



Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)

The National Assembly for Wales
(The Official Record)

Dydd Iau 24 Mai 2001

Thursday 24 May 2001

Cynnwys
Contents

- 3 Cwestiynau ar Gymunedau i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau
Questions on Communities to the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities
- 11 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd
Questions to the Minister for Environment
- 20 Pwyntiau o Drefn
Points of Order
- 23 Dyfarniad dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 5.6
Determination under Standing Order No. 5.6
- 24 Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion
Composite Motion: Approval of Orders
- 26 Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai ar Drosglwyddo'r Stoc Tai
The Local Government and Housing Committee Report on Housing Stock Transfer
- 45 Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Y Blaid Geidwadol): Methiant Clymblaid y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a Llafur i Ddiogelu Lles a Bywoliaeth Cymru Wledig
Minority Party Debate (Conservative Party): The Failure of the Liberal Democrat-Labour Coalition to Protect the Wellbeing and Livelihood of Rural Wales
- 77 Pwynt o Drefn
Point of Order
- 78 Dadl Fer: Gwyddoniaeth yng Nghymru
Short Debate: Science in Wales

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 9.05 a.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 9.05 a.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Cwestiynau ar Gymunedau i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau
Questions on Communities to the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities

Ceiswyr Lloches yng Nghymru
Asylum Seekers in Wales

Q1 John Griffiths: Will the Minister make a statement on the latest position regarding asylum seekers in Wales? (OAQ11674)

C1 John Griffiths: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y sefyllfa ddiweddaraf mewn perthynas â cheiswyr lloches yng Nghymru? (OAQ11674)

The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart): As you know, I made a statement on this issue on Tuesday. Immigration and asylum are not devolved matters. However, as Chair of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity, I have kept in close touch with the Home Office on this issue and have made the relevant Minister aware of our concerns.

Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart): Fel y gwyddoch, gwneuthum ddatganiad ar y mater hwn ddydd Mawrth. Nid yw mewnfudo a lloches yn faterion datganoledig. Fodd bynnag, fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, yr wyf wedi cadw cysylltiad agos â'r Swyddfa Gartref ar y mater hwn ac wedi hysbysu'r Gweinidog perthnasol o'n pryderon.

John Griffiths: The Assembly has made its views on asylum seekers crystal clear and I agree with those views. Will you join me in condemning the British National Party's decision to field a candidate in Newport West in the general election, thus increasing racial tension in that area and throughout Wales?

John Griffiths: Mae'r Cynulliad wedi mynegi ei farn ar geiswyr lloches yn gwbl glir a chytunaf â'r farn honno. A ymunwch â mi wrth gondemnio penderfyniad y Blaid Genedlaethol Brydeinig i gyflwyno ymgeisydd yng Ngorllewin Casnewydd yn yr etholiad cyffredinol, gan gynyddu tensiwn hiliol yn yr ardal honno a ledled Cymru.

Edwina Hart: I am sure that all Members would join me in condemning the BNP's decision. We agree with the Archbishop of Wales's views on this issue.

Edwina Hart: Yr wyf yn sicr y byddai pob Aelod yn ymuno â mi wrth gondemnio penderfyniad y BNP. Cytunwn â barn Archesgob Cymru ar y mater hwn.

Cynog Dafis: Mae gan y Gweinidog lawer ar ei phlât ac mae hi i'w chanmol am roi amser i'r mater hwn ac am weithredu mor effeithiol. I ddychwelyd at gwestiwn a ofynnais ychydig ddiwrnodau yn ôl ynglŷn â hawl ceiswyr lloches i gael cyngor cyfreithiol, a oes rhywbeth y gellir ei wneud er mwyn sicrhau bod hawl gan gyfreithwyr ceiswyr lloches i'w ffonio er mwyn sicrhau nad oes unrhyw broblem ar unrhyw adeg iddynt gael y cyngor cyfreithiol y mae arnynt ei angen?

Cynog Dafis: The Minister has much on her plate and she is to be praised for devoting time to this matter and for acting so effectively. To return to a question that I asked a few days ago on the right of asylum seekers to obtain legal advice, is there anything that can be done to ensure that asylum seekers' solicitors are allowed to telephone them in order to ensure that there are no problems at any time in them obtaining the legal advice that they need?

Edwina Hart: Asylum seekers have phone

Edwina Hart: Mae gan geiswyr lloches

cards that they can use, but I will inquire about whether arrangements of that nature can be made. I know that Members are concerned that asylum seekers should have the maximum access to proper representation, because they are vulnerable individuals.

William Graham: I know that you agree with the views already expressed in the Assembly, that prison is not the place for Assembly seekers. I endorse your remarks—

Jonathan Morgan: Asylum seekers.

William Graham: I am sorry, I meant asylum seekers. It is early in the morning; I apologise. [*Laughter.*] May I start again, Llywydd?

The Presiding Officer: Yes.

William Graham: Minister, I am sure that you will agree that the Assembly's views are clear. Prison is not the place for asylum seekers. I endorse the remarks made by the Archbishop of Wales yesterday and John Griffiths's comments regarding the candidature of the BNP in Newport. We should give as little publicity as possible to that. I am sure that you will endorse those remarks.

Edwina Hart: I agree that we do not want to fuel any publicity for the BNP. The Assembly has shown a responsible attitude to this issue across the parties and we should continue to do so.

gardiau ffôn y gallant eu defnyddio, ond byddaf yn holi a ellir gwneud trefniadau o'r fath. Gwn fod Aelodau yn awyddus i geiswyr lloches gael mynediad i gynrychiolaeth briodol, oherwydd eu bod yn unigolion diamddiffyn.

William Graham: Gwn y cytunwch â'r farn a fynegwyd eisoes yn y Cynulliad, nad carchar yw'r lle i geiswyr Cynulliad. Cytunaf â'ch sylwadau—

Jonathan Morgan: Ceiswyr lloches.

William Graham: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ceiswyr lloches yr oeddwn yn ei olygu. Mae'n gynnar yn y bore; ymddiheuraf. [*Chwerthin.*] A allaf ddechrau eto, Lywydd?

Y Llywydd: Gallwch.

William Graham: Weinidog, yr wyf yn sicr y cytunwch fod barn y Cynulliad yn eglur. Nid carchar yw'r lle i geiswyr lloches. Cytunaf â'r sylwadau a wnaethpwyd gan Archesgob Cymru ddoe a sylwadau John Griffiths ynglŷn ag ymgeisydd y BNP yng Nghasnewydd. Dylem roi cyn lleied â phosibl o gyhoedduswydd i hynny. Yr wyf yn sicr y cytunwch â'r sylwadau hynny.

Edwina Hart: Cytunaf nad ydym am roi unrhyw gyhoedduswydd ychwanegol i'r BNP. Mae'r Cynulliad wedi dangos agwedd gyfrifol tuag at y mater hwn ar draws y pleidiau a dylem barhau i wneud hynny.

Canllawiau i Awdurdodau Lleol (Gwybodaeth i Denantiaid) **Local Authority Guidance (Information to Tenants)**

Q2 Janet Davies: Will the Minister make a statement on guidance issues to local authorities regarding the provision of information to tenants affected by housing stock transfer? (OAQ11575)

Edwina Hart: Our guidance on stock transfer will be issued soon and will make clear that tenant consultation and participation are essential elements of stock transfer. All tenants must be given the opportunity to provide their views and participate in every stage of the transfer process—from the option appraisal stage

C2 Janet Davies: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y canllawiau a roddwyd i awdurdodau lleol ynghylch darparu gwybodaeth i denantiaid a effeithir yn sgîl trosglwyddo'r stoc tai? (OAQ11575)

Edwina Hart: Caiff ein harweiniad ar drosglwyddo stoc ei gyhoeddi yn fuan a bydd yn datgan yn eglur fod ymgynghoriad a chyfranogiad tenantiaid yn elfennau hanfodol o drosglwyddo stoc. Rhaid rhoi cyfle i bob tenant roi eu barn a chyfrannu ym mhob cam o'r broses drosglwyddo—o'r cam gwerthuso opsiynau ymlaen. Yn ogystal, bydd yr

onwards. Moreover, the guidance will stipulate that the information given to tenants must be objective, balanced, clear and accurate. It should be provided in plain language and in formats that will meet the wide range of tenants' needs.

Janet Davies: Thank you for that, Minister. Do you also have plans to ensure that tenants' compacts will be able to cover all aspects of community life following such a transfer, given that they are being established with local authorities at present?

Edwina Hart: I will consider the issue of tenants' compacts in the context of your question, Janet. However, it is essential, and the Local Government and Housing Committee strongly agrees, that tenants' rights must be preserved at all times. They must be consulted properly and in language that they understand. Much jargon is associated with these issues and the consultations must be jargon-free.

Peter Rogers: Could you arrange for councils to inform tenants that renting housing stock that has been transferred out of council control, should be the first step on the road to the benefits of home ownership, which is desired by many people?

Edwina Hart: Home ownership is a matter of choice and of your financial position. It is essential that the authorities give individuals the correct advice about what housing is available. We are committed to a diverse market in Wales, as long as that market is of a high standard.

Strategaeth ar gyfer y Digartref (Cynghorau Lleol) Homelessness Strategy (Local Councils)

Q3 Peter Black: What action is the Minister taking to attempt to ensure that local councils produce a homelessness strategy? (OAQ11612)

Edwina Hart: I have established a Homelessness Commission, which you chair, Peter, to advise the Assembly on future policy on this matter. [*Laughter.*] The commission is preparing guidance for councils on homelessness strategies, which I

arweiniad yn datgan y dylai'r wybodaeth a roddir i denantiaid fod yn wrthrychol, cytbwys, eglur a chywir. Dylid ei ddarparu mewn iaith glir ac mewn ffurfiau a fydd yn bodloni'r ystod eang o anghenion y tenantiaid.

Janet Davies: Diolch ichi am hynny, Weinidog. A oes gennych gynlluniau hefyd i sicrhau y bydd compactau tenantiaid yn gallu cwmpasu pob agwedd ar fywyd cymunedol ar ôl trosglwyddiad o'r fath, o gofio y cânt eu sefydlu gydag awdurdodau lleol ar hyn o bryd?

Edwina Hart: Ystyriaf y mater o gompactau tenantiaid yng nghyd-destun eich cwestiwn, Janet. Fodd bynnag, mae'n hanfodol, ac mae'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai yn cytuno'n gryf, y dylid gwarchod hawliau tenantiaid bob amser. Dylid ymgynghori'n briodol â hwy ac mewn iaith y gallant ei deall. Mae llawer o jargon ynghlwm wrth y materion hyn a rhaid i'r ymgynghoriadau hyn fod yn rhydd o jargon.

Peter Rogers: A allech drefnu i gynghorau hysbysu tenantiaid mai'r cam cyntaf tuag at fanteision bod yn berchennog tŷ, sef dymuniad nifer o bobl, yw rhentu stoc tai a drosglwyddwyd o reolaeth y cyngor?

Edwina Hart: Mater o ddewis a'ch sefyllfa ariannol yw perchnogaeth tŷ. Mae'n hanfodol bod yr awdurdodau yn rhoi'r cyngor cywir i unigolion ynglŷn â'r tai sydd ar gael. Yr ydym yn ymrwymedig i farchnad amrywiol yng Nghymru, cyhyd â bod y farchnad honno o safon uchel.

C3 Peter Black: Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i geisio sicrhau y bydd cynghorau lleol yn cynhyrchu strategaeth ar gyfer y digartref? (OAQ11612)

Edwina Hart: Yr wyf wedi sefydlu Comisiwn y Digartref, yr ydych chi yn gadeirydd arno, Peter, i gynghori'r Cynulliad ar y polisi yn ymwneud â'r mater hwn yn y dyfodol. [*Chwerthin.*] Mae'r comisiwn yn paratoi arweiniad i gynghorau ar

will consider when I receive its report. I have encouraged councils to bid for grant funding to support the development of these strategies, and seven have already received funding from us. Councils are not legally obliged to produce a homelessness strategy. The Assembly supported the inclusion of such a requirement in the Homes Bill, and we will press for it to be introduced in future housing legislation.

I take this opportunity to publicly thank Peter for the work that he has undertaken with the commission.

Peter Black: Thank you for that reply, Minister. [*Laughter.*] Do you share my concern at the failure of the parties to agree to pass the Homes Bill before the Westminster Parliament adjourned for the general election? I thank you for your undertaking to press for that Bill to be reintroduced. Will you confirm that the homelessness provisions in the Bill are important, particularly in requiring local authorities to develop homelessness strategies? Will you also confirm that the Government of Wales will press the UK Government to reintroduce the Bill at the earliest possible opportunity?

Edwina Hart: We would have liked the homelessness legislation to have been passed before the general election. There is cross-party support for that legislation in this Chamber. It is essential that we continue to press, not only as a Government of Wales, but also as the National Assembly for Wales, for this Bill to be passed.

David Lloyd: Yn naturiol, rhaid darganfod y rhesymau pam mae pobl yn troi'n ddigartref yn y lle cyntaf. Yna rhaid darparu gwasanaethau wedi iddynt gael eu hailgartrefu er mwyn sicrhau nad ydynt yn llithro yn ôl i ddigartrefedd. Felly, sut y bwriadwch hyrwyddo strategaeth gynaliadwy hirdymor ar gyfer ymdrin â digartrefedd?

Edwina Hart: The Homelessness Commission is starting to undertake the task of considering a long-term strategy. It must

strategaethau i'r digartref, a byddaf yn ei ystyried pan dderbyniaf ei adroddiad. Yr wyf wedi annog cynghorau i wneud cais am arian grant i gynnal datblygiad y strategaethau hyn, ac mae saith eisoes wedi derbyn arian gennym. Nid oes gorfodaeth gyfreithiol ar gynghorau i gynhyrchu strategaeth i'r digartref. Cefnogodd y Cynulliad y bwriad o gynnwys gorfodaeth o'r fath yn y Mesur Cartrefi, a byddwn yn pwysu iddo gael ei gyflwyno mewn deddfwriaethau tai yn y dyfodol.

Cymeraf y cyfle hwn i ddiolch yn gyhoeddus i Peter am y gwaith a wnaeth gyda'r comisiwn.

Peter Black: Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. [*Chwerthin.*] A ydych yn rhannu fy ngofid bod y pleidiau wedi methu â chytuno i basio'r Mesur Cartrefi cyn i Senedd San Steffan dorri ar gyfer yr etholiad cyffredinol? Diolch am eich addewid i bwysu i'r Mesur hwnnw gael ei ailgyflwyno. A wnewch chi gadarnhau bod y darpariaethau i'r digartref yn y Mesur yn bwysig, yn arbennig wrth orchymyn i awdurdodau lleol ddatblygu strategaethau i'r digartref? A wnewch chi hefyd gadarnhau y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn pwysu ar Lywodraeth y DU i ailgyflwyno'r Mesur ar y cyfle cyntaf posibl?

Edwina Hart: Byddem wedi dymuno i ddeddfwriaeth y digartref gael ei phasio cyn yr etholiad cyffredinol. Mae cefnogaeth trawsbleidiol i'r ddeddfwriaeth honno yn y Siambr hon. Mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn parhau i bwysu, nid yn unig fel Llywodraeth Cymru, ond hefyd fel Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, i'r Mesur hwn gael ei basio.

David Lloyd: Naturally, we must identify the reasons why people become homeless in the first place. We then need to provide services for them after they are rehoused to ensure that they do not slip back into homelessness. How do you, therefore, intend to promote a long-term sustainable strategy to deal with homelessness?

Edwina Hart: Mae Comisiwn y Digartref yn dechrau ymgymryd â'r dasg o ystyried strategaeth hirdymor. Rhaid iddo hefyd

also consider carefully the existing strategies. I visited the Foyer prosiect in Swansea last week and was impressed by the amount of work that had been undertaken. It is important that we assess how well it works and that we consider how to develop programmes in that area. There is an immense difference between the lives of different homeless people, and it important that they feel nurtured when they go to a prosiect such as the Foyer prosiect. It is not just about how they can gain employment, but a holistic approach as to how they can live independently. Much more work needs to be done on that issue. It would be useful, over the next two years, for us to develop a strategy in Wales to put everything in place over the whole range of Assembly policies to assist them.

ystyried strategaethau sydd eisoes ar waith yn ofalus. Ymwelais â phrosiect Foyer yn Abertawe yr wythnos diwethaf ac yr oeddwn wedi rhyfeddu at faint o waith a wnaethpwyd. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn asesu pa mor dda y mae'n gweithio a'n bod yn ystyried sut i ddatblygu rhaglenni yn yr ardal honno. Mae gwahaniaeth mawr rhwng bywydau gwahanol bobl ddiartref, ac mae'n bwysig eu bod yn teimlo yn ddiogel pan fyddant yn ymuno â phrosiect fel prosiect Foyer. Nid yw yn ymwneud â sut y gallant gael gwaith yn unig, ond hefyd yn ymagwedd holistaidd tuag at sut y gallant fyw'n annibynnol. Mae angen llawer mwy o waith ar y mater hwnnw. Byddai'n ddefnyddiol, dros y ddwy flynedd nesaf, inni ddatblygu strategaeth yng Nghymru i roi popeth ar waith ar draws ystod gyfan polisiau'r Cynulliad er mwyn eu cynorthwyo.

9:15 a.m.

The Presiding Officer: Question 4 has been transferred for written answer.

Y Llywydd: Trosglwyddwyd cwestiwn 4 i'w ateb yn ysgrifenedig.

Clustnodi Symiau at Ddibenion Penodol wrth Ddyrannu Cyllid Refeniw Use of Hypothecation in Allocating Revenue

Q5 David Melding: Will the Minister make a statement on the use of hypothecation in the allocation of local authority revenues? (OAQ11598)

C5 David Melding: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar yr arfer o glustnodi symiau at ddibenion penodol wrth ddyrannu cyllid refeniw i awdurdodau lleol? (OAQ11598)

Edwina Hart: I have made it clear that the Assembly has not earmarked within the general revenue settlement for 2001-02. Specific grant schemes will continue to be available as a funding mechanism where they provide the most appropriate means of helping the Assembly to meet its objectives.

Edwina Hart: Nodais yn glir nad yw'r Cynulliad wedi clustnodi o fewn y setliad refeniw cyffredinol ar gyfer 2001-02. Bydd cynlluniau grant penodol yn parhau i fod ar gael fel dull ariannu pan fyddant yn cynnig y dull mwyaf priodol o helpu'r Cynulliad i gyflawni ei amcanion.

David Melding: Do you agree, Minister, that it is difficult for the Assembly to achieve its strategic objectives without ring-fencing major expenditure for local authorities? The only way to achieve good, uniform services is by ensuring that councils spend money on what they are supposed to spend it.

David Melding: A gytunwch, Weinidog, ei bod yn anodd i'r Cynulliad gyflawni ei amcanion strategol heb neilltuo gwariant mawr i'r awdurdodau lleol? Yr unig ffordd o gyflawni gwasanaethau da, unffurf yw drwy sicrhau bod cynghorau yn gwario arian ar yr hyn y dylent ei wario.

Edwina Hart: I do not propose to police local authorities. They are democratically elected bodies. It is important that the new regime of policy agreements and Best Value

Edwina Hart: Ni fwriadaf blismona awdurdodau lleol. Maent yn gyrff a etholwyd yn ddemocrataidd. Mae'n bwysig bod y system newydd o gytundebau polisi a Gwerth

will help to deliver the services that we want as a National Assembly. We can undertake those with local government. The stick approach has not helped with regard to local government in the past, and I prefer the more grown-up approach that we are taking, with its emphasis on outcomes rather than financial input.

Janet Ryder: A previous question referred to homelessness, and one reason for using hypothecation was to ensure that the money that went to local authorities was spent on homelessness. You are now pursuing a policy of agreements with local government. Have you made any firm policy agreements with local government to guarantee that policies on homelessness are delivered through local government, and that money for vulnerable groups, such as the homeless, goes into homeless projects?

Edwina Hart: There are some key policy areas within the agreements with local authorities. I will take on board your point on homelessness and similar issues. I have had discussions with local authorities in Wales on these issues. These are key areas. Homelessness also links into the health strategies, and many other issues. When I review agreements, I will be mindful of what further work can be done on those issues.

The Presiding Officer: Question 6 has been withdrawn.

Gorau yn helpu i ddarparu'r gwasanaethau y dymunwn ni eu cael fel Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Gallwn ymgymryd â'r rheini gyda llywodraeth leol. Nid yw'r ymagwedd o geisio gorfodi llywodraeth leol i gyflawni pethau wedi helpu yn y gorffennol, ac mae'n well gennyf yr ymagwedd fwy aeddfed a gymerwn, gyda'i phwyslais ar ganlyniadau yn hytrach na mewnbwn ariannol.

Janet Ryder: Cyfeiriodd cwestiwn blaenorol at y digartref, ac un o'r rhesymau dros ddefnyddio pridiannu oedd sicrhau y byddai'r arian a roddwyd i awdurdodau lleol yn cael ei wario ar y digartref. Yr ydych yn awr yn mynd ar drywydd polisi o gytundebau gyda llywodraeth leol. A wnaethoch unrhyw gytundebau polisi cadarn â llywodraeth leol i warantu y cyflwynir polisïau ar y digartref drwy lywodraeth leol, ac y bydd arian i grwpiau diamddiffyn, megis y digartref, yn mynd tuag at brosiectau ar gyfer y digartref?

Edwina Hart: Mae rhai meysydd polisi allweddol o fewn y cytundebau ag awdurdodau lleol. Derbyniat eich pwynt am y digartref a materion tebyg. Cefais drafodaethau ag awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru ar y materion hyn. Maent yn feysydd allweddol. Mae bod yn ddigartref hefyd yn cysylltu â'r strategaethau iechyd a nifer o faterion eraill. Pan fyddaf yn adolygu cytundebau, byddaf yn ystyried y gwaith pellach y gellir ei wneud ar y materion hynny.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 6 yn ôl.

Hybu Cynhwysiant Cymdeithasol Promotion of Social Inclusion

Q7 Jonathan Morgan: How are the Minister's policies promoting social inclusion in South Wales Central? (OAQ11611)

Edwina Hart: The National Assembly's annual report on social inclusion details all our policies and programmes aimed at promoting social inclusion in communities throughout Wales. Communities First, the Assembly's groundbreaking programme for regenerating communities and addressing social inclusion, will have a significant

C7 Jonathan Morgan: Sut y mae polisïau'r Gweinidog yn hybu cynhwysiant cymdeithasol yng Nghanol De Cymru? (OAQ11611)

Edwina Hart: Mae adroddiad blynyddol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar gynhwysiant cymdeithasol yn nodi ein holl bolisïau a'n rhaglenni sydd wedi'u hanelu at hyrwyddo cynhwysiant cymdeithasol mewn cymunedau ledled Cymru. Caiff Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf, rhaglen arloesol y Cynulliad ar gyfer adfywio cymunedau a mynd i'r afael â

impact on the most deprived communities in South Wales Central.

Jonathan Morgan: You will be aware of the recent controversy caused by the Salvation Army wishing to locate a drug and alcohol unit next to a primary school in Cardiff. I recognise the excellent work undertaken by the Salvation Army. However, do you not agree that we need to review the planning procedures that have allowed Bro Taf Health Authority in recent months to sit back and do nothing, that have ensured that the police have no responsibility in these matters, and that the National Assembly and local authorities have no authority to offer guidance on these matters? Is it not now time to review the procedures that allow such situations to arise?

Edwina Hart: Jane Hutt has spoken to everyone concerned, and the matter has now been successfully resolved. If Jane feels that I can do anything to assist, as the Minister with responsibility for local government, she will discuss those matters with me.

Alun Pugh: Yr oeddwn yn hapus i'ch gweld chi ar y teledu ar Gadair Idris ddoe, Edwina.

Social exclusion in Colwyn Bay has been exacerbated by a handful of rogue landlords. Will you ensure that the special control scheme for houses in multiple occupation in Colwyn Bay receives a prompt and positive response from your department?

Edwina Hart: I think that my department has been prompt and positive. We are awaiting further information from the local authority. As soon as we are able to do so, we will agree to such a scheme, because these schemes are valuable.

Pauline Jarman: At the last meeting of the Local Government and Housing Committee you indicated your intention to announce before September the names of the authorities that will benefit from the £8

chynhwysiant cymdeithasol, effaith sylweddol ar y cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig yng Nghanol De Cymru.

Jonathan Morgan: Byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r ddadl ddiweddar a achoswyd gan Fyddin yr Iachawdwriaeth yn dymuno lleoli uned gyffuriau ac alcohol y drws nesaf i ysgol gynradd yng Nghaerdydd. Cydnabyddaf y gwaith ardderchog a wneir gan Fyddin yr Iachawdwriaeth. Fodd bynnag, oni chytunwch y dylem adolygu'r trefniadau cynllunio sydd wedi caniatáu i Awdurdod Iechyd Bro Taf dros y misoedd diwethaf eistedd yn ôl a gwneud dim, sydd wedi sicrhau nad oes gan yr heddlu unrhyw gyfrifoldebau yn y materion hyn, ac nad oes gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol nac awdurdodau lleol unrhyw awdurdod i gynnig arweiniad ar y materion hyn? Onid yw bellach yn bryd adolygu'r trefniadau sydd yn galluogi sefyllfaoedd o'r fath i godi?

Edwina Hart: Siaradodd Jane Hutt â phawb dan sylw ac mae'r mater bellach wedi ei ddatrys yn llwyddiannus. Os yw Jane yn credu y gallaf wneud unrhyw beth i fod o gymorth, fel y Gweinidog â chyfrifoldeb dros lywodraeth leol, bydd yn trafod y materion hynny â mi.

Alun Pugh: I was pleased to see you on television on Cadair Idris yesterday, Edwina.

Gwaethygyd eithrio cymdeithasol ym Mae Colwyn gan lond llaw o landlordiaid diegwyddor. A sicrhewch y bydd y cynllun rheolaeth arbennig ar gyfer tai amlbreswyliaeth ym Mae Colwyn yn derbyn ymateb prydlon a chadarnhaol gan eich adran?

Edwina Hart: Credaf y bu fy adran yn brydlon a chadarnhaol. Yr ydym yn aros am wybodaeth bellach oddi wrth yr awdurdod lleol. Cyn gynted ag y gallwn wneud hynny, byddwn yn cytuno i gynllun o'r fath, oherwydd bod y cynlluniau hyn yn werthfawr.

Pauline Jarman: Yng nghyfarfod diwethaf y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai, nodasoch eich bwriad i gyhoeddi enwau'r awdurdodau a fydd yn elwa ar yr £8 miliwn sydd ar gael o dan Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf, cyn mis

million available under Communities First. Are you any nearer to being able to confirm the date for that announcement?

Edwina Hart: Yes. Officials and an expert group met yesterday to consider applications from local government. I hope that the necessary paperwork will come through in the next two weeks.

Medi. A ydych gam yn agosach at allu cadarnhau'r dyddiad ar gyfer y cyhoeddiad hwnnw?

Edwina Hart: Ydw. Cyfarfu swyddogion â grŵp arbenigol ddoe i ystyried ceisiadau gan lywodraeth leol. Gobeithiaf y daw'r gwaith papur angenrheidiol i law yn ystod y bythefnos nesaf.

Treth Fusnes Leol Local Business Rate Tax

Q8 Alun Cairns: Will the Minister make a statement on her policy of introducing a local business rate tax? (OAQ11654)

Edwina Hart: I am presently considering several options that would help us to achieve our aim of building stronger and more productive relationships between local government and the business community in Wales.

Alun Cairns: Many businesses have been looking to the Assembly for hope in gaining a competitive advantage. Does the Minister honestly believe that an additional tax is what businesses need? An additional tax would take away that competitive advantage, and take away their profitability in expanding and in creating further employment.

Edwina Hart: Under these proposals, businesses will have the right to approve the way in which the additional money is spent. That means that they will have a tax with representation.

Rod Richards: Is one of the options that the Minister is considering not to introduce a local tax at all?

Edwina Hart: I am considering all options. It is important that we do that and that I take into account all the information that I have received from the consultation.

C8 Alun Cairns: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ei pholisi o gyflwyno treth fusnes leol? (OAQ11654)

Edwina Hart: Yr wyf ar hyn o bryd yn ystyried nifer o opsiynau a fydd yn ein helpu i gyflawni ein hamcan o adeiladu perthynas gryfach a mwy cynhyrchiol rhwng llywodraeth leol a'r gymuned fusnes yng Nghymru.

Alun Cairns: Mae nifer o fusnesau wedi bod yn edrych tua'r Cynulliad am obaith o ennill mantais gystadleuol. A gred y Gweinidog mewn gwirionedd mai treth ychwanegol sydd ei hangen ar fusnesau? Byddai treth ychwanegol yn dileu'r fantais gystadleuol honno, ac yn dileu eu helwgarwch wrth ehangu ac wrth greu cyflogaeth bellach.

Edwina Hart: O dan y cynigion hyn, bydd gan fusnesau yr hawl i gymeradwyo'r modd y caiff arian ychwanegol ei wario. Golyga hyn y bydd ganddynt dreth gyda chynrychiolaeth.

Rod Richards: A yw'r Gweinidog yn ystyried peidio â chyflwyno treth leol o gwbl fel un o'r opsiynau?

Edwina Hart: Yr wyf yn ystyried pob opsiwn. Mae'n bwysig inni wneud hynny ac imi ystyried yr holl wybodaeth a dderbynais o'r ymgynghoriad.

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd Questions to the Minister for Environment

Ystyriaethau Iaith Gymraeg wrth Neilltuo Defnydd Tir Welsh Language Considerations in Land Use Allocation

Q1 Janet Davies: Is the Minister considering allowing the Welsh language to be incorporated as a consideration into land use allocations in the unitary development plans, where this would be appropriate? (OAQ11663)

The Minister for Environment (Sue Essex): Technical Advice Note (Wales) 20 'The Welsh Language: Unitary Development Plans and Planning Control', which was published in June 2000, gives advice on the Welsh language in unitary development plans and planning control. That note was the subject of wide consultation, and provides more detailed advice to planning authorities and others, on the application of present policy guidance on planning and the Welsh language in the preparation of UDPs.

We are also consulting on 'Planning Policy Wales'. That is a major revision and update of all planning and guidance. Within that, the guidance is strengthened to require that all local authorities consider whether they have communities where language use is part of the social fabric. That requirement was not included in the previous guidance; I asked for it to be included. Therefore, all UDPs should include a statement on that aspect.

Janet Davies: Bearing in mind that at least one local authority in Wales in the past has felt aggrieved at being refused the ability to use the Welsh language as a criterion, could you give local authorities advice on the amount of evidence that they need to support such statements? Is your Government giving any material assistance to local authorities to provide that evidence?

Sue Essex: I do not know of the case to which you refer. Perhaps we can discuss that afterwards. However, the technical advice

C1 Janet Davies: A yw'r Gweinidog yn ystyried caniatáu ymgorffori'r iaith Gymraeg fel ystyriaeth wrth neilltuo defnydd tir yn y cynlluniau datblygu unedol lle byddai hynny'n briodol? (OAQ11663)

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd (Sue Essex): Mae Nodyn Cyngor Technegol (Cymru) 20 'Yr Iaith Gymraeg: Cynlluniau Datblygu Unedol a Rheoli Cynllunio', a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Mehefin 2000 yn rhoi cyngor ar yr iaith Gymraeg mewn cynlluniau datblygu unedol a rheolaeth gynllunio. Bu'r nodyn hwnnw yn destun ymgynghoriad eang, ac mae'n cynnig cyngor manylach i awdurdodau lleol ac eraill ar ddefnyddio arweiniad polisi presennol mewn cynllunio a'r iaith Gymraeg wrth baratoi cynlluniau datblygu unedol.

Yr ydym hefyd yn ymgynghori ar 'Bolisi Cynllunio Cymru', sef adolygiad a diweddariad sylweddol o gynllunio ac arweiniad. O fewn hynny, atgyfnerthwyd yr arweiniad i fynnu fod pob awdurdod lleol yn ystyried a oes ganddynt gymunedau lle mae'r defnydd o iaith yn rhan o'r gwedd cymdeithasol. Ni chynhwyswyd y gofyniad hwnnw yn yr arweiniad blaenorol; gofynnais iddo gael ei gynnwys. Felly, dylai pob cynllun datblygu unedol gynnwys datganiad ar yr agwedd honno.

Janet Davies: O gofio bod o leiaf un awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru yn y gorffennol wedi teimlo anfodlonrwydd na chawsant ddefnyddio'r iaith Gymraeg fel maen prawf, a allech gynghori awdurdodau lleol ar faint o dystiolaeth sydd ei angen arnynt i gefnogi datganiadau o'r fath? A yw eich Llywodraeth yn rhoi unrhyw gymorth ymarferol i awdurdodau lleol i ddarparu'r dystiolaeth honno?

Sue Essex: Ni wn am yr achos y cyfeiriwch ato. Efallai y cawn drafod hynny wedyn. Fodd bynnag, ymgynghorwyd yn eang ar y

note was widely consulted upon. I met with Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg and other organisations. There is a much more detailed support package for local authorities than that which was previously available. I have not yet received representations asking for the points that you raised. That is not to say that no authority would want that. If representations are made to me, I will be happy to discuss them with local authorities. However, I emphasise that we have been consulting on the planning guidance, which also gives people an opportunity to comment.

Jonathan Morgan: Minister, you will be aware that the Welsh language review currently being undertaken is starting to consider this particular aspect of policy. Will you confirm that it is not your Government's intention to change the policy, thereby preventing non-Welsh-speakers who wish to buy homes in these communities, from doing so? I believe—as do the vast majority of people in Wales—that that would be a restrictive policy that would do nothing to enhance Wales or its position in the world.

Sue Essex: I confirm—and it is stated in the new technical advice note—that development plans should not seek to introduce any element of discrimination—and that is the important point—on the basis of linguistic ability. They should not seek to control housing occupancy on linguistic grounds. What we have seen in Wales is that disparity of wealth has all sorts of implications and has meant that local people have not had the opportunity to find suitable housing. We need to take that seriously, but not, as you say, as a basis for discrimination.

nodyn cyngor technegol. Cyfarfûm â Chymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg a sefydliadau eraill. Mae pecyn cymorth manylach o lawer ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol nag oedd ar gael o'r blaen. Nid wyf hyd yn hyn wedi derbyn sylwadau yn gofyn am y pwyntiau a godwyd gennych. Nid yw hynny i ddweud na fyddai unrhyw awdurdod yn dymuno hynny. Os gwneir sylwadau imi, byddaf yn fodlon eu trafod ag awdurdodau lleol. Fodd bynnag, pwysleisiaf y buom yn ymgynghori ar yr arweiniad cynllunio, sydd hefyd yn rhoi cyfle i bobl roi sylwadau.

Jonathan Morgan: Weinidog, byddwch yn ymwybodol bod yr adolygiad o'r iaith Gymraeg sydd yn digwydd ar hyn o bryd yn dechrau ystyried yr agwedd arbennig hon ar bolisi. A wnewch chi gadarnhau nad yw'n fwrriad gan eich Llywodraeth i newid y polisi, ac felly atal y rhai di-Gymraeg sydd yn dymuno prynu tai yn y cymunedau hyn rhag gwneud hynny? Credaf—fel y mwyafrif helaeth o bobl yng Nghymru—y byddai hynny yn bolisi cyfyngol na fyddai'n gwneud dim i ddyrchafu Cymru na'i safle yn y byd.

Sue Essex: Cadarnhaf—ac fe'i cofnodir yn y nodyn cyngor technegol—na ddylai cynlluniau datblygu geisio cyflwyno unrhyw elfen o wahaniaethu—a dyna'r pwynt pwysig—ar sail gallu ieithyddol. Ni ddylent geisio rheoli deiliaid tai ar sail ieithyddol. Yr hyn a welwyd yng Nghymru yw bod gan anghyfartaledd cyfoeth bob math o oblygiadau a'i fod wedi golygu nad yw pobl lleol wedi cael y cyfle i ddod o hyd i dai addas. Mae angen inni ystyried hynny o ddifrif, ond nid, fel y dywedwch, fel sail ar gyfer gwahaniaethu.

Rhwydwaith Trafnidiaeth (Gwelliannau) Transport Network (Improvements)

Q2 Brian Hancock: What measures will the Minister take to improve the transport network? (OAQ11644)

Sue Essex: Consultation on the transport framework for Wales ended on Friday 18 May. Therefore, I hope that you responded by then. I plan to publish the framework this summer. It sets out aims and objectives to create a better co-ordinated and sustainable transport system in Wales. However, I also

C2 Brian Hancock: Pa fesurau fydd y Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i wella'r rhwydwaith trafndiaeth? (OAQ11644)

Sue Essex: Daeth yr ymgynghoriad ar y fframwaith trafndiaeth i Gymru i ben ddydd Gwener 18 Mai. Felly, gobeithiaf ichi ymateb erbyn hynny. Bwriadaf gyhoeddi'r fframwaith yr haf hwn. Mae'n nodi nodau ac amcanion i greu system drafndiaeth fwy cydgysylltiedig a chynaliadwy yng Nghymru.

add that I have already invested a considerable amount of funds, as did Peter Law before me, in improving the transport network throughout Wales. I remind you of the support for the north-south rail service, and earlier this year I announced £300 million for local authority investment in road, rail and public transport packages over the next five years.

9:25 a.m.

Brian Hancock: On a question about transport, you would expect me to raise the matter of an integrated transport system between Ebbw Vale and Newport and Cardiff, via Islwyn. However, will you join me in expressing disappointment at the revised train timetable for this summer, which does not resume the morning north-south link? People will have to revert to using their cars when travelling between Wrexham and Cardiff, forcing more cars onto the roads. The train operating companies have failed to communicate on this issue. Do you agree that the Strategic Rail Authority lacks commitment to rail services in Wales and to delivering the National Assembly's key transport policies?

Sue Essex: Taking the second point first, no, I do not agree. The SRA has worked closely with us. Anyone attending our Environment, Planning and Transport Committee meetings will have seen Chris Austin speak many times about how the authority is trying to support us in meeting our aspirations, particularly on the all-Wales franchise. The SRA listened and changed its policy on that, and is to be congratulated on that. Chris Austin was in Cardiff at a conference last week, talking again about the SRA's commitment to improving the rail system. Therefore, in general, we are seeing a considerable amount of progress.

On the point that you raised about timetabling, I have spoken to colleagues in north Wales and have e-mailed them asking

Fodd bynnag, ychwanegaf hefyd fy mod eisoes wedi buddsoddi swm sylweddol o arian, fel y gwnaeth Peter Law o'm blaen, i wella'r rhwydwaith trafnidiaeth ledled Cymru. Fe'ch atgoffaf o'r cymorth i'r gwasanaeth trên rhwng y gogledd a'r de ac yn gynharach eleni cyhoeddais y byddai £300 miliwn ar gael i'w fuddsoddi gan awdurdodau lleol mewn pecynnau trafnidiaeth ffyrdd, rheilffyrdd a thrafnidiaeth gyhoeddus dros y pum mlynedd nesaf.

Brian Hancock: Ar gwestiwn ynglŷn â thrafnidiaeth, byddech yn disgwyl imi godi'r mater o system drafnidiaeth integredig rhwng Glynebwy a Chasnewydd a Chaerdydd, drwy Islwyn. Fodd bynnag, a ymunwch â mi i fynegi siom yn yr amserlen trenau ddiwygiedig ar gyfer yr haf hwn, nad yw'n parhau'r cyswllt boreol rhwng y gogledd a'r de? Bydd yn rhaid i bobl aildechrau defnyddio eu ceir wrth deithio rhwng Wrecsam a Chaerdydd, gan orfodi mwy o gerbydau ar y ffyrdd. Methodd y cwmnïau trenau â chyfathrebu ar y mater hwn. A gytnwch nad yw'r Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol yn ymrwymedig i wasanaethau trên yng Nghymru ac i gyflawni polisïau trafnidiaeth allweddol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol?

Sue Essex: Gan gymryd yr ail bwynt yn gyntaf, na, ni chytunaf. Cydweithiodd yr Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol yn agos â ni. Bydd unrhyw un a fynychodd gyfarfodydd Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth wedi gweld Chris Austin yn siarad droeon ynglŷn â sut y ceisia'r awdurdod ein cefnogi i gyflawni'n dyheadau, yn arbennig o ran y fasnachfaint Cymru gyfan. Gwrandawodd a newidiodd yr Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol ei bolisi ar hynny, a dylid ei longyfarch am hynny. Yr oedd Chris Austin yng Nghaerdydd mewn cynhadledd yr wythnos diwethaf, unwaith eto yn siarad am ymrwymiad yr Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol i wella'r system rheilffyrdd. Felly, yn gyffredinol, gwelwn gynnydd sylweddol.

Ar y pwynt a godasoch ynglŷn ag amserlennu, siaradais â chydweithwyr yng ngogledd Cymru ac anfonais e-bost atynt yn

for details; I have been following that up. I must stress that it is not within my control—in case anyone thinks that it is. It seems to be the result of a rescheduling by Central Trains, and its wish to improve the service. There has been an improved service east to west, but that has affected the connections to north Wales. I hope that we can sort this out by providing information to the timetabling organisations so that this situation can be improved by the autumn. Hopefully we can do something before then.

Mick Bates: I am sure that you have a copy of the Babbie report on your desk, which outlines improvements to north-south travel in Wales. When will you put that report's recommendations into action?

Sue Essex: Not only does not one Committee meeting go by without Mick Bates mentioning the Babbie report, but now not one Plenary goes by without him mentioning it. For those who do not know—I know that that may seem strange to you, Mick, but there are one or two people who do not know what Babbie is—Babbie Group Limited is a consultancy that produced a report on north-south connections. It has become a bible for Mick, but there are people in north Wales who do not necessarily agree with all its recommendations. We must bear that in mind. You are considering the mid Wales areas, Mick, which are your main concern. The report is being taken into account in terms of underpinning the trunk roads system. I will make statements on that, probably towards the end of July. However, as you will know, because you were at the Committee's meeting yesterday, I have said that we would need considerable injections of finance into transport to help to support some of those initiatives.

gofyn am fanylion; yr wyf wedi bod ar drywydd hynny. Rhaid imi bwysleisio nad yw o fewn fy rheolaeth i—rhag ofn i rywun dybio ei fod. Ymddengys mai canlyniad ailamserlennu gan Central Trains yw hyn, a'i ddymuniaid i wella'r gwasanaeth. Bu gwelliant yn y gwasanaeth o'r dwyrain i'r gorllewin, ond mae hynny wedi effeithio ar y cysylltiadau i ogledd Cymru. Gobeithiaf y gallwn ddatrys hyn drwy ddarparu gwybodaeth i'r sefydliadau amserlennu fel y gellir gwella'r sefyllfa erbyn yr hydref. Gobeithio y gallwn wneud rhywbeth cyn hynny.

Mick Bates: Yr wyf yn siŵr bod gennych gopi o adroddiad Babbie ar eich desg, sydd yn amlinellu gwelliannau i deithio o'r gogledd i'r de yng Nghymru. Pryd byddwch chi'n gweithredu argymhellion yr adroddiad hwnnw?

Sue Essex: Nid yn unig y mae'n rhaid i Mick Bates grybwyll adroddiad Babbie ym mhob cyfarfod o'r Pwyllgor, ond mae hynny bellach yn digwydd ym mhob Cyfarfod Llawn. I'r rhai ohonoch nad ydych yn gwybod—gwn fod hynny'n swnio'n rhyfedd i chi, Mick, ond mae un neu ddau o bobl na wyddant beth yw Babbie—ymgynghorwyr a gynhyrchodd adroddiad ar y cysylltiadau rhwng y gogledd a'r de yw Babbie Group Limited. Mae wedi dod yn feibl i Mick, ond mae pobl yng ngogledd Cymru nad ydynt o reidrydd yn cytuno â'i holl argymhellion. Rhaid inni gofio hynny. Yr ydych yn ystyried ardaloedd canolbarth Cymru, Mick, sef eich prif ystyriaeth. Ystyrir yr adroddiad yn nhermau cynnal y system cefnffyrdd. Gwnaf ddatganiadau ar hynny tua diwedd Gorffennaf mae'n debyg. Fodd bynnag, fel y gwyddoch, gan eich bod yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor ddoe, dywedais y byddai angen chwistrelliad sylweddol o arian arnom ar gyfer trafndiaeth i helpu i gynnal rhai o'r mentrau hynny.

Polisi Llosgi Gwastraff Policy on Incineration of Waste

Q3 Alun Cairns: Will the Minister make a statement on her policy toward the incineration of domestic and non-domestic waste? (OAQ11670)

C3 Alun Cairns: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ei pholisi tuag at losgi gwastraff domestig ac annomestig? (OAQ11670)

Sue Essex: I propose to publish a consultation paper in June seeking views on a new waste strategy for Wales that will aim to minimise waste and increase recycling and composting. In keeping with Labour Party policies, the strategy will promote the development of sustainable waste management policies.

Alun Cairns: I am grateful to the Minister for undertaking consultation. However, is she aware of the concerns of the community of Crymlyn Burrows, which is on the border between Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council and the City and County of Swansea, where there are plans to locate an incinerator? Local residents feel that their concerns have been completely ignored. Will the Minister agree to come to the village with me to listen to them, and hear their concerns at first hand?

Sue Essex: The development at Crymlyn Burrows is an integrated facility. It is not solely an incinerator. The waste-to-energy plant, as it is called, is only a part of the process. The facility has had planning permission from Neath Port Talbot council. I understand local concerns because I have received an enormous number of representations on this. I have also been in close contact with my colleague, Val Feld, to whom I wish a speedy recovery. She is not at all well at the moment. However, Val has worked hard on this matter. She organised a public meeting and passed on an enormous number of representations to me, including written representations yet to come through.

In terms of our present situation, this is a matter for the Environment Agency. It is considering the integrated pollution prevention control application. That will study the consideration of the plant's operation. It is really a matter for the Environment Agency now, and nothing can be done until we see what its report says.

Pauline Jarman: It is good to hear that the first priority is to minimise our waste production and that you agree with Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales's emphasis on the need to reuse, recycle or burn in incinerators those resources currently being

Sue Essex: Bwriadaf gyhoeddi papur ymgynghorol ym mis Mehefin yn ceisio barn ar strategaeth wastraff newydd ar gyfer Cymru a fydd yn anelu at leihau gwastraff a chynyddu ailgylchu a chompostio. Yn unol â pholisïau'r Blaid Lafur, bydd y strategaeth yn hyrwyddo datblygiad polisiau rheoli gwastraff cynaliadwy.

Alun Cairns: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am gynnal ymgynghoriad. Fodd bynnag, a ydyw yn ymwybodol o bryderon cymuned Tywyn Crymlyn, sydd ar y ffin rhwng Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Castell Nedd Port Talbot a Dinas a Sir Abertawe, lle ceir cynlluniau i adeiladu llosgydd? Mae trigolion lleol o'r farn bod eu pryderon wedi'u hanwybyddu'n llwyr. A wnaiff y Gweinidog gytuno i ddod i'r pentref gyda mi i wrando arnynt, a chlywed eu pryderon wyneb yn wyneb?

Sue Essex: Cyfleuster integredig yw'r datblygiad yn Nhywyn Crymlyn. Nid llosgydd yn unig ydyw. Dim ond rhan o'r broses yn unig yw'r gwaith sydd yn troi gwastraff yn ynni, fel y'i gelwir. Cafodd y cyfleuster ganiatâd cynllunio gan gyngor Castell Nedd Port Talbot. Deallaf bryderon lleol oherwydd derbyniais nifer helaeth o sylwadau ynglŷn â hyn. Bûm hefyd mewn cysylltiad agos â'm cyd-Aelod, Val Feld, a dymunaf wellhad buan iddi. Nid yw'n dda o gwbl ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, mae Val wedi gweithio'n galed ar y mater hwn. Trefnodd gyfarfod cyhoeddus a throsglwyddodd nifer fawr o sylwadau imi, gan gynnwys sylwadau ysgrifenedig nad ydynt wedi cyrraedd eto.

O ran ein sefyllfa bresennol, mater i Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yw hwn. Mae'n ystyried y cais rheoli atal llygredd integredig. Bydd hynny yn astudio'r ystyriaeth o weithrediad y gwaith. Mewn gwirionedd, mater i Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd ydyw yn awr, ac ni ellir gwneud unrhyw beth tan inni weld beth a ddywed yr adroddiad.

Pauline Jarman: Mae'n dda clywed mai'r flaenoriaeth gyntaf yw lleihau cynhyrchu gwastraff a'ch bod yn cytuno â phwyslais Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales ar yr angen i aildddefnyddio, ailgylchu neu losgi mewn llosgyddion yr adnoddau hynny a

buried in landfill. Will you confirm that this is an ideal opportunity to create jobs in the waste industry and one unparalleled in recent history?

Sue Essex: It is interesting that we are changing the priority from just dumping waste in landfill sites. That is what we have done in the past and we know the problems that arise from that. The Nantygwyddon investigation is interesting. It has revealed not only this aspect of stuff going into landfill, but also the loss of an opportunity to take what we have called 'waste' in the past and turn it into a resource. We must be cleverer about that.

Some good examples in Wales of where we have managed to do that already are Newport Waste Savers and Valleys Furniture Recycling, where they have reused existing facilities. Those projects are excellent examples. Richard Edwards is not here at the moment; however, there is a good example in Pembrokeshire where this has been done. If we can mainstream those best practice examples throughout Wales, that would be an important aspect of the waste strategy. As you said, that would have a knock-on effect of creating jobs from what is, at the moment, just going into holes in the ground.

gleddir ar hyn o bryd mewn safleoedd tirlenwi. A wnewch chi gadarnhau bod hwn yn gyfle delfrydol i greu swyddi yn y diwydiant gwastraff ac yn gyfle digyffelyb mewn hanes diweddar?

Sue Essex: Mae'n ddiddorol ein bod yn newid y flaenoriaeth oddi wrth gladdu mewn safleoedd tirlenwi. Dyna a wnaethom yn y gorffennol a gwyddom y problemau a gyfyd o hynny. Mae ymchwiliad Nantygwyddon yn ddiddorol. Datgelodd nid yn unig yr agwedd hon ar ddeunydd a roddir mewn safle tirlenwi, ond hefyd y cyfle a gollwyd yn y gorffennol i ddefnyddio'r hyn a adwaenwyd fel 'gwastraff' a'i droi'n adnodd. Rhaid inni fod yn fwy clyfar ynglŷn â hynny.

Ambell enghraifft dda yng Nghymru lle y llwyddasom i wneud hynny eisoes yw Newport Waste Savers a Valleys Furniture Recycling, lle maent wedi aildefnyddio cyfleusterau a oedd yn bodoli eisoes. Mae'r prosiectau hynny'n enghreifftiau gwych. Nid yw Richard Edwards yma ar hyn o bryd; fodd bynnag, ceir enghraifft dda yn Sir Benfro lle y gwnaethpwyd hyn. Os gallwn osod yr enghreifftiau hynny o arfer gorau yn y brif ffrwd yng Nghymru, byddai'n agwedd bwysig ar y strategaeth wastraff. Fel y dywedaso, câi hynny sgîl-ffaith o greu swyddi o'r hyn sydd ar hyn o bryd yn llenwi tyllau yn y ddaear.

Ffermydd Gwynt Alltraeth (Proses Gynllunio) Offshore Windfarms (Planning Process)

C4 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: A yw'r Gweinidog yn bwriadu symleiddio'r broses gynllunio ar gyfer ffermydd gwynt alltraeth? (OAQ11634)

Sue Essex: The seaward limit of the planning system in relation to offshore windfarms is mean low watermark. The planning regime does not extend beyond that. Any onshore development associated with an offshore windfarm development requires planning permission. However, the windfarm itself would not be within the scope of the planning system. To extend the planning system offshore would require primary legislation. The Department of Trade and Industry is currently consulting on proposals to streamline the consent regime, which

Q4 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Does the Minister intend to streamline the planning process for offshore windfarms? (OAQ11634)

Sue Essex: Cyfyngiad tua'r môr y system gynllunio mewn perthynas â ffermydd gwynt alltraeth yw'r nod pen llanw isel cymedrig. Nid yw'r system gynllunio yn ymestyn y tu hwnt i hynny. Mae angen caniatâd cynllunio ar unrhyw ddatblygiad ar y tir sydd yn gysylltiedig â datblygu fferm wynt alltraeth. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddai'r fferm wynt ei hun o fewn cwmpas y system gynllunio. Er mwyn ymestyn y system gynllunio alltraeth byddai angen deddfwriaeth sylfaenol. Ar hyn o bryd mae'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant yn ymgynghori ar gynigion i symleiddio'r

obviously includes issues other than planning. Peter Hain and I recently issued a consultation letter asking about the Assembly's role in terms of the planning regime.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yn dilyn ymgynghoriad yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant ar hynny a'i bwriad i symleiddio'r broses, a wnaiff y Gweinidog ystyried adolygu 'Nodyn Cyngor Technegol (Cymru) 8: Ynni Adnewyddadwy' a fyddai'n caniatáu symleiddio'r broses? Byddai'n dangos ein hymrwymiad i ynni adnewyddadwy, sydd yn hollbwysig wrth inni geisio sicrhau ein bod yn trosglwyddo Cymru mewn ffordd gynaliadwy i'r cenedlaethau i ddod.

Sue Essex: The working group that is concerned with renewable energy is examining technical advice note 8. That will be picked up as part of its work.

Alun Pugh: You have called in two sets of onshore proposals in my constituency. The one at Mynydd Llanelian is the focus of considerable local opposition. Offshore proposals are less objectionable. Will your officials, therefore, give the Abergele offshore proposals a fair wind?

Sue Essex: If we were ever to give out awards in the Assembly, then I would give you a gold star for puns, Alun. I did not say that offshore developments do not have related issues with onshore ones; they do. That is where the work done in the Bristol Channel study is helpful. However, as you rightly say, there is not the same amount of conflict with local people since the impact on local communities is not the same. In that regard, there is more support for offshore developments. It seems that that will be the direction in the future.

The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): To reinforce that last point, windfarms on land often raise objections. I certainly understand that and generally sympathise with those objections. Proposals for offshore windfarms certainly raise fewer objections. Will you do what you can to encourage offshore rather than onshore windfarms? Now that this new technology is

system ganiatâd, sydd yn amlwg yn cynnwys materion ar wahân i gynllunio. Yn ddiweddar cyhoeddodd Peter Hain a minnau lythyr ymgynghori yn holi ynghylch rôl y Cynulliad o ran y system gynllunio.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Following the Department of Trade and Industry's consultation on that and its intention to streamline the process, will the Minister consider reviewing 'Technical Advice Note (Wales) 8: Renewable Energy', which would allow the process to be streamlined? That would demonstrate our commitment to renewable energy, which is crucial as we strive to hand over Wales in a sustainable way to future generations.

Sue Essex: Mae'r gweithgor sydd yn gysylltiedig ag ynni adnewyddadwy yn archwilio nodyn cyngor technegol 8. Caiff hynny ei fabwysiadu fel rhan o'i waith.

Alun Pugh: Yr ydych wedi galw dau set o gynigion ar y tir i mewn yn fy etholaeth i. Mae'r un ar Fynydd Llanelian yn destun gwrthwynebiad lleol sylweddol. Mae llai o wrthwynebiadau i gynigion alltraeth. A wnaiff eich swyddogion, felly, roi rhwydd hynnt i gynigion alltraeth Abergele?

Sue Essex: Pe baem byth yn dyfarnu gwobrau yn y Cynulliad, byddwn yn rhoi seren aur ichi am eiriau mwys, Alun. Ni ddywedais nad oes gan ddatblygiadau alltraeth faterion sydd yn gysylltiedig â rhai ar y tir; mae materion cysylltiedig. Dyna lle y mae'r gwaith a wnaethpwyd yn yr astudiaeth o Fôr Hafren yn ddefnyddiol. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedwch yn gywir, nid yr un yw'r gwrthwynebiad ymhlith pobl leol gan nad yw'r effaith ar gymunedau lleol yr un peth. O ran hynny, mae mwy o gefnogaeth ar gyfer datblygiadau alltraeth. Ymddengys mai dyna fydd y cyfeiriad yn y dyfodol.

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): I atgyfnerthu'r pwynt olaf hwnnw, mae ffermydd gwynt ar y tir yn aml yn destun gwrthwynebiadau. Yr wyf yn sicr yn deall hynny ac yn gyffredinol yn cydymdeimlo â'r gwrthwynebiadau hynny. Yn sicr mae cynigion ar gyfer ffermydd gwynt alltraeth yn destun llawer llai o wrthwynebiadau. A wnewch chi bopeth o

developing, will you ensure that the National Assembly gets behind that to encourage windfarms offshore and not on land?

fewn eich gallu er mwyn annog ffermydd gwynt alltraeth yn hytrach nag ar y tir? Gan fod y dechnoleg newydd hon bellach yn datblygu, a wnewch chi sicrhau bod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn gefnogol i hynny ac yn annog ffermydd gwynt alltraeth yn hytrach nag ar y tir?

9:35 a.m.

Sue Essex: Many onshore windfarms cause conflict, although not all. There is still capacity onshore to build windfarms. There is an example of that in the Gwendraeth Valley, which is related to community benefits. The past regime and the way that it was developed did not make the connection between community benefits from windfarms and the impact on communities. There is still much scope for onshore developments where there is support in the local community. However, looking further offshore and how that might develop, there is huge potential around the coast of Wales. We need to consider that and support it where appropriate. However, we also need to consider it as part of the overall strategy on renewable energy that is being developed. There are many other forms of renewable energy that we can bring on stream in Wales, which will come forward over the next few years.

Sue Essex: Mae nifer o ffermydd gwynt ar y tir yn peri anghydfod, ond nid yw hynny'n wir am bob un. Mae lle o hyd ar y tir er mwyn adeiladu ffermydd gwynt. Mae enghraifft o hynny yng Nghwm Gwendraeth, sydd yn gysylltiedig â buddiannau i'r gymuned. Ni wnaeth y system yn y gorffennol a'r ffordd y cafodd ei datblygu y cysylltiad rhwng buddiannau i'r gymuned yn sgil ffermydd gwynt a'r effaith ar gymunedau. Mae llawer o le o hyd ar gyfer datblygiadau ar y tir lle mae cefnogaeth yn y gymuned leol. Fodd bynnag, drwy edrych ymhellach alltraeth, a'r modd y gallai hynny ddatblygu, mae potensial enfawr o amgylch arfordir Cymru. Mae angen inni ystyried hynny a'i gefnogi lle y bo hynny'n briodol. Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni hefyd ei ystyried fel rhan o'r strategaeth gyffredinol ar ynni adnewyddadwy sydd yn cael ei ddatblygu. Ceir sawl ffurf arall ar ynni adnewyddadwy y gallwn ei chyflwyno yng Nghymru, a ddaw i'r amlwg dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf.

Seilwaith Trafnidiaeth Caerdydd Cardiff Transport Infrastructure

Q5 Jonathan Morgan: Will the Minister report on recent changes to the transport infrastructure in Cardiff? (OAQ11641)

C5 Jonathan Morgan: A wnaiff y Gweinidog adrodd ar y newidiadau diweddar a wnaethpwyd i'r seilwaith trafndiaeth yng Nghaerdydd? (OAQ11641)

Sue Essex: It is difficult to know from this general question to what you are referring exactly. How long is recent? What is the transport infrastructure? You could contact Cardiff City and County Council on transport infrastructure issues. The Assembly is responsible for trunk roads and transport grant money. Railtrack also plays its part in transport infrastructure. I hope that your supplementary question will be more specific.

Sue Essex: Mae'n anodd gwybod ar sail y cwestiwn cyffredinol hwn at beth yn union yr ydych yn cyfeirio? Beth yw ystyr diweddar? Beth yw'r seilwaith trafndiaeth? Gallech gysylltu â Chyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd ar faterion seilwaith trafndiaeth. Mae'r Cynulliad yn gyfrifol am gefnffyrdd ac arian grantiau i drafndiaeth. Mae Railtrack hefyd yn chwarae ei ran yn y seilwaith trafndiaeth. Gobeithiaf y bydd eich cwestiwn atodol yn fwy penodol.

Jonathan Morgan: I will try to be more specific. Recent developments in Cardiff Bay, in terms of the new Assembly building and the Wales Millennium Centre, will add to the volume of traffic and the number of people attempting to get to Cardiff Bay. Once these final pieces in the Cardiff Bay jigsaw are put together, there will be clear implications for the transport infrastructure. Can you outline any further developments to complete the peripheral distributor road, which will be essential if we are to make Cardiff Bay the success that it deserves to be?

Sue Essex: At present, Cardiff Bay primarily needs an improved public transport infrastructure.

Jonathan Morgan: Road.

Sue Essex: I do not want someone shouting 'road' at me. I am in the middle of giving an answer. I did not shout at you when you asked your question.

The Presiding Officer: Order. The Minister is answering the question.

Sue Essex: Primarily, we need to concentrate on improving the public transport infrastructure. We have a good rail link to Cardiff Bay, which I, and other Assembly Members, use. However, many people are enthused by the opportunity of introducing light rail as well. It was originally in the scheme and we have supported a feasibility study. It will make an enormous difference to this area and will be a real shot in the arm. One interesting fact in the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee's public transport study is that many Members have gone around the UK—and I believe that somebody went to Frankfurt—looking at different ways to put a transport infrastructure in place. Everyone, without exception, who has come across the new light rail link, has been enthusiastic about it: not just about its impact as a transport facility, but what it means to the general upgrading of the area. It is important that we recognise that and that everyone gets behind it. We are working in partnership with Grosvenor Waterside and other major land users in Cardiff Bay to support green transport and improve the public transport system. On your

Jonathan Morgan: Ceisiaf fod yn fwy penodol. Bydd datblygiadau diweddar ym Mae Caerdydd, o ran adeilad newydd y Cynulliad a Chanolfan Mileniwm Cymru, yn ychwanegu at y traffig a nifer y bobl sydd yn ceisio cyrraedd Bae Caerdydd. Pan fydd darnau terfynol jig-so Bae Caerdydd yn eu lle, bydd goblygiadau amlwg i'r seilwaith trafndiaeth. A allwch amlinellu unrhyw ddatblygiadau pellach er mwyn cwblhau'r ffordd ddosbarthu ymylol, a fydd yn hanfodol os ydym am wneud Bae Caerdydd mor llwyddiannus ag yr haedda fod?

Sue Essex: Ar hyn o bryd, mae angen seilwaith trafndiaeth well yn bennaf ar Fae Caerdydd.

Jonathan Morgan: Ffordd.

Sue Essex: Nid wyf am i rywun weiddi 'ffordd' arnaf i. Yr wyf yng nghanol rhoi ateb. Ni waeddais arnoch chi pan ofynasoch eich cwestiwn.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae'r Gweinidog yn ateb y cwestiwn.

Sue Essex: Yn bennaf, mae angen inni ganolbwyntio ar wella'r seilwaith trafndiaeth gyhoeddus. Mae gennym gysylltiad rheilffordd da i Fae Caerdydd, yr wyf fi, ac Aelodau eraill y Cynulliad, yn ei ddefnyddio. Fodd bynnag, mae nifer o bobl yn llawn brwdfrydedd ynghylch y cyfle o gyflwyno rheilffordd cul hefyd. Yr oedd yn rhan o'r cynllun yn wreiddiol ac yr ydym wedi cefnogi astudiaeth dichonoldeb. Bydd yn gwneud gwahaniaeth enfawr i'r ardal hon ac yn symbyliad gwirioneddol. Un ffaith ddiddorol a ddeilliiodd o astudiaeth trafndiaeth gyhoeddus Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafndiaeth yw bod nifer o Aelodau wedi teithio o amgylch y DU—a chredaf i rywun fynd i Frankfurt—yn edrych ar ddulliau gwahanol o osod seilwaith trafndiaeth yn ei le. Mae pawb, yn ddieithriad, a ddaeth ar draws y cysylltiad rheilffordd gul newydd, wedi bod yn frwdfrydig yn ei gylch: nid dim ond ynghylch ei effaith fel cyfleuster trafndiaeth, ond ynghylch yr hyn y mae'n ei olygu o ran moderneiddio'r ardal yn gyffredinol. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cydnabod hynny a bod pawb yn ei gefnogi. Yr ydym yn cydweithio

specific point about the peripheral distributor road, we have come together with Cardiff City and County Council to consider innovative ways in which the eastern link of the peripheral distributor road might be achieved. The council is having discussions with the private sector. There is a great deal of hope that a private-public partnership will come out of that to achieve that final link to the Bay.

Kirsty Williams: When looking to help people travel to Cardiff from further afield, will you ensure that objections in north Wales to the Babbie report will not jeopardise the chances of people in Newbridge-on-Wye, Rhayader and Builth Wells of having a much needed by-pass relief road?

Sue Essex: I do not think that objections raised by people in north Wales would specifically undermine those proposals in your area, on which you are keen. It was more a general issue about whether the strategic route should be the A470 or the A49. It is our duty to listen to all comments. We frequently discuss the needs of mid Wales in Committee. Those trunk roads are a part of the local infrastructure. I assure you that that will be taken into account.

The Presiding Officer: Order. I am afraid that I exercised far too much latitude on that question. Jonathan Morgan's question was about Cardiff and although many of us travel between mid and north Wales and Cardiff, it was not exactly relevant, but I will let it pass for today.

mewn partneriaeth â Grosvenor Waterside a defnyddwyr tir mawr eraill ym Mae Caerdydd er mwyn cefnogi trafndiaeth werdd a gwella'r system drafndiaeth gyhoeddus. Ynglŷn â'ch pwynt penodol ar y ffordd ddsbarthu ymylol, yr ydym wedi cydweithio â Chyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd er mwyn ystyried ffyrdd dyfeisgar o wireddu cyswllt dwyreiniol y ffordd ddsbarthu ymylol. Mae'r cyngor yn cynnal trafodaethau â'r sector preifat. Gobeithiwn yn fawr y bydd partneriaeth breifat a chyhoeddus yn deillio o hynny er mwyn gwireddu'r cyswllt olaf hwnnw â'r Bae.

Kirsty Williams: Wrth geisio cynorthwyo pobl i deithio i Gaerdydd o ardaloedd pell a sicrhewch na fydd gwrthwynebiadau yng ngogledd Cymru i adroddiad Babbie yn niweidio gobaith pobl Y Bontnewydd ar Wy, Rhaeadr, a Llanfair ym Muallt i gael ffordd osgoi sydd ei hangen yn ddirfawr?

Sue Essex: Ni chredaf y byddai gwrthwynebiadau a godir gan bobl gogledd Cymru yn tansilio'n benodol y cynigion hynny yn eich ardal, yr ydych mor frwdfrydig yn eu cylch. Yr oedd yn fater mwy cyffredinol ynghylch pa un ai'r A470 neu'r A49 ddylai fod yn ffordd strategol. Ein dyletswydd yw gwrando ar yr holl sylwadau. Trafodwn anghenion canolbarth Cymru yn aml iawn mewn Pwyllgorau. Mae'r cefnffyrdd hynny'n rhan o seilwaith lleol. Fe'ch sicrhaf yr ystyrir hynny.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae arnaf ofn imi ganiatáu llawer gormod o ryddid ar y cwestiwn hwnnw. Yr oedd cwestiwn Jonathan Morgan yn ymwneud â Chaerdydd ac er bod llawer ohonom yn teithio rhwng canolbarth a gogledd Cymru a Chaerdydd, nid oedd yn hollol berthnasol, ond anwybyddaf hynny am heddiw.

Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order

Nick Bourne: Point of order. I raise this under Standing Order No. 18. I had sought to get in touch with Rhodri Morgan's office on this matter; I had anticipated that he would be here today. I quote from the record of proceedings from Tuesday, when the First

Nick Bourne: Pwynt o drefn. Codaf hyn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 18. Ceisiais gysylltu â swyddfa Rhodri Morgan ynglŷn â'r mater hwn, gan imi ragweld y byddai yma heddiw. Dyfynnaf o gofnod y trafodion ddydd Mawrth, pan ddywedodd y Prif Weinidog:

Minister said:

'I do not believe, Dafydd, that you will find any example of me prejudicing the right and proper purpose of forensic investigation, which could possibly lead to criminal investigation and a trial.'

There he was in 'holy Joe' mode on Tuesday. However, would he be in a position to comment on a phone call that he made to Russell Goodway on Sunday evening seeking to put pressure on Peter Perkins, the Labour Welsh Joint Education Committee member for Cardiff, not to refer the matter to the police? That raises serious issues of interference with proper police processes. He told us that due process was important and sought to give lectures to one and all on his view of what the law should be. Is that not outrageous? This Germangate issue has gone on for long enough. Does it not demonstrate weakness and now hypocrisy?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Further to that point of order, and referring to the debate on Tuesday, I distinctly recall the First Minister telling us that he had not read the report. I am somewhat bemused that he would then phone Russell Goodway on Sunday evening, having not read the report, to ask his councillor to pull that report. It seems strange that he had presumed that the report would be damning even though he had not read it.

The Presiding Officer: Order. This is not a matter for me.

Alun Cairns: This point of order is reminiscent of the point of order that I raised last week, when I mentioned a written question I had tabled to the First Minister in which I asked him whether he would detail his personal communications with the WJEC. He completely ignored the question and referred me to previous questions that I had tabled to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning. It seems clear now that the First Minister has played a leading role in this matter. Questions need to be answered.

The Presiding Officer: Order. That is a

'Ni chredaf, Dafydd, y byddwch yn dod o hyd i unrhyw enghraifft lle yr wyf yn rhagfarnu diben cywir a phriodol ymchwiliad fforensig, a allai o bosibl arwain at ymchwiliad troseddol a threial.'

Yr oedd yn gwisgo'i gap sanctaidd ddydd Mawrth. Fodd bynnag, a allai gynnig sylw ar alwad ffôn a wnaeth i Russell Goodway yn gynnar nos Sul yn ceisio rhoi pwysau ar Peter Perkins, yr aelod Llafur dros Gaerdydd ar Gyd Bwyllgor Addysg Cymru, i beidio â rhoi'r mater yn nwylo'r heddlu? Mae hynny'n codi materion difrifol o ymyrraeth â phrosesau cywir yr heddlu. Dywedodd wrthym fod prosesau cyfiawn yn bwysig a cheisiodd roi darlithoedd i bob copa walltog ar ei farn ynghylch yr hyn y dylai'r gyfraith fod. Onid yw hynny'n warthus? Mae'r mater Germangate hwn wedi parhau yn ddigon hir. Onid yw hynny'n dangos gwendid a bellach yn dangos rhagrith?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw i drefn, a chan gyfeirio at y ddatl ddydd Mawrth, mae gennyf gof clir i Brif Weinidog Cymru ddweud wrthym na ddarllenodd yr adroddiad. Synnaf y byddai wedyn yn ffonio Russell Goodway yn gynnar nos Sul, heb fod wedi darllen yr adroddiad, er mwyn gofyn i'w gynghorydd ddylanwadu ar yr adroddiad hwnnw. Ymddengys yn rhyfedd iddo gymryd yn ganiataol y byddai'r adroddiad yn ddamniol er nad oedd wedi'i ddarllen.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid mater i mi yw hyn.

Alun Cairns: Mae'r pwynt hwn o drefn yn adleisio pwynt o drefn a godais yr wythnos diwethaf, pan grybwyllais gwestiwn ysgrifenedig a gyflwynais gerbron y Prif Weinidog yn gofyn iddo a fyddai'n manylu ar ei ohebiaeth bersonol gyda CBAC. Anwybyddodd y cwestiwn yn llwyr a'm cyfeirio at gwestiynau blaenorol a gyflwynais gerbron y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Mae bellach yn amlwg i'r Prif Weinidog chwarae rhan flaenllaw yn y mater hwn. Rhaid cael atebion i gwestiynau.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae hwnnw'n bwynt ar

separate point to which I replied at the time. The content of answers and whether they are transferred is a matter for Ministers.

Rod Richards: Further to that point of order, I seek guidance on your powers regarding a Member telling the truth or not in this Chamber. If it were to emerge that a Member did not tell the truth in this Chamber what powers would you have to redress that situation as far as the Assembly is concerned?

The Presiding Officer: I am afraid that I am not Pontius Pilate.

Cynog Dafis: Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, a deimlwch y dylai bod rheidrwydd ar Brif Weinidog Cymru i ddatgan o flaen y Cynulliad ei farn ar wirionedd, neu fel arall yr honiadau a wnaethpwyd? Ymhellach, a oes gennych unrhyw sylwadau ynghylch priodoldeb y ffaith fod cyngor gan y Cwnsler Cyffredinol ar gael i Brif Weinidog Cymru ar ystyriaethau gwleidyddol ac nid yn unig ar ystyriaethau priodoldeb a chyfraith?

Y Llywydd: Nid yw hynny ychwaith yn fater i mi. Y mae'r cyngor y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru yn dymuno gofyn amdano gan swyddog cyfreithiol yn fater rhwng y Prif Weinidog a'r swyddog cyfreithiol.

Rhag ofn i rywun gamddeall fy nghyfeiriad ysgrythurol yn gynt, roeddwn yn cyfeirio at gwestiwn Pontius Peilat, 'beth yw gwirionedd?' Nid oeddwn yn awgrymu fy mod yn bwriadu golchi fy nwylo o unrhyw fater sydd gerbron—

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Nid yw croeshoelio'n gweithio felly?

Y Llywydd: Mae hynny'n dangos mai camgymeriad yw gwneud cyfeiriadau ysgrythurol.

Reverting to the original point of order, what is on the record is on the record. Clearly, it is not a matter for me to interpret what has been said in debate. However, I consider these matters as being of public importance. I will, at the appropriate time, if I receive a request,

wahân y rhoddais ateb iddo ar y pryd. Mae cynnwys atebion a pha un a gânt eu trosglwyddo ai peidio yn fater i'r Gweinidogion.

Rod Richards: Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, ceisiaf arweiniad ar eich pwerau ynghylch Aelod sydd yn dweud y gwir neu beidio yn y Siambr hon. Pe bai'n dod i'r amlwg na ddywedodd Aelod y gwir yn y Siambr hon pa bwerau sydd gennych i unioni'r sefyllfa o ran y Cynulliad?

Y Llywydd: Ofnaf nad Pontius Peilat mohonof.

Cynog Dafis: Further to that point of order, do you feel that the First Minister should be required to state before the Assembly his position on the veracity or otherwise of the allegations that have been made? Furthermore, do you have any comments on the propriety of the fact that the First Minister can receive advice from the Counsel General on political considerations and not only on considerations covering propriety and the law?

The Presiding Officer: That is not a matter for me either. The advice that the First Minister wishes to seek from a legal official is a matter between the First Minister and the legal official.

In case someone misunderstood my earlier scriptural reference, I was referring to Pontius Pilate's question, 'what is the truth?' I was not suggesting that I intended to wash my hands of any matter before us—

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Crucifixion does not work then?

The Presiding Officer: That proves that making scriptural references is a mistake.

Gan ddod yn ôl at y pwynt o drefn gwreiddiol, mae'r hyn a geir yn y cofnod yn y cofnod. Yn amlwg, nid mater i mi yw dehongli yr hyn a ddywedwyd mewn dadl. Fodd bynnag, ystyriaeth fod y materion hyn o bwysigrwydd cyhoeddus. Byddaf, ar yr adeg

consider whether the Assembly wants the opportunity to vote on whether it wishes to debate this matter.

9:45 a.m.

William Graham: Further to that point of order, in view of the public attention that this matter is receiving, can I ask you to consider a request for a debate, so that all points of view may be aired as soon as possible?

The Presiding Officer: I am grateful to you for enabling me to say that under Standing Order No. 6.9 a Member may propose that the Assembly should consider immediately a matter of urgent public importance, having previously obtained the Presiding Officer's permission. You have not requested that permission, therefore, I have not had an opportunity to take a view on this matter. If I receive a request, I will take a view. I do not consider it appropriate for me to speculate now as to what that view would be.

Rod Richards: Point of order. If a Member were to mislead the Assembly knowingly or unknowingly, would that Member be required to apologise to the Assembly?

The Presiding Officer: The content of Members' speeches and answers to questions in the Chamber, provided that they are in order, is a matter for them. There will be points of fact, dispute and argument. These are matters for me. I am charged with ensuring that what is said is in order.

Rod Richards: Further to that, if a Member were to acknowledge that he or she had misled the Assembly inadvertently, would that Member be required to apologise to the Assembly?

The Presiding Officer: That is a matter for the Member concerned. It is not a matter for me, provided that what is said is in order.

briodol, os derbyniaf gais, yn ystyried a yw'r Cynulliad am gael y cyfle i bleidleisio ar ba un a yw am gynnal dadl ar y mater hwn.

William Graham: Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, o ystyried y sylw cyhoeddus y mae'r mater hwn yn ei dderbyn, a allaf ofyn ichi ystyried cais am ddadl, fel bod modd i bob safbwynt gael ei wyntyllu cyn gynted â phosibl?

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am alluogi imi ddweud o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.9 y gall Aelod gynnig y dylai'r Cynulliad ystyried mater o bwysigrwydd cyhoeddus brys ar unwaith, ar ôl derbyn caniatâd y Llywydd ymlaen llaw. Ni ofynasoch am y caniatâd hwnnw, felly, ni chefais gyfle i benderfynu ar y mater hwn. Pe derbyniwn gais, fe benderfynwn. Nid ystyriaif y byddai'n briodol imi ddamcaniaethu yn awr ynghylch beth fyddai'r penderfyniad hwnnw.

Rod Richards: Pwynt o drefn. Pe bai Aelod yn camarwain y Cynulliad yn fwriadol neu'n anfwriadol, a fyddai'n rhaid i'r Aelod hwnnw ymddiheuro i'r Cynulliad?

Y Llywydd: Mater i'r Aelodau yw cynnwys eu hareithiau a'u hatebion i gwestiynau yn y Siambr, ar yr amod eu bod mewn trefn. Bydd pwyntiau sydd yn ffeithiau, yn destun anghydfod a dadl. Materion i mi yw'r rhain. Fy nyletswydd i yw sicrhau bod yr hyn a ddywedir mewn trefn.

Rod Richards: Ymhellach i hynny, pe bai Aelod yn cydnabod iddo ef neu hi gamarwain y Cynulliad drwy amryfusedd, a fyddai'n rhaid i'r Aelod hwnnw ymddiheuro i'r Cynulliad?

Y Llywydd: Mater i'r Aelod dan sylw yw hynny. Nid mater i mi ydyw, ar yr amod bod yr hyn a ddywedir mewn trefn.

Dyfarniad dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 5.6 Determination under Standing Order No. 5.6

The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies): Further to my announcement on 22 May 2001, I inform the

Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Ymhellach i'm cyhoeddiad ar 22 Mai 2001, hysbysaf y Cynulliad ar ôl ystyried ei ymdriniaeth yn y

Assembly that following consideration of its handling in the Business Committee on Tuesday, the Deputy Presiding Officer has determined, under Standing Order No. 22.5, that the Transport Act (2000) (Commencement No. 1) (Wales) Order 2001 has been referred to the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee, which has a remit to report back to the Assembly within four weeks.

Pwyllgor Busnes ddydd Mawrth, penderfynodd y Dirprwy Lywydd, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.5, gyfeirio Gorchymyn Deddf Trafnidiaeth (2000) (Cychwyn Rhif 1) (Cymru) 2001 i Bwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth sydd â chylch gwaith i adrodd yn ôl i'r Cynulliad o fewn pedair wythnos.

Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion Composite Motion: Approval of Orders

Y Llywydd: Cynigir y cynnig hwn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25, ac felly nid yw'n destun dadl.

The Presiding Officer: This motion is proposed under Standing Order No. 22.25, and therefore is not subject to debate.

The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies): I propose that

Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly, acting under Standing Order No. 22.25,

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25,

approves the Relocation Grants (Forms of Application) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2001 laid in the Table Office on 1 May 2001;

yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Grantiau Adleoli (Ffurflenni Cais) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2001 a gyflwynwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 1 Mai 2001;

considers the report of the Legislation Committee, which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Relocation Grants (Forms of Application) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 8 May 2001;

yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau sydd heb nodi unrhyw fater sy'n destun pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Grantiau Adleoli (Ffurflenni Cais)(Diwygio)(Cymru) 2001, a gyflwynwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 8 Mai 2001;

approves the Education (Publication of Draft Proposals and Orders) (Further Education Corporations) (Wales) Regulations 2001 laid in the Table Office on 1 May 2001;

yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Addysg (Cyhoeddi Cynigion a Gorchmynion Drafft)(Corfforaethau Addysg Bellach) (Cymru) 2001 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 1 Mai 2001;

considers the report of the Legislation Committee, which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Education (Publication of Draft Proposals and Orders) (Further Education Corporations) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 8 May 2001 and the Memorandum of Corrections laid in Table Office on 16 May 2001;

yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau sydd heb nodi unrhyw fater sy'n destun pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Addysg (Cyhoeddi Cynigion a Gorchmynion Drafft) (Corfforaethau Addysg Bellach) (Cymru) 2001 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 8 Mai 2001 a'r Memorandwm o Gywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 16 Mai 2001;

approves the Housing Renewal Grants (Prescribed Forms and Particulars) (Amendment)(Wales) Regulations 2001 laid

yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Grantiau Adnewyddu Tai (Ffurflen a Manylion a Ragnodir)(Diwygio)(Cymru) 2001 a osodwyd

<i>in the Table Office on 1 May 2001; and</i>	<i>yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 1 Mai 2001;</i>
<i>considers the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Housing Renewal Grants (Prescribed Forms and Particulars) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 8 May 2001;</i>	<i>yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau sydd heb nodi unrhyw fater sy'n destun pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Grantiau Adnewyddu Tai (Ffurflen a Manylion a Ragnodir)(Diwygio)(Cymru) 2001 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 8 Mai 2001;</i>
<i>approves the Housing Grants (Additional Purposes) (Wales) Order 2001 laid in the Table Office on 1 May 2001;</i>	<i>yn cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Grantiau Tai (Dibenion Ychwanegol)(Cymru) 2001 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 1 Mai 2001;</i>
<i>considers the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Housing Grants (Additional Purposes) (Wales) Order 2001, laid in the Table Office on 8 May 2001;</i>	<i>yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau sydd heb nodi unrhyw fater sy'n destun pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Grantiau Tai (Dibenion Ychwanegol) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 8 Mai 2001.</i>
<i>approves the Housing Renewal Grants (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 1 May 2001; and</i>	<i>yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Grantiau Adnewyddu Tai (Diwygio)(Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 1 Mai 2001; ac</i>
<i>considers the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Housing Renewal Grants (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 8 May 2001.</i>	<i>yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau sydd heb nodi unrhyw fater sy'n destun pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Grantiau Adnewyddu Tai (Diwygio)(Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 8 Mai 2001.</i>

*Cynnig: O blaid 40, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 40, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine

Halford, Alison
 Hancock, Brian
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Richards, Rod
 Rogers, Peter
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion adopted.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 9.47 a.m.
 The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 9.47 a.m.*

Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai ar Drosglwyddo'r Stoc Tai The Local Government and Housing Committee Report on Housing Stock Transfer

Gwenda Thomas: Cynigiaf fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 9.9, yn nodi'r adroddiad oddi wrth y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai o'r enw 'Arolwg Polisi o Drosglwyddo Stoc Tai' a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 15 Mai 2001.

Mae'n bleser gennyf gyflwyno adroddiad y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai, yn dilyn ei adolygiad polisi o drosglwyddo stoc tai, i'r Cyfarfod Llawn. Mae'n briodol bod adolygiad polisi cyntaf y Pwyllgor yn ymwneud â thai, o gofio'r flaenoriaeth a roddwn i sicrhau bod gan bawb yng Nghymru gartref gweddus. Mae tai da yn hanfodol ar gyfer hybu gwell iechyd, cynorthwyo i orsegyn allgáu cymdeithasol, ac annog datblygu cymunedau bywiog a hyderus. Er mwyn llwyddo i wneud hyn, rhaid inni ymdrin â chyflwr gwael llawer o'r stoc tai cyngor ar fyrder. Wedi blynyddoedd o esgeulustod, mae'n ofynnol gwario'n helaeth er mwyn codi'r tai cyngor i safon sydd yn dderbyniol.

Gwenda Thomas: I propose that

the National Assembly, in accordance with Standing Order No. 9.9, notes the report from the Local Government and Housing Committee entitled 'The Policy Review of Housing Stock Transfer', which was laid in the Table Office on 15 May 2001.

It is a pleasure for me to present the Local Government and Housing Committee report, following its policy review of housing stock transfer, to Plenary. It is appropriate that the Committee's first policy review concerns housing, bearing in mind the priority that we give to ensuring that everyone in Wales has a decent home. Good housing is essential to promoting better health, to providing assistance to overcome social exclusion, and to promoting the development of vibrant and confident communities. To achieve this we must tackle the poor conditions of much of our council housing stock urgently. After years of neglect, we have to spend a significant amount in order to raise council housing to an acceptable standard.

O dan yr amgylchiadau hyn, ni oeddodd y Pwyllgor pan etifeddodd gynnig gan y cyn Bwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a'r Amgylchedd i ymgymryd ag adolygiad o drosglwyddo'r stoc tai. Prif ffocws yr adolygiad oedd polisi'r Cabinet ar drosglwyddo stoc tai'r awdurdodau lleol i berchnogaeth y gymuned. Archwiliodd hefyd unrhyw ddulliau eraill a fyddai'n cynhyrchu'r arian sydd yn angenrheidiol ar gyfer ymdrin â'r gwaith trwsio hanfodol a'r gwaith moderneiddio sydd wedi cronni ers blynnyddoedd.

The review was undertaken through a wide-ranging written consultation exercise, oral consultation sessions with the key bodies, a number of informal briefings and a series of visits. On the latter, the Committee was particularly keen to learn about the well-established transfer programme in England, which has undoubtedly been a considerable success. Much of the initial work on the review was to try to identify the scale of the problem with the council housing stock in Wales. Unfortunately, it soon became clear to the Committee that there are no definitive estimates of the size of the backlog of repair and improvement work. Most estimates are in the range of £750 million to £1 billion, although that is undoubtedly a conservative estimate that takes no account of the significant costs that would be involved in securing the necessary environmental improvements to council housing estates. The Committee concluded that the most straightforward way of tackling the backlog of repair work would simply be—

Janet Ryder: You alluded to us not knowing the extent of the problem. Do you not agree therefore that we need an all-Wales housing needs survey? If you agree, do you believe that the Committee should consider that and ask the Minister responsible to progress an all-Wales housing needs survey?

Gwenda Thomas: I am here today to present the Committee's recommendations. You know that that issue has been widely debated in Committee. It is covered by a recommendation and you should have put that forward in your contribution. Every member of the Committee has been given

Under these circumstances, the Committee did not hesitate when it inherited a proposal from the former Local Government and Environment Committee to undertake a review of housing stock transfer. The main focus of the review has been the Cabinet's policy on the transfer of the local authority housing stock into community ownership. It also investigated alternative approaches that could generate the finance that is necessary to tackle the essential repair and modernisation work that has amassed over the years.

Cynhaliwyd yr adolygiad drwy gyfrwng ymarfer ymgynghori ysgrifenedig ar raddfa eang, sesiynau ymgynghori llafar gyda chyrrff allweddol, nifer o sesiynau briffio anffurfiol a chyfres o ymweliadau. O ran yr olaf, yr oedd y Pwyllgor yn arbennig o awyddus i ddysgu am y rhaglen drosglwyddo hirsefydledig yn Lloegr, a fu'n llwyddiant ysgubol heb amheuaeth. Yr oedd llawer o waith cychwynnol ar yr adolygiad yn ymwneud â cheisio nodi maint y broblem gyda'r stoc tai cyngor yng Nghymru. Yn anffodus, daeth yn amlwg i'r Pwyllgor yn fuan nad oes unrhyw amcangyfrifon pendant am faint y gwaith trwsio a gwella sydd wedi cronni. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o amcangyfrifon yn amrywio rhwng £750 miliwn ac £1 biliwn, er bod hyn yn ddi-os yn amcangyfrif ceidwadol nad yw'n ystyried y costau sylweddol a fyddai'n rhan o sicrhau'r gwelliannau amgylcheddol angenrheidiol i stadau tai cyngor. Daeth y Pwyllgor i'r casgliad mai'r dull mwyaf uniongyrchol o ymdrin â'r ôl-groniad o waith trwsio yn syml iawn fyddai—

Janet Ryder: Cyfeiriasoch at y ffaith na wyddom faint y broblem. Oni chytunwch felly bod angen arolwg o anghenion tai Cymru gyfan arnom? Os cytunwch, a gredwch y dylai'r Pwyllgor ystyried hynny a gofyn i'r Gweinidog sydd yn gyfrifol fwrw ymlaen ag arolwg o anghenion tai Cymru gyfan?

Gwenda Thomas: Yr wyf yma heddiw i gyflwyno argymhellion y Pwyllgor. Gwyddoch bod y mater hwnnw wedi ei drafod yn helaeth yn y Pwyllgor. Fe'i cwmpesir gan argymhelliad a dylech fod wedi sôn am hyn yn eich cyfraniad. Mae pob aelod o'r Pwyllgor wedi cael digon o amser i

adequate time to make these points and I am surprised that you raise this now, Janet.

Councils would be able to retain ownership and control of their housing and borrow to finance the investment necessary to modernise their housing stock. Unfortunately, this approach is ruled out by the restrictive public sector borrowing requirement rules. However, the Committee was aware of other public sector accounting conventions, such as a general government financial deficit that would allow local authorities to borrow for productive investment and create a level playing field between the public and private sectors. The Committee's main recommendation is that the Cabinet should press for this change in the public sector accounting conventions. It is aware that Ministers have already raised this point with the UK Government, but it feels that the Cabinet should continue to bring pressure to bear on the Treasury, particularly at a time when discussions are ongoing over the future of the local government finance system. Once it had reached that conclusion, the Committee considered how the problems with the state of our council housing might be tackled with the existing financial framework. Authorities can retain their social housing and continue to invest in repairs and maintenance using their own resources and those made available by the National Assembly.

9:55 a.m.

However, this ignores both the massive scale of the backlog and the fact that the problem is getting steadily worse. One recent estimate is that £80 million a year, in addition to current levels of expenditure, is required simply to prevent further deterioration. With a clear warning from the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities to be realistic about resources, it seems highly unlikely that many authorities could modernise their housing stock with the resources available to them. This means that, for most authorities, the status quo is not a practical option. In practice, this would amount to a continuing deterioration in their housing stock. In light of this, the Committee came to the view that, in many cases, the most realistic options for securing the necessary investment are for

wneud y pwyntiau hyn a synnaf eich bod yn codi hyn yn awr, Janet.

Byddai cynghorau yn gallu cadw perchenogaeth a rheolaeth o'u tai a benthycu i ariannu'r buddsoddiad angenrheidiol er mwyn moderneiddio eu stoc tai. Yn anffodus, diystyrir yr ymagwedd hon gan reolau cyfyngol y gofyniad benthycu sector cyhoeddus. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd y Pwyllgor yn ymwybodol o gonfensiynau cyfrifo eraill yn y sector cyhoeddus, megis diffyg ariannol cyffredinol llywodraeth a fyddai'n caniatáu i awdurdodau lleol fenthycu ar gyfer buddsoddiad cynhyrchiol a chreu maes chwarae gwastad rhwng y sector cyhoeddus a'r sector preifat. Prif argymhelliad y Pwyllgor yw y dylai'r Cabinet bwysu er mwyn creu'r newid hwn yng nghonfensiynau cyfrifo'r sector cyhoeddus. Mae'n ymwybodol bod Gweinidogion eisoes wedi codi'r pwynt hwn gyda Llywodraeth y DU, ond teimlai y dylai'r Cabinet barhau i roi pwysau ar y Trysorlys, yn arbennig ar adeg pan fo trafodaethau'n parhau am ddyfodol system arian llywodraeth leol. Wedi iddo ddod i'r casgliad hwnnw, aeth y Pwyllgor ati i ystyried y modd y gellir ymdrin â chyflwr ein tai cyngor â'r fframwaith ariannol sydd yn bodoli eisoes. Gall awdurdodau gadw eu tai cymdeithasol a pharhau i fuddsoddi mewn atgyweiriadau a chynnal a chadw tai gan ddefnyddio eu hadnoddau eu hunain a'r rhai a roddir iddynt gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

Fodd bynnag, anwybyddia hyn yr ôl-groniad gwaith enfawr a'r ffaith bod y broblem yn gwaethgu'n raddol. Nododd un amcangyfrif diweddar bod angen £80 miliwn y flwyddyn, yn ychwanegol at y lefelau gwariant presennol, dim ond er mwyn atal unrhyw ddirywiad pellach. Yn dilyn rhybudd clir gan y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau i fod yn realistig o ran hadnoddau, ymddengys yn hynod annhebygol y gallai nifer o awdurdodau foderneiddio eu stoc tai gyda'r hadnoddau sydd ar gael iddynt. Golyga hyn nad yw'r sefyllfa bresennol yn opsiwn ymarferol i'r rhan fwyaf o awdurdodau. Yn ymarferol, byddai hyn yn golygu dirywiad parhaus yn eu stoc tai. Yng ngoleuni hyn, daeth y Cynulliad i'r casgliad mai'r opsiynau mwyaf realistig, mewn nifer o

local authorities either to transfer their stock to a registered social landlord or to pursue a private finance initiative scheme.

In particular, the Committee concluded that stock transfer, with appropriate safeguards for tenants, should continue to be an option available to local authorities for modernising their housing stock. The Committee was aware of two other options, namely arms-length housing management companies and the major repairs allowance. Those options were included in the recent consultation paper on the national housing strategy, 'Better Homes for People in Wales'. However, if implemented, neither of these options would generate any additional resources for local authority housing.

I have highlighted the Committee's main conclusions. We made 30 recommendations, some of them quite detailed, for the Assembly Cabinet to consider. Although I do not have time to outline those today, I will highlight common themes. First, there is the need to devise local solutions to local problems, with local authorities able to determine what is most appropriate for their housing from the range of available options. Secondly, there is the need for genuine consultation with tenants and staff at an early stage in the options appraisal process. Consultation should take place before the local authority has decided its own position, even if that means a two-stage process. Thirdly, there is the need for housing to be considered in the context of the wider community regeneration agenda, with investment decisions on council housing consistent with the local regeneration strategy. Finally, there is the urgent need for better information on the condition of the council housing stock. There should be an independent evaluation of stock transfer in due course.

I hope that Committee members feel that I have given a balanced summary of our deliberations on housing stock transfer. I thank Committee members, past and present, for their work on the review. I also place on record my gratitude to Judy Wayne, the

achosion, ar gyfer sicrhau'r buddsoddiad angenrheidiol, fyddai i awdurdodau lleol naill ai drosglwyddo eu stoc i landlord cymdeithasol cofrestredig neu ddilyn cynllun menter cyllid preifat.

Yn benodol, daeth y Pwyllgor i'r casgliad y dylai trosglwyddo stoc, gydag amodau diogelu priodol ar gyfer tenantiaid, barhau i fod yn opsiwn sydd ar gael i awdurdodau lleol ar gyfer moderneiddio eu stoc tai. Yr oedd y Pwyllgor yn ymwybodol o ddau opsiwn arall, sef cwmnïau rheoli tai hyd braich a'r lwfans atgyweiriadau sylweddol. Cafodd yr opsiynau hynny eu cynnwys yn y papur ymgynghori diweddar ar y strategaeth tai genedlaethol, 'Cartrefi Gwell i Bobl Cymru'. Fodd bynnag, os cânt eu gweithredu, ni fyddai'r un o'r opsiynau hyn yn creu unrhyw adnoddau ychwanegol ar gyfer tai llywodraeth leol.

Amlygais brif gasgliadau'r Pwyllgor. Gwnaethom 30 o argymhellion, rhai ohonynt yn eithaf manwl, er mwyn i Gabinet y Cynulliad eu hystyried. Er nad oes gennyf amser heddiw i amlinellu'r rheini, amlygaf themâu cyffredin. Yn gyntaf, mae angen llunio atebion lleol i broblemau lleol, gydag awdurdodau lleol yn gallu penderfynu ar yr hyn sydd fwyaf priodol i'w tai o'r amrywiaeth o opsiynau sydd ar gael. Yn ail, mae angen ymgynghori gwirioneddol gyda thenantiaid a staff yn gynnar yn y broses arfarnu opsiynau. Dylai'r ymgynghori ddigwydd cyn i'r awdurdod lleol benderfynu ar ei sefyllfa'i hun, hyd yn oed os bydd hynny'n golygu proses dau-gam. Yn drydydd, mae angen ystyried tai yng nghydestun agenda ehangach adfywio cymunedau, gan sicrhau bod penderfyniadau buddsoddi ar dai cyngor yn gyson â'r strategaeth adfywio leol. Yn olaf, mae angen gwell gwybodaeth am gyflwr stoc tai cyngor ar fyrder. Dylid cynnal gwerthusiad annibynnol o drosglwyddo stoc maes o law.

Gobeithiaf y bydd aelodau'r Pwyllgor yn teimlo imi roi crynodeb cytbwys o'n trafodaethau ar drosglwyddo stoc tai. Diolchaf i aelodau'r Pwyllgor, yn gyn aelodau ac aelodau presennol, am eu gwaith ar yr adolygiad. Cofnodaf hefyd fy niolch i

Committee's expert adviser, for her help in guiding us through some of the more technical issues. I also thank the numerous bodies that submitted views or otherwise contributed to the review. Finally, I thank the Committee clerk, Martin Stevenson, and his team for supporting the Committee throughout the review.

I am delighted to present this report to Plenary. No doubt, the Assembly Cabinet will consider the Committee's recommendations in the context of the emerging national housing strategy. I am sure that Edwina will keep Members informed of those deliberations.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I remind Members that they should limit their speeches to five minutes, except for the Minister, who will have eight minutes to respond to the debate.

Janet Davies: I thank the Chair for her report on housing stock transfer. As Gwenda said, the Committee has agreed on many actions that will help tenants in such a transfer, including the need for a full housing condition and needs survey. Janet Ryder raised that issue several times in Committee.

It is important that we consider the rationale of this issue, because it is about Government intervention in housing tenure. Plaid Cymru takes the view that, when Government intervention in any sector is needed, the problem should be described accurately, a cause should be defined and the problem should be addressed in the simplest, most focused, and least traumatic way possible. The Plaid Cymru group on the Local Government and Housing Committee has used that logical and rational approach consistently in the view that is has taken on housing stock transfer, in the contributions that it has made to the debate and in responses within the Committee. We continue to do so.

The reasons for pushing local government towards stock transfer, and now offering it as an option among others, are dictated by a financial imperative. We cannot ignore the

Judy Wayne, ymgynghorydd arbenigol y Pwyllgor, am ei chymorth yn ein tywys drwy rai o'r materion mwy technegol. Diolchaf hefyd i'r cyrff niferus a gyflwynodd sylwadau neu a gyfrannodd i'r adolygiad fel arall. Yn olaf, hoffwn ddiolch i glerc y Pwyllgor, Martin Stevenson, a'i dîm am gynorthwyo'r Pwyllgor drwy gydol yr adolygiad.

Yr wyf yn hynod o falch o gyflwyno'r adroddiad hwn i'r Cyfarfod Llawn. Yn ddiau, bydd Cabinet y Cynulliad yn ystyried argymhellion y Pwyllgor yng nghyd-destun y strategaeth tai genedlaethol arfaethedig. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd Edwina yn hysbysu'r Aelodau ynglŷn â'r trafodaethau hynny.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Atgoffaf yr Aelodau y dylent gyfyngu eu hareithiau i bum munud, ar wahân i'r Gweinidog, a gaiff wyth munud i ymateb i'r ddadl.

Janet Davies: Diolchaf i'r Cadeirydd am ei hadroddiad ar drosglwyddo stoc tai. Fel y dywedodd Gwenda, cytunodd y Pwyllgor ar nifer o gamau a fydd yn cynorthwyo tenantiaid gyda throsglwyddiadau o'r fath, gan gynnwys arolwg llawn o gyflwr ac anghenion tai. Codwyd y mater hwnnw sawl gwaith yn y Pwyllgor gan Janet Ryder.

Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn ystyried rhesymeg y mater hwn, gan ei fod yn ymwneud ag ymyrraeth y Llywodraeth mewn deiliadaeth tai. Pan fo angen ymyrraeth y Llywodraeth mewn unrhyw sector, mae Plaid Cymru o'r farn y dylid disgrifio'r broblem yn gywir, y dylid diffinio'r rheswm dros y broblem ac ymdrin â'r broblem yn y ffordd symlaf, mwyaf eglur a lleiaf trawmatig posibl. Defnyddiodd grŵp Plaid Cymru ar y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai yr ymagwedd resymegol a synhwyrol honno yn gyson yn ei farn ar drosglwyddo'r stoc tai, yn y cyfraniadau a wnaeth i'r ddadl ac yn ei ymatebion o fewn y Pwyllgor. Parhewn i wneud hynny.

Caiff y rhesymau dros wthio llywodraeth leol tuag at drosglwyddo stoc, a'i gynnig yn awr fel opsiwn ymysg eraill, eu pennu gan reidrwydd ariannol. Ni allwn anwybyddu'r

thinking on which that is founded. The stated reason for the pursuit of stock transfer is the dire need for major repairs and renovation, coupled with the lack of public money for that work.

As leader of a council for five years during the 1990s, I know that local government is capable of dealing with repairs and renovation, as long as it has the money to do so. However, the availability of that money is ruled by the Treasury and political priorities. In other European member states, investment in housing does not count against their public sector borrowing requirement, but it is regarded as public investment that is of benefit to everybody. The Minister has acknowledged that, and it is included in the report, but she has been unable to persuade the UK Government to listen to her much saner advice.

The driving force behind stock transfer is fiscal policy. It is not a simple method of intervention, but will introduce extra layers of bureaucracy and regulation. It is not focused on the real problem. It will cause unnecessary trauma for tenants and, to a lesser extent, for the housing staff of local authorities.

We visited housing schemes in England and identified problems with them. One problem that they do not have, but which we are likely to have in Wales, is that of negative equity, which will require much public money investment. Such schemes reduce democracy by taking away local government ownership. Although tenants can vote members onto a management board, such a board does not have the strategic powers of a council, and tenants will not have the opportunity to elect a councillor who can be independent of personal interest in the operation of the estate.

The Committee Chair mentioned a few other possibilities, such as public-private partnerships. *The Guardian's* society page yesterday included a damning report on a public-private partnership on housing in the Kingston upon Hull City Council. We should all take warning from that. Although we will

meddylfryd y mae hynny yn seiliedig arno. Y rheswm datganedig dros ddilyn yr opsiwn trosglwyddo stoc yw'r angen dirfawr am atgyweiriadau a gwaith adnewyddu sylweddol, ynghyd â diffyg arian cyhoeddus ar gyfer y gwaith hwnnw.

Fel arweinydd cyngor am bum mlynedd yn ystod y 1990au, gwn fod gan lywodraeth leol y gallu i ymdrin ag atgyweiriadau a gwaith adnewyddu, cyn belled â bod ganddo'r arian i wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae argaeledd yr arian hwnnw wedi'i ddiystyru gan y Trysorlys a blaenoriaethau gwleidyddol. Mewn aelod wladwriaethau Ewropeaidd eraill, nid yw buddsoddi mewn tai yn cyfrif yn erbyn eu gofyniad benthyca sector cyhoeddus, ond fe'i gwelir fel buddsoddiad cyhoeddus er budd pawb. Cydnabu'r Gweinidog hynny, ac mae wedi ei gynnwys yn yr adroddiad, ond ni lwyddodd i ddarbwyllio Llywodraeth y DU i wrando ar ei chyngor a oedd yn llawer doethach.

Y grym mawr y tu ôl i drosglwyddo stoc yw polisi ariannol. Nid dull syml o ymyrraeth ydyw, ond bydd yn cyflwyno haenau o fiwrocratiaeth a rheolaeth ychwanegol. Nid yw'n canolbwyntio ar y broblem wirioneddol. Bydd yn achosi trawma diangen i denantiaid, ac i raddau llai, i staff tai awdurdodau lleol.

Ymwelasom â nifer o gynlluniau tai yn Lloegr gan nodi problemau â hwy. Un broblem nad oes ganddynt, ond yr ydym yn debygol o'i chael yng Nghymru, yw ecwiti negyddol, a fydd yn galw am fuddsoddiad mawr o ran arian cyhoeddus. Mae cynlluniau o'r fath yn lleihau democratiaeth drwy ddileu perchnogaeth llywodraeth leol. Er y gall tenantiaid ethol aelodau ar fwrdd rheoli, nid oes pwerau strategol cyngor gan fwrdd o'r fath, ac ni chaiff y tenantiaid y cyfle i ethol cynghorydd a all weithredu'n annibynnol heb fuddiant personol yng ngweithrediadau yr ystad.

Soniodd Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor am ambell i bosibilrwydd arall, megis partneriaethau cyhoeddus-preifat. Yr oedd tudalen 'society' *The Guardian* ddoe yn cynnwys adroddiad damniol am bartneriaeth tai cyhoeddus-preifat yng Nghyngor Dinas Kingston upon Hull. Dylai pob un ohonom gymryd hynny

support the Committee's report, it is difficult for Assembly Members to vote in favour of a proposal that increases the democratic deficit, particularly when the major argument for establishing the Assembly was to reduce the democratic deficit in Wales.

Finally, while Plaid Cymru is glad to see this proposed only as an option, the pressures that operate, and the refusal of the UK Government to take those pressures away, are all too reminiscent of the 1980s Government. The Welsh Office Minister with responsibility for housing at that time frequently behaved like a dictator and turned a deaf ear to local government's pleas.

I plead for local government to be given the right to conduct its affairs to the best of its ability, as it normally does. There are exceptions, but local government usually does well. It needs money, not schemes that will make life more difficult in many cases.

Peter Law: I am pleased to have the opportunity to speak in this debate. I declare an interest as a member of the General Municipal Boilermakers Union, and members of my family are members of Unison.

This issue is important because it is about giving wide options for quality of life to our tenants. We are talking about reality. Unfortunately, many tenants throughout Wales live in comparative squalor. I say that with great respect to them. It is not their fault or that of their local authorities. We have a £750 million backlog of work, and it all harks back to what Janet Davies talked about. The guilty men from the 1980s are over on the Conservative side of the Chamber. Not many of the rabble are present for me to abuse this morning. However, the Tories put us in this position. That is what we inherited. It is an interesting point, because we are just about to see that little known species called the lesser spotted-Tory appear over the next two weeks. For instance, in the hedgerows of Wales you will see little blue signs appearing. All of a sudden, they will be displayed by people who were perhaps members of housing associations or health trusts, or what we now call Assembly sponsored public bodies.

fel rhybudd. Er y byddwn yn cefnogi adroddiad y Pwyllgor, mae'n anodd i Aelodau'r Cynulliad bleidleisio o blaid cynnig sydd yn cynyddu'r diffyg democrataidd, yn arbennig pan mai'r ddadl bennaf dros sefydlu'r Cynulliad oedd lleihau'r diffyg democrataidd yng Nghymru.

Yn olaf, er bod Plaid Cymru yn falch mai dim ond fel opsiwn y cynigir hyn, mae'r pwysau sydd yn bodoli, a'r ffaith bod Llywodraeth y DU yn gwrthod dileu'r pwysau hynny, yn ein hatgoffa lawer gormod o Lywodraeth yr 1980au. Yr oedd Gweinidog y Swyddfa Gymreig a oedd â chyfrifoldeb am dai ar y pryd yn ymddwyn yn aml fel unben ac yn fyddar i bledion llywodraeth leol.

Plediaf i lywodraeth leol gael yr hawl i wneud ei waith hyd orau ei allu, fel y mae'n arfer ei wneud. Ceir rhai eithriadau, ond mae llywodraeth leol fel arfer yn gwneud yn dda. Mae angen arian arno, nid cynlluniau a fydd yn gwneud bywyd yn anos mewn nifer o achosion.

Peter Law: Yr wyf yn falch o'r cyfle i siarad yn y ddadl hon. Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o Undeb y Gwneuthurwyr Bwyleri Bwrdeistrefol a Chyffredinol, ac mae aelodau o'm teulu yn aelodau o Unsain.

Mae'r mater hwn yn bwysig gan ei fod yn ymwneud â chynnig opsiynau eang ar gyfer ansawdd bywyd i'n tenantiaid. Yr ydym yn siarad am sefyllfa real. Yn anffodus, mae nifer o denantiaid drwy Gymru gyfan yn byw mewn aflendid cymharol. Dywedaf hynny gyda'r parch mwyaf tuag atynt. Nid eu bai hwy na bai eu hawdurdodau lleol ydyw. Mae gennym werth £750 miliwn o ôl-groniad, ac mae'r cyfan yn deillio o'r hyn y soniodd Janet Davies amdano. Mae'r dynion euog o'r 1980au ar ochr y Ceidwadwyr o'r Siambr. Nid oes llawer o'r giwed yn bresennol imi eu sarhau y bore yma. Fodd bynnag, y Torïaid sydd wedi ein rhoi yn y sefyllfa hon. Dyna'r hyn a etifeddassom. Mae'n bwynt diddorol, oherwydd ein bod ar fin gweld y rhywogaeth brin a elwir y Tori brith yn ymddangos yn ystod y pythefnos nesaf. Er enghraifft, yng ngwrychoedd Cymru gwelwch arwyddion bach glas yn ymddangos. Yn sydyn, fe'u harddangosir gan bobl a fu efallai'n aelodau o gymdeithasau tai neu ymddiriedolaethau

Years ago, we used to ask them if they were Conservatives, and they would say 'Me? No, I am apolitical'. Then when it came to an election, they displayed a little blue sign. We do not want to go back to that, because this is the legacy of what happened in those days. So remember that when you see all those little blue signs in the hedgerows of Wales over the next two weeks. Tenants suffered during the 18 years of Tory indifference, and local authorities had no chance. They were isolated on this subject. Here comes a major spotted-Tory.

iechyd, neu'r hyn a alwn bellach yn gyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad. Flynyddoedd yn ôl, arferem ofyn iddynt a oeddent yn Geidwadwyr a byddent yn ateb "Fi? Nac ydw, yr wyf yn anwleidyddol". A phan ddaeth yn adeg etholiad, yr oeddent yn arddangos arwydd bach glas. Nid ydym am ddychwelyd at hynny, gan mai dyma etifeddiaeth yr hyn a ddigwyddodd y dyddiau hynny. Felly cofiwch hynny pan welwch yr holl arwyddion bach glas hynny yng ngwrychoedd Cymru yn ystod y pythefnos nesaf. Dioddefodd tenantiaid yn ystod 18 mlynedd o ddihidrwydd y Toriaid, ac nid oedd gobaith gan awdurdodau lleol. Yr oeddent ar eu pen eu hunain ar y pwnc hwn. Dyma Dori brith mawr yn dod.

10:05 a.m.

David Davies: I am sorry for interrupting this version of Jackanory that passes for a speech. However, is it not the case that over the 18 years of the Conservative government, millions of people throughout this country were given the right to buy their own homes? The National Assembly's own statistics demonstrate that that is the dominant wish of most people in this country. We gave them the right to buy their own homes, and you in the Labour party tried to stop them. Do not give us any more lectures about lesser spotted-Tories.

David Davies: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf darfu ar yr araith Jackanory hon. Fodd bynnag, mewn dros 18 mlynedd o lywodraeth Geidwadol, onid y gwir amdani yw bod miliynau o bobl ledled y wlad hon wedi cael yr hawl i brynu eu cartrefi eu hunain? Dengys ystadegau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ei hun mai dyma yw prif ddymuniad y rhan fwyaf o bobl yn y wlad hon. Rhoddasom yr hawl iddynt brynu eu cartrefi eu hunain, ac fe wnaethoch chi yn y blaidd Lafur geisio eu hatal. Peidiwch â rhoi mwy o ddarlithoedd inni am Doriaid brith.

Peter Law: In the 18 years of Conservative government, untold hardship was caused to the tenants that we are discussing today. There was no funding available for local authorities to try to give them a decent quality of life. It always wanted to sell off houses so that it was not liable for them. We all know what the Conservative government was like. It was the party of the poll tax. It never wants to talk about that. 'Farmer Poll Tax' over there said the same thing last week. It was amazing.

Peter Law: Mewn 18 mlynedd o lywodraeth Geidwadol, achoswyd caledi aruthrol i'r tenantiaid yr ydym yn eu trafod heddiw. Nid oedd unrhyw arian ar gael er mwyn i awdurdodau lleol geisio rhoi ansawdd bywyd boddhaol iddynt. Yr oedd bob amser am werthu tai fel nad oedd yn gyfrifol amdanynt. Gwyddom oll sut un oedd y llywodraeth Geidwadol. Plaid treth y pen ydoedd. Nid yw byth yn awyddus i siarad am hynny. Dywedodd 'Ffermwr Treth y Pen' yn y fan acw yr un peth yr wythnos diwethaf. Yr oedd yn anhygoel.

This is a useful document, and the Committee has worked well on it. I compliment the Chair, Gwenda Thomas, for her good work, and Judy Wayne and Martin Stevenson and his staff. They all worked together, and it has been a good exercise. I also thank Edwina Hart for her enlightened approach to this. She

Mae hon yn ddogfen ddefnyddiol, a gweithiodd y Pwyllgor yn dda arni. Canmolaf y Cadeirydd, Gwenda Thomas, am ei gwaith da, a Judy Wayne a Martin Stevenson a'i staff. Bu pawb yn cydweithio, a bu'n ymarfer da. Diolchaf hefyd i Edwina Hart am ei hymagwedd oleuedig tuag at hyn.

has listened carefully to what we were saying, and I am sure that she will continue to do so in the future. The key point is that tenants are the important people in this report. They have the final say. We do not want to sell council houses into the private sector. However, if we have to do so to give people a better quality of life and to give them what they deserve, we must be prepared to ensure that safeguards are built-in. We can do so by the community model if necessary.

At the moment, we want to see a relaxation of the public sector borrowing regulations. That has already been said, and I and the Committee support it fully. It would enable local authorities to set up their own independent companies. That is the best way forward. We also need to build-in alternatives, and we have done so. We have given tenants the opportunity to ask for independent advice, which is sacrosanct. We have given tenants the opportunity to get full option appraisal, which is absolutely right. We have also included the involvement of the front line professional staff who maintain and administer these houses, and who have the right to be consulted about what is done. That was not previously included. I am delighted that recommendation 15 covers that point.

Looking to the future, we have the opportunity now to work with tenants, because this cannot happen unless tenants want it to happen. We need to give them the opportunity to see if we can give them a better future. We are not going to be able to conjure up £750 million overnight, so this gives us the opportunity to build a framework for the good of those tenants. The document reflects the wish of the Local Government and Housing Committee and the Assembly to provide tenants with the best choices, and to give them the opportunities to gain good housing and a better quality of life. I am delighted to have played a part in this, and I support the report.

William Graham: The Welsh Conservative group welcomes the opportunity to debate this report on how local authorities may address the problem of financing necessary

Gwrandawodd yn ofalus ar yr hyn yr oeddem yn ei ddweud, ac yr wyf yn sicr y bydd yn parhau i wneud hynny yn y dyfodol. Y pwynt allweddol yw mai tenantiaid yw'r bobl bwysig yn yr adroddiad hwn. Hwy sydd â'r gair olaf. Nid ydym am werthu tai cyngor i'r sector preifat. Fodd bynnag, os bydd rhaid inni wneud hynny er mwyn rhoi gwell ansawdd bywyd i bobl a rhoi yr hyn maent yn ei haeddu iddynt, rhaid inni fod yn barod i sicrhau bod amodau diogelwch yn cael eu hymgorffori. Gallwn wneud hynny yn ôl y model cymuned os oes angen.

Ar hyn o bryd, yr ydym am weld y rheoliadau benthyg yn y sector cyhoeddus yn cael eu llacio. Dywedwyd hynny eisoes, ac yr wyf fi a'r Pwyllgor yn cefnogi hynny'n llwyr. Byddai'n galluogi awdurdodau lleol i sefydlu eu cwmnïau annibynnol eu hunain. Dyna'r ffordd orau ymlaen. Rhaid inni hefyd ymgorffori opsiynau amgenach, a gwnaethom hynny. Rhoddasom gyfle i'r tenantiaid ofyn am gyngor annibynnol, sydd yn gysygreddig. Rhoddasom y cyfle i denantiaid arfarnu'r opsiynau yn llawn, sydd yn gwbl briodol. Yr ydym wedi cynnwys staff proffesiynol rheng flaen sydd yn cynnal a chadw a gweinyddu'r tai hyn, a chanddynt yr hawl i gael rhoi eu barn am yr hyn a wneir. Nid oedd hynny wedi ei gynnwys o'r blaen. Yr wyf yn hynod falch fod argymhelliad 15 yn cwmpasu'r pwynt hwnnw.

Gan edrych i'r dyfodol, mae gennym y cyfle yn awr i gydweithio â thenantiaid, gan na all hyn ddigwydd os na fydd tenantiaid am iddo ddigwydd. Mae angen inni roi'r cyfle iddynt weld a allwn roi dyfodol gwell iddynt. Ni fyddwn yn gallu dod o hyd i £750 miliwn dros nos, felly rhydd hyn gyfle inni adeiladu fframwaith er budd y tenantiaid hynny. Adlewyrcha'r ddogfen ddymuniaid y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Lleol a Thai a'r Cynulliad i roi'r dewisiadau gorau i denantiaid, a rhoi cyfleoedd iddynt gael tai da a gwell ansawdd bywyd. Yr wyf yn hynod falch fy mod wedi chwarae rhan yn hyn, a chefnogaf yr adroddiad.

William Graham: Mae grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn croesawu'r cyfle i gael dadl ar yr adroddiad hwn ar y modd y gall awdurdodau lleol ymdrin â phroblem ariannu'r gwaith

maintenance and repair of homes in Wales. We acknowledge the report's recommendations that seek to ensure that tenants are not only consulted, but that they have advice and information made available to them. We also acknowledge this administration's recognition, in paragraph 2.2 of the report, that from 1997 to 2001 there was a fall from £260 million to £200 million in local authority capital expenditure on housing. That is a fall of £60 million. The recent Assembly budget reverses this trend and by 2004, there is provision for an increase of £214 million. After a combined total of seven years of Labour administration in Westminster and in this Assembly, local authority capital expenditure will have fallen by £46 million. This report clearly illustrates that the elected political parties who dominate the local authorities in Wales have consistently and continually failed to manage their housing stock effectively and efficiently. They should have the reports on maintenance and repairs required at hand and they should be aware of those costs. They should be aware of the intended impact of their current housing maintenance programmes. However, all they can do is issue statements to the media such as that from Torfaen County Borough Council, under the heading—and I apologise for the journalese—

cynnal a chadw angenrheidiol ac atgyweirio tai yng Ngymru. Cydnabyddwn argymhellion yr adroddiad sydd yn ceisio sicrhau nad ymgynghori yn unig a wneir â thenantiaid, ond bod cyngor a gwybodaeth ar gael iddynt. Yr ydym hefyd yn cydnabod cydnabyddiaeth y weinyddiaeth hon, ym mharagraff 2.2 o'r adroddiad, y bu cwymp o £260 miliwn i £200 miliwn mewn gwariant cyfalaf llywodraeth leol ar dai rhwng 1997 a 2001. Mae hynny'n gwmp o £60 miliwn. Mae cronfeydd wrth gefn cyllideb ddiweddar y Cynulliad yn gwyrddroi'r duedd hon ac erbyn 2004, ceir darpariaeth ar gyfer cynnydd o £214 miliwn. Ar ôl cyfanswm cyfunol o saith mlynedd o weinyddiaeth Lafur yn San Steffan ac yn y Cynulliad hwn, bydd gwariant cyfalaf llywodraeth leol ar dai wedi gostwng £46 miliwn. Dengys yr adroddiad hwn yn eglur bod y pleidiau gwleidyddol etholedig sydd yn tra-arglwyddiaethu ar awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru wedi methu â rheoli eu stoc tai yn effeithiol yn gyson a pharhaus. Dylai'r adroddiadau am gynnal a chadw ac atgyweiriadau tai fod wrth law a dylent fod yn ymwybodol o'r costau hynny. Dylent fod yn ymwybodol o effaith arfaethedig eu rhaglenni cynnal a chadw tai presennol. Fodd bynnag, y cyfan y gallant ei wneud yw rhyddhau datganiadau i'r cyfryngau megis yr un gan Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Tor-faen o dan y pennawd—ac ymddiheuraf am y newyddiadureg—

'Sorry Future—Council cannot meet the costs of £20 million bill shock for home repairs'.

How many Labour controlled councils have been blindly throwing ratepayers' money at housing maintenance without assessing the benefits and impact of their repair programmes? They have not been highlighting the continuous failure of the Labour Government at Westminster to provide funds for these repairs from 1997 to 1999—

Sawl cyngor a reolir gan y blaid Lafur sydd wedi bod yn taflu arian trethdalwyr yn gibddall tuag at gynnal a chadw tai heb asesu manteision ac effaith eu rhaglenni atgyweirio? Nid ydynt wedi bod yn amlygu methiant parhaus y Llywodraeth Lafur yn San Steffan i ddarparu arian ar gyfer yr atgyweiriadau hyn rhwng 1997 ac 1999—

Janet Davies: Are you aware that, under law, the housing revenue account does not allow local government to spend ratepayers' money on housing maintenance and that it must come from the rent?

Janet Davies: A ydych yn ymwybodol, o dan y gyfraith, nad yw'r cyfrif refeniw tai yn caniatáu i lywodraeth leol wario arian y trethdalwyr ar gynnal a chadw tai a bod yn rhaid iddo ddod o'r rhent?

William Graham: I am aware of that. I am also aware of the legislation that brought in ring-fencing for housing accounts so that

William Graham: Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o hynny. Yr wyf hefyd yn ymwybodol o'r ddeddfwriaeth a gyflwynodd arian wedi'i

money raised by revenue could be spent on council houses and not for other council activities. The continuous failure of the National Assembly to provide funds for these repairs from 1999 to 2001 is a damning indictment of Labour controlled councils. They have failed to recognise their lack of commitment to address these problems. They place the blame on the lack of funding from a government of the last century. They claim that the funding was inadequate, but they have failed to match that level of funding. They have failed in their claim that they would lead the people of Wales to a better lifestyle.

Janet Ryder: I am pleased that you referred to the last Tory government as the government of the last century. Peter Law was right when he said that local government is only facing this problem because of the Tory government's lack of investment in its public infrastructure. Public housing in facing this problem now.

William Graham: I refute that entirely. The money was made available by Conservative central government. Labour was in control in these local authorities and it failed miserably to spend that money on council housing estates throughout the country. Go and see them when you are canvassing and find out for yourselves.

Recommendation 6 of this report states that

'The Assembly Cabinet should prepare strategic guidance to set out the options available to local authorities for modernising their council housing stock, including the financial implications.'

This report outlines that housing stock transfer is one of the options available to our local authorities. The report outlined the options available such as the status quo, the private finance initiative, arms' length companies—fat chance in Wales—the major repairs allowance and stock transfer. Stock transfer is the only current option available that would be capable of delivering additional investment in local authority stock on a scale that would overcome the identified backlog

neilltuo'n benodol ar gyfer cyfrifon tai fel y gellid gwario arian a godwyd drwy refeniw ar dai cyngor ac nid ar weithgareddau eraill y cyngor. Mae methiant parhaus y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i ddarparu arian ar gyfer yr atgyweiriadau hyn rhwng 1999 a 2001 yn gyhuddiad damniol yn erbyn cynghorau a reolir gan Lafur. Maent wedi methu â chydabod eu diffyg ymrwymiad i ymdrin â'r problemau hyn. Maent yn beio'r diffyg arian a gawsant gan lywodraeth o'r ganrif ddiwethaf. Honant fod yr arian yn annigonol, ond methasant â'r arian hwnnw. Methasant yn eu honiad y byddent yn sicrhau gwell ffordd o fyw ar gyfer pobl Cymru.

Janet Ryder: Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi cyfeirio at y llywodraeth Dorïaidd ddiwethaf fel llywodraeth y ganrif ddiwethaf. Yr oedd Peter Law yn gywir pan ddywedodd mai oherwydd ddiffyg buddsoddiad y llywodraeth Dorïaidd yn ei hisadeiledd gyhoeddus y mae llywodraeth leol yn wynebu'r broblem hon. Mae tai cyhoeddus yn wynebu'r broblem hon yn awr.

William Graham: Gwrthodaf hynny'n llwyr. Sicrhawyd bod yr arian ar gael gan lywodraeth ganolog Geidwadol. Llafur oedd yn rheoli'r awdurdodau lleol hyn a methodd yn druenus â gwario'r arian hwnnw ar ystadau tai cyngor drwy'r wlad. Ewch i'w gweld wrth ganfasio a chanfod drosoch chi eich hun.

Mae argymhelliad 6 yn yr adroddiad hwn yn datgan

'Dylai Cabinet y Cynulliad baratoi cyfarwyddyd strategol i osod allan y dewisiadau sydd ar gael i awdurdodau lleol i foderneiddio'u stoc tai cyngor, gan gynnwys y goblygiadau ariannol'.

Amlinella'r adroddiad hwn bod trosglwyddo stoc tai yn un o'r opsiynau sydd ar gael i'n hawdurdodau lleol. Amlinellodd yr adroddiad yr opsiynau sydd ar gael megis y sefyllfa bresennol, y fenter cyllid preifat, cwmnïau hyd braich—fawr o obaith yng Nghymru—y lwfans atgyweiriadau sylweddol a throsglwyddo stoc. Trosglwyddo stoc yw'r unig opsiwn presennol a fyddai'n gallu cyflwyno buddsoddiad ychwanegol i stoc awdurdod lleol ar raddfa a fyddai'n goresgyn

of repair and modernisation. The report states that in England, 440,000 homes in 100 local authority areas had been transferred to registered social landlords. The Scottish Executive has adopted a policy of promoting stock transfer and Glasgow—not exactly a hotbed of Conservatism—is currently considering transferring almost 100,000 homes. On page five, the report states that,

‘There seems no doubt...that the transferring tenants are more satisfied with their landlord and the services they provide than local authority tenants’.

This report fails to address the dramatic uncertainty of owner-occupiers when stock transfer occurs on large estates that have been redeveloped. In all the Assembly debates on housing policy, I have proposed that there should be a national housing audit that also identifies homes for disabled occupation. This report calls for such an audit. Let us get on with that recommendation and provide better homes for the deserving people of Wales.

10:15 a.m.

Peter Black: I was listening to a programme on Radio Wales a week last Tuesday in which people were asked whether they intended to vote. The programme was recorded in Blaenymaes in Swansea and a local man, John Bowen, was interviewed. He mentioned the tremendous work that has been done in Blaenymaes over the last 10 years to replace system-built precast reinforced concrete houses with new housing association homes. There is no doubt that that has transformed the area and improved many people’s standard of living. However, John Bowen struck a chord when he said that you cannot change an area just by doing up the houses. In discussing this report on housing stock transfer, we would do well to remember that.

Although the report offers a conservative estimate that the overall backlog of improvement and repair in the council house

yr ôl-groniad o waith atgyweirio a moderneiddio a nodwyd. Datgana’r adroddiad bod 440,000 o gartrefi mewn 100 o ardaloedd awdurdodau lleol yn Lloegr wedi eu trosglwyddo i landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig. Mabwysiadodd Gweithrediaeth yr Alban bolisi o hybu trosglwyddo stoc ac mae Glasgow—sydd prin yn fagwrfa ar gyfer Ceidwadaeth—ar hyn o bryd yn ystyried trosglwyddo bron i 100,000 o dai. Ar dudalen pump, noda’r adroddiad,

‘Ymddengys nad oes amheuaeth...bod tenantiaid sydd yn trosglwyddo yn fwy bodlon â’u landord a’r gwasanaeth a ddarperir iddynt na thenantiaid awdurdodau lleol yn gyffredinol’.

Metha’r adroddiad ag ymdrin ag ansicrwydd dramatig perchnogion-ddeiliaid pan fo trosglwyddo stoc yn digwydd ar ystadau mawr a ailddatblygwyd. Ym mhob un o ddadleuon y Cynulliad ar bolisi tai, cynigiais y dylid cynnal archwiliad tai cenedlaethol sydd hefyd yn nodi tai ar gyfer deiliadaeth anabl. Mae’r adroddiad hwn yn galw am archwiliad o’r fath. Gadewch inni symud ymlaen â’r argymhelliad hwnnw a darparu gwell cartrefi ar gyfer pobl haeddiannol Cymru.

Peter Black: Yr oeddwn yn gwranddo ar raglen ar Radio Wales wythnos i ddydd Mawrth diwethaf ble gofynnwyd i bobl a oeddent yn bwriadu pleidleisio. Recordiwyd y rhaglen ym Mlaenymaes yn Abertawe a chyfwelwyd â dyn lleol, sef John Bowen. Soniodd am y gwaith ardderchog a wnaethpwyd ym Mlaenymaes dros y 10 mlynedd diwethaf i newid y tai a adeiladwyd gan system concriid dur cyn-gastieidig gyda chartrefi cymdeithas dai newydd. Nid oes amheuaeth bod hynny wedi trawsnewid yr ardal ac wedi gwella safon byw nifer o bobl. Fodd bynnag, tarodd John Bowen dant pan ddywedodd na ellir newid ardal dim ond drwy atgyweirio’r tai. Wrth drafod yr adroddiad hwn ar drosglwyddo stoc tai, byddai’n dda o beth inni gofio hynny.

Er bod yr adroddiad yn cynnig amcangyfrif ceidwadol mai tua £750 miliwn yw gwerth yr ôl-groniad gwelliannau ac atgyweiriadau yn y

sector is about £750 million, and although Shelter Cymru has estimated that the cost of poor housing to the Welsh health budget is in the range of £39 million to £49 million a year, the issue of investing in council homes cannot be considered in isolation from wider community regeneration issues.

We need to find the money to invest in council housing. However, we also need to invest in the overall environment of council estates, in creating jobs and rebuilding communities, in ensuring that there are adequate transport links and also in training and education. That is why the Communities First programme and the new community planning duty on local councils is so important in achieving joined-up thinking, inter-agency co-operation and in empowering local people. All those elements are required if the investment is to stick.

That is why recommendation 19 in the report—that local authorities should be encouraged to link any stock transfer proposals to community regeneration programmes—is so important. Transfers should be carried out on a human scale to enable the full involvement of tenants and residents and to let them see the full benefits of the transfer on their own estate in terms of the overall improvement in their quality of life.

Recommendation 12 is also important, as it highlights not just the need to consult tenants but to involve them at every stage from the options appraisal process onwards, and before the council has decided its position on the most appropriate way forward. That is good practice, as it represents genuine consultation. It also enables the building of consensus, which can help to prevent abortive costs and the failure of the process.

The report rightly highlights the outstanding financial issues regarding the reasonable request to amend the public sector borrowing requirement so that councils can invest in their housing directly and tenants can choose between equal options. It is reasonable that tenants who opt to stay with the council should not be disadvantaged as a result. The issue of overhanging debt must also be

sector tai cyngor, ac er bod Shelter Cymru wedi amcangyfrif bod cost tai gwael i gyllideb iechyd Cymru rhwng £39 miliwn a £49 miliwn y flwyddyn, ni ellir ystyried y mater o fuddsoddi mewn tai cyngor ar wahân i faterion ehangach adfywio cymunedau.

Mae angen inni ganfod yr arian i fuddsoddi mewn tai cyngor. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni hefyd fuddsoddi yn amgylchedd cyffredinol ystadau cyngor, drwy greu swyddi ac ailadeiladu cymunedau, a sicrhau bod cysylltiadau trafniadaeth digonol a hefyd buddsoddi mewn hyfforddiant ac addysg. Dyna pam bod rhaglen Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf a'r ddyletswydd cynllunio cymunedau newydd sydd ar gynghorau lleol mor bwysig wrth sicrhau meddylfryd gydgyssylltiedig, cydweithrediad rhyng-asiantaethol a galluogi pobl lleol. Mae angen yr holl elfennau hynny os yw'r buddsoddiad am barhau.

Dyna pam bod argymhelliad 19 yn yr adroddiad—sef y dylid annog awdurdodau lleol i gysylltu unrhyw gynigion trosglwyddo stoc â rhaglenni adfywio cymunedau—mor bwysig. Dylid cyflwyno trosglwyddiadau ar raddfa ddynol er mwyn galluogi cyfranogiad llawn gan denantiaid a phreswylwyr a gadael iddynt weld manteision llawn y trosglwyddiad ar eu hystad eu hunain o ran y gwelliant cyffredinol yn ansawdd eu bywydau.

Mae argymhelliad 12 yn bwysig hefyd, gan ei fod yn amlygu nid yn unig yr angen i ymgynghori â thenantiaid ond hefyd i'w cynnwys ym mhob cam, o'r broses arfarnu opsiynau ymlaen, a chyn i'r cyngor benderfynu ar y ffordd fwyaf priodol ymlaen. Arfer da yw hynny, gan ei fod yn cynrychioli ymgynghori dilys. Mae hefyd yn caniatáu i gonsensws gael ei ffurfio, a all helpu i atal costau ofer a methiant y broses.

Mae'r adroddiad yn amlygu, a hynny'n briodol, y materion ariannol neilltuol o ran y cais rhesymol i ddiwygio gofyniad benthyca'r sector cyhoeddus fel y gall cynghorau fuddsoddi yn eu tai yn uniongyrchol ac y gall tenantiaid ddewis rhwng opsiynau cyfartal. Mae'n rhesymol na ddylai tenantiaid sydd yn dewis aros gyda'r cyngor fod o dan anfantais o ganlyniad.

resolved.

In considering this report, we cannot afford to be hamstrung by ideology. We must offer choice to tenants and local councils as to how they find the resources to invest in their homes, whether that be through stock transfer, leasing, the private finance initiative or increased public funding. However, it must be acknowledged that, ultimately, the tenants will have the final say. We must recognise that we will never have enough public finance to deal adequately with the huge task ahead of us. There will always be a need to rely on private financing in some form or another. Therefore, we also need to retain the confidence of the private finance sector in this process.

Ultimately, the issue is not one of ownership. It is about quality of life. We need to be able to guarantee the quality of life of council tenants by providing secure, watertight homes that are free from damp and disrepair. We need to create pleasant and safe communities on our council estates with good transport links, access to training, education and jobs. The community must be active and involved. To do that we need to invest in those communities using whatever resources that we can find and which are acceptable to the tenants. We need to treat tenants as equal partners in the whole process and seek to encourage councils to carry out transfers on a community basis. That is why stock transfer needs to remain an option for all concerned.

David Lloyd: Datganaf fuddiant fel meddyg teulu a chynghorydd sir yn Ninas a Sir Abertawe.

Un o flaenoriaethau'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai, fel y clywsom gan y Cadeirydd, yw sicrhau bod gan bawb yng Nghymru gartref gweddus. Mae pawb erbyn hyn yn ymwybodol o bwysigrwydd tai da ar gyfer hybu iechyd a hybu cymunedau i ddatblygu'n fywiog a hyderus. Un o'r rhwystrau mwyaf wrth geisio cyflawni'r amcan hwn yw cyflwr gwael y mwyafrif o'r stoc tai cyngor yng Nghymru. Mae ein stoc tai cyngor wedi

Hefyd, rhaid datrys y ddyled fargod.

Wrth ystyried yr adroddiad hwn, ni allwn fforddio i gael ein llyffytheirio gan ideoleg. Rhaid inni gynnig dewis i denantiaid a chynghorau lleol ynglŷn â sut i ddod o hyd i'r adnoddau i fuddsoddi yn eu cartrefi, pa un a fyddai hynny drwy gyfrwng trosglwyddo stoc, prydlesu, y fenter cyllid preifat neu gynydd mewn gwariant cyhoeddus. Fodd bynnag, yn y pen draw, rhaid inni gydnabod mai'r tenantiaid a gaiff y gair olaf. Rhaid inni gydnabod na fydd gennym fyth ddigon o arian cyhoeddus i ymdrin yn ddigonol â'r dasg anferth o'n blaenau. Bydd gofyn dibynnu bob amser ar arian preifat ar ryw ffurf neu'i gilydd. Felly, rhaid inni hefyd gadw hyder y sector cyllid preifat yn y broses hon.

Yn y pen draw, nid yw'r mater yn ymwneud â pherchnogaeth. Mae'n ymwneud ag ansawdd bywyd. Mae angen inni allu sicrhau ansawdd bywyd tenantiaid cyngor drwy ddarparu cartrefi diogel, sydd yn dal dŵr nad ydynt yn llaith nac yn dadfeilio. Mae angen inni greu cymunedau diogel a dymunol ar ein hystadau cyngor gyda chysylltiadau trafniadaeth da, mynediad i hyfforddiant, addysg a swyddi. Rhaid i'r gymuned fod yn weithredol a chyfranogol. Er mwyn gwneud hynny rhaid inni fuddsoddi yn y cymunedau hynny gan ddefnyddio pa adnoddau bynnag y gallwn ddod o hyd iddynt ac sydd yn dderbyniol i'r tenantiaid. Mae angen inni drin tenantiaid fel partneriaid cyfartal yn y broses gyfan a cheisio annog cynghorau i gyflwyno trosglwyddiadau ar sail gymunedol. Dyna pam y dylai trosglwyddo stoc barhau yn opsiwn i bawb dan sylw.

David Lloyd: I declare an interest as a general practitioner and a county councillor at the City and County of Swansea.

One of the priorities of the Local Government and Housing Committee, as we heard from the Chair, is to ensure that everybody in Wales has a decent home. Everybody is aware by now of the importance of good housing in promoting health and in stimulating the development of vibrant and confident communities. One of the biggest obstacles in trying to achieve this objective is the poor quality of the majority

dioddef blynyddoedd o dan-fuddsoddi gan lywodraethau Ceidwadol, ac nid yw'r sefyllfa wedi gwella o gwbl o dan Lywodraeth Lafur. Ar ôl pedair blynedd mae'r Trysorlys wedi methu â newid y rheolau benthycu i awdurdodau lleol. Mae Llywodraeth Tony Blair wedi dewis parhau â pholisïau'r Ceidwadwyr ac wedi gorfodi'r polisïau hynny ar y Cynulliad.

Mae awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru, fel y clywsom, yn wynebu costau enfawr i atgyweirio'r stoc i safon dderbyniol. Unig ddewis nifer o awdurdodau yw trosglwyddo'r stoc tai. Pe bai'r Trysorlys yn newid y rheolau benthycu i awdurdodau lleol, o leiaf byddai ganddynt yr opsiwn o drosglwyddo'r stoc tai. Nid dyna fyddai'r unig ddewis.

Thema sydd yn rhedeg drwy adroddiad y Pwyllgor yw prinder gwybodaeth sydd ar gael ar gyflwr ein stoc tai yng Nghymru, yn enwedig ein stoc tai cyngor. Gofynnodd cynrychiolwyr Plaid Cymru, fel y clywsom, i'r Gweinidog ar sawl achlysur yn y Pwyllgor a fyddai'n ystyried comisiynu adolygiad o anghenion a chyflwr tai yng Nghymru. Mae pob awdurdod lleol yn derbyn grant i gasglu'r data yn eu hardaloedd hwy. Mae'r modd y gweithredir hyn yn amrywio o awdurdod i awdurdod. Mae cylch gorchwyl yr adolygiadau yn amrywio a chyflogir gwahanol gwmnïau i gasglu'r data. Mae'n amhosibl, felly, gymharu ardaloedd yng Nghymru, a chael darlun llawn a theg o'n stoc tai.

Hoffem bwysleisio eto mai'r hyn sydd ei angen yw adolygiad tai cenedlaethol i roi darlun llawn o anghenion a chyflwr tai yng Nghymru. Gydag uned ystadegau llywodraeth leol newydd yn cael ei lansio neithiwr, mae gobaith y byddwn yn cael hyn.

Mae'n bwysig cofio bod polisi o drosglwyddo'r stoc tai, os yw'n cael ei weithredu, yn effeithio ar fywydau miloedd o bobl o fewn yr awdurdod. Yr ydym yn falch fod tenantiaid sydd yn trosglwyddo wedi cael sicrwydd na fydd eu rhent yn codi'n gyflymach na phe baent wedi parhau'n

of the council housing stock in Wales. Our council housing stock has suffered years of underinvestment by Conservative governments, and the situation has not improved at all under a Labour Government. After four years, the Treasury has failed to change the borrowing regulations for local authorities. Tony Blair's Government has chosen to continue the Conservative's policies and has forced those policies on the Assembly.

Local authorities in Wales, as we have heard, face huge costs to repair the stock to an acceptable standard. The only choice for a number of authorities is to transfer the housing stock. If the Treasury changed the borrowing regulations for local authorities, then at least the transfer of the housing stock would be one option. It would not be the only choice.

A theme that runs through the whole of the Committee's report is the lack of available information on the state of the housing stock in Wales, and the council housing stock in particular. The Plaid Cymru representatives, as we have heard, asked the Minister on a number of occasions in the Committee whether she would consider commissioning a review of housing needs and housing conditions in Wales. Every local authority receives a grant to collate the data in their areas. The way in which this is done varies from authority to authority. The remit of these reviews varies and different companies are employed to collect this data. It is impossible, therefore, to compare areas in Wales, and to have a full and fair picture of our housing stock.

We wish to emphasise once again that what is needed is a national review of housing to give a full picture of housing needs and housing conditions in Wales. With the launch last night of the new local authority statistical unit, there is hope that we will have this.

It is important to remember that the policy of transferring the housing stock, if it is implemented, impacts on the lives of thousands of people within the authority. We are pleased that tenants that are transferring have had an assurance that their rent will not rise quicker than if they had continued to be

denantiaid i'r awdurdod lleol. Mae'n achos pryder inni na fydd gan denantiaid newydd yr un sicrwydd. Byddai sefyllfa lle mae rhent tenant sydd wedi trosglwyddo a rhent tenant newydd yn wahanol yn debygol o greu rhwygiadau o fewn y gymuned.

Pwynt arall na chafodd sylw teilwng yn yr adroddiad yw dyfodol adrannau tai awdurdodau lleol a'r staff sydd yn gweithio ynddynt. Mae angen arweiniad pellach ar awdurdodau a'u staff ynghylch dyfodol staff adrannau tai pe bai'r awdurdod yn dilyn polisi o drosglwyddo'r stoc. Dylid cynnwys y staff a'u hunedau yn y broses o'r dechrau i'r diwedd.

The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart): I welcome this report. I thank the Committee for undertaking this review and producing such a comprehensive report. All Committee members will feel that we had an excellent opportunity to explore a number of key issues. It has been a major task but the outcome has provided the Assembly with a clear picture of the issues involved in a complex area. The poor condition of much of the housing stock in Wales is undoubtedly one of the major challenges that the Assembly must face over the next 10 years. I think that there is unanimity in all parties that this is a charge that we have to take and run with. This is particularly true as far as much of our council housing is concerned. We have a legacy of a financial regime that has resulted in underinvestment over a prolonged period. The manifestation of this can be seen throughout the country and affects a significant number of people across all constituencies. It is not a coincidence that there is a strong link between high concentrations of deprivation and poor quality housing, and tackling the physical problems will be at the heart of our community regeneration plans. However, that will not be easy. The scale of the problem is growing, and it is not just about dealing with the houses. Improving the quality of the neighbourhoods in which these houses are located is of equal importance. Latest estimates suggest that that will cost well in excess of £1 billion.

local authority tenants. It concerns us that new tenants will not have the same assurance. A situation in which the rent of a transferred tenant and the rent of a new tenant differed would be likely to create divisions within the community.

Another point that was not given appropriate attention in the report is the future of local authority housing departments and the staff that work within them. Authorities and their staff need further guidance on the future of housing departments if the authority were to follow a policy of transferring the stock. Staff and their units should be involved in the process from beginning to end.

Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart): Croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn. Diolchaf i'r Pwyllgor am ymgymryd â'r adolygiad hwn a chynhyrchu adroddiad mor gynhwysfawr. Bydd bob aelod o'r Pwyllgor yn teimlo inni gael cyfle rhagorol i ymchwilio i nifer o faterion allweddol. Bu'n dasg fawr ond mae'r canlyniad wedi rhoi darlun eglur i'r Cynulliad o'r materion sydd yn ymwneud â maes cymhleth. Heb amheuaeth, mae cyflwr gwael llawer o'r stoc tai yng Nghymru yn un o'r sialensau mwyaf y mae'n rhaid i'r Cynulliad ei hwynebu yn ystod y 10 mlynedd nesaf. Credaf fod unfrydedd ym mhob plaid bod hon yn swyddogaeth y mae'n rhaid inni ymgymryd â hi. Mae hyn yn arbennig o wir mewn perthynas â llawer o'n tai cyngor. Mae gennym waddol o gyfundrefn ariannol a arweiniodd at danfuddsoddi dros gyfnod maith. Gwelir enghreifftiau o hyn dros y wlad ac mae'n effeithio ar nifer sylweddol o bobl ar draws bob etholaeth. Nid cyd-ddigwyddiad ydyw bod cysylltiad cryf rhwng crynadau uchel o amddifadedd a thai o safon wael, a bydd mynd i'r afael â phroblemau ffisegol wrth wraidd ein cynlluniau adfywio cymunedau. Fodd bynnag, ni fydd hynny'n hawdd. Mae'r broblem yn cynyddu, ac nid yw'n ymwneud â thai yn unig. Mae gwella ansawdd y cymdogaethau lle lleolir y tai hyn yr un mor bwysig. Awgryma'r amcangyfrifon diweddaraf y bydd hynny yn costio llawer mwy nag £1 biliwn.

10:25 a.m.

As the Assembly is aware, we have been consulting on the national housing strategy and the Local Government and Housing Committee will consider the responses on 6 June. I will bring my proposal for the strategy to the Assembly in July for debate and consideration. Undoubtedly the condition of the housing stock will be a pivotal feature of the strategy. Without prejudging the outcome of the deliberation on the strategy, it is fair to predict that resolving this problem will require a variety of different approaches; we will certainly not be able to adopt a 'one size for all' policy. A number of Members referred to the rules governing the public sector borrowing requirement. I give a commitment to try to bring further pressure to bear on the UK Government on this issue.

Stock transfer will be one of those options and I will issue guidance shortly that takes account of the Committee's report. However, ultimately, this will be, and must be, a matter for tenants to decide. I am considering all the Committee's recommendations and will issue a formal response shortly. I thank Members for their contributions to this debate and for the Committee's work. It is important that such issues are aired and that we take a strategic approach to all the issues on the housing agenda.

Gwenda Thomas: I will start with William Graham's points. In my role as Chair of the Local Government and Housing Committee, I must be scrupulously unbiased. However, I must note that William Graham gave his support for this report and its recommendations. I agree with Janet Ryder and Dai Lloyd that there is insufficient information about the state of council housing. The Committee was concerned about the lack of reliable information on the extent of the backlog of repairs and modernisation work, and the value of the stock. The third recommendation notes that the Cabinet should ensure that the proposed local authority housing stock business plans can be used to produce a definitive assessment of the backlog and value of the stock.

Fel y gŵyr y Cynulliad, buom yn ymgynghori ar y strategaeth dai genedlaethol a bydd y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai yn ystyried yr ymatebion ar 6 Mehefin. Cyflwynaf fy nghynnig ar gyfer y strategaeth gerbron y Cynulliad ym mis Gorffennaf i'w ddadlau a'i ystyried. Yn ddiamau bydd cyflwr y stoc tai yn nodwedd ganolog ar y strategaeth. Heb ragfeirniadu canlyniad y drafodaeth ar y strategaeth, byddai'n deg rhagweld y bydd datrys y broblem hon yn gofyn am amryw o wahanol ymagweddau; yn sicr ni fyddwn yn gallu mabwysiadu polisi 'un ateb i bopeth'. Cyfeiriodd nifer o Aelodau at y rheolau sydd yn llywodraethu gofyniad benthyca'r sector cyhoeddus. Rhoddaf ymrwymiad i geisio dwyn rhagor o bwysau ar Lywodraeth y DU ynglŷn â'r mater hwn.

Bydd trosglwyddo stoc yn un o'r opsiynau hynny a byddaf yn cyhoeddi arweiniad yn fuan a fydd yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor. Fodd bynnag, yn y pen draw, bydd hwn yn fater i denantiaid benderfynu arno, a rhaid iddo fod felly. Byddaf yn ystyried pob un o argymhellion y Pwyllgor a chyhoeddaf ymateb ffurfiol yn fuan. Diolchaf i'r Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau i'r ddatl hon ac am waith y Pwyllgor. Mae'n bwysig bod materion o'r fath yn cael eu trafod a'n bod yn cymryd ymagwedd strategol tuag at bob un o'r materion ar yr agenda dai.

Gwenda Thomas: Dechreuaf gyda phwyntiau William Graham. Rhaid imi fod yn gwbl ddiuedd yn fy rôl fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai. Fodd bynnag, rhaid imi nodi i William Graham roi ei gefnogaeth i'r adroddiad hwn a'i argymhellion. Cytunaf â Janet Ryder a Dai Lloyd nad oes gwybodaeth ddigonol ynglŷn â chyflwr tai cyngor. Yr oedd y Pwyllgor yn bryderus am y diffyg gwybodaeth ddibynadwy ar faint yr ôl-groniad o waith atgyweirio a moderneiddio, a gwerth y stoc. Noda'r trydydd argymhelliad y dylai'r Cabinet sicrhau y gellir defnyddio'r cynlluniau busnes stoc tai awdurdod lleol arfaethedig ar gyfer cynhyrchu asesiad pendant o'r gwaith sydd wedi ôl-gronni a gwerth y stoc.

Janet Ryder also mentioned the merits of stock transfer versus PFI. The Committee's seventh recommendation is that the Cabinet should promote the full range of options available to local authorities for overcoming the repair and modernisation backlog. The eighth recommendation is that the Cabinet should consider how best to advise local authorities interested in proceeding with stock transfer and public private partnership projects.

Peter Law spoke about tenant welfare. Recommendation 13 states that local authorities should be required to ensure that independent advice is available to tenants when they are consulted during the options appraisal process. That would be an extension of the role of the independent consultants, whom authorities must appoint to act as tenants' advisors prior to the development of detailed stock transfer proposals.

On Peter Law and Dai Lloyd's points about the impact on local authority staff, the Committee's recommendation 15 states that local authorities should involve staff working on housing management and maintenance in the options appraisal process. As a matter of law, staff transferring to a new landlord, under stock transfer, would be protected by the TUPE regulations.

Peter Black asked whether stock transfer will hinder community regeneration, and he drew attention to recommendation 19. The opposite should be true, if the transfer can secure the investment necessary to modernise the housing stock. The Committee made a number of recommendations in this area. Recommendation 4 states that local authorities should be encouraged to ensure that any investment decisions on council housing are consistent with their community strategies. Recommendation 20 is that prospective stock transfer organisations should be required to include in their transfer proposals an element of community development, or, as a minimum, to explain why it is not relevant. Recommendation 28 states that the Assembly Cabinet should promote more actively the benefits of community housing agreements between

Soniodd Janet Ryder hefyd am fanteision trosglwyddo stoc dros y fenter cyllid preifat. Seithfed argymhelliad y Pwyllgor yw y dylai'r Cabinet hybu'r amrywiaeth llawn o opsiynau sydd ar gael i awdurdodau lleol ar gyfer goresgyn yr ôl-groniad o waith atgyweirio a moderneiddio. Yr wythfed argymhelliad yw y dylai'r Cabinet ystyried y ffordd orau o gynghori awdurdodau lleol sydd â diddordeb mewn symud ymlaen â throsglwyddo stoc a phrosiectau partneriaeth cyhoeddus preifat.

Siaradodd Peter Law am les tenantiaid. Mae argymhelliad 13 yn datgan y dylai fod yn ofynnol i awdurdodau lleol sicrhau bod cyngor annibynnol ar gael i denantiaid pan ymgynghorir â hwy yn ystod y broses arfarnu opsiynau. Byddai hynny'n estyniad o rôl yr ymgynghorwyr annibynnol, y mae'n rhaid i awdurdodau eu penodi er mwyn gweithredu fel cynghorwyr tenantiaid cyn datblygu cynigion trosglwyddo stoc manwl.

O ran pwyntiau Peter Law a Dai Lloyd ynglŷn â'r effaith ar staff awdurdod lleol, mae argymhelliad 15 y Pwyllgor yn datgan y dylai awdurdodau lleol gynnwys staff sydd yn gweithio ar reoli a chynnal a chadw tai yn y broses arfarnu opsiynau. Yn gyfreithiol, byddai staff sydd yn trosglwyddo i landlord newydd, yn sgîl trosglwyddo stoc, yn cael eu diogelu gan reoliadau TUPE.

Gofynnodd Peter Black a fyddai trosglwyddo stoc yn llesteirio adfywio cymunedau, a thynnodd sylw at argymhelliad 19. Dylai'r gwrthwyneb fod yn wir, os gall y trosglwyddiad sicrhau'r buddsoddiad sydd yn angenrheidiol i foderneiddio'r stoc tai. Gwnaeth y Pwyllgor nifer o argymhellion yn y maes hwn. Noda argymhelliad 4 y dylid annog awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau bod unrhyw benderfyniadau buddsoddi ar dai cyngor yn gyson â'u strategaethau cymunedol. Dywed argymhelliad 20 y dylai bod gofyn i sefydliadau trosglwyddo stoc arfaethedig gynnwys elfen o ddatblygu cymunedol yn eu cynigion trosglwyddo, neu o leiaf egluro pam nad yw'n berthnasol. Noda argymhelliad 28 y dylai Cabinet y Cynulliad fod yn fwy gweithredol o ran hybu manteision cytundebau tai cymunedol rhwng awdurdodau lleol a landlordiaid cymdeithasol

local authorities and registered social landlords. cofrestredig.

Finally, in reply to Peter Black on assistance for local authorities to redeem overhanging debt, the Committee has recommended that

‘The Assembly Cabinet should press the HM Treasury to make provision available for one-off payments (or alternatively continuing subsidy) to help local authorities redeem any overhanging debt.’

That is recommendation 24. I thank the Assembly for its comments. I assure you that they will be taken back to the Committee and that a letter will be sent to Edwina Hart. I am sure that she will take note of this morning’s valuable debate.

Yn olaf, mewn ateb i Peter Black ynglŷn â chymorth i awdurdodau lleol glirio dyled fargod, argymhellodd y Pwyllgor

‘Dylai Cabinet y Cynulliad bwysu ar Drysorlys Ei Mawrhydi i ddarparu arian ar gyfer taliadau unigol (neu, yn lle hynny, i barhau cymhorthdal) i helpu awdurdodau lleol i glirio unrhyw ddyled fargodol’.

Argymhelliad 24 yw hwnnw. Diolchaf i’r Cynulliad am ei sylwadau. Rhoddaf sicrwydd ichi y byddant yn mynd yn ôl i’r Pwyllgor ac y bydd llythyr yn cael ei anfon at Edwina Hart. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd yn nodi’r ddadl werthfawr y bore yma.

*Cynnig: O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Richards, Rod

Rogers, Peter
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Kirsty
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion adopted.*

**Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Y Blaid Geidwadol)
 Minority Party Debate (The Conservative Party)**

**Methiant Clymblaid y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a Llafur i Ddiogelu Lles a Bywoliaeth
 Cymru Wledig
 The Failure of the Liberal Democrat-Labour Coalition to Protect the Wellbeing and
 Livelihood of Rural Wales**

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1, 2 and 3 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2 a 3 yn enw Jocelyn Davies

Peter Rogers: I propose that

Peter Rogers: Cynigiaf fod

this Assembly, regrets the failure of the Liberal Democrat-Labour coalition to protect the wellbeing and livelihood of rural Wales.

y Cynulliad hwn yn gresynu at fethiant clymblaid y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a Llafur i ddiogelu lles a bywoliaeth Cymru wledig.

I have a confession to make. When the coalition was announced, I had hopes that Mick and Kirsty would fight for rural Wales in the coalition partnership. I have been disappointed, because the interests of farmers in Montgomeryshire, and in Brecon and Radnorshire have been sacrificed to prop up the failed Labour administration. It is not hard to see why Labour has bought the silence of the Liberal Democrats. Its record on the countryside has been one of indifference, neglect and contempt. New Labour made it obvious from the beginning that it was going to mount a class war against the countryside. That is why I have contempt for the Liberal Democrats' actions. Unlike them, I have had the courage of my convictions and have continued to speak out against Labour's mismanagement of the crisis in the countryside.

Mae gennyf rywbeth i'w gyfaddef. Pan gyhoeddwyd y glymblaid, gobeithiwn y byddai Mick a Kirsty yn ymladd dros Gymru wledig ym mhartneriaeth y glymblaid. Cefais fy siomi, oherwydd aberthwyd buddiannau ffermwyr yn Sir Drefaldwyn ac ym Mrycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed er mwyn cynnal y weinyddiaeth Lafur aflwyddiannus. Nid yw'n anodd gweld pam bod y Blaid Lafur wedi prynu tawelwch y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Ymdriniodd â chefn gwlad â difaterwch, esgeulustod a dirmyg. Fe'i gwnaethpwyd yn amlwg gan Lafur Newydd o'r dechrau ei fod am ymladd rhyfel dosbarth yn erbyn cefn gwlad. Dyna pam y dirmygaf weithredoedd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Yn wahanol iddynt hwy, bùm yn barod i sefyll dros fy egwyddorion ac yr wyf wedi parhau i godi fy llais yn erbyn y ffordd y mae'r Blaid Lafur wedi camreoli'r argyfwng yng nghefn gwlad.

The First Minister of this coalition has heaped praise on his Minister for Rural Affairs for his handling of the rural crisis. Perhaps that is because Carwyn Jones

Mae Prif Weinidog y glymblaid hon wedi canmol ei Weinidog dros Faterion Gwledig i'r cymylau am y ffordd yr ymdriniodd â'r argyfwng gwledig. Efallai y gwnaeth hynny

emulates his boss in his dithering and buck-passing. That style of government is characteristic of the First Minister. The coalition's failure to protect the wellbeing and livelihood of rural Wales has been a betrayal of trust.

I do not know when the coalition's divorce proceedings will begin, but for rural Wales, it has not been a happy marriage. Foot and mouth disease has dealt a hammer blow to rural Wales, but we should remember that the countryside was already in crisis before the outbreak. That crisis has demonstrated conclusively the important interdependence of agriculture, tourism, and the rural economy in general. No one element of the rural economy can exist and prosper in isolation. It is imperative that we have a comprehensive strategy for recovery and only one party is offering that.

The great tragedy of this crisis is that it need not have been as widespread or as prolonged as it has been had the Government acted more decisively to tackle it. There will be important changes over the coming years. Working with the new Government in London, we can take many positive actions. For example, it is important that we make headway in identifying the true extent of rural deprivation, for we have an incomplete picture. That picture is complicated by the different patterns of rural employment. The majority of people in the countryside, mainly farmers, are self-employed, and have to struggle on because they do not have access to the same levels of social security as others. Many are living on handouts from charities because of their problems. I think that the only benefit to which they are entitled is family credit, if they have school children under the age of 15. Once we scratch beneath the surface, we will find that rural deprivation has been hugely under reported. I have listened to the problems that we face with Corus and in the steel industry. I have great sympathy with that great industry, which is being destroyed. However, the job losses in rural areas will be far greater than those associated with Corus.

gan fod Carwyn Jones yn efelychu ei bennaeth yn y ffordd y mae'n petruso ac yn osgoi cyfrifoldeb. Mae'r math hwnnw o lywodraethu yn nodweddiadol o Brif Weinidog Cymru. Mae methiant y glymblaid i ddiogelu lles a bywoliaeth Cymru wledig wedi bradychu ymddiriedaeth.

Ni wn pryd y bydd achos ysgariad y glymblaid yn dechrau, ond ni fu'n briodas hapus i Gymru wledig. Bu clwy'r traed a'r genau yn ergyd drom i Gymru wledig, ond dylem gofio bod argyfwng eisoes yng nghefn gwlad cyn y clwyf. Mae'r argyfwng hwnnw wedi dangos yn ddiymwad y cyd-ddibyniaeth bwysig rhwng amaethyddiaeth, twristiaeth, a'r economi wledig yn gyffredinol. Ni all un elfen o'r economi wledig fodoli a ffynnu ar ei phen ei hun. Mae'n hollbwysig bod gennym strategaeth adfer gynhwysfawr a dim ond un blaid sydd yn cynnig hynny.

Trychineb mawr yr argyfwng hwn yw nad oedd angen iddo ledu na pharhau fel y gwnaeth pe byddai'r Llywodraeth wedi cymryd camau mwy pendant i fynd i'r afael ag ef. Bydd newidiadau pwysig yn y blynyddoedd i ddod. Gan gydweithio â'r Llywodraeth newydd yn Llundain, gallwn gymryd llawer o gamau cadarnhaol. Er enghraifft, mae'n bwysig y gwnawn gynnydd o ran nodi graddau gwirioneddol amddifadedd gwledig, gan nad oes darlun cyflawn gennym. Mae'r patrymau gwahanol o gyflogaeth wledig yn cymhlethu'r darlun hwnnw. Mae mwyafrif y bobl yng nghefn gwlad, ffermwyr yn bennaf, yn hunangyflogedig, a rhaid iddynt barhau i ymdrechu'n galed gan na allant gael yr un lefelau o nawdd cymdeithasol â phobl eraill. Mae llawer ohonynt yn byw ar arian gan elusennau oherwydd eu problemau. Credaf mai'r unig fudd-dâl y mae ganddynt hawl i'w gael yw credyd teulu, os oes ganddynt blant ysgol o dan 15 oed. Os awn yn ddyfnach, gwelwn mai prin iawn fu'r sôn am amddifadedd gwledig. Yr wyf wedi gwrando ar y problemau a wynebwn o ran Corus a'r diwydiant dur. Cydymdeimlaf yn fawr â'r diwydiant mawr hwnnw, a gaiff ei ddinistrio. Fodd bynnag, bydd y swyddi a gaiff eu colli mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn llawer mwy na'r rheini sydd yn gysylltiedig â Corus.

10:35 a.m.

There are other important issues that the Assembly is beginning to take up from the Conservatives. Only the Welsh Conservatives have constantly championed the policy of honest food labelling. We recognised a long time ago that we needed to make great strides in promoting the quality and safety of our domestic produce. That is why the coalition must make a success of promoting the Welsh brand of our domestic producers.

There are a range of matters on which the Assembly could have been pressing Gordon Brown. Take fuel—the car is not a luxury in rural areas, it is a necessity. Yet Labour has continued to tax the rural motorist to the hilt. What have Assembly Labour Ministers done to get the Chancellor to give the rural motorist a break? The answer is ‘nothing’. The First Minister was conspicuous by his absence during last summer’s fuel blockades. I do not ask what the Liberal Democrats are doing. They are going to the polls with policies designed to make it harder for the people of Brecon and Radnorshire to get about. The Liberal Democrats are asking rural Wales to pay even more tax. Better public transport that meets demand is one thing, but it is wrong to force rural motorists from their cars by continuing to hit them through fuel tax.

Employment is a major concern. No wonder young people are leaving rural Wales. They believe that remaining in their local communities will prevent them from getting on. The Government has not given them any reason to stay. The first and most important reason for young people to stay and to contribute to their local communities is jobs. Without jobs they leave.

Alun Pugh: You rightly mention employment in rural areas. Some 30,000 people in rural Wales benefited from the national minimum wage. Why, therefore, did your party oppose it?

Mae materion pwysig eraill y mae'r Cynulliad yn dechrau mynd ar eu trywydd a ddaw gan y Ceidwadwyr. Dim ond Ceidwadwyr Cymru sydd wedi cefnogi'n gyson y polisi o labelu bwydydd yn onest. Cydnabuom amser maith yn ôl fod angen inni wneud cynnydd mawr wrth hyrwyddo ansawdd a diogelwch ein cynnyrch mewnwladol. Dyna pam bod yn rhaid i'r glymblaid lwyddo i hyrwyddo brand Cymreig ein cynhyrchwyr mewnwladol.

Mae amrywiaeth o faterion y gallai'r Cynulliad fod wedi bod yn pwysu ar Gordon Brown yn eu cylch. Cymerwch danwydd fel enghraifft—nid peth moethus yw car mewn ardaloedd gwledig, ond anghenraid. Serch hynny, mae'r blaid Lafur wedi parhau i drethu modurwyr gwledig hyd yr eithaf. Beth mae Gweinidogion Llafur y Cynulliad wedi'i wneud i ddarbwylo'r Canghellor i helpu modurwyr gwledig? 'Dim' yw'r ateb. Yr oedd absenoldeb Prif Weinidog Cymru yn amlwg yn ystod gwarchaeau tanwydd yr haf diwethaf. Ni ofynnaf beth mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn ei wneud. Ânt i'r etholiad gyda pholisïau sydd â'r nod o'i gwneud yn anodd i drigolion Brycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed deithio. Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn gofyn i Gymru wledig dalu hyd yn oed mwy o drethi. Mae cludiant cyhoeddus gwell sydd yn bodloni'r galw yn iawn, ond nid yw'n briodol gorfodi modurwyr gwledig i beidio â defnyddio eu ceir drwy barhau i wneud iddynt ddiodef oherwydd y dreth danwydd.

Mae cyflogaeth yn achos pryder mawr. Nid oes rhyfedd bod pobl ifanc yn gadael Cymru wledig. Credant y bydd aros yn eu cymunedau lleol yn eu rhwystro rhag llwyddo. Nid yw'r Llywodraeth wedi rhoi unrhyw reswm iddynt aros. Swyddi yw'r rheswm cyntaf a phwysicaf pam bod pobl ifanc yn aros ac yn cyfrannu at eu cymunedau lleol. Heb swyddi, maent yn gadael.

Alun Pugh: Mae'n briodol eich bod yn crybwyll cyflogaeth mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Mae tua 30,000 o bobl yng Nghymru wledig wedi elwa ar yr isafswm cyflog cenedlaethol. Pam, felly, y'i gwrthwynebwyd gan eich plaid?

Peter Rogers: That is a wise effort from you, Alun, coming from the rural area of Clwyd West. Your contribution to help people in rural areas during your reign in the Assembly leaves much to be desired.

Low taxation and employment opportunities are what rural Wales needs, not more stealth tax. This coalition has failed to enhance the great potential of the rural economy and an industry around which we could have built a whole range of other businesses. Liberal Democrat and Labour Ministers should start talking less about joined-up Government and start focusing on an integrated economy. If the Government had supported agriculture-related businesses in rural Wales over the last few years we could have avoided much of the pain and disaster that rural communities must now face. The fact that this unhappy marriage between Labour and the Liberal Democrats has conspired to hammer rural Wales into the ground shows that the Welsh Conservative Party is the true party of rural Wales.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call Phil Williams to propose the amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘Come on, Phil.’]

Phil Williams: I just need to find my notes; I did not expect to speak now. Here they are. [*Applause.*]

Rod Richards: Point of order.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I hope that this point of order will not be facetious.

Rod Richards: Certainly not, Dirprwy Lywydd. I only want to be clear about where we are on the agenda. Is this the short debate by Phil Williams or a previous item?

Alun Pugh: Point of order. Can you tell me who is proposing the amendments on behalf of Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales? Is it, Dirprwy Lywydd, that formal proposing

Peter Rogers: Mae honno'n ymdrech ddoeth gennych chi, Alun, gan eich bod yn dod o ardal wledig Gorllewin Clwyd. Bu eich cyfraniad i helpu pobl mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn ystod eich tymor yn y Cynulliad ymhell o fod yn foddhaol.

Trethi isel a chyfleoedd cyflogaeth yw'r hyn sydd ei angen ar Gymru wledig, nid mwy o drethi llechwraidd. Nid yw'r glymblaid hon wedi gwella potensial mawr yr economi wledig a diwydiant y gallem fod wedi adeiladu amrywiaeth lawn o fusnesau eraill o'i gwmpas. Dylai Gweinidogion y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a'r Blaid Lafur ddechrau siarad llai am Lywodraeth gydgysylltiedig a dechrau canolbwyntio ar economi integredig. Pe byddai'r Llywodraeth wedi cefnogi busnesau yn gysylltiedig ag amaethyddiaeth yng Nghymru wledig dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf, gallem fod wedi osgoi llawer o'r boen a'r trychineb y mae'n rhaid i gymunedau gwledig eu hwynebu ar hyn o bryd. Dengys y ffaith bod y briodas anhapus hon rhwng y Blaid Lafur a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wedi cynllwynio i roi ergyd drom i Gymru wledig mai Plaid Geidwadol Cymru yw gwir blaid Cymru wledig.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Galwaf ar Phil Williams i gynnig y gwelliannau yn enw Jocelyn Davies. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: ‘Dewch ymlaen, Phil.’]

Phil Williams: Rhaid imi gael hyd i'm nodiadau yn gyntaf; nid oeddwn yn disgwyl siarad yn awr. Dyma nhw. [*Cymeradwyaeth.*]

Rod Richards: Pwynt o drefn.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Gobeithiaf na fydd y pwynt hwn o drefn yn wamal.

Rod Richards: Ddim o gwbl, Ddirprwy Lywydd. Yr unig beth yr wyf am fod yn glir yn ei gylch yw ein lle ar yr agenda. Ai'r ddadl fer gan Phil Williams yw hon neu eitem flaenorol?

Alun Pugh: Pwynt o drefn. A allwch ddweud wrthyf pwy sydd yn cynnig y gwelliannau ar ran Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales? Onid yw'n wir, Ddirprwy Lywydd,

speeches—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I am, as usual, grateful to Members for seeking to help me with my duties. I have called Phil Williams to propose the amendments on the agenda.

Phil Williams: I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 1: In line one, after ‘regrets’ add:

the long term decline of rural Wales and

I propose amendment 2. Add at the end of the motion:

The National Assembly recognises the devastating impact of the foot and mouth disease crisis and calls on the Labour-Liberal Democrat administration, with the Rural Partnership, to urgently develop a strategy to revitalise the rural economy, and to fund these regeneration measures over and above the Barnett block.

I propose amendment 3. Add at the end of the motion:

The National Assembly calls upon the Labour-Liberal Democrat administration to implement a young farmers’ entrants scheme as a means of securing the long-term viability of agriculture in Wales.

I will speak to amendment 2 because it contains the crucial words ‘over and above the Barnett block’. The point about the allocation of funds in the UK budget is that it bears no relationship to need.

Alun Cairns: Is this a speech that you have previously prepared about the Barnett formula that you are just using on this occasion?

Phil Williams: No, absolutely not. I noticed that, in an important conference on cohesion in Brussels, only one badge was not claimed on the conference table, and that belonged to a certain Alun Cairns. A serious point emerged from that meeting. The development of regional policy in Europe is now being

fod areithiau cynnig ffurfiol —

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Yr wyf, fel arfer, yn ddiolchgar i'r Aelodau am geisio fy helpu i gyflawni fy nyletswyddau. Yr wyf wedi galw ar Phil Williams i gynnig y gwelliannau ar yr agenda.

Phil Williams: Cynigaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 1: Yn llinell un, ychwanegu ar ôl ‘*gresynu at*’:

ddirywiad tymor hir cefn gwlad Cymru ac

Cynigaf welliant 2. Ychwanegu ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn cydnabod effaith ddinistriol argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau ac yn galw ar y weinyddiaeth Lafur-Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ynghyd â'r Bartneriaeth Wledig i ddatblygu strategaeth ar frys i adfywio'r economi wledig ac ariannu'r mesurau adnewyddu y tu hwnt i floc Barnett.

Cynigaf welliant 3. Ychwanegu ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn galw ar y weinyddiaeth Lafur-Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol i weithredu cynllun ffermwyr ifanc newydd fel ffordd o sicrhau hyfywdra tymor hir amaethyddiaeth yng Nghymru.

Siaradaf am welliant 2 gan ei fod yn cynnwys y geiriau holl bwysig ‘y tu hwnt i floc Barnett’. Y pwynt ynghylch y ffordd y dyrennir arian yng nghyllideb y DU yw nad oes a wnelo ddim ag angen.

Alun Cairns: Ai araith flaenorol a baratoasoch am fformiwla Barnett yw'r araith hon a ddefnyddiwyd yn awr?

Phil Williams: Nage, dim o gwbl. Sylwais, mewn cynhadledd bwysig ym Mrwsel yn ymwneud â chydlyniant, mai dim ond un bathodyn na chafodd ei gasglu o fwrdd y gynhadledd, sef bathodyn rhywun o'r enw Alun Cairns. Deilliodd pwynt difrifol o'r cyfarfod hwnnw. Caiff y gwaith o ddatblygu

monitored by an index called the index of discrepancy in gross domestic product between regions. When you look at the list of indices to see which countries managed to sustain cohesion between prosperity in their different regions—

Rod Richards: Sweden.

Phil Williams: Indeed, yes. Out of the 15, which country had the greatest disparity and greatest gap between the prosperous and the poor areas? By a large margin, it was the United Kingdom with an index of 33.8. Portugal had the lowest index with about 6 or 7, and Sweden's was also low. In the whole of Europe no other country has done less to reduce economic disparity. The reason is that there is a total refusal to base funding on need. We have had several issues where it would be—

Carwyn Jones: As far as agriculture and rural affairs are concerned, the vast majority of funding comes from outside the Barnett block.

Phil Williams: You may have missed the fact, Mr Jones, that the big issue is not agriculture, but the recovery of the tourism industry, and all those businesses that face bankruptcy. They come under our budget. They are our responsibility. In fact, it is the Economic Development Committee's responsibility. When we hear that we have £12 million to meet huge needs—

Huw Lewis: You are always more than generous when giving way, but today, I feel that it might be that you are anxious to pad out the time. [*Laughter.*]

Phil Williams: You asked your question and the answer is that it is not often that I get time—

Huw Lewis: Are you giving way?

Phil Williams: I thought that you had asked your question.

Huw Lewis: No, I was warming up. I was glad to hear that you have such admiration for Sweden, which, of course, has had an

polisi rhanbarthol yn Ewrop ei fonitro bellach gan fynegrif o'r enw mynegrif anghysondeb mewn cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth rhwng rhanbarthau. Pan edrychwch ar y rhestr o fynegrifau i weld pa wledydd a lwyddodd i gynnal cydlyniant rhwng ffyniant yn eu rhanbarthau gwahanol—

Rod Richards: Sweden.

Phil Williams: Yn wir, ie. O'r 15 o wledydd, pa wlad oedd â'r anghyfartaledd mwyaf a'r bwlch mwyaf rhwng yr ardaloedd ffyniannus a thlawd? Y Deyrnas Unedig ydoedd o lawer, gyda mynegrif o 33.8. Portiwgal oedd â'r mynegrif isaf gyda thua 6 neu 7, ac yr oedd mynegrif Sweden yn isel hefyd. Yn Ewrop gyfan, nid oes unrhyw wlad arall wedi gwneud llai i leihau'r anghyfartaledd economaidd. Y rheswm dros hynny yw y gwrthodir ariannu ar sail angen. Cawsom nifer o faterion lle y byddai'n—

Carwyn Jones: O ran amaethyddiaeth a materion gwledig, daw'r mwyafrif helaeth o'r arian o'r tu allan i floc Barnett.

Phil Williams: Efallai eich bod wedi colli'r ffaith, Mr Jones, nad amaethyddiaeth yw'r mater pwysig, ond adfer y diwydiant twristiaeth, a'r holl fusnesau hynny sydd yn wynebu methdaliad. Deuant o dan ein cyllideb. Ein cyfrifoldeb ni ydynt. Yn wir, cyfrifoldeb y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ydyw. Pan glywn fod gennym £12 miliwn i ddiwallu anghenion mawr—

Huw Lewis: Yr ydych bob amser yn hael iawn wrth ildio, ond heddiw, teimlaf ei bod yn bosibl eich bod yn awyddus i lenwi'r amser. [*Chwerthin.*]

Phil Williams: Gofynasoch eich cwestiwn a'r ateb yw na chaf amser yn aml—

Huw Lewis: A ildiwch?

Phil Williams: Credwn eich bod wedi gofyn eich cwestiwn.

Huw Lewis: Nac oeddwn, rhagarweiniad oedd hynny. Yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed bod gennych gymaint o edmygedd tuag at

almost unbroken chain of Labour Governments since the war. I do not doubt that the disparity between rich and poor being so small has had a great deal to do with that. Can I take it—

Sweden, lle y bu cyfres ddi-dor o Lywodraethau Llafur ers y rhyfel, wrth gwrs. Nid oes amheuaeth gennyf mai dyna un o'r prif resymau pam bod yr anghyfartaledd rhwng y cyfoethog a'r tlawd mor fach. A allaf dybio—

10:45 a.m.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Interventions should be brief and to the point.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Dylai ymyriadau fod yn fyr a chryno.

Huw Lewis: I am trying to get there, Dirprwy Lywydd. Given your support for amendment 2, can I take it, in terms of your economic tactics, Phil, that you once again wish to redistribute wealth within the Welsh budget away from the south Wales Valleys towards rural Wales? That is your party's number one priority every time.

Huw Lewis: Ceisïaf gyrraedd y pwynt, Ddirprwy Lywydd. O ystyried eich cefnogaeth i welliant 2, a allaf dybio, o ran eich tactegau economaidd, Phil, eich bod unwaith eto am aiddosbarthu cyfoeth o fewn cyllideb Cymru o Gymoedd de Cymru i Gymru wledig? Dyna brif flaenoriaeth eich plaid bob tro.

Phil Williams. No. That is totally unworthy of you. We are saying that we should not be put in a position where we have a huge crisis of a much greater magnitude than we currently have the resources to cope with. I do not know if you, as I do, have a great number of people who come you and say, 'How do I access this hardship fund? I have had no bookings'. Even in the heads of the Valleys people have lost their tourism incomes. Everywhere is affected. We currently have a formula that is based on a detailed needs assessment in 1978, but which does not recognise current need. The recent flooding is one example of need, the foot and mouth crises is a much bigger example, and Corus is another example. You could quantify the extra need generated by all those, yet no recognition is given to that.

Phil Williams: Na allwch. Mae hynny'n gwbl annheilwng ohonoch. Dywedwn na ddylem fod mewn sefyllfa lle y ceir argyfwng enfawr sydd yn llawer mwy na'r adnoddau sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd i ymdopi ag ef. Ni wn a ddaw nifer o bobl atoch, fel sydd yn dod ataf fi, gan ddweud, 'Sut y gallaf gael arian o'r gronfa caledi hon? Nid wyf wedi cael unrhyw archebion.' Hyd yn oed ym mlaenau'r Cymoedd, mae pobl wedi colli eu hincymau twristiaeth. Caiff pobman ei effeithio. Mae'r fformiwla sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd yn seiliedig ar asesiad manwl o anghenion a gynhaliwyd yn 1978, ond nad yw'n cydnabod anghenion presennol. Mae'r llifogydd diweddar yn enghraifft o un o'r anghenion, mae clwy'r traed a'r genau yn enghraifft lawer mwy, ac mae Corus yn enghraifft arall. Gallwch feintioli'r angen ychwanegol a grëir gan yr holl enghreifftiau hynny, ond ni chydabyddir hynny.

Nick Bourne: I am grateful to Phil Williams for graciously giving way, as always. Our heart goes out to him; he has obviously been dealt a difficult hand. I wonder if a note has gone out to Elin Jones requesting that her notes on the motion be brought in for Phil? Clearly this excursive speech on the Barnett block and Sweden has little to do with rural Wales. As if on cue, I see that the notes have arrived.

Nick Bourne: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Phil Williams am fod mor hael ag ildio, yn ôl ei arfer. Cydymdeimlwn ag ef; mae'n amlwg ei fod wedi cael tro gwael. Tybed a anfonwyd nodyn at Elin Jones yn gofyn i'w nodiadau ar y cynnig gael eu rhoi i Phil? Mae'n amlwg nad yw'r araith grwydrol hon ar flocc Barnett a Sweden yn berthnasol iawn i Gymru wledig. Gwelaf fod y nodiadau wedi cyrraedd, ar y gair.

Phil Williams: I cannot see the relevance of

Phil Williams: Ni welaf berthnasedd eich

your comments. The amendment talks about regenerating the rural economy with money provided over and above the Barnett block and that is what I was talking about. Perhaps the Tories, who contributed so much to the economic decline of Wales—rural and urban—may not understand that that regeneration requires properly planned and allocated resources. We do not currently have those resources and therefore this issue is important. This is one crisis of many where we are told that we must distribute from our under-resourced budget to cope with large crises. While we remain part of the United Kingdom, and a part of the European Union member state with the least effective regional policy to bring cohesion, it is our duty to fight for a better deal.

Delyth Evans: I am sure that voters in rural Wales will be interested to note that Plaid Cymru could not get their act together to contribute to this debate. It is also interesting that the Welsh Conservative Party put themselves forward as the voice of rural Wales. People who live in rural Wales clearly do not agree with that, because they failed to return a single Conservative MP in rural Wales, or anywhere else in Wales at the last election.

David Davies: Having had a taste of what Labour had to offer to rural areas, they were happy to return a Conservative Assembly Member at the last election.

Delyth Evans: I have no doubt that the Tories will repeat their abysmal record in two weeks' time. Little wonder that people in rural areas do not vote for them when you look at their miserable record on rural issues when they were in government. On average, 30 village schools were closed every year. During the Tory years, rural bus services were devastated, rural crime rocketed, huge areas of green-belt land were released for development and unemployment in rural areas increased year on year. The number of Welsh farmers plummeted, the Welsh dairy herd fell by 14,000 in the last two years of the Conservative Government alone, and, of course, they presided over the BSE crisis.

sylwadau. Mae'r gwelliant yn ymwneud ag adfywio'r economi wledig gydag arian a ddarperir y tu hwnt i floc Barnett a dyna'r hyn yr oeddwn yn siarad amdano. Efallai nad yw'r Torïaid, a gyfrannodd gymaint at ddirywiad economaidd Cymru—Cymru wledig a threfol—yn deall bod angen adnoddau wedi eu cynllunio a'u dyrannu yn gywir ar y broses adfywio honno. Nid yw'r adnoddau hynny gennym ar hyn o bryd ac felly mae'r mater hwn yn un pwysig. Un argyfwng mewn nifer yw hwn lle y dywedir wrthym bod yn rhaid inni ddsbarthu arian o'n cyllideb annigonol i ymdopi ag argyfyngau mawr. Tra byddwn yn parhau i fod yn rhan o'r Deyrnas Unedig, a rhan o aelod-wladwriaeth yr Undeb Ewropeaidd sydd â'r polisi rhanbarthol lleiaf effeithiol i sicrhau cydlyniant, mae dyletswydd arnom i ymladd dros fargen well.

Delyth Evans: Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd gan bleidleiswyr Cymru wledig ddiddordeb nodi na allai Plaid Cymru fod yn ddigon trefnus i gyfrannu i'r ddadl hon. Mae hefyd yn ddiddorol bod Plaid Geidwadol Cymru yn cynnig ei hun fel llais Cymru wledig. Mae'n amlwg nad yw trigolion Cymru wledig yn cytuno â hynny, gan nad etholwyd un AS Ceidwadol yng Nghymru wledig, neu unrhyw le arall yng Nghymru yn yr etholiad diwethaf.

David Davies: Ar ôl cael blas ar yr hyn yr oedd gan y Blaid Lafur i'w gynnig i ardaloedd gwledig, yr oeddent yn fodlon ethol Aelod Ceidwadol i'r Cynulliad yn yr etholiad diwethaf.

Delyth Evans: Nid oes gennyf unrhyw amheuaeth y bydd y Torïaid yn cael yr un canlyniadau gwarthus ymhen pythefnos. Nid yw'n syndod nad yw trigolion ardaloedd gwledig yn pleidleisio drostynt pan ystyriwch eu record truenus ar faterion gwledig pan oeddent mewn grym. Ar gyfartaledd, caewyd 30 o ysgolion pentref bob blwyddyn. Yn ystod blynyddoedd y Torïaid, dinistriwyd gwasanaethau bysiau gwledig, cododd yr achosion o droseddau gwledig i'r entrychion, rhyddhawyd ardaloedd enfawr o dir glas ar gyfer datblygu a chododd diweithdra mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn flynyddol. Gostyngodd nifer y ffermwyr yng Nghymru yn sylweddol, cafwyd gostyngiad o 14,000 yn nifer y

buchesau gwartheg godro yng Nghymru yn ystod dwy flynedd olaf y Llywodraeth Geidwadol yn unig, ac, wrth gwrs, yr oeddent mewn grym yn ystod argyfwng BSE.

Compare that depressing list with the Labour Party's record, in the Assembly and at a UK level. There was a £5 million increase in the rural bus subsidy in the Assembly's first year alone, and big increases in funding for community transport schemes, as well as free bus passes for pensioners and free bus travel for pensioners in a year's time. There has been massive investment in rural health services and the creation of NHS Direct, which benefits rural communities as well as urban communities, as well as the creation of Finance Wales, which has already helped hundreds of businesses across rural Wales. Of course, we also secured Objective 1 status. In every rural constituency in Wales unemployment has fallen under the Labour Government.

Cymharwch y rhestr dorcalonnus honno â chanlyniadau'r Plaid Lafur, yn y Cynulliad ac yn y DU. Cafwyd cynnydd o £5 miliwn yn y cymhorthdal bysiau gwledig yn ystod blwyddyn gyntaf y Cynulliad yn unig, a rhoddwyd llawer mwy o arian i gynlluniau cludiant cyhoeddus, yn ogystal â phâs bws am ddim i bensiywyr a theithio ar fysiau am ddim i bensiywyr ymhen blwyddyn. Bu buddsoddiad enfawr mewn gwasanaethau iechyd gwledig a chrewyd NHS Direct, sydd â manteision ar gyfer cymunedau gwledig ynghyd â chymunedau trefol, a chrewyd Cyllid Cymru, sydd eisoes wedi helpu cannoedd o fusnesau ledled Cymru wledig. Wrth gwrs, sicrhawyd statws Amcan 1 hefyd. Mae diweithdra wedi lleihau ym mhob etholaeth wledig yng Nghymru o dan y Llywodraeth Lafur.

In terms of agriculture specifically, we have increased support for organic farming and Tir Gofal. We have created new opportunities and new markets through the excellent work of the agri-food partnership. We are improving and strengthening advice services to farmers. We are creating an independent appeals mechanism for farming disputes. We are lifting the burden of hygiene charges on small abattoirs. I could go on, but time is short.

O ran amaethyddiaeth yn benodol, yr ydym wedi cynyddu cymorth i ffermio organig a Thir Gofal. Yr ydym wedi creu cyfleoedd newydd a marchnadoedd newydd drwy'r gwaith ardderchog gyda'r bartneriaeth bwyd-amaeth. Yr ydym wrthi'n gwella ac atgyfnerthu gwasanaethau cyngor i ffermwyr. Yr ydym wrthi'n creu system apelio annibynnol ar gyfer achosion o anghydfod ffermio. Yr ydym wrthi'n lleihau baich taliadau hylendid ar ladd-dai bach. Gallwn barhau, ond mae amser yn brin.

Unlike the Conservatives, who are trying to divide our urban and rural communities, the Labour Government governs for the whole country. We have introduced policies across the board.

Yn wahanol i'r Ceidwadwyr, sydd yn ceisio rhannu ein cymunedau trefol a gwledig, mae'r Llywodraeth Lafur yn llywodraethu'r wlad gyfan. Yr ydym wedi cyflwyno polisiau yn gyffredinol.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yr ydych yn cyfeirio at Lywodraeth Lafur. A ydych yn cyfeirio at Lywodraeth San Steffan neu Lywodraeth Caerdydd?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: You refer to a Labour Government. Do you refer to the Westminster Government or the Cardiff Government?

Delyth Evans: Yr wyf yn cyfeirio at y ddwy. Cyfeiriaf at Lywodraeth Lafur San Steffan ac arweinyddiaeth Lafur yn y Cynulliad. Ein cryfder yw bod Plaid Lafur Cymru a'r Plaid Lafur ar lefel Brydeinig yn cydweithio i greu bywyd gwell i bobl yn ein hardaloedd

Delyth Evans: I refer to both. I refer to the Labour Government in Westminster and the Labour leadership in the Assembly. Our strength is that the Labour Party in Wales and the Labour Party at the British level co-operate to create a better life for people in our

gwledig.

We have introduced policies that benefit communities across Wales, both rural and urban.

Alun Cairns *rose*—

Delyth Evans: Yr wyf bron â gorffen felly ni fyddaf yn cymryd ymyriad arall.

We will continue and develop that record in a second term of the UK Labour Government and in the Assembly.

Glyn Davies: Peter Rogers gave a brilliant and outstanding performance earlier on. He gets better and better. I was impressed by how he single-handedly destroyed the possibility of Alun Pugh reaching the Cabinet.

Alun Pugh: I pointed out that 30,000 people in rural Wales benefited from the minimum wage. Your colleague would not tell me why your party voted against that. Perhaps you will do so.

Glyn Davies: You know that we were concerned about the impact a minimum wage might have on employment levels. However, I want to keep to the issue at hand. Bearing in mind how well Peter spoke, I want to do something rather different. I am a true countryman. I have had an interest in rural Wales's wellbeing all my life and an interest from a political perspective for perhaps the last 25 years. Since there is an election taking place elsewhere—and I would not want to encourage people to vote one way or another in that—I want my contribution to be a personal reflection on rural issues.

I will address Plaid Cymru's reference to long-term decline. You may well have included that reference to score some political point. I do not know. However, I do think that the issue of long-term decline is a crucial one. The greatest decline in rural Wales took place in the first half of the twentieth century. There is no doubt that for almost the whole of that century there has been what might be loosely termed as rural decline. However, we saw a reverse in that at

rural areas.

Yr ydym wedi cyflwyno polisiau sydd o fudd i gymunedau ledled Cymru, yn wledig ac yn drefol.

Alun Cairns *a gododd*—

Delyth Evans: I have nearly finished so I will not take another intervention.

Byddwn yn parhau i ddatblygu'r record honno mewn ail dymor o Lywodraeth Lafur yn y DU ac yn y Cynulliad.

Glyn Davies: Rhoddodd Peter Rogers berfformiad rhagorol ac eithriadol yn gynharach. Mae'n gwella bob tro. Gwnaeth y modd y dinistriodd, ar ei ben ei hun, y posibilrwydd y byddai Alun Pugh yn cyrraedd y Cabinet argraff arnaf.

Alun Pugh: Nodais fod 30,000 o bobl yng Nghymru wledig yn elwa ar yr isafswm cyflog. Nid oedd eich cyd-Aelod yn fodlon dweud wrthyf pam y pleidleisiodd eich plaid yn erbyn hynny. Efallai y dywedwch chi wrthyf.

Glyn Davies: Gwyddoch ein bod yn poeni am yr effaith y gallai isafswm cyflog ei chael ar lefelau cyflogaeth. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf am gadw at y mater dan sylw. Gan gofio pa mor dda y siaradodd Peter, yr wyf am wneud rhywbeth eithaf gwahanol. Yr wyf yn wladwr i'r cam. Bu diddordeb gennyf mewn lles Cymru wledig drwy gydol fy mywyd a diddordeb o safbwynt gwleidyddol ers efallai 25 mlynedd. Gan fod etholiad yn cael ei gynnal rywle arall—ac ni fyddwn am annog pobl i bleidleisio y naill ffordd neu'r llall ynddo—yr wyf am i'm cyfraniad gynnwys ystyriaethau personol am faterion gwledig.

Ymdriniaf â chyfeiriad Plaid Cymru at ddirywiad hirdymor. Mae'n bosibl eich bod wedi cyfeirio at hynny i ennill rhyw bwynt gwleidyddol. Ni wn. Fodd bynnag, credaf fod y mater o ddirywiad hirdymor yn un hanfodol. Digwyddodd y dirywiad mwyaf yng Nghymru wledig yn ystod hanner cyntaf yr ugeinfed ganrif. Nid oes amheuaeth y digwyddodd yr hyn y gellid ei alw'n fras yn ddirywiad gwledig drwy gydol y ganrif gyfan honno bron. Fodd bynnag, gwrthdrowyd

one time. For example, in the early twentieth century, there was a population of 50,000 in Montgomeryshire, where Mick and I live. That was quite a dynamic community. When I first became interested in rural Wales—that is in the 60s and 70s after I left school—the population had declined to about 36,000 and was declining seriously. All the prospects were poor. Now, of course, it is around 50,000 again and its prospects have been looking good. Let us consider the intervening period. What happened was that governments of various colours in the 1950s, 1960s and 1970s were responsible for Government intervention in different forms to address this specific problem. Eventually, a Labour Government created the Development Board for Rural Wales in 1977. I was involved in that. The Board did a magnificent job. For the whole of that period all the indicators were up for every aspect of rural Wales. This administration abolished the Development Board for Rural Wales, admittedly, under the guise of merger. However, in my view that is the greatest mistake that this Government has made in rural Wales.

I will also comment on the foot and mouth disease outbreak. That has been incredibly damaging to the whole of rural Wales. I cannot speak about rural Wales without commenting on that issue. I must be critical of the Government in general. There are various aspects to this, but one must focus on the first five weeks. Bearing in mind that the Government's policy was to slaughter in the way that it did—and I do not disagree with that—an absolutely crucial part was that it be implemented from day one. However, that did not happen because, for five weeks, the Prime Minister believed that he could gain electoral advantage by pretending that everything was under control. That is what probably caused the slaughtering frenzy. Everyone who cares about rural Wales must insist on a public inquiry into how the foot and mouth disease crisis was managed. It should look at the consequences of pretending to be in control for the first few weeks without addressing the problem, as millions of animals were slaughtered and people's livelihoods were destroyed.

hynny ar un adeg. Er enghraifft, yn gynnar yn yr ugeinfed ganrif, yr oedd poblogaeth o 50,000 yn Sir Drefaldwyn, lle yr wyf fi a Mick yn byw. Yr oedd y gymuned honno yn gymharol ddynamig. Pan ddechreuais ymddiddori yng Nghymru wledig—sef yn y 60au a'r 70au ar ôl imi adael yr ysgol—yr oedd y boblogaeth wedi gostwng i tua 36,000 ac yr oedd yn parhau i ostwng yn gyflym. Yr oedd yr holl ragolygon yn wael. Erbyn hyn, wrth gwrs, mae'r boblogaeth yn tua 50,000 unwaith eto a bu ei rhagolygon yn addawol. Gadewch inni ystyried y cyfnod yn y canol. Yr hyn a ddigwyddodd oedd bod llywodraethau o bleidiau gwahanol yn y 1950au, 1960au a'r 1970au yn gyfrifol am ymyrryd mewn ffyrdd gwahanol i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem benodol hon. Yn y pen draw, sefydlodd Llywodraeth Lafur Fwrdd Datblygu Cymru Wledig yn 1977. Cymerais ran yn y gwaith hwnnw. Gwnaeth y Bwrdd waith ardderchog. Drwy gydol y cyfnod hwnnw, cynyddodd pob dangosydd ar gyfer pob agwedd ar Gymru weledig. Diddymwyd Bwrdd Datblygu Cymru Wledig gan y weinyddiaeth hon, dan gochl uno, rhaid cyfaddef. Fodd bynnag, yn fy marn i, dyna'r camgymeriad mwyaf a wnaeth y Llywodraeth hon yng Nghymru wledig.

Gwnaf sylwadau ar argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau hefyd. Mae'r argyfwng hwnnw wedi cael effaith andwyol dros ben ar Gymru wledig gyfan. Ni allaf siarad am Gymru wledig heb sôn am y mater hwnnw. Rhaid imi fod yn feirniadol o'r Llywodraeth yn gyffredinol. Mae amrywiol agweddau ar hyn, ond rhaid canolbwyntio ar y pum wythnos gyntaf. O gofio mai polisi'r Llywodraeth oedd lladd yn y ffordd a wnaeth—ac nid anghytunaf â hynny—rhan hanfodol o hynny oedd bod yn rhaid ei weithredu o'r diwrnod cyntaf. Fodd bynnag, ni ddigwyddodd hynny gan fod y Prif Weinidog yn credu, am y pum wythnos gyntaf, y gallai ennill mantais etholiadol drwy honni bod popeth o dan reolaeth. Dyna'r hyn a achosodd y lladd gorffwyll. Rhaid i bawb sydd yn poeni am Gymru wledig fynnu bod ymchwiliad cyhoeddus yn cael ei gynnal i'r modd y rheolwyd argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau. Dylai'r ymchwiliad ystyried canlyniadau honni bod y sefyllfa o dan reolaeth am yr ychydig wythnosau cyntaf heb fynd i'r afael â'r broblem, gan i filiynau o anifeiliaid gael

eu lladd a bywoliaeth llawer o bobl gael ei dinistrio.

10:55 a.m.

The Assembly's performance in dealing with GM crops is also important. The view of the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee and the Assembly as a whole is that the future of Welsh agriculture depends on a green and wholesome image. That will undoubtedly be threatened by the development of GM technology in Wales. There is concern about the perception that the growing of GM crops might create. The Assembly has taken a strong view because some Members believe that GM technology is dangerous, while others believe that the future the Assembly has mapped out for rural Wales is under threat. As I have said before, it is an appalling hypocrisy on the part of the UK Government to pretend that it shares this view, while the Minister responsible for this at a UK level has been writing to people to encourage them that these trials should go ahead. How can you trust a party that is prepared to deal in such hypocrisy to have responsibility not only for rural Wales, but for any part of Britain?

Mick Bates: I welcome this debate, which has exposed the hardest line in hypocrisy displayed by any party in the Assembly. It is an insult to this establishment that the party that tabled amendments to this motion was absent from the Chamber at the beginning of the debate. That is a reflection of that party's depth of compassion, sympathy and understanding of what this debate stands for. I will also address some remarks to the proposers of this motion.

Elin Jones *rose*—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Will you give way?

Mick Bates: No, thank you.

When, years ago, I heard a Prime Minister say that society is dead, I knew that the party in question had no compassion. Its actions were proof of that. The party destroyed rural areas through lack of investment, took apart

Mae perfformiad y Cynulliad wrth ddelio â chnydau a addaswyd yn enetig hefyd yn bwysig. Barn y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig a'r Cynulliad cyfan yw bod dyfodol amaethyddiaeth Cymru yn dibynnu ar ddelwedd werdd ac iachus. Caiff hynny ei fygwth yn ddiamau wrth ddatblygu technoleg cnydau a addaswyd yn enetig yng Nghymru. Ceir pryderon am yr argraff y gallai tyfu cnydau a addaswyd yn enetig ei greu. Mae'r Cynulliad wedi cymryd barn bendant gan fod rhai Aelodau yn credu bod technoleg cnydau a addaswyd yn enetig yn beryglus, tra bod Aelodau eraill yn credu bod y dyfodol y mae'r Cynulliad wedi'i lunio i Gymru wledig mewn perygl. Fel y dywedais eisoes, mae'n enghraifft o ragrith warthus ar ran Llywodraeth y DU ei bod yn honni rhannu'r farn hon, tra bod y Gweinidog sydd yn gyfrifol am y mater hwn ar lefel y DU yn ysgrifennu at bobl i'w hannog i barhau â'r treialon hyn. Sut y gallwch ymddiried mewn plaid sydd yn barod i fod mor ragrithiol i fod yn gyfrifol nid yn unig am Gymru wledig, ond am unrhyw ran o Brydain?

Mick Bates: Croesawaf y ddadl hon, sydd wedi amlygu'r rhagrith mwyaf a ddangoswyd gan unrhyw blaid yn y Cynulliad. Mae'n sarhad ar y sefydliad hwn nad oedd y blaid a gyflwynodd y gwelliannau i'r cynnig hwn yn bresennol yn y Siambr ar ddechrau'r dadl. Mae hynny'n adlewyrchiad o dosturi, cydymdeimlad a dealltwriaeth y blaid honno o arwyddocâd y ddadl hon. Byddaf hefyd yn cyfeirio rhai sylwadau at y bobl sydd wedi cynnig y cynnig hwn.

Elin Jones *a gododd*—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: A wnewch chi ildio?

Mick Bates: Dim diolch.

Pan glywais Brif Weinidog, flynyddoedd yn ôl, yn dweud bod cymdeithas wedi marw, gwyddwn nad oedd unrhyw dosturi gan y blaid dan sylw. Profwyd hynny gan ei gweithredoedd. Dinistriodd y blaid ardaloedd

the necessary infrastructure and cut farming support.

David Davies *rose*—

Mick Bates: It witnessed the decline of rural infrastructure, was pleased to praise capitalism at its worst and watched the decline continue year after year. It is rank hypocrisy to criticise what the Assembly has achieved. I hope that the party reverses its stance, and recognises how much the partnership Government has achieved in a short period of time.

Jonathan Morgan *rose*—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Mick Bates is not giving way.

Ron Davies *rose*—

Mick Bates: I will not take any interventions. A few cages have obviously been rattled. However, I will continue.

There are difficulties facing rural communities and challenges that we must meet, from foot and mouth disease to the retention of young people in rural areas. We must improve services and infrastructure in rural areas.

Like other Members, I have first-hand experience of the foot and mouth disease crisis. My son, who farms, will be looking for more work next week. Many farmers are in a similar position and many are suffering from severe depression. There are many problems to be solved in relation to that crisis, for example, the lifting of form D-restrictions to allow normal trading and the security and knowledge that there will be a chance to make a harvest. It is incumbent on the Minister to solve those detailed problems that are causing much suffering in rural areas.

Agriculture, in the midst of this crisis, is also in the midst of fundamental change. We are creating a coherent policy that will meet the challenges. Money must be found now to assist the ancillary industries that need

gwledig drwy ddiffyg buddsoddi, chwalodd y seilwaith angenrheidiol a gostyngodd gymorth i ffermwyr.

David Davies *a gododd*—

Mick Bates: Bu'r blaid yn dyst i ddirywiad y seilwaith gwledig, bu'n bleser ganddi ganmol cyfalafiaeth ar ei gwaethaf a gwyliodd y dirywiad yn parhau'n flynyddol. Mae'n rhagrith llwyr beirniadu'r hyn y mae'r Cynulliad wedi'i gyflawni. Gobeithiaf y bydd y blaid yn newid ei barn, gan gydnabod cymaint y mae'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth wedi'i gyflawni mewn cyfnod byr.

Jonathan Morgan *a gododd*—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Nid yw Mick Bates yn ildio.

Ron Davies *a gododd*—

Mick Bates: Ni dderbyniaf unrhyw ymyriadau. Mae'n amlwg bod rhai pobl wedi cynhyrfu. Fodd bynnag, parhaf.

Mae anawsterau yn wynebu cymunedau gwledig a heriau y mae'n rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â hwy, o glwy'r traed a'r genau i'r gwaith o gadw pobl ifanc mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Rhaid inni wella gwasanaethau a seilweithiau mewn ardaloedd gwledig.

Fel Aelodau eraill, mae gennyf brofiad uniongyrchol o argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau. Bydd fy mab, sydd yn ffermio, yn chwilio am fwy o waith yr wythnos nesaf. Mae llawer o ffermwyr mewn sefyllfa debyg ac mae llawer ohonynt yn dioddef iselder difrifol. Mae llawer o broblemau i'w datrys mewn perthynas â'r argyfwng hwnnw, er enghraifft, rhestru cyfyngiadau ffurflen D er mwyn caniatáu masnachu arferol a'r sicrwydd a'r wybodaeth y bydd cyfle i gynaeafu. Rhaid i'r Gweinidog ddatrys y problemau manwl hynny sydd yn achosi cymaint o ddioddefaint mewn ardaloedd gwledig.

Mae amaethyddiaeth, sydd yng nghanol yr argyfwng hwn, yng nghanol newid sylfaenol hefyd. Lluniwn bolisi cydlynol a fydd yn diwallu'r heriau hyn. Rhaid dod o hyd i arian yn awr i gynorthwyo'r diwydiannau atodol y

support. It is better to pay to retain those jobs now than to pay for social security later.

Despite the trials, regeneration is possible. We must not lose sight of hope that there is a future for rural Wales. I commend many steps taken by the Assembly, for example, on rural housing and transport. Those issues are being built upon and we must ensure that that positive message is conveyed. Too many people here depend on too much negativity.

I will finish with an example of how rural regeneration must be built on the local community principle, in which I believe strongly. It is possible to rebuild. I cite a company in Montgomeryshire, supported and visited by the previous Secretary for Agriculture and Rural Development. That company's assistance enabled the regeneration of 30 companies in a rural area. There are problems, but revival through good partnership and an integrated plan is possible in rural Wales. I, therefore, strongly oppose this motion.

Dafydd Wigley: Yn gyntaf, ymddiheuraf am golli'r araith agoriadol. Digwyddodd yn gynharach nag oeddwn wedi disgwyl. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf am hynny.

Cyfeiriaf at welliannau 1 a 3. Cyfeiriodd Phil Williams at welliant 2. Mae'n iawn cyfeirio at y dirywiad hirdymor yr ydym wedi ei weld yng nghefn gwlad. Cyfeiriodd Glyn Davies at hynny. Nid ffenomen yng Nghymru'n unig yw hwn. Bu'n ffenomen drwy Ewrop ers yr ail ryfel byd a chyn hynny.

Beth y dylem ei wneud i sicrhau y ceir datblygu economaidd sydd yn rhoi incwm a chynhaliath mewn ardaloedd gwledig, fel nad yw pobl yn teimlo bod yn rhaid iddynt symud allan? Y wers a ddysgwyd gan Fwrdd Datblygu Cymru Wledig, a Chymdeithas Datblygu Diwydiant Canolbarth Cymru cyn hynny, oedd bod angen y math hwnnw o gyfundrefn ym mhob rhan o Gymru. Rhaid cofio nad yw Cymru wledig i gyd o fewn tiriogaeth y pum hen sir yng nghanolbarth Cymru. Rhaid cofio am ardaloedd megis Glyndŵr, Ynys Môn, Dwyfor, Sir Benfro a

mae angen cymorth arnynt. Mae'n well talu i gadw'r swyddi hynny yn awr na thalu am nawdd cymdeithasol wedyn.

Er gwaethaf yr anawsterau, mae adfywio yn bosibl. Ni ddylem golli golwg ar y gobaith bod dyfodol i Gymru wledig. Cymeradwyaf lawer o'r camau a gymerir gan y Cynulliad, er enghraifft, o ran tai a chlundiant gwledig. Datblygir y materion hynny a rhaid inni sicrhau y caiff y neges gadarnhaol honno ei chyfleu. Mae gormod o bobl yma yn dibynnu ar ormod o syniadau negyddol.

Gorffennaf gydag enghraifft o sut y mae'n rhaid seilio adfywio gwledig ar egwyddor y gymuned leol, y credaf yn gryf ynddi. Mae ailadeiladu yn bosibl. Nodaf gwmni yn Sir Drefaldwyn fel enghraifft, a gefnogwyd gan y cyn Ysgrifennydd Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig ac yr ymwelodd ag ef. Galluogodd cymorth y cwmni hwnnw i 30 o gwmnïau mewn ardal wledig gael eu hadfywio. Ceir problemau, ond mae adfywio yn bosibl yng Nghymru wledig drwy bartneriaeth dda a chynllun integredig. Felly, gwrthwynebaf y cynnig hwn yn gryf.

Dafydd Wigley: First, I apologise for missing the opening speech. It happened earlier than I had expected. I am sorry about that.

I will refer to amendments 1 and 3. Phil Williams referred to amendment 2. It is appropriate to refer to the long-term decline that we have seen in the countryside. Glyn Davies referred to that. This phenomenon is not unique to Wales. It has been a phenomenon throughout Europe since the second world war and previously.

What should we do to ensure that we have economic development that provides income and a livelihood in rural areas, so that people do not feel that they must move out? The lesson learnt from the Development Board for Rural Wales, and the Mid Wales Industrial Development Association before that, was that that sort of system is needed throughout Wales. We must remember that not all rural Wales is within the territory of the five former counties in mid Wales. We must remember about areas such as Glyndŵr, Anglesey, Dwyfor, Pembrokeshire and

Sir Gaerfyrddin. Mae angen y math hwnnw o waith yn yr ardaloedd hynny. Rhaid cydnabod y dirywiad hirdymor a llunio ateb hirdymor.

Mae angen hefyd sicrhau gweithredu buan ar y cynllun ffermwyr ifanc newydd i alluogi i ffermwyr ifanc ddod i mewn i'r diwydiant. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai Glyn a Mick yn cydnabod ar unwaith fod strwythur oedran amaethyddiaeth yn destun pryder mawr. Oedran cyfartalog ffermwyr yw 57 oed. Mae ffermwyr hyd yn oed yn annog eu plant i beidio â mynd i faes amaethyddiaeth. Rhaid creu strwythur sydd yn galluogi i ffermwyr ymdeol ac i bobl ifanc ddod i mewn i'r diwydiant.

Huw Lewis: Is it not the case that your party has been unable to find a single independent expert that supports your young farmers' entrants scheme, which amounts to little more than an inheritance tax in reverse and is deeply regressive?

Dafydd Wigley: Mae 13 o wledydd yn Undeb Ewropeaidd yn gweithredu cynllun o'r fath ac mae Undeb Amaethwyr Cymru yn cefnogi ein cynllun. Dengys hynny fod yr Aelod Cynulliad ar gyfer Merthyr Tudful a Rhymni wedi colli cysylltiad yn llwyr â phroblemau cefn gwlad—

11:05 a.m.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Mae'n aelod o'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig.

Dafydd Wigley: Mae hynny'n tanlinellu'r broblem. Efallai y dylai lynu at broblemau Merthyr Tudful a gwneud gwell gwaith yno, yn hytrach nag ymyrryd â chefn gwlad.

Cyfeiriaf at broblemau sydd yn wynebu amaethwyr o ganlyniad i argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau. Mae arafwch wrth ddosbarthu'r taliadau y mae gan amaethwyr yr hawl i'w derbyn. Hoffwn glywed gan y Gweinidog beth y mae'r Llywodraeth am ei wneud i gyflymu'r taliadau hynny, gan fod llif arian yn broblem fawr. Bydd llif arian hefyd yn broblem ddiweddd yr haf pan ddaw'r adeg i ŵyn eleni fynd i'r farchnad. A fydd marchnad ddigonol? A ellir gwneud unrhyw

Carmarthenshire. That type of work is needed in those areas. We must acknowledge the long-term decline and create a long-term solution.

We must also ensure that swift action is taken on the new young farmers scheme to enable young farmers to enter the industry. I am sure that Glyn and Mick would acknowledge at once that the age structure within agriculture is of great concern. The average age of farmers is 57. Farmers are even encouraging their children not to enter agriculture. We must create a structure that enables farmers to retire and young people to enter the industry.

Huw Lewis: Onid yw'n wir na fu eich plaid yn gallu dod o hyd i un arbenigwr annibynnol sydd yn cefnogi eich cynllun ffermwyr ifanc newydd, nad yw'n fwy na threth etifeddiant gwrthol ac sydd yn atchweliadol iawn?

Dafydd Wigley: Thirteen countries in the European Union operate such a scheme and the Farmers Union of Wales supports our scheme. That shows that the Assembly Member for Merthyr Tydfil and Rhymney has completely lost touch with the problems of rural areas—

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: He is a member of the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee.

Dafydd Wigley: That underlines the problem. Perhaps he should stick to Merthyr Tydfil's problems and do a better job there, rather than interfering in rural areas.

I will refer to the problems facing farmers as a result of the foot and mouth disease crisis. There is a delay in distributing the payments to which farmers are entitled. I would like to hear from the Minister what the Government will do to speed up those payments, as cashflow is a major problem. Cashflow will also be a problem at the end of the summer when the time comes for this year's lambs to go to market. Will there be an adequate market? Can anything be done to sustain

beth i gynnal prisiau bryd hynny? Fel arall, bydd yr argyfwng hyd yn oed yn waeth.

Mae'r diwydiant twristiaeth yng nghefn gwlad yn wynebu argyfwng o ganlyniad i glwy'r traed a'r genau. Rhaid symud yn fuan i gael arian i'r ardaloedd gwledig yr effeithiwyd arnynt—i leoedd fel Llanberis, Beddgelert a Betws-y-Coed, y cyfeiriais atynt heddiw, sydd yn gyfan gwbl ddibynnol ar gerddwyr. Mae angen grantiau er mwyn ailsefydlu busnesau. Dylai'r Gweinidog wneud datganiad ar sut y gellid sefydlu cyfundrefn o'r fath. Ni fydd benthyg arian ar 8 y cant o log yn ateb y broblem. Mae angen cronfa ddi-log ar gyfer y rhai sydd yn wynebu argyfwng. Bu sôn am hyn yn Llundain ac yn y Siambr hon ers nifer o wythnosau. Mae angen datganiad gan fod pobl angen gwybod yn fuan.

Mae ar Fwrdd Croeso Cymru angen arian mwy sylweddol nag a dderbyniodd hyd yn hyn er mwyn hybu Cymru. Mae'n bosibl ei bod yn rhy hwyr ar gyfer hybu Cymru dramor eleni. Fodd bynnag, bydd angen gwaith mawr yn y cyfeiriad hwnnw y flwyddyn nesaf.

Mae angen sicrhau bod adnoddau Amcan 1 yn rhoi'r sgiliau angenrheidiol i bobl ifanc mewn ardaloedd gwledig i ddenu busnesau i'r ardal ac i adeiladu diwydiannau sydd â'u gwreiddiau yn yr ardaloedd gwledig ac sydd yn defnyddio ein cynnyrch naturiol, megis cig, cynnyrch amaethyddol arall a choed. Yna byddai'r diwydiannau hynny'n tyfu ac yn rhoi gobaith i'r dyfodol.

Mae modd o ddatrys problemau cefn gwlad. Hyd yma, nid wyf yn argyhoeddedig fod Llywodraeth y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a Llafur yn y Cynulliad wedi rhoi'r sylw angenrheidiol i gefn gwlad o'i gymharu ag ardaloedd eraill. Gobeithiaf y rhoddir mwy o sylw i ardaloedd gwledig, yn enwedig pan ddaw'r argyfwng i ben. Bydd hynny'n gyfle i ailadeiladu a chreu hyder newydd.

David Davies: I hope to continue in the more measured tones that were adopted by the former leader of Plaid Cymru, as opposed to the shameless political grandstanding that was effected earlier on by the Liberal Democrats. After that effort, the once proud

prices then? Otherwise, the crisis will be even deeper.

The tourism industry in rural areas faces a crisis as a result of foot and mouth disease. We must move swiftly to move money into the rural areas that have been affected—to places such as Llanberis, Beddgelert and Betws-y-Coed, to which I referred today, which are wholly dependent on walkers. Grants are needed to re-establish businesses. The Minister should make a statement as to how such a system could be established. Borrowing money at 8 per cent interest will not answer the problem. An interest-free fund is needed for those facing crisis. There has been talk of this in London and in the Chamber for several weeks. A statement is needed as people need to know quickly.

The Wales Tourist Board needs more substantial funds than it has so far received in order to promote Wales. It is possibly too late to promote Wales overseas this year. However, much work will need to be done in that direction next year.

We must ensure that Objective 1 resources provide young people in rural areas with the necessary skills to attract businesses to the area and to build industries that have their roots in the rural areas and which use our natural produce, such as meat, other agricultural produce and timber. Those industries would then grow and give hope for the future.

The problems faced by rural areas can be solved. As yet, I am not convinced that the Liberal Democrat and Labour Government in the Assembly has paid the necessary attention to rural areas, as compared to other areas. I hope that more attention will be paid to rural areas, especially when the crisis is over. That will be an opportunity to re-build and create new confidence.

David Davies: Gobeithiaf barhau yn y modd mwy pwylllog a fabwysiadwyd gan gyn arweinydd Plaid Cymru, yn hytrach nag yn y modd rhodresgar a fabwysiadwyd yn gynharach gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Ar ôl yr ymdrech honno, nid adwaenir y blaid

party is not so much known as Labour's little helper as Labour's country cousin.

Rather than make political points as Mick attempted to do earlier, I will discuss the much acclaimed £12 million that was announced by the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities to help businesses affected by the foot and mouth disease crisis. That causes concern. Perhaps I am naïve, but I thought—like many who live in Monmouthshire and other affected areas—that that money would go where it was most needed. I thought that what the Minister described as a 'made in Wales' solution would target the most affected areas. It was with some consternation that I discovered that, out of that £12 million, Monmouthshire will only receive £620,000. That is an absolutely shameful amount. I know of individual businesses that have lost more than that amount of money. Frankly, it is appalling.

I was led to believe that the £12 million was being allocated similarly to how local government revenue is allocated to all local authorities in Wales. As I have mentioned before, Monmouthshire lost out in the last two local government settlements. We were told that that was because the money was needed elsewhere and that it was being given where it was most needed. I will leave aside the question of whether we lost out because of genuine need, or merely because of gross inefficiency and, in some Labour-run authorities, out-and-out corruption. If the Assembly is arguing that the local government revenue finance is going to the areas that are most in need, surely it is reasonable to assume that the £12 million being allocated for the foot and mouth disease outbreak should also be going to those areas? Why is Monmouthshire, which is receiving £620,000, only receiving marginally more than Cardiff and not that much more than the many urban Valleys authorities that have been hit by virtually no crisis at all? That is disgraceful and I demand an answer.

Kirsty Williams: As Member for Brecon and

a arferai fod yn falch fel gwas bach y Blaid Lafur mwyach, ond yn hytrach fel cefnder cefn gwlad y Blaid Lafur.

Yn hytrach na gwneud pwyntiau gwleidyddol fel y ceisiodd Mick eu gwneud yn gynharach, byddaf yn trafod y £12 miliwn a gafodd lawer o ganmoliaeth ac a gyhoeddwyd gan y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau i helpu'r busnesau yr effeithiwyd arnynt gan argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau. Mae hynny'n peri pryder. Efallai fy mod yn naïf, ond credwn—fel llawer o drigolion Sir Fynwy ac ardaloedd eraill yr effeithiwyd arnynt—y byddai'r arian hwnnw yn mynd lle yr oedd yr angen mwyaf. Credwn y byddai'r hyn a ddisgrifiwyd gan y Gweinidog fel ateb 'wedi'i wneud yng Nghymru' yn targedu'r ardaloedd yr effeithiwyd arnynt fwyaf. Achoswyd syndod mawr imi pan ddarganfûm y bydd Sir Fynwy ond yn derbyn £620,000, o'r £12 miliwn hynny. Mae hwnnw'n swm hollol gywilyddus. Gwn am fusnesau unigol sydd wedi colli mwy na'r swm hwnnw. A dweud y gwir, mae'n warthus.

Fe'm harweiniwyd i gredu bod y £12 miliwn yn cael ei ddyrannu mewn ffordd debyg i'r ffordd y caiff refeniw llywodraeth leol ei ddyrannu i bob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru. Fel y crybwyllais eisoes, bu Sir Fynwy ar ei cholled yn y ddau setliad llywodraeth leol diwethaf. Dywedwyd wrthym mai'r rheswm dros hynny oedd bod angen yr arian ar rywle arall ac y rhoddwyd yr arian lle bynnag yr oedd yr angen mwyaf. Nid af ar drywydd pa un a oeddem ar ein colled oherwydd angen gwirioneddol, neu dim ond oherwydd aneffeithlonrwydd dybryd ac, mewn rhai awdurdodau a reolir gan Lafur, llygredd pur. Os dadleua'r Cynulliad fod cyllid refeniw llywodraeth leol yn mynd i'r ardaloedd sydd â'r angen mwyaf, rhaid ei bod yn rhesymol tybio y dylai'r £12 miliwn a ddyrennir oherwydd argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau fynd i'r ardaloedd hynny hefyd? Pam bod Sir Fynwy, sydd yn derbyn £620,000, ond yn cael ychydig yn fwy na Chaerdydd ac nid llawer mwy na nifer o awdurdodau trefol y Cymoedd lle na chafodd yr argyfwng effaith o gwbl bron? Mae hynny'n warthus a mynnaf ateb.

Kirsty Williams: Fel yr Aelod dros

Radnorshire, the largest single rural constituency in this Assembly, I am grateful for this opportunity to reflect on the serious threats to rural Wales. The challenges that face my community, family, friends and neighbours are great and the partnership Government has responded to those challenges. That is in stark comparison to what came before: a BSE crisis, which was handled in such a way that it brought farming to its knees; 25 per cent cuts in the rate of hill livestock compensatory allowance payments; a sweeping programme of school closures; the abolition of Powys health authority that has left our community hospitals in jeopardy ever since; and the decimation of what remained of the public transport services and the failure to invest in rural roads.

This partnership Government has already begun to repair the damage that was wreaked on rural Wales by the previous Conservative Westminster Government. There has already been an extension in mandatory business rate schemes to include pubs, pharmacies, petrol stations and childcare facilities by next year; the maintenance of hill livestock compensatory allowance payments; delivery, through pressure from this Assembly, on agri-compensation money; increases in the budget for Tir Gofal and the organic aid schemes; the establishment of a Welsh farming ombudsman and of a Farming Connect service as well as the introduction of free school milk for key stage 1 pupils, which benefits the children and the crucial milk industry in this country. I am not about to take any lessons from Peter Rogers or any other Conservative who sits in this Chamber.

I am proud of my record as Member for Brecon and Radnorshire and of what this partnership Government seeks to achieve on behalf of my constituents and all those who live in rural Wales. We have delivered more in the short space of a few months than the Welsh Conservative Party has promised to deliver today. They offer the people of rural Wales a divisive system of Government with divisive policies, seeking to divide our country between urban and rural areas. There are problems in all parts of Wales, whether urban or rural.

Frycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed, sef etholaeth wledig fwyaf y Cynulliad hwn, yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle hwn i ystyried y bygythiadau difrifol i Gymru wledig. Mae heriau mawr yn wynebu fy nghymuned, fy ngheulu, fy ffrindiau a'm cymdogion ac mae'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth wedi ymateb i'r heriau hynny. Mae hynny yn gwrthgyferbynnu'n llwyr â'r hyn a ddaeth cyn y bartneriaeth: argyfwng BSE, a gafodd ei drin yn y fath fodd fel bod y diwydiant ffermio ar ei liniau; gostyngiadau o 25 y cant yng nghyfradd y taliadau lwfans iawndal da byw tir uchel; rhaglen ysgubol o gau ysgolion; diddymu awdurdod iechyd Powys sydd wedi peryglu ein hysbytai cymuned ers hynny; a difrodi'r hyn a oedd yn weddill o'r gwasanaethau trafndiaeth gyhoeddus a'r methiant i fuddsoddi mewn ffyrdd gwledig.

Mae'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth hon eisoes wedi dechrau atgyweirio'r difrod a wnaethpwyd yng Nghymru wledig gan gyn Lywodraeth Geidwadol San Steffan. Ehangwyd eisoes ar y cynlluniau trethi busnes gorfodol i gynnwys tafarndai, fferyllfeydd, gorsafoedd petrol a chyfleusterau gofal plant erbyn y flwyddyn nesaf; cynhaliwyd taliadau lwfans iawndal da byw tir uchel; cyflwynwyd arian iawndal amaethyddol, drwy bwysau gan y Cynulliad; gwelwyd cynnydd yn y gyllideb ar gyfer Tir Gofal a'r cynlluniau cymorth organig; sefydlwyd ombwdsmon ffermio i Gymru a gwasanaeth Cyswllt Ffermio a chyflwynwyd llaeth ysgol am ddim i ddisgyblion cyfnod allweddol 1, sydd o fudd i'r plant ac i'r diwydiant llaeth sydd yn hanfodol i'r wlad hon. Nid wyf am dderbyn unrhyw wersi gan Peter Rogers nac unrhyw Geidwadwr arall sydd yn eistedd yn y Siambr hon.

Ymfalchïaf yn fy record fel Aelod dros Frycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed a'r hyn y mae'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth hon yn ceisio ei gyflawni ar ran fy etholwyr a holl drigolion Cymru wledig. Yr ydym wedi cyflwyno mwy yn y cyfnod byr o ychydig o fisoedd nag y mae Plaid Geidwadol Cymru wedi addo ei gyflwyno heddiw. Cynigiant system rwygol gyda pholisïau rhwygol i drigolion Cymru wledig, gan geisio rhannu'n gwlad rhwng ardaloedd trefol a gwledig. Ceir problemau ym mhob rhan o Gymru, boed yn drefol neu'n wledig.

We are using the Liberal Democrats' influence to work in partnership with the Labour Party to ensure that matters in rural Wales improve and that we do not repeat the damaging 18 years of Conservative Government that led to not one Conservative Member of Parliament being elected in Wales. I gladly await the election results on 7 June because I believe that those results will be replicated.

Jonathan Morgan: It is always interesting to listen to 'the Powys two' attempting to reconcile their position as independent Liberal Democrats with the fact that they sit in Government with the Labour Party—which is also a problem for the Labour Party.

I sat through the press conference that was held graciously by Mick Bates while he addressed the Chamber earlier, and the London briefing notes by Delyth Evans, who has now sadly left the Chamber. As 'the Powys two' and their partners in crime in the Labour Party listed their so-called achievements, I noticed that no-one mentioned schools. What have you done for rural schools? Where is your small schools policy and your rural strategy for schools? We know of the plight of many rural areas in Wales. For example, a cloud hangs over at least five schools in north Pembrokeshire. They are threatened with closure because this Assembly, or more specifically this so-called partnership Government, does not have a small schools policy. Apparently, that policy is in the partnership agreement, but not in the forward work programme.

Kirsty Williams: I am grateful that Jonathan is drawing our attention to what is an important plank of the partnership Government. When he accuses us of failing to deliver on the rural schools policy, I remind him that, on average, his Government oversaw the closure of 30 rural schools per year. If he is so keen on a rural schools policy, why was it not in the Welsh Conservative Party's Assembly manifesto? Where was it when John Redwood, William

Defnyddiwn ddylanwad y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol i weithio mewn partneriaeth â'r Blaid Lafur i sicrhau bod materion yng Nghymru wledig yn gwella ac nad ydym yn ailadrodd y 18 mlynedd niweidiol o Lywodraeth Geidwadol a arweiniodd at yr un Aelod Seneddol Ceidwadol yn cael ei ethol yng Nghymru. Arhosaf yn awchus am ganlyniadau'r etholiad ar 7 Mehefin gan fy mod yn credu y caiff y canlyniadau hynny eu hailadrodd.

Jonathan Morgan: Mae bob amser yn ddiddorol gwrando ar y 'ddeuawd o Bowys' yn ceisio cysoni eu statws fel Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol annibynnol â'r ffaith eu bod mewn Llywodraeth gyda'r Blaid Lafur—sydd hefyd yn broblem i'r Blaid Lafur.

Eisteddais drwy'r gynhadledd i'r wasg a gynhaliwyd yn wylaidd gan Mick Bates wrth iddo annerch y Siambr hon yn gynharach, a thrwy nodiadau briffio Llundain a gyflwynwyd gan Delyth Evans, sydd wedi gadael y Siambr erbyn hyn, yn anffodus. Wrth i'r 'ddeuawd o Bowys' a'u cyd-bechaduriaid yn y Blaid Lafur restru eu cyflawniadau honedig, sylwais na chrybwyllodd neb ysgolion. Beth yr ydych wedi'i wneud i ysgolion gwledig? Ble mae eich polisi ysgolion bach a'ch strategaeth wledig i ysgolion? Gwyddom am broblemau llawer o ardaloedd gwledig yng Nghymru. Er enghraifft, mae o leiaf pum ysgol yng ngogledd Sir Benfro o dan gwmwl. Maent mewn perygl o gael eu cau gan nad oes gan y Cynulliad hwn, neu'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth fondigrybwyll hon yn fwy penodol, bolisi ysgolion bach. Ymddengys fod y cytundeb partneriaeth yn cynnwys y polisi hwnnw, ond nid yw'r flaenraglen waith yn ei gynnwys.

Kirsty Williams: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Jonathan am dynnu ein sylw at elfen bwysig o'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth. Pan gyhudda ni o beidio â chyflwyno canlyniadau o ran y polisi ysgolion gwledig, fe'i hatgoffaf i 30 o ysgolion gwledig y flwyddyn, ar gyfartaledd, gael eu cau o dan ei Lywodraeth ef. Os yw mor hoff o bolisi ysgolion gwledig, pam nad oedd hynny'n rhan o fanifesto Plaid Geidwadol Cymru i'r Cynulliad? Ble oedd y polisi hwnnw pan oedd John Redwood,

Hague and all the others were in the Welsh Office? It was non-existent, Jonathan. Do not teach your grandmother to suck eggs. Why did you not deliver a rural schools policy? You had plenty of opportunity to do so and you never did.

11:15 a.m.

Jonathan Morgan: As we have dragged grandmothers into this, I will happily refer to one of my remarks several months ago, when I said that the Liberal Democrats would sell their grandmothers and their principles to get into Government, into partnership, and to get themselves ministerial cars. Talking of which, in walks Jenny Randerson.

David Melding: When the people of Montgomeryshire and Brecon and Radnorshire voted in the Assembly elections, did they realise that they would get Lib-Lab Assembly Members? Do you think that they realised that at the time? Why was that party not honest with the electorate when it stood for election instead of waiting to do so days later?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. This is a debate about rural affairs not these other matters. You have about a minute left to speak.

Jonathan Morgan: I am sure that the Liberal Democrats will attempt in due course to outline their problems and to rebut them in rural Wales.

Rod Richards: I could not help but note that Kirsty Williams was talking emotionally about the closure of rural schools. It so happens that I was Parliamentary Under Secretary of State for Wales with responsibility for education under John Redwood and William Hague between 1994 and 1996. During those two years we were inundated by applications from Labour-controlled local education authorities, as well as Plaid and Liberal Democrat-involved local authorities to close local schools. I did not close any rural schools during that two-year period. Why? It was because the criteria that we set under Redwood and Hague were: can that small school deliver the national

William Hague a'r holl bobl eraill yn y Swyddfa Gymreig? Nid oedd yn bodoli, Jonathan. Peidiwch â dysgu pader i berson. Pam na chyflwynasoch bolisi ysgolion gwledig? Cawsoch ddigon o gyfle i wneud hynny ac ni wnaethoch.

Jonathan Morgan: Gan ein bod yn ystrydebu, mae'n bleser gennyf gyfeirio at un o'm sylwadau a wneuthum ychydig fisoedd yn ôl, pan ddywedais y byddai'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn gwerthu eu neiniau a'u hegwyddorion i fod yn rhan o'r Llywodraeth, yn rhan o'r bartneriaeth, ac i gael ceir gweinidogol. Ar y gair, dyma Jenny Randerson.

David Melding: Pan bleidleisiodd trigolion Sir Drefaldwyn a Brycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed yn etholiadau'r Cynulliad, a sylweddolasant y byddai Aelodau'r Cynulliad Llafur-Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ganddynt? A gredwch iddynt sylweddoli hynny ar y pryd? Pam na fuodd y blaid honno'n onest gyda'r etholwyr pan safodd yr etholiad yn lle aros i wneud hynny ddyddiau wedyn?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Dadl am faterion gwledig yw hon, nid y materion eraill hyn. Mae gennych tua munud ar ôl i siarad.

Jonathan Morgan: Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn ceisio amlinellu eu problemau maes o law a'u gwrthbrofi yng Nghymru wledig.

Rod Richards: Ni allwn beidio â nodi bod Kirsty Williams yn siarad mewn ffordd emosïynol am gau ysgolion gwledig. Fel mae'n digwydd, yr oeddwn yn Is-ysgrifennydd Seneddol Gwladol Cymru yn gyfrifol am addysg o dan John Redwood a William Hague rhwng 1994 a 1996. Yn ystod y ddwy flynedd hynny, cawsom lif o geisiadau gan awdurdodau addysg lleol a reolir gan Lafur, ynghyd ag awdurdodau lleol lle yr oedd Plaid Cymru a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn chwarae rhan, i gau ysgolion lleol. Ni chaeais unrhyw ysgol wledig yn ystod y ddwy flynedd honno. Pam? Oherwydd mai'r meini prawf a osodwyd gennym o dan Redwood a Hague oedd: a all

curriculum; do the governors want to keep it open; and do the parents want to keep it open? If the answer to those three questions was 'yes', the school stayed open, even though the Bolsheviks, the nationalists and the yellows wanted to close them.

Jonathan Morgan: I am grateful to Rod Richards for that clarification and for exposing the rank hypocrisy and lies that the people of rural Wales have experienced for far too long under these individuals from Powys, and from Labour Members who claim to represent Pembrokeshire and other rural areas. It is time for the people of Wales to see sense. The Liberals are on their way out and Labour will soon follow them.

The Minister for Rural Affairs (Carwyn Jones): I am amused to see the general election campaign in Powys being fought out in this Chamber. That is what we have seen over the past hour or so.

I congratulate Phil Williams on a game, if shirty performance in proposing the amendments. We will not support them. Work is already in hand on amendments 2 and 3. The rural partnership has been working on a rural recovery plan for some time, and work is ongoing on a young entrants scheme.

We do not pay enough attention in this Assembly to the rural economy as a whole. It is pretty obvious that tourism is as important to the rural economy as agriculture. We have seen that over the last few months. However, agriculture is cited as an example, and, as it is not possible to delve into all aspects of the rural economy in eight minutes or so, I will use agriculture as an example. From my time in the National Assembly, it is possible to sum up Conservative Party policy in three ways—more subsidies, lower standards of food, and a ban on all competition. Where does that leave the consumer? All I ever hear from the Conservatives is that our standards are too high, there is too much red tape and the competition is too cheap, therefore we should ban it. We cannot do that. People have to wake up and work in the real world.

yr ysgol fach honno gyflwyno'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol; a yw'r llywodraethwyr am ei chadw ar agor; ac a yw'r rhieni am ei chadw ar agor? Os mai 'ie' oedd yr ateb i'r tri chwestiwn hynny, arhosodd yr ysgol ar agor, er bod y Bolsieficiaid, y cenedlaetholwyr a'r 'blaid felen' am eu cau.

Jonathan Morgan: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Rod Richards am egluro hynny ac am ddatgelu'r rhagrith a'r celwyddau noeth y mae trigolion Cymru wledig wedi eu profi'n llawer rhy hir o dan yr unigolion hyn o Bowys, ac o Aelodau Llafur sydd yn honni eu bod yn cynrychioli Sir Benfro ac ardaloedd gwledig eraill. Mae'n hen bryd i bobl Cymru ddod at eu coed. Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ar eu ffordd allan a bydd Llafur yn eu dilyn cyn bo hir.

Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Carwyn Jones): Mae'n ddoniol gweld ymgyrch yr etholiad cyffredinol ym Mhowys yn cael ei ymladd yn y Siambr hon. Dyna'r hyn a welsom yn ystod yr awr ddiwethaf.

Llongyfarchaf Phil Williams am berfformiad dewr, er yn bigog, wrth gynnig y gwelliannau. Ni fyddwn yn eu cefnogi. Mae gwaith eisoes ar y gweill o ran gwelliannau 2 a 3. Bu'r bartneriaeth wledig yn gweithio ar gynllun adfer gwledig ers peth amser, a pharha'r gwaith ar ddatblygu cynllun ffermwyr ifanc newydd.

Ni thalwn ddigon o sylw yn y Cynulliad hwn i'r economi wledig yn gyffredinol. Mae'n amlwg iawn bod twristiaeth yr un mor bwysig i'r economi wledig ag amaethyddiaeth. Gwelsom hynny dros yr ychydig fisoedd diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, dyfynnir amaethyddiaeth fel enghraifft, a, chan nad yw'n bosibl trafod pob agwedd ar yr economi wledig mewn tuag wyth munud, defnyddiaf amaethyddiaeth fel enghraifft. O'm cyfnod yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, mae'n bosibl crynhoi polisi'r Blaid Geidwadol mewn tair ffordd—mwy o gymorthdaliadau, safonau bwyd is, a gwahardd pob math o gystadleuaeth. Beth mae hynny'n ei olygu i'r defnyddiwr? Yr unig beth a glywaf gan y Ceidwadwyr yw bod ein safonau yn rhy uchel, bod gormod o fiwrocratiaeth a bod y gystadleuaeth yn rhy rad, ac felly dylem ei gwahardd. Ni allwn

wneud hynny. Rhaid i bobl agor eu llygaid a dechrau gweithio yn y byd go iawn.

Is this the party that at one time said that the free market was the prime determinant of how people should live their lives? I can hear cries of 'hear, hear' from the Conservatives. Is there a free market in farming? No. We have a subsidy system, and Welsh farming cannot exist without it at present. However, we must ensure that, when subsidies are changed, Welsh farming is in a position to adapt to new circumstances and not to go backwards.

Ai hon yw'r blaid a ddywedodd ar un adeg mai'r farchnad rydd sydd yn penderfynu yn bennaf ar sut y dylai pobl fyw eu bywydau? Gallaf glywed y Ceidwadwyr yn gweiddi 'clywch, clywch'. A oes marchnad rydd yn y diwydiant ffermio? Nac oes. Mae gennym system gymorthdaliadau, ac ni all diwydiant ffermio Cymru fodoli hebddi ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni sicrhau, pan gaiff y cymorthdaliadau eu newid, bod diwydiant ffermio Cymru mewn sefyllfa i addasu i'r amgylchiadau newydd ac na fydd yn cymryd cam yn ôl.

David Melding: Does your Government believe that, at present, we have a level playing field for international trade? Is that your policy, or do you think that our farmers do not get a fair deal at the moment?

David Melding: A gred eich Llywodraeth fod gennym chwarae teg ar gyfer masnach ryngwladol? Ai dyna'ch polisi, neu a gredwch nad yw ein ffermwyr yn cael chwarae teg ar hyn o bryd?

10:51 a.m.

Carwyn Jones: In the 1980s and 1990s yours was the party of compulsory competitive tendering. We saw your party butcher the mining industry, saying that it was better to buy coal produced by 12-year-old children in Columbia because it was cheaper. Yours is the party that said that. Was that a level playing field? Of course it was not. Your party does not believe in the level playing field more than anybody else does. It is simply a matter of trying to get votes. We need a strong and vibrant farming industry that can adapt and that produces what the consumer wants to buy. That is what the coalition Government is about. It is about enabling farming to adapt and change for the future. It is sheer hypocrisy to praise the free market in one sector and then say that it is not appropriate to another.

Carwyn Jones: Yn ystod y 1980au a'r 1990au, eich plaid chi oedd plaid tendro cystadleuol gorfodol. Gwelsom eich plaid yn distrywio'r diwydiant glo, gan ddweud ei bod yn well prynu glo a gynhyrchwyd gan blant 12 mlwydd oed yng Ngholumbia gan ei fod yn rhatach. Eich plaid chi a ddywedodd hynny. Ai chwarae teg oedd hynny? Nage, wrth gwrs. Ni chred eich plaid mewn chwarae teg yn fwy na neb arall. Dim ond mater o geisio ennill pleidleisiau ydyw. Mae angen diwydiant ffermio cryf a bywiog arnom a all addasu ac sydd yn cynhyrchu'r hyn y mae'r defnyddiwr am ei brynu. Dyna waith y Llywodraeth glymblaid. Mae'n ymwneud â galluogi ffermwyr i addasu a newid ar gyfer y dyfodol. Mae canmol y farchnad rydd mewn un sector ac wedyn dweud nad yw'n briodol mewn sector arall yn rhagrith llwyr.

What about foot and mouth disease? Three months have passed since the first case was discovered in Wales. Three months on, it is suggested that we have not moved fast enough. There have not been any suggestions as to what we should have done. However, three months on, those who have the luxury of sitting in an armchair are telling us that we should have done it differently. They do not

Beth am glwy'r traed a'r genau? Mae tri mis wedi mynd heibio ers darganfod yr achos cyntaf yng Nghymru. Dri mis yn ddiweddarach, awgrymir nad ydym wedi symud yn ddigon cyflym. Ni fu unrhyw awgrymiadau ynghylch beth y dylem fod wedi'i wneud. Fodd bynnag, dri mis yn ddiweddarach, mae'r rheini a all eistedd yn gyfforddus yn dweud wrthym y dylem fod

tell us how, just that we should have done it differently. We had to take decisions quickly. It was an emergency. The contiguous cull policy was a roaring success. If you consider where we were before the contiguous cull policy—

Glyn Davies: Do you accept that, for the first three weeks of the outbreak, I and others were pointing to our experience of the 1967 outbreak? We made it public that we were facing a crisis and that it was not under control. Do you accept that, for the first five weeks of the outbreak, the Government did not deal with that? That is the only criticism that I made and I stand by it. You have not defended it.

Carwyn Jones: This is another situation where it is suggested that things should have been done differently but no suggestions are made as to how. One recommendation made during the 1967 outbreak was that animals should be buried on the farms. That cannot be done as it is too dangerous. It would be highly irresponsible to bury animals on the farm. You cannot dig a hole in the ground, bung some cattle in it and not worry about it. In 1967 you could; you cannot in 2001 as the situation is entirely different. What was the one suggestion that was made? Vaccination. It was suggested that we should not have a contiguous cull and that we should vaccinate instead. That was the policy expressed by the Welsh Conservative spokesperson. If we had vaccinated, we would have destroyed the sheep farming industry—at least in Anglesey and in Wales—for a generation.

Alun Pugh and Peter Rogers *rose*—

Carwyn Jones: I will take Alun's intervention first, as he was the first to stand up.

Alun Pugh: Do you accept that the only positive aspect of the foot and mouth disease crisis is that the huge contribution made by outdoor sport and recreation to the rural economy is now recognised? Will you keep the pressure on to open footpaths, particularly

wedi cymryd camau gwahanol. Ni ddywedant wrthym sut y dylem fod wedi gwneud hynny, dim ond y dylem fod wedi cymryd camau gwahanol. Yr oedd yn rhaid inni wneud penderfyniadau yn gyflym. Yr oedd yn argyfwng. Yr oedd y polisi o ddifa ar ffermydd cyffiniol yn llwyddiant ysgubol. Os ystyriwch ein sefyllfa cyn y polisi o ddifa ar ffermydd cyffiniol—

Glyn Davies: A dderbyniwch, yn ystod tair wythnos gyntaf yr argyfwng, fy mod i ac eraill yn cyfeirio at ein profiad o argyfwng 1967? Cyhoeddassom ein bod yn wynebu argyfwng ac nad oedd o dan reolaeth. A dderbyniwch, yn ystod pum wythnos gyntaf yr argyfwng, na ddeliodd y Llywodraeth â hynny? Dyna fy unig feirniadaeth a chadwaf ati. Nid ydych wedi'i hamddiffyn.

Carwyn Jones: Dyma sefyllfa arall lle yr awgrymir y dylem fod wedi cymryd camau gwahanol ond lle na roddir unrhyw awgrymiadau ynglŷn â sut. Un argymhelliaid a wnaethpwyd yn ystod argyfwng 1967 oedd y dylid claddu'r anifeiliaid ar y ffermydd. Ni ellir gwneud hynny gan ei fod yn rhy beryglus. Byddai'n hollol anghyfrifol claddu'r anifeiliaid ar y fferm. Ni ellir torri twll, taflu gwartheg ynddo ac anghofio amdano. Yn 1967, yr oedd yn bosibl gwneud hynny; nid yw'n bosibl yn 2001 gan fod y sefyllfa yn hollol wahanol. Beth oedd yr unig awgrym? Brechu. Awgrymwyd na ddylem gyflwyno polisi o ddifa ar ffermydd cyffiniol ond y dylem frechu. Dyna'r polisi a fynegwyd gan lefarydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru. Pe byddem wedi brechu anifeiliaid, byddem wedi dinistrio'r diwydiant ffermio defaid—o leiaf yn Ynys Môn ac yng Nghymru—am genhedlaeth.

Alun Pugh a Peter Rogers *a gododd*—

Carwyn Jones: Cymeraf ymyriad Alun yn gyntaf, gan mai ef oedd y cyntaf i godi.

Alun Pugh: A dderbyniwch mai'r unig agwedd gadarnhaol ar argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau yw y cydnabyddir bellach y cyfraniad enfawr a wneir gan chwaraeon ac adloniant awyr agored i'r economi wledig? A fyddwch yn parhau i ddwyn pwysau i agor

those in the high mountain areas where there are low stocking densities?

Carwyn Jones: A decision on footpaths was taken yesterday by the Minister for Environment, Sue Essex. Vets have made it clear that footpaths should be opened, except in areas where the disease is present.

Peter Rogers: The Conservative Party never proposed a vaccination policy. The trouble during this crisis is that you do not listen to what we say. What I said was that, in an absolute crisis when there is no other way to turn, a barrier built up by vaccination would be the only answer. The way that the preventative cull was carried out in Anglesey would have justified that. What happened there was an absolute disgrace.

Carwyn Jones: You stood at this podium and said that we should vaccinate and that you did not want the contiguous cull. I welcome another U-turn by Peter Rogers on that point.

Dafydd Wigley: Ar glwy'r traed a'r genau, a wnewch ymateb i'r oedi wrth brosesu taliadau i ffermwyr y cafodd eu hanifeiliad eu difa? Bu rhai heb unrhyw incwm am wythnosau lawer, ac mae angen symud ymlaen yn sydyn ar hyn neu bydd y ffermwyr yn dioddef.

Carwyn Jones: Yr wyf wedi siarad â MAFF am hyn. Ar hyn o bryd, mae pythefnos o waith wrth gefn. Mae MAFF yn gobeithio y bydd y gwaith hwnnw wedi'i glirio mewn tair wythnos. Mae problem ar hyn o bryd, ond mae MAFF yn delio â hi. Gobeithiaf y bydd y gwaith wrth gefn wedi'i glirio cyn gynted â phosibl.

Where are the suggestions from the Welsh Conservatives about what markets we target and about what we sell so that people want to buy from us? Where is the support for the idea that farmers should be helped to produce what people want to buy? We do not get it. All we get is some kind of fool's paradise that we can somehow move backwards.

llwybrau troed agored, yn enwedig y rheini yn yr ardaloedd mynyddig uchel lle y ceir llai o anifeiliaid?

Carwyn Jones: Daeth y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Sue Essex, i benderfyniad ar lwybrau troed ddoe. Mae milfeddygon wedi esbonio'n glir y dylid agor llwybrau troed, ac eithrio yn yr ardaloedd lle y ceir achos o'r clwyf.

Peter Rogers: Nid awgrymwyd polisi brechu erioed gan y Blaid Geidwadol. Y broblem yn ystod yr argyfwng hwn yw na wrandewch ar yr hyn a ddywedwn. Yr hyn a ddywedais oedd, mewn argyfwng llwyr lle nad oes dewis arall, rhwystr wedi'i ddatblygu drwy frechu fyddai'r unig ateb. Byddai'r ffordd y cyflawnwyd y gwaith difa ataliol ar Ynys Môn wedi cyfiawnhau hynny. Yr oedd yr hyn a ddigwyddodd yno yn hollol warthus.

Carwyn Jones: Safasoch ger y podiwm hwn gan ddweud y dylem frechu anifeiliaid ac nad oeddech yn cytuno â difa ar ffermydd cyffiniol. Croesawaf dro pedol arall gan Peter Rogers ar y pwynt hwnnw.

Dafydd Wigley: On foot and mouth disease, will you respond to the delay in processing payments to farmers whose animals were culled? Some have been without any income for many weeks, and we need to move quickly on this, otherwise the farmers will suffer.

Carwyn Jones: I have spoken to MAFF on this. At present, there is a two-week backlog. MAFF hopes that that backlog will have cleared within three weeks. There is a problem at present, but MAFF is addressing it. I hope that the backlog will be cleared as soon as possible.

Ble mae'r awgrymiadau gan Geidwadwyr Cymru ynghylch pa farchnadoedd y dylem eu targedu a beth y dylem ei werthu fel bod pobl am brynu gennym? Ble mae'r gefnogaeth i'r syniad y dylid helpu ffermwyr i gynhyrchu'r hyn y mae pobl am ei brynu? Nid ydym yn ei chael. Yr unig beth a gawn yw rhyw fath o baradwys ffŵl sydd yn awgrymu y gallwn gymryd cam yn ôl rhywfodd.

Alun Cairns *rose*—

Carwyn Jones: I will not take an intervention. Let us consider what the partnership Government has delivered. We will soon have protected geographical indication status. That will be honest labelling as it will not be possible for anybody to label lamb and beef as Welsh unless it has been born, reared and raised in Wales. That will have been instituted by the partnership Government.

More money has been allocated towards the agri-food strategy, something that the Tories never bothered to do when they were in Government. We have now started selling Welsh produce and marketing it, but we should have started that at least 10 years ago. It was not done. We now have to catch up, but we will do so.

Who took away free school milk? Anyone who said 'Margaret Thatcher' was right. Who re-instituted it? The partnership Government. Again, it was the Tories who took that away. The independent appeals mechanism, instituted by the partnership Government, will be of assistance to farmers. Farming Connect, is an all-in policy that will help farmers receive business advice and will establish a grant system. All those have been introduced by the partnership Government to improve life in rural areas.

I close with this point. As far as the Welsh Conservatives are concerned, we must remember this: the Conservative Party is the party that knew about BSE and dithered. It is the party that, if it had been in charge of foot and mouth disease, would have dithered, and needed more time to think about such matters as vaccination. It is a fools' paradise to think that you can take Welsh farming back to where it was in the early 1990s.

David Davies: Will you give way?

Carwyn Jones: Not now. I look forward to taking Welsh farming and rural Wales forward with constructive, relevant and

Alun Cairns *a gododd*—

Carwyn Jones: Ni dderbyniaf ymyriad. Gadewch inni ystyried yr hyn y mae'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth wedi'i gyflawni. Bydd gennym statws nod daearyddol gwarchoddedig cyn bo hir. Bydd hynny yn golygu labelu gonest gan na fydd yn bosibl i unrhyw un labelu cig oen a chig eidion fel cynnyrch Cymreig oni chafodd yr anifail ei eni, ei fagu a'i godi yng Nghymru. Y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth fydd wedi sefydlu hynny.

Dyrannwyd mwy o arian tuag at y strategaeth bwyd-amaeth, sef rhywbeth na thrafferthodd y Torïaid ei wneud pan oeddent mewn grym. Yr ydym bellach wedi dechrau gwerthu cynnyrch Cymreig a'i farchnata, ond dylem fod wedi dechrau ar y gwaith hwnnw o leiaf 10 mlynedd yn ôl. Ni wnaethpwyd hynny. Rhaid inni yn awr ddal i fyny, ond fe lwyddwn.

Pwy a gafodd wared ar laeth ysgol am ddim? Yr oedd unrhyw un a ddywedodd 'Margaret Thatcher' yn gywir. Pwy a'i ailgyflwynodd? Y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth. Eto, y Torïaid a gafodd wared ar hynny. Bydd y system apelio annibynnol, a sefydlodd y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth, o gymorth i ffermwyr. Mae Cyswllt Ffermio yn bolisi cynhwysfawr a fydd yn helpu ffermwyr i gael cyngor busnes ac a fydd yn sefydlu system grantiau. Y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth sydd wedi cyflwyno pob un o'r mesurau hynny i wella bywyd mewn ardaloedd gwledig.

Terfynaf gyda'r pwynt hwn. O ran Ceidwadwyr Cymru, rhaid inni gofio hyn: y Blaid Geidwadol yw'r blaid a oedd yn gwybod am BSE ond a betrusodd. Dyma'r blaid, pe byddai'n rheoli argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau, a fyddai wedi petruso, ac a fyddai wedi gofyn am fwy o amser i ystyried materion megis brechu. Paradwys ffŵl yw credu y gallwch fynd â diwydiant ffermio Cymru yn ôl i'r sefyllfa yr oedd ynddi ar ddechrau'r 1990au.

David Davies: A wnewch chi ildio?

Carwyn Jones: Nid ar hyn o bryd. Edrychaf ymlaen at ddatblygu diwydiant ffermio Cymru a Chymru wledig gyda pholisiau

realistic policies. I am proud to be a part of that process.

Nick Bourne: Before I deal with the Labour Party's response, I will comment on the other parties' participation in this debate. First of all, I turn to Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales. I accept Dafydd Wigley's apology for not being here at the start of the debate. At the start, only three Members of the so-called 'Party of Wales' were in the Chamber, and those three, Owen John Thomas, Phil Williams and Brian Hancock, represent urban areas and are not members of the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee.

Elin Jones: Will you give way?

Nick Bourne: I will give way in a minute to Elin Jones, but it is a shame that we did not hear from her earlier during this debate. It is shameful that on such an important issue, so few Members were in the Chamber for the start of the debate. I will now give way.

Elin Jones: Will you, and the Dirprwy Lywydd, accept my apologies for not being here at the start of debate?

Nick Bourne: I will, Elin. Such humility is disarming. [*Laughter.*] It was not what I expected. It remains on the record that only three of you were here at the start of the debate. Therefore you are suitably chastised. It is a reflection on Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales's concern for rural Wales that you were not here.

As for the Liberal Democrat Party, the rear end of the pantomime horse, it is well known that during negotiations for the partnership Government, Mike German would have been happy to be a Minister in charge of morris dancing in Rhodri Morgan's Government. We now know the result of giving an important job to him. It is in tatters.

Cynog Dafis *rose*—

Nick Bourne: I will give way in a minute. However, is it not serious that we had all that

adeiladol, perthnasol a realistig. Yr wyf yn falch o fod yn rhan o'r broses honno.

Nick Bourne: Cyn imi ddelio ag ymateb y Blaid Lafur, rhoddaf sylwadau ar gyfranogiad y pleidiau eraill yn y ddadl hon. Yn gyntaf oll, trof at Blaid Cymru—The Party of Wales. Derbyniaf ymddiheuriad Dafydd Wigley am fod yn absennol ar ddechrau'r ddadl. Ar ddechrau'r ddadl, dim ond tri Aelod o'r 'Party of Wales' bondigrybwyll oedd yn bresennol yn y Siambr, ac mae'r tri Aelod hynny, sef Owen John Thomas, Phil Williams a Brian Hancock, yn cynrychioli ardaloedd trefol ac nid ydynt yn aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig.

Elin Jones: A wnewch chi ildio?

Nick Bourne: Ildiaf mewn munud i Elin Jones, ond mae'n drueni na chlywsom ganddi yn gynharach yn ystod y ddadl hon. Mae'n warthus bod cyn lleied o Aelodau yn bresennol yn y Siambr ar ddechrau'r ddadl, ar gyfer mater mor bwysig. Ildiaf yn awr.

Elin Jones: A wnewch chi, a'r Dirprwy Lywydd, dderbyn fy ymddiheuriadau am fod yn absennol ar ddechrau'r ddadl?

Nick Bourne: Gwnaf, Elin. Mae gostyngeddwrwydd o'r fath yn fy nghyfareddu. [*Chwerthin.*] Nid dyna'r hyn yr oeddwn yn ei ddisgwyl. Erys ar y cofnod mai dim ond tri Aelod o'ch plaid oedd yn bresennol ar ddechrau'r ddadl. Felly cawsoch gosb addas. Mae'n adlewyrchiad ar bryder Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales am Gymru wledig nad oeddech yn bresennol.

O ran Plaid y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, cefn y ceffyl pantomeim, mae'n dra hysbys, yn ystod y negodiadau ar gyfer y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth, y byddai Mike German wedi bod yn fodlon bod yn Weinidog yn gyfrifol am ddawnsio gwerin yn Llywodraeth Rhodri Morgan. Gwyddom bellach ganlyniad rhoi swydd bwysig iddo. Fe'i difethwyd.

Cynog Dafis *a gododd*—

Nick Bourne: Byddaf yn ildio mewn munud. Fodd bynnag, onid yw'n fater difrifol y

grandstanding without any acceptance of interventions by their spokesman? It is sad that a once proud and independent party has sold out every possibility of representing rural Wales for only two seats in the Cabinet. Has it been worth it? The answer is 'no'.

Cynog Dafis: Your comment about the pantomime horse worries me, because are not the Liberal Democrats claiming to be the brains of the coalition? [*Laughter.*]

Nick Bourne: I share your difficulty with that conundrum of which end has the brains. It is a difficult one, but on balance, the Liberal Democrats, with their lesser experience, their 30 pieces of silver and sell-out, deserve the rear end.

The Minister did not address the issue of this debate. He spoke about one small aspect of the rural economy. I do not doubt that, as his horizons widen, perhaps with experience in other ministries, he will consider the rural economy as a whole. He spoke about farming. You basically knocked others, there were few positive statements. The rural economy is much broader than farming. The Labour Party had every opportunity to table amendments to this motion, but it did not wish to do so, for reasons we can only surmise.

I will consider some other issues. I turn to another matter that concerns the people of Wales, namely rural schools. We have already heard of the last Conservative Government's record. Schools will only close when local authorities request closure, including authorities run by Plaid Cymru, Labour, and sometimes those with a Liberal merger. We heard that few schools, if any, were closed under the Conservative Government. However, they are closing now and proposals are already being introduced. We know that the rural schools policy has dropped off the agenda. We were told that action would be taken in this Assembly term, but it is not in the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee's forward work plan at the moment. That can only be because it has just dropped off the agenda. The Labour

cawsom y sioe fawr honno heb i'w llefarydd dderbyn unrhyw ymyriadau? Mae'n drist bod plaid a oedd yn falch ac yn annibynnol ar un adeg wedi bradychu pob posibilrwydd o gynrychioli Cymru wledig am ddwy sedd yn unig yn y Cabinet. A fu'n werth ei wneud? 'Na' yw'r ateb.

Cynog Dafis: Mae eich sylwadau am y ceffyl pantomeim yn fy mhoeni, oherwydd onid yw'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn honni mai hwy yw pen y glymblaid? [*Chwerthin.*]

Nick Bourne: Rhannaf eich anhawster ynglŷn â phenderfynu pa ben mae'r ymennydd. Mae'n anodd, ond, at ei gilydd, y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, sydd â llai o brofiad, eu 30 darn o arian a'u brad, sydd yn haeddu'r pen ôl.

Nid ymdriniodd y Gweinidog â chraidd y ddadl hon. Siaradodd am un agwedd fach ar yr economi wledig. Nid oes amheuaeth, wrth i'w orwelion ehangu, efallai wrth gael profiad mewn gweinyddiaethau eraill, y bydd yn ystyried yr economi wledig yn gyffredinol. Siaradodd am y diwydiant ffermio. Yr unig beth a wnaethoch yn y bôn oedd beirniadu pobl eraill; prin oedd y datganiadau cadarnhaol. Mae'r economi wledig yn llawer ehangach na ffermio. Cafodd y Blaid Lafur bob cyfle i gyflwyno gwelliannau i'r cynnig hwn, ond nid oedd yn dymuno gwneud hynny, am resymau y gallwn ond eu dyfalu.

Ystyriaf rai materion eraill. Trof at fater arall sydd yn peri pryder i bobl Cymru, sef ysgolion gwledig. Yr ydym eisoes wedi clywed am yr hyn a gyflawnodd y Llywodraeth Geidwadol ddiwethaf. Bydd ysgolion ond yn cau pan wna awdurdodau lleol, gan gynnwys awdurdodau a reolir gan Blaid Cymru, y Blaid Lafur, ac weithiau lle y mae plaid wedi uno â'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, gais i gau'r ysgol. Clywsom mai prin oedd yr ysgolion, os o gwbl, a gaewyd o dan y Llywodraeth Geidwadol. Fodd bynnag, maent bellach yn cau a chaiff cynlluniau eisoes eu cyflwyno. Gwyddom fod y polisi ysgolion gwledig wedi diflannu. Dywedwyd wrthym y câi camau eu cymryd yn ystod tymor hwn y Cynulliad, ond nid yw'n rhan o flaenraglen waith y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ar hyn o bryd. Y

Party does not regard it as important, which I can understand. Those two Cabinet seats are not worth rocking the alliance for as far as the sell-out six are concerned.

Janet Davies: I wondered, Nick, particularly as Rod also raised this matter, whether you would name the Plaid Cymru education authority that asked the Conservatives to close rural schools. I point out that Plaid Cymru did not control any education authorities until 1996.

Nick Bourne: It remains true that if there were requests, they did not come from Conservative local authorities but from other authorities. [*Laughter.*]

If there were no requests from Plaid authorities, and it is a big 'if', then you are exonerated and the record will speak for itself. However, there were certainly requests from Labour controlled authorities. This is not only about rural schools. If you care to make light of the prospects of the five rural schools in north Pembrokeshire that face closure and schools in Powys that face closure in the absence of a rural schools policy, then that is fine. The message will not be lost on the people of Wales.

What about the accelerating rate of post office closures?

The First Minister: It has halved.

Nick Bourne: It is good to see you here, First Minister, but it has not halved. There is an accelerating rate of post office closures. As a Member for a rural area—which you are not, so perhaps you are not aware of this—I am notified of those closures week in, week out, month in, month out. Let me tell you—perhaps you will discuss this in the Cabinet or with Paul Murphy—that the reason they are closing is because of automated credit transfer. Whose policy is that, First Minister? Not ours. We would abolish that. That is your policy. If you can get rid of that then rural post offices will not continue to close. The

rheswm am hynny yw am ei fod wedi diflannu. Nid yw'r Blaid Lafur yn ei ystyried fel mater pwysig, a gallaf ddeall hynny. Nid yw'n werth tarfu ar y gynghrair o achos y ddwy sedd hynny yn y Cabinet o safbwynt y chwe bradychwr.

Janet Davies: Tybiais, Nick, yn enwedig gan fod Rod wedi codi'r mater hwn hefyd, a fydddech yn enwi'r awdurdod addysg a reolwyd gan Blaid Cymru a ofynnodd i'r Ceidwadwyr gau ysgolion gwledig. Nodaf nad oedd Plaid Cymru yn rheoli unrhyw awdurdod addysg tan 1996.

Nick Bourne: Mae'n parhau i fod yn wir, os cafwyd ceisiadau, mai awdurdodau eraill a'u gwnaeth ac nid awdurdodau lleol a reolwyd gan y Blaid Geidwadol. [*Chwerthin.*]

Os na dderbyniwyd unrhyw geisiadau gan awdurdodau Plaid, ac 'os' mawr yw hynny, yr ydych yn ddi-fai a bydd y cofnod yn siarad drosto'i hunan. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bendant y derbyniwyd ceisiadau gan awdurdodau a reolwyd gan Lafur. Nid yw hyn ond yn berthnasol i ysgolion gwledig. Os hoffech ddiystyru dyfodol y pum ysgol wledig yng ngogledd Sir Benfro sydd yn wynebu cael eu cau a'r ysgolion ym Mhowys sydd yn wynebu cael eu cau oherwydd diffyg polisi ysgolion gwledig, mae hynny'n iawn. Ni chaiff y neges ei hanwybyddu gan bobl Cymru.

Beth am y nifer gynyddol o swyddfeydd post a gaiff eu cau?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae'r nifer wedi haneru.

Nick Bourne: Mae'n braf eich gweld yna, Brif Weinidog, ond nid yw'r nifer wedi haneru. Mae nifer gynyddol o swyddfeydd post yn cau. Fel Aelod dros ardal wledig—yn wahanol i chi, ac felly efallai nad ydych yn ymwybodol o'r ffaith hon—fe'm hysbysir o'r swyddfeydd post hynny sydd yn cau wythnos ar ôl wythnos, fis ar ôl mis. Gadewch imi ddweud wrthy ch—efallai y trafodwch hyn yn y Cabinet neu gyda Paul Murphy—mai'r hyn sydd yn achosi iddynt gau yw'r system trosglwyddo credyd awtomataidd. Polisi pwy yw hwnnw, Brif Weinidog? Nid ein polisi ni ydyw. Byddem yn diddymu hynny. Eich

ball is in your court. You are our leader for the moment. Will you get that message across?

Magistrates' courts and county courts are also threatened with closure throughout Wales in a way not seen for a generation.

Carwyn Jones *rose*—

Nick Bourne: Are going to deny that?

Carwyn Jones: As someone who practised in the courts—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Nick, you are running out of time. Gareth Jones wants to intervene.

Nick Bourne: I will briefly give way to Gareth and I will deal with Carwyn's point afterwards.

Gareth Jones: Onid yw'n warthus bod y Llywodraeth yn Lloegr wedi clustnodi £80 miliwn i sicrhau bod ysgolion bach gwledig yn dal ar agor tra bod y Llywodraeth yng Nghaerdydd yn cynnig dim?

Huw Lewis: Point of order. I am sorry to have to raise this again but it concerns terminology in the Chamber. We already have a ruling that the term 'the English Government' does not exist.

Nick Bourne: I will deal with that. I was not listening to Gareth Jones's Welsh, but in the simultaneous translation it came across as 'the English Government'. Perhaps that was not the term in the original. However, we are not discussing the English Government, and I do not think that Gareth was either. He was talking about the Westminster Government, and it is a Westminster Government—

Gareth Jones: Will you give way?

Nick Bourne: I am dealing with that point on your behalf and I think that the point was

polisi chi ydyw. Os gallwch gael gwared ar hynny, ni fydd swyddfeydd post yn parhau i gau. Chi sydd â'r cyfrifoldeb. Chi yw ein harweinydd ar hyn o bryd. A fyddwch yn cyfleu'r neges honno?

Bygythir cau llysoedd ynadon a llysoedd sirol hefyd ledled Cymru mewn ffordd nas gwelwyd ers cenhedlaeth.

Carwyn Jones *a gododd*—

Nick Bourne: A ydych yn bwriadu gwadu hynny?

Carwyn Jones: Fel bargyfreithiwr sydd wedi gweithredu yn y llys—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Nick, mae'ch amser yn brin. Mae Gareth Jones yn dymuno ymyrryd.

Nick Bourne: Byddaf yn ildio i Gareth am ychydig a byddaf yn delio â phwynt Carwyn wedyn.

Gareth Jones: Is it not shameful that the English Government has earmarked £80 million to ensure that small rural schools stay open while the Government in Cardiff offers nothing?

Huw Lewis: Pwynt o drefn. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf orfod codi'r pwynt hwn eto ond mae'n ymwneud â'r terminoleg a ddefnyddir yn y Siambr hon. Mae dyfarniad gennym eisoes nad yw'r term 'the English Government' yn bodoli.

Nick Bourne: Byddaf yn delio â hynny. Nid oeddwn yn gwrandao ar y geiriau a ddefnyddiwyd gan Gareth Jones yn y Gymraeg, ond defnyddiwyd y geiriau 'the English Government' gan y cyfieithydd ar y pryd. Efallai na ddefnyddiwyd y term hwnnw yn y Gymraeg. Fodd bynnag, nid ydym yn trafod Llywodraeth Lloegr, ac ni chredaf mai dyna oedd Gareth yn ei wneud ychwaith. Siaradai am Lywodraeth San Steffan, a Llywodraeth San Steffan ydyw—

Gareth Jones: A wnewch chi ildio?

Nick Bourne: Yr wyf yn ymdrin â'r pwynt hwnnw ar eich rhan a chredaf imi egluro'r

well made. I do not have time to take any more interventions. There are proposals to close magistrates' courts and county courts—perhaps you are not aware of them in your current role, Carwyn—and that would decimate legal provision in Wales.

Nothing is being done about post offices; nothing is being done about rural schools nor rural roads. We have already heard from a Member of the Liberal Democrat group, in rare independent voice, about the neglect of the Babbie report. Meanwhile, what do you do? You seek to ban hunting with hounds. That is irrelevant to rural Wales, it sends out the wrong message. You introduce the right to roam at a time when we have the foot and mouth disease crisis throughout the United Kingdom. That is madness. Labour Members now have the cheek to come down to vote. They were not here throughout this debate, of course. However, I am happy to conclude on that basis that there is only one party that will protect the interests of rural Wales: the Welsh Conservative Party.

pwynt yn dda. Nid oes amser gennyf i dderbyn mwy o ymyriadau. Mae cynlluniau ar y gweill i gau llysoedd ynadon a llysoedd sirol—efallai nad ydych yn ymwybodol ohonynt yn eich rôl bresennol, Carwyn—a byddai hynny yn difetha'r ddarpariaeth gyfreithiol yng Nghymru.

Ni wneir dim ynglŷn â swyddfeydd post; ni wneir dim ynglŷn ag ysgolion gwledig na ffyrdd gwledig. Yr ydym eisoes wedi clywed gan Aelod o grŵp y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, fel llais annibynnol anarferol, am y ffordd yr esgeulusir adroddiad Babbie. Yn y cyfamser, beth a wnewch? Ceisiwch wahardd hela â chŵn. Nid yw hynny'n berthnasol yng Nghymru wledig, anafona'r neges anghywir. Cyflwynwch yr hawl i grwydro pan fo gennym argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau ledled y Deyrnas Unedig. Gwallgofrwydd yw hynny. Mae'r Aelodau Llafur bellach yn ddigon digywilydd i ddod i bleidleisio. Nid oeddent yn bresennol drwy gydol y ddadl hon, wrth gwrs. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn fodlon dod i'r casgliad yn sgîl hynny mai dim ond un blaid a fydd yn diogelu buddiannau Cymru wledig: Plaid Geidwadol Cymru.

11:30 a.m.

Gwelliant 1: O blaid 11, Ymatal 9, Yn erbyn 26
Amendment 1: For 11, Abstain 9, Against 26

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Janet
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne

Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Graham, William
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 26
Amendment 2: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 26*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Graham, William
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 26
Amendment 3: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 26*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine

Cairns, Alun
 Dafis, Cynog
 Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Graham, William
 Hancock, Brian
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Elin
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Richards, Rod
 Rogers, Peter
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Chapman, Christine
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Ron
 Essex, Sue
 Evans, Delyth
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Halford, Alison
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment rejected.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 19, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 26
 Motion: For 19, Abstain 0, Against 26*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Graham, William
 Hancock, Brian
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Elin
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Richards, Rod
 Rogers, Peter
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Chapman, Christine
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Ron
 Essex, Sue
 Evans, Delyth
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Halford, Alison
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.
 Motion rejected.*

Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

Gareth Jones: Pwynt o drefn. Gan fod gan Huw Lewis broblem gyda therminoleg, hoffwn egluro mai cyfeirio at y Llywodraeth yn Lloegr yr oeddwn yn yr achos hwnnw, yn hytrach nag at Lywodraeth Lloegr a Chymru. Gobeithiaf fod Huw yn deall hynny.

Gareth Jones: Point of order. As Huw Lewis has a problem with terminology, I would like to explain that I was referring, in that instance, to the Government in England, rather than the England and Wales Government. I hope that Huw understands that.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I think that you have clarified the position.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Credaf ichi egluro'r sefyllfa.

Huw Lewis: Further to that point of order, we cannot allow basic, factual definitions to be distorted for political reasons by a party in this Chamber. The Government of the United Kingdom is the Government of the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, and it exists throughout that nation. We have a Secretary of State for Wales, who has an office in this building. That cannot be wished away because a party wishes to change simple definitions of truth in order to make cheap political points.

Huw Lewis: Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, ni allwn ganiatáu i ddiffiniadau sylfaenol, ffeithiol gael eu hystumio am resymau gwleidyddol gan blaid yn y Siambr hon. Llywodraeth Teyrnas Unedig Prydain Fawr a Gogledd Iwerddon yw Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig, ac mae'n bodoli ar draws y genedl honno. Mae gennym Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, sydd â swyddfa yn yr adeilad hwn. Ni ellir anwybyddu hynny am fod plaid yn dymuno newid diffiniadau syml o wirionedd er mwyn gwneud pwyntiau gwleidyddol diwerth.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You have a point, but we will not take up time on this matter. The Westminster Government is the Government of the United Kingdom, the Greater London Authority governs the Greater London area, and the National Assembly is the Government of Wales. We should all try to be clear in referring to different establishments, so that misunderstandings are avoided.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae pwynt gennych, ond ni roddwn amser i'r mater hwn. Llywodraeth San Steffan yw Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig, Awdurdod Llundain Fwyaf sydd yn rheoli ardal Llundain Fwyaf, a'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yw Llywodraeth Cymru. Dylem oll geisio bod yn eglur wrth gyfeirio at wahanol sefydliadau, er mwyn osgoi unrhyw gamddealltwriaeth.

Dafydd Wigley: Further to that point of order—and I will speak in English to ensure that it gets through to Huw—Gareth Jones's point was about an expenditure programme that only applies to England. Therefore, reference was made to the fact that the Government in England is responsible for that. This was clear in Gareth Jones's comments in Welsh, and should not be a matter for dispute. It was a proper use of terminology.

Dafydd Wigley: Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn—a siaradaf yn Saesneg er mwyn sicrhau bod Huw yn deall hyn—yr oedd pwynt Gareth Jones yn ymwneud â rhaglen wariant sydd ond yn berthnasol i Loegr. Felly, cyfeiriwyd at y ffaith mai'r Llywodraeth yn Lloegr sydd yn gyfrifol am hynny. Yr oedd hynny'n glir yn sylwadau Gareth Jones yn Gymraeg, ac ni ddylai fod yn destun dadl. Yr oedd ei ddefnydd o derminoleg yn briodol.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: If what Dafydd Wigley said is correct, to refer to the government of the United Kingdom in

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Os yw'r hyn a ddywedodd Dafydd Wigley yn gywir, byddai cyfeirio at Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig yn

England would be unexceptionable.

Lloegr yn gwbl dderbyniol.

Dadl Fer Short Debate

Gwyddoniaeth yng Nghymru Science in Wales

Phil Williams: I declare as an interest as a scientist in receipt of grants from the Particle Physics and Astronomy Research Council.

Phil Williams: Datganaf fuddiant fel gwyddonydd sydd yn cael grantiau gan Gyngor Ymchwil Ffiseg Ronynnol a Seryddiaeth.

I start with a statement that may come as a surprise: science is the area of human activity where Wales has excelled out of all proportion. For the forthcoming encyclopaedia of Wales, I am working on a list of 200 world-class Welsh scientists. However, today, I will only name a few. Robert Recorde from Tenby invented the equals sign. Richard Price from Llangeinor created the first actuarial tables and published Bayes's theorem, which is the basis of modern statistics. William Miller from Llandovery was the father of crystallography, the first to relate the shape of crystals to the underlying atomic structure. Alfred Russell Wallace from Usk was the first to propose natural selection as the mechanism of evolution. William Grove from Swansea invented the fuel cell and was the first to publish the law of conservation of energy in a scientific journal. David Hughes from Corwen invented the microphone, teleprinter and induction magnetometer and was the first to demonstrate electromagnetic radiowaves. Sir Robert Jones from Rhyl was the founder of modern orthopaedic surgery. Humphrey Owen Jones from Ebbw Vale was a pioneer of stereochemistry. Isaac Roberts from Denbigh was the father of astrophotometry and took the first photograph of an extragalactic object—the Andromeda Nebula. Dai Brunt from Llanidloes, universally recognised as the pioneer of modern meteorology, calculated the frequency of oscillation of the atmosphere, still known as the Brunt frequency. Evan Williams from Llandysul, perhaps the greatest of all, discovered the meson and first demonstrated meson decay—the decay of a fundamental particle. Don Hey from Swansea discovered free radicals. Today his work is vital in a

Dechreuaf gyda datganiad a all beri syndod: mae gwyddoniaeth yn faes o weithgaredd dynol y mae Cymru wedi rhagori ynddo a hynny'n gwbl anghymesur â'i maint. Yr wyf wrthi'n gweithio ar restr o 200 o wyddonwyr o'r radd flaenaf o Gymru ar gyfer gwyddoniadur arfaethedig Cymru. Fodd bynnag, heddiw, nid enwaf ond ychydig. Dyfeisiodd Robert Recorde o Ddinbych-y-Pysgod yr arwydd hafal. Creodd Richard Price o Langeinor y tablau actiwari cyntaf a chyhoeddodd theorem Bayes sydd yn sail i ystadegaeth fodern. William Miller o Lanymddyfri oedd sylfaenydd crisialeg, a'r dyn cyntaf i gysylltu siâp crisialau â'r strwythur atomig gwaelodol. Alfred Russell Wallace o Frynbuga oedd y cyntaf i gynnig dehol naturiol fel dull o esblygu. Dyfeisiodd William Grove o Abertawe y gell danwydd ac ef oedd y cyntaf i gyhoeddi cyfraith gwarchod ynni mewn cyfnodolyn gwyddonol. Dyfeisiodd David Hughes o Gorwen y meicroffon, y telegraffydd a'r magnetometr anwytho ac ef oedd y cyntaf i brofi bodolaeth tonnau radio electromagnetig. Syr Robert Jones o'r Rhyl oedd sylfaenydd llawdriniaeth orthopedig fodern. Arloesodd Humphrey Owen Jones o Lynebwy ym maes stereogemeg. Isaac Roberts o Ddinbych oedd sylfaenydd astroffotometreg ac ef a dynnodd y ffotograff cyntaf o wrthrych o tu allan i'r alaeth—sef Andromeda Nebula. Cyfrifodd Dai Brunt o Lanidloes, a gydnabyddir yn gyffredinol fel arloeswr meteoroleg modern, amledd osgiliadau'r atmosffêr, a elwir hyd heddiw yn amledd Brunt. Darganfu Evan Williams o Landysul, y gwyddonydd mwyaf yn eu plith efallai, y meson ac ef oedd y cyntaf i brofi dirywiad meson—dirywiad gronyn hanfodol. Darganfu Don Hey o Abertawe radicalau rhydd. Heddiw mae ei

range of subjects from petrochemicals to medicine. Lewis Boddington, from Brithdir near Bargoed, developed the angled flight deck that made the modern aircraft carrier possible. Eddie Bowen from Swansea developed airborne radar and did more than any other Welshman to win World War Two. I add that he was also a member of Plaid Cymru. Finally, Brian Josephson from Cardiff, whom I knew when we were schoolboys and were students together, won Wales's only Nobel prize for the Josephson Junction, the fastest-ever electronic switch.

I could go on for hours, but I only have a few minutes. Instead I will ask two questions. Why has Wales produced so many world-class scientists? I only have time for a six-word answer to that first question—early nonconformity, industrial revolution, Lord Aberdare. The second question is this—why do we not realise that Wales has produced so many world-class scientists? It is partly because all the scientists on my list left Wales to do their best research, and it is almost always assumed that they were English. I have a list of quotations where Miller, Wallace, Roberts and Brunt are specifically referred to as English. My friends tell me in glee that in a recent radio science conference one delegate referred to the English scientist, Phil Williams. We do our work away from Wales, and it is assumed that many of these people were not Welsh. The reason is that scientists need well-equipped laboratories to do world-class work, and such laboratories are rare in Wales. I recently received the final accounts of all government-funded research in the United Kingdom, for spending in the United Kingdom, for 1999-2000. The budget, through research councils and through government laboratories, totals £2.1 billion. Wales has 5 per cent of the population and 5.3 per cent of the university population, so on a fair distribution we might have expected to get between £100 million and £110 million a year. In fact, in 1999-2000 we received £49 million, or 2.3 per cent of the budget, a shortfall of £60 million in that year.

waith yn hollbwysig mewn ystod o bynciau o betro-gemegion i feddyginiaeth. Datblygodd Lewis Boddington o Frithdir ger Bargoed, y bwrdd hedfan onglog sydd wedi gwneud y cludydd awyrennau modern yn bosibl. Datblygodd Eddie Brown o Abertawe y radar yn yr awyr ac ef a wnaeth fwy nag unrhyw Gymro arall i ennill yr Ail Ryfel Byd. Nodaf ei fod hefyd yn aelod o Blaid Cymru. Yn olaf, Brian Josephson o Gaerdydd, yr oeddwn yn ei adnabod pan oeddem yn fechgyn ysgol ac yn fyfyrwyr gyda'n gilydd, a enillodd yr unig wobr Nobel a gafodd Gymru ar gyfer Cysylltle Josephson, sef y swîts electronig cyflymaf erioed.

Gallwn siarad am oriau, ond dim ond ychydig funudau sydd gennyf. Yn hytrach gofynnaf ddau gwestiwn. Pam bod Cymru wedi esgor ar gymaint o wyddonwyr o'r radd flaenaf? Nid oes gennyf amser ond i roi ateb chwe gair i'r cwestiwn cyntaf hwnnw—sef ymneilltuaeth gynnar, chwyldro diwydiannol, Arglwydd Aberdâr. Yr ail gwestiwn yw—pam na sylweddolwn fod Cymru wedi esgor ar gymaint o wyddonwyr o'r radd flaenaf? Mae'n rhannol oherwydd yr ymadawodd pob gwyddonydd ar fy rhestr â Chymru er mwyn gwneud eu hymchwil orau, a chymerir yn ganiataol, bron yn ddiethriad, mai Saeson oeddent. Mae gennyf restr o ddyfyniadau lle y cyfeiriwyd at Miller, Wallace, Roberts a Brunt yn benodol fel Saeson. Dywed fy ffrindiau wrthyf, dan chwerthin, y cyfeiriwyd at y gwyddonydd o Loegr, Phil Williams, mewn cynhadledd ar wyddoniaeth radio yn ddiweddar. Yr ydym yn gweithio y tu allan i Gymru, a chymerir yn ganiataol nad oedd llawer o'r bobl hyn yn Gymry. Y rheswm dros hynny yw bod angen labordai â chyfarpar da ar wyddonwyr er mwyn gwneud gwaith o'r radd flaenaf, ac anghyffredin yw labordai o'r fath yng Nghymru. Yn ddiweddar cefais gyfrifon terfynol pob ymchwil a ariennir gan y llywodraeth yn y Deyrnas Unedig, ar gyfer gwariant yn y Deyrnas Unedig ar gyfer 1999-2000. Cyfanswm y gyllideb drwy gynghorau ymchwil a labordai'r llywodraeth yw £2.1 biliwn. Mae 5 y cant o'r boblogaeth yng Nghymru a 5.3 y cant o boblogaeth y prifysgolion, felly, yn ôl dyraniad teg, efallai y byddem wedi disgwyl cael rhwng £100 miliwn a £110 miliwn y flwyddyn. Yn wir, yn 1999-2000 cawsom £49 miliwn, neu 2.3 y

cant o'r gyllideb, sef diffyg o £60 miliwn yn y flwyddyn honno.

It is interesting to see that we get a higher proportion of grants allocated on merit but a low proportion of institutional spending. Listen carefully: no government-financed body has ever set up a major laboratory or scientific institute with its headquarters in Wales. Our foremost research institute, the Institute of Grassland and Environmental Research, was set up by the University of Wales and taken over by the research council who then wanted to close it and move it to Maidenhead. It was only a great popular and political campaign that blocked that. There are other strange examples. The old national coal board research centre was in that well-known mining village, Cheltenham. The Hydrology Institute, studying the storage of water in reservoirs, was set up not in Rhayader but in Wallingford, near Oxford, close to the Rutherford Appleton Laboratory, Culham Plasma laboratory, the Joint European Torus and Harwell international business centre for science and technology. If I may be cynical, the top priority in British science is that the institute director must enjoy free claret in his old college on Wednesday evenings.

Mae'n ddiddorol canfod ein bod yn cael canran uwch o ddyraniadau yn ôl teilyngdod ond canran is ar wariant sefydliadol. Gwrandewch yn ofalus: nid yw'r un corff a ariennir gan y llywodraeth erioed wedi sefydlu labordy o bwys neu sefydliad gwyddonol â'i bencadlys yng Nghymru. Sefydlwyd ein sefydliad ymchwil mwyaf blaenllaw, sef Sefydliad Ymchwil Tir Glas a'r Amgylchedd, gan Brifysgol Cymru ac fe'i meddiannwyd gan y cyngor ymchwil a oedd wedyn am ei gau a'i symud i Maidenhead. Dim ond drwy ymgyrch wleidyddol a phoblogaidd fawr yr ataliwyd hynny rhag digwydd. Ceir enghreifftiau rhyfedd eraill. Lleolwyd canolfan ymchwil yr hen fwrdd glo cenedlaethol yn y pentref glofaol enwog hwnnw, Cheltenham. Sefydlwyd y Sefydliad Hydroleg, sydd yn astudio'r broses o gadw dŵr mewn argaeau nid yn Rhaeadr ond yn Wallingford, ger Rhydychen, yn agos i Labordy Rutherford Appleton, labordy Culham Plasma, Cyd-ganolfan fusnes ryngwladol Ewropeaidd Torus a Harwell ar gyfer gwyddoniaeth a thechnoleg. Os caf fod yn sinigaidd, y brif flaenoriaeth ym myd gwyddoniaeth ym Mhrydain yw bod yn rhaid i gyfarwyddwr y sefydliad fwynhau gwyrddraidd o glaret am ddim yn ei hen goleg bob nos Fercher.

11:40 a.m.

UK scientific research is unhealthily concentrated in a golden triangle between Oxford, London and Cambridge. This is out of step with every other country that has a scientific tradition. When I was an astronomer, I collaborated with the National Radio Astronomy Observatory in West Virginia. The 90-metre radio telescope was built in Green Bank because it was a mining town that needed new employment. For two and a half years, I worked in the Swedish Institute for Space Physics in Kiruna, a mining town founded in the same year as Bargoed. Institutet fur Rymdfysik is in Kiruna because it is a mining town in need of new jobs. Later, I worked with Soviet scientists in Apatity, a mining town in the Kola peninsula. The Norwegian Government helped fund my final dream, the Svalbard

Lleolir y rhan fwyaf o sefydliadau ymchwil wyddonol y DU yn anghyfartal yn y triongl euraidd rhwng Rhydychen, Llundain a Chaergrawnt. Mae hyn yn groes i bob gwlad arall â thraddodiad gwyddonol. Pan oeddwn yn seryddwr, cydweithiais â'r Arsyllfa Genedlaethol ar gyfer Seryddiaeth Radio yn West Virginia. Adeiladwyd y telesgop radio 90 metr yn Green Bank am ei bod yn dref lofaol lle yr oedd angen cyflogaeth newydd. Am ddwy flynedd a hanner, gweithiais yn Sweden yn Sefydliad Ffiseg Ofodol Kiruna, sef tref lofaol a sefydlwyd yn yr un flwyddyn â Bargoed. Lleolir Institutet fur Rymdfysik yn Kiruna am ei bod yn dref lofaol lle y mae angen swyddi newydd. Yn ddiweddarach, gweithiais â gwyddonwyr o'r Undeb Sofietaidd yn Apatity, tref lofaol ym mhenrhyn Kola. Helpodd Llywodraeth

radar, because Longyearbyen was a mining town in need of new jobs.

That is the universal pattern in every country in which I have worked, except the UK. There is no major scientific institute in Merthyr Tydfil. That should strike people as odd, because it is precisely the sort of place where any other country would locate a major scientific institute. Some years ago, I discussed this with David Phillips, who was the supremo of UK science. He explained that there may have been mistakes in locating institutes after the war, but, as the UK was no longer establishing scientific institutes, nothing could be done.

Last year, the UK did establish a major scientific facility, namely the Diamond Synchrotron Radiation Source. It will create a large number of direct jobs. It also has huge potential for spin-off in biological and solid-state technology. I did my PhD on synchrotron radiation so I know that Wales had a special claim for Diamond to be located here. The full theory of synchrotron radiation was worked out, not in Oxford, but in Aberystwyth. The present head of the department of physics at the University of Wales Aberystwyth is a world-leader in the field, using synchrotron radiation to study atomic structure—the science started by William Miller from Llandovery. On top of that, we had Objective 1 status.

At the time, we thought that there was strong competition from the Wirral, where there was an existing synchrotron facility and Objective 1 status, or from Sheffield, which made a strong bid and was also in an Objective 1 area. Where did the facility go? Need you ask? To Chilton, near Oxford. It is ironic that houses in that area are so expensive that bright young scientists cannot work there. The location policy is not even in the interests of UK science. One of my best post-doctoral fellows had a job in Chilton. He tried to buy a house, but it was so far out of his reach that he moved to Ireland, where he is now working successfully with his research.

Norwy i ariannu fy mreuddwyd olaf, sef radar Svalbard, am fod Longyearbyen yn dref lofaol lle yr oedd angen swyddi newydd.

Dyna'r patrwm cyffredin ymhob gwlad y bûm yn gweithio ynddi, ac eithrio'r DU. Nid oes unrhyw sefydliad gwyddonol ym Merthyr Tudful. Dylai pobl ryfeddu at hynny, gan mai Merthyr Tudful yw'r union fath o dref lle y byddai unrhyw wlad arall wedi lleoli sefydliad gwyddonol mawr. Rai blynyddoedd yn ôl, cefais drafodaeth am hyn gyda David Phillips, a oedd yn bennaeth ar wyddoniaeth yn y DU. Eglurodd y gwnaethpwyd camgymeriadau wrth leoli sefydliadau ar ôl y rhyfel o bosibl ond, gan nad oedd y DU yn sefydlu rhagor o sefydliadau, ni ellid gwneud unrhyw beth ynghylch hynny.

Y llynedd, sefydlodd y DU sefydliad gwyddonol mawr, o'r enw Diamond Synchrotron Radiation Source. Bydd yn creu nifer fawr o swyddi uniongyrchol. Mae ganddo botensial enfawr hefyd i greu gwaith ym maes technoleg fiolegol a thechnoleg cyflwr solet. Gwneuthum fy noethuriaeth ar ymbelydredd syncrotron felly gwn fod hawl arbennig gan Gymru i fynnu bod Diamond yn cael ei leoli yma. Cyfrifwyd theori lawn ymbelydredd syncrotron, nid yn Rhydychen, ond yn Aberystwyth. Mae pennaeth presennol yr adran ffiseg ym Mhrifysgol Cymru Aberystwyth yn arweinydd yn y maes, gan ddefnyddio ymbelydredd syncrotron er mwyn astudio strwythur atomig—sef yr wyddoniaeth a gychwynnodd William Miller o Lanymddyfri. Ar ben hynny yr oedd gennym statws Amcan 1.

Ar y pryd, credid bod cystadleuaeth gref o Gilgwri, lle yr oedd cyfleuster syncrotron eisoes yn bodoli ynghyd â statws Amcan 1, neu o Sheffield, a wnaeth gais cryf ac a oedd hefyd o fewn ardal Amcan 1. I ble yr aeth y cyfleuster? A oes angen gofyn? I Chilton, ger Rhydychen. Mae'n eironig bod tai mor ddrud yn yr ardal honno fel na all gwyddonwyr ifanc deallus weithio yno. Nid yw'r polisi lleoli hyd yn oed o fudd i wyddoniaeth y DU. Cafodd un o'm cymrodyr ôl-ddoethuriaeth gorau swydd yn Chilton. Ceisiodd brynu tŷ yno, ond yr oedd cymaint allan o'i gyrraedd nes iddo symud i Iwerddon, lle y mae bellach yn gweithio'n llwyddiannus ar ei ymchwil.

It is a myth that Ireland's economic success was based solely on European money. No way. Ireland's success was based on education. The proportion of young people in Ireland with university degrees is one of the highest in the world, with the emphasis on science and engineering. It is because Ireland can offer a young cohort of trained scientists that science-based industry moves to Ireland.

We aspire to a knowledge-based economy. There is an emphasis in the draft national economic development strategy on scientific industry and the need to expand the volume of research. I applaud those aims. They are admirably suited to Wales with its outstanding scientific tradition. However, how do we get there?

First, we must give science due prominence in our school curriculum, as part of our most important national tradition and as the key to our economic future. We desperately need proper and guaranteed funding for our universities. Whatever way you look at the figures, there is a problem. Above all, we need a fair share of the UK research budget and, if necessary, a Welsh research council. If we do not get justice from the existing system, perhaps we must demand a research council of our own. Above all, we need a policy that links advanced research with the creation of new industries. The ideas that led to one of Wales's star firms, IQE plc, which is based in St Mellons, started when Mike Scott was a research student at University of Wales, Aberystwyth. There are many other examples. Our scientific tradition must not only be a subject of justified pride; it must also be the inspiration for our future economic success.

Eleanor Burnham: I feel quite humble, speaking after as highly intelligent a person as Phil. I will make a few points. We are aware that science needs to be central to the basic knowledge of the world and that it encourages people to question, not just to accept, the status quo. In general, we need to improve achievement in science in this country. The Liberal Democrats are looking

Myth ydyw bod llwyddiant economaidd Iwerddon yn seiliedig ar arian Ewropeaidd yn unig. Dim o gwbl. Yr oedd llwyddiant Iwerddon yn seiliedig ar addysg. Mae canran y bobl ifanc yn Iwerddon sydd wedi graddio o'r brifysgol gyda'r uchaf yn y byd, gyda'r pwyslais ar wyddoniaeth a pheirianneg. Y rheswm pam bod diwydiant sydd yn seiliedig ar wyddoniaeth yn symud i Iwerddon yw y gall Iwerddon gynnig llu o wyddonwyr ifanc hyfforddedig.

Yr ydym yn anelu at economi yn seiliedig ar wybodaeth. Ceir pwyslais yn y strategaeth datblygu economaidd cenedlaethol ddrafft ar ddiwydiant gwyddonol a'r angen i gynyddu faint o ymchwil a wneir. Cymeradwyaf y nodau hynny. Maent yn addas tu hwnt i Gymru a'i thraddodiad gwyddonol nodedig. Fodd bynnag, sut y cyflawnwn hynny?

Yn gyntaf, rhaid inni roi blaenoriaeth briodol i wyddoniaeth yng nghwricwlwm ein hysgolion, fel rhan o'n traddodiad cenedlaethol pwysicaf ac fel allwedd i'n dyfodol economaidd. Mae angen dybryd am arian priodol a sicr i'n prifysgolion. Pa ffordd bynnag y dadansoddwch y ffigurau, mae problem. Yn anad dim, mae angen cyfran deg o gyllideb ymchwil y DU arnom ac, os bydd angen, cyngor ymchwil Cymru. Os na chawn gyfiawnder gan y system bresennol, efallai y bydd yn rhaid inni fynnu cael ein cyngor ymchwil ein hunain. Yn anad dim, mae angen polisi arnom sydd yn cysylltu uwch ymchwil â chreu diwydiannau newydd. Dechreuodd y syniadau a arweiniodd at un o brif gwmnïau Cymru IQE ccc, a leolir yn Llaneirwg, pan oedd Mike Scott yn fyfyrwr ymchwil ym Mhrifysgol Cymru, Aberystwyth. Ceir llawer o enghreifftiau eraill. Rhaid inni nid yn unig ymfalchïo yn ein traddodiad gwyddonol; rhaid iddo fod yn ysbrydoliaeth i'n llwyddiant economaidd yn y dyfodol.

Eleanor Burnham: Teimlaf yn eithaf gwylaidd, yn siarad ar ôl person mor ddeallus â Phil. Gwnaf ychydig o bwyntiau. Yr ydym yn ymwybodol bod angen i wyddoniaeth fod yn ganolog i wybodaeth sylfaenol y byd a'i bod yn annog pobl i gwestiynu'r sefyllfa sydd ohoni yn hytrach na'i derbyn yn unig. Yn gyffredinol, mae angen inni wella ein cyflawniadau ym myd gwyddoniaeth yn y

to address this problem by increasing the science budget by diverting government funds away from military research, for example, and concentrating on developing civil science and research. We recognise that developing research is important. We would take steps to improve specialist research facilities in Wales and encourage links between educational institutions and industry, and increase spending on science over the current spending plans. We would also recognise the current crisis in education by offering a crash training programme in maths and science for mature entrants. That is another difficult situation at the moment. We would also take steps to attract more women into science, although it appears that girls have overtaken boys in achievement in science and maths since 1992. Finally, we recognise that science is not just important in terms of research, but also in relation to the environment.

Alun Cairns: I am grateful to Phil Williams choosing this topic for his short debate. No-one would question his commitment to science or science's importance in economic development. We often hear about that in the Economic Development Committee. It is a part of the economy that creates much wealth. I was going to ask which Minister would respond, because there were three Ministers in the Chamber at one time. I shall explain my interest. At yesterday's Economic Development Committee meeting we had a presentation from the National Botanic Garden of Wales. It described the importance of the science centre that it is seeking to develop to creating wealth in that part of south-west Wales. At the meeting, the Deputy First Minister highlighted that the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language would take responsibility for the botanic garden. Bearing in mind that the science centre is the foundation on which we can achieve long-term economic growth from the garden, I question the importance that the Cabinet, the Deputy First Minister and the First Minister place on fostering science. Developing the science centre is the botanic

wlad hon. Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn ystyried mynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon drwy gynyddu'r gyllideb ar gyfer gwyddoniaeth drwy symud arian y llywodraeth oddi wrth ymchwil filwrol, er enghraifft, a chanolbwyntio ar ddatblygu gwyddoniaeth ac ymchwil sifil. Cydnabyddwn fod datblygu ymchwil yn bwysig. Byddem yn cymryd camau i wella sefydliadau ymchwil arbenigol yng Nghymru ac i hyrwyddo'r cysylltiadau rhwng sefydliadau addysgol a diwydiant, a byddem yn gwario mwy ar wyddoniaeth na'r cynlluniau gwario cyfredol. Byddem hefyd yn cydnabod yr argyfwng presennol ym myd addysg drwy gynnig rhaglen hyfforddiant carlam mewn mathemateg a gwyddoniaeth ar gyfer y rhai hŷn sydd yn mynd i mewn i'r proffesiwn. Mae honno'n sefyllfa anodd arall ar hyn o byd. Byddem hefyd yn cymryd camau i ddenu mwy o ferched i fyd gwyddoniaeth, er yr ymddengys fod merched yn goddiweddyd bechgyn o ran cyflawniad mewn gwyddoniaeth a mathemateg ers 1992. Yn olaf, cydnabyddwn fod gwyddoniaeth yn bwysig nid yn nhermau ymchwil yn unig, ond hefyd mewn perthynas â'r amgylchedd.

Alun Cairns: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Phil Williams am ddewis y pwnc hwn ar gyfer ei ddadl fer. Ni fyddai unrhyw un yn amau ei ymrwymiad i wyddoniaeth na phwysigrwydd gwyddoniaeth o ran datblygu economaidd. Clywn yn aml am hynny yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Mae'n rhan o'r economi sydd yn creu llawer o gyfoeth. Yr oeddwn yn bwriadu gofyn pa Weinidog fyddai'n ymateb, gan fod tri Gweinidog yn y Siambr ar un adeg. Egluraf fy niddordeb. Yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ddoe, cawsom gyflwyniad gan Ardd Fotaneg Genedlaethol Cymru. Disgrifiwyd pa mor bwysig yw'r ganolfan wyddoniaeth y mae'n ceisio ei datblygu er mwyn creu cyfoeth yn y rhan honno o dde-orllewin Cymru. Yn y cyfarfod, nododd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog y byddai'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg yn gyfrifol am yr ardd fotaneg. O gofio bod y ganolfan wyddoniaeth yn sefydliad lle y gallwn sicrhau twf economaidd hirdymor o'r ardd, holaf ynglŷn â pha mor bwysig y mae'r Cabinet, y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Prif Weinidog yn ystyried meithrin gwyddoniaeth. Datblygu'r

garden's key project. I ask the Deputy First Minister to urge the First Minister to reconsider that decision.

We heard in the last debate how rural Wales may suffer from the closure of magistrates courts. That discourages high-income earners from rural areas because they are no longer working there. I am not an interventionist, but market forces dictate that biotechnology will be a wealth generator in the future. Therefore, I urge the Deputy First Minister to consider biotechnology to be a priority, because the market forces dictate it, and that he takes responsibility for the science centre at the National Botanic Garden of Wales.

The Deputy First Minister and Minister for Economic Development (Michael German): First, I pay tribute to Phil. His knowledge and understanding of this topic is great, and I hope that today's debate will have ensured that the sale of the encyclopaedia to which he is contributing will increase as Members bid to purchase it from the publishers when it is eventually published.

I am pleased to respond on behalf of the administration on the role of science in Wales. Of course it is right, Phil, to praise the record of scientists from Wales. We must state how great that contribution has been. I am glad that you listed all those that you did; I will add a few names myself. Not only have Welsh scientists contributed to the pure sciences, but also to entrepreneurship. Terry Matthews and Chris Evans are current major players, but I will also mention Sir John Meurig Thomas. He was a chemist. You are a physicist, and physicists do not necessarily like praising chemists. However, I am sure that you would agree that he was another fine person from Wales. He became Master of Peterhouse College, Cambridge. One person that you may have missed out from your encyclopaedia, is Edward Llwyd. He was born in Glan Ffraid, Cardiganshire in 1660. He collected plants around the hill mass of Snowdon and established the existence of a distinct alpine flora and fauna there. I hope

ganolfan wyddoniaeth yw prosiect allweddol yr ardd. Gofynnaf i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog annog y Prif Weinidog i ailystyried y penderfyniad hwnnw.

Clywsom yn y ddadl ddiwethaf sut y gallai Cymru wledig ddiweddef yn sgîl cau'r llysoedd ynadon. Mae hynny yn darbwylllo pobl ar incwm uchel i beidio â byw mewn ardaloedd gwledig am nad ydynt yn gweithio yno bellach. Ni chredaf mewn ymyrraeth, ond mae grymoedd y farchnad yn mynnu y bydd biotechnoleg yn creu cyfoeth yn y dyfodol. Felly, anogaf y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog i ystyried biotechnoleg yn flaenoriaeth oherwydd y bydd grymoedd y farchnad yn deddfu hynny, ac fe'i anogaf i gymryd cyfrifoldeb dros y ganolfan wyddoniaeth yng Ngardd Fotaneg Genedlaethol Cymru.

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd (Michael German): Yn gyntaf, talaf deyrnged i Phil. Mae ei wybodaeth am y pwnc hwn a'i ddealltwriaeth ohono yn eang, a gobeithiaf y bydd y ddadl heddiw yn sicrhau y caiff mwy o gopiâu o'r gwyddoniadur y mae'n cyfrannu ato eu gwerthu wrth i Aelodau gynnig i'w brynu gan y cyhoeddwr pan gaiff ei gyhoeddi.

Mae'n dda gennyf ymateb ar ran y weinyddiaeth ar rôl gwyddoniaeth yng Nghymru. Wrth gwrs Phil, mae'n briodol canmol gwaith gwyddonwyr o Gymru. Rhaid inni nodi pa mor fawr oedd y cyfraniad hwnnw. Yr wyf yn falch ichi restru'r holl bobl a wnaethoch; ychwanegaf ychydig o enwau fy hun. Cyfrannodd gwyddonwyr o Gymru nid yn unig at y gwyddorau pur, ond hefyd at entrepreneuriaeth. Mae Terry Matthews a Chris Evans ymhlith y rhai pwysicaf yn y maes hwn, ond soniaf hefyd am Syr John Meurig Thomas. Cemegydd ydoedd. Ffisegydd ydych chi ac nid yw ffisegwyr o reidrwydd yn hoff o ganmol cemegwyr. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunech ei fod yn berson nodedig arall o Gymru. Daeth yn Feistr ar Goleg Peterhouse, Caergrawnt. Un person ichi ei hepgor o'ch gwyddoniadur o bosibl yw Edward Llwyd. Fe'i ganed yng Nglan Ffraid, Sir Aberteifi yn 1660. Casglodd blanhigion o fryniau Eryri a phrofodd fodolaeth planhigion alpaidd

that he will appear in your encyclopaedia in future.

11:50 a.m.

On Alun's point about biotech, the Welsh Development Agency has responsibility for the technetium biotech, which will be centred on the National Botanic Garden of Wales. The WDA is within my remit, and therefore the centre will come under the Economic Development Committee's remit.

I will talk about the relationship between our academic institutions and our industries. In continental Europe links between industry and universities, where the industrial base has been shared, are common and it has long been the practice to support spinouts. That needs to be the culture that we develop in Wales. I do not need to remind you that when there is a crisis in any manufacturing sector in Wales, one of the first areas to be cut is research and development. If the research and development happens to be far from company headquarters, so much the worse. The National Assembly for Wales refuses to surrender to a victim culture. That is why we see the academic sector as so important to our industrial and scientific development as a nation.

We must take a keen interest in developing the growth of scientific knowledge in Wales. As with most things, we cannot look at Wales in isolation, nor would it be desirable to do so. This Assembly is represented on the Ministerial Science Group, which promotes the interests of science and innovation on a UK-wide basis. On that UK-wide basis, Phil will know that the Save British Science Society has made similar points to those that he has put forward this morning. I have considerable sympathy with those points.

I can give you the latest figures for research income for the higher education institutions in Wales for 1999-2000. The total research income for Wales as a percentage of the UK is 3.9 per cent, about £116.449 million. The interesting perception here is how that is

unigryw yno. Gobeithiaf y bydd yn ymddangos yn eich gwyddoniadur yn y dyfodol.

Ynglŷn â phwynt Alun ar fiotechnoleg, Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru sydd yn gyfrifol am y fiotechnoleg dechnetiwm, a gaiff ei lleoli yng Ngardd Fotaneg Genedlaethol Cymru. Mae'r WDA yn fy nghylch gwaith, ac felly daw'r ganolfan yng nghylch gwaith y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd.

Soniaf am y berthynas rhwng ein sefydliadau academiaidd a'n diwydiannau. Ar dir mawr Ewrop, mae cysylltiadau rhwng diwydiant a'r prifysgolion, lle y caiff sylfaen ddiwydiannol ei rhannu, yn beth cyffredin ac mae'n hen arfer cefnogi sgîl-fanteision. Dyna'r diwylliant y mae angen inni ei ddatblygu yng Nghymru. Nid oes angen imi eich atgoffa mai un o'r meysydd cyntaf y cwtogir arno pan fo argyfwng mewn unrhyw sector gweithgynhyrchu yw gwaith ymchwil a datblygu. Os digwydd y gwaith ymchwil a datblygu ym mhell i ffwrdd o bencadlys y cwmni, gwaethaf oll. Mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn gwrthod ymostwng i ddiwylliant dioddefwr. Dyna pam yr ystyriwn fod y sector academiaidd mor bwysig i'n datblygiad diwydiannol a gwyddonol fel cenedl.

Rhaid inni gymryd diddordeb brwd mewn datblygu twf gwybodaeth wyddonol yng Nghymru. Fel gyda'r rhan fwyaf o faterion, ni allwn ystyried Cymru yn annibynnol, ac ni fyddai'n ddymunol gwneud hynny. Caiff y Cynulliad hwn gynrychiolaeth ar Grŵp Gwyddonol y Gweinidogion, sydd yn hyrwyddo buddiannau gwyddoniaeth a dyfeisgarwch ar draws y DU. Gwŷr Phil fod y Gymdeithas dros Achub Gwyddoniaeth Prydain, ar y sail y DU gyfan, wedi gwneud pwyntiau tebyg i'r rhai a wnaeth y bore yma. Mae gennyf gryn dipyn o gydymdeimlad â'r pwyntiau hynny.

Gallaf roi'r ffigurau diweddaraf ichi ynglŷn ag incwm ymchwil sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru ar gyfer 1999-2000. Cyfanswm incwm ymchwil Cymru fel canran o incwm y DU yw 3.9 y cant, sef tua £116.449 miliwn. Y canfyddiad diddorol yma yw sut y rhennir

spread between the different sources. The only area where Wales does better than its population average is in Government grants, that is the UK central Government bodies grants. It does particularly poorly in research council grants, in recurrent research funding, and overseas sources, which are key areas upon which many universities build. I will address that point later, because we need to put a marker down here for our research institutions.

Our academic institutions have a wealth of expertise and technological know-how, which are currently largely under exploited. However, I am pleased that the numbers taking science-related courses in our universities and further education institutions increased by 24 per cent over the two sessions of 1997-98 and 1999-2000. The Assembly has already introduced new initiatives designed specifically to tackle this issue. I will outline a few of those new initiatives and remind ourselves what we have done. The knowledge exploitation fund has been created. In 2000-01, we invested £4 million in the fund. This year it will receive £10 million. The purpose of this fund is to boost the wealth-creating capabilities of higher and further education institutions in Wales. It is designed to accelerate the exploitation of research and development and other knowledge and expertise that exists in Wales.

Another recently introduced initiative is Know-how Wales. This initiative is to encourage effective collaboration between industry and academia. For example, one of its aims is to look at industrially relevant academic research and improve the prospects of that research becoming commercially viable. Elsewhere, the WDA's long-established and highly-regarded centres of excellence programme has done much to further the cause of effective leading edge collaborations and technology transfer. However, this programme has now been revamped and refocused to provide a more coherent and advanced service to Welsh industry. The new programme, which has been rebadged as CETIC—centres of expertise for technology and industrial

hynny rhwng y gwahanol ffynonellau. Yr unig faes lle y mae Cymru yn gwneud yn well na'r cyffredin o ystyried ei phoblogaeth yw grantiau'r Llywodraeth, hynny yw grantiau gan gyrff Llywodraeth ganolog y DU. Ni chaiff llawer o lwyddiant o ran grantiau'r cyngor ymchwil, o safbwynt arian ymchwil achlysurol, na ffynonellau tramor, sef meysydd allweddol y mae llawer o brifysgolion yn adeiladu arnynt. Ymdriniaf â'r pwynt hwnnw yn nes ymlaen, am fod angen inni dynnu sylw ein sefydliadau ymchwil at hyn.

Mae cyfoeth o arbenigedd a gwybodaeth dechnolegol gan ein sefydliadau academiaidd nas defnyddir i'r eithaf ar y cyfan ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn falch o nodi bod y nifer sy'n dilyn cyrsiau sy'n ymwneud â gwyddoniaeth yn ein prifysgolion a'n sefydliadau addysg bellach wedi cynyddu 24 y cant yn ystod sesiynau 1997-98 a 1999-2000. Mae'r Cynulliad eisoes wedi cyflwyno mentrau newydd sydd â'r nod penodol o fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn. Amlinellaf ychydig o'r mentrau newydd hynny yma gan eich atgoffa o'r hyn a gyflawnwyd gennym. Crëwyd y gronfa defnyddio gwybodaeth. Yn 2000-01, buddsoddwyd £4 miliwn yn y gronfa. Eleni bydd yn derbyn £10 miliwn. Diben y gronfa hon yw hyrwyddo gallu sefydliadau addysg uwch ac addysg bellach i greu cyfoeth. Ei nod yw cyflymu'r broses o ddefnyddio gwaith ymchwil a datblygu a mathau eraill o wybodaeth ac arbenigedd sydd yn bodoli yng Nghymru.

Menter arall a gyflwynwyd yn ddiweddar yw Know-how Cymru. Nod y fenter hon yw hyrwyddo cydweithio effeithiol rhwng diwydiant a'r byd academiaidd. Er enghraifft, un o'i nodau yw ystyried ymchwil sydd yn berthnasol i ddiwydiant a gwella'r posibilrwydd y bydd yr ymchwil honno yn fasnachol ymarferol. Mewn meysydd eraill, mae rhaglen canolfannau rhagoriaeth yr WDA sydd yn hir sefydledig ac yn uchel ei pharch wedi gwneud llawer i sicrhau cydweithio a throsglwyddo technoleg effeithiol a blaengar. Fodd bynnag, ailwampwyd y rhaglen hon ac erbyn hyn mae'n canolbwyntio ar ddarparu gwasanaeth mwy cydlynus a blaenllaw i ddiwydiant Cymru. Caiff y rhaglen newydd, a ailenwyd yn CETIC—sydd yn dynodi canolfannau

collaboration—is being relaunched with significant Assembly and European funding. Twenty academic institutions in Wales have recently been accredited with CETIC status. Each CETIC will provide and continue to develop a world-class scientific, technical and research resource for Welsh industry, which will be used to transfer knowledge to Welsh companies, particularly small and medium-sized enterprises, and UK and international companies seeking to invest in Wales.

Elsewhere in Wales, there are further encouraging signs. Higher education institutions are participating, in increasing numbers, in the long-established teaching company scheme, which continues to play a vital role in delivering technology and knowledge transfer into industry in Wales. As if to highlight the scheme's popularity and high take-up in Wales, I am pleased to report that the University of Wales, Bangor is now third in the UK league table for the number of projects generated. Meanwhile, other Welsh universities continue their enthusiastic support of this long-established and highly-regarded technology transfer programme.

The National Assembly has not been dragging its feet. We relaunched the college business partnership scheme in Wales, ahead of other parts of the United Kingdom. Following the relaunch in Wales, the first year proved highly successful, with the target number of projects being exceeded. The target was 10, and 12 projects were achieved. Another cause for celebration is Cardiff University's innovation network. That has proved a great success and is now regarded as a model of its kind, as exemplified by its inclusion as a case study in the Whitehall Government's July science and innovation White Paper. The University of Wales, Swansea recently hosted the two-day United Kingdom Science Park Association conference. That was the first time that this prestigious event has been held in Wales.

arbenigedd ar gyfer technoleg a chydweithio diwydiannol—ei hail-lansio gyda symiau sylweddol o arian gan y Cynulliad ac Ewrop. Cafodd 20 o sefydliadau academiaidd yng Nghymru eu hachredu â statws CETIC yn ddiweddar. Bydd pob canolfan yn darparu ac yn parhau i ddatblygu adnodd wyddonol, dechnegol ac ymchwil o'r radd flaenaf i ddiwydiant Cymru, a gaiff ei defnyddio i drosglwyddo gwybodaeth i gwmnïau yng Nghymru, yn enwedig busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint, a chwmnïau yn y DU a chwmnïau rhyngwladol sydd am fuddsoddi yng Nghymru.

Mewn mannau eraill yng Nghymru ceir mwy o arwyddion calonogol. Mae nifer gynyddol o sefydliadau addysg uwch yn cymryd rhan yn y cynllun dysgu cwmnïau hir sefydledig, sydd yn parhau i chwarae rôl hollbwysig mewn trosglwyddo technoleg a gwybodaeth i ddiwydiant yng Nghymru. Gan bwysleisio pa mor boblogaidd yw'r cynllun a'r nifer fawr o sefydliadau sydd yn ymuno ag ef yng Nghymru, yr wyf yn falch o nodi bod Prifysgol Cymru, Bangor erbyn hyn yn drydydd yn nhabl cynghrair y DU o ran nifer y prosiectau a grëir. Yn y cyfamser, mae prifysgolion eraill yng Nghymru yn parhau i gefnogi'n frwd y rhaglen trosglwyddo technoleg sydd yn hir sefydledig ac yn uchel ei pharch.

Nid yw'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol wedi bod yn llusgo ei draed. Ail-lansiwyd y cynllun partneriaeth busnes a cholegau yng Nghymru, o flaen rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig. Yn dilyn yr ail-lansio yng Nghymru, bu'r flwyddyn gyntaf yn llwyddiannus dros ben, gan ragori ar y targed ar gyfer nifer y prosiectau. Deg prosiect oedd y targed, a chyflawnwyd 12. Rheswm arall dros ddathlu yw rhwydwaith dyfeisgarwch Prifysgol Caerdydd. Bu'n llwyddiant mawr ac fe'i hystyrir yn fodel enghreifftiol, fel y dengys y ffaith iddo gael ei gynnwys mewn astudiaeth achos ym Mhapur Gwyn Llywodraeth Whitehall ar wyddoniaeth a dyfeisgarwch ym mis Gorffennaf. Cynhaliodd Prifysgol Cymru, Abertawe gynhadledd deuddydd Cymdeithas Parciau Gwyddoniaeth y Deyrnas Unedig yn ddiweddar. Dyna'r tro cyntaf i'r digwyddiad nodedig hwn gael ei gynnal yng Nghymru.

Central Government has established the university challenge fund with the Wellcome Trust and Gatsby Charitable Foundation. This will make significant sums available on a UK-wide basis to help academic institutions make the most of research findings. The fund is designed to support the early stages of commercial exploitation. Two Welsh universities—Cardiff University and the University of Wales, Aberystwyth—have so far been supported under this initiative. Universities can also bid for White Paper moneys. These sums will be allocated to strengthen the university base in key areas such as genomics, e-science and basic technology.

That gives a flavour of what we are doing to raise the profile of the science and research base in Wales and to capitalise and build further on its strengths. However, we have much more to do before we can say that we have succeeded in raising Wales fully from the historically lower research base from which it started.

As Phil noted, a particular shortcoming is that the higher education institutions in Wales secure only between 3 per cent and 4 per cent of the value of grants awarded by the research councils. We would normally expect them to attract considerably more than that, given the size of the sector in Wales. The fact that they do not do so has been a matter of concern to the National Assembly. A study was commissioned to establish why that was the case. It found that one of the main reasons for the disparity lies in the fact that fewer grant applications are made by academics from institutions in Wales.

However, I am glad to report that, following a seminar given by the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales, all five of our research-led institutions have produced plans with targets for increasing their income from research councils over the next three years. I, therefore, look forward—as, I am sure, will the whole Assembly—to applauding their success in due course.

Sefydlodd y Llywodraeth ganolog gronfa sialens i brifysgolion ar y cyd ag Ymddiriedolaeth Wellcome a Sefydliad Elusennol Gatsby. Bydd y gronfa hon yn darparu symiau sylweddol ar draws y DU er mwyn helpu sefydliadau academiaidd i wneud y gorau o ganfyddiadau eu hymchwil. Nod y gronfa yw cynnal camau cynnar y defnydd masnachol a wneir o hynny. Hyd yma cafodd dwy brifysgol yng Nghymru—Prifysgol Caerdydd a Phrifysgol Cymru, Aberystwyth—gymorth o dan y fenter hon. Gall prifysgolion wneud cais hefyd am arian y Papur Gwyn. Caiff y symiau hyn eu dyrannu er mwyn atgyfnerthu rhan prifysgolion mewn meysydd allweddol megis genomeg, e-wyddoniaeth a thechnoleg sylfaenol.

Mae hynny'n rhoi blas o'r hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud er mwyn codi proffil sefydliadau gwyddoniaeth ac ymchwil yng Nghymru ac i fanteisio ac adeiladu ar eu cryfderau. Fodd bynnag, mae gennym lawer mwy i'w wneud cyn y gallwn ddweud ein bod wedi llwyddo i godi Cymru o'r sylfaen ymchwil is draddodiadol y mae wedi dechrau ohoni.

Fel y nododd Phil, un gwendid penodol yw mai dim ond rhwng 3 y cant a 4 y cant o werth y grantiau a ddyfernir gan y cyngorau ymchwil a gaiff eu hennill gan sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru. Fel arfer byddem yn disgwyl iddynt ddenu llawer mwy na hynny, o ystyried maint y sector yng Nghymru. Mae'r ffaith nad ydynt yn gwneud hynny yn fater o bryder i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Comisiynwyd astudiaeth er mwyn canfod pam bod hyn yn digwydd. Canfuwyd mai un o'r prif resymau dros y gwahaniaeth oedd y ffaith bod academyddion o sefydliadau yng Nghymru yn gwneud llai o geisiadau am grantiau.

Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn falch o nodi bod pob un o'n pum sefydliad sydd yn ymgymryd â gwaith ymchwil, yn sgîl seminar a drefnwyd gan Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru, wedi llunio cynlluniau gyda thargedau ar gyfer cynyddu eu hincwm o'r cyngorau ymchwil yn ystod y tair blynedd nesaf. Felly edrychaf ymlaen—fel y bydd y Cynulliad cyfan, mae'n siŵr—at gymeradwyo eu llwyddiant maes o law.

Phil Williams: Do you accept that the existence of a Government-funded laboratory near a university has, in many cases, been a great stimulus to grant application and that that is one of Wales's handicaps?

Michael German: Yes. The more we can establish centres of excellence in research of any sort, the more that is likely to attract extra funding from research councils. We must all learn that lesson, in the context of the whole economic environment.

Christine Chapman: While I welcome the initiatives that you announced, do you agree that a challenge remains in attracting young people to science? There are good examples of science club initiatives throughout Wales. However, there is still a shortfall of younger people who go on to gain A levels and other qualifications in science. We need to target that. Will you discuss this issue with the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, to see what we can do to meet this challenge?

Michael German: I agree that we must go back into the school curriculum to seek out the root cause of these issues. The entrepreneurship action plan talks about how these economic aspects, which include science teaching, research and learning, can be promoted and included in the school curriculum. I am pleased that the Economic Development Committee was yesterday able to take forward, with our budgetary commitment, huge parts of that programme. However, I will discuss this with the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning in terms of the school curriculum, so that when people make vital choices at 13 or 14 years of age, they make the choices that will give them the possibility of higher added value jobs, particularly in Wales.

Finally, the national economic development strategy will continue to evolve, through discussion and as we continue to receive comments from people during the next few

Phil Williams: A dderbyniwch fod lleoliad labordy a ariennir gan y Llywodraeth ger prifysgol wedi bod yn anogaeth fawr, mewn llawer o achosion, i wneud ceisiadau am grantiau a bod hynny'n un o'r rhwystrau yng Nghymru?

Michael German: Derbyniaf hynny. Po fwyaf y gallwn ei wneud i sefydlu canolfannau rhagoriaeth mewn ymchwil o bob math, y mwyaf tebygol y denir arian ychwanegol oddi wrth gynghorau ymchwil. Rhaid inni oll ddysgu'r wers honno, yng nghyd-destun yr amgylchedd economaidd cyfan.

Christine Chapman: Er y croesawaf y mentrau a gyhoeddwyd gennych, a gytunwch yr erys yr her o hyd o ddenu pobl ifanc i astudio gwyddoniaeth? Ceir enghreifftiau da o fentrau sydd yn ymwneud â chlybiau gwyddonol ledled Cymru. Fodd bynnag, mae prinder o hyd o bobl iau sydd yn mynd ymlaen i ennill cymwysterau Safon Uwch a chymwysterau eraill mewn gwyddoniaeth. Mae angen inni dargedu hynny. A drafodwch y mater hwn gyda'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, er mwyn canfod beth y gallwn ei wneud i gyflawni'r sialens hon?

Michael German: Cytunaf fod yn rhaid inni ailystyried cwricwlwm yr ysgolion er mwyn canfod yr hyn sydd wrth wraidd y problemau hyn. Sonia'r cynllun gweithredu entrepreneuriaeth am sut y gellir hyrwyddo'r agweddau economaidd hyn, sydd yn cynnwys addysgu gwyddoniaeth, ymchwil a dysgu, a'u cynnwys yng nghwricwlwm yr ysgolion. Yr wyf yn falch y bu i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ddoe allu gweithredu ar rannau helaeth o'r rhaglen honno, gyda'n hymrwymiad cyllidebol. Fodd bynnag, trafodaf hyn gyda'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes o ran cwricwlwm yr ysgolion, felly pan fydd pobl yn gwneud dewisiadau hollbwysig yn 13 neu 14 mlwydd oed, byddant yn gwneud y dewisiadau a fydd yn rhoi cyfle iddynt sicrhau swyddi â gwerth ychwanegol uwch, yn enwedig yng Nghymru.

I gloi, bydd y strategaeth datblygu economaidd cenedlaethol yn parhau i ddatblygu drwy drafodaeth ac wrth inni barhau i dderbyn sylwadau gan bobl yn ystod

months. This document will emphasise the importance of developing our research capability in education and fully engage academia in Wales as a key component of economic growth and prosperity. If this debate does anything today, I hope that it serves to remind everyone that the National Assembly is committed to scientific development in Wales. We believe that it is central to the development of a richer Wales and, by that I mean richer in all senses.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings today's proceedings to a close.

yr ychydig fisoedd nesaf. Bydd y ddogfen hon yn pwysleisio pa mor bwysig yw datblygu ein gallu i wneud ymchwil mewn addysg a chysylltu'n llwyr â'r byd academaidd yng Nghymru fel rhan allweddol o dwf a ffyniant economaidd. Os cyflawna'r ddadl hon heddiw unrhyw beth, gobeithiaf y bydd yn fodd o atgoffa pawb bod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ymrwymedig i ddatblygiad gwyddoniaeth yng Nghymru. Credwn ei fod yn ganolog i ddatblygu Cymru gyfoethocach ac, yn hynny o beth, golygaf Gymru gyfoethocach ym mhob ystyr.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 12.04 p.m.
The meeting ended at 12.04 p.m.*