



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
The National Assembly for Wales**

**Cofnod y Trafodion  
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mercher, 23 Ionawr 2008  
Wednesday, 23 January 2008**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid a Chyflenwi Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus  
Questions to the Minister for Finance and Public Service Delivery
- 19 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau  
Questions to the Minister for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills
- 37 Datganiad ar Newydd-ddyfodiaid  
Statement on New Entrants
- 53 Cymeradwyo Enwebiad Ombwdsmon Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Cymru  
Approval of the Nomination of a Public Services Ombudsman for Wales
- 55 Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu ar Gynllunio Rheilffyrdd y Dyfodol  
The Enterprise and Learning Committee's Report on Planning for Future Rail  
Provision
- 86 Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig: Gwerth Ychwanegol Crynswth  
Welsh Conservatives Debate: Gross Value Added
- 112 Dadl Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru: Dyled Bersonol  
Welsh Liberal Democrats Debate: Personal Debt
- 138 Amser Pleidleisio  
Voting Time
- 144 Dadl Fer: Ceg Gam—Rhoi Sylw i'r Diffyg Deintyddol yn Sir Benfro  
Short Debate: Down in the Mouth—Addressing the Dental Shortfall in Pembrokeshire

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were  
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been  
included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 12.30 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 12.30 p.m. with the Presiding Officer (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) in the Chair.*

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf y Cynulliad i drefn.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call the Assembly to order.

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid a Chyflenwi Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Questions to the Minister for Finance and Public Service Delivery**

### **Cyflawni Amcanion yn Lleol**

### **Delivering Objectives Locally**

**C1 Alun Ffred Jones:** Sut mae'r Gweinidog yn sicrhau bod y broses gyllidebol yn cyflawni amcanion Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar lefel leol? OAQ(3)0172(FPS)

**Q1 Alun Ffred Jones:** How does the Minister ensure that the budget process delivers Welsh Assembly Government objectives at a local level? OAQ(3)0172(FPS)

**The Minister for Finance and Public Service Delivery (Andrew Davies):** The Assembly Government works closely with delivery partners at all levels to ensure that funding decisions are informed by the best possible understanding of local challenges and opportunities.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid a Chyflenwi Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus (Andrew Davies):** Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cydweithio'n agos â phartneriaid cyflenwi ar bob lefel i sicrhau bod penderfyniadau cyllido yn seiliedig ar y ddealltwriaeth orau bosibl o heriau a chyfleoedd lleol.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Yr ydych wedi sôn bod angen i wasanaethau cyhoeddus wneud arbedion ac yr ydych wedi cyfeirio lawer gwaith at y rhaglen 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau' fel rhan o hynny. A ydych yn derbyn bod perygl y bydd trefniadau ad hoc yn ymddangos drwy Gymru, heb unrhyw gysondeb, ac a ydych yn bwriadu trafod hyn gyda llywodraeth leol a'r gwasanaeth iechyd i geisio cael rhyw fath o strwythur i'r newidiadau a fyddai, yn eu tro, yn arwain at arbedion?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** You have said that public services must make savings and you have referred many times to the 'Making the Connections' programme as part of that. Do you accept that there is a danger that ad hoc arrangements will appear across Wales, without consistency, and do you intend to discuss that with local government and the health service in order to achieve some sort of structure for change that would, in turn, lead to savings?

**Andrew Davies:** We are in discussion with individual local authorities and with local government collectively, through the Welsh Local Government Association, on the 'Making the Connections' agenda, whether that be at a local level through the establishment of the local service boards—we now have six pilot LSBs and they will be rolled out across all 22 local authorities over the next year—or through collaboration at a regional level. A proposal is being considered by the 10 local authorities in south-east Wales, for example, on shared services, which will lead to not only better services, but reduced costs. Again, it is about better public services, more efficient services and

**Andrew Davies:** Yr ydym yn cynnal trafodaethau gydag awdurdodau lleol unigol a gyda llywodraeth leol ar y cyd, drwy Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, am yr agenda 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau', boed hynny ar lefel leol drwy sefydlu'r chwe bwrdd gwasanaethau lleol—mae gennym bellach chwe bwrdd gwasanaethau lleol peilot a chânt eu cyflwyno ar draws pob un o'r 22 awdurdod lleol dros y flwyddyn nesaf—neu drwy gydweithio ar lefel ranbarthol. Er enghraifft, mae 10 awdurdod lleol y de-ddwyrain yn ystyried cynnig am gydwasanaethau, a fydd yn arwain at gostau is, yn ogystal â gwasanaethau gwell. Eto, y nod yw gwasanaethau cyhoeddus gwell,

more bang for the buck of the Welsh taxpayer; but it is also based on collaboration.

**Angela Burns:** While giving local authorities the ability to set their own spending priorities under the revenue support grant distribution system, how will you be able to ensure that things like the indicator-based assessment in education will remain valid and coherent indicators of spend?

**Andrew Davies:** I am working with all my Cabinet colleagues on developing what I think will be a much more robust performance management framework. I am discussing with individual Ministers, as well as local authorities, a range of performance indicators, whether they relate to education, transport, the quality of the roads, or social services. It goes right across the range of services and, in this case, I am working with Jane Hutt, the Minister for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills, to monitor performance and ensure that we are delivering consistently high-quality services.

**Kirsty Williams:** Minister, the Welsh Assembly Government has targets for the swift and efficient handling of planning applications. These targets have been consistently missed by the Brecon Beacons National Park and, on Monday this week, we saw the publication of a damning report into how that authority exercises its development control functions. Are you confident that my constituents are getting a good service and that you, as a Government, are getting value for money from this organisation? If you are not confident about that, what do you and the Minister for Environment, Sustainability and Housing intend to do about it?

**Andrew Davies:** As I said in my response to Angela Burns and Alun Ffred Jones, we need consistently high-quality services. If there are areas where local authorities—or planning authorities in the case of the national parks—are significantly underperforming, we will move to address that weakness or deficiency. In my previous job, it was very important that local authorities were able to address the

gwasanaethau mwy effeithlon a mwy o werth am arian trethdalwyr Cymru; ond mae hynny hefyd yn seiliedig ar gydweithio.

**Angela Burns:** Wrth roi'r gallu i awdurdodau lleol bennu eu blaenoriaethau gwario eu hunain dan system dosbarthu'r grant cynnal refeniw, sut y gallwch sicrhau y bydd pethau megis yr asesiad wedi'i seilio ar ddangosyddion mewn addysg yn dal yn ddangosyddion gwariant dilys a dealladwy?

**Andrew Davies:** Yr wyf yn gweithio gyda fy holl gyd-Weinidogion i ddatblygu'r hyn a gredaf a fydd yn fframwaith rheoli perfformiad llawer cadarnach. Yr wyf yn trafod gyda Gweinidogion unigol, yn ogystal â gydag awdurdodau lleol, amrywiaeth o ddangosyddion perfformiad, boed hwy'n ymwneud ag addysg, trafnidiaeth, ansawdd ffyrdd, neu wasanaethau cymdeithasol. Mae'n mynd ar draws yr ystod gyfan o wasanaethau ac, yn yr achos hwn, yr wyf yn gweithio gyda Jane Hutt, y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau, i fonitro perfformiad ac i sicrhau ein bod yn darparu gwasanaethau o safon sy'n gyson uchel.

**Kirsty Williams:** Weinidog, mae gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru dargedau ar gyfer trin ceisiadau cynllunio'n chwim ac yn effeithlon. Mae Parc Cenedlaethol Bannau Brycheiniog wedi methu'r targedau hyn yn gyson a, ddydd Llun yr wythnos yma, gwelsom gyhoeddi adroddiad damniol am y ffordd y mae'r awdurdod hwnnw'n cyflawni ei swyddogaethau rheoli datblygu. A ydych yn hyderus bod fy etholwyr yn cael gwasanaeth da a'ch bod chi, fel Llywodraeth, yn cael gwerth eich arian gan y sefydliad hwn? Os nad ydych yn hyderus am hynny, beth yr ydych chi a'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynaliadwyedd a Thai yn bwriadu ei wneud am y peth?

**Andrew Davies:** Fel y dywedais yn fy ateb i Angela Burns ac Alun Ffred Jones, mae arnom angen gwasanaethau o safon sy'n gyson uchel. Os oes rhai ardaloedd lle mae awdurdodau lleol—neu awdurdodau cynllunio yn achos y parciau cenedlaethol—yn tangyflawni'n sylweddol, byddwn yn cymryd camau i fynd i'r afael â'r gwendid neu'r diffyg hwnnw. Yn fy swydd flaenorol,

needs of inward investors and I will highlight the example of Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council that dealt with the planning application for the Amazon development of an 800,000 square foot distribution centre on the outskirts of Swansea in 22 days. To me, that is an effective local authority, working as a team, with us, to attract a major inward investor. If you are telling me that there is evidence that areas like the Brecon Beacons are underperforming, I will address those issues with my colleagues through the ongoing performance management framework.

### Public Services

**Q2 The Leader of the Opposition (Nick Bourne):** Will the Minister outline his plans to improve the performance of public services? OAQ(3)0186(FPS)

**Andrew Davies:** We are improving our performance management framework and, with ministerial colleagues, I am taking action to ensure that we have high-performing, ambitious and innovative citizen-centred services. For example, I am establishing local service boards and local delivery agreements in every area of Wales.

**Nick Bourne:** I will ask the Minister about something that puzzles me, namely, the change of view on the private finance initiative since the two previous administrations. Previously, he and I probably did not take a massively different view about PFI—we thought that it should be looked at on its merits, and, occasionally, it might be the right path to proceed along. We know that Labour at Westminster, and certainly the Treasury, act on the basis that it is considered and used where appropriate. Why the change of heart in relation to health?

**Andrew Davies:** That agreement was made between the two political parties in drawing up the 'One Wales' programme for Government. There have been examples where PFI has not delivered on the policy objectives that we set as a Government. However, that is not to say that PFI for other

yr oedd yn bwysig iawn bod awdurdodau lleol yn gallu mynd i'r afael ag anghenion mewnfuddsoddwyr, a thynnaf sylw at enghraifft Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Castell-nedd Port Talbot a ymdriniodd â chais cynllunio'r datblygiad Amazon, sef canolfan ddsbarthu 800,000 troedfedd sgwâr ar gyrion Abertawe, mewn 22 diwrnod. I mi, dyna awdurdod lleol effeithiol, yn gweithio fel tîm, gyda ni, i ddenu mewnfuddsoddwr mawr. Os dywedwch wrthyf fod tystiolaeth yn bodoli bod ardaloedd fel Bannau Brycheiniog yn tangyflawni, af i'r afael â'r materion hynny gyda fy nghyd-Weinidogion drwy'r fframwaith rheoli perfformiad parhaus.

### Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus

**C2 Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Nick Bourne):** A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu ei gynlluniau i wella perfformiad gwasanaethau cyhoeddus? OAQ(3)0186(FPS)

**Andrew Davies:** Yr ydym yn gwella ein fframwaith rheoli perfformiad ac yr wyf, gyda fy nghyd-Weinidogion, yn cymryd camau i sicrhau bod gennym wasanaethau o safon uchel, sy'n uchelgeisiol ac yn arloesol, ac yn canolbwyntio ar y dinesydd. Er enghraifft, yr wyf yn sefydlu byrddau gwasanaethau lleol a chytundebau cyflenwi lleol ym mhob ardal yng Nghymru.

**Nick Bourne:** Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog am rywbeth sy'n peri penbleth imi, sef y newid meddwl am fentrau cyllid preifat ers y ddwy weinyddiaeth flaenorol. Yn flaenorol, mae'n debyg nad oedd ei farn ef a'm barn i am y fenter cyllid preifat yn wahanol iawn—yr oeddem yn meddwl y dylid ei hystyried yn ôl ei rhinweddau, ac, ar rai achlysuron, y gallai fod y llwybr cywir i'w ddilyn. Gwyddom fod Llafur yn San Steffan, a'r Trysorlys yn sicr, yn gweithredu ar sail ystyried a defnyddio'r fenter pan fydd yn briodol. Pam y tro pedol hwn yng nghyswllt iechyd?

**Andrew Davies:** Gwnaethpwyd y cytundeb hwnnw rhwng y ddwy blaid wleidyddol wrth lunio'r rhaglen 'Cymru'n Un' ar gyfer y Llywodraeth. Bu enghreifftiau lle nad yw PFI wedi cyflawni'r amcanion polisi a osodwyd gennym fel Llywodraeth. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n golygu na cheisir PFI ar gyfer

forms of public-private partnership will not be sought where appropriate: where it gives value for money, and enables us to achieve our policy objectives. Indeed, as Minister for finance I have been in close discussion with financial institutions to maximise the level of resource that we can invest in improving public services, and I welcome the review of this area that your colleague Alun Cairns is undertaking as Chair of the Finance Committee.

**Joyce Watson:** As the late Robin Cook observed, good scrutiny produces good government. One of the central messages from the Beecham review, which has fed into the 10-year strategic vision for improving public services, has been the vital role of scrutiny in shaping effective government at a local level. In discussion at the Finance Committee meeting last Thursday, Minister, you made it clear that there was scope for improving scrutiny and, consequently, accountability at the unitary authority level. Could you elaborate on that position, and outline how, in cases where councils are found to be failing—such as the City and County of Swansea, where the performance of social services is a cause for deep concern—local authorities can be made more accountable for their performance?

**Andrew Davies:** I am on record as having said on many occasions that decisions that are accountable and transparent by their very nature are the best decisions, and that is true for Government, the public sector and the private sector. I feel that we need to raise our game; good government at all levels relies upon the Government having a clear view of its role in terms of policy and delivery, but also upon effective scrutiny. If you do not have effective scrutiny then you will not have good governance. Therefore, as I indicated in my responses to Kirsty Williams and others, we need to look seriously at the scrutiny systems that we have at all levels of Government. I do not think that scrutiny or accountability can be reduced to having elections every four or five years—depending on the level of government. Scrutiny needs to be embedded in the processes and systems of any form of government, but we also need active scrutiny by the media, for example. If

mathau eraill o bartneriaethau cyhoeddus-preifat pan fydd yn briodol: pan fydd yn rhoi gwerth am arian, ac yn ein galluogi i gyflawni ein hamcanion polisi. Yn wir, fel Gweinidog dros gyllid yr wyf wedi cael trafodaethau agos gyda sefydliadau ariannol i gael cynifer â phosibl o adnoddau i'w buddsoddi mewn gwella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, a chroesawaf yr adolygiad o'r maes hwn y mae eich cyd-Aelod, Alun Cairns, yn ei gynnal fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyllid.

**Joyce Watson:** Fel y dywedodd y diweddar Robin Cook, mae craffu da'n cynhyrchu llywodraeth dda. Un o negeseuon canolog adolygiad Beecham, sydd wedi bwydo i mewn i'r weledigaeth strategol 10 mlynedd ar gyfer gwella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, oedd swyddogaeth hollbwysig craffu wrth ffurfio llywodraeth effeithiol ar lefel leol. Mewn trafodaeth yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Cyllid ddydd Iau diwethaf, Weinidog, dywedasoch yn glir fod lle i wella systemau craffu ac, o ganlyniad, atebolrwydd ar lefel yr awdurdod unedol. A allech fanylu ar hynny, ac amlinellu sut, mewn achosion lle gwelir bod cynghorau'n methu—megis Dinas a Sir Abertawe, lle mae perfformiad gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn destun pryder dybyrd—y gellir sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol yn fwy atebol am eu perfformiad?

**Andrew Davies:** Yr wyf wedi fy nghofnodi'n dweud droeon mai penderfyniadau sy'n atebol ac yn dryloyw yw'r penderfyniadau gorau yn rhinwedd eu natur, ac mae hynny'n wir i'r Llywodraeth, i'r sector cyhoeddus ac i'r sector preifat. Teimlaf fod angen inni oll wella ein perfformiad; mae llywodraethu da ar bob lefel yn dibynnu ar fod gan y Llywodraeth olwg glir o'i swyddogaeth o ran polisi a chyflenwi, ond hefyd ar graffu effeithiol. Os nad oes gennych systemau craffu effeithiol, ni chewch lywodraethu da. Felly, fel y dywedais yn fy atebion i Kirsty Williams ac i eraill, mae angen inni edrych o ddifrif ar y systemau craffu sydd gennym ar bob lefel o Lywodraeth. Ni chredaf y gellir lleihau craffu nac atebolrwydd i gynnal etholiadau bob pedair i bum mlynedd—gan ddibynnu ar lefel y llywodraeth. Mae angen i graffu fod wedi'i wreiddio ym mhrosesau a systemau unrhyw fath o lywodraeth, ond mae arnom angen

there are deficiencies, we must move to address them. As a Government, if we are funding provision of services at an inadequate level, that should emerge through the performance management framework, or through the use of inspection regimes like Estyn, Care and Social Services Inspectorate Wales and others. We must ensure that we not only have high-quality services, but that we have value for money as well.

**Peter Black:** Minister, would you agree that passing on to local councils the 3.4 per cent increase that you had from the UK Government would be the best way of ensuring the quality of public service delivery around Wales next year?

**Andrew Davies:** The whole thrust of what you are saying implies that the provision of high-quality services is solely dependent upon the level of financial resource that goes in. I do not hold that view. We have a very substantial variation in the quality of service delivery across Wales, and again, I am on record as highlighting the postcode lottery—that is not related to the level of resource going into each local authority. Therefore, this is something that we need to question very firmly through our performance management framework, and through our funding, inspection and regulatory regimes. As I said, it is important that we look at what we get for our investment, not just how much investment we make.

12.40 p.m.

**Peter Black:** My point is that, because the level of resource is so low, there will have to be cuts in public services next year. You are on record as saying that local authorities need to be more efficient in the way that they manage their resources, and you have pressed them to look at efficiency savings to cope with the inadequate settlement that you have provided for them. What do you envisage local authorities being able to achieve through those efficiency savings in the next financial year?

craffu gweithredol hefyd gan y cyfryngau, er enghraifft. Os oes unrhyw ddiffygion, rhaid inni gymryd camau i fynd i'r afael â hwy. Fel Llywodraeth, os ydym yn cyllido darpariaeth gwasanaethau ar lefel annigonol, dylai hynny ddod i'r amlwg drwy'r fframwaith rheoli perfformiad, neu drwy ddefnyddio trefniadau arolygu megis Estyn, Arolygiaeth Gofal a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru ac eraill. Rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn cael gwerth am arian, yn ogystal â gwasanaethau o safon uchel.

**Peter Black:** Weinidog, a gytunech mai pasio'r cynnydd o 3.4 y cant a gawsoch gan Lywodraeth y DU i gynghorau lleol fyddai'r ffordd orau o sicrhau ansawdd cyflenwi gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ledled Cymru y flwyddyn nesaf?

**Andrew Davies:** Mae holl ergyd yr hyn a ddywedwch yn awgrymu bod darparu gwasanaethau o safon uchel yn dibynnu'n llwyr ar faint o adnoddau ariannol a roddir. Nid wyf o'r farn honno. Mae ansawdd cyflenwi gwasanaethau ledled Cymru yn amrywio'n sylweddol, ac eto, yr wyf wedi fy nghofnodi'n tynnu sylw at y loteri cod post—nid yw hynny'n gysylltiedig â faint o adnoddau a aiff i bob awdurdod lleol. Felly, mae hyn yn rhywbeth y mae angen inni ei gwestiynu'n gadarn iawn drwy ein fframwaith rheoli perfformiad, a drwy ein trefniadau cyllido, arolygu a rheoleiddio. Fel y dywedais, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn edrych ar yr hyn a gawn am ein buddsoddiad, ac nid ar faint y buddsoddiad hwnnw'n unig.

**Peter Black:** Fy mhwynt yw, gan fod lefel yr adnoddau mor isel, y bydd yn rhaid gwneud toriadau mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus y flwyddyn nesaf. Yr ydych wedi'ch cofnodi'n dweud bod angen i awdurdodau lleol fod yn fwy effeithlon yn y ffordd y maent yn rheoli eu hadnoddau, ac yr ydych wedi rhoi pwysau arnynt i edrych ar arbedion drwy wella effeithlonrwydd, i ymdopi â'r setliad annigonol yr ydych wedi'i ddarparu iddynt. Beth ydych yn rhagweld y gall awdurdodau lleol ei gyflawni drwy'r arbedion a wnânt drwy wella effeithlonrwydd yn y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf?

**Andrew Davies:** You say that it is an inadequate settlement, but I dispute that. It is a tight settlement, but the overall financial settlement that we had from the UK Government was tighter than it has been in previous years. Each individual local authority is accountable to the electorate for its expenditure, and people will make their judgment in May this year. However, we must highlight that local authorities can borrow as well as raise council tax in addition to the money that they get from us through the revenue support grant. Your local authority, Peter, has borrowed up to the hilt. In fact, the Wales Audit Office has highlighted the problems that the local authority will have given its substantial level of prudential borrowing. It has a big hole in its budget as a result of its profligacy. Voters there—as in the rest of Wales—will make their own judgment in May.

**David Lloyd:** Er mwyn gwella cydweithio rhwng y gwasanaeth iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, sut y bydd cyllidebau sydd wedi eu cyfuno yn gweithio yn ymarferol ar y llawr? A ydych yn rhagweld un awdurdod yn arwain er bod y cyllidebau wedi eu cyfuno?

**Andrew Davies:** That is something that we are actively looking at. My colleague, Brian Gibbons, the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government, has been doing a lot of work with officials on this issue. He visited Scotland and England recently to look at how pooled budgets are working. Barnsley, for example, has the largest pooled budget of its kind in the UK. The budget is £100 million, and resources and sovereignty are pooled between the local authority and, in this case, the primary care trust. It also reflects what I said to Peter Black. Social service departments, following the Grogan judgment, will not have to pay for the provision of continuing care out of their budgets. We are not taking that money back from their budgets. Indeed, we are putting a substantially increased level of resource through the local health boards to address the issue of continuing care. Again, it is about a new collaborative model for service delivery, where we focus on the outcomes—better care for patients and those being transferred from

**Andrew Davies:** Dywedwch ei fod yn setliad annigonol, ond anghytunaf â hynny. Mae'n setliad tynn, ond yr oedd y setliad ariannol cyffredinol a gawsom gan Lywodraeth y DU yn dynnach nag y bu yn y blynyddoedd blaenorol. Mae pob awdurdod lleol unigol yn atebol i'r etholaeth am ei wariant, a bydd pobl yn lleisio'u barn fis Mai eleni. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni dynnu sylw at y ffaith y gall awdurdodau lleol fenthyca yn ogystal â chodi'r dreth gyngor yn ogystal â'r arian a gânt gennym ni drwy'r grant cynnal refeniw. Mae eich awdurdod lleol, Peter, wedi benthyca cymaint â phosibl. Yn wir, mae Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru wedi rhoi sylw i'r problemau a fydd gan yr awdurdod lleol ac ystyried ei lefel sylweddol o fenthyca darbodus. Mae ganddo dwll mawr yn ei gyllideb o ganlyniad i'w afradlonedd. Bydd pleidleiswyr yno—fel yng ngweddill Cymru—yn lleisio'u barn eu hunain ym mis Mai.

**David Lloyd:** In terms of improving co-operation between the health service and social services, how will pooled budgets work practically on the ground? Do you anticipate that one authority will lead even though the budgets have been pooled?

**Andrew Davies:** Mae hynny'n rhywbeth yr ydym yn edrych arno'n weithredol. Mae fy nghyd-Weinidog, Brian Gibbons, y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol, wedi bod yn gwneud llawer o waith gyda swyddogion ar y mater hwn. Ymwelodd â'r Alban a Lloegr yn ddiweddar i edrych ar sut y mae cyllidebau wedi'u cyfuno'n gweithio. Barnsley, er enghraifft, sydd â'r gyllideb wedi'i chyfuno fwyaf o'i math yn y DU. Mae'r gyllideb yn £100 miliwn, a chaiff adnoddau a sofraniaeth eu cyfuno rhwng yr awdurdod lleol ac, yn yr achos hwn, yr ymddiriedolaeth gofal sylfaenol. Mae hefyd yn adlewyrchu'r hyn a ddywedais wrth Peter Black. Yn dilyn dyfarniad Grogan, ni fydd yn rhaid i adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol dalu am ddarparu gofal parhaus o'u cyllidebau eu hunain. Nid ydym yn cymryd yr arian hwnnw'n ôl allan o'u cyllidebau. Yn wir, yr ydym yn rhoi lefel sylweddol uwch o adnoddau drwy'r byrddau iechyd lleol i fynd i'r afael â mater gofal parhaus. Eto, mae'n



care—rather than the amount of money or, indeed, who provides the service.

**Alun Davies:** Following on from that last question, the debate that we had yesterday on the final budget focused on outcomes rather than expenditure, although I think that it is fair to say that the current expenditure on public services is record-breaking in terms of how much this Government is investing in the public infrastructure. Minister, will you repeat and confirm your personal commitment to collaboration in creating excellence in our public services and in creating a world-class public infrastructure in Wales? Will you also give your commitment that this drive for greater efficiency is as important to the Welsh Assembly Government and its programmes as it is to local government?

**Andrew Davies:** Collaboration is very much at the heart of our policies and delivery processes. We know, as a Government, that we cannot deliver on our own; we can only do it through joint working and collaboration. I had a good track record with regard to collaboration when I was the Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks, whether dealing with regeneration in Ceredigion following the withdrawal of Dewhurst, the Heads of the Valleys programme, the Môn a Menai programme in north-west Wales, or indeed working with local authorities on developing transport schemes, whether road, rail or others. However, it also means that we as a Government have to be clear about what we expect in terms of policies and funding. Having had that clear leadership, we must ensure that we deliver jointly on our policy priorities.

#### **Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Portfolio**

**Q3 Leanne Wood:** What discussions has the Minister had regarding the budget allocation for the children, education, lifelong learning and skills portfolio? OAQ(3)0185(FPS)

ymwneud â chael model cydweithredol newydd ar gyfer cyflenwi gwasanaethau, lle'r ydym yn canolbwyntio ar y canlyniadau—gwell gofal i gleifion a'r rheini sy'n cael eu trosglwyddo o ofal—yn hytrach na'r swm o arian nac, yn wir, pwy sy'n darparu'r gwasanaeth.

**Alun Davies:** I ddilyn o'r cwestiwn diwethaf hwnnw, yr oedd y ddafl a gawsom ddoe am y gyllideb derfynol yn canolbwyntio ar ganlyniadau yn hytrach nag ar wariant, er y credaf ei bod yn deg dweud bod y gwariant presennol ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus yr uchaf erioed o ran faint y mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn ei fuddsoddi yn y seilwaith cyhoeddus. Weinidog, a wnewch ailadrodd a chadarnhau eich ymrwymiad personol i gydweithio i greu rhagoriaeth yn ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a chreu seilwaith cyhoeddus o safon fyd-eang yng Nghymru? A wnewch ymrwymo hefyd bod yr ymgyrch hon dros effeithlonrwydd well yr un mor bwysig i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'i rhaglenni ag ydyw i lywodraeth leol?

**Andrew Davies:** Mae cydweithio'n rhan ganolog o'n polisiau a'n prosesau cyflenwi. Gwyddom, fel Llywodraeth, na allwn gyflenwi ar ein pennau ein hunain; dim ond drwy gydweithio y gallwn gyflenwi. Yr oedd gennyf enw da am gydweithio pan yr oeddwn yn Weinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau, boed hynny wrth ymdrin ag adfywio yng Ngheredigion wedi i Dewhurst dynnu'n ôl, rhaglen Blaenau'r Cymoedd, rhaglen Môn a Menai yn y gogledd-orllewin, neu, yn wir, wrth weithio gydag awdurdodau lleol i ddatblygu cynlluniau trafniadaeth, boed hynny'n ffyrdd, yn rheilffyrdd neu'n drafniadaeth arall. Fodd bynnag, mae hefyd yn golygu ei bod yn rhaid inni fel Llywodraeth fod yn eglur am yr hyn yr ydym yn ei ddisgwyl o ran polisiau a chyllid. O gael yr arweinyddiaeth glir honno, rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn cyflenwi ar y cyd o ran ein blaenoriaethau polisi.

#### **Portffolio Plant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau**

**C3 Leanne Wood:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael ynghylch y dyraniad yn y gyllideb ar gyfer portffolio plant, addysg, dysgu gydol oes a sgiliau?

OAQ(3)0185(FPS)

**Andrew Davies:** I have had regular discussions with the Minister for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills, Jane Hutt, throughout the budget process.

**Andrew Davies:** Yr wyf wedi cael trafodaethau rheolaidd gyda Jane Hutt, y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau, drwy gydol y broses o lunio'r gyllideb.

**Leanne Wood:** What specific discussions have you had regarding the national school effectiveness framework for Wales to improve educational standards, what money will be available for the pilot schemes between May and the end of the year, and has a decision been made on where these pilots will take place?

**Leanne Wood:** Pa drafodaethau penodol yr ydych wedi'u cael ynghylch y fframwaith effeithlonrwydd ysgolion cenedlaethol ar gyfer Cymru er mwyn gwella safonau addysg, pa arian fydd ar gael ar gyfer y cynlluniau peilot rhwng mis Mai a diwedd y flwyddyn, ac a oes penderfyniad wedi'i wneud ynghylch ble y cynhelir y cynlluniau peilot hyn?

**Andrew Davies:** Following the Plenary debate on the budget yesterday, I will be holding a series of bilateral meetings with all the spending Ministers, at which issues such as this will be discussed. It is a question of in-year expenditure for this financial year and also plans for the 'One Wales' programme over the next three and a half years. I or the Minister for education will write to you on that specific point.

**Andrew Davies:** Yn dilyn y ddaidl am y gyllideb yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ddoe, byddaf yn cynnal cyfres o gyfarfodydd dwyochrog gyda'r holl Weinidogion sy'n gwario, a thrafodir materion fel y rhain yn y cyfarfodydd hynny. Mae'n ymwneud â gwariant yn ystod y flwyddyn ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol hon yn ogystal â chynlluniau ar gyfer rhaglen 'Cymru'n Un' dros y tair blynedd a hanner nesaf. Byddaf fi, neu'r Gweinidog dros addysg yn ysgrifennu atoch ynghlŷn â'r pwynt penodol hwnnw.

**Alun Cairns:** If you look closely at the funding made available for education and that made available to local authorities for schools, you will see that there is a serious cut, particularly when we take into account the money made available for top-up fees, which will not apply in Wales. If that budget line is taken out so that we can compare Wales with the rest of the UK in terms of this line, you will see that education funding is being seriously cut—I cannot overstate that. How does that accord with the priorities of 'education, education, education'?

**Alun Cairns:** Os edrychwch yn ofalus ar y cyllid sydd ar gael ar gyfer addysg, a hwnnw sydd ar gael i awdurdodau lleol ar gyfer ysgolion, gwelwch fod toriad difrifol, yn enwedig wrth ystyried yr arian sydd ar gael ar gyfer ffioedd atodol, na fydd yn berthnasol yng Nghymru. Os tynnwch y llinell gyllideb honno allan er mwyn inni gael cymharu Cymru â gweddill y DU yng nghyswllt y llinell hon, gwelwch fod y cyllid ar gyfer addysg yn cael ei dorri'n ddifrifol—ni allaf orbwysleisio hynny. Sut y mae hynny'n cydfynd â blaenoriaethau 'addysg, addysg, addysg'?

In terms of the capital spend that is required for school buildings, for example, the Minister for education says that she is first in the queue to apply for funding from your strategic capital investment board. The Minister for Health and Social Services has also said that she is first in the queue for funding from the board. Which Minister is first in the queue? Does the cut in education

O ran y gwariant cyfalaf sy'n ofynnol ar gyfer adeiladau ysgolion, er enghraifft, dywed y Gweinidog dros addysg mai hi yw'r cyntaf yn y ciw i wneud cais am gyllid gan eich bwrdd buddsoddi cyfalaf strategol. Mae'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol hefyd wedi dweud mai hi yw'r cyntaf yn y ciw ar gyfer cael cyllid gan y bwrdd. Pa Weinidog sydd ar

spend not demonstrate the lack of priority that you are placing on education?

**Andrew Davies:** It is not a cut in education spend; we are currently spending more in Wales than in England. We are spending around 5 per cent more per head on education, if you take into account all education spend, than England.

In terms of the strategic capital investment board, it is not a case of queuing. As I explained to the Finance Committee last week, an investment programme will be drawn up, through collaboration with Cabinet colleagues, and then the strategic capital investment board, upon receiving external expert advice, will help in terms of the assessment and delivery of that investment programme. It is not a question of having a queue, be it orderly or not; it is a question of a programme being collaboratively drawn up through the Cabinet.

**Lynne Neagle:** In your closing remarks to the draft budget debate last December, you said that you would think about the additional requirements of disabled children's services in Wales, as identified by the Disabled Children Matter Wales campaign. In the final budget discussed yesterday, however, there was no evidence of additional moneys being found, although reserves were used to fund other priorities. Could you outline precisely what discussions you had between the draft budget stage and the final budget stage with the Minister for children and other Ministers about finding money for these continually neglected services?

**Andrew Davies:** I will write to you regarding the detail on that, but my understanding is that the task group that the Minister for education announced in her written statement—you are obviously in the lead on this campaign, but other Members may not be aware of the timescale—will be set up next week. I will ask Jane Hutt to write a letter to you, which will be made available to all Members, about the process and what the group's proposals will be.

flaen y ciw? Onid yw'r toriad yn y swm a warir ar addysg yn dangos y diffyg blaenoriaeth yr ydych yn ei rhoi ar addysg?

**Andrew Davies:** Nid toriad yn y swm a warir ar addysg ydyw; ar hyn o bryd, yr ydym yn gwario mwy yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr. Os ystyriwch yr holl arian sy'n cael ei wario ar addysg, yr ydym yn gwario tua 5 y cant yn fwy y pen ar addysg nag y mae Lloegr yn ei wario.

O ran y bwrdd buddsoddi cyfalaf strategol, nid yw'n fater o ffurfio ciw. Fel yr eglurais wrth y Pwyllgor Cyllid yr wythnos diwethaf, llunnir rhaglen fuddsoddi, drwy gydweithio â chyd-Aelodau'r Cabinet. Yna, bydd y bwrdd buddsoddi cyfalaf strategol, ar ôl cael cyngor allanol arbenigol, yn cynorthwyo i asesu ac i gyflawni'r rhaglen fuddsoddi. Nid mater o gael ciw ydyw, boed y ciw hwnnw'n drefnus ai peidio; mae'n fater o lunio rhaglen ar y cyd drwy'r Cabinet.

**Lynne Neagle:** Yn eich sylwadau clo yn nadl y gyllideb ddrafft fis Rhagfyr diwethaf, dywedasoch y byddech yn meddwl am ofynion ychwanegol gwasanaethau plant anabl yng Nghymru, a nodwyd yn ymgyrch Plant Anabl yn Cyfri Cymru. Yn y gyllideb derfynol a drafodwyd ddoe, fodd bynnag, ni chafwyd unrhyw dystiolaeth o arian ychwanegol, er i arian wrth gefn gael ei ddefnyddio i ariannu blaenoriaethau eraill. A allech amlinellu pa drafodaethau'n union a gawsoch yn y cyfnod rhwng y gyllideb ddrafft a'r gyllideb derfynol gyda'r Gweinidog dros blant a chyda Gweinidogion eraill ynghylch dod o hyd i arian ar gyfer y gwasanaethau hyn sy'n cael eu hesgeuluso o hyd ac o hyd?

**Andrew Davies:** Ysgrifennaf atoch ynghylch manylion hynny, ond deallaf y bydd y grŵp gorchwyl a gyhoeddwyd gan y Gweinidog dros addysg yn ei datganiad ysgrifenedig—yr ydych yn amlwg ar y blaen gyda'r ymgyrch hon, ond efallai nad yw Aelodau eraill yn ymwybodol o'r amserlen—yn cael ei sefydlu yr wythnos nesaf. Gofynnaf i Jane Hutt ysgrifennu llythyr atoch ynglŷn â'r broses a beth fydd cynigion y grŵp, a sicrhaf fod y llythyr hwn ar gael i'r holl Aelodau.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 4, OAQ(3)0203(FPS), yn ôl.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 4, OAQ(3)0203(FPS), has been withdrawn.

### **The Strategic Capital Investment Board**

### **Y Bwrdd Buddsoddi Cyfalaf Strategol**

**Q5 Jenny Randerson:** Will the Minister make a statement on how the strategic capital investment board will operate? OAQ(3)0154(FPS)

**C5 Jenny Randerson:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am sut y bydd y bwrdd buddsoddi cyfalaf strategol yn gweithredu? OAQ(3)0154(FPS)

**Andrew Davies:** The strategic capital investment board will operate as part of an investment framework. The key components of that will be external expert advice, a common approach to investment appraisal and a strong delivery focus. I believe that the result will be a capital programme that is decided by Ministers and based on 'One Wales' commitments.

**Andrew Davies:** Bydd y bwrdd buddsoddi cyfalaf strategol yn gweithredu fel rhan o fframwaith buddsoddi. Bydd cyngor allanol arbenigol, dull cyffredin o werthuso buddsoddiadau a chanolbwynt cadarn ar gyflenwi yn elfennau allweddol ohono. Credaf mai'r canlyniad fydd rhaglen gyfalaf y penderfynir arni gan Weinidogion, yn seiliedig ar ymrwymadau 'Cymru'n Un'.

**Jenny Randerson:** That is a very disappointing answer in terms of the amount of detail that it gives us. It is a statement of what should be blindingly obvious to any government. I am interested in how you could have set aside, for example, £93 million in 2009-10 for the board from your reserves, without being able to be specific about precisely how the board will operate. If you do not know how it will work, how do you know how much money it will need? Please tell us, in more detail, what the criteria will be. How will Ministers make bids? What will be the dividing line between the money for capital in Ministers' portfolio budgets and the money dealt with by the board? How will you be able to ensure an even-handed approach, or will it just be a first-come-first-served approach or the case that those who shout loudest get the most?

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae hwnnw'n ateb siomedig iawn o ran faint o fanylion a rydd inni. Mae'n ddatganiad o'r hyn a ddylai fod yn gwbl amlwg i unrhyw lywodraeth. Yr hyn y mae gennyf ddiddordeb ynddo yw sut y gallech fod wedi neilltuo, er enghraifft, £93 miliwn yn 2009-10 ar gyfer y bwrdd, o'ch cronfeydd wrth gefn, heb allu dweud yn benodol sut yn union y bydd y bwrdd yn gweithredu. Os na wyddoch sut y bydd yn gweithio, sut y gwyddoch faint o arian y bydd ei angen arno? Os gwelwch yn dda, dywedwch wrthym, yn fanylach, beth fydd y meini prawf. Sut y bydd Gweinidogion yn gwneud cynigion? Beth fydd y llinell a fydd yn rhannu'r arian ar gyfer cyfalaf yng nghyllidebau portffolio'r Gweinidogion a'r arian y bydd y bwrdd yn ymdrin ag ef? Sut y byddwch yn gallu sicrhau dull mwy cytbwys o wneud hyn, ynteu ai dull cyntaf i'r felin a ddefnyddir, neu ddull lle mai'r rheini sydd uchaf eu cloch sy'n cael y swm mwyaf?

12.50 p.m.

**Andrew Davies:** Perhaps this is a useful opportunity to rehearse what has been said on several occasions in the Finance Committee. With regard to the level of resource, you have quoted a figure of £90 million from the reserves in one particular year. However, over the next three and a half years, somewhere in the region of £450 million to £500 million will be ring-fenced to be

**Andrew Davies:** Efallai fod hwn yn gyfle defnyddiol i ailadrodd yr hyn sydd wedi cael ei ddweud droeon yn y Pwyllgor Cyllid. Ac ystyried lefel yr adnodd, yr ydych wedi dyfynnu ffigur o £90 miliwn o'r cronfeydd wrth gefn mewn un flwyddyn benodol. Fodd bynnag, dros y tair blynedd a hanner nesaf, bydd swm a arian rhwng £450 miliwn a £500 miliwn yn cael ei neilltuo at ddefnydd y

handled by the capital investment board. To put that into perspective, our annual capital expenditure across the whole Assembly Government is £1.6 billion.

Therefore, it is very early days; it is a policy initiative, and we want to ensure that this is done in a considered way. Once the discipline is established and the coherent strategic corporate approach is being taken with regard to capital investment, as I said in my reply to Alun Cairns earlier, we hope to extend the discipline to the bulk of capital investment that is currently in each Minister's budget. With regard to how the board will operate, as I said to the committee last week, I will report either to Plenary or the Finance Committee when the detailed proposals are finalised. However, it is policy in progress, and I have given a commitment to report on that in due course.

**Mohammad Asghar:** How will the strategic capital investment board be monitored and how often?

**Andrew Davies:** There are two levels of monitoring. One is what happens in Government. As I said in an earlier response, the investment programme will be decided by the Cabinet; there will be a Cabinet committee that will monitor the position within Government. The external advisory panel will report back to Ministers on its recommendations, assessments of business cases and implementation. The second level of monitoring is the Assembly as a legislature; that will be done either in Plenary, through the Finance Committee or any other relevant committee.

**Darren Millar:** You made a great deal of the strategic capital investment fund during the budget deliberations, as did your ministerial colleagues—a magic pot of gold at the end of the rainbow, as it were. Given the unclear answer that you have just given Jenny Randerson, can you assure my constituents that there will be sufficient capital available from the Welsh Assembly Government—either from the health and social services budget or from this magic pot of gold—to address the very real structural problems at Glan Clwyd Hospital, which serves my

bwrdd buddsoddi cyfalaf. I roi hynny mewn persbectif, £1.6 biliwn yw gwariant cyfalaf blynyddol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i gyd.

Dyddiau cynnar iawn yw hi, felly; menter polisi ydyw, ac yr ydym am sicrhau y gwneir hyn mewn ffordd ystyriol. Ar ôl sefydlu'r ddisgyblaeth, a phan fydd dull corfforaethol strategol a chydlynol ar waith yng nghyswllt buddsoddi cyfalaf, fel y dywedais yn fy ateb i Alun Cairns yn gynharach, gobeithiwn ymestyn y ddisgyblaeth i swmp y buddsoddiad cyfalaf sydd yng nghyllideb pob Gweinidog ar hyn o bryd. O ran sut y bydd y bwrdd yn gweithredu, fel y dywedais wrth y Pwyllgor yr wythnos diwethaf, byddaf yn adrodd naill ai wrth y Cyfarfod Llawn neu wrth y Pwyllgor Cyllid pan fydd y cynigion manwl ar eu ffurf terfynol. Fodd bynnag, polisi ar waith ydyw, ac yr wyf wedi ymrwymo i adrodd ar hynny maes o law.

**Mohammad Asghar:** Sut y bydd y bwrdd buddsoddi cyfalaf strategol yn cael ei fonitro, a pha mor aml?

**Andrew Davies:** Bydd y monitro'n digwydd ar ddwy lefel. Beth sy'n digwydd yn y Llywodraeth yw un ohonynt. Fel y dywedais yn fy ateb blaenorol, y Cabinet fydd yn penderfynu ar y rhaglen fuddsoddi; ceir pwyllgor Cabinet a fydd yn monitro'r sefyllfa o fewn y Llywodraeth. Bydd y panel ymgynghorol allanol yn adrodd yn ôl i'r Gweinidogion ynghylch ei argymhellion, ei asesiadau o achosion busnes, ac ar weithredu. Yr ail lefel fonitro yw'r Cynulliad fel deddfwrfa; gwneir hynny naill ai yn y Cyfarfod Llawn, drwy'r Pwyllgor Cyllid neu unrhyw bwyllgor perthnasol arall.

**Darren Millar:** Rhoesoch lawer iawn o bwyslais ar y gronfa buddsoddi cyfalaf strategol yn ystod yr ystyriaethau ynghylch y gyllideb, yn yr un modd â'ch cyd-Weinidogion—pwrws o aur ym mhen draw'r enfys, fel petai. Ac ystyried yr ateb aneglur yr ydych newydd ei roi i Jenny Randerson, a allwch sicrhau f'etholwyr y bydd digon o gyfalaf ar gael gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru—naill ai o'r gyllideb iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol neu o'r pwrws hud hwn sy'n llawn aur—i fynd i'r afael â phroblemau strwythurol gwirioneddol Ysbyty

constituents so well but that requires at least £0.25 billion to be put right?

**Andrew Davies:** I do not think that I gave an unclear answer. I said that the bulk of capital expenditure or the identified capital investment that the Assembly Government will be making is within each of the spending Minister's budgets. The bulk of the capital investment that will be made in the health service over the next four years is identified in the health Minister's budget. The situation is similar on the education side with Jane Hutt's budget. Therefore, there is no uncertainty about that. In fact, as I said, the capital investment available—for health, education or any other service—is substantial at £1.6 billion. In the early days, over the next few years, the capital investment board will deal with between only £450 million and £500 million. Therefore, we need to get that into perspective. The existing commitments on the health service, hospital rebuilding and so on are accounted for by the health Minister, and I am sure that she would be more than happy to share that with you in due course.

#### Public Services in North Wales

**Q6 Eleanor Burnham:** What is the Minister doing to improve the performance of public services in north Wales? OAQ(3)0167(FPS)

**Andrew Davies:** Along with ministerial colleagues, I am taking action to ensure that we have high-performing, ambitious and citizen-centred public services in north Wales, as elsewhere. As a result, I am establishing local service boards and local service delivery agreements to provide focus and leadership to tackle the major service challenges that we are facing.

**Eleanor Burnham:** In view of the serious situation for local authorities, why should local authorities be squeezed so much when trying to deliver the best public services? The Finance Committee has grave concerns that the current settlement is so inadequate that

Glan Clwyd, sy'n gwasanaethu f'etholwyr gystal ond sydd angen £0.25 biliwn i'w gywiro?

**Andrew Davies:** Nid wyf yn meddwl imi roi ateb aneglur. Dywedais y byddai swmp y gwariant cyfalaf, neu'r buddsoddiad cyfalaf a enwir y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei wneud, o fewn cyllideb pob Gweinidog sy'n gwario. Gwelir swmp y gwariant cyfalaf a wneir yn y gwasanaeth iechyd dros y pedair blynedd nesaf yng nghyllideb y Gweinidog dros iechyd. Mae'r sefyllfa'n debyg yng nghyd-destun addysg gyda chyllideb Jane Hutt. Felly, nid oes unrhyw ansicrwydd ynghylch hynny. Yn wir, fel y dywedais, mae'r buddsoddiad cyfalaf sydd ar gael—ar gyfer iechyd, addysg ac unrhyw wasanaeth arall—yn sylweddol, a'r cyfanswm yn £1.6 biliwn. Yn y dyddiau cynnar, dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf, bydd y bwrdd buddsoddi cyfalaf yn delio â rhwng £450 miliwn a £500 miliwn yn unig. Felly, mae angen inni edrych ar hynny mewn persbectif. Rhoddir cyfrif am yr ymrwymadau presennol ar gyfer y gwasanaeth iechyd, ailadeiladu ysbytai ac yn y blaen gan y Gweinidog dros iechyd, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai hi'n fwy na pharod i rannu hynny â chi maes o law.

#### Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus yn y Gogledd

**C6 Eleanor Burnham:** Beth mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud i wella perfformiad gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng ngogledd Cymru? OAQ(3)0167(FPS)

**Andrew Davies:** Yr wyf i a'm cyd-Weinidogion yn cymryd camau i sicrhau bod gennym wasanaethau cyhoeddus uchelgeisiol sy'n perfformio'n wych ac yn canolbwyntio ar y dinesydd yn y gogledd, fel mewn lleoedd eraill. Yn sgil hyn, yr wyf yn sefydlu byrddau gwasanaethau lleol a chytundebau cyflenwi gwasanaethau lleol i ddarparu ffocws ac arweiniad er mwyn mynd i'r afael â'r prif heriau a wynebwn yng nghyswllt gwasanaethau.

**Eleanor Burnham:** A chofio'r sefyllfa ddifrifol i awdurdodau lleol, pam y dylai awdurdodau lleol gael eu gwasgu cymaint wrth geisio darparu'r gwasanaethau gorau i'r cyhoedd? Mae gan y Pwyllgor Cyllid bryderon difrifol bod y setliad cyfredol mor

core services will not be safeguarded, let alone any extras, and has asked you to review the funding. The Wales Office recently highlighted the poor management of your Government's finances particularly during the absorption of the former Assembly sponsored public bodies into Government departments.

**Andrew Davies:** As I have said, earlier today and on other occasions, I believe that we have made substantial provision for local authorities to deliver core services. It is a tight settlement, but the settlement that we had from the UK Government is the tightest that the Assembly has had since its inception in 1999. As I have often said, you cannot just take this year's settlement or the next three-year settlement in isolation from the substantial and generous funding that we give to local authorities. I repeat what I said yesterday: if we funded local authorities in Wales at the same level as English local authorities are funded by the UK Government, there would be £0.5 billion less going to support local government and to keep council tax levels down. Therefore, I would fundamentally disagree that, somehow, local authorities have been short-changed.

**Janet Ryder:** Obviously, the police force is an important public service. I was pleased last week to receive my certificate for completing the police scheme within the Assembly. I would urge any Members who have not yet signed up for that scheme to do so as it gives a good insight into how the forces operate and how they are run. The scheme also gives you a clear understanding of how valuable police officers are. It is sad that, today, we are seeing in London a demonstration by police officers against their pay settlement. This is the first demonstration of its kind since 1910. We all know that Scotland has moved independently on this issue. Therefore, Minister, are you doing anything to put forward the voice of Wales and to make sure that our police officers are really valued and that a settlement will be secured in their favour as soon as possible?

annigonol nas diogelir gwasanaethau craidd, heb sôn am unrhyw bethau ychwanegol, ac y mae wedi gofyn ichi adolygu'r cyllid. Yn ddiweddar, tynnodd Swyddfa Cymru sylw at y ffaith bod cyllid eich Llywodraeth yn cael ei reoli'n wael, yn enwedig wrth i'r cyrff cyhoeddus a arferai gael eu noddi gan y Cynulliad ddod o dan adain adrannau'r Llywodraeth.

**Andrew Davies:** Fel y dywedais, yn gynharach heddiw ac ar adegau eraill, credaf inni ddarparu'n sylweddol ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol er mwyn iddynt allu darparu gwasanaethau craidd. Mae'r setliad yn un tynn, ond y setliad yr ydym wedi'i gael gan Lywodraeth y DU yw'r un tynnaf i'r Cynulliad ei gael ers y dechrau, yn 1999. Fel yr wyf yn aml wedi'i ddweud, ni allwch gymryd setliad y flwyddyn hon neu'r setliad ar gyfer y tair blynedd nesaf ar eu pennau eu hunain heb ystyried y cyllid sylweddol a hael a roddwn i awdurdodau lleol. Ailadroddaf yr hyn a ddywedais ddoe; petaem yn cyllido awdurdodau lleol Cymru ar yr un lefel ag y mae Llywodraeth y DU yn cyllido awdurdodau lleol Lloegr, byddai £0.5 biliwn yn llai yn mynd i gefnogi llywodraeth leol ac i gadw lefelau'r dreth gyngor i lawr. Felly, byddwn yn anghytuno'n llwyr bod awdurdod lleol, rywsut, yn colli allan.

**Janet Ryder:** Yn amlwg, mae'r heddlu yn wasanaeth cyhoeddus pwysig. Yr oeddwn yn falch yr wythnos diwethaf o gael fy nhystysgrif am gwblhau'r cynllun heddlu yn y Cynulliad. Byddwn yn annog unrhyw Aelodau nad ydynt eto wedi cofrestru ar gyfer y cynllun hwnnw i wneud hynny oherwydd ei fod yn rhoi cyfle ichi weld sut y mae'r heddlu'n gweithredu a sut y cânt eu rhedeg. Mae'r cynllun hefyd yn rhoi dealltwriaeth glir ichi o ba mor werthfawr yw swyddogion yr heddlu. Mae'n drist ein bod, heddiw, yn gweld gwrthdystiad yn Llundain gan swyddogion yr heddlu yn erbyn eu setliad cyflog. Dyma'r gwrthdystiad cyntaf o'i fath er 1910. Gŵyr pob un ohonom fod yr Alban wedi symud yn annibynnol ar y mater hwn. Felly, Weinidog, a ydych yn gwneud unrhyw beth i leisio barn Cymru ac i wneud yn siŵr bod yr heddlu'n cael eu gwerthfawrogi o ddifrif ac y sicrhair setliad o'u plaid cyn gynted ag y bo modd?

**Andrew Davies:** In terms of England and Wales, police pay is a reserved matter; it is a non-devolved matter and therefore for the UK Government to decide upon. However, in response to your first point about the importance of involving police authorities and police officers in the delivery of services, I pay tribute to the contribution of police officers in Wales in working with us and local authorities in improving service delivery, and particularly in addressing issues such as community safety. I know, for example, that the Home Office Minister, Vernon Coaker, visited Swansea last autumn. He was impressed by the work done through the local community safety partnership in addressing issues around community safety, and he viewed that collaborative approach, which I referred to earlier, in marked contrast to the approach taken in many large cities in England. Therefore, we have a good record in working with the local police on improving service delivery. The police are represented on the six pilot local service boards that have been established.

**Andrew Davies:** Yng nghyd-destun Cymru a Lloegr, mae cyflog yr heddlu'n fater nas datganolwyd, ac felly mater i Lywodraeth y DU benderfynu arno ydyw. Fodd bynnag, i ymateb i'ch pwynt cyntaf ynghylch pwysigrwydd cynnwys awdurdodau'r heddlu a swyddogion yr heddlu wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau, rhoddaf deyrnged i gyfraniad swyddogion yr heddlu yng Nghymru sy'n gweithio gyda ni a chydag awdurdodau lleol wrth wella darpariaeth gwasanaethau, ac yn arbennig wrth fynd i'r afael â materion megis diogelwch cymunedol. Gwn, er enghraifft, i Vernon Coaker, un o Weinidogion y Swyddfa Gartref, ymweld ag Abertawe yr hydref diwethaf. Yr oedd y gwaith a wnaethpwyd drwy'r bartneriaeth diogelwch cymunedol lleol i fynd i'r afael â materion yn ymwneud â diogelwch cymunedol, wedi creu argraff arno. Edrychodd ar y dull a grybwyllwyd gennyf yn gynharach, sef dull o weithredu ar y cyd, mewn cyferbyniad llwyr â'r modd y mae llawer o ddinasoedd mawr Lloegr wedi mynd i'r afael â hyn. Felly, mae gennym record dda o ran gweithio gyda'r heddlu lleol i wella'r modd y darperir gwasanaethau. Crëwyd chwe ardal beilot, a chynrychiolir yr heddlu ar y byrddau gwasanaethau lleol a sefydlwyd ar gyfer yr ardaloedd hynny.

### Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol

### Social Justice and Local Government

**C7 David Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddyrannu cyllid i bortffolio cyfiawnder cymdeithasol a llywodraeth leol? OAQ(3)0174(FPS)

**Q7 David Lloyd:** Will the Minister make a statement on the allocation of funding to the social justice and local government portfolio? OAQ(3)0174(FPS)

**Andrew Davies:** The allocation to the social justice and local government portfolio for the period 2008-09 to 2010-11 is set out in the final budget, agreed yesterday by the Assembly. Detailed decisions on the allocation of resources within the portfolio are a matter for the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government.

**Andrew Davies:** Mae'r dyraniad i'r portffolio cyfiawnder cymdeithasol a llywodraeth leol ar gyfer y cyfnod rhwng 2008-09 a 2010-11 yn y gyllideb derfynol y cytunodd y Cynulliad arni ddoe. Mater i'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol yw'r modd y dyrennir yr adnoddau hyn o fewn y portffolio.

**David Lloyd:** Beth a wnewch i hybu datblygu unedau adfer a thrin carcharorion sy'n gaeth i alcohol a chyffuriau yn ein carchardai? Pa drafodaethau a gawsoch o fewn y Cabinet i sicrhau bod blaenoriaeth yn cael ei rhoi i greu a chynnal unedau i garcharorion sy'n gaeth i alcohol a chyffuriau

**David Lloyd:** What are you doing to encourage the development of rehabilitation and treatment units for prisoners who are addicted to alcohol and drugs in our prisons? What discussions have you had within the Cabinet to ensure that priority is given to create and maintain units for prisoners who



mewn carchardai yng Nghymru?

are addicted to alcohol and drugs in prisons in Wales?

1.00 p.m.

**Andrew Davies:** I will discuss that particular matter with Brian Gibbons, the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government, and either he or I will write to you on that.

**Andrew Davies:** Byddaf yn trafod y mater penodol hwnnw gyda Brian Gibbons, y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol, a bydd ef neu byddaf i yn ysgrifennu atoch ynghylch hynny.

**Mark Isherwood:** What discussions have you had with the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government regarding budget provision for the fire and rescue service? After allowing for your cross-budget transfer of capital to revenue, there is actually a reduction. That money appears to have gone into fire and rescue service workers' pensions and retained fire service workers' pensions. What impact do you anticipate that will have on service delivery and on tackling fire deaths in my region and in other parts of Wales?

**Mark Isherwood:** Pa drafodaethau ydych wedi'u cael gyda'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol ynghylch y ddarpariaeth yn y gyllideb ar gyfer y gwasanaeth tân ac achub? Ar ôl caniatáu ar gyfer eich trosglwyddiad ar draws y gyllideb o gyfalaf i refeniw, ceir gostyngiad mewn gwirionedd. Ymddengys fod yr arian hwnnw wedi mynd i bensiynau gweithwyr y gwasanaeth tân ac achub a phensiynau gweithwyr wrth gefn y gwasanaeth tân ac achub. Beth ydych yn ei ragweld fydd effaith hynny ar gyflenwi gwasanaethau ac ar fynd i'r afael â marwolaethau oherwydd tân yn fy rhanbarth ac mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru?

**Andrew Davies:** As I said in my reply to Dai Lloyd, either Brian Gibbons or I will write to you on those specific points.

**Andrew Davies:** Fel y dywedais wrth ateb Dai Lloyd, bydd naill ai Brian Gibbons neu fi yn ysgrifennu atoch ynghylch y materion penodol hynny.

**Mark Isherwood:** Wearing my public services hat for a moment, I would be grateful if you discussed that issue with your local government colleague, because my understanding is that those budgets are delivered via local authorities in each region, whose representatives sit on the local or regional fire authority. They will consider a number of options, but they are aware of the cash constraints imposed on their councils through the budget. Given your public service responsibility, what consideration have you given to the impact of that on fire deaths in Wales?

**Mark Isherwood:** Gan wisgo fy het gwasanaethau cyhoeddus am funud, byddwn yn ddiolchgar petaech yn trafod y mater hwnnw gyda'ch cyd-Aelod Llywodraeth leol, oherwydd caf ar ddeall bod y cyllidebau hynny'n cael eu darparu drwy awdurdodau lleol ym mhob rhanbarth, y mae eu cynrychiolwyr yn eistedd ar yr awdurdod tân lleol neu ranbarthol. Byddant yn ystyried nifer o ddewisiadau, ond maent yn ymwybodol o'r cyfyngiadau arian a roddir ar eu cyngor drwy'r gyllideb. Ac ystyried eich cyfrifoldeb gwasanaeth cyhoeddus, pa ystyriaeth yr ydych wedi'i rhoi i effaith hynny ar farwolaethau oherwydd tân yng Nghymru?

**Andrew Davies:** My priority is to deliver high quality public services. As a Government, we believe that we have given an adequate settlement to local government and others to deliver that high level of service. If you are saying that there are

**Andrew Davies:** Fy mlaenoriaeth yw darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus o ansawdd uchel. Fel Llywodraeth, yr ydym yn credu inni roi setliad digonol i lywodraeth leol ac eraill er mwyn darparu'r lefel uchel honno o wasanaeth. Os ydych yn dweud bod

concerns, I will raise them with Dr Gibbons and either he or I will write to you on that.

pryderon, byddaf yn eu codi gyda Dr Gibbons a bydd ef neu byddaf i yn ysgrifennu atoch ynghylch hynny.

### Spending Power

**Q8 The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** Will the Minister make a statement on initiatives to increase the power of Welsh Assembly Government spending? OAQ(3)0156(FPS)

**Andrew Davies:** As part of the Welsh Assembly Government's drive to improve public services in Wales, we have a programme of measures that deliver better value for the Welsh pound. For example, this includes the XChangeWales system that I announced recently, which has the potential to generate £200 million-worth of procurement savings over five years.

**Michael German:** At an event in Swansea, the *Western Mail* reported that you, the Confederation of British Industry Wales, and the Welsh Local Government Association agreed on a new plan on the use of the private finance initiative in Wales for local government. Did the *Western Mail* report that incorrectly, or will there be a different policy on PFI for schools, local authorities and hospitals?

**Andrew Davies:** There was no agreement on Friday, and there have been no discussions between me, the Assembly Government and the Welsh Local Government Association or the CBI. I cannot answer for any discussions that may or may not have taken place between the CBI and the Welsh Local Government Association, as that is a matter for them. However, we are certainly not involved and we have not had any discussions on that issue. So, not for the first time, the story in the *Western Mail* was wrong, certainly from my perspective.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** For many communities, the Assembly's spending power translates as the money that arrives on their doorstep for community projects. Given

### Grym Gwario

**C8 Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gynlluniau i gynyddu grym gwario Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru? OAQ(3)0156(FPS)

**Andrew Davies:** Fel rhan o ymgyrch Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, mae gennym raglen o fesurau sy'n darparu gwerth gwell am y bunt Gymreig. Er enghraifft, mae hyn yn cynnwys y system XChangeWales a gyhoeddais yn ddiweddar, sydd â'r potensial i gynhyrchu gwerth £200 miliwn o arbedion caffael dros bum mlynedd.

**Michael German:** Yn ystod digwyddiad yn Abertawe, honnodd y *Western Mail* i chi, Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain yng Nghymru a Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, gytuno ar gynllun newydd ar ddefnyddio'r fenter cyllid preifat yng Nghymru ar gyfer llywodraeth leol. A oedd adroddiad y *Western Mail* yn anghywir, ynteu a fydd polisi gwahanol o ran y fenter cyllid preifat ar gyfer ysgolion, awdurdodau lleol ac ysbytai?

**Andrew Davies:** Nid oedd cytundeb ddydd Gwener, ac ni fu trafodaethau rhyngof i, Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru na Chyddfederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain. Ni allaf ateb ar ran unrhyw drafodaethau a allai fod wedi cael eu cynnal rhwng Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain a Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, gan mai mater iddynt hwy yw hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, yn sicr nid ydym yn rhan o hyn ac nid ydym wedi cael trafodaethau ar y mater hwnnw. Felly, nid am y tro cyntaf, yr oedd y stori yn y *Western Mail* yn anghywir, yn sicr o'm safbwynt i.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Ar gyfer nifer o gymunedau, caiff pŵer gwario'r Cynulliad ei gynrychioli gan yr arian sy'n cyrraedd carreg eu drws ar gyfer prosiectau cymunedol. Ac

that the London Olympic Games—of which I am a supporter—is looking to siphon a considerable sum of money out of the lottery development funds that many communities have accessed over successive years to develop community projects, how could you help if those communities looked to the Welsh Assembly Government and the power of your spend to facilitate some of those shortfalls?

**Andrew Davies:** We have made the strongest possible representations to the UK Government on the reduction in the lottery funding that is available as a result of the Olympics, and on how it has set up the Olympics budget. We are concerned about any reduction in lottery funding, which has already had an impact on the grant allocations of the Arts Council of Wales and the Sports Council for Wales. We are in discussion with those bodies, as well as with Ministers, to try to ensure that services are safeguarded in whatever way we can. I will respond in more detail in writing to you on that specific question.

ystyried ei bod yn edrych yn debyg y bydd Gemau Olympaidd Llundain—yr wyf yn eu cefnogi—yn seiffno swm sylweddol o arian allan o gronfeydd datblygu'r loteri y mae nifer o gymunedau wedi eu defnyddio dros flynyddoedd olynol i ddatblygu prosiectau cymunedol, sut y gallech helpu petai'r cymunedau hynny'n troi at Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a phŵer eich gwariant i hwyluso rhai o'r diffygion hynny?

**Andrew Davies:** Yr ydym wedi anfon y sylwadau cryfaf posibl at Lywodraeth y DU ynghylch y gostyngiad yng nghyllid y loteri a fydd ar gael o ganlyniad i'r Gemau Olympaidd, ac ynghylch sut y bu iddi sefydlu cyllideb y Gemau Olympaidd. Yr ydym yn pryderu am unrhyw ostyngiad mewn cyllid loteri, sydd eisoes wedi effeithio ar ddyraniadau grant Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru a Chyngor Chwaraeon Cymru. Yr ydym yn cynnal trafodaethau gyda'r cyrff hynny, yn ogystal â chyda Gweinidogion, i geisio sicrhau bod gwasanaethau'n cael eu diogelu ym mha ffordd bynnag a allwn. Ysgrifennaf atoch gyda rhagor o fanylion ynghylch y cwestiwn penodol hwnnw.

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau Questions to the Minister for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills**

### **School Councils**

**Q1 Bethan Jenkins:** Will the Minister outline the role of school councils?  
OAQ(3)0227(CEL)

**The Minister for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills (Jane Hutt):** A school council is a democratically elected group of pupils whose role is to represent all pupils in the school, to ensure that their voice is heard in decisions that affect them, and to be an active channel of communication between pupils, senior management and the governing body.

**Bethan Jenkins:** I am raising concerns that have been raised with me by Children in Wales over when you intend to initiate an inspection of school councils. This concerns

### **Cynghorau Ysgol**

**C1 Bethan Jenkins:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu swyddogaeth cynghorau ysgol?  
OAQ(3)0227(CEL)

**Y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau (Jane Hutt):** Mae cyngor ysgol yn grŵp o ddisgyblion a etholir yn ddemocrataidd. Mae swyddogaethau'r disgyblion hynny'n cynnwys cynrychioli holl ddisgyblion yr ysgol, sicrhau bod eu lleisiau'n cael eu clywed mewn penderfyniadau sy'n effeithio arnynt, a bod yn sianel cyfathrebu weithredol rhwng y disgyblion, yr uwch reolwyr a'r corff llywodraethu.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Yr wyf yn codi pryderon a godwyd gyda mi gan Plant yng Nghymru ynghylch a ydych yn bwriadu lansio arolygiad o gynghorau ysgol. Mae hyn yn

whether certain pupils are targeted to take part in school councils, and whether decisions taken by schools councils are taken forward through headteachers. There are cases of representations being made to a headteacher, only for them to be ignored. When will this inspection take place?

**Jane Hutt:** You were with me at the Funky Dragon conference, where young people talked about their consideration of school councils. They suggested areas of improvement in their operation.

We have evidence from two separate reports, which we remitted Estyn to undertake, that focus on issues of effective practice in pupil participation, in the case of secondary education. We need to follow that through in our participation strategies, and ensure that an inspection does deliver improved practice.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** As a great fan of the school council system—and our local school has one up and running very well—I welcome the establishment of the compunction on schools, in legislation back in November 2006, to follow the school council model. Surely now is the time to move it on, so that schools and their school councils hold more dialogue with the clusters that feed into the secondary system from the primary element. Does the Minister have any ideas or proposals to provide resource for greater co-operation between school councils within local education authority areas, so that they are not just working in silos in their schools, but are working within the clusters that feed the secondary model?

**Jane Hutt:** We have some good examples of school councils across Wales. Many in the secondary sector are already linking with the primary sector as part of the transition stage. At the recent North of England Education Conference, held at the Wales Millennium Centre here in Cardiff, we had an example of just that: secondary and primary schools coming together to show how they were linking up. We also have a support arrangement for school councils in the Assembly and with Funky Dragon in the

ymwneud ag yw disgyblion penodol yn cael eu targedu i gymryd rhan mewn cynghorau ysgol, ac a fydd penaethiaid yn gweithredu penderfyniadau a wneir gan gynghorau ysgol. Ceir achosion o gyflwyno sylwadau i'r pennaeth a'r pennaeth yn anwybyddu'r sylwadau hynny. Pryd cynhelir yr arolygiad hwn?

**Jane Hutt:** Yr oeddech gyda mi yng nghynhadledd y Ddraig Ffynici, lle'r oedd pobl ifanc yn sgwrsio am eu barn nhw am gynghorau ysgol. Awgrymasant feysydd gweithredu y gellid eu gwella.

Mae gennym dystiolaeth o ddau adroddiad gwahanol, y rhoesom gylch gwaith i Estyn i'w cynnal, sy'n canolbwyntio ar arfer effeithiol mewn cyfranogiad disgyblion yn achos addysg uwchradd. Mae angen inni fynd ar drywydd hynny yn ein strategaethau cyfranogiad, a sicrhau bod arolygiad yn arwain at arfer gwell.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Fel un o gefnogwyr brwd y system cyngor ysgol—ac mae gan ein hysgol leol gyngor sy'n gweithredu'n dda iawn—croesawaf y ffaith bod deddfwriaeth yn ôl ym mis Tachwedd 2006 wedi rhoi'r cyfrifoldeb ar ysgolion i ddilyn y model cyngor ysgol. Onid yn awr yw'r adeg i'w symud ymlaen, er mwyn i ysgolion a'u cynghorau ysgol gynnal rhagor o ddeialog gyda'r clystyrau sy'n bwydo i'r system uwchradd o'r elfen gynradd? A oes gan y Gweinidog unrhyw syniadau neu gynigion i ddarparu adnodd ar gyfer rhagor o gydweithrediad rhwng cynghorau ysgol yn yr ardaloedd awdurdod addysg lleol, er mwyn sicrhau nad ydynt yn gweithio mewn seilo yn eu hysgolion, ond eu bod yn gweithio yn y clystyrau sy'n bwydo'r model uwchradd?

**Jane Hutt:** Mae gennym rai enghreifftiau da o gynghorau ysgol ledled Cymru. Mae nifer yn y sector uwchradd eisoes yn cysylltu â'r sector cynradd fel rhan o'r cyfnod pontio. Yn y Cynhadledd Addysg Gogledd Lloegr diweddar, a gynhaliwyd yng Nghanolfan Mileniwm Cymru yng Nghaerdydd, cawsom enghraifft o union hynny: ysgolion uwchradd a chynradd yn dod ynghyd i ddangos sut yr oeddent yn cysylltu â'i gilydd. Mae gennym drefniant cefnogi hefyd ar gyfer cynghorau ysgol yn y Cynulliad a gyda'r Ddraig Ffynici

shape of the youth fora that link with and bring together the representation and school councils. That is already showing that school councils are having a beneficial impact on the key issue of transition.

**Joyce Watson:** Does the Minister agree that school councils are part of a wider movement that is directed at instilling a strong culture of democracy and citizenship in people in Wales? The innovation and energy that this Government has shown in promoting a strong voice for children is commendable. From establishing the UK's first children's commissioner to promoting rights for all young people aged 11 to 25 through 'Extending Entitlement', as well as by encouraging young people to find their own voice through local youth fora, we are setting the agenda for developing children's rights and responsibilities in Wales. Will you outline what the Assembly Government is doing to help school council representatives, such as the impressive ones whom I met recently from Gorslas, in Carmarthenshire, and Cynlais, in Powys, to share best practice and to drive the agenda forward?

**Jane Hutt:** I am delighted to see that we have Ynyshir school council in the public gallery. I am sure that more school councils will be watching, knowing that these questions are being asked today. Throughout Wales, school councils are engaging in those important points of developing their understanding of democracy and citizenship, and it is delightful that they are engaging with us by attending in the public gallery.

We can support school councils and spread good practice through recommending that they look at the Schools Council Wales website, and we want to hear about how people are using and accessing that. There is also the Schools Council Wales's DVD of the Whose Voice? Your Choice conference that was held recently, bringing together schools councils. We had a competition on best practice; again, we are ensuring that we can see where schools councils are working. That competition contributed case studies and ideas for interactive games and activities, and that is how we can share good practice in Wales.

ar ffurf y fforymau ieuencid sy'n cysylltu'r cynrychiolwyr a'r cynghorau ysgol ac yn dod â nhw at ei gilydd. Mae hwnnw eisoes yn dangos bod cynghorau ysgol yn cael effaith fuddiol ar fater allweddol pontio.

**Joyce Watson:** A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno bod cynghorau ysgol yn rhan o fudiad mwy a anelir at drwytho pobl Cymru mewn diwylliant cryf o ddemocratiaeth a dinasyddiaeth? Rhaid canmol yr arloesedd a'r egni a ddangosodd y Llywodraeth hon wrth hyrwyddo llais cryf ar gyfer plant. O sefydlu comisiynydd plant cyntaf y DU i hyrwyddo hawliau pob person ifanc rhwng 11 a 25 oed drwy 'Ymestyn Hawliau', yn ogystal â drwy annog pobl ifanc i ddod o hyd i'w llais eu hunain drwy fforymau ieuencid lleol, yr ydym yn gosod yr agenda ar gyfer datblygu hawliau a chyfrifoldebau plant yng Nghymru. A wnewch amlinellu'r hyn y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei wneud i helpu cynrychiolwyr cynghorau ysgolion, megis y rhai trawiadol y cyfarfûm â nhw yn ddiweddar o Orslas, yn sir Gaerfyrddin, a Chynlais, ym Mhowys, i rannu'r arfer gorau a gyrru'r agenda yn ei blaen?

**Jane Hutt:** Yr wyf yn falch iawn o weld bod cyngor ysgol Ynyshir yn yr oriel gyhoeddus. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd rhagor o gynghorau ysgol yn gwylio, gan wybod bod y cwestiynau hyn yn cael eu gofyn heddiw. Ledled Cymru, mae cynghorau ysgol yn ymgysylltu â'r pwyntiau pwysig hynny yng nghyswllt datblygu eu dealltwriaeth o ddinasyddiaeth, ac mae'n fendigedig gweld eu bod yn ymgysylltu â ninnau drwy ddod i'r oriel gyhoeddus.

Gallwn gefnogi cynghorau ysgol a lledaenu arfer da drwy argymhell eu bod yn edrych ar wefan Cynghorau Ysgol Cymru, ac yr ydym eisiau clywed sut y mae pobl yn defnyddio honno. Mae gan Cynghorau Ysgol Cymru hefyd DVD o'r gynhadledd Llais Pwy? Eich Dewis a gynhaliwyd yn ddiweddar a ddaeth â chynghorau ysgol ynghyd. Cawsom gystadleuaeth ar yr arfer gorau; unwaith eto, yr ydym yn sicrhau y gallwn weld ble mae cynghorau ysgol yn gweithio. Cyfrannodd y gystadleuaeth honno astudiaethau achos a syniadau ar gyfer gweithgareddau a gemau rhyngweithiol, a dyna sut y gallwn rannu arfer da yng Nghymru.

1.10 p.m.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 2, OAQ(3)0239(CEL), yn ôl.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 2, OAQ(3)0239(CEL), has been withdrawn.

### Further Education Funding Gap

**Q3 Kirsty Williams:** What assessment has the Minister made of the further education funding gap between England and Wales? OAQ(3)0201(CEL)

**The Deputy Minister for Skills (John Griffiths):** There is no direct read-across from the funding structures in England to Wales, so exact comparisons cannot be made. However, the latest Her Majesty's Treasury *Public Expenditure Statistical Analyses* publication indicates that overall investment in Wales on education and training is around 5 per cent greater than it is in England on a per capita basis.

**Kirsty Williams:** Is it not amazing, Minister, that, in one sentence, you say that no comparisons can be made, and then you manage to drag up a statistic that tries to make your Government look good? The evidence and the experience of further education professionals in Wales is that there is a growing gap between what they can offer students in Wales, as opposed to their counterparts in England. On the FE effectiveness programme, for example, the Government is featuring strongly on its plans for school effectiveness, but there is grave concern that there is not the same focus on the FE effectiveness programme. What developments are taking place with this programme, and what resources are available to deliver it?

**John Griffiths:** In answering your initial question, I began by making the obvious and correct point that, some eight years after devolution, it is not possible to do sort of direct read-across comparing the funding of education and training—further education in this case—in Wales with that in England. I went on to give you the best ballpark figure that we can come up with, which is for education and training in general. Your initial

### Bwlch Cyllido Addysg Bellach

**C3 Kirsty Williams:** Pa asesiad y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i wneud o'r bwlch cyllido addysg bellach rhwng Cymru a Lloegr? OAQ(3)0201(CEL)

**Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Sgiliau (John Griffiths):** Nid oes modd cymharu strwythurau cyllido Lloegr a Chymru yn uniongyrchol, felly nid oes modd llunio cymariaethau manwl gywir. Fodd bynnag, mae cyhoeddiad diweddaraf Trysorlys Ei Mawrhydi *Public Expenditure Statistical Analyses* yn dangos bod buddsoddiad cyffredinol yng Nghymru ar addysg a hyfforddiant oddeutu 5 y cant yn fwy y pen nag ydyw yn Lloegr.

**Kirsty Williams:** Onid yw'n anhygoel, Weinidog, eich bod mewn un frawddeg yn dweud na ellir llunio cymhariaeth ac wedyn yr ydych yn llwyddo i lusgo ystadegyn i'r golwg sy'n ceisio gwneud i'ch Llywodraeth edrych yn dda? Mae'r dystiolaeth a phrofiad gweithwyr proffesiynol ym maes addysg bellach yng Nghymru yn dangos bod bwlch cynyddol rhwng yr hyn y gallant ei gynnig i fyfyrwyr yng Nghymru, o'i gymharu â'u cymheiriaid yn Lloegr. Ac ystyried rhaglen effeithiolrwydd addysg bellach, er enghraifft, mae'r Llywodraeth yn sôn llawer am ei chynlluniau ar gyfer effeithiolrwydd ysgolion, ond ceir pryder difrifol na cheir yr un ffocws ar raglen effeithiolrwydd addysg bellach. Pa ddatblygiadau sydd ar waith gyda'r rhaglen hon, a pha adnoddau sydd ar gael i'w darparu?

**John Griffiths:** Wrth ateb eich cwestiwn cyntaf, dechreuais drwy wneud y pwynt amlwg a chywir nad yw'n bosibl, oddeutu wyth mlynedd ar ôl datganoli, llunio'r math o gymariaethau uniongyrchol ynghylch cyllid addysg a hyfforddiant—addysg bellach yn yr achos hwn—rhwng Cymru a Lloegr. Euthum ymlaen i roi'r ffigur bras gorau sydd gennym, sy'n ffigur ar gyfer addysg a hyfforddiant yn gyffredinol. Yr oedd eich cwestiwn cyntaf yn

question was about further education, which is why I made the clear point about there being no direct read-across.

There are many efforts to improve the effectiveness of further education in Wales; happily, they have borne and are bearing fruit. We see many positive Estyn reports on further education institutions, and, in the Chamber the other week, I referred to the wonderful number of grade 1 awards achieved by Deeside College. That is also true of other further education colleges across Wales. Therefore, the big increases in funding that we have seen over several years for further education are bearing fruit in performance terms. The Webb review is very much about how we can take effectiveness forward in the future, and includes many detailed recommendations. We have our skills and employment strategy out for consultation, and we have encouraged people responding to that consultation to address the Webb recommendations also. All that will feed into an action plan that we believe will increase the effectiveness of further education in Wales.

**Kirsty Williams:** It is a good job that Estyn is looking only at the performances of FE colleges, because you have singularly failed to answer my question. How much money is available for implementing an FE effectiveness programme? If you cannot answer that question—and you obviously cannot—let me try another one. How much money has your Government made available for the professionalisation of the FE workforce? I acknowledge that money has been put in the budget for the professionalisation of the teaching workforce in our schools, but how much has been made available for the professional development of FE tutors? Can you answer that one?

**John Griffiths:** I will write to you in detail on this whole issue. There is increased investment for further professionalisation and professional development in further education. We have also made it clear that the funding for the networks that were tasked with taking forward the 14-19 learning

ymwneud ag addysg bellach, a dyna pam y bu imi wneud y pwynt clir na ellir cymharu'n uniongyrchol.

Ceir nifer o ymdrechion i wella effeithiolrwydd addysg bellach yng Nghymru; yn ffodus, maent wedi dwyn ffrwyth ac yn dal i wneud hynny. Yr ydym yn gweld nifer o adroddiadau cadarnhaol gan Estyn ar gyfer sefydliadau addysg bellach, ac, yn y Siambr yr wythnos o'r blaen, cyfeiriais at nifer wych y dyfarniadau gradd 1 a gyflawnwyd gan Goleg Glannau Dyfrdwy. Mae hynny hefyd yn wir ar gyfer colegau addysg bellach eraill ledled Cymru. Felly, mae'r cynnydd mawr mewn cyllid yr ydym wedi'i weld dros nifer o flynyddoedd ar gyfer addysg bellach yn dwyn ffrwyth yn nhermau perfformiad. Mae adolygiad Webb yn ymwneud i raddau helaeth â sut y gallwn fynd ag effeithiolrwydd rhagddo yn y dyfodol, ac mae'n cynnwys nifer o argymhellion manwl. Ymgynghorir ar ein strategaeth sgiliau a chyflogaeth ar hyn o bryd, ac yr ydym wedi annog pobl sy'n ymateb i'r ymgynghoriad hwnnw i roi sylw i argymhellion Webb hefyd. Bydd hynny i gyd yn bwydo i gynllun gweithredu a gredwn fydd yn gwella effeithiolrwydd addysg bellach yng Nghymru.

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae'n ffodus mai dim ond edrych ar berfformiad colegau addysg bellach a wna Estyn, gan ichi fethu'n llwyr ag ateb fy nghwestiwn. Faint o arian sydd ar gael ar gyfer gweithredu rhaglen effeithiolrwydd addysg bellach? Os na allwch ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw—ac mae'n amlwg na allwch—gadewch imi roi cynnig ar un arall. Faint o arian a ddarparwyd gan eich Llywodraeth ar gyfer proffesiynoli'r gweithlu addysg bellach? Yr wyf yn cydnabod bod arian wedi cael ei roi yn y gyllideb ar gyfer proffesiynoli'r gweithlu addysgu yn ein hysgolion, ond faint sydd wedi'i ddarparu ar gyfer datblygiad proffesiynol tiwtoriaid addysg bellach? A allwch ateb hwnnw?

**John Griffiths:** Ysgrifennaf atoch gyda manylion y mater hwn yn ei gyfanrwydd. Ceir buddsoddiad uwch ar gyfer rhagor o broffesiynoli a datblygiad proffesiynol mewn addysg bellach. Yr ydym hefyd wedi egluro y bydd y cyllid ar gyfer y rhwydweithiau y gofynnwyd iddynt fynd â'r llwybrau dysgu

pathways will increase next year by some 30 to 60 per cent. They are in a key position to take forward further education in Wales and to bring about the further improvement that we all want to see. What is clear and indisputable is that there have been substantial increases in funding for further education in Wales across the board over several years. We see many developments in further education now, with new projects coming on board and new builds, which demonstrate the availability of that funding. We will continue in that vein.

**Kirsty Williams:** I am grateful for your commitment to write to me with an answer to that question. However, could you assure me that you will be able to answer it slightly more quickly than the Minister for education? I asked her the very same question in committee on 14 November, and the Minister said that she would write to me. I am still waiting for a reply.

**John Griffiths:** I will ensure that you get a timely response and I know that Jane will also ensure that that happens.

#### **The Workers' Educational Association**

**Q4 Lesley Griffiths:** Will the Minister make a statement on the Workers' Educational Association in Wales? OAQ(3)0193(CEL)

**John Griffiths:** The Workers' Educational Association plays an important role in the provision of learning in Wales and makes a particular contribution with regard to those learners who are the hardest to reach. The outcome of the Webb review and the launch of the skills strategy should provide further opportunities for the WEA.

**Lesley Griffiths:** While I welcome the ongoing financial commitment that this Government has given the WEA over the next year, could you look at Government support and at changing the funding mechanisms to suit the particular needs and nature of the WEA, which, as you say, helps those people who are hardest to reach in our communities?

14-19 rhagddynt yn codi oddeutu 30 i 60 y cant y flwyddyn nesaf. Maent mewn sefyllfa allweddol i fynd ag addysg bellach rhagddi yng Nghymru a chyflwyno'r gwelliant pellach yr ydym i gyd am ei weld. Yr hyn sy'n glir ac yn ddigamsyniol yw y bu cynnydd arwyddocaol mewn cyllid ar gyfer addysg bellach yng Nghymru drwyddi draw ers blynyddoedd lawer. Gwelwn ddatblygiadau niferus mewn addysg bellach yn awr, gyda phrosiectau newydd yn dod i law ac adeiladu o'r newydd, sy'n profi bod y cyllid hwnnw ar gael. Parhawn â'r trywydd hwnnw.

**Kirsty Williams:** Yr wyf i'n ddiolchgar ichi am eich ymrwymiad i ysgrifennu ataf gydag ateb i'r cwestiwn hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, a allech fy sicrhau y gallwch ei ateb fymryn yn gynt na'r Gweinidog dros addysg? Gofynnais yr un cwestiwn iddi mewn pwyllgor ar 14 Tachwedd, a dywedodd y Gweinidog y byddai'n ysgrifennu ataf. Yr wyf fi'n dal i ddisgwyl ateb.

**John Griffiths:** Sicrhaf y cewch ymateb prydlon a gwn y bydd Jane hefyd yn sicrhau y digwydd hynny.

#### **Cymdeithas Addysg y Gweithwyr**

**C4 Lesley Griffiths:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am Gymdeithas Addysg y Gweithwyr yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)0193(CEL)

**John Griffiths:** Mae Cymdeithas Addysg y Gweithwyr yn chwarae rhan bwysig yn y ddarpariaeth ddysgu yng Nghymru, ac mae'n gwneud cyfraniad penodol yng nghyswllt y dysgwyr hynny sydd anoddaf eu cyrraedd. Dylai canlyniad adolygiad Webb a lansio'r strategaeth sgiliau esgor ar gyfleoedd pellach i Gymdeithas Addysg y Gweithwyr.

**Lesley Griffiths:** Er fy mod yn croesawu'r ymrwymiad ariannol rheolaidd y mae'r Llywodraeth hon wedi'i roi i Gymdeithas Addysg y Gweithwyr dros y flwyddyn i ddod, a allech edrych ar gefnogaeth y Llywodraeth ac ar newid y mecanweithiau cyllido i gydweddu ag anghenion a natur penodol Cymdeithas Addysg y Gweithwyr sydd, fel y dywedwch, yn helpu'r bobl hynny sydd anoddaf eu cyrraedd yn ein cymunedau?



**John Griffiths:** Like you, I very much value the work of the WEA. It plays an important role in reaching those who would not otherwise be reached in terms of education and training in Wales. Therefore, it is extremely important to our social justice agenda. We recognise that there have been difficulties in the past in terms of funding mechanisms not truly reflecting the cost of delivery for organisations such as the WEA, and the non-formal nature of many of the courses is perhaps a particular difficulty.

We keep the funding mechanism under constant review and, in the light of your concerns, which I share, we will, as a matter of priority, consider the funding difficulties faced by the WEA and speed up the work that is being done at present, which I hope will better recognise the role that it has and can play.

**Gareth Jones:** Mae'n amlwg o'r ateb hwnnw eich bod yn cytuno a mi y gallai Cymdeithas Addysg y Gweithwyr gyfrannu'n effeithiol iawn tuag at gyflawni cynllun gwaith 'Sgiliau sy'n gweithio i Gymru' ac agenda 'Cymru'n Un'. Sut y byddech yn sicrhau hynny?

**John Griffiths:** I am sorry, Gareth, but I am afraid that I missed your question, because my translation headset was not on the right channel.

**The Presiding Officer:** I will invite Gareth to ask his question again, which will, of course, be properly interpreted so that the Deputy Minister will hear. Please check that your headset working.

**John Griffiths:** Please bear with me a moment, Llywydd.

**The Presiding Officer:** This will not come out of your time, as this is a technological problem.

**John Griffiths:** It does not seem to change channel for some strange reason.

**John Griffiths:** Fel chithau, gwerthfawrogaf waith Cymdeithas Addysg y Gweithwyr yn fawr. Mae'n chwarae rhan bwysig yn cyrraedd y rheini na fyddai, fel arall, yn cael eu cyrraedd yng nghyswllt addysg a hyfforddiant yng Nghymru. O'r herwydd, mae'n hynod bwysig i'n hagenda cyfiawnder cymdeithasol. Cydnabyddwn y cafwyd anawsterau yn y gorffennol oherwydd nad oedd mecanweithiau cyllido yn adlewyrchu gwir gostau darparu cyrff megis Cymdeithas Addysg y Gweithwyr, ac mae natur anffurfiol nifer o'r cyrsiau, o bosibl, yn anhawster penodol.

Yr ydym yn adolygu'r mecanwaith cyllido'n gyson ac, yn wyneb eich pryderon, pryderon a rannaf, ystyriwn fel mater o flaenoriaeth yr anawsterau cyllido a wynebir gan Gymdeithas Addysg y Gweithwyr a phrysturwn y gwaith a wneir ar hyn o bryd, yn y gobaith y bydd hynny'n rhoi gwell cydnabyddiaeth i'r rôl y mae wedi'i chwarae ac y gall chwarae.

**Gareth Jones:** It is clear from that reply that you agree with me that the Workers' Educational Association could make a very effective contribution to delivering the action plan 'Skills that work for Wales' and the 'One Wales' agenda. How will you ensure that?

**John Griffiths:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Gareth, ond mae gen i ofn imi fethu eich cwestiwn gan nad oedd fy nghlustffon cyfieithu ar y sianel gywir.

**Y Llywydd:** Gwahoddaf Gareth i ofyn ei gwestiwn o'r newydd, a bydd hwnnw, wrth gwrs, yn cael ei gyfieithu'n briodol er mwyn i'r Dirprwy Weinidog glywed. A fyddech gystal â sicrhau bod eich clustffon yn gweithio.

**John Griffiths:** Erfyniaf am eich amynedd am eiliad, Lywydd.

**Y Llywydd:** Ni ddaw hyn o'ch dyraniad amser, gan mai problem dechnegol ydyw.

**John Griffiths:** Nid yw fel pe tai'n newid sianel, am ryw reswm rhyfedd.

**The Presiding Officer:** The Minister seems to be assisting you.

**John Griffiths:** Thank you, Llywydd and Jane, it is working now.

**Gareth Jones:** Dywedais ei fod yn amlwg o'ch ateb i'r cwestiwn blaenorol eich bod yn cytuno a mi y gallai Cymdeithas Addysg y Gweithwyr gyfrannu'n effeithiol iawn tuag at gyflawni cynllun gwaith 'Sgiliau sy'n gweithio i Gymru' ac agenda 'Cymru'n Un'. Sut y byddech yn sicrhau hynny a bod y gymdeithas yn chwarae rhan allweddol?

**John Griffiths:** I would probably have been better off listening to the Welsh. My Welsh is probably good enough by now to have got the gist of that.

1.20 p.m.

Funding is obviously key, so my previous answer, hopefully, addresses much of the concern. I know that the Workers' Educational Association in north Wales, at Coleg Harlech, has ambitious programmes for development, on that site and otherwise. It is looking for support from the Welsh Assembly Government and other sources, and my officials are in close contact with it regarding that proposed expansion. I have met representatives of Coleg Harlech in the last few weeks to discuss matters and I hope that, as we take things forward in the light of the skills strategy and the Webb review, we will be able to demonstrate clearly a growing role, not just for the Workers' Educational Association but also for other, similar organisations in Wales doing this valuable work. That is the spirit in which the Welsh Assembly Government is determined to take things forward.

**Nick Ramsay:** I did not think that we were going to get to my question for a minute—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Members will always be called in an orderly manner. I called the Chair of the Enterprise and Learning Committee. Chairs have a distinguished place here, and that includes

**Y Llywydd:** Ymddengys bod y Gweinidog yn eich helpu.

**John Griffiths:** Diolch, Lywydd a Jane, mae'n gweithio yn awr.

**Gareth Jones:** I said that it was clear from your reply to the previous question that you agree with me that the Workers' Educational Association could make a very effective contribution to the delivery of the action plan 'Skills that work for Wales' and the 'One Wales' agenda. How will you ensure that and that the association plays a key role?

**John Griffiths:** Waeth imi fod wedi gwranddo ar y Gymraeg. Siawns nad yw fy Nghymraeg yn ddigon da erbyn hyn i ddeall hynny.

Mae cyllid yn amlwg yn allweddol, felly mae fy ateb blaenorol, gobeithio, yn mynd i'r afael â llawer o'r pryder. Gwn fod gan Gymdeithas Addysg y Gweithwyr yn y gogledd, yng Ngholeg Harlech, raglenni uchelgeisiol ar gyfer datblygu, ar y safle hwnnw ac mewn mannau eraill. Mae'n chwilio am gefnogaeth gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ac o ffynonellau eraill, ac mae fy swyddogion yn cysylltu'n glos ag ef ynghylch yr ehangu arfaethedig hwnnw. Yr wyf wedi cyfarfod â swyddogion o Goleg Harlech dros yr wythnosau diwethaf i drafod materion a gobeithiaf, wrth inni ddwyn pethau ymlaen yn wyneb y strategaeth sgiliau ac adolygiad Webb, y gallwn ddangos yn glir rôl gynyddol, nid dim ond yng nghyswllt Cymdeithas Addysg y Gweithwyr ond hefyd cyrff eraill, cyffelyb yng Nghymru sy'n gwneud y gwaith gwerthfawr hwn. Yr ysbryd hwnnw y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn benderfynol o'i arddel wrth ddwyn pethau ymlaen.

**Nick Ramsay:** Credais am funud na fyddem yn cyrraedd fy nghwestiwn—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Gelwir Aelodau mewn ffordd drefnus bob amser. Gelwais Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu. Mae gan Gadeiryddion le anrhydeddus yma, ac mae hynny'n cynnwys Aelodau Ceidwadol sy'n

Conservative Members who are Chairs of committees.

**Nick Ramsay:** Actually, most of the points that I was going to raise with the Deputy Minister have already been raised. [*Laughter.*] They have been raised many times.

The Workers' Educational Association has a valuable role in my constituency. Not only is it one of the providers of learndirect but it also helps young people with learning disabilities. It is not alone in being one of those organisations that has suffered in the past because of funding arrangements. Can the Minister repeat his assurances that, in the ongoing discussions, he will do what he can to ensure that the WEA and similar organisations get the support that they deserve?

**John Griffiths:** I am happy to do that. I am familiar with the work of the WEA in Monmouthshire, and in Gwent and south Wales in general. The groups that you mention are great beneficiaries of that work. The WEA and similar organisations do a lot of the preparatory work that enables learners who start from a low level of formal education to progress and to have good education and training and worthwhile careers. We are determined that that work will be properly supported in the future, and the funding mechanisms and our general strategies will be shaped with that clear objective in mind.

### Team Sports

**Q5 Mick Bates:** Will the Minister make a statement on team sports in schools? OAQ(3)0191(CEL)

**Jane Hutt:** Team sports form an integral part of the physical education curriculum. They are also promoted through the wide range of extra curricular activities through Dragon Sport and the 5x60 secondary school sport programme supported by the Sports Council for Wales on behalf of the Welsh Assembly Government.

**Mick Bates:** I am certain that, like me, you

Gadeiryddion pwyllgorau.

**Nick Ramsay:** A dweud y gwir, mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r pwyntiau yr oeddwn am eu codi gyda'r Dirprwy Weinidog wedi eu codi eisoes. [*Chwerthin.*] Fe'u codwyd droeon.

Mae gan Gymdeithas Addysg y Gweithwyr rôl werthfawr yn fy etholaeth. Nid yn unig y mae'n un o ddarparwyr learndirect ond y mae hefyd yn helpu pobl ifanc ag anableddau dysgu. Nid yw ar ei phen ei hun ymhlith y mudiadau hynny a ddioddefodd yn y gorffennol oherwydd trefniadau cyllido. A all y Gweinidog ailadrodd ei sicrwydd y gwnaiff ef, yn y trafodaethau cyfredol, wneud popeth o fewn ei allu i sicrhau y bydd Cymdeithas Addysg y Gweithwyr a chyrrff cyffelyb yn cael y gefnogaeth a haeddant?

**John Griffiths:** Yr wyf yn hapus i wneud hynny. Yr wyf yn gyfarwydd â gwaith Cymdeithas Addysg y Gweithwyr yn sir Fynwy, ac yng Ngwent ac yn y de yn gyffredinol. Mae'r grwpiau y cyfeiriwch atynt yn elwa'n fawr o'r gwaith hwnnw. Mae Cymdeithas Addysg y Gweithwyr a chyrrff cyffelyb yn gwneud llawer o'r gwaith paratoi sy'n galluogi dysgwyr sy'n dechrau gydag ond ychydig o addysg ffurfiol i ddod yn eu blaen a chael addysg a hyfforddiant da a gyrfaoedd gwerth chweil. Yr ydym yn benderfynol y bydd y gwaith hwnnw'n cael ei gefnogi'n briodol i'r dyfodol a llunnir ein strategaethau cyffredinol gyda'r amcan clir hwnnw mewn cof.

### Chwaraeon Timau

**C5 Mick Bates:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am chwaraeon timau mewn ysgolion? OAQ(3)0191(CEL)

**Jane Hutt:** Mae chwaraeon timau yn rhan anhepgor o'r cwricwlwm addysg gorfforol. Maent hefyd yn cael eu hyrwyddo drwy gyfrwng yr ystod helaeth o weithgareddau all-gwricwlaidd drwy Campau'r Ddraig a'r rhaglen chwaraeon mewn ysgolion uwchradd 5x60 a gefnogir gan Gyngor Chwaraeon Cymru ar ran Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

**Mick Bates:** Yr wyf yn sicr eich bod chi, fel

have seen many inspirational teachers who have encouraged team sports and built good, strong characters who can co-operate. Equally inspiring is seeing great teams play, such as the Ospreys and the Cardiff Blues—and congratulations to both teams on getting through to the quarter finals of the Heineken Cup; let us hope that they both get to the final. If you were a pupil and played team sport at your school in mid Wales, you could not travel easily to see the Ospreys or Cardiff Blues play, because there is not a first-class sports stadium in east mid Wales. Will you agree to talk to the Minister with responsibility for sport to see whether you could build a pyramid whereby not only is sport encouraged in school but pupils are encouraged to see first-class sport in a first-class facility in east mid Wales?

**Jane Hutt:** You mentioned the Ospreys and Cardiff Blues and we congratulate them. The teams also provide good role models for our young people, not only in terms of team sports and giving them good teams to support but in that they come to see our children and young people and support and enable them to look to what they can achieve in team sports. I anticipate a question to my colleague, Rhodri Glyn Thomas, from you, Mick. We need to consider this from an all-Wales perspective and recognise the good news that, as part of the wider profile of sports and culture leading up to the Olympics, Cardiff, Newport and Swansea will be joint hosts of the UK School Games in 2009. We must ensure that they look to include mid Wales, and ensure that it plays its part.

**Nerys Evans:** Yn ôl ymchwil a gyhoeddwyd ar ddiwedd 2007, mae llai na 10 y cant o ferched 16 mlwydd oed yn cymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon am gyfnod o ddwy i bedair awr yr wythnos. Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth yn eu cymryd i gynorthwyo merched i gymryd rhan mewn mwy o weithgareddau chwaraeon yn yr ysgol?

**Jane Hutt:** That is a key point, and that has

minnau, wedi gweld nifer o athrawon ysbrydoledig sydd wedi annog chwaraeon timau ac adeiladu cymeriadau da, cryf sy'n gallu cydweithio. Yr un mor ysbrydoledig yw gweld timau gwych yn chwarae, megis y Gweilch a Gleision Caerdydd—a llongyfarchiadau i'r ddau dîm ar gyrraedd rowndiau gogynderfynol Cwpan Heineken; gadewch inni obeithio y cyrhaedda'r ddau y rownd derfynol. Pe taech chi'n ddisgybl ac yn chwarae gêm tîm yn eich ysgol yn y canolbarth, ni allech deithio'n rhwydd i weld y Gweilch neu Leision Caerdydd yn chwarae, oherwydd nid oes stadiwm chwaraeon dosbarth-cyntaf yn nwyrain y canolbarth. A gytnwch i siarad â'r Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am chwaraeon i weld a allech adeiladu pyramid, a olygai nid yn unig y byddai chwaraeon yn cael eu hannog mewn ysgolion ond y byddai disgyblion yn cael eu hannog i weld chwaraeon dosbarth-cyntaf mewn cyfleuster dosbarth-cyntaf yn nwyrain y canolbarth?

**Jane Hutt:** Cyfeiriasoch at y Gweilch a Gleision Caerdydd ac fe'u llongyfarchwn. Mae'r timau hefyd yn darparu rolau model da ar gyfer ein pobl ifanc, nid yn unig o ran chwaraeon timau a rhoi timau da iddynt eu cefnogi ond oherwydd hefyd eu bod yn dod i weld ein plant a'n pobl ifanc, gan eu cefnogi a galluogi iddynt weld yr hyn y gallant ei gyflawni mewn chwaraeon timau. Rhagwelaf gwestiwn i fy nghyd-Weinidog, Rhodri Glyn Thomas, gennyh, Mick. Mae angen inni ystyried hyn o safbwynt Cymru gyfan a chydabod y newyddion da y bydd Caerdydd, Casnewydd ac Abertawe, fel rhan o broffil ehangach chwaraeon a diwylliant yn y cyfnod yn arwain at y Gemau Olympaidd, yn cyd-lwyfannu Gemau Ysgolion y DU yn 2009. Rhaid inni sicrhau eu bod yn ystyried cynnwys y canolbarth a sicrhau ei fod yn chwarae ei ran.

**Nerys Evans:** According to research published at the end of 2007, less than 10 per cent of 16-year-old girls participate in sport for two to four hours a week. What steps is the Government taking to help girls to participate in more sports activities in school?

**Jane Hutt:** Mae hwnnw'n bwynt allweddol,

been at the forefront of the active lifestyles work that the Sports Council for Wales is doing and of our PE and schools sports programme. It is interesting to look at the ways in which girls, in particular, can be engaged in sport in schools, for example, through dance. I visited Bryn Hafren Comprehensive School in Barry recently, and there is now a gym in the school, in which the young women are taking a great interest, as well as the young men. It has to be about seeing what is appropriate and increasing the participation of all girls in sport, as well as encouraging girls' participation in elite sports.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Schools are great providers of team sports facilities. Schools have been able to embed themselves in the community, and benefit from community spend, in providing those facilities. Y Bontfaen Primary School in Cowbridge, with its all-weather facility, is a clear example of that. However, an element of that community spend is lottery money and, regrettably, we hear time and again that some of that lottery money will now be diverted into funding the Olympics. How do you, as Minister, see yourself as being able to help schools meet the resulting funding gap? Many community projects over the last three to five years have been able to assist in providing those facilities, which games masters can use to develop team sports.

**Jane Hutt:** I do not think that we can underestimate the important contribution that we have had from the Welsh Assembly Government, the Sports Council for Wales and the lottery to develop those facilities: the all-weather pitches that we see all around Wales and also indoor facilities. We must ensure that investment delivers in that respect, and I think that the UK School Games will be an opportunity for us to lever in that funding.

#### The Flying Start Scheme

**Q6 Alun Davies:** Will the Minister give an update on the Welsh Assembly Government's Flying Start scheme? OAQ(3)0148(CEL)

a bu hynny'n flaenllaw yn y gwaith ar fyw'n weithgar y mae Cyngor Chwaraeon Cymru'n ei wneud ac yn ein rhaglen addysg gorfforol a chwaraeon ysgolion. Mae'n ddiddorol edrych ar y ffyrdd y gellir denu merched, yn enwedig, i wneud chwaraeon mewn ysgolion, er enghraifft, drwy ddawns. Ymwelais ag Ysgol Gyfun Bryn Hafren yn y Barri'n ddiweddar, ac mae campfa newydd yn yr ysgol erbyn hyn, ac mae'r merched ifanc, yn ogystal â'r dynion ifanc, yn dangos diddordeb mawr ynnddi. Rhaid i bopeth ymwneud â gweld beth sy'n briodol a chynyddu cyfranogiad pob merch mewn chwaraeon, yn ogystal ag annog cyfranogiad merched mewn chwaraeon elit.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Mae ysgolion yn ddarparwyr cyfleusterau chwaraeon timau gwych. Llwyddodd ysgolion i ymwreiddio yn y gymuned, ac elwa o wariant cymunedol, wrth ddarparu'r cyfleusterau hynny. Mae Ysgol Gynradd y Bontfaen, gyda'i chyfleuster pob-tywydd, yn enghraifft glir o hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae elfen o'r gwariant hwnnw'n arian loteri ac, yn anffodus, clywn dro ar ôl tro y bydd rhywfaint o'r arian loteri hwnnw yn awr yn cael ei droi'n gyllid ar gyfer y Gemau Olympaidd. Sut rydych chi, Weinidog, yn eich gweld eich hun yn gallu helpu ysgolion i gwrdd â'r bwlch cyllido dilynol? Mae sawl prosiect cymunedol dros y tair i bum mlynedd diwethaf wedi gallu helpu i ddarparu'r cyfleusterau hynny y gall athrawon chwaraeon eu defnyddio i ddatblygu chwaraeon timau.

**Jane Hutt:** Ni chredaf y gallwn danbrisió'r cyfraniad pwysig yr ydym wedi ei gael gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, Cyngor Chwaraeon Cymru a'r loteri i ddatblygu'r cyfleusterau hynny: y caeau pob-tywydd a welwn ar hyd a lled Cymru yn ogystal â chyfleusterau dan-do. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod buddsoddi'n cyflawni yn hynny o beth, a chredaf y bydd Gemau Ysgolion y DU yn gyfle inni ysgogi'r cyllid hwnnw.

#### Cynllun Dechrau'n Deg

**C6 Alun Davies:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am gynllun Dechrau'n Deg Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru? OAQ(3)0148(CEL)

**Jane Hutt:** Flying Start provides high-quality childcare for two-year-olds, additional health visits, parenting programmes and language and play support for 16,000 children across Wales. In rolling it out successfully across the country, the final budget makes provision to reach 10 per cent more children over three years.

**Alun Davies:** Flying Start has already made a real difference to the life chances, wellbeing and opportunities provided to thousands of children throughout Wales, as you have outlined. You recently visited the Flying Start scheme in Llwynhendy, which is run by the Carmarthenshire Children's Partnership. That partnership is doing fantastic work in ensuring that children in the more deprived parts of that county receive these opportunities and chances. I invite you, Minister, to join me in visiting some of these schemes over the next few months to see the impact that the rhetoric of eliminating and eradicating child poverty is having on the reality of children's lives in Carmarthenshire.

**Jane Hutt:** I would certainly like to join you on those visits. Opening Llwynhendy integrated children's centre was extremely inspiring. It is a childcare facility with 40 registered places, offering language and play sessions. It has used Flying Start revenue moneys, as well as capital, to create those new facilities. I also visited Bettws Primary School near Bridgend recently and saw the childcare pods, which are purpose-built demountables housing childcare provision for two to three-year-olds. I also recognise the work of the integrated children's centres in Llangefni and old Blaenau and the work in Pen-y-Waun in Rhondda Cynon Taf. I was delighted to see the facilities that Flying Start is funding in your constituency, particularly in Pembrokeshire.

**Alun Cairns:** I do not think that any Assembly Members would question the merits and benefits of Flying Start where it is provided. However, is the reality not that it is very much hit and miss? If you live in an area

**Jane Hutt:** Mae Dechrau'n Deg yn darparu gofal plant o ansawdd uchel i blant dwy oed, ymweliadau iechyd ychwanegol, rhaglenni rhianta a chefnogaeth iaith a chwarae i 16,000 o blant ledled Cymru. Wrth ei dreiglo'n llwyddiannus ar hyd a lled y wlad, mae'r gyllideb derfynol yn darparu ar gyfer cyrraedd 10 y cant yn fwy o blant dros dair blynedd.

**Alun Davies:** Mae Dechrau'n Deg eisoes wedi gwneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol i gyfleoedd bywyd, lles a chyfleoedd a roddir i filoedd o blant ledled Cymru, fel yr amlinellaso. Ymwelsoch yn ddiweddar â'r cynllun Dechrau'n Deg yn Llwynhendy, a redir gan Bartneriaeth Plant Sir Gaerfyrddin. Mae'r bartneriaeth honno'n gwneud gwaith anhygoel i sicrhau bod plant yn y rhannau mwyaf amddifad o'r sir honno'n derbyn y cyfleoedd a'r agoriadau hynny. Fe'ch gwahoddaf, Weinidog, i ymuno â mi i ymweld â rhai o'r cynlluniau hyn dros y misoedd i ddod i weld yr effaith y mae'r rhethreg o derfynu a dileu tlodi plant yn ei chael ar realiti bywydau plant yn sir Gaerfyrddin.

**Jane Hutt:** Hoffwn yn sicr ymuno â chi ar yr ymweliadau hynny. Yr oedd agor canolfan blant integredig Llwynhendy yn brofiad ysbrydoledig. Mae'n gyfleuster gofal plant â 40 o leoedd cofrestredig, sy'n cynnig sesiynau iaith a chwarae. Defnyddiodd arian refeniw Dechrau'n Deg, yn ogystal â chyfalaf, i greu'r cyfleusterau newydd hynny. Ymwelais hefyd ag Ysgol Gynradd y Betws ger Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr yn ddiweddar, a gwelais y podiau gofal plant, sy'n ddarpariaeth gofal plant symudol a adeiladir yn benodol ar gyfer eu pwrpas, ar gyfer plant dwy i dair oed. Cydnabyddaf hefyd waith y canolfannau plant integredig yn Llangefni a'r hen Flaenau, a'r gwaith ym Mhen-y-Waun yn Rhondda Cynon Taf. Yr oeddwn wrth fy modd yn gweld y cyfleusterau y mae Dechrau'n Deg yn eu hariannu yn eich etholaeth, yn enwedig yn sir Benfro.

**Alun Cairns:** Ni chredaf y byddai unrhyw Aelod Cynulliad yn amau teilyngdod a manteision Dechrau'n Deg lle caiff ei ddarparu. Fodd bynnag, onid yw realiti'r sefyllfa yn fater o hap a damwain? Os ydych

where it is available, you will be okay, and if you do not, whether it is a prosperous or deprived area, you may not be okay. Do you think that that is acceptable?

1.30 p.m.

**Jane Hutt:** It is quite clear that, in order to produce positive outcomes for the children who are targeted for Flying Start, we must ensure that the money is targeted at those communities where there is the greatest disadvantage. Indeed, that is what local authorities are doing across Wales. If you look at that rise in the budget—£31 million rising by £1 million, £2 million and £5 million over the next three years—and the investment in capital to support Flying Start in the new integrated centres, we can see the benefits of that. The international evidence shows that targeting is important. We need to target this at the most disadvantaged children and families, so that it makes a difference to their lives and opportunities.

**Alun Cairns:** We are happy to look at the budget that has been made available, but is the reality not that there has been a cut of £1.5 million in the final budget for Flying Start? That is the priority that you and the Minister for finance have placed on this. There might be lots of rhetoric and talk about what is being delivered through Flying Start, but the fact is that if you are in it, you are okay, and if you are outside—and you may well be part of a community where the vast majority of pupils are outside—you get nothing.

**Jane Hutt:** There is no cut—there is an increase. How do we get that over to you? You will not read the figures. There is a provision of £31 million in this financial year, 2007-08, including £3.5 million in capital, and the budget is rising by £1 million, then £2 million, then £5 million over the next three years. How can you say that it is a cut when we have 16,000 children already benefiting, and an additional 1,600 children who will shortly benefit? Local authorities across Wales are already

yn byw mewn ardal lle mae'r cynllun ar gael, byddwch yn iawn, ond os nad ydych, pa un ai a yw'r ardal honno'n un lewyrchus ynteu'n ardal o amddifadedd, efallai na fyddwch yn iawn. A ydych yn credu bod hynny'n dderbyniol?

**Jane Hutt:** Mae'n glir iawn, er mwyn cael canlyniadau cadarnhaol i'r plant sy'n cael eu targedu gan Dechrau'n Deg, ei bod yn rhaid inni sicrhau bod yr arian wedi'i dargedu at y cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig hynny. Yn wir, dyna a wna awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru. Os edrychwch ar y cynnydd hwnnw yn y gyllideb—£31 miliwn yn cynyddu £1 miliwn, £2 filiwn a £5 miliwn dros y tair blynedd nesaf—a'r buddsoddiad mewn cyfalaf i gefnogi Dechrau'n Deg yn y canolfannau integredig newydd, gallwn weld manteision hynny. Mae'r dystiolaeth ryngwladol yn dangos bod targedu'n bwysig. Mae angen inni dargedu hwn at y plant a'r teuluoedd mwyaf difreintiedig, er mwyn iddo wneud gwahaniaeth i'w bywydau ac i'w cyfleoedd.

**Alun Cairns:** Yr ydym yn fodlon edrych ar y gyllideb a gyflwynwyd, ond a yw'n wir dweud y bu toriad o £1.5 miliwn i Dechrau'n Deg yn y gyllideb derfynol? Dyna'r flaenoriaeth yr ydych chi a'r Gweinidog cyllid wedi'i rhoi i'r mater hwn. Efallai fod llawer o rethreg a siarad am yr hyn a gyflawnir gan Dechrau'n Deg, ond y gwir amdani yw fod popeth yn iawn os ydych yn rhan ohono, ond os nad ydych yn rhan ohono—ac mae'n ddigon posibl eich bod yn aelod o gymuned lle mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r disgyblion y tu allan i'r ffiniau—ni fyddwch yn cael yr un dim.

**Jane Hutt:** Nid oes toriad—ceir cynnydd. Sut y gallwn gyfleu hynny i chi? Yr ydych yn gwrthod darllen y ffigurau. Ceir darpariaeth o £31 miliwn yn y flwyddyn ariannol hon, 2007-08, gan gynnwys £3.5 miliwn o arian cyfalaf, ac mae'r gyllideb yn cynyddu £1 miliwn, £2 filiwn, a £5 miliwn dros y tair blynedd nesaf. Sut y gallwch alw hynny'n doriad pan fydd gennym 16,000 o blant eisoes yn cael budd ohono, a bod 1,600 arall yn mynd i gael budd cyn bo hir? Mae awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru eisoes yn

identifying how they can engage with those extra 1,600 children. This is an increase.

As I said, it is important to target this at the most deprived children and catchment areas in each local authority area—that has been accepted by the professionals, and that is what international evidence shows that we should do. When there are issues about boundaries—and I appreciate that there have been issues about whether people live inside or outside the boundaries—then we need to work in partnership, and the Assembly Government is certainly happy to work with local authorities to resolve those issues.

**Peter Black:** One of the issues with Flying Start that has been raised with me by various directors of education is the fact that many school buildings do not have the facilities to accommodate the demands of that programme—outdoor play areas, and so on. What specific capital allocation is being added to Flying Start to help local authorities to overcome this particular obstacle?

**Jane Hutt:** That is where joined-up work at a local level is crucial, as you know, and, indeed, the budget that we supported yesterday continues the capital investment under Flying Start. However, it is about joined-up investment, linking Flying Start with the foundation phase and with the new integrated centres—I saw the outcome of that at Llwynhendy in Llanelli. Over £7.2 million per year will be available for these investments, and at least £3.3 million will be available to support Flying Start. I also spoke to young people in Duffryn in Newport, which I visited recently, where a new Flying Start centre has opened on the same site as an integrated children's centre, next to an existing school—you could see how joined-up Government works at a local authority level. A good local authority that wants to be strategic can deliver on the capital.

ceisio pennu sut y gallant ymgysylltu â'r 1,600 o blant ychwanegol hynny. Mae hwn yn gynydd.

Fel y dywedais, mae'n bwysig targedu'r cynllun at y plant a'r ardaloedd dalgylch sydd â'r amddifadedd mwyaf ym mhob ardal awdurdod lleol—mae'r gweithwyr proffesiynol wedi derbyn hynny, ac mae tystiolaeth ryngwladol yn dangos mai dyna beth ddylem ei wneud. Pan gyfyd materion am ffiniau—ac yr wyf yn gwerthfawrogi bod materion wedi codi ynghylch a yw pobl yn byw y tu fewn neu'r tu allan i'r ffiniau—yna mae angen inni weithio mewn partneriaeth, ac mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn fwy na pharod i weithio gydag awdurdodau lleol i ddatrys y materion hynny.

**Peter Black:** Un o'r problemau gyda Dechrau'n Deg y mae nifer o gyfarwyddwyr addysg wedi'i godi â mi yw'r ffaith nad yw'r cyfleusterau mewn llawer o adeiladau ysgolion i fodloni gofynion y rhaglen honno—ardaloedd chwarae yn yr awyr agored, ac yn y blaen. Pa ddyraniad cyfalaf penodol a ychwanegir at Dechrau'n Deg i helpu awdurdodau lleol i oresgyn y rhwystr arbennig hwn?

**Jane Hutt:** Mae gwaith cydgysylltiedig ar lefel leol yn hanfodol yn hynny o beth, fel y gwyddoch, ac yn wir, mae'r gyllideb a gefnogwyd gennym ddoe yn sicrhau bod y buddsoddiad cyfalaf dan Dechrau'n Deg yn parhau. Fodd bynnag, mae'n fater hefyd o fuddsoddi ar y cyd, gan gysylltu Dechrau'n Deg â'r cyfnod sylfaen a gyda'r canolfannau integredig newydd—gwelais ffrwyth llafur hynny yn Llwynhendy yn Llanelli. Bydd dros £7.2 miliwn ar gael yn flynyddol ar gyfer y buddsoddiadau hyn, a bydd o leiaf £3.3 miliwn ar gael i gefnogi Dechrau'n Deg. Siaradais hefyd â phobl ifanc yn Nyffryn, yng Nghasnewydd, pan oeddwn ar ymweliad yn ddiweddar, lle agorwyd canolfan Dechrau'n Deg newydd ar yr un safle â chanolfan blant integredig, gerllaw ysgol sydd eisoes yn bodoli—sy'n enghraifft o sut y mae Llywodraeth gydgysylltiedig yn gweithio ar lefel awdurdod lleol. Gall awdurdod lleol da sydd am fod yn strategol gyflawni prosiectau cyfalaf.



## Upgrading School Buildings

**Q7 Michael German:** How much additional funding does the Welsh Assembly Government intend to allocate over the next Assembly term to the capital investment programme for upgrading school buildings? OAQ(3)0243(CEL)

**Jane Hutt:** The Welsh Assembly Government has allocated an additional £27.5 million over the next three years for investment in school buildings. An additional £6 million is also being provided for capital towards the early years or foundation phase, making a total of £33.5 million extra funding over this Assembly term.

**Michael German:** Could you tell us whether that figure includes money that may be set aside for the capital board that the Minister for Finance and Public Service Delivery is setting up? Would you anticipate making bids to that capital board to increase the sum even further?

**Jane Hutt:** None of that funding will be taken, or set aside, for the strategic capital investment board. This is funding for capital investment for schools. To enlighten you, Mike, and to offer you encouragement about the way forward, I have just approved, as a result of the budget, allocations for 2008-09, and from an overall budget of £90.854 million, £44.562 million will be allocated to LEAs in Wales in their formula shares for capital. That can be used for new school facilities, refurbishment improvement projects and fire prevention and disability access work. The sum of £3 million is to be allocated to provide regional facilities for pupils with special educational needs, £0.854 million for voluntary aided schools capital grant and the remainder will be for the £9 million lump sum shares, where that funding has not been taken up by authorities. All of it is for our school building capital investment programme. However, I shall be ensuring that we make a good strategic capital investment bid for education to the new board.

## Uwchraddio Adeiladau Ysgolion

**C7 Michael German:** Faint o gyllid ychwanegol y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn bwriadu ei ddyrannu dros dymor nesaf y Cynulliad i'r rhaglen buddsoddiad cyfalaf ar gyfer uwchraddio adeiladau ysgolion? OAQ(3)0243(CEL)

**Jane Hutt:** Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi dyrannu £27.5 miliwn yn ychwanegol dros y tair blynedd nesaf ar gyfer buddsoddi mewn adeiladau ysgolion. Caiff £6 miliwn arall ei ddarparu hefyd ar gyfer cyfalaf tuag at y blynyddoedd cynnar neu'r cyfnod sylfaen, gan wneud cyfanswm o £33.5 miliwn o gyllid ychwanegol dros dymor y Cynulliad hwn.

**Michael German:** A allech ddweud wrthym a yw'r ffigur hwnnw'n cynnwys yr arian y gellid ei roi o'r neilltu ar gyfer y bwrdd cyfalaf a sefydlir gan y Gweinidog dros Gyllid a Chyflenwi Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus? A fydddech yn rhagweld y byddwch yn cyflwyno ceisiadau i'r bwrdd cyfalaf hwnnw i gynyddu'r swm ymhellach?

**Jane Hutt:** Ni chaiff yr un geiniog o'r cyllid hwnnw ei roi o'r neilltu na'i gymryd gan y bwrdd buddsoddi cyfalaf strategol. Cyllid yw hwn ar gyfer buddsoddiad cyfalaf i ysgolion. Er mwyn i chi gael gwybod, Mike, ac i godi'ch calon o ran y ffordd ymlaen, yr wyf newydd gymeradwyo, o ganlyniad i'r gyllideb, ddyraniadau ar gyfer 2008-09, ac mewn cyllideb gyffredinol o £90.854 miliwn, caiff £44.562 miliwn ei ddyrannu i awdurdodau addysg lleol yng Nghymru yn eu cyfrannau fformiwla ar gyfer cyfalaf. Gellir defnyddio hwnnw ar gyfer cyfleusterau newydd mewn ysgolion, prosiectau adnewyddu a gwaith atal tanau a mynediad i bobl anabl. Dyrennir swm o £3 miliwn i ddarparu cyfleusterau rhanbarthol ar gyfer disgyblion ag anghenion addysgol arbennig, £0.854 miliwn ar gyfer grant cyfalaf i ysgolion gwirfoddol a gynorthwyir a bydd y gweddill ar gyfer cyfrannau'r swm crynswth £9 miliwn, os nad yw'r awdurdodau wedi'i ddefnyddio. Mae pob ceiniog yn mynd i'n rhaglen buddsoddi cyfalaf ar gyfer adeiladau ysgolion. Fodd bynnag, byddaf yn gwneud yn siŵr y byddwn yn cyflwyno cais buddsoddi cyfalaf strategol da ym maes addysg i'r

bwrdd newydd.

**Chris Franks:** Will you congratulate St Bernadette's Roman Catholic Primary School in Cardiff for its excellent inspection report? However, will you also comment on the need to improve accommodation in the school? Further to that, what discussions have you had with Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council regarding the level of investment in upgrading and replacing school buildings?

**Jane Hutt:** I join you in congratulating St Bernadette's school on its achievement. We await the outcome of the school reorganisation capital investment plan in Cardiff. My officials are working with every local authority to see how they are delivering on their capital investment for school buildings. In terms of Rhondda Cynon Taf, I can see already that the projects that are in line to ensure that it is spending up to its £9 million include a number of new builds and refurbishments.

**Jonathan Morgan:** If new money is available to local authorities in Wales to upgrade and refurbish school buildings, I sincerely hope that Birchgrove Primary School in my constituency will benefit. That school had a first-class inspection report a few years ago, but one major problem was highlighted, namely the state of the fabric of the school buildings. It was specifically identified by Estyn as needing to be addressed as quickly as possible. What can you do to ensure that local authorities follow through the recommendations of Estyn reports? You are talking about something that needs to be driven by local authorities in the consideration of their own budgets. Schools can do as much bullying as they can, but, ultimately, it is up to the local authority. What can you do to enhance the guidance issued to local authorities to ensure that Estyn reports are responded to, and that problems are identified and remedied? Otherwise, the school will face further problems at the next inspection.

**Chris Franks:** A wnewch longyfarch Ysgol Gynradd Gatholig St Bernadette yng Nghaerdydd am ei hadroddiad rhagorol gan yr arolygwyr? Fodd bynnag, a wnewch hefyd wneud sylw am yr angen i wella adeiladau yn yr ysgol? Yn ogystal â hynny, pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi'u cael â Chyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf ynghylch lefel y buddsoddiad i uwchraddio adeiladau ysgol ac adeiladu adeiladau newydd?

**Jane Hutt:** Ymunaf â chi wrth longyfarch ysgol St Bernadette ar ei llwyddiant. Yr ydym yn disgwyl canlyniadau'r cynllun buddsoddi cyfalaf ar gyfer ad-drefnu ysgolion yng Nghaerdydd. Mae fy swyddogion yn gweithio gyda phob awdurdod lleol i weld sut y maent yn cyflawni o ran buddsoddi cyfalaf mewn adeiladau ysgolion. O ran Rhondda Cynon Taf, gwelaf eisoes fod y prosiectau sydd ar y gweill ganddo i sicrhau ei fod yn gwario hyd at y £9 miliwn sydd ganddo yn cynnwys adeiladu nifer o adeiladau newydd ac adnewyddu eraill.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Os bydd arian newydd ar gael i awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru i uwchraddio ac adnewyddu adeiladau ysgolion, mawr obeithiaf y bydd Ysgol Gynradd Llwyn Bedw yn fy etholaeth yn manteisio arno. Cafodd yr ysgol honno adroddiad o'r radd flaenaf gan yr arolygwyr rai blynyddoedd yn ôl, ond un broblem fawr y tynnwyd sylw ati oedd cyflwr deunydd adeiladau'r ysgol. Tynnodd Estyn sylw penodol at yr angen i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem cyn gynted â phosibl. Beth allwch ei wneud i sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol yn dilyn argymhellion adroddiadau Estyn? Yr ydych yn siarad am fater y mae angen i awdurdodau lleol ei yrru ymlaen wrth ystyried eu cyllidebau eu hunain. Gall ysgolion roi cymaint o bwysau ag y gallant, ond, yn y pen draw, penderfyniad yr awdurdod lleol ydyw. Beth allwch ei wneud i gryfhau'r canllawiau a gyhoeddir ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau eu bod yn ymateb i adroddiadau Estyn, a bod problemau'n cael eu canfod a'u datrys? Fel arall, bydd yr ysgol yn wynebu mwy o broblemau yn yr arolwg nesaf?

**Jane Hutt:** I welcome that contribution. It is up to local authorities to be strategic and to use the funding that I have announced today for this financial year. I met with the Welsh Local Government Association yesterday and we discussed this very issue. It will launch its review of the supply of school places on 7 February, which links strategically to capital investment and the fact that these Value Wales education projects are bringing together our local authorities to see what best practice can be taken forward and replicated across Wales. I draw attention to the fact that I have recently visited Newport, where the council plans to rebuild three secondary schools—Bettws High School, Hartridge High School and Duffryn High School—at an overall cost of around £80 million. That is about a local authority being imaginative, strategic and bold in taking forward its aspirations to have good school buildings and to deliver the recommendations, as you said Jonathan, of inspections.

### Secondary Education in Wrexham

**Q8 Lesley Griffiths:** Will the Minister make a statement on secondary education in Wrexham? OAQ(3)0192(CEL)

**Jane Hutt:** Statistics show that schools in Wrexham are making positive progress. Teacher assessment results for key stage 3 show significant improvement in nearly all core subjects since 1999, with an increase on 2006 with regard to the percentage of pupils achieving five or more GCSEs at grades A\* to C.

**Lesley Griffiths:** Last week, Wrexham local education authority received a clean bill of health from Estyn on education standards in the borough. However, in recent weeks, two high schools have received inspection reports that were far from satisfactory—indeed, they proved to be quite unsatisfactory for the education of the children who attend those schools. Will you look at the possibility in the future of Estyn having some joined-up thinking in relation to its inspection

**Jane Hutt:** Croesawaf y cyfraniad hwnnw. Awdurdodau lleol sy'n gyfrifol am fod yn strategol a defnyddio'r cyllid hwnnw yr wyf wedi'i gyhoeddi heddiw ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol hon. Cyfarfûm â Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ddoe a chawsom drafodaeth am yr union fater hwn. Bydd yn cyhoeddi ei hadolygiad ar gyflenwi lleoedd mewn ysgolion ar 7 Chwefror, sy'n cysylltu'n strategol â'r buddsoddiad cyfalaf a'r ffaith bod y prosiectau addysg Gwerth Cymru hyn yn tynnu ein hawdurdodau lleol ynghyd i weld pa arfer gorau y gellir ei ddatblygu a'i ddyblygu ledled Cymru. Tynnaf sylw at y ffaith y bûm yng Nghasnewydd yn ddiweddar, lle mae'r cyngor yn bwriadu ailadeiladu tair ysgol uwchradd—Ysgol Uwchradd Bettws, Ysgol Uwchradd Hartridge ac Ysgol Uwchradd Dyffryn—am gyfanswm o tua £80 miliwn. Dyma enghraifft o awdurdod lleol yn ymddwyn yn llawn dychymyg, yn strategol ac yn feiddgar wrth fwrw ymlaen a'i ddyheadau i gael adeiladau ysgol da ac i gyflawni argymhellion arolygon, fel y dywedasoeh Jonathan.

### Addysg Uwchradd yn Wrecsam

**C8 Lesley Griffiths:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am addysg uwchradd yn Wrecsam? OAQ(3)0192(CEL)

**Jane Hutt:** Mae ystadegau'n dangos bod ysgolion yn Wrecsam yn gwneud cynnydd cadarnhaol. Mae canlyniadau asesiadau athrawon ar gyfer cyfnod allweddol 3 yn dangos gwelliannau sylweddol ym mron pob un pwnc craidd er 1999, gan wella ar ganlyniadau 2006 o ran canran y disgyblion a gafodd bump neu fwy gradd A\* i C yn eu TGAU.

**Lesley Griffiths:** Yr wythnos diwethaf, cafodd awdurdod addysg lleol Wrecsam sêl bendith Estyn o ran safonau addysg yn y fwrdeistref. Fodd bynnag, dros yr wythnosau diwethaf, cafodd dwy ysgol uwchradd adroddiadau gan yr arolygwyr a oedd yn bell o fod yn foddhaol—yn wir, yr oeddent yn anfoddhaol iawn o safbwynt addysg y plant sy'n mynychu'r ysgolion hynny. A wnewch edrych yn y dyfodol at bosibilrwydd cael Estyn i feddwl yn gydgyssylltiedig yng

judgments? Education authorities surely cannot have a stamp of approval one week and damning reports on individual schools the next.

1.40 p.m.

**Jane Hutt:** You raise an important point, but, as you said, the recent inspection report on Wrexham LEA was generally positive. If we look at that report, the authority was awarded grade 2 or better—good features, with no important shortcomings—in four of the areas inspected. However, an LEA inspection is different to the inspection of a school within an LEA and, of course, Estyn has to report on what it observes during an inspection. It may be that, where a school is judged to be in need of significant improvement, it is not indicative of, or consistent with, Estyn's overall inspection of the authority. We have to look at schools and how the authority is delivering support to those schools. The chief inspector, as you said, confirmed that a secondary school in Wrexham is performing significantly less well than it should be. We have to take that forward in concert with the local education authority and ensure that the Estyn report on the school and its action plan is addressed and taken forward, if Wrexham wants to ensure that it has a clean bill of health across the board.

**Mark Isherwood:** Will you join me in congratulating the councillors, as the report highlights them as an example of best practice in driving school improvement and taking the achievement of five GCSEs at grades A to C or the equivalent from 42.4 per cent to 50.9 per cent since that council came into being? Will you also note that the problems with those two particular schools have been brought to their attention, and that of the headteachers and the governing bodies, over the last three years, since that council came into being? I believe that one Member in the Chamber sat on the governing body of one of those schools prior to election.

**Jane Hutt:** I have already welcomed positive progress in Wrexham.

ngghyswllt casgliadau arolygon? Yn ddiau, ni all awdurdodau addysg gael sêl bendith un wythnos tra bo ysgolion unigol yn cael adroddiadau damniol yr wythnos ganlynol.

**Jane Hutt:** Codwch bwynt pwysig, ond, fel y dywedasoch, yr oedd adroddiad diweddar yr arolygwyr ar awdurdod addysg lleol Wrecsam yn gadarnhaol ar y cyfan. Os edrychwn ar yr adroddiad hwnnw, dyfarnwyd gradd 2 neu uwch i'r awdurdod—nodweddion da â dim diffygion pwysig—mewn pedwar o'r meysydd a arolygwyd. Fodd bynnag, mae arolwg o AALI yn wahanol i arolwg o ysgol o fewn AALI, ac, wrth gwrs, rhaid i Estyn adrodd ar yr hyn a welant yn ystod arolwg. Mae'n ddigon posibl, pe bernir fod angen gwelliannau sylweddol mewn ysgol, nad yw hynny'n arwydd o farn Estyn wrth arolygu'r awdurdod yn ei gyfanrwydd, nac efallai'n gyson â'r farn honno. Rhaid inni edrych ar ysgolion a sut y mae'r awdurdod yn cefnogi'r ysgolion hynny. Cadarnhaodd y prif arolygwr, fel y dywedasoch, fod ysgol uwchradd yn Wrecsam yn perfformio'n waeth nag y dylai. Rhaid inni ddatblygu ar hynny, law yn llaw â'r awdurdod addysg lleol, a sicrhau y rhoddir sylw i adroddiad Estyn ar yr ysgol a'i gynllun gweithredu, a bod hyn yn cael ei roi ar waith, os yw Wrecsam am sicrhau ei fod am gael sêl bendith cyffredinol.

**Mark Isherwood:** A wnewch ymuno â mi i longyfarch y cynghorwyr, gan fod yr adroddiad yn tynnu sylw atynt fel enghraifft o arfer gorau wrth gyflwyno gwelliannau i ysgolion ac wrth godi cyrhaeddiad o 42.4 y cant yn llwyddo i gael graddau A i C mewn pump TGAU, neu gymhwyster cyfatebol, i 50.9 y cant ers i'r cyngor hwnnw gael ei sefydlu? A wnewch hefyd gofio y tynnwyd eu sylw hwy, yn ogystal â sylw'r penaethiaid a'r byrddau llywodraethu, at y problemau yn y ddwy ysgol benodol hyn, yn gyson dros y tair blynedd diwethaf, ers sefydlu'r cyngor hwnnw? Credaf fod un Aelod yn y Siambr wedi eistedd ar fwrdd llywodraethu un o'r ysgolion hynny cyn cael ei ethol.

**Jane Hutt:** Yr wyf eisoes wedi croesawu'r cynnydd cadarnhaol yn Wrecsam.

**Janet Ryder:** To take the Estyn report as an example, will you make it clear that the inspection that is undertaken of an LEA is totally different to the inspections of schools, otherwise you would have damned all schools in a neighbouring authority of Wrexham because of the inspection of their LEA? That would be very unfair when schools in Denbighshire have consistently, for the most part, performed very well against a failing education authority; in Wrexham, it may be the other way around, for the LEA has received recently a good report and should be praised for those results.

**Jane Hutt:** That is a good point, Janet. I am going up to address the first meeting of the Denbighshire strategic education board on 31 January. That will be important, in ensuring that that authority is fit for purpose and robust in terms of supporting its schools and the excellent education that the schools provide. It is important that we distinguish between the inspection of the LEA and the inspection of schools and remember that, in Wrexham, the report was generally positive, as I said, but there were issues that need to be taken forward—for example, it was awarded grade 3 for access and school organisation and support services. We must look carefully at LEA inspections, but, most importantly, deliver on the action plans for those schools that are performing significantly less well. I would also say that that is something that will be addressed as we develop our school effectiveness framework programme.

**Janet Ryder:** A chymryd adroddiad Estyn fel enghraifft, a wnewch egluro bod arolwg o AALI yn hollol wahanol i arolwg o ysgol, neu fel arall byddech wedi rhoi'r ergyd farwol i'r holl ysgolion mewn awdurdod sy'n ffinio â Wrecsam yn sgil yr arolwg o'u hawdurdod addysg lleol? Byddai hynny'n annheg iawn gan fod ysgolion yn sir Ddinbych wedi perfformio'n dda iawn yn gyson, ar y cyfan, yn wyneb awdurdod addysg a oedd yn methu; yn Wrecsam, efallai mai'r gwrthwyneb sy'n wir, gan fod yr AALI wedi derbyn adroddiad da yn ddiweddar a dylai gael ei gymeradwyo am y canlyniadau hynny.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae hynny'n bwynt da, Janet. Yr wyf yn bwriadu teithio i gyfarfod cyntaf bwrdd addysg strategol sir Ddinbych ar 31 Ionawr i'w hannerch. Bydd hynny'n bwysig, wrth sicrhau bod yr awdurdod yn addas at ei bwrpas ac yn gadarn o ran cefnogi ei ysgolion a'r addysg ardderchog a ddarperir gan yr ysgolion. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn gwahaniaethu rhwng arolwg o AALI ac arolwg o ysgol, gan gofio bod yr adroddiad yn Wrecsam yn gadarnhaol ar y cyfan, fel y dywedais, ond bod angen mynd i'r afael â rhai materion—er enghraifft, cafodd gradd 3 am fynediad a gwasanaethau cefnogi a threfniadaeth ysgolion. Rhaid inni edrych yn ofalus ar arolygon o AALI, ond yn fwy pwysig, rhaid cyflawni'r cynlluniau gweithredu ar gyfer yr ysgolion hynny sy'n perfformio'n sylweddol is. Hoffwn hefyd ddweud y bydd hwn yn fater y rhoddir sylw iddo wrth inni ddatblygu ein rhaglen ar y fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion.

### **Datganiad ar Newydd-ddyfodiaid Statement on New Entrants**

**Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Elin Jones):** Gyda'ch caniatâd, Lywydd, hoffwn wneud datganiad am y gwaith sydd wedi'i wneud hyd yn hyn ar weithredu'r ymrwymiad yn nogfen 'Cymru'n Un' i gyflwyno cynllun i gefnogi pobl ifanc sy'n dechrau ffermio.

Yn draddodiadol, mae'r flwyddyn newydd yn adeg i ddechrau o'r newydd, a bwriadaf ddechrau cymryd camau tuag at greu

**The Minister for Rural Affairs (Elin Jones):** With your permission, Llywydd, I would like to make a statement about the progress towards delivering the commitment in the 'One Wales' agreement to introduce a scheme to support new entrants to farming.

The new year is traditionally the time for new beginnings and it is my intention to begin to put in place the building blocks for a

diwydiant ffermio cynaliadwy yng Nghymru—diwydiant sy'n gymwys ar gyfer y dyfodol ac sy'n gallu goresgyn y sialensiau y mae'n ei wynebu ar hyd y ffordd. Mae'r cyhoeddiad hwn yn nodi dechrau'r strategaeth honno. Heddiw, yr wyf am amlinellu'r ffordd y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn bwriadu mynd ati i gefnogi ffermwyr ifanc newydd yng Nghymru.

Yr wyf wedi bod yn frwd iawn o blaid hyn ers blynnyddoedd. Yr wyf yn credu ei bod yn bwysig rhoi pob anogaeth i ffermwyr ifanc newydd lwyddo mewn diwydiant sy'n newid cymaint; wedi'r cyfan, nhw yw dyfodol y diwydiant. Ym myd ffermio, mae gennym eisoes enghreifftiau ardderchog o ffermwyr ifanc yn dangos arloesedd drwy gydweithredu a chydweithio, er enghraifft, menter Agrisgop sydd wedi helpu grŵp o ffermwyr ifanc yn nyffryn Teifi i gyflenwi cig oen o ansawdd i siopau Marks and Spencer ledled Cymru. Mae Ymddiriedolaeth y Tywysog hefyd wedi cefnogi'r prosiect hwn. Fodd bynnag, nid oes digon o enghreifftiau tebyg. Mae tystiolaeth anecdotaidd yn awgrymu bod tua 200 o ffermwyr ifanc yn dod yn gyfrifol am redeg busnesau ffermio yng Nghymru bob blwyddyn. Mae angen i'r gyfradd hon gynyddu'n sylweddol os yw'r diwydiant i ffynnu a bod yn llewyrchus yn y dyfodol.

Mae angen gwneud mwy i harneisio egni, cymhelliant a brwdfrydedd pobl ifanc a'u sianelu mewn ffordd sy'n caniatáu iddynt arloesi ac sy'n rhoi'r amrywiaeth o sgiliau sydd eu hangen arnynt er mwyn troi syniadau'n fusnesau llwyddiannus. Mae grŵp 2020 wedi ategu'r farn hon. Yn ddiweddar, cyflwynodd y grŵp adroddiad ar ffermio cynaliadwy a'r amgylchedd. Argymhellodd fod angen i ffermwyr ifanc gael cyngor a hyfforddiant ar ddatblygu busnes a bod angen i bob ffermwr gael cyngor ar reoli olyniaeth. Am y rheswm hwn, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ar y cyd â'n partneriaid, yn bwriadu creu cynllun a fydd yn darparu cyngor busnes a chymorth addysgol, yn edrych ar gynllunio ar gyfer olyniaeth ac ar fentrau ffermio ar y cyd, ac, yn y pen draw, yn sicrhau bod cymorth ariannol sydd wedi'i dargedu'n ofalus ar gael, gan ddefnyddio'r gyllideb newydd o £2 filiwn o 2010 ymlaen.

sustainable farming industry in Wales—an industry that will be fit for the future and able to overcome the challenges that it meets along the way. This announcement marks the beginning of that strategy. I want, today, to outline the Assembly Government's approach to supporting young new entrants to farming in Wales.

This has been a passion of mine for several years. I believe that it is important that young entrants are given every encouragement to succeed in an industry that is undergoing many changes—they are, after all, the very future of the industry. In farming, we already have some excellent examples of young farmers demonstrating innovation through collaboration and co-operation, such as the Agrisgop initiative that supported a group of young farmers in the Teifi valley to supply quality lamb to Marks and Spencer stores across Wales. This project was also supported by the Prince's Trust. However, there are not enough examples like this. Anecdotal evidence suggests that the reality is that there are around 200 young entrants taking over the running of farming businesses in Wales each year. I suggest that this rate needs to increase significantly if the industry is to thrive and prosper in future.

More needs to be done to harness young people's energy, drive and enthusiasm and to channel it in a way that allows innovation to flourish and provides the range of skills needed to develop ideas into successful businesses. This view is supported by the 2020 group. The group reported recently on sustainable farming and the environment. It recommended that young farmers need advice and training on business development and that all farmers need advice on succession management. That is why the Assembly Government, working with our partners, is looking to put together a scheme to provide both business advice and educational support, to look at succession planning and joint ventures in farming, and, ultimately, to make available carefully targeted financial support, using the newly allocated budget of £2 million from 2010.

Fel cam cyntaf, yr wyf wedi sefydlu grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen newydd i lywio fy mhohisi ar gefnogi ffermwyr ifanc newydd. Bydd y grŵp yn cynnal ei gyfarfod cyntaf ar 1 Chwefror. Mae aelodau'r grŵp yn cynrychioli amrywiaeth o fuddiannau. Yn eu plith y mae ffermwyr ifanc sydd eu hunain wedi goresgyn rhwystrau i sefydlu busnesau llwyddiannus, gan ddefnyddio syniadau arloesol i sefydlu mentrau traddodiadol ac i arallgyfeirio. Mae cynrychiolwyr clybiau ffermwyr ifanc Cymru hefyd yn aelodau o'r grŵp, a bu'r clybiau yn tynnu sylw at faterion sy'n gysylltiedig â ffermwyr ifanc newydd ers amser. Mae gan y grŵp hefyd gynrychiolwyr o'r sector addysg, hyfforddiant a sgiliau, a chynrychiolydd o'r sector cyllid. Mae manylion yr aelodau i'w gweld yn yr atodiad.

Gorchwyl gyntaf y grŵp fydd ystyried a chynnig cyngor ar bapur ymgynghori drafft sy'n amlinellu pecyn o fesurau i'w dilyn yn y tymor byr, y tymor canolig a'r tymor hir. Nod y mesurau hyn fydd gwella ein prosesau gwneud penderfyniadau yn syth, drwy sicrhau bod lleisiau ffermwyr ifanc newydd yn cael eu clywed. Yr wyf am i ffermwyr ifanc gael eu cynrychioli ar bob un o fy mhaneli cynghori, fel bod modd ystyried yn llawn effaith fy mhohisiau i gyd ar ffermwyr ifanc newydd. Yr wyf wedi dechrau arni'n barod drwy wahodd un o swyddogion Ffederasiwn Clybiau Ffermwyr Ifanc Cymru i gymryd swydd ex officio ar fforwm yr ucheldir, sef grŵp cynghori'r Cynulliad ar faterion yn ymwneud â bryniau ac ucheldir. Mae'r fforwm hwn ar fin cychwyn ar ei ail dymor o dair blynedd, a bydd yn fy nghynghori ar y sialensiau economaidd ac amgylcheddol a fydd yn wynebu pob ffermwr mynydd yn y dyfodol.

Mae'n fwriad hefyd i wella mynediad at wybodaeth, hyfforddiant a chynghori i ffermwyr ifanc newydd. Bydd hyn yn cynnwys gwella'r ffyrdd o'u cyfeirio at y ffynonellau gwybodaeth a'r cyngor sydd eisoes ar gael i'w helpu i ddatblygu'r sgiliau sydd eu hangen arnynt i lwyddo. Bwriad arall yw datblygu sgiliau busnes a chefnogi menter drwy wasanaeth Cyswllt Ffermio ar ei newydd wedd a gaiff ei lansio eleni. O fewn yr amrywiaeth eang o wasanaethau y bydd Cyswllt Ffermio yn eu cynnig bydd pwyslais

As a first step, I have set up a new task and finish group to inform my policy to support young entrants. The group will hold its first meeting on 1 February. Membership of this new group has been drawn from a wide range of interests. It includes young farmers who themselves have overcome barriers to create successful businesses, using innovative thinking to establish a variety of both conventional and diversified enterprises. Representatives from the young farmers clubs of Wales are also members of the group, as the clubs have highlighted young entrant issues for some time. The group also has representatives from the education, training and skills sector, and a representative from the finance sector. Details of members can be found in the annex

The group's first task will be to consider and offer advice on a draft consultation paper setting out a package of short, medium and longer-term measures. These measures will be aimed at an immediate improvement to our decision making by ensuring that young entrants' voices are heard. By this I mean that I want young farmers to be represented on all my advisory panels, so that all of my policies fully consider the impact on young entrants to the industry. I have already taken action by inviting an officer of the Wales Federation of Young Farmers Clubs to take up an ex officio post on the Assembly's advisory group on hill and upland matters, the upland forum. This forum is about to start its second three-year term of office and will be advising me on the economic and environmental challenges facing all hill farmers in the future.

I also intend to improve access to information, training and advice for young entrants. This will include improved signposting to tell them about sources of information and advice already available to help them develop the skills they need to succeed. Business skills and supporting enterprise will be developed through a revamped Farming Connect service to launch this year. Within the broad range of Farming Connect service provision there will be a focus on young farmers. The new Farming

ar ffermwyr ifanc. Bydd Cyswllt Ffermio ar ei newydd wedd yn cynnig cymorth i drosglwyddo gwybodaeth ac i hyfforddi er mwyn helpu newydd-ddyfodiaid. Bydd ffermwyr ifanc yn cael 80 y cant o gymhorthdal tuag at gost gwasanaethau cynllunio'r fferm gyfan, gan gynnwys gwasanaethau mentora ac arweiniad ar faterion technegol, materion sy'n ymwneud â chyllid a busnes, a materion arallgyfeirio ac entrepreneuriaeth.

Hoffwn hefyd helpu pobl ifanc i oresgyn y rhwystrau i sefydlu busnes ffermio drwy gynnig cymorth ariannol wedi'i dargedu o 2010 ymlaen. Bydd £2 filiwn ar gael o 2010 ymlaen ar gyfer cynllun i helpu ffermwyr ifanc sy'n dechrau busnes. Gallai'r cymorth hwn fod ar ffurf cymhorthdal cyfradd llog am gyfnod penodol neu'n gynllun grant uniongyrchol ar gyfer codi adeiladau neu brynu peiriannau. Mae angen i ni ystyried, ar ôl ymgynghori â'r diwydiant, pa fath o gynllun fydd yn diwallu anghenion ffermwyr ifanc newydd orau.

Fy mwriad yw ymgynghori â'r diwydiant ar fanylion y cynigion hyn ar ôl roi ystyriaeth i sylwadau'r grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen, a hynny, fwy na thebyg, erbyn diwedd mis Chwefror. Yr wyf hefyd yn cydweithio'n agos â'm cyd-Weinidogion ar faterion trawsbynciol sy'n effeithio ar ffermwyr ifanc newydd, gan gynnwys mater tai yng nghefn gwlad. Mae Jocelyn Davies yn ymwybodol iawn o'r problemau y mae pobl ifanc yn eu profi wrth geisio cael gafael ar dai fforddiadwy. Mae gwaith ar y gweill gydag awdurdodau lleol i wella'r sefyllfa hon. Hefyd, mae Jane Davidson yn cynnal adolygiad o nodyn cyngor technegol 6. Bydd y gwaith hwn yn cynnwys ystyried anheddau newydd ar gyfer gweithwyr ym myd amaethyddiaeth, ailddefnyddio ac addasu adeiladau yng nghefn gwlad, a datblygiadau er mwyn arallgyfeirio ar ffermydd. Yr wyf yn gwbl gefnogol i'r meysydd gwaith pwysig hyn.

Mae'n amlwg fod llawer i'w wneud i wireddu'r cynigion hyn ar gyfer ffermwyr newydd. Yr wyf yn disgwyl y bydd fframwaith y cynllun cefnogi yn ei le erbyn yr hydref. Yr wyf yn hyderus bod y cynllun

Connect will offer support on knowledge transfer and training to help young entrants. Young farmers will receive an 80 per cent subsidy towards the costs of accessing whole farm planning services, which will include mentoring, and guidance on technical, finance and business issues, and on diversification and entrepreneurship issues.

I would like to help young people overcome the barriers to setting up in a farming business by making available targeted financial support from 2010. Funding of £2 million will be available from 2010 for a scheme to support young entrants starting out in business. This support could take the form of an interest rate subsidy for a specified period or a direct grant scheme for the construction of buildings or machinery purchase. We need to consider, in consultation with the industry, what type of scheme will best meet the needs of young entrants.

I plan to consult the industry on the detail of these proposals once the comments of the task and finish group have been taken into account. That will probably be by the end of February. I am also working closely with my colleagues on cross-cutting issues that affect young entrants, including the issue of rural housing. Jocelyn Davies is well aware of the problems experienced by young people in securing affordable homes, and work is under way with local authorities to improve the situation. Jane Davidson is undertaking a review of technical advice note 6, which will include consideration of new-build agricultural dwellings, the reuse and adaptation of rural buildings, and developments for farm diversification. I am being fully supportive of these important areas of work.

Clearly, there is much to be done to make the young entrant proposals a reality. I expect to have the structure of the support scheme in place by the autumn. I am confident that this scheme represents a significant step in the



hwn yn gam mawr yn y cyfeiriad iawn tuag at greu diwydiant ffermio deinamig a chystadleuol yng Nghymru, diwydiant sy'n barod i'r dyfodol.

1.50 p.m.

**Brynle Williams:** First, we all welcome this statement; it is long overdue. I just hope that we can put some meat on the bones. [*Laughter.*] Clearly, there is much to be done—[*Interruption.*] Have you finished?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. We all wish to hear Brynle Williams. I am sorry the bad habits that I am used to from my right now appear from my left. [*Laughter.*]

**Brynle Williams:** Diolch, Lywydd. I would like some clarification, Minister. It is a simple question, but what constitutes a new entrant? Are we talking about someone who is fresh out of university or someone who has been working on a farm for several years? This is very important, because it is not only the young sons and daughters who are taking over family farms; we also need new blood.

That brings me to my second point which is that, regrettably, over the past few years, dare I say it, Labour policies of selling off council holdings and so on have barred the way for many potential young entrants to farming. Only this week, I spoke to a tenant's son on a council farm who, because of the county's policy, will not be able to inherit the farm; his father has a lifetime tenancy. This is another aspect that we need to consider. Even if the son were able to inherit the tenancy, there would be the problem of where to accommodate the father, who would then need a house in which to live. As we have discussed many times, affordable housing is part of this. When they retire from farming, many tenant farmers sell their livestock and deadstock, because that is their pension to buy a home for the future. I hope that something can be done about succession of tenancy and how we define who qualifies for what.

right direction towards the creation of a dynamic and competitive farming industry in Wales, an industry fit for the future.

**Brynle Williams:** Yn gyntaf, yr ydym i gyd yn croesawu'r datganiad hwn; mae'n hen bryd ei gael. Dim ond gobeithio yr ydwyf y gallwn roi rhywfaint o gig ar yr esgryn. [*Chwerthin.*] Yn amlwg, mae llawer i'w wneud—[*Torri ar draws.*] A ydych wedi gorffen?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Dymunwn glywed Brynle Williams. Mae'n flin gennyf fod yr arferion drwg yr wyf wedi arfer eu clywed ar y dde imi bellach yn ymddangos o'r chwith. [*Chwerthin.*]

**Brynle Williams:** Diolch, Lywydd. Hoffwn air o eglurhad, Weinidog. Mae'n gwestiwn syml, ond beth yw diffiniad ffermwr newydd? A ydym yn sôn am rywun sydd yn syth allan o'r brifysgol neu rywun sydd wedi bod yn gweithio ar fferm ers rhai blynyddoedd? Mae hyn yn bwysig iawn, oherwydd nid mater o feibion a merched ifanc yn cymryd rheolaeth ar ffermydd teulu yn unig yw hyn; mae angen gwaed newydd hefyd.

Daw hynny â mi at fy ail bwynt, sef, ysywaeth, fod polisïau Llafur dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf o werthu mân ddaliadau cynghorau ac ati, os meiddiaf ddweud hynny, wedi cau'r drws ar lawer o bobl ifanc a allasai ddod i mewn i ffermio. Dim ond yr wythnos hon, siaradais â mab i denant ar fferm gyngor na fydd yn gallu etifeddu'r fferm oherwydd polisi'r sir; mae gan ei dad denantiaeth oes. Dyma agwedd arall y mae angen inni ei hystyried. Hyd yn oed pe gallai'r mab etifeddu'r denantiaeth, byddai gan y tad broblem llety, ac angen tŷ i fyw ynddo wedyn. Fel yr ydym wedi ei drafod sawl gwaith, mae tai fforddiadwy'n rhan o hyn. Pan ymddeolant o ffermio, bydd llawer o denantiaid ffermydd yn gwerthu'u da byw a'u stoc marw, oherwydd dyna'u pensiwn ar gyfer prynu cartref i'r dyfodol. Gobeithio y gellir gwneud rhywbeth am olyniaeth tenantiaeth a sut y mae diffinio pwy sydd yn gymwys i gael beth.

I welcome the additional help that you are giving to young farmers by drawing up schemes to improve the viability of their businesses. The idea of such planning, if I understand it correctly, is to enable them to diversify by allowing other activities, which have been severely restricted in the past, to take place on farms. It is all about keeping young people on the land and encouraging them into these areas.

I mentioned retirement; are you going to look at inheritance tax? I know that it falls outside of your portfolio, but it is part and parcel of the problem. When a young man wishes to take over, or when a young lady wishes to take over, because there are many young ladies who—[*Laughter.*] I shall rephrase that, Presiding Officer, and say ‘young people’. We need to look at tax relief for young people who wish to take over farms. I am interested to hear that there may be preferential borrowing rates for young entrants to agriculture. You do not need to be told, given your background in farming, Minister, that a young person going into farming now needs possibly more than £200,000. They need preferential interest rates given the economic climate. I hope that we can influence that.

There has been mention of early retirement. I saw an article by Jill Evans in the *Western Mail* that mentioned that there is money available through an early retirement scheme for older farmers, which enables land to be transferred to young farmers, who can be either existing farmers or new entrants. That is very important. Share farming, which is a method used in the southern hemisphere, occasionally works in this country, but not well enough. Therefore, this needs to be considered and encouraged in order to bring young people into farming.

These are the questions that I would like answered. We see that councils are liquidating estates, which is a shame, as these represent the first step on the ladder. Many young people are getting council tenancies but are then being restricted and forced to milk on a tenancy because it is classed as a dairy farm, but it is too much for a young

Croesawaf y cymorth ychwanegol yr ydych yn ei roi i ffermwyr ifanc drwy lunio cynlluniau i wella hyfywdra eu busnesau. Syniad cynllunio o’r fath, os wyf fi’n deall yn iawn, yw eu galluogi i arallgyfeirio drwy ganiatáu i weithgareddau eraill, a gyfyngwyd yn llym yn y gorffennol, ddigwydd ar ffermydd. Mae a wnelo hyn i gyd â chadw pobl ifanc ar y tir a’u hannog i’r meysydd hyn.

Soniais am ymddeol; a ydych yn mynd i edrych ar dreth etifeddiant? Gwn ei fod y tu allan i’ch portffolio, ond mae’n rhan annatod o’r broblem. Pan fydd dyn ifanc eisiau cymryd yr awenau, neu pan fydd merch ifanc eisiau cymryd yr awenau, oherwydd mae llawer o ferched ifainc sydd—[*Chwerthin.*] Aralleiriau hynny, Lywydd, a dweud ‘pobl ifanc’. Mae angen inni edrych ar ostwng y dreth i bobl ifanc sy’n dymuno cymryd rheolaeth dros ffermydd. Diddorol yw clywed y gall fod cyfraddau benthyca manteisiol i newydd-ddyfodiaid i amaethyddiaeth. Nid oes angen dweud wrthy ch i, a chofio’ch cefndir amaethyddol, Weinidog, fod angen efallai fwy na £200,000 ar berson ifanc sy’n dechrau ffermio’n awr. Mae arnynt angen cyfraddau llog manteisiol ac ystyried yr hinsawdd economaidd. Gobeithio y gallwn ddylanwadu ar hynny.

Bu sôn am ymddeol cynnar. Gwelais erthygl gan Jill Evans yn y *Western Mail* a soniodd fod arian ar gael drwy gynllun ymddeol yn gynnar i ffermwyr hyn, sy’n galluogi trosglwyddo tir i ffermwyr ifanc, a all fod naill ai’n ffermwyr presennol neu’n rhai newydd. Mae hynny’n bwysig iawn. Mae ffermio cyfran, sef dull a ddefnyddir yn hemisffer y de, yn gweithio’n achlysurol yn y wlad hon, ond ddim yn ddigon da. Felly, mae angen ystyried hyn a’i annog er mwyn dod â phobl ifanc i mewn i ffermio.

Dyma’r cwestiynau yr hoffwn gael ateb iddynt. Gwelwn fod cynghorau’n datod ystadau, sydd yn bechod, gan mai’r rhain yw’r cam cyntaf ar yr ysgol. Mae llawer o bobl ifanc yn cael tenantiaethau cyngor ond wedyn yn cael eu cyfyngu a’u gorfodi i odro ar denantiaeth oherwydd bod y fferm wedi’i dosbarthu’n fferm laeth, ond mae’n ormod i

person to take on a tenancy with 50 cows in addition to a part-time job. However, on the other hand, it is not enough to keep young people in farming. I welcome the assistance with buildings, machinery and so forth, and I hope that we can put meat on the bones. Diolch yn fawr iawn.

**Elin Jones:** Diolch am eich cefnogaeth, yn gyffredinol, Brynle, i'r datganiad ac i'r bwriad i ymgymryd â'r gwaith hwn dros y blynyddoedd nesaf. Fe wnaethoch ofyn ar y cychwyn am ddiffiniad o beth yw ffermwr ifanc newydd. Y newyddion anffodus i chi, Brynle, yw na fyddwch chi'n gymwys gan fod rheolau Ewropeaidd yn golygu bod yn rhaid i ni dargedu pobl o dan 40 mlwydd oed. Yn ogystal, byddai'n briodol i'r grŵp a sefydlais i fy nghyngori i roi gwybodaeth ynglŷn ag a ddylid cael targedu pellach yn y cyswllt hwnnw oherwydd bydd yr adnoddau sydd gennym yn gorfod gweithio ar draws ystod eang o ffermwyr. Mae'n bwysig inni ystyried a oes angen targedu pellach a bod yn glir ar y cychwyn, pan fydd y rhaglen yn mynd rhagddi o ddifrif, pwy fydd y flaenoriaeth o safbwynt defnyddio'r arian cyhoeddus hwn.

O ran eich pwynt ynglŷn â ffermydd tenantiaid awdurdodau lleol, mae'n dda clywed cynrychiolydd o'r blaid Doriaidd yn siarad yn erbyn preifateiddio a gwerthu adnoddau cyhoeddus i'r sector breifat. Cytunaf â chi; mae nifer o awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru wedi edrych ar y materion hyn ac wedi gweithredu arnynt dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Maent yn adnoddau pwysig sy'n caniatáu i ffermwyr newydd ddod yn rhan o'r diwydiant amaeth. Mae'n siŵr bod digon o enghreifftiau mewn etholaethau ar hyd a lled Cymru lle mae'r rhain wedi gwneud cyfraniad pwysig yn y gorffennol. Gwnaf ymrwymiad i drafod gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru sut y gall y gymdeithas ymwneud â'r gwaith hwn gan edrych arno o safbwynt awdurdodau lleol fel perchnogion eiddo neu ffermydd.

Nid oes gennyf gyfrifoldeb dros amrywio treth etifeddiant, ond yr wyf yn cydnabod y pwynt a wnewch; mae nifer o bobl wedi dweud wrthyf fod y dreth wedi bod yn rhwystr mewn nifer o achosion o ran sicrhau olyniaeth o un genhedlaeth i'r nesaf a

berson ifanc ymgymryd â thenantiaeth gyda 50 o wartheg ar ben swydd ran amser. Fodd bynnag, ar y llaw arall, nid yw'n ddigon i gadw pobl ifanc ym myd ffermio. Croesawaf y cymorth gydag adeiladau, peiriannau ac ati, a gobeithio y gallwn roi cig ar yr esgryn. Diolch yn fawr iawn.

**Elin Jones:** Thank you for your general support, Brynle, for the statement and for the intention to undertake this work over the ensuing years. You raised a point at the outset about a definition of a new young entrant. Unfortunately for you, Brynle, you will not be eligible because European rules mean that we must target people under the age of 40. Further to that, it will be appropriate for the group that I have established to provide me with advice and information on whether we should have further targeting in this context because our resources will have to be applied across a wide range of farmers. It is important for us to consider whether further targeting is needed and to be clear from the outset, when the programme begins in earnest, who will be in a priority position as regards the use of this public funding.

In relation to your point about local authority tenant farmers, it is good to hear a representative of the Tory party speaking against privatisation and the selling of public assets to the private sector. I agree with you; many local authorities throughout Wales have considered these matters and have taken action in recent years. They are important assets as regards enabling new entrants to become part of the agriculture industry. I am sure that there are plenty of examples in constituencies throughout Wales where these have made an important contribution in the past. I will make a commitment to discussing with the Welsh Local Government Association how it can become involved in this work and consider it from the local authorities' perspective as property owners or farm owners.

I do not have responsibility for the varying of inheritance tax, but I acknowledge your point; many people have told me that the tax has been an obstacle in many instances when it came to securing succession from one generation to the next and transferring the

throsglwyddo rheolaeth dros ffermydd. Efallai bydd y grŵp yn dymuno rhoi cyngor i mi ynglŷn â pha faterion y dylem eu trafod gyda'r Trysorlys yn y cyd-destun hwn. Serch hynny, nid wyf am godi gobeithion ar hyn o bryd ynglŷn â pha mor llwyddiannus neu beidio y byddwn wrth ymhél â hynny.

Cyfeiriasoch at yr angen i edrych ar sut yr ariennir mynediad ar gyfer ffermwyr ifanc, a'r ffaith bod cyfraddau llog a benthyciadau yn sylweddol yn y maes hwn oherwydd pris tir a pheiriannau, ac ati. Mae'n siŵr gennyf y bydd y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen yn dymuno rhoi cyngor i mi ynglŷn â sut y byddwn yn defnyddio'r £2 filiwn a glustnodwyd gennym. Yr wyf hefyd yn siŵr y byddaf yn ystyried benthyciadau di-log neu â llog isel maes o law wrth fynd ati i ddefnyddio'r arian hwnnw.

2.00 p.m.

Bu i chi gyfeirio at y ffaith fod ffermio ar y cyd wedi datblygu mewn ambell wlad ar hyd a lled y byd ond nad yw'n llwyddiannus iawn yng Nghymru eto. Mae enghreifftiau o hynny'n digwydd yng Nghymru ac yr wyf yn awyddus iawn i'w hystyried, oherwydd mae'n bwysig sicrhau'r olyniaeth i'r ffermwyr hynny sy'n heneiddio neu'n ymddeol nad oes ganddynt olynnyddion amlwg yn eu teulu. Mae digonedd o ffermwyr ifanc brwdfrydig fydd eisiau cysylltu eu hunain â fferm i'r dyfodol. Mae Clybiau Ffermwyr Ifanc Cymru wedi datblygu bas data o ran enwau'r ffermwyr hynny sydd ar fin ymddeol er mwyn gallu eu paru â phobl sydd â diddordeb ymuno â'r diwydiant. Yr wyf yn gobeithio gweld y patrwm hwnnw'n cael ei sefydlu i'r dyfodol.

**Joyce Watson:** I welcome the statement, and I very much look forward to the outcome of the consultation process. The decision on how to structure the scheme is important to ensure that it provides the best support for young farmers and makes the most effective use of the £2 million allocation. I welcome the decision to consult widely over a realistic period of time to ensure that we get it right.

The Welsh Assembly Government has a good record of providing support for young

management of farms. The group might wish to advise me on the matters that should be raised with the Treasury in this context. However, I do not want to raise your hopes at this point as regards our being successful or otherwise in pursuing that.

You referred to the need to consider how access for new entrants is funded and the fact that interest rates and loans are substantial as a result of the price of land and machinery, and so on. I am sure that the task and finish group will wish to advise me on how we use the £2 million that we have allocated. I am also sure that I will give consideration to interest-free or low-interest loans in due course as we start to use this money.

You referred to the fact that share farming has developed in several countries around the world but is not yet very successful in Wales. There are examples of it in Wales and I am most eager to consider them, because it is important to ensure succession for farmers who are getting older or retiring and who do not have obvious successors in the family. There are plenty of young, enthusiastic farmers who will wish to be associated with a farm in the future. Wales Young Farmers Clubs has developed a database of names of those farmers who are about to retire so that they can be matched with people who are interested in entering the industry. I hope to see that pattern being established for the future.

**Joyce Watson:** Croesawaf y datganiad, ac edrychaf ymlaen yn fawr at ganlyniad y broses ymgynghori. Mae'r penderfyniad sut i strwythuro'r cynllun yn bwysig er mwyn sicrhau ei fod yn cynnig y gefnogaeth orau i ffermwyr ifanc ac yn defnyddio'r dyraniad o £2 filiwn yn y ffordd fwyaf effeithiol. Croesawaf y penderfyniad i ymgynghori'n eang am gyfnod realistig er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn gwneud y peth iawn.

Mae gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru hanes da o gefnogi ffermwyr ifanc, drwy gyfrwng

farmers, through the Farming for the Future strategy 2001 and the commitment to securing the future of family farms. Already, through schemes such as Farming Connect and Tir Gofal, the Assembly Government has facilitated the changes that have been, and will continue to be, necessary for ensuring a successful and sustainable future for farming in Wales. While agriculture enjoys a special place as part of our environmental and cultural heritage, it is a business, after all. For those working in the agriculture sector, it is their livelihood. Businesses must be adaptable to meet new challenges. Therefore, we as policy-makers have the responsibility to continue to invest political energy in creating new ways of assisting farmers so that the agriculture sector in Wales is, above all, sustainable and profitable.

Supporting new entrants is one way of helping the industry to adapt. The age profile of Welsh farmers, as you say, is getting older. In 1997, the average age of principal farmers in Wales was 55; it is now nearer 60. Half of all registered proprietors of Welsh farm holdings are over the age of 55. While age is not necessarily a barrier to change—and as someone who fits somewhere into that 50ish age bracket, I am inclined to argue that case quite strongly—it remains the case that the age profile of farmers is one factor in making it harder for the industry to adapt.

Young farmers represent a key factor in the development of rural areas, and, in supporting young farmers to develop the skills that they need to establish viable businesses, this scheme will contribute to the overall health of agriculture in Wales.

**Elin Jones:** Thank you for that support and your comments. You are right that previous Government initiatives have shown support for young farmers: Farming Connect, in its previous and its new guise, which is to be launched later this year, provides support for young farmers. In bringing forward this statement today, I hope to provide a focus for the work that we will do with young farmers, to provide a targeted means of supporting

strategaeth Ffermio i'r Dyfodol 2001 a'r ymrwymiad i sicrhau dyfodol ffermydd teuluol. Eisoes, drwy gyfrwng cynlluniau megis Cyswllt Ffermio a Tir Gofal, mae Llywodraeth y Cynlluniad wedi hwyluso'r newidiadau sydd wedi bod yn angenrheidiol, ac a fydd yn parhau felly, er mwyn sicrhau dyfodol llwyddiannus a chynaliadwy i ffermio yng Nghymru. Er bod i amaethyddiaeth le arbennig fel rhan o'n treftadaeth amgylcheddol a diwylliannol, busnes ydyw wedi'r cyfan, I'r rheini sy'n gweithio yn y sector amaethyddiaeth, dyna'u bara menyn. Rhaid i fusnesau allu addasu i ymateb i heriau newydd. Felly, ein cyfrifoldeb ni, lunwyr polisïau, yw parhau i roi egni gwleidyddol wrth greu ffyrdd newydd i gynorthwyo ffermwyr, er mwyn i'r sector amaethyddiaeth yng Nghymru fod, yn anad dim, yn gynaliadwy ac yn broffidiol.

Un ffordd i gynorthwyo'r diwydiant i addasu yw cefnogi ffermwyr newydd. Fel y dywedwch, mae proffil oed ffermwyr Cymru'n heneiddio. Yn 1997, cyfartaledd oedran prif ffermwyr yng Nghymru oedd 55; erbyn hyn mae'n nes at 60. Mae hanner yr holl berchnogion cofrestredig ffermydd yng Nghymru dros 55 oed. Er nad yw oed o anghenraid yn rhwystr rhag newid—ac fel un sy'n perthyn rywle yn y cylch oed hwnnw o gwmpas yr hanner cant, yr wyf yn tueddu i bledio'r ddadl honno'n eithaf brwd—mae'n dal yn wir mai proffil oed ffermwyr yw un o'r ffactorau sy'n ei gwneud yn anos i'r diwydiant addasu.

Mae ffermwyr ifanc yn ffactor allweddol wrth ddatblygu ardaloedd gwledig, a thrwy gynorthwyo ffermwyr ifanc i feithrin y sgiliau y mae eu hangen arnynt i sefydlu busnesau hyfyw, bydd y cynllun hwn yn cyfrannu at iechyd amaethyddiaeth yn gyffredinol yng Nghymru.

**Elin Jones:** Diolch ichi am y gefnogaeth honno a'ch sylwadau. Yr ydych yn iawn bod cynlluniau blaenorol y Llywodraeth wedi dangos cefnogaeth i ffermwyr ifanc: mae Cyswllt Ffermio, ar ei wedd flaenorol ac ar ei newydd wedd, a gaiff ei lansio'n ddiweddarach eleni, yn cynnig cefnogaeth i ffermwyr ifanc. Wrth ddod â'r datganiad hwn ger eich bron heddiw, gobeithiaf greu ffocws ar gyfer y gwaith a wnawn gyda ffermwyr

their initiatives to develop their futures in the farming industry. It is true to say that there are many entrepreneurial go-getting older farmers out there, but many of the new ideas, ways of thinking, and dynamic views about how the commercial and co-operative aspects of farming will develop in the future seem to come from younger farmers. I hear a lot of such ideas, and I suppose that that would be the case in all walks of life: you would see greater dynamism among the younger generation. I want to harness that new way of thinking, and ensure that we have an agriculture system that is flexible enough in Wales to allow the younger generation to access the farming industry so that their thoughts and aspirations for the future of the industry are put into action earlier, rather than later.

**Mick Bates:** Thank you for your statement; the Welsh Liberal Democrats are happy to welcome its principle. We want to have age-balanced communities, and it is particularly important to this industry to have new blood, which once included me. I was young once. I was a completely new entrant who did not come from a farming background. However, I was helped by my father in law, and there are many great stories about how I learned to farm. It is important to remember that new entrants not from a farming background are often not eligible for many farming grants. My colleague, Brynle Williams, raised an important point in that we must take a close look at what constitutes a 'new entrant', because it is often the case that young people who have already established businesses have an advantage over someone who has just left college. So, it is a difficult nut to crack, and I look forward to the deliberations and conclusions of the group that you have established to look into this. It is a vital point, and I know that the people on the group will do an excellent job.

I also accept that it must ultimately be a commercial business. In that respect, I have a few questions on how the £2 million will be used. Will you confirm that the £2 million is Government money, and is it possible that that money could be match funded from other

ifanc, er mwyn targedu'r cymorth a roddir i'w cynlluniau i ddatblygu eu dyfodol yn y diwydiant ffermio. Mae'n wir dweud bod yna nifer o ffermwyr hŷn mentrus ac anturus, ond, i bob golwg, gan ffermwyr iau y daw llawer o'r syniadau newydd, y ffyrdd newydd o feddwl a'r safbwyntiau deinamig ynglŷn â sut y bydd yr agweddau masnachol a chydweithredol mewn ffermio yn datblygu yn y dyfodol. Clywaf lawer o syniadau o'r fath, ac y mae'n debyg y byddai hynny'n wir ym mhob maes: gwelech fwy o dân ymhlith y genhedlaeth iau. Yr wyf am harneisio'r ffordd newydd honno o feddwl, a sicrhau bod gennym system amaethyddol yng Nghymru sy'n ddigon hyblyg i agor y drws i'r diwydiant ffermio i'r genhedlaeth iau er mwyn i'w syniadau a'u dyheadau ar gyfer dyfodol y diwydiant gael eu rhoi ar waith yn gynharach, yn hytrach nag yn hwyrach.

**Mick Bates:** Diolch ichi am eich datganiad; mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n hapus i groesawu ei egwyddor. Dymunwn gael cymunedau cytbwys o ran oed, ac mae'n arbennig o bwysig i'r diwydiant hwn gael gwaed newydd, a oedd ar un adeg yn fy nghynnwys i. Yr oeddwn innau'n ifanc ar un adeg. Yr oeddwn yn gwbl newydd i'r maes; nid oeddwn yn dod o gefndir ffermio. Fodd bynnag, cefais gymorth gan fy nhad-yng-nghyfraith, ac y mae llu o straeon gwych am y ffordd y dysgais ffermio. Mae'n bwysig cofio bod pobl nad ydynt o gefndir ffermio ac sy'n ymuno â'r diwydiant o'r newydd yn aml yn anghymwys i gael llawer o grantiau ffermio. Cododd fy nghyd-Aelod, Brynle Williams, bwynt pwysig y mae'n rhaid inni edrych arno'n ofalus, sef beth yw ystyr 'ffermwr newydd', oherwydd yn aml bydd gan bobl ifanc sydd eisoes wedi sefydlu busnesau fantais dros rywun sydd newydd ddod o'r coleg. Felly, mae'n broblem ddyrys, ac edrychaf ymlaen at drafodaethau a chasgliadau'r grŵp yr ydych wedi'i sefydlu i ystyried hyn. Mae'n bwynt hollbwysig, a gwn y gwnaiff aelodau'r grŵp waith rhagorol.

Derbyniat hefyd fod yn rhaid i'r busnes fod yn un masnachol yn y pen draw. Yn y cyswllt hwnnw, mae gennyf ychydig gwestiynau ynglŷn â'r ffordd y defnyddir y £2 filiwn. A wnewch gadarnhau mai arian y Llywodraeth yw'r £2 filiwn, ac a yw'n bosibl y gellid cael

sources to increase the amount available? What is your advice on state aids, because many other rural businesses would like to have low-interest loans? As much as I welcome it, what impact will offering a loan to one particular business in rural Wales have?

You also mentioned the launch of the new Farming Connect scheme. While I welcome the free business advice that would be available through the scheme, as in the past, I understand that there is no farming enterprise grant to follow on from that advice. As part of that package, having given someone advice about how to improve their business, do you think that they should also be able to access grants to help them to improve it? For example, under the previous Farming Connect scheme, if a farming business had a partner who was aged under 40, the business was entitled to 10 per cent extra. I am certain that your group will examine these mechanisms, but it would be interesting to know whether these aspects are already on your mind.

In concluding, I should declare an interest as someone who is now of retirement age—or of the average age of most farmers, according to the previous speaker. Have you given due consideration to a retirement scheme? My colleague, Brynle Williams, mentioned how difficult it is for people to retire when their business assets are reducing, as it causes considerable problems. If you have considered that, you may find it useful to talk with the Minister responsible for housing. Perhaps it would be possible to provide a decent affordable home not just for younger people, but also for the older people who retire in the country.

**Elin Jones:** Thank you, Mick, and I also thank the Liberal Democrats for their support for my statement. I agree with you, as I agreed with Brynle, that we need a clear definition of what young farmers or new farmers we will be targeting for this scheme, and who is eligible for support. I will be looking for advice from the task and finish group on that particular issue.

arian cyfatebol i'r arian hwnnw o ffynonellau eraill er mwyn cynyddu'r swm sydd ar gael? Beth yw eich cyngor ynglŷn â chymorth gan y wladwriaeth, oherwydd byddai nifer o fusnesau gwledig eraill yn falch cael benthyciadau llog-isel? Er fy mod yn ei groesawu'n fawr, pa effaith a gaiff cynnig benthyciad i un busnes penodol yn y Gymru wledig?

Soniecch hefyd am lansio'r cynllun Cyswllt Ffermio newydd. Er fy mod yn croesawu'r cyngor busnes am ddim a fyddai ar gael drwy'r cynllun, fel yn y gorffennol, deallaf nad oes grant mentrau ffermio ar gael yn sgil y cyngor hwnnw. Fel rhan o'r pecyn hwnnw, ar ôl cynghori rhywun sut i wella'i fusnes, a ydych yn meddwl y dylai hefyd allu cael grantiau i'w gynorthwyo i'w wella? Er enghraifft, dan y cynllun Cyswllt Ffermio blaenorol, petai gan fusnes ffermio bartner a oedd dan 40 oed, yr oedd gan y busnes hawl i 10 y cant yn ychwanegol. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd eich grŵp yn archwilio'r mecanweithiau hyn, ond byddai'n ddi-ddorol gwybod a yw'r agweddau hyn eisoes ar eich meddwl.

Wrth gloi, dylwn ddatgan buddiant a minnau bellach wedi cyrraedd oed ymddeol—neu'r un oed â'r rhan fwyaf o ffermwyr ar gyfartaledd, yn ôl y siaradwr blaenorol. A ydych wedi ystyried cynllun ymddeol? Soniodd fy nghyd-Aelod, Brynle Williams, mor anodd ydyw i bobl ymddeol pan fydd asedau eu busnes yn crebachu, gan fod hynny'n achosi problemau sylweddol. Os ydych wedi ystyried hynny, gallai fod yn fuddiol ichi siarad â'r Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am dai. Efallai y byddai modd darparu cartref fforddiadwy gweddus nid yn unig ar gyfer pobl iau, ond hefyd ar gyfer y bobl hŷn sy'n ymddeol yng nghefn gwlad.

**Elin Jones:** Diolch, Mick, a diolch hefyd i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol am eu cefnogaeth i'm datganiad. Cytunaf â chi, fel y cytunais â Brynle, fod arnom angen diffiniad clir o'r ffermwyr ifanc neu ffermwyr newydd y byddwn yn eu targedu ar gyfer y cynllun hwn, a phwy sy'n gymwys i gael cymorth. Byddaf yn gofyn am gyngor gan y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar y mater penodol hwnnw.

2.10 p.m.

When we come to spend the £2 million financial allocation that we have secured for this scheme, we will have to secure state aid clearance. I have a fairly open mind at this stage, however, on the exact mechanisms that should be put in place for the financial support of younger or newer farmers in using that £2 million. You referred to the grants that were previously available under Farming Connect, but the farm enterprise grant for capital works will no longer be available under the new Farming Connect. It may be possible for part of that £2 million to be used to support the purchase of machinery or buildings, as I said in my statement. Equally, low-interest loans would be another avenue of support that I will want the group to look at.

What we have in mind here is a lead-in period of business support, succession planning, advice, and training opportunities for younger farmers so that they can, in the second or third year of this programme, look for the financial support that they might require to undertake their new role in farming.

You asked about a retirement scheme, but I thought that becoming an Assembly Member was a retirement scheme for some farmers. [*Laughter.*] The One Wales Government has made no commitment to look at a retirement scheme for farmers, and that is not, in my personal opinion, the priority in this case. My priority has always been to look at how we support younger and newer farmers in coming into the industry. However, I do accept your point about planning and housing for generations of farmers. Fifty years ago, I am sure, three generations of farmers would live in one farmhouse, but that pattern is no longer relevant to the farming industry, just as it is not relevant to wider society. We need to look at that. I referred to the review of TAN 6 being undertaken by Jane Davidson, which will look at how we allow younger farmers and older farmers to live within or near their farm complexes, enabling them to undertake their work in rural Wales.

Pan ddaw'n adeg gwario'r dyraniad ariannol o £2 filiwn yr ydym wedi'i sicrhau ar gyfer y cynllun hwn, bydd yn rhaid inni sicrhau cymeradwyaeth ar gyfer cymorth gan y wladwriaeth. Mae gennyf feddwl gweddol agored ar hyn o bryd, fodd bynnag, ynglŷn â'r union fecanweithiau y dylid eu sefydlu i gefnogi ffermwyr iau neu fferiwyr mwy newydd wrth ddefnyddio'r £2 filiwn hwnnw. Cyfeiriec at y grantiau a oedd ar gael gynt dan Cyswllt Ffermio, ond ni fydd y grant mentrau fferm ar gyfer gwaith cyfalaf ar gael mwyach dan y cynllun Cyswllt Ffermio newydd. Hwyrach y gellid defnyddio rhan o'r £2 filiwn hwnnw i gynorthwyo pobl i brynu peiriannau neu adeiladau, fel y dywedais yn fy natganiad. Yn yr un modd, byddai benthyciadau llog-isel yn llwybr cymorth arall y byddaf am i'r grŵp ei ystyried.

Yr hyn sydd gennym mewn golwg yma yw cyfnod cychwynnol o gymorth busnes, cynllunio olyniaeth, a chyfleoedd hyfforddi i ffermwyr ifanc fel y gallant, yn ystod ail neu drydedd flwyddyn y rhaglen hon, geisio'r gefnogaeth ariannol y gall bydd arnynt ei hangen i ymgymryd â'u rôl newydd ym maes ffermio.

Yr oeddech yn holi am gynllun ymddeol, ond yr oeddwn i'n credu mai cynllun ymddeol i ambell ffermwr oedd dod yn Aelod o'r Cynulliad. [*Chwerthin.*] Nid yw Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un wedi ymrwymo i ystyried cynllun ymddeol i ffermwyr, ac yn fy mam bersonol i, nid honno yw'r flaenoriaeth yn y cyswllt hwn. Fy mlaenoriaeth i erioed yw edrych ar y ffordd yr ydym yn cynorthwyo ffermwyr iau a ffermwyr mwy newydd wrth iddynt ymuno â'r diwydiant. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn derbyn eich pwynt am gynllunio a thai i genedlaethau o ffermwyr. Hanner can mlynedd yn ôl, yr wyf yn siŵr, byddai tair cenhedlaeth o ffermwyr yn byw mewn un ffermdy, ond nid yw'r patrwm hwnnw'n berthnasol mwyach i'r diwydiant ffermio, yn union fel nad yw'n berthnasol i gymdeithas drwyddi draw. Mae angen inni edrych ar hynny. Cyfeiriais at yr adolygiad o TAN 6 sydd ar y gweill gan Jane Davidson ac a fydd yn edrych ar y ffordd y gallwn ganiatáu i ffermwyr iau a ffermwyr hŷn fyw o fewn



libart eu fferm neu gerllaw, er mwyn eu galluogi i wneud eu gwaith yn y Gymru wledig.

**Nerys Evans:** Yr wyf yn falch o weld yr ymrwymiadau pwysig hyn i ysgogi a chefnogi ffermwyr ifanc yn cael eu gwireddu mor gynnar yn y trydydd Cynulliad. Gwyddom oll fod y diwydiant wedi dioddef oherwydd rhesymau y tu hwnt i'w reolaeth y llynedd, ac mae'r bai yn cwmpo wrth ddrws San Steffan mewn sawl achos—ond dadl arall yw honno.

**Nerys Evans:** I am pleased to see this important commitment to encouraging and supporting young farmers being realised so early into the third Assembly. We all know that the industry suffered for reasons beyond its control over the past year, and the blame lies with Westminster in many cases—but that is a different debate.

Fel y crybwyllwyd eisoes, mae dyfodol y diwydiant amaethyddol yn nwylo ein pobl ifanc. Mae pob sector o'n cymdeithas yn elwa o syniadau, brwdfrydedd ac egni'n pobl ifanc. A minnau'n Aelod ifanc, credaf fod hynny'n wir yn y sefydliad hwn hefyd.

As has already been mentioned, the future of the agricultural industry is in the hands of young people. Every sector of our society benefits from the ideas, enthusiasm and energy of our young people. As one of the youngest Members, I think that is also true in this establishment.

Wrth ystyried y ffordd ymlaen, mae'n bwysig rhoi cymorth i bobl ifanc gael mynediad i'r diwydiant, a bod y cynlluniau hyn yn mynd law yn llaw â sicrhau cynaliadwyedd i'r diwydiant yn ei gyfanrwydd. Faint o gyfle fydd i'r arian ychwanegol hwn gael ei ddefnyddio i ddatblygu sgiliau yn y diwydiant, felly? A fydd cyfle i weithio gyda'r sector yn ehangach fel bod modd nodi pa sgiliau sydd eu hangen?

When considering the way forward, it is important to help young people to gain access to the industry, and to make sure that these plans go hand in hand with ensuring the sustainability of the industry as a whole. How much scope, therefore, is there for this additional money to be used to develop skills in the industry? Will there be an opportunity to work with the sector more widely, so that we can identify which skills are needed?

Mae'r cynllun hwn yn rhan o becyn o fesurau i helpu'r diwydiant amaethyddol a'r Gymru wledig, a bydd sawl un o ymrwymiadau 'Cymru'n Un' yn y maes hwn yn helpu i sicrhau dyfodol llewyrchus i'r diwydiant. Er hynny, mae pethau ehangach â rôl i'w chwarae wrth geisio rhoi'r cyfle i bobl ifanc aros yn eu cymunedau gwledig, os dymunant. Un o'r elfennau mwyaf sylfaenol yw'r gallu i brynu neu rentu tŷ. Mae'n hanfodol felly fod ein hymrwymiad i gynnig grant i brynwyr am y tro cyntaf yn cael ei wireddu'n gynnar. Yn ogystal, mae'r ymrwymiadau ynghylch TAN 6 yn hanfodol i ehangu categori presennol 'annedd gweithiwr amaethyddol'. I nifer fawr yn ein cymunedau gwledig, bydd edrych eto ar TAN 20 a'r asesiad o effaith ieithyddol yn chwarae rôl fawr. Gyda hynny, a fydd cylch gwaith y grŵp newydd yn ddigon eang i ystyried yr elfennau hyn hefyd?

This scheme is part of a package of measures to help the agricultural industry and rural Wales, and many of the commitments in 'One Wales' in this regard will help to ensure a prosperous future for the industry. However, there are wider issues and a role to play in trying to give young people the opportunity to remain in their rural communities, if they so wish. One of the most fundamental aspects is the ability to buy or rent a home. It is crucial, therefore, that our commitment to offer a grant to first-time buyers is realised early on. In addition, the commitments relating to TAN 6 are crucial to expand the present category of 'agricultural worker dwellings'. For many of our rural communities, looking again at TAN 20 and the linguistic impact assessment would play a very important role. In that regard, will the remit of this new group will be wide enough for it to consider these aspects also?

**Elin Jones:** Diolch am y sylwadau hynny, Nerys. O ran datblygu sgiliau ffermwyr ifanc a chysylltiadau gyda cholegau addysg bellach sy'n arbenigo ym meysydd astudio cefn gwlad ac amaethyddiaeth, bydd y gwaith hwnnw o bwys mawr wrth inni feithrin y ffermwyr ifanc ar gyfer eu dyfodol. Mae rheolwr Lantra yng Nghymru yn aelod o'r grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen yr wyf wedi ei sefydlu i'r pwrpas hwn.

O ran tai yng nghefn gwlad, fel y dywedais yn fy natganiad ac wrth ateb cwestiynau, mae hyn yn rhwystr ar hyn o bryd i rywfaint o'r olynau sydd ei angen yn y diwydiant amaethyddol rhwng y perchennog neu'r teulu hŷn sy'n rhedeg y busnes a'r teulu ifanc sydd â diddordeb mewn cymryd y busnes drosodd.

Mae TAN 6 yn ei ffurf presennol wedi bodoli ers sawl blwyddyn, ac efallai ei fod yn fwy perthnasol i gyfnod pan oedd y diwydiant amaethyddol yn wahanol fath o ddiwydiant, yn cynnig cyfleoedd i ffermwyr llawn amser, ac efallai i fwy nag un genhedlaeth o ffermwyr llawn amser. Nid yw TAN 6 wedi ei ddiwygio i adlewyrchu realiti ffermio yn y ganrif hon. Mae'n bwysig ein bod, yn nhrefodaethau gyda Jane Davidson, yn gwneud TAN 6 yn fwy perthnasol i'r math o amaethyddiaeth sy'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd, a'r hyn yr ydym eisiau ei gyflawni o ran dyfodol ein ffermwyr ifainc, er mwyn caniatáu iddynt fyw a gweithio yng nghefn gwlad.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** I welcome the Minister's statement. As a farmer with two young children whom I hope will go into farming, I am very aware that the average age of someone in the agricultural industry at present is 58.

I agree that Farming Connect is a critical plank in delivering expertise. However, sadly, in the Farming Connect that we used to know, once the capital side had run out, it became a consultants' paradise, and a lot of information that was already out there for businesses was just being repeated to the benefit of the consultants' salary. If the industry is to have faith in the advice that receives, then it must be able to back up that advice by being able to go to the

**Elin Jones:** Thank you for those comments, Nerys. In terms of developing the skills of young farmers and links with further education colleges that specialise in rural studies and agriculture, that work will be most important as we nurture young farmers for the future. The manager of Lantra in Wales is a member of the task and finish group which I have established for this purpose.

In terms of rural housing, as I said in my statement and in my replies to questions, this is currently an obstacle to some of the succession that is required in the agricultural industry between the owner or senior members of the family running the business and the younger members of the family who are interested in taking over the business.

TAN 6 in its present form has been in force for several years, and perhaps it was more relevant at a time when the agricultural industry was a different kind of industry, providing opportunities for full-time farmers, and perhaps to more than one generation of full-time farmers. TAN 6 has not been revised to reflect the reality of farming in this century. It is important, in discussions with Jane Davidson, that we make TAN 6 more relevant to current agricultural practices and what we are trying to achieve in terms of the future of our young farmers, to enable them to live and work in rural areas.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Croesawaf ddatganiad y Gweinidog. Fel ffermwr gyda dau blentyn ifanc a fydd, gobeithio, yn mynd i mewn i ffermio, yr wyf yn ymwybodol iawn mai oed cyfartalog rhywun yn y diwydiant amaethyddol ar hyn o bryd yw 58.

Cytunaf fod Cyswllt Ffermio yn fodd hanfodol i ddarparu arbenigedd. Er hynny, gwaetha'r modd, yn y Cyswllt Ffermio a oedd yn gyfarwydd inni gynt, wedi i'r ochr gyfalaf ddod i ben daeth yn baradwys i ymgynghorwyr, a'r cwbl a ddigwyddai oedd bod llawer o wybodaeth a oedd ar gael eisoes i fusnesau yn cael ei hailadrodd gan ychwanegu at gyflog yr ymgynghorwyr. Os yw'r diwydiant i ymddiried yn y cyngor a gaiff, rhaid iddo allu ategu'r cyngor hwnnw

marketplace. The £2 million that the Government has set aside from 2010 is a large sum taken individually, but, for a whole industry, it is limited, given the capital spend that you aspire for that money, as well as the interest rate subsidy by means of which you are looking for that money to be used. Does the Minister have any confidence that, from the start base of £2 million, the money might grow into a more meaningful sum for the industry as a whole?

We have heard many comments today about rural housing with which I would concur. A constituent of mine has an appeal on a TAN 6 issue; he has been trying for five years. This is a young farmer who feels demoralised because he cannot live at his place of work, and he needs to live there because he needs to manage livestock on that holding. He is selling to the modern marketplace, and the welfare standards that many supermarkets now require of their farmer suppliers require high levels of stockmanship. Unfortunately, many local authorities fail to recognise the change in the marketplace and the demands that farmers have to meet. This obstacle of the stringent interpretation of TAN 6 is also a barrier to enabling young farmers to have the confidence to set down family roots in the industry.

I also draw the Minister's attention to the comments of my colleague, Brynle Williams. The ability to access land is critical for any young entrant. I realise that the competence of this institution would not stretch to tax angles and the tax incentives that estates could have if they were to make land available. However, it would be worthwhile for some sort of forum to be established with our Westminster colleagues to look at the avenues that would stimulate a land bank that young entrants could access to start their farming career. That is where the big incentive will lie. If you go back 40 to 60 years ago, it was the large estates that provided a footstep onto the ladder and allowed many farmers to start to build their careers.

Therefore, this statement is welcome, but, as usual, the proof will lie in the results in three,

drwy allu troi at y farchnad. Mae'r swm o £2 filiwn y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi'i neilltuo o 2010 yn un mawr o'i ystyried ar wahân, ond yng nghyd-destun y diwydiant cyfan mae'n fychan, o gofio'r gwariant cyfalaf yr ydych yn gobeithio'i weld o ganlyniad i'r arian hwnnw, yn ogystal â'r cymhorthdal cyfradd llog yr ydych yn gobeithio gweld defnyddio'r arian hwnnw drwyddo. A yw'r Gweinidog yn ffyddiog o gwbl y gallai'r arian dyfu'n swm mwy ystyrlon ar gyfer y diwydiant cyfan o'i lefel gychwynnol o £2 filiwn?

Clywsom nifer o sylwadau heddiw am dai gwledig y byddwn yn cyd-fynd â hwy. Mae un o'm hetholwyr wedi cyflwyno apêl ar fater yn ymwneud â TAN 6; mae wedi bod yn ymdrechu ers pum mlynedd. Ffermwr ifanc yw hwn sydd wedi digalonni am nad yw'n gallu byw yn ei le gwaith, ac mae arno angen byw yno am fod angen iddo reoli da byw ar y daliad hwnnw. Mae'n gwerthu yn y farchnad gyfoes, ac mae'r safonau lles y mae nifer o uwchfarchnadoedd yn galw amdanynt bellach gan y ffermwyr sy'n eu cyflenwi yn gofyn am lefelau uchel o stocmonaeth. Gwaetha'r modd, mae nifer o awdurdodau lleol yn methu â chydabod y newid yn y farchnad a'r gofynion y mae'n rhaid i ffermwyr eu bodloni. Mae'r rhwystr hwn wrth ddehongli TAN 6 yn gaeth hefyd yn atal ffermwyr ifanc rhag magu digon o hyder i frwr gwreiddiau teuluol yn y diwydiant.

Tynnaf sylw'r Gweinidog hefyd at y sylwadau gan fy nghyd-Aelod, Brynle Williams. Mae gallu cael tir yn hollbwysig i unrhyw newydd-ddyfodiad. Sylweddolaf na fyddai gallu'r sefydliad hwn yn cynnwys agweddau sy'n ymwneud â threth a'r cymhellion treth y gellid eu rhoi i ystadau pe byddent yn cynnig tir. Er hynny, byddai'n fuddiol sefydlu rhyw fath o fforwm gyda'n cymheiriaid yn San Steffan i ystyried y dulliau a fyddai'n ysgogi creu cronfa dir y gallai newydd-ddyfodiaid gael mynediad iddi i ddechrau ffermio. Yn hynny y bydd y cymhelliad mawr. Os ewch yn ôl rhwng 40 a 60 mlynedd, gwelwch mai'r ystadau mawr a fyddai'n cynnig man cychwyn ac yn caniatáu i nifer o ffermwyr ddechrau ar eu gyrfa.

Felly, mae'r datganiad hwn i'w groesawu, ond fel bob amser bydd y dystiolaeth i'w

four or five years' time.

**Elin Jones:** Thank you for that, Andrew. On Farming Connect, I agree that, in relation to the advice that farmers receive on various aspects of their business from the Farming Connect services, farmers must respect the people who are giving them advice, and feel that the advice is of real interest to their business to and offers genuine support. We are currently looking at Farming Connect for the future, and are going through a tendering process in relation to its future delivery. I assure you that the robustness of this scheme and the need to ensure that we have the confidence of the farming industry in the advice and work that we undertake via Farming Connect is important. Otherwise, farmers will have no interest in seeking that advice and that is of no benefit to farmers—or to Government, if it is allocating financial resources for that purpose.

2.20 p.m.

Again, you raised the issue of TAN 6. I am not surprised that many of you have raised this issue this afternoon, because I know, from my own constituency, of the inability to access housing. Many younger people who need to live in the countryside because their work is there are no longer able to afford to do so due to significant house price increases. However, rather than look at a less stringent interpretation of TAN 6, we need to review it and make it more appropriate to meet some of the aspirations that you and I hold for the future of young people in terms of their being able to access housing in the countryside. I alluded in my statement to the fact that I had had discussions with the Minister responsible for planning and her officials on TAN 6, and I hope that we will instigate a public consultation on the future of TAN 6 later this year.

On the UK Treasury and issues relating to taxation and the availability of land, if this is identified as a subject on which this Assembly should engage in discussion with the UK Government, I will not hold back from doing so. I will ensure that my task and finish group looks at that and provides me with advice. In terms of the public

gweld yn y canlyniadau ymhen tair, pedair neu bum mlynedd.

**Elin Jones:** Diolch i chi am hynny, Andrew. Ynghylch Cyswllt Ffermio, yr wyf yn derbyn, mewn cysylltiad â'r cyngor a gaiff ffermwyr ar wahanol agweddau ar eu busnes gan wasanaethau Cyswllt Ffermio, ei bod yn rhaid i ffermwyr barchu'r rhai sy'n eu cynghori, a theimlo bod y cyngor yn wirioneddol berthnasol i'w busnes ac yn cynnig cymorth gwirioneddol. Yr ydym yn edrych ar ddyfodol Cyswllt Ffermio ar hyn o bryd, ac yn mynd drwy broses tendro mewn cysylltiad â'i ddarparu yn y dyfodol. Gallaf eich sicrhau bod cadernid y cynllun hwn a'r angen i sicrhau bod y diwydiant ffermio'n ymddiried yn y cyngor a'r gwaith a wnawn drwy Cyswllt Ffermio yn bwysig. Fel arall, ni fydd gan ffermwyr ddiddordeb mewn ceisio cael y cyngor hwnnw ac nid yw hynny'n fuddiol i ffermwyr—nac i'r Llywodraeth, os yw'n dyrannu arian i'r diben hwnnw.

Unwaith eto, codwyd mater TAN 6. Nid wyf yn synnu bod nifer ohonoch wedi codi'r mater hwn y prynhawn yma, oherwydd gwn, yn fy etholaeth fy hun, am fethu cael tai. Mae nifer o bobl iau sydd ag angen byw yng nghefn gwlad am mai yno y mae eu gwaith bellach yn methu fforddio gwneud hynny oherwydd codiadau mawr ym mhrisiau tai. Fodd bynnag, yn hytrach nag ystyried dehongli TAN 6 yn llai caeth, mae angen inni ei adolygu a'i wneud yn fwy addas i wireddu rhai o'r gobeithion sydd gennych chi a minnau ar gyfer dyfodol pobl ifanc o ran eu gallu i gael tai yng nghefn gwlad. Cyfeiriais yn fy natganiad at y ffaith fy mod wedi cael trafodaethau gyda'r Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am gynllunio a'i swyddogion ynghylch TAN 6, a gobeithio y byddwn yn cychwyn ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus ar ddyfodol TAN 6 yn ddiweddarach eleni.

Ynghylch Trysorlys y DU a materion yn ymwneud â threthiant ac argaeledd tir, os gwelir bod hwn yn bwnc y dylai'r Cynulliad hwn gael trafodaeth arno gyda Llywodraeth y DU, ni fyddaf yn ymatal rhag gwneud hynny. Byddaf yn sicrhau y bydd fy ngrŵp gorchwyl a gorffen yn ystyried hynny ac yn rhoi cyngor i mi. Gyda golwg ar yr ymgynghoriad

consultation, that might well come to the Assembly as a response. I do not wish to raise expectations on any of this, but it is always appropriate for this Assembly and for the Ministers of its Government to look to lobby Westminster on issues of importance to Wales.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch, Weinidog. Yr ydym yn awr yn symud o amser y Llywodraeth i amser y Cynulliad.

cyhoeddus, mae'n ddigon posibl y daw hwnnw o flaen y Cynulliad fel ymateb. Nid wyf yn dymuno codi gobeithion ynghylch unrhyw agwedd ar hyn, ond mae bob amser yn briodol i'r Cynulliad hwn ac i Weinidogion ei Lywodraeth ystyrid lobïo San Steffan ar faterion sydd o bwys i Gymru.

**The Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Minister. We now move from Government time to Assembly time.

### **Cymeradwyo Enwebiad Ombwdsmon Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Cymru Approval of the Nomination of a Public Services Ombudsman for Wales**

**Alun Cairns:** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales nominates Vincent Michael Peter Tyndall for appointment by Her Majesty the Queen to the position of Public Services Ombudsman for Wales in accordance with the Public Services Ombudsman (Wales) Act 2005. (NDM3847)*

I formally call on the Assembly to approve this motion and the nomination of Peter Tyndall for this post. I also take this opportunity to thank Adam Peat for his sterling work in the name of every individual in Wales, in representing them and ensuring that they have received fair play. He has carried out the duties and obligations that have been placed on him and ensured that sound and fair judgments were made. I hope that the Assembly will approve Mr Tyndall's nomination.

**Lorraine Barrett:** It gives me great pleasure to take this opportunity to welcome Peter Tyndall to this role. I remember him as head of the housing department in Cardiff council many years ago, and later with the Welsh Local Government Association. Following that position, he took on the role of the chief executive of the Arts Council of Wales. I have always found him to be fair, firm and someone who listens to people. That will be important in this role. He also has a good sense of humour, which he will need in this new post.

He took on the arts council job at a difficult time and gained the respect of the arts

**Alun Cairns:** Cynigiad fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn enwebu Vincent Michael Peter Tyndall i'w benodi gan Ei Mawrhydi Y Frenhines i swydd Ombwdsmon Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Cymru yn unol â Deddf Ombwdsmon Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus (Cymru) 2005. (NDM3847)*

Galwaf yn ffurfiol ar y Cynulliad i gymeradwyo'r cynnig hwn ac enwebu Peter Tyndall ar gyfer y swydd hon. Achubaf ar y cyfle hwn hefyd i ddiolch i Adam Peat am ei waith rhagorol yn enw pob unigolyn yng Nghymru, wrth eu cynrychioli a sicrhau eu bod wedi cael chwarae teg. Mae wedi cyflawni'r dyletswyddau a'r rhwymedigaethau a osodwyd arno ac wedi sicrhau llunio dyfarniadau da a theg. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd y Cynulliad yn cymeradwyo enwebiad Mr Tyndall.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Hyfrydwch mawr i mi yw achub ar y cyfle hwn i groesawu Peter Tyndall i'r rôl hon. Yr wyf yn ei gofio'n bennaeth yr adran tai yng nghyngor Caerdydd flynyddoedd lawer yn ôl, ac yn ddiweddarach gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru. Yn dilyn y swydd honno, ymgymerodd â rôl prif weithredwr Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru. Yr wyf wedi'i gael bob amser yn deg, yn gadarn ac yn un sy'n gwrandao ar bobl. Bydd hynny'n bwysig yn y rôl hon. Mae ganddo synnwyr digrifwch hefyd, a bydd arno angen hwnnw yn y swydd newydd hon.

Ymgymerodd â'r swydd yng nghyngor y celfyddydau ar adeg anodd, ac enillodd barch

community, which is no mean feat in Wales. He brings a rich experience from both the public and independent sector and I know that he will do an excellent job as the Public Services Ombudsman for Wales; I wish him well.

**Angela Burns:** On behalf of the Welsh Conservative Party, I also take this opportunity to welcome Mr Peter Tyndall to the post and to congratulate him on his nomination. I also, on behalf of the Welsh Conservatives and others in this Chamber, thank Mr Adam Peat for his commitment to the post of Public Services Ombudsman for Wales over the last two years. We wish him well in his retirement. He was appointed in October 2005 and has completed his appointment with dedication and respect for the people of Wales.

**Y Llywydd:** Hoffwn gyplisu fy hun a phob un ohonom yn y diolchgarwch i Adam Peat am ei weithgaredd oherwydd bod swydd Ombwdsmon Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Cymru, yn enwedig yn ei ffurf newydd ac eang, yn swydd o bwys inni i gyd fel Aelodau Cynulliad. Croesawaf Peter Tyndall, sydd wedi bod yn gyfaill da i bob un ohonom, yn enwedig ym maes y celfyddydau. Mae'n bleser mawr gennyf gyfleu i'w Mawrhydi'r Frenhines enw Peter Tyndall er mwyn cwblhau'r penodiad yn briodol.

**Jenny Randerson:** I am sorry, Presiding Officer, but I would like the opportunity to say something.

**The Presiding Officer:** Yes, of course. I wish that I had been notified.

**Jenny Randerson:** I am sorry if an error has occurred.

I wished to speak as I have worked with both Peter Tyndall and with his predecessor, Adam Peat, and I congratulate Peter on his nomination for this important job. Adam Peat was the senior civil servant in my department when I was a Minister and Peter Tyndall was appointed as chief executive of the Arts Council of Wales under my watch. It is worth noting that he took over at the arts council at a time of crisis, as Lorraine said. He faced a

pobl sydd ym myd y celfyddydau, ac mae hynny'n gryn gamp yng Nghymru. Mae ganddo brofiad helaeth o'r sector cyhoeddus a'r sector annibynnol, a gwn y bydd yn gwneud gwaith ardderchog fel Ombwdsmon Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Cymru; dymunaf yn dda iddo.

**Angela Burns:** Ar ran Plaid Geidwadol Cymru, achubaf finnau ar y cyfle hwn i groesawu Mr Peter Tyndall i'r swydd a'i longyfarch ar ei enwebiad. Yr wyf hefyd, ar ran y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig ac eraill yn y Siambr hon, yn diolch i Mr Adam Peat am ei ymroddiad i swydd Ombwdsmon Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Cymru dros y ddwy flynedd diwethaf. Dymunwn yn dda iddo ar ôl ymddeol. Fe'i penodwyd yn Hydref 2005 ac mae wedi cwblhau tymor ei swydd gydag ymroddiad a pharch at bobl Cymru.

**The Presiding Officer:** I wish to associate myself and all of us in our gratitude to Adam Peat for his work since the office of Public Services Ombudsman for Wales, particularly in its new and broader form, is an important post for us all as Assembly Members. I welcome Peter Tyndall, who has been a good friend to all of us, particularly in the arts world. It gives me great pleasure to convey Peter Tyndall's name to Her Majesty the Queen in order to complete the appointment appropriately.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Lywydd, ond hoffwn gael cyfle i ddweud gair.

**Y Llywydd:** Ie, wrth gwrs. Byddai'n dda gennyf pe baen wedi cawl gwybod.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf os bu amryfusedd.

Yr oeddwn yn dymuno siarad gan fy mod wedi gweithio gyda Peter Tyndall a chyda'i ragflaenydd, Adam Peat, a llongyfarchaf Peter ar ei enwebu ar gyfer y swydd bwysig hon. Adam Peat oedd yr uwch was sifil yn fy adran pan oeddwn yn Weinidog, a phenodwyd Peter Tyndall yn brif weithredwr Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru yn ystod fy nghyfnod yn y swydd. Mae'n werth nodi iddo gymryd yr awenau yng nghyngor y

tight budget settlement and a situation requiring significant reform and reorganisation, and I cannot speak highly enough of the quietly effective way in which he undertook that work. I therefore have no doubt that he is the right person to succeed Adam Peat, whom I believe has been a strong and effective but measured champion of the rights of individuals in our society and to whom we in the Assembly and people throughout Welsh society owe a huge debt of gratitude in his setting the highest standards of probity and impartiality in the important role that he undertook.

celfyddydau ar adeg o argyfwng, fel y dywedodd Lorraine. Wynebai setliad cyllideb tynn a sefyllfa a alwai am ddiwygio ac ad-drefnu sylweddol, ac ni allaf ganmol ddigon y modd tawel, effeithiol yr ymgwymerodd â'r gwaith hwnnw. Yr wyf yn berffaith sicr, felly, mai ef yw'r dyn iawn i olynu Adam Peat. Credaf iddo yntau fod yn eiriolwr cadarn ac effeithiol, ond pwylllog, dros hawliau unigolion yn ein cymdeithas, ac y mae arnom ni yn y Cynulliad a phobl ym mhob rhan o gymdeithas yng Nghymru, ddyled aruthrol iddo am osod y safonau uchaf o ran uniondeb a didueddrwydd yn y rôl bwysig yr ymgwymerodd â hi.

### **Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu ar Gynllunio Rheilffyrdd y Dyfodol The Enterprise and Learning Committee's Report on Planning for Future Rail Provision**

**Y Llywydd:** Hon yw'r ddadl gyntaf inni ei chael yn y modd hwn ar adroddiad pwyllgor. Byddwn yn dilyn y drefn hon: galwaf ar Gadeirydd y pwyllgor, ac yna'r Gweinidog cyfrifol, sef y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth. Wedyn, bydd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn ateb y ddadl ac, yna, bydd y Cadeirydd, o leiaf am heddiw, yn cael y gair olaf. Yn ôl â'r pwerau a osodwyd i mi yn ôl Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.19(iii), ni ddetholwyd y gwelliannau.

**The Presiding Officer:** This is the first debate of its kind on a committee report. The order will be as follows: I will call upon the committee Chair, and then the Minister with responsibility, namely the Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport. Then, the Deputy First Minister will respond to the debate, and then the Chair, for today at least, will have the last word. In accordance with the powers conferred on me in Standing Order No. 7.19(iii), the amendments have not been selected.

**Gareth Jones:** Cynigiaf fod

**Gareth Jones:** I propose that

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*the National Assembly for Wales notes:*

1. yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu, 'Cynllunio Rheilffyrdd y Dyfodol', a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 21 Tachwedd; a

1. the report of the Enterprise and Learning Committee on 'Planning for future railway provision' laid in the Table Office on 21 November; and

2. yn nodi ymateb y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth i'r adroddiad, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 15 Ionawr. (NDM3846)

2. the response of the Deputy First Minister and Minister for Economy and Transport to the report, laid in the Table Office on 15 January. (NDM3846)

Mae'n bleser ac yn ffrind i mi fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu gyflwyno'r cynnig sydd yn gofyn i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol nodi adroddiad y pwyllgor, 'Cynllunio Rheilffyrdd y Dyfodol' ac ymateb y

It is a pleasure and a privilege for me as Chair of the Enterprise and Learning Committee to propose the motion asking the National Assembly to note the committee's report, 'Planning for Future Railway

Gweinidog iddo, ar ddechrau'r ddadl gyntaf ar adroddiad pwyllgor craffu yn y trydydd Cynulliad.

Ym mis Gorffennaf y llynedd, cyhoeddodd Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig Bapur Gwyn ar ddarparu rheilffyrdd cynaliadwy. Ar yr un pryd, cyhoeddwyd asesiad yr Adran Drafnidiaeth a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o anghenion cynllunio rheilffyrdd Cymru am yr 20 mlynedd nesaf. O gofio arwyddocâd hirdymor y dogfennau hyn i deithwyr, penderfynodd y pwyllgor ymgymryd ag ymchwiliad byr ar unwaith. Gwelsom fod cyfle i ddylanwadu ar gynlluniau ar gyfer rheilffyrdd y dyfodol, y modd yr ariennir gwelliannau, a phryd y gellid eu disgwyl.

Bu i'r pwyllgor gymryd tystiolaeth gan randdeiliaid allweddol ym mis Medi a mis Hydref y llynedd. Diolchaf yn arbennig i'r rhai a ddaeth i'n cyfarfodydd ac a gyflwynodd dystiolaeth ysgrifenedig, ac yn arbennig i'r Adran Drafnidiaeth am newid ei meddwl, ar ôl cyflwyno tystiolaeth ysgrifenedig yn unig ym mis Medi, i ddod i roi tystiolaeth ar lafar ym mis Hydref. Bu cyfraniad y tystion o gymorth i ni gael gorolwg strategol o gyflwr ein rheilffyrdd a'r her o ddiwallu disgwyliadau y nifer cynyddol sy'n teithio ar ein trenau ar ddechrau'r unfed ganrif ar hugain.

Gosododd y pwyllgor ei adroddiad gerbron y Cynulliad ar 21 Tachwedd. Mae'n adroddiad byr i gyd-fynd â natur ein hymchwiliad, ond y mae'r 10 argymhelliad sydd ynddo yn greiddiol i ddyfodol ein rheilffyrdd yn unol â'r weledigaeth a gyflwynwyd i ni, ein profiadau personol fel teithwyr a phrofiadau ein hetholwyr.

2.30 p.m.

I will now present the committee's recommendations, referring to the Minister's responses as I do so. All Assembly Members are aware that the growth in passenger demand in Wales, and particularly in Cardiff and the Valleys, has exceeded forecasts in recent years. The committee was told that this trend was likely to continue. We were,

'Provision' and the Minister's response to it, at the beginning of the first debate on a scrutiny committee report in the third Assembly.

Last July, the UK Government published a White Paper on the provision of sustainable railways. Concurrently, the assessment by Department for Transport and the Welsh Assembly Government of the planning requirements for railways in Wales for the next 20 years was published. Bearing in mind the long-term significance of these documents to passengers, the committee decided to undertake a brief review immediately. We saw an opportunity to influence plans for the railways of the future, the way in which improvements will be funded, and when they might be expected.

The committee took evidence from key stakeholders in September and October last year. I give particular thanks to those who came to our meetings and submitted written evidence, and in particular to the Department for Transport for changing its mind, after submitting only written evidence in September, to come and give oral evidence in October. The witnesses' contributions were helpful in providing us with a strategic overview of the state of our railways, and the challenge of meeting the expectations of the increasing number of passengers who use our trains at the beginning of the twenty-first century.

The committee laid its report before the Assembly on 21 November. It is a brief report, which suits the nature of our review. But the 10 recommendations contained in it are crucial to the future of our railways in line with the vision presented to us, our personal experiences and the experiences of our constituents.

Cyflwynaf yn awr argymhellion y pwyllgor, gan gyfeirio at ymatebion y Gweinidog wrth imi wneud hynny. Mae holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn ymwybodol fod y twf yn y galw gan deithwyr yng Nghymru, ac yn enwedig yng Nghaerdydd a'r Cymoedd, wedi bod yn fwy na'r rhagolygon yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Dywedwyd wrth y pwyllgor fod y



therefore, concerned that the Department for Transport's high-level output specification and the Wales rail planning assessment, prepared jointly by the Department for Transport and the Welsh Assembly Government, did not accord, even taking into account the different time periods covered. We strongly believe that the growth in passenger demand is likely to exceed the levels used by the DfT and may even exceed those used in the Wales rail planning assessment. I am glad that the Minister has stated in his response that the One Wales Government will plan for growth on the basis of demand assumptions contained within this latter assessment and will track annual changes in demand, but we await the publication of the Wales route utilisation strategy to determine whether his department is ensuring that the provision of capacity is responding appropriately to the market.

I have already referred to the significance of Wales's capital with regard to future rail provision. The need to remove the constraint between Cogan junction and Cardiff Queen Street north junction will be key to meeting increased demand. Again, the HLOS may be found wanting, as the Department for Transport made it clear that the funding that it will provide will be limited to £20 million, while the total cost could be as high as £50 million. The committee has received assurance from the Minister that the One Wales Government will be able to fund the capital cost of improving the infrastructure over and above the £20 million from the DfT, but I would be grateful if he would restate his commitment today.

On the issue of new rolling stock, the committee was particularly concerned to learn that none of the additional 300 carriages to be provided by the DfT will come to Wales, especially as Wales has some of the oldest trains. We realise, of course, that, under the Railways Act 2005, the One Wales Government is responsible for funding additional rolling stock to increase capacity on Arriva Trains Wales services. Rolling

duedd hon yn debygol o barhau. Yr oeddem yn bryderus, felly, nad oedd y fanyleb allbwn lefel uchel gan yr Adran Drafnidiaeth ac asesiad cynllunio rheilffyrdd Cymru, a baratowyd ar y cyd gan yr Adran Drafnidiaeth a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, yn cyd-daro, hyd yn oed o ystyried y gwahanol gyfnodau dan sylw. Credwn yn gryf fod y twf yn y galw gan deithwyr yn debygol o fod yn uwch na'r lefelau a ddefnyddiwyd gan yr Adran Drafnidiaeth, ac y byddant hwyrach yn fwy hyd yn oed na'r rheini a ddefnyddiwyd yn asesiad cynllunio rheilffyrdd Cymru. Yr wyf yn falch fod y Gweinidog wedi nodi yn ei ymateb y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un yn cynllunio ar gyfer twf ar sail y tybiaethau galw sydd yn yr asesiad diweddaraf hwn, ac y bydd yn olrhain y newidiadau blynyddol yn y galw. Ond yr ydym yn disgwyl cyhoeddi strategaeth defnyddio llwybrau Cymru er mwyn penderfynu a yw'r adran hon yn sicrhau bod y ddarpariaeth o ran capasiti yn ymateb yn briodol i'r farchnad.

Yr wyf eisoes wedi cyfeirio at bwysigrwydd prifddinas Cymru o safbwynt darparu rheilffyrdd yn y dyfodol. Bydd yr angen i ddileu'r cyfyngiad rhwng cyffordd Cogan a chyffordd gogledd Heol y Frenhines Caerdydd yn allweddol i fodloni'r galw cynyddol. Unwaith eto, mae'n bosibl na fydd y fanyleb allbwn lefel uchel yn ddigon, oherwydd i'r Adran Drafnidiaeth ddweud yn glir y bydd y cyllid y bydd yn ei ddarparu'n cael ei gyfyngu i £20 miliwn, er y gallai cyfanswm y costau fod mor uchel â £50 miliwn. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi sicrhau'r pwyllgor y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un yn gallu ariannu'r gost gyfalaf o wella'r seilwaith yn ychwanegol at yr £20 miliwn gan yr Adran Drafnidiaeth, ond byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe byddai'n ailddatgan ei ymrwymiad heddiw.

O safbwynt cerbydau newydd, yr oedd y pwyllgor yn arbennig o bryderus o ddeall na fydd dim un o'r 300 o gerbydau ychwanegol a ddarperir gan yr Adran Drafnidiaeth yn dod i Gymru, yn enwedig gan fod yng Nghymru rai o'r trenau hynaf. Sylweddolwn, wrth gwrs, fod Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un, dan Ddeddf Rheilffyrdd 2005, yn gyfrifol am ariannu cerbydau ychwanegol i gynyddu'r capasiti ar wasanaethau Trenau Arriva

stock is in short supply, so, clearly, a rolling stock plan for Wales is required if passenger expectations are to be met and increased capacity delivered. The committee looks to the Minister to explain, as soon as possible, where the additional capacity will be deployed to meet demand and how rolling stock procurement plans are to be co-ordinated with England. A number of Members felt strongly that not enough was being done to encourage a modal shift of freight from road to rail. We learned of a possible conflict between the use of the network for freight traffic and passenger services, and very much hope that this does not undermine future developments. Perhaps the Minister would wish to explain how he will continue to promote state aid approved grant schemes to encourage the greater movement of freight by rail rather than road.

We were concerned to learn that funding for the regional transport consortia had been reduced, at the very time that they are being asked to prepare regional transport plans and take on enhanced responsibilities. We believe that this is wrong and we are disappointed that the Minister has given no firm commitment to restore funding levels, given their increased responsibilities. We urge him to reconsider and to make such a commitment as soon as possible. Members of the committee will no doubt wish to expand on issues such as car parking at stations, rail and bus integration and the overall perception of the quality of stations, as these issues most closely affect their constituents.

We were made aware of the importance of the wider social and community benefits of the rail network and the need to meet the aspirations of the people of Wales in creating vibrant, confident communities during our consideration of the petition to reopen Carno railway station, which fortunately coincided with this inquiry. This inquiry was not, however, an opportunity for Members to highlight particular difficulties in their areas—though some took the opportunity to mention them in the presence of key witnesses; rather, it was a chance for the

Cymru. Mae cerbydau'n brin, felly, mae'n amlwg fod angen cynllun cerbydau ar gyfer Cymru os ydym i fodloni disgwyliadau teithwyr a sicrhau capasiti cynyddol. Mae'r pwyllgor yn troi at y Gweinidog iddo esbonio, cyn gynted â phosibl, ble y caiff y capasiti ychwanegol ei ddefnyddio i fodloni'r galw a sut y caiff cynlluniau caffael cerbydau eu cydlynu â Lloegr. Teimlai nifer o Aelodau'n gryf nad oedd digon yn cael ei wneud i hybu newid yn y modd o gludo nwyddau o'r ffyrdd i'r rheilffyrdd. Clywsom am wrthdaro posibl rhwng defnyddio'r rhwydwaith ar gyfer gwasanaethau i deithwyr a thraffig cludo nwyddau, a gobeithiwn yn fawr iawn na fydd hyn yn tansilio datblygiadau'r dyfodol. Efallai yr hoffai'r Gweinidog esbonio sut y bydd yn parhau i hybu cynlluniau grant cymeradwy o safbwynt cymorth y wladwriaeth i annog cludo rhagor o nwyddau ar y rheilffyrdd yn hytrach nag ar y ffyrdd.

Yr oeddem yn bryderus pan glywsom fod y cyllid ar gyfer y consortia trafniadaeth rhanbarthol wedi'i leihau, ar yr union adeg pan ofynnir iddynt baratoi cynlluniau trafniadaeth rhanbarthol ac ysgwyddo cyfrifoldebau cynyddol. Credwn fod hyn yn anghyfiawn, ac yr ydym yn siomedig na roddodd y Gweinidog ddim ymrwymiad cadarn i adfer y lefelau cyllid, o gofio'u cyfrifoldebau cynyddol. Anogwn ef i ailystyried a gwneud ymrwymiad felly cyn gynted â phosibl. Bydd Aelodau'r pwyllgor heb os yn dymuno ymhelaethu ar faterion megis lleoedd parcio ceir mewn gorsafoedd, integreiddio rheilffyrdd a bysiau, a'r canfyddiad cyffredinol am ansawdd gorsafoedd, oherwydd mae'r materion hyn yn effeithio'n agos iawn ar eu hetholwyr.

Daethom yn ymwybodol o bwysigrwydd manteision cymdeithasol a chymunedol ehangach y rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd ac o'r angen i fodloni dyheadau pobl Cymru a chreu cymunedau bywiog, hyderus, wrth inni ystyried y ddeiseb i ailagor gorsaf reilffordd Carno, deiseb a oedd yn ffodus yn cyd-daro â'r ymchwiliad hwn. Nid oedd yr ymchwiliad hwn, fodd bynnag, yn gyfle i Aelodau dynnu sylw at anawsterau penodol yn eu hardaloedd—er i rai achub ar y cyfle i'w crybwyll ym mhresenoldeb tystion allweddol; yn hytrach, yr oedd yn gyfle i'r pwyllgor

committee to think strategically about the future of our railways and for us to present our conclusions and recommendations to the Minister and the Assembly.

Wedi crynhoi prif gynnwys ein hadroddiad a chyfeirio at ymateb y Gweinidog, edrychaf ymlaen at wrando ar y Gweinidog yn cyflwyno ei ymateb i'n hargymhellion. Fel pwyllgor, byddwn yn parhau i fonitro gweithredu'r argymhellion dros y blynyddoedd nesaf ac, o dro i dro, byddwn yn craffu ar y Gweinidog o ran sut mae'r rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd yn datblygu ac yn darparu ar gyfer teithwyr. Edrychaf ymlaen hefyd at gyfraniadau aelodau'r pwyllgor ac eraill i'r ddadl hon. Mae'n dda gennyf ddweud i'r adroddiad gael cefnogaeth drawsbleidiol, unfrydol yn y pwyllgor.

Yn olaf, talaf deyrnged i swyddogion y pwyllgor am eu gwaith o reoli a threfnu ein hymchwiliad a chyhoeddi a gosod yr adroddiad mor fuan ar ddechrau'r trydydd Cynulliad. Diolchaf yn arbennig i staff gwasanaeth ymchwil yr Aelodau am ein cynorthwyo i ddeall maes technegol a chymhleth.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Diolchaf, yn y lle cyntaf, i'r pwyllgor, o dan gadeiryddiaeth Gareth Jones, am ei adroddiad ar gynllunio siâp y rhwydwaith rheilffordd i'r dyfodol ac am y cyfle i ymateb iddo. Ers datganoli, ac wedi inni gael pwerau ychwanegol yn y maes hwn, yr ydym, fel y dywedodd Gareth, mewn sefyllfa well i baratoi ein gweledigaeth ein hunain o'r math o rwydwaith trafndiaeth yr ydym eisiau ei weld yng Nghymru.

Mae'r Llywodraeth eisoes yn gweithio mewn partneriaeth agos gyda Network Rail, y gweithredwyr gwasanaethau a'r pedwar consortiwm trafndiaeth rhanbarthol er mwyn sicrhau bod addewidion 'Cymru'n Un' yn cael eu gwredden. Hoffwn gymryd y cyfle i ddweud y byddwn yn cyhoeddi diwygiad y strategaeth drafndiaeth yn y dyfodol agos ac, wrth gwrs, bydd hwnnw yn llywio'r penderfyniadau y byddwn yn eu gwneud ynglŷn â'r cyfeiriad y byddwn yn teithio iddo yn y dyfodol, mewn modd sy'n gweddu i anghenion arbennig pobl Cymru.

feddwl yn strategol am ddyfodol ein rheilffyrdd ac inni gyflwyno ein casgliadau a'n hargymhellion gerbron y Gweinidog a'r Cynulliad.

Having summarised the main parts of our report and referred to the Minister's reply, I look forward to hearing the Minister present his reply to our recommendations. As a committee, we will continue to monitor the implementation of the recommendations over the coming years and, from time to time, we will scrutinise the Minister in terms of how the railway network develops and provides for travellers. I also look forward to the contributions of committee members and others to this debate. I am pleased to say that the report was given unanimous, cross-party support in committee.

Finally, I pay tribute to the committee officials for their work in managing and organising our review and in publishing and laying the report so soon at the beginning of the third Assembly. I thank especially the staff of the Members' research service for assisting us in understanding what was a complex, technical issue.

**The Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** In the first place, I thank the committee, under the chairmanship of Gareth Jones, for its report on planning the shape of the rail network for the future, and for the opportunity to respond. Since devolution, and since we gained additional powers in this field, we are, as Gareth said, in a better position to prepare our own vision of the kind of transport network we wish to see in Wales.

The Government is already working in close partnership with Network Rail, the train operators and the four regional transport consortia to ensure that the promises in 'One Wales' are realised. I wish to take this opportunity to say that in the near future we will be publishing the revised transport strategy and that that will, of course, guide our decisions on the direction of travel for the future, in a way which meets the needs of the people of Wales.

Fel y dywedodd y Cadeirydd, yr wyf wedi paratoi ymateb manwl i argymhellion y pwyllgor. Yr wyf am gyfeirio at rai o'r prif argymhellion yn awr, gan adael y gweddill tan y byddaf yn ymateb i'r ddadl.

As the Chair has said, I have prepared a detailed response to the committee's recommendations. I will refer to some of the main recommendations now, and leave the remainder until I respond to the debate.

Mae'r pwyllgor, fel y dywedodd Gareth, wedi pwysleisio pwysigrwydd cynllunio ar gyfer y cynnydd yn y galw i deithio ar drenau yn y dyfodol. Yr ydym oll yn ymwybodol bod y galw hwnnw wedi codi'n sylweddol, nid yn unig yng Nghymru, ond yng ngweddill gwledydd Prydain hefyd. Felly, yr ydym eisiau edrych yn ofalus ar y rhagolwg o'r galw yn y dyfodol. Mae llawer o broblemau ynghlwm wrth hynny. Cyfeiriodd Gareth at y gwahaniaeth rhwng y ffigurau sy'n dod o'r Adran Drafnidiaeth yn Llundain ac asesiad cynllunio rheilffyrdd Cymru sydd, yn fy marn i, yn llawer mwy realistig ynglŷn â'r cynnydd tebygol yn y galw.

As Gareth stated, the committee has emphasised the importance of planning for future increases in demand for rail travel. We all know that that demand has increased significantly, not only in Wales, but also in the rest of Britain. Therefore, we want to look carefully at the forecast of future demand. There are many problems associated with that. Gareth referred to the differences between the figures coming out of the Department for Transport in London and the Welsh rail planning assessment, which is, in my opinion, much more realistic in terms of the likely increase in demand.

Ein bwriad yw sicrhau bod digon o gerbydau ar gael i ddiwallu'r galw yr ydym yn ei ragweld hyd at 2014. Byddwn yn defnyddio technegau modelu asesu galw i gywiro'r rhagolygon hynny wrth inni fynd yn ein blaenau. Gobeithiaf fod hynny'n rhywbeth y bydd y pwyllgor yn ei groesawu. Bydd gennym gyfle i asesu hynny yn weddol rheolaidd.

It is our intention to ensure that sufficient carriages are available to meet the demand which we forecast up to 2014. We will use demand assessment model techniques to refine those forecasts as we go forward. I hope that that is something the committee will welcome. We will have fairly regular opportunities to assess that.

2.40 p.m.

Yr wyf yn siŵr bod y pwyllgor yn cofio i'r Llywodraeth gadarnhau yn y cyfarfod ar 14 Tachwedd ein bod yn hyderus o fod mewn sefyllfa i ddarparu mwy na'r £20 miliwn a gyhoeddwyd gan Ruth Kelly ar gyfer y gwaith sydd ei angen yng ngorsaf Stryd y Frenhines Caerdydd ac ar gyffordd Cogan a chyffordd y gogledd. Gobeithiwn fod mewn sefyllfa i ddarparu mwy na £20 miliwn o gyllid. Yr hyn y gallaf ei ddweud ar hyn o bryd yw ein bod hefyd yn edrych ar yr ateb peirianyddol cywir i oresgyn y problemau sydd yno, er nad yw'r penderfyniad, wrth gwrs, wedi ei wneud eto ynglŷn â sut y bydd hynny'n digwydd.

I am sure the committee will recall that the Government confirmed at the meeting on 14 November that we are confident of being in a position to provide more than the £20 million announced by Ruth Kelly for the work necessary at Cardiff Queen Street station and at the Cogan junction and north junction. We hope to be in a position to provide more than £20 million in funding. What I can say at the moment is that we are also looking at the correct engineering solution to solve the problems there, although the decision as to how that will be done has not yet been made, of course.

Credaf fod y pwyllgor yn argymhell y dylem gyhoeddi cynllun cerbydau ar gyfer Cymru, ochr yn ochr â chynllun Adran Drafnidiaeth y Deyrnas Gyfunol. Mae cytundeb 'Cymru'n

I believe the committee recommends that we should publish a carriage plan for Wales, alongside the plan by the United Kingdom Department for Transport. 'One Wales'

Un' yn gwneud addewid clir ar gyfer trenau a gwasanaethau newydd ac, wrth gwrs, mae'r gyllideb yn cynnwys £56 miliwn yn 2010-11 ar gyfer prynu cerbydau ychwanegol. Yn ystod 2008, bydd fy adran yn edrych ar opsiynau gwahanol o ran sut y gallwn ddefnyddio'r cerbydau presennol ar y gwasanaethau a redir gan Trenau Arriva Cymru.

Mae gennyf gydymdeimlad, fel yr wyf yn siŵr y gŵyr y pwyllgor, â'r galw i symud cludiant nwyddau o'r ffyrdd i'r rheilffyrdd. Wrth gwrs, byddai hynny'n cynorthwyo'r galw sydd arnom fel Llywodraeth, ac fel Cynulliad, o ran cynaliadwyedd. Dyna yw prif fyrdwn y neges yn y strategaeth ddrafft ar gludo nwyddau sydd wedi cael ei chyhoeddi. Gobeithiaf y cawn glywed barn pobl fel rhan o'r ymgynghoriad ar y strategaeth honno.

Clywais yr hyn a ddywedodd y pwyllgor ynglŷn â chyllido'r consortia trafniadaeth rhanbarthol oherwydd eu cyfrifoldebau ychwanegol. Yn anffodus, nid wyf yn gallu gwneud yr addewid hwnnw i'r pwyllgor nac i'r Cynulliad heddiw, ond gallaf eich sicrhau y byddaf yn parhau i weithio â'r consortia gan ystyried yr hyn a ddywedant sydd wedi'i ychwanegu at eu cyfrifoldebau a thystiolaeth arall ynglŷn â'u pwysau gwaith.

Mae'r Llywodraeth yn mynd i gyhoeddi blaenraglen prosiectau buddsoddi cyfalaf unwaith y bydd yr astudiaeth gan Network Rail yr oedd Gareth yn sôn amdani wedi cael ei chwblhau. Bydd y flaenraglen honno wedi'i sylfaenu ar dystiolaeth ynglŷn â'r galw a blaenoriaethau'r consortia rhanbarthol, unwaith y cyhoeddir y cynlluniau hynny.

Mae un pwynt yr wyf am ei wneud cyn cloi'r rhan hon o'r drafodaeth. Cytunaf yn llwyr â'r pwyllgor bod yn rhaid inni wneud defnydd llawn o'r arian strwythurol newydd o dan y rhaglenni cydgyfeirio. Mae arian eithaf sylweddol ar gael i sicrhau ein bod yn edrych ar brosiectau trafniadaeth gynaliadwy. Edrychaf ymlaen at y drafodaeth.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** I thank the Chair and the committee for bringing the report to the Chamber and thank the Deputy First Minister

makes a clear promise on new trains and services and, of course, the budget includes £56 million in 2010-11 for the purchase of additional carriages. During 2008, my department will look at the different options in terms of how we can utilise the carriages we currently have on the services run by Arriva Trains Wales.

I do sympathise, as I am sure the committee knows, with the demand to move freight from road to rail. That would, of course, assist with demand made of us as a Government, and as an Assembly, in terms of sustainability. That is the main thrust of the message in the draft strategy which has been published on freight. I hope we will hear people's opinion as part of the consultation on that strategy.

I heard what the committee had to say about funding the regional transport consortia because of their additional responsibilities. Unfortunately, I cannot give the committee or the Assembly that promise today, but I can assure you that I will continue to work with the consortia and consider what they say has been added to their responsibilities, along with other evidence on their workload.

The Government is to publish a capital investment project forward programme as soon as the Network Rail study to which Gareth referred has been completed. That forward programme will be based on evidence of the demand and on the priorities of regional consortia, once those plans have been published.

There is one point which I wish to make before ending this part of the debate. I fully agree with the committee that we must make full use of the new structural funds under the convergence programmes. Quite a substantial sum of money is available to ensure that we look at sustainable transport programmes. I look forward to the debate.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Diolchaf i'r Cadeirydd a'r pwyllgor am ddod â'r adroddiad i'r Siambr, a diolchaf i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog

for responding to it. Train transport is one of the great growth areas in transport that we have seen over the last few years. The use of all modes of transport has increased due to the increase in people's wealth and disposable income, because one thing that people choose to do when they have money in their pockets is travel around. We must make sure, as was said in the evidence sessions, that there is enough capacity in the rail network in Wales to deliver on the aspiration of the customer—the travelling passenger. There was a clear concern among committee members and the witnesses about the Welsh Assembly Government's ability to meet that demand going forward, especially as it came to light that we in Wales would not be benefiting from the 1,300 carriages that are being provided for England. The draft report says '300 carriages', but I am sure that the evidence was of 1,300 carriages.

We clearly need that strategy, and the Welsh Conservatives would like to see the Government engage with this as a matter of urgency. I have heard the Minister's comments today, and I take heart from them, but when taking the evidence in committee, we heard that the market as regards rolling stock is such that even if the money was available, and there was an aspiration to purchase, there is only limited manufacturing capacity to provide that rolling stock. If people do not have a good journey because they are travelling in old, antiquated rolling stock, then they will not make use of the railways. We are therefore concerned about the capacity to cope with the growing numbers of people who wish to use rail as their preferred mode of transport.

We are also concerned about the move from road freight to rail freight. That is a critical plank, we would suggest, but given the limited network in Wales, it will not benefit every part of the country. However, we should not limit our aspirations in trying to work with business and the public sector to deliver an alternative where it is possible for freight to be transferred from road to rail. We welcome the Government's engagement with business on this, but we understand that the resources to make this a reality are limited at the moment.

am ymateb iddo. Mae trafniadaeth trenau yn un o'r meysydd twf mawr a welsom dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf ym maes trafniadaeth. Mae defnyddio pob math o drafnidiaeth wedi cynyddu oherwydd y cynnydd yng nghyfoeth ac incwm gwario pobl, oherwydd un peth y mae pobl yn dewis ei wneud pan fydd ganddynt arian yn eu pocedi yw crwydro. Rhaid inni sicrhau, fel y dywedwyd yn y sesiynau tystiolaeth, fod digon o leoedd yn y rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru i gyflawni yn unol â dyheadau'r cwsmer—y teithiwr. Yr oedd pryder amlwg ymysg aelodau'r pwyllgor a'r tystion am allu Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i fodloni'r galw hwnnw wrth fynd ymlaen, yn enwedig oherwydd iddi ddod i'r amlwg na fyddem ni yng Nghymru yn elwa o'r 1,300 o gerbydau a ddarperir i Loegr. Dywed yr adroddiad drafft '300 o gerbydau', ond yr wyf yn sicr mai 1,300 o gerbydau oedd yn y dystiolaeth.

Mae'n amlwg fod arnom angen y strategaeth honno, a hoffai Ceidwadwyr Cymru weld y Llywodraeth yn ymgymryd â hyn ar fyrder. Yr wyf wedi clywed sylwadau'r Gweinidog heddiw, ac maent yn galonogol. Ond pan oeddem yn cymryd y dystiolaeth yn y pwyllgor, clywsom fod cyflwr y farchnad cerbydau trên yn golygu, hyd yn oed pe byddai'r arian ar gael a bod awydd i brynu, fod y capasiti gweithgynhyrchu i ddarparu'r cerbydau hynny yn gyfyngedig. Os na fydd pobl yn cael taith dda oherwydd eu bod yn teithio mewn hen gerbydau hen ffasiwn, yna ni fyddant yn defnyddio'r rheilffyrdd. Yr ydym yn bryderus, felly, ynglŷn â'r gallu i ymdopi â'r niferoedd cynyddol y bobl sy'n dymuno defnyddio'r rheilffyrdd fel eu dewis dull o deithio.

Yr ydym yn bryderus hefyd ynglŷn â'r newid o gludo nwyddau ar y ffyrdd i'w cludo ar y rheilffyrdd. Byddem yn awgrymu bod hynny'n elfen hollbwysig ond, oherwydd mai cyfyngedig yw'r rhwydwaith yng Nghymru, ni fydd o les i bob rhan o'r wlad. Fodd bynnag, ni ddylem gyfyngu ein dyheadau wrth geisio gweithio gyda byd busnes a'r sector cyhoeddus i gyflwyno dull amgen sy'n ei gwneud hi'n bosibl trosglwyddo nwyddau o'r ffyrdd i'r rheilffyrdd. Yr ydym yn croesawu'r ffaith fod y Llywodraeth yn ymwneud â byd busnes yn hyn, ond deallwn fod yr adnoddau i wireddu hyn yn

gyfyngedig ar hyn o bryd.

The report touches on the subject of safety at stations, and that is crucial. If people do not think that their journey will be safe, and that their possessions, when left at the station, will be safe, they will not use this mode of transport. Indeed, the Federation of Small Businesses, in the consultation document that it circulated yesterday, made specific points about car parking and the ability of business people to access the rail network through modern, clean, safe stations. Again, it comes down to people's perceptions about their journey, and what they want from that journey. If people have a bad experience when they use the train, then they will revert to other forms of transport.

Therefore, we must engage with Network Rail. This is where I find a problem for us here in Wales, and for the Welsh Assembly Government. Given the major infrastructure projects that Network Rail is undertaking—I am thinking of Crossrail, and the aspiration to extend the high-speed network to the English midlands and Scotland—we must ensure that Network Rail also looks at the western side of Britain. It will fall to you as a Minister, and to the Welsh Assembly Government, to ensure that the Welsh voice is not drowned out in seeking that development. I had a meeting with Network Rail to discuss the Cogan junction and Queen Street station, and the gentlemen from Network Rail, with their broad cockney accents, were astounded to see the Queen Street station rush hour. They told me to go to any of the London stations, or stand on London Bridge, to appreciate what a rush hour really is. Therefore, you need to ensure, as a Minister and as a Government, that our voice is heard when investment projects are proposed, and that money is made available for Wales.

We must also ensure that the regional transport consortia, in taking forward the strategy at a regional level, are properly funded. Sadly, we have seen at local authority level that many initiatives come down from this institution, but they are not funded, and therefore the initiative fails. I was impressed by the aspirations of all four

Mae'r adroddiad yn crybwyll diogelwch mewn gorsafoedd, ac mae hynny'n hollbwysig. Os nad yw pobl yn credu y bydd eu taith yn ddiogel, ac y bydd eu heiddo, wrth ei adael yn yr orsaf, yn ddiogel, ni fyddant yn defnyddio'r dull hwn o deithio. Yn wir, gwnaed pwyntiau penodol gan y Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach, yn y ddogfen ymgynghori a ddosbarthwyd ganddo ddoe, ynglŷn â pharcio ceir a gallu pobl fusnes i ddefnyddio'r rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd drwy gyfrwng gorsafoedd modern, glân a diogel. Eto, yr hyn sy'n cyfrif yn y bôn yw canfyddiadau pobl am eu taith, a'r hyn y mae arnynt ei eisiau o'r daith honno. Os caiff pobl brofiad gwael wrth ddefnyddio'r trênn, yna byddant yn dychwelyd at ddefnyddio mathau eraill o gludiant.

Felly, rhaid inni ymwneud â Network Rail. Dyma ble y gwelaf fod problem inni yma yng Nghymru, ac i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. O gofio'r prosiectau seilwaith sylweddol sydd ar y gweill gan Network Rail—yr wyf yn meddwl am Crossrail, a'r awydd i ymestyn y rhwydwaith cyflymder uchel i ganolbarth Lloegr ac i'r Alban—rhaid inni sicrhau bod Network Rail hefyd yn edrych ar ochr orllewinol Prydain. Eich cyfrifoldeb chi, fel Gweinidog, a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru fydd sicrhau na chaiff llais Cymru ei fodd wrth geisio sicrhau'r datblygiad hwnnw. Cefais gyfarfod gyda Network Rail i drafod cyffordd Cogan a gorsaf Heol y Frenhines, ac yr oedd gwŷr Network Rail, a'u hacenion cocni cryf, yn syfrdan pan welsant yr adeg brysuraf yng ngorsaf Heol y Frenhines. Dywedwyd wrthyf am fynd i unrhyw un o orsafoedd Llundain, neu i sefyll ar Bont Llundain, i werthfawrogi'r hyn yw adeg brysuraf mewn gwirionedd. Mae angen i chi sicrhau, felly, fel Gweinidog ac fel Llywodraeth, fod ein llais yn cael ei glywed pan gaiff prosiectau buddsoddi eu cynnig, a bod arian yn cael ei ddarparu i Gymru.

Rhaid inni hefyd sicrhau bod y consortia trafniadaeth rhanbarthol, wrth iddynt roi'r strategaeth ar waith ar lefel ranbarthol, yn cael digon o arian. Yn anffodus, gwelsom ar lefel awdurdodau lleol fod nifer o fentrau'n dod i lawr o'r sefydliad hwn, ond nad ydynt yn cael eu hariannu a bod y fenter, felly, yn methu. Gwnaeth dyheadau pob un o'r pedwar

regional consortia, and they want to turn those aspirations into reality on the ground. If they are not funded sufficiently to do that, then their work will be impaired.

I must take issue with the point that the Minister made in his response when he assumed that there would be £56 million available in the budget for rolling stock. If you check, I think that you will find that it is £5.6 million for 2010-11. I am glad that you are nodding to acknowledge that; my ears pricked up on hearing the £56 million figure.

We welcome that kind of money, but, equally, I draw the Minister's attention to the constraints within the rolling stock marketplace that we have heard about from users and manufacturers. We have also heard, in this Chamber, that the Ebbw Vale line will be serviced by 40-year-old rolling stock. We cannot accept that if we aspire to have a modern rail network in Wales.

**Lesley Griffiths:** I welcome this debate and the opportunity to discuss the committee's report on rail provision. It is a timely stock take of where we are with rail provision, and it provides an opportunity to look ahead at how we can deliver improvements. The committee's overview has been particularly helpful in drawing all the strings together on the various issues that we are currently addressing and will need to address in the future.

2.50 p.m.

The Government is committed to continuing to improve the safety and quality of stations and platforms across the country as well as introducing new trains and train services. On a personal note, Wrexham station has felt the very real benefits of this investment and local rail users are pleased with the improvements that have taken place in recent years, particularly the provision of a customer information system. We have also seen recently the culmination of the long-running campaign to ensure that the Wrexham, Shropshire and Marylebone Railway company's plans to link Wrexham and

consortium rhanbarthol argraff arnaf, ac y mae arnynt eisiau gwireddu'r dyheadau hynny ar lawr gwlad. Os na chânt ddigon o arian i wneud hynny, bydd yn amharu ar eu gwaith.

Rhaid imi anghytuno â'r pwynt a wnaeth y Gweinidog yn ei ymateb pan gymerodd yn ganiataol y byddai £56 miliwn ar gael yn y gyllideb ar gyfer cerbydau. Os ymholwch i hynny, credaf y gwelwch mai £5.6 miliwn ydyw ar gyfer 2010-11. Yr wyf yn falch eich bod yn arwyddo eich bod yn cydnabod hynny; moelodd fy nghlustiau pan glywais y ffigur hwnnw o £56 miliwn.

Yr ydym yn croesawu swm o arian fel hwnnw, ond ar yr un pryd tynnaf sylw'r Gweinidog at y cyfyngiadau yn y farchnad cerbydau trenau y clywsom amdanynt gan ddefnyddwyr a gwneuthurwyr. Yr ydym hefyd wedi clywed, yn y Siambr hon, mai cerbydau 40 mlwydd oed a ddefnyddir ar linell Glynebwy. Ni allwn dderbyn hynny os ein dyhead yw cael rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd modern yng Nghymru.

**Lesley Griffiths:** Croesawaf y ddadl hon a'r cyfle i drafod adroddiad y pwyllgor ar ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau rheilffordd. Mae'n arolwg amserol o'n sefyllfa o ran darpariaeth gwasanaethau rheilffordd, ac mae'n gyfle i edrych ymlaen i weld sut y gallwn sicrhau gwelliannau. Mae trosolwg y pwyllgor wedi bod yn hynod ddefnyddiol i ddwyn yr holl elfennau ynghyd ar yr amrywiol faterion yr ydym yn ymdrin â hwy ar hyn o bryd ac y bydd angen inni ymdrin â hwy yn y dyfodol.

Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi ymrwymo i barhau i wella diogelwch ac ansawdd gorsafoddedd a phlatfformau ledled y wlad, yn ogystal â chyflwyno trenau a gwasanaethau trên newydd. Ar nodyn personol, mae gorsaf Wrecsam wedi gweld effaith gwir fanteision y buddsoddiad hwn, ac mae defnyddwyr y rheilffordd yn lleol yn falch o'r gwelliannau a gafwyd yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, yn enwedig y system gwybodaeth i gwsmeriaid a ddarparwyd. Gwelsom hefyd yn ddiweddar ddiwedd yr ymgyrch hir i sicrhau bod cynlluniau cwmni Rheilffordd Wrecsam, Swydd Amwythig a Marylebone i gysylltu



London moves into operation. In recent weeks, the Welsh Assembly Government has confirmed that a deal has been reached with Network Rail to create a new depot. This is required in order to run the link from Wrexham. Not only has this given us a new transport link, but the new depot will provide 45 new jobs in Wrexham.

Strategically, improving north-south links by road and rail has already been set out by the Minister in recent months, as have plans to reduce rail travel time between the north and the south. The Wales freight strategy consultation was launched last October. The aim of this consultation is to provide a freight strategy that will deliver a modern, efficient freight transport system and tries, quite rightly, to balance economic, social, and environmental objectives. This again is a very important and pertinent consultation for my part of the world, given the importance of north-east Wales as a distribution hub for the region.

Strategically, it is obvious that improved north-south links are very important in order to bridge the geographic divide. That is undoubtedly in Wales's interest as a whole, and those of north Wales in particular. As an AM representing a north Wales constituency, I also value the east-west links in north Wales, which are economically important to the region's prosperity. To this end, one issue of great importance across north-east Wales is the electrification of the Wrexham to Bidston railway line, which, if it comes to fruition, will give Wrexham and north-east Wales a direct link to the city of Liverpool. When the feasibility study for this rail link is delivered to the Minister's in-tray, I urge him to look carefully at the very real benefits that this link will bring to the north-east Wales economy and, in turn, the Welsh economy as a whole.

**Kirsty Williams:** I begin by putting on record my thanks to Gareth for the way in

Wrecsam â Llundain yn cael eu rhoi ar waith. Yn yr wythnosau diwethaf, mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi cadarnhau ei bod wedi dod i gytundeb â Network Rail i greu depo newydd. Mae angen y depo er mwyn gallu rhedeg y cyswllt o Wrecsam. Yn sgil hyn cawsom nid yn unig gyswllt trafndiaeth newydd, ond hefyd bydd y depo newydd yn creu 45 o swyddi newydd yn Wrecsam.

Yn strategol, mae'r Gweinidog eisoes wedi egluro yn y misoedd diwethaf sut y caiff y cysylltiadau rhwng y gogledd a'r de eu gwella ar y ffyrdd a'r rheilffyrdd, a chyhoeddwyd hefyd gynlluniau i leihau amser teithio trenau rhwng y gogledd a'r de. Cafodd yr ymgynghoriad ar strategaeth cludo nwyddau Cymru ei lansio fis Hydref diwethaf. Nod yr ymgynghori hwn yw darparu strategaeth cludo nwyddau a fydd yn sicrhau system drafnidiaeth i gludo nwyddau sy'n effeithlon ac yn fodern ac sy'n ceisio cydbwysu amcanion economaidd, cymdeithasol ac amgylcheddol, fel y dylai wneud. Mae hwn, eto, yn ymgynghoriad hynod o bwysig a pherthnasol i'm rhan i o'r byd, o gofio pwysigrwydd y gogledd-ddwyrain fel canolfan ddsbarthu i'r rhanbarth.

Yn strategol, mae'n amlwg fod gwell cysylltiadau rhwng y gogledd a'r de yn bwysig iawn er mwyn pontio'r rhanid daearyddol. Mae hynny er budd Cymru gyfan, yn ddiamau, ac er budd y gogledd yn enwedig. Fel AC sy'n cynrychioli etholaeth yn y gogledd, yr wyf hefyd yn gweld gwerth y cysylltiadau rhwng y dwyrain a'r gorllewin yn y gogledd, sy'n bwysig o safbwynt economaidd i ffyniant y rhanbarth. I'r perwyl hwn, un mater hynod o bwysig ledled y gogledd-ddwyrain yw trydanu'r llinell reilffordd rhwng Wrecsam a Bidston. Os caiff hyn ei wireddu, bydd yn creu cyswllt uniongyrchol o Wrecsam a'r gogledd-ddwyrain i ddinas Lerpwl. Pan fydd yr astudiaeth dichonoldeb ar gyfer y cyswllt rheilffordd hwn yn cyrraedd desg y Gweinidog, anogaf ef i edrych yn ofalus ar y manteision gwirioneddol a ddaw i economi'r gogledd-ddwyrain ac, yn ei thro, i economi Cymru gyfan yn sgil y cyswllt hwn.

**Kirsty Williams:** Hoffwn gychwyn drwy gofnodi fy nioch i Gareth am y modd y

which he chairs the committee. It has a huge remit, and looking at so many areas, scrutinising them properly and ensuring sufficient opportunity to debate them has not been easy. He does that very well. He is ably assisted by our clerk and deputy clerk who work tirelessly to ensure that members of the committee have the information that they need to take their work forward.

The committee's report clearly demonstrates the highly complex nature of the railway system in Wales, not only in the plethora of organisations that are responsible for getting passengers from A to B, but in the very complex relationships between the Welsh Assembly Government and the Department for Transport. I have sat on various scrutiny committees that have been responsible for looking at transport issues and have found that the relationship with the Department for Transport has not always been easy. I remain suspicious of the level of understanding that the Department for Transport has with regard to the aspirations of Wales—on the part of the Welsh Assembly Government and the Assembly as a whole—and of its willingness to listen and to prioritise Welsh matters on a par with other matters which are, perhaps, a little closer to home. I was reassured during the last appearance by officials that things are improving in this regard. However, I fear that there is still a long way to go.

Developing our railway system is key to achieving the Government's economic development goals, its environmental goals, and its goals with regard to social exclusion. However, if we are to get people onto our trains, we need to provide them with a reliable, efficient, convenient and safe train service. As we have seen, there is a demand to travel by train. Perhaps we will be the victim of our own success in the sense that the number of people who wish to travel by train will be difficult to accommodate. While I am heartened that the Deputy First Minister intends to use Welsh Assembly Government statistics in order to plan for future, demand rather than those of the Department for Transport, the committee heard that even the Welsh Assembly Government's statistics do not perhaps accurately reflect the demand that there will be for train services in Wales,

mae'n cadeirio'r pwyllgor. Mae gan y pwyllgor gylch gwaith anferth, ac ni fu'n rhwydd edrych ar gynifer o feysydd, gan graffu arnynt yn iawn a sicrhau bod digon o gyfle i'w trafod. Mae'n gwneud hynny'n dda iawn. Caiff gymorth deheuig gan ein clerwr a'n dirprwy glerc, sy'n gweithio'n ddiflino i sicrhau bod gan aelodau'r pwyllgor y wybodaeth y mae arnynt ei hangen er mwyn bwrw ymlaen â'u gwaith.

Mae adroddiad y pwyllgor yn dangos yn glir fod system reilffyrdd Cymru yn un hynod o gymhleth, nid yn unig o ran y llu o gyrff sy'n gyfrifol am gludo teithwyr o A i B, ond o ran y berthynas hynod o gymhleth rhwng Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'r Adran Drafnidiaeth. Yr wyf wedi bod yn aelod o amryw o bwyllgorau craffu sydd wedi bod yn gyfrifol am edrych ar faterion trafnidiaeth, a gwelais nad yw'r berthynas â'r Adran Drafnidiaeth wedi bod yn rhwydd bob amser. Yr wyf yn dal yn amheus ynglŷn â lefel dealltwriaeth yr Adran Drafnidiaeth o ddyheadau Cymru—ar ran Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ac ar ran y Cynulliad cyfan—ac ynglŷn â pharodrwydd yr Adran i wrando ac i roi'r un flaenoriaeth i faterion Cymreig ag i faterion eraill sydd, efallai, ychydig nes adref. Cefais fy nghalonogi yn ystod ymddangosiad diwethaf y swyddogion fod pethau'n gwella yn y cyswllt hwn. Ofnaf, fodd bynnag, fod ffordd bell i fynd o hyd.

Mae datblygu ein system reilffyrdd yn allweddol er mwyn cyflawni amcanion datblygu economaidd y Llywodraeth, ei hamcanion amgylcheddol a'i hamcanion o ran eithrio cymdeithasol. Fodd bynnag, os ydym am ddenu pobl i ddefnyddio'n trenau, mae angen i ni roi gwasanaeth trenau dibynadwy, effeithlon, cyfleus a diogel iddynt. Fel y gwelsom, mae yna alw am deithio ar drenau. Efallai y bydd ein llwyddiant ein hunain yn drech na ni, ac y bydd yn anodd ymdopi â nifer y bobl sy'n dymuno teithio ar drên. Er fy mod yn falch clywed bod y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn bwriadu defnyddio ystadegau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru er mwyn cynllunio ar gyfer y galw yn y dyfodol, yn hytrach na ffigurau'r Adran Drafnidiaeth, clywodd y pwyllgor nad yw ystadegau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, hyd yn oed, efallai yn rhoi adlewyrchiad

especially those that will be bringing people from our Valleys communities into Cardiff. I have concerns about whether the Government is accurately predicting the kind of train capacity we will need. As we have heard, even when you have identified the capacity needed, it is not easy to respond to it in terms of rolling stock and the time that it takes to purchase it, and the very real infrastructure problems that exist.

Gareth touched on the issue of Cogan junction, which is a serious bottleneck when it comes to the development of train services in and out of Cardiff. Considerable investment will be needed if we are to overcome those engineering difficulties. As we have heard, it looks as if the Assembly Government will have to come up with something in the region of £30 million in order for that project to go ahead. The Minister told the committee that the Assembly Government would find the cash, and he has given that commitment today, but where will it come from? Under what mechanism is Ieuan Wyn Jones going to secure that large amount of money for this project? Does the Minister already have an assurance from Andrew Davies that the capital board that he presides over will provide that funding, or will Ieuan have to fight with handbags at dawn with Jane Hutt and Edwina Hart for the money that they say that they need to deliver all their capital projects?

**Rosemary Butler:** I do not fancy his chances. [*Laughter.*]

**Kirsty Williams:** Indeed; I would not put my money on Ieuan Wyn Jones in that fight—no disrespect intended, Ieuan.

While the capital board in some ways provides a more strategic look at how we spend our capital money in Wales, transport projects will now have to compete not just against other transport projects, as they did in the old days, but against education and health projects and any projects that need capital expenditure. I would be grateful if the Minister could say that he has that assurance from Andrew Davies that he will receive the money for the Cogan junction project, but I

cywir o'r galw a fydd am wasanaethau trên yng Nghymru, yn enwedig y rheini a fydd yn cludo pobl o'n cymunedau yn y Cymoedd i mewn i Gaerdydd. Yr wyf yn pryderu a yw'r Llywodraeth yn rhagweld yn gywir y math o gapasiti y bydd arnom ei angen ar drenau. Fel y clywsom, hyd yn oed ar ôi i chi nodi pa gapasiti sy'n ofynnol, nid yw'n rhwydd ymateb iddo o ran cerbydau a'r amser a gymer i'w prynu, a'r problemau gwirioneddol iawn sydd o ran y seilwaith.

Crybwyllodd Gareth fater cyffordd Cogan, sy'n fan lle mae tagfeydd difrifol, wrth ystyried datblygu gwasanaethau trên i mewn ac allan o Gaerdydd. Bydd angen buddsoddiad sylweddol os ydym i ddatrys yr anawsterau peirianyddol hynny. Fel y clywsom, ymddengys y bydd yn rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ddod o hyd i ryw £30 miliwn er mwyn gallu bwrw ymlaen â'r prosiect hwnnw. Dywedodd y Gweinidog wrth y pwyllgor y byddai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn dod o hyd i'r arian, ac y mae wedi rhoi'r ymrwymiad hwnnw heddiw, ond o ble y daw? Dan ba fecanwaith y bydd Ieuan Wyn Jones yn sicrhau'r swm mawr hwnnw o arian ar gyfer y prosiect hwn? A yw'r Gweinidog eisoes wedi cael sicrwydd gan Andrew Davies y bydd y bwrdd cyfalaf y mae'n ei arwain yn rhoi'r arian hwnnw, ynteu a fydd yn rhaid i Ieuan ymladd gornest bagiau llaw gyda Jane Hutt ac Edwina Hart am yr arian y dywedant sy'n ofynnol i gyflawni eu holl brosiectau cyfalaf?

**Rosemary Butler:** Ni chredaf y byddai ganddo fawr o obaith. [*Chwerthin.*]

**Kirsty Williams:** Na fyddai, y wir; ni fyddwn i'n mentro fy arian ar Ieuan Wyn Jones yn y frwydr honno—pob parch ichi, Ieuan.

Er bod y bwrdd cyfalaf, mewn rhai ffyrdd, yn rhoi golwg fwy strategol ar y ffordd y gwariwn ein harian cyfalaf yng Nghymru, yn awr bydd yn rhaid i brosiectau trafniadaeth gystadlu nid yn unig â phrosiectau trafniadaeth eraill, fel yr arferent wneud ers talwm, ond â phrosiectau addysg ac iechyd ac unrhyw brosiectau lle mae angen gwariant cyfalaf. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallai'r Gweinidog ddweud ei fod wedi cael y sicrwydd hwnnw gan Andrew Davies y bydd

suspect that that promise has not yet been made.

On rolling stock, Andrew R.T. Davies made great play of the £5.6 million. In reality, £5.6 million for rolling stock is small beer. I understand that a fourth train for the Heart of Wales line will cost around £4 million—that is one extra train on a very short line in rural Wales. If we are talking about a seismic shift in terms of rolling stock, £5.6 million is not enough.

**Janet Ryder:** I add my thanks and congratulations to the committee staff and the Chair on the production of this report. It is a wide subject to cover, and the committee staff have done very well to draw all the information together.

I wish to add my concerns to those raised already about the availability of the rolling stock, which came across very forcefully in the review. If the intention is to increase the use of rail travel and north-south links, which are crucial and are a key part of Government policy, we need that extra rolling stock. We need to hear quite clearly how we are going to attain it and how it will fit into the pattern.

Between 2002-03 and 2005-06, there was a 44 per cent increase in the number of passengers using the north-south link. That reflects the increasing demand from private and public businesses and the general public for that rail link. That increase has come despite well-over-inflation rises in ticket prices. It is very easy to say that we should encourage more people to use trains, but there are many things that put people off. If the quality of the trains is no good, that will put them off, and if they do not arrive promptly or run regularly, that can affect their usage. The price that people have to pay for tickets can certainly affect the usage. The Government must consider that, because it seems that, within Wales, we have an inequitable rail pricing policy. A return ticket for the 40-mile journey from Colwyn Bay to Chester costs around £13.30, while a return ticket for a similar journey in south Wales,

yn cael yr arian ar gyfer prosiect cyffordd Cogan, ond yr wyf yn amau nad yw'r addewid hwnnw wedi ei roi eto.

O ran cerbydau, gwnaeth Andrew R. T. Davies fôr a mynydd o'r £5.6 miliwn. Mewn gwirionedd, swm bach iawn yw £5.6 miliwn ar gyfer cerbydau. Deallaf y bydd pedwerydd trêrn ar gyfer llinell Calon Cymru yn costio tua £4 miliwn—un trêrn ychwanegol ar linell fer iawn yng nghefn gwlad Cymru yw hynny. Os ydym yn sôn am newid sylweddol o ran cerbydau, nid yw £5.6 miliwn yn ddigon.

**Janet Ryder:** Ychwanegaf fy niolech a'm llongyfarchiadau i staff y pwyllgor ac i'r Cadeirydd am gynhyrchu'r adroddiad hwn. Mae'n bwnc eang i'w gwmpasu, ac mae staff y pwyllgor wedi gwneud gwaith da iawn wrth dynnu'r holl wybodaeth ynghyd.

Hoffwn ychwanegu fy mhryderon at y rhai a godwyd eisoes ynglŷn ag argaeledd cerbydau. Cafodd hyn ei gyfleu'n rymus iawn yn yr adolygiad. Os y bwriad yw cynyddu'r niferoedd sy'n teithio ar y rheilffyrdd a'r cysylltiadau rhwng y gogledd a'r de, sy'n hollbwysig ac sy'n rhan allweddol o bolisi'r Llywodraeth, mae arnom angen y cerbydau ychwanegol hynny. Mae angen inni glywed yn eglur iawn sut y byddwn yn eu cael a sut y bydd hynny'n cydfynd â'r patrwm.

Rhwng 2002-03 a 2005-06, bu cynnydd o 44 y cant yn nifer y teithwyr a oedd yn defnyddio'r cyswllt rhwng y gogledd a'r de. Mae hynny'n adlewyrchu'r galw cynyddol am y cyswllt rheilffordd hwnnw gan fusnesau preifat a chyhoeddus, a chan y cyhoedd yn gyffredinol. Digwyddodd y cynnydd hwnnw er gwaethaf codiadau llawer uwch na chwyddiant ym mhris tocynnau. Mae'n hawdd iawn dweud y dylem annog rhagor o bobl i ddefnyddio trenau, ond mae yna nifer o bethau sy'n perswadio pobl i beidio â gwneud hynny. Os yw ansawdd y trenau'n wael, bydd hynny'n eu perswadio i beidio â'u defnyddio, ac os nad ydynt yn cyrraedd yn brydlon neu'n rhedeg yn rheolaidd, gall hynny effeithio ar y defnydd a wneir ohonynt. Mae'r pris y mae'n rhaid i bobl ei dalu am docynnau yn sicr yn gallu effeithio ar ddefnydd. Rhaid i'r Llywodraeth ystyried hynny, oherwydd mae'n ymddangos, yng

from Swansea to Cardiff, costs £5.10.

Nghymru, fod gennym bolisi prisio anghyfartal ar y rheilffyrdd. Mae tocyn dwyffordd am y daith 40 milltir o Fae Colwyn i Gaer yn costio tua £13.30, tra mae tocyn dwyffordd am daith debyg yn ne Cymru, o Abertawe i Gaerdydd, yn costio £5.10.

3.00 p.m.

I want the Minister to look at that to see whether the Government can do anything to bring about a more equitable pricing policy, because price is certainly a factor in considering whether to take a journey of that sort of distance by rail, given that it is so easy to jump in the car and use the A55. We want to encourage people to use the railways, and the price must be appropriate to achieve that.

Hoffwn i'r Gweinidog edrych ar hynny ac ystyried a all y Llywodraeth wneud unrhyw beth i gyflwyno polisi prisio tecach, oherwydd mae pris yn sicr yn ffactor wrth ystyried defnyddio'r rheilffordd ar gyfer siwrnai o'r pellter yna ai peidio, yn enwedig gan ei bod mor hawdd neidio i mewn i'r car a defnyddio'r A55. Yr ydym am annog pobl i ddefnyddio'r rheilffyrdd, a rhaid i'r pris fod yn briodol er mwyn gwneud hynny.

The length of the journey between north and south Wales is also important. We have talked for many years about reducing the time that it takes, and yet we are still in a situation where trains coming into Wrexham from Cardiff can experience delays of up to 25 minutes because there are still stretches of single track on that route where trains cannot pass each other. If we are to increase rail usage, that must be looked at.

Mae'r amser a gymer y daith o'r gogledd i'r de hefyd yn bwysig. Yr ydym wedi bod yn sôn am leihau'r amser hwn ers blynyddoedd, ac eto mae trenau sy'n dod i Wrecsam o Gaerdydd yn dal i allu cael eu dal yn ôl am hyd at 25 munud gan fod traciau sengl o hyd ar rannau o'r llwybr hwnnw lle mae trenau'n methu â phasio'i gilydd. Os ydym am gael mwy o bobl i ddefnyddio'r rheilffyrdd, rhaid edrych ar hynny.

Finally, I thank the Minister and the Government, as Lesley said, for their support for the development in Wrexham. I pay tribute to local councillor, Dave Bithel, who for three years or more has campaigned for the development of the new link to London. We are now seeing his efforts come to fruition. As Lesley said, it will mean well paid, high quality jobs based in Wrexham. A company can base its headquarters in Wrexham and make runs down to London, and that is an example of the way forward for Wales. We are seeing Wales service the rest of the UK. If we can see more such developments that use the railways, we will certainly be looking at a better shift towards rail travel and a proper fulfilment of Government policies.

Yn olaf, hoffwn ddiolch i'r Gweinidog a'r Llywodraeth, fel y dywedodd Lesley, am eu cefnogaeth i'r datblygiad yn Wrecsam. Hoffwn roi teyrnged i'r cynghorydd lleol, Dave Bithel, sydd wedi ymgyrchu ers tair blynedd neu fwy dros y cyswllt newydd i Lundain. Mae ei ymdrechion yn dwyn ffrwyth yn awr. Fel y dywedodd Lesley, bydd yn golygu bod swyddi da, gyda chyflogau uchel, ar gael yn Wrecsam. Gall cwmni gael ei bencadlys yn Wrecsam a theithio i lawr i Lundain, ac mae hynny'n enghraifft o'r ffordd ymlaen i Gymru. Gwelwn Gymru'n gwasanaethu gweddill y DU. Os gallwn gael mwy o ddatblygiadau o'r fath sy'n defnyddio'r rheilffyrdd, byddwn yn sicr yn gweld mwy o bobl yn teithio ar y rheilffyrdd a pholisïau'r Llywodraeth yn cael eu gweithredu'n briodol.

**Huw Lewis:** I begin by thanking all those who gave evidence to the committee on this important subject; they gave us a great deal to

**Huw Lewis:** Hoffwn ddechrau drwy ddiolch i bawb a roddodd dystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor ar y pwnc pwysig hwn; maent wedi rhoi llawer

think about. I also offer my thanks to Gareth, who was a very level-headed Chair. I wish to focus my remarks on those elements of the report and the accompanying evidence that relate to the Valleys and Cardiff in particular. However, there are broader elements of the report, including those that relate to car parking at stations, that I would like to see addressed as matters of urgency, as would many others. Rail journeys do not begin and end when you get on and off the train. Genuinely joined-up public transport provision is still an aspiration rather than a reality in many parts of south-east Wales. There have been many welcome developments, not least of which are the half-hourly services, which we hope will soon be coming to the Merthyr line. That improvement would have genuine transformational potential with regard to the regeneration of the Merthyr valley. However, there is little point in having a train service to get you from Cardiff to Merthyr at 6.30 p.m. if there is not a bus to get you to, say, the Gurnos estate for the last leg of the journey.

The Bevan Foundation has called for the local transport services grant to be tripled to allow local authorities in areas such as the Valleys to purchase more non-commercial services. I would be grateful for the Minister's response to that recommendation. As he knows, levels of car ownership in my constituency and other parts of the south Wales Valleys are well below the national average. That has a severe impact not only on the distance that people are able to travel to work, but generally on the quality-of-life issues that those people face. There are world-class attractions within striking distance of Valleys towns and villages, including the Wales Millennium Centre, the Millennium Stadium, and the National Waterfront Museum in Swansea, but without suitable evening and Sunday provision and without sensible bus links between communities and stations, these attractions will remain closed to many families in my constituency.

This works both ways. Merthyr Tydfil could and should be a transport hub for the Heads of Valleys region, but how well do we exploit

iawn inni feddwl amdano. Hoffwn ddiolch hefyd i Gareth, a oedd yn Gadeirydd pwylllog iawn. Yr wyf am ganolbwyntio fy sylwadau ar yr elfennau hynny o'r adroddiad a'r dystiolaeth gysylltiedig sy'n ymwneud â'r Cymoedd a Chaerdydd yn fwyaf arbennig. Fodd bynnag, mae yna elfennau ehangach yn yr adroddiad, gan gynnwys y rheini sy'n ymwneud â pharcio ceir mewn gorsafoedd, y byddwn i, a nifer o bobl eraill, yn hoffi gweld rhoi sylw iddynt ar frys. Nid yw siwrneiau rheilffyrdd yn dechrau ac yn gorffen wrth ichi fynd ar y trê neu ddod oddi arno. Mae cludiant cyhoeddus gwirioneddol gydgysylltiedig yn dal yn ddelfryd yn hytrach nag yn realiti mewn nifer o ardaloedd yn y de-ddwyrain. Gwelsom nifer o ddatblygiadau sydd i'w croesawu, gan gynnwys y gwasanaethau bob hanner awr, a fydd yn dod i linell Merthyr cyn hir, gobeithio. Byddai modd i'r gwelliant hwnnw sicrhau gweddnewidiad gwirioneddol o ran adfywio dyffryn Merthyr. Fodd bynnag, nid oes llawer o ddiben cael gwasanaeth trê i fynd â chi o Gaerdydd i Ferthyr am 6.30 p.m. os nad oes bws i fynd â chi, dyweder, i ystâd y Gurnos ar ran olaf y daith.

Mae Sefydliad Bevan wedi galw am dreblu'r grant gwasanaethau trafnidiaeth leol er mwyn i awdurdodau lleol mewn ardaloedd fel y Cymoedd allu prynu mwy o wasanaethau anfasnachol. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar petai'r Gweinidog yn gallu ymateb i'r argymhelliad hwnnw. Fel y gŵyr, mae nifer y perchnogion ceir yn fy etholaeth i ac mewn rhannau eraill o Gymoedd y de lawer is na'r cyfartaledd cenedlaethol. Mae hynny'n cael effaith ddifrifol nid yn unig ar y pellter y gall pobl deithio i'r gwaith, ond yn gyffredinol ar y problemau sy'n wynebu'r bobl hynny o ran ansawdd bywyd. Mae atyniadau sydd ymhlith goreuon y byd yn agos iawn at drefi a phentrefi'r Cymoedd, gan gynnwys Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru, Stadiwm y Mileniwm ac Amgueddfa Genedlaethol y Glannau yn Abertawe, ond heb ddarpariaeth addas gyda'r nos ac ar y Sul, a heb gysylltiadau bws call rhwng cymunedau a gorsafoedd, bydd yr atyniadau hyn yn dal ar gau i lawer o deuluoedd yn fy etholaeth i.

Mae hyn yn gweithio'r ddwy ffordd. Gallai Merthyr Tudful fod yn ganolfan drafnidiaeth i ardal Blaenau'r Cymoedd, a dylai fod felly,

its strategic location? Not nearly well enough. There are also some concerns that I would like to see addressed on the Rhymney side of my constituency. I was pleased to attend, with the previous Minister for transport, the launch of a project that will extend platforms on the Rhymney valley line, allowing for modern six-car trains to replace the current four-car trains. That represents a serious and very welcome investment in our public transport infrastructure. However, the South East Wales Transport Alliance, my colleague, Jeff Cuthbert—who sits next to me in more ways than one because he represents the neighbouring constituency—and I remain impatient for the promised half-hourly services on the Rhymney valley line to become a reality. SEWTA confirmed to the committee that it is ready to implement the project. It was confirmed by the previous Assembly Government as a priority, but, as far as I am aware, we are still awaiting the financial go-ahead. The engineers are ready; I want to know whether the Minister is also ready. Will you give the financial go-ahead, Minister? Will you fulfil the Welsh Assembly Government's promise to the people of the Rhymney valley or not? Please give us the answer this afternoon.

There are also questions remaining over the reopening of the Taff Bargoed line, which is also on SEWTA's list of projects to be done. The Taff Bargoed line running from Bedlinog through Ystrad Mynach, between my constituency and Jeff Cuthbert's, will soon be open to freight traffic. The plan is to open again to passenger traffic, reopening that dead-end valley to passenger rail services for the first time in a couple of decades.

I know that improving north-south links is a stated priority for this Minister—and rightly so. It is interesting, laudable and all very well, but we should not lose sight of our other much more pressing transport priorities. We have promises to keep. A number of those giving evidence to the committee highlighted the serious pressure that will be put on the rail network, specifically in south-

ond i ba raddau yr ydym yn manteisio ar ei lleoliad strategol? Ddim hanner digon da. Mae rhai pryderon hefyd y byddwn yn hoffi eu gweld yn cael sylw ar ochr Rhymni yn fy etholaeth. Yr oeddwn yn falch bod yn bresennol, gyda'r Gweinidog blaenorol dros drafnidiaeth, mewn digwyddiad i lansio prosiect a fydd yn ymestyn platfformau ar linell cwm Rhymni, fel y gall trenau chwe cherbyd modern ddisodli'r trenau pedwar cerbyd presennol. Mae hwnnw'n fuddsoddiad sylweddol sydd i'w groesawu'n fawr yn ein seilwaith cludiant cyhoeddus. Fodd bynnag, mae Cynghrair Trafnidiaeth De-ddwyrain Cymru, fy nghyd-Aelod, Jeff Cuthbert-sy'n eistedd wrth fy ymyl mewn mwy nag un ffordd gan ei fod yn cynrychioli'r etholaeth gyfagos-a minnau yn dal i aros yn eiddgar i'r gwasanaethau bob hanner awr a addawyd ar linell cwm Rhymni ddod yn realiti. Mae'r Gynghrair wedi cadarnhau wrth y pwyllgor ei fod yn barod i weithredu'r prosiect. Cafodd y mater ei gadarnhau fel blaenoriaeth gan Lywodraeth flaenorol y Cynulliad, ond hyd y gwn i yr ydym yn dal i ddisgwyl y caniatâd ariannol i symud ymlaen. Mae'r peirianwyr yn barod; hoffwn wybod a yw'r Gweinidog hefyd yn barod. A wnewch chi roi'r caniatâd ariannol, Weinidog? A wnewch chi wireddu addewid Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i bobl cwm Rhymni ai peidio? Rhowch yr ateb inni yn prynhawn yma, os gwelwch yn dda.

Mae yna gwestiynau heb eu hateb o hyd ynglŷn ag ailagor llinell Taf Bargoed, sydd hefyd ar restr Cynghrair Trafnidiaeth De-ddwyrain Cymru o brosiectau i'w gweithredu. Bydd llinell Taf Bargoed, sy'n ymestyn o Fedlinog drwy Ystrad Mynach, rhwng fy etholaeth i ac etholaeth Jeff Cuthbert, ar agor i draffig cludo nwyddau cyn hir. Y bwriad yw agor y llinell eto i draffig teithwyr, gan ailagor pencaead y cwm i wasanaethau rheilffordd i deithwyr am y tro cyntaf ers degawd neu ddau.

Gwn fod gwella cysylltiadau rhwng y de a'r gogledd wedi'i ddatgan fel blaenoriaeth i'r Gweinidog hwn—a hynny'n gwbl briodol. Mae'n ddiddorol, yn ganmoladwy ac yn gwbl briodol, ond ni ddylem anghofio ein blaenoriaethau cludiant eraill sy'n llawer mwy difrifol. Mae gennym addewidion i'w cadw. Tynnwyd sylw gan nifer o'r rheini a roddodd dystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor at y pwysau

east Wales, in the coming years, with future demand anticipated to be double the all-Wales average. That is undoubtedly the pressure point in Wales as far as transport is concerned. These projects are also vital to the regeneration of the Valleys. Valleys people have been promised these schemes repeatedly by the Welsh Assembly Government.

I will finish on a positive note—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I am sorry, but we will have to miss the positive note as you have run out of time. You will have to keep it for another time.

**Darren Millar:** I thank the Chair of the committee and the Deputy First Minister for their earlier comments. One area that has not been properly emphasised in this report is the problematic rail journey from north to south Wales. I know that Janet Ryder has referred to it, but I also want to draw some attention to it.

Thankfully the service is becoming more popular and I concur with the findings of the committee and the evidence taken that passenger numbers are increasing. However, the benefits of this additional revenue for Arriva Trains Cymru do not seem to be filtering down to passengers in the form of real improvements. While trains are generally punctual, carriages are often dirty, and the rolling stock is ageing and uncomfortable. Therefore, while I welcome the recommendation for the Welsh Assembly Government to produce a rolling stock plan for Wales, there is no excuse for the operators to run dirty trains. There should be a greater onus on them to improve the existing rolling stock in the interim period while the plan is being drawn up.

Train journey times are also still unacceptable. Although I accept that the business-class service that is being looked at will reduce these times, there will clearly be implications for timetables if more freight shifts onto the railways, which could have consequences for rail passengers. On occasion, I have been stuck on a train

difrifol a fydd ar y rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd, yn enwedig yn y de-ddwyrain, yn y blynyddoedd i ddod, pan ddisgwylir y bydd y galw ddwywaith y cyfartaledd ar gyfer Cymru gyfan. Dyna'n sicr lle mae'r pwysau yng Nghymru cyn belled ag y mae trafniadaeth yn y cwestiwn. Mae'r prosiectau hyn yn hanfodol hefyd er mwyn adfywio'r Cymoedd. Mae'r cynlluniau hyn wedi'u haddo i bobl y Cymoedd dro ar ôl tro gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Yr wyf am orffen ar nodyn cadarnhaol—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ond bydd yn rhaid inni gollu'r nodyn cadarnhaol gan nad oes gennych amser ar ôl. Bydd yn rhaid ichi ei gadw at rywbyrd eto.

**Darren Millar:** Hoffwn ddiolch i Gadeirydd y pwyllgor ac i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog am eu sylwadau cynharach. Un maes nad yw wedi ei bwysleisio'n briodol yn yr adroddiad hwn yw'r siwrnai drafferthus ar y rheilffordd o'r gogledd i'r de. Gwn fod Janet Ryder wedi cyfeirio at y mater, ond hoffwn innau roi ychydig sylw iddo.

Mae'r gwasanaeth, yn ffodus, yn dod yn fwy poblogaidd, a chytunaf â darganfyddiadau'r pwyllgor a'r dystiolaeth a gafwyd fod niferoedd teithwyr yn cynyddu. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n ymddangos bod manteision y refeniw ychwanegol hwn i Drenau Arriva Cymru yn cael ei drosglwyddo i deithwyr ar ffurf gwelliannau gwirioneddol. Er bod trenau ar y cyfan yn brydlon, mae'r cerbydau'n aml yn fudr, yn hen ac yn anghyfforddus. Felly, er fy mod yn croesawu'r argymhelliad y dylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru lunio cynllun cerbydau ar gyfer Cymru, nid oes gan y cwmni ddim esgus dros ddefnyddio trenau budr. Dylai fod mwy o gyfrifoldeb arnynt i wella'r cerbydau presennol yn y cyfnod tra bydd y cynllun yn cael ei lunio.

Mae hyd siwrneiau trên hefyd yn dal yn annerbyniol. Er fy mod yn derbyn y bydd y gwasanaeth dosbarth busnes sy'n cael ei ystyried yn lleihau'r amseroedd hyn, mae'n amlwg y bydd hyn yn effeithio ar amserlenni, os bydd mwy o nwyddau'n cael eu cludo ar y rheilffyrdd, a gallai hynny effeithio ar deithwyr trenau. Ar un achlysur, yr wyf wedi



because a freight train has broken down and is in the way. My journey has taken up to seven hours in the past. Those situations are totally unacceptable in this day and age.

I accept that removing freight from the roads could have a positive effect on travelling time for people travelling by car from north to south and vice versa. Anyone making the journey regularly will appreciate the frustration of being stuck behind a heavy goods vehicle on a single carriageway. I understand that there are dynamic tensions between shifting freight between the railway and the roads. This needs more careful consideration.

On station improvements, I note from the report that evidence from Passenger Focus indicated that dissatisfaction with stations is higher in Wales than it is anywhere else in Britain. Part of the problem is that many stations, such as that in Colwyn Bay in my constituency, are managed jointly by the train operators and Network Rail. I find that one partner, usually the operator, is prepared to invest and improve the station, but that commitment is not always forthcoming from the other partner, which is usually Network Rail. That creates a problem. In Colwyn Bay, for example, Arriva has worked hard to improve the station: it is making good use of the buildings, for which it is responsible, and the station is cleaner, safer and more comfortable as a result. However, a number of station buildings that remain the responsibility of Network Rail are still not being used to their full potential, and they let the station down. Perhaps the Minister could do something about this, and give me some indication of that in his response.

3.10 p.m.

While I support the committee's view that appraisal techniques should include reference to the wider social and economic benefits of any investments, there should have been additional emphasis on the environmental benefits when appraising rail schemes, especially given the role that switching from road to rail can play in reducing carbon

fy nal ar drên am fod trên nwyddau wedi torri a neb yn gallu mynd heibio. Mae fy siwrnai wedi cymryd hyd at saith awr yn y gorffennol. Mae'r sefyllfaoedd hynny'n gwbl annerbyniol yn yr oes sydd ohoni.

Derbynïaf y gallai llai o gerbydau nwyddau ar y ffyrdd gael effaith gadarnhaol ar yr amser a gymer taith mewn car o'r de i'r gogledd ac fel arall. Bydd pawb sy'n teithio felly'n rheolaidd yn sylweddoli mor rhwystredig yw'r profiad o gael eich dal y tu ôl i gerbyd nwyddau trwm ar ffordd unffrwd. Yr wyf yn deall bod symud nwyddau oddi ar y ffyrdd i'r rheilffyrdd yn fater sy'n achosi llawer iawn o densiwn. Mae angen ystyried hyn yn fwy gofalus.

O ran gwella gorsafoedd, sylwaf o'r adroddiad fod tystiolaeth gan Passenger Focus yn awgrymu bod mwy o bobl yng Nghymru yn anfodlon am orsafoedd nag yn unman arall ym Mhrydain. Rhan o'r broblem yw bod nifer o'r gorsafoedd, fel honno ym Mae Colwyn yn fy etholaeth i, yn cael eu rheoli ar y cyd gan y cwmni trenau a Network Rail. Mae'n ymddangos bod un partner, y cwmni trenau fel rheol, yn barod i fuddsoddi a gwella'r orsaf, ond nad yw'r partner arall, sef Network Rail fel rheol, yn barod bob amser i ymrwymo i'r gwaith. Mae hynny'n achosi problem. Ym Mae Colwyn, er enghraifft, mae Arriva wedi gweithio'n galed i wella'r orsaf: mae'n gwneud defnydd da o'r adeiladau, y mae'n gyfrifol amdanynt, ac mae'r orsaf yn lanach, yn fwy diogel ac yn fwy cyfforddus o ganlyniad. Fodd bynnag, mae nifer o adeiladau gorsafoedd y mae Network Rail yn dal yn gyfrifol amdanynt nad ydynt yn cael eu defnyddio i'w llawn botensial, ac maent yn gwneud i'r orsaf edrych yn flêr. Efallai y gallai'r Gweinidog wneud rhywbeth ynglŷn â hyn, a chyfeirio at y mater yn ei ymateb.

Er fy mod yn cytuno â'r pwyllgor y dylai technegau gwerthuso gynnwys cyfeiriad at fanteision cymdeithasol ac economaidd ehangach unrhyw fuddsoddiadau, dylai fod wedi rhoi mwy o bwyslais ar y manteision amgylcheddol wrth werthuso cynlluniau rheilffordd, yn enwedig o gofio'r cyfraniad y gall newid o'r ffordd i'r rheilffordd ei wneud

dioxide emissions and addressing climate change. Fortunately, that oversight by the committee has been partially addressed by the Minister in his written response, but I cannot help but feel that there is insufficient joint working between his department and that run by the Minister for Environment, Sustainability and Housing on this particular issue. Perhaps the Minister can give some assurances that that issue is not being overlooked.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I need to call the Minister to reply in 15 minutes' time, and six Members wish to speak, so if you could be brief, I would be grateful.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** I will do my best, Presiding Officer.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. What I meant to say was, 'Please be brief'—full stop. [*Laughter.*]

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Thank you, Presiding Officer. I begin by adding my thanks to Gareth for the way in which he chaired our deliberations and for ensuring that we kept a strategic view in mind and did not drift too often onto the more parochial issues—although you may find that I do just that in this speech from time to time.

Rail provision throughout the country is extremely important, and that is certainly true in the south Wales Valleys. We are not simply talking about being able to travel down to Cardiff to do a bit of shopping or to watch the rugby, although those things are important; when we talk of rail provision, there are many knock-on effects that can make a huge difference. If we truly want to people to give up their cars and pay to travel by public transport, it is vital that we develop a world-class, fully integrated transport infrastructure, and it must include freight and passenger rail transport.

Among the biggest issues facing the south Wales Valleys is the drain of its young people, who go elsewhere in search of jobs. If these young people, many of whom do not drive, had access to a regular and reliable

i leihau allyriadau carbon deuocsid a delio â'r newid yn yr hinsawdd. Yn ffodus, mae'r Gweinidog, yn ei ymateb ysgrifenedig, wedi rhoi sylw yn rhannol i'r esgeulustod hwnnw gan y pwyllgor, ond yr wyf yn rhyw dybio nad oes digon o gydweithio rhwng ei adran ef ac adran y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynaliadwyedd a Thai ar y mater penodol hwn. Efallai y gall y Gweinidog roi rhyw sicrwydd inni nad yw'r mater hwnnw'n cael ei anwybyddu.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae angen imi alw ar y Gweinidog i ymateb ymhen chwarter awr, ac mae chwe Aelod yn awyddus i siarad, felly, byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech fod yn fyr.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Fe wnaif fy ngorau, Lywydd.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr hyn yr oeddwn yn bwriadu ei ddweud oedd, 'Byddwch yn fyr'—dyna ben. [*Chwerthin.*]

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Diolch, Lywydd. Dechreuaf drwy ddweud fy mod i hefyd yn ddiolchgar i Gareth am y ffordd y cadeiriodd ein trafodaethau, gan sicrhau ein bod yn cadw safbwynt strategol mewn golwg ac yn ymatal rhag crwydro'n rhy aml i drafod materion mwy plwyfol—er y gwelwch, efallai, fy mod yn gwneud hynny'n union yn yr araith hon o bryd i'w gilydd.

Mae darpariaeth rheilffyrdd drwy'r wlad yn bwysig iawn, ac mae hynny'n sicr yn wir yng Nghymoedd y de. Nid sôn am allu teithio i Gaerdydd i wneud ychydig siopa neu i weld gêm rygbi yn unig yr ydym, er bod y pethau hynny'n bwysig; pan fyddwn yn sôn am ddarpariaeth rheilffyrdd, mae yna nifer o effeithiau canlynol a all wneud gwahaniaeth mawr. Os ydym o ddifrif am weld pobl yn peidio â defnyddio'u ceir a thalu am ddefnyddio cludiant cyhoeddus, mae'n hanfodol inni ddatblygu seilwaith trafndiaeth cwbl integredig o safon uchel iawn, a rhaid i'r seilwaith hwn gynnwys cludiant rheilffyrdd ar gyfer nwyddau a theithwyr.

Un o'r problemau mwyaf sy'n wynebu Cymoedd y de yw colli pobl ifanc, sy'n gadael yr ardal i chwilio am swyddi rywle arall. Petai modd i'r bobl ifanc hyn, nad dydynt, nifer ohonynt, yn gyrru car, fanteisio

train service to Cardiff and further afield, there is a far greater likelihood that they will stay in the Valleys longer, and help to stop this drain. When the Enterprise and Learning Committee looked at the future of rail provision, it tried to look at all the associated aspects involved.

As has been mentioned, the number of train users continues to grow year on year, so we must look at the long-term goal. We have already seen significant improvements in my constituency: Network Rail, in conjunction with the Welsh Assembly Government, has upgraded the signalling infrastructure to allow an improved timetable to which my colleague, Huw Lewis, referred. That has already been applied as far north as Bargoed in my constituency, but has not yet gone to the stations further north in Rhymney.

Valley line railway stations have been lengthened, allowing them to accommodate six-carriage services. I know that because I have walked along many of those stations with Network Rail officials. However, there have been recent problems. Under its franchise agreement, Arriva Trains Wales must provide a minimum of four cars or carriages on trains running during peak times, but local commuters have complained to me that there have been only two-carriage trains at stations at peak times, and that has led to severe overcrowding. I have raised the matter with Arriva Trains Wales, and I am happy to report that it has promised that these are temporary problems that will quickly be resolved, and that the service will be back to four cars and six cars in the not-too-distant future.

I am glad to see that these improvements are beginning to be replicated across the south Wales Valleys, but with an increase in the number of services running from the Valleys in general, more needs to be done at the Cardiff end to accommodate them. I refer to the points made by Gareth about Queen Street station and the bottleneck there, where the vast majority of Valleys service are funnelled into a narrow strait leading to Queen Street station over the bridge on

ar wasanaeth trên rheolaidd a dibynadwy i Gaerdydd ac ymhellach, byddent lawer yn fwy tebygol o aros yn y Cymoedd yn hirach, a byddai hynny'n helpu atal y llif hwn. Pan edrychodd y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu ar ddyfodol y ddarpariaeth rheilffyrdd, ceisiodd edrych ar bob agwedd gysylltiedig.

Fel y crybwyllwyd, mae nifer y bobl sy'n defnyddio'r trên yn dal i gynyddu o flwyddyn i flwyddyn. Felly, rhaid inni edrych ar y nod hirdymor. Gwelsom eisoes welliannau mawr yn fy etholaeth i: mae Network Rail, ar y cyd â Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, wedi gwella'r seilwaith signalau i roi inni well amserlen, fel y cyfeiriwyd gan fy nghyd-Aelod, Huw Lewis. Mae'r gwaith hwnnw eisoes wedi'i wneud cyn belled i'r gogledd â Bargoed yn fy etholaeth i, ond nid yw eto wedi cyrraedd y gorsafoedd ymhellach i'r gogledd yn Rhymni.

Mae gorsafoedd rheilffordd llinell y Cymoedd wedi'u hymestyn, i'w gwneud yn addas ar gyfer trenau chwe cherbyd. Gwn hynny, oherwydd yr wyf wedi cerdded ar hyd nifer o'r gorsafoedd hynny gyda swyddogion Network Rail. Fodd bynnag, mae problemau wedi codi'n ddiweddar. Yn unol â'r cytundeb masnachfrait, rhaid i Drenau Arriva Cymru sicrhau bod o leiaf bedwar cerbyd ar y trenau a ddefnyddir yn ystod yr oriau brig, ond yr wyf wedi cael cwynion gan gymudwyr lleol sy'n dweud mai trenau dau gerbyd yn unig a welwyd mewn gorsafoedd yn ystod yr oriau brig, a bod hynny wedi achosi gorlwytho difrifol. Yr wyf wedi dwyn y mater i sylw Trenau Arriva Cymru, ac yr wyf yn falch dweud bod y cwmni wedi addo mai problemau dros dro yw'r rhain, y caiff y problemau eu datrys yn fuan, ac a bydd y cwmni'n ailddechrau defnyddio trenau pedwar a chwe cherbyd cyn hir.

Yr wyf yn falch gweld bod y gwelliannau hyn yn dechrau cael eu hefelychu mewn ardaloedd eraill yng Nghymoedd y de, ond gyda chynnydd yn nifer y gwasanaethau o'r Cymoedd yn gyffredinol, mae angen gwneud mwy yng Nghaerdydd i'w derbyn. Cyfeiriaf at y pwyntiau a godwyd gan Gareth ynglŷn â gorsaf Heol y Frenhines a'r dagfa yno, lle mae'r rhan fwyaf o wasanaethau'r Cymoedd yn cael eu sianelu drwy le cul sy'n arwain i orsaf Heol y Frenhines dros y bont ar heol

Newport road. These issues must be addressed, and I take heart from the assurances that it will be addressed, even if that means that at some point the bridge over Newport road will have to be rebuilt to accommodate an extra span.

Another aspect of rail provision that became vividly clear over the last few weeks is that of anti-social behaviour and passengers' ability to feel safe on a train. I am sure that you are all aware of the attempted train derailment, which I have mentioned, near Llanbradach on 4 January. It has become apparent that this was due to anti-social behaviour in the worst sense of the term. It will, hopefully, prove to be an isolated case, but more needs to be done to ensure that such behaviour is not repeated. Substantial investment has been made to counter anti-social behaviour, with the installation of CCTV cameras and help and information points on every station. The franchise holder, Arriva Trains Wales, has also been reaching out to the local communities through schemes such as Partnerships and Communities Together, which see the local community, the local police force and local government members coming together. Schemes to involve local schools in an adopt-a-station-style programme in conjunction with Caerphilly Fast Forward have seen local young people not only develop a sense of ownership of the station, but also develop their skills to upgrade the station.

Finally, I endorse the point—

**The Presiding Officer:** I am afraid that it is 'finally', Jeff, as you are out of time.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** It was a positive point, as well.

**The Presiding Officer:** Then we shall have it next week.

**Nick Bourne:** I will try to keep my contribution brief, although I am disappointed that we did not hear the positive points from either Huw Lewis or Jeff Cuthbert. I am sure that those points will be shared afterwards.

Casnewydd. Rhaid rhoi sylw i'r materion hyn, ac mae'n fy nghalonogi bod yna sicrwydd yr eir i'r afael â hwy, hyd yn oed os yw hynny'n golygu y bydd yn rhaid ailgodi'r bont dros heol Casnewydd rywbryd er mwyn cael rhychwant ychwanegol.

Agwedd arall ar ddarpariaeth rheilffyrdd a ddaeth yn arbennig o glir yn yr ychydig wythnosau diwethaf yw ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol a gallu teithwyr i deimlo'n ddiogel ar drên. Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod i gyd yn ymwybodol o'r ymgais i yrru trên oddi ar y cledrau, fel yr wyf wedi sôn, ger Llanbradach ar 4 Ionawr. Mae wedi dod yn amlwg mai ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol a oedd yn gyfrifol am hyn, a hynny yn yr ystyr waethaf. Gobeithio y gwelwn mai eithriad oedd hyn, ond mae angen gwneud mwy i sicrhau na fydd ymddygiad o'r fath yn ailddigwydd. Bu buddsoddi sylweddol i atal ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol, drwy osod camerâu teledu cylch cyfyng a phwyntiau cymorth a gwybodaeth ar bob gorsaf. Mae Trenau Arriva Cymru, y cwmni sydd â'r fasnachfaint, hefyd wedi bod yn estyn allan i'r cymunedau lleol drwy gyfrwng cynlluniau megis Partneriaethau a Chymunedau Gyda'i Gilydd, sy'n dod â'r gymuned leol, yr heddlu lleol ac aelodau llywodraeth leol at ei gilydd. Yn sgil cynlluniau i gynnwys ysgolion lleol mewn rhaglen debyg i fabwysiadu gorsaf ar y cyd ag Ymlaen yn Chwim Caerffili, gwelwyd pobl ifanc nid yn unig yn magu ymdeimlad o berchnogaeth ar yr orsaf, ond hefyd yn datblygu eu sgiliau i'w gwella.

Yn olaf, ategaf y pwynt—

**Y Llywydd:** Mae arnaf ofn mai 'yn olaf', fydd hynny, Jeff, gan fod eich amser ar ben.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** A hwnnw'n bwynt cadarnhaol, hefyd.

**Y Llywydd:** Fe'i cawn yr wythnos nesaf, felly.

**Nick Bourne:** Ceisiaf gadw fy nghyfraniad yn gryno, er fy mod yn siomedig na chlywsom bwyntiau cadarnhaol Huw Lewis na Jeff Cuthbert. Yr wyf yn siŵr y cawn glywed y pwyntiau hynny wedyn.

I did not serve on the committee, but I thank it for this workmanlike result. Gareth, the committee and the officials clearly worked hard in producing this extremely valuable report—I have had the opportunity to read it.

Wales has always been heavily reliant on the railways, in everything from tourism to business, including the industrial sector. I think that everyone in the Chamber would support the recommended expansion of the railways. That is the easy part, although I am sure that it was not easy getting a unanimous report in many ways. However, it will clearly prove more difficult to secure the political will and the finance necessary, as others have mentioned. We can all agree on the recommendations here, and that is what is happening, but we need the political will of the Minister and the Cabinet to achieve what is set out in the report's recommendations.

Overcrowding is mentioned, and that must be addressed by the proposed investment, because we need to move people from roads to rail. We have an expanding population using an expanded road system. The only way to counter that and reverse the increased use of roads realistically is by means of the railway system. We must do that, and that can only be done if there is the political will in terms of rolling stock and opening new stations on commuter lines, which I have spoken to the Minister about. That would be good for social reasons, health reasons and for environmental reasons. We need to do that, as well as to reopen Carno station, which has also been referred to and which I support, as well as having commuter stations between Aberystwyth and Machynlleth. I know that the Minister is looking at that issue with officials, but it demands political will from the Government.

I welcome the recommendation on using European funding, as does the Minister himself. That is particularly important in relation to north-south routes and increased capacity on the Cambrian, the Heart of Wales and the Valleys lines.

Nid oeddwn yn aelod o'r pwyllgor, ond diolchaf iddo am y canlyniad teilwng hwn. Mae'n amlwg fod Gareth, y pwyllgor a'r swyddogion wedi gweithio'n galed i gynhyrchu'r adroddiad eithriadol erthfawr hwn—yr wyf wedi cael y cyfle i'w ddarllen.

Mae Cymru wedi dibynnu'n drwm ar y rheilffyrdd erioed, ym mhob maes o dwristiaeth i fusnes, gan gynnwys y sector diwydiannol. Credaf y byddai pawb yn y Siambr yn cefnogi'r argymhelliad i ehangu'r rheilffyrdd. Dyna'r rhan hawdd, er fy mod yn siŵr nad oedd yn hawdd cael adroddiad unfrydol mewn llawer ffordd. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg y bydd yn anos sicrhau'r ewyllys gwleidyddol a'r arian angenrheidiol, fel y soniwyd gan bobl eraill. Gallwn i gyd gytuno â'r argymhellion yma, a dyna sy'n digwydd. Ond mae arnom angen ewyllys gwleidyddol y Gweinidog a'r Cabinet i wireddu'r hyn sydd yn argymhellion yr adroddiad.

Sonnir am orlenwi, a rhaid i'r buddsoddiad a gynigir fynd i'r afael â hynny, oherwydd mae angen inni symud pobl oddi ar y ffyrdd i'r rheilffyrdd. Mae ein poblogaeth yn ehangu ac yn defnyddio system ffyrdd sydd wedi'i hehangu. Yr unig ffordd realistig i newid hynny a gwrthdroi'r defnydd cynyddol ar y ffyrdd yw drwy'r system rheilffyrdd. Rhaid inni wneud hynny, a'r unig ffordd i wneud hynny yw sicrhau'r ewyllys gwleidyddol o ran cerbydau ac agor gorsafoedd newydd ar reilffyrdd cymudo. Yr wyf wedi sôn wrth y Gweinidog am hyn. Byddai hynny'n dda am resymau cymdeithasol, am resymau iechyd ac am resymau amgylcheddol. Mae angen inni wneud hynny, yn ogystal ag ailagor gorsaf Carno. Cyfeiriwyd at hynny hefyd, ac yr wyf yn ei gefnogi. Yn ogystal â hyn, mae angen gorsafoedd cymudo rhwng Aberystwyth a Machynlleth. Gwn fod y Gweinidog yn edrych ar y mater hwn gyda swyddogion, ond mae'n gofyn am ewyllys gwleidyddol gan y Llywodraeth.

Croesawaf yr argymhelliad ynglŷn â defnyddio arian Ewrop, fel y Gweinidog ei hun. Mae hynny'n arbennig o bwysig o ran llwybrau o'r gogledd i'r de a mwy o gapasiti ar reilffordd y Cambrian, rheilffordd Calon Cymru a rheilffordd y Cymoedd.

Others have mentioned service infrastructure improvements around Cardiff Queen Street, and they are important not just for commuter links in the immediate Cardiff area, but also for links to the Valleys, as mentioned by Huw Lewis, Jeff Cuthbert and others.

I am sorry to labour the point, but it is important that we make this a top priority and that we ensure that money is available, which it clearly is not at the moment. In terms of delivering on these recommendations for improvements to the railways, which I am sure we all want to see, rail has to be moved up the Government's agenda and made a really top priority. I am pleased to have been able to contribute to this debate.

**The Presiding Officer:** Thank you for being concise.

**Irene James:** I welcome this debate, and the fact that the committee recognises the crucial role that rail travel has to play in the future of transport policy in Wales. Providing the Valleys with a real alternative to the car is vital. This alternative will be available to the people of my constituency for the first time in over 40 years. I thank Nick Bourne for saying how delighted he is to see rail services in the Valleys, as it was his party that took away our rail service more than 40 years ago—*[Interruption.]* It was Mr Beeching and your party, Nick, because your party was in Government at the time.

3.20 p.m.

I am delighted with this development, but I will continue to press you, Minister, for a definite opening date for the Ebbw valley rail line. Many potential rail users welcome the return of the line, as do I, and they have been contacting me and others asking for information on the reopening. They are becoming more and more anxious as each day goes by, as they see trains used to train drivers on the line, but have no information as to when this line will finally open. I recognise that the delay is partially due to the need to guarantee safety, but more information would be welcome, as the

Mae pobl eraill wedi sôn am welliannau yn seilwaith y gwasanaeth o gwmpas Heol y Frenhines Caerdydd, ac maent yn bwysig, nid yn unig ar gyfer cysylltiadau cymudwyr yng Nghaerdydd ei hun, ond hefyd ar gyfer cysylltiadau â'r Cymoedd, fel y soniodd Huw Lewis, Jeff Cuthbert ac eraill.

Mae'n ddrwg gennyf rygnu ymlaen ar y pwynt, ond mae'n bwysig inni wneud hyn yn brif flaenoriaeth a sicrhau bod arian ar gael. Mae'n amlwg nad ydyw ar hyn o bryd. O ran rhoi'r argymhellion hyn ar waith i wella'r rheilffyrdd, sy'n rhywbeth yr ydym i gyd am ei weld, yr wyf yn siŵr, rhaid codi rheilffyrdd tua brig agenda'r Llywodraeth a'u gwneud yn wir yn brif flaenoriaeth. Yr wyf yn falch imi allu cyfrannu at y ddadl hon.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch ichi am fod yn gryno.

**Irene James:** Croesawaf y ddadl hon, a'r ffaith fod y pwyllgor yn cydnabod rôl hollbwysig teithio ar y rheilffyrdd yn nyfodol polisi trafnidiaeth yng Nghymru. Mae'n hollbwysig rhoi gwir ddewis arall i'r Cymoedd yn lle'r car. Bydd y dewis arall hwn ar gael i bobl fy etholaeth i am y tro cyntaf ers dros 40 mlynedd. Diolch i Nick Bourne am ddweud mor falch ydyw o weld gwasanaethau rheilffyrdd yn y Cymoedd, gan mai ei blaid ef a ddygodd ein gwasanaeth rheilffyrdd oddi arnom dros 40 mlynedd yn ôl—*[Torri ar draws.]* Mr Beeching a'ch plaid chi, Nick, oedd yn gyfrifol, oherwydd eich plaid chi oedd yn llywodraethu ar y pryd.

Yr wyf wrth fy modd â'r datblygiad hwn, ond byddaf yn dal i bwysu arnoch, Weinidog, am ddyddiad agor pendant ar gyfer rheilffordd Glynebwy. Mae nifer o ddarpar ddefnyddwyr rheilffyrdd yn croesawu gweld y rheilffordd yn dychwelyd, fel finau, ac y maent wedi bod yn cysylltu â mi ac â phobl eraill yn gofyn am wybodaeth am yr ailagor. Maent yn poeni fwyfwy wrth i'r diwrnodau fynd heibio, gan eu bod yn gweld trenau'n cael eu defnyddio i hyfforddi gyrwyr ar y lein, heb wybod pryd y bydd y rheilffordd hon yn agor o'r diwedd. Sylweddolaf mai er mwyn sicrhau diogelwch yn rhannol y mae'r oedi,

current lack of information causes confusion.

The rail link will go a long way towards enabling the people of the Ebbw valley to access jobs and services in Cardiff. However, more importantly, for the first time in 40 years it will provide the communities of the Ebbw valley with an alternative to the car. The Cardiff link, however, must not be viewed as the end of this project. The Newport spur of the Ebbw valley line is a vital link, which seems to have been pushed back from the agenda. While I understand and accept that there are infrastructure obstacles to be overcome, we need to reassert our commitment to delivering it as soon as possible. The line will enable people to access the employment and services that Newport provides, as well as helping to increase the frequency of trains up and down the valley. It is unreasonable to expect commuters to Newport to use a Cardiff train and then change at Rogerstone to catch a bus to Newport. It is far more likely that people wanting to travel to Newport will choose the far easier alternative, which is the car.

If we are to provide people with a real choice and alternative we must ensure that we continue to deliver high-profile projects and upgrades such as this. When things go wrong, Minister, we must ensure that the public is kept well informed as to why and how things have gone wrong. We do not seem to have done that with the Ebbw valley rail line. When it eventually opens, I am sure that everyone will welcome it for the improvements that it will bring to the communities alongside it. I hope that that will be sooner rather than later.

**Janice Gregory:** I join my colleagues in thanking everyone who was involved in producing this report. It is an important report, and, as the first committee report of the third Assembly, it sets the standard for others to follow.

I, too, welcome the consensus that the use of Valleys lines will grow by a huge amount

ond byddai'n braf cael mwy o wybodaeth, oherwydd mae'r diffyg gwybodaeth ar hyn o bryd yn peri dryswch.

Bydd y cysylltiad rheilffordd yn cyfrannu'n sylweddol at alluogi pobl Glynebwy i fanteisio ar swyddi a gwasanaethau yng Nghaerdydd. Fodd bynnag, yn bwysicach na hynny, am y tro cyntaf ers 40 mlynedd bydd yn rhoi dewis arall i gymunedau Glynebwy yn lle'r car. Serch hynny, ni ddylid ystyried y cysylltiad â Chaerdydd yn ddiwedd y prosiect hwn. Mae cangen Casnewydd o reilffordd Glynebwy yn gysylltiad hollbwysig sydd, i bob golwg, wedi'i wthio'n ôl oddi ar yr agenda. Er fy mod yn deall ac yn derbyn bod rhwystrau i'w goresgyn o ran seilwaith, mae angen inni ail-ategu ein hymrwymiad i'w darparu cyn gynted ag y bo modd. Bydd y rheilffordd yn galluogi pobl i fanteisio ar y swyddi a'r gwasanaethau a gynigir yng Nghasnewydd, yn ogystal â helpu cael trenau i deithio'n amlach i fyny ac i lawr y cwm. Mae'n afresymol disgwyl i gymudwyr i Gasnewydd ddefnyddio trê'n i Gaerdydd ac wedyn newid yn y Tŷ-du i ddal bws i Gasnewydd. Mae'n fwy tebygol o lawer y bydd pobl sydd am deithio i Gasnewydd yn dewis y llwybr llawer haws, sef y car.

Os ydym i roi dewis go iawn a dewis amgen i bobl, rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn parhau i ddarparu prosiectau a gwelliannau uchel eu proffil fel hyn. Pan aiff pethau o le, Weinidog, rhaid inni sicrhau bod y cyhoedd yn cael gwybod yn iawn paham a sut y mae pethau wedi mynd o le. I bob golwg, nid ydym wedi gwneud hynny gyda rheilffordd Glynebwy. Pan fydd yn agor maes o law, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd pawb yn ei chroesawu oherwydd y gwelliannau a ddaw yn ei sgil i'r cymunedau ar ei hyd. Gobeithio mai'n gynharach yn hytrach nag yn hwyrach y bydd hynny.

**Janice Gregory:** Ymunaf â'm cyd-Aelodau i ddiolch i bawb a fu'n ymwneud â chynhyrchu'r adroddiad hwn. Mae'n adroddiad pwysig, a chan mai dyma'r adroddiad pwyllgor cyntaf gan y trydydd Cynulliad, mae'n gosod y safon i eraill ei dilyn.

Yr wyf fi hefyd yn croesawu'r consensws y bydd cynnydd anferth o ran defnyddio

within the next 10 years. Investing in rail is crucial for the future of our environment and our communities. I welcome the improvement in rail services for my constituents in Ogmore. We have seen the reopening of the Llanharan railway station, which is a £4 million state-of-the-art development, the £1.2 million scheme to extend the platforms and increase capacity on the Maesteg line, more frequent services from Bridgend to Swansea and Cardiff, and improvements to the rolling stock. All of these improvements will benefit my constituents.

However, there are people who pay a high price for these improvements. Colleagues have mentioned extensions to Valley lines railway stations, which we accept and applaud. However, on Friday night, I visited constituents in Garth in the Llynfi valley in my constituency, whose houses back on to the line where the platform is being extended. Their privacy and security is severely compromised, and, instead of views across the beautiful Llynfi valley, all they will see in the future will be the ankles and knees of passengers waiting on the platform.

Network Rail suggests that raising a wall to create a 12-foot barrier between them and the world is the answer. There must be a better answer. My constituents know that we need to get people back onto the trains, and applaud that and agree with it. However, it is not good enough for Network Rail to plough ahead with work such as this without talking to local residents first. It is not good enough for the local council to wash its hands of the matter when it should have consulted local residents at the outset. The Assembly, which is leading and financing the revival of Welsh railways, cannot ignore those who will lose out, as these constituents of mine will. I wholeheartedly support the efforts to improve and develop our rail services, but I call on the Welsh Assembly Government to make it clear to Network Rail and to local authorities that our future support depends on their undertaking to show basic consideration for the residents affected by the work.

rheilffyrdd y Cymoedd yn y 10 mlynedd nesaf. Mae'n hollbwysig buddsoddi yn y rheilffyrdd i sicrhau dyfodol ein hamgylchedd a'n cymunedau. Croesawaf wella'r gwasanaethau rheilffordd ar gyfer fy etholwyr yn Ogwr. Gwelsom ailagor gorsaf reilffordd Llanharan, sy'n ddatblygiad o'r math mwyaf cyfoes un a gostiodd £4 miliwn, y cynllun £1.2 miliwn i ymestyn y platfformau a chynyddu'r capasiti ar reilffordd Maesteg, gwasanaethau amlach o Ben-y-bont ar Ogwr i Abertawe a Chaerdydd, a gwella'r cerbydau. Bydd y gwelliannau hyn i gyd o fudd i'm hetholwyr i.

Fodd bynnag, mae rhai pobl yn talu'n ddrud am y gwelliannau hyn. Mae cyd-Aelodau wedi sôn am estyniadau yng ngorsafoddd rheilffyrdd y Cymoedd, ac yr ydym yn derbyn ac yn cymeradwyo hynny. Fodd bynnag, nos Wener, ymwelais ag etholwyr yn y Garth yng Nghwm Llynfi yn fy etholaeth. Mae tai'r bobl hyn yn cefnu ar y lein lle mae'r platfform yn cael ei ymestyn. Mae eu preifatrwydd a'u diogelwch dan fygythiad difrifol, ac yn hytrach na gweld y golygfeydd ar draws hyfrydwch Cwm Llynfi, y cyfan a welant yn y dyfodol fydd fferau a phengliniau teithwyr yn disgwyl ar y platfform.

Mae Network Rail yn awgrymu mai'r ateb yw codi wal i greu rhwystr 12-troedfedd rhyngddynt a'r byd. Mae'n rhaid bod ateb gwell. Mae fy etholwyr yn gwybod bod angen inni gael pobl yn ôl ar y trenau, ac maent yn cymeradwyo hynny ac yn cytuno â'r bwriad. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n ddigon da bod Network Rail yn bwrw ymlaen â gwaith fel hyn heb siarad â thrigolion lleol yn gyntaf. Nid yw'n ddigon da bod y cyngor lleol yn diosg pob cyfrifoldeb pan ddylai fod wedi ymgynghori â thrigolion lleol ar y cychwyn. Ni all y Cynulliad, sy'n arwain ac yn ariannu adfywio rheilffyrdd Cymru, anwybyddu'r rhai a fydd ar eu colled, fel y bydd y bobl hyn yn fy etholaeth. Yr wyf yn cefnogi'n llwyr yr ymdrechion i wella a datblygu ein gwasanaethau rheilffyrdd, ond galwaf ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i'w gwneud yn glir i Network Rail ac i awdurdodau lleol fod ein cefnogaeth yn y dyfodol yn dibynnu ar gael addewid ganddynt y byddant yn rhoi ystyriaeth sylfaenol i'r trigolion yr effeithir arnynt gan y gwaith.



**Alun Davies:** I have spoken on railway issues several times in the Chamber and on those occasions I have discussed the Cambrian main line, the Cambrian coastline and the Heart of Wales line. On this occasion, I wish to speak about the lines west of Swansea, serving Carmarthenshire and Pembrokeshire. With a population of around 300,000 people, which is almost the equivalent of Cardiff, these counties enjoy a service that is inadequate, antiquated and entirely insufficient to meet rising passenger demand, public expectation or even the stated vision of this Government.

We have discussed, on many occasions, the main transport links serving Pembrokeshire and Carmarthenshire, usually in terms of the A40, and I acknowledge many of the points raised in the Chamber in that regard. The Minister has responded by saying, and I agree with him, as it happens, that we should place an equal focus on the future of public transport and the rail links, in particular, serving those counties and that particular transport corridor. I was disappointed, therefore, to see no mention of any of the lines west of Swansea in the committee's report and in the Minister's response, although I accept that the Minister is responding to the report as published. While I appreciate the committee's work and I recognise the hard work that has gone into writing the report and into bringing many issues to the attention of the Assembly and the wider community, I believe that to develop an effective public transport network that serves the whole of Wales, we must recognise the importance of the lines west of Swansea, where the service is laughable.

There is a piece in today's *Western Telegraph*, and I doubt that many of you have seen it, about someone called Ben Large—a 22-year-old who travels from Kilgetty to Pembroke to work. There are occasions when he cannot get to work in the morning because the train simply does not turn up. Frankly, that is not the level of service that people require in Pembrokeshire or Carmarthenshire

**Alun Davies:** Yr wyf wedi sôn am faterion rheilffyrdd droeon yn y Siambr, ac ar yr adegau hynny yr wyf wedi trafod prif reilffordd y Cambrian, rheilffordd arfordir y Cambrian, a rheilffordd Calon Cymru. Y tro hwn, dymunaf sôn am y rheilffyrdd i'r gorllewin o Abertawe, sy'n gwasanaethu sir Gaerfyrddin a sir Benfro. Mae gan y siroedd hyn boblogaeth o ryw 300,000 o bobl, sy'n cyfateb bron i boblogaeth Caerdydd. Mae'r gwasanaeth a gânt yn annigonol, yn hen iawn ac yn gwbl analluog i ateb y galw cynyddol gan deithwyr, disgwyliadau'r cyhoedd neu hyd yn oed y weledigaeth yn natganiadau'r Llywodraeth hon.

Yr ydym wedi trafod droeon y prif gysylltiadau cludiant sy'n gwasanaethu sir Benfro a sir Gaerfyrddin, fel rheol drwy sôn am yr A40, ac yr wyf yn cydnabod nifer o'r pwyntiau a godwyd yn y Siambr yn y cyswllt hwnnw. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi ymateb drwy ddweud, a chytunaf ag ef, fel y mae'n digwydd, y dylem roi'r un ffocws ar ddyfodol cludiant cyhoeddus ac ar y cysylltiadau'r rheilffyrdd, yn enwedig y rheini sy'n gwasanaethu'r siroedd hynny a'r llwybr trafniadaeth penodol hwnnw. Yr oeddwn yn siomedig, felly, o weld nad oedd sôn am yr un o'r rheilffyrdd i'r gorllewin o Abertawe yn adroddiad y pwyllgor nac yn ymateb y Gweinidog, er fy mod yn derbyn mai ymateb i'r adroddiad fel y'i cyhoeddwyd y mae'r Gweinidog. Er fy mod yn gwerthfawrogi gwaith y pwyllgor ac yn cydnabod y gwaith caled a wnaethpwyd wrth ysgrifennu'r adroddiad ac wrth ddod â nifer o faterion i sylw'r Cynulliad a'r gymuned ehangach, er mwyn datblygu rhwydwaith cludiant cyhoeddus effeithiol sy'n gwasanaethu Cymru gyfan, credaf ei bod yn rhaid inni gydnabod pwysigrwydd y rheilffyrdd i'r gorllewin o Abertawe, lle mae'r gwasanaeth yn chwerthinllyd.

Mae darn yn y *Western Telegraph* heddiw, ac mae'n amheus gennyf a oes llawer ohonoch wedi'i weld, am ddyn o'r enw Ben Large—sy'n 22 oed ac yn teithio o Gilgeti i Benfro i weithio. Ar brydiau, ni all fynd i'w waith yn y bore am nad yw'r trê'n yn cyrraedd. A bod yn blwmp ac yn blaen, nid dyna lefel y gwasanaeth y mae ar bobl ei hangen yn sir Benfro neu yn sir Gaerfyrddin, ac nid dyna

and it is not the standard of service that we should accept anywhere in Wales today.

Therefore, in taking forward the development of rail throughout Wales, I hope that we will see an equal emphasis on the lines west of Swansea. I hope that the Minister will be able to outline his priorities and his service objectives for these lines. I believe that we need to see improvements in the infrastructure, the potential line speed and the frequency of service and an improvement in connectivity for people travelling from Pembrokeshire and Carmarthenshire to the rest of the UK network.

I hope that the Government and the Minister will work closely with the transport consortium in the area and with others to create—and this is the important point—a specific development plan for those services west of Swansea. We want, need and demand a fast, frequent, clean, timely and efficient rail service that serves the whole of Pembrokeshire and Carmarthenshire. In the twenty-first century, I do not think that that is too much to demand.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Diolch am y cyfle byr hwn i gyfrannu. Yr oeddwn yn aelod o'r cyn bwyllgor tua dwy flynedd yn ôl. I Alun gael gwybod, bu i mi grybwyll y materion hyn fel rhai pwysig, ond, wrth gwrs, y mae pethau yn symud ymlaen.

3.30 p.m.

Mae pawb yn gwybod, ac yn diflasu weithiau i glywed, fy mod yn deithiwr cyson ar y trenau o'r gogledd i'r de. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn edrych ar hynny. Yr wyf yn cytuno â Huw bod angen edrych yn fanwl ar y Cymoedd, ond mae diffyg democrataidd yng Nghymru oherwydd diffyg cyswllt gweithredol rhwng y de a'r gogledd. Mae hynny yn amharu arnom ni i gyd yn y gogledd. Mae pawb yn cwyno, fel y gwyddom, am y ffyrdd a'r trenau. Yn yr amser byr sydd gennyf, crybwyllaf ambell fater pwysig.

Like the Federation of Small Businesses, the

safon y gwasanaeth y dylem ei derbyn yn unman yng Nghymru heddiw.

Felly, wrth fwrw ymlaen i ddatblygu'r rheilffyrdd ledled Cymru, gobeithio y gwelwn yr un pwyslais ar y rheilffyrdd i'r gorllewin o Abertawe. Gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn gallu amlinellu ei flaenoriaethau a'i amcanion gwasanaeth ar gyfer y rheilffyrdd hyn. Credaf fod angen inni weld gwella'r seilwaith, gwella'r cyflymder posibl ar y rheilffordd ac amllder y gwasanaeth, ynghyd â gwella'r cysylltiadau i bobl sy'n teithio o sir Benfro a sir Gaerfyrddin i weddill rhwydwaith y DU.

Gobeithio y bydd y Llywodraeth a'r Gweinidog yn gweithio'n glos gyda'r consortiwm trafniadaeth yn yr ardal a chyda phobl eraill i greu—a dyma'r pwynt pwysig—cynllun datblygu penodol ar gyfer y gwasanaethau hynny i'r gorllewin o Abertawe. Gwasanaeth trenau sy'n gyflym, yn aml, yn lân, yn brydlon ac yn effeithlon—dyna yr ydym am ei gael, dyna y mae ei angen arnom a dyna yr ydym yn ei fynnu—a hwnnw'n wasanaeth sy'n gwasanaethu sir Benfro a sir Gaerfyrddin benbaladr. Yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain, ni chredaf fod hynny'n ormod i'w fynnu.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Thank you for the brief opportunity to contribute. I was a member of the former committee some two years ago. For Alun's information, I did mention these issues as important ones, but, of course, things move on.

Everyone knows, and we are sometimes tired of hearing, that I am a travel regularly by train from north to south Wales. It is important that we look at this. I agree with Huw that we need to look closely at the Valleys, but there is a democratic deficiency in Wales because of the lack of an operational link between north and south. That affects us all in north Wales. Everyone complains, as we know, about roads and rail. In the short time that I have, I will mention a few important issues.

Fel y Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach, mae

Welsh Liberal Democrats are very keen to see improved reliability. There should be car parking improvements, ticketing should be cheaper and there should be simpler choices. Freight should be moved from road to rail. A former Assembly Member could not get here from Wrexham yesterday because of flooding. It is very important that we pay due regard to the infrastructure issues because of flooding. They affect us in north Wales in the Conwy valley and they obviously affected this previous Assembly Member because he could not get here from Wrexham yesterday. On those very brief points, I look forward with great excitement to hearing Ieuan Wyn Jones's vision. I could not see that vision in the Institute of Welsh Affairs meeting last Friday in Llandudno; that was pretty poor, so I hope for something better this afternoon.

**The Deputy First Minister:** I thank Members for their responses to the report. I hope that they will forgive me today, because despite the strictures of the Chair, Members have discussed matters particularly affecting their constituencies. I suppose that, in their position, I would have done the same, but the reality is that I simply do not have the time to address all the local issues that have been raised, except to say that we have made it clear in the 'One Wales' agreement that we have an all-Wales approach to these matters and that we will be addressing many of those concerns as part of that particular commitment.

On Andrew R.T. Davies's point about the rolling stock, the promise that we have made is £5.6 million. Looking at the strategic overview, the two overriding themes that have come out of this particular debate in an all-Wales context is that, first, it is not a case anymore of persuading more people to use the trains; it is actually accommodating the growth that is projected. I want to make it absolutely clear that we will be looking at our own monitoring of the forecast of demand. Although some people are concerned about whether that in itself is robust enough, I am sure that they will have heard me say, in my

Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn awyddus iawn i weld gwasanaethau mwy dibynadwy. Dylid gwella cyfleusterau parcio, dylai tocynnau fod yn rhatach a dylai dewisiadau haws fod ar gael. Dylid symud cludwyr nwyddau oddi ar y ffyrdd i'r rheilffyrdd. Nid oedd cyn Aelod Cynulliad yn gallu cyrraedd yma o Wrecsam ddoe oherwydd llifogydd. Mae'n bwysig iawn inni roi sylw dyledus i faterion yn ymwneud â seilwaith oherwydd llifogydd. Maent yn effeithio arnom ni yn y gogledd yn nyffryn Conwy, ac y mae'n amlwg iddynt effeithio ar y cyn Aelod Cynulliad hwn gan na allai gyrraedd yma o Wrecsam ddoe. Ar y pwyntiau byr iawn hynny, edrychaf ymlaen yn eiddgar i glywed am weledigaeth Ieuan Wyn Jones. Ni welais y weledigaeth honno yng nghyfarfod y Sefydliad Materion Cymreig ddydd Gwener diwethaf yn Llandudno; yr oedd hynny'n wael, felly, gobeithiaf am rywbeth gwell y prynhawn yma.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Diolch i'r Aelodau am eu hymatebion i'r adroddiad. Gobeithio y maddeuant imi heddiw, oherwydd er y cerydd gan y Cadeirydd, mae'r Aelodau wedi trafod materion sy'n effeithio'n benodol ar eu hetholaethau. Mae'n debyg, yn eu sefyllfa hwy, y byddwn innau wedi gwneud yr un peth. Ond y gwirionedd yw nad oes amser gennyf i fynd i'r afael â'r holl faterion lleol a godwyd, heblaw dweud ein bod wedi gwneud yn glir yng nghytundeb 'Cymru'n Un' fod gennym ymagwedd Cymru gyfan tuag at y materion hyn, ac y byddwn yn mynd i'r afael â nifer o'r pryderon hynny fel rhan o'r ymrwymiad penodol hwnnw.

O ran pwynt Andrew R.T. Davies am y cerbydau, yr addewid yr ydym wedi'i wneud yw £5.6 miliwn. O edrych ar y trosolwg strategol, y ddwy thema bwysicaf sydd wedi tarddu o'r ddadl benodol hon yng nghydestun Cymru gyfan yw, yn gyntaf, nad mater o ddarbwylllo mwy o bobl i ddefnyddio'r trenau mohono, ond mater o ddarparu ar gyfer y twf a ragwelir. Hoffwn ei gwneud yn gwbl glir y byddwn yn edrych ar y ffordd y byddwn ni ein hunain yn monitro'r rhagolygon o ran y galw. Er bod rhai pobl yn pryderu a yw hynny ynddo'i hun yn ddigon cryf, mae'n siŵr iddynt fy nghlywed yn

initial remarks, that we will be constantly monitoring the level of demand to make absolutely sure that, if forecasts have to be revised upwards, we would want to do so. I would rather have the challenge of meeting the rising demand than trying to persuade more people to use the trains. It is a nice challenge to have. Nevertheless, it is one that means that I must use the resources at my disposal in the best possible way.

The other underlying theme was that, although there were demands about increased services and so on, there was also a need to ensure that travel on trains is safe and reliable. Although that is primarily an issue for the train operators, we are working with them to ensure that people feel safe when they travel and on the station and that there is adequate car parking at stations. Much work has been done between my officials, train operators and Network Rail to try to move that agenda forward.

Finally, I will briefly refer to the constant demand—and Andrew R.T. Davies also mentioned this—to try to shift more freight from road to rail. That is an important agenda, but it is not easy to achieve. The first reason for that is the cost. Apparently, there can only be a proper comparison between the two over long distances, and it is very difficult to justify freight movements over short distances. However, I would like to work with transport operators and the private sector to see how much of a modal shift we can achieve, and, over longer distances, to ensure that we have the infrastructure changes in place and the ability to shift freight properly from road to rail at appropriate junctions.

I hope that the debate today has reflected the fact that there is a great deal of interest in improving our train services. I am pretty sure that all the things that we were not able to deal with today can be dealt with as we move forward to have discussions on the transport strategy and the delivery plan for the national rail network and to when I make announcements on particular investments in the year to come.

dweud, yn fy sylwadau cychwynnol, y byddwn yn monitro'r galw yn barhaus er mwyn bod yn gwbl sicr, os bydd yn rhaid adolygu'r rhagolygon a'u cynyddu, y byddem am wneud hynny. Byddai'n well gennyf gael yr her o ddiwallu galw cynyddol yn hytrach na cheisio darbwylllo mwy o bobl i ddefnyddio'r trenau. Mae'n her braf. Serch hynny, mae'n her sy'n golygu ei bod yn rhaid imi ddefnyddio'r adnoddau sydd ar gael imi yn y ffordd orau posibl.

Y thema sylfaenol arall, er bod galw am ragor o wasanaethau ac ati, oedd bod angen sicrhau hefyd fod teithio ar drenau yn ddiogel ac yn ddibynadwy. Er mai mater i'r cwmnïau trenau yn bennaf yw hynny, yr ydym yn cydweithio â hwy i sicrhau bod pobl yn teimlo'n ddiogel wrth deithio ac yn yr orsaf, a bod lleoedd parcio digonol mewn gorsafoedd. Gwnaethpwyd llawer o waith rhwng fy swyddogion, cwmnïau trenau a Network Rail i geisio symud yr agenda honno yn ei blaen.

Yn olaf, cyfeiriai yn fyr at y galw parhaus—a soniodd Andrew R.T. Davies hefyd am hyn—i geisio symud mwy o gludwyr nwyddau oddi ar y ffyrdd i'r rheilffyrdd. Mae honno'n agenda bwysig, ond nid yw'n hawdd ei chyflawni. Y rheswm cyntaf am hynny yw'r gost. Yn ôl pob tebyg, dros bellteroedd mawr yn unig y gellir gwneud cymhariaeth deg rhwng y ddau, ac mae'n anodd iawn cyfiawnhau symud nwyddau dros bellteroedd byr. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn weithio gyda chwmnïau cludiant a'r sector preifat i weld faint o newid modd y gallwn ei gyflawni, a sicrhau, dros bellteroedd mawr, fod y newidiadau seilwaith gennym ar waith a'r gallu i symud cludo nwyddau'n llwyddiannus oddi ar y ffyrdd i'r rheilffyrdd mewn cyffyrdd priodol.

Gobeithio bod y ddadl hon heddiw wedi adlewyrchu'r ffaith fod llawer iawn o ddiddordeb yng ngwella ein gwasanaethau trên. Yr wyf yn eithaf sicr y gellir ymdrin â'r holl bethau nad oedd modd inni ymdrin â hwy heddiw wrth inni symud ymlaen i drafod y strategaeth drafnidiaeth a'r cynllun cyflawni ar gyfer y rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd cenedlaethol, a phryd y byddaf yn gwneud cyhoeddiadau am fuddsoddiadau penodol yn ystod y flwyddyn i ddod.

**Gareth Jones:** Diolch am y cyfle i gael y gair olaf—gair byr fydd hwnnw, ac nid araith. Mae'r Aelodau wedi cael cyfle i siarad. Diolchaf am y geiriau caredig. Fel y dywedais ar y cychwyn, mae'n bleser imi gadeirio'r pwyllgor hwn a chael cydweithio gyda'r aelodau. Gwn mor frwdfrydig yw'r aelodau. Diolchaf yn arbennig i'r swyddogion a'r clerics a'r dirprwy glerc sydd mor barod i'n cynorthwyo.

Mae'r ddadl wedi dangos bod dwy lefel i hyn, efallai. Mae lefel strategol o ran datblygu dyfodol y rheilffyrdd. Bu i'r pwyllgor geisio cadw at y cledrau hynny, os caf ddefnyddio'r gair hwnnw. Gwelsom hefyd, o'r ddadl hon, sut mae Aelodau yn pwysleisio dadleuon sy'n bwysig yn eu cymunedau. Mae'r haen gymdeithasol yr un mor bwysig â'r lefel strategol. Gwn fod yr elfennau hynny yn gorgyffwrdd a'u bod yn rhyngddibynnol ond, i bwrpas y craffu a'r adroddiad hwn, yr oedd yn bwysig inni gadw at y ddau bapur sydd wedi symbylu'r holl beth. Efallai fod rhai Aelodau yn teimlo ein bod wedi esgeuluso pethau fel yr amgylchedd ac, efallai, ranbarthau Cymru, ond nid oedd y pethau hynny yn ein cylch gorchwyl.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog am ei ymateb. Y neges syml oddi wrth y pwyllgor yw: dyma'r negeseuon, dyma yr ydym ni wedi'i ddarganfod, Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog, a gwyddom y byddwch yn gwranddo. Mae sut i ymateb o fewn y ffiniau gwleidyddol a phob peth arall, gyda'r adnoddau sydd ar gael, i fyny i Lywodraeth Cymru. Yr ydym yn dechrau ar y broses graffu yma, a bydd yr holl bethau y mae Aelodau wedi cyfeirio atynt wedi'u cofnodi a bydd y pwyllgor yn ailystyried y pwyntiau pwysig hyn. Yr wyf yn mawr obeithio y bydd y broses graffu yn mynd yn ei blaen yn effeithiol.

**Y Llywydd:** Gan nad oes neb wedi siarad yn ei erbyn, cymeraf fod y cynnig wedi'i dderbyn. Yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.35, felly, caiff y cynnig ei dderbyn.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Gareth Jones:** Thank you for the opportunity to have the final word—it will be a brief word, not a speech. Members have had the opportunity to speak. I am grateful for the kind words. As I said at the beginning, it is a pleasure to chair this committee and to work with the members. I know how enthusiastic the members are. I especially thank the clerk and the deputy clerk, who are so willing to help.

The debate has shown that there are, perhaps, two levels to this. There is a strategic level, in terms of developing the future of railways. The committee tried to keep to those tracks, if I may use that word. We also saw, from this debate, how Members emphasise arguments which are important in their communities. The social level is as important as the strategic level. I know that those two elements coincide and that they are interdependent. But for scrutiny purposes and for the purposes of this report, it was important for us to adhere to the two papers which led us to this point. Some Members may feel that we have neglected some issues, such as the environment and, perhaps, the regions of Wales, but those issues were not within our remit.

I am grateful to the Deputy First Minister for his response. The committee's simple message is this: these are the messages, this is what we have discovered, Deputy First Minister, and we know that you will listen. How it responds, within the political constraints and everything else, with the resources that are available, is up to the Government of Wales. We are embarking upon the scrutiny process here, and everything Members have said will be recorded and the committee will revisit those important issues. I sincerely hope that the scrutiny process progresses effectively.

**The Presiding Officer:** As no-one has spoken against, I take it that the motion is carried. In accordance with Standing Order No. 7.35, the motion is therefore agreed.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd (Rosemary Butler) i'r Gadair am 3.38 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer (Rosemary Butler) took the Chair at 3.38 p.m.*

## **Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives Debate**

### **Gwerth Ychwanegol Crynswth Gross Value Added**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Carwyn Jones and amendment 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

**Y Dirprwy Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Carwyn Jones, a gwelliant 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

**David Melding:** I propose that

**David Melding:** Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

*notes with concern the continuing decline in the gross value added figures for Wales. (NDM3849)*

*yn nodi â phryder y gostyngiad parhaus yn ffigurau gwerth ychwanegol crynswth Cymru. (NDM3849)*

Alas, this debate comes at a gloomy time in terms of the world economic situation. When we laid this debate last week, we could not have anticipated the latest turmoil in the markets and the considerable decline in consumer confidence that is now taking place in the United States. There are now widespread fears of a recession in the US, and most commentators predict that it will have a big impact on the whole world economy, but particularly on the UK, possibly, and other parts of Europe.

Yn anffodus, cynhelir y ddadl hon ar amser digalon yn hanes sefyllfa economaidd y byd. Pan gyflwynwyd y ddadl hon yr wythnos diwethaf, ni allem fod wedi rhagweld yr helbul diweddaraf yn y marchnadoedd a'r dirywiad sylweddol sy'n digwydd yn awr yn hyder defnyddwyr yn yr Unol Daleithiau. Bellach mae yna ofnau mawr y bydd dirwasgiad yn yr Unol Daleithiau, ac mae'r rhan fwyaf o sylwebwyr yn rhagweld y caiff effaith fawr ar economi'r byd i gyd, ond yn arbennig ar y DU, o bosibl, a rhannau eraill o Ewrop.

It is important that we do not talk ourselves into a recession in the UK. I think that we will probably avoid one. However, there will clearly be a climate of reduced growth, given the current world situation, and there is not an awful lot that we can do about that. However, we must try to mitigate its consequences by being as effective as possible in the economic policy that we can control in the Assembly.

Mae'n bwysig inni beidio ag argyhoeddi ein hunain y bydd dirwasgiad yn y DU. Credaf hwyrach y byddwn yn ei osgoi. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg y bydd hinsawdd o lai o dwf, o gofio sefyllfa bresennol y byd, ac nid oes fawr ddim y gallwn ei wneud ynglŷn â hynny. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni geisio lliniaru ei ganlyniadau drwy fod mor effeithiol â phosibl yn y polisi economaidd y gallwn ei reoli yn y Cynulliad.

Over the last eight or nine years, the Labour Government at Westminster has enjoyed benign economic conditions. Gordon Brown chose to spend during a time of economic boom and now that we are seeing economic distress, we have to cut back on public spending, such is the current deficit in our budget, which is the highest of any country in

Dros yr wyth neu'r naw mlynedd diwethaf, mae'r Llywodraeth Lafur yn San Steffan wedi mwynhau amodau economaidd caredig. Dewisodd Gordon Brown wario yn ystod cyfnod o lewyrch economaidd, a chan ein bod bellach yn gweld caledi economaidd, rhaid inni gwtogi gwariant cyhoeddus, cymaint yw'r diffyg yn ein cyllideb, sydd

Europe. The fundamentals of our economy, in Wales and in the rest of the UK, will be considerably tested during the course of 2008.

3.40 p.m.

It is against that background that we consider the current GVA figures. They fell again for 2006, which is of great concern to us, because GVA figures are the measure of choice; at one time, we used to have targets for them. There was a Labour Government a long time ago that used to boast about its target to improve the GVA figures, but that has long been abandoned. It is, however, a measure that is used by international organisations and economists as an effective measure of economic health and an excellent measure of how regions are doing within particular economies.

If you look at the key indicators, we have to ask where Wales is doing badly. Most of the data are challenging—that is the kindest interpretation that I can put on it. I will only run through some of them, because I do not want to smother people in numbers. Of the 12 regions of the UK, we are in eighth position in terms of innovation, measured according to the number of registered patents. Our figures are about a third lower than the total for the UK as a whole. That indicator is not very good. In terms of enterprise, we are the tenth region in the UK, measured according to business start-ups. On creativity, we are at the bottom of all UK regions, measured according to the proportion of our companies that are knowledge-based enterprises.

On education, the situation is better—we are middling. We are in sixth position, measured according to the number of people who have degrees. Perhaps we should focus on the education indicator, because we have to play to our strengths and try to improve those indicators in general. Where there has been some progress and where there is a better foundation, we need to take advantage of that. Our graduate retention rates are not bad—they are not the best in the UK, but they are middling or a little better. Again, that is a key sign of improvement in entrepreneurship and economic health.

gyda'r uchaf o blith holl wledydd Ewrop. Caiff sylfeini ein heconomi, yng Nghymru ac yng ngweddill y DU, eu profi'n sylweddol yn ystod 2008.

Yn y cefndir hwnnw yr ydym yn ystyried y ffigurau GYC cyfredol. Gwelwyd gostyngiad arall ynddynt am 2006, sy'n bryder mawr inni, oherwydd ffigurau GYC yw'r mesur a ddewiswyd; ar un adeg yr oedd gennym dargedau ar eu cyfer. Yr oedd yna Lywodraeth Lafur amser maith yn ôl a arferai frolio am ei tharged i wella'r ffigurau GYC, ond rhoddwyd y gorau i hynny ers tro. Fodd bynnag, mae'n fesur a ddefnyddir gan sefydliadau ac economegwyr rhyngwladol fel mesur effeithiol o economi iach a mesur rhagorol o sefyllfaoedd rhanbarthau o fewn economïau penodol.

Os edrychwch ar y dangosyddion allweddol, rhaid inni ofyn ymhle mae sefyllfa Cymru'n wael. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r data yn heriol-dyna'r dehongliad mwyaf caredig y gallaf ei gynnig. Soniaf am rai ohonynt yn unig, oherwydd nid wyf am orlethu pobl â rhifau. O blith 12 rhanbarth y DU, yr ydym yn yr wythfed safle o ran arloesed, sy'n cael ei fesur yn ôl nifer y patentau a gofrestrir. Mae ein ffigur tua thraean yn is na'r cyfanswm ar gyfer y DU gyfan. Nid yw'r dangosydd hwnnw yn un da iawn. O ran menter, yr ydym yn y degfed safle o blith rhanbarthau'r DU, sy'n cael ei fesur ar sail nifer y busnesau newydd. O ran creadigrwydd, yr ydym ar y gwaelod o blith pob rhanbarth yn y DU, sy'n cael ei fesur yn ôl cyfran ein cwmnïau sy'n fentrau sy'n seiliedig ar wybodaeth.

O ran addysg, mae'r sefyllfa'n well—yr ydym yn y canol. Yr ydym yn y chweched safle, sy'n cael ei fesur yn ôl nifer y bobl sydd â gradd. Efallai y dylem ganolbwyntio ar y dangosydd addysg, oherwydd rhaid inni fanteisio ar ein cryfderau a cheisio gwella'r dangosyddion hynny'n gyffredinol. Lle y gwnaethpwyd rhywfaint o gynnydd a lle y mae gwell sylfaen, rhaid inni fanteisio ar hynny. Nid yw ein cyfraddau cadw graddedigion yn ddrwg—nid ydynt gyda'r gorau yn y DU, ond maent yn y canol neu ychydig yn well na hynny. Unwaith eto, mae hynny'n arwydd pendant o welliant mewn

Therefore, I take some sustenance from that. Higher education qualifications, particularly PhDs and MAs, are linked to innovation in the economy. Therefore, that is clearly an area in which we can try to drive up improvements.

What is key to improving our GVA? First, it has to be productivity. Again, I have not taken the worst figures; I have tried to use the best construction possible of the Welsh data, by taking the GVA per hour worked. However, even on that measure, Wales is 8 per cent below the UK average, making us the second worst region. Our productivity is some 25 per cent below that of the London region. According to economists, productivity probably accounts for a fifth of the difference between Welsh and UK GVA figures. Therefore, clearly, being a more competitive and productive economy has to be one of our key tasks.

Secondly, I will mention employment. I want to acknowledge that there has been some improvement—the reduction in unemployment levels is to be welcomed. We are now just about touching the UK average, and we have been a little better than that average at times. The situation in employment is more encouraging. However, when you look at GVA, it is economic activity rates that are the main driver, and the fact that we have relatively poor activity rates probably accounts for a quarter of the difference between our average GVA figure and that of the UK.

He is not in the Chamber at the moment, but, in the previous debate, we heard an excellent speech by Huw Lewis on the priorities for transport investment, in which he made a plea, with great skill, for Merthyr, Rhymney and the northern parts of the Valleys. If you look at economic activity, a key indicator of health is the ease with which people can commute. If you do not have access to a car, or to regular, reliable public transport, it is practically impossible to commute to the areas where the jobs are. In successful regional economies you will see that it is relatively easy to move people from where they live—often in areas that used to be

entrepreneuriaeth a ffyniant yr economi. Felly, cymeraf rywfaint o gysur o hynny. Mae cymwysterau addysg uwch, yn arbennig graddau PhD ac MA, yn gysylltiedig ag arloesedd yn yr economi. Felly, mae'n amlwg bod hwn yn faes lle y gallwn geisio sicrhau gwelliannau.

Beth sy'n allweddol i wella ein GYC? Yn gyntaf, cynhyrchiant, yn ddi-os. Eto, nid wyf wedi cymryd y ffigurau gwaethaf; yr wyf wedi ceisio defnyddio'r dehongliad gorau posibl o ddata Cymru, drwy gymryd y GYC fesul awr a weithiwyd. Fodd bynnag, hyd yn oed gyda'r mesur hwnnw, mae Cymru 8 y cant yn is na chyfartaledd y DU, sy'n ein rhoi yn y safle gwaethaf ond un o blith y rhanbarthau. Mae ein cynhyrchiant tua 25 y cant yn is na rhanbarth Llundain. Yn ôl yr economegwyr, mae cynhyrchiant yn cyfrif am un rhan o bump o'r gwahaniaeth rhwng ffigurau GYC Cymru a'r DU. Felly, mae'n amlwg mai un o'n prif dasgau yw sicrhau economi fwy cystadleuol a chynhyrchiol.

Yn ail, soniaf am gyflogaeth. Hoffwn gydnabod bod rhywfaint o welliant wedi bod—dylid croesawu'r gostyngiad mewn lefelau diweithdra. Yr ydym bellach bron â chyrraedd cyfartaledd y DU, ac yr ydym wedi bod ychydig yn well na hynny ar adegau. Mae'r sefyllfa o ran cyflogaeth yn fwy calonogol. Fodd bynnag, pan edrychwch ar GYC, y cyfraddau gweithgaredd economaidd yw'r prif ffactor, a'r ffaith fod gennym gyfraddau gweithgaredd cymharol wael sydd fwy na thebyg i'w gyfrif am chwarter y gwahaniaeth rhwng ein ffigur GYC cyfartalog ni a GYC cyfartalog y DU.

Nid yw yn y Siambr ar hyn o bryd, ond yn y ddadl flaenorol clywsom araith wych gan Huw Lewis ar y blaenoriaethau ar gyfer buddsoddi mewn trafnidiaeth, pan wnaeth ble, yn gelfydd iawn, ar ran Merthyr, Rhymni a rhannau gogleddol y Cymoedd. Os edrychwch ar weithgaredd economaidd, un o ddangosyddion allweddol iechyd yw pa mor hawdd y gall pobl gymudo. Os na allwch ddefnyddio car, na chlodiant cyhoeddus rheolaidd, dibynadwy, mae'n amhosibl yn ymarferol ichi gymudo i'r ardaloedd lle mae'r swyddi. Fe welwch, wrth edrych ar economïau rhanbarthol llwyddiannus, ei bod yn gymharol hawdd symud pobl o'r man lle



industrial, but which are now changing as we have more post-industrial economies—to the areas where they work. That is another key indicator.

Finally, the skills agenda is another hugely important point. Wales has a higher proportion of adults without qualifications, and fewer people with higher-level skills, than the rest of the UK. The difference is not massive, and we are making some modest progress, but clearly it is through delivering a more skilful workforce that we will drive up our competitiveness.

I have a point that is rather academic, but which needs to be made: as well as seeing Welsh GVA in the context of the UK, we should remember the great variations that exist within Wales. We have something of a super-region here in Cardiff, the Vale, and parts of south-east Wales. We want to play to that strength in terms of developing it, to see how that economic activity can spark enterprise and competitiveness elsewhere, though it does itself create some spatial problems. On the other hand, the European structural programmes have attempted to spread growth and improve competitiveness. I will again mention the research of Swansea University—which is modest and does not try to paint an overly severe picture—which states that the most that can be claimed for Objective 1 funding is that it may have slowed down an overall decline in relative economic performance in west Wales and the Valleys.

In the next stage of European structural funding, we must do a lot better if we are to see the gap close. I do not think that it will close unless we look at the balance between the private and the public sectors in generating GVA. Here again, the figures are daunting. In London, 36.5 per cent of GVA is generated by the public sector. Perhaps London is not a good comparison, because it is obviously a world city, but in Scotland, 55.6 per cent of GVA is generated by the public sector, while we have 63.8 per cent of GVA being generated by the public sector. Yet we have a Government in office that will not accept that the size of the private sector

maent yn byw—yn aml mewn ardaloedd a arferai fod yn ddiwydiannol, ond sydd bellach yn newid wrth i economïau ôl-ddiwydiannol gynyddu—i'r ardaloedd lle maent yn gweithio. Mae hwnnw'n ddangosydd allweddol arall.

Yn olaf, mae'r agenda sgiliau yn bwynt arall hynod bwysig. Mae gan Gymru gyfran uwch na gweddill y DU o oedolion heb gymwysterau, a nifer llai o bobl sydd â sgiliau lefel uwch. Nid yw'r gwahaniaeth yn enfawr, ac yr ydym yn gwneud ychydig gynydd, ond mae'n amlwg mai drwy gael gweithlu mwy medrus y byddwn yn dod yn fyw cystadleuol.

Mae gennyf bwynt sydd braidd yn academiaidd, ond mae'n bwynt y mae angen ei fynegi: yn ogystal â gweld GYC Cymru yng nghyd-destun y DU, dylem gofio'r amrywiadau mawr sy'n bodoli yng Nghymru. Mae gennym ryw fath o uwch-ranbarth yma yng Nghaerdydd, y Fro, a rhannau o ddeddwyrain Cymru. Yr ydym am fanteisio ar y cryfder hwnnw o ran ei ddatblygu, i weld sut y mae'r gweithgarwch economaidd hwnnw'n gallu sbarduno menter a chystadleurwydd mewn mannau eraill, er ei fod yn creu rhai problemau gofodol. Ar y llaw arall, mae rhaglenni strwythurol Ewrop wedi ceisio lledaenu twf a gwella cystadleurwydd. Soniaf eto am yr ymchwil gan Brifysgol Abertawe-sy'n gymedrol ac nad yw'n ceisio creu darlun rhy dywyll-sy'n dweud mai'r mwyaf y gellir ei ddweud am gyllid Amcan 1 yw y gallai fod wedi arafu dirywiad cyffredinol ym mherfformiad economaidd cymharol gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd.

Yn y cam nesaf o gyllid strwythurol Ewrop, rhaid inni wneud yn well o lawer os ydym am weld y bwlech yn cau. Ni chredaf y bydd yn cau onid ystyriwn y cydbwysedd rhwng y sector preifat a'r sector cyhoeddus wrth gynhyrchu GYC. Yma eto mae'r ffigurau'n frawychus. Yn Llundain, cynhyrchir 36.6 y cant o GYC gan y sector cyhoeddus. Efallai nad yw Llundain yn gymhariaeth dda, oherwydd yn amlwg mae'n ddinas fyd-eang. Ond yn yr Alban cynhyrchir 55.6 y cant o GYC gan y sector cyhoeddus, tra mae 63.8 y cant o GYC Cymru yn cael ei gynhyrchu gan y sector cyhoeddus. Eto, mae gennym Lywodraeth sydd mewn grym nad yw'n

should increase. I have tried to extract this concession from the Minister, but he is not even prepared to make that notional commitment to seeing the size of the private sector grow in relation to the public sector. Indeed, in some areas of its policy, the Government is antagonistic towards the private sector—for example, in the way that the Government boasts that it has driven out the private sector and PFI from the health service. It is no wonder that the Government is being criticised by the private sector—it realises that actions speak louder than some of the Government's warm words.

In conclusion, the Welsh Assembly Government seems complacent at the moment. We had hoped that the inclusion of Plaid Cymru would bring a certain spark, and a certain commitment to looking at some of these questions, but just look at how the Government has responded to this debate in its amendments: the decline in GVA is denied, and it claims that it has been halted since 2000. The statistics just do not bear that out. In 2000, it was at 78.4 per cent of the UK average, and the latest figures, for 2006, show that it stands at 77.3 per cent—a drop of just over 1 per cent. That is the hard data, and trying to smother it in a silly amendment is foolish.

The amendment also mentions a commitment to 80 per cent employment. That is a great commitment; it is ambitious, and we welcome it, but I must say that we need some idea of when you will get there. It cannot happen overnight because such an improvement would mean bringing in a lot of people who are currently economically inactive and who need a lot of support. Many of these people have lots of barriers to overcome to gain access to the labour market—it is not easy. The Bevan Foundation is absolutely right to criticise the Government by saying that we will not reach 80 per cent employment until the mid-2020s—unless you tell us that you are accelerating the progress and have a way of meeting that target more quickly. We need some real answers from the Government, and we need to be able to measure what

derbyn y dylai maint y sector preifat gynyddu. Ceisiais fynnu'r consesiwn hwn gan y Gweinidog, ond nid yw'n fodlon gwneud yr ymrwymiad tybiannol hwnnw hyd yn oed, er mwyn gweld maint y sector preifat yn tyfu o'i gymharu â'r sector cyhoeddus. Yn wir, mewn rhai mannau yn ei pholisi, mae'r Llywodraeth yn wrthwynebus i'r sector preifat—er enghraifft, yn y ffordd y mae'r Llywodraeth yn brolio'i bod wedi gyrru'r sector preifat a'r fenter cyllid preifat allan o'r gwasanaeth iechyd. Nid yw'n syndod fod y Llywodraeth yn cael ei beirniadu gan y sector preifat—mae'n sylweddoli bod gweithredoedd yn cyflawni mwy na rhai o eiriau cynnes y Llywodraeth.

I gloi, mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ymddangos yn hunanfodlon ar hyn o bryd. Yr oeddem wedi gobeithio y byddai cynnwys Plaid Cymru yn dod â rhyw wreichionen, a rhyw ymrwymiad i edrych ar rai o'r cwestiynau hyn, ond ystyriwch y ffordd y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi ymateb i'r ddadl hon yn ei gwelliannau: gwrthodir cydnabod y dirywiad mewn GYC, ac mae'n honni i hynny gael ei atal er 2000. Nid yw'r ystadegau'n cadarnhau hynny. Yn 2000, yr oedd yn 78.4 y cant o gyfartaledd y DU, ac mae'r ffigurau diweddaraf, am 2006, yn dangos ei fod yn 77.3 y cant—gostyngiad o fymryn dros 1 y cant. Dyna'r data caled, a ffolineb yw ceisio'i guddio mewn gwelliant gwirion.

Mae'r gwelliant yn crybwyll hefyd ymrwymiad i gyflogaeth o 80 y cant. Mae hynny'n ymrwymiad mawr; mae'n uchelgeisiol, ac yr ydym yn ei groesawu. Ond rhaid imi ddweud bod arnom angen rhyw syniad pryd y byddwch yn cyrraedd hynny. Ni all ddigwydd dros nos, oherwydd byddai gwelliant o'r fath yn golygu dod â llawer o bobl i mewn sydd ar hyn o bryd yn economaidd anweithgar ac angen llawer o gefnogaeth arnynt. Mae gan lawer o'r bobl hyn nifer o rwystrau i'w goresgyn i gael mynediad at y farchnad lafur—nid yw hynny'n hawdd. Mae Sefydliad Bevan yn gwbl gywir wrth feirniadu'r Llywodraeth drwy ddweud na fyddwn yn cyrraedd y ffigur hwnnw o gyflogaeth o 80 y cant tan ganol y 2020au—os nad ydych yn dweud wrthym eich bod yn cyflymu'r cynnydd hwnnw a bod gennych ffordd o gyrraedd y targed hwnnw

difference the coalition partner, Plaid Cymru, is making at a time when we really need some new thinking, given that the international economic situation does now seem to be turning against us.

ynghynt. Mae arnom angen rhai atebion gwirioneddol gan y Llywodraeth, ac mae angen inni allu mesur pa wahaniaeth y mae partner y glymblaid, Plaid Cymru, yn ei wneud ar adeg pan fo angen gwirioneddol am rai syniadau newydd, o gofio bod y sefyllfa economaidd ryngwladol yn awr i'w gweld yn troi yn ein herbyn.

3.50 p.m.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** I propose amendment 1 in the name of Carwyn Jones. Delete all after 'National Assembly for Wales' and replace with:

**The Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Cynigiau welliant 1 yn enw Carwyn Jones. Dileu popeth ar ôl 'Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru' a rhoi yn ei le:

*1. notes the halt in the decline of GVA since 2000;*

*1. yn nodi'r atal yng ngostyngiad gwerth ychwanegol crynswth ers 2000;*

*2. welcomes the following actions by the Welsh Assembly Government to improve GVA:*

*2. yn croesawu'r camau canlynol gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wella gwerth ychwanegol crynswth:*

*a) an all-Wales approach to economic development and a commitment to implement a labour market strategy with a long term goal of full employment at a rate of 80%;*

*a) dull Cymru gyfan o weithredu datblygiad economaidd ac ymrwymiad i roi strategaeth marchnad lafur ar waith gyda'r nod hirdymor o gyflogaeth lawn ar raddfa o 80 y cant;*

*b) the 'One Wales' commitment to improve the transport infrastructure; and*

*b) ymrwymiad 'Cymru'n Un' i wella'r seilwaith trafndiaeth;*

*c) the new skills and employment strategy 'Skills that work for Wales', to drive up skills levels and address the needs of business.*

*c) y strategaeth sgiliau a chyflogaeth newydd 'Sgiliau sy'n Gweithio i Gymru', i godi lefelau sgiliau a mynd i'r afael ag anghenion busnesau.*

**Kirsty Williams:** I propose amendment 2 in my name. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

**Kirsty Williams:** Cynigiau welliant 2 yn fy enw i. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*notes that small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs) form the back bone of Wales's economy and calls for:*

*yn nodi mai busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yw asgwrn cefn economi Cymru ac yn galw am:*

*1) access to broadband to be extended to allow Welsh business to compete in the global economy; and*

*1) ymestyn mynediad at fand eang i alluogi busnesau Cymru i gystadlu yn yr economi fyd-eang; a*

*2) Welsh SMEs to be given the maximum possible opportunity to bid for public contracts.*

*2) rhoi cymaint o gyfleoedd â phosibl i fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yng Nghymru wneud ceisiadau am gontractau cyhoeddus.*

I thank David for his opening contribution this afternoon, which starkly set out some of the challenges that the Welsh economy is facing at a time when the world economy is experiencing such turmoil. I echo the call to hear from the Deputy First Minister about why his party's inclusion in the Government will make a difference because, as David said, there is precious little in amendment 1 to demonstrate that that is the case.

Wales's GVA, as we have heard, has been in decline since 1989 and, in fact, the most recent statistics, compared with those for the rest of the UK, show Wales's lowest rate since 1989, with Wales reaching just above 77 per cent of the UK average. It is true to say that those drops in GVA have happened not at quite the rate experienced under John Major or John Redwood, but the Government should not be complacent in dismissing a small decrease as being not worthy of notice. A single drop—

**Alun Cairns:** Will you not accept that, in relative terms, Wales is poorer now than it has been since GVA records began?

**Kirsty Williams:** I accept that the figures before us are shocking, but David Melding cannot quote hard facts at Plaid Cymru and hope that I will ignore them. The fact is that the figures show that GVA was at 85.4 per cent in 1989 and, by the time that you left office in 1997, it had dropped to about 81 per cent. There has been—

**Alun Cairns:** Is 81 per cent higher than 77 per cent?

**Kirsty Williams:** Alun is well aware that I am talking about the rate of the decline, and you cannot escape the great rate of decline under the rule of John Major or John Redwood. That is not to say that we are where we should be and, as I said, I regret the Government's complacency. A drop of a single percentage point is equivalent to millions of pounds.

Raising Wales's GVA is a complex matter. We need to look at a whole range of policy

Diolch i David am ei gyfraniad agoriadol y prynhawn yma, a oedd yn gosod allan yn foel rai o'r heriau sy'n wynebu economi Cymru ar adeg pan yw economi'r byd yn gweld y fath gynnwrf. Ategaf yr alwad i glywed gan y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog pam y bydd cynnwys ei blaid yn y Llywodraeth yn gwneud gwahaniaeth, oherwydd fel y dywedodd David, ychydig iawn sydd yng ngwelliant 1 i ddangos bod hynny'n wir.

Mae GYC Cymru, fel y clywsom, wedi bod yn dirywio er 1989, ac yn wir mae'r ystadegau diweddaraf, o'u cymharu â'r rheini ar gyfer gweddill y DU, yn dangos graddfa isaf Cymru er 1989, a Chymru'n cyrraedd mymryn dros 77 y cant o gyfartaledd y DU. Mae'n wir dweud na ddigwyddodd y gostyngiadau hynny mewn GYC ar yr un raddfa'n union â'r hyn a welwyd dan John Major na John Redwood, ond ni ddylai'r Llywodraeth fod yn hunanfodlon drwy anwybyddu gostyngiad bach fel rhywbeth nad yw'n deilwng o sylw. Un gostyngiad—

**Alun Cairns:** Onid ydych yn derbyn bod Cymru, o'i chymharu, yn dlotach yn awr nag y bu ers i gofnodion GYC ddechrau.

**Kirsty Williams:** Derbyniaf fod y ffigurau o'n blaenau yn rhai ysgytiol, ond ni all David Melding ddyfynnu ffeithiau caled wrth Blaid Cymru a gobeithio y byddaf fi'n eu hanwybyddu. Y ffaith yw bod y ffigurau'n dangos bod GYC yn 85.4 y cant yn 1989 a'i fod, erbyn i'ch cyfnod chi mewn grym ddod i ben yn 1997, wedi gostwng i oddeutu 81 y cant. Bu-

**Alun Cairns:** A yw 81 y cant yn uwch na 77 y cant?

**Kirsty Williams:** Gŵyr Alun yn iawn fy mod yn sôn am raddfa'r dirywiad, ac ni allwch ddianc rhag graddfa fawr y dirywiad dan reolaeth John Major neu John Redwood. Nid yw hynny'n gyfystyr â dweud ein bod yn y man lle dylem fod, ac fel y dywedais, gresynaf at hunanfodlonrwydd y Llywodraeth. Mae gostyngiad o un ganran yn cyfateb i filiynau o bunnau.

Mae codi GYC Cymru yn fater cymhleth. Mae angen inni ystyried amrediad llawn o

areas including economic development, education, skills, training, transport, infrastructure and economic activity levels, and that is clearly more than the Assembly can cover in a one-hour debate in the Chamber. The Welsh Liberal Democrats' amendment 2 seeks to point to two areas where we believe that changes could significantly assist small and medium-sized enterprises, which we believe to be fundamental to the success of Wales's economy.

As David quite rightly said, further analysis of the GVA figures suggests that, compared with the nation as a whole, parts of Wales are being left even further behind. GVA in the Gwent valleys region is at just 58 per cent of the UK average and it stands at just 53 per cent in Anglesey. The discrepancies across Wales are staggering and the national GVA figures have not told us the full story. We need to radically change how we approach economic development in the regions. As I said, my party believes that small and medium-sized enterprises are the way forward. In each of these areas, large prestige projects have failed to stimulate the economy. It has become clear that the south Wales Valleys cannot rely on investment along the M4 corridor to stimulate growth any more than my constituency can rely on economic development in Yorkshire to do the same.

Amendment 1, as David said, is staggering. It talks about improvements to the transport infrastructure—the Government could start by getting the Ebbw valley line sorted. It talks about the new skills and employment strategy, in which the Government has such confidence that it is not prepared to have a debate on it in the Chamber. Also, this afternoon, the Deputy Minister for Skills could not provide even the most basic of answers to basic questions about the level of investment being made by the Government in further education.

Amendment 1 also talks about the 80 per cent target, and I agree with David Melding that that is a fine target, but the Deputy First Minister has already acknowledged that he has no intention of meeting that within the

feysydd polisi, gan gynnwys datblygu economaidd, addysg, sgiliau, hyfforddiant, trafnidiaeth, seilwaith a lefelau gweithgarwch economaidd, ac yn amlwg mae hynny'n fwy nag y gall y Cynulliad ei gwmpasu mewn dadl awr yn y Siambr. Mae gwelliant 2 gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn ceisio dangos dau faes lle y credwn y gallai newidiadau roi cymorth sylweddol i fentrau bach a chanolig, a chredwn fod hynny'n sylfaenol i lwyddiant economi Cymru.

Fel y dywedodd David yn hollol gywir, mae dadansoddiad pellach o ffigurau GYC yn awgrymu bod rhannau o Gymru, o'u cymharu â'r wlad gyfan, yn cael eu gadael hyd yn oed ymhellach ar ôl. Mae GYC ardal cymoedd Gwent yn 58 y cant o gyfartaledd y DU ac mae'n 53 y cant yn Ynys Môn. Mae'r anghysondebau ar draws Cymru yn syfrdanol, ac nid yw'r ffigurau GYC gwladol wedi rhoi'r stori lawn inni. Mae angen inni newid yn sylweddol ein hagwedd at ddatblygu economaidd yn y rhanbarthau. Fel y dywedais, mae fy mhlaid i'n credu mai'r ffordd ymlaen yw mentrau bach a chanolig. Ym mhob un o'r ardaloedd hyn, mae prosiectau mawr a chlodfawr wedi methu ag ysgogi'r economi. Mae wedi dod yn glir na all Cymoedd de Cymru ddibynnu ar fuddsoddi ar hyd coridor yr M4 i ysgogi twf, ddim mwy nag y gall fy etholaeth i ddibynnu ar ddatblygiad economaidd yn swydd Efrog i wneud yr un peth.

Mae gwelliant 1, fel y dywedodd David, yn syfrdanol. Mae'n sôn am welliannau yn y seilwaith trafnidiaeth—gallai'r Llywodraeth ddechrau drwy gael trefn ar reilffordd Glynebwy. Mae'n sôn am y strategaeth newydd ar gyfer sgiliau a chyflogaeth, strategaeth y mae'r Llywodraeth mor hyderus ynddi fel nad yw'n fodlon cynnal dadl arni yn y Siambr. Hefyd, y prynhawn yma, ni allai'r Dirprwy Weinidog dros Sgiliau roi'r atebion mwyaf sylfaenol hyd yn oed i gwestiynau sylfaenol am lefel y buddsoddi gan y Llywodraeth mewn addysg bellach.

Mae gwelliant 1 yn sôn hefyd am y targed o 80 y cant, a chytunaf â David Melding fod hwnnw'n darged da. Ond mae'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog wedi cydnabod eisoes nad oes ganddo friad o gwbl i gyrraedd hwnnw o

lifetime of this Assembly. Do note, please, that there is no hyperlink to the labour market strategy that is referred to in the amendment. There are links to the 'One Wales' document and the skills strategy, but there is no link to the labour market strategy. Unless I have missed it somewhere else, that suggests to me that there is no labour market strategy to date. So much for the Government amendment.

As a party, we believe that it would be helpful to look at ways in which we can get a fairer share of the £4 billion-worth of public contract moneys that are spent in Wales each year that are not going to Welsh companies, and to ensure that small and medium-sized enterprises across Wales have access to the very best information technology that they will need in order to compete and to keep up to date with competitors across the rest of the UK, if not the world. Only yesterday, I heard from business people from Abercrave in my constituency who wanted to keep their business in Abercrave but are in danger of moving it out of Wales because of the poor IT infrastructure. I am grateful for your time, Deputy Presiding Officer, and I look forward to hearing the Minister's response.

**Mark Isherwood:** After 15 years of economic growth, our public finances should be in a healthy state. There should be plenty of money left in the coffers to prop up the economy during the harder times. However, there is no money left in the coffers. If Gordon Brown had not fiddled his golden rule, it would have been broken by billions of pounds. The UK has the largest structural budget deficit in Europe because Gordon Brown borrowed in a boom, when he should have saved, and then spent all of the money inflating an unsustainable boom. This is sheer economic incompetence. Mr Brown's career as a serious politician is over. *[Laughter.]* Britain is now poorly prepared for any possible economic downturn and Wales is least prepared of all.

You may laugh, but listen to some economic facts. The heavy public spending increases of this decade have not helped Wales and have

fewn oes y Cynulliad hwn. Sylwch, os gwelwch yn dda, nad oes hyperddolen yn arwain at y strategaeth marchnad lafur y cyfeirir ati yn y gwelliant. Mae dolenni'n arwain at y ddogfen 'Cymru'n Un' a'r strategaeth sgiliau, ond nid oes dolen yn arwain at y strategaeth marchnad lafur. Oni bai fy mod wedi'i cholli rywle arall, mae hynny'n awgrymu i mi nad oes strategaeth marchnad lafur hyd yma. Dyna ben ar welliant y Llywodraeth.

Fel plaid, credwn mai buddiol fyddai ystyried ffyrdd y gallwn gael rhan decach o'r gwerth £4 biliwn o arian contractau cyhoeddus sy'n cael ei wario yng Nghymru bob blwyddyn, arian nad yw'n mynd i gwmnïau Cymru, a sicrhau bod mentrau bach a chanolig ar draws Gymru yn gallu troi at y dechnoleg wybodaeth orau posibl y bydd arnynt ei hangen er mwyn cystadlu a bod crystal â chystadleuwyr ar draws gweddill y DU, os nad y byd. Ddoe ddiwethaf, clywais gan bobl fusnes o Aber-craf yn fy etholaeth a oedd am gadw eu busnes yn Aber-craf ond sydd mewn perygl o symud allan o Gymru oherwydd y seilwaith TG gwael. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich amser, Ddirprwy Lywydd, ac edrychaf ymlaen at ymateb y Gweinidog.

**Mark Isherwood:** Ar ôl 15 mlynedd o dwf economaidd, dylai ein cyllidebau cyhoeddus fod mewn cyflwr iach. Dylai fod digon o arian ar ôl yn y coffrau i gynnal yr economi yn ystod y cyfnodau caletach. Fodd bynnag, nid oes arian ar ôl yn y coffrau. Oni bai bod Gordon Brown heb ffidlan ei reol aur, byddai wedi cael ei thorri o werth biliynau o bunnoedd. Gan y DU y mae'r diffyg cyllidol strwythurol mwyaf yn Ewrop oherwydd bod Gordon Brown wedi benthyg ar adeg o ffyniant, pryd y dylai fod wedi cynilo, ac yna wedi gwario'r arian i gyd gan chwyddo ffyniant na ellid ei gynnal. Anghymhwystra economaidd llwyr yw hyn. Mae gyrfa Mr Brown fel gwleidydd o ddifrif wedi dod i ben. *[Chwerthin.]* Mae Prydain yn awr mewn cyflwr o fod heb baratoi ar gyfer unrhyw gwmp economaidd posibl, a Chymru sydd wedi paratoi leiaf o bawb.

Chwarddwch chi, ond gwrandewch ar rai ffeithiau economaidd. Nid yw'r cynnydd helaeth mewn gwariant cyhoeddus yn y

instead increased dependence on English taxpayers. It is not now a policy option to spend more money to generate growth. As Government spending shrinks in real terms, the challenges facing the Welsh economy will intensify. A series of economic indicators released at the end of 2007 reveal a Welsh economy in a poor state. Business spending on research and development has decreased. Wales has the lowest average full-time earnings in the United Kingdom and the gap is growing. A total of 506,000 working-age people in Wales are not in work and only 72,000 of them are officially unemployed. Although employment has risen by 2.2 per cent since 2003, unemployment has increased by 18 per cent over the same period. Wales has a higher proportion of family poverty than anywhere else in the United Kingdom. Economic dependency is not being eradicated, but it is becoming entrenched.

Creating wealth is the key to the future, yet the new figures from the Office for National Statistics reveal that, despite eight years of the devolution dividend and billions of pounds of European funding, Wales now has the lowest ever prosperity levels. It has fallen to 77 per cent of the UK average. Wales has retained its position as the poorest nation or region in the United Kingdom. Over the past eight years, there has been a steady decline in prosperity relative to the rest of the United Kingdom. With the figures going backwards, the Assembly Government waved goodbye to 'A Winning Wales' when it dumped its target to reach 90 per cent of the UK average.

Rhodri Morgan's career as a serious politician ended when he attempted to argue that it had been a goal and not a target, and that the two were somehow different. The two regions above us in the relegation zone of wealth creation, namely Northern Ireland and the north-east of England, have increased their gross value added prosperity levels at a far higher rate than Wales has done, thereby widening the gap between Wales and the other UK nations and regions. Three regions of Wales—the south-west, the Gwent valleys, and Anglesey—are among the five poorest in the United Kingdom. Areas such as

degawd hwn wedi helpu Cymru; yn hytrach mae wedi cynyddu dibyniaeth ar drethdalwyr Lloegr. Nid yw gwario rhagor o arian i ysgogi twf yn ddewis polisi bellach. Wrth i wariant y Llywodraeth leihau mewn termau real, bydd yr heriau sy'n wynebu economi Cymru yn dwysáu. Mae cyfres o ddangosyddion economaidd a ryddhawyd ddiwedd 2007 yn dangos bod economi Cymru mewn cyflwr gwael. Mae gwariant busnes ar ymchwil a datblygu wedi lleihau. Gan Gymru y mae'r cyfartaledd cyflogau llawn-amser isaf yn y Deyrnas Unedig ac mae'r bwlch yn tyfu. Mae cyfanswm o 506,000 o bobl o oed gweithio yng Nghymru nad ydynt mewn gwaith, a 72,000 yn unig o'r rheini sy'n ddi-waith yn swyddogol. Er bod cyflogaeth wedi codi 2.2 y cant er 2003, mae diweithdra wedi cynyddu 18 y cant yn yr un cyfnod. Mae gan Gymru gyfran uwch o dlodi teuluol nag unman arall yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Nid yw dibyniaeth economaidd yn cael ei dileu, ond mae'n ymwreiddio.

Creu cyfoeth yw'r allwedd i'r dyfodol, eto dengys y ffigurau newydd o'r Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol, er gwaethaf wyth mlynedd o ddifidend datganoli a biliynau o bunnoedd o arian Ewropeaidd, mae yng Nghymru bellach y lefel ffyniant isaf erioed. Mae wedi gostwng i 77 y cant o gyfartaledd y DU. Mae Cymru wedi cadw ei safle fel y genedl neu'r rhanbarth tlotaf yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Dros yr wyth mlynedd diwethaf, bu dirywiad cyson mewn ffyniant o'i gymharu â gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig. Tra oedd y ffigurau'n mynd tuag at yn ôl, ffarweliodd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad â 'Chymru'n Ennill' pan ollyngodd ei tharged i gyrraedd 90 y cant o gyfartaledd y DU.

Daeth gyrfa Rhodri Morgan fel gwleidydd o ddifrif i ben pan geisiodd ddadlau mai nod ac nid targed oedd hynny, a bod y ddau rywsut yn wahanol. Mae'r ddau ranbarth sydd uwch ein pennau ar y rhestr o ranbarthau sy'n disgyn o ran creu cyfoeth, sef Gogledd Iwerddon a gogledd-ddwyrain Lloegr, wedi cynyddu eu lefelau cyfoeth gwerth ychwanegol crynswth ar raddfa lawer uwch nag y mae Cymru wedi'i wneud, a thrwy hynny maent wedi lledu'r bwlch rhwng Cymru a chenhedloedd a rhanbarthau eraill y DU. Mae tair ardal yng Nghymru—y de-orllewin, cymoedd Gwent, ac Ynys Môn—

Bridgend, Neath Port Talbot, and the Gwent valleys have seen their average prosperity deteriorate enormously. Despite receiving hundreds of millions of pounds of European funding, the fortunes of these regions continue to decline. Perhaps the real worry is the situation in Flintshire and Wrexham, which is seen by business and policy makers alike as one of the powerhouses of the Welsh economy. This region has seen its GVA per head decline from 102 per cent of the UK average in 1999 to 85 per cent. Indeed, it has been growing at only a third of the rate of the Welsh economy when it should have been making a far greater contribution to the prosperity of the nation given its close links to the north-west of England.

At the launch in the Assembly of the 2007 manifesto of the Federation of Small Businesses, Cardiff Business School stated that the only opportunity is to get the private sector on board in public-private partnership. In its December 2007 report, CBI Wales stated that the fastest growing regions have all taken steps to involve the private sector and have benefited demonstrably as a result.

4.00 p.m.

The Welsh Assembly Government must make room for the private and voluntary sectors to deliver public services and help to contribute to the economic growth of Wales. New ideas and a greater focus on creating infrastructure, entrepreneurship and innovation are needed. The Government must listen more to business, tell people what to do less, trust more and dictate less, and the private and voluntary sectors must fight back. Policy makers must realise that only the private and voluntary sectors can make a real and lasting contribution to our economy, and that the role of an effective Government is to facilitate, support and encourage. The time has come for the Assembly Government to stop burying its head in the sand and to acknowledge finally that the Welsh economy is in trouble and needs a radical pro-business overhaul.

ymhlith y pump tlotaf yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae ardaloedd megis Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr, Castell-nedd Port Talbot, a chymoedd Gwent wedi gweld eu ffyniant cyfartalog yn dirywio'n enbyd. Er iddynt gael cannoedd o filiynau o bunnoedd o arian Ewropeaidd, dal i ddirywio y mae sefyllfa'r ardaloedd hyn. Y gofid gwirioneddol efallai yw'r sefyllfa yn sir y Fflint a Wrecsam, a ystyrir gan fusnes a gwneuthurwyr polisi fel ei gilydd fel un o bwerdai economi Cymru. Yn yr ardal hon gwelwyd ei GYC y pen yn dirywio o 102 y cant o gyfartaledd y DU yn 1999 i 85 y cant. Yn wir, mae wedi bod yn cynyddu ar ddim ond traean o gyfradd economi Cymru, pryd y dylasai fod yn gwneud cyfraniad llawer mwy i ffyniant y genedl o ystyried ei chysylltiadau agos â gogledd-orllewin Lloegr.

Wrth lansio maniffesto 2007 y Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach yn y Cynulliad, dywedodd Ysgol Fusnes Caerdydd mai'r unig gyfle yw cael y sector preifat i ymuno mewn partneriaeth gyhoeddus-breifat. Yn ei adroddiad ym mis Rhagfyr 2007, dywedodd Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain yng Nghymru fod y rhanbarthau sy'n tyfu gyflymaf i gyd wedi cymryd camau i gynnwys y sector preifat a bod buddiannau amlwg wedi deillio o hynny.

Rhaid i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru sicrhau bod y sectorau preifat a gwirfoddol yn cael cyfle i ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a helpu cyfrannu at dwf economaidd Cymru. Mae angen syniadau newydd a mwy o ganolbwyntio ar greu seilwaith, entrepreneuriaeth ac arloesed. Rhaid i'r Llywodraeth wrando mwy ar fyd busnes, peidio â dweud wrth bobl beth i'w wneud gymaint, ymddiried mwy a gorchymyn llai, a rhaid i'r sectorau preifat a gwirfoddol frwydro'n ôl. Rhaid i lunwyr polisïau sylweddoli mai'r sectorau preifat a gwirfoddol yn unig a all gyfrannu'n wirioneddol ac yn barhaus at ein heconomi, ac mai rôl Llywodraeth effeithiol yw hwyluso, cefnogi ac annog. Mae'r amser wedi dod i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad roi'r gorau i gladdu ei phen yn y tywod a chydabod o'r diwedd fod economi Cymru mewn trafferth a bod angen ei hadfer mewn ffordd radical drwy gynnwys byd busnes.



**Lesley Griffiths:** I wish to focus my comments on where precisely Wales stands today, and how we address the important issue of unlocking the potential of the Welsh people to secure future prosperity for our country. Last week, for example, my colleague, John Griffiths, launched the skills and employment strategy, 'Skills That Work for Wales'. It is a radical new strategy that will see the Government working hand in glove with business, trade unions and all agencies together to ensure that Wales can compete in the future with a skilled and flexible workforce.

We are all aware that the world economy is transforming before our eyes. In Wales, we have a huge challenge ahead of us if we are to compete for our share of prosperity against emerging economies, such as those of China, India and Brazil. I am pleased that the Minister has recently visited the subcontinent to build economic links. It is also worth mentioning the sterling work being done by International Business Wales and the strong and formal links that it is forging with the Chongqing region of China. IBW is involved in some important work on behalf of the Government and the Welsh economy, and it is to be congratulated on that.

A crucial plank of our programme of government through 'One Wales' is to stimulate enterprise and business growth. Therefore, I was particularly pleased to see the Liberal Democrat amendment 2 on the agenda today, which calls on us to note that small and medium-sized enterprises form the backbone of Wales's economy, and also calls for access to broadband to be extended to allow Welsh businesses to compete in the global economy. I am surprised, however, that the Liberal Democrats did not undertake even the most cursory research into the subject before tabling this amendment. If they had, they would have been pleasantly surprised to discover what the Government is achieving on the ground. I am sure that Eleanor Burnham, who has unfortunately left the Chamber, will be particularly pleased to hear what I have to say on this matter, as it relates to our part of the world. Let me share with you what the Government is actually

**Lesley Griffiths:** Hoffwn ganolbwyntio fy sylwadau ar union sefyllfa Cymru heddiw, a sut yr ydym yn rhoi sylw i'r mater pwysig o gyflawni potensial pobl Cymru i sicrhau ffyniant ein gwlad yn y dyfodol. Yr wythnos diwethaf, er enghraifft, lansiodd fy nghyd-Aelod, John Griffiths, y strategaeth sgiliau a chyflogaeth, 'Sgiliau sy'n Gweithio i Gymru'. Mae'n strategaeth newydd radical a fydd yn golygu bod y Llywodraeth yn gweithio law yn llaw â byd busnes, undebau llafur a'r holl asiantaethau gyda'i gilydd i sicrhau bod Cymru'n gallu cystadlu yn y dyfodol gyda gweithlu medrus a hyblyg.

Yr ydym i gyd yn ymwybodol fod economi'r byd yn newid o flaen ein llygaid. Yng Nghymru, mae her enfawr o'n blaenau os ydym i gystadlu am ein cyfran o ffyniant yn erbyn yr economïau sy'n datblygu, megis rhai Tsieina, India a Brasil. Yr wyf yn falch fod y Gweinidog wedi ymweld â'r isgyfandir yn ddiweddar i feithrin cysylltiadau economaidd. Mae'n werth nodi hefyd fod gwaith da'n cael ei wneud gan Fusnes Rhyngwladol Cymru a'r cysylltiadau cryf a ffurfiol y mae'n eu creu gyda rhanbarth Chongqing yn Tsieina. Mae Busnes Rhyngwladol Cymru yn gwneud gwaith pwysig ar ran y Llywodraeth ac economi Cymru, a dylid ei longyfarch am hynny.

Elfen allweddol yn rhaglen y Llywodraeth drwy 'Cymru'n Un' yw ysgogi twf menter a busnes. Felly, yr oeddwn yn falch iawn gweld gwelliant 2 gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ar yr agenda heddiw, sy'n galw arnom i nodi mai mentrau bach a chanolig yw asgwrn cefn economi Cymru. Mae hefyd yn galw am ehangu mynediad i fand eang i ganiatáu i fusnesau yng Nghymru gystadlu yn yr economi fyd-eang. Yr wyf yn synnu, fodd bynnag, nad oedd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wedi gwneud y gwaith ymchwil mwyaf sylfaenol hyd yn oed i'r pwnc cyn cyflwyno'r gwelliant hwn. Petaent wedi gwneud hynny, byddent wedi eu siomi ar yr ochr orau o ddarganfod yr hyn y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei wneud yn ymarferol. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Eleanor Burnham, sydd wedi gadael y Siambr yn anffodus, yn arbennig o falch clywed yr hyn sydd gennyf i'w ddweud am y mater hwn, gan ei fod yn ymwneud â'n rhan ni o'r byd. Gadewch imi

doing in north Wales and in my constituency of Wrexham to support and stimulate enterprise and business growth.

The FibreSpeed network in north Wales will be centred initially on up to 14 strategic business parks in Wrexham and Deeside in the east and along the A55 corridor to Holyhead in north-west Wales. I must say to the Minister that the importance of that network in helping business and enterprise to flourish in north Wales has been understated by the Government. Wrexham industrial estate and Wrexham technology park will be connected to FibreSpeed. The Welsh Assembly Government is investing £30 million in this network, which will provide a regional fibre-optic trunk network across the region that will deliver advanced, high-speed broadband services at greatly reduced prices for north Wales companies and businesses. These services will be delivered at prices comparable with those in London and south-east England. The network will transform high bandwidth availability and pricing across north Wales. This is the first Government in the UK to provide a supported network of this kind. This is precisely the kind of investment that local businesses tell me that they need. Not only will it offer companies the chance to be as competitive as companies in other areas of the UK, but it could also give towns like Wrexham a competitive edge, which is surely what we want for the whole of Wales.

**Angela Burns:** I thank my colleague, David Melding, for bringing forward this debate, as it is vital for Wales and her future. Today, the governor of the Bank of England said that the UK is facing its toughest economic crisis for over a decade. The Monetary Policy Committee agreed, with only one of its members voting for an interest rate cut. It believes that inflation is still not under control in the UK. As I am sure you will know, Minister, the Bank of England's 'Credit Conditions Survey' has reported that 51.8 per cent of lenders report a worsening of credit availability in the corporate sector. The clamp-down on borrowing in the corporate sector will be visited on the SME

rannu gyda chi yr hyn y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei wneud yn y gogledd ac yn fy etholaeth i yn Wrecsam i gynorthwyo ac ysgogi twf menter a busnes.

Bydd y rhwydwaith FibreSpeed yn y gogledd yn canolbwyntio yn y lle cyntaf ar hyd at 14 o barciau busnes strategol yn Wrecsam a Glannau Dyfrdwy yn y dwyrain ac ar hyd coridor yr A55 i Gaergybi yn y gogledd-orllewin. Rhaid imi ddweud wrth y Gweinidog nad yw'r Llywodraeth wedi rhoi sylw haeddiannol i bwysigrwydd y rhwydwaith hwn wrth gynorthwyo busnesau a mentrau i ffynnu. Bydd ystâd ddiwydiannol Wrecsam a pharc technoleg Wrecsam yn cael eu cysylltu â FibreSpeed. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn buddsoddi £30 miliwn yn y rhwydwaith hwn, a fydd yn darparu prif rwydwaith opteg ffibr rhanbarthol ar draws y rhanbarth i ddarparu uwch wasanaethau band eang cyflym am brisiau wedi'u gostwng yn sylweddol i gwmnïau a busnesau'r gogledd. Bydd y gwasanaethau hyn ar gael am brisiau sy'n cymharu â'r hyn sydd ar gael yn Llundain a de-ddwyrain Lloegr. Bydd y rhwydwaith yn trawsnewid argaeledd lled band uchel a phrisiau ar hyd a lled y gogledd. Hon yw'r Llywodraeth gyntaf yn y DU i ddarparu rhwydwaith o'r fath sy'n cael ei gefnogi. Dyma'r union fath o fuddsoddiad y mae busnesau lleol yn dweud wrthyf fod arnynt ei angen. Bydd nid yn unig yn rhoi cyfle i gwmnïau fod yr un mor gystadleuol â chwmnïau mewn rhannau eraill o'r DU, ond gallai hefyd olygu mantais gystadleuol i drefi fel Wrecsam, ac yr wyf yn siŵr mai dyna yr hoffem ei gael i Gymru gyfan.

**Angela Burns:** Diolchaf i fy nghyd-Aelod, David Melding, am gyflwyno'r ddadl hon, oherwydd y mae'n hanfodol i Gymru a'i dyfodol. Heddiw, dywedodd llywodraethwr Banc Lloegr fod y DU yn wynebu ei hargyfwng economaidd mwyaf ers dros ddegawd. Cytunodd y Pwyllgor Polisi Ariannol, ac un yn unig o'i aelodau a bleidleisiodd o blaid gostwng y gyfradd llog. Mae'n credu nad yw chwyddiant eto o dan reolaeth yn y DU. Fel y gwyddoch, yr wyf yn siŵr, Weinidog, mae 'Arolwg Amodau Credyd' Banc Lloegr wedi datgan bod 51.8 y cant o fenthycwyr yn dweud bod gallu cael credyd yn y sector corfforaethol yn gwaethygu. Bydd cyfyngu benthyca yn y

marketplace especially, which Lesley made reference to. In turn, it will really hit Wales.

The Welsh economy is already stagnating, and our gross value added figures, which are used to estimate our gross domestic product, show that. The tightening of credit conditions will lead to slower growth and subsequent rises in unemployment. There are real fears that inflation will not be checked quickly enough or hard enough, and none of this will help Wales. More than 97 per cent of businesses in Wales are classified as SMEs, and it is that bracket that is most likely to be hit by this slow-down in the economy. We need these SMEs because growth in the private sector is the key. We need to be less dependent on the public sector for employment. We need greater emphasis on world-class skills. We need enterprise and business opportunities that will help our economy to turn faster, better and more profitably.

I think that all of us understand that a stronger working economy fuels both the individuals and the process of government in our nation. If we want money for outstanding, worthwhile objectives such as the eradication of child poverty, we must produce that money; we need to make it. How can we do that? Minister, will you call a summit on the Welsh economy so that we can all work together to improve it? The Welsh Conservatives would like to see entrepreneurs involved, such as Sir Terry Matthews, and people such as Chris Evans, Kevin Morgan and Phil Cooke. We would also like the Confederation of British Industry, the trade unions, the Federation of Small Businesses, political parties, other business leaders and academics to be involved in the summit.

We would like it to be a summit of ideas, examining the good examples to be found in today's economy. We would like to see what we can all do to encourage business to come to Wales, and to encourage the businesses in Wales to really grow and prosper, to offer more employment and to help the wheels of

sector corfforaethol yn effeithio ar farchnad y busnesau bach a chanolig yn fwyaf arbennig, fel y dywedodd Lesley. Yn ei dro, bydd yn taro Cymru'n galed.

Mae economi Cymru'n dechrau marweiddio eisoes, ac mae ein ffigurau gwerth ychwanegol crynswth, a ddefnyddir i amcangyfrif ein cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth, yn dangos hynny. Mae cyfyngu amodau credyd yn arwain at dwf arafach ac yna at gynnydd mewn diweithdra. Mae gwir ofnau na chaiff chwyddiant ei ffrwyno'n ddigon cyflym nac yn ddigon llym, ac ni fydd hyn o fudd i Gymru. Mae 97 y cant o fusnesau Cymru'n cael eu cyfrif yn fusnesau bach a chanolig, a dyma'r categori sydd fwyaf tebygol o ddioddef pan fydd yr economi'n arafu fel hyn. Mae arnom angen y busnesau bach a chanolig hyn am fod twf yn y sector preifat yn allweddol. Mae angen inni fod yn llai dibynnol ar y sector cyhoeddus am swyddi. Mae arnom angen mwy o bwyslais ar sgiliau o safon byd. Mae arnom angen cyfleoedd menter a busnes a fydd yn cynorthwyo'n heconomi i droi'n gyflymach, yn well ac yn fwy proffidiol.

Credaf ein bod i gyd yn deall bod economi sy'n gweithio'n gryfach yn ysgogi unigolion a phrosesau llywodraeth yn ein gwlad. Os ydym am gael arian ar gyfer amcanion rhagorol, gwerth chweil megis dileu tlodi plant, rhaid inni gynhyrchu'r arian hwnnw; mae angen inni wneud hynny. Sut y gallwn ni wneud hynny? Weinidog, a wnewch chi alw uwchgynhadledd ar economi Cymru er mwyn inni weithio gyda'n gilydd i'w gwella? Hoffai'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig weld entrepreneuriaid yn cymryd rhan, pobl fel Syr Terry Matthews a Chris Evans, Kevin Morgan a Phil Cooke. Hoffem hefyd weld Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain, yr undebau llafur, y Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach, y pleidiau gwleidyddol, arweinwyr busnes eraill ac academyddion i gyd yn cymryd rhan yn yr uwchgynhadledd.

Hoffem iddi fod yn uwchgynhadledd o syniadau, yn edrych ar yr enghreifftiau da sydd i'w gweld yn ein heconomi heddiw. Hoffem weld beth allwn i gyd ei wneud i annog busnesau i ddod i Gymru, ac annog y busnesau yng Nghymru i dyfu o ddifrif a ffynnu, i gynnig mwy o swyddi ac i

the economy to turn. We want the summit to examine the best of the best; we want it to have action points, and not to be a talking shop. The Welsh Conservatives would work with you, Minister, to help with this, to help to grow our GDP and improve our GVA and to help Wales.

**Mick Bates:** I would like to begin by saying that I accept that there are many things raised by David in his opening remarks that the Minister cannot control. Even our esteemed Deputy First Minister cannot affect what is happening on Wall Street or even in the London Stock Exchange. Therefore, I shall address my remarks to the issue of the Minister's doing something that can help small and medium-sized enterprises in Wales, particularly in rural Wales. My remarks are based on evidence that contradicts a statement made earlier about what this Government had done to bring good broadband access to Wales. Let us look at the figures. The Government proudly tells us that 99.4 per cent of all households in Wales can get broadband. I used to think that the whole of the remaining 0.6 per cent was in Montgomeryshire until I spoke to other Members from every party who also claimed that the 0.6 per cent was in their constituency.

I thought that we should undertake an evidence-gathering session. Together with my local newspaper, I called for evidence about broadband, and there was an overwhelming response. It was not a petition; I wanted to collect evidence about how businesses trade in this modern world, where access to good broadband connections is essential. There were 121 responses within three weeks. That is a huge response for a small newspaper; mind you, we are talking about a quality local newspaper. The *County Times*, I might add, is such a brilliant paper that it has been recognised by the First Minister, who will visit its offices in Welshpool on Friday—

**Kirsty Williams:** After he has been to *The Brecon and Radnor Express*.

**Mick Bates:** Oh, after he has been to *The*

gynorthwyo olwynion yr economi i droi. Yr ydym am i'r uwchgynhadledd edrych ar y gorau o'r goreuon; yr ydym am iddi gael pwyntiau gweithredu, a bod yn fwy na siop siarad. Byddai'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig yn gweithio gyda chi, Weinidog, i'ch cynorthwyo gyda hyn, i helpu ein CMC i dyfu ac i wella ein GYC a chynorthwyo Cymru.

**Mick Bates:** Hoffwn ddechrau drwy ddweud fy mod yn derbyn bod nifer o'r pethau a godwyd gan David yn ei sylwadau agoriadol y tu hwnt i reolaeth y Gweinidog. Ni all hyd yn oed ein Dirprwy Brif Weinidog parchus ddylanwadu ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn Wall Street, na hyd yn oed yng Nghyfnwidfa Stoc Llundain. Felly, cyfeirïaf fy sylwadau at rywbeth y gall y Gweinidog ei wneud i gynorthwyo busnesau bach a chanolig yng Nghymru. Mae fy sylwadau'n seiliedig ar dystiolaeth sy'n gwrth-ddweud datganiad a wnaethpwyd yn gynharach am yr hyn y mae'r Llywodraeth hon wedi'i wneud i ddod â mynediad band eang da i Gymru. Gadewch inni edrych ar y ffigurau. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn ymfalchïo wrth ddweud wrthym fod 99.4 y cant o bob aelwyd yng Nghymru yn gallu cael band eang. Yr oeddwn yn arfer credu bod pob un o'r 0.6 y cant arall yn sir Drefaldwyn tan imi siarad ag Aelodau eraill o bob plaid a oedd hefyd yn honni bod y 0.6 y cant yn eu hetholaeth hwy.

Yr oeddwn yn credu y dylem gael sesiwn o gasglu tystiolaeth. Gyda'm papur newydd lleol, galwais am dystiolaeth am fand eang, a chafwyd ymateb rhyfeddol. Nid deiseb oedd hyn; yr oeddwn am gasglu tystiolaeth am y modd y mae busnesau'n masnachu yn y byd modern sydd ohoni, lle mae gallu cael cysylltiadau band eang da yn hanfodol. Cafwyd 121 o ymatebion mewn tair wythnos. Mae hynny'n ymateb enfawr i bapur newydd bach; ond cofiwch, yr ydym yn sôn yma am bapur newydd lleol o safon. Mae'r *County Times*, cofiwch, yn bapur mor wych nes iddo gael ei gydnabod gan y Prif Weinidog, a fydd yn ymweld â'i swyddfa yn y Trallwng ddydd Gwener—

**Kirsty Williams:** Ar ôl iddo ymweld â'r *Brecon and Radnor Express*.

**Mick Bates:** O ie, ar ôl iddo ymweld â'r

*Brecon and Radnor Express*. He has obviously heard about these talented journalists, and I suppose that the Labour Party wants to learn a bit about just how successful some politicians are at using their press.

4.10 p.m.

However, 65 of these responses were from small businesses in Montgomeryshire alone. I have since learned from other Members who represent rural constituencies that theirs is a similar picture, and businesses are suffering. I will give you some examples of the suffering that constituents undergo because they cannot get decent broadband connections. In response to the question, 'How much are the problems costing your business?' the following responses were received: 'Approx £5000 +', 'A fortune!', and '£100 week'. One respondent said that it cost an extra £200 a month in travel costs because they could not access broadband.

We then look at what that does to people who move in to the area. One business stated that it had just moved to the area and was poor, and was misled by a company who delivered on the last mile. For those of you who are not familiar with what that means, I can tell you that Openreach controls the exchanges and the lines, and then they have to offer access to all companies that sell broadband packages.

Often, these broadband packages are sold with false aspirations about the speed of the connection. The Minister has to look forward and give us a reply on this, because I know that the Government is now about to undertake a tendering process to help to spread more quality broadband and get rid of all not-spots. Here is an opportunity to answer these questions, Minister. How will you get to these not-spots? How will you provide future-proofed technology to these small businesses that are the lifeblood of many of our rural communities?

We have heard two key words today: 'enterprise' and 'innovation', both of which are characteristic of many small businesses in rural Wales. They need you to use some of the powers that you have to facilitate good

*Brecon and Radnor Express*. Mae'n amlwg ei fod wedi clywed am y newyddiadurwyr talentog hyn, a hwyrach fod y Blaid Lafur am ddysgu ryw ychydig am y ffordd y mae rhai gwleidyddion yn gallu defnyddio'u gwasg leol yn llwyddiannus.

Fodd bynnag, yr oedd 65 o'r ymatebion hyn gan fusnesau bach yn sir Drefaldwyn yn unig. Clywais ers hynny gan Aelodau eraill sy'n cynrychioli etholaethau gwledig fod y sefyllfa'n debyg yno hefyd, a bod busnesau'n dioddef. Dyma i chi rai enghreifftiau o'r ffordd y mae etholwyr yn dioddef am na allant gael cysylltiadau band eang derbynol. Dyma rai atebion i'r cwestiwn, 'Faint mae'r problemau hyn yn ei gostio i'ch busnes?': 'Tua £5,000'...'Ffortiwn!'...'£100 yr wythnos'. Dywedodd un ei fod yn costio £200 y mis yn ychwanegol iddo mewn costau teithio oherwydd nad oedd ganddo gysylltiad band eang.

Wedyn edrychwn ar yr hyn y mae hynny'n ei wneud i bobl sy'n symud i'r ardal. Sylw un busnes oedd ei fod newydd symud i'r ardal ac yn dlawd, a'i fod wedi'i gamarwain gan gwmni a gyflawnodd ar y filltir olaf. I'r rheini ohonoch sy'n anghyfarwydd ag ystyr hynny, gallaf ddweud wrthyfch fod Openreach yn rheoli'r cyfnewidfeydd a'r llinellau, ac wedyn rhaid iddynt gynnig mynediad i bob cwmni sy'n gwerthu pecynnau band eang.

Caiff y pecynnau band eang hyn eu gwerthu'n aml gyda dyheadau ffug o ran cyflymder y cysylltiad. Rhaid i'r Gweinidog edrych ymlaen a rhoi ateb inni ar hyn, oherwydd gwn fod y Llywodraeth yn awr ar fin agor proses dendro i helpu lledaenu band eang o safon a dileu'r mannau hynny lle nad yw ar gael. Dyma gyfle i ateb y cwestiynau hyn, Weiniidog. Sut y byddwch yn cael gwared ar y mannau hyn? Sut y byddwch yn darparu technoleg wedi'i diogelu'n gadarn at y dyfodol i'r busnesau bach hyn sydd mor hanfodol i gynifer o'n cymunedau gwledig?

Clywsom ddau air allweddol heddiw: 'menter' ac 'arloesedd', ac mae'r ddau'n nodweddiadol o nifer o fusnesau bach yng Nghymru wledig. Maent yn dibynnu arnoch i ddefnyddio rhai o'r pwerau sydd gennyfch i

broadband connections. It is an investment well worth making, Minister. I hope that you can tell us today that you are looking to the future, at using modern technology—wireless technology, for example—to make sure that people are not scrambling about for 2Mb, 6Mb or 8Mb, but can get 20Mb via good connections. That way, our businesses can prosper and create a better balance between the public and private sectors.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** You were about to move into a not-spot yourself, as you were running out of time.

**Nick Ramsay:** I am pleased to have listened to this interesting and thought-provoking debate this afternoon and to have had the chance to contribute. I particularly agreed with what David Melding had to say in his opening remarks. It is a timely debate given the current turbulent state of the world markets. We are all mindful of the fact that many issues relating to the world economy are beyond the Assembly's control. However, there are issues that we can influence and there are things that we can improve. The question that we have been dealing with today is the extent to which the Assembly Government is doing so.

This is the sort of debate in which it is easy to get bogged down in a mire of figures. I have loads of statistics with me, but, if I waded into them, I would probably get lost and would not be seen again this afternoon. Therefore, I shall keep my remarks on the statistics to a minimum. As a whole, the statistics make depressing reading. The figures published last month by the Office for National Statistics show that Wales is still, sadly, languishing at the bottom of the UK's economic performance league table. I am pleased that the first of the Government amendments addresses the fact that there is a problem with GVA. In tabling our amendments, we, and other parties, are trying to find ways to improve that.

In 1999, Wales's economy was on a par with

hwyluso cysylltiadau band eang da. Mae'n fuddsoddiad sy'n werth ei wneud, Weinidog. Gobeithio y gallwch ddweud wrthym heddiw eich bod yn edrych tua'r dyfodol, ar ddefnyddio technoleg fodern—technoleg ddiwifr, er enghraifft—i sicrhau nad yw pobl yn brwydro i gael cysylltiad 2Mb, 6Mb neu 8Mb, ond eu bod yn hytrach yn gallu cael 20Mb drwy gysylltiadau da. Drwy wneud hynny, gall ein busnesau ffynnu a chreu gwell cydbwysedd rhwng y sectorau cyhoeddus a phreifat.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr oeddech ar fin colli'ch cysylltiad eich hun, gan fod eich amser yn dod i ben.

**Nick Ramsay:** Yr wyf yn falch o fod wedi gwrandao ar y ddadl ddiddorol hon y prynhawn yma, sydd wedi gwneud i bob un ohonom feddwl, ac o gael y cyfle i gyfrannu. Yr oeddwn yn cytuno'n arbennig â'r hyn a oedd gan David Melding i'w ddweud yn ei sylwadau agoriadol. Mae'n ddadl amserol o gofio cyflwr cythryblus marchnadoedd y byd ar y funud. Yr ydym i gyd yn ymwybodol fod llawer o'r materion sy'n effeithio ar economi'r byd y tu hwnt i reolaeth y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, mae rhai materion y gallwn ddylanwadu arnynt ac mae rhai pethau y gallwn eu gwella. Y cwestiwn yr ydym wedi bod yn ei ystyried heddiw yw i ba raddau y mae Llywodraeth yn Cynulliad yn gwneud hynny.

Dyma'r math o ddadl lle mae'n hawdd cael eich llethu gan ormodedd o ffigurau. Mae gennyf lawer o ystadegau gyda mi, ond petawn yn brwydro fy ffordd drwyddynt mae'n debyg y byddwn yn mynd ar goll ac ni fydddech yn fy ngweld am weddill y prynhawn. Felly, bydd fy sylwadau ar yr ystadegau mor fyr â phosibl. Ar y cyfan, mae'r ystadegau'n ddigalon. Mae'r ffigurau a gyhoeddwyd fis diwethaf gan y Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol yn dangos bod Cymru o hyd, yn anffodus, ar waelod tabl perfformiad economaidd y DU. Yr wyf yn falch bod y cyntaf o welliannau'r Llywodraeth yn delio â'r ffaith fod yna broblem gyda'r gwerth ychwanegol crynswth. Wrth gyflwyno'n gwelliannau, yr ydym ni, a'r pleidiau eraill, yn ceisio dod o hyd i ffordd i wella hynny.

Yn 1999, yr oedd economi Cymru ar yr un

those of Northern Ireland and the north-east of England, with GVA per head at 81 per cent of the UK average. As many Members have suggested, sadly, that situation is now worse. If you look back to the time when the Conservatives were in Government, you could pick any number of years and say that there was a decline. Overall, during our time in Government, from 1979 to 1997, there was a clear improvement. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.'] It was a clear improvement.

It is not just argued that the performance of the Assembly Government in this area has not been—[*Interruption.*] I can see that some Plaid Cymru Members were thinking of intervening. Not so long ago, the Deputy First Minister himself agreed with us in this regard. In fact, I have a few interesting quotations from the Deputy First Minister. In April 2007, he said that the whole of Wales needed a fresh approach to our economy to ensure that we became a green and prosperous land, and that it was only Plaid that had a pan-Wales approach to spread prosperity across the country. Given your current role in Government, Deputy First Minister, I would be interested to know whether or not you feel that that is happening. The Plaid Cymru leader in Westminster said in 2006 that Labour's lies and broken promises show that they are a self-serving bunch who will say anything to be elected. How awful—let us hope that that is in the past and not happening now. We will be interested to hear what the Minister has to say about those matters.

The abandonment of the target of achieving 90 per cent of the UK average GVA per capita by 2010 was sad; it is a sign of the sad state of affairs that we are in at the moment, and could be described as fiddling the figures. However, the question is where we go from here. We cannot go back—the industries of the past cannot be resurrected. I listened with interest to Mick Bates's comments regarding broadband, and we will wholeheartedly support amendment 2, because there is a recognition there that we need to move forward as a country and grasp

lefel ac economi Gogledd Iwerddon a gogledd-ddwyrain Lloegr, a gwerth ychwanegol crynswth y pen yn 81 y cant o gyfartaledd y DU. Fel yr awgrymodd nifer o Aelodau, yn anffodus mae'r sefyllfa'n waeth erbyn hyn. Os edrychwch yn ôl ar yr adeg pan oedd y Ceidwadwyr mewn grym, gallwch ddewis unrhyw flynyddoedd a dweud bod dirywiad. Yn gyffredinol, yn ystod ein cyfnod ni mewn grym, rhwng 1979 a 1997, gwelwyd gwelliant pendant. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O'.] Yr oedd yn welliant amlwg.

Ni ellir dadlau nad yw perfformiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn y maes hwn wedi bod—[*Torri ar draws.*] Gwelaf fod rhai Aelodau Plaid Cymru wedi ystyried ymyrryd. Yn gymharol ddiweddar, yr oedd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ei hun yn cytuno â ni ar hyn. Mewn gwirionedd, mae gennyf rai dyfyniadau diddorol gan y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog. Ym mis Ebrill 2007, dywedodd fod ar Gymru gyfan angen agwedd newydd at ein heconomi i sicrhau ein bod yn wlad werdd a ffyniannus, ac mai gan Plaid yn unig yr oedd agwedd Cymru gyfan at ledaenu ffyniant ledled y wlad. O gofio'ch rôl bresennol yn y Llywodraeth, Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog, hoffwn wybod a ydych yn teimlo bod hynny'n digwydd ai peidio. Dywedodd arweinydd Plaid Cymru yn San Steffan yn 2006 fod celwyddau ac addewidion wedi eu torri gan Lafur yn dangos mai criw hunangeisiol ydynt sy'n dweud unrhyw beth i gael eu hethol. Dyna ichi ofnadwy—gadewch inni obeithio bod hynny yn y gorffennol ac nad yw'n digwydd erbyn hyn. Bydd gennym ddiddordeb clywed yr hyn sydd gan y Gweinidog i'w ddweud am y materion hynny.

Yr oedd yn drist rhoi'r gorau i'r targed o gyflawni 90 y cant o GYC y pen cyfartalog y DU erbyn 2010; mae'n arwydd o'r sefyllfa anffodus yr ydym ynddi ar hyn o bryd, a gellid dweud mai ffidlan y ffigurau ydyw. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn i'w ofyn bellach yw i ble yr awn o fan hyn. Ni allwn fynd yn ôl—ni ellir atgyfodi diwydiannau'r gorffennol. Gwrandewais â diddordeb ar sylwadau Mick Bates am fand eang, a byddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant 2 yn llwyr, gan fod cydnabyddiaeth bod angen inni symud ymlaen fel gwlad a manteisio ar dechnolegau newydd. Mae'n

new technologies. It is clear that Wales cannot turn to the past. It is sad that Wales remains the poorest part of the United Kingdom, despite the huge investment in structural funds. As we move forward, we know how tight funding is and that the amount of money that we can expect from Europe will, as the European Union expands, be increasingly threatened. Therefore the situation could get even worse, and so we need action from this Government.

I note that the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government and the Minister for Finance and Public Service Delivery are present, and we have spoken a lot about the local government settlement this week. I know that this debate is not specifically about that, but if we are talking about improving consumer confidence, a low tax agenda must be at the heart of that. While the Welsh Assembly Government does not have a direct influence on the level of income tax, the less money that the Government gives to local authorities, the more money local authorities must raise through council tax. I have made this point repeatedly, and have done so because I think that it is very important. Let us ensure that people across Wales are not put off from spending, and that we have whatever effect we can with regards to the global economic situation. I look forward to hearing what the Minister has to say.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Aside from the knockabout, this is a worthwhile debate and I commend David Melding on his opening remarks, although the comment about PFI was a bit of a red herring, as recent evaluations have shown that many of these schemes have provided very poor value for money.

**Nick Bourne:** Will the Member give way?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Let me have a run at it first. [*Laughter.*] I am interested in the stance of the Tory party at the moment. It believes in a low tax economy but also in spending more money on public services—indeed not just on public services, but everywhere.

amlwg na all Cymru droi at y gorffennol. Mae'n drist mai Cymru yw rhan dlotaf y Deyrnas Unedig o hyd, er y buddsoddiad aruthrol mewn cronfeydd strwythurol. Wrth inni symud ymlaen, gwyddom mor dynn yw cyllid ac y bydd yr arian y gallwn ei ddisgwyl gan Ewrop o dan fygythiad cynyddol, wrth i'r Undeb Ewropeaidd ehangu. Felly, gallai'r sefyllfa waethygu eto, ac felly mae arnom angen gweithredu gan y Llywodraeth hon.

Sylwaf fod y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol a'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid a Chyflenwi Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus yn bresennol, ac yr ydym wedi siarad llawer am y setliad i lywodraeth leol yr wythnos hon. Gwn nad yw'r ddadl hon yn ymwneud yn benodol â hynny, ond os ydym yn siarad am wella hyder defnyddwyr, rhaid i agenda treth isel fod wrth wraidd hynny. Er nad yw Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n dylanwadu'n uniongyrchol ar lefel y dreth incwm, po leiaf yr arian y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei roi i awdurdodau lleol, mwyaf oll o arian y mae'n rhaid i awdurdodau lleol ei godi drwy'r dreth gyngor. Yr wyf wedi dweud hyn droeon, a hynny am fy mod yn credu bod hynny'n bwysig iawn. Gadewch inni sicrhau na fydd pobl ledled Cymru'n cael eu hannog i beidio â gwario, ac y gwelwn pa bynnag effaith y gallwn ei chael o ran y sefyllfa economaidd fyd-eang. Edrychaf ymlaen at glywed yr hyn sydd gan y Gweinidog i'w ddweud.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Ar wahân i'r colbio, mae hon yn ddadl werth chweil, a chymeradwyaf David Melding am ei sylwadau agoriadol, er bod y sylw am y fenter cyllid preifat yn dipyn o ysgyfarnog, gan fod gwerthusiadau'n ddiweddar wedi dangos bod nifer o'r cynlluniau hyn wedi rhoi gwerth gwael iawn am yr arian.

**Nick Bourne:** A wnaiff yr Aelod ildio?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Gadewch imi roi cynnig arni yn gyntaf. [*Chwerthin.*] Mae gennyf ddi-ddordeb yn safle'r blaid Geidwadol ar hyn o bryd. Mae'n credu mewn economi treth isel ond hefyd mewn gwario mwy o arian ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus—yn wir, nid ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus yn unig, ond ym



mhobman.

**Nick Bourne:** I am grateful to the Member for giving way, as he raised the point. There is no doubt that a lower tax economy is linked to the amount of public spending in Wales; for example, the Member has been supportive of the extra £400 million that will come to Wales as a consequence of the Olympics. It is nothing to do with taxation—we are just not getting equitable treatment from your Government.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** It is not my Government that decides whether we will get the consequential from the Olympics, but never mind about that.

GVA is a crude and blunt indicator, but the uncomfortable comparative flat figures for west Wales and the Valleys contain a truth that we cannot and should not hide from. Although there are difficulties with the UK comparative figures, the concentration of wealth in south-east England is disastrous for much of England, let alone Wales. The income gap between the top 10 per cent and the poorest people in our communities is a damning indictment of the record of Westminster Governments for decades. Sweden, with its well-funded and effective public services is also a far less divided society in terms of economic prosperity and wealth distribution. That should be our aim for Wales. A booming Cardiff, or a booming north-east Wales, contrasts with a fragile picture in much of the rest of Wales, where one factory closure is a calamity.

4.20 p.m.

Reference has been made to local GVA figures, but they must be treated with care. Ynys Môn, at 53 per cent of the UK average, appears to be a third world county, but that is, fortunately, not quite the case. The figure is depressed by the fact that thousands of people travel over the bridge every day to work in Bangor and points east. In fact, if you take those into account, the comparative figure is similar to that of Gwynedd, not that Gwynedd is all that brilliant. [*Laughter.*] I am just telling you the truth—perhaps I should

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Aelod am ildio, gan mai ef a gododd y pwynt. Nid oes dim amheuaeth nad yw economi treth isel yn gysylltiedig â gwariant cyhoeddus yng Nghymru; er enghraifft, mae'r Aelod wedi cefnogi'r £400 miliwn ychwanegol a ddaw i Gymru o ganlyniad i'r Gemau Olympaidd. Nid oes a wnelo hynny ddim â threthiant—ond nid ydym yn cael ein trin yn deg gan eich Llywodraeth.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Nid fy Llywodraeth i sy'n penderfynu a gawn y swm canlyniadol o'r Gemau Olympaidd, ond nid oes ots am hynny.

Dangosydd bras a phlaen yw GYC, ond mae'r ffigurau cymharol gwastad anghyffyrddus ar gyfer y gorllewin a'r Cymoedd yn cynnwys gwirionedd na allwn ac na ddylem guddio rhagddo. Er bod anawsterau gyda ffigurau cymharol y DU, mae'r canolbwyntio cyfoeth yn ne-ddwyrain Lloegr yn drychinebus i lawer o Loegr, heb sôn am Gymru. Mae'r bwlch incwm rhwng y 10 y cant uchaf a'r bobl dlotaf yn ein cymunedau yn gyhuddiad damniol o record Llywodraethau San Steffan ers degawdau. Mae Sweden, gyda'i gwasanaethau cyhoeddus effeithiol a ariennir yn dda, hefyd yn gymdeithas sy'n llai rhanedig o lawer o ran llewyrch economaidd a dosbarthiad cyfoeth. Dyna a ddylai fod yn nod i ni ar gyfer Cymru. Mae Caerdydd lewyrchus, neu ogledd-ddwyrain Cymru lewyrchus, yn hollol wahanol i'r darlun bregus mewn rhannau helaeth o weddill Cymru, lle mae cau un ffatri yn drychineb.

Cyfeiriwyd at ffigurau GYC lleol, ond rhaid eu trin yn ofalus. Mae Ynys Môn, ar 53 y cant o gyfartaledd y DU, yn ymddangos fel sir yn y trydydd byd, ond nid yw hynny'n wir i gyd, diolch byth. Mae'r ffigur yn is am fod miloedd o bobl yn teithio dros y bont bob dydd i weithio ym Mangor a mannau tua'r dwyrain. Mewn gwirionedd, os ystyriwch y rheini, mae'r ffigur cymharol yn debyg i ffigur Gwynedd, nid bod Gwynedd yn lle mor fendigedig â hynny. [*Chwerthin.*] Dim ond dweud y gwir wrthyth yr ydwyf—efallai

have added, 'economically'.

**Alun Cairns:** Will you give way?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** No; hold on a minute.

We have made much of Ireland's experience and success—it is the Celtic tiger—but, again, the picture is a complex one. A feature of the Irish economy, despite the boom in Dublin and its environs, is the balance provided by the west coast cities and towns, with Galway one of the fastest-growing cities in Europe, and Limerick and Cork. When you visit there, you note the number of young people involved in running local businesses. In Wales, we need to ensure that we have growth centres in the west, the north, north west and in the Valleys that will draw young entrepreneurs to live and work there. Obviously, reliable and comfortable transport connections are necessary for that to happen.

The challenges in the post-industrial Valleys and in deeply rural Wales are similar, although the answers may be slightly different. We have learned that there are no quick fixes from Europe, and we know what the basic weaknesses are—low skills, poor productivity, and too few people in work, which leads low income levels. We need to improve the skills base of our workforce, and to develop and grow our own companies. Plaid Cymru has fought for long and hard for that, and that is now being recognised as necessary by everybody in Wales. We also need to use our universities to develop research and to create entrepreneurs.

To return to the point about young people, I will again make a plea. The programme, 'Getting on in Gwynedd', has been running over the past three years in Gwynedd. It is devised to get young people to think about starting their own businesses and to offer them practical help to do so. That programme should be rolled out throughout Wales, mainly in schools, but in other areas as well. Let us give the young people the skills and the aspiration to grow our own companies,

y dylwn fod wedi ychwanegu 'yn economaidd'.

**Alun Cairns:** A wnewch chi ildio?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Na wnaif; arhoswch funud.

Yr ydym wedi sôn llawer am brofiad a llwyddiant Iwerddon—hi yw'r teigr Celtaidd—ond eto, mae'r darlun yn gymhleth. Un o nodweddion economi Iwerddon, er gwaethaf y ffyniant yn Nulyn a'i ardaloedd cyfagos, yw'r cydbwysedd a ddarperir gan ddinasoedd a threfi arfordir y gorllewin, gyda Galway ymhlith y dinasoedd sy'n tyfu gyflymaf yn Ewrop, a Limerick a Cork. Pan ewch yno, byddwch yn sylwi cynifer o bobl ifanc sy'n rhedeg busnesau lleol. Yng Nghymru, mae angen inni sicrhau bod gennym ganolfannau twf yn y gorllewin, y gogledd, y gogledd orllewin ac yn y Cymoedd a fydd yn denu entrepreneuriaid ifanc i fyw ac i weithio yno. Yn amlwg, mae angen cysylltiadau trafniadaeth dibynadwy a chyffyrddus er mwyn i hynny ddigwydd.

Mae'r heriau yn y Cymoedd ar ôl cyfnod y diwydiannau trwm ac yn nwf yn Nghymru wledig yn debyg, er y gall bod yr atebion fod ychydig yn wahanol. Yr ydym wedi dysgu nad oes yna atebion cyflym o Ewrop, a gwyddom beth yw'r gwendidau sylfaenol—sgiliau isel, cynhyrchedd gwael, a rhy ychydig o bobl mewn gwaith, sy'n arwain at lefelau incwm isel. Mae angen inni wella sylfaen sgiliau ein gweithlu, a datblygu a thyfu ein cwmnïau ein hunain. Mae Plaid Cymru wedi ymladd yn hir ac yn galed am hynny, ac mae pawb yng Nghymru'n cydnabod erbyn hyn bod angen hynny. Mae angen hefyd inni ddefnyddio'n prifysgolion i ddatblygu ymchwil a chreu entrepreneuriaid.

I ddychwelyd at y pwynt am bobl ifanc, yr wyf eto am wneud ple. Mae'r rhaglen 'Camu 'Mlaen yng Ngwynedd' ar waith ers y tair blynedd diwethaf yng Ngwynedd. Cafodd ei llunio i annog pobl ifanc i ystyried dechrau eu busnesau eu hunain ac i gynnig cymorth ymarferol iddynt wneud hynny. Dylid cyflwyno'r rhaglen honno ledled Cymru, mewn ysgolion yn bennaf, ond mewn meysydd eraill hefyd. Gadewch inni roi i'r bobl ifanc y sgiliau a'r dyhead i dyfu eu

and let them get on with it.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Fel yr awgrymwyd eisoes, byddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant 2 gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, gan eu bod yn cyfeirio yn arbennig at fusnesau bach, ac yr ydym am eu gweld yn ffynnu, ac at yr angen i sicrhau mynediad at fand llydan drwy Gymru i'r graddau sydd yn bosibl. Yr ydym wedi gwneud llawer o waith yn y maes hwnnw, ond yr ydym yn cydnabod bod rhai meysydd lle mae angen gwella o hyd, a'r gobaith yw y gallwn wneud cyhoeddiad ar y ffordd i wneud hynny yn fuan.

One of the interesting facts about this debate is that although there was a real opportunity to have a broad and a wide-ranging debate on the economy, the Conservatives decided to concentrate on one issue. I find that disappointing, because all they say is in their motion is:

'notes with concern the continuing decline in the gross value added figures for Wales.'

In fairness, their spokesperson, David Melding, did widen the debate, but for some reason, they concentrated on GVA figures. Nick mentioned some quotations from the past that he managed to find from somewhere: let me give him a quotation that he might find interesting. David Melding told us that the GVA figures are the measures of choice, but that does not appear to be the measure of choice of the Conservatives in Westminster. In their report on the green economy, the Conservatives in Westminster say,

'GDP, the measurement of progress that we have adopted, is limited and increasingly perverse. It does not adequately measure the health of our environment and society.... A future Conservative government should adopt new measurements of progress, alongside GDP, that measure the other factors which are crucial to human and environmental wellbeing.'

In that regard, I am more in tune with the Conservatives in Westminster than the Welsh

cwmnïau eu hunain, a gadael iddynt fwrw ati.

**The Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** As has already been suggested, we will support amendment 2 by the Liberal Democrats, since they make particular reference to small businesses, and we want to see those prosper, and to the need to ensure access to broadband wherever possible in Wales. We have done a great deal of work in that area, but we acknowledge that there are some aspects that still need improvement, and we hope to make an announcement soon how that will be done.

Un o'r ffeithiau diddorol am y ddadl hon yw bod y Ceidwadwyr wedi penderfynu canolbwyntio ar un mater, er bod cyfle gwirioneddol i gael dadl eang a phellgyrhaeddol ar yr economi. Mae hynny'n fy siomi, oherwydd y cyfan a ddywedant yn eu cynnig yw:

'yn nodi â phryder y gostyngiad parhaus yn ffigurau gwerth ychwanegol crynswth Cymru'.

A bod yn deg, yr oedd eu llefarydd, David Melding, wedi ehangu'r ddadl, ond am ryw reswm buont yn canolbwyntio ar ffigurau GYC. Soniodd Nick am rai dyfyniadau o'r gorffennol y llwyddodd i ddod o hyd iddynt rywle: gadewch imi roi dyfyniad a allai fod o ddiddordeb iddo yntau. Dywedodd David Melding wrthym mai'r ffigurau GYC yw'r mesurau o ddewis, ond nid yw'n ymddangos mai hwnnw yw'r mesur o ddewis y Ceidwadwyr yn San Steffan. Yn eu hadroddiad am yr economi werdd, dywed y Ceidwadwyr yn San Steffan,

Mae CMC, y mesur cynnydd a fabwysiadwyd gennym, yn gyfyngedig ac yn gynyddol wrthnysig. Nid yw'n mesur iechyd ein hamgylchedd a'n cymdeithas yn ddigon da... Dylai llywodraeth Geidwadol y dyfodol fabwysiadu mesurau cynnydd newydd, ochr yn ochr â CMC, sy'n mesur y ffactorau eraill sy'n allweddol i les pobl a lles yr amgylchedd.

Yn hynny o beth, yr wyf yn cytuno'n fwy â'r Ceidwadwyr yn San Steffan nag â'r

Conservatives.

**David Melding:** The main point was that it is your measure of choice. You quoted the former Labour-only Government—it was also its measure of choice. There is an international debate going on about how we improve the way that we measure wealth and wellbeing. That is part of the Conservative agenda, as it is in the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development and the International Monetary Fund—we are quite happy with all that.

**The Deputy First Minister:** Look at the motion, David; it is entirely limited to GVA. You have accepted that there are wider measurements, but that is not included in your motion. We felt it necessary to propose an amendment to this motion because there are other factors at play. We have to deal with economic inactivity, unemployment, and many other wide-ranging issues, which I will mention.

However, let us look at the GVA figures, which are not healthy from a Conservative perspective. Kirsty reminded us of the figures. In 1990, GVA per capita was 85 per cent of the UK average; when the Conservatives left office, it was 79 per cent—a drop of 6 per cent. The Conservative Government in office led to the biggest drop in Welsh GVA, and yet they are trying to accuse others of failing to address the issue. Why do we not just accept that there is an issue, but that dealing with GVA as the only instrument is a mistake, and we have to do is look at the other instruments? Amendment 1, in the Government's name, addresses those issues.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Do you not find it odd that there is no reference in the Tories' manifesto of 2007 to improving GVA figures, or indeed to setting targets?

**The Deputy First Minister:** That is right. I think that they felt that, for some reason, they could embarrass the Government. [*Interruption.*] There is a great deal of embarrassment among the Conservative group at that revelation.

Ceidwadwyr Cymreig.

**David Melding:** Y prif bwynt oedd mai hwnnw yw'r mesur o'ch dewis chi. Yr oeddech yn dyfynnu'r Llywodraeth Lafur flaenorol—dyna oedd y mesur o'i dewis hi hefyd. Mae yna ddadl ryngwladol am y ffordd y gallwn wella'n dull o fesur cyfoeth a lles. Mae hynny'n rhan o'r agenda Geidwadol, fel y mae yn y Sefydliad ar gyfer Cydweithrediad a Datblygiad Economaidd a'r Gronfa Ariannol Ryngwladol—yr ydym yn ddigon bodlon â hynny i gyd.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Edrychwch ar y cynnig, David; mae'n gyfyngedig i GYC yn llwyr. Yr ydych wedi derbyn bod yna fesuriadau ehangach, ond nid yw hynny wedi ei gynnwys yn eich cynnig. Teimlem fod angen cynnig gwelliant i'r cynnig hwn gan fod ffactorau eraill ar waith. Rhaid inni ymdrin ag anweithgarwch economaidd, diweithdra, a nifer o faterion eang eraill y byddaf yn sôn amdanynt.

Fodd bynnag, gadewch inni edrych ar y ffigurau GYC, nad ydynt yn iach o safbwynt Ceidwadol. Atgoffwyd ni gan Kirsty am y ffigurau. Yn 1990, yr oedd GYC y pen yn 85 y cant o gyfartaledd y DU; pan gollodd y Ceidwadwyr rym, yr oedd yn 79 y cant—sef 6 y cant o ostyngiad. Bu'r Llywodraeth Geidwadol mewn grym yn gyfrifol am y gostyngiad mwyaf yn GYC Cymru, ac eto maent yn ceisio cyhuddo eraill o fethu â mynd i'r afael â'r mater. Pam na dderbyniwn yn awr fod yna broblem, ond mai camgymeriad yw mynd i'r afael â hi gan ddefnyddio GYC fel yr unig offeryn, ac mai'r hyn y mae'n rhaid inni ei wneud yw edrych ar yr offerynnau eraill? Mae gwelliant 1, yn enw'r Llywodraeth, yn mynd i'r afael â'r materion hynny.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Oni chredwch ei bod yn rhyfedd nad oes cyfeiriad ym manifesto'r Ceidwadwyr yn 2007 at wella ffigurau GYC, neu'n wir at osod targedau?

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Mae hynny'n wir. Credaf eu bod yn teimlo, am ryw reswm, y gallent godi cywilydd ar y Llywodraeth. [*Torri ar draws.*] Mae datgelu hynny wedi codi cywilydd mawr ar y grŵp Ceidwadol.

Let us look at some of the key figures. Employment in Wales was up by 8,000 over the previous year according to the latest statistics, and up 6,000 over the previous quarter. In the time that this Government has been in power, the employment rate has gone up to 72.1 per cent—it has increased higher in Wales than in the rest of the UK. We have also seen that the unemployment rate in Wales, at 5.1 per cent, is below the UK average, and economic inactivity levels have declined in the period that this Government has been in office. Those three measures show, if you look at what is stated in our amendment, that those key objectives are being met.

There is much more work to be done, and I was interested in Angela's point about the need for us to co-operate; I did not hear much co-operation in many of the other Conservative contributions. However, I accept that there is an issue here, in that, if we want to improve the Welsh economy, it will take an all-Wales approach. If the Conservatives have ideas as to how that can be done, then we would like to hear them; I did not hear many ideas today.

**Nick Bourne:** You suggest that we have not put forward any constructive ideas. One idea is that you are not involving the private sector sufficiently, and it would be interesting to hear your views on that. Also Angela Burns, on behalf of the party, explicitly offered a cross-party summit, involving all parties, trade unions and business leaders, to brainstorm some ideas to drive matters forward. I would be grateful if you would respond to those two constructive ideas on behalf of the Government, as you are the Deputy First Minister.

**The Deputy First Minister:** One point was made by Angela, but I did not hear any ideas from anyone else—that was the problem.

4.30 p.m.

Let us come back to the issue of convergence funding. We have made it clear that that

Gadewch inni edrych ar rai o'r ffigurau allweddol. Cynyddodd cyflogaeth yng Nghymru 8,000 yn ystod y flwyddyn flaenorol yn ôl yr ystadegau diweddaraf, a chynyddodd 6,000 yn ystod y chwarter blaenorol. Yn ystod yr amser y bu'r Llywodraeth hon mewn grym, mae'r gyfradd gyflogaeth wedi codi i 72.1 y cant—mae wedi codi mwy yng Nghymru nag yng ngweddill y DU. Gwelsom hefyd fod y gyfradd ddiweithdra yng Nghymru, sef 5.1 y cant, yn is na chyfartaledd y DU, a bod lefelau anweithgarwch economaidd wedi gostwng yn y cyfnod y bu'r Llywodraeth hon mewn grym. Mae'r tri mesur hynny'n dangos, os edrychwch ar yr hyn a nodir yn ein gwelliant, fod yr amcanion allweddol hynny'n cael eu bodloni.

Mae llawer mwy o waith i'w wneud, ac yr oedd gennyf ddiddordeb ym mhwynt Angela fod angen inni gydweithredu; ni chlywais lawer o gydweithrediad yn nifer o'r cyfraniadau Ceidwadol eraill. Fodd bynnag, derbyniaf fod yma broblem, sef os ydym am wella economi Cymru, bydd angen agwedd Cymru gyfan. Os oes syniadau gan y Ceidwadwyr ynghylch sut y gellir gwneud hynny, hoffem eu clywed; ni chlywais lawer o syniadau heddiw.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr ydych yn awgrymu nad ydym wedi cyflwyno unrhyw syniadau adeiladol. Un syniad yw nad ydych yn cynnwys y sector preifat yn ddigonol, a byddai'n ddiddorol clywed eich sylwadau am hynny. Hefyd cynigiodd Angela Burns yn eglur, ar ran y blaid, uwchgynhadledd drawsbleidiol, yn cynnwys pob plaid, undeb llafur ac arweinydd busnes, i wyntyllu rhai syniadau i yrru pethau yn eu blaen. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe byddech yn ymateb i'r ddau syniad adeiladol hynny ar ran y Llywodraeth, gan mai chi yw'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weidniog:** Gwnaethpwyd un pwynt gan Angela, ond ni chlywais unrhyw syniadau gan neb arall—dyna oedd y broblem.

Gadewch inni ddod yn ôl at fater cyllid cydgyfeirio. Yr ydym wedi gwneud yn glir

programme, particularly in terms of the Lisbon agenda and skills and employment, can only be delivered—I have said it before and I will say it again today—if there is an effective partnership between two Government departments working together, namely the Department for the Economy and Transport and the Department for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills, and also universities and the private sector. I have made that clear in the past and I will make it clear again. I have said it to the Confederation of British Industry and I will be repeating it to the Federation of Small Businesses when I meet with it shortly. I know that there is already a willingness in the private sector to work with us on that agenda.

We will also be changing the way in which we support business with a single investment fund. I was pleased with Lesley's point about the work of International Business Wales. Some excellent work is being done and if you look at Wales's record on exports, it has increased by 43 per cent in the lifetime of the National Assembly. That is a very impressive figure and it is higher than any other part of the United Kingdom. Therefore, let us have a balanced approach to this debate.

I will mention one or two other things about the Conservatives and their one-sided viewpoint on this debate. Andrew R.T. Davies said in the previous debate that there was only £5.6 million for rolling stock and that he wished it could be £56 million. Nick Bourne then mentioned that he wanted more money spent on railways. Where is the money going to come from? In the 2005 election, the UK Conservative Party said that it would cut public spending by at least 1 per cent across the board. Do you know how much that is worth to the Welsh block? It is worth £1.75 billion. I could not even spend the £5.6 million for rolling stock if the Conservatives had had their way.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Alun Cairns has three minutes to reply to the debate.

**Alun Cairns:** I am sorry that there is such a short time to respond to the points that Ieuan Wyn Jones, among others, made. However, I am extremely grateful that David Melding

mai'r unig ffordd y gall y rhaglen honno, yn enwedig yng nghyswllt agenda Lisbon a sgiliau a chyflogaeth, gael ei chyflawni—fe'i dywedais o'r blaen ac fe'i dywedaf eto—yw os bydd partneriaeth effeithiol rhwng dwy o adrannau'r Llywodraeth i weithio gyda'i gilydd, sef yr Adran dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth a'r Adran dros Blant, Addysg Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau, yn ogystal â phrifysgolion a'r sector preifat. Yr wyf wedi gwneud hynny'n glir yn y gorffennol ac fe'i gwnaf yn glir eto. Dywedais hynny wrth Gydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain, a byddaf yn ei ailadrodd wrth y Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach pan fyddwn yn cyfarfod yn fuan. Gwn fod yna barodrydd eisoes yn y sector preifat i weithio gyda ni ar yr agenda honno.

Byddwn hefyd yn newid ein ffordd o gefnogi busnes gydag un gronfa fuddsoddi sengl. Fe'm plesiwyd gan bwynt Lesley am waith Busnes Rhyngwladol Cymru. Mae gwaith ardderchog yn cael ei wneud, ac os edrychwch ar record Cymru gydag allforion, mae wedi cynyddu 43 y cant yn ystod bodolaeth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Mae hwnnw'n ffigur nodedig iawn ac yn uwch nag unrhyw ran arall o'r Deyrnas Unedig. O'r herwydd, gadewch inni gael agwedd gytbwys at y ddadl hon.

Cyfeiriaf at un neu ddau beth arall am y Ceidwadwyr a'u safbwynt unllygeidiog ynghylch y ddadl hon. Dywedodd Andrew R.T. Davies yn y ddadl flaenorol mai £5.6 miliwn yn unig a oedd ar gael ar gyfer stoc dreigl ac yr hoffai iddo fod yn £56 miliwn. Dywedodd Nick Bourne wedyn yr hoffai weld gwario mwy o arian ar reilffyrdd. O ble y daw'r arian? Yn etholiad 2005, dywedodd Plaid Geidwadol y DU y byddai'n tocio o leiaf 1 y cant oddi ar wariant cyhoeddus ar draws y bwrdd. A wyddoch werth hynny i'r bloc Cymreig? Mae'n werth £1.75 biliwn. Ni allwn hyd yn oed wario'r £5.6 miliwn ar stoc dreigl pe bae'r Ceidwadwyr wedi cael eu ffordd.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae gan Alun Cairns dri munud i ateb y ddadl.

**Alun Cairns:** Mae'n anffodus bod cyn lleied o amser i ymateb i'r pwyntiau a wnaethpwyd gan Ieuan Wyn Jones, ymhlith eraill. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn hynod ddiolchgar fod

used the time to make an extremely strong case, which was recognised by the opposition parties. Some of his points were even recognised by opposition Members who contributed to the debate. David, some of us might say, is often one of the more generous Members with regard to the opposition parties. His comments on gross value added were extremely pointed, fair and balanced—*[Interruption.]*

Opposition Members may make glib comments, but they all know how uncomfortable they feel. The day that Plaid Cymru joined the Welsh Assembly Government was the day that the Labour mafia really became the Taffia. We now have Ieuan Wyn Jones and his supporters defending everything that they criticised leading up to the Assembly elections. We recognise that GVA is not a perfect measure, but we also recognise that GVA is the internationally recognised measure of prosperity as it stands. While that is so, it is the only balanced way in which we can compare nations and regions in the same way. That is why the European Commission and the European Union use GVA as the measure when they are spreading cohesion funding. Therefore, even if it was a completely inappropriate measure for every other reason, if it was used for European funding, it would be an important measure on which to focus. It clearly shows the needs of the Welsh economy.

David Melding even highlighted GVA in terms of output per person, per hour and so on, in order to gain a broad perspective rather than focusing on what Alun Ffred—surprisingly—highlighted, namely GVA at the most local level. We recognise that GVA at the local level becomes far more difficult to measure and compare. He talked about people from Ynys Môn working in Bangor, but that should be included in the bigger output for the Gwynedd GVA. However, we know that that is not the case, which only demonstrates how much poorer prosperity is in Gwynedd, even if you take a share of the employment that is coming across from Ynys Môn. Therefore, I was extremely surprised that Alun Ffred made those points.

The clear issue, in the limited time that I

David Melding wedi defnyddio'r amser i bledio achos arbennig o gryf, a chydabuwyd hynny gan y gwrthbleidiau. Cydnabuwyd rhai o'i bwyntiau hyd yn oed gan Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau a gyfrannodd at y ddadl. Mae David, gallai rhai ohonom ddweud, yn aml yn un o'r Aelodau sy'n fwy hael tuag at y gwrthbleidiau. Yr oedd ei sylwadau am werth ychwanegol crynswth yn arbennig o gywir, teg a chytbwys—*[Torri ar draws.]*

Gall Aelodau'r Gwrthbleidiau wneud sylwadau smala, ond gwyddant bob un mor anghyfforddus ydynt. Y diwrnod pan ymunodd Plaid Cymru â Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru oedd y diwrnod y datblygodd maffia Llafur yn wir yn Taffia. Mae gennym Ieuan Wyn Jones a'i gefnogwyr yn awr yn cefnogi popeth yr oeddent yn ei feirniadu cyn etholiadau'r Cynulliad. Cydnabyddwn nad yw GYC yn fesur perffaith, ond cydnabyddwn hefyd mai GYC yw'r mesur ffyniant a gydnabyddir yn rhyngwladol fel y saif. Tra mae hynny'n wir, dyna'r unig ffordd gytbwys inni allu cymharu cenhedloedd a rhanbarthau yn yr un ffordd. Dyna pam y mae'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd a'r Undeb Ewropeaidd yn defnyddio GYC fel mesur pan fyddant yn dosbarthu cyllid cydlyniant. Felly, hyd yn oed pe bae'n fesur cwbl amhriodol am bob rheswm arall, pe câi ei ddefnyddio ar gyfer arian Ewropeaidd, byddai'n fesur pwysig i ganolbwyntio arno. Mae'n dangos anghenion economi Cymru'n glir.

Aeth David Melding ati hyd yn oed i danlinellu GYC o ran cynnyrch y pen, yr awr ac yn y blaen, er mwyn cael darlun eang, yn hytrach na'r hyn a danlinellodd Alun Ffred—er syndod—sef GYC ar ei lefel fwyaf lleol. Cydnabyddwn fod GYC ar y lefel leol yn mynd lawer yn anos ei fesur a'i gymharu. Soniodd am bobl o Ynys Môn yn gweithio ym Mangor, ond dylid cynnwys hynny yn yr allbwn mwy ar gyfer GYC Gwynedd. Fodd bynnag, gwyddon nad dyna'r achos, ac nid yw ond yn profi cymaint tlotach yw ffyniant yng Ngwynedd, hyd yn oed o gymryd cyfran o'r gyflogaeth o ddaw drosodd o Ynys Môn. Felly, yr oeddent yn synnu'n fawr fod Alun Ffred wedi gwneud y pwyntiau hynny.

Y mater clir, yn yr ychydig amser sydd

have, is that Ieuan Wyn Jones stood there seeking to defend the indefensible. He sought to wear Andrew Davies's coat. I can understand this approach when it comes from Andrew Davies, because he is defending the Labour Government both in Cardiff and in Westminster. However, when a member of Plaid Cymru, who has been critical of Labour's economic policy up to now, criticises this motion, compliments the Government's performance up to now and says that perhaps we only need to do a little more, it brings politics into disrepute and provokes feelings of despair more than anger.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The proposal is to agree amendment 1. Does any Member object? I see that they do. Therefore, we will defer the votes until voting time.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisiau tan yr amser pleidleisio.  
Votes deferred until voting time.*

### **Dadl Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru Welsh Liberal Democrats Debate**

#### **Dyled Bersonol Personal Debt**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Carwyn Jones and amendment 2 in the name of William Graham.

**Peter Black:** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. notes with concern that personal debt across the UK is in excess of £1.3 trillion;*

*2. notes with regret that the level of debt among young people, especially students, is a barrier to home ownership;*

*3. calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to support schemes aimed at improving financial literacy among children and adults, and to offer advice and support to those who are already struggling with debt. (NDM3848)*

gennyf, yw fod Ieuan Wyn wedi sefyll yno'n ceisio amddiffyn yr anamddiffynadwy. Ceisiodd wisgo cot Andrew Davies. Gallaf ddeall agwedd o'r fath pan ddaw o enau Andrew Davies, gan ei fod yn amddiffyn y Llywodraeth Lafur yng Nghaerdydd ac yn San Steffan. Fodd bynnag, pan fydd aelod o Blaid Cymru, sydd wedi bod yn feirniadol o bolisi economaidd Llafur cyn belled, yn beirniadu'r cynnig hwn, yn canmol perfformiad y Llywodraeth cyn belled ac yn dweud efallai mai dim ond ychydig mwy y mae angen inni ei wneud, mae hynny'n dwyn anfri ar wleidyddiaeth ac yn ennyn teimladau o anobaith yn fwy na dicter.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Y cynnig yw cytuno gwelliant 1. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiadau? Gwelaf fod. Felly, byddwn yn gohirio'r pleidleisiau tan amser pleidleisio.

**Y Dirprwy Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Carwyn Jones, a gwelliant 2 yn enw William Graham.

**Peter Black:** Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn nodi â phryder bod dyled bersonol ar draws y Deyrnas Unedig yn fwy na £1.3 triliwn;*

*2. yn nodi gyda gofid bod lefel y ddyled ymysg pobl ifanc, yn enwedig myfyrwyr, yn rhwystr rhag perchentyaeth;*

*3. yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gefnogi cynlluniau a anelir at wella llythrennedd ariannol ymhlith plant ac oedolion, a chynnig cyngor a chefnogaeth i'r rheini sydd eisoes yn cael anawsterau â dyled. (NDM3848)*



The Welsh Liberal Democrats have tabled this debate at a time when personal debt is spiralling out of control, and all across the country there are fears about the stability of our economy.

Even the Government has put us in debt—in the last few months, the Northern Rock crisis has seen every family in the country lending the bank £2,000 in order to secure its future. That crisis was brought about as a reaction to the sub-prime crisis that developed in America, where banks were consciously lending money to high-risk customers who had no chance of being able to pay the money back. As we will see, that is happening here too.

Personal debt in the UK has now exceeded £1.3 trillion—£5 billion more than the value of the entire economy. Over the last year, it increased by 10.2 per cent. In November alone, lending was a massive £223 billion. The scale of these figures is phenomenal and, for most people, it is difficult to grasp exactly what they mean. However, the fact that personal debt has now exceeded gross domestic product, namely that it is worth more than the entire economy, should set alarm bells ringing. Credit card debt alone is £126 billion.

Banks have a huge responsibility in this area, and some are not living up to it. Given that they make far more money from borrowers than from savers and investors, it is clearly in their interest to get young people to borrow as soon as they can. In 2001, Labour declared that Britain was now more prosperous, more equal and more respected, but the simple fact is that, in 2008, that is clearly not the case. The gap between the rich and the poor is more significant since Labour came to power in 1997 and crushing levels of personal debt, expanding student loans and obscene house prices are only making a bad situation much worse.

Not only are more people in higher debt than ever before, which is not necessarily a

Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru wedi cyflwyno'r ddadl hon ar adeg pan mae dyled bersonol yn codi y tu hwnt i bob rheolaeth, ac ym mhob cwr o'r wlad mae ofnau am sefydlogrwydd ein heconomi.

Mae hyd yn oed y Llywodraeth wedi ein rhoi mewn dyled—dros yr ychydig fisoedd diwethaf, mae argyfwng Northern Rock wedi golygu bod pob teulu yn y wlad yn rhoi benthyg £2,000 i'r banc i ddiogelu ei ddyfodol. Digwyddodd yr argyfwng hwnnw fel adwaith i'r argyfwng is-fenthyca a ddatblygodd yn America, lle'r oedd banciau'n ymwybodol eu bod yn benthyca arian i gwsmeriaid risg-uchel nad oedd ganddynt unrhyw obaith o allu talu'r arian yn ôl. Fel y gwelwn, mae hynny'n digwydd yma hefyd.

Mae dyled bersonol yn y DU yn awr dros £1.3 triliwn—£5 biliwn yn fwy na gwerth yr economi gyfan. Dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, mae wedi cynyddu 10.2 y cant. Ym mis Tachwedd yn unig yr oedd benthyca yn swm aruthrol o £223 biliwn. Mae graddfa'r ffigurau hyn yn anhygoel, ac i'r rhan fwyaf o bobl mae'n anodd dirnad beth yn union yw eu hystyr. Fodd bynnag, dylai'r ffaith fod dyled bersonol erbyn hyn yn fwy na'r cynnyrch domestig gros, hynny yw, yn werth mwy na'r economi gyfan, fod yn ddigon i seinio larymau perygl. Mae dyled cardiau credyd yn unig yn £126 biliwn.

Mae gan fanciau gyfrifoldeb aruthrol yn y maes hwn, ac nid yw rhai ohonynt yn ei anrhydeddu. A derbyn eu bod yn gwneud llawer mwy o arian ar gorn benthycwyr nag ar gorn cynilwyr a buddsoddwyr, mae'n amlwg yn llesol iddynt gael pobl ifanc i fenthyca mor gynnar ag y gallant. Yn 2001, cyhoeddodd Llafur fod Prydain yn awr yn fwy ffyniannus, yn fwy cyfartal ac yn uwch ei pharch. Ond y ffaith foel, yn 2008, yw ei bod yn amlwg nad yw hynny'n wir. Mae'r bwlch rhwng y cyfoethog a'r tlawd yn fwy sylweddol ers i Lafur ddod i rym yn 1997, ac mae lefelau arteithiol o ddyled bersonol, benthyciadau myfyrwyr cynyddol a phrisiau tai sydd y tu hwnt i bob rheswm yn cyfrannu at wneud sefyllfa wael ganmil yn waeth.

Nid yn unig y mae gan bobl fwy o ddyled nag erioed o'r blaen, nad yw o reidrwydd yn

problem if well managed, but experts say that more people are in day-to-day financial difficulty than before. In a recent survey, 2.5 million people claimed to be 'very concerned' about their personal finances, and rightly so. Datamonitor, the independent financial analyst, warned this week that the total number of Britons credit blacklisted by 2011 will jump by 20 per cent to 8.6 million.

In 2006, the income of the average first-time buyer in Wales was £30,841, compared to the average house price of £168,300. That makes the average house bought by a first-time buyer 5.5 times the average wage. According to other estimates, house prices can be up to 6.28 times the average income.

If you consider that banks traditionally have lent around 3 or 3.5 times a person's income for a mortgage, this situation can only lead to one of two outcomes: either banks lend irresponsible amounts of money, at five or six times a person's income, or people cannot get onto the housing ladder at all. In a society where we promote the idea of home ownership, this has generally led to people borrowing more money than they can sensibly afford.

What is worse is the growth of loan companies seeking to make money out of people's debt problems. In some cases they can help, but in others you have to wonder about the wisdom of some of the deals on offer.

4.40 p.m.

Take the case of Picture Financial Services plc, whose website offers loans of,

'up to 125% of the value of your home... something that traditional lenders won't consider'.

That is for good reason. What is the Government's response to such offers? It provides personal endorsements. The Picture Financial Services website contains a

problem o gael ei reoli'n dda, ond dywed arbenigwyr bod gan fwy o bobl anawsterau ariannol o ddydd i ddydd nag o'r blaen. Mewn arolwg diweddar, dywedodd 2.5 miliwn o bobl eu bod yn 'bryderus iawn' am eu sefyllfa ariannol, ac yr oedd ganddynt le i boeni. Rhybuddiodd Datamonitor, y dadansoddydd ariannol annibynnol, yr wythnos hon y bydd cyfanswm y Prydeinwyr sydd ar restr ddu credyd erbyn 2011 yn llamu 20 y cant i 8.6 miliwn.

Yn 2006, incwm y prynwr tro cyntaf cyffredin yng Nghymru oedd £30,841, o'i gymharu â phris tŷ cyffredin o £168,300. Golyga hynny bod y tŷ cyffredin a brynir gan brynwr tro cyntaf 5.5 gwaith y cyflog cyffredin. Yn ôl amcangyfrifon eraill, gall prisiau tai fod hyd at 6.28 gwaith yr incwm cyffredin.

O gofio bod banciau, yn draddodiadol, wedi benthyca oddeutu 3 neu 3.5 gwaith incwm rhywun ar gyfer morgais, ni all sefyllfa o'r fath ond arwain at un o ddau ganlyniad: naill ai mae banciau'n benthyca symiau anghyfrifol o arian, ar bump neu chwe gwaith incwm rhywun, neu mae pobl yn methu â chamu ar yr ysgol eiddo o gwbl. Mewn cymdeithas lle yr ydym yn hyrwyddo delwedd perchnogi cartrefi, mae hyn wedi yn golygu, yn gyffredinol, fod pobl yn benthyca mwy o arian nag y gallant ei fforddio'n synhwyrol.

Yr hyn sy'n waeth yw twf cwmnïau benthyca sy'n ceisio gwneud arian ar gorn problemau dyledion pobl. Mewn rhai achosion, gallant helpu, ond mewn achosion eraill rhaid ichi amau doethineb rhai o'r cynigion a wneir.

Ystyriwch achos Picture Financial Services plc, a'u gwefan sy'n cynnig benthyciadau o

hyd at 125 y cant o werth eich cartref ... rhywbeth na fydd benthycwyr traddodiadol yn ei ystyried.

Ac mae rheswm da dros hynny. Sut mae'r Llywodraeth yn ymateb i gynigion o'r fath? Mae'n darparu ardystiadau personol. Mae gwefan Picture Financial Services plc yn

prominent testimonial from the Secretary of State for Work and Pensions, praising the company for its success. Questions must be asked about whether it is appropriate for a Government Minister to offer such testimonials, particularly one who is responsible for the whole apparatus of state support for the less-well off in our society. It seems that the Government's response to our growing personal debt burden is to shrug its shoulders and turn the other way.

**Kirsty Williams:** Do you share my concerns about how many of these companies advertise on television and the time of day at which they advertise themselves, which is often during children's programmes? The children of many parents who have found themselves in severe financial situations have told them, 'It's fine; just ring up that nice person with the blue telephone and it will all be all right'.

**Peter Black:** I share your concern about that, Kirsty.

In his defence, it is obvious that Peter Hain's comments have been taken out of context and misused on the Picture site. However, that did not stop him asking the chief executive of Picture for a donation and there is no evidence that he has asked for the quotation to be removed from the website, which he should do. We would do well to heed the warning in a press release put out by Mr Hain's Department for Work and Pensions on 9 January telling us that more than half of the people in the UK, 55 per cent, spend more than they can afford and are struggling.

We would like to see the Welsh Government focus its attention on three areas. By working with bodies such as Citizens Advice, learning providers and local authorities, we would like to see the Government fund and promote best practice in increasing financial literacy. We would like to see financial literacy workshops run through accessible community groups, such as pensioner clubs and parent groups, all with the main objective of informing people, especially the most vulnerable, about sound financial management and the risks of debt. That also needs to be replicated in our schools and colleges.

cynnwys tysteb amlwg gan yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Waith a Phensiynau, yn canmol y cwmni ar ei lwyddiant. Rhaid gofyn a yw'n briodol i Weinidog y Llywodraeth gynnig tystebau o'r fath, yn enwedig un sy'n gyfrifol am holl gyfundrefn o gefnogaeth y wladwriaeth i'r lleiaf cefnog yn ein cymdeithas. Ymddengys mai ymateb y Llywodraeth i'n baich cynyddol o ddyled bersonol yw gwneud ystum ddi-hid a throï ei chefn arnom.

**Kirsty Williams:** A ydych chi fel finau yn pryderu ynghylch yr holl gwmnïau hyn sy'n hysbysebu ar y teledu, a'r adeg o'r dydd pan fyddant yn hysbysebu eu hunain, sef yn aml yn ystod rhaglenni plant? Mae plant nifer o rieni sydd wedi cael eu hunain mewn sefyllfaoedd ariannol difrifol wedi dweud wrthynt, 'Peidiwch â phoeni; ffoniwch y dyn clên a'r ffôn las, a bydd popeth yn iawn'.

**Peter Black:** Yr wyf yn pryderu, fel chithau, Kirsty ynghylch hynny.

I achub ei gam, mae'n amlwg fod sylwadau Peter Hain wedi eu cymryd allan o'u cyddestun a'u camddefnyddio ar y wefan Picture. Fodd bynnag, nid oedd hynny wedi ei rwystro rhag gofyn i brif weithredwr Picture am gyfraniad, ac nid oes tystiolaeth iddo ofyn am ddileu'r dyfyniad oddi ar y wefan, fel y dylai wneud. Byddai'n ddoeth inni wrando ar y rhybudd mewn datganiad i'r wasg a ryddhawyd gan Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau Mr Hain ar 9 Ionawr, yn dweud wrthym fod dros hanner pobl y DU, 55 y cant, yn gwario mwy nag y gallant ei fforddio, a'u bod yn cael anhawster.

Hoffem weld Llywodraeth y Cynlluniad yn hoelio'i sylw ar dri maes. Drwy weithio gyda chyrrff megis Cyngor ar Bopeth, darparwyr dysgu ac awdurdodau lleol, hoffem weld y llywodraeth yn ariannu ac yn hyrwyddo arferion gorau wrth gynyddu llythrennedd ariannol. Hoffem weld gweithdai llythrennedd ariannol yn cael eu rhedeg mewn grwpiau cymunedol hawdd eu cyrraedd, megis clybiau pensynwyr a grwpiau rheini, y cyfan gyda'r prif nod o addysgu pobl, yn enwedig y rhai sydd fwyaf agored i niwed, ynghylch rheolaeth ariannol gadarn a pheryglon dyled. Dylid cynnig yr un

gwasanaeth yn ein hysgolion a'n colegau.

It would also be useful if the Welsh Government could help citizens advice bureaux overcome their many funding issues so as to provide this service and the important debt advice service that they provide. Many of them are struggling to provide a full advice service, because of their reliance on hard-pressed local councils for money. The funding levels are uneven across Wales and, as a result, access to advice is variable. That advice service is crucial for many people and the situation needs to be addressed at a Government level. Perhaps the Minister will outline in his response what he can do to help.

Secondly, we would like to see the funding of independent advice centres to supply those who need it with financial health checks. We hope that the Government will take that on board.

Finally, we would like to see more help for credit unions. The Government currently pledges £800,000 to Welsh credit unions per year, yet that would lift only 26 couples seeking help from the Consumer Credit Counselling Service out of debt. The commitment to helping those in debt and preventing those at risk of becoming financially excluded needs to be far reaching and needs to start at a young age.

I urge the Government to revisit its programme on these issues and to look again at their effectiveness.

**The Minister for Social Justice and Local Government (Brian Gibbons):** I propose amendment 1 in the name of Carwyn Jones. Delete all after point 1 and replace with:

2. *commends the Welsh Assembly Government's schemes aimed at improving financial literacy among children and adults, and to offer advice and support to those who are already struggling with debt.*

Byddai'n ddefnyddiol hefyd pe gallai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad helpu canolfannau Cyngor ar Bopeth i oresgyn eu problemau cyllido niferus er mwyn gallu darparu'r gwasanaeth hwn a'r gwasanaeth pwysig a ddarparant ar ddyled. Mae nifer yn ei chael yn anodd darparu gwasanaeth cyngori llawn am eu bod yn dibynnu am arian gan gynghorau lleol, sydd dan gymaint o bwysau eu hunain. Mae'r lefelau cyllido ledled Cymru yn anwastad, ac o'r herwydd mae gallu cael cyngor yn amrywio. Mae'r gwasanaeth cyngori hwnnw'n allweddol i lawer o bobl, ac mae angen mynd i'r afael â'r sefyllfa ar lefel y Llywodraeth. Efallai y gwnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu yn ei ymateb yr hyn y gall ei wneud i helpu.

Yn ail, caredm weld canolfannau cyngor annibynnol yn cael eu hariannu i ddarparu archwiliadau iechyd ariannol i reini y mae eu hangen arnynt. Gobeithio y bydd y Llywodraeth yn rhoi sylw i hynny.

Yn olaf, caredm weld mwy o gymorth i undebau credyd. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r Llywodraeth yn ymrwymo £800,000 y flwyddyn i undebau credyd Cymru, ond eto byddai hynny'n helpu dileu dyledion dim ond 26 o gyplau sy'n troi at y Gwasanaeth Cwnsela ar Gredyd Defnyddwyr am gymorth. Mae angen i'r ymrwymiad i helpu'r rheini sydd mewn dyled ac i atal y rheini sydd mewn perygl o gael eu hallgau'n ariannol, fod yn bellgyrhaeddol, ac mae angen dechrau'n ifanc.

Anogaf y Llywodraeth i edrych o'r newydd ar ei rhaglen ar y materion hyn, ac ailystyried eu heffeithiolrwydd.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol (Brian Gibbons):** Cynigiaf welliant 1 yn enw Carwyn Jones. Dileu popeth ar ôl y pwynt cyntaf a rhoi yn ei le:

2. *yn cymeradwyo cynlluniau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a anelir at wella llythrennedd ariannol ymhlith plant ac oedolion, a chynnig cyngor a chefnogaeth i'r rheini sydd eisoes yn cael anawsterau â dyled.*

**Mark Isherwood:** I propose amendment 2 in the name of William Graham. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*further calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to liaise with the UK Treasury and financial institutions to address the growing debt crisis.*

We will support this timely motion. We have enjoyed 15 years of economic growth but, over the last decade, it has been built on consumer debt, statistical fiddling and cheap, imported goods. A Bank of England report this month showed that, since the credit crunch, lenders have cut back sharply on their willingness to dish out more money. Consumer demand has been one of the main drivers of UK economic growth, while rising house prices have underpinned a feel-good factor that has allowed shoppers to keep spending. However, the economic environment that allowed consumers to borrow cheaply, remortgage quickly and run up large debts has changed, and tougher times lie ahead. The effects are becoming more evident with an increase in mortgage arrears and bad debt. Only yesterday, the Governor of the Bank of England warned of more losses and a further tightening of credit. When will we ever learn?

As a young building society manager, I remember the cartel and mortgage rationing in the early 1980s. I remember deregulation, introducing real competition and building our home-owning democracy. However, I also remember the arrival of mortgage lenders and intermediaries, targeting high-risk borrowers, and the devastating consequences when membership of the exchange rate mechanism, supported by all parties, forced up interest rates. At first, we called their activities 'adverse credit', then we called them 'non status', and now we call them 'sub-prime'. However, despite the Consumer Credit Act 2006, the banking code, the Financial Services Act 1986, the mortgage code and the Financial Services Authority, growing numbers are being hurt again.

**Mark Isherwood:** Cynigiaf welliant 2 yn enw William Graham.

*yn galw ymhellach ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gysylltu â Thrysorlys y Deyrnas Unedig a sefydliadau ariannol i fynd i'r afael â'r argyfwng dyled sydd ar dwf.*

Cefnogwn y cynnig amserol hwn. Yr ydym wedi mwynhau 15 mlynedd o dwf economaidd, ond dros y degawd diwethaf mae wedi ei adeiladu ar ddyled defnyddwyr, ystumio ystadegau a nwyddau rhad wedi'u mewnfario. Dengys adroddiad gan Fanc Lloegr y mis hwn, ers y wasgfa gredyd, fod benthycwyr wedi lleihau'n ddramatig eu parodrwydd i roi benthycwyr mwy o arian. Galw gan ddefnyddwyr fu un o brif ysgogwyr twf economaidd y DU, tra mae prisiau tai cynyddol wedi bod yn sail i agwedd haf-ohyd sydd wedi caniatáu i siopwyr barhau i wario. Fodd bynnag, mae'r amgylchedd economaidd a oedd yn caniatáu i ddefnyddwyr fenthyca'n rhad, ail-forgeisio'n gyflym a chael dyledion mawr wedi newid, ac mae dyddiau caletach o'n blaenau. Daw'r effeithiau'n fwy amlwg gyda chynnydd mewn dyledion morgais a dyledion gwael. Ddoe yn unig rhybuddiodd Llywodraethwr Banc Lloegr ynghylch mwy o golledion a thynhau credyd ymhellach. Pryd wnawn ni ddysgu?

Fel rheolwr ifanc gyda chymdeithas adeiladu, cofiaf y cartel a'r dogni morgeisi yn y 1980au cynnar. Cofiaf ddadreoleiddio, cyflwyno cystadleuaeth go iawn ac adeiladu ein democratiaeth perchentyaeth. Fodd bynnag, cofiaf hefyd ddyfodiad y benthycwyr morgeisi a'r cyfryngwyr yn targedu benthycwyr risg uchel, a'r canlyniadau difaol pan ymaelodwyd â mecanwaith y gyfradd gyfnewid, gyda chefnogaeth y pleidiau i gyd, gan wthio cyfraddau llog i fyny. Ar y dechrau, 'credyd anffafriol' oedd ein henw ar eu gweithgareddau, wedyn fe'u galwem yn 'ddi-statws', ac erbyn hyn, 'is-fenthyca'. Fodd bynnag, er gwaethaf Deddf Credyd Defnyddwyr 2006, y cod bancio, Deddf Gwasanaethau Ariannol 1986, y cod morgeisi a'r Awdurdod Gwasanaethau Ariannol, mae niferoedd cynyddol unwaith eto'n cael loes.

Total UK personal debt at the end of November stood at £1.4 billion. The growth rate increased to 9.5 per cent for the previous 12 months, which equates to an increase of £120 billion or £1 million every five minutes. Mortgage possession orders in Wales increased by 10 per cent over the same period, compared with 3 per cent in England. PricewaterhouseCoopers has warned that the number of people going bust could rise this year, with a backlog of individual voluntary arrangements and with people building up credit card debt to try to cope with their debt payments. No wonder that debt advice companies in Wales are reporting a rapid expansion in demand for their services.

Wales suffers the greatest debt poverty in the United Kingdom. Citizens Advice in Wales saw a 10 per cent increase in client issues last year—91,000 of which were debt related, and 97,000 of which were benefit related, accounting for between over two thirds of all client problems. Problems with mortgage and second-loan arrears have risen by 11 per cent, predominantly from lower-income families who borrowed at higher rates from sub-prime lenders. Sub-prime lenders have a share in court activity and evictions of up to 10 times their market share. Basic bank accounts are still difficult to obtain for a lot of people. Financial literacy schemes for children and adults are critical, and I commend the scheme being piloted by Citizens Advice in three Flintshire schools. I was pleased to attend its north Wales financial capability forum in Shrewsbury, at its invitation, last September. It has been working with schools for nearly five years, delivering courses in banking, affordable credit using annual percentage rates, saving and credit unions, budgeting and energy efficiency. Flint High School is mentioned in the Assembly Government's financial inclusion strategy, but when will we see this published? Further roll-out will require Assembly Government support. Sponsored by Citizens Advice, Ysgol Maes Garmon and Flint High School will visit the Assembly on 4 March to present their plays and readings, and I urge all Members to go along.

Yr oedd cyfanswm dyledion personol y Deyrnas Unedig ddiwedd mis Tachwedd yn £1.4 biliwn. Cododd y gyfradd dwf i 9.5 y cant am y 12 mis blaenorol, sy'n cyfateb i gynnydd o £120 biliwn, neu £1 filiwn bob pum munud. Cynyddodd gorchmynion meddiannu morgaeisi yng Nghymru 10 y cant yn yr un cyfnod, o'i gymharu â 3 y cant yn Lloegr. Mae PricewaterhouseCoopers wedi rhybuddio y gallai nifer y bobl sy'n mynd yn fethdalwyr godi eleni, gydag ôl-groniad o drefniadau gwirfoddol unigol a phobl yn cynyddu dyledion cardiaid credyd i geisio ymdopi â'u taliadau dyled. Nid oes ryfedd fod cwmnïau sy'n rhoi cyngor ar ddyled yng Nghymru yn dweud bod cynnydd cyflym yn y galw am eu gwasanaethau.

Cymru yw'r wlad sydd â'r tlodi dyled mwyaf yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Gwelodd Cyngor ar Bopeth yng Nghymru gynnydd o 10 y cant ym mhroblemau cleientiaid y llynedd—91,000 ohonynt yn ymwneud â dyled a 97,000 yn ymwneud â budd-dal, sef dros ddwy ran o dair o holl broblemau cleientiaid. Mae problemau gydag ôl-ddyledion morgais ac ail-fenthyciadau wedi codi 11 y cant, yn bennaf gan deuluoedd ag incwm is a gymerodd fenthyciadau ar gyfraddau uwch gan is-fenthycwyr. Mae gan is-fenthycwyr ran mewn gweithgareddau llys a throi pobl allan o'u cartrefi hyd at 10 gwaith eu cyfran o'r farchnad. Mae cyfrif banc sylfaenol yn dal yn anodd ei gael i lawer o bobl. Mae cynlluniau llythrennedd ariannol i blant ac oedolion yn allweddol, a chymeradwyaf y cynllun sy'n cael ei beilota gan Cyngor ar Bopeth mewn tair ysgol yn sir y Fflint. Yr oeddwn yn falch derbyn ei wahoddiad i'w fforwm i ogledd Cymru yn Amwythig fis Medi y llynedd ar allu ariannol. Mae'n gweithio gydag ysgolion ers bron bum mlynedd, gan ddarparu cyrsiau mewn bancio, credyd fforddiadwy a defnyddio cyfraddau canrannol blynyddol, undebau cynilo ac undebau credyd, trefnu cyllideb ac effeithlonrwydd ynni. Crybwyllir Ysgol Uwchradd y Fflint yn strategaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gynhwysiant ariannol, ond pa bryd y gwelwn gyhoeddi hon? Bydd angen cefnogaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ymestyn hyn ymhellach. Dan nawdd Cyngor ar Bopeth, bydd Ysgol Maes Garmon ac Ysgol Uwchradd y Fflint yn dod i'r Cynulliad ar 4 Mawrth i gyflwyno'u

dramâu a'u darlleniadau, ac anogaf bob Aelod i fynd i'w gweld.

We need more restrictions on junk mail, legislation to limit extortionate doorstep credit, awareness raising of the illegal money laundering or lending market, bilingual debt advice and police training on bailiff powers and debtors' rights. Benefits must be reviewed and simplified. We need a cooling-off period for store cards, clearer information for credit card users, the same data sharing standards for home credit companies that apply in the mainstream banking sector, and a co-ordinated crack-down on illegal loan sharks. We must support work done by the Financial Services Authority and the Council of Mortgage Lenders on financial capability, on the creation of their online debt test and on sustainable home ownership. We must continue to strengthen and promote the credit unions across Wales, forging links with organisations such as housing associations, post offices and others.

Mae angen mwy o gyfyngiadau ar bost sothach, deddfwriaeth i gyfyngu rhoi credyd am grobris ar y stepen drws, codi ymwybyddiaeth o'r farchnad fenthyca neu olchi arian anghyfreithlon, cyngor dwyieithog ar ddyled a hyfforddiant heddlu ar bwerau beiliod a hawliau dyledwyr. Rhaid adolygu a symleiddio budd-daliadau. Mae angen cyfnod ymbwyllo ar gyfer cardiau siopau, gwybodaeth fwy eglur i ddefnyddwyr cardiau credyd, yr un safonau rhannu data i gwmnïau credyd cartref ag sy'n berthnasol i'r sector bancio prif ffrwd ac ymgyrch bwrpasol yn erbyn siarcod benthycyca anghyfreithlon. Rhaid inni gefnogi gwaith a wneir gan yr Awdurdod Gwasanaethau Ariannol a Chyngor y Benthycwyr Morgais ar allu ariannol, ar greu eu prawf dyled ar-lein ac ar berchentyaeth gynaliadwy. Rhaid inni barhau i gryfhau a hyrwyddo'r undebau credyd ledled Cymru, gan ffurfio cysylltiadau â chyrff fel cymdeithasau tai, swyddfeydd post ac eraill.

Consumer debt is at record levels. For the most financially vulnerable, intervention is required. Tackling debt is an issue of social responsibility, demanding fair and proportionate credit regulation and consumer protection. There is much—[*Interruption.*]

Mae dyledion defnyddwyr yn uwch nag erioed. I'r mwyaf bregus yn ariannol, mae angen ymyrryd. Mae mynd i'r afael â dyled yn fater o gyfrifoldeb cymdeithasol, ac mae'n mynnu rheoli credyd yn deg ac yn gytbwys a diogelu defnyddwyr. Mae llawer o-[*Torri ar draws.*]

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You have had more than five minutes; your time is now up.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Yr ydych wedi cael mwy na phum munud; mae eich amser ar ben yn awr.

**Jenny Randerson:** The Labour Party can be congratulated on one thing, and that is that it created an almost entirely new brand of debtor, which is the student debtor. Since Labour came to power in Westminster, we have seen the abandonment of its 'education, education, education' promise, and its claim that it would not introduce top-up fees was farcical and rapidly abandoned. It has created billions of pounds-worth of student debt.

**Jenny Randerson:** Gellir llongyfarch y Blaid Lafur am un peth, sef ei bod wedi creu math hollol newydd o ddyledwr i bob pwrpas, sef y myfyriwr dyledus. Ers i Lafur ddod i rym yn San Steffan, gwelsom roi heibio ei haddewid 'Addysg, addysg, addysg' ac yr oedd ei haerid na fyddai'n cyflwyno ffioedd atodol yn chwerthinllyd a chafodd ei daflu o'r neilltu'n ddigon buan. Mae wedi creu gwerth biliynau o bunnau o ddyled myfyrwyr.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Will you give way?

**Bethan Jenkins:** A wnewch chi ildio?

**Jenny Randerson:** Yes, I will happily give way.

**Jenny Randerson:** Gwnaf, ildiaf yn llawen.

**Bethan Jenkins:** I just wanted to ask what your perception was of your colleagues in Scotland who introduced a graduate endowment and whether you would agree with your colleague, Nicol Stephen, for doing that a few years ago?

4.50 p.m.

**Jenny Randerson:** As you well know—or, at least, I hope that you know—when they did that in Scotland, it was in order to avoid the full introduction of top-up fees, and, within the finances that they had at the time, it was the best that they could do. It is a tremendous improvement upon the mess we have here in Wales, even though the Liberal Democrats were able to prevent an entire fiasco with top-up fees here.

I will continue now—clearly, the intention was to intervene before I had even started. When you look at the current level of student debt, it pushes the debt of the previous generation of students totally into the shade. New graduates find it increasingly difficult to become homeowners when they are faced with an average debt of £11,000, and that average is rising rapidly. If you consider doctors, for example, when they fully qualify they have debts in excess of £11,000, and there is strong evidence that, as a result, young people from poorer homes are failing to enrol on courses to become doctors, or on the other lengthy courses. Worryingly, we are creating a debt ethos among young people, and when you take into account the fact that a first home costs six or seven times the salary that they earn upon graduation, we are making it impossible for them to become homeowners.

The Welsh Liberal Democrats believe that money should be invested in financial planning education, to prevent another generation being crippled by ever-increasing sums of debt. The most worrying thing is that if you are an average man or woman in Wales today and you become unemployed through ill-health, redundancy, or a change in circumstances, only three in 10 people would have enough savings to make it through the

**Bethan Jenkins:** Dim ond eisiau gofyn yr oeddwn beth oedd eich barn am eich cyfeillion yn yr Alban a gyflwynodd waddol graddedigion yn yr Alban, ac a fydddech yn cytuno â'ch cyd-Aelod yno, Nicol Stephen, am wneud hynny ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl?

**Jenny Randerson:** Fel y gwyddoch yn iawn-neu o leiaf, gobeithio eich bod yn gwybod-pan wnaethant hynny yn yr Alban, gwneud hynny er mwyn osgoi cyflwyno ffioedd atodol yn llawn a wnaethant, ac o fewn y cyllid a oedd ganddynt ar y pryd, dyna'r gorau y gallent ei wneud. Mae'n welliant aruthrol ar y llanast sydd gennym ni yma yng Nghymru, er i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol lwyddo i atal siop siafins llwyr gyda ffioedd atodol yma.

Af yn fy mlaen yn awr—yn amlwg, yr oedd bwriad i ymyrryd cyn i mi hyd yn oed ddechrau. Pan edrychwch ar y lefel bresennol o ddyled myfyrwyr, mae'n rhoi dyledion myfyrwyr y genhedlaeth flaenorol yn y cysgod yn llwyr. Mae graddedigion newydd yn ei chael yn fwyfwy anodd prynu tŷ a hwythau'n wynebu cyfartaledd dyled o £11,000, cyfartaledd sy'n codi'n gyflym. Os ystyriwch feddygon, er enghraifft, ar ôl iddynt ennill cymhwyster llawn mae ganddynt ddyled o fwy nag £11,000, ac mae'r dystiolaeth yn gryf fod pobl ifanc o gartrefi llai cefnog, o ganlyniad, yn methu cofrestru ar gyrсияu meddygol i fod yn feddygon, nac ar y gyrсияu hir eraill. Testun pryder yw ein bod yn creu ethos dyled ymysg pobl ifanc, a phan ystyriwch fod cartref cyntaf yn costio chwech neu saith gwaith y cyflog a enilliant wedi graddio, yr ydym yn ei gwneud yn amhosibl iddynt fod yn berchen ar dŷ.

Cred Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru y dylid buddsoddi arian mewn addysg cynllunio ariannol, i arbed cenedlaeth arall rhag cael ei chloffi gan ddyledion sy'n cynyddu'n ddi-baid. Yr hyn sy'n peri'r pryder mwyaf yw os ydych yn ddyn neu'n ddynes gyffredin yng Nghymru heddiw, ac yn ddi-waith oherwydd salwch, colli swydd neu newid mewn amgylchiadau, dim ond tri pherson o bob 10 sydd â digon o gynilion i



first six months. This is a serious situation that must be addressed. Both nationally and here in Wales, the Liberal Democrats have been calling for a long time on the Government to take action in relation to the commercial pressure that stems from an endless stream of cheap credit being offered to young people. I note that young students in my family have received offers of credit that are totally inappropriate for young people with no income beyond the limited amount that they are able to earn on a part-time basis as they follow their course. We are endangering family stability for the future, as well as all the other issues that the Labour Government at Westminster says that it is so committed to. Life will be virtually impossible for young people if they have followed an extended course of higher or further education.

We recognise that the Assembly has limited powers in this field, and, as such, there is a limit on what we can ask the Assembly to do. However, we believe that much more can be done to educate people about money and the risk of debt. We believe that the Assembly should be looking at funding independent advice centres. I have one in my constituency—the Speakeasy advice centre—that is funded by a Christian charity. There should be much more funding to assist such centres in dealing with people in crisis, as I find in my constituency surgeries on a regular basis.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I want to focus on the areas of financial literacy and credit unions. Financial literacy is an interest of mine, and I feel that it needs more attention. The one method of addressing over-indebtedness in the long term in Wales is to equip today's children and young people with the skills that they need to manage their finances after they leave compulsory education; whether they are heading into the world of work, taking a gap year, or going to university, good financial management is key. Simple things like how to budget and how to understand payslips and payment options for utility bills can really make a difference to levels of debt and financial exclusion.

fyw drwy'r chwe mis cyntaf. Mae hon yn sefyllfa ddifrifol y mae'n rhaid rhoi sylw iddi. Drwy Brydain ac yma yng Nghymru mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wedi bod yn galw ers amser maith ar y Llywodraeth i wneud rhywbeth am y pwysau masnachol sy'n deillio o'r llif di-baid o gredyd rhad a gynigir i bobl ifanc. Sylwaf fod myfyrwyr ifanc yn fy nheulu i wedi cael cynigion credyd sy'n gwbl amhriodol i bobl ifanc heb ddim incwm heblaw'r swm bach y gallant ei ennill yn rhan-amser wrth iddynt gwblhau eu cwrs. Yr ydym yn peryglu sefydlogrwydd teuluol yn y dyfodol, yn ogystal â'r holl faterion eraill y mae'r Llywodraeth Lafur yn San Steffan yn honni bod mor ymroddedig iddynt. Bydd bywyd fwy neu lai'n amhosibl i bobl ifanc os byddant wedi cymryd cwrs estynedig o addysg uwch neu bellach.

Sylweddolwn mai pwerau cyfyngedig sydd gan y Cynulliad yn y maes hwn, ac yn hynny o beth mae terfyn ar yr hyn y gallwn ofyn i'r Cynulliad ei wneud. Fodd bynnag, credwn y gellir gwneud llawer mwy i addysgu pobl am arian a pheryglon dyled. Credwn y dylai'r Cynulliad fod yn ystyried ariannu canolfannau cyngor annibynnol. Mae yna un yn fy etholaeth i—canolfan cynghori Speakeasy—a ariennir gan elusen Gristnogol. Dylai fod llawer mwy o arian i gynorthwyo canolfannau o'r fath i ddelio â phobl mewn argyfwng y byddaf yn dod ar eu traws yn rheolaidd yn fy nghymorthfeydd yn fy etholaeth.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Mae arnaf eisiau canolbwyntio ar feysydd llythrennedd ariannol ac undebau credyd. Mae llythrennedd ariannol o ddiddordeb imi, a theimlaf fod angen rhoi mwy o sylw i'r pwnc. Yr unig ffordd i ddelio â gorddyled yn y tymor hir yng Nghymru yw sicrhau y caiff plant a phobl ifanc heddiw y sgiliau y mae arnynt eu hangen i reoli eu materion ariannol wedi iddynt adael addysg orfodol; p'un a fyddant yn mynd i fyd gwaith, yn cymryd blwyddyn o hoe, ynteu'n mynd i brifysgol, mae rheolaeth ariannol dda yn allweddol. Gall pethau syml fel sut i drefnu cyllideb, sut i ddeall slipiau cyflog a dewisiadau i dalu biliau cyfleustodau wneud gwahaniaeth go iawn i lefelau dyled ac allgau ariannol.

I was pleased to see the focus on financial capability training in the recently published draft framework for a financial inclusion strategy, and I welcome the Welsh Assembly Government's proposals on financial literacy education in schools. I want to see the subject of financial literacy put at the heart of education in our secondary schools, further education colleges and maybe beyond. It should perhaps be a stand-alone and compulsory, but not accredited, module, rather than part of mathematics courses or personal and social education.

On credit unions, I think that the collapse of the Farepak company taught us a harsh and unfortunate lesson. I was concerned to see on television the other night an advertisement for Farepak 2, which said that it had been going for about 50 or 60 years, trying to give people some assurance that it was safe. People were invited to 'save money with us, and we will give you the vouchers at the end of the day for you to go shopping for Christmas'. It is much better to put your money in a credit union, where you know that it is safe and you know that you are going to get that money, rather than vouchers, and be able to shop in the places where you can afford to shop.

Credit unions provide a safer way to save money and also low-interest loans. I would like to see children and young people being encouraged to take up the option of credit unions. I was pleased that the Deputy Minister for Regeneration was able to attend the launch of a savings club for parents and pupils that has been established in Meadowlane Primary School in my constituency. Every Friday morning during the school term, as well as offering financial advice, volunteer parents, working alongside the Cardiff Credit Union, run a savings collection point at the school. It is a fantastic scheme and I am grateful for the commitment in the 'One Wales' document to providing access to a credit union for every secondary pupil in Wales by 2011. That is the way to do it: get children at a young age, and their parents, used to saving a bit of money, no matter how small that amount, so that they are thinking about saving and looking towards the future.

Yr oeddwn yn falch gweld y pwyslais ar hyfforddiant mewn gallu ariannol yn y fframwaith drafft a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar ar gyfer strategaeth ar gynhwysiant ariannol, a chroesawaf gynigion Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar addysg llythrennedd ariannol mewn ysgolion. Mae arnaf eisiau gweld gosod llythrennedd ariannol fel pwnc wrth galon addysg yn ein hysgolion uwchradd, ein colegau addysg bellach, ac efallai tu hwnt. Hwyrach y dylai fod yn fodiwl annibynnol a gorfodol, ond heb ei achredu, yn hytrach na rhan o fathemateg neu ddatblygiad personol a chymdeithasol.

Ynglŷn ag undebau credyd, credaf fod methiant cwmni Farepak wedi dysgu gwers galed ac anffodus inni. Testun pryder i mi oedd gweld hysbyseb am Farepak 2 ar y teledu y noson o'r blaen yn dweud bod y cwmni'n gweithio ers tua 50 i 60 mlynedd, gan geisio rhoi sicrwydd i bobl ei fod yn ddiogel. Ond yr oedd yn dal i sôn am 'cynilwch gyda ni a chewch y tocynnau gwario yn y pen draw i fynd i siopa ar gyfer y Nadolig'. Mae'n well o lawer rhoi eich arian mewn undeb credyd, lle gwyddoch ei fod yn ddiogel a lle gwyddoch y cewch yr arian hwnnw, yn hytrach na thocynnau gwario, i allu gwario yn y llefydd lle gallwch fforddio gwario.

Mae undebau credyd yn darparu ffordd fwy diogel i gynilo arian, a benthyciadau llog isel hefyd. Hoffwn weld annog plant a phobl ifanc i ddewis defnyddio undebau credyd. Yr oeddwn yn falch fod y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Adfywio wedi gallu bod yn lansiad clwb cynilo i rieni a disgyblion sydd wedi'i sefydlu yn Ysgol Gynradd Meadowlane yn fy etholaeth i. Bob bore Gwener yn ystod y tymor ysgol, yn ogystal â chynnig cyngor ariannol, bydd gwirfoddolwyr o blith y rhieni, ochr yn ochr â gweithwyr Undeb Credyd Caerdydd, yn rhedeg man casglu cynilion yn yr ysgol. Mae'n gynllun ffantastig ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am yr ymrwymiad yn y ddogfen 'Cymru'n Un' i sicrhau y gall pob disgybl uwchradd yng Nghymru fanteisio ar undeb credyd erbyn 2011. Dyna'r ffordd i wneud hyn: annog plant yn ifanc, a'u rhieni, i ddod i arfer cynilo ychydig arian, ni waeth pa mor fach yw'r swm hwnnw, er mwyn iddynt feddwl am gynilo ac edrych tua'r dyfodol.

**Darren Millar:** I am grateful to the Liberal Democrats for bringing forward this debate on what is a worrying subject, of which I think we are yet to see the full implications. I agree with a lot of what has been said by many of the previous speakers, including Mark Isherwood, who made reference to all sorts of statistics.

It goes without saying that debt in the UK is at an all-time high and, apparently, as UK citizens, our debt increases by around £1 million every five minutes. The average household debt, including mortgages, is in excess of £55,000, and we pay an estimated £95 billion in interest each year. Average consumer borrowing on credit cards, motor and retail finance deals, overdrafts and unsecured personal loans rose to an average of over £4,500 per UK adult as recently as November last year. The statistics go on. What we must not forget, as with many numbers and statistics, is that each new figure represents a person struggling to make ends meet.

The Labour-Plaid Government has the cheek to propose an amendment to the very sensible motion put forward by the Liberal Democrats, saying that we should commend its work. While we support schemes that seek to address debt problems in the face of spiralling debt, I am not so sure that a commendation is due—not yet anyway—but rather a recommendation that Labour and Plaid start to take this matter much more seriously.

As noted, one issue connected with debt is, of course, home ownership. In the last week alone in my constituency, I have had four separate housing issues to deal with, ranging from homelessness to absolutely unsuitable accommodation. I am sure that the same applies to many other constituencies. Some of the situations are starting to remind me of the stories that my grandparents used to tell me about their living conditions: growing families sharing bedrooms in two-up, two-down terraced-type accommodation, with

**Darren Millar:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol am ddod â'r ddadl hon gerbron heddiw ar bwnc sy'n destun cryn bryder ac nad ydym eto wedi gweld ei oblygiadau llawn yn fy nhyb i. Cytunaf â llawer o'r hyn sydd wedi'i ddweud gan nifer o'r siaradwyr blaenorol, gan gynnwys Mark Isherwood, a gyfeiriodd at bob math o ystadegau.

Afraid dweud fod dyled yn y Deyrnas Unedig yn uwch nag erioed o'r blaen ac mae'n debyg, fel dinasyddion, fod ein dyled yn cynyddu ryw £1 filiwn bob pum munud. Mae dyled y cartref cyffredin, gan gynnwys morgeisi, yn fwy na £55,000 a thalwn oddeutu £95 biliwn mewn llog bob blwyddyn. Cynyddodd cyfartaledd benthycia cwsmeriaid ar gardiau credyd, bargeinion ceir a siopa, gorddrafft a benthyciadau personol heb eu sicrhau, i gyfartaledd o fwy na £4,500 am bob oedolyn yn y Deyrnas Unedig mor ddiweddar â mis Tachwedd y llynedd. Mae'r ystadegau'n parhau. Yr hyn y mae'n rhaid inni beidio â'i anghofio, fel gyda llawer o rifau ac ystadegau, yw bod pob ffigur newydd yn cynrychioli person sy'n cael trafferth i gael dau ben llinyn ynghyd.

Mae gan Lywodraeth Llafur-Plaid yr wyneb i gynnig gwelliant i'r cynnig call iawn sydd wedi'i gyflwyno gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, gan ddweud y dylem gymeradwyo ei gwaith. Er ein bod yn cefnogi cynlluniau sy'n ceisio mynd i'r afael â phroblemau dyled yn wyneb dyledion sy'n cynyddu'n gyson, nid wyf mor siŵr fod cymeradwyaeth yn ddyledus—ddim eto, beth bynnag—ond yn hytrach, argymhelliaid y dylai Llafur a Phlaid ddechrau cymryd y mater hwn lawer mwy o ddifrif.

Fel y nodwyd, mae perchentyaeth, wrth gwrs, yn un mater sy'n gysylltiedig â dyled, ac yn yr wythnos diwethaf yn unig yn fy etholaeth i yr wyf wedi gorfod delio â phedwar mater gwahanol yn ymwneud â thai, yn amrywio o ddigartrefedd i lety cwbl anaddas. Mae'n siŵr gennyf fod y sefyllfa honno'n berthnasol mewn nifer o etholaethau eraill. Mae rhai o'r sefyllfaoedd yn dechrau f'atgoffa o'r straeon yr arferai fy nain a'm taid eu hadrodd wrthyf am eu hamodau byw: teuluoedd ar eu prifant yn rhannu ystafelloedd gwely mewn tai teras

four people living in a single room. What is Labour-Plaid doing to solve this situation? Whatever they are doing with regard to financial literacy, they are failing. Each month, 64 per cent of people run out of cash five days before their next pay cheque, and 75 per cent of people do not understand the monetary value of the difference that a change of 1 per cent in mortgage rates makes to their pockets.

5.00 p.m.

Some 27 million people in England and Wales do not even have a will. One in three adults do not plan their finances at all, and those who do spend fewer than five minutes a week on average doing so. One interesting statistic shows that 15 per cent of 18 to 24-year-olds thinks that an ISA is an iPod accessory. [*Laughter.*] We may laugh, but this is of serious concern. Perhaps it is time to start engaging much more with other groups in society that can help to solve this problem. Charities and credit unions have already been mentioned, and there are other voluntary groups or faith groups, for example, who have a proven track record and are passionate about helping people in need.

In my constituency, I am familiar with a charity called Christians Against Poverty. To date, that charity has helped more than 19,000 individuals around the United Kingdom, and has handled more than £31 million-worth of clients' unsecured debts. It has no funding from any kind of governmental organisation, including the Welsh Assembly Government. It has only three centres in Wales, but 68 around the United Kingdom. Through the use of a free one-to-one support service emphasising budgeting and individual responsibility, CAP helps its clients to pay more than £800,000 towards bill and debt repayments every month. Quite appropriately, yesterday, it launched its CAP money course, a simple money-management course that helps people to get in control and to stay in control of their finances. The charity has national recognition. For the past two years, it has won the UK *Charity Times* award for being

dwyllofft, a phedwar o bobl yn byw mewn un ystafell. Beth mae Llafur-Plaid yn ei wneud i ddatrys y sefyllfa hon? Beth bynnag y maent yn ei wneud ynglŷn â llythrennedd ariannol, maent yn methu. Bob mis, bydd 64 y cant o bobl yn gweld eu harian yn dod i ben bum diwrnod cyn eu siec gyflog nesaf, ac nid yw 75 y cant o bobl yn deall gwerth ariannol y mae gwahaniaeth o 1 y cant yn ei wneud i gyfraddau morgais yn eu pocedi.

Mae tua 27 miliwn o bobl yng Nghymru a Lloegr nad oes ganddynt ewyllys hyd yn oed. Nid yw un oedolyn o bob tri yn trefnu eu materion ariannol o gwbl, ac mae'r rheini sy'n gwneud hynny'n treulio llai na phum munud yr wythnos ar hynny ar gyfartaledd. Mae un ystadegyn diddorol yn dangos bod 15 y cant o bobl rhwng 18 a 24 oed yn credu mai ategolyn ar gyfer iPod yw ISA. [*Chwerthin.*] Hawdd i ni chwerthin, ond mae hyn yn destun pryder mawr. Efallai ei bod yn bryd dechrau ymgysylltu i raddau mwy o lawer â grwpiau eraill mewn cymdeithas a all helpu datrys y broblem hon. Mae elusennau ac undebau credyd wedi'u crybwyll eisoes, ac mae grwpiau gwirfoddol eraill neu grwpiau crefyddol, er enghraifft, sydd â hanes o lwyddiant ac sy'n frwdfrydig i helpu pobl mewn angen.

Yn fy etholaeth i, yr wyf yn gyfarwydd ag elusen o'r enw Christians Against Poverty. Hyd yma, mae'r elusen honno wedi helpu dros 19,000 o unigolion o gwmpas y Deyrnas Unedig, ac wedi trafod gwerth dros £31 filiwn o ddyledion anwarantedig gan ei chleientiaid. Nid yw'n cael cyllid gan unrhyw fath o gorff llywodraeth, gan gynnwys Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Nid oes ganddi ond tair canolfan yng Nghymru, ond mae 68 o gwmpas y Deyrnas Unedig. Drwy ddefnyddio gwasanaeth cymorth un-i-un am ddim sy'n pwysleisio trefnu cyllideb a chyfrifoldeb yr unigolyn, mae CAP yn helpu ei chleientiaid i dalu dros £800,000 tuag at filiau a dyledion bob mis. Yn gwbl briodol, ddoe lansiodd gwrs arian CAP, cwrs syml ar drin arian sy'n helpu pobl i gael rheolaeth ar eu materion ariannol a'i chadw. Mae'r elusen yn cael ei chydabod ar lefel genedlaethol. Yn y ddwy flynedd diwethaf, mae wedi ennill gwobr *Charity Times* y DU fel yr elusen orau

the best charity to work for. In 2006, it won the Centre for Social Justice award. It is important to note that CAP's clients also rate it: 90 per cent of them said that it was life-transforming and a great help to them in their situation.

These are the kind of groups that we should pay a lot more attention to and which we ought to support a lot more. In the Minister's response, I want to hear exactly what the Government is doing to help to promote such organisations so that they can continue to have a positive impact in places such as my constituency.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Developments in the world markets, particularly during the last 24 hours, have been well documented. It is interesting to note that commentators and economists appear quite reserved on the extent of governmental control over an economic downturn. It is quite possible that the problems in the American sub-prime markets, as well as a slow-down in spending over the festive season, may be the thin edge of a very thick wedge.

As the national legislature of our country, with limited powers, we must be honest and ask ourselves the extent to which we can alleviate or even minimise the pain that will be felt by Welsh citizens who find themselves with high levels of personal debt. As a party, our team at Westminster consistently contributed to the debate on the Consumer Credit Bill in 2005. We have raised concerns over door-to-door lending by irresponsible companies, as research shows that the average interest rate charged is 177 per cent, and some even charge up to 900 per cent interest. We have called for legislation that will cap interest rates and make extortionate interest charges illegal. Statutory caps exist in other countries. Austria, for example, has capped interest charges at 20 per cent; Belgium and Finland have set theirs at 7 per cent. However, the National Assembly for Wales does not have such powers, unless we rely on a Damascene-style conversion at Whitehall for our hopes to be realised. There are steps that we could take, however, which could alleviate hardship for people as they begin their working lives

i weithio iddi. Yn 2006, enillodd wobwr Centre for Social Justice. Mae'n bwysig cofio bod gan gleientiaid CAP hefyd feddwl mawr ohoni: dywedodd 90 y cant ohonynt ei bod yn trawsnewid bywydau ac iddi fod o gymorth mawr iddynt yn eu sefyllfa.

Dyma'r math o grwpiau y dylem roi llawer mwy o sylw a chefnogaeth iddynt. Yn ymateb y Gweinidog, yr wyf am glywed beth yn union y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i helpu hyrwyddo cyrff o'r fath fel y gallant barhau i gael effaith gadarnhaol mewn lleoedd fel fy etholaeth i.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Mae datblygiadau ym marchnadoedd y byd, yn enwedig yn ystod y 24 awr ddiwethaf, wedi'u cofnodi'n helaeth. Mae'n ddiddorol sylwi bod sylwebyddion ac economegwyr yn ymddangos yn ddigon tawedog ynghylch graddau rheolaeth gan lywodraeth ar ddirywiad economaidd. Mae'n eithaf posibl fod y problemau yn y marchnadoedd benthyciadau llai sicr yn America, yn ogystal â'r gwariant arafach dros gyfnod y Nadolig, yn arwydd bach o newid mawr iawn.

Fel deddfwrfa genedlaethol ein gwlad, gyda phwerau cyfyngedig, rhaid inni fod yn onest a gofyn i ni'n hunain i ba raddau y gallwn liniaru neu hyd yn oed leihau'r boen y bydd dinasyddion yng Nghymru yn ei theimlo pan welant fod ganddynt lawer iawn o ddyled bersonol. Fel plaid, cyfrannodd ein tîm yn San Steffan yn gyson at y ddadl ar y Mesur Credyd Defnyddwyr yn 2005. Yr ydym wedi mynegi pryderon ynghylch benthycia o ddrws i ddrws gan gwmnïau anghyfrifol, gan fod ymchwil yn dangos mai'r gyfradd llog a godir ar gyfartaledd yw 177 y cant, ac mae rhai'n codi cymaint â 900 y cant o log. Yr ydym wedi galw am ddeddfwriaeth a fydd yn capio cyfraddau llog ac yn gwneud taliadau llog gormodol yn anghyfreithlon. Mae capiau statudol mewn gwledydd eraill. Mae Awstria, er enghraifft, wedi capio taliadau llog ar 20 y cant; mae Gwlad Belg a'r Ffindir wedi gosod eu rhai hwy ar 7 y cant. Fodd bynnag, nid oes gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru bwerau felly, oni ddibynnwn ar gael trôedigaeth annisgwyl yn Whitehall i wireddu ein gobeithion. Mae yna gamau y gallem eu cymryd, er hynny, ac a allai leihau caledi

following graduation. I could use myself as an example, as I have a significant amount of student debt, which will probably be with me for the next 10 years.

The irony of the situation today is that it is the Liberal Democrats who have introduced this particular debate, which also touches upon the student loan and student fees argument. In Scotland, the Liberal Democrats were instrumental in introducing student fees, which have now been abolished by the SNP-led Government, under Alex Salmond. Last year, Rob Humphreys, the then president of the Liberal Democrats, said that they were preparing to soften up the public before abandoning their policy on top-up fees, because it was not financially viable for them to continue to do so.

I have been interested to read press reports today of the Sale of Student Loans Bill, which the Liberal Democrats, Labour, and the Tories are supporting. This will allow student loans to be transferred to private banks, which will ultimately cost the public purse far more than would have been the case had the Government been in a position to keep hold of them. It is a tad hypocritical for the debate to be referred to in that context.

Before Peter Black starts blogging about Plaid's perceived u-turn on this issue, I wish to state that Plaid Cymru has always supported measures to address debt, especially student debt, and we will remain committed to our opposition to top-up fees in Wales for the foreseeable future.

We must address many measures in Wales to tackle personal debt. I commend the work of Citizens Advice in Wales, which is doing a lot of work on championing this issue. As Plaid Cymru's spokesperson on child poverty, I think that Citizens Advice has a significant role to play in these issues.

**Eleanor Burnham:** According to *The Independent*, dated 17 January 2008, Britons have racked up so much debt on loans and credit cards that the total borrowed now

pobl wrth iddynt ddechrau gweithio ar ôl graddio. Gallwn gyfeirio ataf fi fy hun fel enghraifft, gan fod gennyf ddyled sylwedol fel myfyriwr, a bydd honno'n para am y 10 mlynedd nesaf, yn ôl pob tebyg.

Eironi'r sefyllfa heddiw yw mai'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a gyflwynodd y ddadl neilltuol hon, sydd hefyd yn cyffwrdd â'r ddadl ynghylch benthyciadau myfyrrwyr a ffioedd myfyrrwyr. Yn yr Alban, yr oedd gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ran wrth gyflwyno ffioedd myfyrrwyr, sydd bellach wedi'u dileu gan y Llywodraeth dan arweiniad yr SNP, dan Alex Salmond. Y llynedd dywedodd Rob Humphreys, a oedd yn llywydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ar y pryd, eu bod yn paratoi i feddalu'r cyhoedd cyn rhoi'r gorau i'w polisi ar ffioedd ychwanegol, am nad oedd yn ariannol ymarferol iddynt barhau i wneud hynny.

Yr oedd o ddi-ddordeb imi ddarllen adroddiadau yn y wasg heddiw am y Mesur Gwerthu Benthyciadau Myfyrrwyr, sy'n cael ei gefnogi gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, Llafur, a'r Torïaid. Bydd hwn yn caniatáu trosglwyddo benthyciadau myfyrrwyr i fanciau preifat, a fydd yn costio llawer mwy i'r pwrs cyhoeddus yn y pen draw na phe byddai'r Llywodraeth wedi gallu dal ei gafael arnynt. Mae braidd yn rhagrithiol cyfeirio at y ddadl yn y cyd-destun hwnnw.

Cyn i Peter Black ddechrau blogio am yr hyn a ystyria'n dro pedol gan Plaid ar y mater hwn, dymunaf ddweud bod Plaid Cymru wedi bod yn gefnogol erioed i fesurau i ddelio â dyled, yn enwedig dyled myfyrrwyr, a byddwn yn parhau i ymrwymo i wrthwynebu ffioedd ychwanegol yng Nghymru hyd y gellir rhagweld.

Rhaid inni ddelio â nifer mawr o fesurau yng Nghymru i fynd i'r afael â dyled bersonol. Cymeradwyaf waith Cyngor ar Bopeth yng Nghymru, sy'n gwneud llawer o waith eirioli ar y mater hwn. Fel llefarydd Plaid Cymru ar dlodi plant, credaf fod gan Cyngor ar Bopeth ran bwysig i'w chwarae yn y materion hyn.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yn ôl *The Independent*, dyddiedig 17 Ionawr 2008, mae gan bobl Prydain gymaint o ddyled ar ffurf benthyciadau ac ar gardiau credyd fel bod y

exceeds the entire value of the economy, as Peter Black said earlier. Britons' personal debt is increasing by more than £1 million every five minutes, and families have an average debt of £47,000, which is double the level in 1997. Most of the debt is unsecured credit card debt, which is quite horrifying. Only 30 per cent of borrowers have enough savings behind them to resource six months of unemployment.

The Liberal Democrats have some credibility and quite a solid reputation on financial matters—and I have only to refer to Vince Cable and to how well he has performed in the bear pit in Westminster over the past few months to prove that. Let us be honest. On Gordon Brown's watch over the past 10 years, it seems that that the UK economy has been based totally on ever-increasing personal debt and house prices, but now we see the economic chickens come home to roost.

I have often accused the Labour Government—and I think that I directed the accusation last at Jane Davidson, when she was the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills—of embroiling our youth in another form of substance misuse, namely the misuse of money through credit debt. I have never understood the peculiar rationale behind the perverse and far-reaching debt that students were subjected to by Labour. I am a mother of two graduates. My eldest child will be 30 years old quite soon, and she is still paying off her debts, which is quite frightening.

On average, graduates have a debt of £11,000 on leaving university, which is forced upon them because of tuition fees or student loans, or whatever. It is perverse. A total of 3 million graduates since 1997 have delayed having a family, buying a house or getting married because of the crippling levels of debt foisted upon them by Labour, which is now in league with Plaid. In 2007, UK graduates faced a total debt of £3.2 billion, which is the result of an increase of 167 per cent since 1997. I will not bore you with any more facts, or some of you will be asleep

cyfanswm sydd wedi'i fenthycu bellach yn fwy na gwerth yr economi gyfan, fel y dywedodd Peter Black yn gynharach. Mae dyled bersonol pobl Prydain yn cynyddu dros £1 filiwn bob pum munud, ac mae gan deuluoedd ddyled o £47,000 ar gyfartaledd, sy'n ddwywaith y lefel yn 1997. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r ddyled yn ddyled anwarantedig ar gardiau credyd, ac mae hynny'n codi braw ar rywun. Dim ond 30 y cant o'r benthychwyr sydd â digon o gynilion wrth gefn i dalu am chwe mis o ddiweithdra.

Mae gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol rywfaint o hygredd ac enw digon da ar faterion ariannol—ac nid oes ond rhaid imi gyfeirio at Vince Cable a chystal oedd ei berfformiad yng nghanol y stŵr yn San Steffan dros y misoedd diwethaf i ddangos hynny. Gadewch inni fod yn onest. Yn ystod cyfnod Gordon Brown yn ei swydd dros y 10 mlynedd diwethaf, mae'n ymddangos bod economi'r DU wedi'i seilio'n gyfan gwbl ar ddyled bersonol a phrisiau tai sy'n cynyddu'n gyson. Ond yn awr gwelwn y canlyniadau i'r economi.

Yr wyf wedi cyhuddo'r Llywodraeth Lafur yn aml—a chredaf imi anelu'r cyhuddiad diwethaf at Jane Davidson, pan oedd yn Weinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau—o faglu ein hieuenctid mewn math arall o gamddefnyddio sylweddau, sef camddefnyddio arian drwy ddyled credyd. Nid wyf erioed wedi deall y rhesymeg ryfeddol y tu ôl i'r ddyled annymunol a phellgyrhaeddol a orfodwyd ar fyfyrwyr gan Lafur. Yr wyf yn fam i ddau o raddedigion. Bydd fy mhlentyn hynaf yn 30 oed cyn hir, ac mae'n dal i dalu ei dyledion, sy'n eithaf brawychus.

Ar gyfartaledd, mae gan raddedigion ddyled o £11,000 wrth adael y brifysgol, a orfodir arnynt oherwydd ffioedd dysgu neu fenthyciadau myfyrwyr, neu beth bynnag. Mae'n groes i'r graen. Mae cymaint â 3 miliwn o raddedigion er 1997 wedi aros cyn dechrau teulu, prynu tŷ neu briodi oherwydd lefelau andwyol y ddyled a orfodwyd arnynt gan Lafur, sydd bellach yn gweithio law yn llaw â Plaid. Yn 2007, yr oedd graddedigion yn y DU yn wynebu cyfanswm o £3.2 biliwn o ddyled, oherwydd cynnydd o 167 y cant er 1997. Nid wyf am eich diflasu drwy roi mwy

soon. This is the direct result of Labour breaking its own promises not to introduce top-up fees in the UK—and that from the party that made ‘education, education, education’ its mantra in 1997.

As many Members have said, financial services need to be registered. How many people understand what APR stands for? How many people understand that 30 per cent APR is far too much to pay on a debt? Not many, I suspect.

In conclusion, we welcome anything that the Assembly Government or the Westminster Government can do to help with debt education generally, as we know that the provision is inadequate. We must have credit unions, and the regulation of the bizarre banking practices that appear to allow banks to do anything with us, at whim.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** I welcome the Liberal Democrat motion on debt and credit management. Over the past 24 hours, we have been paying close attention to what is going on in the marketplace, and to the fact that credit relates to the economy. I have heard so many statistics being quoted by Members today, and it is easy to become numbed to the whole issue of credit. However, we must be aware of the importance of the availability of credit to the economic prosperity of our country.

5.10 p.m.

If credit is used correctly, it enriches society, because it allows people to have a better quality of life and it gives families access to things that they would not otherwise be able to have. Therefore, although I take on board many of the points made by other Members, we must bear in mind that, for better or worse, in this country and across the world, economies are built on the ability to access credit. Surely we must address the educational aspect, so that people have a cohesive understanding of how to use credit sensibly to better themselves, their families and communities. It falls within the remit of this institution and the UK Government to

o ffeithiau, neu bydd rhai ohonoch wedi mynd i gysgu cyn hir. Mae hyn yn ganlyniad uniongyrchol i'r ffaith fod Llafur wedi torri ei haddewidion ei hun i beidio â chyflwyno ffioedd ychwanegol yn y Dua hynny gan y blaid a fabwysiadodd ‘addysg, addysg, addysg’ yn fantra yn 1997.

Fel y mae nifer o Aelodau wedi ei ddweud, mae angen cofrestru gwasanaethau ariannol. Faint o bobl sy'n deall beth yw ystyr APR? Faint o bobl sy'n sylweddoli bod 30 y cant o APR yn ormod o lawer i'w dalu ar ddyled? Nifer bach, yr wyf yn amau.

I gloi, croesawn unrhyw beth y gall Llywodraeth y Cynulliad neu Lywodraeth San Steffan ei wneud i hyrwyddo addysgu am ddyled yn gyffredinol, oherwydd gwyddom fod y ddarpariaeth yn annigonol. Rhaid inni gael undebau credyd, a rheoleiddio'r arferion bancio rhyfedd sydd i'w gweld yn caniatáu i fanciau wneud fel y mynnant â ni, yn ôl eu mympwy.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Croesawaf gynnig y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ar ddyled a rheoli credyd. Dros y 24 awr ddiwethaf, buom yn cadw golwg manwl ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn y farchnad, ac ar y ffaith fod credyd yn berthynol i'r economi. Clywais ddyfynnu llawer iawn o ystadegau gan Aelodau heddiw, ac mae'n hawdd troi clust fyddar i holl fater credyd. Er hynny, rhaid inni gofio mor bwysig ydyw i gredyd fod ar gael er mwyn ffyniant economaidd ein gwlad.

Mae credyd yn cyfoethogi cymdeithas o'i ddefnyddio'n gywir, am ei fod yn caniatáu i bobl gael gwell ansawdd bywyd a galluogi teuluoedd i gael pethau na allent eu cael fel arall. Felly, er fy mod yn derbyn nifer o'r pwyntiau a wnaeth Aelodau eraill, rhaid inni gofio, er gwell neu er gwaeth, fod economïau, yn y wlad hon ac ar draws y byd, yn seiliedig ar y gallu i gael credyd. Mae'n sicr ei bod yn rhaid inni roi sylw i'r agwedd addysgol, er mwyn i bobl ddeall yn glir sut i ddefnyddio credyd yn synhwyrol i'w gwella eu hunain a'u teuluoedd a'u cymunedau. Rhan o gylch gwaith y sefydliad hwn a Llywodraeth y DU yw cynnwys cynllunio a



incorporate financial planning and management in the education system, so that pupils learn at a young age the value and benefits of money. We live in a society—

**Leanne Wood:** Do you agree with your colleague, Boris Johnson, who has said that it is the financial illiteracy of the poor that is responsible for the high levels of debt in Britain? If so, surely your position must be that if children were taught financial literacy, debt would no longer be a problem.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** I stand on a platform of delivering financial literacy so that people can understand the value of money across all sectors of society. It is the responsibility of people who have money to be responsible with it; it is the responsibility of people at the other end of the spectrum to gain an understanding. We can achieve that through our legislative process, by forcing schools to introduce a financial literacy education programme.

**Leanne Wood** *rose*—

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** I have taken one intervention, Leanne. I would now like to elaborate on my point. I have been fair enough with you. That is an important aspect with which the Government can engage. It would then be up to us, as politicians, to put that programme in place. We must also work with organisations, such as Citizens Advice, that deal with the day-to-day problems of people in debt when their bills have landed on the doormat. Citizens Advice has informed me, as I am sure it has other Members, that it has dealt with 92,000 inquiries about debt issues alone this year. Sadly, it is confident that, next year, debt will be the issue that gives rise to the largest number of queries that it deals with, taking over from benefit problems. It is regrettable that many local authorities do not support citizens' advice bureaux. In my local authority area, the bureau in Cowbridge is under threat because the local authority wishes to sell the premises. It is a shop-front operation, working in the community, on the high street, and many people see it as their first port of call for help in sorting out financial difficulties.

rheoli ariannol yn y system addysg, fel y bydd disgyblion yn dysgu'n ifanc y gwerth a'r buddion o gael arian. Yr ydym yn byw mewn cymdeithas—

**Leanne Wood:** A ydych yn cytuno ag un o'ch cymheiriaid, Boris Johnson, sydd wedi dweud mai anllythrennedd ariannol y tlawd sy'n gyfrifol am lefelau uchel y ddyled ym Mhrydain? Os felly, mae'n rhaid mai eich safbwynt yw na fyddai dyled yn broblem pe bae llythrennedd ariannol yn cael ei ddysgu i blant.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Yr wyf o blaid addysgu llythrennedd ariannol fel y gall pobl ddeall gwerth arian ym mhob rhan o gymdeithas. Cyfrifoldeb pobl sydd ag arian yw ei drin yn gyfrifol; cyfrifoldeb pobl yn y pegwn arall yw dod i'w ddeall. Gallwn gyflawni hynny drwy ein proses ddeddfwriaethol, drwy orfodi ysgolion i gyflwyno rhaglen o addysg llythrennedd ariannol.

**Leanne Wood** *a gododd*—

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Yr wyf wedi derbyn un ymyriad, Leanne. Hoffwn ymhelaethu ar y pwynt a wneuthum yn awr. Bûm yn ddigon teg â chi. Mae honno'n agwedd bwysig y gall y Llywodraeth ymdrin â hi. Mater i ni wedyn, fel gwleidyddion, fyddai rhoi'r rhaglen honno ar waith. Rhaid inni weithio hefyd gyda chyrff, fel Cyngor ar Bopeth, sy'n delio â phroblemau pob dydd pobl sydd mewn dyled pan fydd eu biliau wedi dod drwy'r drws. Mae Cyngor ar Bopeth wedi dweud wrthyf, ac wrth Aelodau eraill, mae'n siŵr, ei fod wedi delio â 92,000 o ymholiadau ynghylch dyled yn unig eleni. Gwaetha'r modd, mae'n sicr mai dyled fydd y mater a fydd yn achosi'r nifer mwyaf o ymholiadau y bydd yn delio â hwy flwyddyn nesaf, yn hytrach na phroblemau budd-daliadau. Mae'n destun gofid bod nifer o awdurdodau lleol nad ydynt yn cefnogi canolfannau Cyngor ar Bopeth. Yn ardal fy awdurdod lleol i, mae'r ganolfan yn y Bont-faen dan fygythiad am fod yr awdurdod lleol yn dymuno gwerthu'r adeilad. Mae'n sefydliad sy'n gweithio yn nhu blaen y siop, yn y gymuned, yn y stryd fawr, ac ato ef y bydd llawer o bobl yn troi yn gyntaf am gymorth i ddatrys anawsterau ariannol.

We must also work on the regulatory aspect. Consider the plethora of issues related to the accessibility of money. Such regulations do not emanate from this institution, but from Westminster. However, that does not prevent us from engaging in the dialogue. Whether someone is buying a settee, a car, a house or any other goods, these days, everything is available on some form of credit. That situation and how it is regulated surely need to be looked at. The legislators have overlooked the way in which society has evolved over the past 10 years to 15 years. Therefore, it is incumbent upon us to get inside those processes, to ensure that people are well served and that communities get the best out of credit. That way, the economy can continue to grow and credit will not be seen as a bad omen. It is not a bad omen when it is used correctly. It enriches people's lives and empowers them, and so it falls to us as legislators to work with organisations such as Citizens Advice to ensure that legislation is in place that safeguards communities from exploitation.

**The Minister for Social Justice and Local Government (Brian Gibbons):** On the face of it, the level of personal borrowing, at £1.3 trillion, is frightening. However, as Andrew has just said so effectively, behind that figure are the mortgages that pay for our houses, the personal loans that pay for our cars, and the credit cards that pay for our groceries. These are all part of modern society—

**Jenny Randerson:** Will you take an intervention?

**Brian Gibbons:** Let me finish this point. I hope that no Member is calling for a total ban on credit, which the first point of the motion seems to indicate.

**Jenny Randerson:** Do you not agree that a key problem is that mortgages have been given far too readily to people who find it impossible to pay them back? That has fuelled the rise in house prices, which has made it impossible for our young people and first-time buyers to get a foot on the housing

Rhaid inni weithio hefyd ar yr agwedd reoleiddio. Ystyriwch y materion dirifedi sy'n ymwneud â gallu cael arian. Nid o'r sefydliad hwn y daw rheoliadau o'r fath, ond o San Steffan. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n ein rhwystro rhag cymryd rhan yn y ddeialog. P'un a fydd rhywun yn prynu sofffa, car, tŷ neu unrhyw nwyddau eraill y dyddiau hyn, mae popeth ar gael ar ryw fath o gredyd. Mae'n sicr fod angen edrych ar y sefyllfa honno a sut y caiff ei rheoleiddio. Mae'r deddfwyr wedi anwybyddu sut y mae cymdeithas wedi datblygu dros y 10 neu'r 15 mlynedd diwethaf. Felly, mae'n ddyletswydd arnom i ymchwilio i'r prosesau hynny, i sicrhau bod pobl yn cael gwasanaeth da a bod cymunedau'n cael y gorau o gredyd. Drwy hynny, gall yr economi ddal i dyfu ac nid ystyrir credyd yn beth drwg. Nid yw'n arwydd drwg pan gaiff ei ddefnyddio'n gywir. Mae'n cyfoethogi bywydau pobl ac yn eu grymuso, ac felly ein lle ni fel deddfwyr yw gweithio gyda chyrff fel Cyngor ar Bopeth i sicrhau bod deddfwriaeth yn bod sy'n diogelu cymunedau rhag ymelwa.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol (Brian Gibbons):** Ar yr olwg gyntaf, mae'r lefel benthycy personol o £1.3 triliwn yn frawychus. Er hynny, fel y mae Andrew newydd ddweud mor effeithiol, y tu ôl i'r ffigur hwnnw mae'r morgeisi sy'n talu am ein tai, y benthyciadau personol sy'n talu am ein ceir, a'r cardiau credyd sy'n talu am ein nwyddau. Mae'r rhain i gyd yn rhan o gymdeithas fodern—

**Jenny Randerson:** A wnewch chi dderbyn ymyriad?

**Brian Gibbons:** Gadewch imi orffen y pwynt hwn. Gobeithio nad oes yr un Aelod yn galw am wahardd credyd yn llwyr, oherwydd mae'n ymddangos bod pwynt gyntaf y cynnig yn awgrymu hynny.

**Jenny Randerson:** Oni chytunwch mai problem allweddol yw bod benthycwyr morgeisi wedi bod yn rhy barod o lawer i roi morgeisi i bobl sy'n ei chael hi'n amhosibl eu talu'n ôl? Hynny sydd wedi sbarduno'r cynnydd ym mhrisiau tai, a hynny wedi'i gwneud yn amhosibl i'n pobl ifanc a

ladder.

**Brian Gibbons:** I will come to that point later.

To the extent that the initial thesis in the initial part of the motion is not sustainable, it has been necessary for us to table our amendment, which aims to bring some balance to the motion, although not to deny the overall concern that has been expressed in this debate. Although many people can manage credit reasonably well, too many suffer from levels of debt that are not sustainable, which is a real, crying social problem.

One of the ironies of the present situation is that those who have the most and who least need credit are those who can easily get it, whereas those who have the least flexibility in their financial situation find it the most difficult to access the flexibility that credit can offer, and end up failing to meet their day-to-day needs or being trapped in extortionate lending schemes.

In line with what Jenny said, this is not just a matter for credit users. There is a real issue of corporate responsibility in this regard. When we look at the importance of corporate responsibility, we see that blind faith in the capacity of a *laissez-faire* market is inadequate.

**Brynle Williams:** Do you not agree that we have a moral obligation here? All too often, you see advertisements on the television saying 'If your credit is bad, if you are this or that, come to us; and we will give you money instantly' in relation to cars and such goods. Those advertisements are aimed at people with bad credit track records, who simply cannot manage their finances, yet they are still being encouraged to take on more debt.

**Brian Gibbons:** To quote a former leader of your party, that is the unacceptable face of capitalism, which is still alive and well today in exactly the practices that you have outlined.

phrynwyr am y tro cyntaf gael eu troed ar yr ysgol dai.

**Brian Gibbons:** Dof at y pwynt hwnnw'n ddiweddarach.

I'r graddau nad yw'r gosodiad cychwynnol yn rhan gychwynnol y cynnig yn gynaliadwy, yr ydym wedi gorfod cyflwyno'n gwelliant, sy'n ceisio dod â rhywfaint o gydbwysedd i'r cynnig, ond heb anwybyddu'r pryder cyffredinol a fynegwyd yn y ddatl hon. Er bod nifer o bobl yn gallu rheoli credyd yn gymharol dda, mae gormod yn dioddef oherwydd lefelau dyled nad ydynt yn gynaliadwy, ac mae hynny'n broblem gymdeithasol wirioneddol ddigalon.

Un eironi yn y sefyllfa bresennol yw mai'r rhai sy'n berchen ar y mwyaf a'r rhai sydd â'r angen lleiaf am greddyd yw'r rheini sy'n gallu ei gael hawsaf, a'r rheini sydd â'r hyblygrwydd lleiaf o ran eu sefyllfa ariannol sy'n ei chael hi fwyaf anodd cael yr hyblygrwydd y gall credyd ei gynnig, gan gyrraedd sefyllfa lle na allant ddiwallu'u hanghenion beunyddiol neu lle cânt eu dal mewn cynlluniau benthyca cwbl afresymol.

Yn unol â'r hyn a ddywedodd Jenny, nid mater i ddefnyddwyr credyd yn unig mo hyn. Mae mater gwirioneddol o gyfrifoldeb corfforaethol yn y cyswllt hwn. Pan edrychwn ar bwysigrwydd cyfrifoldeb corfforaethol, gwelwn fod ffydd digwestiwn yng ngallu marchnad *laissez-faire* yn annigonol.

**Brynle Williams:** Oni chytunwch fod gennym ddyletswydd foesol yn hyn? Yn rhy aml o'r hanner, gwelir hysbysebion ar y teledu yn dweud 'Os yw eich credyd yn wael, os ydych yn hyn neu'r llall, dewch atom ni; ac fe roddwn yr arian ichi'n syth' yng nghyswllt ceir a nwyddau o'r fath. Anelir yr hysbysebion hynny at bobl sydd â record credyd gwael, pobl na allant reoli'u harian, ac eto maent yn dal i gael eu hannog i gymryd rhagor o ddyled.

**Brian Gibbons:** I ddyfynnu un o gyn arweinwyr eich plaid, dyna wyneb annerbyniol cyfalafiaeth, sy'n dal yn fyw ac yn iach heddiw yn yr union arferion yr ydych wedi'u crybwyll.

As the One Wales Government, we are committed to tackling the problems of the poorest families in Wales. We are working to address many of the issues relating to financial inclusion mentioned in this debate. Our strategy is based on the review of over-indebtedness by my colleague, Huw Lewis, which successfully identified the impact of debt and financial exclusion on many individuals, families and communities throughout Wales. We are committed, as that report recommended, to developing a financial inclusion strategy for Wales. That work is ongoing, and will cover five main themes: promoting better access to mainstream financial services, promoting financial capability and literacy, promoting accessible financial debt advice, promoting income maximisation, and allowing affordable credit and loans to be available. We believe that making progress in these key areas will make a real difference to this important issue.

The key to improving access to mainstream financial services lies in working with financial service providers in a responsible way to ensure that vulnerable customers have a range of services commensurate with their needs and relevant to their vulnerability to risk exposure. We welcome the proposals to make access to LINK machines in our most deprived communities part of the move towards improved access to financial services.

We are already in the process of improving our school curriculum, which will provide a programme of financial literacy that will exceed that provided by the UK Government. As Jane Hutt has mentioned, by September, financial literacy will be formally taught to all children in our schools as part of personal and social education modules and the mathematics framework.

Building on the success of the child trust fund reimbursement scheme for looked-after children, we are developing a further child trust fund initiative. A premium will be made available to every child entering compulsory

Fel Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un, yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i fynd i'r afael â phroblemau teuluoedd tlotaf Cymru. Yr ydym yn gweithio i fynd i'r afael â nifer o'r materion sy'n ymwneud â chynhwysiant ariannol a grybwyllwyd yn y ddatl hon. Mae ein strategaeth yn seiliedig ar yr adolygiad o orddyledusrwydd gan fy nghyd-Aelod, Huw Lewis, a nododd yn llwyddiannus effaith dyled ac allgau ariannol ar nifer o unigolion, teuluoedd a chymunedau ledled Cymru. Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo, fel yr argymhellai'r adroddiad hwnnw, i ddatblygu strategaeth cynhwysiant ariannol i Gymru. Mae'r gwaith hwnnw'n parhau, a bydd yn cynnwys pum prif thema: hyrwyddo gwell mynediad i wasanaethau ariannol prif-ffrwd, hyrwyddo gallu a llythrennedd ariannol, hyrwyddo cyngor ar ddyled ariannol sydd ar gael yn hwylus, hyrwyddo defnyddio incwm i'r eithaf, a chaniatáu i fenthyciadau a chredyd fforddiadwy fod ar gael. Credwn y bydd cynnydd yn y meysydd allweddol hyn yn gwneud gwahaniaeth go iawn i'r mater pwysig hwn.

Yr allwedd i wella gallu pobl i gael gwasanaethau ariannol prif-ffrwd yw gweithio gyda darparwyr gwasanaethau ariannol mewn ffordd gyfrifol i sicrhau bod cwsmeriaid bregus yn cael amrywiaeth o wasanaethau sy'n gymesur â'u hanghenion ac sy'n berthnasol i'w bregusrwydd o ran bod yn agored i risgiau. Yr ydym yn croesawu'r cynigion i wneud darparu peiriannau LINK yn ein cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig yn rhan o'r ymgyrch i wella mynediad i wasanaethau ariannol.

Yr ydym eisoes wrthi'n gwella ein cwricwlwm ysgol, a fydd yn darparu rhaglen llythrennedd ariannol well nag a ddarperir gan Lywodraeth y DU. Fel y soniodd Jane Hutt, erbyn mis Medi bydd llythrennedd ariannol yn cael ei addysgu'n ffurfiol i bob plentyn yn ein hysgolion, fel rhan o fodiwlau addysg bersonol a chymdeithasol a'r fframwaith mathemateg.

Gan adeiladu ar lwyddiant y cynllun ad-dalu gan y gronfa ymddiriedolaeth plant ar gyfer plant sy'n cael gofal, yr ydym yn datblygu cynllun cronfa ymddiriedolaeth plant arall. Darperir premiwm ar gyfer pob plentyn a

education, with a further premium of up to £100 available to the most deprived and disadvantaged children. Those are important steps to allow our children to begin their independent life with some form of financial stability.

5.20 p.m.

For adults, we recognise that it is important to improve basic financial literacy through our basic skills framework, for the reasons that many people have outlined.

There has been an increase in the level of debt, and we are working with the various agencies to promote the debt advice that is available. Debt and money issues are among the most common problems dealt with by citizens advice bureaux, and many Members have already given examples of that.

'One Wales' also commits us to ensuring that a comprehensive benefit advice system is available across local authorities. We are involved with the Legal Services Commission in mapping the level of advice available across Wales, so that we can ensure that a comprehensive advice service is available to all of our citizens.

We have announced a further £1 million in the budget to improve the uptake of council tax benefit, extending the focus to include families with children and pensioners. We also wish to maximise impact by extending the scheme to cover matters such as housing benefit, and by encouraging a more integrated approach to identifying and advising those who are eligible to claim.

**Mark Isherwood:** Will you give way?

**Brian Gibbons:** I do not have time, Mark. In that context, I draw your attention to our ongoing support to the 'Better advice: Better health' scheme, which is run in conjunction with the national health service.

We are also investing £1.5 million in the

fydd yn dechrau mewn addysg orfodol, gyda phremiwm arall o hyd at £100 ar gael ar gyfer y plant mwyaf difreintiedig ac anghenus. Mae'r rheini'n gamau pwysig i alluogi ein plant i ddechrau ar eu bywyd annibynnol gyda rhyw fath o sefydlogrwydd ariannol.

Ar gyfer oedolion, yr ydym yn cydnabod ei bod yn bwysig gwella llythrennedd ariannol sylfaenol drwy ein fframwaith sgiliau sylfaenol, am y rhesymau y mae llawer un wedi'u nodi.

Mae lefel dyled wedi codi, ac yr ydym yn gweithio gyda'r gwahanol asiantaethau i hyrwyddo'r cyngor sydd ar gael ar ddyled. Mae dyled a phroblemau ariannol ymysg y problemau mwyaf cyffredin y bydd canolfannau cyngor ar bopeth yn delio â hwy, ac mae nifer o Aelodau eisoes wedi rhoi enghreifftiau o hynny.

Mae 'Cymru'n Un' hefyd yn ein hymrwymo i sicrhau y bydd system gynhwysfawr i roi cyngor ar fudd-daliadau ar gael ar draws yr awdurdodau lleol. Yr ydym yn gweithio gyda'r Comisiwn Gwasanaethau Cyfreithiol i fapio lefel y cyngor sydd ar gael yng Nghymru, er mwyn inni allu sicrhau bod gwasanaeth cynghori cynhwysfawr ar gael i'n holl ddinasyddion.

Yr ydym wedi cyhoeddi £1 filiwn yn rhagor yn ein cyllideb i gynyddu'r nifer sy'n cael budd-dal y dreth gyngor, gan ymestyn y ffocws i gynnwys teuluoedd lle mae plant a phensiynwyr. Dymunwn hefyd gael yr effaith fwyaf posibl drwy ymestyn y cynllun i faterion megis budd-dal tai, a thrwy annog dull gweithredu mwy integredig ar gyfer nodi a chyngori'r rheini sy'n gymwys i hawlio.

**Mark Isherwood:** A wnewch chi ildio?

**Brian Gibbons:** Nid oes gennyf amser, Mark. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, hoffwn dynnu eich sylw at ein cefnogaeth barhaus i'r cynllun 'Cyngor da: Iechyd da', sy'n cael ei redeg ar y cyd â'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol.

Yr ydym hefyd yn buddsoddi £1.5 miliwn i

development of credit unions, on top of the money that has already been committed. We have 33 active credit unions covering virtually all of Wales, and I believe that we need to work more vigorously to extend the role of credit unions. I am pleased that credit unions are extending the Christmas savings club, in the light of the contributions that Lorraine Barrett made in her speech. We will be promoting those clubs in the next few months and later in the year as people prepare for Christmas.

I urge Members to reject the Conservative's amendment, because it fails to recognise the work in which the Assembly Government is engaged with the UK Government. The UK Government is working to tackle unfair loan services and loan sharks in Wales, and Cardiff Trading Standards is taking the lead on an all-Wales illegal moneylending unit in Wales. We are also working with the UK Government on a financial inclusion strategy, and £3 million and more has been made available to citizens advice bureaux across Wales to allow for an additional 37 face-to-face debt advisors.

In conclusion, I am glad to see that the Assembly acknowledges that the problem of indebtedness is growing, but you will, hopefully, agree that the Assembly Government also acknowledges that it is a problem, and that, within our competences, we are actively engaged in a programme to promote financial inclusion.

**Michael German:** I listened carefully to what the Minister had to say. I am sure that Members will recognise that this was not an aggressive motion. It was not meant to be a motion that challenged the Government in a way that said 'You are doing things entirely wrong in this matter and should be doing something entirely different'. It was intended to raise this issue as one that is a great problem for Wales. I listened carefully to what the Minister had to say, because I wanted to know what it was in the motion that he was rejecting—I presume Plaid Cymru and Labour Members will vote

ddatblygu undebau credyd, yn ogystal â'r arian sydd eisoes wedi'i ymrwymo. Mae gennym 33 o undebau credyd ar waith ar draws Cymru gyfan bron, a chredaf fod angen inni weithio'n fwy diwyd i ymestyn rôl undebau credyd. Yr wyf yn falch fod undebau credyd yn ymestyn y clwb cynilo Nadolig, yng ngoleuni'r cyfraniadau a wnaeth Lorraine Barrett yn ei haraith. Byddwn yn hyrwyddo'r clybiau hynny yn y misoedd nesaf ac yn ddiweddarach yn y flwyddyn wrth i bobl baratoi ar gyfer y Nadolig.

Anogaf yr Aelodau i wrthod gwelliant y Ceidwadwyr, gan nad yw'n cydnabod y gwaith y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei wneud gyda Llywodraeth y DU. Mae Llywodraeth y DU yn gweithio i fynd i'r afael â gwasanaethau benthyca annheg a benthycwyr arian didrwydded yng Nghymru, ac mae Safonau Masnach Caerdydd yn cymryd yr awenau gydag uned benthyciadau arian anghyfreithlon ar gyfer Cymru gyfan. Yr ydym hefyd yn gweithio gyda Llywodraeth y DU ar strategaeth cynhwysiant ariannol, ac mae £3 miliwn a mwy wedi ei ddarparu i ganolfannau cyngor ar bopeth ledled Cymru ar gyfer 37 yn ychwanegol o gynghorwyr dyled wyneb-yn-wyneb.

I gloi, yr wyf yn falch fod y Cynulliad yn cydnabod bod problem gorddyledusrwydd yn cynyddu, ond cytunwch, gobeithio, fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad hefyd yn cydnabod ei fod yn broblem, a'n bod, o fewn ein galluoedd, yn ymwneud yn rhagweithiol â rhaglen i hyrwyddo cynhwysiant ariannol.

**Michael German:** Gwrandewais yn ofalus ar yr hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd Aelodau'n cydnabod nad oedd hwn yn gynnig ymosodol. Nid oedd i fod yn gynnig i herio'r Llywodraeth mewn ffordd a oedd yn dweud 'Yr ydych yn gwneud pethau'n hollol anghywir yn y mater hwn, a dylech fod yn gwneud rhywbeth hollol wahanol'. Ei fwriad oedd codi'r mater hwn fel mater sy'n broblem enfawr i Gymru. Gwrandewais yn ofalus ar yr hyn a oedd gan y Gweinidog i'w ddweud, oherwydd yr oeddwn am wybod beth yn y cynnig yr oedd yn ei wrthod—cymeraf y bydd aelodau Plaid

against the motion. However, it seems to me that all that you are rejecting is the expression of concern about the rising levels of debt, and regret about the level of debt that students have. I challenge Bethan on that, as she carries this large debt. However, she is one of the fortunate ones who will be able to pay student loans back much more rapidly than others—I envisage that Members will be questioning you year after year as to how much debt you have left, Bethan, given the rates of the pay that we receive.

It seems to me that those were the only reasons for which you can reject our motion, because the Government amendment would largely replicate the third part of our motion. We would have been happy to accept that change to the third part of our motion—not to express regret and concern seems to be the problem here.

I must therefore tell you why this is a problem. Since we tabled this motion, the figures have gone up. Debt is no longer at £1.3 trillion, but £1.4 trillion. That recently announced figure demonstrates the level of increasing debt. The second key statistic is that, in the course of 2007, the level of personal debt per person in Wales overtook average wealth—in other words, the average income. The figures are stark: the average personal debt now stands at £22,400, while the average income is £20,134. The lines on the graph crossed, and average debt overtook average income, during the course of last year. We must therefore express concern that that is happening.

My second concern with what the Minister said relates to the fact that we are only dealing with those who are currently financially excluded—I listened carefully to Government's words. However, part of solving the problem lies in challenging those who will become financially excluded; and challenging and helping those who are in fear of becoming financially excluded. I agree with Lorraine Barrett's contribution—most of what she had to say was about the preventative medicine that we can provide to help in this regard. There has been much talk in this Assembly over the years in relation to

Cymru a Llafur yn pleidleisio yn erbyn y cynnig. Ond mae'n ymddangos i mi mai'r cyfan yr ydych yn ei wrthod yw'r mynegiant o bryder am lefelau dyled cynyddol a'r gofid am lefel dyled myfyrwyr. Heriaf Bethan ar hynny, a hithau'n ysgwyddo'r ddyled fawr hon. Ond mae hi'n un o'r rhai ffodus a fydd yn gallu talu'r benthyciadau myfyrwyr yn ôl lawer ynghynt nag eraill—rhagwelaf y bydd Aelodau'n eich holi bob blwyddyn ynghylch faint o ddyled sydd gennych yn weddill, Bethan, o gofio'r cyfraddau tâl a gawn ni.

Ymddengys i mi mai am y rhesymau hynny'n unig y gallwch wrthod ein cynnig oherwydd, i bob pwrpas, ailadrodd trydedd ran ein cynnig fyddai gwelliant y Llywodraeth. Byddem wedi bod yn hapus derbyn y newid hwnnw yn nhrydedd ran ein cynnig—mae'n ymddangos mai peidio â mynegi gofid a phryder yw'r broblem yma.

Felly, rhaid i mi ddweud wrthyfch pam mae hyn yn broblem. Ers inni gyflwyno'r cynnig hwn, mae'r ffigurau wedi codi. Nid £1.3 triliwn yw'r ddyled mwyach, ond £1.4 triliwn. Mae'r ffigur hwnnw a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar yn dangos lefel y cynnydd mewn dyled. Yr ail ystadegyn allweddol yw bod lefel dyled bersonol am bob person yng Nghymru, yn ystod 2007, wedi codi'n uwch na lefel cyfoeth cyfartalog—hynny yw, yr incwm cyfartalog. Mae'r ffigurau'n ddychryn: erbyn hyn mae'r ddyled bersonol ar gyfartaledd yn £22,400, a'r incwm cyfartalog yn £20,134. Croesodd y llinellau ar y graff, ac aeth y ddyled gyfartalog yn fwy na'r incwm cyfartalog yn ystod y llynedd. Felly, rhaid inni fynegi pryder fod hynny'n digwydd.

Mae fy ail bryder am yr hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog yn ymwneud â'r ffaith ein bod yn delio dim ond â'r rheini sydd wedi'u hallgáu'n ariannol ar hyn o bryd-gwrandewais yn ofalus ar eiriau'r Llywodraeth. Ond rhan o'r gwaith o ddatrys y broblem fydd herio'r rheini a fydd yn cael eu hunain wedi eu hallgáu'n ariannol; a herio a helpu'r rheini sy'n ofni cael eu hallgáu'n ariannol. Cytunaf â chyfraniad Lorraine Barret-yr oedd y rhan fwyaf o'r hyn a oedd ganddi i'w ddweud yn sôn am y moddion ataliol y gallwn eu darparu i helpu yn y cyswllt hwn. Bu llawer o sôn yn y Cynulliad

medicine that prevention is better than cure. If we take action in advance to help people, we will help to resolve issues and prevent them from developing into problems that are too much for us to address. That is what this motion seeks to get this Government to do. I am dismayed, however, that the Government seems to be aiming all of its funding and support at those who are currently financial excluded rather than at those—*[Interruption.]* I am only repeating the Minister's words. That is where the funding is going.

**Brian Gibbons:** I do not know whether you were listening, but I made a point about the proactive work that the credit unions are doing to prevent people from getting into debt. I made a particular point about the announcement that Jane Hutt has made, undertaking to promote financial security. I have also made reference to our financial inclusion strategy—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Please speak into the microphone, Minister.

**Brian Gibbons:** That is about preventing people from getting into debt. I made three or four substantial points about the proactive steps that we as an Assembly Government are taking to prevent debt from arising in the first place. You clearly could not have been listening, Mike.

**Michael German:** I listened extremely carefully, because I wanted to see where your priorities lay. That was the issue that I was raising. I am not saying that you are not doing anything in this regard; I am making a point about where your priorities lie.

You have to listen carefully to the Bank of England. Last night, Mervyn King told an audience in Bristol, after the Federal Reserve issue yesterday and the crashing stock markets and everything else, that the problem for us in Britain is that we are debt laden. That is a time bomb ticking away, and we have to deal with it, and with the people who will become financially excluded and are in danger of financial exclusion. That is what I was listening carefully for with regard to

hwn dros y blynyddoedd fod atal yn well meddyginaeth nag iachâd. Os cymerwn gamau ymlaen llaw i helpu pobl, byddwn yn helpu datrys materion a'u hatal rhag tyfu'n broblemau a fydd yn rhy fawr i ni eu datrys. Dyna mae'r cynnig hwn yn ceisio cael gan y Llywodraeth i'w wneud. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf wedi fy siomi fod y Llywodraeth, i bob golwg, yn anelu ei holl arian a'i chefnogaeth at y rheini sydd wedi'u hallgáu'n ariannol ar hyn o bryd yn hytrach na'r rheini—*[Torri ar draws.]* Dim ond ailadrodd geiriau'r Gweinidog yr ydwyf. Dyna ble mae'r arian yn mynd.

**Brian Gibbons:** Ni wn a oeddech yn gwrando, ond soniais am y gwaith rhagweithiol y mae'r undebau credyd yn ei wneud i atal pobl rhag mynd i ddyled. Gwneuthum bwynt penodol am y cyhoeddiad a wnaed gan Jane Hutt, yn addo hyrwyddo diogelwch ariannol. Yr wyf hefyd wedi cyfeirio at ein strategaeth cynhwysiant ariannol—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Byddwch cystal â siarad i mewn i'r meicroffon, Weinidog.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae hynny'n ymwneud ag atal pobl rhag mynd i ddyled. Gwneuthum dri neu bedwar pwynt o bwys am y camau rhagweithiol yr ydym ni fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn eu cymryd i atal dyled rhag cynyddu yn y lle cyntaf. Mae'n amlwg nad oeddech yn gwrando, Mike.

**Michael German:** Gwrandewais yn ofalus iawn, oherwydd yr oeddwn am weld beth oedd eich blaenoriaethau. Hynny oedd y mater yr oeddwn yn ei godi. Nid wyf yn dweud nad ydych yn gwneud dim yn y cyswllt hwn; yr wyf yn gwneud pwynt ynghylch ble mae eich blaenoriaethau.

Mae'n rhaid ichi wrando'n ofalus ar Fanc Lloegr. Neithiwr, dywedodd Mervyn King wrth gynulleidfa ym Mryste, ar ôl problem y Gronfa Ffederal ddoe a chwyp y marchnadoedd stoc a phopeth arall, mai'r broblem i ni ym Mhrydain yw ein bod wedi'n llwytho â dyled. Mae hynny'n fom sy'n ticio'n gyflym, a rhaid inni ddelio â hynny, ac â'r bobl a fydd yn cael eu hallgáu'n ariannol ac mewn perygl o hynny. Am hynny yr oeddwn yn gwrando'n ofalus o ran beth yw



what your priority is, and I think that I got the answer.

**Mark Isherwood:** Would you agree that, beyond what the Minister told us, there is far greater scope to work with the UK Government and financial institutions? For example, Citizens Advice has told us that the most worrying aspect of its casework relates to sub-prime mortgage lending and secured second loans. In my previous job, under the statutory mortgage code, we had to show that we knew our customers, that we had assessed their ability to pay, and that we had given the best advice. Why are sub-prime lenders not required to do the same, and what will the Government do about that?

**Michael German:** This Government could do much to try to influence the debate at Westminster and their Government at Whitehall; I agree with that. The problem for us always with regard to these issues is that they are all interlocked. If Citizens Advice—to which the Government provides funding to assist those who are financially excluded—provides advice, but wants to see a change in policy, you would expect it to turn to Government to influence that policy change. It is important that we take this message. That is why this debate was tabled—to raise this issue, and to try to create a better profile for it. I am not despairing of what the Government is doing, and I am not saying that the Government is doing nothing, but I am saying that, while it has a priority to adhere to financial strictures, it should also have a priority to assist those who will become financially excluded in the future as a result of what has happened. These are the sorts of measures that need greater priority, in terms of education in the broadest context, in communities, by the CAB, and others.

5.30 p.m.

However, there is also a major role to be played in trying to ensure that the UK Government takes action in this respect. The Governor of the Bank of England last night

eich blaenoriaeth, a chredaf imi gael yr ateb.

**Mark Isherwood:** A fydddech chi'n cytuno, y tu hwnt i'r hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog wrthym, fod llawer mwy o le i weithio gyda Llywodraeth y DU a sefydliadau ariannol? Er enghraifft, mae Cyngor ar Bopeth wedi dweud wrthym mai'r agwedd fwyaf pryderus ar ei waith achos yw benthyciadau morgais is-fenthyca ac ail fenthyciadau diogel. Yn fy swydd flaenorol, dan y cod morgesei statudol, yr oedd rhaid inni ddangos ein bod yn adnabod ein cwsmeriaid, ein bod wedi asesu eu gallu i dalu, a'n bod wedi rhoi'r cyngor gorau. Pam nad oes rheidrwydd ar fenthycwyr is-fenthyca i wneud yr un modd, a beth fydd y Llywodraeth yn ei wneud am hynny?

**Michael German:** Gallai'r Llywodraeth hon wneud llawer i geisio dylanwadu ar y ddadl yn San Steffan ac ar eu Llywodraeth yn Whitehall; cytunaf â hynny. Y broblem i ni bob amser yng nghyswllt y materion hyn yw eu bod i gyd yn gydgysylltiedig. Os yw Cyngor ar Bopeth—ac y mae'r Llywodraeth yn darparu arian iddo i helpu'r rheini sydd wedi'u hallgáu'n ariannol—yn darparu cyngor ond am weld newid mewn polisi, byddech yn disgwyl iddo droi at y Llywodraeth i ddylanwadu ar y newid hwnnw mewn polisi. Mae'n bwysig inni dderbyn y neges hon. Dyna pam y cyflwynwyd y ddadl hon—i godi'r mater hwn, a cheisio rhoi mwy o amlygrwydd iddo. Nid wyf yn anobeithio am yr hyn mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei wneud, ac nid wyf yn dweud nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn gwneud dim. Ond yr wyf yn dweud, er ei bod yn flaenoriaeth iddi gadw at gyfyngiadau ariannol, y dylai hefyd roi blaenoriaeth i helpu'r rheini a gaiff eu hallgáu'n ariannol yn y dyfodol oherwydd yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd. Dyma'r math o fesurau y mae angen mwy o flaenoriaeth arnynt, o ran addysg yn ei gyd-destun ehangaf, mewn cymunedau, gan CAB, ac eraill.

Fodd bynnag, mae rhan fawr i'w chwarae hefyd i geisio gofalu bod Llywodraeth y DU yn gweithredu yn hyn. Neithiwr, tynnodd Llywodraethwr Banc Lloegr sylw at y ffaith

drew attention to the fact that we will be facing a big credit crisis in this country. That situation got even worse yesterday. Therefore, tackling this problem will become a greater issue for us all to have to measure up to. I am, therefore, dismayed that the Government does not intend to support the first parts of this motion. What you are voting against is concern for the rising level of debt, and dismay about student debt. Those are the two first parts of this motion; those of you who vote against it will be held accountable for that.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The proposal is to agree amendment 1. Does any Member object? I see that they do. Therefore, I will defer the vote. I will adjourn the meeting. The bell will be rung, and we will reconvene in five minutes for voting time.

y byddwn yn wynebu argyfwng credyd mawr yn y wlad hon. Gwaethygodd y sefyllfa honno fwyfwy ddoe. Felly, bydd mynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon yn dod yn fwy o fater inni bob un orfod ei wynebu. Mae'n destun braw imi, felly, nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn bwriadu cefnogi rhannau cyntaf y cynnig hwn. Yr hyn yr ydych yn pleidleisio yn ei erbyn yw pryder am lefel gynyddol dyledion, a gofid ynghylch dyled myfyrwyr. Dyna ddwy ran gyntaf y cynnig hwn; caiff y rheini ohonoch a fydd yn pleidleisio yn ei erbyn eich dal i gyfrif am hynny.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Y cynnig yw cytuno gwelliant 1. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf fod. Felly, gohiriaf y pleidleisiau. Gohiriaf y cyfarfod. Cenir y gloch, a byddwn yn ailymgynnull ymhen pum munud ar gyfer yr amser pleidleisio.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisiau tan yr amser pleidleisio.  
Votes deferred until voting time.*

*Gohiriwyd y Cyfarfod Llawn rhwng 5.31 p.m. a 5.37 p.m.  
Plenary adjourned between 5.31 p.m. and 5.37 p.m.*

### **Amser Pleidleisio Voting Time**

*Gwelliant 1 i NDM3849: O blaid 38, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 15.  
Amendment 1 to NDM3849: For 38, Abstain 0, Against 15.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Asghar, Mohammad  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
James, Irene  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Melding, David  
Millar, Darren  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Ramsay, Nick  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 2 i NDM3849: O blaid 54, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 2 to NDM3849: For 54, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Asghar, Mohammad  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Paul  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David

Mewies, Sandy  
 Millar, Darren  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Ramsay, Nick  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment carried.*

Motion NDM3849 as amended: that  
*the National Assembly for Wales:*

Cynnig NDM3849 fel y'i diwygiwyd: bod  
*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. notes the halt in the decline of GVA since 2000;*

*1. yn nodi'r atal yng ngostyngiad gwerth ychwanegol crynswth ers 2000;*

*2. welcomes the following actions by the Welsh Assembly Government to improve GVA:*

*2. yn croesawu'r camau canlynol gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wella gwerth ychwanegol crynswth:*

*a) an all-Wales approach to economic development and a commitment to implement a labour market strategy with a long term goal of full employment at a rate of 80%;*

*a) dull Cymru gyfan o weithredu datblygiad economaidd ac ymrwymiad i roi strategaeth marchnad lafur ar waith gyda'r nod hirdymor o gyflogaeth lawn ar raddfa o 80 y cant;*

*b) the 'One Wales' commitment to improve the transport infrastructure; and*

*b) ymrwymiad 'Cymru'n Un' i wella'r seilwaith trafndiaeth;*

*c) the new skills and employment strategy 'Skills that work for Wales,' to drive up skills levels and address the needs of business;*

*c) y strategaeth sgiliau a chyflogaeth newydd 'Sgiliau sy'n Gweithio i Gymru', i godi lefelau sgiliau a mynd i'r afael ag anghenion busnesau;*

*3. notes that small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs) form the back bone of Wales's economy and calls for:*

*3. yn nodi mai busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yw asgwrn cefn economi Cymru ac yn galw am:*

*a) access to broadband to be extended to allow Welsh business to compete in the global economy; and*

*a) ymestyn mynediad at fand eang i alluogi busnesau Cymru i gystadlu yn yr economi fyd-eang; a*

*b) Welsh SMEs to be given the maximum possible opportunity to bid for public contracts.*

*b) rhoi cymaint o gyfleoedd â phosibl i fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yng Nghymru wneud ceisiadau am gontractau cyhoeddus.*

*Cynnig NDM3849 fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 38, Ymatal 6, Yn erbyn 10.  
 Motion NDM3849 as amended: For 38, Abstain 6, Against 10.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Asghar, Mohammad  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
James, Irene  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wood, Leanne

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
German, Michael  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd cynnig NDM3849 fel y'i diwygiwyd.  
Motion NDM3849 as amended carried.*

*Gwelliant 1 i NDM3848: O blaid 38, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 16.  
Amendment 1 to NDM3848: For 38, Abstain 0, Against 16.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Asghar, Mohammad  
Barrett, Lorraine

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Melding, David  
Millar, Darren  
Ramsay, Nick  
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor

Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Alun  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Evans, Nerys  
 Franks, Chris  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 James, Irene  
 Jenkins, Bethan  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Trish  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wood, Leanne

Burns, Angela  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, Andrew R.T.  
 Davies, Paul  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Melding, David  
 Millar, Darren  
 Ramsay, Nick  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 2 i NDM3848: O blaid 17, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 37.  
 Amendment 2 to NDM3848: For 17, Abstain 0, Against 37.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Burns, Angela  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, Andrew R.T.  
 Davies, Paul  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Law, Trish  
 Melding, David  
 Millar, Darren  
 Ramsay, Nick  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Asghar, Mohammad  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Alun  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Evans, Nerys  
 Franks, Chris  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 James, Irene  
 Jenkins, Bethan  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann

Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

Motion NDM3848 as amended: that

Cynnig NDM3848 fel y'i diwygiwyd: bod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. notes with concern that personal debt across the UK is in excess of £1.3 trillion;*

*1. yn nodi â phryder bod dyled bersonol ar draws y Deyrnas Unedig yn fwy na £1.3 triliwn;*

*2. commends the Welsh Assembly Government's schemes aimed at improving financial literacy among children and adults, and to offer advice and support to those who are already struggling with debt.*

*2. yn cymeradwyo cynlluniau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a anelir at wella llythrennedd ariannol ymhlith plant ac oedolion, a chynnig cyngor a chefnogaeth i'r rheini sydd eisoes yn cael anawsterau â dyled.*

*Cynnig NDM3848 fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 48, Ymatal 6, Yn erbyn 0.  
 Motion NDM3848 as amended: For 48, Abstain 6, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Asghar, Mohammad  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Burns, Angela  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Alun  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Andrew R.T.  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Paul  
 Evans, Nerys  
 Franks, Chris  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Hart, Edwina

Hutt, Jane  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jenkins, Bethan  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Trish  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Millar, Darren  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Ramsay, Nick  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Wood, Leanne

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 German, Michael  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Williams, Kirsty

5.40 p.m.

*Derbyniwyd cynnig NDM3848 fel y'i diwygiwyd.  
 Motion NDM3848 as amended carried.*

## **Dadl Fer Short Debate**

### **Ceg Gam—Rhoi Sylw i'r Diffyg Deintyddol yn Sir Benfro Down in the Mouth—Addressing the Dental Shortfall in Pembrokeshire**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I ask Members to please leave the Chamber quietly. [*Interruption.*] Thank you, but I think that I can manage without help from the Conservatives. If you were not making so much noise, it would be much quieter in here.

**Paul Davies:** Alun Davies and Jenny Randerson have asked to contribute to this debate and I have agreed that they may have a minute each of my time.

I have tabled this debate mainly because I

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Gofynnaf i'r Aelodau adael y Siambr yn dawel os gwelwch yn dda. [*Torri ar draws.*] Diolch, ond credaf y gallaf ddod i ben heb help gan y Ceidwadwyr. Pe na baech yn gwneud cymaint o sŵn, byddai'n ddistawach o lawer yma.

**Paul Davies:** Gofynnodd Alun Davies a Jenny Randerson am gyfrannu at y ddadl hon, a chytunais y gallant gael munud yr un o'm hamser.

Cyflwynais y ddadl hon yn bennaf oherwydd



have an obligation to my constituents. I was elected last year because campaigning to improve the dental shortfall in Pembrokeshire was one of my main priorities. This debate will be about highlighting this important issue and persuading the Assembly Government to take further action. We have not spent sufficient time in the Assembly discussing the dental profession, the people who work in it and issues around oral health generally.

I will begin by reminding Members how we have arrived at this point. The former Prime Minister, Tony Blair, pledged in 1999 that everyone would have access to an NHS dentist by September 2001, no matter where they lived. That pledge has not been fulfilled in Wales, and certainly not in Pembrokeshire. Less than half of the Welsh adult population is registered with an NHS dentist. The First Minister pledged in 2006 that,

‘everyone who wants NHS dentistry should be able to get it by 31 March 2007’.

Again, that has not happened, as there is a postcode lottery of provision in many parts of Wales.

Wales was the scene of some of the first queues in the UK for NHS dentistry, which is a damning indictment of the depth of the crisis to which the service had been allowed to sink. Last year, figures revealed that only 15 per cent of the people of Pembrokeshire had access to an NHS dentist. That meant that 85 per cent of the population had to go private or receive no treatment whatsoever. In November last year it was reported that 14,000 people were waiting for an NHS dentist in Pembrokeshire.

There is a huge issue around capacity and access. There is clearly not enough dental workforce, funding or practices to cope with the rise in access in Wales. In April 2006, the Government renegotiated dental contracts in order to attract more practitioners into the NHS. However, I am told that, due to the disadvantaged nature of these new contracts, more practitioners have left the NHS. The British Dental Association has said that one

bod gennyf ymrwymiad i'm hetholwyr. Cefais fy ethol y llynedd oherwydd ymgyrchu i wella'r diffyg deintyddol yn sir Benfro oedd un o'm prif flaenoriaethau. Bydd a wnelo'r ddadl hon â thynnu sylw at y pwnc pwysig hwn a pherswadio Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i gymryd camau pellach. Nid ydym wedi treulio digon o amser yn y Cynulliad yn trafod y proffesiwn deintyddol, y bobl sy'n gweithio ynddo na materion yn ymwneud ag iechedd y geg yn gyffredinol.

Cychwynnaf drwy atgoffa'r Aelodau sut y daethom i'r fan hon. Addawodd y cyn-Brif Weinidog, Tony Blair, yn 1999 y byddai pawb yn gallu cael gwasanaeth gan ddeintydd GIG erbyn Medi 2001, waeth ble byddent yn byw. Ni chadwyd yr addewid hwnnw yng Nghymru, ac yn sicr nid yn sir Benfro. Mae llai na hanner poblogaeth oedolion Cymru wedi cofrestru gyda deintydd GIG. Addawodd Prif Weinidog Cymru yn 2006,

y dylai pawb sydd eisiau deintyddiaeth GIG allu ei chael erbyn 31 Mawrth 2007.

Unwaith eto, ni ddigwyddodd hynny, gan fod loteri cod post o ran y ddarpariaeth mewn llawer rhan o Gymru.

Yng Nghymru y gwelwyd rhai o'r ciwiau cyntaf yn y DU am ddeintyddiaeth GIG, sy'n gondemniad hallt o ddyfnder yr argyfwng y gadawyd i'r gwasanaeth suddo iddo. Y llynedd, datgelodd ffigurau mai 15 y cant yn unig o bobl sir Benfro a allai gael gafael ar ddeintydd GIG. Golygai hynny fod 85 y cant o'r boblogaeth yn gorfod mynd yn breifat neu beidio â chael triniaeth o gwbl. Ym mis Tachwedd y llynedd, dywedwyd bod 14,000 o bobl yn disgwyl am gael deintydd GIG yn sir Benfro.

Mae yna broblem enfawr o ran capasiti a mynediad. Yn amlwg, nid oes digon o weithwyr, cyllid na phractisau deintyddol i ymdopi â'r cynnydd yn y mynediad yng Nghymru. Ym mis Ebrill 2006, ail-drafodwyd contractau deintyddol gan y Llywodraeth er mwyn denu mwy o ddeintyddion i mewn i'r GIG. Fodd bynnag, caf ar ddeall, oherwydd natur anfanteisiol y contractau newydd hyn, fod mwy o

of the main problems with the dental contract is that the Welsh Assembly Government said that there would be a reduction in workload pressures but, because of the oral health workload, particularly among young children, workload pressures have not decreased.

I am told that the unit process of the contract is not working well. Those in need of significant dental treatment are not receiving that treatment and dentists are not paid for the full work that they are doing.

I am fully aware of the Government's task and finish group that is looking into the dental contract in Wales. I welcomed the setting up of this group, which the Minister announced last November, and I hope that it will address some of the difficult issues. Its findings will be essential.

*The Times* reported last week that a survey suggested that one in three people in England and Wales had not seen an NHS dentist for almost two years, because they could not find a practice that would accept them. Citizens Advice, the survey's author, said that 4.7 million people would have sought private care while 2.7 million people would have missed treatment.

In Pembrokeshire, there is a lack of orthodontic provision and dentists are unable to cope with local demand. That is the message received mainly from dentists. As far as I understand it, a sensitive issue is occurring in several corporate practices in the area, whereby those practices are sending patients to nearby hospitals for routine procedures, saying that they cannot undertake such treatments.

I understand that trainees are not coming through the Welsh system, because local health boards are not giving them junior-partner-status contracts. The British Dental Association feels that juniors need to be given greater incentives to remain in Wales. Last year, more than 300 dentists were being trained in Cardiff and I understand that 57 will graduate this year. It is thought that only

ddeintyddion wedi gadael y GIG. Dywedodd y Gymdeithas Ddeintyddol Brydeinig mai un o'r prif broblemau gyda'r contract deintyddol yw bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi dweud y byddai gostyngiad yn y baich gwaith, ond oherwydd baich gwaith iechyd y geg, yn enwedig ymysg plant ifanc, nid yw pwysau'r baich gwaith wedi lleihau.

Dywedir wrthyf nad yw'r broses uned yn y contract yn gweithio'n dda. Nid yw'r rheini sydd ag angen triniaeth ddeintyddol sylweddol yn cael y driniaeth honno, ac nid yw deintyddion yn cael eu talu am y gwaith llawn a wnânt.

Yr wyf yn hollol ymwybodol o grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen y Llywodraeth sy'n ymchwilio i'r contract deintyddol yng Nghymru. Croesewais sefydlu'r grŵp hwn, a gyhoeddwyd gan y Gweinidog fis Tachwedd diwethaf, a gobeithio yr aiff i'r afael â rhai o'r materion dyrys. Bydd ei ddarganfyddiadau'n hanfodol.

Dywedodd *The Times* yr wythnos diwethaf fod un o bob tri yng Nghymru a Lloegr heb weld deintydd GIG ers bron i ddwy flynedd, am na allent ddod o hyd i bractis a fyddai'n eu derbyn. Dywedodd Cyngor ar Bopeth, awdur yr arolwg, y byddai 4.7 miliwn o bobl wedi dewis gofal preifat a 2.7 miliwn o bobl heb gael triniaeth o gwbl.

Yn sir Benfro, mae diffyg darpariaeth orthodontig, ac ni fedr deintyddion ddod i ben â'r galw yn lleol. Dyna'r neges a gawn gan ddeintyddion yn bennaf. Cyn belled ag y deallaf, mae pwnc sensitif yn codi mewn llawer practis corfforaethol yn yr ardal, a'r practisau hynny'n anfon cleifion i ysbytai cyfagos am driniaethau cyffredin, gan ddweud na allant wneud triniaethau o'r fath.

Deallaf nad yw hyfforddeion yn dod drwy'r system yng Nghymru, am nad yw byrddau iechyd lleol yn rhoi contractau statws-partner-iau iddynt. Teimla'r Gymdeithas Ddeintyddol Brydeinig fod angen mwy o gymhelliant i ddeintyddion iau er mwyn iddynt aros yng Nghymru. Y llynedd, yr oedd dros 300 o ddeintyddion yn cael eu hyfforddi yng Nghaerdydd, a deallaf y bydd 57 yn

half of those dentists will go on to work in Wales. A study in recent years found that only 45 per cent of Wales's dentists had trained in Cardiff.

The BDA has said that the Welsh Assembly Government needs to start considering incentives to persuade Cardiff-trained dentists to stay in Wales. This could include offering dental students conditional bursaries or writing off student tuition loans in return for a set number of years' work in Wales. The British Dental Association has said that, since the introduction of the new dental contract, orthodontic waiting lists in some parts of the UK are soaring, while specialists with new practices are being forced out of the NHS. The areas of the UK where it has always been hardest for children to get specialist treatment to straighten crowded or protruding teeth remain the worst served. Wales is one of those areas. Money allocated to local health boards by the Welsh Assembly Government for dentistry and orthodontics is ring-fenced until the end of March 2009. After that date, it will be up to the LHBs, in consultation with members of the public, to work out how much money they want to spend on NHS dentistry in each area of Wales. Obviously, the LHB will have a statutory obligation to provide and pay for a basic dental service, but in an environment where there may be other areas of healthcare that have a greater priority, such as cancer care and maternity services, the LHB may decide not to fund as much orthodontic treatment as it has in the past. This may result in about 30 per cent to 40 per cent of 12 to 16-year-olds who want orthodontic treatment being denied NHS funding if the worst-case scenario becomes a reality. We must ensure that children are given the best possible treatment.

The Minister recognises that dental health among children is very poor. She said in her announcement in November that

graddio eleni. Tybir mai dim ond tua hanner y deintyddion hynny a fydd yn mynd ymlaen i weithio yng Nghymru. Darganfu astudiaeth rai blynyddoedd yn ôl mai 45 y cant yn unig o ddeintyddion Cymru a oedd wedi eu hyfforddi yng Nghaerdydd.

Dywedodd y Gymdeithas Ddeintyddol Brydeinig fod angen i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ddechrau ystyried cymhellion i gymell deintyddion a hyfforddwyd yng Nghaerdydd i aros yng Nghymru. Gallai hyn gynnwys cynnig bwrsariau amodol i fyfyrwyr deintyddiaeth, neu ddileu benthyciadau dysgu myfyrwyr yn gyfnewid am nifer penodol o flynyddoedd o waith yng Nghymru. Yn ôl Cymdeithas Ddeintyddol Prydain, ers cyflwyno'r contract deintyddol newydd, mae rhestrau aros am wasanaeth orthodontig mewn rhai rhannau o'r DU wedi mynd yn hwy, tra mae arbenigwyr sydd â phractisau newydd yn cael eu gorfodi i adael y GIG. Yr ardaloedd sy'n dal i gael y gwasanaeth gwaethaf yw'r ardaloedd hynny yn y DU lle bu'n anodd erioed i blant gael triniaeth arbenigol i sythu dannedd sy'n rhy agos neu sy'n ymwithio allan. Mae Cymru'n un o'r ardaloedd hynny. Mae'r arian a ddyrannwyd i fyrddau iechyd lleol gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer deintyddiaeth ac orthodonteg wedi'i neilltuo hyd ddiwedd Mawrth 2009. Ar ôl hynny, y BILlau, drwy ymgynghori â'r cyhoedd, a fydd â'r hawl i benderfynu faint o arian y maent am ei wario ar ddeintyddiaeth GIG ym mhob ardal yng Nghymru. Wrth gwrs, bydd gan y BILl ddyletswydd statudol i ddarparu a thalu am wasanaeth deintyddol sylfaenol, ond mewn sefyllfaoedd lle mae'n bosibl y rhoir mwy o flaenoriaeth i agweddau eraill ar ofal iechyd, megis gofal canser a gwasanaethau mamolaeth, gallai'r BILl benderfynu peidio â neilltuo cymaint o arian ar gyfer triniaethau orthodontig ag a neilltuwyd ganddo yn y gorffennol. Petai'r gwaethaf yn digwydd, gallai hyn olygu bod tua 30 i 40 y cant o bobl ifanc 12 i 16 oed sydd am gael triniaeth orthodontig yn methu â chael y driniaeth dan y GIG. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod plant yn cael y driniaeth orau posibl.

Mae'r Gweinidog yn cydnabod bod iechyd deintyddol plant yn wael iawn. Dywedodd, yn ei chyhoeddiad ym mis Tachwedd,

‘Some of our children have some of the worst teeth in Europe. The dental health of five-year-old children in Wales is the worst in Great Britain’.

I have received correspondence from several constituents who have told me that they have had to pay hundreds of pounds for their children’s orthodontic treatment. Surely, it is totally unacceptable for parents to be forced to pay for their children’s treatment. How many more children do not receive treatment at all because of their parents’ inability to pay?

The BDA has said that orthodontic treatment is being limited in a number of ways. First, primary care trusts are providing orthodontists with contracts that curtail the growth of NHS orthodontic provision. No matter how many patients they are able and willing to treat, the contracts limit the number of children who can have braces. Secondly, new practices and recently qualified specialists are being given contracts that are well below their capacity. They have no option but to offer private treatment in order to cover their running costs. Thirdly, some dentists who formerly provided orthodontics to less complex cases have been given purely dental contracts to boost access to basic dental care. This has also reduced the amount of available orthodontic treatment.

The criteria under the new dental contracts have been altered so that only those patients who most need treatment would be eligible. It is estimated that the new criteria will reduce the number of children treated by up to 20 per cent. Meanwhile, those who qualify for treatment may find that they are on a waiting list of several years. The British Orthodontic Society is not happy about the way in which the system is being implemented, with no priority given to the most deprived areas of the United Kingdom. The BDA said that in some parts of the country, only the lucky children whose names are near the top of the list will get treatment at the optimum age, if at all.

‘Mae gan rai o’n plant y dannedd gwaethaf yn Ewrop. Iechyd deintyddol plant pump oed yng Nghymru yw’r gwaethaf ym Mhrydain Fawr’.

Mae nifer o’r hetholwyr wedi cysylltu â mi i ddweud eu bod wedi gorfod talu cannoedd o bunnoedd am driniaeth orthodontig i’w plant. Onid yw’n gwbl annerbyniol fod rhieni’n cael eu gorfodi i dalu am driniaeth eu plant? Faint mwy o blant sydd heb fod yn cael triniaeth o gwbl am fod eu rhieni’n methu â thalu?

Mae Cymdeithas Ddeintyddol Prydain wedi dweud bod triniaeth orthodontig yn cael ei chyfyngu mewn llawer ffordd. Yn gyntaf, mae ymddiriedolaethau gofal sylfaenol yn darparu orthodontyddion sydd â chontractau sy’n cyfyngu twf darpariaeth orthodontig y GIG. Ni waeth faint o gleifion y maent yn gallu eu trin ac yn barod i’w trin, mae’r contractau’n cyfyngu nifer y plant a all gael sythwyr dannedd. Yn ail, mae practisau newydd ac arbenigwyr sydd wedi ennill cymwysterau’n ddiweddar yn cael contractau ar gyfer llawer llai o waith nag y gallant ei gyflawni. Nid oes ganddynt ddewis arall ar wahân i gynnig triniaeth breifat er mwyn talu eu costau rhedeg. Yn drydydd, mae rhai deintyddion a oedd yn arfer darparu gwasanaeth orthodonteg mewn achosion llai cymhleth wedi cael contractau deintyddol yn unig er mwyn gwella mynediad i ofal deintyddol sylfaenol. Mae hyn hefyd yn golygu bod llai o driniaethau orthodontig ar gael.

Mae’r meini prawf dan y contractau deintyddol newydd wedi’u haddasu fel mai dim ond y cleifion hynny sydd â’r angen mwyaf am driniaeth a fyddai’n gymwys. Amcangyfrifir y bydd y meini prawf newydd yn arwain at ostyngiad o 20 y cant yn nifer y plant sy’n cael triniaeth. Yn y cyfamser, gallai’r rheini sy’n gymwys i gael triniaeth weld eu bod ar restr aros am flynyddoedd lawer. Mae Cymdeithas Orthodontig Prydain yn anfodlon â’r ffordd y mae’r system yn cael ei gweithredu, heb roi unrhyw flaenoriaeth i’r ardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Yn ôl Cymdeithas Ddeintyddol Prydain, mewn rhai rhannau o’r wlad y plant ffodus sydd â’u henwau’n agos at frig y

rhestr yn unig a fydd yn cael triniaeth ar yr adeg orau yn eu bywydau, os o gwbl.

It has been said that to enable the transition between the old and new contracts for the delivery of orthodontic services, orthodontists were promised a payment of the value of 70 per cent of each course of treatment that they were delivering to each of their patients at the time that the new contract was implemented. However, I understand that, up to last year, this payment had not been made to all orthodontic practices, and the new payments were only allowing for case completion, hence there was little capacity for new patients to begin treatment in the specialist practices with a large workload. I understand that some general practitioners who previously took just a few simple cases have now virtually ceased to provide any orthodontic care, as it was not included in their contracts. In my area in particular, there are few specialist practices and formal paths of referral.

Dywedwyd, er mwyn trosglwyddo o'r hen contractau i'r rhai newydd ar gyfer darparu gwasanaethau orthodontig, fod taliad wedi ei addo i orthodonyddion gwerth 70 y cant o bob cwrs o driniaeth a roddid ganddynt i bob un o'u cleifion adeg gweithredu'r contract newydd. Fodd bynnag, deallaf hyd at y llynedd nad oedd y taliad hwn wedi'i roi i bob practis orthodontig, a'r cyfan a wnâi'r taliadau newydd oedd caniatáu cwblhau achosion. O ganlyniad, nid oedd fawr o obaith i gleifion newydd ddechrau triniaeth yn y practisau arbenigol lle'r oedd llwyth gwaith mawr. Deallaf fod rhai ymarferwyr cyffredinol a oedd yn arfer cymryd dim ond ychydig achosion syml bellach wedi rhoi'r gorau i bob pwrpas i ddarparu unrhyw ofal orthodontig, gan nad oedd yn rhan o'u contract. Yn fy ardal i yn fwyaf arbennig, mae'r practisau arbenigol a'r llwybrau atgyfeirio ffurfiol yn brin iawn.

5.50 p.m.

It was reported last year that almost £22 million that was intended to improve access to NHS dentistry in Wales had not been spent. That massive sum—a sixth of the annual allocation for NHS dentistry—was thought to be sitting in the bank, waiting to be returned to the Welsh Assembly Government at the end of the first full year of the new dental contract. In Pembrokeshire, it was revealed that the local health board had not spent £174,000 allocated to dentistry. Experts fear that if local health boards continue to underspend their dentistry allocations in years to come, Wales could see a return to the bad old days when people were forced to queue in the streets to register with an NHS dentist. This is money that could lead to significantly improved access to NHS dentistry in those areas where even the Assembly Government admits there are still problems. It could have paid for new contracts for some of our most talented new dentists—Welsh-trained graduates.

Adroddwyd y llynedd fd bron i £22 miliwn a fwriadwyd i wella mynediad i ddeintyddiaeth GIG yng Nghymru heb ei wario. Credid bod y swm enfawr hwnnw—un rhan o chwech o'r dyraniad blynyddol ar gyfer deintyddiaeth GIG—yn eistedd yn y banc, yn aros i gael ei ddychwelyd i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar ddiwedd blwyddyn lawn gyntaf y contract deintyddol newydd. Yn sir Benfro, datgelwyd bod y bwrdd iechyd lleol heb wario £174,000 a oedd wedi'i ddyrannu ar gyfer deintyddiaeth. Mae'r arbenigwyr yn ofni, os bydd byrddau iechyd lleol yn dal i danwario'u dyraniadau deintyddiaeth yn y blynyddoedd sydd i ddod, y gallai Cymru fynd yn ôl i'r hen ddyddiau tywyll pan oedd pobl yn gorfod ciwio ar y stryd i gofrestru gyda deintydd GIG. Mae hwn yn arian a allai wella mynediad i ddeintyddiaeth GIG yn sylweddol yn yr ardaloedd hynny lle mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad hyd yn oed yn cyfaddef bod problemau o hyd. Byddai wedi gallu talu am contractau newydd i rai o'n deintyddion newydd mwyaf talentog—graddedigion sydd wedi'u hyfforddi yng Nghymru.

Politicians of all parties have expressed huge

Mae gwleidyddion o bob plaid wedi mynegi

concerns. Helen Mary Jones, the Plaid Assembly Member for Llanelli, said that

‘An underspend of this size will have a huge impact on patient care...It is completely unforgivable that this kind of money is not being spent’.

As a party, we made a pledge during the Assembly election campaign to review the dental contract, which is clearly inadequate. I agree with the British Dental Association Wales that the dental contract was a missed opportunity to provide quality, accessible dental services across Wales. I am, of course, delighted that the Minister for health has listened to this, and I hope that the task and finish group will make firm recommendations and that the Government will then take decisive action. There must be better workforce planning so that dentists can be kept in the areas where they are needed. It is also transparent that investment is needed in some of our deprived areas, and money allocated to dentistry should not be returned to the Welsh Assembly Government. I hope that the Minister will take action to prevent this from happening.

I am sure that the Minister will remind me that a new dental practice has recently opened in Haverfordwest, providing improved access for the people of Pembrokeshire, and, of course, I welcome that. However, plenty more needs to be done to stop the number of patients receiving treatment from decreasing. Figures for the period from June 2006 to March 2007 show that the number of adults and children being treated in Pembrokeshire fell from over 36,000 to just over 31,000. This is a worrying trend, and I hope that this decline will soon be arrested and that access to treatment will improve.

There are clearly interface and communication problems between the Government, local health boards and dental practices in Wales. The Government needs to get this right if we are to make inroads on treating some of the worst oral hygiene in Europe. I look forward to hearing from the Minister, and I hope that she and the

pryder mawr. Yn ôl Helen Mary Jones, Aelod Cynulliad Plaid Cymru dros Lanelli:

Bydd tanwariant o'r maint hwn yn cael effaith aruthrol ar ofal cleifion...Mae'n gwbl anfaddeuol nad yw'r math hwn o arian yn cael ei wario.

Fel plaid, addawsom yn ystod ymgyrch etholiadol y Cynulliad y byddem yn adolygu'r contract deintyddol, sy'n amlwg yn annigonol. Cytunaf â Chymdeithas Ddeintyddol Prydain fod y contract deintyddol wedi colli cyfle i ddarparu gwasanaethau deintyddol cyfleus o safon uchel ledled Cymru. Yr wyf yn falch, wrth gwrs, fod y Gweinidog dros iechyd wedi gwrandao ar hyn, a gobeithio y bydd y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen yn gwneud argymhellion cryf, ac y bydd y Llywodraeth wedyn yn cymryd camau pendant. Rhaid cynllunio'r gweithlu'n well, fel y gellir cadw deintyddion yn yr ardaloedd lle mae eu hangen. Mae'n amlwg hefyd fod angen buddsoddi yn rhai o'n hardaloedd difreintiedig, ac ni ddylai arian sydd wedi'i ddyrannu ar gyfer deintyddiaeth gael ei ddychwelyd i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn gweithredu er mwyn sicrhau na fydd hyn yn digwydd.

Mae'r Gweinidog yn siŵr o'm hatgoffa bod practis deintyddol newydd wedi agor yn ddiweddar yn Hwlfordd, gan ddarparu'n well ar gyfer pobl sir Benfro, ac wrth gwrs, yr wyf yn croesawu hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae angen gwneud llawer mwy i sicrhau na fydd nifer y cleifion sy'n cael triniaeth yn lleihau. Dengys ffigurau am y cyfnod o Fehefin 2006 i Fawrth 2007 fod nifer yr oedolion a'r plant sy'n cael eu trin yn sir Benfro wedi gostwng o dros 36,000 i ychydig dros 31,000. Mae'r patrwm hwn yn peri pryder, a gobeithio y bydd y dirywiad hwn yn cael ei atal cyn hir ac y bydd yn haws gallu cael triniaeth.

Mae'n amlwg fod problemau cysylltu a chyfathrebu rhwng y Llywodraeth, byrddau iechyd lleol a phractisau deintyddol yng Nghymru. Mae angen i'r Llywodraeth gael hyn yn iawn os ydym i symud yn ein blaen a thrin rhai o'r achosion gwaethaf o hylendid y geg yn Ewrop. Edrychaf ymlaen at glywed gan y Gweinidog, ac yr wyf yn gobeithio y

Assembly Government take firm action to address the dental shortfall in my constituency by ensuring proper investment, and by improving the dental contracts so that people are guaranteed NHS treatment. The people of Pembrokeshire deserve no less.

**Alun Davies:** Thank you for bringing this to the attention of the Assembly, and for granting me this opportunity to speak in the debate. You reminded us at the start of your speech, Paul, how we got to the current situation. Perhaps I could take you back a bit further, to 1992, when the then Conservative Government closed two dental schools in Wales and left a legacy of a shortage of qualified dentists throughout the United Kingdom. One of the first actions of the incoming Labour Government in 1997 was to increase the capacity for dental training, and we see evidence of that in Cardiff, where 17 per cent more dentists are now being trained.

Paul will also know that LHBs are responsible for the commissioning and provision of NHS dental services throughout Wales, and that an additional £30 million was made available last year to support dentistry throughout Wales. Along with the £122 million that has been spent by this Government annually on dentistry, that represents a net increase of 89 per cent in funding for dentistry since the dark days of Conservative government.

I recognise well some of the issues that you have raised, Paul, but please do not tell us that we need to return to the past. We need continued, record-breaking investment.

**Jenny Randerson:** Thank you, Paul, for allowing me to contribute. In 2006, I did a survey of all registered dentists in Wales and had a surprisingly good response. They predicted that the new contract would not solve the problems, and many of them said that things would get worse, as indeed they have in some areas. They specifically said that the problem with the new contract was a lack of emphasis on prevention. I would like to ask the Minister what she thinks can be

bydd hi a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cymryd camau pendant i roi sylw i'r prinder deintyddion yn fy etholaeth i drwy sicrhau buddsoddiad priodol, a thrwy wella'r contractau deintyddol er mwyn sicrhau triniaeth i bobl dan y GIG. Mae pobl sir Benfro yn haeddu cymaint â hynny.

**Alun Davies:** Diolch ichi am ddod â'r mater hwn i sylw'r Cynulliad, ac am roi'r cyfle hwn imi siarad yn y ddadl. Cawsom ein hatgoffa ar ddechrau eich araith, Paul, sut y cawsom ein hunain yn y sefyllfa bresennol. Efallai y gallwn fynd â chi yn ôl ychydig ymhellach: i 1992, pan gaeodd y Llywodraeth Geidwadol ar y pryd ddwy ysgol ddeintyddol yng Nghymru, gan arwain at brinder deintyddion cymwysedig ym mhob rhan o'r Deyrnas Unedig. Un o'r pethau cyntaf a wnaeth y Llywodraeth Lafur pan ddaeth i rym yn 1997 oedd sicrhau bod modd cynnig mwy o hyfforddiant deintyddol, a gwelir tystiolaeth o hynny yng Nghaerdydd, lle mae 17 y cant yn fwy o ddeintyddion yn cael eu hyfforddi yn awr.

Bydd Paul hefyd yn gwybod bod BILlau yn gyfrifol am gomisiynu a darparu gwasanaethau deintyddol y GIG ledled Cymru, a bod £30 miliwn yn ychwanegol wedi'i ddarparu y llynedd i gefnogi deintyddiaeth ledled Cymru. Mae hynny, ynghyd â'r £122 miliwn sydd wedi ei wario gan y Llywodraeth hon bob blwyddyn ar ddeintyddiaeth, yn gynydd net o 89 y cant yn yr arian ar gyfer deintyddiaeth ers dyddiau tywyll llywodraeth Geidwadol.

Yr wyf yn cydnabod rhai o'r problemau a godwyd gennych, Paul, ond peidiwch da chi â dweud wrthym fod angen inni fynd yn ôl i'r gorffennol. Mae arnom angen buddsoddi parhaus, mwy fyth.

**Jenny Randerson:** Diolch, Paul, am adael imi gyfrannu at y ddadl. Yn 2006, anfonais arolwg at bob deintydd cofrestredig yng Nghymru a chefais ymateb rhyfeddol o dda. Yr oeddent yn rhagweld na fyddai'r contract newydd yn datrys y problemau, a dywedodd nifer ohonynt y byddai pethau'n gwaethygu, fel yn wir sydd wedi digwydd mewn rhai ardaloedd. Dywedent yn benodol mai'r broblem gyda'r contract newydd oedd diffyg pwyslais ar atal. Hoffwn ofyn i'r Gweinidog

done within the terms of the new contract to deal with the key issue of prevention. I have produced an action plan that emphasised the importance of mobile dentists and salaried posts in rural areas like Pembrokeshire, and I would be interested in hearing in the Minister's response whether she is considering those issues.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Edwina Hart):** I am pleased that this short debate has been brought forward today, and I appreciate the thoughtful contribution that the Member who proposed the subject made in talking about the issues in his constituency that have been brought to his attention not only by taxpayers, but by the profession itself.

It is important, in terms of the profession, to remember that the majority of dentists are independent, self-employed practitioners who are at liberty to choose whether they contract a proportion of their time to providing NHS treatment on behalf of local health boards. As a consequence, they may provide only NHS care, work totally outside the NHS, or, as is commonly the case, provide a mixture of NHS and private dental care. We have no powers of compulsion in this matter and, therefore, we need to make NHS dentistry an attractive option and provide resources to enable LHBs to invest in new services where they are needed.

I am pleased to say that vocational training places in Wales increased from 55 to 65 in 2006-07, and 34 of the 52 vocational trainees who completed their training in August 2006 stayed in Wales. We have to aim to get the 52 to stay in Wales and attract them to areas where we have difficulties in getting dentistry provision. The Assembly Government has provided an additional £30 million to support the introduction of the new dental contract, and that represents an increase in the net spend on NHS dentistry of 68 per cent since 2003-04. However, percentages relating to the spend that we are prepared to put in mean nothing to you as an individual if you cannot get a dentist.

beth yn ei thyb hi y gellir ei wneud o fewn telerau'r contract newyddi fynd i'r afael â mater allweddol atal. Yr wyf wedi llunio cynllun gweithredu a oedd yn pwysleisio pwysigrwydd deintyddion symudol a swyddi cyflogedig mewn ardaloedd gwledig fel sir Benfro, a hoffwn glywed y Gweinidog yn dweud yn ei hymateb a yw'n ystyried y materion hynny.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Edwina Hart):** Yr wyf yn falch fod y ddadl fer hon wedi ei chyflwyno heddiw, a gwerthfawrogaf y cyfraniad ystyriol gan yr Aelod a gynigiodd y pwnc wrth siarad am y materion a ddygwyd i'w sylw yn ei etholaeth ef, nid yn unig gan drethdalwyr, ond gan y proffesiwn ei hun.

Mae'n bwysig cofio, o ran y proffesiwn, fod y rhan fwyaf o ddeintyddion yn ymarferwyr annibynnol, hunangyflogedig sy'n rhydd i ddewis a ydynt am gcontractio cyfran o'u hamser i ddarparu triniaeth dan y GIG ar ran byrddau iechyd lleol. O ganlyniad, gallant fod yn darparu gofal GIG yn unig, yn gwneud eu holl waith y tu allan i'r GIG, neu fel sy'n digwydd yn aml, yn darparu cyfuniad o ofal deintyddol GIG a phreifat. Nid oes gennym hawl i orfodi neb yn y mater hwn ac, felly, mae angen inni wneud deintyddiaeth y GIG yn ddewis deniadol a darparu adnoddau er mwyn galluogi BILlau i fuddsoddi mewn gwasanaethau newydd lle mae eu hangen.

Yr wyf yn falch dweud bod nifer y lleoedd ar gyfer hyfforddiant galwedigaethol yng Nghymru wedi cynyddu o 55 i 65 yn 2006-07, ac mae 34 o'r 52 a gwblhaodd eu hyfforddiant galwedigaethol yn Awst 2006 wedi aros yng Nghymru. Rhaid inni anelu at gael y 52 i aros yng Nghymru a'u denu i ardaloedd lle'r ydym yn cael trafferthion wrth sicrhau darpariaeth ddeintyddol. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi darparu £30 miliwn yn ychwanegol i gefnogi cyflwyno'r contract deintyddol newydd, ac mae hynny'n gynydd o 68 y cant yn y gwariant net ar ddeintyddiaeth GIG er 2003-04. Fodd bynnag, nid yw canrannau'n ymwneud â'r gwariant yr ydym yn barod i'w wneud yn golygu dim i chi fel unigolyn os na allwch gael deintydd.



On top of its increased general dental allocation, Pembrokeshire Local Health Board has received additional recurrent funding of almost £1 million to address some of the access issues. The LHB has tried quite hard to improve the provision of NHS dentistry in the area, but it did return funding to the Assembly Government in 2006-07, as you quite rightly said, as it had not been able to commission new services. I understand that it had difficulties regarding planning issues. Historically, there have been difficulties in attracting NHS dentists and other service providers to rural areas, and that has certainly been the case in Pembrokeshire: the county has one of the lowest numbers of dentists per head of the population in Wales. The rural health panel that has been set up to look at the development of rural health services will wish to consider the provision of NHS dentistry in that area. I will certainly feed into that process the points that were made to me in your speech.

These, along with other planning problems, have delayed the opening of the two new dental practices in the county until November. However, the practices in Milford Haven and Haverfordwest are now providing NHS dental care to some 14,000 new patients. Service expansion in Pembrokeshire has also seen much needed domiciliary services for up to 1,400 patients and an out-of-hours service for weekends and bank holidays located in the trust's premises. Working jointly with Carmarthenshire Local Health Board, Pembrokeshire also commissioned capacity at the new practice in Whitland, with new services for 6,000 Pembrokeshire patients. The expansion of services and the opening of new practices has prompted people to realise that the NHS is there, as its services become more widely available; more people are expressing an interest in registering with the NHS as a result of publicising the fact that we have opened new dental practices, and that is to be welcomed. However, more has to be done in the area until we reach the position that is now enjoyed in quite a number of areas of Wales, especially urban areas, where there is widespread dentistry provision. We must have equality of treatment across Wales in

Yn ychwanegol at y cynnydd yn ei ddyraniad deintyddol cyffredinol, mae Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Sir Benfro wedi cael bron i £1 filiwn o gyllid rheolaidd ychwanegol i fynd i'r afael â rhai o'r problemau mynediad. Mae'r BILL wedi ymdrechu'n bur galed i wella darpariaeth ddeintyddiaeth y GIG yn yr ardal, ond dychwelodd arian i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn 2006-07, fel y dywedasoch, gan nad oedd wedi gallu comisiynu gwasanaethau newydd. Deallaf ei fod wedi cael anawsterau'n ymwneud â materion cynllunio. Yn hanesyddol, mae denu deintyddion GIG a darparwyr gwasanaethau eraill i ardaloedd gwledig wedi bod yn dasg anodd, ac mae hynny'n sicr wedi bod yn wir yn sir Benfro: mae'n un o'r siroedd sydd â'r nifer isaf yng Nghymru o ddeintyddion yn ôl y pen yn y boblogaeth. Bydd y panel iechyd gwledig a sefydlwyd er mwyn edrych ar ddatblygu gwasanaethau iechyd mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn awyddus i ystyried y ddarpariaeth deintyddion GIG yn yr ardal honno. Byddaf yn sicr yn ychwanegu at y broses honno y pwyntiau a gyflwynwyd imi yn eich araith.

Mae'r problemau hyn, ynghyd â phroblemau cynllunio eraill, wedi golygu na fydd y ddau bractis deintyddol newydd yn y sir yn agor tan fis Tachwedd. Fodd bynnag, mae'r practisau yn Aberdaugleddau a Hwlffordd bellach yn darparu gofal deintyddol GIG i ryw 14,000 o gleifion newydd. Mae ehangu'r gwasanaeth yn sir Benfro hefyd wedi arwain at wasanaethau cartref mawr eu hangen i hyd at 1,400 o gleifion, a gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau yn adeilad yr ymddiriedolaeth ar gyfer penwythnosau a gwyliau'r banc. Drwy weithio ar y cyd â Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Sir Gaerfyrddin, mae sir Benfro hefyd wedi comisiynu lleoedd yn y practis newydd yn Hendy-gwyn, gyda gwasanaethau newydd ar gyfer 6,000 o gleifion sir Benfro. Mae ehangu gwasanaethau ac agor practisau newydd hefyd wedi gwneud i bobl sylweddoli bod y GIG yno, wrth iddynt weld ei wasanaethau ar gael yn fwy eang; mae mwy o bobl yn mynegi diddordeb mewn cofrestru gyda'r GIG o ganlyniad i'r cyhoeddusrwydd i'r ffaith ein bod wedi agor practisau deintyddol newydd, ac mae hynny i'w groesawu. Fodd bynnag, rhaid gwneud mae mwy yn yr ardal nes inni gyrraedd yr un sefyllfa â nifer o ardaloedd yng Nghymru, yn enwedig ardaloedd trefol, lle mae darpariaeth

terms of provision.

I, like you, have listened to the concerns expressed by the dental profession, local health boards and patients about some aspects of the new contract, and, as a result, I have put in place the review. I assure Jenny that one issue that the task and finish group will be looking at is prevention because, as we all say, prevention is better than cure. We have to get to children and ensure that people have proper dental hygiene and so on. That group will report to me later in the year. In fact, I will ask the chair to contact you, Paul, to see if there are any points that Pembrokeshire dentists or orthodontists might want to put to him as he takes the review forward.

I am aware that there is more to be done, particularly in areas such as Pembrokeshire, but I am committed to providing an NHS dental service to tackle oral health inequalities and meet the needs of all patients in Wales, wherever they live. I will continue to put the necessary pressure on the LHBs to ensure that they fulfil their obligations. I must also say to Jenny that the points that she made are also part of my thinking. Thank you very much for the opportunity to discuss this issue this afternoon.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings today's proceedings to a close.

ddeintyddol eang. Rhaid inni gael darpariaeth ddeintyddol gyfartal ledled Cymru.

Yr wyf fi, fel chithau, wedi gwrandao ar y pryderon a fynegwyd gan y proffesiwn deintyddol, byrddau iechyd lleol a chleifion am rai agweddau ar y contract newydd, ac o ganlyniad yr wyf wedi rhoi'r adolygiad ar waith. Gallaf sicrhau Jenny mai un o'r materion y bydd y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen yn edrych arno yw atal, oherwydd, fel y mae pawb yn ei ddweud, gwell atal clwy na'i wella. Rhaid inni fynd at blant a sicrhau bod pobl yn gofalu am lendid eu dannedd yn iawn, ac yn y blaen. Bydd y grŵp hwnnw'n cyflwyno adroddiad i mi yn ddiweddarach yn y flwyddyn. Yn wir, byddaf yn gofyn i'r cadeirydd gysylltu â chi, Paul, i weld a oes unrhyw bwyntiau y byddai deintyddion neu orthodontyddion yn sir Benfro yn hoffi eu cyflwyno iddo yn ystod yr adolygiad.

Yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod mwy o waith i'w wneud, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd fel sir Benfro, ond yr wyf wedi ymrwymo i ddarparu gwasanaeth deintyddol GIG i fynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau iechyd y geg ac i ddiwallu anghenion pob claf yng Nghymru, ble bynnag y mae'n byw. Byddaf yn dal i bwysu yn ôl y galw ar y BILlau i sicrhau eu bod yn cyflawni eu dyletswyddau. Rhaid imi hefyd ddweud wrth Jenny fy mod yn cytuno â'r pwyntiau a godwyd ganddi. Diolch yn fawr iawn ichi am y cyfle i drafod y mater hwn y prynhawn yma.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Dyna ddiwedd ein trafodion am heddiw.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 6.00 p.m.*

*The meeting ended at 6.00 p.m.*

#### **Aelodau a'u Pleidiau Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
Asghar, Mohammad (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Burns, Angela (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)

Davies, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew R.T. (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Paul (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Evans, Nerys (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Franks, Chris (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, Lesley (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jenkins, Bethan (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Gareth (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Millar, Darren (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
 Ramsay, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Watson, Joyce (Llafur – Labour)  
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)