



Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

The National Assembly for Wales

Mr & Mrs S George

12 Redhill Park

Haverfordwest

Pembrokeshire

SA61 2HA

Parc Cathays / Cathays Park

Caerdydd / Cardiff

CF10 3NQ

Eich cyf / Your ref:

Ein cyf / Our ref: APP127-98-07-033

Dyddiad/Date: 12 September 2001

Dear Mr and Mrs George

TOWN AND COUNTRY PLANNING ACT 1990: SECTION 77 APPLICATION BY MR & MRS S GEORGE: PROPOSED CONVERSION OF BARN AND RECONSTRUCTION OF REMAINS OF FORMER FARMHOUSE AT ENFIELD, PORTFIELD GATE, HAVERFORDWEST

1. Consideration has been given to the report of the Inspector Mr Stuart B Wild MRTPI MIMgt, who reported on your application for the rehabilitation of the Enfield homestead including the conversion of a barn and reconstruction of former farmhouse and the demolition of derelict buildings. The application was the subject of a hearing.

2. On 24 January 2001 the National Assembly for Wales directed, under Section 77 of the Town and Country Act 1990, that the application be referred to it rather than being determined by the local planning authority. On 17 July 2001 the Assembly resolved that a committee to be known as Planning Decision Committee 2001/6 be established, in accordance with Standing Order 35 to discharge the functions of the Assembly under Section 79 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 in respect of your application described above. Accordingly, the Planning Decision Committee has considered the application and has resolved under Standing Order 35.16 to adopt this letter.

3. The Inspector's conclusions are set out in paragraph 22 of his report, a copy of which is enclosed. The Inspector recommended that the application be approved subject to the conditions set out in paragraph 24 of his report.

4. The Planning Decision Committee agree with the Inspector's conclusions and accept his recommendation that the application be approved subject to conditions. The Planning Decision Committee hereby grants planning permission in respect of planning application Ref 00/0476/PA dated 13 September 2000 for the conversion of barn and reconstruction of remains of former farmhouse to form a single dwelling and demolition of derelict buildings at Enfield, Portfield Gate, Haverfordwest, subject to conditions at Annex A to this letter.

5. This letter, a copy of which has been sent to the local planning authority, does not convey any approval or consent which may be required under any enactment, bylaw, order or regulation other than Section 57 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990.



Tom Middlehurst

Chair, Planning Decision Committee 2001/6

Annex A

CONDITIONS ATTACHED TO PLANNING PERMISSION OF SEPTEMBER 2001 RELATING TO PLANNING APPLICATION REF:00/0476/PA

1. The development hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of five years from the date of this decision.
2. The development hereby permitted shall not be carried out except in complete accordance with the details shown on the submitted plans, numbers 100, 101, 102, 1000, 1001, 1002, 1003 and 1004 of Job No 96036H.
3. Notwithstanding the provisions of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted

Development) Order 1995 (or any order revoking and re-enacting that Order with or without modification), no garages or extensions to the dwelling shall be erected without the prior written consent of the local planning authority.

4. The dwelling shall not be occupied until works for the disposal of sewage and a soakaway to cater for surface water drainage have been provided to serve the development hereby permitted, in accordance with details to be submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority.

5. The dwelling shall not be occupied until the surface of the drive has been paved in bitmac or concrete for a minimum distance of 10m behind the edge of the carriageway.

6. The dwelling shall not be occupied until space has been laid out within the site for cars to be parked and for vehicles to turn so that they may enter and leave the site in forward gear in accordance with details to be submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority.

7. No development shall take place until full details of both hard and soft landscape works have been submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority and these works shall be carried out as approved. Those details shall include proposed finished levels or contours; means of enclosure; car parking layouts; hard surfacing materials; minor artefacts and structures (e.g. furniture, refuse or other storage units, etc).

8. All planting, seeding or turfing comprised in the approved details of landscaping shall be carried out in the first planting and seeding seasons following the occupation of the buildings or the completion of the development, whichever is the sooner; and any trees or plants which within a period of 5 years from the completion of the development die, are removed or become seriously damaged or diseased shall be replaced in the next planting season with others of similar size and species, unless the local planning authority gives written consent to any variation.

9. No development shall take place until a 1m x 1m sample of pointed stonework has been constructed on site for inspection and approved in writing by the local planning authority.

10. The dwelling shall not be occupied until the remains of the buildings shown numbered 2, 3, 4, and 5 on drawing No 100 of Job No 96036H and that part of the original farmhouse to the south of the part to be reconstructed have been completely demolished and the remains removed from the site.

The Planning Inspectorate, Crown Buildings, Cathays Park, Cardiff CF10 3NQ

Tel: 029 2082 3889 Fax: 029 2082 5150

Report

by Stuart B Wild MRTPI MIMgt

an Inspector appointed by the National Assembly for Wales

Date: 25/06/2001

TOWN AND COUNTRY PLANNING ACT 1990

SECTION 77

PEMBROKESHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

APPLICATION FOR CONVERSION OF BARN AND RECONSTRUCTION OF REMAINS OF FORMER
FARMHOUSE TO FORM A SINGLE DWELLING AND DEMOLITION OF DERELICT BUILDINGS

By

MR AND MRS S GEORGE

File Ref: APP/N6845/X/01/513945

Reference: APP/N6845/X/01/513945

Site address: Enfield, Portfield Gate, Haverfordwest.

- The application was called in for decision by the National Assembly for Wales by a direction made under Section 77 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990, for the following reason:

The proposed development raises planning issues of more than local importance.

- The application was made by Mr and Mrs S George to Pembrokeshire County Council.
- The application (ref:00/0476/PA) is dated 13/09/00.
- The development proposed is conversion of barn and reconstruction of remains of former farmhouse to form a single dwelling and demolition of derelict buildings.

Summary of Recommendation: I recommend that planning permission be granted subject to conditions for the reasons set out below.

Procedural matters

1. In a letter dated 7/02/01 the Planning Inspectorate stated that the following matters appear likely to be amongst those relevant to the Assembly for the purposes of its consideration of the application;

1. The visual, environmental and access implications of the proposed development on the site and surrounding areas, and

2. The relevant national and development plan policies, especially in relation to the Government's policy on housing in the open countryside as set out in Planning Guidance (Wales): Planning Policy

2. This report includes a description of the proposal, the planning history, the site and its surroundings, policy framework, my appraisal (on the basis of my observations and the evidence of the parties) and my recommendation as to the decision which might be made in this case. Lists of appearances and documents are attached.

The proposal

3. The application form is dated 13/09/00 and refers to an application for full planning permission for conversion of barn and reconstruction of remains of former farmhouse to form a single dwelling and demolition of derelict buildings. The application form states that there would be no new or alterations to an access to the highway. The application was made in the name of Mr and Mrs S George.

4. This proposal involves the conversion of the barn and the reconstruction of the remains of the former farmhouse to provide a single dwelling and the demolition of four derelict outbuildings. The barn would provide living and dining accommodation whilst the ground floor of the reconstructed section would provide a kitchen, bedroom, study and a toilet/shower room for the disabled. At first floor level three bedrooms and a bathroom would be provided in the reconstructed section.

5. The section of building linking the barn to the main part of the reconstructed building would have a ridge height of approximately 5.8m compared to the barn's height of 4.8m to the ridge. The ridge height of the main part of the reconstructed building would be approximately 6.5m.

6. The barn has natural stone walls. The main part of the reconstructed building would be clad in re-used local stone. The link section would have smooth rendered walls with a paint finish. All roofs would be overlaid with natural slates and two engineering brick chimney stacks of traditional design would be sited at the gables of the main part of the roof. Three gabled dormer windows of a traditional design would be provided on the western elevation and a single dormer window would be provided on the eastern elevation facing the former farmyard. Traditional sliding sash windows with a painted finish would, in general, be used and vernacular detailing respecting the existing features of the original farmhouse would be incorporated throughout the scheme.

Planning history

7. Planning permission was granted in December 1995 (Ref No D2/95/0741) for the conversion of the same barn subject to this application into a small two bedroomed single storey dwelling and the creation of a new access. The new access has been formed and that planning permission therefore remains valid.

8. A planning application dated 23/10/98 was submitted for the rehabilitation of the Enfield Homestead, including conversion of redundant corn barn, removal of eyesores and on-site improvement to access all for use as a single detached dwelling. That application was called in under S77 for determination by the National Assembly for Wales (Ref No APP/N6845/X/99/513585). The Inspector recommended that planning permission should be refused in essence

because of the scale and location of the new dwelling which would have been created. That recommendation was accepted and planning permission was refused on 25/05/00.

The site and surroundings

9. In his report the previous Inspector gave a detailed description of the site and surroundings in paragraphs 3-6. Since his site visit on 30/11/99 a new barn building has been erected adjacent to the access drive and about 100m to the east of the existing barn. The old barn has had a limited amount of maintenance work to the walls. The remains of the former farmhouse have further deteriorated but are still as previously described. The only other change is that there has been additional planting along some of the boundaries.

10. The site remains in the open countryside just outside the settlement of Portfield Gate. The site is well screened from the main road through the settlement but is overlooked from the rear windows of a number of dwellings within the settlement, and from across the open countryside.

The policy framework

11. Government policy is set out in Planning Guidance (Wales): Planning Policy (first revision) (PGW) and the associated Technical Advice Notes. Paragraph 5.1.1 on countryside and paragraphs 10.5.1 and 2 on re-use and conversions are particularly relevant to this case.

12. The Council's policies for the area are contained in the adopted North Pembrokeshire Local Plan, policies GN4 and EV 18 of which are particularly relevant to this proposal.

The case for the applicants

The main points are:

13. The present scheme has been formed following extensive evaluation of the previous Inspector's report and detailed discussion with the planning officers. There is a valid permission on the land to create a residential use on the site by virtue of the barn conversion. The approved driveway which has been provided forms an intrusion into the open countryside around Portfield Gate. The range of derelict buildings around the former farmyard currently remain as an eyesore in this rural scene. There is no provision in the planning permission for the barn conversion for these remains to be removed.

14. The current scheme is to reconstruct the former farmhouse within its existing footprint and in a sensitive manner using materials which reflect the local vernacular. This would give sufficient grounds to override the planning policy objections to the proposal. It would provide an appropriate residential development on a site which has the benefit of that use albeit in a form which does not reflect modern standards of space and environment. The proposal should be approved with appropriate conditions.

The case for the Local Planning Authority

The main points are:

15. The current proposal was prepared having regard to the previous Inspector's comments, in particular the unusual circumstances identified in paragraphs 12 and 13 of his report. The current proposal has been reduced in scale and mass and does not involve extensions beyond the footprint of the former farmhouse, outbuildings and stone barn. No garage, porch or second storey to the barn is now proposed. It is considered that the current proposal respects the character of the original buildings and their setting and the materials used and the treatment of the site curtilage complements the character of the buildings. The proposal is in keeping with its surroundings. The Local Planning Authority considers that the proposal meets the criteria set out in policy EV18 (3) and (4). The proposal also includes provision for the removal of the remains of the unsightly derelict farm buildings which the previous Inspector considered would have a significant beneficial environmental effect on the site and its surroundings.

16. The Local Planning Authority recognises that the proposal does not comply with criteria (1) of policy EV 18. However it is of the view that the other material factors identified by the previous Inspector must be carefully evaluated. This proposal takes into account the comments made by the Inspector regarding the scope for a possible acceptable revised and reduced scheme. The Local Planning Authority considers that there are sufficient grounds to justify an approval as an exception to the presumption against new development in the open countryside as set out in PGW and policy GN4 of the Local Plan.

17. The Camrose Community Council supported the application and the Environment Agency and Highways Department had no objection subject to appropriate conditions. The Council supports the grant of conditional planning permission.

Inspector's appraisal

18. From the evidence before me and from my observations on site the main issue in this case is whether the present proposal offers sufficient benefit to outweigh the normal presumption against new residential development in the open countryside, having regard to the factors identified by the previous Inspector in his report.

19. The application site lies outside the settlement and therefore there is a clear conflict with policy GN4. As regards policy EV18 there are five criteria which must be satisfied. The first relates to conversion of structurally sound buildings without extensive alterations and/or extensions. The approved barn conversion satisfied this criteria but the scale of the present proposal involving significant reconstruction of about 2/3 of the original farmhouse clearly goes beyond this criteria. The second criteria relates to buildings being of traditional construction and materials. The proposal would satisfy this criteria. Similarly it satisfies the third criteria relating to the proposed use being accommodated without changing the character of the building or its setting. The existing permission for the residential use of the barn includes a curtilage in the same general location as the present proposal and therefore the character of the setting will inevitably be that of a residential use.

20. Criteria four states that the proposed form, bulk and general design of the converted building, including any extension, are in keeping with the surroundings. It is here that this proposal is significantly different to that which was previously refused. The design would have the appearance

of a typical country farmhouse with traditional local features. The scale would be smaller than the previous farmhouse. The barn would retain its present scale. The use of rendered walls for the link block would reduce its apparent scale and help the completed dwelling read as a group of traditional buildings set around a courtyard. All these aspects are a significant improvement on the previous schemes and in my view satisfy criteria 4. There is no conflict with criteria 5 which relates to no significant access, parking, amenity, nature conservation or public service provision objections. The new access is largely complete in accord with the previous approval.

21. In addition to providing a new dwelling which would have the appearance of a traditional local farmhouse on the site of the previous farm, this proposal would have the significant benefit of ensuring the removal of the unsightly remains of the former agricultural buildings. These are not of attractive traditional construction. In the main they are concrete and corrugated iron structures. The removal of these buildings would be a significant benefit to the local visual amenity and to the outlook of occupiers of dwellings in the neighbouring settlement.

Conclusions

22. There is a clear conflict between this proposal and the policy background set out in PGW and local plan policy GN4. However, given that the site already has permission for a residential use, that the proposal would make use of the existing traditional barn together with a reconstruction of part of the traditional farmhouse in an entirely traditional style, that the scale and mass of the proposal reflects the character of a traditional local farmhouse, and most important, that the proposal would result in the removal of a number of unsightly dilapidated agricultural buildings to the significant benefit of the visual amenity of the area, I conclude that the specific benefits of this proposal outweigh the objection to the principle of a new dwelling in the open countryside.

Conditions

23. My recommendation in this case has been heavily influenced by the specific nature of the proposal. In my view a condition is necessary to ensure that the development is carried out in strict accordance with the plans. In addition the scale and massing of the proposal has been carefully considered to be suitable for the specific circumstances of this site. A condition removing permitted development rights for extensions is therefore necessary to protect the visual amenity of the setting. Conditions to give effect to the comments of the Environment Agency and the Highways Department, together with standard landscape conditions are appropriate. Specific conditions requiring a sample of stonework and the demolition of the remains of the agricultural buildings are also necessary in the interests of visual amenity. These conditions were discussed at the hearing and were generally acceptable to the parties.

24. I recommend the following conditions should be attached to any permission:

(i) The development hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of five years from the date of this decision.

(ii) The development hereby permitted shall not be carried out except in complete accordance with the details shown on the submitted plans, numbers 100, 101. 102. 1000.

1001, 1002, 1003 and 1004 of Job No 96036H.

(iii) Notwithstanding the provisions of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 1995 (or any order revoking and re-enacting that Order with or without modification), no garages or extensions to the dwelling shall be erected without the prior written consent of the local planning authority.

(iv) The dwelling shall not be occupied until works for the disposal of sewage and a soakaway to cater for surface water drainage have been provided to serve the development hereby permitted, in accordance with details to be submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority.

(v) The dwelling shall not be occupied until the surface of the drive has been paved in bitmac or concrete for a minimum distance of 10m behind the edge of the carriageway.

(vi) The dwelling shall not be occupied until space has been laid out within the site for cars to be parked and for vehicles to turn so that they may enter and leave the site in forward gear in accordance with details to be submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority.

(vii) No development shall take place until full details of both hard and soft landscape works have been submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority and these works shall be carried out as approved. These details shall include proposed finished levels or contours; means of enclosure; car parking layouts; hard surfacing materials; minor artefacts and structures (e.g. furniture, refuse or other storage units, etc).

(viii) All planting, seeding or turfing comprised in the approved details of landscaping shall be carried out in the first planting and seeding seasons following the occupation of the buildings or the completion of the development, whichever is the sooner; and any trees or plants which within a period of 5 years from the completion of the development die, are removed or become seriously damaged or diseased shall be replaced in the next planting season with others of similar size and species, unless the local planning authority gives written consent to any variation.

(ix) No development shall take place until a 1m x 1m sample of pointed stonework has been constructed on site for inspection and approved in writing by the local planning authority.

(x) The dwelling shall not be occupied until the remains of the buildings shown numbered 2, 3, 4, and 5 on drawing No 100 of Job No 96036H and that part of the original farmhouse to the south of the part to be reconstructed have been completely demolished and the remains removed from the site:

Recommendation

25. I recommend that planning permission be granted subject to the conditions in paragraph 24 above.



Inspector

FOR THE APPLICANTS:

Mr D Carnegie Dip TP MRTPI Town Planning Consultant

Mr & Mrs S George The applicants

FOR THE LOCAL PLANNING AUTHORITY:

Mr A Williams BSc(hons) DipEP MRTPI Chief Development Control Officer, Pembrokeshire CC

DOCUMENTS

Document 1 List of persons present at the hearing

Document 2 Copy of application, decision notice and plans for approved barn conversion D2/95/741

Document 3 Mr Carnegie's statement on behalf of applicants (file doc 16)

Document 4 Local Planning Authority's statement (file doc 19)

Document 5 Extract form North Pembrokeshire Local Plan

PLANS

Plans A-H The application plans (In file doc 8)

Plans I-K Previous application plans

Plan L Up to date OS plan 1:2500 showing recent dwellings
(Stone Court and Water Dene) built in Portfield Gate close to site