



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mawrth 10 Gorffennaf 2001**

**Tuesday 10 July 2001**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 3 Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru  
*Questions to the First Minister*
- 24 Datganiad ar yr Wybodaeth Ddiweddaraf am yr Adroddiad Grant Arbennig ar  
Daliadau i Fusnesau wedi Argyfwng Clwy'r Traed a'r Genau  
*Statement on the Special Grant Report Update on Payment to Business Following the  
Foot and Mouth Disease Crisis*
- 29 Datganiad Busnes  
*Business Statement*
- 30 Pwynt o Drefn  
*Point of Order*
- 37 Cymeradwyo'r Rheoliadau Cymorthdaliadau Amaethyddol (Apelau) (Cymru) 2001  
*Approval of the Agricultural Subsidies (Appeals) (Wales) Regulations 2001*
- 46 Pwynt o Drefn  
*Point of Order*
- 47 Cymeradwyo'r Rheoliadau Premiwm Arbennig Eidion 2001  
*Approval of the Beef Special Premium Regulations 2001*
- 48 Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Safonau Gofal 2000 (Cychwyn Rhif 6) (Cymru)  
2001  
*Approval of the Care Standards Act 2000 (Commencement No. 6) (Wales) Order  
2001*
- 55 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cymhellion Hyfforddi Athrawon (Addysg Bellach)  
(Cymru) 2001  
*Approval of the Teacher Training Incentive (Further Education) (Wales) Regulations  
2001*
- 60 Lleihau Biwrocratiaeth mewn Ysgolion  
*Reducing Bureaucracy in Schools*
- 89 Cymeradwyo Adroddiad Grant Arbennig Rhif 14  
*Approval of the Special Grant Report No. 14*
- 91 Yr Adroddiad ar Gyflenwi Lleoedd mewn Ysgolion  
*The Report on Supply of School Places*

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were  
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been  
included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## **Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru Questions to the First Minister**

### **Dathlu Pen-blwydd Cyntaf y Glymblaid Celebrating the First Anniversary of the Coalition**

**Q1 William Graham:** Will the First Minister make a statement concerning any proposals that he has to celebrate the first anniversary of the Liberal Democrat-Labour coalition at the National Assembly for Wales? (OAQ12455)

Good afternoon, First Minister. You have been having some local difficulty recently.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I would be grateful if Members kept to their questions, and then asked supplementaries.

**William Graham:** I stand reproved.

**The First Minister:** Although we have no plans for a celebration, perhaps we will mark the event by giving a progress report on our achievements on the ground, as we did after six months of the coalition's existence.

**William Graham:** To signal the momentous failure of your policies, would it not be wiser for you to resign and submit your candidature to your party in the Assembly and in Wales generally?

**The First Minister:** Given how the original question was framed, I thought that you were being terribly solicitous about our partnership Government. However, someone has clearly persuaded you to adopt a split personality and to show a side of your character that we have not yet seen. If ever there was a better illustration of Harold Macmillan's famous dictum, 'events, dear boy, events', we could not improve on last week. Turbulence is part of politics, as are events such as those that occurred last week, and people's perceptions of them. It is time to draw a veil over those events and move on

**C1 William Graham:** A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ynghylch unrhyw gynigion sydd ganddo i ddathlu pen-blwydd cyntaf y glymblaid rhwng y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a'r Blaid Lafur yng Nghynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru? (OAQ12455)

Prynhawn da, Brif Weinidog. Cawsoch ychydig o drafferthion lleol yn ddiweddar.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe bai Aelodau yn cadw at eu cwestiynau, ac yna'n gofyn cwestiynau atodol.

**William Graham:** Derbyniais y cerydd.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Er nad ydym yn bwriadu dathlu, efallai y nodwn yr achlysur drwy gyflwyno adroddiad o gynnydd ar ein cyflawniadau ar lawr gwlad, fel y gwnaethom ar ôl chwe mis o fodolaeth y glymblaid.

**William Graham:** I nodi methiant nodedig eich polisïau, oni fyddai'n ddoethach ichi ymddiswyddo a chyflwyno eich ymgeisyddiaeth i'ch plaid yn y Cynulliad ac yng Nghymru'n gyffredinol?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Wrth ystyried sut y cyflwynwyd y cwestiwn gwreiddiol, tybiais eich bod yn bod yn ofalus iawn o'n Llywodraeth bartneriaeth. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg fod rhywun wedi eich perswadio i fabwysiadu personoliaeth ddeublyg a dangos agwedd ar eich cymeriad na welwyd gennym hyd yma. Pe bai erioed well esiampl o ddywediad adnabyddus Harold Macmillan, '*events, dear boy, events*', ni allem wella ar yr wythnos diwethaf. Mae tymhestloedd yn rhan o wleidyddiaeth, yn yr un modd â digwyddiadau fel y rhai a ddigwyddodd yr

with progress on the ground. That is what the people of Wales are interested in, as I found in a question and answer session during last Friday's meeting of the North Wales Regional Committee and during a similar session on Radio Wales on Thursday.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Gan mai ers llai na blwyddyn yn unig y mae'r glymblaid yn bodoli, sut y gallwch honni bod sefydlogrwydd o fewn Llywodraeth Cymru bellach? Onid y gwir ydyw mai'r unig beth a wnaethoch yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf yw dyrchafu dau Aelod o'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol i'r Cabinet a diswyddo dau Aelod o'ch plaid eich hun i wneud lle iddynt? Byddai bron bob un ohonom wedi cytuno ar y mesurau a gyflwynwyd gennych beth bynnag. O ystyried hynny, beth yn union y mae eich Llywodraeth wedi'i gyflawni yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf? Oni fu'r flwyddyn ddiwethaf yn siom ac yn hynod o ddi-fflach?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ni dderbyniaf air o ddisgrifiad Ieuan o ddigwyddiadau'r naw mis diwethaf yn dilyn sefydlu'r glymblaid. Yr ydym wedi cyflwyno rhestr di-rif o fesurau sydd o ddiddordeb i bobl Cymru, lle bynnag y byddant yn byw, fel y dywedais wrth ateb cwestiwn atodol William. Nid oedd unrhyw un yn gwneud honiadau fel hyn pan atebais tua 20 o gwestiynau yng nghyfarfod Pwyllgor Rhanbarth y Gogledd. Fe glywodd Ieuan y rhan fwyaf o'r cwestiynau hynny. Nid oes gan unrhyw un ym mhentrefi a chymoedd Cymru ddiddordeb mewn clywed honiadau o'r fath yn hedfan yn ôl ac ymlaen fel pêl tenis yn Wimbledon. Nid ydynt am ein gweld ni yn y Bae yn chwarae gemau ac yn hollti blew, fel yr ydych chi yn ei wneud drwy ofyn y math hwn o gwestiwn. Nid oes gan bobl Cymru ddiddordeb yn hynny.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Atebwch y cwestiwn. Beth yr ydych wedi ei gynnig yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf na fydddech wedi ei gynnig nac wedi ei gael drwy'r Cynulliad oni bai am y glymblaid? Beth yr ydych wedi ei gyflawni drwy'r glymblaid? Mae hwnnw'n

wythnos diwethaf, a chanfyddiadau pobl ohonynt. Mae'n bryd tynnu'r llen ar y digwyddiadau hynny a pharhau â'r datblygiadau ar lawr gwlad. Dyna sydd o ddiddordeb i bobl Cymru, fel y canfyddais mewn sesiwn cwestiwn ac ateb yn ystod cyfarfod dydd Gwener diwethaf o Bwyllgor Rhanbarth Gogledd Cymru ac yn ystod sesiwn tebyg ar Radio Wales ddydd Iau.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** As the coalition is not yet a year old, how can you claim that there is now stability within the Government of Wales? Is it not true that all that has happened during the last year is that you have promoted two Liberal Democrat Members to the Cabinet and sacked two Members of your own party to accommodate them? The vast majority of us would have agreed on the measures that you have introduced anyway. In view of that, what exactly has your Government achieved over the past year? Has the last year not been disappointing and exceptionally uninspiring?

**The First Minister:** I do not accept a single word of Ieuan's description of the events of the nine months following the establishment of the coalition. We have introduced a long list of measures that are of interest to the people of Wales, wherever they live, as I said in response to William's supplementary. No one was making such allegations when I answered about 20 questions at the North Wales Regional Committee. Ieuan heard most of those questions. No-one in the villages and valleys of Wales is interested in hearing such allegations flying back and fore like a tennis ball at Wimbledon. They do not want to look to Cardiff Bay and find us playing games and nit-picking, as you are doing by asking this kind of question. The people of Wales are not interested in that.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Answer the question. What have you proposed in the last year that you would not have proposed and would not have got through the Assembly if it were not for the coalition? What have you achieved as a result of the coalition? That is a fair

gwestiwn teg.

Byddai grŵp Plaid Cymru yn falch o bleidleisio dros nifer o'ch cynigion, fel y gwnaethom yn y gorffennol. Felly, y cwestiwn sylfaenol yw pa arweiniad newydd yr ydych wedi ei roi i'r Cynulliad? Onid yw'n wir mai'r hyn y bydd pobl Cymru yn ei gofio am flwyddyn gyntaf y glymblaid yw, nid y ffaith na wnaethoch unrhyw beth radical o safbwynt polisi, ond eich bod wedi cerdded allan o'r Siambr pan oedd ar y Cynulliad eich angen i ateb cwestiynau yr wythnos diwethaf?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Os oedd angen enghraifft o hollti blew, fe'i cafwyd ym mrawddeg olaf Ieuan.

Atgoffaf Ieuan o'r cyfnod yn arwain at ffurfio'r glymblaid flwyddyn yn ôl, pan benderfynodd Dafydd Wigley, yn ddealladwy, ymddiswyddo fel arweinydd Plaid Cymru am resymau meddygol. Safiad Ieuan Wyn Jones oedd y byddai'n llawer mwy ymosodol tuag at y Blaid Lafur ac y byddai'n creu pellter rhyngddo'i hun ac arweinyddiaeth y Blaid Lafur.

Yn awr, fodd bynnag, dywed y byddai Aelodau Plaid Cymru wedi cytuno i roi llaeth ysgol am ddim i blant dan saith oed a gwario £300 miliwn ar adnewyddu adeiladau ysgolion. Yr oeddent am gael pellter, ond dywedant yn awr y byddent wedi cefnogi'r holl fesurau poblogaidd.

Yn anffodus, Ieuan, penderfynasoch ar eich safiad, gan ddweud y byddai mwy o bellter rhwng Plaid Cymru a'r Blaid Lafur dan eich arweiniad chi nag a fu yng nghyfnod Dafydd Wigley.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** Since the Deputy First Minister's departure last week, the administration looks less like Hamlet without the prince than Aladdin without Widow Twankey. Will the First Minister tell us why the post of Deputy First Minister is of constitutional importance and why it is vital for the future of Wales? Is it not just there to feed the vanity of the Liberal Democrats? If

question.

The Plaid Cymru group would have been happy to vote in favour of many of your proposals, as we have done in the past. Therefore, the fundamental question is what new leadership have you given the Assembly? Is it not true that what the people of Wales will remember about the coalition's first year is, not the fact that you did not do anything radical in terms of policy, but that you walked out of the Chamber when the Assembly required you to answer questions last week?

**The First Minister:** If we needed an example of nit-picking, we had one in Ieuan's last sentence.

I remind Ieuan of the period leading up to the establishment of the coalition a year ago, when Dafydd Wigley understandably decided to stand down as leader of Plaid Cymru for medical reasons. Ieuan Wyn Jones's stance was that he would be much more aggressive towards the Labour Party and that he would distance himself from the leadership of the Labour Party.

Now, however, he says that Plaid Cymru Members would have agreed to give free school milk to children aged under seven and to spend £300 million on renovating school buildings. They wanted distance, but they now say that they would have supported all the popular measures.

Unfortunately, Ieuan, you decided on your stance, saying that there would be greater distance between Plaid Cymru and the Labour Party under your leadership than there was in Dafydd Wigley's tenure.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Ers ymadawriad Dirprwy Brif Weinidog Cymru yr wythnos diwethaf, mae'r weinyddiaeth yn edrych yn llai tebyg i Hamlet heb y tywysog nag Aladdin heb Widow Twankey. A ddywed Prif Weinidog Cymru wrthym pam fod swydd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog o bwysigrwydd cyfansoddiadol a pham ei bod yn hanfodol i ddyfodol Cymru? Onid yw yno i leddfu

it is vital to Wales, why have you not sought to include something in the Standing Orders to explain why that is?

**The First Minister:** The statement that I believe has been circulated to all Members via the internet deals with that issue. I am happy to discuss that in greater detail if required. However, that statement signifies that the partnership Government will continue.

**Nick Bourne:** On the continuation of the partnership Government, is it not undesirable for Wales to have had four changes in the leadership of the economic development portfolio since devolution? First, you dealt with that portfolio on your own, then you combined it with the post of First Secretary, then Mike German dealt with it on his own. You are now dealing with it again along with the post of First Minister, apparently temporarily, so there will be a fifth change. Is it not desirable for somebody to give their entire attention to this vital post, given the importance of Objective 1 and the development of the national economic development strategy? Would it not have been better to appoint somebody to the post temporarily, such as the Deputy Minister for Economic Development, rather than create this uncertainty where you are split between two vital roles at a vital time for Wales?

**The First Minister:** Let us measure the outcomes. If there is reason for criticism as a result of a failure to devote sufficient time and expertise to this matter after putting it to the test over the next few months, I will be happy to answer that question in more detail. However, the Deputy First Minister's portfolio can be combined with that of First Minister during a period which, apart from this and next week, will be summer recess, when demands are entirely different. In some areas, such as tourism, they are greater, but we will not be as tied down with questions, Committees and Plenaries as we are when the Assembly is in session. The demands are entirely different and far more flexible, and can be dealt with with the assistance of John

balchder y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol? Os yw'n hanfodol i Gymru, pam nad ydych wedi ceisio cynnwys rhywbeth yn y Rheolau Sefydlog i egluro hynny?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae'r datganiad y credaf sydd wedi ei ddsbarthu i bob Aelod drwy'r rhyngwrwyd yn ymdrin â'r mater hwnnw. Yr wyf yn fodlon trafod hynny'n fanylach oes angen. Fodd bynnag, mae'r datganiad hwnnw yn nodi y bydd y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth yn parhau.

**Nick Bourne:** Ynglŷn â pharhad y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth, onid yw'n annymunol i Gymru fod arweinyddiaeth y portffolio datblygu economaidd wedi newid bedair gwaith ers datganoli? Yn gyntaf, roeddech yn ymdrin â'r portffolio hwnnw eich hun, yna fe'i cyfunoch â swydd y Prif Ysgrifennydd, ac yna roedd Mike German yn ymdrin ag ef ei hun. Yr ydych bellach yn ymdrin ag ef eto, ynghyd â gwaith Prif Weinidog Cymru, dros dro yn ôl pob tebyg, felly bydd pumed newid. Onid yw'n ddymunol i rywun roi ei holl sylw i'r swydd hanfodol hon, o gofio pwysigrwydd Amcan 1 a datblygu'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol? Oni fyddai wedi bod yn well penodi rhywun i'r swydd dros dro, megis y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd, yn hytrach na chreu'r ansicrwydd hwn lle yr ydych chi yn rhannu rhwng dwy swyddogaeth hanfodol mewn cyfnod hanfodol i Gymru?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Gadewch inni fesur y canlyniadau. Os oes rheswm dros feirniadaeth o ganlyniad i fethu â rhoi digon o amser ac arbenigedd i'r mater hwn ar ôl ei brofi dros yr ychydig fisoedd nesaf, byddaf yn fodlon ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw yn fwy manwl. Fodd bynnag, gellir cyfuno portffolio Dirprwy Brif Weinidog Cymru ag un y Prif Weinidog am gyfnod a fydd, heblaw am yr wythnos hon a'r wythnos nesaf, yn doriad yr haf pan fydd gofynion yn hollol wahanol. Mewn rhai meysydd, megis twristiaeth, maent yn fwy, ond ni fyddwn mor gaeth i gwestiynau, Pwyllgorau a Chyfarfodydd Llawn â phan fo'r Cynulliad yn cyfarfod. Mae'r gofynion yn hollol wahanol ac yn llawer mwy hyblyg, a gellir ymdrin â hwy

Griffiths, who will have to step up in terms of the time commitment that he will give. I have already had several discussions with him on this matter.

2:10 p.m.

**Tom Middlehurst:** Notwithstanding the Deputy First Minister's current difficulties, do you agree that the National Assembly has much to celebrate regarding the successes of its first two years? Do you also agree that many of the policies and decisions currently being implemented by this administration are well-founded on the success and work undertaken by the previous two administrations, under the leadership of both Alun Michael and yourself?

**The First Minister:** I agree. I also acknowledge your contribution, Tom, in pulling off one of the Assembly's great triumphs, namely implementing the Education and Training Action Group report as well as establishing ELWa in April 2001. In addition, I praise your contribution in unifying the provisions for the 16 to 19-year-old age group. I do not exclude Cynog Dafis's contribution as the Chair of the relevant Committee from my praise. That achievement is another of the Assembly's great triumphs.

**Rod Richards:** The First Minister seems to believe that the year of coalition Government has been a success. Will he apportion how much credit for that success he would give to the Liberal Democrats? Will it be 100 per cent, 50 per cent or some figure in between?

**The First Minister:** That is an infantile question, Rod, even by your standards. It is not possible to make mathematical calculations of that nature. Any student of political science could work that out. I believe that you studied for a political science degree at some point, but you may have forgotten the lessons that you learned.

**The Presiding Officer:** Questions 2 and 3 have been withdrawn.

gyda chymorth John Griffiths, a fydd yn gorfod rhoi mwy o ymrwymiad amser. Yr wyf eisoes wedi trafod hynny sawl gwaith ag ef.

**Tom Middlehurst:** Er gwaethaf trafferthion presennol Dirprwy Brif Weinidog Cymru, a gytunwch fod gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol lawer i'w ddathlu yn llwyddiannau ei ddwy flynedd gyntaf? A gytunwch hefyd fod llawer o'r polisiau a'r penderfyniadau a weithredir ar hyn o bryd gan y weinyddiaeth hon wedi eu seilio'n gadarn ar y llwyddiant a'r gwaith a wnaethpwyd gan y ddwy weinyddiaeth flaenorol, dan eich arweiniad chi ac Alun Michael?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cytunaf. Cydnabyddaf eich cyfraniad chi hefyd, Tom, a'ch cyfraniad i un o lwyddiannau mawr y Cynulliad, sef gweithredu adroddiad y Grŵp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant, yn ogystal â sefydlu ELWa ym mis Ebrill 2001. Yn ogystal, canmolaf eich cyfraniad wrth uno'r darpariaethau ar gyfer y grŵp oedran 16 i 19. Nid wyf yn hepgor cyfraniad Cynog Dafis fel Cadeirydd y pwyllgor perthnasol yn fy nghanmoliaeth. Mae'r cyrhaeddiad hwnnw yn un arall o lwyddiannau mawr y Cynulliad.

**Rod Richards:** Ymddengys fod Prif Weinidog Cymru yn credu y bu blwyddyn y Llywodraeth glymblaid yn llwyddiant. A wnaiff ddweud faint o'r clod am y llwyddiant hwnnw y rhoddai i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol? A fydd yn 100 y cant, 50 y cant ynteu rhyw ffigur yn y canol?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae hynny yn gwestiwn plentyynnaidd, Rod, hyd yn oed yn ôl eich safonau chi. Nid yw'n bosibl gwneud cyfrif mathemategol o'r math hwnnw. Gallai unrhyw fyfyrwr gwyddoniaeth wleidyddol gyfrifo hynny. Credaf eich bod wedi astudio ar gyfer gradd mewn gwyddoniaeth wleidyddol unwaith, ond efallai eich bod wedi anghofio'r gwersi a ddysgasoch.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd Cwestiwn 2 a 3 yn ôl.

**Crisialu'r modd y bydd San Steffan a'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn Cydlynu Polisi  
Clarifying Policy Co-ordination Between Westminster and the National Assembly**

**Q4 Helen Mary Jones:** What discussions has the First Minister had with the new UK Secretary of State for Transport, Local Government and the Regions to clarify policy co-ordination between Westminster and the National Assembly? (OAQ12459)

**The First Minister:** The Secretary of State for Transport, Local Government and the Regions has no general responsibility in this matter. It is for the Cabinet Office or for the Secretary of State for Wales. Sue Essex will meet John Spellar, the Minister for Transport and we anticipate that she will also meet Stephen Byers soon, the new Secretary of State for Transport, Local Government and the Regions.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Can you tell us whether Deputy Assembly Ministers, including those for transport, participate in the discussions with Westminster, thereby gaining valuable experience? Will you reconsider your decision not to appoint the excellent Deputy Minister for Economic Development to the temporary role that would have provided him with such valuable experience, and Wales with a much-needed full-time Minister?

**The First Minister:** I yield to no one in my admiration of John Griffiths' talents. I welcome the solicitude for John's place in the administration that has been displayed by both opposition parties. However, I cannot help feeling that some of it is a case of crocodile tears. I am unsure. Perhaps I am being unduly cynical. Subject to the limitations placed on the use of Deputy Ministers by the Government of Wales Act 1998—they are not covered by this statute—I expect that additional burdens will be placed upon John and other Deputy Ministers. I am confident that they will measure up fully to the task, as are you, I am sure, Helen Mary.

**C4 Helen Mary Jones:** Pa drafodaethau y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi'u cael gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol newydd y DU dros Drafnidiaeth, Llywodraeth Leol a'r Rhanbarthau i grisialu'r modd y bydd San Steffan a'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn cydlynu polisi? (OAQ12459)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid oes gan yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Drafnidiaeth, Llywodraeth Leol a'r Rhanbarthau gyfrifoldeb cyffredinol yn y mater hwn. Mae'n fater i'r Cabinet neu Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru. Bydd Sue Essex yn cwrdd â John Spellar, y Gweinidog dros Drafnidiaeth a rhagdybiwn y bydd hefyd yn cwrdd â Stephen Byers, yr Ysgrifennydd newydd dros Drafnidiaeth, Llywodraeth Leol a'r Rhanbarthau yn fuan.

**Helen Mary Jones:** A allwch ddweud wrthym a yw Dirprwy Weinidogion y Cynulliad, gan gynnwys y rhai dros drafnidiaeth, yn cyfranogi i'r trafodaethau â San Steffan, ac yn ennill profiad gwerthfawr drwy hynny? A wnewch ailystyried eich penderfyniad i beidio â phenodi'r Dirprwy Weinidog ardderchog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd i'r swyddogaeth dros dro gan y byddai hynny wedi bod yn brofiad mor werthfawr iddo, ac wedi rhoi Gweinidog llawn-amser angenrheidiol i Gymru?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ni ildiaf i neb yn fy edmygedd o dalentau John Griffiths. Croesawaf y deisyfiad am le i John yn y weinyddiaeth a ddangoswyd gan y ddwy wrthblaid. Fodd bynnag, teimlaf fod ychydig ohono yn ffug. Nid wyf yn siŵr. Efallai fy mod yn bod yn or-sinigaid. Yn amodol ar y cyfyngiadau a osodir ar ddefnyddio Dirprwy Weinidogion gan Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998—ni chânt eu cwmpasu gan y statud hwn—disgwyliaf y gosodir baich ychwanegol ar ysgwyddau John a Dirprwy Weinidogion eraill. Yr wyf yn hyderus y byddant yn cwrdd â'r gofynion yn llwyr, fel yr wyf yn siŵr yr ydych chi, Helen Mary.



**Peter Black:** Rhodri, do you agree with Professor Stuart Cole's comments, which recently praised the Assembly's achievements in transport policy? How can the Assembly develop those achievements, working more closely with the United Kingdom Government to achieve better integration of transport in Wales?

**The First Minister:** Transport is the classic example of a bridged issue. Excuse the pun. We are responsible for roads and highways and have a general duty of sustainable development. However, railway transport is not a generally devolved matter and maritime and aviation transport is hardly devolved at all. We must cover those issues in which we have an interest but no responsibility, as well as those issues where we must work on the general policy framework jointly with the new Secretary of State and those Ministers carrying on from their previous portfolios.

**William Graham:** You referred to Deputy Ministers. They are not referred to in Standing Orders at all, as you know. Can you not assure us that you will co-ordinate matters for transport, local government and the regions between Westminster and the Assembly?

**The First Minister:** I have a general co-ordinating role. When there is a new administration in Westminster, we seek access to the new Cabinet as soon as possible. We have people such as Sue Essex and Jenny Randerson, who have already met their relevant counterpart Cabinet Ministers. As I remember, Jenny has already met Tessa Jowell and Jane Hutt has met Alan Milburn, although he is continuing in the same post. Carwyn Jones has already met Margaret Beckett and Jane Davidson is meeting Margaret Hodge next week. You would expect such meetings to take place following a change in Westminster. I have the overall co-ordinating role of ensuring that they are aware of what we are trying to do here. When a portfolio is handed-over and a UK Minister is new to the job, although he or she

**Peter Black:** Rhodri, a gytunwch â sylwadau'r Athro Stuart Cole, a oedd yn canmol cyraeddiadau polisi trafndiaeth y Cynulliad yn ddiweddar? Sut y gall y Cynulliad ddatblygu'r cyraeddiadau hynny, a chydweithio'n agosach â Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig i gyflawni trafndiaeth integredig well yng Nghymru?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Trafnidiaeth yw'r enghraifft glasurol o fater sydd yn pontio. Esgusodwch y mwyseirio. Ni sydd yn gyfrifol am ffyrdd a phriffyrdd ac mae gennym ddyletswydd cyffredinol dros ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Fodd bynnag, nid yw trafndiaeth rheilffyrdd yn fater datganoledig ar y cyfan ac nid yw trafndiaeth ar y môr nac yn yr awyr wedi eu datganoli o gwbl bron. Rhaid inni gwmpasu'r materion hynny sydd o ddiddordeb ond nad ydynt yn gyfrifoldeb inni, yn ogystal â'r materion hynny sydd angen inni gydweithio arnynt ar fframwaith polisi cyffredinol â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol newydd a'r Gweinidogion hynny sydd yn parhau â'u portffolios blaenorol.

**William Graham:** Cyfeiriasoch at Ddirprwy Weinidogion. Ni chyfeirir atynt yn y Rheolau Sefydlog o gwbl, fel y gwyddoch. Oni allwch ein sicrhau y byddwch yn cydlynu materion trafndiaeth, llywodraeth leol a'r rhanbarthau rhwng San Steffan a'r Cynulliad?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Swyddogaeth gydlynu gyffredinol sydd gennyf. Pan fydd gweinyddiaeth newydd yn San Steffan, ceisiwn gael mynediad i'r Cabinet newydd cyn gynted â phosibl. Mae gennym bobl fel Sue Essex a Jenny Randerson, sydd eisoes wedi cwrdd â'u Gweinidogion Cabinet cyfatebol. Yr hyn a gofiat yw fod Jenny eisoes wedi cwrdd â Tessa Jowell a bod Jane Hutt wedi cwrdd ag Alan Milburn, er ei fod yn parhau yn yr un swydd. Mae Carwyn Jones eisoes wedi cwrdd â Margaret Beckett a bydd Jane Davidson yn cwrdd â Margaret Hodge yr wythnos nesaf. Disgwyliech i gyfarfodydd o'r fath ddigwydd ar ôl newidiadau yn San Steffan. Mae gennyf y swyddogaeth gydlynu gyffredinol o sicrhau eu bod yn ymwybodol o'r hyn y ceisiwn ei wneud yma. Pan drosglwyddir portffolio a

is senior in terms of being in charge of a much bigger administration, our Ministers may have some additional experience having been in their post for a year or two. It is handy at times to have that continuity.

Gweinidog y DU yn newydd i'w swydd, er ei fod ef neu ei bod hi yn uwch yn nhermau gofalaeth gweinyddiaeth lawer mwy, efallai y bydd gan ein Gweinidogion ni ychydig o brofiad ychwanegol ar ôl bod yn eu swydd am flwyddyn neu ddwy. Mae'n ddefnyddiol weithiau i gael y parhad hwnnw.

### **Cyfarfod gyda'r Cabinet Meeting with the Cabinet**

**C5 Owen John Thomas:** Pa mor aml y bydd Prif Weinidog Cymru yn cyfarfod gyda'r Cabinet yn ystod y cyfnod pan na fydd y Cynulliad llawn yn eistedd? (OAQ12447)

**Q5 Owen John Thomas:** How often does the First Minister meet with the Cabinet during the period when the full Assembly is not in session? (OAQ12447)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid oes cyfarfodydd ffurfiol o'r Cabinet ond, yn anffurfiol, mae gwaith y Cabinet yn parhau yn yr un modd yn ystod y tri mis pan nad yw'r Cynulliad yn cyfarfod. O ran maint a phwysau'r gwaith, y mae rhai materion yn bwysicach nag eraill yn ystod yr haf, er enghraifft y rhai hynny sydd yn gysylltiedig â ffermio a meysydd datblygu economaidd fel twristiaeth. Gallaf eich sicrhau y bydd holl aelodau'r Cabinet a minnau yn parhau i weithio er mwyn gwireddu ein polisiau er lles a budd Cymru.

**The First Minister:** There are no formal Cabinet meeting but, informally, the Cabinet's work proceeds in the same manner during the three months when the Assembly is in recess. On the volume and pressure of work, some matters are more important than others during the summer, for example those relating to farming and economic development areas such as tourism. I can assure you that I, and every other Cabinet member, will continue to work to realise our policies for the benefit and welfare of Wales.

**Owen John Thomas:** Mae pryder cyffredinol ynghylch beth fydd yn digwydd i raglen gyllido Amcan 1 yn ystod y toriad, neu'n well byth, yn barhaol. A ydych chi'n fodlon rhoi buddiannau Cymru o flaen unrhyw fân wahaniaethau personol a defnyddio sgiliau, gwybodaeth ac ymroddiad pobl fel Ron Davies a John Griffiths wrth benodi Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd newydd?

**Owen John Thomas:** There is general concern about what will happen to the Objective 1 funding programme during the recess, or even better, permanently. Are you prepared to put Wales's interest before any minor personal differences and use the skills, knowledge and commitment of people such as Ron Davies and John Griffiths when you appoint a new Minister for Economic Development?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid oes angen gwneud hynny dros dro yn ystod yr haf. Eglurais hynny'n barod.

**The First Minister:** That does not need to be done during the summer on a temporary basis. I have already explained that.

### **Diwygio System y Pwyllgor Dethol Reform of the Select Committee System**

**Q6 Pauline Jarman:** Has the First Minister consulted with the Secretary of State for Wales about how reform of the select committee system would effect relations between the Assembly and the rest of the United Kingdom? (OAQ12466)

**C6 Pauline Jarman:** A yw Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi ymgynghori ag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynghylch effaith diwygio system y pwyllgorau dethol ar y berthynas rhwng y Cynulliad a gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig? (OAQ12466)

**The First Minister:** No. Any changes to the select committee system are a matter for Parliament alone.

**Pauline Jarman:** You are no doubt aware that three reports to date by the House of Commons Liaison Select Committee have called for reform of the select committee system. One of the concerns highlighted has been the slowness of the UK Government in replying to proposals arising from select committee hearings. Will you consider asking the UK Government to take such findings more seriously and find a way for the Welsh Affairs Select Committee, or perhaps the Welsh Grand Committee, to play a role in providing a fast-track mechanism for legislation that the Assembly would have passed, such as the St David's Day holiday, which your administration failed to obtain by going through the usual channels and some of the—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Supplementary questions should be brief.

**The First Minister:** I am pleased that you raised that issue because we are interested in any fast-tracking system. As an ex-member of the Liaison Select Committee until 1999, I am pleased that it has continued to take a lively interest in trying to increase the rights of backbenchers. If those rights include committees that specialise in Welsh affairs, such as the Welsh Affairs Select Committee, which has done valuable work, we might be able to get agreement from the authorities in the House for it to assist us with fast-tracking Welsh legislation.

**David Melding:** Does the First Minister agree that whatever happens to the Cabinet post of Secretary of State for Wales, it is essential, as long as Westminster retains full primary powers over Wales, that there is a Welsh Affairs Select Committee?

**The First Minister:** I am in favour of the Welsh Affairs Select Committee and the

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nacydw. Mater i'r Senedd yn unig yw unrhyw newidiadau i system y pwyllgorau dethol.

**Pauline Jarman:** Mae'n debyg eich bod yn ymwybodol bod tri adroddiad hyd yn hyn gan Bwyllgor Dethol Trafodaethau Tŷ'r Cyffredin wedi galw am ddiwygio system y pwyllgorau dethol. Un o'r pryderon a amlygwyd yw arafwch Llywodraeth y DU wrth ymateb i gynigion sydd yn codi o wrandawiadau pwyllgorau dethol. A ystyriwch gofyn i Lywodraeth y DU gymryd canfyddiadau felly o ddifrif a dod o hyd i ffordd i'r Pwyllgor Dethol Materion Cymreig, neu efallai'r Uwch Bwyllgor Cymreig, chwarae rhan mewn darparu peirianwaith llwybr cyflym ar gyfer deddfwriaeth y byddai'r Cynulliad wedi ei ganiatáu, megis gwyliau Dydd Gŵyl Dewi, a fethodd eich gweinyddiaeth chi a'i chael drwy fynd drwy'r sianelau arferol a rhai o'r—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Dylai cwestiynau atodol fod yn fyr.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf yn falch ichi godi'r mater hwnnw gan fod gennym ddiddordeb mewn unrhyw system llwybr cyflym. Fel cyn-aelod o'r Pwyllgor Dethol Trafodaethau tan 1999, yr wyf yn falch ei fod wedi parhau i ddangos diddordeb byw mewn ceisio cynyddu hawliau aelodau ar y meinciau cefn. Os yw'r hawliau hynny yn cynnwys pwyllgorau sydd yn arbenigo mewn materion Cymreig, megis y Pwyllgor Dethol Materion Cymreig, sydd wedi gwneud gwaith gwerthfawr, efallai y gallwn gael cytundeb gan yr awdurdodau yn y Tŷ iddo ein cynorthwyo gyda chreu llwybr cyflym i ddeddfwriaethau Cymreig.

**David Melding:** A gytuna'r Prif Weinidog, tra bydd San Steffan yn dal gafael ar ei bwerau sylfaenol llawn dros Gymru, ei bod yn hanfodol cael Pwyllgor Dethol Materion Cymreig, beth bynnag fydd yn digwydd i swydd Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru yn y Cabinet?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf o blaid y Pwyllgor Dethol Materion Cymreig a'r Uwch

Welsh Grand Committee for precisely the reasons to which you referred.

Bwyllgor Cymreig oherwydd yr union resymau y cyfeiriasoch atynt.

### **Cyflwyno Adnoddau ac Arbenigeddau'r Sector Preifat i Wasanaethau Cyhoeddus Introducing Private Sector Resources and Expertise into Public Services**

**Q7 Alun Cairns:** Will the First Minister make a statement on how private sector resources and expertise will be introduced into the operation of public services across Wales? (OAQ12453)

**C7 Alun Cairns:** A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar sut y caiff adnoddau ac arbenigeddau'r sector preifat eu cyflwyno at ddiben rhedeg gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ledled Cymru? (OAQ12453)

**The First Minister:** Yes. I shall do so non-dogmatically.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Gwnaf. Fe wnaif hynny yn annogmataidd.

**Alun Cairns:** I welcome the First Minister and the Government of Wales to Thatcherism. Will the First Minister recognise the contributions and efforts made by the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning and the Minister for Health and Social Services in championing the private finance initiative priority that they pursue in the Assembly's Committees? Will you concede that you were wrong every time you voted against private finance in the House of Commons?

**Alun Cairns:** Croesawaf Brif Weinidog a Llywodraeth Cymru i Thatcheriaeth. A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru gydnabod y cyfraniadau a'r ymdrechion a wneir gan y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes a'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wrth amddiffyn y flaenoriaeth menter cyllid preifat a gaiff ei hyrwyddo ganddynt ym Mhwyllgorau'r Cynulliad? A gyfaddefwch eich bod yn anghywir bob tro y pleidleisiasoch yn erbyn cyllido preifat yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin?

2:20 p.m.

**The First Minister:** I do not recall those occasions. However, in any mixed economy it is important to have a fluid and flexible line between the public and private sector. Relevant expertise in the private sector should be used, called upon and tapped into. Likewise, relevant expertise in the public sector should also be used. Providing that you are not dogmatic, the best Welsh solutions can be achieved for Welsh problems.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ni chofiaf yr achlysuron hynny. Fodd bynnag, mewn unrhyw economi gymysg, mae'n bwysig cael llinell symudol a hyblyg rhwng y sector cyhoeddus a'r sector preifat. Dylid defnyddio a galw ar arbenigedd perthnasol yn y sector preifat a manteisio arno. Felly hefyd y dylid defnyddio'r arbenigedd perthnasol yn y sector cyhoeddus. Cyn belled â nad ydych yn ddogmataidd, gellir cael yr atebion Cymreig gorau ar gyfer problemau Cymreig.

**Kirsty Williams:** Will you ensure that using private sector resources in the NHS in Wales complies with the Minister for Health and Social Services's comments in the Health and Social Service Committee last week that clinical staff will not be contracted out to the private sector and that, where possible, all other vital health care workers will be kept within the NHS?

**Kirsty Williams:** A sicrhewch y bydd defnyddio adnoddau'r sector preifat yn yr NHS yng Nghymru yn cydymffurfio â sylwadau'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yr wythnos diwethaf na chaiff staff clinigol eu contractio allan i'r sector preifat, ac y cedwir pob gweithiwr gofal iechyd hanfodol arall o fewn yr NHS cyn belled â phosibl?

**The First Minister:** Yes, that is our

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Gwnaf, dyna ein

intention. I realise, Kirsty, that you have a particular interest in the NHS, not only because you chair the Health and Social Services Committee, but also, over the next few months, on a personal level. I wish you well, as I am sure we all do. It is important to remember that in some areas we will not necessarily follow some of the principles to which Alan Milburn has referred. For reasons relating specifically to Wales, it is highly unlikely that we would want to pursue the so-called hip or cataract factories, which would be funded and operated by the private sector. Even though they may be beneficial, we have stopped following that specialised route. Therefore, it is unlikely that we would want to buy services for such waiting lists provided by private sector owned and operated initiatives.

**Geraint Davies:** Do you agree that those already working in healthcare have the best expertise? Do you agree that there should be the utmost co-operation between unions and management to ensure that public sector workers' rights will not be compromised in any way by the Labour Government's privatisation agenda? Will you investigate reports given to the Health and Social Services Committee last week that the Pontypridd and Rhondda NHS Trust is unwilling to hold discussions with the relevant unions on the private finance initiative implications for the new Llwynypia hospital?

**The First Minister:** I am sure that that is correct. However, I would take more notice of what you said, Geraint, if Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough Council, of which you are a member, had not so enthusiastically embraced a PFI initiative that contributed towards a £25 million scheme to build schools. You cannot have it both ways. You cannot lecture me on this front while the council, of which you are a ruling group member, takes the opposite road.

bwriad. Cydnabyddaf, Kirsty, fod gennych ddi-ddordeb arbennig yn yr NHS, nid yn unig oherwydd eich bod yn cadeirio'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, ond hefyd, dros y misoedd nesaf, ar lefel bersonol. Dymunaf yn dda ichi, fel y tybiaf y gwna bawb ohonom. Mae'n bwysig cofio na fyddwn o anghenraid yn dilyn rhai o'r egwyddorion y cyfeiriodd Alan Milburn atynt mewn rhai meysydd. Am resymau sydd yn berthnasol i Gymru yn unig, mae'n annhebygol iawn y byddwn am ganlyn y ffatrioedd clun neu gataract fel y'i gelwir, a gaiff eu cyllido a'u gweithredu gan y sector preifat. Er y gallent fod yn fuddiol, yr ydym wedi rhoi'r gorau i ddilyn y trywydd arbenigol hwnnw. Felly mae'n annhebygol y byddem am brynu gwasanaethau ar gyfer rhestrau aros o'r fath a ddarperir gan fentrau o dan berchnogaeth y sector preifat ac a weithredir ganddynt.

**Geraint Davies:** A gytunwch mai'r rhai sydd eisoes yn gweithio o fewn gofal iechyd sydd â'r arbenigedd gorau? A gytunwch y dylid cael y cydweithredu mwyaf rhwng undebau a rheolwyr i sicrhau na chaiff hawliau gweithwyr y sector cyhoeddus eu cyfaddawdu mewn unrhyw fodd gan agenda preifateiddio y Llywodraeth Lafur? A ymchwiliwch i adroddiadau a roddwyd i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yr wythnos diwethaf nad yw Ymddiriedolaeth NHS Pontypridd a'r Rhondda yn fodlon cynnal trafodaethau â'r undebau perthnasol ar oblygiadau'r fenter cyllid preifat (PFI) ar ysbyty newydd Llwynypia?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf yn siŵr fod hyn yn gywir. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn cymryd mwy o sylw o'r hyn a ddywedwch, Geraint, pe na bai Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf, lle yr ydych yn aelod, wedi cofleidio menter PFI mor frwd pan gyfrannodd tuag at gynllun £25 miliwn i adeiladu ysgolion. Ni allwch gael pethau y ddwy ffordd. Ni allwch ddarlithio i mi ar hyn tra fod y cyngor yr ydych chi'n aelod o'i grŵp rheoli, yn cymryd ffordd arall.

**Trafodaethau gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig**

**Discussions with the Secretary of State for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs**

**C8 Gareth Jones:** Pa drafodaethau y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi'u cael gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol newydd y DU dros yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig i grisialu effaith ffurfio ei hadran newydd ar y modd y bydd San Steffan a'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn cydlynu polisi? (OAQ12458)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Fel y mae'r enw'n ei awgrymu, mae'r adran newydd dipyn yn agosach at y strwythur sydd gennym yn barod, sef cael un Gweinidog dros faterion gwledig a'r amgylchedd. Wrth gwrs, nid yw Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig y Cynulliad yn delio â'r amgylchedd ar hyn o bryd ond yn hytrach â materion gwledig, datblygiad yr economi wledig ac amaethyddiaeth. Nid yw cyfrifoldebau ein Gweinidog yr union yr un peth â rhai'r Ysgrifennydd, ond mae'r adran yn San Steffan wedi symud dipyn tuag at y strwythur sydd gennym ni a Senedd yr Alban. Felly, yr ydym yn hapus dros ben gyda'r strwythur newydd a ddewiswyd gan y Prif Weinidog, Tony Blair.

**Gareth Jones:** Yn dilyn y llifogydd disymwth a effeithiodd ar fusnesau a threfi fel Llandudno yr wythnos diwethaf, mae trigolion rhai ardaloedd yn teimlo bod eu heiddo, os nad eu bywydau, bron yn feunyddiol o dan fygythiad. Mae rhai yn cwyno nad yw'r Cynulliad yn bwrw iddi i sicrhau na fydd ardaloedd sydd eisoes wedi dioddef llifogydd yn dioddef eto yn y dyfodol agos. Rhodri, yng nghanol eich prysurdeb a'ch cyfrifoldebau, pa gysur y gallwch ei roi i'r bobl hynny sydd yn byw mewn ofn? Pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi eu cael gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol newydd yn San Steffan ynglŷn â ffurfio polisi effeithiol i atal llifogydd?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Sue Essex, y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd sydd â chyfrifoldeb penodol dros lifogydd ac sydd yn arbenigo ar y pwnc. Mae Edwina Hart, fel

**Q8 Gareth Jones:** What discussions has the First Minister had with the new UK Secretary of State for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs to clarify what effect the formation of her new department will have on policy co-ordination between Westminster and the National Assembly? (OAQ12458)

**The First Minister:** As the name suggests, the new department is much closer to the structure that we already have, namely one Minister for rural affairs and the environment. Of course, the Assembly's Minister for Rural Affairs does not deal with the environment but rather with rural affairs, the development of the rural economy and agriculture. Our Minister's responsibilities are not exactly the same as those of the UK Secretary, but the department in Westminster has moved considerably towards what the Scottish Parliament and we have. We are happy with the new structure chosen by the Prime Minister, Tony Blair.

**Gareth Jones:** Following the flash floods that affected businesses and towns such as Llandudno last week, inhabitants in some areas feel that their property, if not their lives are at risk almost daily. Some complain that the Assembly is not forging ahead to ensure that areas, which have already suffered flooding, do not suffer again in the near future. Rhodri, despite your heavy workload and responsibilities, what comfort can you give to those who live in fear? What discussions have you had with the new Secretary of State in Westminster on creating an effective policy to prevent flooding?

**The First Minister:** Sue Essex, the Minister for Environment has direct responsibility for flooding and she specialises in the field. She and Edwina Hart, who is responsible for

y Gweinidog sydd yn gyfrifol am faterion cyllido, a hithau wedi gweithio'n galed. Wedi trafod y mater hwn gydag Alun Pugh yr wythnos diwethaf, credaf fod pobl Rhuthun, er enghraifft, yn hapus ein bod wedi darparu adnoddau ar gyfer yr awdurdodau, fel y cyngor lleol ac Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, i baratoi cynllun i atal y llifogydd echrydus a gafwyd yn Rhuthun y gaeaf diwethaf rhag digwydd eto. Deallaf fod problemau newydd wedi codi ym Mochdre ger Bae Colwyn, Llandudno a Chaerdydd. Digwyddodd hyn wythnos yn ôl ac nid ydym wedi gallu gwneud unrhyw beth eto, ond byddwn yn ymateb i'r llifogydd hynny yn yr un modd yn union ag a wnaethom y gaeaf diwethaf, pan oedd llifogydd yn Rhuthun a lleoedd eraill.

**Lynne Neagle:** I know that you are well aware of concerns in my constituency, about the continued imports of toxic waste to Rechem International, Pontypool. Will you and Sue Essex make it clear to the Secretary of State that the Assembly supports a ban on imports of toxic waste to Wales, as stated by the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee a year ago?

**The First Minister:** In danger of appearing to repeat ministerial names, Michael Meacher, the Minister of State for the Department of Environment, Food and Rural Affairs is one of the few Ministers who has continued in the same job after the election. I know that Sue has a good working relationship with him. It will be Michael Meacher, as Minister of State, who will take the lead, because essentially it is a matter of putting European legislation and regulations in place to keep away anything that will harm the environment of New Inn, in your constituency.

### **Rhaglen Ddeddfwriaethol a Amlinellwyd yn Araith y Frenhines Legislative Programme Outline in the Queen's Speech**

**C9 Cynog Dafis:** A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar y rhaglen ddeddfwriaethol a amlinellwyd yn Araith y Frenhines a'i heffaith ar ddatblygiad polisi yng Nghymru? (OAQ12467)

financial matters, have worked hard. Having discussed this issue with Alun Pugh last week, I believe that the people of Ruthin, for example, are happy that we have provided resources to the authorities, such as the local council and the Environment Agency, to prepare a scheme to prevent any repeat of the terrible floods that occurred in Ruthin last winter. I understand that new problems have arisen in Mochdre near Colwyn Bay, Llandudno and Cardiff. This happened a week ago and we have not been able to do anything yet, but we will respond to those floods in exactly the same way as we did last winter, when Ruthin and other areas were affected by floods.

**Lynne Neagle:** Gwn eich bod yn llwyr ymwybodol o'r pryderon yn fy etholaeth, i barhau i fewnforio gwastraff gwenwynig i Rechem International, Pontypŵl. A wnewch chi a Sue Essex ei gwneud yn glir i'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol fod y Cynulliad yn cefnogi gwahardd mewnforio gwastraff gwenwynig i Gymru, fel y datganwyd gan Bwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth flwyddyn yn ôl?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid wyf am ymddangos fel pe bawn yn ailadrodd enwau gweinidogol, Michael Meacher, y Gweinidog Gwladol dros Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig yw un o'r ychydig Weinidogion sydd wedi parhau yn yr un swydd ar ôl yr etholiad. Gwn fod gan Sue ac yntau berthynas waith dda. Michael Meacher, fel y Gweinidog Gwladol, fydd yn arwain, gan ei bod, yn ei hanfod, yn fater o osod deddfwriaethau a rheoliadau Ewropeaidd yn eu lle i gadw unrhyw beth a fydd o ddrwg i'r amgylchedd oddi wrth New Inn, yn eich etholaeth chi.

**Q9 Cynog Dafis:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the legislative programme outlined in the Queen's Speech and its effects upon policy development in Wales? (OAQ12467)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Gwnaf ddatganiad ynghylch y rhaglen ddeddfwriaethol a amlinellwyd yn Araith y Frenhines a'i heffeithiau ar ddatblygu polisi yng Nghymru yn ystod y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 19 Gorffennaf.

**Cynog Dafis:** Yn y cyfamser, a wnewch chi egluro bwriadau'r glymblaid ynglŷn ag ysgolion arbenigol a fydd yn cael dethol disgyblion ar sail gallu? Faint yr ydych yn ei ragweld a fydd yn cael eu sefydlu yng Nghymru? Soniasoch mewn erthygl papur newydd am sefydlu un neu ddwy ysgol. Ar ba sail y bydd un neu ddwy yn cael ei sefydlu? Os ydych o blaid ysgolion cyfun ac yn cyd-fynd â'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes y dylai plant lleol fynychu ysgolion lleol, pam yr ydych eisiau agor y drws i system a gynllunnir yn fwriadol i danseilio addysg gyfun?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ni dderbyniaf y ddadl honno. Mae'n llawer rhy gymhleth. Dywedais—ac nid wyf yn tynnu fy sylwadau'n ôl—ei bod yn debygol y byddwn yn cael un neu ddwy ysgol o'r math hwn. Nid oeddwn yn dweud y byddai Llywodraeth ganolog yn gorfodi awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru i agor ysgol o'r math hwn. Fodd bynnag, mae'n fater iddynt hwy. Yr oeddwn yn ceisio barnu'r hyn sydd yn debygol o ddigwydd yn ystod y 10 mlynedd nesaf. O dan y polisi a'r maniffesto yr enillodd Llafur yr etholiad arnynt, bydd tua 50 i 100 o ysgolion cyfun Lloegr yn symud i'r gyfundrefn newydd hon, gyda chymaint â 15 y cant o'r myfyrwyr yn cael eu dewis i fynychu ysgol. Mae llawer mwy o ddewis yng Nghymru, oherwydd yn yr ardaloedd mwy Seisnigaidd, mae rhwydwaith o ysgolion, sydd yn gweithio drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Ni ddywedais y byddwn yn derbyn y byddai hyd at 15 y cant o fyfyrwyr yn cael eu dewis i fynychu'r ysgolion hynny. Yr oeddwn yn ceisio rhagweld y system yr ydym yn debygol o'i chael yn ystod y 10 mlynedd nesaf. Dyna paham y dywedais y byddem yn debygol o gael un neu ddwy ysgol o'r math hwn.

**David Melding:** The NHS Wales Bill will put local health groups on a statutory footing.

**The First Minister:** I will make a statement on the legislative programme outlined in the Queen's Speech and its effects on policy development in Wales during the Plenary session on 19 July.

**Cynog Dafis:** In the interim, will you clarify the coalition's intentions regarding specialist schools, which will be allowed to select pupils on the basis of ability? How many such schools do you predict will be established in Wales? In a newspaper article you mentioned establishing one or two schools. On what basis will one or two be established? If you are in favour of comprehensive schools and agree with the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning that local children should attend local schools, why do you wish to open the door to a system that is deliberately designed to undermine comprehensive education?

**The First Minister:** I do not accept that argument. It is much too complicated. I said—and I do not withdraw my comments—that it is likely that we will have one or two such schools. I was not saying that central Government would force local authorities in Wales to open such a school. However, it is a matter for them. I was trying to assess what is likely to happen during the next 10 years. Under the policy and manifesto on which the Labour party won the election, about 50 to 100 comprehensive schools in England will move towards this new system, with as many as 15 per cent of students being selected to attend a school. There is much more choice in Wales, because in the more anglicised areas, there is a network of schools, which work through the medium of Welsh. I did not say that I would accept that up to 15 per cent of students would be selected to attend these schools. I was trying to anticipate what system we are likely to have in the next 10 years. That is why I said that we would be likely to have one or two such schools.

**David Melding:** Bydd Mesur NHS Cymru yn rhoi grwpiau iechyd lleol mewn sefyllfa



Do you think that we should take this opportunity to write into law that nurses must be on the executive board of local health groups?

**The First Minister:** I am not sure about the necessity of law, because I do not know whether there is currently any failure as regards nurses on the executive boards of local health groups. However, I hear what you say from a sedentary position and I am happy to accept that. I will discuss this matter with Jane Hutt as the Minister for Health and Social Services. I am aware that, in general, local health groups have settled in well on a cross-professional basis with doctors, nurses, midwives and, above all, social services, who come from a different pay stream. Crossing the boundary between the social services element and the medical and paramedical professions' element is the critical feature. If that works well on a voluntary basis, I would be happy to proceed. That is how I understand it, but there may be one or two problems in some places. Perhaps you could draw those to my attention, David, and we will see what we can do about them.

statudol. A gredwch y dylem gymryd y cyfle hwn i ysgrifennu o fewn y gyfraith y dylai nyrsys fod ar fyrddau gweithredol grwpiau iechyd lleol (LHG)?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid wyf yn siwr ynglŷn ag angen am gyfraith, gan na wn a oes diffyg nyrsys ar fyrddau gweithredol grwpiau iechyd lleol ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, clywaf yr hyn a ddywedwch tra ar eich eistedd ac yr wyf yn fodlon derbyn hynny. Trafodaf y mater hwn â Jane Hutt fel y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol fod grwpiau iechyd lleol, yn gyffredinol, wedi ymdopi yn dda â'r sefyllfa traws-broffesiynol gyda meddygon, nyrsys, bydwagedd, ac yn bennaf, wasanaethau cymdeithasol, sydd yn dod o ffrwd cyflog gwahanol. Mae croesi'r ffin rhwng yr elfen gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a'r proffesiynau meddygol a pharafeddygol yn nodwedd holl bwysig. Os yw hynny yn gweithio'n dda ar sail wirfoddol, byddwn yn fodlon parhau. Dyna sut y deallaf y mae, ond efallai y bydd un neu ddwy o broblemau mewn rhai lleoedd. Efallai y gallech dynnu fy sylw atynt, David, a chawn weld beth y gallwn ei wneud ynglŷn â hwy.

2:30 p.m.

### **Mynd i'r Afael â Thrais yn erbyn Gweision Cyhoeddus Tackling Violence towards Public Servants**

**Q10 David Davies:** Are there any plans to develop new policies designed to tackle violence towards public servants in Wales? (OAQ12450)

**The First Minister:** Policies to safeguard the personal safety of staff have been adopted by several public sector employers in Wales. For example, in the NHS, current Welsh risk management standards require health bodies to assess and reduce risks of all kinds, including exposure of staff to violence and aggression. I understand that closed-circuit television will be one of the tools to assist in that matter. As regards schools, we welcome the package of measures introduced by Estelle Morris, which will be a key part of the forthcoming Education Bill later this year. In Wales, as part of the Department for

**C10 David Davies:** A oes cynlluniau i ddatblygu polisiau newydd i fynd i'r afael â thrais yn erbyn gweision cyhoeddus yng Nghymru? (OAQ12450)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mabwysiadwyd polisiau i sicrhau diogelwch personol staff gan nifer o gyflogwyr sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Er enghraifft, yn yr NHS, mae'r safonau rheoli risg presennol yng Nghymru yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i gyrff iechyd asesu pob math o risgiau a'u lleihau, gan gynnwys amlygu staff i drais ac ymddygiad ymosodol. Deallaf y bydd teledu cylch cyfyng yn un o'r dulliau a fydd yn cynorthwyo yn hynny o beth. O ran ysgolion, croesawn y pecyn o fesurau a gyflwynwyd gan Estelle Morris, a fydd yn rhan allweddol o'r Mesur Addysg arfaethedig yn ddiweddarach y flwyddyn

Education and Skills consultation, a two-day conference will be held on that issue in October.

**David Davies:** Do you accept that the current levels of violence are unacceptable? There is a red card scheme in England designed to stop the perpetrators of violence towards health workers being treated. If it is a good enough scheme for England, why is it not being introduced in Wales? Why are we putting the rights of a violent minority above the rights of those doctors and nurses who face abuse and intimidation on a daily basis?

**The First Minister:** That is over the top, as you are frequently, David. There is a grain of truth in what you say. We value our NHS staff just as highly in Wales as do Ministers in England. We do not have to do everything in the same way. We can from time to time, David—although it may take generations before you accept it—do things better.

**Brian Gibbons:** Do you agree with the current proposal in Wales, that patients who have a record of violence will not be seen at GP surgeries? David Davies seems to be unaware of that. Do you also agree that in our human resource strategy, the threat of violence against staff in the NHS has been explicitly highlighted as an issue for action?

**The First Minister:** I understand that violent patients are assigned to those GPs with appropriate facilities. Do not ask me to describe what the facilities are. Sometimes, it is not wise to describe them exactly. However, action on that issue is underway.

**David Lloyd:** Datganaf fy muddiant arferol fel meddyg teulu. Pa fesurau'n union y byddwch yn eu cyflwyno yng Nghymru i ymdopi â phobl sydd yn mynnu ymosod ar staff yr NHS? Er enghraifft, a sefydlir lleoedd diogel ar gyfer triniaeth?

hon. Yng Nghymru, fel rhan o ymgynghoriad yr Adran Addysg a Sgiliau, cynhelir cynhadledd ddeuddydd ar y mater hwnnw ym mis Hydref.

**David Davies:** A dderbyniwch fod y lefelau presennol o drais yn annerbyniol? Mae cynllun cerdyn coch yn Lloegr sydd â'r nod o atal y rhai sydd yn ymddwyn yn dreisgar tuag at weithwyr iechyd rhag cael eu trin. Os yw'r cynllun yn ddigon da i Loegr, pam na chaiff ei gyflwyno yng Nghymru? Pam ein bod yn rhoi mwy o bwys ar hawliau lleiafrif treisgar nag ar hawliau'r meddygon a'r nyrsys hynny sydd yn wynebu ymddygiad dilornus a bygythiol yn feunyddiol?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae hynny'n eithafol, fel yr ydych chi yn aml, David. Mae peth gwirionedd yn yr hyn a ddywedwch. Yr ydym yn gwerthfawrogi ein staff NHS cymaint ag y mae Gweinidogion yn Lloegr yn gwerthfawrogi eu staff hwy. Gallwn o bryd i'w gilydd David—er y gall gymryd oesoedd cyn ichi dderbyn hynny—wneud pethau yn well.

**Brian Gibbons:** A gytunwch â'r cynnig presennol yng Nghymru, na chaiff cleifion sydd wedi ymddwyn yn dreisgar eu gweld mewn meddygfeydd? Ymddengys nad yw David Davies yn ymwybodol o hynny. A gytunwch hefyd y cafodd y bygythiad o drais yn erbyn staff yn yr NHS ei amlygu'n benodol fel mater i weithredu arno yn ein strategaeth adnoddau dynol?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Deallaf y caiff cleifion treisgar eu rhoi ar gofrestr y meddygon teulu hynny sydd â chyfleusterau priodol. Peidiwch â gofyn imi ddisgrifio'r cyfleusterau. Weithiau, nid yw'n beth doeth eu disgrifio'n fanwl. Fodd bynnag, caiff camau eu cymryd ar hyn o bryd ar y mater hwn.

**David Lloyd:** I declare my usual interest as a GP. What measures exactly will you introduce in Wales to cope with people who insist on attacking NHS staff? For example, will safe areas for treatment be set up?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Rhaid imi ysgrifennu atoch ar y pwynt hwnnw. Nid wyf yn hollol siŵr a ydym yn fodlon cyhoeddi pob un o'r mesurau a gymerir i ddiogelu staff yr NHS. Fodd bynnag, lle gellir cyhoeddi'r manylion, gwnawn hynny. Ysgrifennaf atoch, a bydd y llythyr hwnnw'n agored i'r cyhoedd.

**The First Minister:** I will have to write to you on that point. I am not absolutely sure whether we are prepared to publicise all the measures that will be taken to safeguard NHS staff. However, where we can make those details public, we will do so. I will write to you, and that letter will be open to the public.

### **Polisiau a Gynigir yn 'Rhoi Cymru'n Gyntaf' Policy Proposals in 'Putting Wales First'**

**Q11 Lynne Neagle:** What discussions has the First Minister had with representatives of trade unions in Wales regarding the policy proposals set out in 'Putting Wales First: A Partnership for the People of Wales'? (OAQ12471)

**C11 Lynne Neagle:** Pa drafodaethau y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi'u cael gyda chynrychiolwyr undebau llafur yng Nghymru ynghylch y polisiau a gynigir yn 'Rhoi Cymru'n Gyntaf: Partneriaeth ar gyfer Pobl Cymru'? (OAQ12471)

**The First Minister:** The Wales Trade Unions annual conference starts tomorrow. I will address it, along with Edwina Hart, Jane Davidson and the Secretary of State for Wales, Paul Murphy. To answer your question, we are anxious to ensure that the unions engage positively in policy development. You will be aware that we have set up the social partners body in relation to Objective 1 and other business related measures. We are assisting that body to ensure that it plays a full part in Objective 1.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae cynhadledd flynyddol Undebau Llafur Cymru yn cychwyn yfory. Byddaf yn ei hannerch, gydag Edwina Hart, Jane Davidson ac Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, Paul Murphy. I ateb eich cwestiwn, yr ydym yn awyddus i sicrhau fod yr undebau yn cymryd rhan gadarnhaol wrth ddatblygu polisiau. Byddwch yn ymwybodol ein bod wedi sefydlu'r corff partneriaid cymdeithasol mewn perthynas ag Amcan 1 a mesurau eraill sydd yn gysylltiedig â busnes. Yr ydym yn cynorthwyo'r corff hwnnw i sicrhau ei fod yn chwarae rhan lawn yn Amcan 1.

**Lynne Neagle:** Will you expand on the role that you see trade unions playing in maximising the opportunities provided by the Objective 1 programme?

**Lynne Neagle:** A ymhelaethwch ar y rôl y gwelwch yr undebau llafur yn ei chwarae wrth gynyddu'r cyfleoedd a ddarperir gan raglen Amcan 1 i'r eithaf?

**The First Minister:** We accept that small businesses and trade unions do not have large numbers of staff available who can be taken off frontline duties to promote Objective 1 programmes. The trade unions would have a major interest in those programmes, whether in the establishment of credit unions or other socially related functions. We have said that we will assist in funding staff that help small businesses, trade unions and voluntary organisations to overcome the lack of policy-related people who are available to them. That has been warmly welcomed by the trade unions and by bodies representing small and

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Derbyniwn nad oes gan fusnesau ac undebau llafur bach nifer fawr o staff ar gael y gellir eu tynnu oddi ar ddyletswyddau rheng flaen i hybu rhaglenni Amcan 1. Byddai gan yr undebau llafur ddiddordeb mawr yn y rhaglenni hyn, pa un ai wrth sefydlu undebau credyd neu swyddogaethau eraill sydd yn gysylltiedig â'r gymdeithas. Dywedasom y byddwn yn cynorthwyo wrth ariannu staff sydd yn helpu busnesau, undebau llafur a sefydliadau gwirfoddol bach i oresgyn y prinder pobl sydd yn gysylltiedig â pholisiau sydd ar gael iddynt. Croesawyd hynny'n gynnes gan yr

medium sized firms in Wales.

undebau llafur a chan gyrff sydd yn cynrychioli cwmnïau bach a chanolig eu maint yng Nghymru.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yn ystod y trafodaethau hyn, sut yr ydych yn ymateb i'r feirniadaeth gref o du'r undebau llafur ynglŷn â'r duedd i breifateiddio gwasanaethau cyhoeddus? Dywed yr undebau llafur bod hynny yn gwbl estron i'r traddodiad llafur a'i fod yn tanseilio safon y gwasanaethau hynny. Sut ydych yn ymateb i'r feirniadaeth hon?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** During these discussions, how do you respond to the harsh criticism from the trade unions about the tendency to privatise public services? The trade unions say that that is totally alien to the Labour tradition and undermines the quality of those services. How do you respond to this criticism?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid wyf wedi clywed unrhyw feirniadaeth o'n polisiau ni yng Nghymru.

**The First Minister:** I have not heard any criticism of our policies in Wales.

**Alun Cairns:** I note your answer in which you said that you and several other Ministers will be speaking at the Wales TUC conference that starts tomorrow. If this is truly a partnership Government, why is the Deputy First Minister not contributing?

**Alun Cairns:** Nodaf eich ateb lle y dywedasoch y byddwch chi a sawl Gweinidog arall yn siarad yng nghynhadledd TUC Cymru sydd yn cychwyn yfory. Os mai Llywodraeth bartneriaeth wirioneddol yw hon, pam nad yw'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn cyfrannu?

**The First Minister:** Three Ministers, plus the Secretary of State for Wales, could be in danger of dominating the agenda at the Wales TUC conference, but I am sure that the conference has been carefully arranged. With the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities, the First Minister and the Secretary of State speaking at the conference, it has been nicely pitched.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Gallai tri Gweinidog, ac Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru fod mewn perygl o reoli'r agenda yng nghynhadledd TUC Cymru, ond yr wyf yn siŵr y trefnwyd y gynhadledd yn ofalus. Gyda'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau, Prif Weinidog Cymru a'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yn siarad yn y gynhadledd, gwnaethpwyd dewis da.

### **Effaith y Mesur Troseddau ar Heddluoedd Cymru Impact of the Crime Bill on Welsh Police Forces**

**Q12 Alison Halford:** What discussions has the First Minister had with the Home Secretary with regard to the Crime Bill and its impact on Welsh police forces? (OAQ12473)

**C12 Alison Halford:** Pa drafodaethau y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi'u cael gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref ynghylch y Mesur Troseddau a'i effaith ar heddluoedd Cymru? (OAQ12473)

**The First Minister:** I have not had any discussions myself. However, according to the Queen's Speech, the Home Office intends to introduce four new pieces of legislation on law and order in this current 18 month Parliament, which will all impact on

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid wyf wedi cael unrhyw drafodaethau fy hun. Fodd bynnag, yn ôl Araith y Frenhines, mae'r Swyddfa Gartref yn bwriadu cyflwyno pedwar darn newydd o ddeddfwriaeth ar gyfraith a threfn yn y Senedd 18 mis gyfredol hon, y byddant

Welsh police forces. They are: the Police Reform Bill; the Criminal Justice Bill; the Proceeds of Crime Bill and the Football (Disorder) (Amendment) Bill, which is an interesting title. Welsh chief constables and the chairs of the police authorities for Wales, along with their English counterparts, will meet the Home Secretary on Thursday.

**Alison Halford:** I understand and accept that you have not had discussions. However, in light of the enormous work devoted by police forces to cannabis, and the impact of treating cannabis as a criminal drug, if you had had discussions with the Home Secretary, what would your view be on decriminalising this substance in Wales?

**The First Minister:** I do not have a view on that matter, as it is not a matter for this Assembly. It is not necessarily relevant for us to have views on every single issue, in particular Home Office responsibilities, which have not been devolved. They are a package that remains with Westminster for England and Wales and, in some cases, for the UK as a whole. That is how the devolution settlement was written, and sometimes one is not entirely ungrateful for that. I note the reference that has been made on the recommendation of, I believe, Keith Hellawell, the drugs tsar, for greater concentration on hard drugs, and less concentration on the so-called soft drugs, such as cannabis, especially on possession for personal use.

**David Davies:** Two police officers were injured in Monmouth on Saturday night. I witnessed two more officers being injured in Abergavenny a few weeks ago. Is it not about time that we allowed the police to take the kid gloves off, and start treating the people who habitually commit acts of violent disorder against police officers appropriately? Will this new Crime Bill allow them to do that?

**The First Minister:** That raises the interesting point of whether those incidents were alcohol related, which is the point made

oll yn effeithio ar heddluoedd Cymru, sef: Mesur Diwygio'r Heddlu; Mesur Cyfiawnder Troseddol; Mesur Enillion Troseddu a'r Mesur Pêl-droed (Aflonyddwch) (Diwygiad), sydd yn deitl diddorol. Bydd prif gwnstabiliaid Cymru a chadeiryddion awdurdodau heddlu Cymru, a'u cymheiriaid yn Lloegr, yn cwrdd â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol ddydd Iau.

**Alison Halford:** Deallaf a derbynaf nad ydych wedi cael trafodaethau. Fodd bynnag, o ystyried y gwaith anferth a neilltuwyd gan yr heddluoedd tuag at ganabis, ac effaith ymdrin â chanabis fel cyffur troseddol, os byddech wedi cael trafodaethau â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol, beth fyddai eich barn ar gyfreithloni'r sylwedd hwn yng Nghymru?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid oes gennyf farn ar y mater hwnnw, am nad yw'n fater i'r Cynulliad hwn. Nid yw'n angenrheidiol yn berthnasol inni gael barn ar bob mater, yn arbennig cyfrifoldebau'r Swyddfa Gartref, nad yw wedi'i ddatganoli. Maent yn becyn sydd yn parhau i fod gan San Steffan ar gyfer Cymru a Lloegr ac, mewn rhai achosion, ar gyfer y DU gyfan. Dyna sut yr ysgrifennwyd y setliad datganoli, ac weithiau ni fydd rhywun yn gwbl anniolchgar ynghylch hynny. Nodaf y cyfeiriad a wnaethpwyd ar argymhelliad Keith Hellawell, fe gredaf, y tsar cyffuriau, i ganolbwyntio mwy ar gyffuriau caled, a chanolbwyntio llai ar y cyffuriau meddal fel y'u gelwir, fel canabis, yn enwedig o ran meddiant ar gyfer defnydd personol.

**David Davies:** Anafwyd dau swyddog yr heddlu yn Nhrefynwy nos Sadwrn. Gwelais ddau swyddog arall yn cael eu hanafu yn y Fenni ychydig wythnosau yn ôl. Onid yw'n bryd inni ganiatáu i'r heddlu dynnu'r menyg croen myn, a dechrau trin y bobl sydd yn cyflawni troseddau o aflonyddwch treisgar yn erbyn swyddogion yr heddlu yn gyson, mewn ffordd briodol? A fydd y Mesur Troseddau newydd hwn yn caniatáu iddynt wneud hynny?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae hynny'n codi'r pwynt diddorol pa un a oedd y digwyddiadau hynny yn gysylltiedig ag alcohol, sef y pwynt

by those who are in favour of some sort of change in the status of cannabis for personal use. They argue that it is far more likely that a policeman will be assaulted by somebody who is under the influence of alcohol, which is legal, rather than cannabis, which is not. You go around the houses for years before you solve the problem of the relative perils of alcohol, cannabis and other soft drugs, tobacco smoking, and so on. I do not know the right answer. In the Assembly we can express views fairly freely knowing that we do not have the responsibility. I am not sure how much time we should spend on it.

a wnaethpwyd gan y rhai hynny sydd o blaid rhyw fath o newid yn statws cannabis ar gyfer defnydd personol. Maent yn dadlau ei bod yn llawer mwy tebygol i heddwad ddiodef ymosodiad gan rywun sydd o dan ddylanwad alcohol, sydd yn gyfreithlon, yn hytrach na chanabis, nad yw'n gyfreithlon. Byddwch yn ymdrechu am flynyddoedd cyn datrys problem peryglon perthnasol alcohol, cannabis a chyffuriau meddal eraill, ysmegu tybaco ac ati. Ni wn yr ateb cywir. Yn y Cynulliad gallwn ddatgan barn yn weddol rhydd gan wybod nad yw'r cyfrifoldeb gennym. Nid wyf yn siŵr faint o amser y dylem ei dreulio arno.

2:40 p.m.

### **Cydlynu Polisi er Lles Pobl Gogledd Cymru Co-ordinating Policy for the Benefit of the People of North Wales**

**Q13 Peter Rogers:** Can the First Minister report on the progress that he has made on co-ordinating policy for the benefit of the people of north Wales? (OAQ12470)

**C13 Peter Rogers:** A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru adrodd ar hynt ei ymdrechion i gydlynu polisi er lles pobl gogledd Cymru? (OAQ12470)

**The First Minister:** I am grateful for that question, given that I addressed a question and answer session at Rhyl on Friday, which was attended by around 200 people, which is a record for an Assembly Regional Committee. It was a remarkably lively session, and I was pleased to be there. I have completed around 50 or so public engagements in north Wales since becoming the north Wales co-ordinator last October.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cwestiwn hwnnw, o ystyried imi annerch sesiwn holi ac ateb yn y Rhyl ddydd Gwener, a fynychwyd gan tua 200 o bobl, sydd yn record ar gyfer Pwyllgor Rhanbarthol y Cynulliad. Yr oedd yn sesiwn hynod fywiog, ac yr oeddwn yn falch o fod yno. Yr wyf wedi cwblhau tua 50 o alwadau cyhoeddus yng ngogledd Cymru ers dod yn gydlynedd gogledd Cymru fis Hydref diwethaf.

Specifically, I should say that the A55 not only functions as a road, as it was before the Assembly was constituted, but also as a transport and information communication technology link using optical fibres that were buried under the road. The Assembly is responsible for that development.

Yn benodol, dylwn ddweud nad gweithredu fel ffordd yw unig swyddogaeth yr A55, fel yr oedd cyn sefydlu'r Cynulliad, ond ei bod hefyd yn gyswllt trafniadaeth a thechnoleg cyfathrebu gwybodaeth gan ddefnyddio ffeibrau optig a gladdwyd o dan y ffordd. Y Cynulliad sydd yn gyfrifol am y datblygiad hwnnw.

**Peter Rogers:** Are you aware that the Assembly called in a windfarm project at Tir Mostyn, which Denbighshire County Council resolved to approve? Windjen, the company responsible for the project, has agreed, in principle, to a mitigation package, which means that the objections of the main

**Peter Rogers:** A ydych yn ymwybodol fod y Cynulliad wedi galw prosiect fferm wynt i mewn yn Nhir Mostyn, y penderfynodd Cyngor Sir Ddinbych ei gymeradwyo? Mae Windjen, y cwmni sydd yn gyfrifol am y prosiect, wedi cytuno, mewn egwyddor, i gael pecyn iawndal, sydd yn golygu y gellid

opposition groups, the Royal Society for the Protection of Birds and the Countryside Council for Wales could be resolved. If that is the case, could we resolve to hand the project back to the local council to save money and a great deal of time in terms of holding a public inquiry, and let the local people decide on this project?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. It would not be appropriate for the First Minister to answer questions relating to a quasi-statutory procedure of this Assembly on a planning matter.

**Ann Jones:** Do you agree that Friday's meeting on housing benefited everybody in that record-breaking meeting attended by over 200 people and that the issues raised were taken on board and are being seen in terms of how we are co-ordinating policies, not only across north Wales but the whole of Wales?

**The First Minister:** That must be correct. The Assembly's Regional Committees are an extension of democracy that I do not think the Scottish Parliament practices. The UK Parliament certainly does not. I do not know whether any other Parliamentary body operates regional committees. The question and answer sessions are enormously valuable because they teach you where the shoe pinches and what is at the front of the public's mind, which is often different from what is at the front of people's minds in the Assembly. That is a valuable lesson for politicians everywhere, which may have a bearing on the low turnout in the General Election a month ago.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Does the First Minister believe that the policies proposed by Plaid Cymru councillor Simon Glyn would benefit the people of north Wales or would he prefer to be as silent on the subject as Plaid Cymru's leader?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The First Minister does not have responsibility for the Party of Wales. That question is not relevant.

penderynu ar amcanion y prif grwpiau sydd yn gwrthwynebu, y Gymdeithas Frenhinol er Gwarchod Adar a Chyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru. Os mai dyna yw'r achos, a allem benderfynu trosglwyddo'r prosiect yn ôl i'r cyngor lleol i arbed arian a llawer o amser o ran cynnal ymchwiliad cyhoeddus, a gadael i'r bobl leol benderfynu ar y prosiect hwn?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ni fyddai'n briodol i'r Prif Weinidog ateb cwestiynau yn ymwneud â gweithdrefn lled-statudol y Cynulliad hwn ar fater cynllunio.

**Ann Jones:** A gytunwch fod cyfarfod dydd Gwener ar dai o fudd i bawb yn y cyfarfod hwnnw a dorrodd record a fynychwyd gan dros 200 o bobl ac yr ystyriwyd y materion a godwyd ac y cânt eu gweld o ran sut yr ydym yn cydlynu polisiau, nid yn unig ar hyd gogledd Cymru ond Cymru gyfan?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Rhaid bod hynny'n gywir. Mae Pwyllgorau Rhanbarth y Cynulliad yn estyniad ar ddemocratiaeth na chredaf fod Senedd yr Alban yn ei arfer ac nad yw Senedd y DU yn bendant yn ei arfer. Ni wn a oes unrhyw gorff Seneddol arall yn gweithredu pwyllgorau rhanbarth. Mae'r sesiynau holi ac ateb yn hynod o werthfawr am eu bod yn eich dysgu lle mae'r esgid fach yn gwasgu a beth sydd ar flaen meddwl pobl, sydd yn aml yn wahanol i'r hyn sydd ar flaen meddwl pobl yn y Cynulliad. Mae honno'n wers werthfawr i wleidyddion ym mhobman, a allai gael effaith ar nifer fechan y bobl a bleidleisiodd yn yr Etholiad Cenedlaethol fis yn ôl.

**Gwenda Thomas:** A gred y Prif Weinidog y byddai'r polisiau a gynigiwyd gan gynghorydd Plaid Cymru Simon Glyn o fudd i bobl gogledd Cymru neu a fyddai'n well ganddo fod yn dawel ar y pwnc fel y mae arweinydd Plaid Cymru?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid oes gan y Prif Weinidog gyfrifoldeb dros Plaid Cymru. Nid yw'r cwestiwn hwnnw'n berthnasol.

**Datganiad ar yr Wybodaeth Ddiweddaraf am yr Adroddiad Grant Arbennig ar  
Daliadau i Fusnesau wedi Argyfwng Clwy'r Traed a'r Genau  
Statement on the Special Grant Report Update on Payment to Business following  
the Foot and Mouth Disease Crisis**

**The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart):** Yesterday, I announced my intention to reallocate unspent special grant money between local authorities to ensure that businesses in the worst hit areas get the financial support that they need. Contrary to recent inaccurate and misleading statements in the national press, I have always made it clear that I would review how the special grant money had been spent. That review has now commenced. Clearly, to be able to do so I need to know from authorities how much of their allocations they expect to use. We have written to all local authorities asking them to let us know whether they have unused money that we can redistribute to those areas whose economies continue to suffer as a result of the outbreak.

In light of that information and the latest evidence on the impact of foot and mouth disease on rural businesses, I will decide how best to target the reallocation of grant money to help those who are struggling to survive.

**Nick Bourne:** I thank the Minister for coming forward with that statement because initially there had been no intention to make a statement after her announcement yesterday. I am grateful for her change of heart. On yesterday's announcement and this statement, there is no certainty of a substantial sum being underspent. We do not yet know how much local authorities will not commit and I am concerned that we will not know, with certainty, what that underspend will be until the end of July. In a previous statement, you gave local authorities until the end of July to commit the money. I am concerned that, in the interim, between the end of June—which is the period covered in your original announcement of £12 million—and the end of July or perhaps into August,

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart):** Ddoe, cyhoeddais fy mwriad i ailddyrranu arian grant arbennig heb ei wario ymysg awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau fod busnesau yn yr ardaloedd sydd yn dioddef fwyaf yn cael y cymorth ariannol sydd ei angen arnynt. Yn wahanol i ddatganiadau anghywir a chamarweiniol diweddar yn y wasg genedlaethol, yr wyf wastad wedi egluro y byddwn yn adolygu sut y cafodd yr arian grant arbennig ei wario. Mae'r adolygiad hwnnw wedi cychwyn bellach. Mae'n amlwg, er mwyn gallu gwneud hynny bod angen i mi wybod gan awdurdodau faint o'u dyraniadau maent yn disgwyl ei ddefnyddio. Yr ydym wedi ysgrifennu at bob awdurdod lleol yn gofyn iddynt roi gwybod inni a oes ganddynt unrhyw arian heb ei ddefnyddio y gallwn ei ailddosbarthu i'r ardaloedd hynny y mae eu heconomiâu yn parhau i ddioddef o ganlyniad i'r argyfwng.

Yng ngoleuni'r wybodaeth honno a'r dystiolaeth ddiweddaraf ar effaith clwy'r traed a'r genau ar fusnesau gwledig, byddaf yn penderfynu pa un yw'r ffordd orau o dargedu ailddyrianiad yr arian grant i helpu'r rhai hynny sydd yn cael trafferth i oroesi.

**Nick Bourne:** Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am wneud y datganiad hwnnw am nad oedd unrhyw fwriad i ddechrau i wneud datganiad, ar ôl ei chyhoeddiad ddoe. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar iddi am newid ei meddwl. O ran cyhoeddiad ddoe a'r datganiad hwn, nid yw'n bendant y bydd tanwariant sylweddol. Ni wyddom eto faint o arian na fydd awdurdodau lleol yn ei ymrwymo ac yr wyf yn bryderus na fyddwn yn gwybod, yn bendant, beth fydd y tanwariant hwnnw tan ddiwedd Gorffennaf. Mewn datganiad blaenorol, cafodd awdurdodau lleol tan ddiwedd Gorffennaf i ymrwymo'r arian. Yr wyf yn bryderus, yn y cyfamser, rhwng diwedd Mehefin—sef y cyfnod a gwmpesir yn eich datganiad gwreiddiol o £12 miliwn— a diwedd Gorffennaf neu efallai i mewn i



many businesses will go to the wall. Businesses in Powys and Monmouthshire particularly, but it is also true in other parts of rural Wales. However large the underspend—and I do not think that it will be terribly large in relation to the £12 million—it will not skim the surface of what is necessary for those businesses in mid Wales.

After the recent cases in Libanus, there is a continuing problem in Brecon and Radnorshire and also in other parts of Wales. It continues to have an effect. Will you announce fresh monies? I think that that was your original intention when you made the first statement. You made it clear that you would come up with fresh monies, if required, over and above the £12 million. That is clearly necessary and, bearing in mind that the Assembly rises for the summer recess next week, it is appropriate that you should give an indication of when that announcement will be made, and of what parameters of financial assistance you are considering. Many businesses are in danger of shedding staff or going into liquidation, and they are waiting for a lead on this matter, Minister. I would be grateful if you would take up those points.

**Edwina Hart:** I am aware of the problems of the impact on rural businesses. I am also particularly concerned about Ynys Môn and Gwynedd. I think that Dafydd Wigley originally raised the issue of reviewing the scheme when we had our first debate on this. I have discussed the wider implications of foot and mouth disease with Carwyn Jones, and the type of strategy that is emerging from the rural partnership. Based on the latest information available on the disease and its impact on local communities, I will consider positively what needs to be done. I am hopeful that when the rural partnership reports, I will be able to bring together a complete package that will help to ease the burden in these economies.

**Janet Ryder:** I welcome this statement, but a number of questions arise from it. You said that you do not know exactly how much this

Awst, y bydd llawer o fusnesau'n mynd i'r wal. Busnesau ym Mhowys a Sir Fynwy yn enwedig, ond y mae hefyd yn wir mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru wledig. Pa mor fawr bynnag yw'r tanwariant—ac ni chredaf y bydd yn arbennig o fawr mewn perthynas â'r £12 miliwn—ni fydd yn effeithio fawr ddim ar y busnesau hynny yng nghanolbarth Cymru.

Ar ôl yr achosion diweddar yn Libanus, mae problem barhaol ym Mrycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed a hefyd mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru. Mae'n parhau i gael effaith. A fyddwch yn cyhoeddi arian ychwanegol? Credaf mai dyna oedd eich bwriad gwreiddiol pan wnaethoch y datganiad cyntaf. Eglurasoch y byddech yn cyflwyno arian newydd, os byddai angen, yn ychwanegol at y £12 miliwn. Mae'n amlwg fod hynny'n angenrheidiol ac, o ystyried fod tymor y Cynulliad yn dod i ben ar gyfer gwyliau'r haf yr wythnos nesaf, mae'n briodol y dylech roi arwydd ynghylch pryd y cyhoeddir hwnnw, a pha ffiniau o gymorth ariannol yr ystyriwch. Mae llawer o fusnesau mewn perygl o golli staff neu ddiddymu ei hun, ac maent yn aros am arweiniad ar y mater, Weinidog. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar os gallech ystyried y pwyntiau hyn.

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o broblemau'r effaith ar fusnesau gwledig. Yr wyf hefyd yn arbennig o bryderus ynghylch Ynys Môn a Gwynedd. Credaf mai Dafydd Wigley yn wreiddiol a gododd y mater o adolygu'r cynllun pan gawsom ein dadl gyntaf ar hyn. Yr wyf wedi trafod goblygiadau ehangach clwy'r traed a'r genau gyda Carwyn Jones, a'r math o strategaeth sydd yn deillio o'r bartneriaeth wledig. Yn seiliedig ar yr wybodaeth ddiweddaraf sydd ar gael ar y clwyf a'i effaith ar gymunedau lleol, byddaf yn ystyried yn gadarnhaol beth sydd angen ei wneud. Yr wyf yn obeithiol pan fydd y bartneriaeth wledig yn cyflwyno'i adroddiad, y byddaf yn gallu dod â phhecyn cyflawn ynghyd a fydd yn helpu i leddfu'r baich yn yr economïau hyn.

**Janet Ryder:** Croesawaf y datganiad hwn, ond cyfyd nifer o gwestiynau ohono. Dywedoch nad ydych yn gwybod union faint

underspend will be, but it is more worrying that you do not know how you will distribute it. You have come to the position where you must redistribute money that has not been spent because the original formula was based on the number of businesses, not on the local authorities' needs at the time. How will you now assess that need, Minister? What formula will you use, and how will you distribute that money according to need? Will you give a commitment today that when you have assessed that need—it will be an ever increasing need as the year drags on, as we will not see an early end to foot and mouth disease or the rural crisis—you will come forward with a package of new money to help rural areas out of the crisis that they now face?

**Edwina Hart:** The luxury of opposition is always being able to ask Ministers for a commitment and to offer advice on what is best in terms of financial management. I will not give that commitment in response to Janet's churlish comments today. I made an announcement in terms of the partnership council yesterday to the relevant people in local government with whom I will discuss the underspend. I did not make a mistake in my original allocation, I decided to do it according to a formula because that was a satisfactory means at the time. It was a matter of equity. We were not exactly sure about the type of businesses that would be affected or about the disease's impact. That is why we did it. I always said that I would review the scheme. Some local authorities have already indicated to me that they have not used the money available to them. I have already held discussions with the Minister for Rural Affairs on where the rurality issues in making these calculations for additional money will perhaps need to be considered. However, I will certainly not give a commitment today that will bind me. At the end of the day, I must assess the total package that will be available. It is essential that we do that on the basis of the accurate information that we are currently collating. That does not go far enough perhaps for all of you in the Chamber, but financial decisions must be made in the best interests

y tanwariant hwn, ond yr wyf yn poeni mwy na wyddoch sut y byddwch yn ei ddosbarthu. Daethoch i'r sefyllfa lle y mae'n rhaid ichi aiddosbarthu arian na chafodd ei wario oherwydd y seiliwyd y fformwla wreiddiol ar nifer y busnesau, nid ar anghenion yr awdurdodau lleol ar y pryd. Sut y byddwch yn asesu'r angen hwnnw, Weinidog? Pa fformwla fyddwch chi'n ei ddefnyddio, a sut y byddwch yn dosbarthu'r arian hwnnw yn ôl yr angen? A wnewch ymrwymiad heddiw, pan fyddwch wedi asesu'r angen hwnnw—bydd yn angen byth gynyddol wrth i'r flwyddyn fynd yn ei blaen, am na fyddwn yn gweld diwedd i glwy'r traed a'r genau yn fuan na'r argyfwng gwledig—y byddwch yn cyflwyno pecyn o arian newydd i helpu ardaloedd gwledig allan o'r argyfwng a wynebant yn awr?

**Edwina Hart:** Mantais bod yn yr wrthblaid yw gallu gofyn i Weinidogion am ymrwymiad a chynnig cyngor ar yr hyn sydd orau o ran rheolaeth ariannol. Ni wnaif yr ymrwymiad hwnnw mewn ymateb i sylwadau anfoesgar Janet heddiw. Gwneuthum gyhoeddiad o ran y cyngor partneriaeth ddoe i'r bobl berthnasol mewn llywodraeth leol y byddaf yn trafod y tanwariant â hwy. Ni wneuthum gangymeriad yn fy nyraniad gwreiddiol, penderfynais ei wneud yn ôl fformwla oherwydd bod hynny'n fodd boddhaol ar y pryd. Mater o ecwiti ydoedd. Nid oeddem yn siŵr am y mathau o fusnesau fyddai'n cael eu heffeithio nag am effaith y clwyf. Dyna pam y gwnaethom hynny. Dywedais o hyd y byddwn yn adolygu'r cynllun. Mae rhai awdurdodau lleol wedi dweud wrthyf eisoes nad ydynt wedi defnyddio'r arian sydd ar gael iddynt. Yr wyf wedi cynnal trafodaethau eisoes gyda'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig ar ble y bydd angen ystyried materion gwledigrwydd wrth wneud y cyfrifon hyn ar gyfer arian ychwanegol. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bendant na fyddaf yn rhoi ymrwymiad heddiw fydd yn fy rhwymo. Ar ddiwedd y dydd, rhaid imi asesu'r pecyn cyflawn fydd ar gael. Mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn gwneud hynny ar sail yr wybodaeth gywir a gasglwn ynghyd ar hyn o bryd. Efallai nad yw hynny'n mynd yn ddigon pell i bawb yn y Siambr, ond rhaid gwneud

of all.

**Kirsty Williams:** Thank you, Minister, for your statement and I welcome the news that you intend to reallocate unspent business rate support. I take your point about how the initial allocation had to be distributed fairly across Wales, because at that time the whole country was badly hit, especially in terms of tourism. Negative images were portrayed of the whole of Wales. However, now that you have given a commitment to consider targeting resources, will you accept Powys's case, which has experienced more cases of foot and mouth disease than any other part of Wales? Powys continues to experience outbreaks in the Libanus area. The effects of that have been that we have been unable to resume normal trading in tourism, which was possible to achieve in areas like Pembrokeshire and Snowdonia, where paths have been reopened. The paths in Pen-y-fan and that area of the Brecon Beacons remain closed and will remain so for a considerable period of time while flocks continue to be tested. Therefore, Powys is a special case.

2:50 p.m.

We welcome the money that will be left over. Businesses are awaiting that money. Powys County Council has overspent its allocation and there are businesses on hold. They have been promised more resources should they become available from the Assembly. The quicker we arrange those reallocations, the better for the businesses waiting for the news that we received today.

Will you consider the longer-term prospects for rural business in discussing a rural recovery plan with your colleagues in economic development, agriculture and the rural partnership? Will you also consider the report compiled by Powys County Council that outlined the need for some £23 million over the next two to three years? It is only that kind of investment in Powys that will save the rural economy for people living and working in that area.

**Edwina Hart:** I would be delighted to meet

penderyniadau ariannol er budd pawb.

**Kirsty Williams:** Diolch, Weinidog, am eich datganiad a chroesawaf y newyddion eich bod yn bwriadu ailddyranu'r cymorth treth busnes na chafodd ei wario. Derbynaf eich pwynt ynghylch sut yr oedd rhaid dosbarthu'r dyraniad gwreiddiol yn deg ledled Cymru, oherwydd ar y pryd yr oedd y wlad gyfan wedi cael ei tharo'n galed, yn enwedig o ran twristiaeth. Portreadwyd darluniau negyddol o Gymru gyfan. Fodd bynnag, nawr eich bod wedi rhoi ymrwymiad i ystyried targedu adnoddau, a dderbyniwch achos Powys, a gafodd fwy o achosion o glwy'r traed a'r genau nag unman arall yng Nghymru? Mae Powys yn parhau i gael achosion yn ardal Libanus. Effaith hynny oedd na allem barhau i fasnachu'n arferol mewn twristiaeth, yr oedd yn bosibl ei gyflawni mewn ardaloedd fel Sir Benfro ac Eryri, lle cafodd llwybrau eu hailagor. Mae'r llwybrau ym Mhen-y-fan a'r ardal honno ym Mannau Brycheiniog ar gau o hyd, a byddant yn parhau i fod ar gau am gyfnod sylweddol tra cynhelir profion ar breiddiau. Felly, mae Powys yn achos arbennig.

Croesawn yr arian a fydd dros ben. Mae busnesau yn aros am yr arian hwnnw. Mae Cyngor Sir Powys wedi gorwario ei ddyraniad ac mae busnesau yn dal i aros. Addawyd mwy o adnoddau iddynt os byddant ar gael gan y Cynulliad. Po gyflymaf y trefnwn y dyraniadau hyn, y gorau fydd y sefyllfa i'r busnesau sydd yn disgwyl y newyddion a dderbyniwyd heddiw.

A ystyriwch y posibilidadau hirdymor ar gyfer busnesau gwledig wrth drafod cynllun adfer gwledig gyda'ch cyd-Aelodau o fewn datblygiad economaidd, amaethyddiaeth a'r bartneriaeth wledig? A ystyriwch hefyd yr adroddiad a luniwyd gan Gyngor Sir Powys oedd yn amlinellu'r angen am tua £23 miliwn dros y ddwy neu dair blynedd nesaf? Dim ond buddsoddiad o'r fath ym Mhowys wnaiff achub yr economi wledig i bobl sydd yn byw ac yn gweithio yn yr ardal honno.

**Edwina Hart:** Byddwn wrth fy modd yn

with representatives of Powys County Council and yourself, if you wish, to discuss the nature of its report. It might be useful to get a feel of the situation from somebody in the front line. Although we say the right words in the Chamber, we are not as close to the situation as people in the various communities.

It is also important to recognise that we made the first payment on the basis of impact on the tourist trade. I am well aware of the impact that the crisis has had on Powys businesses. When I booked to go to the Brecon Jazz Festival with my husband, I discussed with the people with whom we were booking the difficulties of small businesses in that area. It is essential that we recognise that businesses in Powys, Gwynedd and other areas of the country have been adversely affected. In the first instance, I intend to examine the underspend position of other authorities, and then develop an integrated package with the assistance of the Minister for Rural Affairs.

**Alun Cairns:** We welcome this statement and the reallocation of funds. It is clear from evidence on the ground that rural businesses need this money. What lessons are you learning from local authorities that have been more successful than others in distributing funds?

**Edwina Hart:** I have officials working on that issue at the moment. However—let us be frank about it—some local authorities have not delivered as well as others. It is essential that valuable lessons are learnt from the simple criteria utilised by some authorities that got the money out of the door quickly. It is important that we consider that.

After recess, I would be happy to report to the Local Government and Housing Committee about issues that have arisen in the distribution of this money. It would be useful to have further discussion on that.

**Brian Gibbons:** In view of Alun Cairns's and Janet Ryder's comments, how many local authorities have contacted you,

cwrdd â chynrychiolwyr o Gyngor Sir Powys a chwithau, os dymunwch, i drafod natur yr adroddiad hwn. Gallai fod yn ddefnyddiol i gael ymdeimlad o'r sefyllfa gan rywun yn y rheng flaen. Er ein bod yn dweud y geiriau cywir yn y Siambr, nid ydym mor agos at y sefyllfa â phobl yn y cymunedau amrywiol.

Mae hefyd yn bwysig cydnabod ein bod wedi gwneud y taliad cyntaf ar sail effaith ar y fasnach twristiaeth. Yr wyf yn hollol ymwybodol o'r effaith a gafodd yr argyfwng ar fusnesau ym Mhowys. Pan archebais docynnau i fynd i Wyl Jazz Aberhonddu gyda'm gŵr, trafodais anawsterau busnesau bach yn yr ardal honno â'r bobl yr oeddem yn archebu tocynnau ganddynt. Mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn cydnabod y cafwyd effaith niweidiol ar fusnesau ym Mhowys, Gwynedd ac ardaloedd eraill o'r wlad. I ddechrau, bwriadaf archwilio sefyllfa tanwariant awdurdodau eraill, ac yna datblygu pecyn integredig gyda chymorth y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig.

**Alun Cairns:** Croesawn y datganiad hwn a'r ailddyrianiad arian. Mae'n glir o'r dystiolaeth sylfaenol fod angen yr arian hwn ar fusnesau gwledig. Pa wersi yr ydych chi'n eu dysgu gan awdurdodau lleol a fu'n fwy llwyddiannus nag eraill wrth ddsbarthu arian?

**Edwina Hart:** Mae gennyf swyddogion yn gweithio ar y mater hwnnw ar y funud. Fodd bynnag—gadewch inni fod yn agored am hyn—nid yw rhai awdurdodau lleol wedi cyflawni cystal ag eraill. Mae'n hanfodol dysgu gwersi gwerthfawr o'r meini prawf syml a ddefnyddir gan rai awdurdodau a ddefnyddiodd yr arian yn gyflym. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn ystyried hynny.

Ar ôl y toriad, byddwn yn hapus i gyflwyno adroddiad i'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai ar faterion a godwyd wrth ddsbarthu'r arian hwn. Byddai'n ddefnyddiol cael trafodaeth bellach ar hynny.

**Brian Gibbons:** O ystyried sylwadau Alun Cairns a Janet Ryder, sawl awdurdod lleol a gysylltodd â chi, yn cwyno eu bod wedi

complaining that they have had to overspend their allocation, to date?

**Edwina Hart:** None.

**Karen Sinclair:** When you consider targeting, will you look at the small rural craft businesses that depend heavily on shows for their income? I have seen cases where business people have lost 50 per cent of their income because shows have been cancelled and because of the knock-on effect of non-existent passing trade. These people are going to the wall fast.

**Edwina Hart:** I will consider that. Such businesses are an integral part of our shows. The various businesses that trade at the Royal Welsh Show in Builth Wells, and at other shows in our constituencies, have been hit and craft people have been adversely affected. We want to assist such small businesses through this difficult period so that they will be in business next year.

gorfod gorwario eu dyraniad, hyd yma?

**Edwina Hart:** Dim un.

**Karen Sinclair:** Pan fyddwch yn ystyried targedu, a wnewch edrych ar fusnesau crefftau bach gwledig sydd yn dibynnu'n drwm ar sioeau ar gyfer eu hincwm? Gwelais achosion o bobl fusnes yn colli 50 y cant o'u hincwm oherwydd bod sioeau wedi'u canslo ac oherwydd effaith ddilynol diffyg masnach gan gwsmeriaid sydd yn mynd heibio. Mae'r bobl hyn yn mynd i'r wal yn gyflym.

**Edwina Hart:** Ystyriaf hynny. Mae busnesau o'r fath yn rhan hanfodol o'n sioeau. Effeithiwyd yn galed ar y busnesau amrywiol a'r crefftwyr sydd yn masnachu yn y Sioe Amaethyddol Frenhinol yn Llanelwedd, ac mewn sioeau eraill yn ein hetholaethau. Yr ydym am gynorthwyo busnesau bach o'r fath yn ystod y cyfnod anodd hwn fel y byddant yn dal i fasnachu y flwyddyn nesaf.

### **Datganiad Busnes Business Statement**

**The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies):** Before turning to the next three weeks' business statement, I inform Members of changes to this week's business.

Following representations from the Business Committee and the Chair of the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee to reschedule before the summer recess the debate on the Committee's report on the diversification of the rural economy that was postponed on 28 June, I have made time available for that debate on Thursday 12 July. Unfortunately, I have been unable to allocate an hour for the debate, but approximately 45 minutes will be available to debate the report.

Turning to the next three weeks' business, the Business Committee agreed the business for the next three weeks at its meeting this morning as shown on the Chamberweb under 'supporting documents'.

**Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies):** Cyn troi at ddatganiad busnes y tair wythnos nesaf, hysbysaf yr Aelodau ynglŷn â'r newidiadau i fusnes yr wythnos hon.

Yn dilyn sylwadau gan y Pwyllgor Busnes a Chadeirydd y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig ar gyfer aildrefnu'r ddadl ar adroddiad y Pwyllgor ar arallgyfeirio'r economi wledig a ohiriwyd ar 28 Mehefin cyn toriad yr haf, yr wyf wedi trefnu bod amser ar gael ar gyfer y ddadl honno ddydd Iau 12 Gorffennaf. Yn anffodus, ni allwn roi awr ar gyfer y ddadl, ond bydd tua 45 munud ar gael er mwyn cynnal dadl ar yr adroddiad.

Gan droi at fusnes y tair wythnos nesaf, cytunodd y Pwyllgor Busnes yn ei gyfarfod y bore 'ma ynglŷn â'r busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y dangosir ar We'r Siambr o dan 'dogfennau ategol'.

Following this morning's Business Committee meeting, the Deputy Presiding Officer has determined under Standing Order No. 22.5 that the Feeding Stuffs and the Feeding Stuffs (Enforcement) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2001 Order need not be referred to a Subject Committee for extended consideration.

I will make arrangements for this statement to be posted to the intranet and the internet.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes? Gwelaf nad oes. A oes unrhyw sylwadau ar y datganiad busnes?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I think that you are aware, Andrew, that Standing Order No. 2.4 allows the First Minister to make a statement in Plenary about changes to the Assembly Cabinet, changes in ministerial responsibility and changes in the designation of Cabinet posts. Why did you not allow him to make a statement on this matter today?

**Alun Cairns:** The economic development portfolio is undergoing severe strain with the conclusion of the consultation on the national economic development strategy last Friday. Sensitive negotiations are being held with the Treasury on operating aids. Do you agree that a full-time Minister for Economic Development is required and that it would be sensible to make a statement on this point?

**Andrew Davies:** The First Minister issued a written statement about the Cabinet changes and the economic development portfolio as a result of the Deputy First Minister stepping aside last week.

Yn dilyn cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, penderfynodd y Dirprwy Lywydd o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.5 nad oes angen cyfeirio Gorchymyn Rheoliadau Diwygio Rheoliadau Porthiant (Cymru) a Rheoliadau Porthiant (Gorfodi) (Cymru) 2001 at Bwyllgor Pwnc ar gyfer ystyriaeth estynedig.

Byddaf yn gwneud trefniadau i osod y datganiad hwn ar y fewnwyd a'r rhyngwyd.

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there any objections to the business statement. I see that there are none. Are there any comments on the business statement?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Credaf eich bod yn ymwybodol, Andrew, fod Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 2.4 yn caniatáu i Brif Weinidog Cymru wneud datganiad yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ynglŷn â newidiadau i Gabinet y Cynulliad, newidiadau mewn cyfrifoldebau gweinidogol a newidiadau i swydd ddisgrifiadau'r Cabinet. Pam na chafodd ganiatâd gennych i wneud datganiad ar y mater hwn heddiw?

**Alun Cairns:** Mae'r portffolio datblygu economaidd o dan straen ddifrifol yn dilyn diwedd yr ymgynghori ar y strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol ddydd Gwener. Cynhelir trafodaethau sensitif gyda'r Trysorlys ynglŷn â chymhorthion gweithredu. A gytunwch fod angen Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd llawn amser ac y byddai'n synhwyrol gwneud datganiad ar y pwynt hwn?

**Andrew Davies:** Cyhoeddodd Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ysgrifenedig ynglŷn â'r newidiadau yn y Cabinet a'r portffolio datblygu economaidd o ganlyniad i'r ffaith bod Dirprwy Brif Weinidog Cymru wedi camu o'r neilltu yr wythnos diwethaf.

### **Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order**

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I raise this point of order following the Minister for Assembly Business' reply to my question about the business statement. The benefit of a written statement to the Government is that the First

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Codaf y pwynt o drefn hwn yn dilyn ateb y Trefnydd i'm cwestiwn ynglŷn â'r datganiad busnes. Mantais datganiad ysgrifenedig i'r Llywodraeth yw'r ffaith nad yw Prif Weinidog Cymru yn

Minister does not have to stand before the Assembly to answer questions on that statement. Standing Order No. 2.4 states that the First Minister, having appointed his Cabinet, should inform the Assembly of its membership, and should also

‘notify the Assembly of any changes as soon as possible after they have been made.’

You will be aware of the precedents set in the Assembly when changes to the Cabinet were made. When Alun Michael, as First Secretary, appointed the Assembly’s first Cabinet, he made an oral statement on its membership. When the First Minister appointed his coalition Cabinet, he also made an oral statement. We need to know, therefore—and I ask you to rule whether the precedent should have been changed in this instance—why is the First Minister not prepared to answer the Assembly’s questions on the significant changes to his Cabinet?

There are two crucial questions that he must answer. The first is why has he taken over the economic development portfolio when he was criticised heavily, inside and outside the Assembly, for doing so previously? He seems to be repeating his own errors. Secondly, we are entitled to know why has a new post been created without the Assembly knowing anything about it? We had a Deputy First Minister, but now we have an Acting Deputy First Minister. Are we not entitled to know what the role of the Acting Deputy First Minister will be? Will Jenny Randerson deputise for the First Minister during Assembly questions, chair the Cabinet in his absence or attend functions in his place? We are entitled to an answer to those questions. Why is the First Minister so frit? Why does he not come to answer the Assembly’s questions, rather than hiding behind a written answer?

**The First Minister:** Ieuan, the Code of Conduct for Assembly Secretaries states that the Assembly must be informed in writing,

gorfod sefyll gerbron y Cynulliad yn ateb cwestiynau ynglŷn â’r datganiad hwnnw. Mae Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 2.4 yn datgan y dylai Prif Weinidog Cymru, ar ôl penodi ei Gabinet, hysbysu’r Cynulliad ynglŷn â’i aelodaeth, ac y dylai hefyd

‘hysbysu’r Cynulliad am unrhyw newidiadau cyn gynted â phosibl wedi iddynt gael eu gwneud.’

Byddwch yn ymwybodol o’r cynseiliau a osodwyd yn y Cynulliad pan wnaethpwyd newidiadau i’r Cabinet. Pan benododd Alun Michael, fel Prif Ysgrifennydd, Gabinet cyntaf y Cynulliad, gwnaeth ddatganiad llafar ar ei aelodaeth. Pan benododd Prif Weinidog Cymru ei Gabinet clymblaid, gwnaeth yntau ddatganiad llafar hefyd. Mae angen inni wybod, felly—a gofynnaf ichi ddyfarnu a ddylid fod wedi newid y cynsail yn yr achos hwn—pam nad yw Prif Weinidog Cymru yn barod i ateb cwestiynau’r Cynulliad ynglŷn â’r newidiadau arwyddocaol i’w Gabinet?

Mae dau gwestiwn allweddol y mae’n rhaid iddo eu hateb. Y cyntaf yw pam iddo gymryd y portffolio datblygu economaidd drosodd pan gafodd ei feirniadu’n llym, y tu fewn a’r tu allan i’r Cynulliad, am wneud hynny o’r blaen? Ymddengys ei fod yn ailadrodd ei gamgymeriadau ei hun. Yn ail, mae hawl gennym i wybod pam bod swydd newydd wedi ei chreu heb i unrhyw un o fewn y Cynulliad wybod amdani? Yr oedd gennym Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog Cymru, ond bellach Dirprwy Brif Weinidog Gweithredol sydd gennym. Onid oes hawl gennym wybod beth fydd rôl y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog Gweithredol? A fydd Jenny Randerson yn dirprwyo dros y Prif Weinidog yn ystod cwestiynau’r Cynulliad, yn cadeirio’r Cabinet yn ei absenoldeb neu’n mynychu digwyddiadau yn ei le? Mae gennym hawl i gael atebion i’r cwestiynau hynny. Pam bod y Prif Weinidog mor ofnus? Pam na ddaw i ateb cwestiynau’r Cynulliad, yn hytrach na chuddio y tu ôl i ateb ysgrifenedig?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ieuan, mae’r Cod Ymddygiad ar gyfer Ysgrifenyddion y Cynulliad yn datgan y dylid hysbysu’r

not orally, of changes to the subject responsibility of Assembly Secretaries.

**Y Llywydd:** Gofynnodd Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid imi roi fy marn ar hyn. Fodd bynnag, atebodd y Prif Weinidog ar fy rhan, i raddau. Cyfeiria Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 2.4 at hysbysu'r Cynulliad ynglŷn ag unrhyw newidiadau i'r Cabinet. O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 33.1, gellid hysbysu Aelodau drwy ddulliau electronig. Felly, gan fod y Prif Weinidog wedi hysbysu'r Cynulliad, cydymffurfiodd â'r Rheolau Sefydlog.

3:00 p.m.

**Nick Bourne:** Further to that point of order, I cannot help feeling that we are seeing history repeat itself, following the discourtesy that we suffered last week when the First Minister departed the Chamber when we were dealing with this matter. There are important issues to— [*Interruption.*] Perhaps the Cabinet does not think that they are important. However, this matter relates to the running of Wales.

It strikes me as extraordinary that these changes were announced without an opportunity for the First Minister to explain his reasoning. How temporary is his responsibility for the Economic Development portfolio, for example? This is a significant development, and we have not had an opportunity to discuss it in the Chamber. I am surprised that you are still here, First Minister, because you are usually gone by this point. I find it staggering that you are in a position to—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I remind the Leader of the Welsh Conservatives that he is not addressing the First Minister. His discourse is, I believe, directed towards me.

**Nick Bourne:** You are absolutely right, Presiding Officer. However, through you, I ask the First Minister again to explain his thinking behind holding the Economic Development portfolio. He has indicated that it will only be temporary. Is he in a position

Cynulliad yn ysgrifenedig, ac nid ar lafar, ynglŷn â newidiadau i briod ddyletswyddau Ysgrifenyddion y Cynulliad.

**The Presiding Officer:** The Leader of the Opposition asked me to give my ruling. However, the First Minister has answered on my behalf, to a certain extent. Standing Order No. 2.4 refers to notifying the Assembly of any changes to the Cabinet. Under Standing Order No. 33.1, Members can be informed by electronic means. Therefore, as the First Minister has informed the Assembly, he has conformed to Standing Orders.

**Nick Bourne:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, ni allaf ond teimlo y gwelwn hanes yn ailadrodd ei hun, yn dilyn yr anghwrteisi a ddioddefasom yr wythnos diwethaf pan adawodd y Prif Weinidog y Siambr wrth inni ymdrin â'r mater hwn. Mae materion pwysig i'w— [*Torri ar draws.*] Efallai nad yw'r Cabinet yn eu hystyried yn bwysig. Fodd bynnag, mae'r mater hwn yn ymwneud â llywodraethu Cymru.

Mae'n anhygoel yn fy marn i y cyhoeddwyd y newidiadau hyn heb i Brif Weinidog Cymru gael y cyfle i egluro'i resymeg. Pa mor barhaol yw ei gyfrifoldeb dros y portffolio Datblygu Economaidd, er enghraifft? Dyma ddatblygiad arwyddocaol, ac ni chawsom gyfle i'w drafod yn y Siambr. Synnaf eich bod yn dal yma, Brif Weinidog, gan y byddwch wedi ein gadael erbyn hyn fel arfer. Yr wyf yn ei chael yn syfrdanol eich bod mewn sefyllfa i—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Atgoffaf Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru nad yw'n annerch y Prif Weinidog. Credaf fod ei anerchiad wedi ei gyfeiro tuag ataf i.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr ydych yn hollol gywir, Lywydd. Fodd bynnag, drwyddoch chi, gofynnaf i'r Prif Weinidog unwaith eto i egluro'i feddylfryd y tu ôl i ddal y portffolio Datblygu Economaidd. Dynododd mai dros dro yn unig a fydd. A ydyw mewn sefyllfa i



to tell us how temporary that will be? Is he in a position, as previously asked, to tell us about the new post—the longer the title, the more meaningless the post—of Acting Deputy First Minister? What role does that post have? It is not contained in Standing Orders. We should be entitled to ask such questions in this Chamber, and we should also be entitled to hear the answers. Why will he not answer? We are in the same position as we were last week.

**The Presiding Officer:** The First Minister has heard your comments and can make a statement on the matter at any time in the Assembly, should he so wish. It is a matter entirely for him.

**Cynog Dafis:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, dyfarnoch bod y Prif Weinidog yn cadw at lythyren y gyfraith, fel petai. Ond, beth am ysbryd y gyfraith? Byddai dyn yn dymuno gweld Prif Weinidog agored a pharod i ateb yn llawn dros ei weithredoedd yn y mater hwn.

Fodd bynnag, mae llythyren y gyfraith yn bwysig, a gobeithiwn fod holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn cadw at lythyren y gyfraith ym mhob mater.

Codaf fater arall, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 2.4, sydd yn dwued mae'r Prif Weinidog sydd i ddewis aelodau ei Gabinet. Mae'r aelodau hynny wedyn yn derbyn pwerau wedi eu dirprwyo gan y Prif Weinidog—pwerau a ddirprwywyd iddo ef gan y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, yn ôl adroddiad yn *The Western Mail*, Mike German a benododd Jenny Randerson fel Dirprwy Brif Weinidog. Efallai bod *The Western Mail* yn anghywir. Byddai'n dda gennyf gael cadarnhad o hynny.

A wnewch chi, Lywydd, ddyfarnu ar briodoldeb y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn gadael ei swydd ac yn penodi ei olynydd, yn hytrach na bod y Prif Weinidog yn gwneud hynny? A wnewch chi hefyd ddyfarnu ar natur y cyfrifoldebau sydd wedi eu dirprwyo i Jenny Randerson? Pa awdurdod sydd gan

ddweud wrthym pa mor barhaol fydd hynny? A yw mewn sefyllfa, fel y gofynnwyd eisoes, i ddweud wrthym am swydd newydd—po hiraf y teitl, y mwyaf diystyr y swydd—Dirprwy Brif Weinidog Cymru Gweithredol? Pa rôl sydd gan y swydd? Nid yw wedi ei chynnwys yn y Rheolau Sefydlog. Dylai fod gennym yr hawl i ofyn cwestiynau o'r fath yn y Siambr, a dylai bod hawl gennym hefyd i glywed yr atebion. Pam na wnaiff ateb? Yr ydym yn yr un sefyllfa ag yr oeddem yr wythnos diwethaf.

**Y Llywydd:** Clywodd Prif Weinidog Cymru eich sylwadau a chaiff wneud datganiad ar y mater ar unrhyw adeg yn y Cynulliad, pe byddai'n dymuno. Mae'n fater iddo ef yn llwyr.

**Cynog Dafis:** Further to that point of order, you have ruled that the First Minister should keep to the letter of the law, as it were. However, what about the spirit of the law? One would wish to see a First Minister behaving in a transparent manner and ready to be fully answerable for his actions in this matter.

However, the letter of the law is important, and one hopes that all Assembly Members keep to the letter of the law in all matters.

I raise another matter, under Standing Order No. 2.4, which states that the First Minister is to appoint the members of his Cabinet. Those members then obtain powers delegated from the First Minister, which were delegated to him by the Assembly. However, according to a report in *The Western Mail*, it was Mike German who appointed Jenny Randerson as Deputy First Minister. Perhaps *The Western Mail* is wrong. I would appreciate confirmation of that.

Will you, Presiding Officer, give a ruling on the appropriateness of the Deputy First Minister leaving his post and appointing his successor, rather than the First Minister doing so? Will you also give a ruling on the nature of the responsibilities delegated to Jenny Randerson? What authority does the

swydd y Prif Weinidog, a deiliad presennol y swydd, Rhodri Morgan? Onid yw'n codi amheuon difrifol ynglŷn â'r materion hyn: y swydd a deiliad y swydd?

**Y Llywydd:** Nid wyf yn bwriadu dyfarnu ar gynnwys *The Western Mail* neu byddwn yma drwy'r dydd. Mae cyfrifoldebau'r Prif Weinidog, dosbarthiad y cyfrifoldebau hynny, a phenodi Gweinidogion, yn faterion i'r Prif Weinidog. Mater i'r Prif Weinidog hefyd yw gosod maes gorchwyl y Gweinidogion a hysbysu'r Cynulliad ynglŷn â hynny.

Y mae bob amser yn fater o ddiddordeb i'r Aelodau i holi Gweinidogion, lle bo hynny'n briodol, a chyflwyno cwestiynau iddynt. Yn yr achos hwn, nid oes cwestiynau penodol i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog Gweithredol, ac ni chyflwynwyd cwestiynau ychwaith i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn rhinwedd y swydd honno. Gellir ond gofyn cwestiynau i Jenny Randerson ar ei phortffolio, ac ar ei haelodaeth o Bwyllgor, sef y Pwyllgor Diwylliant yn yr achos hwn.

**Rod Richards:** Further to that point of order, I seek your guidance as to whether the departed deputy still receives full ministerial pay from the Assembly or has he received a severance payment?

**The Presiding Officer:** I am afraid that the pay and conditions of Cabinet members are not a matter for me, therefore I cannot enlighten you.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Further to that point of order, I refer you to Standing Order No. 7.8, which relates to this matter. Will you rule as to whether or not the First Minister, in making his decision under Standing Order No. 2.4, has been guilty of discourteous or unbecoming conduct towards this Assembly by refusing to make a statement on his new Cabinet so that Members could question him? As was mentioned, he has always been ready to make such statements in the past. Are you concerned that in behaving in this way, he may be bringing to this Assembly bad practices that he learnt from colleagues

post of First Minister, and the current holder of the post, Rhodri Morgan hold? Does it not raise serious doubts about these matters: the post and the holder of the post?

**The Presiding Officer:** I do not intend to rule on the contents of *The Western Mail* or we would be here all day. The responsibilities of the First Minister, the delegation of those responsibilities, and the appointment of Ministers, are matters for the First Minister. It is also a matter for the First Minister to establish Ministers' portfolios and to inform the Assembly of those portfolios.

It is always of interest to Members to quiz Ministers where appropriate, and to table questions for them. In this case, there are no specific questions to the Acting Deputy First Minister, and were tabled for answer by the Deputy First Minister in relation to that post. Jenny Randerson may only be questioned on her portfolio and Committee membership, which is the Culture Committee in this case.

**Rod Richards:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, ceisiaf eich arweiniad ynglŷn ag a yw'r dirprwy ymadawedig yn derbyn tâl gweinidogol llawn gan y Cynulliad neu a dderbyniodd dâl diswyddo?

**Y Llywydd:** Ofnaf nad yw cyflog ac amodau aelodau'r Cabinet yn fater i mi, felly ni allaf daflu goleuni ar y mater.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, fe'ch cyfeiraf at Reol Sefydlog Rhif 7.8, sydd yn ymwneud â'r mater hwn. A wnewch chi ddyfarnu pa un a yw Prif Weinidog Cymru, wrth wneud ei benderfyniad o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 2.4, yn euog o ymddygiad anfoesgar neu amhriodol tuag at y Cynulliad hwn drwy wrthod gwneud datganiad ar ei Gabinet newydd fel y gall yr Aelodau ei gwestiynnu? Fel y soniwyd, bu'n barod i wneud datganiadau o'r fath yn y gorffennol. A ydych yn bryderus ei fod, wrth ymddwyn yn y modd hwn, yn dod ag arferion drwg i'r

in Westminster?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. There are good and bad practices in Westminster and some of us have been trying to bring with us the good ones. One of them, Paul Silk, is sitting to my right. On the conduct of the First Minister, or any other Assembly Member in this matter, I have not come across behaviour that is contrary to Standing Orders, otherwise I would have stopped it.

On informing the Assembly, I have already answered that point under Standing Order No. 33.1, which states that the informing may be by electronic means. That satisfies the demands of Standing Order No. 33.1.

**Alun Cairns:** Further to that point of order under Standing Order No. 2.4, my interest lies with the Assembly's economic development policy. You will be aware that the consultation period for the national economic development strategy came to an end on Friday. The Minister responsible will be involved in sensitive negotiations with the Treasury and European Commission over operating aids. Therefore, I raise this point of order to ask the First Minister how long he will continue to control economic development on an ad-hoc, part-time basis bearing in mind that we are experiencing probably one of the most important periods in terms of the economic development portfolio?

**The Presiding Officer:** The First Minister has heard this; it is not a matter for me.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Further to that point of order, I seek your guidance on the status of the post of Deputy First Minister. The First Minister is elected to his position by this Chamber. If he or she has a deputy, does it not follow that that deputy would also have to be voted into office? If there is an acting Deputy First Minister, is that continuity from the former incumbent or is it a new post?

Cynulliad hwn a ddysgodd gan ei gyd-Aelodau yn San Steffan?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ceir arferion da a drwg yn San Steffan ac mae rhai ohonom wedi bod yn ceisio dod â'r rhai da gyda ni. Mae un ohonynt, sef Paul Silk, yn eistedd ar y dde i mi. O ran ymddygiad Prif Weinidog Cymru, neu unrhyw Aelod arall o'r Cynulliad yn y mater hwn, ni ddeuthum ar draws ymddygiad sydd yn groes i'r Rheolau Sefydlog, neu byddwn wedi ei atal fel arall.

O ran hysbysu'r Cynulliad, yr wyf eisoes wedi ateb y pwynt hwnnw o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 33.1, sydd yn nodi y gellir hysbysu drwy ddulliau electronig. Mae hynny'n diwallu gofynion Rheol Sefydlog 33.1.

**Alun Cairns:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 2.4, mae fy niddordeb yn ymwneud â pholisi datblygu economaidd y Cynulliad. Byddwch yn ymwybodol y daeth y cyfnod ymgynghori ar y strategaeth datblygu economaidd i ben ddydd Gwener. Bydd y Gweinidog sydd yn gyfrifol yn rhan o drafodaethau sensitif â'r Trysorlys a'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd ynglŷn â chymhorthion gweithredu. Felly, codaf y pwynt hwn o drefn er mwyn gofyn i Brif Weinidog Cymru am ba mor hir y bydd yn parhau i reoli datblygu economaidd ar sail ad hoc, rhan amser o gofio ein bod yn mynd drwy un o'r cyfnodau pwysicaf fwy na thebyg o ran y portffolio datblygu economaidd?

**Y Llywydd:** Mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi clywed hyn; nid mater i mi ydyw.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, ceisiaf eich arweiniad ar statws swydd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog. Etholir y Prif Weinidog i'w swydd gan y Siambwr hon. Os oes ganddo ef neu hi ddirprwy, onid yw'n dilyn y byddai'n rhaid ethol y dirprwy i'w swydd hefyd? Os oes Dirprwy Brif Weinidog Gweithredol, ai parhâd o swydd y cyn ddeiliad yw hynny neu ai swydd newydd ydyw?

**The Presiding Officer:** That may appear elegant in democratic theory, but it is not required by our Standing Orders.

**David Melding:** Further to that point of order and your ruling on it, it seems that it was in order for us to receive information in writing from the First Minister sent, presumably, by electronic means. Is your office in a position to tell us when that statement was sent because, to my knowledge, I have not received anything? If it has not yet been sent, what is reasonable time, given that this decision was made some time on Thursday night and appeared in the press and all media on Friday morning?

**The Presiding Officer:** On Cabinet appointments, the wording of Standing Order No. 2.4 is 'as soon as possible'. I would rule that information relating to any changes would also be covered by that Standing Order. I would expect information of this kind to be made available as soon as possible. In fact, Standing Order No. 2.4 states that the First Minister 'shall also notify the Assembly of any changes as soon as possible'. I will not pretend to be a judge ruling on what is the meaning of 'as soon as possible', but clearly it does mean that.

**David Melding:** Further to that point of order, and I am trying to assist you, Presiding Officer, if that communication has not been made before the next Plenary Session, would not an oral statement be the soonest possible means of informing us, or must we wait an inordinate amount of time before receiving any communication at all?

3:10 p.m.

**The Presiding Officer:** It is a matter for Assembly Ministers to request to make a statement and time will be made on the agenda for that. We have exhausted this matter.

**Y Llywydd:** Efallai yr ymddengys hynny yn urddasol mewn theori ddemocrataidd, ond nid yw'n ofynnol gan ein Rheolau Sefydlog.

**David Melding:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn a'ch dyfarniad arno, ymddengys ei bod mewn trefn inni dderbyn gwybodaeth yn ysgrifenedig gan Brif Weinidog Cymru a anfonwyd, yn ôl pob tebyg, drwy ddulliau electronig. A yw eich swyddfa mewn sefyllfa i ddweud wrthym pa bryd yr anfonwyd y datganiad hwnnw gan nad wyf, hyd y gwn i, wedi derbyn unrhyw beth? Os nad yw wedi ei anfon eto, beth yw'r amser rhesymol, o gofio i'r penderfyniad hwn gael ei wneud rywdro nos Iau ac iddo ymddangos yn y wasg a'r cyfryngau i gyd fore dydd Gwener?

**Y Llywydd:** O ran penodiadau'r Cabinet, geiriad Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 2.4 yw 'cyn gynted ag y bo modd'. Dyfarnwn fod gwybodaeth sydd yn ymwneud ag unrhyw newidiadau yn cael ei gwmpasu gan y Rheol Sefydlog honno hefyd. Disgwyliwn y byddai'r math hwn o wybodaeth yn cael ei ryddhau cyn gynted ag y bo modd. Yn wir, mae Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 2.4 yn datgan y dylai Prif Weinidog Cymru 'hysbysu'r Cynulliad hefyd ynglŷn ag unrhyw newidiadau cyn gynted ag y bo modd'. Ni chymeraf arnaf fod yn farnwr yn dyfarnu ar ystyr 'cyn gynted ag y bo modd', ond y mae'n amlwg yn golygu hynny.

**David Melding:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, a cheisïaf eich cynorthwyo, Lywydd, os na cheir y cyfathrebu hwnnw cyn y Cyfarfod Llawn nesaf, onid datganiad ar lafar fyddai'r ffordd gyflymaf bosibl o'n hysbysu, neu a oes rhaid inni aros llawer gormod o amser cyn derbyn unrhyw ohebiaeth o gwbl?

**Y Llywydd:** Mater i Weinidogion y Cynulliad yw gofyn am wneud datganiad a neilltuir amser ar yr agenda ar gyfer hynny. Yr ydym wedi trafod y mater hwn hyd syrffed.

**Pauline Jarman** *rose*—

**Pauline Jarman** *a gododd*—

**The Presiding Officer:** No, we have not.

**Y Llywydd:** Na, nid ydym.

**Pauline Jarman:** Further to that point of order, to pursue the issue of information by electronic means, the Chamberweb specifically states that the Deputy First Minister is responsible for economic development; while he deputises to the First Secretary as necessary, in Plenary, Cabinet, and otherwise, he has no other formal portfolio responsibilities. It notes that, accordingly, he will answer questions on the following, and a list of subjects is then given. Will the Chamberweb now be updated to give proper, correct and accurate information for the Members' benefit?

**Pauline Jarman:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, er mwyn mynd ar ôl mater gwybodaeth drwy ddulliau electronig, mae Gwe'r Siambr yn datgan yn benodol bod y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn gyfrifol am ddatblygu economaidd; nid yw'n gyfrifol am bortffolio ffurfiol pan fo'n dirprwyo ar ran y Prif Weinidog yn y Cyfarfod Llawn, yn y Cabinet neu fel arall. Noda, o ganlyniad, y bydd yn ateb cwestiynau ar y canlynol, a rhoddir rhestr o bynciau. A fydd Gwe'r Siambr yn cael ei diweddarau'n awr er mwyn darparu gwybodaeth briodol, cywir a manwl gywir er budd yr Aelodau?

**The Presiding Officer:** The information as it appears on the Chamberweb will be examined. If there is any doubt about the nature or quality of that information then it will be amended accordingly. I am grateful to you for drawing that to my attention.

**Y Llywydd:** Archwilir y wybodaeth fel yr ymddengys ar We'r Siambr. Os oes unrhyw amheuaeth ynglŷn â natur neu ansawdd yr wybodaeth honno yna fe'i diwygir yn unol â hynny. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am dynnu fy sylw at hynny.

### **Cymeradwyo'r Rheoliadau Cymorthdaliadau Amaethyddol (Apelau) (Cymru) 2001**

#### **Approval of the Agricultural Subsidies (Appeals) (Wales) Regulations 2001**

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 to the motion in the name of William Graham.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw William Graham i'r cynnig.

**The Minister for Rural Affairs (Carwyn Jones):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Carwyn Jones):** Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly considers the principle of the Agricultural Subsidies (Appeals) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 12 June 2001. (NDM726)*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Cymorthdaliadau Amaethyddol (Apelau) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 12 Mehefin 2001. (NDM726)*

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified under Standing Order No. 11.5 any matters for concern in the draft order, the Agricultural Subsidies (Appeals) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 26 June 2001; and*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw wedi nodi o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5 unrhyw faterion sydd yn peri pryder yn y gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Cymorthdaliadau Amaethyddol (Apelau) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y*

*Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 26 Mehefin 2001; ac*

2. *approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 12 June 2001. (NDM727)*

2. *yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 12 Mehefin 2001. (NDM727)*

I ask the Assembly to approve the Agricultural Subsidies (Appeals) (Wales) Regulations 2001 to ensure that farmers in Wales will have a legal right to seek a review of officials' decisions in relation to the main common agricultural policy subsidy schemes related to the European Commission's integrated administration and control system.

Gofynnaf i'r Cynulliad gymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cymorthdaliadau Amaethyddol (Apeliadau) (Cymru) 2001 i sicrhau y bydd gan ffermwyr yng Nghymru yr hawl gyfreithiol i ofyn am adolygiad o benderfyniadau swyddogion mewn perthynas â'r prif gynlluniau cymhorthdal o dan y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin sydd yn ymwneud â system weinyddu a rheoli integredig y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd.

The farmers' perception is that the Assembly, through its officials, can appear to act as both judge and jury when considering appeals against penalties imposed on a subsidy claim. Failure to comply with these rules often results in farmers' subsidy applications being reduced or lost altogether. As I said in May, there is often little room for discretion in the EC rules and cases must often be referred to the Office of the Counsel General and the views of other agriculture departments sought. The UK must be seen to interpret and apply EC rules consistently as a single member state or face the prospect of disallowance.

Teimla'r ffermwyr fod y Cynulliad, drwy ei swyddogion, yn ymddangos fel pe bai'n gallu eistedd mewn barn arnynt wrth ystyried apeliadau yn erbyn cosbau a roddwyd ar geisiadau am gymhorthdal. Mae methiant i gydymffurfio â'r rheolau hyn yn aml yn arwain at ostwng ceisiadau ffermwyr am gymhorthdal neu eu tynnu yn ôl yn gyfan gwbl. Fel y dywedais ym mis Mai, yn aml nid oes llawer o ddisgresiwn o fewn rheolau'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd ac yn aml rhaid cyfeirio achosion at Swyddfa'r Cwnsler Cyffredinol a cheisio barn adrannau amaethyddol eraill. Rhaid i'r DU gael ei gweld yn dehongli ac yn cymhwyso rheolau'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn gyson fel un aelod-wladwriaeth neu bydd yn wynebu'r posibilrwydd na chaiff y cymhorthdal ei ganiatáu.

On the Conservative amendment, it is a differently crafted amendment to that tabled on 22 May. However, it nevertheless conveys the same meaning. It effectively asks for a review of the divisional offices. My position remains the same as it was on 22 May. I reject the amendment. First, it is not relevant to today's debate, which concerns legislation specifically underpinning the appeals mechanism. Secondly, staffing matters are the Permanent Secretary's responsibility. In addition, many of the divisional offices are already going through a system known as JIGSAW, which evaluates re-organising office procedures to make them more

O ran gwelliant y Ceidwadwyr, mae'n welliant sydd wedi ei lunio'n wahanol i'r hyn a gyflwynwyd ar 22 Mai. Fodd bynnag, mae iddo yr un ystyr serch hynny. Gofynna am adolygiad o'r swyddfeydd rhanbarthol i bob diben. Nid yw fy safbwynt wedi newid ers 22 Mai. Gwrthodaf y gwelliant. Yn gyntaf, nid yw'n berthnasol i'r ddadl heddiw, sydd yn trafod deddfwriaeth sydd yn ymwneud yn benodol â sefydlu'r system apelio. Yn ail, cyfrifoldeb yr Ysgrifennydd Parhaol yw materion sydd yn ymwneud â'r staff. Yn ogystal, mae llawer o'r swyddfeydd rhanbarthol eisoes yn ymgymryd â system o'r enw JIGSAW, sydd yn gwerthuso sut y gellir

effective and efficient. That has been under way for some time.

Under the partnership agreement, the National Assembly is committed to providing an independent appeals mechanism for farmers in Wales and these regulations are integral to that process. That is scheduled to come into force on 1 August this year.

The mechanism comprises three stages. The operating instructions for the first two stages are as follows: stage 1 is a review by the divisional executive officer. Stage 2 is a review by the agriculture appeals unit. In the third stage there is a review by an independent panel of three, drawn from a number of people appointed by the Assembly specifically for this task. That will be operational by 31 October. The intention is that the panel will consider decisions taken on cases from the 2001 scheme year onwards. Panel members are being appointed now and I expect that 15 individuals will be in place from all parts of Wales by the end of the month. I will make an announcement when the appointment process is complete. I invite the Assembly to support the motion before Plenary this afternoon in its unamended form.

**Peter Rogers:** I propose amendment 1 in the name of William Graham. Add new point to the end of the motion:

*calls on the Minister to examine the scope for further maximising the effectiveness of decision making processes in relation to the interpretation of agricultural subsidies, so as to reduce the number of potential cases being referred to appeal.*

The Welsh Conservatives are fully committed to establishing an independent appeals mechanism. When we debated the issue in May, the Minister said that we did not need to review what was going on in his department because the JIGSAW programme was up and running. I accept that this will make a positive contribution to that department's work. However, our amendment concerns the interpretation of the

ad-drefnu gweithdrefnau'r swyddfeydd er mwyn eu gwneud yn fwy effeithiol ac effeithlon. Bu hynny ar droed ers tro.

O dan y cytundeb partneriaeth, mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ymrwymedig i ddarparu system apelio annibynnol ar gyfer ffermwyr yng Nghymru ac mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn rhan annatod o'r broses honno. Dylai hyn ddod i rym ar 1 Awst eleni.

Mae tri cham i'r system apelio. Mae'r cyfarwyddiadau gweithredu ar gyfer y ddau gam cyntaf fel a ganlyn: yn y cam cyntaf ceir adolygiad gan y swyddog gweithredol rhanbarthol. Yn yr ail gam ceir adolygiad gan yr uned apêl amaethyddol. Yn y trydydd cam ceir adolygiad gan banel annibynnol o dri o bobl, sydd wedi eu dewis o nifer o bobl a benodir gan y Cynulliad yn benodol ar gyfer y dasg hon. Bydd hynny'n weithredol ar 31 Hydref. Y bwriad yw y bydd y panel yn ystyried penderfyniadau a wnaethpwyd ar achosion o flwyddyn 2001 y cynllun ymlaen. Penodir aelodau'r panel ar hyn o bryd a disgwyliaf i 15 o unigolion gael eu penodi o bob rhan o Gymru erbyn diwedd y mis. Gwnaf ddatganiad pan fydd y broses benodi wedi ei chwblhau. Gwahoddaf y Cynulliad i gefnogi'r cynnig gerbron y Cyfarfod Llawn y prynhawn yma ar ei ffurf wreiddiol.

**Peter Rogers:** Cynigiaf welliant 1 yn enw William Graham. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar y Gweinidog i edrych ar gyfleoedd i wneud y prosesau penderfynu o ran dehongli cymorthdaliadau amaethyddol yn fwy effeithiol eto, er mwyn lleihau nifer yr apeliadau.*

Mae Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn gwbl ymrwymedig i sefydlu system apelio annibynnol. Pan gynhaliwyd dadl ar y mater ym mis Mai, dywedodd y Gweinidog nad oedd angen inni adolygu'r hyn a oedd yn digwydd yn ei adran am fod rhaglen JIGSAW yn mynd rhagddi. Derbyniaf y bydd hon yn gwneud cyfraniad cadarnhaol at waith yr adran honno. Fodd bynnag, mae ein gwelliant yn ymwneud â dehongli'r rheolau

rules and not the efficiency of the department. I ask the Minister to seriously consider what can be done to improve the understanding of how the subsidy rules apply. I have dealt with many cases recently where the department has failed to understand the relevant provisions of the subsidy regulations. There was a particular example in the set-aside scheme recently, where an application made under the IACS form in May resulted in a penalty of £12,000 being imposed on the farmer in December because of the misunderstanding in set-aside of the word 'combinable' with regard to hemp. I can understand that there are problems with growing hemp, which is a relatively new crop in this country, but we have substantial experience in that field in north Wales, which explains the use of the word, 'combinable'.

I am concerned that the farmer I mentioned received no notification that he would be penalised and we had no time to explain to the offices that hemp was a combinable crop. The under and over measurement case goes back to 1992. English farmers took that case to Brussels. It was overruled in Brussels, and yet we fought it until 2001. That was another misinterpretation of what allowances of under measurement should be made against the over measurement. It affected the extensification payment.

These are the factors that we should be considering to ensure that these farmers' cashflow, particularly in these critical times, is not affected. I understand and welcome the appeals brochure, but I also understand that by preparing our case better, we could stop a number of cases from going so far. The Minister went to Brecon last November where there was great controversy over the suckler cow premium payments that had been held up because of—as he said—a computer blip. You said at that meeting that 80 per cent of Welsh farmers had been paid. You conducted a straw poll in Brecon and only two had been paid. You then had to apologise because you had given them the beef special scheme premium figures. The suckler cow premium payments began on 1

ac nid effeithlonrwydd yr adran. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ystyried o ddifrif beth y gellir ei wneud i gael gwell dealltwriaeth o sut y mae'r rheolau ar gymorthdaliadau yn gweithio. Ymdriniais â llawer o achosion yn ddiweddar lle yr oedd yr adran wedi methu â deall darpariaethau perthnasol y rheoliadau ar gymorthdaliadau. Bu enghraifft benodol yn ddiweddar yn y cynllun neilltir, lle yr arweiniodd cais a wnaethpwyd o dan ffurflen IACS ym mis Mai at gosb o £12,000 i'r ffermwr ym mis Rhagfyr oherwydd camddealltwriaeth ar y ffurflen neilltir ynglŷn â'r gair 'combinable' mewn perthynas â chywarch. Gallaf ddeall pam bod problemau o ran tyfu cywarch, sydd yn gnwd cymharol newydd yn y wlad hon, ond mae gennym brofiad helaeth yn y maes hwnnw yng ngogledd Cymru, sydd yn esbonio'r defnydd o'r gair, 'combinable'.

Mae'n achos pryder imi na hysbyswyd y ffermwr a grybwyllais o'r ffaith y câi ei gosbi ac ni chawsom amser i esbonio i'r swyddfeydd bod cywarch yn gnwd y gellir ei gyfuno. Bu'r achos sydd yn ymwneud â thanfesur neu or-fesur tir ar y gweill ers 1992. Dygwyd yr achos hwnnw i Frwsel gan ffermwyr o Loegr. Fe'i gwrthodwyd ym Mrwsel, ond eto buom yn parhau i'w ymladd tan 2001. Yr oedd hynny'n enghraifft arall o gamddehongli pa faint o danfesur y dylid ei wrthbwysu yn erbyn gor-fesur. Effeithiodd ar y taliad anarddwys.

Dyna'r ffactorau y dylem eu hystyried i sicrhau nad effeithir ar lif arian y ffermwyr hyn, yn enwedig yn ystod y cyfnodau tyngedfennol hyn. Deallaf a chroesawaf y llyfryn ar apelio, ond deallaf hefyd y gallem atal nifer o achosion rhag mynd mor bell drwy baratoi ein hachos yn well. Aeth y Gweinidog i Aberhonddu fis Tachwedd diwethaf lle y bu anghydfod mawr ynglŷn â'r oedi cyn derbyn taliadau premiwm buchod sugno oherwydd—fel y dywedodd—diffyg cyfrifiadurol. Dywedasocho yn y cyfarfod hwnnw fod 80 y cant o ffermwyr Cymru wedi'u talu. Cynhaliwyd pŵl sydyn yn Aberhonddu a dim ond dau a oedd wedi cael eu talu. Yna bu'n rhaid ichi ymddiheuro am ichi roi'r ffigurau ar gyfer y cynllun premiwm arbennig biff iddynt. Dechreuodd y



June. Welsh farmers did not receive their forms until yesterday. Another week has passed. English farmers have their forms. They are now moving forward in their sheep premium payments scheme and they will be paying ahead of Wales again. Do not let Welsh farmers suffer again. You must support my amendment so that we can review the situation to ensure that people understand these difficult European forms. I ask Members to support this important amendment today.

**Kirsty Williams:** I welcome today's regulations that go a long way to implementing the partnership agreement's desire for an independent appeals mechanism for farmers. It is a long overdue mechanism and I am sure that all of us who represent farmers—I believe that only one Assembly Member does not have a farmer in her constituency—are aware of the difficulties that farmers face when they fall foul of the system. Many farmers have felt frustrated by the fact that until now, the division has been judge and jury with regard to applications that have gone wrong for whatever reason.

While I sympathise with the points that Peter raised, the training of divisional office staff is not a matter for regulation under an independent appeals mechanism. That must be addressed through the Permanent Secretary. Staff working in field offices do a difficult job in difficult circumstances. The divisional officers that I have approached have been more than willing to talk to individual farmers, and to myself as a representative, to try to work through some of the problems. While I take the point that there are blips to be sorted out with regard to staff training, that is not a matter for these regulations or today's debate. The Liberal Democrats welcome and support the regulations as they stand.

3:20 p.m.

**Elin Jones:** Mae Plaid Cymru hefyd yn

taliadau premiwm buchod sugno ar 1 Mehefin. Ni chafodd ffermwyr yng Nghymru eu ffurflenni tan ddoe. Mae wythnos arall wedi mynd heibio. Mae'r ffermwyr yn Lloegr wedi cael eu ffurflenni. Erbyn hyn maent hwy yn symud ymlaen gyda'r cynllun taliadau premiwm defaid a byddant yn talu cyn Cymru unwaith eto. Peidiwch â gadael i ffermwyr Cymru ddioddef eto. Rhaid ichi gefnogi fy ngwelliant fel y gallwn adolygu'r sefyllfa er mwyn sicrhau bod pobl yn deall y ffurflenni Ewropeaidd anodd hyn. Gofynnaf i'r Aelodau gefnogi'r gwelliant pwysig hwn heddiw.

**Kirsty Williams:** Croesawaf y rheoliadau ger ein bron heddiw sydd yn mynd dipyn o ffordd i weithredu dymuniad y cytundeb partneriaeth i sefydlu system apelio annibynnol ar gyfer ffermwyr. Mae'n hen bryd cael system o'r fath ac yr wyf yn siwr bod pob un ohonom sydd yn cynrychioli ffermwyr—credaf mai dim ond un Aelod o'r Cynulliad sydd heb yr un ffermwr yn ei hetholaeth—yn ymwybodol o'r anawsterau a wyneba ffermwyr pan fyddant yn tramgwyddo. Mae llawer o ffermwyr wedi teimlo'n rhwystredig am y ffaith bod yr is-adran hyd yma wedi bod yn eistedd mewn barn arnynt o ran ceisiadau a aeth o'i le am ba reswm bynnag.

Er y cydymdeimlaf â'r pwyntiau a gododd Peter, nid mater i'w reoleiddio o dan system apelio annibynnol yw hyfforddiant staff y swyddfeydd rhanbarthol. Rhaid mynd i'r afael â hynny drwy'r Ysgrifennydd Parhaol. Mae'r staff sydd yn gweithio mewn swyddfeydd maes yn gwneud gwaith anodd o dan amgylchiadau anodd. Bu'r swyddogion rhanbarthol y cysylltais i â hwy yn fwy na pharod i siarad â ffermwyr unigol, ac â minnau fel cynrychiolydd, er mwyn ceisio datrys rhai o'r problemau. Er y derbynaf y pwynt bod diffygion i'w hunioni o ran hyfforddiant y staff, nid mater i'r rheoliadau hyn na dadl heddiw ydyw. Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn croesawu a chefnogi'r rheoliadau ar eu ffurf presennol.

**Elin Jones:** Plaid Cymru also welcomes

croesawu'r rheoliadau hyn, a fydd yn cyflwyno'r system apelio annibynnol ar benderfyniadau'r Adran Amaethyddiaeth. Fel y dywedodd Kirsty Williams, mae pob Aelod sydd yn cynrychioli ardal wledig yn gyfarwydd ag achosion lle mae ffermwyr yn teimlo eu bod wedi dioddef dyfarniad annheg neu anghywir gan yr Adran Amaethyddiaeth ar ryw gymhorthdal neu'i gilydd. Mae'r hawl a gyflwynir heddiw i apelio'n annibynnol yn gyfraniad pwysig i'r diwydiant amaethyddiaeth yn gyffredinol.

Mae'n drueni, o bosibl, nad oes elfen adolygol i waith yr uned apêl fel y gellid cyfeirio achosion a gododd yn ystod y ddwy flynedd diwethaf at yr uned. Deallaf fod cymhlethdodau gweinyddol ymarferol i hynny. Cefnogwn welliant William Graham. Nid wyf yn ei ddehongli yn union yr un modd â'r Gweinidog. Mae'n bwysig ar bob cyfrif bod yr Adran Amaethyddiaeth, a phob adran o'r Llywodraeth, yn gweithio i leihau nifer y camgymeriadau ac yn cyfathrebu penderfyniadau yn effeithiol a'r rhesymau y tu ôl i'r penderfyniadau hynny yn glir. Mae hynny'n gyfraniad pwysig at leihau'r rhwystredigaeth y mae ffermwyr yn aml yn ei deimlo pan wneir penderfyniadau anghywir ac annheg. Lleihau camgymeriadau a chyflwyno penderfyniadau yn glir i ffermwyr yw'r cam cyntaf. Yr uned apêl, wedyn, yw pen draw'r broses. Mae'n gyfraniad pwysig yn y maes hwn, ac fe'i croesawn. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig bod pob adran o'r Llywodraeth hon yn gweithio yn effeithiol.

**Carwyn Jones:** I cannot accept that there is something fundamentally wrong with our divisional offices. I accept that we must always strive to ensure that offices work ever more efficiently. That has been done via the JIGSAW programme over the last year. There is a tendency sometimes among some people outside this Chamber to consider the staff of the divisional offices as slaves rather than people providing a service to farmers. I will not accept that point of view.

I visited the Caernarfon divisional office at the height of the foot and mouth disease crisis and witnessed staff working during

these regulations, which will introduce the independent appeals mechanism on decisions made by the Agricultural Division. As Kirsty Williams said, every Member who represents a rural area is familiar with cases where farmers feel that they have suffered an unfair or incorrect decision by the Agricultural Division on some subsidy or other. The right that is introduced today to independent appeal is an important contribution to the agricultural industry in general.

It is a shame, possibly, that the work of the appeals unit is not retrospective, so that cases that arose during the past two years could be referred to the unit. I understand that there are administrative and practical complexities to that. We support William Graham's amendment. I do not quite interpret it in the same way as the Minister. It is important on all counts that the Agricultural Division, and all Government departments, strive to decrease the number of errors, and communicate decisions effectively and the reasons for those decisions clearly. That is an important contribution to decreasing the frustration that farmers often feel when incorrect or unfair decisions are made. The first step is to reduce errors and present decisions clearly to farmers. The appeals unit, then, is the culmination of the process. It is an important contribution to this process, and we welcome it. However, it is important that all of this Government's departments work effectively.

**Carwyn Jones:** Ni allaf dderbyn bod rhywbeth mawr o'i le ar ein swyddfeydd rhanbarthol. Derbyniaf fod yn rhaid inni bob amser ymdrechu i sicrhau bod y swyddfeydd yn gweithio'n fwy effeithiol byth. Gwnaethpwyd hynny drwy raglen JIGSAW yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Mae tuedd weithiau ymhlith rhai pobl y tu allan i'r Siambr hon i ystyried staff y swyddfeydd rhanbarthol fel caethweision yn hytrach na phobl sydd yn rhoi gwasanaeth i ffermwyr. Ni dderbyniaf y safbwynt hwnnw.

Ymwelais â'r swyddfa ranbarthol yn Nghaernarfon pan oedd argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau ar ei waethaf a gwelais

their own time, not being paid extra money, and working on a Sunday as if it were a week day. I cannot accept that those same people are in some way deliberately or negligently taking the wrong decisions. Inevitably, when a decision is made that is not in someone's favour, they will think that a mistake has been made. That is quite natural. However, no system is perfect, and it is clear that our present system is as good as we are going to get. That does not mean that we do not continuously look to see what can be done to review and improve the situation. However, a message must go out from this Chamber that we value the work that is done by those in the divisional offices, and that we understand that what they do is subject to a review so that they can provide a service to farmers. Many of those who work in the divisional offices are personally involved in farming and have great sympathy towards, and empathy with, farmers. It is extremely important that we realise that.

aelodau'r staff yno yn gweithio yn ystod eu hamser eu hunain, heb unrhyw arian ychwanegol, ac yn gweithio dros y Sul fel pe bai'n ddiwrnod gwaith arferol. Ni allaf dderbyn bod yr un bobl hyn ryw ffordd neu'i gilydd yn gwneud y penderfyniadau anghywir yn bwrpasol neu drwy esgeulustod. Pan wneir penderfyniad nad yw o blaid rhywun, mae'n anochel y bydd y person hwnnw yn meddwl bod camgymeriad wedi ei wneud. Mae hynny'n gwbl naturiol. Fodd bynnag, nid oes unrhyw system yn berffaith, ac mae'n amlwg bod ein system bresennol cystal ag unrhyw beth a gawn. Ni olyga hynny na ddylem ei hadolygu'n barhaus i ganfod beth y gellir ei wneud i adolygu a gwella'r sefyllfa. Fodd bynnag, rhaid anfon neges o'r Siambr hon ein bod yn gwerthfawrogi gwaith y staff yn y swyddfeydd rhanbarthol, a'n bod yn deall bod eu gwaith yn cael ei adolygu er mwyn iddynt allu rhoi gwasanaeth i ffermwyr. Mae gan lawer o'r staff sydd yn gweithio yn y swyddfeydd rhanbarthol gysylltiadau personol â'r diwydiant ffermio a chydymdeimlad mawr ag ef, ac â'r ffermwyr hefyd. Mae'n holl bwysig inni sylweddoli hynny.

If people feel that they are being hard done by or that mistakes are being made, they are now able to go to the independent appeals mechanism to ensure that an independent voice is introduced at an appropriate stage. They should not feel that the Assembly is judge and jury. That is an excellent way forward and I commend it to the Assembly.

Os teimla pobl eu bod yn cael cam neu fod camgymeriadau'n cael eu gwneud, gallant yn awr ddefnyddio'r system apelio annibynnol er mwyn sicrhau y caiff llais annibynnol ei gyflwyno ar gam priodol. Ni ddylent deimlo bod y Cynulliad yn eistedd mewn barn arnynt. Mae'r system yn ffordd ardderchog ymlaen ac fe'i cymeradwyaf i'r Cynulliad.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 26*

*Amendment 1: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 26*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice

Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John

Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

**Y Llywydd:** Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar **The Presiding Officer:** We will now vote on the principle of the Order.

*Cynnig: O blaid 41, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 41, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet

Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Y Llywydd:** Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar **The Presiding Officer:** We will now vote on  
gymeradwyo'r Gorchymyn. the approval of the Order.

*Cynnig: O blaid 41, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 41, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

## Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

**Rod Richards:** Pwynt o drefn. Fel y sylwasoch, mae'n siŵr, fe fethais i ac un Aelod arall bleidleisio yn gynharach. Un rheswm dros hynny yw bod ein seddi ymhellach o'r drws na'r seddi ar ochr arall y Siambr. Pe byddem yn eistedd yn seddi Dai Lloyd, Gareth Jones neu Ieuan Wyn Jones, byddai'r ddau ohonom wedi gallu pleidleisio. [AELODAU PLAID CYMRU O'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.']

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'n bwysig i Rod Richards gael gwrandawriad.

**Rod Richards:** Beth amser yn ôl, pan oedd Gweinidog yn brysur yn rhoi ei nodiadau i dywyswr ar gyfer y cofnod swyddogol, cafodd ganiatâd gennych i gofnodi ei phleidlais ar ôl pawb arall. A gaiff William Graham a minnau bleidleisio'n awr ar y bleidlais a fethasom oherwydd bod ein seddi yn bell o'r drws?

**Y Llywydd:** Fel y gŵyr Aelodau, mae'n dechnegol bosibl i bleidleisio ar unrhyw bwynt pleidlais yn y Siambr gan ddefnyddio'r cardiau. [AELODAU PLAID CYMRU O'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.'] Pwysleisïaf mai technegol bosibl yn unig yw hynny. Nid wyf eisiau dechrau'r arfer o Aelodau'n ciwio i ddefnyddio un peiriant pleidleisio. Pan geir pleidlais yn ddisymwth, yr wyf wedi aros sawl gwaith i Aelodau allu cerdded i'w seddau o ben draw'r Siambr. Mae'n dda gennyf weld bod Rod Richards yn cytuno. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd y bleidlais dan sylw yn digwydd yng nghanol cyfres o bleidleisiau ar ddiwedd dadl. Tybiwn felly y byddai Aelodau wedi cyrraedd eu seddi erbyn yr ail bleidlais, ac na fyddai angen imi roi rhagor o amser iddynt.

**Rod Richards:** Ymhellach at y pwynt hwnnw o drefn, a gaf yn awr felly fynd â'r cerdyn hwn o'r Siambr ac yna ddod i mewn, eistedd yn sedd Ieuan Wyn Jones a gosod y cerdyn yn y peiriant?

**Y Llywydd:** Mae hynny'n dechnegol bosibl, ond ni fyddai'n cyfrannu at drefn yn y

**Rod Richards:** Point of order. As you noticed earlier, I am sure, another Member and I failed to vote. One reason for that is that our seats are further from the door than the seats on the other side of the Chamber. If we were sitting in the seats of Dai Lloyd, Gareth Jones or Ieuan Wyn Jones, both of us would have been able to vote. [PLAID CYMRU ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.']

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. It is important that Rod Richards is heard.

**Rod Richards:** Some time ago, when a Minister was busy giving her notes to an usher for the official record, you gave her permission to record her vote after everyone else. May William Graham and I vote now on the vote that we missed because our seats are a long way from the door?

**The Presiding Officer:** As Members know, it is technically possible to vote at any voting point in the Chamber, using the cards. [PLAID CYMRU ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.'] I emphasise that that is only technically possible. I do not want to start a custom whereby Members queue to use one voting machine. When a vote arises suddenly, I have paused, on several occasions, to allow Members to walk to their seats from the far end of the Chamber. I am pleased to see that Rod Richards agrees. However, this vote occurred during a series of votes at the end of a debate. I therefore assumed that Members would have reached their seats in time for the second vote, and that I would not need to give them more time.

**Rod Richards:** Further to that point of order, may I now, therefore, take this card out of the Chamber and then come in, sit in Ieuan Wyn Jones's seat and place the card in the machine?

**The Presiding Officer:** That is technically possible, but it would not contribute to order

Cynulliad. Fe sicrhaf fod digon o amser i Aelodau gerdded yn urddasol i'w seddi cyn y bleidlais gyntaf. Fodd bynnag, ni allaf addo y byddwn yn oedi busnes er mwyn i Aelodau gerdded o gwmpas rhwng pleidleisiau, sydd yn un o arferion gwael San Steffan.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw, gan eich bod yn awr yn gwneud trefniadau i ganiatáu i Aelodau ddod yn ôl i'r Siambr i bleidleisio, a wnewch hefyd wneud trefniadau i ganiatáu i Aelodau ddod yn ôl i'r Siambr i ymateb i bwyntiau o drefn? Efallai y byddai hynny'n gallugoi'r Prif Weinidog i ymateb i bwyntiau o drefn.

**Y Llywydd:** Nid yw hynny'n fater i mi.

in the Assembly. I will ensure that there is sufficient time for Members to walk with dignity to their seats before the first vote. However, I cannot promise that we will delay business so that Members can walk around in between votes, which is one of Westminster's bad practices.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Further to that point, as you are now making arrangements to allow Members to come into the Chamber to vote, will you also make arrangements to allow Members to return to the Chamber to respond to points of order? Perhaps that would enable the First Minister to respond to points of order.

**The Presiding Officer:** That is not a matter for me.

### **Cymeradwyo'r Rheoliadau Premiwm Arbennig Eidion 2001 Approval of the Beef Special Premium Regulations 2001**

**The Minister for Rural Affairs (Carwyn Jones):** I propose that

*the National Assembly, acting under Standing Orders Nos. 22.25, 23.10 and 23.11, approves the draft Beef Special Premium Regulations 2001, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 2 July 2001, and the explanatory memorandum laid in the Table Office on 2 July 2001. (NDM728)*

**The Presiding Officer:** As there are no speakers on this motion, we will move immediately to a vote.

**Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Carwyn Jones):** Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan Reolau Sefydlog Rhifau 22.25, 23.10 a 23.11, yn cymeradwyo drafft y Rheoliadau Premiwm Arbennig Eidion 2001, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Gorffennaf 2001, a'r memorandwm esboniadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Gorffennaf 2001. (NDM728)*

**Y Llywydd:** Gan nad oes unrhyw siaradwyr ar y cynnig hwn, symudwn i bleidlais ar unwaith.

*Cynnig: O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn

Davies, Ron  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Richards, Rod  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

3:30 p.m.

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Safonau Gofal 2000 (Cychwyn Rhif 6) (Cymru)  
 2001**  
**Approval of the Care Standards Act 2000 (Commencement No. 6) (Wales) Order  
 2001**

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I propose that **Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly considers the principle of the Care Standards Act 2000 (Commencement No. 6) (Wales) Order 2001, laid in the Table Office on 19 June 2001. (NDM729)*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Deddf Safonau Gofal 2000 (Cychwyn Rhif 6) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 19 Mehefin 2001. (NDM729)*

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified under Standing Order No. 11.5 any matters for*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw wedi nodi o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5 unrhyw faterion sydd yn*



*concern in the draft order, the Care Standards Act 2000 (Commencement No. 6) (Wales) Order 2001, laid in the Table Office on 26 June 2001; and*

2. *approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 19 June 2001 and the regulatory appraisal laid in Table Office on 21 June 2001. (NDM730)*

I am pleased to present this Commencement Order to Members. The Order appoints days for certain provisions of part IV of the Care Standards Act 2000 to come into force. The Care Standards Act 2000 established the Care Council for Wales—Cyngor Gofal Cymru—to regulate the social care workforce and its training. The council will also take over several functions from the Central Council for Education and Training in Social Work—CCETSW—when that council is abolished. Those functions include the regulation of basic and post-qualifying social work training. The abolition of CCETSW will be effected by an Order in Council of Her Majesty under section 70 of the Care Standards Act 2000.

The Care Council for Wales will have two key tasks—to set standards and regulate the workforce, and to ensure that staff get the training and qualifications that they require to do their jobs. This Commencement Order appoints days for certain provisions relating to the training of social workers—in essence, those that are currently the function of CCETSW—to come into force. These are, first, section 63 of the Act, which allows the council to approve certain social work courses in accordance with rules that it makes. Secondly, section 66 of the Act, which allows the council to make provision for the visiting of places where social work training takes place by, for example, assessors or examiners, in accordance with rules that it may make. Thirdly, section 71 of the Act, which makes provisions about the nature of the rules that the council may make, and requires the Assembly's consent before

*peri pryder yn y gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Deddf Safonau Gofal 2000 (Cychwyn Rhif 6) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 26 Mehefin 2001; a*

2. *yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 19 Mehefin 2001 a'r gwerthusiad rheoleiddio a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 21 Mehefin 2001. (NDM730)*

Mae'n dda gennyf gyflwyno'r Gorchymyn Cychwyn hwn i'r Aelodau. Mae'r Gorchymyn yn nodi'r diwrnodau pan ddaw darpariaethau penodol rhan IV Deddf Safonau Gofal 2000 i rym. Sefydlodd Deddf Safonau Gofal 2000 Gyngor Gofal Cymru i reoleiddio gweithlu'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a'i hyfforddiant. Bydd y cyngor hefyd yn ymgymryd â nifer o swyddogaethau'r Cyngor Canolog Addysg a Hyfforddiant mewn Gwaith Cymdeithasol—y cyngor canolog—ar ôl i'r cyngor hwnnw gael ei ddiddymu. Ymhlith y swyddogaethau hynny mae rheoleiddio hyfforddiant sylfaenol ac ôl-gymhwysol ym maes gwaith cymdeithasol. Diddymir y cyngor canolog drwy Orchymyn Cyngor Ei Mawrhydi o dan adran 70 Deddf Safonau Gofal 2000.

Bydd gan Gyngor Gofal Cymru ddwy dasg allweddol—pennu safonau a rheoleiddio'r gweithlu, a sicrhau bod y staff yn cael yr hyfforddiant a'r cymwysterau sydd eu hangen arnynt i gyflawni eu gwaith. Mae'r Gorchymyn Cychwyn hwn yn nodi'r diwrnodau pan ddaw darpariaethau penodol sydd yn ymwneud â hyfforddi gweithwyr cymdeithasol i rym—yn y bôn, y rhai sydd yn ymwneud â swyddogaethau presennol y cyngor canolog sef, yn gyntaf, adran 63 y Ddeddf, sydd yn caniatáu i'r cyngor gymeradwyo cyrsiau gwaith cymdeithasol penodol yn unol â'r rheolau a wna. Yn ail, adran 66 y Ddeddf, sydd yn caniatáu i'r cyngor wneud darpariaeth ar gyfer ymweld â mannau lle y mae hyfforddiant gwaith cymdeithasol yn digwydd, er enghraifft, gan aseswyr neu arholwyr, yn unol â'r rheolau a wna. Yn drydydd, adran 71 y Ddeddf, sydd yn gwneud darpariaethau ynglŷn â natur y

any such rules are made. These provisions will come into force on 31 July 2001. The rules themselves will not come into force before 1 October 2001.

In addition, the Commencement Order makes provision for section 67 of the Act to come into force on 1 October 2001. Section 67 allows the Assembly to promote social care training and to encourage individuals to take part in this training. It also provides for the Assembly to pay grants and allowances to individuals to secure their training. These functions are currently undertaken by CCETSW. The Assembly may delegate these functions to the new council.

Finally, the Order brings into force section 70(1) of the Act on 1 October 2001. This section provides for some of CCETSW's functions in Wales to cease to be exercised from that date. Those functions are similar to those conferred upon the Care Council for Wales and the Assembly by the other provisions in this Order.

In the autumn, I will bring forward further Commencement Orders relating to the council's other functions. They will refer specifically to the registration of the workforce and the issuing of codes of conduct and codes of practice for employers and employees.

This Commencement Order is another step in the implementation of the Care Council for Wales. I ask Members to support the motion.

**David Lloyd:** Datganaf fuddiant fel meddyg teulu. Croesawaf y mesur hwn. Mae gennyf ddau gwestiwn ynghylch y Gorchymyn. Yn gyntaf, mae problem recriwtio a chadw'r gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol yn gefndir perthnasol i Ddeddf Safonau Gofal 2000. Arweiniodd prinder staff at broblemau pellach o ran cyflawni rhai o argymhellion adroddiad Waterhouse. Sut y bydd tasglu'r Gweinidog ar y gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol yn datrys yr argyfwng recriwtio a chadw

rheolau y gallai'r cyngor eu gwneud, ac yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i unrhyw reolau o'r fath gael ei gymeradwyo gan y Cynulliad cyn iddynt gael eu gwneud. Daw'r darpariaethau hyn i rym ar 31 Gorffennaf 2001. Ni ddaw'r rheolau eu hunain i rym cyn 1 Hydref 2001.

Yn ogystal, gwna'r Gorchymyn Cychwyn ddarpariaeth i adran 67 y Ddeddf ddod i rym ar 1 Hydref 2001. Caniatâ Adran 67 i'r Cynulliad hyrwyddo hyfforddiant gofal cymdeithasol ac annog unigolion i gymryd rhan yn yr hyfforddiant hwn. Darpara hefyd i'r Cynulliad dalu grantiau a lwfansau i unigolion sicrhau eu hyfforddiant. Y cyngor canolog sydd yn cyflawni'r swyddogaethau hyn ar hyn o bryd. Gallai'r Cynulliad ddirprwyo'r swyddogaethau hyn i'r cyngor newydd.

Yn olaf, mae'r Gorchymyn hwn yn gweithredu adran 70(1) y Ddeddf ar 1 Hydref 2001. Mae'r adran hon yn darparu i rai o swyddogaethau'r cyngor canolog yng Nghymru ddod i ben ar y dyddiad hwnnw. Mae'r swyddogaethau hynny yn debyg i'r rhai a roddwyd i Gyngor Gofal Cymru a'r Cynulliad drwy'r darpariaethau eraill yn y Gorchymyn hwn.

Yn yr hydref, cyflwynaf ragor o Orchmynion Cychwyn a fydd yn ymwneud â swyddogaethau eraill y cyngor. Byddant yn cyfeirio'n benodol at gofrestru'r gweithlu a chyhoeddi codau ymddygiad a chodau ymarfer ar gyfer cyflogwyr a gweithwyr.

Mae'r Gorchymyn Cychwyn hwn yn gam arall i weithredu Cyngor Gofal Cymru. Gofynnaf i'r Aelodau gefnogi'r cynnig.

**David Lloyd:** I declare an interest as a general practitioner. I welcome this measure. I have two questions on the Order. First, the problem of recruiting and retaining the social care workforce is relevant background to the Care Standards Act 2000. Staff shortages have led to further problems in implementing some recommendations of the Waterhouse report. How does the Minister's taskforce on the social care workforce intend to solve the crisis in recruiting and retaining staff?

staff? Yn ail, sut y bydd y Gweinidog yn datrys problem amodau gwaith, sydd yn llawn pwysau, pryder a straen, a'r cyflogau gwael yn y sector hwn? Mae gweithwyr gofal cymdeithasol yn wynebu'r amodau hyn yn ddyddiol.

**Kirsty Williams:** This Commencement Order will form a crucial part of upskilling and transforming the social care workforce and regime in Wales. It will raise standards, which must be good news for everyone. Dai knows what the administration's taskforce intends to do about the crisis. Its recommendations on what needs to be done were presented clearly to the Health and Social Services Committee—although I take your point that salaries were not part of its consideration. The Committee had the opportunity to voice its concern about the salaries of social care workers, especially those who are not fully qualified.

These Orders are important. However, we must be aware that raising the standards of training and registration of social care workers will place a strain on the private sector, in particular, in funding the training of social care staff up to an appropriate standard. We need to consider that, otherwise the private sector will find it increasingly difficult to recruit the good staff that it needs.

We need to refocus, not as an Assembly, but as a society as a whole, on how we view social workers. We are too quick to get out the stick and use it against social care staff when something goes tragically wrong. Mistakes have been made in the past, but it is the constant haranguing from politicians and the media when something goes wrong that has contributed to poor morale within the social care workforce and caused some of its recruitment problems. We need to refocus our attention and begin to value these people who perform difficult tasks, often with some of the most challenging and vulnerable people in our society. We need to take this opportunity to sing the praises of the social care workforce and consider developing their skills further.

Secondly, how will the Minister solve the problem of work conditions, which are pressurised, stressful and cause anxiety, and the low wages in this sector? Social care workers face these conditions daily.

**Kirsty Williams:** Bydd y Gorchymyn Cychwyn hwn yn rhan holl bwysig o uwchraddio sgiliau'r gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol a'i drawsnewid. Bydd yn codi safonau, a rhaid bod hynny'n newyddion da i bawb. Gŵyr Dai beth yw bwriadau tasglu'r weithrediaeth ynglŷn â'r argyfwng. Cyflwynwyd ei argymhellion ar yr hyn sydd angen ei wneud yn glir i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol—er y derbyniaf eich pwynt na chafodd cyflogau eu hystyried ganddo. Cafodd y Pwyllgor gyfle i fynegi ei bryderon ynglŷn â chyflogau gweithwyr gofal cymdeithasol, yn enwedig y rhai nad ydynt wedi cymhwysu'n llawn.

Mae'r Gorchymynion hyn yn bwysig. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni fod yn ymwybodol y bydd codi safonau hyfforddi a chofrestru gweithwyr gofal cymdeithasol yn rhoi pwysau ar y sector preifat, yn enwedig, o ran ariannu hyfforddiant i staff gofal cymdeithasol i safon briodol. Mae angen inni ystyried hynny. Fel arall, bydd y sector preifat yn ei chael yn fwyfwy anodd recriwtio'r staff da sydd ei angen arno.

Mae angen inni ystyried o'r newydd, nid fel Cynulliad, ond fel cymdeithas gyfan, sut yr ydym yn edrych ar weithwyr cymdeithasol. Yr ydym yn rhy barod i ladd ar staff gofal cymdeithasol pan ddigwydd rhyw drychineb. Gwnaethpwyd camgymeriadau yn y gorffennol, ond yr hyn sydd wedi cyfrannu at forâl isel ymhlith y gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol ac wedi peri rhai o'r problemau recriwtio staff yw'r pregethu di-baid gan wleidyddion a'r cyfryngau pan aiff rhywbeth o'i le. Mae angen inni roi sylw o'r newydd a dechrau gwerthfawrogi'r bobl hyn sydd yn gwneud gwaith anodd, yn aml gyda'r bobl fwyaf anodd a diamddiffyn yn ein cymuned. Mae angen inni fanteisio ar y cyfle hwn i ganu clodydd y gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol ac ystyried datblygu eu sgiliau ymhellach.

**David Melding:** The Welsh Conservative Party also welcomes the report. The Care Council for Wales will have an essential task in regulating the social care workforce and measures will be brought before us in this area. However, this afternoon, it is appropriate that we focus on the work that was formerly carried out by CCETSW to provide training. It is important that we do not talk only about social workers—for understandable reasons we tend to focus on them—because there is a vast workforce that must be trained. This training must be carried out with a high level of expertise and it must be flexible. Let us remember that these people often have demanding jobs and little time to pursue courses. I hope that we can be imaginative in how we allow people to access the expertise that will be available in a wide range of courses. When it comes to placing people on the register, it will be vital, particularly for those who have been trained outside the formal social worker route and are receiving on-the-job training, such as workers in residential homes and providers of domiciliary care. We need great skills to train and retain these workers. I ally myself with the comments about social workers and projecting a positive image of their work. That goes for the whole workforce, extending to the many thousands who perform these vital functions for society as a whole.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** Thank you Dai, Kirsty and David for welcoming these Orders. They are important and we can make the connection with how you want to improve the training and regulation of our social care workforce. As you said, David, it is a social care workforce, and that is recognised by the task and finish group, which was set up earlier this year and reported to the Health and Social Services Committee. The Central Council for Education and Training in Social Work was a main member of that task and finish group, as were representatives from the independent and voluntary sectors and there was also trade union representation from Unison. They drew up some robust

**David Melding:** Mae Plaid Geidwadol Cymru yn croesawu'r adroddiad hefyd. Bydd gan Gyngor Gofal Cymru y dasg hanfodol o reoleiddio'r gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol a chaiff mesurau eu gosod ger ein bron yn y maes hwn. Fodd bynnag, y prynhawn yma, mae'n briodol inni ganolbwyntio ar y gwaith a wnaethpwyd gynt gan y cyngor canolog i hyfforddi gweithwyr. Mae'n bwysig inni beidio â sôn am weithwyr cymdeithasol yn unig—yr ydym yn tueddu i ganolbwyntio arnynt hwy am resymau amlwg—am fod gweithlu enfawr i'w hyfforddi. Rhaid eu hyfforddi â lefel uchel o arbenigedd a rhaid i'r hyfforddiant fod yn hyblyg. Rhaid inni gofio bod gan y bobl hyn swyddi ymestynnol yn aml ac nad oes ganddynt lawer o amser i ddilyn cyrsiau. Gobeithiaf y gallwn fod yn greadigol o ran sut yr ydym yn galluogi pobl i fanteisio ar yr arbenigedd a fydd ar gael mewn ystod eang o gyrsiau. Bydd hynny'n hanfodol, pan ddaw'r amser i gofrestru pobl, yn arbennig i'r rhai a hyfforddwyd y tu allan i'r llwybr ffurfiol ar gyfer gweithwyr cymdeithasol ac sydd yn cael hyfforddiant mewn swydd, megis gweithwyr mewn cartrefi preswyl a'r rhai sydd yn rhoi gofal yn y cartref. Mae angen sgiliau gwych i hyfforddi a chadw'r gweithwyr hyn. Ategap y sylwadau ynghylch gweithwyr cymdeithasol a'r angen i roi delwedd gadarnhaol o'u gwaith. Mae hynny'n wir am y gweithlu cyfan, i'r miloedd lu sydd yn cyflawni'r swyddogaethau hanfodol hyn ar gyfer y gymdeithas gyfan.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Diolch i Dai, Kirsty a David am groesawu'r Gorchmynion hyn. Maent yn bwysig a gallwn eu cysylltu â'r ffordd yr ydych am wella hyfforddiant ein gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol a'r modd y caiff ei reoleiddio. Fel y dywedaso, David, gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol ydyw, a chydabyddir hynny gan y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen, a sefydlwyd yn gynharach eleni ac a roddodd adroddiad i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Yr oedd y Cyngor Canolog ar gyfer Addysg a Hyfforddiant mewn Gwaith Cymdeithasol yn un o brif aelodau'r grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen hwnnw, ynghyd â chynrychiolwyr o'r sector annibynnol a'r sector gwirfoddol ac yr oedd

recommendations about how to improve the status as well as the training, support and regulation of the social care workforce. We must ensure that that is reflected in our budget planning round, showing support for the social care workforce and for the social side of our responsibilities in the Health and Social Services Committee. These Orders relate to the approval and regulation of training and the promotion of training and support for students. Some 70,000 people work in social care, including those who work for the independent and voluntary sectors. It is almost the same size as the NHS workforce. Connections must be made with Education and Learning Wales in relation to training routes. National vocational qualifications are important, as David said. We must accredit competency and ensure that we raise standards through support, regulation and training. These Orders are important and are a step towards implementing the White Paper, 'Building for the Future', in terms of modernising social services.

cynrychiolaeth undebol o Unsain hefyd. Lluniwyd rhai argymhellion cadarn ganddynt ynghylch sut y dylid gwella statws y gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol yn ogystal â'r ffordd y caiff ei hyfforddi, ei gefnogi a'i reoleiddio. Rhaid inni sicrhau y caiff hynny ei adlewyrchu yn ein cylch cynllunio'r gyllideb, gan gefnogi'r gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol a'r agwedd gymdeithasol ar ein cyfrifoldebau yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Mae'r Gorchmynion hyn yn ymwneud â chymeradwyo a rheoleiddio hyfforddiant a hyrwyddo hyfforddiant a chefnogaeth i fyfyrwyr. Mae tua 70,000 o bobl yn gweithio ym maes gofal cymdeithasol, gan gynnwys y rhai sydd yn gweithio i'r sector annibynnol a'r sector gwirfoddol. Mae bron cymaint â gweithlu'r NHS. Rhaid gwneud cysylltiadau â Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru o ran llwybrau hyfforddi. Mae cymwysterau galwedigaethol cenedlaethol yn bwysig, fel y dywedodd David. Rhaid inni achredu cymhwysedd a sicrhau ein bod yn codi safonau drwy gefnogi, rheoleiddio a hyfforddi. Mae'r Gorchmynion hyn yn bwysig ac yn gam tuag at weithredu'r Papur Gwyn, 'Adeiladu ar gyfer y Dyfodol', o ran moderneiddio gwasanaethau cymdeithasol.

3:40 p.m.

**Y Llywydd:** Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar egwyddor y Gorchymyn.

**The Presiding Officer:** We will now vote on the principle of the Order.

*Cynnig: O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian

Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Randerson, Jenny  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

**Y Llywydd:** Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar y cynnig i gymeradwyo'r Gorchymyn. **The Presiding Officer:** We will now vote on the motion to approve the Order.

*Cynnig: O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion: For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin

Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Richards, Rod  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cymhellion Hyfforddi Athrawon (Addysg Bellach)  
 (Cymru) 2001  
 Approval of the Teacher Training Incentive (Further Education) (Wales)  
 Regulations 2001**

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I propose that **Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly considers the principle of the Teacher Training Incentive (Further Education) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 5 June 2001. (NDM731)*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Cymhellion Hyfforddi Athrawon (Addysg Bellach) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 5 Mehefin 2001. (NDM731)*

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified under Standing Order 11.5 any matters for concern in the draft order, the Teacher Training Incentive (Further Education) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 19 June 2001; and*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw wedi nodi o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5 unrhyw faterion sy'n peri pryder yn y gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Cymhellion Hyfforddi Athrawon (Addysg Bellach) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 19 Mehefin 2001; ac*

*2. approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 5 June 2001. (NDM732)*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 5 Mehefin 2001. (NDM732)*

I propose that the National Assembly welcomes and approves the introduction of these regulations. They will extend our

Cynigiau fod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn croesawu ac yn cymeradwyo'r cynnig i gyflwyno'r rheoliadau hyn. Byddant yn

successful scheme of grants for postgraduate teacher training, which leads to qualified teacher status, to cover postgraduates taking full-time further education postgraduate certificate in education courses, which do not lead to qualified teacher status.

The improved scheme will run initially for a two-year pilot period and will be introduced at the start of the coming academic year, in September 2001. The annual grant of up to £6,000 per student will help to ensure that the best candidates are attracted into teaching in the further education sector in Wales, driving up standards and results across the board. It is essential that we attract the highest quality candidates if we are to meet the challenges that we have set ourselves in terms of promoting and encouraging lifelong learning in Wales.

The FE sector is vital to the Assembly's vision of developing and harnessing the talents of all, not only the select few. It is crucial to achieving our aims of increasing employability, raising our economic performance, maximising the talents of all our people, promoting social inclusion and helping those still on the fringes of society back into the main stream. If we are to achieve those aims now and in the future, we must ensure that we harness the talents of our best graduates and promote teaching in the further education sector, as much as in schools, as a rewarding career choice.

The extension of the successful scheme of grants for teaching training to FE students will mean that all full-time postgraduate teacher trainees in Wales will benefit during their training course. Wales has a strong reputation for teacher training and this scheme will help us to maintain that reputation by attracting quality, highly-committed students to train and teach in further education in Wales.

**Pauline Jarman:** Plaid Cymru—The Party

ymestyn ein cynllun grant llwyddiannus ar gyfer hyfforddiant athrawon i ôl-raddedigion, sydd yn arwain at statws athro cymwys, i gynnwys ôl-raddedigion sydd yn dilyn tystysgrif amser llawn ôl-raddedig addysg bellach mewn cyrsiau addysg, nad ydynt yn arwain at statws athro cymwys.

Bydd y cynllun diwygiedig yn gweithredu am gyfnod peilot o ddwy flynedd i ddechrau a chaiff ei gyflwyno ar ddechrau'r flwyddyn academaidd nesaf ym mis Medi 2001. Bydd y grant blynyddol o hyd at £6,000 i bob myfyriwr yn helpu i sicrhau bod yr ymgeiswyr gorau yn cael eu denu i ddysgu yn y sector addysg bellach yng Nghymru, gan godi safonau a chanlyniadau yn gyffredinol. Mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn denu'r ymgeiswyr gorau er mwyn inni ateb yr heriau yr ydym wedi'u gosod i ni ein hunain o ran hyrwyddo ac annog dysgu gydol oes yng Nghymru.

Mae'r sector addysg bellach yn holl bwysig i weledigaeth y Cynulliad o ddatblygu a defnyddio doniau pawb, nid yr ychydig rai dethol yn unig. Mae'n holl bwysig er mwyn cyflawni ein nodau o wella cyflogadwyedd pobl, gwella ein perfformiad economaidd, gwneud y defnydd gorau o doniau ein bobl, hyrwyddo cynhwysedd cymdeithasol a helpu'r rhai sydd ar ymylon cymdeithas o hyd i ddychwelyd i'r brif ffrwd. Er mwyn inni gyflawni'r nodau hynny ar hyn o bryd ac yn y dyfodol, rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn defnyddio doniau ein graddedigion gorau a hyrwyddo dysgu yn y sector addysg bellach, cymaint ag mewn ysgolion, fel dewis gyrfa gwerth chweil.

Bydd ymestyn y cynllun grant llwyddiannus ar gyfer hyfforddi athrawon i fyfyrwyr addysg bellach yn golygu y bydd pob athro dan hyfforddiant sydd yn dilyn cwrs llawn amser i ôl-raddedigion yng Nghymru yn elwa yn ystod eu cwrs hyfforddi. Mae gan Gymru enw da o ran hyfforddi athrawon a bydd y cynllun hwn yn ein helpu i gadw'r enw da hwnnw drwy ddenu myfyrwyr tra ymroddedig o safon i hyfforddi a dysgu ym maes addysg bellach yng Nghymru.

**Pauline Jarman:** Mae Plaid Cymru—The



of Wales welcomes these regulations, which provide for grants to be paid to prospective teachers in further education. We all recognise that the quality of our further education depends entirely on the quality of the staff that we can attract into this sector. Hopefully, these regulations will play a part in attracting high calibre individuals into FE in Wales.

However, achieving a distinctive and world-class post-16 education system also depends upon the sector's ability to retain high quality staff. Only six weeks ago, the National Association of Teachers in Further and Higher Education held a one-day strike over pay and conditions in further education in Wales. There is much resentment in the FE system. Lecturers have had to come to terms with falling salary levels and the fact that their pay, in some cases, is up to 35 per cent less than that of school-based teachers, who do similar jobs.

People are looking for careers with beneficial pay and conditions. Although the Minister has limited direct responsibility in this area, I encourage her to consider carefully the situation facing our lecturers so that we can achieve the success in post-16 education for which we all aim.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn croesawu unrhyw welliant yn y sector hwn. Dros yr 20 mlynedd diwethaf, mae telerau ac amodau darlithwyr wedi dirywio o'u cymharu â rhai athrawon ysgol. Maent wedi dirywio cymaint fel bod gennym yr hyn y geilw'r Sais yn *cinderella service*. Mae telerau ac amodau yn wael yn y sector addysg bellach. Mae hyn yn gwanhau'r strategaeth ar gyfer gwella safonau addysg bellach, hyfforddiant a dysgu gydol oes, sydd yn allweddol i ddatblygiad bywydau pobl Cymru ynghyd â chyflwr economi'r wlad.

**Jonathan Morgan:** We also welcome these regulations as a positive step forward in the recruitment of lecturing staff in further education. Does the Government also have a strategy for the retention of staff?

Party of Wales yn croesawu'r rheoliadau hyn, sydd yn darparu grantiau i ddarpar athrawon ym maes addysg bellach. Yr ydym oll yn cydnabod bod ansawdd ein sector addysg bellach yn dibynnu'n llwyr ar ansawdd y staff y gallwn eu denu i'r sector hwn. Gobeithio y bydd y rheoliadau hyn yn cyfrannu at ddenu unigolion o safon i'r sector addysg bellach yng Nghymru.

Fodd bynnag, mae sicrhau system addysg ôl 16 unigryw o'r radd flaenaf hefyd yn dibynnu ar allu'r sector i gadw staff o safon uchel. Dim ond chwe wythnos yn ôl, bu streic gan Gymdeithas Genedlaethol yr Athrawon mewn addysg bellach ac Uwch oherwydd cyflog ac amodau mewn addysg bellach yng Nghymru. Mae cryn anniddigrwydd o fewn y system addysg bellach. Bu'n rhaid i ddarlithwyr ddygymod â'r ffaith bod lefel eu cyflogau yn gostwng a'u bod, mewn rhai achosion, yn ennill hyd at 35 y cant yn llai nag athrawon ysgol, sydd yn gwneud gwaith tebyg.

Mae pobl yn edrych am yrfaeodd sydd â chyflog ac amodau da. Er mai cyfyngedig yw cyfrifoldeb uniongyrchol y Gweinidog yn y maes hwn, apeliaf arni i ystyried yn ofalus y sefyllfa a wyneba ein darlithwyr er mwyn inni allu sicrhau'r llwyddiant mewn addysg ôl-16 yr ydym oll yn anelu ato.

**Eleanor Burnham:** The Liberal Democrats welcome any improvement in this sector. Over the last 20 years, the terms and conditions of lecturers have deteriorated in comparison with those of schoolteachers. In fact, they have deteriorated to such an extent that we now have a cinderella service. Terms and conditions are bad in the further education sector. That weakens the strategy for improving standards in further education, training and lifelong learning, which are key to improving the lives of people in Wales along with the country's economy.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Croesawn ninnau hefyd y rheoliadau hyn fel cam cadarnhaol ymlaen i recriwtio darlithwyr mewn addysg bellach. A oes gan y Llywodraeth strategaeth ar gyfer cadw staff hefyd? Un mater yw recriwtio

Recruitment is one thing but retention is another. We need to scrutinise the contracts that are used to employ lecturers. We need to consider whether lecturers are flexible in terms of their employment, whether they have the opportunity to develop professionally by taking time out of the college environment and, perhaps, obtaining work placements in industry. There are great opportunities, and I hope that these regulations will be the first step towards an interesting package of measures.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I am pleased that all Assembly Members welcome these new regulations. It is interesting that Jonathan referred to the retention of staff. In fact, it was the introduction of further education into the market place that drove down further education lecturers' wages and salaries, which means that they now have difficulty in matching their pay with their schoolteacher counterparts. The Government is trying to address this problem in Wales. That is why we allocated an extra £3 million to salaries in the FE sector at the end of last term. However, if we are going to deliver the reforms—which Tom Middlehurst initiated with the Education and Training Task Group and that are now coming through via ELWa—we must ensure, over a period of time, that we achieve good pay and conditions in all sectors that deliver the education agenda.

**Y Llywydd:** Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar egwyddor y rheoliadau.

staff, nid yw eu cadw cyn hawsed. Mae angen inni ystyried yn fanwl y contractau a ddefnyddir i gyflogi darlithwyr. Mae angen inni ystyried a yw darlithwyr yn hyblyg o ran eu cyflogaeth, a oes ganddynt gyfle i ddatblygu'n broffesiynol drwy gael seibiant o amgylchfyd y coleg ac, efallai, gael lleoliadau gwaith mewn diwydiant. Mae cyfleoedd gwych i'w cael, a gobeithiaf mai'r rheoliadau hyn fydd y cam cyntaf mewn pecyn diddorol o fesurau.

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Mae'n dda gennyf nodi bod holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn croesawu'r rheoliadau newydd hyn. Mae'n ddiddorol i Jonathan gyfeirio at gadw staff. Yn wir, cyflwyno addysg bellach i'r farchnad a ostyngodd gyflogau darlithwyr addysg bellach, sydd yn golygu y cânt anhawster erbyn hyn i gael yr un cyflog â'u cymheiriaid sydd yn dysgu mewn ysgolion. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn ceisio mynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon yng Nghymru. Dyna pam y dyranwyd £3 miliwn ychwanegol i'r sector addysg bellach ar ddiwedd y tymor diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, er mwyn inni gyflawni'r diwygiadau—a ddechreuwyd gan Tom Middlehurst gyda'r Grŵp Gorchwyl Addysg a Hyfforddiant ac sydd bellach yn cael eu rhoi ar waith drwy ELWa—rhaid inni sicrhau, dros gyfnod, ein bod yn rhoi cyflog ac amodau da ym mhob sector sydd yn darparu'r agenda addysg.

**The Presiding Officer:** We will now vote on the principle of the regulations.

*Cynnig: O blaid 31, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 31, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Ron

Edwards, Richard  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Gareth  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Randerson, Jenny  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried*

**Y Llywydd:** Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar y cynnig  
i gymeradwyo'r rheoliadau.

**The Presiding Officer:** We will now vote on  
the motion to approve the regulations.

*Cynnig: O blaid 30, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 30, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Gareth  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Randerson, Jenny  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3:36 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3:36 p.m.*

### **Lleihau Biwrocratiaeth mewn Ysgolion Reducing Bureaucracy in Schools**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1 and 4 in the name of Jocelyn Davies and amendments 2 and 3 in the name of William Graham. Before I call the Minister, I must stress that we are short of time. The Business Committee agreed this morning that those who propose both motions on this subject and reply to the debates must restrict themselves to 12 minutes. Depending on the number of contributors, I will restrict speeches to less than five minutes.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I propose that

*the National Assembly*

*1. welcomes the report of the project to reduce the bureaucratic burdens on schools in Wales laid in the Table Office on 2 July 2001 and the partnership working underpinning it.*

*2. recognises that the action recommended in the report is a starting point and will need to be carried through by the National Assembly and its partners if teachers and schools are to see a reduction in the amount of bureaucracy they have to deal with.*

*3. endorses the recommendations of the report and the associated action which is identified. (NDM733)*

I am pleased to be able to present the report on reducing the bureaucratic burdens on schools in Wales to Assembly Members. As a former teacher and a governing body chair, I understand the burdens that teachers face. I am committed to reducing bureaucratic burdens on schools and teachers. 'Putting Wales First' makes a commitment to

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 4 yn enw Jocelyn Davies a gwelliannau 2 a 3 yn enw William Graham. Cyn galw ar y Gweinidog, rhaid imi bwysleisio ein bod yn brin o amser. Cytunodd y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma bod yn rhaid i'r rheini sydd yn cynnig y ddau gynnig ar y pwnc hwn ac yn ateb y dadleuon eu cyfyngu eu hunain i 12 munud. Yn dibynnu ar nifer y cyfranwyr, cyfyngaf yr areithiau i lai na phum munud.

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*1. yn croesawu adroddiad y prosiect i leihau'r baich biwrocraidaidd ar ysgolion yng Nghymru, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Gorffennaf 2001, a'r gweithio ar y cyd sy'n sail iddo.*

*2. yn cydnabod bod y camau a argymhellir yn yr adroddiad yn fan cychwyn ac y bydd angen i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a'i bartneriaid weithredu arnynt os dymunir i athrawon ac ysgolion weld lleihad yn maint y fiwrocratiaeth y maent yn gorfod delio â hi.*

*3. yn cymeradwyo'r argymhellion yn yr adroddiad a'r camau gweithredu cysylltiedig a nodir. (NDM733)*

Yr wyf yn falch o allu cyflwyno'r adroddiad ar leihau'r baich biwrocraidaidd ar ysgolion yng Nghymru i Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Fel cyn athrawes a chadeirydd corff llywodraethol, deallaf y baich y mae athrawon yn ei wynebu. Yr wyf yn ymrwymedig i leihau baich biwrocraidaidd ar ysgolion ac athrawon. Ymrwyma 'Rhoi Cymru'n Gyntaf' i

‘free up teachers’ time to teach, by reducing the burden of paperwork.’

‘rhyddhau amser athrawon i ddysgu, drwy leihau baich y gwaith papur.’

3:50 p.m.

I pay tribute to my predecessor, Rosemary Butler, who gave the go-ahead to the bureaucratic burdens study. The Assembly always operates on an evidence base, and it is important that we have that evidence in order to take decisions for the future.

Talaf deyrnged i'm rhagflaenydd, Rosemary Butler, a roddodd ganiatâd i'r astudiaeth o'r baich biwrocraataidd fynd yn ei blaen. Gweithreda'r Cynulliad ar sail tystiolaeth bob amser, ac mae'n bwysig bod y dystiolaeth honno gennym er mwyn gwneud penderfyniadau ar gyfer y dyfodol.

The way in which the project was carried out also breaks new ground. We are dedicated to working in partnership with the teaching profession and other organisations involved with schools. It was decided that the project should be led by a serving teacher on secondment to the Assembly, and informed by input from an advisory group. The project was led by Mandy Paish, the deputy headteacher of Tongwynlais Primary School in Cardiff. I am grateful for all her hard work, and her insistence that the report's recommendations be practical and deliverable—not a wish list or a catalogue of pious intentions.

Mae'r ffordd y cynhaliwyd y prosiect hefyd yn torri tir newydd. Yr ydym yn ymrwymedig i weithio mewn partneriaeth â'r proffesiwn addysgu a sefydliadau eraill sydd yn gysylltiedig ag ysgolion. Penderfynwyd y dylai athro mewn gwasanaeth a secondiwyd i'r Cynulliad arwain y prosiect, ac y dylai gael ei lywio gan fewnbwn gan grŵp ymgynghorol. Arweiniwyd y prosiect gan Mandy Paish, sef dirprwy bennaeth Ysgol Gynradd Tongwynlais yng Nghaerdydd. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar iddi am ei holl waith caled, a'i thaerineb y dylai argymhellion yr adroddiad fod yn ymarferol ac yn gyflawnadwy—nid yn rhestr dymuniadau neu'n gatalog o fwriadau da.

I am also grateful to the advisory group for its support for the project. The membership of that group is listed in the report. All the teachers' and headteachers' unions were involved, as well as Governors Wales, Unison, the Welsh Local Government Association, the Association of Directors of Education in Wales, Estyn, ACCAC and members of staff of the Assembly's Education Department and Statistical Directorate.

Yr wyf hefyd yn ddiolchgar i'r grŵp ymgynghorol am gefnogi'r prosiect. Rhestrir aelodau'r grŵp hwnnw yn yr adroddiad. Bu holl undebau'r athrawon a'r penaethiaid yn cymryd rhan, yn ogystal â Llywodraethwyr Cymru, Unsain, Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, Sefydliad Cyfarwyddwyr Addysg Cymru, Estyn, ACCAC ac aelodau staff Adran Addysg a Chyfarwyddiaeth Ystadegol y Cynulliad.

I know that some bodies on the advisory group are disappointed that the report's recommendations are not more radical. A great deal of expectation has been riding on this report; some of it has probably been unrealistic. However, as the recommendations are implemented, their far-reaching impact will become apparent, and the report will be seen as a key instrument of change. The actions detailed in the report are the beginning of a process to which we are all committed.

Gwn fod rhai cyrff ar y grŵp ymgynghorol yn siomedig nad yw argymhellion yr adroddiad yn fwy radical. Bu disgwyl mawr am yr adroddiad hwn; bu llawer ohono yn afrealistig fwy na thebyg. Fodd bynnag, wrth i'r argymhellion gael eu gweithredu, daw eu heffaith bellgyrhaeddol yn amlwg, a gwelir yr adroddiad fel offeryn allweddol i newid. Mae'r camau gweithredu y manylir arnynt yn yr adroddiad yn ddechrau proses yr ydym oll yn ymrwymedig iddi.

We are at a turning point where we have the opportunity to work in the closest harmony with all partners in education to reduce the burdens on schools in Wales. That work is a catalyst for future co-operation in developing teaching and learning in all our schools.

The motion before you invites the National Assembly to welcome the report and the partnership work that underpins it, and to recognise that the action recommended is a starting point that we and our partners will need to carry forward if teachers and schools are to experience a reduction in bureaucracy. This is the first time that the bureaucratic burden on schools in Wales has been examined in its totality and individual elements examined systematically. All areas of school activity were considered.

The schools that took part in the research were asked whether a certain area of school activity contributed to the key objective of school improvement, or whether it was unduly burdensome because of how it was managed. The conclusion was that all areas of activity contributed to school improvement; none were identified that could simply be removed. However, it was also concluded that the bureaucratic systems that the schools are required to use could be more effective, efficient and manageable.

I draw Members' attention to the page in the report listing the changes that schools can expect as a result of its recommendations: more effective management and presentation by the Assembly of documentation issued to schools; access to curriculum planning materials via a national website; a review of the bureaucracy surrounding public examinations; the introduction of unique pupil numbers and a common data set; and a reduction in the burden of inspections. Those are some examples of major changes that will happen as a result of this work. The National Assembly's Training and Education Department, Estyn, ACCAC and the local education authorities are committed to

Yr ydym wedi cyrraedd trobwynt lle y mae gennym y cyfle i gydweithio mor agos â phosibl gyda phob partner mewn addysg er mwyn lleihau'r baich ar ysgolion yng Nghymru. Mae'r gwaith hwnnw yn gatalydd i gydweithredu yn y dyfodol ym maes datblygu addysgu a dysgu ym mhob un o'n hysgolion.

Mae'r cynnig ger eich bron yn gwahodd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i groesawu'r adroddiad a'r gwaith partneriaeth sydd yn sail iddo, ac i gydnabod mai man cychwyn yw'r cam gweithredu a argymhellwyd ac y bydd angen i ni a'n partneriaid ei ddatblygu er mwyn i athrawon ac ysgolion weld gostyngiad mewn biwrocraetiaeth. Dyma'r tro cyntaf i'r baich biwrocraetiaid ar ysgolion yng Nghymru gael ei ystyried yn ei gyfanrwydd ac i elfennau unigol gael eu harchwilio'n gyfundrefnol. Ystyriwyd pob maes o weithgarwch ysgolion.

Gofynnwyd i'r ysgolion a gymerodd ran yn yr ymchwil pa un a oedd maes penodol o weithgarwch ysgolion yn cyfrannu at yr amcan allweddol o wella ysgolion, neu pa un a oedd yn orfeichus oherwydd y ffordd y câi ei reoli. Y casgliad oedd bod pob maes gweithgarwch yn cyfrannu at wella ysgolion; ni nodwyd yr un y gellid cael gwared arno. Fodd bynnag, daethpwyd i'r casgliad hefyd y gallai'r systemau biwrocraetiaid y mae'n ofynnol i'r ysgolion eu defnyddio fod yn fwy effeithiol, effeithlon a hydrin.

Tynnaf sylw'r Aelodau at y dudalen yn yr adroddiad sydd yn rhestru'r newidiadau y gall ysgolion eu disgwyl o ganlyniad i'w argymhellion: rheoli dogfennaeth a gyhoeddir gan y Cynulliad i ysgolion yn fwy effeithiol a'i gyflwyno yn well; mynediad i ddeunyddiau cynllunio cwricwlwm drwy gyfrwng gwefan genedlaethol; adolygu'r fiwrocraetiaeth sydd yn ymwneud ag arholiadau cyhoeddus; cyflwyno niferoedd disgyblion unigryw a chyfres data cyffredin; a lleihad ym maich yr arolygiadau. Dyna rai enghreifftiau o'r newidiadau mawr a fydd o ganlyniad i'r gwaith hwn. Mae Adran Hyfforddiant ac Addysg y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, Estyn, ACCAC a'r

carrying these recommendations through.

awdurdodau addysg lleol yn ymrwymedig i gyflawni'r argymhellion hyn.

Certain areas of school improvement were not cited by schools as being unduly burdensome, and action is not recommended in those areas. For that reason I cannot support amendment 4, in the name of Jocelyn Davies, which calls for immediate action to reduce burdens in relation to target setting, attainment tests and the national curriculum. These requirements are regularly examined and the bureaucratic burdens involved will be considered as part of that examination. However, the report commends action in relation to inspections, which is the other matter mentioned in her amendment.

Ni chrybwyllodd ysgolion rai meysydd penodol o wella ysgolion fel baich gormodol, ac nid argymhellir gweithredu yn y meysydd hynny. Oherwydd hynny ni allaf gefnogi gwelliant 4, yn enw Jocelyn Davies, sydd yn galw am weithredu'n uniongyrchol i leihau baich mewn perthynas â gosod targedau, profion cyrhaeddiad a'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol. Archwilir y gofynion hyn yn rheolaidd a rhoddir ystyriaeth i'r baich biwrocraidd dan sylw fel rhan o'r archwiliad hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, mae'r adroddiad yn cymeradwyo gweithredu mewn perthynas ag arolygiadau, sef y mater arall a grybwyllwyd yn ei gwelliant.

We will continue to monitor and evaluate the implementation of action plans, and carry through the report's commitment to monitoring all new initiatives, with the intention of ensuring that bureaucratic implications are considered in the light of the overall burdens to schools. The organisations involved in the advisory group will be brought together at intervals to review progress. The gatekeeping arrangements on all policies that will be in place from September 2001 will be a bureaucracy test to ensure that future education policies will not unnecessarily increase the bureaucratic burdens on schools. Therefore, I can support, in principle, the amendments tabled by William Graham. I note that the report specifically states that all new initiatives will be monitored for their bureaucratic input.

Parhawn i fonitro a gwerthuso'r ffordd y gweithredir y cynlluniau gweithredu, a chyflawni ymrwymiad yr adroddiad i fonitro pob menter newydd, gyda'r bwriad o sicrhau yr ystyrir goblygiadau biwrocraidd yng ngoleuni'r baich cyffredinol i ysgolion. Bydd y sefydliadau sydd yn gysylltiedig â'r grŵp ymgynghorol yn dod ynghyd yn achlysurol er mwyn adolygu'r cynnydd. Bydd trefniadau rheoli pob polisi a fydd ar waith o Fedi 2001 yn brawf biwrocraetiaeth i sicrhau na fydd polisiau addysg yn y dyfodol yn cynyddu'r baich biwrocraidd ar ysgolion yn ddiangen. Felly, gallaf gefnogi'r gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd gan William Graham mewn egwyddor. Nodaf fod yr adroddiad yn nodi'n benodol y caiff pob menter newydd ei monitro am ei mewnbwn biwrocraidd.

The ongoing monitoring will also take account of the conclusions of the study on teacher workloads in Wales and England, currently being carried out by PricewaterhouseCoopers for the Department for Education and Skills.

Bydd y monitro parhaus hefyd yn ystyried casgliadau'r astudiaeth ar faich gwaith athrawon yng Nghymru a Lloegr, a gynhelir ar hyn o bryd gan PricewaterhouseCoopers ar ran yr Adran Addysg a Sgiliau.

The actions outlined in the report will take six to nine months to begin to have an impact on schools. Therefore, by the start of the 2002 school year, schools will benefit from a reduction in burden. I cannot, therefore, support amendment 2, which would put the timetable back. The amendment also refers to

Bydd y camau gweithredu a amlinellir yn yr adroddiad yn cymryd rhwng chwech a naw mis i ddechrau cael effaith ar ysgolion. Felly, erbyn dechrau'r flwyddyn ysgol 2002, bydd ysgolion yn elwa ar ostyngiad yn eu baich. Ni allaf, felly, gefnogi gwelliant 2, a fyddai'n arafu'r amserlen. Cyfeiria'r gwelliant hefyd

burdens having increased over the last four years. Teachers tell us constantly that many of the burdens were in place in 1997. It is disingenuous of the Conservatives to accept that their Government had no part to play in placing burdens on schools.

In the short term, I acknowledge that schools will still be burdened by the present requirements. To help schools deal with this, a separate motion to approve a special grant report will be proposed. This will provide every school in Wales with a £1,000 to help them manage their bureaucratic burdens in this school year. The total provision is £2 million. The decision to give a flat rate amount of £1,000 goes some way to recognising the disproportionate difficulty that small schools face in managing bureaucratic burdens. Many schools will want to do a number of things with this money. For example, they could employ additional administrative support, provide supply cover to enable teachers or headteachers to work on administrative tasks, purchase resources needed for those tasks or review systems.

These are the actions flowing from the project that recognises the resource implications of bureaucratic burdens. The report also refers to the importance of recognising administrative support needs in local authorities' formulae for delegated schools budget, and builds on resources the Assembly is already committed to providing for information technology. I cannot support Jocelyn Davies's amendment 4 for two reasons. First, it would strike from the motion the commitment to action by the Assembly and its partners. It is crucial that all the partners work with the Assembly in taking action on this report. Secondly, it would not recognise the fact that many of the recommendations in the report are about better use of existing resources.

The last point links with the message that the report seeks to convey, namely that action should flow from the report at local level. Through the Association of Directors of

at faich a gynyddodd dros y pedair blynedd diwethaf. Dywed athrawon wrthym yn gyson fod llawer o'r beichiau yn bod yn 1997. Mae'r Ceidwadwyr yn ffuantus i dderbyn nad oedd gan eu Llywodraeth hwy ran i'w chwarae yn y baich a roddwyd ar ysgolion.

Yn y tymor byr, cydnabyddaf y bydd ysgolion yn parhau i ddiodeff baich gyda'r gofynion presennol. Er mwyn helpu ysgolion i ddelio â hyn, cynigir cynnig ar wahân i gymeradwyo adroddiad grant arbennig. Bydd hyn yn darparu £1,000 ar gyfer pob ysgol yng Nghymru i'w helpu i reoli ei baich biwrocraidd yn ystod y flwyddyn ysgol hon. Cyfanswm y ddarpariaeth yw £2 filiwn. Aiff y penderfyniad i roi un swm o £1,000 gam o'r ffordd tuag at gydnabod yr anhawster anghymesur a wyneba ysgolion bach wrth reoli baich biwrocraidd. Bydd llawer o ysgolion am wneud nifer o bethau gyda'r arian hwn. Er enghraifft, gallent gyflogi cymorth gweinyddol ychwanegol, darparu athrawon cyflenwi er mwyn galluogi athrawon neu benaethiaid i weithio ar dasgau gweinyddol, prynu adnoddau sydd eu hangen ar gyfer y tasgau hynny neu adolygu systemau.

Dyma'r camau gweithredu sydd yn deillio o'r prosiect sydd yn cydnabod goblygiadau baich biwrocraidd o ran adnoddau. Cyfeiria'r adroddiad hefyd at bwysigrwydd cydnabod anghenion cefnogaeth weinyddol o fewn fformwlâu awdurdodau lleol ar gyfer cyllideb a ddirprwyir i ysgolion, ac mae'n adeiladu ar yr adnoddau y mae'r Cynulliad yn ymrwymedig eisoes i'w darparu ar gyfer technoleg gwybodaeth. Ni allaf gefnogi gwelliant 4 Jocelyn Davies am ddau reswm. Yn gyntaf, byddai ymrwymiad y Cynulliad a'i bartneriaid i weithredu yn cael ei dynnu o'r cynnig. Mae'n hollbwysig bod yartneriaid yn cydweithio gyda'r Cynulliad wrth weithredu ar yr adroddiad hwn. Yn ail, ni fyddai'n cydnabod y ffaith bod llawer o'r argymhellion yn yr adroddiad yn ymwneud â defnyddio adnoddau presennol yn well.

Mae'r pwynt olaf yn gysylltiedig â'r neges y ceisia'r adroddiad ei chyfleu, sef y dylai'r camau a gymerir lifo o'r adroddiad ar lefel leol. Drwy'r Gymdeithas Cyfarwyddwyr



Education in Wales, local authorities have indicated that they will discuss the report with all of their schools, which will lead to shared decisions about how locally imposed bureaucratic burdens can be better managed.

I hope that reflection will extend into the schools themselves, with the result that schools will become more confident about challenging requirements placed on them if their purpose is unclear or the procedures are unduly cumbersome; that, where schools have discretion, they will be more confident about not carrying out tasks judged to be of little benefit to school improvement, which is described in common parlance as 'the wastepaper bin'; and, in order to secure the greatest benefit from reductions in external requirements, and as a matter of good practice, schools keep their own procedures under review.

The report signals clearly our commitment to reducing bureaucratic burdens on schools, and to the long haul involved. There are no instant or easy solutions, but we can make real and sustainable differences and free teachers to get on with the job of driving up standards of teaching and learning in all our schools. I invite members to support the motion.

**Gareth Jones:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 1: ym mhwynt 2, dileu'r geiriau 'ac y bydd angen i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a'i bartneriaid weithredu arnynt', a rhoi yn eu lle 'a bod angen adnoddau ychwanegol'.

Cynigiau welliant 4. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes i gymryd camau ar fyrder i leihau'r beichiau sy'n deillio o'r pwyslais gormodol ar dargedau, gofynion y drefn arolygu, profion cyrhaeddiad a baich y cwricwlwm er mwyn parchu gallu proffesiynol athrawon a rhyddhau mwy o'u hamser ar gyfer eu prif gyfrifoldeb, sef addysgu eu disgyblion.*

Addysg yng Nghymru, mae awdurdodau lleol wedi nodi y trafodant yr adroddiad gyda phob un o'u hysgolion, a fydd yn arwain at rannu penderfyniadau ar sut y gellir rheoli beichiau biwrocraidaidd a orfodir yn lleol yn well.

Gobeithiaf yr ymestynna'r ystyriaeth honno i'r ysgolion eu hunain, gyda'r canlyniad y daw ysgolion yn fwy hyderus am ofynion ymestynnol a roddir arnynt os bydd eu diben yn aneglur neu os bydd y gweithdrefnau yn orfeichus; y byddant, lle y bydd gan ysgolion ryddid i'w weithredu, yn fwy hyderus am beidio â chyflawni tasgau y bernir nad ydynt yn fuddiol iawn i wella'r ysgol, ac a ddisgrifir yn gyffredin fel 'y bin sbwriel'; ac, er mwyn sicrhau'r budd pennaf o leihau gofynion allanol, ac fel mater o arfer da, fod ysgolion yn adolygu eu gweithdrefnau eu hunain.

Dengys yr adroddiad yn glir ein hymrwymiad i leihau baich biwrocraidaidd ar ysgolion, ac i'r ymdrech faith fydd yn ofynnol. Nid oes atebion hawdd y gellir eu gweithredu dros nos, ond gallwn wneud gwahaniaethau gwirioneddol a chynaliadwy a rhyddhau athrawon i fwrw ymlaen â'r gwaith o godi safonau addysgu a dysgu ym mhob un o'n hysgolion. Gwahoddaf yr aelodau i gefnogi'r cynnig.

**Gareth Jones:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 1: in point 2, delete 'and will need to be carried through by the National Assembly and its partners' and replace with 'and that further resources are needed'.

I propose amendment 4. Add new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to take immediate action to reduce the burdens caused by the over-emphasis on targets, the demands of the inspection system, attainment tests and the burdens of the curriculum in order to respect the professional competence of teachers and free more of their time for their principal responsibility, that of educating their pupils.*

Diolchaf i'r cyn-Ysgrifennydd Addysg a Phlant, Rosemary Butler, am gomisiynu arolwg systematig o'r elfennau ym myd addysg sydd yn creu'r fath waith papur yn ein hysgolion fel ei fod yn tansailio ac yn llyffetheirio ymdrechion athrawon. Mae'r sefyllfa bellach yn ddifrifol ymhlith athrawon Cymru, gan ei fod yn achosi lefelau o straen a salwch sydd gyda'r gwaethaf ym Mhrydain. Mae'n achosi i athrawon golli dyddiau o waith, sydd, o ganlyniad, yn gorfodi ysgolion i ddibynnu mwyfwy ar lai a llai o athrawon llanw. Mae hefyd yn creu anawsterau recriwtio ac yn effeithio ar y cyflenwad o athrawon yn gyffredinol. Yn ei dro, mae hyn yn amharu ar berfformiad a safonau cyrhaeddiad disgyblion. Golyga hynny broblemau i reolwyr a llywodraethwyr ysgolion ac, wrth iddynt geisio fynd i'r afael â thanberfformiad, maent yn tueddu i ofyn mwy a mwy gan athrawon. Yn y pen draw, rhydd hynny fwy o bwysau ar athrawon. Mae'r sefyllfa, felly, yn gylch dieflig sydd yn anodd i'w dorri.

Yn anffodus, hanfod yr adroddiad hwn yw adnabod a chydabod y cylch dieflig hwn, heb gynnig ateb a fyddai'n torri'r cylch ac yn rhyddhau ysgolion o'r baich cynyddol o waith papur y maent yn ei wynebu.

4:00 p.m.

Mae'n amlwg nad gormodiaith yw'r math hwnnw o ddatganiad, gan fod yr Adran Addysg a Sgiliau yn San Steffan wedi comisiynu astudiaeth o lwyth gwaith athrawon a fydd, yn ôl y gobaith, yn gwneud argymhellion penodol i gael gwared ag unrhyw lwyth gwaith gormodol.

Mae'r ffaith bod yr astudiaeth honno'n cael ei chynnal yn lleihau arwyddocâd adroddiad Mandy Paish. Serch hynny, mae'n deg cydnabod yr adroddiad a datgan ein gwerthfawrogiad o waith Mandy a'r grŵp ymgynghorol fel man cychwyn i ddatrys y problem.

Yr ydym angen mwy na disgrifiad o'r broblem os ydym wir am ei datrys a gwella ansawdd y gwasanaeth addysg. Yr oeddwn

I thank the former Secretary for Education and Children, Rosemary Butler, for commissioning a systematic review of the aspects of education that create so much paperwork that it undermines and frustrates teachers' efforts. The situation for teachers in Wales is serious, because it creates levels of stress and illness that are among the worst in Britain. It causes teachers to miss work, which, as a result, forces schools to further depend on a decreasing number of supply teachers. It also creates recruitment difficulties and affects the supply of teachers in general. In turn, this affects pupils' performance and their standards of achievement. That causes problems for school managers and governors and, as they try to tackle underperformance, they tend to ask more and more of teachers. Ultimately, that places further pressure on teachers. The situation, therefore, is a vicious circle that is difficult to break.

Unfortunately, the report's essence is to identify and acknowledge this vicious circle, without offering a solution that would break the circle and free schools from the increasing burden of paperwork that they face.

That kind of statement is obviously not an exaggeration, as the Department for Education and Skills at Westminster has commissioned a study on teachers' workloads. That study will, hopefully, make specific recommendations on eliminating any excessive workloads.

The fact that that study is now taking place reduces the significance of Mandy Paish's report. However, it is fair to acknowledge the report and show our appreciation of Mandy's work and the consultation group as a starting point in solving the problem.

We need more than a description of the problem if we are serious about solving it and improving the quality of the education

yn siomedig o ddarllen paragraff 1.13 yr adroddiad, sy'n datgan na ddaeth y prosiect o hyd i unrhyw agwedd o'r gwaith y gellid ei hepgor. Hyd y gwelaf, y prif gasgliad yw y dylid rheoli systemau'n well. Nid oes ryfedd na chafodd yr adroddiad dderbyniad twymgalon gan y cyrff proffesiynol.

Mae sgôp i ddi-ddymu ambell haen fiwrocraidd o obsesiwn ein sefydliadau gyda blaengareddau di-rif, gwneud ceisiadau am yr hyn a'r llall, cynllunio, cofnodi, asesu, arholi, rheoli, monitro, hunanarfarnu, arolygu, targedu, cystadlu, ariannu, cyfarfodydd rhieni, llywodraethu ac ati. Gellid diddymu rhai elfennau o'r rhestr hwnnw.

Dyna pam yr ydym wedi cyflwyno dau welliant sy'n annog y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth i weithredu—i geisio gwneud rhywbeth gweledol a phenodol i leihau biwrocraeth, yn hytrach na dim ond ei ddisgrifio fel y gwna'r adroddiad, er y gwna hynny'n hynod effeithiol. Dyna'r gwahaniaeth rhwng Plaid Cymru a'r Llywodraeth.

Mae'r ddau welliant yn enw Jocelyn Davies yn galw am yr hyn sy'n gwbl amlwg i bawb—heblaw'r Llywodraeth efallai—sef bod angen adnoddau i leihau yr haen fiwrocraidd. Gellid gwneud hynny, er enghraifft, drwy fuddsoddi mewn, a sicrhau, cynhaliadau weinyddol ddigonol i bob ysgol. Mae'r gwelliannau hefyd yn cynnig meysydd amlwg lle gellid lleihau, os nad diddymu, gwaith papur diangen.

Byddwn yn atal ein pleidlais ar welliant 2 yn enw William Graham. Er ein bod yn cytuno bod y Llywodraeth wedi cynyddu biwrocraeth yn ein hysgolion yn ystod y pedair blynedd diwethaf, gan waethygu'r broblem, ni allwn anghofio bod y Llywodraeth Geidwadol wedi cyfrannu at hynny, fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog. Y Llywodraeth honno a ddechreuodd y dirywiad drwy lwytho dyletswyddau a chyfrifoldebau gweinyddol ychwanegol ar ein hysgolion drwy gynlluniau rheolaeth

service. I was disappointed to read paragraph 1.13 of the report, which states that the project did not identify any aspect of the work that could be omitted. As far as I can see, the main conclusion is that there should be better management of systems. It is not surprising that the professional bodies did not give this report a warm-hearted reception.

There is scope to eliminate some layers of bureaucracy from our institutions' obsession with countless initiatives, bidding for this and that, planning, recording, assessing, examining, managing, monitoring, self-assessment, inspection, targeting, competing, funding, parents' meetings, governing and so on. Some elements of that list could be eliminated.

That is why we have tabled two amendments encouraging the partnership Government to act—to try to do something visual and specific to reduce bureaucracy, rather than just describing it as the report does, albeit effectively. That is the difference between Plaid Cymru and the Government.

Both amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies call for what is completely evident to everyone—except the Government perhaps—namely that resources are needed to reduce the bureaucratic tier. That could be done, for example, by investing in, and ensuring, sufficient administrative support for all schools. The amendments also propose obvious areas in which unnecessary paperwork could be decreased, if not eliminated.

We will abstain on amendment 2 in the name of William Graham. Although we agree that the Government has increased bureaucracy in our schools over the past four years, thus exacerbating the problem, we cannot forget that the Conservative Government contributed to that, as the Minister said. It was that Government that began the deterioration by piling additional administrative duties and responsibilities on schools through local management plans, but without giving sufficient financial funding to

lleol, ond heb roi cyllid ariannol digonol i ysgolion allu ymdopi â'r pwysau gweinyddol ychwanegol. Dyna oedd man cychwyn y dirywiad.

Ni fyddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant 3, gan nad ydym o blaid profion na biwrocratiaeth. Ni allaf gefnogi unrhyw welliant sy'n gofyn am brawf biwrocratiaeth. Mae hynny'n gwbl groes i ddaliadau Plaid Cymru.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I can understand why the Plaid Cymru group is against testing performance and ability. After all, the party's chief executive has said that Plaid Cymru's leader is still on a learning curve.

**Gareth Jones:** Nid yw'r Ceidwadwyr yn deall y sefyllfa. Maent eisiau mwy o brofion a mwy o fiwrocratiaeth. Maent yn araf i ddyngu'r wers.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I propose the following amendments in the name of William Graham. Amendment 2: add a new point:

*notes with concern the increase in bureaucracy in schools during the past four years, and calls on the Liberal Democrat/Labour Administration to bring forward policies to reduce this burden by 2003.*

I propose amendment 3. Add a new point:

*calls on the Liberal Democrat/Labour Administration to introduce a 'bureaucracy test' to ensure that future education policies will not increase the bureaucratic burden on schools.*

I am grateful to the Minister for admitting that, since 1997, the overall level of bureaucracy in schools has not been reduced. Her statement is as good as an admission of that. She can point to the 18 years previous to 1997 and say that the levels of bureaucracy increased. They did. There is no doubt about that. However, there is clearly a problem with the school system in England and Wales when you want to raise standards in a variety

enable schools to cope with the additional administrative pressure. That was the starting point of the deterioration.

We will not support amendment 3, as we do not support tests or bureaucracy. I cannot support any amendment that calls for a bureaucracy test. That is completely opposed to Plaid Cymru's beliefs.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Gallaf ddeall pam bod grŵp Plaid Cymru yn erbyn profi perfformiad a gallu. Wedi'r cwbl, mae prif weithredwr y blaid wedi dweud bod arweinydd Plaid Cymru yn dal yn y broses o ddyngu.

**Gareth Jones:** The Conservatives do not understand the situation. They want more tests and more bureaucracy. They are slow to learn the lesson.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Cynigïaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw William Graham. Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu pwynt newydd:

*yn nodi gyda phryder y cynnydd mewn biwrocratiaeth mewn ysgolion yn ystod y pedair blynedd diwethaf, ac yn galw ar Weinyddiaeth y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol/y Blaid Lafur i gyflwyno polisiau i leihau'r baich hwnnw erbyn 2003.*

Cynigïaf welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd:

*yn galw ar Weinyddiaeth y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol/y Blaid Lafur i gyflwyno 'prawf biwrocratiaeth' er mwyn sicrhau na fydd polisiau addysg a gyflwynir yn y dyfodol yn cynyddu'r baich biwrocrataidd ar ysgolion.*

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am gyfaddef nad yw'r lefel biwrocratiaeth gyffredinol mewn ysgolion, ers 1997, wedi gostwng. Mae ei datganiad cystal â chydabod hynny. Gall gyfeirio at y 18 mlynedd cyn 1997 a dweud bod y lefelau biwrocratiaeth wedi cynyddu. Fe wnaethant. Nid oes amheuaeth am hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg bod problem gyda'r system ysgolion yng Nghymru a Lloegr pan fyddwch

of forms, monitor performance or ensure that we have the best education system possible. In monitoring standards, there is a tendency for bureaucracy, paperwork and burdens to increase.

I take on board Gareth Jones's point that, when you attempt to increase the burdens of responsibility on the teaching profession and schools, you must ensure that there are support mechanisms to assist them. I will refer—where there are concerns about the current systems in Wales—to some of the new schemes and initiatives that have been introduced and to some of the means by which we can reduce the administrative burdens that there are in Wales. First, however, I thank Mandy Paish and the team for the work that they undertook. It is a comprehensive report and, as it outlines, it is a starting point for reducing the burden of bureaucracy in schools. It does not outline all the mechanisms for reducing the burden nor does it outline everything that we could do in the next 10 to 15 years. It does not point to every measure that we must introduce, but it is a comprehensive, thorough piece of analytical work that outlines exactly our present situation and the direction in which we should be heading. As outlined in the report, I am looking forward to seeing some of these measures being put into practice in the next nine to 12 months and seeing some of the positive impacts on our schools and the teaching profession in Wales. The report clearly indicates that we would like to see a positive impact as quickly as possible.

I also congratulate the teaching unions for their input in this debate. Unlike the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, the two opposition parties in the Assembly have a more pro-active and positive relationship with the teaching unions. Their input has been welcome and they have a positive role to play in ensuring that we reduce the overall levels of bureaucracy in schools.

The size of the report indicates the extent of the problem. Had this been a two-page summary report you would have said that there were no problems with bureaucracy in

am godi safonau mewn amrywiaeth o ffyrdd, monitro perfformiad neu sicrhau bod gennym y system addysg orau bosibl. Wrth fonitro safonau, mae tuedd i fiwrocratiaeth, gwaith papur a beichiau gynyddu.

Derbyniaf bwynt Gareth Jones sef, pan wnewch ymgais i gynyddu baich cyfrifoldeb y proffesiwn addysgu ac ysgolion, rhaid ichi sicrhau bod cefnogaeth i'w cynorthwyo. Cyfeiriaf—lle y bo pryderon am y systemau presennol yng Nghymru—at rai o'r cynlluniau a'r mentrau newydd a gyflwynwyd ac at rai o'r ffyrdd y gallwn leihau'r baich gweinyddol sydd yng Nghymru. Yn gyntaf, fodd bynnag, diolchaf i Mandy Paish a'r tîm am y gwaith yr ymgymerasant ag ef. Mae'n adroddiad cynhwysfawr ac, fel yr amlinella, mae'n fan cychwyn i leihau baich biwrocratiaeth mewn ysgolion. Nid yw'n amlinellu'r holl ddulliau ar gyfer lleihau'r baich ac nid yw ychwaith yn amlinellu popeth y gallem ei wneud o fewn y 10 i 15 mlynedd nesaf. Ni chyfeiria at bob mesur y mae'n rhaid inni ei gyflwyno, ond mae'n ddarn cynhwysfawr, trwyadl o waith dadansoddol sydd yn amlinellu ein hunion sefyllfa ar hyn o bryd a'r cyfeiriad y dylem fod yn mynd tuag ato. Fel yr amlinellwyd yn yr adroddiad, edrychaf ymlaen at weld rhai o'r mesurau hyn yn cael eu rhoi ar waith o fewn y naw i 12 mis nesaf a gweld rhai o'r effeithiau cadarnhaol ar ein hysgolion a'r proffesiwn addysgu yng Nghymru. Dynoda'r adroddiad yn glir yr hoffem weld effaith gadarnhaol cyn gynted ag y bo modd.

Llongyfarchaf hefyd yr undebau addysgu am eu cyfraniad i'r ddadl hon. Yn wahanol i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, mae gan y ddwy wrthblaid yn y Cynulliad berthynas fwy rhagweithiol a chadarnhaol gyda'r undebau addysgu. Croesawyd eu cyfraniad ac mae ganddynt rôl gadarnhaol i'w chwarae wrth sicrhau ein bod yn lleihau lefelau cyffredinol biwrocratiaeth mewn ysgolion.

Dynoda maint yr adroddiad raddau'r broblem. Pe bai hwn wedi bod yn adroddiad cryno o ddwy dudalen, byddech wedi dweud nad oedd unrhyw broblemau gyda

schools. Clearly, the size of the report and the extent of the work indicate the extent of the problem that we face in Wales. There are a number of initiatives that have been introduced in recent years by this administration that add to the burden of bureaucracy. The first is performance-related pay. That has increased the amount of paperwork, it has increased the amount of monitoring, it has increased the stress, the workload and the number of hours taken by teachers having to monitor their own performance and work.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Jonathan, you refer to the increase in bureaucracy in schools at present. You also refer to this report as a starting point, as did the Minister. I am grateful to you. I am glad that there are some people in this Chamber who are so confident of their abilities to deal with interventions that they take them. However, do you agree that with the present increase in bureaucracy, this report is not going to the heart of the matter in terms of getting rid of it and that it is perhaps characteristic of this coalition Government? It is joined-up, seamless and totally impotent in its desire to do something about the situation.

Your amendment 3 calls for a 'bureaucracy test'. Will you explain how you test bureaucracy without introducing a new level of bureaucracy to test that bureaucracy? In trying to manage bureaucracy you are creating more.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Had I been the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning then this report's remit would have been different. Mandy Paish delivered the report exactly within the remit that was set, but if we had said that we wished to go one stage further then the report would have been more extensive. However, within the remit it was right that that analytical work was written in that way. I would not criticise Mandy Paish and the team for the work that they undertook. The criticism—as you pointed out—is of the Government and the soggy way in which it tends to approach these issues.

biwrocratiaeth mewn ysgolion. Yn amlwg, dynoda maint yr adroddiad a graddau'r gwaith faint y broblem a wynebwn yng Nghymru. Mae nifer o fentrau a gyflwynwyd yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf gan y weinyddiaeth hon sydd yn ychwanegu at faich biwrocratiaeth. Y gyntaf yw tâl ar sail perfformiad. Mae hynny wedi cynyddu'r gwaith papur, mae wedi cynyddu'r monitro, mae wedi cynyddu'r straen, y baich gwaith a nifer yr oriau a gymerir gan athrawon sydd yn gorfod monitro eu perfformiad a'u gwaith eu hunain.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Jonathan, yr ydych yn cyfeirio at gynnydd mewn biwrocratiaeth mewn ysgolion ar hyn o bryd. Cyfeiriwch hefyd at yr adroddiad hwn fel man cychwyn, fel y gwnaeth y Gweinidog. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi. Yr wyf yn falch bod rhai pobl yn y Siambr hon sydd mor hyderus yn eu galluoedd i ddelio ag ymyriadau fel eu bod yn eu cymryd. Fodd bynnag, a gytunwch nad aiff yr adroddiad hwn, gyda'r cynnydd presennol mewn biwrocratiaeth, at wraidd y mater yn nhermau cael gwared â hi a'i fod efallai yn nodweddiadol o'r Llywodraeth glymblaid hon? Mae'n gydgysylltiedig, yn ddi-fwlch ac yn gwbl analluog yn ei hawydd i wneud rhywbeth ynglŷn â'r sefyllfa.

Geilw eich gwelliant 3 am 'brawf biwrocratiaeth'. A esboniwch sut y profwch fiwrocratiaeth heb gyflwyno lefel newydd o fiwrocratiaeth i brofi'r fiwrocratiaeth honno? Wrth geisio rheoli biwrocratiaeth, yr ydych yn creu rhagor.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Pe bawn i wedi bod yn Weinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yna byddai cylch gwaith yr adroddiad hwn wedi bod yn wahanol. Cwblhaodd Mandy Paish yr adroddiad yn union o fewn y cylch gwaith a bennwyd, ond pe baem wedi dweud y dymunem fynd un cam ymhellach, yna byddai'r adroddiad wedi bod yn ehangach. Fodd bynnag, o fewn y cylch gwaith yr oedd yn briodol bod y gwaith dadansoddol hwnnw wedi'i ysgrifennu yn y ffordd y'i ysgrifennwyd. Nid wyf am feirniadu Mandy Paish a'r tîm am y gwaith yr ymgymerasant ag ef. Beirniadaeth ydyw—fel y nodwyd gennyh—o'r Llywodraeth a'r ffordd lipa y

tuedda i fynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn.

Not only is performance-related-pay increasing bureaucracy, but we now know that there is review report of the AS system, which has been given to Estelle Morris. I assume that Jane Davidson has a copy. We know that teachers, parents and pupils are unhappy with the additional workloads caused by that qualification. I expect that there are additional burdens. We must examine that because it was this Government that introduced that scheme.

Nid yn unig y mae tâl ar sail perfformiad yn cynyddu biwrocratiaeth ond gwyddom yn awr fod adroddiad sydd yn adolygu'r system Uwch Gyfrannol, a roddwyd i Estelle Morris. Cymeraf fod gan Jane Davidson gopi. Gwyddom fod athrawon, rhieni a disgyblion yn anhapus gyda'r baich gwaith ychwanegol a achoswyd gan y cymhwyster hwnnw. Tybiaf fod beichiau ychwanegol. Rhaid inni ystyried hynny gan mai'r Llywodraeth hon a gyflwynodd y cynllun hwnnw.

4:10 p.m.

This Government also wants to introduce the Welsh baccalaureate scheme, which will increase the burden of bureaucracy on the teaching profession. This Labour Government introduced exclusion targets. Reducing the number of people who are excluded from schools will also involve additional paperwork. This Government must share some of the blame and I trust that the Minister agrees.

Mae'r Llywodraeth hon hefyd am gyflwyno cynllun bagloriaeth Gymreig, a fydd yn cynyddu baich biwrocratiaeth ar y proffesiwn addysgu. Cyflwynodd y Llywodraeth Lafur hon dargedau eithrio. Bydd gostwng nifer y bobl a eithrir o ysgolion hefyd yn golygu gwaith papur ychwanegol. Rhaid i'r Llywodraeth hon rannu rhywfaint o'r bai a hyderaf fod y Gweinidog yn cytuno.

We can reduce the overall levels of bureaucracy. There is no point reducing the overall levels of bureaucracy in the next two or three years if, after that point, we start increasing the amount of bureaucracy beyond its current point. You cannot reduce it by three steps and in the next couple of years, increase it by another five or six. We must ensure that the level decreases. That is why we agree with the bureaucracy test. We want the officials and the Government to ensure that the policies that are introduced by this administration in the years ahead do not increase the overall level of bureaucracy in our schools. It is easily done, and the Minister and officials have a responsibility to that end.

Gallwn ostwng lefelau cyffredinol biwrocratiaeth. Nid oes pwynt gostwng lefelau cyffredinol biwrocratiaeth yn ystod y ddwy neu dair blynedd nesaf os, wedi hynny, y dechreuwn gynyddu'r fiwrocratiaeth y tu hwnt i'r pwynt a gyraeddasom yn awr. Ni allwch ei ostwng dri cham ac yn ystod yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf, ei gynyddu bum neu chwe cham arall. Rhaid inni sicrhau y daw'r lefel i lawr. Dyna pam y cytunwn â'r prawf biwrocratiaeth. Yr ydym am i'r swyddogion a'r Llywodraeth sicrhau na fydd y polisiau a gyflwynir gan y weinyddiaeth hon yn ystod y blynnyddoedd sydd i ddod yn codi lefel gyffredinol biwrocratiaeth yn ein hysgolion. Mae'n hawdd gwneud hynny, ac mae cyfrifoldeb ar y Gweinidog a'r swyddogion yn hyn o beth.

**Alison Halford:** I also pay tribute to Rosemary Butler and Jane Davidson for their efforts in bringing this report to us today. Mandy Paish, the project leader must also be mentioned. She, like myself, entered the political world rather late. I congratulate her for handling all its intricacies well. She was

**Alison Halford:** Talaf innau hefyd deyrnged i Rosemary Butler a Jane Davidson am eu hymdrechion i ddod â'r adroddiad hwn atom heddiw. Rhaid crybwyll Mandy Paish, arweinydd y prosiect, hefyd. Ymunodd hi, fel minnau, â'r byd gwleidyddol braidd yn hwyr. Fe'i llongyfarchaf am ymdrin â'i holl

given a hard task. I agree with Jonathan that the unions' contribution has been invaluable.

The debate on unnecessary bureaucracy in schools essentially depends on how you choose to define 'unnecessary'. In the first half of 2000, 75 separate documents totalling 2,063 pages, covering everything from the national curriculum to performance management, were sent to secondary schools by the Department of Education and Skills alone. It would take the average person just over two weeks to read all that. That is the problem that we are facing. Unfortunately, this report does not define what is unnecessarily bureaucratic. I know that it is not easy and that the possible result of this may be teachers taking a lead from circular 22/98 or perhaps even following the 'Time for a Limit' report. I would appreciate, Minister, if you could give me some guidance on that point. Having said that, the report excels in providing a clear road map of the key problems facing Welsh teachers today. It is a fair and hard-hitting reflection of the state of bureaucracy in our schools. I am glad that we did not choose the easy route of sacrificing quality for popularity and of crudely cutting important schemes and programmes.

Our approval today sounds the starting gun for actions in many bureaucratic areas. I particularly welcome the review of administrative support in time for the 2002-03 local government revenue settlements and the plan to promote and fund innovative methods of cutting paperwork. I also welcome the local education authorities' improved assessment of administrative support and, as the Minister said, the gatekeeping group to monitor the National Assembly's Training and Education Department documents before they go to schools. Such practical arrangements will have a great impact on teachers, particularly in my own constituency. The one danger is that in our genuine effort to reduce paperwork, we may end up generating even more. For example, the Department of Education's report, 'Cutting the burden of

gymhlethdodau yn dda. Rhoddwyd tasg anodd iddi. Cytunaf â Jonathan y bu cyfraniad yr undebau yn amhrisiadwy.

Yn ei hanfod dibynna'r ddadl ar fiwrocratiaeth ddiangen mewn ysgolion ar sut y dewiswch ddiffinio 'diangen'. Yn ystod hanner cyntaf 2000, anfonwyd 75 o ddogfennau ar wahân sef cyfanswm o 2,063 o dudalennau, gan gwmpasu popeth o'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol i reoli perfformiad, at ysgolion uwchradd gan yr Adran Addysg a Sgiliau yn unig. Cymerai ychydig dros bythefnos i'r person cyffredin ddarllen hynny i gyd. Dyna'r broblem a wynebwn. Yn anffodus, ni ddiffinia'r adroddiad hwn yr hyn sydd yn ddiangen o fiwrocraidaidd. Gwn nad yw'n hawdd ac y gallai hyn arwain at athrawon yn dilyn arweiniad cylchlythyr 22/98 neu efallai adroddiad 'Time for a Limit' hyd yn oed. Gwerthfawrogwn, Weinidog, pe gallech roi rhywfaint o arweiniad imi ar y pwynt hwnnw. Wedi dweud hynny, rhagora'r adroddiad wrth ddarparu map ffordd clir o'r problemau allweddol a wyneba athrawon Cymru heddiw. Mae'n adlewyrchiad teg a diarbed o gyflwr biwrocratiaeth yn ein hysgolion. Yr wyf yn falch na ddewisasom y ffordd hawdd o aberthu ansawdd am boblogrwydd gan hegor cynlluniau a rhaglenni pwysig mewn ffordd ddiotal.

Mae ein cymeradwyaeth heddiw yn fan cychwyn gweithredu mewn sawl maes biwrocraidaidd. Croesawaf yn arbennig yr adolygiad o'r cymorth gweinyddol mewn pryd ar gyfer setliadau refeniw llywodraeth leol 2002-03 a'r cynllun i hyrwyddo ac ariannu dulliau dyfeisgar o dorri ar waith papur. Croesawaf hefyd asesiad yr awdurdodau addysg lleol, sydd wedi'i wella, o'r cymorth gweinyddol ac, fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, o'r grŵp rheoli i fonitro dogfennau Hyfforddiant ac Addysg y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol cyn iddynt fynd i'r ysgolion. Caiff trefniadau ymarferol o'r fath effaith fawr ar athrawon, yn arbennig yn fy etholaeth fy hun. Yr unig berygl yw, yn ein hymdrech ddilys i leihau gwaith papur, y gallem fod yn cynhyrchu fwy hyd yn oed. Er enghraifft, mae adroddiad yr Adran Addysg, sef 'Cutting the burden of bureaucracy



bureaucracy toolkit' is more than 100 pages long. It would take an average person five hours to read it without taking notes. That is as ironic as it is tragic. In today's electronic age, paperwork is anything that must be read, viewed or listened to. That results in increasing the hours teachers spend working away from their students. The plan to maximise the use of information technology is a promising step forward.

The £1,000 extra for schools is good news and will go some way to ease the burden while the key reforms of this report kick in and begin to make a difference to those on the front line of teaching and school management. The latest initiative is the school development plan's 'attendance targets', which was a brilliant idea. However, is it not true that little thought has been given to the additional paperwork that it would cause and the extra cost that it would impose? In my constituency, one headteacher chose to run a marathon to raise money to pay for a secretary to come in twice a week to ease management pressure. The English solution to these problems was to promise 20,000 more classroom assistants. In Wales, for the time being at least, there has been no such pledge. However, it would be a mistake to see this report in isolation and as the only way of reducing pressure in schools. The Minister's work to reduce class sizes, recruit more teachers and increase funding will greatly quicken the pace of change. This report is a first in many ways and lays down thoughtful and innovative plans to streamline bureaucracy in Welsh schools and meet the needs of Welsh teachers. I await with eagerness the review of the administrative support. At last it seems we will be making significant steps to free teachers and headteachers from many of the difficult management burdens that have dogged them in the past.

toolkit' yn fwy na 100 o dudalennau o hyd. Cymerai bum awr i'r person cyffredin ei ddarllen heb gymryd nodiadau. Mae hynny mor eironig ag y mae'n drasig. Yn yr oes electronig sydd ohoni heddiw, mae unrhyw beth y mae'n rhaid ei ddarllen, edrych arno neu wrando arno yn waith papur. Canlyniad hynny yw cynyddu'r oriau y mae athrawon yn eu treulio yn gweithio i ffwrdd oddi wrth eu myfyrwyr. Mae'r cynllun i wneud y defnydd mwyaf posibl o dechnoleg gwybodaeth yn gam addawol ymlaen.

Mae'r £1,000 ychwanegol ar gyfer ysgolion yn newyddion da ac aiff gam o'r ffordd tuag at ysgafnhau'r baich tra bod diwygiadau allweddol yr adroddiad hwn yn cael eu gweithredu gan ddechrau gwneud gwahaniaeth i'r rheini yn rheng flaen addysgu a rheoli ysgolion. Y fenter ddiweddaraf yw 'targedau presenoldeb' y cynllun datblygu ysgol, a oedd yn syniad gwych. Fodd bynnag, onid yw'n wir mai ychydig o feddwl a roddwyd i'r gwaith papur ychwanegol y byddai'n ei achosi a'r gost ychwanegol y byddai'n ei olygu? Yn fy etholaeth i, dewisodd un pennaeth redeg marathon er mwyn codi arian i dalu i ysgrifenyddes ddod i mewn ddwywaith yr wythnos er mwyn ysgafnhau'r pwysau rheoli. Yn Lloegr, yr ateb i'r problemau hyn oedd addo 20,000 yn fwy o gynorthwywyr yn yr ystafell ddosbarth. Yng Nghymru, ar hyn o bryd beth bynnag, nid addawyd unrhyw beth o'r fath. Fodd bynnag, byddai'n gamgymeriad ystyried yr adroddiad hwn ar ei ben ei hun ac fel yr unig ffordd o leihau pwysau mewn ysgolion. Bydd gwaith y Gweinidog i leihau maint dosbarthiadau, recriwtio mwy o athrawon a chynyddu'r arian yn cyflymu'r broses o newid yn wirioneddol. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn unigryw mewn llawer o ffyrdd ac mae'n gosod cynlluniau meddylgar a dyfeisgar i feinhau biwrocratiaeth o fewn ysgolion Cymru a diwallu anghenion athrawon Cymru. Disgwyliaf yn frwd am yr adolygiad o'r cymorth gweinyddol. O'r diwedd ymddengys y cymerwn gamau arwyddocaol i ryddhau athrawon a phenaethiaid o lawer o'r beichiau rheoli anodd a fu'n broblem iddynt yn y gorffennol.

**Cynog Dafis:** Mae rhyw gymaint o'r straen a'r baich gwaith ychwanegol ar athrawon y dyddiau hyn yn anochel. Mae'n ganlyniad i'r ffaith ein bod yn byw mewn oes o newid carlamus a rheidrwydd i adlewyrchu'r newid hwnnw yng ngweithgarwch ysgolion. Ni all cwricwlwm, dulliau arholi ac asesu, cymwysterau a dulliau dysgu aros yn yr unfan. Mae hynny'n creu beichiau biwrocraidd ynddo'i hun. Dan yr amgylchiadau hyn, fodd bynnag, mae'n eithriadol bwysig bod unrhyw flaengaredd newydd a gyflwynir yn werth ei gyflwyno a'i weithredu, ac y caiff ei ddylunio'n ofalus. Fel y dywedodd Jonathan Morgan, enghraifft berffaith o lle nad yw hyn wedi digwydd yw Cwricwlwm 2000, sydd wedi disodli'r hen Safon Uwch. Cafodd y diwygiad hwn—cyfaddawd hollol anfodddhaol rhwng safon aur tybiedig y Safon Uwch a'r angen am gymhwyster ehangach—ei wthio drwodd heb baratoi, heb adnoddau digonol, a heb wrando ar bryderon athrawon. Mae'n debyg mai'r Prif Weinidog yn Llundain, Tony Blair, a fynnodd ei fod yn cael ei wthio drwodd. Mae'n ddiddorol fod yr ysgol lle mae ei blant ef yn astudio wedi boicotio Cwricwlwm 2000.

Mae'r Gweinidog yn ymwybodol o'r problemau gyda'r cymhwyster hwn. Ysgrifennais ati ym mis Ionawr yn disgrifio'r pryderon difrifol a gyflewyd imi mewn cyfarfod â Chyfarwyddwr Addysg Ceredigion ac athrawon a oedd yn ymlafnio i gyflwyno'r cwrs newydd hwnnw—pryderon bod y cwrs wedi ei ddylunio'n wael ac ar frys ac yn annigonol. Fel y dywedwyd, mae Estelle Morris wedi trefnu ymchwiliad gan David Hargreaves o'r Awdurdod Cymwysterau a Chwricwlwm. Mae disgwyl datganiad ganddi hi yfory yn cydnabod y bu gorlwytho ar fyfyrwyr dosbarth chwech ac ar athrawon, ac yn sôn am dorri nifer yr arholiadau AS yn ystod blwyddyn gyntaf dosbarth chwech. Yr hyn sydd yn digwydd wedyn yw eich bod yn cael cyfaddawd ar ben cyfaddawd a oedd yn anfodddhaol yn y lle cyntaf. Dyna'r problem.

Mae cyfle inni yng Nghymru, fel y gŵyr y Gweinidog, ddelio â'r problem mewn ffordd

**Cynog Dafis:** Some of the strain and additional workload on teachers these days is inevitable. It is the result of the fact that we live in an era of galloping change and a necessity to reflect that change in school activity. The curriculum, examination and assessment methods, qualifications and teaching methods cannot remain at a standstill. That creates bureaucratic burdens in itself. Under these circumstances, however, it is extremely important that any new initiative that is introduced is worth introducing and implementing, and is carefully designed. As Jonathan Morgan said, a perfect example of where this has not happened is Curriculum 2000, which replaced the old A-level. This reform—an entirely unsatisfactory compromise between the supposed A-level gold standard and the need for a broader qualification—was pushed through without preparation, without sufficient resources, and without listening to teachers' concerns. It was apparently the Prime Minister in London, Tony Blair, who insisted that that was pushed through. It is interesting that the school that his children attend has boycotted Curriculum 2000.

The Minister is aware of the problems that have been involved with this qualification. I wrote to her in January describing the serious concerns that were conveyed to me in a meeting with Ceredigion's Director of Education and teachers who were making heroic efforts to deliver that new course—concerns that the course had been badly and hastily designed and was inadequate. As has been said, Estelle Morris has arranged for David Hargreaves of the Qualifications and Curriculum Authority to carry out an inquiry. She is expected to give a statement tomorrow, which will recognise that sixth form students and teachers have been overburdened, and talk about reducing the number of AS examinations during the first year of the sixth form. What happens then is that you have a compromise on top of a compromise that was unsatisfactory in the first place. That is the problem.

We have an opportunity in Wales, as the Minister knows, to deal with the problem in a

fwy radical drwy gyflwyno bagloriaeth Gymreig—cymhwyster sydd yn cyfuno ehangder a dyfnder mewn ffordd gydlynol yn ôl model y fagloriaeth gydwladol. Mae'r Gweinidog wrthi'n trefnu peilot o'r hyn y mae'n ei alw yn fagloriaeth Gymreig. Gwaetha'r modd, ar hyn o bryd, y bwriad yw cynnal peilot o gymhwyster sydd yn seiliedig ar Gwricwlwm 2000, yr union fodel a brofwyd yn fethiant yn Lloegr ac, yn wir, yng Nghymru. Ymateb Geraint Talfan Davies, Cadeirydd y Sefydliad Materion Cymreig, i gyhoeddiad y Gweinidog, yw ei bod yn siom fawr bod gwaith saith mlynedd o baratoi gan y Sefydliad Materion Cymreig wedi cael ei roi o'r neilltu, a bod y penderfyniad wedi mynd ymlaen i seilio'r peilot ar Gwricwlwm 2000 yn hytrach nag ar y fagloriaeth ryngwladol. Datblygwyd bagloriaeth Gymreig y Sefydliad Materion Cymreig gyda golwg ar osgoi gorfeichio myfyrwyr a chost ormodol.

4:20 p.m.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I am grateful to Cynog Dafis for giving way. I will raise one point. You said that the Institute for Welsh Affairs was annoyed or upset—I do not recall your exact term—because seven years of work had been wasted. I say to Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales, that the National Assembly for Wales is not a sounding board for the IWA. It is not here to implement the IWA policies. The IWA is nothing more than an independent think-tank. It is accountable to no-one and speaks for no-one. We are the elected representatives of the people of Wales. We have the right to choose not to implement the IWA's policies.

**Cynog Dafis:** Gwelais y Gweinidog yn nodio'n frwd wrth i Jonathan siarad. Fodd bynnag, y ffaith amdani yw bod penderfyniad wedi'i wneud i gynnal cynllun peilot o'r fagloriaeth Gymreig. Pwy greodd y syniad o fagloriaeth Gymreig? Pwy wnaeth y gwaith trwyadl, dros saith mlynedd, o ymgynghori gyda phrifysgolion yng Nghymru a Lloegr? Pwy wnaeth y gwaith a gymeradwywyd gan Sefydliad y Fagloriaeth Ryngwladol, gyda chlod o bob tu? Y Sefydliad Materion

more radically by introducing a Welsh baccalaureate—a qualification that combines breadth and depth in a co-ordinated way according to the international baccalaureate model. The Minister is organising a pilot of what she calls the Welsh baccalaureate. Unfortunately, at present, the intention is to pilot a qualification that is based on Curriculum 2000, the exact model that has proved to be a failure in England and, indeed, in Wales. The response of Geraint Talfan Davies, Chair of the Institute of Welsh Affairs, to the Minister's announcement, is that it is a great disappointment that seven years' work and preparation by the Institute of Welsh Affairs has been pushed aside, and that the decision was made to base the pilot on Curriculum 2000 rather than on the international baccalaureate. The Institute of Welsh Affairs' Welsh baccalaureate was developed with a view to avoid over-burdening students and excessive cost.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Cynog Dafis am ildio. Codaf un pwynt. Dywedasoch fod y Sefydliad Materion Cymreig yn ddig neu wedi cynhyrfu—ni chofiaf eich union derm—am fod saith mlynedd o waith wedi'i wastraffu. Dywedaf wrth Blaid Cymru—The Party of Wales, nad seinfwrdd ar gyfer y Sefydliad yw Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Nid yw yma i weithredu polisiau'r Sefydliad. Nid yw'r Sefydliad yn ddim mwy na seiad ddoethion annibynnol. Nid yw'n atebol i unrhyw un ac ni siarada ar ran unrhyw un. Ni yw cynrychiolwyr etholedig pobl Cymru. Mae gennym hawl i ddewis peidio â gweithredu polisiau'r Sefydliad.

**Cynog Dafis:** I saw the Minister nodding animatedly as Jonathan spoke. However, the fact is that a decision was made to pilot the Welsh baccalaureate. Who came up with the idea for a Welsh baccalaureate? Who did all the thorough work, over seven years, consulting with universities in England and Wales? Who did the work commended by the International Baccalaureate Organisation, with praise from all quarters? The Institute of Welsh Affairs. I believe that it is important

Cymreig. Credaf ei bod yn bwysig i'r Cynulliad fanteisio ar waith a wnaethpwyd; nid ei dderbyn yn ei gryswth yn ddifeddwl, ond adeiladu ar waith trwyadl a wnaethpwyd eisoes. Dyna pam y gresynaf at sut y mae'r sefyllfa yn mynd rhagddi.

Y mae pwynt gennyf ynglŷn â beichiau. Y mae'r model a gynigiwyd gan Gyd-bwyllgor Addysg Cymru yn golygu ychwanegu elfennau llafurfawr at yr hyn sydd yno'n barod, yn hytrach na chreu cymhwyster cydlynol newydd.

Ysgrifennodd un arbenigwr ataf mewn llythyr fod hwn yn drap anferth, sydd yn pentyrru mwy a mwy o waith, heb ddarparu fframwaith cydlynol i'r cyfan. Dywedodd y bydd myfyrwyr ac athrawon yn plygu o dan y straen ac y bydd cysyniad y fagloriaeth wedi'i staenio a'i ddifwyno.

Dywed yn sinigaidd yn ei lythyr mai efallai dyna'r bwriad. Y mae'n mynnu y byddai gweithredu'r peilot fel ag y mae yn wastraff arian, heb fod llawer yn llai na sgandal. Dyna eiriau cryf. Gobeithiaf ei fod yn anghywir. A yw'n rhy hwyr i newid cyfeiriad? Gobeithiaf nad ydyw.

Cred Plaid Cymru y dylai'r Gweinidog wahodd yr arbenigwyr a ddatblygodd fagloriaeth y Sefydliad Materion Cymreig i ymuno â'r tîm a fydd yn dylunio ac yn rhedeg y cynllun peilot. Mae'n warth iddynt gael eu cau allan o'r broses yn llwyr hyd yn hyn.

Yn ail, dylai'r Gweinidog gadw'n agored yr opsiwn o seilio'r cymhwyster Cymreig newydd ar y fagloriaeth gydwladol ac nid ar y Cwricwlwm 2000 methiannus. Cadw'r opsiwn yn agored yw'r cwbl a ofynnaf.

Dylai'r Gweinidog, ar sail hynny, drefnu bod CBAC yn cydweithio gyda Sefydliad y Fagloriaeth Ryngwladol wrth ddatblygu'r peilot.

Y mae'r Gweinidog yn ysgwyd ei phen. Y mae'n ddrwg gennyf weld hynny. Pwysaf arni i fod yn barod i fod yn hyblyg, fel y cawn gymhwyster Cymreig y gallwn fod yn

for the Assembly to take advantage of the work undertaken; not by accepting it in its entirety without consideration, but by building on the thorough work already undertaken. That is why I regret how this is developing.

I have a point concerning burdens. The model suggested by the Welsh Joint Education Committee means adding elaborous elements to what is already there, rather than creating a new cohesive qualification.

One expert wrote a letter to me stating that this is an enormous trap that piles on more and more work without providing a cohesive framework. He said that students and teachers will buckle under the pressure and that the baccalaureate concept will be stained and demeaned.

He cynically stated in his letter that that may be the intention. He insists that running the pilot in its current state would be a waste of money, and would almost be a scandal. Those are strong words. I hope that they are wrong. Is it too late to change direction? I hope not.

Plaid Cymru believes that the Minister should invite the experts who developed the Institute of Welsh Affairs' baccalaureate to join the team that will design and run the pilot scheme. It is a disgrace that they have been completely excluded from the process until now.

Secondly, the Minister should keep open the option of basing the new Welsh qualification on the international baccalaureate rather than the failing Curriculum 2000. All I am asking is that the option be kept open.

The Minister should, on that basis, arrange that the WJEC works with the International Baccalaureate Organisation when developing the pilot.

The Minister is shaking her head. I am sorry to see that. I urge her to be prepared to be flexible, so that we can have a Welsh qualification to be proud of and which will

falch ohono, nad yw'n gosod beichiau diangenrhaid ar athrawon a disgyblion.

not place unnecessary burdens on teachers and pupils.

**Eleanor Burnham:** The Liberal Democrats also welcome this work, overseen by Mandy Paish. At the beginning, the authors acknowledge that the report is only a starting point. Their approach was to examine the burdens that could be minimised by better management. They found that all areas of administrative work are necessary to improve school standards, but that those could be managed better.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol hefyd yn croesawu'r gwaith hwn, a oruchwyliwyd gan Mandy Paish. Ar y dechrau, mae'r awduron yn cydnabod mai dim ond man cychwyn yw'r adroddiad. Eu hymagwedd oedd ystyried y beichiau y gellid eu cadw i isafswm drwy eu rheoli'n well. Canfuwyd fod pob maes o waith gweinyddol yn angenrheidiol er mwyn gwella safonau ysgolion, ond y gellid rheoli'r rheini'n well.

One such area was reducing teachers' workloads. Much has been said about this and I will be as brief as possible. A short term measure is to pay £1,000 per school to local education authorities to help with administrative costs. The money will be administered by the LEA except in instances where schools have delegated budgets. Therefore, the LEA will decide how much it spends on each school, whether it pays administrative staff, or supplies cover teachers to allow time for paperwork. This money will not immediately solve all teachers' problems, but it should prove to be a welcome first step.

Un maes o'r fath oedd lleihau beichiau gwaith athrawon. Dywedwyd llawer ynglŷn â hyn a byddaf mor fyr â phosibl. Mesur byrdymor yw talu £1,000 fesul ysgol i awdurdodau addysg lleol i'w helpu â chostau gweinyddol. Gweinyddir yr arian gan yr AALl ond am achosion lle y bo gan ysgolion gyllidebau a ddirprwywyd. Felly, yr AALl a fydd yn penderfynu faint y bydd yn ei wario ar bob ysgol, pa un a fydd yn talu am staff gweinyddol ai peidio, neu pa un a fydd yn darparu athrawon cyflenwi i ganiatáu amser ar gyfer gwaith papur ai peidio. Ni fydd yr arian hwn yn datrys holl broblemau athrawon ar unwaith, ond dylai fod yn gam cyntaf i'w groesawu.

School inspections should be kept to the minimum necessary for effective checks. Inspectors should be reminded of their remit, and schools reminded of what is and is not required of them in an inspection.

Dylid cadw arolygiadau ysgolion i'r isafswm sydd yn angenrheidiol ar gyfer gwirio effeithiol. Dylid atgoffa'r arolygwyr o'u cylch gwaith, ac ysgolion o'r hyn sydd ac nad yw'n ofynnol ganddynt mewn arolygiad.

Another issue is the greater use of information technology. Where paper documents are sent to schools, a one-page summary should be attached to save time for those who must read them. Many speakers have mentioned the burdensome task of reading huge quantities of documents.

Mater arall yw'r defnydd helaethach o dechnoleg gwybodaeth. Lle yr anfonir dogfennau papur i ysgolion, dylid atodi crynodeb o un dudalen er mwyn arbed amser y rheini sydd yn gorfod eu darllen. Crybwyllodd llawer o siaradwyr y dasg feichus o ddarllen dogfennau maith.

The LEA's role is also interesting. Presumably, this improvement will be co-ordinated by the local education authority. Health and safety is highlighted as a growing responsibility, for which teachers and other school staff do not feel adequately trained. The report also states that LEAs should be responsible for monitoring schools'

Mae rôl yr AALl hefyd yn ddiddorol. Cymeraf y caiff y gwelliant hwn ei gyd-gysylltu gan yr awdurdod addysg lleol. Amlygir iechyd a diogelwch fel cyfrifoldeb cynyddol, nad yw athrawon a staff eraill ysgolion o'r farn eu bod wedi eu hyfforddi'n ddigonol ar ei gyfer. Mae'r adroddiad hefyd yn datgan y dylai AALl fod yn gyfrifol am

performance. New guidance is to be produced to clarify responsibilities, which should be in schools by December 2001.

On the effects of the report, there will be little legal difference. The guidelines that have been suggested are non-enforceable. If much of the bureaucracy is taken away from schools, it will mean an increase in bureaucracy for LEAs, which are already over-stretched, as none of the extra work about which teachers complain is being abandoned. There is no move away from league tables and targets, which will disappoint many working in schools, although that issue is to be considered in the future. The National Union of Teachers is pushing for a re-evaluation of the 1988 teachers' contract. That seems to be a sensible move, as teachers' working conditions are often detrimental to the education of the children whom they are there to help. The report also stated that Estyn inspectors could make a single visit to cover a range of purposes.

In conclusion, there are three ways in which we can address the burden of bureaucracy, namely providing greater administrative support, devising mechanisms to handle paperwork more efficiently and cutting down on the amount of paperwork that must be dealt with. While this report addresses the first two ways, it does not address the third effectively enough. Perhaps that is why it is considered to be disappointing and perhaps that disappointment stems from the remit given to those responsible for the report when it was commissioned a year ago.

Since the report was commissioned, the partnership administration has been formed and, in 'Putting Wales First: A Partnership for the People of Wales', we have made a commitment to free up teachers' time to teach by reducing the burden of paperwork. We therefore have a duty to see that commitment through and we need to take further steps than those outlined in this report's recommendations.

That is reflected in the wording of the

fonitro perfformiad ysgolion. Caiff arweiniad newydd ei gynhyrchu i egluro cyfrifoldebau, a ddylai fod mewn ysgolion erbyn Rhagfyr 2001.

O ran effeithiau'r adroddiad, ychydig fydd y gwahaniaeth cyfreithiol. Ni ellir gorfodi'r canllawiau a awgrymwyd. Os tynnir llawer o'r fiwrocratiaeth oddi wrth ysgolion, golyga gynydd mewn biwrocratiaeth i'r AALL, sydd eisoes wedi'u gorymestyn, gan na roddir y gorau i ddim o'r gwaith ychwanegol y mae athrawon yn cwyno amdano. Ni symudir oddi wrth dablau cynghrair a thargedau, a fydd yn siom i lawer sydd yn gweithio mewn ysgolion, er bod y mater hwnnw i'w ystyried yn y dyfodol. Mae Undeb Cenedlaethol yr Athrawon yn gwthio am ailwerthusiad o gontract athrawon 1988. Ymddengys hynny yn gam synhwyrol, gan fod amodau gwaith athrawon yn aml yn andwyol i addysg y plant y maent yno i'w helpu. Nododd yr adroddiad hefyd y gallai arolygwyr Estyn ymweld unwaith er mwyn cwmpasu amrywiaeth o ddibenion.

I gloi, mae tair ffordd y gallwn ymdrin â baich biwrocratiaeth, sef darparu mwy o gymorth gweinyddol, dyfeisio dulliau o ddelio â gwaith papur yn fwy effeithlon a thorri i lawr ar y gwaith papur y mae'n rhaid delio ag ef. Er bod yr adroddiad hwn yn ymdrin â'r ddwy ffordd gyntaf, nid ymdrinia â'r drydedd yn ddigon effeithiol. Efallai mai dyna pam y'i ystyrir yn siomedig ac efallai bod y siom hwnnw yn deillio o'r cylch gwaith a roddwyd i'r rheini sydd yn gyfrifol am yr adroddiad pan gafodd ei gomisiynu flwyddyn yn ôl.

Ers comisiynu'r adroddiad, ffurfiwyd y weinyddiaeth bartneriaeth ac, yn 'Rhoi Cymru'n Gyntaf: Partneriaeth ar gyfer Pobl Cymru', gwnaethom ymrwymiad i ryddhau amser athrawon i addysgu drwy leihau'r baich gwaith papur. Mae gennym ddyletswydd felly i gyflawni'r ymrwymiad hwnnw ac mae angen inni gymryd camau pellach na'r rheini a amlinellwyd o fewn argymhellion yr adroddiad hwn.

Adlewyrchir hynny yng ngeiriad y cynnig,

motion, which recognises that the report should be viewed only as a starting point. There remains a need to go further and that could involve a more radical review of the need for some of the paperwork. The recognition of the need for greater administrative support in schools is to be welcomed. Overall, we accept that perhaps this report does not go far enough, but we should view it as a basis on which to build in the future.

The Minister has demonstrated her willingness to tackle the need for bureaucracy through her commitment to abolishing school league tables in Wales. We look forward to seeing the positive effects of that step towards reducing bureaucracy, and further initiatives to tackle the bureaucratic burden in the future.

**Christine Chapman:** I welcome this report and pay tribute to the commitment of Rosemary Butler, Jane Davidson and the partnership administration in tackling this important issue proactively. Mandy Paish and her team have also worked enthusiastically on this. Having worked for many years in various roles within education, I know only too well of the commitment and long hours that teachers give to their work.

I will highlight the issue of work experience and pay tribute to the teachers who put an enormous amount of effort into making this a successful programme for pupils. Work experience is not always considered to be vital, but it should be. I have seen the effect that it has on disaffected pupils, who return to school with much more enthusiasm and a new purpose. We should remember that. Although work experience is not a core part of school life, it is nevertheless an important part for young people. It can help to build confidence and self-esteem. We must acknowledge the increasing workload that this creates for certain teachers. For example, there are now tighter regulations on matters such as health and safety. As someone who has been involved in work experience in the past, I know that that is important.

sydd yn cydnabod y dylid ystyried yr adroddiad fel man cychwyn yn unig. Mae angen mynd ymhellach a gallai hynny olygu adolygiad mwy radical o'r angen am rywfaint o'r gwaith papur. Mae cydnabyddiaeth o'r angen am fwy o gymorth gweinyddol mewn ysgolion i'w groesawu. Yn gyffredinol, derbyniwn nad aiff yr adroddiad hwn yn ddigon pell efallai, ond dylem ei ystyried fel sail i adeiladu arno yn y dyfodol.

Dangosodd y Gweinidog ei pharodrwydd i fynd i'r afael â'r angen am fiwrocratiaeth drwy ei hymrwymiad i ddiddymu tablau cynghrair ysgolion yng Nghymru. Edrychwn ymlaen at weld effeithiau cadarnhaol y cam hwnnw tuag at leihau biwrocratiaeth, a mentrau pellach i fynd i'r afael â'r baich biwrocrataidd yn y dyfodol.

**Christine Chapman:** Croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn a thalaf deyrnged i ymrwymiad Rosemary Butler, Jane Davidson a'r weinyddiaeth bartneriaeth wrth fynd i'r afael â'r mater pwysig hwn mewn ffordd ragweithiol. Gweithiodd Mandy Paish a'i thîm yn frwdfrydig ar hyn hefyd. Wedi gweithio am lawer o flynyddoedd mewn rolau amrywiol o fewn addysg, gwn yn iawn am yr ymrwymiad a'r oriau maith y mae athrawon yn eu rhoi i'w gwaith.

Amlygaf fater profiad gwaith a thalaf deyrnged i'r athrawon sydd yn buddsoddi llawer o ymdrech er mwyn gwneud y rhaglen hon yn llwyddiant i ddisgyblion. Nid ystyrir profiad gwaith yn hanfodol bob amser, ond fe ddylid. Yr wyf wedi gweld yr effaith a gaiff ar ddisgyblion anfoddog, sydd yn dychwelyd i'r ysgol â llawer mwy o frwdfrydedd ac egni newydd. Dylem gofio hynny. Er nad yw profiad gwaith yn rhan hanfodol o fywyd ysgol, serch hynny mae'n rhan bwysig i bobl ifanc. Gall helpu i fagu hyder a hunan-barch. Rhaid inni gydnabod y baich gwaith cynyddol y mae hyn yn ei greu i rai athrawon. Er enghraifft, mae rheoliadau tynnach ar faterion fel iechyd a diogelwch erbyn hyn. Fel rhywun a fu'n gysylltiedig â phrofiad gwaith yn y gorffennol, gwn fod hynny'n bwysig.

The report mentions health and safety. Many teachers and those who manage work experience programmes remain confused and concerned about health and safety. People want to ensure that the young people who undertake work experience are safe, but there is always a fear of litigation. There have been high profile cases attached to that. The careers service and the education business partnerships plan work experience programmes in the main, but teachers must monitor, liase with and visit pupils when they are on site. This involves a massive amount of organisation and many hours are spent in meetings. I have spoken to many teachers, who would love to have an administrative assistant to help them in this. Teachers must be congratulated on their work. They are in the best position to ensure that pupils get the most out of their one or two-week placement, because of the close links that they sometimes have with employers and their knowledge of individual pupils.

4:30 p.m.

I want to reinforce the value of work experience for pupils. However, if we are to maximise its potential, we must ensure that any bureaucracy is streamlined. As you said, Jane, this is only a starting point. I hope that our comments today will be incorporated into future work.

**Rosemary Butler:** This is an important report. However, unfortunately it is one of those documents that is perceived as being either not radical enough or as too radical, and whichever way it went, it would have caused problems. However, Mandy Paish approached it from a good angle and delivered a report that is acceptable to everyone. Everyone accepts that we must have proper and appropriate monitoring of activities in our schools. However, we should not only refer to the over-burdening of teachers in schools. We must also consider FE, continuing education and adult education establishments, where the administrative burdens surrounding the delivery of the Open College Network are huge. This applies not

Mae'r adroddiad yn crybwyll iechyd a diogelwch. Mae llawer o athrawon a'r rheini sydd yn rheoli rhaglenni profiad gwaith yn parhau mewn dryswch ac yn pryderu am iechyd a diogelwch. Mae pobl am sicrhau bod y bobl ifanc sydd yn ymgymryd â phrofiad gwaith yn ddiogel, ond ofnir ymglyfreitha bob amser. Cafwyd achosion proffil uchel ynghlwm wrth hynny. Cynllunio rhaglenni profiad gwaith a wna'r gwasanaeth gyrfaoedd a'r partneriaethau addysg busnes yn bennaf, ond rhaid i athrawon fonitro disgyblion, cysylltu â hwy ac ymweld â hwy pan fyddant ar eu profiad gwaith. Golyga hyn drefnu ar raddfa enfawr a llawer o oriau mewn cyfarfodydd. Siaradais â llawer o athrawon, a fyddai wrth eu bodd yn cael cynorthwy-ydd gweinyddol i'w helpu yn hyn o beth. Rhaid llongyfarch athrawon ar eu gwaith. Hwy sydd yn y sefyllfa orau i sicrhau bod disgyblion yn elwa i'r eithaf o'u lleoliad wythnos neu bythefnos, oherwydd y cysylltiadau agos sydd ganddynt weithiau gyda chyflogwyr a'u hadnabyddiaeth o ddisgyblion unigol.

Yr wyf am ategu gwerth profiad gwaith i ddisgyblion. Fodd bynnag, er mwyn inni gyflawni ei botensial mwyaf posibl, rhaid inni sicrhau bod unrhyw fiwrocratiaeth yn cael ei symleiddio. Fel y dywedaso, Jane, dim ond man cychwyn yw hwn. Gobeithiaf yr ymgorfforir ein sylwadau heddiw yng ngwaith y dyfodol.

**Rosemary Butler:** Mae hwn yn adroddiad pwysig. Fodd bynnag, yn anffodus mae'n un o'r dogfennau hynny nas canfyddir yn ddigon radical neu a ganfyddir yn rhy radical, a pha bynnag ffordd yr âi, byddai wedi achosi problemau. Fodd bynnag, trafododd Mandy Paish y pwnc yn dda a chyflwynodd adroddiad sydd yn dderbyniol i bawb. Mae pawb yn derbyn bod yn rhaid inni fonitro gweithgareddau yn ein hysgolion mewn ffordd gywir a phriodol. Fodd bynnag, ni ddylem gyfeirio at orlwytho athrawon mewn ysgolion yn unig. Rhaid inni ystyried hefyd sefydliadau addysg bellach, addysg barhaus ac addysg i oedolion, lle y mae'r beichiau gweinyddol sydd ynghlwm wrth ddarparu'r Rhwydwaith Coleg Agored yn enfawr. Mae



only to schools, but to education as a whole.

I will raise a few points. First, is the £1,000 for the employment of additional clerical staff to deal with the existing burdens and mounds of paper, or will it be spent on quality training for the delivery of good management systems? We must consider that. One element that the Assembly introduced into the new headteachers' qualification was good management and systems training and the offer of time management, which is a useful tool.

One of the most striking presentations given to the Pre-16 Education, Schools and Early Years Committee was on a business partnership between the headteacher of a junior school and the managing director of a large company with hundreds of employees. The headteacher was new and enthusiastic and managed about 11 staff but found that he worked weekends until 8 p.m. The managing director commented that he did not take work home at weekends, therefore, why did he? The headteacher visited the managing director's business to find out why it was happening. He said that that transformed his working life. This is an example of how business and industry systems could help people to run junior and comprehensive schools. Teacher placements are something that we should encourage.

The report states that every school in Wales should have access to the internet as soon as possible. I agree. However, we should develop and deliver an all-Wales intranet, because there is a huge amount of expertise in schools in different parts of Wales and, sometimes, we find that one school does something in a particular way and another school reinvents the wheel on the same issue. An intranet would be helpful. In fact, schoolteachers from Caerphilly gave a good presentation on how their intranet works. A huge amount of expertise is available and all teachers should have access to it. We must ensure that there is proper ICT training and that every teacher in Wales has access to it.

hyn nid yn unig yn wir am ysgolion, ond am addysg yn gyffredinol.

Codaf rai pwyntiau. Yn gyntaf, a yw'r £1,000 ar gyfer cyflogi staff clerigol ychwanegol i ddelio â'r beichiau presennol a'r tomenni o bapur, neu a gaiff ei wario ar hyfforddiant o ansawdd er mwyn darparu systemau rheoli da? Rhaid inni ystyried hynny. Un elfen a gyflwynodd y Cynulliad i'r cymhwyster penaethiaid newydd oedd rheoli da a hyfforddiant da mewn systemau ynghyd â chynnig rheoli amser, sydd yn arf defnyddiol.

Un o'r cyflwyniadau mwyaf trawiadol a roddwyd i'r Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn 16, Ysgolion a Blynyddoedd Cynnar oedd ar bartneriaeth fusnes rhwng pennaeth ysgol iau a rheolwr gyfarwyddwr cwmni mawr â channoedd o gyflogeion. Yr oedd y pennaeth yn newydd a brwdfrydig ac yn rheoli tua 11 o staff ond canfu ei fod yn gweithio ar benwythnosau hyd 8 p.m. Gwnaeth y rheolwr gyfarwyddwr y sylw na fyddai'n mynd â gwaith adref ar benwythnosau, felly, pam ei fod ef yn gwneud hynny? Ymwelodd y pennaeth â busnes y rheolwr gyfarwyddwr i ganfod pam bod hyn yn digwydd. Dywedodd i hynny drawsnewid ei fywyd gwaith. Dyma enghraifft o'r ffordd y gallai systemau busnes a diwydiant helpu pobl i redeg ysgolion iau a chyfun. Mae lleoliadau athrawon yn rhywbeth y dylem eu hannog.

Noda'r adroddiad y dylai pob ysgol yng Nghymru gael mynediad i'r rhyngrwyd cyn gynted â phosibl. Cytunaf. Fodd bynnag, dylem ddatblygu a darparu mewnwyd i Gymru gyfan, gan fod arbenigedd eang o fewn ysgolion mewn rhannau gwahanol o Gymru ac, weithiau, canfyddwn y gwna un ysgol rywbeth mewn ffordd arbennig ac y bydd ysgol arall yn ymdrin â'r un mater mewn ffordd wahanol. Byddai mewnwyd yn fuddiol. A dweud y gwir, rhoddodd athrawon ysgol o Gaerffili gyflwyniad da ar y ffordd y mae eu mewnwyd hwy yn gweithio. Mae arbenigedd eang ar gael a dylai fod ar gael i bob athro. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod hyfforddiant TGCh priodol a'i fod ar gael i bob athro yng Nghymru.

We could dramatically reduce the amount of work involved in the annual governors' meeting and the annual governors' report. I have attended many annual governors' meetings where there are more governors than parents, in a school with 1,200 or 1,300 pupils. We should address that issue. However, now we have even playing fields in terms of inspections, the sooner we move towards self-assessment in schools the better. That is my pet subject in the attempt to reduce bureaucracy. This is my opinion, but I hope that, in five years' time, it will also be the Assembly's opinion.

**Brian Gibbons:** Last week, I attended a parents and governors' meeting, where no parents were present. That was not the first time that I had attended such a meeting. While we waited for hoards of parents to arrive, we discussed whether these annual reports should continue in the same way. It would be useful to give that matter some thought. I do not claim to have any expertise on educational matters. However, I am disappointed by the contributions of the opposition, with the exception of Jonathan Morgan. I find that much of the debate is reminiscent of the woolly-headed liberal educationalism that plagued education in the late sixties, most of the seventies and early eighties—with the exception of the move towards comprehensive education, which has been important for many young people in my area. The only expertise with which I claim to speak in this debate is that I have been a governor of a valley's comprehensive for 20 years—

**Gareth Jones** *rose*—

**Brian Gibbons:** In a second, Gareth. I was a governor at the same school that my children attended. What I have to say is based on that experience.

**Gareth Jones:** Yr wyf yn falch o glywed am eich ymrwymiad i ysgolion cyfun. Beth yw eich barn am y sefyllfa ddiweddaraf lle mae'r Prif Weinidog yn argymhell symud oddi wrth yr egwyddor gyfun a throï at ysgolion arbenigol lle bydd dethol ac felly bydd rhai

Galleu leihau'r gwaith sydd ynghlwm wrth gyfarfod blynyddol y llywodraethwyr ac adroddiad blynyddol y llywodraethwyr yn ddramatig. Bùm yn bresennol mewn llawer o gyfarfodydd blynyddol i lywodraethwyr lle y bu mwy o lywodraethwyr na rhieni, mewn ysgol o 1,200 neu 1,300 o ddisgyblion. Dylem ymdrin â'r mater hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, gan fod y sefyllfa arolygiadau yn gyfartal bellach, gorau po gyntaf y symudwn tuag at hunan-asesu mewn ysgolion. Dyna yw fy hoff bwnc ym maes lleihau biwrocraatiaeth. Yr wyf wedi datgan fy marn i, ond gobeithiaf mai hyn fydd barn y Cynulliad hefyd ymhen pum mlynedd.

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr wythnos diwethaf, mynychais gyfarfod rhieni a llywodraethwyr, lle nad oedd un rhiant yn bresennol. Nid dyna'r tro cyntaf imi fynychu cyfarfod o'r fath. Wrth inni aros i lwythi o rieni gyrraedd, trafodwyd pa un a ddylai'r adroddiadau blynyddol hyn barhau yn yr un ffordd. Byddai'n fuddiol rhoi ystyriaeth i'r mater hwnnw. Ni honnaf fod gennyf unrhyw arbenigedd ar faterion addysgiadol. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siomedig gan gyfraniadau'r wrthblaid, ac eithrio Jonathan Morgan. Mae llawer o'r ddadl yn fy atgoffa o'r addysgiadaeth ryddfrydol amwys a fu'n bla ar addysg ar ddiwedd y chwedegau, y rhan fwyaf o'r saithdegau a'r wythdegau cynnar—ac eithrio'r symudiad tuag at addysg gyfun, a fu'n bwysig i lawer o bobl ifanc yn fy ardal i. Yr unig arbenigedd yr honnaf sydd gennyf yn y ddadl hon yw imi fod yn llywodraethwr ysgol gyfun yn y cymoedd ers 20 mlynedd—

**Gareth Jones** *a gododd*—

**Brian Gibbons:** Mewn eiliad, Gareth. Yr oeddwn yn llywodraethwr yn yr ysgol a fynychodd fy mhlant. Mae'r hyn sydd gennyf i'w ddweud yn seiliedig ar y profiad hwnnw.

**Gareth Jones:** I am pleased to hear of your commitment to comprehensive schools. What is your opinion on the latest situation where the Prime Minister recommends moving away from the comprehensive principle and towards specialist schools where there will

disgyblion yn cael eu gwrthod?

be selection and, therefore, where some pupils will be refused?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Brian, before you start, the clock has gone wrong again. I do not think that you have only had 27 seconds. You asked to be allowed to make a short contribution, which you have made. You must finish quickly.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Brian, cyn ichi ddechrau, mae'r cloc yn anghywir eto. Ni chredaf mai dim ond 27 eiliad a gawsoch. Gofynasoch imi ganiatáu ichi wneud cyfraniad byr, ac fe wnaetoch hynny. Rhaid ichi orffen yn gyflym.

**Brian Gibbons:** I am just coming to the point. When I started as a school governor, the number of children that were sitting GCSE examinations in that school had not reached double figures. Last year, our comprehensive school was the second most improved school in Wales in terms of academic performance. I do not doubt that the commitment of the teaching staff and headteacher is at least partly responsible for that. I also do not doubt that the structured monitoring of education performance throughout our educational system has given the children in my constituency the educational opportunities that they now enjoy. I would like for those who criticise this document's theme to spell out what they propose in its place. They have failed to do so in their contribution so far.

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr wyf ar fin dod at y pwynt. Pan ddechreuais fel llywodraethwr ysgol, nid oedd nifer y plant a safai arholiadau TGAU yn yr ysgol honno wedi cyrraedd ffigurau dwbl. Y llynedd, ein hysgol gyfun ni oedd yr ysgol a oedd wedi gwella fwyaf, ond am un, yng Nghymru yn nhermau perfformiad academiaidd. Nid amheuf mai ymrwymiad y staff addysgu a'r pennaeth sydd yn gyfrifol am hynny yn rhannol o leiaf. Nid amheuf ychwaith bod y gwaith strwythuredig o fonitro perfformiad addysg ar draws ein system addysgiadol wedi rhoi'r cyfleoedd addysgiadol i'r plant yn fy etholaeth y maent bellach yn eu mwynhau. Hoffwn i'r rheini sydd yn beirniadu thema'r ddogfen hon egluro'n ofalus yr hyn a gynigiant yn ei lle. Maent wedi methu â gwneud hynny hyd yn hyn.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** The Assembly is committed to improving the lot of teachers in Wales. All Assembly Members are dedicated to this. It is also a matter to which I am personally committed. I am grateful that this report makes a start into looking at bureaucratic burdens. As Members have said, the report has completed an effective analysis of those burdens. Colleagues in the Department for Education and Skills and PricewaterhouseCoopers are also undertaking a study into teachers' workloads. Members who referred to issues relating to workloads will know that the Assembly does not have responsibility for that matter. However, this report is considered as being complementary to the work carried out in that study. I am sure that together they will have an enormous impact on teachers in Wales.

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Mae'r Cynulliad yn ymrwymedig i wella sefyllfa athrawon yng Nghymru. Mae holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn ymroddedig i hyn. Mae hefyd yn fater yr wyf innau yn ymrwymedig iddo yn bersonol. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar bod yr adroddiad hwn yn dechrau ar y gwaith o edrych ar feichiau biwrocraidd. Fel y dywedodd yr Aelodau, mae'r adroddiad wedi cwblhau dadansoddiad effeithiol o'r beichiau hynny. Mae cydweithwyr yn yr Adran Addysg a Sgiliau a PricewaterhouseCoopers hefyd yn ymgymryd ag astudiaeth o feichiau gwaith athrawon. Bydd yr Aelodau a gyfeiriodd at faterion sydd yn ymwneud â beichiau gwaith yn gwybod nad yw'r Cynulliad yn gyfrifol am y mater hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, ystyrir bod yr adroddiad hwn yn ategu'r gwaith a gyflawnwyd yn yr astudiaeth honno. Gyda'i gilydd, yr wyf yn siŵr y cânt effaith enfawr ar athrawon yng Nghymru.

Brian Gibbons's last comments on Members' contributions to the debate and on the difficulties experienced by members of the advisory group in considering a more radical agenda are justified. Schools who took part in the report's research were given this test: does this school activity contribute to the key objective of school improvement? I am sure that all Members would want to support that test. The conclusion was that almost every activity did contribute to school improvement. However, the report also concluded that we should change how we look at bureaucratic burdens. That is the challenge for me, as Minister, and also for you as Members and for every local education authority in Wales. It is also a challenge for the Association of Directors in Wales, the Qualifications, Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales, Estyn and all the other partners that have worked with us.

4:40 p.m.

The partnership with the members of the advisory group has been invaluable. They all support the document before us today, in the knowledge that we must make a real start in tackling these issues. In terms of Alison's contribution, I make the point that many of the 75 documents to which she referred come from the Department for Education and Skills. They are not Assembly documents. Since I have been Minister I have ensured that we do not send out unnecessary documents. I am keen to work with Members on reviewing guidance, where appropriate, which means that we can bring together eight or nine extant pieces of guidance into one clear document for schools in the future.

Rosemary, in terms of spending the £1,000—and I thank you for your cogent contribution to this debate—it is up to the schools as to how they spend it. They can consider whether they want to spend it on management systems, extra support, supply staff and so on. However, I would endorse the teacher placement suggestions that you and Christine made. I recently presented certificates to teachers who had taken part in placements. In the last year, 24,000 teachers

Mae cyfiawnhad dros sylwadau olaf Brian Gibbons ar gyfraniadau'r Aelodau at y ddadl ac ar yr anawsterau a gafodd aelodau'r grŵp ymgynghorol wrth ystyried agenda fwy radical. Rhoddwyd y prawf hwn i ysgolion a gymerodd ran yn ymchwil yr adroddiad: a yw'r gweithgarwch ysgol hwn yn cyfrannu at yr amcan allweddol o wella'r ysgol? Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai pob Aelod am gefnogi'r prawf hwnnw. Y casgliad oedd bod bron pob gweithgarwch yn cyfrannu at wella'r ysgol. Fodd bynnag, daeth yr adroddiad hefyd i'r casgliad y dylem newid y ffordd yr edrychwn ar feichiau biwrocraidd. Dyna'r her i mi, fel Gweinidog, a hefyd i chi fel Aelodau ac i bob awdurdod addysg lleol yng Nghymru. Mae hefyd yn her i Gymdeithas y Cyfarwyddwyr yng Nghymru, Awdurdod Cymwysterau, Cwricwlwm ac Asesu Cymru, Estyn a phob partner arall a gydweithiodd â ni.

Bu'r bartneriaeth ag aelodau'r grŵp ymgynghorol yn amhrisiadwy. Cefnogant oll y ddogfen ger ein bron heddiw, gan wybod bod yn rhaid inni ddechrau mynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn o ddifrif. Yn nhermau cyfraniad Alison, gwnaf y pwynt y daw llawer o'r 75 o ddogfennau y cyfeiriodd atynt o'r Adran Addysg a Sgiliau. Nid dogfennau'r Cynulliad mohonynt. Ers imi fod yn Weinidog, sicrheais nad anfonwn ddogfennau diangen allan. Yr wyf yn awyddus i gydweithio â'r Aelodau ar adolygu arweiniad, lle y bo'n briodol, sydd yn golygu y gallwn gyfuno wyth neu naw darn sydd mewn bodolaeth i greu un ddogfen glir ar gyfer ysgolion yn y dyfodol.

Rosemary, yn nhermau gwario'r £1,000—a diolchaf ichi am eich cyfraniad grymus i'r ddadl hon—penderfyniad yr ysgolion yw sut y gwariant ef. Gallant ystyried a ydynt am ei wario ar systemau rheoli, cymorth ychwanegol, staff cyflenwi ac ati. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn cymeradwyo'r awgrymiadau am leoliadau athrawon a wnaethpwyd gennych chi a Christine. Yn ddiweddar cyflwynais dystysgrifau i athrawon a gymerodd ran mewn lleoliadau.

have had work placements in industry, which we should celebrate and contribute to.

Yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, cafodd 24,000 o athrawon leoliadau gwaith mewn diwydiant, y dylem ei ddathlu a chyfrannu ato.

In closing, I say that the bureaucracy test that we are prepared to support in the Conservative's amendment is a notional test, not an additional means of bureaucracy. It is a test that ensures that we look at the bureaucratic implications of everything we do in schools. I am prepared to support that amendment on that basis. I ask you to support the motion and amendment 3.

Wrth gloi, dywedaf mai prawf tybiannol yw'r prawf biwrocratiaeth yr ydym yn barod i'w gefnogi yng ngwelliant y Ceidwadwyr, nid cyfrwng biwrocratiaeth ychwanegol. Prawf ydyw sydd yn sicrhau yr edrychwn ar oblygiadau biwrocraidaidd popeth a wnawn mewn ysgolion. Yr wyf yn barod i gefnogi'r gwelliant hwnnw ar y sail honno. Gofynnaf ichi gefnogi'r cynnig a gwelliant 3.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 26*  
*Amendment 1: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 26*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Graham, William  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 9, Ymatal 12, Yn erbyn 26*  
*Gwelliant 2: For 9, Abstain 12, Against 26*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor

Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter

Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 36, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 12  
Amendment 3: For 36, Abstain 0, Against 12*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Melding, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Richards, Rod  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 12, Ymatal 9, Yn erbyn 26  
 Amendment 4: For 12, Abstain 9, Against 26*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Dafis, Cynog  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Janet  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Ron  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn

Graham, William  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Richards, Rod  
 Rogers, Peter

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

Amended motion:

*the National Assembly*

*1. welcomes the report of the project to reduce the bureaucratic burdens on schools in Wales laid in the Table Office on 2 July 2001 and the partnership working underpinning it.*

*2. recognises that the action recommended in the report is a starting point and will need to be carried through by the National Assembly and its partners if teachers and schools are to see a reduction in the amount of bureaucracy they have to deal with.*

*3. endorses the recommendations of the report and the associated action which is identified.*

*4. calls on the Liberal Democrat/Labour Administration to introduce a 'bureaucracy test' to ensure that future education policies will not increase the bureaucratic burden on schools.*

Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*1. yn croesawu adroddiad y prosiect i leihau'r baich biwrocraataidd ar ysgolion yng Nghymru, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Gorffennaf 2001, a'r gweithio ar y cyd sy'n sail iddo.*

*2. yn cydnabod bod y camau a argymhellir yn yr adroddiad yn fan cychwyn ac y bydd angen i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a'i bartneriaid weithredu arnynt os dymunir i athrawon ac ysgolion weld lleihad yn maint y fiwrocraatiaeth y maent yn gorfod delio â hi.*

*3. yn cymeradwyo'r argymhellion yn yr adroddiad a'r camau gweithredu cysylltiedig a nodir.*

*4. yn galw ar Weinyddiaeth y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol/y Blaid Lafur i gyflwyno 'prawf biwrocraatiaeth' er mwyn sicrhau na fydd polisïau addysg a gyflwynir yn y dyfodol yn cynyddu'r baich biwrocraataidd ar ysgolion.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Amended motion: For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Ron  
 Edwards, Richard



Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Richards, Rod  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.  
 Amended motion carried*

### **Cymeradwyo Adroddiad Grant Arbennig Rhif 14 Approval of Special Grant Report No. 14**

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I propose that

*the National Assembly, under section 88B of the Local Government Finance Act 1988 and in accordance with Standing Order No. 19.8, approves the Local Government Finance (Wales) Special Grant Report (No. 14) (Wales) 2001 which was laid in the Table Office on Monday 2 July 2001. (NDM735)*

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, o dan Adran 88B Deddf Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol 1988 ac yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 19.8, yn cymeradwyo Adroddiad Grant Arbennig Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) (Rhif 14) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ddydd Llun 2 Gorffennaf 2001. (NDM735)*

*Cynnig: O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
 Motion: For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick

Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Ron  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Richards, Rod  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried*

### **Yr Adroddiad ar Gyflenwi Lleoedd mewn Ysgolion** **The Report on Supply of School Places**

**Cynog Dafis:** Cynigiaf fod

**Cynog Dafis:** I propose that

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, 'Policy Review: Supply of School Places', a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Gorffennaf 2001. (NDM734)*

*the National Assembly notes the report of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee entitled, 'Policy Review: Supply of School Places', laid in the Table Office on 2 July 2001. (NDM734)*

Diolch am y cyfle i gyflwyno'r adroddiad hwn ar ddarparu lleoedd mewn ysgolion i'r

Thank you for the opportunity to present this report on the supply of school places to the

Gweinidog ac i'r Cyfarfod Llawn. Dyma'r trydydd adroddiad adolygu polisi i'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ei gyflwyno eleni. Cyflwynwyd yr adroddiadau ar dechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu mewn addysg a darpariaeth y blynyddoedd cynnar i blant teirblwydd eisoes. Y Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn 16, Ysgolion ac Addysg Gynnar a gychwynnodd yr arolygon hyn a'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes a'u cwblhaodd. Wrth gasglu tystiolaeth, cynhaliodd y Pwyllgor gyfarfodydd yn Aberaeron a Merthyr Tudful. Y roedd y sesiynau yn fuddiol ac yn dangos bod rhywbeth i'w ennill o gynnal rhai cyfarfodydd y tu allan i Fae Caerdydd. Diolchaf i'r holl gyrrff ac unigolion a gyflwynodd dystiolaeth ac a gyfrannodd at yr adolygiad. Mae'r adroddiad yn cynnwys cryn dipyn o wybodaeth ddefnyddiol.

Cyfrifoldeb statudol ar awdurdodau addysg lleol yw cynllunio cyflenwad lleoedd mewn ysgolion at y dyfodol, ac nid ar chwarae bach y mae llwyddo i wneud hynny a chadw'r ddydysgl yn wastad bob amser. Ar y naill law, rhaid iddynt ystyried gofynion a dyheadau dealladwy rhieni a disgyblion ac, ar y llaw arall, rhaid iddynt ddefnyddio'r adnoddau sydd ar gael yn y ffordd orau posibl. Wrth geisio cadw'r cydbwysedd hwn, rhaid hefyd ystyried llu o ffactorau eraill. Yn eu plith, mae'r gwahaniaeth rhwng anghenion ysgolion cynradd a rhai ysgolion uwchradd, disgwyliadau cymunedau gwledig a chymunedau trefol, newidiadau demograffig posibl ac anghenion disgyblion penodol, er enghraifft, y rhai sydd am gael addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg.

Cyfrifoldeb yr awdurdodau addysg lleol yn bennaf yw'r broses gynllunio hon. Fodd bynnag, yn y dyddiau a fu, darparodd y Swyddfa Gymreig gymorth ar ffurf canllawiau ysgrifenedig. Dangosodd y dystiolaeth a gyflwynwyd i'r Pwyllgor nad oedd y canllawiau bob amser wedi'u gweithredu â chysondeb gan bob awdurdod lleol, yn enwedig o ran mesur capasiti ysgolion. Mae'r Pwyllgor yn awyddus i gael dull teg a chyson o ddelio â'r broses hon yn y dyfodol. Mae'r adroddiad yn argymhell mireinio'r polisi presennol ar sail tystiolaeth

Minister and to Plenary. This is the third policy review report submitted by the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee this year. The reports on information technology in education and the early years provision for three-year olds have already been presented. Each of these reviews was initiated by the Pre-16 Education, Schools and Early Learning Committee and completed by the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee. While gathering evidence, the Committee held meetings in Aberaeron and Merthyr Tydfil. These sessions were useful and demonstrated that there is a benefit to holding some meetings outside Cardiff Bay. I thank all the organisations and individuals who submitted evidence and contributed to the review. The report contains a great deal of useful information.

Planning the future supply of school places is a statutory responsibility of local education authorities and, in carrying out that duty, they have a difficult balancing act to perform. On the one hand, they must consider the understandable demands and aspirations of parents and pupils and, on the other, they must use available resources to the best effect. While trying to maintain that balance, a host of other factors must also be considered. These include the differing needs of primary and some secondary schools, the expectations of urban and rural communities, possible demographic changes and the needs of specific learners, for example, those wishing to receive their education through the medium of Welsh.

The main responsibility for this planning process lies with the local education authorities. However, in bygone days, the Welsh Office provided assistance in the form of written guidelines. The evidence presented to the Committee showed that these guidelines were not always applied consistently by all local education authorities, particularly with regard to measuring the capacity of schools. The Committee is eager to achieve an equitable and consistent approach to this process in the future. The report recommends an evidence-

yn hytrach na newid polisi.

Y man cychwyn ar gyfer rheoli lleoedd mewn ysgolion yn effeithiol yw argaeledd gwybodaeth ddibynadwy a chywir. Y cam nesaf yw dylunio methodoleg sydd yn hawdd i'w deall a'i rhoi ar waith ar gyfer defnyddio'r wybodaeth honno. Nid mater o adnoddau yn unig yw cyflenwi lleoedd mewn ysgolion. Mae'n effeithio ar ddysgwyr, rhieni a chymunedau lleol. Un o argymhellion yr adroddiad yw ceisio sicrhau bod canllawiau yn y dyfodol yn cynnwys cyfeiriad at ddefnydd helaethach gan gymunedau lleol o adeiladau eu hysgolion. Mae hynny'n unol â menter 'Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf' y Cynulliad.

Cymeradwyaf yr adroddiad i'r Gweinidog ac i'r Cyfarfod Llawn. Mae'r adroddiad yn rhoi awdurdodau addysg lleol ar ben y ffordd i allu cynllunio datblygiad adeiladau, adnoddau a chyfleusterau ysgolion yn well, er budd eu cymunedau lleol. Dengys tystiolaeth ddiweddar fod rhai awdurdodau addysg lleol yng Nghymru wedi dechrau adolygu eu prosesau cynllunio strategol ar hyd y trywydd hwn. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn derbyn tri argymhelliad yr adroddiad ac yn gweithredu arnynt o fewn yr amserlen a nodir, fel bod modd lledaenu'r arferion gorau i holl awdurdodau addysg lleol Cymru.

4:50 p.m.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I will try to include everyone in the debate. It will be difficult to do so by 5.30 p.m. because we have no leeway to prolong the session. Therefore, I appeal for short contributions. Anybody who speaks for two or three minutes will certainly be in credit, as far as I am concerned, when they request to speak again. No Member will be allowed to speak for more than five minutes; if they do, I will interrupt them ruthlessly.

**Karen Sinclair:** I applaud the fact that recommendation three of this report states that the revised guidelines on planning school places should include reference to small and rural schools. I am not surprised

based refinement to existing policy rather than changing it.

The starting point for the effective management of school places is the availability of reliable and accurate information. The next step is to devise the methodology for using that information, which is understandable and easy to apply. The supply of school places is not just a resources issue. It affects learners, parents and local communities. One of the report's recommendations seeks to ensure that future guidance includes reference to greater use of school buildings by local communities. This is in accordance with the National Assembly's 'Communities First' initiative.

I commend this report to the Minister and to Plenary. The report points the way forward for local education authorities to better plan the development, resources and facilities of school buildings, for the benefit of their local communities. Recent evidence indicates that some local education authorities in Wales have started to revise the strategic planning processes along these lines. I hope that the Minister accepts the three recommendations in the report and that she acts on them within the indicated timescales, so that best practice can be disseminated to all local education authorities in Wales.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Ceisiaf gynnwys pawb yn y ddadl. Bydd yn anodd gwneud hynny cyn 5.30 p.m. gan nad oes gennym unrhyw hyblygrwydd i ymestyn y sesiwn. Felly, apeliam am gyfraniadau byr. Yn fy marn i, bydd gan unrhyw un a fydd yn siarad am ddwy neu dair munud fwy o obaith wrth wneud cais i siarad eto. Ni chaniateir i unrhyw Aelod siarad am fwy na phum munud; os gwnânt, byddaf yn torri ar eu traws yn ddirugaredd.

**Karen Sinclair:** Cymeradwyaf y ffaith bod argymhelliad tri o'r adroddiad hwn yn datgan y dylai'r canllawiau diwygiedig ar gynllunio lleoedd mewn ysgolion gynnwys cyfeiriad at ysgolion bach a gwledig. Nid oedd yn syndod

that many of the respondents to this review referred to small schools and their important role in the local community. It is impossible to truly value rural schools. They are much more than education centres as they are often the only focus in a village and are therefore used for a wide variety of extra-curricular activities. Any closure or threatened closure of a small rural school leads to a vicious circle. Once a school is closed, communities fail to attract young families and therefore, there would never be enough children to re-open it. Support networks disappear and the consequential cost of services in these areas increase.

A review of school places is currently taking place in my constituency and it is causing a great deal of anguish. Failure to acknowledge the additional, unquantifiable role that these schools play could have a disastrous effect on the communities involved. School roles peak and trough, they always have done, in rural and urban areas, but in rural areas the percentage difference is much more critical. Clustering of small schools may well be the answer. However, budget allocations must reflect the cost of maintaining two or three buildings. At present, that is not the case and the direct payments allocated to split schools over the last year or two have been ineffectual in terms of clustered schools because they are regarded as one school. We must accept that rural provision will cost more than urban provision. It is not possible to make economies of scale in small rural schools. However, that provision is vital and we must not fall into the trap of comparing the cost of rural and urban schools in a simplistic way.

**Jonathan Morgan:** First, I welcome this debate and the report before us this afternoon. When considering the issue of surplus places in schools, it is difficult to attempt to strike a balance between the competing demands of efficiency and supporting schools with parental support. Clearly, tough decisions must be made

imi i lawer o'r ymatebwyr i'r adolygiad hwn gyfeirio at ysgolion bach a'u rôl bwysig yn y gymuned leol. Mae'n amhosibl rhoi gwerth gwirioneddol ar ysgolion gwledig. Maent yn llawer mwy na chanolfannau addysg gan mai hwy yn aml yw'r unig ffocws mewn pentref ac felly cânt eu defnyddio ar gyfer amrywiaeth eang o weithgareddau allgyrsiol. Mae cau ysgol fach wledig neu fygwth ei chau yn arwain at gylch dieflig. Unwaith y caiff ysgol ei chau, metha cymunedau â denu teuluoedd ifanc, ac felly ni fyddai byth digon o blant i'w hailagor. Diflanna rhwydweithiau cymorth ac, yn sgîl hynny, mae cost gwasanaethau yn yr ardaloedd hyn yn cynyddu.

Mae adolygiad o leoedd mewn ysgolion yn mynd rhagddo ar hyn o bryd yn fy etholaeth ac mae'n achosi llawer o bryder. Gallai methu â chydnabod y rhan ychwanegol, anfesuradwy sydd gan yr ysgolion hyn i'w chwarae gael effaith drychinebus ar y cymunedau dan sylw. Mae rôl ysgol yn amrywio, fel y gwnaeth erioed, mewn ardaloedd gwledig a threfol, ond mewn ardaloedd gwledig mae'r gwahaniaeth canrannol yn llawer mwy difrifol. Efallai mai clystyru ysgolion bach yw'r ateb. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i ddyraniadau cyllideb adlewyrchu cost cynnal dau neu dri adeilad. Ar hyn o bryd, nid yw hynny'n digwydd ac ni fu'r taliadau uniongyrchol a ddyrannwyd i ysgolion rhanedig dros y flwyddyn neu ddwy ddiwethaf yn effeithiol yn nhermau ysgolion clwstwr oherwydd cânt eu hystyried fel un ysgol. Rhaid inni dderbyn y bydd darpariaeth wledig yn costio mwy na darpariaeth drefol. Nid yw'n bosibl gwneud darbodion maint mewn ysgolion gwledig bach. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ddarpariaeth honno yn hanfodol ac ni allwn syrthio i'r fagl o gymharu cost ysgolion gwledig a threfol mewn ffordd syml.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yn gyntaf, croesawaf y ddadl hon a'r adroddiad ger ein bron y prynhawn yma. Wrth ystyried y broblem o leoedd gwag mewn ysgolion, mae'n anodd ceisio taro cydbwysedd rhwng gofynion cystadleuol effeithlonrwydd a chynorthwyo ysgolion sydd â chefnogaeth rhieni.

. I want to raise three points on the need to eliminate excessive surplus places, but it is important that we do not throw the baby out with the bathwater. First, on small and rural schools, my concerns are similar to those expressed by Karen Sinclair. It is crucial that we do not pursue what I would consider to be an over-zealous policy on surplus places that would penalise small schools just for being small. Some rural schools are always likely to have surplus places and we need to ensure that such schools are not sacrificed on the altar of efficiency gains. There are differences between small schools in rural and urban areas and, as Karen Sinclair rightly indicated, rural schools are likely to cost more money because of the nature of those schools and the communities that they serve. I look forward to the Assembly putting together a coherent small schools policy, which has so far been absent from the partnership agreement agenda. I hope that the Assembly Minister will bring forward a strategy, which we look forward to helping her devise to assist our smaller, rural schools.

Secondly, while recognising the surplus places problem, it is not good enough to consider that in isolation; there is also the issue of parental choice. It is crucial that popular and successful schools are not unduly constrained by local councils wanting to channel pupils into less successful schools with high levels of surplus places. I am afraid that that is not just an idle concern. I draw the Assembly's attention to an example in my region, South Wales Central, namely, Llysfaen Primary School, which is a successful school. Last year, the local authority decided that, in a desperate attempt to eliminate surplus places elsewhere, it would reduce the intake of one of Cardiff's finest primary schools. We need to be careful that, while looking to reduce surplus places in what are, sometimes, less successful schools, we do not end up penalising our more successful primary schools. This clearly has an impact on parental choice. Had this been successful, it would have denied

Yn amlwg, rhaid gwneud penderfyniadau anodd. Hoffwn godi tri phwynt o ran yr angen i gael gwared ar leoedd gwag, ond mae'n bwysig peidio â thafu'r llo a chadw'r brych. Yn gyntaf, o ran ysgolion bach a gwledig, mae fy mhryderon yn debyg i'r rhai a fynegwyd gan Karen Sinclair. Mae'n hanfodol peidio â mynd ar drywydd yr hyn y byddwn yn ei ystyried yn bolisi gorfrwdfrydig ar leoedd gwag a fyddai'n cosbi ysgolion bach am y rheswm syml eu bod yn fach. Mae'n debygol y bydd gan rai ysgolion gwledig leoedd gwag bob amser a dylem sicrhau na chaiff ysgolion o'r fath eu haberthu ar allor darbodusrwydd. Mae gwahaniaethau rhwng ysgolion bach mewn ardaloedd gwledig a threfol ac, fel y nododd Karen Sinclair yn gwbl gywir, mae ysgolion gwledig yn debygol o gostio mwy oherwydd natur yr ysgolion a'r cymunedau a wasanaethir ganddynt. Edrychaf ymlaen at weld y Cynulliad yn llunio polisi cydlynus ar gyfer ysgolion bach, na welwyd hyd yn hyn ar agenda'r cytundeb partneriaeth. Gobeithiaf y bydd Gweinidog y Cynulliad yn cyflwyno strategaeth, yr edrychwn ymlaen at ei helpu i lunio er mwyn cynorthwyo ein hysgolion gwledig, llai.

Yn ail, tra'n cydnabod y broblem o leoedd gwag, nid yw'n ddigon da ei hystyried ar ei phen ei hun; mae dewis rhieni yn bwysig hefyd. Mae'n hanfodol na chaiff ysgolion poblogaidd a llwyddiannus eu cyfyngu'n ddiangen gan gynghorau lleol sydd am sianelu disgyblion i ysgolion llai llwyddiannus gyda lefelau uchel o leoedd gwag. Ofnaf nad pryder gwag mohono. Tynnaf sylw'r Cynulliad at enghraifft yn fy rhanbarth, Canol De Cymru, sef Ysgol Gynradd Llysfaen, sydd yn ysgol lwyddiannus. Y llynedd, penderfynodd yr awdurdod lleol, mewn ymgais daer i gael gwared ar leoedd gwag mewn ysgolion eraill, y byddai'n lleihau nifer y disgyblion a dderbyniwyd i un o ysgolion cynradd gorau Caerdydd. Mae angen inni fod yn ofalus, wrth geisio lleihau lleoedd gwag yn yr ysgolion hyn sydd weithiau'n llai llwyddiannus, na fyddwn yn cosbi ein hysgolion cynradd mwy llwyddiannus. Caiff hyn effaith amlwg ar ddewis rhieni. Pe bai

many children in my constituency the good fortune of receiving an excellent education at an outstanding primary school. Luckily, a campaign, in which we were all involved, ensured that this was not the case. However, this demonstrates the dangers of local authorities wanting to fill places in unpopular schools by placing artificial constraints on schools that are more successful.

My third and final point relates to faith-based and Welsh-medium schools. We all know that demand for places in denominational and Welsh-medium schools far outstrips the supply of such places, particularly in south Wales. Many local authorities, including Cardiff City and County Council, use the excuse of high levels of surplus places to deny parents the right to send their children to a church school or a Welsh-medium school. The fact that there are surplus places in other schools in a local authority area should not mean that that local authority should not entertain the idea of expanding Welsh medium or church school provision. The Welsh Conservatives would welcome the expansion of the provision of Welsh medium and church schooling. However, many local authorities use the surplus places as an excuse.

Unfortunately, when you consider local authority provision—I point again to Cardiff—it is often the case that surplus places are used as a reason to attempt to fill up schools that have been unpopular in the past. There is a sharp contrast when you compare this with the situation in England, where the Westminster Government plans to open another 100 faith-based schools during the next few years. I hope that we will see a similar strategy in Wales to expand Welsh-medium education schooling and also our faith-based schools.

While the Welsh Conservatives recognise the importance of this report, and the contribution that it makes in considering surplus school places and school places generally, we have many concerns about how local authorities use the excessive surplus

hyn wedi bod yn llwyddiannus, byddai wedi golygu na fyddai llawer o blant yn fy etholaeth wedi bod yn ddigon ffodus i dderbyn addysg ardderchog mewn ysgol gynradd eithriadol. Yn ffodus, o ganlyniad i ymgyrch, y bu pob un ohonom yn rhan ohoni, ni ddigwyddodd hynny. Fodd bynnag, dengys hyn beryglon dymuniad awdurdodau lleol i lenwi lleoedd mewn ysgolion amhoblogaidd drwy osod cyfyngiadau artiffisial ar ysgolion sydd yn fwy llwyddiannus.

Mae fy nhrydydd pwynt, a'm pwynt olaf, yn ymwneud ag ysgolion Cymraeg ac ysgolion sy'n seiliedig ar ffydd. Gwyddom oll fod y galw am leoedd mewn ysgolion enwadol ac ysgolion Cymraeg yn llawer uwch na'r lleoedd sydd ar gael ynddynt, yn enwedig yn ne Cymru. Defnyddia llawer o awdurdodau lleol, gan gynnwys Cyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd, yr esgus o lefelau uchel o leoedd gwag er mwyn gwadu'r hawl i rieni anfon eu plant i ysgol eglwysig neu ysgol Gymraeg. Ni ddylai'r ffaith bod lleoedd gwag mewn ysgolion eraill o fewn ardal awdurdod lleol olygu na ddylai awdurdod lleol ystyried ehangu'r ddarpariaeth o ysgolion Cymraeg neu eglwysig. Byddai Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn croesawu ehangu'r ddarpariaeth o ysgolion Cymraeg ac eglwysig. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer o awdurdodau lleol yn defnyddio'r lleoedd gwag fel esgus.

Yn anffodus, pan ystyriwch ddarpariaeth awdurdodau lleol—cyfeiriaf at Gaerdydd unwaith eto—mae'n aml yn wir bod lleoedd gwag yn cael eu defnyddio fel rheswm i geisio llenwi ysgolion a fu'n amhoblogaidd yn y gorffennol. Ceir cyferbyniad llym wrth gymharu hyn â'r sefyllfa yn Lloegr, lle mae Llywodraeth San Steffan yn bwriadu agor 100 o ysgolion yn seiliedig ar ffydd yn ystod y blynyddoedd nesaf. Gobeithiaf y gwelwn strategaeth debyg yng Nghymru i ehangu nifer yr ysgolion Cymraeg yn ogystal â'n hysgolion yn seiliedig ar ffydd.

Er bod Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd yr adroddiad hwn, a'r cyfraniad a wna wrth ystyried lleoedd ysgol gwag a lleoedd ysgol yn gyffredinol, mae gennym lawer o bryderon ynghylch y ffordd y mae awdurdodau lleol yn defnyddio'r

places as a means of filling unpopular schools. Although those schools are unpopular for a variety of reasons, it is mostly because they have been unsuccessful. We will support the motion.

**Janice Gregory:** I sincerely hope that this debate will lead to a positive outcome in terms of our children's education and our communities. Quality education and strong communities are the two most important factors in this. I hope that we can take an enlightened approach on these issues, taking into account the need for flexibility, sensitivity and new solutions.

It is alarming to learn that there are thousands of surplus places in schools in Wales. It is obviously a huge problem. The report states that, in primary schools, the local education authorities' surplus figures range from 1 per cent to 21 per cent. However, one local education authority has overcrowding of 14 per cent. In secondary schools, surplus places range from 1 per cent to 21 per cent, but one local education authority has overcrowding of 1 per cent. We must give serious consideration to this issue, exploring all possibilities and related factors. In remote and other areas where a small school is an essential part of the community, as has already been mentioned, we must take that into account and do everything that we can for the school, the community and its children. However, we must also take into account the quality of education that each school can provide and the conditions for learning within the school.

It goes without saying that closure *en masse* is not the answer to the challenges that we face. We must find appropriate solutions—new and imaginative ones perhaps—somewhere between the two extremes of surplus places and mass closures. In particular, I agree that a large part of the emphasis must be on better integration and management of the cross-cutting themes of lifelong learning, social exclusion, community development, regeneration and services for young people. I would like to see more exposure being given to the potential

lleoedd ysgol gwag fel modd i lenwi ysgolion amhoblogaidd. Er bod yr ysgolion hynny yn amhoblogaidd am amrywiaeth o resymau, y rheswm pennaf yw na fuont yn llwyddiannus. Byddwn yn cefnogi'r cynnig.

**Janice Gregory:** Fy ngobaith yw y bydd y ddadl hon yn arwain at ganlyniad cadarnhaol yn nhermau addysg ein plant a'n cymunedau. Addysg o ansawdd a chymunedau cryf yw'r ddau ffactor pwysicaf yn hyn o beth. Gobeithiaf y bydd gennym ymagwedd oleuedig tuag at y materion hyn, gan ystyried yr angen am hyblygrwydd, sensitifrwydd ac atebion newydd.

Mae'n frawychus dysgu bod miloedd o leoedd gwag mewn ysgolion yng Nghymru. Mae'n amlwg ei fod yn broblem enfawr. Noda'r adroddiad, fod ffigurau awdurdodau addysg lleol sydd yn nodi nifer y lleoedd gwag mewn ysgolion cynradd, yn amrywio o 1 y cant i 21 y cant. Fodd bynnag, mae gan un awdurdod addysg lleol ormodedd o 14 y cant. Mewn ysgolion uwchradd, mae'r lleoedd gwag yn amrywio o 1 y cant i 21 y cant, ond mae gan un awdurdod addysg lleol ormodedd o 1 y cant o ddisgyblion. Rhaid inni ystyried y mater hwn yn ddwys, gan archwilio'r holl bosibiliadau a'r ffactorau cysylltiedig. Mewn ardaloedd pellennig ac ardaloedd eraill lle mae ysgol fach yn rhan hanfodol o'r gymuned, fel y crybwyllwyd eisoes, rhaid inni ystyried hynny a gwneud popeth o fewn ein gallu ar ran yr ysgol, y gymuned a'i phlant. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni hefyd ystyried ansawdd yr addysg y gall pob ysgol ei darparu a'r amodau dysgu yn yr ysgol.

Mae'n amlwg nad cau ysgolion yn un fflyd yw'r ateb i'r heriau a wynebwn. Rhaid inni ddod o hyd i atebion priodol—rhai newydd, llawn dychymyg efallai—rhywle rhwng y ddau begwn o leoedd gwag a chau nifer fawr o ysgolion. Yn arbennig, cytunaf fod yn rhaid rhoi rhan fawr o'r pwyslais ar integreiddio a rheoli materion trawsbynciol megis dysgu gydol oes, allgáu cymdeithasol, datblygu cymunedol, adfywio a gwasanaethau i bobl ifanc, yn well. Hoffwn weld mwy o sylw yn cael ei roi i rôl bosibl ysgolion yn eu cymunedau lleol, yn arbennig o ran darparu



role of schools in their local communities, particularly with regard to the provision of lifelong learning and community regeneration. The possibilities in this area are huge, especially in the communities that would benefit from an extra impetus to drive forward the Communities First agenda. These may be communities where adult literacy and numeracy standards are low, where adults were not given such chances when they were at school and where lifelong learning and re-skilling is an economic and social imperative.

5:00 p.m.

As the report suggests, this might also be a means of strengthening schools that are seen as unpopular and, therefore, providing an extra incentive for parents to send their children to these local schools. I would like to see more support being given to schools that wish to diversify in this way. They can become not only Monday to Friday daytime and term-time centres for learning, but resource centres for community education and involvement, operating to serve the needs of the community as a whole. I commend Pencoed Comprehensive School in my constituency, which is embarking on this route. Such initiatives are linked in with 'Communities First', funding from the Lottery and Objective 1, which could prove cost-effective as well as socially responsible.

I ask the Minister to consider the possibilities offered in this area, and to support local education authorities that want to pursue such innovative solutions. If we are to be an Assembly that puts social inclusion and lifelong learning at the heart of its work, we must encourage LEAs, when looking at organisational plans and asset management, to seriously consider in a holistic and cross-cutting manner the assets and potential that exist in their schools and communities.

**Gareth Jones:** Croesawaf yr adroddiad. Gwnaf ychydig o sylwadau ar destun sydd—fel sydd yn amlwg o'r hyn a ddywedodd siaradwyr blaenorol—yn amlochrog a

dysgu gydol oes ac adfywio cymunedol. Mae'r posibilïadau yn y maes hwn yn enfawr, yn arbennig yn y cymunedau a fyddai'n elwa ar ysgogiad ychwanegol i ddatblygu agenda Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf. Gallai'r rhain fod yn gymunedau lle mae safonau llythrennedd a rhifedd ymhlith oedolion yn isel, lle na roddwyd y fath gyfleoedd i oedolion pan oeddent yn yr ysgol a lle y mae dysgu gydol oes a dysgu sgiliau newydd yn hanfod economaidd a chymdeithasol.

Fel yr awgryma'r adroddiad, gallai hyn hefyd fod yn fodd i atgyfnerthu ysgolion a ystyrir yn amhoblogaidd a, thrwy hynny, ddarparu cymhelliant ychwanegol i rieni anfon eu plant i'r ysgolion lleol hyn. Hoffwn weld mwy o gefnogaeth yn cael ei rhoi i ysgolion sydd am arallgyfeirio yn y modd hwn. Yn hytrach na chanolfannau dysgu yn ystod y dydd ac yn ystod y tymor o ddydd Llun i ddydd Gwener, gallant ddod yn ganolfannau adnoddau ar gyfer addysg a chyfranogiad cymunedol, gan weithredu i wasanaethu anghenion y gymuned gyfan. Cymeradwyaf Ysgol Gyfun Pencoed yn fy etholaeth, sydd yn dilyn y trywydd hwn. Mae mentrau o'r fath wedi'u cysylltu â 'Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf', arian y Loteri ac Amcan 1, a allai fod yn gost-effeithiol yn ogystal ag yn gymdeithasol gyfrifol.

Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ystyried y posibilïadau a gynigir yn y maes hwn, ac i gefnogi awdurdodau addysg lleol sydd am fynd ar drywydd atebion arloesol o'r fath. Os ydym am fod yn Gynulliad sydd yn rhoi cynhwysedd cymdeithasol a dysgu gydol oes wrth wraidd ei waith, rhaid inni annog AALL, wrth iddynt ystyried cynlluniau trefniannol a rheoli asedau, i roi ystyriaeth ddifrifol, mewn ffordd gyfannol a thrawsbynciol, i'r asedau a'r potensial sydd yn eu hysgolion a'u cymunedau.

**Gareth Jones:** I welcome the report. I will make a few comments on a topic that is—as is evident from what previous speakers said—multilateral and complex.

chymhleth.

Yn y gorffennol, bu gormod o bwylais ar broblem lleoedd gwag mewn ysgolion, ac yr ydym wedi canolbwyntio ar hynny. Am tua 15 mlynedd, o ganol yr 1980au ymlaen, bu rhagdybiaeth o blaid cau ysgolion bach yn hytrach na chwilio am atebion blaengar a chreadigol er mwyn manteisio ar eu potensial.

Heddiw, y flaenoriaeth yw canolbwyntio ein hymdrechion ar ddarparu addysg o ansawdd uchel i gwrdd ag anghenion plant yng Nghymru. Mae digon o dystiolaeth sydd yn awgrymu mai ysgolion bach cymunedol sydd orau yn aml, yn enwedig i blant yn eu blynyddoedd cynnar. O ran safonau addysgiadol, mae arolygon a chanlyniadau yn dangos bod ysgolion bach o leiaf gystal ag ysgolion mawr, ac yn well o lawer mewn nifer fawr o achosion. Mae hynny'n wir am y sectorau cynradd ac uwchradd.

Elfen bwysig arall yw agosrwydd at y cartref. Mae hyn yn allweddol i addysg ofal o ansawdd uchel. Fodd bynnag, mae angen ystyried hefyd anghenion ehangach yn ein cymunedau gwledig. Yr wyf yn falch o weld bod yr adroddiad hwn yn cefnogi'r argymhellion a wnaethpwyd gan y bartneriaeth wledig ddwy flynedd yn ôl, a nododd y dylai polisiâu addysg gydnabod gwerth ysgolion gwledig i'w cymunedau a phwysigrwydd safonau, nid niferoedd disgyblion yn unig.

Yn y cyd-destun hwn, rhaid inni bwysio a mesur yr hyn y mae'r Comisiwn Archwilio yn ei ddweud. Mae'r comisiwn yn astudio ffigurau, cyfrifon, canrannau ac ati. A yw ei waith, a'i ddehongliadau a'i gasgliadau, yn seiliedig ar egwyddorion pwysig y Cynulliad, megis cyfle cyfartal, datblygu cynaliadwy a chynhwysedd cymdeithasol? Ai hynny sydd yn gyrru ei waith ymlaen? A yw'n ystyried yr elfennau ac egwyddorion pwysig hynny?

Mae'r adroddiad hefyd yn nodi y dylid sicrhau darpariaeth addas ac amrywiol ar gyfer pobl ifanc, a lefelau addas o addysg i oedolion, defnydd o adeiladau ysgolion gan y

In the past, there has been too much emphasis on the problem of surplus places in schools, and we have concentrated on that problem. For some 15 years, from the mid 1980s onwards, there has been a presumption in favour of closing small schools rather than searching for innovative and creative solutions in order to take advantage of their potential.

Today, the priority is concentrating our efforts on providing high quality education to meet the needs of children in Wales. There is plenty of evidence to suggest that small community schools are often the most beneficial for children, especially during their early years. In terms of educational standards, surveys and results show that small schools are at least as good as larger schools, and much better in many cases. That is true of the primary and secondary sectors.

Another important aspect is proximity to the home. That is crucial to high quality caring education. However, we must also consider broader needs in our rural communities. I am pleased to see that this report supports the recommendations made by the rural partnership two years ago, which noted that education policies should acknowledge the value of rural schools to their communities and the importance of standards, not only pupil numbers.

In this context, we must weigh up what the Audit Commission says. The commission studies figures, accounts, percentages and so on. Is its work, and its interpretations and findings, based on the Assembly's important principles, such as equality of opportunity, sustainable development and social inclusion? Is that what drives its work forward? Does it consider those important elements and principles?

The report also notes that we should ensure suitable and varied provision for young people, and suitable levels of education for adults, community use of school buildings,

gymuned, cysylltiadau gyda gwasanaethau cyhoeddus eraill a datblygiad a defnydd o dechnoleg gwybodaeth. Mae'r rheini oll yn elfennau pwysig.

I gloi, sut y mae'r adroddiad hwn yn cyfrannu at nod y Llywodraeth o lunio strategaeth? Derbyniaf fod gwahaniaeth mawr rhwng strategaeth a pholisi. Y nod yw strategaeth ar gyfer ysgolion bach gwledig, yn enwedig o gofio bod Lloegr eisoes wedi buddsoddi £80 miliwn ar gyfer gwarchod bodolaeth ysgolion o'r math hwn. A fydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn llunio polisi dychmygus a blaengar fydd yn manteisio ar fodolaeth yr ysgolion bach hyn ac yn sicrhau eu dyfodol?

**Ann Jones:** Like others Members, I welcome the report. There is a need to ensure that the provision of places is efficiently planned. I see little point in tying up resources in maintaining surplus capacities in areas where pupil numbers are falling while other schools within the same LEA are condemned to endure larger classes simply because there are no spare classrooms to accommodate the splitting of a class. The report is also right to highlight the problems that we face in calculating and collecting information on school capacity across Wales. It is also right to recognise the demographic projections used to calculate the demand for places. Demand will differ between Cefn Meiriadog and Cardiff, or Rhyl and Roath. We must recognise that rurality is a factor, but it cannot be the only factor. We cannot use rurality as an excuse to pump additional resources into some schools when we leave other schools crying out for more capacity and better facilities. We must also recognise that in my LEA, Denbighshire, there will always be a need to maintain some small schools where the travel distances involved in merging schools are too far to contemplate for children. We must also recognise the many needs of primary schools in Prestatyn and Rhyl, for example, which may have to cope with four reception classes in future. We must ensure that we can provide additional resources to schools in severely deprived areas. Those schools need the greater resources if they are to have any real

links with other public services and the development and use of information technology. Those are all important elements.

In conclusion, how does this report contribute to the Government's aim of formulating a strategy? I accept that there is a great difference between strategy and policy. The aim is to formulate a strategy for small rural schools, particularly bearing in mind that England has already invested £80 million to safeguard the existence of such schools. Will the Government of Wales formulate an imaginative and progressive policy that will take advantage of the existence of these small schools and ensure their future?

**Ann Jones:** Fel Aelodau eraill, croesawaf yr adroddiad. Mae angen sicrhau y cynllunnir darpariaeth lleoedd yn effeithlon. Ni welaf lawer o bwynt clymu adnoddau wrth gynnal lleoedd gwag mewn ardaloedd lle mae nifer y disgyblion yn gostwng tra y caiff ysgolion eraill o fewn yr un AALl eu condemnio i ddiodef dosbarthiadau mwy am nad oes unrhyw ystafelloedd dosbarth gwag i allu rhannu dosbarth. Mae'n briodol hefyd bod yr adroddiad yn amlygu'r problemau a wynebwn wrth gyfrifo a chasglu gwybodaeth ar leoedd ysgol ledled Cymru. Mae'n briodol hefyd ei fod yn cydnabod y rhagolygon demograffig a ddefnyddiwyd i gyfrifo'r galw am leoedd. Bydd gwahaniaeth yn y galw rhwng Cefn Meiriadog a Chaerdydd, neu'r Rhyl a'r Rhath. Rhaid inni gydnabod bod gwledigrwydd yn ffactor, ond ni all fod yr unig ffactor. Ni allwn ddefnyddio gwledigrwydd fel esgus i ddyrannu adnoddau ychwanegol i rai ysgolion tra'n gadael ysgolion eraill yn ymbilio am fwy o le a gwell cyfleusterau. Rhaid inni hefyd gydnabod yn fy AALl i, sef Sir Ddinbych, y bydd angen parhaol i gadw rhywfaint o ysgolion bach lle mae'r pellterau teithio a fyddai'n berthnasol wrth uno ysgolion yn rhy bell i'w hystyried i blant. Rhaid inni hefyd gydnabod anghenion niferus ysgolion cynradd ym Mhrestatyn a'r Rhyl, er enghraifft, y gallai fod yn rhaid iddynt ymdopi â phedwar dosbarth derbyn yn y dyfodol. Rhaid inni sicrhau y gallwn ddarparu adnoddau ychwanegol i ysgolion

hope of overcoming the challenges faced by children from disadvantaged backgrounds.

If we are genuinely committed to equality of opportunity in our schools, we must be robust in focusing our resources on areas of poverty and disadvantage rather than maintaining historic patterns of expenditure on schools that can no longer continue to fulfil their roles. We must start putting our money where the need is greatest in Wales.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Croesawaf y drafodaeth hon. Mae'n bwnc hynod o bwysig oherwydd ein bod yn ymwneud â'r angen i edrych yn greadigol ar yr adnoddau sydd gennym i gynnig addysg i'n plant, yn ogystal ag addysg gydol oes i holl aelodau ein cymunedau. Felly, mae'n bwysig nad ydym yn ystyried y gwerth gorau am arian yn unig ond ein bod yn edrych ar fuddsoddiad mewn system addysg a fydd yn cynnig y cyfleoedd gorau i bawb. Yn hynny o beth, croesawaf y ffaith fod yr adroddiad yn derbyn nad lleoedd gwag a ddylai fod yr unig ddangosydd ar gyfer penderfynu ar argymhellion rhesymoli yn y gwasanaeth. Mae'n amlwg bod angen inni ystyried yr effaith ar y gymuned, cynaliadwyedd, hawl rhieni i ddewis a lleoliadau daearyddol. Mae'r pethau hynny i gyd yn bwysig, ond mae un peth sydd yn bwysicach, sef ein bod yn cynnig yr addysg orau, yn benodol i'n plant, ond hefyd i aelodau eraill o'n cymunedau.

Felly, mae'n rhaid inni edrych yn greadigol ar y sefyllfa hon, gan ystyried dulliau amgen o ddefnyddio'r adnoddau hyn. Cyfeiriaf at enghraifft y bydd Cynog Dafis yn gyfarwydd â hi, sef y sefyllfa a gododd yn ysgolion cymunedol Capel Dewi, Llandysul, Pont-siân a Thre-groes, lle gwnânt ddefnydd o'r dechnoleg ddiweddaraf er mwyn meithrin cydweithio agosach rhwng clwstwr o ysgolion. Mae hynny'n opsiwn i ddiogelu ysgolion bach gwledig drwy eu galluogi i fod mewn cysylltiad agosach â'i gilydd a gwneud gwell defnydd o'r adnoddau sydd ar gael.

mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig iawn. Mae angen mwy o adnoddau ar yr ysgolion hynny os ydym am iddynt gael unrhyw obaith wrth oresgyn yr heriau a wynebir gan blant o gefndiroedd difreintiedig.

Os ydym yn wirioneddol ymrwymedig i gyfle cyfartal yn ein hysgolion, rhaid inni fod yn gadarn wrth ganolbwyntio ein hadnoddau ar ardaloedd o dlodi ac anfantais yn hytrach na chynnal y patrymau hanesyddol o wariant ar ysgolion na allant bellach barhau i gyflawni eu swyddogaethau. Rhaid inni ddechrau cyfeirio ein harian i'r ardaloedd o angen mwyaf yng Nghymru.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I welcome this discussion. It is an extremely important topic because we are concerned with the need to look creatively at the resources that we have to offer education to our children, as well as lifelong learning to all members of our communities. It is, therefore, important that we do not only consider the best value for money but that we consider investment in an education system that will offer the best opportunities to everyone. In this regard, I welcome the fact that the report accepts that empty places should not be the only indicator for deciding on recommendations to rationalise the service. It is evident that we need to consider the effect on the community, sustainability, the right of parents to choose and geographical locations. Those things are all important, but there is one thing that is more important, namely that we offer the best education, specifically to our children, but also to other members of our communities.

Therefore, we need to look creatively at this situation, considering alternative methods of using these resources. I refer to an example with which Cynog Dafis will be familiar, namely the situation that has arisen in the community schools of Capel Dewi, Llandysul, Pontsiân and Tregroes, where they are making use of the latest technology to foster closer co-operation between a cluster of schools. That is an option to safeguard our small rural schools by enabling them to be in closer contact with each other and make better use of the resources

Cyfeiriaf hefyd at arbrawf yn fy etholaeth, Dwyrain Caerfyrddin a Dinefwr, lle ceir bwriad i gau tair ysgol yng Nghwm Aman a chreu ysgol gymunedol a fydd hefyd yn ganolfan gymunedol. Bydd yn cynnig addysg gydol oes ac fe fydd yn ganolfan y dechnoleg ddiweddaraf i'r cwm hwnnw. Bydd cau'r ysgolion hynny yn golygu cau ysgolion lle mae'r adnoddau yn brin, lle mae gormod o blant ar gyfer y lle sydd ar gael, lle mae o leiaf un ysgol yn dioddef pla o lygod mawr, a chynnig adnoddau addysg gydol oes llawer gwell ar gyfer cwm cyfan.

5:10 p.m.

Felly, yr hyn yr wyf yn ei annog a'i bwysleisio yw'r angen i edrych yn greadigol ac i gynllunio, nid ar gyfer ddoe—ac mae perygl weithiau dan bwysau cymunedol inni feddwl am anghenion ddoe yn ein cynllunio—ond ar gyfer heddiw ac anghenion y presennol. Dylai o leiaf un llygad edrych tuag at y dyfodol fel y gallwn ddarparu strategaeth a fydd yn sicrhau'r addysg orau i'n plant, ac a fydd yn rhoi cyfle i oedolion gael addysg gydol oes, a gwireddu'r dyhead hwnnw yn ein cymunedau.

**Eleanor Burnham:** The Audit Commission conducted a study called 'Trading Places' in December 1996, which found that there was no consensus on what is an appropriate number of unfulfilled places. It suggested that LEAs should aim for school occupancy rates of between 85 per cent and 105 per cent. It also noted that there was no agreed minimum feasible size for a school or sixth form, and that 14 per cent of Welsh schools had fewer than 50 pupils.

Notwithstanding that, the Liberal Democrats welcome this review. We must ensure that we make the best use of the resources spent on education to provide the best for our children and our communities. We all believe that good quality education is vital for our children and we are all concerned that the funding given for education is used in the most effective manner. There is a clear balance between minimising the number of

available. I also refer to an experiment in my constituency, Carmarthen East and Dinefwr, where it is intended to close three schools in the Amman Valley and create a community school that will also be a community centre. It will offer lifelong learning and it will be a centre for the latest technology for that valley. Closing those schools will entail closing schools where resources are scarce, where there are too many children for the places available, where at least one school is suffering a plague of rats, and offer far better lifelong education resources for a whole valley.

Therefore, what I am encouraging and emphasising is the need to look creatively and to plan, not for yesterday—and there is a danger occasionally under community pressure for us to consider yesterday's needs in our planning—but for today and our current needs. At least one eye should look to the future so that we can provide a strategy that will ensure the best education for our children, and that will give adults the opportunity of lifelong learning, and realise that desire in our communities.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Cynhaliodd y Comisiwn Archwilio astudiaeth o'r enw 'Trading Places' yn Rhagfyr 1996, a ganfu nad oedd unrhyw gytundeb o ran nifer briodol o leoedd gwag. Awgrymodd y dylai AALl anelu at gael cyfraddau defnydd o rhwng 85 y cant a 105 y cant yn eu hysgolion. Nododd hefyd nad oedd unrhyw isafswm maint ymarferol cytûn ar gyfer ysgol neu chweched dosbarth, a bod gan 14 y cant o ysgolion Cymru lai na 50 o ddisgyblion.

Serch hynny, mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn croesawu'r adolygiad hwn. Rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn gwneud y defnydd gorau o'r adnoddau a werir ar addysg i ddarparu'r gorau i'n plant a'n cymunedau. Credwn oll fod addysg o ansawdd uchel yn hanfodol i'n plant ac yr ydym oll am weld yr arian a ddyrennir i addysg yn cael ei ddefnyddio yn y ffordd fwyaf effeithiol. Mae cydbwysedd clir rhwng

surplus spaces and keeping local schools open and being run effectively. It is, therefore, helpful for LEAs to have improved guidance to help in this planning, and the recommendation for the Minister to draw up revised guidance is welcomed.

Improved guidance should also ensure that a more consistent approach is taken to the supply of school places across Wales. The consultation conducted in drawing up this report, and the findings of the previous report by the Audit Commission in 1996, have clearly demonstrated that not all LEAs are tackling the issues as rigorously as others. There is, therefore, scope for the Assembly to take more of a lead on this to ensure that a more consistent approach is adopted across Wales. We must also be mindful of ensuring that any guidance produced gives the appropriate level of flexibility to LEAs. There can be significant variations from one year to the next in the number of pupils to be catered for in a particular locality, particularly when taking into account the fluctuations in demand for Welsh medium, denominational or single sex education. We need to be careful to ensure that the appropriate level of flexibility is built in to any guidelines so that the right balance can be achieved between using resources effectively and having the scope to deal with year on year changes in demand.

Small and rural schools are also dear to the hearts of Liberal Democrats. These were frequently mentioned during the consultation exercise carried out in compiling this report. It is important that any guidance produced takes into account the special circumstances of such schools. We must be careful about how we approach the rationalisation of school places in rural areas, perhaps more so than in non-rural areas. We must ensure, for instance, that there is sufficient flexibility to take into account the impact that closing a school may have on the local community. We must also take into account the significant distances that may exist between schools, which could mean pupils being displaced a significant distance if the school was to shut. In addition, we need to consider the wider role, already mentioned by several other

lleihau nifer y lleoedd gwag a chadw ysgolion lleol ar agor a'u rhedeg yn effeithiol. Felly, byddai'n ddefnyddiol rhoi gwell canllawiau i AALI o ran y gwaith cynllunio hwn, a chroesewir yr argymhelliad i'r Gweinidog lunio canllawiau diwygiedig.

Dylai canllawiau gwell hefyd sicrhau y dilynir ymagwedd fwy cyson tuag at gyflenwi lleoedd mewn ysgolion ledled Cymru. Dangosodd yr ymgynghoriad a gynhaliwyd wrth lunio'r adroddiad hwn, a chanfyddiadau'r adroddiad blaenorol gan y Comisiwn Archwilio yn 1996, yn amlwg nad yw pob AALI yn mynd i'r afael â'r materion mor drylwyr â'i gilydd. Felly, mae cyfle i'r Cynulliad gymryd rôl fwy arweiniol yn hyn o beth er mwyn sicrhau y mabwysiedir ymagwedd fwy cyson ledled Cymru. Rhaid inni hefyd fod yn wylidwrus wrth sicrhau bod unrhyw ganllawiau a gynhyrchir yn rhoi lefel briodol o hyblygrwydd i AALI. Gall fod amrywiadau sylweddol o un flwyddyn i'r llall o ran nifer y disgyblion i ddarparu ar eu cyfer mewn ardal benodol, yn arbennig o ystyried yr amrywiadau o ran galw am addysg Gymraeg, enwadol neu un rhyw. Mae angen inni fod yn ofalus wrth sicrhau y caiff y lefel briodol o hyblygrwydd ei chynnwys o fewn unrhyw ganllawiau er mwyn cael y cydbwysedd cywir rhwng defnyddio adnoddau yn effeithiol a bod â'r gallu i ddelio â newidiadau blynyddol o ran galw.

Mae ysgolion bach a gwledig hefyd yn agos at galonnau'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Fe'u crybwyllwyd yn aml yn ystod yr ymarfer ymgynghori a gynhaliwyd wrth lunio'r adroddiad hwn. Mae'n bwysig bod unrhyw ganllawiau a gynhyrchir yn ystyried amgylchiadau arbennig ysgolion o'r fath. Rhaid inni fod yn ofalus o ran ein hymagwedd tuag at resymoli lleoedd ysgol mewn ardaloedd gwledig, efallai'n fwy na mewn ardaloedd trefol. Rhaid inni sicrhau, er enghraifft, bod digon o hyblygrwydd i ystyried yr effaith y gallai cau ysgol ei chael ar y gymuned leol. Rhaid inni hefyd ystyried y pellterau sylweddol a all fod rhwng ysgolion, a allai olygu y byddai'n rhaid i ddisgyblion deithio cryn bellter pe caewyd yr ysgol. Yn ogystal, mae angen inni ystyried y rôl ehangach, a grybwyllwyd eisoes gan sawl

speakers, that schools often have in rural communities in particular, where they may also provide a key community facility.

It is, therefore, important that we do not produce a policy on the supply of school places in isolation, but do so in conjunction with the rural schools policy that we have committed to in the partnership agreement. In drawing up any guidance as recommended in this report, the Minister should give due regard for the need in rural areas to encourage federation, or clustering, of schools, as well as IT networking and other methods that will ensure the continued viability of small schools in those areas. The report has identified that there is often a problem in providing a high quality education across the curriculum in particularly small schools, such as those with just two or three teachers. The challenge is, therefore, to find a way to overcome these problems, while recognising that it will not be feasible or desirable to close or merge such small schools. Mechanisms such as clustering, which has already been mentioned, could provide a way forward in such cases. It is therefore important that these issues are considered in conjunction with any measures that may be brought forward as a result of this report.

In conclusion, this report is welcome as a key contribution to developing a more robust and consistent policy on the supply of school places, which will hopefully result in a more effective use of resources and, therefore, a better quality of education overall for our children. The recommendations for improved guidance are welcome. However, these cannot be drawn up in isolation. They must consider the administration's commitment to supporting small and rural schools.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I will concentrate on one point, as we are running short of time. I welcome the report. This issue must be tackled, as I believe that there are around 70,000 surplus places in Wales. That is a rather large number. My main concern is surplus places in some schools that are perceived to be unpopular. I disagree with

llefarydd arall, sydd gan ysgolion yn aml mewn cymunedau gwledig yn benodol, lle y gallent hefyd ddarparu cyfleuster cymunedol allweddol.

Felly, mae'n bwysig na chynhyrchwn bolisi ar gyflenwi lleoedd ysgol ar ei ben ei hun, ond y gwnawn hynny mewn cydweithrediad â'r polisi ysgolion gwledig yr ymrwymwyd iddo yn y cytundeb partneriaeth. Wrth lunio unrhyw ganllawiau fel yr argymhellwyd yn yr adroddiad hwn, dylai'r Gweinidog roi ystyriaeth briodol i'r angen mewn ardaloedd gwledig i annog uno, neu glystyru, ysgolion, yn ogystal â rhwydweithio TG a dulliau eraill a fydd yn sicrhau ymarferoldeb parhaus ysgolion bach yn yr ardaloedd hynny. Mae'r adroddiad wedi nodi bod problem yn aml wrth ddarparu addysg o ansawdd uchel ar draws y cwricwlwm mewn ysgolion arbennig o fach, megis y rheini lle ceir dau neu dri athro yn unig. Felly, yr her yw dod o hyd i ffyrdd o oresgyn y problemau hyn, tra'n cydnabod na fydd yn ymarferol nac yn ddymunol cau neu uno ysgolion bach o'r fath. Gallai dulliau fel clystyru, a grybwyllwyd eisoes, ddarparu ffordd ymlaen mewn achosion o'r fath. Felly mae'n bwysig ystyried y materion hyn ar y cyd ag unrhyw fesurau y gellid eu cyflwyno o ganlyniad i'r adroddiad hwn.

I gloi, croesewir yr adroddiad hwn fel cyfraniad allweddol i'r gwaith o ddatblygu polisi mwy cadarn a chyson ar gyflenwi lleoedd ysgol, a fydd, gobeithio, yn arwain at ddefnydd mwy effeithiol o adnoddau ac, felly, ansawdd addysg cyffredinol well i'n plant. Croesewir yr argymhellion ar gyfer gwell canllawiau. Fodd bynnag, ni ellir eu llunio ar eu pennau eu hunain. Rhaid iddynt ystyried ymrwymiad y weinyddiaeth i gefnogi ysgolion bach a gwledig.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Canolbwyntiaf ar un pwynt, gan ein bod yn brin o amser. Croesawaf yr adroddiad. Rhaid mynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn, gan y credaf fod tua 70,000 o leoedd gwag yng Nghymru. Mae hwnnw'n nifer cymharol fawr. Fy mhrif bryder yw lleoedd gwag mewn rhai ysgolion yr ystyrir eu bod yn amhoblogaidd.

Jonathan Morgan; I see this problem from the other side. There is a primary school in my constituency that has a state of the art, modern building, magnificent teaching staff and a wonderful headteacher. Yet, it is under threat. Many families who live in the catchment area, including some who live two minutes away from the school, choose to drive their children every day to schools some miles away because they do not believe that this particular school is the kind of school that they want their children to attend. That is sad, as it is a false perception of the school. A good social mix is healthy for the school. Action must be taken on catchment areas, or numbers limited in some instances, in order to save particular schools. That happened in the 1980s, as I have previously mentioned. In the early 1980s, Stanwell school was a failing, unpopular school that was under threat. At the time, the Labour-led authority in South Glamorgan decided to enforce the catchment area, which saved the school. Look what Stanwell school has achieved since then. Hard decisions must be made and we must tackle this issue, although it that will not be easy.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** Like Cynog, I am grateful to the Committee for its work on this issue. I particularly emphasise the point made by Rhodri Glyn Thomas on having access to high quality education. That must be fundamental in terms of the delivery of the education system in Wales.

It is clear from the study that the effective management of the supply of school places is not easy or straightforward. In many parts of Wales, we have a pattern of schools that matches the demands of the nineteenth century, not those of the twenty-first century. In some areas, there are schools that are badly overcrowded while, in other areas, schools are half empty. Many school buildings are in a poor condition and do not offer the facilities that teachers need to deliver the national curriculum and the facilities that pupils deserve. As Lorraine

Anghytunaf â Jonathan Morgan; gwelaf y broblem hon o'r ochr arall. Mae ysgol gynradd yn fy etholaeth sydd wedi'i lleoli mewn adeilad modern, technolegol, gyda staff addysgu rhagorol a phennaeth ardderchog. Serch hynny, mae o dan fygythiad. Mae llawer o deuluoedd sydd yn byw yn y dalgylch, gan gynnwys rhai sydd yn byw ddwy funud o'r ysgol, yn dewis gyrru eu plant bob dydd i ysgolion rai milltiroedd i ffwrdd gan nad ydynt o'r farn bod yr ysgol arbennig hon yn cyfateb â'r math o ysgol yr hoffent i'w plant ei mynychu. Mae hynny'n drist, gan ei fod yn amgyffrediad ffug o'r ysgol. Mae cymysgedd cymdeithasol da yn iach i'r ysgol. Rhaid gweithredu ar ddalgylchoedd, neu gyfyngu ar niferoedd mewn rhai achosion, er mwyn achub ysgolion penodol. Digwyddodd hynny yn yr 1980au, fel y crybwyllais yn gynharach. Ar ddechrau'r 1980au, yr oedd ysgol Stanwell yn ysgol amhoblogaidd a oedd yn methu ac yr oedd o dan fygythiad. Bryd hynny, penderfynodd yr awdurdod Llafur yn Ne Morgannwg orfodi'r dalgylch, ac achubwyd yr ysgol. Edrychwch ar yr hyn a gyflawnwyd ers hynny gan ysgol Stanwell. Rhaid gwneud penderfyniadau anodd a rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn, er na fydd hynny'n hawdd.

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Fel Cynog, yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Pwyllgor am ei waith ar y mater hwn. Pwysleisiaf yn arbennig y pwynt a wnaed gan Rhodri Glyn Thomas o ran cael mynediad i addysg o ansawdd uchel. Rhaid i hynny fod yn hanfodol yn nhermau cyflwyno'r system addysg yng Nghymru.

Mae'n amlwg o'r astudiaeth nad yw rheoli'r cyflenwad o leoedd ysgol yn effeithiol yn hawdd nac yn syml. Mewn sawl rhan o Gymru, mae gennym batrwm o ysgolion sydd yn cyfateb â gofynion y bedwaredd ganrif ar bymtheg, nid gofynion yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Mewn rhai ardaloedd, ceir ysgolion gyda llawer gormod o ddisgyblion ond mewn ardaloedd eraill mae'r ysgolion yn hanner gwag. Mae llawer o adeiladau ysgolion mewn cyflwr gwael ac nid ydynt yn cynnig y cyfleusterau sydd eu hangen ar athrawon i gyflwyno'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol a'r



said, there is surplus capacity of about 13 per cent in schools in Wales. The figure is almost 70,000, consisting of 26,000 spare places in secondary schools and 42,000 spare places in primary schools. If we play the numbers game, it is clear that we must address this problem. If we use the Audit Commission's rule of thumb, the figure represents £16 million a year that could be better spent on other areas of education.

We also have a particularly large number of small schools in Wales. Thirty three per cent of our primary schools have less than 100 pupils, compared to 15 per cent in England. Fourteen per cent of our schools have less than 50 pupils, compared to 4 per cent in England. That is why this is not just a financial issue, and why we must also consider important issues regarding our communities.

I am happy to accept the report's three specific recommendations, although there will be some amendments to the order of working and timing. We need the Audit Commission to conduct a further survey to give us an all-Wales picture. However, we must also take action on some of the issues that the District Audit has already identified from its initial survey of the 10 authorities, otherwise we will just get the same information again. I therefore propose that we do that first.

The initial survey found that only some local education authorities were actively addressing the issues of surplus places and overcrowding by reviewing their schools in relation to the geographical areas that they serve and developing a programme to rationalise provision in the best interests of the school population. This is not good enough. All authorities need to build on the good practice that is identified in the survey report.

5:20 p.m.

A key issue is the validation of school capacity figures. If authorities are to address the issue of surplus places, they need a robust

cyfleusterau y mae disgyblion yn eu haeddu. Fel y dywedodd Lorraine, mae tua 13 y cant o leoedd gwag mewn ysgolion yng Nghymru. Mae'r ffigur tua 70,000, sydd yn cynnwys 26,000 o leoedd gwag mewn ysgolion uwchradd a 42,000 o leoedd gwag mewn ysgolion cynradd. Os ystyriwn y niferoedd, mae'n amlwg bod yn rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon. Os awn yn ôl rheolau'r Comisiwn Archwilio, mae'r ffigwr yn cynrychioli £16 miliwn y flwyddyn y gellid ei wario'n well ar feysydd addysg eraill.

Hefyd, mae gennym nifer arbennig o uchel o ysgolion bach yng Nghymru. Mae gan 30 y cant o'n hysgolion cynradd lai na 100 o ddisgyblion, o'i gymharu â 15 y cant o ysgolion yn Lloegr. Mae gan 14 y cant o'n hysgolion lai na 50 o ddisgyblion, o'i gymharu â 4 y cant yn Lloegr. Dyna pam nad yw hwn ond yn fater ariannol, a pham ei bod yn rhaid inni hefyd ystyried materion pwysig o ran ein cymunedau ein hunain.

Yr wyf yn fwy na pharod i dderbyn y tri argymhelliad penodol o fewn yr adroddiad, er y bydd rhai gwelliannau o ran eu gweithredu a'u hamseru. Mae angen i'r Comisiwn Archwilio gynnal arolwg pellach er mwyn rhoi darlun o Gymru gyfan inni. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni hefyd weithredu ar rai o'r materion a nodwyd eisoes gan yr Archwiliad Dosbarth yn ei arolwg cychwynnol o'r 10 awdurdod, fel arall datgelir yr un wybodaeth eto. Felly cynigiau fydd dylid gwneud hynny yn gyntaf.

Canfu'r arolwg cychwynnol mai dim ond rhai o'r awdurdodau addysg lleol a oedd wrthi'n mynd i'r afael â'r broblem o leoedd gwag a gormod o ddisgyblion drwy adolygu eu hysgolion mewn perthynas â'r ardaloedd daearyddol a wasanaethir ganddynt a datblygu rhaglen i resymoli'r ddarpariaeth er budd y disgyblion. Nid yw hyn yn ddigon da. Mae angen i bob awdurdod adeiladu ar yr arfer da a nodir o fewn adroddiad yr arolwg.

Mae dilysu'r ffigurau ar gyfer lleoedd mewn ysgolion yn fater allweddol. Os ydym am i awdurdodau ymdrin â'r broblem o ran

and systematic approach to measuring school capacity. As the Chair said, a number of LEAs have told us that the existing methodology is inappropriate. It does not give a true picture of available teaching space. Therefore, we must investigate the problems and put them right. I have asked my officials to consult LEAs on how the methodology can be improved and applied consistently throughout Wales.

**Gareth Jones** *rose*—

**Jane Davidson:** I can only take an intervention, if I am allowed extra time to finish my speech.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** You can have an extra minute, which makes eight minutes in total.

**Gareth Jones:** Hoffwn ofyn cwestiwn ar fater pwysig. Yr ydych yn cyfeirio, fel gwnawn i gyd, at roi cyfrifoldeb i'r awdurdod addysg lleol i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon. Purion. Fodd bynnag, sut y gallwn ddisgwyl iddo wneud hynny pan, ar y llaw arall, y gall ysgolion unigol wrthod neu dderbyn disgyblion? Yr ydych yn disgwyl i'r awdurdod ddatrys problem y mae'r ysgolion unigol yn ei chreu, oherwydd bod ganddynt y cyfrifoldeb a'r hawl i wneud hynny.

**Jane Davidson:** Your colleague, Rhodri Glyn Thomas, gave one of the best speeches that I have heard in this kind of Assembly debate. He talked about working with the schools and the LEA to consider how these important issues are addressed to ensure that every child receives the best possible education.

I want to return to the important issue of the validation of school capacity figures, because there may be some additional costs involved in re-measuring schools. I am happy to consider how those might be met, once the revised capacity assessment method has been agreed. I hope that we can do this quickly and put something new into operation by 2003. Reliable data on the capacity of their

lleoedd gwag, mae angen ymagwedd gadarn a systemataidd arnynt tuag at fesur lleoedd mewn ysgolion. Fel y dywedodd y Cadeirydd, mae nifer o AALl wedi dweud wrthym nad yw'r fethodoleg bresennol yn briodol. Nid yw'n rhoi darlun gwir o'r lleoedd addysgu sydd ar gael. Felly, rhaid inni ymchwilio i'r problemau a'u hunioni. Yr wyf wedi gofyn i'm swyddogion gysylltu ag AALl ynghylch sut y gellir gwella'r fethodoleg a'i chymhwyso'n gyson ledled Cymru.

**Gareth Jones** *a gododd*—

**Jane Davidson:** Gallaf ond gymryd ymyriad os y caniateir amser ychwanegol imi orffen fy araith.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Gallwch gael munud ychwanegol, a fydd yn gwneud cyfanswm o wyth munud.

**Gareth Jones:** I want to ask a question on an important issue. You refer, as we all do, to giving the local education authority responsibility to tackle this problem. Fine. However, how can we expect it to do that while, on the other hand, the individual schools can refuse or accept pupils? You expect the authority to solve a problem that individual schools create, because they have the responsibility and the right to do that.

**Jane Davidson:** Rhoddodd eich cyd-Aelod, Rhodri Glyn Thomas, un o'r areithiau gorau a glywais erioed yn y math hwn o ddatl yn y Cynulliad. Soniodd am weithio gyda'r ysgolion a'r AALl i ystyried sut yr ymdrinnir â'r materion pwysig hyn er mwyn sicrhau bod pob plentyn yn cael yr addysg orau bosibl.

Hoffwn ddychwelyd at y mater pwysig o ddilysu ffigurau lleoedd mewn ysgolion, oherwydd gallai hynny olygu rhywfaint o gostau ychwanegol wrth ailfesur ysgolion. Yr wyf yn fwy na pharod i ystyried sut y gellid eu talu, unwaith y cytunir ar y dull diwygiedig ar gyfer asesu lleoedd. Gobeithiaf y gallwn wneud hynny yn gyflym gan roi dull newydd ar waith erbyn 2003. Bydd data

schools will provide a firmer basis on which authorities can act strategically. I have asked my officials to write to LEAs in the next month, giving expanded guidance on the coverage and content of school organisational plans, because these are important for individual authorities to see the picture across Wales. I readily accept the recommendation that we should reconsider our guidance, and not simply on issues such as revised capacity assessment and school organisational plans. We need to consider new policy guidance.

As Eleanor said, we made the commitment to consider developing a rural schools' policy, with particular emphasis on encouraging innovative ways of delivering high quality education to pupils in rural areas. I indicated in responses to Members' questions that I would wait until the completion of this Committee report, before commencing that work. Policy for small and rural schools must be seen in the context of the issues raised in the report, such as matching school provision to demand, managing the stock of existing schools strategically, and considering how we can be innovative.

I am keen for authorities to begin to explore opportunities to develop schools as a community resource. Community use of school facilities for playgroups, after school and holiday clubs, adult education and training, and accessing IT can all provide a broader financial basis and encourage our big agenda on lifelong learning. Community uses outside the education sphere may also be an option, such as health facilities, libraries—particularly mobile library support in rural areas—advice centres, facilities for voluntary organisations and shared sport and leisure facilities. Such approaches can also help to secure the future of a school, anchor it in the local community and contribute to the social regeneration of an area.

I am excited by the work of Carmarthen LEA. It has been brave. There are many

dibynadwy ar y lleoedd yn eu hysgolion yn rhoi sylfaen fwy cadarn i awdurdodau weithredu'n strategol arni. Yr wyf wedi gofyn i'm swyddogion ysgrifennu at AALL yn ystod y mis nesaf, gan roi canllawiau estynedig ar gwmpas a chynnwys cynlluniau trefniannol ysgolion, gan eu bod yn bwysig er mwyn i awdurdodau unigol weld y darlun ledled Cymru. Derbyniaf yr argymhelliad y dylid ailystyried ein canllawiau, ac nid dim ond ar faterion megis dull diwygiedig o asesu lleoedd a chynlluniau trefniannol ysgolion. Mae angen inni ystyried canllawiau polisi newydd.

Fel y dywedodd Eleanor, gwnaethpwyd ymrwymiad gennym i ystyried datblygu polisi i ysgolion gwledig, gyda phwyslais penodol ar annog ffyrdd arloesol o gyflwyno addysg o ansawdd uchel i ddisgyblion mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Nodais mewn ymatebion i gwestiynau gan Aelodau y byddwn yn aros hyd nes i'r adroddiad hwn gan y Pwyllgor gael ei gwblhau, cyn dechrau ar y gwaith hwnnw. Rhaid i bolisi ar ysgolion bach a gwledig gael ei ystyried yng nghyd-destun y materion a godwyd yn yr adroddiad, megis cyfateb darpariaeth ysgolion â galw, rheoli'r stoc o ysgolion presennol yn strategol, ac ystyried sut y gallwn arloesi.

Yr wyf yn awyddus i awdurdodau ddechrau archwilio cyfleoedd i ddatblygu ysgolion fel adnodd cymunedol. Gall defnydd cymunedol o gyfleusterau ysgol i gylchoedd chwarae, clybiau ar ôl ysgol a chlybiau gwyliau, addysg a hyfforddiant i oedolion, a chael mynediad i TG oll ddarparu sail ariannol ehangach ac annog ein hagenda fawr ar ddysgu gydol oes. Gall defnydd cymunedol y tu allan i'r byd addysg hefyd fod yn opsiwn, megis cyfleusterau iechyd, llyfrgelloedd—yn arbennig cymorth llyfrgell symudol mewn ardaloedd gwledig—canolfannau cyngor, cyfleusterau i sefydliadau gwirfoddol a chyfleusterau chwaraeon a hamdden i'w rhannu. Gall ymagweddau o'r fath hefyd helpu i sicrhau dyfodol ysgol, ei hangori yn y gymuned leol a chyfrannu at adfywiad cymdeithasol ardal.

Yr wyf wedi fy nghyffroi gan waith AALL Caerfyrddin. Bu'n ddewr. Mae llawer o

small schools in the area, but it has the support of many parents and residents in its ambition for the provision of high quality education. However, I realise that some rural schools are too small for these kind of approaches to be feasible. Sometimes the community is not large enough to generate alternative uses of school accommodation. We need to consider how existing schools can combine forces, in informal collaboration, clustering or formal federation, where two or more schools combine into one organisational unit or continue to operate on existing sites. The benefits of these approaches are that schools can share resources and expertise and teachers can receive professional support, because we must consider that as well. In some villages, the school may be the only public building and the focus of village life. Therefore, community issues must always be given due weight in any consideration of a school's future. Ultimately, as Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, the educational interests of pupils and the sustainability of good quality education in the twenty-first century must be my prime concern.

5:10 p.m.

I will consider this report, along with the work of the Welsh Local Government Association's small schools taskforce. It will report to the Assembly in September and I will take its conclusions to the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee in October.

**Cynog Dafis:** Wrth ateb y ddadl, trafodaf rai o'r themâu a ddaeth i'r amlwg yn ystod y drafodaeth. Yn gyntaf, pwysleisiwyd y defnydd effeithlon o adnoddau a'r angen i fynd i'r afael â hynny, yn hytrach na'i osgoi. Cysylltwyd hyn gan Ann Jones a Janice Gregory gyda'r angen am adnoddau i wella safonau, sef yr ystyriaeth bwysicaf oll. Pwysleisiodd y Gweinidog hynny hefyd. Yn yr un modd, soniodd Lorraine Barrett y dylid mynd i'r afael â hyn, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai nifer o Aelodau eraill yn cytuno. Soniodd Rhodri Glyn Thomas, ac eraill, am osgoi cael ein clymu wrth batrymau'r gorffennol. Cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog at y ffaith fod nifer o ysgolion Cymru, i raddau

ysgolion bach yn yr ardal, ond mae llawer o rieni a thrigolion yn cefnogi ei uchelgais i ddarparu addysg o ansawdd uchel. Fodd bynnag, sylweddolaf fod rhai ysgolion gwledig yn rhy fach i'r mathau hyn o ymagweddau fod yn ymarferol. Weithiau nid yw'r gymuned yn ddigon mawr i adeiladau ysgolion gael eu defnyddio mewn ffyrdd amgen. Mae angen inni ystyried sut y gall ysgolion presennol gyfuno eu hymdrechion, drwy gydweithredu'n anffurfiol, clystyru neu uno'n ffurfiol, lle y bydd dwy ysgol neu fwy yn cyfuno i ffurfio un uned drefniannol neu'n parhau i weithredu ar safleoedd presennol. Buddiannau'r fath ymagweddau yw y gall ysgolion rannu adnoddau ac arbenigedd a gall athrawon gael cymorth proffesiynol, gan fod angen inni ystyried hynny hefyd. Mewn rhai pentrefi, efallai mai'r ysgol fydd yr unig adeilad cyhoeddus a ffocws bywyd y pentref. Felly, rhaid rhoi sylw priodol bob amser i faterion cymunedol wrth ystyried dyfodol ysgol. Yn y pen draw, fel y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, buddiannau addysgol disgyblion a chynaliadwyedd addysg o ansawdd uchel yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain yw fy mhrif flaenoriaeth.

Ystyriaf yr adroddiad hwn, ynghyd â gwaith tasglu ysgolion bach Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru. Bydd yn cyflwyno adroddiad i'r Cynulliad ym mis Medi a chyflwynaf ei gasgliadau i'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ym mis Hydref.

**Cynog Dafis:** In replying to the debate, I will discuss some of the themes that became evident during the discussion. First, the effective use of resources was emphasised and the need to tackle, rather than avoid, that issue. Ann Jones and Janice Gregory linked this to the need for resources to raise standards, which is the most important consideration. The Minister also emphasised that point. Lorraine Barrett also mentioned the need to tackle this issue, and I am sure that many other Members would agree with that. Rhodri Glyn Thomas, and others, talked about not being tied to the patterns of the past. The Minister referred to the fact that many schools in Wales, to a great extent,

helaeth, yn dilyn patrwm oes Fictoria, a bod angen inni addasu mewn modd sensitif ar gyfer anghenion yr oes fodern.

Pwysleisiwyd hefyd fod ysgol yn adnodd cymunedol, yn enwedig wrth ystyried swyddogaethau ychwanegol ysgolion, megis hyrwyddo dysgu gydol oes a datblygu cymunedol. Pwysleisiodd y Gweinidog yr angen i ganfod datrysiadau newydd o ran yr elfen honno. Mae hyn yn gydnaws ag ymagwedd y Cynulliad, gan fod 'Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf', cynhwysedd cymdeithasol a sicrhau cymunedau bywiog yn berthnasol i hyn.

Cafwyd ychydig o wrthdaro rhwng safbwynt Lorraine Barrett a Jonathan Morgan. Pwysleisiodd yr olaf y dylai fod gan ysgolion llwyddiannus y gallu i dyfu, er y byddai rhai yn dweud y gallai hynny arwain at ddirywiad ysgolion eraill. Dywedodd Lorraine Barrett y dylid rhoi pwyslais ar gryfhau ysgolion sydd yn wynebu problemau, a chredaf imi ei chlywed yn dweud bod angen, dan rai amgylchiadau, orfodi'r dalgylch. Byddai hynny'n denu ymatebion amrywiol oddi wrth aelodau'r Pwyllgor.

Clywsom lawer am ysgolion bach. Dechreuodd Karen Sinclair drwy ddweud bod yn rhaid ystyried eu swyddogaeth gymunedol a'u pellter oddi wrth ysgolion eraill cyn y gellid sôn am eu cau dim ond oherwydd eu bod yn ysgolion bach â lleoedd gwag. Cyfeiriodd Rhodri Glyn Thomas, ac Aelodau eraill, at y syniad o glystyru a ffederaleiddio, yn enwedig drwy ddefnyddio technoleg newydd. Tanlinellodd Eleanor Burnham bwysigrwydd yr ysgol gymunedol, fach mewn ardaloedd gwledig, a chlywsom unwaith eto am ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth i gyflwyno strategaeth ysgolion bach, yn enwedig ar gyfer ardaloedd gwledig. Dywedodd y Gweinidog ei bod yn aros i glywed canlyniadau'r astudiaeth hon a fydd, ynghyd â gwaith Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, yn cyfrannu at y strategaeth honno.

Soniwyd hefyd am y galw am addysg Gymraeg a'r ffaith ei fod yn fwy na'r

follow a Victorian pattern, and that we need to adapt sensitively to the requirements of the modern age.

It was also emphasised that a school is a community resource, particularly when one considers its additional functions, such as the promotion of lifelong learning and community development. The Minister emphasised the need to find new solutions in that respect. This is in accord with the Assembly's approach, as 'Communities First', social inclusion and ensuring the creation vibrant communities are all related to this.

There was some disagreement between the viewpoints of Lorraine Barrett and Jonathan Morgan. The latter emphasised that successful schools should have the capacity for growth, although some might say that that could lead to the decline of other schools. Lorraine Barrett said that emphasis should be placed on strengthening schools that face problems, and I think that I heard her say that, in some circumstances, we need to enforce the catchment area. That would attract varying responses from members of the Committee.

We heard a considerable amount about small schools. Karen Sinclair started by saying that we must consider their community function and distance from other schools before we can start to talk of closure just because they are small schools with surplus spaces. Rhodri Glyn Thomas, and other Members, referred to the idea of clustering and federalisation, particularly through the use of new technology. Eleanor Burnham highlighted the importance of the small, community school in rural areas, and we heard once again about the partnership Government's commitment to introducing a small schools strategy, particularly for rural areas. The Minister said that she awaits the findings of this study, which, along with the work of the Welsh Local Government Association, will contribute to that strategy.

There was also talk of the demand for Welsh-medium education and the fact that the

ddarpariaeth bresennol. Mae gennym gyfle, drwy edrych ar leoedd gwag mewn ysgolion, i gynyddu'r ddarpariaeth honno a sicrhau ei bod yn ddigonol. Cyfeiriodd Jonathan Morgan at ysgolion crefyddol, ac yr wyf yn sicr y byddai rhai Aelodau am ddadlau o blaid twf yn niferoedd ysgolion o'r fath.

Croesawaf y ffaith fod y Gweinidog yn derbyn y tri argymhelliad ac y bydd yn gofyn i'r Comisiwn Archwilio ystyried addasu'r fethodoleg a'r dulliau dilysu ffigurau, gan wahodd awdurdodau lleol i gyfrannu at hynny. Ar ddiwedd ei haraith, rhoes y Gweinidog bwyslais unwaith eto ar y defnydd cymunedol o ysgolion a'r ffaith y gall hynny newid ein canfyddiad o'r hyn sydd yn gost-effeithiol. Gobeithiaf i bawb ystyried y ddadl yn un ddefnyddiol.

demand is greater than the current provision. There is an opportunity, by considering surplus places, to increase that provision to an adequate level. Jonathan Morgan referred to religious schools, and I am sure that some Members would argue in favour of an increase in the number of such schools.

I welcome the fact that the Minister accepts the three recommendations and that she will ask the Audit Commission to consider adapting the methodology and the means of validating figures, and also ask local authorities to contribute. At the end of her speech, the Minister further emphasised community use of schools and the fact that that can change our perceptions of what is cost-effective. I hope that everyone has found this debate useful.

*Cynnig: O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion: For 42, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Neagle, Lynne

Randerson, Jenny  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I thank Members for their co-operation as we have finished about three-quarters of a minute early. That brings today's proceedings to a close.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Diolch i Aelodau am eu cydweithrediad, gan ein bod wedi dod i ben tua tri chwarter munud yn gynnar. Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.29 p.m.*

*The session ended at 5.29 p.m.*