



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru**  
**(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales**  
**(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Iau 8 Chwefror 2001**

**Thursday 8 February 2001**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 3 Cwestiynau ar Gyllid i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau  
*Questions on Finance to the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities*
- 12 Cwestiynau i Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog Cymru a Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd  
*Questions to the Deputy First Minister and Minister for Economic Development*
- 21 Datganiad ar Dairy Crest  
*Statement on Dairy Crest*
- 30 Datganiad ar y Strategaeth Datblygu Economaidd Genedlaethol  
*Statement on the National Economic Development Strategy*
- 49 Pwyntiau o Drefn  
*Points of Order*
- 57 Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ar Gymorth i Fusnesau  
*The Economic Development Committee Report on Business Support*
- 82 Cynnig Trefniadol  
*Procedural Motion*
- 84 Darlledu a Chyfarthrebu  
*Broadcasting and Communication*
- 106 Datganiad gan y Dirprwy Lywydd  
*Statement by the Deputy Presiding Officer*
- 106 Dadl Fer: Marwolaethau yn y Mynyddoedd—Gwella Diogelwch ym Mynyddoedd Cymru  
*Short Debate: Death in the Mountains—Improving Mountain Safety in Wales*

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 9.05 a.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 9.05 a.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

**Cwestiynau ar Gyllid i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau  
Questions on Finance to the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities**

**Hybu Cyfle Cyfartal  
Promoting Equal Opportunity**

**Q1 Peter Black:** How will the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities be promoting equal opportunities among Assembly sponsored public bodies and other bodies funded by the National Assembly such as local government? (OAQ9410) [R]

**C1 Peter Black:** Sut mae'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau yn bwriadu hyrwyddo cyfle cyfartal ymhlith cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad a chyrrff eraill a ariennir gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol megis llywodraeth leol? (OAQ9410) [R]

**The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart):** I encourage all Assembly sponsored public bodies and other bodies, such as local authorities, to promote equal opportunities. I am currently in discussion with the Welsh Local Government Association to consider how equality can be mainstreamed in the work of local authorities through Best Value. I am reviewing how the Assembly manages its sponsored public bodies to ensure that equality is embedded in their operations and planning, and that they are accountable to Ministers for that.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart):** Anogaf bob corff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad a chorff arall, megis awdurdodau lleol, i hybu cyfle cyfartal. Ar hyn o bryd yr wyf wrthi'n trafod gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru i ystyried y ffordd y gellir prif ffrydio cydraddoldeb yng ngwaith awdurdodau lleol drwy Werth Gorau. Yr wyf yn adolygu'r ffordd y mae'r Cynulliad yn rheoli'r cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir ganddo er mwyn sicrhau bod cydraddoldeb yn rhan o'u gwaith a'u cynllunio, a'u bod yn atebol i Weinidogion yn hynny o beth.

**Peter Black:** What scope is there to include a review of equal opportunities as part of the quinquennial reviews of Assembly sponsored public bodies?

**Peter Black:** Pa bosibiliadau sydd yna i gynnwys adolygiad o gyfle cyfartal fel rhan o'r adolygiadau pum mlynedd o gyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad?

**Edwina Hart:** We will have to bear that in mind. It is essential that we recognise that there is a role and function for equality of opportunity in those organisations. It should be mainstreamed and we want to focus on that. It has been the subject of discussion in the Committee on Equality of Opportunity and we need to discuss it further.

**Edwina Hart:** Bydd yn rhaid inni gadw hynny mewn cof. Mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn cydnabod bod yna rôl a swyddogaeth i gyfle cyfartal yn y sefydliadau hynny. Dylid ei brif ffrydio ac yr ydym am ganolbwyntio ar hynny. Bu'n destun trafodaeth yn y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal ac mae angen inni ei drafod ymhellach.

**Helen Mary Jones:** How content is the Minister that all Assembly sponsored public bodies will respond positively to our approaches on equal opportunities, given, for example, the apparent reluctance of the Qualifications, Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales and Estyn to co-operate with the Committee on Equality of

**Helen Mary Jones:** Pa mor fodlon y mae'r Gweinidog yr ymateba pob corff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad yn gadarnhaol i'n hymagweddau ar gyfle cyfartal, o ystyried, er enghraifft, amharodrwydd ymddangosiadol Awdurdod Cymwysterau, Cwricwlwm ac Asesu Cymru ac Estyn i gydweithredu â'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal ynghylch gweithredu

Opportunity over implementing the education requirements of the Macpherson report on the Stephen Lawrence inquiry? Will you comment on the overall progress towards implementing those recommendations in Wales?

**Edwina Hart:** We are always hopeful that Assembly sponsored public bodies will respond positively to our actions, particularly regarding the Macpherson report. I share the Committee's concerns about the apparent reluctance to tackle the issues arising from that report to ensure that we change what happens in Wales in terms of the curriculum and other issues. I had a positive meeting with Jane Davidson, the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning. She indicated that there will be an interim report for the next Committee meeting and a full report, which will hopefully address all the concerns that you, Helen, as Chair of the working group on the Macpherson report, have raised to ensure that its recommendations are fully implemented across the sector. David Melding has also raised several issues on this.

**Lorraine Barrett:** While promoting equal opportunities among the Assembly sponsored public bodies, will you take on board the issue of translation of materials into languages other than Welsh and English, which is a big issue in ensuring that everyone has all the information they need?

**Edwina Hart:** I would be delighted to do so. I will make interim inquiries about what facilities are currently available and report back to the Committee on Equality of Opportunity.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 2 has been transferred for written answer.

### **Arian ar gyfer Materion Trawsbynciol Funding for Cross-cutting Issues**

**Q3 Peter Black:** What funding has been earmarked to take forward cross-cutting issues in the National Assembly? (OAQ9431)

**Edwina Hart:** One theme of my budget was

gofynion addysg adroddiad Macpherson ar ymchwiliad Stephen Lawrence? A wnewch sylw ar y cynnydd cyffredinol tuag at weithredu'r argymhellion hynny yng Nghymru?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr ydym yn obeithiol bob amser yr ymateba cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad yn gadarnhaol i'r camau a gymerwn, yn arbennig o ran adroddiad Macpherson. Rhannaf bryderon y Pwyllgor am yr amharodrwydd ymddangosiadol i fynd i'r afael â'r materion sydd yn deillio o'r adroddiad hwnnw i sicrhau y newidiwn beth sydd yn digwydd yng Nghymru yn nhermau'r cwricwlwm a materion eraill. Cefais gyfarfod cadarnhaol gyda Jane Davidson, y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Nododd y bydd adroddiad interim ar gyfer cyfarfod nesaf y Pwyllgor ac adroddiad llawn, a fydd gobeithio yn mynd i'r afael â phob un o'r pryderon yr ydych chi, Helen, fel Cadeirydd y gweithgor ar adroddiad Macpherson, wedi eu codi er mwyn sicrhau y caiff ei argymhellion eu gweithredu'n llawn ar draws y sector. Mae David Melding hefyd wedi codi sawl mater yn ymwneud â hyn.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Tra byddwch yn hybu cyfle cyfartal ymhlith y cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad, a ystyriwch fater cyfieithu deunyddiau i ieithoedd ar wahân i Gymraeg a Saesneg, sydd yn fater pwysig wrth sicrhau bod gan bawb yr holl wybodaeth sydd ei hangen arnynt?

**Edwina Hart:** Byddwn wrth fy modd yn gwneud hynny. Gwnaf ymholiadau interim ynghylch pa gyfleusterau sydd ar gael ar hyn o bryd ac adrodd yn ôl i'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal.

**Y Llywydd:** Trosglwyddwyd Cwestiwn 2 i'w ateb yn ysgrifenedig.

the need to make progress on the Assembly's cross-cutting issues and many of the spending plans will contribute to tackling social disadvantage, sustainable development and equal opportunities. The approach is to mainstream those issues across our programmes. For example, they inform the whole approach to Objective 1 and the single programming document. Much of the £100 million increase in the environment, planning and transport main expenditure group from this year's baseline to that of 2003-04 will contribute to sustainable development goals in relation to transport, waste and the environment. The budget includes many examples of programmes related to social inclusion, not least Communities First. The diverse nature of channelling funding means that it is not possible to give a definitive answer on the impact of all the budget changes. In terms of earmarking specific amounts, we are, of course, increasing spending on our promoting equality initiative to £305,000 a year. I have allocated £357,000 next year for the development of the sustainable development scheme. These are small, but important, examples of a wider approach. I will take the opportunity, Peter, to analyse the success of this approach in the next budget round.

**Peter Black:** I understand that the budget is complex and that in trying to mainstream these cross-cutting issues it is difficult to achieve the transparent approach we would like. However, given that the Assembly has taken on board these three key themes, is there any way that we can achieve greater transparency in the next budget round? Then we can tell the public that we are investing money into each of these cross-cutting themes through many programmes.

**Edwina Hart:** Yes, we can. In sustainable development, for example, we are investing money in the Carbon Trust, the waste strategy, Tir Gofal and the Countryside Council for Wales. I could draw out those figures to give a compact view of how much is invested in different areas. I will look at that.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** O ystyried y cyfle

oedd yr angen i wneud cynnydd ar faterion trawsbynciol y Cynulliad a bydd llawer o'r cynlluniau gwario yn cyfrannu at fynd i'r afael ag anfantais gymdeithasol, datblygu cynaliadwy a chyfle cyfartal. Yr ymagwedd yw prif ffrydio'r materion hynny ar draws ein rhaglenni. Er enghraifft, maent yn sail i'r ymagwedd gyfan tuag at Amcan 1 a'r ddogfen raglennu sengl. Bydd llawer o'r cynnydd o £100 miliwn ym mhrif grŵp gwariant yr amgylchedd, cynllunio a thrafnidiaeth o fan cychwyn eleni i fan cychwyn 2003-04 yn cyfrannu at nodau datblygu cynaliadwy mewn perthynas â thrafnidiaeth, gwastraff a'r amgylchedd. Mae'r gyllideb yn cynnwys sawl enghraifft o raglenni sydd yn ymwneud â chynhwysiant cymdeithasol, nid lleiaf Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf. Golyga natur amrywiol sianelu arian nad yw'n bosibl rhoi ateb diamod ar effaith holl newidiadau'r gyllideb. O ran clustnodi symiau penodol, yr ydym, wrth gwrs, yn cynyddu gwariant ar ein menter hybu cydraddoldeb i £305,000 y flwyddyn. Yr wyf wedi dyrannu £357,000 y flwyddyn nesaf ar gyfer datblygu'r cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy. Mae'r rhain yn enghreifftiau bach, ond pwysig, o ymagwedd ehangach. Achubaf ar y cyfle, Peter, i ddadansoddi llwyddiant yr ymagwedd hon yng nghylch nesaf y gyllideb.

**Peter Black:** Deallaf fod y gyllideb yn gymhleth a'i bod, wrth geisio prif ffrydio'r materion trawsbynciol hyn, yn anodd cyflawni'r ymagwedd dryloyw a hoffem. Fodd bynnag, o ystyried bod y Cynulliad wedi ymgymryd â'r tair thema allweddol hon, a oes unrhyw ffordd y gallwn gyflawni mwy o dryloywder yng nghylch nesaf y gyllideb? Yna gallwn ddweud wrth y cyhoedd ein bod yn buddsoddi arian ym mhob un o'r themâu trawsbynciol hyn drwy lawer o raglenni.

**Edwina Hart:** Gallwn. O ran datblygu cynaliadwy, er enghraifft, yr ydym yn buddsoddi arian yn yr Ymddiriedolaeth Carbon, y strategaeth gwastraff, Tir Gofal a Chyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru. Gallwn dynnu'r ffigurau hynny allan i roi darlun cryno o faint a fuddsoddir mewn meysydd gwahanol. Edrychaf ar hynny.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Considering the

sydd gan y Cynulliad i fod yn flaengar ymhlith gwledydd Ewrop o ran datblygu cynaliadwy, a wnaiff Edwina roi ymrwymiad y bydd arian ychwanegol ar gael os yw'n dod yn amlwg nad oes digon o arian i hyrwyddo'r cynllun arbennig hwnnw?

**Edwina Hart:** I cannot give a commitment on additional funding today, because I must consider funding issues carefully. In the case of sustainable development, it is important that we widen our horizons to see what other funding might be available from Europe for other schemes. If it is permissible in budgetary terms, we would, if necessary, look favourably upon any request for additional resources for sustainable development.

**Peter Rogers:** I am sure that you will agree that education and training is important for agriculture's long-term success. Could you, therefore, outline how the allocated budgets link education in Wales to the Assembly's rural development plan?

**Edwina Hart:** I could not, Peter, to be honest. I would be happy to consider the issues that relate to agricultural training, and discuss them with Jane Davidson and Carwyn Jones. My responsibility is for the main funding allocations to education and agriculture and not for the specifics of those portfolios, but I will certainly consider this issue.

opportunity that the Assembly has to be a leader in Europe in terms of sustainable development, will Edwina give a commitment that additional funding will be made available if it becomes evident that the funding to promote this particular scheme is insufficient?

**Edwina Hart:** Ni allaf roi ymrwymiad ynghylch arian ychwanegol heddiw, oherwydd rhaid imi ystyried y materion ariannol yn ofalus. Yn achos datblygu cynaliadwy, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn ehangu ein gorwelion i weld pa arian arall allai fod ar gael o Ewrop ar gyfer cynlluniau eraill. Os câi ei ganiatáu yn gyllidebol, byddem, os byddai angen, yn edrych yn ffafriol ar unrhyw gais am adnoddau ychwanegol ar gyfer datblygu cynaliadwy.

**Peter Rogers:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch fod addysg a hyfforddiant yn bwysig i lwyddiant amaethyddiaeth yn y tymor hir. A allwch chi, felly, amlinellu'r ffordd y mae'r cyllidebau a ddyrannwyd yn cysylltu addysg yng Nghymru â chynllun datblygu gwledig y Cynulliad?

**Edwina Hart:** Ni allwn, Peter, a bod yn onest. Byddwn yn barod i ystyried y materion sydd yn ymwneud â hyfforddiant amaethyddol, a'u trafod gyda Jane Davidson a Carwyn Jones. Fy nghyfrifoldeb i yw'r prif ddyraniadau arian i addysg ac amaethyddiaeth ac nid manylion penodol y portffolios hynny, ond ystyriaf y mater hwn yn sicr.

### **Cyfle Cyfartal i Bobl ag Anableddau Equality of Opportunity for People with Disabilities**

**Q4 Karen Sinclair:** How does the National Assembly for Wales promote equality of opportunity for people with disabilities in Wales? (OAQ9408)

**Edwina Hart:** We work closely with the Disability Rights Commission and other organisations to ensure that these policies make a real difference to the lives of disabled people. For example, we are working with interested parties to ensure that the new Assembly building is fully accessible for disabled people. By doing so, we aim to encourage others to examine their own

**C4 Karen Sinclair:** Sut mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn hyrwyddo cyfle cyfartal i bobl ag anableddau yng Nghymru? (OAQ9408)

**Edwina Hart:** Gweithiwn yn agos gyda'r Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd a sefydliadau eraill i sicrhau bod y polisiau hyn yn gwneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol i fywydau pobl anabl. Er enghraifft, yr ydym yn gweithio gyda'r rheini sydd â diddordeb i sicrhau bod adeilad newydd y Cynulliad yn gwbl hygyrch i bobl anabl. Drwy wneud hynny, mae'n nod gennym i annog eraill i archwilio eu

practices, and take action that will enable disabled people to play a full role in society.

harferion eu hunain, a chymryd camau a fydd yn galluogi pobl anabl i chwarae rôl lawn mewn cymdeithas.

9:15 a.m.

**Karen Sinclair:** How many people with learning disabilities are employed by the Assembly? If you cannot give an answer, can information be compiled in the future so that we can monitor the situation and set an example to others?

**Karen Sinclair:** Faint o bobl ag anableddau dysgu a gyflogir gan y Cynulliad? Os na allwch roi ateb, a ellir casglu gwybodaeth yn y dyfodol er mwyn inni allu monitro'r sefyllfa a bod yn esiampl i eraill?

**Edwina Hart:** I could not give you that figure today, and I am not sure that it is available. I will make the necessary inquiries and get back to Members on that, as the issue of learning disabilities is close to all our hearts. We want to see good employment practices exerted. I will come back to you on that point.

**Edwina Hart:** Ni allwn roi'r ffigur hwnnw ichi heddiw, ac nid wyf yn siŵr a yw ar gael. Gwnaf yr ymholiadau angenrheidiol a throsglwyddo unrhyw wybodaeth ar hynny i'r Aelodau, gan fod y mater o anableddau dysgu yn agos at galon pob un ohonom. Yr ydym am weld arferion cyflogi da yn cael eu gweithredu. Dof yn ôl atoch ar y pwynt hwnnw.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol bod cyfran y bobl anabl mewn gwaith bron ddwywaith yn uwch yn ne-ddwyrain Lloegr nag yng Nghymru. Pa gamau y mae'r Llywodraeth yn eu cymryd i sicrhau bod pobl gydag anabledd sydd yn dymuno gweithio yn llwyddo i gael gwaith yng Nghymru?

**Dafydd Wigley:** The Minister will be aware that the proportion of disabled people in employment is twice as high in south-east England as it is Wales. What steps is the Government taking to ensure that people with a disability who wish to work succeed in finding work in Wales?

**Edwina Hart:** We must lead by example in the National Assembly. It is vital that we ensure that we maximise the status of disabled people coming into the workplace in the National Assembly. I am not yet certain that we have done enough as an Assembly to readdress some of those flaws. Following on from that, Dafydd, we have a responsibility in all the areas that we control. The point was made earlier in Peter Black's first question about Assembly sponsored public bodies. That is an area where we can ensure that further work is carried out. We should also bring influence to bear on local government and the health service with regard to employment practices. Leading by example, and ensuring that all those bodies for which we have funding responsibility take these issues on board, will allow us to make a difference. We must also work more closely with the Disability Rights Commission to see how other employers perceive disabled people. We must get away from the myth of

**Edwina Hart:** Rhaid inni arwain drwy esiampl yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn sicrhau ein bod yn rhoi'r statws uchaf posibl i bobl anabl a ddaw i'r gweithle yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Nid wyf yn sicr eto ein bod wedi gwneud digon fel Cynulliad i fynd i'r afael â rhai o'r diffygion hynny o'r newydd. O ran y pwynt hwnnw, Dafydd, mae gennym gyfrifoldeb ym mhob un o'r meysydd a reolwn. Gwnaethpwyd y pwynt yn gynharach yng nghwestiwn cyntaf Peter Black am gyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad. Mae hwnnw'n faes lle y gallwn sicrhau y cyflawnir gwaith pellach. Dylem hefyd ddylanwadu ar lywodraeth leol a'r gwasanaeth iechyd o ran arferion cyflogaeth. Bydd arwain drwy esiampl, a sicrhau bod pob un o'r gyrff hynny y mae gennym gyfrifoldeb ariannu drostynt yn ystyried y materion hyn, yn caniatáu inni wneud gwahaniaeth. Rhaid inni hefyd weithio'n agosach gyda'r Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd er mwyn gweld

what a disability means in terms of employment. I hope that we can undertake further promotional work on this with the Disability Rights Commission.

**Kirsty Williams:** Do you agree that the Wales Council for the Blind does much work in Wales to promote equal opportunities for disabled people? Will you discuss with the Minister for Health and Social Services the fact that the Wales Council for the Blind's application for increased revenue grant funding has been turned down?

**Edwina Hart:** I recognise the excellent work achieved by the council across Wales, as do Assembly Members in general. I will certainly discuss this with the Minister for Health and Social Services.

y ffordd y mae cyflogwyr eraill yn gweld pobl anabl. Rhaid inni gael gwared â'r myth o'r hyn y mae anabledd yn ei olygu yn nhermau cyflogaeth. Gobeithiaf y gallwn ymgymryd â gwaith hyrwyddo pellach ar hyn gyda'r Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd.

**Kirsty Williams:** A gytunwch fod Cyngor Cymru i'r Deillion yn gwneud llawer o waith yng Nghymru i hybu cyfle cyfartal i bobl anabl? A drafodwch gyda'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol y ffaith bod cais Cyngor Cymru i'r Deillion am fwy o arian grant refeniw wedi ei wrthod?

**Edwina Hart:** Cydnabyddaf y gwaith gwych y mae'r cyngor yn ei gyflawni ledled Cymru, fel y gwna Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn gyffredinol. Trafodaf hyn yn sicr gyda'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol.

#### **Dyranriad yn y Gyllideb ar gyfer Cyflogi Cynghorwyr Arbennig i'r Cabinet Budget Allocation for the Employment of Cabinet Special Advisers**

**Q5 David Melding:** Will Edwina Hart make a statement on the budget allocation provided for the employment of special advisers to the Assembly Cabinet? (OAQ9465)

**Edwina Hart:** There is no specific budget allocation for the employment of special advisers. Their salary costs are met from the budget allocation to the Cabinet Secretariat.

**David Melding:** Is the Minister content with the fact that we are now set to have a total of eight special advisers in the Assembly or the Wales Office, whereas in the *ancien régime* of happy and glorious memory there was only one?

**Edwina Hart:** We had an open selection process for the appointment of Labour special advisers. The First Minister agreed that an announcement would be made on additional special advisers resulting from the partnership agreement. I will not comment further.

**Janet Davies:** Bearing in mind the absolutism of the *ancien régime* and the fact that you say that there is no special budget put aside for special advisers, what financial

**C5 David Melding:** A wnaiff Edwina Hart ddatganiad ar y dyranriad yn y gyllideb i gyflogi cynghorwyr arbennig i Gabinet y Cynulliad? (OAQ9465)

**Edwina Hart:** Nid oes unrhyw ddyranriad penodol yn y gyllideb i gyflogi cynghorwyr arbennig. Telir costau eu cyflog o'r dyranriad yn y gyllideb i Ysgrifenyddiaeth y Cabinet.

**David Melding:** A yw'r Gweinidog yn fodlon ar y ffaith ein bod bellach i gael cyfanswm o wyth cynghorydd arbennig yn y Cynulliad neu Swyddfa Cymru, lle mai dim ond un oedd gennym, yn nyddiau hapus a gogoneddus yr *ancien régime*?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr oedd gennym broses ddethol agored ar gyfer penodi cynghorwyr Llafur arbennig. Cytunodd Prif Weinidog Cymru y câi cyhoeddiad ei wneud ar gynghorwyr arbennig ychwanegol a fyddai'n deillio o'r cytundeb partneriaeth. Ni wnafr unrhyw sylwadau pellach.

**Janet Davies:** Gan gofio absoliwtiaeth yr *ancien régime* a'r ffaith y dywedwch na neilltuwyd cyllideb arbennig ar gyfer cynghorwyr arbennig, pa reolaethau ariannol



and proprietorial controls are in place to ensure that such special advisers only serve the interest of the taxpayers?

**Edwina Hart:** Special advisers adhere to civil service rules in terms of confidentiality of information. I can only comment on the special advisers who serve us as a Cabinet. There are currently five special advisers in post, and we will be moving from four to six advisers. On the status of special advisers, it is a special category of appointment. They are civil servants, and their term of office is linked to that of their appointing Minister. When their Minister leaves office, their appointment ends. I assure you that they adhere to the highest standards.

a pherchenogol sydd ar waith i sicrhau mai dim ond gofalu am fuddiannau trethdalwyr y gwna cynghorwyr arbennig o'r fath?

**Edwina Hart:** Glynna cynghorwyr arbennig at reolau'r gwasanaeth sifil yn nhermau cyfrinachedd gwybodaeth. Ni allaf ond gwneud sylw ar y cynghorwyr arbennig sydd yn ein gwasanaethu fel Cabinet. Ar hyn o bryd mae pum cynghorydd arbennig wrth eu gwaith, a byddwn yn symud o bedwar i chwe chynghorydd. O ran statws cynghorwyr arbennig, mae'n gategori penodi arbennig. Gweision sifil ydynt, ac mae tymor eu cyflogaeth yn gysylltiedig â thymor cyflogaeth y Gweinidog a'u penododd. Pan fydd eu Gweinidog yn gadael ei swydd, daw eu penodiad i ben. Fe'ch sicrhaf eu bod yn glynu at y safonau uchaf.

### **Gwelliannau i Gysylltiadau rhwng y Cymoedd Improvement to Inter-Valleys Links**

**Q6 Geraint Davies:** Does Edwina Hart plan to make any additional and separate finance available to enable improvement to inter-Valleys links? (OAQ9402)

**Edwina Hart:** The 2001-02 budget and indicative budgets for 2002-03 and 2003-04 agreed by the Assembly in December provide year on year increases for the transport grant budget. The Assembly will consider the final budget recommendations for 2002-03 and 2003-04 in accordance with Standing Order No. 19. The Minister for Environment has announced an indicative five-year forward programme of transport grant funding to enable local authorities and other providers to plan ahead. That includes an indicative start date for the Porth Lower Rhondda Fach relief road Phase 1 in 2004-05.

**Geraint Davies:** In view of the devastating announcement by Corus last week, the need for improved communications in the Valleys is even more important. Inter-valley links as well as north-south links are essential to sustain Valleys communities. We have seen enormous infrastructure investment in Cardiff

**C6 Geraint Davies:** A yw Edwina Hart yn bwriadu sicrhau bod arian ychwanegol a gwahanol ar gael er mwyn caniatáu gwelliannau i gysylltiadau rhwng y Cymoedd? (OAQ9402)

**Edwina Hart:** Mae cyllideb 2001-02 a'r cyllidebau dynodol ar gyfer 2002-03 a 2003-04 y cytunodd y Cynulliad arnynt ym mis Rhagfyr yn darparu cynnydd blynyddol ar gyfer y gyllideb grant trafniadaeth. Bydd y Cynulliad yn ystyried yr argymhellion cyllidebol terfynol ar gyfer 2002-03 a 2003-04 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 19. Mae'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd wedi cyhoeddi darpar raglen pum mlynedd ddynodol o ariannu grant trafniadaeth er mwyn ei gwneud yn bosibl i awdurdodau lleol a darparwyr eraill gynllunio at y dyfodol. Cynhwysa hynny ddyddiad cychwyn dynodol ar gyfer ffordd liniaru Rhondda Fach Isaf y Porth Cam 1 yn 2004-05.

**Geraint Davies:** Yng ngoleuni'r cyhoeddiad trychinebus gan Corus yr wythnos diwethaf, mae'r angen am gyfathrebu gwell yn y Cymoedd yn fwy pwysig hyd yn oed. Mae cysylltiadau rhwng y Cymoedd yn ogystal â chysylltiadau rhwng y de a'r gogledd yn hanfodol er mwyn cynnal cymunedau'r

and the surrounding area. Is it not time that the Valleys had some of that investment?

**Edwina Hart:** With reference to Corus, improved communications is an issue that we discuss in the context of plan B, which was referred to on Tuesday. The Minister for Environment has already raised with me the issue of those communities' essential needs and how they can access employment in the future if the worst comes to the worst.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** I reinforce Geraint's point. In the context of Corus's announcement, it is vital that we improve inter-valley links. The news about Corus is devastating throughout Wales, but particularly so in Ebbw Vale where so many jobs will be lost and communications are so poor. Can the Assembly re-emphasise the need to consider this issue urgently?

**Edwina Hart:** I welcome the fact that you are re-emphasising this. Sue Essex and I discussed this matter yesterday. We are concerned about the transport links from Ebbw Vale in terms of regeneration if the plant closes.

Cymoedd. Yr ydym wedi gweld buddsoddi enfawr yn seilwaith Caerdydd a'r cylch. Onid yw'n amser i'r Cymoedd gael rhywfaint o'r buddsoddiad hwnnw?

**Edwina Hart:** Gan gyfeirio at Corus, mae cyfathrebu gwell yn fater a drafodwn yng nghyd-destun cynllun B, y cyfeiriwyd ato ddydd Mawrth. Mae'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd eisoes wedi codi'r mater o anghenion hanfodol y cymunedau hynny gyda mi a'r modd y gallant ddod o hyd i gyflogaeth yn y dyfodol os daw hi i'r gwaethaf.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Ategaf bwynt Geraint. Yng nghyd-destun cyhoeddiad Corus, mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn gwella'r cysylltiadau rhwng y cymoedd. Mae'r newyddion am Corus yn drychinebus i Gymru gyfan, ond yn arbennig felly yng Nglynebwy lle y collir llawer o swyddi a lle y mae'r system gyfathrebu mor wael. A all y Cynulliad ailbwysleisio'r angen i ystyried y mater hwn ar fyrder?

**Edwina Hart:** Croesawaf y ffaith eich bod yn ailbwysleisio hyn. Trafododd Sue Essex a minnau'r mater hwn ddoe. Pryderwn am y cysylltiadau trafnidiaeth o Lynebwy yn nhermau adfywio'r ardal os bydd y ffatri'n cau.

### **Effaith yr Adolygiad Cynhwysfawr o Wariant ar Ogledd Cymru Impact of the Comprehensive Spending Review on North Wales**

**Q7 Alison Halford:** What has been the impact of the Government's comprehensive spending review on north Wales? (OAQ9409)

**Edwina Hart:** The 2000 comprehensive spending review has resulted in substantial increases in the Assembly's budget for the next three years, which will have a positive impact on the whole of Wales. The parts of north Wales that are attracting structural funds will also benefit from the increases in the Assembly's budget to cover this expenditure. The excellent local government settlement has benefited local authorities in north Wales in particular.

**Alison Halford:** Do you think that this

**C7 Alison Halford:** Beth fu effaith adolygiad cynhwysfawr y Llywodraeth o wariant ar ogledd Cymru? (OAQ9409)

**Edwina Hart:** Mae adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant 2000 wedi arwain at gryn gynnydd yng nghyllideb y Cynulliad ar gyfer y tair blynedd nesaf, a gaiff effaith gadarnhaol ar Gymru gyfan. Bydd y rhannau hynny o ogledd Cymru sydd yn denu arian strwythurol hefyd yn cael budd o'r cynnydd yng nghyllideb y Cynulliad i gwmpasu'r gwariant hwn. Mae'r setliad gwych ar gyfer llywodraeth leol wedi bod o fudd i awdurdodau lleol yng ngogledd Cymru yn arbennig.

**Alison Halford:** A ydych o'r farn y bydd y

welcome settlement, which sees a substantial increase in police funding in my area, and across Wales, will be enough to protect rural police stations, particularly in Flintshire, from closure?

**Edwina Hart:** There was an excellent discussion yesterday in the Local Government and Housing Committee about rural policing. When we were discussing the formula, Members raised the need for a visible police presence not just in urban areas, although there are problems in terms of police presence and accessibility in urban areas outside the city centres, but also in rural areas. Members made the point about access to the police service and that there are sometimes long delays. People feel confident if they have easy access to the police. As I said to the Committee, I meet with police authorities and chief constables regularly and I will explore this issue with them. This raises the wider issue, which was also raised yesterday, about how the police should be funded.

**Janet Ryder:** One county that will suffer as a result of the new standard spending assessment formula is Flintshire, which does not fall within the Objective 1 area. Flintshire will have to cope should jobs be shed at Corus in Shotton. What extra money can you make available to that county to help it at this time?

**Edwina Hart:** I do not accept that Flintshire is badly affected by this year's local government settlement. When we consider the amount of money that Flintshire receives, we will see that it has done well. The same applies in terms of the grant regime. I am mindful of Corus's decision. Highly skilled workers are being laid off in Shotton. It is important that we consider what training and job transition schemes may be available for such workers, bearing in mind the excellent news about British Aerospace, where perhaps those highly skilled workers could fit in.

**Peter Rogers:** As the Minister is in favour of partnership government, will she outline how north Wales has benefited from the link between the comprehensive spending review and the First Minister taking personal

setliad hwn, sydd i'w groesawu, ac sydd yn peri cryn gynnydd yn arian yr heddlu yn fy ardal i, ac ar draws Cymru, yn ddigon i ddiogelu gorsafoedd heddlu gwledig, yn Sir y Fflint yn arbennig, rhag cau?

**Edwina Hart:** Cafwyd trafodaeth wych ddoe yn y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai am blismona gwledig. Pan oeddem yn trafod y fformwla, cododd Aelodau'r angen i'r heddlu fod yn bresennol mewn ffordd weladwy nid mewn ardaloedd trefol yn unig, er bod problemau yn nhermau presenoldeb heddlu a chael gafael arnynt mewn ardaloedd trefol y tu allan i'r canolfannau dinesig, ond hefyd mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Gwnaeth Aelodau'r pwynt am gael gafael ar wasanaeth yr heddlu a bod oedi hir weithiau. Teimla pobl yn hyderus os bydd yn hawdd iddynt gael gafael ar yr heddlu. Fel y dywedais wrth y Pwyllgor, cyfarfyddaf ag awdurdodau heddlu a phrif gwnstabiliaid yn rheolaidd ac archwiliaf y mater hwn gyda hwy. Cyfyd hyn y mater ehangach, a godwyd ddoe hefyd, ynghylch y ffordd y dylid ariannu'r heddlu.

**Janet Ryder:** Un sir a ddiodefa o ganlyniad i'r fformwla asesu gwariant safonol newydd yw Sir y Fflint, nad yw'n syrthio o fewn ardal Amcan 1. Bydd yn rhaid i Sir y Fflint ymdopi os bydd swyddi'n cael eu colli yn Corus yn Shotton. Pa arian ychwanegol y gallwch ei ryddhau i'r sir honno i'w helpu ar yr adeg hon?

**Edwina Hart:** Ni dderbyniaf fod setliad llywodraeth leol eleni yn cael effaith wael ar Sir y Fflint. Pan ystyriwn faint o arian y mae Sir y Fflint yn ei dderbyn, gwelwn iddi wneud yn dda. Mae'r un peth yn wir yn nhermau'r gyfundrefn grant. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o benderfyniad Corus. Mae gweithwyr hynod fedrus yn cael eu diswyddo yn Shotton. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn ystyried pa hyfforddiant a chynlluniau newid swyddi allai fod ar gael i weithwyr o'r fath, gan gofio'r newyddion gwych am British Aerospace, lle y gallai'r gweithwyr hynod fedrus hynny efallai gael lle.

**Peter Rogers:** Gan fod y Gweinidog o blaid llywodraeth bartneriaeth, a amlinella'r ffordd y bu i ogledd Cymru elwa ar y cyswllt rhwng yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant a'r ffaith y cymer y Prif Weinidog gyfrifoldeb

responsibility for policy in that region?

personol dros bolisiau yn yr ardal honno?

**Edwina Hart:** I think north Wales has benefited enormously from the fact that the First Minister has taken the lead on policy in north Wales. Thank you, Peter, for the complimentary tone of that question.

**Edwina Hart:** Credaf i ogledd Cymru elwa'n rhyfeddol o'r ffaith i'r Prif Weinidog gymryd yr awenau o ran polisiau yng ngogledd Cymru. Diolch, Peter, am naws garedig y cwestiwn hwnnw.

9:25 a.m.

**Cwestiynau i Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog Cymru a Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd**  
**Questions to the Deputy First Minister and Minister for Economic Development**

**Yr Argyfwng yn y Diwydiant Gweithgynhyrchu**  
**The Crisis in the Manufacturing Industry**

**C1 Dafydd Wigley:** Pa fesurau penodol y mae Dirprwy Brif Weinidog Cymru a Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd yn eu cymryd i fynd i'r afael â'r argyfwng o fewn y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru? (OAQ9413)

**Q1 Dafydd Wigley:** What specific measures is the Deputy First Minister and the Minister for Economic Development taking to address the crisis within the manufacturing industry in Wales? (OAQ9413)

**The Deputy First Minister and Minister for Economic Development (Michael German):** We have taken several actions to help those manufacturing sectors in difficulties. For example, Accelerate Wales has been established to help the auto-component industry. In consumer electronics, the Assembly is engaging with the industry through the Welsh electronic taskforce. The Welsh Development Agency and Assembly officials are closely involved in providing assistance in many individual cases. On Corus, I refer you to the statement that I made on Tuesday.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd (Michael German):** Yr ydym wedi cymryd sawl cam i helpu'r sectorau gweithgynhyrchu hynny sydd mewn trafferthion. Er enghraifft, sefydlwyd Sbardun Cymru i helpu'r diwydiant cydrannau ceir. Mewn electroneg cwsmeriaid, mae'r Cynulliad yn creu cyswllt gyda'r diwydiant drwy dasglu electronig Cymru. Mae Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a swyddogion y Cynulliad yn ymwneud yn agos â rhoi cymorth mewn sawl achos unigol. O ran Corus, fe'ch cyfeiriaf at y datganiad a wneuthum ddydd Mawrth.

I hope that we can keep this matter in perspective. Some manufacturing sectors are having difficulties. However, the industry is in fair shape overall. In the four quarters up until the end of the third quarter of 2000, manufacturing output in Wales rose by 3.5 per cent compared to the previous four quarters. For the UK as a whole, the increase in output was 1.5 per cent. Therefore, Wales was ahead of the game in the most recent figures.

Gobeithiaf y gallwn gadw'r mater hwn mewn persbectif. Mae rhai sectorau gweithgynhyrchu yn cael trafferthion. Fodd bynnag, ar y cyfan mae'r diwydiant mewn sefyllfa weddol. Yn ystod y pedwar chwarter hyd at ddiwedd trydydd chwarter 2000, cododd yr allbwn gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru 3.5 y cant o'i gymharu â'r pedwar chwarter blaenorol. I'r DU gyfan, 1.5 y cant oedd cynnydd yr allbwn. Felly, yr oedd Cymru ar y blaen yn y ffigurau diweddaraf.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Y mae'r Gweinidog yn gwybod fod Cymru wedi colli 38,000 o swyddi gweithgynhyrchu ers 1990. Mae'r

**Dafydd Wigley:** The Minister knows the Wales has lost 38,000 manufacturing jobs since 1990. The news about Corus adds

newyddion am Corus yn ychwanegu'n sylweddol at hynny. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, bydd yn ymwybodol fod Gweinidogion yng Nghaerdydd a Llundain wedi dod o dan bwysau i ddatgan y bydd arian ychwanegol ar gael i fynd i'r afael â'r argyfwng sydd yn deillio o'r newyddion hynny. A all sicrhau bod cais wedi'i wneud i'r Llywodraeth yn San Steffan ar gyfer arian ychwanegol i Gymru? Os nad yw'r arian hwnnw'n dod, a yw'n derbyn y bydd hi ar ben ar y pleidiau sydd yn ein llywodraethu ar hyn o bryd?

**Michael German:** I refer you to the Minister for Finance's answer to your previous question on this. These matters are still being considered. An announcement will be made as soon as a conclusion has been reached.

**Alun Cairns:** Do you accept that the climate change tax will be a millstone around the neck of the manufacturing industry in Wales and that it will affect Wales more than the rest of the UK? Will you make representations to the UK Government and ask it to withdraw it?

**Michael German:** You seem to have missed out on the Kyoto Protocol, which involved representatives from all of the western world agreeing that action had to be taken on carbon dioxide emissions. I accept that, because Wales has a larger number of manufacturing industries that use carbon fuels, it is likely that the implications for Welsh industry will be greater. I assure you that that representation has and will be made—[*Interruption.*]

If Alun Cairns is proposing that this Assembly should now be responsible for macro-economic policy and taxation, I would be happy to take the view that the Conservative Party is now in favour of independence for Wales. However, if that is not the case and I have misinterpreted his remarks, I assure him that his view, which was that the climate change levy will have a disproportionate effect on Wales, has been made to the national Government in London.

substantially to that. In that context, he will be aware that Ministers in Cardiff and London have come under pressure to state that additional funding will be made available to tackle the crisis resulting from that news. Can he assure us that a request has been made to the Westminster Government for additional funding for Wales? If that funding is not forthcoming, does he accept that the parties that currently govern us will be finished?

**Michael German:** Fe'ch cyfeirïaf at ateb y Gweinidog dros Gyllid i'ch cwestiwn blaenorol ar hyn. Mae'r materion hyn yn cael eu hystyried o hyd. Gwneir cyhoeddiad cyn gynted ag y byddwn wedi dod i gasgliad.

**Alun Cairns:** A dderbyniwch y bydd y dreth newid hinsawdd yn faen melin am wddf y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru ac yr effeithia ar Gymru yn fwy nag ar weddill y DU? A wnewch sylwadau i Lywodraeth y DU a gofyn iddi ei dileu?

**Michael German:** Ymddengys ichi fethu Protocol Kyoto, lle y cytunodd cynrychiolwyr o'r byd gorllewinol cyfan fod yn rhaid gweithredu ynghylch gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid. Derbyniaf ei bod yn debygol, oherwydd bod gan Gymru nifer fwy o ddiwydiannau gweithgynhyrchu sydd yn defnyddio tanwydd carbon, y bydd y goblygiadau ar gyfer diwydiant Cymru yn fwy. Fe'ch sicrhaf fod y sylw hwnnw wedi ei fynegi ac y byddwn yn parhau i wneud hynny—[*Torri ar draws.*]

Os yw Alun Cairns yn cynnig y dylai'r Cynulliad hwn bellach fod yn gyfrifol am bolisiau a threthiant macro-economaidd, byddwn yn falch o gymryd y safbwynt bod y Blaid Geidwadol bellach o blaid annibyniaeth i Gymru. Fodd bynnag, os nad yw hynny'n wir ac imi gamddechongli ei sylwadau, fe'i sicrhaf i'w safbwynt, sef y caiff y dreth newid hinsawdd effaith anghymesur ar Gymru, gael ei gyfleu i'r Llywodraeth genedlaethol yn Llundain.

**Strategaeth Datblygu Economaidd ar gyfer Glynebwy**  
**Economic Development Strategy for Ebbw Vale**

**Q2 William Graham:** Will Michael German make a statement concerning the economic development strategy for the Ebbw Vale area? (OAQ9412)

**C2 William Graham:** A wnaiff Michael German ddatganiad ynglŷn â'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd ar gyfer ardal Glynebwy? (OAQ9412)

**Michael German:** In respect of Corus, I refer you to the statement that I made last Tuesday. I am launching a consultation paper on the national economic development strategy today. That paper outlines many policy priorities for the whole of Wales. However, while the paper's policy priorities are important to all of Wales, I recognise that the level of priority that they are accorded may vary from place to place according to the structure and needs of the local economy. I therefore see a strong need for major cities, towns and rural areas to develop their own vision for their long-term future in the context of the national strategy.

**Michael German:** O ran Corus, fe'ch cyfeiriai at y datganiad a wneuthum ddydd Mawrth diwethaf. Lansiaf bapur ymgynghorol ar y strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol heddiw. Amlinella'r papur hwnnw sawl blaenoriaeth o ran polisi ar gyfer Cymru gyfan. Fodd bynnag, er bod blaenoriaethau polisi'r papur yn bwysig i Gymru gyfan, cydnabyddaf fod lefel y flaenoriaeth a roddir iddynt yn amrywio o bosibl o le i le yn ôl strwythur ac anghenion yr economi leol. Gwelaf felly angen cryf i ddinasoedd mawr, trefi ac ardaloedd gwledig ddatblygu eu gweledigaeth eu hunain ar gyfer eu dyfodol tymor hir yng nghyd-destun y strategaeth genedlaethol.

In Plenary on Tuesday, I said that the diversification of Ebbw Vale's economic base could be a strategic aim. That view is shared by Blaenau Gwent County Borough Council.

Yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ddydd Mawrth, dywedais y gallai arallgyfeirio sylfaen economaidd Glynebwy fod yn nod strategol. Mae Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Blaenau Gwent yn rhannu'r safbwynt hwnnw.

**William Graham:** Can the Minister outline the range and number of Objective 1 initiatives currently being progressed or under consideration in the Ebbw Vale area?

**William Graham:** A all y Gweinidog amlinellu ystod a nifer y mentrau sydd yn ymwneud ag Amcan 1 a gaiff eu datblygu neu a gaiff eu hystyried yn ardal Glynebwy?

**Michael German:** I cannot give you the exact number of projects from memory. However, I am happy to write to you with those details.

**Michael German:** Ni allaf roi union nifer y prosiectau ichi o'm cof. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn barod i ysgrifennu atoch gyda'r manylion hynny.

**Peter Law:** Bearing in mind that Ebbw Vale currently has the highest unemployment rate in Wales and that we have had a taskforce to deal with that since 1975, when the first steel redundancies occurred—and, sadly, there is still a jobs deficit—will the Minister assure me that he will take positive action to steer large industrial projects to that area to give people there an opportunity to find new employment?

**Peter Law:** Gan gofio mai Glynebwy sydd â'r gyfradd diweithdra uchaf yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd ac y bu gennym dasglu i ddelio â hynny ers 1975, pan ddigwyddodd y diswyddiadau dur cyntaf—ac, yn anffodus, bod diffyg swyddi o hyd,—a rydd y Gweinidog sicrwydd imi y cymer gamau cadarnhaol i lywio prosiectau diwydiannol mawr i'r ardal honno er mwyn rhoi cyfle i bobl ddod o hyd i swyddi newydd yno?

**Michael German:** That economic blackspot

**Michael German:** Bydd penderfyniad Corus

will be devastated further by Corus's decision. The unemployment rate in that area is already double the national average, and will be even higher if Corus proceeds with its proposals. That presents us with the task of ensuring that the poorest and most disadvantaged communities receive help urgently and rapidly. I assure you that we will do that.

**Phil Williams:** Given the level of deprivation and the gaps in infrastructure in Blaenau Gwent and the net loss of 600 jobs last year, before Corus's recent announcement, do you agree that, using the cost-per-job estimates in the Objective 1 single programming document, a total approaching £100 million of additional money will be required to regenerate the economy of Blaenau Gwent if the closures proceed?

**Michael German:** That economic analysis needs to be verified. As I announced on Tuesday, we have commissioned work on an economic impact assessment of the effect of the steel closures, if Corus decides to proceed with them. It will, therefore, be possible to verify the figures. Cost-per-job figures vary greatly between different areas, jobs and economic development schemes. Therefore, it would be premature for me to give a conclusion on that until we have completed that urgent study.

yn drychineb bellach i'r man hwnnw sydd yn dioddef llu o broblemau economaidd. Mae'r gyfradd diweithdra yn yr ardal honno ddwywaith y cyfartaledd cenedlaethol eisoes, a bydd hyd yn oed yn uwch os bydd Corus yn mynd rhagddo gyda'i fwriadau. Mae hynny'n rhoi'r dasg inni o sicrhau bod y cymunedau tlotaf sydd o dan yr anfantais fwyaf yn cael help ar frys ac yn gyflym. Rhoddaf sicrwydd ichi y gwnawn hynny.

**Phil Williams:** O ystyried lefel yr amddifadedd a'r bylchau yn isadeiledd Blaenau Gwent a'r golled net o 600 o swyddi y llynedd, cyn y cyhoeddiad diweddar gan Corus, a gytunwch y bydd angen, gan ddefnyddio'r amcangyfrifon cost fesul swydd yn nogfen raglennu sengl Amcan 1, cyfanswm yn agos i £100 miliwn o arian ychwanegol er mwyn adfywio economi Blaenau Gwent os bydd y ffatrioedd yn cau?

**Michael German:** Mae angen gwirio'r dadansoddiad economaidd hwnnw. Fel y cyhoeddais ddydd Mawrth, yr ydym wedi comisiynu gwaith ar asesiad o ddylanwad economaidd effaith y toriadau ym maes dur, os penderfyna Corus fynd rhagddo gyda hwy. Bydd, felly, yn bosibl gwirio'r ffigurau. Mae ffigurau cost fesul swydd yn amrywio'n fawr rhwng ardaloedd, swyddi a chynlluniau datblygu economaidd gwahanol. Felly, byddai'n gynamserol imi ddod i gasgliad ar hynny hyd nes inni gwblhau'r astudiaeth frys honno.

### **Effaith yr Ewro ar Ddatblygu Economaidd Effect of the Euro on Economic Development**

**Q3 David Davies:** What studies has Michael German conducted into the effect of the euro on economic development in Wales? (OAQ9382)

**Michael German:** My officials monitor continuously the impact of changing economic conditions on the prospects for economic development in Wales. That includes the effect of the euro.

**David Davies:** Is it not the case that one of the economic problems that we face is finding an interest rate that is suitable for the service industries of south-east England as well as for the manufacturing and agriculture

**C3 David Davies:** Pa astudiaethau a gynhaliwyd gan Michael German i effaith yr ewro ar ddatblygu economaidd yng Nghymru? (OAQ9382)

**Michael German:** Mae fy swyddogion yn monitro'n barhaus effaith yr amgylchiadau economaidd cyfnewidiol ar y rhagolygon ar gyfer datblygiad economaidd yng Nghymru. Mae hynny'n cynnwys effaith yr ewro.

**David Davies:** Onid yw'n wir mai un o'r problemau economaidd a wynebwn yw canfod cyfradd llog sydd yn addas ar gyfer diwydiannau gwasanaeth de-ddwyrain Lloegr yn ogystal ag ar gyfer sectorau

sectors of Wales? Given that fact, alluded to by you, the First Minister and Plaid Cymru on many occasions in the Chamber, do you agree that it would be nigh on impossible to find a suitable interest rate for the whole of the euro zone if the UK were to join? Is it not the case that the tensions building in the euro zone, as a result of the economies of Eire, Germany and France being out of synch, would spell disaster for jobs in Wales, should we ever be foolish enough to join this scheme?

**Michael German:** I note your psychological difficulty in accepting that the pound and the euro are matters of great debate among economists across the United Kingdom. However, if we were to have the economic development enjoyed by our nearest neighbour, Ireland, and the success that the euro has brought to that country, we would bring great certainty to those who have lost their jobs, for example, in the steel industry.

Your party's policy on the euro—Mr Hague's vague 'sometime, maybe, maybe never' policy—which is dictated by narrow English nationalism, is not in the interests of Britain or Wales, let alone of the steel workers who are about to lose their jobs. We will have a referendum on this issue. I am grateful that the Prime Minister has announced that we will have a referendum early on and I welcome the opportunity to meet you on the streets during the campaign, along with the vast majority of Assembly Members, who will oppose your view.

**John Griffiths:** Given the increasing evidence of economic damage to the UK from not having joined the euro, as demonstrated by recent events in the steel industry, do you agree—and I think that you will, given what you have just said—that many of those on the right of the political spectrum, who oppose entry when the conditions are right, are blinded by xenophobia and a little Englander mentality?

**Michael German:** My sentiments exactly.

gweithgynhyrchu ac amaethyddol Cymru? O ystyried y ffaith honno, yr ydych chi, y Prif Weinidog a Phlaid Cymru wedi ei chrybwyll ar sawl achlysur yn y Siambr, a gytunwch y byddai bron yn amhosibl dod o hyd i gyfradd llog addas ar gyfer parth cyfan yr ewro pe byddai'r DU yn ymuno? Onid yw'n wir y byddai'r tensiynau sydd yn cronni ym mharth yr ewro, o ganlyniad i'r ffaith fod economïau Iwerddon, yr Almaen a Ffrainc yn anghysain, yn drychinebus ar gyfer swyddi yng Nghymru, pe byddem byth yn ddigon ffôl i ymuno â'r cynllun hwn?

**Michael German:** Nodaf yr anhawster seicolegol sydd gennych wrth dderbyn bod y bunt a'r ewro yn faterion a drafodir yn helaeth ymhlith economegwyr ar draws y Deyrnas Unedig. Fodd bynnag, pe byddem am brofi'r datblygiad economaidd y mae ein cymydog agosaf, sef Iwerddon, yn ei fwynhau, a'r llwyddiant a ddygodd yr ewro i'r wlad honno, deuem â sicrwydd mawr i'r rheini a gollodd eu swyddi, er enghraifft, yn y diwydiant dur.

Nid yw polisi eich plaid ar yr ewro—sef polisi 'rywbryd, efallai, efallai byth' amwys Mr Hague—a ddeddfir gan genedlaetholdeb Seisnig cul, er budd Prydain na Chymru, heb sôn am y gweithwyr dur sydd ar fin colli eu swyddi. Cawn refferendwm ar y mater hwn. Yr wyf yn falch bod y Prif Weinidog wedi cyhoeddi ein bod am gael refferendwm yn gynnar a chroesawaf y cyfle i gyfarfod â chi ar y strydoedd yn ystod yr ymgyrch, ynghyd â mwyafrif helaeth Aelodau'r Cynulliad, a wrthwyneba eich safbwynt.

**John Griffiths:** O ystyried y dystiolaeth gynyddol o niwed economaidd i'r DU o beidio ag ymuno â'r ewro, fel y dengys digwyddiadau diweddar yn y diwydiant dur, a gytunwch—a chredaf y gwnewch, o ystyried yr hyn yr ydych newydd ei ddweud—y dellir llawer o'r rheini ar ochr dde'r sbectwm gwleidyddol, sydd yn gwrthwynebu ymuno pan fo'r amgylchiadau yn iawn, gan estrongasedd a meddylfryd Lloegr fach?

**Michael German:** Dyna'n union fy nheimpladau i.



**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** A sylwasoch fod cadeirydd cwmni Ford, wrth gyhoeddi'r buddsoddiad sylweddol diweddar ym Mheny-bont ar Ogwr, yr ydym oll yn ei groesawu, wedi dweud ei fod yn gwneud hynny ar y dybiaeth y byddem, ar ryw bwynt yn gymharol fuan, yn ymuno â'r ewro? A ydych felly yn croesawu datganiad Tony Blair yn Llundain ddoe y byddai Llywodraeth Lafur, os caiff ei hailethol, yn asesu a yw'r amgylchiadau yn iawn i ymuno â'r ewro o fewn dwy flynedd i'r etholiad? A gytunwch mai'r hyn sydd ei angen yn awr yw trafodaeth adeiladol ar yr hyn y byddai'r ewro yn ei olygu i economi Cymru i sicrhau bod pobl yn cael yr holl wybodaeth angenrheidiol?

**Michael German:** That is exactly right. We need a proper and sensible debate, not one based on the psychological barriers erected and whipped up by those who see the British pound rolling in the gutter. We should engage in what matters to this country, our exporters, those in work and those who are looking for the prospect of higher value work. I agree entirely with Ieuan. That is exactly the approach we must adopt and in which we should be engaged. I welcome the opportunity for the vast majority of Assembly Members to campaign for that against those who see our future as somewhere in the distant outer Hebrides.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Did you notice that the chair of the Ford company, in announcing the recent significant investment in Bridgend, which we all welcome, said that he did so on the assumption that we would, at some point in the not too distant future, join the euro? Do you therefore welcome Tony Blair's announcement in London yesterday that a Labour Government, if re-elected, would assess whether conditions are right to join the euro within two years of the election? Do you agree that what is now required is a constructive discussion on what the euro would mean for the economy of Wales to ensure that people receive all the necessary information?

**Michael German:** Mae hynny'n hollol gywir. Mae arnom angen dadl briodol a synhwyrol, nid dadl ar sail y rhwystrau seicolegol a godwyd yn sydyn gan y rheini sydd yn gweld y bunt Brydeinig yn rholio yn y gwter. Dylem drafod yr hyn sydd yn bwysig i'r wlad hon, ein hallforwyr, y rheini sydd yn gweithio a'r rheini sydd yn edrych am bosibilrwydd o waith o werth uwch. Cytunaf yn llwyr â Ieuan. Dyna'r union ymagwedd y mae'n rhaid inni ei mabwysiadu ac y dylem ymrwymo iddi. Croesawaf y cyfle i'r mwyafrif helaeth o Aelodau'r Cynulliad ymgyrchu dros hynny yn erbyn y rheini sydd yn gweld ein dyfodol rywle yn nynysoedd pellennig yr Hebrides allanol.

#### **Ffatri Dewhirst yn Abergwaun Dewhirst Factory in Fishguard**

**C4 Cynog Dafis:** A wnaiff Michael German ddatganiad ar ddyfodol ffatri Dewhirst yn Abergwaun? (OAQ9426)

**Michael German:** The future of the Fishguard site depends on the success of Dewhirst managers' continuing discussions. The company has said that, although the future of its factories in Cardigan and Swansea is secure, the future of the factory in Goodwick near Fishguard is under review. On 24 January, the First Minister, together with the local Assembly Members and the local Member of Parliament, met with the company to open discussions to save the Goodwick operation. The decision, on cost grounds, of Dewhirst's leading customer,

**Q4 Cynog Dafis:** Will Michael German make a statement on the future of the Dewhirst factory in Fishguard? (OAQ9426)

**Michael German:** Dibynna dyfodol safle Abergwaun ar lwyddiant trafodaethau parhaus rheolwyr Dewhirst. Mae'r cwmni wedi dweud bod dyfodol y ffatri yn Wdig ger Abergwaun yn cael ei adolygu, er bod dyfodol ei ffatrioedd yn Aberteifi ac Abertawe yn ddiogel. Ar 24 Ionawr, cyfarfu Prif Weinidog Cymru, ynghyd ag Aelodau'r Cynulliad o'r ardal honno a'r Aelod Seneddol lleol, â'r cwmni er mwyn dechrau trafodaethau i arbed ffatri Wdig. Mae penderfyniad prif gwsmer Dewhirst, sef Marks & Spencer ccc, ar sail cost, i newid eu

Marks & Spencer plc, to switch from UK suppliers to suppliers in the Far East has led to a significant downturn in business, not only for Dewhirst but also for its competitors, which are in a similar situation. Marks & Spencer buys about 85 per cent of Dewhirst's production.

**Cynog Dafis:** Gobeithiaf fod Dewhirst o ddifrif yn ymroi i sicrhau dyfodol i'r ffatri hon. Mae'r dyfodol yn fregus a byddai cau'r ffatri yn ergyd ddifrifol arall i ardal Abergwaun a gogledd Penfro sydd wedi dioddef cyfres o ergydion difrifol dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Mae'r economi yno mewn cyflwr gwael.

A gytuna Mike German fod cryn botensial i'r ardal? Mae porthladd effeithlon yno, cysylltiadau gydag Iwerddon, ffordd osgoi newydd ac y mae'n ardal eithriadol o ddiadodol. A wnaiff Mike German warantu na fydd arian Amcan 1 yn cael ei ddargyfeirio o Sir Benfro, sydd â chymaint o'i angen? Mae mawr angen cymorth yno.

A wnaiff warantu y bydd unrhyw arian a aiff i ardaloedd megis Blaenau Gwent yn arian ychwanegol o'r Trysorlys, fel bod yr ardaloedd hynny yn cael cymorth ond ddim ar draul ardaloedd sydd hefyd â mawr angen?

**Michael German:** I cannot guarantee money from the Chancellor of the Exchequer, since I am not the Chancellor of the Exchequer. However, we must not allow the strategy that underpins our Objective 1 programme to be undone by any necessary response that we have to make. The issue of how we support the community in Pembrokeshire must be at the top of our agenda. Refocusing—of refocusing is to take place—of the structural funding programmes is the responsibility of the Objective 1 Programme Monitoring Committees, of which four are relevant to this matter.

**Delyth Evans:** Mike will be aware of the efforts of my colleague, Richard Edwards, and Jackie Lawrence MP on behalf of Dewhirst in Fishguard and its staff. Dewhirst is one of only two private sector employers in Fishguard and I am sure that Mike German will agree that it is vital that we maintain

cyflenwyr o'r DU i rai yn y Dwyrain Pell wedi arwain at gryn ddirywiad yn y busnes, nid yn unig i Dewhirst ond hefyd i'w gystadleuwyr, sydd mewn sefyllfa debyg. Pryna Marks & Spencer tua 85 y cant o gynnyrch Dewhirst.

**Cynog Dafis:** I hope that Dewhirst is seriously committed to ensuring this factory's future. The future is uncertain and the closure of the factory would be another severe blow to the Fishguard and north Pembrokeshire area, which has suffered a series of severe blows over recent years. The economy there is in a poor state.

Does Mike German agree that the area has considerable potential? There is an efficient port, links with Ireland, a new by-pass and it is an extremely attractive area. Will Mike German guarantee that Objective 1 funding will not be diverted from Pembrokeshire, which needs it so much? Assistance is greatly needed there.

Will he guarantee that any money that goes into areas such as Blaenau Gwent is additional funding from the Treasury, so that those areas receive assistance but not at the expense of other areas where the need is also great?

**Michael German:** Ni allaf warantu arian gan Ganghellor y Trysorlys, gan nad myfi yw Canghellor y Trysorlys. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni beidio â chaniatáu i'r strategaeth sydd yn sail i'n rhaglen Amcan 1 gael ei dadwneud gan unrhyw ymateb angenrheidiol ar ein rhan. Rhaid i'r ffordd y cynorthwywn y gymuned yn Sir Benfro fod ar frig ein hagenda. Cyfrifoldeb Pwyllgorau Monitro Rhaglenni Amcan 1—y mae pedwar ohonynt yn berthnasol i'r mater hwn—yw ailffocysu'r rhaglenni arian strwythurol, os oes ailffocysu i ddigwydd.

**Delyth Evans:** Bydd Mike yn ymwybodol o ymdrechion fy nghyd-Aelod, Richard Edwards, a Jackie Lawrence AS ar ran Dewhirst yn Abergwaun a'i staff. Mae Dewhirst yn un o ddim ond dau gyflogwr yn y sector preifat yn Abergwaun ac yr wyf yn siŵr y cytuna Mike German ei bod yn

ongoing discussions with the company. Is there anything that we in the Assembly can do to help Dewhirst to maintain its current orders and to find new markets?

**Michael German:** Let me consider the broader context of the company as a whole. Assembly officials, as well as Assembly sponsored public bodies and other departments, have been working with the company regarding, first of all, the Lampeter factory since the announcement of its closure on 12 January. Staff made redundant at Lampeter are being offered relocation to either of the factories at Cardigan and Swansea.

Officials are providing all possible assistance to the workers affected at Lampeter. Thirty-two of the Lampeter staff made redundant have indicated that they may want to transfer to one or other of the two remaining sites in Wales. The company wants to co-operate fully with the various Government agencies to find new employment for staff not wishing to transfer to the company's Swansea or Cardigan operations. That work with Government agencies and Assembly officials continues and I will keep you informed of the situation, if you so wish.

**Nick Bourne:** The job situation in Fishguard is serious. The critical mass at Dewhirst in Fishguard is much smaller than at Cardigan and Swansea. The WDA is concerned about that. Have you had discussions with David Rowe-Beddoe and the WDA on the parlous job situation as regards Dewhirst? Furthermore—and I know you have already commented on the world scene—can I press you on it in relation to the import of cheap textiles from the third world? Are we making representations about the dumping of cheap clothing on the market, particularly given concerns about child labour in south-east and south Asia?

**Michael German:** I share your concern about child labour. It would be inappropriate for us to support unfair trading. Those who have been involved with Traidcraft know that

hanfodol ein bod yn cynnal trafodaethau parhaus gyda'r cwmni. A oes unrhyw beth y gallwn ni yn y Cynulliad ei wneud i helpu Dewhirst i gynnal ei archebion presennol a chanfod marchnadoedd newydd?

**Michael German:** Gadewch imi ystyried cyd-destun ehangach y cwmni cyfan. Bu swyddogion y Cynulliad, yn ogystal â chyrrff cyhoeddus a noddur gan y Cynulliad ac adrannau eraill, yn gweithio gyda'r cwmni ynghylch, yn gyntaf oll, ffatri Llanbedr Pont Steffan ers y cyhoeddiad ar 12 Ionawr y byddai'n cau. Rhoddir y cynnig i staff a ddiswyddir yn Llanbedr Pont Steffan gael eu hadleoli i'r naill neu'r llall o'r ffatrioedd yn Aberteifi ac Abertawe.

Mae swyddogion yn rhoi pob cymorth posibl i'r gweithwyr yr effeithir arnynt yn Llanbedr Pont Steffan. Mae 32 o staff Llanbedr Pont Steffan a ddiswyddwyd wedi nodi y byddant efallai am gael eu trosglwyddo i un o'r ddau safle sydd yn weddill yng Nghymru. Mae'r cwmni am gydweithredu'n llawn ag asiantaethau amrywiol y Llywodraeth er mwyn dod o hyd i gyflogaeth newydd i'r staff nad ydynt yn dymuno trosglwyddo i ffatrioedd y cwmni yn Abertawe neu Aberteifi. Mae'r gwaith hwnnw gydag asiantaethau'r Llywodraeth a swyddogion y Cynulliad yn parhau a rhoddaf y newyddion diweddaraf ichi yn rheolaidd, os dymunwch hynny.

**Nick Bourne:** Mae'r sefyllfa swyddi yn Abergwaun yn ddifrifol. Mae'r màs critigol yn Dewhirst yn Abergwaun yn llawer llai nag yn Aberteifi ac Abertawe. Mae'r WDA yn pryderu am hynny. A ydych wedi cael trafodaethau gyda David Rowe-Beddoe a'r WDA ar y sefyllfa swyddi enbyd mewn perthynas â Dewhirst? Yn ogystal—a gwn eich bod eisoes wedi gwneud sylw ar y sefyllfa fyd-eang—a allaf bwysu arnoch yn hyn o beth o ran mewnfurio tectiliau rhad o'r trydydd byd? A ydym yn gwneud sylwadau am daflu dillad rhad ar y farchnad, yn arbennig o ystyried y pryderon am lafur plant yn ne-ddwyrain a de Asia?

**Michael German:** Rhannaf eich pryder ynghylch llafur plant. Byddai'n amhriodol inni gefnogi masnach annheg. Gŵyr y rheini a fu'n ymwneud â Traidcraft bod pob un o

all Assembly Members share that view. I have spoken with David Rowe-Beddoe about the economic situation in the Pembrokeshire area and in respect of Dewhirst. All of the agencies are working together to provide a comprehensive package of support. That is important. It is vital to support the company at this time in whatever it can do to secure new markets and to extend its current product range to ensure a secure future for its remaining plants.

Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn rhannu'r farn honno. Yr wyf wedi siarad â David Rowe-Beddoe am y sefyllfa economaidd yn ardal Sir Benfro ac ynglŷn â Dewhirst. Mae'r asiantaethau i gyd yn cydweithio er mwyn creu pecyn cymorth cynhwysfawr. Mae hynny'n bwysig. Mae'n hanfodol cynorthwyo'r cwmni ar yr adeg hon ym mha beth bynnag y gall ei wneud i sicrhau marchnadoedd newydd ac i ymestyn ystod presennol ei gynnyrch er mwyn sicrhau dyfodol ei ffatrioedd sydd yn weddill.

### **Darparu Cymorthdaliadau Cyhoeddus i Gwmnïau Provision of Public Subsidies to Companies**

**Q5 Janet Davies:** Will Michael German make a statement on the current policy of the coalition Government of Wales regarding the provision of public subsidies to companies? (OAQ9422)

**C5 Janet Davies:** A wnaiff Michael German ddatganiad ar bolisi presennol Llywodraeth glymblaid Cymru ynglŷn â'r ddarpariaeth o gymorthdaliadau cyhoeddus i gwmnïau? (OAQ9422)

**Michael German:** Our policy is to intervene in the market only when there are sound reasons to do so and when intervention is likely to secure a sustainable improvement in market conditions. In all cases, the Assembly and the other public sector partners in Team Wales must work within the European Commission's rules on state aid.

**Michael German:** Ein polisi yw peidio ag ymyrryd yn y farchnad ond pan fo rhesymau cryf o'i blaid, a lle bod ymyrryd yn debygol o sicrhau gwelliant cynaliadwy yn sefyllfa'r farchnad. Mae'n rhaid i'r Cynulliad, a phartneriaid eraill Tîm Cymru yn y sector cyhoeddus, bob tro weithio yn unol â rheolau'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd ar gymorth gwladol.

**Janet Davies:** Given the substantial additional funding required to deal with the environmental and social aftermath should steel making be shut down in Ebbw Vale or elsewhere, will the Minister outline the exit strategy, if any, that he has agreed with the company, the UK Government and the relevant agencies?

**Janet Davies:** O gofio'r cyllid ychwanegol sylweddol y bydd ei angen i ymdrin â'r sgîl-effeithiau amgylcheddol a chymdeithasol os caiff gweithiau dur eu cau yng Nglynebwy neu rywle arall, a wnaiff y Gweinidog roi braslun o'r strategaeth ymadael, os oes un, y cytunwyd arni â'r cwmni, Llywodraeth y DU a'r asianaethau perthnasol?

**Michael German:** We are not prepared to negotiate with Corus until it has exhausted all avenues of discussion with the trade unions. A moratorium on that kind of action is currently in place. If we have to operate plan B, I assure you that a first priority will be to consider the impact of this, which not only involves the environmental mess that will be left behind by Corus's devastating decision, but the human tragedy that lies behind it.

**Michael German:** Nid ydym yn fodlon negodi â Corus nes ei fod wedi dilyn pob trywydd wrth drafod â'r undebau llafur. Mae gweithredu o'r fath wedi'i ohirio ar hyn o bryd. Os bydd rhaid inni roi cynllun B ar waith, fe'ch sicrhaf mai un o'r blaenoriaethau cyntaf fydd ystyried effaith hyn, sydd yn cynnwys y trasiedi dynol, yn ogystal â'r llanastr amgylcheddol a ddaw yn sgîl penderfyniad dinistriol Corus.

**David Davies:** While all Members want to do everything possible to help those who are left without jobs in the aftermath of Corus's

**David Davies:** Er bod pob Aelod am wneud popeth yn ei allu i helpu'r rhai a fydd heb swyddi yn dilyn cyhoeddiad Corus, onid yw'r

announcement, does the Minister not agree that the lesson of the 1970s was that taxing businesses and individuals and then handing over money to cherry-picked organisations rarely works?

**Michael German:** David is speaking to me as if I were the Chancellor of the Exchequer again. It is interesting that the rules on what you can do to help the steel industry were agreed and put in place by the Conservative Government, in partnership with the other Governments of Europe. Corus believes that those policies should be strictly adhered to. We have strict rules on intervening in the marketplace in order to create a level playing field. That is right. However, interventions can be made, particularly in steel companies where there are problems that lie outside the rules. We will carefully consider how we apply those rules. However, the regulations on state aid are in place to provide a level playing field.

9:45 a.m.

Gweinidog yn cytuno y cafwyd gwers yn y 1970au, sef prin y bydd trethu busnesau ac uniogolion, a throsglwyddo'r arian i gyrff detholedig wedyn, yn llwyddo.

**Michael German:** Mae David yn siarad â mi eto fel pe bawn i'n Ganghellor y Trysorlys. Mae'n ddi-ddorol mai'r Llywodraeth Geidwadol, ar y cyd â Llywodraethau eraill Ewrop, a gytunodd ar y rheolau sydd yn pennu'r hyn a ellwch ei wneud i helpu'r diwydiant dur, ac a'u rhoddodd ar waith. Cred Corus yw y dylid dilyn y polisiau hynny'n gaeth. Mae gennym reolau llym ar ymyrryd yn y farchnad er mwyn creu amgylchiadau cystadlu teg. Mae hynny'n iawn. Fodd bynnag, gellir ymyrryd, yn enwedig gyda chwmnïau dur a chanddynt broblemau sydd yn deillio o'r tu hwnt i'r rheolau. Ystyriwn yn ofalus sut yr ydym yn cymhwyso'r rheolau hynny. Fodd bynnag, pwrpas y rheoliadau ar gymorth gwladol yno i sichrau amgylchiadau cystadlu teg.

### **Datganiad ar Dairy Crest Statement on Dairy Crest**

**The Minister for Rural Affairs (Carwyn Jones):** Members will recall that I indicated last week that I would make a further statement today on my meeting with Dairy Crest Limited in the wake of its announcement on 31 January of plans to close its processing facilities at Carmarthen and Marshfield, with the loss of 545 jobs.

I made it clear at the meeting that the Assembly is extremely concerned about the proposals because of the severe impact that the planned closures would have on local areas. The company recognises its responsibility to assist its employees and welcomed the proposed involvement of the Welsh Development Agency in addressing this problem. Dairy Crest emphasised that it has a positive agenda for its Welsh dairy operations, that it is a major buyer of Welsh milk and wishes to develop this business further. In addition, it is considering plans to expand its cheese-processing operation at

**Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Carwyn Jones):** Bydd yr Aelodau yn cofio imi nodi yr wythnos diwethaf y byddwn yn gwneud datganiad pellach heddiw ar fy nghyfarfod gyda Dairy Crest Cyfyngedig yn sgîl ei gyhoeddiad ar 31 Ionawr am gynlluniau i gau ei weithfeydd prosesu yng Nghaerfyrddin a Maerun, a fyddai'n golygu colli 545 o swyddi.

Eglurais yn y cyfarfod fod y Cynulliad yn bryderus iawn am y cynigion oherwydd yr effaith ddifrifol y câi'r bwriad i gau'r gweithfeydd hyn ar ardaloedd lleol. Mae'r cwmni yn cydnabod ei gyfrifoldeb i gynorthwyo ei gyflogaion a chroesawodd y bwriad i gynnwys Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru wrth ymdrin â'r broblem hon. Pwysleisiodd Dairy Crest fod ganddo agenda gadarnhaol ar gyfer ei weithfeydd cynnyrch llaeth yng Nghymru, ei fod yn un o brynwyr mawr llaeth Cymru a'i fod yn dymuno datblygu'r busnes hwn ymhellach. Yn ogystal, mae'n ystyried cynlluniau i ymestyn

Haverfordwest.

I emphasised to the company that, while the Assembly would want to work with Dairy Crest in developing the Haverfordwest site, that could not be seen in isolation from the redevelopment of the Whitland Creamery site, which has been mothballed since its closure in 1994. I told the company that it was important that it announced plans for the site without further delay.

Dairy Crest accepted these points and agreed to put forward detailed proposals for the development of the Haverfordwest cheese-processing plant and for the disposal of the Whitland Creamery site for redevelopment. These plans are to be prepared in time for a further meeting before the end of March.

While Dairy Crest's announcement was deeply unwelcome, the meeting with its senior executives was business-like and positive and the company agreed to make progress on several important issues. The release of the Whitland Creamery site for regeneration is particularly important, and I will ensure that the company comes back to the table with realistic and constructive plans for its disposal. The National Assembly and WDA are in discussion with several companies about potential additional investment in dairy processing in the west, and I remain confident that this vital element of our agri-food strategy will be delivered in the coming months.

**Cynog Dafis:** Mae arnaf ofn bod rhai ohonom wedi gweld yr ysgrifen ar y mur i Dre Ioan ers tro. Mae colli 270 o swyddi'n golled ddifrifol i ardal Caerfyrddin. Yr unig gysur—a chysur cyfyngedig ydyw—yw nad hufenfa sydd yn cau yng Nghaerfyrddin, ond lle pacio caws yn unig. Mae hynny'n fath o ychwanegu gwerth, ond y peth allweddol yw prosesu'r llaeth ein hunain. A all Carwyn Jones ddweud wrthyf pa drefniadau sydd ganddo i farchnata'r safle yn Nhre Ioan? Mae potensial yno ac yr wyf yn siŵr bod Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru yn ymwneud â hynny. Yn ehangach, hoffwn gael rhagor o sylwadau ar sut y mae'r Gweinidog yn gweld

ei waith prosesu caws yn Hwlffordd.

Pwysleisiais i'r cwmni, er y byddai'r Cynulliad am weithio gyda Dairy Crest wrth ddatblygu'r safle yn Hwlffordd, ni ellid ystyried hynny ar wahân i waith ailddatblygu safle Hufenfa Hendy-gwyn ar Daf, lle gohiriwyd y gwaith ers ei chau yn 1994. Dywedais wrth y cwmni ei bod yn bwysig iddo gyhoeddi cynlluniau ar gyfer y safle heb oedi pellach.

Derbyniodd Dairy Crest y pwyntiau hyn a chytunodd i gyflwyno cynigion manwl ar gyfer datblygu gwaith prosesu caws Hwlffordd ac ar gyfer gwaredu safle Hufenfa Hendy-gwyn ar Daf er mwyn ailddatblygu. Caiff y cynlluniau hyn eu paratoi mewn pryd ar gyfer cyfarfod pellach cyn diwedd Mawrth.

Er na chroesawyd cyhoeddiad Dairy Crest o gwbl, bu'r cyfarfod gyda'i uwch weithredwyr yn bwrpasol ac yn gadarnhaol a chytunodd y cwmni i fwrw ymlaen â sawl mater pwysig. Mae rhyddhau safle Hufenfa Hendy-gwyn ar Daf er mwyn ei adfywio yn arbennig o bwysig, a sicrhaf y bydd y cwmni'n dychwelyd atom gyda chynlluniau realistig ac adeiladol ar gyfer ei waredu. Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a'r WDA yn cynnal trafodaethau gyda sawl cwmni ynglŷn â buddsoddiad ychwanegol posibl mewn gwaith prosesu cynnyrch llaeth yn y gorllewin, ac yr wyf yn hyderus o hyd y caiff yr elfen holl bwysig hon o'n strategaeth amaeth-fwyd ei chyflwyno yn y misoedd nesaf.

**Cynog Dafis:** I am afraid that some of us have seen the writing on the wall for Johnstown for some time. The loss of 270 jobs is a serious blow to the Carmarthen area. The only comfort—and it is cold comfort—is that it is a cheese packaging plant, rather than a creamery, that is closing in Carmarthen. That is a form of adding value, but the key thing is to process the milk ourselves. Can Carwyn Jones tell me what arrangements he has made to market the site at Johnstown? There is potential there and I am sure that the Welsh Development Agency is dealing with that. Taking a wider view, I would like more comments on how the Minister sees the

dyfodol y diwydiant llaeth yn y de orllewin yn gyffredinol. A yw'n gweld safle Hendy-gwyn ar Daf yn dod yn ôl i brosesu llaeth neu'n mynd i gyfeiriad gwahanol, os yw Dairy Crest yn wir yn fodlon cael gwared ar y lle? Dylai wneud, a gwarth o beth yw i'r cwmni eistedd ar y safle hwnnw gyhyd.

Yr wyf innau wedi clywed bod Dairy Crest yn ddifrifol o ran ei fwriadau ar gyfer Hwlfordd, a'i fod am weld helaethu cynnyrch, ac yn y blaen. Fodd bynnag, pan edrychaf ar ddatganiadau i'r wasg gan Dairy Crest, nid oes sôn am Hwlfordd yn ei gynlluniau buddsoddi. Mae sôn am fuddsoddi £39 miliwn yng Nglannau Hafren; mae sôn am Hartington, Crudgington, Chard ac yn y blaen, ond dim cyfeiriad at Hwlfordd. Mae hynny'n destun pryder.

Yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed Carwyn Jones yn dweud bod y cwmni'n ystyried buddsoddi pellach. Fodd bynnag, 'ystyried' yw'r gair a ddefnyddir. Pan gyfarfum â chynrychiolwr Dairy Crest ar y safle, yr oeddynt yn sôn am eu hawydd i fuddsoddi, ond dywedasant fod buddsoddi ac ymhelaethu'n dibynnu ar fod digon o gyflenwad o laeth yn y de orllewin. Beth a all Carwyn Jones ei wneud i annog ffermwyr yr ardal honno i gynyddu eu cynnyrch llaeth fel na fydd gan Dairy Crest reswm i beidio â buddsoddi yn y ffatri yn Hwlfordd neu yn Hendy-gwyn ar Daf a datblygu ei waith prosesu ymhellach? Mae hynny'n allweddol. Hefyd, a gynhelir astudiaeth fanwl o'r union anghenion buddsoddi yn Hwlfordd? Cafwyd buddsoddi helaeth mewn systemau cyfrifiadurol, ond mae lle i gredu bod diffygion o natur wahanol yn bodoli, ac mae angen archwilio'r rheini

**Carwyn Jones:** Mewn perthynas â safle Tre Ioan, dywedodd Dairy Crest ei fod am gydweithio gyda'r WDA a Chynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru i ddod o hyd i ffordd o ailddatblygu'r safle. Gwnaethpwyd hynny'n glir yn y cyfarfod.

Gŵyr y mwyafrif fod problemau gydag ail agor safle Hendy-gwyn ar Daf fel hufenfa. Am iddo fod ar gau am gymaint o flynyddoedd, mae'r peiriannau yn y ffatri bellach yn rhy hen. Byddai mwy o obaith i'r safle petai'n cael ei ail ddatblygu. Bydd rhaid

future of the dairy industry in south-west Wales in general. Does he see the Whitland site returning to milk processing or going in another direction, if Dairy Crest is indeed willing to dispose of that site? It should do so, and it is a disgrace that the company has sat on that site for so long.

I have also heard that Dairy Crest is serious about its plans for Haverfordwest and that it wants to see increased production, and so on. However, when I look at Dairy Crest's press releases, there is no mention of Haverfordwest in its investment plans. There is talk of investing £39 million in Severnside; there is talk of Hartington, Crudgington, Chard and so on, but there is no reference to Haverfordwest. That gives cause for concern.

I was pleased to hear Carwyn Jones saying that the company was considering further investment. However, 'considering' is the word being used. When I met Dairy Crest representatives on site, they talked about their desire to invest, but they said that investment and expansion depended on there being sufficient supplies of milk in south-west Wales. What can Carwyn Jones do to encourage farmers in that area to increase milk production so that Dairy Crest has no reason not to invest in the factory in Haverfordwest or in Whitland and develop its processing works further? That is essential. Furthermore, will a detailed study be undertaken to establish the exact investment requirements in Haverfordwest? There has been considerable investment in computer systems, but there are grounds for believing that deficiencies of another nature exist, and those need to be examined.

**Carwyn Jones:** As for the Johnstown site, Dairy Crest has stated that it wishes to cooperate with the WDA and with the National Assembly for Wales to find a way of redeveloping the site. That was made clear at the meeting.

Most people know that there are problems in terms of reopening Whitland as a creamery. Given that it has been closed for so many years, the machinery in the factory is now obsolete. There would be more of a future for the site if it was redeveloped. I must see what

i mi weld beth yn union sydd gan Dairy Crest i'w gynnig ar ddiwedd mis Mawrth. Rhaid sylweddoli bod problemau ail agor y safle fel hufenfa. Tueddodd ganolbwyntio ar bowdr a menyn, nad yw'n dod ag arian i'r ardal. Bydd yn rhaid edrych ar y safle hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn sydd yn bwysig yw'r ffaith bod cam ymlaen wedi'i gymryd ynglŷn â'r safle wedi cymaint o flynyddoedd.

Ar hyn o bryd mae Dairy Crest yn edrych ar ffyrdd o fuddsoddi yn Hwlfordd ac ehangu ar yr hyn sydd yn digwydd yno. Rhaid edrych ar nifer o elfennau. Dywedodd Dairy Crest fod y safle yn ddigonol ar hyn o bryd ar gyfer y gwaith y mae eisiau ei gyflawni yno. Dywedais wrth y cwmni fod drws y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar agor, os yw'n dymuno siarad gyda ni ynghylch buddsoddiad neu gymorth. Fodd bynnag, pwysleisiaf fod cysylltiad rhwng Hwlfordd a dyfodol Hendy-gwyn ar Daf ac nad oes modd torri'r cysylltiad hwnnw.

Ar hyn o bryd cludir llawer o laeth o'r de-orllewin i'w brosesu yn Lloegr. Mae'n bwysig cadw mwy o laeth yng Nghymru, a'r de-orllewin, er mwyn sicrhau bod y gwaith prosesu yn cael ei wneud yn agos at y cynhyrchwyr laeth.

**Christine Gwyther:** Thank you, Carwyn, for your statement. We must concentrate our minds on the 270 workers who are losing their jobs at Johnstown and the 275 at Marshfield. I could not forget them. As you know, Nick Ainger and I met with the workforce last week. They told us that the first definite news they had about the closure was when they came into work and found a line of Audis parked outside the plant. Those workers who had been involved in closures before knew that the top brass had arrived for a reason. Unfortunately, from their experience, that reason was to close a plant down.

We had a sobering meeting with the workforce. I can assure you that, whatever happens with Whitland, it will be cold comfort to those 270 workers. However, they are skilled in handling food and they have been trained well. I hope that we do not lose sight of that when we consider alternative employment for them. We understand that it

exactly Dairy Crest has to offer at the end of March. We must realise that there are problems with reopening the site as a creamery. It tended to concentrate on powder and butter, which does not bring money into the area. That site will have to be looked at. However, it is important that a step forward has been taken with this site after so many years.

Dairy Crest is currently examining ways of investing in the Haverfordwest site and expanding on what is done there. A number of issues need to be examined. Dairy Crest has stated that the site is adequate at present for the work that it wishes to do there. I have told the company that the National Assembly's door is open if it wishes to discuss investment or assistance. However, I stress that there is a link that cannot be broken between Haverfordwest and the future of Whitland.

At the moment large quantities of milk are transported from south-west Wales to be processed in England. It is important that we retain more milk in Wales, and in the south-west, to ensure that processing occurs close to the point of production.

**Christine Gwyther:** Diolch ichi, Carwyn, am eich datganiad. Rhaid inni ganolbwyntio ar y 270 o weithwyr sydd yn colli eu swyddi yn Nhre Ioan a'r 275 ym Maerun. Ni allwn i eu hanghofio. Fel y gwyddoch, cyfarfu Nick Ainger a minnau â'r gweithlu yr wythnos diwethaf. Dywedasant wrthym mai'r newyddion pendant cyntaf a gawsant am gau'r gwaith oedd pan ddaethant i'r gwaith a chanfod llinell o Audis wedi parcio y tu allan i'r gwaith. Yr oedd y gweithwyr hynny a oedd wedi profi hyn o'r blaen yn gwybod bod y pwysigion wedi cyrraedd am reswm. Yn anffodus, o'u profiad hwy, y rheswm hwnnw oedd er mwyn cau'r gwaith.

Cawsom gyfarfod sboreiddiol gyda'r gweithlu. Beth bynnag a ddigwydd yn Hendy-gwyn ar Daf, gallaf eich sicrhau mai cysur Job fydd hynny i'r 270 o weithwyr. Fodd bynnag, maent yn trin bwyd yn fedrus a chawsant eu hyfforddi'n dda. Gobeithiaf na chollwn olwg ar hynny pan ystyriwn gyflogaeth amgen iddynt. Deallwn na fydd



might not be in the cheese business, but those workers are skilled in food handling. I would like you to bear that in mind.

9:55 a.m.

A taskforce is being set up to help those workers, led by Nick Ainger, and I will ensure that I have a place on it. It will include representatives from the Welsh Development Agency, Carmarthenshire County Council—which is taking a proactive lead on this—and the West Wales Training and Enterprise Council.

Ultimately, we expect the taskforce to have the wider remit of considering the Whitland site. It is important that Whitland is not forgotten. When Nick Ainger and I—and you, of course—met with John Houlston for some hard talking, it became apparent that Whitland will never reopen as a butter and powder plant. We are therefore searching for other uses for the site and I hope that you will do that energetically. Those other uses could be food-related or high-tech.

As a plug for Whitland, Carmarthen now has asymmetric digital subscriber line technology and broadband communication, and that will soon be installed in Haverfordwest also. It would be convenient for Whitland to have that technology. Will you bear that in mind in your discussions with the Deputy First Minister and Minister for Economic Development? Whitland no longer has to look backwards. We can see light at the end of the tunnel. I hope that that includes decent, well-paid jobs for the people who live there.

**Carwyn Jones:** I echo many of Christine's comments. I welcome the setting up of a taskforce in Carmarthen. My impression is that the land currently occupied by the packaging plant will be much sought after because of a shortage of small business units in the town. That land will be welcome in terms of redevelopment. That is welcome news in the midst of the problematic and unwelcome news about Dairy Crest.

mewn gwaith caws efallai ond mae gan y gweithwyr hynny sgiliau trin bwyd. Hoffwn ichi gadw hynny mewn cof.

Caiff tasglu ei sefydlu i helpu'r gweithwyr hynny, o dan arweiniad Nick Ainger, a sicrhaf fod gennyf le arno. Bydd yn cynnwys cynrychiolwyr o Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, Cyngor Sir Caerfyrddin—sydd yn arwain y blaen yn rhagweithiol yn hyn o beth—a Chyngor Hyfforddi a Menter Gorllewin Cymru.

Yn y pen draw, disgwyliwn i'r tasglu gael gylch gwaith ehangach a fydd yn ystyried safle Hendy-gwyn ar Daf. Mae'n bwysig nad anghofir am Hendy-gwyn ar Daf. Pan gyfarfu Nick Ainger a minnau—a chithau, wrth gwrw—â John Houlston i drafod o ddirif, daeth yn amlwg nad ailagorir Hendy-gwyn ar Daf fyth fel gwaith menyf a phowdr. Yr ydym felly'n chwilio am ddefnyddiau eraill i'r safle a gobeithiaf y gwnewch hynny gyda brwdfrydedd. Gallai'r defnyddiau eraill hynny ymwneud â bwyd neu â'r dechnoleg ddiweddaraf.

Wrth sôn am Hendy-gwyn ar Daf, mae gan Gaerfyrddin bellach dechnoleg llinell danysgrifio ddigidol anghymesur a chyfathrebu band llydan, a gosodir hynny yn fuan yn Hwlfordd hefyd. Byddai'n hwylus pe bai'r dechnoleg honno ar gael yn Hendy-gwyn ar Daf. A wnewch chi gadw hynny mewn cof yn eich trafodaethau gyda'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd? Bellach, nid oes yn rhaid i Hendy-gwyn ar Daf edrych yn ôl. Gallwn weld golau ar ddiwedd y twnnel. Gobeithiaf fod hynny'n cynnwys swyddi da, ar gyflog da i'r bobl sydd yn byw yno.

**Carwyn Jones:** Adeisiaf lawer o sylwadau Christine. Croesawaf y ffaith fod tasglu wedi ei sefydlu yng Nghaerfyrddin. Fy argraff i yw y bydd galw mawr am y tir a feddiennir ar hyn o bryd gan y gwaith pecynnu oherwydd prinder unedau busnes bach yn y dref. O ran ailddatblygu, mae'r tir hwnnw i'w groesawu. Mae hynny'n newyddion calonogol ynghanol y newyddion ansicr ac annymunol ynglŷn â Dairy Crest.

When you come down Pengawse hill from Narberth to Whitland, you see that the Dairy Crest factory dominates the Taf valley. It would not be so bad if it produced something. However, the fact that it has been mothballed for so many years almost serves to mock the local population. I am glad that we are moving forward on this. There is a recognition that the plant will not reopen as a creamery, which is not necessarily the best way forward for the area. However, the site must be redeveloped and we are moving forward on that, at long last.

**Peter Rogers:** I welcome your quick action on the job losses at Dairy Crest and the immediate meeting that was held. You must realise the importance of safeguarding the milk industry in Wales. Christine has already described how the skilled workers who are losing their jobs can perhaps find other outlets in which to work. Processing milk in Wales has a direct effect on farming and the dairy industry. We have lost the added value of this milk to Gloucestershire, where it is creating work. In addition to the serious job losses in the dairy industry in Carmarthen and Marshfield, 73 farm jobs are lost every week. As you know, the majority of those jobs are from high-labour dairy farms. We must safeguard this industry. Last year, I visited South Caernarfon Creameries. An item that stood out in its annual general report was increased transport costs of £120,000. That was before this year's tremendous hike in fuel costs. People in the dairy industry will tell you that the industry is based on the price per litre delivered to the creamery. The more facilities we lose in Wales, the greater the disadvantage to the industry. Will you ensure that, with the agri-food partnership, we move forward to add value to milk and process it in Wales, rather than let it go across the border?

**Carwyn Jones:** Although the news regarding Carmarthen and Marshfield is unwelcome, they are not processing plants. Carmarthen is a packaging plant and Marshfield is a bottling plant. However, that is not to belittle those plants' importance to the local community. It

Pan ddowch i lawr bryn Pengawse o Arberth i Hendy-gwyn ar Daf, fe welwch fod ffatri Dairy Crest yn amlwg iawn yn nyffryn Taf. Ni fyddai gynddrwg pe bai'n cynhyrchu rhywbeth. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ffaith ei bod y gwaith yno wedi ei ohirio ers cymaint o flynyddoedd fel pe bai bron yn gwatwar y boblogaeth leol. Yr wyf yn falch ein bod yn symud ymlaen ar hyn. Cydnabyddir na fydd y gwaith yn ailagor fel hufenfa, ac nid dyna'r ffordd ymlaen orau o reidrwydd i'r ardal. Fodd bynnag, rhaid ailddatblygu'r safle a symudwn ymlaen ar hynny, o'r diwedd.

**Peter Rogers:** Croesawaf y camau cyflym a gymerasoch mewn perthynas â'r diswyddiadau yn Dairy Crest a'r cyfarfod a gynhaliwyd ar unwaith. Rhaid ichi sylweddoli pwysigrwydd diogelu'r diwydiant llaeth yng Nghymru. Disgrifiodd Christine eisoes sut y gall gweithwyr medrus sydd yn colli eu swyddi ddod o hyd i fannau eraill lle y gallant weithio o bosibl. Caiff prosesu llaeth yng Nghymru effaith uniongyrchol ar ffermio a'r diwydiant cynnyrch llaeth. Collasom werth ychwanegol y llaeth hwn i Swydd Gaerloyw, lle mae'n creu gwaith. Yn ogystal â'r diswyddiadau difrifol yn y diwydiant llaeth yng Nghaerfyrddin a Maerun, collir 73 o swyddi fferm bob wythnos. Fel y gwyddoch, collir y mwyaf o'r swyddi hynny mewn ffermydd llaeth dwys-lafur. Rhaid inni ddiogelu'r diwydiant hwn. Y llynedd, ymwelais â Hufenfa De Arfon. Un eitem amlwg yn ei adroddiad cyffredinol blynyddol oedd costau cludiant a oedd wedi cynyddu £120,000. Yr oedd hynny cyn y codiad aruthrol eleni mewn costau tanwydd. Bydd pobl yn y diwydiant cynnyrch llaeth yn dweud wrthyech bod y diwydiant yn seiliedig ar y pris fesul litr a gludir i'r hufenfa. Po fwyaf o gyfleusterau a gollwn yng Nghymru, y mwyaf yw'r anfantais i'r diwydiant. A sicrhewch, gyda'r bartneriaeth amaeth-fwyd, ein bod yn symud ymlaen i ychwanegu gwerth at laeth a'i brosesu yng Nghymru, yn hytrach na gadael iddo fynd dros y ffin?

**Carwyn Jones:** Er na chroesewir y newyddion am Gaerfyrddin a Maerun, nid ydynt yn weithfeydd prosesu. Mae Caerfyrddin yn waith pecynnu a Maerun yn waith potelu. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn bychanu pwysigrwydd y gweithfeydd hynny

is sad that the announcements on Carmarthen and Marshfield go against the flow of what is happening in rural Wales in terms of dairy processing. There is tremendous interest in setting up new processing capacity in west and mid Wales and, particularly, in north Wales. Several companies—which I cannot name for reasons of commercial confidentiality—are expressing a strong interest in expanding in our traditional milk producing areas. Therefore, this announcement goes against the trend in the industry this year. However, I take your point on board.

It is important that processing capacity should be as close to the source of the raw product as possible. That seems to make eminent sense. The last thing that we want is for the dairy industry in Wales only to produce the raw goods and for it to be shipped elsewhere to be processed. The agri-food strategy is working hard to ensure that that does not happen.

**Rosemary Butler:** Thank you for coming back to us so quickly with this statement. However, it did not mention the Marshfield plant, which is in my constituency, although you referred to it just now. During your meeting with Dairy Crest—you called it a business-like and positive meeting—was there any mention of the Marshfield plant? Did the directors mention that the bottling machine has broken down and that seven lorries, or maybe trains, have to bring bottles from London every day? The workers are concerned that the directors may not wish to invest the £40,000 that it will cost to repair that machine if they are to close the plant within a year. They are concerned that they will lose their jobs much more quickly than they had anticipated. Was there any mention of that and, if not, will you go back to the company and ask what its plans are?

**Carwyn Jones:** I can confirm that that problem was not mentioned in the meeting, but I will raise it in my next meeting with the company. On Marshfield, I should have made the point with regard to Carmarthen and Marshfield that the company was determined to close both plants. Its directors made it clear that no package offered by the National

i'r gymuned leol. Mae'n drist bod y cyhoeddiadau am Gaerfyrddin a Maerun yn mynd yn erbyn llif yr hyn sydd yn digwydd yng Nghymru wledig o ran prosesu cynnyrch llaeth. Mae diddordeb mawr mewn sefydlu gweithfeydd prosesu newydd yng ngorllewin a chanolbarth Cymru ac, yn arbennig, yng ngogledd Cymru. Mae sawl cwmni—na allaf eu henwi am resymau cyfrinachedd masnachol—yn mynegi diddordeb mawr mewn ymestyn ein hardaloedd cynhyrchu llaeth traddodiadol. Felly, mae'r cyhoeddiad hwn yn groes i'r duedd yn y diwydiant eleni. Fodd bynnag, derbyniaf eich pwynt.

Mae'n bwysig bod y gweithfeydd prosesu mor agos â phosibl at ffynhonnell y cynnyrch crai. Ymddengys fod hynny'n gwneud synnwyr amlwg. Y peth olaf a ddymunwn yw i'r diwydiant cynnyrch llaeth yng Nghymru gynhyrchu'r nwyddau crai yn unig ac iddynt gael eu cludo ar long i rywle arall i gael eu prosesu. Mae'r strategaeth amaeth-fwyd yn gweithio'n galed i sicrhau nad yw hynny'n digwydd.

**Rosemary Butler:** Diolch ichi am ddod yn ôl atom mor gyflym gyda'r datganiad hwn. Fodd bynnag, ni soniodd am waith Maerun, sydd yn fy etholaeth i, er ichi gyfeirio yn awr. Yn ystod eich cyfarfod â Dairy Crest—galwasoch ef yn gyfarfod pwrpasol a chadarnhaol—a fu unrhyw sôn am y gwaith ym Maerun? A soniodd y cyfarwyddwyr fod y peiriant potelu wedi torri a bod yn rhaid i saith lori, neu drenau efallai, ddod â photeli o Lundain bob dydd? Mae'r gweithwyr yn gofidio na fydd y cyfarwyddwyr efallai am fuddsoddi'r £40,000 y bydd yn ei gostio i atgyweirio'r peiriant hwnnw os caeir y gwaith ymhen blwyddyn. Gofidiant y cânt eu diswyddo yn gynt o lawer nag a ragwelsant. A fu unrhyw sôn am hynny ac, os na fu, a ewch yn ôl at y cwmni a holi beth yw ei gynlluniau?

**Carwyn Jones:** Gallaf gadarnhau na soniwyd am y broblem yn y cyfarfod, ond fe'i codaf yn fy nghyfarfod nesaf gyda'r cwmni. O ran Maerun, dylwn fod wedi gwneud y pwynt o ran Caerfyrddin a Maerun fod y cwmni yn benderfynol o gau'r ddau waith. Eglurodd ei gyfarwyddwyr na allai unrhyw becyn a gynigir iddynt gan y

Assembly could deter them from their decision. They stated that they would stick by their decision through thick and thin, unfortunately. That point was made clear.

We made the point about the effect that the closure of those two plants would have on local communities and then we moved on to see what could be done to secure jobs elsewhere in Wales. A total of 175 jobs were created in the Maelor plant near Wrexham, which is welcome in that area, but it is not much use to people in Marshfield or Carmarthen. While we regret the loss of these jobs, the dairy sector, and dairy processing in particular, has the capacity to expand. We must ensure that, where processing expands, it does so in Wales. The National Assembly, through the agri-food strategy, will not cease to state that.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr wyf yn falch o glywed eich bod yn mynd i wneud yr hyn a allwch i sicrhau gwaith arall i'r gweithwyr yng Nghaerfyrddin ac yng Nghaerdydd. O ran cynhyrchu llaeth yn ne-orllewin Cymru, a allwch roi sicrwydd inni na fydd yn lleihau? Gwyddom fod nifer y cynhyrchwyr yn lleihau, ond a allwch roi sicrwydd inni nad ydym yn colli cynnyrch o'r maes hwnnw i fannau eraill?

O ran y ganolfan pecynnu yng Nghaerfyrddin, a godasoch yn eich trafodaethau gyda Dairy Crest ei gynllun masnachol, sef prosesu yn Hwlfordd a chynyddu hynny o bosibl? Beth fydd yn digwydd wedyn i'r llaeth sydd wedi ei brosesu? A eir ag ef dros Glawdd Offa i gael ei becynnu? A oes unrhyw fath o synnwyr masnachol yn hynny? A godasoch hefyd ymddygiad annerbyniol Dairy Crest mewn perthynas â Hendy-gwyn ar Daf? Defnyddiodd y ffatri a oedd wedi ei chau yn Hendy-gwyn ar Daf i atal unrhyw un arall rhag datblygu yno. A roddasoch bwysau ar y cwmni i symud yn gyflym i ryddhau'r ffatri fel bod prosesydd arall yn gallu dod i mewn i Hendy-gwyn?

**Carwyn Jones:** Dywedais hynny wrth y cwmni a gwneuthum y pwynt yn glir a chryf

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol eu hatal rhag gwneud eu penderfyniad. Dywedasant y byddent, yn anffodus, yn glynu wrth eu penderfyniad doed a ddelo. Gwnaethpwyd y pwynt hwnnw'n glir.

Gwnaethom y pwynt ynglŷn â'r effaith y byddai cau'r ddau waith hyn yn ei chael ar gymunedau lleol ac yna symudasom ymlaen i weld beth y gellid ei wneud i sicrhau swyddi mewn mannau eraill yng Nghymru. Crëwyd cyfanswm o 175 o swyddi yng ngwaith Maelor ger Wrecsam, sydd i'w groesawu yn yr ardal honno, ond nid yw'n fawr o werth i bobl ym Maerun neu Gaerfyrddin. Er ein bod yn edifar gennym golli'r swyddi hyn, mae gan y sector cynnyrch llaeth, a phrosesu cynnyrch llaeth yn arbennig, y gallu i ehangu. Rhaid inni sicrhau, pan fydd prosesu yn ehangu, ei fod yn gwneud hynny yng Nghymru. Ni pheidia'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, drwy'r strategaeth amaethfwyd, â nodi hynny.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I am pleased to hear that you will do what you can to ensure alternative employment for the workers in Carmarthen and Cardiff. On milk production in south-west Wales, can you give an assurance that it will not decrease? We know that the number of producers is decreasing, but can you assure us that we are not losing production from that area to other places?

In your discussions with Dairy Crest on the packaging plant in Carmarthen, did you raise its commercial plan, namely processing in Haverfordwest and possibly increasing that? What will happen then to the milk that has been processed? Will it be taken over Offa's Dyke to be packaged? Is there any commercial sense in that? Did you also raise Dairy Crest's unacceptable behaviour in relation to Whitland? It refused to give up the factory that had been closed in Whitland to prevent anyone else from developing there. Did you put pressure on the company to move quickly to release that factory so that another processor can come in to Whitland?

**Carwyn Jones:** I told the company that and I made the point clearly and strongly that the

fod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol am ddatblygu prosesu yng Nghymru. Nid oes dyfodol i gynhyrchwyr llaeth yng Nghymru os nad ydynt ond yn cynhyrchu llaeth sydd wedyn yn mynd allan o Gymru i gael ei brosesu yn Lloegr neu mewn mannau eraill. Mae hynny'n mynd yn erbyn nod ein strategaeth ar laeth. Gwneuthum y pwynt hwnnw'n gryf.

10:05 a.m.

Dywedais hefyd ein bod am hybu prosesu yn ne-orllewin Cymru. Golyga hynny ein bod yn barod i siarad ag unrhyw gwmni a fyddai'n dymuno gwneud hynny. Pwysleisiais na fydd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn caniatáu i fwy o laeth Cymru gael ei brosesu yn Lloegr. Dylai gael ei brosesu yng Nghymru.

**Mick Bates:** Thank you for this prompt statement. Unfortunately, this announcement is part of a trend in which many ancillary industries associated with agriculture have disappeared. Our stated aim, although I sense an air of resignation, is that we want more added value. However, the Whitland plant was mothballed, which held up the development of added value products on that site. While listening to your statement, I was relieved to think that the Liberal Democrats have ensured free school milk, which may be the only bright spot in the milk industry at the moment. Agriculture, and the dairy sector in particular, has lost numerous jobs, and 17,000 people in that industry in England and Wales are now in receipt of the working families tax credit. That reflects the poor state of the dairy sector and agriculture as a whole. I was concerned, therefore, that Dairy Crest, like Corus, did not consult its staff, the WDA or local councils prior to these closures. Why is our intelligence so poor when we employ a large number of people to discuss business development in Wales and have a stated aim of encouraging added value products? Why were those people not aware of this and why is a plan not in place?

In Whitland's case, the statement mentioned the proposal for future development. If you are committed to ensuring the future

National Assembly wishes to develop processing in Wales. There is no future for milk producers in Wales if they only produce milk which then leaves Wales to be processed in England or elsewhere. That goes against the aim of our strategy for milk. I made that point strongly.

I also said that we wish to promote processing in south-west Wales. That means that we are willing to talk to any company that would wish to do so. I emphasised that the National Assembly will not allow more Welsh milk to be processed in England. It should be processed in Wales.

**Mick Bates:** Diolch ichi am y datganiad prydlon hwn. Yn anffodus, mae'r cyhoeddiad hwn yn rhan o duedd lle mae llawer o ddiwydiannau ategol sydd yn gysylltiedig ag amaethyddiaeth wedi diflannu. Ein nod penodol, er y synhwyraf rywfaint o ymostyngiad, yw cael mwy o werth ychwanegol. Fodd bynnag, gohiriwyd gwaith Hendy-gwyn ar Daf, a rwystrodd y gwaith o ddatblygu cynnyrch gwerth ychwanegol ar y safle hwnnw. Tra'n gwrando ar eich datganiad, yr oeddwn yn falch o feddwl bod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wedi sicrhau llaeth ysgol am ddim, sef yr unig nodyn cadarnhaol yn y diwydiant llaeth ar hyn o bryd. Collodd amaethyddiaeth, a'r sector cynnyrch llaeth yn arbennig, nifer o swyddi, a bellach mae 17,000 o bobl yn y diwydiant hwnnw yng Nghymru a Lloegr yn derbyn y credyd treth i deuluoedd sydd yn gweithio. Adlewyrcha hynny gyflwr gwael y sector cynnyrch llaeth ac amaethyddiaeth yn gyffredinol. Gofidiais felly, nad oedd Dairy Crest, fel Corus, wedi ymgynghori â'i staff, y WDA na chynghorau lleol cyn cau'r gweithfeydd hyn. Pam bod ein gwybodaeth mor wael pan gyflogwn nifer fawr o bobl i drafod datblygu busnes yng Nghymru a phan fo gennym nod penodol o annog cynnyrch â gwerth ychwanegol? Pam nad oedd y bobl hynny yn ymwybodol o hyn a pham nad oes cynllun ar waith?

Yn achos Hendy-gwyn ar Daf, soniodd y datganiad am y cynnig ar gyfer datblygu yn y dyfodol. Os ydych yn ymrwymedig i sicrhau

development of added value food processing, the workers who have lost their jobs can use their skills in that area again.

**Carwyn Jones:** As far as free school milk is concerned, I am pleased, as I said yesterday, to reinstate a policy originally put in place by a Labour Government following the second world war.

As regards the intelligence in the case of Haverfordwest and Whitland, it was rumoured for many weeks that this would happen. There were strong rumours of which we were aware. We have been asking Dairy Crest for a meeting for many months. Christine Gwyther started the ball rolling in April last year when she asked the company for a meeting. I have continued with that task. I wrote to the company in January and arranged a meeting, which was held last week. That meeting, therefore, had been arranged for some weeks and was not held to merely talk about the recent job losses in Carmarthen and Marshfield. We therefore, eventually, met with the company. However, short of bringing them to the Assembly at gunpoint, there is little that can be done to force companies to the negotiating table. Dairy Crest came to the table to discuss matters, but not as soon as we would have liked.

On future development, I would like to see the Whitland site used for redevelopment that will bring highly-skilled highly-paid jobs into the community and the surrounding area. Some jobs may come from the food-processing sector. They may come from other sectors. However, it is important that the site is released and used for the economic regeneration of Whitland to ensure highly-skilled, highly-paid jobs regardless of in which sector they are.

datblygiad prosesu bwyd â gwerth ychwanegol yn y dyfodol, gall y gweithwyr a gollodd eu swyddi ddefnyddio eu sgiliau yn y maes hwnnw eto.

**Carwyn Jones:** O ran llaeth ysgol am ddim, yr wyf yn falch, fel y dywedais ddoe, o adfer polisi a roddwyd ar waith gan Lywodraeth Lafur yn dilyn yr ail ryfel byd.

O ran yr wybodaeth yn achos Hwlfordd a Hendy-gwyn ar Daf, bu sibrydion am wythnosau lawer y byddai hyn yn digwydd. Bu sibrydion cryf yr oeddem yn ymwybodol ohonynt. Gofynasom i Dairy Crest am gyfarfod ers misoedd lawer. Cychwynnodd Christine Gwyther bethau ym mis Ebrill y llynedd pan ofynnodd i'r cwmni am gyfarfod. Parheais â'r dasg honno. Ysgrifennais at y cwmni ym mis Ionawr gan drefnu cyfarfod, a gynhaliwyd yr wythnos diwethaf. Felly, trefnwyd y cyfarfod hwnnw rai wythnosau'n ôl ac ni chynhaliwyd ef er mwyn siarad am y swyddi a gollwyd yn ddiweddar yng Nghaerfyrddin a Maerun yn unig. Felly, yn y pen draw, cyfarfuom â'r cwmni. Fodd bynnag, oni ddefnyddiwn gwn i ddod â hwy i'r Cynulliad, nid oes llawer y gellir ei wneud i orfodi cwmnïau i drafod. Daeth Dairy Crest atom i drafod materion, ond nid mor fuan ag y byddem wedi ei ddymuno.

O ran datblygiad yn y dyfodol, hoffwn weld safle Hendy-gwyn ar Daf yn cael ei ddefnyddio i ailddatblygu a daw hyn â sgiliau tra medrus â chyflogau uchel i'r gymuned a'r ardal gyfagos. Efallai y daw rhai swyddi o'r sector prosesu bwyd. Efallai y deuant o sectorau eraill. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig rhyddhau'r safle a'i ddefnyddio er mwyn adfywio Hendy-gwyn ar Daf yn economaidd er mwyn sicrhau swyddi tra medrus â chyflogau uchel waeth pa sector y maent ynddo.

### **Datganiad ar y Strategaeth Datblygu Economaidd Genedlaethol Statement on the National Economic Development Strategy**

**The Deputy First Minister and Minister for Economic Development (Michael German):** I have today issued a consultation paper on the national economic development

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd (Michael German):** Heddiw, cyhoeddais bapur ymgynghorol ar y strategaeth datblygu

strategy. This will set us on the pathway to future economic prosperity in Wales. If we are to deliver a successful future for Wales, we need a clear vision of what that success should look like. I want to see a prosperous Welsh economy that is dynamic, inclusive and sustainable based on world-class competitive businesses and skilled, motivated people.

Wales has an unprecedented opportunity to meet the challenges ahead. First, we have a democratically elected National Assembly for the first time. Secondly, the Welsh Development Agency has been enlarged and will soon take over responsibility for enterprise, and the Wales Tourist Board has a greatly enhanced budget. Thirdly, the new National Council for Education and Training for Wales will have a key role in developing people's skills in Wales. Fourthly, we have Objective 1 for west Wales and the Valleys, the biggest structural funds programme in the United Kingdom.

Given recent developments, especially those affecting the steel industry, it is vital that we work in a genuine spirit of partnership and teamwork. The challenge for us in Wales is not simply to copy the projects or instruments applied in successful regions, but to capture the spirit and the vision. We must build on our strengths and tackle our weaknesses head-on. We have many strengths that we can build upon. For example, we have an excellent record in attracting inward investment; parts of east Wales are as prosperous as the UK average; Welsh manufacturing productivity is above the UK average; our people have demonstrated an impressive capacity to respond flexibly to a modernising economy; and we have several fledgling industries with great potential. The problems the Welsh economy faces are well documented. They include not enough people in jobs, not enough high paying, high quality jobs, sharp variations in economic performance across Wales, and too few businesses for the size of our population.

economaidd genedlaethol. Bydd hwn yn ein rhoi ar y ffordd i ffyniant economaidd yn y dyfodol yng Nghymru. Er mwyn inni sicrhau dyfodol llwyddiannus i Gymru, mae angen gweledigaeth glir arnom o sut y dylai'r llwyddiant hwnnw edrych. Yr wyf am weld economi ffyniannus yng Nghymru sydd yn ddeinamig, cynhwysol a chynaliadwy yn seiliedig ar fusnesau cystadleuol o'r radd flaenaf a phobl fedrus, cryf eu cymhelliad.

Mae gan Gymru gyfle heb ei ail i ateb yr heriau sydd o'n blaen. Yn gyntaf, mae gennym Gynulliad Cenedlaethol, am y tro cyntaf, a etholwyd yn ddemocrataidd. Yn ail, ehangwyd Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a chyn bo hir bydd yn gyfrifol am fenter, ac mae gan Fwrdd Croeso Cymru gyllideb fwy o lawer. Yn drydydd, bydd gan y Cyngor Cenedlaethol Cymru dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant rôl allweddol wrth ddatblygu sgiliau pobl yng Nghymru. Yn bedwerydd, mae gennym raglen Amcan 1 ar gyfer gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd, y rhaglen cronfeydd strwythurol fwyaf yn y Deyrnas Unedig.

O gofio'r datblygiadau diweddar, yn arbennig y rheini sydd yn effeithio ar y diwydiant dur, mae'n holl bwysig ein bod yn gweithio mewn ysbryd gwirioneddol o bartneriaeth gan weithio fel tîm. Yr her i ni yng Nghymru yw peidio â chopio'r prosiectau na'r dulliau a ddefnyddir mewn ardaloedd llwyddiannus, ond i ddal yr ysbryd a'r weledigaeth. Rhaid inni adeiladu ar ein cryfderau a bwrw iddi o ddifrif i fynd i'r afael â'n gwendidau. Er enghraifft, mae gennym hanes rhagorol o ddenu mewnfuddsoddiad; mae rhannau o ddwyrain Cymru mor ffyniannus â chyfartaledd y DU; mae cynhyrchiant gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru yn uwch na chyfartaledd y DU; dangosodd ein pobl allu rhagorol i ymateb yn hyblyg i economi sydd yn moderneiddio; ac mae gennym sawl diwydiant newydd sydd â photensial mawr. Gwyddom yn dda am y problemau y mae economi Cymru yn eu hwynebu. Yn eu plith mae'r ffaith nad oes digon o bobl mewn swyddi, dim digon o swyddi o safon â chyflogau uchel, amrywiadau sydyn mewn perfformiad economaidd ledled Cymru a dim digon o fusnesau o gofio maint ein poblogaeth.

If we are to realise this vision we must plan and prioritise for the future. We can, and must, take a view on how the world economy will develop and its implications for Wales. Given technological advances, location will become less important, giving us the opportunity to overcome the traditional restrictions of peripherality. Investment in science and innovation will create more products and services, demands for new skills and new industries. The internet will continue to grow as a tool for business and leisure. All societies will need to invest more in education and training because a knowledge-based economy demands a knowledge-equipped workforce. Manufacturing is likely to continue to be an essential part of the Welsh economy. Therefore, it is vital that that sector is efficient and modern. Pressures on resources and the environment will accelerate the trend towards more sustainable technologies, products and processes.

Entrepreneurship should be a key theme. One of the most striking regional comparators shows that Wales is at the bottom of the UK league in terms of the formation of new businesses. For too long, too many people in Wales have been employees rather than employers, and people's natural entrepreneurial gifts have been channelled into the arts, sport, education, public service and even politics. The partnership agreement's business birth rate strategy offers a new route for increasing business formation and business stock. While it will take a generation to turn the culture in Wales around, we must start to change the entrepreneur's environment.

I propose key policy priorities that will deliver the vision. First, is to close the regional productivity gap. We must diversify our economic base to ensure that we move up the value chain. That is why the need to focus resources on specific sectors and clusters is so important. Skills, training and education will be critical in assisting this step change. Internationalisation should also be a key part of the strategy. We must compete globally and ensure that our export base expands. We also need to ensure that our international

Er mwyn gwireddu'r weledigaeth hon rhaid inni gynllunio a blaenoriaethu ar gyfer y dyfodol. Gallwn, a rhaid inni, ystyried sut y bydd economi'r byd yn datblygu a'i goblygiadau i Gymru. O gofio'r datblygiadau technolegol, ni fydd lleoliad mor bwysig, gan roi'r cyfle inni oresgyn y rhwystrau traddodiadol o fod ar yr ymylon. Bydd buddsoddi ac arloesi mewn gwyddoniaeth yn creu mwy o gynnyrch a gwasanaethau, galwadau am sgiliau newydd a diwydiannau newydd. Bydd y rhyngwrld yn parhau i dyfu fel cyfrwng busnes a hamdden. Bydd angen i bob cymdeithas fuddsoddi mwy mewn addysg a hyfforddiant gan fod economi sydd yn seiliedig ar wybodaeth yn galw am weithlu sydd yn meddu ar yr wybodaeth honno. Mae gweithgynhyrchu yn debygol o barhau i fod yn rhan hanfodol o'r economi Gymreig. Felly, mae'n holl bwysig bod y sector yn effeithlon a modern. Bydd pwysau ar adnoddau a'r amgylchedd yn cyflymu'r duedd tuag at dechnolegau, cynnyrch a phrosesau mwy cynaliadwy.

Dylai entrepreneuriaeth fod yn thema allweddol. Dengys un o'r cymaryddion rhanbarthol mwyaf trawiadol fod Cymru ar waelod cynghrair y DU o ran llunio busnesau newydd. Ers gormod o amser, bu gormod o bobl yng Nghymru yn gyflogeion yn hytrach na chyflogwyr, a sianelwyd doniau entrepreneuriaid naturiol pobl i'r celfyddydau, chwaraeon, addysg, gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a hyd yn oed gwleidyddiaeth. Yn strategaeth cyfradd geni busnesau y cytundeb partneriaeth cynigir ffordd newydd o gynyddu busnesau a stoc busnesau. Er y cymer genhedlaeth i newid y diwylliant yng Nghymru, rhaid inni ddechrau newid amgylchedd yr entrepreneur.

Cynigiau flaenoriaethau polisiâu allweddol a fydd yn cyflawni'r weledigaeth. Yn gyntaf, rhaid cau'r bwlch mewn cynhyrchiant rhanbarthol. Rhaid inni arallgyfeirio yn economaidd er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn symud i fyny'r gadwyn gwerth. Dyna pam bod angen canolbwyntio adnoddau ar sectorau penodol a pham bod clystyrau mor bwysig. Bydd sgiliau, hyfforddiant ac addysg yn holl bwysig wrth helpu i greu'r newid sylweddol hwn. Dylai rhyngwladoli fod yn rhan allweddol o'r strategaeth hefyd. Rhaid



profile reaches the level that Wales deserves. When we compare the international profile of Wales to that of our Celtic cousins, it is not unreasonable to conclude that we have been a hidden jewel for far too long.

Secondly, we must tackle the economic activity gap. In fighting unemployment, and economic inactivity in particular, we must remove the barriers in the way of those who want to work. Promoting individual and community empowerment is important in raising economic activity. Thirdly, we must ensure that spatial balance remains a priority, not least in closing the gap between west Wales and the Valleys and the rest of Wales.

The key to the strategy, following the consultation paper, will be the effective implementation of our policies. We need to work with our partners to ensure that the right policies are used in the right place and that resources follow needs and priorities. The paper sets targets against which we can realistically measure our progress. Some may argue that they are overly ambitious. Anything less than the targets I propose will confine us to the bottom of the economic league. As time moves on we can judge ourselves against these targets.

This paper is not a final strategy. It is designed to inform the development of a national economic development strategy for Wales. The final strategy will evolve after the consultation period, informed by the responses we receive. The complete strategy will include an implementation plan, which will prioritise the policies, identify lead agencies, consider resources and set ambitious but realistic targets. We must never allow paucity of ambition to undermine our efforts for Wales. We must work closely with our partners to ensure that the strategy is widely accepted and reflected in their own planning. The strategy will be published in the summer.

inni gystadlu ar lefel byd-eang a sicrhau bod ein gallu i allforio yn ehangu. Rhaid inni sicrhau hefyd bod ein proffil rhyngwladol yn cyrraedd y lefel y mae Cymru yn ei haeddu. Pan gymharwn broffil rhyngwladol Cymru â phroffil ein cefndryd Celtaidd, nid yw'n afresymol dod i'r casgliad ein bod wedi bod yn em gudd ers llawer gormod o amser.

Yn ail, rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â'r bwlch o ran gweithgarwch economaidd. Wrth frwydro yn erbyn diweithdra, ac anweithgarwch economaidd yn arbennig, rhaid inni symud y rhwystrau sydd yn wynebu'r rheini sydd am weithio. Mae hybu awdurdod yr unigolyn a'r gymuned yn bwysig wrth gynyddu gweithgarwch cymunedol. Yn drydydd, rhaid inni sicrhau bod cydbwysedd gofodol yn parhau i fod yn flaenoriaeth, yn bennaf wrth gau'r bwlch rhwng gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd a gweddill Cymru.

Yr allwedd i'r strategaeth, yn dilyn y papur ymgynghorol, fydd gweithredu ein polisiau yn effeithiol. Mae angen inni weithio gyda'n partneriaid i sicrhau y defnyddir y polisiau cywir yn y lle cywir a bod adnoddau yn dilyn anghenion a blaenoriaethau. Noda'r papur y targedau y gallwn yn realistig fesur ein cynnydd yn eu herbyn. Gallai rhai ddadlau eu bod yn rhy uchelgeisiol. Bydd unrhyw beth llai na'r targedau a gynigiau yn ein cyfyngu i waelod y gynghair economaidd. Yn nhrefn amser gallwn farnu ein hunain yn erbyn y targedau hyn.

Nid yw'r papur hwn yn strategaeth derfynol. Fe'i cynlluniwyd i fod yn sail i ddatblygiad strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol i Gymru. Bydd y strategaeth derfynol yn esblygu ar ôl y cyfnod ymgynghori, gyda'r ymatebion a gawn yn sail iddi. Bydd y strategaeth gyflawn yn cynnwys cynllun gweithredu, a fydd yn blaenoriaethu'r polisiau, bydd yn nodi asiantaethau arweiniol, yn ystyried adnoddau ac yn pennu targedau uchelgeisiol ond realistig. Rhaid inni beidio â chaniatáu i ddiffyg uchelgais danseilio ein hymdrechion ar gyfer Cymru. Rhaid inni gydweithio â'n partneriaid i sicrhau y caiff y strategaeth ei derbyn yn gyffredinol a'i hadlewyrchu yn eu cynlluniau hwy eu hunain. Cyhoeddir y strategaeth yn ystod yr haf.

10:15 a.m.

This paper has already been subject to continuous consultation throughout the drafting process. An informal consultative group and a wider virtual group were created to comment on working papers. Officials have already met with the four economic fora to obtain a regional perspective on the issues. We have ensured maximum involvement from the outset and will continue to do so. If a final strategy is to be successful we must have maximum buy-in from organisations and individuals throughout Wales. A 12-week period of active consultation will begin tomorrow and consultation is open to all. The document is on the National Assembly website, together with the addresses to which responses can be sent. Officials will be available to discuss any issues throughout the 12-week period.

As part of the consultation process, I am establishing a 'futurology' group. This will consist of academics, business people and key development agencies to further develop our vision for the future, assess options and, in particular, to advise me on the sectoral and cluster based aspects of the consultation document. The paper puts forward real ideas for improving Welsh economic performance. They are not set in stone. They are as much about stimulating creative thinking among our consultees as suggesting solutions. I am determined that our minds should not be closed to new thinking. Similarly, the paper poses a number of key questions. These will prompt responses, although it is stressed that the questions should by no means be considered limiting.

The publication of the strategy will not be the end of the matter. It will then be the subject of ongoing monitoring and review. If the strategy is to be successful it will require fine-tuning and adaptation to changing circumstances. The proposed economic policy board will have an important role of evaluating the National Assembly's economic development programmes and will assist in proposing changes. Further research

Eisoes, bu'r papur hwn yn destun ymgynghori parhaol drwy gydol y broses ddrafftio. Crëwyd grŵp ymgynghorol anffurfiol a grŵp ymarferol ehangach i roi sylwadau ar bapurau gwaith. Eisoes, mae swyddogion wedi cyfarfod â'r pedwar ffora economaidd i gael persbectif rhanbarthol ar y materion. Sicrhasom y cyfranogiad mwyaf o'r cychwyn cyntaf a pharhawn i wneud hynny. Er mwyn i strategaeth derfynol fod yn llwyddiannus rhaid cael y nifer uchaf posibl o sefydliadau ac unigolion ledled Cymru i ymwneud â hi. Bydd cyfnod o 12 wythnos o ymgynghori gweithgar yn dechrau yfory ac mae'r ymgynghoriad yn agored i bawb. Mae'r ddogfen ar wefan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ynghyd â'r cyfeiriadau y gellir anfon yr ymatebion iddynt. Bydd swyddogion ar gael i drafod unrhyw faterion drwy gydol y cyfnod o 12 wythnos.

Fel rhan o'r broses ymgynghorol, sefydlaf grŵp 'dyfodoleg'. Bydd hyn yn cynnwys academyddion, pobl fusnes ac asiantaethau datblygu allweddol i ddatblygu ymhellach ein gwledigaeth ar gyfer y dyfodol, asesu'r opsiynau ac, yn arbennig, rhoi cyngor imi ar yr elfennau yn y ddogfen ymgynghorol sydd yn ymwneud â sectorau a chlystyrau. Cyflwyno'r papur syniadau gwirioneddol ar gyfer gwella perfformaid economaidd Cymru. Nid ydynt yn derfynol. Eu nod yw ysgogi meddwl yn greadigol ymhlith y rhai yr ymgynghorwn â hwy, yn ogystal ag awgrymu atebion. Yr wyf yn benderfynol na ddylem gau ein meddyliau i ffordd newydd o feddwl. Yn yr un modd, gofynna'r papur nifer o gwestiynau allweddol. Bydd y rhain yn annog ymatebion, er y pwysleisir na ddylid ystyried y cwestiynau yn rhai cyfyngol ar unrhyw gyfrif.

Nid diwedd y mater fydd cyhoeddi'r strategaeth. Bydd yn destun monitro ac adolygu parhaus. Er mwyn i'r strategaeth fod yn llwyddiannus bydd angen ei mireinio a'i haddasu i amgylchiadau sydd yn newid. Bydd gan y bwrdd polisi economaidd arfaethedig rôl bwysig o werthuso rhaglenni datblygu economaidd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a bydd yn helpu i gynnig newidiadau. Mae angen gwneud ymchwil

and improved statistics are also needed to inform effective evaluation.

This consultation paper gives everyone an opportunity to make a positive difference to the future of Wales. It marks the latest stage in the development of a national economic development strategy. It is a strategy of which all of Wales can take ownership. This consultation document represents the start of a journey to the future prosperity of our country. Today is a step down the road, not the end of the road. That journey is made more urgent by Corus's recent decision. Now is not the time to be stalled at the roadside. We must get the process under way. To do anything less would delay the task of improving the quality of life for the people of Wales.

Copies of the document will be available on the internet tomorrow and a printed version will be available from Friday, 16 February.

**Phil Williams:** Plaid Cymru do not reject this document. It has many good features and I recognise several points that we recommended. However, it is incomplete and premature. That is not unreasonable because the Economic Development Committee only saw the proper draft less than a month ago.

I will ask questions under three headings. First is the target. The prime target should always be the number of jobs, not gross domestic product. Therefore, is the jobs target 100,000, as indicated on pages 11 and 39, or 150,000, as indicated on pages 42 and 49? Why have you not divided the total into separate regional targets to ensure that we meet the needs of every part of Wales, whether that be the Heads of the Valleys or Pembrokeshire? Secondly, we need to have more detail about the implementation. You have set out an admirable list of general aspirations. Unfortunately for a consultation document, there are no clear indications of what steps you propose to take and what alternatives you are asking people to choose between.

We need to develop research, and to triple research capacity to meet the UK average. This document does not give any idea of how

pellach a gwella ystadegau hefyd er mwyn llywio gwerthusiad effeithiol.

Rhydd y papur ymgynghorol hwn gyfle i bawb wneud gwahaniaeth cadarnhaol i ddyfodol Cymru. Noda'r cam diweddaraf yn natblygiad strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol. Mae'n strategaeth y gall Cymru gyfan fod yn berchen arni. Mae'r ddogfen ymgynghorol hon megis dechrau taith tuag at ffyniant ein gwlad yn y dyfodol. Mae heddiw yn gam ymlaen ar y ffordd, nid diwedd y ffordd. Mae'r daith hon hyd yn oed yn bwysicach o gofio penderfyniad diweddar Corus. Nid dyma'r amser i oedi wrth ochr y ffordd. Rhaid inni ddechrau ar y broses. Byddai gwneud unrhyw beth yn llai na hyn yn ohirio'r dasg o wella ansawdd bywyd pobl Cymru.

Bydd copïau o'r ddogfen ar gael ar y rhyngwyd yfory a bydd fersiwn argraffedig ar gael o ddydd Gwener, 16 Chwefror.

**Phil Williams:** Ni wrthoda Plaid Cymru y ddogfen hon. Mae ganddi lawer o nodweddion da a gwelaf sawl pwynt a argymhellwyd gennym. Fodd bynnag, mae'n anghyflawn ac yn gynamserol. Nid yw'n hynny'n afresymol oherwydd dim ond llai na mis yn ôl y gwelodd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd y drafft cywir.

Gofynnaf gwestiynau o dan dri phennawd. Yn gyntaf, mae'r targed. Nifer y swyddi ddylai'r prif darged fod bob amser, nid cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth. Felly, ai 100,000 yw'r targed ar gyfer swyddi, fel y nodir ar dudalennau 11 a 39, neu 150,000 fel y nodir ar dudalennau 42 a 49? Pam na ranasoch y cyfanswm yn dargedau rhanbarthol ar wahân er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn diwallu anghenion pob rhan o Gymru, boed hynny ym Mlaenau'r Cymoedd neu Sir Benfro? Yn ail, mae angen inni gael rhagor o fanylion am ei gweithredu. Nodasoch restr benignamp o ddyheadau cyffredinol. Yn anffodus ar gyfer dogfen ymgynghorol, nid oes arwyddion clir o ba gamau y bwriadwch eu cymryd a pha ddewisiadau amgen yr ydych yn gofyn i bobl ddewis rhyngddynt.

Mae angen inni ddatblygu ymchwil, ac i dreblu'r gallu i ymchwilio er mwyn cyrraedd cyfartaledd y DU. Ni rydd y ddogfen hon

that will be done. What precisely are the technology schools that you propose? We need to know. I hesitate to ask what peta/yotta means to you. I know what it means to me, and it is incredibly ambitious. I applaud the commitment to sector selectivity and targeting growth sectors where Wales has an advantage. How will you implement selectivity? How will you redirect higher education? What changes in infrastructure and regional selected assistance are open for consultation? You propose fiscal variation, if it is permitted, six times in the document. Negotiations with the Treasury have been ongoing for over a year. Decisions should have been made before the start of Objective 1. You must be near a conclusion. As this is so crucial to several of the plans, would it not have been wiser to wait for a decision before going to consultation? Are you optimistic, or do you fear the decision and prefer to put forward a prospectus of false hope?

Thirdly, and most serious, is the lack of proper costing. The proposed education and research strategy is essential and admirable, but how much extra will it cost on the budget that we have already approved for the next three years? A major boost in promoting Wales worldwide is essential—as you say—but it will be expensive. An improved public transport system and moving freight from road to rail, are not covered in our present budget. You say on page 38 that Objective 1, 2 and 3 will boost our spending capacity by £200 million a year. However, the comprehensive spending review only gives us an extra £110 million above the Barnett formula. From where we will get the extra money? In that context, why do you insist on giving some figures using the old budgetary method and, yet on the same page, give other figures using the new resource? I have pointed this out. Is it intended to give the impression of an extra £1 billion of resources that do not exist in reality?

Finally, you claim on page 39 that the net cost per job is £17,500. I guess that that is a low figure, even for advantaged areas with

unrhyw syniad o sut y gwneir hynny. Beth yn union yw'r ysgolion technoleg a gynigiwch? Mae angen inni wybod. Oedaf cyn gofyn ichi beth mae peta/yotta yn ei olygu i chi. Gwn beth mae'n ei olygu i mi, ac mae'n eithriadol o uchelgeisiol. Cymeradwyaf yr ymrwymiad i ddetholusrwydd sectorau a thargedu sectorau twf lle y mae gan Gymru fantais. Sut y gweithredwch ddetholusrwydd? Sut yr ailgyfeiriwch addysg uwch? Pa newidiadau mewn isadeiledd a chymorth dethol rhanbarthol sydd yn agored i ymgynghori? Cynigiwch amrywiad cyllidol, os caniateir hynny, chwe gwaith yn y ddogfen. Bu'r negodiadau â'r Trysorlys yn mynd rhagddynt ers dros flwyddyn. Dylid bod wedi gwneud y penderfyniadau cyn dechrau Amcan 1. Rhaid eich bod yn agos at benderfyniad. Gan fod hyn mor holl bwysig i sawl un o'r cynlluniau, oni fyddai wedi bod yn ddoethach aros am benderfyniad cyn ymgynghori? A ydych yn optimistaidd, neu a ofnwch beth fydd y penderfyniad a bod yn well gennych gyflwyno prospectws o obaith ffug?

Yn drydydd, ac yn fwyaf difrifol, mae diffyg prisio cywir. Mae'r strategaeth addysg ac ymchwil a argymhellir yn hanfodol ac yn gymeradwy, ond faint yn fwy o faich y bydd hyn ar y gyllideb a gymeradwywyd eisoes gennym ar gyfer y tair blynedd nesaf? Mae'n hanfodol rhoi hwb mawr i Gymru wrth ei hyrwyddo yn fyd-eang—fel y dywedwch—ond bydd yn gostus. Ni chwmpesir system trafniadaeth gyhoeddus well a symud nwyddau o'r ffyrdd i'r rheilffyrdd yn ein cyllideb bresennol. Dywedwch ar dudalen 38 y bydd Amcan 1, 2 a 3 yn cynyddu ein gallu o ran gwariant £200 miliwn y flwyddyn. Fodd bynnag, dim ond £110 miliwn yn ychwanegol at fformwla Barnett y rhydd yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant inni. O ble y daw'r arian ychwanegol? Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, pam eich bod yn mynnu rhoi rhai ffigurau gan ddefnyddio'r hen ddull cyllidebol ac eto, ar yr un dudalen, rhwch ffigurau eraill gan ddefnyddio'r adnodd newydd? Codais y pwynt hwn. A fwriedir iddo roi'r argraff bod £1 biliwn ychwanegol mewn adnoddau ar gael, ond nad sydd yn bodoli mewn gwirionedd?

Yn olaf, honnwyd ar dudalen 39 mai'r gost net fesul swydd yw £17,500. Tybiaf ei fod yn ffigur isel, hyd yn oed ar gyfer ardaloedd

full infrastructure in place. However, in Objective 1 we require £2.4 billion in total to create 43,500 jobs. That is £55,000 per job. I agree with your comment that these are issues that must be carefully considered. However, do you not agree that while serious contradictions are not reconciled, this document is not ready for consultation?

**Michael German:** As you might say, it depends from where you want to start. The Economic Development Committee has been firmly locked into this process since it began over a year ago, as you know. Since September alone—before I took over this post—the Economic Development Committee has met seven times and has produced 14 papers. All of those papers have been included in this document. At the outset, and before I took up this post, I remember that this was the intention at this stage. In other words, we are not doing something that we said we would do differently. We were always going to issue a document like this. We also accepted—and I remind you of the process that we said we would use—that once it had been put out to consultation, we would bring it back so that it could become the basis of the document against which we could negotiate the next budget round. That is the challenge that we face. This is an ongoing process. It has been going on for over a year. This is the way that we said we would do it. It is not proper for Assembly Members to say now that what we agreed to do originally should have been done differently. That is why I reject the accusation that this is not the way that we wanted to do it.

Secondly, it is not premature because we must influence the decisions that we take on budgetary information. You asked detailed questions. The issue of spatial planning—as you know—is being discussed in this Assembly and that policy will feed through into this document. However, if we were to stand by and do nothing now, we would never be able to put the national economic development strategy, subject to consultation, in place. You must start somewhere. That is what we agreed to do in the Economic

llewyrchus gydag isadeiledd llawn yn ei le. Fodd bynnag, yn Amcan 1 mae angen cyfanswm o £2.4 biliwn i greu 43,500 o swyddi. Mae hynny'n £55,000 fesul swydd. Cytunaf â'ch sylw fod y rhain yn faterion y mae'n rhaid eu hystyried yn ofalus. Fodd bynnag, oni chytunwch tra bod gwrthddywediadau difrifol heb eu cysoni, nad yw'r ddogfen hon yn barod ar gyfer ymgynghoriad?

**Michael German:** Fel y gallech ddweud, mae'n dibynnu o ble yr ydych am ddechrau. Fel y gwyddoch, bu'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ynghlwm wrth y broses hon ers iddi ddechrau ychydig dros flwyddyn yn ôl. Ers mis Medi—cyn imi ymgymryd â'r swydd hon—yr oedd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd wedi cyfarfod saith gwaith ac wedi cynhyrchu 14 o bapurau. Cynhwyswyd pob un o'r papurau hynny yn y ddogfen hon. Ar y cychwyn, a chyn imi ymgymryd â'r swydd hon, cofiaf mai dyma oedd y bwriad ar yr adeg hon. Hynny yw, ni wnawn rywbeth y dywedasom y byddem yn ei wneud yn wahanol. Bu'n fwriad gennym erioed i gyhoeddi dogfen fel hon. Derbyniasom hefyd—ac fe'ch atgoffaf o'r broses y dywedasom y byddem yn ei defnyddio—unwaith y byddai'r broses ymgynghorol wedi dechrau, y byddem yn ei dychwelyd ati fel y gallai fod yn sail i'r ddogfen y gallem negodi'r cylch cyllideb nesaf yn ei herbyn. Dyna'r her a wynebwn. Mae hon yn broses barhaus. Bu'n mynd rhagddi ers dros flwyddyn. Dyma'r ffordd y dywedasom y byddem yn gwneud pethau. Nid yw'n iawn i Aelodau'r Cynulliad ddweud yn awr y dylai'r hyn y cytunasom ei wneud yn wreiddiol fod wedi cael ei wneud yn wahanol. Dyna pam y gwrthodaf y cyhuddiad nad hon yw'r ffordd yr oeddem am wneud pethau.

Yn ail, nid yw'n gynamserol oherwydd rhaid inni ddylanwadu ar y penderfyniadau a wnawn ar wybodaeth gyllidebol. Gofynasoch gwestiynau manwl. Trafodir mater cynllunio gofodol—fel y gwyddoch—yn y Cynulliad hwn a bydd y polisi hwnnw yn treiddio i'r ddogfen hon. Fodd bynnag, pe baem yn sefyll o'r neilltu ac yn gwneud dim yn awr, ni fyddem byth yn gallu rhoi'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol, yn amodol ar ymgynghori, ar waith. Rhaid ichi ddechrau rhywle. Dyna'r hyn y cytunasom ei

Development Committee, and that is what this document does.

wneud yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, a dyna beth a wna'r ddogfen hon.

10:25 a.m.

Of course, changes will be made and views expressed. There are contrary proposals included in it. I refer to the eight key policies on page 18 for driving forward the objectives that are before us. Many of those are already in train and are being discussed as we speak. People are waiting for these answers. We have proposed a contingency package for Corus and it is waiting to be informed by the activities we undertake. The business review strategy goes out to consultation today. The Welsh Development Agency, the Wales Tourist Board, the entrepreneurship action plan and regional selective assistance are all to be informed by this process, and not least, of course, the Objective 1, 2 and 3 programmes. At the beginning, we had a draft form of the national economic development strategy, but we did not have a proper strategy. We started wrongly. If this Assembly could have started in the right place, a proper strategy would have been the starting point. We did not have that luxury, and that is why the Economic Development Committee took the view that it did.

Wrth gwrs, caiff newidiadau eu gwneud a safbwyntiau eu mynegi. Mae cynigion croes ynddi. Cyfeiriaf at yr wyth polisi allweddol ar dudalen 18 ar gyfer hyrwyddo'r amcanion sydd ger ein bron. Mae llawer ohonynt eisoes ar waith ac yn cael eu trafod ar hyn o bryd. Mae pobl yn aros am yr atebion hyn. Cynigiasom becyn wrth gefn i Corus ac mae'n aros i gael ei lywio gan y gweithgareddau yr ymgwymerwn â hwy. Bydd y broses ymgynghorol yn dechrau heddiw ar y strategaeth adolygu busnes. Caiff Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, Bwrdd Croeso Cymru, y cynllun gweithredu entrepreneuriaeth a chymorth dethol rhanbarthol oll eu llywio gan y broses hon, ac nid lleiaf, wrth gwrs, raglenni Amcan 1, 2 a 3. Ar y dechrau, yr oedd gennym ffurf ddrafft ar y strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol, ond nid oedd strategaeth gywir gennym. Dechreuasom yn anghywir. Pe gallai'r Cynulliad hwn fod wedi dechrau yn y lle cywir, byddai strategaeth gywir wedi bod yn fan cychwyn. Nid oedd y cyfle hwnnw ar gael inni, a dyna pam yr arddelodd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd y farn a wnaeth.

**Ron Davies:** You know of my serious reservations. At the heart of those reservations is the fact that the targets that have been set and the action that is being proposed do not match. There is nothing wrong with ambition, but it must sometimes be tempered with realism. The balance is wrong. You are proposing that we start from a historically low point in terms of the Welsh economy in relation to the rest of the UK. You set a target of achieving a historically high point. That means that for the next 10 years, we will need to have a rate of economic growth unsurpassed in Welsh history. However, you have not identified the mechanisms or the costs involved. You acknowledged this morning that the document will require substantial rewriting. Will you give an assurance that when that document is rewritten, you will address both of those deficiencies?

**Ron Davies:** Gwyddoch am fy amheuon mawr. Mae'r ffaith nad yw'r targedau a bennwyd a'r camau a gymerir yn cyfateb â'i gilydd wrth wraidd yr amheuon hynny. Nid oes dim o'i le ag uchelgais, ond rhaid ei leddfu â realaeth. Mae'r cydbwysedd yn anghywir. Cynigiwch ein bod yn dechrau o bwynt isel yn hanesyddol yn nhermau economi Cymru mewn perthynas â gweddill y DU. Pennir targed gennych o gyrraedd pwynt uchel yn hanesyddol. Golyga hynny y bydd angen inni gael cyfradd dwf economaidd ddigyffelyb yn hanes Cymru am y 10 mlynedd nesaf. Fodd bynnag, ni nodwyd y dulliau na'r costau dan sylw gennych. Cydnabuoch y bore yma y bydd angen ailysgrifennu'r ddogfen i raddau helaeth. A sicrhewch pan gaiff y ddogfen ei hailysgrifennu yr ymdriniwch â'r ddau ddiffyg hwn?

**Michael German:** I do not accept your second comment. On the first issue, ambitious targets linked to the actual implementation is the next step. The priorities will drive the resources, which will drive the targets that we set our agencies, the targets that we set in Objective 1 and the targets that we set for our budgets. That is the right way to go about this and that is what we agreed at the beginning. When the document comes back, those targets must be in place. I give you that assurance. However, to say that this document is supposed to be conclusive is incorrect. This document must express an ambitious vision for Wales. I do not want Wales to remain poorer than Yorkshire, Humberside and the north-west of England. Those who say that the targets should be reduced are encouraging that. The document expresses ambition.

**Alun Cairns:** This was the Minister's opportunity to shed his new title of 'minister for the dole'. Unfortunately, there is nothing new in this document. The principal purpose of this paper is to close the economic prosperity gap between Wales and the rest of the United Kingdom. Ambitious targets have been set without any form of policy detail. The Welsh Conservative Party does not want Wales to remain in its current economic situation. However, if we are to move forward, we need policies to put out to consultation to gain views. How does the Minister propose to double the current growth rate without any policies? If he denies the lack of policies, what new proposals are included in the document to double the rate of growth predicted by any of the independent forecasters? In your answer to Phil Williams, you mentioned that on page 18 there was a list of eight new economic policies. I have page 18 of the document before me and I cannot see one new policy.

You say that it is not a final strategy. Those are the only correct words that you have spoken. It is not a strategy. The budget priorities have been fixed for the next two and three years. How do you expect to make

**Michael German:** Ni dderbyniaf eich ail sylw. O ran y mater cyntaf, y cam nesaf yw cael targedau uchelgeisiol sydd yn gysylltiedig â'r camau gwirioneddol a gymerir. Bydd y blaenoriaethau yn hyrwyddo'r adnoddau, a fydd yn hyrwyddo'r targedau a benasom ar gyfer ein hasiantaethau, sef y targedau a benasom yn Amcan 1 a'r targedau a bennwn ar gyfer ein cyllidebau. Dyna'r ffordd gywir o wneud pethau a dyna beth a gytunasom ar y dechrau. Pan ddaw'r ddogfen yn ôl, rhaid i'r targedau hynny fod yn eu lle. Rhoddaf y sicrwydd hynny i chi. Fodd bynnag, mae'n anghywir dweud bod y ddogfen hon i fod yn un derfynol. Rhaid i'r ddogfen fynegi gweledigaeth uchelgeisiol i Gymru. Nid wyf am i Gymru barhau i fod yn dlotach na Swydd Efrog, Humberside a gogledd-orllewin Lloegr. Anogir hyn gan y rheini sydd yn dweud y dylid lleihau'r targedau hynny. Mynega'r ddogfen uchelgais.

**Alun Cairns:** Dyma gyfle'r Gweinidog i ddiosg ei deitl newydd sef 'gweinidog dros y dôl'. Yn anffodus, nid oes unrhyw beth newydd yn y ddogfen hon. Prif bwrpas y papur hwn yw cau'r bwloch ffyniant economaidd rhwng Cymru a gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig. Pennwyd targedau uchelgeisiol heb unrhyw fath o sylw at fanylion polisi. Nid yw Plaid Geidwadol Cymru am barhau yn ei sefyllfa economaidd gyfredol. Fodd bynnag, er mwyn symud ymlaen, mae angen polisiau arnom i'w cynnig mewn ymgynghoriad er mwyn cael safbwyntiau. Sut mae'r Gweinidog yn bwriadu dyblu'r gyfradd dwf gyfredol heb unrhyw bolisiau? Os gwada'r diffyg polisiau, pa gynigion newydd a gynhwysir yn y ddogfen i ddyblu'r gyfradd dwf a ragwelir gan unrhyw un o'r rhagolygwyr annibynnol? Yn eich ateb i Phil Williams, soniasoch fod rhestr o wyth polisi economaidd newydd ar dudalen 18. Mae tudalen 18 o'r ddogfen gennyf o'm blaen ac ni allaf weld un polisi newydd.

Dywedwch nad hon yw'r strategaeth derfynol. Dyna'r unig eiriau cywir a lefarwyd gennych. Nid yw'n strategaeth. Pennwyd blaenoriaethau'r gyllideb am y ddwy a'r tair blynedd nesaf. Sut y disgwyliwch wneud

a bid to the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities at the end of the consultation when the budgets have been fixed for the foreseeable future? I assume that when you ran for election to the National Assembly and for nomination to the Cabinet with the First Minister, that you would have proposed some specific policies at that time. I am sure that you would have proposed specific policies to the electorate in your personal manifesto as well as being the leader of the Liberal Democrats—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This statement is not about Michael German's political career, however interesting that may be. I ask you to address the national economic development strategy.

**Alun Cairns:** What were the specific policies within your manifesto? You are now at the helm, Deputy First Minister. The Assembly and the people of Wales expect economic leadership on your policy promises and commitments. In your statement and the document, diversifying the economic base is mentioned. Yet, at the same time, clustering is stated to be the answer. Clustering and diversification are mutually exclusive. Clustering focuses activity but you talk about diversifying in the same breath. Which clusters do you intend to support and how do you plan to support them? That information is not included in the document. All that is included is a list of the potential clusters that could be supported.

The statement lists the problems of the Welsh economy: not enough people have jobs and there are insufficient highly-paid, high-quality jobs. After 17 meetings and 14 documents, that is hardly an effective analysis and critique of the Welsh economy. You talk about the widespread consultation that has fed into the paper. Why, therefore, did you deny and reject the Economic Development Committee's view that releasing the document would be premature and that it was inadequate in its current form? The reality of the situation is that no leadership is being shown. This is full of bland statements and analogies such as we are driving down a road and now is not the time to stop in a lay-by. The people of Wales

cynnig i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau ar ddiwedd y cyfnod ymgynghori pan fydd y cyllidebau wedi eu pennu hyd y gellir rhagweld? Cymeraf yn ganiataol pan oeddech yn sefyll yn etholiadau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a phan gawsoch eich enwebu i'r Cabinet gyda'r Prif Weinidog, y byddech wedi cynnig rhai polisiau penodol bryd hynny. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddech wedi cynnig polisiau penodol i'r etholwyr yn eich maniffesto personol yn ogystal â bod yn arweinydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid datganiad am yrfa wleidyddol Michael German yw hyn, er mor ddiddorol y gallai hynny fod. Gofynnaf ichi ymdrin â'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol.

**Alun Cairns:** Beth oedd y polisiau penodol yn eich maniffesto? Chi sydd wrth y llyw yn awr, Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog. Disgwylia'r Cynulliad a phobl Cymru arweinyddiaeth economaidd ar eich addewidion a'ch ymrwymadau polisi. Yn eich datganiad a'r ddogfen, sonnir am arallgyfeirio'r sail economaidd. Ac eto, ar yr un pryd, nodir mai clystyru yw'r ateb. Nid yw clystyru ac arallgyfeirio yn cyd-fynd. Mae clystyru yn canolbwyntio ar weithgaredd ond soniwrch am arallgyfeirio ar yr un pryd. Pa glystyrau y bwriadwch eu cefnogi a sut y bwriadwch eu cefnogi? Nid yw'r wybodaeth honno yn y ddogfen. Y cyfan sydd ynddi yw rhestr o'r clystyrau posibl y gellid eu cefnogi.

Rhestra'r datganiad broblemau economi Cymru: nid oes gan ddigon o bobl swyddi ac nid oes digon o swyddi â chyflogau uchel, a swyddi da. Ar ôl 17 o gyfarfodydd ac 14 o ddogfennau, prin bod hynny'n ddadansoddiad ac yn feirniadaeth effeithiol ar economi Cymru. Soniwrch am yr ymgynghori eang a gyfrannodd at y papur. Pam felly ichi wadu a gwrthod barn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd y byddai rhyddhau'r ddogfen yn gynamserol a'i bod yn annigonol ar ei ffurf gyfredol? Y gwir amdani yw na ddangosir unrhyw arweinyddiaeth. Mae'n llawn datganiadau a chyfatebiaethau neis-neis megis ein bod yn gyrru i lawr ffordd ac nid dyma'r adeg i aros mewn cilfach barcio. Mae angen



need leadership, definite policy proposals, and targets and the resources to support them.

**Michael German:** When I hear Alun Cairns making up the Economic Development Committee's resolutions, I know that I am on to a winner. You know what the Committee's resolution was—and the record will show it—because you moved it and Ron Davies seconded it. However, it was not what you said it was. I want to make it clear that what you have just said was not the Economic Development Committee's view.

**Ron Davies:** Point of order.

**The Presiding Officer:** I will take points of order immediately after this statement.

**Michael German:** I have read the Conservative manifesto and I was surprised to find that it had no concrete policies. That was its problem. I refer to page 18 of the national economic development strategy. This copy may be numbered differently to yours, so I will read it to you, Alun, so that you understand what the drivers of the strategy include. They include a new strategic clusters programme, a business birth rate strategy, an enhanced export strategy—

**Nick Bourne:** It is not on page 18.

**Michael German:** Turn the page, then. They include re-skilling, entrepreneurship education and developments in the schools curriculum, higher and further education innovation linked to business development and—

**Nick Bourne:** Point of order.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I will take points of order relating to this statement afterwards.

**Nick Bourne:** There is no point in doing this if it is not on page 18.

**Michael German:** You may have a differently numbered copy. That is what I

arweinyddiaeth ar bobl Cymru, cynigion polisi penodol, a thargedau a'r adnoddau i'w cynnal.

**Michael German:** Pan glywaf Alun Cairns yn ffugio penderfyniadau'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, gwn fy mod yn drech nag ef. Gwyddoch beth oedd penderfyniad y Pwyllgor—a bydd y cofnod yn dangos hynny—oherwydd cynigiasoch ef ac eiliodd Ron Davies ef. Fodd bynnag, nid oedd yr hyn a ddywedasoch. Yr wyf am egluro nad barn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yw'r hyn yr ydych newydd ei ddweud.

**Ron Davies:** Pwynt o drefn.

**Y Llywydd:** Cymeraf bwyntiau o drefn yn union wedi'r datganiad hwn.

**Michael German:** Darllenais faniffesto'r Ceidwadwyr a synnais weld nad oedd unrhyw bolisiau cadarn ynddo. Dyna oedd ei broblem. Cyfeiriaf at dudalen 18 o'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol. Efallai bod y copi hwn wedi ei rifo'n wahanol i'ch copi chi, felly fe ddarllenaf ef i chi, Alun, er mwyn ichi ddeall beth a gynhwysir yn ffactorau hyrwyddo'r strategaeth. Maent yn cynnwys rhaglen glwstwr strategol newydd, strategaeth cyfradd geni busnesau, gwell strategaeth allforio—

**Nick Bourne:** Nid yw ar dudalen 18.

**Michael German:** Trowch y dudalen felly. Maent yn cynnwys ailddysgu sgiliau, addysg entrepreneuriaeth a datblygiadau yng nghwricwlwm ysgolion, arloesi ym myd addysg uwch ac addysg bellach mewn cysylltiad â datblygu busnes a—

**Nick Bourne:** Pwynt o drefn.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Cymeraf bwyntiau o drefn sydd yn ymwneud â'r datganiad hwn wedyn.

**Nick Bourne:** Nid oes diben gwneud hynny os nad yw ar dudalen 18.

**Michael German:** Efallai bod gennych gopi wedi ei rifo'n wahanol. Dyna beth yr wyf

have just told you. If you print the copy on the intranet, you will find the strategy's key drivers on page 18. Your copy may be numbered differently because of the way it is laid out. However, I am sure that you will be able to find them. If not, I will continue to read the last three points, as they are important. They are: a community development programme; a refocused inward investment programme; for which there is already an extra £1 million in the budget, and strengthened public/private partnership—

**Alun Cairns:** How?

**Michael German:** I am telling you how. As you know, proposals on public/private partnership are now in the hands of the private sector and I await its response on how it proposes to spend the money that is on the table.

**Alun Cairns:** How?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I have already indicated that this is a statement and that I expect questions and an opportunity for the Minister to answer them.

**John Griffiths:** I agree with the priority the strategy gives to spatial balance and closing the gap between west Wales and the Valleys and the rest of Wales. We must look after the areas in greatest need. However, do you agree that there must be room for flexibility and recognition of economic reality? Flexibility is needed, for example, given the great pace of economic change as demonstrated by the current steel crisis and its impact on Llanwern in Newport. It is also needed to recognise the economic reality.

10:35 a.m.

For example, Newport is the centre of a local economy that extends far beyond the borough's boundary and, crucially, deep into the surrounding Gwent valley. I could give many examples. Llanwern is an obvious one, as many people from the surrounding Valleys have worked and still work there. The

newydd ei ddweud wrthyich. Os argraffwch y copi ar y fewnrwyd, fe welwch ffactorau hyrwyddo allweddol y strategaeth ar dudalen 18. Efallai bod eich copi wedi ei rifo'n wahanol oherwydd y ffordd y cafodd ei gynllunio. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siŵr y gallwch ddod o hyd iddynt. Os na allwch, af ymlaen i ddarllen y tri phwynt olaf, gan eu bod yn bwysig, sef: rhaglen datblygu cymunedau; rhaglen fewnfuddsoddi wedi ei hailffocysu; y mae £1 filiwn ychwanegol eisoes ar gael yn y gyllideb ar ei chyfer, a phartneriaeth cyhoeddus/preifat wedi ei chryfhau—

**Alun Cairns:** Sut?

**Michael German:** Yr wyf yn dweud sut. Fel y gwyddoch, mae cynigion ar bartneriaeth cyhoeddus/preifat bellach yn nwylo'r sector preifat ac arhosaf am ei ymateb ar sut y bwriada wario'r arian sydd ar gael.

**Alun Cairns:** Sut?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Eisoes nodais mai datganiad yw hwn ac fy mod yn disgwyl cwestiynau a chyfle i'r Gweinidog eu hateb.

**John Griffiths:** Cytunaf â'r flaenoriaeth a rydd y strategaeth i gydbwysedd gofodol a chau'r bwlch rhwng gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd a gweddill Cymru. Rhaid inni ofalu am yr ardaloedd sydd â'r angen mwyaf. Fodd bynnag, oni chytunwch fod yn rhaid sicrhau lle ar gyfer hyblygrwydd a chydabod realiti economaidd? Mae angen hyblygrwydd, er enghraifft, o gofio pa mor gyflym y mae pethau'n newid yn economaidd fel y dangosodd yr argyfwng dur presennol a'i effaith ar Lanwern yng Nghasnewydd. Mae ei angen hefyd er mwyn cydnabod y realiti economaidd.

Er enghraifft, Casnewydd yw canolfan economi leol sydd yn ymestyn ymhell y tu hwnt i ffin y fwrdeistref ac, yn holl bwysig, yn ddwfn i gwm cyfagos Gwent. Gallwn roi sawl enghraifft. Mae Llanwern yn un amlwg, gan fod llawer o'r bobl o'r Cymoedd cyfagos wedi gweithio yno ac yn parhau i weithio

Hyundai Microelectronics Wales Limited factory is another example, where a large proportion of the workforce is drawn from the Valleys area. A further example is a factory that produces crisps on the outskirts of Newport where, amazingly, hardly any Newport residents work. The workforce is almost all drawn from the Valleys. That is the economic reality of Newport. It is a centre for economic activity for the surrounding area, which covers many Objective 1 areas. That reality should be recognised, and some flexibility should be shown in taking this strategy forward, especially given recent events.

**Michael German:** The Environment, Planning and Transport Committee is currently considering spatial policy. We must recognise that certain events will happen in certain parts of Wales. The travel-to-work area is a much more important measure of where people find jobs than strict geographical boundaries. In terms of Corus, one of the first challenges that we have set the Employment Service is to find out where the workers are employed and where they live. That information must be matched together.

Flexibility is a key part of this document. In fact, a debate will be held later in today's Plenary on a report by the Economic Development Committee, which includes a proposal to create an economic policy board. Once this strategy is up and running, it will have to be reviewed annually and continually monitored and evaluated. It will be shaped and changed as it moves forward. The document will not sit on a shelf for the next 10 years. It must be shaped in the light of circumstances. We need flexibility to be able to build in the necessary responses to circumstances that we hope will not occur, but which we dread might do so.

**Glyn Davies:** The Minister made many references to transportation in his statement, saying that we are on, or one step down the road to prosperity. Do you share the concern of the majority of the Economic Development Committee members, including

yno. Mae ffatri Hyundai Microelectronics Wales Limited yn enghraifft arall, lle y daw cyfran fawr o'r gweithlu o ardal y Cymoedd. Enghraifft arall yw ffatri sydd yn cynhyrchu creision ar gyrion Casnewydd lle, er mawr ryfeddod, nid oes braidd neb o drigolion Casnewydd yn gweithio yno. Daw'r gweithlu bron yn gyfan gwbl o'r Cymoedd. Dyna realiti economaidd Casnewydd. Mae'n ganolfan ar gyfer gweithgaredd economaidd i'r ardal gyfagos, sydd yn cwmpasu llawer o ardaloedd Amcan 1. Dylid cydnabod y realiti hwnnw, a dylid dangos rhywfaint o hyblygrwydd wrth ddatblygu'r strategaeth hon, yn enwedig o gofio'r digwyddiadau diweddar.

**Michael German:** Mae Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth wrthi ar hyn o bryd yn ystyried polisi gofodol. Rhaid inni gydnabod y bydd digwyddiadau penodol yn digwydd mewn rhannau penodol o Gymru. Mae'r ardal deithio i'r gwaith yn fesur llawer pwysicach o ble y daw pobl o hyd i swyddi na ffiniau daearyddol caeth. O ran Corus, un o'r heriau cyntaf a bennwyd gennym ar gyfer y Gwasanaeth Cyflogi oedd darganfod ble y cyflogir y gweithwyr a ble y maent yn byw. Rhaid cyfuno'r wybodaeth honno.

Mae hyblygrwydd yn rhan allweddol o'r ddogfen hon. Mewn gwirionedd, cynhelir dadl yn ddiweddarach yn y Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw ar adroddiad gan y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, sydd yn cynnwys cynnig i greu bwrdd polisi economaidd. Unwaith y bydd y strategaeth yn weithredol, bydd yn rhaid ei hadolygu'n flynyddol a'i monitro a'i gwerthuso'n barhaol. Caiff ei llunio a'i newid wrth iddi ddatblygu. Ni fydd y ddogfen yn eistedd ar silff am y 10 mlynedd nesaf. Rhaid ei llunio yng ngoleuni amgylchiadau. Mae angen hyblygrwydd arnom i allu cynnwys yr ymatebion angenrheidiol i amgylchiadau na fydd yn digwydd gobeithio, ond yr ofnwn a allai ddigwydd.

**Glyn Davies:** Gwnaeth y Gweinidog sawl cyfeiraid at drafnidiaeth yn ei ddatganiad, gan ddweud ein bod ar y ffordd, neu un cam ar hyd y ffordd, i ffyniant. A rannwch bryder y mwyafrif o aelodau'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, gan gynnwys fi fy hun, eich

myself, that, to some extent, you are going nowhere? As the First Minister would say, you seem to be going around in circles like a two-legged truck.

Many Members have commented that the document is well-written. I accept that. It is an outstanding diagnosis of our situation. However, at this stage, a diagnosis is not enough. The document does not tell us what the Minister thinks we should do. He, as the Minister, should tell us that.

There is concern that the targets may be unrealistic and, as well as taking a huge number of jobs from Wales, Corus's announcement is likely to cause a significant reduction in Wales's gross domestic product per capita. That makes the targets even more ambitious. Do you not agree that it is wrong to publish a document for consultation when it sets targets that are so highly ambitious? It is questionable whether they are achievable, without giving any indication what you, as Minister, think we should do and from where you think the resources to achieve the targets should come?

**Michael German:** I recognise that you are a new member of the Economic Development Committee. This again involves the issue of where we started from and where we propose to be. I listed many of the policies in my statement and explained how each policy would be implemented. I also draw your attention to chapter four of the strategy, 'Policy Priorities'. We have the shape and structure to move this strategy forward. The strategy must reflect current circumstances, and John Griffiths's comment was appropriate. We would be foolish if we thought that this document would guide us and do everything without us having to shape it as we move it forward. However, if we delay and hang back and wait until everything else is in place, the Assembly will not achieve anything, because it will not have taken this document any further down the road. The document contains key challenges, priorities and actions to be taken. It is disingenuous to think that the document does not include them.

bod, i ryw raddau, yn mynd i unlle? Fel y dywed y Prif Weinidog, ymddengys eich bod yn mynd o amgylch mewn cylchoedd fel tryc â dwy goes.

Mae sawl Aelod wedi sôn bod y ddogfen wedi ei hysgrifennu'n dda. Derbyniaf hynny. Mae'n ddadansoddiad rhagorol o'n sefyllfa. Fodd bynnag, ar yr adeg hon, nid yw dadansoddi yn ddigon. Ni ddywed y ddogfen wrthym beth y dylem ei wneud ym marn y Gweinidog. Dylai ef, fel y Gweinidog, ddweud hynny wrthym.

Mae pryder y gallai'r targedau fod yn afrealistig ac, yn ogystal â chymryd nifer fawr iawn o swyddi o Gymru, mae cyhoeddiad Corus yn debygol o achosi gostyngiad sylweddol yng nghynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen yng Nghymru. Gwna hynny'r targedau hyd yn oed yn fwy uchelgeisiol. Oni chytunwch na ddylid cyhoeddi dogfen ar gyfer ymgynghori sydd yn pennu targedau sydd mor uchelgeisiol? Gellid dadlau a ydynt yn gyflawnadwy o gwbl, heb roi unrhyw awgrym beth y credwch chi, fel y Gweinidog, y dylem ei wneud ac o ble y credwch y dylai'r adnoddau ddod i gyflawni'r targedau?

**Michael German:** Yr wyf yn cydnabod eich bod yn aelod newydd o'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Unwaith eto mae hyn yn ymwneud â'r mater o ble y dechreuasom a ble y bwriadwn gyrraedd. Rhestrais lawer o'r polisiau yn fy natganiad gan egluro sut y câi pob polisi ei weithredu. Tynnaf eich sylw hefyd at bennod pedwar o'r strategaeth, 'Blaenoriaethau Polisi'. Mae'r ffurf a'r strwythur gennym i ddatblygu'r strategaeth hon. Rhaid i'r strategaeth adlewyrchu amgylchiadau cyfredol, ac yr oedd sylw John Griffiths yn briodol. Byddem yn ffôl pe credwn y byddai'r ddogfen hon yn ein tywys ac yn gwneud popeth heb inni orfod ei llunio wrth inni symud ymlaen. Fodd bynnag, os oedwn ac aros nes bod popeth yn ei le, ni fydd y Cynulliad yn cyflawni unrhyw beth oherwydd ni fydd wedi cymryd y ddogfen hon ymhellach i lawr y ffordd. Mae'r ddogfen yn cynnwys heriau allweddol, blaenoriaethau a'r camau i'w cymryd. Mae'n ffuantus meddwl nad yw'r ddogfen yn eu cynnwys.

**Val Feld:** I welcome this document as work in progress. We have been working on this, as you said, for the last 18 months. We had to set it to one side in the Economic Development Committee because of the need to address European funding. Do you agree that there has been considerable input from the Committee—probably from all its members—into the strategy’s development? As a result, it has changed substantially. We now relate areas such as economic activity, transport, sustainable development and health to economic development, which have not been addressed in previous strategies. That is important. Do you also agree that it is fundamental to this strategy’s effectiveness that the partners who must deliver our economic programmes are engaged in it early on? We have a great deal to learn from them about what is working and what is not working on the ground. If they are engaged in it now, it will help us to ensure that we can deliver on our end result. I agree with your comments about the particular urgency because of the problems in the steel industry. What is your view about what people, particularly in those communities and areas of which John has just spoken, and in the other poorer parts of Wales, would think if we as an Assembly were to say that our best offer and our best hope was that in 10 years’ time we would be more than 10 per cent below a GDP average for the whole of the UK? We would not even be able to achieve, still being 10 per cent behind the rest of the UK in 10 years’ time. What are your views on what people would think about us if that was our position?

**Michael German:** You are right about the Committee’s input. During the last year, all members of the Committee—from all sides and all parties—have input comments, some more considerable than others. There are views as to how this should be structured, which are different from the view with which we started out. That is a part of politics. This is substantially a new document. It has not previously existed in this form and there has not been a document of this type before. It contains new, existing and some refocused policies. Above all, people are waiting for this to shape their work. When it comes back, will we let these people down by saying that we do not have a strategic policy for Wales

**Val Feld:** Croesawaf y ddogfen hon fel gwaith ar droed. Buom yn gweithio ar hyn, fel y dywedaso, ers 18 mis. Bu’n rhaid inni ei rhoi o’r neilltu yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd am fod angen ymdrin ag arian Ewrop. A gytunwch y bu cryn fewnbwn gan y Pwyllgor—siŵr o fod gan bob un o’i aelodau—i ddatblygiad y strategaeth? O ganlyniad, mae wedi newid yn sylweddol. Bellach cysylltw’n feysydd megis gweithgaredd economaidd, trafniadaeth, datblygu cynaliadwy a iechyd â datblygiad economaidd, nad ymdriniwyd â hwy mewn strategaethau blaenorol. Mae hynny’n bwysig. A gytunwch hefyd ei fod yn sylfaenol i effeithiolrwydd y strategaeth hon fod y partneriaid sydd yn gorfod cyflwyno ein rhaglenni economaidd yn gysylltiedig â hi o’r cychwyn cyntaf? Mae gennym lawer i’w ddydsu oddi wrthynt ynglŷn â’r hyn sydd yn gweithio a’r hyn nad yw’n gweithio ar lawr gwlad. Os ydynt yn gysylltiedig â hi yn awr, bydd yn ein helpu i sicrhau y gallwn gyflwyno’r canlyniad terfynol. Cytunaf â’ch sylwadau am y brys arbennig oherwydd y problemau yn y diwydiant dur. Beth, yn eich barn chi, y byddai pobl, yn arbennig yn y cymunedau hynny a’r ardaloedd y soniodd John amdanynt, yn ei feddwl pe baem ni fel Cynulliad yn dweud mai ein cynnig gorau a’n gobaith gorau oedd y byddem mewn 10 mlynedd fwy na 10 y cant yn is na chyfartaledd CMC ar gyfer y DU gyfan? Ni fyddem hyd yn oed yn gallu cyflawni, a byddem yn parhau i fod 10 y cant y tu ôl i weddill y DU mewn 10 mlynedd? Beth y byddai pobl yn ei feddwl amdanom, yn eich barn chi, os mai dyna oedd ein safbwynt?

**Michael German:** Yr ydych yn iawn ynglŷn â mewnbwn y Pwyllgor. Yn ystod y llynedd, mae pob aelod o’r Pwyllgor—o bob ochr a phob plaid—wedi cynnig sylwadau, rhai yn fwy sylweddol nag eraill. Ceir safbwyntiau ynglŷn â sut y dylid strwythuro hyn, sydd yn wahanol i’r farn a oedd gennym ar y cychwyn. Mae hynny’n rhan o wleidyddiaeth. Mae hon yn ddogfen newydd yn y bôn. Nid yw wedi bodoli o’r blaen ar y ffurf hon ac ni fu dogfen o’r math hwn o’r blaen. Mae’n cynnwys polisiâu newydd, rhai presennol a rhai â ffocws newydd. Yn anad dim, mae pobl yn aros i hyn lunio eu gwaith. Pan ddaw yn ôl, a wnawn ni siomi’r bobl hyn drwy ddweud nad oes gennym bolisi strategol

against which everything can be shaped? Will we say that we should park this in a siding? Are we saying that maybe we should leave it? Of course we will not. We cannot let the people of Wales down. We cannot leave them waiting. We must move this along and make progress. If there is anything to be said, maybe it should be that we have already spent too long discussing it.

**Christine Chapman:** I have a particular question on Objective 1. As Chair of the Objective 1 Programme Monitoring Committee, I am keen to see Wales benefit from this strategy. It is important that we link the Objective 1 programme with this overarching national economic development strategy so that we can make structural changes to the Welsh economy, rather than cosmetic ones. In the recent Objective 1 Programme Monitoring Committee meetings, we demonstrated that we are working to the recommendations of the task and finish report. Members are keen to lead from the front on Objective 1 and we want to work cohesively with the strategy's principles. We are anxious that the strategy is up and running as quickly as possible. We also want to work with the Assembly to produce the best result. Do you agree that, despite the reservations expressed in the Economic Development Committee last week—and I am pleased to learn from Phil Williams's comments that Plaid Cymru is seeing sense and does not want to reject this document—this document represents a plan for the revival of the Welsh economy to be run alongside our Objective 1 programme and will now have flesh on the bones by this consultation? Wales's economy needs this strategy. Our partners and consultees will work with us to deliver it, so they must have a role in shaping it. I agree with Val's comments. Devolution is not just about politicians being part of a strategy. A period of consultation is the right way forward. Will you also confirm that the Objective 1 Programme Monitoring Committee will be included on the list of consultees?

i Gymru y gellir llunio popeth yn ei erbyn? A ddywedwn y dylwn ei barcio mewn seidin? A ddywedwn y dylem efallai ei adael ef? Wrth gwrs na wnawn. Ni allwn siomi pobl Cymru. Ni allwn eu gadael i aros. Rhaid inni symud hyn yn ei flaen a gwneud cynnydd. Os dywedwn unrhyw beth, efallai y dylwn ddweud ein bod eisoes wedi treulio gormod o amser yn ei drafod.

**Christine Chapman:** Mae gennyf gwestiwn penodol i'w ofyn ynglŷn ag Amcan 1. Fel Cadeirydd Pwyllgor Monitro Rhaglenni Amcan 1, yr wyf yn awyddus i weld Cymru yn elwa ar y strategaeth hon. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cysylltu'r rhaglen Amcan 1 gyda'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol drosfwaol, fel y gallwn wneud newidiadau strwythurol i economi Cymru, yn hytrach na rhai cosmetig. Yng nghyfarfodydd diweddar Pwyllgor Monitro Rhaglenni Amcan 1, dangosasom ein bod yn gweithio i argymhellion yr adroddiad gorchwyl a gorfffen. Mae'r Aelodau yn awyddus i arwain o'r blaen ar Amcan 1 ac yr ydym am weithio'n gydlynol gydag egwyddorion y strategaeth. Yr ydym yn awyddus i weld y strategaeth yn gweithredu cyn gynted â phosibl. Yr ydym hefyd am weithio gyda'r Cynulliad i gynhyrchu'r canlyniad gorau. A gytunwch, er gwaethaf yr amheuan a fynegwyd yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yr wythnos diwethaf—ac yr wyf yn falch o nodi, o sylwadau Phil Williams, fod Plaid Cymru yn callio ac nad yw am wrthod y ddogfen hon—fod y ddogfen yn cynrychioli cynllun i adfywio economi Cymru i gydredeg â'n rhaglen Amcan 1 ac y bydd ganddi gnawd ar yr esgyrn erbyn diwedd y cyfnod ymgynghori hwn? Mae angen y strategaeth hon ar economi Cymru. Bydd ein partneriaid a'r rhai yr ymgynghorwn â hwy yn cydweithio â ni i'w chyflwyno, felly rhaid iddynt gael rhan yn y gwaith o'i llunio. Cytunaf â sylwadau Val. Nid yw datganoli'n golygu bod gwleidyddion yn rhan o strategaeth yn unig. Cyfnod o ymgynghori yw'r ffordd orau ymlaen. A gadarnhewch hefyd y caiff Pwyllgor Monitro Rhaglen Amcan 1 ei gynnwys ar y rhestr ymgynghori?

10:45 a.m.

**Michael German:** I am pleased to assure you that members of the Objective 1 Programme Monitoring Committee, and the other monitoring committees, currently being established, will also be involved in that consultation. Interestingly enough, one of the key areas of Objective 1 development has been the establishment of a policy group to oversee the strategic changes being made by the intervention of Objective 1 money in Wales. It is waiting to be informed by the Assembly's strategic view for Wales because the policy group's strategic decisions are informed by this document. If we hold that process back, then we will continue to move haphazardly around general and vague statements.

This document offers a group of people, who represent the widest possible partnership of all the sectors and bodies in Wales—local authorities, voluntary and private sectors—something on which to hang their decisions. The sooner we complete it, and start to move on it, the sooner we can inform that policy group, and the sooner it can inform the process of how we spend Objective 1 money.

I am glad that, at the last Economic Development Committee, Plaid Cymru agreed that the right way to proceed on this was for it to become a consultee like everyone else and contribute to the consultation process. I hope that all Members of every political persuasion will contribute constructively to establish the content of the document, and will comment on it.

**Nick Bourne:** I had not intended to say anything, but I am concerned by the Minister's supposition that almost any economic strategy is better than no economic strategy. This document outlines growth rates that would rival those of Singapore and Hong Kong at their height. I would welcome that if we could achieve those rates. However, we could only do so through spirit of free enterprise and low levels of bureaucracy and taxation, which does not sit comfortably with the Minister's history and political beliefs. It would have been better to have 'parked this document in the sidings' until we could have agreed on something better. It is significant

**Michael German:** Mae'n bleser gennyf eich sicrhau y bydd aelodau Pwyllgor Monitro Rhaglenni Amcan 1 a'r pwyllgorau monitro eraill, sydd wrthi'n cael eu sefydlu ar hyn o bryd, yn gysylltiedig â'r ymgynghori hwnnw hefyd. Yn ddiddorol ddigon, un o feysydd allweddol datblygu Amcan 1 fu sefydlu grŵp polisi i oruchwylio'r newidiadau strategol a wneir yn sgîl arian Amcan 1 yng Nghymru. Mae'n aros i gael ei lywio gan fwiad strategol y Cynulliad ar gyfer Cymru oherwydd caiff penderfyniadau strategol y grŵp polisi eu llywio gan y ddogfen hon. Os ataliwn y broses honno yna byddwn yn parhau i symud yn ddigyfeiriad o amgylch datganiadau cyffredinol ac annelwig.

Cynigia'r ddogfen hon rywbeth y gall grŵp o bobl, sydd yn cynrychioli'r bartneriaeth ehangach bosibl o'r holl sectorau a chyrrff yng Nghymru—awdurdodau lleol, sectorau gwirfoddol a phreifat—seilio eu penderfyniadau arno. Po gynharaf y cwblhawn y ddogfen, a dechrau ei datblygu, cynharaf yn y byd y gall lywio'r broses o sut y gwariwn arian Amcan 1.

Yr wyf yn falch bod Plaid Cymru, yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd diwethaf, wedi cytuno mai'r ffordd gywir o ddatblygu hyn oedd iddi ddod yn rhan o'r ymgynghori, fel pawb arall, a chyfrannu at y broses ymgynghorol. Gobeithiaf y bydd pob Aelod o bob gogwydd gwleidyddol yn cyfrannu'n adeiladol er mwyn llunio cynnwys y ddogfen, a rhoi eu sylwadau arni.

**Nick Bourne:** Nid oeddwn wedi bwriadu dweud unrhyw beth, ond pryderaf ynglŷn â thybiaeth y Gweinidog fod bron unrhyw strategaeth economaidd yn well na bod heb strategaeth economaidd o gwbl. Amlinella'r ddogfen hon gyfraddau twf a fyddai'n cystadlu â rhai Singapore a Hong Kong ar eu gorau. Byddwn yn croesawu hynny pe gallem gyflawni'r cyfraddau hynny. Fodd bynnag, dim ond drwy ysbryd o fenter rydd a lefelau isel o fiwrocratiaeth a threthiant, nad yw'n gydnaws â hanes a chredoau gwleidyddol y Gweinidog, y gallem wneud hynny. Byddai wedi bod yn well pe baem wedi 'parcio'r ddogfen hon mewn seidin' hyd nes y gallem

that the Economic Development Committee did not want Mike German to proceed with this, whatever he says. That decision was based on a cross-party alliance, but he strongly insisted on continuing with this document. He mentioned earlier that Glyn Davies had only been on the Economic Development Committee for a short time, which is true, but it is also true that the Liberal Democratic leader lacks Glyn's perception and business expertise—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. As I indicated earlier, this statement is not about Mike German's qualities; it is about the national economic development strategy.

**Nick Bourne:** It is just as well for the administration that that is the case, because I suspect that many Labour backbenchers and one or two frontbenchers may feel differently about the statement, if that were so. However, I am concerned that those qualities have permeated the document. The Liberal Democrats have no experience of government, which is reflected in this document that was defeated in Committee. Why are we proceeding with this today?

**Michael German:** I was not being rude about Glyn. I said that given that he had not been present from the beginning of the process, he did not know what we had decided and how the matter should progress. I was not being rude about his qualities, but I could try my best, if you wanted me to. However, I reject the opportunity.

I apologise because I said earlier that the resolution passed by the Economic Development Committee was proposed by Alun Cairns and seconded by Ron Davies. It was the other way around. That resolution did not say that we should not proceed. The Economic Development Committee's view was clear. We should move forward with this document. We cannot wait—

**Alun Cairns** *rose*—

gytuno ar rywbeth gwell. Mae'n arwyddocaol nad oedd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd am i Mike German barhau â hyn, beth bynnag a ddywed. Seiliwyd y penderfyniad hwnnw ar gynghrair trawsbleidiol, ond mynnodd yn gadarn barhau â'r ddogfen hon. Soniodd yn gynharach mai dim ond ers ychydig o amser y bu Glyn Davies ar y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, sydd yn wir, ond mae'n wir hefyd nad yw arweinydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn meddu ar amgyffred ac arbenigedd busnes Glyn—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Fel y soniais yn gynharach, nid datganiad am rinweddau Mike German yw hwn; mae'n ymwneud â'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol.

**Nick Bourne:** Llawn cystal i'r weinyddiaeth mai fel hyn y mae, oherwydd yr wyf yn amau y gallai llawer o'r Aelodau Llafur meinciau cefn ac un neu ddau o Aelodau'r meinciau blaen deimlo'n wahanol ynglŷn â'r datganiad, pe bai hynny'n wir. Fodd bynnag, pryderaf fod y rhinweddau hynny wedi ymdreiddio i'r ddogfen. Nid oes gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol unrhyw brofiad o lywodraethu, ac adlewyrchir hyn yn y ddogfen hon a fu'n aflwyddiannus yn y Pwyllgor. Pam ein bod yn parhau â hyn heddiw?

**Michael German:** Nid oeddwn yn siarad yn anghwrtais am Glyn. Dywedais, o gofio na fu'n bresennol o ddechrau'r broses, na wyddai beth yr oeddem wedi ei benderfynu na sut y dylai'r mater fynd yn ei flaen. Nid bod yn anghwrtais ynglŷn â'i rinweddau yr oeddwn, ond gallwn geisio gwneud fy ngorau, os oeddech yn dymuno imi wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, gwrthodaf y cyfle.

Ymddiheuraf am imi ddweud yn gynharach fod y penderfyniad a basiwyd gan y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd wedi cael ei gynnig gan Alun Cairns a'i eilio gan Ron Davies. Fel arall yr oedd hi. Ni ddywedodd y penderfyniad hwnnw na ddylem fynd yn ein blaenau. Yr oedd barn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn glir. Dylem symud ymlaen gyda'r ddogfen hon. Ni allwn aros—

**Alun Cairns** *a gododd*—



**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I have been notified of a point of order from Ron Davies on this statement. I will call him, if he wishes. I will also call you, if you do not seek to intervene during the final stages of this important statement.

**Michael German:** Clearly, this is a starting point that we cannot delay any longer. If we choose to delay this process, we will put off those people who are waiting for our decisions on this. We are putting those people even further behind and delaying the opportunity to take a strategic view on where Wales must go in the future. I reject the accusation that this document has no policy focus. The majority of its pages contain policy priorities.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Fe'm hysbyswyd am bwynt o drefn gan Ron Davies ar y datganiad hwn. Galwaf arno, os dymuna. Galwaf arnoch chi hefyd, os na cheisiwch ymyrryd yn ystod rhan olaf y datganiad pwysig hwn.

**Michael German:** Yn amlwg, mae hwn yn bwynt cychwynnol na allwn ei oedi ragor. Os dewiswn oedi'r broses hon, byddwn yn digalonni'r bobl hynny sydd yn aros am ein penderfyniadau ar hyn. Byddwn yn rhoi'r bobl hynny hyd yn oed ymhellach ar ei hôl hi gan oedi'r cyfle i fynegi barn strategol am ble y mae'n rhaid i Gymru fynd yn y dyfodol. Gwrthodaf y cyhuddiad nad oes gan y ddogfen hon unrhyw ganolbwynt polisi. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o'i thudalennau yn cynnwys blaenoriaethau polisi.

### **Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order**

**Ron Davies:** Point of order. I am grateful to Mike for correcting his earlier comment because his recollection of the Committee's proceedings was somewhat less than exact. I am rather more sensitive about seconding Alun Cairns's motions than he obviously is about seconding mine. I put on record that the majority of Committee members did not want to endorse the report as it stands. There was a general feeling that further work needed to be done. However, the Minister insisted that he wanted to stick to the timetable. The Committee's view was that it would be better to get it right rather than get it soon, but the Minister's view prevailed.

**Alun Cairns:** Further to that point of order, I will clarify the record. It was the Committee's decision to regret the Minister's proposal to proceed with the document.

**Val Feld:** Further to that point of order, as Chair of the Economic Development Committee, I clarify that the wording of the resolution did not include 'regret'. I do not have it with me, but I can produce it, if necessary. However, my recollection is that the resolution stated that a number of members 'had reservations about the

**Ron Davies:** Pwynt o drefn. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Mike am gywiro ei sylw cynharach oherwydd nid yw ei atgof o drafodion y Pwyllgor yn fanwl gywir. Yr wyf ychydig yn fwy petrus ynghylch eilio cynigion Alun Cairns nag y mae ef, mae'n amlwg, ynghylch eilio fy rhai fi. Cofnodaf nad oedd mwyafrif aelodau'r Pwyllgor yn dymuno cymeradwyo'r adroddiad fel ag y mae. Yr oedd ymdeimlad cyffredinol bod angen gwneud gwaith pellach. Fodd bynnag, mynnodd y Gweinidog ei fod am lynu at yr amserlen. Barn y Pwyllgor oedd y byddai'n well sicrhau ei fod yn gywir yn hytrach na'i dderbyn yn gynnar, ond barn y Gweinidog a orfu.

**Alun Cairns:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, egluraf y cofnod. Penderfyniad y Pwyllgor oedd gresynu wrth gynnig y Gweinidog i barhau â'r ddogfen.

**Val Feld:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, egluraf nad oedd geiriad y penderfyniad yn cynnwys 'gresynu'. Nid yw gennyf wrth law, ond gallaf ddod o hyd iddo, os oes angen. Fodd bynnag, fy atgof i yw bod y penderfyniad yn nodi bod gan nifer o aelodau 'amheuan ynghylch y ddogfen', ond

document', but it was noted that the Minister for Economic Development would proceed with consultation. I make that clear because Alun Cairns and his colleagues have presented their view over and over again. I do not want to use unparliamentary language, but, frankly, he is lying. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.']

**Nick Bourne:** That is outrageous.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I ask Val Feld to reconsider her final sentence.

**Val Feld:** In my view, he is being misleading. However, if there is a question about the record of the Economic Development Committee's resolution, then that should be discussed in the Committee, next Wednesday.

**Alison Halford:** Further to that point of order, I support the Chair of the Economic Development Committee. This is the second time that Alun Cairns has been misleading. You will remember, Presiding Officer, that you were kind enough to listen to my point of order on Tuesday, when I complained that he had used the word 'condemned'. That word did not feature in the Economic Development Committee resolution. Yet again, Alun Cairns is playing prima donna politics with a matter as important as this document, and I object to that strongly.

**The Presiding Officer:** The Committee's resolutions and minutes are a matter of record. Clearly, I do not have them in front of me.

**Val Feld:** Further to that point of order, I now have a copy of the resolution.

**The Presiding Officer:** I will allow you to quote briefly from that resolution, if you wish to do so.

**Val Feld:** If Alun Cairns thinks that we have this wrong then it should be discussed in Committee. However, the wording that I have of Ron Davies's resolution is:

nodwyd y byddai'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd yn parhau â'r ymgynghoriad. Egluraf hynny am fod Alun Cairns a'i gyd-Aelodau wedi cyflwyno eu safbwynt dro ar ôl tro. Nid wyf am ddefnyddio iaith anseneddol, ond, i fod yn blwmp ac yn blaen, mae'n dweud celwydd. [AELODAU O'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.']

**Nick Bourne:** Mae hynny'n warthus.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Gofynnaf i Val Feld ailystyried ei brawddeg olaf.

**Val Feld:** Yn fy marn i, mae'n bod yn gamarweiniol. Fodd bynnag, os oes cwestiwn ynghylch y cofnod o benderfyniad y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, yna dylid trafod hynny yn y Pwyllgor, ddydd Mercher nesaf.

**Alison Halford:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, cefnogaf Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Dyma'r ail dro y bu Alun Cairns yn gamarweiniol. Cofiwch, Lywydd, y buoch yn ddigon caredig i wrando ar fy mhwynt o drefn ddydd Mawrth, pan gwynais iddo ddefnyddio'r gair 'condemnio'. Nid oedd y gair hwnnw'n ymddangos ym mhenderfyniad y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Unwaith yn rhagor, mae Alun Cairns yn chwarae gwleidyddiaeth prima donna â mater mor bwysig â'r ddogfen hon, a gwrthwynebaf hynny yn gryf.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae penderfyniadau a chofnodion y Pwyllgor yn fater o gofnod. Yn amlwg, nid ydynt wrth law gennyf.

**Val Feld:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, mae gennyf gopi o'r penderfyniad erbyn hyn.

**Y Llywydd:** Caniatâf i chi ddyfynnu yn fyr o'r penderfyniad hwnnw, pe dymunwch wneud hynny.

**Val Feld:** Os yw Alun Cairns yn credu ein bod wedi gwneud camgymeriad yna dylid ei drafod yn y Pwyllgor. Fodd bynnag, geiriad penderfyniad Ron Davies sydd gennyf i yw:

'Members expressed their reservations about the report in its present form, but noted that it was the Economic Development Minister's intention to publish it as the basis for further consultation.'

Ron can confirm whether that is correct.

Gall Ron gadarnhau a yw hynny'n gywir.

**Ron Davies:** That is correct.

**Ron Davies:** Mae hynny'n gywir.

**Alun Cairns:** Further to this point of order, Val Feld made a serious accusation that she has not yet withdrawn.

**Alun Cairns:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, gwnaeth Val Feld gyhuddiad difrifol nad yw wedi'i dynnu yn ôl eto.

**The Presiding Officer:** My interpretation of what Val Feld carefully said was that she was withdrawing the earlier use of the word 'lying'.

**Y Llywydd:** Fy nehongliad i o'r hyn a ddywedodd Val Feld yn ofalus iawn oedd ei bod yn tynnu yn ôl y defnydd cynharach o'r geiriau 'dweud celwydd'.

**Alun Cairns:** I ask, Llywydd, that you review the Record on that and rule on another occasion because she has not withdrawn that word.

**Alun Cairns:** Gofynnaf, Lywydd, i chi adolygu'r Cofnod ynghylch hynny a dyfarnu ar achlysur arall am nad yw wedi tynnu'r geiriau hynny yn ôl.

**The Presiding Officer:** It was my view that the wording was changed. I invited Val Feld to consider and reflect, which she did.

**Y Llywydd:** Fy marn i oedd i'r geiriad newid. Gwahoddais Val Feld i ystyried a myfyrio, a gwnaeth hithau hynny.

**Alun Cairns:** She did not withdraw the phrase—

**Alun Cairns:** Ni thynnodd yr ymadrodd yn ôl—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. She changed the expression at my request. That is tantamount to a withdrawal.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Newidiodd yr ymadrodd ar fy nghais. Mae hynny gyfystyr â thynnu yn ôl.

**Nick Bourne:** Point of order. This is on a separate point of order—although it relates to this issue and others—on statements made by the administration.

**Nick Bourne:** Pwynt o drefn. Mae hwn ar bwynt o drefn ar wahân—er ei fod yn gysylltiedig â'r mater hwn a materion eraill—ar ddatganiadau a wnaethpwyd gan y weinyddiaeth.

10:55 a.m.

It has come to my attention that when statements are made in Plenary—and I would be grateful for confirmation of this—those statements are e-mailed to Labour AMs. I am not sure whether or not they are e-mailed to Liberal Democrat AMs, but they are not e-mailed to members of other parties. We only receive a copy of the statement immediately before it is made and we have no facility to distribute that. I am concerned if this is the case, because I thought that the Assembly was committed to freedom of information. It seems that the information is free, but the dissemination is not and is being controlled

Daeth i'm sylw pan wneir datganiadau mewn Cyfarfod Llawn—a byddwn yn ddiolchgar am gadarnhad o hyn—y caiff y datganiadau hynny eu hanfon dros yr e-bost at Aelodau Llafur o'r Cynulliad. Nid wyf yn siŵr a gânt eu hanfon dros yr e-bost at Aelodau Cynulliad y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, ond ni chânt eu hanfon dros yr e-bost at aelodau o bleidiau eraill. Ni fyddwn yn derbyn copi o'r datganiad tan yn union cyn iddo gael ei wneud ac nid oes gennym unrhyw gyfleuster i'w ddsbarthu. Yr wyf yn bryderus os mai dyma'r achos, oherwydd yr oeddwn o dan yr argraff fod y Cynulliad yn ymrwymedig i

by the administration. Members across the Chamber would be concerned were that the case.

**The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies):** If Nick's business manager would like to raise this in Business Committee, perhaps that would be the appropriate forum in which to discuss it. We will discuss our protocol on Cabinet statements, to which we comply. If that needs to be looked at and the method of disseminating information enlarged upon we will consider it. However, it is not a matter that we need to discuss in Plenary. We can discuss it in Business Committee.

**Nick Bourne:** Further to that point, it is not a matter for the Business Committee, which is an advisory committee. I am afraid that Andrew is all too fond of this process of trying to kick issues into the Business Committee and then lose them. This is a matter of concern to the whole Assembly. I trust that this is an admission of being guilty as charged. If these statements are given to AMs, they should be given to AMs of all parties simultaneously by the administration. I welcome the assurance that that will be done.

**Andrew Davies:** I was not admitting liability. I know that Nick was a former barrister and he is rather fond of legal jargon. All I am saying is that rather than having a debate in Plenary we will have one in the Business Committee. We will consider the protocol.

**David Davies:** Can we clarify this? Are these statements going out to Labour and Liberal Democrat AMs or are they not? Yes or no?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The Minister for Assembly Business does not wish to respond and that is his prerogative. We have disposed of this point of order.

**Nick Bourne:** With respect, it is an important issue, Llywydd. We need a 'yes' or 'no' from the Minister for Assembly Business as to whether it is happening. If it is, all AMs of all

ryddid gwybodaeth. Ymddengys bod yr wybodaeth yn rhydd, ond nid yw'r dosbarthiad a chaiff ei reoli gan y weinyddiaeth. Byddai aelodau ar draws y Siambr yn bryderus pe bai hynny'n wir.

**Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies):** Pe bai rheolwr busnes Nick yn dymuno codi hyn yn y Pwyllgor Busnes, efallai mai dyna fyddai'r fforwm addas ar gyfer ei drafod. Byddwn yn trafod ein protocol ar ddatganiadau'r Cabinet, y cydymffurfïwn ag ef. Os oes angen edrych ar hwnnw ac ehangu'r dull o ddsbarthu gwybodaeth byddwn yn ei ystyried. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n fater sydd angen inni ei drafod mewn Cyfarfod Llawn. Gallwn ei drafod yn y Pwyllgor Busnes.

**Nick Bourne:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw, nid yw'n fater i'r Pwyllgor Busnes, sydd yn bwyllgor ymgynghorol. Ofnaf fod Andrew yn or-hoff o'r broses hon o geisio gwthio materion at y Pwyllgor Busnes ac yna golli golwg arnynt. Mae hyn yn destun pryder i'r Cynulliad cyfan. Hyderaf fod hwn yn gyfaddefiad ei fod yn euog o'r hyn y'i cyhuddir ohono. Os rhoddir y datganiadau hyn i Aelodau'r Cynulliad, dylai'r weinyddiaeth eu rhoi i Aelodau o bob plaid ar yr un pryd. Croesawaf y sicrwydd y gwneir hynny.

**Andrew Davies:** Nid oeddwn yn cyfaddef atebolrwydd. Gwn fod Nick yn gyn fargyfreithiwr ac mae'n dra hoff o jargon cyfreithiol. Y cyfan a ddywedaf yw yn hytrach na chynnal dadl mewn Cyfarfod Llawn cynhaliwn ddadl yn y Pwyllgor Busnes. Ystyriwn y protocol.

**David Davies:** A allwn grisialu hyn? A yw'r datganiadau hyn yn cyrraedd yr Aelodau o'r blaid Lafur a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ai peidio? Ydynt neu nac ydynt?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw'r Trefnydd yn dymuno ymateb a'i ragorfraint ef yw hynny. Yr ydym wedi ymdrin â'r pwynt hwn o drefn.

**Nick Bourne:** Gyda pharch, mae'n fater pwysig, Lywydd. Mae angen 'ydynt' neu 'nac ydynt' arnom oddi wrth y Trefnydd ynghylch beth sydd yn digwydd. Os yw hyn

parties should receive the statements simultaneously. This is a matter for the whole Assembly. It is not a matter for the Business or any other Committee.

**Jocelyn Davies:** This is not a matter for the Business Committee. There is a protocol, but whether Andrew is directly e-mailing those statements or arranging for them to be e-mailed to backbenchers is outside the remit of that protocol. He should say now whether he is doing so.

**Andrew Davies:** How I communicate with my party group is a matter for me as party business manager and not for other party members. However, we always make Cabinet statements available well within the code of practice and we have always made information available. Nick gets on his high horse rather too often. This should be considered by the Business Committee. I am not saying that it will not be done, but just that the Business Committee should consider it. If appropriate, we will make information available electronically as well as in hard copy. The next Business Committee meeting is next Tuesday. Jocelyn Davies has accepted that it is an appropriate place to discuss this—[OPPOSITION ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘She did not say that.’]

She did say that it should be referred to Business Committee. [OPPOSITION ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘No, she did not.’]

Colleagues are getting rather hot under the collar over a minor issue. If on Tuesday the Business Committee decides to make Cabinet statements available electronically, that will be done immediately. It needs to be discussed in Business Committee through the proper channels.

**David Melding:** The Minister needs to clarify the position. This is not about him as a senior Labour politician communicating with other Labour politicians in this Chamber. It is about the Government disseminating Cabinet statements to Assembly Members. That should either be done completely or not at all.

yn digwydd, dylai Aelodau'r Cynulliad o bob plaid dderbyn y datganiadau ar yr un pryd. Mae hwn yn fater ar gyfer y Cynulliad cyfan. Nid yw'n fater ar gyfer y Pwyllgor Busnes nac unrhyw Bwyllgor arall.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Nid yw hwn yn fater ar gyfer y Pwyllgor Busnes. Ceir protocol, ond os yw Andrew yn anfon y datganiadau hynny yn uniongyrchol dros yr e-bost neu'n trefnu eu bod yn cael eu hanfon yn ôl dros yr e-bost at feincwyr cefn, mae hynny y tu allan i gylch gwaith y protocol hwnnw. Dylai ddweud yn awr a yw'n gwneud hynny.

**Andrew Davies:** Mater i mi fel rheolwr busnes fy mhlaid, ac nid aelodau pleidiau eraill, yw'r ffordd yr wyf yn cyfathrebu â grŵp fy mhlaid. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym bob amser yn sicrhau bod datganiadau'r Cabinet ar gael ymhell o fewn y cod ymarfer ac yr ydym bob amser wedi sicrhau bod gwybodaeth ar gael. Mae Nick yn mynd ar gefn ei geffyl gwyn braidd yn rhy aml. Dylai'r Pwyllgor Busnes ystyried hyn. Nid wyf yn dweud na chaiff ei wneud, ond yn hytrach y dylai'r Pwyllgor Busnes ei ystyried. Os yw hynny'n briodol, byddwn yn sicrhau bod gwybodaeth ar gael yn electronig yn ogystal ag ar ffurf copi caled. Mae cyfarfod nesaf y Pwyllgor Busnes ddydd Mawrth nesaf. Derbyniodd Jocelyn Davies fod hwn yn lle addas ar gyfer trafod hyn—[AELODAU GWRTHBLAID Y CYNULLIAD: ‘Ni ddywedodd hynny.’]

Dywedodd y dylid ei gyfeirio at y Pwyllgor Busnes. [AELODAU GWRTHBLAID Y CYNULLIAD: ‘Naddo, ni ddywedodd hynny.’]

Mae fy nghyd-Aelodau yn dechrau colli eu limpyn dros fater bach. Os bydd y Pwyllgor Busnes yn penderfynu ddydd Mawrth y dylid sicrhau bod datganiadau'r Cabinet ar gael yn electronig, gwneir hynny ar unwaith. Mae angen ei drafod yn y Pwyllgor Busnes drwy gyfrwng y sianeli priodol.

**David Melding:** Mae angen i'r Gweinidog egluro'r sefyllfa. Nid yw hyn yn ymwneud ag ef fel uwch wleidydd Llafur yn cyfathrebu â gwleidyddion Llafur eraill yn y Siambr hon. Mae'n ymwneud â'r Llywodraeth yn dosbarthu datganiadau'r Cabinet i Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Dylid gwneud hynny yn gyflawn

It should not be done partially. At the moment, party groups other than his and, presumably, the Liberals—

**Kirsty Williams:** The Liberal Democrats.

**David Melding:** I am sorry, the Liberal Democrats—distinction without a difference I would have thought, but there you are.

Other party groups receive one hard copy of the Cabinet statements whereas all Labour and Liberal Democrat Members receive a copy. That is not equitable treatment and he should be honest, say 'fair cop', sought the situation out and do what is proper.

**Cynog Dafis:** Cefnogaf yn gryf yr hyn a ddywedodd David Melding. Gofynnaf ichi, Lywydd—os yw'n briodol i chi ddweud—a ydych yn credu y dylid dosbarthu datganiadau gan Weinidogion i holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad neu beidio? Yr arfer yma ac yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin—lle y bŵm am gyfnod—yw i gopi o ddatganiad gael ei ryddhau i bob gwrthblaid ychydig o funudau, efallai hanner awr, cyn iddo gael ei wneud. Mae hynny'n arferol ac yn ddealladwy. Byddai'n sgandal yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin—nid oes angen inni ei ddilyn ym mhopeth ond credaf ei fod yn iawn i wneud hynny yn hyn o beth—pe bai datganiad yn cael ei ryddhau i feinciau cefn y Llywodraeth ac mae'n sgandal os yw'n digwydd yma. Byddwn yn croesawu eglurhad ar egwyddor y mater hwn cyn gynted â phosibl.

**Glyn Davies:** We are fairly clear, Llywydd, that this is happening, although the Minister for Assembly Business has not been entirely open in admitting it. However, we all—and this is true for Labour's partners, the Liberal Democrats in particular—need to know whether they are sharing this advance information. I could not glean that information from the vague answers that were given. We need to know that and the Liberal Democrats need to know as well.

neu ddim o gwbl. Ni ddylid ei wneud yn rhannol. Ar hyn o bryd, mae grwpiau pleidiau ar wahân i'w blaid yntau a, a mwy na thebyg, y Rhyddfrydwyr—

**Kirsty Williams:** Y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol.

**David Melding:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol—nid bod hynny'n gwneud unrhyw wahaniaeth, yn fy marn i—ond dyna ni.

Mae grwpiau'r pleidiau eraill yn derbyn un copi caled o ddatganiadau'r Cabinet tra bod pob Aelod Llafur a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn derbyn copi. Nid yw hynny'n driniaeth gyfartal, a dylai fod yn onest, a chyfaddef ei fod 'wedi'i ddal yn deg', gan ddatrys y sefyllfa a gwneud yr hyn sydd yn gyfiawn.

**Cynog Dafis:** I strongly support what David Melding said. I ask you, Presiding Officer—if it is appropriate for you to comment—whether you believe that statements by Ministers should be distributed to all Assembly Members or not? The practice here and in the House of Commons—where I sat for a time—is for a copy of a statement to be released to every opposition party a few minutes, perhaps half an hour before it is made. That is normal and understandable. However, it would be a scandal in the House of Commons—and we do not need to follow it in everything, but I believe that it is right to do so in this—if a statement were released to Government backbenchers, and it is a scandal if it happens here. I would welcome clarification on the principle of this matter as soon as possible.

**Glyn Davies:** Mae'n eithaf clir, Lywydd, fod hyn yn digwydd, er nad yw'r Trefnydd wedi bod yn gwbl agored wrth gyfaddef hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni i gyd wybod—ac mae hyn yn wir am bartneriaid Llafur, y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn arbennig—a ydynt yn rhannu'r wybodaeth hon a gânt ymlaen llaw ai peidio. Ni allwn loffio'r wybodaeth honno o'r atebion amwys a roddwyd. Mae angen inni wybod hynny ac mae angen i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wybod yn ogystal.

**The Presiding Officer:** I will not seek to delay the Assembly further, but I have been asked to respond as Presiding Officer and I will do so. My understanding is that statements are released to the party business managers in due time before they are made in this Chamber. I was happy to receive a copy of a statement on steel, which was e-mailed to me in the Chamber, as I assume it was to other Members, on Tuesday. I occasionally receive such statements. If Members feel that that information should be given to all Members not just party business managers, that is an appropriate matter for the Business Committee to discuss and advise the Minister for Assembly Business upon. I encourage the freest possible flow of information between the Government of Wales and Assembly Members and I would appreciate any move to increase that flow of information. However, whether the Minister for Assembly Business communicates with his Members on information that is relevant to his activities as party business manager is a matter for him.

**Peter Rogers:** Point of order. I raise a point of order under Standing Order No. 17.4. I met with the Minister for Rural Affairs and officials on 24 January in respect of a complex case raised by a constituent. The matter concerned under—and over—measurement of land, which had resulted in a Welsh farmer being penalised £2,500 in the loss of an extensification payment. A similar case in England had been overturned in Brussels and the penalty repaid. This case is of tremendous importance to Welsh farmers. In my meeting with the Minister, he alleged further over-measurements against my constituent, mentioning sand and rock. That claim was disproved later that day by further evidence provided to me by the farmer in the form of a letter that he had received from this Assembly. The Minister, therefore, provided me with inaccurate and misleading information. That impeded my ability to represent my constituent's interest and prevented me from pursuing an important subject of public interest. That has, therefore, impeded my right as a Member to scrutinise the Executive's work. Will you rule on whether minutes of meetings between Assembly Members, Ministers and civil servants constitute Assembly documents

**Y Llywydd:** Ni pheraf oedi pellach i'r Cynulliad, ond gofynnwyd imi ymateb fel y Llywydd a gwnaf innau hynny. Fy nealltwriaeth yw bod datganiadau'n cael eu rhyddhau i reolwyr busnes y pleidiau mewn da o bryd cyn iddynt gael eu gwneud yn y Siambr hon. Yr oeddwn yn falch o dderbyn y datganiad ar ddur, a anfonwyd ataf yn y Siambr dros yr e-bost, a chymeraf yn ganiataol iddo gyrraedd yr Aelodau eraill hefyd, ddydd Mawrth. Yn achlysurol y derbyniaf ddatganiadau o'r fath. Os yw'r Aelodau o'r farn y dylid rhoi'r wybodaeth honno i'r holl Aelodau ac nid rheolwyr busnes y pleidiau, mae hynny'n fater addas i'r Pwyllgor Busnes ei drafod a chynghori'r Trefnydd yn ei gylch. Anogaf fod gwybodaeth yn llifo mor hwylus â phosibl rhwng Llywodraeth Cymru ac Aelodau'r Cynulliad a byddwn yn croesawu unrhyw gam er mwyn cynyddu'r llif hwnnw o wybodaeth. Fodd bynnag, mater i'r Trefnydd yw pa un a yw'n cyfathrebu â'i Aelodau ar wybodaeth sydd yn berthnasol i'w weithgareddau fel rheolwr busnes ei blaid.

**Peter Rogers:** Pwynt o drefn. Codaf bwynt o drefn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 17.4. Cyfarfûm â'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig a swyddogion ar 24 Ionawr mewn perthynas ag achos cymhleth a godwyd gan etholwr. Yr oedd y mater yn ymwneud â thanfesur—a throsfesur—tir, a olygodd fod ffermwr o Gymru wedi'i ddirwyo £2,500 am golli taliad ymestyn. Gwyrdrowyd achos tebyg yn Lloegr ym Mrwsel ac ad-dalwyd y ddirwy. Mae'r achos hwn o bwysigrwydd aruthrol i ffermwyr Cymru. Yn fy nghyfarfod gyda'r Gweinidog, cyhuddodd ef fy etholwr o drosfesur pellach, gan grybwyll tywod a charreg. Gwrthbrofwyd yr honiad hwnnw yn ddiweddarach y diwrnod hwnnw drwy gyfrwng tystiolaeth bellach a ddarparwyd imi gan y ffermwr ar ffurf llythyr a dderbyniodd oddi wrth y Cynulliad hwn. Darparodd y Gweinidog, felly, wybodaeth anghywir a charmarweiniol imi. Rhwystrodd hynny fy ngallu i gynrychioli buddiant fy etholwr a'm hatal rhag mynd ar drywydd pwnc pwysig o ddi-ddordeb cyhoeddus. Mae hynny, felly, wedi rhwystro fy hawl fel Aelod i archwilio gwaith y Weithrediaeth. A ddyfarnwch a fydd cofnodion cyfarfodydd rhwng Aelodau'r Cynulliad, Gweinidogion a gweision sifil yn gyfystyr â dogfennau'r Cynulliad mewn

relating to the proceedings of the Assembly as laid down in Standing Order No. 17.4? Can you provide guidance on whether oral answers to Members' questions at such meetings should be minuted to comply with Standing Order No. 17.4?

11:05 a.m.

**Carwyn Jones:** I submit, Presiding Officer, that this is not a point of order. Peter Rogers has raised this matter time and again. On every occasion, I have explained to him what is being done. I offered Peter a meeting and we have had that meeting. I extend that courtesy to all Members, without fear or favour to any political party. Since that meeting, Peter has received correspondence from me on this matter and has been told that it is being taken up with the European Commission to obtain advice on what the current legal situation is. When Members have inquiries such as this on behalf of their constituents I seek to help as much as I can by holding meetings with them to listen at first-hand to their queries. However, this question has been asked many times and I have given the answer many times, both orally and in writing. In my view, it is not a point of order.

**Alun Cairns:** Further to that point of order and out of respect to you, Presiding Officer, I do not think that it is the Minister's place to say whether it is a point of order or not.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am grateful to the 'deputy presiding officer', Alun Cairns. I was about to say that myself. I am grateful to Peter Rogers for giving me advance notice of this point of order and to the Minister for his further explanation of the issue. Our Standing Orders and our points of order relate mainly to Assembly business. However, Assembly business includes access to documents. My understanding—and I will review this further—is that it does not include proceedings of meetings between Assembly Members and Ministers and officials. That is not a matter for me. It is a matter between Members, in fulfilling their constituency duties, and Government Ministers.

perthynas â gweithdrefnau'r Cynulliad fel y'u pennwyd yn Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 17.4? A allwch ddarparu arweiniad ynghylch a ddylai atebion llafar i gwestiynau Aelodau mewn cyfarfodydd o'r fath gael eu cofnodi er mwyn cydymffurfio â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 17.4?

**Carwyn Jones:** Honnaf, Lywydd, nad yw hwn yn bwynt o drefn. Mae Peter Rogers wedi codi'r mater hwn dro ar ôl tro. Ar bob achlysur, eglurais iddo beth sydd yn cael ei wneud. Cynigiais gyfarfod â Peter ac yr ydym wedi cynnal y cyfarfod hwnnw. Ymestynnaf y cwrteisi hwnnw i bob Aelod, heb ofni na ffafrio unrhyw blaid wleidyddol. Ers y cyfarfod hwnnw, derbyniodd Peter ohebiaeth oddi wrthyf ynghylch y mater hwn a dywedwyd wrtho yr ymdrinnir ag ef gan y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd er mwyn cael gafael ar wybodaeth am y sefyllfa gyfreithiol bresennol. Pan fydd gan Aelodau ymholiadau fel hwn ar ran eu hetholwyr ceisiaf eu helpu gymaint ag y gallaf drwy gynnal cyfarfodydd gyda hwy a gwranddo ar eu hymholiadau wyneb yn wyneb. Fodd bynnag, gofynnwyd y cwestiwn hwn sawl gwaith a rhoddais innau'r ateb sawl gwaith, ar lafar ac yn ysgrifenedig. Yn fy marn i, nid yw hwn yn bwynt o drefn.

**Alun Cairns:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn ac o barch tuag atoch chi, Lywydd, ni chredaf mai lle'r Gweinidog yw dweud a yw'n bwynt o drefn ai peidio.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r 'is-lywydd', Alun Cairns. Yr oeddwn ar fin dweud hynny fy hun. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Peter Rogers am roi rhybudd ymlaen llaw imi ynghylch y pwynt hwn o drefn ac i'r Gweinidog am ei eglurhad pellach ar y mater. Mae ein Rheolau Sefydlog a'n pwyntiau o drefn yn ymwneud yn bennaf â busnes y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, mae busnes y Cynulliad yn cynnwys mynediad at ddogfennau. Fy nealltwriaeth i—a byddaf yn adolygu hyn ymhellach—yw nad yw'n cynnwys trafodion cyfarfodydd rhwng Aelodau'r Cynulliad a Gweinidogion a swyddogion. Nid mater i mi yw hwn. Mae'n fater rhwng Aelodau, wrth gyflawni eu dyletswyddau etholaethol, a Gweinidogion y Llywodraeth.



In relation to Standing Order No. 17.4, Peter Rogers will have noted that it does not apply where the

‘disclosure of the document would inhibit the free and frank exchange of advice and opinion between Assembly Members and members of the Assembly’s staff’.

Therefore, there are limitations to the inspection powers and the access to documents under the control of the Assembly under Standing Order No. 17.4. It would depend on the particular case whether the documents concerned were regarded as falling within that aspect of the Standing Order. However, I will review this further.

**Peter Rogers:** In relation to the Minister’s reply, my allegation is that he deliberately misled me at that meeting regarding the over-measurement—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I indicated earlier that I would review this further and take further advice. I ask Peter to reconsider his allegation that the Minister was wilfully misleading him. It is not in order to make such allegations in this Chamber.

**Peter Rogers:** I will take your advice.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am grateful. I assure you that I will consider this further to the extent that it applies to our Standing Orders.

Mewn perthynas â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 17.4, bydd Peter Rogers wedi nodi nad yw’n berthnasol lle byddai

‘datgelu’r ddogfen yn atal Aelodau o’r Cynulliad ac aelodau staff y Cynulliad rhag bod yn rhydd ac yn onest wrth gyfnewid cyngor a barn gyda rhyddid a gonestrwydd.’

Felly, mae cyfyngiadau i bwerau arolygu a mynediad i ddogfennau o dan reolaeth y Cynulliad o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 17.4. Byddai’n dibynnu ar yr achos arbennig lle bo’r dogfennau dan sylw yn cael eu hystyried fel pe baent yn syrthio o fewn yr agwedd honno ar y Rheol Sefydlog. Fodd bynnag, byddaf yn adolygu hyn ymhellach.

**Peter Rogers:** Mewn perthynas ag ateb y Gweinidog, yr wyf yn honni iddo fy nghamarwain yn fwriadol yn y cyfarfod hwnnw ynghylch y trosfesur—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Awgrymais yn gynharach y byddwn yn adolygu hyn ymhellach ac yn derbyn cyngor pellach. Gofynnaf i Peter ailystyried ei honiad fod y Gweinidog yn ei gamarwain yn fwriadol. Nid yw gwneud cyhuddiadau o’r fath yn y Siambr hon mewn trefn.

**Peter Rogers:** Derbyniaf eich cyngor.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar. Fe’ch sicrhaf y byddaf yn ystyried hyn ymhellach i’r graddau y mae’n berthnasol i’n Rheolau Sefydlog.

### **Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ar Gymorth i Fusnesau The Economic Development Committee Report on Business Support**

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf ar Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, i gynnig y cynnig.

**Val Feld:** I propose that

*the National Assembly*

*a. welcomes the Economic Development Committee’s Report into Business Support (laid in the Table Office on 31 January 2001)*

**The Presiding Officer:** I call the Chair of the Economic Development Committee to propose the motion.

**Val Feld:** Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*a. yn croesawu Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ar Gymorth i Fusnesau (a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno*

*as an important contribution to securing an effective framework for providing help and support to encourage business in Wales to grow and to achieving sustainable economic development in all parts of Wales;*

*b. agrees that the Administration now undertakes full consultation with business, as a requirement of section 115 of the Government of Wales Act 1998, and full consultation with all interested parties;*

*c. encourages all those involved in business support, both recipients and providers to contribute to the consultation process.*

Mae'n bleser gennyf gyflwyno'r adroddiad hwn, sef adolygiad cyntaf y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd.

In presenting this report, I acknowledge the huge contribution of Dr Jim Driscoll who undertook the main bulk of the research. He spent many hours with us, helping us to develop our recommendations based on his findings. He stayed with us far longer than he had planned. I also thank Helen Usher who was the clerk to the Economic Development Committee for most of the review. Even after she moved to the Welsh European Funding Office private sector unit, she continued to do both jobs to complete the review. I also thank John Grimes, our current clerk, who faced the difficult task of producing the final document and managing the closing stages. I am grateful to them all. I also put on record my thanks to my colleagues who engaged with this work. There are four Members who deserve special mention. Phil Williams, Brian Hancock and Mike German were members of the Committee throughout. I do not want to embarrass him, but I want to say some nice words about Alun Cairns, who also fully engaged with this report, showing that he is able to do so. I am grateful to Alun for that.

**Alun Cairns:** That is the end of my political career.

**Val Feld:** That is fine. I hope that Members will agree that this is a well-researched and

*ar 31 Ionawr 2001) fel cyfraniad pwysig i sicrhau fframwaith effeithiol ar gyfer rhoi help a chymorth i annog busnesau Cymru i dyfu ac ar gyfer sicrhau datblygiad economaidd cynaliadwy ym mhob rhan o Gymru;*

*b. yn cytuno y dylai'r weinyddiaeth yn awr yngynghori'n llawn â byd busnes, fel sy'n ofyniad yn adran 115 o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, ac ymgynghori'n llawn â'r holl bartïon cyfrannog;*

*c. yn annog pawb sydd yn ymwneud â chymorth i funesau, y sawl sydd yn ei roi ac yn ei gael, i gyfrannu i'r broses yngynghori.*

It is a pleasure to present this report, which is the first review of the Economic Development Committee.

Wrth gyflwyno'r adroddiad hwn, cydnabyddaf gyfraniad enfawr Dr Jim Driscoll a ymgymerodd â'r rhan fwyaf o'r ymchwil. Treuliodd oriau maith gyda ni, yn ein helpu i ddatblygu'n hargymhellion yn seiliedig ar ei ganfyddiadau. Arhosodd gyda ni yn llawer hwy nag y bwriadodd. Diolchaf hefyd i Helen Usher sef clerc y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn ystod y rhan fwyaf o'r adolygiad. Hyd yn oed ar ôl iddi symud i uned y sector preifat yn Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru, parhaodd i wneud y ddwy swydd er mwyn cwblhau'r adolygiad. Diolchaf hefyd i John Grimes, ein clerc presennol, a wynebodd y dasg anodd o lunio'r ddogfen derfynol ac o reoli'r camau olaf. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i bob un ohonynt. Cofnodaf hefyd fy niolch i'm cyd-Aelodau a gymerodd ddiddordeb yn y gwaith hwn. Mae pedwar Aelod sydd yn haeddu sylw arbennig. Yr oedd Phil Williams, Brian Hancock a Mike German yn aelodau o'r Pwyllgor drwy gydol y broses. Nid wyf am achosi embaras iddo, ond hoffwn ddweud rhai geiriau caredig am Alun Cairns, a gymerodd ddiddordeb llawn yn yr adroddiad hwn hefyd, gan ddangos y gall wneud hynny. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Alun am hynny.

**Alun Cairns:** Dyna ddiwedd fy ngyrfa wleidyddol.

**Val Feld:** Mae hynny'n iawn. Gobeithiaf y cytuna'r Aelodau yr ymchwiliwyd yn dda i'r

well-argued case and a sound set of recommendations. You will all be aware of Wales's economic problems: the weak indigenous business base reflecting our historic dependence on industrial sectors that have suffered major decline, too few companies exporting, an under-developed service sector, few headquarters functions, a lack of hi-tech knowledge-driven industries, low commitment to innovation and research and development, low exploitation of information and communication technology opportunities, low business birth-rates, high failure rates, poor growth in small to medium-sized to public limited companies.

The key to the successful creation of wealth for Wales and tackling the poverty and deprivation about which we speak so often in this Chamber must be job creation, through foreign direct investment, expanding and safeguarding our existing indigenous business and, critically, by developing new businesses. The Committee decided to look at the type of support that was available to make this happen. Our plan from the outset was to identify the current range of business support and development programmes, consider how effective they were and whether they were meeting the needs of business, establish whether the delivery mechanisms were appropriate and to what gaps there were in provision. We realised, at an early stage, that this was a difficult exercise without an economic development strategy laying out our objectives and without a system for monitoring and evaluating existing programmes.

In our review, we found evidence of a number of worrying experiences and activities. We found a great deal of commitment and activity, many dedicated people but not always experienced or well trained for the task facing them. We found a great deal of money being spent. We estimate that at least £105 million of public money was spent annually and probably a great deal more this year but no consistent or coherent methods for evaluating the impact of the programme. Assessment was on a project-by-project basis, many to meet European Union

achos hwn, y'i dadleuir yn dda ac y ceir cyfres o argymhellion cadarn. Bydd pob un ohonoch yn ymwybodol o broblemau economaidd Cymru: y sylfaen busnesau cynhenid wan sydd yn adlewyrchu'r ffaith ein bod wedi dibynnu'n hanesyddol ar sectorau diwydiannol a ddirywiodd yn sylweddol, nifer annigonol o gwmnïau sydd yn allforio, sector gwasanaeth nas datblygwyd yn ddigonol, diffyg diwydiannau'r dechnoleg ddiweddaraf a lywir gan wybodaeth, ymrwymiad isel i arloesedd ac ymchwil a datblygu, defnydd bach o gyfleoedd technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu, cyfraddau busnesau newydd isel, cyfraddau methiant uchel, twf gwael o ran cwmnïau bach i ganolig eu maint yn dod yn gwmnïau cyfyngedig cyhoeddus.

Yr hyn sydd yn allweddol i greu cyfoeth i Gymru yn llwyddiannus ac i fynd i'r afael â'r tlodi a'r amddifadedd y siaradwn amdanynt mor aml yn y Siambr hon yw creu swyddi, drwy fuddsoddiadau uniongyrchol o dramor, ehangu a diogelu ein busnesau cynhenid presennol ac, yn hanfodol, datblygu busnesau newydd. Penderfynodd y Pwyllgor edrych ar y math o gymorth a oedd ar gael i wneud i hyn ddigwydd. Ein bwriad o'r dechrau oedd nodi'r amrywiaeth bresennol o raglenni cymorth a datblygu i fusnesau, ystyried pa mor effeithiol oeddent ac a oeddent yn diwallu anghenion busnesau, penderfynu a oedd y dulliau cyflwyno yn briodol a pha fylchau a geid yn y ddarpariaeth. Sylweddolasom, yn gynnar iawn, fod hyn yn ymarfer anodd heb strategaeth datblygu economaidd i nodi ein hamcanion a heb system i fonitro a gwerthuso'r rhaglenni presennol.

Yn ein hadolygiad, gwelsom arwyddion o nifer o brofiadau a gweithgareddau a barodd bryder. Gwelsom ymrwymiad a gweithgarwch mawr iawn, llawer o bobl ymroddedig ond nid oeddent bob amser yn brofiadol ac wedi'u hyfforddi'n briodol ar gyfer y dasg a'u hwynebai. Gwelsom lawer iawn o arian yn cael ei wario. Amcangyfrifwn y gwariwyd o leiaf £105 miliwn o arian cyhoeddus yn flynyddol ac mae'n debyg y gwerir llawer mwy eleni ond nid oedd dulliau cyson na chydlynus i werthuso effaith y rhaglen. Aseswyd y

funding criteria but no systematic way of knowing what programmes were helping to develop businesses and creating jobs. We found a great deal of overlap in programmes. A typical region might have had 12 not-for-profit service providers. In one location, we found 30 different schemes available for finance. Inevitably that was and is leading to too much competition between agencies, too many agencies going for the same target group, not playing to their strength, partnership in name but not adding value, only adding time. We found patchy provision of support across Wales. The Business Connect network is successful in some areas—parts of south-west Wales, parts of mid-Wales and north Wales—but poor in others. We found that services were often not responsive to the needs of business, particularly small business, that access was often difficult and that there were too many different products. It is a bit like trying to buy breakfast cereal at Tesco. You look at the range of products, you are easily put off and walk away. Many businesses were not clear what they needed, so they required help to think that through.

11:15 a.m.

What we learnt was the importance of a strategic framework within which the programme could be prioritised and judged. It sounds a grim litany. The consolation is that we also learnt from our discussions with representatives of other governments that they were facing the same problem. We are trying to develop effective economic development plans, to make partnerships effective rather than time consuming and to make business services accessible. We are having difficulty gauging what works and what does not.

In finalising its recommendations, the Committee agreed four key principles to underpin business support services: they should be demand-led rather than supply-driven, that is, that we need to understand

prosiectau yn unigol, er mwyn i lawer ohonynt fodloni meini prawf ariannu yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ond heb ffordd systemataidd o wybod pa raglenni a oedd yn helpu i ddatblygu busnesau ac i greu swyddi. Gwelsom fod llawer iawn o orgyffwrdd rhwng rhaglenni. Gallai ardal nodweddiadol gael 12 o ddarparwyr gwasanaeth na wnânt elw. Mewn un lleoliad, yr oedd 30 o gynlluniau gwahanol ar gael i gael arian. Yn anochel, yr oedd hyn yn arwain, ac mae yn arwain, at ormod o gystadleuaeth rhwng asiantaethau, gormod o asiantaethau yn anelu at yr un grŵp targed, heb fanteisio ar eu cryfderau, partneriaeth mewn enw ond heb ychwanegu gwerth, a dim ond yn ychwanegu amser. Canfuom ddarpariaeth fratiog o gymorth ledled Cymru. Mae'r rhwydwaith Cyswllt Busnes yn llwyddiannus mewn rhai ardaloedd—rhannau o dde orllewin Cymru, rhannau o ganolbarth Cymru a gogledd Cymru—ond yn wael mewn ardaloedd eraill. Gwelsom nad ymatebai gwasanaethau yn aml i anghenion busnesau, yn enwedig busnesau bach, bod mynediad yn aml yn anodd a bod gormod o gynnyrch gwahanol. Mae'n eithaf tebyg i brynu grawnfwyd brecwast yn Tesco. Yr ydych yn edrych ar yr amrywiaeth o gynnyrch sydd ar gael, cewch eich diflasu'n hawdd a cherddwch i ffwrdd. Nid oedd llawer o fusnesau yn glir ynglŷn â'r hyn oedd ei angen arnynt, ac felly yr oedd angen help arnynt i ystyried hynny.

Yr hyn a ddysgasom oedd pwysigrwydd fframwaith strategol y gellir blaenoriaethu a barnu'r rhaglen o'i fewn. Ymddengys yn litani wael. Yr hyn a'n cysurodd oedd inni ddyngu hefyd o'n trafodaethau â chynrychiolwyr llywodraethau eraill eu bod hwythau'n wynebu'r un broblem. Ceisiwn ddatblygu cynlluniau datblygu economaidd effeithiol, gwneud partneriaethau yn effeithiol yn hytrach na llafurus a gwneud gwasanaethau busnes yn hygyrch. Cawn anawsterau i fesur yr hyn sydd yn gweithio a'r hyn nad yw'n gweithio.

Wrth ffurfio ei argymhellion terfynol, cytunodd y Pwyllgor ar bedair egwyddor allweddol i fod yn sail i'r gwasanaethau cymorth i fusnesau: dylent gael eu darparu yn ôl y galw yn hytrach na chael eu llywio gan

what people want and be responsive to the changing demand as the economy develops; that there should be a single gateway for all businesses to the range of all services available; that the roles and responsibilities of all economic development agencies should be clear and agreed; that the vital link between economic development and human resource development should be maintained and reinforced.

We make a number of practical recommendations. I will outline the most fundamental. We recommend the establishment of an economic policy board to work within the framework of the strategy. The board would be a small, dynamic body including representatives of business, trade unions, Education and Learning Wales and the Welsh Development Agency. There needs to be greater investment in research into our economy, its strengths and weaknesses and a detailed evaluation of programmes. We need to establish what works and to track the changes that take place in our economy so that we can move resources and ensure that incremental change takes place. The board would make recommendations to the Economic Development Committee and the Minister on priorities, programmes and opportunities and make proposals on who should do what. It would ensure coherence between programmes and an economic research monitoring and evaluation unit would support it.

The Committee wishes to see a clearer definition of the roles and responsibilities of the different organisations. We recommend that the Assembly leads the development and monitors the economic strategy and framework, but pulls out of service delivery except in relation to regional selective assistance and export services. We believe that the WDA should be confirmed as the lead economic development agency and given the responsibility for developing an effective gateway for all business services. This would build on the current Business Connect model, ensure that high quality support is available in all parts of Wales to all sizes and types of business. The possibility of rebranding is to be considered further by the WDA.

gyflenwyr, hynny yw, mae angen inni ddeall yr hyn y mae pobl am ei gael ac ymateb i'r galw sydd yn newid wrth i'r economi ddatblygu; y dylai fod un porth ar gyfer pob busnes i'r amrywiaeth cyfan o wasanaethau sydd ar gael; y dylai rolau a chyfrifoldebau pob asiantaeth datblygu economaidd fod yn glir ac y dylid cytuno arnynt; y dylid cynnal ac atgyfnerthu'r cyswllt hanfodol rhwng datblygu economaidd a datblygu adnoddau dynol.

Gwnawn nifer o argymhellion ymarferol. Amlinellaf y rhai mwyaf sylfaenol. Argymhellwn y sefydlir bwrdd polisiau economaidd i weithio o fewn fframwaith y strategaeth. Byddai'r bwrdd yn gorff bach, deinamig yn cynnwys cynrychiolwyr busnesau, undebau llafur, Addysg a Dysgu Cymru ac Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru. Mae angen buddsoddi mwy i ymchwilio i'n heconomi, ei chryfderau a'i gwendidau ac mae angen gwerthuso'r rhaglenni'n fanwl. Mae angen inni benderfynu ar yr hyn sydd yn gweithio ac olrhain y newidiadau sydd yn digwydd yn ein heconomi fel y gallwn symud adnoddau a sicrhau newid graddol. Byddai'r bwrdd yn gwneud argymhellion i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a'r Gweinidog o ran blaenoriaethau, rhaglenni a chyfluoedd a byddai'n gwneud argymhellion ar bwy ddylai wneud beth. Byddai'n sicrhau cydlyniaeth rhwng rhaglenni a byddai uned monitro a gwerthuso ymchwil economaidd yn ei gefnogi.

Mae'r Pwyllgor yn awyddus i weld rolau a chyfrifoldebau'r sefydliadau gwahanol yn cael eu diffinio'n gliriach. Argymhellwn fod y Cynulliad yn arwain y gwaith datblygu ac yn monitro'r strategaeth a'r fframwaith economaidd, ond ei fod yn rhoi'r gorau i gyflwyno gwasanaethau ac eithrio mewn perthynas â chymorth dethol rhanbarthol a gwasanaethau allforio. Credwn y dylid cadarnhau'r WDA fel y prif asiantaeth datblygu economaidd ac y dylid rhoi iddo'r cyfrifoldeb dros ddatblygu porth effeithiol ar gyfer pob gwasanaeth busnes. Byddai hyn yn datblygu'r model Cyswllt Busnes presennol, gan sicrhau bod cymorth o ansawdd uchel ar gael ym mhob rhan o Gymru i bob math o fusnesau o bob maint. Caiff y posibilrwydd o ailfrandio ei ystyried ymhellach gan y WDA.

The Committee wishes to see more effective partnership working. We spell out our proposals for the core roles of the major players. In developing the business gateway, we wish to see the WDA continue to deliver at local and regional level via partnership between the key agencies, but we also wish to see the partnership reinforced by a partnership board at Wales level. We propose that at national level standards should be set for core services to be provided for each region and for the quality of the services to be provided. That should be a requirement for branding as a member of the gateway.

We set out a number of proposals on how business services can be better orientated towards consumers' needs and to current business opportunities. These changes will lead to a major improvement in the support given to businesses and we are keen that they are implemented as soon as practicable. We have received widespread support in our consultations so far. If the Assembly agrees today they will be subject to a statutory consultation period. This is not the end of the task, but the beginning. If we are to make the kind of impact on the Welsh economy and on the lives of the Welsh people that is necessary, then the framework must be right. Then the existing opportunities can be capitalised upon and taken forward. I commend this report.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Ni fydd modd imi roi ymateb llawn Plaid Cymru i'r ddogfen hon yn yr ychydig funudau sydd gennyf. Ategaf ddiolchiadau Val Feld i Jim Driscoll am ei waith dros y Pwyllgor.

O'm profiad fel Aelod Seneddol, ac o ddiwydiant cyn hynny, yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod gwendidau sylweddol yn y drefn bresennol ar gyfer cynorthwyo busnes. Rhan o'r broblem yw bod cymaint o wahanol awdurdodau, asiantaethau a mentrau yn ceisio darparu cyngor a chymorth. Mae cymaint â 55 o asiantaethau cyhoeddus yn ceisio cyflwyno'r gwaith hwn yng Nghymru yn unig. Dyn a helpo John Jones bach, neu Jane Jones fach, sydd yn ceisio ymbalfalu drwy'r fath jwngl.

Mae'r Pwyllgor yn awyddus i weld mwy o weithio mewn partneriaethau effeithiol. Eglurwn ein hargymhellion am rolau craidd y bobl allweddol. Wrth ddatblygu'r porth busnes, yr ydym yn awyddus bod y WDA yn parhau i gyflwyno gwasanaethau ar lefel leol a rhanbarthol drwy bartneriaethau rhwng yr asiantaethau allweddol, ond yr ydym yn awyddus hefyd yr atgyfnerthir y bartneriaeth gan fwrdd partneriaeth ar lefel Cymru gyfan. Argymhellwn y dylid pennu safonau ar lefel genedlaethol ar gyfer y gwasanaethau craidd sydd i'w darparu ar gyfer pob rhanbarth ac ar gyfer ansawdd y gwasanaethau i'w darparu. Dylai hynny fod yn ofyniad brandio fel aelod o'r porth.

Nodasom nifer o gynigion ar sut y gellir anelu gwasanaethau busnes yn well i gyfateb ag anghenion defnyddwyr a chyfleodd busnes presennol. Arweinia'r newidiadau hyn at welliant mawr yn y cymorth a roddir i fusnesau ac yr ydym yn awyddus y cânt eu gweithredu cyn gynted ag y bo'n ymarferol. Cawsom gefnogaeth eang yn ein gwaith ymgynghori hyd yma. Os cytuna'r Cynulliad heddiw, byddant yn destun cyfnod ymgynghorol statudol. Nid diwedd y dasg yw hyn, ond y dechrau. Os ydym am gael y math o effaith ar yr economi Gymreig ac ar fywydau pobl Cymru ag sydd ei hangen, yna rhaid i'r fframwaith fod yn iawn. Yna, gellir manteisio ar y cyfleodd presennol a'u datblygu. Cymeradwyaf yr adroddiad hwn.

**Dafydd Wigley:** I will not be able to give Plaid Cymru's full response to this document in the few minutes that I have. I echo Val Feld's thanks to Jim Driscoll for his work for the Committee.

From my experience as a Member of Parliament, and of industry prior to that, I am aware that there are considerable weaknesses in the current regime for helping business. Part of the problem is that there are so many different authorities, agencies and initiatives trying to provide advice and assistance. There are as many as 55 public agencies trying to deliver this work in Wales alone. Heaven help little John Jones, or Jane Jones, who tries to struggle through such a jungle.

Nid oes syndod felly mai un o gasgliadau'r adroddiad yw bod busnes yn anfodlon â'r drefn bresennol. Beth sydd ei angen mewn cyfundrefn newydd? Awgrymaf fod angen pedwar peth. Mae angen cyfundrefn hawdd i'w deall, yn gyfleus i'w defnyddio ac yn broffesiynol ddibynadwy. Yn ail, mae angen i'r gyfundrefn osgoi dyblygu cynnig gwasanaethau, i gadw'r gwaith papur i'r lleiaf posibl, a thrwy hynny gallu ymateb yn sydyn i geisiadau. Yn drydydd, mae angen cyfundrefn sydd yn gallu ymateb i anghenion unigolion sydd yn ymsefydlu am y tro cyntaf, i fusnesau bach cynhenid sydd am ehangu, i fusnesau mawr sydd eisoes yng Nghymru, ac i gorfforaethau rhyngwladol sydd yn ystyried ail-leoli i Gymru. Mae manylion y ddarpariaeth yn amrywio rhwng y sectorau hyn, ond dylent fod yn rhan o un gyfundrefn heb fod unrhyw sector yn teimlo ei fod yn cael ei gam-drin neu ei drin yn eilradd. Yn olaf, rhaid i'r gyfundrefn fod yn gosteffeithiol i'w rhedeg, gan fanteisio ar yr elfennau gorau sydd ar gael yn y sectorau cyhoeddus a phreifat.

Argymhelliad canolog yr adroddiad yw bod angen un porth clir i bob busnes, un gyfundrefn gydnabyddedig yn sianel i fusnesau i'w ddilyn. Mae Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi'r argymhelliad hwn, yn wir buom yn pwyso amdano. Teimlwn fod yn rhaid i'r gyfundrefn fodoli ar ddwy lefel: ar lefel genedlaethol, i sicrhau polisïau gweithredol cyson a modd o ddelio â buddsoddwyr o dramor, ac ar lefel ranbarthol, fel bod y gwasanaethau'n gyfleus i'r cwsmer. Byddwn wedi cefnogi cyfundrefn o chwech neu wyth rhanbarth; mae'r Pwyllgor yn tueddu i ffafrio pedwar i gyfateb â rhanbarthau'r Cynulliad. Yr hyn sydd yn bwysig yw bod y rhanbarthau'n ddigon lleol i fod yn gyfleus i'r cwsmer, ond yn ddigon sylweddol i gynnwys yr arbenigedd angenrheidiol.

Ar y lefel genedlaethol, Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru yw'r corff a ddylai redeg y ddesg ymgynghori. Dylid sefydlu biwro helpu busnes o fewn yr WDA, yn hytrach na'r corff annelwig ac anghyson, Cyswllt Busnes. Gan mai ni ym Mhlaid Cymru a awgrymodd hynny ni allasem ond sylwi ar y sylwadau a wnaed mewn datganiad ar y cyd gan Gydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain

It is no surprise therefore that one of the report's conclusions is that business is unhappy with the current regime. What is needed in a new system? I suggest that four elements are needed. We need a system that is easy to understand, convenient to use, and professionally reliable. Secondly, the system needs to avoid duplicating services, to keep the paperwork to a minimum, and thereby be able to respond to requests immediately. Thirdly, a system is needed that can respond to the needs of individuals who are setting up for the first time, of indigenous small businesses that want to expand, of large businesses that are already established in Wales, and of international corporations that are considering relocating to Wales. The details of the provision vary between these sectors, but they should be part of the same system without any one sector feeling that it is being illtreated or treated as second-rate. Finally, the system must be cost-effective to run, and must exploit the best elements available in the public and private sectors.

The report's central recommendation is that each business needs a single, clear gateway, a single, acknowledged system as a channel for businesses to follow. Plaid Cymru supports this recommendation, indeed we pressed for it. We feel that the system must exist on two levels: on a national level, to ensure a consistent operational policy and as a medium for dealing with overseas investors, and on a regional level, so that the services are convenient to the customer. I would have supported a system of six or eight regions; the Committee tends to favour four, to be coterminous with the Assembly's regions. What is important is that the regions are local enough to be convenient to the customer, but substantial enough to include the necessary expertise.

On the national level, the Welsh Development Agency is the body that should run the advice desk. A business action bureau should be established within the WDA, as opposed to that nebulous and inconsistent body, Business Connect. As we in Plaid Cymru suggested that, we could but notice the comments made in a joint statement by the Confederation of British Industry

(Cymru), gan Ffederasiwn Busesau Bach Cymru, Siambr Cymru a Sefydliad y Cyfarwyddwyr: (Wales), the Federation of Small Business Wales, Chamber Wales and the Institute of Directors:

‘The business community does not wish to see Business Connect retained as a brand for business support.’

Dyna eu barn hwy ac mae'n rhaid inni gymryd sylw ohoni. Ein barn ni yw mai biwro gweithredu busnes, fel rhan o'r WDA, gyda phresenoldeb ar raddfa genedlaethol a rhanbarthol, a ddylai ddarparu'r ymateb cyntaf i ymholiadau busnes. Y biwro a fyddai'n cyfeirio'r ymholiadau i'r asiantaethau priodol.

That is their opinion and we must take notice of it. Our opinion is that a business action bureau, as a part of the WDA, with a presence on a national and local scale, should be the first port of call for business enquires. The bureau would direct inquiries to the appropriate agencies.

11:25 a.m.

Byddwn yn disgwyl i'r biwro gynorthwyo busnesau i gyfeirio ymholiadau at wahanol asiantaethau ac at gwmnïau o arbenigwyr yn y sector preifat neu wirfoddol, neu at brifysgolion, fel sydd yn briodol. Rhaid inni greu dealltwriaeth leol ynglŷn â pha gorff sydd yn cyflawni pa wasanaeth, er mwyn dileu'r dyblygu a'r gwastraff dianghenraid sydd yn bodoli ar hyn o bryd. Os nad yw'r gwahanol awdurdodau ac asiantaethau yn fodlon gweithio fel tîm—fel rhan o Dîm Cymru—ac os ydynt yn mynnu adeiladu a gwarchod eu cestyll eu hunain, yna mae'n rhaid iddynt dalu'r pris. Mae'n rhaid cael system sydd yn ddealladwy i bawb.

I would expect the business action bureau to direct inquiries to various agencies and to companies of specialists in the private or voluntary sector, or to universities, as appropriate. We must create local understanding of which organisation provides which service to eliminate the unnecessary duplication and waste that currently exists. If the various authorities and agencies are not prepared to work as a team—as part of Team Wales—and if they insist on building and protecting their own castles, then they must pay the price. We must have a system that is understandable to all.

Un gwendid mawr yn yr adroddiad yw nad yw'n rhoi hawliau digonol i bobl fusnes sydd yn anffodlon â sut y mae'r gyfundrefn yn gweithio, ac mae digon o'r rheini. Dylid penodi ombwdsman busnes i ymchwilio i gwynion. Hynny yw, swyddfa fechan gyda phennaeth o fyd busnes sydd â'r hawl i ymchwilio i fethiannau gweinyddol ac, yn arbennig, arafwch a biwrocratiaeth sydd yn llesteirio'r gyfundrefn. Byddai argymhellion gan ombwdsman busnes o'r fath yn dod i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd er mwyn iddo ystyried y goblygiadau. Mae'n siom nad yw hynny'n rhan o'r adroddiad.

One great deficiency in the report is that it does not give sufficient rights to businesspeople who are dissatisfied with how the system works, and there are plenty of those. A business ombudsman should be appointed to investigate complaints. That is, a small office headed by a person from the business world who can investigate administrative failures and, especially, tardiness and bureaucracy that hold up the system. The recommendations of such a business ombudsman would come to the Economic Development Committee so that it could consider the implications. It is a disappointment that that is not included in the report.

Wedi dweud hynny, mae'r adroddiad yn sail ar gyfer ymgynghori, a gobeithiwn y bydd ymateb eang o'r byd busnes yng Nghymru ac y gallwn adeiladu system a fydd yn gwneud

Having said that, the report is a basis for consultation, and we hope that there will be a far-reaching response from the business world in Wales and that we can build a



llawer yn well yn y dyfodol na'r hyn sydd wedi bodoli dros y blynyddoedd.

**Christine Chapman:** In welcoming this report today, I am sure that many businesses in Wales will be listening eagerly to these proceedings and will be hoping that the report's recommendations are acted upon as soon as possible. There has been dissatisfaction with business support services currently being provided by Government-funded agencies. However, I hope that this review will allow us to begin to address the concerns of businessmen and businesswomen in Wales and allow us to proceed with our revival of the Welsh economy with the best support available.

The results of our consultation also showed concern from support service providers and users. Their comments included such problems as uncertainty about what help was available and frustration over the speed of response. We know from experience that businesses often do not know where to turn for support and advice. They do not always have the time to look around or to network.

In the last fortnight, I have had direct contact with several business support services in relation to my role in trying to help a local company in the Cynon Valley, namely AB Connectors in Abercynon. It is experiencing difficulties with large-scale job losses. In my efforts to help the company, I have approached the WDA, Venture Wales, South East Wales Training and Enterprise Council, Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough Council's economic development department and the trade unions. All those organisations were extremely efficient and helpful, and they expressed a willingness to do all that they could to help the company. However, it struck me that companies such as AB Connectors are not always clear as to who they should contact in times of trouble. Therefore, communication is important and a key factor that is addressed by the review.

I now turn to the WDA's role with regard to this report. The Assembly is entrusting the WDA with the power to take a central role in

system that will do far better in the future than that which has existed over the years.

**Christine Chapman:** Wrth groesawu'r adroddiad hwn heddiw, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd llawer o fusnesau yng Nghymru yn gwrando'n astud ar y trafodion hyn gan obeithio y gweithredir argymhellion yr adroddiad cyn gynted â phosibl. Bu anfodlonrwydd gyda'r gwasanaethau cymorth i fusnesau a ddarperir ar hyn o bryd gan asiantaethau a ariennir gan y Llywodraeth. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiaf y caniatâ'r adolygiad hwn inni ddechrau mynd i'r afael â phryderon dynion a gwagedd busnes yng Nghymru ac y caniatâ inni barhau â'n gwaith i adfer yr economi Gymreig gyda'r cymorth gorau sydd ar gael.

Dangosodd canlyniadau ein gwaith ymgynghori bryder gan ddarparwyr a defnyddwyr gwasanaethau cymorth. Yr oedd eu sylwadau yn cynnwys problemau megis ansicrwydd ynglŷn â pha help a oedd ar gael a rhwystredigaeth oherwydd cyflymder yr ymateb. Gwyddom o brofiad na wyr busnesau yn aml ble i droi i gael cymorth a chynghor. Nid yw'r amser ganddynt bob amser i edrych o gwmpas nac i rwydweithio.

Yn ystod y pythefnos diwethaf, cefais gyswllt uniongyrchol â nifer o wasanaethau cymorth i fusnesau mewn perthynas â'm rôl i geisio helpu cwmni lleol yng Nghwm Cynon, sef AB Connectors yn Abercynon. Profa anawsterau a cholli nifer helaeth o swyddi. Yn fy ymdrechion i helpu'r cwmni, cysylltais â'r WDA, Venture Wales, Cyngor Hyfforddiant a Menter De Ddwyrain Cymru, adran datblygu economaidd Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf a'r undebau llafur. Yr oedd pob un o'r sefydliadau hynny yn effeithlon iawn ac o gymorth mawr, a buont yn fodlon gwneud popeth y gallent i helpu'r cwmni. Fodd bynnag, ymddengys i mi nad yw cwmnïau megis AB Connectors bob amser yn glir o ran pwy y dylent gysylltu â hwy pan fo pethau'n anodd. Felly, mae cyfathrebu yn bwysig ac yn ffactor allweddol y mae'r adolygiad yn ymdrin ag ef.

Trof yn awr at rôl y WDA mewn perthynas â'r adroddiad hwn. Mae'r Cynulliad yn rhoi'r pŵer i'r WDA gymryd rôl ganolog o ran

business support in Wales. It must act responsibly in doing so. Unfortunately, too many reservations have been expressed over the years by businesspeople in Wales about the WDA's functions and service delivery. We need it to meet those challenges. It must have clarity of purpose and be fully responsive to business. It must also be responsive and representative in all parts of Wales—rural and urban areas, the Valleys, the north and the south—and it must ensure that it embraces all groups in Wales. I am sure that the new board and chief executive of the WDA will meet that challenge. I hope that, over time, trust will be built up.

I will now address the needs of women entrepreneurs and make a plea on their behalf. I am far from satisfied with the support and advice received by women entrepreneurs in Wales. I know that from my dealings with women. I have spoken to many women's groups on this. In Wales, we have a fast growing band of women who want to set themselves up in business and we cannot afford to allow that talent to wither and waste away for the want of timely support and advice. The Welsh economy cannot afford that loss. That is an important point. All agencies involved need to take women and their ideas more seriously than is currently the case. If any of you have visited the University of Glamorgan recently and spoken to Dr Elizabeth Muir, you will know that she has set up a network for women entrepreneurs because of the perception that the established support is failing women.

Finally, I turn to partnership, which Val brought up. Partnership is vital, and agencies need to work in partnership if we are to benefit Wales. That can only be to the benefit of existing and, more importantly, potential new businesses looking to start in Wales. This is a key component of our Objective 1 strategy. From the Objective 1 ni's point of view, we are concerned that this strategy is up and running as soon as possible, and we are looking to have a presentation on that shortly. It is also clear from this report that we need to agree, and work within the framework of, the national economic

cymorth i fusnesau yng Nghymru. Rhaid iddo fod yn gyfrifol wrth wneud hynny. Yn anffodus, mynegwyd gormod o amheuon dros y blynyddoedd gan bobl fusnes yng Nghymru ynglŷn â swyddogaethau'r WDA a'i waith o ddarparu gwasanaethau. Mae angen iddo ateb yr heriau hynny. Rhaid iddo fod yn glir o ran ei bwrpas ac ymateb yn llawn i fusnesau. Rhaid iddo hefyd ymateb i a chynrychioli pob rhan o Gymru—ardaloedd gwledig a threfol, y Cymoedd, y gogledd a'r de—a rhaid iddo sicrhau ei fod yn cynnwys pob grŵp yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd bwrdd a phrif weithredwr newydd y WDA yn ateb yr her honno. Gobeithiaf, gydag amser, y datblygir ymddiriedaeth.

Ymdriniaf yn awr ag anghenion entrepreneuriaid sydd yn ferched a gwnaf apêl ar eu rhan. Yr wyf yn bell o fod yn fodlon â'r cymorth a'r cyngor a roddir i entrepreneuriaid sydd yn ferched yng Nghymru. Gwn hynny drwy fy ngwaith gyda merched. Siaradais â nifer o grwpiau merched am hyn. Yng Nghymru, mae'r grŵp o ferched sydd gennym yn tyfu'n gyflym ac maent yn awyddus i sefydlu busnesau ac ni allwn fforddio caniatáu i'r doniau hynny wywo a diflannu oherwydd diffyg cymorth a chyngor amserol. Ni all yr economi Gymreig fforddio colli hynny. Mae hynny'n bwynt pwysig. Mae angen i bob asiantaeth berthnasol gymryd merched a'u syniadau yn fwy o ddifrif nag a wneir ar hyn o bryd. Os bydd un ohonoch wedi ymweld â Phrifysgol Morgannwg yn ddiweddar ac wedi siarad â Dr Elizabeth Muir, gwyddoch iddi sefydlu rhwydwaith ar gyfer entrepreneuriaid sydd yn fenywod oherwydd y canfyddiad bod y cymorth presennol yn siomi merched.

Yn olaf, trof at bartneriaeth, a grybwyllwyd gan Val. Mae partneriaeth yn hanfodol, ac mae angen i asiantaethau weithio mewn partneriaeth os yw Cymru i elwa. Budd yn unig a ddeuai yn sgîl hynny i fusnesau presennol ac, yn bwysicach, darpar fusnesau newydd sydd yn ystyried dechrau yng Nghymru. Mae hyn yn elfen allweddol o'n strategaeth Amcan 1. O safbwynt Pwyllgor Monitro Rhaglenni Amcan 1, yr ydym yn awyddus y gweithredir y strategaeth hon cyn gynted â phosibl, a bwriadwn wneud cyflwyniad ar hynny cyn bo hir. Mae hefyd yn amlwg o'r adroddiad hwn bod angen inni

development strategy for Wales. To repeat what I have already said this morning, we cannot delay in moving forward with that document. With the various action plans, such as the entrepreneurship action plan, 'Betterwales.com' and the Objective 1 area plans, we can bring many of them together with a steady, sound and co-ordinated system of business support networks.

To conclude, we have set ourselves a challenge of making Wales's economy strong. We cannot do that without clear, accurate and timely business support networks. I welcome this report's recommendations in taking another step towards that goal.

**Alun Cairns:** I wish to express my appreciation to Jim Driscoll for his hard work in advising the Committee on this review, and also to Helen Usher, the former clerk of the Economic Development Committee for her assistance, as well as the existing clerk and deputy clerk for their support in picking up where Helen left off.

Much work has gone into this report as has already been said in this debate. However, I regret that the report stops short of the necessary radical recommendations. The first principle that was established, agreed by all parties, is that the Assembly should be responsible for policy, and its agencies responsible for implementation. That was established at the outset. It was a guiding principle throughout the report until the civil servants, or whoever it was, brought pressure on the Minister. My point relates to the Assembly's internationalisation division. When Rhodri Morgan was Economic Development Secretary, he decided, without consultation with any other party, that the department should be transferred from the WDA to the Assembly—not for any strategic purpose, but because, apparently, there were fewer staff responsible in the WDA, and it would be neater to make them civil servants than to transfer the Assembly staff to the agency. At that time, each party spokesman thought that it was nonsensical and that the decision should be based on strategic

gytuno ar strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol ar gyfer Cymru a gweithio o fewn ei fframwaith. I ailadrodd yr hyn a ddywedais eisoes y bore yma, ni allwn oedi wrth ddatblygu'r ddogfen honno. Gyda'r cynlluniau gweithredu amrywiol, fel y cynllun gweithredu entrepreneuriaeth, 'Gwellcymru.com' a'r cynlluniau ardal Amcan 1, gallwn ddod â llawer ohonynt ynghyd gyda system gyson, gadarn a chydlynus o rwydweithiau cymorth i fusnesau.

I gloi, gosodasom her i ni ein hunain i wneud economi Cymru'n gryf. Ni allwn wneud hynny heb rwydweithiau cymorth i fusnesau clir, cywir ac amserol. Croesawaf argymhellion yr adroddiad hwn sydd yn cymryd cam arall tuag at y nod hwnnw.

**Alun Cairns:** Dymunaf ddiolch i Jim Driscoll am ei waith caled yn cynghori'r Pwyllgor ar yr adolygiad hwn, a hefyd i Helen Usher, cyn glerc y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd am ei chymorth, ynghyd â'r clerc a'r dirprwy glerc presennol am eu cymorth yn parhau â'r gwaith ar ôl i Helen adael.

Gwnaethpwyd llawer o waith ar yr adroddiad hwn fel y dywedwyd eisoes yn y ddadl hon. Fodd bynnag, gresynaf nad yw'r adroddiad yn cynnwys yr argymhellion radicalaidd sydd eu hangen. Yr egwyddor gyntaf a sefydlwyd, y cytunwyd arni gan bob plaid, yw y dylai'r Cynulliad fod yn gyfrifol am sefydlu polisiau, ac y dylai ei asiantaethau fod yn gyfrifol am eu gweithredu. Sefydlwyd hynny ar y dechrau. Dyna oedd yr egwyddor arweiniol drwy'r adroddiad hyd nes i'r gweision sifil, neu bwy bynnag, roi pwysau ar y Gweinidog. Mae fy mhwynt yn ymwneud ag is-adran rhyngwladoli'r Cynulliad. Pan oedd Rhodri Morgan yn Ysgrifennydd Datblygu Economaidd, penderfynodd, heb ymgynghori ag unrhyw blaid arall, y dylid trosglwyddo'r adran o'r WDA i'r Cynulliad—nid oherwydd unrhyw ddiben strategol, ond oherwydd, yn ôl pob tebyg, bod llai o staff yn gyfrifol yn y WDA, ac y byddai'n haws eu gwneud yn weision sifil na throsglwyddo staff y Cynulliad i'r asiantaeth. Ar y pryd, credai llefarydd pob plaid ei fod yn hurt ac y dylid seilio'r

priorities. No-one was more vociferous than Mike German, the Leader of the Liberal Democratic Party. Therefore, given the guiding principles that I mentioned—that the Assembly should focus on policy and the agencies on delivery—and bearing in mind the Deputy First Minister's previous standpoint, I was confident that this document would call for the return of the internationalisation duties to the WDA. Unfortunately, however, principles are not something that the Deputy First Minister and other members of the Committee have adhered to, and sadly that is not within the consultation.

Secondly, the two central themes that should be running through this document should relate to the eradication of duplication and the streamlining of the agencies and their processes. On duplication, a week hardly passes without some contact from a constituent or businessman asking where they should go to receive business support and advice. There are many publicly funded agencies claiming to offer business support, all spending vast amounts of Assembly and European funds to market their organisations, products and services. They are building bureaucracies and creating empires that drain scarce resources provided by the taxpayer. There is no need for such organisations to take the blanket approach that they do. Do not misunderstand me, Llywydd, many of these organisations offer a good service. However, too many spend the resources provided by the Assembly building up their own profile rather than targeting them at the businesses that they should be supporting.

11:35 a.m.

The establishment of an effective common gateway is critical to the eradication of such empire building. Unfortunately, the report has failed to grasp the nettle and, to be blunt, failed to recommend the wind-up of Business Connect. The Committee had a number of discussions on whether it should be rebranded, reorganised or amended. However, the only conclusion that a radical report should have recommended was to learn from experience and wind up the

penderfyniad ar flaenoriaethau strategol. Nid oedd neb yn fwy uchel ei gloch na Mike German, Arweinydd Plaid y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Felly, o ystyried yr egwyddorion arweiniol a grybwyllais—y dylai'r Cynulliad ganolbwyntio ar sefydlu polisiau ac y dylai'r asiantaethau ganolbwyntio ar eu cyflwyno—ac o gofio safbwynt blaenorol y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog, hyderwn y byddai'r ddogfen hon yn galw am drosglwyddo'r dyletswyddau rhyngwladoli yn ôl i'r WDA. Yn anffodus, fodd bynnag, nid yw egwyddorion yn rhywbeth y glynwyd atynt gan y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ac aelodau eraill o'r Pwyllgor, ac yn anffodus nid yw hynny o fewn yr ymgynghoriad.

Yn ail, dylai'r ddwy thema ganolog a ddylai dreiddio drwy'r ddogfen hon ymwneud â dileu dyblygu a symleiddio'r asiantaethau a'u prosesau. O ran dyblygu, nid â wythnos heibio bron heb i etholwr neu ddyn busnes gysylltu â ni yn gofyn i ble y dylent fynd i gael cymorth a chyngor busnes. Mae llawer o asiantaethau a ariennir yn gyhoeddus sydd yn honni eu bod yn cynnig cymorth i fusnesau, gyda phob un ohonynt yn gwario llawer o arian y Cynulliad a chronfeydd Ewropeaidd i farchnata eu sefydliadau, eu cynnyrch a'u gwasanaethau. Adeiladant fïwrocraethau a chreant ymerodraethau sydd yn dihyssbyddu'r adnoddau prin a ddarperir gan y trethdalwyr. Nid oes angen i sefydliadau o'r fath gymryd yr ymagwedd gyffredinol fel y gwnânt. Peidiwch â'm camddeall, Lywydd, cynigia llawer o'r sefydliadau hyn wasanaeth da. Fodd bynnag, gwaria gormod ohonynt yr arian a ddarperir gan y Cynulliad yn datblygu eu proffil eu hunain yn hytrach na'u targedu tuag at y busnesau y dylent fod yn rhoi cymorth iddynt.

Mae sefydlu porth cyffredin effeithiol yn hanfodol wrth geisio dileu adeiladu ymerodraethau o'r fath. Yn anffodus, methodd yr adroddiad â gwasgu'r danadl ac, i fod yn ddi-flewyn-ar-dafod, methodd ag argymell y dylid dirwyn Cyswllt Busnes i ben. Cafodd y Pwyllgor nifer o drafodaethau ynglŷn ag a ddylid ei ailfrandio, ei ad-drefnu neu ei ddiwygio. Fodd bynnag, yr unig gasgliad y dylai adroddiad radical fod wedi'i argymell oedd dysgu o'r profiad a dirwyn y

organisation. At present, Business Connect is a mismatch of affiliated organisations without effective management and targeting.

The branch and organisation have lost all forms of credibility among the business community. I tabled a written Assembly question a short while ago about the activity of Business Connect. There were only 38 phone calls to one of its offices in north Wales, over a period of eight months. During a two-month period, another office did not receive any calls at all. That demonstrates the business community's lack of confidence in Business Connect. I appreciate that Pauline Kotschy, and the board at Business Connect, have made remarkable advances in recent times, and I hope that their experiences can be drawn upon in the new common gateway that should be established. Merely amending the existing procedure would not secure the confidence of the business community.

I am confident that the common gateway should be delivered through the Welsh Development Agency, properly targeted and properly accountable, with the services of an account manager to look after the interests of the client. I would suggest a structure using its regional offices, but would welcome the Agency's proposals for delivering duties. We must not be too prescriptive; we must give it the autonomy but ensure that it is accountable.

The second key theme is streamlining. From a point of principle, no matter how many resources are given to business support organisations, they will never be sufficient to meet the demand for supporting every business in Wales. That would be impossible, and managing expectation is an important element. Therefore, it would be better to use those scarce resources to cut the costs of all businesses by reducing business rates. The Assembly's proposal to introduce a local levy on business rates would be another nail in the Welsh manufacturing industry's coffin.

I mentioned the bureaucracies and empires being built among business support organisations. The funds used for that would

sefydliad i ben. Ar hyn o bryd, mae Cyswllt Busnes yn gymysgedd o sefydliadau cysylltiedig heb reolaeth a thargedu effeithiol.

Collodd y gangen a'r sefydliad bob hygreddd ymysg y gymuned fusnes. Cyflwynais gwestiwn ysgrifenedig i'r Cynulliad ychydig amser yn ôl am weithgarwch Cyswllt Busnes. Dim ond 38 o alwadau ffôn a wnaethpwyd i un o'i swyddfeydd yng ngogledd Cymru, dros gyfnod o wyth mis. Yn ystod cyfnod o ddau fis, ni chafodd swyddfa arall unrhyw alwadau o gwbl. Dengys hynny ddiffyg hyder y gymuned fusnes yn y sefydliad Cyswllt Busnes. Gwerthfawrogaf y gwnaeth Pauline Kotschy, a bwrdd Cyswllt Busnes, ddatblygiadau aruthrol yn ddiweddar, a gobeithiaf y gellir tynnu ar eu profiadau yn y porth cyffredin newydd y dylid ei sefydlu. Ni fyddai diwygio'r weithdrefn bresennol yn unig yn diogelu hyder y gymuned fusnes.

Yr wyf yn hyderus y dylid cyflwyno'r porth cyffredin drwy Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, wedi'i dargedu'n briodol ac yn briodol atebol, gyda gwasanaethau rheolwyr cyfrifon i ofalu am fuddiannau'r cleient. Awgrymwn strwythur sydd yn defnyddio ei swyddfeydd rhanbarthol, ond croesawaf gynigion yr Awdurdod o ran cyflwyno dyletswyddau. Ni ddylem fod yn rhy benodol; rhaid inni roi'r annibyniaeth iddo ond sicrhau ei fod yn atebol.

Yr ail thema allweddol yw symleiddio. O ran egwyddor, waeth faint o adnoddau a roddir i sefydliadau cymorth i fusnesau, ni fyddant byth yn ddigon i fodloni'r galw i roi cymorth i bob busnes yng Nghymru. Byddai hynny'n amhosibl, ac mae rheoli disgwyliadau yn elfen bwysig. Felly, byddai'n well defnyddio'r adnoddau prin hynny i gwtogi ar gostau bob busnes drwy leihau ardrethi busnes. Byddai cynnig y Cynulliad i gyflwyno ardoll leol ar ardrethi busnes yn hoelen arall yn arch diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu Cymru.

Crybwyllais y biwrocraethau a'r ymerodraethau a adeiledir ymysg sefydliadau cymorth i fusnesau. Byddai'n well gwario'r

be better spent cutting businesses' costs, so that they can rely on newly generated resources in an effective way and gain a competitive advantage. We need a cost-cutting agenda and a stringent look at how Assembly funds are received, directly or indirectly. The Welsh Development Agency, for example, funds a range of support organisations. I was astounded to hear during yesterday's Culture Committee meeting, that the WDA has committed £4 million towards the Wales Millennium Centre. Although I appreciate that the centre is a worthy cause, I am not convinced that the WDA is the appropriate funding route.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Your five minutes have come to an end.

**Christine Gwyther:** Earlier, I was pleased to hear Val Feld thank Alun Cairns for his contribution. It would have been nice if Alun would have been man enough to thank her for her contribution. Val Feld was responsible for this project, and the time and effort that she has invested has meant that she has done a good job.

We have ended up with a document that bisects the emerging national economic development strategy in several places. I am interested in spatial targeting and geographical targets. We will have to ensure spatial arrangements to deliver business support. I am a new member of the Economic Development Committee and, like poor Glyn Davies, I hope that my contribution will be appreciated.

The Minister will tire before I do of our endless argument about geographical targets. I hope that he will give in as quickly as possible for his own benefit. In the emerging strategy, we will doubtless see that some areas of Wales will need strengthened and targeted business support services. It goes without saying that the areas hit by the steel closures will need strengthened business support. However, rural areas also need special assistance. I am not only talking about Farming Connect, although that will provide a valuable service. Others in rural areas are in business. I am thinking specifically of the micro-business sector. I used to work in business support in local government in

arian a ddefnyddir ar gyfer hynny i gwtogi ar gostau busnesau, fel y gallant ddibynnu ar adnoddau newydd mewn ffordd effeithiol a chael mantais gystadleuol. Mae angen agenda gostwng costau arnom ac mae angen ystyried yn ofalus sut y ceir arian o'r Cynulliad, yn uniongyrchol neu'n anuniongyrchol. Arianna Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, er enhraifft, amrywiaeth o sefydliadau cymorth. Synnais i glywed yn ystod cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Diwylliant ddoe, i'r WDA ymrwymo £4 miliwn tuag at Ganolfan Mileniwm Cymru. Er y gwerthfawrogaf fod y ganolfan yn achos teilwng, nid wyf yn argyhoeddedig mai'r WDA yw'r llwybr ariannu priodol.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Daeth eich pum munud i ben.

**Christine Gwyther:** Yn gynharach, yr oedd yn dda gennyf glywed Val Feld yn diolch i Alun Cairns am ei gyfraniad. Byddai wedi bod yn braf pe byddai Alun wedi bod yn ddigon o ddyn i ddiolch iddi am ei chyfraniad hi. Val Feld oedd yn gyfrifol am y prosiect hwn, a golygodd yr amser a'r ymdrech a fuddsoddodd ei bod wedi gwneud gwaith da.

Yn y pen draw, cawsom ddogfen sydd yn rhannu'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol arfaethedig mewn sawl man. Mae diddordeb gennyf mewn targedu gofodol a thargedau daearyddol. Bydd yn rhaid inni sicrhau trefniadau gofodol i gyflwyno cymorth i fusnesau. Yr wyf yn aelod newydd o'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ac, fel Glyn Davies druan, gobeithiaf y gwerthfawrogir fy nghyfraniad.

Bydd y Gweinidog yn blino cyn i mi wneud ar ein dadl ddiderfyn am dargedau daearyddol. Gobeithiaf yr ildia cyn gynted â phosibl er ei les ei hun. Yn y strategaeth arfaethedig, gwelwn yn ddiamau y bydd angen gwasanaethau cymorth i fusnesau cryfach wedi'u targedu ar rai ardaloedd o Gymru. Nid oes angen dweud y bydd angen cymorth cryfach i fusnesau ar yr ardaloedd yr effeithir arnynt gan y gweithiau dur yn cau. Fodd bynnag, mae angen cymorth arbennig ar ardaloedd gwledig hefyd. Ni siaradaf am Cyswllt Ffermio yn unig, er y darpara hynny wasanaeth gwerthfawr. Mae pobl eraill mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn rhedeg busnes. Meddyliaf yn benodol am y sector micro-

Pembrokeshire. It was often said that if every small business in Pembrokeshire took on one person, there would be full employment in the county. Although that was a staggering statistic, it remains true today. Measures to support small business specifically include the small firms wage subsidy and regional selective assistance, or a variation of it. We should target peripheral areas where the notion of regional selective assistance is often not well known.

The future for Wales will always depend in part on successful inward investment projects. It is quite right that we put every effort into attracting larger employers who pay good wages. We must remember that and pay tribute to firms that stay in Wales and provide jobs. However, we must not lose sight of the micro-businesses, as they can mean life or death for their small communities, whether urban or rural.

I am agnostic as regards branding. The Business Connect Wales brand is respected in west Wales and, to a lesser degree, in north Wales. However, we must recognise that support for it is patchy in other parts of Wales. The consultation period will tell us what business thinks of the Business Connect Wales branding. We do not need to get side-tracked by that. It is the delivery on the ground that is key and vital. The only way that Business Connect Wales, the WDA or the common gateway—or whatever it will be called—will garner respect from the business community is by providing the support that those businesses deserve.

**Phil Williams:** We can issue this document for consultation with complete confidence. It is worth considering the nine months of hard work that all Committee members have put into the document, with the assistance of Jim Driscoll and Helen Usher. We were under pressure to rush out the business support review. Some bodies justified unnecessary inactivity, not to say laziness, by stating that they were waiting for the business support

fusnesau. Arferwn weithio ym maes cymorth i fusnesau mewn llywodraeth leol yn Sir Benfro. Dywedwyd yn aml y byddai cyflogaeth lawn yn y sir pe byddai pob busnes bach yn Sir Benfro yn cyflogi un person. Er bod hwnnw'n ystadegyn syfrdanol, parha i fod yn wir heddiw. Ymhlith y mesurau i roi cymorth i fusnesau bach yn benodol mae'r cymhorthdal cyflog cwmnïau bach a chymorth dethol rhanbarthol, neu amrywiad ohono. Dylem dargedu ardaloedd ymylol lle nad yw'r syniad o gymorth dethol rhanbarthol yn hysbys yn aml.

Bydd dyfodol Cymru bob amser yn dibynnu'n rhannol ar brosiectau mewnfuddsoddi llwyddiannus. Mae'n eithaf priodol y gwnawn bob ymdrech i ddenu cyflogwyr mwy sydd yn talu cyflogau da. Rhaid inni gofio hynny a thalu teyrnged i'r cwmnïau sydd yn aros yng Nghymru ac yn darparu swyddi. Fodd bynnag, ni ddylem anghofio am ficro-fusnesau, gan y gallant olygu bywyd neu farwolaeth i'w cymunedau bach, boed yn drefol neu'n wledig.

Yr wyf yn agnostig o ran brandio. Perchir Cyswllt Busnes Cymru yng ngorllewin Cymru ac, i raddau llai, yng ngogledd Cymru. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gydnabod bod y gefnogaeth yn fratiog mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru. Bydd y cyfnod ymgynghori yn dweud wrthym beth yw barn byd busnes am frandio Cyswllt Busnes Cymru. Nid oes angen inni gael ein harwain ar gyfeiliorn gan hynny. Cyflwyno gwasanaethau ar lawr gwlad yw'r hyn sydd yn allweddol ac yn hanfodol. Yr unig ffordd y caiff Cyswllt Busnes Cymru, y WDA neu'r porth cyffredin—neu beth bynnag fydd ei enw—ei barchu gan y gymuned fusnes yw drwy roi'r cymorth y mae'r busnesau hynny yn ei haeddu.

**Phil Williams:** Gallwn gyhoeddi'r ddogfen hon ar gyfer ymgynghoriad yn gyfan gwbl hyderus. Mae'n werth ystyried y naw mis o waith caled a wnaeth pob aelod o'r Pwyllgor ar y ddogfen, gyda chymorth Jim Driscoll a Helen Usher. Yr oeddem o dan bwysau i gyhoeddi'r adolygiad o gymorth i fusnesau ar frys. Cyfiawnhawyd diffyg gweithgarwch, diogi hyd yn oed, gan rai cyrff drwy ddweud eu bod yn aros am yr adolygiad cymorth i

review. We waited until we had a document of which we could be proud.

I welcome the recognition of the confusion caused by the plethora of business support bodies and the unevenness of support. To some extent, it reflects a series of initiatives, pilot schemes and good ideas that were never consistently applied throughout Wales as part of a coherent strategy. Thank goodness that we have the National Assembly to give this some shape.

I welcome many features in the report, especially the creation of an economic policy board. That will ensure a genuine partnership between the Assembly, the WDA, the Council for Education and Training for Wales, local authorities, all aspects of business and the unions, with the responsibility of the continuous development of the national economic strategy. I am tempted to say that, in the past, our main problem was not that we had an inadequate economic strategy, but that we had several different inadequate economic strategies. I look forward to having full co-operation on that.

I welcome the strengthening of the machinery to carry out the one-step gateway functions of Business Connect Wales and to ensure that, all over Wales, there will be a uniform quality of provision of expert guidance to small to medium-sized enterprises seeking support. I welcome the establishment of an economic research, monitoring and evaluation unit. The terms of reference of that body are only outlined, but I hope that it can monitor not only the success of the overall strategy but the quality of service delivery at local level.

11:45 a.m.

There is one area, which falls outside the direct powers of this Assembly. We learnt that the main proliferation, overlap and rivalry of services occurs locally. In the past, there were the TECs, the enterprise agencies, local authorities and, to some extent, the chambers of trade as well as the Welsh Development Agency. We must realise that

fusnesau. Arosasom nes bod gennym ddogfen y gallem ymfalchïo ynddi.

Croesawaf y ffaith y cydnabyddir y dryswch a achosir gan y gormodedd o gyrff cymorth i fusnesau ac anghysondeb y cymorth. I ryw raddau, adlewyrcha gyfres o fentrau, cynlluniau peilot a syniadau da nas cymhwyswyd yn gyson erioed ledled Cymru fel rhan o strategaeth gydlynol. Diolch byth bod gennym y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i roi rhywfaint o ffurf i hyn.

Croesawaf lawer o'r nodweddion yn yr adroddiad, yn enwedig creu bwrdd polisi economaidd. Sicrha hynny fod partneriaeth ddilys rhwng y Cynulliad, y WDA, Cyngor Cymru dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant, awdurdodau lleol, pob agwedd ar fusnes a'r undebau, sydd yn gyfrifol am ddatblygu'n barhaus y strategaeth economaidd genedlaethol. Caf fy nhemtio i ddweud mai ein prif broblem yn y gorffennol oedd nid strategaeth economaidd annigonol, ond y ffaith bod gennym nifer o strategaethau economaidd annigonol gwahanol. Edrychaf ymlaen at gael cydweithrediad llawn o ran hynny.

Croesawaf y ffaith yr atgyfnerthir y peirianwaith i gyflawni swyddogaethau porth un-cam Cyswllt Busnes Cymru ac i sicrhau y bydd ansawdd darpariaeth unffurf o arweiniad arbenigol i fusnesau bach i ganolig eu maint sydd yn chwilio am gymorth, ledled Cymru gyfan. Croesawaf y ffaith y sefydlir uned ymchwil, monitro a gwerthuso economaidd. Dim ond amlinelliad o gyloch gorchwyl y corff hwnnw a geir, ond gobeithiaf y gall fonitro nid yn unig llwyddiant y strategaeth gyfan ond ansawdd y gwaith o gyflwyno gwasanaethau ar lefel leol.

Mae un maes sydd yn syrthio y tu allan i bwerau uniongyrchol y Cynulliad hwn. Dysgasom mai yn lleol yn bennaf y lluosogir gwasanaethau, y mae gwasanaethau yn gorgyffwrdd ac y mae gwasanaethau yn cystadlu â'i gilydd. Yn y gorffennol, cafwyd cynghorau hyfforddiant a menter, yr asiantaethau menter, awdurdodau lleol ac, i



whereas the main agencies, such as the WDA, must support the major projects and drive the all-Wales strategy, SMEs expect a rapid response to their needs at local level. We would like to see—and we should do everything to encourage—more co-operation between the bodies that operate locally. Although it is outside our statutory powers, it falls very much within the powers of local authorities or independent agencies. The development in some areas of successful local partnerships for Objectives 1 or 2 is a positive step. It sets the framework that we should encourage so that instead of the past rivalry and overlap at local level we will have full co-ordination. Let us hope that within a year or two a much more effective system of business support will be widely recognised as one of this Assembly's achievements.

**Brian Gibbons:** I took part in this exercise when I was a member of the Economic Development Committee. It was an interesting and challenging job. It is difficult to separate this debate from the previous statement. Inevitably, when we discuss projects such as this we always begin with the negatives and how badly we are doing. It is important, for the record, to emphasise that we have created 50,000 new jobs in Wales over the last three years. Unemployment in Wales is at its lowest for a quarter of a century. Even against the more stringent criteria for reducing unemployment, we have reduced unemployment in Wales by 13 per cent compared to 9 per cent overall in the United Kingdom. As Mike German pointed out, manufacturing output is up by 3.5 per cent compared to 1.5 per cent in the United Kingdom. Exports are up by 8 per cent overall, 70 per cent of which go to the EU, which colleagues in the Conservative party will be pleased to note. The level of employment in manufacturing declined by 2.5 per cent in the United Kingdom, but it remained static in Wales, even though job losses at Corus may change that. However, up until that announcement, employment in manufacturing in Wales has been fairly consistent. Even more interesting is the fact that self-employment in Wales has increased

ryw raddau, siambrau masnach ynghyd ag Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru. Rhaid inni sylweddoli er bod yn rhaid i'r prif asiantaethau, megis y WDA, gefnogi'r prif brosiectau ac arwain y strategaeth Cymru gyfan, disgwylia busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint ateb cyflym i'w hanghenion ar lefel leol. Hoffem weld—a dylem wneud popeth y gallwn i'w annog—mwy o gydweithio rhwng y cyrff sydd yn gweithredu'n lleol. Er ei fod y tu allan i'n pwerau statudol, mae yn sicr o fewn pwerau awdurdodau lleol neu asiantaethau annibynnol. Mae datblygu partneriaethau lleol llwyddiannus ar gyfer Amcan 1 neu 2 mewn rhai ardaloedd yn gam cadarnhaol. Gosoda'r fframwaith y dylem ei annog fel y cydlynir y gwaith yn llawn yn lleol yn hytrach na'r gorgyffwrdd a'r cystadlu a gafwyd yn y gorffennol. Gadewch inni obeithio y cydnabyddir yn eang, fel un o gyflawniadau'r Cynulliad, system lawer mwy effeithiol o gymorth i fusnesau o fewn blwyddyn neu ddwy.

**Brian Gibbons:** Cymerais ran yn yr ymarfer hwn pan oeddwn yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Yr oedd yn waith diddorol a heriol. Mae'n anodd gwahanu'r ddadl hon o'r datganiad blaenorol. Yn anochel, pan drafodwn brosiectau fel hwn, dechreuwn bob tro gyda sylwadau negyddol a pha mor wael y gwnawn. Mae'n bwysig pwysleisio, a chofnodi, ein bod wedi creu 50,000 o swyddi newydd yng Nghymru dros y tair blynedd diwethaf. Mae diweithdra yng Nghymru ar ei lefel isaf ers chwarter canrif. Hyd yn oed yn erbyn y meini prawf llymach ar gyfer gostwng lefelau diweithdra, gostyngodd diweithdra yng Nghymru 13 y cant o'i gymharu â 9 y cant yn gyffredinol yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Fel y nododd Mike German, mae'r allbwn gweithgynhyrchu wedi cynyddu 3.5 y cant o'i gymharu ag 1.5 y cant yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Cynyddodd allforion 8 y cant yn gyffredinol, gyda 70 y cant ohonynt yn mynd i'r UE, y bydd fy nghyd-Aelodau yn y blaid Geidwadol yn falch o'i nodi. Gostyngodd lefel diweithdra mewn gweithgynhyrchu 2.5 y cant yn y Deyrnas Unedig, ond ni newidiodd yng Nghymru, er y bydd y diswyddiadau yn Corus yn newid hynny o bosibl. Fodd bynnag, tan y cyhoeddiad hwnnw, bu cyflogaeth ym maes gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru yn eithaf cyson. Yr hyn sydd hyd

by 3.8 per cent compared to a national decline in the United Kingdom. There are some positive things happening in the Welsh economy. It is important that we never lose sight of that, because if we are trying to create a new entrepreneurial spirit in Wales we must build on our successes as well as recognise our deficiencies.

In promoting individual business support in Wales it is important that it is simple to access the system. That is one of the document's key proposals, which is welcome. There must be a single point of access and it should be localised. It should not be situated, for example, in Penllergaer and Swansea, or in a regional centre in other parts of Wales. It must be situated in a local area, at least, in a local authority area. We should recommend that.

I am impressed that, for example, the Irish Republic, which is mentioned in this document, has areas of local access for populations as small as 36,000 or 50,000 for micro-industries, whereas the bigger industries go to Enterprise Ireland which may cover 250,000 people or more. There are lessons to be learned from Ireland on that point. The key issue is that we must have ease of access, particularly for micro-industries.

Another important point that is not mentioned in the document is that business people should have a right to a second opinion. If people are innovative or feel that there is a market niche and they get one source of advice, somebody may not detect the opportunity's potential and send the person away. Within the business support set-up, even though there should be a single gateway into the system, a person should have a right to ask for a second opinion if the first line of advice has not been supportive of their project.

The issue of the name has been brought up. There is much concern about Business Connect as a name, but in the Neath Port Talbot area—that so-called high-spending, inefficient, profligate local authority—

yn oed yn fwy diddorol yw'r ffaith y cynyddodd hunan-gyflogaeth yng Nghymru 3.8 y cant o'i chymharu â gostyngiad cenedlaethol yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Gwelir rhai pethau cadarnhaol yn economi Cymru. Mae'n bwysig nad anghofiwn fyth am hynny, oherwydd os ydym am greu ysbryd entrepreneuriaidd newydd yng Nghymru rhaid inni adeiladu ar ein llwyddiannau yn ogystal â chydabod ein gwendidau.

Wrth hyrwyddo cymorth i fusnesau unigol yng Nghymru, mae'n bwysig ei bod yn hawdd defnyddio'r system. Dyna un o gynigion allweddol y ddogfen, sydd i'w groesawu. Rhaid bod un man mynediad a dylai fod yn lleol. Ni ddylid ei leoli, er enghraifft, ym Mhenllergaer ac Abertawe, neu mewn canolfan ranbarthol mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru. Rhaid ei leoli mewn ardal leol, o leiaf, mewn ardal awdurdod lleol. Dylem argymhell hynny.

Yr wyf yn edmygu'r ffaith bod gan Weriniaeth Iwerddon, er enghraifft, ardaloedd mynediad lleol ar gyfer poblogaethau sydd cyn lleied â 36,000 neu 50,000 ar gyfer micro-ddiwydiannau, tra bod y diwydiannau mwy yn mynd at Enterprise Ireland a all o bosibl gynnwys 250,000 o bobl neu fwy. Mae gwersi i'w dysgu gan Iwerddon yn hynny o beth. Y mater allweddol yw bod yn rhaid inni gael mynediad hawdd, yn enwedig ar gyfer micro-ddiwydiannau.

Pwynt pwysig arall nas crybwyllwyd yn y ddogfen yw y dylai fod gan bobl fusnes yr hawl i gael ail farn. Os bydd pobl yn arloesol neu os teimlant fod bwlech yn y farchnad a chânt un ffynhonnell o gyngor, mae'n bosibl na fydd neb yn gweld posibiladau'r cyfle ac yn anfon y person i ffwrdd. O fewn y gyfundrefn cymorth i fusnesau, er y dylai fod un porth i mewn i'r system, dylai fod hawl gan rywun ofyn am ail farn os na chefnogwyd eu prosiect gan y cyngor cyntaf.

Crybwyllwyd mater enw'r sefydliad. Ceir llawer o bryderon am yr enw Cyswllt Busnes, ond yn ardal Castell-nedd Port Talbot—yr awdurdod lleol afradlon, aneffeithlon bondigrybwyll hwnnw—mae gan Cyswllt

Business Connect has an excellent name and is one of the beacon Business Connect organisations in Wales. The name is not necessarily the problem. The issue is how the organisation works. There is no point going into the trenches and fighting over the name. Whatever we think will market best is the way forward. It would be a mistake to say that Business Connect is a failure in all parts of Wales.

We should not underestimate the size of the problem that we face in encouraging indigenous business development particularly—this is where we are coming from—because even though people regularly mention the success of economic development in the Irish Republic and particularly the success of Enterprise Ireland in generating indigenous business development, the indigenous business sector in the Irish Republic is not a particularly expanding sector. If I am not mistaken, there was a slight contraction in the indigenous business sector in the Irish Republic last year. Much of the economic success in the Irish Republic is based on foreign direct investment. The issue of foreign direct investment is mentioned in this paper, which is important if we are to have a balanced strategy.

**Glyn Davies:** I will make a brief contribution because I know that time is short. The National Assembly's success depends on Wales' economic performance over the next few years. That is why the levels at which we set our national economic development strategy and our gross domestic product targets is a particularly important matter for me and other members of the Economic Development Committee. We must get those right because of the message that it will convey about the Assembly and its economic performance. This is one of the reasons why I am outraged whenever I see the Assembly using its resources for what I perceive to be unnecessary spending on other things. We must focus all our attention on developing the economy of Wales during the first few years of the Assembly's existence for it to be perceived a success.

Last week's Corus announcement was a huge

Busnes enw da ac mae'n un o'r sefydliadau Cyswllt Busnes mwyaf blaenllaw yng Nghymru. Nid yr enw yw'r broblem o reidrwydd. Sut y gweithia'r sefydliad yw'r hyn sydd yn bwysig. Nid yw'n werth ymladd dros yr enw. Beth bynnag y credwn fydd yn marchnata orau, dyna'r ffordd ymlaen. Byddai'n anghywir dweud bod Cyswllt Busnes wedi methu ym mhob rhan o Gymru.

Ni ddylem fychanu maint y broblem a wynebwn wrth annog y gwaith o ddatblygu busnesau cynhenid yn arbennig—dyma ein safbwynt ni—oherwydd, er bod pobl yn crybwyll yn rheolaidd lwyddiant datblygu economaidd yng Ngweriniaeth Iwerddon ac yn enwedig llwyddiant Enterprise Ireland wrth hyrwyddo busnesau cynhenid i ddatblygu, nid yw'r sector busnesau cynhenid yng Ngweriniaeth Iwerddon yn sector sydd yn tyfu yn arbennig. Os nad wyf wedi camgymryd, lleihaodd y sector busnesau cynhenid yng Ngweriniaeth Iwerddon rhyw ychydig y llynedd. Mae llawer o lwyddiant economaidd Gweriniaeth Iwerddon yn seiliedig ar fuddsoddiad uniongyrchol o dramor. Crybwyllir buddsoddiad uniongyrchol o dramor yn y papur hwn, sydd yn bwysig os ydym am gael strategaeth gytbwys.

**Glyn Davies:** Gwnaf gyfraniad byr oherwydd gwn fod amser yn brin. Dibynna llwyddiant y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar berfformiad economaidd Cymru dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf. Dyna pam bod y lefelau y pennwn ein strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol a'n targedau cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth arnynt yn fater arbennig o bwysig i mi ac i aelodau eraill o'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Rhaid inni eu pennu'n gywir oherwydd y neges y bydd yn ei chyfleu am y Cynulliad a'i berfformiad economaidd. Dyma un o'r rhesymau pam y cynddeiriogaf pryd bynnag y gwelaf y Cynulliad yn defnyddio ei adnoddau ar bethau eraill diangen yn fy marn i. Rhaid inni ganolbwyntio'n llwyr ar ddatblygu economi Cymru yn ystod blynyddoedd cyntaf y Cynulliad er mwyn iddo gael ei ystyried yn llwyddiant.

Yr oedd y cyhoeddiad a wnaethpwyd gan

blow in relation to the number of job losses. It is almost an even bigger blow in terms of the impact it has on the GDP per capita of Wales in the immediate future. The Corus announcement means that it is almost impossible to achieve our GDP per capita targets. The Minister for Economic Development must take that into account. The Economic Development Committee was right—I say that as an inexperienced new member of the Committee—to take on board this issue of business support in Wales. It is a hugely important issue that we must get right. There are one or two areas about which I have a degree of concern. Mid Wales deals with this issue efficiently and well.

11:55 a.m.

There is general agreement that Business Connect has been successful in mid Wales. That is also true of its predecessors. Exports and internationalisation through the Mid Wales Export Association were successful. That is another reason why I am concerned about the way in which internationalisation has been brought into the civil service. To some extent, it threatens the long-term economic prospects of mid Wales.

I agree with Val Feld's point about Alun Cairns. He has become a leading Welsh authority on this issue; a beacon of radical ingenuity and a guiding light, no less. It was a shame that we did not hear all of his speech. This is a consultation document that will return to the Committee, at which stage I will be more experienced in the Committee's considerations and will be able to address points with more authority.

Accountability is one point that must be addressed. I strongly support the concept of partnership. However, obfuscation of responsibility can happen. When we set up a new structure, we must be clear about who is accountable for what. The principle of Assembly Members deciding on policy, delivered by professionals and experts, must also be addressed. If we ask the Welsh Development Agency to deliver and manage the gateway, on which I think we all agree, we must be careful not to be too prescriptive, but ensure that the Agency is allowed an

Corus yr wythnos diwethaf yn ergyd enfawr o ran nifer y diswyddiadau. Mae'n ergyd fwy byth o ran yr effaith a gaiff ar CMC y pen Cymru yn y dyfodol agos. Golyga cyhoeddiad Corus ei bod bron yn amhosibl i ni gyflawni ein targedau o ran CMC y pen. Rhaid i'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd ystyried hynny. Yr oedd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn gywir—dywedaf hynny fel aelod newydd amhrofiadol o'r Pwyllgor—i ystyried y mater hwn o gymorth i fusnesau yng Nghymru. Mae'n fater pwysig iawn y mae'n rhaid inni ei gael yn iawn. Mae un neu ddau o feysydd y pryderaf rywfaint amdanynt. Mae canolbarth Cymru yn delio â'r mater hwn yn effeithlon ac yn dda.

Cytunir yn gyffredinol y bu Cyswllt Busnes yn llwyddiannus yng nghanolbarth Cymru. Mae hynny'n wir am ei ragflaenwyr hefyd. Yr oedd allforio a rhyngwladoli drwy Gymdeithas Allforio Canolbarth Cymru yn llwyddiannus. Dyna reswm arall pam y pryderaf am y ffordd yr ymgwymerwyd â rhyngwladoli gan y gwasanaeth sifil. I ryw raddau, bygythia ragolygon economaidd tymor hir canolbarth Cymru.

Cytunaf â phwynt Val Feld am Alun Cairns. Daeth yn awdurdod blaenllaw yng Nghymru ar y mater hwn; yn ddim llai nag arweinydd dyfeisgarwch radicalaidd a seren ddisglair. Mae'n drueni na chlywsom ei araith gyfan. Dogfen ymgynghorol yw hon a fydd yn dychwelyd i'r Pwyllgor, ac erbyn hynny byddaf yn fwy profiadol o ran ystyriaethau'r Pwyllgor a gallaf ymdrin â phwyntiau gyda mwy o awdurdod.

Mae atebolrwydd yn un pwynt y mae'n rhaid ymdrin ag ef. Cefnogaf y cysyniad o bartneriaeth yn gryf. Fodd bynnag, gall cyfrifoldebau fynd yn ddryslyd. Pan sefydlwn strwythur newydd, rhaid inni fod yn glir ynglŷn â phwy sydd yn atebol am beth. Rhaid ymdrin â'r egwyddor bod Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn penderfynu ar bolisiau, a gânt eu cyflwyno gan bobl broffesiynol ac arbenigwyr. Os gofynnwn i Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru gyflwyno a rheoli'r porth, y credaf fod pob un ohonom yn cytuno arno, rhaid inni fod yn ofalus nad ydym yn rhy

input in terms of its organisation. This is a crucial issue, which must be addressed and, following the consultation, I hope that we get it right.

**The Deputy First Minister and Minister for Economic Development (Michael German):** I start by thanking Val Feld, who had the inordinately difficult task of keeping a disparate group of people together over a long period, and for producing a report in which the members have confidence. I thank the Economic Development Committee as a whole, Jim Driscoll, the expert adviser and the support staff, whose hard and intense work in preparing the business support review I witnessed during visits to WEFO.

This review and the draft national economic development strategy, which we have just discussed, will become the subject of separate and concurrent consultations. There are strong links between the reports. They both start from a strong recognition of weaknesses in the Welsh economy, they both stress the need for a strong strategic vision coupled with clear objectives to co-ordinate and direct the considerable resources that will go into economic regeneration over the next five years and they both identify the need for a clear agreement of roles and responsibilities among the key players.

The business support review proposes the establishment of an economic policy board and an economic research monitoring and evaluation unit, either separately or together. Those bodies would help develop Wales's economic strategy and develop our understanding of the Welsh economy. As part of the consultation to set up the policy board and the evaluation unit, I would welcome views on their remit and their proposed make-up.

I am pleased to note that the report, while recognising shortcomings, reveals, in its findings, the real strengths of existing business support in Wales. In particular, it provides a strong reassurance for the Assembly that there is a diverse range of options available to suit the varying needs of Welsh business. However, the report's

benodol, ond ein bod yn sicrhau y caniateir mewnbwn gan yr Awdurdod o ran sut y'i trefnir. Mae hwn yn fater hanfodol, y mae'n rhaid ymdrin ag ef ac, ar ôl y broses ymgynghori, gobeithiaf y'i cawn yn gywir.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd (Michael German):** Dechreuaf drwy ddiolch i Val Feld, a gafodd y dasg anodd iawn o gadw grwpiau gwahanol o bobl gyda'i gilydd dros gyfnod hir, ac am greu adroddiad y mae gan yr Aelodau hyder ynddo. Diolchaf i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd cyfan, Jim Driscoll, yr ymgynghorydd arbenigol a'r staff cymorth, y gwelais eu gwaith caled a dwys wrth baratoi'r adolygiad cymorth i fusnesau yn ystod ymweliadau â Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru.

Bydd yr adolygiad hwn a'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol ddrafft, yr ydym newydd ei drafod, yn destun prosesau ymgynghori ar wahân a chyfredol. Mae cysylltiadau cryf rhwng yr adroddiadau. Dechreua'r ddau ohonynt gan gydnabod yn gryf wendidau'r economi Gymreig, pwysleisia'r ddau ohonynt yr angen am weledigaeth strategol gref ynghyd ag amcanion clir i gydlynu a chyfeirio'r adnoddau sylweddol a werir ar adfywio economaidd dros y pum mlynedd nesaf a noda'r ddau ohonynt yr angen i gytuno'n glir ar rolau a chyfrifoldebau'r bobl allweddol.

Cynigia'r adolygiad o gymorth i fusnesau y dylid sefydlu bwrdd polisïau economaidd ac uned monitro a gwerthuso ymchwil economaidd, naill ai ar wahân neu gyda'i gilydd. Byddai'r cyrff hynny yn helpu i ddatblygu strategaeth economaidd Cymru ac i ddatblygu'n dealltwriaeth o'r economi Gymreig. Fel rhan o'r broses ymgynghori i sefydlu'r bwrdd polisïau a'r uned gwerthuso, byddwn yn croesawu sylwadau ar eu cylch gwaith a'u cyfansoddiad arfaethedig.

Mae'n dda gennyf nodi y datgela'r adroddiad, tra'n cydnabod y diffygion, gryfderau gwirioneddol y cymorth presennol i fusnesau yng Nghymru yn ei ganfyddiadau. Yn benodol, rhydd sicrwydd cryf i'r Cynulliad fod amrywiaeth o opsiynau ar gael i fodloni anghenion gwahanol fusnesau Cymru. Fodd bynnag, nododd ymarfer mapio

detailed mapping exercise identified some 55 public sector agencies that are spending an estimated £150 million on business support. The report has shown that, throughout Wales, every company has, typically, up to 12 agencies available to help them achieve better results. That cannot continue.

While the report recognises the depth and diversity of support that a modern economy needs, it raises serious concerns about duplication of provision and unhelpful competition in the public sector. Once the strategic objectives of the national economic development strategy have been agreed, the Assembly must be decisive in agreeing roles, responsibilities and priorities with the key players and then ensure, where it has direct control, that resources follow these priorities.

I am worried that there is confusion among businesses about the entry point, or 'gateway', to Welsh business support. There are also concerns in some areas about the quality of the service. We need to achieve much higher usage of the business support gateway services, and to grow the demands for business support services in the public and private sectors. We need to ensure that there are more stringent quality controls and tighter contractual arrangements for those bodies that provide the gateway services. Ahead of the consultation, I shall ask Business Connect Wales to build upon its work of the past years, to focus heavily on raising the game for frontline services and to be aggressive in its pursuit of quality and value for money.

We are often asked to learn more from the business support systems in countries such as the United States of America, Ireland or England. It was encouraging that the Committee found that the range and variety of products available in Wales was similar to those in countries that are admired for their success in that sector. Those engaged in Welsh business support and the frontline Business Connect services should take heart from these findings and be pleased with the extensive support network and comprehensive range of services that they

manwl yr adroddiad ryw 55 o asiantaethau'r sector cyhoeddus sydd yn gwario amcangyfrif o tua £150 miliwn ar gymorth i fusnesau. Dangosodd yr adroddiad fod gan bob cwmni, ledled Cymru, yn nodweddiadol, hyd at 12 o asiantaethau ar gael i'w helpu i gyflawni canlyniadau gwell. Ni all hynny barhau.

Er bod yr adroddiad yn cydnabod dyfnder ac amrywiaeth y cymorth sydd ei angen ar economi fodern, cyfyd bryderon difrifol ynglŷn â dyblygu darpariaeth a chystadleuaeth annefnyddiol yn y sector cyhoeddus. Unwaith y cytunir ar amcanion strategol y strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol, rhaid i'r Cynulliad fod yn bendant wrth gytuno ar rolau, cyfrifoldebau a blaenoriaethau â'r bobl allweddol ac yna sicrhau y dyrennir adnoddau yn ôl y blaenoriaethau hyn, lle y mae rheolaeth uniongyrchol ganddo.

Pryderaf fod busnesau yn drysu o ran y man mynediad, neu'r 'porth', i'r cymorth i fusnesau Cymru. Ceir pryderon hefyd mewn rhai ardaloedd am ansawdd y gwasanaeth. Mae angen i'r gwasanaethau porth cymorth i fusnesau gael eu defnyddio llawer mwy, ac mae angen i'r galw am wasanaethau cymorth i fusnesau yn y sector cyhoeddus a phreifat gynyddu. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod rheolaethau ansawdd llymach a threfniadau cytundebol tynnach ar gyfer y cyrff hynny sydd yn darparu'r gwasanaethau porth. Cyn y broses ymgynghori, gofynnaf i Cyswllt Busnes Cymru adeiladu ar ei waith yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, a chanolbwyntio'n drwm ar wella gwasanaethau rheng flaen a bod yn ymosodol wrth fynd ar drywydd ansawdd a gwerth am arian.

Gofynnir inni yn aml ddysgu mwy gan y systemau cymorth i fusnesau a geir mewn gwledydd megis Unol Daleithiau America, Iwerddon neu Loegr. Yn galonogol, darganfu'r Pwyllgor fod yr ystod a'r amrywiaeth cynnyrch sydd ar gael yng Nghymru yn debyg i'r hyn sydd ar gael mewn gwledydd y'u hedmygir am eu llwyddiant yn y sector hwnnw. Dylai'r canfyddiadau hyn godi calon y rheini sydd yn ymwneud â chymorth i fusnesau Cymru a gwasanaethau Cyswllt Busnes y rheng flaen a dylent fod yn falch o weld y rhwydwaith

have created. The report, however, is rightly critical of the lack of consistency in business support across Wales and the need for more action-oriented partnership working. It offers a wide range of useful recommendations about how these partnerships and the work of Business Connect and its gateway services might be strengthened. They deserve careful study.

This consultation process goes on against the background of the establishment of the National Council for Education and Training in Wales and the other ongoing changes in the major business support agencies. I am anxious that we do not create unnecessary uncertainty for those delivering business support. I am therefore encouraging my officials and the key players to work together during this period to ensure a strong customer focus and high levels of service and to begin to map the future.

To sum up, I welcome this valuable contribution from the Economic Development Committee to the debate on Welsh economic development. I do not wish to be prescriptive. I want the consultation to encourage new thinking from all organisations and individuals in framing their responses. I would like to see as many responses as possible. I want responses not just from the big players or those already in the business, but from anyone who has a useful comment to make on this subject. I also thank the Committee for supplying me with a range of additional key questions that will help to focus the responses. I urge you to support the motion.

**Val Feld:** I am rather disappointed that we have only heard today from people who have already been part of the discussions—I do not blame anyone. I will be brief in my response, because I am conscious that we have heard from people who have been engaged with the Economic Development Committee in one shape or another. It often brings fresh thinking to a subject to hear from people who have not been engaged in previous discussions.

cymorth eang a'r amrywiaeth cynhwysfawr o wasanaethau a grëwyd ganddynt. Fodd bynnag, beirniada'r adroddiad, a hynny'n briodol, y diffyg cysondeb mewn cymorth i fusnesau ledled Cymru a'r angen am fwy o gydweithio mewn partneriaethau lle y canolbwyntir ar y camau i'w cymryd. Cynigia amrywiaeth eang o argymhellion defnyddiol ynglŷn â sut y gellid atgyfnerthu'r partneriaethau hyn a gwaith Cyswllt Busnes a'i wasanaethau porth. Haeddant gael eu hastudio'n ofalus.

Cynhelir y broses ymgynghori hon yn erbyn cefndir sefydlu Cyngor Cymru dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant a'r newidiadau parhaus eraill yn y prif asiantaethau cymorth i fusnesau. Yr wyf yn awyddus na chrëwn ansicrwydd dianghenraid i'r rheini sydd yn cyflwyno cymorth i fusnesau. Felly, anogaf fy swyddogion a'r bobl allweddol i gydweithio yn ystod y cyfnod hwn i sicrhau ffocws cryf ar gwsmeriaid a lefelau gwasanaeth uchel ac i ddechrau cynllunio ar gyfer y dyfodol.

I grynhoi, croesawaf y cyfraniad gwerthfawr hwn gan y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd i'r ddadl ar ddatblygu'r economi Gymreig. Ni ddymunaf fod yn rhagnodol. Hoffwn i'r broses ymgynghori annog pob sefydliad a phob unigolyn i gael syniadau newydd wrth lunio eu hatebion. Hoffwn weld cymaint o atebion â phosibl. Nid wyf am gael atebion gan y bobl allweddol neu'r rheini sydd eisoes yn ymwneud â busnes yn unig, ond gan unrhyw un sydd â sylwadau defnyddiol i'w gwneud ar y pwnc hwn. Diolchaf i'r Pwyllgor hefyd am roi imi amrywiaeth o gwestiynau allweddol ychwanegol a fydd yn helpu i roi ffocws i'r atebion. Pwysaf arnoch i gefnogi'r cynnig.

**Val Feld:** Cefais fy siomi braidd mai dim ond pobl a fu eisoes yn rhan o'r trafodaethau a glywsom heddiw—ni feiaf unrhyw un. Bydd fy ateb yn gryno, oherwydd fy mod yn ymwybodol y clywsom gan bobl a weithiodd gyda'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd mewn rhyw ffurf neu'i gilydd. Yn aml mae clywed pobl na chymerodd ran mewn trafodaethau blaenorol yn dod â syniadau newydd i bwnc.

I will pick up on the key issues raised. One major question is how to transform Business Connect into the single gateway service that we envisage, to ensure the same standard of service delivery and support across Wales. I am sure that that also raises issues for other services that we deal with. I am pleased to hear Mike say that his officials are already working with Business Connect and, presumably, with the WDA and other partners, to start that discussion now. We are all conscious that this will need to be put into practice and implemented as soon as possible. There is much that we need to do. The European funding programmes are coming through. We have been raising expectations. As others have said, businesses rightly want to move forward on that. It is important, therefore, that we get it in place quickly.

There have also been many references to partnership and the nature of partnership. We have been quite critical about the nature of partnerships. We are clear that the economic development agencies have been sincere in their wish to work in partnership. However, because the allocation of roles between them has been unclear, partnerships have unfortunately often led to competition rather than to a sensible use of resources.

12:05 p.m. **Error! Bookmark not defined.**

I turn to Christine Chapman's points about the role of the WDA. A message conveyed strongly to the Committee was that while people want the WDA to be our lead organisation, they also want it to be a little more open-handed in its attitude to partnerships, particularly those with smaller organisations at a local level and that partnerships at a local level have not worked as well as they need to work.

Alun and Glyn raised the question of exports. We spent some time discussing that issue. The document proposes that the decision on exports should be reviewed in due course, that targets should be set for the exports service and that it should have an advisory group that would bring in private sector organisations to work for it. It should also be located so that it has a commercially-

Siaradaf am y materion allweddol a godwyd. Un cwestiwn pwysig yw sut y gellir newid Cyswllt Busnes i fod yn wasanaeth un porth a ragwelwn, er mwyn sicrhau'r un safon o ran cyflwyno gwasanaethau a'r un safon o gymorth ledled Cymru. Yr wyf yn siŵr y cyfyd hynny faterion y mae angen i wasanaethau eraill ddelio â hwy hefyd. Mae'n dda gennyf glywed Mike yn dweud bod ei swyddogion eisoes yn cydweithio â Cyswllt Busnes ac, fe dybiaf, â'r WDA a phartneriaid eraill, er mwyn dechrau'r drafodaeth honno yn awr. Mae pob un ohonom yn ymwybodol y bydd angen rhoi hyn ar waith a'i weithredu cyn gynted â phosibl. Mae llawer y mae angen inni ei wneud. Mae'r rhaglenni ariannu Ewropeaidd yn cyrraedd. Cudasom ddisgwyliadau. Fel y dywedodd eraill, mae busnesau yn awyddus, a hynny'n briodol, i ddatblygu hynny. Mae'n bwysig, felly, ein bod yn ei sefydlu'n gyflym.

Cafwyd llawer o gyfeiriadau at bartneriaeth a natur partneriaeth. Buom yn eithaf beirmiadol o natur partneriaethau. Yr ydym yn glir y bu asiantaethau datblygu economaidd yn ddiffuant yn eu dymuniad i weithio mewn partneriaeth. Fodd bynnag, oherwydd na ddyrennir rolau rhyngddynt mewn ffordd glir, yn anffodus arweiniodd partneriaethau yn aml at gystadleuaeth yn hytrach na defnydd synhwyrol o adnoddau.

Trof at sylwadau Christine Chapman am rôl y WDA. Neges a gyflëwyd yn gryf i'r Pwyllgor oedd er bod pobl yn awyddus mai'r WDA yw ein prif sefydliad, maent hefyd yn awyddus iddo fod ychydig yn fwy llawagored yn ei agwedd tuag at bartneriaethau, yn enwedig y rheini gyda sefydliadau llai ar lefel leol a lle na weithiodd partneriaethau ar lefel leol cystal ag sydd ei angen.

Cododd Alun a Glyn fater allforio. Treuliasom beth amser yn trafod y mater hwnnw. Awgryma'r ddogfen y dylid adolygu'r penderfyniad o ran allforio maes o law, y dylid gosod targedau i'r gwasanaeth allforio ac y dylai fod ganddo grŵp ymgynghorol a fyddai'n gofyn i sefydliadau'r sector preifat weithio iddo. Dylai gael ei leoli hefyd fel bod ganddo ffocws cyfeirio



orientated focus. It is important that businesses feel that they are welcome and that the service is oriented towards their needs.

Alun also raised the question of legislation to cut regulations. I remind him—we discussed this at the Economic Development Committee meeting last week—that the Government is putting that in place. I was pleased that, by and large, he still supports our recommendations. Members may not know that he was so enthusiastic about the Economic Development Committee's recommendations that he announced them as the Conservative Party's economic strategy.

**Alun Cairns** *rose—*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. We are running out of time and I have been very patient.

**Val Feld:** Can you not take a joke, Alun? We have discussed the issue of branding often and it must be subject to further discussion. There are different opinions. Some people think that Business Connect, in the areas where it works well, has a reputation that can be retained. Others feel that a new start and a new gateway service is appropriate. That decision must be taken by those who deliver the services. Dafydd Wigley also raised the issue of the business ombudsman. Unfortunately, that was brought into our discussions fairly late, because Dafydd joined the Committee half way through its deliberations. My understanding, Mike, was that we promised that that would be a question asked in the business consultation. Therefore, that is not lost. It is a matter for further consideration.

I commend this report to Members. The Committee will consider it again once the statutory consultation with business is completed. I assume that will also offer an opportunity for the Assembly to further consider the final recommendations.

masnachol. Mae'n bwysig bod busnesau yn teimlo y rhoddir croeso iddynt ac y cyfeirir y gwasanaeth tuag at eu hanghenion.

Cododd Alun hefyd gwestiwn deddfwriaeth i dorri rheoliadau. Fe'i hatgoffaf—trafodwyd hyn yn ystod cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yr wythnos diwethaf—fod y Llywodraeth yn rhoi hynny ar waith. Yr wyf yn falch ei fod yn dal i gefnogi ein hargymhellion ar y cyfan. Efallai na wyr yr Aelodau ei fod mor frwdfrydig am argymhellion y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd nes iddo eu cyhoeddi fel strategaeth economaidd y Blaid Geidwadol.

**Alun Cairns** *a gododd—*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae amser yn brin a bwm yn amyneddgar iawn.

**Val Feld:** Oni allwch dderbyn jôc, Alun? Mae brandio yn bwnc yr ydym wedi ei drafod yn aml ac mae'n rhaid ei drafod ymhellach. Mae gan bobl farn wahanol. Creda rhai pobl fod gan Cyswllt Busnes enw da y gellir ei gadw, yn yr ardaloedd lle y gweithia'n dda. Teimla eraill y byddai'n briodol dechrau o'r newydd a chreu gwasanaeth porth newydd. Rhaid i'r rheini sydd yn cyflwyno'r gwasanaethau benderfynu ar hynny. Cododd Dafydd Wigley fater yr ombwdsman busnes hefyd. Yn anffodus, daeth hynny i'r trafodaethau yn weddol hwyr, oherwydd i Dafydd ymuno â'r Pwyllgor haner ffordd drwy ei drafodaethau. Deallaf, Mike, inni addo y câi'r cwestiwn hwnnw ei ofyn yn yr ymgynghoriad busnes. Felly, ni chollir hynny. Mater i'w ystyried ymhellach ydyw.

Cymeradwyaf yr adroddiad hwn i'r Aelodau. Bydd y Pwyllgor yn ei ailystyried pan gwblheir yr ymgynghoriad statudol â busnes. Cymeraf y cynigia hynny gyfle i'r Cynulliad ystyried yr argymhellion terfynol ymhellach hefyd.

*Cynnig: O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion adopted.*

### **Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion**

**The Minister for Assembly Business Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies):** Cynigiau fod  
**(Andrew Davies):** I propose that

*the National Assembly, under Standing Order No. 6.16, and in accordance with Standing Order No. 6.18, agrees to extend today's session until 1.30 p.m.*      *y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.16, ac yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.18, yn cytuno i ymestyn cyfarfod heddiw hyd 1.30 p.m.*

**The Presiding Officer:** Ten Members need to show that they support this procedural motion before we proceed to a vote. I see that we have that support.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae angen i 10 Aelod ddangos eu bod yn cefnogi'r cynnig trefniadol hwn cyn inni fynd ymlaen â'r bleidlais. Gwelaf fod y gefnogaeth honno gennym.

*Cynnig: O blaid 34, Ymatal 6, Yn erbyn 5.*

*Motion: For 34, Abstain 6, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Neagle, Lynne  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Chapman, Christine  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Lewis, Huw  
Pugh, Alun  
Wigley, Dafydd

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion adopted.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
Davies, David  
Halford, Alison  
Law, Peter  
Middlehurst, Tom

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 12.08 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 12.08 p.m.*

## Darlledu a Chyfathrebu Broadcasting and Communications

**The Deputy Presiding Officer (John Marek):** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of William Graham and amendments 2, 3 and 4 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

**The Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language (Jenny Randerson):** I propose that

*the National Assembly*

*welcomes the consultation exercise following publication of the British Government's White Paper 'A new future for communications', copies of which are available on the internet at [www.communicationswhitepaper.gov.uk](http://www.communicationswhitepaper.gov.uk); and*

*endorses the response by the National Assembly Cabinet, which was laid in the Table Office and distributed by e-mail to Assembly Members on 1 February 2001.*

I am pleased to have the opportunity to open this debate on our response to the Government's communications White Paper. The point of the debate is to allow early input from Wales into the proposals for new primary legislation at Westminster. Communications is not a devolved matter, but this is a case of the Assembly acting as a voice for Wales, as stated in the devolution White Paper. Wales's voice on this White Paper has been strengthened by the active involvement of the Culture Committee. I express my appreciation to Rhodri Glyn Thomas and other Committee members for their work in examining the White Paper in detail and in taking evidence from Welsh broadcasters. I found it useful to participate in that work.

I trust that Members have had time to, at least, dip into the White Paper and read the Cabinet's response. We are responding to Government proposals to legislate on an important field. We must take full advantage of this opportunity to draw attention to the issues of greatest concern in Wales. Methods of conveying information and knowledge have been revolutionised since the advent of

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd (John Marek):** Detholais welliant 1 yn enw William Graham a gwelliannau 2, 3 a 4 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg (Jenny Randerson):** Cynigïaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*yn croesawu'r ymgynghori sydd yn dilyn cyhoeddi'r Papur Gwyn gan Lywodraeth Prydain, 'A new future for communications'. Mae copïau ohono ar gael ar y rhyngwrdd yn [www.communicationswhitepaper.gov.uk](http://www.communicationswhitepaper.gov.uk); ac*

*yn cymeradwyo ymateb Cabinet y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 1 Chwefror 2001.*

Yr wyf yn falch o gael y cyfle i agor y ddatl hon ar ein hymateb i Bapur Gwyn y Llywodraeth ar gyfathrebu. Pwynt y ddatl yw caniatáu mewnbwn cynnar o Gymru i'r cynigion ar gyfer deddfwriaeth sylfaenol newydd yn San Steffan. Nid yw cyfathrebu yn fater datganoledig, ond mae hwn yn achos o'r Cynulliad yn gweithredu fel llais dros Gymru, fel y nodwyd yn y Papur Gwyn ar Ddatganoli. Cryfhawyd llais Cymru ar y Papur Gwyn hwn drwy gyfranogiad gweithredol y Pwyllgor Diwylliant. Hoffwn gyfleu fy ngwerthfawrogiad i Rhodri Glyn Thomas ac aelodau eraill y Pwyllgor am eu gwaith wrth archwilio'r Papur Gwyn yn fanwl a chymryd tystiolaeth gan ddarlledwyr o Gymru. Teimlais ei bod yn ddefnyddiol cymryd rhan yn y gwaith hwnnw.

Hyderaf i'r Aelodau gael amser i gael cipolwg ar y Papur Gwyn o leiaf, a darllen ymateb y Cabinet. Ymatebwn i gynigion y Llywodraeth i ddeddfu ar faes pwysig. Rhaid inni fanteisio i'r eithaf ar y cyfle hwn i dynnu sylw at y materion o bryder mwyaf yng Nghymru. Chwyldrowyd dulliau o gyfleu gwybodaeth a dealltwriaeth ers dyfodiad y ffôn, e-bost a gwasanaethau darlledu. Dyma

the telephone, e-mail and broadcasting services. They are the prime source of information on current affairs for many people. We must ensure that, in Wales, we keep abreast of these developments, because knowledge is power.

In drawing up the Cabinet's response to the White Paper, I first consulted my colleagues on the Culture Committee and was grateful for their views. I reflected on those and many of them are contained in the proposal before you. I also had the opportunity to talk to broadcasters in Wales and to the Welsh branch of the Independent Television Commission, to hear their views. Their input was invaluable.

I support William Graham's amendment 1 on the importance of S4C. I agree that S4C is important.

**Peter Black:** Are you concerned about the Conservatives' plans to sell off Channel 4 should they be elected? Even if they do not include S4C, that would directly affect S4C, because it depends so much on Channel 4 for its programming.

**Jenny Randerson:** I agree. As much of the programming on S4C comes from Channel 4, any sell off of Channel 4 would have a direct effect on the ability of S4C to provide a full range of programming throughout the week. Nevertheless—I do not know whether there was a conversion on the road to Damascus—for whatever reason, the Conservatives tabled an amendment in William Graham's name, with which I think we all agree. Therefore, I recommend that you vote in favour of it.

I also support Jocelyn Davies's amendment 4. A dynamic market is important to the creative industries in terms of widening access. We must acknowledge the huge contribution made by the public service broadcasters in supporting the arts in Wales.

I will not take you through the White Paper page by page because we do not have time. However, I am sure that you will have noted the mistake on page 102, where it refers to the five nations, rather than six nations, rugby tournament.

brif ffynhonnell gwybodaeth ar faterion cyfoes i lawer o bobl. Rhaid inni sicrhau, yng Nghymru, ein bod yn cael y newyddion diweddaraf am y datblygiadau hyn, oherwydd mae grym mewn gwybodaeth.

Wrth lunio ymateb y Cabinet i'r Papur Gwyn, ymgynghorais i ddechrau â'm cyd-Aelodau ar y Pwyllgor Diwylliant ac yr oeddwn yn ddiolchgar am eu barn. Myfyriais ar hynny ac mae llawer o'r syniadau wedi eu cynnwys yn y cynnig ger eich bron. Hefyd cefais y cyfle i siarad â darlledwyr yng Nghymru a changen Cymru o'r Comisiwn Teledu Annibynnol, i glywed eu barn. Yr oedd eu mewnbwn yn amhrisiadwy.

Cefnogaf welliant 1 William Graham ar bwysigrwydd S4C. Cytunaf fod S4C yn bwysig.

**Peter Black:** A ydych yn bryderus am gynlluniau'r Ceidwadwyr i werthu Channel 4 pe caent eu hethol? Hyd yn oed os na fyddant yn cynnwys S4C, byddai hynny'n effeithio'n uniongyrchol ar S4C, oherwydd ei bod yn dibynnu cymaint ar Channel 4 am ei rhaglennu.

**Jenny Randerson:** Cytunaf. Gan fod cymaint o'r rhaglenni ar S4C yn dod o Channel 4, byddai gwerthu Channel 4 yn cael effaith uniongyrchol ar allu S4C i ddarparu ystod lawn o raglenni drwy gydol yr wythnos. Serch hynny—ni wn a gafwyd trôedigaeth ar y ffordd i Ddamascus—am ba bynnag reswm, cyflwynodd y Ceidwadwyr welliant yn enw William Graham, y credaf ein bod i gyd yn cytuno ag ef. Felly, argymhellaf eich bod yn pleidleisio o'i blaid.

Hefyd cefnogaf welliant 4 Jocelyn Davies. Mae marchnad ddeinamig yn bwysig i'r diwydiannau creadigol o ran ehangu mynediad. Rhaid inni gydnabod y cyfraniad enfawr a wneir gan ddarlledwyr cyhoeddus wrth gefnogi'r celfyddydau yng Nghymru.

Ni fyddaf yn eich arwain drwy'r Papur Gwyn fesul tudalen oherwydd nad oes gennym amser. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch wedi nodi'r camgymeriad ar dudalen 102, lle y cyfeiria at ornest rygbi'r pum gwlad, yn hytrach na'r chwe gwlad.

I shall concentrate on three sets of key issues that we raise in our response. The first is about access to new communications technology for people in Wales. At present, the three digital television platforms provide uneven coverage in Wales. The take-up of digital television in Wales shows that its population wants or needs to take advantage of these services. Almost 30 per cent of Welsh households have signed up compared with 20 per cent of those in the UK as a whole.

12:15 p.m.

**Elin Jones:** A yw'r Gweinidog yn ymwybodol fod darparwyr teledu cebl yng Nghymru yn gwrthod cydnabod darlledu Cymreig a Chymraeg? Soniaf yn benodol am NTL nad yw'n darlledu S4C2 a thrafodion y Cynulliad ar deledu cebl ond y mae'n darlledu BBC Parliament yng Nghymru. A yw'n ymwybodol fod NTL yn darlledu Channel 4 ar ofod sianel pedwar yng Nghymru yn hytrach nag S4C heb, hyd yn oed, roi dewis i bobl Cymru ynghylch yr hyn y maent am ei weld ar y gofod hwnnw? A yw'n cytuno bod hynny'n annerbyniol ac a wnaiff warantu y bydd unrhyw ddeddfwriaeth yn sicrhau na fydd hynny'n parhau yng Nghymru?

**Jenny Randerson:** I agree with you. I am aware of that problem and we have a great deal of work to do. Our response incorporates those points. The problem you raised goes even further because, if you have cable or satellite you can get BBC1 Wales, but not BBC2 Wales, so you miss the delights of *Dragon's Eye* or the *Newsnight* opt-out at 11.00 p.m. Those are important issues, of which we are aware and which we wish to press with the Westminster Government.

Only around half of Welsh households can receive digital television through their aerial. Digital satellite is the only current option, in many areas, for those who want digital television. The analogue switch-off is an important issue for us, and I want to ensure that the three tests to be met before switch-

Canolbwyntiaf ar y tri set o faterion allweddol a godwn yn ein hymateb. Mae'r cyntaf yn ymwneud â mynediad i dechnoleg gwybodaeth newydd i bobl yng Nghymru. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r tri llwyfan teledu digidol yn darparu darllediad anwastad yng Nghymru. Dengys y nifer sydd yn derbyn teledu digidol yng Nghymru bod ei phoblogaeth am fanteisio ar y gwasanaethau hyn neu angen gwneud hynny. Mae bron i 30 y cant o gartrefi Cymru wedi ymrwymo o'i gymharu ag 20 y cant o'r rheini yn y DU yn gyffredinol.

**Elin Jones:** Is the Minister aware that cable providers in Wales refuse to acknowledge Welsh and Welsh language broadcasting? I refer specifically to NTL, which does not broadcast S4C2 and Assembly proceedings on cable television, but does broadcast BBC Parliament in Wales. Furthermore, is she aware that NTL broadcasts Channel 4 on the channel four space in Wales rather than S4C, without even giving people in Wales the choice of what they would like to see on that space? Does she agree that that is unacceptable and will she guarantee that any legislation will ensure that that does not continue in Wales?

**Jenny Randerson:** Cytunaf â chi. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r broblem honno ac mae gennym lawer o waith i'w wneud. Mae ein hymateb yn ymgorffori'r pwyntiau hyn. Aiff y broblem a godwyd gennych ymhellach eto oherwydd, os oes gennych deledu cebl neu loeren gallwch dderbyn BBC1 Cymru, ond nid BBC2 Cymru, felly byddwch yn colli rhyfeddodau *Dragon's Eye* neu raglen ddisodli *Newsnight* am 11.00 p.m. Mae'r rheini yn faterion pwysig yr ydym yn ymwybodol ohonynt ac yn dymuno eu codi â Llywodraeth San Steffan.

Dim ond tua hanner cartrefi Cymru a all dderbyn teledu digidol drwy eu herial. Teledu digidol yw'r unig opsiwn ar hyn o bryd, mewn sawl ardal, ar gyfer y rheini sydd am dderbyn teledu digidol. Mae diffodd analog yn fater pwysig inni, ac yr wyf am sicrhau y caiff y tri phrawf i'w cwrdd cyn y diffodd, a

off, outlined by the Secretary of State for Culture, Media and Sport, are met equally in Wales as in other parts of the UK. I hope that everyone agrees with that. We should not have to accept a second-rate service.

We have also flagged up issues on universal access to advanced telephony services. Telephone services, which are used by the majority, are essential to achieve full social and economic inclusion and should be made available to everyone on reasonable request, at an affordable price. The Government has undertaken to conduct research and monitoring to see whether there are inequalities in the penetration of the new services. We welcome the proposal that the new Office of Communications, OFCOM will be able to create, if necessary, a universal service fund to meet the cost of service providers. There could be benefits to Wales in this and we could help to ensure that operators roll out advanced services here.

The second set of issues relates to the content of communication, and public service broadcasting, in particular. The paper outlines the situation on television reception from England. Elin has already raised this issue in part. The Government has indicated a willingness to reconsider who receives the intended channels for its part of the UK. We welcome that and the Government White Paper's points about setting production targets for the main networks in the nations and regions. I support Jocelyn Davies's amendment 3, which asks the Government to devise a strategy that will improve viewer take-up of television from Wales. That amendment underlines what we said in our response.

The third set of issues relates to the structure of the new regulator, OFCOM. Currently, the Assembly is consulted by Chris Smith on the appointment of members to represent Wales on the bodies that regulate broadcasting. That has been one way of ensuring that the right appointee to represent Wales capably is chosen. We welcome the fact that OFCOM will be required to link and consult with the Assembly Cabinet and Committees. We suggest that it includes a member for Wales

amlinellir gan yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Ddiwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon, eu cwrdd yn gyfartal yng Nghymru fel y gwneir mewn rhannau eraill o'r DU. Gobeithio bod pawb yn cytuno â hynny. Ni ddylem orfod derbyn gwasanaeth eilradd.

Yr ydym hefyd wedi rhoi mwy o sylw i faterion ar fynediad byd-eang i wasanaethau uwch deffoneg. Mae gwasanaethau teleffon, a ddefnyddir gan y mwyafrif, yn hanfodol i gyflawni cynhwysiant cymdeithasol ac economaidd llawn a dylid sicrhau ei fod ar gael i bawb ar gais rhesymol, am bris fforddiadwy. Addawodd y Llywodraeth gynnal ymchwil a monitro i weld pa un a oes anghydraddoldebau wrth i'r gwasanaethau newydd dreiddio. Croesawn y cynnig y bydd y Swyddfa Gyfathrebu newydd, OFCOM yn gallu creu, os oes angen, gronfa gwasanaeth byd-eang i gwrdd â chost darparwyr gwasanaethau. Gallai Cymru elwa ar hyn a gallwn helpu i sicrhau bod y gweithredwyr yn cyflwyno gwasanaethau datblygedig yma.

Mae'r ail set o faterion yn ymwneud â chynnwys y cyfathrebu, a darlledu cyhoeddus, yn arbennig. Amlinella'r papur y sefyllfa ar dderbyn teledu o Loegr. Cododd Elin y mater hwn yn rhannol eisoes. Nododd y Llywodraeth barodrwydd i ailystyried pwy sydd yn derbyn y sianeli a fwriedir ar gyfer ei ran ef o'r DU. Croesawn hynny a phwyntiau Papur Gwyn y Llywodraeth am bennu targedau cynhyrchu ar gyfer y prif rwydweithiau yn y gwledydd a'r rhanbarthau. Cefnogaf welliant 3 Jocelyn Davies, sydd yn gofyn i'r Llywodraeth ddyfeisio strategaeth a fydd yn cynyddu nifer y gwylwyr a fydd yn derbyn teledu o Gymru. Tanlinella'r gwelliant hwnnw yr hyn a ddywedasom yn ein hymateb.

Mae'r trydydd set o faterion yn ymwneud â strwythur y rheoleiddiwr newydd, OFCOM. Ar hyn o bryd, ymgynghorir â'r Cynulliad gan Chris Smith wrth benodi aelodau i gynrychioli Cymru ar y cyrff sydd yn rheoleiddio darlledu. Bu hynny yn un ffordd o sicrhau y dewisir y penodai cywir i gynrychioli Cymru yn fedrus. Croesawn y ffaith y gofynnir i OFCOM gysylltu ac ymgynghori â Chabinet a Phwyllgorau'r Cynulliad. Cynigiwn ei fod yn cynnwys

on its board, a Welsh representative on its consumer panel, and a Welsh advisory committee.

I cannot support Jocelyn's amendment 2, which refers to a communications users' council. The structure suggested in the White Paper envisages a consumer panel and we ask for Wales to be represented on that panel, but consumer bodies are not concerned with regulation. Their role is to lobby the regulators and represent audiences' interests.

I have already pointed out to Chris Smith MP the need to work up the proposal that OFCOM should link with the devolved administrations in some detail. I have told him that I would be happy to be involved in this process.

During the last month, I have also had the opportunity to discuss the White Paper with representatives of the Royal National Institute for the Deaf. The RNID is concerned about pushing forward the pace and extent of subtitling on TV. It points out that subtitling is partial even on public service channels, and largely absent on the cable and satellite channels. The White Paper suggests that the Government is willing to move forward on subtitling as well. Members may be aware by now that Chris Smith MP published a report on this issue last week. The Department for Culture, Media and Sport carried out a separate consultation on access to communications with interest groups last year. I welcome the result of that report. The recommendations include a new target of 80 per cent for subtitling on digital terrestrial television within 10 years. This is an increase from the current target of 50 per cent. The report also proposes that legislation should be introduced to extend the obligations to cover the providers of cable and satellite services. We should back these proposals and urge the Government to ensure that OFCOM will have sufficient power to drive this forward.

I hope that the Assembly will agree that we have identified some key issues for Wales that deserve to be put back to Westminster. I ask the Assembly to endorse our proposed

aelod dros Gymru ar ei fwrdd, cynrychiolydd o Gymru ar ei banel defnyddwyr, a phwyllgor ymgynghorol o Gymru.

Ni allaf gefnogi gwelliant 2 Jocelyn, sydd yn cyfeirio at gyngor defnyddwyr cyfathrebu. Mae'r strwythur a gynigir yn y Papur Gwyn yn rhagweld panel defnyddwyr a gofynnwn i Gymru gael ei chynrychioli ar y panel hwnnw, ond nid yw cyrff defnyddwyr yn ymwneud â rheoleiddio. Eu rôl yw lobbio'r rheoleiddwyr a chynrychioli buddiannau cynulleidfaoedd.

Yr wyf eisoes wedi tynnu sylw Chris Smith AS at y ffaith bod angen datblygu'r cynnig y dylai OFCOM gysylltu â'r gweinyddiaethau datganoledig yn fanwl iawn. Dywedais wrtho y byddwn yn fodlon cymryd rhan yn y broses hon.

Yn ystod y mis diwethaf, cefais gyfle hefyd i drafod y Papur Gwyn â chynrychiolwyr o'r Sefydliad Cenedlaethol Brenhinol i'r Byddar. Mae'r sefydliad yn awyddus i wthio cyflymder a graddau isdeitlo ar y teledu yn eu blaen. Noda mai rhannol yw'r isdeitlo hyd yn oed ar sianeli gwasanaeth cyhoeddus, ac nad yw'n bodoli y rhan fwyaf o'r amser ar y sianeli cebl a lloeren. Awgryma'r Papur Gwyn bod y Llywodraeth yn fodlon symud ymlaen ar isdeitlo hefyd. Efallai bod aelodau yn ymwybodol erbyn hyn i Chris Smith AS gyhoeddi adroddiad ar y mater hwn yr wythnos diwethaf. Cynhaliodd yr Adran Diwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon ymgynghoriad ar wahân ar fynediad i gyfathrebu gyda grwpiau â diddordeb y llynedd. Croesawaf ganlyniad yr adroddiad hwnnw. Ymysg yr argymhellion ceir targed newydd o 80 y cant ar gyfer isdeitlo ar deledu daearol digidol o fewn 10 mlynedd. Mae hyn yn gynydd o'r targed presennol o 50 y cant. Mae'r adroddiad hefyd yn cynnig y dylid cyflwyno deddfwriaeth i ymestyn y goblygiadau i gwmpasu darparwyr gwasanaethau cebl a lloeren. Dylem gefnogi'r cynigion hyn ac annog y Llywodraeth i sicrhau y bydd gan OFCOM ddigon o bŵer i yrru hyn yn ei flaen.

Gobeithio y cytuna'r Cynulliad ein bod wedi nodi rhai materion allweddol i Gymru sydd yn haeddu cael eu rhoi yn ôl i San Steffan. Gofynnaf i'r Cynulliad gymeradwyo ein



response to the UK Government. I look forward to hearing Members' views.

**Alun Cairns:** I propose amendment 1 in the name of William Graham. After the first clause, add

*asserts and reaffirms the importance of Sianel Pedwar Cymru in the Welsh broadcasting sector;*

Although broadcasting is not a devolved matter, I welcome the opportunity to debate this issue because such matters have an increasing influence on individuals across the United Kingdom.

It is important that kind words are not spoken today and no action follows. This debate must have a genuine input into the Bill. I hope that the Minister will come back to the Chamber at a later date to advise the Assembly on the action that she has taken so that we can judge the extent of our influence on the process. Without that the debate has little purpose.

The Welsh Conservative Party intends to support the main motion and amendments 3 and 4 but not to support amendment 2 tabled in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

There is an unprecedented level of convergence between the new media communications. The ability to access the internet from your television set would have been a pipe dream a short while ago. The need to introduce legislation reflecting the speed of transition is critical to fostering a modern economy and the future of the broadcasting industry. The establishment of OFCOM can contribute to that. The demarcations between traditional broadcasting measures have disappeared and a joint regulator could support the industry by taking cross-cutting views.

The amendment reasserts S4C's role in this revolution. On this matter, I hope that all parties will recognise the last Conservative Government's commitment to Welsh broadcasting in both languages. It was the late William Whitelaw's actions, as the then Home Secretary, which led to the establishment of S4C, but we cannot forget

hymateb arfaethedig i Lywodraeth y DU. Edrychaf ymlaen at glywed barn yr Aelodau.

**Alun Cairns:** Cynigiau welliant 1 yn enw William Graham. Wedi'r cymal cyntaf, ychwaneger

*mynnu ac ailddatgan pwysigrwydd Sianel Pedwar Cymru yn y sector darlledu Cymreig;*

Er nad yw darlledu yn fater datganoledig, croesawaf y cyfle i ddadlau'r mater hwn oherwydd bod materion o'r fath yn cael dylanwad cynyddol ar unigolion ledled y Deyrnas Unedig.

Mae'n bwysig na ddywedir geiriau caredig heddiw ac na fydd unrhyw weithred yn dilyn. Rhaid i'r ddadl hon gael mewnbwn dilys i'r Mesur. Gobeithiaf y daw y Gweinidog yn ôl i'r Siambr ar ddyddiad diweddarach i roi cyngor i'r Cynulliad ar y camau a gymerodd fel y gallwn farnu graddau ein dylanwad ar y broses. Heb hynny nid oes llawer o bwrpas i'r ddadl.

Bwriada Plaid Geidwadol Cymru gefnogi'r prif gynnig a gwelliannau 3 a 4 ond peidio â chefnogi gwelliant 2 a gyflwynir yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

Ceir lefel digyffelyb o gydbblethu rhwng dulliau cyfathrebu newydd y cyfryngau. Dim ond breuddwyd fyddai gallu cael mynediad i'r rhyngwrwd o'ch set deledu ychydig amser yn ôl. Mae'r angen i gyflwyno deddfwriaeth yn adlewyrchu cyflymder trosglwyddo yn hanfodol wrth feithrin economi fodern a dyfodol y diwydiant darlledu. Gall sefydlu OFCOM gyfrannu at hynny. Diflannodd y darnodi rhwng mesurau darlledu traddodiadol a gallai cydreoleiddiwr gynorthwyo'r diwydiant drwy gymryd safbwyntiau trawsbynciol.

Mae'r gwelliant yn ailddatgan rôl S4C yn y chwyldro hwn. Ar y mater hwn, gobeithio y bydd pob plaid yn nodi ymrrwymiad y Llywodraeth Geidwadol ddiwethaf i ddarlledu yng Nghymru yn y ddwy iaith. Gweithredoedd y diweddar William Whitelaw, fel yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol ar y pryd, a arweiniodd at sefydlu S4C, ond ni

the influence of Lord Crickhowell and Lord Roberts during those pioneering years.

As a result of the Conservative Party's actions, Cardiff is recognised as the UK's second largest television base after London. Wales has gained enormously from S4C. The channel has raised Wales's profile via its Oscar nominations and the high value jobs it has created. When the Conservative Party wins the next general election, future funding is guaranteed despite of the proposed privatisation of Channel 4.

Although I said at the outset that broadcasting is not a devolved matter, the Assembly could have a critical role in encouraging, facilitating and enabling this sector of the economy to grow.

**Alun Pugh:** You mentioned the privatisation of Channel 4. Do you think that a privatised Channel 4 would be as successful as your privatised railways or steel company?

**Alun Cairns:** It would be as successful as the privatisation of the TSB, British Telecom and many other privatised companies that were previously receiving massive sums of subsidies from the taxpayer, that are now contributing to the Treasury via taxes on their profits.

12.25 p.m.

The Assembly will also have a role to play in preventing a digital divide in Wales. All sectors must have the capacity to enjoy its benefits. It must not become the preserve of the rich or of urban areas. Groups can gain benefits from digital broadcasting that were not available through the analogue system. These groups include the blind and partially sighted, as well as the deaf or hard of hearing. Jenny also mentioned these.

Broadband coverage such as the asymmetric digital subscriber line needs to be available in rural areas in the same way that the Assembly, through the WDA and the privatised British Telecom, encouraged the supporting of sites in mid and west Wales.

allwn anghofio dylanwad Arglwydd Crughywel ac Arglwydd Roberts yn ystod y blynyddoedd arloesol hynny.

O ganlyniad i weithredoedd y Blaid Geidwadol, adwaenir Caerdydd fel ail ganolfan deledu fwyaf y DU ar ôl Llundain. Enillodd Cymru lawer yn sgîl S4C. Cododd y sianel broffil Cymru drwy ei henwebiadau am Oscar a'r swyddi o werth uchel a grëwyd ganddi. Pan fydd y Blaid Geidwadol yn ennill yr etholiad cyffredinol nesaf, ceir sicrwydd ariannu ar gyfer y dyfodol er gwaethaf y bwriad i breifateiddio Sianel 4.

Er i mi ddweud ar y cychwyn nad yw darlledu yn fater datganoledig, gallai'r Cynulliad gael rôl hanfodol wrth annog, hwyluso a galluogi i'r sector hwn o'r economi dyfu.

**Alun Pugh:** Soniasoch am breifateiddio Sianel 4. A gredwch y byddai Sianel 4 wedi'i phreifateiddio yr un mor llwyddiannus â'ch rheilffyrdd neu gwmni dur wedi'u preifateiddio?

**Alun Cairns:** Byddai mor llwyddiannus â phreifateiddio TSB, British Telecom a llawer o gwmnïau eraill sydd wedi'u preifateiddio a oedd yn arfer derbyn symiau anferth o gymorthdaliadau gan y trethdalwyr, sydd erbyn hyn yn cyfrannu at y Trysorlys drwy drethi ar eu henillion.

Bydd gan y Cynulliad hefyd rôl i'w chwarae wrth atal rhaniad digidol yng Nghymru. Rhaid i bob sector fod â'r cynhwysedd i fwynhau ei fanteision. Rhaid iddo beidio â dod yn fraint y cyfoethogion neu'r ardaloedd dinesig. Gall grwpiau elwa ar ddarlledu digidol nad oedd ar gael drwy'r system analog. Ymysg y grwpiau hyn mae'r deillion a rhai â nam ar eu golwg, yn ogystal â'r byddar a rhai â nam ar eu clyw. Soniodd Jenny am y rhain hefyd.

Mae angen i ddarllediadau band llydan fel y llinell tanysgrifio digidol anghymesur fod ar gael mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn yr un ffordd ag y mae'r Cynulliad, drwy'r WDA a British Telecom a breifateiddiwyd, yn annog cefnogi safleoedd yng nghanolbarth a gorllewin

Cymru.

We need to understand that such initiatives will always be demand-led and that the role of the Assembly is to facilitate and encourage their use so that private investment will follow as a result.

Mae angen inni ddeall y caiff mentrau o'r fath eu harwain yn ôl y galw bob tro ac mai rôl y Cynulliad yw hwyluso ac annog y defnydd ohonynt fel y bydd buddsoddiad preifat yn dilyn o ganlyniad.

The Welsh Conservative Party supports the recommendation to spread reception of Welsh broadcasting within Wales. It also encourages Welsh broadcasting across the United Kingdom. S4C2 now displays the test card for much of the time and there is no reason why that airtime should not be accessible to other organisations to develop their programmes.

Mae Plaid Geidwadol Cymru yn cefnogi'r argymhelliad i ledaenu derbyniad darlledu Cymraeg yng Nghymru. Mae hefyd yn annog darlledu Cymraeg ar draws y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae S4C2 yn awr yn dangos y cerdyn prawf y rhan fwyaf o'r amser ac nid oes rheswm pam na ddylai amser ar yr awyr fod ar gael i sefydliadau eraill i ddatblygu eu rhaglenni.

We also support the need for Welsh representatives on OFCOM to ensure complete understanding of the opportunities we offer and the unique challenges in Wales.

Hefyd cefnogwn yr angen am gynrychiolwyr Cymraeg ar OFCOM i sicrhau dealltwriaeth gyflawn o'r cyfleoedd a gynigiwn a'r sialensau unigryw yng Nghymru.

**Owen John Thomas:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu fel cymal newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig

**Owen John Thomas:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 2: add as a new clause at the end of the motion:

*yn galw ar unrhyw ddeddfwriaeth newydd yn y maes hwn i ystyried yr angen am gyngor defnyddwyr cyfathrebu at ddibenion rheoleiddio yng Nghymru i ategu gwaith OFCOM.*

*calls for any new legislation in this area to take into account the need for OFCOM to be supplemented in Wales by a communications users council for the purposes of regulation in Wales.*

Cynigiaf welliant 3. Ychwanegu fel cymal newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig

I propose amendment 3. Add as a new clause at the end of the motion

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth y DU i lunio strategaeth, fel mater brys, sydd yn anelu at wella nifer y bobl sydd yn gwyllo rhaglenni teledu o Gymru, gan gynnwys y posibilrwydd o drosglwyddo signalau digidol o drosglwyddyddion Mendip, Ridge Hill, Dinlle Wrygion a Winter Hill.*

*calls on the UK Government to devise a strategy, as a matter of urgency, aimed at improving viewer take-up of television from Wales, including the possibility of the transmission of Welsh digital signals from Mendip, Ridge Hill, Wrekin and Winter Hill transmitters.*

Cynigiaf welliant 4. Ychwanegu fel cymal newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig

I propose amendment 4. Add as a new clause at the end of the motion

*yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd cynnal marchnad ddeinamig ar gyfer gwasanaethau cyfathrebu i'n diwydiannau creadigol ac yn cydnabod y budd y mae'r sector yn dod ag ef i economi Cymru.*

*recognises the importance to our creative industries of maintaining a dynamic market for communications services and acknowledges the benefits the sector is bringing to the modern Welsh economy.*

Croesawaf ymateb y Cabinet i'r Papur Gwyn,

I welcome the Cabinet's response to the

ac er bod Plaid Cymru yn cynnig tri gwelliant, nid ydynt yn anghytuno ag ysbryd y cynnig gwreiddiol. Cadwaf fy sylwadau yn bennaf at agweddau penodol ar y Papur Gwyn gan gyffwrdd yn unig ar ambell welliant.

Mae sianeli lloeren yn denu cynulleidfa gynyddol ac erbyn hyn mae mwy na 50 o sianeli ar gael, lle yr oedd unwaith bedair neu bump. Mae'r sianeli hyn, Sky ac yn y blaen, yn fusnesau rhyngwladol. Ni pharchant ffiniau ac nid oes ganddynt le i raglenni o ddi-ddordeb Cymreig nag i newyddion am Gymru. Felly, rhaid amddiffyn ein darlledwyr daearol, BBC Cymru, HTV Cymru ac S4C, a sicrhau eu bod yn cael yr adnoddau i gystadlu drwy gynhyrchu rhaglenni deniadol o safon. Yn y mater hwn, cytunwn ag ymateb y Cabinet.

Cyfeiria'r Papur Gwyn at bwysigrwydd ein gwasanaeth rhanbarthol a noda:

'Regionalism is the counterbalance to further ITV consolidation.'

Geiriau da yn wir. Ond er mwyn gwireddu'r dyheadau a fynegir yn y Papur Gwyn, rhaid bod yn siŵr bod y Ddeddf yn sicrhau parhad gwasanaeth rhanbarthol ITV, yn enwedig HTV Cymru. Mae perygl mewn gadael i'r farchnad reoli.

Sonia ymateb y Cabinet am:

'The Government proposes to streamline regulation.'

Fodd bynnag, rhaid sicrhau na fydd HTV Cymru, er enghraifft, yn diflannu i grombil sefydliad mawr fel Carlton. Rhaid sicrhau bod HTV Cymru, er yn rhan o gyfundrefn fasnachol Brydeining, yn cael ei annog i wasanaethu Cymru yn benodol.

Mae gwelliant 1 yn enw William Graham yn dderbyniol, ond beth fyddai'r berthynas rhwng S4C a Channel 4, pe bai Channel 4 yn cael ei breifateiddio, yn ôl bwriad plaid Alun Cairns?

**Alun Cairns** *a gododd—*

**Owen John Thomas:** Nid oes gennyf amser i ildio.

White Paper, and although Plaid Cymru is moving three amendments, none of them contradict the spirit of the original motion. I will keep my comments to specific aspects of the white Paper and will touch briefly on one or two amendments.

Satellite channels are attracting a bigger audience and there are now more than 50 channels available, where there used to be only four or five. These channels, Sky and so on, are international businesses. They do not respect boundaries and do not have any space for Welsh programmes or news. We must therefore protect our terrestrial broadcasters, BBC Wales, HTV Wales and S4C, and ensure that they receive the resources to compete by producing high quality, attractive programmes. We agree with the Cabinet's response on this matter.

The White Paper refers to the importance of the regional services and states:

Fine words indeed. However, to enable us to achieve the White Papers's objectives, we must ensure that the Act allows for the continuation of the regional services of ITV, especially HTV Wales. There is a danger in letting market forces rule.

The Cabinet's response notes:

However, we must ensure that HTV Wales, for example, is not swallowed up by a large establishment such as Carlton. We must ensure that HTV Wales, though part of the British commercial system, is encouraged to serve Wales in particular.

Amendment 1 in the name of William Graham is acceptable, but what would the relationship be between S4C and Channel 4 if Channel 4 were privatised, as intended by Alun Cairns's party?

**Alun Cairns** *rose—*

**Owen John Thomas** I do not have time to give way.

Sut fyddai S4C yn llanw'r oriau sydd ar hyn o bryd yn cael eu llanw gan raglenni Saesneg Channel 4? A fyddai angen mwy o gyllid ar S4C neu a ddylid anelu at lanw'r oriau hynny â rhaglenni Saesneg o ddiddordeb Cymreig a ddangosir ar hyn o bryd ar BBC Cymru a HTV Cymru? Os felly, byddai perygl i raglenni Cymraeg rannu'r un sianel â rhaglenni Saesneg am Gymru a gorfod cystadlu am yr oriau brig. Y perygl wedyn fyddai neilltuo popeth am Gymru i ryw fath o 'ghetto'.

Er nad oes gennym welliant at y diben hwn, hoffwn weld BBC2 Cymru Digidol, wedi iddo gael ei sefydlu tua'r hydref eleni, yn cael ei ddatblygu'n raddol i fod yn sianel sydd yn darparu'n bennaf raglenni Saesneg o ddiddordeb Cymreig. Byddai'n rhoi cyfle i ysgrifenyddwyr, dramodwyr ac eraill ddatblygu eu doniau drwy iaith arall Cymru ac yn ychwanegu at y nifer sylweddol sydd yn gweithio o fewn y diwydiannau creadigol a'r cyfryngau yng Nghymru.

Dylem oll ddysgu gwersi'r gorffennol a chefnogi gwelliant 2. Mae holl hanes teledu yng Nghymru wedi ei lywio gan broblemau daearyddol. Yn y 1950au, yr oedd pwyslais naturiol ar ddod â theledu yn fuan i bawb drwy Brydain, a chodwyd trosglwyddwyr yn y mannau priodol i sicrhau hynny. O ganlyniad, bu trosglwyddydd Gwenfô yn cario rhaglenni gorllewin Lloegr am flynyddoedd. Gadewch inni sicrhau y tro hwn fod gennym lais Cymreig cryf o'r dechrau a bod gan bawb yn ein gwlad y cyfle i wyllo'r holl sianeli Cymreig. Heb y sicrwydd hwnnw, mae bygythiad i ddemocratiaeth os na fydd newyddion am Gymru ar gael i bawb.

Rhaid i Gymru gael cynrychiolaeth gref a all ddylanwadu ar OFCOM. Cytunaf â'r awgrym sydd yn ymateb y Cabinet fod angen bwrw ymlaen â darpariaeth is-deitlo, nid yn unig rhwng Cymraeg a Saesneg ond hefyd fel gwasanaeth i'r trwm eu clyw. Rhaid cofio hefyd anghenion lleiafrifoedd eraill, fel y deillion. Mae angen gwella darpariaeth disgrifio rhaglenni ar eu cyfer hwy. Unwaith eto, mae perygl gadael i'r farchnad benderfynu ar faterion fel hyn.

How would S4C fill the hours that are now filled with Channel 4's English programmes? Would we need more funding for S4C or should we aim at filling those hours with English programmes of Welsh interest that are now shown on BBC Wales or HTV Wales? If so, there would be a danger that Welsh programmes would have to share the same of Welsh interest Wales and have to compete for peak time. The danger then would be the ghettoisation of Welsh output.

Although we do not have an amendment to this intent, I would like to see BBC2 Wales Digital, after it has been established around the autumn this year, being developed gradually into a channel that mainly provides English programmes of Welsh interest. It would provide an opportunity for writers, dramatists and others to develop their talents through Wales's other language and would add to the substantial number of people who work in the creative and media industries in Wales.

We should all learn from the lessons of the past and support amendment 2. The whole history of television in Wales has been led by geographical problems. In the 1950s, there was a natural emphasis on bringing television to everyone throughout Britain quickly, and transmitters were erected in the appropriate places to ensure that. As a result, the Wenvoe transmitter carried western England programmes for years. Let us ensure this time that we have a strong Welsh voice from the beginning and that everyone in our country has the opportunity to watch all the Welsh channels. Without that certainty, there is a threat to democracy if news about Wales is not available to everyone.

Wales must have strong representation that can influence OFCOM. I agree with the suggestion in the Cabinet's response that we need to move forward with subtitling provision, not only from Welsh to English but also as a service for those who are hard of hearing. We must also remember the needs of other minorities, such as the blind. There is a need to improve the programme description provision for them. Once again, there is a danger of letting the market decide on such issues.

Mae angen cynnal y gwasanaeth presennol ac ychwanegu ato. Mae S4C wedi profi ei bod yn bosibl cyrraedd marchnadoedd y tu allan i Gymru drwy werthu'n uniongyrchol i wledydd tramor. Rhaid adeiladu ar hynny. O gynhyrchu'r math iawn o raglenni, gellir codi proffil Cymru drwy'r byd.

Yr wyf yn falch o ddweud mai canlyniad ymgyrch gyntaf Plaid Cymru oedd plannu hedyn y cyfryngau Cymreig, pan agorwyd stwdio fach y BBC Welsh Region bondigrybyll yn 1937. Ni all unrhyw un wadu bod y fesen honno wedi tyfu ers hynny a'i bod yn parhau i dyfu. Dyfal donc a dyr y garreg.

**Delyth Evans:** Mae'r Papur Gwyn yn peintio darlun o ddyfodol cyfathrebu sydd yn gyffrous, yn wahanol i'r hyn sydd gennym yn awr ac yn cynnig sawl her i ni yng Nghymru. Croesawaf y modd blaengar, cynhwysfawr a deallus y deliodd Llywodraeth San Steffan â'r maes dyrys hwn yn y Papur Gwyn. Cymeradwyaf ymateb cadarnhaol Cabinet y Cynulliad.

Yr her i ni yw sut y gallwn sicrhau y gall trigolion, bywyd cyhoeddus ac economi Cymru fanteisio'n llawn ar y newidiadau mawr sydd o'n blaen. O ran teledu, gwneir hynny drwy fynnu cydnabyddiaeth uchel i bwysigrwydd teledu rhanbarthol, neu genedlaethol yng nghyd-destun Cymru. Mae'r Papur Gwyn yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd teledu rhanbarthol. Rhaid inni gadarnhau hynny a sicrhau ei fod yn gwbl ganolog i'r strategaeth ac i'r ddeddfwriaeth. Mae'n hanfodol bwysig bod gan Gymru, a rhaglenni o Gymru, bresenoldeb cryf pan y gall pobl ddewis o blith cannoedd os nad miloedd o sianeli gwahanol.

Rhaid inni wneud hynny, yn gyntaf, drwy sicrhau bod gan wylwyr ym mhob rhan o Gymru fynediad i'r rhaglenni. Hynny yw, bod y dechnoleg briodol yn cyrraedd pob cartref ym mhob rhan o Gymru, heb i gost rwystr hynny. Yn ail, drwy fynnu ymrwymiad ar lefel llywodraeth i ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus Cymreig yn Gymraeg a Saesneg, gyda chynnydd mewn cyllid i gefnogi hynny. Ac, yn drydydd, bod

The present service must be maintained and extended. S4C has proved that it is possible to reach markets outside Wales by selling directly to foreign countries. That must be built upon. By producing the right kind of programmes, Wales's profile throughout the world can be raised.

I am glad to say that the seed of Welsh media was planted as a result of Plaid Cymru's first campaign, when the small studio of the so-called BBC Welsh Region was opened in 1937. No one can deny that that acorn has grown since then, and continues to grow. Perseverance pays.

**Delyth Evans:** The White Paper paints a picture of the future of communications that is exciting, different to what we have at present and which offers many challenges for us in Wales. I welcome the innovative, comprehensive and intelligent way in which the Westminster Government has dealt with this complex issue in the White Paper. I endorse the Assembly Cabinet's positive response.

The challenge for us is how to ensure that the people of Wales, its public life and economy can benefit fully from the huge changes that face us. In terms of television, that is done by demanding a greater recognition of the importance of regional television, or national television in the Welsh context. The White Paper recognises the importance of regional television. We must endorse that and ensure that it is completely central to the strategy and to the legislation. It is crucially important that Wales, and programmes from Wales, have a strong presence at a time when there will be a choice of hundreds if not thousands of different channels.

We must do that, first of all, by ensuring that viewers across Wales have access to the programmes. In other words, the appropriate technology must reach every home in all parts of Wales, and cost must not be an obstacle. Secondly, by insisting on a commitment at government level to provide Welsh public services in Welsh and English, with an increase in funding to support that. And, thirdly, that space is earmarked on the

Ile wedi'i glustnodi ar y sbectrwm darlledu ar gyfer darlledu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus.

broadcasting spectrum for public service broadcasting.

Dyna'r tri phwynt canolog y dylem eu bwydo i mewn i'r Papur Gwyn. Yn ogystal, mae'n hanfodol hawlio presenoldeb cryf o Gymru ar OFCOM a'r corff defnyddwyr. Dylai'r Cynulliad fod yn gyfrifol am y penodiadau hynny.

Those are the three central points that we should feed into the White Paper. Also, it is crucial that we insist on a strong presence from Wales on OFCOM and the consumers' organisation. The Assembly should be responsible for those appointments.

Mae'r trwyddedau sbectrwm a gynigir ar ocsiwn i'r sector preifat yn codi pwynt pwysig. Yn yr hydref, mewn ocsiwn ar gyfer un sbectrwm radio, ni chafwyd cynnig am y drwydded i ddarparu'r sbectrwm yng Nghymru.

The spectrum licences that are auctioned to the private sector raise an important point. In the autumn, an auction for a radio spectrum was held and no bid was made for the licence to provide the spectrum in Wales.

12:35 p.m.

Gallai hynny fod yn broblem inni yn y dyfodol. Oherwydd natur ein gwlad, a'r potensial cyfyng sydd am elw masnachol mewn trwyddedau sbectrwm, dylem sicrhau bod y ddeddfwriaeth yn darparu ar gyfer mesurau arbennig i Gymru—ac i ardaloedd Lloegr lle y ceir amgylchiadau tebyg—a fyddai'n caniatáu i'r Cynulliad ymyrryd yn y ddarpariaeth sbectrwm os bydd angen.

That could be a problem for us in the future. Because of the nature of our country, and the limited potential that exists for a commercial profit in spectrum licences, we should ensure that the legislation provides for special measures in Wales—and for areas of England where there are similar circumstances—that would allow the Assembly to intervene in the spectrum provision if necessary.

Mae'n bwysig bod y ddeddfwriaeth arfaethedig yn cydnabod ein hanghenion yng Nghymru yn llawn ac yn ymateb yn briodol. Mae'n rhaid i'r Cynulliad sicrhau bod hyn yn digwydd.

It is important that the proposed legislation fully acknowledges our needs in Wales and responds appropriately. The Assembly must ensure that that happens.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am y modd cynhwysol y mae wedi delio â'r mater hwn. Mae hi wedi cyfrannu at drafodaethau'r Pwyllgor ac wedi gwrandao ar ei farn. Wrth gyflwyno ymateb y weinyddiaeth i'r Papur Gwyn, llwyddodd i gynnwys llawer o'r materion a gyflwynodd y Pwyllgor. Diolchaf iddi hefyd am gefnogi dau o welliannau Plaid Cymru. Canolbwyntiaf ar y gwelliant nad yw wedi ei gefnogi hyd yn hyn, ond yr wyf yn mawr obeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn newid ei meddwl ar hynny. Gobeithiaf hefyd y bydd y Blaid Geidwadol yn newid ei barn.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I thank the Minister for the inclusive way in which she has dealt with this issue. She has contributed to the Committee's discussions and has listened to its opinions. In presenting the administration's response to the White Paper, she has succeeded in including many of the elements that the Committee put forward. I also thank her for supporting two of Plaid Cymru's amendments. I shall concentrate on the amendment that she has not supported as yet, but I greatly hope that the Minister will change her mind about that. I also hope that the Conservative Party will change its opinion.

Rhaid inni weld y Papur Gwyn hwn yng nghyd-destun yr hyn sydd yn digwydd yn y byd cyfathrebu. Mae chwyldro digidol ar droed. Bwriad y Llywodraeth, yn ôl y Papur

We must view this White Paper in the context of what is happening in the world of communications. There is a digital revolution afoot. The Government's intention, according

Gwyn, yw sicrhau mynediad i bawb i ddewis eang o wasanaethau cyfathrebu a darlledu. Mae'n cyfeirio hefyd at reoleiddio yn benodol. Mae awgrym pendant yn y Papur Gwyn y sefydlir strwythur newydd o dan y teitl 'OFCOM'. Bydd OFCOM yn ymgymryd â dyletswyddau presennol y Comisiwn Teledu Annibynnol. Mae'n rhaid cydnabod y gwaith y mae'r Comisiwn Teledu Annibynnol yng Nghymru wedi ei wneud o ran arolygu safon a chynnwys rhaglenni.

Fodd bynnag, yn y farchnad ddigidol newydd hon, bydd cyfrifoldebau OFCOM yn ymwneud â rheoleiddio'r farchnad, yn hytrach na chynnwys y rhaglenni. Caiff y cyfrifoldeb am reoleiddio cynnwys y rhaglenni ei fwrw yn ôl ar y darlledwyr eu hunain. Golyga hynny hunan-reoleiddio. Soniodd y Gweinidog fod angen cynrychiolydd o Gymru ar y panel defnyddwyr a sefydlir yn Llundain. A ydym ni yng Nghynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, a ninnau wedi cael datganoli gwleidyddol, yn dweud mai'r cyfan sydd ei angen i ddiogelu safon ac ansawdd rhaglenni yng Nghymru yw un cynrychiolydd ar y panel defnyddwyr hwn yn Llundain? A ddywedwn fod anghenion darlledu a chyfathrebu Cymru mor debyg i rai gweddill Prydain fel mai dim ond un llais ar banel yn Llundain sydd ei eisiau arnom? Mae gwelliant 2 Plaid Cymru yn diogelu buddiannau gwylwyr a sicrhau ansawdd rhaglenni yng Nghymru. Mae angen corff neu banel ymgynghorol yng Nghymru a fydd yn ddigon dylanwadol ac yn gallu ymyrryd a sicrhau bod OFCOM yn ymateb i anghenion gwylwyr Cymru.

Mae'r darlledwyr eu hunain yn cyfeirio at hynny yn eu hymatebion i'r broses ymgynghori. Dywed S4C:

'Between them, OFCOM and the National Assembly need to be able to draw upon expert sources of advice to reflect the distinctively Welsh issues surrounding the development of advanced telecommunications networks which can then be fed into OFCOM's policies and regulatory activities at a UK level.'

Galwaf ar y Gweinidog i ailystyried ei gwrthwynebiad i welliant 2, sydd yn welliant holl bwysig.

In this decade we will see a move towards self-regulation by broadcasters, multi-choice

to the White Paper, is to ensure access for all to a wide choice of communications and broadcasting services. It also refers specifically to regulation. There is a definite suggestion in the White Paper that a new structure will be established under the title 'OFCOM'. OFCOM will assume the present duties of the Independent Television Commission. The work that the Independent Television Commission in Wales has done in overseeing the standard and content of programmes must be acknowledged.

However, in this new digital market, OFCOM's responsibilities will be concerned with regulation of the market, as opposed to programme content. The responsibility for regulating programme content will be thrown back onto the broadcasters themselves. That will mean self-regulation. The Minister talked about the need for a representative from Wales on the consumer panel to be established in London. Are we in the National Assembly for Wales, after achieving political devolution, saying that all we need to safeguard the standard and quality of programmes in Wales is one representative on this consumer panel in London? Are we saying that the needs of broadcasting and communications in Wales are so similar to those in the rest of Britain that we only want one voice on a panel in London? Plaid Cymru's amendment 2 safeguards the interests of viewers and ensures the quality of programmes in Wales. We need a consultative body or panel in Wales that will have sufficient influence and will be able to intervene and ensure that OFCOM responds to the needs of the viewers of Wales.

The broadcasters themselves refer to that in their responses to the consultation exercise. S4C says:

I call on the Minister to reconsider her opposition to amendment 2, which is a vital amendment.

Yn ystod y degawd hwn gwelwn symudiad tuag at hunanreoleiddio gan ddarlledwyr,



viewing opportunities and the convergence of services. We have this opportunity to safeguard the interests of Wales and the Welsh people. I urge you to support Plaid Cymru's amendments 2, 3 and 4 to ensure that we are able to position ourselves so that the digital gap does not broaden in Wales. It is interesting that the Conservative party's amendment 1 does not refer to S4C as a public broadcaster. It may be a Freudian slip.

**Karen Sinclair:** I wish to highlight a few pressing issues that need to be addressed with regard to equal access to digital television for people with sensory impairment, as we move from analogue to digital. Teletext is imperative for people with a hearing impediment and technology exists for audio description for people with a sight impediment. The right way to ensure that the industry delivers on these issues is through the new regulatory body. This new regulatory body should ensure that proper weight is given, within the granting of licences, to the special needs of people with disabilities. I know that that is mentioned, but specific detail must be included to ensure that the obligations for accessibility are clear. Targets with specific timescales are a must, as are regulatory powers regarding disabled access. They will create a level playing field between companies who will then be obligated rather than encouraged to be as inclusive as technology allows.

**Lorraine Barrett:** There is a great deal I want to say about digital technology giving us the opportunity to promote and sell our home-produced programmes to the UK and beyond. Time constraints prevent that, but there was much discussion on this in the Culture Committee when we debated this paper. I will concentrate on equal opportunities for everyone to receive the best television service possible. Karen opened up that debate nicely for me. I expect that we have all been approached by the Royal National Institute for the Blind making the case for audio description—as Karen mentioned—to be universally available for blind and partially sighted people. I have heard of audio describing for live theatre, but I had not realised that it was available for

cyfleoedd gwylio amlddewis a gwasanaethau'n cydblethu. Mae gennym y cyfle hwn i ddiogelu buddiannau Cymru a phobl Cymru. Pwysaf arnoch i gefnogi gwelliannau 2, 3 a 4 Plaid Cymru i sicrhau y gallwn roi ein hunain mewn sefyllfa fel na fydd y gagendor digidol yn ehangu yng Nghymru. Mae'n ddiddorol nad yw gwelliant 1 y blaid Geidwadol yn cyfeirio at S4C fel darlledwr cyhoeddus. Efallai mai llithriad Freudaid yw hyn.

**Karen Sinclair:** Dymunaf amlygu rhai materion brys y mae angen mynd i'r afael â hwy o ran mynediad cyfartal i deledu digidol ar gyfer pobl â nam ar eu synhwyrau, wrth inni symud o analog i ddigidol. Mae teletext yn hanfodol ar gyfer pobl â nam ar eu clyw ac mae technoleg yn bodoli i ddarparu disgrifiad sain ar gyfer pobl â nam ar eu golwg. Y ffordd gywir i sicrhau bod y diwydiant yn gweithredu ar y materion hyn yw drwy'r corff rheoleiddio newydd. Dylai'r corff rheoleiddio newydd hwn sicrhau y rhoddir pwyslais digonol, o fewn y broses o gyflwyno trwyddedau, ar anghenion arbennig pobl ag anabledau. Gwn y crybwyllir hynny, ond rhaid cynnwys manylion penodol i sicrhau bod y rhwymedigaethau ar gyfer hygyrchedd yn glir. Rhaid cael targedau ag amserlenni penodol, a phwerau rheoliadol yn ymwneud â mynediad i'r anabl. Byddant yn creu cyfleoedd cyfartal i gwmnïau a fydd wedyn yn rhwymedig yn hytrach na chael eu hannog i fod mor gynhwysol ag y mae technoleg yn ei ganiatáu.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Mae llawer iawn yr hoffwn ei ddweud am dechnoleg ddigidol yn rhoi'r cyfle inni hyrwyddo a gwerthu'r rhaglenni a gynhyrchwyd gennym ni i'r DU a thu hwnt. Mae cyfyngiadau amser yn rhwystro hynny, ond cafwyd llawer o drafodaeth ar hyn yn y Pwyllgor Diwylliant pan gafwyd dadl ar y papur hwn. Canolbwyntiaf ar gyfle cyfartal i bawb dderbyn y gwasanaeth teledu gorau posibl. Agorodd Karen y ddadl honno yn dda imi. Mae'n siŵr bod Sefydliad Cenedlaethol Brenhinol y Deillion wedi cysylltu â phawb ohonom yn cyflwyno'r achos dros sicrhau bod disgrifiad sain—fel y crybwyllodd Karen—ar gael yn fyd-eang i bobl ddall a rhai â nam ar eu golwg. Yr wyf wedi clywed am ddisgrifiadau sain ar gyfer theatr fyw, ond

television. When I first thought about it, I presumed that listening to a television programme or drama such as *Coronation Street* or *Nuts and Bolts*, would be the same as listening to a radio programme. However, I then tried just listening to a few television programmes and found it to be entirely different. On the radio, every second contains words to convey a visual impression, and sound effects are used in radio plays for example. I hope that we will not miss this opportunity to open up the world of television—good or bad, the choice exists—for people with visual impairments.

The Minister and Karen mentioned subtitling. I often use it on Welsh language programmes and I give *Pobol y Cwm* another plug. However, I also use subtitling because I have a hearing impairment. It makes watching certain programmes more comfortable without having to blast my poor neighbour. The Royal National Institute for the Deaf hopes for 100 per cent subtitling within 10 years of digitalisation. I do not know if that is realistic and I know that Chris Smith—as the Minister mentioned—aims for 80 per cent in this paper. However, the RNID has made a sensible suggestion that when subtitling is produced for a programme, it should be made available to all broadcast deliverers. At the moment, satellite and cable channels are not required by legislation to provide any subtitling. I hope that the Minister will emphasise that in our submission to Chris Smith.

I make no excuse for covering areas that have already been mentioned. Everyone has mentioned people with visual or hearing impairments. If we are serious about equal opportunities in the fuller sense, there is no stronger and more effective means of communication than through the broadcasting media. There is also nothing lonelier than being deaf or blind. We must do everything we can to ensure that those with such disabilities not only enjoy the entertainment programmes, but participate as fully as possible in worldwide news and current affairs in the same way that we do.

12:45 p.m.

ni sylweddolais ei fod ar gael ar gyfer y teledu. Pan feddyliais am hyn i ddechrau, cymerais yn ganiataol y byddai gwrando ar raglen deledu neu ddrama fel *Coronation Street* neu *Nuts and Bolts*, yr un fath â gwrando ar raglen ar y radio. Fodd bynnag, wedyn ceisiais wrando ar ychydig o raglenni teledu a gweld ei fod yn hollol wahanol. Ar y radio, mae pob eiliad yn cynnwys geiriau i gyfleu argraff weledol, a defnyddir effeithiau sain mewn dramâu radio er enghraifft. Gobeithio na chollwn y cyfle hwn i agor byd teledu—boed yn dda neu'n ddrwg, mae'r dewis yn bodoli—ar gyfer pobl â nam ar eu golwg.

Crybwyllwyd isdeitlo gan y Gweinidog a Karen. Byddaf yn ei ddefnyddio'n aml ar raglenni Cymraeg a rhoddaf ganmoliaeth i *Pobol y Cwm* unwaith eto. Fodd bynnag, defnyddiaf isdeitlo hefyd oherwydd bod gennyf nam ar fy nghlyw. Bydd gwyllo rhai rhaglenni yn fwy cyfforddus oherwydd hyn heb orfod byddaru fy nghymydog druan. Gobaith Sefydliad Cenedlaethol Brenhinol Pobl Fyddar yw cael 100 y cant o isdeitlo o fewn 10 mlynedd o ddigidoleiddio. Ni wn a yw hyn yn realistig a gwn fod Chris Smith—fel y nododd y Gweinidog—yn anelu at 80 y cant yn y papur hwn. Fodd bynnag, gwnaeth yr RNID awgrym synhwyrol y dylai is-deitlo, gaiff ei gynhyrchu ar gyfer rhaglen, fod ar gael i bob darlledwr. Ar hyn o bryd, nid yw'n ofynnol i sianeli lloeren a chebl yn ôl deddfwriaeth ddarparu unrhyw isdeitlo. Gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn pwysleisio hynny yn ein cyflwyniad i Chris Smith.

Ni wnafr unrhyw esgus dros gwmpasu meysydd a grybwyllwyd eisoes. Mae pawb wedi sôn am bobl â nam ar eu golwg neu eu clyw. Os ydym o ddifrif ynglŷn â chyfleoedd cyfartal yn yr ystyr lawnaf, ni cheir ffordd gryfach a mwy effeithiol o gyfathrebu na thrwy'r cyfryngau darlledu. Hefyd ni cheir unrhyw beth mwy unig na bod yn fyddar neu'n ddall. Rhaid inni wneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i sicrhau bod y rhai hynny ag anableddau nid yn unig yn mwynhau'r rhaglenni adloniant, ond hefyd yn cymryd rhan mor llawn â phosibl mewn newyddion a materion cyfoes byd-eang yn yr un ffordd ag y gwnawn ni.

**The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies):** This is the second time that the Assembly has debated broadcasting and telecommunications issues. These are clearly not devolved responsibilities and there are those who say that we should spend more time taking action on areas for which we are responsible. However, as Members have already indicated, we would be neglecting our duty if we had not seized this opportunity to respond to the Government's White Paper. We commend the Cabinet's response to that paper to you.

This year marks the hundredth anniversary of the first transatlantic radio broadcast. It also marks the twentieth anniversary of the Broadcasting Act 1981, which established S4C. In 2001, we are already in the dot.com age with advanced telephony and multi-channel television becoming a reality for all.

I thank Members for their comments. We ask the Assembly, as Jenny Randerson said earlier, to endorse the Cabinet's paper. I propose to send a copy of today's proceedings to Ministers at Westminster so that they are aware of the breadth of views in this Chamber.

Alun Cairns made a point about reporting back to the Assembly. The Cabinet is happy to report back, not simply on its own response, but also on the Westminster Government's response to the consultation. I suggest that Alun needs to look in more detail at the impact of the sell-off of Channel 4. It is more complex than simply funding. S4C receives much of its programming from Channel 4 and its privatisation may well have major and significant implications for S4C.

**Alun Cairns:** I assure the Minister that when the Conservative Party wins the next general election it will secure the interests of S4C, particularly as it was the Conservative Government that established the channel, as you rightly recognised. I am intrigued by your interest in the policy details, because you are obviously not confident that Labour will win the next election.

**Andrew Davies:** I hope that Alun's

**Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies):** Dyma'r eildro i'r Cynulliad gael dadl ar faterion darlledu a thelathrebu. Mae'n amlwg nad yw'r rhain yn gyfrifoldebau datganoledig ac mae rhai sydd yn dweud y dylem dreulio mwy o amser yn gweithredu ar y meysydd yr ydym yn gyfrifol amdanynt. Fodd bynnag, fel y nododd yr Aelodau eisoes, byddem yn esgeuluso ein dyletswydd pe na baem wedi manteisio ar y cyfle hwn i ymateb i Bapur Gwyn y Llywodraeth. Cymeradwywn ymateb y Cabinet i'r papur hwnnw.

Mae eleni yn nodi canmlwyddiant y darllediad radio trawsatlantig cyntaf. Mae hefyd yn nodi ugeinfed pen-blwydd Deddf Darlledu 1981, a sefydlodd S4C. Yn 2001, yr ydym eisoes yn yr oes dot.com gyda theleffoni datblygedig a theledu aml-sianel yn dod yn realiti i bawb.

Diolchaf i'r Aelodau am eu sylwadau. Gofynnwn i'r Cynulliad, fel y dywedodd Jenny Randerson yn gynharach, gymeradwyo papur y Cabinet. Cynigïaf anfon copi o drafodion heddiw i Weinidogion yn San Steffan fel eu bod yn ymwybodol o'r ystod barn yn y Siambr hon.

Gwnaeth Alun Cairns bwynt ynglŷn ag adrodd yn ôl i'r Cynulliad. Mae'r Cabinet yn fodlon adrodd yn ôl, nid yn unig ar ei ymateb ei hun, ond hefyd ar ymateb Llywodraeth San Steffan i'r ymgynghoriad. Awgrymaf fod angen i Alun edrych yn fanylach ar effaith gwerthu Sianel 4. Mae'n fwy cymhleth nag ariannu yn unig. Mae S4C yn derbyn llawer o'i raglenni gan Sianel 4 ac mae'n debygol y bydd goblygiadau mawr a sylweddol i S4C yn sgîl ei phreifateiddio.

**Alun Cairns:** Sicrhaf y Gweinidog pan fydd y Blaid Geidwadol yn ennill yr etholiad cyffredinol nesaf y bydd yn diogelu buddiannau S4C, yn enwedig gan mai'r Llywodraeth Geidwadol a sefydlodd y sianel, fel y cydnabuwyd gennych, a hynny'n gywir. Mae eich diddordeb ym manylion y polisi yn ddirgelwch imi, oherwydd mae'n amlwg nad ydych yn hyderus y bydd Llafur yn ennill yr etholiad nesaf.

**Andrew Davies:** Gobeithiaf fod gwybodaeth

knowledge of broadcasting is more soundly based than his knowledge of psephology or the future psephology of the next general election.

With regard to Owen John Thomas's points, the new regulatory framework is a realistic solution in the modern world of global communications. If our proposals are accepted, there will be a distinctive Welsh voice in OFCOM. With the exception of S4C, the other public service broadcasters provide programmes networked throughout the UK. Regulation has to be—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Do you accept that the White Paper shows that we are moving towards an age of self-regulation by broadcasters? Therefore, when you say that the interests of Welsh viewers will be safeguarded in OFCOM, is it not true that OFCOM is there to regulate the market and that viewers must take their concerns directly to the broadcasters? Unless we have a consumers' panel, to speak on behalf of Welsh viewers, those interests will not be safeguarded.

**Andrew Davies:** We take heart from the way, for example, telecommunications has been regulated in recent years. The Welsh Advisory Committee on Telecommunications, which has been ably chaired by Professor Mike Tedd, has ensured that Welsh interests are represented to OFTEL. The proposals for OFCOM ensure that that Advisory Committee will have an expanded remit. We are confident that those concerns will be amply addressed by the new proposals.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Will you take another intervention?

**Andrew Davies:** No, I will not. The points made by Lorraine Barrett and Karen Sinclair have been accommodated. Last week, Chris Smith, the Secretary of State for Culture, Media and Sport, responded adequately to the concerns, not only of those people with a hearing impairment, but also of those with a visual impairment. Those of you who were in the Assembly the other day will have noticed that the Royal National Institute for the Blind gave a good presentation and highlighted its

Alun am ddarlledu yn fwy cadarn na'i wybodaeth am etholiadeg neu etholiadeg yr etholiad cyffredinol nesaf yn y dyfodol.

O ran pwyntiau Owen John Thomas, mae'r fframwaith rheoliadol newydd yn ateb realistig ym myd modern cyfathrebu byd-eang. Os derbynnir ein cynigion, bydd llais Cymru yn amlwg yn OFCOM. Ac eithrio S4C, mae'r darlledwyr gwasanaeth cyhoeddus eraill yn darparu rhaglenni a rwydweithir drwy'r DU. Rhaid i'r rheoliad fod—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A dderbyniwch y dengys y Papur Gwyn ein bod yn symud tuag at oes o hunan-reoleiddio gan ddarlledwyr? Felly, pan ddywedwch y diogelir buddiannau gwylwyr Cymreig yn OFCOM, onid yw'n wir mai swyddogaeth OFCOM yw rheoleiddio'r farchnad a bod rhaid i wylwyr fynd â'u pryderon yn uniongyrchol at y darlledwyr? Oni bai fod gennym banel defnyddwyr, i siarad ar ran gwylwyr Cymreig, ni ddiogelir y buddiannau hynny.

**Andrew Davies:** Cawn ein calonogi, er enghraifft, gyda'r ffordd y rheoleiddiwyd telathrebu dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Mae Pwyllgor Ymgynghorol Telathrebu Cymru, a gadeiriwyd yn fedrus gan yr Athro Mike Tedd, wedi sicrhau y caiff buddiannau Cymru eu cyfleu i OFTEL. Mae'r cynigion ar gyfer OFCOM yn sicrhau y bydd gan y Pwyllgor Ymgynghorol gylch gwaith estynedig. Yr ydym yn hyderus y bydd y cynigion newydd yn mynd i'r afael â'r pryderon hyn yn ddigonol.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A gymerwch ymyriad arall?

**Andrew Davies:** Na wna. Cymhwyswyd y pwyntiau a wnaethpwyd gan Lorraine Barrett a Karen Sinclair. Yr wythnos diwethaf, ymatebodd Chris Smith, yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Ddiwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon yn ddigonol i bryderon, nid yn unig y bobl hynny â nam ar eu clyw, ond hefyd y rhai hynny â nam ar eu golwg. Bydd y rheini ohonoch a oedd yn y Cynulliad y diwrnod o'r blaen wedi sylwi bod Sefydliad Cenedlaethol Brenhinol y Deillion wedi rhoi

concerns. My colleagues and I have taken note of those concerns and will express to the Department for Culture, Media and Sport and the Department of Trade and Industry its concerns on the range of issues that were covered.

I am aware of the time, but I hope that I have responded to the concerns and points that have been made. I accept that it may not have been to the listeners' liking. However, this response by the Cabinet—

**Karen Sinclair:** While I accept that many of these issues have been addressed, it is important that we highlight that they need to be addressed specifically in order to guard against a loose interpretation.

**Andrew Davies:** That is a valid point. We will ensure that it is included in our response. With the exception of Jocelyn Davies's amendment 2, we will support all the amendments. As Rhodri Glyn accepted, the way that Jenny Randerson has involved the Culture Committee in this is a model of how to handle such matters. This is a model way of responding to legislation on non-devolved matters, where we have a major and distinctive interest and voice, and of ensuring that the Assembly represents the voice of Welsh consumers and Welsh users.

cyflwyniad da ac wedi amlygu eu pryderon. Nododd fy nghyd-Aelodau a minnau y pryderon hynny a byddwn yn lleisio ei bryderon ar yr ystod o faterion a gwmpaswyd i'r Adran Diwydiant, Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon a'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant.

Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r amser, ond gobeithiaf imi ymateb i'r pryderon a'r pwyntiau a wnaethpwyd. Derbyniaf efallai nad oedd at ddant y gwrandawyr. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ymateb hwn gan y Cabinet—

**Karen Sinclair:** Er y derbyniaf yr ymdriniwyd â llawer o'r materion hyn, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn amlygu bod angen ymdrin â hwy yn benodol er mwyn diogelu rhag dadansoddiad llac.

**Andrew Davies:** Mae hwnnw'n bwynt dilys. Byddwn yn sicrhau y caiff ei gynnwys yn ein hymateb. Ac eithrio gwelliant 2 Jocelyn Davies, cefnogwn yr holl welliannau. Fel y derbyniodd Rhodri Glyn, mae'r ffordd y mae Jenny Randerson wedi cynnwys y Pwyllgor Diwylliant yn hyn yn fodel o sut i ymdrin â materion o'r fath. Mae hon yn ffordd fodel o ymateb i ddeddfwriaeth ar faterion nas datganolwyd, lle mae gennym fuddiant a llais pwysig ac amlwg, ac o sicrhau bod y Cynulliad yn cynrychioli llais prynwyr a defnyddwyr Cymru.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 39, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 39, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison

Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment adopted.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 13, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 2: For 13, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Jane Davidson  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Ron  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 41, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 1.  
Amendment 3: For 41, Abstain 0, Against 1.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment adopted.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 4: For 42, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelod canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Member voted against:

Randerson, Jenny

Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Ron  
 Evans, Delyth  
 Feld, Val  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment adopted.*

12:55 p.m.

Amended motion:

*The National Assembly*

*welcomes the consultation exercise following publication of the British Government's White Paper 'A new future for communications', copies of which are available on the internet at [www.communicationswhitepaper.gov.uk](http://www.communicationswhitepaper.gov.uk);*

*asserts and reaffirms the importance of Sianel Pedwar Cymru in the Welsh broadcasting sector;*

*endorses the response by the National Assembly Cabinet, which was laid in the Table Office and distributed by email to Assembly Members on 1 February 2001;*

*calls on the UK Government to devise a strategy, as a matter of urgency, aimed at improving viewer take-up of television from*

Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:

*Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*yn croesawu'r ymgynghori sydd yn dilyn cyhoeddi'r Papur Gwyn gan Lywodraeth Prydain, 'A new future for communications'. Mae copïau ohono ar gael ar y rhyngwrwyd yn [www.communicationswhitepaper.gov.uk](http://www.communicationswhitepaper.gov.uk);*

*yn arddel ac yn ailddatgan pwysigrwydd Sianel Pedwar Cymru yn sector darlledu Cymru;*

*yn cymeradwyo ymateb Cabinet y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 1 Chwefror 2001;*

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth y DU i lunio strategaeth, fel mater brys, sydd yn anelu at wella nifer y bobl sydd yn gwyllo rhaglenni*



*Wales, including the possibility of the transmission of Welsh digital signals from Mendip, Ridge Hill, Wrekin and Winter Hill transmitters; and*

*teledu o Gymru, gan gynnwys y posibilrwydd o drosglwyddo signalau digidol o drosglwyddyddion Mendip, Ridge Hill, Dinlle Wrygion a Winter Hill; ac*

*recognises the importance to our creative industries of maintaining a dynamic market for communications services and acknowledges the benefits the sector is bringing to the modern Welsh economy.*

*yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd cynnal marchnad ddeinamig ar gyfer gwasanaethau cyfathrebu i'n diwydiannau creadigol ac yn cydnabod y budd y mae'r sector yn dod ag ef i economi Cymru.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amended motion: For 42, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.  
Amended motion adopted.*

## Datganiad gan y Dirprwy Lywydd Statement by the Deputy Presiding Officer

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Before moving on, it is appropriate to make reference to the third annual Channel 4 Political Awards, which were organised by the television station and *House Magazine*. This year's winner of Welsh Politician of the Year was Jocelyn Davies. To make a deliberately partisan statement, the award is well deserved. [*Applause.*]

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Cyn symud ymlaen, mae'n briodol cyfeirio at Wobrau Gwleidyddol blynyddol Sianel 4 a gynhelir am y trydydd tro, a drefnwyd gan yr orsaf deledu a *House Magazine*. Enillydd Gwleidydd Cymreig y Flwyddyn eleni oedd Jocelyn Davies. I wneud datganiad bwriadol bleidiol, yr oedd yn llawn haeddu'r wobr. [*Cymeradwyaeth.*]

### Dadl Fer Short Debate

#### Marwolaethau yn y Mynyddoedd—Gwella Diogelwch ym Mynyddoedd Cymru Death in the Mountains—Improving Mountain Safety in Wales

**Alun Pugh:** Sadly, this debate is timely. It takes place 11 days after the latest tragedy in Snowdonia. On 27 January, Jason Jones, a young man from Llanrug, in the constituency of Caernarfon, slipped on an iced-up slope and fell 500 feet to his death. I understand that Mick Bates and Peter Rogers will contribute to this debate later.

**Alun Pugh:** Yn anffodus, mae'r ddadl hon yn amserol. Fe'i cynhelir 11 diwrnod ar ôl y drychineb ddiweddaraf yn Eryri. Ar 27 Ionawr, llithrodd Jason Jones, dyn ifanc o Lanrug, yn etholaeth Caernarfon, ar lethr iâ a chwympodd 500 troedfedd i'w farwolaeth. Deallaf y bydd Mick Bates a Peter Rogers yn cyfrannu at y ddadl hon yn ddiweddarach.

Mr Jones was the latest in a long list of adults and children injured and killed in our mountains. I hope that this debate will mark the beginning of a process that will see a significant reduction in the number of mountain accidents. All mountain activities, ranging from simple hill walking in summer to ice climbing in the depths of winter, carry an unavoidable risk. Last autumn, a 15-year-old child died in the Ogwen valley. He was hit by a rock fall while being taught how to rock climb. He was wearing a helmet and the accident was simply the result of being in the wrong place at the wrong time—a salutary warning to us all. Although the dangers can never be eliminated, they can be minimised by using appropriate clothing and equipment and obtaining informed advice.

Mr Jones oedd y diweddaraf mewn rhestr faith o oedolion a phlant a niweidiwyd ac a laddwyd ar ein mynyddoedd. Gobeithio y bydd y ddadl hon yn fan cychwyn proses a fydd yn arwain at leihad sylweddol yn nifer y damweiniau yn y mynyddoedd. Mae perygl anochel ynghlwm wrth bob gweithgaredd ar y mynyddoedd, yn amrywio o weithgareddau syml megis cerdded y bryniau yn yr haf i ddringo iâ yn nyfnderoedd y gaeaf. Yn yr hydref y llynedd, bu farw plentyn 15 mlwydd oed yn nyffryn Ogwen. Fe'i trawyd gan gwypm creigiau tra'n cael ei addysgu sut i ddringo creigiau. Yr oedd yn gwisgo helmed ac yr oedd y ddamwain yn achos o fod yn y lle anghywir ar yr adeg anghywir—rhybudd llesol i bob un ohonom. Er na ellir byth ddileu'r peryglon, gellir eu lleihau drwy ddefnyddio dillad ac offer priodol a chael cyngor hyddysg.

Our small nation is blessed with wonderful scenery. The Brecon Beacons, Cader Idris and Snowdonia are stunningly beautiful. It is

Bendithir ein cenedl fach gan olygfeydd bendigedig. Mae Bannau Brycheiniog, Cader Idris ac Eryri yn syfrdanol o hardd.

only natural, therefore, that people want to walk and climb in these special places.

The landmark Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000 will significantly improve access. A huge swathe of Wales will eventually be covered by the new right to roam legislation, which will open up more opportunities for the public to engage in responsible walking. I was pleased to see access to mountain crags and night access included in the legislation. The increase in access will benefit the rural economy. Independent estimates by the University of Wales, Aberystwyth calculate that currently, walkers and climbers sustain 6,000 jobs in Wales. That is around 2 per cent of the rural gross domestic product per capita.

Wales has some of the poorest health statistics in Europe. Although spending greater sums on hospitals will help, adopting healthier living patterns would have a much larger impact on public health. As a nation, we take far too little exercise. The growing incidence of obesity and the number of people who are overweight in Wales will absorb much of the extra resources voted by this Assembly to the health service. Regular swimming, cycling or walking is a much better insurance against ill-health than BUPA membership.

Hill walking builds muscular strength, stamina and cardio-vascular capacity. It can be an opportunity for solitary reflection or a sociable and fun occasion, as anyone who has been out with a ramblers' group can testify. Brian Gibbons also rightly points out that hill walking is a sporting activity that does not exclude on the grounds of gender or age. Anyone who has seen a 50-year-old hill-walking grandmother leaving a 18-year-old male couch potato in her wake after a few miles will testify to that.

As well as being places of great beauty,

Mae ond yn naturiol, felly, fod pobl am gerdded a dringo yn y lleoedd arbennig hyn.

Bydd Deddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000 yn bwysig ac yn gwella mynediad yn sylweddol. Yn y pen draw bydd rhan enfawr o Gymru yn cael ei chwmpasu gan y ddeddfwriaeth hawl i grwydro newydd, a fydd yn rhoi mwy o gyfleoedd i'r cyhoedd ymgymryd â gweithgareddau cerdded cyfrifol. Yr oeddwn yn falch o weld bod mynediad i greigiau mynydd a mynediad yn ystod y nos yn cael eu cynnwys yn y ddeddfwriaeth. Bydd y cynnydd mewn mynediad o fudd i'r economi wledig. Mae amcangyfrifon annibynnol gan Brifysgol Cymru Aberystwyth yn cyfrifo bod cerddwyr a dringwyr yn cynnal 6,000 o swyddi yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd, sef tua 2 y cant o'r cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth gwledig y pen.

Mae Cymru'n meddu ar rai o'r ystadegau iechyd gwaethaf yn Ewrop. Er y byddai gwario symiau uwch ar ysbytai yn helpu, byddai mabwysiadu patrymau byw mwy iach yn cael effaith llawer mwy ar iechyd cyhoeddus. Fel cenedl, ni wnawn ddigon o ymarfer corff o bell ffordd. Bydd y cynnydd mewn gordewdra a nifer y bobl sydd dros bwysau yng Nghymru yn meddiannu llawer o'r adnoddau ychwanegol y pleidleisiwyd drostynt gan y Cynulliad hwn ar gyfer y gwasanaeth iechyd. Mae nofio, seiclo neu gerdded yn rheolaidd yn yswiriant llawer gwell yn erbyn salwch nag aelodaeth o BUPA.

Mae cerdded bryniau yn adeiladu cryfder y cyhyrau, stamina a gallu cardiofasgwlaidd. Gall fod yn gyfle i fyfyrion dawl neu'n ddigwyddiad hwyliog, fel y gall unrhyw un sydd wedi bod allan gyda grŵp cerddwyr dystio. Mae Brian Gibbons hefyd yn pwysleisio, a hynny'n briodol, fod cerdded bryniau yn weithgaredd chwaraeon nad yw'n eithrio unrhyw un ar sail rhyw neu oedran. Gall unrhyw un sydd wedi gweld mam-gu 50 mlwydd oed yn cerdded y bryniau ac yn gadael dyn 18 mlwydd oed anystwyth ar ei hôl ar ôl ychydig filltiroedd dystio i hynny.

Yn ogystal â bod yn lleoedd o gryn

Welsh mountains can also be places of danger. Society owes a special duty of care to children. People who lead parties of children on climbing or hill walking trips face a special responsibility.

After the Lyme Regis disaster when four children drowned, Parliament passed the Activity Centres (Young Persons' Safety) Act 1995. That makes it a legal requirement that organisations taking children mountaineering, caving or canoeing on a commercial basis have properly qualified and experienced leaders. No-one could argue with that.

However, this crucial protection for children does not extend to voluntary groups or even schools. Children can go away for a weekend of abseiling, ice climbing or potholing with a voluntary group in the care of leaders who do not possess the technical skills to ensure that the inevitable risks of these activities are minimised.

Many of us will remember the tragic death of a 10-year-old boy scout on Snowdon. He fell some 500 feet while descending an awkward section. I will not comment further on that case, as it is the subject of a criminal prosecution. However, it is legitimate to ask what the better policy is—to prosecute allegedly inadequate leaders after a child's death, or to put in place a framework which ensures that people who lead children's groups in potentially hazardous environments are up to the task in the first place?

Much is said about the inadequate powers of the Assembly, but we have the power, through secondary legislation, to close that loophole. Even the threat to do this may persuade the handful of voluntary organisations that organise a large percentage of outdoor activities for children in Wales, to improve their safety record.

I have seen too many ill-equipped and abysmally-led children's groups on our summits in driving rain or with ice underfoot,

harddwch, gall mynyddoedd Cymru fod yn lleoedd peryglus hefyd. Mae gan gymdeithas ddyletswydd arbennig i ofalu am blant. Mae pobl sydd yn arwain partion o blant ar deithiau dringo neu gerdded brynau yn wynebu cyfrifoldeb arbennig.

Yn dilyn trychineb Lyme Regis pan foddodd pedwar plentyn, pasiodd y Senedd Ddeddf Canolfannau Gweithgaredd (Diogelwch Pobl Ifanc) 1995. Mae hynny'n ei wneud yn ofyniad cyfreithiol fod gan fudiadau sydd yn mynd â phlant i fynydda, ogofa neu ganwio ar sail masnachol arweinwyr sydd yn briodol gymwys a phrofiadol. Ni allai unrhyw un ddadlau gyda hynny.

Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r diogelwch hanfodol hwn i blant yn ymestyn i grwpiau gwirfoddol nac hyd yn oed i ysgolion. Gall plant fynd i ffwrdd am benwythnos o abseilio, dringo iâ neu ogofa gyda grŵp gwirfoddol yng ngofal arweinwyr nad ydynt yn meddu ar y sgiliau technegol i sicrhau y cedwir y risgiau anochel sydd yn deillio o'r gweithgareddau hyn i leiafswm.

Bydd llawer ohonom yn cofio marwolaeth trasig sgowt 10 mlwydd oed ar yr Wyddfa. Cwmpodd tua 500 troedfedd tra'n cerdded i lawr rhan anodd. Ni ddywedaf fwy am yr achos hwnnw, oherwydd mae'n destun erlyniad troseddol. Fodd bynnag, mae'n deg gofyn beth yw'r polisi gorau—erlyn arweinwyr yr honnir eu bod yn anaddas ar ôl marwolaeth plentyn, neu sefydlu fframwaith sydd yn sicrhau bod pobl sydd yn arwain grwpiau o blant mewn amgylcheddau a allai fod yn beryglus yn gymwys ar gyfer y dasg yn y lle cyntaf?

Sonnir llawer am bwerau annigonol y Cynulliad, ond mae gennym y pŵer, drwy ddeddfwriaeth eilaidd, i gau'r bwlch hwnnw. Byddai hyd yn oed y bygythiad i wneud hyn yn gallu darbwylllo'r dynaid o fudiadau gwirfoddol sydd yn trefnu canran fawr o weithgareddau awyr agored i blant yng Nghymru, i wella eu record ddiogelwch.

Yr wyf wedi gweld gormod o grwpiau o blant heb offer digonol yn cael eu harwain yn wael ar ein mynyddoedd yng nghanol

to be complacent about the current set-up. I understand that The Scouts Association has refused to meet the Adventure Activities Licencing Authority to discuss mountain safety. Some voluntary groups insist that using internal checks, rather than the UK leadership qualifications framework, is acceptable. It is not.

I turn to the protection of adults. Unlike children, adults are capable of making their own decisions on what is an acceptable risk, provided that they are in full possession of the facts. Regular mountaineers build up a store of experience, or near misses, upon which they can draw. However, the attraction of mountains is partly based on their wild nature and their contrast to the highly-regulated, safe built environment. It is easy to get out of one's depth, particularly in winter conditions.

In summer, routes to the top of Welsh mountains such as Y Garn, are straightforward. Last winter, I climbed the well-known banana gully route on this mountain, with a friend from the Ogwen Valley Mountain Rescue team. With our ice axes and crampons, we found the climb up a steeply angled and hard frozen snow slope an enjoyable affair. We chatted happily on our way back down to the valley. Two hours later, a pair attempted the same route without this essential winter gear and both fell. One sustained serious head injuries and his partner was killed.

The regular pattern of death and injury to ill-equipped and inexperienced people in our mountains deserves a policy response from this Assembly. In Scotland, a small team of mountaineers files daily reports on mountain conditions and avalanche information throughout the winter. These are posted on notice boards at popular climbing venues and on the internet.

Access to specialised mountain weather forecasts is also an issue. I record my thanks to BBC Radio Wales for its contribution to

curlaw neu ar iâ, i allu bod yn hunanfodlon ynglŷn â'r sefyllfa bresennol. Deallaf fod Cymdeithas y Sgowtiaid wedi gwrthod cwrdd â'r Awdurdod Trwyddedu Gweithgareddau Antur i drafod diogelwch ar y mynyddoedd. Mynna rhai grwpiau gwirfoddol bod defnyddio gwiriadau mewnol, yn hytrach na fframwaith cymwysterau arweinyddiaeth y DU, yn dderbyniol. Nid ydyw.

Trof at ddiogelwch oedolion. Yn wahanol i blant, gall oedolion wneud eu penderfyniadau eu hunain ar yr hyn sydd yn risg dderbyniol, ar yr amod eu bod yn meddu ar yr holl ffeithiau. Mae mynyddwyr rheolaidd yn adeiladu cronfa o brofiad, neu fethiannau agos, y gallant dynnu arnynt. Fodd bynnag, mae atyniad mynyddoedd yn rhannol seiliedig ar eu natur wyllt a'u cyferbyniad â'r amgylchedd diogel adeiledig a reoleiddir yn gaeth. Mae'n hawdd mynd i ddyfroedd dyfnion, yn enwedig mewn tywydd gaeafol.

Yn yr haf, mae'r llwybrau i gopaon mynyddoedd Cymru, megis Y Garn, yn hawdd eu dilyn. Y gaeaf diwethaf, dringais lwybr adnabyddus y 'banana gully' ar y mynydd hwn, gyda ffrind o dîm Achub Mynydd Dyffryn Ogwen. Gyda'n bwyell iâ a'n heyrn dringo, yr oedd y ddringfa i fyny llethr eira wedi rhewi'n galed ac ar ogwydd serth yn brofiad pleserus. Buom yn sgwrsio'n hapus ar ein ffordd yn ôl i lawr i'r dyffryn. Ddwy awr yn ddiweddarach, ymgeisiodd pâr ddilyn yr un llwybr heb yr offer gaeaf hanfodol hwn a chwmpodd y ddau. Cafodd un niwed difrifol i'w ben a bu farw ei bartner.

Mae'r patrwm rheolaidd o farwolaethau ac anafiadau a ddioddefir yn ein mynyddoedd gan bobl ddibrofiad heb offer digonol yn haeddu ymateb ar ffurf polisi gan y Cynulliad. Yn yr Alban, mae tîm bach o fynyddwyr yn llunio adroddiadau dyddiol ar amodau ar y mynyddoedd a gwybodaeth am gwympiadau eira drwy'r gaeaf. Rhoddir y rhain ar hysbysfyrddau mewn lleoliadau dringo poblogaidd ac ar y rhyngwyd.

Mae mynediad i ragolygon tywydd arbenigol y mynyddoedd hefyd yn fater. Cofnodaf fy niolch i BBC Radio Wales am

mountain safety by transmitting daily hill forecasts. Similarly, the [onlineweather.com](http://onlineweather.com) service provides an excellent mountain forecast on the web. The Meteorological Office, in contrast, has a poor record. It charges several pounds for a faxback service. It should replace the public relations nonsense on weathergirls that is sometimes found on its website, with more useful information such as detailed weather forecasts.

At the major gateways to the Welsh mountains—Pen y Pass, Ogwen, Llanberis and Storey Arms in the south—there should be clear safety and information points, updated daily, to inform people of conditions on the summits. Clear warnings along the lines of, ‘it is dangerous to go above the snow line today without an ice axe, crampons and the ability to use them’ should be prominently displayed.

1:05 p.m.

A mobile phone is no substitute for a compass, a torch or a survival bag costing a few pounds. I am convinced that it is ignorance of an unfamiliar and wild environment, and not recklessness or foolishness, that causes people to find themselves in difficulty. We have a huge stock of expertise upon which we can draw to solve this problem. The Welsh Mountain Leader Training Board has a substantial track record of leader safety training. In Wales, we have an international centre of expertise at Plas y Brenin. The British headquarters of the Adventure Activities Licensing Authority is located in Cardiff. Organisations such as these are more than capable of carrying out this work. Much could be achieved along these lines with a small budgetary allocation. The cost of doing nothing at all is high indeed. I am sure that grieving families and friends will be looking for a sympathetic and positive response from the Government of Wales today.

ei gyfraniad i ddiogelwch ar y mynyddoedd drwy ddarparu rhagolygon dyddiol y brynau. Yn yr un modd, mae'r gwasanaeth [onlineweather.com](http://onlineweather.com) yn darparu rhagolygon mynydd gwyh ar y we. Mae gan y Swyddfa Feteorolegol, mewn gwrthgyferbyniad, record wael. Mae'n codi tâl o nifer o bunnoedd am wasanaeth gwybodaeth dros y ffacs. Yn hytrach na'r dwli cysylltiadau cyhoeddus ar ferched tywydd sydd i'w ganfod weithiau ar ei wefan, dylai roi gwybodaeth fwy defnyddiol, megis rhagolygon manwl y tywydd.

Fel y prif byrth i fynyddoedd Cymru—Pen y Pas, Ogwen, Llanberis a Storey Arms yn y de—dylid sicrhau pwyntiau diogelwch a gwybodaeth clir, wedi eu diweddarau'n ddyddiol, i hysbysu pobl am y tywydd ar y copaon. Dylid arddangos rhybuddion clir tebyg i 'mae'n beryglus mynd yn uwch na llinell yr eira heddiw heb fwyell iâ, heyrn dringo a'r gallu i'w defnyddio' yn amlwg.

Nid yw ffôn symudol yn rhywbeth i'w ddefnyddio yn lle cwmpawd, fflachlamp neu fag goroesi sydd yn costio ychydig bunnoedd. Yr wyf yn sicr mai anwybodaeth am amgylchedd anghyfarwydd a gwyllt, ac nid byrbwylltra na ffolineb, sydd yn achosi pobl i fynd i drafferthion. Mae gennym gronfa enfawr o arbenigedd y gallwn dynnu arni er mwyn datrys y broblem hon. Mae gan Fwrdd Hyfforddi Arweinwyr Mynyddoedd Cymru record sylweddol o ddarparu hyfforddiant diogelwch i arweinwyr. Yng Nghymru, mae gennym ganolfan arbenigedd ryngwladol ym Mhlas y Brenin. Lleolir pencadlys Prydeinig yr Awdurdod Trwyddedu Gweithgareddau Antur yng Nghaerdydd. Mae mudiadau fel y rhain yn fwy na chymwys i gyflawni'r gwaith hwn. Gellid cyflawni llawer ar hyd y llinellau hyn gyda dyraniad cyllidebol bach. Mae'r gost o wneud dim yn wirioneddol uchel. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd teuluoedd a ffrindiau sydd yn galaru yn edrych am ymateb cydymdeimladol a chadarnhaol gan Lywodraeth Cymru heddiw.

I pay tribute to the mountain rescue teams of Talaf deyrnged i dimau achub mynydd

Wales. Teams of volunteers funded by raffles perform a difficult and dangerous job, which is sometimes deeply unpleasant and sometimes involves putting your life on the line to save that of someone else. I am sure that the whole Assembly will want to join me in thanking the women and men who make up these teams.

**Mick Bates:** Thank you, Alun, for allowing me to contribute to this debate. I congratulate you on the points that you raised. I pledge my support to anything that the Assembly can do to improve safety in the mountains. As someone who has taken parties into the hills and enjoys walking, and now farms some of the hills, I am well aware of many of the problems to which Alun referred. However, it is important to strike a balance. Although Alun was critical of the scouts, there must be a form of independence that allows people some freedom. Striking that balance is a difficult task. It is difficult to control a city person who parks his or her car and decides to walk to the top of the hills. Communication is one of the biggest problems. Not enough is done to provide information points, path signs and information on weather conditions.

I agree with Alun that a mobile phone is no substitute for training. However, a great number of people own a mobile phone, which is considered one of the best forms of communication. There must be sufficient masts in remote areas, as there is in most of Scotland, to ensure that anyone who gets into trouble has the chance of fast communication. This is a planning issue and I hope that the planning process does not slow down the provision of good communications in rural areas. I share Alun's concern that unless funds are forthcoming to make signage and daily information available, with the increasing access to which you have heard reference, there may be more not less problems. I endorse Alun's statement today and hope that the Assembly moves forward positively to provide good communication and the information necessary to improve safety in our hills.

Cymru. Mae timau o wirfoddolwyr a ariennir gan rafflau yn cyflawni swydd anodd a pheryglus, sydd yn amhleserus iawn ar adegau ac sydd weithiau'n golygu peryglu eich bywyd er mwyn achub bywyd rhywun arall. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd y Cynulliad cyfan yn dymuno ymuno â mi wrth ddiolch i'r merched a'r dynion sydd yn rhan o'r timau hyn.

**Mick Bates:** Diolch, Alun, am adael imi gyfrannu at y ddaidl hon. Fe'ch llongyfarchaf ar y pwyntiau a godwyd gennych. Yr wyf yn addo fy nghefnogaeth i unrhyw beth y gall y Cynulliad ei wneud er mwyn gwella diogelwch yn y mynyddoedd. Fel rhywun sydd wedi mynd â phartïon i'r bryniau ac un sydd yn mwynhau cerdded, a bellach yn ffermio ar rai o'r bryniau, yr wyf yn ymwybodol iawn o nifer o'r problemau y cyfeiriodd Alun atynt. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig cael cydbwysedd. Er bod Alun yn feirniadol o'r sgowtiaid, rhaid bod ffurf o annibyniaeth sydd yn caniatáu rhyddid i rai pobl. Mae sicrhau'r cydbwysedd hwnnw yn dasg anodd. Mae'n anodd rheoli person o'r ddinas sydd yn parcio ei gar neu ei char ac yn penderfynu cerdded i ben y bryniau. Cyfathrebu yw un o'r prif broblemau. Ni wneir digon i ddarparu pwyntiau gwybodaeth, arwyddion llwybrau a gwybodaeth am y tywydd.

Cytunaf ag Alun na all ffôn symudol gymryd lle hyfforddiant. Fodd bynnag, mae nifer fawr o bobl yn meddu ar ffôn symudol, ac fe'i ystyrir yn un o'r dulliau cyfathrebu gorau. Rhaid bod yna fastiau digonol mewn ardaloedd anghysbell, fel sydd yn y rhan fwyaf o'r Alban, er mwyn sicrhau bod gan unrhyw un sydd yn mynd i drafferth y cyfle i gyfathrebu'n gyflym. Mater cynllunio yw hwn a gobeithiaf na fydd y broses gynllunio yn arafu darpariaeth cyfathrebu da mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Rhannaf bryder Alun, oni bai fod arian yn cael ei ddarparu i sicrhau bod arwyddion a gwybodaeth ddyddiol ar gael, gyda'r mynediad cynyddol y cyfeiriwyd ato eisoes, efallai y bydd mwy nid llai o broblemau. Cymeradwyaf ddatganiad Alun heddiw a gobeithiaf y bydd y Cynulliad yn symud ymlaen yn gadarnhaol i ddarparu cyfathrebu da a'r wybodaeth sydd yn angenrheidiol i wella diogelwch yn ein bryniau.

**Peter Rogers:** Thank you, Alun, for allowing me to contribute. I declare an interest because until four years ago I farmed a small hill farm that included a steep mountain on which I grazed sheep. Over the years of gathering sheep with my dogs, I learned to respect the mountains because changing weather could soon lead to dangerous conditions, particularly mist and rain. Even for a farmer with good knowledge of land conditions, this could mean that you lose your bearings and follow a dangerous descent from the mountains, where it is so easy to lose your footing.

The mountains deserve full respect. They can be dangerous. In my work and through experience, I gained knowledge of what that could mean. The recent tragedy that Alun highlighted was an example of how quickly things can go wrong. I have seen reports that suggest inadequate equipment was responsible or that the chosen route was the worst possible route of ascent. I am worried whether the new right to roam will make mountains a safer place. I am sure that Alun agrees that we are likely to see more accidents because of that legislation. Some irresponsible members of the public will now feel that they have a roaming commission over private land that surrounds mountain areas. We must ensure that there are facilities for training and educating people so that they display the greatest expertise to ensure that our mountains are safe.

**The Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language (Jenny Randerson):** I am grateful to Alun for bringing this important issue to our attention today. By coincidence, the adventure activity industry advisory committee held its regular meeting in Cardiff earlier this week. It also held an open meeting. That was the first time it had met in Wales. I hope that will encourage them to deal with specifically Welsh issues. Alun spoke from experience and with some expertise about the ways in which mountain safety can be improved. However, I dare say

**Peter Rogers:** Diolch ichi, Alun, am ganiatáu i mi gyfrannu. Datganaf fuddiant oherwydd tan bedair blynedd yn ôl bûm yn ffermio fferm fynydd fechan a oedd yn cynnwys mynydd serth yr oeddwn yn pori defaid arno. Dros y blynyddoedd o gasglu defaid gyda'm cwn, dysgais barchu'r mynyddoedd oherwydd buan iawn y gallai tywydd newidiol arwain at amodau peryglus, yn enwedig tARTH a glaw. Hyd yn oed i ffermwr sydd yn meddu ar wybodaeth dda am gyflwr y tir, gallai hyn olygu eich bod yn colli eich ffordd ac yn dilyn ffordd beryglus i lawr y mynydd, lle mae'n hawdd llithro.

Mae'r mynyddoedd yn haeddu'r parch mwyaf. Gallant fod yn beryglus. Yn fy ngwaith i, ac o brofiad, meithrinais wybodaeth am yr hyn y gallai hynny ei olygu. Mae'r drychineb ddiweddar a amlygwyd gan Alun yn enghraifft o ba mor gyflym y gall pethau fynd o'u lle. Yr wyf wedi gweld adroddiadau sydd yn awgrymu mai offer annigonol oedd yn gyfrifol neu mai'r llwybr a ddewiswyd oedd y llwybr gwaethaf posibl i ddringo'r mynydd. Yr wyf yn bryderus a fydd yr hawl newydd i grwydro yn gwneud y mynyddoedd yn lle mwy diogel. Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytuna Alun ein bod yn debygol o weld mwy o ddamweiniau yn sgîl y ddeddfwriaeth honno. Bellach bydd rhai aelodau anghyfrifol o'r cyhoedd yn teimlo bod ganddynt yr hawl i grwydro dros dir preifat sy'n amgylchynu ardaloedd mynyddig. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod cyfleusterau ar gael i hyfforddi ac addysgu pobl er mwyn iddynt ddangos yr arbenigedd mwyaf i sicrhau bod ein mynyddoedd yn ddiogel.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg (Jenny Randerson):** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Alun am ddod â'r mater pwysig hwn i'n sylw heddiw. Drwy gyd-ddigwyddiad, cynhaliodd pwyllgor ymgynghorol y diwydiant gweithgareddau antur ei gyfarfod rheolaidd yng Nghaerdydd yn gynharach yr wythnos hon. Cynhaliodd gyfarfod agored hefyd. Dyna'r tro cyntaf iddo gyfarfod yng Nghymru. Gobeithio y bydd hynny yn ei annog i ddelio'n benodol gyda materion Cymreig. Siaradodd Alun o brofiad a chyd



that everyone has at some point walked up a mountain. As an 18 year old who had never stepped off a pavement—I had probably been on a beach, but never off the pavement, or done anything more than walking in urban parks—I found myself with a scanty knowledge of map reading walking across Helvellyn in the summer in good weather. I was amazed at how long it took to walk what seemed a small distance on the map. That taught me how easily one can be caught out. I also climbed the Glyders and descended in dusk after the clouds had gathered having started the climb on a beautiful, hot day. That kind of thing can catch people out if they do not have experience and expertise.

pheth arbenigedd am y ffyrdd y gellid gwella diogelwch y mynyddoedd. Fodd bynnag, mae'n siŵr bod pawb ar ryw adeg wedi cerdded i fyny mynydd. Fel merch 18 mlwydd oed nad oedd erioed wedi camu oddi ar balmant—yr oeddwn yn fwy na thebyg wedi bod ar draeth, ond erioed oddi ar balmant, na gwneud unrhyw beth mwy na cherdded mewn parciau trefol—canfŵm mai prin oedd fy ngwybodaeth am ddarllen map wrth imi gerdded ar draws Helvellyn yn yr haf mewn tywydd braf. Yr oeddwn wedi'm syfrdanu ynglŷn â pha mor hir a gymerai i gerdded yr hyn a oedd yn ymddangos yn bellter bach ar y map. Dysgodd hynny imi pa mor hawdd y gall rywun fynd i drafferthion. Dringais y Glyderau hefyd a dod i lawr wrth iddi nosi ar ôl i'r cymylau gasglu, wedi imi ddechrau dringo ar ddiwrnod poeth, braf. Gall hynny beri i bobl fynd i drafferthion os nad oes ganddynt brofiad ac arbenigedd.

Looking at the issue in a wider context, it obviously concerns this Assembly closely. The introductory paragraph of our rural development plan states that,

Gan edrych ar y mater hwn mewn cydestun ehangach, mae'n amlwg yn fater o bwys i'r Cynulliad hwn. Mae paragraff rhagarweiniol ein cynllun datblygu gwledig yn datgan,

'Wales is a predominantly rural country with all the administrative areas in Wales, including some parts that exhibit rural characteristics and problems, and where rural activities are undertaken'.

'Mae Cymru yn wlad wledig yn bennaf gyda'r holl ardaloedd gweinyddol yng Nghymru, yn cynnwys rhai rhannau sy'n amlygu nodweddion a phroblemau gwledig, a lle cheir gweithgareddau gwledig.'

That applies not only to climbing mountains, but to caving, canoeing and other water sports. It applies not only to rural areas, but also to the Valleys. Today, it is important that we recognise the links between the urban and the rural on a national level. The more that we are encouraged to enjoy and appreciate the countryside, the greater the mutual understanding will develop. The importance of outdoor pursuits in Wales cannot be underestimated and the adventure activity facilities that are available attract millions of people each year who contribute significantly to our economy. Outdoor activities, particularly adventure activities provide significant educational benefits—as Alun outlined—and assist in developing a broad range of skills such as decision-making, problem-solving, interpersonal skills, developing personal and group responsibility,

Mae hynny'n berthnasol nid yn unig i ddringo mynyddoedd, ond hefyd i ogofa, canwio a chwaraeon dwr eraill. Mae'n berthnasol nid yn unig i ardaloedd gwledig, ond hefyd i'r Cymoedd. Heddiw, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cydnabod y cysylltiadau rhwng y ddinas a'r wlad ar lefel genedlaethol. Po fwyaf y cawn ein hannog i fwynhau a gwerthfawrogi cefn gwlad, y mwyaf y datblyga'r cyd-ddealltwriaeth. Ni ellir tanbrizio pwysigrwydd gweithgareddau awyr agored yng Nghymru ac mae'r cyfleusterau gweithgareddau antur sydd ar gael yn denu miliynau o bobl bob blwyddyn ac yn cyfrannu'n sylweddol at ein heconomi. Mae gweithgareddau awyr agored, yn enwedig gweithgareddau antur, yn darparu manteision addysgol sylweddol—fel yr amlinellodd Alun—ac yn cynorthwyo i ddatblygu ystod eang o sgiliau

improving environmental awareness, as well as health.

Our countryside is enjoyed by a broad range of people, from the experienced specialists and members of organised expeditions to the occasional or recreational participant. I say to Peter that it is important that we use the new right to roam through the countryside to distribute information, knowledge and understanding, and not treat it as a barrier. We must ensure that all activities are undertaken in as safe an environment as possible. It is important to recognise that being safe does not mean that you can eliminate all risks. That element of risk is probably the attraction for many people who take part in these activities. However, dealing with risk in relation to adults is different from dealing with it in relation to children and young people. We must recognise that there are various categories of users, who require different levels of information, supervision and, in some cases, regulation.

1:15 p.m.

The Adventure Activities Licensing Authority and the adventure activity licensing scheme were established in 1996 to ensure that those who provide certain activities on a commercial basis to young people under the age of 18 meet strict safety and quality standards. The authority is based in Llanishen, in Cardiff. It is funded by the Department for Education and Employment and operates under the guidance of the Health and Safety Commission. There have been calls—and Alun referred to this need—to extend the scope of regulations to other service providers. There have been calls to extend it to other ages, although Alun did not refer to that, and to other adventure activities.

Although the limitations of the existing scheme reflect the level of risk identified by the HSC and the Adventure Activity Industry Advisory Committee, there is a broad representation from across the industry, but only from the commercial industry, not from

megis gwneud penderfyniadau, datrysu problemau, sgiliau rhyngpersonol, datblygu cyfrifoldeb personol a chyfrifoldeb grŵp, gwella ymwybyddiaeth amgylcheddol, yn ogystal ag iechyd.

Mae ystod eang o bobl yn mwynhau ein cefn gwlad, o'r arbenigwyr profiadol ac aelodau o deithiau a drefnwyd i'r cyfranogwr achlysurol neu adloniadol. Dywedaf wrth Peter ei bod yn bwysig ein bod yn defnyddio'r hawl newydd i grwydro drwy gefn gwlad i ddosbarthu gwybodaeth a dealltwriaeth, a pheidio â'i drin fel rhwystr. Rhaid inni sicrhau y cyflawnir pob gweithgaredd mewn amgylchedd mor ddiogel â phosibl. Mae'n bwysig cydnabod nad yw bod yn ddiogel yn golygu y gallwch gael gwared ar bob risg. Yr elfen honno o risg, fwy na thebyg, sydd yn denu nifer o bobl sydd yn cymryd rhan yn y gweithgareddau hyn. Fodd bynnag, mae delio â pherygl mewn perthynas ag oedolion yn wahanol iawn i ddelio â pherygl mewn perthynas â phlant a phobl ifanc. Rhaid inni gydnabod y ceir amryw gategoriau o ddefnyddwyr, sydd angen gwahanol lefelau o wybodaeth, goruchwyliaeth ac, mewn rhai achosion, rheoleiddio.

Sefydlwyd yr Awdurdod Trwyddedu Gweithgareddau Antur a'r cynllun trwyddedu gweithgareddau antur yn 1996 i sicrhau bod y sawl sydd yn darparu gweithgareddau penodol yn fasnachol i bobl ifanc o dan 18 oed yn bodloni safonau diogelwch ac ansawdd llym. Lleolir yr awdurdod yn Llanisien, yng Nghaerdydd. Fe'i hariennir gan yr Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth ac mae'n gweithredu o dan arweiniad y Comisiwn Iechyd a Diogelwch. Bu galw—a chyfeiriodd Alun at yr angen hwn—am ehangu cwmpas y rheoliadau i ddarparwyr gwasanaeth eraill. Bu galw am ei ehangu i oedrannau eraill, er na chyfeiriodd Alun at hynny, ac i weithgareddau antur eraill.

Er bod cyfyngiadau'r cynllun presennol yn adlewyrchu lefel y risg a nodir gan y Comisiwn Iechyd a Diogelwch a Phwyllgor Ymgynghorol y Diwydiant Gweithgareddau Antur, ceir cynrychiolaeth eang ar draws y diwydiant, dim ond o'r diwydiant

the voluntary sector. The licensing scheme and regulations are subject to review every three years and I understand that a second review is to be undertaken next year. One of the issues already identified for discussion is their impact on voluntary associations. I welcome that.

Alun's concerns fall into two broad categories. The first is the extension of regulations, particularly to voluntary organisations. The second concern is better education and information. Any changes in regulation need to be taken forward on a UK basis if possible, because consistency is important, especially when dealing with UK-wide voluntary organisations. The Assembly, the outdoor activity industry, voluntary organisations, relevant governing bodies and the general public can influence the scope of regulations through the three-yearly review process. The Assembly is also represented at official level on the Adventure Activity Industry Advisory Committee, whose role is to advise the Health and Safety Commission. We must use that representation to present our views.

On better information and education, a wealth of information is available from the governing bodies, the Wales Tourist Board and the national parks. There is also a website, [brecon-beacons.com](http://brecon-beacons.com), which has much information and detail on suitable equipment, how to plan excursions, clothing and emergency-planning arrangements. However, we could do much more. I take on board what Alun and Mick said about Scotland. We must ensure that the information that is available is promoted effectively and that it is much more easily accessible. To encourage that, I will hold a meeting of the organisations most closely involved in providing this type of information to discuss how we can improve the availability of information. I would welcome Alun's involvement in that. I also take on board the need to look at other countries, Scotland in particular, in terms of how that information is provided. The provision of better signage, better warning systems and better education and information

masnachol, nid o'r sector gwirfoddol. Mae'r cynllun trwyddedu a'r rheoliadau yn agored i'w hadolygu bob tair blynedd a deallaf y bwriedir cynnal ail adolygiad y flwyddyn nesaf. Un o'r materion a nodwyd eisoes ar gyfer trafodaeth yw eu heffaith ar gymdeithasau gwirfoddol. Croesawaf hynny.

Mae pryderon Alun yn cwmpo i ddau gategori cyffredinol. Y cyntaf yw'r broses o ehangu'r rheoliadau, yn enwedig i sefydliadau gwirfoddol. Yr ail bryder yw gwell addysg a gwybodaeth. Rhaid i unrhyw newidiadau mewn rheoleiddo gael eu gweithredu drwy'r DU os yn bosibl, oherwydd bod cysondeb yn bwysig, yn enwedig wrth ddelio â sefydliadau gwirfoddol ledled y DU. Gall y Cynulliad, y diwydiant gweithgareddau awyr agored, sefydliadau gwirfoddol, cyrff llywodraethol perthnasol a'r cyhoedd ddylanwadu ar gwmpas y rheoliadau drwy'r broses adolygu tair blynedd. Cynrychiolir y Cynulliad hefyd ar lefel swyddogol ar Bwyllgor Ymgynghorol y Diwydiant Gweithgareddau Antur, a'i rôl yw cynghori'r Comisiwn Iechyd a Diogelwch. Rhaid inni ddefnyddio'r gynrychiolaeth honno i gyflwyno ein safbwyntiau.

O ran gwell gwybodaeth ac addysg, mae cronfa o wybodaeth ar gael gan y cyrff llywodraethol, Bwrdd Croeso Cymru a'r parciau cenedlaethol. Ceir gwefan hefyd, [breconbeacons.com](http://breconbeacons.com), â llawer o wybodaeth a manylion am offer addas, sut i gynllunio teithiau, dillad a threfniadau cynllunio ar gyfer argyfwng. Fodd bynnag, gallem wneud llawer mwy. Yr wyf yn cydnabod yr hyn a ddywedodd Alun a Mick am yr Alban. Rhaid inni sicrhau y caiff yr wybodaeth sydd ar gael ei hyrwyddo'n effeithiol a bod modd cael gafael arni'n haws. Er mwyn annog hynny, byddaf yn cynnal cyfarfod o'r sefydliadau sydd yn ymwneud fwyaf â darparu'r math hwn o wybodaeth i drafod sut y gallwn wella argaeledd gwybodaeth. Byddwn yn croesawu cyfraniad Alun yn hynny. Yr wyf hefyd yn cydnabod yr angen i edrych ar wledydd eraill, yr Alban yn enwedig, o ran sut y darperir yr wybodaeth honno. Mae darparu gwell arwyddion, gwell systemau rhybuddio a gwell addysg a gwybodaeth yn

requires a multi-agency approach. We need to consult with the experts, those directly involved within the industry—Antur Cymru provides a useful forum for debate—and organisations such as the Wales Tourist Board.

The Adventure Activities Licensing Authority is evaluating the possibility of introducing a non-statutory approval scheme, which would be introduced to cover providers who wish to have some accreditation for their safety systems, but who currently do not require licensing. In addition, there are plans to produce nationally-accepted standards of good practice. Together with better information and, perhaps, an extension of licensing—we will certainly consider how some of the benefits of licensing can apply to the voluntary organisations—I think that we have scope for progress.

I commend the Wales Tourist Board for running an accreditation scheme successfully over many years. The scheme is highly regarded throughout Wales and the UK, and forms the basis of many voluntary schemes adopted by UK governing bodies. We must encourage organisations not covered by licensing to take up these schemes.

In conclusion, it is essential that we do not discourage people from using and enjoying our countryside, and developing their expertise in mountaineering, canoeing and other activities. We must encourage people, and the organisations that take them into the countryside, to ensure that they are protected. We must also provide adults with the necessary information to make wise decisions. I thank Alun for bringing this important subject to our attention.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings today's proceedings to a close.

gofyn am ymagwedd aml-gyfrwng. Mae angen inni ymgynghori â'r arbenigwyr, y rhai hynny â chanddynt ran uniongyrchol o fewn y diwydiant—mae Antur Cymru yn darparu fforwm defnyddiol ar gyfer trafodaeth—a sefydliadau megis Bwrdd Croeso Cymru.

Mae'r Awdurdod Trwyddedu Gweithgareddau Antur yn gwerthuso'r posibilrwydd o gyflwyno cynllun cymeradwyo anstatudol, a fyddai'n cael ei gyflwyno er mwyn diogelu darparwyr sydd yn dymuno cael rhywfaint o achrediad ar gyfer eu systemau diogelwch, ond nad oes angen trwydded arnynt ar hyn o bryd. Yn ogystal, ceir cynlluniau i gynhyrchu safonau arfer da a dderbynnir yn genedlaethol. Ynghyd â gwell gwybodaeth ac, efallai, ymestyn trwyddedu—byddwn yn sicr yn ystyried sut y gall rhai o fanteision trwyddedu fod yn berthnasol i'r sefydliadau gwirfoddol—credaf fod gennym gyfle i wneud cynnydd.

Cymeradwyaf Fwrdd Croeso Cymru am gynnal cynllun achredu llwyddiannus dros nifer o flynyddoedd. Ystyrir y cynllun fel un o bwys ledled Cymru a'r DU, a ffurfia sail nifer o gynlluniau gwirfoddol a fabwysiadwyd gan gyrff llywodraethu'r DU. Rhaid inni annog mudiadau na chânt eu diogelu gan drwydded i ymgymryd â'r cynlluniau hyn.

I gloi, mae'n hanfodol nad ydym yn annog pobl i beidio â defnyddio a mwynhau ein cefn gwlad, a datblygu eu harbenigedd mewn mynydda, canwio a gweithgareddau eraill. Rhaid inni annog pobl, a'r sefydliadau sydd yn mynd â hwy i gefn gwlad, i sicrhau eu bod yn cael eu hamddiffyn. Yn ogystal, rhaid inni roi'r wybodaeth angenrheidiol i oedolion er mwyn iddynt wneud penderfyniadau doeth. Diolchaf i Alun am ddod â'r mater pwysig hwn i'n sylw.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 1.19 p.m.  
The session ended at 1.19 p.m.*

