



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales
(The Official Record)**

Dydd Iau 15 Chwefror 2001

Thursday 15 February 2001

Cynnwys Contents

- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol
Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services
- 11 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes
Questions to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning
- 19 Cwestiynau i Bwyllgor y Tŷ
Questions to the House Committee
- 26 Datganiad ar Corus
Statement on Corus
- 37 Pwynt o Drefn
Point of Order
- 38 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Tir Mynydd (Cymru) 2001
Approval of the Tir Mynydd (Wales) Regulations 2001
- 50 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Ariannu Ysgolion a Gynhelir (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2001
Approval of the Financing of Maintained Schools (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2001
- 52 Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Cynllun Datblygu'r Diwydiant Moch 2000 (Cadarnhau) 2001
Approval of the Pig Industry Development Scheme 2000 (Confirmation) Order 2001
- 55 Adroddiad ar Amrywiaeth mewn Penodiadau Cyhoeddus
The Diversity of Public Appointments Report
- 64 Cynnig Trefniadol
Procedural Motion
- 66 Pwynt o Drefn
Point of Order
- 66 Adroddiad ar Amrywiaeth mewn Penodiadau Cyhoeddus: Parhad
Debate on the Diversity of Public Appointments Report: Continued
- 74 Datganiad gan y Dirprwy Lywydd
Statement by the Deputy Presiding Officer
- 75 Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru): Iawndal ar gyfer Cyn-lowyr
Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru): Compensation for Former Miners
- 102 Cynigion Trefniadol
Procedural Motions

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 9:05 a.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair
The Assembly met at 9:05 a.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair*

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services

Brechiad Rhag y Ffliw i'r Rhai Dros 65 Oed Free Influenza Jabs for the Over-65s

Q1 Gwenda Thomas: Will the Minister for Health and Social Services give a progress report on the uptake of free flu jabs for the over-65s and other high-risk patients? (OAQ9683)

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): This year we have made free flu vaccinations available to everyone aged 65 or over as well as younger people in at-risk groups. Preliminary figures show that some 250,000 people aged 65 or over, over 50 per cent of the target group—and over 85,000 other high-risk patients have received vaccinations in this campaign. I plan to provide a full report when outstanding returns are received.

Gwenda Thomas: I congratulate you on your foresight in using proactive decision-making to effect real improvements in health. Could you explain how you will ensure full and early supplies of vaccine in autumn 2001 and in subsequent years?

Jane Hutt: That has been an issue this year. General practitioners and their representatives were involved in planning this winter's efforts. General practitioners in Wales were given advance warning of the policy change that brought the age range down from 75 to 65 in May 2000. Some did not anticipate or plan for the increased demand when ordering stocks of vaccine. Therefore, there was a shortage of vaccines in the autumn. Increased supplies of vaccine were made available in November. We are now considering whether we could purchase the vaccine centrally. However, we must consult with GP representatives about this. Some health authorities purchased the

C1 Gwenda Thomas: A wnaiff y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol roi adroddiad cynnydd ar y niferoedd sydd wedi cael brechiad rhag y fflw sydd ar gael am ddim i'r rhai dros 65 oed, a chleifion eraill sydd mewn perygl uchel? (OAQ9683)

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Eleni yr ydym wedi sicrhau bod brechiadau rhag y fflw ar gael i bawb sydd yn 65 oed a throsodd yn ogystal ag ar gyfer pobl iau mewn grwpiau sydd mewn perygl. Dengys ffigyrau rhagarweiniol bod tua 250,000 o bobl 65 oed a throsodd—dros 50 y cant o'r grŵp targed—a thros 85,000 o gleifion perygl uchel eraill wedi derbyn brechiadau yn yr ymgyrch hon. Bwriadaf ddarparu adroddiad llawn pan dderbynnir y dychweliadau sydd heb ein cyrraedd.

Gwenda Thomas: Llongyfarchiadau ar eich rhagwelediad yn gwneud penderfyniadau rhagweithiol i wneud gwelliannau gwirioneddol mewn iechyd. A allech egluro sut y byddwch yn sicrhau cyflenwadau llawn a chynnar o'r brechlyn yn ystod hydref 2001 ac yn y blynyddoedd sydd i ddod?

Jane Hutt: Bu hynny'n fater eleni. Cymerodd meddygon teulu a'u cynrychiolwyr ran yn cynllunio ymdrechion y gaeaf hwn. Rhoddwyd rhybudd ymlaen llaw i feddygon teulu am y newid polisi a ddaeth â'r ystod oedran i lawr o 75 i 65 ym Mai 2000. Ni ragwelodd ac ni wnaethpwyd cynlluniau gan rai ar gyfer y cynnydd yn y galw wrth archebu stoc o'r brechlyn. Felly, yr oedd prinder brechlynnau yn yr hydref. Gwnaethpwyd rhagor o gyflenwadau o'r frechlyn ar gael ym mis Tachwedd. Yr ydym ar hyn o bryd yn ystyried a allem brynu'r brechlyn yn ganolog. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni ymgynghori â chynrychiolwyr meddygon teulu yn glŷn â hyn. Prynwyd y frechlyn yn

vaccine centrally for their GPs. Others informed their GPs when new supplies were available. An influenza group plans this. This year's experience will take us forward for next year's planning. However, we have had a good response in terms of the numbers who received the vaccine this year. We can see that reflected in the lower levels of flu in the population.

Pauline Jarman: As a member of the Cabinet, do you not regret that vulnerable people in Wales are forced to spend an extra winter in the cold and are no doubt left increasingly vulnerable to the flu virus due to the appalling delay in allowing applications for the home energy efficiency scheme?

Jane Hutt: As you know, Pauline, the home energy efficiency scheme is not my responsibility.

The Presiding Officer: Order. This question is about flu not the home energy efficiency scheme.

Jane Hutt: This winter, 'Keep Warm, Keep Well' addressed those issues. You will be aware of that campaign, Pauline, because it was launched in your local authority area. It included the home energy efficiency scheme and the campaign on 'slips and trips'. That is a local authority responsibility and we were glad that the Welsh Local Government Association and your local authority were involved in it. We know that many people over the Christmas period slipped or tripped and broke their bones on pavements and roads that were not gritted during the snow. This is a matter of joined-up government between the Assembly and local authorities and of local authorities ensuring that their responsibilities are carried out, as well as ensuring that we carry out our responsibilities.

ganolog gan rai awdurdodau iechyd ar gyfer eu meddygon teulu. Yr oedd eraill yn hysbysu eu meddygon teulu pan oedd cyflenwadau newydd ar gael. Mae grŵp ffliw yn cynllunio hyn. Bydd profiad eleni yn ein cynorthwyo gyda chynlluniau ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wedi derbyn ymateb da o ran y niferoedd a gafodd y frechlyn eleni. Adlewyrchir hynny yn y lefelau is o'r ffliw ymysg y boblogaeth.

Pauline Jarman: Fel aelod o'r Cabinet, onid ydych yn gresynu bod pobl ddiamddifyn yng Nghymru yn cael eu gorfodi i dreulio gaeaf arall yn yr oerfel ac yn cael eu gadael yn gynyddol agored i'r feirws ffliw o ganlyniad i'r oedi gwarthus yn caniatáu ceisiadau ar gyfer y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni yn y cartref?

Jane Hutt: Fel y gwyddoch, Pauline, nid fy nghyfrifoldeb i yw'r cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni yn y cartref.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae'r cwestiwn hwn yn ymwneud â'r ffliw nid am y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni yn y cartref.

Jane Hutt: Yr oedd yr ymgyrch 'Cadwch yn Gynnes, Cadwch yn Iach' yn ymdrin â'r materion hynny y gaeaf hwn. Byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r ymgyrch honno, Pauline, gan iddi gael ei lansio yn eich ardal awdurdod lleol chi. Yr oedd yn cynnwys y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni yn y cartref a'r ymgyrch ar 'lithro a baglu'. Mae hynny'n gyfrifoldeb ar yr awdurdod lleol ac yr oeddem yn falch bod Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru a'ch awdurdod lleol yn cymryd rhan ynddo. Gwyddom fod nifer o bobl wedi llithro neu faglu a thorri eu hesgyrn ar balmentydd a ffyrdd na chafodd eu grutio yn ystod yr eira dros gyfnod y Nadolig. Mae hwn yn fater o lywodraeth gydlynol rhwng y Cynulliad ac awdurdodau lleol ac yn fater i awdurdodau lleol sicrhau eu bod yn cyflawni eu dyletswyddau, yn ogystal â sicrhau ein bod ni'n cyflawni ein dyletswyddau ninnau.

Darparu Cymhorthion yn Ddi-dâl i Gleifion Anymataliol Providing Incontinence Aids Free of Charge

Q2 Alison Halford: Will Jane Hutt consider **C2 Alison Halford:** A wnaiff Jane Hutt

providing incontinence aids to poor patients in Wales free of charge? (OAQ9680)

Jane Hutt: National health service authorities and trusts have discretion to supply incontinence aids to people living at home, in sheltered accommodation or in residential care homes. However, they do not have a statutory duty to do so. Provision depends on the availability of resources and the priority that they are prepared to give to this service.

Alison Halford: In the light of recent academic research, is the Minister able to give an assurance that the regrettable closure of public toilets due to increasing costs and vandalism is not closely related to the increase in the incidence of urinary tract infections and associated conditions? Is she aware that women are at higher risk of such infections than men, for reasons I prefer not to discuss in this public forum?

Jane Hutt: We are moving now from incontinence aids to public conveniences and I am not sure that I can make that connection. Public conveniences are a local authority responsibility also. It might be helpful to say that we are producing good practice guidance for continence services. I hope that that will include the issue of public conveniences because it genuinely concerns people.

You raised an important point about continence and supporting vulnerable people who need good continence services. We must aim to provide good practice guidance for the whole of Wales, the service should not be left to the priorities of some health authorities or trusts.

Geraint Davies: In view of the high incidence of chest diseases in Wales, and especially in the Valleys, do you think that there is a strong case for supplying nebulizers for free when a doctor advises that treatment?

The Presiding Officer: Order. This question

ystyried darparu cymhorthion yn ddi-dâl i gleifion anymataliol tlawd yng Nghymru? (OAQ9680)

Jane Hutt: Mae gan awdurdodau ac ymddiriedolaethau'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol y disgrisiwn i ddarparu cymhorthion anymataliol i bobl sydd yn byw gartref, mewn llety gwarchod neu mewn cartrefi gofal preswyl. Fodd bynnag, nid oes dyletswydd statudol arnynt i wneud hynny. Dibynna'r ddarpariaeth ar argaeledd adnoddau a'r flaenoriaeth y maent yn barod i'w rhoi i'r gwasanaeth hwn.

Alison Halford: Yng ngoleuni ymchwil academiaidd ddiweddar, a all y Gweinidog roi sicrwydd nad yw cau toiledau cyhoeddus, sydd yn resyn o beth, oherwydd costau cynyddol a fandaliaeth, yn gysylltiedig iawn â'r cynnydd mewn achosion o heintiau pibell droethol a chlefydau cysylltiedig? A yw'n ymwybodol bod mwy o risg i menywod ddal yr heintiau hyn na dynion, am resymau na hoffwn eu trafod yn y fforwm cyhoeddus hwn?

Jane Hutt: Yr ydym yn awr yn symud oddi wrth gymhorthion anymataliol i doiledau cyhoeddus ac nid wyf yn sicr o'r cysylltiad. Cyfrifoldeb awdurdodau lleol yw toiledau cyhoeddus hefyd. Gallai fod yn ddefnyddiol dweud ein bod yn cynhyrchu canllawiau ar arfer da ar gyfer gwasanaethau ymataliol. Gobeithiaf y bydd hynny yn cynnwys mater toiledau cyhoeddus gan ei fod yn peri pryder gwirioneddol i bobl.

Gwnaethpwyd pwynt pwysig gennych ynglŷn ag ymataliaeth a rhoi cymorth i bobl ddiamddiffyn y mae angen gwasanaethau ymataliaeth da arnynt. Rhaid inni geisio rhoi canllawiau ar arfer da i Gymru gyfan, ac ni ddylid gadael y gwasanaeth yn amodol ar flaenoriaethau rhai awdurdodau neu ymddiriedolaethau iechyd.

Geraint Davies: O ystyried y gyfradd uchel o afiechydon ar y frest yng Nghymru, ac yn enwedig yn y Cymoedd, oni chredwch fod dadl gref o blaid darparu nebwylddion am ddim pan fydd meddyg yn cynghori rhoi'r driniaeth honno?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid yw'r cwestiwn hwn

is not about chest diseases.

yn ymwneud ag afiechydon y frest.

Geraint Davies: It is about the supply of materials free of charge by the NHS.

Geraint Davies: Mae'n ymwneud â'r NHS yn darparu deunyddiau am ddim.

Jane Hutt: I think that I can make some connection back to incontinence aids.

Jane Hutt: Credaf y gallaf wneud rhyw fath o gysylltiad yn ôl i gymhorthion anymataliol.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Minister.

Y Llywydd: Diolch, Weinidog.

Jane Hutt: To clarify this for Members, GPs can prescribe medicines and a limited range of medical appliances under the NHS. That depends on what is available through the NHS. We started on the subject of incontinence pads and we are now addressing the prescribing of other aids by GPs on the NHS. Chronic chest disease and respiratory infections are, unfortunately, common at the moment, as you may know from your work as a pharmacist, Geraint. We must bear in mind that the influenza vaccination this year, for the first time, was targeted at a much larger group of people who suffer from asthma and respiratory diseases. We are addressing the issues of chronic chest diseases. Chronic ill-health and disease management, as the health professionals call it, is a key part of my new national plan, which will consider the support that people need and the prevention of chronic chest diseases and asthma.

Jane Hutt: Er mwyn egluro hyn i'r Aelodau, gall meddygon teulu ragnodi meddyginiaethau ac amrediad cyfyng o offer meddygol o dan yr NHS. Mae'n dibynnu ar yr hyn sydd ar gael drwy'r NHS. Cychwynasom ar fater padiau anymataliol ac yr ydym yn awr yn ymdrin â rhagnodi cymhorthion eraill gan feddygon teulu ar yr NHS. Yn anffodus, mae afiechyd cronig ar y frest a heintiau anadlol yn gyffredin ar hyn o bryd, fel y gwyddoch o'ch gwaith fel fferylllydd, Geraint. Rhaid inni gofio bod brechlyn y fflw am y tro cyntaf wedi ei dargedu at grŵp mwy o bobl eleni sydd yn dioddef o asthma ac afiechydon anadlu. Yr ydym yn ymdrin â materion afiechydon cronig ar y frest. Mae rheoli salwch cronig ac afiechydon, fel y'i gelwir gan weithwyr iechyd proffesiynol, yn rhan allweddol o'm cynllun cenedlaethol newydd, a fydd yn rhoi ystyriaeth i'r gefnogaeth sydd ei hangen ar bobl ac ystyriaeth i atal afiechydon cronig ar y frest ac asthma.

Llunio Dyfodol y Gwasanaeth Iechyd Shaping the Future of the Health Service

Q3 Karen Sinclair: Will Jane Hutt set out the role for professional workers in shaping the future of the health service in Wales? (OAQ9628)

C3 Karen Sinclair: A wnaiff Jane Hutt amlinellu rôl gweithwyr proffesiynol wrth lunio dyfodol y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru? (OAQ9628)

Jane Hutt: The NHS plan for Wales recognises that a dedicated, hard-working, professional, team-spirited NHS staff will make the plan work. Good employment practices must underpin all health care delivery in Wales and there will be a corporate team approach to workforce issues. All staff need to play a full and active role in developing and implementing policies and have a greater involvement in the key decisions that affect them, particularly through the human resources strategy and the NHS plan.

Jane Hutt: Mae cynllun yr NHS ar gyfer Cymru yn cydnabod y bydd staff NHS ymroddedig, gweithgar sydd yn cyd-dynnu yn gwneud i'r cynllun weithio. Rhaid i arferion cyflogi da fod yn sail i gyflwyno gofal iechyd yng Nghymru a bydd ymagwedd tîm corfforaethol tuag at faterion yn ymwneud â'r gweithlu. Mae angen i bob aelod o'r staff chwarae rôl lawn a gweithgar wrth ddatblygu a gweithredu polisiau a bod â mwy o gyfranogiad mewn penderfyniadau allweddol sydd yn effeithio arnynt, yn arbennig drwy gyfrwng y strategaeth

adnoddau dynol a chynllun yr NHS.

9:15 a.m.

Karen Sinclair: Will you ensure that we break down the barriers between professions within the health service?

Jane Hutt: This is an important part of the plan as we move to breaking down barriers to ensure a more inter-professional education. There are now initiatives, for example, where medical students and nurses in training can follow the same modules and learn together. Educating our healthcare professionals is about people skills, communication skills and caring skills. We mentioned culture and the changes that need to be made in our health service. We know that inter-professional education is vital in that. It also levels out the differences in status and hierarchy that often emerge when we try to build up the role of nurses and professions allied to medicines. Therefore, it is an important point.

David Melding: Will the Minister consult professional staff of various grades on her proposals to reduce the number of traditional hospitals and to close some accident and emergency departments?

Jane Hutt: I do not know how you managed to dig and delve and find a way to criticise the NHS plan earlier this week. I am disappointed that I did not have the chance to respond on Tuesday—as I will after the recess when we recommence the debate—to say that you have misunderstood. I made it clear in the plan that ‘Access and Excellence’, a report that has been widely circulated, made the commitment that we need to keep all our hospitals in Wales. I made that commitment months ago when I came into office and that is clearly stated in the document. You are trying to scaremonger people because you cannot find anything to criticise in this plan.

Kirsty Williams: Professionals who currently work in the NHS face several barriers that prevent them from participating

Karen Sinclair: A wnewch chi sicrhau y byddwn yn cael gwared â'r rhwystrau rhwng y proffesiynau o fewn y gwasanaeth iechyd?

Jane Hutt: Mae hon yn rhan bwysig o'r cynllun wrth inni symud tuag at ddymchwel y rhwystrau er mwyn sicrhau addysg fwy rhyng-broffesiynol. Er enghraifft, mae mentrau erbyn hyn lle y gall myfyrwyr meddygol a nyrsys dan hyfforddiant ddilyn yr un modylau a dysgu gyda'i gilydd. Mae addysgu ein gweithwyr gofal iechyd proffesiynol yn ymwneud â sgiliau pobl, sgiliau cyfathrebu a sgiliau gofal. Soniasom am ddiwylliant a'r newidiadau y mae angen eu gwneud i'n gwasanaeth iechyd. Gwyddom fod addysg ryng-broffesiynol yn hanfodol ar gyfer hynny. Mae hefyd yn lleihau'r gwahaniaethau mewn statws a'r hierarchaeth a ddaw i'r amlwg yn aml wrth inni geisio datblygu rolau nyrsys a'r proffesiynau sydd yn gysylltiedig â meddygaeth. Felly, mae'n bwynt pwysig.

David Melding: A fydd y Gweinidog yn ymgynghori â staff proffesiynol o raddau gwahanol ar ei chynigion i leihau'r nifer o ysbytai traddodiadol a chau rhai adrannau damweinau ac achosion brys?

Jane Hutt: Ni wn sut y llwyddasoch i chwilio a thyrcu a chanfod ffordd i feirniadu cynllun yr NHS yn gynharach yr wythnos hon. Yr wyf yn siomedig na chefais gyfle i ymateb ddydd Mawrth—fel y byddaf wedi'r toriad pan fyddwn yn ailgychwyn y ddadl—i ddweud eich bod wedi camddeall. Nodais yn glir yn y cynllun bod ‘Mynediad a Rhagoriaeth’, adroddiad a ddsbarthwyd yn eang, wedi gwneud yr ymrwymiad bod angen inni gadw pob un o'n hysbytai yng Nghymru. Gwneuthum yr ymrwymiad hwnnw fisoedd yn ôl pan ddechreuais ar fy swydd ac mae hynny wedi ei nodi'n glir yn y ddogfen. Yr ydych yn ceisio codi bwganod am na allwch ganfod unrhyw beth i'w feirniadu yn y cynllun hwn.

Kirsty Williams: Mae gweithwyr proffesiynol sydd yn gweithio yn yr NHS ar hyn o bryd yn wynebu sawl rhwystr i'w hatal

in service planning. Will you take steps to ensure that staff who want to participate in such consultations can have time off work to do so? Will you consider ways of enhancing the role of professions allied to medicine in the management of local health groups?

Jane Hutt: Those are important points. As you know our local health groups are multi-disciplinary and a strong case has already been made by nurses to play a fuller role in them. I have already challenged others, such as professions allied to medicine and physiotherapists, to make their case, because they will be at the frontier of commissioning care. The Health and Wellbeing Partnership Council will also be represented at national level. Trust boards will have staff representation from September. This means that staff from all tiers of the health service will be represented in policy making.

rhag cymryd rhan yn y broses cynllunio gwasanaeth. A fyddwch yn cymryd camau er mwyn sicrhau bod y staff hynny sydd am gymryd rhan mewn ymgynghoriadau o'r fath yn cael amser o'r gwaith er mwyn gwneud hynny? A wnewch chi ystyried ffyrdd o wella rôl y proffesiynau sydd yn gysylltiedig â meddygaeth o ran rheoli grwpiau iechyd lleol?

Jane Hutt: Mae'r rhain yn bwyntiau pwysig. Fel y gwyddoch, mae ein grwpiau iechyd lleol yn rhyng-ddisgyblaethol a dadleuwyd yn gryf gan nyrsys eisoes eu bod am gael mwy o ran ynddynt. Yr wyf eisoes wedi herio eraill i ddadlau eu hachos, fel y proffesiynau sydd yn gysylltiedig â meddygaeth a ffisiotherapyddion, gan mai hwy fydd ar reng flaen comisiynu gofal. Cynrychiolir y Cyngor Partneriaeth Iechyd a Lles ar lefel genedlaethol hefyd. Bydd gan fyrddau'r ymddiriedolaethau gynrychiolaeth staff o fis Medi ymlaen. Golyga hyn y bydd staff o bob haen o'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn cael eu cynrychioli yn y broses llunio polisiau.

Codi Tâl am Wasanaethau Lles Dibreswyl Charging for Non-residential Welfare Services

C4 Elin Jones: A wnaiff Jane Hutt ddatganiad byr ar hynt drafftio'r canllawiau i awdurdodau lleol ar godi tâl am wasanaethau lles dibreswyl? (OAQ9668)

Jane Hutt: I have approved draft statutory guidance for wide-ranging consultation until the middle of May. Following translation, the documents should issue within the next few days. The draft guidance sets out a broad framework to assist councils to ensure that charging policies are designed to be fair and operate consistently between different services and within their overall social care objectives. It assists councils in considering charges for all types of non-residential social services, in looking at options for charging according to the level of service and/or means and in the treatment of benefits, other income and savings. This consultation will now be issued. I will be writing to members of the Health and Social Services Committee shortly with a copy of the draft guidance and I will ensure that it is posted to our website.

Q4 Elin Jones: Will Jane Hutt make a brief statement on the progress in drafting the guidance to local authorities on charging for non-residential welfare services? (OAQ9668)

Jane Hutt: Yr wyf wedi cymeradwyo canllawiau statudol drafft ar gyfer ymgynghoriad eang ei gwmpas tan ganol mis Mai. Ar ôl eu cyfieithu, dylai'r dogfennau gael eu cyhoeddi o fewn y dyddiau nesaf. Mae'r canllawiau drafft yn nodi fframwaith eang er mwyn cynorthwyo cynghorau i sicrhau bod polisiau codi tâl yn rhai teg ac yn gweithredu'n gyson rhwng gwasanaethau gwahanol ac o fewn eu hamcanion gofal cymdeithasol cyffredinol. Mae'n cynorthwyo cynghorau wrth ystyried codi tâl ar gyfer pob math o wasanaethau cymdeithasol dibreswyl, o ran edrych ar opsiynau ar gyfer codi tâl yn ôl lefel y gwasanaeth ac/neu fodd ac wrth drin budd-daliadau, incwm arall a chynilion. Bydd yr ymgynghoriad hwn yn cael ei gyhoeddi yn awr. Byddaf yn ysgrifennu at aelodau'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol maes o law gyda chopi o'r canllawiau drafft a byddaf yn sicrhau eu bod

yn cael eu rhoi ar ein gwefan.

Elin Jones: Yn y ddadl ar strategaeth NHS Cymru ddydd Mawrth, soniasoch y byddai dadl ar ofal henoed hir dymor. A ydych yn ystyried bod gofal am ddim yn opsiwn yng Nghymru?

Jane Hutt: We are discussing local authority charges for non-residential welfare services, as your question stated, and the matter of issuing them with guidance on that. They have a discretionary power to charge for non-residential services to adults. Those services include domiciliary, day and respite care, and the meals on wheels service and so on. Separately, we are discussing how we interpret free nursing care, for which we have already budgeted. However, we need to consider how we can extend that in terms of the package of six weeks' free home care that I have announced. We must now discuss how we implement that with local government. This matter must be discussed further in Committee, in the group that Brian Gibbons will chair—which will be inclusive—and in the Chamber.

Mick Bates: On charging, do you regret that Wales will not receive the power to provide free, universal, personal care under the Health and Social Care Bill that is currently going through Parliament?

Jane Hutt: As I said in my answer to Elin, and in my announcements earlier this week, we are looking to devise a Welsh way of developing long-term care for the elderly. Our main objective is to enable people to stay in their homes or to be discharged from hospital into an appropriate setting, which may be at home with the right kind of care and support, which relates to Elin's first point about charging, or nursing or residential homes. We are looking for a Welsh way of developing that. However, by accepting the amendments—although the debate on the NHS Wales strategy has not yet concluded—I have indicated that we are considering how we can broaden our definition of free nursing care and implement our promise of up to six weeks' free home and personal care. We

Elin Jones: In Tuesday's debate on the NHS strategy, you mentioned that there would be a debate on the long-term care of the elderly. Do you believe that free care is an option in Wales?

Jane Hutt: Yr ydym yn trafod taliadau a godir gan awdurdodau lleol am wasanaethau lles dibreswyl, fel nododd eich cwestiwn, a'r mater o gyhoeddi canllawiau iddynt ar hynny. Mae ganddynt rym diamod i godi tâl am wasanaethau dibreswyl i oedolion. Mae'r gwasanaethau hynny yn cynnwys gofal yn y cartref, gofal dydd a gofal ysbaid, gwasanaeth prydu bwyd ac yn y blaen. Ar wahân, yr ydym yn trafod sut yr ydym yn dehongli gofal nyrsio am ddim, y cyllidebwyd ar ei gyfer eisoes. Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni ystyried sut y gallwn ymestyn hynny o ran y pecyn gofal cartref am chwe wythnos am ddim yr wyf wedi ei gyhoeddi. Rhaid inni drafod yn awr sut y gallwn weithredu hynny gyda llywodraeth leol. Rhaid cael trafodaeth bellach ar y mater hwn yn y Pwyllgor, yn y grŵp a gadeirir gan Brian Gibbons—a fydd yn gynhwysol—ac yn y Siambr.

Mick Bates: O ran codi tâl, a ydych yn gresynu na fydd Cymru yn cael y grym i ddarparu gofal cyffredinol a phersonol am ddim o dan y Mesur Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol sydd yn mynd drwy'r Senedd ar hyn o bryd?

Jane Hutt: Fel y dywedais yn fy ateb i Elin, ac yn fy ngyhoeddiadau yn gynharach yr wythnos hon, yr ydym yn ceisio llunio ffordd Gymreig o ddatblygu gofal hir dymor ar gyfer yr henoed. Ein prif amcan yw galluogi pobl i aros yn eu cartrefi neu gael ei rhyddhau o'r ysbyty i leoliad addas, y cartref o bosibl, gyda'r math cywir o ofal a chefnogaeth, sydd yn ymwneud â phwynt cyntaf Elin ynglŷn â chodi tâl, neu gartrefi preswyl neu nyrsio. Yr ydym yn chwilio am ffordd Gymreig o ddatblygu hynny. Fodd bynnag, drwy dderbyn y diwygiadau—er nad yw'r ddadl ar strategaeth NHS Cymru wedi dod i ben eto—yr wyf wedi nodi ein bod yn ystyried ehangu ein diffiniad o ofal nyrsio am ddim a gweithredu ein haddewid o ofal cartref a phersonol hyd at chwech wythnos

should decide on these issues in Wales and in this Assembly.

am ddim. Dylem benderfynu ar y materion hyn yng Nghymru ac yn y Cynulliad hwn.

Apwyntiadau i Gleifion Allanol yn Ysbyty Brenhinol Gwent Out-Patient Appointments at the Royal Gwent Hospital

Q5 William Graham: Will Jane Hutt make a statement concerning the length of time it takes to have a first out-patient appointment at the Royal Gwent Hospital in Newport? (OAQ9732)

Jane Hutt: The length of time a patient has to wait for an initial out-patient appointment depends on the general practitioner's referral letter and how it is marked, for example, urgent, routine and so on. It is then for the consultant to decide where the patient should be placed on the waiting list, depending on clinical need. The length of the wait will depend on the specialism. Indicative waiting times—based on information provided by the NHS—by specialism, hospital and consultant are shown on the NHS Wales waiting times information service website, www.hsw.wales.nhs.uk/ipd/homepage.htm. It is also possible for a patient to be referred to a different hospital or consultant, outside his or her own health authority area, where the waiting time may be shorter. That should be discussed with the patient's GP.

William Graham: Last evening, I spoke to a constituent in Pill who remembered when you used to give advice at the advice centre there, and she was shocked to learn that the promises you made in those days are not being implemented. She is on the critical operation list and has been put back time and time again. Will you acknowledge that the policies that you are peddling are complete rubbish?

Jane Hutt: You asked me a question about first out-patient appointments at Royal Gwent Hospital and I answered it by explaining what happens when someone goes to a GP needing to see a specialist, and how that visit is then followed by an out-patient appointment and subsequently an operation. You are now discussing the individual situation of a person who is waiting to have an operation. Clearly, the issue here is that we are considering ways of implementing our

C5 William Graham: A wnaiff Jane Hutt ddatganiad ynghylch yr amser y mae'n ei gymryd i gael apwyntiad cyntaf i glaf allanol yn Ysbyty Brenhinol Gwent yng Nghasnewydd? (OAQ9732)

Jane Hutt: Dibynna'r amser y mae'n rhaid i glaf allanol aros i gael apwyntiad cyntaf ar lythyr cyfeirio'r meddyg teulu a sut y caiff ei farcio, er enghraifft, ar frys, cyffredin ac ati. Y meddyg ymgynghorol sydd wedyn yn penderfynu ble y dylid rhoi'r claf ar y rhestr aros, gan ddibynnu ar angen clinigol. Dibynna'r amser y mae'n rhaid aros ar yr arbenigedd. Dangosir amserau aros mynegol—yn seiliedig ar wybodaeth a ddarperir gan yr NHS—yn ôl yr arbenigedd, yr ysbyty a'r meddyg ymgynghorol ar wefan gwasanaeth gwybodaeth am amseroedd aros NHS Cymru, www.hsw.wales.nhs.uk/ipd/homepage.htm. Mae'n bosibl hefyd i glaf gael ei gyfeirio i ysbyty neu feddyg ymgynghorol gwahanol, y tu allan i ardal awdurdod iechyd y claf, lle y gallai'r amser aros fod yn llai. Dylid trafod hynny gyda meddyg teulu'r claf.

William Graham: Neithiwr, siaradais ag etholwraig yn y Pill a gofiodd yr amser pan rhoddid cyngor yn y ganolfan gynghori yno, ac fe'i synnwyd o weld na weithredir yr addewidion a wnaethpwyd gennych y pryd hynny. Mae ar restr y llawdriniaethau critigol a gohiriwyd ei thriniaeth dro ar ôl tro. A gydnabyddwch fod y polisïau a werthwch yn sothach llwyr?

Jane Hutt: Gofynasoch imi gwestiwn am apwyntiadau cyntaf i gleifion allanol yn Ysbyty Brenhinol Gwent ac fe'i atebais drwy egluro'r hyn sydd yn digwydd pan aiff rhywun sydd angen gweld arbenigwr at ei feddyg teulu, a sut y dilynir yr ymweliad hwnnw wedyn gan apwyntiad i glaf allanol ac wedyn llawdriniaeth. Trafodwch yn awr sefyllfa unigolyn sydd yn aros i gael llawdriniaeth. Yn amlwg, y mater yma yw ein bod yn ystyried ffyrdd o weithredu'n

waiting times strategy, which will receive all-party support in the Health and Social Services Committee, following much debate. We are addressing how to implement that using the additional £1 billion that I am putting into the health service over the next three years. That is about ensuring that we implement the waiting times strategy and that we have the capacity and resources to do so to ensure that patients who need operations do not have to wait, as you have described today.

Jocelyn Davies: My partner is still waiting for an outpatient appointment for a head scan around 18 months after sustaining an injury in a car accident. Is that acceptable and can you give me an indication when a prioritisation system based on clinical need will be in place in this important sector?

Jane Hutt: I agree that that is unacceptable and I made that clear to William Graham when he described the case of one of his constituents. It is unacceptable that we inherited a situation where there was an appalling lack of planning and resources had been stripped out of the health service. We are now implementing the waiting times strategy, where priority is given according to clinical need and, in some circumstances, to social need. The strategy will revolutionise how patients are scheduled to see consultants and to be operated on. It also requires resources and capacity. That is what the £1 billion provides.

strategaeth amserau aros, a gaiff gefnogaeth pob plaid yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, ar ôl llawer o ddadlau. Ymdriniwn â'r mater o sut i weithredu hynny gan ddefnyddio'r £1 biliwn ychwanegol a roddaf i'r gwasanaeth iechyd dros y tair blynedd nesaf. Mae hynny'n ymwneud â sicrhau ein bod yn gweithredu'r strategaeth amserau aros a bod gennym y gallu a'r adnoddau i wneud hynny er mwyn sicrhau nad oes rhaid i gleifion y mae angen llawdriniaeth arnynt aros, fel y disgrifiasoch heddiw.

Jocelyn Davies: Parha fy mhartner i aros am apwyntiad claf allanol i gael sganiad ar y pen tua 18 mis ar ôl cael anaf mewn damwain car. A yw hynny'n dderbyniol ac a allwch roi syniad imi pryd y bydd system blaenoriaethu ar sail angen clinigol yn ei lle yn y sector pwysig hwn?

Jane Hutt: Cytunaf nad yw hynny'n dderbyniol ac esboniais hynny i William Graham pan ddisgrifiodd achos un o'i etholwyr. Mae'n annerbyniol yr etifeddasom sefyllfa lle yr oedd diffyg cynllunio ofnadwy a lle'r oedd adnoddau wedi eu tynnu oddi ar y gwasanaeth iechyd. Gweithredwn y strategaeth amserau aros erbyn hyn, lle y rhoddir blaenoriaeth yn ôl angen clinigol ac, mewn rhai amgylchiadau, yn ôl angen cymdeithasol. Bydd y strategaeth yn chwyldroi sut yr amserlennir cleifion i weld meddygon ymgynghorol ac i gael llawdriniaeth. Mae hynny'n gofyn hefyd am adnoddau a gallu. Dyna'r hyn a ddarperir gan yr £1 biliwn.

9:25 a.m.

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes Questions to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning

Dylunio a Thechnoleg o fewn y Cwricwlwm Design and Technology within the Curriculum

C1 Cynog Dafis: Pa werthusiad a wnaeth y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes o'r ddarpariaeth dylunio a thechnoleg o fewn y cwricwlwm yng Nghymru? (OAQ9714)

Q1 Cynog Dafis: What evaluation has the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning undertaken of the provision of design and technology within the curriculum in Wales? (OAQ9714)

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol

Learning (Jane Davidson): Standards and quality in design and technology are reported upon annually, as are other subjects, as part of the school inspection cycle. Estyn publishes a summary of findings for each subject. This year, Estyn published individual subject leaflets for the primary and secondary sectors on 13 February. Those leaflets are being sent to all schools. Design and technology was also examined in the recent review of the national curriculum by the Qualifications, Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales, ACCAC.

Cynog Dafis: Ni chefais gyfle i edrych ar ddeunydd Estyn eto. A yw'r Gweinidog yn rhannu fy mhryder am y modd y mae dysgu am fwyd wedi ei ymyleiddio yn ein hysgolion? Mae hynny'n ddrwg i arferion bwyta ac i'r diwydiant bwyd, lle y mae cyfleoedd am swyddi. A yw'n bwriadu cryfhau statws technoleg bwyd yn y cwricwlwm a sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol, ymgynghorwyr addysg, penaethiaid ysgolion ac yn y blaen, yn cymryd y pwnc hwn fwy o ddirif nag a wnânt ar hyn o bryd?

Jane Davidson: I do not accept that the new curriculum gives insufficient attention to food. Food, including nutrition and other health issues, features prominently in the programmes of study for science, physical education and design and technology. It also features in the new framework for personal and social education. Food technology continues to be an option for pupils at GCSE level. ACCAC has been asked to provide guidance to schools that will draw together the elements of food teaching in the curriculum and highlight the importance of food and food safety. That guidance will be published shortly.

Alun Pugh: Having schools specialise in curriculum areas such as design and technology may make sense in large English conurbations, but do you accept that it is less relevant in Wales? When you visit the design and technology facilities at my son's school in Colwyn Bay next month, do you expect to see a bog-standard comprehensive or a school offering excellence without resorting to selection?

Oes (Jane Davidson): Cyflwynir adroddiad blynyddol ar safonau ac ansawdd mewn dylunio a thechnoleg, fel ar bynciau eraill, fel rhan o'r cylch arolygu ysgolion. Cyhoedda Estyn grynodedb o ganfyddiadau ar gyfer pob pwnc. Eleni, cyhoeddodd Estyn daflenni pwnc unigol ar gyfer y sectorau cynradd ac uwchradd ar 13 Chwefror. Anfonir y taflenni hynny at bob ysgol. Archwiliwyd dylunio a thechnoleg hefyd yn yr adolygiad diweddar o'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol a gynhaliwyd gan Awdurdod Cymwysterau, Cwricwlwm ac Asesu Cymru, ACCAC.

Cynog Dafis: I have not yet had an opportunity to look at the Estyn material. Does the Minister share my concern about the marginalization of learning about food in our schools? That is detrimental to eating habits and the food industry, where there are job opportunities. Does she intend to raise the status of food technology in the curriculum and ensure that local authorities, educational consultants, headteachers and so on, take this subject more seriously than they do at present?

Jane Davidson: Ni chytunaf fod y cwricwlwm newydd yn rhoi sylw annigonol i fwyd. Mae gan fwyd, gan gynnwys maeth a materion iechyd eraill, ran amlwg o fewn y rhaglenni astudio ar gyfer gwyddoniaeth, addysg gorfforol a dylunio a thechnoleg. Mae hefyd yn amlwg yn y fframwaith addysg bersonol a chymdeithasol newydd. Parha technoleg bwyd yn opsiwn i ddisgyblion ar lefel TGAU. Gofynnwyd i ACCAC ddarparu canllawiau i ysgolion a ddaw ag elfennau addysgu bwyd yn y cwricwlwm at ei gilydd ac a amlyga bwysigrwydd bwyd a diogelwch bwyd. Cyhoeddir y canllawiau hynny cyn bo hir.

Alun Pugh: Mae'n bosibl bod cael ysgolion sydd yn arbenigo mewn meysydd cwricwlwm megis dylunio a thechnoleg yn gwneud synnwyr mewn cytrefi mawr yn Lloegr, ond a dderbyniwch ei fod yn llai perthnasol yng Nghymru? Pan ymwelwch â'r cyfleusterau dylunio a thechnoleg a geir yn ysgol fy mab ym Mae Colwyn y mis nesaf, a ddisgwyliwch weld ysgol gyfun gyffredin neu ysgol sydd yn cynnig rhagoriaeth heb ddechrau dewis disgyblion?

Jane Davidson: I did not know that it was your son's comprehensive school but I am looking forward to visiting what is one of many comprehensive schools in Wales that offer excellence to pupils in their local communities. I want to maintain the Assembly's commitment to delivering excellence in all schools in Wales, using a model that has worked well for us. We must ensure that we do not have 'bog-standard' comprehensives, and always use opportunities to drive up standards. Although design and technology is not a compulsory part of the curriculum at key stage 4 in Wales, as it is in England, it is the second most popular subject in Wales. The freedom generated through our national curriculum review is clearly working for schools in Wales.

Jane Davidson: Nid oeddwn ym ymwybodol mai ysgol gyfun eich mab ydoedd ond edrychaf ymlaen at ymweld ag un o'r ysgolion cyfun niferus yng Nghymru sydd yn cynnig rhagoriaeth i'r disgyblion yn eu cymunedau lleol. Yr wyf am gynnal ymrwymiad y Cynulliad i gyflwyno rhagoriaeth ym mhob ysgol yng Nghymru, gan ddefnyddio model a weithiodd yn dda inni. Rhaid inni sicrhau nad oes gennym ysgolion cyfun 'cyffredin', a dylem ddefnyddio pob cyfle i wella safonau. Er nad yw dylunio a thechnoleg yn rhan orfodol o'r cwricwlwm yng nghyfnod allweddol 4 yng Nghymru, fel y mae yn Lloegr, hwn yw'r pwnc mwyaf poblogaidd ond un yng Nghymru. Mae'n amlwg bod y rhyddid a grëwyd drwy ein hadolygiad o'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol yn llwyddiannus o fewn ysgolion Cymru.

The Presiding Officer: As Christine Gwyther is not present to ask question 2, it will be transferred for written answer.

Y Llywydd: Gan nad yw Christine Gwyther yn bresennol i ofyn cwestiwn 2, fe'i trosglwyddir i gael ateb ysgrifenedig.

Ymosodiadau gan Ddisgyblion neu Rieni ar Athrawon Attacks on Teachers by Pupils or Parents

Q3 David Davies: Will Jane Davidson make a statement on the numbers of attacks on teachers by pupils or parents? (OAQ9696)

C3 David Davies: A wnaiff Jane Davidson ddatganiad ar nifer yr ymosodiadau gan ddisgyblion neu rieni ar athrawon? (OAQ9696)

Jane Davidson: We do not have a central record on numbers of attacks on teachers. However, teachers in Wales are highly committed and dedicated professionals, and I deplore any attacks on them by pupils or parents.

Jane Davidson: Nid oes gennym gofnod canolog o niferoedd yr ymosodiadau ar athrawon. Fodd bynnag, mae athrawon Cymru yn weithwyr proffesiynol ymrwymedig ac ymroddedig iawn, a gresynaf unrhyw ymosodiad arnynt gan ddisgyblion neu rieni.

David Davies: Is it not the case that the number of attacks on teachers across Wales is rising inexorably? Does the Minister share the frustration of teachers who are prevented from using any form of meaningful sanction to keep discipline in the classroom? Does she agree, not only with me but with the representatives of teachers' unions whom I have met, that anyone who attacks a teacher, whether a parent or a pupil, should face automatic prosecution? Does the Minister share my opinion that nothing less than a custodial sentence is appropriate for those convicted?

David Davies: Onid yw'n wir bod nifer yr ymosodiadau ar athrawon ledled Cymru yn cynyddu'n ddiwrthdro? A ranna'r Gweinidog rwystredigaeth athrawon a gaiff eu hatal rhag defnyddio unrhyw ffurf ar gosbau ystyrllon i gadw disgyblaeth yn yr ystafell ddosbarth? A gytuna, nid yn unig â mi ond â chynrychiolwyr undebau athrawon yr ydym wedi cyfarfod â hwy, y dylai unrhyw un sydd yn ymosod ar athro, boed yn rhiant neu'n ddisgybl, gael ei erlyn yn awtomatig? A ranna'r Gweinidog fy marn nad oes dim byd yn llai na dedfryd o garchar yn briodol i'r rheini y'u dyfernir yn euog?

Jane Davidson: First, you must consider what provisions are currently in place. Teachers can use reasonable force to restrain pupils in certain situations, including preventing pupils from causing them personal injury. Section 550A of the Education Act 1996 refers to the use of reasonable force by teachers and other authorised members of staff. We also have guidance on school security, dealing with troublemakers and issues around powers of trespass. Amended guidance was issued last year to clarify circumstances under which a pupil may be excluded from the school. The law would ensure that any case would be dealt with on its merits, as is appropriate. I assure David that we will consider this issue shortly.

Lorraine Barrett: Do you agree that this appalling behaviour towards and against our teachers is, in part, a result of the generation produced by the social breakdown caused by the 18 years of reactionary Tory Government, particularly under Mrs Thatcher? It is coming home to haunt the Tories.

Jane Davidson: The important point is, and I accept David's thesis, that attacks on teachers by pupils and parents are utterly unacceptable. When we consider why there are attacks on teachers by pupils or parents, we need to ensure that the Assembly takes all measures possible to encourage people to be part of the education and training system and to tackle disaffection. Creating better opportunities in our communities as, for example, through Communities First, is not a matter for the education agenda only. Tackling any social policy issue is not just a matter for one spending department in the Assembly. We must all be committed to improving the quality of our communities and the quality of those relationships.

Jane Davidson: Yn gyntaf, rhaid ichi ystyried pa ddarpariaethau sydd yn eu lle ar hyn o bryd. Gall athrawon ddefnyddio grym rhesymol i rwystro disgyblion mewn amgylchiadau penodol, gan gynnwys atal disgyblion rhag achosi niwed personol iddynt. Cyfeiria adran 550A Deddf Addysg 1996 at y defnydd o rym rhesymol gan athrawon ac aelodau awdurdodedig eraill o'r staff. Mae gennym arweiniad hefyd ar ddiogelwch ysgolion, delio â'r rhai sydd yn creu trafferth a materion yn ymwneud â phwerau tresmasu. Cyhoeddwyd arweiniad diwygiedig y llynedd i esbonio'r amgylchiadau lle y gellir gwahardd disgybl o'r ysgol. Byddai'r gyfraith yn sicrhau y delid ag unrhyw achos yn ôl ei rinweddau, fel y bo'n briodol. Sicrhaf David yr ystyriwn y mater hwn cyn bo hir.

Lorraine Barrett: A gytunwch fod yr ymddygiad ofnadwy hwn tuag at ac yn erbyn ein hathrawon, yn rhannol, yn deillio o genhedlaeth a grëwyd gan y chwalfa gymdeithasol a achoswyd gan 18 mlynedd o Lywodraeth adweithiol Doriaidd, yn enwedig o dan Mrs Thatcher? Daw yn ôl i aflonyddu ar y Toriaid.

Jane Davidson: Y pwynt pwysig, a derbyniaf osodiad David, yw bod ymosodiadau gan ddisgyblion a rhieni ar athrawon yn gwbl annerbyniol. Pan ystyriwn pam bod ymosodiadau gan ddisgyblion neu rieni ar athrawon, mae angen inni sicrhau y cymer y Cynulliad bob mesur posibl i annog pobl i fod yn rhan o'r system addysg a hyfforddiant ac i fynd i'r afael ag ymddieithrio. Nid mater i'r agenda addysg yn unig yw creu cyfleoedd gwell yn ein cymunedau, er enghraifft, drwy Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf. Nid mater i un adran wario yn y Cynulliad yn unig yw mynd i'r afael ag unrhyw bolisi cymdeithasol. Rhaid i bob un ohonom fod yn ymrwymedig i wella ansawdd ein cymunedau ac ansawdd y cydberthnasau hynny.

Darparu Gwasanaethau Ieuentid yng Ngogledd Cymru Delivering Youth Services in North Wales

Q4 Janet Ryder: Will Jane Davidson make a brief statement on the Government of Wales's priorities in delivering youth

C4 Janet Ryder: A wnaiff Jane Davidson ddatganiad cryno ar flaenoriaethau Llywodraeth Cymru o ran darparu

services in north Wales? (OAQ9707)

Jane Davidson: Our priority for north Wales, as for the rest of Wales, is to take forward the agenda set out in the 'Extending Entitlement: Supporting Young People in Wales' policy document which the Assembly has endorsed. The aim must be to ensure that young people in all parts of Wales have access to a comprehensive set of high quality information and support services.

Janet Ryder: Following a recent North Wales Regional Committee meeting in which we considered this issue, one problem highlighted by the youth service departments was recruitment and retention of staff and the associated problem of youth workers' traditionally low wages. How will you deal with that matter?

Jane Davidson: 'Extending Entitlement' offers a brave new world for youth work. That is why all parties in the Assembly gave it their unequivocal support. We have put significant additional resources in place and have provided an additional £2 million for local authorities this year to support the youth service. We are going beyond the traditional focus of the youth service and engaging a wide range of other public agencies to provide a comprehensive set of services for young people. It is not only about the maintained sector. I know Janet is concerned about the impact on the voluntary sector. Having been a youth worker myself, I know that many people are working for either low wages, or as unpaid volunteers. In Wales, we are driving forward a brave new agenda that encompasses both sectors. I pay tribute to a man who would have played a great role in that, Brian Taylor, Chief Executive of the Wales Association of Youth Clubs, who died at a principal youth officers meeting in Wrexham last Friday. He was committed to taking this agenda forward and was working closely with the Assembly in its delivery.

Peter Black: Given the increasing ineffectiveness of youth clubs in dealing with

gwasanaethau ieuenctid yng ngogledd Cymru? (OAQ9707)

Jane Davidson: Ein blaenoriaeth ar gyfer gogledd Cymru, fel ar gyfer gweddill Cymru, yw gweithredu'r agenda a osodir yn y ddogfen bolisi 'Ymestyn Hawliau: Cynorthwyo Pobl Ifanc yng Nghymru' a gymeradwywyd gan y Cynulliad. Y nod ddylai sicrhau y caiff pobl ifanc ym mhob rhan o Gymru fynediad i gyfres gynhwysfawr o wasanaethau gwybodaeth a chymorth o ansawdd uchel.

Janet Ryder: Yn dilyn cyfarfod diweddar o Bwyllgor Rhanbarth y Gogledd lle yr ystyriasom y mater hwn, un broblem a amlygwyd gan yr adrannau gwasanaethau ieuenctid oedd recriwtio a chadw staff a'r broblem gysylltiedig o gyflogau traddodiadau isel gweithwyr ieuenctid. Sut y byddwch yn delio â'r mater hwnnw?

Jane Davidson: Cynigia'r ddogfen 'Ymestyn Hawliau' syniadau beiddgar newydd ar gyfer gwaith ieuenctid. Dyna pam y rhoddodd pob plaid yn y Cynulliad eu cefnogaeth bendant iddi. Rhoddasom adnoddau ychwanegol sylweddol yn eu lle a darparasom £2 filiwn ychwanegol i awdurdodau lleol eleni er mwyn cynnal y gwasanaeth ieuenctid. Awn y tu hwnt i ffocws traddodiadol y gwasanaeth ieuenctid a chydweithiwn ag amrywiaeth eang o asiantaethau cyhoeddus eraill i ddarparu cyfres gynhwysfawr o wasanaethau i bobl ifanc. Nid yw'n ymwneud â'r sector a gynhelir yn unig. Gwn y prydera Janet am yr effaith ar y sector gwirfoddol. Gan imi fod yn weithiwr ieuenctid fy hun, gwn fod llawer o bobl yn gweithio naill ai am gyflogau isel, neu fel gwirfoddolwyr di-dâl. Yng Nghymru, datblygwn agenda newydd feiddgar sydd yn cwmpasu'r ddau sector. Talaf deyrnged i ddyn a fyddai wedi chwarae rôl fawr yn hynny o beth, sef Brian Taylor, Prif Weithredwr Cymdeithas Clybiau Ieuenctid Cymru, a fu farw mewn cyfarfod o brif swyddogion ieuenctid yn Wrecsam ddydd Gwener diwethaf. Yr oedd yn ymrwymedig i ddatblygu'r agenda hon a chydweithiai'n agos â'r Cynulliad wrth ei chyflwyno.

Peter Black: O ystyried aneffeithiolrwydd cynyddol clybiau ieuenctid i ddelio â grŵp

the hard core of disaffected young people, how are you working with other Government Ministers with responsibility for community development and law and order issues to ensure that youth issues and services are developed to try to meet the needs of disaffected youngsters?

Jane Davidson: When I introduced the report on the 'Extending Entitlement' consultation document to the Assembly, I focused on the 12,000 people between 16 and 18 who are not in training, education or employment. It must be a key focus for us all, in terms of how we work across the sectors in achieving more positive opportunities for them for the future. That is a key element of the consultation. I hope that young people will contribute to that consultation, which will close at the end of March. It is also important to note that we put a great deal of extra money into grants for education support and training to tackle issues of truancy and disaffection, and we will continue to prioritise that.

9:35 a.m.

Tablau Perfformiad i Ysgolion School Performance Tables

Q5 David Melding: Will the administration continue to issue school performance tables? (OAQ9635)

Jane Davidson: I am not convinced that the school performance booklets, as currently published, are the most effective means of placing this information in the public domain. I have therefore reviewed the current arrangements and in the next few weeks I will publish my proposals on the future of school performance data. The consultation exercise will be open and thorough, and will seek the views of headteachers, teachers, parents, representative bodies and others. Decisions on how future school performance data will be made available to the public will not be reached until the outcome of the consultation is known.

David Melding: Do you agree that when you abolish these tables—as you have already

craidd o bobl ifanc sydd wedi'u hymddieithrio, sut yr ydych yn cydweithio â Gweinidogion eraill yn y Llywodraeth sydd â chyfrifoldeb dros ddatblygu cymunedol a materion cyfraith a threfn er mwyn sicrhau y datblygir materion a gwasanaethau ieuencid i geisio bodloni anghenion pobl ifanc sydd wedi'u hymddieithrio?

Jane Davidson: Pan gyflwynais yr adroddiad ar y ddogfen ymgynghorol 'Ymestyn Hawliau' i'r Cynulliad, canolbwyntiais ar y 12,000 o bobl rhwng 16 a 18 oed na ymgymerant â hyfforddiant, addysg na chyflogaeth. Rhaid i bob un ohonom ganolbwyntio ar hyn, o ran sut y gweithiwn ar draws y sectorau i gael mwy o gyfleoedd cadarnhaol iddynt yn y dyfodol. Mae'n elfen allweddol yn y broses ymgynghorol. Gobeithiaf y cyfranna pobl ifanc at y broses ymgynghorol honno, a ddaw i ben ar ddiwedd Mawrth. Mae'n bwysig nodi hefyd y rhoddasom lawer o arian ychwanegol i grantiau cynnal addysg a hyfforddiant er mwyn mynd i'r afael â materion triwantiaeth ac ymddieithrio, a pharhawn i flaenoriaethu hynny.

C5 David Melding: A fydd y weinyddiaeth yn parhau i gyhoeddi tablau perfformiad ysgolion? (OAQ9635)

Jane Davidson: Nid wyf yn argyhoeddedig mai'r llyfrynnau perfformiad ysgolion, fel y'u cyhoeddir ar hyn o bryd, yw'r modd mwyaf effeithiol o roi'r wybodaeth hon i'r cyhoedd. Felly, adolygais y trefniadau presennol a chyhoeddaf fy nghynigion ar ddyfodol data perfformiad ysgolion yn yr ychydig wythnosau nesaf. Bydd yr ymarfer ymgynghori'n agored ac yn drylwyr, ac yn gofyn am farn penaethiaid, athrawon, rhieni, cyrff cynrychioliadol ac eraill. Ni ddeuir i benderfyniadau ar sut y rhoddir data perfformiad ysgolion i'r cyhoedd yn y dyfodol hyd nes y gwyddys canlyniad yr ymarfer ymgynghori.

David Melding: A gytunwch pan ddiddymwch y tablau hyn—fel y nodasoch

indicated to the press, given the reports that have been leaked—it will have a dramatic and deleterious effect on parents' and pupils' rights to the information they need to make good, effective choices.

Jane Davidson: No, I absolutely reject that. The key issues are what information is available, and at whom it is targeted. I am sure that you accept that for the majority of our schools in Wales, parents have no choice because there is only one school in the locality. Therefore, as I have stated again today, I am committed to ensuring that there are excellent schools in every part of Wales. We must ensure that the information in the public domain is appropriate and effective for Wales. It must make a positive contribution to improving the work of schools, local education authorities and parents in raising standards. We should focus on providing excellent schools for all communities. I want schools to get the credit for the added value that they provide to their pupils. My proposals will address this issue. I have already talked to headteachers. They are keen to ensure that information is in the public domain, but that it is not divisive information, like that published in the past.

Brian Hancock: Thank you, that is an extremely important statement. Will you reaffirm how important it is to treat all schools equally, so that all the children of Wales get the best possible education?

Jane Davidson: I feel tempted to say 'watch my lips,' but that has been used against people in the past. I reaffirm that we are committed to excellence throughout Wales. We are privileged in Wales in that we have a system operating across the whole of the country that we all want to build on. Neither I, nor any other Member, will accept any school failing. We must ensure that our schools are of a high standard. My contact with the teaching profession, and their commitment, indicates that with the right support from the Assembly we will achieve that target.

eisoes i'r wasg, o ystyried yr adroddiadau a ddatgelwyd—y caiff effaith ddramatig a niweidiol ar hawliau rhieni a disgyblion i gael yr wybodaeth y mae ei hangen arnynt i wneud dewisiadau da, effeithiol.

Jane Davidson: Na wnaif, gwrthodaf hynny yn llwyr. Y materion allweddol yw pa wybodaeth sydd ar gael, ac at bwy y'i targedir. Yr wyf yn siŵr y derbyniwch o ran mwyafrif ein hysgolion yng Nghymru, nad oes gan rieni ddewis gan mai dim ond un ysgol sydd yn y gymdogaeth. Felly, fel y dywedais eto heddiw, yr wyf wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau bod ysgolion ardderchog ym mhob rhan o Gymru. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod yr wybodaeth sydd ar gael i'r cyhoedd yn briodol ac yn effeithiol i Gymru. Rhaid iddi wneud cyfraniad cadarnhaol tuag at wella gwaith ysgolion, awdurdodau addysg lleol a rhieni wrth godi safonau. Dylem ganolbwyntio ar ddarparu ysgolion ardderchog ar gyfer pob cymuned. Yr wyf yn awyddus i ysgolion gael y clod am y gwerth ychwanegol a roddant i'w disgyblion. Bydd fy nghynigion yn ymdrin â'r mater hwn. Siaradais eisoes â phenaethiaid. Maent yn awyddus i sicrhau bod yr wybodaeth ar gael i'r cyhoedd, ond nad gwybodaeth rwygol ydyw, fel yr hyn a gyhoeddwyd yn y gorffennol.

Brian Hancock: Diolch, yr oedd yn ddatganiad hynod o bwysig. A ailddatganwch pa mor bwysig ydyw i drin pob ysgol yn gyfartal, fel y gall pob plentyn yng Nghymru gael yr addysg orau bosibl?

Jane Davidson: Caf fy nhemtio i ddweud 'gwyliwch fy ngwefusau,' ond defnyddiwyd hynny yn erbyn pobl yn y gorffennol. Ailddatganaf ein bod yn ymrwymedig i ragoriaeth ledled Cymru. Yr ydym yn ffodus yng Nghymru fod gennym system sydd yn gweithredu ledled y wlad y mae pob un ohonom am ei datblygu. Ni dderbyniaf i, nac unrhyw Aelod arall, fod unrhyw ysgol yn methu. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod ein hysgolion o safon uchel. Noda fy nghysylltiad â'r proffesiwn addysgu, a'u hymrwymiad, y cyflawnwn y targed hwnnw, gyda'r gefnogaeth briodol gan y Cynulliad.

Parhad Dyraniad Ariannol Ychwanegol i Ysgolion Cymru
Continuation of Extra Financial Allocation for Schools in Wales

Q6 Gwenda Thomas: Will there be a continuation of the extra financial allocation for schools in Wales in future years? (OAQ9705)

Jane Davidson: The Assembly's budget for 2001-02 includes £20 million in additional revenue funding for schools. It is intended that that funding will go to local authorities as a special grant to secure a reduction in junior class sizes and improved attainment at key stage 3 and in under-performing schools. I expect the funding to go out to schools, but local authorities will decide how to allocate it to individual schools, given the need for targeting. The Assembly will have the opportunity to debate the arrangements on 6 March.

Other funding for 2001-02 will be provided through the local government revenue settlement, which the Assembly approved last week. We will continue to provide schools with modest increases in their delegated school budgets—such the £20.5 million in May 2000 and the £7.9 million in December 2000—where the opportunity arises, and where the Assembly decides that it is appropriate.

Gwenda Thomas: Will you join me in congratulating the Chancellor of the Exchequer for his prudence in developing a framework for increasing spending in priority public services, while also recognising the importance of devolution, in that in many policy areas there is no automatic replication of English decisions in Wales?

Jane Davidson: The fact that devolution means that the Assembly makes its own decisions is a difficult lesson for some people in Wales. I congratulate the Chancellor for bringing sufficient extra money to Wales to enable us to make positive spending decisions in our areas of responsibility.

Owen John Thomas: A ydych yn monitro'r gwasanaeth ymgynghorol ar gyfer athrawon ym mhob awdurdod lleol? Os felly, a ydych

C6 Gwenda Thomas: A fydd y dyraniad ariannol ychwanegol i ysgolion Cymru yn parhau yn y dyfodol? (OAQ9705)

Jane Davidson: Mae cyllideb y Cynulliad ar gyfer 2001-02 yn cynnwys £20 miliwn mewn arian refeniw ychwanegol i ysgolion. Y bwriad yw i'r arian hwnnw fynd i awdurdodau lleol fel grant arbennig er mwyn sicrhau gostyngiad ym maint dosbarthiadau iau a gwella cyrhaeddiad cyfnod allweddol 3 ac mewn ysgolion sydd yn tanberfformio. Disgwyliaf i'r arian fynd allan i'r ysgolion, ond awdurdodau lleol fydd yn penderfynu sut i'w ddyrannu i ysgolion unigol, o ystyried yr angen i dargedu. Caiff y Cynulliad y cyfle i gael dadl ar y trefniadau ar 6 Mawrth.

Darperir arian arall ar gyfer 2001-02 drwy'r setliad refeniw llywodraeth leol, a gymeradwyodd y Cynulliad yr wythnos diwethaf. Parhawn i ddarparu cynnydd cymharol fach i ysgolion yn y cyllidebau ysgol a ddirprwyir iddynt—fel y £20.5 miliwn ym Mai 2000 a'r £7.9 miliwn yn Rhagfyr 2000—lle y bydd cyfle, a lle y penderfyna'r Cynulliad ei fod yn briodol.

Gwenda Thomas: A ymunwch â mi wrth longyfarch Canghellor y Trysorlys am ei ddoethineb wrth ddatblygu fframwaith ar gyfer cynyddu'r gwariant mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus sydd yn flaenoriaeth, tra hefyd yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd datganoli, gan fod llawer o feysydd polisi lle nad atgynhyrchir penderfyniadau Lloegr yng Nghymru yn awtomatig?

Jane Davidson: Mae'r ffaith bod datganoli'n golygu y gwna'r Cynulliad ei benderfyniadau ei hun yn wers anodd i rai pobl yng Nghymru. Llongyfarchaf y Canghellor am ddod â digon o arian ychwanegol i Gymru i'n galluogi i wneud penderfyniadau cadarnhaol o ran gwariant yn ein meysydd cyfrifoldeb.

Owen John Thomas: Do you monitor the advisory service for teachers in each local authority? If so, are you satisfied that

yn fodlon fod digon o arian yn cael ei wario ar y gwasanaeth er mwyn hyrwyddo datblygiad proffesiynol athrawon Cymru?

sufficient money is being spent on the service to promote the professional development of teachers in Wales?

Jane Davidson: One way that the Assembly monitors this service is through Estyn. It will be undertaking Best Value inspections of local authorities, in terms of education, over the coming year. The advisory service is a key issue, and I would be happy to write to you and to report to the Committee in due course on this important issue.

Jane Davidson: Un ffordd y mae'r Cynulliad yn monitro'r gwasanaeth hwn yw drwy Estyn. Bydd yn cynnal arolygiadau Gwerth Gorau o awdurdodau lleol, yn nhermau addysg, dros y flwyddyn sydd i ddod. Mae'r gwasanaeth ymgynghorol yn fater allweddol, a byddai'n bleser gennyf ysgrifennu atoch a chyflwyno adroddiad i'r Pwyllgor maes o law ar y mater pwysig hwn.

Cwestiynau i Bwyllgor y Tŷ Questions to the House Committee

Cynyddu Amrediad y Nwyddau sydd ar Werth yn y Siop Increasing the Range of Goods on Sale in the Shop

Q1 William Graham: Will there be an increase in the range of goods available for sale in the shop? (OAQ9722)

C1 William Graham: A fydd cynnydd yn yr amrediad o nwyddau sydd ar werth yn y siop? (OAQ9722)

The Deputy Presiding Officer (John Marek): There are no current plans to increase the range of goods available for sale in the shop adjacent to the staff restaurant.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd (John Marek): Nid oes cynlluniau ar hyn o bryd i gynyddu amrediad y nwyddau sydd ar werth yn y siop gerllaw bwyty'r staff.

William Graham: That is very disappointing. However, as I informed your staff, I was thinking of the new shop in the new building across the way.

William Graham: Mae hynny'n siom fawr. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais wrth eich staff, meddwl yr oeddwn i am y siop newydd yn yr adeilad newydd dros y ffordd.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That shop is being investigated and there are other questions tabled for answer this morning regarding that shop. There are plans to investigate establishing a shop in the Pierhead building and to stock it with a large range of goods. It will depend on several issues, one being the decision on what logo we will adopt.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Ymchwilir i'r siop honno a chyflwynwyd cwestiynau eraill i'w hateb y bore yma ynglŷn â'r siop honno. Mae cynlluniau i ymchwilio i'r posibilrwydd o sefydlu siop yng Nglanfa'r Cynulliad a'i llenwi ag amrediad mawr o nwyddau. Dibynna ar sawl mater, ac un ohonynt fydd y logo y penderfynwn ei fabwysiadu.

Lorraine Barrett: I thank William for raising this issue, because on a few occasions I have tried to buy a gift made in Wales from the shop, but have failed to do so. There is hardly anything there at all. We often have visitors here and we would like to give them a gift to take away with them, so I am interested in the shop in this building as well as that in the Pierhead. Also, items such as voucher parking tickets for the city centre are

Lorraine Barrett: Diolchaf i William am godi'r mater hwn, gan imi geisio ar rai achlysuron brynu rhodd a wnaethpwyd yng Nghymru o'r siop, ond imi fetu â gwneud hynny. Prin bod unrhyw beth o gwbl yno. Cawn ymwelwyr yma'n aml a hoffem roi rhodd iddynt i fynd gyda hwy, felly mae gennyf ddiddordeb yn siop yr adeilad hwn yn ogystal â siop Glanfa'r Cynulliad. Hefyd, ni werthir eitemau fel tocynnau parcio ar gyfer

not sold in the shop, but I think that they would be useful.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I am grateful for those comments. The shop is run by Eurest, which adapts and varies the range of goods on sale based on customer requests. Those suggestions are sensible, and I will ensure that they are drawn to Eurest's attention.

Brian Hancock: About a month after the establishment of the Assembly, when I was a member of the House Committee, I proposed a range of goods that should display the name of the National Assembly for Wales. These should be freely available. I am disappointed that this has still not been done so many months later. We have many visitors here—particularly school children—and it would be nice to be able to mark their visits by giving them a pen, ruler or eraser. [*Laughter.*] I said 'eraser', deliberately, but for the lesser mortals, I will say 'rubber'.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I thought that you said 'safety razor'. You are quite right. There is demand for various materials to be available to school children visiting the National Assembly. When the Pierhead building opens that demand will be ever more pressing. The House Committee and the Presiding Office are aware of this and are progressing it as quickly as possible.

canol y ddinas yn y siop, ond credaf y byddent yn ddefnyddiol.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y sylwadau hynny. Caiff y siop ei rhedeg gan Eurest, sydd yn addasu ac yn amrywio amrediad y nwyddau sydd ar werth yn ôl gofynion y cwsmeriaid. Mae'r awgrymiadau hynny'n synhwyrol, a sicrhaf y cânt eu dwyn i sylw Eurest.

Brian Hancock: Tua mis ar ôl sefydlu'r Cynulliad, pan oeddwn yn aelod o Bwyllgor y Tŷ, cynigiais amrediad o nwyddau a ddylai ddangos enw Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Dylai'r rhain fod ar gael yn hawdd. Yr wyf yn siomedig bod hyn heb ei wneud o hyd gymaint o fisoedd yn ddiweddarach. Cawn lawer o ymwelwyr yma—plant ysgol yn arbennig—a byddai'n braf gallu nodi eu hymweliadau drwy roi beiro, pren mesur neu ddilëydd iddynt. [*Chwerthin.*] Dywedais 'dilëydd', yn fwriadol, ond i'r meidrolion llai, dywedaf 'rwber'.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Credais ichi ddweud 'raser'. Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle. Mae galw i ddeunyddiau amrywiol fod ar gael i blant ysgol sydd yn ymweld â'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Pan fydd Glanfa'r Cynulliad yn agor bydd y galw hwnnw'n fwy byth. Mae Pwyllgor y Tŷ a'r Llywydd yn ymwybodol o hyn ac yn symud pethau yn eu blaen cyn gynted ag y bo modd.

Darpariaeth Parcio ar gyfer Staff Staff Parking Provision

Q2 Janet Ryder: What arrangements are being made to ensure the continuation of adequate provision for staff parking? (OAQ9723)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The Presiding Office has taken steps to ensure maximum utilisation of available car parking spaces for staff. These have included the marking of car parking spaces in the overflow car park at the rear of the building to increase the number of spaces. The House Committee, at its meeting yesterday, has recommended, and the Presiding Officer has accepted, utilising reserved car parking spaces on days when the reserved holder is not in the Assembly.

C2 Janet Ryder: Pa drefniadau sydd ar waith i sicrhau bod darpariaeth parcio digonol ar gyfer staff yn parhau? (OAQ9723)

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae'r Llywydd wedi cymryd camau i sicrhau bod cymaint o leoedd parcio â phosibl yn cael eu defnyddio gan staff. Yn eu plith mae marcio lleoedd parcio yn y maes parcio gorlanw yng nghefn yr adeilad er mwyn cynyddu nifer y lleoedd. Mae Pwyllgor y Tŷ, yn ei gyfarfod ddoe, wedi argymhell, ac mae'r Llywydd wedi derbyn, y dylid defnyddio lleoedd parcio cadw ar ddyddiau pan na fydd y deiliad cadw yn y Cynulliad.

9:45 a.m.

Janet Ryder: Some staff work here everyday and others only part-time, perhaps during mid-week or in Cathays Park. You mentioned using the reserved parking spaces when reserved holders are not here. Will you make it a priority to ensure that the people who work here everyday have a space to park their car?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There is no 100 per cent solution to this issue. We will endeavour to ensure that those who are here everyday are able to park. However, we must remember that, in conjunction, the Executive is undertaking a green transport plan and we may be able to wean people away from their cars. However, I realise that that cannot be done for every person. Where we can do it, we will. Furthermore, the number of extra spaces in the overflow car park equals the number of car parking spaces lost to the portakabins that are necessary for the construction of the new building.

Rosemary Butler: John has referred to public transport. We must wean people away from using cars. However, when people, particularly elderly citizens, visit the Assembly, it is almost impossible for them to get here without a car. What pressure are you putting on the Minister for Environment to ensure that there is an adequate public transport system to Cardiff Bay?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have not put any pressure on the Minister so far, but, in light of your question, I will do so.

Gwenda Thomas: On parking, I was rightly reprimanded on Tuesday for being in contravention of National Assembly rules on security because I was not displaying my parking ticket. The cumbersome ticket falls all over the car and I often cannot find it. Will you consider the possibility of producing simple, parking stickers for car windows, which would identify Members and staff and make it more difficult for us to contravene the rules?

Janet Ryder: Mae rhai o'r staff yn gweithio yma bob dydd ac eraill ran amser yn unig, efallai yn ystod canol yr wythnos neu ym Mharc Cathays. Crybwyllasoch ddefnyddio'r lleoedd parcio cadw pan na fydd deiliaid cadw yma. A wnewch chi, fel blaenoriaeth, sicrhau y caiff y bobl sydd yn gweithio yma bob dydd le i barcio eu car?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Nid oes ateb perffaith i'r mater hwn. Ymdrechwn i sicrhau y gall y rheini sydd yma bob dydd barcio. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gofio bod y Weithrediaeth, mewn cydweithrediad, yn ymgymryd â chynllun trafndiaeth gwyrdd ac efallai y gallwn ddiddynfu pobl oddi wrth eu ceir. Fodd bynnag, sylweddolaf na ellir gwneud hynny i bob person. Lle y gallwn ei wneud, fe'i gwnawn. At hynny, mae nifer y lleoedd ychwanegol yn y maes parcio gorlanw yn cyfateb â nifer y lleoedd parcio a gollwyd i'r cabanau sydd yn angenrheidiol i godi'r adeilad newydd.

Rosemary Butler: Mae John wedi cyfeirio at drafndiaeth gyhoeddus. Rhaid inni ddiddynfu pobl oddi wrth eu ceir. Fodd bynnag, pan fydd pobl, yn arbennig dinasyddion oedrannus, yn ymweld â'r Cynulliad, mae bron yn amhosibl iddynt gyrraedd yma heb gar. Pa bwysau a roddwch ar y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd i sicrhau system trafndiaeth gyhoeddus ddigonol i Fae Caerdydd?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Nid wyf wedi rhoi unrhyw bwysau ar y Gweinidog hyd yn hyn, ond, yng ngoleuni eich cwestiwn, gwnaf hynny.

Gwenda Thomas: O ran parcio, cefais fy ngheryddu ddydd Mawrth, yn gywir felly, am fynd yn groes i reolau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar ddiogelwch gan nad oeddwn yn arddangos fy nhocyn parcio. Mae'r tocyn lletchwith yn syrthio dros y car i gyd ac yn aml ni allaf ddod o hyd iddo. A ystyriwch y posibilrwydd o gynhyrchu sticeri parcio syml ar gyfer ffenestri ceir, a fyddai'n dynodi Aelodau a staff a'i gwneud yn anos inni fynd yn groes i'r rheolau?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: We will consider it, Gwenda, but there is a downside to that. When you park your car elsewhere, you will draw attention to the fact that you are an Assembly Member. There is an up and down side to these matters, but we will consider it.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Fe'i hystyriwn, Gwenda, ond mae anfantais i hynny. Pan barciwch eich car yn rhywle arall, tynnwch sylw at y ffaith eich bod yn Aelod o'r Cynulliad. Mae manteision ac anfantaision i'r materion hyn, ond fe'i hystyriwn.

Dull Cyfarch Aelodau'r Cynulliad Mode of Greeting Assembly Members

C3 Cynog Dafis: Pa gyfarwyddiadau sydd wedi cael eu rhoi i staff y Cynulliad ynglŷn â dull cyfarch Aelodau'r Cynulliad? (OAQ9724)

Q3 Cynog Dafis: What instructions have been given to Assembly staff concerning the mode of greeting Assembly Members? (OAQ9724)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The Assembly's protocol on staff and Member relations states as a key principle:

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae protocol y Cynulliad ar gysylltiadau staff ac Aelodau yn datgan fel egwyddor allweddol:

'Relationships between Assembly Members and Assembly staff shall be professional and based on mutual respect.'

'Bydd y cysylltiadau rhwng Aelodau'r Cynulliad a staff y Cynulliad yn un broffesiynol, a bydd y naill yn parchu'r llall.'

Staff in the Presiding Office are not given specific guidance on the mode of greeting Assembly Members.

Ni roddir unrhyw arweiniad penodol i staff Swyddfa'r Llywydd ar ddull cyfarch Aelodau'r Cynulliad.

Cynog Dafis: Yr wyf yn falch o glywed hynny. Mae perthynas gyfeillgar, gydradd yn bodoli rhwng Aelodau'r Cynulliad a staff. Fe'm trawodd yn chwithig ar adegau pan gefais fy ngalw gan ambell aelod o staff yn 'syr'. Ni hoffaf gael fy ngalw yn 'syr'. Hoffwn hynny pan oeddwn yn athro ysgol gan ei bod yn iawn i blant alw athrawon yn 'syr', ond nid yw'n gweddu rhwng oedolion a'i gilydd. Byddwn yn falch pe bai'r staff yn cael gwybod nad oes angen y math hwn o gyfarchiad. Byddai defnyddio enwau wrth gyfarch yn ddigon da.

Cynog Dafis: I am glad to hear that. Assembly Members and staff have friendly and equal relationships. It has struck me as strange at times when some members of staff called me 'sir'. I do not like being called 'sir'. I appreciated it when I was a schoolteacher as it is proper for school children to call their teachers 'sir', but it is not appropriate as a greeting between adults. I would be grateful if staff were informed that there is no need for such a greeting. Using names when greeting would be sufficient.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I am tempted to say, 'yes, sir', but I will not, I will say, 'yes, Cynog'. We must have give and take on this issue. 'Sir' is not always used to address someone who is believed to be in a higher position, and is sometimes used as a common form of address. However, where Members prefer a particular form of address, we will ensure that staff are notified. We cannot notify all staff, only the Presiding Office's staff. The Presiding Office is not responsible for Executive staff.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Caf fy nhemtio i ddweud, 'iawn, syr', ond ni wnaaf hynny, dywedaf, 'iawn, Cynog'. Rhaid inni fod yn hyblyg ar y mater hwn. Ni ddefnyddir 'syr' bob amser i gyfarch rhywun y credir ei fod yn uwch ei safle, ac fe'i defnyddir weithiau fel cyfarchiad cyffredin. Fodd bynnag, lle y mae'n well gan Aelodau ffurf cyfarch arbennig, sicrhawn y caiff staff eu hysbysu. Ni allwn hysbysu'r staff i gyd, dim ond staff Swyddfa'r Llywydd. Nid yw Swyddfa'r Llywydd yn gyfrifol am staff y Weithrediaeth.

Val Feld: I am tempted to ask why I have not been called 'ma'am', but I will not. Will you review the Assembly's out-of-office-hours telephone service? A number of Assembly Members, including myself, have telephoned after office hours to obtain direct phone numbers for people who I know are in the building. In doing so, I encounter a central Government answering service that sometimes does not even know that the National Assembly exists. Will you review this service because I do not think that it helps our external relations?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I understand the problem that Members experience when they phone the central answering service, when they know the name and extension number of the person they are trying to contact but not the location. In the Presiding Office we are compiling a comprehensive internal telephone directory that will include the names and extension numbers of staff. That information will be provided to the central telephone answering service. Again, I cannot speak for the Executive. That is a matter for it.

David Melding: One of my favourite works is F.H. Bradley's *My Station and its Duties*; I will not recommend that Cynog reads it. Staff should feel comfortable with how they greet Members and I would prefer for them to greet us in the normal fashion. In America, the use of 'sir' and 'ma'am' is common and, if it were common here, it would also be appropriate in the Assembly. However, we want this to be a friendly place and for people to feel comfortable.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That is right and I have nothing to add to it. Many people, as a result of this interchange, will have heard Cynog's wishes. I hope that Members will take notice of it wherever possible.

Val Feld: Caf fy nhemtio i ofyn pam na chefais fy ngalw'n 'ma'am', ond ni wnaif hynny. A adolygwch wasanaeth ffôn tu allan i oriau swyddfa'r Cynulliad? Mae nifer o Aelodau'r Cynulliad, a minnau yn eu plith, wedi ffonio ar ôl oriau swyddfa er mwyn cael gafael ar rifau ffôn uniongyrchol pobl y gwn eu bod yn yr adeilad. Wrth wneud hynny, dof ar draws gwasanaeth ateb Llywodraeth ganolog nad yw'n gwybod weithiau bod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn bodoli hyd yn oed. A adolygwch y gwasanaeth hwn gan nad wyf o'r farn ei fod yn helpu ein cysylltiadau allanol?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Deallaf y broblem a gaiff Aelodau pan ffoniant y gwasanaeth ateb canolog, pan wyddant enw a rhif estyniad y person y ceisiant gysylltu ag ef ond nid y lleoliad. Yn Swyddfa'r Llywydd yr ydym wrthi'n llunio llyfr ffôn mewnol cynhwysfawr a fydd yn cynnwys enwau a rhifau estyniad y staff. Darperir yr wybodaeth honno i'r gwasanaeth ateb ffôn canolog. Unwaith eto, ni allaf siarad dros y Weithrediaeth. Mae hynny'n fater iddi hi.

David Melding: Un o'm hoff weithiau yw *My Station and its Duties* F.H. Bradley; nid argymhellaf y dylai Cynog ei ddarllen. Dylai'r staff deimlo'n gyfforddus gyda'r ffordd y cyfarchant Aelodau a byddai'n well gennyf iddynt ein cyfarch yn y modd arferol. Yn America, mae defnyddio 'syr' a 'ma'am' yn gyffredin a phetai'n gyffredin yma, byddai hefyd yn briodol yn y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym am i hwn fod yn lle cyfeillgar ac i bobl deimlo'n gyfforddus.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae hynny'n gywir ac nid oes gennyf unrhyw beth i'w ychwanegu ato. Bydd llawer o bobl, o ganlyniad i'r sgwrs hon, wedi clywed dymuniadau Cynog. Gobeithiaf y cymer yr Aelodau sylw ohono lle bynnag y bo'n bosibl.

Canolfan Ymwelwyr Glanfa'r Cynulliad The Assembly at the Pierhead Visitor Centre

Q4 Rosemary Butler: When will the Pierhead visitor centre be open? (OAQ9617)

C4 Rosemary Butler: Pryd fydd canolfan ymwelwyr Glanfa'r Cynulliad yn agor? (OAQ9617)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The Assembly at the Pierhead visitor and education centre will be launched on Wednesday 28 February 2001.

Rosemary Butler: When you say that it will be 'launched' on that date, does that mean it will be open then?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: It will be open, but there will be nagging problems. For example, fire drills must be held and staff will have to move in, although some have already done so. There are problems with finalising access arrangements for the disabled. However, the centre and the exhibition will be open from 28 February. If you want a ballpark figure, I suspect that 80 per cent of the centre will be open, with the whole centre open a short time after that.

The Presiding Officer: You may have a further supplementary question, Rosemary.

Rosemary Butler: I am glad that it will be open in 2001, and I am sure that we are all pleased with that. However, will it only be available for group bookings that come via the Presiding Office? Will the public be able to enter at any time? Will it be open at weekends and, above all, as many Members have asked, will there be information available and items for sale? People like to remember visits and visitors appreciate interesting souvenirs. If possible, I would like to have something in writing about the activities, when will they happen and whether they will be free and so on? We have not been informed about many of the details even though it opens in the near future.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The centre will be open to the public and entry will be free. You will not have to make prior arrangements and will simply be able to walk in. I do not think that opening times have been fixed. Where there is a demand, we should aim to meet it. Having said that, if you want information in writing, I will make sure that you receive it.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Caiff canolfan ymwelwyr ac addysg Glanfa'r Cynulliad ei lansio ddydd Mercher 28 Chwefror 2001.

Rosemary Butler: Pan ddywedwch y caiff ei 'lansio' ar y dyddiad hwnnw, a olyga hynny y bydd ar agor bryd hynny?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Bydd ar agor, ond bydd mân broblemau. Er enghraifft, rhaid cynnal ymarferion tân a bydd yn rhaid i staff symud i mewn, er bod rhai wedi gwneud hynny eisoes. Mae problemau gyda chwblhau trefniadau mynediad i'r anabl. Fodd bynnag, bydd y ganolfan a'r arddangosfa ar agor o 28 Chwefror ymlaen. Os ydych am ffigur bras, tybiaf y bydd 80 y cant o'r ganolfan ar agor, gyda'r ganolfan gyfan ar agor yn fuan wedi hynny.

Y Llywydd: Cewch gwestiwn atodol pellach, Rosemary.

Rosemary Butler: Yr wyf yn falch y bydd ar agor yn 2001, ac yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod i gyd yn bles am hynny. Fodd bynnag, ai dim ond ar gyfer grwpiau sydd yn archebu drwy gyfrwng Swyddfa'r Llywydd y bydd ar gael? A all y cyhoedd fynd i mewn iddo ar unrhyw adeg? A fydd ar agor ar benwythnosau ac, uwchlaw popeth, fel y mae llawer o'r Aelodau wedi gofyn, a fydd gwybodaeth ar gael ac eitemau ar werth? Mae pobl yn hoffi cofio ymweliadau ac mae ymwelwyr yn gwerthfawrogi cofroddion diddorol. Os yn bosibl, hoffwn gael rhywbeth ysgrifenedig am y gweithgareddau, pryd y digwyddant a pha un a fyddant am ddim ai peidio ac ati? Ni chawsom wybod llawer o'r manylion er y bydd yn agor yn y dyfodol agos.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Bydd y ganolfan ar agor i'r cyhoedd a chânt fynd i mewn am ddim. Ni fydd yn rhaid ichi wneud trefniadau blaenorol a gallwch gerdded i mewn. Ni chredaf fod amserau agor wedi eu pennu. Lle ceir galw, dylem anelu at ei ateb. Wedi dweud hynny, os ydych am wybodaeth ysgrifenedig, gwnaf yn siŵr eich bod yn ei derbyn.

**Gwerthu Nwyddau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol
Selling National Assembly Merchandise**

Q5 The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): Has the House Committee explored the possibility of a shop selling National Assembly merchandise? (OAQ9618)

C5 Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): A yw'r Pwyllgor Tŷ wedi ystyried y posibilrwydd o sefydlu siop yn gwerthu nwyddau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol? (OAQ9618)

Q7 Richard Edwards: Are there any plans to open a shop in the Pierhead building? (OAQ9616)

C7 Richard Edwards: A oes unrhyw gynlluniau ar waith i agor siop yng Nglanfa'r Cynulliad? (OAQ9616)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I will answer questions 5 and 7 together.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Atebaf gwestiynau 5 a 7 gyda'i gilydd.

To answer your question, Nick, yes. The present option under consideration is to locate a shop on the ground floor of the Pierhead building.

I ateb eich cwestiwn, Nick, ydy. Yr opsiwn presennol a ystyrir yw lleoli siop ar lawr daear Glanfa'r Cynulliad.

Nick Bourne: We have done the circuit on this, but the National Assembly is expressing a clear message about the importance of having a showcase where we can purchase products made in Wales and visitors can purchase gifts. I hope that this message will be taken on board. They have a successful shop in the Scottish Parliament and that might be a model for us in Wales.

Nick Bourne: Yr ydym wedi trafod hyn yn helaeth, ond mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn mynegi neges glir ynghylch pwysigrwydd cael cwpwrdd gwydr lle y gallwn brynu cynnyrch a wnaethpwyd yng Nghymru ac y gall ymwelwyr brynu anrhegion. Gobeithiaf yr ystyrir y neges hon. Mae ganddynt siop lwyddiannus yn Senedd yr Alban a gallai hynny fod yn fodel i ni yng Nghymru.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Nick is right, we need to get our act together and make goods available for people to buy. We are progressing this speedily.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae Nick yn llygad ei le, mae angen inni gael trefn ar bethau a sicrhau bod nwyddau ar gael i bobl eu prynu. Yr ydym yn datblygu hyn yn gyflym.

Richard Edwards: My question is effectively the same as Nick Bourne's. I had the pleasure of visiting the Scottish Parliament three weeks ago where, as Nick says, there is a shop selling souvenirs, mementos, confectionery and so on. These are a means of marketing the Scottish Parliament and Scotland. In Wales, we will miss out if we do not have a shop that helps to market Wales, the Assembly and the democratic process itself. The sooner the shop is established, the better.

Richard Edwards: I bob pwrpas, yr un yw fy nghwestiwn i â chwestiwn Nick Bourne. Cefais y pleser o ymweld â Senedd yr Alban dair wythnos yn ôl lle, fel y dywed Nick, mae siop sydd yn gwerthu cofroddion, melysion ac ati. Mae'r rhain yn fodd o farchnata Senedd yr Alban a'r Alban ei hun. Yng Nghymru, byddwn ar ein colled oni fydd gennym siop i'n helpu i farchnata Cymru, y Cynulliad a'r broses ddemocrataidd ei hun. Gorau po gyntaf y sefydlir y siop.

9:55 a.m.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: All I can add to that, Richard, is that there was a feeling in some quarters some months ago that a shop would cost too much. The figures

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Y cyfan y gallaf ei ychwanegu at hynny, Richard, yw bod teimlad mewn rhai cylchoedd rai misoedd yn ôl y byddai siop yn costio gormod. Yr oedd y

were prohibitive. We have now progressed on that and we are considering a different option. If it does not make a profit, the will of the Assembly is that it is important that we have a provision, and we will ensure that it happens as early as possible.

Alun Pugh: Alcohol is widely available in this building. Although no Members of this Chamber are in the habit of drinking 14 pints at lunchtime, do you accept that alcohol and the workplace do not mix?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Anybody who is at work must be careful as to what he or she consumes and when he or she does so.

The Presiding Officer: On that sober note, Deputy Presiding Officer, thank you.

fffigurau yn afresymol. Yr ydym bellach wedi symud yn ein blaenau ar hynny ac ystyriwn opsiwn gwahanol. Os na wnaiff elw, ewylllys y Cynulliad yw ei bod yn bwysig bod gennym ddarpariaeth, a sicrhawn ei fod yn digwydd cyn gynted ag y bo modd.

Alun Pugh: Mae alcohol ar gael yn eang yn yr adeilad hwn. Er nad yw'n arfer gan unrhyw Aelodau o'r Siambr hon yfed 14 peint amser cinio, a dderbyniwch nad yw alcohol a'r gweithle yn cymysgu?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Rhaid i unrhyw un sydd yn y gwaith fod yn ofalus o ran yr hyn y bydd ef neu hi yn ei yfed a phryd y bydd ef neu hi yn gwneud hynny.

Y Llywydd: Ar y nodyn sobr hwnnw, Ddirprwy Lywydd, diolch.

Datganiad ar Corus Statement on Corus

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): I am sure that the Assembly will find it helpful to hear a response to the outcome of yesterday afternoon's discussions between Sir Brian Moffat and other senior managers at Corus with the Trade Unions Steel Co-ordinating Committee. I understand from the Unions and the company that the discussions were constructive and that they will continue at a local level. They will focus on the unions' concrete alternative proposals for saving the jobs under threat in Wales and England. The proposals will be developed and refined by people in the plants and the communities involved.

The unions have also said that they will rely on the support of the National Assembly, the Wales Office and the Department of Trade and Industry in developing the proposals. Corus has agreed that there should be tripartite discussions about retraining involving the appropriate public bodies.

As the focus of the discussions will be on saving jobs, the unions have asked the Assembly to hold back from finalising any proposals for support for the people who would be made redundant and for their communities. I have agreed to this request, as

Prif Weinidog Cymru (Rhodri Morgan): Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yn ddefnyddiol i'r Cynulliad glywed ymateb i ganlyniad y trafodaethau brynhawn ddoe rhwng Syr Brian Moffat ac uwch reolwyr eraill yn Corus gyda Phwyllgor Cydlynu'r Undebau Llafur Dur. Deallaf gan yr Undebau a'r cwmni i'r trafodaethau fod yn adeiladol ac y byddant yn parhau ar lefel leol. Byddant yn canolbwyntio ar gynigion amgen pendant yr undebau ar gyfer achub y swyddi sydd o dan fygythiad yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Caiff y cynigion eu datblygu a'u mireinio gan bobl yn y gweithfeydd a'r cymunedau perthnasol.

Dywedodd yr undebau hefyd y byddant yn dibynnu ar gefnogaeth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, Swyddfa Cymru a'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant i ddatblygu'r cynigion. Cytunodd Corus y dylid cynnal trafodaethau tair ochr ynghylch ailhyfforddiant gan gynnwys y cyrff cyhoeddus perthnasol.

Gan y bydd y trafodaethau'n canolbwyntio ar achub swyddi, gofynnodd yr undebau i'r Cynulliad oedi cyn cwblhau'n derfynol unrhyw gynigion i roi cymorth i'r bobl a gâi eu diswyddo ac i'w cymunedau. Cytunais ar y cais hwn, gan y gallai canlyniad y 30

clearly, the outcome of the 30 days of negotiations starting today could result in different numbers. In this context, I reinforce the statement made by the Deputy First Minister and Minister for Economic Development yesterday on the possible re-employment of redundant Corus workers by EXi.

While we welcome positive interest from major companies in the new economy sector utilising the skills and commitment of any worker who may eventually be displaced, now is not the time to talk about redundancy. The emphasis must be on maintaining steel capacity in the UK and saving jobs in the steel industry, especially in Wales in our case. EXi is not a telecommunications equipment manufacturer with a proposal for new plants in steel closure areas. It is a broadband and mobile telephony infrastructure company which needs mobile installation staff.

I welcome Corus's acknowledgement—even at this stage—of the need to work closely with the unions and Government, here and in Whitehall. I see this as an encouraging and real opportunity for Corus to demonstrate that there are alternative ways of running a modern, global and successful company other than by central command and control. While Corus has said that it will begin the statutory 90-day consultation period today, it has agreed to a 30-day period of grace for the local discussions.

I can assure you that all those most directly involved in the Cabinet will be working flat out with Corus, the unions and departments across Whitehall to minimise job losses and that the plant level negotiations on the way forward are given the best possible chance of success.

Phil Williams: Thank you for that statement. You will agree that whatever happens, the National Assembly will be judged on how we deal with the steel crisis, and I am sure that you know that every other major steel producing country in the world is increasing steel production. Only yesterday, Corus announced that it was leading a consortium to invest £2.8 billion in creating extra steel-

diwrnod o negodiadau sydd yn dechrau heddiw, yn amlwg, arwain at niferoedd gwahanol. Yn y cyd-destun hwn, ategaf y datganiad a wnaeth y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd ddoe am y posibilrwydd o EXi yn ailgyflogi'r gweithwyr yn Corus a ddiswyddwyd.

Er ein bod yn croesawu diddordeb adeiladol gan gwmnïau mawr yn y sector economi newydd gan ddefnyddio sgiliau ac ymrwymiad unrhyw weithiwr a allai gollu ei swydd yn y pen draw, nid dyma'r adeg i siarad am ddiswyddo. Rhaid i'r pwyslais fod ar gynnal cynhwysedd dur yn y DU ac achub swyddi yn y diwydiant dur, yn enwedig yng Nghymru yn ein hachos ni. Nid yw EXi yn weithgynhyrchydd cyfarpar telathrebu gyda chynnig am weithfeydd newydd yn yr ardaloedd lle y bydd gweithfeydd dur yn cau o bosibl. Mae'n gwmni isadeiledd band eang a theleffoneg symudol y mae angen staff gosod cyfarpar symudol arno.

Croesawaf y ffaith bod Corus wedi cydnabod—hyd yn oed mor hwyr â hyn—bod angen gweithio'n agos gyda'r undebau a'r Llywodraeth, yma ac yn Whitehall. Gwelaf hyn fel cyfle gwirioneddol a chalonogol i Corus ddangos bod ffyrdd amgen o redeg cwmni modern, byd-eang a llwyddiannus yn hytrach na thrwy reoli o'r canol. Er y dywedodd Corus y bydd yn dechrau'r cyfnod ymgynghorol statudol o 90 diwrnod heddiw, cytunodd ar gyfnod 30 diwrnod o ras ar gyfer y trafodaethau lleol.

Gallaf eich sicrhau y bydd pob un sydd yn ymwneud fwyaf uniongyrchol â'r Cabinet yn gweithio'n ddygn gyda Corus, yr undebau ac adrannau Whitehall er mwyn sicrhau mai'r nifer isaf posibl o swyddi a gollir ac y caiff y negodiadau yn y gweithfeydd ar y ffordd ymlaen y cyfle gorau posibl i lwyddo.

Phil Williams: Diolch am y datganiad hwnnw. Fe gytunwch, beth bynnag a fo'n digwydd, y caiff y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ei farnu ar sut yr ymdriniwn â'r argyfwng dur, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y gwyddoch bod pob gwlad arall o bwys yn y byd sydd yn cynhyrchu dur yn cynyddu eu cynnyrch dur. Dim ond ddoe, cyhoeddodd Corus ei fod yn arwain consortiwm i fuddsoddi £2.8 biliwn i greu

making capacity in Australia. On behalf of Plaid Cymru, I support your determination to maintain steel-making capacity as a strategic industry, especially in Wales where we have such efficient plants and a productive workforce.

I find one part of your statement difficult to understand. Of the options discussed with the trade unions yesterday, do they still have a determined and serious plan to acquire ownership of Corus plants threatened with closure? If so, do those plans include all the threatened Corus plants in Wales? Bearing in mind the £250 million that the Government has made available to preserve 7,000 jobs in Rolls Royce, will the Government provide similar support as additional funds to any plan by trade unions and management to purchase Corus plants? In proportion, that would be about £175 million. In that context, do you agree that if the worst happens—and we must always bear that in mind—and the negotiations fail to save the 5,000 jobs, the total sum required for site redevelopment, extra infrastructure in transport communication, loss of business rates, retraining and so on, would also be about £175 million?

Finally, and we need a clear answer to this question, in your negotiations with the UK Government, will you ask whether it would be prepared to deploy a sum of money—about £175 million—to support any serious deal to bring Corus into popular ownership through management and trade unions? Would it be prepared to give the necessary legislative and European support? Would it be prepared to take action on the level of the pound that would guarantee the success of such an enterprise?

The First Minister: There is some complex weaving and knitting within all those questions, Phil. I will try to disentangle them as best I can. The proposal to acquire the Llanwern plant in its entirety by the trade unions, with backing from merchant banks and other people in the steel industry, is on hold for the moment for the obvious reason that Corus is not willing to sell the whole of Llanwern. That is partially because it is

cynhwysedd dur ychwanegol yn Awstralia. Ar ran Plaid Cymru, cefnogaf y ffaith eich bod yn benderfynol o gynnal cynhwysedd gwneud dur fel diwydiant strategol, yn enwedig yng Nghymru, lle y mae gennym weithfeydd mor effeithlon a gweithlu mor gynhyrchiol.

Mae un rhan o'ch datganiad yn anodd imi ei ddeall. O blith yr opsiynau a drafodwyd gyda'r undebau llafur ddoe, a oes ganddynt gynllun pendant, gwirioneddol o hyd i brynu gweithfeydd Corus a gaiff eu cau o bosibl? Os felly, a yw'r cynlluniau hyn yn cynnwys pob safle Corus sydd o dan fygythiad yng Nghymru? O gofio'r £250 miliwn a roes y Llywodraeth i gadw 7,000 o swyddi yn Rolls Royce, a fydd y Llywodraeth yn rhoi cefnogaeth debyg fel arian ychwanegol i unrhyw gynllun i brynu gweithfeydd Corus gan yr undebau llafur a'r rheolwyr? Byddai hynny tua £175 miliwn o ran cyfartaledd. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, a gytunwch, os digwydd y gwaethaf—a rhaid inni bob amser gadw hynny mewn cof—ac mae'r negodiadau'n methu ag achub y 5,000 o swyddi, y byddai angen cyfanswm o tua £175 miliwn ar gyfer ailddatblygu safleoedd, yr isadeiledd ychwanegol ar gyfer cysylltiadau trafniadaeth, ardrethi busnes a gollir, ailhyfforddiant ac ati hefyd?

I gloi, ac mae angen inni gael ateb clir i'r cwestiwn hwn, yn eich negodiadau gyda Llywodraeth y DU, a ofynnwch a fyddai'n barod i roi swm o arian—tua £175 miliwn—i gefnogi unrhyw fargen wirioneddol i ddod â Corus i mewn i berchenogaeth gyhoeddus gan y rheolwyr a'r undebau llafur? A fyddai'n barod i roi'r gefnogaeth ddeddfwriaethol ac Ewropeaidd angenrheidiol? A fyddai'n barod i weithredu ar lefel y bunt a fyddai'n sicrhau llwyddiant menter o'r fath?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae cryn gydbblethu a chydweu yn yr holl gwestiynau hynny, Phil. Ceisiaf eu datod cystal ag y gallaf. Mae cynnig yr undebau llafur i brynu gwaith Llanwern yn ei gyfanrwydd, gyda chymorth y banciau masnachol a phobl eraill yn y diwydiant dur, wedi ei ohirio am y tro am y rheswm amlwg nad yw Corus yn fodlon gwerthu gwaith Llanwern yn ei gyfanrwydd. Mae hynny yn rhannol am ei fod yn cadw'r

keeping the finishing mills there. Even if it were not, it would not want to encourage competition by having another steel producer. If it was proposing, as we thought it was until about mid January, to close the whole of Llanwern, we could have tried to support that proposition by any means possible, through competition laws and so on, to force Corus to at least disgorge the plant if it was otherwise going to close it down. The problem is that it is only going to close down the heavy end, which therefore renders that proposal extremely difficult to progress. That is why it is off the table. It is not because of a shortage of money or public assistance from the Department of Trade and Industry or from us. The plant is not for sale because only half of it is closing down. If it was for sale, the Iron and Steel Trades Confederation reckons that it has the resources in place to purchase it with assistance from the banks.

You hypothesise about comparability numbers, Phil, regarding launch aid for the Rolls Royce engine. Launch aid for a new project, such as the Trent 900 engine, is comparable to the launch aid that was provided for the airbus wings, which will fortunately be built in Wales. If you wish to make comparisons between Wales and England or if there is a suspicion lurking at the back of your mind that somehow these sums of money are only being made available in England and not in Wales, that is an absurd proposition. The launch aid for the other part of that aerospace package—the engines in the east Midlands, the wings designed in Bristol and manufactured in Broughton, in Wales—is part of that same launch aid package. It comes under the same heading of the DTI's ability to provide launch aid for facilities in aerospace for new engine or aeroplane models. There would then be a levy on the sale of those engines or aeroplanes to get the money back. Luckily, we will benefit hugely from that same launch aid package, so comparability with the steel industry is irrelevant. The high pound is one factor that is putting pressure on Corus. It is not the only factor. Sir Brian Moffat repeated to the Trade and Industry Commons Select Committee yesterday that there was excess capacity in strip mills. He was still—and this must be

melinau terfynu yno. Hyd yn oed pe na bai'n gwneud hynny, ni fyddai am annog cystadleuaeth drwy gael cynhyrchydd dur arall. Pe bai'n bwriadu cau Llanwern yn gyfan gwbl, fel y credasom tan tua chanol Ionawr, gallem fod wedi ceisio cefnogi'r cynnig hwnnw drwy unrhyw fodd posibl, drwy'r gyfraith ar gystadleuaeth ac ati, er mwyn gorfodi Corus o leiaf i ildio'r gwaith os oedd yn bwriadu ei gau fel arall. Y broblem yw mai dim ond yr ochr drwm y mae'n bwriadu ei chau, a olyga felly ei bod yn anodd iawn datblygu'r cynnig hwnnw. Dyna pam nad yw o dan drafodaeth bellach, ac nid oherwydd prinder arian neu gymorth cyhoeddus gan yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant na ninnau. Nid yw'r gwaith ar werth oherwydd dim ond hanner ohono sydd yn cau. Pe bai ar werth, cred Cydffederasiwn y Crefftiau Haearn a Dur fod ganddo adnoddau i'w brynu gyda chymorth y banciau.

Damcaniaethwch, Phil, ynglŷn â rhifau cymharol, o ran cymorth lansio ar gyfer y peiriant Rolls Royce. Gellir cymharu'r cymorth lansio ar gyfer prosiect newydd, fel y peiriant Trent 900, â'r cymorth lansio a roddwyd ar gyfer adenydd y bws awyr, a gaiff eu hadeiladu, yn ffodus, yng Nghymru. Os ydych am gymharu Cymru a Lloegr, neu os oes unrhyw amheuaeth gennych fod y symiau hyn, rhywsut neu'i gilydd, ddim ond yn cael eu darparu yn Lloegr ac nid yng Nghymru, mae hynny'n wirion. Mae'r cymorth lansio ar gyfer rhan arall y pecyn aerofod hwnnw—y peiriannau yn nwyrain Canolbarth Lloegr, yr adenydd a gynllunnir ym Mryste ac a weithgynhyrchir ym Mrychdyn, yng Nghymru—yn rhan o'r un pecyn cymorth lansio hwnnw. Daw o dan yr un pennawd o allu'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant i roi cymorth lansio i weithfeydd aerofod ar gyfer peiriannau neu fodolau newydd o awyrennau. Yna câi ardoll ei chodi ar werthu'r peiriannau neu'r awyrennau hynny er mwyn adennill yr arian. Yn ffodus, byddwn yn elwa'n fawr o'r un pecyn cymorth lansio hwnnw, felly mae'n amherthnasol tynnu cymhariaeth â'r diwydiant dur. Mae'r bunt uchel yn un ffactor a rydd Corus o dan bwysau. Nid dyna'r unig ffactor. Dywedodd Syr Brian Moffat unwaith eto ym Mhwyllgor Dethol Masnach a

repeated for us all to understand—downbeat about any chances of saving the steel making end at Llanwern, or the tinplate and galvanising lines at Ebbw Vale.

10:05 a.m.

Peter Law: I thank you for concentrating on saving jobs, which is vitally important at the moment. Given that the local workforces will consider their plans for the plants' future, and the perceptions in constituencies such as mine, where they recently saw £250 million poured into Rolls Royce, and funding given in the past to Nissan, Toyota, and so on—which I welcome for those communities—would you be prepared to make financial resources available to plants such as Ebbw Vale—the only life-blood of that community—to enter into partnership arrangements with Corus, if it were prepared to give an assurance that those jobs would remain for a reasonable amount of time?

The First Minister: You mentioned Nissan, which was persuaded to continue to invest in the next Micra model in Sunderland because of £40 million of regional selective assistance, an undertaking not to exclude a referendum on the euro during the next parliament, and the undertaking given by local management and the trades unions for a 30 per cent across-the-board increase in productivity at the plant. The only difference between that and the steel industry is that you cannot give RSA in the steel industry because it is banned in the EC. Therefore that is off limits.

If anybody else wanted to set up a plant at Ebbw Vale, they would be at risk of serious injury because of the speed at which we would approach them to offer RSA. That was true before any proposals to close the steelworks, because the problems arising from job losses 25 years ago have still not been solved in your constituency. You have mentioned that, Peter, on many occasions. This is an additional problem for Ebbw Vale on top of the problems that we have not solved over the past quarter century. However, I give you an absolute assurance

Diwydiant Ty'r Cyffredin fod gormod o gynhwysedd yn y melinau stribed. Yr oedd yn besimistaidd o hyd—a rhaid ailadrodd hynny inni oll ddeall—ynghylch unrhyw bosibilrwydd o achub yr ochr gwneud dur yn Llanwern, neu'r gwaith tunplat a galfanu yng Nglynebwy.

Peter Law: Diolch ichi am ganolbwyntio ar achub swyddi, sydd yn holl bwysig ar hyn o bryd. O gofio y bydd y gweithluoedd lleol yn ystyried eu cynlluniau ar gyfer dyfodol y gweithfeydd, a'r amgyffrediad mewn etholaethau fel fy etholaeth i, lle y gwelsant £250 miliwn o bunnoedd yn cael ei wario yn ddiweddar ar Rolls Royce, ac arian yn cael ei roi yn y gorffennol i Nissan, Toyota, ac ati—a groesawaf ar gyfer y cymunedau hynny—a fydddech yn barod i sicrhau bod adnoddau ariannol ar gael i weithfeydd fel Glynebwy—sef unig anadl einioes y gymuned honno—i lunio trefniadau partneriaeth gyda Corus, pe bai'n barod i roi sicrwydd y byddai'r swyddi hynny'n parhau am gyfnod gweddol hir?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Cyfeiriasoch at Nissan, a ddarbwyllwyd i barhau i fuddsoddi yn y model Micra nesaf yn Sunderland oherwydd cymorth rhanbarthol dethol o £40 miliwn, ymgymeriad i beidio â gwrthod caniatáu refferendwm ar yr ewro yn ystod y tymor seneddol nesaf, ac ymgymeriad gan reolwyr lleol a'r undebau llafur i sicrhau cynnydd cyffredinol o 30 y cant mewn cynhyrchiant yn y gwaith. Yr unig wahaniaeth rhwng hynny a'r diwydiant dur yw na ellir rhoi cymorth rhanbarthol dethol i'r diwydiant dur am na chaniateir hynny yn y GE. Felly, nid oes modd gwneud hynny.

Pe dymunai unrhyw un arall agor gwaith yng Nglynebwy, byddent mewn perygl o gael eu hanafu'n ddifrifol oherwydd y cyflymder y byddem yn brysio atynt i gynnig cymorth rhanbarthol dethol. Yr oedd hynny'n wir cyn unrhyw gynigion i gau'r gwaith dur, am na ddatryswyd y problemau yn eich etholaeth yn sgîl colli swyddi yno 25 mlynedd yn ôl. Cyfeiriasoch at hynny droeon, Peter. Mae hon yn broblem ychwanegol i Lynebwy yn ychwanegol i'r problemau nas datryswyd gennym yn ystod y chwarter canrif diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, rhoddaf sicrwydd llwyr ichi y

that Ebbw Vale and the Blaenau Gwent area is in the forefront of our minds in terms of finding the right companies to go there with the help of the RSA budget, which is not restricted by any need for prior approval. We definitely have the money and we will put that money into any project that would create jobs in Ebbw Vale. It has Objective 1 status and has a higher priority than Sunderland. I assure you that officials will trawl the world for projects to go to Ebbw Vale.

The problem with the steel industry and the tinplate industry is that you cannot offer RSA for projects in steel.

Alun Cairns: I am grateful to the First Minister for making his statement and I welcome the fact that Corus has, at last, shown a commitment to discuss these issues with the Assembly, the unions, the Department of Trade and Industry, and other Westminster departments.

My main concerns relate to the three false hopes raised among the possible redundant Corus employees. Firstly, the points made by the nationalists in terms of renationalising the steel industry, which is a false hope and a pipe dream. Will you confirm that no such plans are being explored, and that that would not be the right decision for industry in Wales? Secondly, the plans for purchase of some of the sites, or saving jobs, by the unions. Although we hope that that can be explored, we need to manage these expectations, and not make excessive promises about what might be delivered in the long run. My third concern relates to the false hopes surrounding EXi; some rumours flew yesterday—wholly inappropriate stories—that would link redundant employees directly with EXi in terms of transferable skills. Will you join me in condemning the DTI, which has been party to supporting those stories, and has sought to make political capital from the difficult situations in which these people find themselves? In your negotiations with the DTI and the Treasury, are you seeking additional funds over and above the Barnett formula to help redevelop the communities that will be devastated, if the worst comes to

caiff ardal Glynebwy a Blaenau Gwent bob ystyriaeth gennym o ran dod o hyd i'r cwmnïau priodol i fynd yno gyda chymorth cyllideb CRhD, na chyfyngir arno gan unrhyw angen am ganiatâd ymlaen llaw. Mae'r arian gennym yn sicr, a byddwn yn rhoi'r arian hwnnw i unrhyw brosiect a fyddai'n creu swyddi yng Nglynebwy. Mae iddi statws Amcan 1 a blaenoriaeth uwch na Sunderland. Fe'ch sicrhaf y bydd swyddogion yn chwilio ym mhedwar ban y byd am brosiectau ar gyfer Glynebwy.

Y broblem o ran y diwydiant dur a'r diwydiant tunplat yw na ellir cynnig cymorth rhanbarthol dethol ar gyfer prosiectau ym maes dur.

Alun Cairns: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Prif Weinidog am wneud ei ddatganiad a chroesawaf y ffaith bod Corus, o'r diwedd, wedi ymrwymo i drafod y materion hyn gyda'r Cynulliad, yr undebau, yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant, ac adrannau eraill San Steffan.

Mae fy mhrif bryderon yn ymwneud â'r tri gobaith ofer a godwyd ymhlith cyflogeion Corus a gaiff eu diswyddo o bosibl. Yn gyntaf, y pwyntiau a wnaeth y cenedlaetholwyr ynghylch ailwladoli'r diwydiant dur, sydd yn obaith ofer ac yn freuddwyd gwrrach. A gadarnhewch nad ymchwilir i unrhyw gynlluniau o'r fath, ac na fyddai'n benderfyniad cywir i'r diwydiant yng Nghymru? Yn ail, cynlluniau'r undebau i brynu rhai o'r safleoedd, neu achub swyddi. Er y gobeithiwn y gellir ymchwilio i hynny, mae angen inni reoli'r disgwyliadau hyn, a pheidio â gwneud addewidion eithafol ynghylch yr hyn y gellid ei gyflawni yn y pen draw. Mae fy nhrydydd pryder yn ymwneud â'r gobeithion ofer am EXi; bu rhai sion ddoe—straeon hollol amhriodol—a gysylltai'r cyflogeion a ddiswyddwyd yn uniongyrchol ag EXi o ran sgiliau y gellir eu trosglwyddo. A ymunwch â mi i gondemnio'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant, a fu'n ategu'r straeon hyn ac yn ceisio cael mantais wleidyddol drwy'r sefyllfaoedd anodd y mae'r bobl hynny ynddynt? Yn eich negodiadau gyda'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant a'r Trysorlys, a ydych yn ceisio cael arian yn ychwanegol at fformwla Barnett i helpu i ailddatblygu'r cymunedau a gaiff eu

the worst, and the recent announcements are followed through to the end?

The First Minister: It must be my birthday today, as I find myself in the unusual position of agreeing with 95 per cent of Alun Cairns's comments on false hopes and the management of expectations. It is important that we do not raise false hopes that we cannot follow through. Alun is right to refer to nationalisation as a false hope. There is no prospect of it, and I am unclear whether it is official Plaid Cymru policy or just some freelancing by Dafydd Wigley. I am not sure what Plaid Cymru's official line is on this. I heard Dafydd's suggestion, but I do not think that it is a realistic possibility.

Alun and I may differ in our opinions of the workers and management buy-out at Llanwern. It is not an option at the moment. The whole plant is not being closed down and is therefore not for sale. It is only the heavy end that will be closed down, and that cannot be bought if the finishing mills are not for sale.

I cannot hide from the Assembly the fact that the trade unions involved differ in their views on EXi. The Amalgamated Engineering and Electrical Union represents craftspeople in the steel industry and elsewhere, who will always find their post-redundancy job search experience easier than those without craft skills. The AEEU will be quicker to look for other employers to assemble retraining packs with it and then move the workers to other industries in the new economy. Finding new employment will be easier for people with craft skills than for those whose skills are related to seniority in the industry—that is, steel makers or tin plate makers, who are represented by the Iron and Steel Trades Confederation or the Transport and General Workers' Union. The divide in interests between craftspeople and those whose skills are specific to the steel and tinplate industry will always be a problem. It will be much more difficult for those with specific skills to find new employment.

dinistrio, os digwydd y gwaethaf, ac y gweithredir y cyhoeddiadau diweddar yn llawn?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Rhaid mai fy mhenblwydd ydyw heddiw, gan fy mod yn y sefyllfa anghyffredin o gytuno â 95 y cant o sylwadau Alun Cairns am obeithion ofer a rheoli disgwyliadau. Mae'n bwysig na chodwn obeithion ofer na allwn eu gwireddu. Mae Alun yn llygad ei le i gyfeirio at genedlaetholdeb fel gobaith ofer. Nid oes unrhyw obaith iddo, ac nid wyf yn siŵr ai polisi swyddogol Plaid Cymru ynteu Dafydd Wigley yn gweithio ar ei liwt ei hun ydyw. Nid wyf yn siŵr beth yw ymateb swyddogol Plaid Cymru ar hyn. Clywais awgrym Dafydd, ond ni chredaf ei bod yn bosibilrwydd mewn gwirionedd.

Efallai nad yw Alun a minnau'n cyd-fynd ynglŷn â'r syniad o weithwyr a rheolwyr yn prynu Llanwern. Nid yw'n opsiwn ar hyn o bryd. Ni chaeir y gwaith cyfan ac felly nid yw ar werth. Dim ond yr ochr drwm a gaeir, ac ni ellir prynu honno os na fydd y melinau terfynu ar werth.

Ni allaf gelu'r ffaith o'r Cynulliad fod gwahaniaeth barn ymhlith yr undebau llafur perthnasol am EXi. Cynrychiola Undeb Arunedig y Peirianwyr a'r Trydanwyr grefftwyr yn y diwydiant dur a diwydiannau eraill, a fydd bob amser yn ei chael yn haws i chwilio am swydd ar ôl cael eu diswyddo na'r rhai heb grefft. Bydd yr Undeb hwn yn gynt i chwilio am gyflogwyr eraill er mwyn llunio pecynnau ailhyfforddiant gydag ef ac yna symud y gweithwyr i ddiwydiannau eraill yn yr economi newydd. Bydd yn haws i'r bobl â chreffft ddod o hyd i gyflogaeth newydd na'r rhai y mae eu sgiliau yn ymwneud ag uwch swyddi'r diwydiant—hynny yw, gweithwyr dur neu weithwyr tunplat, a gynrychiolir gan Gydffederasiwn y Crefftau Haearn a Dur neu Undeb y Gweithwyr Trafnidiaeth a Chyffredinol. Bydd y rhaniad rhwng buddiannau crefftwyr a'r rhai â sgiliau sydd yn ymwneud yn benodol â'r diwydiant dur a thunplat bob amser yn broblem. Bydd yn llawer anos i'r rhai â sgiliau penodol ddod o hyd i gyflogaeth newydd.

I will not join Alun Cairns in condemning the Department of Trade and Industry because, as I said yesterday, a balance must be kept. Any jobs are welcome. However, if jobs are offered, it may only be for a few hundred steelworkers and the jobs may not be reserved for those in the steel making industry. The initial presentation of the EXi project, as I heard it at 6 a.m. on the BBC, was that it could result in factories for manufacturing telecommunications equipment being built in Ebbw Vale or Llanwern. In reality, it is nothing of the kind. EXi is offering mobile work installing mobile telephone masts and work in other areas of internet and broadband infrastructure. Although it is not what we are looking for, some people will benefit from it and I commend those who have arranged it. It will benefit, perhaps, a couple of hundred young steelworkers, who have no family commitments and are willing to travel around the country installing mobile telephone masts. However, this is not the answer to the steel industry's prayers.

Tom Middlehurst: I welcome the fact that Corus is encouraging discussions at plant level. The trade unions at Shotton will work on the fact that they can now engage with their plant director, as not being able to do so over the last few weeks has frustrated them. It is important that we continue to give our full support to the trade unions. Will the Minister assure me that he will give the full weight of his office to the efforts being made in steel plants in Wales, through the trade unions' discussions with Corus, to try to mitigate the worst effects of the proposals? Clearly, there will be different solutions in different plants. I recognise the devastation that will be wreaked upon Ebbw Vale as a result of the complete closure of its steel works. However, Shotton will lose 300 or more jobs, which is no less painful for those individuals than for others elsewhere.

I take issue with Alun Cairns's comments on EXi. It is important that the Assembly tries to raise realistic hopes. That is what we are here to do and we should do it by whatever means available. We must engage with the trade

Nid ymunaf ag Alun Cairns i gondemnio'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant am fod yn rhaid, fel y dywedais ddoe, cadw cydbwysedd. Croesewir unrhyw swydd. Fodd bynnag, os cynigir swyddi, efallai mai dim ond i ychydig gannoedd o weithwyr dur fydd y cynnig ac mae'n bosibl na chaiff y swyddi eu cadw ar gyfer y rhai yn y diwydiant dur. Yn ôl y cyflwyniad cyntaf o brosiect EXi, fel y clywais am 6 a.m. ar y BBC, gallai arwain at ffatrïoedd gweithgynhyrchu cyfarpar telathrebu yn cael eu hadeiladu yng Nglynebwy neu Lanwern. Nid yw hynny'n wir o gwbl. Mae EXi yn cynnig gwaith symudol yn gosod mastiau ffonau symudol a gwaith mewn meysydd eraill o'r rhyngwyd a'r adeiledd band eang. Er nad hynny sydd gennym mewn golwg, bydd rhai pobl yn elwa ohono a chymeradwyaf y bobl hynny sydd wedi ei drefnu. Bydd ychydig gannoedd o weithwyr dur ifanc, nad oes ganddynt gyfrifoldebau teuluol o bosibl ac sydd yn fodlon teithio o amgylch y wlad yn gosod mastiau ffonau symudol yn elwa. Fodd bynnag, nid dyna'r ateb i weddïau'r diwydiant dur.

Tom Middlehurst: Croesawaf y ffaith bod Corus yn annog trafodaethau yn y gweithfeydd. Bydd yr undebau llafur yn Shotton yn gweithio ar y ffaith y gallant erbyn hyn gysylltu â chyfarwyddwr y gwaith yno, wedi'r rhwystredigaeth a deimlent am na allent wneud hynny yn ystod yr ychydig wythnosau diwethaf. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn parhau i roi pob cefnogaeth i'r undebau llafur. A wnaiff y Gweinidog fy sicrhau y bydd, yn rhinwedd ei swydd, yn cefnogi i'r carn yr ymdrechion a wneir yng ngweithfeydd dur Cymru, drwy drafodaethau'r undebau llafur gyda Corus er mwyn ceisio lleddfu effeithiau gwaethaf y cynigion hyn? Yn amlwg, bydd gwahanol atebion i wahanol weithfeydd. Cydnabyddaf y dinistr a fydd yng Nglynebwy o ganlyniad i gau'r gwaith dur yn gyfan gwbl. Fodd bynnag, bydd Shotton yn colli 300 o swyddi neu fwy, sydd yr un mor boenus i'r unigolion hynny ag eraill mewn manau eraill.

Anghytunaf â sylwadau Alun Cairns ar EXi. Mae'n bwysig bod y Cynulliad yn ceisio codi gobeithion realistig. Dyna pam ein bod ni yma a dylem wneud hynny drwy ba ffordd bynnag sydd ar gael. Rhaid inni gysylltu â'r

unions. I commend the AEEU on its efforts to provide a lifeline. That must be seen as one strand in a series of measures that we should take, working with the trade unions. I welcome the fact that you will have an early opportunity to discuss Shotton with trade union leaders and I look forward to your visit tomorrow.

The First Minister: I am also looking forward to meeting trade union officials at Shotton tomorrow. I hope to finalise my round of visits to all the affected Welsh steel plants by visiting Bryngwyn next week. During my visit tomorrow, I can test to what degree the people who have been directly affected have been blocked from having sensible plant level discussions over the past few weeks. We can also test, now that those discussions have been given the green light, what those people consider to be realistic prospects for reducing costs or in other ways going for new products. Those ideas must be given our support and I will ensure that the Assembly supports them.

10:15 a.m.

Helen Mary Jones: On behalf of my constituents who work at the Trostre plant, I welcome Corus's decision to re-consider. The workforce at Trostre was not immediately affected, but that was little consolation to us. There was an enormous sense of solidarity with colleagues across Wales who were and still are under serious threat. Will the First Minister ensure in his discussions with Corus that any good news for other plants across Wales does not turn out to be bad news for Trostre, and that the workers in my constituency are not badly affected by what may be good news for others? I am sure that that is not the intention but there is that concern.

Will the First Minister and his colleagues moderate their language in the way that they talk about Corus? There was much concern in the Llanelli area about references to the company as 'butchers' and as 'the enemy'. Much of the company's behaviour was

undebau llafur. Cymeradwyaf Undeb Arunedig y Peirianwyr a'r Trydanwyr am ei ymdrechion i roi rhyw fath o gymorth. Rhaid ystyried hynny fel rhan o gyfres o fesurau y dylem eu cymryd, gan weithio gyda'r undebau llafur. Croesawaf y ffaith y cewch gyfle cynnar i drafod Shotton gydag arweinwyr yr undebau llafur ac edrychaf ymlaen i'ch ymweliad yfory.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Edrychaf ymlaen hefyd at gwrdd â swyddogion yr undebau llafur yn Shotton yfory. Gobeithiaf gwblhau fy nghyfres o ymweliadau â phob gwaith dur yr effeithir arno yng Nghymru drwy ymweld â Bryngwyn yr wythnos nesaf. Yn ystod fy ymweliad yfory, gallaf brofi i ba raddau y rhwystrwyd y bobl yr effeithir arnynt yn uniongyrchol rhag cael trafodaethau synhwyrol yn y gwaith yn ystod yr ychydig wythnosau diwethaf. Gallwn brofi hefyd, gan fod y trafodaethau hynny wedi eu caniatáu erbyn hyn, yr hyn sydd, ym marn y bobl hynny, yn rhagolygon realistig ar gyfer lleihau costau neu fel arall yn datblygu cynhyrchion newydd. Rhaid inni gefnogi'r syniadau hynny a sicrhaf y bydd y Cynulliad yn eu cefnogi.

Helen Mary Jones: Ar ran fy etholwyr sydd yn gweithio yng ngwaith Trostre, croesawaf benderfyniad Corus i ailystyried. Nid effeithiwyd ar weithlu Trostre yn uniongyrchol, ond ni fu hynny fawr o gysur inni. Bu cryn deimlad o gydgefnogaeth i gydweithwyr ar draws Cymru a oedd ac sydd yn parhau i fod o dan fygythiad difrifol. A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru sicrhau yn ei drafodaethau gyda Corus na fydd unrhyw newyddion da i'r gweithfeydd eraill ar draws Cymru yn troi'n newyddion drwg i Drostre, ac na fydd effaith niweidiol ar y gweithwyr yn fy etholaeth oherwydd yr hyn a allai fod yn newyddion da i eraill? Yr wyf yn siŵr nad hynny yw'r bwriad ond teimlir y pryder hwnnw.

A fydd y Prif Weinidog a'i gyd-Aelodau yn defnyddio iaith fwy cymedrol pan fônt yn siarad am Corus? Bu cryn bryder yn ardal Llanelli ynglŷn â'r cyfeiriadau at y cwmni fel 'bwtseriaid' ac fel 'y gelyn'. Yr oedd sawl agwedd ar ymddygiad y cwmni yn

unacceptable but it remains a company with which we need to do business, and some of the tone of the discussion was deeply unhelpful. I had that feedback so I urge the First Minister to dissociate himself from that language. It was no surprise to see—

The Presiding Officer: Order. This is not a speech. Plaid Cymru's lead spokesperson on economic development has asked many questions.

Helen Mary Jones: I have one more question.

The Presiding Officer: Ask one further question only.

Helen Mary Jones: Will the First Minister clarify his Government's position and that of the Westminster Government regarding support for a management or workers buyout that might help the situation? Will there be Government support for that or is New Labour supporting Alun Cairns?

The First Minister: I will deal first with the feedback that we have had from Trostre and Port Talbot, wanting to see more moderate language used. The first reaction to Corus's announcement was outright anger, which I am sure its top management expected. I do not recall using language such as you described, but politicians do use words such as 'butchers' and 'assassins'. I have also had feedback that such language is unhelpful. However, in the natural reaction of communities, whether it is individual members of the workforce or trade unions or politicians who represent steel-making communities, the top management at Corus must expect anger at the announcement, at the way in which the announcement was made and the way that Corus contrasted itself with the behaviour of other major multinationals. For example, BP, in dealing with the Baglan rundown over the past three years, and Ford in the way it dealt with the rundown in America and the investment in Bridgend, consulted with unions and the local community in a way that Corus did not. I appreciate the feelings of those who represent steel-making communities and the trade unions who represent steel-making or tinplate

annerbyniol ond erys yn gwmni y mae angen inni wneud busnes ag ef, ac ni fu naws peth o'r drafodaeth o unrhyw fudd o gwbl. Cefais yr adborth hwnnw felly anogaf y Prif Weinidog i ddatgysylltu ei hun oddi wrth y fath iaith. Ni fu'n syndod imi—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid araith yw hon. Gofynnodd prif lefarydd Plaid Cymru ar ddatblygu economaidd nifer o gwestiynau.

Helen Mary Jones: Mae un cwestiwn arall gennyf i'w ofyn.

Y Llywydd: Gofynnwch un cwestiwn arall yn unig.

Helen Mary Jones: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog egluro safbwynt ei Lywodraeth a Llywodraeth San Steffan ynglŷn â chefnogaeth ar gyfer cynnig i reolwyr a gweithwyr brynu'r gweithfeydd a allai helpu'r sefyllfa? A fydd y Llywodraeth yn cefnogi hynny neu a yw Llafur Newydd yn cefnogi Alun Cairns?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ymdriniaf yn gyntaf â'r adborth a gawsom gan Drostre a Phort Talbot, sydd yn gofyn am iaith fwy cymedrol. Yr ymateb cyntaf i gyhoeddiad Corus oedd dicter llwyr, a ddisgwylwyd gan ei uwch reolwyr, mae'n siŵr. Ni chofiaf ddefnyddio'r fath iaith fel y nodwyd gennych, ond mae gwleidyddion yn defnyddio geiriau fel 'bwtseriaid' a 'llofruddwyr'. Cefais innau adborth nad yw iaith o'r fath fawr o help. Fodd bynnag, o ran ymateb naturiol y cymunedau, boed yn aelodau unigol o'r gweithlu neu'n undebau llafur neu'n wleidyddion a gynrychiola cymunedau dur, rhaid i uwch reolwyr Corus ddisgwyl dicter wrth y cyhoeddiad, yn y ffordd y gwnaethpwyd y cyhoeddiad a'r ffordd y bu ymddygiad Corus yn gwrthgyferbynnu ag ymddygiad cwmnïau amlwladol mawr eraill. Er enghraifft, bu BP, wrth ymdrin â diswyddiadau ym Maglan yn ystod y tair blynedd diwethaf, a Ford yn y ffordd yr ymdrinwyd â diswyddiadau yn America a'r buddsoddiad ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, yn ymgynghori â'r undebau a'r gymuned leol mewn ffordd na wnaeth Corus. Gwerthfawrogaf deimladau'r rhai a gynrychiola cymunedau dur a'r undebau

plants, which will continue and which are relatively unaffected. We must be aware of feelings in Port Talbot and Trostre, as the two least affected plants in Wales, as much as those that are losing jobs, but the reactions will be different. We must ensure that Corus does not divide communities where steel making and tinplate making is continuing from those where it will be rundown or lost altogether.

As regards a workers or workers and management buy-out of the Tower Colliery-type, this is off the agenda at the moment. There is no such proposal. The Iron and Steel Trades Confederation is not in a position to be able to pursue that proposal now so the question of support does not arise. If and when that proposal becomes viable again because a plant is for sale and there is a workers and management buy-out, I am sure we would want to support it. Whether we can support it financially will depend on the application of the code on state aids, which bans public money being put into the steel industry except for environmental improvements and research and development. That is the problem, but we would give it support in every other practical way possible, short of breaching the state aids code.

Peter Black: I welcome the statement because although the situation is still grim, at least talks are ongoing and Corus seems to be prepared to listen to the unions and Assembly representatives, in trying to salvage something from this situation. What practical support and advice is the Assembly giving to the trade unions through these talks, and for their bid to try to salvage jobs?

The First Minister: Both sides were surprised by the constructive atmosphere that pervaded yesterday's meeting. I guess that, had it not been for the 14-day moratorium, it would not have been possible, because the anger, as I mentioned in my answer to Helen Mary Jones's question, would have been too great for there to have been a sensible atmosphere around the negotiating table. I was pleased with that. Although the 90-day

llafur a gynrychiola weithfeydd dur neu dunplat, a fydd yn parhau ac nad effeithir arnynt ryw lawer. Rhaid inni fod yn ymwybodol o'r teimladau ym Mhort Talbot a Throstre, fel y ddau waith yr effeithiwyd arnynt leiaf yng Nghymru, gymaint â'r rhai sydd yn colli swyddi, ond bydd yr ymatebion yn wahanol. Rhaid inni sicrhau nad yw Corus yn rhannu cymunedau lle y mae gweithgynhyrchu dur a thunplat yn parhau a'r rhai lle y bydd diswyddiadau neu gau yn gyfan gwbl.

O ran y syniad o weithwyr neu weithwyr a rheolwyr yn prynu gweithfeydd ar lun Glofa'r Twr, nid yw hynny ar yr agenda ar hyn o bryd. Nid oes cynnig o'r fath mewn bod. Nid yw Cydffederasiwn y Crefftiau Haearn a Dur mewn sefyllfa i allu mynd ar drywydd y cynnig hwnnw yn awr felly ni chyfyd y mater o gefnogaeth. Os a phryd y bydd y cynnig yn ymarferol eto am fod gwaith ar werth a bod gweithwyr a rheolwyr am ei brynu, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddem am ei gefnogi. Bydd ein gallu i'w cefnogi'n ariannol yn dibynnu ar sut y cymhwysir y cod ar gymhorthion gwladol, sydd yn gwahardd rhoi arian cyhoeddus i'r diwydiant dur heblaw am welliannau amgylcheddol a gwaith ymchwil a datblygu. Dyna'r broblem, ond byddem yn rhoi pob cymorth ym mhob ffordd ymarferol bosibl, ond am dorri'r cod ar gymhorthion gwladol.

Peter Black: Croesawaf y datganiad. Er bod y sefyllfa yn adfydus o hyd, o leiaf mae'r trafodaethau yn mynd eu blaen ac ymddengys fod Corus yn barod i wrando ar yr undebau a chynrychiolwyr y Cynulliad er mwyn ceisio arbed rhywbeth o'r sefyllfa hon. Pa gymorth ymarferol a chynghor y mae'r Cynulliad yn ei roi i'r undebau llafur drwy'r trafodaethau hyn, ac ar gyfer eu hymgais i geisio achub swyddi?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Synnodd y ddwy ochr wrth yr awyrgylch adeiladol yn y cyfarfod ddoe. Yr wyf yn amau y byddai wedi bod yn bosibl oni bai am y moratoriwm o 14 diwrnod, oherwydd y byddai'r dichter, fel y soniais yn fy ateb i gwestiwn Helen Mary Jones, wedi mynd yn drech ac ni fyddai modd cael awyrgylch synhwyrol yn y negodiadau. Yr oedd yn falch yn hynny o beth. Er i'r cloc 90 diwrnod ddechrau tician

clock started ticking at midnight last night, the 30-day grace period is intended to encourage management to talk to the local trade unions about measures to cut costs and, therefore, save jobs, relative to the 6,000 job losses that were announced on 1 February.

We are in almost daily contact with the trade unions, and are exploring all avenues. We have talked tactics with them and with Corus. It is right and proper that we are in touch with both sides. During the next 30 days we will continue to do so in order to look at ways of shaving costs, if it helps to save jobs.

am hanner nos neithiwr, bwriedir i'r cyfnod 30 diwrnod o ras annog y rheolwyr i siarad â'r undebau llafur lleol am fesurau a fydd yn lleihau costau ac, felly, yn achub swyddi, o gymharu â'r 6,000 o ddiswyddiadau a gyhoeddwyd ar 1 Chwefror.

Yr ydym mewn cysylltiad â'r undebau llafur bron bob dydd ac yn ymchwilio i bob opsiwn posibl. Siaradasom am dactegau gyda hwy a Corus. Mae'n gwbl briodol ein bod mewn cysylltiad â'r ddwy ochr. Yn ystod y 30 diwrnod nesaf byddwn yn parhau i wneud hynny er mwyn edrych ar ffyrdd o leihau costau, os bydd yn fodd o achub swyddi.

Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

William Graham: Point of order. I raise this under Standing Order No. 2.4 and No. 6.3 (iii). I would like your ruling, Presiding Officer, as to whether you think it appropriate that a designated Minister is not available to answer oral questions during Plenary. I refer to the Minister with responsibility for e-commerce, and believe that his absence is inappropriate.

The Presiding Officer: I would like further clarification on this point of order. As far as I am aware, we have complied with the order of questions for today. Last week, we appeared in reverse formation, if that is the correct term, for the convenience of the Minister concerned. However, today's agenda has been followed, as far as I am aware.

William Graham: I am not referring to today's agenda. There never appears to be a designated time for the Minister responsible for e-commerce to answer questions on that designated responsibility.

The Presiding Officer: Does the Minister for Assembly Business wish to respond?

The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies): I regret that William has raised this issue once again, because it has been raised in the Business Committee. However, I explained fully to William in the Business Committee that I do not have

William Graham: Pwynt o drefn. Fe'i codaf o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 2.4 a Rhif 6.3(iii). Hoffwn gael eich dyfarniad, Lywydd, pa un a yw'n briodol yn eich barn chi, nad yw Gweinidog dynodedig ar gael i ateb cwestiynau llafur yn ystod y Cyfarfod Llawn. Cyfeiriaf at y Gweinidog sydd yn gyfrifol am e-fasnach, a chredaf fod ei absenoldeb yn amhriodol.

Y Llywydd: Hoffwn eglurhad pellach ar y pwynt hwnnw o drefn. Hyd y gwn i, yr ydym wedi cydymffurfio â threfn y cwestiynau ar gyfer heddiw. Yr wythnos diwethaf, ymdriniwyd â'r cwestiynau ffordd arall, fel petai, er hwylustod y Gweinidog perthnasol. Fodd bynnag, dilynwyd yr agenda heddiw, hyd y gwn i.

William Graham: Ni chyfeiriaf at yr agenda heddiw. Ymddengys nad oes byth amser wedi ei bennu i'r Gweinidog sydd yn gyfrifol am e-fasnach ateb cwestiynau ar y cyfrifoldeb dynodedig hwnnw.

Y Llywydd: A hoffai'r Trefnydd ymateb?

Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Gresynaf wrth y ffaith bod William wedi codi'r mater hwn drachefn, am y'i codwyd yn y Pwyllgor Busnes. Fodd bynnag, eglurais yn fanwl i William yn y Pwyllgor Busnes nad oes gennyf gyfrifoldebau dirprwyedig statudol.

statutory delegated responsibilities. Responsibility for e-commerce resides with my colleague, Mike German, just as responsibility for ICT and e-learning resides with the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, Jane Davidson. Mine is purely a co-ordinating role, but I will answer written questions. As I said in the Business Committee, this is under consideration and, if it is felt appropriate for me to answer oral questions, then I will do so. That is a matter that I will have to discuss with the Presiding Officer.

Fy nghyd-Aelod, Mike German sydd yn gyfrifol am e-fasnach, yn yr un modd ag y mae'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, Jane Davidson, yn gyfrifol am TGCh ac e-ddysgu. Rôl cydlynnydd sydd gennyf fi, ond atebaf gwestiynau ysgrifenedig. Fel y dywedais yn y Pwyllgor Busnes, ystyrir y mater hwn ar hyn o bryd ac, os teimlir ei bod yn briodol imi ateb cwestiynau llafar, yna fe wnaif hynny. Mae hwnnw'n fater y bydd yn rhaid imi ei drafod â'r Llywydd.

The Presiding Officer: The Minister for Assembly Business's response shows that he is willing to consider the matter further. Honour seems to be satisfied, therefore we can continue.

Y Llywydd: Dengys ymateb y Trefnydd ei fod yn barod i ystyried y mater ymhellach. Ymddengys fod y naill a'r llall wedi ei fodloni, felly awn ymlaen.

Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Tir Mynydd (Cymru) 2001 Approval of the Tir Mynydd (Wales) Regulations 2001

The Minister for Rural Affairs (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwleideig (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol

considers the principle of the Tir Mynydd (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 24 January 2001.

yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Tir Mynydd (Cymru) 2001 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Ionawr 2001.

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol

(a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified under Standing Order No. 11.5 any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Tir Mynydd (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 6 February 2001;

(a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw fater sydd yn peri pryder o dan Reol Sefydlog 11.5 yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Tir Mynydd (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Chwefror 2001;

(b) approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 24 January 2001 and the memorandum of corrections pursuant to Standing Order No. 22.13 (i) laid in the Table Office on 6 February 2001.

(b) yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Ionawr 2001 a'r memorandwm cywiriadau yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 22.13 (i) a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Chwefror 2001.

About 80 per cent of agricultural land in Wales is designated as, or within, a less favoured area. Most of that land is classed as

Mae tua 80 y cant o dir amaethyddol Cymru wedi ei ddynodi fel ardal llai ffafriol neu o fewn ardal llai ffafriol. Dosberthir y rhan

a severely disadvantaged area. Compensatory allowances are paid to livestock farmers in LFAs, such as the hills and uplands, in recognition of the permanent natural handicaps that make their work more difficult and more expensive. During the past 30 years, the payment has been made in the UK through the hill livestock compensatory allowance scheme. Despite its title, the scheme also had a wider social purpose of helping to keep farmers in the hills.

From next month, LFA support payments to farmers will be made on an area basis, or a per hectare basis, under the Tir Mynydd scheme. This replaces a system of payments per eligible animal, made under the old HLCA scheme. The move to an area-based compensation scheme arises from the agreement between European Union agriculture ministers in March 1999 on Agenda 2000 common agricultural policy reforms. It reflects the European Commission's concern to decouple production from support and to introduce more environmental considerations. We have no choice but to introduce area-based payments.

10:25 a.m.

The rural development regulations state that all member states must replace their existing livestock headage LFA schemes with new area-based schemes as part of their rural development plans. Wales's rural development plan was approved by the Commission last year. The Tir Mynydd scheme is included in that plan. I must make the point, therefore, that maintaining the status quo was never an option. The purpose of this instrument is to provide a legal basis for payment to farmers with eligible land within the less favoured areas of Wales from March 2001 onwards. Given the extent of the LFAs in Wales, these payments provide vital support to farmers, in particular, and to wider rural communities. Similar, but not identical, schemes are being introduced in England, Scotland and Northern Ireland. I believe that we have developed a scheme in Wales that best meets our needs, given what we had to work with initially.

fwyaf o'r tir hwnnw yn ardal dra difreintiedig. Telir lwfansau iawndal i ffermwyr da byw mewn ardaloedd llai ffafriol, megis ar dir uchel neu dir mynydd, er mwyn cydnabod yr anafteision naturiol parhaol sydd yn gwneud eu gwaith yn anos ac yn fwy costus. Yn ystod y 30 blynedd diwethaf, fe'i talwyd yn y DU drwy'r cynllun lwfans iawndal da byw tir uchel. Er gwaethaf ei deitl, mae diben cymdeithasol ehangach i'r cynllun hefyd sef helpu i sicrhau bod ffermwyr yn parhau i ffermio ar y bryniau.

O'r mis nesaf ymlaen, telir taliadau cynnal ardaloedd llai ffafriol i ffermwyr ar sail ardal, neu fesul hectar, o dan gynllun Tir Mynydd. Fe'i cyflwynir yn lle system o daliadau fesul anifail cymwys, a wnaethpwyd o dan yr hen gynllun lwfans iawndal da byw tir uchel. Symudir i gynllun iawndal yn seiliedig ar ardal yn sgil cytundeb rhwng gweinidogion amaethyddol yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ym Mawrth 1999 ar ddiwygio'r polisi amaeth cyffredin o dan Agenda 2000. Adlewyrcha bryder y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd i ddatgysylltu cynnyrch oddi wrth gymorth a chyflwyno ystyriaethau mwy amgylcheddol. Nid oes dewis gennym ond cyflwyno taliadau yn seiliedig ar ardal.

Noda'r rheoliadau datblygu gwledig fod yn rhaid i bob aelod-wladwriaeth gyflwyno cynlluniau newydd yn seiliedig ar ardal yn lle eu cynlluniau presennol ar gyfer ardaloedd llai ffafriol sydd yn seiliedig ar nifer yr anifeiliaid fel rhan o'u cynlluniau datblygu gwledig. Cymeradwywyd cynllun datblygu gwledig Cymru gan y Comisiwn y llynedd. Mae Tir Mynydd yn rhan o'r cynllun hwnnw. Rhaid imi nodi, felly, nad oedd cadw at y sefyllfa bresennol yn opsiwn o gwbl. Diben yr offeryn hwn yw rhoi sail gyfreithiol dros y taliadau i ffermwyr sydd â thir cymwys o fewn ardaloedd llai ffafriol Cymru o fis Mawrth 2001 ymlaen. O gofio nifer yr ardaloedd llai ffafriol yng Nghymru, rhydd y taliadau gymorth hanfodol i ffermwyr, yn arbennig, ac i'r cymunedau gwledig ehangach. Cyflwynir cynlluniau tebyg, ond nid yn union yr un fath, yn Lloegr, yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon. Credaf inni ddatblygu'r cynllun gorau i ddiwallu ein hanghenion yng Nghymru, o ystyried yr hyn yr oedd yn rhaid

inni ymdrin ag ef yn wreiddiol.

The development of the Tir Mynydd scheme has been the subject of extensive consultation with a wide range of bodies that have an interest in agriculture and the environment. That consultation started in 1999. The Agriculture and Rural Development Committee considered the detail of the scheme at several of its meetings and that has continued to be the case since July 1999. I am grateful to those who responded and contributed to the development of the scheme.

It was clear that from an early stage of the consultation process an immediate switch from livestock headage payments to area-based payments would have an adverse effect on many traditional family farms in Wales, many of which are heavily stocked. To try to cushion the blow during the first three years of the scheme, we negotiated hard with the European Commission to include a safety net in the scheme. This, together with a taper to prevent windfall gains for those with large farms, gives farmers the opportunity to restructure their businesses by the time Tir Mynydd is fully implemented in 2004. Ninety-five per cent of the payments to farmers are on a per hectare basis under Element 1 of the scheme—over £39 million in total. The remaining 5 per cent of the budget is available for an environmental budget top up—Element 2. The range of environmental enhancement available to farmers, more so under Tir Mynydd than under the English equivalent, should help to ensure that as many farmers as possible qualify for a top-up on their basic area payments.

We wrote to farmers in November last year asking them to submit their supplementary claim form for the Element 2 enhancements. A significant number have either not yet returned the form or have failed to support it with the necessary evidence to prove that they qualify for the enhancements. In view of this, we have to administer the Tir Mynydd 2001 payments in two stages so that as many farmers as possible will receive their basic area payment in March in line with the traditional payment pattern of the HLCA

Ymgynghorwyd yn eang ag ystod helaeth o gyrff sydd â diddordeb mewn amaethyddiaeth a'r amgylchedd ynglŷn â datblygu cynllun Tir Mynydd. Dechreuodd yr ymgynghoriad hwnnw yn 1999. Ystyriodd y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig fanylion y cynllun mewn sawl un o'i gyfarfodydd ac mae wedi parhau i wneud hynny ers Gorffennaf 1999. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r rheini a ymatebodd ac a gyfrannodd i ddatblygiad y cynllun.

Yr oedd yn amlwg yn gynnar yn y broses ymgynghori y byddai symud oddi wrth daliadau yn ôl nifer yr anifeiliaid i daliadau yn seiliedig ar ardal yn cael effaith andwyol ar nifer fawr o ffermydd teuluol traddodiadol yng Nghymru, y mae llawer ohonynt â nifer fawr o dda byw. Er mwyn ceisio lleddfu'r ergyd yn ystod tair blynedd gyntaf y cynllun, buom yn negodi'n galed â'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd er mwyn sicrhau rhwyd ddiogelwch yn y cynllun hwn. Mae hyn, ynghyd â thapro i atal y rhai â ffermydd mawr rhag cael enillion untro, yn rhoi cyfle i ffermwyr ailstrwythuro eu busnesau cyn i gynllun Tir Mynydd gael ei weithredu yn llawn yn 2004. Mae 95 y cant o'r taliadau i ffermwyr ar sail fesul hectar o dan Elfen 1 o'r cynllun—sef cyfanswm o fwy na £39 miliwn. Mae'r 5 y cant sydd yn weddill o'r gyllideb ar gael ar gyfer ychwanegiad amgylcheddol o'r gyllideb—Elfen 2. Dylai'r ystod o ychwanegiadau amgylcheddol sydd ar gael i ffermwyr, sydd yn fwy o dan gynllun Tir Mynydd na'r cynllun cyfatebol yn Lloegr, helpu i sicrhau bod cymaint o ffermwyr â phosibl yn gymwys ar gyfer ychwanegiad at eu taliadau ardal sylfaenol.

Ysgrifenasom at ffermwyr ym mis Tachwedd y llynedd gan ofyn iddynt gyflwyno eu ffurflen gais atodol ar gyfer ychwanegiadau Elfen 2. Mae nifer sylweddol naill ai heb ddychwelyd y ffurflen neu heb ei hategu â'r dystiolaeth sydd ei hangen i brofi eu bod yn gymwys i gael yr ychwanegiadau. O ganlyniad, rhaid inni weinyddu taliadau Tir Mynydd 2001 mewn dau gam er mwyn i gymaint o ffermwyr â phosibl gael eu taliad ardal sylfaenol ym mis Mawrth yn gyson â'r patrwm traddodiadol o daliadau o dan

scheme. Where necessary, payment of the environmental enhancement will follow in April, or as soon as the necessary data is available. This is not ideal and I urge farmers to submit the necessary documentation for Element 2 by the end of February.

As a result of the extensive consultation process and negotiation with the Commission, we have developed a scheme that suits the nature of Wales's upland farms and which has a much wider coverage than comparable schemes elsewhere in the UK. Cross-border holdings will be the subject of a separate Order once officials have finished their work on the complicated administrative procedures that must be resolved before draft legislation can be put forward. I expect to be in a position shortly to lay a draft Order relating specifically to cross-border issues and to use the Executive procedure to pass it to avoid delays in payments to farmers whose holdings are affected.

My officials already hold the data on eligible land for payments under Element 1 of Tir Mynydd. We will strive to secure the outstanding information required to validate the Element 2 top-up payments. Work on processing the claims can start soon but no payments can be released until these regulations come into force and are adopted by the National Assembly on 1 March. Support for these regulations will allow us to make the first Tir Mynydd payments at the same time as HLCA payment were made in the past. I invite the National Assembly to support the regulations.

Elin Jones: Mae'n teimlo'n amser hir ers i'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig a'r cyn Ysgrifennydd Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig a'r Pwyllgor ddechrau trafod newid yr HLCA a chreu taliadau Tir Mynydd. Bydd Plaid Cymru'n cefnogi'r rheoliadau Tir Mynydd hyn. Mae newid dros nos o system gymorth amaethyddol wedi'i seilio ar nifer anifeiliaid i un sydd wedi'i seilio ar arwynebedd tir yn newid sylweddol a fydd yn golygu newid mawr yn incwm rhai ffermwyr, gyda rhai ar eu hennill ac eraill yn colli. Ar

gynllun lwfans da byw tir uchel. Lle y bo angen, telir yr ychwanegiad amgylcheddol ym mis Ebrill neu cyn gynted ag y bydd y data angenrheidiol ar gael. Nid yw hyn yn ddelfrydol ac anogaf ffermwyr i gyflwyno'r ddogfennaeth angenrheidiol ar gyfer Elfen 2 erbyn diwedd Chwefror.

O ganlyniad i'r broses ymgynghori eang a'r negodiadau â'r Comisiwn, yr ydym wedi datblygu cynllun sydd yn gweddu i natur ffermydd tir mynydd Cymru ac sydd â chwmpas llawer ehangach na'r cynlluniau cyffelyb mewn rhannau eraill o'r DU. Bydd ffermydd traws-ffiniol yn ddarostyngedig i Orchymyn ar wahân unwaith y bydd y swyddogion yn cwblhau eu gwaith ar y gweithdrefnau gweinyddol cymhleth y mae'n rhaid penderfynu arnynt cyn y gellir cyflwyno'r ddeddfwriaeth ddrafft. Disgwyliaf fod mewn sefyllfa i osod Gorchymyn drafft yn ymwneud yn benodol â materion traws-ffiniol yn y man gan ddefnyddio'r weithdrefn Weithredol i'w basio er mwyn osgoi unrhyw oedi cyn talu ffermwyr yr effeithir ar eu ffermydd.

Eisoed mae gan fy swyddogion y data ar dir sydd yn gymwys ar gyfer taliadau o dan Elfen 1 o gynllun Tir Mynydd. Ymdrechwn i sicrhau gweddill yr wybodaeth sydd ei hangen i ddilysu taliadau ychwanegol Elfen 2. Gall y gwaith ar brosesu ceisiadau ddechrau yn y man ond ni ellir gwneud unrhyw daliadau nes y bydd y rheoliadau hyn mewn grym ac y cânt eu mabwysiadu gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar 1 Mawrth. Bydd cefnogaeth i'r rheoliadau hyn yn caniatáu inni wneud y taliadau Tir Mynydd cyntaf ar yr un adeg ag y gwnaethpwyd taliadau lwfans da byw tir uchel yn y gorffennol. Gofynnaf i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gefnogi'r rheoliadau.

Elin Jones: It feels like a long time since the Minister for Rural Affairs, the former Secretary for Agriculture and Rural Development and the Committee began discussing introducing HLCA and amending Tir Mynydd payments. Plaid Cymru will support these Tir Mynydd regulations. An overnight change from an agricultural aid system based on headage to that of hectareage is a substantial change that means a big change in the income of some farmers, with some gaining and others losing. At a time

adeg pan y mae prisiau'r farchnad yn parhau i fod yn afreal o isel, mae colli incwm o ffynhonnell arall yn ergyd farwol. Croesawn, felly, yr arian o'r rhwyd diogelwch a fydd yn diogelu 90 y cant o incwm ffermwyr sydd ar eu colled yn ariannol yn 2001 ac yna 80 a 70 y cant am y ddwy flynedd ddilynol. Mae hyn yn rhoi rhywfaint o sicrwydd incwm i ffermwyr. Y cwestiwn yn awr yw beth fydd yn digwydd yn 2004. Mae'r undebau a'r ffermwyr eisoes yn holi'r cwestiwn hwn.

Wrth ateb y ddadl heddiw, hoffwn pe byddai'r Gweinidog yn datgan ei barodrwydd i sefydlu gweithgor o'r diwydiant i edrych ar Tir Mynydd o 2004 ymlaen, a fyddai'n cyflwyno adroddiad cyn gynted â phosibl i'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig. Os yw ffermwyr yn wynebu newid sylweddol i'w ffynhonnell incwm, maent yn haeddu cymaint o rybudd o hynny ag sydd yn bosibl er mwyn gallu addasu eu cynlluniau busnes neu eu patrwm amaethu. Wrth ystyried diwygio Tir Mynydd ar gyfer 2004, gobeithiwn y byddwch yn ystyried o ddifrif y posibilrwydd o fodwleiddio ar sail unedau llafur. Dywedodd eich swyddogion yn y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig fod system o fodwleiddio ar sail unedau llafur yn rhy gymhleth yn weinyddol. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn drafodaeth eang, ddifrifol ar y pwnc hwn oherwydd ni chredaf i ni gael digon o drafodaeth na manylion ar yr egwyddor o fodwleiddio ar sail unedau llafur.

Cyflogir llai a llai o bobl ym myd amaeth. Collir swyddi ar raddfa echrydus o 70 swydd y diwrnod. Mae'n holl bwysig, felly, fod cefnogaeth i gyflogaeth yn ein cyfundrefnau cymorthdaliadau. Mae nifer o agweddau ar amaethyddiaeth yn bwysig i'n cymunedau gwledig. Un o'r rhai pwysicaf yw cynnig ffynhonnell cyflogaeth bwysig a gyrfa gydol oes i bobl mewn cyfnod pan y mae'r posibiladau cyflogaeth mewn ardal wledig yn mynd yn fwyfwy cyfyng.

Cyfeiriaf hefyd at gyflwyno Tir Mynydd yn 2001. Mae hon yn system newydd a hoffwn gael sicrwydd heddiw—cawsom rywfaint o sicrwydd yn y datganiad agoriadol—y bydd y Gweinidog yn sicrhau y gwenyddir taliadau Tir Mynydd i ffermwyr yn brydlon. Yr oedd

when market prices continue to be unrealistically low, losing income from another source is a fatal blow. We welcome, therefore, the funding safety net that will safeguard 90 per cent of the income of farmers who lose out financially in 2001, and then 80 and 70 per cent over the following two years. That gives farmers some income security. The question now is what will happen in 2004. The unions and farmers are already asking that question.

In replying to today's debate I would like to hear the Minister declare his willingness to establish a working party, comprised of industry representatives to consider Tir Mynydd from 2004 onwards, that would present a report to the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee as soon as possible. If farmers are facing a substantial change in their income source, they deserve as much notice of that as possible so that they can amend their business plans or their farming patterns. In considering reforming Tir Mynydd for 2004, we hope that you will seriously consider the possibility of modulation on the basis of labour units. Your officials said in the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee that a system of modulating on labour units is too administratively complex. However, I would like a wide-ranging and honest discussion on this issue because I do not believe that we have had sufficient discussion or details on the principle of modulation on the basis of labour units.

Fewer and fewer people are employed in agriculture. Jobs are lost at the frightening rate of 70 per day. It is crucial, therefore, that there is support for employment in our grant systems. Several aspects of agriculture are important to our rural communities. One of the most important is that the industry offers an important source of employment and a lifelong career for people at a time when employment opportunities are becoming much more limited in the rural areas.

I also refer to the introduction of Tir Mynydd in 2001. This is a new system and I would like to have an assurance today—we received some assurance in the opening statement—that the Minister will ensure that the Tir Mynydd payments will be paid to farmers on

taliadau lloi sugno yn hwyr eleni oherwydd systemau talu a siecio cyfrifiadurol newydd. Mae hyn wedi achosi caledi mawr i nifer o ffermwyr wrth iddynt ddisgwyl am eu dyraniad i dalu eu biliau bwydydd anifeiliaid dros y gaeaf, ac ati. Mae'r Gweinidog eisoes wedi datgan y bydd y taliadau ar gyfer Elfen 2 Tir Mynydd yn hwyrach na rhai Elfen 1. Byddai'n gwbl annerbyniol pe byddai'r taliadau Elfen 2 ddiwrnod yn hwyrach na diwedd mis Ebrill, os nad bai'r ffermwr unigol yw hyn. Yn aml, fodd bynnag, nid bai'r ffermwr yw'r taliadau hwyr.

Mae cyflwyno Tir Mynydd wedi peri i ffermwyr Cymru ymateb i ddiwygio polisi amaeth cyffredin, sydd yn deillio o drafodaethau byd-eang ar fasnach. Wrth i ni yng Nghymru ymateb i ddiwygio'r polisi amaeth cyffredin, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn gwarchod, i'r graddau eithaf posibl, y patrwm amaethu sydd yn greiddiol i'n cymunedau gwledig, sef y patrwm sydd wedi ei seilio ar y fferm deuluol. Wrth inni drafod Tir Mynydd, rhaid inni gofio mai'r hyn sydd yn bwysig i ffermwyr yw pris teg am eu cynnyrch yn y farchnad. Heb newid sylfaenol ym mholisi economaidd Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig a gostyngiad yng ngwerth y bunt, bydd prisiau cynnyrch fferm o dan wasgfa barhaol a bydd amaethyddiaeth yn parhau mewn argyfwng am fisoedd, os nad blynyddoedd, i ddod.

10:35 a.m

Mick Bates: I declare an interest as a partner in a farming business. As we debate these regulations, we must consider the aim of the payments. In European and UK Government terms, they are socio-economic payments to maintain the basic structure of family farms in less favoured areas. We all share that aim, as we realise how fundamental it is to sustaining the existence of communities in the uplands of Wales. That has repercussions for the language and economic health in those areas. These payments are fundamental to the survival of the family farm.

I was pleased to hear the Minister say that these payments will be made on time. However, it must be made clear that that only applies to Element 1 payments, which form

time. Suckler cow payments were late this year because of the new computerised payment and checking systems. This has caused great hardship for farmers as they await their allocation to pay their bills for animal feed over the winter and the like. The Minister has already said that the payments for Element 2 of Tir Mynydd will be later than those for Element 1. It would be totally unacceptable if Element 2 payments were a day later than the end of April, unless it is the fault of the individual farmer. Frequently, however, late payments are not the farmer's fault.

The introduction of Tir Mynydd has prompted Welsh farmers to respond to common agriculture policy reform, which has arisen from global discussions on trade. As we in Wales respond to CAP reform, it is important that we safeguard, to the highest possible degree, the farming patterns that are central to our rural communities, namely the pattern that is based on the family farm. In discussing Tir Mynydd, we must remember that what is important to farmers is a fair price for their produce in the market place. Without a fundamental change in the economic policy of the UK Government and a reduction in the value of the pound, prices for farm produce will be under continuous pressure and agriculture will remain in crisis for months, if not years, to come.

Mick Bates: Datganaf fuddiant fel partner mewn busnes ffermio. Wrth inni drafod y rheoliadau hyn, rhaid inni ystyried nod y taliadau. O safbwynt Ewrop a Llywodraeth y DU, maent yn daliadau economaidd-gymdeithasol i gynnal strwythur sylfaenol ffermydd teuluol mewn ardaloedd llai ffafriol. Yr ydym oll yn rhannu'r nod hwnnw, gan ein bod yn sylweddoli pa mor hanfodol ydyw i sicrhau bodolaeth cymunedau ar dir mynydd Cymru. Mae gan hynny oblygiadau o ran yr iaith ac iechyd economaidd yn yr ardaloedd hynny. Mae'r taliadau hyn yn hanfodol i'r ffermydd teuluol oresi.

Yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed y Gweinidog yn dweud y caiff y taliadau hyn eu gwneud yn brydlon. Fodd bynnag, rhaid nodi nad yw hynny ond yn berthnasol i daliadau Elfen 1, a

the majority of the payments. I will refer to Element 2. If we are, in the change from headage to area payments, to continue our aim of sustaining agriculture in the hills, we must ensure that the best use is made of Element 2. Unfortunately, the Element 2 payments were halved to pay for the safety net. That is a fundamental weakness in how we have proceeded with these regulations. I want the Minister to clarify that Element 2, which assists the survival of family farms in the hills and the development of sustainable land use, will be funded fully as soon as possible.

For a long time, we have heard fine rhetoric about sustaining family farms in the hills and maintaining the smaller family farm. The taper is an attempt to do that and the Liberal Democrats will support it. However, at a time of crisis in the agriculture industry, we can ill afford its impact on larger businesses.

In the review, which the Minister stated will proceed almost immediately, Element 2 must be used to ensure that we input and manage the change faced by our industry. I recommend that, in Element 2, we ensure that young farmers are part of the review and that encouragement and extra payment is given to farms where younger farmers take over the business. The concept of review is critical. I pay tribute to how the consultation took place in creating these regulations. As can be seen from the Legislation Committee's report, there were many corrections, which have all been accounted for under the memorandum of corrections.

I hope that the new Tir Mynydd regulations will meet what is needed for the survival of family farms in the Welsh hills. To achieve that, will the Minister assure us that the extra £10 million in the partnership agreement will be used to ensure that these payments are kept at their current level? If not, there will be more suffering at a time of deep crisis in the hills.

Peter Rogers: I declare an interest as a farmer, although I will not receive these payments. My resentment and anger about the reformed Tir Mynydd scheme are well

fydd yn cyfrif am y rhan fwyaf o'r taliadau. Cyfeiriaf at Elfen 2. Er mwyn inni barhau â'n nod o gynnal amaethyddiaeth ar dir uchel, o newid o daliadau ar gyfer nifer yr anifeiliaid i daliadau yn ôl ardal, rhaid inni sicrhau y gwneir y defnydd gorau o Elfen 2. Yn anffodus, hanerwyd taliadau Elfen 2 i dalu am y rhwyd ddiogelwch. Mae hynny'n wendid sylfaenol o ran sut y datblygasom y rheoliadau hyn. Yr wyf am i'r Gweinidog egluro y caiff Elfen 2, sydd yn rhoi cymorth i ffermydd teuluol ar dir uchel oroesi a datblygiad defnydd tir cynaliadwy, ei hariannu'n llawn yn gynted â phosibl.

Ers tro, buom yn clywed rhethreg wych am gynnal ffermydd teuluol ar dir uchel a chynnal y ffermydd teuluol llai. Mae'r tapr yn ymgais i wneud hynny a bydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn ei gefnogi. Fodd bynnag, ar adeg o argyfwng yn y diwydiant amaethyddol, prin y gallwn fforddio ei effaith ar fusnesau mwy.

Yn yr adolygiad, a gynhelir bron ar unwaith yn ôl y Gweinidog, rhaid defnyddio Elfen 2 er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn cyfrannu ac yn rheoli'r newid a wyneba ein diwydiant. Argymhellaf ein bod yn sicrhau, yn Elfen 2, bod ffermwyr ifanc yn rhan o'r adolygiad a'n bod yn annog ac yn rhoi taliadau ychwanegol i ffermydd lle y mae ffermwyr iau yn meddiannu'r busnes. Mae'r cysyniad o adolygiad yn holl bwysig. Talaf deyrnged i'r ffordd yr ymgynghorwyd â phobl wrth lunio'r rheoliadau hyn. Fel y gellir gweld o adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, bu nifer o gywiriadau, y cyfrifwyd am bob un ohonynt o dan y memorandwm cywiriadau.

Gobeithiaf y bydd y rheoliadau Tir Mynydd newydd yn cyflawni'r hyn sydd ei angen i sicrhau bod ffermydd teuluol tir uchel Cymru yn goroesi. Er mwyn cyflawni hynny, a wnaiff y Gweinidog ein sicrhau y caiff y £10 miliwn ychwanegol yn y cytundeb partneriaeth eu defnyddio er mwyn sicrhau y cedwir y taliadau hyn ar eu lefel bresennol? Oni wneir hynny, bydd mwy o adfyd ar adeg o argyfwng mawr ar y tir uchel.

Peter Rogers: Datganaf fuddiant fel ffermwr, er na fyddaf yn derbyn y taliadau hyn. Mae fy nicter ynghylch y cynllun Tir Mynydd diwygiedig yn hysbys iawn. Ni chredaf iddo

recorded. I do not believe that it is drafted in the best interests of Welsh farming. I was the only one who voted against the proposal in the Committee. I did so because it does not support family partnerships, labour employment or efficient farming. Also, it does nothing to encourage mixed grazing of sheep and cattle to reduce the over-grazing of sheep, which is a key environmental issue. After three years, the safety net, which amounts to £13 million, will be removed completely. That money will have been in the budget for the previous three years. The onslaught against Welsh farming, therefore, will continue.

I have serious concerns that I insist you take on board, Minister. Tir Mynydd alludes to the benefits for farmland, birds and small mammals, and arable and root crops. However, it excludes crops sown after 15 May 2000. That sends contradictory signals to the farming industry. No-one would lose out if the cut-off date was removed, and that would have shown that the Assembly was adopting a flexible stance to try to revive farming fortunes. There is no provision in the regulations for farm holdings that straddle the border between Tir Mynydd and the operation of the Hill Farm Allowances scheme in England, which you mentioned in your opening speech. Such is the importance of this that it must be sorted out immediately, otherwise there will be severe problems with payments. Farmers need to know how you intend to deal with the provision that has been set down for them.

I turn to Element 2 and the category on environmental enhancement. It appears that producers who have converted to organic farming and suppliers of organic food may be ineligible for enhanced Tir Mynydd payments if they are still in receipt of aid under the organic aid scheme or organic farming scheme. That needs immediate clarification.

The category on farm assurance and providing proof tells us that photocopies are not acceptable. As you know, Minister, auctioneers and slaughterhouses have access to the farm assured Welsh livestock database. Let us stop this paper chase and use that

gael ei ddrafftio er budd ffermwyr Cymru. Fi oedd yr unig un a bleidleisiodd yn erbyn y cynnig yn y Pwyllgor. Gwneuthum hynny am nad yw'n cefnogi partneriaethau teuluol, cyflogi llafur na ffermio effeithlon. Hefyd, ni wna unrhyw beth i annog amlbori defaid a da byw er mwyn lleihau achosion o or-bori gan ddefaid, sydd yn fater amgylcheddol allweddol. Ar ôl tair blynedd, caiff y rhwyd ddiogelwch, sef cyfanswm o £13 miliwn, ei diddymu'n gyfan gwbl. Bydd yr arian hwnnw wedi bod yn y gyllideb am y tair blynedd flaenorol. Felly bydd yr ymosodiad ar ffermio yng Nghymru yn parhau.

Mae gennyf bryderon gwirioneddol a mynnaf eich bod yn eu hystyried, Weinidog. Cyfeiria Tir Mynydd at y buddiannau ar gyfer tir amaeth, adar a mamaliaid bach, a chnydau â'r a chnydau gwreiddlysiau. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n cynnwys cnydau a heuwyd ar ôl 15 Mai 2000. Mae hynny'n anfon negeseuon croes i'r diwydiant ffermio. Ni fyddai neb ar ei golled pe bai'r dyddiad terfynol yn cael ei ddileu, a byddai hynny wedi dangos bod y Cynulliad yn cymryd safbwynt hyblyg wrth geisio adfer ffyniant y byd ffermio. Nid oes unrhyw ddarpariaeth yn y rheoliadau ar gyfer ffermydd sydd ar y ffin rhwng Tir Mynydd a gweithrediad y cynllun Lwfansau Ffermydd Mynydd yn Lloegr, y cyfeiriasoch ato yn eich araith agoriadol. Mae hwn yn fater mor bwysig fel bod yn rhaid ei ddatrys ar unwaith, neu fel arall bydd problemau dybryd o ran taliadau. Mae angen i ffermwyr wybod sut y bwriadwch ymdrin â'r ddarpariaeth a bennwyd ar eu cyfer.

Trof at Efen 2 a'r categori ar welliant amgylcheddol. Ymddengys na fydd cynhyrchwyr a newidiodd i ffermio organig a chyflenwyr bwyd organig yn gymwys o bosibl i gael taliadau ychwanegol Tir Mynydd os ydynt yn dal i gael cymorth o dan y cynllun cymorth organig neu'r cynllun ffermio organig. Mae angen egluro hynny ar unwaith.

Mae'r categori ar sicrwydd fferm a rhoi tystiolaeth yn nodi nad yw llungopiau yn dderbyniol. Fel y gwyddoch, Weinidog, mae arwerthwyr a lladd-dai yn cael mynediad i gronfa ddata da byw Cymru sydd â sicrwydd fferm. Gadewch inni roi'r gorau i'r papurach

database.

On payment, we have had the details in Element 1 since last May. Therefore, payments under Element 1 must be made immediately, not in March. There is a provision for the National Assembly to recover whole or part payments from claimants, and any interest on those payments. Recipients of Tir Mynydd payments should be similarly in receipt of interest when payments are delayed by the Assembly and through no fault of the claimant.

Welsh farmers were the first to receive the explanatory literature on Tir Mynydd, which was meant to demonstrate our commitment to improve the services we give to farmers. We have heard about the fiasco of the late suckler cow payments, and the modulation that was passed, against all the best advice, which has not yet been put into practice. In England, as a result of modulation payments, business advisers are in place and farmers are receiving assistance. We must ensure that we do not let Welsh farmers down. I must caution the Minister that farmers will not accept late Tir Mynydd payments. They cannot afford another betrayal by this coalition Government.

Carwyn Jones: Dechreuaf drwy ymateb i bwyntiau Elin Jones ar newid o un system i'r llall. Rhaid oedd cael rhwyd ddiogelwch oherwydd, ar ôl ymgynghori â'r diwydiant, yr oedd yn amlwg y byddai'r bwlch yn rhy fawr rhwng y ddwy system, heb fod gennym rywbeth i leihau'r effaith ar ffermwyr. Wedi i'r rhwyd ddiogelwch gael ei diddymu, rhaid inni ystyried system newydd—'Tir Mynydd 2' efallai—er mwyn creu system sydd yn well na Tir Mynydd i'r dyfodol. Yr wyf yn awyddus i gydweithio â'r diwydiant ar hyn. Mae'n bwysig bod pobl yn deall yr hyn a wneir yn y dyfodol. Byddaf yn ymgynghori ag undebau'r ffermwyr. Os bydd pwysau i ffurfio gweithgor, yr wyf yn barod i ystyried hynny. Mae'n bwysig bod y diwydiant yn gwybod beth a fydd yn digwydd ar ôl 2003.

10:45 a.m.

Nid yw Tir Mynydd wedi ei fodwleiddio. Trafodasom unedau llafur yn y Pwyllgor

hyn a defnyddio'r gronfa ddata honno.

O ran y taliadau, cawsom y manylion yn Efen 1 ers Mai diwethaf. Felly, rhaid gwneud taliadau o dan Efen 1 ar unwaith, nid ym mis Mawrth. Ceir darpariaeth i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol adennill cyfandaliadau neu randaliadau oddi wrth geiswyr, ynghyd ag unrhyw log ar y taliadau hynny. Dylai'r rhai a fydd yn derbyn taliadau Tir Mynydd gael llog yn yr un modd pan fo oedi cyn i'r Cynulliad eu talu ac nad yw'r ceisiwr ar fai.

Ffermwyr Cymru oedd y cyntaf i gael taflenni eglurhaol ar gynllun Tir Mynydd, a oedd i fod i ddangos ein hymrwymiad i wella ein gwasanaethau i ffermwyr. Clywsom am helbul y taliadau lloi sugno hwyr, a'r modwleiddio a basiwyd, yn groes i bob cyngor da, ac nas gweithredwyd eto. Yn Lloegr, o ganlyniad i'r taliadau modwleiddio, mae cynghorwyr busnes yn eu lle ac mae ffermwyr yn cael cymorth. Rhaid inni sicrhau nad ydym yn siomi ffermwyr Cymru. Rhaid imi rybuddio'r Gweinidog na fydd ffermwyr yn fodlon ar daliadau Tir Mynydd hwyr. Ni allant fforddio cael eu bradychu eto gan y Llywodraeth glymblaid hon.

Carwyn Jones: I will start by responding to Elin Jones's points about the shift from one system to another. The safety net was necessary because, after consulting with the industry, it became obvious that, without something to lessen the effect on farmers, the gap between the two systems would be too wide. When the safety net is removed, we must consider a new system—'Tir Mynydd 2' perhaps—in order to create a system that is better than Tir Mynydd for the future. I am keen to co-operate with the industry on this. It is important that people understand what will be done in the future. I will consult with the farming unions. If there is pressure to form a working party, I am prepared to consider that. It is important that the industry knows what will happen after 2003.

Tir Mynydd is not modulated. We discussed labour units in the Agriculture and Rural

Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig. Mae problemau. Un o'r problemau ar hyn o bryd yw ei bod yn anodd diffinio uned llafur. Mae'n bosibl mai dim ond ffermydd mawr a fydd yn elwa o'r system. Fodd bynnag, nid yw Tir Mynydd, ar ei ffurf bresennol, wedi ei fodwleiddio.

Several Members mentioned payments. I have already referred to the intention to distribute Element 1 payments on the same timescale as the hill livestock compensatory allowance payments. We must strive to do that. On Element 2, I have emphasised that it is important for people to send in the information. We cannot distribute Element 2 payments unless we have the data. On keeping payments at current levels, the present situation in farming means that it is important for people to understand that the amount of money in the budget over the next three years is sufficient to support this scheme and the new scheme in 2004.

Once the Tir Mynydd scheme ends, it is proposed that we look at a scheme that involves the digital mapping of the whole of Wales. At the moment, the geographical information system scheme is mapping the whole of Wales. It will probably be two years before that mapping exercise is completed. It will then be easier to target payments to people who need them most: those who face climate and altitude difficulties on their farmland. The system will be better in terms of targeting the people that need the money.

Peter raised the point about the cut-off date for arable crops. Farmers who wish to be considered for these enhancements were requested to provide full details on their field data print-out. That was emphasised in last years' integrated administration control system booklet. The IACS rules mean that we must record the crop in the ground on 15 May. Therefore, it is no different to the system that is operated in England with the hill farm allowance scheme. In England, applicants for the hill farm allowance are not given the opportunity to submit further details on their enhances, particularly this enhancement.

It is important that we resolve cross border issues as quickly as possible and I will strive

Development Committee. There are problems. One of the problems at present is that it is difficult to define a labour unit. It is possible that only large farms will benefit from the system. However, Tir Mynydd, in its present form, is not modulated.

Cyfeiriodd sawl Aelod at daliadau. Nodais eisoes y bwriedir dosbarthu taliadau Elfenn 1 yn ôl yr un amserlen â thaliadau lwfans iawndal da byw tir uchel. Rhaid inni ymdrechu i wneud hynny. O ran Elfenn 2, pwysleisiais ei bod yn bwysig i bobl anfon yr wybodaeth. Ni allwn wneud taliadau Elfenn 2 oni chawn y data. O ran cadw taliadau ar y lefelau presennol, golyga'r sefyllfa a wyneba'r byd ffermio ar hyn o bryd ei bod yn bwysig i bobl ddeall bod digon o arian yn y gyllideb dros y tair blynedd nesaf i gynnal y cynllun hwn a'r cynllun newydd yn 2004.

Unwaith y daw cynllun Tir Mynydd i ben, y bwriad yw y dylem ystyried cynllun sydd yn cynnwys mapio Cymru gyfan yn ddigidol. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r cynllun system gwybodaeth ddaearyddol yn mapio Cymru gyfan. Bydd yn cymryd dwy flynedd fwy na thebyg cyn i'r ymarfer mapio hwn gael ei gwblhau. Yna bydd yn haws targedu taliadau i'r bobl sydd eu hangen fwyaf: sef y rhai a wyneba anawsterau o ran hinsawdd ac uchder ar eu ffermydd. Bydd y system yn well o ran targedu'r bobl y mae angen yr arian arnynt.

Cododd Peter y pwynt am y dyddiad terfynol ar gyfer cnydau â. Gofynnwyd i ffermwyr sydd am gael eu hystyried ar gyfer yr ychwanegiadau hyn roi manylion llawn ar eu hallbrint data caeau. Pwysleisiwyd hynny yn y llyfryn ar y system rheoli gweinyddiaeth integredig y llynedd. Golyga rheolau IACS fod yn rhaid inni gofnodi'r cnwd yn y tir ar 15 Mai. Felly, nid yw'n wahanol i'r system a weithredir yn Lloegr gyda'r cynllun lwfans fferm tir uchel. Yn Lloegr, ni chaiff ceiswyr am y lwfans fferm tir uchel gyfle i gyflwyno manylion pellach am eu hychwanegiadau, yn enwedig yr ychwanegiad hwn.

Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn datrys y problemau traws-ffiniol mor fuan â phosibl ac

to do that. Peter said that Welsh farmers received information on Tir Mynydd before anybody else. I hope that is true because it only applies in Wales. I would be concerned if English farmers had received that information. I accept the point that payments must go out as promptly as possible.

I do not think that there is anything else that has been raised by any of the speakers.

Mick Bates: You have not responded to the extra money that we put into the partnership arrangement and how that could be used to assist the Tir Mynydd regulations—*[Interruption.]*

The Presiding Officer: Order. We cannot have an intervention on an intervention.

Mick Bates:—to the use of Element 2 to assist young farmers to enter the industry.

Carwyn Jones: You have already made the point about the £10 million. The future budget negotiations will be a matter for discussion between myself and the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities. I am sure that she heard that point. If the £10 million is in the budget, then we can consider that.

We cannot change the 10 categories under Element 2 at this stage. However, let us see what can be done with Tir Mynydd 2. The farming unions, particularly the Farmers Union of Wales, have referred to this scheme as being an example of the Assembly showing its teeth. It is incumbent on us all to remember that the scheme in Wales is far better than that which exists in England. It is an example of the National Assembly working for Welsh farmers.

The Presiding Officer: We will now vote on the first motion on the principle of the Order.

ymdrechaf i wneud hynny. Dywedodd Peter fod ffermwyr Cymru wedi cael gwybodaeth am gynllun Tir Mynydd cyn unrhyw un arall. Gobeithiaf fod hynny'n wir am mai dim ond i Gymru y mae'n berthnasol. Pryderwn pe bai ffermwyr yn Lloegr wedi cael yr wybodaeth honno. Derbyniaf y pwynt fod rhaid anfon y taliadau mor brydlon â phosibl.

Ni chredaf fod unrhyw beth arall a godwyd gan unrhyw un o'r siaradwyr.

Mick Bates: Nid ydych wedi rhoi ateb ynglŷn â'r arian ychwanegol a rown i mewn i'r trefniant partneriaeth a sut y gellid ei ddefnyddio i gynorthwyo'r rheoliadau Tir Mynydd—*[Torri ar draws.]*

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Ni allwn gael ymyriad ar ymyriad.

Mick Bates:—ynglŷn â'r defnydd o Eifen 2 i helpu ffermwyr ifanc i ddod i mewn i'r diwydiant.

Carwyn Jones: Yr ydych eisoes wedi nodi'r pwynt am y £10 miliwn. Bydd y negodiadau ar y gyllideb yn y dyfodol yn fater imi a'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau ei drafod. Yr wyf yn siŵr iddi glywed y pwynt hwnnw. Os yw'r £10 miliwn yn y gyllideb, yna gallwn ystyried hynny.

Ni allwn newid y 10 categori o dan Eifen 2 ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, gadewch inni weld beth y gellir ei gyflawni drwy Tir Mynydd 2. Cyfeiriodd yr undebau amaeth, yn enwedig Undeb Amaethwyr Cymru at y cynllun hwn fel enghraifft o'r Cynulliad yn dangos nerth ei fraich. Rhaid inni oll gofio bod y cynllun yng Nghymru yn well o dipyn na'r hyn sydd yn bodoli yn Lloegr. Mae'n enghraifft o'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn gweithio dros ffermwyr Cymru.

Y Llywydd: Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar y cynnig cyntaf ar egwyddor y Gorchymyn.

*Cynnig: O blaid 36, Ymatal 7, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 36, Abstain 7, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
Feld, Val
German, Michael
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Graham, William
Melding, David
Rogers, Peter

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion adopted.*

The Presiding Officer: We will now vote on **Y Llywydd:** Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar yr ail
the second motion to approve the Order. gynnig i gymeradwyo'r Gorchymyn.

*Cynnig: O blaid 35, Ymatal 7, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 35, Abstain 7, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary

Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
Feld, Val
German, Michael
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Graham, William
Melding, David
Rogers, Peter

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion adopted.*

Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Ariannu Ysgolion a Gynhelir (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2001
Approval of the Financing of Maintained Schools (Amendment) (Wales)
Regulations 2001

Y Llywydd: O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25, pleidleiswn i gymeradwyo neu wrthod y Gorchymyn hwn heb gynnal dadl.

The Presiding Officer: Under Standing Order No. 22.25, we will vote to approve or reject this Order without holding a debate.

The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies): I propose that

Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Cynigiad fod

The National Assembly, acting under Standing Order No. 22.25:

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn gweithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog 22.25:

Approves:

yn cymeradwyo:

The Financing of Maintained Schools (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2001 laid in the Table Office on 24 January 2001; and *Rheoliadau Ariannu Ysgolion a Gynhelir (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2001 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Ionawr 2001, ac:*

Considers the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Financing of Maintained Schools (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2001 laid in the Table Office on 6 February 2001. *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw faterion sydd yn peri pryder yn y gorchymyn drafft, Ariannu Ysgolion a Gynhelir (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Chwefror 2001.*

Cynnig: O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion: For 42, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Butler, Rosemary
 Cairns, Alun
 Chapman, Christine
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Davies, Ron
 Essex, Sue
 Evans, Delyth
 Feld, Val
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Gwyther, Christine
 Halford, Alison
 Hancock, Brian
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Rogers, Peter
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Kirsty

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion adopted.

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Cynllun Datblygu'r Diwydiant Moch (Cadarnhau)
2001**

**Approval of the Pig Industry Development Scheme 2000 (Confirmation) Order
2001**

The Minister for Rural Affairs (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

The National Assembly, acting in accordance with Standing Order No. 23.10 approves the draft Order, the Pig Industry Development Scheme 2000 (Confirmation) Order 2001, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 5 February 2001.

This Order confirms the Meat and Livestock Commission's proposal for a pig industry development scheme. A new fund to help fight pig diseases will be financed through a statutory levy. The Order is being made under the Agriculture Act 1967 that established the Meat and Livestock Commission, which is the main body charged with looking after the interests of the meat industry in Britain. I emphasise that this measure today is an initiative by the pig industry and is not something that is being imposed on the industry by Government.

The main purpose is to establish a fund to be financed by a statutory levy on pig producers to deal with pig diseases. It will provide advice, services, facilities and financial assistance to British pig producers to assist them in the prevention or limitation of an outbreak of pig disease in Great Britain. The fund will operate on a Great Britain wide basis and will initially provide top-up payments for hard-pressed producers caught up in the classical swine fever movement restriction zones currently operating in East Anglia. The fund will also deal with other areas of pig disease risks as and when they arise. The fund will be managed by a separate board appointed by the Meat and Livestock Commission in consultation with the industry and will comprise a majority representing levy payers.

The past few years have been a trying time for the pig industry, with prices generally

Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiau fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn gweithredu yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 23.10 yn cymeradwyo'r gorchymyn drafft, Cynllun Datblygu'r Diwydiant Moch (Cadarnhau) 2001, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 5 Chwefror 2001.

Cadarnha'r Gorchymyn hwn gynnig y Comisiwn Cig a Da Byw ar gyfer cynllun datblygu ar gyfer y diwydiant moch. Ariennir cronfa newydd i helpu i frwydro yn erbyn afiechydon moch drwy ardoll statudol. Gwneir y Gorchymyn o dan Ddeddf Amaethyddiaeth 1967 a sefydlodd y Comisiwn Cig a Da Byw, sef y prif gorff sydd yn gyfrifol am ofalu am fuddiannau'r diwydiant cig ym Mhrydain. Pwysleisiaf fod y mesur hwn heddiw yn fenter gan y diwydiant moch ac nid rhywbeth sydd yn cael ei orfodi ar y diwydiant gan y Llywodraeth.

Y prif nod yw sefydlu cronfa a ariennir gan ardoll statudol y bydd cynhyrchwyr moch yn ei dalu i ddelio ag afiechydon moch. Bydd yn darparu cyngor, gwasanaethau, cyfleusterau a chymorth ariannol i gynhyrchwyr moch Prydain i'w cynorthwyo wrth atal neu gyfyngu ar achosion o afiechyd moch ym Mhrydain Fawr. Gweithreda'r gronfa ar sail Prydain gyfan ac i ddechrau bydd yn darparu taliadau ychwanegol i gynhyrchwyr sydd o dan bwysau drwy fod o fewn parthau gwahardd symudiad y twymyn moch traddodiadol sydd yn gweithredu ar hyn o bryd yn East Anglia. Bydd y gronfa hefyd yn delio â meysydd eraill o risgiau yn ymwneud ag afiechydon moch wrth iddynt godi. Rheolir y gronfa gan fwrdd ar wahân a benodwyd gan y Comisiwn Cig a Da Byw mewn ymgynghoriad â'r diwydiant a bydd yn cynnwys mwyafrif sydd yn cynrychioli talwyr yr ardoll.

Mae'r ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf wedi bod yn gyfnod anodd i'r diwydiant moch,

depressed. The discovery of classical swine fever on an East Anglian farm on 8 August 2000 was a low point for the industry. Thankfully, the incidence of disease in pigs in Britain has been low, but the outbreak of classical swine fever last year shows the devastating effect it can have on the pig industry. The cost in terms of lost business, the disposal of affected stock and to the taxpayer can be very high. The UK Government has already paid out in excess of £4 million in compensation to farmers under the Animal Health Act 1981 for the slaughter of infected animals. In addition, the pig welfare disposal scheme was introduced on 29 August 2000 for the disposal of surplus animals from areas subject to restriction. Under this scheme, the UK Government is paying producers up to £50 per pig. That has cost the UK taxpayer over £13 million.

10:55 a.m.

Therefore, the UK Government is playing its part to help those affected. However, the industry as a whole has also responded and this Order is their initiative. The Order provides for a maximum charge of £1 per pig. However, the Meat and Livestock Commission propose to introduce the levy at 20p per pig in the first instance. In accordance with established practice, the levy will be collected from abattoir operators who will be responsible for recovering the charge from pig producers. There should therefore be little or no additional burden on those collecting the new levy.

The fund will raise an estimated £2.4 million annually based on current pig through put data from abattoirs. I estimate the Welsh contribution will be about £20,000 a year or less than 1 per cent of the total fund. That reflects the size of the Welsh pig industry compared to the rest of the UK. There are no additional financial implications for the National Assembly as the scheme will be funded by the industry through the statutory levy.

State aid clearance from the European Commission is expected any day: the matter was lodged with it on 6 December. Our

gyda phrisiau isel yn gyffredinol. Yr oedd canfod y twymyn moch traddodiadol ar fferm yn East Anglia ar 8 Awst 2000 yn bwynt isel i'r diwydiant. O drugaredd, mae nifer yr achosion affechedd ymhlith moch ym Mhrydain wedi bod yn isel, ond dengys yr achos o'r twymyn moch traddodiadol y llynedd yr effaith ddinistriol y gall ei chael ar y diwydiant moch. Gall y gost yn nhermau colli busnes, gwaredu stoc yr effeithwyd arnynt a'r gost i'r trethdalwr fod yn uchel iawn. Mae Llywodraeth y DU eisoes wedi talu dros £4 miliwn fel iawndal i ffermwyr o dan Ddeddf Iechyd Anifeiliaid 1981 am ladd anifeiliaid heintus. Yn ogystal, cyflwynwyd cynllun gwaredu moch ar 29 Awst 2000 ar gyfer gwaredu anifeiliaid sydd yn weddill o ardaloedd â chyfyngiadau ynddynt. O dan y cynllun hwn, mae Llywodraeth y DU yn talu hyd at £50 y mochyn i gynhyrchwyr. Mae hyn wedi costio dros £13 miliwn i drethdalwyr y DU.

Felly, mae Llywodraeth y DU yn chwarae ei rhan i helpu'r rhai hynny yr effeithiwyd arnynt. Fodd bynnag, ymatebodd y diwydiant cyfan hefyd a'u menter hwy yw'r Gorchymyn hwn. Darpara'r Gorchymyn ar gyfer uchafswm tâl o £1 y mochyn. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Comisiwn Cig a Da Byw yn bwriadu cyflwyn ardoll o 20c y mochyn i ddechrau. Yn unol ag arfer sefydledig, cesglir yr ardoll gan weithredwyr lladd-dai a fydd yn gyfrifol am adfer y tâl gan gynhyrchwyr moch. Felly, ni ddylai bod baich ychwanegol, os o gwbl, ar y rhai hynny sydd yn casglu'r ardoll newydd.

Bydd y gronfa'n casglu tua £2.4 miliwn y flwyddyn yn seiliedig ar ddata ar y nifer o foch a leddir mewn lladd-dai ar hyn o bryd. Amcangyfrifaf y bydd cyfraniad Cymru tua £20,000 y flwyddyn, neu lai nag 1 y cant o gyfanswm y gronfa. Adlewyrcha hynny faint y diwydiant moch yng Nghymru o'i gymharu â gweddill y DU. Nid oes unrhyw oblygiadau ariannol ychwanegol i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol oherwydd ariennir y cynllun drwy'r diwydiant drwy'r ardoll statudol.

Disgwylir cadarnhad cymorth y wladwriaeth gan y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd unrhyw ddydd: cyflwynwyd y mater iddo ar 6 Rhagfyr.

contacts with the Meat and Livestock Commission indicate that it has no difficulties with the scheme and formal clearance should take place soon. The Order has been the subject of extensive consultation by the Meat and Livestock Commission and representative bodies in Wales. The proposals were widely published in the industry press and on the internet.

The consultation process has been scrutinised by an independent arbiter. His assessment concludes that the consultation has been satisfactory. There is strong and unanimous support for this scheme within the British pig industry. It will help to control the spread of pig diseases and is being introduced at the industry's request.

Awgryma ein cysylltiadau â'r Comisiwn Cig a Da Byw nad oes ganddo unrhyw anawsterau â'r cynllun a dylai gyflwyno cadarnhad ffurfiol yn fuan. Bu'r Gorchymyn yn destun ymgynghoriad eang gan y Comisiwn Cig a Da Byw a chyrrff cynrychioliadol yng Nghymru. Cyhoeddwyd y cynigion yn helaeth yng ngwasg y diwydiant ac ar y rhyngwrwyd.

Archwiliwyd y broses ymgynghorol gan gymrodeddwr annibynnol. Canfydda ei asesiad y bu'r ymgynghoriad yn foddhaol. Ceir cefnogaeth gref ac unfrydol ar gyfer y cynllun hwn o fewn diwydiant moch Prydain. Bydd yn helpu i reoli ymlediad afiechydon moch a chaiff ei gyflwyno ar gais y diwydiant.

Cynnig: O blaid 41, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion: For 41, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Feld, Val
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny

Rogers, Peter
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion adopted.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 10:56 a.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 10:56 a.m.*

Adroddiad ar Amrywiaeth mewn Penodiadau Cyhoeddus Debate on the Diversity of Public Appointments Report

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Before we start this debate, I inform Members that I have to protect the time for the short debate. We have the minority party debate after this debate, which must take an hour and votes will take about five minutes. Unless we are going to extend today's session, we have four minutes for this debate. However, I have no powers at this stage other than to continue with this debate.

David Melding: I propose that

The National Assembly:

Endorses the broad proposals contained in the report from the Committee on Equality of Opportunity entitled 'Report for the National Assembly for Wales Equal Opportunities Committee on Public Appointments to Assembly sponsored public bodies', available on the intranet at

[http://assembly/committees/Equal%20Oppor%20tunities%20Committee/Meetings/2000/07-00\(25%20Oct\)/EOC-07-00\(p.1\)%20-%20draft%20report%20on%20public%20ap%20pointments.html](http://assembly/committees/Equal%20Oppor%20tunities%20Committee/Meetings/2000/07-00(25%20Oct)/EOC-07-00(p.1)%20-%20draft%20report%20on%20public%20ap%20pointments.html)

The National Assembly agrees that the Government of Wales report back on the progress towards implementation by July 2001.

The Assembly currently appoints over 800 people to its sponsored bodies. There are a wide range of organisations, from the Place Names Advisory Committee to NHS trusts and the Welsh Development Agency. Of those appointed, only 37 per cent are women, 1 per cent are from ethnic minorities and 2

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Cyn inni ddechrau ar y ddadl hon, hysbysaf yr Aelodau bod yn rhaid imi sicrhau bod amser ar gyfer y ddadl fer. Cynhelir y ddadl plaid leiafrifol ar ôl y ddadl hon, y bydd yn rhaid iddi barhau am awr a bydd y bleidlais yn cymryd tua phum munud. Oni bai ein bod am ymestyn y Cyfarfod heddiw, mae gennym bedair munud ar gyfer y ddadl hon. Fodd bynnag, nid oes gennyf unrhyw bwerau ar hyn o bryd ond i barhau â'r ddadl hon.

David Melding: Cynigiaf fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:

yn cymeradwyo'r egwyddorion cyffredinol a gynhwysir yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal 'Adroddiad i Bwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ar Benodiadau Cyhoeddus i Gyrrff Cyhoeddus a Noddir gan y Cynulliad', ac sydd i'w weld ar y fewnwyd yn:

[http://cynulliad/wcommittees/Equal%20Oppo%20rtunities%20Committee/Meetings/2000/07-00\(25%20Oct\)/EOC-07-00\(p.1\)_w.htm](http://cynulliad/wcommittees/Equal%20Oppo%20rtunities%20Committee/Meetings/2000/07-00(25%20Oct)/EOC-07-00(p.1)_w.htm)

Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn cytuno y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru adrodd yn ôl ar y camau a gymerwyd tuag at ei roi ar waith erbyn mis Gorffennaf 2001.

Penoda'r Cynulliad dros 800 o bobl ar hyn o bryd i'r cyrff a noddir ganddo. Ceir amrywiaeth eang o sefydliadau, o'r Pwyllgor Ymgynghorol ar Enwau Lleoedd i ymddiriedolaethau'r NHS ac Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru. O'r rhai a benodir, dim ond 37 y cant sydd yn ferched, daw 1 y cant o

per cent are disabled. As a result, the Cabinet has asked the Committee on Equality of Opportunity to examine the issue of public appointments. Research undertaken for the commissioner for public appointments has shown that the public has a vague, but negative, image of the public appointments process. There is a general impression that such service is dominated by white, middle-class males—in navy three-piece suits, no doubt. The public does not believe that the appointments process is fair and equitable. Rather, it sees it as being based on personal connections. We must work hard to change those negative impressions. Public appointments to Assembly sponsored public bodies must reflect the population at large and the communities that those bodies serve. That will improve the work of public services. Indeed, it is vital for efficient and appropriate public services that such representation is secured.

The Committee asked Wendy Morgan, senior personnel officer at BBC Wales, to write a report and make recommendations for future action. I am pleased to see Wendy in the Public Gallery this morning. I am pleased to present this excellent report to you today for your consideration. The Committee was determined to have a lively and insightful report, and we have not been disappointed. We asked Wendy Morgan to prepare a report that produced a programme of action to achieve applications for public appointments that are broadly representative of the Welsh population, especially in terms of gender, race and disability. Secondly, we asked her to prepare a report that enabled appointments to be made so that public bodies could better reflect the communities that they serve.

The broad findings of the report are that Wales has a large number of talented people suited to public service. It is appropriate that we start with that optimistic finding. However, we face a challenge in devising a system that attracts, recruits, retains and develops these talented people. The tasks that we expect members of public bodies to

leiafrifoedd ethnig ac mae 2 y cant yn anabl. O ganlyniad, gofynnodd y Cabinet i'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal gynnal archwiliad o benodiadau cyhoeddus. Dengys ymchwil a gynhaliwyd ar ran y comisiynydd penodiadau cyhoeddus mai delwedd amwys, ond negyddol sydd gan y cyhoedd o'r broses penodiadau cyhoeddus. Ceir argraff gyffredinol mai dynion gwyn, dosbarth canol sydd yn rhedeg gwasanaeth o'r fath—mewn siwtiau tridarn glas tywyll, mae'n siŵr. Ni chreda'r cyhoedd fod y broses benodiadau yn un deg. Yn hytrach, ystyrir ei bod yn seiliedig ar gysylltiadau personol. Rhaid inni weithio'n galed i newid yr argraffiadau negyddol hynny. Rhaid i benodiadau cyhoeddus i gyrff a noddur gan y Cynulliad adlewyrchu'r boblogaeth gyfan a'r cymunedau a wasanaethir gan y cyrff hynny. Bydd hynny'n gwella gwaith gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Yn wir, mae'n hanfodol y caiff cynrychiolaeth o'r fath ei sicrhau ar gyfer gwasanaethau cyhoeddus effeithlon a phriodol.

Gofynnodd y Pwyllgor i Wendy Morgan, uwch swyddog personél yn BBC Cymru, ysgrifennu adroddiad a gwneud argymhellion ar gyfer gweithredu yn y dyfodol. Mae'n bleser gennyf weld Wendy yn yr Oriel Gyhoeddus heddiw. Mae'n bleser gennyf gyflwyno'r adroddiad gwych hwn ichi ei ystyried heddiw. Yr oedd y Pwyllgor yn benderfynol o gael adroddiad bywiog a mewnwleddol, ac ni chawsom ein siomi. Gofynnwyd i Wendy Morgan baratoi adroddiad a fyddai'n cynhyrchu rhaglen weithredu i sicrhau ceisiadau ar gyfer penodiadau cyhoeddus sydd yn cynrychioli poblogaeth Cymru yn gyffredinol, yn arbennig o ran cenedl, hil ac anabledd. Yn ail, gofynnwyd iddi baratoi adroddiad a fyddai'n galluogi i benodiadau gael eu gwneud er mwyn i gyrff cyhoeddus adlewyrchu'n well y cymunedau a wasanaethir ganddynt.

Prif gasgliadau'r adroddiad yw bod gan Gymru nifer fawr o bobl dalentog sydd yn addas ar gyfer gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Mae'n briodol felly ein bod yn dechrau gyda'r canfyddiad gobeithiol hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn wynebu her wrth geisio llunio system sydd yn denu, recriwtio, cadw a datblygu'r bobl dalentog hyn. Rhaid cael

perform must be clearly defined, which they are often not at present. By defining the job that we expect such people to perform, we can attract the most suitable applicants. We also need imaginative methods, so that we can attract people to public service. We must make the best use of the media, and the Assembly must actively promote the principle of active citizenship.

The application and selection procedures must be positive and welcoming. We should welcome candidates' interest and enthusiasm. It is vital when we have candidates who have made good applications but have not been appointed, that we give them good, effective feedback so that they realise that they are not being rejected, but that there was a candidate with more suitable qualifications at that particular time. We do not want to put people off or to give them a cold response, where they feel that they are not being valued. Appointments must be made by an efficient process that selects on merit against advertised criteria. Public bodies, once they have made appointments, should ensure that they support and develop their board members. That is key to making the best use of talented people.

Such measures, as outlined in Wendy Morgan's report, offer a realistic opportunity to secure a public appointments process that reflects our diverse society. That is an aspiration of all parties in this Assembly. However, we must be realistic and recognise that the report does not, and does not attempt to, offer a quick fix. We must be vigilant in monitoring and evaluating any future progress. In this, we must engage with our partners, particularly in local government, industry, trade unions, the health service, other Assembly sponsored public bodies, voluntary organisations and those groups that are directly under-represented at present.

In conclusion, the Committee has also considered, in relation to public appointments, the establishment of a separate commissioner for public appointments for Wales. Recommendations may come forward

diffiniad clir o'r tasgau y disgwyliwn i aelodau cyrff cyhoeddus eu cyflawni, ac nid oes iddynt ddiffiniad clir yn aml ar hyn o bryd. Drwy ddiffinio'r swydd y disgwyliwn i bobl o'r fath ei chyflawni, gallwn ddenu ymgeiswyr mwy addas. Mae angen dulliau llawn dychymyg arnom hefyd, er mwyn denu pobl i faes gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Rhaid gwneud y defnydd gorau o'r cyfryngau, a rhaid i'r Cynulliad fynd ati i hyrwyddo'r egyddor o ddinasyddiaeth weithredol.

Rhaid i'r gweithdrefnau ymgeisio a dethol fod yn bositif a chadarnhaol. Dylem groesawu diddordeb a brwdfrydedd yr ymgeiswyr. Pan fydd gennym ymgeiswyr sydd wedi gwneud ceisiadau da ond heb gael eu penodi, mae'n holl bwysig ein bod yn rhoi adborth da ac effeithiol iddynt er mwyn iddynt sylweddi na chânt eu gwrthod, ond bod gan ymgeisydd gymwysterau mwy addas ar y pryd. Nid ydym am ddiflasu pobl na rhoi ymateb oer iddynt, lle byddant yn credu na chânt eu gwerthfawrogi. Rhaid gwneud penodiadau drwy broses effeithlon sydd yn dethol ar sail teilyngdod yn erbyn meini prawf a hysbysebwyd. Dylai cyrff cyhoeddus, ar ôl iddynt benodi, sicrhau eu bod yn cefnogi a datblygu aelodau eu bwrdd. Mae hyn yn holl bwysig er mwyn gwneud y defnydd gorau o bobl dalentog.

Cynigia mesurau o'r fath, fel yr amlinellir yn adroddiad Wendy Morgan, gyfle realistig i sicrhau proses penodiadau cyhoeddus sydd yn adlewyrchu ein cymdeithas amrywiol. Mae hynny yn uchelgais i'r holl bleidiau yn y Cynulliad hwn. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni fod yn realistig a chydabod nad yw'r adroddiad yn cynnig ateb cyflym nac yn ceisio gwneud hynny. Rhaid bod yn wylidwrus wrth fonitro a gwerthuso unrhyw gynnydd yn y dyfodol. Wrth wneud hyn, rhaid inni gynnwys ein partneriaid, yn arbennig mewn llywodraeth leol, diwydiant, undebau llafur, y gwasanaeth iechyd, cyrff cyhoeddus eraill a noddor gan y Cynulliad, sefydliadau gwirfoddol a'r grwpiau hynny sydd yn cael eu tangynrychioli'n uniongyrchol ar hyn o bryd.

I gloi, ystyriodd y Pwyllgor hefyd, mewn perthynas â phenodiadau cyhoeddus, sefydlu comisiynydd ar wahân ar gyfer penodiadau cyhoeddus i Gymru. Efallai y cyflwynir argymhellion yn y tymor canolig ar gyfer yr

in the medium term on that important consideration. It has also considered the revision of the arrangements for independent scrutiny of the public appointments process. We expect measures to come forward quite quickly. It is important when we make public appointments that people on the panel who independently scrutinise the process—

Alun Pugh: I have listened carefully to what you have said, David, and I do not doubt for a moment your commitment to equal opportunities. However, do you accept that your speech would carry more weight if your party had even one female AM?

11:05 a.m.

David Melding: This report is about public appointments and ensuring that they appropriately reflect the populations that they serve. Clearly, it would have been a better outcome for the Welsh Conservative Party if it had won more seats and if some of those had been won by women. According to the principle of equity, I give way to David Davies.

David Davies: Do you agree that there is a problem in representing young people in politics, and does he welcome the fact that three Conservative Members were elected who were under 30? That is a staggering record of achievement.

David Melding: That is a good point. We want the Assembly to reflect all people. To ensure that I am not seen as a Conservative Party hack—a dreadful fate—I will say that the way that the Assembly has had an effective gender balance is inspiring, particularly the Cabinet's balance. In my political mode I am critical of much of what the Executive does, but it has sent out a positive signal in its gender balance.

Cynog Dafis: Will David undertake to resign when he is 35? [*Laughter.*]

David Melding: I assume that Cynog is referring to David Davies rather than myself, as I would have to resign retrospectively from 1996, which is not my intention.

ystyriaeth bwysig honno. Ystyriodd hefyd ddiwygio'r trefniadau ar gyfer archwilio'r broses penodiadau cyhoeddus yn annibynnol. Disgwyliwn gael mesurau yn eithaf cyflym. Wrth inni wneud penodiadau cyhoeddus, mae'n bwysig bod y bobl sydd ar y panel sydd yn cynnal archwiliad annibynnol o'r broses—

Alun Pugh: Yr wyf wedi gwranddo'n ofalus ar yr hyn a ddywedaso, David, ac nid wyf yn amau am funud eich ymrwymiad tuag at gyfle cyfartal. Fodd bynnag, a dderbyniwch y byddai mwy o bwysau i'ch araith pe byddai gan eich plaid hyd yn oed un AC benywaidd?

David Melding: Penodiadau cyhoeddus yw testun yr adroddiad hwn a sicrhau eu bod yn adlewyrchu'r poblogaethau a wasanaethant yn briodol. Yn amlwg, byddai wedi bod yn ganlyniad gwell pe byddai Plaid Geidwadol Cymru wedi ennill mwy o seddau a phe byddai rhai o'r rhai hynny wedi'u hennill gan ferched. Yn ôl yr egwyddor o degwch, ildiaf i David Davies.

David Davies: A gytunwch bod problem o ran cynrychioli pobl ifanc mewn gwleidyddiaeth, ac a ydych yn croesawu'r ffaith yr etholwyd tri Aelod Ceidwadol sydd o dan 30? Mae hynny'n gyflawniad aruthrol.

David Melding: Mae hynny'n bwynt da. Yr ydym am i'r Cynulliad adlewyrchu pob math o bobl. Er mwyn sicrhau na chaf fy ystyried fel gwas bach i'r Blaid Geidwadol—a fyddai'n dynged ddychrynlyd—rhaid dweud bod y ffordd y sicrhoedd y Cynulliad gydbwysedd rhyw yn ysbrydoledig, yn arbennig o ran cydbwysedd y Cabinet. Yn fy swyddogaeth wleidyddol, yr wyf yn feirniadol o sawl peth a wna'r Weithrediaeth, ond mae wedi cyfleu neges bositif gyda'i chydbwysedd rhyw.

Cynog Dafis: A fydd David yn ymddiswyddo pan fydd yn 35? [*Chwerthin.*]

David Melding: Tybiaf fod Cynog yn cyfeirio at David Davies yn hytrach na mi, oherwydd byddai'n rhaid imi fod wedi ymddeol ers 1996, ac nid dyna yw fy mwriad.

I conclude by presenting the report to you and commending it. I also want to put on record the pleasure I have had in the work of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity, and the inspiration that all its members have taken from the cross-party nature of the work, and the way that we have been ably led by Edwina Hart. We are making major advances towards achieving a public appointments procedure that is transparent and accessible, and encourages talented people to come forward, and this report will be a great help to us.

Rosemary Butler: I join David in congratulating the Committee and Edwina in particular as Chair for her personal commitment to equal opportunities. This is an excellent, refreshing report.

I have raised the issue of advertising for Assembly sponsored public bodies posts on several occasions in different forums in the Assembly. The report has innovative and interesting suggestions about how to change the way we advertise. Wendy Morgan's ideas about creating articles and features about the roles of the various ASPBs were good.

However, we still need to consider where we advertise in the press. Why should editors include articles and features about ASPBs when we do not advertise in their newspapers? We must undertake a serious review of our policy on where we advertise, move away from the present exclusive regime, and have an inclusive one. I represent a constituency in south-east Wales where few people read *The Western Mail* and many people read the *South Wales Argus*, in which we never advertise. We should examine this. It appears that our view on placing advertisements is narrow. Can I have an assurance that this excellent report will be adopted but that this policy will be considered? I am not sure who would examine it; I have been told that it is a civil-service matter. I have raised this matter and have not been satisfied with the answers, and I raise it again now to ask this Plenary to request that the civil service reviews the policy.

I gloi, cyflwynaf a chymeradwyaf yr adroddiad ichi. Yr wyf hefyd am gofnodi'r boddhad a gefais gyda gwaith y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, a'r ysbrydoliaeth a gafodd ei aelodau yn sgîl natur traws-bleidiol y gwaith, a'r ffordd gadarn y cafodd ei lywio gan Edwina Hart. Yr ydym yn gwneud cynnydd mawr tuag at gyflawni gweithdrefn penodiadau cyhoeddus sydd yn glir a hygyrch, ac sydd yn annog pobl dalentog i ddod ymlaen, a bydd yr adroddiad hwn o gymorth mawr i ni.

Rosemary Butler: Ymunaf â David i longyfarch y Pwyllgor ac Edwina yn arbennig fel y Cadeirydd am ei hymrwymiad personol i gyfle cyfartal. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn un rhagorol, ffres.

Codais y mater o hysbysebu ar gyfer swyddi cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad ar sawl achlysur mewn gwahanol fforymau yn y Cynulliad. Ceir awgrymiadau llawn dyfeisgarwch a diddorol yn yr adroddiad ynglŷn â sut i newid y ffordd yr ydym yn hysbysebu. Yr oedd syniadau Wendy Morgan ar greu erthyglau ac ysgrifau ar rolau gwahanol gyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad yn dda.

Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni ystyried o hyd lle yr hysbysebwn yn y wasg. Pam y dylai golygyddion gynnwys erthyglau ac ysgrifau am gyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad pan nad ydym yn hysbysebu yn eu papurau newydd? Rhaid inni gynnal adolygiad trylwyr o'n polisi ynglŷn â lle yr hysbysebwn, rhoi'r gorau i ddefnyddio'r drefn bresennol, a defnyddio un gynhwysol. Cynrychiolaf etholaeth yn ne ddwyrain Cymru lle nad oes llawer o bobl yn darllen *The Western Mail* ac mae nifer o bobl yn darllen y *South Wales Argus*, ac nid ydym yn hysbysebu byth yn y papur hwnnw. Dylem edrych ar hyn. Ymddengys bod ein safbwynt ar osod hysbysebion yn gul. A allaf gael sicrwydd y mabwysiedir yr adroddiad gwych hwn ond y byddwn yn ystyried y polisi hwn? Nid wyf yn siŵr pwy fyddai'n ei archwilio; fe'm hysbyswyd mai mater i'r gwasanaeth sifil ydyw. Codais y mater hwn ac ni chefais atebion boddhaol, a chodaf y mater eto yn awr er mwyn gofyn i'r Cyfarfod Llawn hwn

wneud cais i'r gwasanaeth sifil adolygu'r polisi.

Helen Mary Jones: I will not repeat what David Melding has said, but I offer the full support of Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales to all of his comments, this report and the Committee's work on it. I also note that the report is not only the fruit of extensive discussions in the Committee on Equality of Opportunity and Wendy Morgan's first-class work, but also the product of years of campaigning, particularly by women's groups. I take this opportunity to pay tribute to the work of the Wales Assembly for Women, Merched y Wawr, the National Federation of Women's Institutes, Mewn Cymru and, more recently, the Wales Women's National Coalition. The Assembly must work closely with these organisations, and with disabled people's organisations and black and ethnic minority organisations, to encourage people from under-represented groups to put their names forward for public appointments. However, we must not only encourage people to put themselves forward, we must ensure that some of them are appointed, and that they are supported and retained in their posts. That may pose an even bigger challenge than recruitment itself. Too often in the past, when women have been recruited into such roles, they have quickly resigned, finding the whole working environment hostile and unwelcoming. If these plans are to work, public bodies will need to change their working practices, which will not be easy.

There are some key questions about public appointments that are not fully addressed in the report. Indeed, the report did not intend to address them. For example, remuneration for public service varies widely between bodies and often bears little relation to the nature of the duties undertaken. The administration also needs to take a hard look at how employers can be compensated when their employees undertake public service. Otherwise, the pool of people available for public service will remain limited. I trust that the Minister will, in developing the action plan from this report, be able to address these issues.

Helen Mary Jones: Ni wnaaf ailadrodd yr hyn a ddywedodd David Melding, ond hoffwn gynnig cefnogaeth lwyr Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales i'w holl sylwadau, yr adroddiad hwn a gwaith y Pwyllgor arno. Nodaf hefyd mai nid yn unig ffrwyth llafur trafodaethau helaeth y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal a gwaith gwych Wendy Morgan yw hyn, ond canlyniad blynyddoedd o ymgyrchu, gan grwpiau merched yn arbennig. Cymeraf y cyfle hwn i dalu teyrnged i waith Cynulliad Merched Cymru, Merched y Wawr, Ffederasiwn Cenedlaethol Sefydliad y Merched, Mewn Cymru ac, yn fwy diweddar, Cynghrair Cenedlaethol Merched Cymru. Rhaid i'r Cynulliad gydweithio'n agos â'r sefydliadau hyn, a chyda sefydliadau pobl anabl a sefydliadau pobl groenddu a lleiafrifoedd ethnig, er mwyn annog pobl o grwpiau a dangynrychiolir i gyflwyno eu hunain ar gyfer penodiadau cyhoeddus. Fodd bynnag, dylem nid yn unig annog pobl i gyflwyno eu hunain, ond dylem hefyd sicrhau y penodir rhai ohonynt, ac y cânt eu cefnogi a'u cadw yn eu swyddi. Gallai hynny gyflwyno her fwy hyd yn oed na'r broses recriwtio ei hun. Yn rhy aml yn y gorffennol, pan gafodd merched eu recriwtio i rolau o'r fath, maent wedi ymddiswyddo'n fuan wedi hynny, am fod yr amgylchedd gwaith yn anghyfeillgar ac anghroesawgar. Er mwyn i'r cynlluniau hyn lwyddo, bydd angen i gyrff cyhoeddus newid eu harferion gweithio, ac ni fydd hynny'n hawdd.

Mae rhai cwestiynau allweddol am benodiadau cyhoeddus na chawsant eu trafod yn llawn yn yr adroddiad. Yn wir, nid oedd yr adroddiad yn bwriadu eu trafod. Er enghraifft, amrywia'r gydnabyddiaeth ariannol am wasanaeth cyhoeddus yn helaeth rhwng cyrff ac nid oes cysylltiad yn aml rhyngddynt a natur y dyletswyddau yr ymgymerir â hwy. Mae angen i'r weinyddiaeth hefyd edrych yn ofalus ar sut y gellir digolledu cyflogwyr pan fydd eu cyflogaion yn ymgymryd â gwasanaeth cyhoeddus. Fel arall, bydd y gronfa o bobl sydd ar gael ar gyfer gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yn parhau yn gyfyngedig. Hyderaf y bydd y Gweinidog, wrth ddatblygu'r cynllun

gweithredu yn sgîl yr adroddiad hwn yn gallu mynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn.

In 1984, as part of a Wales Assembly of Women public appointments campaign, I put my name forward for consideration for appointment to the Agricultural Dwelling House Advisory Committee. Carwyn need not be concerned because I am not still seeking the job, but I did not get a response. That was the experience of many women and many people from under-represented groups through the 1980s and 1990s when they tried to put themselves forward. It shows how dismissive the old system was of those who simply did not fit. This way forward should ensure that in future all candidates receive due consideration based on their abilities; not that I think my suitability for the Agricultural Dwelling House Advisory Committee would have been great. All candidates must receive due consideration and in time the pattern of public appointments will be transformed.

The report sets out exactly how missionary work among women and others, recommended in Plenary some weeks ago by the First Minister, could be undertaken. We look to the administration to ensure widespread conversion. I commend this report to the National Assembly.

Peter Law: I am delighted to be able to speak in the Chamber today. I have waited for some time to have a chance to speak in this august gathering about quangos and appointments. It was one of my favourite issues before becoming a Member. I warmly welcome this report and I compliment the Minister on her initiative, and congratulate Wendy Morgan on her valued contribution in compiling the document. Reform is long overdue. When David Melding stood up to speak today, I was greatly impressed, because his personal commitment is unquestionable. However, it was rich coming from the Conservative group. Some of us have long been involved in these appointment systems. My mind goes back to the old days—

Alun Cairns: When Peter Law was in the Cabinet, what quangos did he wind-up and what pressure did he put on his colleagues to

Yn 1984, fel rhan o ymgyrch penodiadau cyhoeddus Cynulliad Merched Cymru, cyflwynais fy enw i gael ei ystyried ar gyfer penodiad ar Bwyllgor Ymgynghorol Anheddau Amaethyddol. Ni ddylai Carwyn boeni oherwydd nid wyf yn parhau i fynd ar drywydd y swydd hon, ond ni chefais ymateb. Dyna oedd profiad nifer o ferched a nifer o bobl o grwpiau a dangynrychiolir drwy'r 1980au a'r 1990au wrth wneud cais am swyddi. Dengys hyn pa mor ddiystyriol oedd yr hen system o'r rhai a oedd yn wahanol. Dylai'r ffordd hon ymlaen sicrhau y bydd pob ymgeisydd yn y dyfodol yn derbyn ystyriaeth deg ar sail eu gallu; nid fy mod yn amau y byddai fy addasrwydd ar gyfer y Pwyllgor Ymgynghorol Anheddau Amaethyddol wedi bod yn wych. Rhaid i bob ymgeisydd dderbyn ystyriaeth deg ac ymhen amser, gweddnewidir patrwm y system penodiadau cyhoeddus.

Noda'r adroddiad yn union sut y gellir ymgymryd â gwaith cenhadol ymhlith merched ac eraill, a argymhellwyd gan y Prif Weinidog mewn Cyfarfod Llawn rai wythnosau yn ôl. Edrychwn i'r weinyddiaeth i sicrhau yr ymgymerydd â'r trawsnewid hwn ar raddfa eang. Argymhellaf yr adroddiad hwn i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

Peter Law: Mae'n bleser gennyf siarad yn y Siambr heddiw. Yr wyf wedi aros cryn amser i gael cyfle i siarad yn y cyfarfod urddasol hwn am gwangos a phenodiadau. Dyna un o'm hoff bynciau llosg cyn dod yn Aelod. Croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn yn gynnes a hoffwn ganmol y Gweinidog ar ei blaengaredd, a llongyfarch Wendy Morgan ar ei chyfraniad gwerthfawr wrth lunio'r ddogfen. Mae angen ad-drefnu yn ddybryd. Pan gododd David Melding i siarad heddiw, creodd argraff fawr arnaf, oherwydd ni allaf amau ei ymrwymiad personol. Fodd bynnag, mae'n anhygoel mai'r grwp Ceidwadol sydd yn dweud hyn. Mae rhai ohonom wedi bod yn ymwneud â'r systemau penodi hyn ers cryn amser. Cofiaf yr hen ddyddiau—

Alun Cairns: Pan oedd Peter Law yn y Cabinet, pa gwangos a ddiiddymodd ef a pha bwysau a roddodd ar ei gyd-Aelodau i

wind-up quangos?

Peter Law: I cannot discuss that now. This is a short story, so Alun Cairns will appreciate it. Under the Tory regime in 1993 we had dial-a-quango. If the Tories could build up a quango, they did so. Where four would do instead of one, that was always much appreciated. The centralist approach was to take powers away from local democracy and to put it into the hands of quangos. I remember one morning in Gwent, we woke to find that from having a health authority we had three trusts and a health authority: four quangos stuffed full of people placed there by the Tories. They parachuted them in overnight—

David Davies and William Graham *rose*—

Peter Law: I will not give way. You need to hear this; it is therapy for you. Many people outside the Chamber want me to say this to you because it is possible that nobody has ever said it before. They were parachuted in overnight, without consultation, without Nolan standards and without shame. There was a time when there were so many Conservative appointees, it was almost 'buy-one-and-get-one-free' if you joined the Conservative Party. That was how you did it, you had a free appointment as well.

David Melding *rose*—

Peter Law: I will not give way. That was the situation. In those days there were only about six members of the Labour Party and trade union movement on health bodies throughout Wales. There were no Plaid Cymru members to my knowledge, unless there were Tory/Plaid Cymru members that I did not notice. Liberal Democrats were virtually on another planet. I wish they still were sometimes. Having said that, we need to remember those days, because they are not that long ago.

11:15 a.m.

We must remember with pride that, as a result of how this National Assembly has

ddiddymu cwangos?

Peter Law: Ni allaf drafod hynny yn awr. Stori fer yw hon, felly bydd Alun Cairns yn ei gwerthfawrogi. O dan drefn y Torïaid yn 1993 yr oedd cwangos ymhob man. Pe bai'n bosibl i'r Torïaid lunio cwango, byddent yn gwneud hynny. Lle byddai pedwar yn gwneud y tro yn lle un, gwerthfawrogwyd hynny'n fawr bob amser. Yr ymagwedd ganolog oedd cymryd pwerau oddi ar ddemocratiaeth leol a'u rhoi yn nwylo'r cwangos. Cofiaf un bore yng Ngwent, pan godais i glywed bod gennym dair ymddiriedolaeth ac awdurdod iechyd yn lle un awdurdod iechyd: pedwar cwango yn llawn o bobl a leolwyd yno gan y Torïaid. Cawsant eu parasiwtio yno dros nos—

David Davies a William Graham *a gododd*—

Peter Law: Nid ildiaf. Mae angen ichi glywed hyn; mae'n therapi ichi. Mae llawer o bobl y tu allan i'r Siambr hon yn awyddus imi ddweud hyn wrthy ch oherwydd mae'n bosibl nad oes neb wedi dweud hyn o'r blaen. Cawsant eu parasiwtio i mewn dros nos, heb ymgynghoriad, heb safonau Nolan a heb gywilydd. Yr oedd adeg pan oedd cymaint o bobl a benodwyd gan y Ceidwadwyr, fel ei bod yn sefyllfa 'prynu un a chael un arall am ddim' bron pe byddech yn ymuno â'r Blaid Geidwadol. Dyna sut yr oeddech yn gweithio, yr oeddech yn cael penodiad am ddim hefyd.

David Melding *a gododd*—

Peter Law: Nid ildiaf. Dyna oedd y sefyllfa. Yn y dyddiau hynny dim ond tua chwe aelod o'r Blaid Lafur a mudiad yr undebau llafur a oedd ar gyrff iechyd ledled Cymru. Nid oedd unrhyw aelodau o Blaid Cymru hyd y gwn i, oni bai bod aelodau Torïaidd/Plaid Cymru na sylwais arnynt. Yr oedd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ar blaned arall bron. Trueni na fyddent yno o hyd. Wedi dweud hynny, mae angen inni gofio'r dyddiau hynny, am nad oes cymaint o amser wedi mynd heibio ers hynny.

Rhaid inni gofio gyda balchder, fod gennym y system benodi fwyaf eglur a democrataidd

handled this, we have the most transparent and democratic appointment system in Britain. It is important to ensure that we have the wide cross-section of people to which David Melding referred. I was touched when he mentioned involving local government as partners again, because that was never recognised by the Conservatives—certainly up until the end of the last Conservative Government. So many people have a part to play. We must be careful that we do not go down the road of multi-quango people and of the great and good who are quango collectors. We do not need those people. We need to spread appointments out, because everyone has a part to play. That is what this document states.

I agree that we need to embrace new ways of searching for talent. We need expert advice occasionally. There are people in public relations who can help us. We need to jazz up advertisements and it is important to use the internet, the red-tops and local papers. That is a good approach. We do not want people to be intimidated by the system as many workers are. We do not want all-powerful senior civil servants wielding influence behind the scenes. That has happened in the past and civil servants can damn people with faint praise when they discuss multi-appointments with Ministers. When Ministers have to consider a line of appointments, they can sometimes get distracted. We need to ensure that they are vigilant. All of these issues need to be taken into account. We need to remember that the advertising must be in tune with what the community understands, because, with respect, civil servants do not always understand that type of advertising. That has been rightly pointed out.

Nolan standards could be considered and amended. If we think that we need to amend them, we should propose that, because they can restrict us in trying to find the right people for the right jobs. We want more women, people from ethnic minorities and disabled people. David Melding referred to that. I endorse that strongly—I would do, as I sit by Val Feld, who has made a great contribution to public life on behalf of women. We must ensure that more working

ym Mhrydain, o ganlyniad i'r ffordd y deliodd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol â hyn. Mae'n bwysig sicrhau bod gennym drawstoriad eang o bobl y cyfeiriodd David Melding atynt. Pleser oedd ei glywed yn sôn am gynnwys llywodraeth leol fel partneriaid eto, oherwydd ni chydabuwyd hynny gan y Ceidwadwyr erioed—yn arbennig hyd at ddiwedd cyfnod y Llywodraeth Geidwadol ddiwethaf. Gall cymaint o bobl gymryd rhan. Rhaid inni fod yn ofalus nad ydym yn dilyn llwybr pobl aml-gwango a'r mawrion sydd yn casglu cwangos. Nid oes angen y bobl hynny arnom. Mae angen lledaenu penodiadau, oherwydd bod gan bawb ran i'w chwarae. Dyna a ddywed y ddogfen hon.

Cytunaf fod angen inni ymgorffori ffyrdd newydd o chwilio am dalent. Mae angen cyngor arbenigol arnom weithiau. Mae pobl sydd yn gweithio ym maes cysylltiadau cyhoeddus a allai ein helpu. Mae angen bywiogi hysbysebion ac mae'n bwysig defnyddio'r rhyngwyd, y papurau teitlau coch a'r papurau lleol. Mae'n ymagwedd dda. Nid ydym am i'r system frawychu pobl fel sydd yn digwydd i gymaint o weithwyr. Nid ydym am gael uwch weision sifil hollbwerus sydd yn dylanwadu y tu ôl i'r llenni. Digwyddodd hyn yn y gorffennol a gall gweision sifil gollfarnu pobl gyda lled glod wrth drafod aml-benodiadau gyda Gweinidogion. Pan fo'n rhaid i Weinidogion ystyried nifer o benodiadau, gall pethau dynnu eu sylw weithiau. Mae angen sicrhau eu bod yn wylidwrus. Mae angen ystyried yr holl faterion hyn. Mae angen cofio y dylid llunio hysbysebion yn unol ô'r hyn a ddeallir gan y gymuned, oherwydd, gyda pharch, nid yw gweision sifil bob amser yn deall y math hwnnw o hysbysebu. Nodwyd hynny'n gwbl briodol.

Gellir ystyried a diwygio safonau Nolan. Os credwn bod angen eu diwygio, dylem gynnig hynny, oherwydd gallant gyfyngu arnom wrth geisio dod o hyd i'r bobl gywir ar gyfer y swyddi cywir. Yr ydym am gael mwy o ferched, pobl o leiafrifoedd ethnig a phobl anabl. Cyfeiriodd David Melding at hynny. Cymeradwyaf hynny'n gryf—fel y byddwn yn ei wneud, gyda Val Feld yn eistedd wrth fy ymyl, sydd wedi gwneud cyfraniad enfawr i fywyd cyhoeddus ar ran merched. Rhaid

people are informed of the results of these trawls. People must be given the answer, as Helen Mary said.

inni sicrhau yr hysbysir mwy o bobl sydd yn gweithio o ganlyniadau'r helfeydd hyn. Rhaid i bobl gael yr ateb, fel y dywedodd Helen Mary.

Finally, all Assembly Members should be informed about every public appointment that is made in Wales, so that we avoid the experience of walking down the road, meeting someone who says, 'Oh by the way, did you know so-and-so has been appointed?' and are left gawping, because we did not know. Members should be informed about all Assembly appointments.

I gloi, dylid hysbysu holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad am bob penodiad cyhoeddus a wneir yng Nghymru, er mwyn osgoi'r profiad o gerdded i lawr y stryd, a chyfarfod â rhywun sydd yn dweud, 'Wyddech chi fod hwn a'r llall wedi'i benodi?' ac nad oedd syniad gennych am hyn. Dylid hysbysu'r Aelodau am holl benodiadau'r Cynulliad.

Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion

Nick Bourne: In the absence of the Minister for Assembly Business, I would like to propose a procedural motion. As there is an hour for the minority debate and half an hour for the short debate, it would be appropriate to extend business so that we can hear more from Members who have sat on quangos, such as Peter Law, Val Feld, Jane Hutt and, indeed, the Presiding Officer. The Conservatives are so even-handed that we have distributed these appointments among the parties. We need to hear more about that. Therefore, I propose that we extend the time for debate.

Nick Bourne: Yn absenoldeb y Trefnydd, hoffwn gynnig cynnig trefniadol. Oherwydd bod awr ar gyfer dadl y blaidd leiafrifol a hanner awr ar gyfer y ddadl fer, byddai'n briodol ymestyn busnes er mwyn inni allu clywed gan fwy o Aelodau sydd wedi bod ar gwangos, megis Peter Law, Val Feld, Jane Hutt ac, yn wir, y Llywydd. Mae'r Ceidwadwyr mor ddiuedd fel ein bod wedi dosbarthu'r penodiadau hyn ymhlith y pleidiau. Mae angen inni glywed mwy am hynny. Felly, cynigiau ein bod yn ymestyn yr amser ar gyfer y ddadl.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Extending business will not suffice, because there is a Committee meeting at 2 p.m. We cannot, therefore, sensibly extend business after 1 p.m. If we adjourn this debate, that would take the session to 12:45 p.m. Therefore, there is a choice.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Ni wnaiff ymestyn y ddadl y tro, gan fod cyfarfod Pwyllgor am 2 p.m. Felly, ni allwn ymestyn busnes ar ôl 1 p.m. mewn gwirionedd. Os gohiriwn y ddadl hon, byddai'r Cyfarfod yn parhau tan 12:45 p.m. Felly, mae dewis.

Nick Bourne: May I suggest an adjournment of the debate, then, since it is so important?

Nick Bourne: A gaf awgrymu ein bod yn gohirio'r dadl hon felly, gan ei bod mor bwysig?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: We must either adjourn this debate or the next one. We cannot adjourn the short debate. In view of your comments and the problem of timing, it would not be an abuse of Assembly procedures for me to accept a procedural motion. We must vote on it immediately and at least 10 people must signify support.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Rhaid inni naill ai ohirio'r ddadl hon neu'r un nesaf. Ni allwn ohirio'r ddadl fer. Yn sgîl eich sylwadau a'r broblem amseru, ni fyddwn yn mynd yn groes i weithdrefnau'r Cynulliad drwy dderbyn cynnig trefniadol. Rhaid inni bleidleisio ar hyn ar unwaith a rhaid i o leiaf 10 o bobl ddangos cefnogaeth.

The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies): Further to that, I have had private discussions with the party business managers. I suggest that the debate continues and that the business managers meet to discuss how to deal with this and come forward with proposals.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: We still have a procedural motion to deal with. You can vote against that motion, if you are of that mind. A further procedural motion can be proposed later, if the party managers so decide. Do you formally propose, Nick, that this debate be adjourned?

Nick Bourne: Yes. I propose that

The National Assembly, under Standing Order No. 6.18, adjourns the debate on the diversity of public appointments report.

It is an important debate and I know that many Members wish to speak. As the time is short, unless the minority party debate is withdrawn—and I would not suggest that that be done for a second time—they will be unable to do so. Therefore, it would be appropriate to adjourn this debate to another day.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Do 10 Members support this motion? I see that they do. We will therefore proceed to a vote.

Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Ymhellach at hynny, cefais drafodaethau preifat gyda rheolwyr busnes y pleidiau. Awgrymaf y dylai'r ddadl barhau a dylai'r rheolwyr busnes gwrdd i drafod sut i ddelio â hyn a chyflwyno cynigion.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae gennym gynnig trefniadol o hyd i'w drafod. Gallwch bleidleisio yn erbyn y cynnig hwnnw, pe dymunech wneud hynny. Gellir cynnig cynnig trefniadol pellach yn nes ymlaen, os mai dyma fydd penderfyniad rheolwyr y pleidiau. A ydych yn cynnig yn ffurfiol, Nick, y dylid gohirio'r ddadl hon?

Nick Bourne: Ydwyf. Cynigiau fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.18, yn gohirio'r ddadl ar adroddiad ar amrywiaeth penodiadau cyhoeddus.

Mae'n ddadl bwysig a gwn fod nifer o Aelodau'n dymuno siarad. Gan fod amser yn brin, oni thynnir dadl y blaid leiafrifol yn ôl—ac nid awgrymaf y dylid gwneud hynny am yr ail waith—ni allant wneud hynny. Felly, byddai'n briodol gohirio'r ddadl hon ar gyfer diwrnod arall.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: A oes 10 Aelod sydd yn cefnogi'r cynnig hwn? Gwelaif fod . Felly awn ymlaen â'r bleidlais.

Cynnig: O blaid 13, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 25.

Motion: For 13, Abstain 0, Against 25.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Halford, Alison
Lewis, Huw
Melding, David
Pugh, Alun
Rogers, Peter
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
Feld, Val
Gwyther, Christine
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann

Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Law, Peter
 Lloyd, David
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.
 Motion rejected.*

Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Point of order. I inform the Assembly that the Culture Committee is meeting at the National Museum of Wales at 1 p.m., not 2 p.m. Therefore, extending the debate on public appointments causes difficulty for members of that Committee.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I am sorry that we got the time of the meeting wrong. However, we have just voted against a motion to adjourn the debate. The party business managers are meeting to discuss this and we are in their hands. As Chair, I must continue the debate. I have no choice in this matter.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Pwynt o drefn. Hysbysaf y Cynulliad y cynhelir cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Diwylliant yn Amgueddfa Genedlaethol Cymru am 1 p.m. nid am 2 p.m. Felly, mae ymestyn y ddadl ar benodiadau cyhoeddus yn creu anhawster i aelodau'r Pwyllgor hwnnw.

Y Dirprwy Llywydd: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf ein bod wedi nodi amser y cyfarfod yn anghywir. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym newydd bleidleisio yn erbyn cynnig i ohirio'r ddadl. Mae rheolwyr busnes y pleidiau yn cwrdd i drafod hyn ac yr ydym yn dibynnu arnynt hwy. Fel y Cadeirydd, rhaid inni barhau â'r ddadl hon. Nid oes gennyf ddewis ar y mater hwn.

Adroddiad ar Amrywiaeth mewn Penodiadau Cyhoeddus: Parhad The Diversity of Public Appointments Report: Continued

Pauline Jarman: Following on from Helen Mary's contribution, it is well known that Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales recognises that the Labour administration has said it supports equality of opportunity in public appointments and that there has been a change of direction. However, it does not always happen in practice. There are two notable examples. If we consider the recent appointments to the Welsh Development Agency board, seven men were appointed to fill seven vacancies. When questioned about the lack of gender balance in the appointments, I recall that the First Minister responded by suggesting that we use missionaries to attract applications from women. That was shortly followed by appointments to the National Council for

Pauline Jarman: Gan ddilyn ymlaen o gyfraniadau Helen Mary, gwyddom fod Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales yn cydnabod bod y weinyddiaeth Lafur wedi dweud ei bod yn cefnogi cyfle cyfartal mewn penodiadau cyhoeddus ac y cafwyd newid cyfeiriad. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hyn bob amser yn digwydd yn ymarferol. Ceir dwy enghraifft amlwg o hyn. Os ystyriwn y penodiadau diweddar i fwrdd Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, penodwyd saith dyn i lenwi saith lle gwag. Wrth holi am y diffyg cydbwysedd cenedl yn y penodiadau, cofiaf y Prif Weinidog yn ymateb drwy awgrymu ein bod yn defnyddio cenhadon i ddenu ceisiadau gan ferched. Yna cafwyd penodiadau i Gyngor Cenedlaethol Addysg a Hyfforddiant Cymru, a elwir bellach yn Addysg a Dysgu Cymru.

Education and Training for Wales, now known as Education and Learning Wales. I acknowledge that a woman was appointed as its Chair, but the rest of the senior management team is male. It must be noted that these posts were filled after open competition and a series of interviews.

In welcoming any initiative to improve equality in public appointments—to ‘Assembly sponsored public bodies’ if you are politically correct, or ‘quangos’ if you are not—will the Minister indicate whether the Labour/Liberal Democrat administration is still committed to the bonfire of quangos that was promoted as something that the National Assembly could deliver within its limited powers? Can we expect to witness that wonderful spectacle in Cardiff Bay on 5 November during any year of its remaining term in office?

Has any regard been given to twinning as a vehicle to deliver gender balance in these public bodies? Has it any merit to commend it to bureaucratic, as opposed to democratic, institutions?

David Davies: Following that rather naked bit of party politicking from Peter Law, I am delighted to return to the topic that we were meant to be discussing in the first place. I welcomed Peter Law’s speech. He has more experience of quangos than almost anyone, because he has served on most of them and was appointed by a Conservative Government. However, meritocratic principles have always been a cornerstone of Conservative thinking, so it is no surprise to find that a Conservative ably chairs the Committee on Standards of Conduct. Although the Conservatives do not in any way subscribe to positive discrimination or promoting people above their merits, the aim of this document—to increase the diversity of those who serve on public bodies in Wales—is one that I am sure all Conservative Party Members will support 100 per cent.

Cydnabyddaf y penodwyd merch fel ei Gadeirydd, ond mae gweddill y tîm o uwch reolwyr yn ddyinion. Dylid nodi y llenwyd y swyddi hyn ar ôl cystadleuaeth agored a chyfres o gyfweiliadau.

Wrth groesawu unrhyw fenter i wella cydraddoldeb wrth wneud penodiadau cyhoeddus—i ‘gyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad’ os ydych am fod yn wleidyddol gywir, neu ‘cwangos’ os nad ydych—a wnaiff y Gweinidog ddweud a yw’r weinyddiaeth Lafur/Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn dal yn ymrwymedig i’r broses o goelcerthu cwangos fel rhywbeth y gallai’r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ei gyflawni o fewn ei bwerau cyfyngedig? A allwn ddisgwyl gweld y digwyddiad gwych hwnnw ym Mae Caerdydd ar 5 Tachwedd yn ystod unrhyw flwyddyn sydd yn weddill o’i chyfnod mewn grym?

A roddwyd unrhyw ystyriaeth i efeillio fel dull o gyflawni cydbwysedd rhyw yn y cyrff cyhoeddus hyn? A oes iddo unrhyw deilyngdod i’w argymhell i sefydliadau biwrocraidd, yn hytrach nac i sefydliadau democrataidd?

David Davies: Yn dilyn y gwleidyddia pleidiol amlwg gan Peter Law, yr wyf wrth fy modd yn dychwelyd at y pwnc y dylem fod yn ei drafod o’r dechrau. Croesawaf araith Peter Law. Mae ganddo fwy o brofiad o gwangos nag unrhyw un arall bron, am iddo wasanaethu ar y rhan fwyaf ohonynt a chael ei benodi gan y Llywodraeth Geidwadol. Fodd bynnag, bu egwyddorion meritocrataidd yn gonglfaen i safbwyntiau Ceidwadol erioed, felly nid yw’n syndod canfod bod Ceidwadwr yn cadeirio’r Pwyllgor ar Safonau Ymddygiad mewn ffordd mor fedrus. Er nad yw’r Ceidwadwyr mewn unrhyw ffordd yn ceisio gwahaniaethu’n bositif neu’n hyrwyddo pobl y tu hwnt i’w teilyngdod, bydd nod y ddogfen hon—sef cynyddu amrywiaeth y rhai sydd yn gwasanaethu ar gyrff cyhoeddus yng Nghymru—yn sicr o fod yn un y bydd Aelodau’r Blaid Geidwadol yn ei gefnogi 100 y cant.

11:25 a.m.

However, I draw Members' attention to a paragraph, which appeared in my print out on page 14 of the report. I have some minor concerns about this, which I am sure will be answered. The paragraph begins:

'In advertisements, use language that is inclusive. Be aware of phrases and descriptions that directly or indirectly discriminate against women, disabled people or black and ethnic minority people.'

That is fair enough. I agree with that. However, the next sentence begins ungrammatically:

'that fluency in Welsh is an essential requirement for all public appointments.'

I am not clear what that means. It does not make grammatical sense. However, if it implies that fluency is essential, then I would be concerned, because fluency in Welsh may be desirable but it is certainly not essential. If we give the impression that it is essential then we should not be surprised if people from ethnic minorities, who are less likely to speak Welsh, do not apply for these jobs.

The next sentence also concerns me. It begins:

'What about 'flyers' in other languages such as

I am not sure what is meant by 'flyers'. I presume that it refers to leaflets of some sort. However, I do not see why these languages should be singled out. What about German, Italian, French or other European languages? What about Indonesian? There is a large population of Indonesian speakers in Cardiff. Singling out certain languages is not sensible. After all, there is a large Italian community in Cardiff. At the end of the day, we should be just as willing to say that Italians should be represented on public bodies as those from the Indian sub-continent.

More to the point, why should we advertise in different languages? We all agree that we need to represent the different ethnic communities in Wales. However, clearly—and I am sorry to upset people—an ability to

Fodd bynnag, hoffwn dynnu sylw'r Aelodau at baragraff, a ymddangosodd ar dudalen 14 o'r hallbrint i o'r adroddiad. Mae gennyf fân bryderon am hyn, a hyderaf y cânt eu hateb. Dechreua'r paragraff:

Mae hynny'n ddigon teg. Cytunaf â hynny. Fodd bynnag, dechreua'r frawddeg nesaf yn anramadegol:

Nid wyf yn sicr beth yw ystyr hyn. Nid yw'n gwneud synnwyr yn ramadegol. Fodd bynnag, os awgryma fod bod yn rhugl yn hanfodol, byddai hynny'n peri pryder imi, oherwydd efallai y byddai bod yn rhugl yn y Gymraeg yn ddymunol ond yn sicr nid yw'n hanfodol. Os rhoddwn yr argraff fod hyn yn hanfodol yna ni ddylem synnu os na fydd pobl o leiafrifoedd ethnig, sydd yn llai tebygol o siarad Cymraeg, yn gwneud cais am y swyddi hyn.

Mae'r frawddeg nesaf hefyd yn peri pryder imi. Dechreua:

Urdu, Bengali, Arabic, Chinese or Punjabi?'

Nid wyf yn siŵr beth yw ystyr 'flyers'. Cymeraf fod hyn yn cyfeirio at daflenni o ryw fath. Fodd bynnag, ni ddeallaf pam y dylid nodi'r ieithoedd hyn yn benodol. Beth am Almaeneg, Eidaleg, Ffrangeg ac ieithoedd Ewropeaidd eraill? Beth am Indoneseg? Mae nifer fawr o siaradwyr Indoneseg yng Nghaerdydd. Nid yw'n synhwyrol nodi rhai ieithoedd yn benodol. Wedi'r cyfan, ceir cymuned Eidalaid fawr yng Nghaerdydd. Yn y pen draw, dylem fod yr un mor barod i ddweud y dylai Eidalwyr gael eu cynrychioli ar gyrff cyhoeddus â'r rhai o is-gyfandir India.

Yn fwy penodol, pam y dylem hysbysebu mewn gwahanol ieithoedd? Yr ydym oll yn gytun y dylem gynrychioli cymunedau ethnig gwahanol yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, yn amlwg—ac ymddiheuraf am gynhyrfu pobl—

speaking English is bound to be a prerequisite. Anyone appointed to a public body must be fluent in English and possibly in Welsh as well. Advertising in other languages could be said to be a waste of public money.

Having said all this, the vast majority of ideas in this report are sensible and I am pleasantly surprised. Let us be careful not to undermine the majority of sensible ideas in this report by pandering and throwing a few bones to the politically correct lobby.

Val Feld: I welcome this report and I am pleased that we are having this debate. I will refer to a few points in David Davies's speech. I agree with him on several issues. However, I do not agree that this is pandering to the politically correct lobby. You fail to understand, David, the importance of these appointments to the management of major public services in Wales and the difference that it makes when there is a range of experience on a management board in terms of how that organisation delivers its services. I am sorry that you still do not understand this. I have discussed it on many occasions with Alun Cairns. However, there is no question whatsoever about the fact that men and women have different experiences in many aspects of their lives. Young people and old people have different experiences and indigenous Welsh white people, black people and Asian people have different experiences. Our public services seek to cater for all those people. Therefore, bringing those experiences into the decision-making structures of our public services is vital.

I will make three points. I am delighted that this debate is taking place, but I am disappointed by our slow progress. We are making progress, but it is not enough. The figures that I received indicate that there are currently 233 women sitting on our NHS boards. Jane Hutt has been doing considerable work in that sector. Many women work there, as it is an easier sector to work in. However, only 68 women sit on our Assembly sponsored public bodies. I cannot distinguish from these figures whether those are 68 individuals or 68 appointments. We

mae'r gallu i siarad Saesneg yn sicr o fod yn hanfodol. Rhaid i unrhyw un a benodir i gorff cyhoeddus allu siarad Saesneg yn rhugl a Chymraeg o bosibl hefyd. Gellid dweud y byddai hysbysebu mewn ieithoedd eraill yn wastraff arian cyhoeddus.

Wedi dweud hyn oll, mae'r mwyafrif helaeth o'r syniadau yn yr adroddiad hwn yn synhwyrol a chefais fy siomi ar yr ochr orau. Gadewch inni beidio â thanseilio'r mwyafrif o syniadau synhwyrol yn yr adroddiad hwn drwy ryngu bodd a thafllu ambell asgwrn i'r lobi gwleidyddol gywir.

Val Feld: Croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn ac yr wyf yn falch ein bod yn cael y ddadl hon. Cyfeiriaf at ambell bwynt yn araith David Davies. Cytunaf ag ef ar sawl mater. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn cytuno bod hyn yn rhyngu bodd y lobi gwleidyddol gywir. Ni ddeallwch, David, bwysigrwydd y penodiadau hyn ar gyfer rheoli gwasanaethau cyhoeddus amlwg yng Nghymru a'r gwahaniaeth a wna pan fo amrywiaeth o brofiad ar fwrdd rheoli o ran sut y cyflwynar sefydliad hwnnw ei wasanaethau. Gresynaf nad ydych yn deall hyn o hyd. Yr wyf wedi ei drafod ar sawl achlysur gydag Alun Cairns. Fodd bynnag, nid oes amheuaeth o gwbl am y ffaith bod gan ddynion a merched brofiadau gwahanol mewn sawl agwedd ar eu bywydau. Mae gan bobl ifanc a'r henoed brofiadau gwahanol ac mae gan bobl wyn frodorol o Gymru, pobl groenddu a phobl Asiaidd brofiadau gwahanol. Ceisia ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ddarparu ar gyfer yr holl bobl hyn. Felly, mae cynnwys y profiadau hynny o fewn strwythurau llunio penderfyniadau ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn hanfodol.

Gwnaf dri phwynt. Yr wyf yn falch iawn y cynhaliwyd y ddadl hon, ond yr wyf wedi fy siomi gan ein cynnydd araf. Yr ydym yn gwneud cynnydd, ond nid yw'n ddigon. Dengys y ffigurau a dderbyniais bod 233 o ferched ar ein byrddau NHS ar hyn o bryd. Gwnaeth Jane Hutt waith sylweddol yn y sector hwnnw. Mae llawer o ferched yn gweithio ynddo, am ei fod yn sector haws i weithio ynddo. Fodd bynnag, dim ond 68 o ferched sydd yn eistedd ar gyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad. Ni allaf ddweud o'r ffigurau hyn pa un a yw'r rhain yn 68 o

still have the problem that, once we get people on to public bodies, we tend to recycle them and have them sit on several public bodies one after another. The challenge is to bring new people in so that we spread our pool of expertise and do not use the same people over and over again.

Alison Halford: I support your point. I know a well-qualified lady—I will not tell you who she is—who has managed to get into this upper magic circle. She is being used and now holds six different appointments. We need to consider this carefully. More power to your elbow in making that point.

Val Feld: I am sure that those women who get pilloried as ‘quango queens’ would support the importance of spreading appointments widely. They would wish that to happen and, in my experience, have worked hard to encourage that. It seems to me—Edwina will know this better than I—that we still have a ratio of about three men for every woman who holds a public appointment. That is by no means good enough. Recently, I had the embarrassing experience of being a member of the panel that appointed seven men to the WDA board. That is no longer acceptable. I feel ashamed that that was the case. However, we did not have sufficient numbers of women coming through the system. Similarly, when we made appointments to the Welsh Industrial Development Advisory Board recently, we only had one woman applicant. She was stunning, and we appointed her as the Chair. However, we had insufficient numbers of women coming through the system.

Christine Chapman: Women bear a disproportionate burden of domestic work and even in dual income families, women, in the main, run the home. The ‘new man’ is a rare creature in Wales. Do you agree that until we tackle this root cause of inequality, we will have difficulties in getting women to come forward for public appointments?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Val Feld, your five minutes are over.

unigolion neu 68 o benodiadau. Erys y broblem o hyd ein bod yn tueddu, ar ôl inni lwyddo i gael pobl ar gyrff cyhoeddus, i’w hailgylchu a’u cael i eistedd ar sawl corff cyhoeddus, un ar ôl y llall. Yr her yw cyflwyno pobl newydd er mwyn inni allu taenu ein cronfa o arbenigedd a pheidio â defnyddio’r un bobl drosodd a throsodd.

Alison Halford: Cefnogaf eich pwynt. Gwn am wraig gymwys iawn—nid wyf am ddatgelu ichi pwy ydyw—sydd wedi llwyddo i ymuno â’r cylch cyfrin hwn. Caiff ei defnyddio ac mae bellach yn dal chwe phenodiad gwahanol. Mae angen inni ystyried hyn yn ofalus. Dylech bwysleisio’r pwynt hwn yn gryfach.

Val Feld: Yr wyf yn sicr y byddai’r merched hynny a gaiff eu gwawdio fel ‘brenhinesau’r cwangos’ yn cefnogi pwysigrwydd taenu penodiadau’neang. Byddent yn dymuno i hynny ddigwydd ac, o’r profiad i, byddent wedi gweithio’n galed i annog hynny. Ymddengys i mi—fe wyddoch chi fwy am hyn na mi Edwina—fod gennym gymhareb o hyd o tua tri dyn i bob merch sydd yn ddeiliad penodiad cyhoeddus. Nid yw hyn yn ddigon da o bell ffordd. Yn ddiweddar, cefais y profiad annifyr o fod yn aelod o banel a benododd saith dyn i fwrdd y WDA. Nid yw hyn yn dderbyniol bellach. Teimlaf gywilydd mai dyna a ddigwyddodd. Fodd bynnag, nid oedd gennym nifer digonol o ferched yn dod drwy’r system. Yn yr un modd, pan wnaethom benodiadau i Fwrdd Ymgynghorol Datblygu Diwydiannol Cymru yn ddiweddar, dim ond un ferch a gyflwynodd gais. Yr oedd hi’n wych, a chafodd ei phenodi’n Gadeirydd gennym. Fodd bynnag, ni ddaeth nifer digonol o ferched drwy’r system.

Christine Chapman: Mae merched yn wynebu baich anghyfartal o waith domestig a hyd yn oed mewn teuluoedd dau incwm, merched, yn bennaf, sydd yn rhedeg y cartref. Mae’r ‘dyn newydd’ yn greadur prin yng Nghymru. Oni chytunwch y byddwn yn profi anawsterau wrth geisio cael merched i gyflwyno eu hunain ar gyfer penodiadau cyhoeddus oni fyddwn yn mynd i’r afael â’r hyn sydd wrth wraidd anghydraddoldeb?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Val Feld, mae eich pum munud wedi dod i ben.

Val Feld: I will just deal with that comment and then close. The work on public appointments is part of a larger work programme that must take place in equal opportunities. That is why I ask Edwina to address employers' attitudes towards releasing their staff for public appointments. We have the potential to influence that through the Assembly, given the number of organisations that we fund. Many women work in low status jobs and it is not easy for them to negotiate with employers to get the time off. That is important.

I strongly support the proposal for a central unit. We must work at this in a sustained way over a long period. This is a major step forward. We need greater transparency and, as Assembly Members, we need to know more about the appointments and who is being appointed. We should monitor this over the coming months and years.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: We have had a good debate. I am conscious of time. Six more Members have indicated that they wish to speak and I apologise that they will not be called. Those speakers who have not been called will find it easier to catch my eye next time.

The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart): I would be grateful to have in writing the comments of the six speakers who were not called, and the comments of any other Members, on this report. I am delighted that we have had the opportunity, albeit too briefly, to debate this matter today, because it is important. I thank David Melding, on behalf of the Committee, for proposing the motion. It shows party unity. We can all harp on about what has happened in the past, but this is a positive step forward in how we should deal with public appointments.

I would like to deal with Rosemary's point on advertising, as it is a key point. The majority of people do not look for public appointments in *The Western Mail*. We must consider whether we should advertise in local newspapers or media and whether we should ask the BBC, S4C and others about running

Val Feld: Ymatebaf i'r sylw hwnnw ac wedyn byddaf yn cloi. Mae gwaith ar benodiadau cyhoeddus yn rhan o raglen waith fwy y dylid ei chynnal mewn cyfle cyfartal. Dyna paham y gofynnaf i Edwina fynd i'r afael ag ymagweddau cyflogwyr tuag at ryddhau eu staff ar gyfer penodiadau cyhoeddus. Mae gennym y potensial i ddylanwadu ar hyn drwy'r Cynulliad, o ystyried nifer y sefydliadau a noddwn. Mae llawer o ferched yn gweithio mewn swyddi â statws isel ac nid yw'n hawdd iddynt drafod cael amser o'r gwaith gyda chyflogwyr. Mae hyn yn bwysig.

Cefnogaf yn gryf y cynnig ar gyfer uned ganolog. Rhaid inni weithio ar hyn mewn ffordd gynaliadwy dros gyfnod hir. Mae hyn yn gam mawr ymlaen. Mae angen mwy o eglurder ac, fel Aelodau'r Cynulliad, mae angen inni wybod mwy am y penodiadau a phwy a benodir. Dylem fonitro hyn yn ystod y misoedd a'r blynyddoedd nesaf.

Y Diprwy Lywydd: Cawsom ddadl dda. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r amser. Nododd chwe Aelod arall eu bod yn dymuno siarad ac ymddiheuraf na chânt eu galw. Bydd yn haws i'r siaradwyr hynny na chawsant eu galw ddal fy sylw y tro nesaf.

Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart): Hoffwn dderbyn sylwadau ysgrifenedig y chwe siaradwr na chawsant eu galw, a sylwadau unrhyw Aelodau eraill, ar yr adroddiad hwn. Yr wyf yn falch iawn inni gael y cyfle, er mai cyfle byr ydoedd, i drafod y mater heddiw, oherwydd ei fod yn bwysig. Diolchaf i David Melding, ar ran y Pwyllgor, am gyflwyno'r cynnig. Pwysleisia undod y pleidiau. Gallwn oll sôn byth a beunydd am yr hyn a ddigwyddodd yn y gorffennol, ond mae hwn yn gam cadarnhaol ymlaen o ran sut y dylwn ddelio â phenodiadau cyhoeddus.

Hoffwn ymateb i bwynt Rosemary ar hysbysebu, gan ei fod yn bwynt allweddol. Nid yw'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yn chwilio am benodiadau cyhoeddus yn *The Western Mail*. Rhaid inni ystyried a ddylem hysbysebu mewn papurau newydd neu yn y cyfryngau lleol ac a ddylem ofyn i'r BBC, S4C ac eraill

items on the ethos of public service. Those are key areas.

ynghlych rhedeg eitemau ar ethos gwasanaeth cyhoeddus. Mae'r rhain yn feysydd allweddol.

11:35 a.m.

David Davies referred to flyers. The purpose of flyers is to inform people about public appointments in their native tongues. The other point to which David referred is a typographical error. It was not included in my original copy of the report.

Cyfeiriodd David Davies at 'flyers'. Diben 'flyers' yw hysbysu pobl am benodiadau cyhoeddus yn eu mamiaith. Mae'r pwynt arall y cyfeiriodd David ato yn gamgymeriad argraffyddol. Nid oedd hwn ar fy nghopi gwreiddiol o'r adroddiad.

I assure Rosemary that advertising will be reviewed. Many Members raised the issue of advertising, not only in terms of public appointments, but in general. If the Assembly so wishes, I will ask my officials to consider this and report back to me.

Sicrhaf Rosemary y byddwn yn adolygu'r drefn hysbysebu. Cododd nifer o'r Aelodau y mater o hysbysebu, nid yn unig o ran penodiadau cyhoeddus, ond yn gyffredinol. Os dymuna'r Cynulliad, gofynnaf i'm swyddogion ystyried hyn ac adrodd yn ôl imi.

Helen Mary Jones mentioned that recruitment is not the only issue. That is essential, as another important issue is how you feel after being appointed to a public body. Some Members raised the remuneration issue, which is also key. We must seriously consider remuneration across the board in respect of public appointments. Why do some appointments appear to be more important than others because those appointed are paid? All appointments are important. We must ensure the right balance. Further work must be done on that in the context of this review.

Crybwyllodd Helen Mary Jones nad recriwtio yw'r unig fater dan sylw. Mae hyn yn holl bwysig, a mater pwysig arall yw'r ffordd yr ydych yn teimlo ar ôl cael eich penodi i gorff cyhoeddus. Cododd rai Aelodau'r mater o gydnabyddiaeth, sydd hefyd yn fater holl bwysig. Rhaid inni ystyried o ddifrif gydnabyddiaeth yn gyffredinol mewn perthynas â phenodiadau cyhoeddus. Pam fod rhai penodiadau'n ymddangos yn fwy pwysig nag eraill oherwydd y telir y rhai a benodir? Mae pob penodiad yn bwysig. Rhaid inni sicrhau'r cydbwysedd cywir. Rhaid gwneud mwy o waith ar hynny yng nghyd-destun yr adolygiad hwn.

As Peter Law said, we must consider every public appointment. Committees are advised of appointments made within their subject area. I will consider how all Members can have instant access to a central databank, perhaps, where they could find out whether any public appointments have been made in health or the environment, for example. That would be of great assistance to Members.

Fel y dywedodd Peter Law, rhaid inni ystyried pob penodiad cyhoeddus. Cyngorir pwyllgorau am benodiadau a wneir o fewn eu maes pwnc. Byddaf yn ystyried sut y gall pob Aelod gael mynediad i gronfa ddata ganolog ar unwaith, efallai, lle y gallant gael gwybod a wnaethpwyd unrhyw benodiadau cyhoeddus ym maes iechyd neu'r amgylchedd, er enghraifft. Byddai hynny o gymorth mawr i'r Aelodau.

Pauline Jarman's point on the board of the WDA was well made. Val Feld acknowledged her guilt about being a member of the panel that selected that board. Issues such as gender balance and so on will be applicable. However, I must first try to ensure that the maximum number of people

Cyflwynodd Pauline Jarman bwynt da ar fwrdd WDA. Cydnabu Val Feld ei heuogrwydd ynghlych bod yn aelod o'r panel a ddewisodd y bwrdd hwnnw. Bydd materion fel cydbwysedd rhyw ac ati yn berthnasol. Fodd bynnag, rhaid imi geisio sicrhau bod y nifer uchaf posibl o bobl yn cymryd rhan yn

participate in the process. If we get the first steps right, an appropriate balance will naturally emerge on public bodies in five or 10 years' time.

I will consider several other issues, including slow progress. However, I do not think that we have been that slow. We must set realistic targets for ourselves and the report covers a vast range of areas. This will not be the last debate on this subject in the Assembly. We will return to this issue. It is now up to the Executive to consider all the proposals contained in the report and report back on them, either to the Committee on Equality of Opportunity or to Plenary. The report has financial implications. Another key step is for me to speak to all Assembly Ministers about their responsibilities. I have agreed to do that, as it is my duty. A vast number of public appointments are made in health. Jane Hutt has undertaken substantial reviews in the health sector and we want to develop the good practice that has emerged there. The report recommends the creation of a central recruitment centre. However, what is needed is the centralisation of good practice, which may not require an administrative change. We must consider that carefully.

The most important aspect of the report that we must consider is how we use networks to target people properly. It is the duty of the National Assembly Executive to report back in detail to Members on all the key issues that have risen in the report and on how implementation can be undertaken. I believe that we will achieve something by those means. One important issue that has been raised is appointing a separate commissioner for Wales. The Committee is keen on that. Further work also needs to be undertaken on the role of independent assessors. By taking those practical measures, as well as taking action on headline issues, we will achieve something.

I thank Members for the opportunity to discuss this today. As well as speaking to Ministers, I will speak individually to all Assembly Members who have been involved in public appointments to gather their

y broses. Os cymerwn y camau cyntaf cywir, bydd cydbwysedd priodol yn deillio'n naturiol ar gyrff cyhoeddus ymhen pum neu 10 mlynedd.

Ystyriaf sawl mater arall, yn cynnwys cynnydd araf. Fodd bynnag, ni chredaf ein bod wedi bod mor araf â hynny. Rhaid inni osod targedau realistig i ni ein hunain ac mae'r adroddiad yn cwmpasu amrywiaeth eang o feysydd. Nid hon fydd y ddadl olaf ar y pwnc hwn yn y Cynulliad. Dychwelwn at y mater hwn. Cyfrifoldeb y Weithrediaeth bellach yw ystyried yr holl gynigion a geir yn yr adroddiad ac adrodd yn ôl arnynt, naill ai i'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal neu i'r Cyfarfod Llawn. Mae goblygiadau ariannol i'r adroddiad hwn. Cam allweddol arall imi fydd siarad â holl Weinidogion y Cynulliad am eu cyfrifoldebau. Cytunais wneud hynny, oherwydd dyma yw fy nyletswydd. Gwneir nifer helaeth o benodiadau cyhoeddus ym maes iechyd. Cynhaliodd Jane Hutt adolygiadau sylweddol yn y sector iechyd ac yr ydym am ddatblygu'r arfer da a ddeilliodd yno. Argymhellir yn yr adroddiad y dylid creu canolfan recriwtio ganolog. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn sydd ei angen yw canoli arfer da, ac efallai na fydd hyn yn gofyn am newid gweinyddol. Rhaid inni ystyried hynny'n ofalus.

Yr agwedd bwysicaf ar yr adroddiad y bydd yn rhaid inni ei hystyried yw sut y defnyddiwn rwydweithiau i dargedu pobl yn briodol. Dyletswydd Gweithrediaeth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yw adrodd yn ôl mewn cryn fanylder i'r Aelodau ar yr holl faterion allweddol a godwyd yn yr adroddiad a sut y gellir eu gweithredu. Credaf y gallwn gyflawni rhywbeth drwy ddefnyddio'r dulliau hynny. Un mater arall a godwyd yw penodi comisiynydd ar wahân ar gyfer Cymru. Mae'r Pwyllgor yn awyddus i weithredu hynny. Mae angen gwneud gwaith pellach hefyd ar rôl aseswyr annibynnol. Drwy gymryd y mesurau ymarferol hynny, yn ogystal â gweithredu ar y prif faterion, gallwn gyflawni rhywbeth.

Diolchaf i'r Aelodau am y cyfle i drafod hyn heddiw. Yn ogystal â siarad â'r Gweinidogion, siaradaf yn unigol â holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad sydd wedi bod yn gysylltiedig â phenodiadau cyhoeddus i

opinions. If any other Member wants to talk to me about public appointments before I set work in train on behalf of the administration, I would be delighted to hear their views and those of their constituents.

gasglu eu safbwyntiau. Os dymuna unrhyw Aelod arall siarad â mi am benodiadau cyhoeddus cyn imi ddechrau ar y gwaith ar ran y weinyddiaeth, hoffwn dderbyn eu sylwadau hwy a rhai eu hetholwyr.

Cynnig: O blaid 40, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion: For 40, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Delyth
Feld, Val
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion adopted.

Datganiad gan y Dirprwy Lywydd Statement by the Deputy Presiding Officer

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I understand from party business managers that the short debate can be postponed. I thank Janice

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Deallaf gan reolwyr busnes y pleidiau y gellir gohirio'r ddadl fer. Diolchaf i Janice Gregory am gytuno â

Gregory for agreeing to that. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'It cannot be postponed.'] In that case, the party business managers must discuss this again.

Janice Gregory: I have an important meeting at 1 p.m. with the Deputy First Minister and a manufacturer in my constituency. It has been arranged for some time and I cannot continue with the short debate if it means that I have to miss that meeting. I place on record my grave concerns for the ordinary Assembly Member's right to have a short debate. I have waited 20 months for the opportunity to conduct a short debate.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: We must make progress. Everybody is in the service of the Assembly and the Plenary session here. Nothing is more important than that. We shall proceed with business.

Glyn Davies: Point of order. I have previously asked to postpone a short debate and I was refused point blank. What is your interpretation of the current position? I was keen to hear Janice's contribution today and will be disappointed if it is cancelled, but will you rule whether it is cancelled or postponed?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I will take advice on that and make a statement later. In the interest of time, we should move on.

hynny. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'Ni ellir ei gohirio.'] Os felly, rhaid i reolwyr busnes y pleidiau drafod hyn eto.

Janice Gregory: Mae gennyf gyfarfod pwysig am 1 p.m. gyda'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a gweithgynhyrhydd yn fy etholaeth. Fe'i trefnwyd ers peth amser ac ni allaf barhau â'r ddatl fer os golyga hynny fod yn rhaid imi golli'r cyfarfod hwnnw. Cofnodaf fy mhryderon dybryd ynglŷn â hawl yr Aelod cyffredin o'r Cynulliad i gael datl fer. Arhosais 20 mis am y cyfle i gynnal datl fer.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Rhaid inni symud ymlaen. Mae pawb yng ngwasanaeth y Cynulliad a'r Cyfarfod Llawn yma. Nid oes dim yn bwysicach na hynny. Fe barhawn â busnes.

Glyn Davies: Pwynt o drefn. Gofynnais yn y gorffennol am ohirio datl fer ac fe'm gwrthodwyd yn syth. Beth yw eich dehongliad o'r sefyllfa gyfredol? Yr oeddwn yn awyddus i glywed cyfraniad Janice heddiw a byddaf yn siomedig os caiff ei ganslo, ond a ddyfarnwch pa un a gaiff y ddatl ei chanslo neu ei gohirio?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Cymeraf gyngor ar hynny a gwnaf ddatganiad yn ddiweddarach. O ran amser, dylem symud ymlaen.

Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru): Iawndal ar gyfer Cyn-lowyr Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru): Compensation for Former Miners

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 in the names of William Graham and Alun Cairns and amendment 2 in the name of Andrew Davies.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Cynigaf fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn mynegi ei bryder ynghylch yr oedi mewn perthynas â delio â hawliadau am iawndal gan gyn-lowyr a'u teuluoedd yng Nghymru yn dilyn dyfarniad yr Uchel Lys ar 23 Ionawr 1998, ac mae'n galw ar Brif Weinidog Cymru i ddwyn pwysau sylweddol ar lywodraeth y DU i:

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dewis gwelliant 1 yn enw William Graham ac Alun Cairns a gwelliant 2 yn enw Andrew Davies.

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): I propose that

the National Assembly expresses its concern at the delay in dealing with claims for compensation by former miners and their families in Wales following the High Court ruling on the 23 January 1998, and calls on the First Minister to make the strongest representations to the UK Government to:

gyflogi mwy o staff meddygol a gweinyddol i gyflymu'r broses o brosesu'r hawliadau; *employ more medical and administrative staff to speed up the processing of claims;*

rhoi'r gorau i adhawlio taliadau budd-dâl o'r hawliadau a dalwyd, a hynny ar unwaith; ac *to abolish its clawback of benefit payments from the settled claims immediately; and*

i roi'r gorau i herio elfen colli pensiwn yr hawliadau iawndal. *end its challenge to the pension loss element of compensation claims.*

Yr wyf yn falch o'r cyfle i agor y ddadl gyntaf ar y mater hwn yn y Cynulliad. I am glad of the opportunity to open the first debate on this matter in the Assembly.

Dair blynedd yn ôl, ar 23 Ionawr 1998, enillodd cyn-lowyr achos yn yr Uchel Lys yn deillio o'r afiechyd yr oeddynt wedi'i ddiodeff yn sgîl gweithio yn y pyllau glo. Er iddynt ennill yr achos, ychydig iawn o deuluoedd sydd wedi derbyn iawndal. Dyna pam mae'r cynnig hwn gerbron y Cynulliad heddiw. Three years ago, on 23 January 1998, former miners won a case in the High Court arising from the disease that they had suffered as a result of working in the coal mines. Although the case was won, very few families have received compensation. That is why this motion is before the Assembly today.

Rhaid cydnabod bod yr oedi parhaol hwn yn peri loes difrifol i'r cyn-lowyr a'u teuluoedd. Pwrpas y cynnig hwn yw rhoi cyfle i'r Cynulliad—yn unol, gobeithio—bwyso ar Lywodraeth y DU i gyflymu'r broses i sicrhau y telir yr iawndal yn fuan. Er bod yr achos wedi'i ennill, mae'r broses sydd yn rhaid mynd drwyddi er mwyn derbyn yr arian yn anodd. Mae'n broses hir a biwrocraataidd sydd yn peri loes i'r teuluoedd gan fod rhaid gofyn cwestiynau di-ben-draw, cynnal profion meddygol, casglu tystiolaeth ar gyfer pob achos, ceisio adfachu taliadau budd-dâl a cheir oedi rhwng pob cam. Ein gobaith heddiw yw y gall y Cynulliad siarad ag un llais i gynyddu'r pwysau ar Lywodraeth y DU i gyflymu'r broses ac i weithredu ar fyrder. We must acknowledge that the endless delays cause grave concern to former miners and their families. The purpose of this motion is to give the Assembly an opportunity to—hopefully, unanimously—put pressure on the UK Government to speed up this process to ensure that compensation is paid promptly. Although the case was won, the process that must be gone through in order to receive the money is difficult. It is a long, bureaucratic process which causes the families concern, with its endless questions, medical tests, gathering of evidence for every case, attempts to claw back benefit payments and delays between each stage. Our hope today is that the Assembly can speak with one voice to increase the pressure on the UK Government to speed up the process and to act promptly.

Mae hwn yn gynnig y gall pob plaid ei gefnogi ac uno y tu ôl iddo, i alw ar Stephen Byers ac Alistair Darling i gymryd camau penodol i symud hyn ymlaen. Yr wyf yn siomedig fod y weinyddiaeth wedi cyflwyno gwelliant i ddiddymu tri o'r pwyntiau yr ydym wedi'u cyflwyno fel rhan o'r cynnig. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiaf, wedi gwrando ar y drafodaeth ac yn yr ysbryd yr ydym yn cynnig y cynnig, y bydd yn tynnu gwelliant 2 yn ôl. This is a motion that all parties can support and unite behind in calling on Stephen Byers and Alistair Darling to take measures to move this forward. I am disappointed that the administration has tabled an amendment to delete three of the points that we have proposed as part of the motion. However, I hope that, after listening to the debate, and in the spirit in which we propose the motion, it will withdraw amendment 2.

The scale of the problem facing former miners and their families in securing compensation is enormous. Some 29,000 claims have been lodged for compensation in Wales and more are lodged every week. No-one knows how many claims there will eventually be. At the current rate of progress it will take several years to deal with the current claims. That is unacceptable. Progress has been painfully slow and the process that the miners and their families must endure is stressful and time consuming.

Investigations into possible claims by the National Association of Colliery Overmen, Deputies and Shotfirers in south Wales began as long ago as 1988 and judgment was eventually given in 1998. It took 10 years to settle the case. Despite the long court battle, every case must be fought over. However, some of the delays are inexcusable.

11:45 a.m.

By the week ending 21 January 2001, out of the then 27,000 claimants, only 455 full medical assessments had been carried out. In the same week, there were around 2,000 new claimants, which is why more medical staff are needed urgently to handle the claims. In early 1999, the Department of Trade and Industry said that it would complete full medical assessments at the rate of 2,500 per month and after the summer of 2000, at the rate of 4,000 per month. However, by the end of 2000 it was completing less than 2,000 per month, which is less than half its target. In the last few days, we have learnt that more medical staff are to be recruited. It would be good to know—perhaps the Cabinet's response at the end of this debate will tell us—how many extra staff are to be recruited and what the current targets are for dealing with those claims?

I am pleased to note that the Government in London has now conceded that the priority system to deal with the oldest and sickest claimants first—agreed some time ago—will now be implemented. I hope that that will be

Mae maint y broblem sydd yn wynebu cyn-lowyr a'u teuluoedd wrth sicrhau iawndal yn anferth. Cofnodwyd tua 29,000 o geisiadau am iawndal yng Nghymru a chofnodir mwy bob wythnos. Ni wyr neb faint o geisiadau a fydd yn y pen draw. Fel y mae pethau ar hyn o bryd cymer sawl blwyddyn i ddelio â'r ceisiadau presennol. Mae hynny'n annerbyniol. Bu cynnydd yn llafurus o araf ac mae'r broses y mae'n rhaid i'r glowyr a'u teuluoedd ei dioddef yn rhoi pwysau mawr arnynt ac yn mynd â llawer o'u hamser.

Dechreuodd ymchwiliadau i geisiadau posibl gan Gymdeithas Genedlaethol Goruchwylwyr Pyllau Glo, Dirprwyon a Thanwyr (NACODS) yn ne Cymru mor bell yn ôl â 1988 a gwnaethpwyd dyfarniad yn y pen draw yn 1998. Cymerodd 10 mlynedd i setlo'r achos. Er gwaethaf y frwydr hir yn y llys, rhaid ymladd dros bob achos. Serch hynny, mae rhai o'r achosion o oedi yn anfaddeuol.

Erbyn yr wythnos a ddaeth i ben 21 Ionawr 2001, o'r 27,000 a wnaeth gais am iawndal ar y pryd, dim ond 455 o asesiadau meddygol llawn a oedd wedi eu cynnal. Yn yr un wythnos, cafwyd tua 2,000 o hawlwr newydd, sydd yn egluro pam bod angen mwy o staff meddygol ar frys i ymdrin â'r ceisiadau. Ar ddechrau 1999, dywedodd yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant y byddai'n cwblhau asesiadau meddygol llawn ar gyfradd o 2,500 y mis ac ar ôl haf 2000, ar gyfradd o 4,000 y mis. Fodd bynnag, erbyn diwedd 2000 yr oedd yn cwblhau llai na 2,000 y mis, sydd yn llai na hanner ei tharged. Yn yr ychydig ddyddiau olaf, clywsom y caiff mwy o staff meddygol eu recriwtio. Byddai'n dda gwybod—ac efallai y bydd ymateb y Cabinet ar ddiwedd y ddadl yn dweud hyn—faint o staff ychwanegol a gaiff eu recriwtio a beth yw'r targedau cyfredol ar gyfer delio â'r ceisiadau hynny?

Mae'n bleser gennyf nodi bod y Llywodraeth yn Llundain bellach wedi cytuno y caiff y system flaenoriaethu i ddelio â'r hawlwr hynaf a mwyaf sâl yn gyntaf—y cytunwyd arni beth amser yn ôl—ei gweithredu yn awr.

acted on soon. In some cases, the UK Government is challenging liability, and at a late stage in other cases, is raising fresh legal challenges to avoid paying full compensation. There are instances where loss of earnings is being challenged. What is most stressful for the families and, in many cases, the seriously ill claimants, is that many of these challenges are being made at the last moment, even when the assessment process is all but completed. In some cases, that is putting pressure on claimants to settle for less than their full entitlement. That is wrong, and those challenges have to stop.

The Conservative Government introduced the recovery of benefit provisions in 1989. That allowed the state to recover benefits paid to claimants from the compensation that they receive. That did not apply to those in whom the onset of the disease or injury had occurred before 1989. In September 1997, the current Government introduced regulations that made the clawback provisions retrospective, thereby sweeping many claimants, including miners, into the clawback system. However, even when the Compensation Recovery Unit has lodged clawback claims, in many cases, it has disastrously miscalculated the amount to be recovered. For example, in one case in the Rhondda, the unit claimed back over £21,000 of benefit. On first appeal, that was reduced to £8,500, and on eventual appeal to £6.38. In another case, an original claim of almost £20,000 was reduced to £22.02. Unfortunately, in both cases, the miners died before receiving their compensation. In 80 per cent of these cases, trivial sums between nil and £100 are being recovered. However, it takes up to 12 months to settle them. It is clearly costing the Government far more in bureaucracy and administration to claim back the money than the sum it eventually receives. That is creating unnecessary stress for the families; it cannot be right and should not be allowed to continue. The answer is simple: you either abolish the 1997 regulations, or you amend them to exempt miners and their families.

Gobeithiaf y gweithredir ar hynny'n fuan. Mewn rhai achosion, mae Llywodraeth y DU yn herio atebolrwydd, ac ar gam hwyr mewn achosion eraill, yn codi heriau cyfreithiol newydd er mwyn osgoi talu iawndal llawn. Ceir enghreifftiau o gyflog a gollwyd yn cael ei herio. Yr hyn sydd yn rhoi'r pwysau mwyaf ar y teuluoedd ac, mewn llawer o achosion, ar yr hawlwyd sydd yn ddifrifol wael, yw y caiff llawer o'r heriau hyn eu codi ar y funud olaf, hyd yn oed pan fydd y broses asesu fwy neu lai wedi ei chwblhau. Mewn rhai achosion, mae hynny'n rhoi pwysau ar hawlwyd i setlo am lai na'r hyn y mae ganddynt yr hawl i'w gael. Mae hynny'n anghywir, ac mae'n rhaid i'r herio hyn ddod i ben.

Cyflwynodd y Llywodraeth Geidwadol system adennill darpariaethau budd-dâl yn 1989. Caniataodd hynny i'r wladwriaeth adennill budd-daliadau a dalwyd i hawlwyd o'r iawndal a dderbyniant. Nid oedd hynny'n berthnasol i'r rheini lle yr oedd yr afiechyd wedi dechrau neu'r anaf wedi digwydd cyn 1989. Ym mis Medi 1997, cyflwynodd y Llywodraeth gyfredol reoliadau a wnaeth y darpariaethau adfachu yn ôl-weithredol, gan ddwyn llawer o'r hawlwyd, gan gynnwys y glowyr, i mewn i'r system adfachu. Fodd bynnag, hyd yn oed pan fo'r Uned Adennill Iawndal wedi cofnodi ceisiadau adfachu, mewn llawer o achosion, mae wedi camgyfrifo yn drychinebus y swm i'w adennill. Er enghraifft, mewn un achos yn y Rhondda, hawliodd yr uned dros £21,000 o fudd-dâl yn ôl. Ar ôl yr apêl gyntaf, gostyngwyd hynny i £8,500, ac ar ôl yr apêl derfynol, fe'i gostyngwyd i £6.38. Mewn achos arall, gostyngwyd cais gwreiddiol o bron £20,000 i £22.02. Yn anffodus, yn y ddau achos, bu farw'r glowyr cyn iddynt gael eu hiawndal. Mewn 80 y cant o'r achosion hyn, adenillir symiau bach rhwng dim a £100. Fodd bynnag, cymer hyd at 12 mis i ddelio â hynny. Yn amlwg, mae'n costio llawer mwy i'r Llywodraeth o ran biwrocratiaeth a gweinyddiaeth i hawlio'r arian yn ôl na'r swm a gaiff yn y pen draw. Mae hynny'n rhoi pwysau diangen ar y teuluoedd; ni all hyn fod yn iawn ac ni ddylid caniatáu iddo barhau. Mae'r ateb yn syml: naill ai diddymwch reoliadau 1997 neu diwygiwch hwy er mwyn eithrio glowyr a'u teuluoedd.

There is also a challenge on pension entitlements, which means that where a miner has had to give up work before reaching a pensionable age, he loses from his pension the value of the contributions that he would have made had he continued working. That should change, and the Government should accept that that should be part of the compensation. In essence, we are calling for the following measures: first, more medical staff and clear targets to remove the backlog. Unless that happens, it will take several years to get full assessment in all these cases. Secondly, to ensure that the priority system of dealing with the oldest and sickest miners is implemented without further delay. Thirdly, to abolish or amend the clawback system, and fourthly, to include the pension loss element in the claim. I am sure that Members will be aware that we are discussing miners who have suffered chronic illnesses such as bronchitis, emphysema, chronic obstructive airway disease and asthma. Why should they be put through more stress and anxiety?

These men and their families have suffered enough. They gave the best years of their lives to the coal industry and they should now be treated with dignity and respect. Today, the Assembly has a clear duty to tell the UK Government not to put these families through more suffering and distress. It also has a responsibility to stand up for communities in all parts of Wales. The coal mining communities have suffered enough. We demand action to end the scandalous delays in settling these claims and, of all issues, the Assembly, above all else, has an obligation to speak with one voice on this.

Glyn Davies: I propose amendment 1 in the name of William Graham and Alun Cairns. Place a full stop after 'January 1998' and insert

The persistent changes in ministerial responsibility for this matter has compounded the delay

before 'and calls on'.

Caiff yr hawl i dderbyn pensiwn ei herio hefyd, sydd yn golygu pan fydd glöwr yn gorfod rhoi'r gorau i weithio cyn cyrraedd oed pensiwn, cymerir o'i bensiwn werth y cyfraniadau y byddai wedi eu gwneud pe bai wedi parhau i weithio. Dylai hynny newid, a dylai'r Llywodraeth dderbyn y dylai hynny fod yn rhan o'r iawndal. Yn y bôn, galwn am y mesurau canlynol: yn gyntaf, mwy o staff meddygol a thargedau clir i ddileu'r gwaith sydd wedi ôl-gronni. Oni ddigwydd hynny, cymer sawl blwyddyn i gael asesiad llawn ym mhob un o'r achosion hyn. Yn ail, sicrhau y gweithredir y system flaenoriaethu o ddelio â'r glowyr hynaf a mwyaf sâl heb oedi pellach. Yn drydydd, diddymu neu ddiwygio'r system adfachu, ac yn bedwerydd, cynnwys yr elfen colli pensiwn yn y cais. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yr Aelodau yn ymwybodol ein bod yn sôn am lowyr sydd wedi dioddef salwch cronig fel bronchitis, emffysema, afiechyd pibell aer rhwystrol cronig ac asthma. Pam y dylent ddioddef rhagor o straen a gofid?

Mae'r dynion hyn a'u teuluoedd wedi dioddef digon. Rhoddasant flynyddoedd gorau eu bywydau i'r diwydiant glo a dylid eu trin yn awr ag urddas a pharch. Heddiw, mae gan y Cynulliad ddyletswydd glir i ddweud wrth Lywodraeth y DU i beidio â gwneud i'r teuluoedd hyn ddioddef a gofidio mwy. Mae ganddo gyfrifoldeb hefyd i sefyll o blaid cymunedau ym mhob rhan o Gymru. Mae cymunedau'r pyllau glo wedi dioddef digon. Mynnwn fod camau'n cael eu cymryd i ddod â'r oedi gwarthus hwn i ben drwy dalu'r ceisiadau hyn ac, o'r holl faterion dan sylw, mae gan y Cynulliad, yn anad dim, rwymedigaeth i siarad ag un llais ar y mater hwn.

Glyn Davies: Cynigiau welliant 1 yn enw William Graham ac Alun Cairns. Rhodder atalnod llawn ar ôl 'Ionawr 1998' ac ychwaneger

Mae'r newidiadau parhaus mewn cyfrifoldeb gweinidogol am y mater hwn wedi ychwanegu at yr oedi

cyn 'ac mae'n galw ar'

I am pleased to have the opportunity to speak on this today, although I have always lived in a part of Wales where there is no coal and few coal miners. I have always had a great personal sympathy with the suffering that, for decades, has destroyed the lives of so many miners and their families. That sympathy is felt by many farming families in Wales, particularly among my generation and previous ones. I will explain why.

I will share with the Assembly a typical farmer's life in rural Wales in my youth during, what I will call, 'the age of the threshing box' and before the arrival of the combine harvester. Corn was cut and tied-up into sheaves in the field with a binder. After weathering, they were carried into the stack yard and built into huge stacks, which many of you may have seen on Christmas cards. Later in the year, the threshing box would arrive—a massive itinerant Heath Robinson contraption—along with the neighbours. Everyone would set about the major operation of separating the grain from the chaff and the straw.

Like all young farmers, I began my threshing career on the chaff chute, progressing to pikle from the stack. I still recall the thrill when I was first allowed to undertake the top job, which was feeding the drum. The way in which farmers came together to thrash their corn, as they did to shear their sheep and stick their pigs, created a sense of community that is so typical of our mining communities. On threshing day, there was much drinking of cider and I remember a man called Uncle Monty, who could yodel and would catch rats that lived in these giant stacks with his bear hands. He would chase the children and threaten to put them down their trousers. However, there was a more sinister similarity between threshing and mining, namely the cruel illnesses that its associated dust visited on hard working people.

By supper time on threshing day, I had invariably retired to bed with flu-like symptoms caused by dust and mould, as had my father and many others. A shift system was always necessary to complete the day's work. I was lucky because before I reached

Yr wyf yn falch o'r cyfle i siarad am hyn heddiw, er fy mod bob amser wedi byw mewn rhan o Gymru lle nad oes glo na llawer o lowyr. Yr wyf bob amser wedi cydymdeimlo'n fawr pan glywaf am y dioddef sydd, ers degawdau, wedi difetha bywydau cynifer o lowyr a'u teuluoedd. Rhennir y cydymdeimlad hwnnw gan lawer o deuluoedd ffermio yng Nghymru, yn arbennig ymhlith fy nghenedlaeth i a'r rhai blaenorol. Egluraf pam.

Soniaf wrth y Cynulliad am fywyd ffermwr traddodiadol yng nghefn gwlad Cymru yn ystod fy ieuenctid, yr hyn a alwaf yn, 'oes y peiriant dyrnu' a chyn dyfodiad y dyrnwr medi. Torrwyd yr yd a'i glymu yn ysgubau yn y cae gyda pheiriant rhwymo. Ar ôl hindreulio, fe'u cariwyd i'r ydlan a'u hadeiladu yn deisi mawr, y bydd llawer ohonoch wedi eu gweld efallai ar gardiau Nadolig. Yn ddiweddarach yn y flwyddyn, byddai'r peiriant dyrnu yn cyrraedd—teclyn Heath Robinson anferth ar grwydr—ynghyd â'r cymdogion. Byddai pawb yn bwrw ati gyda'r orchwyl fawr o nithio'r grawn o'r us.

Fel pob ffermwr ifanc, dechreuais fy ngyrfa dyrnu ar y llithren us, gan symud ymlaen i bicellu o'r das. Gallaf gofio'r wefr o hyd pan ganiatawyd imi wneud y dasg bwysicaf am y tro cyntaf, sef bwydo'r drwm. Creodd y ffordd y daeth ffermwyr at ei gilydd i ddyrnu'r yd, fel y gwnaethant i gneifio eu defaid a lladd eu moch, ymdeimlad o gymuned sydd mor nodweddiadol o'n cymunedau glofaol. Ar ddiwrnod dyrnu, yfwyd llawer o seidr a chofiaf ddyn o'r enw Ewythr Monty a allai iodlan ac a fyddai'n dal llygod mawr a oedd yn byw yn y teisi mawr hyn gyda'i ddwylo. Byddai'n rhedeg ar ôl y plant gan fygwth rhoi'r llygod mawr i lawr eu trowsus. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd cyffelybiaeth fwy sinistr rhwng dyrnu a chloddio, sef y salwch creulon a ddioddefai pobl weithgar o ganlyniad i'r llwch.

Erbyn amser swper ar ddiwrnod dyrnu, yr oeddwn yn ddieithriad, fel fy nhad a llawer un arall, wedi mynd i'm gwely gyda symptomau tebyg i'r fflw a achoswyd gan lwch a llwydni. Yr oedd system sifft bob amser yn angenrheidiol i gwblhau gwaith y

adulthood, we had bought our first combine harvester and the age of the threshing box was over. However, my father was not so lucky. He was a short, powerful man who, when only in his thirties, was struck down by what we called 'farmer's lung'. I am sure that many of us remember that. It was almost certainly caused by dust and mould and claimed many lives throughout the fifties and sixties; people are still suffering today.

In the 1950s and 1960s, no-one knew how exposure to dust damaged our bodies. So many farmers, like miners, sacrificed the quality of their lives, and often life itself. When compensation for what happens is legally due, it should be paid quickly. Assessing entitlement to compensation is complex, bedevilled by conflicting legal opinions. However, when the legal process has been completed and the law decrees that compensation is due, it should be paid. I ask this Government to use all the influence available to it to make progress and emphasise the importance of meeting what are legally justified claims for compensation as swiftly as possible. Compensation can never restore the quality of life that has been sacrificed by so many miners who now suffer debilitating illnesses, but it is a way of recognising the sacrifice that they have made.

11:55 a.m.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Before I call the First Minister to propose amendment 2 in the name of Andrew Davies, I note that the time for Government in minority party debates is under discussion in the Business Committee. I have agreed with the First Minister that he will have five minutes to propose the amendment, then, under Standing Order No. 7.4, a further five minutes later to reply to the debate on the amendment.

The First Minister: I propose amendment 2 in the name of Andrew Davies. Delete all after 'UK Government' and add

to do everything within its legal powers to ensure the prompt distribution of the funds

dydd. Yr oeddwn yn ffodus oherwydd cyn imi dyfu'n oedolyn, prynasom ein dyrnwr medi ein hunain ac yr oedd oes y peiriant dyrnu ar ben. Fodd bynnag, ni fu fy nhad mor ffodus. Yr oedd yn ddyn byr, pwerus a drawyd, pan yr oedd ond yn ei dri degau, gan yr hyn a alwem yn 'fogfa'r ffermwr'. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod llawer ohonom yn cofio hynny. Diau mai llwch a llwydni a achosodd hynny a chollwyd llawer o fywydau drwy gydol y pum degau a'r chwe degau o'i herwydd; mae pobl yn dioddef hyd heddiw.

Yn y 1950au a'r 1960au, ni wyddai neb sut yr oedd gweithio mewn awyrgylch llychlyd yn niweidio ein cyrff. Aberthodd nifer o ffermwyr, fel glowyr, ansawdd eu bywydau, ac yn aml fywyd ei hun. Pan fydd iawndal am yr hyn sydd yn digwydd yn ddyledus yn gyfreithiol, dylid ei dalu'n gyflym. Mae asesu hawl i iawndal yn gymhleth, wedi ei blagio gan safbwyntiau cyfreithiol croes i'w gilydd. Fodd bynnag, pan gwblheir y broses gyfreithiol, a deddfir bod iawndal yn ddyledus yn ôl y gyfraith, dylid ei dalu. Gofynnaf i'r Llywodraeth hon ddefnyddio'r holl ddylanwad posibl sydd ganddi i wneud cynnydd a phwysleisio pa mor bwysig yw talu'r hyn sydd yn geisiadau am iawndal a gyfiawnhawyd yn gyfreithiol mor gyflym â phosibl. Ni all iawndal byth adfer yr ansawdd bywyd a aberthwyd gan gymaint o lowyr sydd bellach yn dioddef salwch gwanychol, ond mae'n ffordd o gydnabod yr aberth a wnaethant.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Cyn imi alw ar y Prif Weinidog i gynnig gwelliant 2 yn enw Andrew Davies, nodaf fod yr amser ar gyfer y Llywodraeth mewn dadleuon pleidiau lleiafrifol o dan drafodaeth ar hyn o bryd yn y Pwyllgor Busnes. Cytunais â'r Prif Weinidog y caiff bum munud i gynnig y gwelliant, yna, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 7.4, caiff bum munud arall yn ddiweddarach i ymateb i'r ddadl ar y gwelliant.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Cynigiaf welliant 2 yn enw Andrew Davies. Dileer y cyfan ar ôl 'Llywodraeth y DU' ac ychwaneger

i wneud y cyfan o fewn ei bwerau cyfreithiol i sicrhau bod y cyllid sydd eisoes wedi'i

already made available for the compensation of former miners and dependants.

This Government amendment seeks to achieve everything that the Plaid Cymru motion seeks to achieve, but does so in a way that recognises the practical problems that have bedevilled this entire process. It is the largest personal injury claim in British legal history, involving 130,000 claimants across the UK, almost 30,000 of whom are in Wales, and, as Ieuan said, it is a moving target in which new claims are coming in faster than claims are being settled. We do not know what the ultimate number will be. We only know that the numbers involved are staggering. That is why the wording of amendment 2 urges the UK Government to do everything within its legal powers to ensure the prompt distribution of the funds already made available—there is no problem about that—for the compensation of former miners and their dependants. That is how a government acts when it is in a legal dispute in which there are two sides, namely the miners and their families, and British Coal, which lost the legal case and is therefore responsible. However, the company does not exist any more. The Government said that it will stand in for British Coal as though it had been the employer, that had negligently exposed miners to the undue amounts of dust that have caused the emphysema that is the root of the problem.

What we are saying is honest, up-front and exactly what the Government should do, namely everything within its legal powers. The Plaid Cymru motion on the other hand is disingenuous. It is disingenuous for the motion to mention employing more doctors, as though there was a common market stockpile of unemployed respiratory consultants who, when you need more of them, are ready and waiting. There is a huge shortage of respiratory consultants available to do this kind of work. When you require more respiratory consultants, it is not good enough, Ieuan, to say 'employ more of them'. You must say how you will find more of them. We are taking the practical steps of

neilltuo ar gyfer talu iawndal i gyn-lowyr a'r rhai sydd yn ddibynnol arnynt yn cael ei ddosbarthu'n ddiymdroi

Mae gwelliant y Llywodraeth yn ceisio cyflawni popeth y ceisia cynnig Plaid Cymru ei gyflawni, ond gwna hynny mewn ffordd sydd yn cydnabod y problemau ymarferol a blagiodd y broses gyfan. Dyma'r cais mwyaf o ganlyniad i anaf personol yn hanes cyfreithiol Prydain, sydd yn ymwneud â 130,000 o hawlwyd ledled y DU, â bron i 30,000 ohonynt yng Nghymru, ac, fel y dywedodd Ieuan, mae'n darged symudol lle y caiff ceisiadau newydd eu cofnodi'n gyflymach nag y cânt eu talu. Ni wyddom beth fydd y nifer yn y pen draw. Yr ydym ond yn gwybod bod y niferoedd dan sylw yn syfrdanol. Dyna pam bod geiriad gwelliant 2 yn annog Llywodraeth y DU i wneud popeth o fewn ei phwerau cyfreithiol i sicrhau y dosberthir yr arian sydd ar gael eisoes yn gyflym—nid oes unrhyw broblem ynglŷn â hynny—i ddigolledu cyn-lowyr a'u dibynyddion. Dyna sut y gweithreda llywodraeth pan fydd mewn anghydfod cyfreithiol lle mae dwy ochr, sef y glowyr a'u teuluoedd, a British Coal, a gollodd yr achos cyfreithiol ac sydd felly yn gyfrifol. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r cwmni yn bodoli rhagor. Dywedodd y Llywodraeth y byddai'n cymryd lle British Coal, gan gymryd arni mai hi oedd y cyflogwr a oedd wedi ymddwyn yn esgeulus drwy adael i lowyr weithio mewn gormod o lwch, sef yr hyn a achosodd yr emffysema sydd wrth wraidd y broblem.

Mae'r hyn a ddywedwn yn onest, agored ac yn union yr hyn y dylai'r Llywodraeth ei wneud, sef popeth o fewn ei phwerau cyfreithiol. Mae cynnig Plaid Cymru ar y llaw arall yn annidwyll. Mae'n annidwyll i'r cynnig sôn am gyflogi rhagor o feddygon, fel pe bai stôr o ymgynghorwyr afiechyd anadlu di-waith ar gael yn y farchnad gyffredin, sydd, pan fydd angen rhagor ohonynt arnoch, yn barod i gamu i'r blwch. Mae prinder aruthrol o ymgynghorwyr afiechyd anadlu ar gael i wneud y math hwn o waith. Pan fydd angen rhagor o ymgynghorwyr afiechyd anadlu arnoch, nid yw'n ddigon da, Ieuan, dweud 'cyflogwch ragor ohonynt'. Rhaid ichi ddweud sut y dewch o hyd i ragor ohonynt.

finding more respiratory consultants. We are combing the globe for more respiratory consultants. We are talking to retired respiratory consultants in Wales to see whether they can be persuaded to come back to help us crack this problem.

It is not entirely fair of you, Ieuan, to say that everybody should be able to support this motion. If you really meant it to be a motion that everybody should support, you would not have used words that imply that it is easy to just clap your hands and more respiratory consultants suddenly drop off the trees for you to take on-board. Had you really been seeking cross-party support for this, you would not have framed the motion in those disingenuous terms. This is an unprecedented legal personal injury case. There has been nothing like it in United Kingdom legal history. In Wales, where there are 30,000—in broad terms—out of the 130,000 cases so far registered, and it is climbing quickly, we are dealing with cases in order to get at all the practical problems, when you must present everything in front of the judge again, offering people interim payments, and quicker ways of solving the problem. However, for perfectly good reasons—and nobody is going to take their legal rights away from them—people choose to go through the full medical assessment procedure, which brings us to the problem of the acute shortage of respiratory consultants and spirometry lung function technicians.

We are willing to listen to practical suggestions that anybody in the Assembly, in whatever party, can come up with. They would help to bring some kind of restitution for those suffering from emphysema as a result of negligent employment practices by the former National Coal Board, since the cut-off date of 1954. That is why we have the Welsh monitoring group, on which Brian Gibbons, as Deputy Minister for Health, represents the Assembly. The group met for the second time on 12 February, when it was agreed that the Chief Medical Officer for Wales, Dr Ruth Hall, would write to retired respiratory consultants in Wales to ask if they

Yr ydym yn cymryd y camau ymarferol o ganfod rhagor o ymgynghorwyr afiechyd anadlu. Yr ydym yn edrych ym mhob cwr o'r byd am ymgynghorwyr afiechyd anadlu. Yr ydym yn siarad ag ymgynghorwyr afiechyd anadlu yng Nghymru sydd wedi ymddeol i weld a ellir eu perswadio i ddod yn ôl i'n helpu i ddatrys y broblem hon.

Ieuan, nid yw'n hollol deg ichi ddweud y dylai pawb fod yn gallu cefnogi'r cynnig hwn. Os oeddech, o ddifrif, am iddo fod yn gynnig y dylai pawb ei gefnogi, ni fydddech wedi defnyddio geiriau sydd yn awgrymu ei fod yn hawdd curo eich dwylo ac yn sydyn byddai mwy o ymgynghorwyr afiechyd anadlu yn disgyn o'r coed yn barod ichi eu defnyddio. Pe baech wedi ceisio cefnogaeth drawsbleidiol ar gyfer hyn mewn gwirionedd, ni fydddech wedi geirio'r cynnig yn y termau annidwyll hynny. Mae hwn yn achos anaf personol cyfreithiol heb ei ail. Ni fu mo'i debyg yn hanes cyfreithiol y Deyrnas Unedig. Yng Nghymru, lle mae 30,000—yn gyffredinol—o'r 130,000 o achosion a gofrestrwyd hyd yn hyn, ac mae'n cynyddu'n gyflym, deliwn ag achosion er mwyn datrys yr holl broblemau ymarferol, pan fydd yn rhaid ichi gyflwyno popeth ger bron y barnwr unwaith eto, gan gynnwys taliadau dros dro i bobl, a ffyrdd cyflymach o ddatrys y broblem. Fodd bynnag, am resymau da—ac ni fydd unrhyw un am dynnu eu hawliau cyfreithiol oddi arnynt—mae pobl yn dewis mynd drwy weithdrefn yr asesiad meddygol llawn, sydd yn dod â ni at broblem y prinder aruthrol o ymgynghorwyr afiechyd anadlu a thechnegwyr spirometreg gweithrediad yr ysgyfaint.

Yr ydym yn fodlon gwrandao ar awgrymiadau ymarferol y gall unrhyw un yn y Cynulliad, ym mha blaid bynnag, eu cynnig. Byddent yn ein helpu i roi rhyw fath o iawndal i'r rheini sydd yn dioddef o emffysema o ganlyniad i arferion cyflogaeth esgeulus gan y cyn Fwrdd Glo Cenedlaethol, ers y torbwynt yn 1954. Dyna pam y mae gennym y grwp monitro Cymreig, lle mae Brian Gibbons, fel y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Iechyd, yn cynrychioli'r Cynulliad. Cyfarfu'r grwp am yr ail dro ar 12 Chwefror, pan gytunwyd y byddai Prif Swyddog Meddygol Cymru, Dr Ruth Hall, yn ysgrifennu at ymgynghorwyr afiechyd anadlu yng Nghymru sydd wedi

wished to help with this crisis. Those letters will be sent today. We are, therefore, getting on with the job. We are working practically on this issue, not playing politics.

Gwenda Thomas: Do you agree that many of us do not need to be preached to by the party of Welsh nationalists? We know about the suffering. During my husband's last shift as a miner, he had to dig out a friend who had died underground. We understand the suffering. Will you join me in commending the efforts of Paul Murphy, Peter Hain and other members of the monitoring committee? Are you aware that miners are receiving home visits on Sundays as part of the assessment procedure?

The First Minister: Yes, absolutely.

To clarify the factual position, 28,000 Welsh claims have been received, 6,246 interim payments have been made, 1,353 claims have been determined in full, of which 897 have been paid in full and 456 have been rejected. A total of £27.5 million has been paid in compensation in Wales as a result of these respiratory diseases. We are trying to shift the bottleneck, which is caused by a shortage of respiratory technicians and consultants. Those technicians and consultants, who take a long time to train, are needed to check the records and carry out the lung function test.

Geraint Davies: When I was a child, growing up in Rhondda, I knew men with bad chests, and often heard conversations about dust and miners being cheated out of compensation for pneumoconiosis. They were either under-diagnosed, and a post mortem would subsequently show the diagnosis to be incorrect, or a diagnosis of emphysema or bronchitis resulted in no compensation at all. Over the past 30 years as a pharmacist, I have visited dozens of ex-miners' homes to supply oxygen and have seen the suffering at first hand.

NACODS's success in its epic and historic 10-year battle for compensation for miners suffering from emphysema and bronchitis

ymddeol i ofyn a fyddent yn dymuno helpu gyda'r argyfwng hwn. Anfonir y llythyrau hynny heddiw. Felly awn ymlaen â'r gwaith. Yr ydym yn gweithio ar y mater hwn mewn ffordd ymarferol, ac nid yn chwarae gwleidyddiaeth.

Gwenda Thomas: A gytunwch nad oes angen i blaid o genedlaetholwyr Cymreig bregethu wrth lawer ohonom? Yr ydym yn gwybod am y dioddefaint. Yn ystod sifft olaf fy ngwr fel glöwr, bu'n rhaid iddo gloddio ffrind allan a oedd wedi marw o dan y ddaear. Deallwn y dioddefaint. A ymunwch â mi i ganmol ymdrechion Paul Murphy, Peter Hain ac aelodau eraill o'r pwyllgor monitro? A ydych yn ymwybodol bod glowyr yn cael ymweliadau cartref ar ddydd Sul fel rhan o'r weithdrefn asesu?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ydwyf, yn sicr.

I egluro'r sefyllfa o ran y ffeithiau, derbyniwyd 28,000 o geisiadau o Gymru, gwnaethpwyd 6,246 o daliadau dros dro, penderfynwyd ar 1,353 o geisiadau yn llawn, talwyd 897 ohonynt yn llawn a gwrthodwyd 456. Talwyd cyfanswm o £27.5 miliwn mewn iawndal yng Nghymru o ganlyniad i'r afiechydon anadlu hyn. Ceisiwn glirio'r dagfa a achosir gan brinder technegwyr ac ymgynghorwyr afiechydon anadlu. Mae angen y technegwyr a'r ymgynghorwyr hynny, sydd yn cymryd amser hir i'w hyfforddi, er mwyn gwirio'r cofnodion a chynnal prawf gweithrediad yr ysgyfaint.

Geraint Davies: Pan oeddwn yn blentyn, yn tyfu i fyny yn y Rhondda, gwyddwn am ddyinion a chanddynt afiechyd ar y frest, ac yn aml clywn sgysiau am lwch a glowyr yn cael eu twyllo o iawndal am glefyd y llwch. Yr oeddent naill ai heb gael y diagnosis cywir, a byddai post mortem yn y pen draw yn dangos bod y diagnosis yn anghywir neu byddai diagnosis o emffysema neu fronicitis yn golygu dim iawndal o gwbl. Dros y 30 mlynedd diwethaf fel fferylllydd, ymwelais â dwsinau o gartrefi cyn lowyr i gyflenwi ocsigen a gwelais y dioddefaint â'm llygaid fy hun.

Felly bu llwyddiant NACODS yn ei frwydr arwrol a hanesyddol dros gyfnod o 10 mlynedd am iawndal i lowyr a oedd yn

was, therefore, a red-letter day in Rhondda, as in all mining areas.

Huw Lewis: NACODS's involvement has attracted a lot of publicity for the union. Will you join with me in questioning your colleague in Plaid Cymru, Bleddyn Hancock, who has been charging a 5-10 per cent levy on miners for legal costs, despite the fact that the Government pays those costs? Will you also join with me in asking NACODS where this money has gone and for it to return the money to the miners, where it belongs?

Geraint Davies: It is sad that you have raised that matter, when you think of the enormous struggle over the last 10 years. NACODS took on British Coal, the Tory Party under Mrs Thatcher and the New Labour administration, which should support the miners, and it won. It needed that 5 per cent to support its fight. Everyone agreed to the fight at the beginning, and the 5 per cent was not mentioned at that time. You raise this issue three months before an election to discredit one of the most historic victories for the working class in this country. To raise that point was shameful.

12:05 p.m.

Huw Lewis: Tell us what Bleddyn Hancock's wages are.

Geraint Davies: I cannot comment on that.

Huw Lewis: Around £47,000 per year?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Let us have a debate. Huw, you have intervened enough. Please, get on with your speech, Geraint.

Geraint Davies: That was three years ago and ex-miners are still waiting. On the anniversary of 27,000 claims having been made, only 32 had been settled in full and 1,500 miners had died, many of them in Rhondda, because ex-miners had not been a New Labour priority. I will give you three examples of the off-hand way ex-miners have

dioddef o emffysema a bronchitis yn ddiwrnod bythgofiadwy yn y Rhondda, fel ym mhob ardal lofaol.

Huw Lewis: Denodd y rhan a chwaraeodd NACODS lawer o gyhoeddusrwydd i'r undeb. A ymunwch â mi i gwestiynu eich cyd-Aelod ym Mhlaid Cymru, Bleddyn Hancock, a fu'n codi ardoll o 5-10 y cant ar lowyr am gostau cyfreithiol, er gwaethaf y ffaith bod y Llywodraeth yn talu'r costau hynny? A ymunwch â mi hefyd i ofyn i NACODS i ble yr aeth yr arian hwn gan ofyn iddo ddychwelyd yr arian i'r glowyr, lle dylai fod?

Geraint Davies: Mae'n drueni eich bod wedi codi'r mater hwnnw, wrth feddwl am y frwydr aruthrol dros y 10 mlynedd diwethaf. Heriodd NACODS British Coal, y Blaid Dori'aidd o dan Mrs Thatcher a gweinyddiaeth Llafur Newydd—a ddylai gefnogi'r glowyr—ac fe enillodd. Yr oedd angen y 5 y cant hwnnw arno i ennill ei frwydr. Cytunodd pawb i ymladd ar y dechrau, ac ni soniwyd am y 5 y cant ar yr adeg honno. Yr ydych yn codi'r mater hwn dri mis cyn etholiad i ddwyn amarch ar un o'r buddugoliaethau mwyaf hanesyddol i'r dosbarth gweithiol yn y wlad hon. Yr oedd yn gywilyddus codi'r pwynt hwnnw.

Huw Lewis: Dywedwch wrthym faint yw cyflog Bleddyn Hancock.

Geraint Davies: Ni allaf wneud sylw ar hynny.

Huw Lewis: Tua £47,000 y flwyddyn?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Gadewch inni gael dadl. Huw, yr ydych wedi ymyrryd digon. Ewch ymlaen â'ch araith, Geraint os gwelwch yn dda.

Geraint Davies: Yr oedd hynny dair blynedd yn ôl ac mae'r cyn lowyr yn aros o hyd. Ar ben-blwydd cofnodi 27,000 o geisiadau, dim ond 32 a dalwyd yn llawn ac yr oedd 1,500 o'r glowyr wedi marw, llawer ohonynt yn y Rhondda, gan na fu cyn lowyr yn un o flaenoriaethau Llafur Newydd. Rhoddaf dair enghraifft ichi o'r ffordd ddidaro y cafodd

been treated. A 77-year-old miner from my hometown of Treherbert submitted a claim three years ago. In 1999, he had spirometry tests in Swansea—[*Interruption.*]

[*Huw Lewis left the Chamber.*]

Dafydd Wigley: Come back here and say that. Point of order, Huw Lewis was threatening a fight in the Chamber.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. If you have a point of order, I will listen to it, but I did not hear what Huw Lewis said.

Geraint Davies: My constituent had spirometry tests in Swansea and further tests seven months ago in Mountain Ash. Last November, he was told that his claim had been finalised, but there was a little snag and he would hear about his settlement in three weeks time. However, he has still not heard anything about his full settlement. Another man living in Treorchy is on oxygen 24-hours a day. He suffers from emphysema and has already had one cardiac arrest. At the Mountain Ash clinic, he was informed that he had to be re-tested because, at that time he was suffering from pneumonia and was not entitled to the fast track claim or expedited offer. A full medical assessment needed to be carried out. He is still waiting to hear about that.

There are those who have died while waiting. An 82-year-old ex-miner of Llwynypia died recently having received a mere £2,000 compensation. Why the delays? The plain fact is that there are barely enough medical staff to carry out the assessments and too few administrative staff to ensure that results and compensation claims are processed speedily and efficiently. The Government promised to process 4,000 claims per month, yet at the end of last year it was processing less than half that number. More staff must be recruited as a matter of priority.

For those ex-miners who have survived and come to the end of the medical assessment road, there is the disgrace of the Government's refusal to take into account loss of pension and earnings in determining the amount of compensation. Consequently,

cyn lowyr eu trin. Cyflwynodd glöwr 77 mlwydd oed o'm tref enedigol, Treherbert, gais dair blynedd yn ôl. Yn 1999, cafodd brofion sbirometreg yn Abertawe—[*Torri ar draws.*]

[*Gadawodd Huw Lewis y Siambr.*]

Dafydd Wigley: Dewch yn ôl yma a dywedwch hynny. Pwynt o drefn, yr oedd Huw Lewis yn bygwth ymladd yn y Siambr.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Os oes gennych bwynt o drefn, gwrandawaf arno, ond ni chlywais yr hyn a ddywedodd Huw Lewis.

Geraint Davies: Cafodd fy etholwr brofion sbirometreg yn Abertawe a phroffion pellach saith mis yn ôl yn Aberpennar. Fis Tachwedd diwethaf, dywedwyd wrtho bod ei gais wedi ei gwblhau, ond bod un broblem fach a byddai'n clywed am ei setliad ymhen tair wythnos. Fodd bynnag, mae'n aros o hyd i glywed am ei setliad llawn. Mae dyn arall, sydd yn byw yn Nhreorci, ar ocsigen 24 awr y dydd. Mae'n dioddef o emffysema ac eisoes wedi cael un trawiad ar y galon. Yng nghlinig Aberpennar, dywedwyd wrtho bod yn rhaid rhoi prawf arall iddo oherwydd, ar yr adeg honno yr oedd yn dioddef o niwmonia ac nid oedd hawl ganddo i'r cais carlam na'r cynnig brysiedig. Yr oedd angen cynnal asesiad meddygol llawn. Mae'n aros o hyd i glywed am hynny.

Mae pobl wedi marw tra'n aros. Bu farw cyn löwr 82 mlwydd oed o Llwynypia yn ddiweddar ar ôl cael dim ond £2,000 o iawndal. Pam yr oedi? Y gwir amdani yw nad oes digon o staff meddygol i gynnal yr asesiadau a dim digon o staff gweinyddol i sicrhau y caiff y canlyniadau a'r ceisiadau iawndal eu prosesu'n gyflym ac yn effeithlon. Addawodd y Llywodraeth brosesu 4,000 o geisiadau y mis, ac eto ar ddiwedd y llynedd yr oedd yn prosesu llai na hanner y nifer honno. Rhaid recriwtio rhagor o staff fel mater o flaenoriaeth.

I'r cyn lowyr hynny sydd wedi goroesi a dod i ddiwedd taith yr asesiad meddygol, mae'n warthus bod y Llywodraeth wedi gwrthod ystyried y pensiynau a'r enillion a gollwyd wrth bennu swm yr iawndal. O ganlyniad, gorfodir yr undeb i ddychwelyd i'r uchel lys

the union will be forced to return to the high court leading to further delays of two years or more. The implementation of the clawback by the Department of Social Security is another disgrace. I was disappointed that not one Labour AM supported my statement of opinion calling for miners to be exempt from such claims.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Geraint, please wind up, You have had five minutes.

Geraint Davies: When calculated correctly, the clawback amounts to pennies, but it can take a year to process such claims, which are often calculated incorrectly. Claims of £22,000 have been corrected to £22. The clawback must be stopped forthwith in the interest of justice for the miners and to prevent public money from being spent on wasteful administration.

New Labour touts itself as the party of the people. It likes to portray itself as being concerned about workers. I see no evidence of that when it comes to miners—the workers, who for so long, were the backbone of the Welsh and British economies. They have been denied their rightful compensation, which is being paid for by money plundered from their own pension funds. These men should be showered with gratitude and not treated with contempt. Miners must become the Government's top priority, or New Labour will be remembered as the Government that regarded miners as unimportant and expendable.

Karen Sinclair: My constituency is made up of post-industrial villages. Indeed, many of those villages were a consequence of coal. My father was one of five brothers and the only one not to work down the mines. All my father's brothers died prematurely as a consequence of working there. In fact, I doubt that there are many families who have lived in these villages for any length of time who cannot relay similar tragedies.

Many other Members in this Chamber also represent mining communities. All share in the frustration felt by miners and their widows. Plaid Cymru should not posture that

gan arwain at oedi pellach o ddwy flynedd neu fwy. Mae gweithredu'r cynllun adfachu gan yr Adran Nawdd Cymdeithasol yn warth arall. Yr oeddwn yn siomedig na chefnogodd yr un AC Llafur fy natganiad barn yn galw am eithrio glowyr o geisiadau o'r fath.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Geraint, a wnewch chi ddirwyn i ben. Yr ydych wedi cael pum munud.

Geraint Davies: Pan gaiff ei gyfrifo'n gywir, ceiniogau yw cyfanswm yr adfachu, ond gall gymryd blwyddyn i brosesu ceisiadau o'r fath, a gyfrifir yn anghywir yn aml. Cywirwyd ceisiadau o £22,000 i £22. Rhaid rhoi'r gorau i'r adfachu ar unwaith er cyfiawnder i'r glowyr ac er mwyn atal arian cyhoeddus rhag cael ei wario ar weinyddiaeth wastraffus.

Mae Llafur Newydd yn pedlera ei hun fel plaid y bobl. Mae'n hoffi portreadu ei hun fel plaid sydd yn gofidio am y gweithwyr. Ni welaf unrhyw dystiolaeth o hynny pan ddaw i fater y glowyr—y gweithwyr a fu'n asgwrn cefn i economïau Cymru a Phrydain ers cyhyd. Gwrthodwyd eu hiawndal dilys iddynt, y telir amdano gan arian a ysbeiliwyd o'u cronfeydd pensiwn eu hunain. Dylid pentyrru diolchiadau ar y dynion hyn ac nid eu dirmygu. Rhaid i'r glowyr fod ar frig rhestr blaenoriaethau'r Llywodraeth neu caiff Llafur Newydd ei chofio fel y Llywodraeth a ystyriodd y glowyr yn bobl ddibwys a diwerth.

Karen Sinclair: Mae fy etholaeth yn cynnwys pentrefi ôl-ddiwydiannol. Yn wir, datblygodd llawer o'r pentrefi hynny o ganlyniad i lo. Yr oedd fy nhad yn un o bump o frodyr a'r unig un nad aeth i weithio yn y pwll glo. Bu farw pob un o frodyr fy nhad yn ifanc o ganlyniad i weithio yno. A dweud y gwir, mae'n amheus gennyf a oes llawer o deuluoedd sydd wedi byw yn y pentrefi hyn am gyfnod o amser na allant adrodd am drasiediau tebyg.

Mae llawer o Aelodau eraill yn y Siambr hon yn cynrychioli cymunedau glofaol hefyd. Rhanna pob un ohonynt y rhwystredigaeth a deimlir gan lowyr a'u gwragedd gweddw. Ni

it has the monopoly of interest or compassion, because I can assure you that it does not.

I, along with many others, have lobbied hard to speed-up the process to deliver much deserved compensation to these miners and their families. There is no doubt that a shortage of medical expertise has caused severe problems. We cannot argue with that. There is also no doubt that a way to speed-up the assessment must be found. We cannot argue with that either. The Energy Minister, Peter Hain, accepts that the process has become far too cumbersome and that there must be ways to speed it up. This is essential.

Andrew Davies's amendment 2 reflects our feelings in this Chamber. Speed is of the essence and we must ensure that everything within the Government's legal powers is done to give our miners what they justly deserve. However, the issue of compensation clawback is a difficult one. I wish to introduce some facts into this emotive argument.

Compensation is paid in two parts, 'general damages' and 'special damages'. General damages cover pain and suffering and loss of future earnings. Special damages refund actual financial loss, such as, travel to hospital, medical expenses and loss of earnings to date.

The Benefits Agency can only recover from the amount awarded under the special damages category. It seems that anyone whose claim has gone through the court, but has ended up with little or no compensation because of recoupment, has not been paid for general damages. This points clearly to a fault on the solicitor's part.

The benefits that are recovered have been paid to those unable to work. The special damages award compensates for being unable to work. To exempt recovery would mean that claimants are compensated twice. The problem is that civil law does not allow claims from two insurance policies for the same accident.

ddylai Plaid Cymru ymhonni fod ganddi'r monopoli o ran diddordeb neu dosturi, oherwydd gallaf eich sicrhau nad oes ganddi.

Yr wyf i, ynghyd â sawl un arall, wedi llobio'n galed i gyflymu'r broses o gyflwyno iawndal haeddiannol iawn i'r glowyr hyn a'u teuluoedd. Yn ddiau mae prinder arbenigedd meddygol wedi achosi problemau difrifol. Ni allwn ddadlau â hynny. Yn ddiau hefyd, rhaid chwilio am ffordd o gyflymu'r broses asesu. Ni allwn ddadlau â hynny ychwaith. Derbynia'r Gweinidog dros Ynni, Peter Hain, fod y broses wedi mynd yn rhy feichus a bod yn rhaid dod o hyd i ffyrdd o'i chyflymu. Mae hyn yn hanfodol.

Adlewyrcha gwelliant 2 Andrew Davies ein teimladau yn y Siambr hon. Mae cyflymder yn hanfodol a rhaid inni sicrhau y gwneir popeth o fewn pwerau cyfreithiol y Llywodraeth i roi i'n glowyr yr hyn yr haeddant yn deg. Fodd bynnag, mae mater adfachu iawndal yn un anodd. Hoffwn gyflwyno rhai ffeithiau yn y ddadl emosiynol hon.

Telir iawndal mewn dwy ran, 'iawndal cyffredinol' a 'iawndal arbennig'. Mae iawndal cyffredinol yn cwmpasu poen a dioddefaint ac enillion a gollir yn y dyfodol. Mae iawndal arbennig yn ad-dalu colled ariannol wirioneddol, megis, teithio i'r ysbyty, treuliau meddygol ac enillion a gollwyd hyd yn hyn.

Dim ond o'r swm a ddyfernir o dan y categori iawndal arbennig y gall yr Asiantaeth Budd-daliadau adennill arian. Ymddengys bod unrhyw un y mae ei gais wedi mynd drwy'r llys, ond na chafodd fawr ddim iawndal neu ddim iawndal o gwbl oherwydd adennill, heb gael ei dalu am iawndal cyffredinol. Yn amlwg mae hynny'n awgrymu bai ar ran y cyfreithiwr.

Talwyd y buddiannau a adennillwyd i'r rheini na allant weithio. Mae'r dyfarniad am iawndal arbennig yn digolledu am fethu â gallu gweithio. Byddai eithrio adennill yn golygu bod hawlwyd yn cael eu digolledu ddwywaith. Y broblem yw nad yw cyfraith sifil yn caniatáu ceisiadau gan ddau bolisi yswiriant ar gyfer yr un ddamwain.

We must understand that an exemption in this case would have a knock-on effect for thousands of claims, for example, claims now being processed for groups of workers in similar circumstances, such as asbestosis in railway workers. We must be careful that we do not create a hierarchy of illness. Who will volunteer for the post of prescribed industrial disease point scorer? Whose job description will include compiling a list of worthy and unworthy diseases? I do not think that Plaid Cymru would like that job.

The law must give us guidance in this instance. Yes, use discretion and compassion in its application, but do not dismantle the foundations of fairness and equality on which it is based.

Jocelyn Davies: I come from a mining community. At one time, Newbridge had two pits. Therefore, it has its fair share of ex-miners. My neighbour is an ex-miner, but I do not see him any more, because he does not get out much. He cannot. His wife tells me that he is okay. However, he sometimes apologises if he has had a bad night, in case he disturbed us with his coughing. He does not need to apologise, but in so doing, he preserves his dignity.

I can hear him sometimes. A miner's cough is unmistakable. It starts with a real determination to shift the obstruction in the airways. There is the scraping of the throat in an effort to spit out the offending blockage, then more coughing. That strong man's cough soon subsides and his determination ebbs away as the airways refuse to clear. The coughing often ends in vomiting, gasping for breath and utter exhaustion. The obstruction is, of course, still there and that continues year after year.

I have no doubt—and I am sure that no one here would argue—that these claims are justified. We also know that no amount of compensation will make the victims well again. They will never be well because their conditions are incurable. However, they have been robbed of more than their health. My neighbour has a lovely granddaughter. He adores her but he cannot play with her as my

Rhaid inni ddeall y câi eithriad yn yr achos hwn effaith ddilynol ar filoedd o geisiadau, er enghraifft, ceisiadau a gaiff eu prosesu yn awr ar gyfer grwpiau o weithwyr mewn amgylchiadau tebyg, megis asbestosis mewn gweithwyr rheilffordd. Rhaid inni fod yn ofalus na chrëwn hierarchaeth o salwch. Pwy fydd yn gwirfoddoli ar gyfer swydd sgoriwr pwyntiau afiechydon diwydiannol penodol? Disgrifiad swydd pwy fydd yn cynnwys llunio rhestr o afiechydon teilwng ac annheilwng? Ni chredaf y byddai Plaid Cymru yn hoffi'r swydd honno.

Rhaid i'r gyfraith ein harwain yn yr achos hwn. Ie, defnyddiwch ddisgresiwn a thosturi wrth ei defnyddio, ond peidiwch â datgymalu'r seiliau tegwch a chydraddoldeb y'i seilir arnynt.

Jocelyn Davies: Yr wyf yn dod o gymuned lofaol. Ar un adeg, yr oedd dau bwll glo yn Nhrecelyn. Felly, mae digon o gyn-lowyr yno. Mae fy nghymydog yn gyn-löwr, ond ni welaf ef ragor, gan nad yw'n mynd allan yn aml. Ni all fynd allan. Dywed ei wraig wrthyf ei fod yn iawn. Fodd bynnag, ymddiheura weithiau os cafodd noson wael, rhag ofn ei fod wedi ein diuno gyda'i beswch. Nid oes angen iddo ymddiheuro, ond wrth wneud hynny, mae'n cadw ei urddas.

Gallaf ei glywed weithiau. Mae pesychiad glöwr yn ddigamsyniol. Dechreuwa gyda phenderfyniad gwirioneddol i symud yr ataliad yn y bibell aer. Yna crafu'r llwnc mewn ymdrech i boeri allan yr ataliad drwg, yna mwy o beswch. Bydd pesychiad y dyn cryf hwnnw yn tawelu'n fuan a'i benderfyniad yn pallu wrth i'r bibell aer wrthod clirio. Daw'r peswch i ben yn aml drwy gyfogi, caiff drafferth i anadlu a bydd wedi llwyr ddiffygio. Mae'r ataliad yno o hyd, wrth gwrs, ac mae hynny'n parhau flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn.

Yn ddiau—ac yr wyf yn siŵr na fyddai neb yma yn dadlau—mae cyfiawnhad dros y ceisiadau hyn. Gwyddom na fydd yr iawndal mwyaf yn gwella'r dioddefwyr. Ni fyddant yn iach oherwydd ni ellir gwella eu salwch. Fodd bynnag, fe'u hamddifadwyd o fwy na'u hiechyd. Mae gan fy nghymydog wyres hyfryd. Mae'n gwirioni arni ond ni all chwarae gyda hi fel y chwaraea fy nhad

father plays with my children. I am not sure how you compensate for that loss.

When his claim is settled, he can decide what to do with the money. However, he cannot plan now, because he does not know when the money will be awarded to him. If his claim is also subject to the clawback, it will be delayed even longer. There are exemptions, Karen, in the clawback regulation and perhaps you can explain why those illnesses and claims have been exempted.

12:15 p.m.

Lynne Neagle *rose*—

Jocelyn Davies: I will not give way. This subject should not divide the National Assembly. Many of us come from mining communities and all of us appreciate the contribution that this industry has made to our history. Most of us have had requests for help from constituents on this matter. No one here needs to defend the resistance to these claims by the Westminster Government. It would not have taken 10 years to settle the issue through the courts had Westminster Governments not resisted the claims. Instead, we in Wales can be proud that miners took on the might and the resources of a Government to sue for their damages. This is quite an achievement, and they have managed to use the law of tort to win those original test cases in such a long court battle. The precedent set will help miners in other common law jurisdictions throughout the world. We should pay tribute to all the people who led and took part in the battle.

I pay tribute to the *South Wales Argus*, which has been running a campaign for a long time to get justice for the miners. Some of those waiting for their claims to be settled look to the *South Wales Argus* for information, and many who would have been tempted to settle for much less than their full entitlement have, because of the *South Wales Argus* campaign, decided to stick with their full claims. That is only a regional newspaper, and if it can pursue this just cause I am sure the National Assembly can.

gyda'm plant i. Nid wyf yn siŵr sut y digolledwch rywun am y golled honno.

Pan gaiff ei gais ei dalu, gall benderfynu beth i'w wneud gyda'r arian. Fodd bynnag, ni all gynllunio yn awr, oherwydd ni wyr pryd y dyfernir yr arian iddo. Os bydd ei gais yn destun adfachu hefyd, caiff ei oedi hyd yn oed ymhellach. Mae eithriadau, Karen, yn y rheoliad adfachu ac efallai y gallwch egluro pam yr eithriwyd yr afiechydon a'r ceisiadau hynny.

Lynne Neagle *a gododd*—

Jocelyn Davies: Nid ildiaf. Ni ddylai'r testun hwn rannu'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Daw llawer ohonom o gymunedau glofaol a gwerthfawroga llawer ohonom y cyfraniad a wnaeth y diwydiant hwn i'n hanes. Mae llawer ohonom wedi cael ceisiadau am gymorth gan etholwyr ar y mater hwn. Nid oes angen i unrhyw un yma amddiffyn y gwrthwynebiad i'r ceisiadau hyn gan Lywodraeth San Steffan. Ni fyddai wedi cymryd 10 mlynedd i ddatrys y mater drwy'r llysoedd pe na bai Llywodraethau San Steffan wedi gwrthod y ceisiadau. Yn hytrach, gallwn ni yng Nghymru fod yn falch bod y glowyr wedi herio grym ac adnoddau Llywodraeth i ddwyn achos am eu hiawndal. Mae hynny'n dipyn o gamp, ac maent wedi llwyddo i ddefnyddio cyfraith camweddau i ennill yr achosion prawf gwreiddiol hynny mewn brwydr llys mor hir. Bydd y cynsail a osodwyd yn helpu glowyr mewn awdurdodaethau cyfraith gwlad eraill ledled y byd. Dylem dalu teyrnged i'r holl bobl a arweiniodd ac a gymerodd ran yn y frwydr.

Talaf deyrnged i'r *South Wales Argus*, a fu'n ymgyrchu ers amser maith dros gyfiawnder i'r glowyr. Mae rhai o'r bobl hynny sydd yn aros i'w ceisiadau gael eu talu yn dibynnu ar y *South Wales Argus* am wybodaeth, ac mae llawer ohonynt a fyddai wedi cael eu tentio i dderbyn llawer llai na'r hyn y mae ganddynt hawl llawn iddo, oherwydd y *South Wales Argus*, wedi penderfynu cadw at eu ceisiadau llawn. Dim ond papur newydd rhanbarthol yw hwn, ac os gall fwrw ymlaen â'r achos cyfiawn hwn, yr wyf yn siŵr y gall y

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol wneud hynny.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Everybody will not be able to speak in this debate, so brief speeches would be much appreciated.

Kirsty Williams: The constituency of Brecon and Radnorshire is one of contrasts, from its rural heartland down to the upper Swansea Valley. The communities of Ystradgynlais, Pen-y-cae, Coelbren and Caehopcyn are mining communities that share a heritage that perhaps is more commonly associated with the Rhondda Valley. In those communities there is an overwhelming feeling of disappointment, of being let down by a Labour Government in London that they believed would right a long-standing wrong. The miners, their widows and their families had never expected support from the Conservative Party, a party that delayed, blocked and obstructed the miners in their fight for justice every step of the way.

David Davies: Will the Member give way?

Kirsty Williams: I will not give way.

David Davies *rose—*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Kirsty is not giving way. She is scheduled to make a brief speech.

Kirsty Williams: Surely the election result of 1997 meant that things could only get better. I suppose on the grounds that they could not get any worse, there has been some improvement. However, matters have moved slowly, and for some they have not moved at all. The slowness of the Labour Government in Westminster in ensuring that miners and their families in Wales get the compensation has done nothing but cause further suffering on top of the chronic disability brought on by bronchitis, emphysema and other diseases. It seems to some of my constituents that the UK Government prefers paying out money to lawyers, just to make certain that ex-miners who gave their health for the prosperity of this nation do not receive a penny too much.

Given the large number of claims that have been lodged, it was always going to be an extremely difficult process to manage, but the

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Ni all bawb siarad yn y ddadl hon, felly gwerthfawrogir areithiau byr.

Kirsty Williams: Mae etholaeth Brycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed yn llawn gwrthgyferbyniadau, o'i chefn gwlad i Gwm Tawe uchaf. Mae cymunedau Ystradgynlais, Pen-y-cae, Coelbren a Chaehopcyn yn gymunedau glofaol sydd yn rhannu etifeddiaeth a gysylltir yn fwy cyffredinol efallai â Chwm Rhondda. Yn y cymunedau hynny mae ymdeimlad aruthrol o gael eu siomi gan Lywodraeth Lafur yn Llundain a fyddai, yn eu tyb hwy, wedi unioni cam hirsefydlog. Nid oedd y glowyr, eu gweddwon na'u teuluoedd erioed wedi disgwyl cefnogaeth gan y Blaid Geidwadol, plaid a ohiriodd, a rwystrodd ac a ataliodd y glowyr yn eu brwydr dros gyfiawnder bob cam o'r ffordd.

David Davies: A wnaiff yr Aelod ildio?

Kirsty Williams: Nid ildiaf.

David Davies *a gododd—*

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Nid yw Kirsty'n ildio. Trefnwyd iddi roi araith fer.

Kirsty Williams: Siawns na olygodd canlyniad etholiad 1997 y gallai pethau ond gwella. Ar y sail na allai pethau waethygu, bu rhywfaint o welliant am wn i. Fodd bynnag, mae materion wedi datblygu'n araf ac ers peth amser nid ydynt wedi datblygu o gwbl. Nid yw arafwch y Llywodraeth Lafur yn San Steffan wrth sicrhau y caiff glowyr a'u teuluoedd yng Nghymru iawndal wedi gwneud dim ond achosi dioddefaint pellach ar ben yr anabled cronig a achoswyd gan fronchitis, emffysema ac afiechydon eraill. Ymddengys i rai o'm hetholwyr bod yn well gan Lywodraeth y DU dalu arian i gyfreithwyr, er mwyn sicrhau na chaiff cyn lowyr a aberthodd eu hiechyd er mwyn ffyniant y genedl hon geiniog yn ormod.

O gofio'r nifer fawr o geisiadau a gyflwynwyd, yr oedd yn mynd i fod yn broses eithriadol o anodd i'w rheoli, ond nid

UK Government has done little to help itself in the situation. Why did it take so long to establish and accept a priority system? Why sit back and accept poor performance in special processing units? It is high time that we do all that we can to speed up these processes.

As a child I watched my grandfather reduced to a shadow of his former self in a wheelchair, oxygen mask clamped to his face as emphysema drained away the strength that had once enabled him to hew coal from the ground. Now I see constituents in the same state and I receive their letters and petitions. I welcome what the First Minister said in his opening remarks, but the question remains, why has it taken so long for that letter to come from Dr Ruth Hall? Why have any of the measures, which the First Minister will no doubt announce and trumpet today, taken so long? Where have they been? Where has the Labour Government in London been for my constituents in Caehoppcyn, Coelbren, Pen-y-cae and Ystradgynlais?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn llawn sylweddoli beth yr ydym yn ymdrin ag ef yma. 'Iawndal' yw'r gair Cymraeg: talu iawn i weithwyr y diwydiant glo sydd wedi dioddef ac sydd yn parhau i ddioddef. Pan fo angen talu iawn, ni ddylem chwilio am esgusodion i rwystro taliadau. Ni ddylem orfodi glowyr i fynd drwy'r system gyfreithiol i hawlio'r tâl hwnnw. Mae ganddynt hawl iddo, oherwydd eu bod wedi dioddef.

Yn syml, mae glowyr Cwm Aman a Chwm Gwendraeth yn edrych am ewyllys wleidyddol gan y Cynulliad yn y drafodaeth hon i symud y broses ymlaen. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf ddweud bod rhai o gyfraniadau'r drafodaeth hon hyd yn hyn—a gobeithio na chawn fwy o'r cyfraniadau hynny—yn chwilio am esgusodion, yn ceisio trosglwyddo'r bai. Nid dyna mae'r glowyr yn chwilio amdano ar hyn o bryd. Mae'r frwydr hon wedi bod yn mynd ymlaen ers 10 mlynedd, ac mae'r glowyr yn chwilio am ewyllys wleidyddol yn y Cynulliad a chan y Llywodraeth yn San Steffan—ac mae ganddynt hawl i'w disgwyl—i symud y broses ymlaen a thalu'r tâl y mae ganddynt yr

yw Llywodraeth y DU wedi gwneud llawer i helpu ei hun yn y sefyllfa. Pam y cymerodd gymaint o amser i sefydlu a derbyn system flaenoriaethu? Pam llaesu dwylo a derbyn perfformiad gwael mewn unedau prosesu arbennig? Mae'n hen bryd inni wneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i gyflymu'r prosesau hyn.

Fel plentyn, gwyliais fy nhad-cu yn gwanhau nes yr oedd ond cysgod o'r hyn ydoedd yn eistedd mewn cadair olwyn, mwgwd ocsigen am ei wyneb wrth i'r emffysema sugno'r nerth a'i alluogodd gynt i dorri glo o'r ddaear. Yn awr, gwelaf etholwyr yn yr un cyflwr a derbynaf eu llythyrau a'u deisebau. Croesawaf yr hyn a ddywedodd y Prif Weinidog yn ei sylwadau agoriadol, ond erys y cwestiwn, pam y cymerodd gymaint o amser i'r llythyr hwnnw ddod oddi wrth Dr Ruth Hall? Pam y cymerodd unrhyw un o'r mesurau, y bydd y Prif Weinidog yn siŵr o'u cyhoeddi a'u datgan heddiw, gymaint o amser? Ble maent wedi bod? Ble bu'r Llywodraeth Lafur yn Llundain pan oedd ei hangen ar fy etholwyr yng Nghaehoppcyn, Coelbren, Pen-y-cae ac Ystradgynlais?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: It is important that we fully understand what we are dealing with here. 'Iawndal' is the Welsh word—literally a proper or just payment: recompensing coal industry workers who have suffered and who are still suffering. When recompense needs to be made, we should not search for excuses to prevent payments. We should not force miners to go through the legal system to claim payment. They are entitled to it, because they have suffered.

The miners of the Amman Valley and the Gwendraeth Valley are simply looking for the political will of the Assembly in this discussion to drive the process forward. I am sorry to say that some of the contributions to this debate so far—and hopefully we will have no more of those contributions—are looking for excuses, and trying to pass the buck. That is not what miners are looking for at the moment. This battle has been going on for 10 years, and the miners are looking for the political will in this Assembly and the Government in Westminster—and they have a right to expect that—to drive the process forward and to make the payment to which they are entitled.

hawl iddo.

William Graham: We have heard much emotion this morning; to suggest that any one party has a monopoly on compassion is a bogus philosophy. I endorse Karen Sinclair's remarks. Let us look at the facts.

All Members know that governments must be guided by scientific experts. The Industrial Injuries Advisory Committee advises successive governments on diseases that seem to be attributable to a particular occupation. Such 'prescribed' diseases, subject to specified conditions, allow the sufferer to claim weekly benefit from the state. We all agree on that.

In 1973 the IAC concluded that coal dust does not cause disabling chronic bronchitis and emphysema. In 1988, the committee came to the same conclusion. That was a committee of scientific experts. Even if we think that they were wrong, that was their advice at that time. In 1992 it produced a further report recommending prescription of chronic bronchitis and emphysema. This was accepted by the government at that time, and a 'no-fault' compensation scheme—that is with no blame attached to British Coal, and no reduction in compensation for smokers—was introduced in 1993. Some 45,000 applications were received.

The Government's no-fault scheme helped stimulate an influx of claims and—I ask you to note this particularly—an agreement with the plaintiffs' representatives that there should be a High Court test case to examine the issues in detail. Accordingly, eight lead cases were selected, which embraced a variety of lung injuries and working histories, to establish whether their injuries were caused by coal dust and/or nitrous fumes. We know what happened subsequently: Mr Justice Turner ruled that there was a causative link between exposure to coal-mining dust and a contribution to some respiratory conditions. We agree with that.

We are all concerned about the increasing

William Graham: Clywsom lawer o emosiwn y bore yma; mae awgrymu bod gan un blaid fonopoli ar dosturi yn ffugathroniaeth. Cymeradwyaf sylwadau Karen Sinclair. Gadewch inni edrych ar y ffeithiau.

Gwyr pob Aelod fod yn rhaid i lywodraethau gael eu harwain gan arbenigwyr gwyddonol. Mae'r Pwyllgor Ymgynghorol Anafiadau Diwydiannol yn cynghori llywodraethau olynol ar afiechydon y gellir eu priodoli yn ôl pob tebyg i alwedigaeth benodol. Mae afiechydon 'penodol' o'r fath, yn ddarostyngedig i amodau penodedig, yn caniatáu i'r dioddefwr wneud cais am fudd-dâl wythnosol gan y wladwriaeth. Cytuna pob un ohonom ar hynny.

Yn 1973 daeth y Pwyllgor Ymgynghorol Anafiadau Diwydiannol i'r casgliad nad yw llwch glo yn achosi bronchitis ac emffysema cronig sydd yn analluogi. Yn 1988, daeth y pwyllgor i'r un casgliad. Yr oedd hwnnw'n bwyllgor o arbenigwyr gwyddonol. Hyd yn oed os credwn eu bod yn anghywir, dyna oedd eu cyngor ar y pryd. Yn 1992, cynhyrchodd adroddiad pellach yn argymhell rhagnodi bronchitis ac emffysema cronig. Derbyniwyd hynny gan y llywodraeth ar y pryd, a chyflwynwyd cynllun iawndal 'dim bai'—hynny yw heb roi unrhyw fai ar British Coal, a dim gostyngiad mewn iawndal i ysmygwyr—yn 1993. Derbyniwyd tua 45,000 o geisiadau.

Cynorthwyodd cynllun dim bai y llywodraeth i ysgogi dylifiad o geisiadau a—gofynnaf ichi nodi hyn yn arbennig—chytundeb gyda chynrychiolwyr yr achwynyddion y dylid cynnal achos prawf yn yr Uchel Lys i archwilio'r materion yn fanwl. Yn unol â hynny, detholwyd wyth achos arweiniol, a ymgorfforai amrywiaeth o anafiadau i'r ysgyfaint a hanesion am waith, er mwyn sefydlu a achoswyd eu hanafiadau gan lwch glo a/neu anweddu nitraidd. Gwyddom beth a ddigwyddodd wedi hynny: dyfarnodd Meistr Ustus Turner fod cysylltiad achosol rhwng amlygiad i lwch glo a chyfraniad tuag at rai mathau o salwch anadlu. Cytunwn â hynny.

Mae pob un ohonom yn pryderu am y

problems with settling those claims. I am sure that the First Minister and the Assembly's Executive are pressing their colleagues at every opportunity to ensure that these claims are settled. It is incomprehensible that there should be attempts to milk this for extra votes, which we condemn. We ask the First Minister to take on board our reservations about what is happening—I know that he shares those reservations—and we urge him to ensure that everything will be done to meet these claims as justly and quickly as possible.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call Lorraine Barrett.

Lorraine Barrett: Thank you, Deputy Presiding Officer. I had just sent you an e-mail to ask you not to call me to speak because everything has been said already.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have just received it. You may have three minutes if you wish.

Lorraine Barrett: I welcome William Graham's and Karen Sinclair's comments; they spoke much sense. I was getting so angry sitting here and I did not want to bring in an emotional element into this debate. My father has pneumoconiosis. My grandfather had emphysema and died of it, as did two of my uncles. This is like the Communities First debate: who has the most deprivation in their constituencies? We did not need to rehearse all that emotion, some of which made me feel sick as it was churned out.

12:25 p.m.

All Assembly Members and Members of Parliament want former miners who are eligible for compensation to receive it as soon as possible. However, it was only after Labour come to power in 1997 that the liability for those claims was accepted. Much work has been done. We can all say that it is not being done quickly enough. However, the First Minister has explained the difficulty in finding enough experts such as respiratory consultants. More testing centres have been established in Wales than in any other part of

problemau cynyddol o ran talu'r ceisiadau hynny. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod y Prif Weinidog a Gweithrediaeth y Cynulliad yn pwysu ar eu cyd-Aelodau ar bob cyfle i sicrhau y telir y ceisiadau hyn. Mae'n anodd credu bod ymdrechion yn cael eu gwneud i odro hyn am bleidleisiau ychwanegol, a chondemniwn hynny. Gofynnwn i'r Prif Weinidog ystyried ein hamheuon ynglŷn â'r hyn sydd yn digwydd—gwn ei fod yn rhannu'r amheuon hynny—ac anogwn ef i sicrhau y gwneir popeth i dalu'r ceisiadau hyn yn y ffordd fwyaf cyfiawn a chyflym posibl.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Galwaf ar Lorraine Barrett.

Lorraine Barrett: Diolch ichi, Ddirprwy Lywydd. Yr oeddwn newydd anfon e-bost atoch yn gofyn ichi beidio â'm galw i siarad gan fod popeth wedi ei ddweud eisoes.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf newydd ei dderbyn. Cewch dair munud os dymunwch.

Lorraine Barrett: Croesawaf sylwadau William Graham a Karen Sinclair; yr oeddent yn siarad llawer o synnwyr. Yr oeddwn yn mynd yn ddig iawn yn eistedd yma ac nid oeddwn am ddod ag elfen emosiynol i'r ddadl hon. Mae fy nhad yn dioddef o glefyd y llwch. Yr oedd gan fy nhad-cu emfffysema a bu farw ohono, fel y gwnaeth dau o'm hewythrod. Mae hyn fel y ddadl Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf: pwy sydd â'r amddifadedd mwyaf yn eu hetholaethau? Nid oedd angen inni fynd drwy'r holl emosiwn hwnnw, a theimlais yn sâl wrth wrando ar rai o'r hanesion.

Mae pob Aelod o'r Cynulliad ac Aelodau Seneddol am i gyn-lowyr sydd yn gymwys i gael iawndal ei dderbyn cyn gynted â phosibl. Fodd bynnag, dim ond ar ôl i Lafur ddod i rym yn 1997 y derbyniwyd yr atebolrwydd am y ceisiadau hynny. Gwnaethpwyd llawer o waith. Gall pob un ohonom ddweud na chaiff ei wneud yn ddigon cyflym. Fodd bynnag, eglurodd y Prif Weinidog pa mor anodd yw dod o hyd i ddigon o arbenigwyr, fel ymgynghorwyr afiechydon anadlu. Sefydlwyd mwy o ganolfannau profi yng

the UK. We should go forward from here with one voice, accepting that much has been done and that much remains to be done. We should go forward together. However, the way in which Plaid Cymru has handled this debate is pure party politicking. I cannot support it in that, as the issue is too emotive for me.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The First Minister has five minutes to reply.

The First Minister: I apologise for taking up the Assembly's time again. However, Members will understand why I am speaking again.

The letter being sent out today by the Chief Medical Officer for Wales, Dr Ruth Hall, is a quick development. It was only agreed on Monday that it would be sent out. The Department of Trade and Industry is the lead body in seeking to hire respiratory consultants. The Assembly's actions, through the Chief Medical Officer for Wales, are over and above those of the DTI, as we have better contacts with retired respiratory consultants in Wales. It was agreed that a letter would be sent out on Monday and it is being acted upon on Thursday. Members may ask why this was not done before. Although it could have been done yesterday, perhaps, it was only agreed on Monday and is additional to the DTI's efforts to re-recruit retired respiratory consultants.

Alun Cairns: Do you accept that, without the persistent change in ministerial responsibility at the DTI, this could have happened much earlier? If you disagree, why did it not happen much earlier?

The First Minister: This issue of ministerial changes raised by the Conservatives is wrong. John Battle MP inherited this during a long stint, by governmental standards, as Minister of State at the DTI. He was in post for about 27 months. When the major reshuffle took place in the summer of 1999, Helen Liddell MP took over. That was one

Nghymru nag mewn unrhyw ran o'r DU. Dylem symud ymlaen gydag un llais o'r fan hon, gan dderbyn bod llawer wedi ei wneud a bod llawer eto i'w wneud. Dylem symud ymlaen gyda'n gilydd. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ffordd y mae Plaid Cymru wedi trin y ddatl hon yn wleidyddia pleidiol pur. Ni allaf ei chefnogi yn hynny o beth, gan fod y mater yn un rhy emosiynol i mi.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae gan y Prif Weinidog bum munud i ymateb.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ymddiheuraf am fynd ag amser y Cynulliad unwaith eto. Fodd bynnag, bydd yr Aelodau yn deall pam fy mod yn llefaru eto.

Mae'r llythyr a anfonir heddiw gan Brif Swyddog Meddygol Cymru, Dr Ruth Hall, yn ddatblygiad cyflym. Dim ond dydd Llun y cytunwyd y câi ei anfon. Yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant yw'r corff arweiniol sydd yn ceisio cyflogi ymgynghorwyr afiechydon anadlu. Mae'r camau y cymer y Cynulliad, drwy Brif Swyddog Meddygol Cymru, yn ychwanegol at rai'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant, gan fod gwell cysylltiadau gennym ag ymgynghorwyr afiechydon anadlu yng Nghymru sydd wedi ymddeol. Cytunwyd y câi llythyr ei anfon ddydd Llun gan weithredu arno ddydd Iau. Efallai y bydd yr Aelodau yn gofyn pam na wnaethpwyd hyn yn gynt. Er y gellid bod wedi ei wneud ddoe, efallai, dim ond ddydd Llun y cytunwyd ar hyn ac mae'n ychwanegol at ymdrechion yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant i ailrecriwtio ymgynghorwyr afiechydon anadlu sydd wedi ymddeol.

Alun Cairns: A dderbyniwch, heb y newid cyson mewn cyfrifoldeb gweinidogol yn yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant, y gallai hyn fod wedi digwydd lawer ynghynt? Os anghytunwch, pam na ddigwyddodd lawer ynghynt?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae'r mater hwn o newidiadau gweinidogol a godwyd gan y Ceidwadwyr yn anghywir. Etifeddodd John Battle AS hyn yn ystod cyfnod hir, yn ôl safonau llywodraeth, fel Gweinidog Gwladol yn yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant. Bu yn ei swydd am tua 27 mis. Yn ystod yr ad-drefnu mawr yn haf 1999, cymerodd Helen Liddell

ministerial change. There was only one further change, which occurred last month as a result of the resignation of the Secretary of State for Northern Ireland. Following the post-Mandelson trauma, Helen Liddell left the DTI. Therefore, there have not been many ministerial changes and it is not a problem.

The Assembly is not the main body responsible for this. Central Government is party to this dispute. It is glad that it lost the dispute, and is now trying to find a way of paying out the money arising from that. The Assembly's only other involvement is as guardian of NHS records, which are of critical significance. It is standard procedure that we have agreed with general practitioners and hospitals that, when records need to be found for the processing to take place, priority will be given to finding them. We have asked GPs to speed this up and, although they are self-employed contractors and it is up to them in the end, I am sure that they will show the same goodwill as hospitals, where we have more direct control to insist that records are found. The records can date back to the cut-off point of 1954.

I agree with Ieuan Wyn Jones on the clawback. When we can agree on something, we should do so and announce it. Ieuan is right that the only basis on which you can overcome the problem to which Karen referred eloquently in her outstanding contribution is where the cost of recovery is greater than the value of the money recovered. You cannot sweep away the recovery issue because it means double compensation. That would mean changing the law, which would take time. However, you can demonstrate, as Ieuan implied, that the cost of recovery is greater than the money recovered. When that is done, you can make a ministerial judgment that recovery does not occur. We have been seeking to do that. Ieuan is right—in many cases where recovery has occurred, £100 has been recovered at a cost of £300 of civil service clerical time.

Labour MPs in Westminster have been seeking to agree with the Department of

AS drosodd. Yr oedd hwnnw'n un newid gweinidogol. Dim ond un newid arall a fu, a ddigwyddodd fis diwethaf o ganlyniad i ymddiswyddiad yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Ogledd Iwerddon. Yn dilyn y trawma ar ôl ymadawiad Mandelson, gadawodd Helen Liddell yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant. Felly, ni fu llawer o newidiadau gweinidogol ac nid yw'n broblem.

Nid y Cynulliad yw'r prif gorff sydd yn gyfrifol am hyn. Mae'r Llywodraeth ganolog yn rhan o'r anghydfod hwn. Mae'n falch ei bod wedi colli'r anghydfod, ac mae bellach yn ceisio canfod ffordd o dalu'r arian sydd yn deillio o hynny. Yr unig ffordd arall y mae'r Cynulliad yn ymwneud â hyn yw drwy ei rôl fel gwarchodwr cofnodion yr NHS, sydd yn holl bwysig. Mae'n weithdrefn safonol y cytunasom arni gyda meddygon teulu ac ysbytai, sef rhoi'r flaenoriaeth ar ddod o hyd i gofnodion pan fydd eu hangen er mwyn i'r prosesu ddigwydd yn y lle cyntaf. Yr ydym wedi gofyn i feddygon teulu gyflymu'r broses hon ac er eu bod yn gcontractwyr hunangyflogedig a'u cyfrifoldeb hwy yw hyn yn y pen draw, yr wyf yn siŵr y dangosant yr un ewyllys da ag ysbytai, lle mae gennym reolaeth fwy uniongyrchol i fynnu y canfyddir cofnodion. Gall y cofnodion ddyddio'n ôl i'r torbwynt yn 1954.

Cytunaf â Ieuan Wyn Jones ar bwynt yr adfachu. Pan allwn gytuno ar rywbeth, dylem wneud hynny a'i gyhoeddi. Mae Ieuan yn iawn mai'r unig sail i allu goresgyn y broblem hon y cyfeiriodd Karen ati mor huawdl yn ei chyfraniad rhagorol yw lle mae cost yr adennill yn fwy na gwerth yr arian a adennillir. Ni allwch anwybyddu'r adennill oherwydd mae'n golygu dwbl yr iawndal. Byddai hynny'n golygu newid y gyfraith, a fyddai'n cymryd amser. Fodd bynnag, gallwch arddangos, fel yr awgrymodd Ieuan, fod cost yr adennill yn fwy na'r arian a adennillir. Pan wneir hynny, gallwch wneud dyfarniad gweinidogol nad yw adennill yn digwydd. Buom yn ceisio gwneud hynny. Mae Ieuan yn iawn—mewn sawl achos lle mae adennill wedi digwydd, adennillwyd £100 ar gost o £300 o amser clercaidd y gwasanaeth sifil.

Bu ASau Llafur yn San Steffan yn ceisio cytuno â'r Adran Nawdd Cymdeithasol a

Social Security and have been telling them to ignore these recovery claims when, as time goes by, overwhelming evidence emerges that the recovery is not worth a candle. However, you cannot set it aside altogether without changing the law. It would be a false premise to the miners to hold out hopes of a change in the law. If you changed the law you are into Karen's problem; why change the law on emphysema but not on asbestosis? The issue that was raised earlier is the way forward. If we can agree on that, Westminster MPs and Assembly Members would agree that we are looking to demonstrate that.

On pensions, there is widespread agreement on both sides that even the solicitors are close to final agreement. I do not want to disturb those delicate negotiations between solicitors for the Government and the miners. I am told that there are only one or two technical points left. That will solve the pension problem, which is the third item in Plaid Cymru's motion.

We are not that far apart today. We would have liked to set aside the occasional grandstanding and the occasional accusation of grandstanding. If there had been some change on your motion, we would have dispensed with that, Ieuan. The way we have made this case is the right way. We are not that far apart from each other. We must take party politics out of this issue.

Dafydd Wigley: Ymatebaf i'r ddadl hon drwy ddweud na fyddem yn trafod y mater hwn heddiw oni bai am gynnig Plaid Cymru. Dylem gofio hynny. Mae Rhodri Morgan yn cyhuddo Ieuan Wyn Jones o fod yn 'disingenuous'. Hoffwn ei atgoffa fod Ieuan Wyn Jones hefyd yn siarad o brofiad teuluol. Bu ef a'i dad yn Chwarel y Penrhyn a cholodd ewythr o effaith llwch. Gwyddom oll yn ein hetholaethau am agweddau ar y problemau hyn. Mae cwestiwn iawndal llwch ar gyfer chwarelwyr sydd yn dioddef o emffysema eto i'w ddatrys.

Teimlaf i'r byw fod y mater hwn wedi mynd ymlaen yn rhy hir ac roedd angen, fel y lledawgrymodd Rhodri, dod â'r mater i ben ymhell cyn heddiw. Byddai'n dda pe bai pawb yn gallu cytuno ar hynny. Mae 30,000

buont yn dweud wrthynt i anwybyddu'r ceisiadau adennill hyn tra bod tystiolaeth aruthrol yn dod i'r golwg, wrth i amser fynd heibio, nad yw'r adennill yn werth y drafferth. Fodd bynnag, ni allwch ei roi i un ochr yn gyfan gwbl heb newid y gyfraith. Byddai'n rhagosodiad ffug i'r glowyr i gynnig gobaith y byddai'r gyfraith yn newid. Pe baech yn newid y gyfraith yna mae problem Karen yn berthnasol; pam newid y gyfraith ar emffysema ond nid ar asbestosis? Y mater a godwyd yn gynharach yw'r ffordd ymlaen. Os gallwn gytuno ar hynny, byddai ASau San Steffan ac Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn cytuno ein bod yn bwriadu arddangos hynny.

Ar bensiynau, mae cytundeb cyffredinol ar y ddwy ochr bod hyd yn oed y cyfreithwyr yn agos at gytundeb terfynol. Nid wyf am darfu ar y negodi anodd rhwng cyfreithwyr y Llywodraeth a'r glowyr. Dywedir wrthyf mai dim ond un neu ddau o bwyntiau technegol sydd heb eu trafod. Bydd hynny'n datrys problem y pensiynau, sef y drydedd eitem yng nghynnig Plaid Cymru.

Nid oes fawr o wahaniaeth barn rhyngom heddiw. Byddem wedi hoffi anwybyddu'r tynnu sylw achlysurol a'r cyhuddiad o dynnu sylw achlysurol. Pe bai rhywfaint o newid wedi bod yn eich cynnig, byddem wedi hepgor hynny, Ieuan. Hon oedd y ffordd gywir o gyflwyno'r achos hwn. Nid ydym mor bell â hynny oddi wrth ein gilydd. Rhaid dileu gwleidyddiaeth bleidiol o'r mater hwn.

Dafydd Wigley: I respond to this debate by saying that we would not be discussing this issue today were it not for the motion tabled by Plaid Cymru. We should remember that. Rhodri Morgan accuses Ieuan Wyn Jones of being disingenuous, but I remind him that Ieuan Wyn Jones is also talking from family experience. He and his father worked in Penrhyn Quarry and he lost an uncle to the effects of dust. We all know of aspects of this problem in our constituencies. The question of compensation for quarrymen who suffer from emphysema has yet to be resolved.

I firmly believe that this issue has dragged on for far too long and, as Rhodri half-suggested, it should have been brought to a close long before today. I would like to see us all agreeing on that. There are 30,000 cases in

o achosion yng Nghymru. O'u plith, 455 o geisiadau yn unig a broseswyd yn llawn hyd at y mis diwethaf. Hyd yn oed o gymryd ffigurau Rhodri, 897 o achosion o'r 30,000 a broseswyd. Mae hynny'n annerbyniol.

Methodd y llywodraeth â dyfeisio system sydd yn gallu asesu a thalu yn brydlon ac effeithiol. Mae adfachu'r iawndal yn ddieflig ac yn groes i resymeg talu iawndal.

Lynne Neagle *a gododd—*

Dafydd Wigley: Nid ildiaf, yr wyf yn cloi'r ddadl. Holl bwrpas yr iawndal yw derbyn cydnabyddiaeth o ddiodefaint. Mae lleihad mewn gallu i fwynhau bywyd, ac yn wir byrhau bywyd, yn sylfaen ar gyfer talu iawndal. Nid pwrpas iawndal yw talu arian at fyw o ddydd i ddydd. Mae'r egwyddor eisoes yn gydnabyddedig o fewn y gyfundrefn nawdd cymdeithasol. Os yw person yn derbyn lwfans symudedd neu lwfans gweini, nid yw'n golygu gostyngiad mewn budd-daliadau eraill. Ni ddylai iawndal sydd yn ddyledus i'r glowyr, ac i weddwon y glowyr, gael ei leihau geiniog. Dylid ei dalu'n llawn.

Tynnaf sylw hefyd sylw at y ffaith bod iawndal clefyd y llwch eisoes yn cael ei eithrio mewn rhai amgylchiadau. Mae'r Torïaid wedi cefnogi hynny. Os oes angen newid y ddeddfwriaeth, fel yr awgrymodd Rhodri, dylid mynd ati i wneud hynny. Beth sydd yn ein dal yn ôl rhag gwneud hynny? Cofiaf yn 1979 sut yr aeth Deddf Clefyd y Llwch drwy Dy'r Cyffredin a Thy'r Arglwyddi mewn dau ddiwrnod. Pan fo gan y Llywodraeth yr ewyllys i wneud rhywbeth, mae'n bosibl ei wneud. Nid yw'r ewyllys yno yn awr a dyna pam y bu farw cymaint o lowyr heb gael yr iawndal yr oedd ganddynt yr hawl i'w dderbyn. Mae hynny'n warthus.

Cyfeiriodd Rhodri at brinder technegwyr. Mae'r achos llys wedi ei setlo ers tair blynedd. Yn sicr, gellid bod wedi gwneud rhywbeth yn yr amser hwnnw. Croesawn unrhyw gam ymlaen a geir yr wythnos hon gan y Cynulliad. Os oedd gan y Cynulliad yr hawl i weithredu, pam nad yw wedi gwneud hynny cyn hyn? Croesawn y ffaith ei fod yn digwydd yn awr. Gwell hwyr na hwyrach. Fodd bynnag, ble y mae'r Adran Masnach a

Wales. Only 455 had been fully processed up to the end of last month. If we take the figures to which Rhodri referred, only 897 cases out of 30,000 have been processed. That is unacceptable.

The Government has failed to devise a system that can assess and make payments promptly and effectively. The clawback of compensation is diabolical and flies in the face of the logic of compensation.

Lynne Neagle *rose—*

Dafydd Wigley: I will not give way, I am closing the debate. The whole point of the compensation is the recognition of suffering. A deterioration in quality of life, and indeed in life expectancy, forms the basis for the compensation payment. The purpose of compensation is not to pay money for day-to-day expenses. That is already recognised in the social security system. If you receive mobility or attendance allowance, it does not mean a reduction in other benefits. The compensation due to miners, and to miners' widows, should not be reduced by one penny. It should be paid in full.

I also draw attention to the fact that pneumoconiosis compensation is already exempt in some circumstances. The Tories have supported that. If, as Rhodri suggested, the legislation needs to be amended, then we should set about it. What is stopping us from doing that? I remember in 1979, that the Pneumoconiosis Act was passed through the House of Commons and the House of Lords in two days. When the Government has the will to take action, it is possible. The truth is that the will does not exist and that is why so many miners have died before receiving the compensation to which they were entitled. That is a disgrace.

Rhodri referred to the lack of technicians. The court case was settled three years ago. Certainly, action could have been taken in that time. We welcome the fact that the Assembly is taking steps this week. If the Assembly had the right to act, why has it not done so before now? I welcome the fact that it is happening now. Better late than never. However, where has the DTI been? This is unreasonable. I welcome Kirsty Williams's

Diwydiant wedi bod? Mae'n afresymol. Croesawaf sylwadau Kirsty Williams, a ddaeth o'i phrofiad personol. Yr wyf yn falch ei bod yn condemnio agwedd y Llywodraeth yn San Steffan a'r amser a gymerir i ddatrys hyn. Trof yn awr at y sylwadau ar Bleddyn Hancock.

12:35 p.m.

I know Bleddyn Hancock. I lived with him in Merthyr Tydfil before I became an MP, and I know of his fight to ensure this compensation. He and NACODS, his union, risked all in pursuing this case through the courts at a time when others who could have done so turned their backs on these sufferers. The recent attacks on Bleddyn Hancock, who has led this fight, are disgraceful. It is also outrageous that even now the New Labour Government in Westminster is taking steps that could further delay the payment of compensation to widows. On 15 and 16 March, the solicitors on behalf of the Government are taking this issue back to the courts again to try to reduce the Government's payment to widows. I hope that the Liberal Democrat/Labour Government here will disassociate itself from the despicable policy pursued by its colleagues in London. If it does not, when the time of reckoning comes, the people will hold it to account.

comments, which arose from her personal experience. I am pleased that she condemns the Westminster Government's attitude and the time that it is taking to resolve this. I will now turn to the comments on Bleddyn Hancock.

Yr wyf yn adnabod Bleddyn Hancock. Bûm yn byw gydag ef ym Merthyr Tudful cyn imi ddod yn AS, a gwn am ei frwydr i sicrhau'r iawndal hwn. Peryglodd ef a NACODS, ei undeb, y cyfan wrth erlyn yr achos hwn drwy'r llysoedd ar adeg pan drodd eraill a allai fod wedi gwneud hynny eu cefnau ar y dioddefwyr hyn. Mae'r ymosodiadau diweddar ar Bleddyn Hancock, a arweiniodd y frwydr hon, yn warthus. Mae'n gywilyddus hefyd bod y Llywodraeth Lafur Newydd yn San Steffan hyd yn oed yn awr yn cymryd camau a allai oedi talu iawndal i wragedd gweddw ymhellach. Ar 15 a 16 Mawrth, mae'r cyfreithwyr ar ran y Llywodraeth yn mynd â'r mater hwn yn ôl i'r llysoedd unwaith eto i geisio gostwng taliad y Llywodraeth i'r gwagedd gweddw. Gobeithiaf y bydd Llywodraeth y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol/Llafur yma yn datgysylltu ei hun oddi wrth y polisi ffaidd a ddilynir gan ei chyd-Aelodau yn Llundain. Os na wna, pan ddaw dydd y farn, bydd pobl yn ei dwyn i gyfrif.

Gwelliant 1: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 26.

Gwelliant 1: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 26.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Rogers, Peter
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
Feld, Val
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn

Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 24, Ymatal 7, Yn erbyn 16.
Amendment 2: For 24, Abstain 7, Against 16.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
Feld, Val
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty
Williams, Phil

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Graham, William
Melding, David
Rogers, Peter

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment adopted.*

Amended motion:

the National Assembly expresses its concern at the delay in dealing with claims for compensation by former miners and their families in Wales following the High Court ruling on 23 January 1998, and calls on the

Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:

mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn mynegi ei bryder ynghylch yr oedi mewn perthynas â delio â hawliadau am iawndal gan gyn-lowyr a'u teuluoedd yng Nghymru yn dilyn dyfarniad yr Uchel Lys ar 23 Ionawr 1998,

First Minister to make the strongest representations to the UK Government to do everything within its legal powers to ensure the prompt distribution of the funds already made available for the compensation of former miners and dependents.

ac mae'n galw ar Brif Weinidog Cymru i ddwyn pwysau sylweddol ar Lywodraeth y DU i wneud y cyfan o fewn ei bwerau cyfreithiol i sicrhau bod y cyllid sydd eisoes wedi'i neilltuo ar gyfer talu iawndal i gyn-lowyr a'r rhai sydd yn ddibynnol arnynt yn cael ei ddosbarthu'n ddiymdroi.

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amended motion: For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
Feld, Val
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Rogers, Peter
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty
Williams, Phil

Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.

Amended motion adopted.

Cynigion Trefniadol Procedural Motions

The Deputy Presiding Officer: It is 12.37 p.m. We cannot prolong the session in order to hold the short debate. What I propose may be at variance with past practice, but the Presiding Office is confident that we have interpreted the Standing Orders correctly. I invite Janice Gregory to propose a procedural motion under Standing Order No. 6.16. If 10 Members are in support and the motion is adopted, she will be invited to move a further procedural motion to postpone her short debate under Standing Order No. 6.10. However, that vote cannot take place if 10 Members object to it.

Janice Gregory: I propose that

the National Assembly, under Standing Order No. 6.16, allows me to propose a further procedural motion to postpone the short debate.

I propose this motion in order to protect the rights of ordinary Assembly Members and their short debates.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Do 10 Members support the motion? I see that they do. We will proceed to a vote.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae'n 12.37 p.m. Ni allwn ymestyn y sesiwn er mwyn cynnal y ddadl fer. Efallai y bydd yr hyn a gynigiau yn groes i'r arfer yn y gorffennol, ond mae Swyddfa'r Llywydd yn hyderus ein bod wedi dehongli'r Rheolau Sefydlog yn gywir. Gwahoddaf Janice Gregory i gynnig cynnig trefniadol o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.16. Os cefnogir hyn gan 10 Aelod a mabwysiedir y cynnig, caiff ei gwahodd i gynnig cynnig trefniadol pellach i ohirio ei dadl fer o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.10. Fodd bynnag, ni ellir cynnal pleidlais os bydd 10 Aelod yn gwrthwynebu hyn.

Janice Gregory: Cynigiau fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.16, yn caniatáu imi gynnig cynnig trefniadol pellach i ohirio'r ddadl fer.

Cynigiau y cynnig hwn er mwyn diogelu hawliau Aelodau cyffredin o'r Cynulliad a'u dadleuon byr.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: A oes 10 Aelod yn cefnogi'r cynnig? Gwelaf eu bod. Awn ymlaen i bleidleisio.

*Cynnig: O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue

Evans, Delyth
 Feld, Val
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hancock, Brian
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Rogers, Peter
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Kirsty
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion adopted.*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I therefore invite Janice Gregory to propose a procedural motion to postpone her short debate.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Felly gwahoddaf Janice Gregory i gynnig cynnig trefniadol i ohirio ei dadl fer.

Janice Gregory: I propose that

Janice Gregory: Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly, under Standing Order No. 6.10, postpones my short debate until a later date.

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.10, yn gohirio fy nadl fer i'w chynnal ar ddyddiad i'w drefnu

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Do 10 Members object? I see that they do not. We will therefore proceed to a vote.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: A oes 10 Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf nad oes. Felly awn ymlaen i bleidleisio.

*Cynnig: O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
 Motion: For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Butler, Rosemary
 Cairns, Alun
 Chapman, Christine
 Davidson, Jane

Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Feld, Val
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Rogers, Peter
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion adopted.*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â
today's proceedings to a close. chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 12.39 p.m.
The session ended at 12.39 p.m.*