



Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)

The National Assembly for Wales
(The Official Record)

Dydd Iau 17 Mai 2001

Thursday 17 May 2001

Cynnwys
Contents

- | | |
|----|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 3 | Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg
<i>Questions to the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language</i> |
| 11 | Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig
<i>Questions to the Minister for Rural Affairs</i> |
| 20 | Pwynt o Drefn
<i>Point of Order</i> |
| 21 | Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion
<i>Composite Motion: Approval of Orders</i> |
| 22 | Adolygu Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 6.3 a 6.26
<i>Revision of Standing Orders Nos. 6.3 and 6.26</i> |
| 24 | Blaenraglenni Gwaith Strategol y Pwyllgorau
<i>Committees' Strategic Forward Work Programmes.</i> |
| 53 | Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru): Polisiâu Ariannol, Cyllidol a Gwariant
Cyhoeddus Llywodraeth y DU
<i>Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru): The UK Government's Monetary, Fiscal and
86Public Expenditure Policy</i> |
| 86 | Dadl Fer: Bod yn Rhydd o Addasu Genetig ai Peidio
<i>Short Debate: To Be GM-free or Not</i> |

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been
included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 9.05 a.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 9.05 a.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg Questions to the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language

Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru National Museums and Galleries of Wales

Q1 Christine Gwyther: Will the Minister make a statement on visitor figures to the National Museums and Galleries of Wales? (OAQ11403)

C1 Christine Gwyther: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y ffigurau ymwelwyr i Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru? (OAQ11403)

The Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language (Jenny Randerson): I am pleased to announce that there were 160,000 visitors to the national museums during April. That is 78 per cent more visitors than in the same month last year. I have made a detailed breakdown available on the culture and sport pages of the Assembly's website. The increase is a measure of the success of the free entry policy introduced with additional funding provided by the Assembly. Many thousands of people who may not have been able to visit the museums previously have now been able to see our national treasures.

Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Iaith Gymraeg (Jenny Randerson): Yr wyf yn falch o gyhoeddi yr ymwelodd 160,000 o bobl â'r amgueddfeydd cenedlaethol ym mis Ebrill. Mae hynny yn 78 y cant yn fwy o ymwelwyr nag yn yr un mis y llynedd. Yr wyf wedi paratoi dadansoddiad manwl ar gyfer y tudalennau diwylliant a chwaraeon ar wefan y Cynulliad. Mae'r cynnydd yn dangos llwyddiant y polisi mynediad am ddim a gyflwynwyd gydag arian ychwanegol oddi wrth y Cynulliad. Mae miloedd lawer o bobl na fyddai wedi gallu ymweld â'r amgueddfeydd cyn hyn bellach wedi gallu gweld ein trysorau cenedlaethol.

Christine Gwyther: The numbers of visitors for April are staggering. When I examined the statistics, I realised that the number of visitors to historical and heritage attractions has increased substantially. People have flocked to those places. I think that that is because we love real life.

Christine Gwyther: Mae niferoedd yr ymwelwyr ym mis Ebrill yn syfrdanol. Pan archwiliais yr ystadegau, sylwais fod nifer y rhai â ymwelodd ag atyniadau hanesyddol a threftadaeth wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol. Mae pobl wedi tyrru i'r lleoedd hynny. Credaf fod hynny oherwydd ein bod yn hoffi bywyd go-iawn.

Next week is the civil servants' delivering better policy week. Perhaps next year we could have a being a better politician week—that would be interesting. In the meantime, do you agree that the free admission policy captures all that we should aspire to do, namely engaging people and keeping matters relevant and real?

Yr wythnos nesaf bydd y gweision sifil yn cynnal wythnos polisiâu gwell. Y flwyddyn nesaf, efallai y cawn wythnos bod yn well gwleidydd—byddai hynny'n ddiddorol. Yn y cyfamser, a gytunwch fod y polisi mynediad am ddim yn cyfleu y cyfan y dylem ymgynraedd ato, sef cynnwys pobl a sicrhau bod materion yn berthnasol a real?

Jenny Randerson: I agree wholeheartedly. It strongly reflects the themes of the partnership Government. One main reason why I was anxious to implement this policy on 1 April was because of foot and mouth disease,

Jenny Randerson: Cytunaf yn llwyr. Mae'n adlewyrchiad cryf o themâu'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth. Un o'r prif resymau pam fy mod yn awyddus i weithredu'r polisi hwn ar 1 Ebrill oedd oherwydd clwy'r traed a'r genau,

which has hit our economy hard. I wanted to do my bit to stimulate the economy by attracting visitors. However, in the long term, we need to attract into our museums people who would not otherwise visit them. The anecdotal evidence to date shows that people who have never visited our museums before are doing so and will develop a museum-visiting habit.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yr ydym oll yn falch o glywed y ffigurau ynglŷn â nifer y bobl sydd yn ymweld ag amgueddfeydd. Mae'r cynnydd hwnnw'n bwysig.

Cyfeiriasoch at glwy'r traed a'r genau. A dderbyniwch, yn sgîl hynny, yn anffodus, fod llawer o ganolfannau twristiaeth sydd yn cynnig atyniadau addysgiadol yn dioddef? Os yw ysgolion yn cael cyfle i ymweld ag amgueddfeydd am ddim, ni fyddant y mynd i ganolfannau twristiaeth o'r fath. A allwch gynorthwyo ysgolion i'w galluogi i fynd i ganolfannau lle ceir atyniadau addysgiadol, er mwyn cefnogi'r diwydiant twristiaeth?

Jenny Randerson: Assisting schools or other visitor attractions are matters for either Jane Davidson, as Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, or Mike German, as Minister for Economic Development. However, a basic law of economics is that the vast majority of people have a limited income. If they do not have to spend that income on visiting one attraction, then they can spend it on visiting another. I hope and expect that, in the long term, when Wales recovers from foot and mouth disease, other visitor attractions will benefit from the fact that families have money to spend, which they have not had to spend on visiting museums.

a fu yn ergyd drom i'n heconomi. Yr oeddwn am wneud fy rhan i hybu'r economi drwy ddenu ymwelwyr. Fodd bynnag, yn yr hirdymor, bydd angen inni ddenu pobl i'n hamgueddfeydd na fyddent yn ymweld â hwy fel arall. Dengys y dystiolaeth anecdotaidd hyd yma fod pobl nad ymwelasant â'n hamgueddfeydd erioed o'r blaen yn gwneud hynny yn awr ac y byddant yn mynd i arfer o wneud hynny.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: We are all pleased to hear the figures for the number of visitors to museums. That increase is important.

You referred to foot and mouth disease. Do you accept that, as a consequence of it, unfortunately, many tourism centres that offer educational attractions are suffering? If schools are afforded an opportunity to visit museums free of charge, they will not go to such visitor centres. Can you assist schools to enable them to visit centres where there are educational attractions, to support the tourism industry?

Jenny Randerson: Mae cynorthwyo ysgolion neu atyniadau ymwelwyr eraill yn faterion naill ai i Jane Davidson, y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, neu Mike German, y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd. Fodd bynnag, un o reolau sylfaenol economeg yw mai incwm cyfyngedig sydd gan y mwyafrif helaeth o bobl. Os nad oes rhaid iddynt wario'r incwm hwnnw ar ymweld ag un atyniad, gallant ei wario ar ymweld ag un arall. Gobeithiaf, a disgwyliaf, yn yr hirdymor, pan fydd Cymru wedi cael ei thraed dani wedi clwy'r traed a'r genau, y bydd atyniadau ymwelwyr eraill yn cael budd o'r ffaith fod gan deuluoedd arian i'w wario, nad ydynt wedi gorfod ei wario ar ymweld ag amgueddfeydd.

Comisiynau Ffilm Rhanbarthol Regional Film Commissions

Q2 Eleanor Burnham: What plans is the Minister considering in relation to the regional film commissions? (OAQ11462)

Jenny Randerson: The Welsh Development Agency and Sgrî, in partnership with the regional film commissions, are taking

C2 Eleanor Burnham: Pa gynlluniau y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu hystyried o ran comisiynau ffilm rhanbarthol? (OAQ11462)

Jenny Randerson: Mae Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a Sgrî, mewn partneriaeth â'r comisiynau ffilm rhanbarthol, yn datblygu

forward an initiative to restructure film commission work in Wales. That includes marketing Wales as a location for filming and assistance to film-makers when they are working here. It is proposed to establish a new Wales Screen Commission brand, which will include a national office located at Sgrîn, working together with regional offices.

Eleanor Burnham: Will you ensure that any new funding structures do not undermine the current excellent partnerships, particularly in north Wales?

Jenny Randerson: Sgrîn in north Wales is an excellent example of partnership, and it has worked well for a number of years. There is no intention for any new funding arrangements to undermine it. They are designed to shore it up.

Elin Jones: Yr wyf yn gwybod eich bod chi yn ymrwymedig i ddefnyddio'r we fyd eang i'w llawn potensial. Pa gynlluniau sydd gennych i ddefnyddio'r we ar gyfer gwerthu Cymru fel lleoliad ffilm?

Jenny Randerson: That is clearly a matter for Sgrîn, and it will be a matter of discussion between it and the Welsh Development Agency as part of the new funding processes.

menter i ailstrwythuro gwaith comisiynu ffilmiau yng Nghymru. Mae hynny yn cynnwys marchnata Cymru fel lleoliad ar gyfer ffilmio a chymorth i wneuthurwyr ffilmiau pan fyddant yn gweithio yma. Bwriedir sefydlu brand Comisiwn Sgrîn Cymru newydd, a fydd yn cynnwys swyddfa genedlaethol wedi ei lleoli yn Sgrîn, a fydd yn cydweithio â'r swyddfeydd rhanbarthol.

Eleanor Brunham: A wnewch chi sicrhau na fydd unrhyw strwythurau ariannu newydd yn tansilio'r partneriaethau ardderchog presennol, yn arbennig yng ngogledd Cymru?

Jenny Randerson: Mae Sgrîn yng ngogledd Cymru yn enghraifft wych o bartneriaeth, ac mae wedi gweithio'n dda am nifer o flynyddoedd. Nid oes unrhyw fwriad i drefniadau ariannu newydd danseilio'r bartneriaeth. Fe'u cynlluniwyd i'w chynnal.

Elin Jones: I know that you are committed to using the world wide web to its full potential. What plans do you have to use the web in order to sell Wales as a film location?

Jenny Randerson: Mae hynny yn amlwg yn fater i Sgrîn, a bydd yn fater i'w drafod gydag Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru fel rhan o'r broses ariannu newydd.

Gweithgareddau'r Comisiynau Ffilm Rhanbarthol yng Nghymru Activity of Regional Film Commissions in Wales

Q3 Kirsty Williams: What plans does the Minister have for the development of the activity of regional film commissions in Wales? (OAQ11447)

Jenny Randerson: I refer you to the answer that I have just given to Eleanor Burnham.

Kirsty Williams: The regional commission in mid Wales has an excellent track record in attracting investment to the area, generating jobs and income for local businesses. What actions will the Minister take to ensure the continued success of this much-valued commission in mid Wales?

Jenny Randerson: We have already started working on the new funding structure, as I indicated earlier. I will give you some more

C3 Kirsty Williams: Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Gweinidog i ddatblygu gweithgareddau'r comisiynau ffilm rhanbarthol yng Nghymru? (OAQ11447)

Jenny Randerson: Fe'ch cyfeiriai at yr ateb a roddais yn awr i Eleanor Burnham.

Kirsty Williams: Mae gan y comisiwn rhanbarthol yng nghanolbarth Cymru hanes ardderchog o ddenu buddsoddiad i'r ardal, gan greu swyddi ac incwm i fusnesau lleol. Pa gamau fydd y Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i sicrhau llwyddiant parhaus y comisiwn gwerthfawr hwn yng nghanolbarth Cymru?

Jenny Randerson: Yr ydym eisoes wedi dechrau gweithio ar y strwythur ariannu newydd, fel y nodais yn gynharach. Rhoddaf

details. A meeting was held on 4 April, attended by the WDA, Sgrîn and the British Film Commission. There is a commitment from all those involved to secure film commission activity for the future. In outline, the plan is that Sgrîn will be funded by the WDA as a central commission, allocating funds to regional offices. They, in turn, will be expected to attract match-funding support from local partners. In the past, the local partners have been local authorities, and I am anxious that we maintain the links with them. My intention is simply to try to find a way of filling the gap left by the fact that the commissions are no longer eligible for European regional development funding.

fwy o fanylion ichi. Cynhaliwyd cyfarfod ar 4 Ebrill, a fynychwyd gan WDA, Sgrîn a Chomisiwn Ffilm Prydain. Mae pob un ohonynt wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau gweithgareddau comisiynu ffilm ar gyfer y dyfodol. Yn fras, y cynllun yw yr ariennir Sgrîn gan y WDA fel comisiwn canolog, ac y bydd yntau yn dyrannu arian i swyddfeydd rhanbarthol. Disgwylir iddynt hwythau, yn eu tro, ddenu cymorth ariannol cyfatebol gan bartneriaid lleol. Yn y gorffennol, yr awdurdodau lleol oedd y partneriaid lleol, ac yr wyf yn awyddus ein bod yn cadw cysylltiad â hwy. Fy mwriad yn syml yw ceisio canfod ffordd o lenwi'r bwlch a adawyd gan y ffaith nad yw'r comisiynau bellach yn gymwys ar gyfer arian datblygu rhanbarthol Ewrop.

The Presiding Officer: Question 4 has been withdrawn.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd Cwestiwn 4 yn ôl.

Amgueddfeydd ac Orielau Cenedlaethol Cymru National Museums and Galleries of Wales

C5 Owen John Thomas: A wnaiff y Gweinidog gomisiynu ymchwil i ganfod yr effaith ar amgueddfeydd eraill yng Nghymru yn sgîl y penderfyniad i roi mynediad am ddim i safleoedd Amgueddfeydd ac Orielau Cenedlaethol Cymru? (OAQ11414)

Q5 Owen John Thomas: Will the Minister commission research to discover the effect on other museums in Wales resulting from granting free entry to the National Museums and Galleries of Wales sites? (OAQ11414)

Jenny Randerson: I believe that free entry to National Museum sites will have a beneficial effect on museums and heritage attractions across Wales. It will attract increased levels of tourism and also raise awareness and interest in heritage and cultural issues. However, museums—and all tourist attractions—are operating in exceptional and testing times because of the foot and mouth disease crisis, and in view of that, I do not consider that conducting research at the current time would be appropriate.

Jenny Randerson: Credaf y bydd mynediad am ddim i safleoedd yr Amgueddfa Genedlaethol yn fanteisiol i amgueddfeydd ac atyniadau treftadaeth ar draws Cymru. Bydd yn denu lefelau cynyddol o dwristiaeth ac yn codi ymwybyddiaeth a diddordeb mewn treftadaeth a diwylliant. Fodd bynnag, mae amgueddfeydd—a phob atyniad twristiaeth—yn gweithredu mewn cyfnod anghyffredin ac anodd oherwydd argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau, ac yng ngoleuni hynny, nid ystyriaf y byddai'n briodol cynnal ymchwiliad ar hyn o bryd.

Owen John Thomas: Mae rhai amgueddfeydd sydd yn perthyn i awdurdodau lleol yng nghymoedd y de, fel y ganolfan dreftadaeth yn Rhondda Cynon Taf a Chastell Cyfarthfa ym Merthyr Tudful, yn wynebu cystadleuaeth annheg oherwydd y penderfyniad i gynnig mynediad am ddim i'r Amgueddfa Genedlaethol. Mae rhai o'r rhain mewn ardaloedd sydd eisoes yn dioddef

Owen John Thomas: Some local authority museums in the south Wales valleys, such as the heritage centre in Rhondda Cynon Taff and Cyfarthfa Castle in Merthyr Tydfil, are facing unfair competition because of the decision to grant free entry to the National Museum. Some of these are in areas that are already suffering because of poverty. Will you bring pressure to bear on the rest of the

oherwydd tlodi. A geisiwch ddwyn pwysau ar weddill y Cabinet i sicrhau bod cymorth ar gael iddynt?

Jenny Randerson: I strongly contest your use of the words 'unfair competition'. It is up to local authorities whether they wish to make entry to their museums free. Local authorities are funded by us, to a large extent, and they decide how they wish to spend their money. It is a matter for them. I draw your attention to the excellent examples of local authority museums that provide free entry, which have existed for many years in Wales. In Newport and Swansea, for example, we have excellent examples of free museum services. No-one has ever complained about those in the past, and I find it amazing that you should be complaining about eight national museum sites throughout Wales offering free entry. You must accept that you cannot have it both ways.

Peter Law: Will the Minister agree that the popular and successful policy of free entry to museums in Wales was, in fact, not part of the partnership agreement, but was developed by the previous Labour administration, particularly by my good friend, Tom Middlehurst, whom I compliment? Will she therefore ask for the withdrawal of Liberal Democrat leaflets distributed in Cardiff that quote her as saying that this policy was introduced because of the Liberal Democrats? That is absolutely false.

Jenny Randerson: I am sure that you will acknowledge the fact that I am a Liberal Democrat, and that I am the Minister. When I became Minister, the policy intended for introduction, which I inherited, was for a charge of £1 per head. I was pleased to work with Edwina Hart to provide the money in advance of the policy being introduced, I believe, in England.

Cabinet to ensure that they can receive assistance?

Jenny Randerson: Heriaf eich defnydd o'r geiriau 'cystadleuaeth annheg'. Penderfyniad awdurdodau lleol yw pa un a ydynt am gynnig mynediad am ddim i'w hamgueddfeydd ai peidio. Ni sydd yn ariannu awdurdodau lleol i raddau helaeth, a hwy sydd i benderfynu sut i wario'u harian. Mater iddynt hwy ydyw. Tynnaf eich sylw at yr enghreifftiau gwych o amgueddfeydd awdurdodau lleol sydd yn cynnig mynediad am ddim, ac sydd wedi bodoli yng Nghymru ers blynyddoedd. Yng Nghasnewydd ac Abertawe, er enghraifft, mae gennym enghreifftiau gwych o wasanaethau amgueddfeydd am ddim. Nid oes neb wedi cwyno amdanynt yn y gorffennol, ac mae'n rhyfeddod i mi eich bod yn cwyno am wyth safle amgueddfa genedlaethol ledled Cymru sydd yn cynnig mynediad am ddim. Rhaid ichi dderbyn na allwch ei chael hi bob ffordd.

Peter Law: A gytuna'r Gweinidog nad oedd y polisi poblogaidd a llwyddiannus o fynediad am ddim i amgueddfeydd yng Nghymru yn rhan o'r cytundeb partneriaeth, mewn gwirionedd, ond y cafodd ei ddatblygu gan y weinyddiaeth Lafur flaenorol, yn arbennig gan fy nghyfaill, Tom Middlehurst, a rhoddaf glod iddo? A wnaiff hi yn felly ofyn am i daflenni'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a ddosbarthwyd yng Nghaerdydd gael eu tynnu yn ôl, oherwydd maent yn ei dyfynnu yn dweud y cyflwynwyd y polisi hwn oherwydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol? Mae hynny'n gelwydd noeth.

Jenny Randerson: Yr wyf yn sicr y cydnabyddwch y ffaith fy mod yn Democrat Rhyddfrydol ac mai fi yw'r Gweinidog. Pan ddeuthum yn Weinidog, y polisi y bwriadwyd ei gyflwyno, ac a etifeddais, oedd ar gyfer tâl o £1 yr un. Yr oeddwn yn falch o gydweithio gydag Edwina Hart i ddarparu arian cyn cyflwyno'r polisi, fe gredaf, yn Lloegr.

9:15 a.m.

**Tîm Hoci Iâ'r Cardiff Devils
Cardiff Devils Ice Hockey Team**

Q6 William Graham: Will the Minister make a statement concerning any discussions she has had concerning the Cardiff Devils ice hockey team? (OAQ11411)

C6 William Graham: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ynghylch unrhyw drafodaethau y mae wedi'u cael ynghylch tîm hoci iâ'r Cardiff Devils? (OAQ11411)

Jenny Randerson: The owner of the Cardiff Devils approached me because I am the constituency Assembly Member. However, it is important to note that it is a commercial venture, in which I have no powers to intervene in my ministerial capacity.

Jenny Rnderson: Daeth perchennog Cardiff Devils ataf oherwydd mai fi yw Aelod y Cynulliad dros yr etholaeth. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig nodi ei bod yn fenter fasnachol, lle nad oes gennyf unrhyw bŵer i ymyrryd yn fy swyddogaeth weinidogol.

Unfortunately, the operators went into voluntary liquidation and therefore, the Ice Hockey Superleague franchise has been removed. The Ice Hockey Superleague Board is hopeful that someone else will bid for the franchise. I am disappointed that the Cardiff Devils have lost their franchise for the Ice Hockey Superleague, as Cardiff has gained significantly from the Cardiff Devils' success, in terms of an increased profile and marketing.

Yn anffodus, penderfynodd y gweithredwyr ddiddymu'r cwmni'n wirfoddol, ac felly, diddymwyd masnachfaint yr Ice Hockey Superleague. Mae Bwrdd yr Ice Hockey Superleague yn gobeithio y bydd rhywun arall yn gwneud cais am y fasnachfaint. Yr wyf yn siomedig bod y Cardiff Devils wedi colli eu masnachfaint ar gyfer yr Ice Hockey Superleague, gan fod Caerdydd wedi bod ar ei hennill yn sylweddol yn sgîl llwyddiant y Cardiff Devils, yn nhermau cynyddu proffil a marchnata.

William Graham: Thank you for your answer, Minister. You will acknowledge that the sporting success of the Cardiff Devils has been a catalyst in attracting investment from north America and illustrates how sporting success can have a positive effect on the economic development of an area. Does the Minister not agree that she should redouble her efforts to ensure that Wales retains an ice hockey team?

William Graham: Diolch ichi am eich ateb, Weinidog. Cydnabyddwch fod llwyddiant y Cardiff Devils yn eu maes wedi bod yn gatalydd i ddenu buddsoddiadau o ogledd America a'i fod yn dangos sut y gall llwyddiant mewn chwaraeon gael effaith bositif ar ddatblygiad economaidd ardal. Oni chytuna'r Gweinidog y dylai ddwysáu ei hymdrechion i sicrhau bod Cymru yn cadw gafael ar dîm hoci iâ?

Jenny Randerson: It is not within my powers to intervene in a commercial organisation, but I believe that the Ice Hockey Superleague Board's chief executive is confident that Superleague ice hockey will continue in Cardiff. It is important to understand that the Cardiff Devils are owned by a commercial company, and the ice hockey rink is owned by Cardiff City and County Council. The arrangement must be between those parties.

Jenny Randerson: Nid yw o fewn fy mhwerau i ymyrryd mewn sefydliad masnachol, ond credaf fod prif weithredwr Bwrdd yr Ice Hockey Superleague yn hyderus y bydd hoci iâ Superleague yn parhau yng Nghaerdydd. Mae'n bwysig deall bod y Cardiff Devils yn eiddo i gwmni masnachol, a bod y ganolfan hoci iâ yn eiddo i Gyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd. Rhaid i'r trefniant fod rhwng y partïon hynny.

Alun Cairns: I am grateful for the Minister's response, in which she said that she cannot intervene in commercial activities. However, it is my understanding that rugby operates on

Alun Cairns: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am ymateb y Gweinidog, pan ddywedodd na all ymyrryd mewn gweithgareddau masnachol. Fodd bynnag, yn ôl a ddeallaf, mae rygbi, yn

a commercial basis, as does the Football Association. However, she was more than happy to offer subsidies for those sports.

Jenny Randerson: The owner company of the ice rink has gone into voluntary liquidation. It is a significantly different situation. Also, the county council has been involved in discussions and negotiations with the company and it would be inappropriate for me to intervene at this stage of the negotiations.

The Presiding Officer: Questions 7, 8 and 9 have been transferred for written answer. Question 10 has been withdrawn.

ogystal â'r Gymdeithas Bêl-droed, yn gweithredu ar sail fasnachol. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd yn fwy na bodlon cynnig cymorthdaliadau i'r chwaraeon hynny.

Jenny Randerson: Mae'r cwmni sydd yn berchen ar y ganolfan sglefrio wedi penderfynu diddymu'r cwmni'n wirfoddol. Mae hynny'n sefyllfa wahanol iawn. Hefyd, bu'r cyngor sir yn rhan o'r trafodaethau a'r negodiadau â'r cwmni a byddai'n amhriodol i mi ymyrryd yn y negodiadau ar hyn o bryd.

Y Llywydd: Trosglwyddwyd cwestiynau 7, 8 a 9 i'w hateb yn ysgrifenedig. Tynnwyd Cwestiwn 10 yn ôl.

Sefydliadau Garddwriaethol Cyhoeddus Public Horticultural Establishments

Q11 Peter Law: What support is the Minister giving to public horticultural establishments in Wales? (OAQ11471)

Jenny Randerson: The Horticultural Development Council, which supports the horticulture industry on a UK basis, is funded by a statutory levy on producers. No public money is provided from the National Assembly or from the Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food.

Peter Law: Does the Minister look favourably upon providing financial assistance to keep the tropical plant house open, on the former Garden Festival Wales site in Ebbw Vale? For lack of funding of around £20,000, it is in danger of closing and people in a deprived area will lose an excellent facility. It is enjoyed by many hundreds of people who visit the garden festival site every year. The sum of £20,000 is a small amount compared with the £25 million or so we will spend on a millennium concert centre in Cardiff. It is a small amount and I ask the Minister to be sympathetic in making money available.

Jenny Randerson: I regret that Peter appears not to have received my reply to his letter, which I signed some time ago. I am concerned that you have not received that

C11 Peter Law: Pa gefnogaeth mae'r Gweinidog yn ei rhoi i sefydliadau garddwriaethol cyhoeddus yng Nghymru? (OAQ11471)

Jenny Randerson: Ariennir y Cyngor Datblygu Garddwriaethol, sydd yn cefnogi'r diwydiant garddwriaethol yn y DU, gan dreth statudol ar gynhyrchwyr. Ni ddarperir arian cyhoeddus gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol na'r Weinyddiaeth Amaethyddiaeth, Pysgodfeydd a Bwyd.

Peter Law: A yw'r Gweinidog o blaid darparu cymorth ariannol i gadw'r tŷ planhigion trofannol blaenorol ar agor ar hen safle Gŵyl Gerddi Cymru yng Nglynebwy? Oherwydd diffyg ariannu o tua £20,000, efallai y bydd yn rhaid iddo gau, a bydd pobl mewn ardal ddifreintiedig yn colli cyfleuster ardderchog. Caiff ei fwynhau gan gannoedd o bobl sydd yn ymweld â safle'r ŵyl gerddi yn flynyddol. Mae'n ffigur bach o'i gymharu â'r amcangyfrif o £25 miliwn y byddwn yn ei wario ar ganolfan gyngherddau'r mileniwm yng Nghaerdydd. Mae'n swm bychan, a gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog fod yn gydymdeimladol gan sicrhau bod arian ar gael.

Jenny Randerson: Gresynnaf nad yw'n debyg y bu i Peter dderbyn fy ateb i'w lythyr, a arwyddais beth amser yn ôl. Yr wyf yn bryderus na dderbynioch yr ateb hwnnw ac af

reply and I will follow that up. In it, I made it clear that these issues are not my Cabinet responsibility. I imagine that they would fall between the portfolio responsibilities of Edwina Hart for local government, possibly Carwyn Jones for agriculture, given the link to MAFF and that of Sue Essex for the environment. It is not a matter for me.

ar ei drywydd. Ynndo, gwneuthum yn glir nad fy nghyfrifoldeb gweinidogol i yw'r materion hyn. Credaf y deuant rhwng cyfrifoldebau portffolio Edwina Hart ar gyfer llywodraeth leol, o bosibl Carwyn Jones ar gyfer amaethyddiaeth, o ystyried y cysylltiad â MAFF a phortffolio Sue Essex ar gyfer yr amgylchedd. Nid yw'n fater i mi.

Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru (Ailstrwythuro) **Arts Council of Wales (Restructuring)**

C12 David Lloyd: Pa gamau y bydd y Gweinidog yn eu cymryd tuag at sicrhau y bydd lleihad yn y lefel o fiwrocratiaeth yn sgîl ailstrwythuro Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru? (OAQ11486)

Q12 David Lloyd: What action will the Minister take towards ensuring a reduction in levels of bureaucracy following the restructuring of the Arts Council of Wales? (OAQ11486)

Jenny Randerson: My ministerial group on the restructuring of the Arts Council of Wales has considered the council's detailed action plan for change, which the council's members have approved. It is available on its website and I urge you to read it. I welcome the progress made so far on the action plan, which will transform the council into a leaner and more effective organisation in terms of staffing structure and the streamlining of grant procedures through schemes that will integrate lottery and grant-in-aid moneys and operational arrangements.

Jenny Randerson: Mae fy grŵp gweinidogol ar ailstrwythuro Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru wedi ystyried cynllun gwaith manwl y cyngor ar gyfer newid, a gymeradwywyd gan aelodau'r cyngor. Mae ar gael ar ei wefan a phwysaf arnoch i'w ddarllen. Croesawaf y cynnydd a wnaethpwyd ar y cynllun gwaith hyd yma, a fydd yn trawsffurfio'r cyngor yn sefydliad mwy effeithlon ac effeithiol o ran strwythur staffio a symleiddio trefniadau grant drwy gynlluniau a fydd yn integreiddio arian y loteri ac arian cymorth grant a threfniadau gweithredu.

David Lloyd: A oes gennych unrhyw gynlluniau i leihau'r nifer o bobl sydd yn eistedd ar y cyngor?

David Lloyd: Do you have any plans to reduce the number of people who sit on the council?

Jenny Randerson: Following recommendations from Anthony Everitt, the ministerial group's special adviser, I have had preliminary discussions on the appointments that are being made to the Arts Council of Wales with the Chair of the Culture Committee and Rosemary Butler, who are members of the sub-group of the Culture Committee that deals with appointments. I believe that a slimmer Arts Council of Wales would be a good thing. That matter will be discussed in detail at the next meeting of the Culture Committee.

Jenny Randerson: Yn dilyn argymhellion gan Anthony Everitt, ymgynghorydd arbennig y grŵp gweinidogol, cefais drafodaethau rhagarweiniol ar y penodiadau a wneir i Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru gyda Chadeirydd y Pwyllgor Diwylliant a Rosemary Butler sydd yn aelodau o is-grŵp y Pwyllgor Diwylliant sydd yn ymwneud â phenodiadau. Credaf y byddai'n beth da cael Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru mwy effeithlon. Trafodir y mater hwnnw yn fanylach yn y cyfarfod nesaf o'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant.

Jonathan Morgan: This so-called Arts Council of Wales seems to lumber from crisis to crisis. It has no leadership, no chief executive and no direction. Is it not time that

Jonathan Morgan: Mae'r Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru bondigrybwyll hwn fel pe bai'n baglu o un argyfwng i'r llall. Nid oes arweinyddiaeth ganddo, dim prif weithredwr

we abolished this useless organisation and replaced it with a cultural agency for Wales, one that can start delivering for the arts organisations in Wales, which have been badly let down by this organisation and the people running it?

Jenny Randerson: I will make two points. First, the current chair and acting chief executive of the council would be grossly insulted by your comment in view of their excellent work in attempting to carry out this restructuring process in difficult circumstances. You do the arts world a great disservice. Secondly, I am amazed by your question, Jonathan, since you were a member of the Post-16 Education and Training Committee that agreed to the Wallace report and to restructuring along the current lines. You signed up to that. You did not dissent from the reports on which the current restructuring is based.

a dim cyfeiriad. Onid yw'n bryd inni ddiddymu'r sefydliad di-werth hwn a'i ddisodli gydag asiantaeth ddiwylliannol i Gymru, un a all ddechrau gweithredu ar ran sefydliadau celfyddydol yng Nghymru, a siomwyd yn fawr gan y sefydliad hwn a'r bobl sydd yn ei reoli?

Jenny Randerson: Gwnaf ddau bwynt. Yn gyntaf, byddai'r cadeirydd a'r prif weithredwr presennol dros dro yn cael eu sarhau'n arw gan eich sylwadau yn wyneb eu gwaith ardderchog o geisio cynnal y broses ailstrwythuro hon mewn amgylchiadau anodd. Yr ydych yn gwendu tro gwael iawn â'r celfyddydau. Yn ail, fe'm syfrdanwyd gan eich cwestiwn, Jonathan, gan y buoch yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 a gytunodd i adroddiad Wallace ac ailstrwythuro yn ôl y drefn bresennol. Bu i chi gymeradwyo hynny. Nid anghytunoch â'r adroddiadau sydd yn sail i'r ailstrwythuro presennol.

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig Questions to the Minister for Rural Affairs

Gwariant y Comisiwn Coedwigaeth ar Ailblannu Forestry Commission Spending on Replanting

C1 Eleanor Burnham: Faint mae'r Comisiwn Coedwigaeth yn ei wario bob blwyddyn ar ailblannu ar ôl torri coed yn llwyr? (OAQ11468)

Q1 Eleanor Burnham: How much does the Forestry Commission spend each year on replanting after clear felling? (OAQ11468)

Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Carwyn Jones): Y llynedd, gwariodd y Comisiwn Coedwigaeth £2.2 miliwn ar ailblannu y coedwigoedd sydd o dan ei reolaeth yng Nghymru. Yr oedd hyn yn cynnwys y gost o baratoi'r ddaear, plannu ac edrych ar ffyrdd o hybu tyfiant naturiol yn yr ardaloedd hyn. Ailblannodd y Comisiwn tua 1,400 hectar, sydd yn cynnwys 150 hectar o dyfiant naturiol.

The Minister for Rural Affairs (Carwyn Jones): Last year, the Forestry Commission spent £2.2 million on replanting forests that are under its control in Wales. That included the cost of preparing the ground, planting and looking at ways of stimulating natural growth in these areas. The Commission replanted about 1,400 hectares, which includes 150 hectares of natural growth.

Eleanor Burnham: A ydych yn cytuno bod y broses hon yn rhy ddrud, o'i chymharu â phrynu coed aeddfed? Beth yr ydych yn bwriadu ei wneud ynglŷn â'r ddyled flynyddol o £6 miliwn?

Eleanor Burnham: Do you agree that this process is too expensive compared to felling mature trees? What do you intend to do about the annual debt of £6 million?

Carwyn Jones: Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau sydd â'r

Carwyn Jones: The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities is

cyfrifoldeb dros y mater hwn. Trafodwyd y mater gyda Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig a chyda'n cymdogaion yng ngwledydd eraill y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae paratodau ar y gweill i glirio'r ddyled.

Alun Cairns: Is the Minister concerned that 80 per cent of timber is imported into Wales? It is difficult to access the trees in Wales. However, we must make use of the timber that is grown here. What plans do you have to discuss this matter with the Minister for Environment to ensure appropriate access and communication links to these areas?

Carwyn Jones: That is a matter for those who grow timber. We must not only consider the Forestry Commission but also private growers who are assisted by a grant system for timber growers in Wales. The nature of timber growing is such that it is not always possible to have access to the timber. There are hills, upland areas and areas where it is not possible to create access. The problem with importing timber is that other countries can produce it at a much lower price, regardless of currency fluctuation, because they have larger stocks and their industries benefit from the state of their economies and the skills of their growers. However, we will do everything to encourage the use of homegrown timber. Wales's timber industry employs nearly 4,000 people and contributes £400 million to the economy every year. It is important, therefore, that we find new and innovative ways to encourage the use of Welsh timber.

9:25 a.m.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Soniwch am geisio creu gwerth ychwanegol ar gyfer coed o Gymru. A ydych wedi trafod gyda'r Comisiwn Coedwigaeth y posibilrwydd o blannu mwy o goed caled fel bod cyfle i gael gwerth ychwanegol o'r plannu hwnnw?

Carwyn Jones: Mae tua 10 i 15 y cant o dyfiant coed newydd ar dir y Comisiwn Coedwigaeth, gan gynnwys coed caled. Mae Coed Cymru yn ystyried ffyrdd o farchnata coed caled, sef coed naturiol Cymru. Mae wedi hybu a chefnogi cynllun o'r enw Welsh

responsible for this matter. The matter has been discussed with the UK Government and with our neighbours in the other UK countries. Preparations are in hand to clear the debt.

Alun Cairns: A yw'r Gweinidog yn bryderus bod 80 y cant o goed yn cael ei fewnforio i Gymru? Mae'n anodd cael mynediad at goed yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i ni ddefnyddio'r coed a dyfir yma. Pa gynlluniau sydd gennych i drafod y mater hwn â'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd er mwyn sicrhau mynediad a chysylltiadau cyfathrebu priodol i'r ardaloedd hyn?

Carwyn Jones: Mae hynny'n fater i'r sawl sydd yn tyfu coed. Rhaid i ni ystyried nid yn unig y Comisiwn Coedwigaeth ond hefyd y tyfwyr coed preifat sydd yn cael cymorth system grantiau ar gyfer tyfwyr coed yng Nghymru. Golyga'r dulliau o dyfu coed nad yw bob amser yn bosibl cael mynediad at y coed. Ceir bryniau, ardaloedd ucheldir ac ardaloedd lle nad yw'n bosibl creu mynediad. Y broblem gyda mewnforio coed yw bod gwledydd eraill yn gallu ei gynhyrchu am bris llawer llai, beth bynnag fo'r amrywiaeth yn yr arian cyfred, gan fod ganddynt stociau mwy ac mae eu diwydiannau yn elwa ar gyflwr eu heconomiâu a sgiliau eu tyfwyr. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn gwneud popeth i annog y defnydd o goed a dyfir gartref. Mae diwydiant coed Cymru yn cyflogi bron i 4,000 o bobl ac mae'n cyfrannu £400 miliwn i'r economi bob blwyddyn. Felly, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn canfod ffyrdd newydd a dyfeisgar i annog y defnydd o goed Cymru.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: You mention attempting to create added value for Welsh wood. Have you discussed with the Forestry Commission the possibility of planting more hardwood so that there is an opportunity to gain added value from that planting?

Carwyn Jones: About 10 to 15 per cent of new tree growth is on Forestry Commission land, including hardwood. Coed Cymru is considering ways of marketing hardwood, which is the natural wood of Wales. It has promoted and supported a scheme called

Angle, sydd yn ceisio dod o hyd i farchnadoedd newydd ar gyfer coed caled a sicrhau bod modd i'r rheini sydd yn tyfu coed caled gael mynediad i'r farchnad drwy ddefnyddio'r coed i greu celfi.

Welsh Angle, which attempts to find new markets for hardwood and ensure that those who grow hardwood can access the market by using the timber to create furniture.

Astudiaethau Penodol (Safleoedd Profi Cnydau a Addaswyd yn Enetig) **Site-specific Studies (GM Trial Sites)**

Q2 Richard Edwards: Were any site-specific studies undertaken prior to the decision to designate trial sites for genetically modified crops at Mathry, Pembrokeshire? (OAQ11417)

C2 Richard Edwards: A wnaethpwyd unrhyw astudiaethau penodol cyn penderfynu dynodi safleoedd ym Mathri, Sir Benfro, yn rhai ar gyfer profi cnydau a addaswyd yn enetig? (OAQ11417)

Carwyn Jones: The proposed farm-scale evaluations at Mathry have been suspended. That is a victory for the people of Pembrokeshire, including their representatives. It is a good outcome, reflecting the depth of local concern and the principled objection to the trials. Selection of the trial sites is a matter for the scientific steering committee, which includes experts from academia and conservation organisations. I am not aware that any site-specific studies were undertaken at Mathry.

Carwyn Jones: Mae'r asesiadau ar raddfa fferm arfaethedig ym Mathri wedi eu gohirio. Mae hynny'n fuddugoliaeth i bobl Sir Benfro, gan gynnwys eu cynrychiolwyr. Mae'n ganlyniad da, sydd yn adlewyrchu dwyster y pryder lleol a'r gwrthwynebiad egwyddorol i'r profion. Mae dethol safleoedd profion yn fater i'r pwyllgor llywio gwyddonol, sydd yn cynnwys arbenigwyr o'r byd academiaidd a sefydliadau cadwraeth. Nid wyf yn ymwybodol bod unrhyw astudiaethau penodol wedi eu cynnal ym Mathri.

Richard Edwards: Thank you for those comments about the people of Pembrokeshire. It is difficult to see how the precautionary principle is being applied when blanket approval is given to sites in the field trials programme without site-specific studies. Yet, as you know, the Advisory Committee on Releases to the Environment has banged on about the lack of site-specific research for Wales as a reason for not stopping the trials. It seems to be a catch-22 situation. Can you charge the Countryside Council for Wales and the Environment Agency Wales, which are Assembly sponsored public bodies, with conducting such studies? I would particularly suggest that that is done in Sealand, where planting has gone ahead for the second year. Tests should be conducted on honey and pollen collected from the area, and on soil biology, to see whether genetic pollution has occurred.

Richard Edwards: Diolch am y sylwadau hynny ynglŷn â phobl Sir Benfro. Mae'n anodd gweld ym mha fodd y cymhwysir yr egwyddor rhagofal pan roddir cymeradwyaeth gyffredinol i safleoedd yn y rhaglen profion maes heb astudiaethau penodol. Eto, fel y gwyddoch, mae'r Pwyllgor Ymgynghorol ar Ollyngiadau i'r Amgylchedd wedi rhygnu ymlaen ynglŷn â'r diffyg ymchwil penodol yng Nghymru fel rheswm dros beidio ag atal y profion. Ymddengys ei bod yn sefyllfa lle nad allwn ennill. A allwch roi'r cyfrifoldeb ar Gyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru ac Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd Cymru, sydd yn gyrrff cyhoeddus a noddur gan y Cynulliad, i gynnal astudiaethau o'r fath? Byddwn yn awgrymu'n arbennig bod hynny'n cael ei wneud yn Sealand, lle yr aethpwyd ymlaen â'r plannu am yr ail flwyddyn. Dylid cynnal profion ar fêl a phail a gasglwyd o'r ardal, ac ar fioleg pridd, er mwyn canfod a yw llygredd genetig wedi digwydd.

Carwyn Jones: We will continue to press all these matters. As I mentioned when I made a

Carwyn Jones: Byddwn yn parhau i bwysleisio'r holl faterion hyn. Fel y soniais

statement on this some weeks ago in the Assembly, we will consider commissioning studies into the topography and wind conditions in parts of Wales to better understand the difficulties of planting GM crops in those areas. If a site-specific study is needed at Mathry, in particular, or other parts of Pembrokeshire, we will consider that. We intend to be proactive rather than sit back and wait to see what the European Commission does. We intend to ensure that we have studies of our own, which we will commission.

Cynog Dafis: Yr ydym wedi ennill blwyddyn o ras yn dilyn penderfyniad y ffermwr perthnasol i beidio â mynd ymlaen â'r profion. Croesawaf yr hyn a ddywedwch, ond hoffwn ofyn i chi am eich trefniadau ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf. A wnewch warantu y byddwch yn ystyried pob tystiolaeth wyddonol? Derbyniosoch dystiolaeth a barn wyddonol gan bobl annibynnol yn ystod yr wythnosau diwethaf. A fyddwch yn rhoi ystyriaeth i farn wyddonol felly, yn ogystal â barn ACRE, ac yn y blaen, wrth benderfynu a ydych yn fodlon defnyddio gwaharddeb i rwystro cynydu o'r fath rhag cael eu plannu y flwyddyn nesaf?

Carwyn Jones: Mae nifer o bobl wedi mynegi barn i'r Cynulliad ac i swyddogion. Mae'n bwysig sylweddoli ein bod yn gweithio o dan strwythur cyfreithiol. Ar ganiatâd rhan C y system sydd yn rheoli cynydu a addaswyd yn enetig, gall unrhyw un blannu unrhyw fath o gnydau a addaswyd yn enetig yn unrhyw ran o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd os cânt ganiatâd i wneud hynny mewn un wlad.

Yr unig ffordd i atal hynny fyddai drwy foratoriwm, fel sydd gennym yn y Deyrnas Unedig, a chynnal treialon. Mae hynny'n profi nad yw Llywodraeth San Steffan am weld cynydu GM yn tyfu ar draws y Deyrnas Unedig heb fod treialon wedi eu cynnal yn gyntaf. Mae hynny'n bwynt pwysig i'w gofio. Dylid cofio hefyd mai dim ond tystiolaeth berthnasol y byddaf yn ei hystyried ac yna'n ei chyflwyno i'r Undeb Ewropeaidd. Cawsom ddarnau o dystiolaeth a oedd yn ddiddorol a phwysig, ond nad oeddent yn berthnasol i'r pwynt hwn.

wrth wneud datganiad ar hyn rai wythnosau'n ôl yn y Cynulliad, byddwn yn ystyried comisiynu astudiaethau ar dopograffi ac amodau gwynt mewn rhannau o Gymru er mwyn cael gwell dealltwriaeth o blannu cynydu a addaswyd yn enetig yn yr ardaloedd hynny. Os oes angen astudiaeth benodol ym Mathri, yn arbennig, neu rannau eraill o Sir Benfro, byddwn yn ystyried hynny. Bwriadwn fod yn rhagweithiol yn hytrach nag aros i weld beth a wna'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd. Bwriadwn sicrhau bod gennym astudiaethau ein hunain, y byddwn yn eu comisiynu.

Cynog Dafis: We have been given a year's grace following the decision of the relevant farmer not to proceed with the tests. I welcome what you say, but I would like to ask you about your arrangements for next year. Will you guarantee that you will consider all the scientific evidence? You received scientific evidence and opinion from independent people during the past few weeks. Will you take such scientific opinions into consideration, as well as the opinion of ACRE, and so on, in deciding whether you are willing to use an injunction to prevent the planting of such crops next year?

Carwyn Jones: A number of people have expressed an opinion to the Assembly and to officials. It is important to realise that we are working under a legal structure. On the part C permissions of the system that control GM crops, anyone can plant any type of GM crop in any part of the European Union if they are given permission to do so in one country.

The only way to prevent that would be by means of a moratorium, as we have in the United Kingdom, and by conducting trials. That proves that the Westminster Government does not wish to see GM crops grown throughout the United Kingdom without conducting trials first. That is an important point to remember. It should also be remembered that I will be considering only relevant evidence, which I will then present to the European Union. We have received pieces of evidence which were interesting and important, but which were not

relevant to this point.

Ailstrwythuro'r Diwydiant Ffermio Restructuring the Farming Industry

C3 Elin Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar unrhyw drafodaethau y mae wedi'u cael gyda'r Weinyddiaeth Amaethyddiaeth, Pysgodfeydd a Bwyd ynglŷn ag ailstrwythuro'r diwydiant ffermio yng Nghymru? (OAQ11497)

Carwyn Jones: Ddydd Mawrth, cyfarfûm â Gweinidogion y Deyrnas Unedig sydd â chyfrifoldeb am amaeth a materion gwledig. Mae cynlluniau ar lefel Brydeinig yn cael eu hystyried, ond mae'n bwysig ein bod yn awgrymu ffyrdd o ddatrys y broblem yng Nghymru. Dyna pam y soniais wrth y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig ddoe ynglŷn â beth sydd yn digwydd o ran y grŵp Dyfodol Ffermio, er mwyn i'r aelodau baratoi adroddiad ar opsiynau'r diwydiant ffermio yng Nghymru ar gyfer y dyfodol a'r cyfeiriad y dylai'r diwydiant ei ddilyn yn ystod y blynyddoedd nesaf. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn manteisio ar y cyfle sydd gennym i gyfrannu ar lefel Brydeinig, a hefyd ystyried y problemau ar lefel Gymreig er mwyn darganfod ffyrdd o'u datrys.

Elin Jones: A ydych wedi cynnal trafodaethau gyda MAFF ynglŷn ag ailstrwythuro'r weinyddiaeth? Pe bai hynny'n digwydd, a gredwch y byddai'n gyfle i sicrhau diffiniad cliriach a mwy rhesymol o ddsbarthiad pwerau rhwng San Steffan a'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol o ran amaethyddiaeth a physgodfeydd?

Carwyn Jones: O ran dosbarthiad pwerau, yr wyf bob amser yn barod i wrando ar unrhyw awgrymiadau ar sut i wella sefyllfa pysgodfeydd, lles anifeiliaid ac ati. Mae digwyddiadau'r wythnosau diwethaf wedi amlygu pethau y dylid eu trafod o ran pwerau ychwanegol i Gymru. Mae sefydlu adran i fod yn gyfrifol am faterion gwledig yn y Deyrnas Unedig yn fater i'r Prif Weinidog, a bydd yn rhaid inni aros i weld beth fydd yn digwydd wedi'r etholiad cyffredinol.

Peter Rogers: Any restructuring of farming

Q3 Elin Jones: Will the Minister make a statement on any discussions he has had with the Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food to restructure the farming industry in Wales? (OAQ11497)

Carwyn Jones: On Tuesday, I met with the United Kingdom Ministers with responsibility for agriculture and rural affairs. Plans at a British level are under consideration, but it is important that we suggest ways of resolving the problem in Wales. That is why I told the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee yesterday what is happening with the Farming Futures group, so that the members can prepare a report on the Welsh agriculture industry's options for the future and the direction that the industry should take during the next few years. It is important that we take advantage of the opportunity that we have to contribute at a British level, and also to consider the problems at a Welsh level in order to find ways of resolving them.

Elin Jones: Have you had discussions with MAFF on restructuring the ministry? Were that to happen, do you believe that it would be an opportunity to establish a clearer and more reasonable definition of the distribution of powers between Westminster and the National Assembly in terms of agriculture and fisheries?

Carwyn Jones: In terms of the distribution of powers, I am always prepared to listen to any suggestions on how to improve the situation regarding fisheries, animal welfare and so on. The events of recent weeks have highlighted certain things that need to be discussed in terms of additional powers for Wales. The establishment of a department with responsibility for rural affairs in the United Kingdom is a matter for the Prime Minister, and we will have to wait to see what happens after the general election.

Peter Rogers: Rhaid i unrhyw broses

in Wales must be complemented by organisational efficiency in the Assembly's Agriculture Department. We have had two problems in Wales in terms of payments, with the suckler cow premium scheme and compensation payments for animals slaughtered as a result of foot and mouth disease. Immaterial to what you said yesterday about problems in the Caernarfon divisional office with processing movement licences—

The Presiding Officer: Order. This question is not about processing licences, it is about the restructuring of the agriculture industry.

Peter Rogers: Have you discussed plans to prevent this from happening in future with MAFF?

Carwyn Jones: The running of divisional offices is a matter for the National Assembly, and a matter for discussion with MAFF. Problems with compensation payments and so on are a matter for MAFF, and we are in regular contact with the ministry to ensure that people are paid as quickly as possible.

ailstrwythuro ffermio yng Nghymru fynd law yn llaw ag effeithlonrwydd trefniadol yn Adran Amaethyddiaeth y Cynulliad. Cawsom ddwy broblem yng Nghymru o ran taliadau, gyda'r cynllun premiwm gwartheg sugno a thaliadau iawndal ar gyfer anifeiliaid a laddwyd o ganlyniad i glwy'r traed a'r genau. Er yr hyn a ddywedasoch ddoe ynglŷn â phroblemau yn swyddfa adrannol Caernarfon gyda phrosesu trwyddedau symud—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid yw'r cwestiwn hwn yn ymwneud â phrosesu trwyddedau, mae'n ymwneud ag ailstrwythuro'r diwydiant amaethyddiaeth.

Peter Rogers: A ydych wedi trafod cynlluniau gyda MAFF i atal hyn rhag digwydd yn y dyfodol?

Carwyn Jones: Mae rhedeg swyddfeydd adrannol yn fater i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ac yn fater i'w drafod â MAFF. Mae problemau gyda thaliadau iawndal ac yn y blaen yn fater i MAFF, ac yr ydym mewn cysylltiad rheolaidd â'r weinyddiaeth er mwyn sicrhau bod pobl yn cael eu talu cyn gynted â phosibl.

Profi Cnydau a Addaswyd yn Enetig yng Nghymru GM Crop Trials in Wales

Q4 Janet Ryder: What discussions has the Minister had with the European Commission regarding trials of genetically modified crops in Wales? (OAQ11500)

Carwyn Jones: I have not yet discussed GM crop trials with the European Commission. The Assembly is continuing with its action to issue prohibition notices under Section 110 of the Environmental Protection Act 1990, to place separation distances between GM and organic crops on a statutory basis. As I have already indicated, this will trigger an Article 16 notification under the European Directive 90/220 and give the National Assembly an opportunity to take its legitimate and principled concerns over the lack of protection for the organic sector directly to the European Commission. When the Article 16 notification has been made, that will be the time to start intense discussion with the European Commission.

C4 Janet Ryder: Pa drafodaethau a gafodd y Gweinidog gyda'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd ynghylch profi cnydau a addaswyd yn enetig yng Nghymru? (OAQ11500)

Carwyn Jones: Nid wyf wedi trafod profi cnydau a addaswyd yn enetig gyda'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd hyd yma. Mae'r Cynulliad yn parhau â'i gamau gweithredu er mwyn cyhoeddi hysbysiadau gwahardd o dan Adran 110 Deddf Diogelu'r Amgylchedd 1990, er mwyn gosod pellteroedd gwahanu rhwng cnydau a addaswyd yn enetig a chnydau organig ar sail statudol. Fel y dynodais eisoes, bydd hyn yn peri hysbysiad Erthygl 16 o dan Gyfarwyddeb Ewropeaidd 90/220 ac yn rhoi cyfle i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol fynd â'i bryderon cyfreithlon ac egwyddorol am y diffyg diogelwch ar gyfer y sector organig yn uniongyrchol i'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd. Yr amser i gychwyn trafodaethau dwys gyda'r Comisiwn

Ewropeaidd yw pan gyflwynir hysbysiad Erthygl 16.

Janet Ryder: Only one trial is being conducted in Wales, namely in Flintshire. In Committee yesterday, you confirmed that this ruling will apply to that trial. Have you, or will you hold discussions with the farmer in Flintshire and, if discussions are planned, what do you intend to ask?

9:35 a.m.

Carwyn Jones: Tom Middlehurst and myself will be meeting John Cottle, the farmer involved, this afternoon, and we will be putting to him the concerns both locally and nationally in Wales about GM crops. We will be asking him—I am sure that I can speak for Tom also—not to continue growing GM crops in view of the stated and settled view of the National Assembly and the views of people locally.

Tom Middlehurst: I congratulate the people of Pembrokeshire on their successful campaign, in an attempt to create a GM free Wales. I regret that the farmer in Flintshire has planted the maize crop. We must now face that issue locally. There are deep concerns, as Carwyn knows. What measures can we take, other than the pressure that we will exert on John Cottle today and that which the local community will exert on him, to introduce measures that will enable us to destroy that crop at the first opportunity so that we can proclaim that Wales is GM free?

Carwyn Jones: The people of Pembrokeshire are an example of what can be done when people have, as I said, principled objections, and those in a community who wish to do something that is against the wishes of the majority of people within that community listen to their voice. Tom and I will put these points to the farmer involved today, and I hope, although one can never be sure, that the farmer involved will understand the points made and will reconsider the further development of the crops on his land.

Janet Ryder: Dim ond un prawf a gynhelir yng Nghymru, sef yn Sir y Fflint. Yn y Pwyllgor ddoe, cadarnhach y bydd y dyfarniad hwn yn gymwys i'r prawf hwnnw. A ydych, neu a fyddwch yn cynnal trafodaethau â'r ffermwr yn Sir y Fflint ac, os oes trafodaethau wedi'u trefnu, pa gwestiynau y bwriadwch eu gofyn?

Carwyn Jones: Bydd Tom Middlehurst a minnau yn cyfarfod â John Cottle, y ffermwr dan sylw, y prynhawn yma, a byddwn yn cyflwyno iddo'r pryderon lleol a chenedlaethol yng Nghymru ynglŷn â chnydau a addaswyd yn enetig. Byddwn yn gofyn iddo—ac yr wyf yn sicr y gallaf siarad ar ran Tom hefyd—i roi'r gorau i dyfu cnydau a addaswyd yn enetig yng ngoleuni barn ddatganedig a sefydledig y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a barn pobl leol.

Tom Middlehurst: Llongyfarchaf bobl Sir Benfro ar eu hymgyrch lwyddiannus, mewn ymgais i greu Cymru sydd yn rhydd o gnydau a addaswyd yn enetig. Gresynnaf fod y ffermwr yn Sir y Fflint wedi plannu'r cnwd indrawn. Rhaid inni wynebu'r mater hwnnw'n lleol bellach. Mae pryderon dwys, fel y gŵyr Carwyn. Pa fesurau y gallwn eu cymryd, ar wahân i'r pwysau y byddwn yn ei roi ar John Cottle heddiw ac y bydd y gymuned leol yn ei roi arno, i gyflwyno mesurau a fydd yn ein galluogi i ddinistrio'r cnwd hwnnw ar y cyfle cyntaf fel ein bod yn gallu datgan bod Cymru yn rhydd o gnydau a addaswyd yn enetig?

Carwyn Jones: Mae pobl Sir Benfro yn enghraifft o'r hyn y gellir ei gyflawni pan fo pobl, fel y dywedais, yn gwrthwynebu o ran egwyddor, a phan fo'r rheini yn y gymuned sydd yn dymuno gwneud rhywbeth sydd yn groes i ddymuniadau'r mwyafrif o'r bobl o fewn y gymuned yn gwrando ar eu barn. Bydd Tom a minnau yn cyflwyno'r pwyntiau hyn i'r ffermwr dan sylw heddiw, a gobeithiaf, er na allaf fod yn sicr, y bydd y ffermwr dan sylw yn deall y pwyntiau a wneir ac yn ailystyried datblygu rhagor o gnydau ar ei dir.

Glyn Davies: What is your view of the propriety of a Government where a Minister, namely Michael Meacher, seeks to give the impression that the Government does not want to see GM crop trials in Wales, while at the same time the Cabinet Minister responsible, namely Mo Mowlam, is writing to the growers giving them encouragement and support for what they are doing?

The Presiding Officer: Order. The Minister for Rural Affairs of the National Assembly for Wales has no responsibility whatsoever for members of the UK Cabinet.

David Melding: Does it not show?

Carwyn Jones: I am asked 'does it not show?' If the Conservatives wish to see the re-election of a Labour Government, to electioneer in the same way that they have—

The Presiding Officer: Order. We should move on to question 5.

Glyn Davies: Beth yw eich barn ynglŷn â phriodolrwydd Llywodraeth pan fo Gweinidog, sef Michael Meacher, yn ceisio rhoi'r argraff nad yw'r Llywodraeth am weld profion cynydau a addaswyd yn enetig yng Nghymru, tra bo'r Gweinidog Cabinet sydd yn gyfrifol, sef Mo Mowlam, ar yr un pryd, yn ysgrifennu at y tyfwyr yn annog a chefnogi'r hyn y maent yn ei wneud?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid oes gan Weinidog dros Faterion Gwledig Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru unrhyw gyfrifoldeb dros aelodau o Gabinet y DU.

David Melding: Onid yw hynny'n amlwg?

Carwyn Jones: Gofynnir i mi 'onid yw hynny'n amlwg?' Os yw'r Ceidwadwyr am weld Llywodraeth Lafur yn cael ei hail-ethol, i ymgyrchu yn yr un modd ag y gwnaethant—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Dylem symud ymlaen i gwestiwn 5.

Lansio Cyswllt Ffermio Farming Connect

Q5 Ann Jones: Will the Minister make a statement on the launch of Farming Connect? (OAQ11436)

Carwyn Jones: It is too early to launch Farming Connect across Wales, given the need to maintain the highest biosecurity standards in order to combat foot and mouth disease. I believe that many farmers in areas not directly affected by the disease would be unwilling to allow consultants on-farm to undertake business development planning at present. I am keeping the situation closely under review and we are looking at introducing the service widely across Wales in the autumn. April was the original launch date, but because of the difficulties caused by foot and mouth disease, that was not possible. However, we are in the process of implementing farm business options reviews to assist those farmers that have had their livestock culled as a result of foot and mouth disease.

Ann Jones: Do you agree that Farming

C5 Ann Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar lansio Cyswllt Ffermio? (OAQ11436)

Carwyn Jones: Mae'n rhy gynnar i lansio Cyswllt Ffermio ar draws Cymru, o gofio'r angen i gynnal y safonau bioddiogelwch uchaf er mwyn mynd i'r afael â chlwy'r traed a'r genau. Nid wyf yn credu y byddai nifer o ffermwyr mewn ardaloedd nad effeithwyd yn uniongyrchol gan y clwyf yn fodlon caniatáu ymgynghorwyr ar y fferm er mwyn ymgymryd â chynllunio datblygu busnes ar hyn o bryd. Yr wyf yn cadw llygad barcud ar y sefyllfa ac yr ydym yn bwriadu cyflwyno'r gwasanaeth yn helaeth ar draws Cymru yn yr hydref. Y dyddiad lansio gwreiddiol oedd mis Ebrill, ond o ganlyniad i'r anawsterau a achoswyd gan glwy'r traed a'r genau, nid oedd hynny'n bosibl. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn y broses o weithredu adolygiadau opsiynau busnes fferm er mwyn cynorthwyo ffermwyr y cafodd eu da byw eu difa o ganlyniad i glwy'r traed a'r genau.

Ann Jones: A gytunwch y bydd Cyswllt

Connect will give us a chance to work in partnership to develop a more sustainable approach to agriculture and rural communities after the foot and mouth disease outbreak has abated?

Carwyn Jones: That is right. We all accept that farming must be restructured, and we must ensure that, in the coming years, it is restructured in the way that we want. There are many farmers who wish to have business advice, and it is only right that a system is put in place not only to provide them with on-farm business advice, but also with a grants system to assist them with any developments that they wish to put in place. This policy is envied in other parts of the UK.

William Graham: Farming Connect was intended to form part of the delivery mechanism for priority 5 of the Objective 1 programme. Will you confirm which elements of Farming Connect will come on-line so that farmers can obtain funding for development, which is crucial given the foot and mouth disease crisis?

Carwyn Jones: The situation is unchanged. Farming Connect will be delivered with Objective 1 funding. We have a delay of some months because of the foot and mouth disease crisis.

Rod Richards: Will the Deputy Prime Minister be invited to the launch of Farming Connect? Is the Minister aware that many of us were impressed by how the Deputy Prime Minister came to grips with farmers' concerns—particularly those who are under the yolk? [*Laughter.*]

Carwyn Jones: I cannot compete at the Olympic level of punning at which Rod Richards competes, but I would like to see John Prescott and Rod Richards together—I am sure that we would all pay to watch that. [*Laughter.*]

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Minister, for just about keeping in order.

Ffermio yn rhoi cyfle inni weithio mewn partneriaeth er mwyn datblygu ymagwedd fwy cynaliadwy tuag at amaethyddiaeth a chymunedau gwledig wedi i'r achosion o glwy'r traed a'r genau ddod i ben?

Carwyn Jones: Mae hynny'n gywir. Yr ydym oll yn derbyn bod rhaid ailstrwythuro ffermio, a rhaid inni sicrhau, yn y blynyddoedd i ddod, y caiff ei ailstrwythuro yn y ffordd y dymunwn. Mae nifer o ffermwyr yn dymuno cael cyngor busnes, ac mae'n briodol bod system yn ei lle i ddarparu nid yn unig gyngor busnes ar y fferm, ond hefyd system grantiau er mwyn eu cynorthwyo gydag unrhyw ddatblygiadau y dymunant eu cyflwyno. Mae'r polisi hwn yn destun cenfigen mewn rhannau eraill o'r DU.

William Graham: Bwriad Cyswllt Ffermio oedd ffurfio rhan o'r mecanwaith cyflwyno ar gyfer blaenoriaeth 5 rhaglen Amcan 1. A gadarnhewch pa elfennau o Cyswllt Ffermio a fydd yn mynd ar-lein fel y gall ffermwyr gael arian ar gyfer datblygu, sydd yn hanfodol o gofio'r argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau?

Carwyn Jones: Nid yw'r sefyllfa wedi newid. Bydd Cyswllt Ffermio yn cael ei gyflwyno gydag arian Amcan 1. Mae gennym gyfnod oedi o ychydig fisoedd oherwydd argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau.

Rod Richards: A wahoddir Dirprwy Brif Weinidog y DU i achlysur lansio Cyswllt Ffermio? A yw'r Gweinidog yn ymwybodol o'r argraff a grewyd ar nifer ohonom gan y modd yr aeth Dirprwy Brif Weinidog y DU i'r afael â phryderon ffermwyr—yn arbennig y rhai sydd o dan y lach? [*Chwerthin.*]

Carwyn Jones: Ni allaf gystadlu â gallu Rod Richards i ddefnyddio geiriau awgrymog, ond hoffwn weld John Prescott a Rod Richards gyda'i gilydd—yr wyf yn sicr y byddem i gyd yn talu i weld hynny. [*Chwerthin.*]

Y Llywydd: Diolch, Weinidog, am gadw mewn trefn, o drwch blewyn.

Pwynt o Drefn
Point of Order

Peter Law: Point of order. Earlier I asked the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language a question about the tropical plant house at Festival Park in Ebbw Vale. I was surprised when she told me that she had replied to me in a letter. I accept that she has, although I have not received the letter. That is fine, however, she said that it was not a matter for her. I am surprised by that answer and I ask you to consider it. That question was accepted as being in order by the Table Office. We all respect the Table Office's work greatly and we know what a good job it does for the Presiding Office. It was appropriate for her to answer that question, yet the Minister took evasive action and said that it had nothing to do with her. How can we be credible? When Members need help, they need to be able to ask questions and have them answered by Ministers. Otherwise it might appear to our constituents that we are wasting our time. I would be grateful if you would reflect on that.

The Presiding Officer: I am sure that your constituents would never think that you are wasting your time in the Assembly, or anywhere else. The question was in order, and it would not have appeared on the agenda had it not been. I am grateful for your remarks about the Table Office, which serves the whole of the Assembly. The Minister is responsible for the content of the answer. That is all I can say to help you.

David Davies: Further to that point of order, I have also been concerned that questions that I have tabled to Ministers have been transferred at the last minute for written, rather than oral answer. I share Peter's concerns: if his question was in order then the Minister should be required to answer it.

The Presiding Officer: Ministers cannot be required to answer questions. They can only be required to be present to answer them, and

Peter Law: Pwynt o drefn. Yn gynharach gofynnais gwestiwn i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg ynglŷn â'r tŷ planhigion trofannol ym Mharc yr Ŵyl yng Nglynebwy. Fe'm synnwyd pan ddywedodd wrthyf ei bod wedi ymateb imi drwy lythyr. Derbyniaf ei bod, er na dderbyniais y llythyr. Mae hynny'n iawn, fodd bynnag, dywedodd nad oedd yn fater iddi. Fe'm synnwyd gan yr ateb hwnnw a gofynnaf ichi ei ystyried. Derbyniwyd y cwestiwn hwnnw fel un a oedd mewn trefn gan y Swyddfa Gyflwyno. Yr ydym i gyd yn parchu gwaith y Swyddfa Gyflwyno yn fawr a gwyddom am y gwaith da a wna i Swyddfa'r Llywydd. Yr oedd yn briodol ei bod yn ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw, eto cymerodd y Gweinidog gamau i'w osgoi a dywedodd nad oedd a wnelo dim â hi. Sut y gallwn sicrhau hygredded? Pan fydd angen cymorth ar Aelodau, mae angen iddynt allu gofyn cwestiynau a chael atebion gan Weinidogion. Fel arall gallai ymddangos i'n hetholwyr fel ein bod yn gwastraffu'n hamser. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe byddech yn myfyrio ar hynny.

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf yn sicr na fyddai eich etholwyr byth yn meddwl eich bod yn gwastraffu eich amser yn y Cynulliad, nag yn unman arall. Yr oedd y cwestiwn mewn trefn, ac ni fyddai wedi ymddangos ar yr agenda oni fyddai. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich sylwadau ynglŷn â'r Swyddfa Gyflwyno, sydd yn gwasanaethu'r Cynulliad cyfan. Y Gweinidog sydd yn gyfrifol am gynnwys yr ateb. Dyna'r cyfan y gallaf ei ddweud i'ch cynorthwyo.

David Davies: Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, bùm innau hefyd yn bryderus bod y cwestiynau a gyflwynais i Weinidogion wedi eu trosglwyddo ar y munud olaf ar gyfer ateb ysgrifenedig, yn hytrach nag ateb llafar. Rhannaf bryderon Peter: os oedd ei gwestiwn mewn trefn dylai bod gofyn i'r Gweinidog ei ateb.

Y Llywydd: Ni ellir gorfodi Gweinidogion i ateb cwestiynau. Dim ond eu gorfodi i fod yn bresennol i'w hateb y gellir ei wneud, a

that happened today. The transfer of questions is a separate issue, which we have discussed in previous points of order. The transfer of questions occurs in line with a clear statement of ministerial responsibilities that has been made available to Members. Transfer is not a matter for the Table Office or myself. Members should ensure that their questions are as incisive and ingenious as possible, as I have indicated previously to your colleague, Alun Cairns.

Peter Law: Further to that, I am grateful for your comments. However, I cannot understand the why the Government Minister, with the staff that she has available, did not realise that this should be transferred to another Minister, if that is true. The question came to the Chamber today only to receive a futile comment from the Minister. I regret that.

The Presiding Officer: I do not think that I can take this further. I am sure that your constituents have noted your views.

digwyddodd hynny heddiw. Mae trosglwyddo cwestiynau yn fater ar wahân, a drafodwyd mewn pwyntiau o drefn blaenorol. Mae trosglwyddo cwestiynau yn digwydd yn unol â datganiad eglur o gyfrifoldebau gweinidogol a roddwyd i'r Aelodau. Nid yw trosglwyddo'n fater i'r Swyddfa Gyflwyno nac i minnau. Dylai'r Aelodau sicrhau bod eu cwestiynau mor dreiddgar a medrus â phosibl, fel y nodais yn flaenorol wrth eich cyd-Aelod, Alun Cairns.

Peter Law: Yn ychwanegol at hynny, yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich sylwadau. Fodd bynnag, ni ddeallaf pam na sylweddolodd Gweinidog y Llywodraeth, gyda'r staff sydd ar gael iddi, y dylid trosglwyddo hyn i Weinidog arall, os yw hynny'n wir. Daeth y cwestiwn i'r Siambr heddiw ac ni dderbyniodd ond sylw di-werth gan y Gweinidog. Gresynnaf at hynny.

Y Llywydd: Ni chredaf y gallaf fynd â hyn ymhellach. Yr wyf yn sicr i'ch etholwyr nodi eich sylwadau.

Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion Composite Motion: Approval of Orders

Y Llywydd: Cynigir y cynnig hwn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25 ac felly ni chynhelir dadl arno.

The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies): I propose that

the National Assembly, acting under Standing Order No 22.25,

approves the Crab Claws (Prohibition of Landing) (Revocation) (Wales) Order 2001 laid in the Table Office on 28 March 2001;

considers the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Crab Claws (Prohibition of Landing) (Revocation) (Wales) Order 2001, laid in the Table Office on 1 May 2001;

approves the Undersized Whiting (Revocation) (Wales) Order 2001 laid in the

The Presiding Officer: This motion is proposed under Standing Order No. 22.25 and is therefore not subject to debate.

Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Cynigiau fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25,

yn cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Crafangau Crancod (Gwahardd eu Glanio) (Diddymu) (Cymru) 2001 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Mawrth 2001;

yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw faterion sydd yn achosi pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Crafangau Crancod (Gwahardd eu Glanio) (Diddymu) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 1 Mai 2001;

yn cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Gwyniaid Rhy Fach (Diddymu) (Cymru) 2001 a osodwyd yn

Table Office on 28 March 2001; and *y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Mawrth 2001; ac*

considers the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Undersized Whiting (Revocation) (Wales) Order 2001, laid in the Table Office on 1 May 2001. *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw faterion sydd yn achosi pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Gwyniaid Rhy Fach (Diddymu) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 1 Mai 2001.*

Cynnig: O blaid 31, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion: For 31, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Elin
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion adopted.

Adolygu Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 6.3 a 6.26 Revision of Standing Orders Nos. 6.3 and 6.26

The Minister for Assembly Business Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Cynigiau fod
(Andrew Davies): I propose that

the National Assembly, acting under section 46(6) of the Government of Wales Act and Standing Order No. 34, *y Cynulliad, gan weithredu o dan adran 46(6) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 34,*

considers the report of the Business *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Busnes a*

Committee laid in the Table Office on 3 April 2001; and *osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 3 Ebrill 2001; ac*

approves the following revisions to Standing Orders: *yn cymeradwyo'r diwygiadau canlynol i'r Rheolau Sefydlog;*

Standing Order No. 6.3

1. Insert new sub-paragraph (iii):

(iii) the Assembly Secretary with particular responsibility for business to answer questions related to his or her responsibilities other than for business for oral answer at least once, and for at least 5 minutes, every four weeks that the Assembly meets in Plenary;

2. Renumber the remaining sub-paragraphs.

Standing Order No. 6.26

3. After 'to any Assembly Secretary' delete 'other than the Assembly Business Secretary'.

4. After 'any matters relating to' delete 'their' and insert 'his or her'.

5. After 'responsibilities' insert '(except that oral questions may be tabled to the Assembly Business Secretary only about matters relating to his or her responsibilities other than for business)'.

Y Llywydd: Atgoffaf yr Aelodau fod angen mwyafrif o ddwy ran o dair i ddiwygio Rheolau Sefydlog.

Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.3

1. Cynnwys is-baragraff (iii) newydd:

(iii) Ysgrifennydd y Cynulliad sydd â chyfrifoldeb penodol am fusnes i ateb cwestiynau yn ymwneud â'i gyfrifoldebau ef neu ei chyfrifoldebau hi, heblaw am fusnes, sydd i'w hateb ar lafar o leiaf unwaith, ac am o leiaf 5 munud, bob pedair wythnos pan fydd y Cynulliad yn cyfarfod mewn Cyfarfodydd Llawn;

2. Ailrifo'r is-baragraffau sydd yn weddill.

Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.26

3. Ar ôl 'i unrhyw un o Ysgrifenyddion y Cynulliad' dileu 'heblaw'r Trefnydd' .

4. Ar ôl 'unrhyw fater sydd yn ymwneud' dileu 'â'u cyfrifoldebau' a gosod 'â'i gyfrifoldebau ef neu ei chyfrifoldebau hi' yn ei le.

5. Ar ôl 'ei chyfrifoldebau hi' gosod '(gellir gofyn cwestiynau llafar i'r Trefnydd dim ond ar faterion yn ymwneud â'i gyfrifoldebau ef neu ei chyfrifoldebau hi heblaw am fusnes)'.

The Presiding Officer: I remind Members that a two-thirds majority is needed to revise Standing Orders.

Cynnig: O blaid 34, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion: For 34, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint

Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Elin
Law, Peter
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion adopted.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 9.44 a.m.
The Deputy First Minister took the Chair at 9.44 a.m.*

9:45 a.m.

Blaenraglenni Gwaith Strategol y Pwyllgorau Committees' Strategic Forward Work Programmes

The Minister for Assembly Business Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Cynigaf fod
(Andrew Davies): I propose that

the National Assembly, in accordance with Standing Order No. 9.9, notes the strategic forward work programmes and progress reports of the National Assembly's Subject Committees on Health and Social Services, Economic Development, Education and Lifelong Learning and Environment, Planning and Transport, which were e-mailed to Members on 10 May 2001.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The debate will begin with a five minute contribution from each Committee Chair before I open it to the floor.

Kirsty Williams: The report on the progress of the Health and Social Services Committee was approved by the Committee on 2 May

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 9.9, yn nodi blaen-raglenni gwaith strategol ac adroddiadau cynnydd Pwyllgorau Pwnc y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, Datblygu Economaidd, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, a'r Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth, a anfonwyd dros yr e-bost at yr Aelodau ar 10 Mai 2001.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Bydd y ddadl yn dechrau gyda chyfraniad pum munud gan Gadeirydd pob Pwyllgor cyn imi ei agor i'r llawr.

Kirsty Williams: Cymeradwywyd yr adroddiad ar gynnydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol gan y Pwyllgor

and laid on 4 May. This year has been another active and productive one for the Committee. There have been some changes to membership, with one or two individuals staying for just a few weeks, but I thank those who have served on the Committee this year for their contributions. The Committee has benefited from the professional experiences of many of its members and their willingness to apply their experiences more widely than their speciality.

The Committee has a wide remit and policies, service developments and health and social care continue to develop rapidly. We have not always been able to undertake the lengthy reviews that we would have liked, unlike, perhaps, other Committees. However, the Health and Social Services Committee is sustaining a strategic role in policy review and development and has been assisted in this work by several expert working groups and task and finish groups. It has been a privilege for all of us to work alongside those with first-hand experience in the health service, social care and voluntary sector, whose contributions have been invaluable.

During the year we completed our initial work on the appointment of a Children's Commissioner. Peter Clarke has taken up his post and I am delighted that the Children's Commissioner for Wales Act 2000 received Royal Assent last Friday.

The work that the Committee undertook last summer in examining the case for extending the categories of people entitled to free eye tests led to an eyecare package that will benefit people in our communities who are particularly vulnerable to eye diseases. Last December, we started our intensive work on the report of the Phillips inquiry into BSE, which we debated last week. It is sufficient to say that subsequent scientific reports underline the importance of our work and recommendations in respect of caring for the sufferers of vCJD and protecting the human food chain.

One of the most exciting issues that we considered is the development of

ar 2 Mai a'i osod gerbron ar 4 Mai. Bu eleni'n flwyddyn brysur a chynhyrchiol arall i'r Pwyllgor. Gwnaethpwyd rhai newidiadau i'r aelodaeth, gydag un neu ddau o unigolion yn aros am ychydig wythnosau yn unig, ond diolchaf i'r rheini a wasanaethodd ar y Pwyllgor eleni am eu cyfraniadau. Elwodd y Pwyllgor ar brofiadau proffesiynol nifer o'i aelodau a'u parodrwydd i ddefnyddio'u profiadau yn ehangach na'u harbenigedd.

Mae gan y Pwyllgor gylch gwaith eang ac mae polisiâu, datblygiadau yn y gwasanaeth ac iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yn parhau i ddatblygu'n gyflym. Nid ydym bob amser wedi gallu ymgymryd â'r adolygiadau hirfaith y byddem wedi dymuno eu gweld, yn wahanol, efallai, i Bwyllgorau eraill. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn cynnal rôl strategol wrth adolygu a datblygu polisi ac fe'i cynorthwywyd yn y gwaith hwn gan sawl gweithgor arbenigol a grwpiau gorchwyl a gorffen. Bu'n frain i bob un ohonom gydweithio ochr yn ochr â'r rheini â phrofiad yn rheng flaen y gwasanaeth iechyd, gofal cymdeithasol a'r sector gwirfoddol, yr oedd eu cyfraniadau yn amhrisiadwy.

Yn ystod y flwyddyn cwblhawyd ein gwaith cychwynnol o benodi Comisiynydd Plant. Dechreuodd Peter Clarke ar ei swydd ac yr wyf yn falch i Ddeddf Comisiynydd Plant Cymru 2000 dderbyn Cydsyniad Brenhinol ddydd Gwener diwethaf.

Arweiniodd y gwaith yr ymgymerodd y Pwyllgor ag ef yr haf diwethaf wrth archwilio'r dadleuon dros ymestyn y categorïau o bobl â'r hawl i brofion llygaid am ddim at becyn gofal llygaid a fydd o fudd i bobl yn ein cymunedau sydd mewn perygl arbennig o gael afiechydon llygaid. Fis Rhagfyr diwethaf, dechreuasom ar ein gwaith manwl ar adroddiad Phillips ar yr ymchwiliad i BSE, y cawsom ddadl arno yr wythnos diwethaf. Digon yw dweud bod adroddiadau gwyddonol dilynol yn tanlinellu pwysigrwydd ein gwaith a'r argymhellion yn ymwneud â gofalu am ddioddefwyr vCJD a diogelu'r gadwyn fwyd ddynol.

Un o'r materion mwyaf cyffrous a ystyriasom yw datblygiad telefeddyginiaeth.

telemedicine. At a time when the demands on the NHS are increasing rapidly, we should be prepared to grasp the nettle and develop telemedicine and teleworking which offer tremendous scope for improving services and access to those services. I am sure that the Committee will want to reconsider how, in Wales, we can best harness this new technology in the future.

We have continued to adopt a consensual approach to our work, and I thank the Minister for Health and Social Services, Jane Hutt, for the positive way in which she listens and responds to the Committee. However, it has not been cosy all the time. Committee members have had the opportunity to question and scrutinise the administration's performance in monthly sessions that focus on the Minister's report. The questioning is often robust and probing. We have also scrutinised some of the service providers. In April last year, we met with the Welsh Ambulance Service NHS Trust because of our concerns about its resources and performance. Since then, the service has improved its management structure and is performing better. Following our budget discussions, more money has been made available to the ambulance services, which was a priority for the Committee.

Similarly, we recently met with the Chair and senior management of Carmarthenshire NHS Trust, following the report of the Commission for Health Improvement. Yesterday, we met with them again to listen to the improvements that they hope to make. We are hoping to develop an even more robust way of scrutinising NHS bodies to which we provide considerable resources.

I commend the Committee's report to the Assembly and I record my thanks to all those with whom we have worked and who have provided evidence and discussed issues with us. I also thank the civil servants based at Cathays Park who have worked tirelessly to provide us with papers and information and I thank the Committee clerk and deputy clerk for their outstanding work and invaluable

Ar adeg pan fo'r galw ar yr NHS yn cynyddu'n gyflym, dylem fod yn barod i achub ar y cyfle a datblygu telefeddyginiaeth sydd yn cynnig cyfle gwych i wella gwasanaethau a mynediad i'r gwasanaethau hynny. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y Pwyllgor yn dymuno ailystyried sut y gallwn ni yng Nghymru fanteisio i'r eithaf ar y dechnoleg newydd hon yn y dyfodol.

Yr ydym wedi parhau i fabwysiadu ymagwedd gydsyniol at ein gwaith, a diolchaf i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, Jane Hutt, am y dull cadarnhaol y mae'n gwrando ar y Pwyllgor ac yn ymateb iddo. Fodd bynnag, ni fu'n gysurus bob amser. Cafodd aelodau'r Pwyllgor gyfle i gwestiynu a chraffu ar berfformiad y weinyddiaeth mewn sesiynau misol sydd yn canolbwyntio ar adroddiad y Gweinidog. Yn aml mae'r cwestiynu'n gadarn ac yn dreiddgar. Yr ydym hefyd wedi craffu ar rai o'r darparwyr gwasanaeth. Ym mis Ebrill y llynedd, cyfarfu'r Pwyllgor ag Ymddiriedolaeth Gwasanaeth Ambiwlans yr NHS yng Nghymru oherwydd ein pryderon am ei hadnoddau a'i pherfformiad. Ers hynny, mae'r gwasanaeth wedi gwella ei strwythur rheoli ac mae'n perfformio'n well. Yn sgîl ein trafodaeth ar y gyllideb, rhoddwyd mwy o arian i'r gwasanaethau ambiwlans, a oedd yn flaenoriaeth ar gyfer y Pwyllgor.

Yn yr un modd, cyfarfu'r Pwyllgor yn ddiweddar â Chadeirydd ac uwchreolwyr Ymddiriedolaeth NHS Sir Gaerfyrddin, yn sgîl adroddiad y Comisiwn Gwella Iechyd. Ddoe, cafwyd cyfarfod arall â hwy er mwyn gwrando ar y gwelliannau y gobeithiant eu gwneud. Gobeithiwn ddatblygu ffordd fwy trylwyr byth o graffu ar gyrff yr NHS yr ydym yn darparu adnoddau sylweddol iddynt.

Cymeradwyaf adroddiad y Pwyllgor i'r Cynulliad a chofnodaf fy niolch i bawb a gydweithiodd â ni ac a ddarparodd dystiolaeth inni ac a drafododd faterion â ni. Diolchaf hefyd i'r gweision sifil ym Mharc Cathays a weithiodd yn ddiflino er mwyn darparu papurau a gwybodaeth inni a diolchaf i glerc a dirprwy glerc y Pwyllgor am eu gwaith neilltuol a'u cefnogaeth

support to me as Chair.

Christine Gwyther: I stand here today with mixed emotions, mainly of sadness because Val had to stand down as Chair for health reasons, but also with great enthusiasm, not just for my role as Chair, although I enjoy that, but more importantly, for the Committee's future. I only have a few minutes and I will comment on the main issues only. The Committee's scrutiny task has been immense. Kirsty talked about robust scrutiny in Committees and long may it be so. That is certainly the case in the Economic Development Committee. We have scrutinised the wind-up of the Cardiff Bay Development Corporation, the European structural funds—and will continue to do so—Hyder, now Glas Cymru, including joint meetings with the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee.

I will talk later about some of the joint meetings that we have planned for the future. We have also begun to scrutinise the working up to, and the development and consultation for, the national economic development strategy. There has also been a substantial contribution to policy development. We have worked hard on the business support review, which is the first review that the Committee has undertaken. We know that it is a key area for economic development and is vital for Wales's wellbeing. Business has not been backwards in coming forwards with examples of agencies and individuals underperforming, often because of the delivery mechanism rather than any internal problems in their own agencies. There are two key recommendations for that. First, the establishment of an economic policy board and, secondly, the reorganisation of the support delivery into a business support gateway with a common portal. Much work will be done on that in the months ahead. The Minister for Economic Development is undertaking a consultation at present and it would be wrong to pre-empt the result of that consultation. However, the Committee wants to see the changes focusing business support and making it more effective.

amhrisiadwy i minnau fel Cadeirydd.

Christine Gwyther: Safaf yma heddiw gyda theimladau cymysg, ond yn bennaf yn drist oherwydd y bu'n rhaid i Val ildio'i swydd fel Cadeirydd oherwydd ei hiechyd, ond hefyd gyda llawer o frwdfrydedd, nid yn unig oherwydd fy rôl fel Cadeirydd, er fy mod yn mwynhau hynny, ond yn bwysicach ar gyfer dyfodol y Pwyllgor. Dim ond ychydig funudau sydd gennyf a dim ond ar y prif faterion y cynigiau sylwadau. Bu tasg archwilio'r Pwyllgor yn aruthrol. Siaradodd Kirsty am archwilio trylwyr mewn Pwyllgorau a hir y pery hynny. Dyna yn wir yw'r achos yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Yr ydym wedi archwilio diddymu Corfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd, y cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd—a byddwn yn parhau i wneud hynny—Hyder, sef Glas Cymru bellach, gan gynnwys cyfarfodydd ar y cyd â Phwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth.

Siaradaf yn ddiweddarach am rai o'r cydgyfarfodydd a gynlluniwyd gennym ar gyfer y dyfodol. Hefyd, dechreuasom graffu ar y gwaith paratoi ar gyfer y strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol, a'r gwaith datblygu ac ymgynghori a wnaethpwyd ar ei chyfer. Gwnaethpwyd cyfraniad sylweddol hefyd i ddatblygu polisi. Yr ydym wedi gweithio'n galed ar yr adolygiad cymorth i fusnes, sef yr adolygiad cyntaf yr ymgymerodd y Pwyllgor ag ef. Gwyddom fod hyn yn faes allweddol ar gyfer datblygu economaidd ac mae'n hanfodol ar gyfer lles Cymru. Nid oedd prinder busnesau ag enghreifftiau o asiantaethau ac unigolion sydd yn tangyflawni, yn aml oherwydd y drefn gyflwyno yn hytrach nag unrhyw broblemau mewnol yn eu hasiantaethau eu hunain. Ceir dau argymhelliad allweddol ar gyfer hynny. Yn gyntaf, sefydlu bwrdd polisi economaidd, ac yn ail, ad-drefnu'r cymorth a gyflwynir yn borth cymorth busnes gyda mynediad cyffredin. Bydd llawer o waith yn cael ei wneud ar hynny yn ystod y misoedd nesaf. Mae'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd yn ymgymryd ag ymgynghoriad ar hyn o bryd a byddai'n anghywir achub y blaen ar ganlyniad yr ymgynghoriad. Fodd bynnag, dymuniad y Pwyllgor yw gweld y newidiadau'n canolbwytio ar gymorth i fusnesau a'i wneud yn fwy effeithiol.

Like the Health and Social Services Committee, we have an open and inclusive approach. If you look back at some of the people to whom we have spoken in the last year it is a truly inclusive list. We have spoken to obvious partners such as the Welsh Development Agency, the Wales Tourist Board, TECs and now ELWa. We have spoken to representatives of local government, the Welsh Local Government Association, the City and County of Cardiff and a range of authority members who have come to the Committee for reasons other than that they are members of local authorities. We have also spoken to business organisations such as the Confederation of British Industry, the Institute of Directors, Chamber Wales and the Federation of Small Businesses. We also spoke to trade unions, and it is important that we continue to do so. The list of those with which we discuss includes the Wales Trade Union Congress and the Iron and Steel Trades Confederation in relation to Corus.

We have talked to bodies helping people into the labour market such as Chwarae Teg, Disability Wales and the Employment Service. Looking further afield, we have discussed business support with representatives from regional agencies in France, Belgium, Spain, Italy and Sweden. We have also met our opposite numbers from the Northern Ireland Assembly.

We have worked closely, and will continue to do so, with other Committees in the Assembly in joint meetings, as I said. Discussions are planned with the Culture Committee on the creative industries, and with the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee next week to discuss the Corus package and the higher education review. We are also planning a joint meeting with the Rural Affairs Committee, hopefully later on in this summer term or possibly, in the autumn, to discuss the place of tourism in our future rural economy. We are also starting work on our next review. It will be a massive piece of work on energy policy. We aim to involve a wide range of outside bodies and the clear focus will be on sustainability in

Fel y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, mae gennym agwedd agored a chynhwysol. Os edrychwch yn ôl ar rai o'r bobl yr ydym wedi siarad â hwy yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf mae'n rhestr wirioneddol gynhwysol. Siaradwyd â phartneriaid amlwg megis Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, Bwrdd Croeso Cymru, y Cynghorau Hyfforddi a Menter ac erbyn hyn ELWa. Siaradwyd â chynrychiolwyr llywodraeth leol, Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, Dinas a Sir Caerdydd ac amrywiaeth o aelodau awdurdodau a ddaeth at y Pwyllgor am resymau ar wahân i'r ffaith eu bod yn aelodau o awdurdodau lleol. Siaradwyd hefyd â sefydliadau busnes megis Cyd-ffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain, Sefydliad y Cyfarwyddwyr, Siambr Cymru a'r Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach. Yn ogystal, siaradwyd ag undebau llafur, ac mae'n bwysig inni barhau i wneud hynny. Mae'r rhestr o'r rheini y dymunwn drafod â hwy yn cynnwys Cyngres Undebau Llafur Cymru, a Chyddfederasiwn y Crefftiau Haearn a Dur mewn perthynas â Corus.

Siaradwyd â chyrff sydd yn helpu pobl i gael mynediad i'r farchnad lafur megis Chwarae Teg, Anabledd Cymru a'r Gwasanaeth Cyflogi. Gan ymestyn ein gorwelion, trafodwyd cymorth i fusnesau gyda chynrychiolwyr asiantaethau rhanbarthol yn Ffrainc, Gwlad Belg, Sbaen, yr Eidal a Sweden. Yr ydym hefyd wedi cyfarfod â'n cymheiriaid yng Nghynulliad Gogledd Iwerddon.

Cydweithiasom yn agos â Phwyllgorau eraill yn y Cynulliad mewn cyfarfodydd ar y cyd, a byddwn yn parhau i wneud hynny, fel y dywedais. Cynllunnir trafodaethau â'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant ynglŷn â'r diwydiannau creadigol, a chyda'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yr wythnos nesaf er mwyn trafod pecyn Corus a'r adolygiad addysg uwch. Yr ydym hefyd yn trefnu cyfarfod ar y cyd â'r Pwyllgor Materion Gwledig, yn nes ymlaen yn ystod tymor yr haf, gobeithio, neu o bosibl yn yr hydref, er mwyn trafod safle twristiaeth yn ein heconomi wledig yn y dyfodol. Yr ydym hefyd yn dechrau ar y gwaith ar gyfer ein hadolygiad nesaf. Bydd yn ddarn enfawr o waith ar bolisi ynni. Anelwn at gynnwys amrywiaeth eang o gyrff

line with the Assembly's central theme of sustainable development. The subject is critical for Wales and it is a real opportunity for Wales to lead the field. We will look at the best and worst practices across the world, although we will be virtual rather than actual travellers. It will be a busy year. I look forward to it with enthusiasm and I hope that the rest of the Committee does also. I would like to place on record my deepest thanks to Val for the engaging way that she has talked to the Committee and to business throughout Wales. It is important that I realise her contribution and try to build on it. I know that Val would want me to thank the Committee clerks for their dedication over the last 12 months. I am sure that the work will not let up for them, but I thank them in advance.

Cynog Dafis: Diolch am y cyfle i gyflwyno adroddiad cynnydd y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Mae'r adroddiad yn rhoi crynodeb o weithgareddau'r Pwyllgor o'i gyfarfod cyntaf ar 15 Tachwedd hyd at y cyfarfod diwethaf cyn toriad y Pasg ym mis Ebrill eleni. Yn dilyn yr aildrefnu yn Hydref 2000, etifeddodd y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes gyfrifoldebau'r ddau gyn-Bwyllgor Addysg, y Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16 a'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16.

9:55 a.m.

Ynghylch adolygu polisi, etifeddasom adolygiadau polisi gan y ddau gyn-Bwyllgor Addysg, sef: darpariaeth blynyddoedd cynnar i blant teirblwydd, technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu mewn addysg, a chyflenwi lleoedd mewn ysgolion ac addysg uwch. Cwblhaodd y Pwyllgor y gwaith ar ddau o'r adolygiadau polisi hyn yn gynharach eleni a chyflwynais yr adroddiadau ar ddarpariaeth blynyddoedd cynnar i blant teirblwydd a thechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu mewn addysg i Gyfarfodydd Llawn ym mis Mawrth.

Yr oedd yr adroddiadau yn cynnwys argymhellion pwysig ar gyfer y ffordd ymlaen ac mae'r Gweinidog erbyn hyn wedi mabwysiadu rhai ohonynt. Er enghraifft, mae

o'r tu allan a bydd ffocws clir ar gynaliadwyedd yn unol â thema ganolog y Cynulliad o ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Mae'r pwnc yn hollbwysig i Gymru ac mae'n gyfle gwirioneddol i Gymru arwain y ffordd. Edrychwn ar yr arferion gorau a gwaethaf ar draws y byd, er mai teithwyr rhithiol yn hytrach na theithwyr gwirioneddol y byddwn. Bydd yn flwyddyn brysur. Edrychaf ymlaen ati gyda brwdfrydedd fel y gobeithiaf y gwna gweddill y Pwyllgor hefyd. Hoffwn gofnodi fy niolch diffuant i Val am y ffordd gysylltiol y siaradodd â'r Pwyllgor a chyda busnesau ledled Cymru. Mae'n bwysig sylweddoli ei chyfraniad a cheisio adeiladu ar hynny. Gwn y byddai Val yn dymuno imi ddiolch i glercod y Pwyllgor am eu hymroddiad dros y 12 mis diwethaf. Yr wyf yn siŵr na fydd y gwaith yn peidio iddynt, ond diolchaf iddynt ymlaen llaw.

Cynog Dafis: Thank you for the opportunity to present the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee's progress report. The report gives a summary of the Committee's activities from its inaugural meeting on 15 November to the last meeting before the Easter recess in April of this year. Following the reorganisation in October 2000, the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee inherited the responsibilities of the two previous Education Committees, the Pre-16 Education Committee and the Post-16 Education and Training Committee.

On policy review, we inherited policy reviews from the two former Education Committees, namely: early years provision for three-year-olds, information and communication technology in education, and the supply of places in schools and higher education. The Committee concluded the work on two of these policy reviews earlier this year and I presented the reports on early years provision for three year olds and information and communications technology in education to Plenary in March.

The reports contained important recommendations for the way forward and the Minister has now adopted some of them. For example, she has established an early

hi wedi sefydlu panel ymgynghorol blynyddoedd cynnar i roi cyngor ar sut i ddatblygu a gweithredu'r strategaeth. Yn ogystal, mae wedi nodi y bydd adnoddau yn cael eu dyrannu er mwyn sefydlu panel ymgynghorol ar gyfer TGCh mewn ysgolion a grid cenedlaethol ar gyfer dysgu.

Hoffwn ddiolch i aelodau'r ddau Bwyllgor Addysg blaenorol am eu gwaith ar yr adolygiadau hyn ac, yn arbennig, ddiolch i Huw Lewis a Jonathan Morgan am eu gwaith ar yr adolygiad polisi TGCh. Bu gan Lorraine Barrett rôl bwysig yn y broses ar ddarpariaeth blynyddoedd cynnar.

Mae'r adolygiad ar gyflenwi lleoedd mewn ysgolion ar y gweill o hyd. Hyd yma yr ydym wedi derbyn cyflwyniadau llafar gan amryw sefydliadau gan gynnwys y Comisiwn Archwilio. Mae'r Comisiwn Archwilio wedi arolygu deg awdurdod addysg lleol yng Nghymru mewn perthynas â'r mater hwn. Cyflwynodd adroddiad ar ei ddarganfyddiadau i'r Pwyllgor yn ddiweddar. Bydd y Pwyllgor yn ystyried yr adroddiad hwn yn ei drafodaethau a chyflwynaf adroddiad tefynol y Pwyllgor i Gyfarfod Llawn yng Ngorffennaf.

Mae'r adolygiad o addysg uwch ar waith. Amcan yr adolygiad hwn yw dod o hyd i weledigaeth ar gyfer addysg uwch a'r ffordd y dylai ddiwallu anghenion Cymru a rhoi cychwyn ar y broses o ddatblygu strategaeth hirdymor i wneud y gorau posibl o gyfraniad y sector.

Mae'r Pwyllgor, ynghyd â'r ymgynghorydd arbenigol wedi nodi nifer o themâu allweddol y mae am eu harchwilio. Clywodd y Pwyllgor dystiolaeth gan academyddion, myfyrwyr ac eraill y tu mewn i Gymru a thu hwnt i Gymru ar nifer o'r themâu allweddol hyn. Yr ydym wedi datblygu system o ddeialog rhwng y Pwyllgor, tyst arbenigol a chynrychiolwyr o Addysg Uwch Cymru. Talaf deyrnged i Addysg Uwch Cymru am ei gydweithrediad yn yr adolygiad hwn.

Mae'r Pwyllgor yn cwrdd y prynhawn yma i glywed rhagor o dystiolaeth ar yr adolygiad hwn, gan gynnwys cyflwyniad gan yr Arglwydd Dearing, sef Cadeirydd Pwyllgor Ymchiliad y DU i Addysg Uwch a

years advisory panel to advise on how to develop and implement the strategy. Also, she has indicated that resources will be allocated to establish an advisory panel on ICT in schools and a national grid for learning.

I would like to thank the members of the two previous Education Committees for their work on these reviews and I particularly thank Huw Lewis and Jonathan Morgan for their work on the ICT policy review. Lorraine Barrett played an important role in the process on early years provision.

The review of the supply of school places is still underway. To date, we have received oral submissions from various organisations including the Audit Commission. The Audit Commission has inspected ten local education authorities in Wales in relation to this matter. It recently submitted a report on its findings to the Committee. The Committee will consider this report in its deliberations and I will present the Committee's final report to Plenary in July.

The higher education review is proceeding. The aim of this review is to establish a vision for higher education and how it should meet the needs of Wales and initiate the process of developing a long-term strategy to optimise the sector's contribution.

The Committee, along with the expert advisor, has identified a number of key themes that it wishes to examine. The Committee heard evidence from academics, students and others from Wales and beyond on a number of these key themes. We have developed a system of dialogue between the Committee, expert witness and Higher Education Wales. I pay tribute to HEW for its co-operation in this review.

The Committee is meeting this afternoon to hear more evidence on this review, including a presentation by Lord Dearing, the Chair of the UK Committee of Inquiry into Higher Education who published his influential

gyhoeddodd ei adroddiad dylanwadol yn 1997. Hefyd, bydd cyflwyniad ar thema addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn y sector.

Fis Rhagfyr y llynedd, cyhoeddodd y Gweinidog ei bod wedi sefydlu grŵp i ymchwilio i galedi ymhlith myfyrwyr dan gadeiryddiaeth yr Athro Teresa Rees. Gwaith y grŵp oedd cynnal adolygiad annibynnol o galedi ymhlith myfyrwyr. Deallaf fod hwnnw bron â dod i ben. Cytunwyd y dylai'r pwnc aros o fewn cylch gorchwyl adolygiad y Pwyllgor a bydd yr Athro Rees yn rhoi cyflwyniad i'r Pwyllgor ar y pwnc yng Ngorffennaf.

Y bwriad wedyn yw i'r Pwyllgor ymweld â Gogledd Iwerddon a'r Alban fis nesaf i'r aelodau ddysgu sut y darperir addysg uwch a'i hariannu yn y gwledydd hynny. Y bwriad yw cwblhau'r adolygiad yn yr hydref, tua Tachwedd neu Ragfyr.

Yn ychwanegol at ei adolygiadau polisi ei hun, cyfrannodd y Pwyllgor at y datblygiadau polisi eraill a ddygir ymlaen gan y Gweinidog a'i swyddogion, sef, grantiau cynnal addysg a hyfforddiant, adroddiad tasglu sgiliau Cymru, prosiectau peilot anghenion addysgol arbennig a'r cyngor dysgu cyffredinol.

Yn Ebrill, ar gais y Pwyllgor Diwylliant, cytunodd y Pwyllgor Addysg i gyfrannu at adolygiad y Pwyllgor Diwylliant o'r iaith Gymraeg. Bydd y cylch gorchwyl a'r rhaglen yn cael eu pennu yn y man, ond mae'r Pwyllgor yn edrych ymlaen at gychwyn ar yr adolygiad polisi hwn cyn diwedd y flwyddyn.

O ran rôl craffu, bu'r Pwyllgor yn craffu ar waith y Gweinidog drwy ei hadroddiadau misol. Mae'r Pwyllgor wedi gofyn iddi egluro rhai materion penodol ymhellach os ydym wedi bod o'r farn bod angen gwneud hynny. Yr hyn sydd yn digwydd yw bod y Cadeirydd a'r Gweinidog yn cytuno ar y pynciau a gynhwysir yn yr adroddiad misol cyn y cyfarfod perthnasol. Ar hyn o bryd, treulir 45 munud bob mis ar y gwaith hwn. Hoffwn weld yr amser hwnnw'n cael ei estyn. Hoffwn hefyd weld yr elfen graffu yn cael ei—

report in 1997. Also, there will be a presentation on the theme of Welsh medium education in the sector.

In December last year, the Minister announced that she had established a group chaired by Professor Teresa Rees to conduct research into student hardship. The group's remit was to undertake an independent review of student hardship. I understand that that is almost complete. It was agreed that this subject should remain within the remit of the Committee's review and Professor Rees will make a presentation to the Committee on this matter in July.

The Committee then intends to visit Northern Ireland and Scotland next month so the members can learn how higher education is provided and funded in those countries. It is intended that the review will be completed in the autumn, around November or December.

In addition to its own policy reviews, the Committee contributed to the other policy developments being taken forward by the Minister and her officials, namely, grants for education, support and training, the Wales skills taskforce report, special education needs pilot projects and the general teaching council.

In April, at the request of the Culture Committee, the Education Committee agreed to contribute to the Culture Committee's review of the Welsh language. The remit and the programme will be finalised shortly, but the Committee looks forward to beginning this policy review before the end of the year.

In terms of the scrutiny role, the Committee has scrutinised the Minister's work through her monthly reports. The Committee has asked her to clarify some particular matters further if we thought there was a need to do so. What happens is that the Chair and the Minister agree on the topics to be included in the monthly report before the relevant meeting. At present, 45 minutes a month is spent on this work. I would like to see that time being extended. I would also like to see the scrutiny element being—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. A wnewch chi

Please wind up.

Cynog Dafis: Yr oeddwn gystal â bod wedi dod i ben.

Richard Edwards: It has been an exciting challenge to get the new Environment, Planning and Transport Committee up and running and deal with several membership changes during the year. I thank Committee members past and present for making this a successful first year. I also thank the excellent secretariat, namely Siwan Davies, Vaughan Watkin and the team, for all their hard work and assistance.

As well as working together, the Committee has established partnerships with other organisations in Wales. Most important of all, perhaps, it has been the first Subject Committee to take its standard meetings to the people of Wales. The Committee's tour started in Pembrokeshire last July. We held two meetings in the Rhondda in October and one in Snowdonia in November. Brecon will soon be added to that list.

The Committee's annual report for 2000-01 and the work programme for 2001-02 have been circulated. I will now detail highlights of the Committee's first year. Our priorities included overseeing the developing waste strategy and the review of planning policy guidance. The Committee has been keeping a close eye on the direction of those developments. With the welcome addition of sustainable development to Sue Essex's portfolio as Minister for Environment, the Committee has also been proactively steering the sustainable development action plan.

The Committee's main priority, the review of public transport, got underway at the end of the summer term, when the Committee held two transport seminars. Those seminars were praised as being innovative in a recent publication. Interactive evidence sessions ran through the autumn and spring terms, providing an opportunity to gather evidence from a huge number of interest groups, as well as the strategic rail authority and public transport operators. We are now focusing on quality and testing options for different

gloi os gwelwch yn dda?

Cynog Dafis: I had more or less finished.

Richard Edwards: Bu sefydlu'r Pwyllgor Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth yn ogystal â delio â sawl newid yn yr aelodaeth yn ystod y flwyddyn yn her gyffrous. Diolchaf i aelodau presennol y Pwyllgor ac aelodau'r gorffennol am sicrhau bod hon yn flwyddyn gyntaf lwyddiannus. Diolchaf hefyd am yr ysgrifenyddiaeth ardderchog, sef Siwan Davies, Vaughan Watkin a'r tîm, am eu cymorth a'u holl waith caled.

Yn ogystal â chydweithio, sefydlodd y Pwyllgor bartneriaethau gyda sefydliadau eraill yng Nghymru. Yn bwysicaf oll, efallai, dyma'r Pwyllgor Pwnc cyntaf i fynd â'i gyfarfodydd safonol at bobl Cymru. Dechreuodd taith y Pwyllgor yn Sir Benfro fis Gorffennaf y llynedd. Cynaliwyd dau gyfarfod yn y Rhondda ym mis Hydref ac un yn Eryri ym mis Tachwedd. Ychwanegir Aberhonddu at y rhestr honno yn fuan.

Dosbarthwyd adroddiad blynyddol y Pwyllgor ar gyfer 2000-01 a'r rhaglen waith ar gyfer 2001-2002. Manylaf yn awr ar uchafbwyntiau blwyddyn gyntaf y Pwyllgor. Yr oedd ein blaenoriaethau'n cynnwys goruchwyllo'r strategaeth wastraff ddatblygol a'r adolygiad o ganllawiau polisi cynllunio. Bu'r Pwyllgor yn cadw llygad barcud ar gyfeiriad y datblygiadau hynny. Gyda chyflwyno datblygu cynaliadwy fel ychwanegiad i'w groesawu i bortffolio Sue Essex, fel y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, bu'r Pwyllgor hefyd yn llywio'r cynllun gweithredu ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy yn rhagweithiol.

Ymgwymerwyd â phrif flaenoriaeth y Pwyllgor, sef yr adolygiad o drafndiaeth gyhoeddus, ar ddiwedd tymor yr haf, pan gynhaliodd y Pwyllgor ddau seminar ar drafndiaeth. Canmolwyd y seminarau hynny fel rhai blaengar mewn cyhoeddiad diweddar. Cynhaliwyd sesiynau tystiolaeth rhyngweithiol drwy gydol tymhorau'r hydref a'r gwanwyn, gan ddarparu cyfle i gasglu tystiolaeth oddi wrth nifer fawr o grwpiau diddordeb, yn ogystal â'r awdurdod rheilffyrdd strategol a gweithredwyr

delivery structures, that would need primary legislation.

In July 2000, the Committee's work programme was unexpectedly revised with the addition of the investigation into the Nantygwyddon landfill site. The terms of reference for the investigation received all-party support before the summer recess. The Committee advertised for an independent investigator. In October, we launched the investigation by holding two Committee meetings in the Rhondda in order to hear evidence from local residents and public and statutory bodies. Both meetings were well attended. In November, David Purchon was appointed as independent investigator. He has heard over 200 hours of evidence so far and is making excellent progress.

A number of joint Committee meetings were held on issues of public concern. The Committee held a joint meeting with the Economic Development Committee to scrutinise rival bidders' plans for Hyder and Glas Cymru's proposals for Dŵr Cymru. The Committees' joint statements were influential in steering decisions on both occasions. A joint meeting was held with the Local Government and Housing Committee to consider reports on flooding. During the Easter recess, the Committee held a joint meeting with the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee to discuss the environmental implications of the foot and mouth disease crisis.

During the year, the Committee also took evidence from ramblers, landowners and sponsored bodies on the implications of the Countryside and Rights of Way Bill, for which the Committee will be steering the legislative programme for the Assembly.

On scrutiny, the sponsored bodies—namely Cadw, the Countryside Council for Wales, the Environment Agency Wales and the national parks—were questioned on their performance and on bids for additional resources. The Committee also challenged

trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus. Yr ydym bellach yn canolbwyntio ar ansawdd ac yn arbrofi â'r opsiynau ar gyfer gwahanol strwythurau cyflwyno, a fyddai'n galw am ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol.

Ym mis Gorffennaf 2000, adolygwyd rhaglen waith y Pwyllgor yn annisgwyl pan ychwanegwyd yr ymchwiliad i safle tirlenwi Nantygwyddon. Derbyniodd y cylch gorchwyl ar gyfer yr ymchwiliad gefnogaeth drawsbleidiol cyn toriad yr haf. Hysbysebodd y Pwyllgor am ymchwilydd annibynnol. Ym mis Hydref, lanswyd yr ymchwiliad drwy gynnal dau gyfarfod Pwyllgor yn y Rhondda er mwyn clywed tystiolaeth gan drigolion lleol a'r cyhoedd a chyrff statudol. Yr oedd presenoldeb da yn y ddau gyfarfod. Ym mis Tachwedd, penodwyd David Purchon fel ymchwilydd annibynnol. Hyd yn hyn clywodd dros 200 awr o dystiolaeth ac mae'n gwneud cynnydd ardderchog.

Cynhaliwyd sawl cydgyfarfod o'r Pwyllgor ar faterion o bryder i'r cyhoedd. Cynhaliodd y Pwyllgor gyfarfod ar y cyd â'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd er mwyn craffu ar gynlluniau y gwahanol cynigwyr ar gyfer Hyder a chynigion Glas Cymru ar gyfer Dŵr Cymru. Yr oedd cyd-ddatganiadau'r Pwyllgorau yn ddylanwadol wrth llywio'r penderfyniadau ar y ddau achlysur. Cynhaliwyd cyfarfod ar y cyd â'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai er mwyn ystyried adroddiadau ar lifogydd. Yn ystod toriad y Pasg, cynhaliodd y Pwyllgor gydgyfarfod â'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig er mwyn trafod goblygiadau amgylcheddol argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau.

Yn ystod y flwyddyn, derbyniodd y Pwyllgor hefyd dystiolaeth gan gerddwyr, perchenogion tir a chyrff nodedig ar oblygiadau'r Mesur Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy. Bydd y Pwyllgor yn llywio'r rhaglen ddeddfwriaethol ar ei gyfer ar ran y Cynulliad.

O ran craffu, holwyd y cyrff nodedig—sef Cadw, Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru, Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd Cymru a'r parciau cenedlaethol—ar eu perfformiad ac ar gynigion am adnoddau ychwanegol. Hefyd, heriodd y Pwyllgor faterion a ddeilliai o

issues emerging from reviews of the Countryside Council for Wales and the Environment Agency Wales.

On the Committee's executive role, a Planning Decision Committee met five times to consider two planning appeals, eight planning applications that had been called in by the Assembly and one transport and works Order. Frustrated by the rigid procedures, we asked for greater speed and flexibility in the decision-making process. As a result, Sue Essex will shortly bring revised proposals before the Business Committee.

Those are just some of the Committee's achievements. Looking forward, our priorities until Christmas are to complete the Nantygwyddon investigation and the policy review of public transport. Those are two major areas of work. The Committee plans to set aside informal time to review its performance and to consider policy development priorities for 2002. Once again, the Committee will seek to concentrate on those areas where it can make the greatest impact, and strike a balance between its policy development and scrutiny roles.

10:05 a.m.

David Lloyd: Datganaf fuddiant fel meddyg teulu a chynghorydd sir.

Wrth drafod rhaglen waith y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, diolchaf i'r clerod, Jane Westlake a Claire Morris, am eu gwaith dygn bob amser, ac i Kirsty am ei hadroddiad.

Yn ogystal â'r ddyletswydd bob dydd o oruchwylio gwaith y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, mae'r Pwyllgor hefyd wedi ymgymryd â sawl prosiect mewn manylder, fel y dywedodd Kirsty Williams. Yr oedd y gwaith ar sefydlu Comisiynydd Plant Cymru, ar y cyd â'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes a phartneriaid yn y sector gwirfoddol, yn arloesol. Mae'r gwaith hwnnw'n parhau—a chawsom gyfarfod arall ddoe—i sicrhau bod gweledigaeth drawsbleidiol y Pwyllgor ynglŷn â phwerau'r Comisiynydd Plant yn

adolygiadau o Gyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru ac Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd Cymru.

O ran rôl weithredol y Pwyllgor, cyfarfu Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio bum gwaith er mwyn ystyried dwy apêl gynllunio, wyth cais cynllunio a alwyd i mewn gan y Cynulliad ac un Gorchymyn trafndiaeth a gwaith. Wedi'n llesteirio gan y gweithdrefnau caeth, gofynasom am fwy o gyflymder a hyblygrwydd yn y broses o wneud penderfyniadau. O ganlyniad, bydd Sue Essex yn dwyn cynigion diwygiedig gerbron y Pwyllgor Busnes yn fuan.

Dim ond rhai o orchestion y Pwyllgor yw'r rheini. Gan edrych ymlaen, ein blaenoriaethau tan y Nadolig fydd cwblhau'r ymchwiliad i Nantygwyddon a'r adolygiad polisi o drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus. Mae'r rheini'n ddau faes gwaith mawr. Mae'r Pwyllgor yn bwriadu neilltuo amser anffurfiol i adolygu ei berfformiad ac ystyried blaenoriaethau datblygu polisi ar gyfer 2002. Unwaith eto, bydd y Pwyllgor yn ceisio canolbwyntio ar y meysydd hynny y gellid effeithio arnynt fwyaf, a chael cydbwysedd rhwng ei rôl o ddatblygu polisi a'i rôl craffu.

David Lloyd: I declare an interest as a general practitioner and a county councillor.

In discussing the Health and Social Services Committee's work programme, I thank the clerks, Jane Westlake and Claire Morris, for their consistent hard work, and Kirsty for her report.

In addition to the everyday duty of supervising the Minister for Health and Social Services's work, the Committee has also undertaken several detailed projects, as Kirsty Williams stated. The work on establishing a Children's Commissioner for Wales, jointly with the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee and partners in the voluntary sector, was innovative. That work is ongoing—and we had another meeting yesterday—to ensure that the Committee's cross-party vision for the Children's Commissioner's powers become a

dod yn realiti.

Bu'r Pwyllgor hefyd yn ymgymryd ag ymchwiliadau manwl i brofion llygaid am ddim—ac mae newidiadau wedi deillio o hynny—ac adroddiad Phillips ar BSE ac amrywiolyn newydd CJD.

Mae rhagor o waith i'w wneud i ddatblygu ein rôl craffu ac archwilio. Mae angen i'r Pwyllgor ystyried y ffordd orau ymlaen o ran archwilio cyrff megis yr ymddiriedolaethau iechyd. Mae rhagor o waith i'w wneud hefyd ar bynciau traws-bortffolio. Mae her sylweddol o ran datblygu polisi ar y cyd â Phwyllgorau eraill. Mae angen datblygu gwell cydweithio, er enghraifft rhwng y Pwyllgorau ar iechyd a thai. Cydnabyddaf y cynhelir cyfarfod ar y cyd yn fuan. Mae gan dai gyfraniad allweddol i safonau iechyd.

Mae angen gwell cydweithio â llywodraeth leol yn gyffredinol ac ar bwnc penodol, sef anghenion arbennig ein plant. Mae hynny'n faes dyrys, sydd yn gofyn am gydweithio manwl rhwng y rhai sydd yn gyfrifol am iechyd, gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ac addysg. Derbyniaf lawer o lythyrau ar y pwnc hwn a fydd yn derbyn sylw haeddiannol yn yr wythnosau nesaf.

Mae hefyd angen cydlynu'n agos waith y gwahanol Bwyllgorau ynglŷn â throeddwy'r ifanc, Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf a'r holl strategaethau cymunedol. Mae her sylweddol o'n blaenau.

Phil Williams: I wished to make one amendment to the Economic Development Committee's annual report. Paragraph 8 refers to informal briefing sessions. I hoped that we could have had all-party agreement on the exact number of extra meetings that we held, including consultation meetings, regional workshops and the valuable sequence of meetings held in Dublin and Brussels. Unfortunately, we seem to have lost count. However, the figure was well over 30 and I estimate that over 40 extra meetings were held. Therefore, we can justly claim to be a hard-working Committee.

That meant an exceptionally heavy load on

reality.

The Committee also undertook detailed investigations into free eye tests—and some changes have stemmed from that—and the Phillips report on BSE and new variant CJD.

More work must be done to develop our scrutiny and examination role. The Committee must consider the best way forward in terms of scrutinising bodies such as the health trusts. More work must also be done on cross-portfolio issues. There is a great challenge in terms of developing policy jointly with other Committees. We need to develop better co-operation, for example between the Committees on health and housing. I acknowledge that a joint meeting will be held soon. Housing makes a key contribution to health standards.

We need better co-operation with local government generally and on a specific issue, namely our children's special needs. That is a complex area, which requires detailed co-operation between those responsible for health, social services and education. I receive many letters on this issue, which will be afforded the attention that it deserves during the next few weeks.

We also need to closely co-ordinate the different Committees' work on young offenders, Communities First and all the community strategies. We face a significant challenge.

Phil Williams: Hoffwn wneud un gwelliant i adroddiad blynyddol y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Cyfeiria paragraff 8 at sesiynau briffio anffurfiol. Gobeithiwn y gallwn gael cytundeb trawsbleidiol ar union nifer y cyfarfodydd ychwanegol a gynaliasom, gan gynnwys cyfarfodydd ymgynghori, gweithdai rhanbarthol a'r gyfres werthfawr o gyfarfodydd a gynhaliwyd yn Nulyn a Brwsel. Yn anffodus, ymddengys inni fethu â'u cyfrif i gyd. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd y ffigur ymhell dros 30 ac amcangyfrifaf i dros 40 o gyfarfodydd ychwanegol gael eu cynnal. Gallwn, felly, honni'n gyfiawn ein bod yn Bwyllgor gweithgar.

Golygodd hynny faich gwaith eithriadol o

the Committee's clerks and Chair. I join Chris in expressing our appreciation for the enormous amount of work done. I also express our heartfelt wishes to Val—and I wish that she were here today to receive them—for a rapid and complete recovery to full health.

The largest single piece of work that we undertook was the special study on business support. I hope that, when its recommendations are implemented, we will have a simpler and more effective system of business support, integrated with a coherent economic strategy.

Developing such a strategy is one of the Committee's prime aims. As stated in the report, the Committee expressed reservations about the draft strategy that was released to the public in the name of the Minister for Economic Development because, in our opinion, more work was necessary before its release.

I speak for many, if not all, members of the Committee in saying that we are still eager to contribute to the further development of the national economic development strategy, to ensure that it meets the urgent problems of the economy. Members will appreciate how pleased I am that our next big task will be a special study on energy, with an emphasis on renewable energy. We will continue to be a hard-working Committee. I hope that it will be possible to pursue this work in close co-operation with the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee because far more co-operation between Committees is needed.

I end by mentioning the theme of co-operation. Our Committees are unique, as members of the Northern Ireland Assembly's Enterprise, Trade and Investment Committee pointed out when they came here. We are unique in combining scrutiny with policy development. Some cynics think that that is impossible. I maintain that, despite occasional disagreements, in the main we are able to do a big job of work together to meet the urgent challenge of the Welsh economy. I give my good wishes to Chris for the Committee's work in the next year, and long

drwm ar glercod y Pwyllgor a'r Cadeirydd. Ymunaf â Chris wrth fynegi ein gwerthfawrogiad o'r swm enfawr o waith a wnaethpwyd. Mynegaf hefyd ein dymuniadau didwyll i Val—a hoffwn petai hi yma heddiw i'w derbyn—am wellhad buan ac adferiad llawn.

Y darn unigol mwyaf o waith yr ymgymerasom ag ef oedd yr astudiaeth arbennig ar gymorth i fusnesau. Gobeithiaf, pan gaiff ei argymhellion eu gweithredu, y bydd gennym system haws ac mwy effeithiol o roi cymorth i fusnes, wedi'i integreiddio â strategaeth economaidd gydlynol.

Mae datblygu strategaeth o'r fath yn un o brif amcanion y Pwyllgor. Fel y nodwyd yn yr adroddiad, mynegodd y Pwyllgor amheuan ynghylch y strategaeth drafft a gyhoeddwyd i'r cyhoedd o dan enw'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd oherwydd, yn ein tyb ni, yr oedd angen mwy o waith arno cyn ei gyhoeddi.

Siaradaf dros sawl aelod o'r Pwyllgor, os nad pob aelod, wrth ddweud ein bod yn dal yn awyddus i gyfrannu at ddatblygu'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd ymhellach, er mwyn sicrhau ei bod yn mynd i'r afael â phroblemau brys yr economi. Bydd yr aelodau'n gwerthfawrogi pa mor falch yr wyf mai ein tasg fawr nesaf fydd astudiaeth arbennig ar ynni, gyda phwyslais ar ynni adnewyddadwy. Byddwn yn parhau i fod yn Bwyllgor gweithgar. Gobeithiaf y bydd yn bosibl bwrw ymlaen â'r gwaith hwn mewn cydweithrediad agos â Phwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth gan fod angen llawer mwy o gydweithio rhwng Pwyllgorau.

Terfynaf drwy sôn am y thema cydweithredu. Mae ein Pwyllgorau'n unigryw, fel y sylwodd aelodau Pwyllgor Menter, Diwydiant a Buddsoddi Cynulliad Gogledd Iwerddon pan ddaethant yma. Yr ydym yn unigryw am ein bod yn cyfuno craffu gyda datblygu polisi. Cred rhai sinigiad fod hynny'n amhosibl. Daliaf innau, er gwaethaf anghytuno achlysurol, ein bod ar y cyfan yn gallu gwneud llawer o waith ar y cyd er mwyn mynd i'r afael â her economi Cymru sydd yn gofyn am sylw brys. Dymunaf yn dda i Chris ar gyfer gwaith y Pwyllgor dros y

may that spirit of co-operation continue.

David Davies: I welcome the Member's point that the Economic Development Committee can manage the twin task of scrutiny and policy development, but I have some doubt as to whether that can be done as effectively as the Member's optimism suggested. The Committees, particularly those that are chaired by Members of the Government-supporting parties, spend far too much time discussing matters that Cabinet Ministers would like us to discuss, and not nearly enough time scrutinising. On one occasion in the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee, when I attempted to question the Minister, I was told that we were not there to scrutinise but to aid in the policy development. I disagree. I was not elected to help this Government to develop its policy. If I was elected to do anything it was to hold up a microscope and to ensure that the Government behaves appropriately at all times. This goes to the heart of one of our biggest problems in the Assembly. I want to be constructive and ensure that the Assembly develops appropriately. Local government has been reorganised bearing in mind the importance of allowing committees to scrutinise what is being done by the new cabinets that have been formed in local authorities. That is not happening in the Assembly. Every time we try to scrutinise we are told that that is not our job.

Tom Middlehurst: That is not true.

David Davies: I am afraid that it is. I have been told that by a Labour Minister, Tom. Why is more time not being spent in the Health and Social Services Committee looking at the diabolical state of waiting lists in Wales? Why is the Economic Development Committee not looking at the fact that the average growth rate of the UK lags far behind the growth rate of other developed countries? If we want to spend more on public services, we can only do so if the economy grows. Why is it that in the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee—no offence to the Chair—the fuel protest, which was one of the most

flwyddyn nesaf, a hir y pery'r ysbryd hwnnw o gydweithredu.

David Davies: Croesawaf bwynt y Gweinidog y gall y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ymdopi â'r dasg ddeublyg o graffu a datblygu polisi, ond mae gennyf beth amheuaeth a ellir gwneud hynny mor effeithiol ag yr awgrymodd optimistiaeth yr Aelod. Mae'r Pwyllgorau, yn arbennig y rheini o dan gadeiryddiaeth Aelodau'r pleidiau sydd yn cefnogi'r llywodraeth, yn treulio llawer gormod o amser yn trafod materion yr hoffai Gweinidogion y Cabinet inni eu trafod, a dim digon o amser yn craffu. Ar un achlysur ym Mhwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth, pan geisiais holi'r Gweinidog, dywedwyd wrthyf nad oeddem yno er mwyn craffu ond er mwyn cynorthwyo gyda'r gwaith o ddatblygu polisi. Anghytunaf â hynny. Ni chefais fy ethol er mwyn cynorthwyo'r Llywodraeth hon i ddatblygu ei pholisi. Os cefais fy ethol i wneud unrhyw beth yna craffu drwy chwyddwydr oedd hynny a sicrhau bod y Llywodraeth yn ymddwyn yn briodol ar bob achlysur. Dyma graidd un o'n problemau mwyaf yn y Cynulliad. Dymunaf fod yn adeiladol a sicrhau bod y Cynulliad yn datblygu mewn dull priodol. Aildrefnwyd llywodraeth leol gan gadw mewn cof y pwysigrwydd o ganiatáu i bwyllgorau graffu ar yr hyn a wneir gan y cabinetau newydd a ffurfiwyd mewn awdurdodau lleol. Nid dyna sydd yn digwydd yn y Cynulliad. Bob tro y ceisiwn graffu dywedir wrthym nad dyna ein gwaith.

Tom Middlehurst: Nid yw hynny'n wir.

David Davies: Mae arnaf ofn ei fod. Dywedwyd hynny wrthyf gan Weinidog Llafur, Tom. Pam na threulir mwy o amser yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn edrych ar gyflwr enbyd rhestrau aros yng Nghymru? Pam nad yw'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn edrych ar y ffaith fod cyfradd twf y DU ar gyfartaledd ymhell y tu ôl i gyfradd twf gwledydd datblygedig eraill? Os dymunwn wario mwy ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus, dim ond os bydd yr economi'n tyfu y gallwn wneud hynny. Pam na thrafodwyd y brotest danwydd ym Mhwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth—heb fwrw sen ar y

important issues and one of the biggest crises in Wales, along with foot and mouth disease, was not discussed, not even on the day when lorries came to blockade the Assembly building? The honourable exception is the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee, but there is a difference there, which is that the Chair of the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee is not a supporter of the Government. He believes that his task is to hold the Government to account. That is why Carwyn was dragged to the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee during a recess and was expected to answer questions, and did so reasonably. That would not necessarily happen in other Committees.

Richard Edwards: David was getting carried away there. Do you not recall, David, that I convened a joint meeting of the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee and the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee to scrutinise the Executive on its conduct during the foot and mouth disease crisis? You had ample opportunity then to scrutinise, as, indeed, you have ample opportunity to scrutinise at every Committee meeting. I am not sure which meetings you attend. You clearly do not attend the same ones as I do.

David Davies: My point is that with the best will in the world you will never be as enthusiastic about bringing forward for discussion matters which embarrass the Government as Chairs who come from parties that do not necessarily represent Government views—

Lorraine Barrett and Kirsty Williams *rose—*

10:15 a.m.

David Davies: I am about to wrap up, but I will give way to Lorraine as she stood up first.

Lorraine Barrett: David Davies obviously does not know Richard Edwards.

David Davies: I do know him. I have nothing against him personally, having sat through many meetings with him. I will give way to

Cadeirydd—sef un o'r materion pwysicaf ac un o'r argyfyngau mwyaf yng Nghymru, ynghyd â chlwy'r traed a'r genau, hyd yn oed ar y diwrnod pan ddaeth lorïau i ffurfio blocâd ger adeilad y Cynulliad? Yr eithriad anrhydeddus yw'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig, ond mae gwahaniaeth yn y fan honno, sef nad yw Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig yn un o gefnogwyr y Llywodraeth. Cred ef mai ei dasg yw dwyn y Llywodraeth i gyfrif. Dyna pam y cafodd Carwyn ei lusgo i'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig yn ystod toriad ac y disgwyliwyd iddo ateb cwestiynau, a gwnaeth hynny'n rhesymol. Ni fyddai hynny'n digwydd o anghenraid mewn Pwyllgorau eraill.

Richard Edwards: Yr oedd David yn dechrau mynd dros ben llestri. Oni chofiwch, David, imi alw ynghyd gyfarfod ar y cyd rhwng Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth a'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig er mwyn craffu ar y Weithrediaeth ynghylch ei hymddygiad adeg argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau? Cawsoch ddigon o gyfle bryd hynny i graffu, fel, yn wir, y cewch ddigon o gyfle i graffu ym mhob cyfarfod Pwyllgor. Nid wyf yn siŵr pa gyfarfodydd yr ydych yn eu mynychu. Mae'n amlwg nad ydych yn mynychu'r un rhai â mi.

David Davies: Fy mhwynt yw na fyddwch gyda'r bwriad gorau yn y byd byth yr un mor frwdfrydig ynghylch cyflwyno materion i'w trafod sydd yn cywilyddio'r Llywodraeth â Chadeiryddion o bleidiau nad ydynt o anghenraid yn cynrychioli safbwyntiau'r Llywodraeth—

Lorraine Barrett a Kirsty Williams *a gododd—*

David Davies: Yr wyf ar fin cloi, ond ildiaf i Lorraine gan iddi sefyll yn gyntaf.

Lorraine Barret: Mae'n amlwg nad yw David Davies yn adnabod Richard Edwards.

David Davies: Yr wyf yn ei adnabod. Nid oes gennyf unrhyw beth yn ei erbyn yn bersonol, gan imi eistedd gydag ef mewn

Kirsty Williams, briefly.

sawl cyfarfod. Ildiaf i Kirsty Williams, yn gyflym.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Kirsty has just come into the Chamber. I do not see why David should give way to a Member who has been absent for the debate and who has just walked into the Chamber and intervened. However, David may give way if he wishes.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Newydd ddod i mewn i'r Siambr y mae Kirsty. Ni welaf pam y dylai David ildio i Aelod a fu'n absennol o'r ddadl ac sydd newydd gerdded i mewn i'r Siambr ac ymyrryd. Fodd bynnag, gall David ildio os dymuna wneud hynny.

David Davies: I will give way.

David Davies: Ildiaf.

Kirsty Williams: Perhaps David would like to reconsider his comments on the role of Committee Chairs. In my experience over the last two years, Committee Chairs from all political parties have been keen, and have strived hard, to remain independent, whatever their political party views. David's comment is a slur on all Committee Chairs in the Assembly. All have tried hard to maintain their independence while chairing, whatever their party leanings. All Committee Chairs should be commended for that. David's comment is a slur on the behaviour of all chairs.

Kirsty Williams: Efallai yr hoffai David ailystyried ei sylwadau ar rôl Cadeiryddion Pwyllgorau. Yn ôl fy mhrofiad i dros y ddwy flynedd diwethaf, bu Cadeiryddion Pwyllgorau ar draws pob plaid wleidyddol yn awyddus i aros yn annibynnol, beth bynnag fo barn eu pleidiau. Mae sylw David yn sarhad ar Gadeirydd pob Pwyllgor yn y Cynulliad. Mae pob un ohonynt wedi ceisio cynnal eu hannibyniaeth wrth gadeirio, beth bynnag fo'u tueddiadau pleidiol. Dylid canmol Cadeirydd pob Pwyllgor am hynny. Mae sylw David yn sarhad ar ymddygiad pob cadeirydd.

David Davies: I have had time to reconsider and, in my opinion, no matter how hard some Committee Chairs have strived for impartiality, they have failed. That is my belief. Committee Chairs have not been as impartial as those of the Select Committees in Parliament or the scrutiny committees that have been set up in local authorities as a result of the Local Government Act 2000, which was introduced by the Labour Government. Until that situation changes, the Assembly will not have the respect that it should have because, quite simply, we are not scrutinising the Government as we should.

David Davies: Cefais gyfle i ailystyried, ac yn fy marn i, ni waeth pa mor galed y ceisiodd Cadeiryddion Pwyllgorau fod yn amhleidiol, methasant. Dyna fy marn. Ni fu Cadeiryddion Pwyllgorau mor amhleidiol â'r rheini ar y Pwyllgorau Dethol yn y Senedd neu ar bwyllgorau craffu a sefydlwyd mewn awdurdodau lleol o ganlyniad i Ddeddf Llywodraeth Leol 2000, a gyflwynwyd gan y Llywodraeth Lafur. Tan y bydd y sefyllfa honno yn newid, ni chaiff y Cynulliad y parch sydd yn ddyledus iddo oherwydd, yn syml iawn, nid ydym yn craffu ar y Llywodraeth fel ag y dylem.

Gareth Jones: Croesawaf y cyfle i drafod adroddiad cynnydd y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Cyfeiriodd y Cadeirydd at waith pwysig a chyfrifol y Pwyllgor yn adolygu polisiau a all arwain at newidiadau a gwelliannau sylweddol i blant ac oedolion ein gwlad. Maent hefyd yn bolisiau heriol sydd yn ymwneud â datblygiadau anodd a dyrys, megis darpariaeth addysg blynyddoedd cynnar, cyfeirio datblygiadau ym maes technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu a datblygu cyfeiriad a strategaeth ar gyfer

Gareth Jones: I welcome the opportunity to discuss the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee's progress report. The Chair referred to the Committee's important and responsible work in reviewing policies that can lead to substantial changes and improvements for children and adults in this country. They are also challenging policies that involve difficult and complex developments, such as the provision of early years education, steering developments in information and communications technology

addysg uwch fel yr ydym wedi clywed eisoes.

Mae'r ffaith fod gennym gyfle i drafod materion o bwys fel y rhain a dylanwadu arnynt, yn tanlinellu pwysigrwydd rôl y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Gellid dadlau y dylid bod wedi mynd i'r afael â nifer o'r materion hyn flynyddoedd yn ôl, ond diolchwn am y cyfle inni newid pethau er gwell yn awr. Croesawaf hefyd y ffaith fod aelodau'r Pwyllgor yn cael craffu ar waith y Gweinidog neu archwilio'r gwaith hwnnw, gan roi cyfle inni gyfrannu'n fwy effeithiol at adolygu effaith polisiau ar y gwasanaeth addysg.

Yn ddiamau, un o sialensau mwyaf y Pwyllgor fydd ei gyfraniad at adolygiad y Pwyllgor Diwylliant o'r iaith Gymraeg. Mae hynny yn argoeli'n dda ac mae'n galondid gwybod bod cefnogaeth ac ymrwymiad trawsbleidiol i hyrwyddo defnydd o'r Gymraeg ac, felly, ddiogelu ei dyfodol. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni ystyried y sefyllfa argyfyngus sydd yn bodoli ar hyn o bryd. Mae gwendidau amlwg ym myd addysg—rhaid ohonynt eisoes wedi'u crybwyll yn adroddiad Estyn—yn ymwneud â dysgu'r Gymraeg fel ail iaith a diffygion yn y ddarpariaeth ar gyfer addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg. Mae angen datrysiad buan i'r holl wendidau hynny. Efallai mai dyma'r unig gyfle a gawn i ddatblygu a mewndoli polisi dychmygus ac effeithiol ar gyfer y Gymraeg. Bydd yn fater o bwys ac yn brawf ar ymrwymiad a pharodrwydd y Pwyllgorau ac Aelodau i wneud cyfiawnder o'r diwedd â gofynion yr iaith Gymraeg.

Christine Chapman: I welcome the opportunity to contribute to the debate, particularly with regard to the Economic Development Committee's programme and in the context of my role as Chair of the Objective 1 Programme Monitoring Committee. Objective 1 cannot be divorced from the rest of the national economic development strategy. I have welcomed the opportunity to scrutinise the progress and implementation of the programme in the Economic Development Committee's meetings. As Christine Gwyther said, that

and, as we have heard, developing the direction of, and a strategy for, higher education.

The fact that we have an opportunity to discuss and influence such important issues as those underlines the importance of the National Assembly's role. It could be argued that several of these matters should have been tackled years ago, but we are grateful for the opportunity to change things for the better now. I also welcome the fact that Committee members can scrutinise or oversee the Minister's work, thus giving us an opportunity to contribute more effectively to reviewing the effect of policies on the education service.

Undoubtedly, one of the Committee's greatest challenges will be its contribution to the Culture Committee's review of the Welsh language. Initial indications are promising and it is heartening to know that there is cross-party support for, and a commitment to, promoting the use of the Welsh language and, therefore, safeguarding its future. However, we must consider the critical situation that exists at present. There are clear weaknesses in education—some of which have already been mentioned in the Estyn report—as regards teaching Welsh as a second language and deficiencies in the provision of Welsh-medium education. We need a speedy resolution to all those weaknesses. Perhaps this is the only opportunity that we will have to develop and integrate an imaginative and effective policy for the Welsh language. It will be an important issue and a test of Committees' and Members' commitment and willingness to finally do justice to the needs of the Welsh language.

Christine Chapman: Croesawaf y cyfle i gyfrannu at y ddadl, yn enwedig mewn perthynas â rhaglen y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ac yng nghyd-destun fy rôl fel Cadeirydd Pwyllgor Monitro Rhaglenni Amcan 1. Ni ellir gwahanu Amcan 1 oddi wrth weddill y strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol. Croesewais y cyfle i graffu ar gynnydd y rhaglen a'i gweithrediad yng nghyfarfodydd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Fel y dywedodd Christine Gwyther, rhaid i hynny barhau. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni hefyd gydnabod bod

must continue. However, we must also recognise that the Programme Monitoring Committee, as laid down in the single programming document, is somewhat at arm's length from the Assembly. The Assembly has given the partners who serve on that Committee the task of supervising the programme. Today I pay tribute to those partners, who come from the voluntary, private and public sectors and who are ensuring that this programme is a success. They give much time and commitment in undertaking this task.

Since December, when the task and finish group's report was agreed by the Programme Monitoring Committee, much progress has been made, despite some scaremongering and negativity. In a short time improvements have been made to many aspects of the current structure.

There is much more still to be done on Objective 1, but we must emphasise that great progress has been made. Some examples of that include the setting up of a policy group that provides advice and guidance to the Programme Monitoring Committee, and of a central inquiry point and private sector unit. Priority is being given to providing the best possible service to project applicants.

Most significantly, four strategy partnerships have been established. They met recently and are taking forward the direction and thematic principles of the programme to support the Welsh European Funding Office in its deliberations. That strategic focus will make a difference and help build an advanced, dynamic and more diverse economy in which everyone in west Wales and the Valleys has a chance to prosper. This has been of particular concern to the Economic Development Committee, and its partnership with the Programme Monitoring Committee must continue.

I welcome the fact that almost £180 million of Objective 1 money has been committed to date. There are 250 projects that are rolling forward and will benefit our hardest-hit communities. However, the key to this is transparency and partnership, which are some of devolution's guiding principles. Val Feld,

y Pwyllgor Monitro Rhaglenni, fel yr amlinellir yn y ddogfen raglennu sengl, i raddau hyd braich oddi wrth y Cynulliad. Rhoddodd y Cynulliad y dasg o oruchwylio'r rhaglen i'r partneriaid sydd yn gwasanaethu ar y Pwyllgor hwnnw. Heddiw, talaf deyrnged i'r partneriaid hynny, sydd yn dod o'r sectorau gwirfoddol, preifat a chyhoeddus ac sydd yn sicrhau bod y rhaglen hon yn llwyddiant. Rhoddant lawer o amser ac ymrwymiad wrth ymgymryd â'r dasg hon.

Ers mis Rhagfyr, pan gytunodd y Pwyllgor Monitro'r Rhaglenni ar adroddiad y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen, gwnaethpwyd llawer o gynnydd, er gwaethaf rhywfaint o godi bwganod ac agweddau negyddol. Mewn amser byr, gwnaethpwyd newidiadau i nifer o agweddau ar y strwythur cyfredol.

Mae llawer i'w wneud o hyd ar Amcan 1, ond rhaid inni bwysleisio y gwnaethpwyd cynnydd mawr eisoes. Mae rhai enghreifftiau o hynny yn cynnwys creu grŵp polisi sydd yn darparu cyngor ac arweiniad i'r Pwyllgor Monitro Rhaglenni, a phwynt ymholi canolog ac uned sector preifat. Rhoddir blaenoriaeth i ddarparu'r gwasanaeth gorau posibl i ymgeiswyr prosiect.

Yn fwyaf arwyddocaol, sefydlwyd pedair partneriaeth strategaeth. Cyfarfuont yn ddiweddar ac maent yn datblygu cyfeiriad ac egwyddorion thematig y rhaglen er mwyn cynorthwyo Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru yn ei drafodaethau. Bydd y ffocws strategol hwnnw yn gwneud gwahaniaeth ac yn helpu i adeiladu economi ddatblygedig, ddeinamig a mwy amrywiol a fydd yn rhoi cyfle i bawb yng ngorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd ffynnu. Bu hwn yn fater o bryder arbennig i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, ac mae'n rhaid i'w bartneriaeth gyda'r Pwyllgor Monitro Rhaglenni barhau.

Croesawaf y ffaith bod bron £180 miliwn o arian Amcan 1 wedi cael ei glustnodi hyd yn hyn. Cyflawnir 250 o brosiectau a byddant o fudd i'n cymunedau mwyaf truenus. Fodd bynnag, yr allwedd i hyn yw tryloywder a phartneriaeth, sef rhai o egwyddorion arweiniol datganoli. Yr oedd Val Feld, ein

our previous Chair, was a fine ambassador for those principles. If we can achieve this by means of consensus between the Assembly and the private, public and voluntary sectors—challenging though it sometimes—it will mean the laying down of firm building blocks for Wales's future prosperity.

Jonathan Morgan: I refer to the role of the Chairman of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee. That role is crucial in steering the Committee through what can be difficult times. I pay tribute to Cynog Dafis, and put party politics aside; the Education Committee is well served by an experienced chairman. It is essential, if a Committee is to have a strategic direction in contributing to policy development, and in scrutinising the Government, to have a competent chairman who can act impartially, and in the best interests of the members of that Committee.

The role of the clerk and the deputy clerk of a Committee, which has developed slowly over time, is also crucial. I point to the work undertaken in the review of information and communications technology, which was undertaken out of committee and, therefore, involved the work of clerks and deputy clerks outside of committee time. That developing role has been important in developing policies, specifically when a policy has not been on the agenda for successive Committee meetings. Their input is also crucial.

In terms of policy development, the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee has been quite successful in developing its own policy, particularly in relation to the provision of education for three-year-olds, the review of ICT in schools and also the higher education review, which is currently underway. However, that is purely a Committee review. Whether those reviews will have long-lasting implications for Government policy is another matter. They are good and worthwhile Committee reviews, but whether Assembly Committees will actually contribute to long-term Government policy objectives is another matter. The Government is not obliged to take these policy developments into account when

cyn Gadeirydd, yn llysgennad da dros yr egwyddorion hynny. Os gallwn gyflawni hyn drwy gyfrwng consensws rhwng y Cynulliad a'r sectorau preifat, cyhoeddus a gwirfoddol—er y gall fod yn heriol ar adegau—bydd yn golygu y gellir gosod sylfaen gadarn ar gyfer llwyddiant Cymru yn y dyfodol.

Jonathan Morgan: Cyfeirïaf at rôl Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Mae'r rôl honno yn hollbwysig o ran llywio'r Pwyllgor drwy'r hyn a all fod yn amserau anodd. Talaf deyrnged i Cynog Dafis, a rhoi gwleidyddiaeth y pleidiau o'r neilltu; gwasanaethir y Pwyllgor Addysg yn dda gan gadeirydd profiadol. Mae'n hanfodol, os yw Pwyllgor i fod â chyfieriad strategol wrth gyfrannu at ddatblygu polisiau, ac wrth graffu ar y Llywodraeth, fod ganddo gadeirydd cymwys a all ymddwyn yn amhleidiol, ac er budd aelodau'r Pwyllgor hwnnw.

Mae rôl y clerck a dirprwy glerc Pwyllgor, a ddatblygodd yn araf gydag amser, hefyd yn hollbwysig. Cyfeirïaf at y gwaith yr ymgwymerwyd ag ef yn yr adolygiad o dechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu, a gyflawnwyd y tu allan i'r pwyllgor ac a oedd, felly, yn golygu bod clerckod a dirprwy glercmod yn gweithio y tu allan i amser y pwyllgor. Bu'r rôl honno, sydd yn datblygu, yn bwysig wrth ddatblygu polisiau, yn arbennig pan na fu polisi ar agenda'r Pwyllgor am sawl cyfarfod ar ôl ei gilydd. Mae eu mewnbwn hefyd yn hollbwysig.

O ran datblygu polisiau, bu'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn eithaf llwyddiannus wrth ddatblygu ei bolisi ei hun, yn enwedig mewn perthynas â'r ddarpariaeth addysg ar gyfer plant tair blwydd oed, yr adolygiad o TGCh mewn ysgolion a hefyd yr adolygiad addysg uwch, a gyflawnir ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, adolygiad gan y Pwyllgor yn unig yw hynny. Mae pa un a fydd gan yr adolygiadau hynny oblygiadau parhaol ar gyfer polisi'r Llywodraeth yn fater arall. Maent yn adolygiadau Pwyllgor da a gwerthfawr, ond mae pa un a fydd Pwyllgorau'r Cynulliad yn cyfrannu'n wirioneddol at amcanion polisi hirdymor y Llywodraeth yn fater arall. Nid oes gorfodaeth ar y Llywodraeth i ystyried y

considering its own objectives.

datblygiadau polisi hyn wrth ystyried ei amcanion ei hun.

10:25 a.m.

In terms of Government scrutiny, that has been somewhat more difficult, partly because we expect individual Members to battle against not only a Government Minister, but also the weight of officials, official advice, and the official support to which Ministers are privy. It is different and difficult for backbenchers. One aspect of policy for which area it was quite difficult to get the Government to see sense was in relation to the former Pre-16 Education Committee's worries about the performance related pay scheme that the Westminster Government wanted to introduce. At the time, the Government Minister indicated to the Committee that we were mere consultees in the process. Perhaps it was an indication of the Government's attitude toward the Subject Committees. I hope that that attitude has changed, but it demonstrates the difficulties that can exist for Committees in scrutinising the Government.

There are also certain time constraints when we receive ministerial reports, which are weighty and detailed. Proper scrutiny cannot be done in 45 minutes. Trying to balance the scrutiny objectives of a Committee with its policy development objectives becomes difficult to do in our meetings. There are time constraints, therefore, that the party business managers might wish to consider in the years ahead to see how we can improve both those aspects of Committees' work.

On the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee, we miss certain things. Gareth Jones alluded to some of them. It is important for the Committee to determine how money is spent in the education system in Wales. There is a great deal of confusion. The National Union of Teachers and others call it a funding fault. It is important for us to determine whether money is spent correctly and whether school buildings are being brought up to scratch. These are ongoing issues of which the Committee would wish to be aware, and on which it would wish to be able to scrutinise the Minister. Another issue

O ran craffu ar y Llywodraeth, bu hynny rhywfaint yn anos, yn rhannol oherwydd y disgwyliwn i Aelodau unigol frwydro nid yn unig yn erbyn Gweinidog y Llywodraeth, ond hefyd yn erbyn dylanwad swyddogion, cyngor swyddogol a'r cymorth swyddogol y mae Gweinidogion yn gyfarwydd â hwy. Mae'n wahanol ac yn anodd i aelodau'r meinciau cefn. Un agwedd ar bolisi y bu'n anodd cael cytundeb y Llywodraeth arni oedd pryderon y Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16 blaenorol ynglŷn â'r cynllun tâl ar sail perfformiad yr oedd Llywodraeth San Steffan am ei gyflwyno. Ar y pryd, dywedodd Gweinidog y Llywodraeth wrth y Pwyllgor mai dim ond ymgynghorwyr oeddem ni yn y broses. Efallai ei fod yn arwydd o ymagwedd y Llywodraeth at y Pwyllgorau Pwnc. Gobeithiaf fod yr ymagwedd honno wedi newid, ond mae'n dangos yr anawsterau sydd yn gallu bodoli ar gyfer Pwyllgorau wrth graffu ar y Llywodraeth.

Yn ogystal ceir rhai cyfyngiadau amser pan dderbyniwn adroddiadau gweinidogol, sydd yn drwm ac yn fanwl. Ni ellir craffu'n briodol o fewn 45 munud. Mae ceisio cydbwysu amcanion craffu Pwyllgor gyda'i amcanion datblygu polisi yn datblygu'n dasg anodd i'w chyflawni yn ein cyfarfodydd. Ceir cyfyngiadau amser, felly, y dymunai rheolwyr busnes y pleidiau eu hystyried o bosibl yn y blynyddoedd i ddod er mwyn gweld sut y gallwn wella'r ddwy agwedd honno ar waith Pwyllgorau.

O ran y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, yr ydym yn gweld eisiau rhai pethau. Cyfeiriodd Gareth Jones at rai ohonynt. Mae'n bwysig i'r Pwyllgor benderfynu sut y caiff arian ei wario yn y system addysg yng Nghymru. Ceir cryn dipyn o benbleth. Mae Undeb Cenedlaethol yr Athrawon ac eraill yn ei alw'n ddiffyg ariannu. Mae'n bwysig inni benderfynu a gaiff arian ei wario'n gywir ac a yw adeiladau ysgolion yn cyrraedd y safon. Mae'r rhain yn faterion parhaus y dymuna'r Pwyllgor fod yn ymwybodol ohonynt, ac y dymunai allu craffu ar waith y Gweinidog yn eu cylch. Mater arall yw pa un a yw'r

is whether the Welsh baccalaureate is a suitable alternative to the A-level. We have not had an independent assessment nor have we had any scrutiny by the Committee of the components of the Welsh baccalaureate. It seems that the Government has merely taken the word of the Institute of Welsh Affairs for granted.

There are a huge number of opportunities for the Committee to take in pursuing its policy developmental role, as well as in terms of improving its scrutiny role of the Minister. After all, we are there to scrutinise Government policy. We are not there to merely rubber-stamp decisions taken by the Government. We have our own policy agenda, of which the Government can take account or can reject, as Jenny Randerson has done in the Culture Committee on some aspects of the 'A Culture in Common' report. It is important for us to improve the scrutiny role so that Government Ministers are held to account week by week for the role that they undertake on behalf of the Assembly.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I would be grateful if speakers could keep to less than five minutes. Members have been doing so, but shorter speeches would be welcome.

Eleanor Burnahm: Talaf finnau deyrnged i Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes.

I have experienced a challenging baptism of fire. I came to the Committee two years down the line and there is a huge brief to get to grips with. The Liberal Democrats welcome the merging of the Pre-16 Education Committee and the Post-16 Education and Training Committee as according to our partnership agreement as a thoroughly sensible way of delivering education policy and driving it forward. I look forward to the Minister taking forward the recommendations and, in particular, the Committee's specific recommendations on ICT in early years provision. The two ongoing reviews are of immense importance—the supply of school places and higher education in Wales. I hope that the rural schools policy, as stated in the partnership agreement, will be developed, together with a review of school places. On

fagloriaeth Gymreig yn gymhwyster arall addas yn lle Safon Uwch. Ni chawsom asesiad annibynnol ac ni fu'r Pwyllgor yn craffu ar gynnwys y fagloriaeth Gymreig. Ymddengys fel pe bai'r Llywodraeth ond wedi cymryd gair y Sefydliad Materion Gymreig yn ganiataol.

Mae nifer enfawr o gyfleoedd y gall y Pwyllgor eu cymryd wrth ddilyn ei rôl datblygu polisiau, yn ogystal ag yn nhermau gwella ei rôl wrth graffu ar waith y Gweinidog. Wedi'r cyfan, ein nod yw craffu ar bolisi'r Llywodraeth. Nid ein nod yw rhoi sêl ein bendith yn unig ar benderfyniadau a wneir gan y Llywodraeth. Mae gennym ein hagenda bolisi ein hunain, y gall y Llywodraeth ei hystyried neu ei gwrthod, fel y gwnaeth Jenny Randerson yn y Pwyllgor Diwylliant ar rai agweddau ar yr adroddiad 'Diwylliant Cytûn'. Mae'n bwysig inni wella'r rôl graffu fel y gellir sicrhau bod Gweinidogion y Llywodraeth yn atebol, o wythnos i wythnos, am y rôl y maent yn ymgymryd â hi ar ran y Cynulliad.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallai'r siaradwyr gadw at lai na phum munud. Bu'r Aelodau yn gwneud hynny, ond byddai areithiau byrrach yn cael eu croesawu.

Eleanor Burnahm: I also pay tribute to the Chair of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee.

Euthum drwy fedydd tân heriol. Deuthum i'r Pwyllgor ddwy flynedd ar ôl sefydlu'r Cynulliad ac mae briff enfawr y mae angen mynd i'r afael ag ef. Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn croesawu uno'r Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16 â'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 sydd, yn ôl ein cytundeb partneriaeth, yn ffordd hollol synhwyrol o ddarparu polisi addysg a'i roi ar waith. Edrychaf ymlaen i weld y Gweinidog yn gweithredu ar yr argymhellion ac, yn enwedig, argymhellion penodol y Pwyllgor ar TGCh mewn darpariaeth blynyddoedd cynnar. Mae'r ddau adolygiad parhaus o'r pwys mwyaf—y ddarpariaeth o leoedd ysgol ac addysg uwch yng Nghymru. Gobeithiaf y caiff y polisi ysgolion gwledig, fel y nodwyd yn y cytundeb partneriaeth, ei ddatblygu, ynghyd ag adolygiad o leoedd ysgol. Ynglŷn

the higher education review, that has an obvious significance for the future development of, and as a contribution to, the country's economic development, including working together with small and medium-sized enterprises. Within the Committee's remit, student hardship has been a contentious issue. Even though the investigating group was established by the Minister, we regret that the Committee will no longer receive the report from the investigation group next week as was originally planned.

Geraint Davies: I declare an interest as a pharmacist and a member of Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough Council. I welcome the Environment, Transport and Planning Committee's report and I thank Richard for how he conducted its meetings and the officials for their support, in particular Siwan Davies and Vaughan Watkin. I welcome the fact that the Committee held several meetings outside Cardiff, including some in my constituency, and that these meetings were a success. It showed how the Assembly could engage with individuals and organisations throughout Wales.

The policy review of public transport has been thorough and we are confident that the Committee will be able to give the Executive detailed and well-thought out advice on how to improve public transport in Wales. It has been beneficial to compare our transport problems and solutions with those in other European regions. Developing more accessible and efficient public transport across Wales is key to achieving many of our sustainable development targets, including social inclusion and equal opportunities.

The development of a waste strategy for Wales is a key issue and we are eager that the opportunity to develop better waste management in Wales is grasped. It is essential that we aim high—or perhaps low in the case of waste—and set tough targets for ourselves and those who are involved in the waste industry. We must improve waste management by re-using and recycling. We hope that the Nantygwyddon investigation will answer many of the questions about that site and will address the concerns of local

â'r adolygiad addysg uwch, mae hwnnw'n arwyddocaol iawn ar gyfer datblygu a chyfrannu at ddatblygu economaidd y wlad yn y dyfodol, ynghyd â chydweithio gyda busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint. O fewn cylch gwaith y Pwyllgor, bu caledi myfyrwyr yn fater dadleuol. Er y sefydlwyd y grŵp ymchwilio gan y Gweinidog, gresynwn na fydd y Pwyllgor bellach yn derbyn yr adroddiad gan y grŵp ymchwilio yr wythnos nesaf yn ôl y bwriad gwreiddiol.

Geraint Davies: Datganaf fuddiant fel fferylllydd ac aelod o Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf. Croesawaf adroddiad Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth a diolchaf i Richard am ei ddull o gynnal y cyfarfodydd ac i'r swyddogion am eu cymorth, yn enwedig Siwan Davies a Vaughan Watkin. Croesawaf y ffaith y cynhaliodd y Pwyllgor nifer o gyfarfodydd y tu allan i Gaerdydd, yn cynnwys rhai yn fy etholaeth i, ac y bu'r cyfarfodydd hyn yn llwyddiant. Dangosodd sut y gallai'r Cynulliad gyfathrebu ag unigolion a sefydliadau ledled Cymru.

Bu'r adolygiad polisi o drafndiaeth gyhoeddus yn drwyadl ac yr ydym yn hyderus y gall y Pwyllgor roi cyngor manwl a gofalus i'r Weithrediaeth ynglŷn â sut i wella trafndiaeth gyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Bu'n fuddiol i gymharu ein problemau trafndiaeth a'n datrysiadau â'r rheini mewn rhanbarthau eraill yn Ewrop. Mae'r gwaith o ddatblygu trafndiaeth gyhoeddus mwy hygyrch ac effeithlon ar draws Cymru yn allweddol er mwyn cyflawni nifer o'n targedau datblygiad cynaliadwy, yn cynnwys cynhwysiant cymdeithasol a chyfle cyfartal.

Mae datblygu strategaeth wastraff i Gymru yn fater allweddol ac yr ydym yn awyddus y manteisio i'r eithaf ar y cyfle i ddatblygu gwell rheolaeth gwastraff yng Nghymru. Mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn anelu'n uchel—neu efallai'n isel yn achos gwastraff—ac yn gosod targedau cadarn ar ein cyfer ni ein hunain ac ar gyfer y rheini sydd yn gysylltiedig â'r diwydiant gwastraff. Rhaid inni wella rheolaeth gwastraff drwy ailddefnyddio ac ailgylchu. Gobeithiwn y bydd ymchwiliad Nantygwyddon yn ateb

residents. Any relevant conclusions should be incorporated into a future waste strategy for Wales.

We welcome the Committee's involvement in the development of a national spatial planning framework and its further input into Planning Policy Wales. These are key. Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales believes that the national spatial planning framework is a real opportunity to bring polycentric development to Wales and that it enables a more even spread of opportunities across Wales. We look forward to the Committee's further involvement in it. We also believe that Planning Policy Wales is of key importance to the Assembly's work and look forward to further discussions in Committee. It is an opportunity to ensure that we introduce a positive planning system for Wales that meets the needs of the environment, society and economy in Wales. It is essential that planning in Wales reflects the Assembly's commitment to sustainable development.

However, we regret that we have not had the opportunity recently to discuss any draft subordinate legislation. That should be an important role for the Subject Committees. We look forward to finalising the priorities for 2002 in the Autumn and we hope that there will be an opportunity to debate sustainable development, its action plan and indicators in more detail. We hope that the list of priorities will include key environmental concerns such as bio-diversity, the need for adaptation and mitigation in the face of climate change, and the conservation of our natural resources.

David Melding: I welcome, like others, the method of working that our Committees have adopted. I record my thanks to the Chair of the Health and Social Services Committee, Kirsty Williams, for her non-partisan approach and the effective way that she has chaired our meetings. I also extend my commendation to the Minister. Although we engage in some partisan banter, most of the Committee's work is carried out on a productive cross-party basis. When the Committee has made criticisms and called for

nifer o'r cwestiynau ynglŷn â'r safle hwnnw ac y bydd yn mynd i'r afael â phryderon trigolion lleol. Dylid ymgorffori unrhyw ganlyniadau perthnasol i mewn i strategaeth wastraff ar gyfer Cymru yn y dyfodol.

Croesawn ran y Pwyllgor yn natblygiad fframwaith cynllunio gofodol cenedlaethol a'i fewnbwn pellach i Bolisi Cynllunio Cymru. Mae'r rhain yn allweddol. Cred Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales fod y fframwaith cynllunio gofodol cenedlaethol yn gyfle gwirioneddol i ddod â datblygiad lluosganolog i Gymru a'i fod yn galluogi lledaenu cyfleoedd yn decach ar draws Cymru. Edrychwn ymlaen at gyfraniad pellach y Pwyllgor yn y gwaith. Credwn hefyd fod Polisi Cynllunio Cymru o bwysigrwydd allweddol i waith y Cynulliad ac edrychwn ymlaen i drafodaethau pellach yn y Pwyllgor. Mae'n gyfle i sicrhau ein bod yn cyflwyno system gynllunio gadarnhaol i Gymru sydd yn mynd i'r afael ag anghenion yr amgylchedd, y gymdeithas a'r economi yng Nghymru. Mae'n hanfodol bod cynllunio yng Nghymru yn adlewyrchu ymrwymiad y Cynulliad i ddatblygu cynaliadwy.

Fodd bynnag, gresynwn na chawsom y cyfle i drafod unrhyw isdeddfwriaeth ddrafft. Dylai hynny fod yn rôl bwysig i'r Pwyllgorau Pwnc. Edrychwn ymlaen i gadarnhau'r blaenoriaethau ar gyfer 2002 yn yr Hydref a gobeithiwn y bydd cyfle i drafod datblygu cynaliadwy, ei gynllun gweithredu a'i ddangosyddion yn fwy manwl. Gobeithiwn y bydd y rhestr o flaenoriaethau yn cynnwys pryderon amgylcheddol allweddol megis bioamrywiaeth, yr angen i addasu a lleihau yn wyneb newid hinsawdd, a gwarchod ein hadnoddau naturiol.

David Melding: Croesawaf, fel eraill, y dull gwaith a fabwysiadwyd gan ein Pwyllgorau. Cofnodaf fy niolch i Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, Kirsty Williams, am ei hymagwedd amhleidiol a'r ffordd effeithiol y cadeiriodd ein cyfarfodydd. Estynnaf fy nghanmoliaeth i'r Gweinidog hefyd. Er ein bod yn ymhel â rhywfaint o gellwair pleidiol, cyflawnir y rhan fwyaf o waith y Pwyllgor ar sail trawsbleidiol adeiladol. Pan wnaeth y Pwyllgor feirniadaethau a galw am newid

Executive action to be changed, the Minister has, on occasion, taken that away and acted on it. I am thinking in particular of the adult mental health strategy, with which the Committee was initially unhappy. To the inconvenience of the administration, perhaps, we asked for certain aspects to be changed and for a different process to be adopted. In fairness to the Minister, she took action on that and responded comprehensively to our concerns. I also thank my fellow Committee members. For a long time I was the only Conservative on the Committee, but an independent Conservative now joins me. There are now two of us of Conservative disposition. However, one gains a great deal from Committee members who have different political views and experiences but have spent much time on the subject at hand. That is valuable, as I have sometimes left Committee meetings thinking about an issue from an angle that I would not have previously considered.

10:35 a.m.

As other Members have said this morning, the Committees' most valuable work is the major reporting on specific issues. I draw your attention to this year's report on the Children's Commissioner for Wales and the report of the Phillips inquiry into BSE. Those were major items that added great value to the Assembly's work and achieved a cross-party consensus on issues that, in other circumstances, could have been divisive. When people review the Assembly's work, they will concentrate on those areas and will see that these items stood the test of time, proving that the work of Committees is effective.

On the Committees' scrutiny role, piecemeal involvement in policy development results in Committees being submerged in detail without any obvious added value. I find it curious that the Assembly, as an elected institution, comprehensively delegates authority to the Executive. To say that we could claw back that authority via fortnightly meetings, when some policies receive the attention of Committees for 20 minutes or half an hour, is a parody of policy development. We should be honest and say

camau'r Weithrediaeth, ar adegau, mae'r Gweinidog wedi rhoi ystyriaeth i hynny ac wedi ymateb i'r sefyllfa. Yr wyf yn meddwl yn arbennig am strategaeth iechyd meddwl oedolion, yr oedd y Pwyllgor, ar y cychwyn, yn anhapus yn ei chylch. Er anghyfleustra i'r weinyddiaeth, efallai, gofynasom am newid rhai agweddau a mabwysiadu proses wahanol. Er tegwch i'r Gweinidog, gweithredodd ar hynny ac ymatebodd yn eang i'n pryderon. Diolchaf hefyd i'm cyd aelodau yn y Pwyllgor. Am gyfnod hir iawn, fi oedd yr unig Geidwadwr ar y Pwyllgor, ond bellach mae Ceidwadwr annibynnol yn ymuno â mi. Bellach, mae dau ohonom o anian Geidwadol. Fodd bynnag, mae rhywun yn dysgu cryn dipyn oddi wrth aelodau'r Pwyllgor sydd â safbwyntiau a phrofiadau gwleidyddol gwahanol ond sydd wedi treulio llawer o amser ar y pwnc dan sylw. Mae hynny'n werthfawr, ac weithiau yr wyf wedi gadael cyfarfodydd y Pwyllgor gan feddwl am fater o safbwynt na fyddwn wedi ei ystyried yn flaenorol.

Fel y dywedodd Aelodau eraill heddiw, gwaith mwyaf gwerthfawr y Pwyllgorau yw'r dasg bwysig o adrodd ar faterion penodol. Tynnaf eich sylw at adroddiad eleni ar y Comisiynydd Plant i Gymru ac adroddiad ymchwiliad Phillips i BSE. Yr oedd y rheini'n faterion pwysig a ychwynegodd werth mawr i waith y Cynulliad ac a gyflawnodd gonsensws trawsbleidiol ar faterion a allai, mewn amgylchiadau eraill, fod wedi hollti'r farn. Pan fydd pobl yn adolygu gwaith y Cynulliad, byddant yn canolbwyntio ar y meysydd hynny ac yn gweld bod y materion hyn yn arhosol, gan brofi bod gwaith y Pwyllgorau yn effeithiol.

O ran rôl craffu y Pwyllgorau, mae cyfrannu fesul tipyn at ddatblygu polisi yn arwain at y ffaith bod y Pwyllgorau yn ymdrin â gormod o fanylion heb fod iddynt unrhyw werth ychwanegol amlwg. Credaf ei bod yn rhyfedd bod y Cynulliad, fel sefydliad etholedig, yn dirprwyo awdurdod yn eang i'r Weithrediaeth. Mae dweud y gallem adfachu'r awdurdod hwnnw drwy gyfrwng cyfarfodydd bob pythefnos, pan fydd rhai polisiau yn derbyn sylw'r Pwyllgorau am 20 munud neu hanner awr, yn barodi o

that we do not do it in that way. We must concentrate on major investigations, as they involve genuine policy development. The work of the Health and Social Services Committee on the Children's Commissioner for Wales, the Phillips report and public involvement in the NHS, which is now being conducted, are excellent examples of innovative work that involves all parties, and involves the Committee working in collaboration with the Executive.

The Assembly's great innovation is not that we pretend that the Committees perform two functions, namely scrutiny and policy development, but that Committees can develop policies through their scrutiny role and, in all their work, the relevant Minister is a member of the Committee. That is a unique development—at least I do not know of another system that operates in this fashion. It gives Committees direct input into the work of the Executive, which is immensely valuable. I agree with the typically lucid remarks of Cynog Dafis that routine scrutiny should be conducted via a Minister's monthly report to Committee. Allocating more time, perhaps up to an hour, for the monthly report, would allow Subject Committees to consider more of the detail. It would also ease the burden of having numerous items on the agenda on which the Executive is working, and on which the Committee will not be able to spend the time necessary to give meaningful policy input. The Committees' scrutiny role is usually to examine policies brought forward by the Executive after consultation. We should not try to spike effective scrutiny by saying that Committees always sign up to policies; they sign up to policies developed through the major reports that they conduct.

Glyn Davies: I will concentrate my contribution on sustainable development. That is a cross-cutting issue that the Assembly has adopted as one of its main themes and, therefore, does not relate specifically to one Committee. It is responsible for the degree of enthusiasm that I, in my role as Chair of the Agriculture and

ddatblygiad polisi. Dylem fod yn onest a dweud nad dyna ein ffordd o weithio. Rhaid inni ganolbwyntio ar brif ymchwiliadau, am eu bod yn cynnwys datblygiad polisi gwirioneddol. Mae gwaith y pwyllgor iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar y Comisiynydd Plant i Gymru, adroddiad Phillips a rhan y cyhoedd yn yr NHS, sydd yn cael ei gynnal ar hyn o bryd, yn enghreifftiau gwych o waith dyfeisgar sydd yn cynnwys yr holl bleidiau, ac sydd yn cynnwys y Pwyllgor yn cydweithio â'r Weithrediaeth.

Nid yw dyfeisgarwch mawr y Cynulliad yn ymwneud â'r ffaith ein bod yn esgus bod y Pwyllgorau yn perfformio dwy swyddogaeth, sef craffu a datblygiad polisi, ond yn hytrach, y gall y Pwyllgorau ddatblygu polisïau drwy eu rôl craffu ac, yn eu holl waith, mae'r Gweinidog perthnasol yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor. Mae hwnnw'n ddatblygiad unigryw—neu o leiaf ni wn am system arall sydd yn gweithredu yn y fath fodd. Rhydd fewnbnw uniongyrchol i'r Pwyllgorau i waith y Weithrediaeth, sydd yn arbennig o werthfawr. Cytunaf â safbwyntiau nodweddiadol eglur Cynog Dafis y dylid cyflawni gwaith craffu rheolaidd drwy adroddiad misol gan Weinidog i'r Pwyllgor. Byddai neilltuo mwy o amser, hyd at awr o bosibl, ar gyfer yr adroddiad misol, yn caniatáu i'r Pwyllgorau Pwnc ystyried mwy o'r manylion. Byddai hefyd yn ysgafnhau'r baich o gael nifer o eitemau ar yr agenda y mae'r Weithrediaeth yn gweithio arnynt, ac na fyddai'r Pwyllgor yn gallu treulio'r amser angenrheidiol arnynt er mwyn rhoi mewnbwn polisi ystyrlon. Fel arfer, mae rôl craffu'r Pwyllgorau yn ymwneud ag archwilio polisïau a gyflwynir gan y Weithrediaeth ar ôl ymgynghoriad. Ni ddylem geisio rhoi terfyn ar graffu effeithiol drwy ddweud bod Pwyllgorau'n cymeradwyo polisïau bob amser; cymeradwyant bolisïau a ddatblygir drwy'r prif adroddiadau a gyflawnant.

Glyn Davies: Canolbwyntiaf ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Mae hwnnw'n fater trawsbynciol a fabwysiadwyd gan y Cynulliad fel un o'i brif themâu ac, felly, nid yw'n ymwneud yn benodol ag un Pwyllgor. Mae'n gyfrifol am y brwdfrydedd sydd gennyf i, fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig, am y

Rural Development Committee, have for the agri-environment scheme Tir Gofal. That contributes across the board to the Assembly's objectives. I expect to see the previous Minister for Agriculture and Rural Development—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I remind you that we are not discussing the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee. You may by all means talk about cross-cutting themes, but it must be based on the Committees that are the subject of this debate.

Glyn Davies: Had you waited a few minutes longer you would have understood the point I was trying to make. It was a congratulatory point about the previous Minister for Agriculture and Rural Development, who is now Chair of the Economic Development Committee. I associate Christine Gwyther with a commitment to sustainable development. It is one of my memories. I expect to see a real commitment to that particular National Assembly objective in the Economic Development Committee. Indeed, Phil Williams talked about the Committee's work, not only in including sustainable development in all its policies, but in using it as a way of developing economic prosperity in Wales. That has much potential. During the next year or so, I expect to see sustainable development emerging as an important part of the Committee's policy.

Equally, in terms of the Health and Social Services Committee, nothing has caused more damage to health, or more expenditure from the public purse, than the casual approach to development and its sustainability over the decades. The casual use of fossil fuels led to so much ill-health that I believe a commitment to sustainable development is crucial to developing the health of Welsh people. The same applies to education. The only way that people will understand the importance of sustainable development to every part of our lives is for it to become a cross-cutting educational theme, from the age of five until one walks out of university with a doctorate degree.

The Committee most involved in sustainable

cynllun amaeth-amgylcheddol Tir Gofal. Mae hwnnw'n cyfrannu yn gyffredinol at amcanion y Cynulliad. Disgwyliaf weld y cyn Weinidog dros Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Fe'ch atgoffaf nad ydym yn trafod y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig. Gallwch, ar bob cyfrif, siarad am themâu trawsbynciol, ond rhaid iddo fod yn seiliedig ar Bwyllgorau, sef pwnc y ddadl hon.

Glyn Davies: Pe baech wedi aros ychydig funudau yn hwy byddech wedi deall y pwynt yr oeddwn yn ceisio ei wneud. Yr oedd yn bwynt i longyfarch y cyn Weinidog dros Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig, sydd bellach yn Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Cysylltaf Christine Gwyther ag ymrwymiad i ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Mae'n un o'm hatgofion. Disgwyliaf weld gwir ymrwymiad i'r amcan arbennig hwnnw gan y Cynulliad yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Yn wir, siaradodd Phil Williams am waith y Pwyllgor, nid yn unig drwy gynnwys datblygu cynaliadwy yn ei holl bolisiau, ond drwy ei ddefnyddio fel ffordd o ddatblygu ffyniant economaidd yng Nghymru. Mae gan hynny lawer o botensial. Yn ystod y flwyddyn neu ddwy nesaf, disgwyliaf weld datblygu cynaliadwy yn dod yn rhan bwysig o bolisi'r Pwyllgor.

Yn yr un modd, o ran y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, nid oes dim wedi achosi mwy o niwed i iechyd, neu fwy o wariant o bwrs y wlad, na'r ymagwedd ddiotal tuag at ddatblygiad a'i gynaliadwyedd dros y degawdau. Arweiniodd y defnydd diotal o danwydd ffosil at gymaint o salwch fel y credaf fod ymrwymiad i ddatblygu cynaliadwy yn hanfodol er mwyn datblygu iechyd pobl Cymru. Mae'r un peth yn berthnasol i addysg. Yr unig ffordd y bydd pobl yn deall pwysigrwydd datblygu cynaliadwy i bob rhan o'n bywydau yw drwy sicrhau y daw yn thema addysgol trawsbynciol, o bump oed hyd nes y bydd person yn gadael prifysgol â doethuriaeth.

Y Pwyllgor sydd yn ymwneud fwyaf â

development is the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee. There are several aspects that I could discuss, but I specifically wish to focus on the planning process. I believe—and this is a criticism—that there is a tendency not to take on the difficult issues that relate to making sustainable development a serious policy matter.

I have talked in the past about the Newbridge-on-Wye wood-burning power station. I know that it has been called in for appeal and that there is a delay in dealing with that. I suspect—and I make an accusation, as I have done previously—that there is a tendency to deal with such difficult planning applications by using delay as a tactic in the hope that they will go away. That is partly what has happened at Newbridge-on-Wye, and part of how the Assembly is dealing with wind power applications in Montgomeryshire. It is a difficult issue, in relation to which we have planning applications that have been made since 1996.

I want the issue of sustainable development to be included in all of the Assembly's programmes, including the work of the four Committees being debated today. The Environment, Planning and Transport Committee should fulfil its role as a Committee concerned with planning, and not use the mechanism of delay, or of hoping that difficult situations will disappear, in relation to one of the most serious issues that we face.

Alun Cairns: Thank you for giving me the opportunity to speak to the Chamber on the Economic Development Committee and its work.

First, I recognise Val Feld's contribution as chair of the Economic Development Committee and in pursuing the agenda in her own context. I also take this opportunity to congratulate Christine Gwyther for her strong chairmanship of the Economic Development Committee at her first meeting only two weeks ago. She demonstrated strong management and indicated how the Committee might be run over the coming period.

datblygu cynaliadwy yw Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth. Mae sawl agwedd y gallwn eu trafod, ond dymunaf ganolbwyntio'n arbennig ar y broses gynllunio. Credaf—ac mae hon yn feirniadaeth—bod tuedd i beidio ag ymgymryd â'r materion anodd sydd yn ymwneud â gwneud datblygu cynaliadwy yn fater polisi difrifol.

Yn y gorffennol, siaradais am orsaf bŵer llosgi coed y Bontnewydd ar Wy. Gwn y cafodd ei galw i mewn ar gyfer apêl a bod oedi wrth ymdrin â hynny. Tybiaf—a gwnaf gyhuddiad, fel yr wyf wedi gwneud yn flaenorol—bod tuedd i ddelio â cheisiadau cynllunio anodd o'r fath drwy ddefnyddio oedi fel tacteg yn y gobaith y bydd y broblem yn diflannu. Dyma'n rhannol a ddigwyddodd ym Montnewydd ar Wy, ac mae'n rhan o'r ffordd y mae'r Cynulliad yn delio â cheisiadau pŵer gwynt yn Sir Drefaldwyn. Mae'n fater anodd, o ran y ffaith fod gennym geisiadau cynllunio a wnaethpwyd ers 1996.

Dymunaf weld datblygu cynaliadwy yn cael ei gynnwys ym mhob un o raglenni'r Cynulliad, yn cynnwys gwaith y pedwar Pwyllgor yr ydym yn cynnal dadl yn eu cylch heddiw. Dylai Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth gyflawni ei rôl fel Pwyllgor sydd yn ymwneud â chynllunio, a pheidio â defnyddio techneg oedi, neu obeithio y bydd sefyllfaoedd anodd yn diflannu, mewn perthynas ag un o'r materion mwyaf difrifol yr ydym yn ei wynebu.

Alun Cairns: Diolch am roi'r cyfle imi siarad yn y Siambr ar y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a'i waith.

Yn gyntaf, cydnabyddaf gyfraniad Val Feld fel cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ac am ddilyn yr agenda yn ei chyd-destun ei hun. Manteisiaf ar y cyfle hwn hefyd i longyfarch Christine Gwyther am ei chadeiryddiaeth gadarn o'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn ei chyfarfod cyntaf dim ond pythefnos yn ôl. Dangosodd reolaeth gadarn a dangosodd sut y byddai'r Pwyllgor yn cael ei redeg o bosibl dros y cyfnod sydd i ddod.

The Economic Development Committee is probably one of the Assembly's most politically charged Committees. David Melding commented on the Health and Social Services Committee and I listened with interest to what he had to say about the way that some Committees are scrutinising policy in a non-political way, where it is often difficult to identify which political parties individuals represent. That cannot be said about the Economic Development Committee. I refer you to the obvious examples of the national economic development strategy and Objective 1. That is where I feel the Committee confused its scrutiny and its policy development responsibilities. It seems clear that other Committees approach issues in a different way. I do not intend this as a positive point about the Economic Development Committee. From listening to other spokesmen's reports, I am interested in establishing how the Committees tackle issues and differentiate between their scrutiny and policy development roles. Some contributions have questioned the policy development role and whether it should lie with the Committee. The Economic Development Committee expressed strong views on the national economic development strategy. The Minister rejected those views. In the same way that we seek to inform the public that there is a difference between the Government of Wales and the Assembly as an institution, we must also recognise that there is a difference between the Minister's decision in the Committee and those pursued by the Committee itself. They need not necessarily be the same, but it gives a strong message to the Minister as to how the Committee, on a cross-party basis, feels in relation to some issues. I would hope and expect that the Minister would listen to them, but make clear that he or she is developing policy according to his or her own agenda and ideals.

10:45 a.m.

On responsibilities, we can also refer to Objective 1. Responsibility for Objective 1 was not clear from the outset. Committee members felt that they probably had a stronger influence on the agenda for

Y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, fwy na thebyg, yw un o Bwyllgorau mwyaf gwleidyddol y Cynulliad. Cafwyd sylwadau gan David Melding ar y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a gwrandawais â diddordeb ar yr hyn yr oedd ganddo i'w ddweud am y ffordd y mae rhai o'r Pwyllgorau yn craffu ar bolisi mewn ffordd anwleidyddol, lle y mae'n aml yn anodd gwybod pa bleidiau gwleidyddol y mae unigolion yn eu cynrychioli. Ni ellir dweud hynny am y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Fe'ch cyfeiriaf at yr enghreifftiau amlwg o'r strategaeth ddatblygu economaidd genedlaethol ac Amcan 1. Yn fy marn i, dyna lle y bu i'r Pwyllgor ddrysu rhwng ei gyfrifoldebau craffu a datblygu polisi. Ymddengys bod Pwyllgorau eraill yn mynd i'r afael â materion mewn ffordd wahanol. Ni fwriadaf i hwn fod yn bwynt cadarnhaol ynglŷn â'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Wrth wrando ar adroddiadau llefarwyr eraill, mae gennyf ddiddordeb gwybod sut yr aiff y Pwyllgorau i'r afael â'u rolau craffu a datblygu polisi a gwahaniaethu rhyngddynt. Cwestiynodd rai cyfraniadau y rôl datblygu polisi ac a ddylai hynny fod yn gyfrifoldeb i'r Pwyllgor. Mynegodd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd safbwyntiau cryf ar y strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol. Gwrthododd y Gweinidog y safbwyntiau hynny. Yn yr un modd ag y ceisiwn hysbysu'r cyhoedd bod gwahaniaeth rhwng Llywodraeth Cymru a'r Cynulliad fel sefydliad, rhaid inni hefyd gydnabod bod gwahaniaeth rhwng penderfyniad y Gweinidog yn y Pwyllgor a'r rhai hynny y mae'r Pwyllgor ei hunan yn eu ffafrio. Nid oes rhaid iddynt fod yr un rhai o reidrwydd, ond mae'n rhoi neges gryf i'r Gweinidog ynglŷn â sut y mae'r Pwyllgor, ar sail trawsbleidiol, yn teimlo mewn perthynas â rhai materion. Byddwn yn gobeithio ac yn disgwyl y byddai'r Gweinidog yn gwrandao arnynt, ond yn pwysleisio ei fod ef neu hi yn datblygu polisi yn unol â'i agenda a'i ddefnyddau personol ef neu hi.

O ran cyfrifoldebau, gallwn gyfeirio hefyd at Amcan 1. Nid oedd cyfrifoldeb dros Amcan 1 yn glir o'r cychwyn. Yr oedd aelodau'r Pwyllgor o'r farn bod ganddynt fwy na thebyg, fwy o ddylanwad ar yr agenda ar

Objective 1 than they did in reality. If it was pointed out at the outset that the Committee's views would be listened to, but would not influence thinking in the way that we had hoped, the political charge would have been taken away from the proceedings. The business support review pursued by the Economic Development Committee was done on a positive basis. Policy development was used and handed over to the Minister. We were fortunate in that the Minister was an integral part of the business support review, because he was not the Minister at the time that the policies were being developed. That might be a basis for a debate on policy development in the future. The Minister was an integral part of the review. That means that now that he is Minister, he is in a position where he influenced policy at that time in conjunction with other members of the Committee. I appreciate that time is tight, so I will close with those comments and in recognising Val's contribution in pursuing her agenda to the Committee. I wish Christine Gwyther the best for her period as Chair of the Economic Development Committee.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Before I call a vote on the motion, I thank the Chairs of Committees who were present during the debate, and in particular, the Ministers who were present. I am sure that Committee proceedings will be better as a result of that attendance.

gyfer Amcan 1 nag yr oedd ganddynt mewn gwirionedd. Pe pwysleisiwyd ar y cychwyn y byddai safbwyntiau'r Pwyllgor yn cael eu hystyried, ond na fyddent yn dylanwadu ar y meddylfryd yn y modd yr oeddem wedi gobeithio, ni fyddai cymaint o bwyslais gwleidyddol ar y trafodion. Cynhaliwyd yr adolygiad cymorth busnes a ddilynwyd gan y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ar sail gadarnhaol. Defnyddiwyd datblygiad polisi ac fe'i trosglwyddwyd i'r Gweinidog. Yr oeddem yn ffodus ynglŷn â'r ffaith y bu'r Gweinidog yn rhan ganolog o'r adolygiad cymorth busnes, oherwydd nad oedd yn Weinidog ar yr adeg y datblygwyd y polisiâu. Gallai hwnnw fod yn sail ar gyfer dadl ar ddatblygu polisi yn y dyfodol. Yr oedd y Gweinidog yn rhan ganolog o'r adolygiad. Mae hynny'n golygu gan ei fod bellach yn Weinidog, ei fod mewn sefyllfa lle y dylanwadodd ar bolisi ar yr adeg honno ar y cyd ag aelodau eraill y Pwyllgor. Gwerthfawrogaf bod amser yn dynn, felly gorffennaf gyda'r sylwadau hynny a chan gydnabod cyfraniad Val at ddilyn ei agenda i'r Pwyllgor. Dymunaf y gorau i Christine Gwyther ar gyfer ei chyfnod fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Cyn imi alw am bleidlais ar y cynnig, diolchaf i Gadeiryddion y Pwyllgorau a oedd yn bresennol yn ystod y ddadl, ac yn enwedig, i'r Gweinidogion a oedd yn bresennol. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd trafodion y Pwyllgorau yn well o ganlyniad i'r presenoldeb hwnnw.

Cynnig: O blaid 33, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion: For 33, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John

Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Richards, Rod
 Rogers, Peter
 Ryder, Janet
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Kirsty
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion adopted.*

Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru) Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru)

Polisiâu Ariannol, Cyllidol a Gwariant Cyhoeddus Llywodraeth y DU The UK Government's Monetary, Fiscal and Public Expenditure Policy

The Deputy Presiding Officer: As Dafydd Wigley is not present in the Chamber, I call on Cynog Dafis to propose the motion. I have selected amendments 1, 2, 3 and 4 in the names of William Graham and Alun Cairns.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Gan nad yw Dafydd Wigley yn bresennol yn y Siambr, galwaf ar Cynog Dafis i gynnig y cynnig. Yr wyf wedi dehol gwelliannau 1, 2, 3 a 4 yn enwau William Graham ac Alun Cairns.

Cynog Dafis: Cynigiaf fod

Cynog Dafis: I propose that

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn mynegi ei bryder difrifol ynghylch effaith polisiâu ariannol, cyllidol a gwariant cyhoeddus Llywodraeth y DU ar economi a chymunedau Cymru.

the National Assembly expresses its profound concern at the effect of UK Government monetary, fiscal and public expenditure policy on the economy and communities of Wales.

Dafydd Wigley sydd i fod i agor y ddadl ar ein rhan. Yr wyf yn siŵr y daw, ac yr wyf yn sicr y bydd ei araith yn rymus ac yn sylweddol.

Dafydd Wigley is supposed to open this debate on our behalf. I am sure that he will turn up, and I am sure that his speech will be powerful and substantial.

Mae dwy agwedd ar waith y Cynulliad hwn. Un agwedd yw llywodraethu Cymru orau ag y gellir o dan y trefniadau cyfansoddiadol sydd ohonynt. Nid ydynt yn drefniadau cyfansoddiadol da, ond gwnawn y gorau ohonynt. Dyna un agwedd ar waith y Cynulliad. Yr ail agwedd yw cynrychioli lles Cymru mewn perthynas â lefelau uwch llywodraeth. Yr ydym yn sôn am Lywodraeth

There are two aspects to this Assembly's work. One aspect is to govern Wales as best it can under the existing constitutional arrangements. They are not good constitutional arrangements, but we make the best of them. That is one aspect of this Assembly's work. The second aspect is to represent the needs of Wales in relation to the higher levels of Government. We are talking

y Deyrnas Unedig a'r Undeb Ewropeaidd. 'Llais i Gymru' oedd enw'r Papur Gwyn a gyhoeddwyd cyn llunio Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru a chyn iddo fynd drwy'r Senedd yn Llundain.

about the United Kingdom Government and the European Union. 'A Voice for Wales' was the name of the White Paper that was published before the Government of Wales Bill was drawn up and before it went through Parliament in London.

Yr wyf yn ymfalchïo'n fawr yng nghyfraniad Aelodau Plaid Cymru i'r cyntaf o'r ddwy swyddogaeth hynny, sef ceisio llywodraethu Cymru orau a allwn. Ni all unrhyw un wadu cyfoeth a chreadigedd cyfraniad Aelodau Plaid Cymru i'r gwaith hwnnw.

I am extremely proud of Plaid Cymru Members' contribution to the first of those two functions, namely attempting to govern Wales as best we can. No-one can deny the wealth and creativity of Plaid Cymru Members' contribution to that work.

Serch hynny, mae'r ddadl hon yn ymwneud â'r ail swyddogaeth, sef cynrychioli lles Cymru ar lefelau uwch Llywodraeth. Â ninnau'n wynebu Llywodraeth Llafur Newydd newydd yn San Steffan—ac nid oes amheuaeth ynglŷn â hynny—mae'n amser priodol i'r Cynulliad, ar ran pobl Cymru, ddatgan, fel y noda ein cynnig, ei bryder dwfn am effaith polisi Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Gyfunol ar economi a chymunedau Cymru.

However, this debate relates to the second function, namely representing the needs of Wales at higher levels of Government. Now that we face a new New Labour Government at Westminster—and there is no doubt about that—it is an opportune time for the Assembly, on behalf of the people of Wales, to state, as our motion notes, its profound concern about the effect of the United Kingdom Government's policy on the economy and communities of Wales.

Mae Cymru wedi dioddef drwg-effeithiau 22 mlynedd o Thatcheriaeth. Yr oedd datganiadau Llafur ddoe yn bygwth pum mlynedd pellach o'r fath. Dyna'r broblem. Mae tystiolaeth y camlywodraethu a ddioddefodd Cymru dros y cyfnod hwnnw i'w gweld o bob tu.

Wales has suffered the harmful effects of 22 years of Thatcherism. Labour's statements yesterday threatened a further five such years. That is the problem. The evidence of the misgovernment that Wales suffered during that period is all around us.

Gwelwn ddirywiad y diwydiannau gweithgynhyrchu a dur ac argyfwng ym maes amaethyddiaeth a thwristiaeth. Mae gwahaniaeth grotésg rhwng perfformiad economi Cymru a de-ddwyrain Lloegr, ac mae gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn gwegian o dan y beichiau. Mae buddsoddi cyhoeddus, fel cyfran o gynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth, yn is o dan Lafur Newydd nag yr oedd o dan y Torïaid. Mae'r tlotaf yn ein cymdeithas yn talu cyfran fwy o'u hincwm yn drethi na'r cyfoethocaf, ac mae gan Gymru fwy na'i siâr o'r rheini.

We see the deterioration of the manufacturing and steel industries and a crisis in agriculture and tourism. There is a grotesque difference between the performance of the Welsh economy and that of south-east England, and public services are buckling under the burden. Public investment, as a proportion of gross domestic product, is lower under New Labour than it was under the Tories. The poorest in our society are paying a larger proportion of their income in taxation than the richest, and Wales has more than its fair share of those.

Pan fo gennych bolisiau sydd yn niweidio'r tlotaf mewn cymdeithas, yr ydych hefyd yn niweidio economi'r ardaloedd lle mae llawer o bobl dlawd yn byw. Pan fo gennych bolisi o gadw pensiynau yn isel, yr ydych yn niweidio economi ardaloedd lle ceir llawer o bensynwyr. Felly, mae polisiau sydd yn

When you have policies that damage the poorest in society, you also damage the economy of areas where many poor people live. When you have a policy of keeping pensions low, you damage the economy of areas where there are many pensioners. Therefore, policies that are bad in terms of

ddrwg o ran cyfartaledd cymdeithasol hefyd yn ddrwg o ran cyfartaledd rhanbarthol.

Un o benderfyniadau tyngedfennol Llafur Newydd cyn dod i rym yn 1997 oedd peidio â chodi trethi personol. Datganodd ymlaen llaw na wnâi hynny, hyd yn oed mewn perthynas â'r cyfoethocaf mewn cymdeithas. Effaith hynny, yn gyntaf, oedd ymwadu â dull pwysig o godi cyllid ychwanegol i'r pwrs cyhoeddus. Yn ail, ymwadodd Llafur â dull allweddol o ailddosbarthu adnoddau i helpu'r tlawd.

Nid oes ryfedd, felly, fod y bwlch rhwng cyfoethog a thlawd wedi cynyddu o dan Lafur Newydd. Nid yw Prif Weinidog y Deyrnas Gyfunol yn poeni o gwbl am hynny. Datganodd hynny yr wythnos hon. Nid ei bwrpas yw ceisio cau'r bwlch rhwng y cyfoethog a'r tlawd. Mae ef yn wahanol i Brif Weinidog Cymru yn hynny o beth, ond Prif Weinidog y Deyrnas Gyfunol sydd yn penderfynu ar faterion o'r fath.

Yn drydydd, mae'r ymrwymiad hwnnw'n golygu gorddibyniaeth ar drethi anuniongyrchol, sydd yn llawer mwy annheg eu heffaith ar y tlawd a'r ardaloedd tlotaf. Dyna pam y taflwyd wŷ i wyneb John Prescott ddoe yn y Rhyl.

Pan oedd Llafur Newydd yn wrthblaid, dywedai o hyd fod treth ar werth ar danwydd cartref yn enghraifft o drethu anuniongyrchol anghyfiawn. Dywedai hynny hyd syrffed ond, ers dod i rym, mae wedi gweithredu yn wahanol.

Tynnaf sylw at agwedd arall ar effeithiau yr ymrwymiad i beidio â chodi trethi personol. Os nad ydych yn fodlon defnyddio trethi personol ar y cyfoethog fel dull o reoli chwyddiant a thynnu'r gwres o'r economi mewn lleoedd fel de-ddwyrain Lloegr, rhaid ichi ddibynnu ar raddfeydd llog i wneud hynny.

Mae Banc Lloegr, felly, wedi cael gorchymyn gan y Canghellor a'r Llywodraeth i gadw chwyddiant yn isel, heb ystyried unrhyw beth arall. Dyna'r amcan mawr. Nid yw'r Llywodraeth wedi gwneud unrhyw beth drwy gyfrwng y system drethiant neu bolisi ariannol i arafu

social equality are also bad in terms of regional equality.

One of New Labour's fateful decisions before coming to power in 1997 was not to raise personal taxes. It stated beforehand that it would not do so, even in relation to the richest in society. The effect of that, first, was to renounce an important means of raising additional funding for the public purse. Secondly, Labour renounced a key method of redistributing resources to help the poor.

It is no wonder, therefore, that the gap between rich and poor has increased under New Labour. The United Kingdom Prime Minister is not at all worried about that. He stated so this week. His purpose is not to try to close the gap between rich and poor. He is different to the First Minister in that respect, but it is the United Kingdom Prime Minister who decides on such issues.

Thirdly, that commitment means over-dependence on indirect taxation, which is far more inequitable in its effect on the poor and the poorest areas. That is why an egg was thrown in John Prescott's face yesterday in Rhyl.

When New Labour was in opposition, it said repeatedly that value-added tax on household fuel was an example of unjust indirect taxation. It said that ad nauseam, but, since coming to power, it has acted differently.

I draw attention to another aspect of the effects of the commitment not to raise personal taxation. If you are not prepared to use personal taxes on the rich as a means of controlling inflation and taking the heat out of the economy in areas such as south-east England, you have to depend on interest rates to do so.

The Bank of England, therefore, has been ordered by the Chancellor and the Government to keep inflation low, without any other considerations. That is the big aim. The Government has not done anything through the taxation system or fiscal policy to slow down inflation. The pressure is

chwyddiant. Mae'r pwysau felly ar Fanc Lloegr i godi cyfraddau llog er mwyn rheoli chwyddiant mewn rhannau o'r wlad lle ceir gordwymo.

10:55 a.m.

Beth yw effaith hynny? Mae'n cledro yn arbennig ar ardaloedd lle mae'r economi, nid yn chwyddo, nid yn gor-dwymo, ond yn dioddef marweidd-dra. Dyna'r sefyllfa yng Nghymru—ardaloedd nad ydynt yn dioddef chwyddiant o gwbl, ond sydd yn dioddef dachwyddiant. Effeithir arnynt gan lefelau llog uchel. Mae'n cynyddu costau busnes a diwydiant. Golyga nad yw pobl yn gwneud incwm i dalu treth incwm arno os ydynt yn rhedeg busnes mewn amgylchiadau o'r fath.

Yn ail, mae'n cryfhau'r bunt. Gwelir effeithiau trychinebus hyn ar draws Cymru—o Lynebwy i Ben Llŷn, o Bowys i Fae Ceredigion. Yr hyn sydd yn ofnadwy yw bod Llafur Newydd ddoe wedi addo gwneud rhagor o'r un peth. Dyna'n union y mae wedi ei wneud—addo peidio â chodi trethi personol. Addewid meddai Llafur; bygythiad meddwn i.

Tynnaf sylw Aelodau'r grŵp Llafur at lyfr rhagorol—

Jonathan Morgan: I would like to pick up on one point. You talk about redistribution and the fact that the Labour Party is not committed to increasing personal taxation. Looking at the past 12 months, when the Inland Revenue has recently said that we are now paying £52 billion extra in tax a year compared with 1997, how much more tax do you think should be taken from the people of this country to put into the Exchequer? That money belongs to the people of this country and, moreover, to the wealth creators who create the jobs and industries that are now suffering as a result of this taxation.

Cynog Dafis: Credwn y dylai mwy o arian gael ei gymryd i'r pwrs cyhoeddus drwy'r system drethi. Mae derbyniadau trethiant Prydain gyda'r isaf yn Ewrop—rhywbeth tebyg i 37 y cant o'r cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth sydd yn cael ei gymryd mewn trethiant. Mae lefel gwariant cyhoeddus ym

therefore on the Bank of England to raise interest rates in order to control inflation in parts of the country where over-heating is occurring.

What is the effect of that? It hammers in particular on areas where the economy is not expanding, nor overheating, but suffering from stagnation. That is the situation in Wales—areas that are not suffering from inflation at all, but from deflation. They are being affected by high levels of interest. It increases the costs to business and industry. It means that people are not making an income on which to pay income tax if they are running a business in such circumstances.

Secondly, it strengthens the pound. The disastrous effects of this are to be seen the length and breadth of Wales—from Ebbw Vale to the Lleyn Peninsula, from Powys to Cardigan Bay. What is dreadful is that New Labour yesterday promised to do more of the same. That is exactly what it has done—promised not to raise personal taxes. Labour calls this a promise; I call it a threat.

May I draw the attention of Members of the Labour group to an excellent book—

Jonathan Morgan: Hoffwn godi un pwynt. Yr ydych yn sôn am aiddosbarthu a'r ffaith nad yw'r Blaid Lafur yn ymrwymedig i gynyddu trethiant personol. Wrth edrych ar y 12 mis diwethaf, pan ddywedodd Cyllid y Wlad yn ddiweddar ein bod yn talu £52 biliwn y flwyddyn yn ychwanegol mewn treth o'i gymharu â 1997, faint yn rhagor o dreth y credwch y dylai gael ei chymryd oddi wrth bobl y wlad hon i'w rhoi i'r Trysorlys? Mae'r arian hwnnw yn perthyn i bobl y wlad hon ac, ar ben hynny, i'r creawdwy'r cyfoeth sydd yn creu'r swyddi a'r diwydiannau sydd yn dioddef erbyn hyn o ganlyniad i'r trethiant hwn.

Cynog Dafis: We believe that more money should be placed in the public purse through the taxation system. Britain's tax receipts are among the lowest in Europe—something like 37 per cent of gross domestic product is taken in taxation. The level of public expenditure in Britain as a proportion of GDP is also among

Mhrydain fel cyfran o CMC hefyd gyda'r isaf yn Ewrop. Nid yw ond yn mynd i godi i tua 40.5 y cant erbyn diwedd cyfnod yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant. Dyma Lywodraeth sydd wedi ymrwymo i beidio â chynyddu gwariant cyhoeddus, ac mae'r Torïaid yn ei chymeradwyo yn hynny. Yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd yw—a gwelaf bwynt y Torïaid yn y fan hon—oherwydd ei gwrthodiad i godi trethiant personol, ei bod wedi gorfod codi trethi anuniongyrchol. Dyna'r holl bwynt. Mae trethi anuniongyrchol yn taro'r tlawd ac ardaloedd difreintiedig lawer iawn mwy nag y mae trethi personol. Mae'r effeithiau i'w gweld ar bob llaw, felly.

Yr wyf am dynnu sylw Aelodau'r Cynulliad, ac aelodau'r grŵp Llafur Newydd yn arbennig, at lyfr rhagorol un o'u cymrodyr, Ted Rowlands. Yr oeddwn i a Ted Rowlands yn cyd-frecwasta rywfaint pan oeddem yn y Senedd, ac yn cael sgysiau diddorol pan oedd wrthi'n ysgrifennu'r llyfr hwn. Mae'n sôn am ymateb Llywodraethau'r Deyrnas Unedig i'r argyfwng economaidd a chymdeithasol yng Nghymoedd y De yn yr 1930au, yr 1940au a'r 1950au. Disgrifia ymateb Llywodraeth Lafur 1945-1951—Llywodraeth wirioneddol sosialaidd, a oedd wedi ymrwymo mewn difrif i ailddosbarthu cyfoeth—i'r argyfwng, ar ffurf polisi datblygu rhanbarthol egniol ac effeithiol. Dyna ddisgrifiad Ted Rowlands. Bryd hynny, yr oedd cymunedau diwydiannol Cymru yn cyfrif i'r Blaid Lafur, ond nid ydynt mwyach. Arall yw'r targed etholiadol. Yr ydym i gyd yn gwybod lle mae strategaeth Llafur Newydd yn anelu.

Yr oeddwn am ddal llyfr Ted Rowlands o flaen y camera, ond yr wyf wedi ei adael ar fy sedd, gan fy mod wedi dod at y ddarllenfa ar dipyn o frys. Teitl y llyfr yw *Something Must be Done*, sef dyfyniad gan Dywysog Cymru ar y pryd. Mae'n drawiadol yn aml bod tywysogion Cymru wedi dangos llawer mwy o gydymdeimlad â lles economaidd Cymru nag y gwnaeth Prif Weinidogion Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig. Yr oedd geiriau Tywysog Cymru yn ôl yn yr 1930au, nid oes amheuaeth, yn ddylanwadol—'something must be done'. Neges Tony Blair

the lowest in Europe. It will only increase to about 40.5 per cent by the end of the period of the comprehensive spending review. Here is a Government that is committed to not increasing public expenditure, and the Tories commend it for that. What has happened is—and I see the Tories' point here—that because of its refusal to raise personal taxes, it has had to raise indirect taxes. That is the whole point. Indirect taxes hit the poorest and deprived areas far more than personal taxes. The effects are to be seen everywhere, therefore.

I should like to draw the attention of Assembly Members, and the members of the New Labour group in particular, to an excellent book written by one of their fellows, Ted Rowlands. Ted Rowlands and I used to breakfast together sometimes when we were in Parliament, and had interesting conversations when he was writing this book. It describes the response of United Kingdom Governments to the economic and social crisis in the south Wales Valleys during the 1930s, the 1940s and the 1950s. It describes the response of the 1945-1951 Labour Government—a truly socialist Government, which was seriously committed to redistributing wealth—to the crisis, by means of an energetic and effective regional development policy. That is Ted Rowlands's description. At that time, Wales's industrial communities were important to the Labour Government, but that is no longer the case. The electoral target is now different. We all know where the New Labour strategy is aimed.

I was going to hold Ted Rowlands's book up before the camera, but I have left it on my seat, as I came to the lectern in a hurry. The book's title is *Something Must be Done*, which is a quotation from the then Prince of Wales. It is often striking that the princes of Wales have shown far more sympathy for Wales's economic wellbeing than the Prime Ministers of the United Kingdom's Governments. The Prince of Wales's words back in the 1930s, there is no doubt, were influential—'something must be done'. Tony Blair's message to the people of Wales

i bobl Cymru ddoe oedd, *nothing must be done*. Bydd ein heconomi a'n cymunedau yn talu'r pris am y pum mlynedd nesaf, y pum mlynedd blin sydd o'n blaenau, oni bai bod pobl Cymru yn datgan eu dicter a'u penderfyniad i gael cyfiawnder i'w gwlad. Daw cyfle iddynt wneud hynny yn ystod yr wythnosau nesaf.

Alun Cairns: I propose the following amendments in the name of William Graham. Amendment 1: add as a new sentence to the end of the motion:

It recognises that the tax burden for the UK has risen from 35.2 per cent of gross domestic product or £104 billion in 1996/97 to 38.2 per cent of GDP or £156 billion in 2000/01. An increase of £1 billion a week, that has resulted in the UK becoming one of the highest tax economies in the developed world.

I propose amendment 2. Add as a new sentence to the end of the motion:

It calls upon the Liberal Democrat-Labour administration to condemn the:

imposition of 'stealth taxation' which has reduced the competitiveness of our industries and impeded entrepreneurial development;

level of tax on fuel, which penalises our rural communities and all those who rely upon their own transport;

failure to fully commit towards Objective 1; and the

inadequate funding given in response to flooding, foot and mouth, tourism and Corus.

I propose amendment 3. Add as a new sentence to the end of the motion:

It calls upon the Liberal Democrat-Labour administration to abandon all plans to introduce a local business rate tax.

yesterday was, nothing must be done. Our economy and our communities will pay the price for the next five years, the next five painful years that we face, unless the people of Wales demonstrate their anger and determination to secure justice for their country. They will have an opportunity to do so during the coming weeks.

Alun Cairns: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw William Graham. Gwelliant 1: ychwaneger fel brawddeg newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Mae'n cydnabod bod baich treth y DU wedi codi o 35.2 y cant o'r cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth neu £104 biliwn ym 1996/97 i 38.2 y cant o'r cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth neu £156 biliwn yn 2000/01. Mae hyn gyfystyr â chynnydd o £1 biliwn yr wythnos, sydd yn golygu bod y DU erbyn hyn yn un o'r economïau â'r trethi uchaf yn y byd datblygedig.

Cynigiau welliant 2. Ychwaneger fel brawddeg newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Mae'n galw ar y weinyddiaeth Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol-Lafur i gondemnio'r canlynol:

gosod 'trethi trwy'r drws cefn' sydd wedi gwneud ein diwydiannau'n llai cystadleuol ac wedi rhwystro datblygiad entrepreneuriaidd;

lefel y dreth ar danwydd, sydd yn cosbi'n cymunedau gwledig a phawb sydd yn dibynnu ar eu cludiant eu hunain;

peidio ag ymrwymo'n llwyr i Amcan 1; ac

yr arian annigonol a roddwyd mewn ymateb i lifogydd, clwy'r traed a'r genau, twristiaeth a Corus.

Cynigiau welliant 3. Ychwaneger fel brawddeg newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Mae'n galw ar y weinyddiaeth Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol-Lafur i roi'r gorau i'w holl gynlluniau i gyflwyno treth fusnes leol.

I propose amendment 4. Add as a new sentence to the end of the motion:

It acknowledges that the UK policy to fund initiatives, particularly in health and education, directly to hospitals and schools allows these service providers to more accurately forecast their income and to be able to plan more effectively.

A commitment was made four years ago to prioritise education, education, education. After the last four years' stealth tax increases, a more accurate phrase would have been tax, tax, tax. That is the reality of the economy after the last four years and the massive tax increases that we have experienced. Amendment 1 points out clearly—and this is a point on which I tried to intervene during Cynog Dafis's statement—that the tax take in relation to GDP per head in the United Kingdom has increased from 35.2 per cent to 38.2 per cent. As a result, that makes us one of the most highly taxed economies in the developed world.

Cynog Dafis: Mae'n rhaid ei fod yn anghywir ar y pwynt hwnnw. Nid yw'r Deyrnas Unedig yn un o'r gwledydd sydd yn cael ei threthu drymaf yn y byd datblygedig. Mae'n un o'r gwledydd yn Ewrop sydd yn cael ei threthu leiaf. Mae'r ffigurau yn dangos hynny yn ddigon clir. Rhywbeth tebyg i 37 neu 38 y cant o CMC y pen sydd yn mynd mewn trethiant. Dyna pam yr ydym yn y picil hwn. Ei blaidd ef, wrth gwrs, a osododd y sylfeini yn effeithiol dros gyfnod o 18 mlynedd.

Alun Cairns: Nid wyf yn fodlon gadael rhwydd hynt i Cynog wneud datganiad felly ar ôl i drethi godi o £1 biliwn yr wythnos. Dangos hyn fod trethi yn codi yn gyflymach ym Mhrydain Fawr nag yn unrhyw le arall drwy'r byd datblygiedig. Mae'n dangos hefyd uchelgais Plaid Cymru wrth iddynt edrych tuag Ewrop yn lle ystyried y byd i gyd wrth i'r economi ddatblygu yn economi fyd eang ac nid economi Ewropeaidd yn unig.

The Government of Wales is striving to develop business-friendly policies, without too much success. However, efforts are at least being made to develop those policies in Wales. The Minister is struggling with the

Cynigiau welliant 4. Ychwaneger fel brawddeg newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Mae'n cydnabod bod polisi'r DU i ariannu mentrau yn uniongyrchol, yn arbennig ym meysydd iechyd ac addysg, drwy roi arian i ysbytai ac ysgolion yn galluogi'r darparwyr gwasanaeth hyn i ragweld eu hincwm yn gywirach a chynllunio'n fwy effeithiol.

Gwnaethpwyd ymrwymiad bedair blynedd yn ôl i flaenoriaethu addysg, addysg, addysg. Ar ôl y cynnydd mewn trethi drwy'r drws cefn dros y pedair blynedd diwethaf, byddai treth, treth, treth wedi bod yn ymadrodd mwy priodol. Dyna realiti'r economi ar ôl y pedair blynedd diwethaf a'r cynnydd aruthrol mewn trethi a gawsom. Mae gwelliant 1 yn nodi'n eglur—ac mae hwn yn bwynt y ceisiais ymyrryd arno yn ystod datganiad Cynog Dafis—bod y derbyniadau treth mewn perthynas â CMC y pen yn y Deyrnas Unedig wedi cynyddu o 35.2 y cant i 38.2 y cant. O ganlyniad, yr ydym yn un o'r economïau sydd â'r trethi uchaf yn y byd datblygedig.

Cynog Dafis: He must be wrong on that point. The United Kingdom is not one of the most heavily taxed countries in the developed world. It is one of the least taxed countries in Europe. The figures show that clearly enough. Something like 37 or 38 per cent of GDP per head goes in taxation. That is why we are in this mess. It was his party, of course, which laid the foundations effectively over a period of 18 years.

Alun Cairns: I am not prepared to let Cynog get away with that statement after taxes rose £1 billion a week. That shows that taxes are rising quicker in Great Britain than anywhere else in the developed world. It also shows Plaid Cymru's ambition as it looks toward Europe instead of considering the whole world as the economy develop into a global economy and not just a European economy.

Mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ymdrechu i ddatblygu polisiau sydd yn ystyriol o fusnesau, heb lawer o lwyddiant. Fodd bynnag, o leiaf gwneir ymdrechion i ddatblygu'r polisiau hynny yng Nghymru.

national economic development strategy to foster and encourage a strong economy, but steps are effectively being kicked from under them by the high tax economy. Our first amendment focuses on the impact and effect of the UK Government's fiscal policy on our economy. How can the WDA attract inward investors when taxes on business have increased by more than £5 billion per annum over the last four years? That is the reality. The WDA, during the 18 years of Conservative Government, and with just 5 per cent of the UK population in Wales, attracted 25 per cent of the UK's inward investment. We managed to achieve that success. However, the proportion of inward investment is not in Wales's favour as much as previously. It has dramatically reduced because of the high tax policy of this administration. We do not see large-scale inward investment coming to Wales or to the UK in the way that it did when we had a low tax economy. That is the reality. To add insult to injury, where the Assembly can make a difference, the Minister, supported by all other parties, including the nationalists, wants to introduce a business rate tax.

This amendment has been tabled on a number of occasions since it was discussed at the Business Partnership Council some months ago. However, it has never been answered satisfactorily. Therefore, I put it to the Minister who will respond and to every other party that a new local business rate tax will destroy small business and drive larger business away from Wales like never before. That is the reality. We need to foster the policies that encourage business to come to Wales. To introduce a local business rate tax on top of the uniform business rate will destroy the small businesses that we are trying to foster.

Janet Davies: That proposal is subject to consultation and agreement with local businesses. It would only exist to improve the economic infrastructure, and so on, of the local area. That was put in black and white.

Alun Cairns: I am grateful for your point. However, every businessperson to whom I

Mae'r Gweinidog yn ymgodymu â'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol i feithrin ac annog economi gref, ond caiff y camau eu dwyn oddi wrthynt mewn gwirionedd gan economi o drethi uchel. Mae ein gwelliant cyntaf yn canolbwyntio ar effaith polisi cyllidol Llywodraeth y DU ar ein heconomi. Sut y gall y WDA ddenu mewnfuddsoddwyr pan fo trethi ar fusnesau wedi cynyddu mwy na £5 biliwn y flwyddyn dros y pedair blynedd diwethaf? Dyna'r realiti. Denodd y WDA, yn ystod y 18 mlynedd o Lywodraeth Geidwadol, a chyda dim ond 5 y cant o boblogaeth y DU yng Nghymru, 25 y cant o fewnfuddsoddiad y DU. Llwyddasom i gyflawni'r llwyddiant hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, nid yw cyfran y mewnfuddsoddi o blaid Cymru gymaint ag y bu o'r blaen. Mae wedi lleihau'n ddramatig oherwydd polisi trethi uchel y weinyddiaeth hon. Ni welwn fewnfuddsoddi ar raddfa fawr yn dod i Gymru nac i'r DU yn y ffordd y gwnaeth pan oedd gennym economi o drethi isel. Dyna'r realiti. I rwbio halen i'r briw, lle y gall y Cynulliad wneud gwahaniaeth, mae'r Gweinidog, gyda chefnogaeth pob plaid arall, gan gynnwys y cenedlaetholwyr, am gyflwyno treth fusnes.

Cyflwynwyd y gwelliant hwn ar nifer o achlysuron ers iddo gael ei drafod yn y Cyngor Partneriaeth Busnes rai misoedd yn ôl. Fodd bynnag, ni chafodd ei ateb yn foddhaol erioed. Felly, awgrymaf i'r Gweinidog a fydd yn ymateb ac i bob plaid arall y bydd treth fusnes leol newydd yn dinistrio busnesau bach ac yn gyrru busnesau mwy allan o Gymru mewn ffordd nas gwelwyd erioed o'r blaen. Dyna'r realiti. Mae angen inni feithrin y polisiau sydd yn annog busnesau i ddod i Gymru. Bydd cyflwyno treth fusnes leol ar ben y dreth fusnes unffurf yn dinistrio'r busnesau bach y ceisiwn eu meithrin.

Janet Davies: Mae'r cynnig hwnnw yn destun ymgynghoriad a chytundeb â busnesau lleol. Dim ond i wella seilwaith economaidd, ac yn y blaen, yr ardal leol y byddai'n bodoli. Rhoddwyd hynny ar ddu a gwyn.

Alun Cairns: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich pwynt. Fodd bynnag, mae pob person busnes

have spoken is worried about the potential implications of such a new tax. The reality is that if we want businesses to prosper, we need to tax them less. They need the opportunity to invest. Paying less tax gives businesses more of an opportunity to invest and plan for the future. I ask the Minister to tackle these points explicitly in responding to this debate. It is not good to have an economy that is seeking to develop, with economic drivers such as small businesses, in a situation where there is so much uncertainty as a result of this. I cannot help thinking that this point has been ignored because of the general election campaign. The amendments have been tabled time and again, and I ask the Minister to respond.

11:05 a.m.

Plaid Cymru always calls for higher taxes. I am not sure whether it is higher or lower than its previous calls, but it is calling at present for a tax rate of 50 per cent. The reality is that a 50 per cent tax rate would drive entrepreneurs out of Wales. However, were the Liberal Democrats to manage to influence the UK Government, they would ensure that they were driven not only out of Wales, but out of the United Kingdom. We remember the brain drain of the 1970s and, were these parties to have their way, that would happen once again.

Brian Gibbons *rose—*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Will you give way to Brian Gibbons? I remind Members that, if they wish to contribute, they should not seek to intervene. Many Members wish to speak in this debate, but perhaps there will not be enough time for everyone to do so.

Brian Gibbons: In view of what you have said, Alun, can you explain why the level of self-employment in Wales is increasing at a significantly higher rate than the rest of the UK? Why is it also that the number of foreign firms in Wales survive for a much longer period than in other regions of the United Kingdom, with the exception of Northern Ireland?

y siaradais â hwy yn gofidio ynglŷn â goblygiadau posibl treth newydd o'r fath. Y realiti yw bod angen inni godi llai o dreth ar fusnesau os ydym am iddynt ffynnu. Mae angen y cyfle arnynt i fuddsoddi. Mae talu llai o dreth yn rhoi mwy o gyfle i fusnesau fuddsoddi a chynllunio ar gyfer y dyfodol. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog fynd i'r afael â'r pwyntiau hyn mewn ffordd bendant wrth ymateb i'r ddadl hon. Nid yw'n beth da cael economi sydd yn ceisio datblygu, gyda busnesau bach a'u tebyg yn llywio'r economi, mewn sefyllfa lle mae cymaint o ansicrwydd o ganlyniad i hyn. Ni allaf lai na meddwl fod y pwynt hwn wedi ei anwybyddu oherwydd ymgyrch yr etholiad cyffredinol. Cyflwynwyd y gwelliannau dro ar ôl tro, a gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ymateb.

Mae Plaid Cymru bob amser yn gofyn am drethi uwch. Nid wyf yn sicr a yw'n uwch neu'n is na'i geisiadau blaenorol, ond ar hyn o bryd mae'n gofyn am gyfradd treth o 50 y cant. Y realiti yw y byddai cyfradd treth o 50 y cant yn gyrru entrepreneuriaid allan o Gymru. Fodd bynnag, pe bai'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn llwyddo i ddylanwadu ar Lywodraeth y DU, byddent yn sicrhau nid yn unig y caent eu gyrru allan o Gymru, ond o'r Deyrnas Unedig. Cofiw'n am ymfudiad ymennydd y 1970au a phe bai'r pleidiau hyn yn cael eu ffordd eu hunain, byddai hynny'n digwydd unwaith eto.

Brian Gibbons *a gododd—*

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: A ildiwch i Brian Gibbons? Atgoffaf yr Aelodau, os ydynt yn dymuno cyfrannu, na ddylent geisio ymyrryd. Mae llawer o'r Aelodau yn dymuno siarad yn y ddadl hon, ond efallai na fydd digon o amser i bawb wneud hynny.

Brian Gibbons: Yng ngoleuni'r hyn a ddywedaso, Alun, a allwch egluro pam bod lefel hunan-gyflogaeth yng Nghymru yn cynyddu ar gyfradd sylweddol uwch na gweddill y DU? Pam hefyd bod nifer y cwmnïau tramor yng Nghymru yn goroesi am gyfnod hwy o lawer nag y maent mewn rhanbarthau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig, ac eithrio Gogledd Iwerddon?

Alun Cairns: Self-employment is increasing in Wales. However, we must remember that, in the first five weeks of this year, 5,000 people were made redundant and, because of the economic prospects over which this administration has presided, there is no alternative to anything other than self-employment. That is the reality.

The most dynamic economy will be the most flexible economy. The most flexible economy will have the lowest taxes. Lower taxes will provide further prosperity that can then be distributed. By lowering taxes it may well be that the total tax take, as a proportion, will be less, but the total tax sum will be far greater.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Your time has come to an end. I will allow one final sentence.

Alun Cairns: I can respect the point of view expressed by Plaid Cymru in this motion, and I can also respect part of the point of view expressed by the Liberal Democrats because they are honest in their call for higher taxes.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Your time has now come to an end. Many Members wish to contribute to this debate and, therefore, I appeal for succinct and short contributions.

Janet Ryder: The House of Commons Select Committee on Welsh Affairs recently published a report on social exclusion in Wales. We are still waiting for a commitment from the Assembly's Labour administration to many of the proposals in that report. The Assembly was not the author of the report, but it includes many recommendations that we should take on board and act upon.

One area of concern is post offices. We must remember that 150 post offices in Wales have closed during the past five years, probably as a result of UK Government policies that reduce the functions of post offices. For example, the intention to pay benefits through automated credit transfer from 2003 will put at least 50 per cent of post offices in Wales at risk, because 35 per cent of their

Alun Cairns: Mae hunan-gyflogaeth yn cynyddu yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gofio, yn ystod pum wythnos gyntaf y flwyddyn hon, y collodd 5,000 o bobl eu swyddi, ac oherwydd y rhagolygon economaidd y mae'r weinyddiaeth hon wedi rheoli drostynt, nid oes dewis amgen heblaw hunan-gyflogaeth. Dyna'r realiti.

Yr economi fwyaf deinamig fydd yr economi fwyaf hyblyg. Bydd gan yr economi fwyaf hyblyg y trethi isaf. Bydd trethi is yn sicrhau ffyniant pellach y gellir ei ddosbarthu wedyn. Drwy ostwng trethi efallai y bydd cyfanswm y derbyniadau treth, fel cyfran, yn llai, ond bydd cyfanswm y swm treth yn llawer mwy.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Daeth eich amser i ben. Caniatâf un frawddeg derfynol.

Alun Cairns: Gallaf barchu'r safbwynt a fynegir gan Blaid Cymru yn y cynnig hwn, a gallaf barchu hefyd y safbwynt a fynegir gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol oherwydd maent yn onest yn eu cais am drethi uwch.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Daeth eich amser i ben. Mae llawer o'r Aelodau yn dymuno cyfrannu at y ddaidl hon ac, felly, apelïaf am gyfraniadau byr a chryno.

Janet Ryder: Yn ddiweddar, cyhoeddodd y Pwyllgor Dethol ar Faterion Cymreig yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin adroddiad ar allgáu cymdeithasol yng Nghymru. Yr ydym yn aros o hyd am ymrwymiad gan weinyddiaeth Lafur y Cynulliad i lawer o'r cynigion yn yr adroddiad hwnnw. Nid y Cynulliad oedd awdur yr adroddiad, ond mae'n cynnwys llawer o argymhellion y dylem eu hystyried a gweithredu arnynt.

Un achos pryder yw swyddfeydd post. Rhaid inni gofio bod 150 o swyddfeydd post yng Nghymru wedi cau yn ystod y pum mlynedd diwethaf, o ganlyniad i bolisiau Llywodraeth y DU yn ôl pob tebyg sydd yn lleihau swyddogaethau swyddfeydd post. Er enghraifft, bydd y bwriad i dalu budd-daliadau drwy drosglwyddiad credyd awtomataidd o 2003 ymlaen yn rhoi o leiaf

business—rural post offices in particular—is dependent on the payment of benefits. The role of the post office could be extended. It could play a major role in the development of a credit union network in Wales. I press the Minister to make representations to the UK Government to change the policy on automated credit transfer and to encourage the role of the post office in the development of a credit union.

Another area that gives cause for concern is housing benefit, particularly as it affects young people. The current housing benefit arrangements are not sufficient to support young people who are unemployed and do not have a family to rely on for support. The single room rent restriction means that the amount of housing benefit a person under the age of 25 can receive is limited to the cost of renting a single room in that person's area. The amount claimants receive is often not enough to rent a single room in a shared house. It is difficult for a person aged between 16 and 25 to sustain independent living if they are on a low income. The applicable amount used in a calculation for housing benefit is less for 16-24 year olds than it is for 25-year-olds. Are living costs higher for a 25-year-old than a 24-year-old? It is no wonder that homelessness among young people is a big problem in Wales. We call on the Minister to make representations to the UK Government to abolish the single room rent restrictions for young people, and also to ensure that landlords do not exploit the system to offer poor quality housing at inflated rents.

A major area of concern in the Labour UK Government's fiscal and expenditure policy as it impacts on Wales is the way it has totally embraced Conservatives' economic policy enshrined in the private finance initiative. In yesterday's Local Government and Housing Committee, the Minister heard widespread objections, even some from her New Labour colleagues, to private finance initiative. She would have heard her friend, Russell Goodway, describe the policy as Thatcherite economics. PFI is a policy that reminds us all of past Conservative Governments and the Conservative way of

50 y cant o swyddfeydd post yng Nghymru mewn perygl, gan fod 35 y cant o'u busnes—swyddfeydd post gwledig yn arbennig—yn ddibynnol ar dalu budd-daliadau. Gellid ymestyn rôl y swyddfa bost. Gallai chwarae rhan fawr wrth ddatblygu rhwydwaith undebau credyd yng Nghymru. Pwysaf ar y Gweinidog i gyflwyno sylwadau i Lywodraeth y DU i newid y polisi ar drosglwyddiad credyd awtomataidd ac annog rôl y swyddfa bost wrth ddatblygu undeb credyd.

Un maes arall sydd yn achosi pryder yw budd-dâl tai, yn arbennig gan ei fod yn effeithio ar bobl ifanc. Nid yw'r trefniadau budd-dâl tai yn ddigonol i gefnogi pobl ifanc sydd yn ddi-waith a heb deulu i ddibynnu arno am gefnogaeth. Mae cyfyngu rhent i ystafell sengl yn golygu bod swm y budd-dâl tai y gall person o dan 25 oed ei gael yn cael ei gyfyngu i gost rhentu ystafell sengl yn ardal y person hwnnw. Yn aml, nid yw'r swm a gaiff ceiswyr yn ddigon i rentu ystafell sengl mewn tŷ a rennir. Mae'n anodd i berson rhwng 16 a 25 oed barhau i fyw yn annibynnol os ydynt ar incwm isel. Mae'r swm perthnasol a ddefnyddir mewn cyfrifiad ar gyfer budd-dâl tai yn llai i bobl 16-24 oed nag y mae i bobl 25 oed. A yw costau byw yn uwch i berson 25 oed nag i berson 24 oed? Nid yw'n syndod bod digartrefedd ymhlith pobl ifanc yn broblem fawr yng Nghymru. Galwn ar y Gweinidog i gyflwyno sylwadau i Lywodraeth y DU i ddiddymu'r cyfyngiadau i rent ystafell sengl i bobl ifanc, ac i sicrhau hefyd nad yw landlordiaid yn camddefnyddio'r system gan gynnig tai ar osod o ansawdd gwael am grobris.

Un o'r prif bryderon ynglŷn â pholisi cyllidol a gwariant Llywodraeth Lafur y DU o ran ei effaith ar Gymru yw'r modd y mae wedi ymgorffori polisi economaidd y Ceidwadwyr yn llwyr a gynhwyswyd yn y fenter cyllid preifat. Yn y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai ddoe, clywodd y Gweinidog wrthwynebiadau helaeth, hyd yn oed gan rai o'i chyd-Aelodau Llafur Newydd, i'r fenter cyllid preifat. Byddai wedi clywed ei chyfaill, Russell Goodway, yn disgrifio'r polisi fel economeg Thatcheriaidd. Mae'r fenter cyllid preifat yn bolisi sydd yn atgoffa pob un ohonom am gyn Lywodraethau Ceidwadol

thinking. It is a quick fix, short-term, profit-driven answer, not an option that considers the long-term wellbeing of the community, or even the short-term wellbeing of the staff involved in the PFI process. This is a Conservative policy, shamefully continued by this Labour UK Government and the Labour/Liberal Democrat administration in the Assembly. Tony Blair took on this policy despite serious concerns expressed by a wide range of public bodies. In the long-term, PFI is not the cheapest way of providing services. It is a way of privatising both the ownership of public bodies and the service offered in and from them. We are also building up costs for future council tax payers. The strength of the health service has always been team ethos, which has been destroyed by PFI's creation of two-tier staff.

Alun Cairns: I listened carefully to the points that Janet made about private finance initiative. By how much must tax rise in order to fund Penweddig School, Aberystwyth, which was built with private finance initiative, and also the new Baglan Hospital, which is being funded by private finance initiative? How much extra taxes should the local people pay in order to fund those public services?

Janet Ryder: Perhaps you should think about changing the public sector borrowing requirements instead of your suggestion. PFI has created two-tier staff. Staff are being transferred from the public sector to the private sector, and seeing their pensions and their terms and conditions being totally changed. The driving forces behind PFI are commercial and profit-making. Surely public sector provision should be considered more highly than that. Minister, we ask you again to make representations to the UK Government to change the public sector borrowing requirement, so that we can at least consider other options for funding public sector projects. Those present at yesterday's Local Government and Housing Committee heard the Trades Union Congress representatives expressing their concern at the detrimental effects of PFI on staff morale. The example of Baglan Hospital was flagged

a'r ffordd Geidwadol o feddwl. Mae'n ateb cyflym, byrdymor, a gaiff ei lywio gan elw, nid yn opsiwn sydd yn ystyried lles hirdymor y gymuned, na hyd yn oed lles byrdymor y staff sydd yn gysylltiedig â'r broses menter cyllid preifat. Mae hwn yn bolisi Ceidwadol, a barhawyd yn gywilyddus gan Lywodraeth Lafur y DU hon a'r weinyddiaeth Lafur/Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn y Cynulliad. Ymgwymerodd Tony Blair â'r polisi hwn er gwaethaf pryderon difrifol a fynegwyd gan ystod eang o gyrff cyhoeddus. Yn yr hirdymor, nid y fenter cyllid preifat yw'r ffordd rataf o ddarparu gwasanaethau. Mae'n ffordd o breifateiddio perchenogaeth o gyrff cyhoeddus a'r gwasanaeth a gynigir ynddynt a chanddynt. Yr ydym hefyd yn cronni costau ar gyfer talwyr y dreth gyngor yn y dyfodol. Yr ethos o dîm fu cryfder y gwasanaeth iechyd erioed, a dinistriwyd hyn pan greodd y fenter cyllid preifat staff dwy haen.

Alun Cairns: Gwrandewais yn astud ar y pwyntiau a wnaeth Janet ynglŷn â'r fenter cyllid preifat. Faint yn rhagor y mae'n rhaid i dreth godi er mwyn ariannu Ysgol Penweddig, Aberystwyth, a adeiladwyd drwy gymorth y fenter cyllid preifat, a'r Ysbyty newydd ym Maglan, a ariennir drwy'r fenter cyllid preifat? Faint o drethi ychwanegol y dylai'r bobl leol eu talu er mwyn ariannu'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus hynny?

Janet Ryder: Efallai y dylech ystyried newid gofynion benthycar sector cyhoeddus yn lle eich awgrym chi. Mae'r fenter cyllid preifat wedi creu staff dwy haen. Caiff staff eu trosglwyddo o'r sector cyhoeddus i'r sector preifat, a gwelant eu pensiynau a'u telerau a'u hamodau'n cael eu newid yn llwyr. Grymoedd masnachol ac elwgarwch rhai sydd yn gwneud elw yw'r grymoedd pennaf y tu ôl i'r fenter cyllid preifat. Oni ddylid rhoi mwy o ystyriaeth na hynny i ddarpariaeth y sector cyhoeddus. Weinidog, gofynnwn ichi unwaith eto i gyflwyno sylwadau i Lywodraeth y DU i newid gofyniad benthycar sector cyhoeddus fel y gallwn o leiaf ystyried opsiynau eraill ar gyfer ariannu prosiectau'r sector cyhoeddus. Clywodd y rheini a oedd yn bresennol yn y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai ddoe gynrychiolwyr Cyngres yr Undebau Llafur yn mynegi eu pryder ynglŷn ag effeithiau andwyol y fenter

up. Non-clinical staff in Neath Port Talbot are extremely concerned for the future. They do not want to work for the private sector but they are being given no choice. The Minister said yesterday that it is better to have Baglan Hospital under PFI than no hospital at all. That underlines the Labour Party's wholehearted adoption of Tory policies. The Labour Government at Westminster has had four years to change the borrowing requirements but instead it stayed with Thatcherite PFI principles and has offered no choice to authorities or public bodies. It is PFI or no building. UK policies are having a devastating effect on Wales.

Peter Black: We are in the middle of a general election campaign. No doubt that is why this motion has been tabled.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I must stop you. Assembly Members are not in the middle of a general election campaign. I am sure that you can rephrase that appropriately.

Peter Black: My sentence was leading somewhere, however you cannot have been listening to the debate that we have had—

11:15 a.m.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I have pressed my red button, so no one can hear you. You are not supposed to attack the Chair. I am listening carefully. If you say anything that is out of order, I will stop you. However, you have the right to be heard if you do not say anything that is out of order.

Peter Black: The fact that this motion has been tabled undermines the ruling that the general election should not intrude on the Assembly's normal business. Plaid Cymru is making a mockery of the National Assembly by turning it into another arena in which to fight the general election. By their amendments, the Conservatives are also treating Assembly proceedings as an extension of the general election campaign. It should be taken as read that, although the

cyllid preifat ar forâl y staff. Nodwyd Ysbyty Baglan fel enghraifft. Mae'r staff anghlinigol yng Nghastell Nedd Port Talbot yn gofidio llawer am y dyfodol. Nid ydynt am weithio i'r sector preifat ond nid oes dewis ganddynt. Dywedodd y Gweinidog ddoe ei fod yn well cael Ysbyty Baglan o dan y fenter cyllid preifat na bod heb ysbyty o gwbl. Pwysleisia hynny fod y Blaid Lafur wedi mabwysiadu polisiau'r Torïaid yn llwyr. Cafodd y Llywodraeth Lafur yn San Steffan bedair blynedd i newid y gofynion benthyca ond yn lle hynny arhosodd gydag egwyddorion y fenter cyllid preifat Thatcheriaid ac nid yw wedi cynnig unrhyw ddewis i awdurdodau na chyrff cyhoeddus. Y dewis yw'r fenter cyllid preifat neu bod heb adeilad. Caiff polisiau'r DU effaith ddinistriol ar Gymru.

Peter Black: Yr ydym ynghanol ymgyrch etholiad cyffredinol. Dyna pam, heb os, y cyflwynwyd y cynnig hwn.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Rhaid imi eich atal. Nid yw Aelodau'r Cynulliad ynghanol ymgyrch etholiad cyffredinol. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gallwch aralleirio hynny'n briodol.

Peter Black: Yr oedd fy mrawddeg yn arwain i rywle, fodd bynnag, rhaid nad oeddech yn gwrandao ar y ddadl a gawsom—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Yr wyf wedi gwasgu fy motwm coch, felly ni all unrhyw un eich clywed. Ni ddylech ymosod ar y Cadeirydd. Yr wyf yn gwrandao'n astud. Os dywedwch unrhyw beth sydd allan o drefn, byddaf yn eich atal. Fodd bynnag, mae gennych yr hawl i gael eich clywed os na ddywedwch unrhyw beth sydd allan o drefn.

Peter Black: Mae'r ffaith y cyflwynwyd y cynnig hwn yn tansilio'r dyfarniad na ddylai'r etholiad cyffredinol amharu ar fusnes arferol y Cynulliad. Mae Plaid Cymru yn gwneud y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn destun sbort drwy ei droi yn arena arall lle y gellir ymladd yr etholiad cyffredinol. Yn ôl eu gwelliannau, mae'r Ceidwadwyr hefyd yn trin busnes y Cynulliad fel estyniad o ymgyrch yr etholiad cyffredinol. Dylid derbyn, er bod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol

Liberal Democrats agree with the text of the Plaid Cymru motion, we do not agree with any of the amendments. The Liberal Democrats believe in investing in our public services and have proposed that this should be funded by an extra 1p in income tax, if necessary, and a new top rate of 50p in the pound for those earning more than £100,000.

Alun Cairns and David Davies *rose—*

Peter Black: I will not take an intervention. We want to use that money to increase pensions, to introduce free care for the elderly, to put more resources into health and education and to recruit more police officers.

Alun Cairns and David Davies: Will the Deputy Minister give way?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Peter Black is not taking interventions. However, Cynog Dafis wants to raise a point of order.

Cynog Dafis: Point of order. It may be inappropriate for Members to describe the contents of their manifestos for the Westminster general election. I was scrupulous not to do that in my contribution. However, I would be happy to elaborate if Peter Black would allow me to do so.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I do not want to stifle the debate, Peter, but an election is not being held in the Assembly. I hope that you will phrase your comments appropriately so that they do not give rise to further points of order.

Peter Black: The Plaid Cymru motion relates to the UK Government's fiscal policy. It is therefore appropriate for the Liberal Democrats to set out their view of what that fiscal policy should be. Whether that is in our manifesto or not is irrelevant because, as the Deputy Presiding Officer stated, there is not a general election campaign in this Chamber. I am just putting across a Liberal Democrat point of view on fiscal policy, as previous speakers have done for their parties. I have no doubt that most of the previous speakers' comments are included in their manifestos and have been put forward on the hustings as part of the general election campaign. This is

yn cytuno â thestun cynnig Plaid Cymru, nid ydym yn cytuno ag unrhyw un o'r gwelliannau. Cred y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol mewn buddsoddi yn ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ac yr ydym wedi cynnig y dylid ariannu hyn drwy 1c ychwanegol o dreth incwm, os oes angen, a chyfradd uchaf newydd o 50c yn y bunt i'r rheini sydd yn ennill mwy na £100,000.

Alun Cairns a David Davies *a gododd—*

Peter Black: Ni chymeraf ymyriad. Yr ydym am ddefnyddio'r arian hwnnw i gynyddu pensiynau, cyflwyno gofal am ddim i'r henoed, rhoi mwy o adnoddau ym meysydd iechyd ac addysg a recriwtio mwy o heddlu.

Alun Cairns a David Davies: A wnaiff y Dirprwy Weinidog ildio?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Nid yw Peter Black yn cymryd ymyriadau. Fodd bynnag, mae Cynog Dafis am godi pwynt o drefn.

Cynog Dafis: Pwynt o drefn. Efallai ei bod yn amhriodol i'r Aelodau ddisgrifio cynnwys eu maniffestos ar gyfer etholiad cyffredinol San Steffan. Bùm yn ofalus i beidio â gwneud hynny yn fy nghyfraniad. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn fodlon ymhelaethu pe bai Peter Black yn caniatáu imi wneud hynny.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Nid wyf am dewi'r ddadl, Peter, ond nid oes etholiad yn cael ei gynnal yn y Cynulliad. Gobeithiaf y geiriwch eich sylwadau'n briodol fel nad ydynt yn arwain at bwyntiau o drefn pellach.

Peter Black: Mae cynnig Plaid Cymru yn ymwneud â pholisi cyllidol Llywodraeth y DU. Felly mae'n briodol i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol fynegi eu barn am yr hyn y dylai'r polisi cyllidol fod. Mae pa un a yw hynny yn ein maniffesto ai peidio yn amherthnasol oherwydd, fel y nododd y Dirprwy Lywydd, nid oes ymgyrch etholiad cyffredinol yn y Siambr hon. Yr wyf yn mynegi barn y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol am bolisi cyllidol, fel y gwnaeth siaradwyr blaenorol ar ran eu pleidiau hwy. Yn ddiaw, cynhwysir y rhan fwyaf o sylwadau'r siaradwyr blaenorol yn eu maniffestos ac fe'u cyflwynwyd ar lwyfan etholiad fel rhan o

not about a general election campaign. This is the National Assembly for Wales. We should not conduct a general election campaign in the Assembly.

The Liberal Democrats are in favour of investing in public services. We want to introduce an extra 1p in income tax, if necessary, and a new top rate of 50p in the pound for those earning more than £100,000 to achieve that investment. We want to use that money to increase pensions, to introduce free care for the elderly, to put more resources into health and education and to recruit more police officers. We also want to see early entry into the euro, when conditions are right, to give stability to the economy and to help protect our manufacturing industry. We are putting those arguments across outside this Chamber in the general election campaign.

Peter Law: Does the manifesto for Britain that Peter is quoting in response to Members whom he criticised for quoting a manifesto include sunshine every day, which is typical of the Liberal Democrat approach of all things to all people? They can always say what they like, as they will never be in power anywhere else to do anything about it.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Let us be clear. Peter Black was describing his party's policy without reference to any particular manifesto for any particular election campaign that might be being conducted at present.

Peter Black: I understand that Peter Law has always been in favour of sunshine and has been promoting that view for some time in this Chamber.

In this Chamber, we should discuss issues relating to the responsibilities of the Government of Wales, such as student hardship, foot and mouth disease, Corus, the national health service in Wales, the education system, housing, homelessness, local government and many more. Parties should use minority party debates

ymgyrch yr etholiad cyffredinol. Nid yw hyn yn ymwneud ag ymgyrch etholiad cyffredinol. Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yw hwn. Ni ddylem gynnal ymgyrch etholiad cyffredinol yn y Cynulliad.

Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol o blaid buddsoddi mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Yr ydym am gyflwyno 1c ychwanegol mewn treth incwm, os bydd angen, a chyfradd uchaf newydd o 50c yn y bunt i'r rheini sydd yn ennill mwy na £100,000 i gyflawni'r buddsoddiad hwnnw. Yr ydym am ddefnyddio'r arian hwnnw i gynyddu pensiynau, cyflwyno gofal am ddim i'r henoed, rhoi mwy o adnoddau ym meysydd iechyd ac addysg a recriwtio mwy o heddlu. Yr ydym hefyd am ymuno â'r ewro'n gynnar, pan fo'r amodau yn briodol, i roi sefydlogrwydd i'r economi a helpu i ddiogelu ein diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu. Cyfleir y dadleuon hynny gennym y tu allan i'r Siambr hon yn ymgyrch yr etholiad cyffredinol.

Peter Law: A yw'r maniffesto ar gyfer Prydain y mae Peter yn ei ddyfynnu mewn ymateb i'r Aelodau a feirniadwyd ganddo am ddyfynnu maniffesto yn cynnwys heulwen bob dydd, sydd yn nodweddiadol o ymagwedd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, sef bod yn bopeth i bawb? Gallant ddweud beth bynnag y mynnont, gan na fyddant byth â'r grym yn unman arall i wneud unrhyw beth yn ei gylch.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Gadewch inni fod yn glir. Yr oedd Peter Black yn disgrifio polisi ei blaid heb gyfeirio at unrhyw faniffesto penodol ar gyfer unrhyw ymgyrch etholiad benodol a allai fod yn cael ei chynnal ar hyn o bryd.

Peter Black: Deallaf fod Peter Law wedi bod o blaid heulwen erioed ac wedi bod yn hyrwyddo'r farn ers peth amser yn y Siambr hon.

Yn y Siambr hon, dylem drafod materion sydd yn ymwneud â chyfrifoldebau Llywodraeth Cymru, fel caledi myfyrwyr, clwy'r traed a'r genau, Corus, y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru, y system addysg, tai, digartrefedd, llywodraeth leol a llawer mwy. Dylai'r pleidiau ddefnyddio dadleuon pleidiau lleiafrifol yn adeiladol i

constructively to debate those issues and to promote their own secondary legislation if necessary. Minority party debates should not be used to fight another parliament's election, as this debate does. The Liberal Democrats will, therefore, take no further part in this debate. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.']

Janet Davies: I want to address the issue of housing, which needs a considerable amount of investment. Decent housing is fundamental to decent lives, but it demands quite a high percentage of people's incomes and, in some cases, public spending to help the less well off. Social housing is an issue that is unfortunately apt only to claim the attention of people who require such help. It does not claim as much attention as health and education, but if housing is not of a satisfactory standard, it can drain the budgets for health and education quite severely.

The effects of bad housing on employment, education, health and crime can be severe on individuals, and can badly affect society in general. The cost of bad housing to those budgets can be crippling for governments. The Assembly has initially had difficulty in finding the money to invest in housing in order to reduce the call on other budgets later on. Plaid Cymru recognises that.

On public funding, there have been illogical attacks on Plaid Cymru lately. Some attacks have perhaps been offensive to people living in Wales. First, someone said that Plaid Cymru lives in a dream world of independence and before going on to attack our policies, which concern the present, and the fair deal that Wales needs. It is illogical and irrational to put both those views forward. We have also been accused of being Oliver Twists with begging bowls. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Yes.'] Well, as a degenerate, I ask what the accusers are saying about Welsh people, when they accuse us of being Oliver Twists. Are they saying that the people of Wales are in a workhouse? What a terrible admission for the Government of Wales to make.

Alun Pugh *rose*—

ddadlau'r materion hynny a hyrwyddo eu his-ddeddfwriaeth eu hunain os bydd angen. Ni ddylid defnyddio dadleuon y pleidiau lleiafrifol i ymladd etholiad senedd arall, fel y gwna'r ddadl hon. Felly, ni chymer y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ran bellach yn y ddadl hon. [AELODAU O'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.']

Janet Davies: Yr wyf am ymdrin â thai, y mae angen swm sylweddol o fuddsoddiad yn y maes. Mae tai safonol yn sylfaenol i fywydau safonol, ond mae'n galw am ganran eithaf uchel o incwm pobl, ac, mewn rhai achosion, gwariant cyhoeddus i helpu'r rhai llai cyfoethog. Yn anffodus, mae tai cymdeithasol yn fater sydd ond yn tueddu i ddenu sylw y bobl y mae angen help o'r fath arnynt. Nid yw'n denu cymaint o sylw ag iechyd ac addysg, ond os nad yw tai o safon foddhaol, gall ddi-hysbyddu'r cyllidebau ar gyfer iechyd ac addysg yn eithaf difrifol.

Gall effeithiau tai gwael ar gyflogaeth, addysg, iechyd a throseddau fod yn ddifrifol ar unigolion, a gall effeithio'n wael ar gymdeithas yn gyffredinol. Gall cost tai gwael i'r cyllidebau hynny fod yn andwyol iawn i lywodraethau. Ar y dechrau cafodd y Cynulliad anhawster i ddod o hyd i'r arian i fuddsoddi mewn tai er mwyn lleihau'r galw ar gyllidebau eraill yn ddiweddarach. Mae Plaid Cymru yn cydnabod hynny.

O ran arian cyhoeddus, bu ymosodiadau afresymegol ar Plaid Cymru yn ddiweddar. Bu rhai ymosodiadau efallai yn dramgwyddus i bobl sydd yn byw yng Nghymru. Yn gyntaf, dywedodd rhywun fod Plaid Cymru yn byw mewn byd o freuddwydion am annibyniaeth cyn mynd ymlaen i ymosod ar ein polisïau, sydd yn ymwneud â'r presennol, a'r fargen deg sydd ei hangen ar Gymru. Mae'n afresymegol ac yn afresymol cyflwyno'r ddau safbwynt hwnnw. Fe'n cyhuddwyd hefyd o fod fel Oliver Twist gyda ffiolau cardod. [AELODAU O'R CYNULLIAD: 'Ie'] Wel, fel plaid ddirywiedig, gofynnaf beth ddywed y cyhuddwyr ynglŷn â phobl Cymru, pan gyhuddant ni o fod fel Oliver Twist. A ydynt yn dweud bod pobl Cymru mewn tloty? Mae hynny'n gyfaddefiad ofnadwy i Lywodraeth Cymru ei wneud.

Alun Pugh *a gododd*—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Will you give way to Alun Pugh?

Janet Davies: No. Over the past few years, spending on housing fell, in real terms, below that of the last year of the Conservative Government. It is now moving back up to that level, but surely a Labour Government should be prepared to spend more on social issues than a Conservative one. Why is it not prepared to try to narrow the gap between the rich and the poor? I recognise that the National Assembly has great difficulty in investing in housing, due to the fiscal policies of the Treasury. The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities said as much in the Local Government and Housing Committee.

On public investment in funding, the UK is out on a limb, compared with the European Union. The United Kingdom says that money invested in public housing is lost and sets it against the public sector borrowing requirement. Every other member state in the European Union regards it as what it is, an investment that increases the country's wealth. The UK Government is out of step, and people in Wales are out on a limb, and in some cases, without a decent roof over their heads. Caution and prudence are one thing, saving pence to spend pounds later on the effects of bad housing on health and education and increased crime, is another entirely.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I appeal for shorter speeches. Three Members are due to speak, and I am still receiving requests from other Members. Not everyone will be able to contribute to this debate. Please restrict your contribution to three minutes, or not much longer.

11:25 a.m.

Brian Gibbons: It is ironic, if not bizarre, that Plaid Cymru should propose this resolution today. Yesterday, the unemployment figures were announced: below 1 million for the third successive

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: A ildiwch i Alun Pugh?

Janet Davies: Na wnaf. Dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf, syrthiodd gwariant ar dai, mewn termau gwirioneddol, yn is na'r ffigur ar gyfer blwyddyn ddiwethaf y Llywodraeth Geidwadol. Mae'n symud yn ôl i fyny i'r lefel honno erbyn hyn, ond dylai Llywodraeth Lafur fod yn barod i wario mwy ar faterion cymdeithasol nag un Geidwadol. Pam nad yw'n barod i geisio culhau'r bwlch rhwng y cyfoethog a'r tlawd? Cydnabyddaf y caiff y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol anhawster mawr i fuddsoddi mewn tai oherwydd polisïau cyllidol y Trysorlys. Dywedodd y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Thai gymaint â hynny yn y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai.

O ran buddsoddiad cyhoeddus mewn ariannu, mae'r DU ar ei phen ei hun, o'i chymharu â'r Undeb Ewropeaidd. Dywed y Deyrnas Unedig y caiff arian a fuddsoddir mewn tai cyhoeddus ei gollu ac mae'n ei osod yn erbyn gofyniad benthyca'r sector cyhoeddus. Mae pob aelod-wladwriaeth arall yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yn ei ystyried am yr hyn ydyw, sef buddsoddiad sydd yn cynyddu cyfoeth y wlad. Mae Llywodraeth y DU yn anghydnaws â'r gweddill, ac mae pobl yng Nghymru ar eu pen eu hunain, ac mewn rhai achosion, heb do gweddus uwch eu pennau. Mae pwyll a gofal yn un peth. Mater arall yw cynilo ceiniogau i wario punnoedd yn ddiweddarach ar effeithiau tai gwael ar iechyd ac addysg a chynnydd mewn troseddau.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Apeliâf am areithiau byrrach. Mae tri Aelod yn aros i siarad, ac yr wyf yn dal i gael ceisiadau gan yr Aelodau eraill. Ni fydd pawb yn gallu cyfrannu at y ddadl hon. Cyfyngwch eich cyfraniad i dair munud, os gwelwch yn dda, neu nid fawr mwy na hynny.

Brian Gibbons: Mae'n eironig, os nad yn rhyfedd, fod Plaid Cymru yn cynnig y penderfyniad hwn heddiw. Ddoe, cyhoeddwyd y ffigurau diweithdra: llai na miliwn am y trydydd mis yn olynol. Mae

month. The level of unemployment in Wales, on the claimant count, is down 7 per cent to 4 per cent. We are on the verge of the prospect of full employment in Wales, which we would not have dreamt was possible a decade ago. The reduction in unemployment was brought home to me when, as a governor, I visited my local comprehensive school two weeks ago. During most of the last decade, around 20 per cent of those aged 16 and 17 left that comprehensive and joined the dole queue straightaway. This year, the statistics for that school indicated that, for the first time ever, less than 10 per cent of those children now face unemployment. That is a quantitative improvement. Anyone who walks the streets of our communities in Wales can see that fewer young people are hanging around and that more are entering jobs and training. More of the long-term unemployed are finding jobs. If people do not realise that, they are living in a dream world, just as Janet Davies said.

Phil Williams: Are you saying that there is a mistake in what appears on our web pages and in the reports today, stating that unemployment has risen in Wales in the three months up to April?

Brian Gibbons: The figures published by the Office of National Statistics last night state that there is 4 per cent unemployment in Wales. If it has revised those figures since 8 p.m. last night, I am prepared to stand corrected. However, the current figure is 4 per cent, compared with 7 per cent when the Labour Party came to power.

We have been criticised for the so-called meltdown in manufacturing in Wales at a time when manufacturing productivity, output and exporting is increasing in Wales. It is true that the number of people employed in manufacturing has decreased from 216,000 to 210,000, but at the same time there has been an increase in the number of people employed in the service sector by 19,000 over the last 12 months up to December. Furthermore, the number of job vacancies available in job centres is now over 19,000. There is significant evidence that people are leaving one sector of the economy to move into others, and are finding jobs successfully.

lefel diweithdra yng Nghymru, gan gyfrif y ceiswyr, i lawr 7 y cant i 4 y cant. Yr ydym ar fin gweld cyflogaeth lawn yng Nghymru, na fyddem wedi dychmygu a oedd yn bosibl ddegawd yn ôl. Deuthum yn ymwybodol o'r gostyngiad mewn diweithdra pan ymwelais, fel llywodraethwr, â'm hysgol gyfun leol bythefnos yn ôl. Yn ystod y rhan fwyaf o'r degawd diwethaf, gadawodd tua 20 y cant o'r rheini a oedd yn 16 ac 17 mlwydd oed yr ysgol gyfun honno gan ymuno â'r ciw dól yn syth. Eleni, dangosodd yr ystadegau ar gyfer yr ysgol honno, am y tro cyntaf erioed, fod llai na 10 y cant o'r plant hynny yn wynebu diweithdra yn awr. Mae hwnnw'n welliant meintiol. Gall unrhyw un sydd yn cerdded strydoedd ein cymunedau yng Nghymru weld fod llai o bobl ifanc yn cicio'u sodlau a bod mwy yn cael swyddi a hyfforddiant. Mae mwy o'r bobl a fu'n ddi-waith yn yr hirdymor yn dod o hyd i swyddi. Os nad yw pobl yn sylweddoli hynny, maent yn byw mewn byd o freuddwydion, fel y dywedodd Janet Davies.

Phil Williams: A ydych yn dweud bod camgymeriad yn yr hyn sydd yn ymddangos ar y tudalennau ar y we ac yn yr adroddiadau heddiw, sydd yn nodi bod diweithdra wedi codi yng Nghymru yn y tri mis hyd at Ebrill?

Brian Gibbons: Noda'r ffigurau a gyhoeddwyd gan y Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol neithiwr fod diweithdra yn 4 y cant yng Nghymru. Os yw wedi diwygio'r ffigurau hynny ers 8 p.m. neithiwr, yr wyf yn barod i syrthio ar fy mai. Fodd bynnag, y ffigur presennol yw 4 y cant, o'i gymharu â 7 y cant pan ddaeth y Blaid Lafur i rym.

Cawsom ein beirniadu am yr hyn a elwir yn ddifflaniad yn y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru ar adeg pan fo cynhyrchiant gweithgynhyrchu, allbwn ac allforio yn cynyddu yng Nghymru. Mae'n wir bod nifer y bobl a gyflogir yn y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu wedi gostwng o 216,000 i 210,000, ond ar yr un pryd bu cynnydd yn nifer y bobl a gyflogir yn y sector gwasanaeth o 19,000 dros y 12 mis diwethaf hyd at Ragfyr. At hynny, mae dros 19,000 o swyddi gwag ar gael mewn canolfannau gwaith erbyn hyn. Mae tystiolaeth sylweddol bod pobl yn gadael un sector o'r economi i symud i un arall, ac yn dod o hyd i swyddi yn

That is evident in the unemployment figures.

llwyddiannus. Mae hynny'n amlwg yn y ffigurau diweithdra.

It is extraordinary that Cynog said that he kept the general election studiously out of his contribution, yet he managed to comment on the amount of public expenditure as a proportion of gross domestic product and stated that the Labour Government was

Mae'n rhyfeddol bod Cynog wedi dweud ei fod yn fwriadol wedi cadw'r etholiad cyffredinol allan o'i gyfraniad, ac eto llwyddodd i roi sylwadau ar swm y gwariant cyhoeddus fel cyfran o'r cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth a nododd fod y Llywodraeth Lafur wedi

'committed to not increasing public expenditure'.

'ymrwymo i beidio â chynyddu gwariant cyhoeddus'.

Cynog Dafis: Yr hyn a ddywedais oedd bod y Llywodraeth Lafur wedi addo ddoe peidio â chodi trethiant personol yn ystod ei thymor nesaf. Dyna'r hyn a ystyriaf yn anghyfrifol. Y mae gwariant cyhoeddus yn cynyddu, ond nid yn sylweddol fel cyfran o gynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth. Bydd gwariant yn llai na 41 y cant o gynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth erbyn diwedd yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant.

Cynog Dafis: What I said was that the Labour Government had promised yesterday not to increase personal taxes during its next term. That is what I consider irresponsible. Public spending is increasing but not significantly as a proportion of GDP. Spending will be less than 41 per cent of GDP by the end of the comprehensive spending review.

Brian Gibbons: I accept that public expenditure is possibly not increasing as a proportion of GDP, but the most significant reason for the previous high level of expenditure as a proportion of GDP was the economic failure of the Conservative Party and the amount of people who had to be paid to be on the dole. We do not have that unemployment bill. We have also been able to pay back some of the public debt. More money is going directly into frontline public services and to the people who need those services.

Brian Gibbons: Derbyniad nad yw gwariant cyhoeddus o bosibl yn cynyddu fel cyfran o CMC, ond y rheswm mwyaf arwyddocaol am y lefel uchel o wariant yn flaenorol fel cyfran o'r CMC oedd methiant economaidd y Blaid Geidwadol a nifer y bobl y bu'n rhaid eu talu i fod ar y dôl. Nid yw'r bil diweithdra hwnnw gennym. Llwyddasom hefyd i ad-dalu peth o'r ddyled gyhoeddus. Mae mwy o arian yn mynd yn uniongyrchol i wasanaethau cyhoeddus rheng flaen ac i'r bobl y mae angen y gwasanaethau hynny arnynt.

David Davies: Will you give way?

David Davies: A ildiwch?

Brian Gibbons: No. It is ironic that during the past few weeks, we have had announcements in this Chamber of 9 per cent increase in spending on education, 8 per cent increase in spending on local government, over 50 per cent increase in spending on health in Wales over 6 years to 2003 and an extra £1 billion for the NHS over the next three years. Those are real public expenditure increases and I am sure that the people of Wales will recognise that.

Brian Gibbons: Na wna. Mae'n eironig ein bod, dros yr ychydig wythnosau diwethaf, wedi cael cyhoeddiadau yn y Siambr hon am gynnydd o 9 y cant mewn gwariant ar addysg, cynnydd o 8 y cant mewn gwariant ar lywodraeth leol, cynnydd o dros 50 y cant mewn gwariant ar iechyd yng Nghymru dros 6 mlynedd hyd at 2003 ac £1 biliwn ychwanegol i'r NHS dros y tair blynedd nesaf. Mae pob un o'r rhain yn gynnydd gwirioneddol mewn gwariant cyhoeddus ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd pobl Cymru yn cydnabod hynny.

Glyn Davies: There can be no doubt, whether partisan or non-partisan, we in Wales have suffered under the yoke of one of the most oppressive and dangerous Governments that has ever managed to wheedle itself into power. A Government that has taken the art of spin—*[Interruption.]*

Lorraine Barrett *rose*—

Glyn Davies: Nowhere has the Government spin and manipulation of public opinion been more damaging and threatening to Wales than in its policies on monetary and fiscal—*[Interruption.]*

Lorraine Barrett: Point of order.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. What is your point of order, Lorraine?

Lorraine Barrett: What Glyn Davies says relates to the UK general election and has nothing to do with this Assembly. His comments are outrageous.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I do not think so, but thank you for assisting me in my duties here. When I hear Glyn say something that is out of order, you may rest assured that I will draw his attention to it immediately.

Glyn Davies: In no part of the UK has the effect of these policies been more hurtful than in Wales. In our country, located on the periphery of the UK, somehow the Government has managed to persuade people that it is not made up of a bunch of tax grabbers.

While I was canvassing in this election—to which I do not want to refer today—I met Welsh people who did not realise that the Government had raised taxes in Wales. The truth is that the tax burden has increased by £1 billion per week from £100 billion to £160 billion. We all know of the impact of extra duty on fuel on the Welsh people. It is a vicious attack on the countryside, increasing the running costs of every farm vehicle, every lorry that delivers goods to our rural and peripheral country and adding huge extra running costs to ambulances, police vehicles, fire engines, meals-on-wheels services and

Glyn Davies: Yn ddiau, pa un a ydych yn gefnogwr ai peidio, yr ydym ni yng Nghymru wedi dioddef o dan iau un o'r Llywodraethau mwyaf gormesol a pheryglus a lwyddodd i ddod i rym drwy wenieithio a seboni. Llywodraeth a gymerodd dechneg sbin—*[Torri ar draws.]*

Lorraine Barrett *a gododd*—

Glyn Davies: Nid yw'r Llywodraeth wedi camddefnyddio sbin a'r farn gyhoeddus mewn ffordd mor ddiniistriol a bygythiol i Gymru nag y gwnaeth yn ei pholisïau ar faterion ariannol a cyllidol—*[Torri ar draws.]*

Lorraine Barrett: Pwynt o drefn.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Beth yw eich pwynt o drefn, Lorraine?

Lorraine Barrett: Mae'r hyn a ddywed Glyn Davies yn ymwneud ag etholiad cyffredinol y DU ac nid oes a wnelo ddim â'r Cynulliad hwn. Mae ei sylwadau yn warthus.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Ni chredaf hynny, ond diolch ichi am fy nghynorthwyo yn fy nyletswyddau yma. Pan glywaf Glyn yn dweud rhywbeth sydd allan o drefn, gallaf eich sicrhau y tynnaf ei sylw ato ar unwaith.

Glyn Davies: Bu effaith y polisïau hyn yn fwy niweidiol yng Nghymru nag mewn unrhyw ran arall o'r DU. Yn ein gwlad ni, a leolir ar ymylon y DU, mae'r Llywodraeth, mewn rhyw ffordd, wedi darbwyllo pobl nad yw'n gasgliad o gipwyr treth.

Tra yr oeddwn yn canfasio yn yr etholiad hwn—ac nid wyf am gyfeirio at hynny heddiw—cyfarfûm â phobl Cymru nad oeddent yn sylweddoli bod y Llywodraeth wedi codi trethi yng Nghymru. Y gwir yw bod y baich treth wedi cynyddu £1 biliwn yr wythnos o £100 biliwn i £160 biliwn. Gŵyr pob un ohonom am effaith y dreth ychwanegol ar danwydd ar bobl Cymru. Mae'n ymosodiad milain ar gefn gwlad, yn cynyddu costau rhedeg pob cerbyd fferm, pob lori sydd yn mynd â nwyddau i'n hardaloedd gwledig ac ymylol ac ychwanegu costau rhedeg ychwanegol enfawr i gerbydau

school transport. Given the rural and peripheral nature of Wales, we would hugely benefit from a desperately needed cut in fuel duty—around 6p was what I had in mind.

The First Minister: I would be grateful if you could tell us when the fuel duty escalator was introduced and which Government was in charge then, and when the fuel duty escalator was abolished and which Government was in charge then?

Glyn Davies: A sensible Government recognises that when on an escalator, you eventually reach the top, and you would do well to get off when you reach it. [LABOUR ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘Answer the question’.] I just answered it.

We all know about the impact of extra tax on private pensions, particularly on people in Wales. It is the most iniquitous of all the tax increases. Around £5 billion per year is taken from those who are trying to set aside part of their income to care for themselves and dependants in retirement. It has a particularly damaging effect in Wales because of the age structure. It is a direct strike against the elderly, delivered as accurately as a left jab from the Deputy Prime Minister. At the same time, the percentage of gross domestic product invested in health, transport and public services is less than that invested by the previous Government, which is reflected in the Barnett formula product that has such an impact on Wales.

The Government’s policy on income tax, and how it affects Wales, is good, sensible, Conservative thinking designed to lead to lower taxation. However, I can respect those who disagree with me, as many do in this Chamber. What I consider worthy of condemnation and worse is when a Government raises taxes massively and simultaneously cuts or holds back income tax as a public relations exercise. I accept that the balance of taxation varies over time, but the sheer scale on which this has happened over

ambiwylans, cerbydau’r heddlu, cerbydau injan dân, gwasanaethau pryd ar glud a chludiant ysgol. O gofio natur wledig ac ymylol Cymru, byddem yn elwa’n fawr ar ostyngiad mewn treth tanwydd y mae angen dybryd amdano—tua 6c oedd y ffigur yr oedd gennyf mewn golwg.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech ddweud wrthym pryd y cyflwynwyd y cymal codi pris treth tanwydd a pha Lywodraeth oedd mewn grym ar y pryd, a phryd y diddymwyd y cymal codi pris treth tanwydd a pha Lywodraeth oedd mewn grym bryd hynny?

Glyn Davies: Mae Llywodraeth synhwyrol yn cydnabod bod pen draw i bopeth, a phan gyrhaeddir y pen draw, ei bod yn ddoeth rhoi’r gorau iddi. [AELODAU LLAFUR O’R CYNULLIAD: ‘Atebwch y cwestiwn’.] Yr wyf newydd ei ateb.

Gŵyr pob un ohonom am effaith treth ychwanegol ar bensiynau preifat, yn arbennig ar bobl yng Nghymru. Dyma’r mwyaf anghyfiawn o unrhyw gynnydd mewn treth. Cymerir tua £5 biliwn y flwyddyn oddi wrth y rheini sydd yn ceisio neilltuo rhan o’u hincwm i ofalu amdanynt eu hunain a’u dibynyddion ar ôl ymddeol. Caiff effaith arbennig o niweidiol yng Nghymru oherwydd y strwythur oedran. Mae’n ergyd uniongyrchol i’r henoed, wedi ei hanelu mor gywir â phwniad â’r chwith gan y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog. Ar yr un pryd, mae canran y cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth a fuddsoddir mewn iechyd, trafndiaeth a gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn llai na’r canran a fuddsoddiwyd gan y Llywodraeth flaenorol, a adlewyrchir yng nghynnyrch y fformiwla Barnett sydd wedi effeithio gymaint ar Gymru.

Mae polisi’r Llywodraeth ar dreth incwm, a’r modd yr effeithia ar Gymru, yn feddylfryd da, synhwyrol, Ceidwadol a gynlluniwyd i arwain at drethi is. Fodd bynnag, gallaf barchu’r rheini sydd yn anghytuno â mi, fel y gwna llawer yn y Siambr hon. Yr hyn a ystyriaf sydd yn werth ei gondemnio, a gwaeth na hynny, yw pan fydd Llywodraeth yn cynyddu trethi’n sylweddol ac ar yr un pryd yn torri neu’n dal treth incwm yn ôl fel ymarfer cysylltiadau cyhoeddus. Derbyniaf fod cydbwysedd trethiant yn amrywio dros

the last four years has been so regressive that it has had a disproportionately large impact on the poorest regions of Britain, including Wales, where the income tax paid per capita is lower. The Labour Government should be ashamed of that.

However, the Labour Government is lucky because as bad as its policies are, there is always a political party that can be depended on to come up with something worse—the Liberal Democrats. No matter what level of taxation a British Chancellor levies and no matter how much damage the tax burden inflicts on Wales and Welsh business through a burgeoning tax take, the Liberal Democrats will call for just 1 more p. When the tax stake was £100 billion per year—1 more p; at £120 billion—1 more p; at £140 billion—1 more p; at £160 billion—still 1 more p. The Liberal Democrats are the 1p party—the dodgy-prostate party—[*Laughter.*]

Given that this is a Plaid Cymru motion, it would be unfair to leave them out of this because they have such an interesting policy of more and more tax. They are the new socialists and proud of it. They will stand up and cheer about it. Let all those small 'c' conservative voters who have been attracted to Plaid Cymru over the years come back to their natural home, which is the Conservative Party.

11:35 a.m.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Delyth, I can allow you three minutes as we have to finish within an hour. I could refuse to call Delyth as we have run out of time, but I want to give her the opportunity to speak. Members are responsible for their own speeches.

Delyth Evans: Gan ein bod yn sôn am record y Llywodraeth Lafur yn y drafodaeth hon, mae'n hollol ddilys ein bod, ar yr un pryd, yn ystyried polisiau arfaethedig Plaid Cymru. Mae rhywun yn digalonni wrth ddarllen dogfen fel maniffesto Plaid Cymru ar gyfer yr etholiad cyffredinol. Mae'n llawn

gyfnod o amser, ond mae hyn wedi digwydd dros y pedair blynedd diwethaf ar raddfa mor atchweliadol fel y cafodd effaith anghymesur ar ardaloedd tlotaf Prydain, gan gynnwys Cymru, lle mae'r dreth incwm a delir y pen yn is. Dylai'r Llywodraeth Lafur deimlo cywilydd o achos hynny.

Fodd bynnag, mae'r Llywodraeth Lafur yn ffodus oherwydd, er mor wael yw ei pholisiau, mae yna blaid wleidyddol o hyd y gellir dibynnu arni i feddwl am rywbeth gwaeth—y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Waeth faint yw lefel y trethiant a godir gan Ganghellor Prydain ac waeth faint o ddifrod a achosir i Gymru a busnesau Cymru gan y baich treth drwy dderbyniadau treth cynyddol, bydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn galw am un geiniog arall. Pan oedd cyfanswm y trethi yn £100 biliwn y flwyddyn—un geiniog ychwanegol; £120 biliwn—un geiniog ychwanegol; £140 biliwn—un geiniog ychwanegol; £160 biliwn—un geiniog ychwanegol o hyd. Y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yw plaid y geiniog ychwanegol—[*Chwerthin.*]

O gofio mai cynnig Plaid Cymru yw hwn, byddai'n annheg eu hepgor o hyn gan fod ganddynt bolisi mor ddiddorol o fwy a mwy o dreth. Nhw yw'r sosialwyr newydd ac maent yn falch o hynny. Gadewch i'r holl bleidleiswyr ceidwadol gydag 'c' fach a ddenwyd i Blaid Cymru dros y blynyddoedd ddychwelyd i'w cartref naturiol sef y Blaid Geidwadol.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Delyth, gallaf adael ichi gael tair munud gan fod yn rhaid inni orffen ymhen awr. Gallwn wrthod galw Delyth gan fod ein hamser wedi dod i ben, ond yr wyf am roi'r cyfle iddi siarad. Mae'r Aelodau yn gyfrifol am eu hareithiau eu hunain.

Delyth Evans: As we are referring to the Labour Government's record in this discussion, it is valid that we, at the same time, consider Plaid Cymru's proposed policies. It is depressing to read a document such as Plaid Cymru's manifesto for this general election. It is full of misleading and

honiadau ffug a charmarweiniol, nid yn unig am record y Llywodraeth Lafur ond am yr hyn y gallai llywodraeth arfaethedig Plaid Cymru ei gyflawni. Dyma rai o'r cynlluniau ar gyfer llywodraeth: codi'r isafswm cyflog i £5.00 yr awr; darparu cynllun ymddeol i ffermwyr; ailwladoli Railtrack; ailwladoli'r diwydiant dur; cynyddu gwariant ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus heb ddarparu unrhyw ffigurau ar hynny. Byddai'r cynlluniau hyn, ynghyd â'r holl gynlluniau eraill a gynigir, yn costio biliynau o bunnoedd. Sut y bydd yn talu am y rhaglen hud a lledrith hon? Mae'n bwriadu codi trethi ar y rhai sydd yn ennill mwy na £50,000 i 50 y cant o'u hincwm. Byddai'r codiad trethi hwn yn dod â £285 miliwn o arian ychwanegol i'r gyllideb Gymreig. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddai hynny'n ddigon i dalu am chwarter yr argymhellion hyn. Felly o ble y daw gweddill yr arian? Ar raglen radio yr wythnos hon, dywedodd Cynog Dafis fel ateb i'r cwestiwn hwn:

'It is not our business to set out a fully costed programme for public expenditure at the UK level'.

Yr ydych yn blaid wleidyddol, yr ydych am i bobl bleidleisio drosoch, yr ydych am fod yn Llywodraeth Cymru ac eto, yr hyn a ddywedwch yw, 'it is not our business to set out a fully costed programme'. Mae hyn yn nonsens amlwg. Mae cymaint o gelwydd yn eich rhaglen am bolisïau Llafur.

Rod Richards: Soniodd Delyth bod Cynog Dafis wedi dweud, 'it is not our business to set out a fully costed programme'. Os cofiaf yn iawn, cyn etholiad 1997, pan ofynnwyd i gynrychiolwyr y Blaid Lafur ddweud sut y byddent yn costio eu polisïau, yr ateb oedd y byddai'n rhaid iddynt aros nes iddynt weld y llyfrau.

Delyth Evans: Yr oedd gan y Blaid Lafur ar y pryd gynllun clir ynglŷn â sut y byddai'n codi arian ac ar beth y byddai'n ei wario. Yr oedd yn gynllun realistig a dyna pam y pleidleisiodd pobl dros y Blaid Lafur a'i rhoi mewn grym.

Rhodaf un enghraifft o nonsens Plaid Cymru. Mae'n ymosod ar y Llywodraeth Lafur am ad-dalu'r ddyled genedlaethol yn lle buddsoddi mewn gwasanaethau. Pan

false claims, not only on the Labour Government's record, but also on what a proposed Plaid Cymru Government could do. Here are some of its plans for government: raising the minimum wage to £5.00 an hour; retirement plans for farmers; the renationalisation of Railtrack; the renationalisation of the steel industry; an increase in public expenditure, without providing any figures for that. These plans, along with all the other proposed plans, would cost billions of pounds. How will it pay for this fantasy programme? It intends to raise the taxes of those who earn more than £50,000 to 50 per cent of their income. That tax raise would bring an additional £285 million into the Welsh budget. However, that would not be enough to pay for a quarter of its proposals. Where will the rest of the money come from? On a radio programme this week, Cynog Dafis said in response to this question:

You are a political party, you want people to vote for you, you want to be the Government of Wales and yet you say that 'it is not our business to set out a fully costed programme'. That is blatant nonsense. There are so many lies in your programme on Labour's policies.

Rod Richards: Delyth mentioned that Cynog Dafis said that it was not Plaid Cymru's business to cost its programmes. If I remember rightly, when representatives of the Labour Party were asked to cost their policies, before the 1997 election, the answer given by everyone was that they must wait until they saw the books.

Delyth Evans: The Labour Party at that time had a clear plan on how to raise the money and on what they would spend it. It was a realistic plan and that is why people voted for the Labour Party and put it into power.

I will give you one example of Plaid Cymru's nonsense. It attacks the Labour Government for repaying the national debt rather than investing in public service. When

ddaeth Llafur i rym, yr oeddem yn talu mwy mewn cyfraddau llog ar y ddyled genedlaethol nac yr oeddem ar addysg ym Mhrydain. Y rheswm dros ad-dalu'r ddyled genedlaethol oedd er mwyn rhyddhau arian ychwanegol ar gyfer ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Nid ydych wedi deall y pwynt sylfaenol hwnnw ynglŷn ag ad-dalu'r ddyled genedlaethol.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Will you wind up, please?

Delyth Evans: Dysgodd y Plaid Lafur wers boenus yn ystod ei deunaw mlynedd fel gwrthblaid sef na fyddai yn ennill mandad i lywodraethu, nac yn wir yn haeddu'r mandad hwnnw, nes iddi esbonio'n glir ac yn onest sut y byddai'n talu am ei huchelgais i wella Prydain. Nid yw Plaid Cymru yn dod yn agos—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Delyth, nobody can hear you, I have pressed the red button.

The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart): This is gesture politics at its most blatant. The notion that Janet Ryder's principles prevent her from driving down the A55 because it was built with private finance initiative funding is hilarious. If she followed the same principle, she would not be able to go to Baglan hospital, when it is built, or use any of the new schools. The reality of politics is that we must have capital investment. I believe it was Russell Goodway who said to the Local Government and Housing Committee yesterday, and I apologise if I misquote him, 'Who cares who owns the building? It is the services that are delivered and the quality that count.'

This motion predictably expresses 'profound concern'. 'Profound' gives the impression that those proposing the motion are a bit deeper than the rest of us other mortals. It is like the language you find on a sympathy card, full of apparent sincerity. The truth is different. We as an administration can deliver. Plaid Cymru cannot. All it can do is complain. None of us are ever completely happy about anything in life, but for the last

Labour came into power, we were paying more in interest on the national debt than on education in Britain. The reason for repaying the national debt was to free up money for our public services. You have not understood that basic point on repaying the national debt.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: A fyddech cystal â dirwyr i ben?

Delyth Evans: The Labour Party learnt a painful lesson during its 18 years in opposition, that it would never win a mandate to govern, or even deserve that mandate, until it set out clearly and honestly how it would pay for its ambition to improve Britain. Plaid Cymru does not come close—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Delyth, ni all unrhyw un eich clywed, yr wyf wedi gwasgu'r botwm coch.

Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart): Ystumio gwleidyddol yw hyn ar ei fwyaf amlwg. Mae'r syniad bod egwyddorion Janet Ryder yn ei hatal rhag gyrru ar hyd yr A55 am fod y ffordd wedi ei hadeiladu gydag arian y fenter cyllid preifat yn ddoniol iawn. Pe bai wedi dilyn yr un egwyddor, ni fyddai'n gallu mynd i ysbyty Baglan, pan gaiff ei adeiladu, na defnyddio un o'r ysgolion newydd. Realiti gwleidyddiaeth yw bod yn rhaid inni gael buddsoddiad cyfalaf. Credaf mai Russell Goodway a ddywedodd wrth y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai ddoe, ac ymddiheuraf os camddyfynaf ef, 'Who cares who owns the building? It is the services that are delivered and the quality that count.'

Mae'r cynnig hwn, yn ôl y disgwyl yn mynegi 'pryder difrifol'. Mae 'difrifol' yn rhoi'r argraff bod y rheini sydd yn cynnig y cynnig ychydig yn ddyfnach na'r gweddill ohonom ni feidrolion. Mae'n debyg i'r iaith a welwch ar gerdyn cydymdeimlad, yn llawn diffuantrwydd ffug. Mae'r gwirionedd yn wahanol. Gallwn ni fel gweinyddiaeth gyflawni pethau. Ni all Plaid Cymru. Y cyfan y gall ei wneud yw cwyno. Nid oes yr un

four years there have been real achievements. People all across the UK know that, whether it is the minimum wage or trade union representation. We must look at what has happened. We have not had a run on the pound by international speculators undermining our currency. Our problems are the problems of success. One of the first actions of the new Labour Government in 1997 was to make the Bank of England independent. Many criticised that at the time. Nearly everyone now agrees what an excellent decision that was, given the financial stability that has resulted.

The commonly held wisdom of the 1980s was that the price for low inflation was high unemployment. The Labour Government has disproved that. Despite all the setbacks in manufacturing, jobs in Wales rose by 50,000 between 1997 and December 2000. Plaid Cymru is like a spectator that constantly says, 'You will never do it'. It is always disappointed when we prove it wrong. An example of that is the spending review when the Assembly secured additional money to deliver the structural funds programme. Do you remember the clamour about Objective 1? If the Treasury had just supported Objective 1, there would have been a shortfall over three years of £120 million. The settlement proved flexible for us and I am sure that we will now deliver on that particular programme.

Plaid Cymru also missed the mark when it said that we would not deliver certain things. It has also been proved wrong on the spending review, which was an excellent settlement, with the addition of the structural funds that I indicated.

Phil Williams: Will you give way?

Edwina Hart: No, I will not. The exchange rate situation is complex. As you know, the euro is stronger against the pound. On the other hand, the rate against the dollar is about 6.5 per cent lower than a year ago. Before Alun Cairns gets too excited about that, the latest data shows that the rate against the yen

ohonom fyth yn hollol fodlon ar unrhyw beth mewn bywyd, ond ers y pedair blynedd diwethaf, cafwyd llwyddiannau gwirioneddol. Gŵyr pobl ledled y DU hynny, pa un a soniwn am yr isafswm cyflog neu gynrychiolaeth undebau llafur. Rhaid inni edrych ar yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd. Ni welsom werthu ar y bunt gan hapfasnachwyr rhyngwladol yn tanseilio ein harian cyfred. Problemau llwyddiant yw ein problemau. Un o'r camau cyntaf a gymerwyd gan y Llywodraeth Lafur newydd yn 1997 oedd gwneud Banc Lloegr yn annibynnol. Beirniadwyd hynny gan lawer ar y pryd. Erbyn hyn mae bron pawb yn cytuno y gwnaethpwyd penderfyniad rhagorol, o gofio'r sefydlogrwydd ariannol a ddeilliodd o hynny.

Y doethineb a arddelwyd yn gyffredin yn yr 1980au oedd mai'r pris am chwyddiant isel oedd diweithdra uchel. Mae'r Llywodraeth Lafur wedi gwrthbrofi hynny. Er gwaethaf yr holl rwystrau mewn gweithgynhyrchu, cynyddodd nifer y swyddi yng Nghymru 50,000 rhwng 1997 a Rhagfyr 2000. Mae Plaid Cymru fel gwylwr sydd yn dweud yn gyson, 'Ni lwyddwch byth'. Mae bob amser yn siomedig pan brofw'n nad oedd yn gywir. Enghraifft o hynny yw'r adolygiad gwariant pan sicrhodd y Cynulliad arian ychwanegol i gyflawni'r rhaglen cronfeydd strwythurol. A gofiwch yr helynt ynglŷn ag Amcan 1? Pe bai'r Trysorlys wedi cefnogi Amcan 1 yn unig, byddai diffyg wedi bod dros dair blynedd o £120 miliwn. Bu'r setliad yn hyblyg inni ac yr wyf yn siŵr y gweithredwn ar y rhaglen arbennig honno yn awr.

Methodd Plaid Cymru y nod hefyd pan ddywedodd na fyddem yn cyflawni rhai pethau penodol. Nid oedd yn gywir ychwaith ynglŷn â'r adolygiad o wariant, a oedd yn setliad rhagorol, gyda'r cronfeydd strwythurol ychwanegol a nodais.

Phil Williams: A ildiwch?

Edwina Hart: Na wna. Mae sefyllfa'r gyfradd gyfnewid yn gymhleth. Fel y gwyddoch, mae'r ewro yn gryfach na'r bunt. Ar y llaw arall, o gymharu'r gyfradd â'r ddoler mae tua 6.5 y cant yn is nag yr oedd flwyddyn yn ôl. Cyn i Alun Cairns gynhyrfu ormod ynglŷn â hynny, dengys y data

is 4.8 per cent higher than it was a year ago. It is only to middle-aged men in saloon bars that the answer to all these economic questions is so blindingly obvious. If the nationalists have solved the conundrum of how to bring exchange rates into balance in a way that benefits Wales, why do they not let us in on their secret—

David Davies: Point of order. If I were to talk about chattering women in hairdressers—

Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I have pressed the red button. There is no point your continuing to speak; nobody can hear you. I take exception to that point of order, David. It is not a point of order for me. What Edwina said was not out of order. I would be grateful when you raise points of order, in future, if there were some semblance of a point of order in what you say.

Edwina Hart: As I said, why do they not let us in on their secret? Can they explain why it is that, as the Japanese economy weakens, the pound rises against the yen, but, as the US economy weakens to the point of recession, the pound falls against the dollar? The answer is that markets do not behave rationally, Alun. That is a fact of life. Even if an action was aimed at reducing the pound's value, there is no guarantee that such an action would have the required result. To imagine that it would is to simply accept the kindergarten economics of the Tories. I suppose that it is logical, after all the attacks on this administration, that Plaid Cymru and the Tories are now almost together in kindergarten economics. They are joined ideologically, as well as politically, across this Chamber in opposing every decent thing that we have done as an administration.

Manufacturing in Wales has received serious blows this year. However, let us be clear: manufacturing losses in the 1980s were a result of the worker-hostile government philosophy that saw high efficiency and high unemployment as going hand-in-hand. That is neither our philosophy nor our practice. No-one can doubt where the sympathies of

diweddaraf fod y gyfradd o'i chymharu â'r ien yn 4.8 y cant yn uwch nag yr oedd flwyddyn yn ôl. Dim ond i ddynion canol oed mewn bariau salŵn y mae'r ateb i'r holl gwestiynau economaidd hyn yn ddigon amlwg i'w dallu. Os yw'r cenedlaetholwyr wedi datrys y pos o sut i fantoli'r cyfraddau cyfnewid mewn ffordd sydd yn fanteisiol i Gymru, pam na rannent eu cyfrinach â ni—

David Davies: Pwynt o drefn. Pe bawn yn sôn am ferched parablus mewn siopau trin gwallt—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Yr wyf wedi gwasgu'r botwm coch. Nid oes diben ichi barhau i siarad; ni all unrhyw un eich clywed. Gwrthwynebaf y pwynt o drefn hwnnw, David. Nid yw'n bwynt o drefn i mi. Nid oedd yr hyn a ddywedodd Edwina allan o drefn. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pan godwch bwyntiau o drefn yn y dyfodol, pe bai rhyw lun ar bwynt o drefn yn yr hyn a ddywedwch.

Edwina Hart: Fel y dywedais, pam na rannant eu cyfrinach â ni? A allant egluro pam fod y bunt, wrth i economi Japan wanhau, yn codi o'i chymharu â'r ien, ond, wrth i economi'r UD wanhau hyd at ddirwasgiad, bod y bunt yn gostwng o'i chymharu â'r ddoler? Yr ateb yw nad yw marchnadoedd yn ymddwyn mewn ffordd resymegol, Alun. Mae hynny'n ffaith. Hyd yn oed pe cymerid cam i leihau gwerth y bunt, nid oes unrhyw sicrwydd y byddai cam o'r fath yn rhoi'r canlyniad a ddymunir. Mae dychmygu y byddai'n gwneud hynny fel derbyn economeg blentynnaidd y Torïaid. Mae'n rhesymegol, siŵr o fod, ar ôl yr holl ymosodiadau ar y weinyddiaeth hon, bod Plaid Cymru a'r Torïaid bron yn unedig yn awr o ran economeg blentynnaidd. Maent wedi uno'n ideolegol, yn ogystal â gwleidyddol, ar draws y Siambr hon wrth wrthwynebu pob peth safonol a wnaethom fel gweinyddiaeth.

Dioddefodd gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru ergydion difrifol eleni. Fodd bynnag, gadewch inni fod yn glir: cafwyd colledion gweithgynhyrchu yn yr 1980au o ganlyniad i athroniaeth anghyfeillgar y Llywodraeth tuag at weithwyr a welodd effeithlonrwydd uchel a diweithdra uchel yn mynd law yn llaw. Nid ein hathroniaeth na'n harfer ni yw hynny. Yr

the Government lay when job losses at Corus were announced. It was the macho management philosophy that delivered that blow to those workers. It is for that reason that the Government has unitedly, at a UK and Wales level, been able to ensure that substantial support is being given to those communities. Jobs in manufacturing now account for 8.6 per cent of all jobs in Wales. That is significantly more than in the UK as a whole, but less than in the Midlands, Yorkshire and Humberside. Therefore, Plaid Cymru is not justified in having an English chip on its shoulder about all the issues that affect Wales. I understand Plaid Cymru's frustration. We can deliver and it cannot. As far as the Conservatives are concerned, they cannot see a bandwagon without jumping on it and today's amendments are a fine example of that. They are gesture politics with a vengeance.

11:45 a.m.

We will not support amendment 1. It is blatant electioneering not within the Assembly's gift. Neither will we support amendment 2 as it is also blatant electioneering not within the Assembly's gift. The same goes for amendment 3. On amendment 4, while the policy to direct money to hospitals and schools may be appropriate in some circumstances for England, such policy is not binding in Wales. It is for the Assembly to decide, in light of its overall priorities, how to spend its resources on health and education. We prefer to work in partnership with local education authorities and national health service bodies. This approach is far more likely to deliver the desired outcomes, rather than directly funding institutions that are narrowly focused and unlikely to meet our strategic objectives. That is a fact of life and a fact of government.

Plaid Cymru's motion and the Conservative amendments may suggest that there is something else going on in the outside world. However, we all know that that is not the case. The Assembly administration also has a

oedd yn amlwg gyda phwy yr oedd y Llywodraeth yn cydymdeimlo pan gyhoeddwyd y colledion swyddi yn Corus. Athroniaeth rheoli 'macho' a darodd yr ergyd honno i'r gweithwyr hynny. Am y rheswm hwnnw mae'r Llywodraeth yn unedig, ar lefel y DU a Chymru, wedi gallu sicrhau bod y cymunedau hynny'n cael cefnogaeth sylweddol. Mae swyddi gweithgynhyrchu bellach yn gyfrifol am 8.6 y cant o'r holl swyddi yng Nghymru. Mae hynny'n sylweddol fwy nag yn y DU yn gyffredinol, ond yn llai nag yng Nghanolbarth Lloegr, Swydd Efrog a Glannau Humber. Felly, nid oes gan Plaid Cymru achos cyfiawn dros ddal dig wrth y Saeson ynglŷn â'r holl faterion sydd yn effeithio ar Gymru. Deallaf rwystredigaeth Plaid Cymru. Gallwn ni gyflawni ond ni all hi. O ran y Ceidwadwyr, ni allant adael i gyfle i ddilyn y dorf fynd heibio ac mae gwelliannau heddiw yn enghraifft dda o hynny. Ystumio gwleidyddol yw hyn heb os nac oni bai.

Ni chefnogwn welliant 1. Lecsiyna amlwg a digywilydd yw hyn nad yw o fewn awdurdod y Cynulliad. Ni chefnogwn ychwaith welliant 2 gan mai lecsiyna amlwg a digywilydd yw hyn hefyd nad yw o fewn awdurdod y Cynulliad. Mae'r un peth yn wir am welliant 3. O ran gwelliant 4, er bod y polisi o gyfeirio arian tuag at ysbytai ac ysgolion yn briodol o dan rai amgylchiadau i Loegr, nid yw polisi o'r fath yn ymrwymol yng Nghymru. Y Cynulliad fydd yn penderfynu, yng ngoleuni ei flaenoriaethau cyffredinol, sut i wario ei adnoddau ar iechyd ac addysg. Byddai'n well gennym weithio mewn partneriaeth ag awdurdodau addysg lleol a chyrrff y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Mae'r ymagwedd hon yn llawer mwy tebygol o gyflawni'r canlyniadau a ddymunir, yn hytrach nag ariannu sefydliadau'n uniongyrchol sydd â nod cul ac sydd yn annhebyg o gyflawni ein hamcanion strategol. Mae hynny'n wir am fywyd ac am Lywodraeth.

Efallai bod cynnig Plaid Cymru a gwelliannau'r Ceidwadwyr yn awgrymu bod rhywbeth arall yn digwydd yn y byd y tu allan. Fodd bynnag, gŵyr pob un ohonom nad felly y mae. Mae gweinyddiaeth y

profound concern for the economy. Our concern is translated into action, not into idle words that are blatant electioneering. Wales is too important for this type of indulgence on macro-economic issues.

Dafydd Wigley: Ymddiheuraf am y dryswch ar ddechrau'r ddadl hon a diolchaf i Cynog Dafis am gymryd yr awenau ar y funud olaf.

Ymatebaf yn gryno i sylwadau Edwina Hart. Rhyfeddais o'i chlywed yn dweud nad yw o bwys pwy sydd yn berchen ar asedau cyhoeddus, cyhyd â'u bod yn gwneud y gwaith. Edrychwn ymlaen, felly, at weld ysgolion, ysbytai a hyd yn oed ffyrdd yn cael eu gwerthu i gwmnïau preifat. Byddai Margaret Thatcher yn falch o glywed y sylwadau hynny.

Mae cynnig y ddadl hon yn mynd i galon ein gwaith fel Cynulliad, ac yn cydnabod mai gan Lywodraeth San Steffan y mae'r pwerau sylfaenol sydd yn rheoli gallu'r Cynulliad i warchod safon byw ac ansawdd bywyd pobl Cymru. Mae polisi ariannol y Llywodraeth a gwerth y bunt yn effeithio ar allu ein cynhyrchwyr i lwyddo. Y gwir yw fod y Llywodraeth wedi golchi ei dwylo o'i chyfrifoldebau yn ystod y pedair blynedd diwethaf, a bu Edwina'n brolio'r modd y bu i Gordon Brown drosglwyddo cyfrifoldebau i Fanc Lloegr. Gwnaeth hynny gydag un nod, sef cadw chwyddiant dan reolaeth. Ni chafwyd sôn am lefel cyflogaeth, lefel deg o incwm y pen na chyfiawnder rhanbarthol. Dyna'r hyn a wnaeth Gordon Brown.

Y polisi hwn a arweiniodd at werth uchel y bunt o'i gymharu â'r ewro, a thrwy hynny ei gwneud bron yn amhosibl i gynhyrchwyr allforio eu nwyddau. Gwelsom yr effaith ar y diwydiant dur ac ar nifer o gwmnïau eraill yn y sector gweithgynhyrchu. Disgynnodd nifer y swyddi yn y sector hwnnw o 218,000 yn 1998 i 202,000 ym Medi 2000. Mae'r ffigur hwnnw yn dal i ddisgyn wrth i filoedd rhagor o swyddi gael eu colli. Mae'r pris hwn yn cael ei dalu yn y sector amaeth hefyd, wrth i swyddi gael eu colli am yr un rheswm. Gwelsom effaith y polisi hwn ar dwristiaeth

Cynulliad hefyd yn pryderu'n aruthrol am yr economi. Caiff ein pryder ei droi yn weithredu, nid yn eiriau ofer sydd yn lecsiyna amlwg a digywilydd. Mae Cymru yn rhy bwysig i'r math hwn o ymblesera mewn materion macro-economaidd.

Dafydd Wigley: I apologise for the confusion at the start of this debate and thank Cynog Dafis for stepping in at the last moment.

I will respond briefly to the comments made by Edwina Hart. I was astonished to hear her say that it does not matter who owns public assets, as long as they do the work. We can look forward, therefore, to seeing the sale of schools, hospitals and even roads to private companies. Margaret Thatcher would have been pleased to hear those comments

The motion of this debate goes to the heart of our work as an Assembly, and acknowledges that the primary powers that control the Assembly's ability to safeguard the living standards and quality of life of the people of Wales lie with the Westminster Government. The Government's monetary policy and the value of the pound affect our producers' ability to succeed. The reality is that the Government has washed its hands of its responsibilities during the past four years, and Edwina was boasting the way in which Gordon Brown transferred responsibilities to the Bank of England. He did so with one aim in mind, namely to keep inflation under control. There was no mention of levels of employment, a fair level of per capita income or regional justice. That is what Gordon Brown did.

It was this policy that led to the high value of the pound against the euro and, as a result, made it almost impossible for manufacturers to export their produce. We have witnessed the impact on the steel industry and on a number of other companies in the manufacturing sector. The number of jobs in that sector decreased from 218,000 in 1998 to 202,000 in September 2000. That figure continues to decrease as thousands more jobs are lost. The price is also being paid in the agriculture industry, as jobs are lost for the same reason. We also saw the effects of this

hefyd, cyn i'r diwydiant hwnnw gael ei ddinistrio o ganlyniad i argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau.

Dyna effeithiau damniol polisi ariannol Llafur Newydd ar yr economi Gymreig. Mae wedi dinistrio swyddi, tanseilio busnesau a lleihau lefelau incwm.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: A ydych yn derbyn, er gwaethaf y rhestr honno o drasiedïau, fod lefel cyflogaeth yng Nghymru yn cynyddu?

Dafydd Wigley: Yr wyf wedi gweld y ddau ffigur a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos hon, sydd yn gwrth-ddweud ei gilydd. Fodd bynnag, derbyniaf y bu cynnydd o'i gymharu â sefyllfa'r gorffennol. Fy mhryder yw y bu'r cynnydd, i raddau helaeth, yn y sector gwasanaethau, nid yn y diwydiannau sydd yn helpu i gynyddu cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen. Ein nod fel cenedl yw cau'r bwlch o ran CMC y pen, er mwyn cyrraedd y targed a osodwyd ar gyfer hynny o dan Amcan 1.

Brian Gibbons *rose*—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Will you give way to Brian Gibbons?

Dafydd Wigley: Nid wyf am ildio eto gan fy mod yn wynebu targed o ran yr amser.

Effaith hyn oll yw lleihad yng nghynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen Cymru, o'i gymharu â gweddill Prydain. Yr oedd y ffigur yn 90 y cant yn y 1970au, 82.6 y cant yn 1996 ac 80.2 y cant yn 1998. Mae'r ffigur hwnnw'n parhau i ddisgyn. [AELODAU LLAFUR Y CYNULLIAD: 'Nac ydy.']

Ydy, mae'r ffigur yn parhau i ddisgyn. Noda ffigurau cyhoeddus ei fod yn 80.2 y cant yn 1998. Gwn nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn hoff o hynny, ond rhaid iddi wynebu'r ffeithiau. Dyna drasedi—

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae'r cwmp o 82.5 y cant i 79.5 y cant yr ydych chi a Cynog yn cyfeirio ato drwy'r amser yn ailasesiad gan ystadegwyr y Llywodraeth. Nid cwmp mohono, ond ailasesiad. Y ffigur oedd 79.5 y cant ond mae wedi codi i 80.2 y cant. Dyna'r hyn y mae'r ystadegwyr yn ei ddweud. Yr

policy on tourism, before that industry was destroyed as a result of the foot and mouth disease crisis.

Those are the damning effects of New Labour's monetary policy on the Welsh economy. It has destroyed jobs, undermined businesses and decreased income levels.

The First Minister: Do you accept that, despite that list of tragedies, the level of employment in Wales is increasing?

Dafydd Wigley: I have seen the two figures published this week, which contradict each another. However, I accept that there has been an increase compared with the past situation. I am concerned that the increase occurred, to a great extent, in the service sector, not in the industries that help increase the level of gross domestic product per capita. Our aim as a nation is to close the gap in terms of GDP per capita, in order to reach the target set under Objective 1.

Brian Gibbons *a gododd*—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: A ildiwch i Brian Gibbons?

Dafydd Wigley: I will not give way as I am facing a target as regards time.

The overall effect of this is a decrease in GDP per capita in Wales, as compared with the rest of Britain. The figure was 90 per cent in the 1970s, 82.6 per cent in 1996 and 80.2 per cent in 1998. The figure is still falling. [LABOUR ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'No it is not'.]

Yes, the figure is still falling. Public figures note that it was 80.2 per cent in 1998. I know that the Government does not like that, but it must face facts. That is the tragedy—

The First Minister: The fall from 82.5 per cent to 79.5 per cent to which you and Cynog keep referring is a reassessment by Government statisticians. It is not a fall, but a reassessment. The figure was 79.5 per cent but it has risen to 80.2 per cent. That is what the statisticians say. You misunderstand the

ydych yn camddeall y sefyllfa. Mae'n amlwg o'r ffigurau cyhoeddus.

Dafydd Wigley: Pe bai'r Prif Weinidog wedi gwranddo, byddai'n gwybod na ddywedais 79.5 y cant. Dywedais 80.2 y cant, yr union ffigur y cyfeiriodd ato. Cafwyd gostyngiad i'r ffigur hwnnw. Mae'n gyfleus bod ystadegwyr y Llywodraeth yn gallu newid ffigurau er cyfleustra i Lywodraeth yng nghanol y cyfnod sydd yn arwain at etholiad cyffredinol. Mae ymateb y Prif Weinidog i'r sefyllfa hon yn dweud y cyfan am gydwybod y Llywodraeth Lafur.

Gwelsom hefyd effeithiau polisiau ceidwadol Llywodraeth Llafur Newydd, er enghraifft y modd y mae'r gagendor rhwng y cyfoethog a'r tlawd wedi tyfu dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf, o dan Lywodraethau Ceidwadol a Llafur. Gostyngwyd y baich trethiannol ar yr 20 y cant mwyaf cyfoethog ym Mhrydain o 37 y cant i 35 y cant dros yr 20 mlynedd diwethaf. Dros yr un cyfnod, cafwyd codiad yn y baich trethiannol ar yr 20 y cant mwyaf tlawd o 31 y cant i 38 y cant. Dyna ganlyniad symudiad tuag at drethiant anuniongyrchol yn bennaf.

Dyma ffrwyth polisiau trethiant Llywodraeth Llafur Newydd a'r Torïaid, sef gwneud y cyfoethog yn gyfoethocach a'r tlawd yn dlotach. A all Aelodau Llafur edrych i'n llygaid a brolio am y record hwnnw gan y Llywodraeth Llafur Newydd yn Llundain?

Mae trydedd elfen ein cynnig yn ymwneud â lefel gwariant cyhoeddus y wlad. Ynghylch gwelliant Alun Cairns, ni wn o ble y mae'n cael ei ffigurau. Y realiti yw bod canran y cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth a oedd yn cael ei wario ar wariant cyhoeddus ym Mhrydain yn 1999, sef 39.1 y cant, yn llai na'r lefel yn Sweden, Denmarc, Ffrainc, Awstria, yr Eidal, Gwlad Belg, y Ffindir, yr Almaen, Groeg, yr Iseldiroedd, Portiwgal a Sbaen. Daw'r wybodaeth honno o'r Sefydliad Astudiaethau Ariannol.

Rhaid inni fod yn barod i gyllido gwariant cyhoeddus. Mae angen gwariant cyhoeddus yn y sectorau addysg, iechyd a thai, a rhaid inni ysgogi'r gwariant hwnnw a chreu'r amodau i godi cyflogau yn y diwydiannau cynhyrchu.

situation. It is obvious from the public figures.

Dafydd Wigley: If the First Minister had listened, he would know that I did not say 79.5 per cent. I said 80.2 per cent, the exact figure to which he referred. There has been a reduction to that figure. It is convenient that Government statisticians can change figures for the convenience of a Government in the middle of the period leading up to a general election. The First Minister's response to this situation says it all about the Labour Government's conscience.

We have also seen the effects of the New Labour Government's conservative policies, for example how the gap between rich and poor has grown over the last few years, under Conservative and Labour Governments. The tax burden on the richest 20 per cent in Britain has dropped from 37 per cent to 35 per cent over the past 20 years. Over the same period, there was an increase in the tax burden on the poorest 20 per cent from 31 per cent to 38 per cent. That is a result of a move towards indirect taxation mainly.

This is the result of the taxation policy of the New Labour Government and the Tories, namely making the rich richer and the poor poorer. Can Labour Members look us in the eye and boast about that record of the New Labour Government in London?

The third element of our motion relates to the country's level of public spending. On Alun Cairns's amendment, I do not know from where he gets his figures. The reality is that the percentage of gross domestic product spent on public spending in Britain in 1999, 39.1 per cent, was lower than the level in Sweden, Denmark, France, Austria, Italy, Belgium, Finland, Germany, Greece, the Netherlands, Portugal and Spain. That information comes from the Institute of Fiscal Studies.

We must be prepared to fund public spending. We need public spending in the education, health and housing sectors, and we must encourage that spending and create the conditions to raise salaries in the manufacturing industries.

Gwelsom ras rhwng Llywodraethau Ceidwadol a Llafur, sydd wedi ceisio gostwng treth incwm yn hytrach na dweud yn anrhydeddus eu bod yn credu mewn gwariant cyhoeddus a'u bod yn fodlon talu amdano. Dyna pam y rhoddwn y cynnig hwn ger bron y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

Peter Law: Point of order. Do you know where the Liberal Democrats are? Does this prove what I have always said—that you cannot trust them? Are they away, being sponsored by taxpayers' money, canvassing? They are all missing.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I heard Peter Black's speech, but I have no further knowledge apart from what was said in the Chamber recently.

We have seen a race between Conservative and Labour Governments, who have tried to reduce income tax rather than say honourably that they believe in public spending and that they are willing to pay for it. That is why we place this motion before the National Assembly.

Peter Law: Pwynt o drefn. A wyddoch ble mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol? A yw hyn yn profi'r hyn yr wyf wedi ei ddweud yn gyson—na allwch ymddiried ynddynt? A ydynt i ffwrdd yn canfasio ac yn cael eu noddi gan arian y trethdalwyr? Nid oes yr un ohonynt yma.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Clywais araith Peter Black, ond nid oes gennyf unrhyw wybodaeth arall ar wahân i'r hyn a ddywedwyd yn y Siambr yn ddiweddar.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 7, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 34.
Amendment 1: For 7, Abstain 0, Against 34.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Graham, William
Melding, David
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Gareth
Lloyd, David
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd

Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 17, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 23.
Amendment 2: For 17, Abstain 0, Against 23.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Jones, Gareth
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Richards, Rod
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 7, Ymatal 11, Yn erbyn 23.
Amendment 3: For 7, Abstain 11, Against 23.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Graham, William
Melding, David
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne

Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Jones, Gareth
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 7 , Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 34.
Amendment 4: For 7, Abstain 0, Against 34.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Graham, William
Melding, David
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Gareth
Lloyd, David
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected.*

11:55 a.m.

*Cynnig: O blaid 17, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 22.
Motion: For 17, Abstain 0, Against 22.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Jones, Gareth
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.
Motion rejected.*

Dadl Fer Short Debate

Bod yn Rhydd o Addasu Genetig ai Peidio To Be GM-free or Not

Richard Edwards: I understand that in his weekly media briefing on Monday, the Minister for Assembly Business was challenged about how frequently I seem to be delivering the short debate, three in as many weeks it was claimed. It was a genetically modified claim, because it is actually three in five months. The media exaggerated—that is a novelty. There may be an implication that somehow I am rigging the ballot. If I could rig a ballot I would aim at something more ambitious than the short debate. It is three in five months, and four in two years, to give the complete picture. As usual, I have agreed to requests from Rhodri Glyn Thomas, Glyn Davies and Eleanor Burnham to contribute a minute each to the debate.

Richard Edwards: Yn ei friff wythnosol i'r cyfryngau ddydd Llun, deallaf yr heriwyd y Trefnydd ynglŷn â pha mor aml yr ymdengys fy mod yn cyflwyno'r ddadl fer, sef deirgwaith mewn tair wythnos yn ôl yr honiad. Honiad a addaswyd yn enetig ydoedd, gan mai tri mewn pum mis ydyw mewn gwirionedd. Gorliwiodd y cyfryngau'r ffeithiau—dyna beth newydd. Efallai bod ensyniad fy mod yn rigio'r bleidlais rhywsut. Pe gallwn rigio pleidlais byddwn yn anelu at rywbeth mwy uchelgeisiol na'r ddadl fer. Yr wyf wedi ei chyflwyno deirgwaith mewn pum mis, a bedair gwaith mewn dwy flynedd, i roi'r darlun llawn. Fel arfer, cytunais i geisiadau gan Rhodri Glyn Thomas, Glyn Davies ac Eleanor Burnham i gyfrannu munud yr un i'r ddadl.

Last Saturday night I had the pleasure of attending a community party at Mathry village hall, to join the celebration of a great community triumph—the withdrawal from the UK GM farm-scale evaluations programme by the owners of Castle Cenlas farm. It was a voluntary withdrawal in the face of unanimous community opposition, from organic and conventional farmers, environmentalists, scientists and from all local people who were prepared to stand up and be counted in their determination to preserve a green, clean organic future for this most ecologically sensitive of areas.

Contrary to the disgraceful, inflammatory allegations of Mr Ben Gill, the President of the National Farmers' Union, with its large investments in Monsanto, the protest was not the work of political agitators intent on violent direct action. The protest was good-humoured and peaceful. Ask the local police. It was a whole community speaking with one voice and speaking unequivocally, not only for Mathry and Pembrokeshire, but for all of Wales. People power, in the most inclusive sense, and quite the reverse of shallow nimbyism. In fact, I have suggested that the community might care to export its zeal to other parts of the country in the absence of effective resistance from the institutions of government, including this Assembly. However, this was a great victory on a local scale only. In the greater scheme of things, the Assembly is no nearer achieving its aspiration of a GM-free Wales. The seed has been planted in Sealand, as it was last year. The people of Mathry took their destiny into their own hands. What about the Assembly having the courage to do likewise? Perhaps we could start addressing the democratic deficit by exploring and exposing what is undoubtedly a scientific deficit. The word 'science' conjures up, in my mind, images of rigorous intellectual discipline and objectivity in the pursuit of universal truths. I am not a Luddite, but neither am I an apologist for multinational corporations who masquerade as dispassionate scientific observers.

Nos Sadwrn diwethaf cefais y pleser o fynychu parti cymunedol yn neuadd bentref Mathri, er mwyn ymuno â dathlu buddugoliaeth gymunedol bwysig—sef diddymu rhaglen asesiadau ar raddfa fferm cynydau a addaswyd yn enetig yn y DU gan berchnogion fferm Castell Cenlas. Yr oedd yn ddiddymiad gwirfoddol yn wyneb gwrthwynebiad cymunedol unfrydol, gan ffermwyr organig a chonfensiynol, ymgyrchwyr amgylcheddol, gwyddonwyr a chan yr holl bobl leol a oedd yn barod i sefyll dros eu hegwyddorion yn eu hymdrech benderfynol i ddiogelu dyfodol gwyrdd, glân i'r ardal hon sydd yn hynod o sensitif yn ecolegol.

Yn groes i honiadau cywilyddus, ymfflamychol Mr Ben Gill, Llywydd Undeb Cenedlaethol y Ffermwyr, sydd â buddsoddiadau mawr yn Monsanto, nid gwaith cynhyrfwyr gwleidyddol â'i bryd ar weithredu uniongyrchol treisgar oedd y brotest. Yr oedd y brotest yn ddifalais a heddychlon. Gofynnwch i'r heddlu lleol. Cymuned gyfan a oedd yn siarad ag un llais ac yn siarad yn ddigamsyniol, nid yn unig dros Mathri a Sir Benfro, ond dros Gymru gyfan. Grym y bobl ydoedd, yn yr ystyr mwyaf cynhwysol, ac yn hollol groes i hunan-les arwynebol. Yn wir, awgrymais efallai yr hoffai'r gymuned drosglwyddo ei brwdfrydedd i rannau eraill o'r wlad yn absenoldeb gwrthwynebiad effeithlon gan sefydliadau'r llywodraeth, gan gynnwys y Cynulliad hwn. Fodd bynnag, buddugoliaeth fawr ar raddfa leol yn unig oedd hon. Yn y darlun ehangach, nid yw'r Cynulliad fymryn agosach at wireddu ei ddymuniad o gael Cymru'n rhydd o gnydau a addaswyd yn enetig. Plannwyd yr hadau yn Sealand, fel y gwnaethpwyd y llynedd. Cymerodd pobl Mathri eu tynged i'w dwylo eu hunain. Beth am i'r Cynulliad fagu'r dewrder i weithredu yn yr un modd? Efallai y gallem gychwyn ymdrin â'r diffyg democrataidd drwy archwilio ac amlygu'r hyn sydd, heb amheuaeth, yn ddiffyg gwyddonol. Yn fy meddwl i, mae'r gair 'gwyddoniaeth' yn dwyn i gof ddelweddau o ddisgyblaeth ddeallusol lem a gwrthrychedd yn yr ymchwil am wirioneddau cyffredinol. Nid Ludiad mohonof, ond nid diffynnydd mohonof ychwaith ar ran corfforaethau amlwladol sydd yn ffugio bod yn wylwyr

We are told that trials on genetically modified crops are not about safety issues. Big science—by which I mean scientists tainted by commercial involvement with the agri-chemical and biotechnology industries—tells us that safety is already proven.

I have mentioned before in this Chamber, that history is littered with false assurances from so-called independent scientists. There is something poignant—or should I say grotesque—about the irony that only a week after the publication of the Phillips report last October on the BSE catastrophe, a public inquiry established that the minimum official testing of Chardon LL, the GM maize crop planted at Sealand, had not taken place.

There is no compelling evidence that proves the safety of genetically modified organisms. There is no consensus, no settled scientific view. The matter is hotly disputed. Even the Advisory Committee on Releases to the Environment, concedes that it is a complex issue and that guidance is unlikely to be available until the end of 2001. What happened to the precautionary principle? What we have instead, it seems, is glib complacency from people who should be looking after our best interests and not those of big businesses.

Two renowned geneticists, Professor Brian Goodwin and Dr Mae-Wan Ho, visited Pembrokeshire and the Assembly last week. They have written to ACRE and to the Scientific Steering Committee, which oversees all of the UK farm-scale field trials, demanding that they cease on grounds of legality and safety. I quote

‘Any new technology must be tested ... but there are important scientific issues that must be addressed before GM crops can be released into the environment, even in the context of testing. To conduct field trials before this has been done is both premature and hazardous; it is like carrying out clinical trials of a drug before the laboratory tests are complete.’

They provide evidence that genetic contamination of non-GM and organic crops

gwyddonol gwrthrychol.

Dywedir wrthym nad yw'r profion a wneir ar gnydau a addaswyd yn enetig yn ymwneud â materion diogelwch. Dywed gwyddoniaeth ar raddfa fawr—golygaf wyddonwyr a lygrwyd gan gysylltiad masnachol â'r diwydiannau amaeth-gemegol a biodechnoleg—bod eu diogelwch wedi'i brofi eisoes.

Soniais eisoes yn y Siambr hon, bod hanes yn frith o sicrwydd ffug gan wyddonwyr annibynnol bondigrybwyll. Mae rhywbeth ingol—neu a ddylwn i ddweud grotés—am yr eironi mai dim ond wythnos ar ôl cyhoeddi adroddiad Phillips ar drychineb BSE fis Hydref diwethaf, y darganfu ymchwiliad cyhoeddus nad oedd y profion swyddogol lleiaf ar Chardon LL, y cnwd indrawn a addaswyd yn enetig a blannwyd yn Sealand, wedi digwydd.

Ni cheir tystiolaeth anorchfygol sydd yn profi diogelwch organeddau a addaswyd yn enetig. Nid oes unrhyw gonsensus, unrhyw farn wyddonol sefydlog. Mae anghydweled chwyrn ar y mater. Mae hyd yn oed y Pwyllgor Ymgynghorol ar Ollyngiadau i'r Amgylchedd yn cyfaddef ei fod yn fater cymhleth ac na fydd arweiniad yn debygol o fod ar gael tan ddiwedd 2001. Beth ddigwyddodd i'r egwyddor rhagofal? Ymddengys mai'r hyn sydd ganddom, yn hytrach, yw hunanfodlonrwydd parod gan bobl a ddylai fod yn gofalu am ein buddiannau gorau ni ac nid rhai busnesau mawrion.

Ymwelodd dau enetegwr enwog, sef yr Athro Brian Goodwin a Dr Mae-Wan Ho, â Sir Benfro a'r Cynulliad yr wythnos diwethaf. Maent wedi ysgrifennu at ACRE a'r Pwyllgor Llywio Gwyddonol, sydd yn goruchwyllo holl brofion maes ar raddfa fferm y DU, yn galw arnynt i roi'r gorau i'r profion ar sail cyfreithlondeb a diogelwch. Dyfynnaf

Maent yn darparu tystiolaeth y bydd yn anochel y caiff cnydau nad addaswyd yn

is inevitable, that pollinators including bees may be harmed. Their chief concern is the spread of transgenes and antibiotic resistance genes, by horizontal gene transfer to bacteria in the soil and also by way of transgenic pollen, dust and animal feed to bacteria in the mouth, respiratory tract and gut of both humans and animals. They accuse ACRE of selective interpretation of evidence.

Before considering what action the Assembly could take, there are several major issues on which we should continue to press Westminster. The problem of liability for the crop trials is a shambles. There should be a producer liability compensation scheme based on the principle that the polluter pays. If someone wants to conduct these trials where others in the community stand to suffer substantially, then he or she should be liable. Llangloffan Cheese in Pembrokeshire received an ultimatum from their exporters that if plans for GM planting went ahead, they would no longer be willing to export their cheese. The Assembly must press the Department of the Environment, Transport and the Regions on this matter.

The consultation process is also a shambles, with no one quite sure whether there is a different process required for part B and part C licences. Whatever the process, the dismissive manner in which the Supply Chain Initiative on Modified Agricultural Crops and Aventis have responded to Michael Meacher's reasonable plea for more time to be spent on consultation and notification was appalling and indicates the extent of the democratic deficit. This needs to be sorted. The Assembly must also apply pressure on the DETR about this.

This democratic deficit is deeply worrying. ACRE, SCIMAC and the Scientific Steering Committee seem to be outside the bounds of normal democratic accountability. All have links with the GM industry that are far too strong.

ACRE and the Ministry for Agriculture, Fisheries and Food appear to be blasé about

enetig a chnydau organig eu llygru'n enetig, ac y gall peillwyr yn cynnwys gwenyn gael eu niweidio. Eu prif bryder yw lledaenu trawsennynau a genynnau sydd yn gwrthsefyll gwrthfotigau, drwy drosglwyddo genynnau yn llorweddol i facteria yn y pridd a hefyd drwy baill trawsgenynauidd, llwch a phorthiant anifeiliaid i facteria yn y geg, pibell anadlu a pherfedd bodau dynol ac anifeiliaid. Maent yn cyhuddo ACRE o ddehongli'r dystiolaeth yn ddedhol.

Cyn ystyried pa gamau y gallai'r Cynulliad eu cymryd, mae nifer o faterion pwysig y dylem barhau i roi pwysau ar San Steffan ynglŷn â hwy. Mae'r broblem o bwy sydd yn atebol am y profion cnydau yn llanast. Dylai bod cynllun iawndal cyfrifoldeb cynhyrchydd yn seiliedig ar yr egwyddor mai'r llygrwr sydd yn talu. Os bydd rhywun am gynnal y profion hyn pan fo eraill yn y gymuned yn debygol o ddiodef yn sylweddol, yna dylai ef neu hi fod yn atebol. Derbyniodd Caws Llangloffan yn Sir Benfro rybudd olaf gan eu hallforwyr na fyddent yn fodlon parhau i allforio eu caws pe byddai cynlluniau ar gyfer plannu cnydau a addaswyd yn enetig yn mynd yn eu blaen. Rhaid i'r Cynulliad bwysu ar Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau ynglŷn â'r mater hwn.

Mae'r broses ymgynghori hefyd yn llanast, gan nad oes unrhyw un yn hollol sicr a oes angen proses wahanol ar gyfer trwyddedau rhan B a rhan C. Beth bynnag fo'r broses, roedd y modd diystyriol yr ymatebodd y Fenter Cadwyn Gyflenwi ar Gnydau Amaethyddol a Addaswyd i gais rhesymol Michael Meacher i dreulio rhagor o amser yn ymgynghori a hysbysu yn frawychus a dynoda faint y diffyg democrataidd. Mae angen datrys hyn. Rhaid i'r Cynulliad hefyd roi pwysau ar Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau ynglŷn â hyn.

Mae'r diffyg democrataidd hwn yn peri llawer o bryder. Ymddengys bod ACRE, SCIMAC a'r Pwyllgor Llywio Gwyddonol y tu allan i ffiniau atebolrwydd democrataidd arferol. Mae ganddynt oll gysylltiadau llawer rhy gryf â'r diwydiant cnydau a addaswyd yn enetig.

Ymddengys bod ACRE a'r Weinyddiaeth Amaethyddiaeth, Pysgodfeydd a Bwyd yn

the effects of horizontal gene transfer and the passage of GM material into the human food chain via bee transport and incorporation into pollen and honey. They gave no specific advice on this to the Assembly.

There is also the matter of ACRE banging on about the lack of convincing site-specific research for Wales, as a reason for not stopping the trials. But should not they themselves have done this work in the first place, before giving blanket approval to all of the sites in the field trial programme? Is this how the precautionary principle works? I think not.

Finally, the legality of planting Chardon LL maize anywhere in the UK is disputed. The doubts over the original licensing procedure, the greater doubts over whether Chardon LL meets the distinctiveness, uniformity and stability test and the fact that the Chardon LL hearing was indefinitely adjourned in disarray. All of this suggests that, at best, it is profoundly irresponsible of SCIMAC, ACRE and the rest of them to allow any planting of the seed this year.

12:05 p.m.

On the action that the Minister for Rural Affairs can take, the prohibition Order on separation distances is a start. However, the distances are completely inadequate. I still think that the Minister should issue an Order under section 110 of the Environmental Protection Act 1990, on the basis that he is convinced by new scientific evidence presented to him that no further plantings of Chardon LL should occur in Wales. The Minister should say that he is acting under EU rules to protect organic agriculture.

The reason for this Order must be the precautionary principle, since ACRE has clearly not adequately considered the activity of bees in pollination and in the transport of pollen from maize crops into the hive. The note on pollination provided to the Assembly by ACRE indicates a separation distance of 200 metres and does not even mention the

ddidaro am effeithiau trosglwyddo genynnau'n llorweddol a phasio deunydd a addaswyd yn enetig i'r gadwyn fwyd ddynol drwy gyfrwng cludo gan wenyn a'i ymgorffori i mewn i baill a mêl. Ni roddasant unrhyw gyngor penodol ar hyn i'r Cynulliad.

Hefyd, mae'r mater bod ACRE yn rhygnu ymlaen am ddiffyg ymchwil safle penodol ar gyfer Cymru, fel rheswm i beidio ag atal y profion. Oni ddylent hwy eu hunain fod wedi gwneud y gwaith hwn yn y lle cyntaf, cyn rhoi cymeradwyaeth gyffredinol i'r holl safleoedd yn y rhaglen profion maes? Ai dyma'r modd y mae'r egwyddor rhagofal yn gweithio? Ni chredaf hynny.

Yn olaf, ceir dadl am ba mor gyfreithlon yw plannu indrawn Chardon LL yn unrhyw le yn y DU. Yr oedd yr amheuan am y weithdrefn drwyddedu wreiddiol, yr amheuan mwy ynglŷn ag a oedd Chardon LL yn diwallu'r prawf arwahanrwydd, unffurfiaeth a sefydlogrwydd a'r ffaith bod gwrandawriad Chardon LL wedi ei ohirio am gyfnod amhenodol mewn anhrefn. Awgryma hyn i gyd, ar y gorau, ei bod yn hynod o anghyfrifol i SCIMAC, ACRE a'r gweddill ohonynt ganiatáu plannu'r had eleni.

O ran y camau gweithredu y gall y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig eu cymryd, mae'r Gorchymyn gwahardd ar bellteroedd gwahanu yn fan cychwyn. Fodd bynnag, mae'r pellteroedd yn gwbl annigonol. Parhaf i gredu y dylai'r Gweinidog gyhoeddi Gorchymyn o dan adran 110 Deddf Diogelu'r Amgylchedd 1990, ar y sail ei fod wedi'i argyhoeddi gan dystiolaeth wyddonol newydd a gyflwynwyd iddo na ddylid plannu rhagor o Chardon LL yng Nghymru. Dylai'r Gweinidog ddweud ei fod yn gweithredu o dan reolau'r UE i ddiogelu amaethyddiaeth organig.

Yr egwyddor rhagofal ddylai fod yn rheswm dros y Gorchymyn hwn, gan nad yw ACRE yn amlwg wedi rhoi ystyriaeth ddigonol i weithgarwch gwenyn wrh beillio ac wrth gludo pail o'r cnydau indrawn i mewn i'r nyth. Mae'r nodyn ar beillio a ddarparwyd i'r Cynulliad gan ACRE yn nodi pellter gwahanu o 200 metr ac nid yw hyd yn oed yn

word 'bee'. There are at least 200 hives within 10 kilometres of Castle Cenlas and, since maize pollen is on the plants at a time when there is relatively little other pollen available to bees, it is certain that bees will selectively seek out a forage maize crop and travel from one to another.

The scientists at ACRE have not pointed out that it is inevitable that GM material will find its way into the human food chain. We now know that genetically modified material can cross species and be harmful to health. At the very least, we are talking about a statistically measurable risk of harm. The Minister says that he has a fiduciary duty not to waste taxpayers' money by ending up in court, but at present it seems to me and to many others that we are preoccupied with protecting the interests of greedy corporations such as Aventis instead of being preoccupied with protecting the public. The Minister has a fiduciary duty on that score as well.

I call on the Minister to create an advisory committee of his own in Wales. He can call it the Wales Advisory Committee on Releases to the Environment—WACRE—if he likes. He should ensure that it gives advice based on genuine, peer-reviewed scientific material. It can inform a specifically Welsh attitude to planting genetically modified crops, regardless of ACRE being intent on peddling the same old line that all field trials are safe because someone or other said so a few years ago.

In the meantime, to help the Minister provide new scientific data to ACRE, he could charge publicly-funded bodies such as the Countryside Council for Wales, the Environment Agency Wales, as well as the Welsh universities, with site-specific tasks. These could be located at Sealand, where Chardon LL seed has been planted, and at White House Farm, Newcastle, Monmouthshire where, apparently, genetically modified oilseed rape was planted in 1997. Also, there is at least one site near St David's in my constituency where polluted oilseed rape, brought into the UK accidentally last year, has been planted. They

crybwyll y gair 'gwenyn'. Ceir o leiaf 200 o nythod o fewn 10 cilomedr i Gastell Cenlas, a chan fod paill indrawn ar y planhigion ar adeg pan nad oes llawer o baill arall ar gael i wenyn, mae'n sicr y bydd gwenyn yn mynd ati i ddethol cnwd porthi indrawn ac yn teithio o un i'r llall.

Nid yw gwyddonwyr ACRE wedi nodi ei bod yn anochel y bydd deunydd a addaswyd yn enetig yn canfod ei ffordd i mewn i'r gadwyn fwyd ddynol. Gwyddom bellach y gall deunydd a addaswyd yn enetig groesi rhywogaethau a niweidio iechyd. O leiaf, yr ydym yn sôn am berygl o niwed ystadegol sydd yn fesuradwy. Dywed y Gweinidog bod ganddo ddyletswydd ymddiriedol i beidio â gwastraffu arian y trethdalwyr drwy fynd drwy'r llysoedd, ond ar hyn o bryd ymddengys i mi a nifer o bobl eraill ein bod yn poeni gormod am ddiogelu buddiannau corfforaethau barus fel Aventis yn hytrach na phoeni am ddiogelu'r cyhoedd. Mae gan y Gweinidog ddyletswydd ymddiriedol dros hynny hefyd.

Galwaf ar y Gweinidog i greu pwyllgor ymgynghorol ei hun yng Nghymru. Gall ei alw yn Bwyllgor Ymgynghorol Cymru ar Olyngiadau i'r Amgylchedd—WACRE—os y dymuna. Dylai sicrhau ei fod yn cynghori ar sail deunydd gwyddonol dilys a adolygwyd gan gymheiriaid. Gall lywio agwedd Gymreig benodol tuag at blannu cynydau a addaswyd yn enetig, er gwaethaf y ffaith bod ACRE yn mynnu ailadrodd yr un hen linell fod pob prawf maes yn ddiogel oherwydd i hwn neu'r llall ddweud hynny ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl.

Yn y cyfamser, er mwyn cynorthwyo'r Gweinidog i ddarparu data gwyddonol newydd i ACRE, gallai roi'r cyfrifoldeb ar gyrff a ariennir gan arian cyhoeddus megis Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru, Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd Cymru, yn ogystal â phrifysgolion Cymru, i gynnal tasgau ar safleoedd penodol. Gellid lleoli'r rhain yn Sealand, lle y plannwyd Chardon LL, ac yn White House Farm, Castell-meirch, Sir Fynwy, lle yr ymddengys i rêp had olew a addaswyd yn enetig gael ei blannu yn 1997. Hefyd, mae o leiaf un safle ger Tyddewi yn fy etholaeth i lle plannwyd rêp had olew llygredig, a ddaethpwyd i mewn i'r DU yn

could do some decent science on honey and pollen collected from those areas, as well as on soil biology and oilseed rape that might have cross-pollinated, to see whether genetic pollution has occurred. In doing so, these publicly-funded bodies would be undertaking tasks that are important to the Welsh agenda. The Minister could also commission science from genuinely independent geneticists. There are still a few not on the payroll of, or otherwise corrupted by, Monsanto and Aventis.

We need as many blocking mechanisms as possible to make doing business in Wales so uncomfortable for Aventis and co that the inclination—part C licences or not—will disappear.

Can we obtain assurances from Aventis that the seeds from Castle Cenlas will be transported out of Wales at the earliest opportunity, and that there will be no chance of accidental spillages, either at the storage site or during transport? What are the security conditions enforced by the Department of the Environment, Transport and the Regions on the transport and handling of genetically modified seeds? There are stories about slapdash procedures with seeds and crop debris ending up all over the place and off the trial sites. Can not the Assembly, having declared Wales GM-free—well, sort of—ask the Environment Agency to act on its behalf in monitoring all movements of genetically modified seeds and other genetically modified materials, such as the harvested forage maize from the field trial sites at Sealand, checking sacks, silos and vehicles for accidental pollution?

Do we really live in a democracy? I know that a general election is being held but, somehow, I do not think that the agricultural industry will be too bothered by its outcome. That can be demonstrated with an example from Warwickshire where, incredibly, there is a GM trial site on the doorstep of the Henry Doubleday research centre for organic crops—the largest centre of its kind in Europe. It could lose its licence if any trace of genetically modified material

ddamweiniol y llynedd. Gallant gynnal profion gwyddonol safonol ar fêl a phail a gasglwyd o'r ardaloedd hynny, yn ogystal â phroffion ar fioleg pridd a rêp had olew a allai fod wedi traws-beillio, i weld a yw llygru genetig wedi digwydd. Wrth wneud hynny, byddai'r cyrff hyn a ariennir yn gyhoeddus yn ymgymryd â thasgau sydd yn bwysig i'r agenda Gymreig. Gallai'r Gweinidog hefyd gomisiynu profion gwyddonol gan enetigwyr annibynnol dilys. Mae ambell un ar ôl na chânt eu cyflogi, neu na lygrwyd fel arall, gan Monsanto ac Aventis.

Mae angen cymaint o fecanweithiau rhwystro â phosibl arnom er mwyn peri cymaint o anesmwythyd i Aventis a'r gweddill wrth gynnal eu busnes yng Nghymru fel y bydd yr awydd—trwyddedau rhan C neu beidio—yn diflannu.

A allwn gael sicrwydd gan Aventis y bydd yr hadau o Gastell Cenlas yn cael eu cludo o Gymru cyn gynted ag y bo modd, ac na fydd unrhyw berygl o golli'r hadau'n ddamweiniol, naill ai yn y safle storio neu wrth iddynt gael eu cludo? Beth yw'r amodau diogelwch a orfodir gan Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau ar gludo ac ymdrin â hadau a addaswyd yn enetig? Ceir straeon am weithdrefnau ffwrdd â hi gyda hadau a gweddillion cynydau wedi'u gwasgaru dros y lle ac oddi ar safleoedd y profion. Oni all y Cynulliad, a ddatganodd bod Cymru'n rhydd o gnydau a addaswyd yn enetig—wel, fwy neu lai—ofyn i Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd weithredu ar ei ran i fonitro pob symudiad o hadau a addaswyd yn enetig a deunyddiau eraill a addaswyd yn enetig, megis yr indrawn porthi a gynaeafwyd o'r safleoedd prawf maes yn Sealand, gan wirio sachau, seilos a cherbydau rhag llygru damweiniol?

A ydym yn byw mewn democratiaeth mewn gwirionedd? Gwn y cynhelir etholiad cyffredinol ond, rhywsut, ni chredaf y bydd y diwydiant amaeth-gemegol yn poeni llawer am y canlyniad. Gellir dangos hynny gydag enghraifft o Swydd Warwick lle ceir, yn anhygoel, safle profi cynydau a addaswyd yn enetig ar riniog canolfan ymchwil Henry Doubleday ar gyfer cynydau organig—y ganolfan fwyaf o'i bath yn Ewrop. Gallai golli ei thrwydded os canfyddir unrhyw olion

is found in its fields. Michael Meacher, the democratically elected Minister for the Environment in the UK Government, has requested that a less ecologically-sensitive trial site be found. Defying the Minister, the chair of the Scientific Steering Committee for the Farm Scale Evaluations of Genetically Modified Crops, Professor Christopher Pollock of the Institute of Grassland and Environmental Research at Aberystwyth—which receives most of its funding via the Assembly—contemptuously dismissed the Minister's intervention as political, good public relations and certainly not scientific. Heaven forbid that he and his colleagues, and the big business that they seem to be in hock to, should be subject to democratic accountability. The resignation yesterday of one of the committee members in protest at Professor Pollock's behaviour may mean that the worm has finally turned. Whatever, it is scandalous that a vital aspect of public policy, arousing a great deal of public concern, has been written out of political control. It is even more scandalous that this democratic deficit almost certainly conceals a scientific deficit that could yet prove disastrous for us all.

Glyn Davies: I would like to make one point regarding the growers. I agree with almost all the efforts that have been made on this issue—I have made some contribution to it myself; we all act in different ways. However, I do not want to see the farmers criticised. I have spoken to Mr Cottle on several occasions, once last week. He believes in what he is doing. I would like to ensure that Richard accepts the following point—he is usually a courageous politician. Let us put the blame where it lies. You make genuine comments about Michael Meacher's intervention in this. At the same time, you and I both know, that the UK Government, through the Cabinet Minister responsible, Mo Mowlam, is writing to all growers, including John Cottle, giving them encouragement and support. Unless there is clear direction from Westminster, what you say here will not count for anything.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Diolchaf i Richard am y ddadl fer bwysig hon. Ymunaf ag ef i longyfarch cymuned Mathri am ei safiad

o ddeunydd a addaswyd yn enetig yn ei chaeau. Mae Michael Meacher, y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd a etholwyd yn ddemocrataidd i Lywodraeth y DU, wedi galw am ganfod safle prawf llai sensitif yn ecolegol. Gan herio'r Gweinidog, diystyrwyd ymyriad y Gweinidog yn ddirmygus gan gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Llywio Gwyddonol ar gyfer Asesiadau Fferm Gyfan o Gnydau a Addaswyd yn Enetig, sef yr Athro Christopher Pollock o'r Sefydliad Ymchwil Tir Glas a'r Amgylchedd yn Aberystwyth—sydd yn derbyn y rhan fwyaf o'i arian gan y Cynulliad—fel ymyriad gwleidyddol, a oedd yn hybu cysylltiadau cyhoeddus da, ac yn anwyddonol. Na ato Duw os bydd ef a'i gydweithwyr, a'r busnesau mawr yr ymddengys eu bod yn ddyledus iddynt, yn destun atebolrwydd democrataidd. Efallai bod ymddiswyddiad un o aelodau'r pwyllgor ddod mewn protest yn erbyn ymddygiad yr Athro Pollock yn golygu bod y llanw wedi troi o'r diwedd. Beth bynnag, mae'n warthus bod agwedd hanfodol ar bolisi cyhoeddus, wedi mynd o ofal gwleidyddol. Mae'n fwy gwarthus bod y diffyg democrataidd hwn bron yn bendant yn cuddio diffyg gwyddonol a allai eto brofi'n drychinebus i ni i gyd.

Glyn Davies: Hoffwn wneud un pwynt ynglŷn â'r tyfwyr. Cytunaf gyda bron bob ymdrech a wnaethpwyd ynglŷn â'r mater hwn—gwneuthum rhywfaint o gyfraniad iddo fy hun; yr ydym i gyd yn gweithredu'n wahanol. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf am weld ffermwyr yn cael eu beirniadu. Siaradais â Mr Cottle ar sawl achlysur, unwaith yr wythnos diwethaf. Mae ganddo ffydd yn yr hyn a wna. Hoffwn sicrhau bod Richard yn derbyn y pwynt canlynol—y mae'n wleidydd dewr fel arfer. Gadewch i ni roi'r bai ar y sawl sydd yn gyfrifol. Gwnewch sylwadau dilys ynglŷn ag ymyriad Michael Meacher yn hyn. Ar yr un pryd, fel y gwyddom ein dau, mae Llywodraeth y DU, drwy Weinidog y Cabinet sydd yn gyfrifol, sef Mo Mowlam, yn ysgrifennu at y tyfwyr i gyd, gan gynnwys John Cottle, yn rhoi anogaeth a chefnogaeth iddynt. Oni cheir cyfarwyddyd eglur gan San Steffan, ni fydd yr hyn a ddywedwch yma yn cyfrif am ddim.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I thank Richard for this important short debate. I join him in congratulating the community of Mathry for

dewr yn wyneb y bygythiad hwn. Mae'n drueni nad oedd y Gweinidog yn barod i wneud safiad tebyg.

Ymddangosodd erthygl yn y *Financial Times* ar 27 Ebrill yn nodi'r pryderon yn America a Chanada y bydd y ffaith eu bod yn tyfu cynydau a addaswyd yn enetig yn golygu y bydd eu marchnadoedd yn diflannu. Dywedant eu bod hefyd yn poeni am lygredd o'r cynydau hyn i'r cyflenwadau gwenith arferol. Dyma eiriau Trish Jordan, llefarydd y cwmni mawr Monsanto:

'Nobody can guarantee zero tolerance. If that is what people want, then nobody can deliver it'.

Dyna beth yr ydym ei eisiau. Ni allant ei gyflawni, ac ni ddylem ildio iddynt.

Eleanor Burnham: Cefais gyfle i gefnogi protest yn Sealand bythefnos yn ôl yn erbyn treialon ar gnydau a addaswyd yn enetig. Mae'n hynod bwysig inni gefnogi ffermwyr organig, yn enwedig ar ôl problemau clwy'r traed a'r genau. Ar gynhyrchu mêl, nid yw gwenyn yn gwahaniaethu rhwng pail naturiol a phail o gnydau a addaswyd yn enetig. Deallaf fod ffermwr wedi cael ei erlid yn y llysoedd gan Monsanto yn Saskatchewan, Canada am dyfu eu hadau hwy a addaswyd yn enetig. Disgynnodd yr hadau ar ei dir ef, sydd yn cynnwys cynydau naturiol. Mae hyn yn warthus, ac yn golygu bod gan y cwmnïau byd-eang bŵer llethol. Fel Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, gwrthwynebwn hyn yn llwyr.

Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Delyth Evans): Yr wyf yn ymateb ar ran y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig, sydd yn ymddiheuro am fod yn absennol. Yr wyf wedi gwrando'n astud ar eich argymhellion penodol, Richard, a byddaf yn eu pasio ymlaen i'r Gweinidog iddo eu hystyried.

Ar atebolrwydd dros gnydau a addaswyd yn enetig, mae hyn o dan ystyriaeth ar hyn o bryd gan Weinidogion. Yr ydym yn hyderus y caiff symudiadau cadarnhaol eu gwneud i ddelio â'r mater dyrys hwn. Mae angen ystyried tair agwedd ar y cwestiwn hwn—safbwynt ac ewyllys y Cynulliad, safbwynt Llywodraeth Prydain a safbwynt Ewrop. Y

its brave stance in the face of this threat. It is a shame that the Minister was not prepared to make a similar stance.

An article appeared in the *Financial Times* on 27 April noting the concerns in America and Canada that the fact that they are growing GM crops will mean that their markets will disappear. They say that they are also concerned about pollution from these crops to the normal wheat stocks. These are the words of Trish Jordan, the spokesperson for the large company Monsanto:

That is what we want. They cannot deliver it, and we should not give in to them.

Eleanor Burnham: I had an opportunity to support the protest against GM trials at Sealand a fortnight ago. It is extremely important that we support organic farmers, especially following the problems with foot and mouth disease. On honey production, bees do not differentiate between natural pollen and pollen from GM crops. I understand that a farmer has been prosecuted in the courts by Monsanto in Saskatchewan, Canada for growing their GM seeds. The seeds fell on his land, which contains natural crops. This is disgraceful, and means that global companies have an oppressive power. As Liberal Democrats, we totally oppose this.

The Deputy Minister for Rural Affairs (Delyth Evans): I am responding on behalf of the Minister for Rural Affairs, who apologises for his absence. I have listened carefully to your specific recommendations, Richard, and I shall pass them on to the Minister for his consideration.

On the liability for the effects of GM crops, this is presently under consideration by Ministers. We are confident that positive moves will be made to deal with this complex matter. Three aspects of this question must be considered—the Assembly's viewpoint and will, the British Government's viewpoint, and Europe's viewpoint. The question is, how

cwestiwn yw, sut y gallwn symud ymlaen o fewn y cyd-destun hwn. Mae safbwynt y Cynulliad yn glir ac yn mynegi ewylls ddemocrataidd pobl Cymru fod Cymru am fod yn rhydd o gnydau a addaswyd yn enetig. Mae'r Weithrediaeth yn dilyn y polisi hwnnw ar sail egwyddor, ond hefyd ar y sail ymarferol bod cnydau wedi'u haddasu'n enetig yn anghydnaws â pholisi organig y Cynulliad, ac yn ei danseilio. Mae'r polisi organig hwnnw'n llwyddiant mawr, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd fel Sir Benfro.

12:15 p.m.

Y gwir yw ein bod yn gorfod gweithio o fewn cyfraith Ewrop. Mae gan y diwydiant addasu genetig ryddid yn ôl cyfraith Ewrop i blannu'r hadau hyn ar draws gwledydd Ewrop. Yr unig ffordd y gallem osgoi bod hynny'n digwydd yw drwy gynnal y rhagbrofion hyn.

Hoffwn ateb y cyhuddiad y mae llawer o bobl yn ei wneud fod ein sefyllfa o ran cnydau wedi'u haddasu'n enetig yn enghraifft o ddiffyg grym y Cynulliad o'i gymharu â Llywodraeth Prydain. Nid yw hynny'n wir oherwydd bod yr Alban a Lloegr yn yr un sefyllfa â ni o safbwynt y grym dros gnydau wedi'u haddasu'n enetig, sef ein bod yn gorfod gweithredu o fewn canllawiau Ewropeaidd. Felly, pe bai gennym yr un pwerau â Llywodraeth yr Alban, ni fyddem damaid yn well ynglŷn â sut y gallem ymateb i'r sefyllfa addasu genetig ar lefel Ewropeaidd.

Mae'n werth esbonio safbwynt Llywodraeth Prydain: oherwydd pryderon Llywodraeth Prydain rhwystrasom gwmnïau addasu genetig rhag plannu'n fasnachol ym Mhrydain, er bod ganddynt yr hawl ar lefel Ewropeaidd i wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr amod oedd ein bod yn caniatáu'r profion ym Mhrydain. Oni bai bod Llywodraeth Prydain wedi gallu sicrhau'r profion hyn, byddai cnydau wedi'u haddasu'n enetig eisoes wedi'u plannu'n fasnachol. Yr ydym wedi llwyddo i ohirio plannu'n fasnachol.

Mae'r Cynulliad yn awr yn gweld cyfle, drwy roi'r pellterau plannu ar sail statudol yng Nghymru, i fynd â holl fater cnydau wedi'u haddasu'n enetig yn ôl i'r Comisiwn

can we move forward within this context. The Assembly's viewpoint is clear and expresses the democratic will of the people of Wales that Wales should be free of GM crops. The Executive follows that policy on the basis of principle, but also on the practical basis that genetically-modified crops are inconsistent with the Assembly's organic policy, and undermine it. That organic policy is a great success, especially in areas such as Pembrokeshire.

The reality is that we must work within European law. The genetic modification industry is free under European law to plant these seeds throughout the countries of Europe. The only way that we can avoid that happening is by conducting these trials.

I would like to answer the accusation that many people are making that our situation as regards genetically-modified crops is an example of the Assembly's lack of power, compared to that of the British Government. That is not true because Scotland and England are in the same position as us as regards powers over genetically-modified crops, namely that we must work within European guidelines. Therefore, if we had the same powers as the Scottish Government, we would not be any better off in how we could respond to the genetically-modified crops situation on the European level.

It is worth explaining the British Government's position: because of the British Government's concerns we prevented genetically-modified crop companies from planting commercially in Britain, although they have the right to do so on a European level. However, the condition was that we would allow trials in Britain. If the British Government had not been able to secure these trials, genetically-modified crops would already be planted commercially. We have succeeded in delaying commercial planting.

The Assembly now sees an opportunity, by establishing these planting distances in Wales on a statutory basis, to take the whole issue of genetically-modified crops back to the

Ewropeaidd. Safbwynt y weinyddiaeth hon yw bod yn rhaid i'r Comisiwn ystyried o'r newydd y cwestiwn holl bwysig o drefn addasu genetig a'r drefn organig a gofyn a oes modd i'r ddwy drefn hyn fodoli ochr yn ochr. Ein barn yng Nghymru yw nad oes modd, a'n blaenoriaeth yma yw hybu a phlannu cynydu organig.

Mae gan Gymru gyfle arbennig yn awr i arwain y ffordd yn y drafodaeth ar y mater hwn, sydd hefyd yn cythruddo gwleidyddion ledled Ewrop. Mae amheuon mawr mewn gwledydd fel Ffrainc, er enghraifft, ynglŷn â safbwynt presennol y Comisiwn. Mae Cymru am ennill cefnogaeth i'n safbwynt ni ymysg gwledydd Ewrop a defnyddio'r drefn statudol i symud yn nes at uchelgais Cymru i greu gwlad sydd yn rhydd o addasu genetig.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings today's proceedings to a close.

European Commission. This administration's position is that the Commission must consider afresh the crucial question of the genetically-modified system and the organic system and whether it is possible for these two systems to co-exist. Our view in Wales is that it is not possible, and our priority here is promoting and planting organic crops.

Wales now has a unique opportunity to lead the way in the discussion of this issue, which is also angering politicians throughout Europe. There are grave doubts in countries such as France, for example, regarding the Commission's present position. Wales wants to win support for our viewpoint among the countries of Europe, and to use the statutory regime to move closer towards Wales's ambition to create a country free from genetic modification.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Daw hyn â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 12.18 p.m.
The session ended at 12.18 p.m.*