



Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)

The National Assembly for Wales
(The Official Record)

Dydd Mawrth 1 Mai 2001

Tuesday 1 May 2001

Cynnwys
Contents

3	Datganiad gan y Llywydd <i>Statement by the Presiding Officer</i>
3	Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru <i>Questions to the First Minister</i>
23	Datganiad ar Achosion o Dwbercwlosis yng Nghasnewydd <i>Statement on Incidences of Tuberculosis in Newport</i>
32	Datganiad ar Glwy'r Traed a'r Genau <i>Statement on Foot and Mouth Disease</i>
51	Datganiad ar Dreialon Cnydau a Addaswyd yn Enetig <i>Statement on Trials of Genetically Modified Crops</i>
64	Datganiad Busnes <i>Business Statement</i>
67	Cynnig Trefniadol <i>Procedural Motion</i>
68	Pwynt o Drefn <i>Point of Order</i>
69	Cynnig o Gerydd <i>Censure Motion</i>
88	Pleidlais a Ohiriwyd ar y Cynnig Trefniadol <i>Postponed Vote on the Procedural Motion</i>
89	Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion <i>Composite Motion: Approval of Orders</i>

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Datganiad gan y Llywydd Statement by the Presiding Officer

Y Llywydd: Ni chynigir yr eitem gyntaf ar yr agenda. **The Presiding Officer:** The first item on the agenda will not be moved.

Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru Questions to the First Minister

Cydlynu Polisiâu Economaidd a Chymdeithasol Co-ordinating Economic and Social Policies

Q1 Val Feld: Will the First Minister make a statement on what measures the Assembly can take to co-ordinate its economic and social policies to benefit all of Wales? (OAQ11083)

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): We must continue with our policies for a strong economy, with falling unemployment and rising employment. That must be combined with policies that give preference to west Wales and the Valleys, which lag behind the rest of Wales.

Val Feld: Will you join me in applauding the potential of the new Welsh Industrial and Maritime Museum—the plans for which were presented to Assembly Members at lunchtime today—and its importance for the broader economy of Swansea and west Wales? Do you agree that a regional strategy that considered the location of arts, sports, cultural and public institutions, and looked at future developments in our major towns and cities, could have a great impact on local and regional economies?

The First Minister: Yes. I am pleased that you referred to the presentation held jointly at lunchtime by the City and County of Swansea and the National Museums and Galleries of Wales. Unfortunately, I was only able to attend a part of the presentation. What I saw was impressive. I understand that the development depends on a favourable decision by the Heritage Lottery Fund when the mark II application is submitted for

C1 Val Feld: A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar y camau y gall y Cynulliad eu cymryd i gydgyssylltu ei bolisiâu economaidd a chymdeithasol er lles Cymru gyfan? (OAQ11083)

Prif Weinidog Cymru (Rhodri Morgan): Rhaid inni barhau gyda'n polisiâu ar gyfer economi gref, gyda diweithdra'n gostwng a chyflogaeth yn codi. Rhaid cyfuno hynny â pholisiâu sydd yn rhoi blaenoriaeth i orllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd, sydd ar ei hôl hi o'u cymharu â gweddill Cymru.

Val Feld: A ymunwch â mi wrth gymeradwyo potensial Amgueddfa Diwydiant a Môr newydd Cymru—y cyflwynwyd y cynlluniau ar ei chyfer i Aelodau'r Cynulliad amser cinio heddiw—a'i phwysigrwydd ar gyfer economi ehangach Abertawe a gorllewin Cymru? A gytunwch y gallai strategaeth ranbarthol a fyddai'n ystyried lleoliadau sefydliadau celfyddydol, chwaraeon, diwylliannol a chyhoeddus, ac a fyddai'n ystyried datblygiadau ar gyfer y dyfodol yn ein prif drefi a'n dinasoedd, gael dylanwad mawr ar economïau lleol a rhanbarthol?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Cytunaf. Yr wyf yn falch ichi gyfeirio at y cyflwyniad a gynhaliwyd ar y cyd amser cinio gan Ddinas a Sir Abertawe ac Amgueddfeydd ac Oriaelau Cenedlaethol Cymru. Yn anffodus, dim ond am ran o'r cyflwyniad yr oeddwn yn bresennol. Yr oedd yr hyn a welais yn creu argraff. Deallaf fod y datblygiad yn dibynnu ar benderfyniad ffafriol gan Gronfa Dreftadaeth y Loteri pan gyflwynir y cais

decision later this summer. That is typical of the kind of preferential imparting of additional economic growth to west Wales and the Valleys that I talked of in my earlier reply.

Cynog Dafis: Dychwelaf at yr angen i gydlynu polisiau datblygu economaidd a chynllunio. Beth a ddywedai Prif Weinidog Cymru pe collai ardal y Bontnewydd ar Wy felin lifio BSW Timber ccc a chynllun biomas Border Biofuels Cyfyngedig a phe lleolid hwy yn ne-ddwyrain Lloegr oherwydd y gohirio a'r gost barhaus a roddir arnynt? A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru daro pennau Mike German a Sue Essex â'i gilydd i sicrhau na ddigwydd y drychineb hon i Gymru wledig?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr wyf yn eithaf cyfarwydd â'r prosiect hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, fel Prif Weinidog y Cynulliad, ni allaf ymyrryd yn y modd yr awgryma Cynog. Ni allaf ddweud beth fyddai'r penderfyniad pe cyflwynid hyn i Sue Essex a Phwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio'r Cynulliad. Ni allaf ragweld beth fyddai'r penderfyniad hwnnw. Nid yw'r modd y gofynnodd Cynog ei gwestiwn yn gwbl weddus.

The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): One way in which social policies are delivered in Wales is through the Barnett block that we receive from the Treasury. What representations has the First Minister made to his Government about plans for a much smaller Prescott block, whereby money from Wales would be distributed to the English regions? That is clearly John Prescott's intention, as he spoke of 'blood on the carpet' were the formula to be revised.

The First Minister: I have checked the content of the story in *The Guardian*, to which I think Nick is referring. The reference to 'blood on the carpet' appears to relate to impending negotiations between local authorities in the south and north of England about revisions of local government finance in England and a further argument in the south-east between inner London and the home counties. The comment did not have any bearing on the Barnett formula.

The interview with John Prescott was held

rhan II i benderfynu arno yn ddiweddarach yn yr haf. Mae hynny'n nodweddiadol o'r math o ddewis dyrannu twf economaidd ychwanegol i orllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd y soniais amdano yn fy ateb cynharach.

Cynog Dafis: I return to the need to co-ordinate economic development and planning policies. What would the First Minister say if the BSW Timber plc sawmill and Border Biofuels Limited's biomass scheme in the Newbridge-on-Wye area were relocated to the south-east of England because of the continuous delays and cost imposed upon them? Will the First Minister knock Mike German and Sue Essex's heads together to avert this disaster for rural Wales?

The First Minister: I am quite familiar with that project. However, as First Minister of the Assembly, I cannot intervene in the way that Cynog suggests. I cannot say what the decision would be were this to come before Sue Essex and the Assembly's Planning Decision Committee. I cannot anticipate what that decision would be. The way in which Cynog asked his question is not entirely appropriate.

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): Un ffordd y cyflwynir polisiau cymdeithasol yng Nghymru yw drwy'r bloc Barnett a dderbyniwn gan y Trysorlys. Pa sylwadau a gyflwynodd Prif Weinidog Cymru i'w Lywodraeth ynghylch cynlluniau am floc Prescott llawer llai, lle y byddai arian o Gymru yn cael ei ddsbarthu i ranbarthau Lloegr? Dyna'n amlwg yw bwriad John Prescott, wrth iddo sôn am waed ar y carped pe diwygiwyd y fformiwla.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr wyf wedi gwirio cynnwys y stori yn *The Guardian*, y credaf fod Nick yn cyfeirio ati. Ymddengys fod y cyfeiriad at waed ar y carped yn ymwneud â negodiadau arfaethedig rhwng awdurdodau lleol yn ne a gogledd Lloegr ynghylch diwygio cyllid llywodraeth leol yn Lloegr a dadl arall yn y de-ddwyrain rhwng canol Llundain a'r siroedd cartref. Nid oedd cysylltiad rhwng y sylw a fformiwla Barnett o gwbl.

Cynhaliwyd y cyfweiliad gyda John Prescott

over lunch, and it must have been a good lunch. I have no doubt that, at some stage during the lunch, reference was made to these various subjects. I also suspect that, at some stage, the reporter's notebook fell into the minestrone. When it re-emerged from the soup, it contained various obscure writings that do not relate to anything that represents Government policy or the Deputy Prime Minister's views.

Nick Bourne: One way of checking that would be to speak to the Deputy Prime Minister or other members of the Government, possibly the Secretary of State for Wales. John Prescott should be careful about comments made over good liquid lunches, as they cause concern throughout Wales. Rather than just dismiss the comments as ramblings made over minestrone, the First Minister would be advised to check them out. Would the First Minister further agree that, before anyone argues for a revision of the Barnett formula on a needs basis, we should check how that would affect Wales? It may result in poorer rather than better services for Wales.

The First Minister: Absolutely. I have checked out the comments. I apologise if I did not make that clear. I checked them out with the Secretary of State for Wales, who had checked them with other Cabinet members. The UK Government's view is clear. There is no pending revision of the Barnett formula. Public expenditure totals for the three-year period that started three weeks ago and lasts until April 2004 have only just come into force. They settle the matter of how much public expenditure the Scottish Parliament, the National Assembly for Wales, the Northern Ireland Assembly and other departments will receive until 1 April 2004. There is no question of anything covering that period of the spending review.

The misunderstanding on the reporter's part was of matters that have not yet been determined, namely local government finance changes in England. This remains in the block of the Department of the Environment, Transport and the Regions.

dros ginio, a rhaid ei fod yn ginio da. Nid oes gennyf unrhyw amheuaeth, ar ryw adeg yn ystod y cinio, y cyfeiriwyd at yr amrywiol bynciau hyn. Amheuaf hefyd, ar ryw adeg, i lyfr nodiadau'r newyddiadurwr gael ei ollwng i'r minestrone. Wedi iddo gael ei dynnu allan o'r cawl, yr oedd yn cynnwys amrywiol nodiadau dyrys nad oeddent yn ymwneud ag unrhyw beth sydd yn cynrychioli polisi'r Llywodraeth na safbwyntiau Dirprwy Brif Weinidog y DU.

Nick Bourne: Un ffordd o wirio hynny fyddai siarad â Dirprwy Brif Weinidog y DU neu ag aelodau eraill o'r Llywodraeth, Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru o bosibl. Dylai John Prescott fod yn ofalus wrth wneud sylwadau dros giniawau hylifol, gan eu bod yn peri pryder ledled Cymru. Yn hytrach na dim ond diystyru'r sylwadau fel malu awyr dros ginio, byddai'n syniad da i Brif Weinidog Cymru ymchwilio iddynt. A gytunai Prif Weinidog Cymru, ymhellach at hyn, cyn i unrhyw un ddadlau o blaid diwygio fformiwla Barnett ar sail anghenion, y dylem ystyried sut y byddai hynny'n effeithio ar Gymru? Gallai olygu gwasanaethau gwaeth i Gymru yn hytrach na rhai gwell.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yn bendant. Yr wyf wedi ymchwilio i'r sylwadau. Ymddiheuraf os nad oedd hynny'n glir. Fe'u codais gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, a oedd wedi'u codi gydag aelodau eraill o'r Cabinet. Mae safbwynt Llywodraeth y DU yn glir. Ni fwriedir diwygio fformiwla Barnett. Dim ond newydd ddod i rym y mae'r cyfansymiau gwariant cyhoeddus ar gyfer y cyfnod tair blynedd a ddechreuodd dair wythnos yn ôl ac sydd yn parhau hyd Ebrill 2004. Maent yn pennu faint o wariant cyhoeddus y bydd Senedd yr Alban, Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, Cynulliad Gogledd Iwerddon ac adrannau eraill yn ei gael hyd 1 Ebrill 2004. Heb os, ni fydd dim byd yn cwmpasu'r cyfnod hwnnw o'r adolygiad gwariant.

Yr oedd y camddealltwriaeth ar ran y newyddiadurwr yn ymwneud â materion na phenderfynwyd arnynt hyd yma, sef newidiadau cyllid llywodraeth leol yn Lloegr. Erys hyn ym mloc Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau.

Cynullidiadau Rhanbarthol yn Lloegr English Regional Assemblies

Q2 Peter Black: What discussions has the First Minister had with the Deputy Prime Minister about the impact of the creation of English regional assemblies on the powers and finances of the National Assembly for Wales? (OAQ11042)

The First Minister: Wales is unaccustomed to hearing certain English regions saying that they want what we have. As English regional devolution gradually gets off the ground, those regions will be looking at Wales. It will be a gradual process because the level of demand for regional government in England is variable, as between the far north-east of England, north-west England, Yorkshire and Humberside, and the rest of the country. Therefore, it will be a voluntary opt-in system. However, English regions are looking at Wales, and perhaps even more so at Scotland, and saying that they want what Scotland has in terms of finance. There is a difficult relationship between north-east England and Scotland on financial grounds.

2:10 p.m.

Peter Black: As part of the development of English regional assemblies, a review may be conducted of how regional assemblies and national assemblies and parliaments are financed. Do you agree that Wales has nothing to fear from a review based on Wales's needs and a formula that funds the National Assembly for Wales according to those needs?

The First Minister: As an Assembly, we are aware of the interest in this issue. People are asking why Wales is receiving 18 per cent more per head than the UK average, and why Scotland and Northern Ireland are receiving 23 per cent and 37 per cent more respectively. We ensure that academic work is ongoing within the administration to indicate why that is a justifiable differential between the average expenditure of equivalent departments in England and Wales. Wales's expenditure is justifiable. That is why we receive funding not only

C2 Peter Black: Pa drafodaethau y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi'u cael gyda Dirprwy Brif Weinidog y DU ynghylch effaith creu cynullidiadau rhanbarthol yn Lloegr ar bwerau a chyllid Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru? (OAQ11042)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid yw Cymru wedi arfer â chlywed rhai rhanbarthau yn Lloegr yn datgan eu bod am gael yr hyn sydd gennym ni. Wrth i ddatganoli rhanbarthol yn Lloegr gael ei gyflwyno'n raddol, bydd y rhanbarthau hynny yn edrych ar Gymru. Bydd yn broses raddol gan fod lefel y galw am lywodraeth ranbarthol yn Lloegr yn amrywiol, fel rhwng gogledd-ddwyrain eithaf Lloegr, gogledd-orllewin Lloegr, Swydd Efrog a Glannau Humber, a gweddill y wlad. Felly, bydd yn system ddewisol wirfoddol. Fodd bynnag, mae rhanbarthau Lloegr yn edrych ar Gymru, ac efallai yr Alban yn fwy fyth, ac yn datgan eu bod am gael yr un peth â'r Alban yn nhermau cyllid. Mae perthynas anodd rhwng gogledd-ddwyrain Lloegr a'r Alban ar sail ariannol.

Peter Black: Fel rhan o ddatblygu cynullidiadau rhanbarthol yn Lloegr, mae'n bosibl y cynhelir adolygiad o'r ffordd yr ariennir cynullidiadau rhanbarthol a chynullidiadau cenedlaethol a seneddau. A gytunwch na ddylai Cymru ofni adolygiad yn seiliedig ar anghenion Cymru a fformiwla sydd yn ariannu Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ôl yr anghenion hynny?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Fel Cynulliad, yr ydym yn ymwybodol o'r diddordeb yn y mater hwn. Mae pobl yn gofyn pam bod Cymru yn derbyn 18 y cant yn fwy y pen na chyfartaledd y DU, a pham bod yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon yn derbyn 23 y cant a 37 y cant yn fwy, yn y drefn honno. Sicrhawn fod gwaith academaidd yn mynd rhagddo o fewn y weinyddiaeth i ddynodi pam y gellir cyfiawnhau'r gwahaniaeth hwnnw rhwng gwariant cyfartalog adrannau cyfatebol yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Gellir cyfiawnhau gwariant Cymru. Dyna pam y derbyniwn

through the Barnett formula, but why we justified the need for almost £0.5 billion above Barnett, which we received through Objective 1, last July. We are receiving Barnett plus at the moment and that is justifiable. We had to argue the case for that; we did so and we got the money.

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): You gave Nick Bourne a laboured reply to the question about John Prescott's comments. It now seems that the only person who has not disowned those remarks is John Prescott himself. Will you undertake to write to John Prescott asking him to disown those remarks and stating that there is no support for them in Wales?

The First Minister: Except from Plaid Cymru, as I understand it. It was Plaid Cymru that first asked for a review of the Barnett formula, unless I am mistaken. I hope that you do not consider that to be a Labour reply. I often given Labour replies.

The report in *The Guardian* could almost have been written, not about John Prescott—and that newspaper was wrong to do so—but about Plaid Cymru's views. You are the only group in this Chamber—unless you have changed your mind again on this issue—that has called for a review of the Barnett formula.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Mike German also wants a review.

The First Minister: You are saying that others want a review, but you are not denying that you do. Therefore, why are you arguing about John Prescott's comments? You think that he should have said what *The Guardian* reported. The Government is not saying that. This is not a Government policy matter.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I am afraid that it is you answering the questions.

The difference between us and John Prescott is that he wants to review the Barnett formula to ensure that Wales gets less money than at present. That is the point that he made in *The Guardian*. Why do you not state clearly—

arian nid yn unig drwy fformiwla Barnett, ond pam y cyfiawnhawyd yr angen am bron £0.5 biliwn yn fwy na Barnett, a dderbyniom drwy Amcan 1, fis Gorffennaf diwethaf. Yr ydym yn derbyn Barnett a mwy ar hyn o bryd a gellir cyfiawnhau hynny. Bu'n rhaid inni ddadlau'r achos dros hynny; gwnaethom hynny a derbyniom yr arian.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Ymateb clogyrnaidd braidd a roesoch i Nick Bourne ynghylch sylwadau John Prescott. Ymddengys erbyn hyn mai John Prescott ei hun yw'r unig berson nad ydyw wedi diarddel y sylwadau hynny. A ysgrifennwch at John Prescott gan ofyn iddo wadu y sylwadau hynny a chan ddatgan nad oes unrhyw gefnogaeth iddynt yng Nghymru?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ar wahân i Blaid Cymru, fel y'i deallaf. Plaid Cymru a ofynnodd gyntaf am adolygiad o fformiwla Barnett, onid wyf yn camgymryd. Gobeithiaf nad ystyriwch hynny fel ymateb Llafur. Rhoddaf ymatebion Llafur yn aml.

Bron y gallai'r adroddiad yn *The Guardian* fod wedi'i ysgrifennu, nid am John Prescott—ac yr oedd bai ar y papur newydd hwnnw am wneud hynny—ond am safbwyntiau Plaid Cymru. Chi yw'r unig grŵp yn y Siambr hon—onid ydych wedi newid eich meddwl eto yn hyn o beth—sydd wedi galw am adolygiad o fformiwla Barnett.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Mae Mike German am gynnal adolygiad hefyd.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nodwch fod eraill am gael adolygiad, ond nid ydych yn gwadu eich bod chi am gael un. Felly, pam dadlau am sylwadau John Prescott? Credwch y dylai fod wedi dweud yr hyn a gofnodwyd yn *The Guardian*. Nid dyna farn y Llywodraeth. Nid yw'n fater o bolisi Llywodraeth.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Mae gennyf ofn mai chi sydd yn ateb y cwestiynau.

Y gwahaniaeth rhyngom ni a John Prescott yw ei fod ef am gynnal adolygiad o fformiwla Barnett er mwyn sicrhau bod Cymru yn cael llai o arian nag ar hyn o bryd. Dyna'r pwynt a wnaethwyd ganddo yn *The*

like Peter Black, Mike German and Ron Davies—that Wales has nothing to lose from a review of the Barnett formula based on need? You do not have to support Plaid Cymru; support Mike German, Peter Black or Ron Davies. Will you be the only person in the Chamber who agrees with Nick Bourne today?

The First Minister: Let us be realistic. Are you saying that, if you were ever in charge of Wales's affairs, you would seek to negotiate a revision of the Barnett formula? I agree that we have nothing to fear from such a revision, but our public expenditure total has been settled for the next three-year period, which started three weeks ago. We received money over and above Barnett, which you did not expect us to get. We are sorry to have to shoot your fox, but we received £420 million over and above the Barnett formula. Therefore, we have already renegotiated the Barnett formula; that is how we got the extra £420 million for the period up to April 2004. Therefore, I am not sure what the fuss is about. We have had Barnett and Barnett plus. What more do you want?

Guardian. Pam na ddatganwch yn glir—fel Peter Black, Mike German a Ron Davies—nad oes gan Gymru unrhyw beth i'w gollu o gynnal adolygiad o fformiwla Barnett yn seiliedig ar angen? Nid oes yn rhaid ichi gefnogi Plaid Cymru; cefnogwch Mike German, Peter Black neu Ron Davies. Ai chi fydd yr unig berson yn y Siambr i gytuno â Nick Bourne heddiw?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Gadewch inni fod yn realistig. A ydych yn dweud, pe byddech fyth yn gyfrifol am faterion Cymru, y byddech yn ceisio negodi diwygiad i fformiwla Barnett? Cytunaf na ddylem ofni diwygiad o'r fath, ond pennwyd ein cyfanswm gwariant cyhoeddus ar gyfer y cyfnod tair blynedd nesaf, a ddechreuodd dair wythnos yn ôl. Derbyniom swm o arian a oedd yn uwch na fformiwla Barnett, na ddisgwylioch y byddem yn ei gael. Mae'n flin gennym eich siomi, ond derbyniom £420 miliwn yn fwy na fformiwla Barnett. Felly, yr ydym eisoes wedi ailnegodi fformiwla Barnett; dyna sut y cawsom y £420 miliwn ychwanegol ar gyfer y cyfnod hyd at Ebrill 2004. Felly, nid wyf yn siŵr beth yw achos yr helynt. Derbyniom Barnett a mwy na hynny. Beth yn fwy a ddymunwch?

Recriwtio Swyddogion yr Heddlu yng Nghymru Police Recruitment in Wales

Q3 Alison Halford: What discussions has the First Minister had with the UK Government on the issue of police recruitment in Wales? (OAQ11081)

The First Minister: None. The four forces in Wales have been allocated 422 recruits from the crime fighting fund over three years until 2002-03. They recruited about 160 officers through the CFF last year and qualified for some £2.3 million of CFF grant. CFF recruits are over and above forces' previous recruitment plans.

Alison Halford: We all welcome the 71.4 per cent increase in recruits. However, the UK Government has failed. It admitted the need for statistics on equality of opportunity in our police forces and has—allegedly—not yet collected this data. That means that our

C3 Alison Halford: Pa drafodaethau y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi'u cael gyda Llywodraeth y DU ynghylch recriwtio swyddogion yr heddlu yng Nghymru? (OAQ11081)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Dim. Dyrannwyd 422 o recriwtiaid o'r gronfa ymladd trosedd i bedair ardal yr heddlu yng Nghymru dros dair blynedd tan 2002-03. Recriwtiwyd tua 160 o swyddogion drwy'r gronfa y llynedd ac yr oeddent yn gymwys i gael tua £2.3 miliwn o grant gan y gronfa. Mae nifer recriwtiaid y gronfa yn rhagori ar gynlluniau recriwtio blaenorol yr heddlu.

Alison Halford: Croesawn oll y cynnydd o 71.4 y cant mewn recriwtiaid. Fodd bynnag, mae Llywodraeth y DU wedi methu. Cyfaddefodd fod angen ystadegau ar gyfle cyfartal yn ein heddluoedd ond ymddengys nad yw wedi casglu'r data hwn hyd yma.

well-intentioned policy responses may miss their mark and that Welsh policemen and policewomen continue to suffer prejudice. Do you agree that it would be a tragedy to lose some of these recruits acquired at great financial cost because of lax monitoring of this issue? Will you consider requesting the Assembly's statistics directorate to begin consultation on the collection of this data in Wales? That would be in accordance with Section 33 of the Government of Wales Act 1998 and would underline our statutory commitment to equality of opportunity in this country and in our police service.

The First Minister: We would all agree with that. I hope that it would bring even further increases in police numbers in Wales. The numbers have risen over the period since 1997 to 2001 from 6,592 to 6,863.

Glyn Davies: I am pleased with the last part of your answer because I wanted to ask you a detailed question on it. I knew that you would have the exact figures in your notes. What is the exact figure for the increase in police numbers in Britain and in Wales risen since 1997 when Labour came to power in Westminster and since 1999 when Labour came to power in the Assembly? By how far do those figures fall short of the promises that were made before those elections?

The Presiding Officer: Order. The First Minister has no responsibility for the conduct of the Labour Government in Westminster. I am sure that he will answer your question as regards Wales.

The First Minister: I understand that this rise of 270 from 6,592 to 6,863 is a steady year-by-year rise in Wales. I would not like to guarantee that because I do not have it in my briefing. However, an extra 270 on top of the January 1997 total of 6,592 is a reasonably good rise.

Glyn Davies: The question was how many?

The Presiding Officer: Order. You have asked one question.

Golyga hynny y gallai ein hymatebion polisi fethu, er bod bwriadau da yn sail iddynt, ac y gallai heddlu yng Nghymru barhau i ddiodeff rhagfarn. A gytunwch y byddai'n drasiedi pe collir rhai o'r recriwtiaid hyn a gaffaelwyd am gost ariannol fawr o ganlyniad i ddiffygion wrth fonitro'r mater hwn? A ystyriwch wneud cais i gyfarwyddiaeth ystadegau'r Cynulliad ddechrau ymgynghori ar gasglu'r data hwn yng Nghymru? Byddai hynny'n unol ag Adran 33 Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 a byddai'n tanlinellu ein hymrwymiad statudol i gyfle cyfartal yn y wlad hon ac yn ein gwasanaeth heddlu.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Byddem oll yn cytuno â hynny. Gobeithiaf y byddai'n golygu cynnydd pellach o ran nifer yr heddlu yng Nghymru. Mae'r niferoedd wedi codi dros y cyfnod ers 1997 i 2001 o 6,592 i 6,863.

Glyn Davies: Yr wyf yn falch o glywed rhan olaf eich ateb gan fy mod am ofyn cwestiwn manwl ichi am y mater. Gwyddwn y byddai gennych yr union ffigurau yn eich nodiadau. Beth yw'r union ffigur ar gyfer y cynnydd yn nifer yr heddlu ym Mhrydain ac yng Nghymru ers 1997 pan ddaeth y Blaid Lafur i rym yn San Steffan ac ers 1999 pan ddaeth y Blaid Lafur i rym yn y Cynulliad? Beth yw'r gwahaniaeth rhwng y ffigurau hyn a'r addewidion a wnaethpwyd cyn yr etholiadau hynny?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid oes gan Brif Weinidog Cymru unrhyw gyfrifoldeb dros ymddygiad y Llywodraeth Lafur yn San Steffan. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnaiff ateb eich cwestiwn mewn perthynas â Chymru.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Deallaf fod y cynnydd hwn o 270 o 6,592 i 6,863 yn gynydd blwyddyn-ar-flwyddyn cyson yng Nghymru. Ni hoffwn warantu hynny gan nad yw'r wybodaeth gennyf wrth law. Fodd bynnag, mae 270 ychwanegol ar ben cyfanswm Ionawr 1997 o 6,592 yn gynydd cymharol dda.

Glyn Davies: Y cwestiwn oedd faint?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr ydych wedi gofyn un cwestiwn.

Eleanor Burnham: Do you agree that it is better to invest in the prevention of crime rather than spending millions on dealing with the consequences of it? Do you accept that if the extra funding for recruitment that was given to police forces last year had been given in 1997, the fear of crime in Wales and the number of offences would be much less?

The First Minister: Police recruitment is also part of the prevention of crime. The presence of uniformed officers on the street is a part of crime prevention. They reassure those people who might be vulnerable or believe that they are about to become victims of crime. It is as important as having plain-clothed CID officers detecting crime. It is important that people see uniformed officers on the beat. Having them there in greater numbers is part of a good crime prevention policy, although there are many other aspects to that policy also.

Eleanor Burnham: A gytunwch ei bod yn well buddsoddi mewn atal troseddau yn hytrach na gwario miliynau ar ddelio â'r canlyniadau? A dderbyniwch pe byddai'r arian ychwanegol a roddwyd i'r heddlu recriwtio y llynedd wedi'i roi yn 1997, y byddai'r ofn o droseddau yng Nghymru a nifer y troseddau yn llawer is?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae recriwtio i'r heddlu hefyd yn rhan o atal troseddau. Mae presenoldeb swyddogion mewn lifrau ar y stryd yn rhan o atal troseddau. Maent yn rhoi sicrwydd i'r bobl hynny a allai fod yn ddiamddiffyn neu'n credu eu bod ar fin dioddef trosedd. Mae yr un mor bwysig â defnyddio swyddogion CID mewn dillad cyffredin i ganfod troseddau. Mae'n bwysig i bobl weld swyddogion mewn lifrau ar y stryd. Mae sicrhau nifer uwch ohonynt yn rhan o bolisi atal troseddau da, er bod sawl agwedd arall i'r polisi hwnnw hefyd.

Prif Elfennau Llywodraeth Cymru Main Elements of the Government of Wales

C4 Owen John Thomas: Pa drafodaethau y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi'u cael ynghylch sefydlogi disgrifiadau sydd yn gwahaniaethu rhwng prif elfennau Llywodraeth Cymru? (OAQ11040)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae hwn yn gwestiwn diddorol. Cefnogais y syniad a'r egwyddor y tu ôl i'r cais a wnaethpwyd gan y grŵp Ceidwadol i adolygu'n gwaith fel Cynulliad ac i wahaniaethu mwy rhwng y Llywodraeth yma a'r Cynulliad cyfan, sydd yn deddfu. Nid oeddwn yn cytuno gyda phob enw a gynigiwyd. Fodd bynnag, cytunwn o ran yr egwyddor o helpu'r cyhoedd ledled Cymru, a thu hwnt, i ddeall yn well nag y maent yn awr, efallai yr hyn y mae'r Cynulliad yn ei wneud fel Llywodraeth a'r hyn y mae yn ei wneud fel corff y mae'r Llywodraeth yn atebol iddo. Gallem ddadlau drwy'r dydd ynghylch enwau, ond y mae'r egwyddor yn gywir ac yr wyf yn llongyfarch y grŵp Ceidwadol ar ei gais i'r adolygiad.

2:20 p.m.

Owen John Thomas: Wrth ddefnyddio termau fel 'y Llywodraeth', 'Tŷ'r Cyffredin'

Q4 Owen John Thomas: What discussions has the First Minister had regarding fixing the definitions used to differentiate between the main elements of the Government of Wales? (OAQ11040)

The First Minister: This is an interesting question. I supported the idea and principle behind the request made by the Conservative group to review our work as an Assembly and to differentiate more between the Government here and the Assembly as a whole, which legislates. I did not agree with every name suggested. However, I agreed with the principle of helping the public across Wales and outside to come to a better understanding as to what the Assembly does as a Government and what it does as a body to which the Government is accountable. We could argue about names all day, but the principle is correct, and I congratulate the Conservative group on its input into the review.

Owen John Thomas: By using terms such as 'the Government', 'House of Commons' and

a 'Whitehall', y mae Llywodraeth San Steffan yn llwyddo i wahaniaethu rhwng y cyrff hynny. A ydych yn fodlon ystyried bachu disgrifiadau swyddogol megis 'Llywodraeth Cymru' 'y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol' a 'Parc Cathays' er mwyn i strwythur ein sefydliad, yn raddol, ddod yn gliriach i bawb?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Atebais eich ail gwestiwn eisoes yn fy ymateb i'ch cwestiwn cyntaf. Credaf fod pawb yn derbyn fod y cyhoedd wedi ei ddrysau gan statws y Cynulliad fel corff corfforaethol o ran y Ddeddf. Felly, rhaid i ni geisio gwahaniaethu. Ni fyddai'n iach i'r weinyddiaeth greu'r argraff fod Plaid Cymru a'r Torïaid yn ein cefnogi ym mhob penderfyniad. Yn yr un modd, yr wyf yn sicr na fyddent eisiau greu'r argraff eu bod yn cefnogi ein polisiau, ni waeth faint o les y mae pobl Cymru yn ei gael o'r polisiau hynny.

William Graham: I endorse your point, First Minister. With the approaching general election, the electorate will need to clearly identify the responsibilities of Assembly Members and Members of Parliament. Are you planning any initiatives to make them clear to the public?

The First Minister: Our feelings on this are mutual. We agree that the confusion between responsibilities is not helpful. There are two parties involved here in the administration, which does not involve Plaid Cymru and the Tories. That is good for you and for us. It is better for us than for you, but you think the opposite. That is democracy, but we must not allow ourselves to be diverted by the forthcoming general election, although we must deal with it.

The Conservative group has taken the right course of action in its request that the Assembly review addresses this issue. I am sure that other groups will do the same, and it is a logical way of resolving the names issue to help to increase the public's understanding of the Assembly. Owen John stated that UK Government structures such as the House of Commons, Westminster, Whitehall and the Government are well understood by the public, but that is because they have been in place for a thousand years compared with the

'Whitehall', the Westminster Government succeeds in differentiating between those bodies. Are you prepared to consider adopting official descriptions such as 'the Government of Wales', 'the National Assembly' and 'Cathays Park' so that the structure of our establishment can, gradually, become more comprehensible to everyone?

The First Minister: I have answered your second question in my response to your first. I think that everyone accepts that the public is confused by the Assembly's status as a corporate body under the Act. Therefore, we must try to differentiate. It would not be healthy for the administration to create the impression that Plaid Cymru and the Tories support our every decision. Similarly, I am sure that they would not want to create the impression that they support our policies, no matter how much the people of Wales benefit from these policies.

William Graham: Atebais eich pwynt, Brif Weinidog. Gyda'r etholiad cyffredinol yn agosáu, bydd angen i'r etholwyr nodi cyfrifoldebau Aelodau'r Cynulliad ac Aelodau Seneddol yn glir. A oes unrhyw fentrau yn yr arfaeth i sicrhau eu bod yn glir i'r cyhoedd?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr ydym yn cytuno yn hyn o beth. Cytunwn nad yw'r dryswch rhwng cyfrifoldebau yn ddefnyddiol. Mae dwy blaid yn gysylltiedig â'r weinyddiaeth, nad yw'n cynnwys Plaid Cymru a'r Torïaid. Mae hynny'n beth da i chi ac i ni. Mae'n well i ni nag i chi, ond nid ydych o'r un farn. Democratiaeth yw hynny, ond ni ddylem adael i'r etholiad cyffredinol arfaethedig fynnu ein holl sylw, er bod yn rhaid inni ddelio ag ef.

Cymerodd grŵp y Ceidwadwyr y cam cywir wrth ofyn i adolygiad y Cynulliad ymdrin â'r mater hwn. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnaiff grwpiau eraill yr un peth, ac mae'n ffordd resymegol o ddatrys y broblem o enwau er mwyn helpu i gynyddu dealltwriaeth y cyhoedd o'r Cynulliad. Nododd Owen John fod y cyhoedd yn deall strwythurau Llywodraeth y DU megis Tŷ'r Cyffredin, San Steffan, Whitehall a'r Llywodraeth yn dda, ond y rheswm am hynny yw iddynt gael eu sefydlu ers mil o flynyddoedd o'u cymharu â

Assembly's two years. We are up against a much longer history, and we do not follow the classic Whitehall and Westminster models, unlike the Scottish Parliament and Executive. We do not have that model; we have a different legal structure, outlined in the first line of the first clause of the Government of Wales Act 1998. Therefore, we must function within the confines or the corset—if you like—of that corporate body status.

dwy flynedd y Cynulliad. Yr ydym yn brwydro yn erbyn hanes llawer hwy, ac nid ydym yn dilyn modelau clasurol Whitehall a San Steffan, yn wahanol i Senedd a Gweithrediaeth yr Alban. Nid yw'r model hwnnw gennym; mae ein strwythur cyfreithiol yn wahanol, wedi'i amlinellu yn llinell gyntaf cymal cyntaf Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. Felly, rhaid inni weithredu o fewn cyfyngiadau neu gorsed—os mynnwch—y statws corff corfforaethol hwnnw.

**Perthynas ag Adrannau Llywodraeth y DU (Clwy'r Traed a'r Genau)
Relations with UK Government Departments (Foot and Mouth Disease)**

Q5 David Davies: Will the First Minister make a statement on the Assembly's relations with UK Government departments concerned with public health, environmental, economic and agricultural policies in the wake of the foot and mouth disease crisis? (OAQ11043)

C5 David Davies: A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar berthynas y Cynulliad ag adrannau Llywodraeth y DU sydd yn ymwneud â pholisïau iechyd y cyhoedd, yr amgylchedd, yr economi ac amaethyddiaeth yn sgîl argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau? (OAQ11043)

The First Minister: It has been a great and valuable experience for us all to witness the way in which the foot and mouth disease crisis has been dealt with. If you visit the operations room in Cathays Park, you will see British Government agencies and Assembly officials working together as a team to provide the co-ordinated response to which you refer. In one corner of the room is the army—the Ministry of Defence representing the British Government—and in another corner is the Environment Agency in England and Wales, which is devolved in Scotland. During the Eppynt Mountain crisis, Dyfed Powys Police was also present representing the Home Office in terms of ministerial responsibility along with vets from the Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, and, finally, ourselves. They were all working together as a team, which responded magnificently. Anyone who wanted to see an operations room at work would get a classic example of how to co-ordinate different agencies, which forget whether they are paid by the UK Government and its agencies, or by the Assembly and its agencies.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Bu'n brofiad arbennig a gwerthfawr inni oll fod yn dyst i'r ffordd yr ymdriniwyd ag argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau. Pe baech yn ymweld â'r ystafell reoli ym Mharc Cathays, byddech yn gweld asiantaethau Llywodraeth Prydain a swyddogion y Cynulliad yn cydweithio fel tîm i ddarparu'r ymateb cydgysylltiedig y cyfeiriwch ato. Mae'r fyddin mewn un gornel o'r ystafell—yr Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn yn cynrychioli Llywodraeth Prydain—ac mewn cornel arall mae Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yng Nghymru a Lloegr, a ddatganolwyd yn yr Alban. Yn ystod argyfwng Mynydd Epynt, yr oedd Heddlu Dyfed Powys yn bresennol hefyd yn cynrychioli'r Swyddfa Gartref o ran cyfrifoldeb gweinidogol ynghyd â milfeddygon o'r Weinyddiaeth Amaethyddiaeth, Pysgodfeydd a Bwyd ac, yn olaf, ni ein hunain. Yr oeddent i gyd yn cydweithio fel tîm, a ymatebodd yn rhagorol. Byddai unrhyw un sydd am weld ystafell reoli ar waith yn cael enghraifft wych o sut i gydlynu asiantaethau gwahanol, sydd yn diystyru a ydynt yn cael eu talu gan Lywodraeth y DU a'i hasiantaethau, neu gan y Cynulliad a'i asiantaethau.

David Davies: You say that those agencies have been working together as a team, but the guidance on closure of footpaths was

David Davies: Dywedwch fod yr asiantaethau hynny wedi bod yn cydweithio fel tîm, ond cyhoeddwyd y canllawiau ar gau

published a week later in Wales than in England and movement licences had to be delivered to vets by hand whereas in England they were faxed. MAFF officials in Worcester, who are dealing with cases in Grosmont, were unaware of the role of the National Assembly and Assembly Members. Do you not agree with a member of your own team that the handling of this has been catastrophic or is your own administration now working as two teams?

The First Minister: Not at all, David. That was a good attempt at a punch line, but it fell noticeably flat. However, no doubt you can work on that.

I am not saying that everything has been perfect. In a civil emergency, which is neither a peace or war situation, there will be some bruising, because it is impossible to conduct lengthy consultations. Occasionally, decisions must be made quickly and not everybody can be consulted as one would like in an ideal, peacetime situation. However, it is not a war situation either. Therefore people do not understand why they have been pushed to one side to help the national effort to get rid of this huge crisis in rural, and from time to time, urban Wales as well. However, the teamwork across the board, regardless of whether we refer to National Assembly or British Government officials, has been superb. Carwyn Jones, the Minister for Rural Affairs and Gareth Jones, the civil servant—the ‘Jones boys’—have run things extremely well in the operations room. It is an object lesson. It would be good if there was a camera in the room and that was used to show how to do seamless web, interdepartmental, no silo thinking, joined-up Government. It could be used on civil service management courses for the next quarter of a century.

llwybrau troed wythnos yn ddiweddarach yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr a bu'n rhaid i drwyddedau symud gael eu cludo â llaw i filfeddygon tra cawsant eu ffacio yn Lloegr. Nid oedd swyddogion yr Weinyddiaeth Amaethyddiaeth, Pysgodfeydd a Bwyd yng Nghaerwrangon, sydd yn delio ag achosion yn y Grysmwnt, yn ymwybodol o rôl y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ac Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Oni fydddech yn cytuno ag aelod o'ch tîm eich hun y bu'r ymdriniaeth o hyn yn drychinebus neu a yw eich gweinyddiaeth eich hun yn gweithio fel dau dîm bellach?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ddim o gwbl, David. Yr oedd yn ymdrech dda ar ergyd, ond roedd yn fethiant amlwg. Fodd bynnag, mae'n siŵr y gallwch weithio ar hynny.

Nid wyf yn honni y bu popeth yn berffaith. Mewn achos brys sifil, nad yw'n sefyllfa heddwch na rhyfel, bydd rhywfaint o gleisio, gan ei bod yn amhosibl cynnal ymgynghoriadau hirfaith. Yn achlysurol, rhaid gwneud penderfyniadau sydyn ac ni cheir cyfle i ymgynghori â phawb fel y byddai rhywun yn hoffi ei wneud mewn sefyllfa ddelfrydol ar adeg heddwch. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n sefyllfa rhyfel ychwaith. Felly nid yw pobl yn deall pam eu bod wedi cael eu gwthio o'r neilltu er mwyn helpu'r ymdrech genedlaethol i gael gwared ar yr argyfwng anferth hwn yng nghefn gwlad, ac yn y Gymru drefol o dro i dro hefyd. Fodd bynnag, bu'r gwaith tîm yn gyffredinol, waeth a ydym yn cyfeirio at swyddogion y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol neu swyddogion Llywodraeth Prydain, yn rhagorol. Mae Carwyn Jones, y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig a Gareth Jones, y gwas sifil—y Jonesiaid—wedi rhedeg pethau yn arbennig o dda yn yr ystafell reoli. Mae'n enghraifft dda. Byddai'n dda o beth pe byddai camera yn yr ystafell a hwnnw'n cael ei ddefnyddio er mwyn dangos sut yr ydym yn gweithredu Llywodraeth lefn, ryngadrannol, eglur a chydgyssylltiedig. Gellid ei defnyddio ar gyrsiau rheoli'r gwasanaeth sifil am y chwarter canrif nesaf.

Materion nas Datganolwyd sydd yn Effeithio ar Gymru Non-devolved Matters that Affect Wales

Q6 Alun Pugh: Has the First Minister had **C6 Alun Pugh:** A yw Prif Weinidog Cymru

any discussions with the Secretary of State for Wales and the Deputy Prime Minister on non-devolved matters that affect Wales? (OAQ11068)

The First Minister: We have frequent discussions on non-devolved and devolved issues, such as the foot and mouth disease crisis. GM crops would be another topic under discussion, in which the DETR has considerable interest, as does the Assembly, in trying to align policies for the betterment of agriculture and life in general in Wales.

Alun Pugh: We have given Barnett an airing this afternoon. However, my question relates to the north Wales railway line, which is fundamental to the economy of north Wales. Will you stress the vital nature of this line to UK Ministers with a view to securing line speed improvements in the Strategic Rail Authority's plan?

The First Minister: We hope that the all-Wales franchise will be a good deal for Wales, when it is determined. It is a hopeful development. Furthermore, on the mainlines into Wales across north Wales to Holyhead and likewise across to Fishguard on the long-distance high speed lines, we can either choose the big hit of electrification or line speed improvements, which can be brought into effect earlier. Our ability as an Assembly to lobby the transport section of the DETR effectively gives us extra clout. That is why we have progressed as far as we have with the all-Wales rail franchise. I believe that we can continue with those negotiations to a successful conclusion.

Helen Mary Jones: I am afraid that I must return to the issue of the Barnett formula, because I still do not understand your position after your answers to earlier questions. I am not a mathematician, but do you agree with John Prescott that Wales is unfairly subsidised by England, or do you agree with Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales that it currently gets a rough deal and it

wedi cael unrhyw drafodaethau gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru a Dirprwy Brif Weinidog y DU ynghylch materion nad ydynt wedi'u datganoli ond sydd yn effeithio ar Gymru? (OAQ11068)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr ydym yn cael trafodaethau rheolaidd ar faterion nas datganolwyd a materion a ddatganolwyd, megis argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau. Mae cynydau a addaswyd yn enetig yn bwnc arall a drafodir, ac yn bwnc y mae gan Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau gryn ddiddordeb ynddo, fel sydd gan y Cynulliad, wrth geisio alinio polisiau er mwyn gwella amaethyddiaeth a bywyd yn gyffredinol yng Nghymru.

Alun Pugh: Yr ydym wedi mynegi barn ar Barnett y prynhawn yma. Fodd bynnag, mae fy nghwestiwn yn ymwneud â rheilffordd gogledd Cymru, sydd yn hollbwysig i economi gogledd Cymru. A wnewch chi bwysleisio natur hanfodol y llinell hon i Weinidogion y DU gyda'r bwriad o geisio gwella cyflymder y llinell yng nghynllun yr Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Gobeithiwn y bydd y fasnachfaint i Gymru gyfan yn fargen dda i Gymru, pan gaiff ei phenderfynu. Mae'n ddatblygiad gobeithiol. At hynny, ar y prif linellau i mewn i Gymru ar draws Gogledd Cymru i Gaerdybi ac ar draws y de i Abergwaun ar y llinellau cyflymder uchel hir, gallwn ddewis naill ai eu trydaneiddio neu wella cyflymder y llinellau, y gellir ei gyflwyno'n gynharach. Mae ein gallu fel Cynulliad i lobïo adran drafnidiaeth Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau fwy neu lai yn rhoi grym ychwanegol inni. Dyna pam ein bod wedi symud ymlaen mor bell â hyn gyda masnachfaint i Gymru gyfan. Credaf y gallwn barhau â'r trafodaethau hynny yn llwyddiannus.

Helen Mary Jones: Mae gennyf ofn fod yn rhaid imi ddychwelyd at fater fformiwla Barnett, gan nad wyf o hyd yn deall eich safle yn dilyn eich atebion i gwestiynau cynharach. Nid mathamategydd mohonof, ond a gytunwch â John Prescott bod Cymru yn cael ei chynnal yn annheg gan Loegr, neu a gytunwch â Phlaid Cymru—The Party of Wales ei bod yn cael bargaen wael ar hyn o

would be better off with a proper needs-based formula? Will you answer with words of one syllable please?

The First Minister: Your question is academic, because John Prescott does not hold the views that you attribute to him. You have fallen into the trap of reading what was in *The Guardian* and not in quotation marks, as though it was Gospel truth, even though it was denied by the entire Government machine afterwards as not representing the views of the Deputy Prime Minister or the Government. Do I think that a needs-based formula may be introduced in the long-term? I have said on many occasions that a needs-based formula would hold few fears for us. It might lose the precision and predictability of the Barnett formula. However, Barnett's predictability can cause problems. You know exactly where you are year on year, but if there is a crisis, you cannot go outside that formula unless there is a National Assembly with an administration, of which I am First Minister, that negotiates money in addition to Barnett. Therefore, as much as Helen Mary might like to deny it, we have money over and above Barnett, which is based on need. Therefore, to a large extent, last July we achieved exactly what she asks for now.

2:30 p.m.

Jonathan Morgan: A report published during the last week displays the extent of student hardship across the United Kingdom, caused, according to the National Union of Students, by your party's national policies on tuition fees and the abolition of the maintenance grant. In your discussions with Ministers about non-devolved matters, what opportunities have you used to raise the concern of many students in Wales about their financial prospects?

The First Minister: We may have something to report on that on 26 June in terms of our student hardship review. I am not familiar with the report to which you refer—I do not know whether it is from the National Union of Students or from an independent body. I cannot help you on that. If you want to write

bryd ac y byddai yn well ei byd gyda fformiwla sydd yn seiliedig ar anghenion priodol? A fydddech cystal ag ateb mewn ffordd syml?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae'ch cwestiwn yn academig, gan nad yw John Prescott yn dal y farn yr ydych yn ei phriodoli iddo. Yr ydych wedi disgyn i'r fagl o ddarllen yr hyn a oedd yn *The Guardian* heb fod mewn dyfynodau, fel pe bai'n Efengyl wir, er y cawsant eu gwadu gan y Llywodraeth wedi hynny fel sylwadau nad oeddent yn cynrychioli barn y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog na'r Llywodraeth. A wyf yn credu y cyflwynir fformiwla ar sail anghenion yn yr hirdymor? Yr wyf wedi dweud droeon na fyddai fformiwla ar sail anghenion yn peri llawer o bryder inni. Gallai golli manyldeb ac elfen ragweladwy fformiwla Barnett. Fodd bynnag, gall elfen ragweladwy Barnett achosi problemau. Gwyddoch yn union ble yr ydych flwyddwn wrth flwyddyn, ond pe bai argyfwng, ni allwch fynd y tu allan i'r fformiwla oni bai bod gennym Gynulliad Cenedlaethol â gweinyddiaeth, yr wyf fi yn Brif Weinidog arno, sydd yn negodi arian sydd yn ychwanegol at Barnett. Felly, er cymaint yr hoffai Helen Mary ei wadu, cawn arian ychwanegol i Barnett, ar sail angen. Felly, i raddau helaeth, bu inni gyflawni yn union yr hyn y mae'n gofyn amdano yn awr fis Gorffennaf diwethaf.

Jonathan Morgan: Mae adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos diwethaf yn dangos graddau caledi myfyrwyr ar draws y Deyrnas Unedig, a achoswyd, yn ôl Undeb Cenedlaethol y Myfyrwyr, gan bolisiâu cenedlaethol eich plaid ar ffioedd dysgu a diddymu'r grant cynnal. Yn eich trafodaethau gyda Gweinidogion ar faterion nas datganolwyd, pa gyfleoedd a gawsoch i godi pryder llawer o fyfyrwyr yng Nghymru am eu rhagolygon ariannol?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Efallai y bydd gennym rywbeth i'w adrodd ar hynny ar 26 Mehefin o ran ein hadolygiad o galedi myfyrwyr. Nid wyf yn gyfarwydd â'r adroddiad y cyfeiriwch ato—ni wn a ddaeth o du Undeb Cenedlaethol y Myfyrwyr neu gan gorff annibynnol. Ni allaf eich helpu ar

to me about the report's content, Jane Davidson or I will ensure that you receive a reply.

hynny. Os hoffech ysgrifennu ataf ynglŷn â chynnwys yr adroddiad, byddaf fi neu Jane Davidson yn sicrhau eich bod yn derbyn ateb.

**Cydlynu Polisiâu'r Cynulliad (Clwy'r Traed a'r Genau)
Co-ordinating Assembly Policy (Foot and Mouth Disease)**

Q7 Phil Williams: How is Assembly policy being co-ordinated across all areas to deal with the foot and mouth disease outbreak, to minimise financial losses to Wales and to help sustain the Welsh economy? (OAQ11048)

The First Minister: I am glad that you have raised the issue of foot and mouth disease in the wider context. Most of us would accept that the economic losses experienced in tourism are probably greater than those experienced in agriculture per se. We have been trying to put that right insofar as anybody can when it is impossible to bring back customers, which is what hotels, guesthouses, bed and breakfasts and small rural businesses need. Pending the ability to return everything to normal in the rural parts of Wales after the last case of foot and mouth disease, we are doing our best with a range of measures to try to enable businesses to survive what is undoubtedly a rocky period. These measures have been listed, and I am sure that you are familiar with most of the details. The important thing in terms of co-ordination is that the rural taskforce has set up a sub-committee task and finish group that will consider how to answer the needs of businesses to survive the foot and mouth disease, to what we hope will be a return to normality in tourism and other businesses in rural Wales before long.

Phil Williams: What steps have you and your officials taken to determine the overall economic impact of foot and mouth disease on the different regions of Wales, and to calculate the total amount of government finance necessary for a full economic recovery in each of those regions as a basis for negotiating the necessary extra funds from the Treasury on top of the budget allocated in the spending review?

C7 Phil Williams: Sut y mae polisiâu'r Cynulliad yn cael eu cydlynu ym mhob maes i ymdrin â chlwy'r traed a'r genau, er mwyn sicrhau cyn lleied o golledion ariannol ag y bo modd i Gymru a helpu i gynnal economi Cymru? (OAQ11048)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr wyf yn falch ichi godi mater clwy'r traed a'r genau yn y cyddestun ehangach. Byddai'r rhan fwyaf ohonom yn derbyn bod y colledion economaidd a gafwyd ym maes twristiaeth yn llawer mwy na'r rhai a gafwyd mewn amaethyddiaeth fel y cyfryw. Yr ydym wedi ceisio unioni hynny gymaint ag y gall unrhyw un pan ei bod yn amhosibl denu cwsmeriaid yn ôl, sef yr hyn sydd ei angen ar westai mawr a bach, lleoedd sydd yn cynnig gwely a brecwast a busnesau bach gwledig. Tra'n disgwyl i bopeth dychwelyd i'r hyn yr oeddent yn y rhannau gwledig o Gymru wedi'r achos olaf o glwy'r traed a'r genau, yr ydym yn gwneud ein gorau gydag amrywiaeth o fesurau i geisio galluogi busnesau i oroesi cyfnod sydd, heb amheuaeth, yn un anodd. Rhestrwyd y mesurau hynny, ac yr wyf yn sicr eich bod yn gyfarwydd â'r rhan fwyaf o'r manylion. Y peth pwysicaf o ran cydlynu yw'r ffaith y bu i'r tasglu gwledig sefydlu is-bwyllgor gorchwyl a gorffen a fydd yn ystyried sut i ddiwallu anghenion busnesau er mwyn goroesi clwy'r traed a'r genau, a dychwelyd i'r hyn y gobeithiwn a fydd yn stâd o normalrwydd i dwristiaeth a busnesau eraill yn y Gymru wledig cyn bo hir.

Phil Williams: Pa gamau a gymerwyd gennych chi a'ch swyddogion i benderfynu ar effaith economaidd gyffredinol clwy'r traed a'r genau ar ranbarthau gwahanol Cymru, ac i gyfrifo cyfanswm arian y llywodraeth sydd ei angen ar gyfer adferiad economaidd llawn ym mhob un o'r rhanbarthau hynny fel sail ar gyfer negodi'r arian ychwanegol angenrheidiol gan y Trysorlys ar ben y gyllideb a ddyrannwyd yn yr adolygiad o wariant?

The First Minister: I am grateful for your constructive question. I will say two things in answer to that. First, each of the regional tourism partnerships have sent out questionnaires to all tourist-related businesses. It does not cover all businesses affected, but the tourism businesses are sending out questionnaires to try to find out by what percentage businesses are down, so that we can get those results in and co-ordinate them. Secondly, the Deputy First Minister and Minister for Economic Development, Mike German, was in Glasgow last week for a meeting with the tourism ministers of Scotland and Northern Ireland. They are putting together a submission, which will be co-ordinated by the Department for Culture, Media and Sport, to the Treasury for funds that will depend on collecting good figures of the kind that you are talking about and what kind of compensation the industry needs. We cannot do 100 per cent consequential losses. That is physically and financially impossible, and no Government has attempted it after things that impact on an industry such as tourism. However, insofar as it is possible to try to preserve the tourist industry in the best condition possible for the summer, next winter, and the following summer, that work was done last week by the tourism ministers of England and the three devolved administrations.

Rod Richards: A few moments ago, First Minister, you gave us a kind of rose-tinted picture of crisis management at Cathays Park regarding the foot and mouth disease outbreak. I got the impression that you had all these agencies and Government departments working together like happy families, whereas the rest of us on the outside thought that Captain Chaos was in charge. Who is in charge of this so-called idyllic teamwork? Does the responsibility change according to what issue is coming up, or is one department continuously in charge? If that is not the case, when is your department ever in charge of a particular issue, and what may those issues have been over these last eight weeks?

The First Minister: I thought that I had

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich cwestiwn adeiladol. Dywedaf ddau beth yn ateb i hynny. Yn gyntaf, mae pob un o'r partneriaethau twristiaeth rhanbarthol wedi anfon holiaduron at bob busnes sydd yn gysylltiedig â thwristiaeth. Nid yw'n cwmpasu yr holl fusnesau yr effeithwyd arnynt, ond mae'r busnesau twristiaeth yn anfon holiaduron er mwyn ceisio darganfod pa ganran y maent ar eu colled, er mwyn inni gael y canlyniadau hynny a'u cydgysylltu. Yn ail, yr oedd Mike German, Dirprwy Brif Weinidog Cymru a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd, yn Glasgow yr wythnos diwethaf mewn cyfarfod gyda gweinidogion twristiaeth yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon. Maent yn llunio cais, a gydgysylltir gan yr Adran dros Ddiwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon, i'r Trysorlys am arian a fydd yn dibynnu ar gasglu'r math o ffigurau da yr ydych yn sôn amdanynt a pha fath o iawndal sydd ei angen ar y diwydiant. Ni allwn ddigolledu colledion canlyniadol o 100 y cant. Mae hynny'n amhosibl yn gorfforol ac yn ariannol, ac nid oes unrhyw Lywodraeth wedi ceisio gwneud hynny ar ôl i bethau effeithio ar ddiwydiant fel twristiaeth. Fodd bynnag, er mwyn ceisio gwneud y gorau i gadw'r diwydiant twristiaeth yn y cyflwr gorau posibl ar gyfer yr haf, y gaeaf nesaf, a'r haf canlynol, gwnaethpwyd y gwaith hwnnw yr wythnos diwethaf gan weinidogion twristiaeth Lloegr a'r tair gweinyddiaeth ddatganoledig.

Rod Richards: Ychydig funudau'n ôl, Brif Weinidog, rhoesoch ryw fath o ddarlun ffyddiog inni o'r modd y rheolir yr argyfwng ym Mharc Cathays o ran clwy'r traed a'r genau. Cefais yr argraff fod asiantaethau ac adrannau'r Llywodraeth yn cydweithio fel teulu mawr hapus, tra bod y gweddill ohonom ar y tu allan o'r farn mai Syr Wynff a Plwmsan oedd wrth y llyw. Pwy sydd yn gyfrifol am y gwaith tîm delfrydol honedig hwn? A yw'r cyfrifoldeb yn newid yn ôl y mater sydd yn codi, neu a oes un adran yn gyfrifol drwy'r adeg? Os nad dyna'r achos, pa bryd mae eich adran chi yn gyfrifol am fater arbennig, a pha fath o faterion oedd y rheini yn ystod yr wyth wythnos diwethaf?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Credais imi wneud

made that clear. You must not be too picky on this issue because the legal position is only one aspect. As regards the practical day-to-day control of matters in the operations room, Carwyn Jones deals with the political side and Gareth Jones, a senior administrator from our Agriculture Department who is co-ordinating activities there, deals with the operational side. I am not a lawyer, but I understand that the legal position is that the Prime Minister is in charge because technically and legally, animal welfare is not a devolved issue. Therefore, the control of the disease lies with MAFF. However, after the first few weeks of the outbreak, it has increasingly been a matter for 10 Downing Street. Carwyn Jones and Gareth Jones, as politician and administrator, respectively, have operational, day-to-day control and are in charge of what goes on in the operations room.

hynny'n glir. Ni ddylech orfanylu ar y mater gan mai dim ond un agwedd yw'r sefyllfa gyfreithiol. O ran rheolaeth ymarferol o ddydd i ddydd yn yr ystafell reoli, Carwyn Jones sydd yn ymdrin â'r ochr wleidyddol a Gareth Jones, uwch weinyddwr yn yr Adran Amaethyddiaeth sydd yn cydgysylltu gweithgareddau yno, sydd yn ymdrin â'r ochr weithrediadol. Nid cyfreithiwr mohonof, ond deallaf mai'r sefyllfa gyfreithiol yw mai'r Prif Weinidog sydd â'r cyfrifoldeb, gan nad yw lles anifeiliaid yn dechnegol nac yn gyfreithiol yn fater a ddatganolwyd. Felly, cyfrifoldeb MAFF yw rheoli'r clwyf. Fodd bynnag, ar ôl wythnosau cyntaf yr argyfwng, tyfodd fwy-fwy yn fater i 10 Stryd Downing. Carwyn Jones a Gareth Jones, fel gwleidydd a gweinyddwr, yn y drefn honno, sydd â rheolaeth weithrediadol o ddydd i ddydd a hwy sydd yn gyfrifol am yr hyn sydd yn mynd ymlaen yn yr ystafell reoli.

Effeitholrwydd Cynghorau Partneriaeth Effectiveness of Partnership Councils

Q8 Janet Ryder: Will the First Minister make a statement on how the effectiveness of partnership councils is monitored? (OAQ11050)

C8 Janet Ryder: A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar y ffordd y caiff effeithiolrwydd cynghorau partneriaeth ei fonitro? (OAQ11050)

The First Minister: The partnership councils were established as a means of supporting a healthy working relationship between the Assembly and local government, voluntary and business sectors. They provide an opportunity for co-operation in policy development and evaluation. As open bodies, anybody can monitor their effectiveness.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Sefydlwyd y cynghorau partneriaeth fel modd o gefnogi perthynas waith iach rhwng y Cynulliad a llywodraeth leol, y sectorau gwirfoddol a busnes. Maent yn rhoi cyfle i gydweithio er mwyn datblygu polisi a gwerthuso. Fel cyrff agored, gall unrhyw un fonitro eu heffeithiolrwydd.

Janet Ryder: The partnership councils discuss many issues, take decisions and come up with initiatives. However, there does not seem to be a clear process for taking those decisions or initiatives forward. Furthermore, in some cases, there does not seem to be a clear process to allow partnership councils to report back to subject committees and for them, in turn, to take up the ideas. Are you satisfied with that situation and, if not, will you consider introducing a protocol showing how decisions can be taken forward and clarifying to which subject committees they will report back?

Janet Ryder: Mae'r cynghorau partneriaeth yn trafod llawer o faterion, yn gwneud penderfyniadau ac yn creu mentrau. Fodd bynnag, ymddengys nad oes proses eglur ar gyfer datblygu'r penderfyniadau neu'r mentrau hynny. At hynny, mewn rhai achosion, ymddengys nad oes proses eglur i ganiatáu i gynghorau partneriaeth adrodd yn ôl i bwyllgorau pwnc, ac iddynt hwythau, yn eu tro, ddatblygu'r syniadau. A ydych yn fodlon â'r sefyllfa, ac os nad ydych, a wnewch chi ystyried cyflwyno protocol sydd yn dangos sut y gellir datblygu penderfyniadau ac egluro i ba bwyllgorau pwnc y byddant yn adrodd yn ôl?

The First Minister: They are not decision-making bodies. I think that that is what you are saying. You correctly describe the situation that was always intended for the partnership councils. They open up the Assembly's work and ensure that local government, business and voluntary sectors do not think of the Assembly as some sort of big brother handing things out and telling them what will happen whether they like it or not. We do not want to work like that. That was never the intention of the Government of Wales Act 1998. That is how the partnership councils work. As a result, some people, who have not read that rulebook, join the councils and wonder why they do not take decisions. It was never the intention for them to take decisions. You ask how partnership councils' decisions are followed up. As with all meetings, there is always a fear of what happens at the next meeting, when somebody asks you if you have done what was agreed upon at the last meeting. You always want to ensure that you have done it before the next meeting. That is what we do.

Alun Cairns: I am sure that the First Minister is well connected. Can he tell us whether he thinks the local government partnership council will be more or less effective if Councillor Russell Goodway has to leave to pursue other interests elsewhere?

The First Minister: The 'other interests elsewhere' are matters on which this Assembly may not intrude and therefore I will not answer that question.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid cyrff gwneud penderfyniadau mohonynt. Credaf mai dyna yr ydych yn ei ddweud. Yr ydych yn disgrifio'r sefyllfa a fwriadwyd erioed ar gyfer y cynghorau partneriaeth yn gywir. Maent yn agor gwaith y Cynulliad ac yn sicrhau nad yw llywodraeth leol, y sectorau busnes a gwirfoddol yn ystyried y Cynulliad fel math o frawd mawr sydd yn dosbarthu pethau ac yn dweud wrthynt beth fydd yn mynd i ddigwydd pa un ai a ydynt yn cytuno neu beidio. Nid ydym am weithio felly. Nid dyna oedd bwriad Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. Dyna sut y mae'r cynghorau partneriaeth yn gweithio. O ganlyniad, mae rhai pobl, na ddarllenodd y llyfr rheolau hwnnw, yn ymuno â'r cynghorau ac yn holi pam nad ydynt yn gwneud penderfyniadau. Ni fu erioed yn fwriad iddynt wneud penderfyniadau. Yr ydych yn holi ym mha fodd y caiff penderfyniadau'r cynghorau partneriaeth eu datblygu. Fel gyda phob cyfarfod, ceir pryder o hyd am yr hyn a fydd yn digwydd yn y cyfarfod nesaf, pan fydd rhywun yn gofyn ichi a ydych wedi gweithredu'r hyn y cytunwyd arno yn y cyfarfod diwethaf. Yr ydych bob amser am sicrhau eich bod wedi ei gyflawni cyn y cyfarfod nesaf. Dyna'r hyn a wnawn.

Alun Cairns: Yr wyf yn siŵr fod gan Brif Weinidog Cymru gysylltiadau da. A allai ddweud wrthym a fydd cyngor partneriaeth llywodraeth leol yn ei dyb ef yn fwy neu'n llai effeithiol pe bai'n rhaid i'r Cynghorydd Russell Goodway adael i fynd ar drywydd diddordebau eraill mewn mannau eraill?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae'r 'diddordebau eraill mewn mannau eraill' yn faterion na chaiff y Cynulliad ymyrryd â hwy ac felly nid atebaf y cwestiwn hwnnw.

Cynnydd yn yr Isafswm Cyflog Rise in the Minimum Wage

Q9 Ann Jones: What discussions has the First Minister had with the Secretary of State for Wales, or other UK Ministers, about the effects on social exclusion and small businesses in Wales of the rise in the minimum wage to £4.10 per hour from October this year and to £4.20 per hour from October 2002? (OAQ11070)

C9 Ann Jones: Pa drafodaethau y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi'u cael gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, neu â Gweinidogion eraill y DU, ynghylch effeithiau'r cynnydd yn yr isafswm cyflog i £4.10 yr awr o fis Hydref eleni ac i £4.20 yr awr o fis Hydref 2002 ar ddiethrio cymdeithasol a busnesau bach yng Nghymru? (OAQ11070)

The First Minister: The Secretary of State for Wales, the Secretary of State for Trade and Industry, on his recent visit to Wales, and myself have discussed this issue. The effect of the minimum wage increase from £3.70 to £4.10 per hour and, in 18 months' time, from £4.10 to £4.20 per hour will be positive for Wales. More people in Wales will be beneficially affected because a higher proportion of our workforce is on the minimum wage. Furthermore, the minimum wage has had the biggest, single impact in narrowing the gap between wages for men and women since the Equal Pay Act 1970 because 70 per cent of those on the minimum wage are women. I noticed that Cerys Matthews of Catatonia was singing in her return concert in support of the UNISON campaign for a £5.00 per hour minimum wage. We are not ready for that yet, although I am sure that we all admire Cerys Matthews and Catatonia and their contribution to modern Welsh pop music.

Ann Jones: Like you, I welcome the fact that around 80,000 low-paid workers in Wales stand to gain from this increase in the minimum wage. As you said, three-quarters of them are women workers. Do you also agree that this rise in the minimum wage will be especially welcome in seaside towns, such as Rhyl and Prestatyn in my constituency? Many workers in such towns were exploited before the minimum wage in candyfloss jobs, with conditions such as 'a-pound-an-hour and all the chips you can eat'. What do you estimate that the minimum wage will contribute towards our target of tackling social disadvantage, as set out in 'Betterwales.com'?

2:40 p.m.

The First Minister: You disappoint me, Ann. I thought that life in Rhyl was all about chamber music concerts and meetings of the Royal Philosophical Society. Now you tell me differently.

Ann Jones: It is now that they have the minimum wage. [*Laughter.*]

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr wyf fi, Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, a'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Fasnach a Diwydiant, yn ystod ei ymweliad diweddar â Chymru, wedi trafod y mater hwn. Bydd effaith y cynnydd yn yr isafswm cyflog o £3.70 i £4.10 yr awr, ac o £4.10 i £4.20 yr awr ymhen 18 mis yn un gadarnhaol i Gymru. Bydd mwy o bobl yn cael budd yng Nghymru gan fod cyfran uwch o'n gweithlu yn ennill yr isafswm cyflog. At hynny, yr isafswm cyflog sydd wedi cael yr effaith unigol, fwyaf ar gau'r bwlc rhwng cyflogau merched a dynion ers Deddf Cyflog Cyfartal 1970 gan fod 70 y cant o'r rhai sydd yn ennill yr isafswm cyflog yn ferched. Sylwais fod Cerys Matthews o Catatonia wedi canu mewn cyngerdd, am y tro cyntaf ers amser, a oedd yn cefnogi ymgyrch UNISON am isafswm cyflog o £5.00 yr awr. Nid ydym yn barod am hynny eto, er fy mod yn siŵr ein bod i gyd yn edmygu Cerys Matthews a Catatonia a'u cyfraniad i gerddoriaeth bop Gymreig fodern.

Ann Jones: Fel chithau, croesawaf y ffaith y gallai tua 80,000 o weithwyr sydd yn ennill cyflog isel yng Nghymru elwa o'r cynnydd hwn yn yr isafswm cyflog. Fel y dywedaso, mae tri chwarter ohonynt yn ferched. A fydddech yn cytuno hefyd y bydd y cynnydd hwn yn yr isafswm cyflog yn cael croeso arbennig mewn trefi glan môr, megis y Rhyl a Phrestatyn, sydd yn fy etholaeth i? Manteiswyd ar lawer o weithwyr mewn trefi o'r fath cyn yr isafswm cyflog mewn swyddi candi-fflos gydag amodau megis 'punt-yr-awr a'r holl sglodion y gallwch eu bwyta'. Faint o gyfraniad y gall yr isafswm cyflog ei wneud i'n targed o fynd i'r afael ag anfantais cymdeithasol, fel y nodwyd yn 'Gwellcymru.com'?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr ydych yn fy siomi, Ann. Yr oeddwn yn meddwl mai canolbwynt bywyd y Rhyl oedd cyngherddau cerddoriaeth siambr a chyfarfodydd o'r Gymdeithas Athronyddol Frenhinol. Yr ydych yn adrodd stori wahanol yn awr.

Ann Jones: Dyna fel y mae bellach ar ôl iddynt gael yr isafswm cyflog. (*Chwerthin.*)

The First Minister: You are right that all of those seaside towns—starting at Rhyl and Prestatyn, going around Cardigan Bay to Tenby, and across to Barry Island—are hotspots for people directly impacted by the minimum wage. You must also consider whether instituting the minimum wage in the first place impacted on jobs, as the Tories predicted. Clearly it cannot have had any material effect. Secondly, will any sharp increase in the minimum wage have an impact on jobs? The evidence so far—although we can never be completely sure—is that it cannot have much material impact, because unemployment continues to fall and employment continues to rise.

Brian Hancock: Will you make a further statement about social inclusion and small businesses, and their burden as unofficial tax collectors and distributors? Last week, accountants in the City of London gave evidence, on official Government figures, that the gap between rich and poor was wider under New Labour than under Margaret Thatcher or John Major. That report confirmed what the people of Wales already know, that New Labour has done little to combat poverty and deprivation, particularly when, in Wales, 98 per cent of small business are small and—

The Presiding Officer: Order. I want just one question, on the minimum wage.

Brian Hancock: Can I finish the question?

The Presiding Officer: No, you have asked it.

The First Minister: I am not sure who Brian Hancock said was the author of that report. Was it the Federation of Small Businesses?

Brian Hancock: No, I said accountants in the City of London.

The First Minister: I am sorry, I missed the beginning of the question. The evidence that there has been an improvement in the lives of the poor in Wales is first, the minimum wage,

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr ydych yn gywir bod y trefi glan môr hynny—gan gychwyn yn y Rhyl a Phrestatyn, a mynd o amgylch Bae Ceredigion i lawr i Ddinbych-y-pysgod, ac ar draws i Ynys y Barri—yn fannau gwael i bobl yr effeithir yn uniongyrchol arnynt gan yr isafswm cyflog. Rhaid ichi ystyried hefyd a gafodd gosod yr isafswm cyflog effaith ar swyddi yn y lle cyntaf, fel y rhagwelodd y Torïaid. Yn amlwg ni allai fod wedi cael unrhyw effaith wirioneddol. Yn ail, a fydd unrhyw gynnydd sydyn yn yr isafswm cyflog yn cael effaith ar swyddi? Mae'r dystiolaeth hyd yma—er na allwn fod yn hollol sicr—yn awgrymu na allai gael llawer o effaith berthnasol, gan fod diweithdra'n parhau i ostwng a chyflogaeth yn parhau i gynyddu.

Brian Hancock: A wnewch chi ddatganiad pellach ynglŷn â chynhwysedd cymdeithasol a busnesau bach, a'u baich fel casglwyr a dosbarthwyr treth answyddogol? Yr wythnos diwethaf, rhoddodd cyfrifwyr yn y Ddinas dystiolaeth, yn ôl ffigurau swyddogol y Llywodraeth, fod y bwll rhwng y cyfoethog a'r tlawd yn lletach o dan Lafur Newydd nag yr oedd o dan Margaret Thatcher neu John Major. Cadarnhaodd yr adroddiad hwnnw yr hyn a wyddai pobl Cymru eisoes, sef mai ychydig iawn a wnaeth Llafur Newydd i fynd i'r afael â thlodi ac amddifadedd, yn arbennig yng Nghymru, pan fo 98 y cant o fusnesau bach yn fach ac—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Un cwestiwn yn unig yr wyf yn ei ganiatáu, ar yr isafswm cyflog.

Brian Hancock: A gaf orffen y cwestiwn?

Y Llywydd: Na chewch, yr ydych wedi ei ofyn.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid wyf yn siŵr pwy oedd awdur yr adroddiad hwnnw yn ôl Brian Hancock. Ai'r Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach?

Brian Hancock: Nage, dywedais mai cyfrifwyr yn y Ddinas oeddent.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, collais ddechrau'r cwestiwn. Y dystiolaeth sydd yn dangos y bu gwelliant ym mywydau'r tlawd yng Nghymru yw, yn

second, the fall in unemployment, third, then the rise in employment, combined—unusually in British history—with low inflation. That low inflation leaves you with low mortgage rates if you are paying a small mortgage. All these elements are unusual in British history. Normally, if you had high employment and low unemployment, you had rocketing inflation. We have not, at the moment, which is good for people at the bottom of the social scale. As a result, people are doing well in closing the huge gap in incomes that the previous Government bequeathed to us.

gyntaf, yr isafswm cyflog, yn ail, y gostyngiad mewn diweithdra ac, yn drydydd, y cynnydd mewn cyflogaeth, wedi ei gyfuno—yn anarferol yn hanes Prydain—gyda chwyddiant isel. Mae'r chwyddiant isel hwnnw yn arwain at gyfraddau morgais isel os ydych yn talu morgais bach. Mae'r elfennau hyn i gyd yn anarferol yn hanes Prydain. Fel arfer, pe bai cyflogaeth uchel a diweithdra isel gennych, byddai chwyddiant yn saethu i fyny. Ar hyn o bryd, nid oes gennym hynny, sydd yn beth da i bobl ar waelod y raddfa gymdeithasol. O ganlyniad, mae pobl yn gwneud yn dda wrth gau'r bwlch enfawr o ran incymau a etifeddasom gan y Llywodraeth flaenorol.

Agor Carchar i Fenywod yng Nghymru Establishing a Women's Prison in Wales

C10 Gareth Jones: Pa drafodaethau y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi'u cael â'i gydweithwyr yn San Steffan ynghylch agor carchar i fenywod yng Nghymru? (OAQ11053)

Q10 Gareth Jones: What discussions has the First Minister had with Westminster colleagues on establishing a women's prison in Wales? (OAQ11053)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid wyf wedi cael trafodaethau â'm cyfeillion gwleidyddol yn Llywodraeth San Steffan ar y pwnc hwn. Fodd bynnag, ymwelodd y Pwyllgor Dethol ar Faterion Cymreig y bore yma â charchar Eastwood Park yn Swydd Gaerloyw, sydd yn delio â charcharorion benywaidd o ganolbarth a de Cymru. Yr oedd yr ymweliad yn rhan o ymchwiliad y pwyllgor ar beth a ddigwydd i garcharorion o Gymru na ddelir â hwy yng Nghymru, sef menywod a rhai pobl ifanc.

The First Minister: I have not had discussions with my political colleagues in the Westminster Government on this subject. However, this morning the Select Committee on Welsh Affairs visited Eastwood Park in Gloucestershire, which houses female prisoners from mid and south Wales. The visit was part of the committee's investigation into what happens to prisoners from Wales who are not incarcerated in Wales, namely women and some young people.

Nid oes digon o fenywod yng Nghymru sydd yn euog o droseddu ac yn haeddu eu hanfon i'r carchar. Nid wyf yn sicr a allem gytuno mai rhywbeth i'w groesawu yw hynny ac nid rhywbeth i deimlo'n flin amdano.

There are not enough female offenders deserving of imprisonment in Wales. I am not sure whether we can agree that that is something to welcome, rather than a cause for concern.

Gareth Jones: Derbyniaf fod hyn yn fater sensitif a chymhleth. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn sicr eich bod yn ymwybodol o'r problemau sydd yn wynebu'r ychydig fenywod o Gymru sydd wedi'u carcharu yn Lloegr, ymhell o'u teuluoedd, a than orchymyn i beidio â chyfathrebu â'i gilydd yn y Gymraeg. A wnewch chi bwysu ar yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref i ystyried y problemau hyn, drwy leihau'r nifer o fenywod a garcherir am fân

Gareth Jones: I accept that this is a sensitive and complex matter. However, I am sure that you are aware of the problems facing those few Welsh women incarcerated in England, far from their families and under orders not to communicate with one another through the medium of Welsh. Will you put pressure on the Home Secretary to solve these problems, by reducing the number of women who are imprisoned for minor offences, and by

droseddau, a thrwy ddarparu cyfleusterau gwarchodol yng Nghymru i'r ychydig fenywod yr ystyrir carchar yn unig ddewis iddynt?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Y paradox yw, po leiaf o fenywod a anfonir i'r carchar, po leiaf o gyfiawnhad fydd dros gael carchar i fenywod yng Nghymru. Nid wyf am weld rhagor o fenywod yn cyflawni troseddau sy'n arwain at gyfnod o garchar. Y paradox arall yw bod mwy o ddynion o Gymru na menywod yn y carchar, ond bod mwy o fenywod mewn ysbytai meddwl. Dyna'r broblem sydd gennym gyda phobl nad ydynt yn gwbl addas i gael eu carcharu.

Alun Cairns: A gytuna'r Prif Weinidog fod troseddwy'r yn cael eu haeddiant, ac nad ydym am wastraffu arian cyhoeddus drwy adeiladu carchar newydd yng Nghymru?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid oes cyfiawnhad dros adeiladu rhagor o garchardai yng Nghymru. Yr ydym am weld llai o droseddwy'r yn cael eu hanfon i'r carchar. Gwelsom gynnydd o hyd at 500 y cant yn nifer y carcharorion yn Lloegr a Chymru yn ystod y 10 mlynedd diwethaf. Mae hynny'n drueni, ond ni olyga fod nifer y menywod yng Nghymru sy'n troseddu yn cyfiawnhau adeiladu carchar i fenywod yma.

providing custodial facilities in Wales for the small number of women for whom imprisonment is considered the only option?

The First Minister: The paradox is, the fewer women that are sent to prison, the less justification exists for having a women's prison in Wales. I do not wish to see more women committing offences leading to jail sentences. The other paradox is that there are more Welsh men than women in prison, but there are more women in mental hospitals. That is the problem we face with people who are not totally suitable to be imprisoned.

Alun Cairns: Does the First Minister agree that offenders get what they deserve, and that we do not want to waste public money on building a new prison in Wales?

The First Minister: There is no justification for building more prisons in Wales. We wish to see fewer offenders being sent to prison. We have seen an increase of up to 500 per cent in the number of prisoners in England and Wales over the last ten years. That is regrettable, however it does not mean that there are enough women offenders in Wales to justify building a women's prison here.

Datganiad ar Achosion o Dwbercwlosis yng Nghasnewydd Statement on Incidences of Tuberculosis in Newport

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): I am grateful for this opportunity to make a statement on a matter of public concern, namely the outbreak of tuberculosis in Duffryn High School in Newport and its implications for an all-Wales vaccination policy. Earlier this year a pupil in Duffryn High School in Newport was diagnosed with TB. Following that diagnosis, screening of other children in the pupil's year group and contacts occurred in early April. Eight pupils were identified as having contracted TB. As a precautionary measure Gwent Health Authority began screening the school population on 24 April. Those pupils who test negative for TB will be offered Bacille Calmette-Guerin (BCG) vaccination. Other pupils will be referred for further

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle hwn i wneud datganiad ar fater o bryder cyhoeddus, sef yr achosion o dwbercwlosis yn Ysgol Uwchradd Duffryn yng Nghasnewydd a'i oblygiadau ar gyfer polisi brechu i Gymru gyfan. Yn gynharach eleni, cafwyd bod disgybl yn Ysgol Uwchradd Duffryn yng Nghasnewydd yn dioddef o dwbercwlosis. Yn dilyn y diagnosis hwnnw, sgriniwyd plant eraill yng ngrŵp blwyddyn y disgybl a phobl y bu'r disgybl mewn cysylltiad â hwy yn gynnar ym mis Ebrill. Canfuwyd bod wyth disgybl wedi dal TB. Fel cam rhagofalus, dechreuodd Awdurdod Iechyd Gwent sgrinio poblogaeth yr ysgol ar 24 Ebrill. Cynigir brechiad Bacille Calmette-Guerin (BCG) i'r disgyblion hynny

investigation. Screening results are expected this week.

Gwent Health Authority's Director of Public Health, the Director of the Communicable Disease Surveillance Centre (Wales), and the education and environmental health departments of the local authority are working together to ensure a co-ordinated response. The Chief Medical Officer, who is keeping in close touch with the situation, is ensuring that I am briefed.

Tuberculosis has been with us for many years and is controlled by a number of measures: prompt and effective treatment of identified cases, particularly if they are infectious; examination of contacts of cases; screening for those at high risk, and a national BCG vaccination programme in schools. BCG vaccination helps to prevent TB but is only effective in about 70 per cent of cases. Many countries do not use it because of that.

Tuberculosis was once a common and often fatal illness. However, as a result of the measures that I have outlined, the number of cases has fallen dramatically. Cases of TB occur occasionally in the community but antibiotics can treat it. Surveillance data indicates that there have been small year on year increases in the incidence of TB in the UK. However this trend is not reflected in Wales, but we must be vigilant.

Wales relies on consortium arrangements with the Department of Health for vaccine supplies. Due to severe manufacturing problems, the routine schools immunisation programme was suspended in the UK in 1999. Previously approximately 70 per cent of the target group was immunised. I am pleased to announce that those supply difficulties have been overcome. On 24 March, it was announced that sufficient stocks of vaccine were available to start to reintroduce the schools programme. Health authorities received supplies of vaccine on 16

y bydd canlyniad eu profion ar gyfer TB yn negatif. Cyfeirir disgyblion eraill ar gyfer archwiliad pellach. Disgwylir canlyniadau'r sgrinio yr wythnos hon.

Mae Cyfarwyddwr Iechyd Cyhoeddus Awdurdod Iechyd Gwent, Cyfarwyddwr Canolfan Gwyliadwriaeth Clefydau Heintus (Cymru), ac adrannau addysg a iechyd yr amgylchedd yr awdurdod lleol yn cydweithio er mwyn sicrhau y ceir ymateb cydgysylltiedig. Mae'r Prif Swyddog Meddygol, sydd yn cadw mewn cysylltiad agos â'r sefyllfa, yn sicrhau fy mod yn derbyn yr wybodaeth ddiweddaraf.

Bu twbercwlosis yn bresennol yn ein plith ers llawer o flynyddoedd a chaiff ei reoli gan nifer o fesurau: triniaeth brydlon ac effeithiol o achosion a nodir, yn enwedig os byddant yn heintus; archwiliad o'r rhai hynny a fu mewn cysylltiad ag achosion o TB; sgrinio'r rhai hynny sydd mewn perygl uchel, a rhaglen genedlaethol o frechiadau BCG mewn ysgolion. Mae brechiadau BCG yn helpu i atal TB ond dim ond mewn tua 70 y cant o achosion y mae'n effeithiol. Nid yw llawer o wledydd yn ei ddefnyddio oherwydd hynny.

Ar un adeg, bu twbercwlosis yn salwch cyffredin ac yn aml yn un marwol. Fodd bynnag, o ganlyniad i'r mesurau a amlinellwyd gennyf, mae nifer yr achosion wedi gostwng yn ddramatig. Weithiau ceir achosion o TB yn y gymuned ond gall gwrthfotigau ei drin. O gadw golwg ar afiechyd, dengys data y bu cynnydd bach o flwyddyn i flwyddyn yn yr achosion o TB yn y DU. Fodd bynnag, nid adlewyrchir y duedd hon yng Nghymru, ond rhaid inni fod yn wylidwrus.

Mae Cymru'n dibynnu ar drefniadau consortiwm gyda'r Adran Iechyd ar gyfer cyflenwad o'r brechiad. O ganlyniad i broblemau cynhyrchu difrifol, rhoddwyd y gorau i'r rhaglen frechu reolaidd mewn ysgolion yn y DU yn 1999. Cyn hynny, brechwyd tua 70 y cant o'r grŵp targed. Mae'n bleser gennyf ddatgan y cafodd yr anawsterau cyflenwi hynny eu datrys. Ar 24 Mawrth, cyhoeddwyd bod cyflenwadau digonol o frechiadau ar gael er mwyn dechrau ailgyflwyno'r rhaglen ysgolion. Derbyniodd yr awdurdodau iechyd

April.

gyflenwadau o frechiadau ar 16 Ebrill.

2:50 p.m.

Authorities are now planning the reintroduction programme in a way that best suits the individual requirements of their areas. The initial effort will be concentrated on pupils who may be leaving school this summer. We are aware that only a small window exists this term because pupils are approaching a busy examination period. Programmes will be carefully planned to avoid any disruption.

Bellach, mae'r awdurdodau yn cynllunio'r rhaglen ailgyflwyno yn y ffordd a fydd yn gweddu orau i ofynion unigol eu hardaloedd. Bydd yr ymdrech gychwynnol yn canolbwyntio ar ddisgyblion sydd yn debygol o adael yr ysgol yn yr haf eleni. Yr ydym yn ymwybodol mai prin fydd y cyfle y tymor hwn oherwydd bod y disgyblion yn nesáu at gyfnod prysur o arholiadau. Cynllunnir rhaglenni yn ofalus er mwyn osgoi tarfu ar waith disgyblion.

In view of the local situation, Gwent Health Authority has decided to offer the vaccine to pupils in Duffryn High School first because of the incidence at the school. This will not have any effect on other health authority plans. There are no specific implications for the reintroduction programme across Wales as a result of the Duffryn High School outbreak.

O gofio'r sefyllfa leol, mae Awdurdod Iechyd Gwent wedi penderfynu cynnig y brechiad i'r disgyblion yn Ysgol Uwchradd Duffryn yn gyntaf oherwydd yr achosion a gafwyd yn yr ysgol. Ni fydd hyn yn effeithio mewn unrhyw ffordd ar gynlluniau eraill yr awdurdod iechyd. Ni cheir unrhyw oblygiadau penodol ar gyfer y rhaglen ailgyflwyno ar draws Cymru o ganlyniad i'r achosion yn Ysgol Uwchradd Duffryn.

Further supplies of BCG vaccine are expected in the autumn to enable health authorities to restart the routine immunisation programme in schools. Tuberculosis is a disease that can be conquered, but we must ensure that we maintain our guard. The new effort to immunise will be an important contribution to doing so.

Disgwylir cyflenwadau pellach o frechiad BCG yn yr hydref er mwyn galluogi awdurdodau iechyd i ailgychwyn y rhaglen imiwneiddio rheolaidd yn yr ysgolion. Mae twbercwlosis yn glefyd y gellir ei drechu, ond rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod ar ein gwyliadwriaeth. Bydd yr ymdrech newydd i imiwneiddio yn gyfraniad pwysig at sicrhau hynny.

David Melding: I thank the Minister for her statement. It is clear that modern society poses some challenges in the treatment of TB that were not wholly anticipated. Even though people think that TB has been conquered, that is clearly not the case. Many people travel great distances on business or for pleasure, and there is a chance that they will pick up infection when abroad. We also have a multicultural society with many links to nations all over the world that could give a window of opportunity for this disease and for people to carry the infection. These different needs have to be addressed, and we have to take stock of what a modern society needs in TB prevention. The treatment is successful but long, and potentially troublesome. It is not something to which we

David Melding: Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei datganiad. Mae'n amlwg bod sialensau o fewn cymdeithas fodern wrth drin TB nas rhagwelwyd yn llawn. Er bod pobl o'r farn y trechwyd TB, mae'n amlwg nad yw hynny'n wir. Mae llawer o bobl yn teithio yn bell iawn ar fusnes neu ar wyliau, ac mae'n bosibl y byddant yn magu haint pan fyddant dramor. Yn ogystal, yr ydym yn byw mewn cymdeithas amlddiwylliannol gyda llawer o gysylltiadau â chenhedloedd ar draws y byd a allai roi cyfle i'r clefyd hwn ymledu ac i bobl gludo'r haint. Mae angen mynd i'r afael â'r anghenion gwahanol hyn, ac mae angen inni ystyried beth sydd ei angen ar gymdeithas fodern er mwyn atal TB. Mae'r driniaeth yn llwyddiannus ond yn hir, ac yn gallu bod yn drafferthus. Nid yw'n rhywbeth y dymunwn i

want to subject people if it can possibly be avoided. We do need to consider widespread vaccination again. One of the troublesome aspects of this case is that it is a cluster and, as such, it is a serious event to which we must respond with great vigour.

Jane Hutt: I agree with you that it is important that we conquer this disease and take all possible measures to prevent it and to treat it. In dealing with TB in the past, a great deal was done as a result of improving housing and the conditions in which people live. Antibiotic treatment has transformed the incidence of TB. We also know that social deprivation may have a role in this, and we need to be vigilant in that respect in terms of our health and social policies.

With regard to the issues that you raise, it is important that all health authorities adhere to screening guidelines in relation to people travelling abroad and returning to this country. It is important that that point is clarified today. We must ensure that the vaccination programme proceeds. The vaccine supply is here, but we must recognise that it has only a 70 per cent success rate.

Rosemary Butler: As the Member for Newport West, where Duffryn High School is located, I thank you for your statement. David Melding made the point that this is a nasty disease, and although it is curable, we must do everything that we can to prevent our children from contracting it. I am pleased that the routine BCG schools programme is to be reintroduced.

I pay tribute this afternoon to the way the school in Newport has handled this case. It is a model to be used, were we to have another outbreak. I mention the local authority, the public health authority, the school, particularly the governors and the headteacher, the parents who have been incredibly responsible in not keeping their children from the school, and the pupils themselves. Children can be boisterous and a little naughty, but I was impressed with how responsible they were on this occasion. They knew how serious the situation was. I also pay tribute to the local media. They did not

bofl ei ddiodef os gellir ei osgoi. Mae angen inni ystyried brechu cyffredin unwaith eto. Un o agweddau trafferthus yr achos hwn yw ei fod yn glwstwr ac, o ganlyniad, mae'n ddigwyddiad difrifol y dylem ymateb iddo ar frys.

Jane Hutt: Cytunaf â chi bod angen inni drechu'r clefyd hwn a chymryd pob cam posibl i'w atal a'i drin. Wrth ddelio â TB yn y gorffennol, gwnaethpwyd cryn dipyn o ganlyniad i wella tai ac amodau byw pobl. Mae triniaeth drwy wrthfotigau wedi trawsnewid nifer yr achosion o TB. Gwyddom hefyd fod gan amddifadedd cymdeithasol, o bosibl, rôl yn hyn o beth, a rhaid inni fod yn effro i hynny, o ran ein polisiau iechyd a chymdeithasol.

O ran y materion a godwyd gennych, mae'n bwysig bod pob awdurdod iechyd yn glynu wrth ganllawiau sgrinio mewn perthynas â phobl sydd yn teithio dramor ac yn dychwelyd i'r wlad hon. Mae'n bwysig y caiff y pwynt hwnnw ei egluro heddiw. Mae'n rhaid inni sicrhau bod y rhaglen frechu yn mynd yn ei blaen. Mae'r cyflenwad o frechiadau wedi cyrraedd, ond dylem gydnabod mai dim ond 70 y cant yw ei gyfradd llwyddiant.

Rosemary Butler: Fel yr Aelod dros Orllewin Casnewydd, ble y lleolir Ysgol Uwchradd Duffryn, diolchaf am eich datganiad. Cyfeiriodd David Melding at y ffaith ei fod yn glefyd creulon ac, er bod modd ei drin, rhaid inni wneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i atal ein plant rhag dal y clefyd. Yr wyf yn falch y caiff y rhaglen BCG i ysgolion ei hailgyflwyno.

Talaf deyrnged y prynhawn yma i'r ffordd yr ymdriniodd yr ysgol yng Nghasnewydd â'r achos hwn. Pe bai unrhyw achosion eraill yn digwydd, dylid dilyn y model hwnnw. Crybwyllaf yr awdurdod lleol, yr awdurdod iechyd cyhoeddus, yr ysgol, yn enwedig y llywodraethwyr a'r pennaeth, y rhieni a fu'n arbennig o gyfrifol wrth beidio â chadw eu plant o'r ysgol, a'r disgyblion eu hunain. Gall plant fod yn swnllyd ac yn ddrygionus ar adegau, ond yr oeddwn yn llawn edmygedd wrth weld pa mor gyfrifol y buont ar yr achlysur hwn. Yr oeddent yn ymwybodol o ddifrifoldeb y sefyllfa. Talaf deyrnged hefyd

hype this up. They reported it responsibly. If it does happen again, the Duffryn High School model should be implemented throughout Wales.

Jane Hutt: I am glad that you have made that statement as the local Assembly Member. You are closely involved in it and have seen the good co-operation and collaboration in that community between all the authorities. A multi-agency approach is needed to ensure that this is handled effectively. It is a model. We talked earlier about situations and outbreaks that, as David Melding said, we do not wish to have to handle. When they come upon us we must ensure that good communication results in action and that it is handled sensitively. We must recognise that the local media has been sensitive and responsible, and has taken the right action in terms of prevention, screening and reassuring parents, children, and the wider community.

David Lloyd: Datganaf fuddiant fel meddyg teulu. Croesawn y datganiad a'r gwaith clodwiw sydd wedi cael ei wneud yng nghyffiniau Casnewydd i ddelio â'r mater hwn.

Tuberculosis has never gone away. That is my fundamental point, and questions arise from it. Every year in practice there would be one or two cases, and over the years the BCG vaccination programme has lapsed as TB has fallen out of the national consciousness. TB is also a poverty indicator, as it preferentially, though not exclusively, preys on poorer communities. Recent reports, as we have heard, indicate that poverty remains significant in Wales and the UK. What are you doing, therefore, to highlight the serious health impacts of poverty? Do you agree that tackling poverty is fundamental to eradicating diseases such as TB?

Jane Hutt: As I said, the origins of tuberculosis and many other diseases have been tackled. However, we must recognise that poverty and social deprivation still exist, and we must ensure that we learn lessons as a result of the kind of situation that has

i'r cyfryngau lleol. Ni wnaethant fôr a mynydd o'r sefyllfa. Cyflwynwyd adroddiadau mewn ffordd gyfrifol. Os digwydd hyn eto, dylid gweithredu model Ysgol Uwchradd Duffryn ledled Cymru.

Jane Hutt: Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi gwneud y datganiad hwnnw fel Aelod lleol y Cynulliad. Mae gennych gysylltiad agos â'r digwyddiad a gwelsoch y cydweithrediad da yn y gymuned honno rhwng yr holl awdurdodau. Mae angen ymagwedd aml-asiantaethol er mwyn sicrhau yr ymdrinnir â hyn yn effeithiol. Mae'n fodel. Trafodasom sefyllfaoedd ac achosion yn gynharach, fel y dywedodd David Melding, na ddymunwn y bydd yn rhaid inni ymdrin â hwy. Pan ddaw'r achosion ar ein pennau, rhaid inni sicrhau bod cyfathrebu da yn arwain at weithredu ac yr ymdrinnir yn sensitif â'r sefyllfa. Rhaid inni gydnabod y bu'r cyfryngau lleol yn sensitif ac yn gyfrifol, a chymerasant y camau cywir o ran atal, sgrinio a rhoi sicrwydd i rieni, plant, a'r gymuned gyfan.

David Lloyd: I declare an interest as a general practitioner. We welcome the statement and the commendable work that has been done in the Newport area to deal with this issue.

Nid yw twbercwlosis erioed wedi diflannu. Dyna yw fy mhwynt sylfaenol, a deillia cwestiynau o'r ffaith honno. Bob blwyddyn, byddwn, fel meddyg, yn dod ar draws un neu ddau achos, ac ar hyd y blynyddoedd dirywiodd y rhaglen frechu BCG wrth i TB dreiglo o'r ymwybyddiaeth genedlaethol. Mae TB hefyd yn arwydd o dlodi, oherwydd ceir y rhan fwyaf o achosion, ond nid yr unig rai, yn y cymunedau tlotaf. Mae adroddiadau diweddar, fel y clywsom, yn nodi bod tlodi yn parhau yn sylweddol yng Nghymru ac yn y DU. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud, felly, er mwyn amlygu effeithiau difrifol tlodi ar iechyd? Oni gytunwch bod mynd i'r afael â thlodi yn hanfodol er mwyn dileu clefydau megis TB?

Jane Hutt: Fel y dywedais, aethpwyd i'r afael â tharddiad twbercwlosis a llawer o glefydau eraill. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gydnabod bod tlodi ac amddifadedd cymdeithasol yn bodoli o hyd, a rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn dysgu gwersi o ganlyniad

emerged in Newport. Our ambition to tackle poverty and inequality is high on my agenda. Our targeting health inequalities fund may have a role to play as far as this is concerned. It is also about working together with our partners in local government who have an influence on public health and on tackling poverty and inequality. Our local health alliances are well placed. The ambitions of Improving Health in Wales, where we are working much closer with local government and with communities through Communities First, will help us to tackle poverty, as you described. In Wales, we could perhaps pioneer an understanding of how we should tackle the conditions that unfortunately allow diseases such as tuberculosis to emerge.

William Graham: Regarding the TB outbreak at Duffryn High School, this was communicated by an adult strain, and then communicated to children. There is now, hopefully, little prospect of further infection. I join my colleague in paying tribute to the headmaster, Mr David Snashall, and the community health physicians who have a major task—there are some 1,200 pupils in this school and 110 staff. The importance of screening cannot be over emphasised. Will you join me once again in emphasising to parents and pupils the importance of attendance at school and carrying out the accepted procedures for screening?

Jane Hutt: That follows on from Rosemary's point about how the school has pulled together with the community, through the leadership of the headteacher and his staff. It was helpful that that school went back straight after the Easter break. In other parts of Wales, schools did not go back until a week later, but Duffryn High School was ready and prepared, and pupils came back. That was the most important thing—those pupils came back on the first day of term and were willingly involved in the screening, as was the staff. Everything possible that could be done has been done as a result of how this has been handled. That is also a lesson for us in this Assembly—we need to be sensitive and responsible about how we respond to

i'r math o sefyllfa a gafwyd yng Nghasnewydd. Mae ein huchelgais i fynd i'r afael â thlodi ac anghydraddoldeb yn uchel ar fy agenda. Mae'n debyg y bydd gan ein cronfa targedu anghydraddoldebau iechyd rôl i'w chwarae o ran hynny. Mae'n ymwneud hefyd â chydweithio â'n partneriaid mewn llywodraeth leol a all ddylanwadu ar iechyd cyhoeddus ac ar fynd i'r afael â thlodi ac anghydraddoldeb. Mae ein cynghreiriau iechyd lleol mewn sefyllfa dda. Bydd dyheadau Gwella Iechyd yng Nghymru, lle yr ydym yn gweithio'n llawer agosach â llywodraeth leol a chyda chymunedau drwy Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf, yn ein helpu i fynd i'r afael â thlodi, fel y disgrifiwyd gennych. Yng Nghymru, gallem, o bosibl, greu dealltwriaeth newydd o'r modd y dylem fynd i'r afael â'r amodau sydd, yn anffodus, yn caniatáu i glefydau megis twbercwlosis ymddangos.

William Graham: O ran yr achos o TB yn Ysgol Uwchradd Duffryn, trosglwyddwyd hwn gan feirws oedolion, a drosglwyddwyd i blant yn dilyn hynny. Bellach, prin, gobeithio, yw'r cyfle o heintio pellach. Ymunaf â'm cyd-Aelod wrth dalu teyrnged i'r pennaeth, Mr David Snashall, a'r meddygon iechyd cymunedol sydd â thasg enfawr—mae tua 1,200 o ddisgyblion yn yr ysgol hon a 110 o staff. Ni ellir gorbwysleisio pwysigrwydd sgrinio. A ymunwch â mi unwaith eto i bwysleisio i rieni a disgyblion bwysigrwydd mynychu'r ysgol a chyflawni'r gweithdrefnau derbyniol ar gyfer sgrinio?

Jane Hutt: Mae hynny'n dilyn pwynt Rosemary ynglŷn â'r ffordd y cydweithiodd yr ysgol gyda'r gymuned, drwy arweinyddiaeth y pennaeth a'r staff. Yr oedd o gymorth bod yr ysgol wedi mynd yn ôl yn syth ar ôl gwyliau'r Pasg. Mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru, ni ddychwelodd ysgolion tan wythnos yn ddiweddarach, ond roedd Ysgol Uwchradd Duffryn yn barod ac wedi paratoi, a daeth y disgyblion yn ôl. Dyna'r peth pwysicaf—aeth y disgyblion hynny yn ôl ar ddiwrnod cyntaf y tymor ac roeddent yn barod i gymryd rhan yn y sgrinio, fel yr oedd y staff hefyd. Gwnaethpwyd popeth posibl o ganlyniad i'r ffordd yr ymdriniwyd â'r sefyllfa hon. Mae honno hefyd yn wers inni yn y Cynulliad hwn—rhaid inni fod yn

such incidents.

Kirsty Williams: Can you confirm that the problems that have been experienced in acquiring stocks of vaccine have now fundamentally been overcome and that we will not find ourselves in a situation of beginning what is a welcome return to a comprehensive programme only to find that that has to stop again because of difficulties in supply? Will you consider the need for a wider screening programme throughout Wales, to include people who have visited or lived abroad in poorer regions of the world where there is a high incidence of TB? Communities that often experience difficulties in accessing primary healthcare must also be targeted with information on TB and its symptoms, so that they can be encouraged, should anyone show any signs of the disease, to proactively seek medical advice and treatment before the disease is passed on to other members of the community.

3:00 p.m.

Jane Hutt: I can assure you that supplies of the vaccine are available from the manufacturers. Unfortunately, we were forced to suspend the schools vaccination programme in September 1999 because of severe manufacturing problems. At that time we had a sole UK licence for the vaccine. The Department of Health has now ensured that we can source sufficient amounts of vaccine to fully restart the programme without further disruption. The supplies of vaccine came through in April and more will be available in July. We will ensure, as the Department of Health will, that we have a supplier, and the fact that we now have a new supplier is good news.

It is also important that health authorities are vigilant in terms of the screening guidance that they issue, particularly in relation to people who travel a great deal for work or for other purposes. Social deprivation, as Dai Lloyd and others have said, is also a factor. There are always lessons to be learnt as a result of these situations. We may all have to talk to public health officials and health authority colleagues to see whether

sensitif ac yn gyfrifol yn ein hymateb i ddigwyddiadau o'r fath.

Kirsty Williams: A allwch gadarnhau y goresgynnwyd y problemau a gafwyd wrth gael gafael ar gyflenwadau o frechiadau fwy neu lai, bellach, ac na fyddwn yn ein cael ein hunain mewn sefyllfa lle y byddwn yn dychwelyd yn synhwyrol i raglen gynhwysfawr, dim ond i ganfod bod yn rhaid ei hatal unwaith eto oherwydd anawsterau cyflenwadau? A wnewch chi ystyried yr angen am raglen sgrinio ehangach ledled Cymru, i gynnwys pobl a ymwelodd neu a fu'n byw dramor yn rhannau tlotach y byd lle ceir nifer o achosion o TB? Yn ogystal, dylid targedu cymunedau sydd yn aml yn profi anawsterau wrth asesu gofal iechyd sylfaenol drwy ddarparu gwybodaeth ar TB a'i symptomau, fel y gellir eu hannog, os bydd unrhyw un yn dangos arwyddion o'r clefyd, i ofyn am gyngor a thriniaeth feddygol yn rhagweithiol cyn y trosglwyddir y clefyd i aelodau eraill o'r gymuned.

Jane Hutt: Gallaf eich sicrhau bod cyflenwadau o'r brechiad ar gael gan y cynhyrchwyr. Yn anffodus, fe'n gorfodwyd i ohirio rhaglen frechu'r ysgolion ym Medi 1999 o ganlyniad i broblemau cynhyrchu difrifol. Ar yr adeg honno, ni oedd â'r unig drwydded yn y DU ar gyfer y brechiad. Bellach mae'r Adran Iechyd wedi sicrhau y gallwn gael cyflenwadau digonol o frechiadau er mwyn ailgychwyn y rhaglen yn llawn heb ymyrraeth bellach. Daeth y cyflenwadau yn Ebrill a bydd mwy ar gael yng Ngorffennaf. Byddwn yn sicrhau, fel y gwna'r Adran Iechyd, y bydd gennym gyflenwr, ac mae'r ffaith bod gennym gyflenwr newydd bellach yn newyddion da.

Mae hefyd yn bwysig bod awdurdodau iechyd yn effro o ran y canllawiau sgrinio a gyhoeddir ganddynt, yn arbennig mewn perthynas â phobl sydd yn teithio cryn bellter fel rhan o'u gwaith neu at ddibenion eraill. Mae amddifadedd cymdeithasol, fel y dywedodd Dai Lloyd ac eraill, hefyd yn ffactor. Bydd gwersi i'w dysgu o hyd o ganlyniad i'r sefyllfaoedd hyn. Mae'n bosibl y bydd yn rhaid inni oll siarad â swyddogion

something can be done. As I said to Dai, we must look at the whole picture of how we tackle poverty and social deprivation, and identify any gaps that may exist.

Rod Richards: Does the Minister for Health and Social Services recall a discussion I had with her and her deputy over a year ago about the increase in the incidence of TB in this country? Does she recall my subsequent question to the First Minister on this issue? Does she recall the questions about this issue that I tabled at that time? Does she recall that I drew to her attention, over a year ago, that health authorities in Wales were pursuing a policy different to that in England? Notwithstanding the shortage of BCG vaccine, health authorities were pursuing a non-immunising policy in Wales. She knew about this a year ago because I told her. However, she has done nothing about it. What has she done about the Department of Health's monitoring committee, on which—as her written answer to a question of mine tells me—Wales does not have a representative? What has the Minister for Health and Social Services been doing for the last 12 months since I first drew her attention to this matter?

Jane Hutt: I acknowledge that you drew my attention to this matter, Rod, as well as that of my deputy at the time. I agreed to consider the situation. My statement and responses today have identified the action taken by health authorities and the Assembly in partnership with the Department of Health. As I have stated and explained to you, the supplies of vaccine were not available. As a result of the Department of Health's search for new suppliers, supplies became available, which we now have. That is the important message that we must send out today.

It was the South Glamorgan Health Authority, during the last Conservative Government, Rod, that decided to stop routine immunisation in 1989. It is important to note that health authorities in Wales did not want to stop immunisation, and when vaccine supplies became available, those

iechyd cyhoeddus a chyd-weithwyr yn yr awdurdod ieched er mwyn gweld a ellir gwneud rhywbeth. Fel y dywedais wrth Dai, dylem edrych ar y darlun cyflawn ynglŷn â sut yr awn i'r afael â thlodi ac amddifadedd cymdeithasol, a nodi unrhyw fylchau a allai fodoli.

Rod Richards: A yw'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn cofio'r drafodaeth a gefais gyda hi a'i dirprwy dros flwyddyn yn ôl ynglŷn â'r cynnydd yn nifer yr achosion o TB yn y wlad hon? A yw'n cofio fy nghwestiwn dilynol i'r Prif Weinidog ar y mater hwn? A yw'n cofio'r cwestiynau ynglŷn â'r mater hwn a gyflwynais yr adeg honno? A yw'n cofio imi dynnu ei sylw, dros flwyddyn yn ôl, at y ffaith bod awdurdodau ieched yng Nghymru yn dilyn polisi gwahanol i un Lloegr? Er gwaethaf prinder y brechiadau BCG, roedd awdurdodau ieched yn dilyn polisi o beidio ag imiwneiddio yng Nghymru. Gwyddai am hyn flwyddyn yn ôl oherwydd dywedais wrthi. Fodd bynnag, ni wnaeth unrhyw beth ynglŷn â'r sefyllfa. Beth a wnaeth ynglŷn â phwyllgor monitro'r Adran Iechyd, nad oes gan Gymru—fel y noda ei hateb ysgrifenedig i gwestiwn gennyf i—gynrychiolydd? Beth y bu'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn ei wneud am y 12 mis diwethaf ers imi dynnu ei sylw at y mater hwn am y tro cyntaf?

Jane Hutt: Cydnabyddaf i chi dynnu fy sylw at y mater hwn, Rod, yn ogystal â'm dirprwy ar y pryd. Cytunais i ystyried y mater. Mae fy natganiad a'm hymatebion heddiw wedi nodi'r camau a gymerwyd gan awdurdodau ieched a'r Cynulliad mewn partneriaeth â'r Adran Iechyd. Fel y datganais ac yr eglurais i chi, nid oedd cyflenwadau'r brechiadau ar gael. O ganlyniad i waith yr Adran Iechyd yn chwilio am gyflenwyr newydd, daeth cyflenwadau, ac mae'r rhain gennym yn awr. Dyna'r neges bwysig y mae'n rhaid inni ei hanfon allan heddiw.

Penderfyniad Awdurdod Iechyd De Morgannwg, yn ystod y Llywodraeth Geidwadol ddiwethaf, Rod, oedd rhoi'r gorau i imiwneiddio rheolaidd yn 1989. Mae'n bwysig nodi nad oedd yr awdurdodau ieched yng Nghymru am roi'r gorau i imiwneiddio, a phan ddaeth cyflenwadau ar gael, daeth yr

authorities came together again to plan their programme for schools. That is the sort of responsible information that the Assembly should provide for the people of Wales. I acknowledge, Rod, that we must ensure that we are represented at monitoring committees and are closely linked with the Department of Health. That function is carried out by the Chief Medical Officer for Wales, who also ensures that we are up-to-date, well-briefed, receiving sufficient supplies of vaccine and are monitoring its impact.

Brian Hancock: I declare an interest as a former governor of a Newport school, vice-chair of the Newport Association of School Governors and a non-voting member of Newport Education Committee.

Thank you for the statement, Minister. I would like to know about the length of the vaccination programme, and its flexibility, bearing in mind that you say in your statement that this is an examination period where students are perhaps leaving school. I would also like to know what risk assessment, if any, has been carried out of this disease becoming even more widespread throughout Wales.

Jane Hutt: As I said, the schools programme is commencing and Duffryn High School is looking at those leaving the school at this examination period. There are some who do not know whether they will be returning for another year. It is important that all schools in Wales now implement the programme with the vaccine supplies that have been made available. We must ensure—as has been done in Newport—that this does not disrupt a difficult time in terms of examinations and so on. We must also recognise that the efficacy of the BCG vaccine is between 70 and 80 per cent. It gives protection for 15 years, and I expect that all of us here have probably benefited from the BCG vaccination.

Geraint Davies: In view of the close link between TB and deprivation and poverty, do you agree that it is important to know exactly where this disease occurs? Can you explain the policy of Bro Taf Health Authority during the Rhondda Cynon Taff outbreak last year

awdurdodau hynny at ei gilydd unwaith eto i gynllunio eu rhaglen ar gyfer ysgolion. Dyna'r math o wybodaeth gyfrifol y dylai'r Cynulliad ei darparu ar gyfer pobl Cymru. Cydnabyddaf, Rod, fod yn rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn cael ein cynrychioli mewn pwyllgorau monitro ac y cynhaliwn gysylltiad agos â'r Adran Iechyd. Cyflawnir y swyddogaeth honno gan Brif Swyddog Meddygol Cymru, sydd hefyd yn sicrhau y cawn yr wybodaeth ddiweddaraf, y derbyniwn gyflenwadau digonol o frechiadau a'n bod yn monitro ei effaith.

Brian Hancock: Datganaf fuddiant fel cyn lywodraethwr mewn ysgol yng Nghasnewydd, is-gadeirydd Cymdeithas Llywodraethwyr Ysgol Casnewydd ac aelod dibleidlais o Bwyllgor Addysg Casnewydd.

Diolch am y datganiad, Weinidog. Hoffwn wybod am hyd y rhaglen frechu, a'i hyblygrwydd, gan gadw mewn cof y dywedwch yn eich datganiad bod hwn yn gyfnod arholiadau lle bydd myfyrwyr, o bosibl, yn gadael yr ysgol. Hoffwn wybod hefyd pa waith asesu risgiau, os bu unrhyw waith, a gyflawnwyd ynglŷn ag ymlediad y clefyd hwn hyd yn oed yn ehangach ledled Cymru.

Jane Hutt: Fel y dywedais, mae'r rhaglen ysgolion yn cychwyn ac mae Ysgol Uwchradd Duffryn yn edrych ar y rhai hynny sydd yn gadael yr ysgol yn ystod y cyfnod hwn o arholiadau. Mae rhai disgyblion nad ydynt yn gwybod a fyddant yn dychwelyd am flwyddyn arall. Mae'n bwysig bod pob ysgol yng Nghymru bellach yn gweithredu'r rhaglen gyda'r cyflenwadau o frechiadau sydd ar gael. Mae'n rhaid inni sicrhau—fel y gwnaethpwyd yng Nghasnewydd—na fydd hyn yn amharu ar gyfnod anodd o ran arholiadau ac ati. Dylem gydnabod hefyd bod effeithiolrwydd y brechiad BCG rhwng 70 ac 80 y cant. Mae'n rhoi diogelwch am 15 mlynedd, a disgwyliaf ein bod oll yma wedi elwa o'r brechiad BCG.

Geraint Davies: O ystyried y cysylltiad agos rhwng TB ac amddifadedd a thlodi, a gytunwch ei fod yn bwysig gwybod ble yn union y digwydd y clefyd hwn? A allwch egluro polisi Awdurdod Iechyd Bro Taf yn ystod yr achosion yn Rhondda Cynon Taf y

of not ascertaining exactly in which wards the disease occurred? It said that that was done on the grounds of confidentiality. That was something I could not understand. As a Member, I would like to know exactly where there were cases of the disease in my constituency.

Jane Hutt: That goes back to the difficult balance we have to strike between handling a situation like this sensitively and responsibly, raising public awareness in the communities affected, and also respecting confidentiality. In your professional capacity, that is something that you will understand. In relation to the situation in Rhondda Cynon Taff and the Bro Taf Health Authority, it was important that the cases were handled sensitively. It goes back to the point made by Rosemary Butler, that there are lessons to be learned about the way this has been handled in Newport. I will undertake to ensure that that does happen. This will ensure that in future, health authorities take the same route in terms of respecting confidentiality for individuals concerned and their families and also raising appropriate awareness, ensuring that people are aware of screening opportunities. When we go down the route of vaccination, we must encourage full take-up.

llynedd o beidio â chanfod ym mha wardiau yn union y digwyddodd yr haint? Dywedwyd y gwnaethpwyd hynny ar sail cyfrinachedd. Yr oedd hwnnw'n rhywbeth na allwn ei ddeall. Fel Aelod, hoffwn wybod ble yn union y cafwyd achosion o'r clefyd yn fy etholaeth.

Jane Hutt: Mae hynny'n mynd yn ôl at y cydbwysedd anodd sydd yn rhaid inni ei sefydlu rhwng delio â sefyllfa fel hon yn sensitif ac yn gyfrifol, codi ymwybyddiaeth y cyhoedd yn y cymunedau yr effeithir arnynt, a hefyd barchu cyfrinachedd. Yn rhinwedd eich swydd, mae hynny'n rhywbeth y byddwch yn ei ddeall. O ran y sefyllfa yn Rhondda Cynon Taf ac Awdurdod Iechyd Bro Taf, roedd yn bwysig ymdrin â'r achosion yn sensitif. Mae'n dychwelyd at y pwynt a wnaethpwyd gan Rosemary Butler, bod gwersi i'w dysgu ynglŷn â'r ffordd yr ymdriniwyd â'r sefyllfa hon yng Nghasnewydd. Bwriadaf sicrhau bod hyn yn digwydd. Bydd hyn yn sicrhau y bydd awdurdodau iechyd, yn y dyfodol, yn dilyn yr un trywydd o ran parchu cyfrinachedd ar gyfer yr unigolion dan sylw a'u teuluoedd a hefyd yn codi ymwybyddiaeth briodol, gan sicrhau bod pobl yn ymwybodol o'r cyfleoedd sgrinio. Pan awn ar hyd trywydd brechiadau, rhaid inni sicrhau bod pawb yn cymryd rhan.

Datganiad ar Glwy'r Traed a'r Genau Statement on Foot and Mouth Disease

The Minister for Rural Affairs (Carwyn Jones): As at 11 a.m. today, there are 83 cases of foot and mouth disease in Wales and 5 slaughtered-on-suspicion cases. To date, some 313,000 sheep, cattle and pigs have been culled as a consequence of foot and mouth disease. This cull total includes 280,000 sheep, and over 700 farms have been affected. In addition, the Intervention Board is operating the welfare disposal scheme.

Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Carwyn Jones): Am 11 a.m. heddiw, mae 83 o achosion o glwy'r traed a'r genau yng Nghymru a 5 achos o ladd ar sail amheuaeth. Hyd yn hyn, cafodd tua 313,000 o ddefaid, gwartheg a moch eu difa o ganlyniad i glwy'r traed a'r genau. Mae cyfanswm y difa hwn yn cynnwys 280,000 o ddefaid, ac effeithiwyd ar fwy na 700 o ffermydd. Yn ogystal, mae'r Bwrdd Ymyrraeth yn gweithredu'r cynllun lles-gwaredu.

There have been several developments since my last statement. The Agriculture and Rural Development Committee has met, and there has been a joint meeting with the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee. The Chair of the Health and

Bu nifer o ddatblygiadau ers fy natganiad diwethaf. Mae'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig wedi cyfarfod, a bu cyfarfod ar y cyd â Phwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth. Gwahoddwyd Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a

Social Services Committee, Kirsty Williams, was invited, and was present. I have held several meetings with local interest groups relating to their concerns about the use of the Eppynt site. On the Intervention Board's welfare disposal scheme, I have met with local authority representatives and community interest groups about the use of landfill sites for disposal of the carcasses of animals that do not have foot and mouth disease.

Where disease occurs, we have adopted a firm policy to meet the 24-hour and 48-hour targets on culling animals. I am pleased to report that, as of a week last Sunday, there is no backlog on the contiguous cull. That reflects the enormous amount of work put in by the Welsh operations team, including staff from the Assembly, the State Veterinary Service and the Army. I thank them all for their dedication.

3:10 p.m.

Some of the most difficult issues have been those surrounding the disposal of carcasses. They were discussed with the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee last week. I have announced that we have no plans to dispose of any more animals at the Eppynt site unless the circumstances of the disease in Wales take a significant turn for the worse. There is no sign of that happening at present, thankfully. Animals already at the site are being burnt and I expect the burning to be completed by early next week. As Members know, there was a problem in the pit when leachate was found to be escaping into nearby land. We took immediate and decisive action to control the problem, which was quickly brought under control. A consultant hydro-geologist was engaged who advised on several remedial measures, all of which were put in place. I clarify that the level of ammonia in the nearby watercourse was just above the drinking water standard for one day only.

I assure Members that water and air quality at Eppynt is being monitored in line with the Department of Health guidance. The Food Standards Agency is also working with the

Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, Kirsty Williams, ac yr oedd yn bresennol. Cynhaliais nifer o gyfarfodydd â grwpiau lleol sydd â diddordeb mewn perthynas â'u pryderon ynglŷn â defnyddio safle Epynt. O ran y cynllun lles-gwaredu, cyfarfûm â chynrychiolwyr awdurdodau lleol a grwpiau cymuned sydd â diddordeb ynglŷn â defnyddio safleoedd tirlenwi i waredu carcasau anifeiliaid nad ydynt yn dioddef o glwy'r traed a'r genau.

Pan fydd achos o'r clwyf yn codi, mabwysiadwn bolisi cadarn i gyrraedd y targedau 24 awr a 48 awr ar ddifa anifeiliaid. Yr wyf yn falch o nodi, ers wythnos i ddydd Sul diwethaf, nad oes ôl-groniad o ran gwaith difa ar ffermydd cyffiniol. Mae hynny'n adlewyrchu'r gwaith mawr a wnaethpwyd gan dîm gweithrediadau Cymru, gan gynnwys staff o'r Cynulliad, y Gwasanaeth Milfeddygol Gwladol a'r Fyddin. Diolchaf i bob un ohonynt am eu hymroddiad.

Rhai o'r materion anoddaf oedd y rhai a oedd yn ymwneud â gwaredu carcasau. Fe'u trafodwyd gyda Phwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth yr wythnos diwethaf. Cyhoeddais nad oes gennym unrhyw gynlluniau i waredu rhagor o anifeiliaid ar safle Epynt oni fydd amgylchiadau'r clwyf yng Nghymru yn gwaethygu'n sylweddol. Nid oes unrhyw arwydd o hynny ar hyn o bryd, diolch byth. Caiff anifeiliaid sydd eisoes ar y safle eu llosgi a disgwyliaf i'r llosgi ddod i ben yn gynnar yr wythnos nesaf. Fel y gŵyr yr Aelodau, bu problem yn y pydew pan ddarganfuwyd trwytholch yn treiddio i dir cyfagos. Cymerasom gamau pendant ac ar unwaith i reoli'r broblem, a chafwyd rheolaeth ar y mater yn fuan. Cyflogwyd hydro-ddaearegwr ymgynghorol a roddodd gyngor ar nifer o fesurau adferol, a rhoddwyd pob un ohonynt ar waith. Egluraf mai ychydig yn uwch na safon dŵr yfed oedd lefel yr amonia yn y ddyfrffos gyfagos am un diwrnod yn unig.

Rhoddef sicrwydd i'r Aelodau fod ansawdd y dŵr a'r aer yn Epynt yn cael ei fonitro yn unol ag arweiniad yr Adran Iechyd. Mae'r Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd yn gweithio hefyd

Environment Agency and local authorities to monitor the effects of pyres. The Health Authority is also much involved. There has also been some speculation about the Cefn Golog site in north Powys. Preparations to use the site were on a contingency basis only. Like Eppynt, Cefn Golog would only be utilised if a disposal need arose from a significant increase in confirmed disease outbreaks. That is not the case at present and let us hope that it remains that way.

It is right that I mention events at Buttington Hall. The original decision to bury on the farm was taken by the book, in consultation with the relevant agencies. Buttington Hall was an infected farm and the carcasses could not be taken to Eppynt for disposal or to an approved landfill site. Capacity was not available for rendering. The Environment Agency advised that burning on the farm was inappropriate, given the proximity to habitation and the main road. There was no alternative therefore at that time but to bury sheep on the farm. The site for the burial was chosen in consultation with the Environment Agency. However, late last week, problems emerged. Assessments from the local authority and the health authority confirmed the earlier decision not to burn the carcasses on site. However, disposal will be by means of a mobile incinerator, which has been made available to us now and will be arriving on the farm today. Once site preparations have been completed, incineration will be initiated. That will take a couple of days and we hope to start tomorrow.

I am conscious that the movement restrictions on animals continues to cause difficulties for farmers. Some further flexibilities have been introduced to allow movement in recognition of animal husbandry needs. Within infected areas, animals can now move for slaughter. My officials are in negotiation with MAFF for the introduction of a Wales specific policy to relax movement restrictions as they currently apply to common land. I expect an announcement on that soon. Officials continue to press for action on artificial insemination and the movement of bulls. We

gydag Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd ac awdurdodau lleol i fonitro effeithiau'r coelcerthi. Mae'r Awdurdod Iechyd â rhan sylweddol yn y gwaith hwn hefyd. Bu rhywfaint o ddyfalu ynglŷn â safle Cefn Golog yng ngogledd Powys. Yr oedd y paratodau i ddefnyddio'r safle ar sail wrth gefn yn unig. Fel Epynt, dim ond os byddai angen gwaredu o ganlyniad i gynnydd sylweddol mewn achosion cadarnhaol o'r clwyf, y byddai angen defnyddio Cefn Golog. Nid felly y mae ar hyn o bryd a gobeithio y bydd yn parhau felly.

Mae'n iawn imi sôn am ddigwyddiadau yn Neuadd Buttington. Cymerwyd y penderfyniad gwreiddiol i gladdu ar y fferm gan ddilyn llythyren y ddeddf, drwy ymgynghori â'r asiantaethau perthnasol. Yr oedd Neuadd Buttington yn fferm heintus ac ni ellid mynd â'r carcasau i Epynt i'w gwaredu nac i safle tirlenwi cymeradwy. Nid oedd y gallu ar gael i rendro. Dywedodd Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd fod llosgi ar y fferm yn amhriodol, o gofio pa mor agos yr oedd i gartrefi a'r brif ffordd. Claddu'r defaid ar y fferm felly oedd yr unig ddewis amgen. Dewiswyd y safle ar gyfer claddu drwy ymgynghori ag Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd. Fodd bynnag, yn hwyr yr wythnos diwethaf, cododd problemau. Ategodd asesiadau gan yr awdurdod lleol a'r awdurdod iechyd y penderfyniad cynharach i beidio â llosgi'r carcasau ar y safle. Fodd bynnag, caiff yr anifeiliaid eu gwaredu drwy gyfrwng llosgydd symudol, sydd ar gael inni yn awr ac a fydd yn cyrraedd y fferm heddiw. Unwaith y cwblheir paratodau'r safle, bydd y gwaith llosgi yn dechrau. Cymer hynny ychydig o ddyddiau a gobeithiwn ddechrau yfory.

Yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod cyfyngiadau o ran symud anifeiliaid yn parhau i achosi anawsterau i ffermwyr. Cyflwynwyd mwy o hyblygrwydd i ganiatáu symud er mwyn cydnabod anghenion magu anifeiliaid. O fewn ardaloedd heintus, gall anifeiliaid symud yn awr i gael eu lladd. Mae fy swyddogion yn negodi â MAFF i gyflwyno polisi penodol i Gymru er mwyn llacio'r cyfyngiadau o ran symud fel y'u cymhwysir ar hyn o bryd i dir comin. Disgwyliaf gyhoeddiad ar hynny'n fuan. Mae swyddogion yn parhau i bwyso am weithredu

are also pressing for action on collection centres to be implemented. I am also aware of Members' concerns about the apparent difficulties with the livestock welfare disposal scheme operated by the Intervention Board. The Board has enlisted our assistance to identify suitable landfill sites for the disposal of animals culled under its scheme.

It is far too premature to speculate that the foot and mouth disease crisis is over. No one can afford to be complacent about the disease. Disinfectant regimes and effective bio-security measures must remain in place. The recent cases in south Wales over the last week, and in Anglesey over the weekend, are worrying developments. We will continue to monitor the situation by testing. Firm action will be taken where it is required. There are concerns that some of the more recent outbreaks have occurred because people have dropped their guard, for whatever reason. I urge farmers to remain vigilant.

Finally, the experience of foot and mouth disease has clearly heightened the debate about the long-term future of agriculture. The Farming Futures group, which I chair, had made good progress on defining a long-term direction for Welsh agriculture at the time of its last meeting in February. I will make arrangements for the group to meet again to take stock of the issues highlighted in the last couple of months and to press forward with this important work.

Elin Jones: Diolch am y datganiad. Cyfeiriad yn gyntaf at y cynllun lles-gwaredu. Mae'n gwbl warthus fod y bwrdd ymyrraeth, gyda chefnogaeth Llywodraethau'r Cynulliad a San Steffan, wedi gostwng y prisiau ddoe ar gyfer anifeiliaid yn y cynllun hwnnw. Synnaf yn fawr nad oedd cyfeiriad at hynny yn eich datganiad. Y Llywodraeth sydd yn gosod y gwaharddiadau ar symud, a'r Llywodraeth, drwy'r bwrdd ymyrraeth, a ddylai ddigolledu yn deg am effeithiau'r gwaharddiadau. Yr ydym yn gyfarwydd â'r archfarchnadoedd yn manteisio ar ffermwyr, ond nid yw'n dderbyniol i'r Llywodraeth fanteisio ar ffermwyr yn yr un modd ar adeg mor anodd.

ar semenu artiffisial a symudiadau teirw. Pwyswn hefyd am weithredu i sefydlu canolfannau casglu. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o bryderon yr Aelodau ynglŷn â'r anawsterau amlwg â'r cynllun lles da byw-gwaredu, a weithredir gan y Bwrdd Ymyrraeth. Mae'r Bwrdd wedi ymorol am ein cymorth i nodi safleoedd tirlenwi addas i waredu anifeiliaid a ddifir o dan ei gynllun.

Mae'n rhy gynnar o lawer i fentro dweud bod argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau drosodd. Ni all unrhyw un fod yn hunanfodlon ynglŷn â'r clwyf. Rhaid i reolaethau diheintio a mesurau bio-diogelwch effeithiol barhau. Mae'r achosion diweddar yn ne Cymru dros yr wythnos diwethaf ac ar Ynys Môn dros y penwythnos yn ddatblygiadau gofidus. Byddwn yn parhau i fonitro'r sefyllfa drwy brofi. Cymerir camau cadarn pan fydd angen gwneud hynny. Mae pryderon bod rhai o'r achosion mwy diweddar wedi codi gan nad yw pobl mor wylriadwus bellach, am ba reswm bynnag. Anogaf ffermwyr i barhau yn wylriadwus.

Yn olaf, mae profiad clwy'r traed a'r genau wedi amlygu'r ddadl ynglŷn â dyfodol hirdymor amaethyddiaeth. Gwnaeth y grŵp Dyfodol Ffermio, a gadeiriaf, gynnydd da wrth ddiffinio cyfeiriad hirdymor i amaethyddiaeth Cymru adeg ei gyfarfod diwethaf ym mis Chwefror. Gwnaf drefniadau i'r grŵp gyfarfod unwaith eto i ystyried y materion a amlygwyd yn yr ychydig fisoedd diwethaf ac i fwrw ati â'r gwaith pwysig hwn.

Elin Jones: Thank you for the statement. I first refer to the welfare disposal scheme. It is utterly disgraceful that the intervention board, with the support of the Assembly and Westminster Governments, yesterday reduced the prices for stock under that scheme. I am most surprised that you made no reference to that in your statement. It is the Government that imposes the ban on movement and it is the Government, through the intervention board, that should give equitable compensation for the effects of the ban. We are familiar with the supermarkets exploiting farmers, but it is not acceptable for the Government to exploit farmers in the same way at such a difficult time.

Nid wyf am eich clywed yn ymateb, fel y gwnaethoch yn y Pwyllgor yr wythnos diwethaf, fod y cynllun yn cael ei ddefnyddio fel marchnad amgen gan ffermwyr. Y ffordd i ddelio â hynny, os oedd yn broblem, oedd drwy asesiadau llymach ar gyflwr anifeiliaid. Hoffwn glywed pam fod y Llywodraeth yn credu y dylai'r ffermwyr dderbyn pris llai yr wythnos hon am eu hanifeiliaid yn y cynllun lles-gwaredu tra bod yr un gwaharddiadau mewn grym ag oedd yr wythnos diwethaf.

Pa gynnydd sydd yn cael ei wneud ar lacio gwaharddiadau symud? Yr ydych wedi cyfeirio at rai yn eich datganiad. Cyfeiriaf yn benodol at yr ardaloedd sydd yn rhydd o'r clwyf, yn enwedig yn y gorllewin. Yn yr Alban, disgwylant gyhoeddi heddiw ryddhau gwaharddiadau yn yr ucheldiroedd a'r ynysoedd. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn galluogi ffermwyr i symud a gwerthu da stôr, er enghraifft, yn y gorllewin, ac ail-sefydlu'r marchndaoedd da byw fel manau casglu yn gyntaf ar gyfer gwerthu stoc i'w lladd. Pa gynnydd sydd yn cael ei wneud ar hynny? Derbyniaf nad oes gennych, fel Gweinidog, rym ar hyn, fel sydd gan y Gweinidog cyfatebol yn yr Alban, ond a ydych yn disgwyl clywed gan MAFF? A ydych yn rhoi pwysau ar MAFF i weld symud i'r cyfeiriad hwn?

Yr oedd eich datganiad yn cyfeirio at rôl y grŵp Dyfodol Ffermio. Cyfeiriodd y Prif Weinidog heddiw at y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen o dan Bartneriaeth Wledig Cymru. Beth yn union y mae'r grwpiau hyn yn gyfrifol am ei wneud? Pwy sydd yn gwneud beth? Yn bwysicach, pryd y gallwn ddisgwyl pecyn gweithredu ar gyfer adfywio'r economi wledig, gennych chi fel Gweinidog a Chabinet y Cynulliad?

Clywsom heddiw fod John Prescott yn cynnig miliwn o bunnoedd yr un i 43 o drefi marchnad yn Lloegr yn ymateb i glwy'r traed a'r genau. A oes gennych fwriad i gynnig cynlluniau tebyg i drefi marchnad sydd yn dioddef mor enbyd yng Nghymru? A oes cyllid ar gael yng Nghymru i ganiatáu i chi wneud hynny?

Yn olaf, a ydych mor ganmoliaethus ag oedd y Prif Weinidog yn gynharach y prynhawn yma ynghylch y cydweithio a fu rhwng y

I do not wish to hear you responding, as you did in the Committee last week, that farmers are using the scheme as an alternative market. The way to deal with that, if such a problem existed, was through stricter assessments of the condition of stock. I would like to hear why the Government feels that the farmers should receive a reduced price this week for their stock under the welfare disposal scheme while the same prohibitions on movement are in force as last week.

What progress is being made on relaxing the prohibitions on movement? You referred to some in your statement. I refer specifically to the disease-free areas, especially in west Wales. In Scotland, they expect to announce today a relaxation of the prohibitions on movement in the highlands and islands. It is important that we enable farmers to move and sell store cattle, for example, in the west, and re-establish the livestock markets as collection points initially for the sale of stock to be slaughtered. What progress is being made on that? I understand that you as a Minister have no power over this, unlike your counterpart in Scotland, but do you expect to hear from MAFF? Are you putting pressure on MAFF to see a move in this direction?

You referred in your statement to the role of the Farming Futures group. The First Minister referred today to the task and finish group under the Wales Rural Partnership. What exactly are the remits of these groups? Who does what? More importantly, when can we expect an action package for the regeneration of the rural economy, from you as a Minister and from the Assembly Cabinet?

We heard today that John Prescott is offering one million pounds each to 43 market towns in England as a response to the foot and mouth disease crisis. Do you have any intention to propose similar plans for the market towns that are suffering so dreadfully in Wales? Is the funding available in Wales to allow you to do so?

Finally, are you as full of praise as the First Minister was this afternoon as regards the collaboration between the National Assembly

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a MAFF drwy gydol yr argyfwng hwn? Synnais at glywed y Prif Weinidog mor ganmoliaethus. Credaf nad yw'n ymwybodol o rai o'r problemau sydd wedi deillio o'r argyfwng ac o geisio'i reoli yn ystod yr wythnosau diwethaf. Nid wyf mor ganmoliaethus, ac yn sicr nid yw ffermwyr gogledd Ceredigion wedi canmol MAFF yn ystod yr wythnosau diwethaf. Lladdwyd cannoedd o anifeiliaid yn gwbl ddiangen oherwydd bod MAFF wedi bod mor araf yn codi'r statws heintus ar yr ardal honno. Dim ond un enghraifft yw honno o anhrefn MAFF yn yr argyfwng hwn. A gredwch fod rhannu'r pŵer dros les anifeiliad, rhwng y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a MAFF, wedi eich galluogi i ymdrin â chlwy'r traed a'r genau yn y ffordd fwyaf effeithiol yng Nghymru?

Carwyn Jones: Codwyd sawl pwynt gennych. Ynghylch prisiau'r cynllun llesgwaredu, pan ofynnwyd fy marn gan MAFF, dywedais yn blwmp ac yn blaen fy mod yn bryderus oherwydd bod telerau'r cynllun wedi eu sefydlu wythnosau yn ôl. Ni fyddai gostyngiad yng ngwerth y cynllun wedi bod yn boblogaidd ymhlith ffermwyr Cymru. Dywedais yn blwmp ac yn blaen wrth MAFF beth oedd fy mhryder ynglŷn â hynny. [*Torri ar draws.*]

3:20 p.m.

I do not know whether the Conservatives' microphones are on but I can hear jabbering.

The Presiding Officer: I am in charge of order and I advise you to continue regardless.

Carwyn Jones: It is like interference on a radio set.

Yr ydym yn gweithio'n galed er mwyn llacio'r rheolau mewn perthynas â thrwyddedau symud. Gobeithiwn sefydlu system newydd a fydd yn helpu wrth symud anifeiliad yn ôl i dir comin, rhywbeth na fu gennym o'r blaen. Bydd hwnnw'n gam pwysig ymlaen i ffermwyr Cymru.

Yr ydym yn gweithio gyda MAFF mewn perthynas â chanolfannau casglu, sydd yn bwysig i Gymru. Gobeithiaf y ceir datganiad ar hynny cyn bo hir. Yr ydym yn gweithio'n

and MAFF throughout this crisis? I was surprised to hear the First Minister lavishing such praise. I do not think that he is aware of some of the problems that have arisen from the crisis and its control during recent weeks. I do not have the same praise, and certainly the farmers of north Ceredigion have not sung the praises of MAFF during recent weeks. Hundreds of animals have been culled unnecessarily because MAFF was so slow in lifting the diseased zone status in that area. That is only one example of the chaos within MAFF during this crisis. Do you think that the division of powers on animal welfare, between the National Assembly and MAFF, has enabled you to deal with foot and mouth disease in Wales in the most effective manner?

Carwyn Jones: You raised several points. Regarding the prices under the welfare disposal scheme, when MAFF asked me for my view, I made it clear that I was concerned because the terms of the scheme had been established weeks ago. A reduction in the scheme's payments would not have gone down well with Wales's farmers. I made it clear to MAFF what my concern was about that. [*Interruption.*]

Ni wn a yw microffonau'r Ceidwadwyr ymlaen ond gallaf glywed clebran.

Y Llywydd: Fi sydd yng ngofal trefn ac fe'ch cynghoraf i barhau er hynny.

Carwyn Jones: Mae fel clecian ar set radio.

We are working hard to relax the rules in relation to movement licences. We hope to establish a new system that will facilitate the movement of animals back to common land, something that we have not had before. That will be an important step forward for Wales's farmers.

We are working with MAFF on the issue of collection centres, which are important to Wales. We hope that a statement on that will be issued soon. We are working hard to

galed i gyfleu'r neges i MAFF.

Sefydlwyd y grŵp Dyfodol Ffermio sawl mis yn ôl i sicrhau gweledigaeth i ddyfodol ffermio. Dyna gylch gwaith y grŵp hwnnw. Rôl y bartneriaeth wledig yw ystyried yr economi wledig eang, nid ffermio yn unig. Mae'r bartneriaeth yn gweithio ar ddulliau o hybu'r economi wledig fel y gall dyfu eto.

Bu'n bleser gweithio gyda MAFF a phob asiantaeth arall sydd wedi gweithio'n galed yng Nghymru i geisio dileu clwy'r traed a'r genau. Gallwn fod yn hapus yng Nghymru ynghylch yr hyn a wnaethom hyd yn hyn i geisio dileu'r clwyf. Daw achosion pellach i'r amlwg ac mae'n bwysig bod pobl yn deall y cymer fwy o amser cyn y gallwn ddweud bod Cymru yn rhydd o'r clwyf. Fodd bynnag, mae'r difa ar ffermydd cyffiniol drosodd a gwnaethpwyd y gwaith hwnnw'n dda.

Ron Davies: Referring to the apparently sporadic outbreaks during recent weeks in Nelson, Abercynon and Marshfield, do you have any idea as to what the vector was in those cases? Are you carrying out an investigation to try to identify the cause of those sporadic outbreaks? If, as you indicated—and this may well be the case—the farming community is becoming slightly more relaxed and is dropping its guard, do you have fresh advice to offer people who are outside the infected areas in the light of any information that you have about the possible cause of such sporadic outbreaks?

Carwyn Jones: Investigations take place with regard to all outbreaks to establish, where it is unknown, how the disease came into a particular area. An epidemiologist is sent on site to try to ascertain where the disease came from. It is clear with regard to one of the recent outbreaks that the disease was brought to the farm by a farmer. The circumstances surrounding that instance indicate, as the farmer admits, that the guidelines were not followed.

I do not want this to turn into a witch hunt against individuals. However, it is important to remember that, in 1967, when the disease was in abeyance, people dropped their guard

convey the message to MAFF.

The Farming Futures group was established some months ago to ensure a vision for the future of farming. That is the group's remit. The rural partnership's role is to consider the wider rural economy, not only farming. The partnership is working on methods of promoting the rural economy so that it can grow again.

It has been a pleasure to work with MAFF and every other agency that has worked hard in Wales to try to eradicate foot and mouth disease. We in Wales can be proud of what we have done to date to eradicate the disease. Further cases will occur and it is important that people understand that it will take more time before we can say that Wales is free of the disease. However, the contiguous cull is over and that work was well done.

Ron Davies: Gan gyfeirio at yr achosion achlysurol yn ôl pob tebyg a fu yn ystod yr wythnosau diwethaf yn Ffos y Gerddinen, Abercynon a Maerun, a oes gennych unrhyw syniad beth oedd y cludwr yn yr achosion hynny? A gynhaliwch ymchwiliad i geisio nodi'r rheswm dros yr achosion achlysurol hynny? Os yw ffermwyr, fel yr awgrymasoch—ac efallai mai fel hyn y mae—yn ymlacio ychydig ac nad ydynt mor wylidwrus, a oes gennych gyngor newydd i'w gynnig i bobl sydd y tu allan i'r ardaloedd heintus yng ngoleuni unrhyw wybodaeth sydd gennych ynglŷn â'r rheswm posibl dros achosion achlysurol o'r fath?

Carwyn Jones: Cynhelir ymchwiliadau mewn perthynas â phob achos er mwyn sefydlu, lle nad yw'n hysbys, sut y daeth y clwyf i mewn i ardal benodol. Anfonir epidemiologydd i'r safle i geisio canfod o ble y daeth y clwyf. Mewn perthynas ag un o'r achosion diweddar, mae'n amlwg bod y clwyf wedi ei ddwyn i'r fferm gan ffermwr. Awgryma amgylchiadau'r achos hwnnw, fel y cyfaddefa'r ffermwr, na ddilynwyd y canllawiau.

Nid wyf am i hyn gael ei droi yn erledigaeth yn erbyn unigolion. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig cofio, yn 1967, pan oedd y clwyf yn cilio, dechreuodd pobl beidio â bod mor

and it continued far longer than it should have. We must ensure that that does not happen in Wales this time. All farmers in Wales must ensure that vehicles coming onto their farms are disinfected and that people coming out of those vehicles have not come from other farms where they may have come into contact with livestock.

The message to farmers is simple: do not go near anybody else's livestock. It is as simple as that. Farmers who are in contact with livestock must not move to another group of animals unless they have changed their clothes. That is an important point. Such action is the easiest way of spreading the disease. It is right to say that, as far as the new outbreaks are concerned, it is extremely unlikely that they were caused by an airborne spread, but that the disease was carried onto farms by a physical vector. That is why it is doubly, if not trebly, important for people to remember that we are far from coming out of the woods and we must keep our guard up.

Peter Rogers: Thank you for the latest update on the foot and mouth disease crisis. I have four points to make about this statement. The first relates to common land. One of the biggest problems experienced during this crisis is officials' inability to recognise the difference between common land and enclosed open common. Compensation for *cynefin* sheep that had to be slaughtered because it was not possible for them to return to their home farms to lamb has cost the Treasury a large amount of money. You know that I have argued a strong case for this during the past three weeks, and your statement noted that you hope to make announcements during the next few days. You have warned me about libel laws and I am still ready to accept what you said about that.

The Presiding Officer: Order. We are not in the business of discussing individual cases, and certainly nothing that may be sub judice or outside the business of the Assembly. This is a statement on the foot and mouth disease crisis and I would be grateful if Members

wyliadwrus a pharhaodd am lawer mwy o amser nag y dylai fod wedi parhau. Rhaid inni sicrhau na ddigwydd hynny yng Nghymru y tro hwn. Rhaid i bob ffermwr yng Nghymru sicrhau y diheintir cerbydau a ddaw i'w ffermydd ac na ddaeth y bobl hynny a ddaw allan o'r cerbydau hynny o ffermydd eraill lle y daethant, o bosibl, i gysylltiad â da byw.

Mae'r neges i ffermwyr yn syml: peidiwch â mynd yn agos at anifeiliaid unrhyw un arall. Mae mor syml â hynny. Ni ddylai ffermwyr sydd mewn cysylltiad ag anifeiliaid symud at grŵp arall o anifeiliaid oni fyddant wedi newid eu dillad. Mae hynny'n bwynt pwysig. Cymryd camau o'r fath yw'r ffordd hawsaf o ledaenu'r clwyf. Mae'n iawn dweud, o ran achosion newydd, ei bod yn annhebygol iawn eu bod wedi cael eu hachosi gan ledaeniad yn yr awyr, ond bod y clwyf wedi ei gario i'r ffermydd gan gludwr yn gorfforol. Dyna pam y mae ddwywaith os nad tair gwaith mor bwysig i bobl gofio nad ydym yn rhydd o berygl eto a rhaid inni barhau i fod yn wyliadwrus.

Peter Rogers: Diolch ichi am y newyddion diweddaraf am glwy'r traed a'r genau. Mae gennyf bedwar pwynt i'w wneud ynglŷn â'r datganiad hwn. Mae'r cyntaf yn ymwneud â thir comin. Un o'r problemau mwyaf a brofwyd yn ystod yr argyfwng hwn yw anallu'r swyddogion i gydnabod y gwahaniaeth rhwng tir comin a thir comin amgaeedig. Mae iawndal mewn perthynas â defaid cynefin yr oedd yn rhaid eu lladd gan nad oedd yn bosibl eu dychwelyd i'w ffermydd cartref i wyna wedi costio swm mawr iawn o arian i'r Trysorlys. Gwyddoch fy mod wedi dadlau'n gryf o blaid hyn yn ystod y tair wythnos diwethaf, a nododd eich datganiad eich bod yn gobeithio gwneud cyhoeddiadau yn ystod yr ychydig ddyddiau nesaf. Cefais fy rhybuddio gennyf am gyfraith enllib ac yr wyf yn barod o hyd i dderbyn yr hyn a ddywedasoeh ynglŷn â hynny.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid ydym yn y busnes o drafod achosion unigol, ac yn sicr dim a all fod yn lled gyfreithiol neu y tu allan i fusnes y Cynulliad. Mae hwn yn ddatganiad ar argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau a byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe bai'r Aelodau yn cyfyngu eu

would confine their questions to that.

Peter Rogers: We have failed to recognise that, since 1960, a large area of common land in Wales has been fenced off and considered as fields, which should therefore have been treated in the control of foot and mouth disease. With regard to the artificial insemination of dairy cattle, it has not been possible to inseminate cows or move bulls onto herds for four weeks. I welcome the fact that you now hope to relax this restriction. We can, on welfare grounds, move bulls onto dairy herds for any reason other than to serve cows. That will be to the detriment of the dairy industry.

Another concern is farms that are subject to form D-restrictions, which, for some, will now have lasted about eight or nine weeks. They are the forgotten farmers of this crisis. Their farms were in an infected area but were not included in the subsequent contiguous cull. They have too much stock on their farms and are suffering tremendous welfare problems along with stress and trauma within the family as a result of their concern. Will you ensure that farms under form D-restrictions are immediately given top priority in the livestock welfare disposal scheme? Will you ensure that cattle over 30 months are removed from these farms to reduce feeding capacity and that cattle ready for market are also removed to save the farms from having to use valuable feeding stuffs? Such farms often have land to which their animals could have been moved, or own other farms that are subject to other form D-restrictions. We must consider farms that are subject to these restrictions, as nobody has given them any hope. There are a large number of these in the Brecon and Painscastle areas, which are all Tir Mynydd farms or are within a less favoured area and have land that is in the most appalling condition.

Compensation is another problem. When you discussed the preventative cull with farmers in Anglesey, you said that a quick firebreak cull would take place within 10 days. As you know, there was no abattoir or anywhere else to dispose of the carcasses, and the cull took

cwestiynau i hynny.

Peter Rogers: Yr ydym wedi methu â chydabod, ers 1960, bod ardal fawr o dir comin yng Nghymru wedi ei ffensio a'i hystyried yn gaeau ac, felly, dylent fod wedi cael eu trin wrth reoli clwy'r traed a'r genau. Mewn perthynas â semenu gwartheg godro yn artiffisial, ni fu'n bosibl semenu gwartheg na symud teirw i dir buchesau ers pedair wythnos. Croesawaf y ffaith eich bod yn gobeithio llacio'r cyfyngiad hwn yn awr. Gallwn, am resymau lles, symud teirw i dir gwartheg godro am unrhyw reswm heblaw i gyfebru gwartheg. Bydd hynny'n anfanteisiol i'r diwydiant cynhyrchu llaeth.

Pryder arall yw bod ffermydd yn agored i gyfyngiadau ffurflen D a fydd, i rai, wedi parhau am tua wyth neu naw wythnos erbyn hyn. Hwyl yw ffermwyr angof yr argyfwng hwn. Yr oedd eu ffermydd mewn ardal heintus ond ni chawsant eu cynnwys yn y gwaith difa ar ffermydd cyffiniol a wnaethpwyd wedi hyn. Mae ganddynt ormod o anifeiliaid ar eu ffermydd ac maent yn dioddef problemau lles aruthrol ynghyd â straen a thrawma o fewn y teulu o ganlyniad i'w pryder. A sicrhewch y rhoddir y flaenoriaeth uchaf ar unwaith i ffermydd o dan gyfyngiadau ffurflen D yn y cynllun lles da byw-gwaredu? A sicrhewch y symudir gwartheg dros 30 mis oed o'r ffermydd hyn i leihau'r capasiti bwydo ac y caiff gwartheg sydd yn barod i'r farchnad eu symud hefyd i arbed ffermydd rhag gorfod defnyddio bwydydd gwerthfawr? Yn aml mae gan ffermydd o'r fath dir y gellid bod wedi symud eu hanifeiliaid iddo, neu ffermydd eraill sydd yn agored i gyfyngiadau ffurflen D eraill. Rhaid inni ystyried ffermydd sydd yn agored i'r cyfyngiadau hynny, gan nad oes unrhyw un wedi rhoi unrhyw obaith iddynt. Mae nifer fawr o'r rhain yn ardaloedd Aberhonddu a Chastell Paun, sydd i gyd yn ffermydd Tir Mynydd neu sydd o fewn ardal lai ffafriol ac sydd â thir mewn cyflwr ofnadwy.

Mae iawndal yn broblem arall. Pan drafodasoch y gwaith difa ataliol gyda ffermwyr ar Ynys Môn, dywedasoch y byddai'r anifeiliaid yn cael eu difa'n gyflym o fewn cylch penodol o fewn 10 diwrnod. Fel y gwyddoch, nid oedd lladd-dy nac unman

20 days to complete, which meant that the impetus was lost. What is worse is that the compensation intended to maintain the livelihoods of those farmers was to be sent out within three weeks, but no money has yet been received.

There have been problems on farms where outbreaks of foot and mouth disease have been confirmed and where MAFF contractors have been sent to sterilise those farms. Their use of equipment and employment of farmers' sons and other workers has meant huge bills. Ruttle Plant Hire Ltd, one of the main contractors from Chorley in Lancashire, has run up bills with local contractors in my area of £15,000, £50,000 and £12,000, but are unable to pay. The company told me that its bills for MAFF amount to approximately £5 million. It has submitted accounts of nearly £2 million. I have been negotiating with MAFF in London for the last two days. It says that it has no contract with Ruttle. Ruttle is MAFF's main contractor. It was involved in sterilising after the swine fever outbreak. MAFF now says that it does not have a contract. Carwyn knows that we moved with urgency when we first started to cull animals. As a result, many contracts were made verbally. I have supplied evidence to MAFF today of contracts that were submitted, with one or two alterations. I have notes to this respect. I ask Carwyn to speak to MAFF to ensure that Ruttle can submit the outstanding bill, which is not far off £2 million, and to settle with the company immediately, so that it can pay some of the hard-pressed farmers in Wales who are facing absolute devastation as they have no cashflow.

3:30 p.m.

The issue of the welfare cull was raised in Committee last Tuesday, where I told Carwyn that the abattoir in Anglesey has not slaughtered an animal under the welfare disposal scheme for two weeks. The 80 men who work in the abattoir ring up daily at 4 p.m. to see whether they have to come into work the next day. Every day they are told that the cull cannot go ahead because there is

arall ar gael i waredu'r carcasau a pharhaodd y gwaith difa am 20 diwrnod, a olygodd fod yr ysgogiad wedi'i golli. Beth sydd yn waeth na hyn yw bod yr iawndal a fwriadwyd i gynnal bywoliaethau'r ffermwyr hynny i fod i gael ei anfon o fewn tair wythnos, ond hyd yn hyn ni dderbyniwyd unrhyw arian.

Bu problemau ar ffermydd lle y cadarnhawyd achosion o glwy'r traed a'r genau a lle yr anfonwyd contractwyr MAFF i ddiheintio'r ffermydd hynny. Mae'r offer a ddefnyddiasant, a'r meibion ffermwyr a gweithwyr eraill a gyflogwyd ganddynt i ddiheintio'r ffermydd hynny wedi golygu biliau mawr. Mae Ruttle Plant Hire Ltd, un o'r prif gontractwyr o Chorley yn Swydd Gaerhirfryn, wedi mynd i ddyledion â chontractwyr lleol yn fy ardal i o £15,000, £50,000 a £12,000, ond ni allant dalu. Dywedodd y cwmni wrthyf fod ei filiau i MAFF yn gwneud cyfanswm o tua £5 miliwn. Bûm yn negodi gyda MAFF yn Llundain dros y ddau ddiwrnod diwethaf. Dywed nad oes ganddo unrhyw gontract â Ruttle. Ruttle yw prif gontractwr MAFF. Bu'n ymwneud â'r gwaith diheintio ar ôl yr achosion o dwymyn y moch. Dywed MAFF yn awr nad oes ganddo gontract. Gŵyr Carwyn ein bod wedi gweithredu ar frys pan ddechreuasom ddifa anifeiliaid. O ganlyniad, gwnaethpwyd llawer o gontractau ar lafar. Rhoddais dystiolaeth i MAFF heddiw o gontractau a gyflwynwyd, gydag un neu ddau o newidiadau. Mae gennyf nodiadau i'r perwyl hwn. Gofynnaf i Carwyn siarad â MAFF er mwyn sicrhau y gall Ruttle gyflwyno'r bil sydd yn ddyledus, sydd bron yn £2 filiwn, a thalu'r cwmni ar unwaith, fel y gall dalu rhai o'r ffermwyr sydd dan bwysau mawr yng Nghymru sydd yn wynebu dinistr llwyr gan nad oes ganddynt unrhyw lif arian.

Codwyd mater difa er lles anifeiliaid yn y Pwyllgor ddydd Mawrth diwethaf, lle y dywedais wrth Carwyn nad yw'r lladd-dy ar Ynys Môn wedi lladd anifail o dan y cynllun lles-gwaredu ers pythefnos. Mae'r 80 o ddynion sydd yn gweithio yn y lladd-dy yn ffonio bob dydd am 4 p.m. i weld a oes rhaid iddynt ddod i'r gwaith y diwrnod nesaf. Bob dydd, dywedir wrthynt na all y difa fynd yn

nowhere to take the carcasses.

Carwyn tells us that one success of the welfare disposal scheme was that the rates of compensation were too favourable. We told Carwyn, in no uncertain terms, how far off he was when he said that he thought that finished lambs in the spring of the year that had been creep fed and ewes that had been fed since Christmas were worth £40 and that hoggets were worth £45. Immediately after that meeting, we told Carwyn that he had made a mistake in making that statement. On Saturday, letters were received from the intervention board telling farmers that their prime lambs were no longer worth £42 a head; they were only worth £30. People in Anglesey and the rest of north Wales never had the ability to place any animals in the welfare disposal scheme. People who entered the welfare disposal scheme for that meagre amount of money—£42 for a prime lamb and £22 for a culled ewe—should have those prices maintained. They could not push their animals through the welfare disposal scheme because it was not available to them. Those people have been acted against. I ask Carwyn to take these points on board.

Carwyn Jones: The original rates under the livestock welfare disposal scheme were put forward by the farming unions at a meeting that I well remember. At the time, the rates were agreed by the authorities in London. Subsequently, those rates have been cut. Peter has already heard me express concern about that. It struck me at the time that that would not be taken well by farmers, especially as the rates were high at the beginning of the scheme. I had concerns about that and I made them forcefully known.

I will follow up the compensation payment issue and will take further instructions on payments to contractors. If compensation has not yet been paid, we will have to investigate why.

On prioritising those under form D-restrictions, we have explained to the

ei flaen gan nad oes unrhyw le i fynd â'r carcasau.

Dywed Carwyn wrthym mai un o lwyddiannau'r cynllun lles-gwaredu oedd bod y cyfraddau iawndal yn rhy ffafriol. Dywedasom wrth Carwyn, yn blwmp ac yn blaen, pa mor bell yr oedd o'r gwir pan ddywedodd ei fod yn credu bod wŷn wedi pesgi yn ystod tymor y gwanwyn a gafodd eu didol-borthi a mamogiaid a fwydwyd ers Nadolig yn werth £40 a bod hesbinod yn werth £45. Yn union wedi'r cyfarfod hwnnw, dywedasom wrth Carwyn ei fod wedi gwneud camgymeriad wrth wneud y datganiad hwnnw. Ddydd Sadwrn, derbyniwyd llythyrau gan y bwrdd ymyrraeth yn dweud wrth ffermwyr nad £42 y pen oedd gwerth eu hŵyn gorau bellach; £30 yn unig oedd eu gwerth. Ni chafodd pobl ar Ynys Môn a gweddill gogledd Cymru y cyfle erioed i osod unrhyw anifeiliaid yn y cynllun lles-gwaredu. Dylai pobl a ymunodd â'r cynllun ar gyfer y swm pitw hwnnw o arian—£42 am yr oen gorau a £22 am famog wedi ei difa—barhau i gael y prisiau hynny. Ni allent wthio eu hanifeiliaid drwy'r cynllun lles-gwaredu gan nad oedd ar gael iddynt. Gweithredwyd yn erbyn y bobl hynny. Gofynnaf i Carwyn ystyried y pwyntiau hynny.

Carwyn Jones: Cyflwynwyd y cyfraddau gwreiddiol o dan y cynllun lles da byw-gwaredu gan yr undebau ffermio mewn cyfarfod a gofiau yn dda. Ar y pryd, cytunwyd ar y cyfraddau gyda'r awdurdodau yn Llundain. Wedi hyn, cwtogwyd ar y cyfraddau hynny. Eisoed mae Peter wedi fy nghlywed yn mynegi pryder ynglŷn â hynny. Fe'm tarodd ar y pryd na fyddai'r ffermwyr yn derbyn hyn yn dda iawn, yn enwedig gan fod y cyfraddau yn uchel ar ddechrau'r cynllun. Yr oedd gennyf bryderon ynglŷn â hynny ac fe'u gwneuthum yn hysbys mewn ffordd rymus.

Af ar drywydd mater talu iawndal a chymeraf gyfarwyddiadau pellach ar daliadau i gontractwyr. Os na thalwyd iawndal eto, bydd yn rhaid inni ymchwilio i'r rheswm pam.

O ran blaenoriaethu'r sawl sydd o dan gyfyngiadau ffurflen D, eglurasom i'r bwrdd

intervention board that there are people under form D-restrictions who are in the worst of positions. I will convey Peter's thoughts and requests to the intervention board today. As there is an intervention board representative in the operation centre in Cardiff, it is now easier to communicate with the board.

I mentioned common land and artificial insemination in my statement. Those issues will be taken up as quickly as possible. The difference between Wales and Scotland is that Scotland has greater autonomy to make decisions regarding animal health than we do in Wales. Therefore, we must operate on a basis of hard lobbying, rather than being able to take the decisions ourselves.

Mick Bates: On behalf of the Liberal Democrats, I thank all those working in the operations rooms and on helplines throughout the UK, but particularly in Wales, who offer advice, often in life-threatening situations. This is a time of tremendous anxiety, and our colleague, Peter Rogers, has expounded many issues that are currently uppermost in the farming community. However, we should also remember that this outbreak has affected all rural businesses and I am pleased that the Powys rural business support group is collecting information to show the crisis's damaging financial effect that goes beyond agriculture.

Restrictions are causing immense welfare problems leading to tremendous anxiety among farmers. There does not appear to be any intention of lifting the form D-restrictions that cause these restrictions with any urgency. I refer to outbreaks that occurred before the contiguous cull was implemented. What plans do you have to lift the form D-restrictions that have caused many of the problems mentioned today, of which I am sure that you were previously aware, along with tremendous cashflow and animal welfare problems as well as anxiety and depression among farmers?

You referred to two farms in my Montgomeryshire constituency, which both share a common theme that I would like you to address, namely the lack of consultation on site. The community of Cefn Golog was

ymyrraeth fod pobl ar gael o dan gyfyngiadau ffurflen D sydd yn y sefyllfa waethaf. Mynegaf deimladau a cheisiadau Peter i'r bwrdd ymyrraeth heddiw. Gan fod cynrychiolydd y bwrdd ymyrraeth yn y ganolfan weithrediadau yng Nghaerdydd, mae'n haws cyfathrebu â'r bwrdd yn awr.

Soniais am dir comin a semenu artiffisial yn fy natganiad. Caiff y materion hynny eu trin cyn gynted â phosibl. Y gwahaniaeth rhwng Cymru a'r Alban yw bod gan yr Alban fwy o awtonomiaeth i wneud penderfyniadau o ran iechyd anifeiliaid nag sydd gennym ni yng Nghymru. Felly, rhaid inni weithredu ar sail labio dygn, yn hytrach na gallu cymryd y penderfyniadau ein hunain.

Mick Bates: Ar ran y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, diolchaf i bawb sydd yn gweithio yn yr ystafelloedd rheoli ac ar linellau ffôn ledled y DU, ond yn arbennig yng Nghymru, sydd yn cynnig cyngor mewn sefyllfaoedd sydd yn aml yn bygwth bywyd. Mae hon yn adeg o gryn bryder, a thraethodd ein cyd-aelod Peter Rogers ar sawl mater sydd ar flaen meddyliau ffermwyr ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, dylem gofio hefyd fod yr argyfwng hwn wedi effeithio ar bob busnes gwledig ac yr wyf yn falch bod grŵp cymorth busnes gwledig Powys yn casglu gwybodaeth i ddangos effaith ariannol niweidiol yr argyfwng sydd yn mynd y tu hwnt i amaethyddiaeth.

Mae cyfyngiadau yn achosi problemau lles enfawr sydd yn arwain at bryder aruthrol ymhlith ffermwyr. Nid yw'n ymdangos bod unrhyw frys i godi cyfyngiadau ffurflen D sydd yn achosi'r cyfyngiadau hyn. Cyfeiriaf at achosion a gododd cyn dechrau difa ar ffermydd cyffiniol. Pa gynlluniau sydd gennych i godi'r cyfyngiadau ffurflen D sydd wedi achosi llawer o'r problemau y soniwyd amdanynt heddiw, yr oeddech yn ymwybodol ohonynt o'r blaen mae'n siŵr, ynghyd â'r problemau llif arian a'r problemau lles anifeiliaid aruthrol yn ogystal â phryder ac iselder ysbryd ymhlith ffermwyr?

Cyfeiriasoch at ddwy fferm yn fy etholaeth yn Sir Drefaldwyn, sydd ill dwy yn rhannu thema gyffredin yr hoffwn ichi ymdrin â hi, sef y diffyg ymgynghori a fu ar y safle. Dywedwyd yn ddisymwth wrth gymuned

suddenly told that livestock would be burnt in the middle of a forest. What protocols are in place—and I have asked this question many times—to deal with the local democratically elected people, the farming unions and Assembly Members? All too often, AMs seem to be left out of the loop. On Buttington Hall, I was pleased to hear what you had to say about the mistakes that were made. A vital question that you should answer is, given that there was a pollution problem, why was a pyre built next to that pit? There was a pyre there on Saturday night. Those infected animals could have been burnt over the weekend; a screen was built by the main road to do so, the problem could then have been alleviated.

Suddenly, there is a delay, which means extra pollution and extra cost. No-one has answered my question on how effective this incinerator is. Will you address the issue of the fuel supply to the incinerator? Will the fuel be sufficient and will it be possible to get the incinerator on site? Will the animals be transferred directly to it from the pit rather than being handled twice, because every time they are handled, they pose a severe public health problem? Finally, I am pleased that you are looking at the future, but there is little future for those who cannot move their livestock or get their stock onto the welfare scheme. I join others in requesting a clear answer on what the Assembly is doing to get a fair price from the welfare disposal scheme. The offer is derogatory and insulting to those who have suffered greatly for a long time. How will you ensure that the farmers whose stock has been taken can re-stock? It is all very well to discuss the future and re-stocking, but how can that be done without livestock markets? What mechanisms have you put in place to ensure that we can re-stock this autumn?

3:40 p.m.

Carwyn Jones: Firstly, we must consider re-stocking. We are aware of potential difficulties and will consider ways to alleviate that situation. It is too early to open livestock markets and it is difficult to know when they can be re-opened. Clearly, until

Cefn Golog y câi anifeiliaid eu llosgi ynghanol coedwig. Pa brotocolau sydd ar waith—a gofynnais y cwestiwn hwn sawl gwaith—i ddelio â'r bobl leol a etholwyd yn ddemocrataidd, yr undebau ffermio ac Aelodau'r Cynulliad? Yn rhy aml, ymddengys bod Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn cael eu hepgor o'r broses. Ar fater Neuadd Buttington, yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed yr hyn a oedd gennych i'w ddweud ynglŷn â'r camgymeriadau a wnaethpwyd. Un cwestiwn hollbwysig y dylech ei ateb, o gofio am y broblem llygredd, yw pam yr adeiladwyd coelcerth wrth ochr y pydew hwnnw? Yr oedd coelcerth yno nos Sadwrn. Gallai'r anifeiliaid heintus hynny fod wedi cael eu llosgi dros y penwythnos; adeiladwyd sgrîn ger y brif ffordd i wneud hynny, felly gellid bod wedi lliniaru'r broblem.

Yn sydyn, ceir oedi, sydd yn golygu llygredd a chost ychwanegol. Nid oes unrhyw un wedi ateb fy nghwestiwn ar ba mor effeithiol yw'r llosgydd hwn. A ymdriniwch â mater y cyflenwad tanwydd i'r llosgydd? A fydd y tanwydd yn ddigonol ac a fydd yn bosibl cael y llosgydd ar y safle? A gaiff yr anifeiliaid eu trosglwyddo'n uniongyrchol iddo o'r pydew yn hytrach na chael eu trin ddwywaith, oherwydd bob tro y cânt eu trin, maent yn peri problem iechyd cyhoeddus ddifrifol? Yn olaf, yr wyf yn falch eich bod yn edrych i'r dyfodol, ond nid oes llawer o ddyfodol i'r rheini na all symud eu hanifeiliaid na rhoi eu hanifeiliaid ar y cynllun lles. Ymunaf ag eraill i ofyn am ateb clir ar yr hyn a wna'r Cynulliad i gael pris teg o'r cynllun lles-gwaredu. Mae'r cynnig yn fychanol ac yn sarhaus i'r rheini sydd wedi dioddef llawer ers amser hir. Sut y sicrhewch y gall ffermwyr gael anifeiliaid eraill yn lle'r rhai a gymerwyd? Mae'n hawdd iawn trafod y dyfodol ac ailstocio, ond sut y gellir gwneud hynny heb y marchnadoedd da byw? Pa fecanweithiau a roddwyd ar waith gennych i sicrhau y gallwn ailstocio'r Hydref hwn?

Carwyn Jones: Yn gyntaf, rhaid inni ystyried ailstocio. Yr ydym yn ymwybodol o'r anawsterau posibl a byddwn yn ystyried ffyrdd o leddfu'r sefyllfa honno. Mae'n rhy gynnar i agor marchnadoedd da byw eto ac mae'n anodd gwybod pryd y gellir eu

we have a better idea from the completed blood tests of where the disease remains, to re-open livestock markets would pose a severe risk. You heard of my concerns when I was asked about the livestock welfare disposal scheme, and I will continue to express those concerns when I meet with the appropriate authorities in London.

I will meet farming representatives on Thursday to discuss the form D-restrictions when I hope that we can move things forward. On Buttington Hall, all of the authorities including the Assembly's Public Health department, the environmental health department of Powys County Council and the Environment Agency agreed that incineration was the best method of disposing of these carcasses. The Environment Agency is not concerned about a pollution risk occurring while the carcasses are on the ground. Normally, they would have been burnt in a pyre. However, Powys County Council's environmental health department did not want us to burn at this site. Having gleaned more information from Powys, there were no protests by local people, but that is the council's point of view. An incinerator is available. If it had not been available, we would have burnt the carcasses, because there would not have been an alternative as they could not have been moved, buried or eaten. However, because there is an incinerator to dispose of the carcasses for this case only, and because incineration is a preferred method of disposal to burning in pyres, an incinerator will be used.

Your points on fuel and other matters relating to the incinerator are operational ones for the vets on the ground to deal with and when further information is available, I will pass it on.

The Presiding Officer: Before I call on other Members to speak, I point out that we have exceeded the time allocated for the statement. I have called the lead spokespeople for all groups, I therefore insist that other Members who are called limit their remarks to one question as was agreed in relation to statements.

hailagor. Yn amlwg, nes bod gennym syniad gwell ar ôl cael y profion gwaed wedi eu cwblhau yn dangos y manau lle mae'r clwyf yn bodoli o hyd, byddai ailagor marchnadoedd anifeiliaid yn peri risg ddifrifol. Clywsoch fy mhryderon pan ofynnwyd imi ynglŷn â'r cynllun lles da byw-gwaredu, a byddaf yn parhau i fynegi'r pryderon hynny pan fyddaf yn cyfarfod â'r awdurdodau priodol yn Llundain.

Byddaf yn cyfarfod â chynrychiolwyr ffermio ddydd Iau i drafod cyfyngiadau ffurflen D pan allwn, gobeithio, wneud cynnydd. O ran Neuadd Buttington, cytunodd pob un o'r awdurdodau, gan gynnwys adran Iechyd Cyhoeddus y Cynulliad, adran iechyd amgylcheddol Cyngor Sir Powys ac Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd mai defnyddio llosgydd oedd y ffordd orau o waredu'r carcasau hyn. Nid yw Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn gofidio ynglŷn â risg o lygredd tra bod y carcasau ar y tir. Fel arfer, byddent wedi cael eu llosgi mewn coelcerth. Fodd bynnag, nid oedd adran iechyd amgylcheddol Cyngor Sir Powys am inni losgi ar y safle hwn. Ar ôl casglu mwy o wybodaeth oddi wrth Powys, ni fu gwrthdystiadau gan bobl leol, ond barn y cyngor yw hynny. Mae llosgydd ar gael. Pe na bai wedi bod ar gael, byddem wedi llosgi'r carcasau gan na fyddai dewis arall wedi bod ar gael oherwydd ni fyddent wedi gallu cael eu symud, eu claddu na'u bwyta. Fodd bynnag, gan fod llosgydd ar gael i waredu'r carcasau ar gyfer yr achos hwn yn unig, a chan fod llosgi mewn llosgydd yn ddull dewisol yn lle gwaredu drwy losgi mewn coelcerthi, caiff llosgydd ei ddefnyddio.

Mae eich pwyntiau ynglŷn â thanwydd a materion eraill sydd yn ymwneud â'r llosgydd yn rhai gweithredol y bydd y milfeddygon ar lawr gwlad yn delio â hwy a phan fydd rhagor o wybodaeth ar gael, byddaf yn ei throsglwyddo.

Y Llywydd: Cyn imi alw ar yr Aelodau eraill i siarad, nodaf ein bod wedi mynd y tu hwnt i'r amser a ganiatawyd ar gyfer y datganiad. Yr wyf wedi galw'r prif lefarwyr ar gyfer pob grŵp, felly mynnaf fod yr Aelodau eraill a elwir yn cyfyngu eu sylwadau i un cwestiwn fel y cytunwyd mewn perthynas â datganiadau.

Glyn Davies: Thank you for the opportunity to ask the Minister a question relating to Buttington Hall, which is extremely worrying. What is the difference between that pyre, which must have cost around £50,000 to build—which is wasted money—and the hundreds of other pyres in Wales?

Glyn Davies: Diolch ichi am y cyfle i ofyn cwestiwn i'r Gweinidog mewn perthynas â Neuadd Buttington, sydd yn fater sydd yn peri llawer o ofid. Beth yw'r gwahaniaeth rhwng y goelcerth honno, a gostiodd tua £50,000 i'w hadeiladu siŵr o fod—sydd yn arian a wastraffwyd—a'r cannoedd o goelcerthi eraill yng Nghymru?

Can I ask another question, Presiding Officer?

A gaf ofyn cwestiwn arall, Lywydd?

The Presiding Officer: No, you have asked one question, if I allow you to ask another we will be here all afternoon.

Y Llywydd: Na chewch, yr ydych wedi gofyn un cwestiwn, os gadawaf ichi ofyn un arall byddwn yma drwy'r prynhawn.

Carwyn Jones: Powys County Council could answer that question because its environmental health department made these observations. However, there is an important difference between this case and others, namely that an incinerator is available for this one and is not available for the other Powys cases. That is an important difference, which does not set a precedent.

Carwyn Jones: Gallai Cyngor Sir Powys ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw gan mai ei adran iechyd amgylcheddol a wnaeth y sylwadau hyn. Fodd bynnag, mae gwahaniaeth pwysig rhwng yr achos hwn ac eraill, sef bod llosgydd ar gael ar gyfer yr achos hwn ond nid oes un ar gael ar gyfer yr achosion eraill ym Mhowys. Mae hynny'n wahaniaeth pwysig, nad yw'n gosod cynsail.

Alun Pugh: Today's *Daily Post* contains a disturbing account of men armed with sledgehammers turning up in the middle of the night outside the home of a man who voiced certain doubts about agricultural policy. Do you agree that bully-boy tactics of threats and intimidation have no place in Welsh society?

Alun Pugh: Mae'r *Daily Post* heddiw yn cynnwys stori annymunol am ddynion â gyrdd yn mynd ynghanol y nos i gartref dyn a leisiodd rhai amheuron ynglŷn â'r polisi amaethyddol. A gytunwch nad oes lle mewn cymdeithas yng Nghymru i dactegau colbiwr o fygythiadau a chodi ofn?

Carwyn Jones: Everyone is entitled to free speech without fear of intimidation.

Carwyn Jones: Mae gan bawb yr hawl i ryddid barn heb ofni bygythion.

Janet Ryder: Can you confirm whether an abatement order was served on the Astbury landfill site in Llay on Thursday night, and can you tell me the total number of carcasses that will be put into that site?

Janet Ryder: A allwch gadarnhau a gyflwynwyd gorchymyn dirymu ar safle tirlenwi Astbury yn Llai nos Iau, ac a allwch ddweud wrthyf faint o garcasau gaiff eu rhoi ar y safle hwnnw?

Carwyn Jones: The total number of carcasses is impossible to state at this stage because there is no indication from the intervention board as to the latest figures. Last week, the intervention board indicated that around 80,000 carcasses needed to be disposed of in Wales. A further 80,000 had to be disposed of elsewhere because they came from an infected area.

Carwyn Jones: Mae'n amhosibl nodi cyfanswm nifer y carcasau ar yr adeg hon oherwydd nid yw'r bwrdd ymyrraeth yn rhoi unrhyw awgrym o'r ffigurau diweddaraf. Yr wythnos diwethaf, nododd y bwrdd ymyrraeth fod angen gwaredu tua 80,000 yng Nghymru. Yr oedd yn rhaid gwaredu 80,000 arall yn rhywle arall gan eu bod wedi dod o ardal heintus.

With the Astbury site as with every other landfill site, the amount of animal carcasses that are dumped is limited to 5 per cent of the site's weekly load, which is three lorry-loads per day. Any impressions that people may have of several lorry-loads of carcasses being dumped is wrong as are those of carts carrying sheep with their legs in the air. When the first lorries entered the Astbury site, no-one noticed that they had been there because the operation was carried out so discreetly. It is important to emphasise that there is a limit to the number of carcasses that are dumped in these sites in a week. In fact, 95 per cent of the rubbish would be disposed of on that site anyway.

Kirsty Williams: You said that it is fair that farmers who previously registered stock on the welfare calf disposal scheme will now receive a lower price than they would have a week ago. However, will you investigate several cases in the Brecon and Radnorshire area where farmers were given dates before Monday, on which their stock would be collected under the welfare calf disposal scheme? Some even had lorries parked on their yards ready to transport the animals, but the licences were not faxed through. Will you take up these cases to ensure that farmers who were given dates of disposal will be fully compensated if you are unable to reinstate the prices, which should be done as a matter of principle?

Carwyn Jones: If you give me details of these individuals, I will take up the matter with the intervention board.

Nick Bourne: Further to points that have already been made by Peter Rogers and even loyal members of your own administration, such as Kirsty Williams and Mick Bates, on the welfare disposal scheme, is it not ill-advised to have called those payments 'generous'? We heard from the First Minister about co-operation with MAFF and how wonderful it is. When you criticised MAFF, it was referred to as the 'authority' in London. These people are from your own Government. What are you and Rhodri Morgan doing to reinstate the price, because that is what is needed? Was is not ill-advised

Gyda safle Astbury fel gyda phob safle tirlenwi arall, cyfyngir nifer y carcasau anifeiliaid a waredir i 5 y cant o lwyth wythnosol y safle, sef tair lori lawn bob dydd. Mae unrhyw argraffiadau a gaiff pobl fod nifer o lorïau yn llawn carcasau yn cael eu gwaredu yn anghywir yn yr un modd ag y mae'r argraffiadau hynny bod wagenni yn cario defaid a'u coesau yn yr awyr. Pan ddaeth y lorïau cyntaf i safle Astbury, ni sylwodd neb eu bod wedi bod yno oherwydd cyflawnwyd y gwaith yn ddisywlw. Mae'n bwysig pwysleisio bod terfyn i nifer y carcasau a waredir ar y safleoedd hyn mewn wythnos. Mewn gwirionedd, byddai 95 y cant o'r sbwriel yn cael ei waredu ar y safle hwnnw beth bynnag.

Kirsty Williams: Dywedasoeh ei fod yn deg bod ffermwyr a gofrestrodd anifeiliaid yn flaenorol ar y cynllun lles lloi-gwaredu yn cael pris is yn awr nag y byddent wedi ei gael wythnos yn ôl. Fodd bynnag, a ymchwiliwch i sawl achos yn ardal Brycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed lle yr hysbyswyd ffermwyr cyn dydd Llun o'r dyddiadau y byddai eu hanifeiliaid yn cael eu casglu o dan y cynllun lles lloi-gwaredu? Yr oedd rhai wedi parcio lorïau ar eu hierdydd hyd yn oed yn barod i gludo'r anifeiliaid, ond ni chafodd y trwyddedau eu hanfon atynt drwy'r ffacs. A ystyriwch yr achosion hyn er mwyn sicrhau y digolledir yn llawn ffermwyr y rhoddwyd dyddiadau gwaredu iddynt os na allwch adfer y prisiau, sef rhywbeth y dylid ei wneud fel mater o egwyddor?

Carwyn Jones: Os rhoddwch fanylion imi am yr unigolion hyn, trafodaf y mater gyda'r bwrdd ymyrraeth.

Nick Bourne: Ymhellach i'r pwyntiau a wnaethpwyd eisoes gan Peter Rogers a hyd yn oed gan aelodau ffyddlon o'ch gweinyddiaeth eich hun, fel Kirsty Williams a Mick Bates, ynglŷn â chynllun lles – gwaredu, onid oedd yn annoeth galw'r taliadau hynny yn rhai 'hael'? Clywsom gan Brif Weinidog Cymru am y cydweithio â MAFF a pha mor wych y mae. Pan feirniadwyd MAFF gennych, cyfeiriwyd ati fel yr 'awdurdod' yn Llundain. Daw'r bobl o'ch Llywodraeth chi. Beth a wnewch chi a Rhodri Morgan i adfer y pris, oherwydd dyna beth sydd ei angen? Onid oedd yn annoeth

to call these payments 'generous'?

Carwyn Jones: I am surprised to hear Nick Bourne suggest that we are all as one in the Labour party as the Conservatives are. That must surely mean that John Townend's views are held by everybody in the Conservative party. [CONSERVATIVE ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Answer the question.']

Parties are broad churches. We are an administration in Cardiff. We take our own decisions. We are members of the same party as the administration in London. It is a good administration and it will be re-elected in the general election.

The Presiding Officer: Order. This is a statement about foot and mouth disease, as the Minister well knows.

Tom Middlehurst: Given the reversal of the Environment Agency's decision regarding the suitability of the landfill site at Brookhill in my constituency, will you assure me that standards of disposal will be in no way compromised as a consequence of that decision and that the standards used for disposal will be common to all landfill sites in Wales?

Carwyn Jones: I give you that assurance, Tom. The situation at Brookhill was not that the site itself was not of the required standard, but that there were certain operational matters as to how the site could be used, which have now been resolved. However, following representations made by Flintshire County Council, it is right to say that the Environment Agency has accepted that the original load that it was thought that Brookhill could accept has now been halved.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yn eich adroddiad, Carwyn, cyfeiriwch at y trafferthion sydd wedi codi o ran gwaredu anifeiliaid sydd wedi eu difa ar Epynt ac mewn safleoedd tirlenwi eraill. A gytunwch pe baech wedi sicrhau bod cynlluniau wrth gefn ar gyfer argyfyngau o'r math hwn, yn benodol ar gyfer cael gwared ar anifeiliaid sydd wedi eu difa, fel y mae cyfraith Ewrop yn galw arnoch i'w wneud, na fyddai'r trafferthion hyn wedi codi i'r fath raddau?

galw'r taliadau hyn yn 'hael'?

Carwyn Jones: Yr oeddwn yn synnu i glywed Nick Bourne yn awgrymu ein bod megis un yn y blaid Lafur fel y mae'r Ceidwadwyr. Rhaid bod hynny'n golygu y coledir barn John Townend gan bawb yn y blaid Geidwadol siŵr o fod. [AELODAU CEIDWADOL O'R CYNULLIAD: 'Atebwch y cwestiwn.']

Mae pleidiau yn gynhwysol. Yr ydym yn weinyddiaeth yng Nghaerdydd. Gwnawn ein penderfyniadau ein hunain. Yr ydym yn aelodau o'r un blaid â'r weinyddiaeth yn Llundain. Mae'n weinyddiaeth dda a chaiff ei hailthol yn yr etholiad cyffredinol.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae hwn yn ddatganiad am glwy'r traed a'r genau, fel y gŵyr y Gweinidog yn dda.

Tom Middlehurst: O gofio bod Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd wedi gwrthdroi'r penderfyniad o ran addasrwydd y safle tirlenwi yn Brookhill yn fy etholaeth i, a roddwch sicrwydd imi na pheryglir y safonau gwaredu mewn unrhyw ffordd o ganlyniad i'r penderfyniad hwnnw ac y bydd y safonau a ddefnyddir i waredu yn gyffredin i bob safle tirlenwi yng Nghymru?

Carwyn Jones: Rhoddaf y sicrwydd hwnnw ichi Tom. Nid y ffaith nad oedd y safle o'r safon angenrheidiol oedd y broblem yn Brookhill ond bod rhai materion gweithredol o ran y ffordd y gellid defnyddio'r safle, sydd bellach wedi eu datrys. Fodd bynnag, yn dilyn sylwadau a wnaethpwyd gan Gyngor Sir y Fflint, mae'n iawn dweud bod Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd wedi derbyn bod y llwyth gwreiddiol y credwyd y gallai Brookhill ei dderbyn wedi ei haneru.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: In your report, Carwyn, you refer to the difficulties that have arisen in terms of disposing of culled animals on Epynt and other landfill sites. Do you agree that if you had ensured that there were contingency plans for these kind of crises, especially for the disposal of culled animals as required by European law, that these difficulties would not have arisen to the degree that they have?

Carwyn Jones: Nid oes rhaid i'r Cynulliad gael unrhyw fath o gynlluniau, gan nad yw'n rhan o'i gyfrifoldeb i ofalu am les anifeiliaid. Mae swyddogion y Cynulliad wedi gweithio'n galed o'r dechrau i sicrhau bod y clwyf yng Nghymru yn lleihau. Gallant ddweud eu bod wedi gwneud gwaith da. Nid yw lles anifeiliaid yn fater wedi ei ddatganoli ond, wrth wneud hynny, mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol wedi gweithio fel asiantaeth i MAFF. Mae llawer o'r cynlluniau sydd wedi eu llunio ar gyfer Cymru wedi cael eu paratoi yng Nghymru ac wedi'u gweithredu yng Nghymru. Mae'n glod mawr i swyddogion y Cynulliad eu bod wedi gallu gweithredu cynllun a luniwyd mor gyflym.

David Davies: What official advice is given to MAFF officials and support staff if they find symptoms of foot and mouth disease in animals which are being slaughtered on contiguous farms or under the livestock welfare disposal scheme? Are those animals properly tested or are they simply slaughtered and forgotten about?

Carwyn Jones: If there are outward signs of the disease in animals in the contiguous culls, they immediately become confirmed cases. Similarly, if there are outward signs of the disease in animals in the livestock welfare disposal scheme, they immediately become confirmed cases.

3:50 p.m.

Owen John Thomas: The consideration of the Lamby Way, Rumney, Cardiff landfill site as a possible location for disposal of carcasses is causing anxiety among local residents. Since I wrote to you 11 days ago—and I have not had a reply—there has been a case of foot and mouth disease in Wentloog, of which Lamby Way forms a part. Are you not concerned that if it is used as a landfill site, hundreds of trucks going back and forth into that diseased area stand a good chance of taking it to other parts of Wales? You said earlier that you were worried about people going to different places and yet you still intend to send hundreds of lorries into Lamby Way.

Carwyn Jones: The Assembly does not have to have any plans, since animal welfare is not a devolved issue. Assembly officials have worked hard from the beginning to ensure that the disease in Wales is minimised. They can say that they have done a great job. Animal welfare is not a devolved issue but, by doing this, the National Assembly has worked as a MAFF agency. Many plans that have been drawn up for Wales have been prepared in Wales and implemented in Wales. It is to the credit of Assembly officials that they have been able to implement a scheme that was drawn up so quickly.

David Davies: Pa gyngor swyddogol a roddir i swyddogion MAFF a staff cymorth os darganfyddant symptomau clwy'r traed a'r genau mewn anifeiliaid a leddir ar ffermydd cyffiniol neu o dan y cynllun lles da byw-gwaredu? A wneir y profion cywir ar yr anifeiliaid hynny neu a leddir hwy ac yna anghofio amdanynt?

Carwyn Jones: Os oes arwyddion allanol o'r clwyf mewn anifeiliaid sydd yn cael eu difa ar ffermydd cyffiniol, maent yn achosion wedi eu cadarnhau ar unwaith. Yn yr un modd, os oes arwyddion allanol o'r clwyf mewn anifeiliaid yn y cynllun lles da byw-gwaredu, deuant yn achosion wedi eu cadarnhau ar unwaith.

Owen John Thomas: Mae ystyried Lamby Way, Tredelerch, safle tirlenwi Caerdydd fel lleoliad posibl i waredu carcasau yn achosi pryder ymhlith trigolion lleol. Ers imi ysgrifennu atoch 11 diwrnod yn ôl—ac nid wyf wedi cael ateb—bu achos o glwy'r traed a'r genau yng Ngwynllŵg, ac mae Lamby Way yn rhan ohono. Oni ofidiwch, os caiff ei ddefnyddio fel safle tirlenwi, ei bod yn bosibl i gannoedd o lorïau sydd yn mynd yn ôl ac ymlaen i'r ardal heintus honno ei gludo i rannau eraill o Gymru? Dywedasoeh yn gynharach eich bod yn pryderu ynglŷn â phobl yn mynd i fannau gwahanol ac eto bwriadwch anfon cannoedd o lorïau i Lamby Way.

Carwyn Jones: Lamby Way can only take four trucks a day. It is hardly the case that hundreds of lorries will go into Lamby Way. The welfare disposal scheme comes to an end in two weeks time.

Owen John Thomas: Whatever number?

Carwyn Jones: Not hundreds? Thank you for that clarification: it was an exaggeration. The welfare disposal scheme will have to deal with a backlog. However, it is animals that are infectious, not carcasses. Carcasses cannot be infected by witchcraft through the air from animals that are miles away. Infection is carried from animal to animal. The risk of airborne infection between animal and carcasses over the course of miles is unheard of.

Christine Chapman: You will know that cases of foot and mouth disease have been confirmed in my constituency, Cynon Valley. I ask you to comment further on the options available to farmers with pedigree stud bulls that are ready for cattle breeding. As you know, they will become dangerous due to the current movement restrictions prohibiting their transfer for breeding purposes. I ask this question on behalf of a constituent of mine who values each of his stock at between £1,000 and £2,000. He is running out of feed at the moment and must sell them within the coming months to retain their value.

Carwyn Jones: With regard to the question of frisky bulls, I cannot offer any immediate practical advice. However, there are farmers who will find themselves within infected areas. If a welfare problem occurs, the livestock welfare disposal scheme would become available to them. If you refer me to the individual case, I will seek to do what I can.

Alun Cairns: My question is simple. Why did the Minister not consult with local residents in relation to the disposal of animal carcasses at Pwll y Watcyn and Tir John in Swansea? Will he agree with the Deputy Minister for Local Government who attacked him for the lack of consultation?

Carwyn Jones: I do not remember him

Carwyn Jones: Dim ond pedair lori y dydd y gall Lamby Way ei dderbyn. O'r braidd y bydd cannoedd o lorïau yn mynd i Lamby Way. Daw'r cynllun lles-gwaredu i ben mewn pythefnos.

Owen John Thomas: Pa rif bynnag?

Carwyn Jones: Nid cannoedd? Diolch ichi am yr eglurhad hwnnw: yr oedd yn or-ddweud. Bydd yn rhaid i'r cynllun lles-gwaredu ymdopi ag ôl-groniad. Fodd bynnag, anifeiliaid sydd yn heintus, nid carcasau. Ni ellir heintio carcasau drwy ddewiniaeth drwy'r awyr o anifeiliaid sydd filltiroedd i ffwrdd. Cludir yr haint o anifail i anifail. Ni chlywyd erioed bod risg o haint rhwng anifeiliaid a charcasau yn cael ei gludo drwy'r awyr am filltiroedd.

Christine Chapman: Gwyddoch fod achosion o glwy'r traed a'r genau wedi eu cadarnhau yn fy etholaeth i, Cwm Cynon. Gofynnaf ichi roi sylwadau pellach ar yr opsiynau sydd ar gael i ffermwyr â theirw o dras sydd yn barod ar gyfer bridio gwartheg. Fel y gwyddoch, byddant yn mynd yn beryglus oherwydd y cyfyngiadau presennol ar symud sydd yn eu hatal rhag cael eu trosglwyddo at ddibenion bridio. Gofynnaf y cwestiwn hwn ar ran un o'm hetholwyr sydd yn prisio pob un o'i anifeiliaid rhwng £1,000 a £2,000. Mae'r bwyd yn dod i ben a rhaid iddo eu gwerthu yn ystod y misoedd nesaf er mwyn cadw eu gwerth.

Carwyn Jones: O ran teirw bywiog, ni allaf gynnig unrhyw gyngor ymarferol uniongyrchol. Fodd bynnag, bydd ffermwyr mewn ardaloedd heintus. Os bydd problem lles yn codi, byddai'r cynllun lles da byw-gwaredu ar gael iddynt. Os gwnewch fy nghyfeirio at yr achos unigol, ceisiaf wneud yr hyn a allaf.

Alun Cairns: Mae fy nghwestiwn yn un syml. Pam nad ymgynghorodd y Gweinidog â thrigolion lleol mewn perthynas â gwaredu carcasau anifeiliaid yn Mhwll y Watcyn a Thir John yn Abertawe? A gytuna â'r Dirprwy Weinidog dros Lywodraeth Leol a'i beirniadodd am y diffyg ymgynghori?

Carwyn Jones: Ni chofiaf ef yn fy

attacking me for a lack of consultation. He issued a press release expressing his concern, which he then clarified. You must read the clarification of that press release. There is no point telling half the story. There are animals dying in the fields. We cannot sit back and have leisurely armchair consultations. This is an emergency and this administration knows how to deal with an emergency compared with the party of BSE.

Gwenda Thomas: Do you agree that when Alun Cairns talks about consulting with local residents that he, by implication, caused a great deal of worry in that community by his comments on the leachate? He should have said that the amendment to the protocol that is now governing landfill sites meant that the extra precautions taken with leachate is over and above what is usual on the site and that the leachate is now treated with acid that forms a further protection. Do you agree that in Pwll y Watcyn they are burying animals at five metres rather than three as is required and that they are currently using 3,000 gallons of disinfectant per three lorries?

Carwyn Jones: I was aware of four local Plaid Cymru councillors who suggested that instead of taking the animals to Pwll y Watcyn, a large hole should be dug in mid-Wales and they should be placed there. That is a matter of public record and I deplore the fact that a more national view could not have been taken by the so-called Party of Wales. In terms of the matters that you raised regarding Alun Cairns, you, Gwenda, were at public meetings and you discussed the matter with local people. It was because of your leadership in the community that people's concerns were assuaged in Gwauncaegurwen, Rhyd-y-fro and Brynman. That is something for which you deserve credit.

meirniadu am ddiffyg ymgynghori. Cyhoeddodd ddatganiad i'r wasg yn mynegi ei bryder, ac eglurodd hyn wedyn. Rhaid ichi ddarllen yr eglurhad o'r datganiad hwnnw i'r wasg. Nid oes unrhyw ddiben dweud hanner stori. Mae anifeiliaid yn marw ar y caeau. Ni allwn laesu dwylo ac ymgynghori'n hamddenol. Mae hwn yn argyfwng a gŵyr y weinyddiaeth sut i ddelio ag argyfwng o'i chymharu â phlaid BSE.

Gwenda Thomas: A gytunwch pan soniodd Alun Cairns am ymgynghori â thrigolion lleol ei fod, drwy oblygiad, wedi achosi llawer iawn o ofid yn y gymuned honno o ganlyniad i'w sylwadau ar y trwytholch? Dylai fod wedi dweud bod y newid i'r protocol sydd yn rheoli safleoedd tirlenwi erbyn hyn yn golygu bod y camau diogelu ychwanegol a gymerwyd o ran trwytholch yn fwy na'r hyn sydd yn arferol ar y safle a bod y trwytholch yn cael ei drin yn awr gydag asid sydd yn creu haen ddiogelu arall. A gytunwch eu bod ym Mhwll y Watcyn yn claddu anifeiliaid 5 metr i lawr yn hytrach na thri fel sydd yn ofynnol a'u bod yn defnyddio 3,000 o alwyni o ddiheintydd am bob tair lori?

Carwyn Jones: Yr oeddwn yn ymwybodol o bedwar o gynghorwyr lleol Plaid Cymru a awgrymodd y dylid cloddio twll mawr yng nghanolbarth Cymru ac y dylid rhoi'r anifeiliaid yno yn lle mynd â hwy i Bwll y Watcyn. Mae hynny'n hysbys i bawb a gresynaf na allai Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales fel y'i gelwir fod wedi cymryd barn fwy cenedlaethol. O ran y materion a godwyd gennych mewn perthynas ag Alun Cairns, yr oeddech chi, Gwenda, mewn cyfarfodydd cyhoeddus a thrafodasoch y mater â phobl leol. Lleddfwyd pryderon pobl yng Ngwauncaegurwen, Rhyd-y-fro a Brynman oherwydd eich arweinyddiaeth yn y gymuned. Mae hwnnw'n rhywbeth yr ydych yn haeddu canmoliaeth amdano.

Datganiad ar Dreialon Cnydau a Addaswyd yn Enetig Statement on Trials of Genetically Modified Crops

The Minister for Rural Affairs (Carwyn Jones): I have now received the scientific **Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Carwyn Jones):** Yr wyf bellach wedi

assessment that I requested from the Advisory Committee on Releases to the Environment in relation to the trials of genetically modified crops announced for three sites in Wales last month. In short, it does not constitute a sufficient basis for the exercise of my powers under section 110 of the Environmental Protection Act 1990 to restrict the planting of GM crops.

However, in pursuing the Assembly's policy of adopting the most restrictive approach possible, within the existing legislative framework, in relation to GM crops, I can also advise you that I have found a means to provide a basis to safeguard organic production in Wales. This will be done by placing separation distances between GM and non-GM production methods on a statutory basis. Acting in this way will trigger a notification to Europe under Article 16 of the European Directive 90/220. The contents of this statement have been discussed with the GM strategy group.

On 5 April, I informed Assembly Members of the Department of the Environment, Transport and the Regions' announcement that genetically modified T25 maize was set to be planted this spring at Mathry, Pembrokeshire, and at Sealand, Flintshire, as part of the farm-scale evaluations of genetically modified crops. Following that debate, Assembly officials wrote to the farmers involved in the trials enclosing the transcript of our proceedings and drawing their attention to the depth of local concern and principled objection to the trials.

As soon as the DETR announced the sites in Wales, we wrote to ACRE. We sought its advice over concerns as to whether the separation distances between GM and non-GM crops proposed in the SCIMAC guidelines was sufficient to protect the integrity of nearby non-GM maize crops, whether conventional or organic.

derbyn yr asesiad gwyddonol y gofynnais amdano gan y Pwyllgor Ymgynghorol ar Ollyngiadau i'r Amgylchedd mewn perthynas â threialon cynydau a addaswyd yn enetig a gyhoeddwyd ar gyfer tri safle yng Nghymru fis diwethaf. Yn gryno, nid yw'n sail ddigonol i arfer fy mhwerau o dan adran 110 Deddf Diogelu'r Amgylchedd 1990 i gyfyngu ar blannu cynydau a addaswyd yn enetig.

Fodd bynnag, wrth ddilyn polisi'r Cynulliad o fabwysiadu'r ymagwedd fwyaf cyfyngol posibl, o fewn y fframwaith deddfwriaethol presennol, mewn perthynas â chnydau a addaswyd yn enetig, gallaf hefyd eich hysbysu fy mod wedi dod o hyd i ddull o ddarparu sail i ddiogelu cynhyrchu cynydau organig yng Nghymru. Gwneir hyn drwy bennu pellteroedd gwahanu rhwng dulliau cynhyrchu cynydau a addaswyd yn enetig a chnydau heb eu haddasu'n enetig. Bydd gweithredu yn y modd hwn yn rhoi hysbysiad i Ewrop o dan Erthygl 16 Cyfarwyddeb Ewropeaidd 90/220. Trafodwyd cynnwys y datganiad hwn gyda grŵp strategaeth cynydau a addaswyd yn enetig.

Ar 5 Ebrill, hysbysais Aelodau'r Cynulliad o gyhoeddiad Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau y bwriadwyd plannu indrawn T25 wedi'i addasu'n enetig y gwanwyn hwn ym Mathri, Sir Benfro, ac yn Sealand, Sir y Fflint fel rhan o asesiadau fferm gyfan o gnydau a addaswyd yn enetig. Yn dilyn y ddadl honno, ysgrifennodd swyddogion y Cynulliad at y ffermwyr a oedd yn cymryd rhan yn y treialon yn amgáu trawsysgrifiad o'r gweithrediadau ac yn tynnu eu sylw at faint y pryder lleol a'r gwrthwynebiad i'r treialon o ran egwyddor.

Cyn gynted ag y cyhoeddodd Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau y safleoedd yng Nghymru, ysgrifenasom at ACRE. Gofynnasom am ei gyngor ynghylch a oedd y pellteroedd gwahanu rhwng cynydau a addaswyd yn enetig a chnydau heb eu haddasu'n enetig a argymhellwyd yng nghanllawiau SCIMAC yn ddigonol i ddiogelu integredd cynydau indrawn cyfagos nad oeddent yn gnydau a addaswyd yn enetig, pa un a oeddent yn gonfensiynol neu'n organig.

ACRE gave these concerns detailed consideration at its meeting on 26 April. It took the view that, based on its review of the best available information in the scientific and plant-breeding literature, the existing separation distances are reliable. The nearest organic holding to any of the Welsh trial sites is at a distance of 650 metres. ACRE advises that should forage, maize or sweetcorn be grown, any contamination through cross-pollination with GM organisms would be significantly below 0.1 per cent.

ACRE accepted that pollen drift studies had not been carried out at the proposed trial sites in Wales, but questioned whether the topography and wind-speed characteristics were unique. I am asking my officials to commission further studies on that point. Should any new evidence emerge we could, of course, refer it back to ACRE for further advice. ACRE is preparing a note of its advice, which includes all the issues raised by the Assembly. This note will be made available shortly and I will circulate it to all Members.

The Assembly also invited ACRE's views on the issue of harm, as defined in the Environmental Protection Act 1990, and how this might impact on its assessment of separation distance. ACRE advised that it was not constituted to advise on points of law, but has, in its forward work programme, a detailed scientific and biological definition of harm as applied to the deliberate release of genetically modified organisms. This is a complex issue for which guidance is unlikely to be available until the end of 2001. However, I am pleased to have pushed forward the clarification of this area of the law and practise.

On legal concerns, in parallel with scientific assessment I have sought further advice on the legal framework pertaining to the release of GMOs. I am advised that on the basis of the scientific assessment there are no grounds on which I could exercise my powers under Section 110 of the Environmental Protection Act 1990 to issue an environmental prohibition notice, which would have the

Rhoddodd ACRE ystyriaeth fanwl i'r pryderon hyn yn ei gyfarfod ar 26 Ebrill. Yr oedd o'r farn, yn seiliedig ar ei adolygiad o'r wybodaeth orau sydd ar gael mewn llenyddiaeth wyddonol a thyfu planhigion, bod y pellteroedd gwahanu presennol yn ddibynadwy. Mae pellter o 650 metr rhwng y fferm organig sydd agosaf at unrhyw un o'r safleoedd treialu yng Nghymru a'r safle ei hun. Cynghora ACRE, pe tyfid porthiant, indrawn neu india corn, y byddai unrhyw heintio drwy groesbeilliad gydag organebau a addaswyd yn enetig yn sylweddol is na 0.1 y cant.

Derbyniodd ACRE na chynhaliwyd astudiaethau symudiad paill ar safleoedd arfaethedig y treialon yng Nghymru, ond gofynnodd a oedd y nodweddion topograffi a chyflymder y gwynt yn unigryw. Gofynnaf i'm swyddogion gomisiynu astudiaethau pellach ar y pwynt hwnnw. Os daw unrhyw dystiolaeth newydd i'r fei gallem, wrth gwrs, ei gyfeirio yn ôl at ACRE i gael cyngor pellach. Mae ACRE yn paratoi nodyn o'i gyngor, sydd yn cynnwys yr holl faterion a godwyd gan y Cynulliad. Bydd y nodyn hwn ar gael yn fuan a byddaf yn ei ddisbarthu i bob Aelod.

Gwahoddodd y Cynulliad hefyd farn ACRE ar ddifrod, fel y'i diffinnir yn Neddf Diogelu'r Amgylchedd 1990, a sut y gallai hyn effeithio ar ei asesiad o bellter gwahanu. Nododd ACRE na chafodd ei sefydlu i roi cyngor ar bwyntiau o gyfraith, ond mae ganddo, yn ei flaenraglen waith, ddiffiniad gwyddonol a biolegol manwl o ddifrod mewn perthynas â rhyddhau organebau a addaswyd yn enetig yn fwriadol. Mae hwn yn fater cymhleth ac nid yw'n debygol y bydd canllaw ar gael tan ddiwedd 2001. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn falch o fod wedi mynnu eglurhad o'r maes hwn o'r gyfraith ac arfer.

O ran pryderon cyfreithiol, ochr yn ochr ag asesiadau gwyddonol yr wyf wedi ceisio cyngor pellach ar y fframwaith cyfreithiol sydd yn ymwneud â rhyddhau organebau a addaswyd yn enetig. Fe'm cynghorir ar sail asesiadau gwyddonol nad oes unrhyw sail imi allu gweithredu fy mhwerau o dan Adran 110 Deddf Diogelu'r Amgylchedd 1990 i gyhoeddi hysbysiad gwahardd amgylcheddol,

effect of halting the trials. Nor are there other grounds for the issue of a prohibition notice that would have that effect. I conveyed that to the all-party GM strategy group on 27 April.

It is likely that a blanket prohibition notice preventing any farm-scale trials in Wales would be considered an inexplicable and disproportionate response for the potential environmental harm, which the scientific assessment identifies. Such a response would contravene the directive, which, subject to the Article 16 procedures, provides that member states may not prohibit, restrict or impede the placing on the market of products containing GMOs that comply with the directive. A disproportionate interference with this right, on grounds that are not justified under Article 16, would give rise to a serious risk of legal challenge in the courts. If I were to prohibit the trials, in the absence of scientific and legal justifications, there would be a high risk of an award of substantial damages against the Assembly based on a serious breach of community law leading to consequent economic loss. It could have the further adverse effect of undermining specific measures that we have in mind to give legal effect to separation distances by casting doubt on the genuineness of our concerns.

4:00 p.m.

I recognise that some Members, particularly those living close to the trial sites, will be disappointed with this outcome. However, I assure you that I have pursued every avenue of scientific and legal advice in order to further the Assembly's adoption of the most restrictive policy possible within the constraints of the EU and the domestic legislative framework.

While a ban is not possible, we have identified grounds on which we can act to safeguard the integrity of organic and conventional production. Regulatory force can be given to the establishment of separation distances between GM and non-GM crops through the issue of Section 110 notices under the Environmental Protection

a fyddai wedi atal y treialon. Nid oes ychwaith seiliau eraill dros gyhoeddi hysbysiad gwahardd a gâi yr effaith honno. Cyfleais hynny i'r grŵp strategaeth pob plaid ar gnydau a addaswyd yn enetig ar 27 Ebrill.

Mae'n debygol y câi hysbysiad gwahardd cyffredinol yn atal unrhyw dreialon fferm gyfan rhag cael eu cynnal yng Nghymru ei ystyried yn ymateb anesboniadwy ac anghymesur mewn perthynas â'r niwed amgylcheddol posibl, a nodir gan yr asesiad gwyddonol. Byddai ymateb o'r fath yn groes i'r gyfarwyddeb, sydd, yn amodol ar weithdrefnau Erthygl 16, yn nodi na all aelod wladwriaethau atal, cyfyngu neu lesteirio rhoi cynnyrch sydd yn cynnwys organebau a addaswyd yn enetig sydd yn cydymffurfio â'r gyfarwyddeb ar y farchnad. Byddai ymyrryd yn anghymesur â'r hawl hon, ar seiliau na ellir eu cyfiawnhau o dan Erthygl 16, yn arwain at y posibilrwydd o her gyfreithiol yn y llysoedd. Pe bawn yn gwahardd y treialon, yn absenoldeb cyfiawnhad gwyddonol a chyfreithiol, byddai perygl mawr o ddyfarnu iawndal sylweddol yn erbyn y Cynulliad yn seiliedig ar achos difrifol o dor-cyfraith gymunedol a fyddai'n arwain at golled economaidd. Gallai gael yr effaith andwyol bellach o danseilio mesurau penodol sydd gennym mewn golwg i roi grym cyfreithiol i bellteroedd gwahanu drwy fwrw amheuaeth ar ddiwylledd ein pryderon.

Cydnabyddaf y bydd rhai Aelodau, yn arbennig y rheini sydd yn byw gerllaw safleoedd y treialon, yn siomedig gyda'r canlyniad hwn. Fodd bynnag, rhoddaf sicrwydd ichi fy mod wedi mynd ar drywydd pob cyngor gwyddonol a chyfreithiol er mwyn sicrhau bod y Cynulliad yn mabwysiadu'r polisi mwyaf cyfyngedig posibl o fewn cyfyngiadau'r UE a'r fframwaith deddfwriaethol domestig.

Er nad yw gwaharddiad yn bosibl, yr ydym wedi nodi seiliau y gallwn weithredu arnynt er mwyn diogelu integreidd cynhyrchu cnydau organig a chonfensiynol. Gellir rhoi grym rheoleiddio i sefydlu pellteroedd gwahanu rhwng cnydau a addaswyd yn enetig a chnydau heb eu haddasu'n enetig drwy gyhoeddi hysbysiaidau Adran 110 o dan

Act 1990. This would ensure that wherever the progeny of T25 maize is cultivated, separation distances to registered organic or conventional maize crops would be enforced. The practical consequences are that farm scale evaluations of GM maize would have to respect those separation differences, thus safeguarding an environment in which conventionally and organically pure crops can be grown. Although the tests announced for Wales would be unaffected directly by this measure, it has the effect of introducing for the first time a statutory safeguard of organic reproduction.

If these powers were invoked, the European Commission and other member states would be notified on the basis of concerns raised by the Assembly, using the procedure under Article 16 of the European Directive 90/220. We are aware that the Department of the Environment, Transport and the Regions is also considering this course of action since ACRE was briefed to this effect last Thursday. An Article 16 notification would give the National Assembly an opportunity to take its legitimate and principled concerns directly to the European Commission.

Richard Edwards: I thank you for that statement. As the Assembly Member for Preseli Pembrokeshire, I would like to place on the record my bitter disappointment at your decision not to issue a prohibition notice. I assure you that that disappointment is shared by almost everyone in Pembrokeshire, the odd rogue ex-Tory MP notwithstanding, and by people all over Wales. I hear what you say in defence of your position, although I have to say that Friends of the Earth hotly dispute the legal niceties. I welcome your intention to establish a statutory basis for prescribed minimum distances, but I hope that you do not expect my constituents or I to leap with joy. With respect, how many years will that take to enact? It will not help the organic farmers and beekeepers in north Pembrokeshire. No green, clean future for us.

This is not only about distance is it? There are safety, environmental, economic and

Ddeddf Diogelu'r Amgylchedd 1990. Byddai hyn yn sicrhau lle bynnag y tyfir hiliogaeth indrawn T25, câi pellteroedd gwahanu oddi wrth gnydau indrawn organig neu gonfensiynol wedi'u cofrestru eu gweithredu. Y canlyniadau ymarferol yw y byddai'n rhaid i asesiadau fferm gyfan o indrawn wedi'i addasu'n enetig barchu'r gwahaniaethau gwahanu hynny, gan ddiogelu amgylchedd lle gellir tyfu cnydau pur confensiynol ac organig. Er na fyddai'r mesur hwn yn effeithio'n uniongyrchol ar y profion a gyhoeddwyd ar gyfer Cymru, byddai am y tro cyntaf yn cyflwyno diogelwch statudol ar gyfer atgynhyrchu organig.

Pe gweithredid y pwerau hyn, byddai'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd ac aelod wladwriaethau eraill yn cael eu hysbysu ar sail pryderon a godwyd gan y Cynulliad, gan ddefnyddio'r weithdrefn o dan Erthygl 16 Cyfarwyddeb Ewropeaidd 90/220. Yr ydym yn ymwybodol bod Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau hefyd yn ystyried cymryd y cam hwn gan i ACRE gael gwybodaeth i'r perwyl hwn ddydd Iau diwethaf. Byddai hysbysiad o dan Erthygl 15 yn rhoi cyfle i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gyflwyno ei bryderon dilys ac egwyddorol yn uniongyrchol i'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd.

Richard Edwards: Diolch ichi am y datganiad hwnnw. Fel Aelod y Cynulliad dros Breseli Sir Benfro, hoffwn gofnodi fy siom ddirfawr yn sgîl eich penderfyniad i beidio â chyhoeddi hysbysiad gwahardd. Fe'ch sicrhaf y caiff y siom honno ei rhannu gan bron pawb yn Sir Benfro, ar wahân i ambell ddihiryn o gyn-AS Torïaidd, a chan bobl drwy Gymru benbaladr. Clywaf yr hyn a ddywedwch i amddiffyn eich sefyllfa, er bod yn rhaid imi ddweud bod Cyfeillion y Ddaear yn dadlau'n gryf yn erbyn y manylion cyfreithiol. Croesawaf eich bwriad i sefydlu sail statudol ar gyfer isafswm pellteroedd penodedig, ond gobeithiaf nad ydych yn disgwyl i'm hetholwyr na minnau ymlawenhau. Gyda phob parch, sawl blwyddyn y cymer hynny i'w weithredu? Ni fydd o gymorth i ffermwyr organig a gwynwyr gogledd Sir Benfro. Dim dyfodol gwyrdd, glân i ni.

Nid ymwneud â phellter yn unig y mae'r mater hwn. Mae diogelwch, yr amgylchedd,

health issues at stake as well. The body responsible for maintaining bio-diversity in Wales is the Assembly sponsored Countryside Council for Wales. Why did this body not offer any advice beyond reiterating support for the trials in line with scientific assessments undertaken by English Nature? Do you call that being supportive when the Assembly is endeavouring to keep Wales GM free? It is supposed to offer independent advice but based on what? Did the CCW make a site-specific assessment of local conditions at Mathry? I, nor anyone else, knows of such an assessment. It says that there is not a scientific reason for opposing GM trials, but it has not proved this scientifically. Simply passing on a blanket assurance from English Nature, with no site-specific studies, is bad science. Furthermore, why did CCW not advise you, or your officials, that a candidate special area of conservation had been designated for an area that almost certainly included parts of the trial sites at Mathry? Supply Chain Initiative on Modified Agricultural Crops and the scientific steering committee that took the decision to locate trials at Mathry were presumably unaware of this despite the fact that the European Commission had been notified in March under the European Habitats Directive. The otter, a protected species, lives in and around the western Cleddau river, adjacent to the field trial site. Did you know that? Is it not true that the landowner could be liable to criminal proceedings if he has not researched the specific effects of the Chardon LL variety of GM maize on the local otter population? The idea of GM trials in a special area of conservation is preposterous. Should we not use the terms of the European habitats directive and environmental protection legislation to apply the precautionary principle?

I have received e-mails from scientists accusing me of Ludditism. I am no Luddite, but neither am I an apologist for the agricultural industry, which masquerades in this

yr economi ac iechyd yn y fantol hefyd. Y corff sydd yn gyfrifol am gynnal bioamrywiaeth yng Nghymru yw Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru a noddir gan y Cynulliad. Pam na chynigiodd y corff hwn unrhyw gyngor ar wahân i ailadrodd cefnogaeth i'r treialon yn unol ag asesiadau gwyddonol a gynhelir gan English Nature? A ydych yn ystyried bod hynny'n gefnogol pan fydd y Cynulliad yn ymdrechu i gadw Cymru yn rhydd o addasu genetig? Dylai gynnig cyngor annibynnol ond yn seiliedig ar beth? A wnaeth Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru asesiad o amodau lleol y safle penodol ym Mathri? Ni wn i, nac unrhyw un arall, am unrhyw asesiad o'r fath. Dywed nad oes unrhyw reswm gwyddonol dros wrthwynebu treialon cynydau a addaswyd yn enetig, ond nid yw wedi profi hyn yn wyddonol. Mae gwneud dim heblaw trosglwyddo sicrwydd cyffredinol gan English Nature, heb unrhyw astudiaethau o safleoedd penodol, yn wyddoniaeth wael. At hynny, pam na wnaeth Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru eich cynghori chi, neu eich swyddogion, fod ardal sydd yn ddarpar ardal gadwraeth arbennig wedi'i neilltuo ar gyfer ardal a oedd bron yn sicr yn cynnwys rhannau o safleoedd y treialon ym Mathri? Tybiaf nad oedd y Fenter Cadwyn Gyflenwi ar Gnydau Amaethyddol a Addaswyd a'r pwyllgor llywio gwyddonol a wnaeth y penderfyniad i leoli treialon ym Mathri yn ymwybodol o hyn er gwaethaf y ffaith fod y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd wedi ei hysbysu fis Mawrth o dan Gyfarwyddeb Cynefinoedd Ewropeaidd. Mae'r dyfrgi, sydd yn rhywogaeth a ddiogelir, yn byw yn afon Cleddau wen ac o'i hamgylch, gerllaw safle'r treialon maes. Wyddech chi hynny? Onid yw'n wir y gallai'r tîrfeddiannwr fod yn destun achos cyfreithiol os na fydd wedi ymchwilio i effeithiau penodol math Chardon LL o indrawn wedi'i addasu'n enetig ar y dyfrgwn lleol? Mae'r syniad o dreialon cynydau a addaswyd yn enetig mewn ardal gadwraeth arbennig yn hurt. Oni ddylem ddefnyddio termau'r gyfarwyddeb cynefinoedd Ewropeaidd a deddfwriaeth diogelu'r amgylchedd i gymhwyso'r egyddor rhagofal?

Yr wyf wedi derbyn negeseuon e-bost gan wyddonwyr yn fy nghyhuddo o Ludiaeth. Nid Ludiad mohonof, ond nid diffynnydd mohonof ychwaith ar ran y diwydiant

matter as independent scientific observer. Is it not a fact that there is no settled scientific view on GM? We are far from a consensus. History is littered with false assurances from so-called independent scientists; you need look no further than BSE. The precautionary principle should be paramount.

It could be argued that we are all prisoners, the Government and the people alike, in thrall to the all-powerful multinational agro-chemical companies. Their greed takes priority over the public interest and the democratic choice of citizens in Wales, and elsewhere. Governments have written off political control, and therefore democratic accountability, for vital areas of public policy to so-called independent scientists. They have not shown themselves to be good at understanding local politics, or social and economic issues. I ask seriously whether they are any good at science. Is it any wonder that feelings are running high in Mathry, in the face of this democratic vacuum? Who controls our countryside—Aventis? Monsanto? It is totally unacceptable. Christine Gwyther and I will shortly present a Friends of the Earth petition to the First Minister, to plead for a moratorium. Over 5,000 people have signed it. I have no doubt that almost all the 50,000 plus electors in Preseli Pembrokeshire would have signed it, if they had had the opportunity. I appeal to you and the First Minister not to take this lying down, but to fight to the last ditch and join forces with the growing chorus across the English border, where there are also absurdities—for example, a proposed trial less than two miles from Ryton showpiece organic gardens. Let us have the courage to pit the will of people against the power of multinational capital, people before profit and our environment before Aventis's greed. We must have a moratorium. Will you please do all you can to press for one?

Carwyn Jones: Thank you for that powerful speech delivered on behalf of your constituents, and containing a wide range of issues. I will deal with one or two of them.

The Assembly's resolution is that we do all

amaeth-gemegol, sydd yn ffugio bod yn arsylwr gwyddonol annibynnol yn y mater hwn. Onid yw'n ffaith nad oes unrhyw farn wyddonol bendant ar gnydau a addaswyd yn enetig? Yr ydym ymhell o gael consensws. Mae hanes yn frith o ffug addewidion gan wyddonwyr annibynnol bondigrybwyll; nid oes rhaid edrych ymhellach na BSE. Dylai'r egwyddor rhagofal fod yn hollbwysig.

Gellid dadlau ein bod oll yn garcharorion, y Llywodraeth a'r bobl fel ei gilydd, yn gaeth i'r cwmnïau amaeth-gemegol amlwladol holl bwerus. Mae eu trachwant yn trarglwyddiaethu dros fudd y cyhoedd a dewis democrataidd dinasyddion yng Nghymru, ac mewn mannau eraill. Mae llywodraethau wedi ildio rheolaeth wleidyddol, ac felly atebolrwydd democrataidd, ar gyfer meysydd hollbwysig o bolisi cyhoeddus i'r gwyddonwyr annibynnol bondigrybwyll. Nid ydynt wedi dangos y gallant ddeall gwleidyddiaeth leol, na materion cymdeithasol ac economaidd yn dda. Gofynnaf o ddifrif a ydynt yn wyddonwyr. Nid oes ryfedd fod teimladau cryf ym Mathri, yn wyneb y gwactod democrataidd hwn. Pwy sydd yn rheoli ein cefn gwlad—Aventis? Monsanto? Mae'n hollol annerbyniol. Cyn bo hir bydd Christine Gwyther a minnau yn cyflwyno deiseb gan Gyfeillion y Ddaear i Brif Weinidog Cymru, i erfyn am foratoriwm. Mae dros 5,000 o bobl wedi'i llofnodi. Nid oes amheuaeth gennyf y byddai bron bob un o'r 50,000 a mwy o etholwyr Preseli Sir Benfro wedi'i llofnodi, pe cawsant y cyfle. Apeliaf arnoch chi a'r Prif Weinidog i beidio ildio i hyn, ond i ymladd i'r pen ac ymuno â'r côr sydd yn tyfu ar draws y ffin yn Lloegr. Mae gwallgofrwydd yno hefyd—er enghraifft, treial arfaethedig lai na dwy filltir o erddi organig gwych Ryton. Gadewch inni gael yr hyder i roi ewyllys y bobl yn erbyn grym cyfalaf amlwladol, pobl cyn elw a'n hamgylchedd cyn trachwant Aventis. Rhaid inni gael moratoriwm. A wnewch bopeth o fewn eich gallu i bwysu am un?

Carwyn Jones: Diolch ichi am yr araith bwerus honno a gyflwynwyd ar ran eich etholwyr. Mae'n cynnwys ystod eang o faterion ac ymdriniaf ag un neu ddau ohonynt.

Penderfyniad y Cynulliad yw y gwnawn

that we can to restrict the growth of GM crops. I believe that this policy represents that resolution. As regards the legal niceties, as you described them, we do not have a leg to stand on, in terms of the law. It is not a matter of one case against the other. We do not have anything. We could be left open to charges of maladministration and misfeasance. We asked Friends of the Earth if they could help us and they could not. We asked them what science they had available that we could use to consider a full prohibition notice and they could not give us any. The door was open to any number of organisations to help us, but, unfortunately, although no stone was left unturned, no organisations could help us.

You raised wider issues with regard to a moratorium. It is right that these issues are debated. However, importantly, this game is played on the European playing field. If we were to make this prohibition notice, notification would be made to the European Commission, which would allow us to put forward our case at a European level. This is not a party-political issue, and the whole Assembly can feel proud that it will do something that will indirectly raise the profile of the GM and organic debate at the European level. That is a side effect, I emphasise that it is not the reason why the prohibition notice would be made, but it would raise the question more widely.

Jocelyn Davies: I share Richard Edwards's disappointment, but I am delighted to hear that we may now have identified a way to protect organic and conventional producers from GM cross-pollination. We should pursue the European route as far as possible, and join with like-minded governments elsewhere in Europe. Your threat to issue a prohibition order preventing the planting has failed and, obviously, it would have made more sense to seek advice before making that threat. However, never mind, we will learn from that mistake. The Assembly would like to see an end to these trials. Therefore, will you meet with the farmers, in an attempt to dissuade them from continuing with the trials, because charm may well work where threats have failed? We were in exactly the same position last May, when we also failed

bopeth o fewn ein gallu i gyfyngu ar dyfu cynydau a addaswyd yn enetig. Credaf fod y polisi hwn yn cynrychioli'r penderfyniad hwnnw. O ran y manylion cyfreithiol, fel y disgrifiasoch hwy, nid oes gennym goes i sefyll arni, o ran y gyfraith. Nid mater o un achos yn erbyn y llall ydyw. Nid oes achos gennym. Gallem gael ein cyhuddo o gamweinyddu a chamweithredu. Gofynasom i Gyfeillion y Ddaear a allent ein helpu ond ni allasant. Gofynasom iddynt pa wyddoniaeth oedd ar gael iddynt y gallem ei defnyddio i ystyried hysbysiad gwahardd llawn ac ni allasent roi unrhyw beth inni. Yr oedd y drws ar agor i nifer o sefydliadau ein helpu, ond, yn anffodus, er inni wneud ein gorau, ni allai unrhyw sefydliad ein helpu.

Codasoch faterion ehangach o ran moratoriwm. Mae'n briodol cynnal dadl ar y materion hyn. Fodd bynnag, yn bwysicach, chwaraeir y gêm hon ar faes chwarae Ewropeaidd. Pe baem yn gwneud yr hysbysiad gwahardd hwn, câi y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd ei hysbysu, a fyddai'n caniatáu inni gyflwyno ein hachos ar lefel Ewropeaidd. Nid mater gwleidyddiaeth pleidiau yw hwn, a gall y Cynulliad cyfan ymfalchïo y bydd yn gwneud rhywbeth a fydd yn anuniongyrchol yn codi proffil dadl cynydau a addaswyd yn enetig a chnydau organig ar lefel Ewropeaidd. Sgîl effaith yw hynny. Pwysleisiaf nad dyma'r rheswm dros wneud yr hysbysiad gwahardd, ond byddai'n codi'r cwestiwn yn ehangach.

Jocelyn Davies: Rhannaf siom Richard Edwards, ond yr wyf yn falch iawn o glywed y gallem bellach fod wedi nodi ffordd o ddiogelu cynhyrchwyr organig a chonfensiynol rhag croesbeilliad cynydau a addaswyd yn enetig. Dylem ddilyn y llwybr Ewropeaidd mor bell â phosibl, ac ymuno â llywodraethau o'r un anian mewn mannau eraill yn Ewrop. Mae eich bygythiad i gyhoeddi hysbysiad gwahardd i atal y plannu wedi methu ac, yn amlwg, byddai wedi gwneud mwy o synnwyr i ofyn am gyngor cyn gwneud y bygythiad hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn dysgu o'r camgymeriad hwnnw. Hoffai'r Cynulliad weld diwedd ar y treialon hyn. Felly, a wnewch chi gwrrd â'r ffermwyr, mewn ymdrech i'w darbwylllo i beidio â pharhau gyda'r treialon, oherwydd gallai cyfaredd weithio lle y methodd

to prevent the trials from continuing. What preparations have you made for the inevitable return of the trials this year, and what preparations will you make for the return of the trials next spring, which will be their last year?

4:10 p.m.

You have indicated, on more than one occasion, that direct losses incurred by organic and conventional producers as a result of cross-pollination may be recovered. From whom? Do we not have a moral obligation to support the small organic farmer against the massive multinational company? How long do you estimate it will take to go through the article 16 procedure of the GMO Directive 90/220/EEC?

Carwyn Jones: It is not possible at this stage to say how long it will take. The European Commission works to its own timetable in many ways. However, it would allow us the opportunity of taking our case to the European level, although that is not a factor in making the prohibition notice. That is made entirely on the basis of the legal advice that we have received and in order to safeguard organic production. It is a side-effect, not part of the decision-making process, that this matter can be taken to a European level.

It is important to remember that, this time last year, we started from a legal basis of nil. As far as we were aware, we had no powers last year to do anything. We have moved away from that situation, but we do not have the powers that we would like. In order to have the powers that we desire, we would need to be an independent state outside of the European Union, because safeguarding and regulating these crops is part of a European system. Representations with a view to changing the regime must, therefore, be made at a European level. It is important to remember that our position today is a significant development compared with where we started. We can all be proud of that.

bygythion? Yr oeddem yn yr un sefyllfa yn union fis Mai diwethaf, pan fethasom ag atal y treialon rhag mynd rhagddynt. Pa baratoadau yr ydych wedi'u gwneud ar gyfer dychweliad anochel y treialon eleni, a pha baratoadau a wnewch ar gyfer dychweliad y treialon y gwanwyn nesaf, sef eu blwyddyn olaf?

Yr ydych wedi nodi, ar fwy nag un achlysur, y gellir adfer colledion uniongyrchol a ddioddefir gan gynhyrchwyr organig a chonfensiynol o ganlyniad i groesbeilliad. Gan bwy? Onid oes gennym ddyletswydd foesol i gefnogi ffermydd organig bach yn erbyn y cwmnïau amlwladol enfawr? Pa mor hir yr ydych yn amcangyfrif y bydd yn ei gymryd i fynd drwy weithdrefn erthygl 16 Cyfarwyddeb Organebau a Addaswyd yn Enetig 90/220/EEC?

Carwyn Jones: Nid yw'n bosibl ar yr adeg hon i ddweud pa mor hir y bydd yn ei gymryd. Mae'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn gweithio i'w amserlen ei hun mewn sawl ystyr. Fodd bynnag, byddai'n rhoi'r cyfle inni fynd â'n hachos i lefel Ewropeaidd, er nad yw hynny'n ffactor wrth wneud yr hysbysiad gwahardd. Gwneir hynny yn gyfan gwbl ar sail y cyngor cyfreithiol a gawsom ac er mwyn diogelu cynhyrchu cynydu organig. Sgîl-effaith, nid rhan o'r broses gwneud penderfyniadau, yw'r ffaith y gellir mynd â'r mater hwn i lefel Ewropeaidd.

Mae'n bwysig cofio, yr adeg hon y llynedd, ein bod wedi dechrau o sail gyfreithiol o ddim. Cyhyd ag y gwyddom, nid oedd gennym unrhyw bwerau y llynedd i wneud unrhyw beth. Nid ydym yn y sefyllfa honno bellach, ond nid oes gennym y pwerau yr hoffem eu cael. Er mwyn inni gael y pwerau a ddymunwn, byddai angen inni fod yn wladwraeth annibynnol y tu allan i'r Undeb Ewropeaidd, gan fod diogelu a rheoleiddio'r cynydu hyn yn rhan o'r system Ewropeaidd. Felly, rhaid gwneud sylwadau gyda'r bwriad o newid y system ar lefel Ewropeaidd. Mae'n bwysig cofio bod ein sefyllfa heddiw yn ddatblygiad sylweddol o'i gymharu â'r man cychwyn. Gallwn oll ymfalchïo yn hynny.

Mick Bates: I share the general disappointment that we cannot, at present, prohibit the GM crop trials. However, I welcome the fact that, as you said, we have made progress, through our partnership agreement, by establishing the GM strategy group.

This issue exposes the contradiction that exists between the Assembly's promotion of organic farming and environmentally-friendly practices and the permission of GM crop trials. I welcome the mechanism that you have identified for taking this issue to the European Commission. Furthermore, it may benefit us to hold a conference with other member states and regions of Europe that wish to follow our aspiration regarding restricting GM crops. We have an opportunity to put a Welsh voice at the heart of European policy. There are many regions in Europe that wish to follow our example and, as an Assembly, we should take a lead in that. I would like to hear your view, Minister, on committing the Assembly to invite other European regions and member states to Wales to discuss how that policy could be promoted through the European Commission.

I would also like to hear some more about the timescale of your proposal to use Section 110 of the Environmental Protection Act 1990, because there is deep concern that this process may go on and on, to such an extent that we will be swamped by Monsanto and Aventis, as they dominate world agriculture. It is fitting, on a day when we discuss globalisation, that we heard from Richard Edwards about an ethical stance on the promotion of GM crops. These companies, undoubtedly, wish to control the market, not only for the seed, but for the herbicides and pesticides that would follow. I would like to hear your view on how you can ensure that this timescale is fitting and would work, so that next year we can stop these trials if possible, through the separation distances. Finally, you referred to writing to farmers after our last debate. Can you confirm that these farmers are liable to any damage caused, or any harm to the environment, by their GM trials?

Mick Bates: Rhannaf y siom gyffredinol na allwn, ar hyn o bryd, wahardd treialon cynydau a addaswyd yn enetig. Fodd bynnag, croesawaf y ffaith, fel y dywedasoeh, ein bod wedi gwneud cynnydd, drwy ein cytundeb partneriaeth, drwy sefydlu'r grŵp strategaeth cynydau a addaswyd yn enetig.

Mae'r mater yn amlygu'r gwrthgyferbyniad sydd yn bodoli rhwng hyrwyddo ffermio organig ac arferion cyfeillgar i'r amgylchedd gan y Cynulliad a chaniatáu treialon cynydau a addaswyd yn enetig. Croesawaf y dull a nodasoch ar gyfer dwyn y mater hwn gerbron y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd. At hynny, gallai fod o fudd inni gynnal cynhadledd gydag aelod-wladwriaethau a rhanbarthau eraill Ewrop sydd yn dymuno dilyn ein dyhead o ran cyfyngu ar gnydau a addaswyd yn enetig. Mae gennym gyfle i roi llais Cymreig wrth wraidd polisi Ewropeaidd. Mae sawl rhanbarth o fewn Ewrop sydd am ddilyn ein hesiampl ac, fel Cynulliad, dylem gymryd yr arweiniad yn hynny o beth. Hoffwn glywed eich barn, Weinidog, ar ymrwymo'r Cynulliad i wahodd rhanbarthau ac aelod wladwriaethau eraill Ewrop i Gymru i drafod sut y gellid hyrwyddo'r polisi hwnnw drwy'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd.

Hoffwn hefyd glywed mwy am amserlen eich argymhelliad i ddefnyddio Adran 110 Deddf Diogelu'r Amgylchedd 1990, gan fod pryder mawr y gall y broses hon fod yn ddi-bendraw, i'r fath raddau y cawn ein boddi gan Monsanto ac Aventis, wrth iddynt feddiannu amaethyddiaeth y byd. Mae'n briodol, ar ddiwrnod pan drafodwn fydoli, ein bod wedi clywed am safiad moesegol ar hyrwyddo cynydau wedi'u haddasu'n enetig gan Richard Edwards. Mae'r cwmnïau hyn, yn ddiau, yn dymuno rheoli'r farchnad, nid yn unig am yr hadau, ond am y chwynladdwyr a'r plaleiddiaid a fyddai'n dilyn. Hoffwn glywed eich barn ar sut y gallwch sicrhau fod yr amserlen yn addas ac y byddai'n gweithio, fel y gallwn atal y treialon hyn y flwyddyn nesaf os yn bosibl, drwy'r pellteroedd gwahanu. Yn olaf, cyfeiriasoch at ysgrifennu at ffermwyr ar ôl ein dadl ddiwethaf. A allwch gadarnhau pa un a yw'r ffermwyr hyn yn gyfrifol am unrhyw ddifrod a achosir, neu niwed i'r amgylchedd, yn sgîl eu treialon cynydau a addaswyd yn enetig?

Carwyn Jones: Jocelyn raised this point. If harm can be proven by the organic farmers, and they can show a loss as a result of these crops being brought onto land next to them, the advice that we have is that liability would lie with those who brought the GM crops onto the land. If my memory serves me right, the legal principle is *Rylands v Fletcher*. I am not insured to give advice any more—so do not take notice of that. That is my understanding of the situation. Of course, there is nothing to stop people or farmers in Pembrokeshire from considering their legal position. I am sure that they are doing so at the moment. It would not be right for me to comment on that.

The idea of a conference is interesting. In the course of the work done on GM crops we contacted other administrations in Europe—Tuscany was mentioned in particular. We found that the stances being taken by other administrations were to do with other regimes, not the path C regime. They were to do with other areas and other issues. We did not find another area of Europe that had the same problem as us. We are unique, therefore, in our situation and in the work that has already been done. On timescale, I intend to wait a few more days before making the notice, because we are currently taking advice as to what the proper separation distance should be. The present minimum is, I believe, 200 meters. We are looking to see whether there is any way that that can be extended on the basis of science and made part of the prohibition notice, hopefully in the next few days.

Peter Rogers: I will be brief, because you have allowed me to speak at great length on the foot and mouth disease statement, Presiding Officer. The other spokesmen have already addressed most of my concerns. This is an interesting statement. You tell us, Minister, that you are going to get legal powers that would stop planting near organic producers. Where will you take legal advice on this? If recent experience is anything to go by, you will not get far. You could not even manage to put together a successful legal case against the Anglesey six—the smallholders—to give up their sheep. I

Carwyn Jones: Cododd Jocelyn y pwynt hwn. Os gall y ffermwyr organig brofi difrod, a dangos colled o ganlyniad i dyfu'r cnydau hyn ar dir gerllaw iddynt, y cyngor sydd gennym yw mai'r rheini fyddai wedi dod â'r cnydau a addaswyd yn enetig ar y tir fyddai'n ysgwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb. Os cofiaf yn iawn, yr egwyddor gyfreithiol yw *Rylands v Fletcher*. Nid wyf wedi fy yswirio i roi cyngor bellach—felly peidiwch â chymryd sylw o hynny. Dyna fy nealltwriaeth i o'r sefyllfa. Wrth gwrs, nid oes unrhyw beth i atal pobl neu ffermwyr yn Sir Benfro rhag ystyried eu sefyllfa gyfreithiol. Yr wyf yn siŵr eu bod yn gwneud hynny ar hyn o bryd. Ni fyddai'n briodol imi wneud sylwadau ar hynny.

Mae'r syniad o gynhadledd yn un diddorol. Yn ystod y gwaith a wnaethpwyd ar gnydau a addaswyd yn enetig gwnaethom gysylltu â gweinyddiaethau eraill yn Ewrop—crybwyllwyd Tuscany yn arbennig. Canfuom fod y safbwyntiau a gymerwyd gan weinyddiaethau eraill yn ymwneud â systemau eraill, nid y system llwybr C. Yr oeddent yn ymwneud â meysydd eraill a materion eraill. Ni chanfuom unrhyw ardal arall o Ewrop gyda'r un broblem â ni. Yr ydym yn unigryw, felly, o ran ein sefyllfa ac o ran y gwaith sydd eisoes wedi'i wneud. O ran amserlen, bwriadaf aros ychydig ddyddiau eto cyn gwneud yr hysbysiad, gan ein bod ar hyn o bryd yn cymryd cyngor o ran y pellter gwahanu priodol. Yr isafswm presennol yw 200 metr, fe gredaf. Yr ydym yn edrych i weld a oes unrhyw ffordd y gellid ymestyn hynny ar sail wyddonol a'i wneud yn rhan o'r hysbysiad gwahardd, o fewn yr ychydig ddyddiau nesaf, gobeithio.

Peter Rogers: Byddaf yn gryno, gan eich bod wedi caniatáu imi siarad yn faith ar y datganiad ar glwy'r traed a'r genau, Lywydd. Mae'r llefarwyr eraill eisoes wedi ymdrin â'r rhan fwyaf o'm pryderon. Mae hyn yn ddatganiad diddorol. Dywedwch wrthym, Weinidog, y byddwch yn cael pwerau cyfreithiol a fyddai'n atal plannu ger cynhyrchwyr organig. O ble y cewch gyngor cyfreithiol ar hyn? Yn ôl profiad diweddar, ni chewch fawr o lwyddiant. Ni wnaethoch hyd yn oed lwyddo i lunio achos cyfreithiol llwyddiannus yn erbyn y chwe thyddynwr ar Ynys Môn i ildio eu defaid. Tybed faint yn

wonder how much better you will do against a large multinational co-operation.

Carwyn Jones: The lawyers who advised on the Anglesey six case were MAFF lawyers in London. They have legal responsibility for the cull. The lawyers who have advised in this case are our lawyers in Cardiff. Legal advice has also been obtained from junior and leading counsel on this matter, via the Office of the Counsel General, and the advice that has been provided to us has been broadly similar. The legal case is based on the advice that we have sought.

The Presiding Officer: Before I call other Members who have indicated a wish to speak, I remind Members again of what I said earlier regarding statements. I insist that contributions be limited to one clear and concise question.

Brian Gibbons: I think that everybody agrees that Carwyn is working hard to implement the Assembly's policies on GM crops. However, are you at all worried, Carwyn, about the anti-scientific ethos surrounding this debate, even here today, insofar as—

The Presiding Officer: Order. This is not a debate. Please ask a question.

Brian Gibbons: There seems to be an equation that GMO is 100 per cent bad and that non-GMO is intrinsically pure and good. Do you feel that this dogmatic approach that appears to be all-pervasive in this Chamber is preventing a rational and intelligent debate on this matter?

4:20 p.m.

Carwyn Jones: Members must inform themselves as best they can. However, I am aware of the requirements placed upon me by the National Assembly's resolution.

Cynog Dafis: Cododd Richard Edwards un cwestiwn na chlywais mo'r Gweinidog yn ei ateb. Mae'r tir a ddefnyddir ar gyfer y

well y gallwch ei wneud yn erbyn cwmni amlwladol mawr?

Carwyn Jones: Cyfreithwyr yr Weinyddiaeth Amaethyddiaeth, Pysgodfeydd a Bwyd yn Llundain oedd y cyfreithwyr a roddodd gyngor ar achos y chwe thyddynwr ar Ynys Môn. Mae ganddynt gyfrifoldeb cyfreithiol dros ddiol a difa. Y cyfreithwyr a roddodd gyngor yn yr achos hwn yw ein cyfreithwyr ni yng Nghaerdydd. Cafwyd cyngor cyfreithiol hefyd gan gwmsler iau a phrif gwmsler ar y mater hwn, drwy Swyddfa'r Cwmsler Cyffredinol, ac mae'r cyngor a roddwyd inni yn eithaf tebyg. Mae'r achos cyfreithiol yn seiliedig ar y cyngor a geisiwyd.

Y Llywydd: Cyn imi alw ar yr Aelodau eraill sydd wedi nodi eu bod am siarad, atgoffaf yr Aelodau unwaith eto o'r hyn a ddywedais yn gynharach ynglŷn â datganiadau. Mynnaf y dylai cyfraniadau gael eu cyfyngu i un cwestiwn clir a chryno.

Brian Gibbons: Credaf fod pawb yn cytuno fod Carwyn yn gweithio'n galed i weithredu polisiau'r Cynulliad ar gnydau a addaswyd yn enetig. Fodd bynnag, a ydych yn pryderu o gwbl, Carwyn, ynglŷn â'r ethos wrthwyddonol sydd yn gysylltiedig â'r ddadl hon, hyd yn oed yma heddiw, o ran—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid dadl yw hon. Gofynnwch gwestiwn.

Brian Gibbons: Ymddengys fod rhagfarn fod organebau a addaswyd yn enetig yn ddrwg i gyd a bod organebau heb eu haddasu'n enetig yn hollol bur a da. A ydych o'r farn bod yr ymagwedd ddogmataidd hon sydd yn hollbresennol yn y Siambr hon yn atal dadl resymegol a deallus ar y mater hwn?

Carwyn Jones: Rhaid i'r Aelodau sicrhau bod ganddynt gymaint o wybodaeth â phosibl. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r gofynion a osodwyd arnaf gan benderfyniad y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

Cynog Dafis: Richard Edwards raised one question to which I did not hear the Minister respond. The land that will be used for the

treialon yn Sir Benfro yn ffinio ag ardal orllewinol y Cleddau, sydd yn ardal gadwraeth arbennig. Daw hynny â'r mater o fewn cwrpas Deddf Bywyd Gwyllt a Chefn Gwlad 1981, sydd yn golygu fod unrhyw weithred a allai wneud niwed i'r ardal gadwraeth arbennig yn drosedd. A ystyriwyd hynny wrth wneud y penderfyniad i ganiatáu'r treialon? Os nad ystyriwyd ef, pam?

Carwyn Jones: Yng nghyfarfod y grŵp strategol ar gnydau a addaswyd yn enetig, soniodd Christine Gwyther am yr ardal gadwraeth arbennig sydd yn cael ei chreu ar hyn o bryd yn Sir Benfro. Nid yw o gymorth, yn anffodus. Yn ôl y Pwyllgor Ymgynghorol ar Ollyngiadau i'r Amgylchedd, mae wedi ystyried y sefyllfa a'i farn yw bod yr wyddoniaeth yn iawn ac mae'r pellterau gwahanu yn ddigonol er mwyn sicrhau nad oes niwed i'r amgylchedd nac i gnydau eraill. Derbyniodd Christine Gwyther ateb gan y swyddog gwyddonol yn dweud na wna hyn wahaniaeth gan fod y pwyllgor ymgynghorol o'r farn fod y sefyllfa'n ddiogel ar hyn o bryd.

Tom Middlehurst: There is significant unease in my constituency as regards the imminent planting of genetically modified maize at Sealand. Despite Carwyn's best efforts, which I commend, it appears that we have no powers to prohibit that planting. Given the unanimous view of the Assembly, will Carwyn join me in urging those people who have the power to stop this from proceeding? That is, to urge the farmers in Flintshire and Pembrokeshire not to proceed with this programme. I understand that the farmers may have contractual obligations. Nevertheless, it is within their power to ensure that the Assembly's wishes are respected and reflected. Will the Minister also ask the farming unions in Wales—the Farmers' Union of Wales and the National Farmers' Union—to do all that they can to persuade their colleagues and members to bring pressure to bear on those farmers who can take action to deal with the problem this year, notwithstanding the efforts that he is about to embark upon to ensure that we reflect the Assembly's policies in subsequent years?

trials in Pembrokeshire borders the western Cleddau area, which is a special conservation area. That brings the issue within the scope of the Wildlife and Countryside Act 1981, which means that any action that could damage the special conservation area is a criminal offence. Was that considered in taking the decision to allow the trials to take place? If it was not considered, why not?

Carwyn Jones: In the meeting of the GM strategy group, Christine Gwyther mentioned the special conservation area that is currently being created in Pembrokeshire. It does not help us, unfortunately. According to the Advisory Committee on Releases to the Environment, it has considered the situation and its view is that the science is good and the separation distances are adequate to ensure that there is no damage to the environment or to other crops. Christine Gwyther received an answer from the scientific officer stating that this would not make a difference because ACRE says that the situation is safe at present.

Tom Middlehurst: Mae cryn anniddigrwydd yn fy etholaeth ynghylch y bwriad i blannu indrawn a addaswyd yn enetig yn Sealand. Er gwaethaf ymdrechion glew Carwyn, a gymeradwyaf, ymddengys nad oes gennym unrhyw bwerau i atal y plannu hwnnw. O gofio barn unfrydol y Cynulliad, a wnaiff Carwyn ymuno â mi i bwysu ar y bobl hynny sydd yn meddu ar y pŵer i atal hyn rhag mynd rhagddo? Hynny yw, annog y ffermwyr yn Sir y Fflint a Sir Benfro i beidio â mynd ymlaen â'r rhaglen hon. Deallaf y gallai fod rwymedigaethau cytundebol gan y ffermwyr. Serch hynny, mae o fewn eu pŵer i sicrhau y caiff dymuniadau'r Cynulliad eu parchu a'u hadlewyrchu. A wnaiff y Gweinidog hefyd ofyn i'r undebau ffermio yng Nghymru—Undeb Amaethwyr Cymru ac Undeb Cenedlaethol y Ffermwyr—i wneud popeth o fewn eu gallu i ddarbwylllo eu cydweithwyr a'u haelodau i roi pwysau ar y ffermwyr hynny a all gymryd camau i ddelio gyda'r broblem eleni, er gwaethaf yr ymdrechion y mae ar fin eu gwneud i sicrhau ein bod yn adlewyrchu polisiau'r Cynulliad mewn blynyddoedd dilynol?

Carwyn Jones: Opinion in the farming unions is divided. The two farming unions are not unanimous on whether these GM trials should take place. Therefore, there is some division within farming itself. I am happy to join Tom in echoing the views of the majority of people within the communities around Sealand and Mathry that these GM trials should not take place in the face of the National Assembly's declared viewpoint.

Carwyn Jones: Nid oes cytundeb barn ymhlith yr undebau ffermio. Nid yw'r ddau undeb ffermio yn unfryd ynghylch a ddylid cynnal y treialon cynydau a addaswyd yn enetig hyn. Felly, mae rhywfaint o hollt o fewn ffermio ei hun. Yr wyf yn fodlon ymuno â Tom wrth adleisio barn mwyafrif y bobl yn y cymunedau o amgylch Sealand a Mathri na ddylid cynnal y treialon cynydau a addawyd yn enetig hyn yn wyneb safbwynt clir y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

Datganiad Busnes Business Statement

The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies): I start by reporting changes to Plenary business today and on Thursday, as it differs from the business statement that I made before the Easter recess. In response to a request for an urgent question, Edwina Hart will make a statement in Plenary on Thursday on the asylum seekers being housed in Cardiff prison. Janice Gregory's short debate on crime will now take place on Thursday, immediately before Rhodri Glyn Thomas's short debate. In addition, depending on the outcome of discussions between the Government, the trade unions and Corus, we hope to be in a position to make a statement during Plenary on Thursday. I thank my colleagues on the Business Committee for their co-operation and support in planning business this week. Immediately after this statement, I will seek the Presiding Officer's agreement to propose a procedural motion under Standing Order No. 6.16 to postpone Janice Gregory's short debate until Thursday and to postpone the debate on the Health and Social Services Committee report on BSE until Tuesday 8 May.

Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Dechreuaf drwy hysbysu ynghylch newidiadau i fusnes y Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw a dydd Iau, gan ei fod yn wahanol i'r datganiad busnes a wneuthum cyn toriad y Pasg. Mewn ymateb i gais am gwestiwn brys, bydd Edwina Hart yn gwneud datganiad yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ddydd Iau ar y ceiswyr lloches sydd yn aros yng ngharchar Caerdydd. Bellach cynhelir dadl fer Janice Gregory ar droseddau ddydd Iau, yn union cyn dadl fer Rhodri Glyn Thomas. Yn ogystal, yn dibynnu ar ganlyniad trafodaethau rhwng y Llywodraeth, yr undebau llafur a Corus, gobeithiwn y byddwn mewn sefyllfa i wneud datganiad yn ystod y Cyfarfod Llawn ddydd Iau. Diolchaf i'm cyd-Aelodau ar y Pwyllgor Busnes am eu cydweithrediad a'u cefnogaeth wrth gynllunio busnes yr wythnos hon. Yn union wedi'r datganiad hwn, gofynnaf am ganiatâd y Llywydd i gynnig cynnig trefniadol o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.16 i ohirio dadl fer Janice Gregory tan ddydd Iau ac i ohirio'r ddadl ar adroddiad y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar BSE tan ddydd Iau 8 Mai.

I have also tabled a no named-day motion today to elect Rod Richards to the Health and Social Services Committee which, with the Presiding Officer's agreement, I propose to move on Thursday via a procedural motion. It is with considerable sadness that I have tabled a no-named day motion to replace Val Feld with Christine Gwyther on the panel of chairs and a motion to elect Christine Gwyther to the Economic Development Committee in place of Val Feld. I hope to

Yr wyf hefyd wedi cyflwyno cynnig heb ddyddiad trafod i ethol Rod Richards i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Gyda chaniatâd y Llywydd, bwriadaf gyflwyno hyn ddydd Iau drwy gynnig trefniadol. Gyda thristwch mawr y cyflwynais gynnig heb ddyddiad trafod i ddisodli Val Feld gyda Christine Gwyther ar y panel cadeiryddion a chynnig i ethol Christine Gwyther i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn lle Val Feld. Gobeithiaf

propose that motion in Plenary next Tuesday, 8 May. I take this opportunity to thank Val not only on behalf of the Labour Party, but also on behalf of the wider Assembly for her tremendous contribution to the work of the Committee and the Assembly as a whole. We wish her a rapid recovery.

I refer to the business statement for the next three weeks. On Tuesday 8 May, business will include elections to the Committee on Equality of Opportunity, the Committee on European Affairs and the Economic Development Committee. There will also be a motion to adopt the revised code of practice on public access to information, a composite motion to approve two items of subordinate legislation, and the debate on the Health and Social Services Committee's report on the Phillips inquiry into BSE. Finally, in agreement with Business Committee this morning, business will also include a motion to approve changes to Standing Orders Nos. 23 and 34.

On Thursday 10 May, there will be a debate on the Welsh Development Agency quinquennial review, a debate on Tom Middlehurst's Part 7 Order, our version of the private members Bill, and the motion to approve the Local Government Finance (Wales): Special Grant Report (No. 8) Wales 2000 on school funding. Business on Tuesday 15 May and Thursday 17 May is as I reported in my last business statement. Business on Tuesday 22 May and Thursday 24 May will include debates on the independent appeal mechanism for farmers, Estyn's chief inspector's report on training and development, the Local Government and Housing Committee's report on housing stock transfer and a debate on a subject proposed by the Conservative Party.

Finally, on the advice of the Business Committee this morning, the Presiding Officer has determined in accordance with Standing Order No. 22.5, that the following items of subordinate legislation need not be referred to a Subject Committee. These are, the Care Standards Act 2000 (Commencement No. 3) (Wales) Order 2001, the Potatoes Originating in Egypt (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2001, the National Health Service (Charges for Drugs

gynnig y cynnig hwnnw yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ddydd Mawrth nesaf, 8 Mai. Hoffwn gymryd y cyfle hwn i ddiolch i Val, nid yn unig ar ran y Blaid Lafur, ond hefyd ar ran y Cynulliad yn gyffredinol am ei chyfraniad aruthrol i waith y Pwyllgor a'r Cynulliad yn gyffredinol. Dymunwn wellhad buan iddi.

Cyfeiriai at y datganiad busnes am y tair wythnos nesaf. Ddydd Mawrth 8 Mai, bydd y busnes yn cynnwys etholiadau i'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, y Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd a'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Bydd cynnig hefyd i fabwysiadu cod ymarfer diwygiedig ar fynediad y cyhoedd i wybodaeth, cynnig cyfansawdd i gymeradwyo dwy eitem o is-ddeddfwriaeth, a'r ddadl ar Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar ymchwiliad Phillips i BSE. Yn olaf, gyda chaniatâd y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, bydd y busnes hefyd yn cynnwys cynnig i gymeradwyo newidiadau i Reolau Sefydlog Rhifau 23 a 34.

Ddydd Iau 10 Mai, bydd dadl ar adolygiad pum mlynedd Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, dadl ar Orchymyn Rhan 7 Tom Middlehurst, ein fersiwn ni o'r Mesur aelodau preifat, a'r cynnig i gymeradwyo Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru): Adroddiad Grant Arbennig (Rhif 8) Cymru 2000 ar ariannu ysgolion. Mae'r busnes ddydd Mawrth 15 Mai a dydd Iau 17 Mai fel y nodwyd gennyf yn fy natganiad busnes diwethaf. Bydd y busnes ddydd Mawrth 22 Mai a dydd Iau 24 Mai yn cynnwys dadleuon ar y ddyfais apelio annibynnol ar gyfer ffermwyr, adroddiad prif arolygydd Estyn ar hyfforddi a datblygu, adroddiad y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai ar drosglwyddo stoc tai a dadl ar bwnc a gynigir gan y Blaid Geidwadol.

Yn olaf, ar gyngor y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, mae'r Llywydd wedi penderfynu yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 22.5, nad oes angen cyfeirio'r eitemau canlynol o is-ddeddfwriaeth i Bwyllgor Pwnc, sef Gorchymyn Deddf Safonau Gofal 2000 (Cychwyniad Rhif 3) (Cymru) 2001, Rheoliadau Tatws sy'n Deillio o'r Aiff (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2001, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd am Gyffuriau a Chyfarpar) (Diwygio) (Cymru)

and Appliances) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2001, the Care Council for Wales (Appointment, Membership and Procedure) Regulations 2001, the Welsh Language Schemes (Public Bodies) Order 2001, the Education (Publication of Draft Proposals and Orders) (Further Education Corporations) (Wales) Regulations 2001, the Housing Grants (Additional Purposes) (Wales) Order 2001, the Housing Renewal Grants (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2001, the Housing Renewal Grants (Prescribed Forms and Particulars) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2001, the Relocation Grants (Forms of Application) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2001, the Contaminated Land (Wales) Regulations 2001, the Common Agricultural Policy (Wine) (Wales) Regulations 2001, the National Health Service (General Dental Services) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2001 and the Meat (Enhanced Enforcement Powers) (Wales) Regulations 2001.

Arrangements will be made to post a copy of the business statement to the intranet and internet later today.

The Presiding Officer: Are there any objections to the business statement? I see that there are not. Are there any comments on the business statement?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: You indicated that there will be a statement on Corus on Thursday. I presume that that will be a substantial statement. In view of the fact that the outcome of these latest discussions will have a profound impact on several communities in Wales—in the north and south—will you assure us that that statement will be followed by a full debate in the administration's time on a tabled motion to allow the Assembly as a whole to express a view on the Government's response to this crisis?

Jonathan Morgan: I raise a concern regarding the postponement of the debate on the Local Government Finance (Wales): Special Grant Report (No. 8) Wales 2000 until next week. We understood that payments would be made to schools in Wales under the special grant report and we wanted this report to be debated here as quickly as possible so that schools could benefit from

2001, Rheoliadau Cyngor Gofal Cymru (Penodi, Aelodaeth a Gweithdrefn) 2001, Gorchymyn Cynlluniau Iaith Gymraeg (Cyrrff Cyhoeddus) 2001, Rheoliadau Addysg (Cyhoeddi Cynigion a Gorchymnion Drafft) (Corfforaethau Addysg Bellach) (Cymru) 2001, Gorchymyn Grantiau Tai (Dibenion Ychwanegol) (Cymru) 2001, Rheoliadau Grantiau Adnewyddu Tai (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2001, Rheoliadau Grantiau Adnewyddu Tai (Ffurflenni a Manylion Penodedig) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2001, Rheoliadau Grantiau Adleoli (Ffurflenni Cais) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2001, Rheoliadau Tir Halogedig (Cymru) 2001, Rheoliadau'r Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin (Gwin) (Cymru) 2001, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2001 a Rheoliadau Cig (Pwerau Gorfodi Ehangach) (Cymru) 2001.

Gwneir trefniadau i roi copi o'r datganiad busnes ar y rhyngwrwyd a'r fewnwrwyd yn ddiweddarach heddiw.

Y Llywydd: A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes? Gwelaf nad oes. A oes unrhyw sylwadau ar y datganiad busnes?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Nodasoch y bydd datganiad ar Corus ddydd Iau. Tybiaf y bydd y datganiad hwnnw'n un sylweddol. Yng ngoleuni'r ffaith y caiff canlyniad y trafodaethau diweddaraf hyn effaith sylweddol ar sawl cymuned yng Nghymru—yn y gogledd a'r de—a wnewch roi sicrwydd inni y caiff y datganiad hwnnw ei ddilyn gan ddadl lawn o fewn amser yr weinyddiaeth ar gynnig wedi'i gyflwyno i alluogi'r Cynulliad cyfan i fynegi barn ar ymateb y Llywodraeth i'r argyfwng hwn?

Jonathan Morgan: Codaf bryder ynghylch gohirio'r ddadl ar Gyllid Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru): Adroddiad Grant Arbennig (Rhif 8) Cymru 2000 tan yr wythnos nesaf. Yr oeddem ar ddeall y câi taliadau eu gwneud i ysgolion yng Nghymru o dan yr adroddiad grant arbennig ac yr oeddem am i ddadl gael ei chynnal ar yr adroddiad hwn cyn gynted â phosibl fel y gallai ysgolion elwa ar yr arian a

the money that was being passed on. My second concern regarding postponing the report is that it falls in the week in which we might expect a certain announcement from 10 Downing Street. It would be all too convenient for the Government to announce bits of good news to assist that campaign. We hope that the Government would not use those opportunities in the future.

4:30 p.m.

Andrew Davies: I will consider Ieuan's request with colleagues, and I will get back to him on that. On Jonathan's point, it was more of a cock-up than a conspiracy. There was a drafting error in the special grant report. The announcement has been made, therefore it is not a question of being connected with the general election; it was purely a drafting error, which is being corrected. We tried to table it, but we were not in a legal position to do so, as it would have been invalid. We have now withdrawn it, and we will table it for next week.

drosglwyddwyd iddynt. Fy ail bryder ynghylch gohirio'r adroddiad yw ei fod yn digwydd mewn wythnos lle y gallem ddisgwyl rhyw gyhoeddiad o 10 Stryd Downing. Byddai'n llawer rhy gyfleus i'r Llywodraeth gyhoeddi darnau o newyddion da i gynorthwyo'r ymgyrch honno. Gobeithiwn na fydd y Llywodraeth yn defnyddio'r cyfleoedd hynny yn y dyfodol.

Andrew Davies: Ystyriaf gais Ieuan gyda chyd-Aelodau, a dof yn ôl ato ar hynny. O ran pwynt Jonathan, yr oedd yn fwy o gamgymeriad na chynllwyn. Yr oedd gwall drafftio yn yr adroddiad grant arbennig. Mae'r cyhoeddiad wedi'i wneud, felly nid yw'n fater o fod â chyswllt gyda'r etholiad cyffredinol; camgymeriad drafftio ydoedd, sydd yn cael ei gywiro. Fe wnaethom geisio ei gyflwyno, ond nid oeddem mewn sefyllfa gyfreithiol i wneud hynny, gan y byddai wedi bod yn annilys. Yr ydym bellach wedi'i dynnu'n ôl, a byddwn yn ei gyflwyno yr wythnos nesaf.

Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion

The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies): I propose that

the National Assembly, under Standing Order No. 6.16, seeks to defer Janice Gregory's short debate until Thursday 3 May 2001 and the debate on the Health and Social Services Committee report on the Phillips report on BSE until Tuesday 8 May 2001.

Y Llywydd: Nid yw'r system bleidleisio yn gweithio, felly tra ein bod yn aros iddi gael ei hailosod, cyfeirïaf at y ddadl ar y cynnig o gerydd. Byddaf yn caniatáu 15 munud i gynigydd y cynnig. Bydd modd i'r cynigydd gymryd yr amser hwnnw ar ddechrau neu ar ddiwedd y ddadl. Caniateir 15 munud ar gyfer y Gweinidog. Bydd prif lefarydd y pleidiau eraill yn cael 10 munud a bydd unrhyw siaradwyr eraill yn cael pum munud.

Nid yw'r system wedi ei hailosod, felly awgrymaf ein bod yn parhau gyda'r cynnig o gerydd a dychwelyd at y bleidlais ar y cynnig

Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Cynigiad fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.16, yn gohirio dadl fer Janice Gregory tan ddydd Iau 3 Mai 2001 a'r ddadl ar adroddiad y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar adroddiad Phillips ar BSE tan ddydd Mawrth 8 Mai 2001.

The Presiding Officer: The voting system is not working and while we wait for it to be reset, I will refer to the debate on the censure motion. I will allow 15 minutes to the proposer of the motion. The proposer can use that time at the start or end of the debate. The Minister will be allowed 15 minutes. The main spokesperson for the other parties will have 10 minutes and any other speakers will have five minutes.

The system has not been reset, therefore I suggest that we continue with the censure motion and return to the vote on the

trefniadol ar ddiwedd y ddadl honno.

procedural motion at the end of that debate.

Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order

Alun Cairns: Point of order. It does not relate to the censure motion or to the problems with the voting system, but I have given due notice of it. I raise it under Standing Order No. 2 to clarify the roles and responsibilities of Deputy Ministers and the First Minister.

Alun Cairns: Pwynt o drefn. Nid yw'n ymwneud â'r cynnig o gerydd na'r problemau o ran y system bleidleisio, ond rhoddais rybudd priodol ohono. Fe'i codaf o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 2 er mwyn egluro rolau a chyfrifoldebau'r Dirprwy Weinidogion a'r Prif Weinidog.

A public letter issued by the First Minister read that, following a press release by a Deputy Minister, the contents of which were, among other things—

Mewn llythyr cyhoeddus gan Brif Weinidog Cymru, yn dilyn datganiad i'r wasg gan Ddirprwy Weinidog, yr oedd ei gynnwys, ymhlith pethau eraill yn—

The Presiding Officer: Order. Press releases issued by the First Minister are a matter for his determination, not for me.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mater iddo ef, nid i mi, benderfynu arno yw datganiadau i'r wasg a gyhoeddir gan y Prif Weinidog.

Alun Cairns: My point of order relates to the First Minister's powers and whether he has the authority to sack a Liberal Democrat Deputy Minister or whether he—
[*Interruption.*] A Liberal Democrat Deputy Minister remains in post after attacking the administration.

Alun Cairns: Mae fy mhwynt o drefn yn ymwneud â phwerau'r Prif Weinidog ac a oes ganddo'r awdurdod i ddiswyddo Dirprwy Weinidog sydd yn Ddemocrat Rhyddfrydol neu a yw—[*Torri ar draws.*] Mae Dirprwy Weinidog sydd yn Ddemocrat Rhyddfrydol yn parhau yn ei swydd ar ôl ymosod ar yr weinyddiaeth.

The Presiding Officer: Order. This is not a matter for me.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid mater i mi ydyw.

Jocelyn Davies: Point of order. I raise this under Standing Order No. 32 about petitions. We heard earlier that Richard Edwards intends to present the First Minister with a petition from the good people of Pembrokeshire today. If under that Standing Order it is addressed to you, it has the potential of being subject to an Assembly debate and, therefore, an Assembly resolution. Will you give us your interpretation of that Standing Order and inform us of the mechanism for using it to bring that petition to the attention of the Assembly?

Jocelyn Davies: Pwynt o drefn. Fe'i codaf o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 32 ar ddeisebau. Clywsom yn gynharach fod Richard Edwards yn bwriadu cyflwyno deiseb i'r Prif Weinidog gan bobl Sir Benfro heddiw. Os yw wedi ei chyfeirio atoch chi, o dan y Rheol Sefydlog honno, gall y Cynulliad gynnal dadl arni ac, felly, wneud penderfyniad yn ei chylch. A wnewch roi'ch dehongliad chi o'r Rheol Sefydlog honno a rhoi gwybod inni ym mha ffordd y'i defnyddir i gyflwyno'r ddeiseb honno i sylw'r Cynulliad?

The Presiding Officer: Petitions addressed to the Assembly, which may or may not be what we are referring to in this case—my understanding was that the petition is to be handed to the Minister and is, therefore, not a

Y Llywydd: Caiff deisebau a gyfeirir at y Cynulliad, sydd efallai wedi digwydd yn yr achos hwn—ond yr oeddwn ar ddeall y caiff y ddeiseb ei throsglwyddo i'r Gweinidog ac felly, nid yw'n ddeiseb i'r Cynulliad o dan

petition to the Assembly under Standing Order No. 32—are presented through the mechanism of the Table Office. The head of the Table Office ensures that the information is placed on the intranet so that the contents of petitions and the numbers of signatures are immediately made available to the Assembly. Standing Order No. 32.2 states that the Assembly, or any of its Committees, may resolve to debate the contents of petitions under Standing Orders. I cannot help you with petitions that are presented directly to Ministers.

Reol Sefydlog Rhif 32—eu cyflwyno drwy'r Swyddfa Gyflwyno. Mae pennaeth y Swyddfa Gyflwyno yn sicrhau y caiff yr wybodaeth ei rhoi ar y fewnwyd er mwyn i gynnwys deisebau a nifer y llofnodion fod yn hysbys i'r Cynulliad ar unwaith. Noda Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 32.2 y gall y Cynulliad, neu unrhyw un o'i Bwyllgorau, benderfynu dadlau cynnwys deiseb o dan y Rheolau Sefydlog. Ni allaf ymwneud â deisebau a gyflwynir yn uniongyrchol i Weinidogion.

Cynnig o Gerydd Censure Motion

David Melding: I propose the motion in my name and the names of Nick Bourne, Alun Cairns, David Davies, Glyn Davies, William Graham, Jonathan Morgan and Peter Rogers.

David Melding: Cynigiaf y cynnig yn fy enw i ac yn enwau Nick Bourne, Alun Cairns, David Davies, Glyn Davies, William Graham, Jonathan Morgan a Peter Rogers.

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly notes that, on 7 June 2000, the Minister for Health and Social Services pledged to:

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn nodi bod y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, ar 7 Mehefin 2000, wedi addo gwneud y canlynol:

cut the inpatient waiting list by 15,000, and halve the number of patients waiting over six months for an outpatient appointment;

sicrhau gostyngiad o 15,000 yn y cleifion mewnol sydd ar y rhestr aros, a haneru nifer y cleifion sy'n aros dros chwe mis am apwyntiad fel claf allanol;

the National Assembly notes with deep concern and regret that the Minister for Health and Social Services has failed to meet either target, as the:

mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn nodi, gyda phryder a gofid mawr, fod y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wedi methu â chyrraedd y naill darged na'r llall, oherwydd y canlynol:

inpatient waiting list is 3,500 longer than she promised, and the number of patients waiting more than six months for an outpatient appointment has increased; and

mae'r rhestr aros ar gyfer cleifion mewnol 3,500 yn fwy na'r hyn yr oedd hi wedi'i addo, ac mae nifer y cleifion sy'n aros dros chwe mis am apwyntiad fel claf allanol wedi cynyddu;

the National Assembly therefore censures the Minister for Health and Social Services for failing to meet her pledges.

gan hynny, mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ceryddu'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol am beidio â chadw ei haddewidion.

A cut in waiting lists was one of the Labour Party's great pledges to the people of Wales and Britain in 1997. When it made that

Un o addewidion mawr y Blaid Lafur i bobl Cymru a Phrydain yn 1997 oedd lleihau rhestrau aros. Pan wnaeth yr addewid

promise, there were 67,600 inpatients waiting for treatment in Wales. The Labour Party promised 'as a first step' to cut that figure by 5,000.

By May 2000—three years later—Labour's first, second and third steps resulted in waiting list increases not decreases. They went up by a colossal 14,000, not down by its promised 5,000. Many of us said that the obsession with waiting lists was damaging the health service and was fundamentally misguided. We regarded the waiting list figures and the targets as crude and subject to manipulation. It is far better to focus on waiting times. We could set realistic waiting times for the future and give patients a promise that had a chance of being honoured.

Instead of apologising for her failure and moving on, the Minister set new waiting list figures. In June 2000, the Minister committed this administration to reducing inpatient waiting lists by 15,000 and to cutting outpatient waiting lists by 50 per cent. Labour has failed on both counts. We had the figures for March this month. Just like Labour's manifesto promise, the new pledges have not been honoured. The outpatient list has increased by 3,000 to nearly 46,000. That is despite the promise to halve it. In 1997, 6,000 patients were waiting to see a consultant in Wales. Under Labour, that figure has increased by 670 per cent. Shame on you for failing the patients of Wales.

There has been a reduction in inpatient figures, but not of 15,000—the target that the Minister set last year. The figures are 3,500 short of that target. The double promise has resulted in a double failure.

Geraint Davies: Do you agree that the fundamental reason for the disgraceful waiting lists at present is because the new Labour Government is following the spending patterns of the previous Tory government? As a consequence, the people of Wales have suffered the anxiety of

hwnnw, yr oedd 67,600 o gleifion mewnol yn aros am driniaeth yng Nghymru. Addawodd y Blaid Lafur 'fel cam cyntaf' i sicrhau gostyngiad o 5,000 yn y ffigur hwnnw.

Erbyn Mai 2000—dair blynedd yn ddiweddarach—arweiniodd camau cyntaf Llafur, a'i hail gamau a'i thrydydd camau at gynnydd nid gostyngiad yn y rhestrau aros. Bu cynnydd anferth o 14,000, nid gostyngiad o 5,000 yn ôl ei haddewid. Dywedodd llawer ohonom fod yr obsesiwn ynglŷn â rhestrau aros yn niweidiol i'r gwasanaeth iechyd ac yn gyfeiliornus yn y bôn. Yr oeddem yn ystyried y ffigurau a'r targedau ar gyfer rhestrau aros yn amrwd ac yn hawdd eu camddefnyddio. Mae'n llawer gwell canolbwyntio ar amseroedd aros. Gallem osod amseroedd aros realistig ar gyfer y dyfodol a rhoi addewid i gleifion y byddai'n bosibl ei chadw.

Yn hytrach nag ymddiheuro am ei methiant a symud ymlaen, gosododd y Gweinidog ffigurau newydd ar gyfer y rhestrau aros. Ym mis Mehefin 2000, ymrwymodd y Gweinidog yr weinyddiaeth hon i ostwng nifer y cleifion mewnol ar y rhestrau aros 15,000 ac i ostwng y rhestrau aros ar gyfer cleifion allanol 50 y cant. Methodd Llafur ar y ddau gyfrif. Cawsom y ffigurau ar gyfer Mawrth y mis hwn. Yn union fel addewid maniffesto Llafur, ni chadwyd yr addewidion newydd. Mae'r rhestr aros ar gyfer cleifion allanol wedi cynyddu 3,000 i bron i 46,000, a hynny er gwaethaf y ffaith y gwnaethpwyd addewid i'w haneru. Yn 1997, yr oedd 6,000 o gleifion yn aros i weld ymgynghorydd yng Nghymru. O dan Lafur, mae'r ffigur hwn wedi cynyddu 670 y cant. Rhag eich cywilydd am fethu cleifion Cymru.

Bu gostyngiad yn nifer y cleifion mewnol, ond nid gostyngiad o 15,000—sef y targed a osodwyd gan y Gweinidog y llynedd. Mae'r ffigurau yn 3,500 yn brin o'r targed hwnnw. Arweiniodd yr addewid ddyblyg at fethiant dyblyg.

Geraint Davies: A gytunwch mai'r rheswm sylfaenol dros y rhestrau aros gwarthus ar hyn o bryd yw'r ffaith bod y Llywodraeth Lafur newydd yn dilyn patrymau gwario y llywodraeth Doriaidd flaenorol? O ganlyniad, mae pobl Cymru wedi dioddef gofid rhestrau aros ac amseroedd aros enfawr cyn cael

tremendous waiting lists and waiting times to get treatment. triniaeth.

4:40 p.m.

David Melding: We will see how Plaid Cymru responds to this debate and how it votes. I will have something to say about activity rates and the number of people who are treated by the NHS. The record has been much poorer under this Government. I welcome the reduction of 11,500 since May 2000. It is appropriate to do that. However, that has largely been at the expense of outpatients. I quote the King's Fund, the independent think-tank. In its publication last week they judged the Government's record as follows,

David Melding: Gwelwn sut y bydd Plaid Cymru yn ymateb i'r ddadl hon a sut y bydd yn pleidleisio. Hoffwn ddweud rhywbeth am y cyfraddau gweithgarwch a nifer y bobl a gaiff eu trin gan yr NHS. Bu'r record yn llawer gwaeth o dan y Llywodraeth hon. Croesawaf y gostyngiad o 11,500 ers Mai 2000. Mae'n briodol gwneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, digwyddodd hynny i raddau helaeth ar draul cleifion allanol. Dyfynnaf y King's Fund, sef y pwyllgor ystyried annibynnol. Yn ei gyhoeddiad yr wythnos diwethaf, dyfarnodd ar record y Llywodraeth fel a ganlyn,

'It appears that reductions in numbers at the treatment stage have been offset by an increase at the diagnostic stage.'

That is what has happened. We have seen a reduction in inpatient figures because many more people are waiting at outpatients to see the consultant for the first time. Despite the Minister's pledge given last summer to cut that outpatient list in half.

Dyna beth sydd wedi digwydd. Gwelsom ostyngiad yn nifer y cleifion mewnol am fod llawer mwy o bobl yn gleifion allanol sydd yn aros i weld yr ymgynghorydd am y tro cyntaf. Er gwaethaf addewid y Gweinidog a roddwyd yr haf diwethaf i haneru nifer y cleifion allanol ar y rhestr honno.

Why censure? This pledge was one of the Labour party's main commitments to the people of Wales. It chose to repeat the pledge last summer. The Labour administration before us in this devolved administration could have argued that it inherited this from their UK party. It could have argued that to cut waiting lists was a Westminster pledge and that it did not feel committed to that pledge. It could have moved away from it and considered waiting times instead. However, it decided to do no such thing. It considered the waiting list pledge and repeated it and exaggerated it. It has still failed to deliver. It is now literally a double failure. The manifesto promise has failed. The new promise issued in June 2000 has also failed. I mentioned to the Labour backbenchers here that waiting lists in Wales are now higher than when your party came to office in 1997. There has been a reversal and the situation has worsened. If you look at the wider picture, there is no comfort for members of the Labour and Liberal parties in

Pam cerydd? Yr oedd yr addewid hon yn un o brif ymrwymadau'r Blaid Lafur i bobl Cymru. Dewisodd ailadrodd yr addewid yr haf diwethaf. Gallai'r weinyddiaeth Lafur ger ein bron yn yr weinyddiaeth ddatganoledig hon fod wedi dadlau iddi ei hetifeddu gan ei phlaid yn y DU. Gallai fod wedi dadlau mai addewid San Steffan oedd lleihau rhestrau aros ac nad oedd o'r farn ei bod wedi ymrwymo i'r addewid honno. Gallai fod wedi symud o'r addewid hwnnw ac ystyried amseroedd aros yn ei lle. Fodd bynnag, penderfynodd beidio â gwneud hynny. Ystyriodd yr addewid ar gyfer rhestrau aros a gwnaeth ei hailadrodd a'i hestyn. Mae wedi methu â'i chyflawni o hyd. Methiant dyblyg ydyw yn llythrennol bellach. Mae addewid y maniffesto wedi methu. Mae'r addewid newydd a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Mehefin 2000 wedi methu hefyd. Crybwyllais wrth Aelodau Llafur y meinciau cefn fod rhestrau aros erbyn hyn yn uwch na phan ddaeth eich plaid i rym yn 1997. Yr ydym wedi mynd am yn ôl ac mae'r sefyllfa wedi gwaethygu. Os

this coalition.

The activity rates, which is the number of inpatients receiving treatment has declined. The number of inpatients treated has declined from 133,000 in March 1997 to 128,500 in December 2000. That is a decrease of 4,500 patient treatments per quarter. We know why they have been reducing. It is because these people are now shunted on to the outpatient waiting list. The number of people receiving inpatient treatment is declining, despite the fact that since last June the waiting list figure as a whole has declined. That shows you what you are doing. You are shifting these people on to the outpatient waiting list and keeping them waiting inordinate times to see a consultant. It is shameful.

Val Feld: As you all know, I have had a great deal of recent experience of the NHS in Wales and am due to have a great deal more over the next few months. David, do you agree that the reason why waiting lists are rising is because people now have faith in the NHS in Wales in a way that they did not under the years of the previous Conservative government? They now expect that if they put their names on a waiting list they will get seen and get good treatment and are assured of that. That is the fundamental difference as a result of what has taken place over the last four years.

David Melding: I wish you a full and speedy recovery. It is true that, when people are treated, they are inspired by the staff and by the care that they receive. That is appropriate on an individual level and I repeat it. When you receive treatment in the NHS, it is marvellous treatment and there is no doubt about that. However, that spin will not convince anyone waiting to receive treatment. You should deliver on your election promises if you make them. You should not make these promises if there is no chance of them being delivered.

I will say a few words about the way forward,

edrychwch ar y darlun mwy, nid oes unrhyw gysur i aelodau'r blaid Lafur na'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn y glymblaid hon.

Mae'r cyfraddau gweithgarwch, sef nifer y cleifion mewnol sydd yn cael triniaeth, wedi gostwng. Mae nifer y cleifion mewnol sydd yn cael triniaeth wedi gostwng o 133,000 ym Mawrth 1997 i 128,500 yn Rhagfyr 2000 sef gostyngiad o 4,500 fesul chwarter yn nifer y cleifion sydd yn cael triniaeth. Gwyddom pam eu bod yn gostwng, sef am fod y bobl hyn bellach yn cael eu symud i'r rhestr aros ar gyfer cleifion allanol. Mae nifer y bobl sydd yn cael triniaeth fel cleifion mewnol yn gostwng, er gwaethaf y ffaith bod cyfanswm y cleifion sydd ar y rhestrau aros wedi gostwng ers mis Mehefin diwethaf. Dengys hynny beth yr ydych yn ei wneud. Yr ydych yn symud y bobl hyn i'r rhestr aros ar gyfer cleifion allanol lle y maent yn aros am amser maith cyn gweld ymgynghorydd. Mae'n warthus.

Val Feld: Fel y gwyddoch, cefais gryn dipyn o brofiad o'r NHS yng Nghymru yn ddiweddar ac yr wyf ar fin cael llawer mwy yn ystod yr ychydig fisoedd nesaf. David, a gytunwch mai'r rheswm pam bod y rhestrau aros yn cynyddu yw bod pobl erbyn hyn yn ymddiried yn yr NHS yng Nghymru mewn ffordd nad oeddent yn ystod blynyddoedd y llywodraeth Geidwadol flaenorol? Erbyn hyn disgwylant gael eu gweld a chael triniaeth dda os yw eu henwau ar restr aros ac y maent yn sicr o hynny. Dyna'r gwahaniaeth sylfaenol o ganlyniad i'r hyn a ddigwyddodd yn ystod y pedair blynedd diwethaf.

David Melding: Dymunaf adferiad llawn a buan ichi. Mae'n wir, pan gaiff pobl eu trin, cânt eu hysbrydoli gan y staff a'r gofal a gânt. Mae hynny'n briodol ar lefel yr unigolyn ac ategaf hynny. Pan gewch eich trin yn yr NHS, mae'r driniaeth yn wych ac nid oes unrhyw amheuaeth am hynny. Fodd bynnag, ni fydd y sbin hwnnw yn argyhoeddi unrhyw un sydd yn aros am driniaeth. Dylech gyflawni eich addewidion etholiadol os ydych yn eu gwneud. Ni ddylech wneud yr addewidion hyn os nad oes unrhyw bosiblwydd y cânt eu cyflawni.

Dywedaf ychydig o eiriau am y ffordd

which the Minister might be kind enough to address directly. I hope that the Minister is now moving away from crude waiting list figures and targets. I hope that she will not repeat a target nor commit herself to a new target for the future and that she will realise that this is not the way forward. We have had enough of these failed waiting list targets. We need waiting time targets, where we can set realistic times for the main specialities for the future. They also act as a good benchmark for us to calculate how many more nurses, doctors and beds we will need. That approach will strengthen the morale of staff and will not undermine NHS frontline staff with ill-conceived crude waiting list pledges.

It is appropriate for the Labour Party, and the Liberal Democrats in the administration, to apologise for this terrible failure. You saw the situation a year ago and thought that you could get out of the hole that had been dug. You have not and have failed dramatically. If your manifesto promise meant anything when you made it, and repeated and reaffirmed it last summer, you should apologise for that failure. If no apology is forthcoming, it is proper that this administration is censured. On outpatient lists, the Labour Party has failed. On inpatient lists, the Labour Party has failed. On activity rates, the Labour Party has failed. Fewer people today receive treatment in the NHS than under the last Conservative Government.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): Llywydd and colleagues, I have some sympathy for the Welsh Conservatives. It cannot be easy to represent a party in such shambles. Even so, have they never heard of Denis Healey's first law of holes—when you are in one, stop digging? The pettiness of today's censure motion suggests that they have not. This whole debate is a result of a script for a show that never came to town. The Tories have been desperately hoping for bad news, based without doubt on their days of being in charge. When matters turned out differently, they simply carried on digging and this is the

ymlaen, efallai y bydd y Gweinidog gystal â'i thrafod yn y man. Gobeithiaf fod y Gweinidog erbyn hyn yn symud o ffigurau a thargedau amrwd ar gyfer rhestrau aros. Gobeithiaf na fydd yn ailadrodd targed nac yn ymrwymo i darged newydd yn y dyfodol ac y bydd yn sylweddoli nad dyma'r ffordd ymlaen. Yr ydym wedi diflasu ar y targedau hyn ar gyfer rhestrau aros nas cyflawnwyd. Mae angen targedau amseroedd aros, lle y gallwn osod amseroedd realistig ar gyfer y prif feysydd arbenigol yn y dyfodol. Maent hefyd yn gweithredu fel meincnod da inni gyfrifo faint yn fwy o nyrsys, meddygon a gwelyau y bydd eu hangen arnom. Bydd yr ymagwedd honno'n codi morâl y staff ac ni fydd yn tanseilio staff rheng flaen yr NHS trwy addewidion amrwd, byrbwyll ar restrau aros.

Mae'n briodol i'r Blaid Lafur a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn yr weinyddiaeth ymddiheuro am y methiant ofnadwy hwn. Gwelsoch y sefyllfa flwyddyn yn ôl gan feddwl y gallech ddianc o'r twll a gloddiwyd. Ni wnaethoch hynny gan fethu'n affwysol. Os oedd eich addewid maniffesto yn golygu unrhyw beth pan wnaethoch hi, a'i hailadrodd a'i hategu yr haf diwethaf, dylech ymddiheuro am y methiant hwnnw. Os na wneir ymddiheuriad, mae'n briodol i'r weinyddiaeth gael ei cheryddu. O ran y rhestrau ar gyfer cleifion allanol, methodd y Blaid Lafur. O ran y rhestrau ar gyfer cleifion mewnol, methodd y Blaid Lafur. O ran cyfraddau gweithgarwch, methodd y Blaid Lafur. Mae llai o bobl heddiw yn cael eu trin gan yr NHS nag o dan y Llywodraeth Geidwadol ddiwethaf.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Lywydd a chyd-Aelodau, cydymdeimlaf â Cheidwadwyr Cymru i raddau. Ni all fod yn hawdd cynrychioli plaid sydd mewn cymaint o anhrefn. Eto i gyd, a glywsant erioed am reol gyntaf Denis Healey ar dyllau—pan fyddwch mewn twll, peidier â thyllu? Mae arwynebedd y cynnig o gerydd heddiw yn awgrymu nad ydynt. Mae'r holl ddadl hon o ganlyniad i rywbeth nad yw wedi digwydd. Mae'r Torïaid wedi bod yn ysu am newyddion drwg, yn ddiâu yn seiliedig ar eu cynnod hwy mewn grym. Pan ddigwyddodd pethau fel arall, aethant ati a pharhau i dyllu a

censure motion that they found at the bottom of the hole.

Thanks, David, for giving me the opportunity to put the record straight on the achievements of the national health service over the past two years. A year ago the Assembly voted for the largest ever increase in spending in the health service since its inception and, through the comprehensive spending review, the largest ever sustainable increases year on year to provide growth and stability.

David Davies *rose—*

Jane Hutt: I will not give way. This is my statement. There will be an increase of a billion pounds over the next three years to improve services for patients in Wales for all our people. When I came into post two years ago, I was determined to rebuild the NHS and to heal the near fatal wounds inflicted on it by 18 years of Conservative Government. On coming to office in 1997 we found an NHS driven by cost improvement programmes, with an annual round of cuts and the internal market, hospital set against hospital. There was no planning or strategic vision for Wales, we had spiralling debts, rising waiting lists, demoralised staff, bed numbers cut for 16 consecutive years, nurse and midwifery numbers reduced every year since 1992 and workforce planning disbanded. Where was David during those days?

Last May, the service felt ready to come together and agreed a set of targets, aims and objectives to help steer it on its road to recovery. These were negotiated with my officials and presented to me on the back of the new investment. In setting targets and goals, we must be clear and open about what we are measuring ourselves against. We must ensure that people understand the figures, which sounded like gobbledegook when you gave them out, David, a few moments ago. Out activity rates are not fully reflected in published information as our day case activity rates have increased. I will return to that.

hwn yw'r cynnig o gerydd y daethant o hyd iddo yng ngwaelod y twll.

Diolch, David, am roi cyfle imi roi'r ffeithiau cywir am y cyflawniadau yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol dros y ddwy flynedd diwethaf. Flwyddyn yn ôl, pleidleisiodd y Cynulliad o blaid y cynnydd mwyaf erioed yng ngwariant y gwasanaeth iechyd ers ei sefydlu a, thrwy'r adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant, y cynnydd cynaliadwy mwyaf erioed flwyddyn wrth flwyddyn er mwyn sicrhau twf a sefydlogrwydd.

David Davies *a gododd—*

Jane Hutt: Nid ildiaf. Hwn yw fy natganiad. Bydd cynnydd o biliwn o bunnoedd yn ystod y tair blynedd nesaf er mwyn gwella gwasanaethau i gleifion yng Nghymru ar gyfer ein pobl. Pan ddechreuais yn fy swydd ddwy flynedd yn ôl, yr oeddwn yn benderfynol o ailadeiladu'r NHS a gwella'r clwyfau angheuol bron a barwyd gan 18 mlynedd o Lywodraeth Geidwadol. Ar ôl dod i rym yn 1997 canfuom NHS a oedd wedi'i lywio gan raglenni gwella costau, ynghyd â chylch blynyddol o doriadau a marchnad fewnol, gan osod ysbyty yn erbyn ysbyty. Nid oedd unrhyw gynllunio na gweledigaeth strategol ar gyfer Cymru, yr oedd gennym ddyledion cynyddol, rhestrau aros cynyddol, staff a oedd wedi digalonni, gostyngiad yn nifer y gwelyau am 16 mlynedd yn olynol, nifer y nyrsys a bydwagedd wedi'i ostwng bob blwyddyn ers 1992 a chynllunio ar gyfer y gweithlu wedi'i ddiddymu. Ym mhle yr oedd David bryd hynny?

Fis Mai diwethaf, teimlai'r gwasanaeth ei fod yn barod i ddod ynghyd a chytuno ar set o dargedau, nodau ac amcanion i'w helpu i wella. Negodwyd y rhain gyda'm swyddogion ac fe'u cyflwynwyd imi ar gefn y buddsoddiad newydd. Wrth osod targedau a nodau, rhaid inni fod yn glir ac yn agored ynglŷn â'n llinyn mesur. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod pobl yn deall y ffigurau, a oedd yn swnio fel rwdl-mi-ri pan oeddech yn eu darllen yn uchel ychydig funudau yn ôl, David. Ni chaiff ein cyfraddau gweithgarwch eu hadlewyrchu yn yr wybodaeth gyhoeddedig am fod ein cyfraddau gweithgarwch o ran achosion dydd wedi cynyddu. Dychwelaf at hynny.

4:50 p.m.

The challenges that we posed to the service were tough. I will not apologise for that. As *The Western Mail* wrote last year on this subject

‘lack of ambition will achieve nothing’.

The money had to reach the patient through good management, recruitment of new staff, increases in capacity at all levels, as well as investment to drive up innovation and improve performance. We want to identify new practice, as you know, David, and to improve activity—there is £4 million this year for the innovation performance fund. You know of all the measures that we are driving through to put patients first. Less than a year on we have good news, with 10,000 fewer people waiting for treatment. We have made a good start in addressing waiting times, which everyone in this Chamber wants, rather than the length of list. I am particularly pleased that 2,500 people who were waiting over six months for cataract operations have now had those operations. We are paving the way for our waiting times strategy, which we all agree is the way forward. What waiting time did you come up with during your time in office?

It has not been an easy time for NHS staff. There are pressures all year round, but they are particularly tough in winter. These have not hit the headlines because of the extra £40 million that we put into the service. This money will make a permanent difference so that last year’s gains can be built upon year on year—no more one-off initiatives that your Government fostered.

On activity, my main response is that our investments, our planning and our collaboration are now showing results, David. You choose to attack the results today. We are still recovering from your blows. Do you support quality care, David? When did you last speak to doctors and nurses under pressure? The money has

Yr oedd y sialensau a osodwyd gennym i'r gwasanaeth yn rhai anodd. Nid ymddiheuraf am hynny. Fel yr ysgrifennodd *The Western Mail* y llynedd ar y pwnc hwn

Yr oedd yn rhaid i'r arian gyrraedd y claf drwy reoli da, recriwtio aelodau newydd o staff, gwella capasiti ar bob lefel, yn ogystal â buddsoddi er mwyn symbylu dyfeisgarwch a gwella perfformiad. Yr ydym am nodi arferion newydd, fel y gwyddoch, David, a gwella gweithgarwch—clustnodir £4 miliwn eleni ar gyfer y gronfa perfformiad dyfeisgarwch. Gwyddoch am bob un o'r mesurau yr ydym yn eu cyflwyno er mwyn rhoi cleifion yn gyntaf. Lai na blwyddyn wedi hynny mae gennym newyddion da. Mae 10,000 yn llai o bobl yn aros am driniaeth. Yr ydym wedi dechrau'n dda o ran mynd i'r afael ag amseroedd aros, sef rhywbeth y mae pawb yn y Siambr hon yn dymuno ei weld, yn hytrach na hyd y rhestr. Yr wyf yn arbennig o falch bod 2,500 o bobl a oedd yn aros dros chwe mis am lawdriniaeth ar gyfer cataract erbyn hyn wedi cael y llawdriniaeth honno. Yr ydym yn paratoi'r ffordd ar gyfer ein strategaeth amseroedd aros, sef y ffordd ymlaen ym marn pawb. Pa amseroedd aros a luniwyd gennych chi pan oeddech mewn gym?

Ni fu'n gyfnod hawdd i staff yr NHS. Ceir pwysau drwy gydol y flwyddyn, ond maent yn arbennig o drwm yn ystod y gaeaf. Ni fu'r rhain yn y penawdau oherwydd y £40 miliwn ychwanegol a roesom i'r gwasanaeth. Bydd yr arian hwn yn gwneud gwahaniaeth parhaol er mwyn inni adeiladu ar yr hyn a gyflawnwyd y llynedd flwyddyn wrth flwyddyn—dim rhagor o fentrau untro a fabwysiadwyd gan eich Llywodraeth chi.

O ran gweithgarwch, fy mhrif ymateb yw bod ein buddsoddiadau, ein cynllunio a'n cydweithio bellach yn dwyn ffrwyth, David. Penderfynwch ymosod ar y canlyniadau heddiw. Yr ydym yn dal i adfeddiannu ar ôl eich ergydion. A gefnogwch ofal o ansawdd, David? Pryd oedd y tro diwethaf ichi siarad â meddygon a nyrsys o dan bwysau? Mae'r

provided 20 extra critical care beds, more than 100 acute beds over the winter, extra clinics and operating sessions, and 36 new consultants. Our flu immunisation campaign was successful, but the admission rates on average were the same this year as last year, and referrals from primary care have gone up. We may have missed our targets on outpatients, but in the year to December 2000, the NHS in Wales saw over 2.647 million outpatients, and increased the number of outpatients seen over the previous year. These are the increases in activity to which I refer. There has been a downward trend in outpatients lists since last September after five years of increases. The fall in inpatients is not at the expense of outpatients. For the first time in years inpatients and outpatients numbers and waiting times are falling.

Remember, David, that we have an ageing population, and we still have unacceptable levels of ill health in Wales. The ageing population will possibly result in longer stays in hospitals and will require closer joined-up government, which we are achieving with our plan for the NHS. Will you join me in giving that vote of thanks to NHS staff and carers who have played their part in keeping people well at home, to prevent admissions and re-admissions, to provide occupational therapy and physiotherapy and district nursing in the community? The staff and patients of Wales want to see and hear constructive politics in this Chamber, not schoolboy playground politics.

'I know that you can do better' would be my mid-term report for you. You are capable of constructive and positive politics, and when you are, as you know, I listen and I learn. We have a great opportunity in the Assembly to put dignity back into politics, to demonstrate that every move that we make is for the betterment of government and for the common good. Your ill-judged motion today undermines that dignity and opportunity, and undermines the extraordinary good news that

arian wedi darparu 20 o welyau gofal llym ychwanegol, mwy na 100 o welyau aciwt dros y gaeaf, rhagor o glinigau a sesiynau o lawdriniaeth, a 36 o ymgynghorwyr newydd. Bu ein hymgyrch i frechu rhag y fflw yn llwyddiant, ond ar gyfartaledd cafwyd yr un cyfraddau derbyn eleni ag a gawsom y llynedd a gwelwyd cynnydd yn y cyfeiriadau o ofal sylfaenol. Efallai ein bod wedi methu â chyrraedd ein targedau ar gyfer cleifion allanol, ond yn y flwyddyn hyd at Ragfyr 2000, gwelodd yr NHS yng Nghymru dros 2.647 miliwn o gleifion allanol, gan ragori ar nifer y cleifion allanol a welwyd yn y flwyddyn flaenorol. Dyma'r meysydd y cyfeiraf atynt lle y mae cynnydd o ran gweithgarwch. Ers Medi diwethaf mae nifer y cleifion allanol ar y rhestrau wedi bod yn gostwng ar ôl pum mlynedd o dwf. Nid yw'r gostyngiad yn nifer y cleifion mewnol ar draul cleifion allanol. Am y tro cyntaf ers blyneddoddedd mae nifer y cleifion mewnol ac allanol ar y rhestrau aros a'r amseroedd aros yn gostwng.

Cofiwch, David, fod y boblogaeth yn heneiddio, ac mae gennym lefelau annerbyniol o afiechyd yng Nghymru o hyd. Yn sgîl y ffaith bod y boblogaeth yn heneiddio efallai y bydd cleifion yn aros am gyfnodau hwy mewn ysbyty a fydd yn gofyn am lywodraeth fwy cydgyssylltiedig, a gyflawnir gennym drwy ein cynllun ar gyfer yr NHS. A wnewch ymuno â mi i ddiolch i staff a chynhalwyr yr NHS sydd wedi chwarae eu rhan i gadw pobl yn iach yn eu cartrefi, i atal cleifion rhag cael eu derbyn a'u haillderbyn i'r ysbyty, i ddarparu therapi galwedigaethol a ffisiotherapi a nyrsio dosbarth yn y gymuned? Mae staff a chleifion Cymru am weld a chlywed gwleidyddiaeth adeiladol yn y Siambr hon, nid gwleidyddia iard yr ysgol.

'Gwn y gallwch wneud yn well' fyddai fy adroddiad canol tymor ichi. Yr ydych yn gallu gwleidyddia'n adeiladol a chadarnhaol, a phan fyddwch yn gwneud hynny, fel y gwyddoch, yr wyf yn gwranddo ac yn dysgu. Mae gennym gyfle gwych yn y Cynulliad i adfer urddas gwleidyddiaeth, i ddangos y caiff pob cam a gymerwn ei gymryd er mwyn gwella llywodraeth ac er mwyn lles pawb. Mae eich cynnig byrbwyll heddiw yn tanseilio'r urddas a'r cyfle hwnnw, ac yn

we have on this Labour Day for the NHS. It belies the support for the health service's renewal and rebirth. It has a long journey ahead, as set out in our plan Improving Health in Wales, which was endorsed by the Assembly. We have taken the first steps down a long road of recovery from your years in power. It also distracts from our bigger task in the Assembly, which is to improve the health and wellbeing of the people of Wales. This crosses all our policy boundaries, from improving prosperity to educational opportunity, housing, environment and culture.

I am here, David, to serve the people of Wales, and to play my part as Minister for Health and Social Services in this great Assembly, based upon my determination to tackle poverty and injustice, to end the inequalities that blight so many communities in Wales and to improve and invest in health. I invite the Assembly to join me in this task, as Members often do, to show the staff and patients of NHS Wales that we respect them and their needs, and that their aspirations are our aspirations. We must get on with that task as we start a new term of the National Assembly for Wales.

David Lloyd: Datganaf fuddiant fel meddyg teulu.

Ni fydd Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi'r cynnig hwn, ond byddwn yn atal ein pleidlais. Mae ar y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol angen gweithredu gwirioneddol yn y maes, gyda strategaeth hirdymor a blaenoriaeth i gynyddu'r nifer o welyau, nyrsys a meddygon. Nid yw fy nghleifion am weld gêm wleidyddol yn cael ei chwarae. Maent am weld gwahaniaeth a gwelliant sylweddol yn y gallu i drin pobl yn y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru.

Plaid Cymru will not support the censure motion. It is an election gesture from the Conservative Party. The Welsh Conservatives had their chance with the NHS in Wales; never again.

Rod Richards *rose*—

tanseilio'r newyddion hynod o dda a gawsom am yr NHS ar Wyl y Gweithwyr. Mae'n gwadu'r gefnogaeth i sicrhau adferiad ac aileni'r gwasanaeth iechyd. Mae ganddo daith hir o'i flaen, fel y nodwyd yn ein cynllun Gwella Iechyd yng Nghymru, a gefnogwyd gan y Cynulliad. Yr ydym wedi cymryd y camau cyntaf ar hyd ffordd hir tuag at wellhad ar ôl y blynyddoedd pan oeddech mewn grym. Mae hefyd yn tynnu ein sylw o'r dasg fwy sydd gennym yn y Cynulliad, sef gwella iechyd a lles pobl Cymru. Mae hyn yn croesi pob un o'n ffiniau polisi, o wella ffyniant i gyfle addysgol, tai, yr angylchedd a diwylliant.

Yr wyf fi yma, David i wasanaethu pobl Cymru, a chwarae fy rhan fel Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn y Cynulliad mawreddog hwn, yn seiliedig ar fy mhenderfyniad i fynd i'r afael â thlodi ac anghyfiawnder, i ddileu'r anghydraddoldebau sydd yn diffeithio cymaint o gymunedau yng Nghymru ac i wella a buddsoddi mewn iechyd. Gwahoddaf y Cynulliad i ymuno â mi yn y dasg hon fel y gwna'r Aelodau yn aml, er mwyn profi i staff NHS Cymru a'r cleifion ein bod yn eu parchu hwy a'u hanghenion, ac mai eu dyheadau hwy yw ein dyheadau ni. Rhaid inni fwrw iddi i gyflawni'r dasg honno wrth inni ddechrau tymor newydd yng Nghynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru.

David Lloyd: I declare an interest as a general practitioner.

Plaid Cymru will not support this motion, but will abstain. The national health service needs real action on the ground, with a long-term strategy and priority given to increasing the number of beds, nurses and doctors. My patients do not want to see a political game played out. They want to see a real difference and a substantial improvement in the ability to treat people in the health service in Wales

Ni fydd Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi'r cynnig o gerydd. Gweithred etholiadol ydyw gan y Blaid Geidwadol. Cafodd Ceidwadwyr Cymru eu cyfle gyda'r NHS yng Nghymru; byth eto.

Rod Richards *a gododd*—

Y Llywydd: A wnewch chi ildio i Rod Richards?

David Lloyd: Na wnaif.

Six thousand hospital beds in Wales were lost from 1988 onwards. National Health Service staff and people in Wales have not forgotten the Conservatives' role in that. The Conservative Party is a discredited and, for the most part, a spent force in Wales. It does not have a Member of Parliament representing a Welsh constituency, and has only eight Assembly Members with the party whip. It is a small, fringe band.

Rod Richards *rose—*

David Lloyd: On the point about not having the Tory whip, I will allow a short intervention.

Rod Richards: The Member, once in Welsh and once in English, mentioned the decrease in the number of hospital beds. In Welsh, he said that the number of hospital beds should be increased. Will he tell us what that increase should be and whether it should be a continuous process or whether there is a limit?

David Lloyd: I will come to that point later, therefore you should continue to listen, Rod.

This is desperate electioneering from the Conservative group, which is, quite frankly, irrelevant and insulting to the real needs of Wales. It was the UK Labour Party that, in the first two years of this Government, stuck to Tory spending plans. The damage caused by the Conservative Party has been continued by Labour.

David Davies: Will you give way? You supported the Tories—

The Presiding Officer: Order. It is not appropriate, as David knows—as he is a courteous, fine, upstanding gentleman—to make an intervention when he is requesting to make it. Will the Member give way to David Davies?

The Presiding Officer: Will you give way to Rod Richards?

David Lloyd: No.

Collwyd chwe mil o welyau ysbyty yng Nghymru o 1988 ymlaen. Nid yw staff y Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol a phobl Cymru wedi anghofio am rôl y Ceidwadwyr yn hynny. Mae'r Blaid Geidwadol wedi colli hygrededd, ac ar y cyfan, wedi chwythu ei phlwc yng Nghymru. Nid oes ganddi Aelod Seneddol sydd yn cynrychioli un etholaeth yng Nghymru, a dim ond wyth o Aelodau ynghyd â chwip y blaid sydd ganddi yn y Cynulliad. Mae'n blaid fach, ymylol.

Rod Richards *a gododd—*

David Lloyd: Ynglŷn â'r pwynt ar dynnu'r chwip Torïaidd yn ôl, caniatâf ymyriad byr.

Rod Richards: Soniodd yr Aelod, unwaith yn Gymraeg ac unwaith yn Saesneg, am y gostyngiad yn nifer y gwelyau ysbyty. Yn Gymraeg, dywedodd y dylid cynyddu nifer y gwelyau ysbyty. A ddywed wrthym beth y dylai'r cynnydd hwnnw fod ac a ddylai fod yn broses barhaus neu a oes unrhyw derfyn iddo?

David Lloyd: Trafodaf y pwynt hwnnw yn y man, felly dylech barhau i wrando, Rod.

Mae hyn yn lecsiyna truenus gan y grŵp Ceidwadol, sydd, a dweud y gwir, yn amherthnasol ac yn sarhau gwir anghenion Cymru. Yn ystod dwy flynedd gyntaf y Llywodraeth hon, cadwodd Plaid Lafur y DU at gynlluniau gwario'r Torïaid. Mae'r niwed a barodd y Blaid Geidwadol wedi parhau o dan Lafur.

David Davies: A wnewch chi ildio? Cefnogasoch y Torïaid—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid yw'n briodol, fel y gŵyr David—am ei fod yn ŵr bonheddig, cwrtais a pharchus—i ymyrryd pan fo'n gofyn am wneud hynny. A wnaiff yr Aelod ildio i David Davies?

David Lloyd: No. I have listened to enough Conservatives during the course of this debate.

The Labour Government has failed to reduce waiting lists and, in fact, they have increased. In Wales, the number of patients waiting over 12 months for inpatient treatment has increased from 6,000 in March 1997 to 8,800 in March 2001, which is an increase of over 44 per cent. The number of patients waiting over 18 months for inpatient treatment has increased from 1,400 in March 1997 to 3,900 in March 2001, which is an increase of 181 per cent. The number of patients waiting over three months for their first outpatient appointment has increased from 28,000 in March 1997 to 85,000 in March 2001, which is an increase of 201 per cent. The number of patients waiting for over six months for their first outpatient appointment has increased from 5,000 in March 1997 to 45,000 in March 2001, which is an increase of 675 per cent.

Alun Cairns: Will you give way?

David Lloyd: No.

The solution is capacity. It is also about resources, but it is mainly about increasing capacity and making a real difference to patients in the consulting room. Patients do not want to know about statistics. They want to know about their operation, their nurse and their doctor. The NHS's capacity to treat sick patients must be increased. There must be more doctors, more nurses and more beds. The Government's response to last year's winter crisis was to announce the creation of an emergency pressures taskforce. The taskforce's key recommendation was that an extra 400 beds were needed in the NHS in Wales. As yet, Jane Hutt has only delivered about 130 extra beds. There are currently 750 known nursing vacancies in the system. The Royal College of Nursing estimates a need for 2,000 extra nurses in addition to the current vacancies. Today is national doctor day. There are problems in recruiting GP Registrars for some of the most prominent GP vocational training schemes in Wales, namely in Swansea and Bridgend. There is also an overwhelming threat of mass resignation by GPs in the NHS in the coming

David Lloyd: Na wnaif. Yr wyf wedi gwrando ar ddigon o Geidwadwyr yn ystod y ddadl hon.

Methodd y Llywodraeth Lafur â lleihau'r rhestrau aros ac, yn wir, maent wedi cynyddu. Yng Nghymru, mae nifer y cleifion sydd yn aros dros 12 mis am driniaeth fel cleifion mewnol wedi cynyddu o 6,000 ym Mawrth 1997 i 8,800 ym Mawrth 2001, sef cynnydd o dros 44 y cant. Mae nifer y cleifion sydd yn aros dros 18 mis am driniaeth fel cleifion mewnol wedi cynyddu o 1,400 ym Mawrth 1997 i 3,900 ym Mawrth 2001, sef cynnydd o 181 y cant. Mae nifer y cleifion sydd yn aros dros dri mis am eu hapwyntiad cyntaf fel claf allanol wedi cynyddu o 28,000 ym Mawrth 1997 i 85,000 ym Mawrth 2001, sef cynnydd 201 y cant. Mae nifer y cleifion sydd yn aros dros chwe mis ar gyfer eu hapwyntiad cyntaf fel claf allanol wedi cynyddu o 5,000 ym Mawrth 1997 i 45,000 ym Mawrth 2001, sef cynnydd o 675 y cant.

Alun Cairns: A wnewch chi ildio?

David Lloyd: Na wnaif.

Capasiti yw'r ateb. Mae hefyd yn ymwneud ag adnoddau, ond yn bennaf mae'n ymwneud â sicrhau mwy o gapasiti a gwneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol i gleifion yn ystafell y meddyg. Nid yw pobl am wrando ar ystadegau. Maent am gael gwybod am eu llawdriniaeth, eu nyrs a'u meddyg. Mae'n rhaid cynyddu capasiti'r NHS i drin cleifion. Rhaid cael mwy o feddygon, mwy o nyrsys a mwy o welyau. Ymateb y Llywodraeth i'r argyfwng yn ystod y gaeaf y llynedd oedd cyhoeddi ei bod yn sefydlu tasglu pwysau brys. Argymhelliad allweddol y tasglu oedd bod angen 400 o welyau ychwanegol yn yr NHS yng Nghymru. Hyd yma, dim ond 130 o welyau ychwanegol a ddarparwyd gan Jane Hutt. Mae 750 o swyddi nyrsio gwag yn y system ar hyn o bryd. Mae'r Coleg Nyrsio Brenhinol yn amcangyfrif bod angen 2,000 o nyrsys yn ychwanegol at y swyddi sydd yn wag ar hyn o bryd. Diwrnod Cenedlaethol y Meddygon ydyw heddiw. Ceir problemau o ran recriwtio Cofrestryddion sydd yn Feddygon Teulu ar gyfer rhai o'r cynlluniau hyfforddi galwedigaeth mwyaf blaenllaw ar gyfer Meddygon Teulu yng Nghymru, sef yn

year.

Abertawe a Phen-y-bont ar Ogwr. Ceir bygythiad aruthrol hefyd yn sgîl y llu o feddygon teulu a fydd yn ymddiswyddo o'r NHS yn ystod y flwyddyn nesaf.

5:00 p.m.

A debate on whether or not to censure one Labour Minister is not the point. The people of Wales remember all too well how the NHS suffered at the hands of the Tories. They will also remember how the Labour Government of Wales let them down by way of increased waiting lists. We need a Government of Wales that will deliver change for my patients and for everyone else in Wales.

Nid dadlau ynghylch a ddylid ceryddu un o'r Gweinidogion Llafur ai peidio sydd yn bwysig. Mae'r ffordd y bu'r NHS yn dioddef yn nwylo'r Torïaid yn fyw yng nghof pobl Cymru o hyd. Byddant hefyd yn cofio sut y mae Llywodraeth Lafur Cymru wedi eu siomi yn sgîl y cynnydd yn y rhestrau aros. Mae angen Llywodraeth Cymru a fydd yn cyflwyno newidiadau i'm cleifion i a phawb arall yng Nghymru.

Brian Gibbons: This debate is bizarre, to say the least. It comes at a time when there are many good news stories in the NHS. One wonders, if the Minister has to face a censure motion at such a time, what would happen if there was a bad news story in the NHS.

Brian Gibbons: Mae'r ddadl hon yn un rhyfedd, a dweud y lleiaf. Digwydd ar adeg pan fydd llawer o straeon newyddion da yn yr NHS. Tybed, o ystyried bod yn rhaid i'r Gweinidog wynebu cynnig o gerydd ar adeg fel hon, beth fyddai'n digwydd pe bai newyddion drwg am yr NHS.

Alun Cairns *rose*—

Alun Cairns *a gododd*—

Brian Gibbons: I will give way in a minute. Conservative spokespeople have raised this issue on several occasions over the last three or four months. A question on the subject was asked to the First Minister around Christmas time. There was absolute derision when Rhodri said that we would get close to the targets for inpatient care services. We have now delivered on that. If David Melding was offered a bet at that time, I am sure that he would have given us long odds to reduce the waiting list to 65,000.

Brian Gibbons: Ildiaf mewn munud. Codwyd y mater hwn ar sawl achlysur yn ystod y tri neu bedwar mis diwethaf gan lefarwyr y Blaid Geidwadol. Gofynnwyd cwestiwn ar y pwnc i'r Prif Weinidog cyn y Nadolig. Bu cryn wawdio pan ddywedodd Rhodri y byddem yn nesáu at y targedau ar gyfer gwasanaethau gofal i gleifion mewnol. Yr ydym bellach wedi cyflawni hynny. Pe bai rhywun wedi cynnig bet i David Melding bryd hynny, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai wedi cynnig ods hir ar sicrhau gostyngiad o 65,000 yn y rhestr aros.

The Presiding Officer: Order. Before Brian gives way, I advise Alun Cairns that, if he is keen, there is time for him to make a speech. Because of deferred business, there is more time available for this debate. I would be happy to call Alun, if he wants to save his intervention.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Cyn i Brian ildio, cynghoraf Alun Cairns fod amser iddo wneud araith os yw'n awyddus i wneud hynny. Oherwydd y busnes a ohiriwyd, mae mwy o amser ar gael i'r ddadl hon. Byddwn yn falch o alw ar Alun, os hoffai gadw ei ymyriad.

Alun Cairns: I will use my intervention as I want to clarify a point that Brian made. He claimed that there were currently many good news stories in the NHS. Does he therefore consider that missing the waiting list target is

Alun Cairns: Defnyddiaf fy ymyriad gan fy mod am egluro pwynt a wnaeth Brian. Honnodd fod llawer o straeon newyddion da yn yr NHS ar hyn o bryd. A yw felly o'r farn bod methu â chyrraedd y targed ar gyfer

a good news story?

Brian Gibbons: There are good news stories. Since the waiting list peaked last May, there has been an 18 per cent decline in the number of patients on the inpatient waiting list. David Melding then tables a censure motion. He would not recognise good news in the NHS if it came up and ran him over. Equally, the outpatient waiting list has decreased by 5 to 6 per cent over the last quarter. Has David Melding any comment to make on this good news? Of course not.

David Melding: The outpatient waiting list has increased by 680 per cent under Brian's party's administration. It may now have decreased 7 per cent, so it is now up only 662 per cent or whatever the figure is. That is still a massive failure.

Brian Gibbons: You have conceded the point. The problems are being turned around because of the extra money that the Labour administration is putting in to the NHS. By the time that the comprehensive spending review finishes in 2004, the amount of spending on the NHS since David Melding's party was in power will have increased by over 50 per cent. We did not hear that good news from David Melding. He is much more interested in making cheap political points. David Melding dealt with the issue of waiting times. We have responded to that. David probably does know—or if he does not, he should—that there was a conference in November specifically dealing with introducing waiting times in the NHS. The whole emphasis of the new focus of targets in the NHS and for trust performance is the importance of waiting times. If David did not know that, he should have known. If he did know it, he did not recognise a good news story. He chose to emphasise the negative.

Finally, on the numbers that David Lloyd mentioned, it is true that the number of hospital beds has gone down consistently for at least two or three decades. This is the first time that the number of hospital beds has started to increase. With the extra money that we are putting into the health service, we will

rhestrau aros yn newyddion da?

Brian Gibbons: Ceir straeon newyddion da. Ers i'r rhestr aros gyrraedd brig fis Mai diwethaf, bu gostyngiad o 18 y cant yn nifer y cleifion ar y rhestr aros ar gyfer cleifion mewnol. Yna mae David Melding yn cyflwyno cynnig o gerydd. Ni fyddai'n adnabod newyddion da yn yr NHS pe bai o flaen ei lygaid. Yn yr un modd, mae'r rhestr aros ar gyfer cleifion allanol wedi gostwng 5 i 6 y cant yn ystod y chwarter diwethaf. A oes unrhyw sylw gan David Melding ar y newyddion da hyn? Go brin.

David Melding: Cynyddodd y rhestr aros ar gyfer cleifion allanol 680 y cant o dan weinyddiaeth plaid Brian. Efallai ei bod wedi gostwng 7 y cant erbyn hyn, felly dim ond cynnydd o 662 y cant neu beth bynnag yw'r ffigur a geir yn awr. Mae hynny yn dal yn fethiant enfawr.

Brian Gibbons: Yr ydych wedi ildio'r pwynt. Mae'r problemau'n dechrau cael eu datrys oherwydd yr arian ychwanegol y mae'r weinyddiaeth Lafur yn ei roi i'r NHS. Erbyn i'r adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant ddod i ben yn 2004, bydd y gwariant ar yr NHS ers i blaid David Melding fod mewn grym, wedi cynyddu dros 50 y cant. Ni chlywsom y newyddion da hynny gan David Melding. Mae'n llawer mwy awyddus i wneud pwyntiau gwleidyddol diwerth. Ymdriniodd David Melding â mater amseroedd aros. Yr ydym wedi ymateb i hynny. Gŵyr David siŵr o fod—os na ŵyr, fe ddylai—y cynhaliwyd cynhadledd ym mis Tachwedd yn arbennig i drafod cyflwyno amseroedd aros yn yr NHS. Holl bwyslais ffocws newydd y targedau o fewn yr NHS a pherfformiad yr ymddiriedolaethau yw pwysigrwydd amseroedd aros. Os nad oedd David yn gwybod hynny, dylai fod. Os oedd yn gwybod amdano, nid adnabu stori sydd yn newyddion da. Mynnodd bwysleisio'r ochr negyddol.

I gloi, o ran y ffigurau a grybwyllodd David Lloyd, mae'n wir bod nifer y gwelyau ysbyty wedi gostwng yn gyson am o leiaf dau neu dri degawd. Dyma'r tro cyntaf i nifer y gwelyau ysbyty ddechrau codi. Oherwydd yr arian ychwanegol a roddwn i'r gwasanaeth iechyd, byddwn yn gallu mynd i'r afael â'r

be able to address these capacity issues. That is one of the reasons why the number of medical students in Wales, for example, will double over the next two to three years. This is our record and it is a good news story. David Melding would not recognise it if it hit him across the face.

Kirsty Williams: I am pleased to see that despite rumours of an election to other institutions and widespread fears that these could interfere with this Assembly's activities, we are pursuing business as usual. In fairness to David Melding, there is nothing out of the ordinary about another Assembly session beginning with yet another Conservative censure motion. It is beginning to feel as if the people of Wales have not got their money's worth without another female cabinet minister being castigated by Bourne's boys for this, that and the other.

Nick Bourne: Mike German's next, do not worry. [*Laughter.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order.

Kirsty Williams: Governments are criticised by oppositions. There is something fundamentally wrong with the system if there is never any dissent. As a Liberal Democrat, I can see nothing intrinsically wrong in questioning a Minister, or anyone else in the Government, on their performance in office. I do not disagree with the Assembly having the opportunity to discuss waiting lists. The Liberal Democrats gave up on them years ago. They are ineffective and clinically unhelpful in measuring NHS performance, and completely ignore the quality of care received by patients in Wales, to which Val has already attested. By constantly using the blunt instrument of censure, I am unsure if the Conservative Party achieves anything. Its own reputation is damaged by the continuous impression that it plays the person and not the issue. The function of censure—an extreme measure in any circumstance—is devalued from being the ultimate ministerial sanction to being just another every day part of the political armoury over which we divide on party lines. I wonder if David, as a Conservative politician who is genuinely committed to the success of this institution

materion hyn sydd yn ymwneud â chapasiti. Dyna un o'r rhesymau pam y bydd nifer y myfyrwyr meddygol yng Nghymru, er enghraifft, yn dyblu yn ystod y ddwy neu dair blynedd nesaf. Dyna ein record ac mae'n stori newyddion da. Ni fyddai David Melding yn ei hadnabod pe bai yn ei fwrw yn ei wyneb.

Kirsty Williams: Yr wyf yn falch o weld ein bod yn cynnal ein busnes fel arfer er gwaethaf y sïon am etholiad i sefydliadau eraill a'r ofnau cyffredinol y gallai'r rhain ymyrryd â gweithgareddau'r Cynulliad hwn. A bod yn deg â David Melding, nid anghyffredin o beth yw dechrau sesiwn arall o'r Cynulliad gyda chynnig o gerydd gan y Ceidwadwyr. Mae'n dechrau teimlo na fydd pobl Cymru wedi cael gwerth eu harian oni chaiff merch arall sydd yn Weinidog Cabinet ei dwrdio am rywbeth neu'i gilydd gan fechgyn Bourne.

Nick Bourne: Tro Mike German fydd hi nesaf, peidiwch â phoeni. [*Chwerthin.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn.

Kirsty Williams: Caiff llywodraethau eu beirniadu gan wrthbleidiau. Byddai rhywbeth mawr o'i le ar y system pe na bai unrhyw anghytuno. Fel Democrat Rhyddfrydol, ni welaf unrhyw beth o'i le yn y bôn ar holi Gweinidog, neu unrhyw un arall yn y Llywodraeth, ar eu perfformiad mewn swydd. Nid anghytunaf â rhoi cyfle i'r Cynulliad drafod rhestrau aros. Cefnodd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol arnynt flynyddoedd yn ôl. Maent yn aneffeithiol ac nid ydynt o gymorth yn glinigol o ran mesur perfformiad yr NHS, ac maent yn anwybyddu ansawdd y gofal a gaiff cleifion yng Nghymru yn llwyr, fel y dywedodd Val eisoes. Drwy ddefnyddio arf amrwd megis cerydd, nid wyf yn siŵr a yw'r Blaid Geidwadol yn cyflawni unrhyw beth. Caiff ei henw da ei hun ei niweidio drwy'r argraff barhaus ei bod yn mynd ar drywydd y person ac nid y mater o dan sylw. Caiff swyddogaeth cerydd—mesur eithafol o dan unrhyw amgylchiadau—ei dibrisio o fod yn sancsiwn eithaf ar weinidog i fod yn rhan feunyddiol o'r ymgiprys gwleidyddol lle yr ydym yn rhannu yn ôl ein pleidiau. Tybed a yw David, fel gwleidydd Ceidwadol sydd yn wir

and who works constructively, hard and intelligently week in week out on the Health and Social Services Committee, is concerned about the damage that this kind of politics does to his reputation, to his party, and, more importantly, to this institution? Will this censure motion recruit a much-needed nurse? Will this censure motion create another operating session? I think not. It undermines the efforts of the staff of the NHS and dumbs down our ambitions for the patients of Wales.

ymrwymedig i lwyddiant y sefydliad hwn ac sydd yn gweithio mewn modd adeiladol, diwyd a deallus wythnos ar ôl wythnos ar y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, yn pryderu am y niwed y mae gwleidyddiaeth o'r fath yn ei achosi i'w enw da, i'w blaid ac, yn bwysicach, i'r sefydliad hwn? A fydd y cynnig hwn o gerydd yn recriwtio yr un nyrs sydd ei hangen yn ddybryd? A fydd y cynnig hwn o gerydd yn creu sesiwn arall o lawdriniaeth? Ni chredaf. Mae'n tanseilio ymdrechion staff yr NHS ac yn glastwreiddio ein dyheadau ar gyfer cleifion Cymru.

5:10 p.m.

It is not for me to defend an election pledge in a 1997 party manifesto. Those arguments are for another day, another place and another occasion. However, it is true that since October and the creation of the partnership Government, the Liberal Democrats and the Labour Party have worked together to allocate nearly £250 million of additional resources to the NHS. That shows that this Government puts its money where its mouth is. The fact that, in February this year, we had the largest single fall in the number of patients waiting for inpatient treatment in any month since the Assembly began, shows that the policies pursued by the Minister on behalf of the partnership Government are beginning to take effect.

Nid fy lle i yw amddiffyn addewid etholiad maniffesto plaid yn 1997. Mae'r dadleuon hynny yn perthyn i ddiwrnod arall, lle arall ac achlysur arall. Fodd bynnag, mae'n wir bod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a'r Blaid Lafur ers creu'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth ym mis Hydref wedi cydweithio i ddyrannu ymron i £250 miliwn o adnoddau ychwanegol i'r NHS. Dengys hynny fod y Llywodraeth hon yn cadw at ei gair. Mae'r ffaith inni sicrhau'r gostyngiad mwyaf yn nifer y cleifion sydd yn aros am driniaeth fel cleifion mewnlol ym mis Chwefror eleni nag mewn unrhyw fis ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad, yn dangos bod y polisiau a ddilynwyd gan y Gweinidog ar ran y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth yn dechrau dwyn ffrwyth.

I know that the Tories would love us all to return to the good old days when William Hague or John Redwood ran the Welsh Office, when the sun always shined, nobody got sick, and Wales had so much cash that we could afford to give it back to the Treasury. However, those in the NHS in Wales will probably remember those years differently. For 20 years, under successive Conservative governments, waiting lists rose by 22 per cent while over 6,000 hospital beds were lost. No workforce planning was done, which led to the disastrous level of recruitment that we see today, and a divisive two tier system: one for those who had, and the rest be damned.

Gwn y byddai'r Torïaid wrth eu bodd pe baem yn dychwelyd at yr hen oes a fu pan oedd William Hague neu John Redwood yn ben ar y Swyddfa Gymreig, pan oedd yr haul bob amser yn disgleirio, pan nad oedd neb yn mynd yn sâl, a phan oedd gan Gymru gymaint o arian fel y gallem fforddio i'w ddychwelyd i'r Trysorlys. Fodd bynnag, mae'n debyg y bydd cof y rhai yn yr NHS yng Nghymru am y blynyddoedd hynny yn wahanol. Am 20 mlynedd, o dan lywodraethau Ceidwadol olynol, cynyddodd rhestrau aros 22 y cant tra yr oedd 6,000 o welyau yn cael eu colli. Ni wnaethpwyd unrhyw waith cynllunio ar gyfer y gweithlu, ac fe arweiniodd hynny at y lefel drychinebus o recriwtio a welwn heddiw, a system dwy haen gynhennus: un ar gyfer y cyfoethogion, ac i'r diawl â'r gweddill.

Of course there is room for improvement for the patients and people of Wales. There is room for the Minister, in conjunction with the Health and Social Services Committee, the service providers, the management, and the staff at the sharp end, to get together to find out why we failed to hit the target and to renew our efforts to do better on behalf of the people of Wales. There is room for improvement but I beg of you, on behalf of the people of Wales, do not take any lessons from the Tories.

David Melding: I shall start by replying to the Minister. Rather than hiding behind the commitment of the staff, you should stand up for the promises you made. If those promises meant nothing, you should never have uttered them in the first place. However, if they were solemnly made last June, they mean something and you should answer for them. Those members who feel that this Assembly should not scrutinise the work of the Executive fail completely to grasp the importance of devolution. We are here to hold the Executive to account.

I did not come up with these figures. It is as though we have somehow imposed these figures on the Government, that what we are doing is unfair, and somehow they are victims. You, Minister, were the person who said to the people of Wales that you would cut the waiting lists for inpatients by 15,000; it has been cut by 11,500.

The Presiding Officer: Will you give way to Richard Edwards?

David Melding: Not at the moment.

I welcome that reduction, but it is still a failure. It is a failure in that the figures increased in the first place by over 14,000, despite the fact that, when you were elected to office, you promised to cut them by 5,000. You may say that these are mumbo-jumbo figures, but that is the last refuge of someone who cannot defend her record. It is serious. You have not said whether you are moving away from waiting list figures now, are repudiating them, and moving, as you have always urged, to waiting list times. I hope

Wrth gwrs mae lle i wella ar gyfer cleifion a phobl Cymru. Mae lle i'r Gweinidog, ar y cyd â'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, y darparwyr gwasanaeth, y rheolwyr, a'r staff ar y rheng flaen, ddod at ei gilydd a chanfod pam ein bod wedi methu â chyrraedd y targed ac i ymdrechu o'r newydd ar ran pobl Cymru. Mae lle i wella ond erfyniaf arnoch, ar ran pobl Cymru, na efelychwch y Torïaid.

David Melding: Dechreuaf drwy ymateb i'r Gweinidog. Yn hytrach na chuddio y tu ôl i ymrwymiad y staff, dylech gymryd cyfrifoldeb dros yr addewidion a wnaethoch. Os nad oedd yr addewidion yn golygu dim, dylech fyth fod wedi eu gwneud yn y lle cyntaf. Fodd bynnag, os cawsant eu gwneud o ddifrif fis Mehefin diwethaf, maent yn golygu rhywbeth a dylech gymryd cyfrifoldeb drostynt. Nid yw'r Aelodau hynny a deimla na ddylai'r Cynulliad archwilio gwaith y Weithrediaeth yn llwyr ddeall pwysigrwydd datganoli. Yr ydym yma i sicrhau bod yr Weithrediaeth yn atebol.

Nid fi a luniodd y ffigurau hyn. Mae fel pe baem rywfodd wedi gorfodi'r ffigurau hyn ar y Llywodraeth, bod yr hyn a wnawn yn annheg, a rhywsut neu'i gilydd mai hwy sydd yn cael cam. Chi, Weinidog, oedd y person a ddywedodd wrth bobl Cymru y byddech yn sicrhau gostyngiad o 15,000 yn y rhestrau aros ar gyfer cleifion mewnol; bu gostyngiad o 11,500.

Y Llywydd: A wnewch chi ildio i Richard Edwards?

David Melding: Nid ar hyn o bryd.

Croesawaf y gostyngiad hwnnw, ond mae'n dal yn fethiant. Mae'n fethiant am fod y ffigurau wedi cynyddu yn y lle cyntaf dros 14,000 er gwaethaf y ffaith ichi addo gostyngiad o 5,000 pan gawsoch eich ethol i'ch swydd. Gallwch ddweud mai ffigurau gwirion ydynt, ond dyna noddfa olaf rhywun na all amddiffyn ei record. Mae'n ddifrifol. Ni ddywedaso ch a ydych erbyn hyn yn symud o ffigurau ar gyfer rhestrau aros, a ydych yn eu gwrthod, a symud, fel yr ydych wedi ei annog erioed, i restrau ar gyfer

that you will now move to waiting list times, but you did not give that commitment.

You would think, as far as outpatient waiting lists are concerned, that this Government has made great progress and is on the road to cutting those lists significantly. They have increased from 6,000 to 46,000, an increase of over 660 per cent. Brian Gibbons is now boasting about a 6 or 7 per cent reduction. My maths is not good enough to work out how many years it would take to get back to where you were when the Conservatives were in office.

The most damning statistic is from the Government's own figures about the number of patients who get treated by the national health service in Wales. Is it greater or less than when we were in office? Fewer people are treated in Welsh hospitals today than when the Conservatives were in administration in Wales. That is a complete failure.

Do you think that the Minister would not have referred to figures if they had been to her advantage? It is shabby to badmouth your own statisticians, because these figures at least give us some measure of your performance, and you should stand up for them.

Richard Edwards: Do you not think that it is sad that you must resort to such behaviour to convince the grassroots in your party that you belong to the same party as they do?

David Melding: I am proud to have been a member of the Conservative Party since 1978 and I look forward to being a member of the Conservative Party when we sit on the front bench. I assure you that—[*Laughter.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order.

David Melding: We would not make such a hash of the job as you have [*Interruption.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order.

amseroedd aros. Gobeithiaf y byddwch yn awr yn symud i amseroedd aros, ond ni wnaethoch yr ymrwymiad hwnnw.

Fe dybiech, o ran rhestrau aros ar gyfer cleifion allanol, fod y Llywodraeth hon wedi gwneud cynnydd mawr a'i bod ar y ffordd i leihau'r rhestrau hynny yn sylweddol. Maent wedi cynyddu o 6,000 i 46,000, sef cynnydd o dros 660 y cant. Mae Brian Gibbons yn ymfrostio erbyn hyn am ostyngiad o 6 neu 7 y cant. Nid yw fy symiau i yn ddigon da i gyfrifo faint o flynyddoedd a gymerai i ddychwelyd at y sefyllfa lle yr oeddech pan oedd y Ceidwadwyr mewn grym.

Mae'r ystadegyn mwyaf damniol yn deillio o ffigurau'r Llywodraeth ei hun am nifer y cleifion a gaiff eu trin gan y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru. A yw'n fwy neu'n llai na'r ffigur pan oeddem ni mewn grym? Caiff llai o bobl eu trin mewn ysbytai yng Nghymru heddiw na'r adeg pan oedd gweinyddiaeth Geidwadol yng Nghymru. Mae hwnnw'n fethiant llwyr.

A gredwch na fyddai'r Gweinidog wedi cyfeirio at y ffigurau oni fyddai wedi bod o fudd iddi wneud? Peth salw yw difrïo eich ystadegwyr eich hun, gan fod y ffigurau hyn o leiaf yn rhoi rhyw amcan inni o'ch perfformiad, a dylech gymryd cyfrifoldeb drostynt.

Richard Edwards: Oni chredwch ei bod yn drist bod yn rhaid ichi droi at ymddygiad o'r fath er mwyn argyhoeddi'r aelodau cyffredin yn eich plaid eich bod yn perthyn i'r un plaid â hwy?

David Melding: Yr wyf yn falch o fod yn aelod o'r Blaid Geidwadol ers 1978 ac edrychaf ymlaen at fod yn aelod o'r Blaid Geidwadol pan fyddwn yn eistedd ar y fainc flaen. Gallaf roi sicrwydd i chi fod— [*Chwerthin.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn.

David Melding: Ni fyddem yn gwneud cymaint o draed moch o bethau â chi [*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn.

David Melding: You have failed Welsh patients, outpatients and inpatients. You are treating fewer people now than when you came into office. That is what you have done with the inheritance you received. The Deputy Minister for Health is now making assertive remarks from a sedentary position. There is nothing more undignified than members of a political party pulling punches. That is what you and the Chair of the Health and Social Services Committee are doing. Your supporters deserve better. I doubt whether your present record will find much support when it is judged.

Is it a cheap political trick to hold people to their stated and considered promises? We are here to scrutinise you and we will continue to do so. This is not a political ploy. You set the targets and the date when they will be judged. That has nothing to do with me. You control the Assembly timetable. You would not have allowed us time to debate this issue unless we used the established device of the censure motion. The people of Wales deserve immediate debate on this because you have failed so fundamentally. You should stand up for your record and not try to disown it. On the point that I have made a personal attack, I did not mention the Minister by name or even directly. I mentioned the Labour administration.

Mick Bates: This is a censure motion.

David Melding: There is no other device available in order to debate this issue. The Liberals do not want to talk about this waiting list failure because they are now a part of the administration. They could have taken action on this when they joined it—

The Presiding Officer: Order. David Melding is replying to the debate. He must be heard in relative silence.

David Melding: This scrutiny role is important for opposition parties. We will not duck from it. We will remind the Labour Party's backbenchers of what the Minister means when she cuts the number of traditional hospitals and when the number of

David Melding: Yr ydych wedi siomi cleifion Cymru, yn gleifion allanol ac yn gleifion mewnol. Yr ydych yn trin llai o bobl yn awr nag ar yr adeg pan ddaethoch i rym. Dyna beth a wnaethoch gyda'r etifeddiaeth a gawsoch. Mae'r Dirprwy Weinidog dros Iechyd bellach yn gwneud sylwadau heriol ar ei eistedd. Nid oes unrhyw beth mwy diurddas nag aelodau o blaid wleidyddol yn cosi â'u dynau. Dyna beth yr ydych chi a Chadeirydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn ei wneud. Mae'ch cefnogwyr yn haeddu gwell. Yr wyf yn amau a fydd llawer o gefnogaeth i'ch record bresennol pan gaiff ei barnu.

A yw'n dric gwleidyddol diwerth i fynnu bod pobl yn cadw addewidion bwriadol a wnaethpwyd ganddynt yn gyhoeddus? Yr ydym yma i archwilio'ch gwaith yn fanwl a byddwn yn parhau i wneud hynny. Nid rhyw ystryw wleidyddol ydyw. Chi a osododd y targedau a'r dyddiad i'w barnu. Nid oedd a wnelo mi ddim â hynny. Chi sydd yn rheoli amserlen y Cynulliad. Ni fydech wedi rhoi amser inni drafod y ddadl hon oni bai ein bod wedi defnyddio'r dull sefydledig o gynnig cynnig o gerydd. Mae pobl Cymru yn haeddu dadl ar unwaith ar hyn am ichi fethu mewn ffordd mor hanfodol. Dylech fod yn gyfrifol am eich record a pheidio â'i gwadu. Ynglŷn â'r pwynt fy mod wedi ymosod yn bersonol, ni chyfeiriais at y Gweinidog yn ôl ei henw nac hyd yn oed yn uniongyrchol. Cyfeiriais at y weinyddiaeth Lafur.

Mick Bates: Cynnig o gerydd yw hwn.

David Melding: Nid oes unrhyw fodd arall ar gael o gynnal dadl ar y mater hwn. Nid yw'r Rhyddfrydwyr am siarad am y methiant hwn o ran y rhestrau aros am eu bod bellach yn rhan o'r weinyddiaeth. Gallent fod wedi gweithredu ar hyn wrth ymuno â hi—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae David Melding yn ymateb i'r ddadl. Rhaid i'r Aelodau wrando arno yn gymharol dawel.

David Melding: Mae'r rôl archwilio manwl hon yn bwysig i'r gwrthbleidiau. Ni wnawn ei hosgoi. Byddwn yn atgoffa aelodau meinciau cefn y Blaid Lafur o'r hyn y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei olygu pan fydd yn cwtogi nifer yr ysbytai traddodiadol a phan fydd

patients declines—

Helen Mary Jones: I acknowledge that the issues that your party has raised today are serious ones. However, as your party's equal opportunities spokesperson, do you have concerns about the way that this weapon is used against women Ministers but not men? I do not mean to implicate you personally in that. As opposition parties, you say that we need to hold the Ministers to account. I agree with that. However, I am concerned about using the serious weapon of censure as a kind of scattergun tactic. If we needed to censure someone for a fundamental failure—in our view, this is a serious failure but not a totally fundamental failure—motions of censure would have become so devalued as to have no meaning.

David Melding: I will not be intimidated. [*Laughter.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order.

David Melding: I have moved the censure on this administration's record on health. It is only by coincidence that the Minister for Health and Social Services is a woman. It is on record that I have congratulated the administration for being the first government in Western Europe to have a majority of women in its Cabinet. I cannot be clearer than that. This is not such an issue. I am saddened that people seek to make that point. I agree that censure has to be used sparingly. However, this is one of their major pledges to the patients of Wales and it deserves an answer.

I conclude by saying to Plaid Cymru that I recognise that it does not support what the Conservative Party did in office. It does not want to be associated with that. However, in supporting this censure motion, you would not be supporting our record. It would condemn the Labour and Liberal administration's record. By heavens it deserves condemnation.

nifer y cleifion yn gostwng—

Helen Mary Jones: Cydnabyddaf fod y materion a godwyd gan eich plaid heddiw yn rhai difrifol. Fodd bynnag, fel llefarydd eich plaid dros gyfle cyfartal, onid oes gennych bryderon ynglŷn â'r ffordd y caiff yr arf hon ei defnyddio yn erbyn Gweinidogion sydd yn ferched ond nid dynion? Ni fwriadaf eich cyhuddo'n bersonol o hynny. Fel gwrthbleidiau, dywedwch fod angen inni sicrhau bod y Gweinidogion yn atebol. Cytunaf â hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn pryderu ynglŷn â defnyddio arf difrifol megis cerydd fel math o danio digyfeiriad. Pe bai angen inni geryddu rhywun am fethiant sylfaenol—mae hwn yn fethiant difrifol ond nid yn fethiant llwyr yn ein barn ni—byddai cynigion o gerydd wedi cael eu dibrisio cymaint fel na fyddai unrhyw ystyr iddynt bellach.

David Melding: Ni chaf fy nychryn. [*Chwerthin.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn.

David Melding: Yr wyf wedi cynnig cynnig o gerydd ar record y weinyddiaeth hon ym maes iechyd. Cyd-ddigwyddiad ydyw mai merch yw'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Mae'r cofnod yn dangos fy mod wedi llongyfarch y weinyddiaeth fel y llywodraeth gyntaf yng Ngorllewin Ewrop â mwyafrif o ferched yn ei Chabinet. Ni allaf fod yn fwy plaen na hynny. Nid dyna'r mater o dan sylw. Yr wyf yn drist o weld pobl yn ceisio gwneud y pwynt hwnnw. Cytunaf fod yn rhaid defnyddio cerydd yn gynnil. Fodd bynnag, mae hon yn un o'u prif addewidion i gleifion Cymru ac mae'n haeddu ateb.

I gloi, dywedaf wrth Blaid Cymru fy mod yn cydnabod nad yw'n cefnogi'r hyn a wnaethom pan oedd y Blaid Geidwadol mewn grym. Nid yw am gael ei chysylltu â hynny. Fodd bynnag, drwy gefnogi'r cynnig hwn o gerydd, ni fydddech yn cefnogi ein record ni. Byddai'n condemnio record gweinyddiaeth y Blaid Lafur a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Dyn a wŷr mae haeddu cael ei chondemnio.

Cynnig: O blaid 9, Ymatal 11, Yn erbyn 31

Motion: For 9, Abstain 11, Against 31

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Graham, William
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
Feld, Val
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Hancock, Brian
Jones, Gareth
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Helen Mary
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.
Motion rejected.*

**Pleidlais a Ohiriwyd ar y Cynnig Trefniadol
Postponed Vote on the Procedural Motion**

Y Llywydd: Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar y cynnig trefniadol, y methwyd pleidleisio arno yn gynharach oherwydd problemau gyda'r system bleidleisio.

The Presiding Officer: We will now vote on the procedural motion, on which we failed to vote earlier owing to problems with the voting system.

*Cynnig: O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion adopted.*

**Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion
Composite Motion: Approval of Orders**

Y Llywydd: Cynigir y cynnig hwn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25, ac felly ni chynhelir dadl arno.
The Presiding Officer: This motion is proposed under Standing Order No. 22.25, and therefore it is not subject to debate.

The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies): I propose that **Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies):** Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly, acting under Standing Order No. 22.25, *y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25,*

approves the Miscellaneous Food Additives (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2001 laid in the Table Office on 27 March 2001; *yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Ychwanegion Bwyd Amrywiol (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2001 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Mawrth 2001;*

considers the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Miscellaneous Food Additives (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 3 April 2001; *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau sydd heb glustnodi unrhyw faterion o bwys yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Ychwanegion Bwyd Amrywiol (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2001 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 3 Ebrill 2001;*

approves the Infant Formula and Follow-on Formula (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2001 laid in the Table Office on 21 March 2001; *yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Fformwla Fabanod a Fformwla Ddilynol (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2001 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 21 Mawrth 2001;*

considers the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Infant Formula and Follow-on Formula (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 3 April 2001; *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau sydd heb glustnodi unrhyw faterion o bwys yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Fformwla Fabanod a Fformwla Ddilynol (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2001 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 3 Ebrill 2001;*

approves the Processed Cereal-based Foods and Baby Foods for Infants and Young Children (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 21 March 2001; *yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Bwydydd Proses sydd wedi'u Seilio ar Rawn a Bwydydd ar gyfer Babanod a Phlant Ifanc (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 21 Mawrth 2001;*

considers the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Processed Cereal-based Foods and Baby Foods for Infants and Young Children (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 3 April 2001; *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau sydd heb glustnodi unrhyw faterion o bwys yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Bwydydd Proses sydd wedi'u Seilio ar Rawn a Bwydydd ar gyfer Babanod a Phlant Ifanc (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2001 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 3 Ebrill 2001;*

approves the Education (Nutritional Standards for School Lunches) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 6 March 2001; *yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Addysg (Safonau Maeth Cinio Ysgol) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Mawrth 2001;*

considers the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Education (Nutritional Standards for School Lunches) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 20 March 2001; *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau sydd heb glustnodi unrhyw faterion o bwys yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Addysg (Safonau Maeth Cinio Ysgol) (Cymru) 2001 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Mawrth 2001;*

approves the Housing (Right to Buy) (Priority of Charges) (Wales) Order 2001, laid in the Table Office on 21 March 2001; and

yn cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Tai (Hawl i Brynu) (Blaenoriaeth Arwystlon) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 21 Mawrth 2001; ac

considers the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Housing (Right to Buy) (Priority of Charges) (Wales) Order 2001, laid in the Table Office on 3 April 2001 and the Memorandum of Corrections laid in the Table Office on 4 April 2001.

yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau sydd heb glustnodi unrhyw faterion o bwys yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Tai (Hawl i Brynu) (Blaenoriaeth Arwystlon) (Cymru) 2001 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 3 Ebrill 2001 a'r Memorandwm Cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Ebrill 2001.

*Cynnig: O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun

Randerson, Jenny
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion adopted.*

Y Llywydd: Daw hynny â thrafodaethau **The Presiding Officer:** That brings today's proceedings to a close.
heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.20 p.m.
The session ended at 5.20 p.m.*