



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
The National Assembly for Wales**

**Cofnod y Trafodion  
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mercher, 2 Gorffennaf 2008  
Wednesday, 2 July 2008**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- |     |   |
|-----|---|
| 3   | Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynaliadwyedd a Thai<br>Questions to Minister for Environment, Sustainability and Housing                              |
| 22  | Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth<br>Questions to Minister for Heritage   |
| 39  | Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol<br>Questions to Minister for Social Justice and Local Government                           |
| 57  | Cwestiynau i Gomisiwn y Cynulliad<br>Questions to the Assembly Commission   |
| 59  | Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu ar Drefniadau Ariannu Ysgolion yng Nghymru<br>The Enterprise and Learning Committee's Report on Arrangements for School Funding |
| 83  | Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig: Addysg Cyfrwng Cymraeg<br>Welsh Conservatives Debate: Welsh-medium Education   |
| 106 | Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig: Yr Argyfwng Tai<br>Welsh Conservatives Debate: The Housing Crisis  |
| 127 | Cyfnod Pleidleisio<br>Voting Time   |
| 135 | Dadl Fer: 60 Mlynedd ers Sefydlu'r GIG: Treftadaeth Falch a Dyfodol Disglair<br>Short Debate: The NHS 60 Years on: a Proud Heritage and a Bright Future             |

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 12.30 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 12.30 p.m. with the Presiding Officer (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) in the Chair.*

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf y Cynulliad i drefn.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call the Assembly to order.

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynaliadwyedd a Thai Questions to Minister for Environment, Sustainability and Housing**

### **Tai Cymdeithasol**

**C1 Gareth Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddyrannu tai cymdeithasol ar gyfer pobl leol? OAQ(3)0463(ESH)

**The Deputy Minister for Housing (Jocelyn Davies):** Local authorities and housing associations are responsible for setting their own allocations policies. Our guidance expects them to work in partnership to meet the housing needs of people in their areas. They should take account of the sustainability of tenancies and communities as well as responding to need.

**Gareth Jones:** Mae llawer o etholwyr yn Aberconwy ac ar draws y gogledd yn teimlo y dylid rhoi mwy o flaenoriaeth i drigolion lleol o ran ceisiadau am dai cymdeithasol addas. Mae methiant yn hyn o beth yn creu tyndra mewn llawer o gymunedau. Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un ei wneud i sicrhau bod trigolion presennol cymunedau'r gogledd yn cael blaenoriaeth haeddiannol wrth iddynt geisio am dai cymdeithasol?

**Jocelyn Davies:** I am afraid that my translation equipment failed for the supplementary question, so I will do my best to answer, but I will read the Record tomorrow and give you a fuller answer. I know that you have raised with me, on a number of occasions, the issue of housing local people and the importance of a local connection. I have mentioned research to you in the past, and we are now able to undertake that. I have instructed officials to commission research into the impact of housing legislation on the re-housing of local people that includes the six-month local connection rule that you have raised with me so many times. It will be a complex piece of work, and

### **Social Housing**

**Q1 Gareth Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on the allocation of social housing for local people? OAQ(3)0463(ESH)

**Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Dai (Jocelyn Davies):** Awdurdodau lleol a chymdeithasau tai sy'n gyfrifol am bennu eu polisiau dyrannu eu hunain. Mae ein canllaw yn disgwyl iddynt weithio mewn partneriaeth er mwyn diwallu anghenion tai'r bobl yn eu hardaloedd. Dylent ystyried cynaliadwyedd tenantiaeth a chymunedau yn ogystal ag ymateb i'r angen.

**Gareth Jones:** Many constituents in Aberconwy and across north Wales feel that greater priority should be given to local residents in terms of applications for appropriate social housing. Failures in this sphere are creating tensions in many communities. What is the One Wales Government doing to ensure that the current residents of communities in north Wales receive due priority when they apply for social housing?

**Jocelyn Davies:** Yn anffodus nid oedd fy offer cyfieithu'n gweithio ar gyfer y cwestiwn atodol, felly gwnaf fy ngorau i ateb, ond byddaf yn darllen y Cofnod yfory ac yn rhoi ateb llawn ichi. Gwn eich bod wedi codi'r mater o dai i bobl leol a phwysigrwydd cysylltiad lleol gyda mi droeon. Yr wyf wedi crybwyll gwaith ymchwil ichi yn y gorffennol, ac yr ydym bellach yn gallu cyflawni hwnnw. Yr wyf wedi dweud wrth swyddogion am gomisiynu gwaith ymchwil i effaith deddfwriaeth dai ar ail gartrefu pobl leol sy'n cynnwys y rheol cysylltiad lleol chwe mis yr ydych wedi'i chodi gyda mi gymaint o weithiau. Bydd yn waith cymhleth, a gobeithiaf y bydd wedi'i

I hope that it will be completed early in 2009. We will then look at the issue of legislation within the context of that work and the development of the national housing strategy. I will read the Record tomorrow and if I have not answered your question in full, I will write to you.

**Mark Isherwood:** You will be aware that Shelter Cymru has made a number of proposals on tackling homelessness. Shelter is conscious, as are so many other organisations, of the growing friction in communities when priority housing needs allocations take priority over local people at a time when there is a shortage of affordable housing. How do you respond to Shelter's proposal that, in addition to increasing the supply of affordable housing, homelessness assistance to people outside the priority needs groups needs to be considered when the supply is closer to the need? The Scottish Executive has set a timetable to abolish priority need and to make a link to the availability of affordable housing.

**Jocelyn Davies:** I meet regularly with Shelter, of course, and I am aware of the case that it has made. It is playing a major part in the development of the national housing strategy and the homelessness strategy. I have told Shelter that, at present, we are not considering new legislation, but we would not rule it out in future if, during the development of the housing strategy and the homelessness strategy, we found that it was necessary.

### Improving Energy Efficiency

**Q2 Paul Davies:** Will the Minister make a statement on what the Welsh Assembly Government is doing to improve energy efficiency? OAQ(3)0448(ESH)

**Q6 Alun Cairns:** Will the Minister make a statement on Welsh Assembly Government plans to improve energy efficiency across Wales? OAQ(3)0429(ESH)

**The Minister for Environment, Sustainability and Housing (Jane**

gwblhau erbyn dechrau 2009. Yna byddwn yn ystyried y ddeddfwriaeth o fewn cydestun y gwaith hwnnw a'r broses o ddatblygu'r strategaeth dai genedlaethol. Byddaf yn darllen y Cofnod yfory ac os nad wyf wedi ateb eich cwestiwn yn llawn, byddaf yn ysgrifennu atoch.

**Mark Isherwood:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod Shelter Cymru wedi gwneud nifer o gynigion i fynd i'r afael â digartrefedd. Mae Shelter yn ymwybodol, fel llawer o sefydliadau eraill, o'r gwrthdaro cynyddol mewn cymunedau lle y mae dyraniadau anghenion tai blaenoriaethol yn cael blaenoriaeth dros bobl leol mewn cyfnod pan fydd prinder o dai fforddiadwy. Sut yr ydych yn ymateb i gynnig Shelter sef, yn ogystal â chynyddu'r cyflenwad o dai fforddiadwy, bod angen ystyried rhoi cymorth digartrefedd i bobl nad ydynt yn perthyn i'r grwpiau angen blaenoriaethol pan fydd y cyflenwad yn nes at yr angen? Mae Gweithrediaeth yr Alban wedi pennu amserlen ar gyfer diddymu'r angen blaenoriaethol a gwneud cysylltiad â nifer y tai fforddiadwy sydd ar gael.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Yr wyf yn cyfarfod yn rheolaidd â Shelter, wrth gwrs, ac yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r achos y mae wedi'i wneud. Mae'n chwarae rhan bwysig yn y broses o ddatblygu'r strategaeth dai genedlaethol a'r strategaeth ar ddigartrefedd. Yr wyf wedi dweud wrth Shelter nad ydym, ar hyn o bryd, yn ystyried y ddeddfwriaeth newydd, ond na fyddem yn ei diystyru yn y dyfodol pe byddem, wrth inni ddatblygu'r strategaeth dai a'r strategaeth ar ddigartrefedd, yn canfod bod hynny'n angenrheidiol.

### Gwella Effeithlonrwydd Ynni

**C2 Paul Davies:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am yr hyn y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n ei wneud i wella effeithlonrwydd ynni? OAQ(3)0448(ESH)

**C6 Alun Cairns:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gynlluniau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wella effeithlonrwydd ynni ledled Cymru? OAQ(3)0429(ESH)

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynaliadwyedd a Thai (Jane Davidson):**

**Davidson):** We will be considering ways to improve energy efficiency as part of our work on the national energy efficiency and savings plan, which will be ready for consultation by the end of this year. Existing programmes include our support to the Carbon Trust and the home energy efficiency scheme.

**Paul Davies:** Leaving electrical products on standby greatly contributes to our carbon footprint, and leaving lights, such as street lights, on unnecessarily not only contributes to our carbon footprint but also increases light pollution. Several constituents have contacted me with concerns that, in some new business parks, lights are unnecessarily left on all night. Will the Minister confirm the steps that the Assembly Government is taking to reduce light pollution, and therefore, at the same time, to improve energy efficiency?

**Jane Davidson:** The point that you raise is extremely important. We should be encouraging every individual, business and organisation to look at reducing their use of electricity as much as possible. I have asked officials to have a look at the Assembly Government's buildings and workplaces to ensure that we take that forward, and I will be able to report to the Assembly in due course on how that is developing.

**Alun Cairns:** The home energy efficiency scheme has received widespread support from all parties in the Chamber and has contributed significantly to energy efficiency in many of the households that qualify. What priority are you giving this policy in view of the fact that the cost of kerosene heating oil, for example, has gone up from 33p a litre 12 months ago to 63p a litre at present? Not even I would blame the increase in heating oil on the Assembly Government, but it could use policies to mitigate the effects of such an increase. Although gas and electricity prices have gone up, they have not gone up as much as heating oil has over the last four years—it has increased by several hundred per cent. What consideration have you given to these factors for people living in rural areas? As HEES has not increased in line with inflation, is it not the case that there has been a real-

Byddwn yn ystyried ffyrdd o wella effeithlonrwydd ynni fel rhan o'n gwaith ar y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ac arbed ynni cenedlaethol, a fydd yn barod i fynd allan i ymgynghori arno erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn. Mae'r rhaglenni presennol yn cynnwys ein cymorth i'r Ymddiriedolaeth Garbon a'r cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref.

**Paul Davies:** Mae gadael offer trydanol yn y modd segur yn cyfrannu llawer at ein hôl-troed carbon, ac mae gadael goleuadau, megis goleuadau stryd, ymlaen yn ddiangen nid yn unig yn cyfrannu at ein hôl-troed carbon ond hefyd yn cynyddu llygredd golau. Mae nifer o'm hetholwyr wedi cysylltu â mi yn mynegi eu pryderon bod goleuadau, mewn rhai parciau busnes newydd, yn cael eu gadael ymlaen yn ddiangen drwy'r nos. A wnaiff y Gweinidog gadarnhau'r camau y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn eu cymryd i leihau llygredd golau, ac felly, ar yr un pryd, i wella effeithlonrwydd ynni?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'r pwynt yr ydych yn ei godi'n bwysig iawn. Dylem fod yn annog pob unigolyn, busnes a sefydliad i geisio lleihau faint o drydan y maent yn ei ddefnyddio gymaint ag y bo modd. Yr wyf wedi gofyn i swyddogion edrych ar adeiladau a gweithleoedd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn gweithredu ar hynny, a byddaf yn gallu adrodd i'r Cynulliad sut y mae hynny'n datblygu maes o law.

**Alun Cairns:** Mae'r cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref wedi cael cefnogaeth eang gan bob plaid yn y Siambr ac wedi cyfrannu'n sylweddol at effeithlonrwydd ynni yn llawer o'r cartrefi sy'n gymwys. Pa flaenoriaeth yr ydych yn ei rhoi i'r polisi hwn yng ngoleuni'r ffaith bod cost olew cynhesu kerosene, er enghraifft, wedi cynyddu o 33c y litr 12 mis yn ôl i 63c y litr ar hyn o bryd? Ni fyddwn i hyd yn oed yn beio Llywodraeth y Cynulliad am y cynnydd mewn olew cynhesu, ond gallai ddefnyddio polisiau i liniaru effeithiau cynnydd o'r fath. Er bod prisiau nwy a thrydan wedi cynyddu, nid ydynt wedi cynyddu gymaint â phrisiau olew cynhesu dros y pedair blynedd diwethaf—mae wedi gwneud cynnydd o gannoedd ar gannoedd y cant. Pa ystyriaethau yr ydych wedi'u rhoi i'r ffactorau hyn ar gyfer pobl sy'n byw mewn ardaloedd gwledig? Gan nad yw'r cynllun

terms cut in the home energy efficiency scheme?

**Jane Davidson:** It is critically important that the Assembly Government does what it can to support people in fuel poverty in Wales. In fact, the review of HEES demonstrated that, in its current form, the scheme does not sufficiently benefit the fuel poor. Regulations to change HEES will therefore form part of our consultation on the national energy efficiency and savings plan, which will come forward in the autumn.

One important new contribution is the additional £1 million from the UK Government. That will be matched, or more than matched, by my department, in terms of looking at renewable energy provision for fuel-poor households. That will be particularly focused on hard-to-heat homes, and will amount to extra investment of over £2 million.

#### **Deddf Tyddynnod a Rhandroedd 1908**

**C3 David Lloyd:** Pa ystyriaeth y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i rhoi i ddefnyddio Deddf Tyddynnod a Rhandroedd 1908 i wella'r amgylchedd lleol? OAQ(3)0424(ESH)

**Jane Davidson:** Gallai rhandroedd wneud cyfraniad mawr at wella'r amgylchedd lleol. Gallant hefyd helpu i wella bioamrywiaeth drefol, a chael pobl i wneud mwy o ymarfer corff ac i fyw'n iachach, yn ogystal â darparu bwyd ffres. Yr wyf yn edrych ar sut y gall y rhaglen Trefi Taclus, a amlinellir yn y ddogfen 'Cymru'n Un', helpu i ddatblygu hyn.

**David Lloyd:** One of the provisions under this 1908 Act encourages local residents to request the development of allotments in empty, unused green areas. With allotments under threat everywhere—and there is a campaign under way in Gowerton to save local allotments—does the Minister see this 1908 Act as one way of encouraging the development of allotments instead of losing

effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref wedi cynyddu yn unol â chwyddiant, onid oes toriad termau real wedi'i wneud i'r cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'n hollbwysig bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwneud popeth o fewn ei gallu i helpu pobl sydd mewn tlodi tanwydd yng Nghymru. Yn wir, dangosodd yr adolygiad o'r cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref nad yw'r cynllun, yn ei ffurf bresennol, yn ddigon manteisiol i gartrefi tlawd o ran tanwydd. Bydd rheoliadau i newid y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref felly'n ffurfio rhan o'n ymgynghoriad ar y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ac arbed ynni cenedlaethol, a gyflwynir yn yr hydref.

Un cyfraniad pwysig newydd yw'r £1 miliwn ychwanegol gan Lywodraeth y DU. Bydd fy adran yn darparu arian cyfatebol, neu swm sy'n fwy nag arian cyfatebol, ar gyfer hynny o ran chwilio am ddarpariaeth ynni adnewyddadwy i gartrefi tlawd o ran tanwydd. Bydd hynny'n canolbwyntio'n arbennig ar gartrefi anodd eu gwresogi, a bydd yn arwain at fuddsoddiad ychwanegol o dros £2 miliwn.

#### **Small Holdings and Allotments Act 1908**

**Q3 David Lloyd:** What consideration has the Minister given to utilising the Small Holdings and Allotments Act 1908 to improve the local environment? OAQ(3)0424(ESH)

**Jane Davidson:** Allotments have great potential to contribute to the local environment. They can also help improve urban biodiversity and promote exercise and healthy living as well as provide fresh food. I am looking at how the Tidy Towns programme set out in the 'One Wales' document can help take this forward.

**David Lloyd:** Mae un o'r darpariaethau o dan y Ddeddf 1908 hon yn annog trigolion lleol wneud cais am ddatblygu rhandroedd mewn ardaloedd gwyrdd gwag, nad ydynt yn cael eu defnyddio. Gan fod rhandroedd o dan fygythiad ym mhob man—ac mae ymgyrch ar y gweill yn Nhre-gwyr i achub rhandroedd lleol—a yw'r Gweinidog yn gweld y Ddeddf 1908 hon fel un ffordd o

them?

annog datblygu rhandiroedd yn hytrach na'u colli?

12.40 p.m.

**Jane Davidson:** Statutory allotments are not under threat, and section 23 of the 1908 Act refers to statutory allotments. As an Assembly Government, we have made it very clear that we support allotments and we would like to see more of them I would encourage residents who want to make written representations on the basis of a demand by six registered parliamentary electors or council tax payers that such representations must be taken into account by the appropriate council. I hope that people will use this legislation to increase the number of allotments.

**Jane Davidson:** Nid yw rhandiroedd statudol o dan fygythiad, ac mae adran 23 Deddf 1908 yn cyfeirio at randiroedd statudol. Fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yr ydym wedi nodi'n glir iawn ein bod yn cefnogi rhandiroedd ac yr hoffem weld mwy ohonynt. Byddwn yn annog trigolion sydd am ysgrifennu sylwadau ar sail galw gan chwe etholwr seneddol cofrestredig neu dalwyr y dreth gyngor ei bod yn rhaid i'r cyngor priodol ystyried sylwadau o'r fath. Gobeithiaf y bydd pobl yn defnyddio'r ddeddfwriaeth hon i gynyddu nifer y rhandiroedd.

**Brynle Williams:** Using an allotment is a great opportunity for city and town dwellers to connect with how their food is grown. It is an activity that is growing in popularity, thanks in no small part to inflation putting a squeeze on family budgets. As you may be aware, Minister, getting a plot is not straightforward, and many have long been on the waiting list for an allotment, and this is not helped by absentee plot holders. What are your plans to encourage councils to obtain agreements with farmers on urban fringes to make more land available for new allotments as well as to free up unused plots on existing allotments?

**Brynle Williams:** Mae defnyddio rhandir yn gyfle ardderchog i bobl y dinasoedd a'r trefi ymgysylltu â sut y caiff eu bwyd ei dyfu. Mae'n weithgaredd sy'n tyfu o ran poblogrwydd, diolch yn bennaf gan fod chwyddiant yn achosi gwasgfa ar gyllidebau teuluoedd. Fel y byddwch yn ymwybodol yr wyf yn siŵr, Weinidog, nid yw cael plot yn broses syml, ac mae llawer o bobl wedi bod ar restr aros ar gyfer rhandir ers amser maith, ac nid yw perchnogion rhandiroedd absennol yn helpu'r sefyllfa. Beth yw eich cynlluniau i annog cynghorau i ddod i gytundebau â ffermwyr ar gyrion ardaloedd trefol i sicrhau bod mwy o dir ar gael ar gyfer rhandiroedd newydd yn ogystal â rhyddhau plotiau nad ydynt yn cael eu defnyddio ar randiroedd presennol?

**Jane Davidson:** I would hope that that would happen. The use of land as an allotment falls under the definition of 'agriculture', as you know and, therefore, does not require planning permission. The erection of sheds or other types of building on that land may require planning permission, but the allotments themselves do not. I would strongly urge partnership between local landowners and local authorities in the provision of allotments.

**Jane Davidson:** Yr oeddwn wedi gobeithio y byddai hynny'n digwydd. Mae defnyddio tir fel rhandir yn dod o dan ddiffiniad 'amaethyddiaeth', fel y gwyddoch ac, felly, nid oes angen caniatâd cynllunio ar gyfer hyn. Mae'n bosibl ei bod yn ofynnol cael caniatâd cynllunio ar gyfer codi siediau neu fathau eraill o adeiladau ar y tir hwnnw, ond nid oes angen hyn ar gyfer y rhandiroedd eu hunain. Byddwn yn pwysu'n gryf ar ffurfio partneriaeth rhwng perchnogion tiroedd ac awdurdodau lleol ar gyfer y broses o ddyrannu rhandiroedd.

**Rosemary Butler:** Rhiwderin allotments, in my constituency, are owned by a private

**Rosemary Butler:** Mae rhandiroedd Rhiwderin, yn fy etholaeth, yn berchen i

landlord and are leased to the community council. The landlord has notified the community council of its intention to develop the land, and it will therefore not be renewing the lease when it expires. The community council has chosen not to pursue the issue, and the allotment holders and local residents are, naturally, disappointed and somewhat aggrieved by this decision. You referred to the 1908 Act, but I will refer to your recent statement in which you said that where land on which allotments are situated is owned privately, and the landowner ceases to use it for that purpose, the local community may object. You said that mechanisms under the 1908 Act are available to allotment holders and that they need to pursue those provisions to try to right the situation. You suggested that communities interested in securing alternative or additional allotments should investigate and utilise that legislation. Would it be possible for your officials to meet representatives of the Rhiwderin allotment holders to discuss options that may be available to them?

**Jane Davidson:** In a situation where a landowner has indicated an intention to bring to an end the use of that land for the purposes of allotments, the Small Holdings and Allotments Act 1908 and the Allotments Acts of 1922 to 1950 could provide a solution for displaced allotment holders in terms of calling on the appropriate authority. I was particularly interested to discover recently that, in circumstances where a community council wishes to acquire compulsorily, and the local authority refuses to make an order for it, we have the power to make a compulsory purchase order in place of the local authority. I would therefore also encourage community councils to use this legislation.

In view of the interest in this matter, my department should look at providing opportunities for good guidance to be delivered to allotment holders, and particularly those who hold allotments on privately owned land, so that they can understand what pressure can be brought to bear on public authorities to deliver the appropriate allotments for the future. I am

landlord preifat ac yn cael eu prydlesu i'r cyngor cymuned. Mae'r landlord wedi rhoi gwybod i'r cyngor cymunedol ei fod yn bwriadu datblygu'r tir, ac felly na fydd yn adnewyddu'r brydles pan fydd yn dod i ben. Mae'r cyngor cymuned wedi dewis peidio â bwrw ymlaen â'r mater, ac mae deiliaid y rhandiroedd a'r trigolion lleol yn siomedig, yn naturiol ac yn ddig i raddau o ganlyniad i'r penderfyniad hwn. Cyfeiriasoch at Ddeddf 1908, ond cyfeiriaf at eich datganiad diweddar lle dywedasoch pan fydd rhandiroedd ar dir preifat a bod perchennog y tir yn rhoi'r gorau i'w ddefnyddio i'r diben hwnnw, y gall y gymuned leol wrthwynebu. Dywedasoch fod y dulliau o dan Ddeddf 1908 ar gael i ddeiliaid rhandiroedd a bod angen iddynt fynd ar drywydd y darpariaethau hynny er mwyn ceisio unioni'r sefyllfa. Awgrymasoch y dylai cymunedau a chanddynt ddiddordeb mewn diogelu rhandiroedd eraill neu rai ychwanegol ymchwilio i'r ddeddfwriaeth honno a'i defnyddio. A fyddai'n bosibl i'ch swyddogion gyfarfod â chynrychiolwyr deiliaid rhandir Rhiwderin i drafod yr opsiynau a allai fod ar gael iddynt?

**Jane Davidson:** Mewn sefyllfa lle mae perchennog tir wedi nodi ei fod yn bwriadu rhoi'r gorau i ddefnyddio'r tir hwnnw ar gyfer rhandiroedd, gallai Deddf Tyddynnod a Rhandiroedd 1908 a Deddfau Rhandiroedd 1922 i 1950 roi ateb i ddeiliaid rhandiroedd sydd wedi'u dadleoli o ran galw ar yr awdurdod priodol. Yr oedd gennyf ddiddordeb arbennig pan ganfyddais yn ddiweddar, mewn amgylchiadau lle mae cyngor cymuned am brynu tir yn orfodol, a bod yr awdurdod lleol yn gwrthod gwneud gorchymyn ar ei gyfer, bod gennym y pŵer i wneud gorchymyn prynu gorfodol yn lle'r awdurdod lleol. Felly byddwn hefyd yn annog cynghorau cymuned i ddefnyddio'r ddeddfwriaeth hon.

Wrth ystyried y mater hwn, dylai fy adran ystyried darparu cyfleoedd ar gyfer cyflwyno canllaw da i ddeiliaid rhandiroedd, ac yn enwedig y rheini sydd â rhandiroedd ar dir preifat, fel y gallant ddeall pa bwysau y gellir eu rhoi ar awdurdodau cyhoeddus i gyflwyno rhandiroedd addas ar gyfer y dyfodol. Yr wyf yn siŵr yr hoffai pob Aelod Cynulliad weld mwy o rhandiroedd statudol, a byddwn yn fwy



sure that every Assembly Member would like to see more statutory allotments, and I would be happy to work with you in advising your constituents.

na pharod i weithio gyda chi er mwyn cynghori eich etholwyr.

### Polisiau Cynllunio

**C4 Gareth Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am bolisiau cynllunio fel y maent yn berthnasol i anheddau anghenion lleol? OAQ(3)0464(ESH)

**Jane Davidson:** Mae 'Datganiad Polisi Cynllunio Interim y Gweinidog 01/2006' yn amlinellu polisiau cynllunio cenedlaethol ar dai, gan gynnwys y polisi ar ddarparu tai fforddiadwy i ddiwallu anghenion lleol. Disgwylir ymgynghori yn fuan ar y newidiadau arfaethedig i'r polisi i sicrhau bod cymaint â phosibl o dai fforddiadwy ar gael mewn ardaloedd gwledig, a hynny mewn cysylltiad â'r adolygiad cyfredol o nodyn cyngor technegol 6.

**Gareth Jones:** Os oes un agwedd ar bolisiau'r Cynulliad sy'n bygwth hyfywedd ein cymunedau, yn rhwystr i'w hadfywiad, ac yn rhwystr i ffyniant y Gymraeg, rheolau caeth polisiau cynllunio awdurdodau lleol—a oedd yn berthnasol yn y 1960au a'r 1970au—yw honno. Gwn am nifer o enghreifftiau o'r modd y mae'r fath bolisiau yn tanseilio dyheadau a chynlluniau teuluoedd ifanc, gan amlaf, i addasu neu adeiladu estyniad i'w anheddau oherwydd eu lleoliad gwledig. Pa sylw mae Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un yn ei roi i hyn gyda'r bwriad o newid y gyfundrefn?

**Jane Davidson:** Diolch yn fawr, Gareth. I am just about to consult on ideas for more affordable housing for local needs, which arises from work on TAN 6. That is concerned with helping rural businesses that need dwellings, with positive proposals to help the farming industry with succession and new tenants, proposing more sites for affordable housing, and looking at low-impact development. There is also a commitment in 'One Wales' to look at TAN 20 in the context of the Welsh language.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Nick Bourne):** I agree with the sentiments that have just been expressed. However, I want to

### Planning Policies

**Q4 Gareth Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on planning policies as they apply to local needs dwellings? OAQ(3)0464(ESH)

**Jane Davidson:** 'Ministerial Interim Planning Policy Statement 01/2006' sets out national planning policies on housing, including providing affordable housing to meet local needs. Proposed policy changes to optimise the delivery of affordable housing in rural areas, related to the current review of technical advice note 6, are due to be issued for consultation shortly.

**Gareth Jones:** If there is one aspect of Assembly policy that is a threat to the viability of our communities, is a barrier to their regeneration and to the success of the Welsh language, it is local authorities' strict planning policy regulations, which were relevant in the 1960s and 1970s. I know of several examples of such policies undermining the aspirations and plans of young families, usually, to adapt or extend their homes given their rural location. What is the position of the One Wales Government on this, with a view to changing the system?

**Jane Davidson:** Thank you, Gareth. Yr wyf ar fin ymgynghori ar syniadau ar gyfer mwy o dai fforddiadwy ar gyfer anghenion lleol, sy'n codi o waith ar TAN 6. Mae a wnelo hynny â helpu busnesau gwledig y mae angen anheddau arnynt, gyda chynigion cadarnhaol i gynorthwyo'r diwydiant ffermio o ran cael olyniaeth a thenantiaid newydd, cynnig mwy o safleoedd ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy, ac edrych ar ddatblygiadau isel eu heffaith. Ceir hefyd ymrwymiad yn 'Cymru'n Un' i edrych ar TAN 20 yng nghyd-destun yr iaith Gymraeg.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Nick Bourne):** Yr wyf yn cytuno â'r datganiadau sydd newydd eu mynegi. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn

ask the Minister specifically about the national parks. There is great concern, certainly in the Brecon Beacons National Park, in relation to housing for local needs. I know that the Minister is looking at the performance of the national park, and I appreciate that she cannot go too far in her answer to this, but could she could give a general indication of how things stand in relation to the planning process in the BBNP?

**Jane Davidson:** The national parks are not housing authorities; they are planning authorities, but they are required to work closely with housing authorities within an important set of requirements that are being delivered jointly in my portfolio and that of Jocelyn Davies. In the context of planning in national parks, you will be aware that we are to have a Wales Audit Office analysis of the planning functions of all three national parks in the autumn. I met with new and existing members of the Brecon Beacons National Park Authority last week, and I was pleased to see that they were absolutely determined to restore public confidence in the planning function of the Brecon Beacons National Park.

### Fairtrade Nation

**Q5 Lorraine Barrett:** Will the Minister give a progress report on the Fairtrade Nation campaign? OAQ(3)0462(ESH)

**Jane Davidson:** I was delighted to congratulate the Wales Fair Trade Forum on making Wales the world's first Fairtrade Nation at an international summit on fair trade in Newport on 6 June 2008. That follows a two-year campaign right across Wales and is an achievement that we can all be proud of.

**Lorraine Barrett:** We would not have achieved that status without the help of many small businesses, such as Foxy's Deli in Penarth, which was one of the first fair-trade coffee shops in the town. Will you join me in paying tribute to the many volunteers, such as those belonging to the Penarth Fair Trade Forum, of which Foxy's Deli is a part, who,

holi'r Gweinidog yn benodol am y parciau cenedlaethol. Ceir cryn bryder, yn sicr ym Mharc Cenedlaethol Bannau Brycheiniog, ynghylch tai ar gyfer anghenion lleol. Gwn fod y Gweinidog yn edrych ar berfformiad y parc cenedlaethol, ac yr wyf yn sylweddoli na all roi gormod o fanylion yn ei hateb i hyn, ond a allai roi syniad cyffredinol o sut y mae pethau ar hyn o bryd o ran y broses gynllunio ym Mharc Cenedlaethol Bannau Brycheiniog?

**Jane Davidson:** Nid awdurdodau tai yw'r parciau cenedlaethol; awdurdodau cynllunio ydynt. Er hynny, mae'n ofynnol eu bod yn gweithio'n glós gydag awdurdodau tai o fewn cyfres bwysig o ofynion sy'n cael eu cyflawni ar y cyd yn fy mhortffolio i ac ym mhortffolio Jocelyn Davies. Yng nghydestun cynllunio mewn parciau cenedlaethol, byddwch yn gwybod ein bod am gael dadansoddiad o swyddogaethau cynllunio'r tri pharc cenedlaethol gan Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru yn ystod yr hydref. Cyfarfûm ag aelodau newydd ac aelodau presennol Awdurdod Parc Cenedlaethol Bannau Brycheiniog yr wythnos diwethaf, ac yr oeddwn yn falch o weld eu bod yn gwbl benderfynol o adennill hyder y cyhoedd yn swyddogaeth gynllunio Parc Cenedlaethol Bannau Brycheiniog.

### Cenedl Masnach Deg

**C5 Lorraine Barrett:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi adroddiad cynnydd am yr ymgyrch Cenedl Masnach Deg? OAQ(3)0462(ESH)

**Jane Davidson:** Yr oedd yn bleser gennyf longyfarch Fforwm Masnach Deg Cymru ar wneud Cymru'n Genedl Masnach Deg gyntaf y byd mewn uwchgynhadledd ryngwladol ar fasnach deg yng Nghasnewydd ar 6 Mehefin 2008. Mae hynny'n dilyn ymgyrch dwy flynedd o hyd ledled Cymru, ac mae'n gamp y gall pob un ohonom ymfalchio ynddi.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Ni fyddem wedi ennill y statws hwnnw heb gymorth llawer o fusnesau bach, megis Foxy's Deli ym Mhenarth, a oedd yn un o siopau coffi masnach deg cyntaf y dref. A ymunwch â mi i roi teyrnged i'r gwirfoddolwyr lu, megis y rheini sy'n rhan o Fforwm Masnach Deg Penarth, y mae Foxy's yn rhan ohono, sydd, drwy weithio'n galed,

through hard work, have helped to make possible this remarkable achievement of being the world's first Fairtrade Nation?

**Jane Davidson:** I am more than happy to do so. It has been a phenomenal achievement by the people of Wales. As a Government, we have been able to assist by setting the framework against which becoming the world's first fair-trade country could be measured and agreed. It is down to the people of Wales, who have bought the fairly traded products and who need to carry on buying more if we are to take this forward. More than 400 schools have registered with the Fairtrade Foundation's Fairtrade Schools scheme in Wales, which is more than the number in any other part of the United Kingdom. I also congratulate you and the other Assembly Commissioners, because this is not just about the Assembly Government supporting the fair-trade campaign; it is also about the Assembly Commissioners supporting it, which I know you have done strongly.

12.50 p.m.

**Mark Isherwood:** Would you also join me in congratulating Together Creating Communities, the Wrexham-based campaigning charity whose initiative led to Wrexham's establishing the first fair-trade coalition and to that initiative extending across the region, ensuring that there were members of all political parties in the coalition, including me and other colleagues in the Chamber? Will you also congratulate it on the event that it held in Wrexham on 21 June to celebrate Wales becoming the world's first fair-trade country, with representatives from schools such as Ysgol Bryn Alyn and Darland High School present alongside the Wales Fair Trade Forum and the Wrexham Fairtrade Coalition?

**Jane Davidson:** I am fully aware that Lesley, the Assembly Member for Wrexham, has continually raised fair trade in that forum, because Wrexham has played such a critical part in the campaign. It is important that it be an all-party initiative, and I am delighted that

wedi helpu i wireddu'r llwyddiant eithriadol hwn, sef bod yn Genedl Masnach Deg gyntaf y byd?

**Jane Davidson:** Yr wyf yn fwy na balch o wneud hynny. Mae wedi bod yn gamp aruthrol gan bobl Cymru. Yr ydym, fel Llywodraeth, wedi gallu cynorthwyo drwy osod y fframwaith er mwyn gallu mesur cyrhaeddiad wrth geisio dod yn wlad masnach deg gyntaf y byd, a chytuno ar hynny. Pobl Cymru sydd wrth wraidd hyn. Dyma'r bobl sydd wedi prynu cynhyrchion masnach deg, a'r bobl y mae angen iddynt ddal ati i brynu mwy os ydym am fwrw ymlaen â hyn. Mae dros 400 o ysgolion wedi cofrestru gyda chynllun Ysgolion Masnach Deg y Sefydliad Masnach Deg yng Nghymru, sy'n uwch na'r nifer yn unrhyw ran arall o'r Deyrnas Unedig. Hefyd, hoffwn eich llongyfarch chi a Chomisiynwyr eraill y Cynulliad, oherwydd mae mwy i hyn na dim ond Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cefnogi'r ymgyrch masnach deg; mae hefyd yn ymwneud â Chomisiynwyr y Cynulliad yn cefnogi'r ymgyrch, a gwn ichi wneud hynny'n gadarn.

**Mark Isherwood:** A fydddech hefyd yn ymuno â mi i longyfarch Trefnu Cymunedol Cymru, yr elusen ymgyrchu o Wrecsam y mae eu menter wedi arwain at sefydlu yn Wrecsam y gynghrair masnach deg gyntaf, ac i'r fenter honno ymestyn dros y rhanbarth, gan sicrhau bod aelodau o bob plaid wleidyddol yn y gynghrair, gan gynnwys fi a chyd-aelodau eraill yn y Siambr? A wnewch hefyd ei llongyfarch ar y digwyddiad a gynhaliodd yn Wrecsam ar 21 Mehefin i ddatlu i Gymru gael ei gwneud yn wlad masnach deg gyntaf y byd, gyda chynrychiolwyr o ysgolion megis Ysgol Bryn Alyn ac Ysgol Uwchradd Darland yn bresennol, ochr yn ochr â Fforwm Masnach Deg Cymru a Chynghrair Masnach Deg Wrecsam?

**Jane Davidson:** Gwn yn iawn fod Lesley, yr Aelod Cynulliad dros Wrecsam, wedi codi mater masnach deg yn y fforwm hwnnw'n barhaus, gan fod Wrecsam wedi chwarae rhan mor allweddol yn yr ymgyrch. Mae'n bwysig ei bod yn fenter drawsbleidiol, ac yr

the Wales Fair Trade Forum has demonstrated that 100 per cent of local authorities now have groups working actively towards securing fair-trade status, as that means that the issue cuts right across the political spectrum. We all need to ensure that we put our money where our mouth is and that we personally buy fairly traded products, as well as support the organisations that we are in daily contact with.

**Bethan Jenkins:** I also want to congratulate all the groups that have worked to make Wales a Fairtrade Nation, especially Sustainable Wales, based in Porthcawl, which is in my region. I want to extend the debate, and ask whether your department would be willing to invest as much as you have in achieving Fairtrade Nation status to make Wales more viable. Are you looking to achieve transition town status, by reducing carbon emissions and addressing the imminent crisis in peak oil? We need to address that issue now, and put in the same investment as that invested in fair trade.

**Jane Davidson:** Your leader, Ieuan Wyn Jones, is the Minister responsible for transition towns, and he has already indicated that the Assembly Government will announce where the transition towns will be piloted in Wales this year.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call on Joyce Watson to ask question 7.

**Joyce Watson:** Will the Minister join me in congratulating the latest six eco-schools in Mid and West Wales to achieve the green flag award since March? I believe that educating our younger generation about environmental sustainability is the key to mitigating the effects of climate change—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. It would be helpful if you asked the question as tabled first, and then the Minister could reply before you ask your supplementary question.

wyf yn hynod falch bod Fforwm Masnach Deg Cymru wedi dangos bod gan 100 y cant o awdurdodau lleol yn awr grwpiau sy'n gweithio'n frwd er mwyn sicrhau statws masnach deg, gan fod hynny'n golygu bod y mater yn treiddio drwy bob rhan o'r sbectwm gwleidyddol. Mae angen i bob un ohonom sicrhau ein bod yn rhoi ein harian ar ein gair a'n bod yn bersonol yn prynu cynnyrch wedi'i fasnachu'n deg, ac yn cefnogi'r sefydliadau y down ar eu traws o ddydd i ddydd.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Hoffwn innau hefyd longyfarch yr holl grwpiau sydd wedi gweithio i wneud Cymru yn Genedl Masnach Deg, yn enwedig Cymru Gynaliadwy, ym Mhorthcawl, yn fy rhanbarth i. Hoffwn ymhelaethu ar y drafodaeth, a gofyn a fyddai'ch adran yn fodlon buddsoddi cymaint ag y gwnaethoch i ennill statws Cenedl Masnach Deg i wneud Cymru'n fwy hyfyw. A ydych yn gobeithio ennill statws trefi trawsnewid, drwy leihau allyriadau carbon a mynd i'r afael â'r argyfwng sydd ar droed o ran brig olew? Mae angen inni fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwnnw'n awr, a buddsoddi'r un faint ynddo ag a fuddsoddiwyd mewn masnach deg.

**Jane Davidson:** Eich arweinydd, Ieuan Wyn Jones, yw'r Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am drefi trawsnewid, ac y mae eisoes wedi dweud y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cyhoeddi ym mhle y bydd y trefi trawsnewid yn cael eu treialu yng Nghymru eleni.

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf ar Joyce Watson i ofyn cwestiwn 7.

**Joyce Watson:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ymuno â mi i longyfarch y chwe eco-ysgol ddiweddaraf yng Nghanolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru i ennill gwobr y faner werdd er mis Mawrth? Credaf fod addysgu ein cenedlaeth iau ynghylch cynaliadwyedd amgylcheddol yn allweddol i liniaru effeithiau newid yn yr hinsawdd—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Byddai o fudd petaech yn gofyn y cwestiwn fel y mae wedi'i gyflwyno i ddechrau, ac yna gallai'r Gweinidog ateb cyn ichi ofyn eich cwestiwn atodol.

**Q7 Joyce Watson:** Will the Minister give an update on Welsh Assembly Government initiatives on climate change? OAQ(3)0475(ESH)

**Jane Davidson:** Work continues across the Assembly Government on a number of areas. The Climate Change Commission has just had its third, very constructive, meeting, on which I reported to the Assembly yesterday, and we are progressing with the commitments set out in 'One Wales', including the development of the 3 per cent target.

**Joyce Watson:** Thank you for that answer, Minister, and sorry for asking my supplementary question first, Llywydd. Minister, will you join me in congratulating the latest six eco-schools in Mid and West Wales to achieve the green flag award since March? I believe that educating our younger generation about environmental sustainability is the key to mitigating the effects of climate change in Wales. How will the extra £326,000 announced for the eco-schools programme for 2008-09 be used to encourage small schools to achieve eco status?

**Jane Davidson:** I must admit that much of your super constituency of Mid and West Wales does particularly well with this programme. Carmarthenshire and Powys have among the highest number of schools registered on the programme and the highest number of green flags awarded. I was delighted to attend a recent ceremony in Carmarthenshire to reward 50 eco-schools. Some 1,600 of our schools are now on the eco-schools programme, and I hope that all Assembly Members strongly encourage their schools to move through the programme, through the bronze and silver flags to the green flag awards, because our funding enables all schools to participate. We are shifting the emphasis from registering as an eco-school, which schools can do without doing anything else, to progressing through the flags to achieving a green flag, because that is the ultimate accolade when it comes to

**C7 Joyce Watson:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am gynlluniau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar newid yn yr hinsawdd? OAQ(3)0475(ESH)

**Jane Davidson:** Mae gwaith ar nifer o feysydd yn dal i fynd rhagddo ar draws Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae'r Comisiwn ar y Newid yn yr Hinsawdd newydd gael ei drydydd cyfarfod, ac yr oedd hwnnw'n gyfarfod adeiladol iawn. Adroddais am y cyfarfod hwnnw wrth y Cynulliad ddoe, ac yr ydym yn gweld cynnydd gyda'r ymrwymadau a osodwyd allan yn 'Cymru'n Un', gan gynnwys datblygu'r targed 3 y cant.

**Joyce Watson:** Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog, ac mae'n ddrwg gennyf am ofyn fy nghwestiwn atodol yn gyntaf, Lywydd. Weinidog, a ymunweh â mi i longyfarch y chwe eco-ysgol ddiweddaraf yng Nghanolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru i ennill gwobr y faner werdd er mis Mawrth? Credaf fod addysgu ein cenhedlaeth iau ynghylch cynaliadwyedd amgylcheddol yn allweddol i liniaru effeithiau newid yn yr hinsawdd yng Nghymru. Sut y bydd y £326,000 ychwanegol a gyhoeddwyd ar gyfer y rhaglen eco-ysgolion ar gyfer 2008-09 yn cael ei ddefnyddio i annog ysgolion bach i ennill statws eco-ysgol?

**Jane Davidson:** Rhaid imi gyfaddef bod cryn dipyn o'ch etholaeth o fri, sef Canolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru, yn gwneud yn arbennig o dda gyda'r rhaglen hon. Mae sir Gaerfyrddin a Phowys ymhlith y siroedd sydd â'r niferoedd uchaf o ysgolion wedi'u cofrestru ar y rhaglen, ac mae'r un peth yn wir am nifer y baneri gwyrdd a ddyfarnwyd. Yr oedd yn bleser gennyf fod yn bresennol mewn seremoni ddiweddar yn sir Gaerfyrddin i wobrwyo 50 o eco-ysgolion. Mae ryw 1,600 o'n hysgolion yn awr yn rhan o'r rhaglen eco-ysgolion, a gobeithiaf fod holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn mynd ati o ddifrif i annog eu hysgolion i symud drwy'r rhaglen, gan ennill baner efydd a baner arian cyn ennill gwobr y faner werdd, gan fod yr arian a roddwn yn galluogi pob ysgol i gymryd rhan. Yr ydym yn symud y pwyslais o gofrestru fel eco-ysgol—gall ysgolion wneud hyn heb wneud dim arall—i symud ymlaen o un faner i'r

schools demonstrating that they are buying into this agenda.

**Darren Millar:** One challenge for Wales presented by climate change is the increased risk of flooding. Sir Michael Pitt, in his report on the 2007 floods, recommended that the Government should,

‘ensure proper resourcing of flood resilience measures, with above inflation increases in every spending review’.

Do you agree with that recommendation? If so, can you explain why the Welsh Assembly Government is planning to cut capital expenditure on flood defences in real terms for each of the next three years?

**Jane Davidson:** We have had this debate before, and either you deliberately misunderstand the Assembly Government’s figures, or you genuinely do not understand them. The overall amount invested in flooding issues is increasing. I have already announced that substantial additional funding is likely to be available as a result of our making a bid for a large amount of convergence funding.

**Darren Millar:** Thank you for that answer. However, it is a matter of fact that there is a real-term cut in the budget figures for each of the next three years on capital expenditure on flood defences. Last summer’s floods devastated the homes and businesses of hundreds of people across Wales, and you do not appear to understand the need for significant capital investment in flood defences. Given all the various organisations that are responsible for flood defences and flood risk in Wales, will you bring forward our party’s suggestion for a single, all-Wales flood defence agency to bring a halt to the blame game that often occurs between landowners, councils, the Environment Agency and others in the aftermath of any floods? We have mentioned this on several occasions, and you have yet to take this matter forward and consider it properly.

nesaf er mwyn ennill baner werdd, oherwydd dyna’r brif wobr o ran ysgolion yn dangos eu bod am fod yn rhan o’r agenda hon.

**Darren Millar:** Un her y mae newid yn yr hinsawdd wedi’i rhoi i Gymru yw’r risg gynyddol o lifogydd. Yn ei adroddiad am lifogydd 2007, argymhellodd Syr Michael Pitt y dylai’r Llywodraeth.

sicrhau adnoddau priodol ar gyfer mesurau atal llifogydd, gyda chynnydd uwch na chwyddiant ym mhob arolwg gwariant.

A ydych yn cytuno â’r argymhelliad hwnnw? Os ydych, a allwch egluro pam mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn bwriadu torri’r gwariant cyfalaf ar gyfer amddiffynfeydd rhag llifogydd mewn termau real ar gyfer pob un o’r tair blynedd nesaf?

**Jane Davidson:** Yr ydym wedi cael y ddadl hon o’r blaen, a naill ai yr ydych yn camddeall ffigurau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn fwriadol, neu nid ydych yn eu deall go iawn. Mae’r swm cyffredinol a fuddsoddir mewn materion sy’n gysylltiedig â llifogydd yn cynyddu. Yr wyf eisoes wedi cyhoeddi y bydd cyllid ychwanegol sylweddol yn debygol o fod ar gael oherwydd inni wneud cais am swm uchel o gyllid cydgyfeirio.

**Darren Millar:** Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, y gwir amdani yw y ceir toriad mewn termau real yn ffigurau’r gyllideb ar gyfer pob un o’r tair blynedd nesaf, o ran gwariant cyfalaf ar gyfer amddiffynfeydd rhag llifogydd. Achosodd llifogydd y llynedd ddfrod enfawr i gartrefi a busnesau cannoedd o bobl ledled Cymru, ac nid ymddengys eich bod yn deall yr angen am fuddsoddiad cyfalaf sylweddol mewn amddiffynfeydd rhag llifogydd. Ac ystyried yr holl sefydliadau amrywiol sy’n gyfrifol am amddiffynfeydd rhag llifogydd a pherygl llifogydd yng Nghymru, a gyflwynwch awgrym ein plaid sef cael asiantaeth amddiffyn rhag llifogydd Cymru gyfan i roi terfyn ar y gêm beio eraill sy’n aml yn digwydd rhwng tîrfeddianwyr, cynghorau, Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd ac eraill yn dilyn unrhyw lifogydd? Yr ydym wedi crybwyll hyn droeon, ac nid ydych eto wedi bwrw ymlaen â’r mater a’i ystyried yn iawn.

**Jane Davidson:** As you continue to take this forward without acknowledging all the funding that goes into flooding, I will write to all Assembly Members, pointing out all the aspects of the budget that relate to flooding. That will demonstrate unequivocally the increases in the budget for all the issues around flooding. I say ‘all the issues around flooding’, because the Michael Pitt report also said, as did the report from the Institution of Civil Engineers, that we cannot carry on putting money into flood defences only, as we cannot ensure that our flood defences will continue to keep the sea out as the effects of climate change get worse. A flood-defence-led approach might make our communities even more unsafe. We cannot be sure.

As a Government, we are responding positively to that agenda. We announced our New Approaches programme on flooding last year, and we are taking that agenda forward positively, with increased investment, and the substantial increase in investment that will come from convergence funding. The Environment Agency is the key agency driving forward issues of flooding, but it is important that it works with other organisations as well. A new floods and water Bill will be introduced in the UK Parliament next year, and we will participate in the work on that, to clarify some of the responsibilities.

**Leanne Wood:** Doing all that we can to tackle the climate crisis has to be the Assembly’s greatest priority, because anything else that we do will be worth nothing if we do not have an environment left to pass on to future generations. The Centre for Alternative Technology, based in Machynlleth, has argued that it is possible for Britain to move to a zero-carbon economy. As Wales has a smaller population and a greater proportion of natural resources, it should be easier for us to take that route than it is for Britain as a whole. What initiatives is the One Wales Government undertaking that could help towards moving Wales to a zero-

**Jane Davidson:** Gan eich bod yn dal i fwrw ymlaen â’r mater hwn heb gydnabod yr holl arian sy’n cael ei fuddsoddi mewn atal llifogydd, ysgrifennaf at holl Aelodau’r Cynulliad er mwyn tynnu sylw at bob agwedd ar y gyllideb sy’n ymwneud â llifogydd. Bydd hynny’n dangos yn ddiamwys y cynnydd yn y gyllideb ar gyfer yr holl faterion sy’n ymwneud â llifogydd. Dywedaf ‘yr holl faterion sy’n ymwneud â llifogydd’, gan fod adroddiad Michael Pitt hefyd yn dweud, yn yr un modd ag adroddiad Sefydliad y Peirianwyr Sifil, na allwn barhau i fuddsoddi arian mewn amddiffynfeydd rhag llifogydd yn unig, gan na allwn sicrhau y bydd ein hamddiffynfeydd rhag llifogydd yn parhau i gadw’r môr allan wrth i effeithiau newid yn yr hinsawdd waethygu. Gallai dull gweithredu ar sail amddiffynfeydd rhag llifogydd wneud ein cymunedau’n fwy anniogel byth. Ni allwn fod yn siŵr.

Fel Llywodraeth, yr ydym yn ymateb yn gadarnhaol i’r agenda honno. Cyhoeddasom ein rhaglen Dulliau Newydd o Weithredu ar llifogydd y llynedd, ac yr ydym yn mynd â’r agenda honno rhagddi yn gadarnhaol, gyda mwy o fuddsoddiad, a’r cynnydd sylweddol mewn buddsoddiad a ddaw o gyllid cydgyfeirio. Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yw’r brif asiantaeth sy’n gyrru materion sy’n ymwneud â llifogydd yn eu blaen, ond mae’n bwysig ei bod yn gweithio gyda sefydliadau eraill hefyd. Bydd Mesur sy’n ymwneud â llifogydd a dŵr newydd yn cael ei gyflwyno yn Senedd y DU y flwyddyn nesaf, a byddwn yn rhan o’r gwaith a fydd yn gysylltiedig â hynny, er mwyn egluro rhai o’r cyfrifoldebau.

**Leanne Wood:** Gwneud popeth yn ein gallu i frwydro yn erbyn newid yn yr hinsawdd—rhaid i hynny fod yn brif flaenoriaeth y Cynulliad, oherwydd ni fydd gwerth i ddim arall a wnawn oni fydd gennym amgylchedd ar ôl i’w drosglwyddo i genedlaethau’r dyfodol. Mae’r Ganolfan Dechnoleg Amgen ym Machynlleth wedi dadlau ei bod yn bosibl i Brydain symud i gyfeiriad economi digarbon. Gan fod gan Gymru lai o boblogaeth a chyfran uwch o adnoddau naturiol, dylai ei bod yn haws i ni ddilyn y trywydd hwnnw na Phrydain drwyddi draw. Pa gynlluniau y mae Llywodraeth Cymru’n Un yn ymgymryd â hwy a allai helpu i symud Cymru at ddyfodol

carbon future?

**Jane Davidson:** The Centre for Alternative Technology is a member of our Climate Change Commission for Wales. That commission is looking at how to deliver our obligation of making 3 per cent annual reductions in greenhouse gas emissions from 2011. Such reductions would mean that Wales was committed to 90 per cent reductions by 2050, which is the highest target of any part of the United Kingdom.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** I asked you yesterday about your package of planning and climate change measures, which you said that you would announce in the next three days. I asked why you had not announced them to the Assembly; perhaps you could tell us why that is so, or can you outline the package of measures that you intend to announce in the next day or so?

1.00 p.m.

**Jane Davidson:** I will, in the normal way, be announcing the package of measures to Assembly Members in a written statement.

#### Cleanliness of Welsh Beaches

**Q8 Alun Davies:** Will the Minister make a statement on the cleanliness of Welsh beaches? OAQ(3)0450(ESH)

**Jane Davidson:** Last month I was delighted to present over 110 seaside awards, 42 blue flag awards for beaches, 5 blue flag awards for marinas, and 46 green coast awards. These awards recognise the excellent beaches and seaside facilities that we have. Despite that, I still want to tackle the issue of litter on Welsh beaches, and I will be meeting the Marine Conservation Society next week.

**Alun Davies:** You were in the Chamber yesterday when I asked for an urgent statement on the current situation in Carmarthen bay. The figures that you have just given us are hugely encouraging, in that 57 per cent of Welsh beaches meet the

di-garbon?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'r Ganolfan Dechnoleg Amgen yn aelod o Gomisiwn Cymru ar y Newid yn yr Hinsawdd. Mae'r comisiwn hwnnw yn edrych ar ffyrdd o gyflawni ein hymrwymiad i ostwng 3 y cant ar ein hallyriadau nwyon tŷ gwydr bob blwyddyn ar ôl 2011. Byddai gostyngiadau o'r fath yn golygu bod Cymru wedi ymrwmo i gael gostyngiadau o 90 y cant erbyn 2050, sef targed uchaf unrhyw ran o'r Deyrnas Unedig.

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Gofynnais ichi ddoe am eich pecyn mesurau cynllunio a newid yn yr hinsawdd, y dywedasoch y byddech yn ei gyhoeddi yn ystod y tri diwrnod nesaf. Holais pam nad oeddech wedi'i gyhoeddi i'r Cynulliad; efallai y gallech ddweud wrthym pam, neu a allwch amlinellu'r pecyn mesurau y bwriadwch ei gyhoeddi yn y diwrnod neu ddau nesaf?

**Jane Davidson:** Byddaf yn cyhoeddi'r pecyn mesurau, a hynny yn y ffordd arferol, sef drwy gyfrwng datganiad ysgrifenedig i Aelodau'r Cynulliad.

#### Glanweithdra Traethau Cymru

**C8 Alun Davies:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am lanweithdra traethau Cymru? OAQ(3)0450(ESH)

**Jane Davidson:** Fis diwethaf, cefais y ffrind o gyflwyno mwy na 110 o wobrau glan môr, 42 o wobrau baner las ar gyfer traethau, 5 gwobr baner las ar gyfer marinas a 46 o wobrau arfordir gwyrdd. Mae'r gwobrau hyn yn cydnabod ein traethau a'n cyfleusterau glan môr rhagorol. Er gwaethaf hynny, yr wyf am fynd i'r afael â'r sbwriel ar draethau Cymru, a byddaf yn cwrdd â'r Gymdeithas Cadwraeth Forol yr wythnos nesaf.

**Alun Davies:** Yr oeddech yn bresennol yn y Siambr ddoe pan ofynnais am ddatganiad brys am sefyllfa gyfredol bae Caerfyrddin. Mae'r ffigurau yr ydych newydd eu rhoi inni yn galonogol dros ben, sef bod 57 y cant o draethau Cymru'n bodloni safonau sylfaenol



Marine Conservation Society's minimum standards; considering the wetness of last summer, it is a real achievement. However, there are still phenomenal issues that we must deal with, such as pollution run-off from agricultural sources, stormwater and sewage outflows, and so on, which cause real challenges to beaches and water quality around the Welsh coast. Can you assure us that the work that you do with Welsh Water—the green sea initiative—focuses on some of these coastal pollution issues, so that all of our children, and the rest of us, can bathe in absolute safety this summer?

**Jane Davidson:** I can assure you of that. I was interested to find that 69 of our beaches were eligible for an award for bathing water quality; it is some of the land elements that let those beaches down. So, a huge number of our beaches in Wales are extremely good in terms of water quality, which makes Wales a fantastic destination for people to come to spend their summers.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Last Friday, I had the pleasure of visiting the Heritage Coast Centre in Southerndown—I see from your expression that you know the centre—and saw the benefit that the beach brings in terms of harnessing what the Heritage Coast Centre can offer to children on educational visits. The accessibility of the coastline there is also enhanced by landowners who voluntarily allow access to the beaches along the heritage coast. In your opinion, is that a good example of voluntary access working, and should it be the model that we use to provide best practice in terms of access to the coastline in other parts of Wales?

**Jane Davidson:** The work that has taken place in the Vale of Glamorgan on the heritage coastal path has been wonderful; I have used the path on many occasions. As I have pointed out on a number of occasions, where the voluntary agreement is working well, we have had very effective delivery, as in the case of the Pembrokeshire coastal path area. However, there are some parts of Wales where individual landowners have obstructed

y Gymdeithas Cadwraeth Forol; ac ystyried gwlypter haf diwethaf, mae'n dipyn o gamp. Fodd bynnag, ceir problemau enfawr o hyd y mae'n rhaid inni ddelio â hwy, megis rhedlif llygredd o ffynonellau amaethyddol, all-lifau gwrtaith a dŵr storm ac ati, sy'n creu heriau gwirioneddol i ansawdd dŵr a thraethau o amgylch arfordir Cymru. A allwch ein sicrhau bod y gwaith a wnewch gyda Dŵr Cymru—y fenter môr gwyrdd—yn canolbwyntio ar rai o'r problemau hyn sy'n ymwneud â llygredd arfordirol, er mwyn i'n plant i gyd, a'r gweddill ohonom, allu ymdrochi yn gwbl ddiogel yr haf hwn?

**Jane Davidson:** Gallaf eich sicrhau yn hynny o beth. Yr oedd yn ddiddorol gennyf ganfod bod 69 o'n traethau'n gymwys i gael gwobr am ansawdd y dŵr ymdrochi; rhai o'r elfennau sy'n ymwneud â'r tir yw dolen wan rhai o'r traethau hynny. Felly, mae nifer helaeth o'n traethau yng Nghymru'n arbennig o dda yng nghyd-destun ansawdd y dŵr, ac mae hynny'n gwneud Cymru'n gyrchfan wych i bobl ddod i dreulio'u gwyliau haf.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Ddydd Gwener diwethaf, cefais y pleser o ymweld â'r Ganolfan Arfordir Treftadaeth yn Southerndown—gwelaf o'ch ymateb eich bod yn gyfarwydd â'r ganolfan—a gwelais y manteision a geir yn sgil y traeth o ran defnyddio'r hyn y gall y Ganolfan Arfordir Treftadaeth ei gynnig i blant ar ymweliadau addysgol. Mae tîrfeddianwyr sy'n caniatáu mynediad i'r traethau ar hyd y llwybr treftadaeth—a hynny o'u gwirfodd—yn gwella'r mynediad at y morlin yn y fan honno. Yn eich barn chi, a yw honno'n enghraifft dda o fynediad gwirfoddol ar waith, ac ai hwn yw'r model y dylem ei ddefnyddio i ddarparu arfer gorau o ran mynediad i'r morlin mewn ardaloedd eraill yng Nghymru?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'r gwaith a gyflawnwyd ar lwybr arfordir treftadaeth Bro Morgannwg wedi bod yn wych; yr wyf wedi defnyddio'r llwybr droeon. Fel yr wyf wedi'i ddweud ar lawer achlysur, pan fydd y cytundeb gwirfoddol yn mynd rhagddo'n dda, mae'r canlyniad wedi bod yn effeithiol iawn, fel yn achos ardal llwybr arfordir sir Benfro. Fodd bynnag, mae tîrfeddianwyr unigol wedi amharu ar y gwaith da mewn rhai rhannau o

the greater good. Therefore, we have always argued that we need to consider the appropriate statutory approach to ensure that the greater good is not obstructed. Wherever possible, the type of voluntary arrangements that you describe are an extremely important way to move forward.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I am sure that we are all heartened by your warm words, as usual, but to have only 57 per cent of our beaches reaching the minimum standards is rather shameful, given that tourism is one of our important selling points. In north Wales, for instance, there are many exquisite beaches that we have always frequented as a family. My understanding from Keep Wales Tidy is that, while many beaches have attention paid to them from May to September, it believes that attention should be paid to them all year round. There should also be a better survey of beaches, which would look into the facilities available, including basics such as lavatories—dare I mention it?—which are not always accessible to the general public. I hope that this is an issue that you will take on board to address as quickly as possible.

**Jane Davidson:** As you heard in my response to Alun Davies, 69 of our beaches, which is substantially more than the 47 that attained the blue flag standard this year, are eligible in terms of water quality. I will work with local authorities to look at ways in which we can contribute to the land-based element for the future. In the context of the all-Wales coastal path, we are providing around £2 million to local authorities, which will be helpful.

I was delighted to launch the blue flags this year at Aberafan beach. I have to say to my esteemed colleague, Brian Gibbons, that Aberafan beach would not necessarily be how people envisaged a blue flag beach, given its industrial backdrop. However, the local authority has invested a lot of time and effort into that incredibly popular beach and demonstrated that the water quality and the facilities can be provided. So, I was delighted that all kinds of beaches across Wales benefited from blue flags this year. I pay tribute to all those local authorities that have

Gymru. Felly, yr ydym wastad wedi dadlau bod angen inni ystyried yr ymagwedd statudol briodol er mwyn sicrhau nas amherir ar y gwaith da. Mae'r math o drefniadau gwirfoddol a ddisgrifiwch yn ffordd hynod bwysig o symud ymlaen, pryd bynnag y bydd hynny'n bosibl.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yr wyf yn siŵr bod eich geiriau gwresog yn codi calon pob un ohonom, fel arfer, ond mae'r ffaith mai dim ond 57 y cant o'n traethau sy'n cyrraedd y safonau sylfaenol yn eithaf gwarthus wrth gofio bod twristiaeth yn un o'n nodweddion pwysig wrth werthu ein hunain. Yn y gogledd, er enghraifft, ceir nifer o draethau godidog yr ydym wedi ymweld â hwy'n fynych fel teulu. Caf ar ddeall gan Cadw Cymru'n Daclus, ei fod yn credu y dylid rhoi sylw i'r holl draethau gydol y flwyddyn, gan mai o fis Mai i fis Medi y rhoddir sylw i nifer ohonynt. Dylid hefyd cael gwell arolwg o draethau, a fyddai'n edrych ar y cyfleusterau sydd ar gael, gan gynnwys pethau sylfaenol megis toiledau—a fentraf grybwyll hynny?—nad ydynt bob amser ar gael i'r cyhoedd. Gobeithiaf fod hwn yn fater yr ymgymerwch ag ef er mwyn rhoi sylw iddo cyn gynted â phosibl.

**Jane Davidson:** Fel y clywsoch yn fy ateb i Alun Davies, mae 69 o'n traethau—sydd gryn dipyn yn fwy na'r 47 o draethau a gyraeddodd safon y faner las eleni—yn gymwys yng nghyswllt ansawdd y dŵr. Byddaf yn gweithio gydag awdurdodau lleol i edrych ar ffyrdd y gallwn gyfrannu at yr elfen sy'n ymwneud â'r tir yn y dyfodol. Yng nghyd-destun llwybr arfordirol Cymru gyfan, yr ydym yn darparu oddeutu £2 miliwn i awdurdodau lleol, a bydd hynny'n fuddiol.

Yr oedd yn bleser gennyf lansio'r baneri glas eleni yn nhraeth Aberafan. Rhaid imi ddweud wrth Brian Gibbons, fy nghyd-Weinidog uchel ei barch, na fyddai pobl o reidrwydd wedi rhagweld traeth Aberafan fel traeth baner las, a chofio ei gefndir diwydiannol. Fodd bynnag, mae'r awdurdod lleol wedi rhoi llawer o amser ac ymdrech i'r traeth hynod boblogaidd hwnnw, ac mae wedi dangos y gellir darparu'r ansawdd dŵr a'r cyfleusterau gofynnol. Felly, yr oeddwn wrth fy modd bod traethau o bob lliw a llun ledled Cymru wedi cael budd o faneri glas eleni.

made that effort.

### Fuel Poverty

**Q9 William Graham:** Will the Minister outline discussions held with the UK Government concerning how increased energy costs impact upon fuel poverty in Wales? OAQ(3)0444(ESH)

**Jane Davidson:** I have written to John Hutton concerning the effect that rising domestic fuel prices is having on the level of fuel poverty in Wales. I also attended the fuel poverty summit, convened by Ofgem, where the issue of fuel poverty was discussed between Ministers and suppliers across the UK and I will meet UK Ministers again to discuss this issue on 14 July.

**William Graham:** Thank you for the action that you are taking on this issue. You will have seen the recent Citizens Advice report about the increase of 11 per cent in the number of fuel debt cases in Britain. That must be reflected in Wales, as everyone is affected by the dramatic increase in fuel prices. It does not offer a great deal of promise for the winter, when prices are likely to go up again with increasing demand. Could you state whether you are prepared to expand the fuel poverty pilot programme?

**Jane Davidson:** The new low carbon building programme, which I mentioned earlier, brings £1 million into Wales from the UK Government. We are more than matching that in terms of renewable energy opportunities for fuel-poor households. I hope that Members will encourage their constituents to look at switching their supplier. This is a critical issue in Wales—only just over half of energy customers in Wales have switched supplier. Energywatch has said that customers in Wales pay £47 million per year more than they need to pay for their energy, so I hope that people will now look at switching supplier. We will respond as an Assembly Government on the areas for which we are responsible in terms of driving this agenda forward.

Rhoddaf deyrnged i'r holl awdurdodau lleol hynny sydd wedi gwneud yr ymdrech honno.

### Tlodi Tanwydd

**C9 William Graham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu trafodaethau a gynhaliwyd gyda Llywodraeth y DU ynghylch sut y mae costau ynni uwch yn effeithio ar dlodi tanwydd yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)0444(ESH)

**Jane Davidson:** Yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at John Hutton ynghylch effaith costau uwch tanwydd ar gyfer y cartref ar lefel tlodi tanwydd yng Nghymru. Yr oeddwn hefyd yn bresennol yn yr uwch gynhadledd tlodi tanwydd, a gynullwyd gan Ofgem, lle bu Gweinidogion a chyflenwyr ledled y DU yn trafod tlodi tanwydd, a byddaf yn cwrdd â Gweinidogion y DU eto ar 14 Gorffennaf i drafod y mater hwn.

**William Graham:** Diolch ichi am y camau yr ydych yn eu cymryd ar y mater hwn. Mae'n siŵr eich bod wedi gweld adroddiad diweddar Cyngor ar Bopeth am y cynnydd 11 y cant yn nifer yr achosion o ddyled tanwydd ym Mhrydain. Rhaid bod hynny'n cael ei adlewyrchu yng Nghymru, gan fod y cynnydd dramatig ym mhrisiau tanwydd yn effeithio ar bawb. Nid yw'n argoeli'n dda ar gyfer y gaeaf, gan ei bod yn debygol y bydd y prisiau'n codi eto wrth i'r galw am danwydd gynyddu. A allech ddatgan a ydych yn fodlon ehangu'r rhaglen beilot ar gyfer tlodi tanwydd?

**Jane Davidson:** Daw rhaglen newydd adeiladau carbon isel, a grybwyllais yn gynharach, â £1 miliwn i Gymru gan Lywodraeth y DU. Yr ydym yn rhoi mwy na hynny o ran cyfleoedd ynni adnewyddadwy ar gyfer aelwydydd sy'n wynebu tlodi tanwydd. Gobeithiaf y bydd Aelodau'n annog eu hetholwyr i edrych ar newid eu cyflenwr. Mae hwn yn fater hollbwysig yng Nghymru—dim ond ychydig dros hanner cwsmeriaid y cwmnïau ynni yng Nghymru sydd wedi newid eu cyflenwr. Mae Golwg ar Ynni wedi dweud bod cwsmeriaid yng Nghymru'n talu £47 miliwn y flwyddyn yn fwy nag y mae angen iddynt ei dalu am eu hynni, felly gobeithiaf y gwnaiff pobl ystyried newid eu cyflenwr yn awr. Byddwn yn ymateb fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i'r

meysydd yr ydym yn gyfrifol amdanynt o ran bwrw ymlaen â'r agenda hon.

**Nerys Evans:** Today, Plaid Cymru and the SNP are presenting an amendment to the Finance Bill to be considered in the House of Commons. It proposes the introduction of a fuel duty regulator and, if accepted, it will provide relief for motorists and industry from soaring fuel prices. The proposal is backed by the Road Haulage Association. There is no doubt that industry is suffering in Wales because of spiralling fuel costs. Do you agree with the appointment of a fuel duty regulator in Wales to protect, and provide relief for, our industry and, therefore, do you support today's Plaid Cymru amendment in the House of Commons?

**Nerys Evans:** Heddiw, mae Plaid Cymru a Phlaid Genedlaethol yr Alban yn cyflwyno gwelliant i'r Mesur Cyllid a gaiff ei ystyried yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin. Mae'n cynnig cyflwyno rheolydd treth tanwydd ac, os y'i derbynir, bydd yn rhyddhad i fodurwyr ac i ddiwydiannau yn wyneb costau cynyddol tanwydd. Mae'r Gymdeithas Cludiant Ffyrdd yn cefnogi'r cynnig. Nid oes amheuaeth nad yw diwydiant yng Nghymru'n dioddef yn sgil costau cynyddol tanwydd. A ydych yn cytuno y dylid penodi rheolydd treth tanwydd yng Nghymru er mwyn diogelu ein diwydiant a'i gynorthwyo ac felly, a ydych heddiw yn cefnogi gwelliant Plaid Cymru yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin?

**Jane Davidson:** Ieuan Wyn Jones has already met haulage contractors and I am sure that both he and I will be interested in discussions on the fuel duty regulator.

**Jane Davidson:** Mae Ieuan Wyn Jones eisoes wedi cwrdd â chontractwyr cludo ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd ganddo ef a minnau ddi-ddordeb mewn trafodaethau ynghylch y rheolydd treth tanwydd.

### National Homelessness Strategy

### Strategaeth Genedlaethol ar Ddigartrefedd

**Q10 Peter Black:** Will the Minister make a statement on the national homelessness strategy? OAQ(3)0427(ESH)

**C10 Peter Black:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y strategaeth genedlaethol ar ddigartrefedd? OAQ(3)0427(ESH)

**Jocelyn Davies:** The One Wales Government is taking forward its commitment to develop a 10-year plan to tackle homelessness, which will be brought out for consultation in the next few weeks. The vision will be to reduce homelessness to a minimum through all-encompassing service provision.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Mae Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un yn bwrw ymlaen â'i hymrwymiad i ddatblygu cynllun 10 mlynedd i fynd i'r afael â digartrefedd. Bydd hyn yn destun ymgynghoriad yn ystod yr wythnosau nesaf. Y weledigaeth fydd lleihau digartrefedd i lefel mor isel â phosibl drwy ddarparu gwasanaeth hollgynhwysol.

**Peter Black:** Have you carried out any assessment as yet of the effectiveness of local homelessness strategies and, in particular, whether there is sufficient provision around Wales to deal with homelessness and to meet the demands placed on authorities by those who present themselves as homeless or who are sleeping rough?

**Peter Black:** A ydych wedi cynnal unrhyw asesiad hyd yma o effeithiolrwydd strategaethau digartrefedd lleol ac, yn benodol, a oes digon o ddarpariaeth o amgylch Cymru i ddelio â digartrefedd ac i fodloni'r gofynion a roddir ar awdurdodau gan y rheini sy'n cyflwyno'u hunain fel pobl ddigartref neu sy'n cysgu ar y stryd?

1.10 p.m.

**Jocelyn Davies:** As you know, we are currently developing the new homelessness

**Jocelyn Davies:** Fel y gwyddoch, yr ydym yn datblygu'r cynllun digartrefedd newydd ar

plan and there is an expert panel looking at that. I take your point, and I have mentioned to you in the past that we have asked local authorities to assess whether they are interpreting the legislation effectively, by asking consultants, perhaps, to look into it. If you wish to write to me about a specific local authority that the Minister should be looking at, I would be glad to hear from you.

**Peter Black:** I will certainly write to you about specific issues. The general issue involved the section 180 grants, and the fact that they are tied up over three or five years, which means that there is little money now available for new initiatives. There are demands on local authorities to make provision, either in hostels, as in Swansea, or elsewhere, so will there be any additional funding available in the near future to assist local authorities to develop those new facilities?

**Jocelyn Davies:** A great deal of money was spent in the past on bed and breakfast provision, for example, that was not effective in tackling homelessness and was extremely expensive. We have found that local authorities can use spend-to-save initiatives, so it is not a case of the overall amount of money that you spend, but how smart you are in spending it.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** When we discuss homelessness, we tend to think that the answers always lie in social housing. Of course, there are many private properties that could also be used to address the problems. Agorfa, which is an organisation based in Bangor, specialises in helping tenants who find it difficult to get on the housing ladder to rent private properties. Would you be able to come to meet this organisation, which seems to be achieving remarkable success in helping tenants into the private-let market?

**Jocelyn Davies:** I know that many local authorities have developed good relationships with the private rented sector, and there are private landlords who are prepared to help and who take the risk of giving tenancies to

hyn o bryd, ac mae panel arbenigol yn edrych ar hynny. Derbyniaf eich pwynt, ac yr wyf wedi sôn wrthyich yn y gorffennol ein bod wedi gofyn i awdurdodau lleol asesu a ydynt yn dehongli'r ddeddfwriaeth yn effeithiol, drwy ofyn i ymgynghorwyr edrych ar hynny. Os hoffech ysgrifennu ataf ynghylch awdurdod lleol penodol y dylai'r Gweinidog fod yn edrych arno, byddwn yn falch o glywed gennych.

**Peter Black:** Byddaf yn siŵr o ysgrifennu atoch ynghylch materion penodol. Yr oedd y mater cyffredinol yn ymwneud â grantiau adran 180, a'r ffaith eu bod wedi'u clymu am dair neu bum mlynedd, sy'n golygu nad oes llawer o arian ar gael yn awr ar gyfer cynlluniau newydd. Mae galw ar awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau darpariaeth, naill ai mewn hosteli, fel yn Abertawe, neu yn rhywle arall. Felly, a fydd unrhyw arian ychwanegol ar gael yn y dyfodol agos i gynorthwyo awdurdodau lleol i ddatblygu'r cyfleusterau newydd hynny?

**Jocelyn Davies:** Gwariwyd cryn dipyn o arian yn y gorffennol ar ddarpariaeth gwely a brecwast, er enghraifft. Nid oedd hynny'n ffordd effeithiol o fynd i'r afael â digartrefedd, ac yr oedd yn ddud dros ben. Yr ydym wedi canfod y gall awdurdodau lleol ddefnyddio cynlluniau gwario-er mwyn-arbed, felly nid cyfanswm yr arian a wariwch sy'n bwysig, ond pa mor ddoeth y byddwch yn ei wario.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Pan fyddwn yn trafod digartrefedd, tueddwn i feddwl mai tai cymdeithasol yw'r ateb bob tro. Wrth gwrs, mae nifer o eiddo preifat y gellid eu defnyddio hefyd er mwyn mynd i'r afael â'r problemau. Mae Agorfa, sef sefydliad ym Mangor, yn arbenigo mewn cynorthwyo tenantiaid sy'n ei chael yn anodd rhoi cam ar yr ysgol dai i rentu eiddo preifat. A allech ddod i gwrdd â'r sefydliad hwn sydd, i bob golwg, yn cael llwyddiant ysgubol o ran cynorthwyo tenantiaid i ymuno â'r farchnad rhentu preifat?

**Jocelyn Davies:** Gwn fod nifer o awdurdodau lleol wedi meithrin perthynas dda gyda'r sector rhentu preifat, a cheir landlordiaid preifat sy'n barod i helpu ac i fentro rhoi tenantiaeth i bobl anodd eu lleoli.

people who are hard to place. My next visit to north Wales is not until the beginning of October, but if I could fit in a visit on that day, I would be glad to meet you there.

Ni fyddaf yn ymweld â'r gogledd tan ddechrau mis Hydref, ond, pe gallwn gael amser am ymweliad ar y diwrnod hwnnw, byddwn yn falch o'ch cyfarfod yno.

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth Questions to Minister for Heritage**

### **Museums and Archives**

**Q1 Lorraine Barrett:** What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to support Wales's museums and archives?  
OAQ(3)0430(HER)

**The Minister for Heritage (Rhodri Glyn Thomas):** The Welsh Assembly Government provides funding to Amgueddfa Cymru-National Museum Wales and enables free entry for everyone to our national museums. In addition, we are committed to improving access to local museums and archives across Wales, and we provide development grants for improving the services that they offer.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I welcome the comprehensive 'Spotlight on Museums' survey commissioned recently by CyMAL: Museums Archives and Libraries Wales, and I had an opportunity to raise this issue following your statement last week. I hope that the survey will inform much of your new museum strategy for Wales. However, I would like assurance that you will be consulting with the huge variety of black and minority ethnic communities that surround us here in the Assembly, in my constituency, and that the communities' involvement in the historic development of this area will be well-documented and celebrated in the new museums strategy.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I look forward to the publication of the museums strategy. It will be a key document that highlights issues and future directions for the development of museums in Wales. On the specific point you raised about ethnic diversity in this area, I discussed this recently with the arts strategy board, and we are placing a mechanism in place that will allow that to happen. We are

### **Amgueddfeydd ac Archifau**

**C1 Lorraine Barrett:** Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n ei wneud i gefnogi amgueddfeydd ac archifau Cymru?  
OAQ(3)0430(HER)

**Y Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth (Rhodri Glyn Thomas):** Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n darparu cyllid i Amgueddfa Cymru, ac yn galluogi i bawb gael mynediad am ddim i'n hamgueddfeydd cenedlaethol. Hefyd, yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i wella mynediad at amgueddfeydd ac archifau lleol ledled Cymru, ac yr ydym yn darparu grantiau datblygu ar gyfer gwella'r gwasanaethau a gynigiant.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Croesawaf 'Sbotolau ar Amgueddfeydd', yr arolwg cynhwysfawr a gomisiynwyd yn ddiweddar gan CyMAL: Amgueddfeydd, Archifau a Llyfrgelloedd Cymru, a chefais gyfle i godi'r mater hwn yn dilyn eich datganiad yr wythnos diwethaf. Gobeithiaf y bydd yr arolwg yn sail helaeth i'ch strategaeth amgueddfeydd newydd ar gyfer Cymru. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn gael fy sicrhau y byddwch yn ymgynghori â'r amrywiaeth enfawr o gymunedau pobl dduon a lleiafrifoedd ethnig sydd o'n cwmpas yma yn y Cynulliad, yn fy etholaeth, ac y rhoddir digon o sylw i gyfraniad y cymunedau yn natblygiad hanesyddol yr ardal hon ac y dethlir hynny yn y strategaeth amgueddfeydd newydd.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr wyf yn edrych ymlaen at weld y strategaeth amgueddfeydd yn cael ei chyhoeddi. Bydd yn ddogfen allweddol a fydd yn tynnu sylw at faterion a chyfarwyddiadau i'r dyfodol ar gyfer datblygu amgueddfeydd yng Nghymru. Parthed y pwynt penodol a wnaethoch ynghylch amrywiaeth cefndiroedd ethnig yn yr ardal hon, trafodais hyn yn ddiweddar

now trying to contact the main groups as well as some of the smaller groups through that mechanism.

gyda bwrdd strategaeth y celfyddydau, ac yr ydym yn sefydlu mecanwaith a fydd yn caniatáu i hynny ddigwydd. Yr ydym yn awr yn ceisio cysylltu â'r prif grwpiau yn ogystal â rhai o'r grwpiau llai drwy gyfrwng y mecanwaith hwnnw.

**Paul Davies:** Mae'n hollbwysig ein bod yn galluogi pobl i weld cymaint o drysorau'r genedl â phosibl, ac yr wyf yn gwerthfawrogi bod y Llywodraeth yn sicrhau bod mwy o bobl yn gallu gweld casgliadau cenedlaethol drwy'r cynllun grant Cyfoeth Cymru Gyfan. Mae'r cynllun hwn yn galluogi amgueddfeydd ac orielau lleol i wella eu cyfleusterau er mwyn derbyn gwrthrychau ac arddangosfeydd o'r casgliadau cenedlaethol. A all y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym sut y bydd y Llywodraeth yn sicrhau bod y casgliadau hyn ar gael i ysgolion a cholegau er mwyn i bobl ifanc yn enwedig elwa'n addysgiadol?

**Paul Davies:** It is vital that we enable people to see as many of our nation's treasures as possible, and I appreciate that the Government is ensuring that more people are able to see national collections through the Sharing Treasures grant scheme. This scheme enables local museums and galleries to improve their facilities so that they can acquire artefacts and exhibitions from the national collection. Can the Minister tell us how the Government will ensure that these collections are available to schools and colleges so that young people in particular can benefit academically?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Croesawaf yr hyn yr ydych wedi ei ddweud ynglŷn â'r cynllun hwnnw. Mae'r cynllun yn galluogi rhai arddangosfeydd i fynd allan i amgueddfeydd ledled Cymru. Yr wyf wedi cael cyfle i weld rhai o'r arddangosfeydd hynny ac maent yn hynod o effeithiol. Yng nghyd-destun ceisio ymestyn y gwasanaeth a sicrhau mwy o fynediad iddo, mae gan Amgueddfa Cymru ei safle rhithiol, sef Rhagor. Mae cyfle, drwy'r safle rhithiol hwnnw, i ysgolion a sefydliadau eraill gael mynediad i'r arddangosfeydd hyn.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I welcome what you have said about that particular scheme. The scheme enables some exhibitions to go out to museums throughout Wales. I have had an opportunity to view some of these exhibitions and they have been extremely effective. In the context of trying to extend the service and ensuring that there is greater access to it, National Museum Wales has its virtual site, called Rhagor. There is an opportunity, through that virtual site, for schools and other institutions to gain access to these exhibitions.

**Paul Davies:** Mae amgueddfeydd lleol yn chwarae rhan bwysig yn hyrwyddo hanes ein cymunedau. Mae sefydliadau fel hyn yn chwarae rhan allweddol mewn ardaloedd lleol drwy ddenu twristiaid. Gwn hynny drwy weld y gwaith da a wneir gan amgueddfeydd bach lleol yn fy etholaeth i; er enghraifft, yr amgueddfeydd yn Hwlfordd ac Aberdaugleddau. Yn anffodus, mae rhai amgueddfeydd bach yn ei gweld hi'n anodd yn ariannol. A all y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym, yn ychwanegol i gynllun grant Cyfoeth Cymru Gyfan, a oes cynlluniau eraill gan y Llywodraeth i gefnogi amgueddfeydd bach yn uniongyrchol?

**Paul Davies:** Local museums play an important role in promoting the history of our communities. Such institutions play a key role in local areas by attracting tourists. I know that through the good work that the small local museums in my constituency are doing; such as the museums in Haverfordwest and Milford Haven. Unfortunately, some small museums find it difficult financially. Can the Minister tell us, in addition to the Sharing Treasures grant scheme, whether the Government has other schemes to support small museums directly?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr ydym yn disgwyl i'r strategaeth gael ei gyhoeddi. Fel y

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** We are awaiting the publication of the strategy. As I said earlier,

dywedais yn gynharach, bydd hynny yn cynnig cyfeiriad ar gyfer y dyfodol. Fodd bynnag, mae £400,000 eisoes wedi ei glustnodi yng nghyllideb 2008-09 ar gyfer amgueddfeydd lleol fel rhan o'n cynllun grant amgueddfeydd. Mae hefyd £175,000 wedi ei glustnodi ar gyfer archifdai drwy'r cynllun grant archifau.

**Janet Ryder:** Minister, will you join me in congratulating Wrexham's Racecourse, which has just been recognised as the holder of the Guinness world record for the oldest international football ground? Would you also support any moves to create a small museum or permanent exhibition to commemorate this historical fact in Wrexham and join me in wishing Wrexham a speedy return to league football next year so that professional football can continue at the Racecourse?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I am glad to recognise the Racecourse as one of the oldest international football grounds. In fact, the first international game was held there in 1877. I hasten to add that, although I hail from Wrexham, I was not there on that particular date, and, unfortunately, Scotland won 2-0. It is an important date in terms of recognising the part that the Racecourse has played in international football. I certainly welcome the initiative to have a museum there to commemorate that fact, and I look forward to being given further information about that particular project.

#### Tourism in North Wales

**Q2 Mark Isherwood:** Will the Minister make a statement on Welsh Assembly Government support for tourism in north Wales? OAQ(3)0400(HER)

**Q7 Darren Millar:** Will the Minister make a statement on tourism levels in north Wales? OAQ(3)0433(HER)

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** The tourism industry is the key to the economy of north Wales. In recognition of this, Tourism Partnership North Wales receives the highest level of annual funding of the regional tourism partnerships, which it uses to promote and develop tourism in the region according to

that will offer a direction for the future. However, £400,000 has already been allocated in the 2008-09 budget for local museums as part of our museum grant scheme. Also, £175,000 has been allocated to archive offices through the archive grant scheme.

**Janet Ryder:** Weinidog, a wnewch ymuno â mi i longyfarch Cae Ras Wrecsam, sydd newydd gael ei gydnabod fel y cael pêl-droed rhyngwladol hynaf ac sydd yn awr yn dal record y byd Guinness am hynny? A fydddech hefyd yn cefnogi unrhyw ymdrechion i greu amgueddfa fach neu arddangosfa barhaol i goffâu'r ffaith hanesyddol hon yn Wrecsam ac ymuno â mi i ddymuno y bydd Wrecsam yn dychwelyd i'r gynghrair bêl-droed yn gyflym y flwyddyn nesaf er mwyn i bêl-droed proffesiynol allu parhau yn y Cae Ras?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr wyf yn falch o gydnabod mai'r Cae Ras yw un o'r caeau pêl-droed rhyngwladol hynaf. Mewn gwirionedd, cynhaliwyd y gêm ryngwladol gyntaf yno yn 1877. Prysuraf i ychwanegu, er fy mod yn hanu o Wrecsam, nad oeddwn yno ar y dyddiad penodol hwnnw, ac, yn anffodus, enillodd yr Alban 2-0. Mae'n ddyddiad pwysig o ran cydnabod y rhan y mae'r Cae Ras wedi'i chwarae mewn pêl-droed rhyngwladol. Yr wyf yn sicr yn croesawu'r fenter i gael amgueddfa yno i goffâu'r ffaith honno, ac edrychaf ymlaen ar gael rhagor o wybodaeth am y prosiect penodol hwnnw.

#### Twristiaeth yn y Gogledd

**C2 Mark Isherwood:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gefnogaeth Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer twristiaeth yn y gogledd? OAQ(3)0400(HER)

**C7 Darren Millar:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am lefelau twristiaeth yn y gogledd? OAQ(3)0433(HER)

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Y diwydiant twristiaeth yw'r allwedd i economi'r gogledd. Er mwyn cydnabod hyn, mae Partneriaeth Twristiaeth Gogledd Cymru yn cael y lefel uchaf o gyllid blynyddol o blith yr holl bartneriaethau twristiaeth rhanbarthol. Mae'n defnyddio'r cyllid hwnnw i hyrwyddo



local needs and priorities.

**Mark Isherwood:** Thank you. How do you respond to concerns expressed by the tourism sector in north Wales that delays in the convergence funding programme and, specifically, the INTERREG programme have led to opportunities being lost over the last year and that this continues to be the case as we move rapidly through the tourist season this year? Instead of retaining people with knowledge, contracts are being ended and, when they finally go ahead, they will have to start with completely new people on a huge learning curve with massive disruption to the programme.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** You referred to convergence funding, which only came into existence this year. Therefore, halfway through the year, it is difficult to accept your criticism that there has been slow uptake in terms of convergence bids. Visit Wales has a number of bids already on the Welsh European Funding Office website, and it is making progress with those bids, which will be some of the first bids to be implemented.

1.20 p.m.

When you are moving from one system of funding to another, there is a gap, but we are trying to ensure that that does not have an adverse effect on tourism in north Wales or anywhere else. I was glad to announce recently the £4.2 million of additional money that has become available because of the exchange rate between the pound and the euro, and that will be used for marketing—it is being used for that purpose at the moment. I referred earlier to Tourism Partnership North Wales. It has received £980,000, more than any other region in Wales. Therefore, I think that you must accept that the partnership is doing all that it can to ensure that every opportunity is taken to promote tourism in north Wales.

**Darren Millar:** I am pleased to see that you are reading the right answers today, Minister, given your gaffe at the Wales Book of the Year awards last night.

a datblygu twristiaeth yn y rhanbarth yn ôl anghenion a blaenoriaethau lleol.

**Mark Isherwood:** Diolch. Sut yr ydych yn ymateb i bryderon a fynegwyd gan y sector twristiaeth yn y gogledd bod oedi yn y rhaglen cyllid cydgyfeirio ac, yn benodol, y rhaglen INTERREG, wedi arwain at golli cyfleoedd dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf a bod hyn yn dal yn wir wrth inni brysur fynd drwy'r tymor twristiaid eleni? Yn hytrach na chadw pobl â gwybodaeth, mae contractau'n dod i ben, a phan fyddant yn mynd ymlaen o'r diwedd, bydd yn rhaid iddynt ddechrau gyda phobl newydd sbon a fydd yn gorfod dysgu'n gyflym gan amharu'n fawr ar y rhaglen.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Cyfeiriasoch at gyllid cydgyfeirio, nad yw ond wedi bod ar gael eleni. Felly, hanner ffordd drwy'r flwyddyn, mae'n anodd derbyn eich beirniadaeth y bu hi'n araf yng nghyswllt ceisiadau cydgyfeirio. Mae gan Croeso Cymru nifer o geisiadau ar wefan Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru'n barod, ac y mae'n symud ymlaen gyda'r ceisiadau hynny, a fydd yn rhai o'r ceisiadau cyntaf i gael eu rhoi ar waith.

Pan fyddwch yn symud o un system cyllido i un arall, ceir bwloch, ond yr ydym yn ceisio sicrhau na chaiff hynny effaith andwyol ar dwristiaeth yn y gogledd nac yn unman arall. Yr oeddwn yn falch o gyhoeddi'n ddiweddar y £4.2 miliwn o arian ychwanegol a fydd ar gael oherwydd y gyfradd gyfnewid rhwng y bunt a'r ewro, a bydd hwnnw'n cael ei ddefnyddio ar gyfer marchnata—mae'n cael ei ddefnyddio ar gyfer hynny ar hyn o bryd. Cyfeiriais yn gynharach at Bartneriaeth Twristiaeth Gogledd Cymru. Mae wedi cael £980,000, sy'n fwy nag unrhyw ranbarth arall yng Nghymru. Felly, yr wyf yn meddwl ei bod yn rhaid ichi dderbyn bod y bartneriaeth yn gwneud popeth yn ei gallu i sicrhau yr achubir ar bob cyfle i hyrwyddo twristiaeth yn y gogledd.

**Darren Millar:** Yr wyf yn falch o weld eich bod yn darllen yr atebion cywir heddiw, Weinidog, ac ystyried eich camgymeriad yng ngwobrau Llyfr y Flwyddyn Cymru neithiwr.

The Caravan Club is in the Senedd today, therefore will you join me in congratulating the club on its work in promoting caravanning and camping and acknowledge the contribution that caravanning and camping can make to reducing carbon emissions by getting people to switch from taking flights for holidays overseas to caravanning and camping in this country, given the excellent quality of the campsites and caravan sites in north Wales, particularly in my constituency?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I am sorry that you should take that attitude to the incident at the Wales Book of the Year awards last night. It was a misunderstanding and a genuine mistake, for which I took full responsibility. It is a serious situation, which affected a number of people who had been nominated for a very important prize. We should all accept that it has happened. I take full responsibility for it. I have apologised to Academi and to all of the authors involved, and I have written to them again today to apologise. It was a genuine mistake and a misunderstanding. These things happen and, as a Minister, I take full responsibility.

Returning to your point about tourism in north Wales, the tourism partnership grant, which I referred to, goes towards a number of schemes. We are talking about Golf North Wales, Adventure North Wales, Walking North Wales, and Giants North Wales, which is a culture and heritage campaign. North Wales is also capitalising on Liverpool being the European Capital of Culture 2008. The Assembly Government, through Visit Wales, continues to support marketing area partnerships for Llandudno and Colwyn Bay, Rhyl and Prestatyn, the Snowdonia mountains and the coast, the isle of Anglesey, and the north Wales borderlands. We are promoting and supporting a whole range of campaigns to promote opportunities for tourism in north Wales.

**Alun Davies:** Minister, I invite you to meet Mid Wales Tourism, which represents 600 businesses across Powys, Ceredigion and

Mae'r Clwb Carafanwyr yn y Senedd heddiw, felly a wnewch ymuno â mi i longyfarch y clwb ar ei waith yn hyrwyddo carafanio a gwerysyla a chydabod y cyfraniad y mae carafanio a gwerysyla'n gallu ei wneud i leihau allyriadau carbon drwy gael pobl i newid o hedfan am wyliau tramor i garafanio a gwerysyla yn y wlad hon, ac ystyried ansawdd gwych y safleoedd gwerysyla a charafannau yn y gogledd, yn enwedig yn fy etholaeth?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae'n ddrwg gennych eich bod yn cymryd yr agwedd honno at y digwyddiad yng ngwobrau Llyfr y Flwyddyn Cymru neithiwr. Yr oedd yn gamddealltwriaeth ac yn gamgymeriad gwirioneddol yr wyf wedi derbyn cyfrifoldeb llawn amdano. Mae'n sefyllfa ddifrifol a effeithiodd ar nifer o bobl a oedd wedi cael eu henwebu am wobwr bwysig iawn. Dylem i gyd dderbyn ei fod wedi digwydd. Yr wyf yn derbyn cyfrifoldeb llawn amdano. Yr wyf wedi ymddiheuro i Academi ac i'r holl awduron dan sylw, ac yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu atynt eto heddiw i ymddiheuro. Yr oedd yn gamgymeriad gwirioneddol ac yn gamddealltwriaeth. Mae'r pethau hyn yn digwydd ac, fel Gweinidog, yr wyf yn derbyn cyfrifoldeb yn llawn.

A dychwelyd at eich pwynt am dwristiaeth yn y gogledd, mae'r grant partneriaeth twristiaeth, y cyfeiriais ato, yn mynd at nifer o gynlluniau. Yr ydym yn siarad am Golff Gogledd Cymru, Antur Gogledd Cymru, Cerdded Gogledd Cymru a Chewri Gogledd Cymru, sy'n ymgyrch diwylliant a threftadaeth. Mae gogledd Cymru hefyd yn manteisio ar y ffaith mai Lerpwl yw Prifddinas Diwylliant Ewrop 2008. Drwy Croeso Cymru mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn parhau i gefnogi marchnata partneriaethau ardal ar gyfer Llandudno a Bae Colwyn, y Rhyl a Phrestatyn, mynyddoedd ac arfordir Eryri, Ynys Môn, a gororau gogledd Cymru. Yr ydym yn hyrwyddo ac yn cefnogi ystod lawn o ymgyrchoedd i hyrwyddo cyfleoedd ar gyfer twristiaeth yn y gogledd.

**Alun Davies:** Weinidog, yr wyf yn eich gwahodd i gwrdd â Thwristiaeth Canolbarth Cymru, sy'n cynrychioli 600 o fusnesau

Gwynedd. It has some concerns about the support from the Welsh Assembly Government in terms of the future growth in the marketing budget and how the Visit Wales website is working. Some of its businesses are concerned that the Visit Wales website is not currently achieving its potential and that there are real losses taking place as a result. At the same time, there is a real nervousness that the growth that you have spoken about, which has been appreciated in terms of the marketing budgets, will not be able to be sustained in future.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I am happy to discuss that matter further with you, Alun, and meet whichever tourism organisations you think would be relevant to that discussion. If there is further work that can be done in order to gain the full potential, not only of the Visit Wales website, but also of the whole marketing campaign, I am more than happy to discuss those issues with you.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I am delighted that Tourism Partnership North Wales is having some funding, but North Wales Tourism is another body, of which I am sure that you are aware, which speaks on behalf of its members. I understand from North Wales Tourism that there is some concern about the Invest Wales scheme in relation to smaller business. As you aware, smaller businesses probably need more support than the established industry. There was also a concern that some of this big pot might go outside the tourist industry. Can you give us your assurance that you will look after the little people who are working hard and are important in the tourism equation in north Wales?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Certainly. There are a number of people who contribute greatly to tourism in north Wales and other parts of Wales who run comparatively small businesses. Darren Millar referred earlier to caravanning. There is a reception here later today with the Wales Tourism Alliance and the Caravan Club. A number of those businesses are small caravan sites but they contribute a great deal. The way forward is

ledled Powys, Ceredigion a Gwynedd. Mae ganddo rai pryderon ynghylch y gefnogaeth gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o ran twf yn y gyllideb farchnata yn y dyfodol a sut y mae gwefan Croeso Cymru'n gweithio. Mae rhai o'i fusnesau'n poeni nad yw gwefan Croeso Cymru'n cyflawni ei botensial ar hyn o bryd a bod colledion go iawn yn digwydd o ganlyniad i hynny. Ar yr un pryd, ceir gwir nerfusrwydd na fydd y twf yr ydych wedi sôn amdano, sydd wedi cael ei werthfawrogi o ran y cyllidebau marchnata, yn gallu cael ei gynnal yn y dyfodol.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr wyf yn fodlon trafod y mater hwnnw ymhellach gyda chi, Alun, a chwrdd â pha fudiadau twristiaeth bynnag yr ydych yn meddwl a fyddai'n berthnasol i'r drafodaeth honno. Os oes rhagor o waith y gellir ei wneud er mwyn manteisio'n llawn, nid yn unig ar wefan Croeso Cymru, ond ar yr holl ymgyrch farchnata hefyd, yr wyf yn fwy na bodlon trafod y materion hynny gyda chi.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yr wyf wrth fy modd bod Partneriaeth Twristiaeth Gogledd Cymru yn cael rhywfaint o gyllid, ond mae Twristiaeth Gogledd Cymru yn gorff arall, yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn gwybod amdano, sy'n siarad ar ran ei aelodau. Caf ar ddeall gan Dwristiaeth Gogledd Cymru bod rhywfaint o bryder ynghylch y Cynllun Buddsoddi Cymru yng nghyswllt busnesau llai. Fel y gwyddoch, mae'n debyg bod angen mwy o gefnogaeth ar fusnesau llai na'r diwydiant sydd wedi ennill ei blwyf. Yr oedd pryder hefyd y gallai rhywfaint o'r pwrs mawr hwn fynd y tu allan i'r diwydiant twristiaeth. A allwch ein sicrhau y byddwch yn gofalu am y bobl fach sy'n gweithio'n galed ac sy'n bwysig i'r hafaliad twristiaeth yn y gogledd?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yn sicr. Ceir nifer o bobl sy'n cyfrannu'n fawr at dwristiaeth yn y gogledd a rhannau eraill o Gymru sy'n rhedeg busnesau cymharol fach. Cyfeiriodd Darren Millar yn gynharach at garafanio. Ceir derbyniad yma yn ddiweddarach heddiw gyda Chynghrair Twristiaeth Cymru a'r Clwb Carafanwyr. Mae nifer o'r busnesau hynny yn safleoedd carafannau bach ond mae eu cyfraniad yn fawr. Drwy'r bartneriaeth

through the tourism partnership and bringing everyone—the larger and smaller players—together to ensure that we maximise opportunities. I can assure you that we value greatly the contribution made by some of those smaller organisations in terms of tourism.

**Gareth Jones:** Mae'r Comisiwn Digwyddiadau, fel y gwyddoch, yn helpu i drefnu a hysbysebu rhai o brif ddigwyddiadau diwylliannol a chwaraeon yn y gogledd, megis Eisteddfod Gerddorol Ryngwladol Llangollen, Gŵyl y Faenol, Sioe Amaethyddol Môn, Criced Morgannwg, ac un o'm ffefrynnau, Cwpan Ryder Ewropeaidd Agored ar gyfer Golffwyr Hŷn a fynychais yn ddiweddar yng Nghonwy. Yr oeddwn yno fel aelod o'r cyhoedd; nid oeddwn yn cystadlu. A wnewch chi ymuno â mi wrth ganmol ymdrechion y comisiwn hyd yn hyn, a chyflwyno'ch sylwadau ar yr adroddiad terfynol ar strategaeth digwyddiadau gogledd Cymru a gyhoeddwyd gan BIC Innovation? Mae'n argymhell y dylid dal at staff hŷn ac, yn enwedig, arbenigedd Comisiwn Digwyddiadau i'r gogledd os am gyflawni'r strategaeth. Beth yw'r amserlen, a sut y byddwch yn dal at yr aelodau staff allweddol i sicrhau gwireddu cynlluniau i gynyddu incwm o ddigwyddiadau yn y gogledd o £40 miliwn i £50 miliwn dros y pum mlynedd nesaf?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr oeddwn yn barod i'th longyfarch, Gareth, am gymryd rhan yn y gystadleuaeth golff. Mae'n siŵr gennyf dy fod yn gymwys o ran oedran a gallu i chwarae golff. [*Chwerthin.*] Serch hynny, bu'n ddigwyddiad hynod o lwyddiannus gan fod cydweithredu yno.

O ran y cwestiwn ehangach am y Comisiwn Digwyddiadau yng ngogledd Cymru, ariennid y comisiwn drwy Amcan 1 ac arian cyfatebol gan Gyngor Gwynedd. Nid oedd arian uniongyrchol gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru er ein bod wedi gweithio gyda'r comisiwn i ariannu ar y cyd rai digwyddiadau megis Gŵyl y Faenol. Mae'r arian Amcan 1 yn dod i ben ac y mae'r Comisiwn Digwyddiadau yn awr yn ceisio cael arian o ffynonellau eraill. Yr ydym yn monitro'r datblygiadau hynny'n ofalus. Yr

twristiaeth a drwy ddod â phawb—yn fawr ac yn fach—ynghyd i sicrhau ein bod yn cynyddu'r cyfleoedd, yw'r ffordd ymlaen. Gallaf eich sicrhau ein bod yn gwerthfawrogi'n fawr y cyfraniad a wneir gan rai o'r sefydliadau llai hynny yng nghyswllt twristiaeth.

**Gareth Jones:** The Events Commission, as you know, assists in organising and advertising some of the main cultural and sporting events in north Wales, such as Llangollen International Musical Eisteddfod, the Faenol Festival, Anglesey Agricultural Show, Glamorgan Cricket, and one of my favourites, the Ryder Cup European Seniors Open, which I attended recently in Conwy. I was there as a member of the public; I was not there as a competitor. Will you join me in praising the efforts of the commission to date, and present your observations on the final report on the north Wales events strategy published by BIC Innovation? It recommends that senior staff should be retained and, in particular, the expertise of the Events Commission in north Wales if the strategy is to be achieved. What is the timescale and how would you retain key staff members to ensure that plans can be realised to increase income from events in north Wales from £40 million to £50 million over the next five years?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I was prepared to congratulate you, Gareth, on participating in the golf competition. I am sure that you would have been eligible in age and in your competence to play golf. [*Laughter.*] However, it was an exceptionally successful event as there was such a lot of collaboration there.

In terms of the broader question on the Events Commission in north Wales, the commission was funded through Objective 1 and match funding by Gwynedd Council. There was no direct funding from the Welsh Assembly Government although we have collaborated with the commission to jointly fund some events such as the Faenol Festival. The Objective 1 funding is to be discontinued and the Events Commission is now looking at alternative sources of funding. We are monitoring those developments carefully. I

wyf yn llwyr gytuno bod y comisiwn wedi bod yn llwyddiannus a bod gogledd Cymru wedi elwa'n helaeth o'i weithgareddau.

**Alun Davies:** To go back to the whole question of internet marketing, many tourist operators are confident about how the offline marketing is being done at present, although there are concerns about the future. In my experience, however, many operators have real concerns about the online marketing, particularly in terms of the relationship and interface between the Visit Wales and VisitBritain websites where, I believe, there have been difficulties in the past. Many operators would appreciate an effort from you to ensure that these websites work well together and promote the whole of Wales and businesses within Wales.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I take on board the point that you make about integrated websites. We are looking at ways of improving the Visit Wales website. Again, I am happy to have those discussions with you. If you or those who have contacted you are able to furnish me with information that might be useful in moving that forward, I would be glad to have it.

#### Cymdeithas Bêl-droed Cymru

**C3 David Lloyd:** Pa drafodaethau diweddar y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael gyda Chymdeithas Bêl-droed Cymru? OAQ(3)0401(HER)

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Er fy mod yn cynnal cyfarfodydd cyson gyda Chymdeithas Bêl-droed Cymru, nid wyf wedi cynnal unrhyw drafodaethau diweddar gyda'r gymdeithas.

**David Lloyd:** Yr ydym eisoes wedi clywed am eich diddordeb mewn pêl-droed a Chlwb Pêl-droed Wrecsam. Yn naturiol, yr ydych yn ymwybodol o gystadleuaeth Euro 2008 yr wythnos diwethaf. Amcangyfrifir fod pencampwriaeth Ewrop wedi dod â buddiannau economaidd i Awstria a'r Swistir o dros €359 miliwn yr un. O ystyried bod gennym ni Wrecsam, Stadiwm y Mileniwm a Stadiwm Liberty yn Abertawe, a'r ffaith bod stadia newydd yn cael eu hadeiladu yng Nghaerdydd a Llanelli, mae Cymru mewn

completely agree with you that the commission has been a great success and that north Wales has benefited greatly from its activities.

**Alun Davies:** A dychwelyd at gwestiwn marchnata ar y rhyngwrwyd, mae nifer o weithredwyr twristiaeth yn hyderus ynghylch y ffordd y caiff y marchnata all-lein ei wneud ar hyn o bryd, er bod pryderon ynghylch y dyfodol. O'm profiad i, fodd bynnag, mae nifer o weithredwyr yn poeni am y marchnata ar-lein, yn enwedig o ran y berthynas a'r rhyngwyneb rhwng gwefannau Croeso Cymru a VisitBritain lle y credaf y bu anawsterau yn y gorffennol. Byddai nifer o weithredwyr yn gwerthfawrogi ymdrech gennych i sicrhau bod y gwefannau hyn yn gweithio'n dda gyda'i gilydd ac yn hyrwyddo Cymru gyfan a busnesau yng Nghymru.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr wyf yn derbyn y pwynt a wnewch am wefannau integredig. Yr ydym yn edrych ar ffyrdd o wella gwefan Croeso Cymru. Unwaith eto, yr wyf yn fodlon cael y trafodaethau hynny gyda chi. Os gallwch chi, neu'r rheini sydd wedi cysylltu â chi, roi'r wybodaeth imi a allai fod yn ddefnyddiol i symud hynny ymlaen, byddwn yn falch o'i chael.

#### The Football Association of Wales

**Q3 David Lloyd:** What recent discussions has the Minister had with the Football Association of Wales? OAQ(3)0401(HER)

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Although I meet regularly with the Football Association of Wales, I have not held any recent discussions with the association.

**David Lloyd:** We have already heard about your interest in football and Wrexham Football Club. Naturally, you will be aware of the Euro 2008 championship last week. It is thought that the European championship has brought economic benefits to Austria and Switzerland of over €359 million each. Given that we have Wrexham, the Millennium Stadium and the Liberty Stadium in Swansea and that new stadia are being built in Cardiff and Llanelli, Wales is in a strong position to bid for the European championship in 2016.

sefyllfa gref i wneud cais am bencampwriaeth Ewrop yn 2016. A ydych mewn sefyllfa i ymrwymo i gefnogi cais gan Gymdeithas Bêl-droed Cymru i gynnal y gystadleuaeth ar y cyd gyda'r Alban yn 2016?

Are you in a position to commit to support a bid by the Football Association of Wales to hold the competition jointly with Scotland in 2016?

1.30 p.m.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae Cymdeithas Bêl-droed Cymru ar hyn o bryd yn cynnal trafodaethau gyda Chymdeithas Bêl-droed yr Alban ynglŷn â'r posibilrwydd o gyflwyno cais, ac mae'r datblygiad hwnnw'n gyffrous iawn, ac mae'r posibiladau'n rhai cyffrous hefyd. Fel yr ydych eisoes wedi sôn, Dai, mae modd i elwa'n sylweddol o hynny. Byddai hefyd yn cyd-fynd â'n strategaeth o ddod â chystadlaethau rhyngwladol o'r safon uchaf i Gymru. Eisoes yr haf hwn, yr ydym wedi gweld cwpan rygbi'r byd dan 20 yn dod i bob rhan o Gymru, a bydd cyfres y Llundw yn dod i'r Stadiwm Swalec newydd yng Nghaerdydd yn ystod y flwyddyn nesaf, a daw Cwpan Ryder i Gymru yn 2010. Edrychaf ymlaen yn fawr at glywed am ddatblygiadau. Ar hyn o bryd, nid oes cais ac, wrth rheswm, byddai angen imi weld y cais cyn fy mod yn gallu ymrwymo i'w gefnogi, ond yr wyf yn cadw llygad ar ddatblygiadau a'r trafodaethau rhwng Cymdeithas Bêl-droed Cymru a Chymdeithas Bêl-droed yr Alban.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** The FAW is currently in discussion with the Scottish Football Association regarding the possibility of making a bid, and that development is very exciting, and the possibilities are also exciting. As you have already said, Dai, we could benefit greatly from that. It would also be in accordance with our strategy of bringing major international competitions to Wales. Already this summer we have seen the under-20 rugby world cup coming to all parts of Wales, and the Ashes series will be coming to the new Swalec Stadium in Cardiff during the next year, and the Ryder Cup will come to Wales in 2010. I look forward to hearing about developments. At present, there is no bid and, naturally, I would need to see the bid before I could commit to supporting it, but I am keeping a close eye on developments and the discussions between the FAW and the Scottish FA.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** In the 'One Wales' document published last year, you highlighted the aspiration that the Government would seek to address the shortfall in coaches in sport, in particular, football, rugby and other participation sport. Will you inform us how you are progressing that initiative, and of the sort of capacity increase that you envisage being on the ground by 2011, at the end of the One Wales Government's term, so that sport can benefit at grass-roots level from dedicated coaches, with professional coaching qualifications?

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Yn y ddogfen 'Cymru'n Un' a gyhoeddwyd y llynedd, yr oeddech yn tynnu sylw at y dyhead y byddai'r Llywodraeth yn ceisio rhoi sylw i'r prinder hyfforddwyr chwaraeon, yn enwedig pêl-droed, rygbi a chwaraeon eraill y mae pobl yn cymryd rhan ynddynt. A wnewch roi gwybod inni sut yr ydych yn mynd â'r fenter honno rhagddi, a'r math o gynnydd mewn capasiti yr ydych yn rhagweld a fydd ar lawr gwlad erbyn 2011, ar ddiwedd tymor Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un, er mwyn i chwaraeon elwa ar lefel llawr gwlad yn sgil hyfforddwyr pwrpasol sydd â chymwysterau hyfforddi proffesiynol?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** We have made that commitment, and we are working to deliver on it. Over the last few weeks, I have had discussions with a number of sporting organisations, including the Sports Council

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr ydym wedi gwneud yr ymrwymiad hwnnw, ac yr ydym yn gweithio i'w gyflawni. Dros yr ychydig wythnosau diwethaf, yr wyf wedi cael trafodaethau gyda nifer o sefydliadau

for Wales, on how we can develop the number of sporting coaches in Wales. One of the difficulties that has arisen is that a number of organisations are finding it difficult to cope with the bureaucratic burden of meeting the criteria of both the Criminal Records Bureau and the ICA, and the fact that coaches who work for more than one organisation have to go through that process every time with each organisation. I have written to Gerry Sutcliffe, the Minister with responsibility for sport at Westminster, and raised this issue with him, as I did when we last had our UK ministerial meeting. So, we will be working to deliver on that commitment, and I will keep you informed about developments.

**Lesley Griffiths:** Following on from Dai Lloyd's question, I was very pleased with your comments on the possible joint bid for Euro 2016. While I appreciate that there is no bid at the moment, will you join me today in urging both the Football Association of Wales and the Scottish Football Association to have talks with UK Sport to see whether there is a possibility of it helping with the funding of such a joint bid?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** As I said, I understand that those discussions are ongoing and I know that the Football Association of Wales is enthusiastic about the potential of a bid. As a Government, we look forward to seeing the development of that bid, and I hope that every possible avenue will be explored in terms of financial support.

#### Twristiaeth Ddiwydiannol

**C4 Alun Ffred Jones:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cynnal i ddatblygu Llanberis fel canolfan allweddol i dwristiaeth ddiwydiannol? OAQ(3)0399(HER)

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae Amgueddfa Lechi Cymru yn Llanberis yn parhau i chwarae rhan amlwg yn y broses o hybu twristiaeth yn yr ardal, ac yr oedd ymysg y materion a drafodwyd gennyf yn fy nghyfarfod gyda swyddogion Amgueddfa Cymru ar 24 Mehefin.

chwaraeon, gan gynnwys Cyngor Chwaraeon Cymru, ynghylch sut y gallwn ddatblygu nifer yr hyfforddwyr chwaraeon yng Nghymru. Un o'r anawsterau sydd wedi codi yw bod nifer o sefydliadau'n ei chael hi'n anodd ymdopi â baich biwrocraidd diwallu meini prawf y Swyddfa Cofnodion Troseddol a'r ICA ill dau, a'r ffaith ei bod yn rhaid i hyfforddwyr sy'n gweithio i fwy nag un sefydliad fynd drwy'r broses honno bob tro gyda phob sefydliad. Yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at Gerry Sutcliffe, y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am chwaraeon yn San Steffan, ac wedi codi'r mater hwn ag ef, fel yr oeddwn wedi'i wneud y tro diwethaf inni gael ein cyfarfod Gweinidogion DU. Felly, byddwn yn gweithio i gyflawni'r ymrwymiad hwnnw, a byddaf yn rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf ichi am ddatblygiadau.

**Lesley Griffiths:** Yn dilyn cwestiwn Dai Lloyd, yr oeddwn yn falch iawn o'ch sylwadau ynghylch y cais posibl ar y cyd ar gyfer Euro 2016. Er fy mod yn gwerthfawrogi nad oes cais ar hyn o bryd, a wnewch ymuno â mi heddiw i annog Cymdeithas Bêl-droed Cymru a Chymdeithas Bêl-droed yr Alban i siarad â UK Sport i weld a yw'n bosibl iddo helpu i gyllido cais ar y cyd o'r fath?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Fel y dywedais, caf ar ddeall bod y trafodaethau hynny'n parhau a gwn fod Cymdeithas Bêl-droed Cymru yn frwdfrydig ynghylch potensial cais. Fel Llywodraeth, yr ydym yn edrych ymlaen at weld y cais hwnnw'n cael ei ddatblygu, a gobeithiaf y dilynir pob trywydd posibl yng nghyswllt cefnogaeth ariannol.

#### Industrial Tourism

**Q4 Alun Ffred Jones:** What discussions has the Minister had on developing Llanberis as a key centre for industrial tourism? OAQ(3)0399(HER)

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** The National Slate Museum at Llanberis continues to play an active role in promoting tourism in the area and was among the issues that I discussed with National Museum Wales officials on 24 June.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Bu i chi gyfeirio at Amgueddfa Lechi Cymru yn Llanberis sydd, yn eithriadol o lwyddiannus ac yn denu dros 100,000 o bobl bob blwyddyn. Mae'r atyniadau sy'n seiliedig ar y diwydiant llechi drwy Wynedd i gyd—gan gynnwys y rheilffyrdd bach a adeiladwyd yn wreiddiol er mwyn cario'r llechi i lawr i'r porthladdoedd—yn denu mwy na 1 miliwn o bobl y flwyddyn. A fydddech yn gefnogol i gais ar gyfer arian cydgyfeiriant er mwyn inni allu manteisio ar y cyfleoedd yn yr atyniadau hyn, nid yn unig i ddenu mwy o ymwelwyr i'r ardal, ond hefyd i addysgu'r ymwelwyr am hanes a thraddodiadau'r ardal ac am ei diwylliant, o ran y gorffennol a'r presennol?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Cefais gyfle i ymweld â safle Amgueddfa Cymru yn Llanberis a chefais gyfle hefyd i ymweld â'r ysbyty sydd yno. Mae gan yr ysbyty stori arbennig i'w dweud ynglŷn â datblygiadau ym maes meddyginiaeth ac yn arbennig meddyginiaeth yn ymwneud â damweiniau ac anafiadau a oedd yn gysylltiedig â'r diwydiant chwareli. Cytunaf yn llwyr â'r hyn yr ydych wedi ei ddweud. Mae angen i ni gefnogi'r safleoedd hyn—bydd Amgueddfa Cymru, sy'n gweithredu ar saith safle, yn derbyn £25 miliwn o gymorth oddi wrth y Llywodraeth yng nghyllideb 2008-09, a gobeithiaf y bydd hynny yn ei galluogi i ddatblygu'i safleoedd, gan gynnwys hwnnw yn Llanberis—ond y peth pwysig yw bod pob safle yn dweud yr hanes, nid yn unig ar gyfer ymwelwyr, ond ar gyfer y bobl sy'n byw yn yr ardal hefyd.

### Broadcasting

**Q5 Alun Cairns:** Will the Minister make a statement on the broadcasting of Welsh-related issues in Wales? OAQ(3)0425(HER)

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Ar y cyfan, teimlaf fod gan Gymru nifer o raglenni sy'n ymdrin â materion Cymreig. Bydd yn bwysig sicrhau bod y nifer amrywiol hwn yn parhau i gael ei ddarlledu.

**Alun Cairns:** Cytunaf fod darlledu yng Nghymru, ar y cyfan, yn gefnogol iawn i ni'r Cymry ac yn adlewyrchu anghenion

**Alun Ffred Jones:** You referred to the Welsh Slate Museum in Llanberis, which is exceptionally successful and attracts over 100,000 people every year. The attractions based on the slate industry throughout the whole of Gwynedd—including the narrow gauge railways that were originally built to carry slate down to the ports—attract more than 1 million people a year. Would you be supportive of a bid for convergence funding so that we could take advantage of the opportunities in these attractions, not only to attract more visitors to the area, but also to educate visitors about the history and traditions of the area and about its culture, past and present?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I had the opportunity to visit the National Museum Wales site in Llanberis and I also had an opportunity to visit the hospital there. The hospital has a special story to tell about developments in the field of medicine and especially about medicine with regard to accidents and injuries that were connected to the slate industry. I agree completely with what you said. We need to support these sites—National Museum Wales, which operates on seven sites, is receiving £25 million of assistance from the Government in the 2008-09 budget, and I hope that that will enable it to develop its sites, including that in Llanberis—but the important thing is that every site tells the history, not only for visitors but for people living in the area too.

### Darlledu

**C5 Alun Cairns:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddarlledu materion sy'n ymwneud â Chymru yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)0425(HER)

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** On the whole, I believe that Wales has several programmes that deal with Welsh issues. It will be important to ensure that the plurality of existing coverage is maintained.

**Alun Cairns:** I agree that broadcasting in Wales, on the whole, is very supportive of us as the people of Wales and reflects the needs



gwylwyr, gwleidyddion a phawb arall. Pa astudiaeth y mae'r Gweinidog wedi ymgymryd â hi i ymchwilio i ddarlledu o Gymru ledled y Deyrnas Unedig, er enghraifft ar raglenni newyddion 10 p.m. ar ITV ac ar BBC, er mwyn sicrhau bod straeon positif o Gymru yn cael eu darlledu ledled y Deyrnas Unedig fel bod pobl o'r Alban, Lloegr a Gogledd Iwerddon yn sylweddoli bod gwahaniaethau gwleidyddol a diwylliannol rhyngom?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf, yr wyf wedi cael cyfarfodydd â Mark Thompson, cyfarwyddwr cyffredinol y BBC, a Michael Grade, sy'n dal swydd gyfatebol gydag ITV. Yr wyf wedi gwneud yr union bwyntiau hynny ynglŷn â chynnwys rhaglenni newyddion gyda hwy, sef bod yn rhaid i raglenni newyddion adlewyrchu'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn y gwledydd datganoledig eraill, felly nid yn unig yng Nghymru, ond hefyd yn yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon. Fel y gwŷr pawb, mae Ymddiriedolaeth y BBC wedi cyhoeddi ei hadolygiad ar y sefyllfa hon. Cefais gyfle i gyflwyno tystiolaeth i'r Athro Anthony King ar gyfer yr adolygiad hwnnw, ac yr wyf wedi trafod y mater â Michael Lyons, cadeirydd yr ymddiriedolaeth. Yr wyf hefyd wedi trefnu cyfarfodydd pellach gyda Michael Lyons a Mark Thompson.

Yr wyf hefyd yn edrych ymlaen yn fawr at weld adroddiad pwyllgor y Cynulliad a sefydlwyd, dan gadeiryddiaeth Alun Davies, i edrych ar ddarlledu. Cefais gyfle i gyflwyno tystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor hwnnw, a chredaf y cyhoeddir yr adroddiad hwnnw ar 16 Gorffennaf. Bydd gan yr adroddiad hwnnw ran i'w chwarae wrth i mi ystyried beth yn union fydd ymateb swyddogol Llywodraeth Cymru i'r materion hyn oll.

1.40 p.m.

### Public Service Broadcasting

**Q6 Peter Black:** Will the Minister make a statement on what representations he has made with regard to public service broadcasting on commercial channels in Wales? OAQ(3)0424(HER)

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** We have made many

of viewers, politicians, and everyone else. What study has the Minister undertaken into broadcasting from Wales across the United Kingdom, for example on the 10 p.m. news programmes on ITV and BBC, to ensure that positive stories from Wales are broadcast across the United Kingdom so that the people of Scotland, England and Northern Ireland realise that there are political and cultural differences between us?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** During the last months, I have had meetings with Mark Thompson, the director-general of the BBC, and Michael Grade, who holds a corresponding position with ITV. I have made exactly those points regarding the content of news programmes to them, namely that news programmes must reflect what is happening in the other devolved nations, so not only in Wales, but in Scotland and Northern Ireland too. As everyone knows, the BBC Trust has published its review of this situation. I had the opportunity to present evidence to Professor Anthony King for that review, and I have discussed the matter with Michael Lyons, the chair of the trust. I have also organised further meetings with Michael Lyons and Mark Thompson.

I also look forward to seeing the report of the Assembly committee, chaired by Alun Davies, that was set up to look at broadcasting. I had an opportunity to present evidence to that committee, and I believe that its report will be published on 16 July. That report will have a role to play as I consider what exactly the Welsh Government's official response will be to all these matters.

### Darlledu Gwasanaeth Cyhoeddus

**C6 Peter Black:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y sylwadau y mae wedi'u gwneud ynghylch darlledu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus ar sianeli masnachol yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)0424(HER)

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr ydym wedi

representations on this matter, and I have made clear my concerns that the existing level of plurality should be upheld.

**Peter Black:** I know from what you have told the Broadcasting Committee that you are in the process of drawing up a Government strategy on broadcasting. However, Ofcom's consultation on the various options available in terms of public service broadcasting may well expire before that strategy is available. Has the Government therefore formally responded to Ofcom's consultation, and if so, what exactly have you told it about the options that it has put before Wales in terms of future public service broadcasting requirements?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I am preparing a response to Ofcom at the moment, and I will be sending it to Ofcom shortly. I will be happy to share the contents of that response with Members as soon as I have sent it to Ofcom.

**Paul Davies:** Mae sicrhau bod cwmnïau fel ITV a'r BBC yn parhau i fod â chyfrifoldebau darlledu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yn hollbwysig er mwyn rhoi dewis go iawn i'r cyhoedd. Mae ITV wedi awgrymu y bydd ei gyfrifoldebau darlledu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yn rhy gostus mewn rhai blynyddoedd, ond mae ffigurau eraill wedi awgrymu bod ei gyfrifoldebau yn costio £9 miliwn, a'i fod yn elwa o ryw £45 miliwn. Beth yw eich barn chi am hyn a sut all y Llywodraeth sicrhau bod lluosogrwydd yn parhau mewn darlledu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Fel y dywedais eisoes, mae lluosogrwydd yn eithriadol o bwysig, ac, oherwydd hynny, mae dyfodol ITV Wales yn bwysig ar gyfer darlledu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Ceisiais sicrhau bod Michael Grade yn ymwybodol bod gan ITV Wales gyfraniad hollbwysig i'w wneud yn y maes hwnnw. Yr wyf wedi gwneud yr un pwynt yn glir wrth Ofcom, ac, yn ei ymgynghoriad, mae Ofcom yn cynnig nifer o ffyrdd ymlaen i ITV Wales. Nid yw'r un ohonynt yn rhwydd, ond bydd yn rhaid eu hystyried i gyd. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o bwysigrwydd ITV Wales o ran

gwneud nifer o sylwadau am y mater hwn, ac yr wyf wedi egluro fy mhryderon y dyldid cynnal y lefel bresennol o ran nifer.

**Peter Black:** Gwn o'r hyn yr ydych wedi'i ddweud wrth y Pwyllgor Darlledu eich bod ar ganol llunio strategaeth Llywodraeth ar ddarlledu. Fodd bynnag, efallai y daw ymgynghoriad Ofcom am y dewisiadau amrywiol sydd ar gael yng nghyswllt darlledu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus i ben cyn i'r strategaeth honno fod ar gael. A yw'r Llywodraeth felly wedi ymateb yn ffurfiol i ymgynghoriad Ofcom, ac os felly, beth yn union ydych wedi'i ddweud wrtho am y dewisiadau y mae wedi'u cyflwyno gerbron Cymru o ran gofynion darlledu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yn y dyfodol?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr wyf yn paratoi ymateb i Ofcom ar hyn o bryd, a byddaf yn ei anfon at Ofcom cyn bo hir. Byddaf yn fodlon rhannu cynnwys yr ymateb hwnnw gydag Aelodau cyn gynted ag y byddaf wedi'i anfon at Ofcom.

**Paul Davies:** Ensuring that companies such as ITV and BBC continue to have public service broadcasting responsibilities is vital in order to give the public a proper choice. ITV has suggested that its public service broadcasting responsibilities will be too costly in a few years' time, but other figures have suggested that its responsibilities cost £9 million, and that it benefits from some £45 million. What is your opinion on this and how the Government can ensure that plurality is maintained in public service broadcasting?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** As I have already said, plurality is exceptionally important and, for that reason, the future of ITV Wales is important for public service broadcasting in Wales. I tried to ensure that Michael Grade was aware that ITV Wales has a vital contribution to make in this area. I have made the same the point clearly to Ofcom, and, in its consultation, Ofcom has offered several ways forward for ITV Wales. None of them is easy, but they will all have to be considered. I am aware of the importance of ITV Wales in terms of there being another significant body in the field of broadcasting

cael corff sylweddol arall ym maes darlledu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus ynghyd â'r BBC. Yr ydym oll yn cydnabod cyfraniad BBC Cymru ac S4C yn y maes hwn, ond mae angen inni sicrhau bod llais arall yn darlledu yng Nghymru.

### Promoting and Supporting Libraries

**Q8 Sandy Mewies:** What is the Assembly Government doing to promote and support libraries in Wales? OAQ(3)0428(HER)

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** On 15 May 2008, I launched the Welsh Assembly Government's strategic document, 'Libraries for Life: Delivering a Modern Library Service for Wales 2008-11', backed by a record level of funding of £10.5 million. A key strand of the programme is the marketing of library services in Wales.

**Sandy Mewies:** Thank you for that, Minister. I am an enthusiastic library user, and I get an excellent service in Flintshire, where I am always pleased to see a whole range of activities going on, such as art exhibitions or exhibitions of other sorts, or computer use. Most important are the books, which sometimes get forgotten. I fully back the plan to attract more people to use their local library, because I am sure that you will agree that reading is one of the main planks of education, enabling people to tap into a vast resource of entertainment, culture and knowledge. It is a facility that I hope the Government will always seek to support and extend.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I totally agree with you that the library service in Wales is an important service, and one that now offers people a wide range of provision. One of the things that have pleasantly surprised me since I have been in office is the fact that so many people in Wales, like you, take advantage of the services offered by local libraries. It is also interesting that the new range of services that are available are not distracting people from reading but are complementing the book-loan provision that is at the heart of the

along with the BBC. We all recognise the contribution of BBC Wales and S4C in this area, but we need to ensure that there is another voice broadcasting in Wales.

### Hyrwyddo a Chefnogi Llyfrgelloedd

**C8 Sandy Mewies:** Beth mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei wneud i hyrwyddo a chefnogi llyfrgelloedd yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)0428(HER)

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Ar 15 Mai 2008, yr oeddwn wedi lansio dogfen strategol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, 'Llyfrgelloedd am Oes: Darparu Gwasanaeth Llyfrgell Modern i Gymru 2008-11', ac mae lefel nas gwelwyd o'r blaen o gyllid, sef £10.5 miliwn, ar gael yn gefn iddi. Rhan allweddol o'r rhaglen yw marchnata gwasanaethau llyfrgelloedd yng Nghymru.

**Sandy Mewies:** Diolch ichi am hynny, Weinidog. Yr wyf yn ddefnyddiwr brwd ar fy llyfrgell, a byddaf yn cael gwasanaeth penigamp yn sir y Fflint, lle byddaf bob amser yn falch o weld ystod lawn o weithgareddau yn mynd rhagddynt, megis arddangosfeydd celf neu arddangosfeydd o fath arall, neu ddefnyddio cyfrifiaduron. Yn anad dim arall mae'r llyfrau, a fydd yn cael eu hanghofio weithiau. Yr wyf yn llawn gefnogi'r cynllun i ddenu rhagor o bobl i ddefnyddio eu llyfrgell leol, oherwydd yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn cytuno mai darllen yw un o brif sylfeini addysg, gan alluogi pobl i fanteisio ar adnoddau enfawr adloniant, diwylliant a gwybodaeth. Mae'n gyfleuster yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd y Llywodraeth bob amser yn ceisio'i gefnogi a'i ymestyn.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr wyf yn cytuno â chi i'r carn bod y gwasanaeth llyfrgelloedd yng Nghymru yn wasanaeth pwysig, ac yn un sydd yn awr yn cynnig ystod eang o ddarpariaeth i bobl. Un o'r pethau a'm synnodd ar yr ochr orau ers imi ddod i'm swydd yw'r ffaith bod cynifer o bobl yng Nghymru, fel chi, yn manteisio ar y gwasanaethau a gynigir gan lyfrgelloedd lleol. Mae'n ddiddorol hefyd nad yw'r ystod newydd o wasanaethau sydd ar gael yn troi pobl oddi wrth ddarllen ond eu bod yn

library service and always has been. Therefore, we can look forward to a flourishing future for libraries in Wales, and, through our investment, we hope that over the next three years we will have ensured that nearly 25 per cent of libraries in Wales will be refurbished, offering the people who visit them a better environment in which to enjoy the services that they offer.

**David Melding:** I have been using libraries since I was seven or eight years old. [*Interruption.*] Perhaps it was even earlier, as I do enjoy reading, research and so on. [*Laughter.*] Over the years, it has been wonderful to see the regeneration of libraries, despite the fact that, 10 or 15 years ago, some people were saying that it was the end of an era for these wonderful local authority libraries. It is a particular advantage for new developments to have an element of dual use, or a variety of uses, such as painting exhibitions, and other community uses, and Barry library is a good example. Libraries can be the hub of intellectual and artistic life in many of our communities. At a time when capital investment is perhaps not as much as we would like it to be, we need to spend rather more wisely on these facilities.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I agree with you, David. The whole point of the refurbishment programme is to open out space in libraries, so that they offer a wider range of provision. It is interesting that the libraries that have been refurbished are tailoring their services to the communities that they serve, and I agree that Barry library is a fine example. Therefore, a wide variety of services is being offered. It is not uniform; it is diverse, and that is important for those local communities. Paul Davies asked me earlier how we could ensure access to museum exhibitions throughout Wales. I referred him to the virtual site, Rhagor. Those people who do not have computers of their own and do not have access to broadband can go to their local library to access those services, and can gain access to museum exhibitions, as well as

ategu'r ddarpariaeth rhoi benthyg llyfrau sydd wrth galon y gwasanaeth llyfrgelloedd ac sydd wedi bod felly ers y cychwyn cyntaf. Felly, gallwn edrych ymlaen at ddyfodol llewyrchus i lyfrgelloedd yng Nghymru, a, drwy ein buddsoddiad, gobeithiwn dros y tair blynedd nesaf y byddwn wedi sicrhau bod bron i 25 y cant o lyfrgelloedd yng Nghymru wedi cael eu hailwampio, gan gynnig amgylchedd gwell i'r bobl sy'n ymweld â hwy er mwyn mwynhau'r gwasanaethau y maent yn eu cynnig.

**David Melding:** Yr wyf wedi bod yn defnyddio llyfrgelloedd er pan oeddwn yn saith neu wyth mlwydd oed. [*Torri ar draws.*] Efallai ei bod yn gynharach byth, gan fy mod yn mwynhau darllen, ymchwilio, ac yn y blaen. [*Chwerthin.*] Dros y blynyddoedd, mae wedi bod yn wych gweld adfywio llyfrgelloedd, er gwaethaf y ffaith bod rhai pobl, 10 neu 15 mlynedd yn ôl, yn dweud bod oes y llyfrgelloedd gwych hyn sydd gan awdurdodau lleol yn dod i ben. Mae'n neilltuol o fanteisiol i ddatblygiadau newydd fod ag elfen o ddefnydd deulol, neu amryw o ddibenion, fel arddangosfeydd o luniau, a dibenion cymunedol eraill, ac mae llyfrgell y Barri'n enghraifft dda. Gall llyfrgelloedd fod yn ganolbwynt i fywyd deallusol a chelfyddydol mewn llawer o'n cymunedau. Ar adeg pan nad oes cymaint o fuddsoddi ar gyfalaf ag y dymunem, o bosibl, mae angen inni wario ychydig yn fwy doeth ar y cyfleusterau hyn.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr wyf yn cytuno â chi, David. Holl amcan y rhaglen adnewyddu yw creu mwy o le mewn llyfrgelloedd, fel eu bod yn cynnig darpariaeth fwy amrywiol. Mae'n ddiddorol bod y llyfrgelloedd sydd wedi'u hadnewyddu'n addasu eu gwasanaethau yn ôl anghenion y cymunedau y maent yn eu gwasanaethu, ac yr wyf yn cytuno bod llyfrgell y Barri'n enghraifft ragorol. Felly, cynigir amrywiaeth fawr o wasanaethau. Nid yw'n unffurf; mae'n amrywiol, ac mae hynny'n bwysig i'r cymunedau lleol hynny. Gofynnodd Paul Davies imi'n gynharach sut y gallem sicrhau mynediad i arddangosfeydd mewn amgueddfeydd ledled Cymru. Tynnais ei sylw at y wefan rith, Rhagor. Mae'r bobl hynny nad oes ganddynt eu cyfrifiaduron eu hunain ac sydd heb fynediad at fand eang yn

many other important resources.

gallu mynd i'w llyfrgell leol i gael mynediad at y gwasanaethau hynny, a gallant gael mynediad i arddangosfeydd mewn amgueddfeydd ac at lawer o adnoddau pwysig eraill.

### UK Transplant

**Q9 Jenny Randerson:** What plans does the Minister have to consult with UK Transplant on increasing its bilingual service provision? OAQ(3)0397(HER)

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I am in discussion with several bodies that are interested in increasing their bilingual provision. I understand that the Welsh Language Board has worked closely with UK Transplant on developing a Welsh language scheme.

**Jenny Randerson:** I encourage you to take a proactive interest in this, because, like many organisations that also operate in Wales, UK Transplant appears to pay too little regard to Welsh-language services. These are particularly sensitive services, which are at the core of life decisions, and it is important that they are available to all in their first language or the language of their choice. The Welsh Assembly Government contributed £562,000 last year to UK Transplant. Can you confirm whether it has yet been named under the Welsh Language Act 1993? If not, how soon do you expect to be able to name it?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** It has not been named as yet under the Welsh Language Act 1993, although, as you will remember, 57 organisations were named some two or three months ago. However, the Welsh Language Board is continuing its discussions with UK Transplant, and, when it can offer a comprehensive Welsh language scheme, we will be in a position to name it under the Act. It may well come under a new Measure created here on the basis of the legislative competence Order, which is to be tabled in Westminster in the autumn. I understand that UK Transplant currently offers bilingual services over the phone, and that all its literature is produced bilingually. However, as a result of your question, I will go back to the Welsh Language Board to get a more comprehensive report on how it is developing

### UK Transplant

**C9 Jenny Randerson:** Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Gweinidog i ymgynghori ag UK Transplant ynghylch cynyddu darpariaeth ei wasanaeth dwyieithog? OAQ(3)0397(HER)

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr wyf mewn trafodaeth â nifer o gyrff sy'n ymddiddori mewn cynyddu eu darpariaeth ddwyieithog. Yr wyf yn deall bod Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg wedi cydweithio'n agos gyda UK Transplant ar ddatblygu cynllun iaith Gymraeg.

**Jenny Randerson:** Yr wyf yn eich annog i ymddiddori'n rhagweithiol yn hyn, oherwydd, fel llawer o gyrff sydd hefyd yn gweithredu yng Nghymru, mae'n ymddangos bod UK Transplant yn rhoi rhy ychydig o sylw i wasanaethau Cymraeg. Mae'r rhain yn wasanaethau neilltuol o sensitif, sydd wrth wraidd penderfyniadau bywyd, ac mae'n bwysig iddynt fod ar gael i bawb yn eu hiaith gyntaf neu eu dewis iaith. Cyfrannodd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru £562,000 y llynedd i UK Transplant. A allwch gadarnhau a yw wedi'i enwi eto dan Ddeddf yr Iaith Gymraeg 1993? Os nad ydyw, pa mor fuan yr ydych yn disgwyl gallu ei enwi?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Nid yw wedi'i enwi eto dan Ddeddf yr Iaith Gymraeg 1993, er bod 57 o gyrff wedi'u henwi, fel y cofiwch, ryw ddau neu dri mis yn ôl. Fodd bynnag, mae Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg yn parhau â'i drafodaethau ag UK Transplant, a phan fydd yn gallu cynnig cynllun iaith Gymraeg cynhwysfawr, byddwn mewn lle i'w enwi dan y Ddeddf. Mae'n ddigon posibl y daw dan Fesur newydd a greir yma ar sail y Gorchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol, a fydd yn cael ei gyflwyno yn San Steffan yn yr hydref. Yr wyf yn deall bod UK Transplant yn cynnig gwasanaethau dwyieithog dros y ffôn ar hyn o bryd, a bod ei holl lenyddiaeth yn ddwyieithog. Er hynny, o ganlyniad i'ch cwestiwn, af yn ôl at Fwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg i gael adroddiad mwy cynhwysfawr am y modd y mae'n

that Welsh language scheme, and I will ensure that you and other Members are made aware of that information.

### Widening Access to the Welsh Language

**Q10 Alun Cairns:** What policies does the Welsh Assembly Government have to help to widen access to the Welsh language? OAQ(3)0434(HER)

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae'r Gymraeg yn ganolog i hunaniaeth Cymru, ac, oherwydd hynny, mae Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un wedi ymrwymo i ddiogelu'r iaith, a chynnig cynifer o gyfleoedd â phosibl i bobl ei defnyddio.

1.50 p.m.

**Alun Cairns:** A ydych yn derbyn ei bod yn gwbl annheg cynnig trafnidiaeth ysgol i ddisgyblion ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg nad yw ar yr un lefel â'r drafnidiaeth sydd ar gael i ddisgyblion ysgolion cyfrwng Saesneg? Onid yw hynny'n tanseilio egwyddorion pob Aelod yn y Cynulliad?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau mynediad i addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg i bob plentyn sy'n dymuno ei chael, ac i'w darparu o fewn pellter rhesymol i'w cartref. Mae honno yn her enfawr i'r Llywodraeth. Rhaid i gynlluniau teithio sy'n cludo plant i ysgolion gyd-fynd â'r dyhead a'r ymrwymiad i addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg a geir yn 'Cymru'n Un'.

**Leanne Wood:** Minister, do you agree that the Assembly's learner travel Measure will provide free transport for more primary school pupils, and will strengthen the protocols for good behaviour on school buses? Do you welcome the initiative that places a specific duty on all local authorities to promote Welsh-medium education, and see it as evidence of the One Wales Government's strong commitment to the Welsh language?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I can only agree with every word, Leanne. The Measure is a vital part of our commitment to ensure access to Welsh-medium education for every child who desires it in Wales, as I stated in my

datblygu'r cynllun iaith Gymraeg hwnnw, a byddaf yn sicrhau y cewch chi ac Aelodau eraill eich hysbysu am y wybodaeth honno .

### Ehangu Mynediad at y Gymraeg

**C10 Alun Cairns:** Pa bolisiau sydd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i helpu i ehangu mynediad at yr iaith Gymraeg? OAQ(3)0434(HER)

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** The Welsh language is central to the identity of Wales, and, as such, the One Wales Government is committed to preserving the language and offering as many opportunities as possible for people to use it.

**Alun Cairns:** Do you accept that it is totally unfair to offer school transport to pupils at Welsh-medium schools that is not on the same level as that provided to pupils at English-medium schools? Does that not undermine the principles of every Member in the Assembly?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** The One Wales Government is committed to ensuring access to Welsh-medium education for every child who wants it, and to provide it within a reasonable distance from their homes. That is a huge challenge for the Government. School travel plans for children must coincide with the aspiration and commitment for Welsh-medium education found in 'One Wales'.

**Leanne Wood:** Weinidog, a ydych yn cytuno y bydd Mesur teithio gan ddysgwyr y Cynulliad yn rhoi cludiant am ddim i fwy o ddisgyblion ysgolion cynradd, ac y bydd yn ategu'r protocolau ar gyfer ymddygiad da ar fysiau ysgol? A ydych yn croesawu'r cynllun sy'n gosod dyletswydd benodol ar yr holl awdurdodau lleol i hyrwyddo addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg, ac yn ei weld yn dystiolaeth o'r ymrwymiad cadarn sydd gan Lywodraeth Cymru'n Un i'r Gymraeg?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Ni allaf ond cytuno â phob gair, Leanne. Mae'r Mesur yn rhan annatod o'n hymrwymiad i sicrhau mynediad i addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg i bob plentyn sy'n ei dymuno yng Nghymru, fel y dywedais yn

response to Alun Cairns.

fy ymateb i Alun Cairns.

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol** **Questions to Minister for Social Justice and Local Government**

### **Anti-social Behaviour**

**Q1 Lorraine Barrett:** What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to work with young people to combat anti-social behaviour? OAQ(3)0429(SJL)

**The Minister for Social Justice and Local Government (Brian Gibbons):** The Welsh Assembly Government's Safer Communities fund is providing £4.5 million to the community safety partnerships during 2008-09 to support the all-Wales youth offending strategy by funding projects that tackle youth crime, including anti-social behaviour, criminal damage and vandalism and supportive interventions that target drug and alcohol misuse.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Thank you for that response, Minister. Anti-social behaviour by young people often happens because there are not enough facilities for them. I have been involved with the Penarth youth project information shop for around 12 years, and I know that it is a continual battle to find new funding every three years, whether it is lottery funding or funding under the community facilities and activities programme. We now have a partnership with the local authority, but we are still struggling to find core funding. Will you give consideration to how successful projects such as ours in Penarth can survive with or without council support? We are told continually that we must change and diversify, but it is a successful project and it is one of the few youth facilities in Penarth, and we are finding it increasingly difficult to find the funding mechanism to keep going.

**Brian Gibbons:** How to achieve sustainability is a common concern across many parts of Wales. It is one reason why the Assembly Government is looking at youth

### **Ymddygiad Gwrthgymdeithasol**

**C1 Lorraine Barrett:** Beth mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i weithio gyda phobl ifanc i fynd i'r afael ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol? OAQ(3)0429(SJL)

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol (Brian Gibbons):** Mae cronfa Cymunedau Diogelach Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn darparu £4.5 miliwn i'r partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol yn ystod 2008-09 i hybu strategaeth troseddwr ifanc Cymru gyfan drwy ariannu prosiectau sy'n delio â throseddau gan bobl ifanc, gan gynnwys ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol, difrod troseddol a fandaliaeth, ac ymyriadau cefnogol sy'n targedu camddefnydd o gyffuriau ac alcohol.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Diolch i chi am yr ymateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Mae ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol gan bobl ifanc yn digwydd yn aml am nad oes digon o gyfleusterau ar eu cyfer. Yr wyf wedi bod yn gysylltiedig â siop wybodaeth prosiect ieuenctid Penarth ers tua 12 mlynedd, a gwn fod ymdrech barhaus i ddod o hyd i gyllid newydd bob tair blynedd, boed yn arian y loteri neu'n arian dan y rhaglen cyfleusterau a gweithgareddau cymunedol. Mae gennym bartneriaeth yn awr â'r awdurdod lleol, ond yr ydym yn dal i'w gael yn anodd dod o hyd i gyllid craidd. A wnewch ystyried sut y bydd prosiectau llwyddiannus fel ein hun ni ym Mhenarth yn gallu parhau gyda chymorth y cyngor neu hebdo? Dywedir wrthym o hyd ei bod yn rhaid inni newid ac arallgyfeirio, ond mae'n brosiect llwyddiannus ac mae'n un o'r ychydig gyfleusterau i bobl ifanc ym Mhenarth, ac yr ydym yn ei chael yn fwyfwy anodd dod o hyd i ddull ariannu i barhau.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae'r modd i sicrhau cynaliadwyedd yn destun pryder cyffredin mewn llawer rhan o Gymru. Mae'n un o'r rhesymau pam y mae Llywodraeth y

policy, because it is much better for young people to have a good start in life and to be constructively engaged rather than for us to try to rescue the situation when the damage has been done, often irreparably.

**Michael German:** The chief constable of South Wales Police recently made a speech in London on issues relating to youth anti-social behaviour. She said,

‘Tribal loyalty has replaced family loyalty and gang culture based on violence and drugs is a way of life’.

She also said,

‘there is no appetite for solutions that have no visible return’.

Among the positive solutions that she suggested were acceptable behaviour contracts. Do you accept the position as outlined by the chief constable of South Wales Police, and do you agree that acceptable behaviour contracts are one mechanism available to us as a solution to a particularly difficult problem?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yes. Acceptable behaviour contracts are deployed regularly in Wales, and their benefits, and that of the various written warnings that often precede them, have been shown, given that the success rate is as high as 66 to 70 per cent when it comes to preventing re-offending. Therefore, there is a good record of success.

We also need to accept fully the point that if we are to address the anti-social behaviour of young people, a much more complex approach will be required than merely that of getting the police to enforce the law. As Lorraine said, we need to engage young people in a wide range of activities to give them much more constructive outlets for their energy and enthusiasm.

**Leanne Wood:** I am sure that you will be aware of the new report published by the Scottish Prisons Commission, which calls for

Cynulliad yn ystyried polisi ieuenctid, gan ei bod yn well o lawer i bobl ifanc gael cychwyniad da mewn bywyd ac ymgysylltu’n gadarnhaol nag ydyw i ni geisio achub y sefyllfa pan yw’r niwed wedi’i wneud, a hynny’n anadferadwy’n aml.

**Michael German:** Yn ddiweddar, rhoddodd prif gwnstabl Heddlu De Cymru araith yn Llundain ar faterion sy’n ymwneud ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol gan bobl ifanc. Dywedodd,

Mae teyrngarwch llwythol wedi disodli teyrngarwch teuluol ac mae diwylliant y gang sy’n seiliedig ar drais a chyffuriau’n ffordd o fyw.

Dywedodd hefyd,

nid oes awydd am atebion sydd heb ganlyniad amlwg.

Un o’r atebion cadarnhaol a awgrymodd oedd contractau ymddygiad derbyniol. A ydych yn derbyn bod y sefyllfa fel y’i disgrifiwyd gan brif gwnstabl Heddlu De Cymru, ac a ydych yn cytuno bod contractau ymddygiad derbyniol yn un dull sydd ar gael i ni i ddatrys problem neilltuol o anodd?

**Brian Gibbons:** Ydwyf. Defnyddir contractau ymddygiad derbyniol yn rheolaidd yng Nghymru, a dangoswyd eu bod hwy, a’r gwahanol rybuddion ysgrifenedig a roddir o’u blaen yn aml, yn dod â budd, gan fod y gyfradd lwyddiant gyn uchod â 66 i 70 y cant o ran atal aildroeddu. Felly, mae hanes o lwyddiant.

Mae angen hefyd inni dderbyn yn llwyr y ddadl y bydd angen dull gweithredu mwy cymhleth o lawer na dim ond peri i’r heddlu orfodi’r gyfraith, os ydym i ddelio ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol ymysg pobl ifanc. Fel y dywedodd Lorraine, mae angen inni gynnwys pobl ifanc mewn gweithgareddau amrywiol iawn i roi iddynt ffyrdd mwy adeiladol o lawer i ryddhau eu hegna a mynegi eu brwdfrydedd.

**Leanne Wood:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn ymwybodol o’r adroddiad newydd a gyhoeddwyd gan Gomisiwn Carchardai’r



the scrapping of short prison sentences, with some exceptions for violent and sexual offences, and a move towards more community-based rehabilitation. Will you join me in welcoming that report and tell us whether you think that meaningful community rehabilitation and associated well funded support services can be much more effective than prison or anti-social behaviour orders?

**Brian Gibbons:** The level of imprisonment in Scotland is very high, and it has a problem accommodating the number of people in prison. I understand that some people commenting on the Scottish proposals have classed it as a high-risk strategy. Nonetheless, there is a lot of evidence to suggest that people can turn their lives around by engaging more constructively in a community setting. That is what this is about, particularly in relation to substance and alcohol abuse, given that around two thirds of people in prison are there for drugs and alcohol-related crime. Those people have to serve their sentence, be released, and then be allowed to pick up a normal life. There has to be a community rehabilitation element to the programme if we are to allow those people to start again and to stop being a problem to themselves and to their families and communities.

### Community Safety

**Q2 Chris Franks:** Will the Minister make a statement on community safety in South Wales Central? OAQ(3)0410(SJL)

**Brian Gibbons:** The Welsh Assembly Government is supporting community safety partnerships to ensure a joined-up, multi-agency approach to combating anti-social behaviour and crime in south Wales and the rest of the country.

**Chris Franks:** You will be aware that of the 10 hot spots in Wales for railway crime, four were in South Wales Central, namely Pontypridd, Ton Pentre, Cogan and Penrhiwceiber. What discussions have you

Alban, sy'n galw am gael gwared â dedfrydau byr o garchar, gyda rhai eithriadau ar gyfer troseddau treisiol a rhywiol, ac am droi at adsefydlu yn y gymuned i raddau mwy. A wnewch ymuno â mi i groesawu'r adroddiad hwnnw a dweud wrthym a ydych yn credu bod adsefydlu ystyrion yn y gymuned a gwasanaethau cymorth a ariannwyd yn dda yn gysylltiedig â hynny'n gallu bod yn fwy effeithiol o lawer na'r carchar neu orchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol?

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae lefel y carchariadau yn yr Alban yn uchel iawn, ac mae'n ei chael yn anodd cartrefu nifer y bobl sydd mewn carchar. Yr wyf yn deall bod rhai sydd wedi gwneud sylwadau am y cynigion yn yr Alban wedi dweud ei bod yn strategaeth risg uchel. Er hynny, mae llawer o dystiolaeth sy'n awgrymu y gall pobl drawsnewid eu bywydau drwy ymgysylltu'n fwy cadarnhaol mewn cymuned. Hynny sydd dan sylw yma, yn enwedig mewn cysylltiad â chamddefnyddio sylweddau ac alcohol, gan fod tua dwy ran o dair o'r rhai sydd yn y carchar wedi'u rhoi yno am droseddau sy'n ymwneud â chyffuriau ac alcohol. Rhaid i'r bobl hynny orffen eu dedfryd, cael eu rhyddhau, a chael ailafael mewn bywyd normal. Rhaid cael elfen o adsefydlu cymunedol yn y rhaglen os ydym i ganiatáu i'r bobl hynny ailddechrau a pheidio â bod yn broblem iddynt hwy eu hunain ac i'w teuluoedd a'u cymunedau.

### Diogelwch Cymunedol

**C2 Chris Franks:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddiogelwch cymunedol yng Nghanol De Cymru? OAQ(3)0410(SJL)

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn rhoi cymorth i bartneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol i sicrhau dull cydgysylltiedig, amlasiantaethol o wrthweithio ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol a throseddau yn ne Cymru ac yng ngweddill y wlad.

**Chris Franks:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod pedwar o blith y 10 man gwaethaf yng Nghymru am droseddau ar reilffyrdd yng Nghanol De Cymru, sef Pontypridd, Ton Pentre, Cogan a Phenrhiw-ceibr. Pa

had with the British Transport Police and Network Rail on improving safety on our railways, and what are you doing to improve matters?

**Brian Gibbons:** I have not had any direct discussions with the British Transport Police on this matter, but I know that, as part of the upgrade programme run by the Deputy First Minister, measures have been put in place to provide greater security in railway stations in north and south Wales. Many of these problems are related to alcohol abuse, and so the work that we are doing to promote a much more responsible attitude towards alcohol consumption and to ensuring a more vigorous enforcement of existing restrictions is part of the wider solution.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** This time last year, we were just getting to grips with the smoking ban. When people say that they are concerned for their safety, they mean when walking around their communities. One side effect of the smoking ban in public houses, particularly in Cardiff and with the nights being so light, is people moving onto the streets outside pubs to have a cigarette and, in some cases, congregating in large gangs. By and large, most of them are peaceful, but I have been approached by several constituents who have found this presence on the sidewalk rather threatening. Has the Assembly Government undertaken any studies with local government, as the licensing authorities, to see how this can be better controlled in neighbourhoods, so that people can enjoy a cigarette, which is their legitimate right, but that other people can move around their communities free from the fear of the perceived—and I stress the word ‘perceived’—threat posed by a crowd of people outside a pub?

**Brian Gibbons:** Four pilot projects are currently under way in Wales, looking at the night-time economy and at what needs to be done, from a preventative point of view, to address the range of problems and concerns raised over personal safety. Hopefully, as

drafodaethau yr ydych wedi’u cael â Heddlu Trafnidiaeth Prydain a Network Rail ynghylch gwella diogelwch ar ein rheilffyrdd, a beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i wella’r sefyllfa?

**Brian Gibbons:** Nid wyf wedi cael unrhyw drafodaethau uniongyrchol â Heddlu Trafnidiaeth Prydain ar y mater hwn, ond gwn fod mesurau wedi’u rhoi ar waith, fel rhan o’r rhaglen uwchraddio sy’n cael ei rhedeg gan y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog, i ddarparu mwy o ddiogelwch mewn gorsafoddd rheilffyrdd yn y gogledd a’r de. Mae llawer o’r problemau hyn yn ymwneud â chamddefnyddio alcohol, ac felly mae ein gwaith i hyrwyddo ymagwedd lawer mwy cyfrifol at yfed alcohol ac i sicrhau gorfodi mwy trwyadl ar y cyfyngiadau presennol yn rhan o’r ateb mwy cyffredinol.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Yr adeg hon y llynedd, yr oeddem newydd ddechrau dod i arfer â’r gwaharddiad ar ysmegu. Pan ddywed pobl eu bod yn poeni am eu diogelwch, maent yn golygu wrth gerdded o gwmpas eu cymunedau. Un o sgil-ffeithiau’r gwaharddiad ar ysmegu mewn tafarndai, yn enwedig yng Nghaerdydd a chan fod y nosweithiau mor olau, yw bod pobl yn symud i’r strydoedd y tu allan i dafarndai i gael sigarét ac, mewn rhai achosion, yn ymgynnull yn gangiau mawr. At ei gilydd, mae’r rhan fwyaf ohonynt yn heddychlon, ond mae nifer o etholwyr wedi cysylltu â mi sydd wedi cael bod y presenoldeb hwn ar balmentydd yn eithaf bygythiol. A yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ymgymryd ag unrhyw astudiaethau gyda llywodraeth leol, fel yr awdurdodau trwyddedu, i weld sut y gellir rheoli hyn yn well mewn cymdogaethau, fel y gall pobl fwynhau sigarét, gan fod ganddynt hawl gyfreithiol i wneud hynny, ond y gall pobl eraill symud o gwmpas eu cymunedau’n rhydd o ofn y bygythiad ymddangosiadol—a rhoddaf bwys ar y gair ‘ymddangosiadol’—gan dorf o bobl y tu allan i dafarn?

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae pedwar prosiect peilot yn mynd ymlaen yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd sy’n ystyried economi’r nos a’r hyn y mae angen ei wneud, o ran camau ataliol, i ymateb i’r gwahanol broblemau a’r pryderon a fynegwyd ynghylch diogelwch personol.

those four pilot schemes develop and we learn from that experience, we will have a valuable resource from which to ensure that good practice is disseminated across Wales.

2.00 p.m.

**Jenny Randerson:** I have raised with you before the lengthy waiting times for treatment with the Cardiff-based community addiction unit. Waiting times are currently up to 47 weeks, which makes complete nonsense of the chances of dealing with your addiction if you happen to live in Cardiff. It was 39 weeks in March, and now it is 47 weeks. Last year, a one-off additional payment of £176,000 was made by the community safety partnership, enabling the unit to bring the waiting list down, marginally, to 22 weeks. However, that is still much too long.

This year, the community addiction unit has closed its waiting list to all patients, except pregnant patients and emergency cases. Do you accept, Minister, that there is a serious and ongoing underfunding of addiction services in Cardiff, and will you agree to address the problem?

**Brian Gibbons:** I discussed this issue with my officials this morning, because we are aware of this particular concern, and it is one of the reasons why I have been anxious to have published data on waiting times for substance misuse services. Hopefully, that information will be available in the public domain in the next few months, giving us a platform on which to drive forward action on waiting times, as we have seen in the health service. Clearly, the length of time that people have to wait is not acceptable in some parts of Wales, although the waiting times are shorter in other areas.

**Jenny Randerson:** With all due respect, you may publish the waiting times, but you will not improve things unless there is recognition that additional funding is needed. Currently, 470 patients are accessing the community

Gobeithio, wrth i'r pedwar cynllun peilot hynny ddatblygu ac wrth inni ddysgu yn sgil y profiad hwnnw, y bydd gennym adnodd gwerthfawr i sicrhau bod arferion da'n cael eu lledaenu i bob cwr o Gymru.

**Jenny Randerson:** Yr wyf wedi codi gyda chi o'r blaen yr amserau maith y mae'n rhaid aros am driniaeth yn yr uned ddibyniaeth gymunedol yng Nghaerdydd. Erbyn hyn, mae'r amser aros wedi codi i 47 wythnos. Mae hynny'n golygu nad oes gobaith mul i chi ddelio â'ch caethiwed os digwydd ichi fyw yng Nghaerdydd. Yr oedd yn 39 wythnos ym mis Mawrth, ac yn awr mae'n 47 wythnos. Y llynedd, cafwyd taliad ychwanegol untro o £176,000 gan y bartneriaeth diogelwch cymunedol, gan alluogi'r uned i gwtogi'r rhestr aros, fymryn, i 22 wythnos. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny'n dal yn rhy hir o lawer.

Eleni, mae'r uned ddibyniaeth gymunedol wedi cau ei rhestr aros i bob claf, ac eithrio cleifion sy'n feichiog ac achosion brys. A ydych yn derbyn, Weinidog, bod gwasanaethau dibyniaeth yng Nghaerdydd yn wynebu sefyllfa ddifrifol o ddifffyg cyllid parhaus, ac a gytunwch i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem?

**Brian Gibbons:** Trafodais y mater hwn gyda'm swyddogion y bore yma, oherwydd yr ydym yn ymwybodol o'r pryder penodol hwn, a dyma un o'r rhesymau pam yr wyf wedi bod yn awyddus i gael data wedi'u cyhoeddi am gyfnodau aros am wasanaethau camddefnyddio sylweddau. Bydd y wybodaeth honno ar gael yn gyhoeddus yn yr ychydig fisoedd nesaf, gobeithio, gan roi llwyfan inni fwrw ymlaen i wneud rhywbeth ynglŷn â chyfnodau aros, fel y gwelsom yn y gwasanaeth iechyd. Mae'n amlwg nad yw'r cyfnod y mae'n rhaid i bobl aros yn dderbyniol mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru, er bod y cyfnodau aros yn fyrrach mewn ardaloedd eraill.

**Jenny Randerson:** Gyda phob dyledus barch, cyhoeddi'r cyfnodau aros neu beidio, ni fyddwch yn llwyddo i wella pethau oni chydabyddir bod angen arian ychwanegol. Ar hyn o bryd, mae 470 o gleifion yn

addiction unit, and a further 225 are on the GP shared service, which is largely funded by the local health board. In addition, there is a hidden demand, which is suppressed because people know that they have no hope of being seen within a reasonable timescale.

Your performance indicators are for a waiting time of no more than 10 working days between referral and assessment, and no more than 10 working days between assessment and treatment. Do you acknowledge that, although you may publish the statistics, unless something is done to secure a step change in the way in which the unit operates and is funded, there will not be the kind of improvement that your performance indicators demand?

**Brian Gibbons:** You mentioned statistics, but if those statistics were not available, you would not be able to make the very point that you are trying to make. Therefore, it is a prerequisite that we have information on performance. Waiting times, counselling services and family support services are among the key areas that we want to address as part of our substance misuse strategy, with extra resources going into that strategy. That has to be one of the priorities for the future strategy. This involves not only the money coming into the service from the community safety partnerships, but from the national health service as well. This is a multidisciplinary approach and I am pleased that a good spirit of co-operation exists.

We also know from health services that you can throw money at the problem, but if processes for managing waiting times are not slick and sharp enough and not properly informed, it is a case of throwing good money after bad.

#### **Rhaglen Cau Swyddfeydd Post**

**C3 Nerys Evans:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y rhaglen cau swyddfeydd post? OAQ(3)0426(SJL)

**Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Adfywio (Leighton Andrews):** Nid yw polisi

defnyddio'r uned ddibyniaeth gymunedol, a 225 arall yn defnyddio'r cyd-wasanaeth meddygon teulu. Caiff hwnnw ei gyllido'n bennaf gan y bwrdd iechyd lleol. Hefyd, mae yna alw cudd, sy'n cael ei fygu am fod pobl yn gwybod nad oes gobaith iddynt gael eu gweld o fewn amser rhesymol.

Mae eich dangosyddion perfformiad yn dweud na ddylid gorfod aros mwy na 10 diwrnod gweithio rhwng yr atgyfeirio a'r asesu, a dim mwy na 10 diwrnod gweithio rhwng yr asesu a'r driniaeth. A ydych yn cydnabod, cyhoeddi'r ystadegau neu beidio, oni wneir rhywbeth i sicrhau newid mawr yn y ffordd y mae'r uned yn gweithredu ac yn cael ei chyllido, na welir y math o welliant y mae eich dangosyddion perfformiad yn ei fynnu?

**Brian Gibbons:** Soniech am ystadegau, ond oni bai bod yr ystadegau hynny ar gael, ni fydddech yn gallu gwneud yr union bwynt yr ydych yn ceisio'i wneud. Felly, rhaid inni gael y wybodaeth am berfformiad yn gyntaf. Cyfnodau aros, gwasanaethau cwnsela a gwasanaethau cymorth i deuluoedd yw rhai o'r meysydd allweddol yr ydym am fynd i'r afael â hwy fel rhan o'n strategaeth ar gamdefnyddio sylweddau, gan roi adnoddau ychwanegol i'r strategaeth honno. Rhaid i hynny fod yn un o'r blaenoriaethau ar gyfer strategaeth y dyfodol. Mae hyn yn golygu nid yn unig fod yr arian yn dod i mewn i'r gwasanaeth gan y partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol, ond gan y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol hefyd. Ymagwedd aml-ddisgyblaeth yw hon ac yr wyf yn falch fod yna ysbryd o gydweithredu da.

Gwyddom o'n profiad gyda'r gwasanaethau iechyd y gallwch daflu arian at y broblem, ond os nad yw'r prosesau ar gyfer rheoli'r cyfnodau aros yn ddigon llym a chadarn, ac os nad ydynt wedi'u seilio ar wybodaeth briodol, gwastraffu arian da fyddwch chi.

#### **Post Office Closure Programme**

**Q3 Nerys Evans:** Will the Minister make a statement on the post office closure programme? OAQ(3)0426(SJL)

**The Deputy Minister for Regeneration (Leighton Andrews):** Post office policy is

swyddfeydd post wedi ei ddatganoli, a'r Adran Fenter, Busnes a Diwygio Rheoleiddiol sydd â'r prif gyfrifoldeb dros hyn. Yr ydym wedi ei wneud yn glir ein bod yn disgwyl i'r rhaglen gau fod yn sensitif i'r anghenion penodol sydd gennym wrth inni fynd ati i gynorthwyo rhai o'r cymunedau mwyaf bregus yng Nghymru.

**Nerys Evans:** Mae Swyddfa'r Post yn ymgynghori yn ne-orllewin Cymru ar hyn o bryd ynglŷn â chau swyddfeydd post, ac mae'n gweithredu dan gyfarwyddyd Llywodraeth San Steffan i gau 2,500 o swyddfeydd post. A ydych yn credu ei bod yn dderbyniol i Lywodraeth San Steffan roi cyfarwyddyd i beidio ag ystyried amddifadedd gwledig, y gallu i gael band eang na'r effaith ar y siop pan fydd swyddfa'r post o fewn adeilad y siop leol, wrth ddynodi pa swyddfeydd post i'w cau? Mae'r rhain yn ffactorau sy'n effeithio'n fawr ar gymunedau cefn gwlad, yn enwedig rhai fel Llanboidy a Tre-lech, i enwi dim ond dau.

**Leighton Andrews:** The previous Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration made representations to the Westminster Government around the issues that ought to be taken into account when the post office closure programme was being considered. A number of the issues that were raised by Mrs Hart in her representations were taken into account in the guidance that was subsequently adopted by the Post Office for determining its network change programme.

**Nick Bourne:** I have a few points to put to the Deputy Minister in relation to the Labour-inspired closure programme—although, admittedly, in Westminster rather than here. The first may be something on which he will need to make representations, if he agrees with it. I was very pleased when two post offices were saved in mid and west Wales, in Tremont Road, Llandrindod Wells and Pendre in Brecon. However, the next thing that happens is that another post office, with no geographic proximity at all—in Penparc, Ceredigion—is picked on and threatened with closure. That seems to be extremely unfair and illogical. Is the Deputy Minister doing anything about that?

non-devolved, and lead responsibility rests with the Department of Business, Enterprise and Regulatory Reform. We have made it clear that we expect the closure programme to be sensitive to the particular needs we have in supporting some of our most vulnerable communities in Wales.

**Nerys Evans:** The Post Office is undertaking a consultation on the closure of post offices in south-west Wales at the moment, acting under Westminster Government guidance to close 2,500 post offices. Do you believe it is acceptable that the Westminster Government should issue guidance not to consider rural deprivation, access to broadband or the effect on the shop when a post office located within the local shop is closed, when earmarking post offices for closure? These factors have a significant effect on rural communities, such as Llanboidy and Trelech, to name but two.

**Leighton Andrews:** Cyflwynodd y cyn-Weinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio sylwadau i Lywodraeth San Steffan ynglŷn â'r materion y dylid rhoi sylw iddynt pan oedd y rhaglen cau swyddfeydd post yn cael ei hystyried. Ystyriwyd nifer o'r materion a godwyd gan Mrs Hart yn ei sylwadau yn y cyfarwyddyd a fabwysiadwyd wedi hynny gan Swyddfa'r Post wrth benderfynu ynglŷn â'i rhaglen ar gyfer newid y rhwydwaith.

**Nick Bourne:** Mae gennyf ychydig bwyntiau i'w codi gyda'r Dirprwy Weinidog ynglŷn â'r rhaglen gau a ysbrydolwyd gan Lafur—er, rhaid cyfaddef, yn San Steffan yn hytrach nag yma. Mae'r cyntaf, o bosibl, yn rhywbeth y bydd angen iddo gyflwyno sylwadau yn ei gylch, os yw'n cytuno ag ef. Yr oeddwn yn falch iawn pan achubwyd dwy swyddfa bost yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin, yn Heol Tremont, Llandrindod ac ym Mhen-dre, yn Aberhonddu. Fodd bynnag, y peth nesaf sy'n digwydd yw bod swyddfa bost arall, heb fod yn agos o gwbl yn ddaearyddol—ym Mhenparc, Ceredigion—yn cael ei thargedu gan fygwth ei chau. Mae hynny i bob golwg yn eithafol o annheg ac afresymegol. A yw'r Dirprwy Weinidog yn gwneud rhywbeth ynghylch hynny?

The second issue is within his control: it is his messianic zeal in relation to the post office development grant. When a post office is closed against its will, because of the Labour-inspired programme, if it has had a grant, you try to get it back. Post Office Ltd thinks that that is bonkers, as does Postwatch; will you drop that idea?

**Leighton Andrews:** On the latter point, I have never had it communicated to me from the Post Office that it thinks that it is bonkers; so, I entirely dispute what you have said.

On the first point, had you been paying attention to the closure programmes throughout Wales, you would know that the Post Office's previous policy was that, where post offices had been saved, a post office in a different geographical area was then proposed for closure. I do not like that, and I have raised it with the Post Office. It is unfortunate, but it is one of the reasons why I do not comment here on individual proposals for the closure of post offices.

**Kirsty Williams:** Minister, I recently asked the First Minister to help to secure the future of the post office in Llanbadarn Fynydd. The service is hosted by the village shop, which is run on a voluntary basis for the village by members of the village community. Following a refurbishment project, the group has now been landed with an unexpected bill by the Post Office of just over £1,000 to reconnect the telephone and computer lines. I know that it is your intention to reopen the post office development fund once you are certain which post offices are to remain open or are to be closed. Given that the future of Llanbadarn Fynydd is assured—it is not one that is going to be closed—could you consider an upfront allocation from the post office development fund to ensure that it survives?

**Leighton Andrews:** Kirsty, I am not going to make any commitments in the Chamber, but I suggest that you write to me on the issue.

**Cymunedau yn Gyntaf**

Mae'r ail yn fater sydd o fewn ei reolaeth, sef ei sêl feseianaidd dros y grant datblygu swyddfeydd post. Pan gaeir swyddfa bost yn groes i'w hewylllys, oherwydd y rhaglen a ysbrydolwyd gan Lafur, os yw wedi cael grant, byddwch yn ceisio'i gael yn ôl. Mae Swyddfa'r Post Cyf. yn meddwl bod hynny'n hurt, a Golwg ar Bost hefyd; a wnewch chi roi'r gorau i'r syniad hwnnw?

**Leighton Andrews:** Ynglŷn â'r ail bwynt, nid wyf erioed wedi cael neges gan Swyddfa'r Post yn dweud ei bod yn meddwl ei fod yn hurt; felly, yr wyf yn ymwrthod yn llwyr â'r hyn a ddywedaso.

Ynglŷn â'r pwynt cyntaf, petaech wedi rhoi sylw i'r rhaglenni cau ledled Cymru, byddech yn gwybod mai polisi blaenorol Swyddfa'r Post, lle'r oedd swyddfeydd post wedi'u hachub, oedd eu bod wedyn yn cynnig cau swyddfa bost mewn ardal ddaearyddol wahanol. Nid wyf yn hoffi hynny, ac yr wyf wedi'i godi gyda Swyddfa'r Post. Mae'n anffodus, ond mae'n un o'r rhesymau pam nad ydwyf yn cyfeirio yma at gynigion unigol i gau swyddfeydd post.

**Kirsty Williams:** Weinidog, gofynnais i'r Prif Weinidog yn ddiweddar helpu sicrhau dyfodol swyddfa'r post yn Llanbadarn Fynydd. Siop y pentref sy'n darparu'r gwasanaeth a chaiff ei rhedeg yn wirfoddol ar gyfer y pentref gan aelodau o'r gymuned yn y pentref. Ar ôl prosiect adnewyddu, mae'r grŵp yn awr wedi cael bil annisgwyl gan Swyddfa'r Post am ychydig dros £1,000 i ailgysylltu'r llinell ffôn a llinell y cyfrifiadur. Gwn mai eich bwriad yw ailagor y gronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post pan fyddwch yn sicr pa swyddfeydd post a fydd yn dal ar agor a pha rai a gaiff eu cau. Gan fod dyfodol Llanbadarn Fynydd yn ddiogel—nid yw'n un sydd i gael ei chau—a allech ystyried dyrannu arian ymlaen llaw o'r gronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post i sicrhau y bydd yn parhau?

**Leighton Andrews:** Kirsty, nid wyf am ymrwymo i ddim yn y Siambr, ond awgrymaf ichi ysgrifennu ataf ynglŷn â'r mater.

**Communities First**

**C4 Gareth Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am lwyddiant Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn y gogledd? OAQ(3)0442(SJL)

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn datblygu'n dda iawn ledled y gogledd, ac mae 28 o bartneriaethau wedi'u sefydlu ar draws y rhanbarth ers sefydlu'r rhaglen. Mae'r partneriaethau yn cynnwys y cymunedau lleol ac yn gweithio'n agos gydag awdurdodau lleol, yr heddlu ac asiantaethau a sefydliadau eraill, i sicrhau newid gwirioneddol i bobl leol.

**Gareth Jones:** Yn ddiweddar, bûm ar ymweliad â Chanolfan Gymuned Tŷ Llywelyn yn Llandudno, sy'n cynnal rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf lwyddiannus iawn, ac sy'n enghraifft o'r arfer gorau mewn datblygu cymuned. Pa gamau yr ydych yn eu hystyried i drosglwyddo'r holl gorff hwnnw o wybodaeth ac arbenigedd i'r cymunedau hynny sy'n wynebu heriau cymdeithasol sylweddol ond nad ydynt yn derbyn y math hwn o becyn ariannol? Yr wyf yn meddwl yn bennaf am gymunedau yn nyffryn Conwy, fel Dolgarrog.

2.10 p.m.

**Leighton Andrews:** It is important that we spread good practice from the Communities First programme. One issue that has been of concern to me as we look around the programme is that, often, you have good examples, sometimes in adjoining communities, where the lessons have not been learned from one to another. Later this year we are planning to publish a summary of best practice across the Communities First programme, which, I hope, will have wider application than just in those Communities First partnerships.

**Darren Millar:** There is no doubt, Deputy Minister, that Communities First can have, and is having, a positive impact in north Wales, not least in Kinnel Bay and Colwyn Bay in my constituency. One criticism of it is the tight geographical focus of the programme, which often makes it difficult for those running Communities First activities to address matters in the wider community that

**Q4 Gareth Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on the success of Communities First in north Wales? OAQ(3)0442(SJL)

**Leighton Andrews:** Communities First is making very good progress throughout north Wales, with 28 partnerships established across the region since the programme was established. The partnerships are involving the local communities and engaging with local authorities, the police, and other agencies and organisations to bring about real change for local people.

**Gareth Jones:** I recently visited Tŷ Llywelyn Community Centre in Llandudno, which is responsible for a very successful Communities First programme, and which is an example of best practice in community development. What steps are you considering in order to transfer that whole body of knowledge and expertise to those communities which face significant social challenges but which do not receive this sort of financial package? I am thinking specifically of communities in the Conwy valley, such as Dolgarrog.

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae'n bwysig inni ledaenu arferion da y rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Un mater sydd wedi bod yn destun pryder imi wrth inni edrych o gwmpas y rhaglen yw eich bod yn aml yn gweld esiamplau da, weithiau mewn cymunedau cyffiniol, lle nad yw'r naill wedi dysgu gwersi gan y llall. Yn ddiweddarach eleni, bwriadwn gyhoeddi crynodeb o'r arferion gorau yn y rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf i gyd, gan obeithio y bydd hynny'n ddefnyddiol y tu hwnt i bartneriaethau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn unig.

**Darren Millar:** Nid oes amheuaeth, Ddirprwy Weinidog, na all Cymunedau yn Gyntaf gael dylanwad er gwell yn y gogledd, ac, yn wir, y mae'n cael dylanwad er gwell, yn enwedig ym Mae Cinnel ac ym Mae Colwyn yn fy etholaeth i. Un feirniadaeth ar y rhaglen yw ei bod yn canolbwyntio ar ardal ddaeryddol gyfyng, sy'n aml yn ei gwneud yn anodd i'r rheini sy'n cynnal

may have an impact in Communities First wards. What action are you taking to overcome this problem, which is manifesting itself in north Wales?

**Leighton Andrews:** The partnership areas were drawn up on the basis of the Welsh index of multiple deprivation and, therefore, we have been very specific over the time of the programme in determining which areas are covered by it. However, we have also ensured that there is flexibility, for example through the Communities First trust fund, for services that may be based in adjoining wards but which serve Communities First wards.

### Child Poverty

**Q5 William Graham:** Will the Minister outline progress towards achieving Welsh Assembly Government targets for child poverty? OAQ(3)0409(SJL)

**Brian Gibbons:** The Welsh Assembly Government has made clear its commitment to halving child poverty by 2010 and eradicating it by 2020, by developing Wales-specific solutions and better integration with UK strategies. We are also committed to achieving and monitoring progress by introducing a child wellbeing monitor, which we hope to have in place by the autumn of this year.

**William Graham:** I note that one of the recommendations from Save the Children was that you should work with Her Majesty's Revenue and Customs to raise awareness of working tax credits; I appreciate that you have probably held talks with the Treasury on that basis. However, it would be within your control to take action to reduce the burden of indebtedness by improving the availability of money advice services and tackling illegal lending, which is not restricted purely to urban areas, but is also prevalent in some rural areas. The administration of housing benefit in Wales must be significantly improved—you will know of this from your experience as a constituency Member, Minister—and many Members have been burdened with this issue, which is often seen

gweithgareddau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf fynd i'r afael â materion yn y gymuned ehangach a allai ddylanwadu ar wardiau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd i oresgyn y broblem hon, sy'n ymddangos yn y gogledd?

**Leighton Andrews:** Lluniwyd yr ardaloedd partneriaeth ar sail mynegai amddifadedd lluosog Cymru, ac felly yr ydym wedi bod yn benodol iawn yn ystod oes y rhaglen wrth bennu pa ardaloedd sy'n cael eu cynnwys. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym hefyd wedi sicrhau hyblygrwydd, er enghraifft, drwy'r gronfa ymddiriedolaeth Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, ar gyfer gwasanaethau a all fod â'u canolfan mewn wardiau cyffiniol ond sy'n gwasanaethu wardiau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf.

### Tlodi Plant

**C5 William Graham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu'r cynnydd at gyrraedd targedau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer tlodi plant? OAQ(3)0409(SJL)

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi gwneud ei hymrwymiad yn glir i haneru tlodi plant erbyn 2010 a'i ddileu erbyn 2020, drwy ddatblygu atebion penodol ar gyfer Cymru ac integreiddio'n well â strategaethau'r DU. Yr ydym hefyd wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau cynnydd a'i fonitro drwy gyflwyno monitor lles plant, a gobeithiwn y bydd hwnnw ar waith erbyn yr hydref eleni.

**William Graham:** Sylwaf mai un o argymhellion Achub y Plant oedd y dylech weithio gyda Chyllid a Thollau Ei Mawrhydi i gynyddu ymwybyddiaeth am y credydau treth gweithio. Sylweddolaf eich bod, efallai, wedi cael trafodaethau gyda'r Trysorlys ar y sail honno. Fodd bynnag, byddai o fewn eich rheolaeth i gymryd camau i leihau'r baich dyled drwy wella'r gwasanaethau cyngor am arian sydd ar gael a mynd i'r afael â benthyca anghyfreithlon. Nid yw hynny wedi'i gyfyngu'n llwyr i ardaloedd trefol. Mae'n amlwg hefyd mewn ambell ardal wledig. Rhaid gwella'n sylweddol y drefn o weinyddu budd-dal tai yng Nghymru—gwyddoch hyn o'ch profiad fel Aelod etholaeth, Weinidog—ac mae llawer o Aelodau wedi gorfod ysgwyddo'r broblem



as a way in which local authorities seek to influence housing need and availability. These matters are within your control, so will you take action?

**Brian Gibbons:** That is one of the reasons why we have a £3 million programme over the next three years to improve benefit uptake in relation to housing benefit, not just targeted at older people, but also, equally, to be available for young people. I am also pleased that the UK Government has continued to support Citizens Advice in Wales to the tune of £75 million, providing face to face advice for many people who find themselves in difficult financial situations.

**Bethan Jenkins:** The Minister may be aware of new ideas produced by Polly Toynbee of the Social Policy Association, which included proposals to create a new tax band for the top 1.5 per cent of earners in the UK. She calculated that such a move would yield an additional £7 billion for the Treasury, part of which could provide more funding for the eradication of child poverty. While I accept that the National Assembly has no responsibility over fiscal powers, could you express concern to the UK Government Ministers who find it unacceptable to tax the rich fairly but have no problem whatsoever with increasing the tax burden for those on low incomes?

**Brian Gibbons:** We know from recent UK budgets statements that an extra £1 billion will, effectively, be made available to tackle child poverty. For example, the UK Government has increased the rate of child benefit for a first child to £20 a week, it is currently disregarding child benefit in calculating income for housing and council tax benefit, and it will also be increasing the child element of the child tax credit by £50 a year above indexation from April 2009. We also know that the national minimum wage continues to increase dramatically above inflation and the level of earnings in Britain. The UK Government is making a significant commitment to this. Clearly, there is no doubt that the targets, particularly for 2010, are challenging. I do not think that we can get away from that fact.

hon. Fe'i gwelir yn aml yn y ffordd y bydd awdurdodau lleol yn ceisio dylanwadu ar yr angen am dai ac ar y tai sydd ar gael. Mae'r materion hyn o fewn eich rheolaeth, felly, a wnewch chi weithredu?

**Brian Gibbons:** Dyna un o'r rhesymau pam y mae gennym raglen £3 miliwn dros y tair blynedd nesaf i gynyddu'r nifer sy'n manteisio ar fudd-dal tai. Nid yw honno'n targedu pobl hŷn yn unig, ond bydd ar gael hefyd, yn yr un modd, i bobl ifanc. Yr wyf yn falch hefyd fod Llywodraeth y DU wedi parhau i gefnogi Cyngor ar Bopeth yng Nghymru drwy roi £75 miliwn iddynt, gan ddarparu cyngor wyneb yn wyneb i lawer o bobl sy'n eu cael eu hunain mewn sefyllfaedd ariannol anodd.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Efallai fod y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol o syniadau newydd a gynhyrchwyd gan Polly Toynbee o'r Gymdeithas Polisi Cymdeithasol. Un cynnig oedd creu band treth newydd i'r 1.5 y cant sy'n ennill fwyaf yn y DU. Amcangyfrifai hi y byddai symudiad o'r fath yn dod â £7 biliwn yn ychwanegol i'r Trysorlys, a gellid defnyddio rhywfaint o'r arian hwnnw i ddileu tldi plant. Er fy mod yn derbyn nad oes gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gyfrifoldeb dros bwerau ariannol, a allech fynegi pryder wrth Weinidogion Llywodraeth y DU sy'n ei chael yn annerbyniol trethu'r cefnog yn deg, ond eto'n ei chael yn ddigon hawdd cynyddu'r baich treth i bobl sydd ar incwm isel?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yn sgil datganiadau cyllidebau'n ddiweddar yn y DU, gwyddom y bydd £1 biliwn yn ychwanegol, mewn gwirionedd, ar gael i fynd i'r afael â thlodi plant. Er enghraifft, mae Llywodraeth y DU wedi cynyddu cyfradd y budd-dal plant ar gyfer y plentyn cyntaf i £20 yr wythnos. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'n anwybyddu'r budd-dal plant wrth gyfrif incwm ar gyfer budd-dal tai a budd-dal treth gyngor, a bydd hefyd yn cynyddu elfen blant y credyd treth plant £50 y flwyddyn dros y mynegai o fis Ebrill 2009 ymlaen. Gwyddom hefyd fod y lleiafswm cyflog cenedlaethol yn dal i gynyddu'n ddramatig yn uwch na chwyddiant a lefel enillion ym Mhrydain. Mae Llywodraeth y DU yn gwneud ymrwymiad sylweddol i hyn. Yn amlwg, nid oes amheuaeth nad yw'r targedau, yn enwedig ar gyfer 2010, yn

heriol. Ni chredaf y gallwn wadu'r ffaith honno.

**Peter Black:** Bethan Jenkins's question has underlined, if anything, the fact that many of the key tools for tackling child poverty are not in the hands of the Welsh Assembly Government. What mechanisms do you have in place to regularly liaise with the Westminster Government to express your Government's concerns about what needs to be done if you are to meet this target? Is there any particular unit within the Assembly Government that is dedicated to dealing with child poverty and working on this issue exclusively?

**Brian Gibbons:** We have representatives at meetings of the four nations child poverty group, which co-ordinates work across the four administrations in the United Kingdom. The group had its last meeting on 17 June 2008. I am not sure whether I totally agree with your thesis, because we know that one of the most significant risk factors for poverty in Wales is worklessness. We are working with the Department for Work and Pensions to develop the Want to Work scheme, which provides well over £30 million in additional funds to tackle worklessness in Wales. We should not be too pessimistic about what we can do in Wales. The Genesis programme for childcare—and childcare problems are a key barrier to getting people into work—is continuing under the windfall benefits of the current structural funds programme. There is a bid to further develop the Genesis programme under convergence funding. There is much that we, as an Assembly Government, can do and are doing to tackle child poverty in Wales.

### Alleviating Poverty

**Q6 Brynle Williams:** Will the Minister make a statement on measures to alleviate poverty in north Wales? OAQ(3)0439(SJL)

**Brian Gibbons:** The 'One Wales' agreement reaffirms our joint commitment to the principles of social justice and our ambitions for everyone, in the whole of Wales, to live free from poverty. To support this, for

**Peter Black:** Mae cwestiwn Bethan Jenkins, a dweud y gwir, wedi tanlinellu'r ffaith nad yw nifer o'r arfau allweddol i fynd i'r afael â thlodi plant yn nwylo Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Pa fecanweithiau sydd wedi'u sefydlu gennych i gysylltu'n rheolaidd â Llywodraeth San Steffan i fynegi pryderon eich Llywodraeth am yr hyn y mae angen ei wneud os ydym i gyrraedd y targed hwn? A oes rhyw uned neilltuol o fewn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad sy'n canolbwyntio ar ddelio â thlodi plant ac yn gweithio'n unswydd ar y mater hwn?

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae gennym gynrychiolwyr yng nghyfarfodydd grŵp tlodi plant y pedair gwlad, sy'n cyd-drefnu gwaith ar draws y pedair gweinyddiaeth yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Cafodd y grŵp ei gyfarfod diwethaf ar 17 Mehefin 2008. Nid wyf yn siŵr a wyf yn cytuno'n llwyr â'ch dadl, oherwydd gwyddom mai un o'r ffactorau risg mwyaf arwyddocaol o ran tlodi yng Nghymru yw diweithdra. Yr ydym yn gweithio gyda'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau i ddatblygu'r cynllun Yn Awyddus i Weithio, sy'n darparu ymhell dros £30 miliwn mewn arian ychwanegol i fynd i'r afael â diweithdra yng Nghymru. Ni ddylem fod yn rhy anobeithiol am yr hyn y gallwn ei wneud yng Nghymru. Mae rhaglen gofal plant Genesis—ac mae problemau gofal plant yn rhwystr allweddol i bobl fynd i weithio—yn parhau o dan arian annisgwyl y rhaglen bresennol o gronfeydd strwythurol. Mae yna gais i ddatblygu rhaglen Genesis ymhellach dan gyllid cydgyfeirio. Mae llawer y gallwn ni, fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ei wneud ac yr ydym yn ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â thlodi plant yng Nghymru.

### Lliniaru Tlodi

**C6 Brynle Williams:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gamau i liniaru tlodi yn y gogledd? OAQ(3)0439(SJL)

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un' yn ailgadarnhau ein hymrwymiad ar y cyd i egwyddorion cyfiawnder cymdeithasol a'n huchelgais i bawb, yng Nghymru gyfan, fyw heb dlodi. I gefnogi hyn, er enghraifft, yr

example, we have provided £100,000 to Llandudno and District Credit Union to establish a basic banking platform to allow greater access to basic banking services among disadvantaged communities.

**Brynle Williams:** As you are aware, we are half way through the summer, so we should not really be talking about winter yet. However, the winter is coming and will pose severe challenges for north Wales households living in fuel poverty. [*Laughter.*]

With energy companies likely to push up their prices by over 40 per cent, more and more vulnerable pensioners, who are seeing their incomes stripped away by inflation, will face a decision between heating and eating. What are you doing now in relation to energy supplies in preparation for the coming winter to protect the vulnerable and growing number of Welsh households living in fuel poverty?

**Brian Gibbons:** As we face the winter recess in a few weeks' time, I am pleased to say that, for example, households of people aged over 80 will have an extra £100 this autumn as part of the winter fuel payment, with an extra £50 for people aged over 60. Equally, the home energy efficiency scheme in Wales will be taking part in a wider scheme to divert people, when they approach the HEES programme, to their provider. As the Minister for Environment, Sustainability and Housing pointed out, some £43 million is not being claimed through people not making best use of the options to change fuel suppliers and so forth. I am also pleased that Wales is being included in the microgeneration pilot schemes that have been announced by the Minister for Energy in the UK Government. Hopefully, we will also be able to benefit from that.

2.20 p.m.

**Lesley Griffiths:** One way of alleviating poverty in north Wales is to enable people to help themselves. Two areas of my constituency of Wrexham, Hightown and Caia Park, benefit through the Government's Communities First programme and through

ydyd wedi darparu £100,000 i Undeb Credyd Llandudno a'r Cylch i sefydlu llwyfan bancio sylfaenol i ganiatáu gwell mynediad i wasanaethau bancio sylfaenol mewn cymunedau difreintiedig.

**Brynle Williams:** Fel y gwyddoch, yr ydym hanner ffordd drwy'r haf, felly, ni ddylem mewn gwirionedd fod yn siarad am y gaeaf eto. Fodd bynnag, mae'r gaeaf ar ei ffordd a bydd yn dod â her ddifrifol i aelwydydd yng ngogledd Cymru sy'n byw mewn tldi tanwydd. [*Chwerthin.*]

Gyda chwmnïau ynni'n debygol o gynyddu eu prisiau fwy na 40 y cant, bydd mwy a mwy o bensiynwyr bregus, sy'n gweld eu hincwm yn cael ei erydu gan chwyddiant, yn gorfod penderfynu rhwng gwresogi ynteu bwyta. Beth ydych chi'n ei wneud yn awr yng nghyswllt cyflenwadau ynni i baratoi ar gyfer y gaeaf sydd i ddod, er mwyn diogelu'r aelwydydd bregus a chynyddol eu nifer yng Nghymru sy'n byw mewn tldi tanwydd?

**Brian Gibbons:** Wrth inni wynebu toriad y gaeaf ymhen ychydig wythnosau, yr wyf yn falch o ddweud, er enghraifft, y bydd aelwydydd pobl sy'n 80 oed a hŷn yn cael £100 ychwanegol yr hydref hwn fel rhan o'r taliad tanwydd gaeaf, a £50 ychwanegol i bobl dros 60 oed. Yn yr un modd, bydd y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref yng Nghymru yn dod yn rhan o gynllun ehangach i gyfeirio pobl, pan fyddant yn cysylltu â rhaglen HEES, at ei darparwr. Fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynaliadwyedd a Thai, mae yna tua £43 miliwn nad yw'n cael ei hawlio am nad yw pobl yn gwneud y defnydd gorau o'r dewisiadau i newid cyflenwyr tanwydd ac ati. Yr wyf yn falch hefyd fod Cymru'n cael ei chynnwys yn y cynlluniau microgynhyrchu peilot a gyhoeddwyd gan y Gweinidog dros Ynni yn Llywodraeth y DU. Gobeithio y gallwn elwa o hynny hefyd.

**Lesley Griffiths:** Un ffordd i liniaru tldi yn y gogledd yw galluogi pobl i'w helpu eu hunain. Mae dwy ardal yn fy etholaeth i yn Wrecsam, sef Hightown a Pharc Caia, yn elwa o raglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf y Llywodraeth a thrwy'r rhaglen gronfa

the new £25 million Communities First outcomes fund, which delivers practical improvements on the ground to tackle poverty, regenerate these areas and improve employment opportunities for local people. Do you agree that through such initiatives the Government is beginning to make a real difference to the lives of people such as those who live in Hightown and Caia Park in Wrexham?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yes. I saw a similar example of good practice yesterday, in Neath Port Talbot, where the Communities First initiative in Sandfields, Aberavon is working with the Port Talbot credit union to open a collecting point in that community. Nearby, in Melin, Neath East, Communities First has been at the forefront of increasing benefit uptake. In that very disadvantaged community, hundreds of thousands, if not millions, of pounds have been made available to the citizens because of the good work of the Communities First programme.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The First Minister has said that income levels are a good measure of economic success. Although average income levels in Wales are generally very poor compared to those in the rest of the UK, a surprising finding from recent inquiries is that many of the more rural local authority areas in north Wales have some of the lowest income levels in Wales. Do you regard that as a measure of comparative poverty?

**Brian Gibbons:** We place great importance on the ability of the Wales index of multiple deprivation to pick up the areas that are suffering the greatest poverty in Wales. That index is currently being looked at and we hope that we will have a new one in place within the next few months. There was extensive consultation on the development of the new index and, hopefully, the point that you have made, Alun Ffred, went into that consultation and has been taken into account.

#### Household Debt

**Q7 Eleanor Burnham:** Will the Minister make a statement on what the Welsh

canlyniadau newydd gwerth £25 miliwn dan Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, sy'n darparu gwelliannau ymarferol ar lawr gwlad i fynd i'r afael â thlodi, i adfywio'r ardaloedd hyn ac i wella cyfleoedd cyflogaeth i bobl leol. A ydych yn cytuno bod y Llywodraeth, drwy gynlluniau o'r fath, yn dechrau gwneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol i fywydau pobl fel y rhai sy'n byw yn Hightown a Pharc Caia yn Wrecsam?

**Brian Gibbons:** Ydwyf. Gwelais enghraifft debyg o arfer da ddoe, yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot, lle mae'r cynllun Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn Sandfields, Aberafan yn gweithio gydag undeb credyd Port Talbot i agor man casglu yn y gymuned honno. Gerllaw, yn y Felin, Dwyrain Castell-nedd, mae Cymunedau yn Gyntaf wedi bod yn flaenllaw yn cynyddu'r niferoedd sy'n hawlio budd-daliadau. Yn y gymuned hynod ddifreintiedig honno, mae cannoedd ar filoedd, os nad miliynau, o bunnoedd wedi eu darparu i'r trigolion oherwydd gwaith da y rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi dweud bod lefelau incwm yn fesur da o lwyddiant economaidd. Er bod y lefelau incwm cyfartalog yng Nghymru yn wael iawn yn gyffredinol o'u cymharu â'r lefelau yng ngweddill y DU, un canfyddiad annisgwyl o ymchwiliadau'n ddiweddar yw bod gan nifer o'r ardaloedd awdurdodau lleol mwyaf gwledig yn y gogledd rai o'r lefelau incwm isaf yng Nghymru. A ydych yn ystyried bod hynny'n fesur o dlodi cymharol?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr ydym yn rhoi pwyslais mawr ar allu mynegai amddifadedd lluosog Cymru i nodi'r ardaloedd sydd â'r tlodi mwyaf yng Nghymru. Yr ydym yn edrych ar y mynegai ar hyn o bryd, a gobeithiwn weld sefydlu un newydd yn y misoedd nesaf. Bu ymgynghori helaeth ynglŷn â datblygu'r mynegai newydd, ac yr wyf yn gobeithio, Alun Ffred, fod y pwynt a wnaethpwyd gennych wedi ei gyflwyno i'r ymgynghoriad ac wedi cael sylw.

#### Dyledion Aelwydydd

**C7 Eleanor Burnham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am yr hyn y mae

Assembly Government is doing to tackle increasing household debt? OAQ(3)0433(SJL)

**Brian Gibbons:** Our financial inclusion strategy will propose a range of actions to tackle unmanageable debt. We have already announced a £3 million council tax and housing benefit uptake programme and £1.25 million to deliver our 'One Wales' commitments on supporting the credit union movement. There is also the recently announced expansion of the social housing grant mortgage rescue scheme.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Are you having any discussions with your various colleagues about helping households, including children, with their numeracy skills, particularly when banks are now sending debit cards to youngsters, which surely will not help with household debts? I am sure that most of us were horrified to learn that one bank—Lloyds TSB Bank plc—has been sending debit cards to children as young as 11 and perhaps encouraging illegal activity in that it may have been aiding and abetting in the purchase of all kinds of goods, such as porn, cigarettes, videos and so on. What is the Assembly Government doing about this? Surely this is not helping household debt.

**Brian Gibbons:** My colleague, Jane Hutt, announced to the Assembly earlier this year the inclusion of a new strand on financial literacy in the school curriculum in Wales. That will be an important development. We are also working to establish the Welsh unit for financial education to ensure that that curriculum is well informed and provides what young people need to carry out their financial business. As the Assembly Government, we are committed to extending credit unions to every secondary school in Wales—not only to promote saving, but also as a way of broadening young people's financial awareness in a practical sense.

**David Lloyd:** In relation to household debt,

Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â dyledion cynyddol aelwydydd? OAQ(3)0433(SJL)

**Brian Gibbons:** Bydd ein strategaeth cynhwysiant ariannol yn cynnig ystod o gamau gweithredu i fynd i'r afael â dyledion na ellir eu rheoli. Yr ydym eisoes wedi cyhoeddi rhaglen gwerth £3 miliwn i hybu manteisio ar fudd-dal treth gyngor a budd-dal tai, ynghyd ag £1.25 miliwn i wireddu ein hymrwymadau yn 'Cymru'n Un' ynglŷn â chefnogi'r mudiad undebau llafur. Hefyd, cyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar y bydd y cynllun i achub morgeisi dan y grant tai cymdeithasol yn cael ei ehangu.

**Eleanor Burnham:** A ydych yn cael unrhyw drafodaethau gyda'ch amrywiol gyd-Weinidogion ynglŷn â helpu aelwydydd, gan gynnwys plant, gyda'u sgiliau rhifedd, yn enwedig gan fod y banciau bellach yn anfon cardiau debyd at bobl ifanc? Yn sicr, ni fydd hynny'n helpu gyda dyledion aelwydydd. Yr wyf yn siŵr fod y mwyafrif ohonom yn arswydo o glywed bod un banc—Banc Lloyds TSB ccc—wedi bod yn anfon cardiau debyd at blant mor ifanc ag 11 oed a hwyrach yn annog gweithgarwch anghyfreithlon, oherwydd gallai fod yn helpu ac yn annog prynu pob mathau o nwyddau, megis pornograffi, sigarêts, fideos ac ati. Beth y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei wneud ynglŷn â hyn? Does bosibl fod hyn yn helpu gyda dyledion aelwydydd.

**Brian Gibbons:** Cyhoeddodd fy nghyd-Weinidog, Jane Hutt, yn y Cynulliad yn gynharach eleni y byddai llinyn newydd ar lythrennedd ariannol yn cael ei gynnwys yn y cwricwlwm ysgolion yng Nghymru. Bydd hynny'n ddatblygiad pwysig. Yr ydym hefyd yn gweithio i sefydlu uned addysg ariannol Cymru i sicrhau bod y cwricwlwm hwnnw wedi'i seilio ar wybodaeth gadarn ac yn darparu'r hyn y mae ar bobl ifanc ei angen ar gyfer eu busnes ariannol. Fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i ehangu undebau credyd i bob ysgol uwchradd yng Nghymru—nid i hyrwyddo cynilo yn unig, ond hefyd fel ffordd i ehangu ymwybyddiaeth ariannol pobl ifanc mewn ystyr ymarferol.

**David Lloyd:** O ran dyledion aelwydydd, fel

as you will be aware, during a recent meeting of the Business and Enterprise Committee at Westminster, energy bosses warned that households across the UK could face a 40 per cent increase in their gas and electricity bills later this year. Over 12 million households in the UK have benefited from the winter fuel allowance that you alluded to in your seasonal exchange with Brynle. I believe that the winter fuel allowance, which has cushioned pensioners from spiralling energy costs, should now be extended to include low-income households across the United Kingdom. It is the same proposal really. I have already written to Gordon Brown, seeking his consideration of this proposal. May I count on your support in this matter?

**Brian Gibbons:** Clearly, for families outside the pensioner group, there is considerable pressure. I have already made reference to the fact that there are great savings to be made by families if they can switch between various providers. The utility companies themselves are also aware of these particular problems and, in discussions with the UK Government, the main providers are looking at, for example, trying to introduce tariffs that get rid of the pre-payment premium that many struggling families face. Indeed, for prepayment meter customers, British Gas has introduced a social tariff that will be the same as the direct debit tariff. Scottish Gas and Southern Equity have done the same, and EDF Energy is looking at proposals. Therefore, while I understand Dai's point, there is considerable work that can be done to reduce the pressure of fuel bills on families by working with the utility companies.

**Darren Millar:** The cross-party group on faith recently received presentations from Christians against Poverty and Speakeasy—two faith-based organisations supporting people to manage their way out of debt in Wales. There must have been something in the air that night because the biggest challenges that both of these organisations suggested they were facing was sustainability of funding and the increased demand for their services across Wales. It seems to me that it all boils down to money, money, money.

y gwyddoch, yn ystod cyfarfod o'r Pwyllgor Busnes a Menter yn San Steffan yn ddiweddar rhybuddiodd y meistri ynni y gallai aelwydydd ar draws y DU weld cynnydd o 40 y cant yn eu biliau nwy a thrydan yn ddiweddarach eleni. Mae dros 12 miliwn o aelwydydd yn y DU wedi elwa o'r lwfans tanwydd gaeaf y cyfeiriasoch ato yn eich cyfarchion tymhorol gyda Brynle. Credaf y dylai'r lwfans tanwydd gaeaf, sydd wedi cysgodi pensiynwyr rhag y cynnydd yng nghostau ynni, gael ei ehangu yn awr i gynnwys aelwydydd ar incwm isel ar draws y Deyrnas Unedig. Yr un cynnig ydyw mewn gwirionedd. Yr wyf eisoes wedi ysgrifennu at Gordon Brown yn gofyn iddo ystyried y cynnig hwn. A gaf fi ddibynnu ar eich cefnogaeth chi yn y mater hwn?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yn amlwg, i deuluoedd y tu allan i'r grŵp pensiynwyr, mae yna gryn bwysau. Yr wyf eisoes wedi cyfeirio at y ffaith fod arbedion mawr y gall teuluoedd eu gwneud os gallant newid rhwng gwahanol ddarparwyr. Mae'r cwmnïau cyfleustodau eu hunain hefyd yn ymwybodol o'r problemau neilltuol hyn, ac mewn trafodaethau gyda Llywodraeth y DU mae'r prif ddarparwyr yn edrych, er enghraifft, ar geisio cyflwyno tariffau sy'n dileu'r premiwm rhag-dalu sy'n wynebu nifer o deuluoedd sy'n cael anawsterau. Yn wir, i gwsmeriaid mesuryddion rhag-dalu, mae Nwy Prydain wedi cyflwyno tariff cymdeithasol a fydd yr un fath â'r tariff debyd uniongyrchol. Mae Scottish Gas a Southern Equity wedi gwneud yr un peth, ac mae EDF Energy hefyd yn edrych ar gynigion. Felly, er fy mod yn deall pwynt Dai, mae gwaith sylweddol y gellir ei wneud i leihau pwysau biliau tanwydd ar deuluoedd drwy weithio gyda'r cwmnïau cyfleustodau.

**Darren Millar:** Yn ddiweddar, cafodd y grŵp ffydd trawsbleidiol sylwadau gan Christians against Poverty a Speakeasy—dau fudiad ffydd sy'n helpu pobl i reoli eu ffordd allan o ddyled yng Nghymru. Mae'n rhaid bod rhywbeth yn yr aer y noson honno, oherwydd y sialensiau mwyaf yr awgrymodd y naill a'r llall o'r mudiadau hyn yr oeddent yn eu hwynebu oedd cyllid cynaliadwy a'r cynnydd yn y galw am eu gwasanaethau ar draws Cymru. Mae'n ymddangos i mi mai hanfod hyn oll yw arian, arian, arian. Pa

What action are you taking to ensure that these valuable organisations are able to continue to offer their services to vulnerable people in the future?

**Brian Gibbons:** It was a very good meeting, and I commend Darren on helping to sponsor it. There was a very useful exchange of views from organisations that are doing good work. One way in which the One Wales Government is seeking to address this—and it is one of our commitments in the ‘One Wales’ agreement—is through having a comprehensive advice network across Wales. We are working with the Legal Services Commission and other commissioning organisations across Wales on a joint commissioning process. We are aware that there are certain risks in that particular process, and we need to give further, detailed considerations as to how those risks can be effectively managed.

**Y Llywydd:** Trosglwyddwyd cwestiwn 8, OAQ(3)0408(SJL), i’w ateb yn ysgrifenedig gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol.

### Local Government

**Q9 Alun Davies:** How is the Welsh Assembly Government helping local government to be more open and accountable? OAQ(3)0418(SJL)

**Brian Gibbons:** The Local Government Act 2000, supported by relevant regulations introduced by the Welsh Assembly Government, sets out key requirements on local authorities to operate in ways that are open, transparent and accountable. Local authorities also have a duty to publish their annual improvement plans, which account for their performance.

**Alun Davies:** One way in which we promote openness and accountability is through access to knowledge and understanding of how local authorities deliver services and of the performance of those services. I understand that the Welsh Assembly Government has already funded a project to develop the Ffynnon website. I am anxious, Minister, that this website should be promoted to enable people to understand what it does and to

gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd i sicrhau y gall y mudiadau gwerthfawr hyn barhau i gynnig eu gwasanaethau i bobl fregus yn y dyfodol?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr oedd yn gyfarfod da iawn, ac yr wyf yn canmol Darren am helpu ei noddi. Cafwyd cyfnewid barn buddiol iawn gan fudiadau sy’n gwneud gwaith da. Un ffordd y mae Llywodraeth Cymru’n Un yn ceisio ymdrin â hyn—ac mae’n un o’n hymrwymiaid yng nghytundeb ‘Cymru’n Un’—yw drwy gael rhwydwaith cynghori cynhwysfawr ar draws Cymru. Yr ydym yn gweithio gyda’r Comisiwn Gwasanaethau Cyfreithiol a chyrrff comisiynu eraill ledled Cymru ar broses gomisiynu ar y cyd. Gwyddom fod rhai risgiau yn y broses neilltuol honno, ac mae angen inni roi ystyriaeth fanwl, bellach, i’r ffordd y gellir rheoli’r risgiau hynny’n effeithiol.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 8, OAQ(3)0408(SJL) is transferred for written answer by the Minister for Health and Social Services.

### Llywodraeth Leol

**C9 Alun Davies:** Sut mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn helpu llywodraeth leol i fod yn fwy agored ac atebol? OAQ(3)0418(SJL)

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae Deddf Llywodraeth Leol 2000, ynghyd â rheoliadau perthnasol a gyflwynwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, yn nodi gofynion allweddol awdurdodau lleol i weithredu mewn ffyrdd sy’n agored, yn dryloyw ac yn atebol. Mae gan awdurdodau lleol hefyd ddyletswydd i gyhoeddi eu cynlluniau gwella blynyddol, sy’n rhoi cyfrif am eu perfformiad.

**Alun Davies:** Un ffordd yr ydym yn hyrwyddo bod yn agored ac yn atebol yw drwy allu cael gwybodaeth a dealltwriaeth o’r ffordd y mae awdurdodau lleol yn darparu gwasanaethau, ac o berfformiad y gwasanaethau hynny. Deallaf fod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru eisoes wedi cyllido prosiect i ddatblygu’r wefan Ffynnon. Yr wyf yn awyddus, Weinidog, i’r wefan hon gael ei hyrwyddo er mwyn galluogi pobl i

understand the performance of local authorities, which will enable them to hold authorities accountable.

**Brian Gibbons:** The Ffynnon website is an excellent development to improve services in local government and performance in general. I have had some preliminary discussions with the local government data unit, and I am keen to see whether the Ffynnon software could be put on display here in the Senedd, so that Assembly Members might have more direct experience of its potential benefits in understanding what is going on in their local authority areas, and as a way of promoting greater awareness among the public.

2.30 p.m.

**Nick Ramsay:** One way in which local government is striving to become more accountable is through the development of local service boards and related local delivery agreements. Do you agree that the jury is still out on whether local service boards will ultimately deliver the changes that we would like to see? Do you also agree that if they are to have a chance to work properly, extra resources will need to be made available to them and there will need to be strong leadership across the board?

**Brian Gibbons:** Local service boards are not statutory bodies and, as such, they are not resourced in the way that you imply. Following the Beecham review, there is a key requirement on all public bodies to work collaboratively in their local authority area and across boundaries. Local service boards are a key way of facilitating that development, and if we as an Assembly Government were not promoting local service boards actively, I would suggest that local bodies would have to invent something similar, because the days in which public bodies could deliver services in splendid isolation are long gone, and collaboration and partnership for improvement must be a keyword for all public services in Wales.

ddeall yr hyn mae'n ei wneud a deall perfformiad awdurdodau lleol. Bydd hynny'n eu galluogi i wneud awdurdodau'n atebol.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae'r wefan Ffynnon yn ddatblygiad rhagorol i wella gwasanaethau mewn llywodraeth leol a pherfformiad yn gyffredinol. Yr wyf wedi cael rhai trafodaethau rhagarweiniol gydag uned ddata llywodraeth leol, ac yr wyf yn awyddus i weld a fyddai modd arddangos meddalwedd Ffynnon yma yn y Senedd, fel y gallai Aelodau'r Cynulliad gael profiad mwy uniongyrchol o'i manteision posibl wrth ddeall yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn ardaloedd eu hawdurdodau lleol, ac fel ffordd i hyrwyddo mwy o ymwybyddiaeth ymhlith y cyhoedd.

**Nick Ramsay:** Un ffordd y mae llywodraeth leol yn ymdrechu i fod yn fwy atebol yw drwy ddatblygu byrddau gwasanaethau lleol a chytundebau darparu lleol yn gysylltiedig â hynny. A ydych yn cytuno nad oes sicrwydd eto y bydd byrddau gwasanaethau lleol yn y pen draw yn llwyddo i gyflawni'r newidiadau yr hoffem eu gweld? A ydych yn cytuno hefyd, os ydynt i gael cyfle i weithio'n iawn, y bydd angen trefnu bod adnoddau ychwanegol ar gael iddynt ac y bydd angen arweiniad cryf yn gyffredinol?

**Brian Gibbons:** Nid yw byrddau gwasanaethau lleol yn gyrff statudol, ac felly nid ydynt yn cael adnoddau yn y modd a awgrymwch. Yn dilyn adolygiad Beecham, mae gofyniad allweddol ar bob corff cyhoeddus i gydweithio yn ei ardal awdurdod lleol ac ar draws ffiniau. Mae byrddau gwasanaethau lleol yn ffordd allweddol i hwyluso'r datblygiad hwnnw, a phe na baem ni fel Llywodraeth Cynulliad wrthi'n hyrwyddo byrddau gwasanaethau lleol, awgrymaf y byddai'n rhaid i gyrff lleol ddyfeisio rhywbeth tebyg, oherwydd mae'r dyddiau pan allai cyrff cyhoeddus ddarparu gwasanaethau yn gwbl annibynnol wedi hen fynd, a rhaid i gydweithio a phartneriaeth er mwyn gwella fod yn allweddair i bob gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.



## Cwestiynau i Gomisiwn y Cynulliad Questions to the Assembly Commission

### Public Access to the Siambr

**Q1 Alun Cairns:** Will the Commissioner make a statement on public access to the Siambr? OAQ(3)0012(AC)

**The Commissioner for the Sustainable Assembly (Lorraine Barrett):** Escorted public and visitor access to the Siambr is permitted on non-business days but is restricted on business days for security and business-related reasons. On business days, we are pleased to encourage members of the public and visitors to gain an impressive view of the Siambr from the public gallery and we continue to receive positive feedback from members of the public about their visits to the Senedd generally.

**Alun Cairns:** This question has come up several times in the past. The purpose of my question about access to the Siambr was to ask about the public being able to come into the Chamber itself, although obviously not to stand on the piece of artwork in the centre, or to touch the mace that is on display or the computer equipment. Every individual and Assembly Member should have equal access to the Chamber within specific times. The feedback from people who have been able to come into the Chamber and view it from the centre—whether they are permitted or not, people simply have been in the Chamber—has been exceptionally positive. I ask you and the other Commissioners again to reconsider this policy, because it cannot be fair that ordinary members of the public cannot come in here in the way that some dignitaries have done in the past. Other chambers, in Westminster, Scotland and elsewhere in the Commonwealth, have much more open access than we do, when we pride ourselves on open government and open access.

**Lorraine Barrett:** As someone who brings lots of visitors and groups into the Assembly, I can sympathise with the comments that you made. I am always happy and prepared to go back and speak to officials, and to give these

### Mynediad y Cyhoedd i'r Siambr

**C1 Alun Cairns:** A wnaiff y Comisiynydd ddatganiad am fynediad y cyhoedd i'r Siambr? OAQ(3)0012(AC)

**Comisiynydd y Cynulliad Cynaliadwy (Lorraine Barrett):** Caniateir i'r cyhoedd ac ymwelwyr gael eu hebrwng i'r Siambr ar ddiwrnodau pan nad oes busnes, ond mae cyfyngiad ar ddiwrnodau busnes am resymau diogelwch a busnes. Ar ddiwrnodau busnes, yr ydym yn falch annog y cyhoedd ac ymwelwyr i gael golygfa wych o'r Siambr o'r oriel gyhoeddus, ac yn yr ydym yn dal i gael sylwadau cadarnhaol y cyhoedd am eu hymweliadau â'r Senedd yn gyffredinol.

**Alun Cairns:** Mae'r cwestiwn hwn wedi codi droeon yn y gorffennol. Pwrpas fy nghwestiwn ynglŷn â mynediad i'r Siambr oedd holi ynghylch caniatáu i'r cyhoedd ddod i mewn i'r Siambr ei hun, ond yn amlwg nid i sefyll ar y darn gwaith celf yn y canol, wrth reswm, nac i gyffwrdd y byrlysg sy'n cael ei arddangos na'r offer cyfrifiadurol. Dylai pob unigolyn ac Aelod Cynulliad gael yr un hawl mynediad i'r Siambr o fewn adegau penodol. Mae'r ymateb gan bobl sydd wedi cael dod i mewn i'r Siambr a'i gweld o'r canol—p'un a oes ganddynt ganiatâd neu beidio, y mae pobl wedi bod yn y Siambr—wedi bod yn eithriadol o gadarnhaol. Gofynnaf eto i chi a'r Comisiynwyr eraill ailystyried y polisi hwn, oherwydd ni all fod yn deg na chaiff aelodau cyffredin o'r cyhoedd ddod i mewn yma fel y mae rhai pwysigion wedi cael yn y gorffennol. Mae siambrau eraill, yn San Steffan, yr Alban a rhannau eraill o'r Gymanwlad, yn caniatáu mynediad llawer mwy agored nag sydd gennym ni, a ninnau'n ymfalchïo yn ein llywodraeth agored a mynediad agored.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Fel un sy'n dod â llawer o ymwelwyr a grwpiau i mewn i'r Cynulliad, gallaf gydymdeimlo â'r sylwadau a wnaethoch. Yr wyf bob amser yn fodlon ac yn barod i fynd yn ôl i siarad â swyddogion,

matters further thought, but our protocol came about because, during the period when we had open access—I would bring groups in and they would go to the front there—and large groups and smaller groups were coming in, some people were walking on the Heart of Wales and touching the mace. We even had incidents where voting cards were taken out, Members' seats were sat in and IT equipment was tampered with. After discussions with the police and the security and IT staff, we brought this protocol in to protect the infrastructure of the Chamber. I would suggest that some chambers in other parliamentary buildings do not have the same fixtures that we have here. These things happened, and the protocol exists to protect the infrastructure of the Chamber. I will go back and talk about it with officials, but there were serious concerns previously.

#### Health and Safety Advice

**Q2 Lesley Griffiths:** Will the Commissioner make a statement on the provision of health and safety advice to Assembly Member support staff? OAQ(3)0011(AC)

**Lorraine Barrett:** Members have the responsibility, as the employers of their staff, to ensure, as far as is reasonably practicable, their health, safety and welfare. In respect of constituency offices, the office costs allowance includes up to £2,000 per annum for security, disability access, and health and safety advice. If more is needed, Members can apply for it. For those Assembly Member support staff who work in Tŷ Hywel, the Assembly Commission has a duty to ensure, again, as far as is reasonably practicable, the provision of a safe place of work, and these two different types of responsibilities can include the provision of advice on health and safety matters.

**Lesley Griffiths:** A member of my support staff, based in my constituency office in Wrexham, recently had what was believed to be a work-related health issue. On contacting the Assembly's health and safety department, I was concerned to learn that the same level of resources is not offered to our staff based in the constituency as is offered to staff here

ac i roi mwy o ystyriaeth i'r materion hyn, ond daeth ein protocol i fod oherwydd, yn ystod y cyfnod pan oedd gennym fynediad agored—arferwn ddod â grwpiau i mewn a byddent yn mynd i'r tu blaen acw—gyda grwpiau mawr a grwpiau llai'n dod i mewn, byddai rhai pobl yn cerdded ar Galon Cymru ac yn cyffwrdd y byrillysg. Cawsom hyd yn oed ddigwyddiadau lle cymerwyd cardiau pleidleisio allan, eisteddwyd yn seddau Aelodau a chwaraewyd ag offer cyfrifiadurol. Ar ôl trafod gyda'r heddlu a'r staff diogelwch a TG, cyflwynwyd y protocol hwn i ddiogelu seilwaith y Siambr. Byddwn yn awgrymu nad oes mewn rhai siambrau mewn adeiladau seneddol eraill yr un gosodion ag sydd gennym ni yma. Digwyddodd y pethau hyn, ac mae'r protocol yn bodoli i warchod seilwaith y Siambr. Af yn ôl i siarad am hyn gyda swyddogion, ond yr oedd yna bryderon difrifol gynt.

#### Cyngor Iechyd a Diogelwch

**C2 Lesley Griffiths:** A wnaiff y Comisiynydd ddatganiad am ddarparu cyngor iechyd a diogelwch i staff cymorth Aelodau'r Cynulliad? OAQ(3)0011(AC)

**Lorraine Barrett:** Mae'n gyfrifoldeb ar Aelodau, fel cyflogwyr eu staff, i sicrhau, cyn belled ag sy'n rhesymol ymarferol, eu hiechyd, eu diogelwch a'u lles. Yn achos swyddfeydd etholaeth, mae'r lwfans costau swyddfa yn cynnwys hyd at £2,000 y flwyddyn ar gyfer diogelwch yr adeilad, mynediad i'r anabl, a chyngor ar iechyd a diogelwch. Os oes angen mwy, gall Aelodau wneud cais amdano. I staff cymorth Aelodau Cynulliad sy'n gweithio yn Nhŷ Hywel, mae'n ddyletswydd ar Gomisiwn y Cynulliad i sicrhau, eto cyn belled ag sy'n rhesymol ymarferol, y darperir lle diogel i weithio, a gall y ddau fath gwahanol hyn o gyfrifoldebau gynnwys darparu cyngor ar faterion iechyd a diogelwch.

**Lesley Griffiths:** Cafodd aelod o'm staff cymorth i, sy'n gweithio yn fy swyddfa etholaeth yn Wrecsam, broblem iechyd yn ddiweddar, a chredid ei bod yn gysylltiedig â'r gwaith. Pan gysylltais ag adran iechyd a diogelwch y Cynulliad, yr oedd yn ogid i mi ddeall na chynigir yr un lefel o adnoddau i'n staff yn yr etholaeth ag a gynigir i staff yma

in the Assembly offices. What plans does the Commission have to ensure that our constituency-based staff have access to the same services as our staff who are based here?

**Lorraine Barrett:** I am sorry to hear of the problems suffered by your member of staff. As I have just said, one resource is directly under the Commission's control for staff working in Tŷ Hywel, but the other resource is under the control of Members, as the constituency office is their responsibility, and the office costs allowance can be accessed for those services. One option that I have already discussed with officials is to remove the requirement for Members to spend the £2,000 in any one year, because I think that we all agree that health and safety issues are paramount, and occupational health matters are particularly serious. I am happy to continue discussions on that option, and any evidence that you can give us will also help us in the forthcoming review into allowances to see whether Members need any more provision for members of their staff in their constituency offices.

**The Presiding Officer:** I thank my Commissioner colleague for taking those questions.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd (Rosemary Butler) i'r Gadair am 2.37 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer (Rosemary Butler) took the Chair at 2.37 p.m.*

### **Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu ar Drefniadau Ariannu Ysgolion yng Nghymru** **The Enterprise and Learning Committee's Report on Arrangements for School Funding**

**Gareth Jones:** Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*yn nodi 'Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu—Trefniadau ariannu ysgolion yng Nghymru', a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Mai 2008. (NDM3980)*

A minnau'n Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu, mae'n bleser gennyf gynnig bod y Cynulliad yn nodi'r adroddiad hwn.

yn swyddfeydd y Cynulliad. Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Comisiwn i sicrhau y gall ein staff sy'n gweithio yn yr etholaethau gael yr un gwasanaethau â'n staff sy'n gweithio yma?

**Lorraine Barrett:** Mae'n flin gennyf glywed am y problemau a gafodd eich aelod staff. Fel yr wyf newydd ei ddweud, mae un adnodd dan reolaeth uniongyrchol y Comisiwn ar gyfer staff sydd yn gweithio yn Nhŷ Hywel, ond mae'r adnodd arall dan reolaeth Aelodau, gan mai eu cyfrifoldeb hwy yw'r swyddfa etholaeth, a gellir defnyddio'r lwfans costau swyddfa ar gyfer y gwasanaethau hynny. Un dewis yr wyf eisoes wedi'i drafod gyda swyddogion yw dileu'r gofyniad i Aelodau wario'r £2,000 mewn unrhyw un flwyddyn, oherwydd credaf ein bod i gyd yn cytuno bod materion iechyd a diogelwch yn hollbwysig, ac mae materion iechyd galwedigaethol yn arbennig o ddifrifol. Yr wyf yn hapus i barhau trafodaethau am y dewis hwnnw, a bydd unrhyw dystiolaeth y gallwch ei rhoi inni yn ein helpu hefyd yn yr adolygiad o lwfansau sydd i ddod, i weld a oes ar Aelodau angen mwy o ddarpariaeth o gwbl ar gyfer aelodau o'u staff yn eu swyddfeydd etholaeth.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch i'r Comisiynydd am gymryd y cwestiynau hynny.

**Gareth Jones:** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*notes the 'Report of the Enterprise and Learning Committee—Arrangements for school funding in Wales', which was laid in the Table Office on 6 May 2008. (NDM3980)*

As Chair of the Enterprise and Learning Committee, it is my pleasure to propose that the Assembly note this report.

Fel y gŵyr Aelodau, yn yr ail Gynulliad, sefydlwyd y Pwyllgor Ariannu Ysgolion i edrych ar dryloywder, gwrthrychedd a thegwch yn nosbarthiad yr arian ar gyfer addysg ein plant. Adroddodd y pwyllgor ym Mehefin 2006, gan gynnig 27 o argymhellion, 25 ohonynt wedi eu hanelu at Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Derbyniodd y Llywodraeth 23 o'r argymhellion hynny.

As Members will know, in the second Assembly the Committee on School Funding was established to look at transparency, objectivity and fairness in the distribution of money for our children's education. The committee reported in June 2006, proposing 27 recommendations, 25 of which were aimed at the Assembly Government. The Government accepted 23 of those recommendations.

Pan sefydlwyd y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu flwyddyn yn ôl, yr oedd ei aelodau yn unfryd o'r farn bod angen inni edrych o'r newydd ar fater ariannu ysgolion. Am fod nifer fawr o randdeiliaid allweddol yn dal i fynegi anfodlonrwydd ynghylch trefniadau ariannu, ac am na wnaethid unrhyw asesiad cynhwysfawr o'r modd yr oedd y Llywodraeth yn gweithredu argymhellion y pwyllgor blaenorol, penderfynwyd ymgymryd ag ymchwiliad dilynol fel arfer da mewn craffu effeithiol, ac er mwyn sicrhau cynnydd yn y maes.

When the Enterprise and Learning Committee was established a year ago, its members were unanimous in the view that there was a need to look anew at the matter of school funding. Since a great number of key stakeholders were still expressing dissatisfaction with funding arrangements, and since no comprehensive assessment had been made of the way the Government was implementing the former committee's recommendations, it was decided that a follow-up inquiry should be held as good practice in effective scrutiny and in order to ensure progress in the field.

Craffodd y pwyllgor ar y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau ym mis Tachwedd y llynedd i asesu i ba raddau yr oedd y Llywodraeth yn gweithredu'r 23 o argymhellion a dderbyniwyd yn 2006. Hoffwn ddiolch i'r Gweinidog am y modd y mae hi a'i hadran wedi cydweithio â ni yn ystod yr ymchwiliad. O ganlyniad i'r sesiwn graffu honno, penderfynasom ymgymryd ag ymgynghoriad ysgrifenedig a gofyn am gyngor arbenigol yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol a Phrif Arolygydd Ei Mawrhydi dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant yng Nghymru, sef Estyn. Bu i ni hefyd ymgynghori â'r Athro Glen Bramley, gan i'w adroddiad yntau ar amddifadedd ac ar ardaloedd prin eu poblogaeth ymddangos ar ddiwedd 2007. Yn benodol, bu i ni archwilio gydag ef a allai'r fformiwla bresennol fod yn llai dibynnol ar wariant yn y gorffennol. Edrychwn ymlaen at dderbyn y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf gan y Llywodraeth ar y pwyntiau penodol hynny maes o law.

The committee scrutinised the Minister for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills last November to assess the extent to which the Government was implementing the 23 recommendations accepted in 2006. I thank the Minister for the way in which she and her department have co-operated with us during the inquiry. As a result of that scrutiny session, we decided to undertake a written consultation and to seek the expert advice of the Auditor General and Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education and Training in Wales, namely Estyn. We also consulted Professor Glen Bramley, since his report on deprivation and sparsely populated areas appeared towards the end of 2007. Specifically, we investigated with him whether the current formula could be less dependent on past expenditure. We look forward to receiving an update from the Government on these specific points in due course.

Diolchaf i bawb a gyfrannodd at ein gwaith drwy gyflwyno tystiolaeth ysgrifenedig neu dystiolaeth ar lafar. Bu'r cyflwyniadau a thystiolaeth y tystion yn allweddol o ran ein

I thank everyone who contributed to our work by presenting written or oral evidence. The presentations and the evidence of witnesses were key in enabling us to

galluogi i ddeall maes cymhleth, amlweddog, ac i werthfawrogi yr anawsterau y mae amryw yn amlwg yn eu profi ar lawr gwlad.

understand a complex, multifaceted area and to appreciate the difficulties that a number of people experience at the coalface.

2.40 p.m.

Yr ydym wedi cynhyrchu adroddiad cryno i gyd-fynd â natur ein hymchwiliad dilynol, ond credwn fod y 10 argymhelliad sydd ynddo o'r pwys mwyaf os yw'r Llywodraeth o ddifrif ynghylch sicrhau bod trefniadau ariannu ein hysgolion yn gweithio yn fwy effeithiol, prydlon, cyson a thryloyw.

We have produced a succinct report to complement the nature of our follow-up inquiry, but we believe the 10 recommendations contained in it are of the greatest import if the Government is serious about ensuring that funding arrangements for our schools work more effectively, promptly, consistently and transparently.

I droi at yr argymhellion, ceisiaf eu cyflwyno ochr yn ochr ag ymateb y Gweinidog, gan grynhoi ein safbwynt fel Aelodau ar y materion sydd gerbron. Yr ydym yn falch bod y Gweinidog yn derbyn pob un o'n hargymhellion ond yn siomedig mai mewn egwyddor yn unig y gwna hynny mewn perthynas â phedwar ohonynt.

Turning to the recommendations, I will attempt to present them in tandem with the Minister's response, summarising our viewpoint as Members on the matters before us. We are pleased that the Minister accepts each of our recommendations, but disappointed that she accepts four of them in principle only.

I now turn to a more detailed discussion of the committee's recommendations and the Minister's response to them. The key areas of concern that we focused on were the need for effective information, the effective use of funding, the effectiveness of school budget fora and the quality of school buildings. It is clearly the case that the complexity of education funding compounds the perception of a funding fog. Almost all respondents to our consultation, which included the teaching unions, local authorities, school budget fora and the Welsh Local Government Association, felt that the funding process was not transparent and was difficult to understand.

Trof yn awr at drafodaeth fanylach ar argymhellion y pwyllgor ac ymateb y Gweinidog iddynt. Y meysydd pryder allweddol y bu inni ganolbwyntio arnynt oedd yr angen am wybodaeth effeithiol, defnyddio cyllid yn effeithiol, effeithiolrwydd fforymau cyllidebau ysgolion ac ansawdd adeiladau ysgolion. Mae cymhlethdod ariannu addysg yn amlwg yn ychwanegu at y syniad o niwl ariannu. Teimlai bron pawb a ymatebodd i'n hymgyngoriad, gan gynnwys yr undebau athrawon, awdurdodau lleol, fforymau cyllidebau ysgolion a Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, nad oedd y broses ariannu'n dryloyw a'i bod yn anodd ei deall.

We were especially grateful to the Wales Audit Office for its advice on financial reporting. The Auditor General highlighted a number of areas where he felt that Assembly Government guidance to authorities on the completion of returns was not clear enough. He drew our attention to the need to improve the consistency of published data, stating that,

Yr oeddem yn arbennig o ddiolchgar i Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru am ei chynghor ar adroddiadau ariannol. Tynnodd yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol sylw at nifer o feysydd lle teimlai nad oedd canllawiau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i awdurdodau ar gwblhau adroddiadau ariannol yn ddigon clir. Tynnodd ein sylw at yr angen i wella cysondeb data a gyhoeddir, gan ddweud,

'inconsistent compliance with accounting standards means that education budgets cannot be compared on a like-for-like basis'.

mae anghysondeb wrth gydymffurfio â safonau cyfrifyddu'n golygu na ellir cymharu cyllidebau addysg ar sail tebyg wrth ei debyg.

The way in which authorities choose to report, of course, can adjust the net education budget either above or below the indicator-based assessment, which was of particular concern to the committee. Given the strength of advice from the Wales Audit Office regarding the distortions caused by capital expenditure charged to the revenue account by some authorities, and differing but quite legitimate practices in terms of charges to the education budget for corporate services, we were compelled to recommend that the Welsh Assembly Government considers further revising guidance and/or regulations in respect of section 52 under the School Standards and Framework Act 1998 with regard to returns and revenue account forms. We are glad that the Minister has accepted this recommendation and that she has moved quickly to set up a working group to undertake a full review of regulations and guidance governing data collection under section 52. We ask that the Minister inform us of the group's main conclusions and recommendations in due course.

It is a fact of modern life that how we access and use information and our use of information and communications technology determines the quality of our private and professional lives. In order to aid the wide range of stakeholders that we consulted, and to ensure that they had access to clear, consistent and timely information, we made three specific recommendations with regard to the new school funding area on the Welsh Assembly Government's website. After a disappointing delay, we are glad that information about the funding of schools is now available on the web. We will continue to monitor the site's development, and stakeholders will no doubt make their views known to us.

We were most concerned by Estyn's assertion that:

'Generally, the strategic leadership of school reorganisation across Wales is weak',

and that in terms of local authorities' expenditure on buildings and accommodation, existing funds are not managed effectively. These weaknesses should be addressed as a matter of urgency,

Gall y modd y mae awdurdodau'n dewis adrodd, wrth gwrs, gymhwyso'r gyllideb addysg net uwchlaw ynteu islaw'r asesiad yn seiliedig ar ddangosyddion, pwynt a oedd yn peri pryder arbennig i'r pwyllgor. O gofio cryfder y cyngor gan Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru ynglŷn â'r ystumiadau a achosir wrth i rai awdurdodau godi gwariant cyfalaf ar y cyfrif refeniw, ac arferion gwahanol ond cwbl gyfreithlon o ran codi ar y gyllideb addysg am wasanaethau corfforaethol, yr oedd yn rhaid inni argymhell bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ystyried adolygu ymhellach y canllawiau a/neu'r rheoliadau perthnasol i adran 52 dan Ddeddf Safonau a Fframwaith Ysgolion 1998 o ran adroddiadau ariannol a ffurflenni cyfrifon refeniw. Yr ydym yn falch fod y Gweinidog wedi derbyn yr argymhelliad hwn ac wedi symud yn gyflym i sefydlu gweithgor i ymgymryd ag adolygiad llawn o'r rheoliadau a'r canllawiau ynglŷn â chasglu data dan adran 52. Gofynnwn i'r Gweinidog roi gwybod inni am brif gasgliadau ac argymhellion y gweithgor maes o law.

Un o ffeithiau bywyd cyfoes yw bod y ffordd yr ydym yn cael ac yn defnyddio gwybodaeth a'r modd y defnyddiwn dechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu yn penderfynu ansawdd ein bywydau preifat a phroffesiynol. Er mwyn cynorthwyo'r amrediad eang o randdeiliaid yr ymgynghorwyd â hwy, ac i sicrhau eu bod yn gallu cael gwybodaeth glir, gyson ac amserol, gwnaethom dri argymhelliad penodol parthed y rhan newydd ar ariannu ysgolion ar wefan Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Ar ôl oedi siomedig, yr ydym yn falch fod gwybodaeth ynghylch ariannu ysgolion bellach ar gael ar y we. Byddwn yn dal i fonitro datblygiad y wefan, ac mae'n siŵr y bydd rhanddeiliaid yn cyfleu eu barn inni.

Yr oeddem yn bryderus tu hwnt ynghylch haerriad Estyn fod:

yr arweiniad strategol ar ad-drefnu ysgolion ar draws Cymru yn gyffredinol wan,

ac o ran gwariant awdurdodau lleol ar adeiladau, nad yw'r cyllid presennol yn cael ei reoli'n effeithiol. Dylid rhoi sylw i'r gwendidau hyn ar frys, gan fod defnyddio gwariant yn effeithiol yn sylfaenol i

as the effective use of expenditure is fundamental to an effective education service.

We noted reports of the positive impact of schools appointing bursars or financial officers and, therefore, recommended that the Assembly Government review the role of bursars and finance officers and consider producing best practice guidance to be shared among all stakeholders. We are particularly pleased that the Minister, in her next remit letter for 2009-10, intends to commission Estyn to undertake a review to establish what impact bursars and finance officers have and to identify good practice.

Allied to that is the work of the school budget fora, which received broad support during our review. Without a defined role, there is always a danger that they could become nothing more than talking shops. We will, therefore, keep a watching brief on their operation to ensure that effective dialogue and understanding is maintained and enhanced between schools and local authorities.

Of our four remaining recommendations, the Minister has accepted these in principle only. On asset management plans, we felt that, while ultimate responsibility lies with local government to deliver buildings that are fit for purpose, there is strength in the argument that each council's asset management plan should be published and readily accessible, and that councils should consider them as part of wider authority asset management plans. We are aware of the guidance published by the Consortium of Local Authorities in Wales in 2001, which highlights the need for asset management plans to be integrated to the wider corporate planning framework. We are grateful to the Minister for directing CLAW and LEAs to express their views as to whether current guidance is adequate or needs updating.

Finally, I must report to the Assembly that Members were appalled that, at the beginning of the twenty-first century, the health, hygiene and safety of school toilets is still an

wasanaeth addysg effeithiol.

Nodwyd adroddiadau gennym am effaith gadarnhaol ysgolion yn penodi bwsariaid neu swyddogion cyllid, a dyna pam y bu inni argymhell y dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad adolygu rôl bwsariaid a swyddogion cyllid ac ystyried cynhyrchu cyfarwyddyd ar arfer gorau i'w rannu ymhlith yr holl randdeiliaid. Yr ydym yn arbennig o falch fod y Gweinidog, yn ei llythyr cylch gorchwyl nesaf ar gyfer 2009-10, yn bwriadu comisiynu Estyn i wneud adolygiad i sefydlu pa effaith a gaiff bwsariaid a swyddogion cyllid ac i nodi arfer da.

Yn gysylltiedig â hynny y mae gwaith y fforymau cyllideb ysgolion, a gafodd gefnogaeth gyffredinol yn ystod ein hadolygiad. Heb swyddogaeth bendant, mae perygl bob amser y gallent ddatblygu'n ddim mwy na siopau siarad. Felly, byddwn yn cadw golwg fanwl ar y modd y maent yn gweithredu er mwyn sicrhau bod cyfathrebu effeithiol a dealltwriaeth rhwng ysgolion ac awdurdodau lleol yn cael eu cynnal a'u gwella.

Mae'r Gweinidog wedi derbyn y pedwar argymhelliad sy'n weddill yn ein hadroddiad mewn egwyddor yn unig. O ran cynlluniau rheoli asedau, er mai cyfrifoldeb llywodraeth leol yn y pen draw yw darparu adeiladau sy'n addas at y diben, teimlem fod sail i'r ddadl o blaid cyhoeddi cynllun rheoli asedau pob cyngor a sicrhau ei fod ar gael i'w weld, ac y dylai cynghorau ystyried y cynlluniau fel rhan o gynlluniau rheoli asedau ehangach awdurdodau. Yr ydym yn ymwybodol o'r cyfarwyddyd a gyhoeddwyd gan Gonsortium Awdurdodau Lleol Cymru yn 2001, sy'n tynnu sylw at yr angen am gynnwys cynlluniau rheoli asedau yn y fframwaith cynllunio corfforaethol ehangach. Yr ydym yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am orchymyn i'r Consortium ac AALl roi eu barn am y cwestiwn a yw'r canllawiau cyfredol yn ddigonol, ynteu a oes angen eu diweddarau.

Yn olaf, rhaid imi ddweud wrth y Cynulliad fod yr Aelodau'n credu ei bod yn ofnadwyo beth, ar ddechrau'r unfed ganrif ar hugain, fod iechyd, glanweithdra a diogelwch

issue. Estyn has reported that facilities in 54 per cent of the primary schools inspected were criticised. That is in spite of the chief inspector's annual reports and the children's commissioner's 'Lifting the Lid' report in 2004. Recommendations 8 and 9 of our report stated categorically that the Welsh Assembly Government should undertake an immediate survey to establish the exact condition of pupils' toilets, and that necessary improvements be implemented as a matter of urgency. Members will be aware that the Minister announced such a survey last week, after the motion for this debate had been laid. We are delighted that she is addressing our concerns and that our report has had such an immediate outcome. We will monitor progress closely over the coming months. I am sure that the Assembly would wish me to emphasise today that, above all, the health and wellbeing of our children and young people are of paramount importance.

In conclusion, I am glad to inform the Assembly that the committee agreed its report unanimously. I thank Siân Hughes and David Blair of the Members' research service for their specialist support to our inquiry. I have already mentioned that the report is the product of a follow-up inquiry. We would commend this approach to Members as an effective, focused way of monitoring progress and securing policy development.

I gloi, edrychaf ymlaen at gyfraniadau aelodau'r pwyllgor ac eraill ac at ddadl adeiladol a chynhwysfawr am ein hadroddiad.

**Y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau (Jane Hutt):** Diolch, Gareth, am adroddiad pwyllgor da iawn.

I welcome the Enterprise and Learning Committee's work on arrangements for school funding and the commitment of Members to this important subject. As you know, the Government's response was made available to Members on 20 June and, at this stage of the debate, I wish to make reference to three important sets of recommendations.

toiledau ysgol yn dal yn broblem. Yn ôl Estyn, cafodd cyfleusterau 54 y cant o'r ysgolion cynradd a arolygwyd eu beirniadu. Mae hynny er gwaethaf adroddiadau blynyddol y prif arolygydd ac adroddiad 'Codi'r Clawr' a gyhoeddwyd gan y comisiynydd plant yn 2004. Yr oedd argymhellion 8 a 9 yn ein hadroddiad yn dweud yn ddiamod y dylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gynnal arolwg ar unwaith i weld beth yn union yw cyflwr toiledau disgyblion, ac y dylai gwelliannau angenrheidiol gael eu gweithredu'n fuan. Bydd Aelodau'n ymwybodol fod y Gweinidog wedi cyhoeddi arolwg felly wythnos diwethaf, ar ôl cyflwyno'r cynnig ar gyfer y ddadl hon. Yr ydym wrth ein bodd ei bod yn ymateb i'n pryderon, a bod ein hadroddiad wedi esgor ar ganlyniad mor uniongyrchol. Byddwn yn monitro'r cynnydd yn ofalus dros y misoedd nesaf. Yr wyf yn siŵr yr hoffai'r Cynulliad imi bwysleisio heddiw fod iechyd a lles ein plant a'n pobl ifanc, yn anad dim arall, o'r pwys mwyaf.

Wrth gloi, mae'n dda gennyf ddweud wrth y Cynulliad fod y pwyllgor wedi cytuno'n unfryd ar ei adroddiad. Hoffwn ddiolch i Siân Hughes a David Blair o wasanaeth ymchwil yr Aelodau am eu cefnogaeth arbenigol i'n hymchwiliad. Yr wyf eisoes wedi crybwyll mai cynnyrch ymchwiliad dilynol yw'r adroddiad. Byddem yn argymhell y dull hwn o weithio i Aelodau fel ffordd effeithiol a manwl i fonitro cynnydd a sicrhau datblygu polisi.

To close, I look forward to contributions from committee members and others and to a constructive and comprehensive debate on our report.

**The Minister for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills (Jane Hutt):** Thank you, Gareth, for a very good committee report.

Yr wyf yn croesawu gwaith y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu ar drefniadau ar gyfer ariannu ysgolion, ac ymroddiad yr Aelodau i'r pwnc pwysig hwn. Fel y gwyddoch, cafodd ymateb y Llywodraeth ei ddosbarthu i'r Aelodau ar 20 Mehefin, a'r pryd hwn yn y ddadl, hoffwn gyfeirio at dair cyfres bwysig o argymhellion.



As the Chair has outlined, the committee began by looking back at the recommendations contained in the first report in relation to transparency, objectivity and fairness in the arrangements for school funding in Wales. The report acknowledges that progress has been made, but points to new evidence, helpfully, from the Wales Audit Office, which identifies further areas for improvement.

2.50 p.m.

I can confirm this afternoon that these issues will be taken up by the working group that I have set up to provide revised guidance on how financial information is to be collected from local authorities. I will ensure that the group pays particular attention to the issue of section 52 returns and revenue account forms. I look forward to bringing the work of the group back to the committee, but my intention is that changes should be made in time for the collection of the 2009-10 budget data.

The second set of recommendations that I wish to address deals with dedicated web pages on school funding issues. Hopefully, Members will have already seen these web pages and I am pleased to say that they are now live. They provide information about how funding is allocated and associated topics. I want to make the web pages a core information source that is kept under development and review. I fully agree with the committee's recommendations that the availability of this new resource be widely advertised to parents, teachers, governors and all those with a direct interest in school funding. I also agree that the site ought to be used to develop a dialogue, so that we encourage feedback on the usefulness of the web pages and on the issues that they deal with.

Turning now to the issue of the Bramley report on school funding, there is, as the committee acknowledges, an interplay between three-year budgets and the wish to make changes on a shorter timescale. I am glad that the committee accepts that progress has been made in relation to three-year

Fel yr amlinellodd y Cadeirydd, man cychwyn y Pwyllgor oedd edrych yn ôl ar argymhellion yr adroddiad cyntaf o ran eglurder, gwrthrychedd a thegwch yn y trefniadau ar gyfer ariannu ysgolion yng Nghymru. Mae'r adroddiad yn cydnabod bod cynnydd wedi'i wneud, ond mae'n tynnu sylw at dystiolaeth newydd ddefnyddiol gan Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru, sy'n nodi rhagor o feysydd lle mae angen gwella.

Gallaf gadarnhau y prynhawn yma y bydd y materion hyn yn cael eu hystyried gan y gweithgor yr wyf wedi'i sefydlu i ddarparu cyfarwyddyd diwygiedig ar y modd y cesglir gwybodaeth ariannol gan awdurdodau lleol. Byddaf yn sicrhau bod y grŵp yn rhoi sylw arbennig i ffurflenni adran 52 a ffurflenni cyfrifon refeniw. Edrychaf ymlaen at ddod â gwaith y grŵp yn ôl gerbron y pwyllgor, ond fy mwriad yw y dylid gwneud newidiadau mewn pryd ar gyfer casglu data cyllideb 2009-10.

Mae'r ail gyfres o argymhellion yr hoffwn eu trafod yn ymwneud â thudalennau penodol ar y we ynglŷn ag ariannu ysgolion. Gobeithio bod yr Aelodau eisoes wedi gweld y tudalennau gwe hyn, ac mae'n bleser gennyf ddweud eu bod ar gael yn fyw bellach. Maent yn rhoi gwybodaeth am y ffordd y caiff arian ei ddyrannu a materion cysylltiedig. Mae arnaf eisiau i'r tudalennau gwe hyn fod yn ffynhonnell wybodaeth graidd a fydd yn cael ei datblygu a'i hadolygu'n barhaus. Cytunaf yn llwyr ag argymhellion y pwyllgor y dylid hysbysebu'r ffaith fod yr adnodd newydd hwn ar gael yn eang ymhlith rhieni, athrawon, llywodraethwyr a phawb sydd â diddordeb uniongyrchol mewn ariannu ysgolion. Cytunaf hefyd y dylid defnyddio'r safle i ddatblygu deialog, er mwyn inni annog adborth am ddefnyddioldeb y tudalennau gwe ac am y materion a drafodir arnynt.

I droi'n awr at adroddiad Bramley ar ariannu ysgolion, mae yna gydadwaith rhwng cyllidebau tair blynedd a'r awydd i wneud newidiadau mewn llai o amser, ac mae'r pwyllgor yn cydnabod hynny. Yr wyf yn falch fod y pwyllgor yn derbyn bod cynnydd wedi'i wneud o ran ariannu tair blynedd.

funding. It was, after all, a priority recommendation in its first report. I now agree that the Bramley report's conclusions on educational attainment and funding distribution need to be thoroughly discussed and made congruent with any wider developments in local authority finance. I will be working to that end with Brian Gibbons to find a way to achieve change that is progressive, outcome-focused and well planned and that links to wider policy developments and to commitments to tackle child poverty, in recognition of the impact of child poverty on attainment, as Bramley identifies. I am hopeful that some improvements will be possible from 2010, and I will keep the committee informed, as one of the report's recommendations suggests.

My acceptance of a number of proposals in principle only is because they involve others, including local education authorities. However, I will engage with them to ensure that we succeed in implementing the proposals in full. Therefore, I have responded to the issues relating to asset management plans in full in my written statement, and, as the Chair said in his introduction, they link to schools' reorganisation responsibilities and the capital programme. I am sure that that matter will be brought up in the debate and then I can respond in full.

Finally, I want to acknowledge and thank the committee for the work that it has done, and for drawing out the issues relating to school toilets from Estyn and the Children's Commissioner for Wales. The report does not specifically place this matter in the context of school funding but links it to the quality of school buildings. However, there are clear links to asset management. I fully accept that evidence from Estyn and the Children's Commissioner for Wales's report demonstrates that action is needed across Wales.

The responsibility for providing adequate and sufficient toilet facilities rests with local authorities. However, as Minister, my responsibility is to draw the attention of those responsible to any issues that need to be

Wedi'r cyfan, yr oedd yn argymhelliad blaenoriaeth yn yr adroddiad cyntaf. Cytunaf yn awr fod angen i gasgliadau adroddiad Bramley ar gyrhaeddiad addysgol a dosbarthu arian gael eu trafod yn fanwl a'u gwneud ochr yn ochr ag unrhyw ddatblygiadau ehangach yng nghyllid awdurdodau lleol. Byddaf yn gweithio i'r diben hwnnw gyda Brian Gibbons i ddod o hyd i ffordd i sicrhau newid sy'n flaengar, yn canolbwyntio ar ganlyniadau, wedi'i gynllunio'n dda ac yn cysylltu â datblygiadau polisi ehangach ac ymrwymadau i ymdrin â thlodi plant, er mwyn cydnabod effaith tlodi plant ar gyrhaeddiad, fel y mae Bramley yn ei nodi. Gobeithio y bydd rhywfaint o welliannau'n bosibl o 2010, a byddaf yn rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i'r pwyllgor, fel y mae un o argymhellion yr adroddiad yn ei awgrymu.

Derbyniais rai cynigion mewn egwyddor yn unig am eu bod yn cwmpasu cyrff eraill, gan gynnwys awdurdodau addysg lleol. Fodd bynnag, byddaf yn gweithio gyda â hwy i sicrhau ein bod yn llwyddo i gyflwyno'r cynigion yn llawn. Felly, yr wyf wedi ymateb i'r materion sy'n ymwneud â chynlluniau rheoli asedau yn llawn yn fy natganiad ysgrifenedig, ac fel y dywedodd y Cadeirydd yn ei gyflwyniad, mae cyswllt rhyngddynt â chyfrifoldebau ad-drefnu ysgolion a'r rhaglen gyfalaf. Yr wyf yn siŵr y caiff y mater hwnnw ei godi yn ystod y drafodaeth, ac yna gallaf ymateb yn llawn iddo.

Yn olaf, hoffwn gydnabod a diolch i'r pwyllgor am ei waith, ac am fynd ar drywydd y problemau'n ymwneud â thoiledau ysgolion a godwyd gan Estyn a Chomisiynydd Plant Cymru. Nid yw'r adroddiad yn gosod y mater hwn yn bendant yng nghyd-destun ariannu ysgolion, ond mae'n ei gysylltu ag ansawdd adeiladau ysgolion. Fodd bynnag, mae yna gysylltiadau clir â rheoli asedau. Derbynaf yn llwyr fod y dystiolaeth gan Estyn ac adroddiad Comisiynydd Plant Cymru yn dangos bod angen gweithredu ledled Cymru.

Cyfrifoldeb awdurdodau lleol yw darparu cyfleusterau toiled addas a digonol. Fodd bynnag, fel Gweinidog fy nghyfrifoldeb i yw tynnu sylw'r sawl sy'n gyfrifol at unrhyw broblemau y mae angen mynd i'r afael â

addressed. There must then be proper regimes in place through which local authority performance can be assessed and assurance given on the adequacy of facilities. When shortcomings are identified, they must be addressed by local authorities and schools with remedial action plans. I share the committee's wish to see urgent improvement in the cleanliness, hygiene and safety of school toilets, and I will be monitoring the situation closely.

With these overall comments on these sets of recommendations, I look forward to the debate, and I will respond in due course.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** I thank the committee Chair for his opening remarks and the committee for bringing together this report, which is timely. I am commenting on the report, despite the fact that I was not a Member of the committee at the time. However, I have a great interest in this report as an Assembly Member and a parent.

I have always found the deficit in school funding to be a quagmire that no-one seems to be able to get out of. I note that the first page of the report welcomes the introduction of three-year funding, but states that little progress has been made in the other areas that were identified in the initial report that was brought before the Assembly in 2006. Turning the page, I see that one contribution to the consultation report notes that:

'Where some of the funding fog has lifted it is still far too dense'.

We all feel that. Long before I became an elected Member of this institution, I was a governor of a small primary school—and, indeed, I still am. When the headteacher tries to explain why the LEA will not fund x, y, or z, you try to seek an answer, but it is nigh on impossible. It is as though you are faced with a fog. I welcome the initiative in this report to develop an understanding with bursars and school governors on how we finance our educational establishments.

Given the recent fiasco surrounding the

hwy. Rhaid sicrhau, felly, fod systemau priodol ar waith i asesu perfformiad awdurdodau lleol a rhoi sicrwydd am addasrwydd cyfleusterau. Lle dangosir bod diffygion, rhaid i awdurdodau lleol ac ysgolion fynd i'r afael â hwy drwy gyfrwng cynlluniau gweithredu i wella'r sefyllfa. Fel y pwyllgor, yr wyf yn awyddus i weld gwelliant yn fuan yng nglendid, glanweithdra a diogelwch toiledau ysgol, a byddaf yn monitro'r sefyllfa'n ofalus.

Gyda'r sylwadau cyffredinol hyn ar y cyfresi hyn o argymhellion, edrychaf ymlaen at y ddadl, a byddaf yn ymateb iddi maes o law.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Hoffwn ddiolch i Gadeirydd y pwyllgor am ei sylwadau agoriadol, ac i'r pwyllgor am lunio'r adroddiad amserol hwn. Yr wyf yn rhoi sylwadau ar yr adroddiad er nad oeddwn yn aelod o'r pwyllgor ar y pryd. Fodd bynnag, mae gennyf ddiddordeb mawr yn yr adroddiad hwn fel Aelod o'r Cynulliad ac fel rhiant.

Yr wyf bob amser wedi meddwl bod y diffyg arian ar gyfer ysgolion yn gors nad oes neb fel pebaent yn gallu dod allan ohoni. Gwelaf fod tudalen gyntaf yr adroddiad yn croesawu cyflwyno ariannu tair blynedd, ond yn dweud mai prin fu'r cynnydd yn y meysydd eraill y tynnwyd sylw atynt yn yr adroddiad cychwynnol a ddaeth gerbron y Cynulliad yn 2006. Wedi troi'r ddalen, sylwaf fod un cyfraniad i'r adroddiad ymgynghori yn nodi:

Er bod rhywfaint o'r niwl cyllido wedi codi, mae'n dal yn rhy drwchus o lawer.

Yr ydym i gyd yn teimlo hynny. Ymhell cyn imi ddod yn Aelod etholedig o'r sefydliad hwn, yr oeddwn yn llywodraethwr ar ysgol gynradd fechan—ac, yn wir, yr wyf yn dal yn llywodraethwr arni. Pan fydd y pennaeth yn ceisio egluro pam nad yw'r AALl yn fodlon ariannu a, b, neu c, byddwch yn ceisio cael ateb, ond mae bron yn amhosibl. Mae'n union fel petaech yn wynebu niwl. Croesawaf y fenter yn yr adroddiad hwn i ddatblygu dealltwriaeth gyda bwrsariaid a llywodraethwyr ysgolion ynglŷn â'r ffordd yr ydym yn ariannu ein sefydliadau addysgol.

O gofio'r llanast yn ddiweddar gyda'r cyfnod

foundation phase, I recently went to meet two headteachers and a governor from Rhondda Cynon Taf. They put their budgets before me and showed me that, at the bottom of the budget, there was a 1 per cent efficiency cut implemented by the LEA. Not one of them could explain what that 1 per cent would be used for. They did not know whether it would be retained within the local education authority's budget or put back into the council budget as a whole. I thought that it was telling that, despite the numerous investigations that we have had at the Assembly, those people at the cutting edge who have the professional qualifications are still having problems dealing with the funding issues that they face.

On a further visit to Cantonian High School, the headteacher highlighted an anomaly between her budget and that of a similar school in England. There was a difference of around £2 million in funding, as her budget was £4 million while that of a comparable school in England was £6 million. That is a massive disparity, and these gaps will impede the effective delivery of education in Wales. I welcome the Chair's comment, and I think that he is right to highlight the fact that this is a supplementary report to the main report that came out in 2006. It is too easy to park a report, or to deal with one or two issues and not to see it through to its conclusion. It has been an effective piece of work by the committee to address current issues and to look back at what was recommended in 2006.

The Bramley report is emphasised in the committee's report, and evidence is taken from it. I appreciate that the Government is in the process of digesting that, as is the case with the Reed report. We await the outcomes that will result from the Government's taking on board the advice of those two critical reports on improving education in Wales.

What is also fundamental—and was an adopted manifesto commitment of the Conservative Party—is the commitment to a three-year spending cycle. That provides clarity and security to headteachers and

sylfaen, euthum i gyfarfod dau bennaeth ysgol a llywodraethwr yn Rhondda Cynon Taf yn ddiweddar. Rhoesant eu cyllidebau o'm blaen a dangos imi, ar waelod y gyllideb, fod toriad effeithlonrwydd o 1 y cant wedi'i weithredu gan yr AALL. Ni allai'r naill na'r llall egluro i ba ddiben y byddid yn defnyddio'r 1 y cant hwnnw. Nid oeddent yn gwybod a fyddai'n cael ei gadw yng nghyllideb yr awdurdod addysg lleol ynteu'n cael ei ddychwelyd i gyllideb y cyngor yn gyffredinol. Yr oeddwn yn meddwl ei bod yn arwyddocaol, er gwaethaf yr ymchwiliadau niferus a gawsom yn y Cynulliad, fod y bobl hynny sydd ar flaen y gad ac sydd â'r cymwysterau proffesiynol yn dal i gael trafferth wrth ymdrin â'r problemau ariannu y maent yn eu hwynebu.

Ar ymweliad pellach ag Ysgol Uwchradd Cantonian, tynnodd y pennaeth sylw at anghysondeb rhwng ei chyllideb hi a chyllideb ysgol debyg yn Lloegr. Yr oedd gwahaniaeth o tua £2 filiwn yn yr arian, gan fod ei chyllideb hi yn £4 miliwn a chyllideb yr ysgol debyg yn Lloegr yn £6 miliwn. Mae hwnnw'n wahaniaeth enfawr, a bydd y bylchau hyn yn rhwystro darparu addysg yn effeithiol yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn croesawu sylwadau'r Cadeirydd, a chredaf ei fod yn gywir i dynnu sylw at y ffaith mai adroddiad atodol at y prif adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd yn 2006 yw hwn. Mae'n rhy hawdd rhoi adroddiad ar silff, neu ymdrin ag un neu ddau fater a pheidio â dilyn y gwaith i'r pen. Mae'n ddarn effeithiol o waith gan y pwyllgor i ymdrin â'r problemau cyfredol ac edrych yn ôl ar yr hyn a argymhellwyd yn 2006.

Caiff adroddiad Bramley ei bwysleisio yn adroddiad y pwyllgor, a defnyddir tystiolaeth ohono. Yr wyf yn sylweddoli bod y Llywodraeth wrthi'n ystyried yr adroddiad hwnnw, fel gydag adroddiad Reed. Yr ydym yn aros am y canlyniadau a fydd yn deillio wrth i'r Llywodraeth dderbyn cyngor y ddau adroddiad hollbwysig hynny ar wella addysg yng Nghymru.

Yr hyn sydd hefyd yn hanfodol—ac a oedd yn ymrwymiad a fabwysiadwyd ym maniffesto'r Blaid Geidwadol—yw'r ymrwymiad i gylch gwario tair blynedd. Mae hynny'n rhoi eglurder a sicrwydd i

governing bodies when managing their assets and developing their schools. That has to be of critical benefit to education in Wales.

The report also highlights the importance of looking at school buildings as community assets so that they are used and developed for community purposes as well as for educational purposes. Hopefully, that will release more funding to develop those buildings into first-class, twenty-first-century community assets. I draw the attention of the Minister and the committee to a project undertaken some three years ago at Llanfair Primary School in my constituency, which was an excellent initiative. The school hall is also used as a community hall, so is at the heart of the community. If the partnership between the community and the school had not worked, that idea would never have taken off. That is a good example of what this report recommends.

The Minister made an announcement last week about improving hygiene in school toilets. When I think of the problems faced by LEAs in that regard, such as the E. coli outbreak in Bridgend—although that did not relate to school toilets, personal hygiene was a critical factor—I welcome the fact that the committee is looking at this issue. I hope that, on the back of the Minister's inquiry, LEAs will be compelled to deliver the sanitary and hygienic facilities in our schools that we should be able to take for granted.

**Huw Lewis:** I thank those who gave evidence to the committee and also thank Gareth, who always does a superb job as chair.

3.00 p.m.

We heard some important evidence, which Gareth has ably summarised, and I will focus my remarks on the most important outcome of the initial Committee on School Funding: the Bramley report. The committee universally agreed that this report's recommendations, if accepted, would represent a radical change in the way in

benaeithiaid ysgolion a chyrrff llywodraethu wrth reoli eu hasedau a datblygu eu hysgolion. Mae'n rhaid bod hynny o les hanfodol i addysg yng Nghymru.

Mae'r adroddiad hefyd yn tynnu sylw at edrych ar adeiladau ysgolion fel asedau cymunedol er mwyn eu defnyddio a'u datblygu at ddibenion cymunedol yn ogystal ag addysgol. Gobeithio y bydd hynny'n rhyddhau mwy o arian i ddatblygu'r adeiladau hynny yn asedau cymunedol o'r radd flaenaf sy'n addas i'r unfed ganrif ar hugain. Tynnaf sylw'r Gweinidog a'r pwyllgor at brosiect a wnaethpwyd tua tair blynedd yn ôl yn Ysgol Gynradd Llanfair yn fy etholaeth i, a oedd yn fenter ragorol. Caiff neuadd yr ysgol ei defnyddio hefyd fel neuadd gymuned, felly, hi yw calon y gymuned. Pe na byddai'r bartneriaeth rhwng y gymuned a'r ysgol wedi gweithio, ni fyddai'r syniad hwnnw erioed wedi ei ddatblygu. Mae hynny'n enghraifft dda o'r hyn y mae'r adroddiad hwn yn ei argymhell.

Gwnaeth y Gweinidog gyhoeddiad yr wythnos diwethaf ynglŷn â gwella glanweithdra mewn toiledau ysgol. Pan feddyliaf am y problemau sy'n wynebu AALl yn y cyswllt hwnnw, megis yr achosion o E. coli ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr—er nad oedd hynny'n ymwneud â thoiledau ysgol, yr oedd glendid personol yn ffactor hollbwysig—croesawaf y ffaith fod y pwyllgor yn ystyried y mater hwn. Gobeithio, ar sail ymchwiliad y Gweinidog, y caiff AALlau eu cymhell i ddarparu'r cyfleusterau glanweithdra yn ein hysgolion y dylem allu eu cymryd yn ganiataol.

**Huw Lewis:** Hoffwn ddiolch i'r rheini a roddodd dystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor, a diolch hefyd i Gareth, sydd bob amser yn gwneud gwaith rhagorol fel cadeirydd.

Clywsom dystiolaeth bwysig, a grynhowyd yn fedrus gan Gareth, ac yr wyf am ganolbwyntio fy sylwadau ar ganlyniad pwysicaf y Pwyllgor cyntaf ar Ariannu Ysgolion: adroddiad Bramley. Cytunodd y pwyllgor yn gyffredinol y byddai argymhellion yr adroddiad hwn, pe caent eu derbyn, yn golygu newid mawr yn y ffordd y

which our schools are funded. I also think that we approached near unanimous acceptance as to the logic behind the Bramley report's findings. Although some are worried about the report, particularly in local government, and I know that the Minister is also cautious about how to proceed: no-one has yet argued against the evidence put forward by Bramley, nor have they put forward a cogent case as to why the recommendations should not be implemented. Therefore, my central question today is this: if no-one is prepared to argue why Bramley might be wrong, why are we not implementing his suggested changes right now? The report is complicated, but no more complicated than the arcane funding formula that we have inherited, with which we muddle through today. It is a truly pitiful argument, and I have heard it put, that the report should be shelved because it requires thoughtful understanding.

There is a lot about the Bramley report that is straightforward. It destroys the myth, which has been peddled in this Chamber before, that there is no link between educational spending and attainment; there is such a link. I remember studying the first spend per head figures for our schools, which arrived on my desk in 1999, and noticing immediately the wild variation between spend in the lower spending authority, Blaenau Gwent, and in the highest spending authority—the variation was 100 per cent at that time. It was no coincidence that the authority with the highest spend was at the top of the educational attainment league and that Blaenau Gwent was at the bottom, joined occasionally by my local authority of Merthyr Tydfil, although Caerphilly, in the Rhymney side of my constituency, historically does better. There is clearly, and there has been since 1999, a link between spending and attainment; since that time, nine cohorts of Welsh schoolchildren have passed through our care without this injustice being righted.

Crucially, Bramley states that the most important drivers of attainment are simple and twofold: special educational needs and poverty. That should be common sense, but, as always when breaking down vested

mae ein hysgolion yn cael eu hariannu. Credaf hefyd ein bod bron yn unfrydol yn derbyn y rhesymeg a oedd wrth wraidd canfyddiadau adroddiad Bramley. Er bod rhai'n poeni am yr adroddiad, yn enwedig ym maes llywodraeth leol, a gwn fod y Gweinidog hefyd yn ochelgar ynglŷn â sut i symud ymlaen: nid oes neb eto wedi dadlau yn erbyn y dystiolaeth a gyflwynwyd gan Bramley, nac wedi cyflwyno achos cryf pam na ddylid gweithredu'r argymhellion. O ganlyniad, fy nghwestiwn canolog heddiw yw hyn: os nad oes neb yn barod i ddadlau pam y gallai Bramley fod yn anghywir, pam nad ydym yn awr yn gweithredu'r newidiadau a awgrymwyd ganddo? Mae'r adroddiad yn gymhleth, ond nid yw'n fwy cymhleth na'r fformiwla ariannu ddirgel a etifeddwyd gennym, ac a ddefnyddir gennym heddiw rywsut rywfodd. Mae'n ddadl druenus iawn, a chlywais rywun yn dweud y dylai'r adroddiad gael ei roi o'r neilltu gan fod angen dealltwriaeth ystyriol ohono.

Mae nifer o bethau syml ynglŷn ag adroddiad Bramley. Mae'n chwala'r syniad, sydd wedi ei bedlera yn y Siambr hon o'r blaen, nad oes cysylltiad rhwng gwariant a chyrhaeddiad addysgol; y mae cysylltiad rhwng y ddau. Cofiaf astudio'r ffigurau cyntaf ar wariant y pen ar gyfer ein hysgolion, a roddwyd ar fy nesg yn 1999, a sylwi ar unwaith ar yr amrywiad enfawr rhwng gwariant yn yr awdurdod gwariant isaf, sef Blaenau Gwent, a'r awdurdod gwariant uchaf—yr oedd yr amrywiad yn 100 y cant bryd hynny. Nid cyd-ddigwyddiad oedd y ffaith fod yr awdurdod a oedd â'r gwariant uchaf ar frig y gynghrair cyrhaeddiad addysgol a Blaenau Gwent ar y gwaelod. Yr oedd fy awdurdod lleol i, sef Merthyr Tudful, yno hefyd o bryd i'w gilydd, er bod Caerffili, ar ochr Rhymni yn fy hetholaeth, yn gwneud yn well yn hanesyddol. Mae'n amlwg fod cysylltiad, er 1999, rhwng gwariant a chyrhaeddiad; ers hynny, mae plant naw blwyddyn ysgol yng Nghymru wedi mynd drwy ein gofal heb inni gywiro'r anghyfiawnder hwn.

Yn ôl Bramley, y ffactorau pwysicaf sy'n effeithio ar gyrhaeddiad, yn syml iawn, yw anghenion addysgol arbennig a thlodi. Dylai hynny fod yn synnwyr cyffredin, ond fel arfer wrth ddadansoddi budd, nid yw synnwyr

interests, common sense is not enough, you must show the evidence. We now have that evidence. I have stated before that I applaud schemes like Flying Start and raising attainment and individual standards in education in Wales, which are helping to fix the problem of poor attainment in deprived areas. However, the existence of these schemes betrays the fact that the overarching funding system does not deliver a fair start in life for all Welsh children.

Surely, Minister, it is now time to tackle the cause and not the effect. I recall the Minister telling the committee that there would be a meeting of the distribution sub-group to discuss school funding in light of the Bramley report; I think that all committee members would be keen to learn the outcome of that. I urge the Minister and all Assembly Members not to let this critical report into how we spend billions of pounds on our children's education go unheeded. Many will remember the heated discussions that we had on the Townsend report into health spending in Wales. That research was based on tackling the inverse care law, moving the money to where sick people live, which should have been a simple, progressive case to make. However, where is Townsend today? It has disappeared. We cannot let Bramley become another Townsend.

**Janet Ryder:** As someone who sat on that first inquiry into school funding, it is sad to think that we are still holding inquiries, that it is still not clear how much money goes into schools and how it gets there and that there is still so much confusion. I welcome the Minister's intention to take up the recommendations relating to section 52, because some of the funding fog arises around the section 52 return.

As we heard in committee, there are many different ways in which local authorities can, quite legitimately, report on how much they retain, the amount that they charge between departments within councils for services, and how they account for their maintenance and repairs. All of those different things can create what would appear to be huge

cyffredin yn ddigon, a rhaid ichi ddangos y dystiolaeth. Mae'r dystiolaeth honno gennym erbyn hyn. Yr wyf wedi dweud o'r blaen fy mod yn cymeradwyo cynlluniau fel Dechrau'n Deg a gwella cyrhaeddiad a safonau unigol mewn addysg yng Nghymru, sy'n helpu datrys problem cyrhaeddiad isel mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig. Fodd bynnag, mae bodolaeth y cynlluniau hyn yn bradychu'r ffaith nad yw'r system ariannu gyffredinol yn rhoi dechrau teg mewn bywyd i holl blant Cymru.

Onid yw'n bryd yn awr, Weinidog, inni fynd i'r afael â'r achos yn hytrach na'r effaith? Cofiaf y Gweinidog yn dweud wrth y pwyllgor y cynhelid cyfarfod o'r is-grŵp dosbarthu i drafod ariannu ysgolion yn dilyn adroddiad Bramley; credaf y byddai pob aelod o'r pwyllgor yn hoffi gwybod beth oedd canlyniad hynny. Anogaf y Gweinidog a phob Aelod Cynulliad i beidio â gadael i'r adroddiad pwysig hwn am y ffordd yr ydym yn gwario biliynau o bunnoedd ar addysg ein plant fynd heibio'n ddisylw. Bydd llawer yn cofio'r trafodaethau brwd a gawsom ar adroddiad Townsend ynglŷn â gwariant ar iechyd yng Nghymru. Yr oedd y gwaith ymchwil hwennw'n seiliedig ar fynd i'r afael â'r ddeddf gofal gwrthgyfartal, a symud yr arian i'r man lle mae pobl wael yn byw, a ddylai fod yn achos syml a blaengar i'w gyflwyno. Fodd bynnag, ble mae Townsend heddiw? Mae wedi diflannu. Ni allwn adael i Bramley fod yn Townsend arall.

**Janet Ryder:** Fel rhywun a oedd yn rhan o'r ymchwiliad cyntaf hwennw i ariannu ysgolion, mae'n drist meddwl ein bod yn dal i gynnal ymchwiliadau, ei bod yn dal yn aneglur faint o arian sy'n mynd i ysgolion, a sut y mae'n cyrraedd yno, a bod cymaint o ddryswch o hyd. Yr wyf yn croesawu bwriad y Gweinidog i fynd ar ôl yr argymhellion sy'n ymwneud ag adran 52, gan fod rhywfaint o'r niwl ariannu'n deillio o ddatganiad adran 52.

Fel y clywsom yn y pwyllgor, gall awdurdodau lleol adrodd mewn llawer ffordd wahanol, yn gwbl ddilys, am yr hyn y maent yn ei gadw, faint y mae gwahanol adrannau mewn cynghorau'n ei godi ar ei gilydd am wasanaethau, a sut y maent yn rhoi cyfrif am eu gwaith cynnal a chadw a thrwsio. Gall yr holl bethau gwahanol hynny greu

differences in spending, on paper, between authorities. While a fair argument could be built that the way in which local authorities choose to spend their education budgets is a local decision—that they should be held accountable locally by their constituents as to priorities within their own budgets on education—you cannot prevent parents from comparing budgets with those of other counties to see how their children are faring. Yet, we know very clearly, from the evidence that we have taken, that they may not be looking at comparable things—the same things are not accounted for in the same way. Further recommendations and clarification from the Assembly to local authorities would take us one step closer to clearing that funding fog.

Andrew R.T. Davies today made comparisons with England. We have always had this argument, but if we are not sure how those figures are arrived at, it is difficult to make those comparisons. It also creates difficulties in other areas. This was one of the arguments that led to the establishment of the first Committee on School Funding. Schools hear announcements made here about certain sums of money going to schools, and when headteachers and governors receive their budgets they will look at them and think, 'Now, where is that money?'. It is not clear. We have school funding fora that should be making what is happening a little clearer to schools, especially in relation to the middle bit, but it does not always happen. We had a classic example—or we are in the middle of a classic example—in relation to the foundation phase, where there are arguments about what is happening here, in local government and in schools. It needs to be cleared up.

I also want to point to issues with regard to the small grant culture. Although some work has been done on trying to remove the bureaucracy, which eats into teachers' and headteachers' time in preparing bids for funding, there was clear evidence when the committee first took evidence—I think that it still holds true—that those grants should, as

gwahaniaethau mewn gwariant a fyddai'n ymddangos yn rhai mawr iawn ar bapur rhwng awdurdodau. Gellid dadlau ei bod yn briodol i'r penderfyniad ynglŷn â sut y mae awdurdodau lleol yn dewis gwario'u cyllidebau addysg gael ei wneud yn lleol—y dylent gael eu galw i gyfrif yn lleol gan eu hetholwyr yng nghyswllt blaenoriaethau yn eu cyllidebau eu hunain ym maes addysg—ond ni allwch atal rhieni rhag cymharu cyllidebau â chyllidebau siroedd eraill er mwyn gweld beth yw sefyllfa eu plant. Ac eto, gwyddom yn iawn, o'r dystiolaeth a glywsom, nad ydynt efallai'n edrych ar bethau cymaradwy—nid yw'r un pethau'n cael eu hegluro yn yr un ffordd. Byddai rhagor o argymhellion ac eglurhad gan y Cynulliad i awdurdodau lleol yn mynd â ni un cam yn nes at glirio'r niwl ariannu hwnnw.

Cafwyd cymariaethau â Lloegr heddiw gan Andrew R.T. Davies. Yr ydym wedi cael y ddadl hon erioed, ond os nad ydym yn siŵr sut y ceir y ffigurau hynny, mae'n anodd gwneud y cymariaethau hynny. Mae'n creu anawsterau mewn meysydd eraill hefyd. Yr oedd hon yn un o'r dadleuon a arweiniodd at sefydlu'r Pwyllgor cyntaf ar Ariannu Ysgolion. Bydd ysgolion yn clywed cyhoeddiadau'n cael eu gwneud yma ynglŷn â symiau penodol o arian yn mynd i ysgolion, a phan fydd penaethiaid a llywodraethwyr yn cael eu cyllidebau byddant yn edrych arnynt ac yn meddwl, 'Nawr, ble mae'r arian hwnnw?'. Nid yw'n glir. Mae gennym fforymau ariannu ysgolion a ddylai fod yn gwneud yr hyn sy'n digwydd ychydig yn gliriach i ysgolion, yn enwedig y rhan ganol, ond nid yw'n digwydd bob amser. Gwelsom enghraifft nodweddiadol—neu yr ydym yng nghanol enghraifft nodweddiadol—yng nghyswllt y cyfnod sylfaen, lle mae dadleuon ynglŷn â'r hyn sy'n digwydd yma, mewn llywodraeth leol ac mewn ysgolion. Mae angen gwneud hyn yn eglur.

Hoffwn gyfeirio hefyd at faterion yn ymwneud â'r diwylliant grantiau bach. Er bod ychydig waith wedi ei wneud i geisio lleihau biwrocratiaeth, sy'n gorfodi athrawon a phenaethiaid i dreulio cymaint o amser yn paratoi ceisiadau am arian, clywodd y pwyllgor cyntaf dystiolaeth glir a oedd yn nodi—a chredaf fod hynny'n wir o hyd—y



much as possible, be rolled into the one grant given to a school in its three-year funding mechanism. In that way, schools could plan properly.

There is another issue with short-term funding. The Minister has said that there can be a need for short-term funding to address immediate situations, but, usually, those situations continue—in education, they do not often disappear. Once you have realised that the situation exists, it needs to be dealt with, but that money will need to be there consistently. I am afraid that you are back to the old problem, in that, after three years of providing it as a short-term grant, it rolls into the revenue support grant. Schools will look at their budgets and ask, ‘Where is it?’, and authorities will say, ‘We have given it to you’. It is never very clear. The section 52 issue has to be addressed. It will not solve the whole issue but it may make it a little clearer. However, I fear that we will be revisiting this issue yet again in years to come.

**Kirsty Williams:** I begin by thanking the clerk and her deputy for their ongoing support, and thank the Members’ research service, which has been invaluable in helping the committee put this report together.

When I was little, my dad said that there were only two things in life of which you could be certain: death and taxes. Over the last nine years that I have been an Assembly Member, I have learned that you can be sure of two other things happening on an annual basis in the Assembly: my colleague, Eleanor Burnham will raise the issue of train toilets, and, when schools get their budget allocations, there will be a row about how much money is in that allocation and how it has been arrived at.

3.10 p.m.

The local authorities say that it is the Welsh Assembly Government’s fault and the Welsh Assembly Government says that it is the councils’ fault; school leaders, governors and

dylai’r grantiau hynny, i’r graddau y mae hynny’n bosibl, gael eu cynnwys yn yr un grant a roddir i ysgol fel rhan o’i threfniadau ariannu tair blynedd. Byddai hynny’n galluogi ysgolion i gynllunio’n briodol.

Mae problem arall gydag arian tymor byr. Mae’r Gweinidog wedi dweud y gall fod angen arian tymor byr i fynd i’r afael â sefyllfaoedd sy’n codi, ond fel rheol mae’r sefyllfaoedd hynny’n parhau—nid yn aml y byddant yn diflannu ym maes addysg. Pan fyddwch wedi sylweddoli bod y sefyllfa’n bodoli, bydd angen ymdrin â hi, ond bydd angen i’r arian hwnnw fod ar gael yn gyson. Mae arnaf ofn eich bod yn ôl gyda’r hen broblem, sef, ar ôl tair blynedd o’i ddarparu fel grant tymor byr, mae’n cael ei gynnwys yn y grant cynnal refeniw. Bydd ysgolion yn edrych ar eu cyllidebau ac yn gofyn, ‘Ble mae’r arian?’, a bydd awdurdodau’n dweud, ‘Yr ydym wedi’i roi i chi’. Nid yw byth yn glir iawn. Rhaid mynd i’r afael â phroblem adran 52. Ni fydd yn datrys y broblem gyfan, ond gall ei gwneud ychydig yn gliriach. Fodd bynnag, ofnaf y byddwn yn trafod y mater hwn eto yn y dyfodol.

**Kirsty Williams:** Hoffwn ddechrau drwy ddiolch i’r clerc a’i dirprwy am eu cefnogaeth barhaus, a diolch i wasanaeth ymchwil yr Aelodau, sydd wedi bod o gymorth mawr i’r pwyllgor wrth lunio’r adroddiad hwn.

Pan oeddwn yn blentyn, byddai fy nhad yn dweud nad oedd ond dau beth mewn bywyd y gallech fod yn sicr ohonynt: marwolaeth a threthi. Yn ystod fy nghyfnod o naw mlynedd fel Aelod Cynulliad, yr wyf wedi dysgu bod dau beth arall y gallwch fod yn sicr y byddant yn digwydd bob blwyddyn yn y Cynulliad: bydd fy nghyd-Aelod, Eleanor Burnham yn codi mater toiledau ar drenau, a phan fydd ysgolion yn cael eu dyraniadau cyllideb, bydd ffræ ynglŷn â faint o arian sydd yn y dyraniad hwnnw a sut y mae wedi ei benderfynu.

Mae’r awdurdodau lleol yn dweud mai ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru y mae’r bai, ac mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru’n dweud mai ar y cynghorau y mae’r bai; nid yw

parents are left not knowing whose fault it is or how those processes can be influenced in the future and be properly scrutinised. Therefore, I very much welcome the committee's decision to look again at this issue, at whether the previous committee's recommendations had been taken forward and at whether we were, indeed, clearing the funding fog.

It became clear that, while there has been some marginal change and some of the recommendations from the first report have been implemented, in reality very little has changed. It may not be a fog on the Tyne, but the Minister certainly continues to preside over a fog on the Taff. If we are to be clear about what local authorities are spending, we need a clear and consistent reporting mechanism. At present, that is simply not the case. While I welcome the Minister's commitment and acceptance of the committee's recommendation to change this, I am concerned that we will see yet another working group being set up to look at these proposals with the issue not being taken forward until there is a report on mechanisms for 2009-10. I do not know about other committee members, but the advice that we received from the audit office seemed to be pretty clear to me and it seemed to be pretty clear what needed to be done; therefore, and I am not quite certain why we need a working group to tell us what the audit office was quite clear in recommending to the committee in the first place. On recommendations 2, 3 and 4, I welcome that, at last, the web pages are now up and running. It has taken years. I do not think that it took that long to paint the Sistine Chapel, but I guess that we should be grateful that we are finally there.

One of the reasons why we have these debates on school funding and why they get so heated is that it is felt that there is not enough money to go around. If everybody had plenty of money, no-one would be arguing about the funding formula or how the money got there. In relation to the budget that we have at present—and what I believe will be an ever-shrinking and tightening budget—it is even more crucial that we get the principles by which we allocate school

arweinwyr ysgolion, llywodraethwyr na rhieni'n gwybod ar bwy y mae'r bai na sut y gellir dylanwadu ar y prosesau hynny yn y dyfodol a chraffu'n briodol arnynt. Felly, yr wyf yn falch iawn clywed bod y pwyllgor wedi penderfynu edrych unwaith eto ar y mater hwn, ystyried a yw argymhellion y pwyllgor blaenorol wedi eu gweithredu, ac a oeddem, yn wir, yn clirio'r niwl ariannu.

Er bod mân newidiadau wedi'u gwneud, ac er bod rhai o argymhellion yr adroddiad cyntaf wedi eu gweithredu, daeth yn amlwg mai ychydig iawn sydd wedi newid mewn gwirionedd. Efallai nad oes niwl ar afon Tyne, ond mae'r Gweinidog yn sicr yn dal mewn niwl ar afon Taf. Cyn y gallwn fod yn glir faint y mae awdurdodau lleol yn ei wario, mae angen inni gael trefniadau adrodd clir a chyson. Nid oes trefniadau felly ar hyn o bryd. Er fy mod yn croesawu ymrwymiad y Gweinidog a'r ffaith ei fod yn derbyn argymhelliad y pwyllgor i newid hyn, yr wyf yn bryderus y byddwn yn gweld sefydlu gweithgor arall i edrych ar y cynigion hyn, ac na fydd dim yn cael ei wneud ynglŷn â'r mater nes ceir adroddiad ar drefniadau ar gyfer 2009-10. Ni wn beth yw barn aelodau eraill y pwyllgor, ond yr oedd y cyngor a gawsom gan y swyddfa archwilio'n ymddangos yn ddigon clir i mi, ac yr oedd yn ymddangos yn ddigon clir beth yr oedd angen ei wneud. Felly, nid wyf yn hollol siŵr pam y mae arnom angen gweithgor i ddweud yr hyn y mae'r swyddfa archwilio eisoes wedi'i argymhell i'r pwyllgor yn ddigon clir. O ran argymhellion 2, 3 a 4, yr wyf yn falch iawn fod y tudalennau i'w gweld ar y we o'r diwedd. Mae wedi cymryd blynyddoedd. Ni chredaf iddi gymryd cymaint â hynny o amser i beintio'r Capel Sistinaidd, ond mae'n debyg y dylem fod yn ddiolchgar fod y gwaith wedi'i gwblhau o'r diwedd.

Un o'r rhesymau pam yr ydym yn cael y dadleuon hyn ynglŷn ag ariannu ysgolion, a pham y maent yn mynd mor danbaid, yw bod teimlad nad oes digon o arian ar gyfer pawb. Petai digon o arian i bawb, ni fyddai neb yn dadlau ynglŷn â'r fformiwla ariannu neu sut y mae'r arian wedi dod yno. O ran y gyllideb bresennol—a fydd yn mynd yn llai ac yn dynnach o hyd yn fy marn i—mae'n bwysicach fyth inni gael yr egwyddorion ar gyfer dyrannu cyllid ysgolion yn iawn.

funding right.

As has been raised previously, there are two issues that impact on a child's attainment: the economic wealth of that child's family and the presence of any special educational need. There is a not-very-virtuous circle working here. If your parents are poor, you are more likely not to attain high levels of qualifications in school. The attainment of high-level qualifications is, of course, intrinsically linked to your earning power and potential—if you do less well at school, you earn less as an adult. Guess what? It is then your children who will find themselves back at the beginning again, and it goes on and on. We have to break this circle now.

Bramley is indeed complex. I have heard some say that it is controversial, but I believe that it is only controversial if you want to defend the status quo; I am not in the business of doing that, and I do not believe that this Chamber should be either. I am not sure how the Minister views Bramley. Her speech this afternoon was civil-service speak at its best and maybe she would be good enough to translate for me what she actually feels about the review and what her intentions are. As Huw Lewis has already said, the danger is that Bramley will go the way of Townsend, and that we will not break that circle.

I agree with the points raised by Janet Ryder with regard to small grants. With regard to recommendation 9, toilets are perhaps the most unsavoury aspect of our school building problem. The previous Government failed to meet its target, but at least it had a target. I would ask the Minister to reflect again on whether she should be setting targets for the One Wales Government with regard to school buildings and identifying how much money she intends to put into tackling the problem.

**William Graham:** I am delighted that you have called me to speak this afternoon, Deputy Presiding Officer, as I was Chair of the Committee on School Funding that reported two years ago. Janet Ryder, who has

Fel y nodwyd gynt, mae dau fater sy'n effeithio ar gyrhaeddiad plentyn: cyfoeth economaidd teulu'r plentyn hwnnw, ac unrhyw anghenion addysgol arbennig. Mae cylch dieflig ar waith yma. Os yw eich rhieni'n dlawd, yr ydych yn fwy tebygol o beidio â chael cymwysterau da yn yr ysgol. Mae cael cymwysterau da, wrth gwrs, yn gysylltiedig â'ch gallu a'ch potensial i ennill cyflog—os na fyddwch yn gwneud yn dda iawn yn yr ysgol, byddwch yn ennill llai o arian fel oedolyn. Beth sy'n digwydd wedyn? Bydd eich plant yn cael eu hunain yn ôl yn y dechrau unwaith eto, a hynny'n mynd ymlaen ac ymlaen. Rhaid inni dorri'r cylch hwn yn awr.

Mae Bramley'n gymhleth. Yr wyf wedi clywed rhai'n dweud ei fod yn ddadleuol, ond credaf ei fod yn ddadleuol dim ond os ydych yn awyddus i gadw pethau fel y maent; nid wyf fi'n credu mewn gwneud hynny, ac nid wyf yn credu y dylai'r Siambr hon fod eisiau gwneud hynny ychwaith. Nid wyf yn siŵr beth yw barn y Gweinidog am Bramley. Yr oedd ei haraith y prynhawn yma'n llawn jargon gwasanaeth sifil, ac efallai y byddai mor garedig â chyfieithu ei geiriau er mwyn imi allu deall beth yn union yw ei barn am yr adolygiad a beth yw ei bwriadau. Fel y mae Huw Lewis eisoes wedi ei ddweud, mae perygl mai'r un fydd tynged Bramley a Townsend, ac na fyddwn yn torri'r cylch hwnnw.

Cytunaf â'r pwyntiau a godwyd gan Janet Ryder am grantiau bach. O ran argymhelliad 9, efallai mai toiledau yw'r agwedd fwyaf annymunol ar broblem adeiladau ein hysgolion. Methodd y Llywodraeth flaenorol â chyrraedd ei tharged, ond o leiaf yr oedd ganddi darged. Byddwn yn gofyn i'r Gweinidog ystyried eto a ddylai fod yn gosod targedau ar gyfer Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un yng nghyswllt adeiladau ysgolion a nodi faint o arian y mae'n bwriadu ei neilltuo i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem.

**William Graham:** Yr wyf yn falch iawn eich bod wedi galw arnaf i siarad y prynhawn yma, Ddirprwy Lywydd, gan mai fi oedd Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor ar Ariannu Ysgolion a gyflwynodd adroddiad ddwy flynedd yn ôl.

already spoken, and Peter Black were also members of that committee. I would remind the Assembly that it was a cross-party committee that agreed a series of unanimous recommendations. It is sad that, two years on, the majority of those recommendations are yet to be implemented and those that have been partly implemented are yet to be completed.

Three of the issues that dominated the original committee's discussions were comparisons with England, an alleged postcode lottery and the funding fog, which has been much referred to today. The latest report indicates that, over the last two years, these issues still dominate considerations of school funding in Wales. This is in part because of a mindset and historically based funding formula that pays insufficient attention to the needs of schools now and for the future. Incidentally, the Sistine Chapel only took Michelangelo four years to complete. I think that we will, unfortunately, have to wait a much longer period for our desires to come about in Wales.

One of these delays is illustrated by the Minister's response to recommendations 8 and 9 on necessary improvements to school lavatories. Estyn and the Children's Commissioner for Wales's joint report, 'Lifting the Lid', highlights the urgency of addressing this issue. In fact, failing to address this problem impedes the achievement of the Assembly Government's target on making our schools fit for purpose.

It is evident that some progress has been made, but the problems identified two years ago still remain, notably that:

'the funding process is not transparent and is difficult to understand'.

This view is held by organisations representing every aspect of education: school budget fora, the Welsh Local Government Association, teaching unions, local authorities and, of course, parents. I trust that the Minister will confirm today that the necessary guidelines to alleviate this

Yr oedd Janet Ryder, sydd eisoes wedi siarad, a Peter Black hefyd yn aelodau o'r pwyllgor hwnnw. Hoffwn atgoffa'r Cynulliad ei fod yn bwyllgor trawsbleidiol a gytunodd ar gyfres o argymhellion unfrydol. Mae'n drist fod y rhan fwyaf o'r argymhellion hynny, ddwy flynedd yn ddiweddarach, yn dal heb eu gweithredu a bod y rheini sydd wedi eu gweithredu'n rhannol heb eu cwblhau eto.

Tair o'r ystyriaethau a gafodd fwyaf o sylw yn nhrafodaethau'r pwyllgor gwreiddiol oedd cymariaethau â Lloegr, loteri cod post honedig a'r niwl ariannu, y cyfeiriwyd ato'n helaeth heddiw. Mae'r adroddiad diweddaraf yn dangos, dros y ddwy flynedd diwethaf, fod yr ystyriaethau hyn yn parhau'n elfennau pwysig mewn ariannu ysgolion yng Nghymru. Mae hyn yn rhannol oherwydd meddylfryd a fformiwla ariannu hanesyddol nad yw'n rhoi sylw digonol i anghenion ysgolion heddiw ac yn y dyfodol. Gyda llaw, dim ond pedair blynedd a gymerodd i Michelangelo gwblhau'r Capel Sistinaidd. Yn anffodus, credaf y bydd yn rhaid inni aros llawer mwy i'n dyheadau ni gael eu gwireddu yng Nghymru.

Mae un o'r rhesymau dros yr oedi i'w weld yn ymateb y Gweinidog i argymhellion 8 a 9 ar welliannau angenrheidiol yn rhoileddau ysgolion. Mae'r adroddiad ar y cyd gan Estyn a Chomisynydd Plant Cymru, 'Codi'r Clawr', yn tynnu sylw at y ffaith fod hwn yn fater brys. Yn wir, mae methiant i roi sylw i'r broblem hon yn rhwystro cyrraedd targed Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar wneud ein hysgolion yn addas at y diben.

Mae'n amlwg fod ychydig gynnydd wedi'i wneud, ond mae'r problemau a nodwyd ddwy flynedd yn ôl yn aros, yn fwyaf arbennig:

'nad yw'r broses ariannu yn dryloyw a'i bod yn anodd i'w deall'.

Dyna yw barn sefydliadau sy'n cynrychioli pob agwedd ar addysg: fforymau ariannu ysgolion, Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, yr undebau athrawon, awdurdodau lleol ac, wrth gwrs, rhieni. Hyderaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn cadarnhau heddiw fod y canllawiau angenrheidiol i ddatrys y mater

matter are about to be issued and that she will be mindful of the Wales Audit Office comment that:

‘Assembly Government guidance to authorities was not clear enough’.

One of the baseline indicators to allow the required assessment of progress on addressing the challenges facing those in the education sector is being able to analyse comparable data adequately. A further Wales Audit Office comment is that:

‘inconsistent compliance with accounting standards means that education budgets cannot be compared on a like-for-like basis’.

We must acknowledge that surplus places have a major impact upon education budgets, and that schools’ catchment areas often cross local authority boundaries. I am sure that all Members wish to ensure best practice on tackling the issues that have been so widely discussed today, especially on giving schools a wider community focus by using them for health or youth activities. Achieving comparable and fair school funding is an integral part of achieving schools that are fit for purpose and which reflect the needs in terms of educating future generations. I reiterate the comments by the distinguished Chair about how co-operative people were in trying to get this problem solved once and for all. It is our hope today that the recommendations are accepted by the Minister and can be implemented soon.

**Peter Black:** I welcome this debate today and that the Enterprise and Learning Committee has undertaken this report. Had that not happened and we had not had this second report, there was a real possibility that the report of the Committee on School Funding would have been lost forever and that many of its recommendations would never have been implemented. The jury is still out as to whether they will be implemented, as it is out as to whether this latest set of recommendations will be implemented, but we need to remind ourselves that it is now over two years since that ad-hoc committee reported on this

hwn ar fin cael eu cyhoeddi, ac y bydd yn cadw sylw Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru mewn cof, sef:

Nad oedd cyfarwyddyd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i awdurdodau’n ddigon clir.

Un o’r dangosyddion sylfaenol i ganiatáu’r asesiad gofynnol o gynnydd wrth roi sylw i’r heriau sy’n wynebu’r rheini yn y sector addysg yw gallu dadansoddi data cymaradwy yn ddigonol. Dywed sylw pellach gan Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru fod:

cydymffurfio anghyson â safonau cyfrifo’n golygu na ellir cymharu cyllidebau addysg tebyg â’i gilydd.

Rhaid inni gydnabod bod lleoedd dros ben yn cael effaith sylweddol ar gyllidebau addysg, a bod dalgylchoedd ysgolion yn aml yn croesi ffiniau awdurdodau lleol. Yr wyf yn siŵr fod pob Aelod am sicrhau arfer gorau wrth fynd i’r afael â’r materion a drafodwyd mor fanwl heddiw, yn enwedig o ran rhoi mwy o bwyslais cymunedol i ysgolion drwy eu defnyddio ar gyfer gweithgarwch iechyd neu ieuenctid. Mae sicrhau trefniadau ariannu cymaradwy a theg i ysgolion yn rhan anhepgor o’r gwaith o sicrhau bod ysgolion yn addas at y diben a’u bod yn ateb y gofynion o ran addysgu cenedlaethau’r dyfodol. Yr wyf am ailadrodd sylwadau’r Cadeirydd nodedig, a ddywedodd mor barod oedd pobl i gydweithredu i geisio datrys y broblem hon unwaith ac am byth. Ein gobaith heddiw yw y caiff yr argymhellion eu derbyn gan y Gweinidog ac y gellir eu gweithredu’n fuan.

**Peter Black:** Croesawaf y ddadl hon heddiw a’r ffaith fod y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu wedi mynd ati i baratoi’r adroddiad hwn. Pe na bai hynny wedi digwydd, a phe na baem wedi cael yr ail adroddiad hwn, yr oedd posibilrwydd gwirioneddol y byddai adroddiad y Pwyllgor ar Ariannu Ysgolion wedi’i gollu am byth ac y byddai nifer o’r argymhellion heb eu gweithredu byth. Mae ansicrwydd yn parhau ynghylch a fyddant yn cael eu gweithredu, ac mae hynny’n wir hefyd yn achos y gyfres ddiweddaraf hon o argymhellion, ond rhaid inni’n hatgoffa’n hunain fod dros ddwy flynedd bellach ers i’r pwyllgor ad-hoc hwnnw adrodd ar y mater

particular issue, and yet the vast majority of the recommendations have not been implemented. As is pointed out in the current report, some of the recommendations have had to be repeated, in the hope that the Minister will take notice of them this time. Some of these are key recommendations. For example, recommendations 19 and 21 of the report of the Committee on School Funding on grants stated that,

‘the Assembly Government should avoid initiating unsustainable policy actions through short-term specific grant programmes and should aim to provide longer-term funding ... to allow better financial planning by schools’.

It went on to mention several other things, including sustainability and ensuring:

‘that the benefits of new grant schemes and streams of funding are not compromised by excessively onerous and bureaucratic bidding mechanisms’.

However, if I go to my local education authority and talk about the grant regimes that it has to implement, and if I go to my local schools and talk to the headteachers about grant mechanisms, I am told that there are still scores of small grants and that the cost of putting those grants into effect often exceeds the money that is received by the local authority. Little or no action has been taken by the Assembly Government on those recommendations and, as a result, schools and local education authorities have to spend huge amounts of time and resources on implementing short-term grants, which they do not know whether they will have from year to year. The impact of those grants is undermined by that very fact. On capital, the current report notes that the ultimate responsibility for capital programmes should lie with the local authority and local government. I cannot disagree with that, but how much assistance local government is getting in terms of implementing its own capital programmes is yet another issue.

3.20 p.m.

arbennig hwn, ac eto mae mwyafrif llethol yr argymhellion heb eu gweithredu. Fel y dywedir yn yr adroddiad cyfredol, bu'n rhaid ailadrodd rhai o'r argymhellion, yn y gobaith y bydd y Gweinidog yn cymryd sylw ohonynt y tro hwn. Mae rhai ohonynt yn argymhellion allweddol. Er enghraifft, dywed argymhellion 19 ac 21 yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor ar Ariannu Ysgolion ar grantiau,

‘y dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad osgoi cyflwyno gweithredoedd polisi anghynaliadwy trwy raglenni grantiau penodol tymor byr ac y dylai geisio darparu arian tymor hirach ... i alluogi gwell cynllunio ariannol gan ysgolion’.

Mae'n mynd ymlaen i grybwyll nifer o bethau eraill, gan gynnwys cynaliadwyedd a sicrhau:

‘nad yw buddion cynlluniau grant a ffrydiau arian newydd yn cael eu peryglu gan ddulliau bidio biwrocraidd a beichus’.

Fodd bynnag, os af at fy awdurdod addysg lleol a sôn am y cyfundrefnau grant y mae'n rhaid iddo'u gweithredu, ac os af i fy ysgolion lleol a sôn wrth benaethiaid am fecanweithiau grant, dywedir wrthyf fod ugeiniau o grantiau bach ar gael o hyd a bod y gost o weithredu'r grantiau hynny'n aml yn fwy na'r arian a dderbynnir gan yr awdurdod lleol. Nid oes dim neu fawr ddim wedi'i wneud gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ynghylch yr argymhellion hyn ac, o ganlyniad i hynny, rhaid i ysgolion ac awdurdodau addysg lleol dreulio llawer iawn o amser a gwario llawer o adnoddau i weithredu grantiau tymor byr; grantiau na wyddant a fyddant ar gael iddynt o flwyddyn i flwyddyn. Mae effaith y grantiau hynny'n cael ei thanseilio gan yr union ffaith honno. O ran cyfalaf, dywed yr adroddiad cyfredol y dylai'r cyfrifoldeb am raglenni cyfalaf fod yng ngofal yr awdurdod lleol a llywodraeth leol yn y pen draw. Ni allaf anghytuno â hynny, ond mae faint o gymorth mae llywodraeth leol yn ei gael o ran gweithredu ei chynlluniau cyfalaf ei hun yn broblem arall eto.

The committee report, as well as another report, highlighted the issue of school toilets, and Kirsty and others have made the very important point—this an issue that was raised continuously by the previous children’s commissioner, and no doubt will be raised by the present children’s commissioner—that you cannot separate that issue from the condition of the school buildings. You can put in place short-term measures to ensure that the toilets are more pleasant to use and do not become a place where children can be bullied or picked on, but unless you tackle the issue of school buildings, and ensure that some of that vast reserve of capital money that the Assembly is so far sitting on is put into school buildings and that the Assembly Government works with local councils to deliver a proper capital rolling programme, then we are never going to get to grips with the huge backlog of work that needs to be done in school buildings around the country.

What happened to the key recommendations of the Committee on School Funding on the distribution formula? Recommendation 5 was about setting:

‘in train a review of the local government distribution formula so that the education element is based on the current and future costs of providing education services rather than on historic costs.’

There was also talk, very much reflecting what Huw Lewis and Kirsty said, about Bramley and dealing with deprivation and its relationship to poor educational achievement. There were recommendations on that in the report as well, and, again, we are still waiting for action by the Assembly Government on implementing those particular recommendations. Recommendation 15 of the previous committee’s report recommended publishing

‘minimum common basic funding requirements for school staffing’

and so on so that comparisons can be made on a like-for-like basis. Two years have passed and there has been no action. Two years have passed and a committee has had to publish another report. Minister, I hope this

Mae adroddiad y pwyllgor, yn ogystal ag adroddiad arall, wedi tynnu sylw at fater toiledau ysgol, ac mae Kirsty ac eraill wedi codi pwynt pwysig iawn—mae hwn yn fater a godwyd yn barhaus gan y comisiynydd plant blaenorol, ac mae’n siŵr o gael ei godi gan y comisiynydd plant presennol—ni allwch wahanu’r mater hwnnw a mater cyflwr adeiladau ysgol. Gallwch gyflwyno mesurau tymor byr i sicrhau bod y toiledau’n fwy dymunol i’w defnyddio ac na fyddant yn datblygu’n fan lle mae plant yn cael eu bwlio neu’n lle mae plant eraill yn pigo arnynt. Ond onid ewch i’r afael â mater adeiladau ysgol, a sicrhau bod y gronfa wrth gefn enfawr honno o arian cyfalaf y mae’r Cynulliad wedi bod yn eistedd arni hyd yma yn cael ei gwario ar adeiladau ysgol, a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gweithio gydag awdurdodau lleol i ddarparu rhaglen dreigl gyfalaf wirioneddol, ni lwyddwn fyth i fynd i’r afael â’r holl waith y mae angen ei wneud mewn adeiladau ysgol ar hyd a lled y wlad.

Beth ddigwyddodd i argymhellion allweddol y Pwyllgor ar Ariannu Ysgolion ar y fformwla ddsbarthu? Yr oedd argymhelliad 5 yn ymwneud â chychwyn:

‘adolygiad o’r fformiwla ddsbarthu llywodraeth leol fel bo’r elfen addysg yn seiliedig ar gostau presennol a chostau’r dyfodol o ddarparu gwasanaethau addysg, yn hytrach nag ar gostau hanesyddol.’

Bu sôn hefyd, gan ategu i raddau helaeth yr hyn a ddywedodd Huw Lewis a Kirsty, am Bramley a delio ag amddifadedd a’r berthynas rhyngddo a chyrhaeddiad addysgol isel. Cafwyd argymhellion ar hynny hefyd yn yr adroddiad, ac unwaith eto yr ydym yn dal i aros i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad weithredu’r argymhellion arbennig hynny. Yr oedd argymhelliad 15 adroddiad y pwyllgor blaenorol yn argymhell cyhoeddi

‘gofynion ariannu sylfaenol cyffredin safonol ar gyfer staffio ysgolion’

ac yn y blaen fel y gellir cymharu tebyg i’w debyg. Mae dwy flynedd wedi mynd heibio ac ni weithredwyd arno. Mae dwy flynedd wedi mynd heibio ac mae pwyllgor wedi gorfod cyhoeddi adroddiad arall. Weinidog,

time that you will listen.

**The Minister for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills (Jane Hutt):**

This debate and report demonstrate how important it is that we have committee scrutiny in this way. I can only make three points in my three minutes of allotted time. One is on transparency, the second is about principles and the third is about how we are putting priority into the education spend for the outcomes that we seek. I have said what I am going to do in terms of transparency, and I assure Janet that I have made it clear that I expect new guidance on section 52 returns and revenue account forms. This is complex, Kirsty, and there is a working group dealing with it. However, if you look at the Chartered Institute of Public Finance and Accountancy code of practice—and we must go back to this—on charges for corporate services for example, it is very specific as to the amount of corporate services chargeable to individual services. If authorities followed the code, then it would not be possible for them to erroneously inflate their education spending by increasing the amount of corporate services charged to education. I want to get it right this time, so I emphasise that point.

On transparency, Peter, and the fact that we must do this in partnership with our colleagues in local government, as of last week, Swansea still had not provided the information I needed or the financial modelling for the foundation phase. This has to be a two-way street. You must play your part, in partnership—

**Peter Black:** All the local councils have provided information on the foundation phase. I suggest, Minister, that the information you are asking for is fairly superfluous and that you know exactly how much money needs to be spent on the foundation phase, but that you just cannot find it.

**Jane Hutt:** Swansea has consistently failed to provide us with the information that I need in order to make my case in terms of the

gobeithio y byddwch yn gwrando y tro hwn.

**Y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau (Jane Hutt):**

Mae'r ddadl hon a'r adroddiad yn dangos mor bwysig yw inni gael craffu gan bwyllgorau fel hyn. Dim ond tri phwynt y gallaf eu gwneud yn y tri munud sydd ar gael imi. Mae'r cyntaf am dryloywder, mae'r ail yn ymwneud ag egwyddorion a'r trydydd yn ymwneud â'r ffordd yr ydym yn rhoi blaenoriaeth i wariant ar addysg i sicrhau'r canlyniadau a geisiwn. Yr wyf wedi dweud yr hyn y byddaf yn ei wneud o ran tryloywder, a gallaf sicrhau Janet fy mod wedi ei gwneud yn glir fy mod yn disgwyl canllaw newydd ar ffurflenni adran 52 a ffurflenni cyfrifon refeniw. Mae hyn yn gymhleth, Kirsty, ac mae gweithgor yn delio â'r mater. Fodd bynnag, os edrychwch ar god ymarfer y Sefydliad Siartredig Cyllid Cyhoeddus a Chyfrifyddiaeth—a rhaid inni fynd yn ôl at hyn—ar godi tâl am wasanaethau corfforaethol, er enghraifft, mae'n benodol iawn ynghylch y swm y gellir ei godi am wasanaethau corfforaethol ar wasanaethau unigol. Petai awdurdodau'n dilyn y cod, yna ni fyddai modd iddynt chwyddo'u gwariant ar addysg ar gam drwy gynyddu faint o wasanaethau corfforaethol a godir ar addysg. Yr wyf am gael hyn yn iawn y tro hwn, felly, pwysleisiaf y pwynt hwnnw.

O ran eglurder, Peter, a'r ffaith ei bod yn rhaid inni wneud hyn mewn partneriaeth gyda'n cydweithwyr mewn llywodraeth leol, tan yr wythnos diwethaf nid oedd Abertawe wedi cyflwyno'r wybodaeth y mae arnaf ei hangen na'r model ariannol ar gyfer y cyfnod sylfaen. Rhaid i hon fod yn broses ddwyffordd. Rhaid ichi chwarae eich rhan, mewn partneriaeth—

**Peter Black:** Mae pob cyngor lleol wedi cyflwyno gwybodaeth am y cyfnod sylfaen. Awgrymaf, Weinidog, fod y wybodaeth yr ydych yn gofyn amdani braidd yn ormodol a'ch bod yn gwybod faint yn union o arian y mae angen ei wario ar y cyfnod sylfaen, ond na allwch ddod o hyd iddo.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae Abertawe dro ar ôl tro wedi methu rhoi'r wybodaeth y mae arnaf ei hangen er mwyn cyflwyno fy achos dros y



foundation phase. I am sure that it will get there, Peter, particularly as you have heard that message today. Moving on to principles and the point that Huw made about the Bramley report, which is key, I say to Huw, Kirsty and Peter, and all those who raised it, that I am very clear about Bramley, as I said in the committee. I favour an outcome-based approach to funding; it must be money that we know will deliver, and it is essential that we look at that in terms of the Bramley message. It is a message about the impact of poverty special educational needs, primary school education, and secondary school attainment is clear—Bramley mentioned them all. However, the research was there way before Bramley, in terms of social disadvantage being the biggest obstacle to achievement in education.

I am working with the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government, Brian Gibbons, to ensure that we can start making those changes in terms of implementation for 2010. That work on the Bramley report will move forward. It is crucial—that is the principle, and that is the basis in terms of social justice that I want to take forward.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Please wind up, Minister.

**Jane Hutt:** Finally, I wish to tell Andrew that all local authorities increased their budgets this year. The gross base budget for LEAs increased by 4 per cent—remember that, Andrew. The total budgeted gross schools expenditure—

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Will you give way?

**Jane Hutt:** I will not. This is my last point. There is a 'One Wales' commitment to £673 million of capital investment from 2008-09 onwards. It is for local authorities to play their part, but it is for us to ensure the principle, as Huw mentioned, and it is the Government that delivers. However, the scrutiny in this report is important and effective, and I intend to implement the recommendations.

cyfnod sylfaen. Yr wyf yn siŵr y llwyddwn ni, Peter, yn enwedig gan eich bod wedi clywed y neges honno heddiw. I symud ymlaen at egwyddorion a'r pwynt a wnaeth Huw ynghylch adroddiad Bramley, sy'n allweddol, dywedaf wrth Huw, Kirsty a Peter, a phawb a'i cododd, fy mod yn gwbl bendant ynghylch Bramley, fel y dywedais yn y pwyllgor. Yr wyf o blaid dull ariannu sy'n seiliedig ar ganlyniadau; rhaid iddo fod yn arian y gwyddom a fydd yn cyflawni, ac mae'n hanfodol inni edrych ar hynny yng nghyd-destun neges Bramley. Neges ydyw am effaith tlodi ar anghenion addysgol arbennig, addysg ysgolion cynradd ac mae cyrhaeddiad ysgolion uwchradd yn glir—soniodd Bramley am bob un ohonynt. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd yr ymchwil ar gael ymhell cyn Bramley, sef mai anfantais gymdeithasol yw'r rhwystr mwyaf rhag cyflawni mewn addysg.

Yr wyf yn gweithio gyda Brian Gibbons, y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol, i sicrhau y gallwn ddechrau gwneud y newidiadau hynny o ran gweithredu ar gyfer 2010. Bydd y gwaith hwnnw ar adroddiad Bramley yn mynd yn ei flaen. Mae'n hanfodol—dyna yw'r egwyddor, a dyna yw'r sail o ran cyfiawnder cymdeithasol yr wyf am ei datblygu.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. A wnewch chi ddirwyn i ben, Weinidog?

**Jane Hutt:** Yn olaf, hoffwn ddweud wrth Andrew fod pob awdurdod lleol wedi cynyddu ei gyllideb eleni. Bu cynnydd o 4 y cant yng nghyllideb sail gros AALLau—cofiwch hynny, Andrew. Yr oedd cyfanswm gwariant gros ysgolion wedi'i gyllidebu —

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** A wnewch chi ildio?

**Jane Hutt:** Na wna. Hwn yw fy mhwynt olaf. Mae ymrwymiad yn 'Cymru'n Un' i £673 miliwn o fuddsoddiad cyfalaf o 2008-09 ymlaen. Rhaid i awdurdodau lleol wneud eu rhan, ond rhaid inni sicrhau'r egwyddor, fel y dywedodd Huw, a'r Llywodraeth sy'n darparu. Fodd bynnag, mae'r gwaith craffu yn yr adroddiad hwn yn bwysig ac yn effeithiol, a bwriadaf weithredu'r argymhellion.

**Gareth Jones:** I appreciate the kind words that have been said about the committee's work. Thank you for the contributions that you have made—they have been significant and important to us. It was also important that Peter Black and William Graham contributed, as they were directly involved in the 2006 report.

I would like to think that, as a follow-up from today's debate, the true winner is the scrutiny process. We need to emphasise the significance of a follow-up report to any policy, or any strategy that has been implemented, and that is what we have succeeded in doing this afternoon. It may not always be comfortable for the Government, but I wish to heartily thank the Minister for her positive response. We look forward to further developments in this important field, as far as the education of our young people is concerned.

There have been references to key areas, such as the Bramley report. Huw Lewis is right to remind us how crucial that is. We have been reminded again about the funding fog, and the need to improve the returns to the Welsh Assembly Government. Therefore, all these are positive outcomes from what has been a positive debate. There is a long way to go, but we are on track, and we look forward to seeing the changes implemented.

As I have said, if we have succeeded in anything, it is in the way that we have gone about this. I thank all committee members for their valuable contributions, and the clerk, and the deputy clerk on this occasion, for their work. As always, we rely very much on their services, as well as the services of our experts in the Members' research service. Therefore, I thank you all for your contributions this afternoon. We understand where we are at; there are promises of further developments and delivery, and I hope that we can all look forward to that.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The proposal is to note the report of the Enterprise and Learning Committee. Is there any objection? I see that there is not. In accordance with Standing Order No. 7.35, the

**Gareth Jones:** Gwerthfawrogaf y geiriau caredig sydd wedi eu dweud am waith y pwyllgor. Diolch ichi am eich cyfraniadau—maent wedi bod yn sylweddol ac yn bwysig inni. Yr oedd yn bwysig hefyd fod Peter Black a William Graham yn cyfrannu, gan fod ganddynt gysylltiad uniongyrchol ag adroddiad 2006.

Hoffwn gredu, fel dilyniant i'r ddadl heddiw, mai'r enillydd gwirioneddol yw'r broses graffu. Mae angen inni bwysleisio arwyddocâd adroddiad dilynol i unrhyw bolisi, neu unrhyw strategaeth sydd wedi'i gweithredu, a dyna yr ydym wedi llwyddo i'w wneud y prynhawn yma. Efallai nad yw'n brofiad braf i'r Llywodraeth bob amser, ond hoffwn ddiolch o galon i'r Gweinidog am ei hymateb cadarnhaol. Edrychwn ymlaen at ddatblygiadau pellach yn y maes pwysig hwn, lle mae addysg ein pobl ifanc dan sylw.

Cyfeiriwyd at feysydd allweddol, megis adroddiad Bramley. Yr oedd Huw Lewis yn gywir i'n hatgoffa o'i bwysigrwydd. Cawsom ein hatgoffa eto am y niwl ariannu, a'r angen am wella'r ffurflenni i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Felly, mae'r rhain i gyd yn ganlyniadau cadarnhaol o'r hyn sydd wedi bod yn ddadl gadarnhaol. Mae llawer o waith i'w wneud eto, ond yr ydym ar y trywydd cywir, ac edrychwn ymlaen at weld weithredu'r newidiadau.

Fel y dywedais, os ydym wedi llwyddo i wneud rhywbeth, hwnnw yw y ffordd yr ydym wedi mynd ynglŷn â hyn. Diolch i holl aelodau'r pwyllgor am eu cyfraniadau gwerthfawr, ac i'r clerwr a'r dirprwy glerc y tro hwn, am eu gwaith. Fel arfer, yr ydym yn dibynnu'n fawr ar eu gwasanaethau, yn ogystal ag ar wasanaethau ein harbenigwyr yng ngwasanaeth ymchwil yr Aelodau. Felly, diolch ichi i gyd am eich cyfraniadau y prynhawn yma. Gwyddom ble'r ydym yn sefyll; cafwyd addewidion o ddatblygiadau a chyflawniadau pellach, a gobeithio y gallwn i gyd edrych ymlaen at hynny.

**Y Llywydd:** Y cynnig yw nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu. A oes gwrthwynebiad? Gwelaf nad oes. Yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.35, felly, caiff y cynnig ei dderbyn.

motion is therefore agreed.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

## **Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives Debate**

### **Addysg Cyfrwng Cymraeg Welsh-medium Education**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams and amendments 3 and 4 in the name of Carwyn Jones. Amendment 2 has been withdrawn.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams a gwelliannau 3 a 4 yn enw Carwyn Jones. Tynnwyd gwelliant 2 yn ôl.

**Alun Cairns:** I propose that

**Alun Cairns:** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. recognises that access to Welsh-medium education is not a matter of local priority but is a national issue;*

*1. yn cydnabod nad yw mynediad at addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg yn fater o flaenoriaeth leol ond yn hytrach yn fater cenedlaethol;*

*2. calls on the Assembly Government to ensure that pupils who wish to study primarily in Welsh must have equal entitlement to the transport provisions made available to pupils who study primarily in English. (NDM3978)*

*2. yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i sicrhau bod disgyblion sy'n dymuno astudio'n bennaf drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn cael yr un hawliau i ddarpariaethau cludiant ag a roddir i ddisgyblion sy'n astudio'n bennaf drwy gyfrwng y Saesneg. (NDM3978)*

The purpose of this motion is to draw Assembly Members' attention to the risks that we currently face in relation to access to Welsh-medium education. Long before the establishment of the Assembly, and since its establishment, there has been a general agreement around Welsh-language policy across all parties. That agreement has focused on a fundamental principle that the Welsh language should be treated equally to the English language in public policy in Wales.

Pwrpas y cynnig hwn yw tynnu sylw Aelodau'r Cynulliad at y risgiau sy'n ein hwynebu ar hyn o bryd o ran gallu cael addysg Gymraeg. Ymhell cyn sefydlu'r Cynulliad, ac ers ei sefydlu, cafwyd cytundeb cyffredinol ynglŷn â pholisi ar y Gymraeg rhwng yr holl bleidiau. Mae'r cytundeb hwnnw wedi canolbwyntio ar egwyddor sylfaenol y dylai'r Gymraeg gael ei thrin yn gyfartal â'r Saesneg mewn polisi cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.

3.30 p.m.

Such an all-party agreement has encouraged parents and pupils to be educated through the medium of Welsh, contributing to a halt in the decline in the number of Welsh speakers and a growth in the number of Welsh learners. This fundamental principle of Welsh and English being treated equally is something of which all parties should be

Mae cytundeb felly rhwng yr holl bleidiau wedi annog rhieni a disgyblion i gael eu haddysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, gan gyfrannu at atal y gostyngiad yn nifer y siaradwyr Cymraeg a thwf yn nifer y dysgwyr. Mae'r egwyddor sylfaenol hon o drin y Gymraeg a'r Saesneg yn gyfartal yn rhywbeth y dylai pob plaid ymfalchïo ynddi,

proud, and it is a fitting legacy to the work started by Sir Wyn Roberts, now Lord Roberts of Conwy. If the architect of this policy and principle was from any other party, I would pay equal tribute to that person.

That fundamental principle means equal access to education and training through the Welsh or English medium. It is disappointing that this principle is being torn up with the second Assembly Measure aimed at improving rights to, and safety in, school transport. I find it difficult to understand why a Plaid Cymru Minister does not want those who choose Welsh-medium education to have the same level of access as those who choose English-medium education.

In fairness, most if not all local authorities currently provide equal access and transport facilities to Welsh-medium education. However, this is at their discretion, and I am sure that most of us, from time to time, have been called upon to support the case of an individual whose local authority is not supporting access to a Welsh-medium school, because it is further away than the English-medium school. Thankfully, those cases are usually resolved quite swiftly because of the discretion and the general positive outlook that is currently being offered by local authorities.

As I said, funding of transport to Welsh-medium schools for most pupils is at the discretion of the local authority, and I cannot believe that a Welsh Assembly Government that includes Plaid Cymru does not want to enshrine that as a right in law. Transport to Welsh-medium schools comes out of discretionary spend; in other words, transport or access to Welsh-medium education for many is at the discretion of the local authority. If we are to abide by that fundamental principle that I talked about at the outset, access to Welsh-medium education should not be discretionary; it should be a right. That is why I am disappointed in the Government's amendments to the motion, which play around with words rather than meeting the rights and needs of constituents and pupils across Wales.

ac mae'n etifeddiaeth weddus o waith a ddechreuwyd gan Syr Wyn Roberts, yr Arglwydd Roberts o Gonwy erbyn hyn. Pe byddai lluniwr y polisi a'r egwyddor hon yn perthyn i blaid arall, byddwn yn rhoi'r un deyrnged i'r unigolyn hwnnw.

Mae'r egwyddor sylfaenol honno yn golygu mynediad cyfartal i addysg a hyfforddiant drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg neu'r Saesneg. Mae'n siomedig fod yr egwyddor hon yn cael ei rhwygo yn sgil Mesur yr ail Gynulliad sy'n anelu at wella hawliau i gludiant ysgol a'i ddiogelwch. Yr wyf yn ei chael yn anodd deall pam nad yw un o Weinidogion Plaid Cymru am i'r rheini sy'n dewis cael addysg Gymraeg gael yr un mynediad â'r rheini sy'n dewis addysg cyfrwng Saesneg.

I fod yn deg, mae'r rhan fwyaf o awdurdodau lleol, os nad pob un, yn darparu mynediad a chyfleusterau cludiant cyfartal i addysg Gymraeg ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, ar sail disgresiwn y gwnânt hyn, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y galwyd ar y rhan fwyaf ohonom, o bryd i'w gilydd, i gefnogi achos unigolyn nad yw ei awdurdod lleol yn cefnogi mynediad i ysgol Gymraeg am ei bod ymhellach na'r ysgol cyfrwng Saesneg. Yn ffodus, caiff yr achosion hynny eu datrys yn weddol gyflym fel rheol oherwydd disgresiwn ac agwedd gadarnhaol bresennol awdurdodau lleol yn gyffredinol.

Fel y dywedais, i'r rhan fwyaf o ddisgyblion darperir cludiant i ysgolion Cymraeg yn ôl ewyllys yr awdurdod lleol, ac ni allaf gredu nad yw Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru sy'n cynnwys Plaid Cymru am ymgorffori hynny fel hawl gyfreithiol. Telir am gludiant i ysgolion Cymraeg o wariant ar sail disgresiwn; hynny yw, mae cludiant neu fynediad i addysg Gymraeg i lawer yn ôl disgresiwn yr awdurdod lleol. Os ydym am gadw at yr egwyddor sylfaenol honno y soniais amdani ar y dechrau, ni ddylai'r gallu i gael addysg Gymraeg fod ar sail disgresiwn; dylai fod yn hawl. Dyna pam yr wyf yn siomedig â gwelliannau'r Llywodraeth i'r cynnig: chwarae â geiriau yw hyn yn hytrach na bodloni hawliau ac anghenion etholwyr a disgyblion ledled Cymru.

Local authority budgets are becoming increasingly tighter. As a result, all discretionary spend is constantly under review. I well remember Members rightly criticising Bridgend County Borough Council for considering cutting some school transport provided with discretionary spend. The Conservative Party was part of that administration, and I was equally disappointed and angry as Members in other parties about its proposals. I want to stop that discretion and make it a right in law for pupils to have equal access, so that we can avoid having those debates and discussions that we have had in the past.

In England, and in Wales for that matter, transport to schools of a religious character is also provided at the discretion of the local authority. However, in the south-west of England and Oxfordshire, there are plans by some to withdraw such a privilege. Unless we act to close this loophole, there will always be a threat to the transport arrangements for accessing Welsh-medium education.

To overcome this discrepancy, section 10 in the Welsh Assembly Government's proposals calls on local authorities to promote access through the medium of the Welsh language. That is welcome, but it does not make access to Welsh-medium education equal to that for English-medium education. This section would be difficult to enforce through the courts and, in any case, why would we want to leave a law so vague and open to interpretation and force a parent of a Welsh-medium child to use that to go through the courts? I spoke to a leading Welsh language campaigner who originally took heart from section 10, but when he realised the ambiguity of it and the implications and that Welsh-medium education would not be treated equally to English-medium education, his opposition was as strong as ours.

I understand the Minister's reasoning with regard to some schools in Wales not being classified as Welsh or English-medium schools. I appreciate that classifying them could cause difficulty and that is the last thing that we want to do, but there are ways around it, and I hope that the Minister will at

Mae cyllidebau awdurdodau lleol yn mynd yn dynnach. O ganlyniad, caiff pob gwariant yn ôl disgresiwn ei adolygu'n barhaus. Cofiaf yn iawn yr Aelodau'n beirniadu Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr, a hynny'n briodol, am ystyried cwtogi rhywfaint o gludiant ysgolion a ddarperid ar sail disgresiwn. Yr oedd y Blaid Geidwadol yn rhan o'r weinyddiaeth honno, ac yr oeddwn lawn mor siomedig a dig ag Aelodau o bleidiau eraill ynghylch ei gynigion. Yr wyf am roi terfyn ar y disgresiwn hwnnw a sicrhau bod mynediad cyfartal i ddisgyblion yn hawl gyfreithiol, er mwyn inni osgoi cael y dadleuon a'r trafodaethau a gawsom yn y gorffennol.

Yn Lloegr, ac yng Nghymru o ran hynny, darperir cludiant i ysgolion crefyddol hefyd yn ôl disgresiwn yr awdurdod lleol. Fodd bynnag, yn ne-orllewin Lloegr a Swydd Rydychen mae cynlluniau gan rai i ddi-ddymu'r fraint honno. Oni weithredwn i gau'r bwlch hwn, bydd bygythiad i'r trefniadau cludiant ar gyfer gallu cael addysg Gymraeg.

Er mwyn datrys yr anghysondeb hwn, mae adran 10 o gynigion Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn galw ar awdurdodau lleol i hyrwyddo mynediad drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Mae hynny i'w groesawu, ond nid yw'n gwneud gallu cael addysg Gymraeg yn gyfartal â chael addysg cyfrwng Saesneg. Byddai'n anodd gorfodi'r adran hon drwy'r llysoedd, a beth bynnag, pam y byddem am adael cyfraith sydd mor annelwig ac mor agored i ddehongliad a gorfodi rhiant plentyn cyfrwng Cymraeg i ddefnyddio hynny i fynd drwy'r llysoedd? Siaradais ag ymgyrchydd iaith blaenllaw a oedd wedi'i galonogi gan adran 10 i ddechrau, ond pan sylweddolodd ei hamwysedd a'i goblygiadau ac na fyddai addysg Gymraeg yn cael ei thrin yn gyfartal ag addysg cyfrwng Saesneg, yr oedd ei wrthwynebiad mor gryf â'n gwrthwynebiad ni.

Gallaf ddeall rhesymeg y Gweinidog o ran rhai ysgolion yng Nghymru nad ydynt yn cael eu dosbarthu'n ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg na chyfrwng Saesneg. Sylweddolaf y gallai eu dosbarthu achosi anawsterau a dyna'r peth olaf y dymunwn ei wneud. Ond mae ffyrdd i oresgyn hynny, a gobeithio y

least consider our proposals and amendments, which aim to overcome this inequality. Replacing one unequal law with another is not the way forward.

There is another question, namely funding. In reality, any additional cost is likely to be minimal because the service is already being provided by local authorities. However, if it becomes statutory, the Welsh Assembly Government may well have to pick up the cost. I hope that cost is not the factor that informs the Deputy First Minister's decision not to make access to Welsh-medium education equal to that for English-medium education.

How many times have we heard Ministers in the Chamber state that they do not have the powers to act in a certain area? How many times have speeches closed with, 'We look forward to rectifying this inequality when the powers are devolved to the Assembly when it is a parliament or through legislative competence Orders'? We are not playing any more; we have the powers to address such issues. We have the power to change the law to make access to Welsh-medium education equal to access to English-medium education, and I call on the Minister to think long and hard about the amendments to the Proposed Learner Travel (Wales) Measure before he decides not to give equal access to Welsh-medium education. It would be such a shame and an embarrassment to all of us if that were allowed to happen, given the fundamental principle that we are agreed upon and which I discussed at the outset.

**Kirsty Williams:** I propose amendment 1 in my name. Delete 'is not a matter of local priority but is a national issue' and replace with:

*should be available on an equitable basis with English-medium education.*

For the sake of clarity and transparency, I declare an interest in that my daughter currently uses free school transport to attend her Welsh-medium school. Powys County

bydd y Gweinidog o leiaf yn ystyried ein cynigion a'n gwelliannau, sy'n ceisio goresgyn yr anghydraddoldeb hwn. Nid disodli un gyfraith anghyfartal gan gyfraith anghyfartal arall yw'r ffordd ymlaen.

Mae yna gwestiwn arall, sef ariannu. Y realiti yw y bydd unrhyw gost ychwanegol yn debygol o fod yn fach oherwydd mae'r gwasanaeth eisoes yn cael ei ddarparu gan awdurdodau lleol. Fodd bynnag, os daw'n statudol, efallai y bydd yn rhaid i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru dalu'r gost. Gobeithio nad cost yw'r ffactor sy'n sail i benderfyniad y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog i beidio â sicrhau bod gallu cael addysg Gymraeg yn gyfartal â gallu cael addysg cyfrwng Saesneg.

Sawl gwaith y clywsom Weinidogion yn y Siambr yn dweud nad oes ganddynt bwerau i weithredu mewn maes penodol? Sawl gwaith y clywsom areithiau'n dod i ben gyda'r geiriau, 'Edrychwn ymlaen at unioni'r anghydraddoldeb pan gaiff pwerau eu datganoli i'r Cynulliad pan fydd yn senedd neu drwy Orchmynion cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol'? Nid chwarae yr ydym bellach; mae gennym bwerau i fynd i'r afael â materion o'r fath. Mae gennym bŵer i newid y gyfraith ac i sicrhau bod gallu cael addysg Gymraeg yn gyfartal â gallu cael addysg cyfrwng Saesneg, a galwaf ar y Gweinidog i feddwl yn ddwys am y gwelliannau i'r Mesur Arfaethedig Teithio gan Ddysgwyr (Cymru) cyn penderfynu peidio â darparu mynediad cyfartal i addysg Gymraeg. Byddai'n drueni mawr ac yn embaras i bob un ohonom pe caniateid i hynny ddigwydd, o gofio'r egwyddor sylfaenol yr ydym wedi cytuno arni ac a drafodais ar y dechrau.

**Kirsty Williams:** Cynigiaf welliant 1 yn fy enw i. Dileu 'nad yw mynediad at addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg yn fater o flaenoriaeth leol ond yn hytrach yn fater cenedlaethol' a rhoi:

*y dylai mynediad at addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg fod ar gael ar sail gydradd ag addysg cyfrwng Saesneg.*

Er mwyn eglurder a thryloywder, datganaf fuddiant gan fod fy merch yn defnyddio cludiant ysgol am ddim i fynd i'w hysgol Gymraeg ar hyn o bryd. Nid yw'n ofynnol i

Council is not required to provide that under the current provision nor will it be required to do so under the terms of the new learner travel Measure. It does so because it is committed to providing the opportunity for young people in Powys to learn through the medium of Welsh, if that is what they and their parents decided. However, as we have heard, in a world of ever-shrinking local authority budgets, it is all too easy for local authorities to look at areas where they are not required by law to act to save money.

Alun Cairns has mentioned—and I was only too aware of this—how, in the last term, when Bridgend County Borough Council, then led by the Liberal Democrats, began to consider whether it would continue to provide free transport to Welsh-medium schools were met with howls of derision. We were told by that side of the Chamber that we were not supporting the Welsh language and Welsh-medium education and that we should be ashamed of the actions of our Liberal Democrat colleagues in Bridgend council. That is why, since the Measure was first published, I have consistently called for this provision to be enshrined in the Measure, to ensure that, in the future, no local authority, for whatever reason can, withdraw that service.

This is not just a call based on party political advantage, but a call supported by organisations throughout Wales. It is supported by Rhieni dros Addysg Gymraeg, parents for Welsh-medium education, representatives of which gave clear and concise evidence to the Enterprise and Learning Committee when it considered this Measure, instead of its being considered by a Stage 1 committee. RhAG has considerable experience of dealing with individual cases and local authorities that have proven to be difficult in ensuring that those children have access to Welsh-medium education.

3.40 p.m.

I recognise that, as a result of representations made by organisations such as RhAG, the

Gyngor Sir Powys ddarparu hynny dan y ddarpariaeth bresennol ac ni fydd yn ofynnol iddo wneud hynny dan delerau'r Mesur newydd ar deithio gan ddysgwyr. Mae'n gwneud hynny oherwydd ei fod wedi ymrwmo i roi cyfle i bobl ifanc Powys ddysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, os dyna'u penderfyniad hwy a'u rhieni. Fodd bynnag, fel y clywsom, mewn byd lle mae cyllidebau awdurdodau lleol yn crebachu fwyfwy, mae'n rhy hawdd i awdurdodau lleol edrych ar feysydd lle nad yw'n ofynnol iddynt weithredu yn ôl y gyfraith er mwyn arbed arian.

Mae Alun Cairns wedi sôn—ac yr oeddwn yn ymwybodol iawn o hyn—am Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr, y tymor diwethaf, dan arweiniad y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol bryd hynny, yn dechrau ystyried a fyddai'n parhau i ddarparu cludiant am ddim i ysgolion Cymraeg a'r ffordd y cafodd hynny ei wawdio'n hallt. Dywedwyd wrthym gan yr ochr acw o'r Siambr nad oeddem yn cefnogi'r iaith Gymraeg nac addysg Gymraeg ac y dylem gywilyddio wrth weithredoedd ein cyd-aelodau Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ar gyngor Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr. Dyna pam yr wyf wedi galw'n barhaus am i'r ddarpariaeth hon gael ei hymgorffori yn y Mesur ers i hwnnw gael ei gyhoeddi gyntaf, er mwyn sicrhau, yn y dyfodol, na all yr un awdurdod lleol, am ba bynnag reswm, ddiddymu'r gwasanaeth hwnnw.

Nid galwad ar sail mantais wleidyddol yw hon, ond galwad a gefnogir gan sefydliadau ledled Cymru. Fe'i cefnogir gan Rien dros Addysg Gymraeg, y rhoddodd ei gynrychiolwyr dystiolaeth glir a chryno i'r Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu pan oedd yn ystyried y Mesur hwn, yn hytrach na chael ei ystyried gan bwyllgor Cam 1. Mae gan RhAG gryn brofiad o ymdrin ag achosion unigol ac awdurdodau lleol sydd wedi bod yn anodd o ran sicrhau bod y plant hynny'n gallu cael addysg Gymraeg.

Yr wyf yn cydnabod, o ganlyniad i sylwadau gan sefydliadau fel RhAG, fod y Dirprwy

Deputy First Minister has sought to amend the Proposed Learner Travel (Wales) Measure. I acknowledge that, and I see that the Minister is trying to respond to those calls. However, the section 10 addition that he has come up with does not give firm legal clarity on a parent's right to choose. A simple way of amending that would have been to accept the amendments that Alun Cairns and I proposed in committee, but the Government has not seen fit to do that. I hope that the Government will think again.

The reality for many children who want to learn through the medium of Welsh, especially in my constituency, because of where the language has traditionally been spoken, is that they have to travel many miles to have that opportunity. That is fine for those parents who can afford the time and the money to ferry their children back and forth. However, I do not believe that Welsh-medium education should be the preserve of those who can afford to make those choices. It is particularly important in my constituency with regard to the continuum. Brecon High School supposedly has a Welsh-medium unit at which children can study through the medium of Welsh from the ages of 11 to 16. However, the ability to do so is completely dependent upon the number of qualified teachers that it happens to have that year. The curriculum has shrunk and shrunk and, in reality, the teaching of very few subjects is delivered. If children in my area want to have continuum, they have to travel to Builth Wells, which is 21 miles away, or Ystalyfera, which is over 25 miles away. If we cannot provide Welsh-medium education properly for our pupils in a wide network of schools, then we have to enshrine this right to local authority transportation to schools where Welsh-medium education is available.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Carwyn Jones. Gwelliant 3: ym mhwynt 2, dileu popeth ar ôl 'sichrau bod' a rhoi yn eu lle:

*anghenion cludiant disgyblion sy'n dymuno astudio'n bennaf drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn cael eu bodloni gan awdurdodau lleol.*

Brif Weinidog wedi ceisio diwygio'r Mesur Arfaethedig Teithio gan Ddysgwyr (Cymru). Cydnabyddaf hynny, a gwelaf fod y Gweinidog yn ceisio ymateb i'r galwadau hynny. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r ychwanegiad ar ffurf adran 10 a gyflwynwyd ganddo yn rhoi unrhyw eglurder cyfreithiol cadarn ynghylch hawl rhiant i ddewis. Ffordd syml i ddiwygio hynny fyddai derbyn y gwelliannau a gynigiwyd gan Alun Cairns a minnau yn y pwyllgor, ond nid yw'r Llywodraeth wedi gweld yn dda i wneud hynny. Gobeithio y bydd y Llywodraeth yn ailfeddwl.

Y realiti i lawer o blant sydd am ddysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, yn arbennig yn fy etholaeth i, oherwydd ble y mae'r iaith wedi ei siarad yn draddodiadol, yw bod yn rhaid iddynt deithio milltiroedd lawer i gael y cyfle hwnnw. Mae hynny'n iawn i'r rhieni hynny sy'n gallu fforddio'r amser a'r arian i gludo'u plant yn ôl ac ymlaen. Fodd bynnag, ni chredaf y dylai addysg Gymraeg fod yn gadwedig i'r rheini sy'n gallu fforddio gwneud y dewisiadau hynny. Mae'n bwysig iawn yn fy etholaeth i o ran y continwmm. Honnir bod gan Ysgol Uwchradd Aberhonddu uned Gymraeg lle y gall plant astudio drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg rhwng 11 a 16 oed. Fodd bynnag, mae eu gallu i wneud hynny'n gwbl ddibynnol ar nifer yr athrawon cymwys sydd yno yn y flwyddyn honno. Mae'r cwricwlwm wedi crebachu a chrebachu, ac mewn gwirionedd nifer fach iawn o bynciau a addysgir. Os yw plant yn fy ardal i am gael continwmm, rhaid iddynt deithio i Lanfair-ym-muallt, sydd 21 milltir i ffwrdd, neu i Ystalyfera, sydd dros 25 milltir i ffwrdd. Os na allwn ddarparu addysg Gymraeg yn iawn i'n disgyblion mewn rhwydwaith eang o ysgolion, yna rhaid inni ymgorffori'r hawl hon i gael cludiant awdurdod lleol i ysgolion lle mae addysg Gymraeg ar gael.

**The Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** I propose the following amendments in the name of Carwyn Jones. Amendment 3: in point 2 delete all after 'that' and replace with:

*the transport needs of pupils who wish to study primarily in Welsh are met by local authorities.*



Gwelliant 4: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn cymeradwyo'r hyn y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi'i wneud i sicrhau, am y tro cyntaf, y caiff dyletswydd statudol ei rhoi ar awdurdodau lleol i hyrwyddo addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg trwy ddarparu cludiant.*

**Nick Bourne:** It is a pleasure to be able to contribute to an important debate on the nature and status of the Welsh language, because that is central to this debate. As Alun Cairns said, there has been a consensus on the language across parties since the Welsh Language Act 1993 was passed. As Alun said, that was piloted through Parliament by Wyn Roberts. It has served us well. Over the last nine years in the Assembly—and this is also true of the Assembly's predecessors—there has been a consensus on the language. Therefore, I am mystified that the amendments proposed by Alun Cairns and Kirsty Williams did not attract Government support. Whatever the content of section 10—and, like me, the Deputy First Minister is a lawyer—it does not in any way provide for equality in terms of the languages.

**The Deputy First Minister:** I can see that at least Nick is trying to have a proper debate rather than ranting, as Alun Cairns did.

**Jonathan Morgan:** It was not a rant.

**The Deputy First Minister:** It was a rant. However, I ask Nick—and I understand the point that he is making, and it is a political debate—whether he has read the recommendations of the committee that scrutinised me, the letter that I sent to that committee, and the legal advice that was given to me and which was presented to the committee? Has he looked at the way in which the committee responded to that legal advice? If so, would he like to reflect on his opening remarks?

**Nick Bourne:** I thought that you were going to address the point that I have just made. I will continue with that point and then I will come to your point—and, yes, I have read them. The point that I was making to you—which I thought you were going to deal with

Amendment 4: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*commends the Welsh Assembly Government's action to ensure that, for the first time, a statutory duty will be placed on local authorities to promote, through transport provision, Welsh-medium education.*

**Nick Bourne:** Mae'n bleser gallu cyfrannu at ddadl bwysig ar natur a statws yr iaith Gymraeg, oherwydd mae hynny'n ganolog i'r ddadl hon. Fel y dywedodd Alun Cairns, cafwyd consensws ar yr iaith ar draws y pleidiau ers pasio Deddf yr iaith Gymraeg 1993. Fel y dywedodd Alun, arweiniwyd hynny drwy'r Senedd gan Wyn Roberts. Mae wedi ein gwasanaethu'n dda. Dros y naw mlynedd diwethaf yn y Cynulliad—ac mae hyn yn wir am ragflaenwyr y Cynulliad hefyd—cafwyd consensws ar yr iaith. Felly, mae'n ddirgelwch imi pam na chafodd y gwelliannau a gynigir gan Alun Cairns a Kirsty Williams gefnogaeth y Llywodraeth. Beth bynnag yw cynnwys adran 10—ac, fel minnau, cyfreithiwr yw'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog—nid yw'n darparu ar gyfer cydraddoldeb o ran y ddwy iaith.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Gallaf weld fod Nick o leiaf yn ceisio cael dadl briodol yn hytrach na rhefru, fel y gwnaeth Alun Cairns.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Nid rhefru oedd hynny.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Yr oedd yn rhefru. Fodd bynnag, gofynnaf i Nick—a deallaf y pwynt y mae'n ei wneud, ac mae'n ddadl wleidyddol—a yw wedi darllen argymhellion y pwyllgor a fu'n craffu arnaf, y llythyr a anfonais at y pwyllgor hwnnw, a'r cyngor cyfreithiol a roddwyd imi ac a gyflwynwyd gerbron y pwyllgor? A yw wedi edrych ar y ffordd yr ymatebodd y pwyllgor i'r cyngor cyfreithiol hwnnw? Os felly, a hoffai fyfyrion ar ei sylwadau agoriadol?

**Nick Bourne:** Yr oeddwn yn meddwl eich bod yn bwriadu ymdrin â'r pwynt yr wyf newydd ei wneud. Âf ymlaen ar y pwynt hwnnw ac yna deuaif at eich pwynt chi—ac, ydwyf, yr wyf wedi eu darllen. Y pwynt yr oeddwn yn ei wneud—yr oeddwn yn credu

specifically, but perhaps you will deal with it when you respond to the debate—is that there is no way that that section provides equality across the two languages. Imagine if it was the other way around and we were providing access to Welsh-language schools as a right and saying that we would only encourage access English-language schools. That would not provide for equality and, understandably, people would be up in arms. We have two languages in Wales. My fundamental point of view on this is that we are not providing for the equality of the languages. I have no doubt that you will want to deal with that later. For me, it is a simple point. I accept that there are difficulties, but, as far as I am concerned, they are difficulties to be overcome. We have been explicit about the equality of the languages in our manifesto—

**The Deputy First Minister:** Have you read the legal advice?

**Nick Bourne:** Yes.

No-one should be surprised by our stance on this. What you put forward is a movement in the right direction. I can see that, but it does not provide for equality. It is as pure and simple as that. If it were the other way around, you would be up in arms—and so would I.

**The Deputy First Minister:** You obviously have not read the legal advice. Genuinely, Nick, have you read it?

**Nick Bourne:** Yes.

**The Deputy First Minister:** In that case, do you not understand the difficulties that amending the Measure in that way would cause?

**Nick Bourne:** Yes. That is specifically why I have been making the point that I do understand the difficulties, but that there is a fundamental point here about the equality of the two languages, which I do not think that you are seeking to address. As far as I am concerned, the legal difficulties can be overcome.

eich bod am ymdrin ag ef yn benodol, ond efallai yr ymdriniwch ag ef wrth ymateb i'r ddatl—yw nad yw'r adran honno'n sicrhau cydraddoldeb o gwbl i'r ddwy iaith. Dychmygwch petai'r sefyllfa i'r gwrthwyneb a'n bod yn darparu mynediad i ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg fel hawl gan ddweud mai dim ond annog mynediad i ysgolion cyfrwng Saesneg y byddem. Ni fyddai hynny'n sicrhau cydraddoldeb, ac yn hollol ddealladwy byddai pobl yn gwrthwynebu. Mae gennym ddwy iaith yng Nghymru. Fy marn sylfaenol ar hyn yw nad ydym yn sicrhau cydraddoldeb i'r ddwy iaith. Mae'n sicr gennyf y byddwn am ymdrin â hynny'n ddiweddarach. I mi, mae'n bwynt syml. Derbyniaf fod yna anawsterau, ond o'm rhan i maent yn anawsterau i'w goresgyn. Yr ydym wedi bod yn bendant ynghylch cydraddoldeb yr ieithoedd yn ein manifesto—

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** A ydych wedi darllen y cyngor cyfreithiol?

**Nick Bourne:** Ydwyf.

Ni ddylai neb synnu at ein safbwynt ar hyn. Mae'r hyn a gynigiwch yn symud i'r cyfeiriad iawn. Gallaf weld hynny, ond nid yw'n sicrhau cydraddoldeb. Mae mor syml a rhwydd â hynny. Petai fel arall, byddech ar gefn eich ceffyl—a byddwn innau hefyd.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Mae'n amlwg nad ydych wedi darllen y cyngor cyfreithiol. O ddifrif, Nick, a ydych wedi'i ddarllen?

**Nick Bourne:** Ydwyf.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Os felly, onid ydych yn deall yr anawsterau a achosid drwy ddiwygio'r Mesur fel hynny?

**Nick Bourne:** Ydwyf. Dyna'n union pam yr wyf wedi bod yn gwneud y pwynt fy mod yn deall yr anawsterau, ond bod yna bwynt sylfaenol ynglŷn â chydraddoldeb y ddwy iaith. Ni chredaf eich bod yn ceisio mynd i'r afael â hynny. Hyd y gwelaf, mae modd datrys yr anawsterau cyfreithiol.

**The Deputy First Minister:** How?

**Nick Bourne:** You will have an opportunity to respond to the debate, Ieuan, in all fairness. Let me move on.

The point made by Alun Cairns and Kirsty Williams is that this is fine when money is plentiful and when local authorities want to abide by this and go along with it. However, we know from past experience—in Bridgend and elsewhere—that not all local authorities will want to play ball. Will you then be happy to stand by and see the Welsh language being discriminated against? I will not. You shake your head, but that is what will happen.

**Gareth Jones** *rose*—

**Nick Bourne:** I am not giving way again, because I do not have the time.

I am amazed by the attitude of both parts of the Government—and, although it is to do with a Plaid Cymru Minister, we should not just be getting at Plaid Cymru, as this also applies to Labour. We are moving away from the consensus on ensuring equality between the two languages of Wales—English and Welsh. This will be a sad day unless we come out of the Chamber with a commitment to honour and abide by the basic principle that we should not discriminate against either of our languages—and we will be discriminating against the Welsh language with this policy, unless it is corrected this afternoon.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** You had more time, but that is fine, thank you.

**Nick Bourne:** I thought that I had five minutes.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Nid wyf yn siŵr beth i'w wneud o'r ddadl y prynhawn hwn. Mae'r Torïaid un ai ddim yn deall neu ddim eisïau deall y pwynt, a hynny er mwyn gwneud pwynt gwleidyddol a phrofi, rywsut neu'i gilydd, nad yw'r Llywodraeth o blaid y Gymraeg.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Sut?

**Nick Bourne:** Cewch gyfle i ymateb i'r ddadl, Ieuan, a bod yn gwbl deg. Gadewch imi fwrw ymlaen.

Y pwynt a wnaeth Alun Cairns a Kirsty Williams yw bod hyn yn iawn pan fydd digon o arian ar gael a phan fydd awdurdodau lleol am gadw at hyn a dilyn y drefn. Fodd bynnag, gwyddom o brofiad yn y gorffennol—ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr ac mewn mannau eraill—na fydd pob awdurdod lleol am gydweithredu. A fyddwch yn fodlon sefyll o'r neilltu wedyn a gweld yr iaith Gymraeg yn destun gwahaniaethu? Ni fyddaf fi. Yr ydych yn ysgwyd eich pen, ond dyna a fydd yn digwydd.

**Gareth Jones** *a gododd*—

**Nick Bourne:** Nid wyf am ildio eto, oherwydd nid oes gennyf amser.

Yr wyf yn rhyfeddu at agwedd dwy ran y Llywodraeth—ac er mai ag un o Weinidogion Plaid Cymru y mae a wnelo hyn, ni ddylem fod yn targedu Plaid Cymru'n unig, gan fod hyn yn berthnasol i Lafur hefyd. Yr ydym yn symud i ffwrdd oddi wrth y consensws ynglŷn â sicrhau cydraddoldeb rhwng dwy iaith Cymru—y Gymraeg a'r Saesneg. Bydd heddiw'n ddiwrnod trist oni adawn y Siambr gydag ymrwymiad i anrhydeddu'r egwyddor sylfaenol na ddylem wahaniaethu yn erbyn y naill iaith na'r llall, ac i gadw at yr egwyddor honno—a gwahaniaethu yn erbyn y Gymraeg y byddwn gyda'r polisi hwn, oni chaiff ei gywiro y prynhawn yma.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr oedd gennych fwy o amser, ond mae hynny'n iawn, diolch.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr oeddwn yn meddwl mai pum munud oedd gennyf.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I am not sure what to make of this afternoon's debate. The Tories either do not understand or do not want to understand the point, in order to make some kind of political point, and to prove, in some way or other, that the Government is anti-Welsh.

Pe bai'r sefyllfa ieithyddol, a darpariaeth yr addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg, Saesneg neu ddwyieithog yn gyson drwy Gymru, efallai y gallech ddadlau ar hyd y llwybrau hyn, ond nid felly y mae hi. Yr ydych yn sôn am gyfartaledd—am *'equal access'*—ond nid yw hynny'n bod. Er enghraifft, mae merch fach gyda Leanne ac mae ysgol ar gael iddi ar waelod ei lôn, ond nid ysgol Gymraeg mohoni, ac felly rhaid i Leanne fynd â hi i ysgol sydd 3.5 milltir i ffwrdd. Nid yw hynny'n *'equal access'* ar unrhyw ystyr. Mae'r sefyllfa honno'n bodoli drwy Gymru gyfan, i raddau mwy neu lai.

Mae rheolau gan bob cyngor o ran y pellter y maent yn fodlon cario plant i'r ysgol, ac mae'r terfyn hwnnw fel arfer yn 1.5 filltir neu'n 2 filltir. Dyna ydyw yn gyffredinol ym mhob llywodraeth leol, bron. A ydych yn dweud na fydddech yn fodlon talu i blentyn fynychu ysgol os yw'n bellach na 2 filltir i ffwrdd, neu a ydych yn dweud y dylai pob plentyn gael mynediad i unrhyw ysgol, beth bynnag y bo ei chyfrwng ac y dylai'r llywodraeth leol dalu am hynny? Os dweud hynny yr ydych, gwell i chi ddechrau gwneud eich symiau.

Yng Ngwynedd, mae'r addysg yn cael ei hadnabod yn addysg ddwyieithog oherwydd natur y gymdeithas, ac am fod y Gymraeg yn iaith lafar i fwyafrif y trigolion. Mae'r addysg yn gyfartal ar draws y sir. Gallai hynny gael ei herio'n hawdd drwy ddweud mai darparu addysg Gymraeg y mae'r ysgolion hynny i gyd ac addysg Saesneg yr ydych am ei chael ar gyfer eich plentyn. Os ydych yn byw yn Aberdaron, mae'n debyg y byddai'n rhaid ichi fynd yn bell iawn i'w chael. Ai dyna'r sefyllfa y mae arnoch ei heisiau? A ydych yn dymuno troi ysgolion Gwynedd, er enghraifft, yn ysgolion penodedig Cymraeg neu Saesneg? Pe baech yn gwneud hynny, byddech yn tanseilio gwerth degawdau o waith gan yr awdurdod lleol.

3.50 p.m.

**Alun Cairns:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Alun Ffred Jones am ildio. Dyna pam y mae'r gwelliannau wedi'u llunio mewn ffordd sy'n dod dros hyn—y gair *'primarily'* sy'n berthnasol yma. Bu unedau Cymraeg mewn ysgolion Saesneg yn y Cymoedd ac yn ne

If the linguistic situation, and the provision of Welsh-medium, English-medium, or bilingual education, was consistent across Wales, perhaps you could argue along those lines, but that is not the situation. You talk about equality and about *'equal access'* but that does not exist. For instance, Leanne has a young daughter, and there is a school at the end of her road that she could go to, but it is not a Welsh-medium school, and so Leanne must take her to school, which is 3.5 miles away. That is not *'equal access'* in any sense of the word. That is the situation throughout Wales, to a greater or lesser extent.

Every council has rules governing the distance it is prepared to transport children to school, and the limit is usually 1.5 miles or 2 miles. That is the norm in virtually all local authorities. Are you saying that you would not be willing to pay for a child to attend a school if it was more than 2 miles away, or are you saying that every child should have access to any school, whatever the medium of education, and local authorities should foot the bill? If that is what you are saying, you had better start doing your sums.

In Gwynedd, education is recognised as being bilingual education because of the nature of the community, and because the Welsh language is the spoken language of the majority of residents. Education is equal across the county. That could easily be challenged by saying that all schools provide a Welsh-medium education and you want an English-medium education for your child. If you lived in Aberdaron, it is likely that you would have to travel great distances to access that. Is that the position you want to see? Do you want to turn Gwynedd schools, for example, into designated Welsh-medium or English-medium schools? If you did that, you would undermine decades of work by the local authority.

**Alun Cairns:** I am grateful to Alun Ffred Jones for giving way. That is why the amendments were drafted in such a way as to overcome this—*'primarily'* is the operative word. There have been Welsh-language units in English-medium schools for years in the

Cymru ers tro. Felly, os nad yw'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn fodlon derbyn y gwelliannau fel ag y'u lluniwyd eisoes i oresgyn y broblem, ac os yw'n gweld rhyw broblem arall nad ydym wedi'i gweld—er fy mod wedi cael cadarnhad cyfreithiol o hyn gan arbenigwyr o fewn y Cynulliad ac o'r tu allan—efallai y byddai unedau Cymraeg yn ffordd o oresgyn y broblem.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Yr ydych yn sôn am oresgyn y broblem ond yr ydym yn ymdrin â deddfwriaeth yma. Mae'n rhaid i chi fod yn ofalus iawn i beidio â rhoi dim mewn deddfwriaeth a fydd, yn y pen draw, yn creu mwy o broblemau. Nid wyf yn siŵr beth yw pwrpas y cynnig fel ag y mae, heblaw creu rhywfaint o drafferth. Mae adran 10 y Mesur, fel y mae Ieuan yn ei chynnig, yn rhoi dyletswydd ar awdurdod lleol i hyrwyddo trafndiaeth i sefydliadau addysg Gymraeg. Gan nad yw addysg Gymraeg ar gael yn gyson drwy Gymru, mae hwnnw'n bwynt go bwysig.

Yr ydych yn sôn am hawliau cyfartal, ond mae hyn yn cyflwyno problem wirioneddol oherwydd eich bod wedyn yn gorfodi pobl i ddweud, 'Nid wyf yn hoffi'r ysgol honno gan nad wyf yn hoffi'r iaith a ddefnyddir ynddi, felly byddai'n well gennyf fynd i'r fan acw'. Rhaid i awdurdodau addysg dalu am hynny. Mae'r problemau y byddech yn eu creu mewn rhai awdurdodau yn y gorllewin yn anferthol. Un ai ymosod yn fwriadol yr ydych ar y polisi hwnnw, sydd wedi'i feithrin dros ddegawdau, neu nid oes gennyh unrhyw syniad o'r hyn a wnewch. Yr wyf yn amau mai'r cyntaf o'r rheiny sy'n wir.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I am delighted to contribute to this important debate. I listened carefully to Alun Ffred Jones and watched the body language of the Plaid Cymru group, and I can understand that they are rather sensitive about this subject this afternoon. They need not be, because, whether they like it or not, our job is to raise the concerns that we have about how this legislation is framed. Alun Cairns has made a valid point about the way in which section 10 has been drafted. You could drive a coach and horses through it, it is so weak. We are right to raise the concerns that people are raising with us. If you do not like that, that is your problem and

Valleys and in south Wales. If the Deputy First Minister is not prepared to accept the amendments as drafted to overcome the problem, and if he sees some other problem that we have not been able to identify—although I have had legal confirmation of this by experts within and without the Assembly—perhaps the Welsh-medium units are a way of overcoming the problem.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** You are talking about trying to overcome the problem, but we are dealing with legislation here. You have to be very careful not to put anything in legislation that will create more problems down the line. I am not sure what purpose the motion as tabled serves, other than mischief-making. Section 10 of the Measure, as Ieuan has proposed it, places a duty on local authorities to promote transport to Welsh-medium education settings. Given that Welsh-medium education is not available consistently throughout Wales, that is a very important point.

You talk about equal rights, but this introduces a genuine problem, given that you then compel people to say, 'I do not like that school because I do not like the language used there, so I would rather go to the school over there'. Local education authorities have to pay for that. The difficulties which you would create in some authorities in west Wales are enormous. You are either intentionally attacking that policy, which has been nurtured over decades, or you have absolutely no concept of what you would be doing. I strongly suspect that the first of those that is true.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yr wyf wrth fy modd yn cael cyfrannu at y ddadl bwysig hon. Gwrandewais yn ofalus ar Alun Ffred Jones gan wylio osgo grŵp Plaid Cymru, a gallaf ddeall eu bod yn sensitif braidd am y pwnc hwn y prynhawn yma. Nid oes angen iddynt fod, oherwydd p'un a hoffant hynny neu beidio, ein gwaith ni yw codi'r pryderon sydd gennym am y ffordd y mae'r ddeddfwriaeth hon wedi'i llunio. Mae Alun Cairns wedi gwneud pwynt dilys ynglŷn â'r ffordd y mae adran 10 wedi'i drafftio. Gallech yrru ceffyl a chert drwyddi, mae mor wan. Mae'n iawn inni godi'r pryderon y mae pobl yn eu mynegi wrthym. Os nad ydych yn hoffi

not ours. We are doing our job as the official opposition.

**Gareth Jones** *rose*—

**Jonathan Morgan:** In a minute, Gareth.

When we talk about access to schools and the problems of transport to schools, we often talk about it in the context of rural Wales, with people going some distance to get to hard-to-reach schools from isolated villages and communities. I am lucky to represent what is a small constituency. I have three Welsh-medium primary schools in my constituency: Ysgol Gymraeg Melin Gruffydd, Ysgol y Wern and Ysgol Mynydd Bychan. All three schools offer an excellent standard of education. The principal challenge in the past 15 to 20 years has been an ability to increase the number of pupil places to accommodate the demand from parents who want a Welsh-medium education for their children. I am sure that Jenny Randerson would bear this out: the decade of Russell Goodway rule in Cardiff was dreadful at addressing the needs of those people who wanted to send their children to a Welsh-medium primary school. Therefore, the initial problem was one of access based on the lack of pupil places. Hopefully, that will be addressed. However, transport is a real issue.

I will give you a quick example. Neighbours of mine send their children more than 2 miles away—so they would be excluded under this—to Ysgol y Wern in Llanishen. They live in the catchment area for the English-medium school, Ton-yr-Ywen Primary School, which is a similar distance away. However, they have chosen to send their children to Ysgol y Wern, which is also an excellent school offering a wonderful standard of education. They have made that decision as parents. Many parents in my constituency who send their children to Welsh-medium schools do not speak a word of Welsh, but they want their children to benefit from a Welsh-medium education, and my colleagues and I support that. However, my neighbours would be discriminated against because they send their children to Ysgol y Wern; if they were to send their

hynny, eich problem chi yw hynny, nid ein problem ni. Yr ydym yn gwneud ein gwaith fel yr wrthblaid swyddogol.

**Gareth Jones** *a gododd*—

**Jonathan Morgan:** Mewn munud, Gareth.

Pan soniwn am fynediad i ysgolion a phroblemau cludiant i ysgolion, byddwn yn aml yn sôn amdano yng nghyd-destun y Gymru wledig, a phobl yn teithio gryn bellter i gyrraedd ysgolion anodd eu cyrraedd o bentrefi a chymunedau diarffordd. Yr wyf yn ffodus o fod yn cynrychioli etholaeth weddol fechan. Mae gennyf dair ysgol gynradd Gymraeg yn fy etholaeth: Ysgol Gymraeg Melin Gruffydd, Ysgol y Wern ac Ysgol Mynydd Bychan. Mae pob un o'r tair yn cynnig addysg o safon ardderchog. Y brif her yn y 15 i'r 20 mlynedd diwethaf oedd llwyddo i gynyddu nifer y lleoedd i ddisgyblion er mwyn ateb y galw gan rieni sy'n dymuno cael addysg Gymraeg i'w plant. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai Jenny Randerson yn ategu hyn: yr oedd y degawd pan oedd Russell Goodway yn rheoli Caerdydd yn ofnadwy o ran mynd i'r afael ag anghenion y bobl hynny a ddymunai anfon eu plant i ysgol gynradd Gymraeg. Felly, y broblem wreiddiol oedd mynediad oherwydd y diffyg lleoedd i ddisgyblion. Delir â hynny, gobeithio. Fodd bynnag, mae cludiant yn broblem wirioneddol.

Dyma ichi enghraifft sydyn. Mae cymdogion i mi yn anfon eu plant dros 2 filltir i ffwrdd—felly, byddent yn cael eu heithrio dan hyn—i Ysgol y Wern yn Llanisien. Maent yn byw yn nalgylch ysgol Saesneg ei chyfrwng, Ysgol gynradd Tonyrywen, sydd tua'r un pellter. Serch hynny, maent wedi dewis anfon eu plant i Ysgol y Wern, sydd hefyd yn ysgol ardderchog ac yn cynnig addysg o safon ragorol. Dyna'u penderfyniad fel rhieni. Mae nifer o rieni yn fy etholaeth sy'n anfon eu plant i ysgolion Cymraeg yn hollol ddi-Gymraeg, ond maent yn dymuno i'w plant elwa o gael addysg Gymraeg, ac mae fy nghyd-Aelodau a minnau'n cefnogi hynny. Fodd bynnag, gwahaniaethid yn erbyn fy nghymdogion oherwydd eu bod yn anfon eu plant i Ysgol y Wern; petaent yn anfon eu plant i Ysgol Gynradd Tonyrywen, byddent yn elwa dan y Mesur teithio gan ddysgwyr. Y

children to Ton-yr-Ywen Primary School, they would benefit under the learner travel Measure. It is that level of discrimination that I fail to understand. It does not just affect parts of rural Wales; it will affect small urban constituencies such as mine. If you, as a party, and as a Government, wish to increase access to Welsh-medium education and if you wish to support the choices that people have made, there needs to be equity of access.

This legislation needs to be addressed from the legal point of view. Ieuan Wyn Jones has a duty to sort this out, because we need to ensure that people are not discriminated against because of the choices that they have made. You say that this will place an obligation on local authorities to encourage improvements to access to Welsh-medium education. It places no real obligation at all; it is not an obligation in law and it will do nothing to deal with the challenges that people will face. It carries no weight and all it will do is encourage large numbers of people in Wales to go down the legal route of enforcing their rights in the courts. I am afraid that too many families are doing that already because of the education system, and I do not think that that mess needs to be extended to people who merely want to get their kids to the school of their choice. That is wrong and I think that you, as a party, and as a Government, need to address this serious concern.

Regardless of the contributions that we have heard so far from the other side of the Chamber, people outside do not believe you. All they see is a Government that is willing, for whatever reason, to discriminate against those people who have decided to send their children to a Welsh-medium primary school. Quite frankly, I do not believe that that says a good thing about this Government. We need to improve access to Welsh-medium education to support and sustain the language in the long term.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Perhaps we should keep this simple, silly. I am beginning to conclude that we would be far better off if we had bilingual schools, full stop, and if every school were deemed good enough so that

lefel honno o wahaniaethu yw'r hyn na allaf ei ddeall. Nid ar rannau o'r Gymru wledig yn unig y bydd hyn yn effeithio; bydd yn effeithio ar etholaethau trefol bychain megis fy etholaeth i. Os ydych, fel plaid, ac fel Llywodraeth, am ehangu mynediad i addysg Gymraeg, ac os ydych am gefnogi'r dewisiadau y mae pobl wedi'u gwneud, mae angen sicrhau mynediad cyfartal.

Mae angen mynd i'r afael â'r ddeddfwriaeth hon o'r safbwynt cyfreithiol. Dyletswydd Ieuan Wyn Jones yw datrys hyn, oherwydd mae angen inni sicrhau na wahaniaethir yn erbyn pobl oherwydd y dewisiadau y maent wedi'u gwneud. Dywedwch y bydd dyletswydd yn sgil hyn ar awdurdodau lleol i hyrwyddo gwelliannau er mwyn sicrhau gwell mynediad i addysg Gymraeg. Nid yw'n gosod unrhyw ddyletswydd o ddifrif; nid yw'n ddyletswydd dan y gyfraith ac ni fydd yn gwneud dim i fynd i'r afael â'r anawsterau y bydd pobl yn eu hwynebu. Nid oes iddi ddim grym o gwbl, a'r cyfan a wnaiff fydd annog nifer fawr o bobl yng Nghymru i ddilyn llwybr y gyfraith a mynnu eu hawliau yn y llysoedd. Mae arnaf ofn fod gormod o deuluoedd yn gwneud hynny eisoes oherwydd y system addysg, ac ni chredaf fod angen ymestyn y llanestr hwnnw i bobl nad ydynt ond am gael eu plant i'w dewis ysgol. Nid yw hynny'n iawn, a chredaf fod angen i chi, fel plaid, ac fel Llywodraeth, fynd i'r afael â pryder difrifol hwn.

Er gwaethaf y cyfraniadau a glywsom hyd yn hyn o ochr arall y Siambr, nid yw pobl y tu allan yn eich credu. Y cyfan a welant yw Llywodraeth sy'n barod, am ba reswm bynnag, i wahaniaethu yn erbyn y bobl hynny sydd wedi penderfynu anfon eu plant i ysgol gynradd Gymraeg. I fod yn blwmp ac yn y blaen, nid wyf yn credu bod hynny'n dweud llawer am y Llywodraeth hon. Mae angen inni agor y drws ar addysg Gymraeg er mwyn cynnal a chadw'r iaith yn y tymor hir.

**Eleanor Burnham.** Efallai y dylem gadw hyn yn syml. Yr wyf yn dechrau casglu y byddai'n well o lawer arnom petai gennym ysgolion dwyieithog, a dyna ni, a phetai pob ysgol yn cael ei hystyried yn ddigon da fel na

people did not have to make all these complicated choices or move their children hither and thither. We are here because of the learner travel Measure, and it perhaps has got so complicated because people have too many choices. People listening outside must be wondering what the hell we are talking about, quite frankly.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Eleanor Burnham, can you keep to parliamentary language, please?

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yes, I apologise.

In a nutshell, it would be better if only we could keep it simple. However, we are where we are and, in many respects, we are just trying to make the best of a bad job. This is a dog's dinner. I understand Alun Ffred, despite the fact that we oppose him on this issue, and I appreciate his—*[Interruption.]* No, as I have already made a bit of a dog's dinner of my own few words, I think that I had better get on.

Seriously, we are trying to make the best of a very bad job and it is difficult, but we are living in the real world.

Rhaid i ni wneud ein gorau o'r sefyllfa sydd ohoni, ac nid ydym yn teimlo bod adran 10 y Mesur yn ddigon cryf, fel yr oedd Kirsty yn ei amlinellu. Mae darparu cludiant yn beth andros o anodd. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddwn yn cefnogi'r Ceidwadwyr gan fod y ddarpariaeth yn fater lleol ac yn fater cenedlaethol. Gyda hynny, credaf y dylwn eistedd i lawr.

**Angela Burns:** I declare an interest, as I have a five-year-old daughter and I am finding it impossible to get her into a Welsh-medium school in Pembrokeshire—that is, unless I am prepared to stick her on a public transport bus, on her own, at the age of five, to travel the 16 miles or so to school.

We need to go back to basics on this issue. Why are we all so concerned about the learner travel Measure and about why the right to transport has not been given to children who want to go to a school that offers Welsh-medium education? It is

fyddai'n rhaid i bobl wneud yr holl ddewisiadau cymhleth hyn neu symud eu plant o'r naill le i'r llall. Yr ydym yma oherwydd y Mesur teithio gan ddysgwyr, ac efallai mai'r rheswm y mae pethau mor gymhleth erbyn hyn yw bod gan bobl ormod o ddewis. Mae'n siŵr fod pobl y tu allan yn methu â deall am beth ddiawl yr ydym yn sôn, a dweud y gwir.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Eleanor Burnham, a wnewch chi chi gadw at iaith seneddol, os gwelwch yn dda?

**Eleanor Burnham:** Gwnaf, Mae'n ddrwg gennyf.

Yn y bôn, byddai'n well pebae modd cadw pethau'n syml. Fodd bynnag, dyna'r sefyllfa, ac mewn llawer ffordd ceisio gwneud y gorau o'r gwaethaf yr ydym. Mae'n draed moch. Yr wyf yn deall Alun Ffred, er ein bod yn ei wrthwynebu yn y cyswllt hwn, a gwerthfawrogaf ei—*[Torri ar draws.]* Na, gan fy mod eisoes wedi gwneud traed moch braidd o'm ychydig eiriau fy hun, credaf y byddai'n well imi fwrw ymlaen.

O ddifrif, yr ydym yn ceisio gwneud y gorau o smonach, ac mae'n anodd, ond yr ydym yn byw yn y byd go iawn.

We have to make the best of the situation we are in, and we do not feel that section 10 of the Measure is strong enough, as Kirsty has outlined. Providing transport is tremendously difficult. However, we will not be supporting the Conservatives because the provision is a local and a national matter. With that, I think that I should sit down.

**Angela Burns:** Yr wyf yn datgan buddiant, gan fod gennyf ferch sy'n bum mlwydd oed ac yr wyf yn ei chael yn amhosibl cael lle iddi mewn ysgol Gymraeg yn sir Benfro—hynny yw, oni fyddaf yn barod i'w rhoi ar fws cyhoeddus, ar ei phen ei hun, yn bump oed, i deithio'r 16 milltir neu fwy i'r ysgol.

Mae angen inni ddychwelyd at hanfodion y mater hwn. Pam yr ydym i gyd yn poeni cymaint am y Mesur teithio gan ddysgwyr a pham nad yw plant sy'n dymuno mynd i ysgol sy'n cynnig addysg Gymraeg wedi cael yr hawl i gludiant? Y rheswm yw am ein bod



because we, in the Assembly, all say that we want to encourage the Welsh language. I do not speak a word of Welsh, apart from a few salutations.

4.00 p.m.

We want to encourage everyone in Wales to preserve our culture and all our children to grow up able to speak Welsh. In order to do that successfully, it is helpful that they learn it at an early age, whether that age is five or 10. I am linguistically challenged—I have tried to learn Welsh but I am getting nowhere fast—and I immensely admire the people all around this Chamber who can flip from one to the other.

**Alun Ffred Jones** *a gododd*—

**Angela Burns:** I hope that you will not do that now, Alun Ffred.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** If you want to change the education of all children, surely you need to change the curriculum in all schools. It has nothing to do with travelling here or there.

**Angela Burns:** I absolutely agree with you, but what is most likely to happen first, and what is the most achievable short-term objective? We can stop doing all sorts of things while we wait for a long-term goal, but that does not help us or the country, and more and more generations of children will go through our schools without being given this opportunity. My concern is about a number of issues—

**Gareth Jones** *a gododd*—

**Angela Burns:** I will not take another intervention.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. If someone says ‘no’, you are not supposed to stand up to try to persuade them. [*Laughter.*] Have you been persuaded or not?

**Angela Burns:** No, I would rather keep going, I keep losing track.

ni, yn y Cynulliad, i gyd yn dweud ein bod am hybu'r iaith Gymraeg. Nid oes gennyf fi air o Gymraeg, ac eithrio ambell gyfarchiad.

Mae arnom eisiau annog pawb yng Nghymru i gadw ein diwylliant a gweld ein plant i gyd yn tyfu i allu siarad Cymraeg. I wneud hynny'n llwyddiannus, mae'n gymorth iddynt ddysgu'r iaith yn ifanc, boed hynny'n bump neu'n 10 oed. I mi mae dysgu iaith yn anodd—yr wyf wedi ceisio dysgu Cymraeg ond nid wyf yn llwyddo ryw lawer—ac yr wyf yn edmygu'n fawr iawn y bobl ym mhob rhan o'r Siambr hon sy'n gallu troi o'r naill iaith i'r llall.

**Alun Ffred Jones** *rose*—

**Angela Burns:** Gobeithio na wnewch chi hynny'n awr, Alun Ffred.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Os ydych am newid addysg pob plentyn, yn sicr ddigon mae angen ichi newid y cwricwlwm ym mhob ysgol. Nid oes a wnelo hyn ddim â theithio yma ac acw.

**Angela Burns:** Cytunaf yn llwyr â chi, ond beth sydd fwyaf tebygol o ddigwydd gyntaf, a beth yw'r amcan tymor byr mwyaf tebygol o gael ei gyflawni? Gallwn roi'r gorau i wneud pob math o bethau tra byddwn yn aros am amcan hirdymor, ond nid yw hynny o gymorth i ni nac i'r wlad, a bydd mwy a mwy o genedlaethau o blant yn mynd drwy ein hysgolion heb gael y cyfle hwn. Yr wyf yn pryderu am nifer o faterion—

**Gareth Jones** *rose*—

**Angela Burns:** Nid wyf am dderbyn ymyriad arall.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Os bydd rhywun yn dweud ‘na’, ni ddylech sefyll i geisio'i berswadio. [*Chwerthin.*] A ydych wedi'ch perswadio ynte ddim?

**Angela Burns:** Nac ydwyf, byddai'n well gennyf ddal ati; yr wyf yn colli fy nhrywydd o hyd.

**Leanne Wood:** Are you afraid?

**Angela Burns:** I assure you, Miss Wood, that I am not afraid; that is not an accusation that is usually levelled at me.

We want our children to be very good at being able to speak Welsh, as one of the key languages of this country. We are under immense pressure from all sorts of people to preserve the Welsh language. In Parliament, we have endless debates, as the Hansard reports testify, where people like Mr Wigley have said that there should be a facility within Welsh education to make all children as thoroughly bilingual as possible. We have a legislative competence Order going through. We consider this to be one of the most important things that we can do. There have been calls for Welsh Ministers to make appropriate arrangements to ensure that every child in Wales is able to receive education in the appropriate language. However, in terms of the transportation of children to the school of their choice, we are not allowing that to happen.

Why is it that, if I were a Christian or a Muslim, or a member of any other religious faith, my child could be transported to school at a cost to the state, but not if I wanted my child to learn through the medium of Welsh? It is a real issue. I would very much like to be able to support the learner travel Measure, because it is a good piece of legislation that we can pass in Wales, but unless we fulfil this aspect of it, we will deprive many of our children of the ability to learn Welsh.

The other aspect that I do not think that anyone has considered is that this will not help us in fighting poverty and deprivation. If I was struggling to send my daughter 16 miles to a school where she could learn through the medium of Welsh, how would someone with less income than me, and who was not in a two-car family, be able to do it? We are depriving a whole bundle of people of choice and of the ability to encourage their children to develop in the way that they want them to develop, even though we always talk about choice. It is important that we review this, and I ask the Minister to do it.

**Leanne Wood:** Oes arnoch chi ofn?

**Angela Burns:** Yr wyf yn eich sicrhau, Miss Wood, nad oes ofn arnaf; nid yw hwnnw'n gyhuddiad a deflir ataf fel arfer.

Yr ydym am i'n plant allu siarad Cymraeg yn dda, fel un o ieithoedd allweddol y wlad hon. Yr ydym dan bwysau anferth gan bob math o bobl i gadw'r iaith Gymraeg. Yn y Senedd cawn ddadleuon diddiwedd, fel y tystia adroddiadau Hansard, lle mae pobl fel Mr Wigley wedi dweud y dylid cael cyfleuster o fewn addysg Gymraeg i wneud pob plentyn mor ddwyieithog ag sy'n bosibl. Mae gennym Orchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol yn mynd trwodd. Ystyriwn mai hyn yw un o'r pethau pwysicaf y gallwn ei wneud. Galwyd ar Weinidogion Cymru i wneud trefniadau priodol i sicrhau bod pob plentyn yng Nghymru yn gallu cael addysg yn yr iaith briodol. Fodd bynnag, o ran cludo plant i'r ysgol a ddewisant, nid ydym yn caniatáu i hynny ddigwydd.

Pam, petawn yn Gristion neu'n Fwslim, neu'n aelod o unrhyw ffydd arall, y gellid cludo fy mhleintyn i'r ysgol ar gost y wlad, ond nid petawn yn dymuno i'm plentyn ddysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg? Mae'n broblem wirioneddol. Hoffwn yn fawr iawn allu cefnogi'r Mesur teithio gan ddysgwyr, oherwydd mae'n ddarn da o ddeddfwriaeth y gallwn ei wneud yng Nghymru, ond os na chyflawnwn yr agwedd hon arno, byddwn yn amddifadu llawer o'n plant rhag gallu dysgu Cymraeg.

Yr agwedd arall na chredaf fod neb wedi'i hystyried yw na fydd hyn yn ein helpu wrth ymladd tlodi ac amddifadedd. Petawn yn ymdrechu i anfon fy merch 16 filltir i ysgol lle gallai ddysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, sut y gallai rhywun â llai o incwm na mi, a heb ddau gar yn y teulu, allu gwneud hynny? Yr ydym yn amddifadu carfan gyfan o bobl o'r dewis a'r gallu i annog eu plant i ddatblygu yn y ffordd y dymunant iddynt ddatblygu, er ein bod bob amser yn siarad am ddewis. Mae'n bwysig inni adolygu hyn, a gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog wneud hynny.

I will end by reading a Plaid Cymru press release of 16 April 2008, because I am confused by it:

‘Plaid Cymru AM Leanne Wood has welcomed moves by the Plaid Transport Minister to improve access to Welsh medium education. New legislation brought in by Ieuan Wyn Jones puts a statutory duty on local authorities to provide transport for students and pupils to Welsh language schools or colleges’.

I am confused. What is the point of this debate? That press release said that you had already done it, and that my child should be able to be transported to Welsh-medium education, but that is not the case.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Yr wyf am gadarnhau ein bod yn gofyn am gefnogaeth y Cynulliad i welliannau 3 a 4 y prynhawn yma. Mae gwelliant 2 wedi ei dynnu yn ôl. Yr ydym yn gofyn i'r Cynulliad wrthod gwelliant 1 a phleidleisio o blaid y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio gan ddau welliant y Llywodraeth, sef gwelliannau 3 a 4.

Yr wyf yn synnu bod y Ceidwadwyr wedi cyflwyno'r cynnig hwn. Mae proses deddfwriaethol yn mynd drwy'r Cynulliad ar hyn o bryd—yn ogystal â phwyllgor y mae Alun Cairns ei hun yn ei gadeirio—i drafod manylion y Mesur hwn. Yr hyn mae Alun Cairns a'r Blaid Geidwadol yn ei wneud y prynhawn yma yw ailagor y drafodaeth. Bu iddynt fethu â chael eu ffordd yn y pwyllgor craffu, a'r hyn y maent yn ei wneud yn awr, yn hytrach na dod atom a gofyn a oes modd cryfhau'r mynediad at drafnidiaeth i addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg, yw defnyddio'r Cyfarfod Llawn i ailagor y drafodaeth y maent wedi ei cholli mewn lleoedd eraill. Dyfynnaf yr hyn a ddywedodd Alun Cairns yn y pwyllgor:

‘This is an issue on which I am sure we all want to reach agreement—the last thing that we want is for the language to become a divisive issue’.

Ystyr y gair ‘*agreement*’ yw dod i ddealltwriaeth. Nid yw Alun Cairns, nac unrhyw Aelod Ceidwadol arall, wedi gofyn i mi am gyfarfod i drafod y Mesur hwn.

Gorffennaf drwy ddarllen datganiad i'r wasg gan Blaid Cymru ar 16 Ebrill 2008, oherwydd mae'n peri dryswch imi:

‘Mae AC Plaid Cymru Leanne Wood wedi croesawu cynigion gan Weinidog Trafnidiaeth Plaid i wella mynediad i addysg gyfrwng Gymraeg. Mae deddfwriaeth newydd a gyflwynwyd gan Ieuan Wyn Jones yn rhoi dyletswydd statudol ar awdurdodau lleol i ddarparu trafnidiaeth i fyfyrwyr a disgyblion i ysgolion neu golegau cyfrwng Cymraeg.’

Yr wyf wedi drysu. Beth yw diben y ddadl hon? Dywedodd y datganiad hwnnw i'r wasg eich bod wedi ei wneud eisoes, ac y dylai fy mhlentyn allu cael ei gludo i addysg Gymraeg, ond nid yw hynny'n wir.

**The Deputy First Minister:** I wish to confirm that we are asking for the Assembly's support for amendments 3 and 4. Amendment 2 has been withdrawn. We are asking the Assembly to reject amendment 1 and to vote in favour of the motion as amended by the two Government amendments, namely amendments 3 and 4.

I am surprised that the Conservatives have proposed this motion. A legislative process is going through the Assembly at present—in addition to a committee chaired by Alun Cairns himself—to discuss the detail of this Measure. What Alun Cairns and the Conservative Party are doing today is to reopen the debate. They failed to get their way in the scrutiny committee, and what they are now doing, rather than come to us and asking whether access to Welsh-medium education can be made more robust, is to use Plenary to reopen a debate which they have already lost in other places. I quote what Alun Cairns said in committee:

Mae hwn yn fater yr wyf yn sicr ein bod i gyd am ddod i gytundeb yn ei gylch—y peth olaf a ddymunwn yw i'r iaith ddod yn fater ymrannol.

The meaning of the word ‘*agreement*’ is to come to an understanding. I have had no request from Alun Cairns, or from any other Conservative Member, for a meeting to

**Alun Cairns:** Ysgrifennais atoch yn nodi sawl rhan o'r Mesur lle yr oedd gennyf gwestiynau; cyhoeddwyd y llythyr hwnnw i'r wasg hefyd. Gofynnodd un o'ch swyddogion i mi, ar ôl derbyn y llythyr, pam nad oedd adran 10 yn ateb fy nghwestiynau ynglŷn â'r iaith Gymraeg. Felly, gofynnaf i chi dynnu eich geiriau yn ôl.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Cawsom drafodaeth yn y pwyllgor ar yr union bwynt mae Alun Cairns yn ceisio ei ailgodi heddiw. Naill ai nid yw'r Ceidwadwyr yn deall y drefn ddeddfwriaethol yn y Cynulliad, neu maent yn fwriadol yn peidio â defnyddio'r drefn ddeddfwriaethol honno. Yr hyn y maent yn ei wneud yw ceisio codi'r ddatl hon yn y Siambr, gan ofyn pwy bellach sy'n siarad ar ran yr iaith Gymraeg—

**Eleanor Burnham** *a gododd*—

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Nid wyf am ildio.

Maent yn gofyn pwy bellach sy'n siarad ar ran yr iaith Gymraeg—y Blaid Geidwadol ynteu Plaid Cymru. Dyna'r ddatl heddiw. Nid yw'n ymwneud â'r Mesur nac â phwy sy'n gwneud eu gorau dros y Gymraeg; y cyfan ydyw bellach yw'r Blaid Geidwadol, am ei rhesymau pleidiol, cul, yn ceisio defnyddio'r Gymraeg er mwyn ei bwriadau ei hun. Dyna'r unig beth yr ydym yn ei drafod heddiw.

Gadewch inni edrych ar y cefndir. Pan gyflwynwyd y Mesur yn ei ffurf drafft, nid oedd yn cynnwys unrhyw gyfeiriad at yr iaith Gymraeg, nac yn delio â'r mater yr ydym wedi bod yn ei drafod ers hynny. Ymddangosais ger bron y pwyllgor craffu, dan gadeiryddiaeth Gareth Jones—yr oedd Alun Cairns a Kirsty Williams yn aelodau o'r pwyllgor hwnnw—a cefais fy holi ar y mater hwn. Cytunais y byddem eisiau ystyried y mater hwn ymhellach. Yr hyn yr oeddent yn ceisio ei ddweud yw y dylai bod hawl statudol i fynediad at drafndiaeth i addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg a Saesneg. Cawsom drafodaeth ar y pwnc. Eglurais bod problemau gwleidyddol, ymarferol a chyfreithiol dwys yn hynny o beth.

discuss this Measure.

**Alun Cairns:** I wrote to you setting out a many sections in the Measure where I had questions; the letter was also sent to the press. One of your officials asked me, having received the letter, why section 10 did not answer my questions regarding the Welsh language. Therefore, I would ask you to retract that.

**The Deputy First Minister:** We had a discussion in committee on the very point which Alun Cairns is trying to bring up again today. Either the Conservatives do not understand the legislative procedures of the Assembly or they are deliberately ignoring those procedures. What they are doing is attempting to bring this debate to the Chamber, and asking who now speaks for the Welsh language—

**Eleanor Burnham** *rose*—

**The Deputy First Minister:** I will not give way.

They now ask who now speaks for the Welsh language—the Conservatives or Plaid Cymru. That is today's debate. It has nothing to do with the Measure, nor with who is doing his best for the Welsh language; it is now a matter of the Conservative Party, for narrow, political reasons, trying to use the Welsh language for its own ends. That is all we are discussing this afternoon.

Let us look at the background to this. When the draft Measure was tabled, it did not include any reference to the Welsh language, nor did it deal with the matter we have been discussing since then. I appeared before the scrutiny committee, chaired by Gareth Jones—Alun Cairns and Kirsty Williams were members of the committee—and I was questioned on this issue. I agreed that we would want to consider this issue further. What they were trying to say was that there should be a statutory right to access transport to Welsh-medium and English-medium education. We had a discussion on this. I explained that there were political, practical and legal problems with that.

Yn ychwanegol at hynny, anfonais lythyr at y pwyllgor, gyda chopi o'r cyngor cyfreithiol, a oedd yn egluro'r cefndir. Gan bod Alun Cairns a Kirsty Williams wedi bod mor frwd yn y pwyllgor yn gofyn i mi ailystyried, yr oeddwn yn edrych ymlaen at gael gweld beth fyddai'r pwyllgor yn ei argymhell. Os oeddent wedi dadlau yn y pwyllgor, a minnau wedi anfon llythyr yn rhoi'r cyngor cyfreithiol, byddwn yn gobeithio y byddent wedi gallu perswadio'r pwyllgor i ofyn i mi newid y Mesur.

Fodd bynnag, yr unig beth a ddigwyddodd oedd bod y pwyllgor wedi nodi'r cyngor cyfreithiol yr oeddwn i wedi ei roi, ac felly'n derbyn bod problemau. Ni wnaeth y pwyllgor, yr oeddynt yn aelodau ohono, unrhyw argymhelliad i gynnwys gwelliant yn y Mesur.

4.10 p.m.

**Kirsty Williams:** Will you give way?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. He is not taking any interventions.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn derbyn fod Nick Bourne wedi darllen yr adroddiad a'r cyngor cyfreithiol, ond yr wyf yn synnu nad yw yn derbyn y casgliad. Yr unig beth y byddwn yn gofyn i Nick ei wneud, fel cyfreithiwr, yw edrych ar y llythyr a'r cyngor cyfreithiol.

Mae ffordd ymlaen. Euthum yn ôl at fy swyddogion a gofyn am farn gyfreithiol bellach. Yn wyneb y ffaith nad oedd y pwyllgor yr oedd Alun Cairns yn aelod ohono wedi gwneud unrhyw argymhelliad, dywedais wrth fy swyddogion, 'Pe bai'r pwyllgor yn cael ei ffordd, ni fyddwn yn newid y Mesur o gwbl'. Felly, trafodais gyda'm swyddogion a oedd ffordd arall ymlaen, oherwydd y problemau cyfreithiol. Nid dim ond problem gyda chyfraith Prydain Fawr yw hon; mae problem hefyd gyda'r confensiwn Ewropeaidd ar hawliau dynol, a thynnais sylw'r pwyllgor at y confensiwn hwnnw. Mae'r confensiwn hwnnw yn sôn am nifer o achosion lle mae hyn yn gallu bod yn beth sensitif iawn. Felly, penderfynwyd rhoi cymal yn y Mesur a oedd yn mynd cyn belled

In addition, I wrote a letter to the committee, with a copy of the legal advice, explaining the background. As Alun Cairns and Kirsty Williams had been so eager in committee to ask me to reconsider, I looked forward to seeing what the committee would recommend. If they had argued in committee, and I had written a letter giving the legal advice, I would have hoped that they would be able to persuade the committee to ask me to amend the Measure.

However, all that happened was that the committee noted the legal advice which I had provided, thereby accepting that there were problems. The committee, of which they were members, made no recommendations to amend the Measure.

**Kirsty Williams:** A wnewch chi ildio?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw'n derbyn unrhyw ymyriadau.

**The Deputy First Minister:** I accept that Nick Bourne has read the report and the legal advice, but I am surprised he does not accept the conclusion. All I was asking Nick to do, as a lawyer, was to look at the letter and the legal advice.

There is a way forward. I went back to my officials and asked for further legal advice. In light of the fact that the committee of which Alun Cairns was a member had not made any recommendations, I said to my officials, 'If the committee had its way, I would not change the Measure at all'. Therefore, I discussed with my officials whether there was another way of moving forward, because of the legal problems. These are not only problems in British law; there are also problems with the European convention on human rights, which I drew to the committee's attention. That convention mentions a number of cases where this can be very sensitive. Therefore, what we decided to do was to insert a clause in the Measure which would go as far as was legally

ag yr oedd yn gyfreithiol bosibl i ni ei wneud. Yr oedd yn gofyn i awdurdodau lleol, wrth iddynt ystyried trafniadaeth, gofio fod ganddynt ymrwymiad i hyrwyddo mynediad i addysg cyfrwng Gymraeg. Mae hynny yn mynd ymhellach na'r hyn yr oedd y pwyllgor am ei wneud, ac mae hefyd yn golygu, am y tro cyntaf, fod awdurdodau lleol yn gorfod ystyried hynny.

O ran y pwynt a wnaeth Alun Ffred, nid yw'r Ceidwadwyr, am ryw reswm, eisiau ei ddeall. Mae patrymau gwahanol o safbwynt y ffordd mae ysgolion yn addysgu Cymraeg mewn gwahanol rannau o Gymru. Gofynnaf i Kirsty Williams edrych ar yr hyn a ddywedodd John Davies, ar ran awdurdodau lleol, wrth y pwyllgor. Soniodd yn benodol am y problemau ym Mhowys a sir Benfro. Dywedodd fod rhoi'r math hwnnw o gyfrifoldeb ar y Llywodraeth yn chwalu'r patrymau sydd yn bodoli eisoes. Golyga hynny y byddai'n bosibl ei wneud mewn ardaloedd trefol, lle mae ysgolion yn agos at ei gilydd, ond o ran patrymau mewn ardaloedd gwledig, lle mae ysgolion yn bell oddi wrth ei gilydd, yr ydych yn dod wyneb yn wyneb â'r broblem y cyfeiriodd Alun Ffred Jones ati—yr ydych yn chwalu rhywbeth a adeiladwyd dros gyfnod o 30 mlynedd.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Can you please wind up, Deputy First Minister?

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Felly, yr unig gasgliad y gallaf ddod iddo yw nad oes gan y Blaid Geidwadol ddiddordeb mewn newid y Mesur. Yr unig ddiddordeb sydd gan y Blaid Geidwadol yw ceisio rhoi'r argraff ei bod yn gryfach ar yr iaith nag unrhyw blaid arall.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** I thank everyone who has contributed to this debate. This part of the learner travel Measure seeks to improve school transport, in particular on the back of the tragic death of Stuart Cunningham-Jones, but it has developed into an issue of priority for the Welsh language. We heard about the various ways in which people interpret it. We opened with Alun Cairns, who highlighted the enormous progress that we have made in Wales, which is uniformly supported across

permissible. It required local authorities, when considering transport issues, to bear in mind that they had a commitment to promote access to Welsh-medium education. That goes further than the committee wished to do, and it also means that, for the first time, local authorities have to take that into account.

To turn to the point raised by Alun Ffred, the Conservatives, for some reason, do not want to understand it. There are different patterns in terms of the way schools provide Welsh-medium education in various parts of Wales. I ask Kirsty Williams to look at what John Davies, on behalf of local authorities, told the committee. He spoke specifically about the problems in Powys in Pembrokeshire. He said that giving Government that responsibility destroyed the patterns which already exist. That means it would be possible to do so in urban areas, where schools are close together, but in terms of patterns in rural areas, where the schools are vast distances apart, you come up against the problem which Alun Ffred Jones outlined—you destroy something that has been built up over a period of 30 years.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. A allwch ddirwyn i ben, os gwelwch yn dda, Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog?

**The Deputy First Minister:** Therefore, the only conclusion I can come to is that the Conservative Party is not interested in changing the Measure. The Conservative Party's only interest is in giving the impression that it is stronger on the language than anyone else.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Diolch i bawb sydd wedi cyfrannu at y ddadl hon. Mae'r rhan hon o'r Mesur teithio gan ddysgwyr yn ceisio gwella cludiant ysgolion, yn arbennig o ganlyniad i farwolaeth drasig Stuart Cunningham-Jones, ond mae wedi datblygu i fod yn fater o flaenoriaeth i'r iaith Gymraeg. Clywsom am y gwahanol ffyrdd y mae pobl yn ei ddehongli. Agorwyd gydag Alun Cairns, a danlinellodd y cynnydd enfawr yr ydym wedi'i wneud yng Nghymru, cynnydd

the Chamber, and the crucial role that Wyn Roberts played in setting the roots for the development of the Welsh language in Wales.

The debate is on whether we keep free travel to Welsh-medium schools discretionary or whether we make it compulsory. We had a debate earlier on school funding, and we heard what happens when things become discretionary—they get lost in the funding fog. As we develop this Measure—one of the first Assembly Measures to become law—we must ensure that there are no grey areas. That is the fundamental principle behind the argument, that the Government accepts that there will be no grey areas and that people will not fall into this trap. However, if they do fall into it, they can revert to law. We all know what happens when you revert to law—it is traumatic for the individuals concerned, it is inordinately expensive and the outcome is never satisfactory.

**Alun Cairns:** I am grateful to Andrew for giving way. Do you agree that the addition that the Minister has made, section 10, is so weak that you could drive a coach and horses through it? He is seeking to replace an unequal law with another unequal law that will just create more ambiguity and more challenges in the courts. In reality, how many parents would make the challenge? They will instead end up sending their children to the nearest English-medium school instead of their children being given the absolute right to a Welsh-medium education.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** You will not be surprised to hear that I agree. I would describe that as a fig leaf to hide the Minister's embarrassment on this subject, because he has had to offer something. We heard a contribution from Jonathan Morgan about the Russell Goodway factor in Cardiff, highlighting how Russell Goodway held back the development of Welsh-medium education here. I have often heard of Plaid Cymru leading the One Wales Government, but I think that on this issue we are seeing the Labour Party leading Plaid Cymru. It is Plaid that has been led up the cul-de-sac of the Welsh language.

a gefnogir ar draws y Siambr, a rôl allweddol Wyn Roberts wrth osod y seiliau ar gyfer datblygiad yr iaith Gymraeg yng Nghymru.

Dadl ydyw ar y cwestiwn a ydym am gadw teithio am ddim i ysgolion Cymraeg yn fater o ddisgresiwn, ynteu a ydym am ei wneud yn orfodol. Cawsom ddadl yn gynharach ar ariannu ysgolion, a chlywsom beth sy'n digwydd pan fydd pethau'n mynd yn fater o ddisgresiwn—maent yn mynd ar goll yn y niwl ariannu. Wrth inni ddatblygu'r Mesur hwn—un o Fesurau cyntaf y Cynulliad i ddod yn gyfraith—rhaid inni sicrhau na fydd dim amwysedd. Dyna'r egwyddor sylfaenol y tu ôl i'r ddadl, fod y Llywodraeth yn derbyn na fydd dim amwysedd ac na fydd pobl yn syrthio i'r fagl hon. Fodd bynnag, os byddant yn syrthio i'r fagl, gallant droi'n ôl at y gyfraith. Gwyddom i gyd yr hyn sy'n digwydd pan drowch yn ôl at y gyfraith—mae'n drawmatig i'r unigolion sy'n gysylltiedig, mae'n afresymol o ddrud ac nid yw'r canlyniad byth yn foddhaol.

**Alun Cairns:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Andrew am ildio. A ydych yn cytuno bod yr ychwanegiad y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i wneud, adran 10, mor wan fel y gallech yrru ceffyl a throl drwyddo? Mae'n ceisio disodli deddf anghyfartal gan ddeddf anghyfartal arall na fydd ond yn creu mwy o amwysedd a mwy o heriau yn y llysoedd. Mewn gwirionedd, faint o rieni a fyddai'n herio'r drefn? Yr hyn a wnânt yn hytrach fydd anfon eu plant i'r ysgol Saesneg agosaf yn hytrach na bod eu plant yn cael yr hawl absoliwt i addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Ni fyddwch yn synnu clywed fy mod yn cytuno. Byddwn i'n disgrifio hynny fel deilen ffigys i guddio embaras y Gweinidog ynglŷn â'r pwnc hwn, oherwydd mae wedi gorfod cynnig rhywbeth. Clywsom gyfraniad gan Jonathan Morgan am y ffactor Russell Goodway yng Nghaerdydd, gan dynnu sylw at y ffordd y llesteiriodd Russell Goodway ddatblygiad addysg Gymraeg yma. Yr wyf wedi clywed yn aml fod Plaid Cymru'n arwain Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un, ond ar y mater hwn credaf ein bod yn gweld y Blaid Lafur yn arwain Plaid Cymru. Plaid sydd wedi ei harwain i fyny heol hosan yr iaith Gymraeg.

Kirsty Williams, from a rural constituency, emphasised the dilemma in relation to distance and Angela also came in on that point.

**Kirsty Williams:** Do you not think that the stance that Plaid Cymru Members have taken today is highly ironic given that they are well-practised at using the Welsh language for their own political ends and have done so for many years? The Minister says that he was willing to talk to parties outside committee to achieve a consensus on this; he did not mention that in committee a fortnight ago. He offered to do so with regard to other amendments and improvements that we sought to make—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Is this an intervention or a speech?

**Kirsty Williams:** He did not offer that in committee last week and you can check the record. He made no such offer.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** I concur, Kirsty. That just demonstrates the weakness of the Minister's argument. He is all over the place on this. He is being led by the Labour Party on this issue, and is having to fall in line while his other colleagues help the One Wales Government.

Kirsty gave us an example of what happens in a rural constituency such as hers. Brecon High School's capacity to develop Welsh-medium education is shrinking. Pupils either have to travel to Ystradfellte or Builth Wells, both of which are some considerable distance from Brecon, and that will not help parents to access that opportunity, will it?

Jonathan Morgan highlighted that there is a problem not just in rural schools, but in urban schools also, particularly in Cardiff. Minister, you have shown a complete lack of understanding of how to deliver this. In the committee, we saw the tenacity and conviction of Ann Jones, who backed the amendment on faith schools. Sadly Ann will not be at the committee meeting tomorrow; the Labour presiding-officer-in-waiting, Jeff

Pwysleisiodd Kirsty Williams, o etholaeth wledig, y cyfyng-gyngor ynglŷn â phellter, a rhoddodd Angela hithau ei phig i mewn ar y pwynt hwnnw.

**Kirsty Williams:** Onid ydych yn meddwl bod safbwynt Aelodau Plaid Cymru heddiw yn hynod o eironig o gofio'u bod wedi hen arfer â defnyddio'r iaith Gymraeg at eu dibenion gwleidyddol eu hunain ac wedi gwneud hynny ers blynnyddoedd lawer? Dywed y Gweinidog ei fod yn barod i siarad â phleidiau y tu allan i'r pwyllgor i sicrhau consensws ar hyn; ni soniodd am hynny yn y pwyllgor bythefnos yn ôl. Cynigiodd wneud hynny mewn cysylltiad â gwelliannau eraill yr oeddem am geisio'u gwneud—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Ai ymyriad yw hyn ynteu araith?

**Kirsty Williams:** Ni chynigiodd hynny yn y pwyllgor yr wythnos diwethaf, a gallwch edrych yn y cofnod. Ni wnaeth ddim cynnig o'r fath.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Yr wyf yn cyd-fynd, Kirsty. Dyna ddangos gwendid dadl y Gweinidog. Mae mewn llanast llwyr ynglŷn â hyn. Mae'n cael ei arwain gan y Blaid Lafur ar y mater hwn, ac yn gorfod mynd i'w le tra mae ei gyd-Aelodau eraill yn helpu Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un.

Rhoddodd Kirsty enghraifft inni o'r hyn sy'n digwydd mewn etholaeth wledig fel ei hetholaeth hi. Mae gallu Ysgol Uwchradd Aberhonddu i ddatblygu addysg Gymraeg yn crebachu. Rhaid i ddisgyblion deithio naill ai i Ystradfellte neu i Lanfair-ym-Muallt, dwy dref sydd gryn bellter o Aberhonddu, ac ni fydd hynny'n helpu rhieni i fanteisio ar y cyfle hwnnw, na fydd?

Tynnodd Jonathan Morgan sylw at y ffaith fod problem nid yn unig mewn ysgolion gwledig, ond mewn ysgolion trefol hefyd, yn enwedig yng Nghaerdydd. Weinidog, yr ydych wedi dangos diffyg dealltwriaeth llwyr o'r ffordd i gyflawni hyn. Yn y pwyllgor, gwelsom ddycnwch ac argyhoeddiad Ann Jones, a oedd yn cefnogi'r gwelliant ar ysgolion ffydd. Yn anffodus, ni fydd Ann yng nghyfarfod y pwyllgor yfory; bydd



Cuthbert, will be taking her place. Hopefully, common sense will prevail, but, sadly, I am afraid that the Labour whip will work in your favour tomorrow, Minister. *[Interruption.]*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Kirsty Williams, please either ask to make an intervention or do not speak when you are sitting down.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** The issue is plain and simple: do you support the ability of parents to access Welsh-medium schools through the learner travel Measure? It is not rocket science. The motion sets it out plain, clear and simple on the agenda today. Given the level of Plaid Cymru's engagement on this debate—I think that only two speakers participated—

**Gareth Jones:** Will you give way?

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Yes, go on.

**Gareth Jones:** I am eternally grateful to you, Andrew. My intervention is also about being plain and simple. You started by referring to this discretion that is creating havoc with five-year-olds, as Angela pointed out—that is what we have now. However, being plain and simple, I have section 10 in front of me and I would like to know what you do not understand about the sea change from the discretionary state of affairs that we currently have to placing a compulsion on authorities and Ministers, and not parents, as Alun Cairns said? We are talking about Ministers getting involved and telling authorities how things should be and laying down the law to that extent. I am no solicitor, for which I am thankful, but you need to go back to your textbooks.

4.20 p.m.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** It is always good to respond to a like-minded Conservative. Section 10 is too opaque and it creates too much of a grey area and does not place a compulsion on the local authority. That is coming through loud and clear from the organisations speaking about this Measure. It is you, and your party, who do not understand that, Gareth. That is emphasised, as my

darpar lywydd Llafur, Jeff Cuthbert, yn cymryd ei lle. Bydd synnwyr cyffredin yn ennill y dydd, gobeithio, ond, ysywaeth, mae arnaf ofn y bydd y chwip Llafur yn gweithio o'ch plaid yfory, Weinidog. *[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Kirsty Williams, naill ai gofynnwch am wneud ymyriad ynteu peidiwch â siarad ar eich eistedd, os gwelwch yn dda.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Mae'r cwestiwn yn blaen ac yn syml: a ydych yn cefnogi gallu rhieni i gael mynediad i ysgolion Cymraeg trwy'r Mesur teithio gan ddysgwyr? Nid yw hyn yn gymhleth o gwbl. Mae'r cynnig yn ei osod allan yn blaen, yn eglur ac yn syml ar yr agenda heddiw. O gofio lefel ymroddiad Plaid Cymru i'r ddadl hon—dim ond dau siaradwr a gymerodd ran, mi gredaf—

**Gareth Jones:** A wnewch chi ildio?

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Gwnaf, ymlaen â chi.

**Gareth Jones:** Yr wyf yn fythol ddiolchgar ichi, Andrew. Mae a wnelo fy ymyriad i hefyd â bod yn blaen ac yn syml. Dechreuasoch drwy gyfeirio at y disgrisiwn hwn sy'n creu hafog gyda phlant pumlwydd, fel y dywedodd Angela—dyna sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, i fod yn blaen ac yn syml, mae adran 10 gennyf o fy mlaen a hoffwn wybod beth nad ydych yn ei ddeall ynghylch y newid sylfaenol o'r sefyllfa ddewisol sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd i osod gorfodaeth ar awdurdodau a Gweinidogion, ac nid rhieni, fel y dywedodd Alun Cairns? Yr ydym yn sôn am Weinidogion yn dweud wrth awdurdodau sut y dylai pethau fod ac yn gosod y ddeddf i'r graddau hynny. Nid wyf yn gyfreithiwr, a diolch am hynny, ond mae angen i chi fynd yn ôl at eich gwerslyfrau.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Mae bob amser yn braf ymateb i Geidwadwr o anian debyg. Mae adran 10 yn rhy niwlog ac mae'n creu gormod o dir llwyd ac nid yw'n rhoi gorfodaeth ar yr awdurdod lleol. Mae hynny'n dod drwodd yn eglur ac yn uchel gan y cyrff sy'n siarad am y Mesur hwn. Chi, a'ch plaid, sydd heb ddeall hynny, Gareth. Pwysleisir hynny, fel y dywedodd fy nghyd-

colleague Angela Burns said, by Leanne Wood's press release—which was most probably drafted by Plaid's central office—which tries to cover Plaid's embarrassment. You will be found out; the weakness of the Minister on this is evident. This motion seeks to safeguard parents' and children's interests, but, above all, it seeks to safeguard the Welsh educational establishment. Shame on Plaid that it is not prepared to stand up for it.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The proposal is to agree amendment 1. Does any Member object? I see that there is objection. In that case, I will defer all voting on this item until voting time.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisiau tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.  
Votes deferred until voting time.*

## **Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives Debate**

### **Yr Argyfwng Tai The Housing Crisis**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1 and 2 in the name of Carwyn Jones and amendments 3 and 4 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

**Mark Isherwood:** I propose that

*this Assembly recognises that tackling the housing crisis is essential to the wellbeing of Wales and its people. (NDM3979)*

I call on the Assembly to recognise that tackling the housing crisis is essential to the wellbeing of Wales and its people. This motion was intended to draw cross-party support as a consensual motion, following the report on affordable housing in Wales published last week by a task and finish group chaired by Sue Essex, a Labour Minister in previous Assembly Governments. When Sue Essex launched the report last week, she had projected on a screen beside her the report's key message. It read:

'the current crisis serves to remind us that the bedrock of affordable housing in sustainable communities is essential to the wellbeing of

Aelod Angela Burns, gan ddatganiad Leanne Wood i'r wasg—a ddrafftwyd, mae'n debygol, gan swyddfa ganolog Plaid—sy'n ceisio cuddio embaras Plaid. Cewch eich dal; mae gwendid y Gweinidog ar hyn yn amlwg. Mae'r cynnig hwn yn ceisio diogelu buddiannau rhieni a phlant, ond, yn anad dim, mae'n ceisio diogelu sefydliad addysgol Cymru. Rhag cywilydd i Plaid nad yw'n barod i sefyll drosto.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Y cynnig yw derbyn gwelliant 1. A oes gwrthwynebiad? Gwela fod. Felly, gohiriaf y pleidleisio dan yr eitem hon tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 2 yn enw Carwyn Jones a gwelliannau 3 a 4 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

**Mark Isherwood:** Cynigiaf hyn

*mae'r Cynulliad hwn yn cydnabod bod mynd i'r afael â'r argyfwng tai yn hanfodol i les Cymru a'i phobl. (NDM3979)*

Galwaf ar y Cynulliad i gydnabod bod mynd i'r afael â'r argyfwng tai yn hanfodol i les Cymru a'i phobl. Bwriad y cynnig hwn oedd ennyn cefnogaeth drawsbleidiol fel cynnig cydsyniol, yn dilyn yr adroddiad ar dai fforddiadwy yng Nghymru a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos diwethaf gan grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen dan gadeiryddiaeth Sue Essex, Gweinidog Llafur mewn Llywodraethau Cynulliad yn y gorffennol. Pan lansiodd Sue Essex yr adroddiad yr wythnos diwethaf, yr oedd neges allweddol yr adroddiad ganddi wedi'i ddangos ar sgrin wrth ei hochr. Dyma a ddywedai:

mae'r argyfwng presennol yn ein hatgoffa bod y sylfaen o dai fforddiadwy mewn cymunedau cynaliadwy yn hanfodol i les

Wales and its people’.

Given the warm words of support for the report across the Chamber last week, it is beneath contempt that Labour should table an amendment today seeking to delete the words ‘housing crisis’ from the motion. Housing is key to social justice and regeneration, and Wales has a housing crisis. Every housing body in Wales has been saying so for years. Only Labour has not been listening. Supported by Plaid Cymru, it played the same silly game when it sabotaged our motion on 5 March, which called on the Welsh Assembly Government to take urgent and practical action to address the growing housing crisis. Once again, it is putting a proverbial two fingers up to housing organisations and to the tens of thousands trapped on housing waiting lists across Wales.

We welcome the report of the affordable housing task and finish group, and are pleased to support both Liberal Democrat amendments today. We commend the Assembly Government on commissioning the Essex report. After all, as the Deputy Minister reminded me last week, I had called for this report, and, as I stated last week, I thanked her for consulting me on the composition of the task and finish group. We also welcome the establishment of a mortgage rescue scheme—something that I have also been calling for. However, I would be grateful for clarification on whether, as the Deputy Minister told me in the Chamber, this is new money for an existing scheme and does not therefore require prior agreement from mortgage lenders, without whom no such scheme can operate. Furthermore, housing associations have raised concerns that, as is the case with the proposals for the homebuy low-cost home ownership scheme, they were not consulted. They welcome the money, but warn that the scheme could backfire if not managed correctly. The housing movement needs discussion on the guidance, but it tells me that the Assembly Government has not spoken to it. It applies strict criteria before agreeing to rescue anyone’s mortgage. We cannot commend the Assembly Government on its failure to respond to calls for urgent action to tackle the housing crisis, as it has grown over the last

Cymru a’i phobl.

Gan gofio’r geiriau gwresog o gefnogaeth i’r adroddiad ar draws y Siambr yr wythnos diwethaf, mae’n ddirmygus tu hwnt fod Llafur yn cyflwyno gwelliant heddiw sy’n ceisio dileu’r geiriau ‘argyfwng tai’ o’r cynnig. Mae tai yn allweddol i gyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac adfywio, ac mae yng Nghymru argyfwng tai. Mae pob corff tai yng Nghymru yn dweud hyn ers blynnyddoedd, ond nid yw Llafur wedi bod yn gwranddo. Gyda chefnogaeth Plaid Cymru, chwaraeodd yr un gêm wirion pan danseiliodd ein cynnig ar 5 Mawrth, a oedd yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gymryd camau brys ac ymarferol i ddelio â’r argyfwng tai cynyddol. Unwaith eto, mae’n codi dau fys ffigurol ar y mudiadau tai ac ar y degau o filoedd sydd wedi eu dal ar restrï aros am dai ledled Cymru.

Croesawn adroddiad y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar dai fforddiadwy, ac yr ydym yn falch cefnogi dau welliant y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol heddiw. Cymeradwywn Lywodraeth y Cynulliad am gomisiynu adroddiad Essex. Wedi’r cwbl, fel yr atgoffodd y Dirprwy Weinidog fi yr wythnos diwethaf, yr oeddwn wedi galw am yr adroddiad hwn, ac fel y dywedais yr wythnos diwethaf, diolchais iddi am ymgynghori â mi ynglŷn â chyfansoddiad y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen. Yr ydym hefyd yn croesawu sefydlu cynllun achub morgesiaiu—rhywbeth arall yr wyf wedi bod yn galw amdano. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn ddiolchgar am eglurhad ai arian newydd, fel y dywedodd y Dirprwy Weinidog wrthyf yn y Siambr, yw hwn ar gyfer cynllun sy’n bodoli, ac nad oes arno angen cytundeb ymlaen llaw felly gan fenthycwyr morgesi, na all yr un cynllun o’r fath weithio hebddynt. At hynny, mae cymdeithasau tai wedi mynegi pryderon nad ymgynghorwyd â hwy, fel gyda’r cynigion ar gyfer y cynllun cymorth prynu perchentyaeth cost isel. Maent yn croesawu’r arian, ond yn rhybuddio y gallai’r cynllun ôl-danio os na chaiff ei reoli’n iawn. Mae ar y mudiad tai angen trafodaeth ar y cyfarwyddyd, ond dywed wrthyf nad yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi siarad ag ef. Mae’n pennu meini prawf caeth cyn cytuno i achub morgais neb. Ni allwn gymeradwyo Llywodraeth y Cynulliad am fetu ymateb i

decade, and cannot therefore support Labour's cynical amendment 2. As Sue Essex stated last week, affordable housing is about delivery to meet housing need as that need changes.

Research commissioned by Community Housing Cymru in 2007 found that 57 per cent of people considered social housing a priority issue, compared with just 15 per cent in 2002. The Assembly Government must take urgent and practical action to address the growing housing crisis in Wales, drawing fully on the expertise available within the independent and voluntary and charitable sectors. The number of households needing accommodation in Wales is forecast to increase by 12 per cent over the next decade. However, since devolution, the number of people in Wales receiving Government help to buy their first house has fallen by two thirds. Wales has the worst housing conditions in the UK, and children living in poor housing are at a far higher risk of ill health and educational underachievement.

The Joseph Rowntree Foundation report on rural housing in Wales, which was launched last month, found that the current and projected supply of new affordable housing will not be sufficient, that a seismic upward shift in provision is required to meet the need, and that the limited supply of housing and the difficulty of getting onto the property ladder is threatening the social and cultural sustainability of communities in rural Wales. Housing Forum Cymru has stated that housing is creating a more divided Wales and that the consequences for social cohesion are enormous. The Chartered Institute of Housing has stated that an adequate supply of affordable housing is key to creating sustainable communities. The Confederation of British Industry and Business in the Community have both stated that new housing is a key factor in attracting investment into Wales and in retaining the workforce.

However, the supply of new housing for rent or low-cost ownership has been slashed as

alwadau am weithredu ar frys i ddelio â'r argyfwng tai, oherwydd mae wedi tyfu dros y degawd diwethaf, ac felly ni allwn gefnogi'r gwelliant 2 sinigaidd gan Lafur. Fel y dywedodd Sue Essex yr wythnos diwethaf, ystyr tai fforddiadwy yw darparu i ateb yr angen am dai wrth i'r angen hwnnw newid.

Darganfu ymchwil a gomisiynwyd gan Gartrefi Cymunedol Cymru yn 2007 fod 57 y cant o bobl yn ystyried bod tai cymdeithasol yn fater o flaenoriaeth, o'u cymharu â 15 y cant yn unig yn 2002. Rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad gymryd camau brys ac ymarferol i roi sylw i'r argyfwng tai cynyddol yng Nghymru, gan fanteisio'n llawn ar yr arbenigedd sydd ar gael yn y sectorau annibynnol a gwirfoddol ac elusennol. Rhagwelir y bydd nifer y teuluoedd yng Nghymru y mae arnynt angen lle i fyw yn cynyddu 12 y cant dros y degawd nesaf. Fodd bynnag, ers datganoli mae nifer y bobl yng Nghymru sy'n cael cymorth gan y Llywodraeth i brynu eu tŷ cyntaf wedi gostwng ddwy ran o dair. Yng Nghymru y mae'r amodau tai gwaethaf yn y Deyrnas Unedig, ac mae plant sy'n byw mewn tai gwael lawer yn fwy tebygol o gael iechyd gwael a thangyflawni'n addysgol.

Darganfu adroddiad Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree ar dai gwledig yng Nghymru, a lansiwyd fis diwethaf, na fydd y cyflenwad cyfredol a rhagamcanedig o dai fforddiadwy newydd yn ddigonol, bod angen cynnydd mawr yn y ddarpariaeth i ateb yr angen, a bod y cyflenwad cyfyngedig o dai a'r anhawster i gael troed ar yr ysgol eiddo yn bygwth cynaliadwyedd cymdeithasol a diwylliannol cymunedau yn y Gymru wledig. Mae Fforwm Tai Cymru wedi dweud bod tai yn creu Cymru fwy rhanedig a bod canlyniadau aruthrol i gydlynid cymdeithasol. Mae'r Sefydliad Tai Siartredig wedi dweud bod cyflenwad digonol o dai fforddiadwy yn allweddol i greu cymunedau cynaliadwy. Mae Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain a Busnes yn y Gymuned ill dau wedi dweud bod tai newydd yn ffactor allweddol i ddenu buddsoddiad i Gymru ac i gadw'r gweithlu.

Fodd bynnag, mae'r cyflenwad tai newydd ar rent neu ar gyfer perchentyaeth cost isel

waiting lists have increased. Housing organisations state that fewer homes are now being built in Wales than at any time since the second world war. The Assembly Government's social housing budget is still smaller than that inherited from the Conservative Government in 1997. Despite a rise in repossessions and waiting lists, there is only one affordable dwelling for every four then being provided. Community Housing Cymru has indicated that housing associations can raise £112 million extra to support an expanded development programme. That was supported in the Essex report. Housing associations must be given the freedom to deliver this over the next three years.

As the Essex report also states:

'Whilst the commitment to an additional 6,500 affordable homes between 2007-2011 is welcome, we think this is unlikely to be sufficient to fully address needs.'

Even this modest commitment is looking increasingly less achievable. The programmes of many housing associations over the next few years were to come out of section 106 agreements. However, they tell me that developers are pulling out. This is but one symptom of the so-called credit crunch; the International Monetary Fund has declared that the UK's banking system is the system most exposed to low-quality sub-prime lending in the world. Housing associations that have successfully assisted homeowners on section 106 schemes with a mixture of open market, rental, and low-cost properties report a growing reluctance by mortgage lenders to provide mortgages for this type of scheme. The cost to housing associations of borrowing to fund schemes is rising, further compromising the affordability of developments. Of course, the credit crunch should have been planned for. It was the almost inevitable outcome of the Government's economic policy, about which many, including me, have been warning for several years—often to laughter from the other side of the Chamber.

wedi'i gwtogi'n sylweddol wrth i restrï aros gynyddu. Dywed mudiadau tai fod llai o dai'n cael eu hadeiladu yng Nghymru'n awr nag ar unrhyw adeg ers yr ail ryfel byd. Mae cyllideb tai cymdeithasol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn dal yn llai nag a etifeddwyd oddi wrth y Llywodraeth Geidwadol yn 1997. Er y cynnydd mewn adfeddiannu a rhestrï aros, un annedd fforddiadwy yn unig sydd ar gael am bob pedwar a ddarperid bryd hynny. Mae Cartrefi Cymunedol Cymru wedi dweud y gall cymdeithasau tai godi £112 miliwn yn ychwanegol i gefnogi rhaglen ddatblygu ehangach. Cefnogwyd hynny yn adroddiad Essex. Rhaid rhoi'r rhyddid i gymdeithasau tai wneud hyn dros y tair blynedd nesaf.

Fel y dywed adroddiad Essex hefyd:

Er y croesewir yr ymrwymiad i ychwanegu 6,500 o gartrefi fforddiadwy rhwng 2007 a 2011, credwn fod hyn yn annhebygol o fod yn ddigon i ddiwallu'r anghenion yn llawn.

Mae hyd yn oed yr ymrwymiad cymedrol hwn yn edrych yn llai a llai posibl i'w gyflawni. Yr oedd rhaglenni nifer o gymdeithasau tai dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf i fod i ddod allan o gytundebau adran 106. Fodd bynnag, dywedant wrthyf fod datblygwyr yn tynnu allan. Un syptom yn unig yw hyn o'r argyfwng credyd bondigrybwyll; mae'r Gronfa Ariannol Ryngwladol wedi dweud mai cyfundrefn fancio'r Deyrnas Unedig yw'r gyfundrefn fwyaf agored yn y byd i is-fenthyca o ansawdd isel. Mae cymdeithasau tai sydd wedi llwyddo i gynorthwyo perchennogion ar gynlluniau adran 106 gyda chymysgedd o eiddo'r farchnad agored, rhentu, a chost isel yn dweud bod benthychwyr morgeisi'n mynd yn fwyfwy cyndyn i ddarparu morgeisi ar gyfer y math hwn o gynllun. Mae'r gost yn cynyddu i gymdeithasau tai fenthyca i dalu am gynlluniau, gan beryglu fforddiadwyedd datblygiadau ymhellach. Wrth gwrs, dylid bod wedi cynllunio ar gyfer yr argyfwng credyd. Yn anochel bron, dyna oedd canlyniad polisi economaidd y Llywodraeth, ac y mae llawer, a minnau yn eu plith, wedi bod yn rhybuddio am hyn ers blynnyddoedd lawer—a hynny'n aml i sw'n chwerthin o ochr arall y Siambr.

We need a flexible range of low-cost home-ownership schemes, not just the homebuy scheme, which reflect the successful experience of housing associations in developing stand-alone schemes. Shared ownership does work for some housing associations, but it would work better with social housing grant. Further, homebuy funding must be separate to that for social rent, recognising that there are two affordable housing markets: social for rent and intermediate for purchase. England has recognised that the intermediate housing market need cannot be met without social housing grant; Wales has not. This cannot and should not continue.

Housing associations tell me that they could increase the supply of affordable housing if they could procure private sector housing from the housebuilders affected by the credit crunch. They are receiving many calls from developers wanting to do business. However, the Assembly Government states that it will permit this only if the room sizes meet the Welsh housing quality standard. When I said last week that if new build houses are of good enough quality for private sector sale, they are good enough for people in the social and intermediate market, the Deputy Minister disagreed. I do not accept that being trapped on a housing waiting list is preferable to having a home of your own that meets stringent mortgageable standards.

We need a change in mindset if housing associations are to act now, when needed. It is simply not good enough to pass the buck to local authorities, expecting them to get a quart out of a pint pot at a time of huge resource pressure across the public, private, and voluntary sectors. As the Essex report states, we need robust evidence about the number of homes needed, and we then need a robust and funded strategy to deliver that.

4.30 p.m.

Reference has been made in the past—and I am sure that it will be made today—to the

Mae arnom angen amrywiaeth hyblyg o gynlluniau perchentyaeth cost isel, nid y cynllun cymorth prynu yn unig, a fydd yn adlewyrchu profiad llwyddiannus cymdeithasau tai wrth ddatblygu cynlluniau annibynnol. Mae rhan-berchenogaeth yn gweithio i rai cymdeithasau tai, ond byddai'n gweithio'n well gyda grant tai cymdeithasol. At hynny, rhaid i gyllid cymorth prynu fod ar wahân i'r cyllid ar gyfer rhentu cymdeithasol, gan gydnabod bod yna ddwy farchnad tai fforddiadwy: cymdeithasol ar gyfer rhentu a chanolraddol ar gyfer prynu. Mae Lloegr wedi cydnabod na ellir diwallu angen y farchnad tai canolraddol heb grant tai cymdeithasol; nid yw Cymru wedi gwneud hynny. Ni all hyn barhau ac ni ddylai.

Dywed cymdeithasau tai wrthyf y gallent gynyddu'r cyflenwad o dai fforddiadwy pe gallent brynu tai'r sector preifat oddi wrth yr adeiladwyr tai y mae'r argyfwng credyd yn effeithio arnynt. Cânt lawer o alwadau gan ddatblygwyr sydd eisiau gwneud busnes. Fodd bynnag, dywed Llywodraeth y Cynulliad y bydd yn caniatáu hyn dim ond os bydd maint yr ystafelloedd yn cyrraedd safon ansawdd tai Cymru. Yr oedd y Dirprwy Weinidog yn anghytuno pan ddywedais yr wythnos diwethaf fod tai newydd, sydd o ansawdd digon da i'w gwerthu yn y sector preifat, yn ddigon da i bobl yn y farchnad gymdeithasol a chanolraddol. Nid wyf yn derbyn bod cael eich dal ar restr aros am dŷ yn well na chael eich cartref eich hun sy'n cyrraedd safonau llym morgeiswyr.

Mae angen inni newid meddylfryd os yw cymdeithasau tai am gael gweithredu'n awr, tra mae angen. Nid yw'n ddigon da taflu'r baich ar awdurdodau lleol, a disgwyl iddynt hwy gael chwart allan o bot peint ar adeg o bwysau aruthrol ar adnoddau drwy'r sectorau cyhoeddus, preifat a gwirfoddol. Fel y dywed adroddiad Essex, mae arnom angen tystiolaeth gadarn am nifer y cartrefi angenrheidiol, ac wedyn mae arnom angen strategaeth gadarn, wedi'i hariannu, i gyflawni hynny.

Cyfeiriwyd yn y gorffennol—ac yr wyf yn siŵr y cyfeirir heddiw—at yr argyfwng tai

last housing crisis of the early 1990s. However, during 1992-93, an extra £35 million of social housing grant funding was made available in Wales. We need a new regulatory framework for housing associations, but we also need a comparable Assembly Government funding response to deal with today's housing crisis.

Priority housing need allocations, at a time of housing shortage, are causing friction in our local communities, and I know that every one of you will have had cases referred to you from your localities. At a time of housing pressure and rising numbers of mortgage repossessions, we need nothing less than an emergency housing programme for Wales. As the authors of the Essex report told me last week, an early start is needed and all agencies and all sectors need to work together.

**The Deputy Minister for Housing (Jocelyn Davies):** I propose the following amendments in the name of Carwyn Jones. Amendment 1: delete 'housing crisis' and replace with:

*impact of the credit crunch on housing.*

Amendment 2: add at the end of the motion:

*, and commends the Government for its action to date including establishing a mortgage rescue scheme and commissioning the Essex report.*

**Peter Black:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 3: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*welcomes the affordable housing task and finish group's report and calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to put in place a measurable action plan on how it will deliver on the recommendations of the report.*

Amendment 4: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to*

diwethaf ddechrau'r 1990au. Fodd bynnag, yn ystod 1992-93 darparwyd £35 miliwn o gyllid ychwanegol ar gyfer y grant tai cymdeithasol yng Nghymru. Mae arnom angen fframwaith rheoleiddio newydd ar gyfer cymdeithasau tai, ond mae arnom angen ymateb tebyg hefyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ar ffurf cyllid i ddelio â'r argyfwng tai presennol.

Mae dyraniadau anghenion tai blaenoriaethol, ar adeg pan yw tai yn brin, yn achosi gwrthdaro yn ein cymunedau lleol, a gwn y bydd achosion wedi dod i sylw pob un ohonoch o'ch ardaloedd. Ar adeg o bwysau ar dai ac o adfeddiannu nifer cynyddol o dai morgais, mae arnom angen dim llai na rhaglen dai frys i Gymru. Fel y dywedodd awduron adroddiad Essex wrthyf yr wythnos diwethaf, mae angen dechrau'n fuan ac mae angen i'r holl asiantaethau a'r holl sectorau gydweithio.

**Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Dai (Jocelyn Davies):** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Carwyn Jones. Gwelliant 1: dileu 'â'r argyfwng tai' a rhoi yn eu lle:

*ag effaith y wasgfa gredyd ar dai.*

Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*, ac mae'n canmol y Llywodraeth am yr hyn y mae wedi'i wneud hyd yma gan gynnwys sefydlu cynllun achub morgeisi a chomisiynu adroddiad Essex.*

**Peter Black:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 3: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn croesawu adroddiad y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar dai fforddiadwy ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i roi cynllun gweithredu mesuradwy ar waith ynghylch sut y bydd yn cyflawni argymhellion yr adroddiad.*

Gwelliant 4: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i*

*report at the earliest possible opportunity on how they will monitor the number of new affordable properties built in Wales.*

I will take up a point that Mark Isherwood referred to with regard to amendment 1, because, like him, I am slightly disappointed at the way in which this amendment has been phrased. Just because the housing crisis is caused by the credit crunch does not make it any less of a crisis. There is a crisis facing us, and we must recognise that. There has been a crisis for some time in Wales and no doubt that crisis will continue as long as the credit crunch continues, but it is not just the credit crunch that has caused that crisis. There have been issues with affordable housing for many years, in rural and urban Wales, and there is clearly a need for the Assembly Government to take action to deal with that.

I want this speech to be constructive and positive, therefore, to be fair, I will note that the Assembly Government has taken some action and that some things have been done, but much more needs to be done. We are coming to the end of the first year of the present Assembly Government, and it is a year during which it has put in place strategies, promises and working groups, but it now needs to start delivering on what it has promised. We need to start moving forward in terms of meeting the targets that the One Wales Government has set, and, in particular, that relating to the 6,500 new affordable homes, which have been promised as part of that 'One Wales' agreement.

The Deputy Minister will know of my scepticism about how we can measure whether or not those 6,500 homes have been built. According to figures from the Wales Audit Office, either 500 or 1,200 new social houses were built in the last year for which figures are available. It is impossible to determine exactly how many houses have been built under section 106, on which the Assembly Government is increasingly relying to meet the gap between what it can afford to provide and what needs to be provided.

*adrodd cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl ynghylch sut y byddant yn monitro nifer yr eiddo fforddiadwy newydd a adeiladir yng Nghymru.*

Af ar ôl pwynt y cyfeiriodd Mark Isherwood ato mewn cysylltiad â gwelliant 1, oherwydd, fel yntau, yr wyf wedi fy siomi braidd gan y modd y mae'r gwelliant hwn wedi'i eirio. Nid yw'r ffaith fod yr argyfwng tai wedi'i achosi gan y wasgfa gredyd yn golygu ei fod yn llai o argyfwng. Mae argyfwng yn ein hwynebu, a rhaid inni gydnabod hynny. Mae argyfwng ers cryn amser yng Nghymru, ac mae'n sicr y bydd yr argyfwng hwnnw'n parhau cyhyd ag y bydd y wasgfa gredyd yn parhau, ond nid y wasgfa gredyd yn unig sydd wedi achosi'r argyfwng hwnnw. Cafwyd anawsterau gyda thai fforddiadwy ers blynyddoedd lawer, yng Nghymru wledig a Chymru drefol, ac mae'n amlwg fod angen i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad gymryd camau i ddelio â hynny.

Dymunaf i'r araith hon fod yn adeiladol ac yn gadarnhaol, felly, er mwyn bod yn deg, sylwaf fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cymryd rhai camau a bod rhai pethau wedi'u gwneud, ond mae angen gwneud llawer mwy. Yr ydym yn nesáu at ddiwedd blwyddyn gyntaf y Llywodraeth Gynulliad bresennol, ac yn ystod y flwyddyn honno mae wedi gwneud addewidion ac wedi sefydlu strategaethau a gweithgorau, ond mae angen yn awr iddi ddechrau cyflawni'r hyn y mae wedi'i addo. Mae angen inni ddechrau symud ymlaen o ran cyrraedd y targedau a osodwyd gan Lywodraeth Cymru'n Un ac, yn benodol, hwnnw'n ymwneud â'r 6,500 o gartrefi fforddiadwy newydd sydd wedi'u haddo fel rhan o'r cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un' hwnnw.

Bydd y Dirprwy Weinidog yn gwybod am fy amheuan am y modd y gallwn fesur a yw'r 6,500 hynny o gartrefi wedi'u codi ai peidio. Yn ôl ffigurau gan Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru, adeiladwyd un ai 500 neu 1,200 o dai cymdeithasol newydd yn y flwyddyn ddiwethaf y mae ffigurau ar gael ar ei chyfer. Mae'n amhosibl pennu union nifer y tai sydd wedi'u codi dan adran 106, ac y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn dibynnu fwyfwy arni i lenwi'r bwloch rhwng yr hyn y gall fforddio'i ddarparu a'r hyn y mae angen ei ddarparu.



The Welsh Liberal Democrats have carried out our own survey of local authorities. We asked them how many houses they have built in the last five years under section 106, and the answer that came back to us was they had built around 1,800, but it may be slightly more than that because not every local authority has been able to supply figures. Therefore, we think that around 2,000 affordable homes under planning gain have been built in the last five years. That pace needs to be picked up if we are to get anywhere near the 6,500 homes mark.

The pace of social housing new build, built through the social housing grant or by local councils also needs to be picked up, because the number of houses being built are still being balanced out and, in many cases, overshadowed by the number of houses being sold through the right to buy and the number of houses that are being demolished because they are not fit for purpose or can no longer be used for the purposes that they were built for, because of the vagaries of demand.

There is no general gain in terms of the number of affordable housing in Wales at the moment. We are clearly way off the target in the first year of the four years that the Assembly Government has to meet the target. Therefore, we have a lot to do, and I hope that the Assembly Government is able to do it. I hope that the target can be achieved, but what we need, above everything else—and this is referred to in our first amendment—now that we have the Essex report, or the affordable housing task and finish group's report, as the Table Office made us call it, and the strategies are being into place, is the Assembly Government to put in place a measurable action plan. We need to have a means of holding the Assembly Government to account for exactly how many homes are being built—we are still waiting for the figures on that—and we can then start to determine exactly how it is doing in relation to the targets that it has set for itself. That is yet to come.

Yr ydym ni, Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, wedi gwneud ein harolygon ein hunain o awdurdodau lleol. Gofynasom iddynt faint o dai y maent wedi'u codi yn y pum mlynedd diwethaf dan adran 106, a'r ateb a gawsom oedd eu bod wedi adeiladu tua 1,800, ond gall hynny fod ychydig yn fwy gan nad yw pob awdurdod lleol wedi gallu darparu ffigurau. Felly, credwn fod tua 2,000 o dai fforddiadwy wedi'u codi fel rhan o fantais gynllunio yn y pum mlynedd diwethaf. Mae angen symud yn gyflymach na hynny os ydym i ddod rywle'n agos at gyrraedd y nod o 6,500 o gartrefi.

Mae angen symud yn gyflymach wrth adeiladu tai cymdeithasol newydd, drwy'r grant tai cymdeithasol neu drwy gynghorau lleol, gan fod nifer y tai sy'n cael eu codi'n dal i gael ei gydbwyso, a'i orbwyso mewn llawer achos, gan nifer y tai sy'n cael eu gwerthu drwy'r hawl i brynu, a nifer y tai sy'n cael eu dymchwel am eu bod yn anaddas neu am na ellir eu defnyddio bellach at y dibenion a fwriadwyd, oherwydd bod y galw'n newid.

Nid oes cynnydd cyffredinol yn nifer y tai fforddiadwy yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd. Mae'n amlwg ein bod ymhell o gyrraedd y targed ym mlwyddyn gyntaf y pedair blynedd sydd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i gyrraedd y targed. Felly, mae gennym lawer i'w wneud, a gobeithio bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gallu ei wneud. Gobeithio y gellir cyrraedd ei tharged, ond yr hyn y mae arnom ei angen, yn anad dim—a chyfeirir at hyn yn ein gwelliant cyntaf—a ninnau bellach wedi cael adroddiad Essex, neu adroddiad y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar dai fforddiadwy, fel y mynnodd y Swyddfa Gyflwyno inni ei alw, a chan fod y strategaethau'n cael eu rhoi ar waith, yw i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad roi cynllun gweithredu mesuradwy ar waith. Mae angen inni gael modd i wneud Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn atebol am union nifer y cartrefi sy'n cael eu codi—yr ydym yn dal i aros am y ffigurau ar hynny—ac wedyn gallwn ddechrau penderfynu'n union sut y mae'n gwneud mewn cysylltiad â'r targedau y mae wedi'u gosod iddi ei hun. Mae hynny eto i ddod.

I accept, in terms of a measurable action plan, that that does not mean that every recommendation that Sue Essex has made has to be put in place, but we need to have some action quickly and we need to move forward on this quickly. If we do not do so, I fear that the crisis that we have now will continue, and that, even when the credit crunch comes to an end, we will not be in the position that we should be in and that we would be in if we had taken swift and decisive action to deal with it.

We need a can-do attitude from the Assembly Government. I also need to have some confidence in the Assembly Government's being able to do this.

**Brynle Williams:** Since I have been an Assembly Member—and I have been a Member for five or six years—we have been asking for the same thing as Peter Black, and the situation is not improving. I hope that we have started to get the tools in place over the last couple of months.

We have serious situations. In my own village, there are young people who have been away at university and have returned to live in the village but cannot afford to buy a home there. They want to live there and they want to have their extended family around them so that they can work in the area. There is no question that these people are needed to keep village facilities alive—we have been taking evidence on that for the last three months, effectively.

This is important; people are important. Regrettably, we are not doing enough. I came here six years ago and we were discussing this issue then, at the former Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee. It was said that we had to do something about young people getting affordable housing. That is not happening. We want houses where people want to live, not where we decide they have to live. In the outlying villages, we should have one and two-bedroomed houses for retired people or families who do not want to move out of the community but do not need the use of a three or four-bedroomed house.

Yr wyf yn derbyn, gyda golwg ar gynllun gweithredu mesuradwy, nad yw hynny'n golygu ei bod yn rhaid gweithredu ar bob un o'r argymhellion a wnaeth Sue Essex, ond mae angen inni gael rhywfaint o weithredu'n fuan, ac mae angen inni symud ymlaen ar hyn yn gyflym. Os na wnawn hynny, mae arnaf ofn y bydd yr argyfwng sydd gennym yn awr yn parhau, a hyd yn oed pan ddaw'r wasgfa gredyd i ben, na fyddwn yn y sefyllfa y dylem fod ynddi ac y byddem ynddi pe baem wedi cymryd camau buan a phendant i ddelio ag ef.

Mae arnom angen agwedd gadarnhaol gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae angen hefyd imi gel ychydig ffydd yng ngallu Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i wneud hyn.

**Brynle Williams:** Ers imi fod yn Aelod o'r Cynulliad—ac yr wyf yn Aelod ers pum neu chwe blynedd—yr ydym wedi bod yn gofyn am yr un peth â Peter Black, ac nid yw'r sefyllfa'n gwella. Gobeithio ein bod wedi dechrau cael yr offer yn barod dros y ddau fis diwethaf.

Mae gennym sefyllfaoedd difrifol. Yn fy mhentref fy hun, mae pobl ifanc sydd wedi bod i ffwrdd yn y brifysgol ac wedi dychwelyd i fyw i'r pentref yn methu fforddio prynu cartref yno. Maent am fyw yno, ac maent am gael eu teulu estynedig o'u cwmpas fel y gallant weithio yn yr ardal. Nid oes amheuaeth nad oes angen y bobl hyn i gadw cyfleusterau pentrefi'n fyw—yr ydym wedi bod yn cymryd tystiolaeth am hynny dros y tri mis diwethaf, i bob pwrpas.

Mae hyn yn bwysig; mae pobl yn bwysig. Gwaetha'r modd, nid ydym yn gwneud digon. Deuthum yma chwe blynedd yn ôl ac yr oeddem yn trafod y mater hwn bryd hynny, ym Mhwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad gynt. Dywedwyd ei bod yn rhaid inni wneud rhywbeth ynghylch gallu pobl ifanc i gael tai fforddiadwy. Nid yw hynny'n digwydd. Yr ydym am gael tai lle y mae pobl am fyw, nid lle y penderfynwn ni y mae'n rhaid iddynt fyw. Yn y pentrefi anghysbell, dylem gael tai un neu ddwy ystafell wely i bobl sydd wedi ymddeol, neu i deuluoedd nad ydynt am symud o'r gymuned ond nad oes arnynt angen tŷ â thair neu bedair ystafell wely.

Again, in my own village, there are two young people who hold down four jobs between them to try to get a foot on the housing ladder. They do not want to move out of the village. They are essential workers in the community and they are rearing families. It is shameful that they have to live in a mobile home. They have the land and they meet the criteria, but the planning authority will not allow them to build on the land. If we are serious about this, we must get to grips with it. As Peter says, we do not have the time. The time has gone. These people want homes now.

Mae'n rhaid i ni gadw'r cymunedau hyn yn fyw a'r bobl i gadw cymunedau'n fyw yw pobl ifanc.

**Alun Davies:** I come to this debate this afternoon from the perspective of some of the work that we have been undertaking in the Rural Development Sub-committee as part of our focus on rural poverty issues. While we have not focused on housing per se, housing has been one of the themes and threads that have run through all of the evidence that we have received, and it was one of the constant themes of the debates that we have had over the last six months.

These are real issues, as Brynle has already said. People are literally being forced out of their local communities, and it is not only the young but the old too. People face different issues and problems. Young people with families have been unable to find sufficient housing to meet the needs of their growing families; older people need accommodation that meets their needs and allows them to maintain their independence; and people with disabilities have their own special housing needs. All of these requirements have failed to be met within the current housing market and the context of the current housing debate. At the same time, notwithstanding the credit crunch, which forms a background to the debate this afternoon and other debates that we are having, we are still seeing phenomenal prices in parts of rural Wales that I represent, in particular. In Ceredigion, the average house price is nine times the

Gan gyfeirio eto at fy mhentref fy hun, mae yna ddau berson ifanc sy'n gwneud pedair swydd rhyngddynt er mwyn ceisio rhoi troed ar yr ysgol dai. Nid ydynt am symud o'r pentref. Maent yn weithwyr hanfodol yn y gymuned ac yn magu teuluoedd. Mae'n gywilyddus eu bod yn gorfod byw mewn cartref symudol. Mae ganddynt dir ac maent yn bodloni'r meini prawf, ond ni wnaiff yr awdurdod cynllunio ganiatáu iddynt adeiladu ar y tir. Os ydym o ddifrif am hyn, rhaid inni fynd i'r afael ag ef. Fel y dywed Peter, nid oes gennym ddigon o amser. Mae'r amser wedi mynd. Mae'r bobl hyn am gael cartrefi'n awr.

We must keep these communities alive, and the people to keep communities alive are young people.

**Alun Davies:** Yr yw yn cyfrannu at y ddadl hon y prynhawn yma o safbwynt ychydig o'r gwaith yr ydym wedi'i wneud yn yr Is-bwyllgor Datblygu Gwledig wrth ganolbwyntio ar faterion yn ymwneud â thlodi cefn gwlad. Er nad ydym wedi canolbwyntio ar dai fel y cyfryw, mae tai wedi bod yn un o'r themâu a'r llinynnau sydd wedi rhedeg drwy'r holl dystiolaeth a gawsom, ac yr oedd yn un o'r themâu cyson yn y dadleuon yr ydym wedi'u cael dros y chwe mis diwethaf.

Mae'r rhain yn broblemau gwirioneddol, fel y mae Brynle eisoes wedi dweud. Mae pobl yn cael eu gorfodi'n llythrennol i adael eu cymunedau lleol, ac nid yr ifanc yn unig, ond yr hen hefyd. Mae pobl yn wynebu gwahanol broblemau ac anawsterau. Mae pobl ifanc gyda theuluoedd wedi methu cael tai digonol i fodloni anghenion eu teuluoedd wrth iddynt dyfu; mae ar bobl hyn angen lle i fyw sy'n bodloni eu hanghenion ac yn caniatáu iddynt barhau'n annibynnol; ac mae gan bobl sydd ag anableddau eu hanghenion tai arbennig eu hunain. Methwyd â diwallu pob un o'r anghenion hyn o fewn y farchnad dai bresennol ac yng nghyd-destun y ddadl bresennol am dai. Ar yr un pryd, er gwaethaf y wasgfa gredyd, sy'n gefndir i'r ddadl y prynhawn yma ac i ddadleuon eraill yr ydym yn eu cael, yr ydym yn dal i weld prisiau syfrdanol mewn rhannau o Gymru wledig yr wyf fi'n eu cynrychioli, yn benodol. Yng

average wage; in Pembrokeshire, the average house price is eight times the average wage. Many people in many communities are locked out of the housing market, and that is not something that we can simply put on the back burner. That is why I welcome the commitment that you made last autumn, Deputy Minister, in commissioning this task and finish group, and I welcome the work that Sue Essex has published recently. I also welcome the work of the Joseph Rowntree Foundation, which has also just published an excellent report, describing the problems that we are facing in parts of rural Wales and outlining some of the solutions.

4.40 p.m.

The 'One Wales' commitment to deliver significantly more affordable housing by 2011 is critical if we are to sustain the sorts of communities that we want to sustain in rural Wales. That means that we need to build on the target of 6,500 new homes, and I emphasise that these new homes need to be well designed to help people who are suffering due to fuel poverty and may not be able to insulate their homes. They need to be quality homes—the right type in the right place—and they need to be integrated into the local community. All too often we see homes being built that are there, frankly, for profit and not for people. We need a different sort of housing policy, and I am pleased, Deputy Minister, that that is the direction in which you are taking policy.

Sue Essex proposes a striking way forward in her report in terms of the structures within which she wants policy to be pursued, by putting the 'Making the Connections' philosophy into the housing context. That would establish a new and different approach for the Welsh Assembly Government. It would mean taking a far stronger strategic role and it would involve an emphasis on outcomes. It would mean working with local authorities to identify local need and with housing associations and others to ensure the delivery of those homes for people. I

Ngheredigion, mae'r pris cyfartalog am dŷ naw gwaith yn fwy na'r cyflog cyfartalog; yn sir Benfro, mae'r pris cyfartalog am dŷ wyth gwaith yn fwy na'r cyflog cyfartalog. Mae llawer o bobl mewn llawer o gymunedau wedi'u cau allan o'r farchnad dai, ac nid yw hynny'n rhywbeth y gallwn ohirio rhoi sylw iddo. Dyna pam yr wyf yn croesawu'r ymrwymiad a wnaethoch yr hydref diwethaf, Ddirprwy Weinidog, wrth gomisiynu'r grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen hwn, a chroesawaf y gwaith y mae Sue Essex wedi'i gyhoeddi'n ddiweddar. Yr wyf hefyd yn croesawu gwaith Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree, sydd hefyd newydd gyhoeddi adroddiad rhagorol, gan ddisgrifio'r problemau sy'n ein hwynebu mewn rhannau o gefn gwlad Cymru ac amlinellu rhai o'r atebion.

Mae'r ymrwymiad yn 'Cymru'n Un' i ddarparu llawer mwy o dai fforddiadwy erbyn 2011 yn hollbwysig os ydym i gynnal y mathau o gymunedau y dymunwn eu cynnal yng nghefn gwlad Cymru. Mae hynny'n golygu bod angen inni ychwanegu at y targed o 6,500 o gartrefi newydd, a phwysleisaf y bydd angen i'r cartrefi newydd hyn fod wedi'u dylunio'n dda i helpu pobl sy'n dioddef oherwydd tlodi tanwydd ac sydd efallai'n methu inswleiddio'u cartrefi. Mae angen iddynt fod yn gartrefi o safon—y math iawn yn y lle iawn—a'u hintegreiddio yn y gymuned leol. Yn rhy aml o lawer, gwelwn gartrefi'n cael eu codi sydd yno, i fod yn blaen, er mwyn gwneud elw, nid er mwyn pobl. Mae arnom angen math gwahanol o bolisi tai, ac yr wyf yn falch, Ddirprwy Weinidog, eich bod yn arwain polisi i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw.

Mae Sue Essex yn cynnig ffordd ymlaen drawiadol yn ei hadroddiad o ran y strwythurau y mae'n dymuno gweld hyrwyddo polisi o'u mewn, drwy gynnwys athroniaeth 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau' yn y cydestun tai. Byddai hynny'n sefydlu dull gweithredu newydd a gwahanol i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Byddai'n golygu cael rôl strategol gryfach o lawer ac yn cynnwys rhoi pwyslais ar ganlyniadau. Byddai'n golygu gweithio gydag awdurdodau lleol i nodi anghenion lleol a chyda chymdeithasau tai ac eraill i sicrhau darparu'r cartrefi hynny i bobl.

commend that work, Deputy Minister, and I hope that we will see the results of it very soon.

**David Melding:** This is an important debate and I am pleased to take part in it. I start by stating the obvious, namely that there has been an acute supply problem for many years in terms of the number of homes being built. That is the direct reason for the lack of affordable housing, and it has contributed considerably to the rise in house prices that we have seen in the last 10 or 12 years. We are now facing the consequences of previous decisions.

Before I proceed, Deputy Presiding Officer, I must say that I do not think that the clock has been set, and I do not want to suffer the same fate as Nick Bourne. I had about 10 seconds left.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Perhaps that was enough. [*Laughter.*]

**David Melding:** I accept the quip, but I hope that that is not the conclusion when I sit down, namely that it was not worth listening to me.

We have seen this problem over the years—over 30 years—and I am not attributing it to one particular political party. We have seen the supply of land for housing being very limited. In Britain, we have traditionally had some of the most restrictive planning laws in the whole of Europe, and that has played a large part in driving up house prices. Asset prices have been increasing anyway internationally, but the position in Britain is particularly acute. As the previous speaker, Alun Davies, pointed out, the result is that the price of family homes, in particular, in many parts of Wales is now a multiple of average earnings that is just fantastic by any historical measure that normally would have set it at three times a person's income or, where there were two incomes coming in, it may have been five times the household income. House prices that are up to seven or nine times the average income is completely unsustainable, and it is a real issue.

Cymeradwyaf y gwaith hwnnw, Ddirprwy Weinidog, a gobeithio y gwelwn ganlyniadau hynny'n fuan iawn.

**David Melding:** Mae hon yn ddadl bwysig ac yr wyf yn falch cael cymryd rhan ynddi. Dechreuaf drwy ddweud yr hyn sy'n amlwg, sef bod problem gyflenwi ddifrifol ers blynnyddoedd lawer o ran nifer y cartrefi sy'n cael eu codi. Dyna'r rheswm uniongyrchol dros brinder tai fforddiadwy, ac mae wedi cyfrannu'n sylweddol at y cynnydd ym mhrisiau tai a welsom yn y 10 neu 12 mlynedd diwethaf. Yr ydym yn awr yn wynebu canlyniadau penderfyniadau blaenorol.

Cyn imi fynd ymlaen, Ddirprwy Lywydd, rhaid imi ddweud nad wyf yn credu bod y cloc wedi'i osod, ac nid wyf am ddioddef yr un ffawd â Nick Bourne. Yr oedd gennyf tua 10 eiliad ar ôl.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Efallai fod hynny'n ddigon. [*Chwerthin.*]

**David Melding:** Derbyniaf eich sylw bachog, ond gobeithio nad dyna fydd y casgliad pan eisteddaf, sef nad oedd yn werth gwrandao arnaf.

Yr ydym wedi gweld y broblem hon dros y blynnyddoedd—dros 30 mlynedd—ac nid wyf yn ei phriodoli i ddim un blaid wleidyddol neilltuol. Gwelsom gyfyngu mawr iawn ar y cyflenwad tir gyfer tai. Ym Mhrydain yr ydym yn draddodiadol wedi cael rhai o'r deddfau cynllunio mwyaf cyfyngus yn Ewrop gyfan, ac mae hynny wedi cyfrannu'n fawr at gynyddu prisiau tai. Mae prisiau asedau wedi bod yn codi'n rhyngwladol beth bynnag, ond mae'r sefyllfa ym Mhrydain yn neilltuol o ddifrifol. Fel y nododd y siaradwr blaenorol, Alun Davies, y canlyniad yw bod pris cartrefi teuluol, yn benodol, mewn llawer rhan o Gymru lawer iawn o weithiau'n fwy yn awr na'r enillion cyfartalog, a hynny'n syfrdanol yn ôl unrhyw ffon fesur hanesyddol a fyddai fel rheol wedi'i osod dair gwaith cymaint ag incwm rhywun neu, os oedd dau incwm, gallai fod yn bum gwaith cymaint â'r incwm teuluol. Mae prisiau tai sydd hyd at saith neu naw gwaith cymaint â'r incwm cyfartalog yn hollol anghynaliadwy, ac mae'n broblem wirioneddol.

The other side of this is that people have seen house prices increase and the value of their home increase and may have made poor investment decisions and raised capital on homes that are now likely to fall in value. We are facing a considerable problem. Our ability to influence this is somewhat limited, but we should use the levers that are available to us with great care and determination.

In the Welsh Conservatives' manifesto for the last Assembly elections, we called for a more flexible planning system combined with local control. If local communities in Wales, particularly rural areas, were prepared to increase the land available in their communities for housing, the people living there could access that housing. If they agreed to that—and you could put all sorts of covenants in place to restrict the future sale of that housing, so that individuals would not get a windfall in five years' time or whenever—that could be the answer. I think that people would go along with that. That is not to say that we can just allow free and easy planning that overrides all other considerations, but why should a local village not be allowed to increase its curtilage modestly, if it would then have control over the availability of the housing on that land?

We cannot solve many of the current problems that we face, but we must cope with them. The credit crunch is a cause of great concern, and all that we can say at the moment is that we do not know where it is going. I am still slightly more optimistic than most commentators, as I think that things will even out, but, at the moment, it is difficult to sell a house because people are anticipating considerable falls in house values. People need to have confidence that the prices currently being set reflect market values or are likely to reflect the market values in the next year or so. Mortgage approvals are at something like half the rate of a year ago, and are a third of that rate in some areas. These are formidable problems.

Yr ochr arall i hyn yw bod pobl wedi gweld prisiau tai'n codi a gwerth eu cartref yn cynyddu, a gallent fod wedi gwneud penderfyniadau annoeth ar fuddsoddi ac wedi codi cyfalaf ar gartrefi sy'n awr yn debygol o golli gwerth. Yr ydym yn wynebu problem sylweddol. Mae ein gallu i ddylanwadu ar hyn braidd yn gyfyngedig, ond dylem ddefnyddio'r dulliau sydd ar gael inni gyda gofal mawr a phenderfyniad.

Ym manifesto'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig ar gyfer etholiadau diwethaf y Cynulliad, yr oeddem yn galw am gyfundrefn gynllunio fwy hyblyg ynghyd â rheolaeth leol. Petai cymunedau lleol yng Nghymru, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd gwledig, yn barod i gynyddu'r tir sydd ar gael yn eu cymunedau ar gyfer tai, gallai'r bobl sy'n byw yno fanteisio ar y tai hynny. Petaent yn cytuno i hynny—a gallech sefydlu pob math o gyfamodau i gyfyngu gwerthiant y tai hynny yn y dyfodol, fel na fyddai unigolion yn cael gwneud elw mawr ymhen pum mlynedd neu pryd bynnag—gallai hynny ddatrys y mater. Credaf y byddai pobl yn cytuno i hynny. Nid yw'n golygu y gallwn ganiatáu cynllunio llac sy'n sathru ar bob ystyriaeth arall, ond pam na ddylai pentref lleol gael cynyddu rywfaint ar ei gwmpas, os byddai ganddo wedyn reolaeth dros y tai a fyddai ar gael ar y tir hwnnw?

Ni allwn ddatrys nifer o'r problemau sy'n ein hwynebu ar hyn o bryd, ond rhaid inni ddelio â hwy. Mae'r wasgfa greddyd yn peri pryder mawr, a'r cyfan y gallwn ei ddweud ar hyn o bryd yw na wyddom i ble y mae'n mynd. Yr wyf yn dal ychydig yn fwy gobeithiol na'r rhan fwyaf o sylwebyddion, gan fy mod yn credu y bydd pethau'n gwastatáu. Ond ar hyn o bryd mae'n anodd gwerthu tŷ gan fod pobl yn rhagweld y bydd gwerth tai'n disgyn yn sylweddol. Mae angen hyder ar bobl fod y prisiau sy'n cael eu gosod ar hyn o bryd yn adlewyrchu gwerth y farchnad neu'n debygol o adlewyrchu gwerth y farchnad yn y flwyddyn nesaf yn fras. Dim ond tua hanner y morgeisi a oedd yn cael eu cymeradwyo flwyddyn yn ôl sy'n cael eu cymeradwyo erbyn hyn, a thraean yn unig o'r gyfradd honno mewn rhai ardaloedd. Mae'r rhain yn broblemau enbyd.

I will make one ideological point, which I hope will be indulged, and that is on the one area on which I criticise the Welsh Assembly Government, namely its position—which is also ideological—of attacking the right to buy. That misses the point. Huw Irranca-Davies got it right when he yesterday warned his colleagues on restricting the right to buy.

‘It isn’t a magic bullet to be used indiscriminately, but it does add a significant new power where there is an acute issue to be addressed. It may well be that existing Assembly policies, by and large, will be able to address affordable housing issues.’

That is damning with faint praise, or faint endorsement, one of the central planks of this coalition Government, and I think that he is right. There is obviously a different view at the other end of the M4 of where Labour policy ought to be going. The truth of the matter is that the only way out of our housing problem is to use a broad range of measures, to be as imaginative as possible, and to give more power to local communities over the supply of land.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Wow. Follow that. It is refreshing to hear the Tories speak as they do, because I thoroughly agree that we should allow local communities more autonomy. Surely that is the key. There is so much irrational debate going on and there so many emotive issues involved locally that, wherever we are, we open our papers and see that, on the one hand, people are bemoaning the fact that there is no affordable housing available, while, on the other, questioning that anyone should dare to build any new houses.

Diolch i’r Ceidwadwyr am ddewis y pwnc hwn a diolch i’r Dirprwy Lywydd am adael i mi siarad. Mae tai fforddiadwy yn bwnc llosg ers blynyddoedd, a bu pobl yn poeni yn fawr am hyn, yn arbennig yng nghymunedau cefn gwlad. Mae’n bwnc ofnadwy o anodd i ddelio ag ef. Fodd bynnag, bu Mick Bates yn dweud ers blynyddoedd y dylem wneud rhywbeth ynghylch prisiau uchel y tir a bennir ar gyfer adeiladu.

We support the building of 6,500 new homes,

Gwnaf un pwynt ideolegol—gobeithio y maddeuwch hynny—ac mae a wnelo â’r un maes yr wyf yn beirniadu Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru amdano, sef ei safbwynt—sydd hefyd yn ideolegol—o ymosod ar yr hawl i brynu. Methu’r pwynt yw hynny. Yr oedd Huw Irranca-Davies yn iawn ddoe pan rybuddiodd ei gyd-Aelodau ynglŷn â chyfyngu’r hawl i brynu.

‘Nid yw’n fwled hud i’w defnyddio’n ddiwahân, ond mae’n ychwanegu pŵer newydd sylweddol lle mae problem enbyd i fynd i’r afael â hi. Mae’n bosibl iawn y bydd polisiau presennol y Cynulliad, at ei gilydd, yn gallu ymdrin â materion tai fforddiadwy.’

Condemnio gydag arlliw o ganmoliaeth yw hynny, neu arlliw o gymeradwyaeth i un o brif bolisiau’r Llywodraeth glymblaid hon, a chredaf ei fod yn hollol iawn. Yn amlwg, mae barn wahanol ym mhen arall yr M4 ble y dylai polisi Llafur fod yn mynd. Y gwir amdani yw mai’r unig ffordd allan o’n problem tai yw defnyddio ystod eang o fesurau, gyda chymaint o ddychymyg â phosibl, a rhoi mwy o bŵer i gymunedau lleol dros y cyflenwad tir.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Waw. Sut mae dilyn hynny? Mae’n braf clywed y Torïaid yn siarad fel y gwnânt, oherwydd yr wyf yn cytuno’n llwyr y dylem ganiatáu rhagor o ymreolaeth i gymunedau lleol. Dyna’r allwedd, yn sicr. Mae cymaint o ddadlau dreswm yn digwydd a chynifer o faterion emosiynol ymhlyg yn hyn yn lleol. Ble bynnag yr ydym, pan agorwn ein papurau gwelwn ar yr un llaw bobl yn cwyno nad oes tai fforddiadwy ar gael, ond ar y llaw arall gofynnir pam y dylai unrhyw un feiddio codi unrhyw dai newydd.

I thank the Conservatives for choosing this topic and I thank the Deputy Presiding Officer for allowing me to speak. Affordable housing has been a controversial subject for years, and people are greatly concerned about it, particularly in rural communities. It is an incredibly difficult matter to get to grips with. However, Mick Bates has been saying for years that we should do something about the high price of land designated for building

Yr ydym yn cefnogi codi 6,500 o gartrefi

but I am not sure whether that goes far enough. Sue Essex is undoubtedly right in her assertion that a tougher line needs to be taken with developers, and I believe that the Welsh Assembly Government needs to get on and do something constructive, because, as Brynle said, we have been discussing this since the Assembly's inception.

It is a scary scenario, because we now face a complex situation. As David Melding said, we face the credit crunch and the difficulty of securing a mortgage, and more and more people will become homeless.

4.50 p.m.

The increase in homelessness is scary, because it is a basic right to have a home. That is where we can grow and be nurtured, and so I am as concerned as anyone about that. The housing associations are the key to this. If we allow them to play their part, as well as relax planning regulations and have a proper, rational debate with communities about why we desperately need to build more houses, I am sure that we can do a great deal to solve the problem.

From January to March this year, only 123 right-to-buy sales were completed. In many respects, the right to buy has been a difficult situation to deal with. However, I hope that we can move the Welsh Assembly Government forward on this. Our Deputy Minister for Housing is a rational person, and I am sure that she will give this her strongest commitment.

**The Deputy Minister for Housing (Jocelyn Davies):** I support amendments 3 and 4 from the Liberal Democrats, and I commend the Government's amendments to Members.

The restrictions on the availability of credit are undoubtedly having a major impact on housing in Wales. There are three early signs of this: a slow-down in house prices; a reduction in housebuilding completions; and an increase in repossession proceedings, particularly by sub-prime lenders. For those families and individuals who face mortgage

newydd, ond nid wyf yn siŵr a yw hynny'n mynd yn ddigon pell. Mae Sue Essex yn sicr yn iawn yn ei haerriad fod angen delio'n llymach â datblygwyr, a chredaf fod angen i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru fynd ati i wneud rhywbeth adeiladol, oherwydd, fel y dywedodd Brynle, yr ydym wedi bod yn trafod hyn ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad.

Mae'n senario brawychus, oherwydd yr ydym yn awr yn wynebu sefyllfa gymhleth. Fel y dywedodd David Melding, yr ydym yn wynebu'r wasgfa gredyd ac anhawster cael morgais, a bydd mwy a mwy o bobl yn mynd yn ddigartref.

Mae'r cynnydd yn nifer y digartref yn frawychus, oherwydd mae cael cartref yn hawl sylfaenol. Dyna lle y gallwn dyfu a chael ein meithrin, felly, yr wyf mor bryderus â neb ynglŷn â hynny. Mae'r cymdeithasau tai yn allweddol yn hyn. Os caniatawn iddynt chwarae eu rhan, yn ogystal â llacio'r rheoliadau cynllunio a chael trafodaeth iawn, resymegol gyda chymunedau ynglŷn â pham y mae angen dirfawr inni godi rhagor o dai, yr wyf yn siŵr y gallwn wneud llawer iawn i ddatrys y broblem.

Rhwng mis Ionawr a mis Mawrth eleni, cwblhawyd dim ond 123 o werthiannau hawl i brynu. Mewn llawer ffordd, mae'r hawl i brynu wedi bod yn sefyllfa anodd delio â hi. Fodd bynnag, gobeithio y gallwn symud Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ymlaen ar hyn. Mae ein Dirprwy Weinidog dros Dai yn berson rhesymol, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yn rhoi ei hymrwymiad cryfaf i hyn.

**Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Dai (Jocelyn Davies):** Yr wyf yn cefnogi gwelliannau 3 a 4 gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, a chymeradwyaf welliannau'r Llywodraeth i'r Aelodau.

Mae'r cyfyngiadau ar allu cael credyd yn sicr yn effeithio'n fawr ar dai yng Nghymru. Mae tri arwydd cynnar o hyn: gostyngiad ym mhrisiau tai; gostyngiad yn nifer y tai newydd sy'n cael eu cwblhau; a chynnydd mewn achosion o adfeddiannu, yn enwedig gan fenthycwyr sy'n benthycwyr ar gyfradd uwch na'r brif gyfradd. I'r teuluoedd a'r



repossession and, in some cases, homelessness, this is definitely a housing crisis. We have an obligation to find ways to prevent the situation from worsening, and to work proactively to minimise the hardship caused. However, we must also recognise the origins of this situation, which is the reason for our amendment 1, to put it in today's context. I do not want anyone to imagine for a moment that tabling a motion that includes the words 'housing crisis', as the opposition has done, solves anything. If it did, Mark, I would have done it years ago, and I have tabled plenty of motions and amendments.

The credit crunch will have serious consequences for the housing market, but not all those will be disadvantages. Lower house prices, for instances, will be welcomed by many. I remember debates in the Senedd and the old Chamber during which Members from all parties would call for a brake on house prices. At the time, we said that the high house prices were a crisis. Therefore, we have all said that we want lower house prices.

The lack of available credit is a difficulty, but it will not be everlasting, and so we must ensure that, as the market frees up, we can take advantage of some of the opportunities that will arise. Over the intermediate period, the housing market that we are working with will be different from the high-growth market that we have seen in recent years. That will change the opportunities and the pressure for Government intervention. Last week, we received the Sue Essex report, the independent review into social housing. You called for it, Mark, but you have to be in Government to deliver it. You were wrong to say that we have the worst housing in the UK; we have the most improved housing over the past 10 years, and we are now on a par with England.

The Sue Essex report focused on several steps that we could take in the current market conditions. First, land prices are now cheaper, which provides new opportunities for housing associations to buy into the market. House prices are falling, and many developers, as you told us last week, Mark,

unigolion hynny sy'n wynebu adfeddiannu tai ar forgais, a digartrefedd mewn rhai achosion, mae hwn yn bendant yn argyfwng tai. Mae'n ddyletswydd arnom i ddod o hyd i ffyrdd i atal y sefyllfa rhag gwaethygu, ac i fynd ati'n weithgar i leihau'r caledi a achosir. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni hefyd gydnabod tarddiad y sefyllfa hon, a dyna'r rheswm dros welliant 1 gennym ni, i'w roi yng nghydestun heddiw. Ni fynnwn i neb ddychmygu am eiliad fod cyflwyno cynnig sy'n cynnwys y geiriau 'argyfwng tai', fel y gwnaeth yr wrthblaid, yn datrys dim. Petai hynny'n wir, Mark, byddwn wedi gwneud hynny flynyddoedd yn ôl, ac yr wyf wedi cyflwyno digon o gynigion a gwelliannau.

Bydd i'r wasgfa greddy ganlyniadau difrifol i'r farchnad dai, ond ni fydd y rheini i gyd yn anfanteision. Bydd prisiau tai is, er enghraifft, yn cael eu croesawu gan lawer. Cofiaf ddadleuon yn y Senedd ac yn yr hen Siambr pan fyddai Aelodau o bob plaid yn galw am arafu prisiau tai. Ar y pryd, dywedem fod prisiau tai uchel yn argyfwng. Felly, yr ydym i gyd wedi dweud ein bod am gael prisiau tai is.

Mae'r diffyg credyd sydd ar gael yn anhawster, ond ni fydd yn para am byth, felly rhaid inni sicrhau, wrth i'r farchnad ddod yn fwy rhydd, ein bod yn gallu manteisio ar rai o'r cyfleoedd a fydd yn codi. Yn y cyfamser bydd y farchnad dai yr ydym yn gweithio gyda hi yn wahanol i'r farchnad twf uchel a welsom dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Bydd hynny'n newid y cyfleoedd a'r pwysau o blaid ymyrryd gan y Llywodraeth. Yr wythnos diwethaf cawsom adroddiad Sue Essex, yr adolygiad annibynnol o dai cymdeithasol. Chi a alwodd amdano, Mark, ond rhaid ichi fod mewn Llywodraeth i'w wireddu. Yr oeddech yn anghywir i ddweud mai ni sydd â'r tai gwaethaf yn y DU; ni sydd â'r tai sydd wedi gwella fwyaf dros y 10 mlynedd diwethaf, ac yr ydym yn awr ar yr un lefel â Lloegr.

Canolbwyntiai adroddiad Sue Essex ar nifer o gamau y gallem eu cymryd yn y farchnad fel y mae hi ar hyn o bryd. Yn gyntaf, mae prisiau tir yn rhatach yn awr, sy'n darparu cyfleoedd newydd i gymdeithasau tai i brynu i mewn i'r farchnad. Mae prisiau tai'n gostwng, ac mae gan nifer o ddatblygwyr, fel

have unsold homes. Housing associations could take some of those onto their books to address local needs, although, as I told you last week, not all those unsold homes will be suitable for our needs. The social housing that we build is generally of a higher standard than that which is developed for private sale. We are also increasing standards in our mainstream social housing grant programme to meet the challenge of climate change. We need to be flexible and proactive, which means taking the new opportunities that are on offer to us without compromising our strategic objectives. For that reason, I ask you to support the amendments tabled in the name of Carwyn Jones.

You mentioned the social housing grant, as you always do, Mark. I thought, 'Here we go again—it is always money, money, money with Mark', but at least you are consistent. However, to correct you, we do not use the social housing grant to pay for shared ownership. We support the homebuy scheme, but, with shared ownership, registered social landlords have to pay rent on the equity share that they own, and that does not happen with homebuy.

The Essex report sets a challenging and welcome agenda for change in the housing sector.

**Mark Isherwood:** Do you accept that the 17 members of Housing Forum Cymru announced at its formation three years ago—not this year or last year—that Wales had a housing crisis even then? The problem did not start with the credit crunch. It has changed to something else, but most of the concerns that applied then still apply today.

**Jocelyn Davies:** If you tell me that that is what it said three years ago, I will accept it. As I said, when I tabled motions for the Plaid Cymru group when we were in opposition, I often used the term 'housing crisis', but that was about something different; it was about the high house prices at the time, and we are now in a different position. That is the

y dywedasoeh wrthym yr wythnos diwethaf, Mark, gartrefi heb eu gwerthu. Gallai cymdeithasau tai gymryd rhai o'r rheini ar eu llyfrau i ddelio ag anghenion lleol. Ond fel y dywedais wrthy ch yr wythnos diwethaf, ni fydd y cartrefi hynny sydd heb eu gwerthu i gyd yn addas at ein hanghenion ni. Mae'r tai cymdeithasol yr ydym yn eu codi yn gyffredinol o safon uwch na'r rheini sy'n cael eu ddatblygu i'w gwerthu'n breifat. Yr ydym hefyd yn codi'r safonau yn ein prif raglen grant tai cymdeithasol i ateb her y newid yn yr hinsawdd. Mae angen inni fod yn hyblyg ac yn rhagweithiol, sy'n golygu manteisio ar y cyfleoedd newydd sydd ar gael inni heb gyfaddawdu yn ein hamcanion strategol. Am y rheswm hwnnw, gofynnaf ichi gefnogi'r gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd yn enw Carwyn Jones.

Soniec h am y grant tai cymdeithasol, fel bob amser, Mark. Meddyliais, 'Dyma ni eto—arian, arian, arian yw hi bob amser gyda Mark', ond o leiaf yr ydych yn gyson. Fodd bynnag, i'ch cywiro, nid ydym yn defnyddio'r grant tai cymdeithasol i dalu am ran-berchenogaeth. Yr ydym yn cefnogi'r cynllun cymorth prynu, ond gyda rhan-berchenogaeth rhaid i landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig dalu rhent ar y gyfran ecwiti y maent yn berchen arni, ac nid yw hynny'n digwydd gyda chymorth prynu.

Mae adroddiad Essex yn gosod agenda heriol, sydd i'w chroesawu, o blaid newid yn y sector tai.

**Mark Isherwood:** A ydych yn derbyn bod y 17 aelod o Fforwm Tai Cymru wedi cyhoeddi, pan ffurfiwyd ef dair blynedd yn ôl—nid eleni na'r llynedd—fod argyfwng tai yng Nghymru hyd yn oed bryd hynny? Nid gyda'r wasgfa greddyd y dechreuodd y broblem. Mae wedi troi'n rhywbeth arall, ond mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r pryderon a fodolai bryd hynny yn dal yn berthnasol heddiw.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Os ydych yn dweud wrthyf mai dyna a ddywedodd dair blynedd yn ôl, derbyniaf hynny. Fel y dywedais, pan oeddwn i'n cyflwyno cynigion ar ran grŵp Plaid Cymru pan oeddem yn wrthblaid, byddwn yn aml yn defnyddio'r term 'argyfwng tai', ond cyfeiriai hynny at ryw beth gwahanol; cyfeiriai at brisiau tai

context for our amendment.

The Sue Essex report is a comprehensive review of the housing challenges that we face and makes recommendations for change. We want to work with stakeholders on all 43 recommendations to develop a programme of change. The broad policy direction will help us to deliver not only our 'One Wales' commitments, including our target of building 6,500 more affordable homes, but it also establishes a strategic framework for all stakeholders to work in partnership to deliver the right housing in the right places, which is what our communities deserve.

I will accept the amendment in the name of Kirsty Williams on the report, on the clear understanding that I cannot yet say that I will necessarily take forward all of the recommendations in full, and I think that you would understand that. However, I accept the spirit of the amendment.

On Kirsty Williams's amendment 4, we are working with Community Housing Cymru and local authorities to ensure that our information base is accurate, and we will shortly be able to report on the progress to date on meeting our target. You will receive that report as soon as it is available. Therefore, I am happy to accept that amendment.

I would not disagree with much of what Peter Black said, but as I said earlier, you have to be in Government to deliver, and the Liberal Democrats missed two opportunities last year to do that. Plaid Cymru was prepared to step up to the plate.

Repossession has the most serious potential impact on families and, as Members will know, I have already announced that we will make up to £5 million of uncommitted funding available—so it is new money, Mark—to support more action on mortgage rescue, enabling registered social landlords to step in and take on a home in full or in part, enabling its occupants to avoid homelessness. That gives us the opportunity to help families for whom there is potentially no other place

uchel ar y pryd, ac yr ydym mewn sefyllfa wahanol erbyn hyn. Dyna'r cyd-destun ar gyfer ein gwelliant.

Mae adroddiad Sue Essex yn adolygiad cynhwysfawr o'r sialensiau tai sy'n ein hwynebu, ac mae'n argymhell newidiadau. Yr ydym am weithio gyda rhanddeiliaid ar bob un o'r 43 argymhelliad i ddatblygu rhaglen o newid. Bydd y cyfeiriad polisi bras yn help inni wireddu nid yn unig ein hymrwymiaidau yn 'Cymru'n Un', gan gynnwys ein targed o godi 6,500 o dai fforddiadwy, ond mae hefyd yn sefydlu fframwaith strategol ar gyfer yr holl rhanddeiliaid i weithio mewn partneriaeth i ddarparu'r tai iawn yn y manau iawn, sef yr hyn y mae ein cymunedau yn ei haeddu.

Derbyniaf y gwelliant yn enw Kirsty Williams ynglŷn â'r adroddiad, ar y ddealltwriaeth glir na allaf ddweud eto y byddaf o reidrwydd yn gweithredu'r argymhellion i gyd yn llawn, a chredaf y byddech yn deall hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn derbyn ysbryd y gwelliant.

O ran gwelliant 4 gan Kirsty Williams, yr ydym yn gweithio gyda Cartrefi Cymunedol Cymru a'r awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau bod ein sylfaen gwybodaeth yn gywir, a gallwn adrodd yn fuan ar y cynnydd a wnaethpwyd hyd yma i gyrraedd ein targed. Cewch yr adroddiad hwnnw cyn gynted ag y bydd ar gael. Felly, yr wyf yn hapus i dderbyn y gwelliant hwnnw.

Ni fyddwn yn anghytuno â llawer o'r hyn a ddywedodd Peter Black, ond fel y dywedais yn gynharach, rhaid ichi fod mewn Llywodraeth i gyflawni, a chollodd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ddau gyfle y llynedd i wneud hynny. Yr oedd Plaid Cymru yn barod i gamu i fyny.

Adfeddiannu sydd â'r potensial mwyaf difrifol i effeithio ar deuluoedd, ac fel y gwyr yr Aelodau, yr wyf eisoes wedi cyhoeddi y byddwn yn darparu hyd at £5 miliwn o arian heb ei rwymo—felly, mae'n arian newydd, Mark—i gefnogi mwy o weithredu i achub morgeisi, gan alluogi landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig i gamu i mewn ac chymryd cartref yn llwyr neu'n rhannol, gan alluogi ei ddeiliaid i osgoi bod yn ddigartref. Mae hynny'n rhoi'r cyfle inni helpu

to turn but temporary accommodation. The scheme has been in existence for some time, although this level of funding has not been allocated to it before. It has the support of lenders, Mark, but if you write to me about issues with any specific lenders, I would be happy to have discussions with them.

I have convened a group from the national housing forum to advise me on what else we need to do, including looking at financial advice and support, and homelessness services. The group is meeting soon, and it includes representatives of Shelter Cymru, the Council of Mortgage Lenders, the Welsh Local Government Association and others, and I expect to receive a suggested action plan from it by August.

We already support a network of independent advice services in 20 local authority areas with funding of £800,000 a year. That can provide support and advice for families at risk. If anyone comes to Members with a problem in this area, Members should encourage them to take advice as early as possible. Traditional lenders are usually happy to negotiate changes to payments, or to work with social landlords on rescue packages, but there must be early dialogue with lenders to access that help.

David Melding was right about the fact that many people have got into financial difficulties—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You need to wind up, Deputy Minister.

**Jocelyn Davies:** However, he is completely wrong to claim that we are attacking the right to buy scheme. You will not be able to put a fag paper between Huw Irranca-Davies and me on this issue, because he is very much on-message on this issue. You are deliberately distorting our message, and you should look at that again.

**Nick Ramsay:** We have had a constructive debate on an important subject that is increasingly affecting and impinging on the

teuluoedd nad oes lle arall o gwbl yn bosibl iddynt droi, ar wahân i lety dros dro. Mae'r cynllun yn bodoli ers tro, er nad yw'r lefel hon o gyllid wedi ei dyrannu iddo o'r blaen. Mae benthycwyr yn ei gefnogi, Mark, ond os ysgrifennwch ataf ynglŷn â phroblemau gydag unrhyw fenthycwyr penodol, byddwn yn hapus i drafod gyda hwy.

Yr wyf wedi cynnull grŵp o'r fforwm tai cenedlaethol i'm cynghori ynglŷn â beth arall y mae angen inni ei wneud, gan gynnwys edrych ar gyngor a chymorth ariannol, a gwasanaethau i'r digartref. Bydd y grŵp yn cwrdd yn fuan, ac mae'n cynnwys cynrychiolwyr o Shelter Cymru, y Cyngor Benthycwyr Morgeisi, Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ac eraill, a disgwyliaf gael cynllun gweithredu a awgrymir ganddo erbyn mis Awst.

Yr ydym eisoes yn cefnogi rhwydwaith o wasanaethau cynghori annibynnol mewn 20 o ardaloedd awdurdodau lleol gyda chyllid o £800,000 y flwyddyn. Gall hynny ddarparu cymorth a chyngor i deuluoedd sydd mewn perygl. Os daw unrhyw un at Aelodau gyda phroblemau yn y maes hwn, dylai'r Aelodau eu hannog i geisio cyngor mor gynnar â phosibl. Fel rheol bydd benthycwyr traddodiadol yn barod i drafod newidiadau mewn taliadau, neu i weithio gyda landlordiaid cymdeithasol ar becynnau achub, ond rhaid trafod yn gynnar gyda benthycwyr i allu cael y cymorth hwnnw.

Yr oedd David Melding yn iawn ynglŷn â'r ffaith fod llawer o bobl wedi mynd i anawsterau ariannol—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae angen ichi ddirwyn i ben, Ddirprwy Weinidog.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Fodd bynnag, mae'n hollol anghywir i honni ein bod yn ymosod ar y cynllun hawl i brynu. Ni allech roi papur sigarét rhwng Huw Irranca-Davies a minnau ar y mater hwn, oherwydd mae'n sicr iawn yn ategu ein neges ni ar y mater hwn. Yr ydych yn ystumio ein neges yn fwriadol, a dylech edrych eto ar hynny.

**Nick Ramsay:** Yr ydym wedi cael dadl adeiladol ar fater pwysig sy'n gynyddol yn cyffwrdd â bywydau pobl ac yn effeithio

lives of many people.

arnynt.

5.00 p.m.

In his opening remarks Mark Isherwood referred to Sue Essex's report on tackling the housing crisis, published last week to widespread approval from Assembly Members. That was a timely report and this debate logically follows on from that.

Yn ei sylwadau agoriadol, cyfeiriodd Mark Isherwood at adroddiad Sue Essex ar fynd i'r afael â'r argyfwng tai a gyhoeddwyd wythnos diwethaf, a chafodd gymeradwyaeth eang gan Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Yr oedd hwnnw'n adroddiad amserol ac mae'r ddadl hon yn dilyn yn rhesymegol o hynny.

During the course of this afternoon, many statistics have been bandied around, and understandably so. The statistics do, by and large, tell a frightening story. I do not intend to reiterate all of the statistics, because we have heard many of them and, as Alun Davies said, you can get lost in a sea of statistics, as I would rather concentrate on the underlying message that encapsulates the problems that we are grappling with here.

Yn ystod y prynhawn yma, taflwyd llawer o ystadegau o amgylch, a hynny'n ddealladwy. At ei gilydd, mae'r ystadegau'n adrodd stori frawychus. Nid wyf yn bwriadu ailadrodd yr holl ystadegau, gan ein bod wedi clywed llawer ohonynt, ac fel y dywedodd Alun Davies, gallwch fynd ar goll mewn môr o ystadegau. Byddai'n well gennyf ganolbwyntio ar y neges sylfaenol sy'n crynhoi'r problemau yr ydym yn mynd i'r afael â hwy yma.

There is a real crisis in the availability of affordable housing in Wales, particularly—although not particularly specified in the motion—for younger people. Housing associations have said, as mentioned by Mark, that shared ownership is one way of dealing with this problem, but that it needs to be underpinned by social housing and grants.

Mae yna argyfwng go iawn o ran gallu cael tai fforddiadwy yng Nghymru, yn benodol—er na nodir hynny'n benodol yn y cynnig—i bobl iau. Mae cymdeithasau tai wedi dweud, fel y soniodd Mark, fod rhannu perchenogaeth yn un ffordd i ymdrin â'r broblem hon, ond bod angen i dai cymdeithasol a grantiau fod yn sail i hynny.

I was intrigued by the Deputy Minister's comments on crisis—how she described it as a 'housing crisis' when in opposition and that she did not see it as such now. I think that we are—

Yr oedd sylwadau'r Dirprwy Weinidog ar argyfwng yn ddiregelwch i mi—y ffordd y disgrifiodd hyn fel 'argyfwng tai' pan oedd yn yr wrthblaid ond nad oedd yn ei ystyried felly'n awr. Yr wyf yn credu ein bod—

**Jocelyn Davies:** What I said is that, if you are in opposition and you table a motion that includes the words 'housing crisis', that does not address the problem; it does not mean anything.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Yr hyn a ddywedais yw, os ydych yn yr wrthblaid ac yn cyflwyno cynnig sy'n cynnwys y geiriau 'argyfwng tai', nid yw hynny'n mynd i'r afael â'r broblem; nid yw'n golygu dim.

**Nick Ramsay:** I was listening. There was a lot of information in the Deputy Minister's contribution, so forgive me if I missed out a couple of points. On that specific point on crisis, I think that we are playing with words—okay, you can say that that that does not tackle it, but I will move on to why I think that action needs to be taken, beyond the words that we use.

**Nick Ramsay:** Yr oeddwn yn gwranddo. Yr oedd llawer o wybodaeth yng nghyfraniad y Dirprwy Weinidog, felly, maddeuwch imi os collais ambell bwynt. Ar y pwynt penodol hwnnw am argyfwng, credaf ein bod yn chwarae â geiriau—iawn, gallwch ddweud nad yw hynny'n mynd i'r afael ag ef, ond symudaf ymlaen at y rheswm pam yr wyf yn credu bod angen cymryd y cam hwnnw, y tu hwnt i'r geiriau a ddefnyddiwn.

The Government clearly does not like the word 'crisis'. We have had many opposition debates where 'crisis' has metamorphosed into a watered-down version of that word—in this case, it is the 'impact of the credit crunch on housing'. Much has been said about the credit crunch and it is clearly a reality; we have seen it coming and it is having a big impact. However, as Peter Black said in his contribution, the Government's amendment confuses the effects of that credit crunch with the housing situation and the lack of available housing. That Government amendment waters down the substance of our motion.

We also veered into the public/private, right-to-buy argument; I do not intend to discuss that, because, ultimately, we need to solve the problem and I think that it will be tackled through a mixture of those things. I do not think that there should be an ideological, dogmatic ruling out of one or the other.

The housing issue goes to the heart of how we protect our communities, particularly our village communities. The Chair of the Rural Development Sub-committee, Alun Davies, hinted at that when he said that this problem touches many different areas and all aspects of the issues that we seek to deal with here as Assembly Members.

Briefly, I am pleased that amendment 3 tabled by the Liberal Democrats has been taken on board by the Government. It seems pretty logical to me that, if you commission a housing task and finish group that comes forward with some important findings—a lot of hard work was done by Sue Essex and that group—you would want the findings to be dealt with and an action plan implemented. Listening to the Deputy Minister's comments, it is clear that she is prepared to support the amendment to take on board the findings of that report; we definitely need that.

There has been action in terms of mortgage rescue but, on this side of the Chamber, we

Mae'n amlwg nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn hoff o'r gair 'argyfwng'. Cawsom nifer o ddadleuon gan yr wrthblaid lle mae 'argyfwng' wedi trawsnewid yn fersiwn wannach o'r gair hwnnw—yn yr achos hwn, 'effaith y wasgfa gredyd ar dai' ydyw. Mae llawer wedi'i ddweud am y wasgfa gredyd ac mae'n amlwg yn realiti; yr ydym wedi'i gweld yn dod ac mae'n cael effaith anferth. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedodd Peter Black yn ei gyfraniad, mae gwelliant y Llywodraeth yn drysu rhwng effeithiau'r wasgfa gredyd honno a'r sefyllfa dai a'r diffyg tai sydd ar gael. Mae'r gwelliant hwnnw gan y Llywodraeth yn glastwreiddio sylwedd ein cynnig.

Troesom hefyd at y ddadl hawl i brynu, cyhoeddus/preifat; nid wyf yn bwriadu trafod hynny, oherwydd yn y pen draw mae angen inni ddatrys y broblem a chredaf mai cymysgedd o'r pethau hynny a fydd yn mynd i'r afael â hi. Nid wyf yn credu y dylid diystyru'r naill na'r llall yn ideolegol ac yn ddogmatig.

Mae'r mater tai yn mynd i wraidd y ffordd yr amddiffynnwn ein cymunedau, yn benodol ein cymunedau pentref. Lledawgrymwyd hynny gan Gadeirydd yr Is-bwyllgor Datblygu Gwledig, Alun Davies, pan ddywedodd fod y broblem hon yn cyffwrdd â nifer o wahanol feysydd a phob agwedd ar y materion y ceisiwn ni'r Aelodau Cynulliad ymdrin â hwy yma.

Yn fyr, yr wyf yn falch fod y Llywodraeth wedi rhoi sylw i welliant 3 gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Pe byddech yn comisiynu grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar dai sy'n cyflwyno rhai darganfyddiadau pwysig—gwnaethpwyd llawer o waith caled gan Sue Essex a'r grŵp hwnnw—mae'n ymddangos yn ddigon rhesymegol i mi y byddech eisiau gweld bod y darganfyddiadau'n cael sylw a bod cynllun gweithredu'n cael ei roi ar waith. O wrando ar sylwadau'r Dirprwy Weinidog, mae'n amlwg ei bod yn barod i gefnogi'r gwelliant i roi sylw i ddarganfyddiadau'r adroddiad hwnnw; mae angen hynny arnom yn bendant.

Cymerwyd camau i achub morgeisi, ond ar yr ochr hon o'r Siambr credwn y gellir

think that more can be done. I know that the Deputy Minister will say that there is a limit to what can be done in any situation, but this is a big topic and our motion, that tried to deal with the problems, has been watered down.

In his contribution, David Melding pointed out that this problem has been developing for many years—it is not new, and no Government will be able to solve it overnight; we clearly recognise that. However, it is important to take action before this runs out of control any further.

In conclusion—I am running out of time—the Joseph Rowntree Foundation has highlighted the massive impact of the shortage of affordable housing on the economy and on the social fabric of our society. Members have taken on board the findings of the task and finish group and I ask them to support our motion and the amendments. They go a long way to recognising the problem and to suggesting a solution that will help people living in Wales now and in the future.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** It is past voting time; does anyone wish for the bell to be rung? I see that that is the case. Clerk, please ring the bell.

5.10 p.m.

### Cyfnod Pleidleisio Voting Time

*Gwelliant 1 i NDM3978: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 42.*

*Amendment 1 to NDM3978: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 42.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Burnham, Eleanor  
German, Michael  
Law, Trish  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Kirsty

gwneud mwy. Gwn y bydd y Dirprwy Weinidog yn dweud bod pen draw i'r hyn y gellir ei wneud mewn unrhyw sefyllfa, ond mae hwn yn bwnc mawr ac mae ein cynnig, a oedd yn ceisio mynd i'r afael â'r problemau, wedi ei lastwreiddio.

Yn ei gyfraniad, eglurodd David Melding fod y broblem hon wedi bod yn datblygu ers blynyddoedd bellach—nid yw'n newydd, ac ni fydd yr un Llywodraeth yn gallu ei datrys dros nos; yr ydym yn cydnabod hynny'n amlwg. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig gweithredu cyn inni golli rheolaeth bellach ar hyn.

I gloi—mae amser yn drech na mi—mae Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree wedi tynnu sylw at effaith enfawr y diffyg tai fforddiadwy ar yr economi ac ar ffabrig cymdeithasol ein cymdeithas. Mae aelodau wedi rhoi sylw i ddarganfyddiadau'r grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen, a gofynnaf iddynt gefnogi ein cynnig a'r gwelliannau. Maent yn gwneud llawer i gydnabod y broblem, ac i awgrymu ateb a fydd yn helpu pobl sy'n byw yng Nghymru heddiw ac yn y dyfodol.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae'r amser pleidleisio wedi mynd heibio; a oes unrhyw un yn dymuno i'r gloch gael ei chanu? Gwelaf fod. Glerc, canwch y gloch, os gwelwch yn dda.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Asghar, Mohammad  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Burns, Angela  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris

Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jenkins, Bethan  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Millar, Darren  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Ramsay, Nick  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Tynnwyd gwelliant 2 i NDM3978 yn ôl.  
 Amendment 2 to NDM3978 withdrawn.*

*Gwelliant 3 i NDM3978: O blaid 35, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 12.  
 Amendment 3 to NDM3978: For 35, Abstain 0, Against 12.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Asghar, Mohammad  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Alun  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Evans, Nerys  
 Franks, Chris  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 James, Irene  
 Jenkins, Bethan  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Burnham, Eleanor  
 Burns, Angela  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Melding, David  
 Millar, Darren  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Ramsay, Nick  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty



Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Trish  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 4 i NDM3978: O blaid 35, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 12.  
 Amendment 4 to NDM3978: For 35, Abstain 0, Against 12.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Asghar, Mohammad  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Alun  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Evans, Nerys  
 Franks, Chris  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 James, Irene  
 Jenkins, Bethan  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Trish  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment carried.*

Motion NDM3978 as amended: that

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Burnham, Eleanor  
 Burns, Angela  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Melding, David  
 Millar, Darren  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Ramsay, Nick  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Cynnig NDM3978 fel y'i diwygiwyd: bod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

1. *recognises that access to Welsh-medium education is not a matter of local priority but is a national issue;*

2. *calls on the Assembly Government to ensure that the transport needs of pupils who wish to study primarily in Welsh are met by local authorities;*

3. *commends the Welsh Assembly Government's action to ensure, that for the first time, a statutory duty will be placed on local authorities to promote, through transport provision, Welsh-medium education.*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

1. *yn cydnabod nad yw mynediad at addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg yn fater o flaenoriaeth leol ond yn hytrach yn fater cenedlaethol:*

2. *yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i sicrhau bod anghenion cludiant disgyblion sy'n dymuno astudio'n bennaf drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn cael eu bodloni gan awdurdodau lleol;*

3. *yn cymeradwyo'r hyn y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi'i wneud i sicrhau, am y tro cyntaf, y caiff dyletswydd statudol ei rhoi ar awdurdodau lleol i hyrwyddo addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg trwy ddarparu cludiant.*

*Cynnig NDM3978 fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 34, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 12.  
Motion NDM3978 as amended: For 34, Abstain 0, Against 12.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Asghar, Mohammad  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
James, Irene  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Melding, David  
Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ramsay, Nick  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd cynnig NDM3978 fel y'i diwygiwyd.  
Motion NDM3978 as amended carried.*

*Gwelliant 1 i NDM3979: O blaid 33, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 13.  
Amendment 1 to NDM3979: For 33, Abstain 0, Against 13.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Asghar, Mohammad  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Alun  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
James, Irene  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Davies, Jocelyn  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Melding, David  
Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ramsay, Nick  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 2 i NDM3979: O blaid 35, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 12.  
Amendment 2 to NDM3979: For 35, Abstain 0, Against 12.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Asghar, Mohammad  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Melding, David  
Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ramsay, Nick  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
James, Irene  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 3 i NDM3979: O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 3 to NDM3979: For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Asghar, Mohammad  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David

Mewies, Sandy  
Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Ramsay, Nick  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 4 i NDM3979: O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 4 to NDM3979: For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Asghar, Mohammad  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Ramsay, Nick  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl

Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment carried.*

Motion NDM3979 as amended: that  
*this Assembly*

Cynnig NDM3979 fel y'i diwygiwyd: bod  
*y Cynulliad hwn*

*1. recognises that tackling the impact of the credit crunch on housing is essential to the wellbeing of Wales and its people, and commends the Government for its action to date including establishing a mortgage rescue scheme and commissioning the Essex report;*

*1. yn cydnabod bod mynd i'r afael ag effaith y wasgfa gredyd ar dai yn hanfodol i les Cymru a'i phobl, ac mae'n canmol y Llywodraeth am yr hyn y mae wedi'i wneud hyd yma gan gynnwys sefydlu cynllun achub morgeisi a chomisiynu adroddiad Essex.*

*2. welcomes the affordable housing task and finish group's report and calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to put in place a measurable action plan on how it will deliver on the recommendations of the report;*

*2. yn croesawu adroddiad y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar dai fforddiadwy ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i roi cynllun gweithredu mesuradwy ar waith ynghylch sut y bydd yn cyflawni argymhellion yr adroddiad;*

*3. calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to report at the earliest possible opportunity on how they will monitor the number of new affordable properties built in Wales.*

*3. yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i adrodd cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl ynghylch sut y byddant yn monitro nifer yr eiddo fforddiadwy newydd a adeiladir yng Nghymru.*

*Cynnig NDM3978 fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 35, Ymatal 4, Yn erbyn 8.  
 Motion NDM3978 as amended: For 35, Abstain 4, Against 8.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Asghar, Mohammad  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Alun  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Evans, Nerys  
 Franks, Chris  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 James, Irene  
 Jenkins, Bethan  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Burns, Angela  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Melding, David  
 Millar, Darren  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Ramsay, Nick  
 Williams, Brynle

Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Trish  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wood, Leanne

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Burnham, Eleanor  
 German, Michael  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig NDM3978 fel y'i diwygiwyd.  
 Motion NDM3978 as amended carried.*

### **Dadl Fer Short Debate**

#### **60 Mlynedd ers Sefydlu'r GIG: Treftadaeth Falch a Dyfodol Disglair The NHS 60 Years on: a Proud Heritage and a Bright Future**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Members should leave the Chamber if they intend to have a discussion. First Minister and Deputy First Minister, could you have your conversation outside please? Thank you.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I am grateful for the opportunity to present this debate to the Assembly today. I am pleased to accept requests from Jenny Randerson and Jonathan Morgan for a minute each of my allotted time.

This week we celebrate the sixtieth birthday of our national health service. My contention today is that this really is a cause for celebration, and that, as we move the service forward over the next 60 years, we should hold fast to the core values of justice, equity and responsibility for one another—socialist values—that led to its establishment.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Dylai Aelodau adael y Siambr os ydynt yn bwriadu cael trafodaeth. Brif Weinidog a Dirprwy Brif Weinidog, a allech gael eich sgwrs y tu allan, os gwelwch yn dda? Diolch.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle i gyflwyno'r ddadl hon i'r Cynulliad heddiw. Yr wyf yn falch derbyn ceisiadau gan Jenny Randerson a Jonathan Morgan am funud yr un o'r amser a bennwyd imi.

Yr wythnos hon yr ydym yn dathlu pen-blwydd ein gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yn drigain oed. Fy nadl heddiw yw bod hyn yn wirioneddol yn achos dathlu, ac wrth symud y gwasanaeth yn ei flaen dros y 60 mlynedd nesaf y dylem ddal yn dynn yn gwerthoedd craidd, sef cyfiawnder, tegwch a chyfrifoldeb dros ein gilydd—gwerthoedd sosialaidd—a arweiniodd at ei sefydlu.

*Daeth William Graham i'r Gadair am 5.14 p.m.  
 William Graham took the Chair at 5.14 p.m.*

We rightly spend much time in the Chamber debating the challenges faced by the NHS today. In the last few weeks, we have examined the problems with ambulance response times, the poor quality of end-of-life care in some parts of Wales and the difficulties faced in bringing new drugs and treatments into use. During those debates, we all always make reference to the excellent work that staff do, to their commitment, and so on, but I am sometimes left feeling that if historians were to use our Record of Proceedings and only that, including my own contributions, as the sole measure by which to judge the health service in Wales at the beginning of the twenty-first century, they would be left with the impression that it was in a terrible mess. Without being complacent for one minute, as there is much work to do, which will always be the case, our health service is, on the whole, there for us when we need it. To suggest that it is a total mess could not be further from the truth. Our health professionals are committed, caring and highly skilled. They love what they do and they do it well.

For every patient who is failed in some way—and even one patient is one too many—who waits for too long, who cannot get the treatment that he or she needs or who is subject to discourtesy or unkindness, there are literally thousands treated every day who are pleased and grateful for the care that they receive, and whose lives are literally saved or immeasurably improved by their contact with our services. We should never forget that.

With the acting Deputy Presiding Officer's indulgence I invite Members to join me for a moment in the TARDIS to travel to a parallel universe in which Labour was defeated in the general election of 1945. The Beveridge report is never implemented, health services are never Tredegarised, and so we struggle on. The wealthy and the middle classes pay. Those with half decent jobs, such as miners and steelworkers, insure themselves, their families and each other. The rest: the poor, the old and disabled rely on charity. Time

Yr ydym yn briodol yn treulio llawer o amser yn y Siambr yn dadlau'r heriau sy'n wynebu'r GIG heddiw. Yn yr ychydig wythnosau diwethaf yr ydym wedi archwilio'r problemau gydag amseroedd ymateb ambiwlans, ansawdd gwael gofal diwedd oes mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru, a'r anawsterau a wynebir o ddechrau defnyddio cyffuriau a thriniaethau newydd. Yn ystod y dadleuon hynny byddwn yn cyfeirio bob amser at y gwaith rhagorol a wneir gan staff, eu hymrwymiad, ac yn y blaen, ond weithiau byddaf yn teimlo wedyn, petai haneswyr yn defnyddio Cofnod y Trafodion, a hynny'n unig, gan gynnwys fy nghyfraniadau i fy hun, fel yr unig ffordd i fesur gwerth y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru ar ddechrau'r unfed ganrif ar hugain, byddent yn cael yr argraff ei fod mewn cyflwr difrifol. Heb geisio swnio'n hunanfodlon am eiliad, oherwydd mae llawer o waith i'w wneud, a bydd hynny'n wir bob amser, mae ein gwasanaeth iechyd, ar y cyfan, yno inni pan fydd arnom ei angen. Byddai awgrymu ei fod yn llanastr llwyr ymhell iawn o fod yn wir. Mae ein gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol yn ymroddedig, yn ofalus iawn o'u cleifion ac yn fedrus iawn. Maent wrth eu bodd yn eu gwaith ac yn ei wneud yn dda.

Am bob claf y gwneir cam ag ef mewn rhyw ffordd—ac mae hyd yn oed un claf yn ormod—drwy orfod aros yn rhy hir, methu â chael y driniaeth y mae ei hangen arno ef neu hi neu ddioddef anghwrteisi neu angharedigrwydd, mae miloedd yn llythrennol yn cael triniaeth bob dydd ac yn teimlo'n fodlon ac yn ddiolchgar am y gofal a gânt. Caiff bywydau'r bobl hyn eu hachub yn llythrennol, neu eu gwella'n fawr iawn o ganlyniad i'w cysylltiad â'n gwasanaethau. Ni ddylem byth anghofio hynny.

Gyda chaniatâd y Dirprwy Lywydd dros dro, gwahoddaf yr Aelodau i ymuno â mi am eiliad yn y TARDIS a theithio i fydsawd cyfochrog lle trechwyd Llafur yn etholiad cyffredinol 1945. Nid yw adroddiad Beveridge yn cael ei weithredu, nid yw Tredegar yn cael dylanwad ar wasanaethau iechyd, ac mae bywyd yn mynd yn ei flaen. Mae'r cyfoethog a'r dosbarthiadau canol yn talu. Mae'r rheini sydd â swyddi da, fel glöwyr a gweithwyr dur, yn eu hyswiro'u hunain, yn yswiro'u teuluoedd ac yn



moves on. More complex and costly treatments are invented. The health of the wealthy minority improves dramatically, especially when it comes to such things as surviving cancer. The majority in the middle still struggle on, often finding that their insurance is inadequate or does not cover what they really need. People sell their homes and all that they have to fund their child's cancer treatment or their parent's Alzheimer's drugs. The poor minority suffer a lack of care that would disgrace the world's poorest nation: mugged pensioners are refused care in accident and emergency departments because they lack insurance, mothers give birth alone and unattended, infant mortality rates are on a par with sub-Saharan Africa, and the massive vested interests of insurance companies, drug companies and certain sections of the medical elite block all government attempts at reform.

It is a portrait of healthcare—or the lack of it—in the United States of America today. It is a portrait of what might have happened here without socialism, 1945, Nye Bevan and—fair play—the Labour Party. Let us travel with great relief and gratitude back to where we really are today, to a service that is, on the whole, free at the point of delivery and which, on the whole, serves us very well.

When it is suggested that we should keep politics out of the NHS we need to remember that it was a political decision that established the NHS. When ideologically motivated decision making in the NHS is criticised, we should remember that free healthcare, or healthcare paid for by taxes levied on those who can afford them and free to those who need it, is all about ideology. There is a world of difference between ideology, belief and dogmatic inflexibility. Bevan said that a free health service is pure socialism, and he was right.

yswirio'i gilydd. Mae'r gweddill, y tlawd, yr hen a'r anabl, yn dibynnu ar elusen. Mae amser yn mynd yn ei flaen. Mae triniaethau mwy cymhleth a mwy costus yn cael eu dyfeisio. Mae iechyd y lleiafrif cyfoethog yn gwella'n sylweddol, yn enwedig o ran datblygiadau fel trechu cancer. Mae'r mwyafrif yn y canol yn dal i ymlafnio, ac yn gweld yn aml fod eu hyswiriant yn annigonol neu'n methu darparu ar gyfer yr hyn y mae arnynt ei angen. Mae pobl yn gwerthu eu cartrefi a phopeth sydd ganddynt i dalu am driniaeth cancer i'w plentyn neu am gyffuriau Alzheimer i un o'u rhieni. Mae'r lleiafrif tlawd yn dioddef diffyg gofal a fyddai'n codi cywilydd ar wledydd tlotaf y byd: gwrthodir gofal mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion bryd i bensynwyr sydd wedi eu mygio am nad oes ganddynt yswiriant, mae mamau'n geni babanod ar eu pen eu hunain a heb gymorth, mae cyfraddau marwolaethau babanod yr un fath â chyfraddau gwledydd i'r de o'r Sahara ar gyfandir Affrica, ac mae budd aruthrol cwmnïau yswiriant, cwmnïau cyffuriau a rhai cyrff meddygol yn rhwystro holl ymdrechion y llywodraeth i ddiwygio.

Mae'n bortread o ofal iechyd—neu ddiffyg gofal iechyd—yn Unol Daleithiau America heddiw. Mae'n bortread o'r hyn a allai fod wedi digwydd yma heb sosialaeth, 1945, Nye Bevan a—chwarae teg—y Blaid Lafur. Gadewch inni symud gyda rhyddhad a diolchgarwch mawr yn ôl at yr hyn sydd gennym mewn gwirionedd heddiw, at wasanaeth sydd, ar y cyfan, am ddim lla caiff ei ddarparu ac sydd, ar y cyfan, yn ein gwasanaethu'n dda iawn.

Pan awgrymir y dylem gadw gwleidyddiaeth allan o'r GIG mae angen inni gofio mai o ganlyniad i benderfyniad gwleidyddol y sefydlwyd y GIG. Pan fydd pobl yn beirniadu penderfyniadau sy'n seiliedig ar gymhelliant ideolegol yn y GIG, dylem gofio bod gofal iechyd di-dâl, neu ofal iechyd y telir amdano drwy drethi a godir ar y rhai hynny a all eu fforddio, ac sydd ar gael am ddim i'r rheini y mae arnynt ei angen, yn ymwneud ag ideoleg. Mae gwahaniaeth mawr rhwng ideoleg, cred ac anhyblygrwydd dogmataidd. Dywedodd Bevan mai sosialaeth lwyr yw gwasanaeth iechyd di-dâl, ac yr oedd yn llygad ei le.

Successive Westminster Governments have undermined the original principles of the NHS, either for pragmatic financial reasons in the case of previous Labour administrations, or for ideologically motivated ones in the case of the Tories and New Labour. The absurd Thatcherite obsession with the market as the only effective mechanism for delivery has been not only unchallenged by New Labour in London, but wholeheartedly embraced, and I am frankly at a loss to understand why.

There is no valid evidence that competition between healthcare providers does anything but place already vulnerable services under intolerable pressure. Those services are usually the services that serve the poorest communities. The idea of patient choice has never been much more than a polite fiction in most of Wales, where geography or deprivation makes access to alternative services impossible. Private finance initiatives are a very costly way to fund capital developments, leaving our children with a legacy of debt for which they will not thank us. We know the result of contracting out cleaning and catering services: high infection rates and patient malnutrition.

That is not what we want in Wales. Previous Assembly Governments, in all their contributions, despite many decisions with which I would not have agreed, began the process of separation, moving away from a market-driven agenda to a patient-focused one, placing a strong emphasis on public health, and developing strong policy on issues such as mental health and carers' rights. It is interesting to see the extent to which these developments, and this divergence, have received cross-party support from all across this Assembly, despite some real and justified concerns from the opposition and the backbenches about delivery.

5.20 p.m.

It is ironic, given Bevan's almost pathological hostility to the idea of devolution and to Welsh nationalist politics

Mae'r naill Lywodraeth ar ôl y llall yn San Steffan wedi tanseilio egwyddorion gwreiddiol y GIG, am resymau ariannol pragmataidd yn achos gweinyddiaethau Llafur blaenorol, neu am resymau ideolegol yn achos y Toriaid a Llafur Newydd. Yn hytrach na herio'r obsesiwn Thatcheriaidd hurt gyda'r farchnad fel yr unig fecanwaith effeithiol i ddarparu gwasanaethau, mae Llafur Newydd yn Llundain wedi'i groesawu â breichiau agored, ac yr wyf yn methu'n glir â deall pam.

Nid oes tystiolaeth ddilys fod cystadleuaeth rhwng darparwyr gofal iechyd yn gwneud dim ond rhoi mwy o bwysau ar wasanaethau sydd eisoes dan bwysau. Y gwasanaethau hynny fel rheol yw'r gwasanaethau sy'n gwasanaethu'r cymunedau tlotaf. Nid yw'r syniad o gynnig dewis i gleifion erioed wedi bod fawr mwy na chelwydd golau yn y rhan fwyaf o Gymru, lle mae daearyddiaeth neu amddifadedd yn golygu ei bod yn amhosibl i bobl ddefnyddio gwasanaethau eraill. Mae mentrau cyllid preifat yn ffordd gostus iawn o gyllido datblygiadau cyfalaf, ac yn gadael dyled i'n plant na fyddant yn diolch inni amdani. Gwyddom beth yw canlyniad rhoi gwasanaethau glanhau ac arlwyo ar gontract: cyfraddau heintio uchel a diffyg bwyd maethlon i gleifion.

Nid dyna y mae arnom ei eisiau yng Nghymru. Dechreuodd Llywodraethau blaenorol y Cynulliad, yn eu holl gyfraniadau, er gwaethaf llawer o benderfyniadau na fyddwn wedi cytuno â hwy, ar y broses o wahanu, symud i ffwrdd o agenda'n seiliedig ar y farchnad at agenda'n seiliedig ar y claf, gan roi pwyslais cryf ar iechyd y cyhoedd, a datblygu polisi cryf ar faterion fel iechyd y meddwl a hawliau gofalwyr. Mae'n ddiddorol gweld bod y datblygiadau hyn, a'r ymwahanu hwn, wedi cael cymaint o gefnogaeth gan yr holl bleidiau ar draws y Cynulliad hwn, er gwaethaf rhai pryderon dilys a theg gan y gwrthbleidiau a'r meincwyr cefn ynglŷn â dulliau darparu.

Mae'n eironig, o gofio'r agwedd elyniaethus, batholegol bron, a oedd gan Bevan at y syniad o ddatganoli a gwleidyddiaeth

that it has taken the devolution process and the Labour-Plaid One Wales Government to return his beloved health service to its core value base in socialism. Goodness knows what he would have made of New Labour. As I sat in a television studio with Ben Bradshaw this week, I found myself wondering whether Bevan would recognise him as a member of the same species, never mind of the same political party. However, here in Wales, in the hands of the One Wales Government, Bevan's legacy is not only safe, but flourishing. I am proud to support a Government that has shown that it really values our NHS staff by involving them actively in decision making, by proactively addressing concerns about issues such as safety at work, and by paying our nurses their pay award in full.

I am proud that the One Wales Government has reversed the centralising tendencies of previous administrations and is now committed to providing services as close as possible to patients' homes, and to a rural health plan that will protect and enhance services in our rural communities. I am proud that this Government will not saddle future generations with further private finance initiative charges in health, that it is ending hospital car parking charges, and is wresting back basic services such as cleaning out of the hands of private firms and handing control back to ward sisters.

Soon, this Government will take steps to address an area where even Aneurin Bevan lost his nerve. He nationalised our hospitals, but left primary care services in the hands of private contractors—GPs, dentists and opticians. This model has, on the whole, worked very well, with those contractors giving excellent services to their communities, but it has risks, as has been shown by the many dentists opting out of NHS provision altogether because they were not happy with the contract at the time. In some of our most needy communities, it is now getting harder to persuade young doctors to take on traditional GP practices. They may want to practice medicine, but they may not want to run a small business. While continuing to work closely with practitioners

genedlaetholgar Gymreig, mai'r broses ddatganoli a Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un gan Lafur-Plaid sydd wedi dod â'r gwasanaeth iechyd, a oedd mor agos at ei galon, yn ôl at ei wreiddiau sosialaidd. Duw a wŷr beth fyddai ei farn am Lafur Newydd. Pan oeddwn yn eistedd mewn stiwdio deledu gyda Ben Bradshaw yr wythnos hon, dechreuais feddwl tybed a fyddai Bevan yn ei weld fel aelod o'r un rhywogaeth, heb sôn am aelod o'r un blaid wleidyddol. Fodd bynnag, yma yng Nghymru, yn nwylo Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un, mae etifeddiaeth Bevan yn ddiogel, ac yn ffynnu. Yr wyf yn falch cefnogi Llywodraeth sydd wedi dangos ei bod yn gwerthfawrogi staff y GIG drwy eu cynnwys yn effeithiol wrth wneud penderfyniadau, drwy roi sylw rhagweithiol i bryderon ynglŷn â materion fel diogelwch yn y gwaith, a thrwy roi codiad cyflog llawn i' nyrsys.

Yr wyf yn falch bod Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un wedi gwrthdroi tueddiadau gweinyddiaethau blaenorol i ganoli pethau, ac wedi ymrwymo'n awr i ddarparu gwasanaethau mor agos â phosibl at gartrefi cleifion, ac i gynllun iechyd gwledig a fydd yn diogelu ac yn gwella gwasanaethau yn ein cymunedau gwledig. Yr wyf yn falch na fydd y Llywodraeth hon yn llethu cenedlaethau'r dyfodol â mwy o daliadau mentrau cyllid preifat ym maes iechyd, ei bod yn rhoi'r gorau i godi tâl am barcio mewn ysbytai, a'i bod yn tynnu gwasanaethau fel glanhau o ddwylo cwmnïau preifat ac yn rhoi rheolaeth yn ôl yn nwylo prif nyrsys wardiau.

Cyn hir bydd y Llywodraeth hon yn cymryd camau i roi sylw i faes lle'r oedd Aneurin Bevan hyd yn oed yn digalonni. Gwladolodd ein hysbytai, ond gadawodd wasanaethau gofal sylfaenol yn nwylo contractwyr preifat—meddygon teulu, deintyddion ac optegwyr. Mae'r model hwn wedi gweithio'n dda iawn ar y cyfan, a'r contractwyr hynny'n rhoi gwasanaethau rhagorol i'w cymunedau. Ond mae yna risgiau, fel y gwelwyd wrth i nifer o ddeintyddion eithrio allan o ddarpariaeth y GIG yn gyfan gwbl am nad oeddent yn fodlon â'r contract bryd hynny. Mae'n mynd yn anos, yn rhai o'n cymunedau mwyaf anghenus, i berswadio meddygon ifanc i ymgymryd â phractisau meddygon teulu traddodiadol. Hwyrach eu bod yn dymuno bod yn feddygon, ond nid ydynt yn

providing services on a contract basis, who will remain the majority providers, and so they should, for many years to come, the One Wales Government will soon pilot truly public sector primary care through community wellbeing centres, where salaried community doctors will work side by side, on an equal basis, with nurses, therapists, social workers, advice workers and whatever that community needs. What a contrast to London New Labour's massive, remote, privately run polyclinics.

I firmly believe that the NHS has a very bright future here in Wales. The emphasis will be more and more on services in the community, on empowering patients to manage their own conditions, on public health and health promotion and on empowering staff. We will develop excellence, but not at the expense of providing services close to people's homes. Here I would like to pay tribute, as an example, to the world-class breast care services provided by Mr Simon Holt and his team at Llanelli hospital—a hospital about which we were told, 18 months ago, that it was too small, too close to other hospitals and only really fit to deliver cottage-hospital-style services.

Of course, there will be many challenges, such as providing new treatments, meeting the needs of an ageing population and, perhaps above all, funding. While this parliamentary body, this National Assembly, and our Government has less right to raise revenue than the community council in my home village, Trimsaran, we will face real threats to the funding of all our services, especially with the prospect of a Tory Government looming at Westminster. My friend, Jonathan Morgan, may well be too young to remember what happened the last time that the Tories controlled health spending in Wales, but some of us are a little bit longer in the tooth.

All that said, I am confident that we will meet those challenges. This Government, with

dymuno rhedeg busnes bach. Gan ddal i weithio mewn cysylltiad agos ag ymarferwyr sy'n darparu gwasanaethau ar sail contract, sef y mwyafrif o'r darparwyr o hyd, a dylent yn sicr fod yn y mwyafrif, am flynyddoedd eto, bydd Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un cyn hir yn treialu gofal sylfaenol sy'n wirioneddol seiliedig ar y sector cyhoeddus drwy ganolfannau lles cymunedol, lle bydd meddygon cymunedol cyflogedig yn gweithio ochr yn ochr, ar sail gyfartal, â nyrsys, therapyddion, gweithwyr cymdeithasol, gweithwyr cynghori a beth bynnag y mae ar y gymuned honno ei angen. Y fath gyferbyniad â pholyclinigau preifat, enfawr a phell Llafur Newydd yn Llundain.

Credaf yn gryf fod dyfodol llewyrchus iawn i'r GIG yma yng Nghymru. Bydd mwy a mwy o bwyslais ar wasanaethau yn y gymuned, ar alluogi cleifion i reoli eu hanhwylderau eu hunain, ar iechyd y cyhoedd a hybu iechyd ac ar roi grym i staff. Byddwn yn datblygu rhagoriaeth, ond nid ar draul darparu gwasanaethau'n agos at gartrefi pobl. Hoffwn roi teyrnged yma, fel enghraifft, i'r gwasanaethau rhagorol ym maes gofal y fron sy'n cael eu darparu gan Mr Simon Holt a'i dîm yn ysbyty Llanelli—ysbyty y dywedwyd wrthym, 18 mis yn ôl, ei fod yn rhy fach, ac yn rhy agos at ysbytai eraill, ac nad oedd yn addas mewn gwirionedd i ddarparu dim mwy na gwasanaethau ysbyty bach.

Wrth gwrs, bydd llawer her, megis darparu triniaethau newydd, diwallu anghenion poblogaeth sy'n heneiddio, ac yn anad dim, efallai, cyllido. Er bod gan y corff seneddol hwn, y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol hwn, a'n Llywodraeth lai o hawl i godi refereniw na'r cyngor cymuned yn fy mhentref i, Trimsaran, byddwn yn wynebu bygythiadau gwirioneddol yng nghyswllt cyllido ein holl wasanaethau, yn enwedig os oes perygl gweld Llywodraeth Doriaidd yn San Steffan. Mae'n bosibl fod fy nghyfaill, Jonathan Morgan, yn rhy ifanc i gofio beth a ddigwyddodd y tro diwethaf pan oedd y Toriaid yn rheoli gwariant iechyd yng Nghymru, ond mae rhai ohonom ychydig yn hŷn.

Wedi dweud hynny, yr wyf yn hyderus y byddwn yn ateb yr heriau hynny. Mae'r

staff, with patients and with communities, building as much consensus as possible across this Chamber without unacceptable compromise, is laying the foundations for the next 60 years. While it continues to do so from a basis of belief—a socialist basis—as I am sure that it will, it will be guaranteed not only my support, but that of the people of Wales.

Let us celebrate today the last 60 years and look forward, while acknowledging the challenges to come, to a bright future for our NHS. In doing so, let us remember with gratitude the staff who have served our communities so well and those who, 60 years ago, had the courage of their political convictions and took the bold step of establishing this service of which we are all so proud.

**Jenny Randerson:** I thank Helen Mary for allowing me to speak briefly. I want to take issue, however, with her reference to socialist values. The establishment of the NHS is firmly based on the work of William Beveridge, who wrote the Beveridge report as the result of a commission of the British Government between 1940 and 1945, which included members from all three parties. Beveridge was a prominent Liberal whose views were strongly influenced by the welfare reforms of David Lloyd George. It fell to the Labour Party to implement the Beveridge report, and all praise to it for doing so. However, Bevan would never have succeeded had he been afraid to embrace the new and the controversial. As the NHS faces the future, the Assembly Government owes it to the people of Wales to have the same vision and courage as Nye Bevan. I predict that you will not succeed in preserving the precious fundamental principle of the NHS, that is, services for all who need them free at the point of need, if you spend your time looking backwards to a so-called golden era of socialism.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I thank Helen Mary Jones for raising this subject today. As we approach the sixtieth anniversary this coming weekend of the creation of the national health service, it is appropriate that we should

Llywodraeth hon, gyda staff, cleifion a chymunedau, gan ddatblygu cymaint o gonsensws â phosibl ar draws y Siambr hon heb gyfaddawdu annerbyniol, yn gosod y sylfeini ar gyfer y 60 mlynedd nesaf. Tra bydd yn dal i wneud hynny ar sail cred—sail sosialaidd—fel yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnaiff, bydd yn sicr o gael fy nghefnogaeth i, a chefnogaeth pobl Cymru.

Gadewch inni heddiw ddatlu'r 60 mlynedd diwethaf ac edrych ymlaen, gan gydnabod yr heriau sydd i ddod, at ddyfodol disglair i'n GIG. Wrth wneud hynny, gadewch inni gofio'n ddiolchgar am y staff sydd wedi rhoi cystal gwasanaeth i'n cymunedau a'r bobl hynny, 60 mlynedd yn ôl, a oedd ag argyhoeddiad gwleidyddol cryf ac a gymerodd y cam dewr o sefydlu'r gwasanaeth hwn yr ydym i gyd mor falch ohono.

**Jenny Randerson:** Hoffwn ddiolch i Helen Mary am adael imi ddweud gair neu ddau. Hoffwn gwestiynu, fodd bynnag, ei chyfeiriad at werthoedd sosialaidd. Mae sefydliad y GIG wedi'i seilio'n gadarn ar waith William Beveridge, a ysgrifennodd adroddiad Beveridge o ganlyniad i gomisiwn a sefydlwyd gan Lywodraeth Prydain rhwng 1940 a 1945 a oedd yn cynnwys aelodau o'r tair plaid. Yr oedd Beveridge yn Rhyddfrydwr blaenllaw a dylanwad diwygiadau lles David Lloyd George yn gryf arno. Y Blaid Lafur a gafodd y gwaith o weithredu adroddiad Beveridge, a phob clod iddi am wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddai Bevan byth wedi llwyddo petai arno ofn derbyn syniadau newydd a dadleuol. Wrth i'r GIG wynebu'r dyfodol, mae'n ddyletswydd ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, er mwyn pobl Cymru, i gael yr un weledigaeth a'r un dewrder â Nye Bevan. Rhagwelaf na fyddwch yn llwyddo i gadw egwyddor sylfaenol werthfawr y GIG, hynny yw, gwasanaethau i bawb y mae eu hangen arnynt yn rhad ac am ddim lle mae eu hangen, os btreulwch eich amser yn edrych yn ôl at yr hyn a elwir yn oes aur sosialaeth.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Hoffwn ddiolch i Helen Mary Jones am godi'r pwnc hwn heddiw. A ninnau'n dathlu trigain mlynedd ers sefydlu'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol y penwythnos hwn, mae'n briodol inni ddatlu popeth y

celebrate all that the NHS has achieved in the past 60 years. I would like to do one thing this afternoon, which is to congratulate and thank all those who have worked in the NHS during those 60 years: those who were there at its foundation and those who are working in it now. They are dedicated and capable professionals, who we are lucky to have serving patients in Wales. They are the health service's greatest asset, and we cannot ever forget the enormous contribution that those staff make to the healthcare of the people of Wales now, and will make in the future. It is the duty of the Assembly Government and the Assembly to recognise that contribution always and to ensure that we support them in their all-important task.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Edwina Hart):** The contributions and discussion have been enjoyable, and I am glad that we have had the opportunity to spend some time in the Assembly celebrating the national health service, because it is a cause for celebration, and, as Jonathan indicated, we should celebrate all the excellent NHS staff who have dedicated their lives to the service over the last 60 years, because they are the asset that we most value.

A lot can be said about this subject. We could go back to the history, as Jenny did, but the theme on which I would like to concentrate is one of the great ideas that animated the founders of the welfare state, which was freedom. Those who opposed the foundation of the NHS, and let us not forget who was included in that—the doctors, and as a matter of policy, the Conservative Party—thought that it would be an assault on individual freedom. Those were some of the issues at the time. Those people saw the NHS as preventing individuals from pursuing their best interests and spending their money as they saw fit to obtain the sort of medical advice that they would prefer and so on. In practice, the health service has delivered the sort of freedom that any socialist would readily understand and which was so readily apparent to its founder: freedom from fear, from want and from disease.

It delivered freedom from fear, because before the NHS illness brought not simply

mae'r GIG wedi'i gyflawni yn ystod y 60 mlynedd diwethaf. Hoffwn wneud un peth y prynhawn yma, sef llongyfarch a diolch i bawb sydd wedi gweithio yn y GIG yn ystod y 60 mlynedd hynny: y rheini a oedd yno yn y dyddiau cynnar a'r rheini sy'n gweithio ynddo heddiw. Maent yn weithwyr proffesiynol ymroddedig a galluog, ac yr ydym yn ffodus iawn o'u cael i wasanaethu cleifion yng Nghymru. Dyna ased mwyaf y gwasanaeth iechyd, ac ni allwn byth anghofio cyfraniad aruthrol y staff hynny i ofal iechyd pobl Cymru heddiw, na'u cyfraniad yn y dyfodol. Mae'n ddyletswydd ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r Cynulliad i gydnabod y cyfraniad hwnnw bob amser ac i sicrhau ein bod yn eu cefnogi yn eu gwaith hollbwysig.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Edwina Hart):** Yr wyf wedi mwynhau gwrando ar y cyfraniadau a'r drafodaeth, ac yr wyf yn falch ein bod wedi cael cyfle i dreulio ychydig amser yn y Cynulliad yn dathlu'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol, oherwydd mae gennym le i ddathlu. Ac fel y dywedodd Jonathan, dylem ddathlu holl staff rhagorol y GIG sydd wedi rhoi eu bywyd i'r gwasanaeth yn ystod y 60 mlynedd diwethaf, oherwydd hwy yw'r ased yr ydym yn ei werthfawrogi fwyaf.

Gellir dweud llawer am y pwnc hwn. Gallem fynd yn ôl at yr hanes, fel y gwnaeth Jenny, ond y thema yr hoffwn ganolbwyntio arni yw un o'r syniadau mawr a ysgogodd sylfaenwyr y wladwriaeth les, sef rhyddid. Yr oedd y rheini a oedd yn gwrthwynebu sefydlu'r GIG, a chofiwch pwy oedd ymhlith y rheini—y meddygon, ac fel mater o bolisi, y Blaid Geidwadol—yn credu y byddai'n amharu ar ryddid yr unigolyn. Dyna rai o'r pryderon ar y pryd. Credai'r bobl hynny y byddai'r GIG yn atal unigolion rhag cael yr hyn a fyddai o les iddynt, a rhag gwario'u harian fel y gwelent orau er mwyn cael y math o gyngor meddygol y byddai'n well ganddynt ei gael, ac yn y blaen. Mewn gwirionedd, mae'r gwasanaeth iechyd wedi cyflwyno'r math o ryddid a fyddai'n gwbl ddealladwy i unrhyw sosialydd ac a oedd mor amlwg i'w sylfaenydd: rhyddid rhag ofn, rhag eisiau a rhag afiechyd.

Yr oedd yn rhoi rhyddid rhag ofn, oherwydd cyn y GIG byddai pobl yn pryderu nid yn

the anxiety that comes with ill health, but fear about not being able to afford treatment. It delivered freedom from want, because the struggle to meet health bills fell most sharply on those who could not afford to meet them. It delivered freedom from disease, because of the central promise of the NHS to provide services to all, regardless of background, where you live and of the ability to pay.

As any of the great Labour figures of the 1945 generation would have recognised, one of the greatest achievements of socialised medicine has been the way that it has added so much to the sum total of human freedom in our society. Sixty years on, the NHS does not simply offer a far wider range of treatments of a higher quality, provided by highly trained and dedicated staff, it has become the cornerstone of society. The service was founded on the basic principle that we all do our best when we share the risks that face us all and pool our efforts to provide the best possible response when any one of us falls into difficulty.

Freedom and equality are themes that have animated progressive politics in Wales for more than 150 years. They were embodied in the life's work of Aneurin Bevan, and they continue to resonate in the Assembly and in the work of its Government. I thank you for the chance to have contributed some of these thoughts to the discussion.

**William Graham:** That brings today's proceedings to a close.

unig am am y gwaeledd ei hun, ond hefyd na allent fforddio triniaeth. Yr oedd yn rhoi rhyddid rhag eisiau, oherwydd y rhai a oedd yn ymlafnio fwyaf i dalu biliau iechyd oedd y rheini na allent fforddio'u talu. Yr oedd yn rhoi rhyddid rhag afiechyd, oherwydd addewid canolog y GIG i ddarparu gwasanaethau i bawb, beth bynnag yw eu cefndir, ble bynnag y maent yn byw a ph'un a allwch dalu neu beidio.

Fel y byddai unrhyw rai o arweinwyr Llafur mawr cenedlaeth 1945 wedi sylweddoli, un o lwyddiannau mwyaf meddygaeth sosialaidd yw'r ffordd y mae wedi ychwanegu cymaint at ryddid pobl yn gyffredinol yn ein cymdeithas. Drigain mlynedd yn ddiweddarach, mae'r GIG nid yn unig yn cynnig amrywiaeth lawer ehangach o driniaethau gwell, a ddarperir gan staff medrus ac ymroddedig iawn, hwn bellach yw conglaen cymdeithas. Seiliwyd y gwasanaeth ar yr egwyddor sylfaenol ein bod i gyd yn gwneud ein gorau glas pan fyddwn yn rhannu'r risgiau sy'n ein hwynebu i gyd, ac yn cyfuno ein hymdrechion i ddarparu'r ymateb gorau posibl pan fydd unrhyw un ohonom mewn anhawster.

Mae rhyddid a chydraddoldeb yn themâu sydd wedi bywiogi gwleidyddiaeth flaengar yng Nghymru ers dros 150 mlynedd. Fe'u hymgorfforwyd yng ngwaith oes Aneurin Bevan, ac maent yn dal i atseinio yn y Cynulliad ac yng ngwaith ei Lywodraeth. Diolch ichi am y cyfle i gyfrannu rhai o'r sylwadau hyn at y drafodaeth.

**William Graham:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.29 p.m.*

*The meeting ended at 5.29 p.m.*

#### **Aelodau a'u Pleidiau Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
Asghar, Mohammad (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Burns, Angela (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)

Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew R.T. (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Paul (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Evans, Nerys (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Franks, Chris (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, Lesley (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jenkins, Bethan (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Gareth (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Millar, Darren (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
 Ramsay, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Watson, Joyce (Llafur – Labour)  
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)