment to realise this.

To close, as the Government considers its strategy, I ask it to consider these needs in an integrated manner. 'The Learning Country' document and the Government's Education Bill is opening doors for us in Wales to be innovative and revolutionary, and to develop, for example, cross-cutting economic schemes in our communities.

This is an important subject—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. A fyddech cystal â dod i ben yn awr, Gareth.

**Gareth Jones:** We have recognised weaknesses in the report, and I hope that the scheme will allow us to move forward and improve the situation in this important field.

**David Melding:** Cynigiaf welliant 5 yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Ychwanegwch bwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd gweithlu gofal plant sydd wedi cael safon uchel o hyfforddiant a sy'n cael ei reoleiddio'n briodol.*

Mae'n bleser gan Blaid Geidwadol Cymru gymeradwyo'r strategaeth ddrafft hon. Mae'n parhau i gael ei datblygu, ond rhaid i'r Gweinidog ymateb iddi ac mae'n dda gennym glywed y cawn gyfle i drafod y strategaeth eto mewn Cyfarfod Llawn.

Mae'n bwysig bod gennym isafswm safonau gwarantedig yn y sector hwn gan fod gofal plant yn bwysig erbyn hyn, a bydd yn gynyddol bwysig i lawer o rieni yn y dyfodol wrth iddynt ddod yn fwy gweithgar yn economaidd gan ddibynnu ar ddarpariaeth gofal plant.

Clywsom mai ychydig o ddewis sydd fel arfer i rieni o ran gofal plant ar hyn o bryd.

However, although there may not be many providers in one particular geographic locality, there are many organisations providing care, and this sets us a challenge in ensuring that guaranteed standards are met and that the workforce and the service provided is properly regulated. Therefore it will require a determined effort on the part of the Executive to ensure that robust systems are put in place, and you will have the support of our group in trying to fulfil that aim.

It has not been mentioned yet, but the importance of the voluntary sector should be emphasised because often it can be particularly adept at providing services in disadvantaged areas, for instance, or for children with specific needs, and we should be aware of that.

The haphazard funding streams that presently apply in this sector, can be particularly challenging for voluntary groups. Five or six different funding streams can apply. We need some co-ordination so that people are, at least, signposted to where they can apply for an appropriate grant. I repeat the call for funding to be spread over a three-year period, rather than having small community groups scrambling around every year trying to secure funding.

4:00 p.m.

I agree with Gareth Jones's comments on behalf of Plaid Cymru that we need a better paid workforce. When one calls for better training to increase the level of recruitment and retention in the workforce, the level of pay is implicit in that. If a workforce is better trained and must respond to greater demands, in terms of qualifications, for example, then the corollary of that is that it will require greater financial reward for that level of commitment.

No-one mentioned special educational needs. As we consider the special educational needs strategy and how it is developing robustly—which I support—it is important to remember that there is an increasing ability to identify special educational needs and specific health conditions in children under the age of three.

Fodd bynnag, er nad oes llawer o ddarparwyr mewn un ardal benodol, mae llawer o sefydliadau sy'n darparu gofal, ac mae hyn yn gosod her inni o sicrhau y bodlonir y safonau gwarantedig ac y rheoleiddir y gweithlu a'r gwasanaeth a ddarperir yn briodol. Felly, bydd angen ymdrech benderfynol ar ran y Weithrediaeth i sicrhau y caiff systemau cadarn eu sefydlu, a bydd gennyh gefnogaeth ein grŵp ni wrth ichi geisio cyflawni'r nod hwnnw.

Nis crybwyllwyd eto, ond dylid pwysleisio pwysigrwydd y sector gwirfoddol oherwydd gall fod yn arbennig o fedrus yn aml wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau mewn ardaloedd sydd o dan anfantais, er enghraifft, neu wasanaethau i blant ag anghenion arbennig, a dylem fod yn ymwybodol o hynny.

Gall y llifoedd ariannu ar hap sy'n berthnasol i'r sector hwn ar hyn o bryd fod yn heriol i grwpiau gwirfoddol yn arbennig. Gall pum neu chwe llif ariannu gwahanol fod yn berthnasol. Mae angen rhywfaint o waith cydgysylltu arnom fel yr hysbysir pobl o leiaf ble y gallant wneud cais am grant priodol. Ailadroddaf y galw i rannu cyllid dros gyfnod o dair blynedd, yn hytrach na bod mewn sefyllfa lle bo grwpiau bach yn ymgiprys bob blwyddyn i geisio sicrhau cyllid.

Cytunaf â sylwadau Gareth Jones ar ran Plaid Cymru bod angen gweithlu â chyfflogau gwell arnom. Pan fydd galw am hyfforddiant gwell i gynyddu nifer y bobl a gaiff eu recriwtio i'r gweithle ac a gaiff eu cadw, mae cyfflog yn ymhlyg yn hynny. Os oes rhaid i weithlu gael ei hyfforddi'n well ac os oes rhaid iddo ymateb i fwy o alwadau, o ran cymwysterau, er enghraifft, yna canlyneb hynny yw y bydd angen gwobr ariannol fwy am yr ymrwymiad hwnnw.

Ni chrybwyllwyd anghenion addysgol arbennig gan neb. Wrth inni ystyried y strategaeth anghenion addysgol arbennig a'r ffordd gadarn y mae'n datblygu—yr wyf yn ei chefnogi—mae'n bwysig cofio bod gallu cynyddol i nodi plant o dan dair oed sydd ag anghenion addysgol arbennig ac anhwylderau

Early diagnosis and intervention can improve life outcomes radically. We must be aware of that. It is challenging that there are so many providers, and it is often a community-led sector. However, we need to be aware of this in furthering the special educational needs agenda.

The issue of childcare fits into the general pattern of care that is provided by various people in the community. I want to mention specifically the need to improve care for the elderly. In considering economic inactivity rates in deprived areas, it is important to remember that people often have to care for children and elderly relatives. To improve one level of care without the other may not have the advantages that we seek in trying to increase the economic productivity of an area. It is important to remember that when we consider Objective 1 and the use of funding in those streams to increase the level of childcare. We may still not get maximum output, because people still bear heavy burdens in caring for the elderly, as they do not receive effective day-care provision, perhaps for elderly relatives or disabled friends or members of the family. We often mention the heavy level of disability in deprived communities, which is above the national average.

The working families tax credit is not a matter for the Assembly, but we can influence it through the Executive. This benefit needs to be considered. There seem to be some strange disincentives. Those in training are not valid for this particular tax credit, which, as a way of trying to encourage people back to economic activity, seems perverse.

**Peter Black:** I also welcome this report. It is an appropriate response to the fact that there has been little development in the childcare sector in Wales in recent years. There is also limited support for childcare from many employers, although there are examples of good practice.

The UK is at the bottom of the European league on the public funding of childcare and

iechyd penodol. Gall diagnosis ac ymyriad cynnar wella canlyniad bywyd yn sylweddol. Rhaid inni fod yn ymwybodol o hynny. Mae'r ffaith bod cymaint o ddarparwyr yn her, a sector o dan arweiniad y gymuned ydyw yn aml. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni fod yn ymwybodol o hyn wrth ddatblygu'r agenda anghenion addysgol arbennig ymhellach.

Mae gofal plant yn rhan o'r patrwm cyffredinol o ofal a ddarperir gan amrywiaeth o bobl yn y gymuned. Yr wyf am grybwyll yn benodol yr angen i wella gofal i'r henoed. Wrth ystyried cyfraddau anweithgarwch economaidd mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig, mae'n bwysig cofio bod yn rhaid i bobl ofalu am blant a pherthnasau oedranus yn aml. Mae'n bosibl nad oes gan y broses o wella un lefel o ofal heb y llall y manteision yr ydym yn chwilio amdanynt wrth geisio gwella cynhyrchiant economaidd ardal. Mae'n bwysig cofio hynny wrth inni ystyried Amcan 1 a'r defnydd o arian yn y llifoedd hynny i gynyddu lefel gofal plant. Efallai na fyddwn yn sicrhau'r cynhyrchiant mwyaf o hyd, gan fod pobl yn parhau i ysgwyddo beichiau trwm o ran gofalu am yr henoed, gan nad ydynt yn cael darpariaeth gofal dydd effeithiol, ar gyfer perthnasau oedranus neu ffrindiau anabl neu aelodau anabl o'r teulu o bosibl. Soniwn yn aml am y lefel uchel o anabled mewn cymunedau difreintiedig, sy'n uwch na'r cyfartaledd cenedlaethol.

Nid yw'r credyd treth i deuluoedd sy'n gweithio yn fater i'r Cynulliad, ond gallwn ddylanwadu arno drwy'r Weithrediaeth. Mae angen ystyried y budd-dal hwn. Ymddengys fod rhai anghymhellion rhyfedd. Nid yw'r rhai sy'n cael hyfforddiant yn gymwys ar gyfer y credyd treth penodol hwn, sydd, fel ffordd o geisio annog pobl i ddychwelyd i weithgarwch economaidd, yn ymddangos yn wrthnysig.

**Peter Black:** Croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn hefyd. Mae'n ymateb priodol i'r ffaith nad yw'r sector gofal plant yng Nghymru wedi datblygu llawer yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Cefnogaeth gyfyngedig a geir hefyd i ofal plant gan lawer o gyflogwyr, er bod enghreifftiau o arfer da.

Mae'r DU ar waelod cynghrair wledydd Ewrop o ran yr arian cyhoeddus a roddir i

this needs to be reversed. The cost of childcare is high and prohibitive for all except professional couples—and I am sure that many of those also struggle. This means that most people in Wales rely on their families, friends and neighbours, or on the voluntary sector. As David said previously, the voluntary sector plays an important role in childcare. Various services have developed, but there is still little choice for parents.

I listened to a report on the radio this morning about how inadequate transport links disadvantage people seeking to work or undertake training. The non-availability of childcare is also a major obstacle. Estates in some urban areas with high levels of deprivation, such as Blaen-y-maes in Swansea, not far from where I live, do not even have one locally-registered childminder. This adds to the other obstacles, such as poor transport links, which face many who wish to return to work.

As David Melding said, families who qualify for working families tax credit must still find 30 per cent of the cost of day care, while single mothers undertaking training courses, such as those training to be nurses, may not qualify for child support, which is available to others. Future Skills Wales revealed that one in five women surveyed cited the availability of childcare as the main barrier to work, while, in 1999, the WDA estimated that, if female economic activity rates increased to the UK average, GDP per head in Wales would increase by 2 per cent.

As I have said, employers' attitude to childcare is crucial in changing cultural resistance to flexible working practices to accommodate carers. There is no formal career or wage structure for childminders, yet they provide 25 per cent of non-parental care for children. The report's recommendation to create a national network is therefore welcome. The use of structural funds for that purpose would be appropriate. However, will

ofal plant ac mae angen gwrthdroi hyn. Mae cost gofal plant yn uchel ac yn rhy uchel i bawb ar wahân i barau proffesiynol—ac yr wyf yn siŵr bod llawer o'r rheini yn ei chael yn anodd hefyd. Golyga hyn fod y rhan fwyaf o bobl yng Nghymru yn dibynnu ar eu teuluoedd, eu ffrindiau a'u cymdogion, neu ar y sector gwirfoddol. Fel y dywedodd David o'r blaen, mae'r sector gwirfoddol yn chwarae rhan bwysig ym maes gofal plant. Datblygwyd amrywiaeth o wasanaethau, ond ychydig o ddewis sydd i rieni o hyd.

Gwrandewais ar adroddiad ar y radio y bore yma am y ffordd y mae cysylltiadau teithio annigonol yn rhoi pobl sydd am weithio neu sydd am ymgymryd â hyfforddiant o dan anfantais. Mae diffyg gofal plant yn rhwystr mawr hefyd. Nid oes gan ystadau mewn rhai ardaloedd trefol sydd â lefelau uchel o amddifadedd, megis Blaen-y-maes yn Abertawe, nad yw'n rhy bell o fy nghartref i, un gwarchodwr plant a gofrestrwyd yn lleol hyd yn oed. Mae hyn yn ychwanegu at rwystrau eraill, megis cysylltiadau teithio gwael, a wynebir gan lawer o bobl sydd am ddychwelyd i waith.

Fel y dywedodd David Melding, rhaid i deuluoedd sy'n gymwys i gael y credyd treth i deuluoedd sy'n gweithio ddod o hyd i 30 y cant o gost gofal dydd, tra na fydd mamau sengl sy'n dilyn cyrsiau hyfforddiant, megis rhai sy'n hyfforddi i fod yn nyrs, o bosibl yn gymwys i gael cymorth plant, sydd ar gael i bobl eraill. Datgelodd Sgiliau Dyfodol Cymru i un ferch ym mhob pump a gymerodd ran yn yr arolwg nodi mai diffyg gofal plant oedd y prif rwystr rhag gweithio, tra amcangyfrifodd y WDA, yn 1999, y byddai CMC y pen yng Nghymru yn codi 2 y cant, pe byddai cyfraddau gweithgarwch economaidd ymhlith merched yn codi i gyfartaledd y DU.

Fel y dywedais, mae agwedd cyflogwyr tuag at ofal plant yn hollbwysig wrth newid y gwrthwynebiad diwylliannol i arferion gwaith hyblyg er mwyn diwallu anghenion gofalwyr. Nid oes strwythur gyrfa ffurfiol na strwythur cyflog ffurfiol ar gyfer gwarchodwyr plant, ac eto darparant 25 y cant o'r gofal plant nas darperir gan rieni. Felly, croesewir argymhelliad yr adroddiad i greu rhwydwaith cenedlaethol. Byddai'n

the Minister investigate the use of the community investment tax credit announced by the Chancellor, and the proposed community investment authority, to fund childcare in deprived communities, linked to the creation of jobs?

This report is an important step forward in terms of putting together a coherent childcare strategy that builds on the work already carried out by the National Assembly. The key issue is to put in place sustainable funding for this strategy and I look forward to the Minister's response to this debate and to the action plan to take this forward.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Yr wyf yn falch o'r cyfle i gyfrannu at y ddatl hon. Yr wyf am ganolbwyntio ar yr elfen economaidd. Cyn imi wneud hynny, cyfeiriaf at brofiad fy etholaeth. Yr wyf wedi bod yn gysylltiedig â datblygiadau gwerthfawr ym Mhwlheli a Phen-y-groes, a gwelais fanteision darpariaethau o'r fath. Mae problemau unigryw mewn ardaloedd gwledig, wrth i rieni—y fam gan amlaf—orfod teithio yn bell os ydynt am weithio. Golyga hynny fod angen gofal plant am gyfnodau hir arnynt. Mae gofal drwy gyfrwng mamiaith y plentyn a sicrhau darpariaeth ddigonol drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg hefyd yn broblem. Mae profiad Pen-y-groes yn ddifyr. Sefydlwyd uned gydweithredol yno gyda chymorth arian Ewropeaidd. Daeth yr uned i fod yn sgîl arolwg JIGSAW o anghenion y pentref. Hen bentref yn ardal chwareli llechi Dyffryn Nantlle ydyw, ac mae ganddo yr un math o broblemau â llawer o bentrefi Cymoedd de Cymru. Dangosodd arolwg JIGSAW mai gofal plant oedd un o'r anghenion mwyaf er mwyn rhyddhau rhieni—mamau yn bennaf—i chwilio am waith. Mae'n ddatblygiad pwysig sydd wedi mynd o nerth i nerth.

I turn to the economic dimension, which has been referred to already. The real challenge in increasing GDP per head in Wales and improving the standard of living for all our people is to ensure that we have the highest practical activity rates. Over 40 per cent of the economically inactive female population of Wales would like to work if circumstances

briodol defnyddio cronfeydd strwythurol i ariannu hynny. Fodd bynnag, a fydd y Gweinidog yn ymchwilio i'r ffordd y defnyddir credyd treth ar gyfer buddsoddi yn y gymuned a gyhoeddwyd gan y Canghellor, a'r awdurdod arfaethedig ar gyfer buddsoddi yn y gymuned, i ariannu gofal plant mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig, sy'n gysylltiedig â'r broses o greu swyddi?

Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn ddatblygiad pwysig o ran llunio strategaeth gydlynol sy'n adeiladu ar y gwaith a gyflawnwyd eisoes gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Y mater allweddol yw sicrhau bod arian cynaliadwy ar gyfer y strategaeth hon ac edrychaf ymlaen at ymateb y Gweinidog i'r ddatl hon ac at y cynllun gweithredu a fydd yn datblygu hyn.

**Dafydd Wigley:** I welcome the opportunity to contribute to this debate. I will concentrate on the economic aspect. Before doing so, I will refer to my constituency's experience. I have been involved with constructive developments in Pwllheli and Pen-y-groes, and witnessed the advantages of this provision. There are unique problems in rural areas, as parents—usually mothers—have to travel long distances if they want to work. That means that they need childcare for long periods. Childcare provision in a child's mother tongue and ensuring adequate Welsh-medium provision is also a problem. Pen-y-groes's experience is interesting. A co-operative unit was established with the aid of European money. It came into existence as a result of a JIGSAW survey of the village's needs. It is an old village in the slate-mining region of Dyffryn Nantlle and has similar problems to those of several villages in the south Wales Valleys. The JIGSAW survey revealed that childcare was one of the greatest needs in order to enable parents—mainly mothers—to look for work. It is an important development that has gone from strength to strength.

Trof at y dimensiwn economaidd, y cyfeiriwyd ato eisoes. Yr her wirioneddol wrth godi CMC y pen yng Nghymru ac wrth wella safon byw pawb yw sicrhau bod gennym y cyfraddau gweithgarwch ymarferol uchaf. Hoffai dros 40 y cant o ferched Cymru sy'n economaidd anweithgar weithio pe bai'n bosibl. Crybwyllwyd goblygiadau hyn yn

allowed. The implications of this were mentioned earlier. Evidence provided by Future Skills Wales shows that 26 per cent of females surveyed identified the availability of childcare as the main barrier to work. We must take that on board. I hope that what follows as a result of this debate will be of economic significance. If we can crack the question of increasing female activity rates to the UK average—there are some challenges in terms of male activity rates also—it would contribute more than £400 million in direct earnings across Wales. That is a significant amount. We must not only look at this issue from a rights, educational or cultural point of view or in terms of the kind of problems seen in my constituency; it must be considered from an economic point of view, which should be part of an overall attack on Wales's economic challenges. I hope that progress is made on that agenda.

4:10 p.m.

**Karen Sinclair:** I welcome this debate. I will focus on accessibility of childcare information available to parents. The internet site for Childcare Link—and it is a wonderful site that covers the whole of Britain—shows contact details to enable working parents to easily and quickly get information about childcare provision in their locality. The list includes childminders, play schemes, early education, toddler, infant, and national childcare contacts. It is a marvellous example of technology at its best, giving easy, accessible information to help working parents take advantage of the myriad of choices on offer and to be able, at the touch of a mouse or a simple phone call, to access information on quality, flexible childcare. However, there is one small disadvantage. The information on Wales is currently under development. This is, however, an improvement on the situation a few months ago.

The system of providing access to childcare information has been up and running in England and Scotland for well over a year. If you had looked at the map on the internet page at the beginning of this year, you would not have found a single entry for Wales. The

gynharach. Dengys tystiolaeth a ddarparwyd gan Sgiliau Dyfodol Cymru fod 26 y cant o ferched a gymerodd ran yn yr arolwg yn nodi mai diffyg gofal plant yw'r prif rwystr rhag gweithio. Rhaid inni ystyried hynny. Gobeithiaf y bydd yr hyn sy'n deillio o'r ddadl hon o arwyddocâd economaidd. Os gallwn lwyddo i godi cyfraddau gweithgarwch ymhlith merched fel eu bod yn cyrraedd cyfartaledd y DU—mae rhai heriau o ran cyfraddau gweithgarwch ymysg dynion hefyd—byddai'n cyfrannu dros £400 miliwn mewn enillion uniongyrchol ledled Cymru. Mae hwnnw'n swm sylweddol. Ni ddylem edrych ar y mater hwn o safbwynt hawliau neu o safbwynt addysgol neu ddiwylliannol yn unig nac o ran y math o broblemau a welir yn fy etholaeth i; rhaid ei ystyried o safbwynt economaidd, a ddylai fod yn rhan o broses gyffredinol o fynd i'r afael â heriau economaidd Cymru. Gobeithiaf y gwneir cynnydd yn hynny o beth.

**Karen Sinclair:** Croesawaf y ddadl hon. Byddaf yn canolbwyntio ar hygyrchedd gwybodaeth am ofal plant sydd ar gael i rieni. Dengys gwefan Childcare Link—sy'n wefan ardderchog i Brydain gyfan—fanylion cysylltu er mwyn galluogi rhieni sy'n gweithio i gael gwybodaeth am ofal plant yn eu hardal yn hawdd ac yn gyflym. Mae'r rhestr yn cynnwys gwarchodwyr plant, cynlluniau chwarae, addysg blynyddoedd cynnar, cysylltiadau gofal plant i fabanod a phlant bach a chysylltiadau gofal plant cenedlaethol. Mae'n enghraifft wych o dechnoleg ar ei gorau, yn rhoi gwybodaeth hawdd a hygyrch i helpu rhieni sy'n gweithio i fanteisio ar y dewisiadau di-rif sydd ar gael ac i gael gwybodaeth, drwy bwysu botwm neu drwy wneud galwad ffôn syml, am ofal plant hyblyg o safon. Fodd bynnag, mae un anfantais fach. Mae'r wybodaeth am Gymru wrthi'n cael ei datblygu. Serch hynny, mae hyn yn well na'r sefyllfa ychydig o fisoedd yn ôl.

Bu'r system o sicrhau mynediad i wybodaeth am ofal plant ar waith yn Lloegr a'r Alban ers dros flwyddyn. Pe baech wedi edrych ar y map ar y dudalen ar y rhyngwyd ar ddechrau'r flwyddyn hon, ni fydddech wedi dod o hyd i unrhyw wybodaeth am Gymru.



need to co-ordinate and disseminate information on childcare facilities is recognised. There are, in Wales, several local children's information bureaux, and we have an excellent one in Wrexham. However, at present we have no co-ordinated national helpline. Chwarae Teg holds an all-Wales database, and appropriate funding will allow the development of existing information and technology at local level.

The National Assembly is committed to childcare provision for all who need it, and recognises the important economic benefits of childcare provision. It is important that the 2,800 childminders registered in Wales, and the other childcare services, have a cost-effective, strategic method of advertising their services. We have spoken today of the need for co-ordinating and raising the status of childminding in Wales. It is imperative that parents in Wales have accessibility to quality information. We need a well-funded system to roll out that information locally—local information is imperative. I will remember going back to work full-time myself, and having to face the prospect of finding quality childcare for my children. It is a difficult time, and you need the reassurance and expertise that gives you the confidence to go forward.

It may surprise Members to know that partnership funding for this important initiative in England and Scotland for 2001-02 was £15 million, with an average of £100,000 per partnership. We have some serious catching up to do. We have an existing national information network ready to link into, and we must make it a priority to bring this information into the national arena. We must ensure that all the initiatives discussed today, once implemented, are well publicised, and we must make funding available to do this.

**Helen Mary Jones:** We have before us a valuable document highlighting all the major issues that must be tackled if the woeful state of childcare provision in Wales today is to be addressed. The Plaid Cymru—The Party of

Cydnabyddir yr angen i gydgyssylltu ac i ledaenu gwybodaeth am gyfleusterau gofal plant. Yng Nghymru, mae nifer o swyddfeydd gwybodaeth plant lleol, ac mae gennym un ardderchog yn Wrecsam. Fodd bynnag, ar hyn o bryd, nid oes gennym linell gymorth genedlaethol gydgyssylltiedig. Mae gan Chwarae Teg gronfa ddata i Gymru gyfan, a bydd arian priodol yn sicrhau y gellir datblygu'r wybodaeth a'r dechnoleg bresennol yn lleol.

Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ymrwymedig i ddarparu gofal plant i bawb sydd ei angen, ac mae'n cydnabod manteision economaidd pwysig gofal plant. Mae'n bwysig bod gan y 2,800 o warchodwyr plant a gofrestrwyd yng Nghymru, a gwasanaethau gofal plant eraill, dull strategol, cost-ffeithiol o hysbysebu eu gwasanaethau. Nodwyd heddiw yr angen i gydgyssylltu ac i godi statws gwarchodwyr plant yng Nghymru. Mae'n hanfodol bod gan rieni yng Nghymru fynediad i wybodaeth o safon. Mae angen system a ariennir yn dda arnom er mwyn cyflwyno'r wybodaeth honno yn lleol—mae gwybodaeth leol yn hanfodol. Cofiaf yn dda ddychwelyd i waith llawn amser, a gorfod wynebu'r sefyllfa o ddod o hyd i ofal plant o safon ar gyfer fy mhlant. Mae'n gyfnod anodd, ac mae angen y sicrwydd a'r arbenigedd arnoch sy'n rhoi'r hyder ichi barhau.

Efallai y bydd yn synnu Aelodau i wybod mai £15 miliwn oedd yr arian partneriaeth ar gyfer y fenter bwysig hon yn Lloegr a'r Alban ar gyfer 2001-02, gyda chyfartaledd o £100,000 fesul partneriaeth. Mae gennym lawer o waith i'w wneud i gyfateb â hynny. Mae gennym rwydwaith gwybodaeth cenedlaethol y gallwn gysylltu ag ef, a rhaid inni sicrhau mai un o'n blaenoriaethau yw tynnu sylw'r genedl at y wybodaeth hon. Rhaid inni sicrhau y rhoddir llawer o gyhoeddusrwydd i bob un o'r mentrau a drafodwyd heddiw, cyn gynted ag y cânt eu rhoi ar waith, a rhaid inni sicrhau bod arian ar gael i wneud hyn.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Mae hon yn ddogfen werthfawr sy'n amlygu pob un o'r prif faterion y mae'n rhaid mynd i'r afael â hwy os bwriedir ymdrin â sefyllfa druenus gofal plant yng Nghymru heddiw. Mae

Wales amendments seek to give the force of Plenary decision to some of the key elements of the report's recommendations. I am pleased that the Minister supports amendments 2, 3 and 4. I understand her reasons for not supporting amendment 1. However, we will push it to a vote, and I trust that the Minister will take into account those principles as she draws up the action plan.

Given her support for the amendments, will the Minister take this opportunity to dissociate herself from some of the negative remarks made in the press today by her ministerial colleague, Jenny Randerson, about these amendments. If I were the Minister, I would expect my colleagues to consult me in advance before going public on such matters, but then, perhaps they do not chat much.

I will address my serious comments mainly to amendments 3 and 4. Amendment 3 highlights the key funding issue, which is the bottom line. The current pattern of funding, as the taskforce report points out, is unsustainable and sometimes wasteful. Good schemes have all too often been provided with initial funding, but have proved unsustainable financially on a purely commercial basis. I trust that the Minister will acknowledge today that childcare provision, particularly in underprivileged communities, may well need long-term Government funding support if that provision is to provide the kind of consistent, high-quality service that children deserve and their families need. I also trust that the action plan will address the key issue of affordability. Much other good work will fail if this problem is not solved.

Amendment 4 calls on the Minister to work closely with the UK Government to ensure the best possible primary legislative framework for the promotion of the wellbeing of young children. I am glad that this amendment is being supported. The protection of children's physical safety is key to that legislative framework. I wonder what new discussions the Minister has had—if any—with Westminster colleagues in light

gwelliannau Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales yn ceisio rhoi grym penderfyniad Cyfarfod Llawn i rai o elfennau allweddol argymhellion yr adroddiad. Y wyf yn falch bod y Gweinidog yn cefnogi gwelliannau 2, 3 a 4. Deallaf ei rhesymau dros beidio â chefnogi gwelliant 1. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn ei roi i bleidlais, a hyderaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn ystyried yr egwyddorion hynny pan fydd yn paratoi'r cynllun gweithredu.

O ystyried ei chefnogaeth i'r gwelliannau, a wnaiff y Gweinidog achub ar y cyfle hwn i'w datgysylltu ei hun oddi wrth rai o'r sylwadau negyddol a wnaethpwyd yn y wasg heddiw gan ei chyd-Weinidog, Jenny Randerson. Pe bawn yn Weinidog, byddwn yn disgwyl i'm cyd-Weinidogion ymgynghori â mi ymlaen llaw cyn iddynt wneud sylwadau cyhoeddus ar faterion o'r fath, ond efallai nad ydynt yn siarad â'i gilydd rhyw lawer.

Mae fy sylwadau difrifol yn ymwneud â gwelliannau 3 a 4 yn bennaf. Mae gwelliant 3 yn amlygu'r mater ariannu allweddol, a dyma yw diwedd y gân. Nid yw'r patrwm presennol o ariannu yn gynaliadwy ac mae'n wastraffus weithiau, fel y noda adroddiad y tasglu. Yn rhy aml darparwyd arian cychwynnol i gynlluniau da, ond ni fuont yn gynaliadwy yn ariannol ar sail fasnachol. Hyderaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn cydnabod heddiw ei bod yn bosibl y bydd angen cymorth ariannol hirdymor gan y Llywodraeth ar ddarpariaeth gofal plant os bwriedir i'r ddarpariaeth honno ddarparu'r math o wasanaeth cyson o safon y mae plant yn ei haeddu ac sydd ei angen ar eu teuluoedd. Hyderaf hefyd y bydd y cynllun gweithredu yn ymdrin â'r mater allweddol o fforddiadwyedd. Bydd llawer o waith da arall yn methu os na chaiff y broblem hon ei datrys.

Mae gwelliant 4 yn galw ar y Gweinidog i gydweithio'n agos â Llywodraeth y DU i sicrhau'r fframwaith deddfwriaethol sylfaenol gorau posibl i hyrwyddo lles plant ifanc. Yr wyf yn falch y caiff y gwelliant hwn ei gefnogi. Mae diogelu diogelwch corfforol plant yn rhan hanfodol o'r fframwaith deddfwriaethol hwnnw. Tybed pa drafodaethau newydd a gafodd y Gweinidog—os o gwbl—â chyd-aelodau yn

of recent debates in the Scottish Parliament about the physical punishment of children in the family. I realise that this is a highly emotive subject and that strong and understandable views are held on all sides. I am at a loss to understand how anyone can strike a child, particularly a small child, 'with love', to quote the view of a Westminster Government Minister on this matter. Being a parent, as many of us know, can be a challenging and deeply frustrating experience as well as a deeply rewarding one. However, I cannot see how that challenge and frustration ever justifies physical violence, even if it sometimes explains it.

Does the Minister agree with me and with all the major children's voluntary organisations that the Government at Westminster should keep these complex and sensitive matters under review? I urge her today to keep a close eye on developments in Scotland and, depending on the progress that that Parliament's ban on physical punishment of children under three makes, to consider pressing the Westminster Government to consult again on legislation. I hate to think that young children in Wales are less protected by the law than children elsewhere in Europe. Children, families and communities need good childcare. We look forward to the Government's action plan responding to this important report. We welcome the commitment to providing that action plan by February 2002 and to scrutinising it in a future Plenary.

**Gwenda Thomas:** I welcome the national childcare strategy taskforce's report and the Minister's promise to produce an action plan by the end of February 2002. However, I also welcome the opportunity to comment on paragraph 2 of chapter 1, headed, 'The Current Situation'. There is a reference here to a reliance, more significant in Wales, on family members for the provision of childcare. There is nothing wrong with family members, especially grandparents, caring for children. That is often what parents choose and what is in the best interests of the children. Within the family setting, childcare is often complemented by family support such as the preparation of a meal and some help with the washing. Grandparents' role and contribution must be recognised. It must

San Steffan yng ngoleuni'r trafodaethau diweddar yn Senedd yr Alban am gosbi plant yn gorfforol o fewn y teulu. Sylweddolaf fod hwn yn bwnc cynyrfiadol iawn a bod gan bob ochr farn gref a dealladwy. Ni allaf ddeall sut y gall unrhyw un fwrw plentyn, yn enwedig plentyn bach, 'gyda chariad', a dyfynnu barn Gweinidog yn Llywodraeth San Steffan ar y mater hwn. Gall bod yn rhiant fod yn brofiad heriol a rhwystredig iawn yn ogystal â bod yn brofiad boddhaus iawn, fel y gŵyr llawer ohonom. Fodd bynnag, ni allaf weld ym mha ffordd y mae'r her a'r rhwystredigaeth hynny yn cyfiawnhau unrhyw drais corfforol, hyd yn oed os bydd yn ei egluro weithiau.

A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno â mi ac â phob un o'r prif sefydliadau plant gwirfoddol y dylai Llywodraeth San Steffan barhau i adolygu'r materion cymhleth a sensitif hyn? Fe'i hanogaf heddiw i gadw llygad ar y datblygiadau yn yr Alban ac i ystyried pwysu ar Lywodraeth San Steffan, gan ddibynnu ar y cynnydd a wna gwaharddiad Senedd yr Alban ar gosbi plant o dan dair oed yn gorfforol, i ymgynghori eto ar ddeddfwriaeth. Mae'n gas gennyf feddwl y caiff plant ifanc Cymru eu diogelu'n llai gan y gyfraith na phlant mewn gwledydd eraill yn Ewrop. Mae angen gofal plant da ar blant, teuluoedd a chymunedau. Edrychwn ymlaen at weld cynllun gweithredu'r Llywodraeth yn ymateb i'r adroddiad pwysig hwn. Croesawn yr ymrwymiad i ddarparu'r cynllun gweithredu hwnnw erbyn Chwefror 2002 ac i graffu arno mewn Cyfarfod Llawn yn y dyfodol.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Croesawaf adroddiad tasglu'r strategaeth genedlaethol gofal plant ac addewid y Gweinidog i lunio cynllun gweithredu erbyn diwedd Chwefror 2002. Fodd bynnag, croesawaf hefyd y cyfle i roi sylwadau am baragraff 2 o bennod 1, o dan y teitl, 'Y Sefyllfa Bresennol'. Cyfeirir yma at y ffaith y dibynnir ar aelodau o'r teulu, i raddau helaethach yng Nghymru, i ddarparu gofal plant. Nid oes dim o'i le ar aelodau o'r teulu, yn enwedig neiniau a theidiau, yn gofalu am blant. Yn aml, dyna'r hyn y mae rhieni yn ei ddewis a'r hyn sy'n well i'r plentyn. O fewn y teulu, ategir gofal plant yn aml gan gymorth y teulu, megis drwy baratoi pryd o fwyd neu rywffaint o gymorth i olechi dillad. Rhaid cydnabod rôl a chyfraniad neiniau a theidiau. Rhaid cydnabod hefyd

also be acknowledged that childcare provided by family members is often the only form available. That is likely to remain the position for some time in some communities.

There is also reference in the report to the care of the elderly, and rightly so. However, where a carer gives up paid work to look after a person of whatever age group who is in receipt of attendance allowance, that carer can then qualify for invalid care allowance. Could this principle not be applied to carers of children, where it can be proven that it will facilitate a return to work by the parents? I know of grandparents who have chosen to give up work to care for grandchildren, even though it has meant a significant reduction in their own income, while they still have considerable financial commitments. Is that not an example of putting the needs of the child first? I realise that it is a benefits issue—which is not devolved—but the Minister might wish to include this suggestion when making representations to the UK Government. I also take this opportunity to defend the right of the mother or father to choose to be a full time parent. This must remain an option. The value of a career break during a child's formative years must not be underestimated. I hope that this basic right will be accommodated in the Minister's plan.

In conclusion, I reiterate my support for the recommendations contained in the report, but urge the Minister to take account of the points that I have made so that the action plan produced will be even more comprehensive.

4:20 p.m.

**Ann Jones:** I will concentrate briefly on one area. We have heard from various speakers today that one of the main barriers to returning to work for women is childcare. It will remain a barrier if we do not consider how childminders are employed and how they set up their businesses. I am not saying that they do not do a good; I think that they do. However, as we work towards flexible working patterns, we must have flexible

mai'r gofal plant a ddarperir gan aelodau o'r teulu yw'r unig fath o ofal plant sydd ar gael yn aml. Mae'n debygol y bydd y sefyllfa honno yn parhau am beth amser mewn rhai cymunedau.

Cyfeirir yn yr adroddiad hefyd at ofal yr henoed, ac mae'n briodol gwneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, pan fydd gofalwr yn rhoi'r gorau i waith cyflogedig i ofalu am berson o unrhyw grŵp oedran sy'n derbyn lwfans gweini, yna bydd y gofalwr hwnnw yn gymwys i gael lwfans gofal analluedd. Oni ellid cymhwyso'r egwyddor hon i ofalwyr plant, lle y gellir profi y bydd yn helpu'r rhieni i ddychwelyd i'r gwaith? Gwn am sefyllfa lle mae neiniau a theidiau wedi dewis rhoi'r gorau i weithio er mwyn gofalu am eu hwyron a'u hwyresau, er bod eu hincwm eu hunain wedi gostwng yn sylweddol o ganlyniad i hynny, a bod ganddynt ymrwymadau ariannol mawr o hyd. Onid yw'n enghraifft o roi anghenion y plentyn yn gyntaf? Sylweddolaf fod hyn yn ymwneud â budd-daliadau—nad yw'n fater datganoledig—ond efallai y bydd y Gweinidog am gynnwys yr awgrym hwn pan fydd yn cyflwyno sylwadau i Lywodraeth y DU. Yr wyf am achub ar y cyfle hwn hefyd i amddiffyn hawl mam neu dad i ddewis bod yn rhiant llawn amser. Rhaid bod y dewis hwn ar gael o hyd. Ni ddylid tanbrisieo gwerth seibiant gyrfa yn ystod blynyddoedd ffurfiannol plentyn. Gobeithiaf y caiff yr hawl sylfaenol hon ei hystyried yng nghynllun y Gweinidog.

I gloi, ailadroddaf fy nghefnogaeth i'r argymhellion a geir yn yr adroddiad, ond anogaf y Gweinidog i ystyried y pwyntiau a godais fel y bydd y cynllun gweithredu a lunnir yn fwy cynhwysfawr byth.

**Ann Jones:** Canolbwyntiaf yn fyr ar un maes. Clywsom gan nifer o siaradwyr heddiw fod gofal plant yn un o'r prif bethau sy'n rhwystro merched rhag dychwelyd i'r gwaith. Bydd yn parhau i fod y rhwystr os nad ystyriwn sut y cyflogir gwarchodwyr plant a sut y maent yn sefydlu eu busnesau. Nid dweud yr wyf na wnânt waith da; credaf eu bod yn gwneud gwaith da. Fodd bynnag, wrth inni weithio tuag at batrymau gwaith

childcare arrangements that take into account that many people throughout the country work shifts. Gwenda mentioned the importance of grandparents in caring for children. That is true in my experience. My mother sacrificed her paid employment to allow me to return to work, because I could not find a childminder for my child when I worked from 6 p.m. until 9 a.m. the following morning. I know the sacrifice that my mother made in order for me to continue my paid employment. We must consider ways around child caring and how we can accommodate for shift workers.

This action plan gives us the opportunity to address some of these issues. If we can address them, we will help those who are trying to return to work and we will hopefully recruit and retain far more childminders. We must be careful that, when we consider childminding, we take account of the full needs of the communities where the children live. It is no good having a childminder who lives 10 miles from the mother's workplace. We must address all these issues. I know that Jane will pay particular attention to this in the action plan.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I am grateful to colleagues for their comments, which will be useful in developing the action plan. This is the first time that we have addressed the childcare strategy in such depth. As Members have said, this involves social, educational, economic and cultural issues and policy concerns. The debate has helped to give a sense of direction, which can be reflected in the action plan.

Gareth and other colleagues who are concerned about funding levels will be pleased by the substantial increase that I announced today for the early years development and childcare partnerships. That is a big step towards change.

Many helpful points have been made on the report. It is an independent report, drawn

hyblyg, rhaid inni sicrhau bod gennym drefniadau gofal plant hyblyg sy'n cofio bod llawer o bobl ledled y wlad yn gweithio sifftiau. Crybwyllodd Gwenda bwysigrwydd neiniau a theidiau wrth ofalu am blant. Mae hynny'n wir yn fy mhrofiad i. Aberthodd fy mam ei swydd er mwyn fy ngalluogi i ddychwelyd i'r gwaith, oherwydd na allwn ddod o hyd i rywun a fyddai'n gwarchod fy mhlentyn o 6 p.m. tan 9 a.m. y bore canlynol tra oeddwn yn gweithio. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r aberth a wnaeth fy mam er mwyn imi barhau yn fy swydd. Rhaid inni ystyried ffyrdd o ddarparu gofal plant a sut y gallwn ddiwallu anghenion pobl sy'n gweithio patrymau gwaith gwahanol.

Rhydd y cynllun gweithredu hwn y cyfle inni ymdrin â rhai o'r materion hyn. Os gallwn ymdrin â hwy, byddwn yn helpu'r rheini sy'n ceisio dychwelyd i'r gwaith a gobeithiaf y byddwn yn recriwtio ac yn cadw llawer mwy o warchodwyr plant. Rhaid inni fod yn ofalus, wrth ystyried gwarchod plant, ein bod yn ystyried anghenion llawn y cymunedau lle y mae'r plant yn byw. Nid yw'n fawr o werth cael gwarchodwr plant sy'n byw 10 milltir i ffwrdd o weithle'r fam. Rhaid inni ymdrin â phob un o'r materion hyn. Gwn y bydd Jane yn rhoi sylw penodol i hyn yn y cynllun gweithredu.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'm cyd-Aelodau am eu sylwadau, a fydd yn ddefnyddiol wrth ddatblygu'r cynllun gweithredu. Dyma'r tro cyntaf yr ydym wedi ymdrin â'r strategaeth gofal plant mewn ffordd mor drwyadl. Fel y soniodd Aelodau, mae hyn yn cynnwys materion cymdeithasol, addysgol, economaidd a diwylliannol ynghyd â phryderon o ran polisi. Mae'r ddadl wedi helpu i roi cyfeiriad i'r gwaith, y gellir ei adlewyrchu yn y cynllun gweithredu.

Bydd Gareth a'm cyd-Aelodau eraill sy'n pryderu am y lefelau ariannu yn fodlon ar y cynnydd mawr a gyhoeddais heddiw ar gyfer y partneriaethau datblygu blynyddoedd cynnar a gofal plant. Mae hwnnw'n gam mawr tuag at newid.

Gwnaethpwyd llawer o bwyntiau defnyddiol am yr adroddiad. Mae'n adroddiad

from those who are at the sharp end of trying to integrate strategically the concerns made so powerfully by Members today.

The points made by Gareth Jones, David Melding, Peter Black and others about raising the status of the childcare profession is of key importance. Education and Learning Wales has an important role to play in this, as have all the national childcare organisations. All Members have recognised the vulnerability that exists as a result of parents and communities having to grapple with many strands and arrangements in terms of childcare. We must develop a strategic approach in the action plan.

This involves good quality care, early child development, equal opportunities and, as Dafydd mentioned, tackling economic inequalities. I attended the launch of the co-operative in Pen-y-groes to which Dafydd referred, which was supported by funding from Chwarae Teg, the previous Welsh Office and Europe. We have not maximised the opportunities available, particularly through European structural funds, to support childcare development.

Some of David's points on standards are important. We are proposing regulations for minimum standards in day care for children under eight years of age. The Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales will be key in establishing those standards. The regulations will be open to discussion. We must have quality in the care that we offer to our youngest children, not just minimum standards. We must ensure that childcare maximises the quality of experience that we offer to our children.

Helen Mary knows that we are proposing a consultation on outlawing smacking of children by childminders or anyone in regulated childcare. That is of key importance to this debate.

I am working closely with the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, Jane Davidson, to consider how we can integrate policy through joint planning and joint government. That includes the special

annibynnol, sy'n defnyddio sylwadau'r rheini sydd yn y rheng flaen wrth geisio integreiddio yn strategol y pryderon a fynegwyd mor rymus gan Aelodau heddiw.

Mae'r pwyntiau a wnaethpwyd gan Gareth Jones, David Melding, Peter Black ac eraill ynglŷn â chodi statws y proffesiwn gofal plant o bwys mawr. Mae gan Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru rôl bwysig i'w chwarae yn hyn o beth, fel sydd gan bob un o'r sefydliadau cenedlaethol gofal plant. Mae pob un o'r Aelodau wedi cydnabod y man gwan sy'n bodoli o ganlyniad i'r ffaith fod rhieni a chymunedau yn gorfod ymgodymu â llawer o elfennau a threfniadau o ran gofal plant. Rhaid inni ddatblygu ymagwedd strategol yn y cynllun gweithredu.

Mae hyn yn cynnwys gofal o safon, datblygiad cynnar plant, cyfle cyfartal ac, fel y crybwyllodd Dafydd, mynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau economaidd. Euthum i lansiad y cwmni cydweithredol ym Mhen-y-groes y cyfeiriodd Dafydd ato, a ariannwyd gan Chwarae Teg, yr hen Swyddfa Gymreig ac Ewrop. Nid ydym wedi manteisio i'r eithaf ar y cyfleoedd sydd ar gael, yn arbennig drwy gronfeydd strwythurol Ewrop, i gefnogi'r gwaith o ddatblygu gofal plant.

Mae rhai o bwyntiau David ynglŷn â safonau yn bwysig. Yr ydym yn cynnig rheoliadau ar gyfer isafswm safonau mewn gofal dydd i blant o dan wyth oed. Bydd gan Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru ran allweddol yn y gwaith o sefydlu'r safonau hynny. Bydd lle i drafod y rheoliadau hyn. Rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn cynnig gofal o safon i'n plant ieuaf, nid isafswm y safonau yn unig. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod gofal plant yn rhoi'r profiad o'r ansawdd gorau i'n plant.

Gŵyr Helen Mary ein bod yn bwriadu ymgynghori ar wahardd gwarchodwyr plant neu unrhyw un sydd ym maes gofal plant a reoleiddir rhag taro plant. Mae hynny o bwys mawr i'r ddadl hon.

Cydweithiaf yn agos â'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, Jane Davidson, i ystyried ym mha ffordd y gallwn integreiddio polisi drwy gynllunio a llywodraethu ar y cyd. Mae hynny'n cynnwys yr agenda

educational needs agenda, which David rightly mentioned.

David, Peter and others referred to the working families tax credit. In Wales, 73,000 families benefit from that tax credit. It has made a great difference to children's lives. However, you also know that the Chancellor has announced his decision to introduce a new integrated child credit for all families from April 2003. We await the details of that but I think that it will address some of the issues raised in terms of the working families tax credit. We must remember that this is about funding services and supporting the poorest and most vulnerable children and parents in Wales. We must fund both: it is not a question of just subsidising the service, but also of subsidising the parents if we are to reach our most disadvantaged communities.

Karen's point about information is of key importance. This is part of the increased investment in information services: we allowed £15,000 for each early years' development and childcare partnership, to develop their children's information service, and £6,000 for the voluntary organisations that can help to take that forward. We did have an excellent Wales childcare information service, pioneered through Chwarae Teg, working with local partnerships, such as the excellent one in Wrexham, which Karen described. We must take that forward. We may have had a gap in terms of bringing the national and the local together but, with this commitment through the action plan, we will address that, so that parents can access information wherever they are in Wales.

This also goes back to the fact that we are not only trying to integrate all our policies and opportunities in the Assembly, but trying to focus on the child and on the most disadvantaged children and parents in our communities in Wales. We must recognise—and this goes back to Gwenda's important points—that family support is vital. We are talking about the most disadvantaged children in our communities, and many of

anghenion addysgol arbennig, a grybwyllodd David yn briodol.

Cyfeiriodd David, Peter ac eraill at y credyd treth i deuluoedd sy'n gweithio. Yng Nghymru, mae tua 73,000 o deuluoedd yn cael y credyd treth hwnnw. Mae wedi gwneud gwahaniaeth mawr i fywydau plant. Fodd bynnag, gwyddoch hefyd fod y Canghellor wedi cyhoeddi ei benderfyniad i gyflwyno credyd plant integredig newydd i bob teulu o Ebrill 2003 ymlaen. Arhoswn am fanylion y credyd hwnnw ond credaf y bydd yn ymdrin â rhai o'r materion a godwyd o ran y credyd treth i deuluoedd sy'n gweithio. Rhaid inni gofio bod hyn yn ymwneud ag ariannu gwasanaethau a rhoi cymorth i'r plant a'r rhieni tlotaf a mwyaf diamddiffyn yng Nghymru. Rhaid inni ariannu'r ddau: er mwyn cyrraedd ein cymunedau sydd o dan yr anfantais fwyaf rhaid inni roi cymhorthdal i'r rhieni yn ogystal ag i'r gwasanaeth.

Mae pwynt Karen am wybodaeth yn allweddol. Mae'n rhan o'r buddsoddiad cynyddol mewn gwasanaethau gwybodaeth: neilltuwyd £15,000 ar gyfer pob partneriaeth datblygu blynyddoedd cynnar a gofal plant, i ddatblygu eu gwasanaeth gwybodaeth plant, a neilltuwyd £6,000 ar gyfer y sefydliadau gwirfoddol a all helpu i ddatblygu'r gwaith hwnnw. Yr oedd gennym wasanaeth gwybodaeth gofal plant ardderchog yng Nghymru, a arloeswyd gan Chwarae Teg, a oedd yn cydweithio â phartneriaethau lleol, megis yr un ardderchog yn Wrecsam, a ddisgrifiwyd gan Karen. Rhaid inni ddatblygu hynny. Efallai y bu bwlech o ran dod â'r gwaith cenedlaethol a'r gwaith lleol at ei gilydd ond, yn sgîl yr ymrwymiad hwn drwy'r cynllun gweithredu, byddwn yn ymdrin â hynny, fel y gall rhieni gael y wybodaeth ble bynnag y maent yn byw yng Nghymru.

Mae hyn hefyd yn ymwneud â'r ffaith nad ydym yn ceisio integreiddio ein holl bolisiau a chyfleoedd yn y Cynulliad yn unig, ond ein bod yn ceisio canolbwyntio ar y plentyn ac ar y plant a'r rhieni sydd o dan yr anfantais fwyaf yn ein cymunedau yng Nghymru. Rhaid inni gydnabod—ac mae hyn yn ymwneud â'r pwyntiau pwysig a wnaethpwyd gan Gwenda—bod cymorth i deuluoedd yn hanfodol. Yr ydym yn sôn am

them benefit from family support services provided by the voluntary sector, many of them from open-access play and free provision, which is enabled through a variety of funding streams. Much of that is too ad hoc. We must learn, in terms of the voluntary sector, that our commitment to three-year funding is key if we are going to reach some of these children and enable play opportunities, childcare support, and free childminding arrangements to empower people to step out into training opportunities and work, and to enable them to support their families.

Of course, grandparents play a key role in all communities. Ann mentioned that her parents helped her. I am sure that there are many in the Chamber who have had parents and grandparents helping to support their battery of childcare arrangements. Some Members may be grandparents who play that part with their grandchildren. That is a part of family life: parents work and they need the opportunity to train. Children should not be disadvantaged by that.

Finally, this goes back to all parts of that agenda—the social, educational, economic and cultural elements—coming together. Childcare strategy is not just for my ministerial portfolio; it is for all of us in the Cabinet. The Local Government and Housing Committee, the Health and Social Services Committee, and the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee have copies of the childcare taskforce report because they all need to give it attention to ensure that when I come back to the Assembly with the action plan—to which I have committed myself—it is a robust action plan. That plan will be based on the independent expertise of the taskforce, and on the debates that we have had in the Assembly. We must ensure that we maximise the funding streams, that we are clear about our objectives, and that the child comes first in terms of our commitment in Wales to the better quality of care for children and young people.

y plant sydd o dan yr anfantais fwyaf yn ein cymunedau. Mae llawer ohonynt yn manteisio ar wasanaethau cynnal teuluoedd a ddarperir gan y sector gwirfoddol, gan gynnwys mynediad i gyfleoedd chwarae a darpariaeth am ddim, a geir drwy amrywiaeth o ffynonellau ariannu. Mae llawer o'r gwaith hwnnw yn rhy ad hoc. Mewn perthynas â'r sector gwirfoddol, rhaid inni ddysgu bod ein hymrwymiad i gyllid dros dair blynedd yn hanfodol os bwriadwn gyrraedd rhai o'r plant hyn gan sicrhau cyfleoedd chwarae, cymorth gofal plant, a threfniadau gwarchod plant am ddim i alluogi pobl i ymgymryd â chyfleoedd hyfforddiant a gwaith, ac i'w galluogi i gynnal eu teuluoedd.

Mae neiniau a theidiau yn chwarae rhan allweddol ym mhob cymuned, wrth gwrs. Crybwyllodd Ann fod ei rhieni wedi ei helpu. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod rhieni a neiniau a theidiau llawer o Aelodau yn y Siambr wedi'u helpu i ategu eu trefniadau gofal plant. Efallai fod rhai o'r Aelodau yn neiniau neu'n deidiau sy'n chwarae'r rhan honno gyda'u hwyron neu eu hwyresau. Mae hynny'n rhan o fywyd teuluol: mae rhieni yn gweithio ac mae angen cyfleoedd hyfforddi arnynt. Ni ddylai hynny roi plant o dan anfantais.

Yn olaf, mae hyn yn ymwneud â phob rhan o'r agenda honno—yr elfennau cymdeithasol, addysgol, economaidd a diwylliannol—yn dod at ei gilydd. Nid yw'r strategaeth gofal plant yn berthnasol i fy mhorthffolio gweinidogol i yn unig; mae'n fater i bob un ohonom yn y Cabinet. Mae gan y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai, y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, a'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes gopïau o adroddiad y tasglu gofal plant oherwydd y bydd angen i bob un ohonynt ei ystyried i sicrhau, pan ddychwelaf i'r Cynulliad gyda'r cynllun gweithredu—yr wyf wedi ymrwymo fy hunan iddo—ei fod yn gynllun gweithredu cadarn. Bydd y cynllun hwnnw yn seiliedig ar arbenigedd annibynnol y tasglu, ac ar y dadleuon a gawsom yn y Cynulliad. Rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn manteisio i'r eithaf ar y ffynonellau ariannu, bod ein hamcanion yn glir, a bod y plentyn yn dod yn gyntaf o ran ein hymrwymiad yng Nghymru i ofal o ansawdd gwell i blant a phobl ifanc.



4:30 p.m.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30*  
*Amendment 1: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 30*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Cairns, Alun  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Graham, William  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Melding, David  
 Richards, Rod  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Ron  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 1.*  
*Amendment 2: For 45, Abstain 0, Against 1.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Ron  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelod canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Member voted against:

Neagle, Lynne

Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Richards, Rod  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 3: For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn

Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Richards, Rod  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 4: For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny

Richards, Rod  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 5: For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Richards, Rod  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

Amended motion:

Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:

*the National Assembly*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*welcomes the report of the national childcare strategy taskforce, which was laid in the Table Office on 26 November 2001, and notes that the Minister for Health and Social Services will produce an action plan by the end of February 2002;*

*yn croesawu adroddiad tasglu'r strategaeth genedlaethol gofal plant ac yn nodi y bydd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn cyhoeddi cynllun gweithredu erbyn diwedd Chwefror 2002;*

*calls on the Minister to bring this action plan for discussion in Plenary session in March 2002;*

*yn galw hefyd ar y Gweinidog i gynnal trafodaeth ar y cynllun gweithredu hwn mewn Cyfarfod Llawn ym mis Mawrth 2002;*

*calls on the Minister for Health and Social Services, with the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities, to develop a long-term, adequate, sustainable funding model for the strategy, addressing the key issue of the affordability of childcare;*

*yn galw ar y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, ynghyd â'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau, i ddatblygu model cyllido digonol, cynaliadwy a thymor hir ar gyfer y strategaeth, gan fynd i'r afael â fforddiadwyedd gofal plant, sy'n fater allweddol;*

*calls on the Minister for Health and Social Services to work closely with the UK Government to ensure the best possible primary legislative framework for the promotion of the wellbeing of young children; and*

*yn galw ar y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i gydweithio'n agos â Llywodraeth y DU i sicrhau'r fframwaith deddfwriaethol gorau posibl ar gyfer hyrwyddo lles plant ifanc; ac*

*recognises the importance of a well-trained and properly regulated childcare workforce.*

*yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd gweithlu gofal plant sydd wedi cael safon uchel o hyfforddiant a sy'n cael ei reoleiddio'n briodol.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion: For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard

Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Richards, Rod  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Adroddiad Grant Arbennig (Rhif 16) (Cymru) 2001 a  
 Chymeradwyo Adroddiad Grant Arbennig (Rhif 16A) (Cymru) 2001  
 Approval of Special Grant Report (No. 16) (Wales) 2001 and Approval of Special  
 Grant Report (No. 16A) (Wales) 2001**

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

*the National Assembly, under Section 88B of the Local Government Finance Act, 1988, and in accordance with Standing Order No. 19.8, approves the Local Government Finance (Wales) Special Grant Report (No. 16) (Wales) 2001, which was laid in the Table Office on 26 November 2001. (NDM878)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly, under Section 88B of the Local Government Finance Act, 1988, and in accordance with Standing Order No. 19.8, approves the Local Government Finance (Wales) Special Grant Report (No. 16A) (Wales) 2001, which was laid in the*

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, o dan Adran 88B o Ddeddf Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol 1988, ac yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 19.8, yn cymeradwyo Adroddiad Grant Arbennig Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) (Rhif 16) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 26 Tachwedd 2001. (NDM878)*

Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, o dan Adran 88B o Ddeddf Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol 1988, ac yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 19.8, yn cymeradwyo Adroddiad Grant Arbennig Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) (Rhif 16A) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa*

*Table Office on 26 November 2001. Gyflwyno ar 26 Tachwedd 2001. (NDM879)*  
(NDM879)

Supporting our children and young people and making a positive difference to their lives is a high priority for us all. Last year, we discussed the Assembly Government's distinctive policy agenda contained in the framework for partnership and extending entitlement strategies. Key elements are improving the co-ordination and coherence of services and ensuring that children and young people have a voice in decision making. Work is now in hand to turn this policy vision into action at the local level through new planning arrangements and partnerships. This is a joint package of funding to support a small but vital element, assisting with the work involved in producing the new plans under both strategies, including the involvement of children and young people. Jane Davidson will talk about how extending entitlement is being taken forward practically. The first special grant report enables local authorities to be reimbursed for work carried out between August and the end of this financial year. The second puts funding in place in good time for next year.

The new overarching children and young people framework will provide a strategic overview of service planning and delivery from a different perspective. It will focus on the needs and priorities of children and young people rather than of service providers. This common strategic vision, agreed by all partners, will be based on core aims consistent with the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child. Issues facing our children and young people are complex and inter-related and require a joined-up response across all sectors that brings together local partners who can contribute to the future of children and young people in a single forum. The children and young people partnership will encourage joint working and a co-ordinated response. It will integrate the efforts of different providers across the range of services to achieve maximum effect. Consultation has just finished on the draft planning guidance for the framework. We intend to issue final guidance next spring. In the meantime, the

Mae cefnogi ein plant a'n pobl ifanc a gwneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol i'w bywydau yn flaenoriaeth uchel inni oll. Y llynedd, trafodwyd agenda polisi unigryw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a geir yn strategaeth y fframwaith ar gyfer partneriaeth a'r strategaeth ar gyfer ymestyn hawliau. Mae'r elfennau allweddol yn cynnwys gwella sut y caiff gwasanaethau eu cydgyssylltu a'u cydlynu a sicrhau bod gan blant a phobl ifanc lais yn y broses gwneud penderfyniadau. Mae gwaith ar y gweill erbyn hyn i roi'r polisi hwn ar waith ar lefel leol drwy drefniadau a phartneriaethau cynllunio newydd. Mae hwn yn becyn ariannu ar y cyd sy'n rhoi cymorth i elfen fach ond hollbwysig, gan gynorthwyo yn y gwaith o lunio'r cynlluniau newydd o dan y naill strategaeth a'r llall, a chan gynnwys plant a phobl ifanc. Bydd Jane Davidson yn siarad am y ffordd yr ydym yn ymestyn hawliau mewn modd ymarferol. Mae'r adroddiad grant arbennig cyntaf yn fodd i awdurdodau lleol gael eu had-dalu am waith a wnaethpwyd rhwng Awst a diwedd y flwyddyn ariannol hon. Mae'r ail adroddiad yn darparu arian mewn da bryd ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf.

Bydd y fframwaith cyffredin newydd ar gyfer plant a phobl ifanc yn rhoi trosolwg strategol o sut y caiff gwasanaethau eu cynllunio a'u darparu o safbwynt gwahanol. Bydd yn canolbwyntio ar anghenion a blaenoriaethau plant a phobl ifanc yn hytrach na darparwyr gwasanaethau. Bydd y weledigaeth strategol gyffredin hon, y cytunwyd arni gan bob un o'r partneriaid, yn seiliedig ar nodau craidd sy'n gyson â Chonfensiwn y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar Hawliau Plant. Mae'r materion a wyneba ein plant a'n pobl ifanc yn rhai cymhleth, wedi eu cydblethu, ac maent yn galw am ymateb cydgyssylltiedig ar draws pob sector sy'n dwyn ynghyd bartneriaid lleol sy'n gallu cyfrannu at ddyfodol plant a phobl ifanc yn un fforwm. Bydd y bartneriaeth plant a phobl ifanc yn hybu cydweithio ac ymateb cydgyssylltiedig. Bydd yn integreiddio ymdrechion gwahanol ddarparwyr ar draws ystod o wasanaethau i sicrhau'r canlyniad gorau. Mae'r ymgynghoriad ar y canllawiau cynllunio drafft ar gyfer y fframwaith newydd ddod i ben. Bwriadwn gyhoeddi

funding will allow local authorities to put preparatory work in place. The philosophy behind the children and young people framework is one of local solutions for local needs. It will be up to local partners to decide what works best in their area. Involving children and young people is crucial to this process. Only by placing them at the heart of planning the services that affect them can we ensure that those services are relevant to their lives and experiences. This funding will encourage the development of existing local children and youth fora and their establishment where they do not already exist. The Assembly Government is strongly committed to giving children and young people in Wales the best possible opportunities and these motions give financial backing to that commitment. I urge you to support the motions.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call William Graham.

**David Melding:** I apologise, Deputy Presiding Officer, you were misinformed; I will speak on this issue.

I commend the work of the youth forum in the Vale of Glamorgan as an example of one that is now up and running. I think that the Minister has also had contact with that forum. It shows you how effective a device this is for gathering opinion on a wide range of issues and services. It is right that we require local authorities to take this aspect of their work seriously. In the past, they have not always been particularly skilled in engaging groups such as children and young people. When you talk about delivering a wide range of services, it is a little strange not to ask the people who are to receive those services what they consider to be most important and how they should be delivered.

I have been in contact with many young people and children who have visited the Assembly to take part in various fora here. That is important and we often realise that what we think needs to be emphasised is not always what young people will emphasise themselves. There was a function recently

canllawiau terfynol y gwanwyn nesaf. Yn y cyfamser, bydd yr arian yn galluogi'r awdurdodau lleol i wneud gwaith rhagbaratoawl. Llunio atebion lleol i anghenion lleol yw'r athroniaeth sy'n sail i'r fframwaith ar gyfer plant a phobl ifanc. Y partneriaid lleol fydd yn penderfynu ar yr hyn sydd orau i'w hardal hwy. Mae'n hanfodol y caiff plant a phobl ifanc eu cynnwys yn y broses hon. Dim ond drwy sicrhau eu bod wrth wraidd y broses o gynllunio'r gwasanaethau sy'n effeithio arnynt y gallwn sicrhau bod y gwasanaethau hynny yn berthnasol i'w bywydau a'u profiadau. Bydd yr arian hwn yn hybu datblygiad y fforymau lleol i blant ac ieuenctid sy'n bodoli eisoes ac yn sefydlu fforymau lle nad ydynt eisoes yn bodoli. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn hollol ymrwymedig i roi'r cyfleoedd gorau i blant a phobl ifanc Cymru ac mae'r cynigion hyn yn cefnogi'r ymrwymiad hwnnw drwy gymorth ariannol. Apeliaf arnoch i gefnogi'r cynigion.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Galwaf ar William Graham.

**David Melding:** Ymddiheuraf, Ddirprwy Lywydd, rhoddwyd y wybodaeth anghywir ichi; fi sy'n siarad ar y mater hwn.

Cymeradwyaf waith y fforwm ieuenctid ym Mro Morgannwg fel enghraifft o un sydd bellach ar waith. Credaf i'r Gweinidog hefyd fod mewn cyswllt â'r fforwm hwnnw. Dengys pa mor effeithiol ydyw fel dyfais i geisio barn ar ystod eang o faterion a gwasanaethau. Mae'n briodol ein bod yn gofyn i awdurdodau lleol gymryd yr agwedd hon ar eu gwaith o ddifrif. Yn y gorffennol, nid oeddent bob amser yn arbennig o fedrus wrth gysylltu â grwpiau megis plant a phobl ifanc. Wrth siarad am ddarparu ystod eang o wasanaethau, mae braidd yn rhyfedd peidio â gofyn i'r bobl a gaiff y gwasanaethau hynny nodi'r hyn sydd o'r pwys mwyaf iddynt hwy a sut y dylid eu darparu.

Yr wyf wedi siarad â llawer o bobl ifanc a phlant sy'n ymweld â'r Cynulliad i gymryd rhan mewn gwahanol fforymau yma. Mae hynny'n bwysig a sylweddolwn yn aml nad yw pobl ifanc eu hunain bob amser yn pwysleisio'r hyn sydd angen ei bwysleisio yn ein barn ni. Cynhaliwyd digwyddiad yn



when children from a variety of secondary schools visited. When discussing the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child, they emphasised their right to protection and the scourge of bullying in some schools. I am not sure that we would have highlighted that issue as specifically as they did.

It is important that we back these measures to ensure that youth fora are encouraged throughout Wales and that those who plan local services have to show how they are consulting these key groups of people. Young people and children are our future—that is often said rather tritely—but they do not get a vote and can often go unheard. Yet, they are as much our constituents as the people who voted for us. They are also the constituents of those who have been elected onto local authorities. We must remember that they need to be listened to. Often they are the experts who can see through a great deal of froth and can tell you when a service is not being delivered well and needs to be improved. I commend these measures.

**Eleanor Burnham:** The Liberal Democrats welcome these proposals as they demonstrate the Assembly's commitment to ensuring that we get the best out of our young people. Cross-cutting various aims to ensure cohesiveness is particularly welcomed, especially as they will be delivered locally. Our party has a fundamental, strong commitment to devolution in the belief that local issues are best dealt with locally. My peripatetic work with under-achieving 14 to 16-year-olds before I came to the Assembly reminds me that many of these young people were under-achieving because in certain schools no-one took any notice of their wishes. Our young people have to feel a part of the society in which they live. Unless they do, we will reap the results of apathy, which is already deeply worrying. This issue is particularly important to us, and accordingly we have given our full support to the establishment of a youth parliament. The proposals to ensure the participation of children and young people in decision-making that affects them is a good example of a similar project on a local level and receives our full backing.

ddiweddar pan ymwelodd plant o nifer o ysgolion uwchradd. Wrth drafod Confensiwn y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar Hawliau Plant, pwysleisiodd y plant broblem bwlio mewn rhai ysgolion a'u hawl i ddiogelwch. Ni chredaf y byddem wedi rhoi cymaint o bwys ar y mater hwnnw ag y gwnaethant hwy.

Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cefnogi'r mesurau hyn i sicrhau y caiff fforymau ieuenctid eu hybu ledled Cymru a bod yn rhaid i'r rhai sy'n cynllunio gwasanaethau lleol ddangos sut yr ymgynghorant â'r bobl allweddol hyn. Pobl ifanc a phlant yw ein dyfodol—ystrydeb yw hynny yn aml—ond nid oes ganddynt bleidlais ac yn aml ni wrandewir arnynt. Ac eto, maent hwy gymaint yn rhan o'n hetholaeth â'r bobl a bleidleisiodd drosom. Maent hefyd yn rhan o ardal y rhai a etholwyd i'r awdurdodau leol. Rhaid inni gofio bod angen gwrandeio arnynt. Yn aml hwy yw'r arbenigwyr. Maent yn gallu bod yn graff iawn a gallant ddweud wrthyh lle na ddarperir gwasanaeth yn dda a lle mae angen ei wella. Argymhellaf y mesurau hyn.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn croesawu'r cynigion hyn am eu bod yn dangos ymrwymiad y Cynulliad i sicrhau ein bod yn cael y gorau o'n pobl ifanc. Croesewir yn arbennig yr ymgais i rychwantu gwahanol nodau i sicrhau cydlyniant, yn arbennig gan y byddant yn cael eu darparu'n lleol. Mae gan ein plaid ymrwymiad sylfaenol, cadarn i ddatganoli am ein bod yn credu mai ar lefel leol y dylid ymdrin â materion lleol. Mae fy ngwaith peripatetig gyda phlant 14 i 16 oed a oedd yn tangyflawni, cyn imi ddod i'r Cynulliad, yn fy atgoffa bod llawer o'r bobl ifanc hyn yn tangyflawni am nad oedd neb yn rhoi sylw i'w dymuniadau o gwbl mewn rhai ysgolion. Rhaid i bobl ifanc deimlo eu bod yn rhan o'r gymdeithas lle maent yn byw. Oni theimlant hynny, byddwn yn wynebu canlyniadau difaterwch, sydd eisoes yn achosi pryder mawr. Mae'r mater hwn yn arbennig o bwysig inni, ac felly rhoesom gefnogaeth lawn i'r cynnig i sefydlu senedd ieuenctid. Mae'r cynigion ar gyfer sicrhau bod plant a phobl ifanc yn cymryd rhan yn y penderfyniadau sy'n effeithio arnynt yn enghraifft dda o brosiect cyffelyb ar lefel leol a gefnogwn i'r carn.

4:40 p.m.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** Jane Hutt and I have been working closely on these issues because the children and young people partnership is the overall framework for setting our policy imperatives for the Assembly. Within that, we have what I consider to be a terribly exciting agenda—the extending entitlement agenda, for which every Member voted in November 2000 in terms of taking forward the statutory frameworks for young people aged between 11 and 25. The frameworks focus on participation and ensuring that the young person's voice is heard, developing partnerships to require local authorities to deliver services, and ensuring that they are co-ordinated across the voluntary and statutory sectors. We know that the children and young people fora will be established as a result of these frameworks. The frameworks are also about ensuring that we have school councils so that young people's voices are heard. Like David Melding, I commend the Vale of Glamorgan youth forum. I read its work with interest. When we listen to young people, we realise that what matters to us as adults, and what matters to them, is not always the same. We must take that into account if we want to ensure that young people participate in future democratic decisions.

The extending entitlement draft directions and guidance went out for wide consultation last week. They will be discussed by the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee next week. The new partnerships will be set up early in 2002, with five-year strategies running from September 2002 for the development of services for young people in Wales. That means that, for the first time in the UK, youth work will operate on a firm statutory footing, and that is happening in Wales. We have already provided an extra £2 million for local authorities this year to strengthen local youth work. We have launched canllaw online—a major, fresh initiative to provide young people with the right information at the right time. That is one of the cornerstones of extending entitlement. Many of you will have visited the exhibition held here in the *neuadd* on 15

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Bu Jane Hutt a minnau yn gweithio'n agos ar y materion hyn am mai'r bartneriaeth plant a phobl ifanc yw'r fframwaith cyffredinol ar gyfer pennu ein polisiau ar gyfer y Cynulliad. O fewn y fframwaith hwnnw, mae gennym agenda gyffrous iawn yn fy marn i—yr agenda i ymestyn hawliau, y pleidleisiodd pob Aelod o'i phlaid ym mis Tachwedd 2000 o ran datblygu'r fframweithiau ar gyfer pobl ifanc rhwng 11 a 25 mlwydd oed. Bydd y fframweithiau'n canolbwyntio ar gyfranogiad ac ar sicrhau ein bod yn gwrando ar lais yr ifanc, gan ddatblygu partneriaethau sy'n gofyn i awdurdodau lleol ddarparu gwasanaethau, a sicrhau y cânt eu cydgysylltu ar draws y sector gwirfoddol a'r sector statudol. Gwyddom y caiff fforymau i blant a phobl ifanc eu sefydlu o ganlyniad i'r fframweithiau hyn. Un o ddibenion eraill y fframweithiau yw sicrhau ein bod yn sefydlu cynghorau ysgol fel y gellir clywed llais yr ifanc. Fel David Melding, cymeradwyaf fforwm ieuenctid Bro Morgannwg. Darllenaf am ei waith â diddordeb. Pan wrandawn ar bobl ifanc, sylweddolwn nad yw'r hyn sydd o bwys i ni fel oedolion bob amser o bwys iddynt hwy. Rhaid inni ystyried hynny er mwyn sicrhau bod pobl ifanc yn cymryd rhan mewn penderfyniadau democrataidd yn y dyfodol.

Dechreuodd ymgynghoriad eang ar y cyfarwyddiadau a'r canllawiau drafft ar ymestyn hawliau yr wythnos diwethaf. Bydd y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn eu trafod yr wythnos nesaf. Sefydlir y partneriaethau newydd ar ddechrau 2002, a bydd strategaethau pum mlynedd yn dechrau ym mis Medi 2002 ar gyfer datblygu gwasanaethau i bobl ifanc yng Nghymru. Mae hynny yn golygu y bydd sylfaen statudol gadarn i waith ieuenctid am y tro cyntaf yn y DU, ac yng Nghymru y mae hyn yn digwydd. Yr ydym eisoes wedi darparu £2 filiwn yn ychwanegol ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol eleni i atgyfnerthu gwaith ieuenctid lleol. Yr ydym wedi lansio canllaw ar-lein—menter newydd sbon bwysig sy'n rhoi gwybodaeth gywir ar yr adeg gywir i bobl ifanc. Dyna un o gonglfeini ein hymgais i ymestyn hawliau. Bydd llawer ohonoch wedi ymweld â'r

November.

arddangosfa a gynhaliwyd yma yn y neuadd ar 15 Tachwedd.

Last Thursday, I was privileged to represent Wales and the UK at the youth council meeting in Brussels, as Rhodri Morgan said during questions, where I was delighted to see that our participation agenda in Wales was used as an example of good practice in the European White Paper. We are ahead of the game, and we want to remain so. This Thursday, I will speak at a conference organised by the Wales European Centre to take that agenda forward and consider how we can liaise with other European countries to ensure that the voices of young people are heard.

Ddydd Iau diwethaf, cefais y fraint o gynrychioli Cymru a'r DU mewn cyfarfod o'r cyngor ieuenctid ym Mrwsel, fel y dywedodd Rhodri Morgan yn ystod y sesiwn cwestiynau. Yr oeddwn yn hynod falch o nodi i'n hagenda ar gyfranogiad yng Nghymru gael ei defnyddio fel enghraifft o arfer da yn y Papur Gwyn Ewropeaidd. Yr ydym ar flaen y gad, a boed i hynny barhau. Ddydd Iau yma, byddaf yn siarad mewn cynhadledd a drefnir gan Ganolfan Ewropeaidd Cymru i ddatblygu'r agenda honno ac ystyried sut y gallwn gysylltu â gwledydd eraill yn Ewrop i sicrhau y caiff llais yr ifanc ei glywed.

As Jane Hutt mentioned in her opening speech, these motions and the funding package that they represent are essential to maintaining the impetus of the Cabinet's investment in young people. I urge you to support them.

Fel y crybwyllodd Jane Hutt yn ei haraith agoriadol, mae'r cynigion hyn a'r pecyn ariannu sy'n gysylltiedig â hwy yn hanfodol i sicrhau bod y Cabinet yn parhau i fuddsoddi mewn pobl ifanc. Apeliaf arnoch i'w cefnogi.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call for a vote on the approval of special grant report (No. 16) (Wales) 2001.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Galwaf am bleidlais i gymeradwyo adroddiad grant arbennig (Rhif 16) (Cymru) 2001.

*Cynnig: O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina

Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Richards, Rod  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I now call **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Galwaf yn awr am  
for a vote on the approval of special grant bleidlais ar gymeradwyo adroddiad grant  
report (No. 16A) (Wales) 2001. arbennig (Rhif 16A) (Cymru) 2001.

*Cynnig: O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val

Melding, David  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Richards, Rod  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

## **Cod y Gweinidogion The Ministerial Code**

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1, 2 and 3 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2 a 3 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

**The First Minister:** I propose that

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly, acting under Standing Order No. 2.7, approves the revised guidance for Cabinet members on the proper discharge of their responsibilities and accountabilities contained in the document entitled 'Ministerial Code', which was laid in the Table Office on 26 November 2001. (NDM880)*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 2.7, yn cymeradwyo'r canllawiau diwygiedig i aelodau'r Cabinet ar gyflawni eu dyletswyddau a'u cyfrifoldebau'n briodol, sydd i'w cael yn y ddogfen 'Cod y Gweinidogion', a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 26 Tachwedd 2001. (NDM880)*

We have produced this new Ministerial Code after the publication of the Nolan Committee's first report and the Cabinet Office's review of the UK Ministerial Code of Conduct. This was also an opportunity to reconsider our Ministerial Code to ensure that it takes account of the Assembly Government's own particular requirements. I will therefore now list the major differences between this new code and the one that the Assembly approved in May 1999.

Yr ydym wedi llunio'r Cod newydd hwn i Weinidogion ar ôl cyhoeddi adroddiad cyntaf Pwyllgor Nolan ac adolygiad Swyddfa'r Cabinet o God Ymddygiad Gweinidogion y DU. Yr oedd hefyd yn gyfle i ailystyried Cod Gweinidogion y Cynulliad i sicrhau ei fod yn ystyried gofynion penodol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Felly rhestraf yn awr y prif wahaniaethau rhwng y cod newydd hwn a'r cod a gymeradwywyd gan y Cynulliad ym mis Mai 1999.

The code contains expanded guidance on Ministers' private interests, including an enhanced role for the Permanent Secretary in relation to that part of the code. There is reference to the fact that the guidance will generally apply to Deputy Ministers. There is also information on Cabinet sub-committees and on modes of travel. I expect all Ministers to work within the letter and spirit of the code. Its purpose is to ensure that we, as Ministers, serve Wales, and are seen to be

Mae'r cod yn cynnwys canllawiau estynedig ar fuddiannau preifat yr Aelodau, gan gynnwys rôl estynedig i'r Ysgrifennydd Parhaol mewn perthynas â'r rhan honno o'r cod. Cyfeirir hefyd at y ffaith y bydd y canllawiau yn berthnasol i Ddirprwy Weinidogion yn gyffredinol. Ceir gwybodaeth hefyd am is-bwyllgorau'r Cabinet ac am ddulliau teithio. Disgwyliaf i bob Gweinidog weithredu yn unol â llythyren ac ysbryd y cod. Ei ddiben yw sicrhau ein

servicing Wales, honestly and in the true interests of the people of Wales who gave us our positions of trust. I believe that the Welsh Assembly Government will find the code a useful source of guidance and reference. It will assist us to undertake our official duties in a way that upholds the highest standards of propriety and adheres to the seven principles of public life. The code expands on the overarching duties on Ministers to comply with the law and to protect the integrity of public life. I firmly believe that we should be absolutely clear about how Ministers should be held accountable to the Assembly and to the public.

Section 1 of the code sets out these responsibilities clearly. That section also applies to Deputy Ministers when they are acting on behalf of a Minister, unless otherwise stated, and section 2 contains further guidance on Deputy Ministers. The code makes it clear that Ministers should always bear in mind that the most important policy announcements should be made to the Assembly in the first instance. That is, properly, the Assembly's right and expectation. Even when Assembly Government announcements are not of major importance, timing still has to be considered carefully so as to avoid clashes with planned Assembly business, Assembly Government publications, statements or other announcements.

Section 5 of the code sets out guidance on the working relationship between Ministers and civil servants. The main thrust of this section is to recognise that civil servants are under a duty to give honest and impartial advice to Ministers without fear or favour. That should underpin the relationship between Ministers and their civil servants. Ministers therefore need to be familiar with the civil service code. The new code also includes a section on the Welsh Administration Ombudsman's role and appropriate procedures. It further defines how Ministers should differentiate between their roles as constituency or regional Assembly Members on the one hand, and as Cabinet Ministers on the other. The code contains detailed information on Ministers' overseas visits and travel and hospitality expenses. It includes guidance for

bod ni, fel Gweinidogion, yn gwasanaethu Cymru ac yn cael ein gweld yn gwasanaethu Cymru, yn gywir ac er gwir fudd pobl Cymru a'n hetholodd i'n swyddi cyfrifol. Credaf y bydd y cod yn ganllaw ac yn gyfeiriad defnyddiol i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Bydd yn ein helpu i ymgymryd â'n dyletswyddau swyddogol gan gynnal y safonau uchaf o ran cywirdeb a chadw at saith egwyddor bywyd cyhoeddus. Mae'r cod yn ymhelaethu ar y dyletswyddau cyffredin sydd ar yr Aelodau i weithredu yn ôl y gyfraith ac i ddiogelu cywirdeb bywyd cyhoeddus. Credaf yn daer y dylem fod yn hollol eglur ynghylch sut y dylai'r Aelodau fod yn atebol i'r Cynulliad a'r cyhoedd.

Mae adran 1 y cod yn nodi'r cyfrifoldebau hyn yn glir. Mae'r adran honno hefyd yn berthnasol i Ddirprwy Weinidogion pan fyddant yn gweithredu ar ran Gweinidog, oni nodir fel arall, ac mae adran 2 yn cynnwys canllawiau pellach ar Ddirprwy Weinidogion. Mae'r cod yn egluro y dylai Gweinidogion bob amser gofio mai yn y Cynulliad y dylid gwneud y cyhoeddiadau pwysicaf ar bolisiau yn y lle cyntaf. Dyna hawl a disgwyliad priodol y Cynulliad. Hyd yn oed pan na fo cyhoeddiadau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o'r pwys mwyaf, dylid ystyried amseru cyhoeddiadau er mwyn osgoi gwrthdaro â busnes arfaethedig y Cynulliad, a chyhoeddiadau a datganiadau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Noda adran 5 y cod ganllawiau ar y berthynas waith rhwng Gweinidogion a gweision sifil. Prif fyrdwn yr adran hon yw cydnabod bod dyletswydd ar weision sifil i roi cyngor cywir i Weinidogion mewn modd diduedd. Dylai hynny fod yn sail i'r berthynas rhwng Gweinidogion a'u gweision sifil. Felly bydd angen i Weinidogion fod yn gyfarwydd â chod y gwasanaeth sifil. Mae'r cod newydd hefyd yn cynnwys adran ar rôl Ombwdsmon Gweinyddiaeth Cymru a gweithdrefnau priodol. Noda ymhellach sut y dylai Gweinidogion wahaniaethu rhwng eu rôl fel Aelodau Cynulliad etholaethol neu Aelodau Cynulliad rhanbarthol ar y naill law, a'u rôl fel Gweinidogion y Cabinet ar y llaw arall. Mae'r cod yn cynnwys gwybodaeth fanwl am ymweliadau tramor Gweinidogion a threuliau teithio a lletygarwch. Mae'n cynnwys

Ministers as members of Regional Committees. That, for example, explains the requirement to ensure that Ministers are always clear about in which capacity they are contributing to the work of those Committees.

The code also covers the communication of policy, including through press conferences, the publication of consultation papers, broadcasts by Ministers and press articles. Members should note that section 10 relates to Ministers' private interests and states that it is the personal responsibility of each Minister to avoid conflict of interest. Ministers must provide the Permanent Secretary with a full list, in writing, of all interests that might give rise to conflict of interest. That should cover all kinds of interest, including financial interests, as well as relevant non-financial private interests. This section also deals with the acceptance of gifts and hospitality in greater detail. Most notably, the acceptance of gifts and hospitality is now aligned to the threshold for the declaration of gifts in the register of Members' interests. The last section of the code contains an updated guidance on Assembly Ministers' pensions.

I now turn to the annexes. Annex 1 lists the seven principles of public life to which I referred earlier. I reaffirm my strong commitment to abiding by them. Annex 2 sets out revised ground rules for official travel, covering the allocation of official cars, travel by rail and air, and flights in privately chartered aircraft.

I turn now to the amendments tabled in the name of Jocelyn Davies, which I cannot support. I cannot support amendment 1 as section 1 of the Ministerial Code already deals with Ministers' personal conduct in the performance of their duties. In the Chamber, Ministers are subject to the Presiding Officer's Protocol on Conduct in the Chamber. I would not expect this code to cut across the Presiding Officer's role in that regard.

I cannot support amendment 2 either. It is clearly stated that the code applies to Deputy

canllawiau i Weinidogion fel aelodau o'r Pwyllgorau Rhanbarth. Mae hynny, er enghraifft, yn egluro'r gofyniad i sicrhau bod Gweinidogion bob amser yn gwybod yn rhinwedd pa swydd y maent yn cyfrannu i waith y Pwyllgorau hynny.

Mae'r cod hefyd yn cwmpasu'r polisi cyfathrebu, gan gynnwys, drwy gynadleddau'r wasg, gyhoeddi papurau ymgynghori, darllediadau gan Weinidogion ac erthyglau i'r wasg. Dylai'r Aelodau nodi bod adran 10 yn ymwneud â buddianau preifat yr Aelodau. Mae'n datgan bod cyfrifoldeb personol ar bob Gweinidog i osgoi gwrthdaro buddiannau. Rhaid i Weinidogion roi rhestr lawn, yn ysgrifenedig, o bob un o'u buddianau a allai greu gwrthdaro buddiannau i'r Ysgrifennydd Parhaol. Dylai hynny gwmpasu pob math o fuddiant, gan gynnwys buddiannau ariannol, yn ogystal â buddiannau preifat anariannol perthnasol. Mae'r adran hon hefyd yn rhoi mwy o fanylion am dderbyn rhoddion a lletygarwch. Yn benodol, mae rhoddion a lletygarwch a dderbynnir erbyn hyn yn unol â'r trothwy ar gyfer datgan rhoddion yng nghofrestr buddiannau'r Aelodau. Mae adran olaf y cod yn cynnwys canllawiau diwygiedig ar bensiynau Aelodau'r Cynulliad.

Trof yn awr at yr atodiadau. Rhestra atodiad 1 saith egwyddor bywyd cyhoeddus y cyfeiriais atynt yn gynharach. Nodaf unwaith eto fy ymrwymiad cadarn i gadw atynt. Noda atodiad 2 reolau diwygiedig ar gyfer teithio swyddogol, gan gynnwys y defnydd a wneir o geir swyddogion, teithio ar y trên a hedfan, a hedfan mewn awyrennau a drefnir yn breifat.

Trof yn awr at y gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ni allaf eu cefnogi. Ni allaf gefnogi gwelliant 1 am fod adran 1 o God y Gweinidogion eisoes yn ymdrin ag ymddygiad personol Gweinidogion wrth gyflawni eu dyletswyddau. Yn y Siambr, rhaid i Weinidogion ufuddhau i BroTOCOL y Llywydd ar Ymddygiad yn y Siambr. Ni ddisgwyliwn i'r cod hwn dorri ar draws rôl y Llywydd o ran hynny.

Ni allaf gefnogi gwelliant 2 ychwaith. Noda'r cod yn glir ei fod yn berthnasol i Ddirprwy

Ministers. The role of Deputy Ministers is covered in the guidance, which has been available on the intranet since last April.

I cannot support amendment 3 either. Sections 2.31 and 2.32 of the code already provide a comprehensive statement of the application of the principle of collective responsibility to Ministers. I intend that the code should apply, subject to this Assembly's view, to Ministers forthwith and I invite Plenary to endorse that proposal today.

4:50 p.m.

**Jocelyn Davies:** I propose the following amendments. Amendment 1: add at the end of the motion:

*underlines the importance of adhering to the highest standards of personal conduct in the performance of their duties in the Chamber.*

I propose amendment 2. Add at the end of the motion:

*instructs the Government to issue clear guidance on the role of Deputy Ministers.*

I propose amendment 3. Add at the end of the motion:

*places particular emphasis on the duty of Ministers to uphold the principle of collective responsibility.*

First, I generally welcome this revised code. However, I address my comments today to the conduct of Ministers in the Chamber because it sometimes leaves a great deal to be desired. Before the First Minister attacks me for mentioning this, I point out that I have raised this matter as a point of order many times.

I have been disappointed to see our First Minister, who is elected by the whole Assembly, shaking his fist at other Assembly Members, shouting and intimidating other speakers, or yawning when he hears things that he does not like. I urge him to stop setting such a bad example to the rest of the Cabinet and his party group. You can

Weinidogion. Cwmpesir rôl Dirprwy Weinidogion yn y canllawiau, sydd wedi bod ar gael ar y fewnrwyd ers mis Ebrill diwethaf.

Ni allaf gefnogi gwelliant 3 ychwaith. Mae adrannau 2.31 a 2.32 y cod eisoes yn rhoi datganiad cynhwysfawr o gymhwysor egwyddor o gyfrifoldeb ar y cyd i Weinidogion. Bwriadaf i'r cod fod yn berthnasol i Weinidogion ar unwaith, yn ddarostyngedig i farn y Cynulliad, a gwahoddaf y Cyfarfod Llawn i gymeradwyo'r cynnig hwnnw heddiw.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol. Gwelliant 1: ychwaneger ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn tanlinellu pwysigrwydd glynu at ymddygiad personol o'r safon uchaf wrth ymgymryd â'u dyletswyddau yn y Siambr.*

Cynigiau welliant 2. Ychwaneger ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn cyfarwyddo'r Llywodraeth i gyhoeddi canllawiau clir ar rôl Dirprwy Weinidogion.*

Cynigiau welliant 3. Ychwaneger ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn rhoi pwyslais arbennig ar ddyletswydd Gweinidogion i lynu at egwyddor cyfrifoldeb ar y cyd.*

Yn gyntaf, croesawaf y cod diwygiedig hwn yn gyffredinol. Fodd bynnag, yn fy sylwadau heddiw hoffwn gyfeirio at ymddygiad yr Aelodau yn y Siambr am fod eu hymddygiad yn gwbl annerbyniol weithiau. Cyn i'r Prif Weinidog ymosod arnaf am grybwyll hyn, hoffwn nodi imi godi'r mater hwn fel pwynt o drefn droeon.

Bu'n destun siom imi weld Prif Weinidog Cymru, a etholwyd gan y Cynulliad cyfan, yn codi ei ddwrn ar Aelodau Cynulliad eraill, yn bygwth a gweiddi ar siaradwyr eraill, ac yn dylyfu gên pan fo'n clywed pethau nad ydynt yn ei blesio. Apeliaf arno i beidio â gosod esiampl mor wael i weddill y Cabinet a grŵp ei blaid. Gellir dychmygu'r argraff a wna ar y



imagine the public perception that he creates. If he is too busy to think about that, he always has the option of using an expensive focus group. However, I offer my observations for free. They will not cost the £7,000 that was needed to come up with the silliest of names for the Cabinet. Incidentally, the First Minister might like to outline the work of these focus groups and comment on the wisdom of using them.

Apart from the physical intimidation on offer, I have also been disappointed by the patronising and dismissive way in which the opposition's views are dealt with. That is not confined to the First Minister. The Minister for Rural Affairs, Carwyn Jones surprised me when he said that one of our Committee members had a thick skull. Andrew Davies, the Minister for Assembly Business, dismissed a valid question from Rhodri Glyn Thomas on broadband by saying that Rhodri was intellectually challenged and struggled to understand most things, and last month, he spitefully commented that the Cabinet often failed to understand points made by Brian Hancock.

However, the First Minister is the worst offender. He often makes personal and arrogant attacks on Members in response to their questions and views. Last week, he was cutting towards Helen Mary Jones when she pressed him on an unfulfilled coalition commitment. The Record of Proceedings shows that he roused laughter from his own group when he reminded her that she was not successful in last year's Plaid Cymru leadership election. I remind him that he failed, not once, but twice in his quest for the Labour crown.

It might amuse some Members in the Chamber when the First Minister makes the ridiculous claim that Phil Williams—a distinguished academic—cannot understand ideas. Such remarks will only turn off people who take an interest in our proceedings. What will young people think when they hear the First Minister attempting to dismiss the youngest Member, Jonathan Morgan, by saying that all of his children are older than Jonathan? It is not surprising that someone in his 60s—and there is no shame in that—has

cyhoedd. Os yw'n rhy brysur i feddwl am hynny, mae opsiwn ganddo o hyd i ddefnyddio grŵp ffocws costus. Fodd bynnag, rhoddaf fi fy sylwadau am ddim. Ni fyddant yn costio'r £7,000 yr oedd ei angen i lunio'r enw mwyaf hurt i'r Cabinet. Gyda llaw, efallai yr hoffai'r Prif Weinidog amlinellu gwaith y grwpiau ffocws hyn a mynegi barn ynghylch doethineb eu defnyddio.

Ar wahân i'r achosion o geisio bygwth Aelodau yn gorfforol, fe'm siomwyd hefyd gan y ffordd nawddoglyd yr ymdrinnir â safbwyntiau'r gwrthbleidiau. Nid Prif Weinidog Cymru yn unig sydd ar fai o ran hynny. Fe'm synnwyd gan y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig, Carwyn Jones pan ddywedodd fod un o'n aelodau Pwyllgor yn dwp. Diystyrwyd cwestiwn dilys Rhodri Glyn Thomas ar fand llydan gan Andrew Davies, y Trefnydd, a ddywedodd fod Rhodri yn dwp ac yn ei chael yn anodd i ddeall unrhyw beth, a'r mis diwethaf, gwnaeth sylw gwatwarus fod y Cabinet yn aml yn methu â deall pwyntiau a wneir gan Brian Hancock.

Fodd bynnag, y Prif Weinidog sy'n trangwyddo fwyaf. Mae'n ymosod ar yr Aelodau mewn ffordd bersonol a thrahaus yn aml mewn ymateb i'w cwestiynau a'u safbwyntiau. Yr wythnos diwethaf, gwawdiodd Helen Mary Jones pan bwysodd arno i drafod ymrwymiad clymblaid nas cyflawnwyd. Dengys Cofnod y Trafodion iddo beri i'w grŵp ei hun chwerthin pan y'i hatgoffodd na fu'n llwyddiannus yn etholiad arweinyddiaeth Plaid Cymru y llynedd. Hoffwn ei atgoffa iddo ef fethu, nid unwaith, ond dwywaith yn ei ymgais i gipio coron Llafur.

Efallai fod rhai Aelodau yn y Siambr yn ei gweld yn ddoniol pan fydd y Prif Weinidog yn gwneud y gosodiad hurt na all Phil Williams—academydd nodedig—ddeall syniadau. Ni fydd sylwadau o'r fath ond yn diflasu pobl sy'n ymddiddori yn ein trafodion. Beth fydd pobl ifanc yn ei feddwl wrth glywed y Prif Weinidog yn ceisio gwawdio'r Aelod ieuaf, Jonathan Morgan, drwy ddweud bod pob un o'i blant yn hŷn na Jonathan? Nid yw'n syndod bod gan rywun dros ei drigain—ac nid oes dim byd

children who are old enough to be elected to public office.

Members may feel that the personal comments I have mentioned would be within the cut and thrust of political debate if they came from ordinary Assembly Members. However, I am sure that everyone would agree that they are not acceptable from Ministers. The First Minister's response to the short debate last week was appalling in this respect. To belittle an opposition Member who does not have an opportunity to respond by referring to his size and by describing him—to use the First Minister's own words—as just 'a former bank clerk', rather than answering the points raised, is cowardly and it caused embarrassment to Members. It does not raise the standard of political exchange and it is unbecoming of the leader of the Government of Wales. Are you making an intervention, Rhodri?

**The First Minister:** No, get on with it.

**Jocelyn Davies:** No, of course you are not making an intervention.

Has anyone ever questioned Edwina Hart's competence as Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities on the basis of her background of working in a bank? Of course not. The Assembly has always paid the proper respect due to the ministerial team by virtue of their office. That is appropriate. We may disagree with them but we respect them and behave accordingly.

I have not often been subjected to—but I am expecting it later—the unpleasant side of the First Minister's tongue, but I do not like to see it directed at others. I remind the First Minister that it takes more than being a tall man to be a big man. Your Ministerial Code should be led by example. I, for one, look forward to seeing the code in action and I will remind the First Minister of its contents from time to time.

**John Griffiths:** I am in favour of our new style of politics, which is less confrontational and more informal than others. It is an improvement on what people are accustomed to in terms of political debate. The people of

cywilyddus yn hynny—blant sy'n ddigon hen i gael eu hethol i swydd gyhoeddus.

Efallai fod yr Aelodau yn teimlo y byddai'r sylwadau personol a grybwyllais yn rhan o ymryson gwleidyddol pes gwneid gan Aelodau Cynulliad cyffredin. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siŵr fod pawb yn gytŷn nad yw'n dderbyniol i Weinidogion wneud sylwadau o'r fath. Yr oedd ymateb y Prif Weinidog i'r ddadl fer yr wythnos diwethaf yn warthus o ran hynny. Yr oedd bychanu Aelod o wrthblaid drwy gyfeirio at ei faint a thrwy ei ddisgrifio—gan ddefnyddio geiriau'r Prif Weinidog—fel 'cyn glerc banc', yn hytrach nag ateb y pwyntiau a godwyd, yn beth llwfr a chododd gywilydd ar yr Aelodau. Nid yw'n codi safon dadl wleidyddol ac nid yw'n gweddu i arweinydd Llywodraeth Cymru. A ydych am ymyrryd, Rhodri?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nac ydwyf, ewch ymlaen.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Na, wrth gwrs, nid ydych am ymyrryd.

A oes unrhyw un wedi amau gallu Edwina Hart fel y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau oherwydd ei bod wedi gweithio mewn banc? Nac oes, yn wir. Mae'r Cynulliad bob amser wedi rhoi'r parch dyledus i dîm y gweinidogion yn rhinwedd eu swydd. Mae hynny yn briodol. Er ein bod yn anghytuno â hwy, yr ydym yn eu parchu ac yn ymddwyn yn unol â hynny.

Nid wyf wedi cael pryd o dafod gan y Prif Weinidog yn aml—ond yr wyf yn disgwyl yn nes ymlaen—ond ni hoffwn weld pobl eraill yn dioddef. Hoffwn atgoffa'r Prif Weinidog nad yw dyn tal yn ddyn mawr o reidrwydd. O ran Cod y Gweinidogion mae angen arwain drwy esiampl. Yn sicr, edrychaf ymlaen at weld y cod yn cael ei arfer a byddaf yn atgoffa'r Prif Weinidog o'i gynnwys o bryd i'w gilydd.

**John Griffiths:** Yr wyf o blaid ein math newydd o wleidyddiaeth, sy'n llai gwrthdrawol ac yn fwy anffurfiol na mathau eraill. Mae'n welliant ar yr hyn y mae pobl yn gyfarwydd ag ef o ran dadl wleidyddol.

Wales support it. They do not want to see politicians tearing strips off each other negatively and unproductively. From the feedback that I have received, they are keen on the new style of politics that we have established in the Assembly. Jocelyn's comments were nonsense. We must not depart from robust political exchange, with a little bit of colour and life. All debates in the Assembly thus far have been, broadly speaking, well within those parameters. None of the examples that Jocelyn gave were of anything near unacceptable behaviour; it was greatly overstated. Jocelyn was grossly exaggerating. I have not seen any physical intimidation in this Chamber. None of the examples cited by Jocelyn come anywhere near that.

**Janet Davies:** John is right in what he says, provided that Members have an opportunity to respond to that sort of remark. However, when the Member does not have comeback, such remarks are invidious.

**John Griffiths:** I maintain what I said. We are in danger of getting far too precious about these matters. We have not witnessed anything that is out of order. Had we done so, the Presiding Officer and the Deputy Presiding Officer would have ensured that Members behaved acceptably and withdrew remarks that were in breach of Standing Orders. Had Members been guilty of physical intimidation, they would have been reprimanded forthwith. This is silly, and the people of Wales will see it as such. We must debate issues robustly and passionately, and with a little bit of life and colour. However, we must refrain from the level of personal insult that is seen all too often at Westminster.

**Helen Mary Jones:** You know, John, that I do not shy away from robust debate, either making it or receiving it. However, do you think it would be appropriate, for example, for a Minister or any other Member to disparage someone because of his or her previous employment as, let us say, a coal miner? I do not think that it would be. It is not the standard of debate that we expect. Whether it crosses over into being discriminatory language, which would be within the remit of the Presiding Officer and

Mae pobl Cymru yn ei gefnogi. Nid ydynt am weld gwleidyddion yn difrïo ei gilydd mewn modd negyddol ac ofer. Yn ôl yr adborth a roddwyd imi, maent yn frwdfrydig ynghylch y math newydd o wleidyddiaeth yr ydym wedi ei gyflwyno yn y Cynulliad. Yr oedd sylwadau Jocelyn yn ddwli. Rhaid inni beidio â chefnu ar ddadl wleidyddol gadarn, sydd â rhywfaint o liw a bywyd. Mae pob dadl yn y Cynulliad hyd yma wedi bod o fewn y terfynau hynny ar y cyfan. Nid oedd yr un o'r enghreifftiau a roddodd Jocelyn yn ymddygiad annerbyniol o gwbl; gor-ddweud ydoedd. Yr oedd Jocelyn yn gorliwio llawer gormod. Nid wyf wedi gweld bygwth corfforol yn y Siambr hon o gwbl. Nid oedd un o'r enghreifftiau a nododd Jocelyn yn dod yn agos at hynny.

**Janet Davies:** Mae'r hyn a ddywedodd John yn iawn, ar yr amod bod gan yr Aelodau gyfle i ymateb i sylw o'r fath. Fodd bynnag, pan na fo cyfle gan Aelod i ymateb, mae sylwadau o'r fath yn annheg.

**John Griffiths:** Cadwaf at yr hyn a ddywedais. Mae perygl ein bod yn dod yn rhy fursennaidd o ran y materion hyn. Ni welsom unrhyw beth a oedd allan o drefn. Pe bai hynny wedi digwydd, byddai'r Llywydd a'r Dirprwy Lywydd wedi sicrhau bod yr Aelodau yn ymddwyn yn briodol ac yn tynnu eu sylwadau yn ôl os oeddent yn groes i'r Rheolau Sefydlog. Pe bai Aelod wedi bygwth Aelod arall yn gorfforol, byddai wedi ei geryddu ar unwaith. Mae hyn yn hurt, a bydd pobl Cymru yn ei ystyried felly. Rhaid inni drafod materion mewn ffordd gadarn ac angerddol, a chyda rhywfaint o fywyd a lliw. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni ymwrthod â'r difrïo personol a welir yn rhy aml yn San Steffan.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Gwyddoch, John, na chiliaf rhag dadl gref, rhag dechrau dadl nac ymateb iddi. Fodd bynnag, a gredwch y byddai'n briodol, er enghraifft, i Weinidog neu unrhyw Aelod arall fychanu rhywun oherwydd ei gyn-gyflogaeth ef neu ei chyn-gyflogaeth hi fel glöwr, dyweder? Ni chredaf y byddai'n briodol. Nid yw'n gyson â'r safon a ddisgwyliwn mewn dadleuon. Mae'r cwestiwn a yw'n iaith wahaniaethol, a fyddai'n rhan o gylch gwaith y Llywydd a'i ddirprwy, yn un mater; mater arall yw a

his deputy, is one matter; whether it is suitable behaviour for the leader of Wales is another.

**John Griffiths:** I am acutely aware of former occupations and that they may, for example, be unpopular ones. Some of us may not want to be reminded of them. As a former lawyer, I am sensitive to such matters. I am aware of the remarks to which Helen Mary refers. In my opinion, the First Minister did not say anything to that Member about his former occupation that insulted him. That was not the case.

We should be sensible about this. If we are too precious, we will bring ourselves into disrepute. The people of Wales and the media will have another feeding frenzy because we will be in danger of making how we discuss business in the Assembly ridiculous.

**William Graham:** The Conservative group views this proposal with great suspicion. That is one reason why we have tabled a no named day motion on it, which is not being debated today. I will summarise our objections shortly. However, our main objection is that there was a lack of consultation. As the First Minister and his Cabinet are so keen to promote openness and accountability, some method of consultation would have been greatly welcomed. I think that the majority of Members, on a free vote, would agree that some consultation was necessary.

We also believe that Deputy Ministers as well as Ministers should have been included in the code. The doctrine of collective responsibility should also apply to Deputy Ministers. We also seek that, in the absence of the First Minister, the Deputy First Minister—where such a post has been created by the Assembly Cabinet—should assume all the rights, duties, privileges and liabilities of the First Minister. References in this code to the First Minister should apply to the Deputy First Minister when he or she acts in place of the First Minister.

5:00 p.m.

ydyw'n ymddygiad priodol ar gyfer arweinydd Cymru ai peidio.

**John Griffiths:** Yr wyf yn ymwybodol iawn o gyn-alwedigaethau a'r ffaith y gall rhai, er enghraifft, fod yn amhoblogaidd. Ni fyddai rhai ohonom am gael ein hatgoffa ohonynt. Fel cyn-gyfreithiwr, yr wyf yn sensitif i'r materion hyn. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r sylwadau y cyfeiria Helen Mary atynt. Yn fy marn i, ni ddywedodd y Prif Weinidog unrhyw beth sarhaus wrth yr Aelod hwnnw am ei gyn-gyflogaeth. Nid yw hynny yn wir.

Rhaid inni fod yn gall ynglŷn â hyn. Os ydym yn rhy fursennaidd, byddwn yn dwyn anfri arnom ni ein hunain. Bydd pobl Cymru a'r cyfryngau yn cael modd i fyw eto oherwydd byddwn yn gwneud y ffordd yr ydym yn trafod busnes yn y Cynulliad yn gyff gwawd o bosibl.

**William Graham:** Mae gan grŵp y Ceidwadwyr amheuan mawr ynglŷn â'r cynnig hwn. Dyna un rheswm pam ein bod wedi cyflwyno cynnig heb ddyddiad trafod arno, na chynhelir dadl arno heddiw. Byddaf yn crynhoi ein gwrthwynebiad yn y man. Fodd bynnag, ein prif wrthwynebiad yw'r diffyg ymgynghori. Gan fod y Prif Weinidog a'i Gabinet mor awyddus i hybu natur agored ac atebol y Cynulliad, byddem wedi croesawu rhyw fath o ymgynghoriad. Credaf y byddai'r rhan fwyaf o'r Aelodau, mewn pleidlais rydd, yn cytuno bod angen rhyw fath o ymgynghoriad.

Credwn hefyd y dylid bod wedi cynnwys y Dirprwy Weinidogion yn ogystal â'r Gweinidogion yn y cod. Dylai'r egwyddor o gyfrifoldeb ar y cyd fod yn berthnasol i Ddirprwy Weinidogion hefyd. Yr ydym yn argymhell hefyd y dylai'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog—lle mae Cabinet y Cynulliad wedi creu swydd o'r fath—ymgymryd â holl hawliau, dyletswyddau, breiniau a rhwymedigaethau'r Prif Weinidog pan fo'r Prif Weinidog yn absennol. Dylai cyfeiriadau yn y cod hwn at y Prif Weinidog fod yn berthnasol i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog pan fo'n gweithredu yn lle'r Prif Weinidog.

When legal proceedings, in which the Minister is involved, affect the functioning of that Minister, he or she should stand down from office. Ministerial announcements should not be made except to the Assembly, unless it is not in session. When Ministers are absent from the United Kingdom, their duties in Plenary session should be undertaken by another Minister and when a Minister visits a constituency or region, notice to local Assembly Members should normally be given at least seven working days in advance.

Although there is, in general, much to support in the thrust and comment of the code, these are our principal objections. Therefore, although we support Plaid Cymru's amendments, we cannot support the motion itself.

**Peter Law:** The Ministerial Code is excellent. It represents the best standards of transparency and openness, which we should support. However, bearing in mind some of the comments that have been made, as a political realist, I began to feel somewhat sensitive, because I am not, thankfully, subject to such a stringent code. I am delighted, as a backbencher, to still be able to yawn, shout and shake my fist at these Tory cheapskates, for instance, who have wreaked so much havoc for so long on people in Wales. I intend to do that while I am here. We must remember that I only cite a toerag here and hobbledehoy there to help people concentrate their minds on some of the types of people in this Assembly.

The amendments are virtually all covered in the code, when you look at it in detail. That is why we will vote against them today. There is sometimes a grey area, perhaps in relation to Deputy Ministers. The Labour Deputy Ministers, who were appointed by the First Minister, are efficient and do an excellent job. I admire and compliment them—even Brian Gibbons looks happy to hear that.

However, because of what sometimes happens, we might need a separate code. Perhaps that separate code would be appropriate for the wonderful chief jester of the Liberal Democrat hokey cokey artists, my

Pan fo Gweinidog yn gysylltiedig ag achos cyfreithiol sy'n effeithio ar ei allu i weithredu, dylai ymddiswyddo. Dim ond yn y Cynulliad y dylai Gweinidogion wneud eu datganiadau, oni bai bod y Cynulliad ar doriad. Pan fo Gweinidogion yn absennol o'r Deyrnas Unedig, dylai Gweinidog arall ymgymryd â'u dyletswyddau yn y Cyfarfod Llawn a phan fo Gweinidog yn ymweld ag etholaeth neu ranbarth, dylid fel arfer roi o leiaf saith diwrnod gwaith o rybudd i'r Aelodau Cynulliad lleol.

Er bod llawer i'w gefnogi ym mhrif fyrddwn a sylwadaeth y cod ar y cyfan, dyma'n prif wrthwynebiadau. Felly, er y cefnogwn welliannau Plaid Cymru, ni allwn gefnogi'r cynnig ei hun.

**Peter Law:** Mae Cod y Gweinidogion yn ardderchog. Mae'n arddel ymddygiad tryloyw ac agored o'r safon uchaf, a dylem gefnogi hynny. Fodd bynnag, o gofio rhai o'r sylwadau a wnaethpwyd, fel realydd gwleidyddol, dechreuais deimlo braidd yn sensitif, am nad oes rhaid imi ddilyn cod mor llym, diolch byth. Yr wyf yn falch o nodi, fel Aelod o'r meinciau cefn, fy mod yn dal i allu dylyfu gêm, gweiddi a chodi dwrn ar y cnafon o Doriaid yma, er enghraifft, a fu'n gyfrifol am wneud cymaint o ddifrod i Gymru ers cymaint o amser. Bwriadaf wneud hynny tra fy mod yma. Rhaid inni gofio mai'r unig reswm fy mod yn sôn am rhyw gnaf y fan yma neu ryw benbwl y fan draw yw i helpu i atgoffa pobl o rai o'r mathau o bobl sydd yn y Cynulliad hwn.

Mae'r cod yn cwmpasu bron pob gwelliant, os edrychir arno yn fanwl. Dyna pam y pleidleisiwn yn eu herbyn heddiw. Efallai ei fod yn annelwig weithiau, o ran Dirprwy Weinidogion. Mae'r Dirprwy Weinidogion Llafur, a benodwyd gan y Prif Weinidog, yn effeithlon ac yn gwneud gwaith rhagorol. Yr wyf yn eu hedmygu ac yn eu canmol—mae hyd yn oed golwg ddedwydd ar Brian Gibbons o glywed hynny.

Fodd bynnag, oherwydd yr hyn a all ddigwydd weithiau, efallai y bydd angen cod ar wahân. Efallai y byddai cod ar wahân o'r fath yn briodol i brif ddigrifwas gwych y criw o Sionis bob ochr a elwir y Democratiaid

colleague, Peter Black, the Deputy Minister for Local Government, because collective responsibility affects everyone in Government. It means that you are either in or out. That may be too complicated for the Liberal Democrats—

**David Davies:** Are you aware that the Deputy Minister currently says one thing about stamp duty and what came out of the budget and that the Minister says something else? Is this an example to which you refer?

**Peter Law:** I am grateful to David for giving me that example, as I had not caught up with that, but I will add it to some of the others that I will cite in a moment. As I say, it may be too difficult for the Liberal Democrats to understand, because, as always, they do things differently. When is a Deputy Minister not a Deputy Minister? That is the point. I follow the principle that if you are in the Government, you share the collective responsibility. You carry the title of Deputy Minister from the day that you are appointed. The public perception is that you are Government Deputy Minister for 24 hours a day. It may be nice to opt out now and then, but that title carries a responsibility and people who hold such a post should honour it and demonstrate that responsibility. When we look back over the past year or so and consider how Peter Black has acted—

**Peter Black:** I am trying to clarify whether Peter, having said that he supported the code, is now trying to rewrite it. He knows that every action I take complies with the terms of that code and that I adhere to the collective responsibility that applies to Deputy Ministers' actions—in my own case, in terms of the local government and housing portfolio. Surely the principle of collective responsibility is that you cannot be bound by a decision unless you play a part in making it. That is the principle in the code.

**Peter Law:** Those who enter into an agreement must accept the liabilities as well as the assets. It is time that the Liberal Democrats realised that, because they want to

Rhyddfrydol, sef fy nghyd-Aelod, Peter Black, y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Lywodraeth Leol, am fod cyfrifoldeb ar y cyd yn effeithio ar bawb yn y Llywodraeth. Mae'n golygu eich bod naill ar un ochr neu'r llall. Efallai fod hynny yn rhy gymhleth i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol—

**David Davies:** A ydych yn ymwybodol bod yr hyn a ddywed y Dirprwy Weinidog am y doll stamp a chanlyniadau'r gyllideb ar hyn o bryd yn wahanol i'r hyn a ddywed y Gweinidog? A yw hyn yn enghraifft o'r hyn y cyfeiriwch ato?

**Peter Law:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i David am roi'r enghraifft honno imi, gan nad oeddwn yn ymwybodol ohoni, ond fe'i hychwanegaf i'r enghreifftiau eraill a nodaf mewn eiliad. Fel y dywedais, efallai ei bod yn rhy anodd i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ddeall hyn, oherwydd, yn ôl eu harfer, maent yn gwneud pethau yn wahanol. Pryd nad yw Dirprwy Weinidog yn Ddirprwy Weinidog? Dyna'r pwynt. Yr wyf yn glynu wrth yr egwyddor eich bod oll yn gyfrifol ar y cyd os ydych yn y Llywodraeth. Yr ydych yn dwyn teitl Dirprwy Weinidog o ddydd eich penodiad. Ym marn y cyhoedd yr ydych yn Ddirprwy Weinidog yn y Llywodraeth 24 awr y dydd. Efallai ei bod yn braf newid ochr bob hyn a hyn, ond mae'r teitl hwnnw yn dwyn cyfrifoldeb a dylai pobl sy'n dal swydd o'r fath ei pharchu a dangos y cyfrifoldeb hwnnw. Os edrychwn yn ôl dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, ac ystyried sut y gweithredodd Peter Black—

**Peter Black:** Yr wyf yn ceisio canfod a yw Peter, ar ôl dweud ei fod yn cefnogi'r cod, yn ceisio ei ailysgrifennu bellach. Gŵyr fod pob cam a gymeraf yn cydymffurfio â thelerau'r cod hwnnw ac y cadwaf at y cyfrifoldeb ar y cyd sy'n berthnasol i weithrediadau Dirprwy Weinidogion—yn fy achos i, portffolio llywodraeth leol a thai. Rhaid mai egwyddor cyfrifoldeb ar y cyd yw na allwch gael eich clymu i benderfyniad oni fyddwch wedi chwarae rhan wrth ei wneud. Dyna'r egwyddor yn y cod.

**Peter Law:** Rhaid i bobl sy'n llunio cytundeb dderbyn y rhwymedigaethau yn ogystal â'r asedau. Mae'n bryd i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol sylweddoli

cherry-pick everything. I hope that I get injury time for your intervention because you wasted half a minute of my time. I remind you of the time when you criticised this Government's approach on foot and mouth disease. We do not have short memories here. I remember it well because my colleague Huw Lewis took the honourable course of action when the situation became difficult and resigned as Deputy Minister. That could not be said of Peter Black, who got away with something for which he should have been sacked at the time. He failed to support the Minister for Health and Social Services recently when he sat on his hands in the Health and Social Services Committee. We did not have his support in that Committee. His colleague, Eleanor Burnham, even boasted on *The People's Assembly* the following night that Jane Hutt was stopped by Peter Black in the Health and Social Services Committee meeting. That is a fact.

**Peter Black:** That is completely untrue. As Peter knows, I fully supported the Minister for Health and Social Services through the NHS structural reform process. I am sure that you will not find any complaints from Jane Hutt about the way that I supported her on that issue.

**Peter Law:** I have made my assertion and others will draw their own conclusions. I do not think that you are on the winning side.

While you are the Deputy Minister, you should not write letters on constituency matters to the press with 'Deputy Minister' written at the bottom. I remind you of that, because a few people remember that you did that in the early days of your appointment. You should have known better.

Those are a few examples of bad practice if you are a Deputy Minister and particularly if you are a Liberal Democrat Deputy Minister. That means, Peter, that you are out of step, that you abuse the responsibility that was given to you and that you betray the First Minister's confidence. You need to be told that publicly. You must get your act together, either by behaving with a collective

hynny, oherwydd ni allant ddewis a dethol drwy'r amser. Gobeithiaf y caf amser ychwanegol ar gyfer eich ymyriad gan ichi wastraffu hanner munud o'm hamser. Fe'ch atgoffaf o'r achlysur pan feirniadasoch ymagwedd y Llywodraeth hon tuag at glwy'r traed a'r genau. Mae gennym gof da yma. Fe gofiaf yr achlysur yn dda am fod fy nghyd-Aelod, Huw Lewis, wedi ymddwyn yn anrhydeddus ar ôl i'r sefyllfa ddod yn anodd drwy ymddiswyddo fel Dirprwy Weinidog. Ni ellid dweud hynny am Peter Black, am na chafodd ei gosbi o gwbl am rywbeth y dylid bod wedi ei ddiswyddo ar y pryd o'r herwydd. Ni chefnogodd ef y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn ddiweddar pan ymataliodd yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Ni chawsom ei gefnogaeth yn y Pwyllgor hwnnw. Bu i'w gyd-Aelod, Eleanor Burnham, hyd yn oed frolio ar *The People's Assembly* y noson ganlynol i Jane Hutt gael ei hatal gan Peter Black yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Mae hynny'n ffaith.

**Peter Black:** Nid yw hynny'n wir o gwbl. Fel y gŵyr Peter, cefnogais y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i'r carn ar y broses o ddiwygio strwythur yr NHS. Yr wyf yn siŵr nad oes cwyn gan Jane Hutt am y ffordd yr wyf wedi ei chefnogi ar y mater hwnnw os gofynnwch iddi.

**Peter Law:** Dyna fy haerid i. Caiff eraill benderfynu drostynt hwy eu hunain. Ni chredaf eich bod ar yr ochr lwyddiannus.

Tra eich bod yn Ddirprwy Weinidog, ni ddylech ysgrifennu llythyrau am faterion etholaethol i'r wasg a chynnwys 'Dirprwy Weinidog' ar y gwaelod. Hoffwn eich atgoffa o hynny, gan fod ychydig o bobl yn cofio ichi wneud hynny yn fuan ar ôl ichi gael eich penodi. Dylech wybod yn well.

Ychydig o enghreifftiau o arfer gwael yw'r rhain os ydych yn Ddirprwy Weinidog ac yn enwedig os ydych yn Ddirprwy Weinidog sy'n Ddemocrat Rhyddfrydol. Mae hynny yn golygu, Peter, nad ydych yn cyd-dynnu, eich bod yn camddefnyddio'r cyfrifoldeb a roddwyd ichi a'ch bod yn bradychu ymddiriedaeth y Prif Weinidog. Mae angen ichi glywed hynny yn gyhoeddus. Mae'n hen

responsibility within the Government, or by commenting freely when you are outside, as I am at present. The Liberal Democrats' approach of facing all ways at the same time is not acceptable when you are in the Government. You need to get that into perspective.

The Ministerial Code is good and we should support it. I hope that some of the points that I have made today will be taken seriously and to heart.

**Geraint Davies:** I enjoyed Peter Law's speech. It is more or less the same as mine. [*Laughter.*] I refer to amendment 2 on the role of Deputy Ministers. I am sure that Peter will vote for that amendment because he agrees with every word of it.

Plaid Cymru believes that the code, as it stands, is not sufficiently clear on the role of Deputy Ministers. We are told that the code applies to Deputy Ministers when they are acting on behalf of a Minister. When exactly is that? When is a Deputy Minister not a Deputy Minister? It is important that Assembly Members, the press and the public are clear as to whether someone is speaking as a Deputy Minister or as an Assembly Member. I will go on to cite examples with regard to Peter Black. During a recent debate on miners' compensation, Peter Black spoke with great authority—as usual—about the funding arrangements of the coalfields regeneration fund. He stated knowledgeably,

'I am therefore pleased that the agreement that has been reached with the coalfields communities campaign is that the investment of the money...will be used to complement Communities First.'

However, was he saying that as Peter Black AM or as Peter Black, Deputy Minister for Local Government? According to the answer given by the Minister, Edwina Hart, to a recent written Assembly question, she had never had discussions with the Coalfields Communities Campaign. The campaign's representatives are also blissfully unaware of

bryd ichi gael siâp ar bethau, naill ai drwy gadw at y cyfrifoldeb ar y cyd yn y Llywodraeth, neu drwy wneud sylwadau yn rhydd pan na fyddwch yn y Llywodraeth, fel minnau ar hyn o bryd. Nid yw'r ffordd y mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn wynebu i bob cyfeiriad ar yr un pryd yn dderbyniol pan ydych yn y Llywodraeth. Mae angen ichi roi hynny yn ei gyd-destun.

Mae Cod y Gweinidogion yn dda a dylem ei gefnogi. Gobeithiaf y caiff rhai o'r pwyntiau a wneuthum heddiw eu hystyried o ddifrif.

**Geraint Davies:** Mwynheais araith Peter Law. Yr un araith sydd gennyf fi fwy neu lai. [*Chwerthin.*] Cyfeiriaf at welliant 2 ar rôl Dirprwy Weinidogion. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Peter yn pleidleisio dros y gwelliant hwnnw am ei fod yn cytuno â phob gair ohono.

Cred Plaid Cymru nad yw'r cod, fel y saif, yn ddigon eglur ynglŷn â rôl Dirprwy Weinidogion. Dywedwyd wrthym fod y cod yn berthnasol i Ddirprwy Weinidogion pan fyddant yn gweithredu ar ran Gweinidog. Pryd yn union yw hynny? Pryd nad yw Dirprwy Weinidog yn Ddirprwy Weinidog? Mae'n bwysig bod Aelodau'r Cynulliad, y wasg a'r cyhoedd yn glir ai fel Dirprwy Weinidog ynteu Aelod Cynulliad y bydd rhywun yn siarad. Af ymlaen i ddyfynnu enghreifftiau sy'n ymwneud â Peter Black. Yn ystod dadl ddiweddar ar iawndal i gyn-lowyr, siaradodd Peter Black yn awdurdodol iawn—yn ôl ei arfer—ynglŷn â'r trefniadau ar gyfer ariannu cronfa adfywio'r meysydd glo. Dywedodd yn ddeallus,

'Felly mae'n dda gennyf mai'r cytundeb y daethpwyd iddo gydag ymgyrch adfywio'r meysydd glo yw y caiff yr arian...ei ddefnyddio i ategu Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf.'

Fodd bynnag, ai fel Peter Black AC ynteu Peter Black, Dirprwy Weinidog dros Lywodraeth Leol yr oedd yn dweud hynny? Yn ôl ateb y Gweinidog, Edwina Hart, i un o gwestiynau ysgrifenedig y Cynulliad yn ddiweddar, ni fu hi erioed mewn trafodaethau gydag Ymgyrch Cymunedau'r Meysydd Glo. Nid yw cynrychiolwyr yr ymgyrch yn



any agreement. Therefore, perhaps the Minister or her deputy could enlighten us on how and when that alleged agreement took place.

**Peter Black:** Will you give way?

**Geraint Davies:** I will if you can give an explanation. I am nearly finished. Has the Deputy Minister been engaging in discussions without the Minister's authorisation?

**Peter Black:** I was responding to the debate in my capacity as a Liberal Democrat spokesperson. What I said was echoed by the note that the Minister subsequently issued to the Local Government and Housing Committee. Therefore, what I said was not out of line with what the Minister said on that issue.

5:10 p.m.

**Geraint Davies:** Are you saying that the Minister misled the Assembly?

**Edwina Hart:** Will you give way?

**Geraint Davies:** Yes.

**Edwina Hart:** The confusion arises from two different names. The Coalfields Regeneration Trust is the organisation that the Assembly has supported, with which we will hopefully reach an agreement in terms of money. The other is a much looser organisation than the Coalfields Regeneration Trust. However, the subject of my discussions has been the trust. That will be clarified in any note prepared for the Local Government and Housing Committee.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. If a Member is accused of misleading the Assembly, it should be noted that it was unintentional. I am sure that Members would wish to explain themselves if they have inadvertently misled the Assembly.

**Geraint Davies:** This confusion is also reflected in Committee business. Recently, the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities felt it necessary to clarify

ymwybodol ychwaith o unrhyw gytundeb. Felly, efallai yr hoffai'r Gweinidog neu ei dirprwy roi gwybod inni sut a phryd y daethpwyd i'r cytundeb honedig hwn.

**Peter Black:** A ildiwch?

**Geraint Davies:** Gwnaf os gallwch roi eglurhad imi. Yr wyf bron â gorffen. A yw'r Dirprwy Weinidog wedi bod mewn trafodaethau heb awdurdodaeth y Gweinidog?

**Peter Black:** Yr oeddwn yn ymateb i'r ddadl yn rhinwedd fy swydd fel llefarydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Ategwyd yr hyn a ddywedais yn y nodyn a anfonodd y Gweinidog at y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai wedi hynny. Felly, nid oedd yr hyn a ddywedais yn anghyson â'r hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog ar y mater hwnnw.

**Geraint Davies:** A ydych yn dweud bod y Gweinidog wedi camarwain y Cynulliad?

**Edwina Hart:** A ildiwch?

**Geraint Davies:** Gwnaf.

**Edwina Hart:** Cyfyd y dryswch oherwydd y ddau enw gwahanol. Ymddiriedolaeth Adfywio'r Meysydd Glo yw'r sefydliad a gefnogwyd gan y Cynulliad, sefydliad yr ydym yn gobeithio dod i gytundeb ag ef o ran ariannu. Mae'r sefydliad arall yn un llawer mwy llac nag Ymddiriedolaeth Adfywio'r Meysydd Glo. Fodd bynnag, gyda'r ymddiriedolaeth y bûm i mewn trafodaethau. Caiff hynny ei egluro mewn unrhyw nodyn a baratoir ar gyfer y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Os caiff Aelod ei gyhuddo o gamarwain y Cynulliad, dylid nodi mai anfwriadol ydoedd. Yr wyf yn siŵr yr hoffai'r Aelodau egluro os ydynt wedi camarwain y Cynulliad yn anfwriadol.

**Geraint Davies:** Ceir yr un dryswch hefyd ym musnes y Pwyllgor. Yn ddiweddar, teimlai'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau fod angen

that she alone, and not her deputy, was responsible for speaking on behalf of the administration in the Local Government and Housing Committee. Perhaps she was aware of the problem of singing from different hymnbooks.

So that I am not accused of a personal vendetta against Peter Black, I will refer to an example that involves Alun Pugh, the Deputy Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning. When people read his comments calling for more powers for the Assembly, how were they to know that he was not speaking in his capacity as Deputy Minister and therefore representing the administration's opinion? How are people outside the Assembly supposed to make a distinction? Comments by Deputy Ministers inside and outside the Chamber have created, and will continue to create, confusion. Clear and unambiguous guidance on their role is vital. Therefore I urge Members to support amendment 2, which I am sure Peter Law will do.

**Christine Gwyther:** We have spent long enough talking about Deputy Ministers. I will refer to the First Minister, but not to support Jocelyn Davies's comments. However, I noticed a smile playing on her lips when she reminded us that Rhodri Glyn Thomas is intellectually challenged. I would not argue with her on that.

I will concentrate on the language used in the code. I know that we are not supposed to comment on the document itself. However, I remind the First Minister that when the code refers to his post, it does so in gender-specific language. That sends out a negative message. It could suggest that we cannot conceive of a woman being First Minister, or that if Rhodri falls off the twig or retires, the code will go with him. Even though we cannot amend the document, I respectfully ask the Cabinet to look again at the language used.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** To clarify, Members can comment on the document but they cannot make amendments to the code. They may also vote against the motion to approve the code, as I think you just suggested.

iddi egluro mai hi, ac nid ei dirprwy, oedd yn gyfrifol am siarad ar ran y weinyddiaeth yn y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai. Efallai ei bod yn ymwybodol o'r broblem o beidio â bod yn gyson.

Fel na'm cyhuddir o ymosod yn bersonol ar Peter Black, cyfeiriai at enghraifft sy'n ymwneud ag Alun Pugh, y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Pan fydd pobl yn darllen ei sylwadau sy'n galw am fwy o bwerau i'r Cynulliad, sut y gwyddant nad yn rhinwedd ei swydd fel Dirprwy Weinidog yr oedd yn siarad ac felly yn cynrychioli barn y weinyddiaeth? Sut y mae pobl y tu allan i'r Cynulliad i wahaniaethu? Mae sylwadau Dirprwy Weinidogion yn y Siambr a'r tu allan iddi wedi creu dryswch a bydd yn parhau i wneud hynny. Mae canllawiau clir a phendant ar eu rôl yn hollbwysig. Felly, apeliai ar yr Aelodau i gefnogi gwelliant 2, fel y gwna Peter Law, mae'n siŵr.

**Christine Gwyther:** Yr ydym wedi treulio hen ddigon o amser yn siarad am Ddirprwy Weinidogion. Cyfeiriai at y Prif Weinidog, ond nid er mwyn cefnogi sylwadau Jocelyn Davies. Fodd bynnag, sylwais ei bod yn cilwenu pan wnaeth ein hatgoffa bod Rhodri Glyn Thomas yn dwp. Ni fyddwn yn dadlau â hi o ran hynny.

Canolbwyntiai ar yr ieithwedd a ddefnyddir yn y cod. Gwn na ddylem wneud sylwadau ar y ddogfen ei hun. Fodd bynnag, atgoffaf y Prif Weinidog fod y cod, wrth gyfeirio at ei swydd ef, yn gwneud hynny mewn ieithwedd sy'n benodol i ryw. Rhydd hynny neges negyddol. Gellid awgrymu na allwn feddwl am fenyw yn Brif Weinidog, neu pe bai Rhodri yn trengi neu'n ymddeol, â'r cod gydag ef. Er na allwn ddiwygio'r ddogfen, gofynnaf gyda phob parch i'r Cabinet ailystyried yr ieithwedd a ddefnyddir.

**Y Dirprwy Llywydd:** Er eglurdeb, gall yr Aelodau wneud sylwadau ar y ddogfen ond ni allant ddiwygio'r cod. Gallant hefyd bleidleisio yn erbyn y cynnig i gymeradwyo'r cod, fel yr ydych newydd awgrymu, fe gredaf.

**Christine Gwyther:** I did not do that.

**Christine Gwyther:** Ni wneuthum hynny.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** You did not. I am sorry.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Ni wnaethoch. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf.

**Pauline Jarman:** I have with me a document that shows that disillusionment with Ministers' conduct is not confined to this Chamber. A paragraph forming part of a recently agreed protocol between Labour in Wales and tiers of government in Wales and beyond states that

**Pauline Jarman:** Mae gennyf ddogfen yn fy llaw sy'n dangos nad dim ond yn y Siambr hon y ceir dadrithiad ynglŷn ag ymddygiad Gweinidogion. Noda paragraff sy'n rhan o brotocol y cytunwyd arno yn ddiweddar rhwng Llafur yng Nghymru a haenau llywodraeth yng Nghymru a thu hwnt:

'Liaison needs to be on a politician-to-politician basis. This is a cardinal principle that will avoid the debacle of the recent incident when Ministers were writing directly to Council Chief Executives on sensitive matters.'

The document goes on to state

Â'r ddogfen yn ei blaen

'It is a fundamental principle of developing good working relationships that Labour representatives should not publicly criticise other Labour representatives.'

I make these points because the public is gravely concerned that the conduct of Labour Ministers in this administration not only affects the Assembly's performance but goes beyond this Chamber and affects the performance of local government and Westminster. There is real concern. It is imperative that we have a Member-officer protocol as well as a tightly worded protocol for Ministers. Conduct towards some Members has been appalling. I hope that I never again witness personal criticism of individuals based on their stature or the type of good, honest work that they used to undertake before they became Assembly Members.

Gwnaf y pwyntiau hyn am fod y cyhoedd yn pryderu'n fawr ynglŷn â'r ffaith fod ymddygiad Gweinidogion Llafur yn y weinyddiaeth hon nid yn unig yn effeithio ar berfformiad y Cynulliad ond yn mynd y tu hwnt i'r Siambr hon, ac yn effeithio ar berfformiad llywodraeth leol a San Steffan. Mae pryder gwirioneddol. Mae'n hanfodol inni gael protocol rhwng Aelodau a Swyddogion yn ogystal â'r protocol wedi'i eirio'n ofalus ar gyfer Gweinidogion. Bu'r ymddygiad tuag at rai Aelodau yn warthus. Gobeithiaf na welaf fyth eto y feirniadaeth bersonol o unigolion oherwydd eu taldra neu'r math o waith gonest, da a wnaethant cyn iddynt ddod yn Aelodau Cynulliad.

**Eleanor Burnham:** The Liberal Democrats welcome the adoption of this code, which is more robust and detailed than that it replaces. The Assembly can already pride itself on its level of openness and transparency. It can now also pride itself on the enhanced propriety with which Ministers seek to conduct themselves to pursue their duties. We can rightly champion the standards to which the Welsh Assembly Government seeks to adhere. The code is rigid and detailed to ensure that ambiguity is minimised as much as possible. That is welcome. It is vital for the good of the Assembly that Ministers can clearly

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn croesawu mabwysiadu'r cod hwn, sy'n fwy cadarn a manwl na'r cod y mae'n ei ddisodli. Gall y Cynulliad ymfalchïo yn ei natur agored a thryloyw eisoes. Erbyn hyn gall ymfalchïo hefyd yn y ffaith bod Gweinidogion yn ceisio ymddwyn hyd yn oed yn fwy cywir wrth ymgymryd â'u dyletswyddau. Mae'n briodol inni gefnogi'r safonau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ceisio cadw atynt. Mae'r cod yn un llym a manwl er mwyn sicrhau bod cyn lleied o amwysedd â phosibl. Rhaid croesawu hynny. Mae'n hanfodol er budd y Cynulliad bod y Gweinidog yn gallu dangos yn glir i bobl

demonstrate to the people of Wales that this is the way in which they conduct their public duties at all time. This code will play a major role in achieving that and we should support it. Plaid Cymru's amendments demonstrate its ineffectiveness as an opposition. Whether or not its amendments are carried will make no difference to the Assembly policy. The amendments, like so much of what Plaid Cymru proposes, represent a wasted opportunity, and will make no difference to the people of Wales.

**The First Minister:** Jocelyn's contribution was about knock-about in the Chamber. As far as I can see—having read through the document as quickly as I could—that is not dealt with in the Ministerial Code. The purpose of the Ministerial Code is to cover Nolan type issues, such as conflicts of interest, the relationship between Ministers and civil servants, visits abroad and to constituencies, and notice periods. It is not meant to cover the subject of order in this Chamber. However, as the subject has been raised, I will comment on it. It is notable, for the purposes of our relationship with the people of Wales, that we have a superb record in the terms of the number of Assembly Members who are women, probably even more so in terms of the women in the Cabinet. It is probably remarkable throughout the world that we have the highest proportion of women Members ain the world and a majority of women in the Cabinet. That should allow us to get away from traditional Westminster-style macho knock-about. However, it would not be right to say that you could get rid of it all together, or that Ministers would not respond if they were attacked in such a way.

It appears that Members feel that I have attacked them discriminatorily, with reference to their size, or height or previous occupation. I do not remember doing so but I apologise to them and to the Chamber if I did so. If people believe that I have done that, I am happy to try to abide by the kind of standards displayed during First Minister's questions today, when we managed to act in a way that respected everybody's views. I do not believe that I ever start this kind of behaviour, but I may have fallen into the trap due to my previous 14 years in the

Cymru mai yn y modd hwn y byddant yn ymgymryd â'u dyletswyddau cyhoeddus bob amser. Bydd gan y cod hwn ran i'w chwarae wrth gyflawni hynny a dylem ei gefnogi. Dengys gwelliannau Plaid Cymru pa mor aneffeithiol ydyw fel gwrthblaid. Ni fydd yn gwneud gwahaniaeth o gwbl i bolisi'r Cynulliad pa un ai llwyddo y bydd ei gwelliannau ai peidio. Mae'r gwelliannau, fel cymaint a gynigir gan Blaid Cymru, yn gyfle coll, ac ni fydd yn gwneud gwahaniaeth o gwbl i bobl Cymru.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr oedd cyfraniad Jocelyn yn ymdrin a thrafodaeth dymhestlog yn y Siambr. Hyd y gwelaf fi—ar ôl darllen drwy'r ddogfen mor gyflym â phosibl—nid ymdrinnir â hynny yng Nghod y Gweinidogion. Diben Cod y Gweinidogion yw cwmpasu'r math o faterion a godwyd gan Nolan, megis gwrthdaro buddiannau, y berthynas rhwng Gweinidogion a gweision sifil, ymweliadau dramor ac ymweliadau ag etholaethau a rhoi rhybudd. Nid pwrpas y Cod yw cwmpasu materion sy'n ymwneud â threfn yn y Siambr hon. Fodd bynnag, am fod y pwnc wedi ei godi, gwnaf sylwadau arno. Dylid nodi, o ran ein perthynas â phobl Cymru, fod gennym record wych o ran nifer yr Aelodau Cynulliad sy'n fenywod, a record well byth o ran nifer y menywod yn y Cabinet. Mae'n syfrdanol drwy'r byd mai yn y Cynulliad hwn y mae'r gyfran uchaf yn y byd o Aelodau sy'n fenywod a mwyaftrif o fenywod yn y Cabinet. Dylai hynny fod yn fodd inni gefnu ar yr ymddygiad ymosodol, *macho* a arferir yn San Steffan. Fodd bynnag, ni ellir dweud y gellid cael gwared ohono yn gyfan gwbl, neu na fyddai Gweinidogion yn ymateb pe bai rhywun yn ymosod arnynt yn y fath fodd.

Ymddengys fod yr Aelodau yn teimlo fy mod wedi ymosod arnynt mewn ffordd gamwahaniaethol, drwy gyfeirio at eu maint, eu taldra neu eu cyn-alwedigaeth. Ni chofiaf wneud hynny ond ymddiheuraf iddynt ac i'r Siambr os gwneuthum hynny. Os cred pobl fy mod wedi gwneud hynny, yr wyf yn fwy na pharod i gadw at y safonau a welwyd yn ystod cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog heddiw, pan lwyddwyd i ymddwyn mewn ffordd a ddangosodd barch i safbwyntiau pawb. Ni chredaf imi ddechrau ymddygiad o'r fath, ond efallai fy mod wedi cwmpo i'r fagl ar ôl

Westminster bear pit. Let us try to set a good example and act like we did earlier today. However, that is not what this code of conduct is about. Any obligation to try to be gentle in the way that we treat each other, despite genuine, deeply held political differences, must involve the Cabinet and all other Members including those from the Labour Party. Ministers cannot act alone. There was a fair bit of knock-about in relation to Peter Black earlier. It is not a one-way street—if other parties do it, then Members on the ministerial side will be inclined to respond.

5:20 p.m.

On the question of language, I have been trying to read through the document hurriedly to look for examples of what Christine mentioned earlier. I could not find any, but I do not doubt that they exist. As I understand it, referring to 'the First Minister' as 'he' is in line with the practice followed in all ministerial codes of conduct. For example, in Westminster, the Secretary of State for Trade and Industry will be referred to in documents as 'she' while Patricia Hewitt holds that post. The same would apply to documents—although I cannot think of any off-hand—concerning any of the five Assembly Cabinet Ministers who are female. There is no implication that the office of First Minister is meant to be a 'he' for all time. If the First Minister is a man when the code is written, it is easier to make subsequent references to 'he' than to 'the First Minister'. That is all. I will look into ways of making the document gender-neutral next time it is published. However, it follows a standard pattern for the Scottish Executive and the Westminster Government codes of conduct. Those are the main points that I want to cover.

With this code of conduct, we are accountable, via the Assembly and the public, to the Welsh body politic, and we must be clear on how we comply with the best principles of integrity in public life. In the two and a half years since the first code was introduced, we have moved towards creating a democratic Welsh polity. Lessons have

been learned. y 14 mlynedd imi dreulio ar dalwrn San Steffan. Gadewch inni geisio gosod esiampl dda ac ymddwyn fel y gwnaethom yn gynharach heddiw. Fodd bynnag, nid dyna ddiben y cod ymddygiad hwn. Rhaid i unrhyw ddyletswydd i geisio bod yn hynaws yn ein hymwneud â'n gilydd, er gwaethaf gwahaniaethau gwleidyddol diffuant a dwfn iawn, gynnwys y Cabinet a'r holl Aelodau gan gynnwys Aelodau'r Blaid Lafur. Ni all Gweinidogion weithredu ar eu pen eu hunain. Bu cryn ymosod ar Peter Black yn gynharach. Nid rhywbeth unffordd ydyw—os bydd y pleidiau eraill yn gwneud hynny, yna bydd Aelodau'r Llywodraeth yn tueddu i ymateb.

O ran ieithwedd, ceisiais ddarllen drwy'r ddogfen yn gyflym i chwilio am enghreifftiau o'r hyn a grybwyllodd Christine yn gynharach. Ni allwn ddod o hyd i'r un enghraifft, ond nid amheuf eu bod yn bodoli. Fel y'i deallaf, mae cyfeirio at 'Prif Weinidog' fel 'ef' yn unol â'r arfer ym mhob un o godau ymddygiad gweinidogion. Er enghraifft, yn San Steffan, cyfeirir at yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Fasnach a Diwydiant mewn dogfennau fel 'hi' tra bod Patricia Hewitt yn y swydd honno. Byddai'r un peth yn wir am ddogfennau—er na allaf feddwl am rai ar hyn o bryd—sy'n ymwneud ag unrhyw un o'r pum Gweinidog yng Nghabinet y Cynulliad sy'n ferched. Nid oes unrhyw awgrym mai 'ef' bob amser fydd yr un a ddeil swydd y Prif Weinidog. Os mai dyn yw'r Prif Weinidog ar adeg llunio'r cod, mae'n haws cyfeirio ato fel 'ef' yn hytrach na'r 'Prif Weinidog' bob tro. Dyna i gyd. Ystyriaf ffyrdd o sicrhau bod y ddogfen yn ddiuedd o ran rhyw y tro nesaf y caiff ei chyhoeddi. Fodd bynnag, mae'n dilyn patrwm safonol codau ymddygiad yng Ngweithrediaeth yr Alban a San Steffan. Dyna'r prif bwyntiau yr hoffwn eu gwneud.

Drwy'r cod ymddygiad hwn, yr ydym yn atebol, drwy'r Cynulliad a'r cyhoedd, i gorff gwleidyddol Cymru, a rhaid inni fod yn glir ynglŷn â'r ffordd yr ydym yn cydymffurfio â'r egwyddorion gorau o ran cywirdeb mewn bywyd cyhoeddus. Yn y ddwy flynedd a hanner ers i'r cod cyntaf gael ei gyflwyno, yr ydym wedi symud tuag at greu

been learned on how we have conducted ourselves. Some of those lessons regarding Government and Cabinet titles and so forth, were mentioned earlier. This is the result of the past two years' experience, as is the revision of the Ministerial Code. However, the code is not about the standard of debate, or the elimination or encouragement of knock-about between Members. That must be covered in a different way, which is why we continue to maintain the irrelevance of the amendments proposed by Jocelyn Davies—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Will you give way to Rhodri Glyn Thomas?

**The First Minister:** As it is Christmas, I will.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Nid yw'n Nadolig eto, mae'n gyfnod yr Adfent, sef amser i baratoi ar gyfer y Nadolig.

Bu ichi sôn am wersi a ddysgwyd dros y ddwy flynedd a hanner diwethaf o ran teitlau. Mae'n siŵr eich bod yn cyfeirio at y teitl 'Welsh Assembly Government' a grëwyd o ganlyniad i argymhellion grwpiau ffocws, a'r buddsoddiad o £7,000—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. This is supposed to be an intervention, not a speech.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I will ask a question. Will you, Rhodri, divulge the discussions of those focus groups, because the impression given was that they agreed, and indeed wished, to refer to the Government as the 'Welsh Assembly Government'? Is it not true that those focus groups said that 'the National Assembly for Wales' and 'the Government of Wales' were far more appropriate titles?

**The First Minister:** This is not relevant to the Ministerial Code. I felt particularly Christmassy and allowed you to intervene on the basis that you might feel particularly bright and alert and try to relate your intervention to the subject under discussion. I am disappointed and sorry that you made no

ffurflywodraeth ddemocrataidd Gymreig. Dysgwyd y gwersi o'r ffordd yr ydym wedi ymddwyn. Cyfeiriwyd at rai o'r gwersi hynny o ran teitlau'r Llywodraeth a'r Cabinet ac ati, yn gynharach. Mae hyn yn ffrwyth profiad y ddwy flynedd diwethaf, fel y mae'r Cod diwygiedig i'r Gweinidogion. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r cod yn ymwneud â safon dadleuon, nac â dileu nac annog trafodaeth gyhyrog rhwng Aelodau. Rhaid trafod hynny mewn ffordd wahanol, a dyna'r rheswm pam ein bod yn parhau i ddweud bod y gwelliannau a gynigir gan Jocelyn Davies yn amherthnasol—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. A wnewch chi ildio i Rhodri Glyn Thomas?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Gan ei bod yn dymor y Nadolig, gwnaf.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** It is not Christmas yet; it is the Advent period, which is a time to prepare for Christmas.

You mentioned lessons learned over the past two and a half years in terms of titles. You are surely referring to the title of 'Welsh Assembly Government', which was created as a result of focus groups' recommendations, and the investment of £7,000—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Ymyrryd ddylech ei wneud, nid rhoi araith.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Gofynnaf gwestiwn. A wnewch chi, Rhodri, ddatgelu trafodaethau'r grwpiau ffocws hynny, oherwydd crewyd yr argraff eu bod wedi cytuno, ac yn wir, yn dymuno cyfeirio at y Llywodraeth fel 'Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'? Onid yw'n wir i'r grwpiau ffocws hynny ddweud bod 'Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru' a 'Llywodraeth Cymru' yn deitlau llawer mwy priodol?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid yw hyn yn berthnasol i God y Gweinidogion. Yr oeddwn mewn hwyliau arbennig o Nadoligaidd gan ganiatáu ichi ymyrryd ar yr amod y byddech yn teimlo'n arbennig o fywiog ac effro ac am geisio gwneud ymyriad a oedd yn berthnasol i'r pwnc dan sylw. Yr wyf yn siomedig ac yn

attempt to do that.

gresynu at y ffaith ichi beidio â gwneud unrhyw ymgais i wneud hynny.

My point was that in the two and a half years in which we have had experience of the Assembly, Plenary, ministerial conduct and so forth, we have proposed a second code of conduct. We made changes to the first code on the basis of that experience. Rhodri Glyn Thomas's intervention was not a clever way of trying to raise a point about titles.

Fy mhwynt i oedd yn y ddwy flynedd a hanner o brofiad y Cynulliad, Cyfarfodydd Llawn, ymddygiad Gweinidogol ac ati, ein bod wedi cynnig ail god ymddygiad. Newidiwyd y cod cyntaf gennym yn dilyn y profiad hwnnw. Nid oedd ymyriad Rhodri Glyn Thomas yn ffordd glyfar o geisio codi pwynt ynglŷn â theitlau.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 13, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 1: For 13, Abstain 1, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Graham, William  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Richards, Rod  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelod canlynol:  
The following Member abstained:

Melding, David

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 13, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 2: For 13, Abstain 1, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Cairns, Alun  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Graham, William  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Richards, Rod  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Ron  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelod canlynol:  
 The following Member abstained:

Melding, David

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 13, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 29.  
 Amendment 3: For 13, Abstain 1, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Cairns, Alun  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Graham, William  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Richards, Rod  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Black, Peter  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Ron  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter



Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelod canlynol:  
The following Member abstained:

Melding, David

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 40, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 3.*  
*Motion: For 40, Abstain 1, Against 3.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Cairns, Alun  
Graham, William  
Richards, Rod

Ymataliodd yr Aelod canlynol:  
The following Member abstained:

Melding, David

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings today's proceedings to a close. **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.26 p.m.  
The session ended at 5.26 p.m.*