



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
The National Assembly for Wales**

**Cofnod y Trafodion
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mercher, 5 Mawrth 2008
Wednesday, 5 March 2008**

Cynnwys Contents

- 4 Cwestiynau i'r Cwnsler Cyffredinol ac Arweinydd y Tŷ
Questions to the Counsel General and Leader of the House
- 8 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig
Questions to the Minister for Rural Affairs
- 25 Datganiad am Ailgyflunio Gwasanaethau Iechyd yng Ngogledd Cymru
Statement on Reconfiguration of Services in North Wales
- 44 Atal Rheolau Sefydlog
Suspension of Standing Orders
- 45 Sefydlu Pwyllgor Darlledu
Establishment of a Broadcasting Committee
- 45 Ethol i'r Pwyllgor Darlledu
Election to the Broadcasting Committee
- 46 Newid Aelodaeth y Pwyllgor Archwilio
Change to the Membership of the Audit Committee
- 46 Newid Aelodaeth y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal
Change to the Membership of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity
- 46 Cymeradwyo Diwygiadau i God Ymddygiad yr Aelodau a Gweithdrefn Gwyno'r
Aelodau
Approval of Revisions to the Members' Code of Conduct and Members' Complaints
Procedure
- 49 Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig: Yr Argyfwng Tai sydd ar Dwf yng Nghymru
Welsh Conservatives Debate: The Growing Housing Crisis in Wales
- 79 Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig: Gwastraff sy'n Mynd i Safleoedd Tirlenwi
Welsh Conservatives Debate: Waste that is Going to Landfill
- 104 Dadl Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru: Sut y Caiff Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus eu
Darparu
Welsh Liberal Democrats Debate: How Public Services are Delivered
- 133 Amser Pleidleisio
Voting Time
- 145 Dadl Fer
Short Debate

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 12.30 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 12.30 p.m. with the Presiding Officer (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) in the Chair.*

Y Llywydd: Galwaf y Cynulliad i drefn.

The Presiding Officer: I call the Assembly to order.

Cwestiynau i'r Cwnsler Cyffredinol ac Arweinydd y Tŷ Questions to the Counsel General and Leader of the House

Framework Powers

Q1 Peter Black: Will the Counsel General outline the process by which the Welsh Assembly Government requests framework powers for Wales in UK Bills? OAQ(3)0096(CGE)

The Counsel General and Leader of the House (Carwyn Jones): Yes. The process is undertaken through negotiations by officials and Ministers with their counterparts as early as possible before Bills are drafted.

Peter Black: We have raised the issue of framework powers on various occasions in the Chamber, and we do not think that the Assembly is being ambitious enough in asking for powers. For example, we missed the opportunity to devolve power over deciding on energy developments of more than 50 MW, and the power to implement single transferable voting in local elections. Do you agree that opposition parties should have a greater role to play in scrutinising this process, in the interests of inclusiveness?

Carwyn Jones: It is not for me to advise opposition parties on how they should scrutinise legislation or policy; they must stand up and form their own abilities.

Alun Davies: Counsel General, is it possible for you to consider how the Assembly Government could become more involved in the creation of legislation at Westminster and Whitehall before the parliamentary stages begin? One issue that has attracted some debate in the Proposed Affordable Housing LCO Committee is the fact that we are not seeking framework powers in the Housing and Regeneration Bill, which appears to most

Pwerau Fframwaith

C1 Peter Black: A wnaiff y Cwnsler Cyffredinol amlinellu'r broses y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei defnyddio i ofyn am bwerau fframwaith ar gyfer Cymru ym Mesurau'r DU? OAQ(3)0096(CGE)

Y Cwnsler Cyffredinol ac Arweinydd y Tŷ (Carwyn Jones): Gwnaf. Cynhelir y broses drwy gyfrwng negodiadau gan swyddogion a Gweinidogion gyda'u cyd-swyddogion a'u cyd-Aelodau mor fuan â phosibl cyn drafftio Mesurau.

Peter Black: Yr ydym wedi codi pwerau fframwaith ar wahanol adegau yn y Siambr, ac nid ydym o'r farn bod y Cynulliad yn ddigon uchelgeisiol wrth ofyn am bwerau. Er enghraifft, collasom y cyfle i ddatganoli pŵer ar gyfer penderfynu ynghylch datblygiadau ynni dros 50 MW, a'r pŵer i roi'r bleidlais sengl drosglwyddadwy ar waith mewn etholiadau lleol. A gytunwch y dylai fod gan wrthbleidiau fwy o swyddogaeth wrth graffu ar y broses hon, er mwyn bod yn gynhwysol?

Carwyn Jones: Nid fy lle i yw cynghori gwrthbleidiau ynghylch sut y dylent graffu ar ddeddfwriaethau neu ar bolisiau; rhaid iddynt sefyll ar eu traed eu hunain a ffurfio eu galluoedd eu hunain.

Alun Davies: Gwnsler Cyffredinol, a yw'n bosibl ichi ystyried sut y gallai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad gymryd mwy o ran wrth greu deddfwriaeth yn San Steffan ac yn Whitehall cyn i'r camau seneddol ddechrau? Un mater a fu'n destun cryn ddadlau ym Mhwylgor y Gorchymyn Cymhwysedd Deddfwriaethol Arfaethedig ynghylch Tai Fforddiadwy yw'r ffaith nad ydym yn ceisio cael pwerau fframwaith yn y Mesur Tai ac Adfywio. I'r

people to be sufficiently broad to include the additional powers that we are requesting via the Order in Council process. Could you ensure that a system is set up, so that the Assembly Government can play an active part in the creation of legislation at Westminster, to ensure that framework powers are a more natural part of the process?

Carwyn Jones: There is a lot of sense in what you say, but the difficulty is that the Government's legislative programme is determined via the Queen's Speech, so there is no way of knowing from one year to the next what might be in the programme. Where an LCO is proposed and taken forward here, and then a Bill is put before Parliament that appears to cover some or all of the detail of that LCO, we would have to deal with that situation, as a Government. You mentioned the committee considering the National Assembly for Wales (Legislative Competence) (No. 5) Order 2008 on affordable housing, which continues to be taken forward. However, where Bills before Parliament could provide for framework powers to be devolved to us, we would always try to ensure that we do that.

Nerys Evans: A ydych yn hapus fod digon o sgôp yn y maes hwn i sicrhau trosglwyddo pwerau fframwaith o Fesurau San Steffan? Sut ydych chi'n gweld y broses yn esblygu o ran canran y pwerau ychwanegol a gawn drwy bwerau fframwaith a thrwy Orchymynion cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol?

Carwyn Jones: Mae'n anodd gwybod beth yw'r cydbwysedd. Os oes cyfle i sicrhau pwerau fframwaith drwy Fesur seneddol, mae hwnnw'n opsiwn, ond pan fyddwn ni eisiau pwerau mewn rhyw faes a heb fodd arall o'u cael, Gorchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol fydd y ffordd ymlaen. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw ein bod yn defnyddio'r modd mwyaf cyflym i gael y pwerau, gan ddibynnu ar natur y pwerau hynny, boed drwy Orchymyn trosglwyddo swyddogaethau, Gorchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol,

rhan fwyaf o bobl, ymddengys ei bod yn ddigon eang i gynnwys y pwerau ychwanegol yr ydym yn gofyn amdanynt drwy gyfrwng y broses Gorchymyn yn y Cyfrin Gyngor. A allech sicrhau y sefydlir system, er mwyn i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad allu chwarae rhan fwy gweithredol wrth greu deddfwriaeth yn San Steffan, i wneud yn siŵr bod pwerau fframwaith yn rhan fwy naturiol o'r broses?

Carwyn Jones: Mae'r hyn a ddywedwch yn gwneud cryn synnwyr, ond yr hyn sy'n anodd yw mai Araith y Frenhines sy'n pennu rhaglen deddfwriaethol y Llywodraeth, felly nid oes unrhyw ffordd o wybod o un flwyddyn i'r llall beth all fod yn y rhaglen. Os cynigir Gorchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol ac yr eir ag ef yn ei flaen yma, ac wedyn pe roddir Mesur gerbron y Senedd, a hwnnw, i bob golwg, yn cynnwys rhywfaint o fanylion, neu holl fanylion, y Gorchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol, byddai'n rhaid inni ddelio â'r sefyllfa honno fel Llywodraeth. Crybwyllasoch y pwyllgor sy'n ystyried Gorchymyn Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Cymhwysedd Deddfwriaethol) (Rhif 5) 2008 ynghylch tai fforddiadwy, sy'n parhau i gael ei symud yn ei flaen. Fodd bynnag, lle gallai Mesurau gerbron y Senedd ddarparu pwerau fframwaith i'w datganoli inni, byddem bob amser yn ceisio sicrhau ein bod yn gwneud hynny.

Nerys Evans: Are you content that there is sufficient scope in this area to secure the transfer of framework powers contained in Westminster Bills? How do you see the process evolving in terms of the percentage of additional powers that we will acquire through framework powers and legislative competence Orders?

Carwyn Jones: It is difficult to know the balance. If there is an opportunity to secure framework powers through a parliamentary Bill, that is an option, but when we are seeking powers in a field without another means of acquiring them, a legislative competence Order is the way forward. The important thing is that we use the quickest means of acquiring the powers, depending on the nature of those powers, be it by a transfer of functions Order, a legislative competence Order, or framework powers in a

neu bwerau fframwaith drwy Fesur seneddol. parliamentary Bill.

Y Goruchel Lys

C2 David Lloyd: A wnaiff y Cwnsler Cyffredinol ddatganiad am ei bwerau i gyfeirio materion i'r goruchel lys o'r flwyddyn nesaf ymlaen? OAQ(3)0095(CGE)

Carwyn Jones: O dan Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006, mae'r pŵer gennyf eisoes i drosglwyddo mater i Bwyllgor Barnwrol y Cyfrin Gyngor—a'r oll yw hynny yw Tŷ'r Arglwyddi—i ystyried materion o ran datganoli. Unwaith y bydd y goruchaf lys newydd wedi'i sefydlu, y flwyddyn nesaf, yr un pŵer fydd gennyf, ond y llys newydd hwnnw fydd yn ystyried unrhyw faterion a gyfeiriwyd gennyf.

David Lloyd: In a statement on 14 December, Jane Davidson said,

'The Assembly Government regards it as anomalous that the decision-making power for major electricity generating station projects located in Wales remains a function which is reserved to the UK Government'.

Does the Counsel General feel that the UK Government's intransigent stance on the transfer of energy consents over 50 MW could be challenged in the supreme court?

Carwyn Jones: The answer to that is 'no', as that is a matter for the joint ministerial committee. The supreme court's role will be to determine, among other things, whether an issue falls within the devolution settlement. As matters are inserted into fields in Schedule 5 to the Government of Wales Act 2006, and develop over time, there may be some discussion in future as to whether a Measure that the Assembly wishes to pass comes within a matter in a field in Schedule 5. It is on those occasions that the court may be asked to intervene to make a ruling as to whether a particular Measure or action comes within the devolution settlement. The matter that you referred to is a political matter and would not, in my view, come within the purview of the courts.

The Supreme Court

Q2 David Lloyd: Will the Counsel General make a statement on his powers to refer matters to, what will be from next year, the supreme court? OAQ(3)0095(CGE)

Carwyn Jones: Under the Government of Wales Act 2006, I already have the power to transfer a matter to the Judicial Committee of the Privy Council—which is simply the House of Lords—to consider issues regarding devolution. Once the new supreme court is established next year, I will have the same power, but the new court will consider any matters that I refer.

David Lloyd: Mewn datganiad ar 14 Rhagfyr, dywedodd Jane Davidson,

'Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o'r farn bod anghysondeb yn y ffaith bod y pŵer i benderfynu ar brosiectau mawr i gynhyrchu trydan yng Nghymru yn dal i fod yn un o swyddogaethau Llywodraeth y DU'.

A yw'r Cwnsler Cyffredinol yn teimlo y gellid herio safiad di-ildio Llywodraeth y DU ar drosglwyddo cysyniadau ynni dros 50 MW yn y goruchaf lys?

Carwyn Jones: Yr ateb i hynny yw 'nac ydw', oherwydd mai mater i'r cydbwyllgor gweinidogion yw hwnnw. Swyddogaeth y goruchaf lys fydd pennu, ymysg pethau eraill, a yw mater yn dod o fewn y setliad datganoli. Gan fod materion yn cael eu rhoi mewn meysydd yn Atodlen 5 Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006, ac yn datblygu dros amser, efallai y ceir dipyn o drafodaethau yn y dyfodol ynghylch a yw Mesur y dymuna'r Cynulliad ei basio yn dod o fewn maes yn Atodlen 5. Ar yr adegau hynny y gellid gofyn i'r llys ymyrryd i ddyfarnu a yw gweithred neu Fesur penodol yn rhan o'r setliad datganoli ai peidio. Mae'r mater y cyfeiriasoch ato yn fater gwleidyddol ac ni fyddai'n dod yn rhan o gymalau'r llys yn fy nhyb i.

The Marine Bill

Q3 Mick Bates: What discussions has the Minister had with law officers on the potential for Welsh provisions in the forthcoming draft marine Bill? OAQ(3)0097(CGE)

Carwyn Jones: As I have said many times before in the Chamber, I do not reveal whether I have had discussions with the UK law officers on any issue.

Mick Bates: I thought that things were going rather well today, but normal service is now resumed. [*Laughter.*]

Minister, I appreciate that we are still waiting for the marine Bill and that I am looking in advance, but can you clarify the role of the National Assembly for Wales in developing subordinate or secondary legislation arising from the marine Act?

Carwyn Jones: It is a Bill at the moment, but, when it becomes an Act, it will—or may—contain clauses that enable the Assembly or Assembly Ministers to exercise certain powers. It is a matter for the Assembly to decide how it wishes to exercise those powers, as it has done since the Assembly was set up in 1999.

Alun Ffred Jones: Nid wyf yn siŵr a fyddaf yn gofyn yr un cwestiwn â Mick Bates fan hyn, ond faint o drafodaeth a fu rhwng y Llywodraeth hon a Llywodraeth San Steffan ynghylch y cymalau hynny o'r Mesur hwn fydd yn trosglwyddo pwerau i Gymru?

Carwyn Jones: Yn ôl y disgwyl gyda Mesur mor bwysig â hwn, mae trafodaethau yn mynd rhagddynt rhwng Gweinidogion a swyddogion, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddant yn parhau.

Y Mesur Morol

C3 Mick Bates: Pa drafodaethau mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael gyda swyddogion y gyfraith ynghylch y potensial ar gyfer darpariaethau Cymreig yn y Mesur morol drafft sydd ar ddod? OAQ(3)0097(CGE)

Carwyn Jones: Fel yr wyf wedi'i ddweud droeon gerbron y Siambr, ni fyddaf yn datgelu a wyf wedi cynnal trafodaethau gyda swyddogion y gyfraith yn y DU ynghylch unrhyw fater.

Mick Bates: Yr oeddwn yn meddwl bod pethau'n mynd yn eithaf da heddiw, ond yr ydym wedi dychwelyd i'r un hen rigol ag arfer yn awr. [*Chwerthin.*]

Weinidog, yr wyf yn gwerthfawrogi ein bod yn dal yn aros am y Mesur morol ac mai edrych i'r dyfodol yr wyf, ond a allwch egluro swyddogaeth Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru wrth ddatblygu is-ddeddfwriaeth neu ddeddfwriaeth eilaidd a fydd yn codi o'r Ddeddf forol?

Carwyn Jones: Mesur ydyw ar hyn o bryd, ond, pan ddaw'n Ddeddf, bydd yn cynnwys—neu gall gynnwys—cymalau fydd yn galluogi'r Cynulliad neu Weinidogion y Cynulliad i ymarfer rhai pwerau. Mater i'r Cynulliad yw penderfynu sut y dymuna ymarfer y pwerau hynny, fel y mae wedi'i wneud ers i'r Cynulliad gael ei sefydlu yn 1999.

Alun Ffred Jones: I am not sure whether I will repeat Mick Bates's question here, but how much discussion has there been between this Government and the Westminster Government regarding the clauses of this Bill that will transfer powers to Wales?

Carwyn Jones: As you would expect with such an important Bill, discussions are ongoing between Ministers and officials, and I am sure that they will continue.

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig Questions to the Minister for Rural Affairs

Fishing Industry

Q1 Nick Ramsay: What action is the Welsh Assembly Government taking to support Wales's fishing industry?
OAQ(3)0230(RAF)

The Minister for Rural Affairs (Elin Jones): The Welsh Assembly Government's plans for supporting the Welsh fishing industry are set out in the Wales fisheries strategy, which is presently out to public consultation. It was developed in consultation with all sectors of the industry, and will be underpinned financially by the European fisheries fund and match funding.

Nick Ramsay: You will be aware that, three years ago, Wales received £16 million of European Union funds for the fishing industry, which is £5 million more than it gets at present. Various fishing associations are deeply concerned about the lack of representation that they feel they get from the UK Government. They have also expressed concern that representations made by the Welsh Assembly Government are watered down before they get to the UK Government level. Can you give our fishermen an assurance that you are doing everything in your power to ensure that representations made by fishermen's associations in Wales, and from your department, are being listened to at the UK level, and that fishermen can expect the best possible deal for their industry?

Elin Jones: I am not quite clear about who you suggest is watering down representations from the Assembly Government to the UK Government on fishing matters. I can assure you that I have made several representations on behalf of the Welsh fishing industry in meetings with my UK, Scottish, and Northern Irish counterparts. We secured a good deal on the European fisheries fund. There were tough negotiations on the allocation to Wales, but we secured a deal

Diwydiant Pysgota

C1 Nick Ramsay: Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n eu cymryd i gefnogi diwydiant pysgota Cymru?
OAQ(3)0230(RAF)

Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Elin Jones): Mae cynlluniau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer cefnogi'r diwydiant pysgota yng Nghymru wedi'u gosod allan yn strategaeth pysgodfeydd Cymru, sy'n destun ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus ar hyn o bryd. Fe'i datblygwyd mewn ymgynghoriad â holl sectorau'r diwydiant, a bydd cronfa pysgodfeydd Ewrop ac arian cyfatebol yn ei chynnal yn ariannol.

Nick Ramsay: Mae'n siŵr y byddwch yn ymwybodol y bu i Gymru dderbyn £16 miliwn gan yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ar gyfer y diwydiant pysgod dair blynedd yn ôl. Mae hynny £5 miliwn yn fwy na'r swm a gaiff ar hyn o bryd. Mae amrywiol gymdeithasau pysgota'n bryderus iawn ynghylch y diffyg cynrychiolaeth y teimlant eu bod yn ei chael gan Lywodraeth y DU. Maent hefyd wedi mynegi pryder bod sylwadau a wneir gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cael eu gwanhau cyn iddynt gyrraedd lefel Llywodraeth y DU. A allwch sicrhau ein pysgotwyr eich bod yn gwneud popeth yn eich grym i wneud yn siŵr y gwrandewir, ar lefel y DU, ar y sylwadau a wneir gan gymdeithasau pysgotwyr yng Nghymru a chan eich adran, ac y gall pysgotwyr ddisgwyl y fargen orau bosibl ar gyfer eu diwydiant?

Elin Jones: Nid wyf yn gwbl glir pwy yr ydych yn ei awgrymu sy'n gwanhau sylwadau gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i Lywodraeth y DU am faterion yn ymwneud â physgota. Gallaf eich sicrhau imi wneud amryw o sylwadau ar ran diwydiant pysgota Cymru mewn cyfarfodydd â'm cyd-Aelodau yn y DU, yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon. Gwnaethom sicrhau bargaen dda gyda chronfa pysgodfeydd Ewrop. Bu'n rhaid negodi'n galed ar y dyraniad ar gyfer Cymru, ond

that will be of benefit to Welsh fisheries.

llwyddasom i sicrhau bargaen a fydd yn fanteisiol i bysgodfeydd Cymru.

12.40 p.m.

Nerys Evans: Yr wyf yn siŵr y gwyddoch fod nifer y trwyddedau cwrwgl ar afon Tywi wedi gostwng o 12 i wyth yn ddiweddar. Yr wyf wedi bod mewn cysylltiad ag etholwr sy'n ddisgynnydd o deulu sydd wedi pysgota ar yr afon ers canrifoedd ond sy'n awr yn methu â gwneud hynny. A allwch esbonio sut y penderfynwyd ar y gostyngiad hwn? A wnewch chi gytuno i gwrdd â'r cwrwglwr hwn i drafod y mater ymhellach?

Nerys Evans: I am sure that you are aware that the number of coracle licenses on the Tywi river has been reduced from 12 to eight recently. I have been in contact with a constituent who is a descendant of a family that has been fishing on the river for centuries, but is now unable to do so. Can you explain how this reduction was decided upon? Will you agree to meet this coracler to discuss the matter further?

Elin Jones: Diolch am y cwestiwn hwnnw, Nerys. Ar y Tywi eleni, o fis Ionawr, mae nifer y trwyddedau cwrwgl wedi gostwng o 12 i wyth. Bu ymgynghoriad yn 2006 o ran nifer y trwyddedau, a phenderfynodd fy rhagflaenydd y llynedd i leihau'r nifer. Mwyafswm y trwyddedau a ddefnyddiwyd ar y Tywi rhwng 1997 a 2006 oedd wyth, sef y swm sydd yn awr yn gymwys am y 10 mlynedd nesaf. Yn 2007 yn unig y cynyddwyd y nifer i 11. Er bod y penderfyniad hwn eisoes wedi'i wneud, byddwn yn hapus i drafod y mater gydag unrhyw etholwr i chi.

Elin Jones: Thank you for that question, Nerys. On the Tywi this year, since January, the number of coracle licenses has been reduced from 12 to eight. There was a consultation in 2006 on the number of licenses, and my predecessor decided to reduce the number last year. The maximum number of licenses used on the Tywi between 1997 and 2006 was eight, which will be the number of eligible licenses for the next 10 years. Only in 2007 was that number increased to 11. Although this decision has already been made, I would be prepared to discuss the matter with any of your constituents.

The Animal Welfare Act 2006

Deddf Lles Anifeiliaid 2006

Q2 Irene James: Will the Minister give an update on what the Welsh Assembly Government is doing to support the implementation of the Animal Welfare Act 2006 in Wales? OAQ(3)0231(RAF)

C2 Irene James: A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am yr hyn y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n ei wneud i gefnogi rhoi Deddf Lles Anifeiliaid 2006 ar waith yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)0231(RAF)

Q5 Janice Gregory: Will the Minister give an update on what the Welsh Assembly Government is doing to support the implementation of the Animal Welfare Act 2006 in Wales? OAQ(3)0223(RAF)

C5 Janice Gregory: A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am yr hyn y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n ei wneud i gefnogi rhoi Deddf Lles Anifeiliaid 2006 ar waith yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)0223(RAF)

Elin Jones: We have issued consultations on several codes of practice, revising several farm codes, and developing companion animal codes. We are also considering the contributions on the electric shock dog collar consultation. I have also had discussions on circuses and greyhounds, and am considering how to support local authorities in long-term

Elin Jones: Yr ydym wedi cyhoeddi ymgynghoriadau ar amryw o godau ymarfer, ar adolygu amryw o godau ffermydd, ac ar ddatblygu codau ar gyfer cadw anifeiliaid dof. Yr ydym hefyd yn ystyried cyfraniadau at yr ymgynghoriad ar goleri cŵn sy'n rhoi sioc drydanol. Yr wyf hefyd wedi cynnal trafodaethau ar syrcau a milgwn, ac yn

action on animal welfare.

Irene James: Thank you for that response, Minister. Animal welfare in the livestock farming industry has had a lot of coverage recently, with celebrity chefs running campaigns against intensive farming techniques. Does the Minister agree that the 2006 Act should give Welsh consumers renewed confidence in our excellent livestock farming sector?

Elin Jones: You are right to say that there has been extensive coverage of celebrity chefs expressing concerns about animal welfare, related primarily to the farming of poultry in the UK. I can assure you that the EU directives that dictate to us, to ensure that there is proper legislation in place in member states throughout the EU on welfare considerations for intensive poultry farming, will be implemented in Wales at the earliest opportunity.

Janice Gregory: Cats and dogs provide great pleasure to many people in Wales, particularly older people. The medical benefits of pet companionship are increasingly being recognised, and it is important that cats and dogs have the best quality of life. Will the Minister join me in congratulating all of those organisations and individuals who have joined the Welsh, Scottish, and UK Governments to draft practical, helpful guidance for owners? I am sure that, like me, you look forward to the publication and the implementation of final versions, following the closure of the consultations on 20 March.

Elin Jones: I am certainly encouraged by the involvement of all parties in developing the companion animal welfare codes that are currently out for consultation. I look forward to seeing the responses, and to ensuring that we have the appropriate codes implemented in Wales that ensure the highest degree of animal welfare provisions for companion animals such as cats and dogs, important as they are in many households in Wales.

ystyried sut y mae cefnogi awdurdodau lleol i gymryd camau hirdymor yng nghyswllt lles anifeiliaid.

Irene James: Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Mae lles anifeiliaid yn y diwydiant ffermio da byw wedi cael llawer o sylw yn ddiweddar, gyda chogyddion enwog yn ymgyrchu yn erbyn technegau ffermio dwys. A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno y dylai Deddf 2006 roi hyder o'r newydd i ddefnyddwyr Cymru yn ein sector ffermio da byw rhagorol?

Elin Jones: Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle wrth ddweud y rhoddyd sylw eang i gogyddion enwog sy'n mynegi pryderon ynghylch lles anifeiliaid, a'r pryderon hynny'n ymwneud yn bennaf â ffermio dofednod yn y DU. Gallaf eich sicrhau y bydd cyfarwyddbau'r UE a bennir inni, i sicrhau y gweithredir deddfwriaeth briodol mewn aelod-wladwriaethau ledled yr UE ar ystyriaethau lles ar gyfer ffermio dofednod yn ddwys, yn cael eu rhoi ar waith yng Nghymru ar y cyfle cyntaf.

Janice Gregory: Mae cathod a chŵn yn rhoi cryn bleser i lawer o bobl yng Nghymru, yn arbennig pobl hŷn. Mae'r manteision meddygol sy'n gysylltiedig â chael cyfeillgarwch anifail anwes yn cael eu cydnabod fwyfwy, ac mae'n bwysig bod cathod a chŵn yn cael yr ansawdd bywyd gorau. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ymuno â mi i longyfarch yr holl unigolion a'r holl fudiadau hynny sydd wedi ymuno â Llywodraeth Cymru, Llywodraeth yr Alban a Llywodraeth y DU i fraslunio canllawiau ymarferol a defnyddiol i berchnogion? Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod, fel finnau, yn edrych ymlaen at gyhoeddi'r fersiynau terfynol a'u rhoi ar waith, pan ddaw'r ymgynghoriadau i ben ar 20 Mawrth.

Elin Jones: Mae'r ffaith bod yr holl bleidiau yn cyfrannu at ddatblygu'r codau lles ar gyfer cadw anifeiliaid dof yr ymgynghorir arnynt ar hyn o bryd, yn sicr yn codi fy nghalon. Edrychaf ymlaen at weld yr ymatebion, ac i sicrhau bod y codau priodol ar waith gennym yng Nghymru a fydd yn sicrhau darpariaethau lles anifeiliaid o'r radd flaenaf ar gyfer anifeiliaid dof megis cathod a chŵn, a hwythau mor bwysig mewn cynifer o

aelwydydd yng Nghymru.

Brynle Williams: Given the number of additional costs that the Act imposes on local authorities—with the costs of prosecution and monitoring already running to approximately £3 million—what work are you doing with your colleagues to ensure that Welsh local authorities have the additional money that they need to carry out the duties under the Act to protect the welfare of these animals?

Elin Jones: The Animal Health and Welfare Act 2006 places additional burdens on the Welsh Assembly Government and local authorities in terms of ensuring that the aspirations of the Act are realised in Wales. That is why we identified additional funding for local authorities within our budget for forthcoming years for the implementation of the Act, and my department is in consultation with the local authorities on how the additional funding will be spent in Wales.

Bethan Jenkins: Mae is-ddeddfwriaeth yn cael ei chyflwyno yn Lloegr i wahardd anifeiliaid gwyllt o syrcasau. Comisiynodd y Gymdeithas Frenhinol er Atal Creulondeb i Anifeiliaid yng Nghymru bôl MORI ym mis Medi 2006 a danlinellodd fod 76 y cant o'r cyhoedd yn cefnogi gwaharddiad o'r fath. Felly, yn eich rôl fel Gweinidog, a wnewch ystyried gwahardd anifeiliaid gwyllt o syrcasau yng Nghymru?

Elin Jones: Diolch am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Fel y dywedais wrth Irene James, yr wyf yn ystyried yr adroddiad a baratowyd ynglŷn ag anifeiliaid gwyllt mewn syrcasau yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd. Yr wyf wedi cwrrdd ag awdur yr adroddiad i drafod cyflwyno deddfwriaeth, ac yr wyf yn ystyried yr adroddiad. Mae'n bwysig cofio nad oes syrcasau gyda lleoliad sefydlog yng Nghymru, ond mae syrcasau yn dod i mewn i Gymru sydd yn defnyddio anifeiliaid gwyllt, a byddaf yn ymateb i'r adroddiad yn y dyfodol agos.

Lorraine Barrett: In response to a huge number of calls for a ban on snares in Scotland, the Scottish Government has announced a series of measures on the use of

Brynle Williams: Ac ystyried nifer y costau ychwanegol y mae'r Ddeddf yn eu gosod ar awdurdodau lleol—gyda'r costau sy'n gysylltiedig ag erlyn a monitro eisoes yn cyrraedd tua £3 miliwn—pa waith yr ydych yn ei wneud gyda'ch cyd-Aelodau i sicrhau bod gan awdurdodau lleol Cymru yr arian ychwanegol y mae ei angen arnynt i gyflawni'r dyletswyddau dan y Ddeddf i warchod lles yr anifeiliaid hyn?

Elin Jones: Mae Deddf Iechyd a Lles Anifeiliaid 2006 yn rhoi beichiau ychwanegol ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ac ar awdurdodau lleol o ran sicrhau y caiff dyheadau'r Ddeddf eu gwireddu yng Nghymru. Dyna pam ein bod wedi pennu cyllid ychwanegol ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol yn ein cyllideb dros y blynyddoedd nesaf er mwyn rhoi'r Ddeddf ar waith, ac mae fy adran yn ymgynghori ag awdurdodau lleol ar sut y caiff y cyllid ychwanegol ei wario yng Nghymru.

Bethan Jenkins: Secondary legislation is being introduced in England to ban wild animals from circuses. The Royal Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals in Wales commissioned a MORI poll in September 2006 that underlined that 76 per cent of the public supported such a ban. Therefore, in your role as Minister, would you consider banning wild animals from circuses in Wales?

Elin Jones: Thank you for that question. As I said in response to Irene James, I am currently considering the report that has been prepared about the use of wild animals in circuses in Wales. I have met the author of the report to discuss the introduction of legislation, and I am considering the report. It is important to bear in mind that there are no circuses permanently based in Wales, but circuses that use wild animals do visit Wales, and I will respond to the report in the near future.

Lorraine Barrett: Wrth ymateb i nifer enfawr o alwadau am wahardd defnyddio maglau yn yr Alban, mae Llywodraeth yr Alban wedi cyhoeddi cyfres o fesurau ar

snare, such as compulsory fitting of safety stops, and so on. Has the Minister considered taking similar action, or, even better, banning the manufacture and use of snares completely in Wales?

Elin Jones: I am aware of some proposed changes in Scotland on this issue; it is not a matter to which I have given any consideration as yet in Wales, but, after your question today, I may well receive representations on the issue, and I will look at those carefully.

Farming Communities

Q3 The Leader of the Opposition (Nick Bourne): Will the Minister outline her priorities for farming communities? OAQ(3)0243(RAF)

Elin Jones: Providing the framework for a sustainable and profitable agricultural industry will benefit farming families and contribute to the socioeconomic, environmental and cultural wellbeing of rural Wales. A key delivery mechanism within my portfolio will be support via the £795 million investment under the rural development plan.

Nick Bourne: Thank you for that response, Minister. The Minister will be aware that the vector-free period for bluetongue is due to end around 15 March, and that the vaccine will not become available until some time in May. What is she doing to ensure that we have proper biosecurity in that interim period? That is crucial.

Elin Jones: The best way of ensuring that the disease does not extend its hold in England and Wales as a result of the ending of the vector-free period and there not being a vaccine in place, is to ensure that animal movements do not contribute to disease spread in any way. That is why, after the vector-free period comes to an end after 15 March, no animal movements will be allowed from a restriction zone.

Lesley Griffiths: Do you agree that one way of helping rural Wales, Welsh farmers and

ddefnyddio maglau, er enghraifft, mae'n orfodol gosod atalwyr diogelwch, ac yn y blaen. A yw'r Gweinidog wedi ystyried cymryd camau tebyg, neu'n well fyth, gwahardd cynhyrchu a defnyddio maglau'n gyfan gwbl yng Nghymru?

Elin Jones: Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o rai newidiadau a gynigiwyd yn yr Alban i'r perwyl hwn; ond nid yw'n fater yr wyf wedi'i ystyried hyd yn hyn yng Nghymru, ond, yn sgil eich cwestiwn heddiw, mae'n bosibl y byddaf yn cael sylwadau am y mater, a byddaf yn edrych arnynt yn fanwl.

Cymunedau Ffermio

C3 Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Nick Bourne): A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu ei blaenoriaethau ar gyfer cymunedau ffermio? OAQ(3)0243(RAF)

Elin Jones: Bydd darparu'r fframwaith ar gyfer diwydiant amaethyddol cynaliadwy a phroffidiol yn helpu teuluoedd sy'n ffermio ac yn cyfrannu at les cymdeithasol economaidd, amgylcheddol a diwylliannol Cymru wledig. Un mecanwaith allweddol ar gyfer cyflwyno hyn yn fy mhortffolio fydd y gefnogaeth a ddarperir drwy'r buddsoddiad £795 miliwn dan y cynllun datblygu gwledig.

Nick Bourne: Diolch yn fawr am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol bod cyfnod di-wybed y tafod glas yn dod i ben oddeutu 15 Mawrth, ac na fydd y brechlyn ar gael tan rywbryd ym mis Mai. Beth mae'n ei wneud i sicrhau bod gennym drefn bioddiogelwch briodol mewn grym yn y cyfnod interim hwnnw? Mae hynny'n hanfodol.

Elin Jones: Y ffordd orau o sicrhau nad yw'r clefyd yn lledaenu yn Lloegr ac yng Nghymru, ar ôl i'r cyfnod di-wybed ddod i ben a phan nad oes brechlyn ar gael, yw sicrhau na chyfrennir at ledaeniad y clefyd mewn unrhyw ffordd drwy symud anifeiliaid. Dyna pam, ar ôl i'r cyfnod di-wybed ddod i ben ar 15 Mawrth, ni chaniateir symud anifeiliaid o barth lle mae cyfyngiadau mewn grym.

Lesley Griffiths: A ydych yn cytuno mai un ffordd o helpu Cymru wledig, ffermwyr

the Welsh economy in general is to do what the Government has been doing in recent years, namely encouraging local food procurement in the public sector? In just two years, there has been a 45 per cent increase in the procurement of Welsh food by our public sector, with 76 per cent of meat used in the public sector now coming from Wales. Do you agree with Graham Titchener of Hybu Cig Cymru, who said recently that the procurement picture in Wales has dramatically improved?

12.50 p.m.

Elin Jones: I agree, and there has been considerable success on red meat issues in particular over the past few years. There remains considerable scope and that is why the One Wales Government has made a commitment to look at increasing public sector procurement of Welsh food in Wales even further. The red meat sector has improved greatly over the past few years. There is more that can be done, but there are other sectors that are not performing as well, such as the dairy sector and the dairy produce sector. My department is currently working on a plan for Wales with Cardiff University, local authorities and other public sector agencies, to see how we can create systems throughout Wales that will further develop the ability of the public sector to access local Welsh food.

Kirsty Williams: Minister, my understanding is that the amount of bluetongue vaccine that you have been able to order will only vaccinate approximately 70 per cent of the livestock in Powys and Monmouthshire, which are the counties that you would expect to be the first affected by any potential bluetongue outbreak. Could you explain to me how you intend to distribute that vaccine when we will, potentially, not have enough to go around everybody who wants it?

Elin Jones: On the issue regarding the use of the vaccine, you are right that 2.5 million doses of vaccine were pre-ordered by the Assembly Government as part of the wider Department for Environment, Food and Rural

Cymru ac economi Cymru'n gyffredinol yw gwneud yr hyn y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi bod yn ei wneud dros y blynyddoedd diweddar, hynny yw, annog y sector cyhoeddus i gaffael bwyd lleol? Mewn cwta ddwy flynedd, mae ein sector cyhoeddus wedi caffael 45 y cant yn fwy o fwyd o Gymru, ac erbyn hyn mae 76 y cant o'r cig a ddefnyddir yn y sector cyhoeddus yn dod o Gymru. A ydych yn cytuno â Graham Titchener o Hybu Cig Cymru, a ddywedodd yn ddiweddar fod y darlun caffael yng Nghymru wedi gwella'n sylweddol?

Elin Jones: Yr wyf yn cytuno ac yr ydym wedi cael cryn lwyddiant ar faterion yn ymwneud â chig coch yn benodol dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Ond pery cryn bosibiliadau o hyd a dyna pam mae Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un wedi ymrwmo i geisio cael y sector cyhoeddus i gaffael mwy fyth o fwyd o Gymru. Mae'r sector cig coch wedi gwella'n sylweddol dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Mae mwy y gellir ei wneud, ond nid yw rhai sectorau eraill yn perfformio cystal, megis y sector llaeth a'r sector cynnyrch llaeth. Mae fy adran wrthi'n gweithio ar hyn o bryd gyda Phrifysgol Caerdydd, awdurdodau lleol ac asiantaethau sector cyhoeddus eraill, ar gynllun i Gymru i weld sut y gallwn greu systemau ledled Cymru a fydd yn datblygu gallu'r sector cyhoeddus ymhellach i gael gaffael ar fwyd lleol o Gymru.

Kirsty Williams: Weinidog, yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf, bydd nifer y brechlyn tafod glas yr ydych wedi gallu eu harchebu dim ond yn brechu oddeutu 70 y cant o'r da byw ym Mhowys a sir Fynwy, sef y siroedd y byddech yn disgwyl i unrhyw achos posibl o'r tafod glas effeithio arnynt gyntaf. A allech egluro imi sut y bwriadwch ddosbarthu'r brechlyn hwnnw pan na fydd gennym, o bosibl, ddigon ar gael i bawb y mae ei angen arnynt?

Elin Jones: O ran y mater ynghylch defnyddio'r brechlyn, yr ydych yn llygad eich lle wrth ddweud bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi archebu 2.5 miliwn dos o'r brechlyn ymlaen llaw fel rhan o gcontract

Affairs contract last year. We are early in the queue with regard to the availability of the vaccine. My department is currently in discussion with DEFRA on the future purchasing of vaccine. As you identified, 2.5 million doses of vaccine are not enough to cover the whole of Wales and therefore having sound veterinary scientific advice on the priority areas will be key. I will be looking to my veterinary officials to guide me on that.

Alun Ffred Jones: Mae'r mudiad Clybiau Ffermwyr Ifanc Cymru yn chwarae rhan bwysig yn niwylliant cefn gwlad ac mae hefyd yn datblygu sgiliau a hyder pobl ifanc sydd o fewn y diwydiant amaeth a rhai sydd y tu allan iddo. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i hyrwyddo gwaith y mudiad pwysig a gwerthfawr hwn?

Elin Jones: Diolch i chi am y cwestiwn, Alun Ffred. Cytunaf â chi'n llwyr fod Clybiau Ffermwyr Ifanc Cymru yn fudiad pwysig yng nghefn gwlad, nid yn unig ar gyfer pobl ifanc sydd wedi tyfu lan ar ffermydd, ond pobl ifanc yng nghefn gwlad yn gyffredinol. Mae'r hyn y mae'r clybiau yn eu cyflawni o ran darparu cyfleoedd, hyfforddiant ac adloniant i bobl ifanc yng nghefn gwlad yn hollbwysig. Gwneuthum ddatganiad ddydd Llun fy mod yn bwriadu cyfrannu £50,000 ychwanegol o arian newydd i'r mudiad hwn. Dioddefodd y mudiad broblem y llynedd nad oedd wedi'i greu ei hun o ran datblygiad ei gynllun busnes ac mae'n fwriad gennyf i sicrhau bod ei gynllun busnes yn gryf ar gyfer y dyfodol, fel bod y mudiad yn gallu mynd o nerth i nerth. Dyna pam fe'm perswadiwyd fod angen i'r Llywodraeth wneud cyfraniad o £50,000 tuag at sicrhau sefydlogrwydd y mudiad pwysig hwn.

Brynle Williams: I wish to briefly go back to local procurement, Minister. I, for one, as a practising farmer, most certainly welcome what has been done by the Welsh Assembly Government and Hybu Cig Cymru in particular. However, will you have talks with your colleagues in the health sector about this? I found last week's figures, that 85 per cent of lamb served in Welsh hospitals is imported, to be rather disturbing. I ask that

ehangach Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig y llynedd. Yr ydym yn uchel ar y rhestr o ran pan gaiff y brechlyn ei ryddhau. Mae fy adran mewn trafodaethau ar hyn o bryd gyda DEFRA o ran pwrcasu'r brechlyn i'r dyfodol. Fel y dywedasoeh, nid yw 2.5 miliwn dos o'r brechlyn yn mynd i fod yn ddigon i gyflenwi Cymru gyfan, felly bydd ceisio cyngor gwyddonol milfeddygol cadarn ar flaenoriaethau yn allweddol. Byddaf yn troi at fy swyddogion milfeddygol i'm harwain yn hynny o beth.

Alun Ffred Jones: Wales Young Farmers' Clubs play an important role in the culture of rural areas and also develop the skills and confidence of young people within and outside the agricultural industry. What are you doing to promote the work of this important and valuable organisation?

Elin Jones: Thank you for that question, Alun Ffred. I agree completely that Wales Young Farmers' Clubs is an important organisation in rural areas, not only for young people who have grown up on farms, but young people in rural areas in general. What the clubs achieve in terms of the provision of opportunities, training and entertainment for young people in rural areas is vital. I made a statement on Monday announcing my intention to contribute an additional £50,000 in new money to this organisation. The organisation suffered from a problem last year that was not of its own making with regard to the development of its business plan, and it is my intention to ensure that its business plan is robust for the future, so that the organisation can go from strength to strength. That is why I was persuaded that the Government needed to make a contribution of £50,000 towards ensuring the stability of this important organisation.

Brynle Williams: Hoffwn ddechweyd yn sydyn at gaffael lleol, Weinidog. Yr wyf i, fel ffermwr, yn un sy'n croesawu'r hyn y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a Hybu Cig Cymru yn benodol wedi'i wneud. Fodd bynnag, a wnewch drafod y mater hwn â'ch cyd-Aelodau yn y sector iechyd? Cefais fy synnu gan ffigurau'r wythnos diwethaf bod 85 y cant o'r cig oen a weinir mewn ysbytai Cymru wedi cael ei fewnforio. Gofynnaf ichi

you have discussions with your colleagues in the Cabinet about that, please.

Elin Jones: I am not aware of the source of that particular figure. I certainly know that the figures on the use of Welsh beef in our hospitals are particularly encouraging. If you can provide me with the source of that evidence, I will certainly look at it. I know that my ministerial colleagues who are responsible for public sector delivery and the purchasing of food products in Wales are particularly keen to engage to identify ways to improve on the work already done to ensure that more Welsh food is procured by the public sector.

Alun Davies: Minister, I am sure that you agree that one of the key priorities of the farming community is to earn a living. We are aware of the statistics published last week on farm incomes, which have reduced as a result of the disruptions caused by animal disease and the increase in prices of fertiliser, feed and fuel. I noted, last week, the publication of First Milk's annual report, which highlighted the importance of having a fair price for milk in this case—but also for other products—in supermarkets to ensure sustainable profitability for the farming industry. Will you continue to work with those of us who represent rural constituencies to ensure that supermarkets pay farmers and producers a fair price for their produce?

Elin Jones: Yes, I agree with that, because nothing will ensure the future of the farming industry better than fair prices that reflect the costs of production. As it happens, I met with First Milk this morning, and we discussed the report that it has just published on the need to ensure a fair price for milk that adequately reflects the fact that the dairy industry requires investment and must cover the increasing costs that it has seen over the past few years. Therefore, I concur with your remarks; ensuring a fair price for product is something that I will continue to discuss with all those involved in the food industry in Wales.

gynnal trafodaethau â'ch cyd-Weinidogion yn y Cabinet am y mater hwn, os gwelwch yn dda.

Elin Jones: Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o ffynhonnell y ffigur penodol hwnnw. Gwn fod y ffigurau ar ddefnyddio cig eidion o Gymru yn ein hysbytai yn hynod galonogol. Os gallwch ddarparu ffynhonnell y dystiolaeth honno, ymchwiliad iddi. Gwn fod fy nghyd-Weinidogion sy'n ysgwyddo cyfrifoldeb dros gyflenwi gwasanaethau yn y sector cyhoeddus a dros bwrcasu cynnyrch bwyd yng Nghymru yn hynod awyddus i gymryd rhan er mwyn canfod ffyrdd o wella'r gwaith a wneir eisoes i sicrhau bod y sector cyhoeddus yn caffael mwy o fwyd o Gymru.

Alun Davies: Weinidog, yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch mai un o flaenoriaethau allweddol y gymuned ffermio yw ennill bywoliaeth. Yr ydym yn ymwybodol o'r ystadegau a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos diwethaf am incwm ffermydd sydd wedi disgyn o ganlyniad i'r holl drafferthion a achoswyd gan glefydau anifeiliaid a chodiadau ym mhrisiau gwrtaith, porthiant a thanwydd. Yn adroddiad blynyddol First Milk, a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos diwethaf, tynnwyd sylw at bwysigrwydd cael pris teg am laeth yn yr achos hwn—ond hefyd am gynnyrch eraill—mewn archfarchnadoedd er mwyn sicrhau cynaliadwyedd o ran elw yn y diwydiant ffermio. A wnewch barhau i weithio â'r rheiny ohonom sy'n cynrychioli etholaethau gwledig i sicrhau bod archfarchnadoedd yn talu pris teg i ffermwyr a chynhyrchwyr am eu cynnyrch?

Elin Jones: Gwnaf, cytunaf â hynny, oherwydd, yn anad dim, mae cael prisiau teg sy'n adlewyrchu costau cynhyrchu yn mynd i sicrhau dyfodol y diwydiant ffermio. Fel mae'n digwydd, cyfarfûm â First Milk y bore yma, a chawsom gyfle i drafod yr adroddiad y mae wedi'i gyhoeddi'n ddiweddar am yr angen i sicrhau pris teg am laeth sy'n adlewyrchu'n ddigonol y ffaith bod angen buddsoddi yn y diwydiant llaeth a'i bod yn rhaid talu am y costau cynyddol a welwyd dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Felly, cytunaf â'ch sylwadau; mae sicrhau pris teg am gynnyrch yn fater y byddaf yn parhau i'w drafod â phob un sydd ynghlwm wrth y

diwydiant bwyd yng Nghymru.

Bee Livestock

Q4 William Graham: Will the Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's policies to sustain bee livestock in Wales? OAQ(3)0252(RAF)

Elin Jones: We are currently in discussion with Welsh beekeepers on the development of a strategy on protecting and improving the health of managed bees in England and Wales. Formal consultation with stakeholders on the strategy will commence shortly.

William Graham: You may be aware of the perhaps apocryphal statement by Albert Einstein that if the bee disappeared off the face of the globe, man would last but four years. You will understand the necessity for maintaining the bee population, particularly given the decline due to the varroa mite and colony collapse disorder—two things about which apiarists are most concerned. You will be aware that the honeybee is extremely important in pollination for most garden plants and the flora of the British Isles. The value of their pollination in UK food production is estimated to be £166 million, and their contribution to Wales's biodiversity is considerable. Will you acknowledge the exceptional work done by non-commercial beekeepers in Wales and encourage more apiarists to join associations and the national bee database, so that they can gain access to information that might improve the biosecurity of their hives?

Elin Jones: I have no intention of challenging Albert Einstein's interpretation of the importance of the bee population to the wider ecosystem, and I understand its importance in the context of Wales's ecosystem and beyond. There are concerns regarding the health of our bees, and, as you outlined, there are challenges to that. That is why we are undertaking work with the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs and Welsh beekeepers to ensure that the priorities for bee health are addressed through research and disease protection.

Stociau Gwenyn

C4 William Graham: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am bolisiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer cynnal stociau gwenyn yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)0252(RAF)

Elin Jones: Ar hyn o bryd yr ydym mewn trafodaethau gyda phobl sy'n cadw gwenyn yng Nghymru o ran datblygu strategaeth ar warchod a gwella iechyd gwenyn a reolir yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Byddwn yn cynnal ymgynghoriad â rhanddeiliad ar y strategaeth cyn bo hir.

William Graham: Efallai eich bod yn gyfarwydd â datganiad apocryffaid Albert Einstein sef petai'r wenynen yn diflannu oddi ar wyneb y ddaear, ni fyddai dyn yn gallu goroesi am fwy na phedair blynedd. Byddwch yn deall pa mor angenrheidiol yw cynnal poblogaeth y gwenyn, yn enwedig a chofio'r dirywiad o ganlyniad i'r gwyddon varroa ac anhwylder cwmp yr haid—dau fater sy'n peri cryn bryder i wenynwyr. Byddwch yn gwybod bod y wenynen fêl yn hynod o bwysig ar gyfer peillio'r rhan fwyaf o'r planhigion a'r blodau yn Ynysoedd Prydain. Amcangyfrifir bod eu gwaith peillio i gynhyrchu bwyd yn y DU werth £166 miliwn, ac mae eu cyfraniad at fioamrywiaeth yng Nghymru yn sylweddol. A wnewch gydnabod y gwaith eithriadol a wneir gan bobl sy'n cadw gwenyn yn anfasnachol yng Nghymru ac annog mwy o wenynwyr i ymuno â chymdeithasau a'r gronfa ddata wenyn genedlaethol, fel y gallant gael gafael ar wybodaeth a all wella bioddiogelwch eu cychod?

Elin Jones: Nid wyf yn bwriadu herio dehongliad Albert Einstein o bwysigrwydd gwenyn i'r ecosystem ehangach, a deallaf pa mor bwysig ydynt yng nghyd-destun ecosystem Cymru a'r tu hwnt. Ceir pryderon ynghylch iechyd ein gwenyn, ac, fel y gwnaethoch amlinellu, mae heriau ynghlwm wrth hynny. Dyna pam ein bod yn gweithio gydag Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig a phobl sy'n cadw gwenyn i sicrhau bod y blaenoriaethau ar gyfer iechyd gwenyn yn cael sylw drwy ymchwil ac amddiffyn yn erbyn clefydau.

The Presiding Officer: Question 5 was grouped with question 2.

Y Llywydd: Cafodd cwestiwn 5 ei grwpio gyda chwestiwn 2.

Farmers' Unions

Q6 Joyce Watson: Will the Minister provide an update on any discussions she has had with farmers' unions in Wales?
OAQ(3)0229(RAF)

Elin Jones: I am in regular contact with the farming unions in Wales, and I discuss with them a wide range of issues affecting their members, ranging from animal health and welfare issues to the rural development plan.

Joyce Watson: First, I am sure that you will join me in congratulating the National Farmers Union on its recent centenary celebrations. Over its 100 years, the NFU has been a strong collective voice for farmers and acted as an important link between policy-makers and individuals working in the sector. Currently, those close links are vital to our strategy for controlling bluetongue disease. Ahead of the end of the vector-free period, which, as things stand, will be 15 March, how is the Welsh Assembly Government, together with farmers' unions and other stakeholders, ensuring that farmers are fully aware of what the new movement restrictions will mean for them?

1.00 p.m.

Elin Jones: I would be more than happy to take this opportunity to congratulate the NFU—an important farming organisation—on celebrating its centenary this year. The NFU, the FUW and others are key to ensuring that we have appropriate mechanisms in place, and that appropriate advice is given to me on animal disease control priorities. All these stakeholders have played a busy and key role over the last eight months in all the animal disease issues facing Welsh farmers. In that dialogue, the NFU and FUW play a key role in ensuring that good information is available to their members about the most recent decisions and

Undebau Amaethwyr

C6 Joyce Watson: A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am unrhyw drafodaethau y mae wedi'u cael ag undebau amaethwyr yng Nghymru?
OAQ(3)0229(RAF)

Elin Jones: Yr wyf yn cysylltu'n rheolaidd â'r undebau amaethwyr yng Nghymru, gan drafod amrywiol faterion sy'n effeithio ar eu haelodau, o iechyd anifeiliaid a materion yn ymwneud â lles i'r cynllun datblygu gwledig.

Joyce Watson: Yn gyntaf, mae'n siŵr y gwnewch ymuno â mi i longyfarch Undeb Cenedlaethol yr Amaethwyr ar ei dathliadau canmlwyddiant diweddar. Dros y 100 mlynedd hynny, mae'r NFU wedi bod yn llais cryf cyfunol dros ffermwyr ac wedi gweithredu fel cyswllt pwysig rhwng llunwyr polisïau ac unigolion sy'n gweithio yn y sector. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r cysylltiadau agos hynny'n hanfodol ar gyfer ein strategaeth ar gyfer rheoli clefyd y tafod glas. Cyn diwedd y cyfnod di-wybed, a fydd, fel y mae pethau ar hyn o bryd, yn dod i ben ar 15 Mawrth, sut y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, ynghyd ag undebau'r amaethwyr a rhanddeiliaid eraill, yn sicrhau bod ffermwyr yn hollol ymwybodol o'r hyn y bydd y cyfyngiadau newydd ar symud yn ei olygu iddynt?

Elin Jones: Byddwn yn fwy na bodlon achub ar y cyfle hwn i longyfarch Undeb Cenedlaethol yr Amaethwyr—sefydliad ffermio pwysig—wrth iddo ddathlu ei ganmlwyddiant eleni. Mae Undeb Cenedlaethol yr Amaethwyr, Undeb Amaethwyr Cymru ac eraill yn allweddol i sicrhau bod gennym fecanweithiau priodol ar waith, a bod cyngor priodol yn cael ei roi imi ar flaenoriaethau rheoli clefydau anifeiliaid. Mae'r holl randdeiliaid hyn wedi chwarae rhan brysur ac allweddol dros yr wyth mis diwethaf yng nghyswllt yr holl faterion clefydau anifeiliaid sydd wedi wynebu ffermwyr Cymru. Yn y ddeialog honno, mae

developments in the ever changing disease picture for bluetongue disease. The Assembly Government, too, has a direct role to play in providing good information, and our website is particularly key in ensuring that farmers have access to direct information on the status of the disease.

Andrew R.T. Davies: A week ago, the NFU held an informative meeting at the Heronston Hotel about bluetongue disease. It was attended by some of your officials, and among the topics being discussed was the consequences of the restrictions for our area when the vector-free period comes to an end on 15 March. You have responded to a question about the bluetongue disease vaccine and its apportionment, and you say that you are waiting for your officials to come back to you. You do not seem to be on your game, because your officials tell me that we will receive vaccines on an apportionment basis. Some 22 million doses were apportioned to the UK, and we will get 10 per cent of that apportionment, which equals 2 million doses. As the vaccine becomes available, we will get it in 10-per-cent allocations. Obviously, there is a real problem with numbers and with allocating the resource. Is the Welsh Assembly Government minded to order more vaccine at this stage, given that France is already in the market for 40 million doses? Also, how are you collating a plan to ensure that areas that are currently under surveillance will be first in the queue for that vaccine? My own veterinary practice told me this morning that it has no ability to source the vaccine, and no order in at the moment.

Elin Jones: You obviously have close contact with my officials on bluetongue disease vaccine issues, and I am glad that that is the case. However, you are incorrect to say that I have ordered 2 million vaccines; the order was for 2.5 million vaccines. As I mentioned in my answer to Kirsty Williams, this figure will not come close to allowing for the vaccination of all animals in Wales, which is why I am currently considering

Undeb Cenedlaethol yr Amaethwyr ac Undeb Amaethwyr Cymru yn chwarae rhan allweddol o ran sicrhau bod gwybodaeth dda ar gael i'w haelodau am y penderfyniadau a'r datblygiadau diweddaraf yn y cyd-destun clefydau sy'n newid yn gyson ar gyfer clefyd y tafod glas. Mae gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad hefyd, ran uniongyrchol i'w chwarae o ran darparu gwybodaeth dda, ac mae ein gwefan yn allweddol iawn o ran sicrhau bod ffermwyr yn gallu cael gfael ar wybodaeth uniongyrchol am statws y clefyd.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Wythnos yn ôl, cynhaliodd yr NFU gyfarfod yng Ngwesty Heronston am glefyd y tafod glas. Yr oedd rhai o'ch swyddogion yn bresennol yn y cyfarfod hwnnw, ac ymhlith y pynciau a drafodwyd oedd canlyniadau'r cyfyngiadau ar gyfer ein hardal pan ddaw'r cyfnod diwybed i ben ar 15 Mawrth. Yr ydych wedi ateb cwestiwn am y brechlyn clefyd tafod glas a'i ddsbarthu, a dywedwch eich bod yn disgwyl i'ch swyddogion ddod yn ôl atoch. Ymddengys nad ydych ar eich gorau, oherwydd dywed eich swyddogion wrthyf y cewch frechlynnau ar sail dosbarthu. Dosbarthwyd oddeutu 22 miliwn dos i'r DU, a byddwn yn cael 10 y cant o'r dosbarthiad hwnnw, sy'n gyfystyr â 2 miliwn dos. Wrth i'r brechlyn ddod ar gael, byddwn yn ei gael mewn dyraniadau o 10 y cant. Yn amlwg, ceir problem go iawn gyda rhifau a dyrannu'r adnodd. A yw Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n bwriadu archebu rhagor o frechlyn ar hyn o bryd, ac ystyried bod Ffrainc eisoes yn y farchnad ar gyfer 40 miliwn dos? Hefyd, sut ydych yn coladu cynllun i sicrhau mai ardaloedd sy'n cael eu goruchwylio ar hyn o bryd fydd ar flaen y ciw ar gyfer y brechlyn hwnnw. Dywedodd fy mhreactis milfeddyg fy hun wrthyf y bore yma na all brynu'r brechlyn, ac nad oes ganddo archeb i mewn ar hyn o bryd.

Elin Jones: Yn amlwg mae gennych gyswllt agos gyda'm swyddogion ar faterion sy'n ymwneud â brechlyn clefyd y tafod glas, ac yr wyf yn falch o hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych yn anghywir pan ddywedwch fy mod wedi archebu 2 miliwn dos; yr oedd yr archeb ar gyfer 2.5 miliwn dos. Fel y crybwyllais yn fy ateb i Kirsty Williams, nid yw'r ffigur hwn yn agos at fod yn ddigon ar gyfer yr holl anifeiliaid yng Nghymru, sef pam yr wyf yn

advice on placing another order for the vaccine. I will report back to you on that when I have fully considered the advice.

Mick Bates: When I meet the unions and, come to that, most farmers in Welshpool market, one of the main issues of discussion is that of form filling and red tape. You have announced a review of this, but what progress has been made?

Elin Jones: You will know that I appointed Peredur Hughes as an independent adviser on the red tape review. We had our first meeting last week. The first meeting with stakeholders that Peredur Hughes and I will attend is to be held in the next few weeks—I cannot give an exact date.

Mick Bates: No matter. It is pleasing to hear of progress, and I am sure that Peredur Hughes will do a fine job. I look forward to the conclusion of the review.

One of the most painful red-tape delays is the delay in single farm payments caused by inspections of agri-environment schemes. Can you give an assurance that there will be no repeat of this year's fiasco, in which SFP has been delayed for several months by agri-environment and on-farm inspections?

Elin Jones: Thank you for allowing me the opportunity to say that over 95 per cent of single farm payments have been made to Welsh farmers. With regard to inspections, we must ensure that we pass the audit processes that the European Commission places upon us. There have been particular issues about matching up land with the single farm payment and agri-environment schemes—we worked through those last year. I cannot give you a commitment that individual farms will not face issues on this in the future, but I can give you the commitment that the red-tape review will make a priority of considering inspection and visits to farms, and that it will look at whether there is any possibility of rationalising the number of on-farm visits.

ystyried cyngor ar roi archeb arall ar gyfer y brechlyn ar hyn o bryd. Byddaf yn adrodd yn ôl i chi ar hynny ar ôl imi ystyried y cyngor yn llawn.

Mick Bates: Pan gyfarfûm a'r undebau ac, a dweud y gwir, y rhan fwyaf o ffermwyr ym marchnad y Trallwng, un o'r prif bynciau trafod oedd llenwi ffurflenni a biwrocratiaeth. Yr ydych wedi cyhoeddi adolygiad o hyn, ond pa gynnydd a wnaethpwyd?

Elin Jones: Byddwch yn gwybod imi benodi Peredur Hughes fel ymgyngorydd annibynnol ar yr adolygiad o fiwrocratiaeth. Cawsom ein cyfarfod cyntaf wythnos diwethaf. Cynhelir y cyfarfod cyntaf gyda rhanddeiliaid y bydd Peredur Hughes a minnau'n cymryd rhan ynddo yn ystod yr wythnosau nesaf—ni allaf roi union ddyddiad.

Mick Bates: Dim gwahaniaeth. Mae'n braf clywed bod pethau'n symud ymlaen, ac yr wyf yn ffyddiog y bydd Peredur Hughes yn gwneud gwaith da. Edrychaf ymlaen at gasgliad yr adolygiad.

Un o'r achosion mwyaf poenus o oedi oherwydd biwrocratiaeth yw'r oedi cyn talu taliadau sengl oherwydd arolygiadau cynlluniau amaeth-amgylchedd. A allwch sicrhau na chaiff llanastr eleni ei ailadrodd, pan fu'r taliad sengl rai misoedd ar ei hôl hi oherwydd arolygiadau amaeth-amgylchedd ac arolygiadau ar y fferm?

Elin Jones: Diolch ichi am roi'r cyfle imi ddweud bod dros 95 y cant o daliadau sengl wedi cael eu gwneud i ffermwyr Cymru. Ac ystyried arolygiadau, rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn pasio'r prosesau archwilio y mae'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn eu rhoi inni. Bu materion penodol ynghylch cyfateb tir â'r taliad sengl a chynlluniau amaeth-amgylchedd—yr ydym wedi gweithio drwy'r rheiny y llynedd. Ni allaf ymrwymo na fydd ffermydd unigol yn wynebu materion ynghylch hyn yn y dyfodol, ond gallaf ymrwymo y bydd yr adolygiad o fiwrocratiaeth yn rhoi blaenoriaeth i ystyried arolygiadau ac ymweliadau â ffermydd, ac y bydd yn edrych i weld a yw'n bosibl rhesymoli nifer yr ymweliadau ar y fferm. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny i gyd yng nghyd-

However, that is all within the context of domestic and EU legislation.

Brynle Williams: I obviously welcome the fact that 95 per cent of payments were made before Christmas—that is most welcome. However, many of my constituents are still in serious financial trouble due to what appear to be small queries holding back their SFP. This 5 per cent is not a large amount, but is there any way that your office could look at possibly paying 70 per cent of the money after 31 January, while the query is being looked at? Just this morning I heard from a distressed farmer's wife, who told me that they have mounting bills and are waiting for their payment. She asked whether anything could be done. Could you look at this for the future, Minister?

Elin Jones: I am not minded, and have not been minded, to look at early payment until all the checks have been made. That is a requirement placed on us by the European Commission. You will not be surprised to hear that many Members have written to me over the past few weeks about the claims of individual constituents, and I am sure that, if you have a particular question relating to a constituent, you will also want to avail yourself of that opportunity to write to me about the issue.

Poultry Farming

Q7 Sandy Mewies: Will the Minister make a statement on animal welfare in poultry farming in Wales? OAQ(3)0238(RAF)

Elin Jones: I take the welfare of all farm animals, including poultry, very seriously. Council directive 99/74/EC, laying down minimum standards for the protection of laying hens, bans the use of conventional battery cages throughout the EU from 1 January 2012. The Welsh Assembly Government is committed to meeting that 2012 deadline.

Sandy Mewies: You will be aware that Welsh consumers are increasingly demanding that their food comes from a source where

destun deddfwriaeth ddomestig a'r UE.

Brynle Williams: Yn amlwg yr wyf yn croesawu'r ffaith bod 95 y cant o'r taliadau wedi cael eu gwneud cyn y Nadolig—mae hynny i'w groesawu. Fodd bynnag, mae nifer o'm hetholwyr yn dal mewn trafferthion ariannol difrifol oherwydd yr hyn sy'n ymddangos i fod yn ymholiadau bach sy'n dal eu taliad sengl yn ôl. Nid yw'r 5 y cant hwn yn swm mawr, ond a oes unrhyw ffordd y gallai eich swyddfa edrych ar bosibilrwydd talu 70 y cant o'r arian ar ôl 31 Ionawr, pan ymchwilir i'r ymholiad? Bore yma, clywais gan wraig ffermwr mewn trallod, a ddywedodd wrthyf fod eu biliau'n tyfu a'u bod yn disgwyl am eu taliad. Gofynnodd a oedd unrhyw beth y gellid ei wneud? A allech ymchwilio i hyn ar gyfer y dyfodol, Weinidog?

Elin Jones: Nid wyf yn bwriadu, ac nid wyf wedi bwriadu, edrych ar dalu'n fuan cyn cwblhau'r holl archwiliadau. Mae hwnnw'n un o ofynion y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd. Ni fyddwch yn synnu clywed bod nifer o Aelodau wedi ysgrifennu ataf dros yr ychydig wythnosau diwethaf am hawliadau etholwyr unigol, ac yr wyf yn siŵr, os oes gennych gwestiwn penodol ynghylch etholwr, y byddwch chithau hefyd eisiau achub ar y cyfle i ysgrifennu ataf ynghylch y mater.

Ffermio Dofednod

C7 Sandy Mewies: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am les anifeiliaid mewn ffermio dofednod yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)0238(RAF)

Elin Jones: Yr wyf yn ystyried lles pob anifail fferm, gan gynnwys dofednod, yn ddifrifol iawn. Mae cyfarwyddeb cyngor 99/74/EC, sy'n pennu'r safonau sylfaenol ar gyfer gwarchod ieir sy'n dodwy, yn gwahardd defnyddio cewyll batri confensiynol ledled yr UE o 1 Ionawr 2012 ymlaen. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ymrwymo i gyrraedd y dyddiad terfyn hwnnw yn 2012.

Sandy Mewies: Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod defnyddwyr Cymru'n mynnu fwyfwy bod eu bwyd yn dod o ffynhonnell sy'n rhoi'r

animal welfare is paramount, as was reflected in a recent UK survey. The Co-op, our third major supermarket, has banned the sale of eggs from caged hens, for which it must be congratulated. Do you, like me, hope that other large chains follow this magnificent lead, and is there any way in which the Government can encourage progress?

Elin Jones: There are EU directives and domestic regulations in place as a result of the Animal Health and Welfare Act 2006, so there is an improving picture on this. However, as you suggested, consumer interest and demand will be as powerful, if not more so, than legislation on these issues. There is a particular concern about poultry farming, as we have already discussed this afternoon, and consumer choices will dictate what retailers do. However, I am happy to make representations at any time on behalf of this Assembly Government—we take farmed animal welfare very seriously, and we will look to implement the EU regulations in full.

Darren Millar: Given the cuts that local authorities are facing in animal health budgets, how can you reassure poultry farmers that there are adequate resources to prevent a repeat of the avian flu outbreak that occurred near Llanfihangel Glyn Myfyr in my constituency last year?

Elin Jones: My officials have been in discussion with the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs, and with local authorities, about the issue of funding for trading standards at a local authority level. It is an issue that has been raised in the Chamber before, and has been raised with me by some local authority leaders. It is not up to this Government to meet any financial shortfalls caused by DEFRA in Wales, but it is up to the Assembly Government to ensure, through the work that we undertake with trading standards in this field, that all issues relating to animal health and animal disease control are being implemented in full in Wales.

pwys mwyaf ar les anifeiliaid, fel yr adlewyrchwyd mewn arolwg diweddar yn y DU. Mae'r Co-op, ein trydydd archfarchnad fwyaf, wedi gwahardd gwerthu wyau ieir a gedwir mewn cewyll, ac mae'n rhaid ei llongyfarch am hynny. A ydych chi, fel finnau, yn gobeithio y bydd siopau cadwyn mawr eraill yn dilyn yr arweiniad gwych hwn, ac a oes unrhyw ffordd y gall y Llywodraeth hybu cynnydd?

Elin Jones: Mae cyfarwydddebau'r UE a rheoliadau domestig ar waith o ganlyniad i Ddeddf Iechyd a Lles Anifeiliaid 2006, felly mae'r darlun yn gwella yn hyn o beth. Fodd bynnag, fel yr awgrymasoch, bydd diddordeb a galw defnyddwyr yr un mor bwerus, os nad yn fwy pwerus, na deddfwriaeth ar y materion hyn. Ceir pryder penodol ynghylch ffermio dofednod, fel yr ydym eisoes wedi'i drafod y prynhawn yma, a dewisiadau defnyddwyr fydd yn pennu beth fydd adwerthwyr yn ei wneud. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn fodlon gwneud sylwadau unrhyw bryd ar ran Llywodraeth y Cynulliad hwn—yr ydym yn ystyried lles anifeiliaid sy'n cael eu ffermio'n ddifrifol iawn, a byddwn yn edrych ar weithredu rheoliadau'r UE yn llawn.

Darren Millar: Ac ystyried y toriadau sy'n wynebu awdurdodau lleol mewn cyllidebau iechyd anifeiliaid, sut y gallwch sicrhau ffermwyr dofednod bod digon o adnoddau ar gael i atal ailadrodd yr achos o fflw adar a ddigwyddodd ger Llanfihangel Glyn Myfyr yn fy etholaeth y llynedd?

Elin Jones: Mae fy swyddogion wedi cynnal trafodaethau gydag Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig, a gydag awdurdodau lleol, ynghylch cyllid ar gyfer safonau masnach ar lefel awdurdod lleol. Mae'n fater a godwyd yn y Siambr o'r blaen, ac mae rhai arweinwyr awdurdodau lleol wedi codi'r mater gyda mi. Nid y Llywodraeth hon sy'n gyfrifol am dalu am unrhyw ddiffygion ariannol a achosir gan DEFRA yng Nghymru, ond Llywodraeth y Cynulliad sy'n gyfrifol am sicrhau, drwy'r gwaith a wnawn gyda safonau masnach yn y maes hwn, bod yr holl faterion sy'n ymwneud ag iechyd anifeiliaid a rheoli clefydau anifeiliaid yn cael eu rhoi ar waith yn llawn yng Nghymru.

1.10 p.m.

Jenny Randerson: There is a great deal of public support for increased cage sizes under EU regulations. I welcome the move in the hearts and minds of the public towards free-range poultry, but it is now two years since the EU banned the majority of antibiotics in poultry farming. There was widespread recognition at the time of the serious health threat to public health of bug immunity caused by over-exposure to antibiotics. However, there is still little to protect consumers from foreign food imported into Wales from non-EU countries, particularly in pre-prepared foods. What are you doing to deal with the risk to the Welsh public from those foods?

Elin Jones: Having proper labelling of the source of food would help with this. The EU is currently consulting on food labelling. It is particularly important to enable consumers to be fully aware of the origin of the products that they buy. The source of a chicken or an egg may well be clear, but, as you say, there is not much clarity about processed and packaged foods. I will involve myself in the EU consultation on food labelling to make representations on behalf of Welsh consumers to ensure clarity of labelling and that the source of food production and all content of food are placed on packaging.

Fuel Prices

Q8 Alun Cairns: What assessment has the Minister made of the effect of fuel prices on rural communities? OAQ(3)0250(RAF)

Elin Jones: Mae cynnydd prisiau tanwydd yn effeithio ar gymunedau ar hyd a lled Cymru, gan gynnwys cefn gwlad. Nid wyf wedi ymgymryd ag asesiad ffurfiol o'r effaith penodol ar gefn gwlad.

Alun Cairns: Mae graff gennyf sy'n dangos mai tua \$12 y faril oedd cost olew yn 1999; heddiw, mae'n fwy na \$100 y faril. Nid oes gan bobl mewn ardaloedd gwledig lawer o

Jenny Randerson: Ceir llawer iawn o gefnogaeth gyhoeddus ar gyfer meintiau cewyll mwy dan reoliadau'r UE. Yr wyf yn croesawu'r symudiad yng nghalonau ac ym meddyliau'r cyhoedd at ddefnednod buarth, ond mae hi bellach yn ddwy flynedd ers i'r UE wahardd y rhan fwyaf o wrthfotigau mewn ffermio dofednod. Bu cydnabyddiaeth eang ar y pryd o'r bygythiad difrifol i iechyd y cyhoedd o golli imiwnedd a achoswyd drwy gael gormod o wrthfotigau. Fodd bynnag, ychydig iawn o hyd a geir i amddiffyn defnyddwyr rhag bwyd tramor sy'n cael ei fewnforio i Gymru o wledydd nad ydynt yn yr UE, yn enwedig mewn bwydydd sydd eisoes wedi cael eu paratoi. Beth ydych yn ei wneud i ddelio â'r risg o'r bwydydd hyn i gyhoedd Cymru?

Elin Jones: Byddai labelu ffynhonnell y bwyd yn iawn yn helpu gyda hyn. Ar hyn o bryd mae'r UE yn ymgynghori ar labelu bwyd. Mae'n arbennig o bwysig galluogi defnyddwyr i fod yn hollol ymwybodol o darddiad y cynnyrch y maent yn ei brynu. Efallai fod ffynhonnell cyw iâr neu wŷ yn glir, ond, fel y dywedwch, nid oes llawer o eglurder ynghylch bwydydd sydd wedi'u prosesu a'u pecynnu. Byddaf yn cymryd rhan yn ymgynghoriad yr UE ar labelu bwyd i gyflwyno sylwadau ar ran defnyddwyr Cymru i sicrhau labelu clir a bod ffynhonnell cynhyrchu'r bwyd a holl gynnwys y bwyd yn cael ei roi ar y pecynnau.

Prisiau Tanwydd

C8 Alun Cairns: Pa asesiad mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i wneud o effaith prisiau tanwydd ar gymunedau gwledig? OAQ(3)0250(RAF)

Elin Jones: The impact of rising fuel prices affects communities across Wales, including rural areas. I have not undertaken a formal assessment of the effect on rural Wales.

Alun Cairns: I have a graph showing that in 1999 the cost of oil was around \$12 a barrel; today, the cost is over \$100 a barrel. People in rural areas do not have much choice in

ddewis o ran y ffurf o ynni y gallant ei gael. Mae rhaid iddynt brynu olew neu LPG, sy'n deillio o olew. Felly, pa fath o neges y dylem ei hanfon at y Gweinidog â chyfrifoldeb dros inswleiddio tai ac yn y blaen, i roi cefnogaeth i ardaloedd gwledig er mwyn sicrhau bod pobl yno yn fwy effeithiol o ran sut y maent yn defnyddio ynni?

Elin Jones: Cytunaf fod agweddau ar y cynnydd mewn pris olew a thanwydd, sydd wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf, yn effeithio'n uniongyrchol ac yn benodol iawn ar gefn gwlad, oherwydd pellteroedd teithio, a hefyd oherwydd y diwydiannau penodol a geir yn yr ardaloedd hynny. Er enghraifft, mae'r diwydiannau amaeth a chynhyrchu bwyd yn ddibynnol iawn ar danwydd ac ar gynnyrch o danwydd. Dyna pam mae ffigurau incwm ar gyfer ffermwyr, yn benodol, wedi gostwng y llynedd unwaith eto mewn nifer o feysydd amaethyddol penodol.

Mae'r materion hyn yn rhai o bwys. Mae agweddau arnynt ymhell tu hwnt i fy nghyfrifoldeb i a chyfrifoldeb y Llywodraeth hon, gan eu bod yn ymwneud â phris olew rhyngwladol. Ond, bydd rhaid inni ystyried y materion hyn wrth inni ddatblygu ein strategaethau economaidd a chefn gwlad.

Gareth Jones: Mae adfywio cymunedau gan gynnwys cymunedau gwledig yn rhan allweddol o raglen 'Cymru'n Un'. Yn sicr, bydd y prisiau uchel hyn yn effeithio ar y rhaglen. O ystyried y cynnydd o 2c y litr ar 1 Ebrill, a oes lle inni gael achos arbennig o ran cymunedau gwledig yng Nghymru? A allwch geisio cysylltu â San Steffan a'r Trysorlys, yn enwedig mewn perthynas â'r cynnydd hwn o 1 Ebrill? A oes achos arbennig i'w gael yma yng Nghymru?

Elin Jones: Ni chredaf fod gan gymunedau gwledig achos cryfach na chymunedau eraill o ran y cynnydd mewn treth ar danwydd. Yr oedd yn ddiddorol gweld y bore yma fod Pwyllgor Archwilio Amgylcheddol trawsbleidiol San Steffan wedi gwneud argymhelliad cryf i'r Trysorlys o ran cyllideb yr wythnos nesaf, gan ddweud bod y pwyllgor o'r farn bendant na ddylid gohirio unrhyw gynnydd mewn treth ar danwydd gan fod angen cryfhau agweddau amgylcheddol

terms of the type of energy that they are able to have. They have to purchase oil or LPG, which is produced from oil. Therefore, what kind of message should we send to the Minister with responsibility for insulation in homes and so forth, to support rural areas so that people can be more efficient in their use of energy?

Elin Jones: I agree that aspects of the increases in prices for oil and fuel, which have increased considerably in recent years, have a direct and specific effect on rural areas due to travelling distances, and also because of the specific industries located in those areas. For example, the agricultural and food production industries are dependent upon fuel and by-products of fuel. That is why the income figures for farmers, in particular, reduced last year, once again, in a number of specific agricultural areas.

These are important issues. There are aspects of them that are way beyond my responsibility and the Government's responsibility, because they concern the global price of oil. However, we will have to consider these issues as we develop our economic and rural strategies.

Gareth Jones: Community regeneration, including rural communities, is a key part of the 'One Wales' programme. These high prices will most certainly have an effect on the programme. Given the increase of 2p per litre from 1 April, is there any scope for us to make a special case for rural communities in Wales? Could you try to contact Westminster and the Treasury, particularly in relation to that increase from 1 April? Is there a special case here in Wales?

Elin Jones: I do not believe that rural communities have a stronger case than other communities as regards the increase in fuel duty. It was interesting to see this morning that the cross-party Environmental Audit Committee at Westminster made a strong recommendation to the Treasury for next week's budget, saying that the committee was of the definite opinion that any increase in fuel tax should not be postponed given the need to consolidate the environmental aspects

unrhyw dreth. Felly, ni fyddwn yn cytuno bod angen gweld system wahanol yng nghefn gwlad, ond, pan fyddwn yn ystyried ariannu agweddau ar gefn gwlad a'n strategaethau ar ei gyfer, mae angen ystyried bob tro y gall y gost o gyflwyno gwasanaethau fod yn ddrutach oherwydd y pellteroedd y mae angen eu teithio.

Y Didiâu mewn Gwartheg

C9 David Lloyd: Pa gamau mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i fynd i'r afael â'r didiâu mewn gwartheg yng Ngorllewin De Cymru? OAQ(3)0233(RAF)

Elin Jones: Byddwch yn gwybod bod y Llywodraeth wedi ymrwymo i wario £27 miliwn yn ychwanegol er mwyn mynd i'r afael â TB yng Nghymru. Byddaf yn gwneud cyhoeddiad am sut y bydd y Llywodraeth yn mynd i'r afael â'r maes hwn ym mis Ebrill.

David Lloyd: A ydych yn cytuno gydag argymhellion yr Is-bwyllgor Datblygu Gwledig bod angen ymateb sy'n ystyried yr holl opsiynau ac sy'n fwy holistaidd?

Elin Jones: Yr ydych yn ceisio fy nhemtio i ddweud yn awr yr hyn y byddaf yn ei gyhoeddi ym mis Ebrill ynglŷn â pholisi penodol y Llywodraeth ar y rhaglen gwaredu TB yng Nghymru. Felly, rhaid ichi fy esgusodi, ond ni chaf fy nhemtio. Fodd bynnag, byddaf yn cymryd argymhellion yr Is-bwyllgor Datblygu Gwledig i mi o ddifrif wrth ystyried y camau nesaf.

Alun Cairns: Bovine TB is a problem in many parts of Wales that do not have natural boundaries—other than the isle of Anglesey and the Gower peninsula, and it is not that much of a problem in Anglesey—which could cause problems when it comes to any potential test of the effect of culling badgers on preventing the spread of bovine TB. What consideration has the Minister given to looking at the Gower as a testing ground, given its natural boundary as a peninsula, with industrial Swansea to the north and the rural community to the south? Using that area would enable us to get a specific measurement, rather than using areas of Pembrokeshire, for example, where there is not that natural boundary with industry to

of any duty. Therefore, I would not agree that a different system is needed in rural areas, but, when we consider funding for services in rural areas and our strategies for those areas, we need to consider every time the possibility that introducing services there will cost more, given the distances that have to be travelled.

Bovine Tuberculosis

Q9 David Lloyd: What steps is the Minister taking to tackle bovine tuberculosis in South Wales West? OAQ(3)0233(RAF)

Elin Jones: You will know that the Government has committed an additional £27 million to tackle bovine TB in Wales. I will be making an announcement about how the Government intends to get to grips with that matter in April.

David Lloyd: Do you agree with the recommendations of the Rural Development Sub-committee that we need a response that considers all options and is more holistic?

Elin Jones: You are trying to tempt me to say now what I intend to announce in April, about the Government's specific policy on the TB eradication programme in Wales. Therefore, you will have to excuse me, but I will not be tempted. However, I will take the Rural Development Sub-committee's recommendations seriously when considering the next steps.

Alun Cairns: Mae TB mewn gwartheg yn broblem mewn nifer o ardaloedd yng Nghymru nad oes ganddynt ffiniau naturiol—ac eithrio ynys Môn a phenrhyn Gŵyr, ac nid yw'n gymaint o broblem yn ynys Môn—a gallai hynny achosi problem mewn unrhyw brawf posibl o ran yr effaith y mae difa moch daear yn ei chael ar atal TB mewn gwartheg rhag lledaenu. Pa ystyriaeth a roddodd y Gweinidog i edrych ar y Gŵyr fel y man profi, oherwydd ei ffin naturiol fel penrhyn, a chydag ardal ddiwydiannol Abertawe i'r gogledd a'r gymuned wledig i'r de ohono? Byddai defnyddio'r ardal honno yn ein galluogi i gael mesuriad penodol, yn hytrach na defnyddio ardaloedd yn sir Benfro, er enghraifft, lle na cheir y ffin naturiol honno

prevent the movement of badgers.

Elin Jones: Efallai fod Alun Cairns hefyd yn ceisio fy nhemtio i ddweud rhywbeth am y rhaglen gwaredu TB mewn gwartheg cyn fy nghyhoeddiad ym mis Ebrill. Nid wyf mewn sefyllfa i wneud hynny, ac eithrio i ddweud y byddaf yn edrych ar yr holl dystiolaeth wyddonol sydd ar gael yn ei gyfanrwydd, gan gynnwys yr agweddau hynny sy'n ymwneud â bywyd gwyllt. Fel y mae Alun Cairns wedi'i ddweud, mae gwyddonwyr o'r farn y dylid gwaredu bywyd gwyllt, os o gwbl, mewn ardaloedd lle mae cyfyngiadau corfforol penodol i sicrhau nad yw'r clwyf yn lledu oherwydd unrhyw waredu. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn bwriadu gwneud unrhyw gyhoeddiad ymhellach i hynny heddiw.

1.20 p.m.

Y Llywydd: Rhag i mi ychwanegu at y temtasiynau sy'n wynebu'r Gweinidog, gwell i mi ddod â'r sesiwn gwestiynau i ben.

gyda'r ardal ddiwydiannol, a fyddai'n atal moch daear rhag symud.

Elin Jones: I think that Alun Cairns may also be trying to tempt me to say something about the bovine TB eradication programme before my announcement in April. I am in no position to do that, other than to say that I will look at the whole body of scientific evidence that is available, including that on those aspects to do with wildlife. As Alun Cairns has referred to, scientists are of the view that any culling of wildlife should occur, if at all, in areas where there are specific physical restrictions to ensure that the disease does not spread as a result of any culling. However, I do not intend to make any announcement further to that today.

The Presiding Officer: In case I add to the temptations facing the Minister, I had better bring this questions session to a close.

Datganiad am Ailgyflunio Gwasanaethau Iechyd yng Ngogledd Cymru Statement on Reconfiguration of Services in North Wales

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Edwina Hart): Last week in Plenary, I advised Members that I was awaiting Michael Williams's review of the consultation processes adopted in relation to service reconfiguration at Blaenau Ffestiniog and Prestatyn hospitals. I also said that I would publish it and make a further oral statement to the Assembly this week. The report has been made available to Members this morning.

Members will be aware that proposals for service reconfiguration in north Wales have proved controversial in many aspects. My approach has been to identify the underlying difficulties that caused such public disquiet, and to put in place new procedures that will allow us to engage local populations more effectively to help to shape new and better services for north Wales.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Edwina Hart): Yn ystod y Cyfarfod Llawn yr wythnos diwethaf, rhoddais wybod i'r Aelodau fy mod yn aros am adolygiad Michael Williams o'r prosesau ymgynghori a fabwysiadwyd yng nghyswllt ailgyflunio gwasanaethau yn ysbyty Blaenau Ffestiniog ac ysbyty Prestatyn. Dywedais hefyd y byddwn yn ei gyhoeddi ac yn gwneud datganiad llafar pellach i'r Cynulliad yr wythnos hon. Mae'r adroddiad wedi'i ddarparu i Aelodau'r bore yma.

Bydd yr Aelodau'n ymwybodol bod cynigion ar gyfer ailgyflunio gwasanaethau yn y gogledd wedi bod yn bwnc llosg mewn nifer o agweddau. Yr wyf wedi mynd ati drwy ganfod yr anawsterau sylfaenol a achosodd gymaint o anfonlonrwydd ymhlith y cyhoedd, a drwy roi gweithdrefnau newydd ar waith a fydd yn caniatáu inni ymgysylltu'n fwy effeithiol â phoblogaethau lleol er mwyn cynorthwyo i lunio gwasanaethau newydd a gwell ar gyfer y gogledd.

I have now received Michael's report, and have studied it carefully, not only for what it tells us about what took place in Blaenau Ffestiniog and Prestatyn, but for any more general lessons to be learned about consulting people on the future of health services. The report concluded that Gwynedd Local Health Board acted professionally in dealing with a difficult issue relating to changes in services. It made real efforts to meet the spirit and the letter of the Assembly Government consultation guidance.

However, the report states that the LHB failed to engage the public, despite its best efforts, and identifies a number of areas where the process could have been improved: by earlier engagement with the community and the media, and by improving its consultation booklet. These are not just lessons for this LHB, but for all LHBs across Wales. The earlier consultation process led the public to concentrate on the future use of its hospital, and not on the possibilities of providing better integrated services in the community.

The report traces the way in which, following the public consultation in 2005, the LHB implemented a number of positive service changes to community services in the area. Agreement was reached with the community health council that the 12 beds at the Blaenau Ffestiniog community hospital would be retained for a further three years, or 12 months after the commissioning of Ysbyty Alltwen. Michael suggests that, to provide a period of stability, these beds should be kept in service until 1 April 2011. The report further recommends that a new review be undertaken, one that concentrates on the possible future role of a community hospital in Blaenau Ffestiniog, while considering how other services based at Blaenau Ffestiniog might be improved.

As I said last week, we must not lose sight of what we need to do for the health and wellbeing of the community as a whole, and any further review should take this into

Mae adroddiad Michael bellach wedi dod i law, ac yr wyf wedi'i astudio'n ofalus, nid yn unig oherwydd yr hyn a ddywed wrthym am yr hyn a ddigwyddodd ym Mlaenau Ffestiniog ac ym Mhrestatyn, ond oherwydd unrhyw wersi cyffredinol pellach y dylid eu dysgu ynghylch ymgynghori â phobl am ddyfodol gwasanaethau iechyd. Daeth yr adroddiad i'r casgliad bod Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Gwynedd wedi ymddwyn yn broffesiynol wrth ymdrin â mater anodd yn ymwneud â newidiadau mewn gwasanaethau. Ymdrechodd yn galed i gydymffurfio â chyfarwyddyd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ym mhob ffordd.

Fodd bynnag, mae'r adroddiad yn datgan bod y BILl wedi methu ymgysylltu â'r cyhoedd, er gwaethaf ei waith caled, ac mae'n nodi llawer o feysydd lle gellid bod wedi gwella'r broses: drwy ymgysylltu â'r gymuned a'r cyfryngau yn gynharach a drwy wella ei lyfryn ymgynghori. Nid gwersi i'r BILl hwn yn unig yw'r rhain—maent yn wersi i bob BILl ledled Cymru. Arweiniodd y broses ymgynghori gynharach at y cyhoedd yn canolbwyntio ar y modd y defnyddir ei ysbyty yn y dyfodol, ac nid ar bosiblirwydd darparu gwell gwasanaethau integredig yn y gymuned.

Mae'r adroddiad yn olrhain y ffordd y gweithredodd y BILl nifer o newidiadau gwasanaeth cadarnhaol mewn gwasanaethau cymunedol yn yr ardal, a hynny'n dilyn yr ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus yn 2005. Daethpwyd i gytundeb gyda'r cyngor iechyd cymuned y cedwid y 12 gwely yn ysbyty cymuned Blaenau Ffestiniog am dair blynedd arall, neu am 12 mis ar ôl comisiynu Ysbyty Alltwen. Awgryma Michael y dylid, er mwyn darparu cyfnod o sefydlogrwydd, parhau i ddefnyddio'r gwelyau hyn tan 1 Ebrill 2011. Mae'r adroddiad yn awgrymu ymhellach y dylid cynnal adolygiad newydd, sy'n canolbwyntio ar swyddogaeth bosibl ysbyty cymuned ym Mlaenau Ffestiniog yn y dyfodol, gan ystyried sut y gellid gwella gwasanaethau eraill a leolir ym Mlaenau Ffestiniog.

Fel y dywedais yr wythnos diwethaf, rhaid inni beidio â cholli golwg ar yr hyn y mae angen inni ei wneud er budd iechyd a lles y gymuned drwyddi draw, a dylai unrhyw

account. As Michael has suggested that there should be a period of stability in Blaenau Ffestiniog, I would wish to defer a decision on a new review until Alltwn community hospital opens, and has been fully operational for one year. That supports Michael's recommendation of a period of stability, and satisfies the community health council's original request. Finally, Michael's report concluded that the local health board and the community needed to develop and build on the positive outcomes of the 2005-06 consultation. I cannot stress enough the importance of this collaborative engagement.

On Prestatyn, the report concludes that Denbighshire LHB also failed to engage the public, but, in this case, it concluded that the LHB did not have the appropriate expertise or experience to engage effectively. It also concludes that the model of care proposed was not properly understood by the community, and that there was a breakdown in communication. The report recommends that the consultation process be rerun, which I support. It specifically refers to the need to clearly describe all available options to the community, and to explain exactly the effect of extra care housing beds on the range of future services available in this community. Michael recommends that the 12 beds in Prestatyn be retained until the rerun public consultation is completed, and I support that recommendation.

The local health board will need to take on board the lessons learned from the Williams report very seriously when it engages with the public this time around. I suggest that the regional director support the local health board throughout the process. In response to my Plenary statement on north Wales matters last week, Ann Jones made the important observation that we have to ensure a coherent approach to the development of primary healthcare in the Prestatyn area. I endorse that point and the recommendation of the Williams report. I will require the further consultation exercise to be conducted on that more comprehensive basis. The report recommends that the further consultation

adolygiad pellach ystyried hyn. Yn unol ag awgrymiad Michael y dylid cael cyfnod o sefydlogrwydd ym Mlaenau Ffestiniog, byddwn yn dymuno gohirio penderfyniad ynghylch adolygiad newydd nes bydd ysbyty cymuned Alltwn wedi agor, ac yn gwbl weithredol ers blwyddyn. Mae hyn yn cefnogi argymhelliad Michael am gyfnod o sefydlogrwydd, ac mae hefyd yn bodloni cais gwreiddiol y cyngor iechyd cymuned. Yn olaf, daeth adroddiad Michael i'r casgliad bod angen i'r bwrdd iechyd lleol a'r gymuned ddatblygu canlyniadau cadarnhaol ymgynghoriad 2005-06, ac adeiladu arnynt. Ni allaf orbwysleisio pwysigrwydd yr ymgysylltiad cydweithredol hwn.

O ran Prestatyn, daw'r adroddiad i'r casgliad bod BILl Sir Ddinbych hefyd wedi methu ymgysylltu â'r cyhoedd, ond, yn yr achos hwn, daeth i'r casgliad nad oedd gan y BILl y profiad na'r arbenigedd priodol i ymgysylltu'n effeithiol. Daw hefyd i'r casgliad nad oedd y gymuned wedi deall model y gofal arfaethedig yn iawn, ac y bu diffyg cyfathrebu. Argymhella'r adroddiad y dylid ailgynnal y broses ymgynghori, ac yr wyf o blaid hynny. Cyfeiria'n benodol at yr angen i ddisgrifio'n glir bob opsiwn sydd ar gael i'r gymuned, ac i egluro'n union yr effaith a gaiff gwelyau cartref gofal ychwanegol ar ystod y gwasanaethau a fydd ar gael yn y gymuned hon yn y dyfodol. Argymhella Michael y dylid cadw'r 12 gwely ym Mhrestatyn nes caiff yr ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus ei ailgynnal a'i gwblhau, ac yr wyf yn cefnogi'r argymhelliad hwn.

Bydd angen i'r BILl ystyried y gwersi a ddysgwyd gan adroddiad Williams yn ddifrifol iawn wrth ymgysylltu â'r cyhoedd y tro hwn. Byddwn yn awgrymu i'r cyfarwyddwr rhanbarthol gefnogi'r BILl gydol y broses. Wrth ymateb i'm datganiad yn y Cyfarfod Llawn yr wythnos diwethaf ynghylch materion yn ymwneud â'r gogledd, gwaeth Ann Jones y sylw pwysig ei bod yn rhaid inni sicrhau agwedd gydlynol at ddatblygu gofal iechyd sylfaenol yn ardal Prestatyn. Cefnogaf y pwynt hwnnw ac argymhelliad adroddiad Williams. Bydd angen i'r ymgynghoriad pellach gael ei gynnal ar y sail fwy cynhwysfawr hon. Mae'r adroddiad yn argymhell y dylai'r

exercise include the services required for the population of Rhyl. That suggestion has benefits in ensuring that a more comprehensive review takes place for this stretch of the north Wales coast, and I endorse that recommendation.

The report makes a number of recommendations on the process to be used in future consultations, and on ways in which the existing consultation guidance might be improved. They include the need for openness and earlier public engagement, improved communication strategies, clinical leadership and trust involvement in the process, additional resources for community health councils, the role and composition of task-and-finish groups, and the methods of effectively consulting with the public. I have said in the Chamber on a number of occasions that I am worried about the consultation processes used by the NHS when changes to services are being considered. Michael's report has suggested that clinicians be given a greater role in the process, which I agree with.

These recommendations, together with those of the Goodwin report in Carmarthenshire and Chris Jones's review of community services in north Wales, will be considered and developed as part of the revision of the Assembly Government's engagement and consultation guidance. I must stress that this revised guidance will start with the need to engage the public as early in the process as possible. My officials will start work on this important piece of guidance immediately.

That concludes my update on the reconfiguration of health services and structures in north Wales this week; I hope to provide Members with a further statement next week on the work that has been undertaken by Dr Chris Jones on community services in north Wales. Finally, I publicly thank Michael Williams for the detailed work that he has undertaken in this review, the time that he has taken going out to meet people, and congratulate him on a comprehensive piece of work, which I am

ymgyngoriad pellach hwn gynnwys y gwasanaethau y mae eu hangen ar boblogaeth y Rhyl. Ceir buddiannau i'r awgrymiad hwn o ran sicrhau y cynhelir adolygiad mwy cynhwysfawr ar gyfer y rhan hon o arfordir y gogledd, a chefnogaf yr argymhelliad hwn.

Gwna'r adroddiad lawer o argymhellion i'r broses gael ei defnyddio mewn ymgynghoriadau yn y dyfodol, a ffyrdd y gellid gwella'r arweiniad ymgynghori presennol. Maent yn cynnwys yr angen i fod yn agored ac i ymgysylltu â'r cyhoedd yn gynharach, gwell strategaethau cyfathrebu, rhan ymddiriedaeth ac arweinyddiaeth glinigol yn y broses, adnoddau ychwanegol ar gyfer cynghorau iechyd cymuned, swyddogaeth a chyfansoddiad y grwpiau gorchwyl a gorffen, a dulliau ymgynghori'n effeithiol â'r cyhoedd. Yr wyf wedi dweud droeon yn y Siambr fy mod yn pryderu am y prosesau ymgynghori a ddefnyddir gan y GIG pan ystyrir newidiadau mewn gwasanaethau. Mae adroddiad Michael wedi awgrymu y dylid rhoi mwy o swyddogaeth i glinigwyr yn y broses, ac yr wyf yn cytuno â hyn.

Caiff yr argymhellion hyn, ynghyd â'r rheiny gan adroddiad Goodwin yn sir Gaerfyrddin ac adolygiad Chris Jones o wasanaethau cymunedol yn y gogledd, eu hystyried a'u datblygu fel rhan o'r gwaith i ddiwygio arweiniad ymgynghori ac ymgysylltu Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Rhaid imi bwysleisio y bydd yr arweiniad diwygiedig hwn yn dechrau gyda'r angen i ymgysylltu â'r cyhoedd cyn gynted â phosibl yn y broses. Bydd fy swyddogion yn bwrw ati i weithio ar y darn pwysig hwn o arweiniad ar unwaith.

Dyna ddiwedd fy niweddariad am ailgyflunio strwythurau a gwasanaethau iechyd yn y gogledd am yr wythnos hon; gobeithiaf ddarparu datganiad arall i'r Aelodau'r wythnos nesaf ynghylch y gwaith a wnaethpwyd gan Dr Chris Jones ar wasanaethau cymunedol yn y gogledd. Yn olaf, diolchaf yn gyhoeddus i Michael Williams am y gwaith manwl a wnaethpwyd ganddo yn yr adolygiad hwn, yr amser y mae wedi'i roi i fynd i gwrdd â phobl, a'i longyfarch am ddarn cynhwysfawr o waith,

delighted to support.

Mark Isherwood: Thank you for your statement, Minister. It does not seem like a long time since you announced it, although several months have passed. On that occasion, I said that the proof of the pudding would be in the eating. As you know, I speak as the person who, at the request of Blaenau Ffestiniog and Prestatyn campaigners, established Community Hospitals Acting Nationally Together Cymru, who held a rally here, and who invited both those groups to attend the Llandudno Hospital rally in April, attended by all parties and referred to last week. I also attended a public meeting in Prestatyn, and can confirm that the local community was unanimously of the view that it had not been properly or adequately consulted. Therefore, I am pleased to see the conclusion that Denbighshire Local Health Board had failed to engage the public, and perhaps lacks the necessary expertise and experience. I am sure that Blaenau Ffestiniog will be pleased that a period of stability will now be provided until 2011 and that there is a recommendation for a new review to be undertaken. What assurances can you give to the community in Blaenau Ffestiniog that the delay until Alltwen community hospital has been open for a year will still leave all options open, and that it will be fully consulted and engaged at the earliest opportunity, and not just at that point in time?

With regard to Prestatyn, I am pleased to see that the process will be rerun. I note your comments about extra care beds. Will you take on board the concerns that were widely raised at the time, including at a public meeting that I attended, and subsequently through CHANT? People were well briefed on the options and the model of care proposed, contrary to what you are saying, and on the proposal that new extra care provision would include beds commissioned by the local health boards, working, I believe, with Wales and West Housing Association. Can you provide assurances to local people that this new review will be on a level playing field and will not make such presumptions? I can assure you that the people who protested on the roof and the lead

ac mae'n bleser gennyf gefnogi'r gwaith hwnnw.

Mark Isherwood: Diolch am eich datganiad Weinidog. Er bod misoedd lawer wedi mynd heibio ers ichi ei gyhoeddi, nid yw'n teimlo cyn hired. Ar yr achlysur hwnnw, dywedais y câi'r adolygiadau eu profi ar ôl iddynt gael eu rhoi ar waith. Fel y gwyddoch, fi a sefydlodd Ysbytai Cymuned yn Gweithredu'n Genedlaethol Gyda'i Gilydd Cymru, a hynny ar gais ymgrychwyr Blaenau Ffestiniog a Phrestatyn. Cynhaliais rali yma, gan wahodd y ddau grŵp hynny i fynd i rali Ysbyty Llandudno ym mis Ebrill—rali lle'r oedd pob plaid yn bresennol ac y cyfeiriwyd ati'r wythnos diwethaf. Yr oeddwn hefyd yn bresennol mewn cyfarfod cyhoeddus ym Mhrestatyn, a gallaf gadarnhau bod y gymuned leol yn unfrydol o'r farn nas ymgynghorwyd â hi'n briodol nac yn ddigonol. Felly, yr wyf yn falch o weld y casgliad bod Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Sir Ddinbych wedi methu ymgysylltu â'r cyhoedd, ac nad oes ganddo efallai'r profiad na'r arbenigedd angenrheidiol. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Blaenau Ffestiniog yn falch y darperir yn awr gyfnod o sefydlogrwydd tan 2011, ac y ceir argymhelliad am gynnal adolygiad newydd. Sut y gallwch sicrhau cymuned Blaenau Ffestiniog y bydd yr oedi nes bydd ysbyty cymuned Alltwen wedi bod ar agor ers blwyddyn yn arwain at nifer o opsiynau, ac yr ymgynghorir â'r gymuned ac yr ymgysylltir â hi cyn gynted â phosibl, ac nid dim ond ar yr adeg hynny?

O ran Prestatyn, yr wyf yn falch o weld y caiff y broses ei hailchynnal. Sylwaf ar eich sylwadau am welyau gofal ychwanegol. A ystyriwch y pryderon a godwyd droeon ar y pryd, gan gynnwys mewn cyfarfod cyhoeddus yr oeddwn yn bresennol ynddo, ac wedyn drwy Ysbytai Cymuned yn Gweithredu'n Genedlaethol Gyda'i Gilydd? Cafodd pobl lawer o wybodaeth am yr opsiynau a'r model gofal arfaethedig, i'r gwrthwyneb i'r hyn a ddywedwch, a chawsant lawer iawn o wybodaeth am y cynnig y byddai darpariaeth gofal ychwanegol newydd yn cynnwys gwelyau a gomisiynwyd gan y byrddau iechyd lleol, gan weithio gyda Chymdeithas Dai Wales and West yr wyf yn credu. A allwch sicrhau pobl leol y bydd yr adolygiad newydd hwn

campaigners were so well briefed that they confused me on many occasions with the complexity and depth of their knowledge. Finally, I know that you have asked your civil servants to start work on this, but how will you engage with the public in Prestatyn at the earliest opportunity, to ensure its full involvement in that process?

Edwina Hart: I had the opportunity to visit Prestatyn Community Hospital with Ann Jones and to meet with protesters, as she was kind enough to organise a meeting for me there to hear at first hand their very real concerns about the consultation process. That meeting influenced me and my decision to ask Michael Williams to undertake the consultation.

1.30 p.m.

I am not surprised by the outcome of Michael Williams's report, because the grave concerns that Ann and I heard at first hand that day related to the lack of transparency in the process and the fact that, although options were given, they were not given in full. If you give options, they must be properly costed. You must know what they are, and you must understand how they were reached. That is what I aim to do when we have the rerun consultation, which will be kept under close review by the regional office. It will be very open and transparent. In addition, the future consultation must be widened in many ways. Prestatyn cannot be looked at in isolation, so we must look at the primary healthcare needs of other areas, at additional housing and all the other issues that come within the realm of what we are doing for community services.

I also visited Blaenau Ffestiniog with Gareth Jones AM, and I have been kept regularly updated on the local issues by the Presiding Officer, who has an interest in the hospital. Given the geography of the area, which is an isolated community, in many ways, its needs and requirements were clear to me, including

yn deg i bawb, ac na fydd yn gwneud rhagdybiaethau o'r fath? Gallaf eich sicrhau bod gan y bobl a oedd yn protestio ar y to a'r prif ymgyrchwyr gymaint o wybodaeth fel y gwnaethant fy nrysu'n lân droeon gyda'u gwybodaeth ddofn a chymhleth. Yn olaf, gwn eich bod wedi gofyn i'ch gweision sifil ddechrau gweithio ar hyn, ond sut y byddwch yn ymgysylltu â'r cyhoedd ym Mhrestatyn ar y cyfle cyntaf posibl, er mwyn sicrhau y cânt eu cynnwys yn llawn yn y broses honno?

Edwina Hart: Cefais gyfle i ymweld ag Ysbyty Cymuned Prestatyn gydag Ann Jones a chyfarfûm â phrotestwyr, gan iddi fod yn ddigon caredig i drefnu cyfarfod imi yno i gael clywed o lygad y ffynnon eu pryderon gwirioneddol am y broses ymgynghori. Dylanwadodd y cyfarfod hwnnw arnaf o ran fy mhenderfyniad i ofyn i Michael Williams gynnal yr ymgynghoriad.

Nid yw canlyniad adroddiad Michael Williams yn fy synnu, oherwydd yr oedd y pryderon enbyd a glywodd Ann a minnau o lygad y ffynnon y diwrnod hwnnw yn ymwneud â'r diffyg tryloywder yn y broses a'r ffaith, er bod dewisiadau'n cael eu rhoi, nad oeddent yn cael eu hegluro'n llawn. Os ydych yn rhoi dewisiadau, rhaid iddynt fod wedi'u costio'n iawn. Rhaid ichi wybod beth ydynt, a rhaid ichi ddeall sut y cawsant eu paratoi. Dyna'r hyn y bwriadaf ei wneud pan gaiff yr ymgynghoriad ei gynnal eto, a bydd y swyddfa ranbarthol yn cadw golwg fanwl arno. Bydd yn agored ac yn dryloyw iawn. Yn ychwanegol at hynny, rhaid ehangu'r ymgynghoriadau yn y dyfodol mewn llawer o ffyrdd. Ni ellir edrych ar Brestatyn ar wahân, felly rhaid inni edrych ar anghenion gofal iechyd sylfaenol ardaloedd eraill, ar dai ychwanegol ac ar yr holl faterion eraill sydd ym maes yr hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud ar gyfer gwasanaethau cymunedol.

Ymwelais hefyd â Blaenau Ffestiniog gyda Gareth Jones AC, ac mae'r Llywydd wedi bod yn rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf imi'n gyson ynglŷn â'r materion lleol, gan fod ganddo ddiddordeb yn yr ysbyty. Ac ystyried daearyddiaeth yr ardal, sy'n gymuned ynysig mewn nifer o ffyrdd, yr oedd ei hanghenion

the need for improved public transport links. As far as I am concerned, all options are now open, so that we achieve what we have to achieve in Blaenau Ffestiniog. Dr Chris Jones also visited Blaenau Ffestiniog, and was very impressed. Some of Chris's recommendations on primary care, which are winging their way to me, will also influence the future of Blaenau Ffestiniog.

We must look at our community hospitals as a resource. They may not be the resource that they were previously, when the trusts were running them, but they could still be a palliative care resource for GPs, or a resource for other organisations. We must approach primary care in an holistic way. However, on the wider issues, my officials will be keeping a close eye on how the consultation arrangements are carried out across Wales, and I would be very grateful if Members would draw any concerns to my attention early, once the new processes start, as we do not want to get into the same mess as previously, when people did not feel engaged by some of these consultation exercises.

Helen Mary Jones: I thank the Minister for her statement. With regard to Blaenau Ffestiniog, I strongly support the decision to delay any further review until the Alltwn community hospital has been fully operational for a year. It is important that we understand the travel issues and the geographical realities of these areas. Communities, particularly in the north, may look very close together on a map, but it can take a long time to travel from one place to another. The Minister has demonstrated that she acknowledges that by saying that we need to see what the effect of Ysbyty Alltwn will be before any decision is taken on Blaenau Ffestiniog. Minister, will you confirm that the new review of the situation at Blaenau Ffestiniog will fully take into account primary care needs, and the future needs of that community and the surrounding communities?

a'i gofynion yn amlwg imi, gan gynnwys yr angen am well cysylltiadau trafniadaeth gyhoeddus. O'm rhan i, mae'r holl ddewisiadau yn bosibl yn awr, er mwyn inni gyflawni'r hyn y mae'n rhaid inni ei gyflawni ym Mlaenau Ffestiniog. Ymwelodd Dr Chris Jones â Blaenau Ffestiniog hefyd, a gwnaeth y lle argraff fawr arno. Bydd rhai o argymhellion Chris am ofal sylfaenol, sydd ar eu ffordd ataf yn ddiymdroi, hefyd yn dylanwadu ar ddyfodol Blaenau Ffestiniog.

Rhaid inni ystyried ein hysbytai cymuned yn adnodd. Efallai nad ydynt yr un math o adnodd ag yr arferent fod, pan oedd yr ymddiriedolaethau'n eu rhedeg, ond gallent barhau i fod yn adnodd gofal lliniarol i feddygon teulu, neu'n adnodd i sefydliadau eraill. Rhaid inni fabwysiadu agwedd gyfannol at ofal sylfaenol. Fodd bynnag, o ran y materion ehangach, bydd fy swyddogion yn cadw golwg fanwl ar y modd y caiff y trefniadau ymgynghori eu gweithredu ledled Cymru, a byddwn yn ddiolchgar iawn pe gallai Aelodau dynnu fy sylw at unrhyw bryderon yn gynnar, wedi i'r prosesau newydd gychwyn, gan nad oes arnom eisiau bod yn yr un llanast ag o'r blaen, pan nad oedd pobl yn teimlo eu bod yn cael eu cynnwys yn rhai o'r ymarferion ymgynghori hyn.

Helen Mary Jones: Hoffwn ddiolch i'r Gweinidog am ei datganiad. O ran Blaenau Ffestiniog, yr wyf yn cefnogi'n gryf y penderfyniad i oedi unrhyw adolygiad pellach nes bydd ysbyty cymuned Alltwn wedi bod yn gwbl weithredol am flwyddyn. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn deall y materion sy'n ymwneud â theithio a realiti daearyddol yr ardaloedd hyn. Efallai fod cymunedau, yn enwedig yn y gogledd, yn edrych yn agos iawn at ei gilydd ar fap, ond gall gymryd cryn amser i deithio o un man i'r llall. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi dangos ei bod yn cydnabod hynny drwy ddweud bod angen inni weld beth fydd effaith Ysbyty Alltwn cyn y gwneir unrhyw benderfyniad ynghylch Blaenau Ffestiniog. A wnewch chi gadarnhau, Weiniog, y bydd yr adolygiad newydd o'r sefyllfa ym Mlaenau Ffestiniog yn rhoi ystyriaeth lawn i anghenion gofal sylfaenol, ac anghenion y gymuned honno a'r cymunedau cyfagos yn y dyfodol?

With regard to Prestatyn, I again welcome the decision to rerun the consultation. Those of us who visited the hospital and spoke to campaigners were struck by how confused they were about some of the issues being put forward. The quality of information that people had been given, as Mark Isherwood said, was very poor. It is clear that that consultation needs to be started from scratch. Will you confirm that the regional director will oversee this process to avoid a repeat of further mistakes, although I take from what you have said that that will be the case? Will you also let us know whether this consultation process will use the new guidance that your officials are working on now?

On the border consultation issues, I share your concern and endorse everything that you and other Members have said about previous consultation processes. What is the timetable for the production of the new guidance? Prestatyn is an example, and there are others, of the need to undertake certain pieces of work quite urgently. I understand, Minister, that there is a balance to be struck between ensuring that we get this right and delaying pieces of work unnecessarily. I would be grateful, therefore, for further information on the timetable of the new consultation guidance.

Minister, do you think it would be appropriate to consult on the new guidance, once it is in draft form? It is my belief that one of the problems with the previous set of guidance was that it was generated by the health service, within the health service, for the use of the health service. We know that the voluntary sector in Wales, and perhaps local government, has a great deal of expertise in conducting consultation processes. Can you ensure that that best practice is incorporated in the new health service guidance, through an open consultation process or in the way in which your officials draw up the new guidance?

O ran Prestatyn, yr wyf, eto, yn croesawu'r penderfyniad i gynnal yr ymgynghoriad unwaith eto. Sylwodd y rhai ohonom a ymwelodd â'r ysbyty ac a fu'n siarad â'r ymgyrchwyr pa mor ddryslyd oeddent ynghylch rhai o'r materion a oedd yn cael eu cyflwyno. Fel y dywedodd Mark Isherwood, yr oedd ansawdd y wybodaeth a roddwyd i bobl yn wael iawn. Mae'n amlwg bod angen dechrau o'r dechrau ar yr ymgynghoriad hwnnw. A wnewch gadarnhau y bydd y cyfarwyddwr rhanbarthol yn goruchwyllo'r broses hon er mwyn osgoi ailadrodd rhagor o gamgymeriadau, er fy mod yn cymryd yn ganiataol o'r hyn yr ydych wedi'i ddweud mai dyna fydd yn digwydd? A wnewch roi gwybod inni hefyd a fydd y broses ymgynghori hon yn defnyddio'r canllawiau newydd y mae eich swyddogion yn gweithio arnynt ar hyn o bryd?

O ran y materion ynghylch ymgynghori ar draws ffiniau, yr wyf fi, fel chi, yn bryderus ynglŷn â hynny ac yr wyf yn ategu popeth yr ydych chi ac Aelodau eraill wedi'i ddweud ynglŷn â phrosesau ymgynghori blaenorol. Beth yw'r amserlen ar gyfer paratoi'r canllawiau newydd? Mae Prestatyn yn enghraifft, a cheir enghreifftiau eraill, o'r angen i wneud rhai darnau o waith ar gryn frys. Deallaf, Weinidog, bod angen cadw'r ddysgl yn wastad rhwng sicrhau ein bod yn gwneud hyn yn iawn a pheri oedi diangen i ddarnau o waith. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar, felly, pe gallwn gael rhagor o wybodaeth ynglŷn ag amserlen y canllawiau ymgynghori newydd.

A gredwch, Weinidog, y byddai'n addas ymgynghori ar y canllawiau newydd, pan fyddant yn barod ar ffurf ddrafft? Yr wyf fi o'r farn mai un o'r problemau gyda'r set flaenorol o ganllawiau oedd eu bod wedi'u creu gan y gwasanaeth iechyd, o fewn y gwasanaeth iechyd, i'w defnyddio gan y gwasanaeth iechyd. Gwyddom fod gan y sector gwirfoddol yng Nghymru, a llywodraeth leol o bosibl, gryn arbenigedd o ran cynnal prosesau ymgynghori. A allwch sicrhau bod yr arferion gorau hynny yn cael eu cynnwys yng nghanllawiau newydd y gwasanaeth iechyd, a hynny drwy gyfrwng proses ymgynghori agored neu yn y modd y mae eich swyddogion yn paratoi'r canllawiau newydd?

Edwina Hart: I hope to have suggestions on the new consultation guidance in front of me by the end of April, in light of reports being prepared. I intend to consider a slightly different consultation method from the old one of putting it on the website, advising anyone and everyone of where it is, and hoping for the right result. What I would like to see, which I am discussing currently, is more engagement with community health groups, patient groups, local government, and so on by way of seminars, so that they can discuss their feelings about consultation. The type of consultation that I would like to see is more than a paper exercise, and I would be happy to report back to the Assembly on that, when I am in a position to do so. Therefore, that is my interim timetable.

On Prestatyn hospital, I will have the regional director oversee the consultation, because the responsibility lies with the local health board, given that it is a statutory duty. We have to keep an eye on this process, because the point that has been made by you, Helen Mary, and others is that people in Prestatyn are confused by this. They were unsure whether the information that they had received was correct, so they dug a bit more and found out a bit more. That is not a satisfactory way of consulting on the future of any service, and so we will take that forward.

The issues key to the review of Blaenau Ffestiniog hospital will be the primary health considerations there. I met a local general practitioner, who was full of enthusiasm about carrying out work in that area, and we need to build on that with the provision of services. I can assure you that that will also be an open process. I cannot put a timescale on its completion. Michael suggested 2011, but it could take longer than that, depending on the new operation of Ysbyty Alltwen.

Your points about geography and travel times in certain areas are interesting. If you

Edwina Hart: Gobeithiaf y bydd awgrymiadau ynglŷn â'r canllawiau ymgynghori newydd ar gael imi erbyn diwedd mis Ebrill, ar sail yr adroddiadau sy'n cael eu paratoi. Bwriadaf ystyried dull ymgynghori a fydd rywfaint yn wahanol i'r hen ddull o'i roi ar y wefan, rhoi gwybod i bawb a phopeth ymhle y mae, a gobeithio am y canlyniad iawn. Yr hyn yr hoffwn ei weld, ac yr wyf yn ei drafod ar hyn o bryd, yw rhagor o gyswllt â grwpiau iechyd cymunedol, grwpiau cleifion, llywodraeth leol, ac yn y blaen, drwy gyfrwng seminarau, er mwyn iddynt allu trafod eu teimladau ynglŷn ag ymgynghori. Mae'r math o ymgynghori yr hoffwn ei weld yn fwy nag ymarferiad ar bapur, a byddwn yn gwbl fodlon adrodd yn ôl i'r Cynulliad ar hynny, pan fyddaf mewn sefyllfa i wneud hynny. Dyna, felly, yw fy amserlen dros dro.

O ran ysbyty Prestatyn, byddaf yn sicrhau bod y cyfarwyddwr rhanbarthol yn goruchwylio'r ymgynghori, oherwydd cyfrifoldeb y bwrdd iechyd lleol ydyw, gan ei bod yn ddyletswydd statudol. Rhaid inni gadw golwg ar y broses hon, oherwydd y pwynt yr ydych chi, Helen Mary, ac eraill wedi'i grybwyll yw bod hyn wedi drysu pobl ym Mhrestatyn. Yr oeddent yn ansicr ynghylch a oedd y wybodaeth yr oeddent wedi'i chael yn gywir ai peidio, felly gwnaethant ragor o ymchwil a chanfod rhagor o wybodaeth. Nid yw hynny'n ffordd foddhaol o ymgynghori ar ddyfodol unrhyw wasanaeth, ac felly byddwn yn mynd ar drywydd hynny.

Y materion allweddol ar gyfer yr adolygiad o ysbyty Blaenau Ffestiniog fydd yr ystyriaethau iechyd sylfaenol yno. Cyfarfûm â meddyg teulu lleol, a oedd yn llawn brwdfrydedd ynglŷn â chynnal gwaith yn yr ardal honno, ac mae angen inni adeiladu ar sail hynny drwy ddarparu gwasanaethau. Gallaf eich sicrhau y bydd honno hefyd yn broses agored. Ni allaf roi amserlen ar gyfer ei chwblhau. Awgrymodd Michael 2011, ond gallai gymryd yn hwy na hynny, gan ddibynnu ar sut y bydd ysbyty newydd Alltwen yn gweithio.

Mae eich pwyntiau ynglŷn â daearyddiaeth ac amseroedd teithio mewn rhai ardaloedd yn

want to go somewhere that looks close on the map, you might be better off taking the public transport that is going in the other direction. An interesting point is that it will be quicker for people to go to Llandudno to access some services rather than to Ysbyty Alltwen, because of the transport issues. There are many issues to consider in relation to patient transport provision, and I do not think that we placed some of the practical issues high enough on the agenda during the consultation.

Eleanor Burnham: Diolch am y datganiad, Weinidog. Fel y soniais yr wythnos diwethaf, yn gyffredinol, nid oeddwn yn teimlo fod arolwg Wanless wedi rhoi digon o bwyslais ar yr hyn yr ydych chi'n ei weld mor glir, sef trafniadaeth i bobl hŷn a phobl fregus ein cymunedau. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar eich bod wedi bod mor ddoeth am y materion hyn. Yr oeddwn yn credu bod y broses yn hollol ddiffygiol, ac yn ffug, bron iawn. Ni chymerwyd unrhyw sylw o'r hyn a ddywedasom fel Aelodau, a'r teimlad oedd bod y byrddau iechyd yn gallu codi gwrychyn pawb, a hynny heb geisio yn galed iawn. Mae'n bleser clywed eich bod yn gwneud eich gorau dros y cymunedau hyn.

Er bod eisiau gwneud popeth yn iawn, gobeithiaf y bydd amserlen eithaf tyn yn cael ei phennu. Yr wyf yn siŵr y cawn arweiniad cadarn gennyh, a gobeithiaf y bydd y tryloywder yn parhau. Un o'r pethau pwysicaf yn y broses hon yw bod y bobl yn y cymunedau yn deall yn union beth sy'n digwydd, a bod ganddynt lais cryf. Dymunaf yn dda i chi, a gobeithiaf y cawn glywed yn fuan am yr hyn y byddwch yn ei wneud. Byddaf yn canolbwyntio ar Brestatyn, lle bŵm hefyd yn ymgynghori, a mawr obeithiaf y bydd pethau'n gwella. Nid wyf am gyffwrdd â mater Blaenau Ffestiniog, oherwydd nid yw yn fy ardal, ond gobeithiaf am ddiweddglo positif er mwyn i bawb fod yn hapus.

Edwina Hart: We will have to take a firm line on future consultations, especially those that occur in the interim period, before the new arrangements are in place. However, we have an idea about best practice emerging from these reports, which local health boards

ddiddorol. Os ydych am fynd i rywle sy'n edrych yn agos ar y map, mae'n bosibl y byddai'n well ichi fynd ar drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus sy'n teithio i'r cyfeiriad cwbl groes. Un pwynt diddorol yw y bydd yn gyflymach i bobl fynd i Landudno i gael rhai gwasanaethau yn hytrach nag i Ysbyty Alltwen, oherwydd materion yn ymwneud â thrafnidiaeth. Mae llawer o faterion i'w hystyried o ran y ddarpariaeth drafnidiaeth i gleifion, ac ni chredaf inni roi blaenoriaeth digon uchel i rai o'r materion ymarferol yn ystod yr ymgynghori.

Eleanor Burnham: Thank you for the statement, Minister. As I mentioned last week, I did not feel, in general, that the Wanless review had given enough emphasis on the issues that you regard to be so clear, namely transportation for older and vulnerable people in our communities. I am grateful that you have been so wise in respect of these issues. I thought that the process was totally deficient and almost a sham. No-one took any notice of our comments, as Members, and the feeling was that the health boards managed to infuriate everyone, without even trying too hard. I am pleased to hear that you are now doing your best for these communities.

Although everything needs to be done properly, I hope that quite a tight timescale will be set. I am sure that you will give us firm leadership, and I hope that the transparency will continue. One of the most important things in this process is that the people in these communities understand exactly what is happening, and that they should have a strong voice. I wish you well, and I hope to hear very soon exactly what you will be doing. I will be concentrating on Prestatyn, where I also held consultations, and I very much hope that things will improve. I will not touch upon Blaenau Ffestiniog as it is not in my area, but I am hoping for a positive outcome so that everyone can be content.

Edwina Hart: Bydd yn rhaid inni osod trefn gaeth ar gyfer ymgynghoriadau yn y dyfodol, yn enwedig y rheiny a gynhelir yn y cyfnod dros dro cyn cyflwyno'r trefniadau newydd. Fodd bynnag, mae gennym syniad ynglŷn â'r arferion gorau sy'n codi o'r adroddiadau hyn,

can look at, in the first instance. I will ask my regional office to discuss the timetabling of future consultations with LHBs. I will give some consideration as to whether to issue my preliminary guidance before allowing a consultation to start again, even if it is only in preliminary as opposed to final form. At least that would be helpful to local health boards.

We have to get the balance right, because it is all well and good saying that everything has to be super duper and that we need all these large centres, which is true, but we also have to get the mixture right, and understand why. I very much hope that the new ways of engaging in consultation will allow that to happen.

1.40 p.m.

Ann Jones: Thank you, Minister, for asking Michael Williams to conduct the review. It is a thorough review, and I am grateful for the opportunity to discuss with you and him the very real concerns of my constituents regarding Prestatyn Community Hospital.

It is interesting to note that he cites in his report the lack of capacity within the local health board to deal with such a public consultation. I was pleased to hear you say that there will now be preliminary guidance and direction for the local health board from the regional director. I have always said—and you alluded to this in your statement—that the primary and secondary healthcare needs of Prestatyn require a holistic approach to be taken. I would not want this review to be singled out in any way and to be rerun purely for that one narrow issue. Many issues affect the people of Prestatyn. It is the second largest town in my constituency. It has few primary healthcare resources other than its GP surgeries. There is a need for us to look at this holistically. Therefore, Minister, I would be grateful if you could outline how you see that fitting in with all the other reviews that are ongoing. When do you think we can start a meaningful consultation of the residents of Prestatyn, who will be accessing this primary healthcare resource centre for

y gall byrddau iechyd lleol edrych arnynt, yn y lle cyntaf. Gofynnaf i'm swyddfa ranbarthol drafod amserlennu ymgynghoriadau yn y dyfodol gyda'r byrddau iechyd lleol. Byddaf yn ystyried a ddylwn gyhoeddi fy nghanllawiau cychwynol cyn caniatáu i ymgynghori gychwyn eto, hyd yn oed os dim ond ar ffurf gychwynol y maent, yn hytrach na ffurf derfynol. O leiaf y byddai hynny'n ddefnyddiol i fyrddau iechyd lleol.

Rhaid inni sicrhau'r cydbwysedd cywir, oherwydd mae'n hawdd iawn dweud ei bod yn rhaid i bopeth fod yn wych a bod arnom angen yr holl ganolfannau mawr hyn, sy'n wir, ond mae'n rhaid inni hefyd sicrhau'r cyfuniad cywir, a deall pam. Gobeithiaf yn fawr y bydd y ffyrdd newydd o ymgynghori yn caniatáu i hynny ddigwydd.

Ann Jones: Hoffwn ddiolch ichi, Weinidog, am ofyn i Michael Williams gynnal yr adolygiad. Mae'n adolygiad trylwyr, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle i drafod pryderon gwirioneddol fy etholwyr ynglŷn ag Ysbyty Cymuned Prestatyn gyda chi a chydag ef.

Mae'n ddiddorol sylwi ei fod yn tynnu sylw yn ei adroddiad at y diffyg capasiti yn y bwrdd iechyd lleol i ymdrin ag ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus o'r fath. Yr oedd yn dda gennyf eich clywed yn dweud y bydd y cyfarwyddwr rhanbarthol yn awr yn rhoi canllawiau a chyfarwyddyd cychwynol i'r bwrdd iechyd lleol. Yr wyf wastad wedi dweud—a chyfeiriasoch at hyn yn eich adroddiad—bod angen mabwysiadu dull gweithredu cyfannol i ymdrin ag anghenion gofal iechyd sylfaenol ac eilaidd Prestatyn. Ni fyddwn am i'r adolygiad hwn gael ei neilltuo mewn unrhyw fodd a chael ei gynnal eto am y rheswm cyfyng hwnnw'n unig. Mae llawer o faterion yn effeithio ar bobl Prestatyn. Hon yw'r ail dref fwyaf yn fy etholaeth. Ychydig iawn o adnoddau gofal iechyd sylfaenol sydd yno oni bai am ei meddygfeydd teulu. Mae angen inni edrych ar hyn mewn modd cyfannol. Felly, Weinidog, byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech amlinellu sut yr ydych yn gweld hynny'n cyd-fynd â'r holl adolygiadau eraill sy'n cael

many years?

Edwina Hart: Thank you very much for that, Ann. When I was considering what to say in my statement today, I checked last week's Record and other discussions. I was mindful of your advice that I should look at the whole of primary healthcare provision. Borders do not then become an issue, whether LHB borders or trust borders. We have to look at the requirements of patients in particular areas.

Primary healthcare needs will drive this review, and it cannot just be a matter of building a hospital; it has to be about the whole, and that does not necessarily always involve health. It might involve other local authority provision, such as additional care beds, and so on. Therefore, it will not be a standard rerun, as there would be no point in doing that. The same information would be presented and the discussion would carry on. We want to get to the heart of the matter, namely the requirements of Prestatyn, the requirements of the near neighbours in Rhyl, and how we can join it all up. That is the holistic approach.

You raised with me the capacity of LHBs, which I am concerned about, not only in their delivery of consultations, but also the way in which contracts are sometimes dealt with, and their engagement with others. If LHBs are to continue to be involved in the process, we must find a way of strengthening these issues. That is very much on my mind for the future. That is an issue for the whole of Wales, not just this area.

We are not singling out Prestatyn; the matter happened to come to my attention when I visited Ann, and I asked Michael to look at it specifically. I am sure that there are issues across Wales that are similar to those that are found here, and we have to learn the lessons.

eu cynnal ar hyn o bryd. Pryd y credwch y gallwn ddechrau cynnal ymgynghoriad ystyrion â thrigolion Prestatyn, a fydd yn defnyddio'r ganolfan adnoddau gofal iechyd sylfaenol hon am lawer blwyddyn?

Edwina Hart: Diolch yn fawr iawn am hynny, Ann. Pan oeddwn yn ystyried beth i'w ddweud yn fy natganiad heddiw, edrychais ar Gofnod yr wythnos diwethaf ac ar drafodaethau eraill. Yr oeddwn yn cofio'ch cyngor y dylwn edrych ar y ddarpariaeth gofal iechyd sylfaenol yn ei chyfanrwydd. Nid yw ffiniau'n bwysig wedyn, boed hwy'n ffiniau rhwng byrddau iechyd lleol neu'n ffiniau rhwng ymddiriedolaethau. Mae'n rhaid inni edrych ar anghenion cleifion mewn ardaloedd penodol.

Anghenion gofal iechyd sylfaenol fydd wrth wraidd yr adolygiad hwn, ac ni all fod yn fater o adeiladu ysbyty yn unig; mae'n rhaid iddo ymwneud â'r cyfanwaith, ac nid yw hynny, o reidrwydd, yn ymwneud ag iechyd bob amser. Gall gynnwys darpariaethau eraill yr awdurdodau lleol, megis gwelyau gofal ychwanegol, ac yn y blaen. Felly, ni fydd yn fater o gynnal yr un broses eto, oherwydd ni fyddai pwrpas gwneud hynny. Byddai'r un wybodaeth yn cael ei chyflwyno a byddai'r trafod yn parhau. Mae arnom eisiau mynd at graidd y mater, sef anghenion Prestatyn, anghenion eu cymdogion agos yn y Rhyl, a sut y gallwn ddwyn y cyfan ynghyd. Dyna'r dull gweithredu cyfannol.

Gwnaethoch godi pwynt capasiti BILl gyda mi, ac yr wyf yn bryderus ynglŷn â hynny, nid dim ond o ran y modd y maent yn cynnal prosesau ymgynghori, ond hefyd y modd yr ymdrinnir â chontractau ar adegau, a'u cyswllt ag eraill. Os yw'r BILl am barhau i fod yn rhan o'r broses, rhaid inni ganfod ffordd o gryfhau'r materion hyn. Mae hynny'n sicr mewn golwg gennyf ar gyfer y dyfodol. Mae hwnnw'n fater ar gyfer Cymru gyfan, nid dim ond yr ardal hon.

Nid ydym yn neilltuo Prestatyn; digwyddodd y mater ddod i'm sylw pan ymwelais ag Ann, a gofynnais i Michael edrych arno'n benodol. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod materion ledled Cymru sy'n debyg i'r rhai a geir yma, ac mae'n rhaid inni ddysgu'r gwersi.

Jonathan Morgan: As with so many of these hospital reviews, whether into Prestatyn, Blaenau Ffestiniog, Llandudno, or Prince Philip Hospital in Llanelli, it is the process of consultation that is criticised as much as the outcome, or the situation that sparked the review all those years ago with 'Designed to Deliver'. It is clear, having listened to what you have said this afternoon, that there will have to be revisions to the Welsh health circular 2004, which talked about how the NHS should consult with the public and organisations. Having looked at the current guidance to the NHS, what is it do you think might need to be altered over the next couple of months or years, to ensure that we get the consultation process spot on?

To return to the point that Ann Jones raised, does this not demonstrate once again that local health boards, given their size and capacity, do not have the expertise or relevant background to consult effectively with those people who need to be consulted? How will we ensure that we have that relevant expertise in future, and that we have the guidance that people need to follow to ensure that consultations are effective?

Edwina Hart: You have got to the crux of all the issues relating to the consultation process. The spirit of the guidance that was issued is fine, and that spirit was adopted quite well in some areas. However, I will have to be slightly more prescriptive.

One issue that Michael has raised in the report is the involvement of clinicians, and I must be far more specific about how I expect clinicians to be involved in the early discussions about what exists in terms of service provision. If you are looking holistically at primary care linked to community hospitals, your first port of call must be the clinicians, GPs and the other health professionals for them to say, 'In an ideal world, this is how it should be structured and this is how we can engage'. We are not saying that we will automatically accept their option, but that should be the

Jonathan Morgan: Fel yn achos cynifer o'r adolygiadau ysbytai hyn, boed yn trafod Prestatyn, Blaenau Ffestiniog, Llandudno, neu Ysbyty'r Tywysog Philip yn Llanelli, mae'r broses ymgynghori yn cael ei beirniadu i'r un graddau â'r canlyniad, neu'r sefyllfa a ysgogodd yr adolygiad flynyddoedd yn ôl gyda'r 'Cynllun Cyflenwi'. Mae'n amlwg, ar ôl gwranddo ar yr hyn yr ydych wedi'i ddweud y prynhawn yma, y bydd yn rhaid diwygio cylchlythyr iechyd Cymru 2004, a oedd yn trafod sut y dylai'r GIG ymgynghori â'r cyhoedd ac â sefydliadau. Ar ôl edrych ar y canllawiau a roddir i'r GIG ar hyn o bryd, beth a gredwch y bydd angen ei newid, o bosibl, dros yr ychydig fisoedd neu flynyddoedd nesaf, i sicrhau ein bod yn perffeithio'r broses ymgynghori?

I ddychwelyd at y pwynt a godwyd gan Ann Jones, onid yw hyn yn dangos eto nad oes gan y byrddau iechyd lleol, ac ystyried eu maint a'u capasiti, yr arbenigedd na'r cefndir perthnasol i ymgynghori'n effeithiol â'r bobl hynny y mae angen ymgynghori â hwy? Sut y byddwn yn sicrhau bod gennym yr arbenigedd perthnasol hwnnw yn y dyfodol, a bod gennym y canllawiau y mae angen i bobl eu dilyn i sicrhau bod ymgynghoriadau'n effeithiol?

Edwina Hart: Yr ydych wedi canfod craidd yr holl faterion sy'n ymwneud â'r broses ymgynghori. Mae ysbryd y canllawiau a gyhoeddwyd yn iawn, a chafodd yr ysbryd hwnnw ei ddilyn yn eithaf da mewn rhai ardaloedd. Fodd bynnag, bydd yn rhaid imi fod rywfaint yn fwy cyfarwyddol.

Un mater y mae Michael wedi'i grybwyll yn yr adroddiad yw'r ymwneud gan glinigwyr, a rhaid imi fod yn llawer mwy manwl ynghylch y modd y disgwyliaf i glinigwyr gymryd rhan yn y trafodaethau cynnar am y ddarpariaeth o wasanaethau sydd ar gael. Os ydych yn ystyried gofal sylfaenol mewn modd cyfannol mewn cysylltiad ag ysbytai cymunedol, rhaid ichi fynd yn gyntaf at y clinigwyr, y meddygon teulu a'r gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol eraill fel y gallant ddweud, 'Mewn byd perffaith, fel hyn y dylid ei drefnu a dyma sut y gallwn gymryd rhan'. Nid ydym yn dweud y byddwn yn derbyn y

starting point, and I think that that will clearly come across in the guidance.

In terms of the reviews, they are all coming to the inevitable conclusion that the outcomes have sometimes been correct but have just not been reached in the right way. What happens then is that the outcomes are challenged because people feel that they have not been a proper part of the process. Whatever systems I put in place, some people who have a pet health centre or hospital will always be unhappy, but if you can be assured that you have gone rigorously through an open and transparent process, and all the figures have been available, that allows you at least to have some peace of mind when you sign-off the piece of paper that makes the final decision.

I also share your concerns about local health boards. Sometimes, it relies upon having a good individual there—if you have that good individual, there is good engagement. However, we cannot allow the health service to be based just on good individuals—we must ensure that we have the proper systems in place, and I am looking at that closely.

Alun Davies: Like other Members, I warmly welcome your statement, particularly in terms of Blaenau Ffestiniog. I know that the Presiding Officer and others representing Blaenau Ffestiniog have felt the concerns, fears and anger of people in the town and the surrounding community about the uncertainty over the future of the memorial hospital. I particularly welcome your words about taking a holistic approach, linking in the community services with the larger hospital centres and the role of community hospitals. You described community hospitals as a resource for the whole community, and that is exactly the policy direction that many people want to see the Government pursue to ensure that the hospital facilities and services available are linked in to ensure that people have the best possible treatment in the best possible locations.

I also welcome your comments about consultation; others in the Chamber have already discussed the issue and place of

dewis a gynigiant yn awtomatig, ond yn y fan honno y dylid cychwyn, a chredaf y bydd hynny i'w weld yn glir yn y canllawiau.

Gyda golwg ar yr adolygiadau, maent i gyd yn dod i'r casgliad anochel bod y canlyniadau wedi bod yn gywir weithiau ond na ddaethpwyd iddynt yn y modd cywir. Yr hyn a ddigwydd wedyn yw y caiff y canlyniadau eu herio gan fod pobl yn teimlo nad ydynt wedi bod â rhan briodol yn y broses. Pa bynnag systemau a roddaf ar waith, bydd rhai pobl sydd â hoff ganolfan iechyd neu ysbyty bob amser yn anfodlon, ond os gallwch fod yn sicr eich bod wedi dilyn proses agored a thryloyw mewn modd trwyadl, ac os bu'r holl ffigurau ar gael, mae hynny o leiaf yn rhoi rhywfaint o dawelwch meddwl i chi pan lofnodwch y darn papur sy'n gwneud y penderfyniad terfynol.

Yr wyf yn pryderu yn yr un modd â chi am fyrddau iechyd lleol. Weithiau, mae'n dibynnu ar gael unigolyn da yno—os oes rhywun da, ceir ymgysylltu da. Fodd bynnag, ni allwn ganiatáu i'r gwasanaeth iechyd fod yn seiliedig ar unigolion da'n unig—rhaid inni sicrhau bod systemau priodol ar waith gennym, ac yr wyf yn ystyried hynny'n ofalus.

Alun Davies: Fel Aelodau eraill, croesawaf eich datganiad yn fawr, yn enwedig mewn cysylltiad â Blaenau Ffestiniog. Gwn fod y Llywydd ac eraill sy'n cynrychioli Blaenau Ffestiniog wedi teimlo pryderon, ofnau a dicter pobl yn y dref a'i chyffiniau am yr ansicrwydd ynghylch dyfodol yr ysbyty coffa. Croesawaf yn benodol yr hyn a ddywedasoich am weithredu'n gyfannol, gan gysylltu'r gwasanaethau cymunedol â'r canolfannau ysbyty mwy a rôl ysbytai cymunedol. Dywedasoich fod ysbytai cymunedol yn adnodd i'r gymuned gyfan, a dyna'r union gyfeiriad y mae llawer o bobl am weld y Llywodraeth yn mynd iddo o ran polisi i sicrhau bod y cyfleusterau a'r gwasanaethau sydd ar gael mewn ysbytai wedi'u cysylltu â hyn er mwyn sicrhau y caiff pobl y driniaeth orau posibl yn y lleoliadau gorau posibl.

Yr wyf hefyd yn croesawu'ch sylwadau am ymgynghori; mae eraill yn y Siambr eisoes wedi trafod mater ymgynghori a'r lle sydd

consultation. Many of us were horrified by the way in which the health service has consulted with people in the past. Some of the most vulnerable people in society have faced real and terrible fears about the future of their local services because the health service failed to consult adequately. So, I welcome your comments about taking control of that process and consulting on how this process will unfold in the future.

In conclusion, how do you envisage Blaenau Ffestiniog fitting in with Ysbyty Alltwen to ensure that there is a network of primary care and secondary care so that people throughout this part of north-west Wales have access to world-class facilities?

Edwina Hart: Thank you, Alun. I am always conscious when I make these statements that I am drawing attention to bad practice in health service consultation. We must acknowledge that some excellent consultations have been undertaken, by means of which local health boards and trusts have done their best to engage with the public and do some good work. So, I am conscious when I make such statements that I am always highlighting areas where there have been problems.

In terms of Blaenau Ffestiniog, Michael said that those involved acted very professionally in undertaking the consultation, so it is now a question of the future issues. I would not be so bold or brave as to indicate what the community might like in terms of connections between the services in that area, because what needs to go where and what would be best needs to be discussed in that area. That will be the subject of further consultations.

The key aspect in all of this is the community, and the way in which we acknowledge community resources and facilities and how they can be used. They might be used in slightly different ways, but it is an obligation of health bodies to look at community needs and requirements as the first port of call. When I publish Chris Jones's report, I hope that he will also have something to say about the organisation of

iddo. Arswydodd llawer ohonom at y modd y mae'r gwasanaeth iechyd wedi ymgynghori â phobl yn y gorffennol. Mae rhai o'r bobl sy'n fwyaf agored i niwed mewn cymdeithas wedi wynebu ofnau mawr a gwirioneddol ynghylch dyfodol eu gwasanaethau lleol am fod y gwasanaeth iechyd wedi methu ag ymgynghori'n ddigonol. Felly, croesawaf eich sylwadau am gael rheolaeth ar y broses honno ac ymgynghori ar y modd y bydd y broses hon yn datblygu yn y dyfodol.

I gloi, sut yr ydych yn rhagweld y bydd ysbyty Blaenau Ffestiniog yn cydgyssylltu ag Ysbyty Alltwen i sicrhau bod rhwydwaith o ofal sylfaenol a gofal eilaidd fel y bydd mynediad gan rai drwy'r rhan hon o'r gogledd-orllewin at gyfleusterau o'r radd flaenaf?

Edwina Hart: Diolch i chi, Alun. Yr wyf bob amser yn ymwybodol, wrth wneud datganiadau o'r math hwn, fy mod yn tynnu sylw at arferion gwael mewn ymgynghori gan y gwasanaeth iechyd. Rhaid inni gydnabod bod rhai ymgynghoriadau rhagorol wedi'u cynnal, a fu'n fodd i fyrddau iechyd lleol ac ymddiriedolaethau ymgysylltu â'r cyhoedd yn y modd gorau a gwneud gwaith da. Felly, yr wyf yn ymwybodol, wrth wneud datganiadau o'r fath, fy mod bob amser yn tynnu sylw at feysydd lle bu problemau.

Gyda golwg ar Flaenau Ffestiniog, dywedodd Michael fod y rhai a oedd yn gysylltiedig wedi gweithredu'n dra phroffesiynol wrth ymgymryd â'r ymgynghoriad, felly materion ar gyfer y dyfodol sydd dan sylw'n awr. Ni fyddwn mor ddewr ac eofn ag awgrymu pa gysylltiadau y carai'r gymuned eu gweld rhwng y gwasanaethau yn yr ardal honno, gan fod angen trafod lleoliad gwasanaethau a'r hyn a fyddai orau yn yr ardal honno. Bydd hynny'n destun i ymgynghoriadau pellach.

Yr agwedd allweddol ar hyn oll yw'r gymuned, a'r modd yr ydym yn cydnabod adnoddau a chyfleusterau cymunedol a'r modd y gellir eu defnyddio. Gellid eu defnyddio mewn dulliau sydd ychydig yn wahanol, ond mae cyrff iechyd yn gorfod ystyried anghenion a gofynion y gymuned yn gyntaf. Pan gyhoeddaf adroddiad Chris Jones, yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd ganddo rywbeth i'w ddweud hefyd am drefniadaeth

community services and how we need to pressure more into primary services, and what we need to do, and start to re-jig where we place our priorities in Wales.

I am also acutely aware of the rurality issues in Blaenau Ffestiniog, which come to the fore all of the time. Those rurality issues are keenly linked to issues of urban deprivation of the top end of the Valleys. Perhaps I should not use the word 'rurality' but rather the term 'communities on the edge', that is, on the edge in geographical terms, and on the edge of areas. We have to look at what services we provide for those communities.

1.50 p.m.

Jenny Randerson: Thank you very much for your statement, Minister, and I endorse virtually all of the comments in it. It does a great deal to set out a clear view of the mess that has been created so far. The report itself includes some very damning words. It refers to the poor consultation methods as detrimental because they cause the public to distrust the motives of the politicians and health bodies that are trying to reform and improve the health service, and confirm the public's suspicion that the NHS wants to cut costs and that the consultation is a sham. Most importantly, poor consultation methods delay necessary reforms and may prevent them from happening at all.

Derek Wanless produced his report in June 2003, almost five years ago, and, effectively, the whole thing has stalled on the basis of poor consultation. We can all endorse your comments and the reports that we have in front of us, but the sad truth is that much-needed health reforms have stalled not just in this area, but in many parts of Wales, because these reports set out lessons for every area. I think that it would be helpful, Minister, and I hope that you will agree, if you were to give us some kind of overview of where we are in Wales, noting where you see the process as having been adequate, so that it is satisfactory to carry on and roll out the reforms, and in which areas you feel that there are still

gwasanaethau cymunedol a'r angen inni roi mwy o bwys ar wasanaethau gofal sylfaenol, a'r hyn y mae angen inni ei wneud, ac am ddechrau ad-drefnu ein blaenoriaethau yng Nghymru.

Yr wyf hefyd yn dra ymwybodol o'r materion sy'n ymwneud â natur wledig Blaenau Ffestiniog, sy'n dod i'r amlwg drwy'r amser. Mae cysylltiad agos rhwng y materion hynny a materion sy'n ymwneud ag amddifadedd trefol ym mhen uchaf y Cymoedd. Efallai na ddylwn ddefnyddio'r term 'natur wledig' ond yn hytrach 'cymunedau ymylol', hynny yw, rhai sy'n ymylol o ran daearyddiaeth, ac sydd ar gyrion ardaloedd. Rhaid inni ystyried pa wasanaethau yr ydym yn eu darparu ar gyfer y cymunedau hynny.

Jenny Randerson: Diolch yn fawr i chi am eich datganiad, Weinidog, ac ategaf bron bob un o'r sylwadau sydd ynddo. Mae llawer ynddo sy'n egluro'r llanastr a grëwyd hyd yma. Mae'r adroddiad ei hun yn cynnwys rhai geiriau damniol iawn. Mae'n dweud bod y dulliau ymgynghori gwael yn niweidiol am eu bod yn peri i'r cyhoedd amau cymhellion y gwleidyddion a'r cyrff iechyd sy'n ceisio diwygio a gwella'r gwasanaeth iechyd, ac yn cadarnhau amheuan y cyhoedd bod y GIG yn dymuno torri costau a bod yr ymgynghori'n ffug. Yn bwysicaf oll, mae dulliau ymgynghori gwael yn arafu gwelliannau angenrheidiol a gallent eu hatal yn gyfan gwbl.

Cyflwynodd Derek Wanless ei adroddiad ym mis Mehefin 2003, bron bum mlynedd yn ôl, ac, i bob pwrpas, mae'r holl beth wedi sefyll yn ei unfan oherwydd ymgynghori gwael. Gallwn oll gymeradwyo'ch sylwadau a'r adroddiadau sydd gennym o'n blaen, ond y gwir trist yw bod diwygiadau mawr eu hangen ym maes iechyd wedi'u gohirio, nid yn unig yn yr ardal hon, ond mewn llawer rhan o Gymru, gan fod yr adroddiadau hyn yn dangos gwersi ar gyfer pob ardal. Credaf y byddai'n fuddiol, Weinidog, ac yr wyf yn gobeithio y byddwch yn cytuno, petaech yn rhoi rhyw fath o drosolwg i ni ar ein sefyllfa yng Nghymru, gan nodi lle bu'r broses yn ddigonol, yn eich barn chi, fel y bydd yn

fundamental questions. I note that, in Prestatyn, you are forced into a review of the review and a stay of decision making—I will not use the term ‘execution’—for a couple of years, at the very least. I would be grateful for some kind of overview of where you feel that we are and I would be grateful if you could give us that commitment today.

The second question that I have is on your statement, in which you refer to the importance of clinician leadership, trust involvement in the process and additional resources for CHCs. Community health councils in this context are very much the Davids versus the Goliaths of the ever-bigger trusts and the local health boards. CHCs are vital champions, expressing the voice of the people. In our health service, they are the only formal voice for ordinary people. I would be grateful if you could tell us that you are minded to provide additional resources for CHCs in the future.

I would also like to question you very specifically about the role of clinicians. Throughout the first round of consultations, when I was asked for my views, I said repeatedly that we needed clinicians to stand up and nail their colours to the mast—preferably with one voice, because clinicians are divided on many occasions by loyalties to their local services, and understandably so. Until we get the clinicians, the royal colleges and so on to stand up and say, ‘It is our clinical judgment that this service is not safe; you will get a very much better service there rather than here’, we are not going to convince the public because, sadly, the public does not trust politicians, it appears not to trust the health service trusts, and certainly does not trust the LHBs. I would like your thoughts, Minister, on how you can engage clinicians in that front-line commitment. That will be vital if we are to win hearts and minds and therefore the support of the public for the reforms, which must come at some point.

foddhaol ar gyfer symud ymlaen a rhoi'r diwygiadau ar waith, ac ym mha ardaloedd y teimlwch fod amheon sylfaenol. Yr wyf yn sylwi eich bod wedi'ch gorfodi i gynnal adolygiad o'r adolygiad ym Mhrestatyn, ac i ohirio penderfyniadau am ddwy flynedd o leiaf. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar o gael rhyw fath o drosolwg ar y sefyllfa yr ydym ynddi, fel yr ydych yn ei gweld, a byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech ymrwymo heddiw i'w roi.

Mae'r ail gwestiwn sydd gennyf yn ymwneud â'ch datganiad, lle'r ydych yn cyfeirio at bwysigrwydd arweinyddiaeth glinigol, yr ymwneud gan ymddiriedolaethau yn y broses ac adnoddau ychwanegol ar gyfer cynghorau iechyd cymuned. Yn y cyd-destun hwn, mae cynghorau iechyd cymuned yn debyg iawn i Dafydd wrth wynebu Goliath y byrddau iechyd lleol a'r ymddiriedolaethau sy'n mynd yn fwy o hyd. Mae cynghorau iechyd cymuned yn hyrwyddwyr hollbwysig sy'n cyfleu barn y bobl. Yn ein gwasanaeth iechyd, hwy yw'r unig lais ffurfiol ar ran pobl gyffredin. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech ddweud wrthym eich bod yn bwriadu darparu mwy o adnoddau ar gyfer cynghorau iechyd cymuned yn y dyfodol.

Byddwn hefyd yn hoffi'ch holi'n benodol iawn am rôl clinigwyr. Drwy gydol cylch cyntaf yr ymgynghoriadau, pan ofynnwyd i mi am fy marn, dywedais dro ar ôl tro fod arnom angen i glinigwyr sefyll ar eu traed a datgan eu barn—yn unfryd os oedd modd, gan fod clinigwyr wedi'u rhannu'n aml oherwydd eu teyrngarwch at eu gwasanaethau lleol, a hawdd y gellir deall hynny. Nes gwnawn i'r clinigwyr, y colegau brenhinol ac yn y blaen sefyll ar eu traed a dweud, ‘Yn ein barn ni fel clinigwyr, nid yw'r gwasanaeth hwn yn ddiogel; cewch wasanaeth gwell o lawer yn y fan honno nag a gewch yma’, ni fyddwn yn argyhoeddi'r cyhoedd oherwydd, gwaetha'r modd, nid yw'r cyhoedd yn ymddiried mewn gwleidyddion, mae'n ymddangos nad yw'n ymddiried yn ymddiriedolaethau'r gwasanaeth iechyd ac, yn sicr, nid yw'n ymddiried yn y BILlau. Hoffwn gael eich barn, Weinidog, am y modd y gallwch ymgysylltu â chlinigwyr o ran yr ymrwymiad rheng flaen hwnnw. Bydd hynny'n hollbwysig os ydym i ddarbwylllo'r cyhoedd a drwy hynny ennill ei gefnogaeth i'r

diwygiadau y mae'n rhaid iddynt ddigwydd rywbryd.

Edwina Hart: I will start with your last point, Jenny, because I think that it is absolutely essential that we engage clinicians and know where they are going in terms of services.

I accept your point that they will not always speak with one voice, but, when it comes to certain issues, they do. If, clinically, a service is better and safer provided elsewhere, they will say that. Since I have been Minister, I have tried to engage with the royal colleges and others, and I have been discussing these issues in a meaningful way. I am hoping to make progress in this area, so that, when I look at the issues around consultation, there will be a clearly defined role for clinicians. As far as I am concerned, they must stand up and be counted on these issues. You are right that there is enormous distrust of politicians on health issues when we are dealing with changes in service provision. I think that people will better accept changes and understand them if a clinician says that the service is better provided elsewhere, and points out that they are in a position to say that because they provide the service. That is in hand in the discussions, and I will return to the issue, as I indicated, when I talk about how I will deal with consultation processes in future.

You are right about community health councils. As part of greater consultation, I will look at the resource issues for community health councils, but I also need to look at the issue of localism and the engagement of communities in health discussions at a far earlier stage. Therefore, I am doing some work on that issue that will help to engage people in a better way. I must consider those issues in the round, and, when I have made decisions, I will come back to Members. Like you, some days, I wonder where we have gone with Wanless and what we have achieved. I will try to get some information together to provide an overview, although I cannot say that it will be across the

Edwina Hart: Dechreuaf â'r pwynt olaf a wnaethoch, Jenny, oherwydd credaf ei bod yn hollbwysig inni ymgysylltu â chlinigwyr a gwybod i ba gyfeiriad y maent yn mynd o ran gwasanaethau.

Derbyniaf y pwynt a wnaethoch i'r perwyl na fyddant bob amser yn unfrydol ond, yn achos rhai materion, byddant yn unfrydol. Os yw gwasanaeth yn cael ei ddarparu'n well ac yn fwy diogel o ran ei ansawdd clinigol mewn man arall, byddant yn dweud hynny. Ers imi ddod yn Weinidog, yr wyf wedi ceisio ymgysylltu â'r colegau brenhinol ac eraill, ac yr wyf wedi bod yn trafod y materion hyn yn ystyrllon. Yr wyf yn gobeithio gwneud cynnydd yn y maes hwn, fel y bydd rôl bendant i glinigwyr pan ystyriaf y materion sy'n ymwneud ag ymgynghori. Yn fy marn i, rhaid iddynt sefyll ar eu traed a datgan eu barn am y materion hyn. Yr ydych yn iawn wrth ddweud bod amheuaeth fawr o wleidyddion mewn cysylltiad â materion iechyd pan ydym yn delio â newidiadau yn y ddarpariaeth o wasanaethau. Credaf y bydd pobl yn fwy parod i dderbyn newidiadau a'u deall os yw clinigydd yn dweud bod y gwasanaeth yn cael ei ddarparu'n well mewn man arall, ac yn nodi ei fod mewn lle i ddweud hynny am mai ef sy'n darparu'r gwasanaeth. Mae hynny dan sylw yn y trafodaethau, a byddaf yn dod yn ôl at y mater hwn, fel y nodais, pan siaradaf am y modd y byddaf yn delio â phrosesau ymgynghori yn y dyfodol.

Yr ydych yn gywir wrth sôn am gynghorau iechyd cymuned. Fel rhan o'r ymgynghori mwy cyffredinol, byddaf yn ystyried yr anawsterau y mae cynghorau iechyd cymuned yn eu hwynebu o ran adnoddau, ond mae angen hefyd imi ystyried mater lleoliaeth a chynnwys cymunedau mewn trafodaethau ar iechyd yn gynharach o lawer. Felly, yr wyf yn gwneud rhywfaint o waith ar y mater hwnnw a fydd o gymorth i ymgysylltu â phobl yn well. Rhaid imi ystyried y materion hynny o bob safbwynt, ac, wedi imi wneud penderfyniadau, deuf yn ôl at Aelodau. Fel chithau, byddaf yn meddwl, weithiau, tybed i ble'r ydym wedi mynd mewn cysylltiad â Wanless a beth yr

piece.

We have had successes in some areas, where people have worked very well and changed services and engaged with this agenda. There are several positive examples, but because things have been done so well in those cases, we have not heard about them. The changes might have been contentious at the beginning, but we do not hear about the outcome because they have been dealt with so skilfully, sometimes through the involvement of politicians or due to the way in which the local health boards have handled them. I look particularly at Kirsty and her involvement in her constituency on some matters on which she has been prepared to take the lead in discussing issues. That is important. So, there are some positive examples, and I will try to produce some sort of paper for Members, but I cannot guarantee that it will be as substantial as Michael Williams's report.

Joyce Watson: This is a nice note on which to finish. Leadership has been somewhat lacking, and because we have not had leadership on where we are going and why we want to journey there, the resulting vacuum has become filled with doubt—doubt that we, as politicians, are sincere in wishing to reconfigure health services for the benefit of those who access these services. I am pleased to hear today's announcement; I am sure that it will come as a breath of fresh air to those people to hear the terms 'community hospitals' and 'resource facilities' together, because people do not believe that we see community hospitals as a resource. Quite rightly, as a consequence of that lack of faith, they demonstrated against what they believed they were hearing, which was that their services were not being valued.

On behalf of the people in Blaenau Ffestiniog in particular, I am pleased that a period of stability will now ensue and that all healthcare needs will be considered for re-provision. Again, somehow, that was the weak link in the chain when it came to the

ydym wedi'i gyflawni. Byddaf yn ceisio casglu rhywfaint o wybodaeth i gynnig trosolwg, er na allaf ddweud y bydd yn un cyffredinol.

Yr ydym wedi cael llwyddiannau mewn rhai ardaloedd, lle mae pobl wedi gweithio'n dda iawn ac wedi newid gwasanaethau ac wedi dilyn yr agenda hon. Mae nifer o enghreifftiau da ond, am fod pethau wedi'u gwneud cystal yn yr achosion hynny, nid ydym wedi clywed amdanynt. Efallai i'r newidiadau fod yn ddadleuol ar y dechrau, ond nid ydym yn clywed am y canlyniad am eu bod wedi'u trafod mor ddeheuig, weithiau drwy ymwneud gan wleidyddion neu oherwydd y modd y mae'r byrddau iechyd lleol wedi'u trafod. Cyfeirïaf yn benodol at Kirsty a'r rhan a gymerodd yn ei hetholaeth mewn cysylltiad â rhai materion y bu'n barod i arwain y drafodaeth arnynt. Mae hynny'n bwysig. Felly, mae rhai enghreifftiau da, a byddaf yn ceisio llunio rhyw fath o bapur ar gyfer Aelodau, ond ni allaf warantu y bydd mor sylweddol ag adroddiad Michael Williams.

Joyce Watson: Dyma nodyn dymunol i orffen arno. Bu'r arweinyddiaeth braidd yn ddiffygiol, ac am nad ydym wedi cael arweinyddiaeth o ran y cyfeiriad yr ydym yn mynd iddo a pham yr ydym yn dymuno mynd i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw, mae'r bwlch a gafwyd wedi'i lenwi gan amheuon—amheuon ynghylch a ydym ni, fel gwleidyddion, yn ddidwyll wrth dymuno ad-drefnu gwasanaethau iechyd er budd y rhai sy'n cael mynediad iddynt. Yr wyf yn falch o glywed y cyhoeddiad heddiw; yr wyf yn sicr y bydd fel chwa o awyr iach i'r bobl hynny glywed y termau 'ysbytai cymunedol' a 'chyfleusterau adnoddau' gyda'i gilydd, gan nad yw pobl yn credu ein bod yn ystyried ysbytai cymunedol yn adnodd. Yn gwbl briodol, o ganlyniad i'r diffyg ymddiriedaeth hwnnw, protestiasant yn erbyn yr hyn y credent eu bod yn ei glywed, sef nad oedd eu gwasanaethau'n cael eu trysori.

Ar ran pobl Blaenau Ffestiniog yn benodol, yr wyf yn falch y bydd cyfnod o sefydlogrwydd o hyn ymlaen ac yr ystyrir ailddarparu ar gyfer yr holl anghenion gofal iechyd. Unwaith eto, hynny rywsut oedd y man gwan yn y gadwyn o ran hygrededd yr

believability of what we were doing. To return to the issue of consultation, I welcome the Minister's comments this morning about Welsh Assembly Government guidance, and particularly about the interim guidance that might be needed if the WAG guidance is not immediately on hand when required. Therefore, thank you for your statement. I am sure that it will go down well in those communities that really understand—and are now clear that the Minister understands—that community hospitals are a resource facility.

2.00 p.m.

Edwina Hart: The key issue is that we must understand what communities want, and, if we cannot deliver that, explain in a simple way why that is the case, and show how the analysis has been made and what the needs and requirements are. However, the important thing is that we use our resources as well as we can, and as safely as we can, and that is the aim in the situations in Prestatyn and Blaenau Ffestiniog, as I have outlined today. The statutory sector sometimes has a lot to learn from the way that the voluntary sector consults. We need to take those lessons on board.

hyn yr oeddem yn ei wneud. Gan fynd yn ôl at fater ymgynghori, croesawaf sylwadau'r Gweinidog y bore yma am ganllawiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, ac yn enwedig am y canllawiau dros dro y gallai fod galw amdanynt os na fydd canllawiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gael yn syth pan fydd eu hangen. Felly, diolch i chi am eich datganiad. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd yn dderbyniol iawn gan y cymunedau hynny sy'n gwir ddeall—ac sydd bellach yn gweld bod y Gweinidog yn deall—fod ysbytai cymunedol yn gyfleuster adnoddau.

Edwina Hart: Y mater allweddol yw ei bod yn rhaid inni ddeall yr hyn y mae cymunedau ei eisiau, ac, oni allwn gyflawni hynny, esbonio mewn ffordd syml pam na allwn, a dangos sut y gwnaethpwyd y dadansoddiad a beth yw'r anghenion a'r gofynion. Fodd bynnag, y peth pwysig yw ein bod yn defnyddio ein hadnoddau gorau gallwn, ac mor ddiogel ag y gallwn, a dyna'r nod yn y sefyllfaedd ym Mhrestatyn a Blaenau Ffestiniog, fel yr amlinellais heddiw. Mae gan y sector statudol weithiau lawer i'w ddysgu o'r ffordd y mae'r sector gwirfoddol yn ymgynghori. Mae angen inni ddysgu'r gwersi hynny.

Atal Rheolau Sefydlog Suspension of Standing Orders

Y Cwnsler Cyffredinol ac Arweinydd y Tŷ (Carwyn Jones): Cynigial fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 35.6 a 35.8:

yn atal Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.18(i) a'r rhan honno o Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.10 sy'n ei gwneud yn ofynnol bod y cyhoeddiad wythnosol o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.3 yn darparu'r amserlen ar gyfer busnes yn y cyfarfod llawn yr wythnos ganlynol, er mwyn caniatáu i'r cynigion o dan eitem 5 a 6 gael eu hystyried yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ddydd Mercher 5 Mawrth 2008. (NNDM3893)

Y Llywydd: A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu'r cynnig? Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad. Yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog

The Counsel General and Leader of the House (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales in accordance with Standing Orders Nos. 35.6 and 35.8:

suspends Standing Order No. 7.18(i) and that part of Standing Order No. 6.10 that requires the weekly announcement under Standing Order No. 6.3 to constitute the timetable for business in Plenary for the following week, to allow the motions under items 5 and 6 to be considered in Plenary on Wednesday 5 March 2008. (NNDM3893)

The Presiding Officer: Does any Member object to the motion? I see there are no objections. In accordance with Standing

Rhif 7.35, felly, caiff y cynnig ei dderbyn.

Order No. 7.35, the motion is therefore agreed.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Sefydlu Pwyllgor Darlledu Establishment of a Broadcasting Committee

**Y Cwnsler Cyffredinol ac Arweinydd y Tŷ
(Carwyn Jones):** Cynigiau fod

**The Counsel General and Leader of the
House (Carwyn Jones):** I propose that

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â
Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 21, yn sefydlu Pwyllgor
Darlledu. Daw'r pwyllgor i ben ar 18
Gorffennaf 2008.*

*the National Assembly for Wales, in
accordance with Standing Order No. 21,
establishes a Broadcasting Committee. The
committee will cease to exist on 18 July 2008.*

Cylch gwaith y pwyllgor fydd:

The remit of the committee shall be:

*ymchwilio i ddyfodol darlledu gwasanaeth
cyhoeddus Cymraeg a Saesneg ei iaith yng
Nghymru a chyhoeddi adroddiad arno;*

*to investigate and report on the future of
public service broadcasting in Wales in the
English and Welsh languages;*

*ymchwilio i effeithiau'r newid i ddigidol a
chreu llwyfannau darlledu newydd ar
gynhyrchu a darparu rhaglenni a chynnwys
digidol o Gymru ac yng Nghymru, a
chyflwyno adroddiad ar yr effeithiau hyn.
(NNDM3894)*

*to investigate and report on the impact of
digital switchover and the creation of new
delivery platforms, on the production and
availability of programming and digital
content from Wales and in Wales.
(NNDM3894)*

Y Llywydd: A oes unrhyw Aelod yn
gwrthwynebu'r cynnig? Gwelaf nad oes
gwrthwynebiad. Yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog
Rhif 7.35, felly, caiff y cynnig ei dderbyn.

The Presiding Officer: Does any Member
object to the motion? I see there are no
objections. In accordance with Standing
Order No. 7.35, the motion is therefore
agreed.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Ethol i'r Pwyllgor Darlledu Election to the Broadcasting Committee

**Y Cwnsler Cyffredinol ac Arweinydd y Tŷ
(Carwyn Jones):** Cynigiau fod

**The Counsel General and Leader of the
House (Carwyn Jones):** I propose that

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â
Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 10.3, yn ethol Alun
Davies (Llafur), Alun Ffred Jones (Plaid
Cymru), Paul Davies (Ceidwadwyr) a Peter
Black (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol) yn
aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Darlledu.
(NNDM3895)*

*the National Assembly for Wales, in
accordance with Standing Order No. 10.3,
elects Alun Davies (Labour), Alun Ffred
Jones (Plaid Cymru), Paul Davies
(Conservative) and Peter Black (Liberal
Democrat) as members of the Broadcasting
Committee. (NNDM3895)*

Y Llywydd: A oes unrhyw Aelod yn

The Presiding Officer: Does any Member

gwrthwynebu'r cynnig? Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad. Yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.35, felly, caiff y cynnig ei dderbyn.

object to the motion? I see there are no objections. In accordance with Standing Order No. 7.35, the motion is therefore agreed.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Newid Aelodaeth y Pwyllgor Archwilio Change to the Membership of the Audit Committee

Y Cwnsler Cyffredinol ac Arweinydd y Tŷ (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiau fod

The Counsel General and Leader of the House (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 10.3, yn ethol Bethan Jenkins (Plaid Cymru) yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor Archwilio yn lle Helen Mary Jones (Plaid Cymru). (NDM3885)

the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order No. 10.3, elects Bethan Jenkins (Plaid Cymru) in place of Helen Mary Jones (Plaid Cymru) as a member of the Audit Committee. (NDM3885)

Y Llywydd: A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu'r cynnig? Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad. Yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.35, felly, caiff y cynnig ei dderbyn.

The Presiding Officer: Does any Member object to the motion? I see there are no objections. In accordance with Standing Order No. 7.35, the motion is therefore agreed.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Newid Aelodaeth y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal Change to the Membership of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity

Y Cwnsler Cyffredinol ac Arweinydd y Tŷ (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiau fod

The Counsel General and Leader of the House (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 10.3, yn ethol Chris Franks (Plaid Cymru) yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal yn lle Helen Mary Jones (Plaid Cymru). (NDM3886)

the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order No. 10.3, elects Chris Franks (Plaid Cymru) in place of Helen Mary Jones (Plaid Cymru) as a member of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity. (NDM3886)

Y Llywydd: A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu'r cynnig? Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad. Yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.35, felly, caiff y cynnig ei dderbyn.

The Presiding Officer: Does any Member object to the motion? I see there are no objections. In accordance with Standing Order No. 7.35, the motion is therefore agreed.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Cymeradwyo Diwygiadau i God Ymddygiad yr Aelodau a Gweithdrefn Gwyno'r Aelodau Approval of Revisions to the Members' Code of Conduct and Members'

Complaints Procedure

Jeff Cuthbert: I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. notes the National Assembly for Wales's Procedure for Dealing with Complaints against Assembly Members approved by the Committee on Standards of Conduct on 29 January 2008 and laid in the Table Office on 18 February 2008;

2. approves the National Assembly for Wales's Code of Conduct for Assembly Members agreed by the Committee on Standards of Conduct on 29 January 2008 and laid in the table Office on 18 February 2008. (NDM3887)

You will be aware that the Committee on Standards of Conduct exists to encourage and foster excellent standards of conduct from every Member of this institution. However, the committee is ever mindful of the need to ensure that we provide relevant and up-to-date guidance to Members, and to that end the committee continually reviews, and where necessary revises, both the Code of Conduct for Assembly Members and the complaints procedure.

The changes that this motion seeks to approve are not the result of a large-scale inquiry, but of the ongoing consideration of the guidance that we offer Members. Both the Code of Conduct for Assembly Members and the complaints procedure seek to underline the value that we have always placed on this Assembly's high standards. As the way we work changes and new issues arise, the guidance has been, and will continue to be, reviewed, considered and revised according to the needs of the Assembly and its Members.

The Government of Wales Act 2006 changed the way that we work in this third Assembly. Assembly Measures and legislative competence Orders are now familiar terms to us in Wales, and work is well underway to lay down the first piece of Welsh law of modern times. However, the Government of

Jeff Cuthbert: Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. yn nodi gweithdrefn Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ar gyfer ymdrin â chwynion yn erbyn Aelodau'r Cynulliad cymeradwywyd gan y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad ar 29 Ionawr 2008, ac fe'i osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Chwefror 2008;

2. yn cymeradwyo Cod Ymddygiad Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ar gyfer Aelodau'r Cynulliad cytunwyd gan y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad ar 29 Ionawr 2008, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Chwefror 2008. (NDM3887)

Gwyddoch fod y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad yn bodoli i annog a meithrin safonau ymddygiad ardderchog gan bob Aelod yn y sefydliad hwn. Fodd bynnag, mae'r pwyllgor bob amser yn ymwybodol fod angen sicrhau ein bod yn rhoi arweiniad perthnasol a chyfoes i Aelodau, a dyna pam y mae'r pwyllgor yn adolygu'n barhaus, a lle bydd angen yn diwygio Cod Ymddygiad Aelodau'r Cynulliad a'r weithdrefn gwyno, y naill a'r llall.

Nid ffrwyth ymchwiliad helaeth mo'r newidiadau y mae'r cynnig hwn yn ceisio'u cymeradwyo, ond ffrwyth ystyriaeth barhaus o'r arweiniad a gynigiwn i Aelodau. Mae Cod Ymddygiad Aelodau'r Cynulliad a'r weithdrefn gwyno, y naill a'r llall, yn ceisio tanlinellu'r gwerth yr ydym bob amser wedi ei osod ar safonau uchel y Cynulliad hwn. Wrth i'n ffordd o weithio newid ac wrth i faterion newydd godi, mae'r arweiniad wedi ei adolygu, ei ystyried a'i ddiwygio yn unol ag anghenion y Cynulliad a'r Aelodau, a pharheir i wneud hynny.

Yr oedd Deddf Llywodraethu Cymru 2006 yn newid ein ffordd o weithio yn y trydydd Cynulliad hwn. Mae Mesurau Cynulliad a Gorchmynion cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol yn eiriau cyfarwydd inni yng Nghymru bellach, ac mae gwaith mawr wedi ei wneud o ran gosod yr eitem gyntaf o gyfraith

Wales Act did not just make these high-profile changes to the way that we work. It also required the formal separation of the Welsh Assembly Government from the Assembly Parliamentary Service, and the setting up of the Assembly Commission. Changes have also been made to the way planning casework is handled, and this and other changes have necessitated consequential amendments to the Code of Conduct for Assembly Members.

In this Chamber, with members of the public sitting in the galleries overhead, we are reminded that all that we do as Assembly Members, we do in the public arena. Discussions that take place outside of the Chamber, be they with the media or in the publications that we produce ourselves, are just as public as the discussions that take place during formal Assembly proceedings. With this in mind, and in the light of experience, the Committee on Standards of Conduct agreed to include in the revised code of conduct a duty that Members should not misrepresent any recommendation made by the committee following a complaint hearing. This new duty is not an onerous one, and the committee would in no way wish to interfere with individual Assembly Members' media strategies. However, if we are to avoid undermining the position of the Committee on Standards of Conduct, and eroding the culture of high standards we have built up here, then we must accept that misrepresentation of a decision by the committee is unacceptable.

The committee has also undertaken a review of the procedure for dealing with complaints against Assembly Members. Apart from an administrative change that allows complaints to be made directly to the Commissioner for Standards rather than to the committee secretariat, the only change is to the list of recommendations available to the Committee on Standards of Conduct after considering a complaint. After the last hearing, complaints were made regarding the committee's finding that a breach had been found, but that it was 'trivial or inconsequential'. The committee stands by the recommendations that it made, but it also feels that the recommendation

Gymreig yn y cyfnod modern. Fodd bynnag, nid y newidiadau uchel eu proffil hyn yn y ffordd o weithio yn unig yr oedd Deddf Llywodraethu Cymru yn eu gwneud. Yr oedd hefyd yn gofyn am wahanu Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ffurfiol oddi wrth Wasanaethau Seneddol y Cynulliad, a sefydlu Comisiwn y Cynulliad. Newidiwyd hefyd y ffordd y delir â gwaith achos cynllunio, ac mae hyn a newidiadau eraill wedi golygu ei bod yn rhaid gwneud gwelliannau canlyniadol yng Nghod Ymddygiad Aelodau'r Cynulliad.

Yn y Siambr hon, gydag aelodau o'r cyhoedd yn eistedd yn yr orielau uwchben, cawn ein hatgoffa bod y cyfan a wnawn fel Aelodau Cynulliad yn cael ei wneud ar y llwyfan cyhoeddus. Mae trafodaethau a gynhelir y tu allan i'r Siambr, boed gyda'r cyfryngau ynteu yn y cyhoeddiadau a gynhyrchwn ein hunain, lawn mor gyhoeddus â'r trafodaethau a gynhelir yn ystod busnes ffurfiol y Cynulliad. A chofio hyn, ac yn wyneb profiad, cytunodd y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad gynnwys dyletswydd yn y cod ymddygiad diwygiedig na ddylai Aelodau gam-ddehongli unrhyw argymhelliad a wneir gan y pwyllgor yn dilyn gwrandawriad cwyno. Nid yw'r ddyletswydd newydd hon yn un feichus, ac ni fynnai'r pwyllgor ymyrryd mewn unrhyw ffordd â strategaethau Aelodau unigol o'r Cynulliad ar gyfer delio â'r cyhoedd. Fodd bynnag, os ydym i osgoi tanseilio safbwynt y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad, ac erydu'r diwylliant o safonau uchel yr ydym wedi ei greu yma, rhaid inni dderbyn bod cam-ddehongli penderfyniad gan y pwyllgor yn annerbyniol.

Mae'r pwyllgor hefyd wedi gwneud adolygiad o'r weithdrefn ar gyfer delio â chwynion yn erbyn Aelodau Cynulliad. Ar wahân i newid gweinyddol sy'n caniatáu cyflwyno cwynion yn uniongyrchol i'r Comisiynydd Safonau yn hytrach nag i ysgrifenyddiaeth y pwyllgor, yr unig newid yw'r rhestr o argymhellion sydd ar gael i'r Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad ar ôl ystyried cwyn. Ar ôl y gwrandawriad diwethaf, gwnaethpwyd cwynion ynglŷn â chanfyddiad y pwyllgor fod toramod wedi digwydd, ond ei fod yn 'bitw neu'n ddibwys'. Mae'r pwyllgor yn cadw at yr argymhellion a wnaeth, ond mae hefyd yn teimlo y dylid

should be reworded to better express the sentiment and principle behind it. Members will note that the recommendation listed under section 7.10(ii) of the report now recognises a failure of ‘a minor nature’. I hope that Members will agree with me that the ongoing review function undertaken by the Committee on Standards of Conduct offers support to Assembly Members and their commitment to maintaining high standards.

Y Llywydd: Gwelaf nad oes neb am gyfrannu. Mae hynny'n arwydd o'r unfrydedd y tu ôl i sylwadau'r Cadeirydd, yr wyf yn sicr. Felly, datganaf fod y cynnig wedi'i dderbyn, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.35.

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion carried.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd (Rosemary Butler) i'r Gadair am 2.06 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer (Rosemary Butler) took the Chair at 2.06 p.m.*

Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives Debate

Yr Argyfwng Tai sydd ar Dwf yng Nghymru The Growing Housing Crisis in Wales

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1 and 2 in the name of Carwyn Jones and amendments 3 and 4 in the name of Kirsty Williams

Mark Isherwood: I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to take urgent and practical action to address the growing housing crisis in Wales, drawing fully on the expertise available within the independent and voluntary/charitable sectors. (NDM3889)

Housing is key to social justice and regeneration, but Wales has a housing crisis. Every housing body in Wales has been saying so for years, but this does not compute with the cut-and-paste Muppets on the Labour benches. However, it should compute with their Plaid Cymru props. Alun Fred Jones referred to the housing crisis on his

aralleirio'r argymhelliad er mwyn iddo fod yn well mynegiant o'r teimlad a'r egwyddor y tu ôl iddo. Bydd Aelodau'n sylwi bod yr argymhelliad a restrir dan adran 7.10(ii) yn yr adroddiad yn cydnabod yn awr fethiant 'bach ei natur'. Gobeithio y cytuna Aelodau â mi fod y swyddogaeth adolygu parhaus a gyflawnir gan y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad yn cynnig cefnogaeth i Aelodau Cynulliad a'u hymrwymiad i gynnal safonau uchel.

The Presiding Officer: I see there are no speakers. That is a sign of unanimity with the Chair's remarks, I am sure. I therefore declare that the motion is carried in accordance with Standing Order No. 7.35.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 2 yn enw Carwyn Jones a gwelliannau 3 a 4 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

Mark Isherwood: Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gymryd camau brys ac ymarferol i roi sylw i'r argyfwng tai sydd ar dwf yng Nghymru, gan fanteisio'n llawn ar yr arbenigedd sydd ar gael yn y sectorau annibynnol a gwirfoddol/elusennol. (NDM3889)

Mae tai yn allweddol i gyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac adfywio, ond mae hi'n argyfwng tai ar Gymru. Mae pob mudiad tai yng Nghymru yn dweud hynny ers blynnyddoedd, ond nid yw hynny'n cyfrif dim i'r *Muppets* torri-a-gludo ar y meinciau Llafur. Fodd bynnag, dylai gyfrif i'w hategion o Blaid Cymru. Cyfeiriodd Alun

blog last April. Gareth Jones referred to this crisis in the Chamber last June. Elin Jones referred to the housing crisis in the *Western Mail*. Only five weeks ago, Plaid Cymru councillor Penri James met the Plaid Cymru Deputy Minister for Housing to discuss his concerns about the rural housing crisis. Research commissioned by Community Housing Cymru in 2007 found that 57 per cent of people considered social housing a priority issue, up from 15 per cent in 2002—a massive increase. It is therefore an insult for the Labour-Plaid Assembly Government to table an amendment denying the housing crisis. The Assembly Government must take urgent and practical action to address the growing housing crisis in Wales, drawing fully on the expertise available within the independent and voluntary/charitable sectors.

The number of households needing accommodation in Wales is forecast to increase by 12 per cent over the next 10 years. Since devolution, the number of people in Wales receiving Government help to buy their first house has fallen by two thirds. Wales has the worst housing conditions in the UK, and children living in poor housing are at a far higher risk of ill health and educational underachievement. The number of households in Wales accepted as being homeless has more than doubled. Recent claimed falls in homelessness are contradicted by the rising hidden homelessness reported to the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee during its review of youth homelessness in the second Assembly.

The Joseph Rowntree Foundation highlighted rural homelessness as being twice the urban rate. Housing providers highlight the need for an all-Wales network of rural housing enablers. Housing Forum Cymru states that housing is creating a more divided Wales, and that the consequences for social cohesion are enormous. The Chartered Institute of Housing states that an adequate supply of affordable housing is key to creating sustainable communities. The Confederation of British Industry and Business in the

Ffred Jones yn ei flog fis Ebrill diwethaf at yr argyfwng tai . Cyfeiriodd Gareth Jones yn y Senedd fis Mehefin y llynedd at yr argyfwng hwn. Cyfeiriodd Elin Jones yn y *Western Mail* at yr argyfwng tai. Gwta bum wythnos yn ôl, cyfarfu cynghorydd Plaid Cymru, Penri James, â Dirprwy Weinidog Plaid Cymru dros Dai i drafod ei bryderon ynglŷn â'r argyfwng tai yng nghefn gwlad. Dangosodd ymchwil a gomisiynwyd gan Dai Cymunedol Cymru yn 2007 bod 57 y cant o bobl yn credu bod tai cymdeithasol yn fater o flaenoriaeth, o'i gymharu â 15 y cant yn 2002—cynnydd anhygoel. Sarhad felly yw i Lywodraeth Lafur-Plaid y Cynulliad gyflwyno gwelliant yn gwadu bod yna argyfwng tai. Rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad gymryd camau brys ac uniongyrchol i fynd i'r afael â'r argyfwng tai cynyddol yng Nghymru, gan fanteisio'n llawn ar yr arbenigedd sydd ar gael yn y sectorau annibynnol a gwirfoddol/elusennol.

Rhagwelir y bydd nifer yr aelwydydd yng Nghymru y mae angen llety arnynt yn cynyddu 12 y cant dros y 10 mlynedd nesaf. Ers datganoli, mae nifer y bobl yng Nghymru sy'n cael cymorth gan y Llywodraeth i brynu eu cartref cyntaf wedi gostwng ddwy ran o dair. Cymru sydd â'r amodau tai gwaethaf yn y DU, ac mae plant sy'n byw mewn tai gwael mewn perygl mwy o lawer o fod ag iechyd gwaeth a thangyflawni'n addysgol. Mae nifer yr aelwydydd yng Nghymru y derbynir eu bod yn ddigartref wedi mwy na dyblu. Mae'r gostyngiadau honedig yn ddiweddar mewn digartrefedd yn cael eu gwrth-ddweud gan y digartrefedd cudd cynyddol y clywodd y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio amdano yn yr ail Gynulliad yn ystod ei adolygiad o ddigartrefedd ymhlith pobl ifanc.

Tynnodd Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree sylw at y ffaieth fod cyfradd digartrefedd yng nghefn gwlad ddwywaith y gyfradd drefol. Mae darparwyr tai yn tynnu sylw at yr angen am rwydwaith Cymru gyfan o hwyluswyr tai gwledig. Mae Fforwm Tai Cymru yn dweud bod tai yn creu Cymru fwy rhanedig, a bod y canlyniadau i gydlyniad cymdeithasol yn aruthrol. Mae'r Sefydliad Tai Siartredig yn dweud bod cyflenwad digonol o dai fforddiadwy yn allweddol i greu cymunedau cynaliadwy. Mae Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant

Community both state that new housing is a key factor in attracting investment into Wales and in retaining the workforce.

At the heart of the problem has been a cut in the supply of new housing for rent or low-cost ownership, as house prices, homelessness and waiting lists have increased. Housing organisations state that fewer homes are being built in Wales than at any time since the second world war, and that Wales is short by about 40,000 of affordable homes for rent or purchase. Shelter Cymru believes that the number is closer to double this figure, and housing experts have identified the need for regional planning, reduced regulation, community land trusts and simplified section 106 agreements. House builders tell me that they seek consistency and clarity on what the Assembly Government wants done, and we must note that Office of Fair Trading research last year showed that it had only a two-year land bank, despite claims to the contrary.

2.10 p.m.

Housing waiting lists across Wales now exceed 80,000. Only a minority now manage to climb onto the property ladder. Poor housing links directly to ill health, educational under-achievement and poor life chances thereafter. Mortgage possession orders across Wales rose by 14.5 per cent last year, compared to 4.7 per cent in England. However, the Assembly Government social housing budget is still less than that inherited from the Conservative Government in 1997. Despite rising mortgage repossessions and longer waiting lists, that represents a 71 per cent cut after allowing for house price inflation.

Since devolution, only one new social home has been provided in Wales for every four provided over the last eight years of Conservative Government. Labour broke the housing ladder and created the housing crisis and it is now trying to deflect responsibility with its Plaid Cymru props by blaming the most successful low-cost home-ownership scheme ever, namely the right to buy for council tenants.

Prydain a Busnes yn y Gymuned y naill a'r llall yn dweud bod tai newydd yn ffactor allweddol wrth ddenu buddsoddiad i Gymru a chynnal y gweithlu.

Hanfod y broblem fu cwtdogi'r cyflenwad tai newydd i'w rhentu neu berchnogaeth gost-isel, wrth i brisiau tai, digartrefedd a rhestri aros gynyddu. Dywed mudiadau tai bod llai o gartrefi'n cael eu hadeiladu yng Nghymru nag ar unrhyw adeg ers yr ail ryfel byd, a bod Cymru'n brin o ryw 40,000 o gartrefi fforddiadwy i'w rhentu neu eu prynu. Cred Shelter Cymru bod dwywaith y ffigur hwn yn nes ati, ac mae arbenigwyr tai wedi nodi bod angen cynllunio rhanbarthol, llai o reoleiddio, ymddiriedolaethau tir cymunedol a chytundebau adran 106 symlach. Mae adeiladwyr tai yn dweud wrthyf eu bod yn ceisio cael cysondeb ac eglurder ynghylch yr hyn y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad eisiau gweld yn cael ei wneud, a rhaid inni gofio bod ymchwil y Swyddfa Masnachu Teg y llynedd yn dangos mai banc tir dwy-flynedd yn unig oedd ganddi, er yr honiadau croes.

Mae rhestri aros am dai yng Nghymru erbyn hyn dros 80,000. Lleiafrif erbyn hyn sy'n llwyddo i fynd ar yr ysgol eiddo. Mae tai gwael yn cysylltu'n uniongyrchol ag iechyd gwael, tangyflawni addysgol a chyfleoedd gwael mewn bywyd wedi hynny. Cynyddodd gorchmynion ildio meddiant morgeisi ledled Cymru 14.5 y cant y llynedd, o'u cymharu â 4.7 y cant yn Lloegr. Fodd bynnag, mae cyllideb tai cymdeithasol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn dal yn llai nag a etifeddwyd gan y Llywodraeth Geidwadol yn 1997. Er gwaethaf adfeddiannu morgeisi cynyddol a rhestri aros hwy, mae hynny'n ostyngiad o 71 y cant ar ôl caniatáu ar gyfer chwyddiant ym mhrisiau tai.

Ers datganoli, un cartref cymdeithasol newydd yn unig a ddarparwyd yng Nghymru am bob pedwar a ddarparwyd dros wyth mlynedd olaf y Llywodraeth Geidwadol. Mae Llafur wedi dinistrio'r ysgol eiddo a chreu'r argyfwng tai, ac yn awr mae'n ceisio gwadu cyfrifoldeb gyda'i hategion o Blaid Cymru drwy feio'r cynllun perchnogaeth tai cost-isel mwyaf llwyddiannus erioed, sef hawl i brynu i denantiaid cyngor.

In seeking powers to suspend this scheme, they are exposing just how shoddy, small-minded and vindictive they really are. As Labour MP Paul Flynn states,

‘This will not supply additional houses, but it will send a disastrous signal that the deep injustice of housing in the past 70 years is not understood.’

He adds that:

‘There is likely to be a major rift between politicians in Parliament and in the Assembly, if any proposal to drop the right to buy is pushed.’

Leanne Wood: The One Wales Government is committed to building 6,500 affordable homes over the course of this Assembly. Clearly, that will be subsidised with public money. Allowing suspension of the right to buy through this LCO that we are applying for will protect those houses in the long term, yet you are prepared to see those sold off.

Mark Isherwood: That is utter rubbish, as you have heard in evidence and that I am about to re-explain to you.

As the Labour Secretary of State for Wales, Paul Murphy, states:

‘For the past two decades, the fact that houses have been sold by local authorities has meant that people in Wales, by becoming homeowners, have improved their lot’.

Housing waiting lists exceed 6,000 in both those MPs’ constituencies, should others seek to emulate the First Minister, who tried to suggest the last time that I raised these points that, in fact, Paul Flynn and Paul Murphy did not have high waiting lists in their constituencies.

It is now two decades since legislation transferred prime responsibility for new social housing to housing associations because of the added investment that they can bring. They did not stop building; they transferred it and increased it. Over the next

Wrth geisio pwerau i atal y cynllun hwn, maent yn dangos yn union mor ddi-raen, cul eu meddwl a dialgar y maent. Fel y dywed yr AS Llafur Paul Flynn,

ni fydd hyn yn darparu tai ychwanegol, ond bydd yn cyfleu neges drychinebus nad yw anghyfiawnder eithafol tai yn y 70 mlynedd diwethaf wedi ei ddeall.

Mae’n ychwanegu:

mae hi’n debygol y bydd rhwyg rhwng gwleidyddion yn y Senedd ac yn y Cynulliad os bydd unrhyw gynnig i ollwng yr hawl i brynu yn cael ei wthio.

Leanne Wood: Mae Llywodraeth Cymru’n Un wedi ymrwymo i adeiladu 6,500 o gartrefi fforddiadwy yn ystod y Cynulliad hwn. Yn amlwg, noddir hynny gan arian cyhoeddus. Bydd caniatáu gohirio’r hawl i brynu drwy’r Gorchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol yr ydym yn gofyn amdano yn diogelu’r tai hynny yn y tymor hir, ac eto yr ydych yn fodlon gweld y rhain yn cael eu gwerthu.

Mark Isherwood: Lol llwyr yw hynny, fel y clywsoch mewn tystiolaeth ac fel yr wyf ar fin ei ailesbonio wrthyh.

Fel y dywed Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru Llafur, Paul Murphy:

ers y ddau ddegawd diwethaf, mae’r ffaith fod tai wedi eu gwerthu gan awdurdodau lleol wedi golygu bod pobl yng Nghymru, drwy ddod yn berchnogion tai, wedi gwella’u bywydau.

Mae rhestrï aros am dai yn etholaethau’r ddau AS hwnnw dros 6,000, rhag ofn i rywun ystyried efelychu’r Prif Weinidog, a geisiodd awgrymu’r tro diwethaf pan godais y pwyntiau hyn nad oedd gan Paul Flynn na Paul Murphy, yn wir, restrï aros hir yn eu hetholaethau hwy.

Aeth dau ddegawd heibio bellach ers deddfwriaeth i drosglwyddo’r prif gyfrifoldeb dros dai cymdeithasol newydd i gymdeithasau tai oherwydd y buddsoddiad ychwanegol y gallant ei wneud. Ni roesant y gorau i adeiladu; trosglwyddwyd hynny a’i

eight years, over 22,000 new social dwellings were built in Wales under the Conservative Government. However, despite rising council house sales, that was cut to just 5,000 in the first eight years of Labour-led devolution. Evidence to the committee, which Leanne chaired, confirmed that suspending the right to buy will not increase the supply of social housing in the short term, although it is intended to be a short-term measure.

In fact, people remain in occupation of those houses for 15 years, by which time properly funded housing associations could have replaced them many times over. We know that proposals for that were put to us. The Plaid-Labour promise to deliver just 6,500 low-cost dwellings over four years relies heavily on planning gain without Assembly Government grant, primarily involving mixed tenure land deals between local authorities, housing associations, house builders and other landowners.

However, councils are identifying significant gaps between the number of low-cost dwellings in their local development plans and the level of need in their housing assessments. They state that they cannot provide land for low-cost housing at sub-market prices because they have to rely on land sales for investment in key services as funding is cut by this Assembly Government. Attempts to increase the percentage of low-cost homes through revised supplementary planning guidance have been complicated by Lord Scarman's ruling that this must not be used as a device to avoid legitimate public scrutiny.

Last year, only 180 affordable dwellings were delivered under section 106 in 11 local authorities, with none in the others. The Assembly Government has not published a response to the report on the homebuy scheme in Wales, published last April. Housing associations are concerned about that and the absence of funding for low-cost home ownership in the Assembly Government budget.

gynyddu. Dros yr wyth mlynedd wedyn, adeiladwyd dros 22,000 o anheddau cymdeithasol newydd yng Nghymru dan Lywodraeth Geidwadol. Fodd bynnag, er y cynnydd mewn gwerthu tai cyngor, torrwyd hynny i gwta 5,000 yn ystod wyth mlynedd cyntaf datganoli dan arweiniad Llafur. Yr oedd tystiolaeth a gyflwynwyd i'r pwyllgor, dan gadeiryddiaeth Leanne, yn cadarnhau na fydd atal yr hawl i brynu yn cynyddu'r cyflenwad tai cymdeithasol yn y tymor byr, er mai fel mesur tymor byr y mae wedi ei fwriadu.

Yn wir, mae pobl yn dal i breswyllo yn y tai hynny am 15 mlynedd, ac yn y cyfamser gallai cymdeithasau tai gyda chyllid priodol fod wedi disodli'r rheiny lawer gwaith. Gwyddom fod cynigion felly wedi eu cyflwyno i ni. Mae addewid Plaid-Llafur i ddarparu dim ond 6,500 o anheddau cost-isel dros bedair blynedd yn dibynnu'n helaeth ar enillion cynllunio heb grant Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, gan gynnwys yn bennaf gytundebau cymysg dalaidaeth tir rhwng awdurdodau lleol, cymdeithasau tai, adeiladwyr tai a thirfeddianwyr eraill.

Fodd bynnag, mae cynghorau'n nodi bylchau sylweddol rhwng nifer yr anheddau cost-isel yn eu cynlluniau datblygu lleol a lefel yr angen yn eu hasesiadau tai. Dywedant na allant ddarparu tir ar gyfer tai cost-isel am brisiau is na'r farchnad oherwydd eu bod yn gorfod dibynnu ar werthu tir i'w fuddsoddi mewn gwasanaethau allweddol, gan fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi tocio ei nawdd. Mae ymdrechion i gynyddu canran y cartrefi cost-isel drwy arweiniad cynllunio ategol diwygiedig wedi eu cymhlethu gan ddyfarniad yr Arglwydd Scarman na ellir defnyddio hyn fel dyfais i osgoi craffu cyhoeddus dilys.

Y llynedd, dim ond 180 o anheddau fforddiadwy a ddarparwyd dan adran 106 mewn 11 awdurdod lleol, a dim yn y lleill. Nid yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cyhoeddi ymateb i'r adroddiad ar y cynllun cymorth prynu yng Nghymru a gyhoeddwyd fis Ebrill diwethaf. Mae cymdeithasau tai'n poeni am hynny ac am ddiffyg cyllid ar gyfer perchentyaeth cost-isel yng nghyllideb Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Plaid Cymru's first-time buyer grants policy was derided by the housing sector because it would further stimulate demand without increasing supply. The review of regulation has been warmly received, and I congratulate the Deputy Minister on that, but the housing sector needs a progress report and I, therefore, pass on its request for a statement from the Minister.

Housing associations have developed shared ownership schemes imaginatively, using their own resources, but they now need Assembly Government support for this. This year alone, housing associations are delivering £300 million of regeneration work, housing development and maintenance. They also develop real tenant participation. Their £3 billion worth of assets in Wales are being underutilised by the regulatory environment in which they operate. A culture of Assembly Government micromanagement in the social housing grant programme is causing delays, potential underspends and reworking.

Associations are prevented from developing homes for sale, which prevents cross-subsidy and the development of mixed tenure schemes, which associations in England are able to do. The current association inspection programme that the Wales Audit Office runs as an agent for the Assembly Government is slow, process-dominated and expensive. Modest changes to the current operating environment would encourage a more permissive and independent culture, create a genuine risk-based regulatory environment, and enable housing associations to become more widely involved in regeneration activities. Therefore, we all look optimistically to the review's producing major steps in these directions.

Despite the Labour/Plaid support for supporting people in 'One Wales', there will be little or no inflationary uplift for 2008-09. That is as a result of mismanagement by the Assembly Government: it thought that it had increased the budget by £4 million but it had its baseline figures wrong by about £4

Gwawdiwyd y polisi grantiau prynwyr tro cyntaf gan Blaid Cymru gan y sector tai oherwydd byddai'n ysgogi galw pellach heb gynyddu'r cyflenwad. Cafodd yr adolygiad rheoleiddio groeso brwd, ac yr wyf yn llongyfarch y Dirprwy Weinidog am hynny. Ond mae angen adroddiad cynnydd ar y sector tai, ac yr wyf fi, o'r herwydd, yn trosglwyddo'i gais am ddatganiad gan y Gweinidog.

Mae cymdeithasau tai wedi datblygu cynlluniau perchentyaeth ar y cyd mewn ffordd wreiddiol, drwy ddefnyddio'u hadnoddau eu hunain, ond yn awr mae arnynt angen cefnogaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer hyn. Eleni yn unig, mae cymdeithasau tai yn darparu £300 miliwn o waith adnewyddu, datblygiadau tai a gwaith cynnal a chadw. Maent hefyd yn datblygu cyfranogiad gwirioneddol gan denantiaid. Mae eu gwerth £3 biliwn o asedau yng Nghymru yn cael eu tanddefnyddio gan yr amgylchedd rheoleiddio y maent yn gweithredu ynddo. Mae diwylliant o ficoreolaeth gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn y rhaglen grantiau tai cymdeithasol yn achosi oedi, tanwario posibl ac ail-wneud.

Mae cymdeithasau'n cael eu hatal rhag datblygu cartrefi i'w gwerthu, sy'n atal traws-gymhorthdal a datblygu cynlluniau daliadaeth gymysg, rhywbeth y mae cymdeithasau yn Lloegr yn gallu ei wneud. Mae'r rhaglen arolygu cymdeithasau, sy'n cael ei rhedeg gan Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru ar hyn o bryd fel asiant i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn araf, yn cael ei llethu gan brosesau, ac yn ddrud. Byddai newidiadau cymedrol yn yr amgylchedd gweithredu presennol yn annog diwylliant mwy caniatol ac annibynnol, yn creu amgylchedd rheoleiddio sydd o ddifrif wedi'i seilio ar risg, ac yn galluogi cymdeithasau tai i ymwneud yn fwy eang â gweithgareddau adfywio. Felly, yr ydym i gyd yn obeithiol y bydd yr adolygiad yn cynhyrchu camau mawr i'r cyfeiriadau hyn.

Er gwaethaf cefnogaeth Llafur/Plaid i gefnogi pobl yn 'Cymru'n Un', ychydig iawn neu ddim ychwanegiad a fydd ar gyfer chwyddiant yn 2008-09. Mae hynny'n ganlyniad i gamreoli gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad; credai ei bod wedi cynyddu'r gyllideb £4 miliwn, ond yr oedd ei ffigurau

million. That will have a devastating impact on supported housing for the most vulnerable groups.

Shelter Cymru states that the Assembly Government should invest in the supply of social rented housing, increase the resources available to develop a range of low-cost home ownership schemes and provide homeless assistance to people outside the priority need groups when supply is closer to need.

Having requested help from north Wales police officers, I received a letter from the north Wales central division commander stating that the lack of a key worker housing scheme meant that she was losing officers to forces outside Wales. I am advised that, without Assembly Government funding, by 2010, there will be a drastic shortage of police, nurses, firefighters and ambulance crew. The Assembly Government budget falsely inflated the provision for housing through a £40 million reduction in housing revenue account subsidy, but we now know that council tenants are being asked to pay the price through inflation-busting rent increases, with guidelines set by this Assembly Government. Do not look surprised, Minister; I have read the papers.

Better strategic engagement with the Welsh housing sector would have allowed the Assembly Government to address the many problems contributing to the Welsh housing crisis. Given regulatory freedom, housing associations could spend an extra £110 million on affordable housing and community regeneration over the next four years. We need radical change and more investment in the social housing grant programme to enable local authorities to focus on strategy and housing associations to focus on delivery without the current micromanagement and counterproductive bureaucracy.

The Deputy Minister for Housing (Jocelyn Davies): I propose the following amendments in the name of Carwyn Jones. Amendment 1: delete 'the growing housing crisis' and replace with 'housing needs'.

llinell sylfaen £4 miliwn allan ohoni. Caiff hynny effaith drychinebus ar dai cymorth i'r grwpiau sydd fwyaf agored i niwed.

Dywed Shelter Cymru y dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad fuddsoddi yn y cyflenwad tai cymdeithasol ar rent, cynyddu'r adnoddau sydd ar gael i ddatblygu ystod o gynlluniau perchentyaeth cost isel, a darparu cymorth digartrefedd i bobl y tu allan i'r grwpiau anghenion y rhoddir blaenoriaeth iddynt, pan fydd y cyflenwad yn cyfateb yn well i'r angen.

Ar ôl gofyn am help gan swyddogion heddlu yn y gogledd, cefais lythyr gan gomander rhanbarth canol gogledd Cymru yn dweud bod y diffyg cynllun tai i weithwyr allweddol yn golygu ei bod yn colli swyddogion i heddluoedd y tu allan i Gymru. Dywedir wrthyf y bydd prinder dirfawr o heddlu, nyrsys, diffoddwyr tân a chriwiau ambiwlans erbyn 2010, heb gyllid gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Yr oedd cyllideb Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn chwyddo'r ddarpariaeth ar gyfer tai yn anghywir drwy ostyngiad o £40 miliwn yng nghymorthdal y cyfrif refeniw tai, ond gwyddom bellach fod tenantiaid cyngor yn gorfod talu'r pris drwy godiadau rhent uwch na chwyddiant, a chanllawiau wedi eu pennu gan y Llywodraeth hon yn y Cynulliad. Peidiwch ag edrych yn syn, Weinidog; yr wyf wedi darllen y papurau.

Byddai gwell ymwneud strategol â sector tai Cymru wedi caniatáu i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad roi sylw i nifer o'r problemau sy'n cyfrannu at argyfwng tai Cymru. O gael rhyddid i reoleiddio, gallai cymdeithasau tai wario £110 miliwn ychwanegol ar dai fforddiadwy ac adfywio cymunedol dros y pedair blynedd nesaf. Mae arnom angen newid radical a mwy o fuddsoddi yn y rhaglen grantiau tai cymdeithasol i alluogi awdurdodau lleol i ganolbwyntio ar strategaeth a chymdeithasau tai i ganolbwyntio ar ddarparu heb y microreoli a'r fiwrocratiaeth wrthgynhyrchiol sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd.

Y Diprwy Weinidog dros Dai (Jocelyn Davies): Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Carwyn Jones. Gwelliant 1: dileu 'argyfwng tai sydd ar dwf' a rhoi yn ei le 'anghenion tai'.

Amendment 2: Insert at the end of the motion:

and endorses the Welsh Assembly Government's actions to date and the programme set out under 'One Wales'.

Peter Black: I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 3: add a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to:

review the regulation of registered social landlords so as to maximise the investment they are able to make in communities.

Amendment 4: add as new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to:

a) work more closely with local authorities to ensure that they make the maximum use of existing powers to secure a greater number of affordable homes for local people;

b) ensure that each local council has a robust housing needs survey and strategy so as to underpin effective action in the provision of affordable housing and in tackling homelessness;

c) review the provision of facilities and support for homeless people in each local authority and to provide additional resources where needed to bolster this.

I will begin by commenting on the Government's amendments 1 and 2 before moving on to the substance of our amendments. Amendment 1 seeks to delete the words 'growing housing crisis' from the motion. Although one gets the impression from listening to Mark Isherwood that there is not just a crisis but an impending nuclear war in the UK in terms of housing, there is certainly a case for saying that there is a crisis. I am not the only one to say that there is a crisis in housing in Wales; Plaid Cymru said so not so long ago, in June 2007, when it tabled a motion speaking of an ongoing

Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

ac yn cymeradwyo'r camau a gymerwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru hyd yma a'r rhaglen a amlinellwyd o dan 'Cymru'n Un'.

Peter Black: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 3: chwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i:

adolygu rheoleiddio landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig er mwyn cynyddu'r buddsoddiad y gallant ei wneud mewn cymunedau.

Gwelliant 4: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i:

a) gweithio'n agosach gydag awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau eu bod yn defnyddio pwerau cyfredol i'r eithaf i sicrhau nifer fwy o gartrefi fforddiadwy ar gyfer pobl leol;

b) sicrhau bod gan bob cyngor lleol arolwg a strategaeth anghenion tai cadarn er mwyn bod yn sylfaen i weithredu effeithiol ar gyfer darparu tai fforddiadwy a mynd i'r afael â digartrefedd;

c) adolygu'r ddarpariaeth o gyfleusterau a chefnogaeth ar gyfer pobl ddigartref ym mhob awdurdod lleol a darparu adnoddau ychwanegol lle bydd angen i ategu hyn.

Dechreuaf drwy gynnig sylwadau ar welliannau 1 a 2 o eiddo'r Llywodraeth cyn symud ymlaen at sylwedd ein gwelliannau ni. Mae gwelliant 1 yn ceisio dileu'r geiriau 'argyfwng tai sydd ar dwf' o'r cynnig. Er bod rhywun yn cael yr argraff o wrando ar Mark Isherwood fod yna nid yn unig argyfwng ond ryfel niwclear yn yr arfaeth yn y DU o safbwynt tai, mae yna yn sicr achos dros ddweud bod argyfwng. Nid fi yw'r unig un i ddweud bod argyfwng tai yng Nghymru; dywedodd Plaid Cymru hynny ychydig yn ôl, ym mis Mehefin 2007, pan gyflwynodd gynnig yn sôn am argyfwng tai a oedd yn

housing crisis.

If we are now seeking to take out the words 'growing housing crisis', what has changed between June 2007 and the present day to allay that crisis? The answer that I come to every time that I look at this is that we have a review; little else has changed. I am not criticising the fact that there is a review, because I believe that that is needed, but I would not suggest that the Welsh Assembly Government's actions over the last six months or so have in any way allayed the sense of crisis that many people in the housing field feel in Wales, nor the sense of crisis that was expressed in that Plaid Cymru motion back in 2007. Therefore, I am rather mystified by the Government's amendment 1, which wishes to delete 'the growing housing crisis' from the motion.

2.20 p.m.

Mark Isherwood listed many statistics, and I will not dispute any of them; I will mention some of the bald figures that we have in front of us about what exactly the situation is, and where we are at present. Average house prices have gone up 60 per cent in seven years, repossessions are up 10 per cent on the previous year, 18 per cent of private sector homes are unfit, 80,000 people are on council and housing association waiting lists, and 6,800 households have been accepted as homeless. Those are the bald figures that form part of this crisis.

I will not pretend that I can conjure up money out of thin air, as was implied by Mark's speech, because I do not believe that you can, but there are solutions that can be followed, and ideas that can be put in place, and policies that can be implemented, if we are prepared to work in partnership with all the relevant bodies—local councils in particular, as well as housing associations and many other bodies. We should be doing that now, rather than waiting for the review to take effect, and we should be doing that with more urgency.

To underline that, the number of affordable homes that have been provided under section

parhau.

Os ydym yn awr yn ceisio tynnu'r geiriau 'argyfwng tai sydd ar dwf' allan, beth sydd wedi newid rhwng mis Mehefin 2007 a heddiw i leddfu'r argyfwng hwnnw? Yr ateb y dof fi iddo bob tro wrth edrych ar hyn yw bod gennym adolygiad; nid oes fawr ddim arall wedi newid. Nid wyf yn beirniadu'r ffaith fod yna adolygiad, oherwydd credaf mai dyna sy'n ofynnol, ond ni fyddwn yn awgrymu bod gweithredoedd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru dros y chwe mis diwethaf yn fras wedi lleddfu'r ymdeimlad o argyfwng ymysg llawer o bobl yn y maes tai yng Nghymru, na'r ymdeimlad o argyfwng a fynegwyd yn y cynnig hwnnw gan Blaid Cymru yn 2007. Felly, mae gwelliant 1 gan y Llywodraeth, sy'n dymuno dileu 'argyfwng tai sydd ar dwf' o'r cynnig, yn ddirgelwch imi braidd.

Rhestrodd Mark Isherwood nifer o ystadegau, ac ni fyddaf yn amau yr un ohonynt; byddaf yn crybwyll rhai o'r ffigurau moel sydd gennym o'n blaenau ynglŷn â beth yn union yw'r sefyllfa, a ble'r ydym ar hyn o bryd. Mae prisiau cyfartalog tai wedi codi 60 y cant mewn saith mlynedd; mae nifer yr achosion o adfeddiannu 10 y cant yn uwch na'r flwyddyn flaenorol, mae 18 y cant o gartrefi'r sector preifat yn anaddas, mae 80,000 o bobl ar restrau aros cynghorau a chymdeithasau tai, ac mae 6,800 o aelwydydd wedi eu derbyn fel rhai digartref. Dyna'r ffigurau moel sy'n rhan o'r argyfwng hwn.

Nid wyf am esgus y gallaf gonsurio'r arian o ddim byd, fel yr awgrymwyd gan araith Mark, oherwydd ni chredaf fod hynny'n bosibl, ond mae yna atebion y gellir eu dilyn, a syniadau y gellir eu rhoi ar waith, a pholisïau y gellir eu gweithredu, os ydym yn barod i weithio mewn partneriaeth gyda'r holl gyrff perthnasol—cynghorau lleol yn arbennig, yn ogystal â chymdeithasau tai a nifer o gyrff eraill. Dylem fod yn gwneud hynny'n awr, yn hytrach na disgwyl i'r adolygiad ddod i rym, a dylem fod yn gwneud hynny gyda mwy o frys.

I danlinellu hynny, 1,089 yw nifer y tai fforddiadwy sydd wedi eu darparu dan adran

106 in the last five years is 1,089; I have got these figures from local authorities, having written to ask them for this. Some local authorities have had no affordable homes built in those five years. The one that stands out is Carmarthenshire, which is a rural authority facing many of the issues relating to affordable housing. According to its reply to my letter, it said that it has not had a single home built in the last five years under section 106.

There is something amiss, when there are 80,000 people on waiting lists—not all of them without a home, but some of them are in desperate need of rehousing—and only 1,089 affordable homes were built under section 106. If you then consider the figures on social housing to rent, you will see that 4,370 homes have been demolished since 2000, and that we have built 4,673—a net gain of 303. Furthermore, 28,000 homes have been taken out of the social housing stock through the right-to-buy scheme. Although those homes have not been lost to the housing stock, they are no longer available as affordable homes to rent; that is the key issue, when more and more people are going to local authorities asking for somewhere to be rehoused.

Therefore, there is a sense of crisis but there is also a sense that there is not a proper focus in Wales of local authorities and others delivering to try to deal with that. Much more can be done, as has been demonstrated by authorities such as South Shropshire District Council, which has a particularly good scheme in place. I believe that I have run out of time, so I will conclude with this comment. I ask the Minister to look urgently at how we can focus efforts much more in order to tackle this crisis.

Angela Burns: I thank Mark Isherwood and Peter Black for their comments. I reiterate what has been said—there is a housing crisis, and it is growing. People need to be able to rent quality homes at decent, affordable prices. People also need to be able to provide their own solutions, if possible, by being able to build decent, affordable houses. All these homes—public or private—need to be built in a sustainable and environmentally friendly

106 yn y pum mlynedd diwethaf; cefais y ffigurau hyn gan awdurdodau lleol, ar ôl ysgrifennu atynt i ofyn am hyn. Nid oes cartrefi fforddiadwy o gwbl wedi eu codi yn ardaloedd rhai awdurdodau lleol yn y pum mlynedd hynny. Yr un sy'n sefyll allan yw sir Gaerfyrddin, awdurdod gwledig yn wynebu nifer o'r problemau sy'n ymwneud â thai fforddiadwy. Yn ôl ei ateb i'm llythyr, dywed nad oes yr un cartref wedi ei godi dan adran 106 yn y pum mlynedd diwethaf.

Mae rhywbeth o'i le lle mae 80,000 o bobl ar restrau aros—nid yw pob un ohonynt heb gartref, ond mae angen dirfawr i rai ohonynt gael eu hailgartrefu—a dim ond 1,089 o gartrefi fforddiadwy a godwyd dan adran 106. Os ystyriwch wedyn y ffigurau ar dai cymdeithasol ar rent, gwelwch fod 4,370 o gartrefi wedi eu dymchwel er 2000 a'n bod wedi codi 4,673—cynnydd net o 303. Ar ben hynny, mae 28,000 o gartrefi wedi eu tynnu o'r stoc tai cymdeithasol drwy'r cynllun hawl i brynu. Er nad yw'r cartrefi hyn wedi eu colli o'r stoc tai, nid ydynt ar gael mwyach fel cartrefi fforddiadwy ar rent; dyna'r mater allweddol, ar adeg pan fydd mwy a mwy o bobl yn mynd at awdurdodau lleol i ofyn am rywle i gael eu hailgartrefu.

Felly, mae yna ymdeimlad o argyfwng, ond mae yna ymdeimlad hefyd nad oes ffocws priodol yng Nghymru ac awdurdodau lleol ac eraill yn darparu i geisio delio â hynny. Mae modd gwneud llawer mwy, fel y dangoswyd gan awdurdodau fel Cyngor Dosbarth De Swydd Amwythig, sydd wedi sefydlu cynllun neilltuol o dda. Credaf fod fy amser wedi dod i ben, felly, diweddaf gyda'r sylw hwn. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog edrych ar frys i weld sut y gallwn ganolbwyntio ymdrechion lawer yn fwy er mwyn mynd i'r afael â'r argyfwng hwn.

Angela Burns: Diolch i Mark Isherwood a Peter Black am eu sylwadau. Ailadroddaf yr hyn sydd wedi ei ddweud—mae yna argyfwng tai, ac y mae ar gynnydd. Mae angen i bobl allu rhentu tai safonol am brisiau teg, fforddiadwy. Mae angen hefyd i bobl allu darparu eu hatebion eu hunain, os yw'n bosibl, drwy allu codi tai teilwng, fforddiadwy. Mae angen i'r tai hyn i gyd—cyhoeddus neu breifat—gael eu codi mewn

way, and they need to be built for the future, and not simply replicate the past, as we are so often doing in our countryside.

Many Members will talk about numbers, statistics and figures; Peter Black and Mark Isherwood have done just that. However, I would like to mention a few examples, because, behind every statistic, there is a story. My constituency is extremely rural; it consists of many small villages and hamlets, where people have homes with large gardens. The people who live in those homes want to build a house in their gardens. Why? Is it to make huge amounts of money? No; almost every constituent who comes to me wants to build a house for their son their daughter, their grandchildren or their ageing parents.

This particularly applies to the farming industry, but it is also happening more and more in smaller towns and larger villages. We should be able to let people do that and say, 'You build that house, but we will put a socking big covenant on it, so that when it is sold on, it remains in the affordable housing stock'. However, we do not do that: we just say, 'No, you cannot build that house'. It has happened repeatedly; I could give you many examples.

I could also give you the example of a farmer who fell 10 ft and broke his neck; he cannot move a muscle below his neck. He is being cared for in a home at the moment, and his soul is dying. He wants to be with his family, who have had to sell their farm, but have managed to keep the land on which they keep cattle and sheep, by which the wife can earn some money. She wants to build a specialised bungalow for him, because he is so incapacitated—

Alun Ffred Jones: This story—I have heard many similar stories—makes me wonder why the Tories did not introduce this as a planning issue when you were in power.

Angela Burns: I knew that someone would come up with that, but I thought that it would be Jeff. I do not care; I am not interested. I am here today for my constituents, but you

ffordd gynaliadwy sy'n parchu'r amgylchedd, ac mae angen iddynt gael eu codi ar gyfer y dyfodol, yn hytrach na dim ond copio'r gorffennol, fel y gwnawn yn rhy aml yng nghefn gwlad.

Bydd nifer o Aelodau yn siarad am niferoedd, ystadegau a ffigurau; mae Peter Black a Mark Isherwood wedi gwneud yn union hynny. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn i sôn am rai enghreifftiau, oherwydd y tu ôl i bob ystadegyn mae stori. Mae fy etholaeth i yn hynod o wledig; mae'n cynnwys nifer o bentrefi bach a phentrefannau, lle mae gan bobl gartrefi gyda gerddi mawr. Mae'r bobl sy'n byw yn y cartrefi hynny am godi tŷ yn eu gardd. Pam? Ai i wneud llawer iawn o arian? Nage; mae pob etholwr bron sy'n dod ataf am godi tŷ i'w mab, eu merch, eu hwyron neu rieni sy'n heneiddio.

Mae hyn yn arbennig o berthnasol i'r diwydiant ffermio, ond mae'n digwydd yn gynyddol hefyd mewn trefi llai a phentrefi mwy. Dylem allu gadael i bobl wneud hynny a dweud, 'Codwch chi'r tŷ, ond byddwn yn gosod amod cryf iawn arno, er mwyn iddo barhau yn y stoc tai fforddiadwy pan gaiff ei werthu'. Ond nid ydym yn gwneud hynny: yr hyn a ddywedwn yw, 'Na, ni chewch godi'r tŷ hwnnw'. Mae wedi digwydd dro ar ôl tro; gallwn roi lawer o enghreifftiau ichi.

Gallwn roi enghraifft arall ichi o ffermwr o syrthiodd 10 troedfedd a thorri ei wddf; ni all symud yr un cyhyr islaw'r gwddf. Mae'n cael gofal mewn cartref ar hyn o bryd, ac mae ei enaid yn marw. Mae am fod gyda'i deulu, sydd wedi gorfod gwerthu eu fferm. Ond maent wedi llwyddo i gadw'r tir lle maent yn cadw gwartheg a defaid, fel y gall y wraig ennill ychydig arian. Mae hi am godi byngalo arbenigol iddo, am ei fod mor analluog—

Alun Ffred Jones: Mae'r stori hon—chlywais lawer stori debyg—yn gwneud imi bendroni pam tybed na wnaeth y Torïaid gyflwyno hyn fel mater cynllunio pan oeddech chi mewn grym.

Angela Burns: Gwyddwn y byddai rhywun yn codi hynny, ond credais mai Jeff fyddai hwnnw. Nid oes ots gennyf; nid oes gennyf ddiddordeb. Yr wyf yma heddiw ar ran fy

cannot be bothered to move from your bigoted, stereotypical attitude, where you say, 'Because you did that 10 years ago, we are not going to let the world move on'. I am fighting for Mrs Thomas, the people in Sageston, and my farmers in Carew. They are the people who do not have homes, and an awful lot of what they have been given by the council is in a shocking condition. They are the people that I am asking the Deputy Minister to talk about. They are the reason why we need to change our planning laws and let people build good quality homes.

This poor farmer, whom you treat quite lightly, cannot move and wants to be with his family. There is a field on which they could build a house in which he could live with his family and still see the fields where he used to farm. However, he cannot build there, Deputy Minister, because it is just outside of the joint unitary development plan—by just outside, I mean as close as two adjoining houses.

Let us forget the farmers and look at the children. There is a situation in Skrinkle Haven where three affordable houses will be built on a children's playing field. That is absolutely fantastic, because those affordable houses are necessary; however, they will take away a children's playing field. From here to your office, Deputy Minister, is the distance between that playing field and another small parcel of land that could have affordable houses built on it. The housing authority is perfectly happy to buy that land and build affordable homes on it, but it is not allowed to do so by the national park. Once again, the planners are stopping the development. This is a good quality development put forward by a housing association, but the national park is saying, 'No, you cannot build there, but you can build here'. I swear that we could all walk the distance between the two locations in 30 seconds. I cannot see the logic of it. We now have a controversial and bitter struggle going on between Pembrokeshire County Council, the housing association, the national park and all the people on this estate. It is crazy and has caused untold misery.

We cannot possibly afford to build enough

etholwyr, ond ni allwch chi fynd i'r drafferth o symud oddi wrth eich agwedd gul, ystrydebol, gan ddweud, 'Gan i chi wneud hynny 10 mlynedd yn ôl, nid ydym ni'n mynd i adael i'r byd symud ymlaen'. Yr wyf yn ymladd dros Mrs Thomas, pobl Sageston, a'm ffermwyr yng Nghaeriw. Hwyr yw'r bobl sydd heb gartrefi, ac mae llawer iawn o'r hyn a roddwyd iddynt gan y cyngor mewn cyflwr brawychus. Hwyr yw'r bobl yr wyf yn gofyn i'r Dirprwy Weinidog sôn amdanynt. Hwyr yw'r rheswm pam y mae angen inni newid ein deddfau cynllunio a gadael i bobl godi cartrefi o safon dda.

Nid yw'r ffermwr truan hwn yr ydych chi'n ei drin yn bur ysgafn yn gallu symud, ac mae am fod gyda'i deulu. Mae yna gae y gallent godi tŷ arno lle gallai fyw gyda'i deulu a dal i weld y caeau lle'r arferai ffermio. Fodd bynnag, ni chaiff adeiladu yno, Ddirprwy Weinidog, am ei fod fymryn y tu allan i'r cynllun datblygu unedol ar y cyd—wrth ddweud mymryn y tu allan, yr wyf yn golygu mor agos â dau dŷ cyffiniol.

Gadewch inni anghofio'r ffermwyr ac edrych ar y plant. Mae sefyllfa yn Skrinkle Haven lle bydd tri thŷ fforddiadwy yn cael eu codi ar faes chwarae plant. Mae hynny'n gwbl wych, oherwydd mae'r tai fforddiadwy hynny yn angenrheidiol; fodd bynnag, byddant yn cymryd cae chwarae i blant. Oddi yma i'ch swyddfa chi, Ddirprwy Weinidog, yw'r pellter rhwng y cae chwarae hwnnw a llain fach arall o dir y gellid codi tai fforddiadwy arni. Mae'r awdurdod tai yn gwbl hapus i brynu'r tir hwnnw a chodi tai fforddiadwy arno, ond nid yw'r parc cenedlaethol yn caniatáu iddo wneud hynny. Unwaith eto, mae'r cynllunwyr yn rhwystro'r datblygiad. Mae hwn yn ddatblygiad safonol a gyflwynwyd gan gymdeithas tai, ond mae'r parc cenedlaethol yn dweud, 'Na, chewch chi ddim adeiladu yma, ond cewch adeiladu acw'. Tyngaf y gallai pob un ohonom gerdded y pellter rhwng y ddau leoliad mewn 30 eiliad. Ni allaf weld y rhesymeg. Yn awr mae gennym frwydr ddadleuol a chwerw yn mynd ymlaen rhwng Cyngor Sir Penfro, y gymdeithas tai, y parc cenedlaethol a'r holl bobl ar yr ystâd hon. Mae'n wallgof, ac mae wedi achosi diflastod di-ben-draw.

Ni allwn fforddio codi digon o dai i'r holl

houses for all the people in Wales who need homes; in Pembrokeshire alone, 4,500 people are on the council waiting list. However, we can build some homes and enable other people to find and develop their own solutions; we must lighten up on our planning policies, and give these people a chance to do just that. I ask you to give serious consideration to this issue.

Leanne Wood: All parties in the Assembly are in agreement that we have a big problem with housing in Wales, which is why the question of affordable housing is such a high priority for the One Wales Government. The links between poor housing, low educational attainment and poverty are well recorded, and that is why Plaid Cymru has long held the view that housing is a question of social justice and not something that can be left to the whims of the market.

2.30 p.m.

We still support the ideals that existed prior to the setting up of the welfare state. We still believe in the value of council housing, one of the pillars of the welfare state. In the 1940s, it was recognised that affordable homes for rent for workers was an essential safety net. That principle was abandoned in 1980 when the Thatcher Government introduced the right to buy. By 2003, 1.5 million council homes had been sold off, and nowhere near that number has been rebuilt. In fact, the Conservative Government made it almost impossible to use the receipts from the sale of those council houses to build new ones. Housing as a central plank of the welfare state has been further undermined by the current UK Government's insistence on pushing ahead with housing stock transfer—

Andrew R.T. Davies: Can I take it that you are clearly and categorically against any right to buy scheme, and that you would have been against anyone being allowed to benefit from exercising that right had you been in Government in the 1980s?

Leanne Wood: Had I been in Government in the 1980s, I would have opposed the right to buy legislation. I accept that some individuals

bobl yng Nghymru sydd ag angen cartrefi arnynt: yn sir Benfro yn unig mae 4,500 o bobl ar restr aros y cyngor. Fodd bynnag, gallwn godi rhai tai a galluogi eraill i ddod o hyd i'w hatebion eu hunain a'u datblygu; rhaid inni fod yn fwy hyblyg yn ein polisiau cynllunio, a rhoi cyfle i'r bobl hyn wneud yn union hynny. Gofynnaf ichi roi ystyriaeth ddifrifol i'r mater hwn.

Leanne Wood: Mae pob plaid yn y Cynulliad yn cytuno bod gennym broblem fawr gyda thai yng Nghymru, a dyna pam y mae tai fforddiadwy yn flaenoriaeth mor uchel i Lywodraeth Cymru'n Un. Mae'r cysylltiadau rhwng tai gwael, cyrhaeddiad addysgol isel a thlodi wedi eu cofnodi'n helaeth, a dyna pam y mae Plaid Cymru wedi credu ers amser maith fod tai yn fater o gyfiawnder cymdeithasol, nid yn rhywbeth i'w adael i fympwy'r farchnad.

Yr ydym yn dal i gefnogi'r delfrydau a oedd yn bodoli cyn sefydlu'r wladwriaeth les. Yr ydym yn dal i gredu yng ngwerth tai cyngor, un o bileri'r wladwriaeth les. Yn yr 1940au, cydnabuwyd bod cartrefi fforddiadwy i'w rhentu ar gyfer gweithwyr yn rhwyd diogelwch hanfodol. Lluchiwyd yr egwyddor honno o'r neilltu yn 1980 pan gyflwynodd Llywodraeth Thatcher yr hawl i brynu. Erbyn 2003, yr oedd 1.5 miliwn o dai cyngor wedi'u gwerthu, ac nid oes dim byd tebyg i'r nifer hwnnw wedi'u hailgodi. A dweud y gwir, gwnaeth y Llywodraeth Geidwadol hi bron yn amhosibl defnyddio'r arian a gafwyd drwy werthu'r tai cyngor hynny i godi rhai newydd. Mae'r maes tai, un o gonglfeini'r wladwriaeth les, wedi'i danseilio ymhellach gan y ffaith fod Llywodraeth bresennol y DU yn mynnu bwrw ymlaen i drosglwyddo'r stoc tai—

Andrew R.T. Davies: A gaf fi gymryd eich bod yn amlwg ac yn bendant yn erbyn unrhyw gynllun hawl i brynu, ac y byddech wedi gwrthwynebu rhoi'r hawl i neb elwa drwy fynnu'r hawl honno petaech wedi bod yn y Llywodraeth yn yr 1980au?

Leanne Wood: Petawn i yn y Llywodraeth yn yr 1980au, byddwn wedi gwrthwynebu'r ddeddfwriaeth hawl i brynu. Derbyniaf fod

have benefited from it, but the greater good has been diminished as a result. We have lost so many council houses from our housing stock.

The rules on housing stock transfer have been deliberately skewed to promote stock transfer, and local authorities who want to keep their housing stock have been at a massive disadvantage, despite some attempts to support such local authorities here in Wales. All of these policies have been driven by the private-good, public-bad ideology. It is an ideology that we, in Plaid Cymru, and the One Wales Government firmly reject.

Both parties in Government—and the Liberal Democrats, to be fair to them—accept that there is a need to suspend the right to buy in some areas. That move is particularly important if we are to protect the increase in social housing that will be delivered by the One Wales Government over the next three years. I am astounded to see that the Conservative Party is doggedly sticking to this policy, despite the fact that it has resulted in the decimation of social housing stock over the past 18 years and in increased levels of homelessness. If it really wants to see practical and urgent action on housing, it would support the proposed LCO on affordable housing and the subsequent Measure to suspend the right to buy in areas of high housing pressure; otherwise, it is just showing its true colours as the anti-public sector, anti-devolution party that it has always been.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Thank you for that enlightening contribution, Leanne. I am sure that the residents of the estates of Cardiff and the rest of South Wales Central will benefit from the Karl Marx rhetoric that has come from you today, although they live in homes that they were able to buy because of that Conservative policy, and have gained more wealth through that. I suggest that it was a popular move indeed.

I will focus my attention on the planning policies that prevent many people from gaining permission to build a house. We all

rhai unigolion wedi elwa ohoni, ond yn ei sgil mae'r mwyafrif ar eu colled. Yr ydym wedi colli cynifer o dai cyngor o'n stoc tai.

Mae'r rheolau ynglŷn â throsglwyddo'r stoc tai wedi eu hystumio'n fwriadol er mwyn hyrwyddo trosglwyddo stoc, ac mae awdurdodau lleol sy'n dymuno cadw'u stoc tai wedi bod dan anfantais anferth, er gwaethaf rhai ymdrechion i gefnogi awdurdodau lleol felly yma yng Nghymru. Mae'r polisïau hyn i gyd wedi'u sbarduno gan yr ideoleg fod preifat yn dda, a chyhoeddus yn ddrwg. Mae'n ideoleg yr ydym ni, ym Mhlaid Cymru, a Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un yn bendant yn ymwrthod â hi.

Mae'r ddwy blaid yn y Llywodraeth—a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, a bod yn deg â hwy—yn derbyn bod angen gohirio'r hawl i brynu mewn rhai ardaloedd. Mae'r cam hwnnw'n arbennig o bwysig er mwyn amddiffyn y cynnydd yn nifer y tai cymdeithasol y bydd Lywodraeth Cymru'n Un yn ei sicrhau dros y tair blynedd nesaf. Yr wyf yn rhyfeddu gweld y Blaid Geidwadol yn cadw'n ystyfnig at y polisi hwn, er iddo arwain at ddinistrio'r stoc tai cymdeithasol dros y 18 mlynedd diwethaf a chynyddu'r niferoedd sy'n ddigartref. Os yw'n wir am weld gweithredu ymarferol a diymdroi ym maes tai, byddai'n cefnogi'r Gorchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol a gynigir ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy, a'r Mesur dilynol i ohirio'r hawl i brynu mewn ardaloedd lle mae pwysau mawr ar dai; fel arall, nid yw ond yn dangos ei gwir liwiau, lliwiau'r blaid wrth-ddatganoli a gwrth-sector cyhoeddus, sef yr hyn ydyw erioed.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Diolch ichi am y cyfraniad hwnnw i'n goleuo, Leanne. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd trigolion ystadau Caerdydd a gweddill Canol De Cymru ar eu hennill o glywed rhethreg Karl Marx gennyh heddiw, er eu bod yn byw yn y cartrefi y llwyddasant i'w prynu oherwydd y polisi Ceidwadol hwnnw, ac er eu bod wedi casglu mwy o gyfoeth yn sgil hynny. Awgrymaf iddo fod yn gam poblogaidd yn wir.

Canolbwytiaf fy sylw ar y polisïau cynllunio sy'n atal llawer o bobl rhag cael caniatâd i godi tŷ. Yr ydym i gyd yn derbyn bod prisiau

accept the massive inflation in house prices, but we keep coming back to the lack of supply in the housing market. Very often, it is the many directives issued from this building, via the technical advice notes that planning authorities must deal with, that are the stumbling block preventing many housebuilders and property developers from providing that supply. I can see the Minister shaking her head, and I hate to contradict her, but I have great experience of dealing with the planning field—in redeveloping old barns and building new properties—and so I know that you could go to two authorities in the South Wales Central region and get two different interpretations of the same technical advice note. It is high time we had an audit of how local authorities interpret the Assembly's technical advice notes.

I have raised the issue with the Minister on several occasions, and I understand that there is no process of auditing local authorities in that regard. Given the expensive process that people must endure when they apply for planning permission, we need a clearer picture of what is going on, from local authority to local authority. Power over the planning system clearly resides here, and the technical advice notes emanate from this building. I know that the One Wales Government is committed to reviewing TAN 6, but since I have come to this institution, I have been pressing to find out when that will happen. Perhaps the Minister could use today's debate to enlarge on the timescale the Government is operating under. In rural areas, you can be granted planning permission under technical advice note 6 in one authority, but then another authority will use a different consultant to arrive at a different conclusion. Time and again, businesses are suffering because they cannot benefit from the dispensation under technical advice note 6.

We should be working with the Westminster Government to ensure that financial products are in place that recognise the needs of the market. Credit is suddenly becoming much harder to acquire, and yet the fact is that easy credit has fuelled a massive property surge. In 1997, the average price of a property in

tai wedi codi'n anferthol, ond down yn ôl o hyd at y diffyg cyflenwad yn y farchnad tai. Yn aml iawn, y llu cyfarwyddebau a gyhoeddir o'r adeilad hwn, drwy gyfrwng y nodiadau cyngor technegol y mae'n rhaid i awdurdodau cynllunio ddelio â hwy, yw'r maen tramgwydd sy'n rhwystro nifer o adeiladwyr tai a datblygwyr eiddo rhag darparu'r cyflenwad hwnnw. Gwelaf y Gweinidog yn ysgwyd ei phen, ac mae'n gas gennyf ei gwrth-ddweud, ond mae gennyf brofiad helaeth o ddelio â'r maes cynllunio—wrth ailddatblygu hen ysguboriau ac adeiladu eiddo newydd—ac felly gwn y gallech fynd at ddau awdurdod yn rhanbarth Canol De Cymru a chael dau ddehongliad gwahanol o'r un nodyn cyngor technegol. Mae'n hen bryd inni gael archwiliad o'r ffordd y mae awdurdodau lleol yn dehongli nodiadau cyngor technegol y Cynulliad.

Yr wyf wedi codi'r mater gyda'r Gweinidog droeon, a deallaf nad oes proses ar gyfer archwilio awdurdodau lleol yn y cyswllt hwnnw. O ystyried y broses ddrud y mae'n rhaid i bobl ei dioddef wrth wneud cais am ganiatâd cynllunio, mae arnom angen darlun cliriach o'r hyn sy'n digwydd, o'r naill awdurdod lleol i'r llall. Mae'n amlwg mai yma y mae'r pŵer dros y system cynllunio, ac o'r adeilad yma y deillia'r nodiadau cyngor technegol. Gwn fod Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un wedi ymrwymo i adolygu TAN 6, ond ers imi ddod i'r sefydliad hwn, yr wyf wedi pwyso am gael gwybod pa bryd y bydd hynny'n digwydd. Efallai y gallai'r Gweinidog ddefnyddio'r ddadl heddiw i ymhelaethu ar yr amserlen sydd gan y Llywodraeth. Mewn ardaloedd gwledig, gallwch gael caniatâd cynllunio dan nodyn cyngor technegol 6 mewn un awdurdod, ond wedyn bydd awdurdod arall yn defnyddio ymgynghorydd gwahanol a bydd ei gasgliad yntau'n wahanol. Dro ar ôl tro, mae busnesau'n dioddef oherwydd na allant fanteisio ar y goddefiad a ganiateir dan nodyn cyngor technegol 6.

Dylem fod yn gweithio gyda Llywodraeth San Steffan i sicrhau bod cynhyrchion ariannol ar gael sy'n cydnabod anghenion y farchnad. Yn sydyn iawn, mae'n anos o lawer cael gafael ar gredyd. Eto i gyd, y ffaith yw fod credyd hawdd wedi sbarduno ymchwydd anferth yn y farchnad eiddo. Yn 1997, pris tŷ

Wales was between £56,000 and £57,000; today, the average property price is around £168,000. Trying to raise a deposit for a house, when the percentage amount required has increased by at least 10 per cent in some instances, is a bar to many young people, as well as middle-aged people, moving up the property ladder. We need to work proactively with financial institutions to ensure that they understand the Welsh property market. There is no point in their tailoring products to the needs of the market in south-east England or London only; they need to be tailored to what is going on in Wales, too. Wages in Wales are lower than those in the south-east of England, and so the product should reflect wage levels. We have our own building societies, such as the Principality, but they often rely on the London market to borrow money.

The supply of housing is a key issue if we are to tackle the housing problem, whether through more social housing or increasing levels of home ownership. This year in Wales, we will hit the lowest number of new builds since the war. It has been a progressive decline, and, unless we get new buildings under way, any statistics cited in this Chamber will be almost irrelevant. I fully remember the debate held in the Chamber back in June, initiated by Plaid Cymru, and I accept the genuine anxiety of all Members, particularly Plaid Cymru Members, over the housing problem, and the fact that people are prevented from getting on the property ladder. As Assembly Members, these are major issues for us to deal with. We have the ability to start doing that by tackling the planning process, which would deliver real gains. Then, we could get the significant new build structure in place, so that property developers and individuals can start to build the properties that we need for the twenty-first century.

The population of Wales is set to hit 3 million by the end of the year, which, in global or national terms, is not a big figure, but, for Wales, is historical. We have never

ar gyfartaledd yng Nghymru oedd rhwng £56,000 a £57,000; heddiw, pris tŷ ar gyfartaledd yw oddeutu £168,000. Mae ceisio codi blaendal ar gyfer tŷ, gan fod y ganran y mae gofyn ei thalu wedi cynyddu 10 y cant o leiaf dan rai amgylchiadau, yn rhwystro llawer o bobl ifanc, yn ogystal â phobl ganol-oed, rhag dringo'r ysgol eiddo. Mae angen inni weithio'n rhagweithiol gyda'r sefydliadau ariannol er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn deall y farchnad eiddo yng Nghymru. Nid oes diben iddynt deilwra'u cynnyrch i weddu i anghenion y farchnad yn ne-ddwyrain Lloegr neu yn Llundain yn unig; mae angen ei deilwra ar gyfer yr hyn sy'n digwydd yng Nghymru hefyd. Mae cyflogau yng Nghymru'n is na chyflogau yn ne-ddwyrain Lloegr, ac felly dylai'r cynnyrch adlewyrchu lefelau cyflogau. Mae gennym ein cymdeithasau adeiladu ein hunain, megis Principality, ond maent yn aml yn dibynnu ar farchnad Llundain i fenthyca'r arian.

Mae'r cyflenwad tai yn fater allweddol os ydym i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem tai, boed drwy gyfrwng mwy o dai cymdeithasol ynteu drwy gynyddu lefelau perchentyaeth. Yng Nghymru eleni, codir llai o dai newydd nag a godwyd mewn unrhyw flwyddyn ers y rhyfel. Mae'r sefyllfa wedi bod yn dirywio'n gynyddol, ac oni ddechreuwn godi adeiladau newydd bydd unrhyw ystadegau a ddyfynnir yn y Siambr hon bron iawn yn amherthnasol. Cofiaf yn iawn y ddadl a gynhaliwyd yn y Siambr yn ôl ym mis Mehefin. Fe'i cychwynwyd gan Plaid Cymru, a derbyniasf fod pryder yr Aelodau i gyd, yn enwedig Aelodau Plaid Cymru, yn bryder dilys am y broblem tai, a'r ffaith fod pobl yn cael eu hatal rhag cael troed ar yr ysgol eiddo. Fel Aelodau o'r Cynulliad, mae'r rhain yn broblemau mawr inni ddechrau delio â hwy. Gallwn ddechrau gwneud hynny drwy fynd i'r afael â'r broses cynllunio, a allai sicrhau enillion go iawn. Yna, gallem sefydlu'r strwythur newydd sylweddol ar gyfer codi tai newydd, er mwyn i ddatblygwyr eiddo ac unigolion ddechrau adeiladu'r tai y mae arnom eu hangen ar gyfer yr unfed ganrif ar hugain.

Disgwylir i boblogaeth Cymru gyrraedd 3 miliwn erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn, ac nid yw hwnnw'n ffigur mawr o safbwynt byd-eang na chenedlaethol, ond i Gymru mae'n

hit that figure before, though we have been at 2.5 million and 2.7 million for several decades. More pressure will be placed on the housing market, and we must respond to that challenge. It falls to the Government to do so.

Mick Bates: I am grateful to the Welsh Conservatives for proposing this debate today. I am struck by the number of times we have debated affordable housing in the Chamber. I will focus my contribution today on the fact that a sustainable future for all our communities is in the hands of the Government. I want to concentrate on the actions that the Government can take to improve the situation here and now, not only by buying houses, but also by providing more rental property, given that we tend to focus more on property for purchase.

First, the most crucial factor to consider is land, which accounts for the major part of any purchase price. Long ago, the Government was lobbied—by me, too—to release plots of Government-owned land to be sold on for affordable housing. I have searched for figures to show just how much land had been put on the market at a reasonable price, through section 106 agreements or whatever, to build affordable homes, but I could not find any. I hope that the Minister will tell me what has happened to that policy on the availability of Government land, and on the Government's being proactive to build affordable housing on it—for purchase or rent, I do not mind.

Secondly, the Government used to have a scheme called homebuy. I tried to research what happened to the money for homebuy, but I cannot even find out what its future will be. I cannot see the budget line for homebuy, though, we, as Welsh Liberal Democrats, have long lobbied the Government to put a clear line in the budget that says how much is available for homebuy. As many of you will know, it is part of the universal grant for housing, and so gets lost. Very few houses are built by homebuy; the number is tiny. What plans do you have to improve the homebuy scheme, Minister?

hanesyddol. Nid ydym erioed o'r blaen wedi cyrraedd y ffigur hwnnw, er bod ein poblogaeth wedi bod yn 2.5 miliwn ac yn 2.7 miliwn ers nifer o ddegawdau. Bydd mwy o bwysau ar y farchnad tai, a rhaid inni ymateb i'r her honno. Gwaith y Llywodraeth yw gwneud hynny.

Mick Bates: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Geidwadwyr Cymru am gynnig y ddadl hon heddiw. Mae'n fy nharo gynifer o weithiau yr ydym wedi cael dadl yn y Siambr ar dai fforddiadwy. Byddaf yn canolbwyntio fy nghyfraniad heddiw ar y ffaith fod dyfodol cynaliadwy i'n cymunedau i gyd yn nwylo'r Llywodraeth. Yr wyf am ganolbwyntio ar y camau y gall y Llywodraeth eu cymryd i wella'r sefyllfa yma'n awr, nid yn unig drwy brynu tai, ond hefyd drwy ddarparu mwy o eiddo ar rent, gan gofio ein bod yn tueddu i ganolbwyntio mwy ar eiddo i'w brynu.

Yn gyntaf, y ffactor pwysicaf i'w ystyried yw tir, sef yr elfen fwyaf o unrhyw bris prynu. Ers talwm, pwyswyd ar y Llywodraeth—gennyf fi hefyd—i ryddhau lleiniau o dir a oedd yn eiddo i'r Llywodraeth i'w gwerthu ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy. Yr wyf wedi chwilio am ffigurau i ddangos faint o dai yn union a oedd wedi'u rhoi ar y farchnad am bris rhesymol, drwy gyfrwng cytundebau adran 106 neu beth bynnag, er mwyn codi tai fforddiadwy, ond ni allwn ddarganfod dim. Gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn dweud wrthyf beth sydd wedi digwydd i'r polisi hwnnw ar ddarparu tir y Llywodraeth ac ar gael y Llywodraeth i wneud rhywbeth rhagweithiol er mwyn codi tai fforddiadwy arno—i'w prynu neu i'w rhentu, nid oes ots gennyf.

Yn ail, arferai fod gan y Llywodraeth gynllun a elwid yn gymorth prynu. Ceisiais ymchwilio i'r hyn a ddigwyddodd i'r arian ar gyfer y cynllun cymorth prynu, ond ni allaf gael gwybod hyd yn oed beth fydd ei ddyfodol. Ni allaf weld y llinell yn y gyllideb ar gyfer y cynllun cymorth prynu, er ein bod ni, Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, wedi pwyso ar y Llywodraeth ers tro byd i gael llinell glir yn y gyllideb sy'n dweud faint sydd ar gael ar gyfer cymorth prynu. Fel y gŵyr nifer ohonoch, mae'n rhan o'r grant tai cyffredinol ac felly mae'n mynd ar goll. Ychydig iawn o dai a godir dan y cynllun

cymorth prynu; mae'r nifer yn fach iawn. Pa gynlluniau sydd gennych i wella'r cynllun cymorth prynu, Weinidog?

2.40 p.m.

How many key workers have you housed? What policies will you implement to ensure that key workers can remain in their communities? The fundamental drift of what I am saying is that, unless these issues are addressed, many of our rural communities will simply disappear, or they will become retirement zones, with the only people able to afford to live there those fortunate enough to have made a killing on their houses, who can outbid local people. That is where there is a role for us, and where Government intervention is necessary. Where are we in relation to the deregulation of financial constraints on our Welsh housing associations? In England, housing associations can borrow money to help to build houses more easily than is the case in Wales. These things are all under your control, Minister.

Another Minister controls planning. I listened intently to Angela Burns talking about the grief, which I have also seen, of people who own land but cannot build on it. I know that the Town and Country Planning Act 1947 was introduced to stop random development, but surely it is possible to use rural exceptions to allow people who have been born and bred in communities to build a home there. Why can they not do that? Many people come to my surgeries and tell me, 'I do not want a mansion, just a simple two-bedroomed bungalow', but they cannot get the planning permission.

Brynle Williams: On that point, like you, I am annoyed and frustrated. There are seven young people in my village, who were born and bred there, and they still cannot afford to build their own homes. The restrictions will not allow it, even though their parents are prepared to give them the land.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Brynle, you are intervening on Mick Bates, not on Alun Ffred Jones. *[Laughter.]*

Mick Bates: Thank you for your

Faint o weithwyr allweddol yr ydych wedi'u cartrefu? Pa bolisiau y byddwch yn eu rhoi ar waith i sicrhau bod modd i weithwyr allweddol aros yn eu cymunedau? Byrdwn yr hyn yr wyf yn ei ddweud yn y bôn yw hyn: oni roddir sylw i'r materion hyn, bydd nifer o'n cymunedau gwledig yn diflannu neu'n troi'n ardaloedd ymddeol, a'r unig bobl a fydd yn gallu fforddio byw yno yw'r rheiny sy'n ddigon ffodus i fod wedi gwerthu eu tai am grocbris, ac yn gallu fforddio cynnig mwy na phobl leol. Dyna ble mae rôl i ni, a ble mae angen i'r Llywodraeth ymyrryd. Ble'r ydym arni o ran dadreoleiddio'r cyfyngiadau ariannol ar ein cymdeithasau tai yng Nghymru? Yn Lloegr, gall cymdeithasau tai gael benthyg arian i'w helpu i godi tai yn haws nag y gellir yng Nghymru. Mae'r pethau hyn i gyd dan eich rheolaeth chi, Weinidog.

Gweinidog arall sy'n rheoli cynllunio. Gwrandewais yn ofalus ar Angela Burns yn sôn am boen pobl sy'n berchen ar dir ond na allant adeiladu arno, ac yr wyf fi hefyd wedi gweld hyn. Gwn fod Deddf Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref 1947 wedi'i chyflwyno er mwyn rhwystro datblygu ar hap, ond onid oes modd defnyddio eithriadau gwledig i ganiatáu i bobl sydd wedi'u geni a'u magu mewn cymunedau godi cartref yno. Pam na chânt wneud hynny? Bydd llawer o bobl yn dod i'm cymorthfeydd a dweud wrthyf, "Nid gofyn am gael plasty ydw i, dim ond byngalo syml dwy lofft", ond ni allant gael y caniatâd cynllunio.

Brynle Williams: Yr wyf fi, fel chithau, yn ddig ac yn rhwystredig ynglŷn â hynny. Mae saith o bobl ifanc yn fy mhentref i, a anwyd ac a fagwyd yno, sydd eto'n methu fforddio prynu eu cartrefi eu hunain. Nid yw'r cyfyngiadau'n caniatáu hynny, er bod eu rhieni'n barod i roi'r tir iddynt.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Brynle, yr ydych yn ymyrryd yng nghyfraniad Mick Bates, nid cyfraniad Alun Ffred Jones. *[Chwerthin]*

Mick Bates: Diolch ichi am eich ymyriad,

intervention, Brynle—and to Alun Ffred for allowing it. [*Laughter.*]

The issue is well understood, but we still have not cracked it. We have a collective responsibility to achieve something that allows people who have been born and bred in a community to build there, if they have land. Even if they do not have the land, why can we not dedicate some of the Government's land to them, given that it owns a lot of land? Some 14 per cent of the land area in Wales is Forestry Commission land, owned by the Government.

My second point is to do with living in homes, because I want to make these homes sustainable, too. It will cost a bit more to build homes that are reasonably priced but that do not force you to scramble around for money when you get your utility bills. Let us build them to a better standard. The economy can gain from this, too. I know many people who are involved with community land trusts who have solved that problem; they get section 106 agreements, and set covenants that mean that the house has to be sold at a price that is affordable for the community. I know that the Minister and her predecessor support the concept of community land trusts, and I endorse the work that has been done, and I hope that more encouragement can be given to that.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You are way over time.

Nick Ramsay: It is incredible that the Government amendment to the motion questions the fact that there is an affordable housing crisis in Wales. There is clearly a crisis. I listened to Leanne Wood earlier, and, while she did not use the word 'crisis', it was clear that many Plaid Cymru Members believe that the term 'housing need' is certainly not strong enough; 'crisis' is a far better word. I am sure that many Plaid Cymru Members will agree with those of us on this side of the Chamber on that. In fact, the Carmarthen East and Dinefwr MP, Adam Price, said that the current figures regarding

Brynle—ac i Alun Ffred am ei ganiatáu. [*Chwerthin.*]

Yr ydym yn deall y sefyllfa'n iawn, ond nid ydym wedi'i datrys eto. Yr ydym yn gydgyfrifol am wireddu rhywbeth sy'n caniatáu i bobl sydd wedi'u geni a'u magu mewn cymuned godi tŷ yno, os yw'r tir ganddynt. Hyd yn oed os nad yw'r tir ganddynt, pam na allwn neilltuo rhywfaint o dir y Llywodraeth ar eu cyfer, gan ei bod yn berchen ar lawer o dir? Mae oddeutu 14 y cant o arwynebedd tir Cymru yn dir y Comisiwn Coedwigaeth, ym mherchnogaeth yr Llywodraeth.

Mae a wnelo fy ail bwynt â byw mewn cartrefi, oherwydd yr wyf am wneud y cartrefi hyn yn gynaliadwy hefyd. Bydd yn costio ychydig yn fwy i godi tai sy'n rhesymol eu pris heb ichi orfod chwilio ym mhob twll a chornel am arian pan fydd eich biliau ynni'n cyrraedd. Gadewch inni godi tai o well safon. Gall yr economi fod ar ei hennill yn sgil hyn, hefyd. Yr wyf yn adnabod llawer o bobl sy'n ymwneud ag ymddiriedolaethau tir cymunedol ac sydd wedi datrys y broblem honno; maent yn sicrhau cytundebau adran 106 ac yn gosod cyfamodau sy'n golygu ei bod yn rhaid gwerthu'r tŷ am bris y gall y gymuned ei fforddio. Gwn fod y Gweinidog a'i rhagflaenydd yn cefnogi'r cysyniad o ymddiriedolaethau tir cymunedol, a chymeradwyaf y gwaith sydd wedi'i wneud eisoes gan obeithio y gellir rhoi mwy o anogaeth i hynny.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Yr ydych ymhell dros eich amser.

Nick Ramsay: Mae'n rhyfeddol fod gwelliant y Llywodraeth i'r cynnig yn gyndyn o dderbyn bod yna argyfwng tai fforddiadwy yng Nghymru. Mae'n amlwg bod argyfwng. Gwrandewais ar Leanne Wood gynnu, ac er na ddefnyddiodd y gair 'argyfwng', yr oedd yn amlwg bod nifer o Aelodau Plaid Cymru yn credu nad yw'r term 'anghenion tai' yn sicr yn ddigon cryf; mae 'argyfwng' yn air gwell o lawer. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd nifer o Aelodau Plaid Cymru yn cytuno â'r rheiny ohonom ar yr ochr hon i'r Siambr ynglŷn â hynny. A dweud y gwir, dywedodd AS Dwyrain Caerfyrddin a

the number of people trying to get onto the housing ladder reflects ‘a desperate situation’, and he has called for a proportion of homes to be designated for local buyers in perpetuity. That was alluded to by my colleagues earlier in the debate.

There has been a trebling of the average wage over the past 10 years, but that has still not kept up with the increase in house prices. My colleague, Mark Isherwood, said that the basic problem is that demand is greater than supply. That is what we are dealing with here. There are all sorts of issues relating to how you address the affordable housing issue, but the basic problem is one of supply and demand.

Whenever we have these debates—whether they are tabled by my party or other parties—we always seem to end up discussing the right to buy, which is a great shame because, setting dogmatic differences aside, I do not think that it deals with the basic issue here, which is that not enough houses are being built. There may well have been some 1.5 million council houses sold to people in the 1980s—I welcome that; I think that it empowered people, although I know that there are differences of opinion here about that. However, those houses still exist, and people are still living in them. Those houses have not disappeared, and whether people own them or not is not the issue. What we need to do is to look at how the Assembly Government can move forward and how we can encourage local authorities to allow for the building of more houses.

There are a number of ways in which local authorities can increase the supply of affordable housing, whether in managing their own stock or going through housing stock transfer schemes, which have happened successfully across Wales. That has happened in my own authority of Monmouthshire, and I know that neighbouring authorities are following suit. Local authorities could also grant more applications for houses to be built, ensuring that affordable housing makes up an element of the development. That currently varies between authorities, and we could give

Dinefwr, Adam Price, fod nifer y bobl sy'n ceisio cael troed ar yr ysgol tai yn adlewyrchu 'sefyllfa anobeithiol', ac mae wedi galw am ddynodi cyfran o dai ar gyfer prynwyr lleol hyd byth. Cyfeiriodd fy nghyd-Aelodau at hynny yn gynharach yn y ddaol.

Ar gyfartaledd, mae cyflogau wedi treblu dros y 10 mlynedd diwethaf, ond eto i gyd, nid yw hynny yn cyfateb i'r cynnydd ym mhrisiau tai. Dywedodd fy nghyd-Aelod, Mark Isherwood, mai'r broblem sylfaenol yw bod y galw'n fwy o lawer na'r cyflenwad. Dyna yr ydym yn delio ag ef yma. Mae pob math o bethau'n codi ynglŷn â sut i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem tai fforddiadwy, ond y cyflenwad a'r galw yw'r broblem sylfaenol.

Pa bryd bynnag y cawn y dadleuon hyn—pa un a gânt eu cyflwyno gan fy mhlaid i ynteu gan bleidiau eraill—mae'n ymddangos ein bod bob amser yn dod yn ôl i drafod yr hawl i brynu, sy'n drueni, oherwydd gan roi gwahaniaethau dogmataidd o'r neilltu, nid wyf yn credu bod hynny'n ymdrin â'r broblem sylfaenol yn y cyswllt hwn, sef nad oes digon o dai'n cael eu hadeiladu. Mae'n ddigon posibl fod oddeutu 1.5 miliwn o dai cyngor wedi eu gwerthu i bobl yn y 1980au—yr wyf yn croesawu hynny; credaf ei fod wedi rhoi grym i bobl, ond gwn nad yw pawb yma'n cytuno â hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'r tai hynny'n bodoli o hyd, ac mae pobl yn dal i fyw ynddynt. Nid yw'r tai hynny wedi diflannu, ac nid y cwestiwn a yw pobl yn berchen arnynt ai peidio sy'n bwysig yma. Yr hyn y mae angen i ni ei wneud yw edrych ar y ffordd y gall Llywodraeth y Cynulliad symud ymlaen a sut y gallwn annog awdurdodau lleol i ganiatau ar gyfer adeiladu mwy o dai.

Gall awdurdodau lleol gynyddu nifer y tai fforddiadwy sydd ar gael mewn nifer o wahanol ffyrdd, boed wrth reoli eu stoc eu hunain ynteu drwy gynlluniau i drosglwyddo'r stoc tai, sydd wedi bod yn llwyddiannus ledled Cymru. Mae hynny wedi digwydd yn fy awdurdod i, sef sir Fynwy, a gwn fod awdurdodau cyfagos yn gwneud yr un peth. Gallai awdurdodau lleol hefyd ganiatau mwy o geisiadau i adeiladu tai, gan sicrhau bod tai fforddiadwy'n elfen yn y datblygiad. Mae hynny'n amrywio ar hyn o bryd o'r naill awdurdod i'r llall, a gallem roi

better guidance to authorities across Wales on how they could increase the affordable housing element in giving planning permissions for housing developments.

Mick Bates mentioned the homebuy scheme, which is a successful scheme that has allowed more people to own their houses than ever before. That is the way ahead. As I said, we do not want to get into the dogmatic arguments of the 1980s and 1990s, or even the 1940s, as was mentioned earlier, because that does not provide the solutions for the future. It is clear that this issue has gone up the agenda, and there is consensus that something needs to be done, because the proportion of letters in Assembly Members' postbags devoted to this issue is enormous. There is a real problem out there, particularly in the rural communities that I represent, where young people cannot get a foot on the housing ladder in communities in which they have grown up. They want to stay in their communities, but if they cannot do that—

Nerys Evans: Do you and your party—*[Inaudible.]*—'The All-Wales Accord'?

Nick Ramsay: You are the ones in coalition with the Labour Party, and what we need from you is for you to use leverage with your coalition partners to ensure that what you have committed to in the coalition discussions is honoured. I do not think that that is happening at the moment.

I mentioned that the housing crisis is particularly acute in rural communities, but it is a significant problem that affects all parts of Wales. Whatever the Assembly Government may say, there is a housing crisis. It is much more than just a question of housing need—there is always housing need, but the situation is clearly getting worse. It is incredible to think that house price inflation has made Wales one of the least affordable regions outside of London and the broader south of England—who would have thought that 10 or 20 years ago?

The lack of investment in social housing by

gwell arweiniad i awdurdodau ledled Cymru ynglŷn â'r ffordd y gallent gynyddu elfen tai fforddiadwy wrth roi caniatâd cynllunio ar gyfer datblygiadau tai.

Cyfeiriodd Mick Bates at y cynllun cymorth prynu. Mae hwn yn gynllun llwyddiannus, ac mae wedi caniatáu i fwy o bobl nag erioed o'r blaen fod yn berchen ar eu tai eu hunain. Dyna'r ffordd ymlaen. Fel y dywedais, nid oes arnom eisiau mynd i mewn i ddadleuon dogmataidd y 1980au a'r 1990au, neu hyd yn oed y 1940au, fel y soniwyd yn gynharach, oherwydd nid yw hynny'n cynnig atebion ar gyfer y dyfodol. Mae'n amlwg bod y mater hwn yn cael mwy o flaenoriaeth ar yr agenda, ac mae cytundeb bod angen gwneud rhywbeth, oherwydd mae cyfran y llythyrau ym magiau post yr Aelodau Cynulliad sy'n ymdrin â'r mater hwn yn enfawr. Mae problem wirioneddol allan yna, yn enwedig yn y cymunedau gwledig yr wyf fi'n eu cynrychioli, lle nad yw pobl ifanc yn gallu cael troed ar yr ysgol tai yn y cymunedau lle maent wedi eu magu. Mae arnynt eisiau aros yn eu cymunedau, ond os methant â gwneud hynny—

Nerys Evans: A ydych chi a'ch plaid—*[Anghlywadwy.]*—'Cytundeb Cymru Gyfan'?

Nick Ramsay: Chi sydd mewn clymblaid gyda'r Blaid Lafur, a'r hyn yr ydym ni'n disgwyl i chi ei wneud yw rhoi pwysau ar eich partneriaid yn y glymblaid i sicrhau bod yr hyn yr ydych wedi ymrwymo i'w wneud yn nhrefodaethau'r glymblaid yn cael ei anrhydeddu. Ni chredaf fod hynny'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd.

Soniais fod yr argyfwng tai yn ddrwg iawn mewn cymunedau gwledig, ond mae'n broblem fawr sy'n effeithio ar bob rhan o Gymru. Beth bynnag a ddywed Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, mae yna argyfwng tai. Mae'n llawer mwy na mater o fod angen tai—mae angen tai o hyd, ond mae'n amlwg bod y sefyllfa'n gwaethygu. Mae'n anhygoel bod y cynnydd ym mhrisiau tai wedi gwneud Cymru'n un o'r rhanbarthau lleiaf fforddiadwy y tu allan i Lundain a de Lloegr yn gyffredinol—pwy fyddai wedi dychmygu hynny 10 neu 20 mlynedd yn ôl?

Mae diffyg buddsoddiad gan y Llywodraeth

the Labour Government has created an environment in which far too many people experience poor and sometimes overcrowded housing conditions. I am pleased that this debate has been brought forward by my party, and I urge everyone to support our motion and to ensure that we have a far more equitable housing situation for people across Wales, which delivers the social justice that we often talk about, but which does not often seem to be delivered in practice.

Alun Davies: Social justice is often talked about, but not by the Conservative Party. The Conservative Party is the party of homelessness; it was Conservative economic incompetence that led to interest rates of 15 per cent, which led to more people losing their homes than at any point in our history. Millions of people were left with negative equity and tens of thousands of people—

David Melding: Will you give way?

Alun Davies: Give me a chance, David. Tens of thousands of families were left homeless as a result of Conservative incompetence. The Conservatives managed to sell off most of the housing stock without replacing it, and still ended up in 1997 with around a £19 billion backlog in repairs.

2.50 p.m.

David Melding: Will you give way?

Alun Davies: Let me finish my point, and I will let you in. My final point, in these opening remarks, is that when the Conservatives talk about urgent and practical action, I am not sure that they have told Mark Isherwood about it. I am not sure that Nick Ramsay speaks to Mark very often because, last week, in the Proposed Affordable Housing LCO Committee, Mark voted against not the principle of suspending the right-to-buy scheme, but against transferring the power to do so to this place. In one vote, he demonstrated that the Conservatives do not like devolution or giving this place the power to take urgent and practical action.

Lafur mewn tai cymdeithasol wedi creu sefyllfa lle mae llawer gormod o bobl yn byw mewn tai o safon isel lle mae nifer o bobl yn byw. Yr wyf yn falch fod y ddadl hon wedi ei chyflwyno gan fy mhlaid i, ac anogaf bawb i gefnogi ein cynnig a sicrhau bod gennym sefyllfa lawer tecach o ran tai i bobl ym mhob cwr o Gymru, sefyllfa sy'n cynnig y cyfiawnder cymdeithasol y byddwn yn aml yn siarad amdano ond nad yw fel petai'n cael ei weithredu'n aml.

Alun Davies: Cyfeirir at gyfiawnder cymdeithasol yn aml, ond nid gan y Blaid Geidwadol. Y Blaid Geidwadol yw plaid digartrefedd; anallu economaidd y Ceidwadwyr a arweiniodd at gyfraddau llog o 15 y cant, a olygodd fod mwy o bobl wedi colli eu cartrefi nag ar unrhyw adeg yn ein hanes. Gadawyd miliynau o bobl ag ecwiti negyddol a gadawyd degau o filoedd o bobl—

David Melding: A wnewch chi ildio?

Alun Davies: Rhowch gyfle imi, David. Gadawyd degau o filoedd o deuluoedd yn ddigartref o ganlyniad i anallu'r Ceidwadwyr. Llwyddodd y Ceidwadwyr i werthu'r rhan fwyaf o'r stoc tai heb ddarparu tai eraill yn eu lle, ac yr oedd ganddynt oddeutu £19 biliwn o waith atgyweirio yn aros i gael ei wneud yn 1997.

David Melding: A wnewch chi ildio?

Alun Davies: Gadewch imi orffen fy mhwynt. Byddaf yn ildio ichi wedyn. Fy mhwynt olaf, yn y sylwadau agoriadol hyn, yw nad wyf yn siŵr a yw'r Ceidwadwyr, pan fyddant yn siarad am weithredu brys ac ymarferol, wedi dweud wrth Mark Isherwood am hynny. Nid wyf yn siŵr a yw Nick Ramsay yn siarad â Mark yn aml iawn, oherwydd wythnos diwethaf yn y Pwyllgor ar y Gorchymyn Cymhwysedd Deddfwriaethol Arfaethedig ynghylch Tai Fforddiadwy, pleidleisiodd Mark nid yn erbyn yr egwyddor o atal y cynllun hawl i brynu, ond yn erbyn trosglwyddo'r pŵer i wneud hynny i'r lle hwn. Mewn un bleidlais, dangosodd nad yw'r Ceidwadwyr yn hoffi datganoli nac yn hoffi rhoi pŵer i'r lle hwn i gymryd camau brys ac

ymarferol.

David Melding: Can one infer from your remarks, if you think that the 1980s and the first half of the 1990s were so catastrophic for this country, that you would have voted for the 1983 Labour manifesto? That was the only time when a neo-Marxist programme has been presented to the people of Britain. It proposed, basically, the end of capitalism, withdrawal from the European Economic Community and the nationalisation of the commanding heights of the economy. That was the alternative, so I presume that you would have signed up to it happily.

Alun Davies: I thought—[*Interruption.*]

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I ask that we listen to Alun Davies's reply, please.

Alun Davies: I thought that I had heard everything when Angela Burns was too ashamed to defend her own Government's record, but now we also have David Melding being ashamed to defend the record himself. The reality is that when you left office in 1997, housing in this country was in absolute crisis. It was a crisis of your creation, and one that you are failing and refusing to address today. That is the reality of Conservative policy on housing. I welcome the legislation—[*Interruption.*] I have a microphone, so I will shout louder. I welcome the legislation that the Government will pass to suspend the right to buy. I do so for the same reason that Shelter Cymru and every witness in the Proposed Affordable Housing LCO Committee welcomed it: it is moving forward and demonstrating that the Government is committed to ensuring that homelessness is a thing of the past, not a thing of the future, which is what would happen if you had a Conservative Government.

I would like to ask the Minister, in terms of the legislation that we will bring to the Chamber in the next few years, to ensure that she has the powers that she requires to legislate to allow local authorities far greater

David Melding: A ellir casglu o'ch sylwadau, os ydych yn credu bod y 1980au a hanner cyntaf y 1990au wedi bod mor drychinebus i'r wlad hon, y byddech wedi pleidleisio o blaid maniffesto Llafur yn 1983? Dyna'r unig adeg pan gafodd rhaglen neo-Farcsaidd ei chyflwyno i bobl Prydain. Yr hyn yr oedd yn ei gynnig, yn ei hanfod, oedd diwedd cyfalafiaeth, tynnu'n ôl o Gymuned Economaidd Ewrop a gwladoli uchelfannau'r economi. Dyna'r dewis arall, felly, cymeraf y byddech wedi bod yn barod iawn i gefnogi'r maniffesto.

Alun Davies: Yr oeddwn yn meddwl—[*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Gadewch inni wrando ar ateb Alun Davies, os gwelwch yn dda.

Alun Davies: Yr oeddwn yn meddwl fy mod wedi clywed popeth pan oedd gan Angela Burns ormod o gywilydd i amddiffyn record ei Llywodraeth ei hun, ond gwelwn fod gan David Melding hefyd ormod o gywilydd i amddiffyn y record ei hun. Y gwir amdani yw bod argyfwng difrifol ym maes tai yn y wlad hon pan adawsoch eich swydd yn 1997. Yr oedd yn argyfwng a achoswyd gennych chi, argyfwng yr ydych yn gwrthod ac yn methu â rhoi sylw iddo heddiw. Dyna yw realiti polisi'r Ceidwadwyr ar dai. Yr wyf yn croesawu'r ddeddfwriaeth—[*Torri ar draws.*] Mae gennyf ficroffon, felly, gwaeddaf yn uwch. Yr wyf yn croesawu'r ddeddfwriaeth y bydd y Llywodraeth yn ei phasio i atal yr hawl i brynu. Gwnaf hynny am yr un rheswm ag y croesawyd ef gan Shelter Cymru a phob un o'r tystion yn y Pwyllgor ar y Gorchymyn Cymhwysedd Deddfwriaethol Arfaethedig ynghylch Tai Fforddiadwy: mae'n symud ymlaen ac yn dangos bod y Llywodraeth wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau bod digartrefedd yn perthyn i'r gorffennol, yn hytrach na'r dyfodol, oherwydd dyna a fyddai'n digwydd petai gennyh Lywodraeth Geidwadol.

Hoffwn ofyn i'r Gweinidog sicrhau, yng nghyswllt y ddeddfwriaeth y byddwn yn ei chyflwyno i'r Siambr yn y blynyddoedd nesaf, bod ganddi'r pwerau y mae arni eu hangen i ddeddfu i ganiatáu llawer mwy o

freedom to address affordable housing issues in their localities. I want to make a difference to planning, to ensure that we can designate non-development sites for affordable housing, reform the guidance on what 'affordability' and 'local' mean, and to ensure that there is a supply of publicly owned land for—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Will you take an intervention from Peter Black?

Alun Davies: I will.

Peter Black: Thank you, Alun. I certainly support your call for those additional powers. Would you not agree that if we are to have those powers, it would be better to have them immediately, and that we should therefore be widening the present LCO to that effect? Do you not think that the Minister should be taking that on board as well?

Alun Davies: We are having that debate in the committee at the moment. My view is that we should have those powers, and that they should be available to the Minister, but I am not prepared, Peter, to hold up the process today in order to achieve different powers tomorrow. I want the Minister to ensure that we have the powers to pass this legislation as soon as possible. I would like those powers to be transferred to this place before the summer recess. The Conservatives do not want the powers at all and I hope that people will remember and recognise that. I hope, Minister, that when you are drawing up your homelessness strategy, you will ensure that we will have the means to transfer further powers to this place, so that we can pass legislation to address the housing needs in communities throughout Wales. In doing so, we can address issues of social justice and make life better for people. That is in contrast to the crocodile tears that we are seeing from the Conservatives, who have created a housing crisis in this country greater than that we have seen at any other time in our history.

The Deputy Minister for Housing (Jocelyn Davies): Mark, I have tried to explain how the housing revenue subsidy account system works, but you simply will not listen. Peter,

ryddid i awdurdodau lleol roi sylw i faterion tai fforddiadwy yn eu hardaloedd. Yr wyf yn awyddus i wneud gwahaniaeth mewn cynllunio, er mwyn sicrhau y gallwn nodi safleoedd nad ydynt yn safleoedd datblygu ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy, diwygio'r canllawiau ar ystyr 'bod yn fforddiadwy' a 'lleol', a sicrhau bod cyflenwad o dir sy'n eiddo cyhoeddus ar gyfer—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: A wnewch chi dderbyn ymyriad gan Peter Black?

Alun Davies: Gwnaf.

Peter Black: Diolch, Alun. Yr wyf yn sicr yn cefnogi'ch cais am y pwerau ychwanegol hyn. Oni fyddech yn cytuno, os ydym i gael y pwerau hynny, y byddai'n well inni eu cael ar unwaith, ac y dylem felly fod yn ehangu'r Gorchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol presennol i'r perwyl hwnnw? Oni chredwch y dylai'r Gweinidog fod yn ystyried hynny hefyd?

Alun Davies: Yr ydym yn cael y ddadl honno yn y pwyllgor ar hyn o bryd. Fy marn i yw y dylem gael y pwerau hynny, ac y dylent fod ar gael i'r Gweinidog. Ond nid wyf yn barod, Peter, i atal y broses heddiw er mwyn cael pwerau gwahanol yfory. Yr wyf yn awyddus i'r Gweinidog sicrhau ein bod yn cael y pwerau i basio'r deddfwriaeth hon cyn gynted ag y bo modd. Hoffwn weld y pwerau hynny'n cael eu trosglwyddo i'r lle hwn cyn toriad yr haf. Nid oes ar y Ceidwadwyr eisiau'r pwerau o gwbl, ac yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd pobl yn cofio ac yn cydnabod hynny. Gobeithio y byddwch yn sicrhau, Weinidog, pan fyddwch yn llunio'ch strategaeth ar ddigartrefedd, y bydd modd inni drosglwyddo rhagor o bwerau i'r lle hwn, fel y gallwn basio deddfwriaeth i roi sylw i'r angen am dai mewn cymunedau ledled Cymru. Wrth wneud hynny, gallwn roi sylw i faterion cyfiawnder cymdeithasol a gwneud bywyd yn well i bobl. Mae hynny i'r gwrthwyneb i'r dagrau gwneud a welsom gan y Ceidwadwyr, sydd wedi creu argyfwng tai mwy nag a welwyd erioed yn y wlad hon.

Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Dai (Jocelyn Davies): Mark, yr wyf wedi ceisio egluro sut y mae system y cyfrif cymhorthdal refeniw tai yn gweithio, ond nid ydych yn gwranddo.

you were the Deputy Minister for housing for three years, so you cannot pretend that the housing problems that we are facing now are nothing to do with you. I have been the Deputy Minister for six months and I think that a great deal has been achieved. Frankly, we should stop blaming each other. Attacks here might give you enough material for your press releases, and we have all enjoyed it this afternoon, but it will not address the problems that we face.

Peter Black: No-one is pretending that the problems are nothing to do with me; in fact, I am trying to find solutions with you. However, we must recognise that the affordable housing crisis has worsened over the past three or four years in particular, with the increase in house prices. I do not think that that situation existed when I was Deputy Minister.

Jocelyn Davies: Okay, Peter, but you could have done some of the things that you mentioned when you were Deputy Minister. I suppose that I should be relieved that you did not say that the problem has developed over the past three or four months. On behalf of the Government, I will support the motion, subject to its being amended by the amendments tabled by the Counsel General and Leader of the House. The Assembly Government has demonstrated its clear intention to improve and increase its delivery of affordable housing across Wales, and it has taken a number of practical actions to pursue its policy intent. An affordable housing policy package was published by the previous administration, and we would all have to accept that it was a significant step in addressing the issues of undersupply and affordability in the housing market.

In drafting the 'One Wales' agreement, we recognised the need to go further to provide additional resources and to further policy interventions that will reach all parts of Wales. That is why I will support the motion, subject to its amendment by Carwyn's amendments. A great deal has been said about the Government amendments, and the attempts to replace the words 'the growing

Peter, chi oedd y Dirprwy Weinidog dros dai am dair blynedd, felly, ni allwch gymryd arnoch nad oes a wnelo'r problemau tai yr ydym yn eu hwynebu'n awr ddim oll i'w wneud â chi. Yr wyf yn Ddirprwy Weinidog am chwe mis a chredaf fod llawer iawn wedi'i gyflawni. A bod yn onest, dylem roi'r gorau i feio'n gilydd. Efallai y bydd ymosodiadau yn y Siambr yn rhoi digon o ddeunydd ichi ar gyfer eich datganiadau i'r wasg, ac yr ydym i gyd wedi mwynhau hynny y prynhawn yma, ond ni fyddant yn rhoi sylw i'r problemau sy'n ein hwynebu.

Peter Black: Nid oes neb yn honni nad oes a wnelo'r problemau â mi; mewn gwirionedd, yr wyf yn ceisio dod o hyd i atebion gyda chi. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gydnabod bod yr argyfwng tai fforddiadwy wedi gwaethgu yn ystod y tair neu bedair blynedd diwethaf yn fwyaf arbennig, o ganlyniad i'r cynnydd ym mhrisiau tai. Nid wyf yn credu bod y sefyllfa'n bodoli pan oeddwn i'n Ddirprwy Weinidog.

Jocelyn Davies: Iawn, Peter, ond byddech wedi gallu gwneud rhai o'r pethau y cyfeirich atynt pan oeddech yn Ddirprwy Weinidog. Mae'n debyg y dylwn fod yn falch nad ydych wedi dweud bod y broblem wedi datblygu yn ystod y tri neu bedwar mis diwethaf. Ar ran y Llywodraeth, byddaf yn cefnogi'r cynnig, ar yr amod ei fod yn cael ei wella gan y gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd gan y Cwnsler Cyffredinol ac Arweinydd y Tŷ. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi dangos ei bwriad clir i wella a chynyddu ei darpariaeth o dai fforddiadwy ledled Cymru, ac mae wedi cymryd nifer o gamau ymarferol i gyflawni ei bwriadau polisi. Cyhoeddwyd pecyn polisi tai fforddiadwy gan y weinyddiaeth flaenorol, a byddai'n rhaid i ni bob un dderbyn ei fod yn gam sylweddol ymlaen wrth fynd i'r afael â materion prinder a fforddiadwyedd yn y farchnad tai.

Wrth ddrafftio cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un', cydnabuom fod angen mynd ymhellach drwy ddarparu adnoddau ychwanegol a hybu ymyriadau polisi a fydd yn cyrraedd pob rhan o Gymru. Dyna pam y byddaf yn cefnogi'r cynnig, ar yr amod y caiff ei wella drwy welliannau Carwyn. Mae llawer iawn wedi ei ddweud am welliannau'r Llywodraeth, a'r ymdrechion i ddileu'r geiriau 'argyfwng tai

housing crisis' with the words 'housing needs'. Whether you think that there is a growing housing crisis depends on whether you are someone in housing need or someone with a vested interest in the boom continuing. As a Government, we are, of course, interested in need. All the indications are that we have now passed the peak of the current housing market cycle, with prices beginning to stabilise, and, in some parts of Wales, to fall. This is good news for those who have saved hard for their first home only to be frustrated by rising prices. I do not deny that there are areas of extreme housing pressure, and I am delighted that housing is now a priority for the Government.

The second Government amendment, amendment 2, invites the Assembly to endorse the Government's actions and the commitments set out in 'One Wales' on affordable housing. It is worth highlighting some of those. 'One Wales' commits us to a target of securing the provision of an additional 6,500 new affordable homes over four years. Some will say that we need more, while others will say that it is an ambitious target. However, it is the target we have set, and we recognise that we must deliver on that commitment.

Despite the very tight budget settlement, I am pleased that we were able to secure an additional £30 million for the provision of affordable housing over the next three years. The bulk of this additional funding will be taken up by the independent and voluntary sectors, through housing associations, drawing upon the social housing grants programme. The balance will be dedicated to a pilot programme to provide grants for first-time buyers. That, of course, is being derided by the Tories this afternoon. However, Nerys, you are quite right that they endorsed that in 'The All-Wales Accord', and I now wonder how serious they were about that accord. I will shortly announce details of the pilot programme for grants for first-time buyers, and I assure Members that it will not inflate house prices. I promise you that.

sydd ar dwf' a rhoi'r geiriau 'anghenion tai' yn eu lle. Mae'r cwestiwn a ydych yn credu bod yma argyfwng tai sy'n gwaethygu yn dibynnu ar y cwestiwn a oes arnoch chi angen tŷ arnynt ynteu a fyddech yn elwa'n bersonol petai'r cynnydd yn parhau. Fel Llywodraeth, mae gennym ddiddordeb, wrth gwrs, mewn angen. Mae'r arwyddion i gyd yn dangos ein bod wedi mynd heibio'r pwynt uchaf yng nghylch presennol y farchnad tai, a bod prisiau'n dechrau sefydlogi, ac mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru maent yn dechrau disgyn. Mae hyn yn newyddion da i'r rheini sydd wedi bod yn cynilo ar gyfer eu cartref cyntaf ond yn teimlo rhwystredigaeth wrth i brisiau godi. Nid wyf yn gwadu bod pwysau eithafol ar dai mewn rhai ardaloedd, ac yr wyf yn falch iawn bod tai'n un o flaenoriaethau'r Llywodraeth erbyn hyn.

Mae ail welliant y Llywodraeth, gwelliant 2, yn gwahodd y Cynulliad i gymeradwyo'r camau a gymerwyd gan y Llywodraeth a'r ymrwymadau a roddwyd yn 'Cymru'n Un' gyda golwg ar dai fforddiadwy. Mae'n werth tynnu sylw at rai o'r ymrwymadau hynny. Mae 'Cymru'n Un' yn ein rhwymo i darged o sicrhau bod 6,500 yn rhagor o dai newydd fforddiadwy'n cael eu darparu dros bedair blynedd. Bydd rhai'n dweud bod arnom angen mwy, a bydd eraill yn dweud bod y targed yn un uchelgeisiol. Fodd bynnag, dyna'r targed yr ydym wedi'i osod, ac yr ydym yn cydnabod ei bod yn rhaid inni wireddu'r ymrwymiad hwnnw.

Er gwaetha'r setliad cyllideb tynn iawn, yr wyf yn falch inni allu sicrhau £30 miliwn yn ychwanegol er mwyn darparu tai fforddiadwy yn ystod y tair blynedd nesaf. Bydd y rhan fwyaf o'r arian ychwanegol hwn yn mynd i'r sectorau annibynnol a gwirfoddol, drwy gymdeithasau tai, a fydd yn defnyddio'r rhaglen grantiau tai cymdeithasol. Bydd y gweddill yn cael ei neilltuo ar gyfer rhaglen beilot i gynnig grantiau i bobl sy'n prynu am y tro cyntaf. Mae hynny, wrth gwrs, yn cael ei watwar gan y Torïaid y prynhawn yma. Fodd bynnag, Nerys, yr ydych yn llygad eich lle wrth ddweud eu bod wedi cymeradwyo hynny yn 'Cytundeb Cymru Gyfan', ac yr wyf yn amau erbyn hyn a oeddent o ddifrif mewn gwirionedd am y cytundeb hwnnw. Byddaf yn cyhoeddi manylion cyn hir am y rhaglen beilot ar gyfer grantiau i bobl sy'n

prynu am y tro cyntaf, a gallaf sicrhau'r Aelodau na fydd yn codi prisiau tai. Yr wyf yn addo hynny ichi.

I announced the budgetary provision for affordable housing at a major housing development less than a quarter of a mile from here. It demonstrates the use of planning powers to secure the delivery of affordable homes in a very attractive location. It is the product of a close partnership between the council, the developer and the housing association. I have seen other such examples elsewhere. So, Mark, a great deal can be done with planning, and independent research shows clearly that much more could be achieved by some local authorities in Wales. Angela, please do not look to me to defend national park planning policies, because you will be holding your breath for a very long time.

We want to see these planning powers being used in all parts of Wales, and we are doing everything we can to encourage authorities to make full use of the powers available to them. For example, we recently held a series of training seminars on the delivery of affordable housing through the planning system for planning and housing officers, developers and registered social landlords. Similar training was provided for local members.

3.00 p.m.

Assembly Members who come to the Chamber and call for more affordable housing should think very carefully about the impact that they are having when they jump on bandwagons and support campaigns that oppose affordable housing applications in their own constituencies—I could name names. I am not the Minister for planning, but I will ask Jane Davidson to address the problem regarding the revision of TAN 6 that you mentioned.

At the events for councillors, Jane Davidson and I announced a presumption in favour of new housing developments for those local authorities that do not have a five-year land supply identified for housing, provided that all other policy considerations are met. There

Cyhoeddais darpariaeth y gyllideb ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy mewn datblygiad tai sylweddol lai na chwarter milltir oddi yma. Mae'n dangos defnyddio pwerau cynllunio i ddarparu cartrefi fforddiadwy mewn lleoliad atyniadol iawn. Mae'n deillio o bartneriaeth agos rhwng y cyngor, y datblygwr a'r gymdeithas tai. Gwelais enghreifftiau eraill tebyg mewn ardaloedd eraill. Felly, Mark, gellir gwneud llawer iawn drwy gynllunio, ac mae gwaith ymchwil annibynnol yn dangos yn glir y gallai rhai awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru gyflawni llawer mwy. Angela, peidiwch â disgwyl imi amddiffyn polisiau cynllunio'r parciau cenedlaethol, oherwydd byddwch yn dal eich gwynt am amser hir iawn.

Yr ydym yn awyddus i weld y pwerau cynllunio hyn yn cael eu defnyddio ym mhob rhan o Gymru, ac yr ydym yn gwneud popeth posibl i annog awdurdodau i ddefnyddio'r pwerau sydd ar gael iddynt yn llawn. Er enghraifft, cynaliwyd cyfres o seminarau hyfforddi gennym yn ddiweddar ar ddarparu tai fforddiadwy drwy'r system gynllunio ar gyfer swyddogion cynllunio a thai, datblygwyr a landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig. Darparwyd hyfforddiant tebyg ar gyfer aelodau lleol.

Dylai Aelodau Cynulliad sy'n dod i'r Siambr ac yn galw am dai mwy fforddiadwy feddwl yn ofalus iawn am yr effaith a gânt pan fyddant yn dilyn y dyrfa ac yn cefnogi ymgyrchoedd sy'n gwrthwynebu ceisiadau am dai fforddiadwy yn eu hetholaethau eu hunain—gallwn eu henwi. Nid fi yw'r Gweinidog dros gynllunio, ond gofynnaf i Jane Davidson fynd i'r afael â'r broblem a grybwyllwyd gennych ynglŷn â diwygio TAN 6.

Yn y digwyddiadau ar gyfer cynghorwyr, cyhoeddodd Jane Davidson a minnau ragdybiaeth o blaid datblygiadau tai newydd ar gyfer yr awdurdodau lleol hynny nad oes ganddynt gyflenwad tir pum mlynedd wedi'i neilltuo ar gyfer tai, ar yr amod eu bod yn

is a situation whereby local authorities are refusing planning permissions, which will be allowed on appeal. This currently applies to nine of the 25 local planning authorities, and this is being taken into account by the Planning Inspectorate. We are confident that this will crystallise minds and increase the supply of land for housing. We will shortly be issuing guidance for authorities on the preparation of mandatory affordable housing delivery plans, to ensure that they introduce appropriate measures to fill the gap that exists before the first local development plans are adopted in 2011 and beyond. Obviously, you are all interested in the issue of affordable housing, and I hope that you will support us when we introduce those plans for the delivery of the right amount of housing where it is needed. I ask those of you with influence with your local authorities to use it so that we can have good affordable housing delivery plans.

We are also funding a series of training seminars for local authorities on the negotiation of 106 agreements. Obviously, some local authorities are very good at this, while others are not. We need to spread that good practice. We know that rural communities face particular problems, and I wish to thank Mick for mentioning the Community Land Trust and Land for People, which we are supporting, as you know. If you would like a full briefing on the homebuy scheme, Mick, I would be happy to provide that.

We have a protocol on the disposal of Assembly land, which is currently being strengthened and has been extended to include NHS land, which I am sure you will all welcome.

On Kirsty's amendments, you will know that we are doing some of these things already so there is no problem in accepting the amendments. We have a task and finish group on affordable housing, which is chaired by Sue Essex. I will be receiving her final report very soon, but, in the meantime, I will be undertaking a consultation on how best to implement the interim

cydymffurfio â phob ystyriaeth polisi arall. Mae yna sefyllfa lle bydd awdurdodau lleol yn gwrthod rhoi caniatâd cynllunio a'r cais yn cael ei ganiatáu wrth apelio. Mae hyn yn berthnasol ar hyn o bryd i naw o'r 25 awdurdod cynllunio lleol, ac mae'r Arolygiaeth Cynllunio yn rhoi sylw i hyn. Yr ydym yn hyderus y bydd hyn yn crisialu meddyliau ac yn cynyddu'r cyflenwad tir ar gyfer tai. Cyn hir byddwn yn cyhoeddi cyfarwyddyd i awdurdodau ar baratoi cynlluniau darparu tai fforddiadwy yn orfodol, i sicrhau eu bod yn cyflwyno camau priodol i lenwi'r bwlch sy'n bodoli cyn mabwysiadu'r cynlluniau datblygu lleol cyntaf yn 2011 ac wedyn. Mae'n amlwg fod gennych i gyd ddiddordeb ym mater tai fforddiadwy, a gobeithio y byddwch yn ein cefnogi pan gyflwynwn y cynlluniau hynny i ddarparu'r nifer iawn o dai lle mae eu hangen. Gofynnaf i'r rheiny ohonoch sydd â dylanwad ar eich awdurdodau lleol i'w ddefnyddio er mwyn inni gael cynlluniau da ar gyfer darparu tai fforddiadwy.

Yr ydym hefyd yn talu am gyfres o seminarau hyfforddi ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol ynglŷn â negodi cytundebau 106. Mae'n amlwg bod rhai awdurdodau lleol yn dda iawn am wneud hyn, ac eraill heb fod cystal. Mae angen inni ledaenu'r arferion da hynny. Gwyddom fod cymunedau gwledig yn wynebu problemau penodol, a dymunaf ddiolch i Mick am grybwyll yr Ymddiriedolaeth Tir Cymunedol a Thir ar gyfer Pobl, cynlluniau yr ydym yn eu cefnogi, fel y gwyddoch. Os hoffech gael gwybodaeth lawn am y cynllun cymorth prynu, Mick, byddwn yn falch o'i rhoi ichi.

Mae gennym brotocol ar gyfer cael gwared ar dir y Cynulliad,. Mae wrthi'n cael ei gryfhau ac mae wedi'i ymestyn i gynnwys tir y GIG. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch i gyd yn croesawu hynny.

O ran gwelliannau Kirsty, gwyddoch ein bod yn gwneud rhai o'r pethau hyn eisoes, felly, nid oes problem wrth dderbyn y gwelliannau. Mae gennym grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar dai fforddiadwy, dan gadeiryddiaeth Sue Essex. Byddaf yn cael ei hadroddiad terfynol yn fuan iawn, ond yn y cyfamser byddaf yn ymgynghori ynglŷn â sut orau mae rhoi ar waith yr argymhellion dros dro y mae wedi'u

recommendations that she has given to me, which I have already shared with the opposition spokespeople.

It is an exciting time to be involved in housing policy development and delivery in Wales. We can shape a new progressive agenda in this area. We will be supporting the motion as amended.

Mark Isherwood: I wish to thank Members for their contributions. Many constructive comments were made, but, regrettably, some were small-minded and dogmatic—I thank the Deputy Minister and specifically exclude her from the latter group.

Peter Black was right to ask what has changed since June 2007 and to express his mystification at the fact that the Assembly Government wants to remove the term ‘growing housing crisis’ from the motion. I think that it would garner greater respect if it sometimes acknowledged problems more and buried its head in the sand a little bit less. That might help to foster faith and confidence in politicians across the spectrum.

Angela Burns raised a particular concern about constituents asking for help for their sons, daughters, grandchildren and parents. Although this is not directly within the Deputy Minister for Housing’s brief, the issue of having planning refusals rather than adaptive ways of delivering housing with some form of restriction on resale must be addressed. Alun Ffred asked why the Tories did not introduce this when they were in power. I was working in the industry for two decades during that period, and we never had a crisis like this one.

Leanne Wood’s comments were very interesting. As a former employee of a building society, I helped hundreds of people to buy their council houses through right to buy. I also worked with Tai Cymru on delivering and developing shared-ownership schemes, and the low-cost home-ownership scheme, which was renamed the homebuy scheme when it was shrunk and re-introduced by Labour. I also sat on the board of a housing association for 12 years, delivering

rhoi imi. Yr wyf eisoes wedi rhoi’r wybodaeth hon i lefarwyr y gwrthbleidiau.

Mae’n adeg gyffrous i fod yn ymwneud â datblygu a gwireddu polisi tai yng Nghymru. Gallwn lunio agenda flaengar newydd yn y maes hwn. Byddwn yn cefnogi’r cynnig gyda’r gwelliannau.

Mark Isherwood: Dymunaf ddiolch i’r Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau. Cafwyd nifer o sylwadau adeiladol, ond yn anffodus yr oedd rhai’n gul ac yn ddogmatig—diolch i’r Ddirprwy Weinidog, ac yr wyf yn ei heithrio’n benodol o’r grŵp hwnnw.

Yr oedd Peter Black yn iawn i ofyn beth sydd wedi newid er mis Mehefin 2007, ac i synnu bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad am ddileu’r term ‘argyfwng sydd ar dwf’ o’r cynnig. Credaf y byddai’n ennyn mwy o barch petai weithiau’n fwy parod i gydnabod problemau ac yn cuddio’i phen yn y tywod fymryn yn llai. Efallai y byddai hynny’n gymorth i feithrin ffydd a hyder mewn gwleidyddion ar draws y sbectwm.

Mynegodd Angela Burns bryder penodol ynglŷn ag etholwyr sy’n gofyn am help ar gyfer eu meibion, eu merched, eu hwyrion a’u rhieni. Er nad yw hyn yn un o gyfrifoldebau uniongyrchol y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Dai, rhaid mynd i’r afael â’r broblem mai’r hyn sydd gennym yw trefn o wrthod caniatâd cynllunio yn hytrach na ffyrdd hyblyg o ddarparu tai gyda chyfyngiad o ryw fath ar ailwerthu. Gofynnodd Alun Ffred pam na chyflwynodd y Torïaid hyn pan oeddent mewn grym. Yr oeddwn yn gweithio yn y diwydiant am ddau ddegawd yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw, ac ni fu gennym erioed argyfwng fel hwn.

Yr oedd sylwadau Leanne Wood yn ddiddorol iawn. Fel cyn weithiwr i gymdeithas adeiladu, rhoddais gymorth i gannoedd o bobl i brynu eu tai cyngor drwy’r cynllun hawl i brynu. Bûm yn gweithio hefyd gyda Tai Cymru i ddarparu a datblygu cynlluniau rhanberchnogaeth, a’r cynllun perchentyaeth cost-isel, a ailenwyd yn gynllun cymorth prynu pan gafodd ei grebachu a’i ailgyflwyno gan Lafur. Bûm yn aelod o fwrdd cymdeithas tai hefyd am 12

affordable rental housing for people who could not otherwise afford to access the market. Therefore, I have some experience here, and I feel grossly insulted by her closed-minded comments—on my own behalf, and on behalf of the hundreds of people that I helped to buy houses, as well as the housing associations and mortgage lenders, both mutual and non-mutual.

Bethan Jenkins: I note your concern about affordable housing, and I therefore wondered if you would be supporting Plaid Cymru's call at Westminster, in an early day motion ahead of the budget debate, for the UK Government to scrap its policy to reduce capital gains tax on the sale of second homes. It has been brought to our attention that that might affect rural poverty and affordable housing in rural areas.

Mark Isherwood: Whereas I might personally be sympathetic to that, I am not a Member of Parliament and have no say on the issue.

Leanne said that she believes in social justice, but all we heard was an expression of belief in a closed-minded dogma that would commit people to unfit housing and homelessness in perpetuity. The reason that social housing provision was moved to housing associations 20 years ago was because, unlike cash-strapped councils, they could borrow more money, double the Government investment, and address the housing crisis. They went on to do so, and, as I said, they delivered four times as many new social dwellings in the last eight years of the Conservative Government than Labour's devolved administrations here did in the Assembly's first eight years. [*Interruption.*]

I am sorry, but I am short of time. She said that we are against the public sector; I am not, but I am for the social market, for the voluntary and mutual sectors, for the not-for-profit housing associations, and I am all for maximising investment in social and affordable housing by every means possible—through the public, private and voluntary sectors.

mlynedd, gan ddarparu tai fforddiadwy ar rent i bobl na allent fforddio ymuno â'r farchnad fel arall. Felly, mae gennyf rywfaint o brofiad yma, a chredaf mai sarhaus iawn yw ei sylwadau cul—ar fy rhan fy hun, ac ar ran y cannoedd o bobl y bûm yn eu cynorthwyo i brynu tai, yn ogystal â'r cymdeithasau tai a'r benthycwyr morgeisi, rhai cydfuddiannol a rhai anghydfuddiannol.

Bethan Jenkins: Sylwaf eich bod yn poeni am dai fforddiadwy, ac felly yr oeddwn yn meddwl tybed a fyddech yn cefnogi galwad Plaid Cymru yn San Steffan, mewn cynnig cynnar-yn-y-dydd cyn y ddadl am y gyllideb, ar Lywodraeth y DU i roi'r gorau i'w pholisi o ostwng y dreth enillion cyfalaf ar werthu ail gartrefi. Tynnwyd ein sylw at y ffaith y gallai hynny effeithio ar dlodi gwledig ac ar dai fforddiadwy mewn ardaloedd gwledig.

Mark Isherwood: Er y byddwn efallai'n cydymdeimlo â hynny'n bersonol, nid wyf yn Aelod Seneddol ac nid oes gennyf lais yn y mater.

Dywedodd Leanne ei bod yn credu mewn cyfiawnder cymdeithasol, ond y cyfan a glywsom ganddi oedd ei chred mewn dogma a fyddai'n dedfrydu pobl i fyw mewn tai anaddas neu fod yn ddigartref hyd byth. Y rheswm dros drosglwyddo'r ddarpariaeth tai cymdeithasol i gymdeithasau tai 20 mlynedd yn ôl oedd oherwydd eu bod, yn wahanol i gynghorau prin eu hadnoddau, yn gallu cael benthyc mwy o arian, dyblu buddsoddiad y Llywodraeth a mynd i'r afael â'r argyfwng tai. Aethant rhagddynt i wneud hynny, ac fel y dywedais, darparwyd pedair gwaith yn fwy o dai cymdeithasol newydd yn ystod wyth mlynedd diwethaf y Llywodraeth Geidwadol nag a wnaeth gweinyddiaethau datganoledig Llafur yma yn ystod wyth mlynedd cyntaf y Cynulliad. [*Torri ar draws.*]

Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ond mae fy amser yn brin. Dywedodd ein bod yn erbyn y sector cyhoeddus; nid wyf fi yn ei erbyn, ond yr wyf o blaid y farchnad gymdeithasol, o blaid y sector gwirfoddol a'r sector cydfuddiannol, o blaid y cymdeithasau tai nad ydynt yn gwneud elw, ac yr wyf yn llwyr o blaid sicrhau'r buddsoddiad mwyaf posibl mewn tai cymdeithasol a fforddiadwy ym mha fodd bynnag—drwy'r sectorau cyhoeddus, preifat

a gwirfoddol.

I will briefly move on to Alun Davies's points. He said that Conservatives do not often speak about social justice, but I spend my whole life talking about it, both inside and outside this place. You referred to 15 per cent interest rates—what about the interest rates at the end of the UK Labour Government in 1979? What about the economic and social meltdown that we were voted in to sort out? What about your support for the exchange rate mechanism that we were forced out of in 1992? That was not just the Conservatives—you backed it, and you backed the exchange rates, too.

With regard to the legislative competence Order, it is pitiful, and does nothing except devolve powers to suspend the right to buy. You know from the evidence, and from what the Minister told us last week, that this is not a wide-ranging device to access further powers to do what we need on affordable housing—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You are running out of time.

Mark Isherwood: The socialist parties tick their dogmatic boxes and try to deride the Tories when there are 80,000 people on waiting lists and homelessness has doubled—you do yourselves discredit.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You have run out of time. The proposal is to agree amendment 1. Does any Members object? I see that there is objection, so we will defer the votes until voting time.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisiau tan yr amser pleidleisio.
Votes deferred until voting time.*

Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives Debate

Gwastraff sy'n Mynd i Safleoedd Tirlenwi Waste that is Going to Landfill

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have amendments 2 and 3 in the name of Kirsty

Symudaf ymlaen yn gyflym at bwyntiau Alun Davies. Dywedodd nad yw Ceidwadwyr yn sôn yn aml am gyfiawnder cymdeithasol, ond yr wyf yn treulio fy mywyd i gyd yn sôn amdano, yn y lle hwn a'r tu allan iddo. Cyfeirich at gyfraddau llog o 15 y cant—beth am y cyfraddau llog ar ddiwedd Llywodraeth Lafur y DU yn 1979? Beth am y chwalfa economaidd a chymdeithasol y cawsom ein hethol i'w datrys? Beth am eich cefnogaeth i fecanwaith y gyfradd gyfnewid y cawsom ein gorfodi i'w gadael yn 1992? Nid y Ceidwadwyr yn unig oedd hynny—yr oeddech chithau'n ei gefnogi, ac yn cefnogi'r cyfraddau cyfnewid hefyd.

O ran y Gorchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol, mae'n druenus, ac nid yw'n gwneud dim ar wahân i ddatganoli pwerau i ohirio'r hawl i brynu. Gwyddoch yn sgil y dystiolaeth, ac yn sgil yr hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog wrthym yr wythnos diwethaf, nad dyfais eang ei chwmpas yw hon i gael gafael ar fwy o bwerau i wneud yr hyn y mae angen i ni ei wneud ar dai fforddiadwy—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae eich amser yn dirwyn i ben.

Mark Isherwood: Mae'r pleidiau sosialaidd yn ticio'u blychau dogmatig ac yn ceisio gwawdio'r Toriaid, er bod 80,000 o bobl ar y rhestrau aros a digartrefedd wedi dyblu—yr ydych wedi dwyn anfri arnoch eich hunain.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae eich amser ar ben. Y cynnig yw ein bod yn cytuno gwelliant 1. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf fod, felly, gohiriwn y pleidleisio tan yr amser pleidleisio.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have amendments 2 and 3 in the name of Kirsty

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 2 a 3 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

Williams. Amendment 1 in the name of Carwyn Jones has been withdrawn.

Darren Millar: I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. regrets the increase in waste that is going to landfill over the last nine years and calls upon the Welsh Assembly Government to:

a) engage with manufacturers, retailers and suppliers to reduce the amount of unnecessary packaging that would go to landfill;

b) instruct local authorities to have residual waste collections on a weekly basis;

c) instruct local authorities to improve their recycling programmes by increasing more kerb-side collections and recycling banks; and

d) consider introducing incentives for people to reduce the amount of their household waste that goes to landfill. (NDM3888)

I am grateful for the opportunity to bring forward this debate on waste and recycling, an issue that is increasingly causing concerns in communities across Wales, and one that the Welsh Conservatives continue to take very seriously.

At this early stage in the debate, I should clarify that, when I say waste and recycling, I am talking about that which is often referred to as refuse and rubbish—and that is not a reference to the efforts of Labour, Plaid or their policies.

We would all agree that this topic comes under the greater banner of caring for the environment, and is one of the challenges associated with addressing climate change and promoting more sustainable living. As a nation, the argument for sustainable communities is slowly being won, with more and more people acknowledging the need for us all to change our behaviour and take steps in the right direction. It is time for change at all levels, and the role of responsible Government is becoming more evident—

Tynnwyd gwelliant 1 yn enw Carwyn Jones yn ôl.

Darren Millar: Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. yn gresynu wrth y cynnydd mewn gwastraff sy'n mynd i safleoedd tirlenwi dros y naw mlynedd diwethaf ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i:

a) ymgysylltu â gweithgynhyrchwyr, adwerthwyr a chyflenwyr i leihau faint o ddeunyddiau pecynnu diangen a fyddai'n mynd i safleoedd tirlenwi;

b) cyfarwyddo awdurdodau lleol i gasglu gwastraff gweddilliol bob wythnos;

c) cyfarwyddo awdurdodau lleol i wella eu rhaglenni ailgylchu drwy gynyddu nifer y casgliadau ar ochr y ffordd a nifer y banciau ailgylchu; a

d) ystyried cyflwyno cymhellion i bobl leihau faint o'u gwastraff cartref sy'n mynd i safleoedd tirlenwi. (NDM3888)

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle i gyflwyno'r ddadl hon am wastraff ac ailgylchu, mater sy'n destun pryder cynyddol mewn cymunedau ledled Cymru, a rhywbeth y mae Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn dal i'w ystyried yn fater difrifol iawn.

Ar ddechrau'r ddadl fel hyn, dylwn egluro, pan soniaf am wastraff ac ailgylchu, mai sôn yr wyf am yr hyn a elwir yn aml yn ysbwriel a gwastraff—ac nid cyfeiriad at ymdrechion Llafur, Plaid na'u polisïau yw hynny.

Byddem i gyd yn cytuno bod y pwnc hwn yn dod o dan faner ehangach gofalu am yr amgylchedd, ac mae'n un o'r heriau sy'n gysylltiedig â mynd i'r afael a newid yn yr hinsawdd ac â hyrwyddo byw'n fwy cynaliadwy. Fel cenedl, mae'r ddadl o blaid cymunedau cynaliadwy'n cael ei hennill yn araf, gyda mwy a mwy o bobl yn cydnabod bod angen inni i gyd newid ein hymddygiad a chamu i'r cyfeiriad iawn. Mae'n bryd cael newid ar bob lefel, ac mae swyddogaeth Llywodraeth gyfrifol yn dod yn fwy

whether it is to provide leadership and inspiration, to give direction, or to recommend solutions, the responsibility at this particular level has never been more acute. That is why I am left scratching my head when, in this debate, for example, those in Government seem reluctant to paint the real picture about the current situation.

3.10 p.m.

Therefore we see that, in response to Westminster's aim to reduce reliance on landfill, and increase the degree to which value is reclaimed from household waste, this Labour-Plaid Government trumpets its statistic of 27.4 per cent as the amount of recycled municipal waste in Wales—do not get me wrong; it is commendable, and it is improving. However, the Government appears unable to acknowledge that, even though recycling has increased, so has the total amount of municipal waste going to landfill. It is up 15 per cent over the last nine years. The amount of waste going to landfill is on the increase when, actually, the trend should be in the other direction.

I recently had the opportunity to visit the Llanddulas landfill site in my constituency. It is the main landfill site for north Wales. I was impressed by the management of the site and by many of the high-tech aspects, such as generating energy onsite from the extracted natural gases. Of course, the site is not without its problems, which are those associated with many landfill sites, especially with regards to the occasional concerns of local residents. However, what really is worrying is that, even considering the sheer scale of the site—it is enormous—at its current rate of in-filling, its remaining capacity to take new waste will be used up in around just five years. When the time comes for Llanddulas to close, north Wales will, understandably, have some serious problems. I believe that I am right in saying that there are no alternative sites left in north Wales, and unless this issue is addressed—this may come as a shock to the Plaid half of this Government—there will be no alternative but to crack a hole in the slate curtain that you are trying to draw between us and England, and we will have to go into England to

amlwg—boed i ddarparu arweiniad ac ysbrydoliaeth, er mwyn dangos y cyfeiriad, ynteu'n argymhell atebion, nid yw'r cyfrifoldeb ar y lefel benodol hon erioed wedi bod mor bwysig. Dyna pam y byddaf yn crafu fy mhen, pan fydd y rheiny sydd yn y Llywodraeth, yn y ddadl hon, er enghraifft, i bob golwg yn gyndyn o ddarlunio'r sefyllfa bresennol fel y mae mewn gwirionedd.

Felly, gwelwn, wrth ymateb i nod San Steffan o leihau'r ddibyniaeth ar dirlenwi, ac adennill mwy o werth o wastraff cartrefi, mae'r Llywodraeth Lafur-Plaid hon yn canu ei chlodydd ei hun drwy sôn am yr ystadegyn 27.4 y cant, sef faint o wastraff trefol Cymru sy'n cael ei ailgylchu—peidiwch â'm camddeall; mae'n gymeradwy, ac mae'n gwella. Fodd bynnag, i bob golwg ni all y Llywodraeth gydnabod, er bod mwy'n cael ei ailgylchu, fod cyfanswm y gwastraff trefol sy'n mynd i safleoedd tirlenwi hefyd yn cynyddu. Mae wedi cynyddu 15 y cant dros y naw mlynedd diwethaf. Mae mwy a mwy o wastraff yn mynd i safleoedd tirlenwi yn hytrach llai, fel y dylai'r duedd fod.

Yn ddiweddar, cefais y cyfle i ymweld â safle tirlenwi Llanddulas yn fy etholaeth. Dyma brif safle tirlenwi'r gogledd. Gwnaeth y ffordd y rheolir y safle argraff arnaf, yn ogystal â llawer o'r agweddau uwch-dechnoleg, megis echdynnu nwyon naturiol i gynhyrchu ynni ar y safle. Wrth gwrs, mae problemau'n gysylltiedig â nifer o safleoedd tirlenwi ac nid yw'r safle hwn yn eithriad, yn enwedig o ran pryderon achlysurol gan drigolion lleol. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn sy'n wir yn poeni rhywun yw hyn: hyd yn oed ar ôl ystyried maint y safle—mae'n anferth—os bydd y tirlenwi'n parhau ar yr un gyfradd ag ar hyn o bryd, bydd y lle sydd ar ôl yno ar gyfer gwastraff newydd yn llawn ymhen oddeutu pum mlynedd. Pan ddaw'n adeg cau safle Llanddulas, bydd gan y gogledd broblemau difrifol, a hynny'n ddealladwy. Credaf fy mod yn iawn wrth ddweud nad oes safleoedd eraill ar ôl yn y gogledd, ac onid eir i'r afael â'r mater hwn—ac efallai y bydd hyn yn synnu hanner Plaid y Llywodraeth hon—ni fydd dewis arall ond tyllu drwy'r llen llechi yr ydych yn ceisio'i chodi rhyngom a Lloegr, a bydd yn rhaid inni fynd drwyddi i

dispose of our waste, God forbid. I am concerned at the cost implications for already-squeezed local authorities if waste disposal no longer remains a local issue.

The Welsh Conservatives believe that the Labour-Plaid Government should be better addressing our over-reliance on landfill and putting long-term measures in place to sort it out. This problem is not going to disappear unless action is taken.

The current situation runs along these lines: some 1.8 million tonnes of municipal waste was collected by local authorities in Wales during 2006-07, while we throw away about 350,000 tonnes of food each year. The average person in the UK throws away his or her own body weight in rubbish every seven weeks—looking around, I assume that some people throw away a great deal more waste than others.

Supermarkets give away the equivalent of nearly 290 plastic bags per person per year, the majority of which end up in landfill, where—as we heard from our debate earlier this term—they will take 500 years to decay. In other words, there is still a huge problem, and more needs to be done. For a start, the incentive needs to be there from Government, and more needs to be done to encourage local authorities to implement measures to encourage us all to lead more sustainable lives. By the way, I am not talking about the usual cynical measures that stem from the corner-cutting culture of this corner-cutting coalition. It is disappointing that eight local authorities in Wales felt it necessary to implement fortnightly residual waste collections and once-a-fortnight recycling collections. Rather than helping the situation, this policy is in most cases proving a greater drain on valuable resources given the added problem of having to deal with increased fly tipping. In my own constituency, only last week, I had yet another complaint about fly-tipping—I receive such complaints regularly—and the unauthorised use of other people's bins. Some people in my constituency are actually fighting to dispose of waste, using other people's bins inappropriately to hide their own waste as they cannot fit it into their own bins because

Loegr i waredu ein gwastraff, Duw a'n gwaredo. Yr wyf yn poeni am y goblygiadau o ran costau i'r awdurdodau lleol sydd eisoes dan bwysau oni fydd gwaredu gwastraff yn fater lleol bellach.

Cred Ceidwadwyr Cymru y dylai'r Llywodraeth Lafur-Plaid fod yn mynd i'r afael yn well â'n gorddibyniaeth ar dirlenwi, ac yn sefydlu camau tymor hir i'w datrys. Ni fydd y broblem hon yn diflannu oni wneir rhywbeth.

Dyma'r sefyllfa ar hyn o bryd: casglwyd oddeutu 1.8 miliwn o dunelli o wastraff trefol gan awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru yn ystod 2006-07, a thafwn oddeutu 350,000 tonnall o fwyd bob blwyddyn. Ar gyfartaledd yn y DU, bydd pob person yn taflu'r hyn sy'n cyfateb i'w bwysau ei hun o ysbwriel bob saith wythnos—ac wrth edrych o'm cwmpas, cymeraf fod rhai pobl yn taflu llawer iawn mwy o wastraff na phobl eraill.

Bydd yr archfarchnadoedd yn rhoi'r hyn sy'n cyfateb i bron 290 o fagiau plastig y pen bob blwyddyn i'w cwsmeriaid, a'r rhan fwyaf o'r rheiny'n diweddu'u hoes mewn safle tirlenwi. Yno—fel y clywsom yn ein dadl yn gynharach y tymor hwn—bydd angen 500 mlynedd arnynt i bydr. Mewn geiriau eraill, mae gennym broblem anferth o hyd, ac mae angen gwneud rhagor. I ddechrau, mae angen i'r Llywodraeth gynnig cymhelliant, ac mae angen gwneud mwy i annog awdurdodau lleol i roi camau ar waith i'n hannog i gyd i fyw bywydau mwy cynaliadwy. Gyda llaw, nid sôn yr wyf am y camau sinigaidd arferol sy'n deillio o'r diwylliant torri-corneli gan y glymblaid torri-corneli. Mae'n siomedig bod wyth awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru'n teimlo bod angen iddynt roi trefn ar waith i gasglu gwastraff gweddilliol bob pythefnos a chasglu deunydd ailgylchu unwaith bob pythefnos. Yn hytrach na helpu'r sefyllfa, mae'r polisi hwn ar y cyfan yn fwy o dreth ar adnoddau gwerthfawr am ei fod yn creu problem ychwanegol, sef tipio anghyfreithlon. Yn fy etholaeth fy hun, dim ond yr wythnos diwethaf cefais gŵyn eto fyth am dipio anghyfreithlon—byddaf yn cael cwynion o'r fath yn rheolaidd—ac am bobl yn defnyddio biniau pobl eraill heb ganiatâd. Mae rhai pobl yn fy etholaeth o ddifri'n ymladd i gael gwared ar eu gwastraff, gan

of the fortnightly collections.

Alun Ffred Jones: Do you not think that there is something inconsistent in how you complain about all the rubbish being thrown into landfill sites and then say the weekly collections that are responsible for landfill should be kept up? Do you not understand the relationship between the two things?

Darren Millar: There is nothing to suggest that collecting waste fortnightly will reduce the amount of waste that people produce. We are talking about the fact that waste is left in bins for a fortnight at a time, and that is leading to massive increases in vermin populations and overflowing bins that lead to litter on our streets, which then cause costs for local authorities and an increase in fly-tipping. It is clear that authorities are moving to fortnightly bin collections not to improve the recycling rate—it is a cost-cutting measure because you are underfunding local government. People are paying more in council tax and getting a worse service. It is not fair, and the issue must be addressed. Surely, by now, we should have realised that people prefer the carrot to the stick. They have seen through the untrustworthiness and the stealth tactics that you take to reduce bin collection services across Wales. That is why we will unashamedly campaign in the local elections to ensure that weekly residual waste collections are standard and required by local authorities throughout Wales.

However, that is not where we leave it. To coincide with that, local authorities should be genuinely encouraging people to recycle by creating more opportunities to recycle whether through kerbside collections of recyclables or the increased availability of recycling banks in our communities.

I note today's survey results that a problem that 25 per cent of the citizens of Wales have

ddefnyddio biniau pobl eraill mewn ffordd amhriodol er mwyn cuddio'u gwastraff eu hunain am nad oes lle iddo yn eu biniau eu hunain oherwydd mai bob pythefnos y cânt eu casglu.

Alun Ffred Jones: Oni chredwch eich bod yn anghyson braidd yn cwyno am daflu'r holl ysbwriel i safleoedd tirlenwi ac wedyn yn dweud y dylid cadw at y casgliadau wythnosol sy'n gyfrifol am y tirlenwi hwnnw? Onid ydych yn deall y berthynas rhwng y ddau beth?

Darren Millar: Nid oes dim i awgrymu y bydd casglu gwastraff bob pythefnos mewn gwirionedd yn lleihau faint o wastraff a gynhyrchir gan bobl. Sôn yr ydym am y ffaith fod gwastraff yn cael ei adael mewn biniau am bythefnos ar y tro a hynny'n arwain at gynnydd anferth mewn fermin ac at finiau gorlawn. Mae hynny'n arwain at ysbwriel ar ein strydoedd, sydd wedyn yn gostus i awdurdodau lleol, ac mae hefyd yn arwain at fwy o dipio anghyfreithlon. Mae'n amlwg nad er mwyn gwella'r gyfradd ailgylchu y mae awdurdodau'n troi at gasglu biniau bob pythefnos—camau i leihau costau ydyw oherwydd eich bod yn tangyllido llywodraeth leol. Mae pobl yn talu mwy o dreth gyngor ac yn cael gwaeth gwasanaeth. Nid yw'n deg, a rhaid mynd i'r afael â'r mater. Dylem fod wedi sylweddoli erbyn hyn, nid oes bosibl, ei bod yn well gan bobl y foronen na'r wialen. Maent wedi sylweddoli nad oes modd ymddiried yn y tactegau llechwraidd yr ydych yn eu defnyddio i leihau gwasanaethau casglu ysbwriel ledled Cymru. Dyna pam y byddwn yn ymgyrchu'n ddigywilydd yn yr etholiadau lleol i sicrhau bod y casgliadau gwastraff gweddilliol wythnosol yn safonol ac yn ofynnol gan awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru.

Fodd bynnag, ni fyddwn yn ei gadael yn y fan honno. I gyd-fynd â hynny dylai awdurdodau lleol fod yn annog pobl o ddifrif i ailgylchu drwy greu rhagor o gyfleoedd ailgylchu, boed drwy gasglu deunyddiau i'w hailgylchu o ymyl y palmant ynteu drwy gynyddu nifer y banciau ailgylchu yn ein cymunedau.

Sylwaf o ganlyniadau'r arolwg heddiw mai'r broblem sydd gan 25 y cant o ddinasyddion

with improving public service delivery is a lack of time or need, or difficulty, in accessing recycling facilities.

Nerys Evans: I will shortly propose a Measure on recycling that will place a duty on local authorities to undertake a social and environmental impact on where they send their recycling. Can I take it that the Tories will support that proposed Measure?

Darren Millar: We will support any Measure that will deliver extra recycling throughout Wales, but we do not support cutting people's bin services to a fortnightly collection basis.

We also believe that more should be done to engage with manufacturers, retailers and suppliers. It is perhaps not surprising that less than 10 per cent—

Irene James: Will you take an intervention?

Darren Millar: No, I will not; I have taken enough. Sit down.

It is perhaps not surprising that less than 10 per cent of our total waste output is household waste. More action should be taken to reflect where the bulk of the problem lies. I acknowledge that this needs to be done with care, because the last thing that we want is more Labour/Plaid red tape and bureaucracy, which will continue to make Wales uncompetitive. Businesses are already pretty much sick to death of it. Instead, we need to foster a greater sense of partnership. The Federation of Small Businesses has suggested several measures that, if nothing else, merit some thought and consideration. For example, it would like to see the provision of free kerbside paper waste recycling for businesses throughout Wales, business waste being incorporated into waste recycling targets for local authorities and a reduction in rates for SMEs that can demonstrate a commitment to environmental sustainability. Let me reiterate: I am not saying that these are our policies, but at least we are listening; you should try it sometime, Minister.

Cymru o ran gwella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yw diffyg amser neu angen, neu anhawster, i allu defnyddio cyfleusterau ailgylchu.

Nerys Evans: Cyn hir byddaf yn cynnig Mesur ar ailgylchu a fydd yn gosod dyletswydd ar awdurdodau lleol i asesu'r effaith gymdeithasol ac amgylcheddol ar ble maent yn anfon eu deunyddiau i'w hailgylchu. A allaf gymryd y bydd y Torïaid yn cefnogi'r Mesur arfaethedig hwnnw?

Darren Millar: Byddwn yn cefnogi unrhyw Fesur a fydd yn darparu adnoddau ailgylchu ychwanegol ledled Cymru, ond nid ydym yn cefnogi lleihau gwasanaethau ysbwriel pobl i gasgliadau bob pythefnos.

Credwn hefyd y dylid gwneud mwy i ymgysylltu â gweithgynhyrchwyr, manwerthwyr a chyflenwyr. Efallai nad yw'n syndod bod llai na 10 y cant—

Irene James: A gymerwch ymyriad?

Darren Millar: Na wnaif; yr wyf wedi cymryd digon. Eisteddwch i lawr.

Efallai nad yw'n syndod bod llai na 10 y cant o gyfanswm ein gwastraff yn wastraff cartrefi. Dylid cymryd mwy o gamau i adlewyrchu ble mae'r broblem ar ei gwaethaf. Cydnabyddaf fod angen i hyn gael ei wneud yn ofalus, oherwydd y peth olaf y mae arnom ei eisiau yw rhagor o fiwrocratiaeth gan Lafur/Plaid, a fydd yn dal i wneud Cymru'n anghystadleuol. Mae busnesau eisoes wedi cael llond bol arno. Yn hytrach, mae angen inni feithrin gwell ymdeimlad o bartneriaeth. Mae'r Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach wedi awgrymu amryw o fesurau sy'n haeddu rhywfaint o sylw ac ystyriaeth o leiaf. Er enghraifft, hoffai weld gwasanaeth ailgylchu papur gwastraff am ddim oddi ar ymyl y palmant yn cael ei ddarparu i fusnesau ledled Cymru, gwastraff busnesau yn cael ei ymgorffori mewn targedau ailgylchu gwastraff ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol, a gostyngiad mewn trethi i fusnesau bach a chanolig a all ddangos ymrwymiad i gynaliadwyedd amgylcheddol. Gadewch imi ailadrodd: nid wyf yn dweud mai dyma yw ein polisiau, ond o leiaf yr ydym yn gwrandio; dylech roi cynnig ar hynny rywbryd, Weinidog.

Recently, if you remember, it was us who tabled a debate on the need to reduce plastic carrier bag use. We addressed the issue in a constructive way, engaged with all parties concerned, including businesses, and the outcome was clearly positive. We believe that there is now unanimous support for some kind of carrier bag reduction scheme, and, as our amendment suggests, we need to find more innovative ways of reducing unnecessary packaging. I suppose that we could have approached the carrier bag issue in an old-fashioned, we-know-best, Labour/Plaid fashion—the Minister appears to have already made up her mind on the carrier bag issue, advocating a ban just last week. Now she simply wants to go through the motions of consultation. She told us a few weeks ago that she had not made up her mind and that she needed to keep her options open. However, we have had the courage in this party to grasp a difficult subject and discover what solutions are out there, by listening to all those involved.

The Labour/Plaid Government should make these issues its priorities, if the over-dependence on landfill is to end. It should be investing in new technology and new ideas. Going back to my recent visit to the landfill site, I was surprised that so much material that I recognised as being recyclable was simply being buried. In essence, it was valuable waste going to waste. Evidence suggests that the message still has some way to go. Unless that message is fully realised and unless action is properly taken, we will find ourselves five years down the road with no more landfill sites and without alternatives in place. We need to take the right action right now. Wales can lead on this; I urge Members to support our motion.

Mick Bates: I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 2: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

notes that the landfill tax may cause fines of up to £32 million in 2012/13 across local authorities in Wales.

Yn ddiweddar, os cofiwch, ni a gyflwynodd ddaol ar yr angen i ddefnyddio llai o fagiau plastig. Aethom i'r afael â'r mater yn adeiladol, drwy gysylltu â phawb dan sylw, gan gynnwys busnesau, ac yr oedd y canlyniad yn hollol gadarnhaol. Credwn fod cefnogaeth unfrydol bellach i ryw fath o gynllun lleihau bagiau plastig, ac fel yr awgryma ein gwelliant, mae angen inni gael ffyrdd arloesol i leihau deunydd pacio diangen. Mae'n debyg y gallem fod wedi mynd i'r afael â'r mater bagiau plastig yn yr arddull hen ffasiwn, ni-a-ŵyr-orau gan Lafur a Phlaid Cymru—ymddengys fod y Gweinidog eisoes wedi gwneud penderfyniad ar fagiau plastig, gan gefnogi gwaharddiad wythnos diwethaf. Yn awr mae am gymryd arni ei bod yn ymgynghori. Dywedodd wrthym rai wythnosau'n ôl nad oedd wedi gwneud penderfyniad a bod angen iddi gadw meddwl agored. Fodd bynnag, mae'r blaid hon wedi cael y dewrder i fynd i'r afael â phwnc anodd a gweld pa atebion sydd ar gael, drwy wrando ar bawb dan sylw.

Dylai'r Llywodraeth Lafur/Plaid sicrhau bod y materion hyn yn flaenoriaeth iddi, os yw am roi diwedd ar orddibyniaeth ar dirlenwi. Dylai fod yn buddsoddi mewn technoleg newydd a syniadau newydd. I fynd yn ôl at fy ymweliad yn ddiweddar â'r safle tirlenwi, synnais fod cymaint o'r deunydd yr oeddwn yn sylweddoli y gellid ei ailgylchu yn cael ei gladdu. Yr oedd fwy neu lai yn wastraff gwerthfawr yn cael ei wastraffu. Awgryma tystiolaeth fod llawer o waith i'w wneud o hyd i gyfleu'r neges. Oni chaiff y neges honno ei gwireddu ac oni chymerir camau priodol, yna ymhen pum mlynedd ni fydd gennym ddim rhagor o safleoedd tirlenwi ac ni fydd trefniadau amgen wedi eu gwneud. Mae angen inni gymryd y camau cywir yn awr. Gall Cymru arwain yn hyn; pwysaf ar yr Aelodau i gefnogi ein cynnig.

Mick Bates: Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn nodi y gall y dreth tirlenwi achosi dirwyon o hyd at £32 miliwn yn 2012/13 ar draws awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru.

Amendment 3: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

believes that local authorities must have funds available to develop their recycling infrastructure in order to meet their waste reduction obligations.

We are in danger in Wales of becoming dependent on landfill. In preparation for this debate, I looked up what we end up burying that is reusable, and mused on the time when we will be digging up our old landfill sites to reclaim some of the things that we bury.

To give you an indication of the scale of this issue and of why this debate is important—I thank the Welsh Conservatives for bringing it forward—there is a potential loss in Europe, on which these figures are based, of 2.4 million tonnes of ferrous metal. Given the commodity price of steel today, you will understand what a waste that is. We also bury 1.2 million tonnes of plastic, which is recyclable, and 0.65 million tonnes of copper. I can imagine the day when we dig this up, Minister.

3.20 p.m.

I have always said that we do not want to suffer similar losses in Wales, but 68 per cent of all our household rubbish is still going into landfill, so we must have the driver—the landfill directive. I hope that the Minister addresses the issue that Mark Williams, the Welsh Local Government Association waste adviser, brought to us. He suggested that the net result will be that the only way of funding the massive landfill tax burden will be either by services standing still or by their being cut. Having spoken to the WLGA again, I have found that it is not convinced that it can meet some of the targets that have been set, particularly in terms of the funding necessary to support the escalating landfill tax. It would be as well for the Minister to put on record exactly what the position is with the WLGA.

The gist of what we suggest in our second amendment is that we want to ensure that the stuff that we throw away that can be reused is

Gwelliant 3: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn credu bod yn rhaid i awdurdodau lleol fod ag arian ar gael er mwyn iddynt ddatblygu eu seilwaith ailgylchu i ddiwallu eu rhwymedigaethau lleihau gwastraff.

Yr ydym mewn perygl o fynd yn ddibynnol ar dirlenwi yng Nghymru. I baratoi ar gyfer y ddadl hon, edrychais ar yr hyn yr ydym yn ei gladdu ac y gellir ei aildddefnyddio, a myfyriais am yr amser pan fyddwn yn cloddio yn ein hen safleoedd tirlenwi i adfer rhai o'r pethau yr ydym yn eu claddu.

I roi syniad ichi o faint y broblem hon a pham mae'r ddadl hon yn bwysig—hoffwn ddiolch i Geidwadwyr Cymru am gyflwyno'r ddadl—mae yna golled bosibl yn Ewrop, ac ar honno y mae'r ffigurau hyn yn seiliedig, o 2.4 miliwn o dunelli o fetel fferrus. O gofio pris dur yn y farchnad nwyddau heddiw, byddwch yn deall cymaint o wastraff yw hynny. Yr ydym hefyd yn claddu 1.2 miliwn o dunelli o blastig y gellir ei ailgylchu, a 0.65 miliwn o dunelli o gopr. Gallaf weld y dydd pan fyddwn yn cloddio am y rhain, Weinidog.

Yr wyf wedi dweud o'r cychwyn nad oes arnom eisiau cael colledion tebyg yng Nghymru, ond mae 68 y cant o holl wastraff ein cartrefi yn parhau i gael ei dirlenwi, felly, rhaid inni gael sbardun—y gyfarwydddeb tirlenwi. Gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn mynd i'r afael â'r mater a gyflwynwyd inni gan Mark Williams, cynghorydd gwastraff Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru. Awgrymodd mai'r canlyniad yn y pen draw yw mai'r unig ffordd i gyllido baich treth tirlenwi enfawr fydd naill ai drwy i wasanaethau aros yn eu hunfan neu drwy eu cwtogi. Ar ôl siarad â CLILC eto, gwelais nad yw'n argyhoeddedig y gall gyrraedd rhai o'r targedau a bennwyd, yn arbennig o ran y cyllid angenrheidiol i gefnogi'r dreth tirlenwi sy'n cynyddu. Byddai'n beth da i'r Gweinidog ddweud yn union beth yw'r sefyllfa gyda CLILC.

Sylwedd yr hyn a awgrymwn yn ein hail welliant yw ein bod yn dymuno sicrhau y gellir aildddefnyddio'r pethau a daflwn ac y

reused. That needs extra investment to ensure that the sorting can take place and that the service is available throughout Wales. One of the Audit Commission's recommendations—I cannot remember the date of this, Minister; it was some years ago—stated that there is a lack of recycling and waste sites in Wales. The WLGA says that it does not have the money to put all these sites together. To what extent can we allow regional working in Wales so that there are cost-effective sites that can have recycling facilities? Cardiff County Council has, at last—after years of neglect—produced Wales's biggest recycling site. However, before people regret the previous administration in Cardiff, I congratulate your predecessor, Sue Essex, who hypothecated money to deal with waste issues. That is the way forward for most of this.

I was much taken by the remarks made by the Prime Minister the other day on Marks and Spencer's decision to charge 5p for plastic bags from May. He said that, if other stores do not follow suit, the Government will be ready to do what it can. That is almost a betrayal of the trust placed in us to ensure that we care for our environment. I have already indicated the waste of chucking things in the ground. The environmental impacts are bad enough and we know that plastic does not biodegrade for many years—possibly 500 years, as somebody mentioned. I would like to hear what the Minister has to say about the idea of implementing in Wales, through the waste LCO that is currently in progress, a tax on plastic bags, if not on all bags, at the point of sale, so that we can really see a reduction in the use of this material. One of the critical weaknesses in terms of the difference between the situation here and the situation on the continent is that, on the continent, there is producer responsibility, and producers have to pay towards the recycling. I know that it is a Welsh Liberal Democrat policy to promote this idea and that we do not have the powers for it, but it is important that there is producer responsibility; a tax on such things as plastic bags would help the people who sell them understand that they have responsibility when they are thrown away and litter our environment to such an extent.

cânt eu hailddefnyddio. Mae angen buddsoddiad ychwanegol ar gyfer hynny i sicrhau y gellir didoli'r nwyddau a sicrhau bod y gwasanaeth ar gael ledled Cymru. Dywedai un o argymhellion y Pwyllgor Archwilio—ni chofiaf y dyddiad, Weinidog; yr oedd rai blynyddoedd yn ôl—fod prinder safleoedd ailgylchu a safleoedd gwastraff yng Nghymru. Dywed CLILC nad oes ganddi arian i uno'r safleoedd hyn. I ba raddau y gallwn ganiatáu cydweithio rhanbarthol yng Nghymru er mwyn cael safleoedd cost-ffeithiol ar gyfer cyfleusterau ailgylchu? Mae Cyngor Sir Caerdydd, o'r diwedd—ar ôl blynyddoedd o esgeulustod—wedi cynhyrchu safle ailgylchu mwyaf Cymru. Fodd bynnag, cyn i bobl resynu wrth y weinyddiaeth flaenorol yng Nghaerdydd, llongyfarchaf eich rhagflaenydd, Sue Essex, a neilltuodd arian i ddelio â materion gwastraff. Dyna'r ffordd ymlaen ar gyfer y rhan fwyaf o hyn.

Synnais yn fawr at y sylwadau a wnaethpwyd gan y Prif Weinidog y diwrnod o'r blaen am benderfyniad Marks and Spencer i godi 5c am fagiau plastig o fis Mai ymlaen. Dywedodd, os na fydd siopau eraill yn gwneud yr un fath, y bydd y Llywodraeth yn barod i wneud yr hyn a all. Bron nad yw hynny'n bradychu'r ymddiriedaeth ynom i sicrhau ein bod yn gofalu am ein hamgylchedd. Yr wyf eisoes wedi dweud mor wastraffus yw claddu pethau yn y ddaear. Mae'r effeithiau amgylcheddol yn ddigon drwg, a gwyddom nad yw plastig yn boddiddio am flynyddoedd lawer—500 mlynedd o bosibl, fel y soniodd rhywun. Hoffwn glywed beth sydd gan y Gweinidog i'w ddweud am y syniad o godi treth ar fagiau plastig, os nad ar bob bag, wrth y man gwerthu yng Nghymru, drwy'r Gorchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol, er mwyn inni allu gweld defnyddio llai o'r deunydd hwn. Un o'r gwendidau mwyaf o ran y gwahaniaeth rhwng y sefyllfa yma a'r sefyllfa ar y Cyfandir yw bod cyfrifoldeb ar gynhyrchwyr ar y Cyfandir, a rhaid i gynhyrchwyr dalu tuag at ailgylchu. Gwn ei fod yn bolisi gan Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru i hyrwyddo'r syniad hwn ac nad oes gennym y pwerau i wneud hynny, ond mae'n bwysig bod cyfrifoldeb ar y cynhyrchwyr; byddai codi treth ar bethau fel bagiau plastig yn helpu'r bobl sy'n eu gwerthu i ddeall bod ganddynt gyfrifoldeb pan gânt eu taflu

ymaith gan greu cymaint o hagrwech yn ein hamgylchedd.

The whole issue needs to be incentivised and we need what I term a 'green smartcard'. We go through the education process of eco-schools but, all too often, once young adults leave school, they forget some of the great lessons that they have learned in their eco-school. I would like to see us incentivise the process by saying that people can get credits on a swipe card for taking things to be recycled, enabling them to use their local leisure centre, or that when they buy a healthy option at school, they get points that will enable them to travel on a bus or train. That is not beyond the skill of any Government. We should incentivise these processes and meet all the targets that are essential to ensure that we care for our environment.

Mark Isherwood: I will focus on the three regional waste strategy consultations that are due to be referred to the Petitions Committee, meeting in north Wales tomorrow. Sadly, I cannot attend, because I will be here.

Hyder Consulting (UK) Ltd, which is conducting this, has said that the next three to four years will be critical in determining whether Wales establishes the necessary infrastructure in time to meet UK, EU and Welsh-specific targets and to provide the necessary alternative to landfill. It also says that the Assembly Government firmly believes that the people of Wales should be involved in the process of developing these strategies and help to design future waste management services and infrastructure across Wales. To do this, it wants members of the public to get involved, ask questions and give their views on the current and future plans.

I have a letter from constituents stating that Hyder Consulting says that it cannot let them know their terms of reference for this survey or who signed it off, despite its website stating that it cares deeply about quality and understanding people's objectives and priorities. It also says that it is committed to

Mae angen cynnig cymhellion, ac mae angen yr hyn yr wyf fi yn ei alw'n 'gerdyn call gwyrdd' arnom. Yr ydym yn mynd drwy broses addysg eco-ysgolion, ond yn rhy aml, pan fydd oedolion ifanc yn gadael yr ysgol, maent yn anghofio rhai o'r gwersi mawr y maent wedi eu dysgu yn eu heco-ysgolion. Hoffwn weld cymhellion yn gysylltiedig â'r broses drwy ddweud wrth bobl y gallant gael credydau ar gerdyn call am fynd â phethau i gael eu hailgychu. Bydd hynny'n eu galluogi i ddefnyddio'u canolfan hamdden leol, neu gael pwyntiau pan fyddant yn prynu bwyd iach yn yr ysgol i'w galluogi i deithio ar fws neu drên. Nid yw hyn y tu hwnt i fedr unrhyw Lywodraeth. Dylem sicrhau bod cymhellion yn gysylltiedig â'r prosesau hyn a chyrraedd pob targed sy'n hanfodol i sicrhau ein bod yn gofalu am ein hamgylchedd.

Mark Isherwood: Canolbwyntiaf ar dri ymgynghoriad rhanbarthol ar strategaethau gwastraff sydd ar fin cael eu cyfeirio i'r Pwyllgor Deisebau a fydd yn cyfarfod yn y gogledd yfory. Yn anffodus, ni allaf fod yn bresennol, gan y byddaf yma.

Mae Hyder Consulting (UK) Cyf, sy'n trefnu'r ymgynghoriadau hyn, wedi dweud y bydd y tair neu bedair blynedd nesaf yn hollbwysig o ran penderfynu a fydd Cymru yn sefydlu'r strwythur angenrheidiol mewn pryd i gyrraedd targedau'r DU, yr UE a thargedau penodol Cymru ac i ddarparu dewis yn lle tirlenwi. Dywed hefyd fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn credu'n gryf y dylid cynnwys pobl Cymru yn y broses o ddatblygu'r strategaethau hyn a helpu cynllunio gwasanaethau a seilwaith rheoli gwastraff yn y dyfodol ledled Cymru. Er mwyn gwneud hyn, mae arno eisiau i'r cyhoedd gymryd rhan, gofyn cwestiynau a rhoi eu barn am y cynlluniau presennol a chynlluniau'r dyfodol.

Mae gennyf lythyr gan etholwyr sy'n dweud bod Hyder Consulting yn dweud na all ddatgelu ei gylch gorchwyl ar gyfer yr arolwg hwn na phwy a'i cymeradwyodd, er bod ei wefan yn dweud ei fod yn rhoi pwys mawr ar ansawdd a deall amcanion a blaenoriaethau pobl. Dywed hefyd ei fod

providing a quality service through working in partnership, with clear lines of communication and responsibility, and that all it had to base its comments on was the statement in the introduction to the survey that it is very important that every person in Wales had a say.

This group of constituents said that they originally encountered the survey on the internet, but found that the printed survey differed from the online survey, and that there was no reference to any document in most of the survey questions or in the introduction.

A little while ago, I put a question to the Minister in the Chamber, saying that residents in Flintshire:

‘feel that the application is being steamrolled to the detriment of the health of thousands of customers and staff. I have received a similar letter from a constituent who attended a consultation on the north Wales regional waste plan, and who is concerned that public awareness has been minimal. I have received a letter from campaigners in Wrexham similarly calling for the consultation process to be extended and its scope widened to include consideration of the need for waste to be reduced at source. Finally, I have received correspondence from Caerphilly, which is not in my region, stating that the so-called consultation exercise conducted by Hyder is nothing more than a public relations exercise to take the public’s eyes off the real villain of the piece: the new regional waste plan. They are also calling for the consultation period to be extended’.

Jane Davidson responded:

‘The regional waste plans are a voluntary process...involving the local authorities in each region. They are looking at issues around types of waste and types of location’.

However, I found out from the officer responsible for co-ordinating this in the lead authority in north Wales that:

‘The approach taken for the consultation was

wedi ymrwymo i ddarparu gwasanaeth o safon drwy weithio mewn partneriaeth, gyda sianelau cyfathrebu a chyfrifoldebau clir, ac mai'r cyfan a oedd ganddo i seilio'i sylwadau arno oedd y datganiad yn y cyflwyniad i'r arolwg. Mae hwnnw'n dweud ei bod yn bwysig iawn i bawb yng Nghymru gael dweud eu barn.

Dywedodd y grŵp hwn o etholwyr iddynt ddod o hyd i'r arolwg yn wreiddiol ar y rhyngwryd, ond bod yr arolwg a argraffwyd yn wahanol i'r arolwg ar-lein, ac nad oedd cyfeiriad at yr un ddogfen yn y rhan fwyaf o'r cwestiynau yn yr arolwg nac yn y cyflwyniad.

Ychydig amser yn ôl, gofynnais gwestiwn i'r Gweinidog yn y Siambr, gan ddweud bod trigolion sir y Fflint yn teimlo:

‘fod y cais yn cael ei wthio drwodd yn ddirugaredd ar draul iechyd miloedd o gwsmeriaid a staff. Yr wyf wedi cael llythyr tebyg gan etholwr a fynychodd ymgynghoriad ar gynllun gwastraff rhanbarthol y gogledd, ac sy'n poeni bod ymwybyddiaeth y cyhoedd yn isel. Yr wyf wedi cael llythyr gan ymgyrchwyr yn Wrecsam sydd hefyd yn galw am ymestyn y broses ymgynghori a lledaenu ei sgôp er mwyn rhoi sylw i ystyried yr angen i leihau gwastraff yn y man lle'i cynhyrchir. I gloi, yr wyf wedi cael gohebiaeth o Gaerffili, sydd y tu allan i'm rhanbarth, yn datgan bod yr ymarfer ymgynghori honedig gan Hyder yn ddim mwy nag ymarfer cysylltiadau cyhoeddus i dynnu sylw'r cyhoedd oddi wrth y gwir ddihiryn: y cynllun gwastraff rhanbarthol newydd. Maent hefyd yn gofyn am gael ymestyn y cyfnod ymgynghori’.

Ymatebodd Jane Davidson drwy ddweud:

‘Proses wirfoddol yw'r cynlluniau gwastraff rhanbarthol...sy'n cynnwys yr awdurdodau lleol ym mhob rhanbarth. Maent yn edrych ar faterion yn ymwneud â mathau o wastraff a mathau o leoliad’.

Fodd bynnag, darganfûm drwy siarad â'r swyddog sy'n gyfrifol am gydgylltu hyn yn yr awdurdod arweiniol yn y gogledd:

Cytunwyd ar y dull ar gyfer yr ymgynghoriad

agreed by the Regional Waste Group, initially following receipt of a consultation strategy’.

Presumably, this was from the Minister, and it broadly set out the approach to be taken. Furthermore, I am told that:

‘The consultation strategy was developed by the three coordinating authorities and agreed (by the three coordinating authorities) before circulation to our groups. WAG’s role, in terms of the consultation strategy was to agree the strategy along with the rest of the Regional Waste Groups’.

I am also told that:

‘Following the appointment of Hyder, and an inception meeting which was attended by the three coordinating authorities, WAG and the WLGA, the approach was made more detailed’.

Campaigners from throughout Wales have referred me to the European Convention on Access to Information, Public Participation in Decision-Making and Access to Justice in Environmental Matters and article 6, which relates to public participation in decisions on specific activities under section 5, which specifically refers to waste management. The convention refers to:

‘Installations for the incineration, recovery, chemical treatment or landfill of hazardous waste’

and to

‘Landfills receiving more than 10 tons per day or with a total capacity exceeding 25,000 tons’,

and so on. This clearly falls within this European legislation.

I have also received correspondence from campaigners referring to an admission in

gan y Grŵp Gwastraff Rhanbarthol, i ddechrau ar ôl cael strategaeth ymgynghori.

Tybiaf mai oddi wrth y Gweinidog y daeth hynny, ac yr oedd yn gosod allan yn fras y dull y dylid ei gymryd. Yn ogystal, dywedir wrthyf:

Datblygwyd y strategaeth ymgynghori gan y tri awdurdod a oedd yn cydgysylltu’r broses, a chytunwyd arni (gan y tri awdurdod hwn) cyn ei dosbarthu i’n grwpiau. Rôl Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, o ran y strategaeth ymgynghori, oedd cytuno’r strategaeth ynghyd â gweddill y Grwpiau Gwastraff Rhanbarthol.

Dywedir wrthyf hefyd:

Ar ôl penodi Hyder, a chael cyfarfod cychwynnol lle yr oedd y tri awdurdod a oedd yn cydgysylltu’r broses, sef Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a CLILC yn bresennol, gwnaethpwyd y dull yn fanylach.

Mae ymgyrchwyr o bob cwr o Gymru wedi fy nghyfeirio at y Confensiwn Ewropeaidd ar Fynediad at Wybodaeth, Cyfranogiad y Cyhoedd mewn Prosesau Gwneud Penderfyniadau a Mynediad at Gyfiawnder mewn Materion Amgylcheddol. Cyfeiriwyd hefyd at erthygl 6, sy’n ymwneud â chyfranogiad y cyhoedd mewn penderfyniadau ar weithgareddau penodol o dan adran 5. Mae honno’n cyfeirio’n benodol at reoli gwastraff. Mae’r confensiwn yn cyfeirio at:

Gosodiadau ar gyfer llosgi, adfer, triniaeth gemegol neu dirlenwi gwastraff peryglus

ac at

Safleoedd tirlenwi sy’n derbyn mwy na 10 tonnall y dydd ac yn gallu ymdrin â chyfanswm o fwy na 25,000 tonnall o wastraff

ac ati. Mae hyn yn amlwg yn dod o dan y ddeddfwriaeth Ewropeaidd hon.

Yr wyf hefyd wedi cael gohebiaeth gan ymgyrchwyr yn cyfeirio at gyfaddefiad yn eu

their region that the regional waste groups were opposed to public consultation. A letter written by Harry Andrews, the leader of Caerphilly council, states that the public focus group meetings held in Cardiff were not advertised, because they were intended to be 'by invitation only' meetings for organisations across the whole region that represent the public, rather than 'open meetings' for individual members of the public.

I find that telling, and it helps to explain what has happened across Wales. I was tipped off by a journalist—I would not have known otherwise, and I am sure that I should have done as an Assembly Member—that the north Wales strategic directors had, in February, requested an extension to the consultation to the end of February. How is that an open and transparent consultation?

Lesley Griffiths: I congratulate Jane Davidson on sending such a strong message to retailers, which brought about last week's announcement from Marks and Spencer. The announcement that it is to charge food shoppers 5p per carrier bag in a bid to reduce the number of plastic bags in circulation and reduce a not inconsiderable source of landfill in Wales can rightly be considered real progress towards tackling the levels of waste produced by the retail sector. Congratulations should go to Marks and Spencer for that bold move, and I hope that other retailers and stores will follow its excellent example.

3.30 p.m.

The Government has delivered this through the voluntary code, and, despite all the brickbats thrown at it, this agreement with Marks and Spencer proves that the code has delivered on this important issue. A close eye needs to be kept on things to see what further action the Government can, or may need to, take to meet the ambitious reduction target, but this is a great start on addressing a serious environmental problem for all communities across Wales. It is now up to other retailers to pick up the gauntlet and act without delay.

rhanbarth fod y grwpiau gwastraff rhanbarthol wedi gwrthwynebu'r ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus. Mae llythyr a ysgrifennwyd gan Harry Andrews, arweinydd cyngor Caerffili, yn dweud na chafodd cyfarfodydd y grwpiau ffocws cyhoeddus a gynhaliwyd yng Nghaerdydd eu hysbysebu. Fe'u bwriadwyd i fod yn gyfarfodydd 'drwy wahoddiad yn unig' i sefydliadau ledled y rhanbarth sy'n cynrychioli'r cyhoedd, yn hytrach na 'chyfarfodydd agored' i aelodau unigol o'r cyhoedd.

Mae hynny'n dweud cyfrolau, ac mae'n helpu esbonio'r hyn sydd wedi digwydd ledled Cymru. Cefais wybod gan newyddiadurwr—ni fyddwn wedi cael gwybod fel arall, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y dylwn fod wedi cael gwybod fel Aelod o'r Cynulliad—fod cyfarwyddwyr strategol y gogledd, ym mis Chwefror, wedi gofyn am ymestyn yr ymgynghoriad tan ddiwedd Chwefror. Sut y gellir dweud bod hynny'n ymgynghoriad agored ac eglur?

Lesley Griffiths: Llongyfarchaf Jane Davidson ar anfon neges mor gryf at fanwerthwyr, a arweiniodd at y cyhoeddiad gan Marks and Spencer yr wythnos diwethaf. Mae'r cyhoeddiad y bydd yn codi 5c am bob bag plastig ar bobl sy'n siopa am fwyd mewn ymdrech i leihau nifer y bagiau plastig a ddosberthir, ac i leihau ffynhonnell nid ansylweddol o dirlenwi yng Nghymru, yn gynydd gwirioneddol at fynd i'r afael â'r lefelau gwastraff a gynhyrchir gan y sector manwerthu. Dylid llongyfarch Marks and Spencer am y cam dewr hwnnw, a gobeithio y bydd manwerthwyr a siopau eraill yn dilyn ei esiampl glodwiw.

Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi cyflawni hyn drwy'r cod gwirfoddol, ac er yr holl feirniadu a fu arno mae'r cytundeb hwn gyda Marks and Spencer yn profi bod y cod wedi cyflawni ar y mater pwysig hwn. Mae angen cadw llygad barcud ar bethau i weld pa gamau pellach y gall y Llywodraeth eu cymryd, neu y gall fod angen iddi eu cymryd, i gyrraedd y targed lleihau uchelgeisiol. Ond mae hwn yn ddechrau gwyach o ran mynd i'r afael â phroblem amgylcheddol ddifrifol i bob cymuned ledled Cymru. Mater i'r

This agreement is also good news as, importantly, it does not cut across local schemes of abandoning plastic bags for more sustainable solutions; indeed, it will actually give those towns and villages great encouragement to press ahead with their schemes.

I now turn to the work of Waste Awareness Wales and its campaigns to educate people of all ages across Wales to remember the three Rs—reduce, reuse and recycle—to make a real difference to the environment. The Welsh Assembly Government has funded Waste Awareness Wales since 2002 to provide that kind of information to the public via its website and other advertising methods, to educate about managing materials and resources more sustainably, and very importantly, to reduce waste. Waste Awareness Wales is doing important work on raising awareness across the country about the three Rs, but probably the most important aspect of its work is educating consumers all over Wales that they have immense power in their hands: consumer power.

Consumers can demand that shops and supermarket chains, indeed, all retailers, take active steps to reduce the amount of packaging used when selling products, goods and services. Ultimately, that is the powerful and important message that we all need to spread. We can then exercise tremendous influence with retailers, and then manufacturers, and show that Wales is serious about the environment and about reducing the levels of waste generated and produced by the retail sector. The Government's continued investment in organisations such as Waste Awareness Wales is now beginning to have an effect on the consumer psyche in Wales, and long may it continue, because the results will mean considerably less dependence on landfill and less damage to the environment by not producing packaging and wrapping in the first place.

Brynle Williams: How waste is dealt with is often a contentious issue, but it is a challenge that deserves attention if Wales is to change

manwerthwyr eraill yn awr yw derbyn yr her a gweithredu'n ddi-oed. Mae'r cytundeb hwn hefyd yn newyddion da, oherwydd nid yw, yn bwysig iawn, yn torri ar draws cynlluniau lleol i gefnu ar fapiau plastig o blaid atebion mwy cynaliadwy; yn wir, yn y bôn bydd yn rhoi mwy o anogaeth i'r trefi a'r pentrefi hynny yrru ymlaen â'u cynlluniau.

Trof yn awr at waith Ymwybyddiaeth Gwastraff Cymru a'i ymgyrchoedd i addysgu pobl o bob oed ym mhob cwr o Gymru i gofio tri phen y bregeth—lleihau, aildefnyddio ac ailgylchu—er mwyn gwneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol i'r amgylchedd. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ariannu Ymwybyddiaeth Gwastraff Cymru er 2002 i ddarparu'r math hwnnw o wybodaeth i'r cyhoedd drwy ei wefan a dulliau hysbysebu eraill, i addysgu am reoli defnyddiau ac adnoddau'n fwy cynaliadwy, ac yn bwysig iawn, i leihau gwastraff. Mae Ymwybyddiaeth Gwastraff Cymru yn gwneud gwaith pwysig wrth gynyddu ymwybyddiaeth ledled y wlad o dri phen y bregeth, ond mae'n debyg mai'r agwedd bwysicaf ar ei waith yw addysgu defnyddwyr ledled y wlad bod ganddynt rym nerthol yn eu dwylo: grym defnyddwyr.

Gall defnyddwyr fynnu bod siopau a chadwyni archfarchnadoedd, yn wir, pob manwerthwr, yn cymryd camau gweithredol i leihau faint o becynnu a ddefnyddir wrth werthu cynhyrchion, nwyddau a gwasanaethau. Yn y pen draw, dyna'r neges rymus a phwysig y mae gofyn i bob un ohonom ei lledu. Gallwn wedyn gael dylanwad aruthrol dros fanwerthwyr, ac yna'r cynhyrchwyr, a dangos bod Cymru o ddifrif ynglŷn â'r amgylchedd ac am leihau lefelau'r gwastraff sy'n cael ei gynhyrchu a'i greu gan y sector manwerthu. Mae buddsoddiad parhaus y Llywodraeth mewn cyrff fel Ymwybyddiaeth Gwastraff Cymru yn awr yn dechrau dylanwadu ar seici'r defnyddiwr yng Nghymru. Hir y parhaed, oherwydd bydd y canlyniadau'n golygu dibyniaeth sylweddol lai ar dirlenwi a llai o niwed i'r amgylchedd drwy beidio â chynhyrchu defnyddiau pecynnu a lapio yn y lle cyntaf.

Brynle Williams: Mae sut y delir â gwastraff yn aml yn bwnc dadleuol, ond mae'n her sy'n haeddu sylw os yw Cymru i newid ei statws

its regrettable status as one of the worst recyclers in Europe. It is better to reduce amounts of waste by preventing its creation in the first place, as has been alluded to, than try to manage the ever-increasing amount that gets thrown out each year. That is particularly pertinent to food waste, some 327,000 tonnes of which gets thrown away every year in Wales. To put that into financial figures, it is worth around £430 million. That waste is absolutely needless, and releases vast amount of methane once landfilled, which contributes to climate change.

The first priority should be prevention, as all waste involves a huge missed opportunity to recover the energy that was used, and the greenhouse gases emitted, to make it. Wales could learn a lot from best practice in Europe, particularly Germany and Belgium, which send a fraction of what the UK does to landfill. Both those countries stopped seeing waste as a problem many years ago, and looked at it as a resource, both for recycling valuable materials, and to get energy from waste. A few years ago, my colleague, Mick Bates, and I had the opportunity to visit examples of these facilities in Belgium, some of which were sited in the middle of urban areas. That was possible because the Government had engaged all its citizens in a grown-up debate about waste and what to do with it. There was far less of the not-in-my-backyard sentiment that is so prevalent here.

That is an approach that the Assembly Government should take, because, no matter how much recycling and composting rates increase—and Wales has a long way to go—there will always be a substantial amount of residual waste. If landfill is to be ruled out as an option, Wales cannot afford to ignore the potential of energy from waste.

Alun Ffred Jones: Mae gennyf barch mawr at Darren Millar, a agorodd y drafodaeth, ond mae'n amlwg ei fod wedi penderfynu bod siarad yn gyflym ac yn uchel yn gwella ansawdd ei ddadleuon rywsut.

Yn union yn yr un drefn, mae'r cynnig hwn yn fy atgoffa o ffrind i mi a benderfynodd

anffodus fel un o'r ailgylchwyr gwaethaf yn Ewrop. Mae'n well lleihau maint y gwastraff drwy atal ei greu yn y lle cyntaf, fel y soniwyd, yn hytrach na thrwy geisio rheoli'r llwyth cyson-gynyddol a deflir bob blwyddyn. Mae hynny'n arbennig o berthnasol i wastraff bwyd: mae oddeutu 327,000 tonnell ohono'n cael ei daflu bob blwyddyn yng Nghymru. O droi hynny'n ffigurau ariannol, mae'n werth oddeutu £430 miliwn. Mae'r gwastraff hwnnw'n gwbl ddiangen ac yn rhyddhau lefel aruthrol o fethan o'i dirlenwi. Mae hwnnw, yn ei dro, yn cyfrannu at y newid yn yr hinsawdd.

Atal ddylai'r flaenoriaeth gyntaf fod, gan fod pob gwastraff yn golygu colli cyfle aruthrol i adfer yr ynni a ddefnyddiwyd, a'r nwyon tŷ gwydr a ryddhawyd, i'w gynhyrchu. Gallai Cymru ddysgu llawer o arferion gorau yn Ewrop, yn enwedig yr Almaen a gwlad Belg, sy'n tirlenwi ffracsiwn o'r hyn sy'n cael ei dirlenwi yn yr DG. Rhoddodd y ddwy wlad hynny'r gorau i ystyried gwastraff yn broblem flynyddoedd lawer yn ôl, gan ei ystyried yn adnodd, ar gyfer ailgylchu defnyddiau gwerthfawr ac ar gyfer cael ynni o wastraff. Rai blynyddoedd yn ôl cafodd fy nghyd-Aelod, Mick Bates, a minnau gyfle i ymweld ag enghreifftiau o'r cyfleusterau hyn yng ngwlad Belg, rai ohonynt yng nghanol ardaloedd trefol. Yr oedd hynny'n bosibl oherwydd bod y Llywodraeth wedi cynnwys ei holl ddinasyddion mewn trafodaeth aeddfed am wastraff a beth i'w wneud ag ef. Yr oedd llawer llai o'r agwedd nid-yn-fy-libart-i sydd mor amlwg yma.

Dyna'r agwedd y dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ei harddel, oherwydd, waeth faint y bydd cyfraddau ailgylchu a chompostio'n cynyddu—ac mae gan Gymru ffordd bell i fynd—bydd yna bob amser lwyth sylweddol o wastraff gweddilliol. Os yw tirlenwi i gael ei ddiystyru fel dewis, ni all Cymru fforddio anwybyddu potensial ynni o wastraff.

Alun Ffred Jones: I have great respect for Darren Millar, who opened the debate, but he has obviously decided that speaking quickly and loudly will somehow improve the quality of his debate.

In exactly the same order, this motion reminds me of a friend of mine who decided

sefyll mewn etholiad lleol ar gyfer cyngor tref yn enw plaid arbennig. Nid oedd yn gwybod unrhyw beth am ei maniffesto, na dim yr oedd y blaid yn ei gredu, felly ei dacteg oedd addo popeth i bawb. beth bynnag yr oedd rhywun yn ei ofyn iddo, byddai'n cytuno â hwy. Yn anffodus, ni enillodd yr etholiad—peth lwcus iddo ef.

Dyna mae'r cynnig hwn yn ei wneud: addo popeth i bawb. Mae'r Ceidwadwyr yn gresynu at y cynnydd ym maint y gwastraff sy'n mynd i safleoedd tirlenwi, ac yna, yn ail ran y cynnig, maent yn ceisio cynnal trefn sy'n gyfrifol am y cynnydd hwnnw, drwy gasglu ysbwriel yn wythnosol. Mae rhai cyngorau sydd o dan ofal y Torïaid eisoes wedi symud i system o gasglu bob pythefnos.

Darren Millar *a gododd*—

Alun Ffred Jones: Gad imi orffen.

Mae dau bwynt yn codi gyda chasglu bob pythefnos. Y cyntaf yw'r mater ariannol. Mae casglu ac ailgylchu yn ddrutach na thafllu pethau i mewn i dwll yn y ddaear. Mae honno'n ffaith syml, felly, rhaid buddsoddi mwy o arian. Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi rhoi mwy o arian ar gyfer hynny, ond ni allwch wneud hynny a chynnal y drefn fel ag y mae.

Yr ail bwynt wrth symud at gasglu bob pythefnos—a dyna sy'n digwydd lle yr wyf i'n byw—yw eich bod yn cael eich gorfodi i newid eich ffordd o feddwl am ddelio â gwastraff yn y cartref. Fodd bynnag, ateb y Torïaid yw gwario mwy ar bopeth, ac yr ydym wedi cael addewidion di-rif ganddynt: byddent yn gwario mwy ar addysg, yn rhoi iawndal o ran clwy'r traed a'r genau, yn helpu gyda'r dreth gyngor, yn rhoi rhagor i lywodraeth leol, y loteri, ac ati. Mae eu rhesymeg ariannol wedi mynd drwy'r to, a nid oes unrhyw ots ganddynt—dim ond eu bod yn addo popeth i bawb. Ni fydd hynny'n gweithio, mae arnaf ofn.

Os ydym o ddifrif o ran ailgylchu—ac mae pawb, ar draws y pleidiau, yn deall rhesymeg a synnwyr cyffredin hynny—rhaid i ni newid ein harferion. Golyga hynny newid yn y patrymau casglu ysbwriel yn un peth, ac ni allwn ddweud ein bod am ddal ati o dan yr

to stand in the local town council election in the name of a particular party. He knew nothing about the party's manifesto or what the party stood for, therefore, his tactics were to promise everything to everyone. No matter what he was asked by anyone, he would agree with them. Unfortunately, we won that election—luckily for him.

That is what this motion does: it promises everything to everyone. The Conservatives regret the increase in the amount of waste going to landfill sites, and yet, in the second part of the motion, they try to maintain a system which is responsible for that increase, by collecting refuse once a week. Some Tory-led councils have already moved to a system of fortnightly collections.

Darren Millar *rose*—

Alun Ffred Jones: Let me finish.

The fortnightly collection raises two points, the first of which is the issue of finance. Collecting and recycling is more expensive than throwing things into a hole in the ground. That is a simple fact; therefore, more money must be invested. The Government has allocated more funding to this, but you cannot do so and then sustain the present system.

Secondly, as we move to a system of fortnightly collection—which is what happens where I live—you have to change your way of thinking in terms of dealing with household waste. However, the Tory response is to spend more on everything, and we have seen countless promises that they will spend more on education, give more compensation for foot and mouth disease, assist with council tax, give more to local government, the lottery, and so forth. Their financial reasoning has gone through the roof, and they just do not care—they just promise everything to everyone. I am afraid that will not work.

If we are serious about recycling—and everyone, across the parties, understands the reasoning and common sense of that—we have to change our habits. That means changing the patterns of waste collection, and we cannot say that we will just continue with

hen drefn, gan ddisgwyl i bobl newid ar yr un pryd.

Alun Cairns: The management of waste is a huge issue, and the landfill tax has focused the attention of accountants as well as environmentalists. We all have a large part to play in reducing packaging, reusing materials, and recycling more, but those are just some of the issues that we need to focus on. That is where policy should be driven. My comments will focus on waste in relation to businesses, specifically small and medium-sized enterprises.

When researching and preparing for this debate, I was surprised to learn out that small businesses and small retailers have to pay for their waste to be recycled. We are trying to drive the agenda away from landfill and towards recycling, so what consideration has the Minister given to that? Kerb-side recycling for businesses would be a positive policy to encourage recycling in some areas, where practical. Huge numbers of directives have been aimed at business in general, but they affect small businesses more than larger organisations, which have the management capacity to handle and deliver them. The directives have had a huge impact on the cost to small businesses of handling waste.

I was also interested to learn that business waste is not currently included in the recycling targets of local authorities. What consideration has the Minister given to focus the attention of local authorities on those targets?

3.40 p.m.

Given the number of directives issued by the European Commission over recent times, such as the battery directive and many others, the Federation of Small Businesses has called for a toolkit to help businesses to manage waste.

My final point relates to the provision of hazardous waste, as there are no waste sites in Wales capable of handling hazardous waste. What plans does the Minister have in that regard, as it is hardly environmentally

the old system but expect people to change at the same time.

Alun Cairns: Mae rheoli gwastraff yn fater anferth, ac mae'r dreth tirlenwi wedi hoelio sylw cyfrifwyr yn ogystal ag amgylcheddwyr. Mae gan bob un ohonom ran fawr i'w chwarae i leihau pecynnu, ailddefnyddio defnyddiau ac ailgylchu mwy. Ond rhai yn unig o'r materion y mae gofyn inni ganolbwyntio arnynt yw'r rheiny. Dyna ble dylid cyfeirio polisi. Bydd fy sylwadau'n canolbwyntio ar wastraff yng nghyswllt busnesau, busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yn benodol.

Wrth ymchwilio a pharatoi ar gyfer y ddadl hon, synnais o ddeall bod busnesau bach a manwerthwyr bach yn gorfod talu am ailgylchu eu gwastraff. Yr ydym yn ceisio llywio'r agenda oddi wrth dirlenwi ac at ailgylchu, felly, pa ystyriaeth y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i rhoi i hynny? Byddai ailgylchu ar ymyl y palmant ar gyfer busnesau yn bolisi cadarnhaol i annog ailgylchu mewn rhai ardaloedd, lle mae hynny'n ymarferol. Cyfeiriwyd nifer aruthrol o gyfarwyddebau at fusnes yn gyffredinol, ond cânt fwy o effaith ar fusnesau bach na mudiadau mwy, sydd â'r gallu rheoli i ddelio â hwy a'u cyflawni. Mae'r cyfarwyddebau wedi cael effaith aruthrol ar gost trin gwastraff i fusnesau bach.

Yr oedd yn ddiddorol deall hefyd nad yw gwastraff busnes wedi ei gynnwys ar hyn o bryd yn nhargedau ailgylchu awdurdodau lleol. Pa ystyriaeth y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i rhoi i hoelio sylw awdurdodau lleol ar y targedau hynny?

Yn wyneb nifer y cyfarwyddebau a ryddhawyd gan y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn ddiweddar, megis y gyfarwyddeb ar fatris a llawer mwy, mae'r Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach wedi galw am flwch offer i helpu busnesau i reoli gwastraff.

Mae fy mhwynt olaf yn ymwneud â darparu gwastraff peryglus, gan nad oes yr un safle gwastraff yng Nghymru sy'n gallu trin gwastraff peryglus. Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Gweinidog yn y cyswllt hwnnw, oherwydd

friendly to be transporting hazardous waste from one end of Wales to the midlands and the north of England, to the limited sites in the United Kingdom?

Jenny Randerson: Waste is a problem that affects every single one of us living in Wales. As the problem affects us all, so, too, do the consequences of it. Her Majesty's Revenue and Customs states that a landfill tax aims to encourage waste producers to produce less waste or to 'recover more value from waste'. That responsibility, of course, falls to local authorities.

The landfill tax for active waste has been increasing by £3 a tonne every year since 2004-05, and will increase to an additional £8 a tonne per year at least until 2010-11. In addition to that are the gate fees for landfill sites, which vary between £28 and £38 a tonne. Therefore, from April 2007, the cost to local authorities in Wales of disposing of a tonne of waste to landfill will be approximately £68 in taxes and fees. The Landfill Allowances Scheme (Wales) Regulations 2004 places more of a financial burden on local councils, with a £200 penalty per tonne imposed for any amount of biodegradable municipal waste above each authority's allowance in a scheme year. European Commission directives place a final burden on local communities for missing goals set for waste reductions in landfill. By 2013, the goal is to achieve a 50 per cent reduction in the amount of waste sent to landfill in 1995—that is, a 50 per cent reduction between 1995 and 2013—with resulting fines of up to £32 million. These penalties will all fall to local authorities. Furthermore, Wales will be charged for its contributions in causing the UK to miss its targets, which could amount to £0.5 million a day. It stands to reason that we cannot afford to pay all these penalties; neither our councils nor our citizens can afford to pay these penalties.

Local authorities need real leadership from the National Assembly for Wales on a matter as crucial as waste. Extra funding is desperately needed by local authorities to develop the correlating infrastructure that is required if they are to meet their waste

mae ymhell o fod yn ecogyfeillgar i gludo gwastraff peryglus o un pen o Gymru i ganolbarth a gogledd Lloegr, i'r ychydig safleoedd yn y Deyrnas Unedig.

Jenny Randerson: Mae gwastraff yn broblem sy'n effeithio ar bob un ohonom sy'n byw yng Nghymru. Gan fod y broblem yn effeithio arnom bob un, felly hefyd ei chanlyniadau. Mae Refeniw a Chyllid Ei Mawrhydi yn dweud mai nod treth tirlenwi yw annog cynhyrchwyr gwastraff i gynhyrchu llai o wastraff neu i 'adfer mwy o werth o wastraff'. Mae'r cyfrifoldeb hwnnw, wrth gwrs, yn disgyn ar awdurdodau lleol.

Mae'r dreth tirlenwi ar gyfer gwastraff gweithredol wedi bod yn cynyddu £3 y dunnell bob blwyddyn er 2004-05, a bydd yn cynyddu i £8 y dunnell yn ychwanegol bob blwyddyn tan o leiaf 2010-11. At hynny, mae yna ffioedd gât ar gyfer safleoedd tirlenwi, sy'n amrywio o £28 i £38 y dunnell. O'r herwydd, o Ebrill 2007 ymlaen bydd y gost i awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru o waredu tunnell o wastraff i safle tirlenwi oddeutu £68 mewn trethi a ffioedd. Mae Rheoliadau Cynllun Lwfansau Tirlenwi (Cymru) 2004 yn gosod mwy o faich ariannol ar gynghorau lleol, gyda chosb o £200 y dunnell am unrhyw wastraff bwrdeistrefol bioraddadwy y tu hwnt i lwfans pob awdurdod mewn blwyddyn cynllun. Mae cyfarwyddbau'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn gosod baich terfynol ar gymunedau lleol am fethu cyrraedd targedau a bennir ar gyfer lleihau gwastraff mewn safleoedd tirlenwi. Erbyn 2013, y nod yw sicrhau gostyngiad o 50 y cant yn y gwastraff a anfonid i'w dirlenwi yn 1995—hynny yw, gostyngiad o 50 y cant rhwng 1995 a 2013—gyda dirwyon canlyniadol hyd at £32 miliwn. Ymhellach, codir tâl ar Gymru am ei chyfraniad at achosi i'r DU fethu ei thargedau, a allai fod gymaint â £0.5 miliwn y dydd. Mae'n sefyll i reswm na allwn fforddio talu'r holl gosbau hyn; ac ni all ein cynghorau na'n dinasyddion ychwaith fforddio talu'r cosbau hyn.

Mae ar awdurdodau lleol angen gwir arweiniad gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ar fater mor hollbwysig â gwastraff. Mae ar awdurdodau lleol taer angen cyllid ychwanegol i ddatblygu'r seilwaith cydberthynol angenrheidiol os ydynt i

reduction obligations. If you do the calculations, you will see that councils' waste management grants are, effectively, cancelled out by landfill taxes. Many of them are living hand to mouth. I am quite curious to learn what happens to all these financial penalties and to see where the tax goes. I assume that it goes to the Treasury, and I would be interested to know from the Minister whether we get it all back, a proportion of it, or whether it is all building up in a nice big coffer in the Treasury. would it not be great if it handed it back with a specific requirement that it should be used to build the necessary infrastructure?

What is needed in many cases across Wales is pump-priming money. We need to act now, because it takes time for local authorities to react and to build the new infrastructure. Cardiff has the largest waste recycling facility in Europe. That was not planned and built overnight; it took at least a couple of years. It then took months for the commissioning and for the process to be rolled out across Cardiff, and even longer to educate the people of Cardiff about how they should be recycling and to encourage them to recycle more year on year. Sadly, it is a very slow process. Local authorities need assistance and a steer from the Government. They do not need a diktat that says, 'You must do A, B, or C in order to achieve this'. They need pump-priming money to ensure that they get can things up and running and ready for the future.

The Minister for Environment, Sustainability and Housing (Jane Davidson): This motion is founded upon a false premise. There has been an overall reduction in the amount of waste going to landfill over the last nine years. The official figures are very clear, and tell a different story to the motion. Since 1999, under the Welsh Assembly Government's administration, published statistics show that the amount of waste going to landfill has fallen by over 8 per cent. For the benefit of Members, the figures are as follows. In 2000, the Environment Agency published its strategic waste management assessment for landfill site deposits in 1998-99. That showed

gyflawni eu hymrwymiaidau i leihau gwastraff. Gwnewch eich symiau, a gwelwch fod grantiau rheoli gwastraff cynghorau, yn y bôn, yn cael eu dileu gan drethi tirlenwi. Mae nifer ohonynt yn byw o'r llaw i'r genau. Yr wyf yn bur chwilfrydig ynglŷn â'r hyn sy'n digwydd i'r holl gosbau ariannol hyn ac i ble mae'r dreth yn mynd. Tybiaf eu bod yn mynd i'r Trysorlys, a byddai'n ddiddorol clywed gan y Gweinidog a ydym yn ei chael i gyd yn ôl, canran ohoni, neu a yw'r cyfan yn creu coffr swmpus braf yn y Trysorlys. Oni fyddai'n wych petai'n dychwelyd yr arian gyda chais penodol i'w ddefnyddio i adeiladu'r seilwaith angenrheidiol?

Yr hyn y mae ei angen mewn llawer achos ledled Cymru yw arian sefydlu. Mae angen inni weithredu'n awr, oherwydd mae'n cymryd amser i awdurdodau lleol ymateb ac adeiladu'r seilwaith newydd. Yng Nghaerdydd y mae'r cyfleuster ailgylchu gwastraff mwyaf yn Ewrop. Nid dros nos y cafodd hwnnw'i gynllunio a'i adeiladu; cymerodd ddwy flynedd o leiaf. Yna cymerwyd misoedd i gomisiynu a chyflwyno'r broses ledled Caerdydd, a mwy na hynny hyd yn oed i addysgu pobl Caerdydd sut y dylent ailgylchu ac i'w hannog i ailgylchu mwy flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn. Yn anffodus, mae'n broses araf iawn. Mae angen i awdurdodau lleol gael cymorth ac arweiniad gan y Llywodraeth. Nid oes arnynt angen dictad sy'n dweud, 'Rhaid ichi wneud A, B neu C er mwyn cyflawni hyn'. Mae arnynt angen arian sefydlu i sicrhau y gallant roi pethau ar waith yn barod ar gyfer y dyfodol.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynaliadwyedd a Thai (Jane Davidson): Mae'r cynnig hwn wedi'i seilio ar gynsail anghywir. Bu gostyngiad cyffredinol ym maint y gwastraff a roir mewn safleoedd tirlenwi dros y naw mlynedd diwethaf. Mae'r ffigurau swyddogol yn glir iawn, ac yn rhoi stori wahanol i'r cynnig. Er 1999, o dan weinyddiaeth Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, mae ystadegau a gyhoeddwyd yn dangos bod faint o wastraff sy'n cael ei dirilenwi wedi gostwng dros 8 y cant. Er mwyn yr Aelodau, dyma'r ffigurau. Yn 2000 cyhoeddodd Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd ei asesiad o'r strategaeth rheoli gwastraff ar gyfer cynhwysedd safleoedd tirlenwi yn 1998-99.

that, in Wales, total landfill deposits in that year were 4,378,000 tonnes. The data published by the Environment Agency yesterday show that, in 2006, total landfill deposits were 4,019,000 tonnes. Thus, in 2006, the latest year for which figures are available, there was a reduction of 359,000 tonnes in the amount of waste sent to landfill compared with that sent in 1998-99. As I said, there was a reduction of more than 8 per cent.

Moreover, there was an even higher fall in the amount of municipal waste sent to landfill. The National Assembly for Wales's reports, produced in accordance with national statistics requirements, show that, in 1998-99, Wales sent 1,472,414 tonnes of municipal waste to landfill. In 2006-07, Wales sent 1,259,000 tonnes of municipal waste to landfill. That is a drop of 213,390 tonnes, or 14.5 per cent. Those are the official figures for the quantities of material sent to landfill. I hope that, in winding up, the Conservatives will concede that their assertions about the quantities of waste sent to landfill are inaccurate.

The Conservatives also call upon the Assembly Government to engage with manufacturers, retailers, and suppliers to reduce the amount of unnecessary packaging. I am happy to advise the Assembly that we have been engaging with these stakeholders on the issue of packaging—although, Lesley, I am sure that I had nothing to do with Marks and Spencer's decision, which I very warmly welcome. Through continued work on the Courtauld commitment, and making sure that we as an Assembly Government put out a strong message that we will legislate to reduce packaging if retailers do not do it voluntarily, we will take that forward.

Darren Millar: Minister, will you take an intervention?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. The Minister is not taking interventions.

Dangosodd hwnnw mai 4,378,000 tonnell oedd cyfanswm y cynhwysedd tirlenwi yng Nghymru y flwyddyn honno. Dengys y data a gyhoeddwyd ddoe gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd mai 4,019,000 tonnell oedd cyfanswm y cynhwysedd tirlenwi yn 2006. Felly, yn 2006, y flwyddyn ddiweddaraf y mae ffigurau ar gael ar ei chyfer, yr oedd gostyngiad o 359,000 tonnell ym maint y gwastraff a anfonwyd i safleoedd tirlenwi o'i gymharu â'r hyn a anfonwyd yn 1998-99. Fel y dywedais, yr oedd dros 8 y cant o ostyngiad.

At hynny, yr oedd gostyngiad mwy fyth ym maint y gwastraff trefol a anfonwyd i safleoedd tirlenwi. Dengys adroddiadau Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, a gynhyrchwyd yn ôl gofynion ystadegau gwladol, fod Cymru yn 1998-99 wedi anfon 1,472,414 tonnell o wastraff trefol i safleoedd tirlenwi. Yn 2006-07, anfonodd Cymru 1,259,000 tonnell o wastraff trefol i safleoedd tirlenwi. Mae hynny'n ostyngiad o 213,390 tonnell, neu 14.5 y cant. Y ffigurau hynny yw'r rhai swyddogol am faint o ddefnyddiau sy'n mynd i safleoedd tirlenwi. Gobeithio, wrth imi ddirwyn i ben, y bydd y Ceidwadwyr yn addef bod eu honiadau am faint o wastraff a anfonir i safleoedd tirlenwi yn anghywir.

Mae'r Ceidwadwyr yn galw hefyd ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i gysylltu â gwneuthurwyr, manwerthwyr a chyflenwyr i leihau'r pecynnu diangen a ddefnyddir. Yr wyf yn fodlon dweud wrth y Cynulliad ein bod wedi cysylltu â'r rhanddeiliaid hyn ynghylch pecynnu—er fy mod yn sicr, Lesley, nad oedd gennyf ran o gwbl ym mhenderfyniad Marks and Spencer, penderfyniad yr wyf yn ei groesawu'n gynnes iawn. Drwy barhau i weithio ar yr ymrwymiad Courtauld, a sicrhau ein bod ni fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cyfleu neges gadarn y byddwn yn deddfu i leihau pecynnu oni fydd manwerthwyr yn gwneud hynny'n wirfoddol, byddwn yn bwrw ymlaen â hynny.

Darren Millar: Weinidog, a dderbyniwch chi ymyriad?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Nid yw'r Gweinidog yn derbyn ymyriadau.

Jane Davidson: The Conservatives also call upon the Assembly Government to instruct local authorities to make residual waste collections on a weekly basis. The Conservatives might instruct democratically elected local government on operational matters such as the frequency of refuse collection; we, however, issue advice. Our advice is that we support authorities in moving from weekly to fortnightly residual waste collections provided that they make weekly collections of food waste. As Alun Ffred said, the experience of those local authorities that have moved to fortnightly collections of residual waste is that there is less waste to collect, and they are able to recycle much higher percentages of the waste that they collect. The financial consequences are lower costs, both in terms of collection and in avoiding landfill costs, including tax.

Jane Davidson: Mae'r Ceidwadwyr yn galw hefyd ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i gyfarwyddo awdurdodau lleol i gasglu gwastraff gweddilliol bob wythnos. Efallai y byddai'r Ceidwadwyr yn cyfarwyddo llywodraethau lleol a etholwyd yn ddemocrataidd ar faterion gweithredol megis pa mor aml y cesglir sbwriel; yr ydym ni, fodd bynnag, yn darparu cyngor. Ein cyngor yw ein bod yn cefnogi awdurdodau wrth symud oddi wrth gasglu gwastraff gweddilliol bob wythnos i'w gasglu bob pythefnos, os byddant yn casglu gwastraff bwyd bob wythnos. Fel y dywedodd Alun Ffred, profiad yr awdurdodau lleol hynny sydd wedi symud i gasglu gwastraff gweddilliol bob pythefnos yw bod llai o wastraff i'w gasglu, a'u bod yn gallu ailgylchu canrannau llawer mwy o'r gwastraff a gesglir ganddynt. Y canlyniadau ariannol yw costau is, o ran casglu ac o ran osgoi costau tirlenwi, gan gynnwys treth.

3.50 p.m.

Through the separate weekly collection of food waste, local authorities are able not only to prevent substantial quantities of biodegradable waste from going to landfill, but to provide feedstock for new infrastructure such as anaerobic digestion plants. Those anaerobic digestion plants can then produce renewable fuel and generate heat and electricity, as well as producing a valuable soil conditioner. Fortnightly collections of residual waste and weekly collections of food waste underpin the development of anaerobic digestion technology and all the benefits that it brings.

Drwy gael casgliadau gwastraff bwyd wythnosol ar wahân, gall awdurdodau lleol nid yn unig atal llawer iawn o wastraff bioddiraddadwy rhag mynd i safleoedd tirlenwi, ond gallant hefyd ddarparu seilwaith newydd megis canolfannau treulio anaerobig. Yna gall y canolfannau treulio anaerobig hynny gynhyrchu tanwydd adnewyddadwy a chynhyrchu gwres a thrydan, yn ogystal â chynhyrchu cyflyrydd pridd gwerthfawr. Mae casgliadau gwastraff gweddilliol bob pythefnos a chasgliadau gwastraff bwyd bob wythnos yn sail ar gyfer datblygu technoleg treulio anaerobig a'r holl fanteision cysylltiedig.

The Conservative proposals would therefore require local authorities to reverse measures that have significantly improved performance and lowered costs, and the electorate of Wales needs to be informed that the Welsh Conservatives want to reduce levels of service and increase costs. This proposal is for a pay more, get less society that aspires to fail. Such a society will recycle less, send more to landfill and waste huge amounts of public money in so doing. You also call on us to:

Byddai cynigion y Ceidwadwyr, felly, yn galw ar awdurdodau lleol i wrth-droi mesurau sydd wedi gwella perfformiad yn sylweddol ac wedi lleihau costau, a dylid dweud wrth etholwyr Cymru bod Ceidwadwyr Cymru am ostwng lefelau gwasanaeth a chynyddu costau. Mae'r cynnig hwn am weld cymdeithas sy'n talu mwy a chael llai, sy'n sicr o fethu. Bydd cymdeithas felly'n ailgylchu llai, yn anfon mwy i safleoedd tirlenwi ac yn gwastraffu symiau enfawr o arian cyhoeddus drwy wneud hynny. Yr ydych hefyd yn galw arnom:

‘instruct local authorities to improve their recycling programmes by increasing more kerb-side collections and recycling banks’.

Members will be interested to know that the Wales performance indicators published by the local government data unit show that in 2006-07, kerbside recycling services were provided to over 86 per cent of Welsh households. That compares to 67 per cent of households in 2003-04. It is a significant improvement, and, along with improvements in facilities at recycling centres and sites containing recycling banks, we have seen a dramatic turnaround in recycling fortunes. In 1999, the official figures showed that the municipal recycling rate in Wales was about 6 per cent. In 2006-07, the rate was over 26 per cent and in the first six months of 2007-08, it rose to 33 per cent—that is a fivefold increase, under this Government, on the rate nine years ago.

The Conservatives are behind the times. They call for some positive changes, but those have already been introduced. We continue to recycle record levels of municipal waste and to landfill far less of it, and this trend will continue. Members will know that I am consulting with local government on future waste management targets. I propose that Wales should aspire to an ambitious, long-term municipal waste recycling target of more than 70 per cent. We would be the first country in the UK to do so. I look at best practice from Europe, about fortnightly collections of residual waste and about increased recycling. I propose that any waste that cannot be recycled or composted should be used to generate heat and power, because our goal is to minimise the amount of waste going to landfill.

You call on us to:

‘consider introducing incentives for people to reduce the amount of their household waste that goes to landfill.’

The first and most obvious incentive is the provision of a good recycling infrastructure in Wales. We have better recycling collection

i gyfarwyddo awdurdodau lleol i wella’u rhaglenni ailgylchu drwy gael mwy o gasgliadau ymyl y palmant a banciau ailgylchu.

Bydd Aelodau am wybod bod dangosyddion perfformiad Cymru, a gyhoeddwyd gan yr uned data llywodraeth leol, yn dangos bod gwasanaethau ailgylchu ymyl y palmant yn 2006-07 wedi’u darparu i dros 86 y cant o gartrefi Cymru. Mae hynny’n cymharu â 67 y cant o gartrefi yn 2003-04. Mae’n welliant sylweddol, ac ynghyd â gwella cyfleusterau mewn canolfannau ailgylchu a safleoedd sydd â banciau ailgylchu, yr ydym wedi gweld newid dramatig yn llwyddiant ailgylchu. Yn 1999, dangosodd y ffigurau swyddogol fod y raddfa ailgylchu trefol yng Nghymru oddeutu 6 y cant. Yn 2006-07, yr oedd y raddfa dros 26 y cant, ac yn chwe mis cyntaf 2007-08 cododd i 33 y cant—mae hynny’n gynydd o bum gwaith, o dan y Llywodraeth hon, o’i gymharu â’r raddfa naw mlynedd yn ôl.

Mae’r Ceidwadwyr ar ei hôl hi. Galwant am newidiadau cadarnhaol, ond cyflwynwyd y rheiny eisoes. Yr ydym yn parhau i ailgylchu lefelau mwy nag erioed o wastraff trefol ac i ddefnyddio llawer llai ohono ar gyfer tirlenwi, a bydd y duedd hon yn parhau. Gŵyr yr Aelodau fy mod yn ymgynghori â llywodraeth leol ar dargedau rheoli gwastraff yn y dyfodol. Yr wyf yn cynnig y dylai Cymru anelu at darged ailgylchu gwastraff trefol hirdymor uchelgeisiol o fwy na 70 y cant. Ni fyddai’r wlad gyntaf yn y DU i wneud hynny. Yr wyf yn edrych ar yr arfer gorau yn Ewrop, ynghylch casglu gwastraff gweddilliol bob pythefnos ac ynghylch mwy o ailgylchu. Cynigiaf y dylai unrhyw wastraff na ellir ei ailgylchu neu ei gompostio gael ei ddefnyddio i gynhyrchu gwres a phŵer, oherwydd ein nod yw lleihau’r gwastraff sy’n mynd i safleoedd tirlenwi.

Yr ydych yn galw arnom:

i ystyried cyflwyno cymhellion i bobl i leihau faint o’u gwastraff cartref sy’n mynd i safleoedd tirlenwi.

Y cymhelliad cyntaf a mwyaf amlwg yw darparu seilwaith ailgylchu da yng Nghymru. Mae gennym wasanaethau ailgylchu gwell

services than ever before, and an extra £200 million has been invested since 'Wise About Waste' was published in 2002. We are working to persuade householders to use that infrastructure to the maximum. We promote recycling among young people and their parents through the eco-schools programme, we encourage participation through the work of Waste Awareness Wales, and when we publish our strategy 'Wise About Waste' mark II in the autumn, there will be a number of other issues in that regard.

Kirsty's amendments, amendments 3 and 4, are also inaccurate because landfill tax will not cause fines—the landfill tax is a UK tax designed to encourage waste operators to reduce the amount of waste that they landfill. The landfill tax rate fixed by the UK Government is currently £24 per tonne, which is up from £21 per tonne last year, so it is a major incentive. Fines do, however, apply to the landfill allowance scheme, and, to date, no local authority in Wales has failed to meet those targets and no fines have been applied. We do not want our local authorities to be fined, Jenny—we want to ensure that they recycle, and you should also want to ensure that. If Welsh local authorities contribute to the UK's missing EU targets, infraction fines will be passed on, and that is why our policies are designed to ensure that local authorities meet their targets. It is why they have received an additional £92 million in hypothecated funding focused on dealing with food waste.

Nick Bourne: I agree with the Minister on one thing and one thing only: that she was not responsible for action taken by Marks and Spencer on carrier bags. It is a shame about the Minister, because we have had some contributions from her recently in which she has been in discuss mode, and has been much more warm and cuddly than when she is in dictate mode. The schoolma'am approach does not go down well with Assembly Members when we have a constructive—

Jane Davidson: Will you take an intervention?

nag erioed o'r blaen, a buddsoddwyd £200 miliwn yn ychwanegol ers cyhoeddi 'Doeth Ynghylch Gwastraff' yn 2002. Yr ydym yn gweithio i berswadio deiliaid tai i ddefnyddio'r seilwaith hwnnw i'r eithaf. Yr ydym yn hyrwyddo ailgylchu ymysg pobl ifanc a'u rhieni drwy'r rhaglen eco-ysgolion, yr ydym yn annog pobl i gyfranogi drwy waith Ymwybyddiaeth Gwastraff Cymru, a phan gyhoeddwn ein strategaeth 'Doeth Ynghylch Gwastraff' fersiwn II yn yr hydref, bydd nifer o faterion eraill yn hynny o beth.

Mae gwelliannau Kirsty, gwelliannau 3 a 4, hefyd yn anghywir oherwydd ni fydd treth tirlenwi yn achosi dirwyon—treth gan y DU yw treth tirlenwi wedi'i chynllunio i annog gweithredwyr gwastraff i anfon llai o wastraff i safleoedd tirlenwi. Ar hyn o bryd, £24 y dunnell yw graddfa'r dreth tirlenwi a bennwyd gan y DU, sydd wedi codi o £21 y dunnell y llynedd, felly mae'n gymhelliad mawr. Mae dirwyon, fodd bynnag, yn gymwys i'r cynllun lwfans tirlenwi, a hyd yma nid oes yr un awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru wedi methu cyrraedd y targedau hynny ac ni osodwyd dim dirwyon. Nid ydym am i'n hawdurdodau lleol gael eu dirwyo, Jenny—yr ydym am sicrhau eu bod yn ailgylchu, a dylech chithau fod am sicrhau hynny. Os bydd awdurdodau lleol Cymru yn cyfrannu at y targedau UE y mae'r DU yn methu eu cyrraedd, bydd dirwyon am dor-dyletswydd yn cael eu trosglwyddo, a dyna pam y mae ein polisiau wedi'u cynllunio i sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol yn cyrraedd eu targedau. Dyna pam y maent wedi cael £92 miliwn yn ychwanegol o gyllid wedi ei neilltuo a'i anelu'n fwriadol at ymdrin â gwastraff bwyd.

Nick Bourne: Cytunaf â'r Gweinidog ar un peth, ac un peth yn unig: nad hi oedd yn gyfrifol am y gweithredu gan Marks and Spencer ynghylch bagiau nwyddau. Mae'n drueni am y Gweinidog, oherwydd cawsom rai cyfraniadau ganddi'n ddiweddar lle'r oedd hi'n defnyddio'r dull trafod, a lle'r oedd hi'n llawer mwy cynnes ac anwesol na phan fydd hi'n gosod gorchmynion. Nid yw dull yr ysgolfeistres yn cael derbyniad da gan Aelodau'r Cynulliad pan fydd gennym—

Jane Davidson: A wnewch dderbyn myriad?

Nick Bourne: I would be very happy, unlike the Minister, to take a brief intervention.

Jane Davidson: I would be very happy for you to demonstrate why you have put an inaccurate motion in front of the Assembly.

Nick Bourne: I scarcely think that that intervention was necessary, because I was 30 seconds in and just about to deal with that issue. It is clear—I have the figures here—that, over 10 years, there has been a 15.3 per cent increase in municipal waste. Those figures were just checked with the Members' research service and have been texted to me. Municipal waste is up: there has been a 15.3 per cent increase over 10 years. That is accurate; that information has just come from the Members' research service.

Let us deal with the issues, because this is an important debate and there were some useful contributions. I agree very much with what Lesley Griffiths said about the three Rs—reduce, reuse and recycle—which is a point that I think that Brynle Williams was also making. Brynle Williams and I have first-hand experience of this, along with Mick Bates, when we were on the bins with Biffa one summer. We were actually out there, experiencing how this is brought about. You do it through a combination of incentives and action to make sure that something is followed; you take a carrot-and-stick approach.

We need to look at the recycling rates. The Minister, quite frankly, was horribly complacent about them. The recycling rates have gone up, that is certainly true, but they are not as good as the best in England and they are far behind the best in Scandinavia, the Netherlands and France. I can see that the Minister is acknowledging that, to her credit. There is a long way to go, which I do not think that I heard the Minister say. The best are getting up to the same level as some of the average rates in England, but there is a long way to go. At the bottom of the tree is Cardiff, which has a very long way to go with its recycling rates.

Nick Bourne: Byddwn yn fodlon iawn derbyn ymyriad byr, yn wahanol i'r Gweinidog,

Jane Davidson: Byddwn yn fodlon iawn ichi ddangos pam yr ydych wedi rhoi cynnig anghywir gerbron y Cynulliad.

Nick Bourne: Go brin y credaf fod yr ymyriad hwnnw'n angenrheidiol, oherwydd yr oeddwn 30 eiliad i mewn i'm haraith ac ar fin ymdrin â'r mater hwnnw. Mae'n eglur—mae'r ffigurau gennyf yma—fod 15.3 y cant o gynnydd wedi bod mewn gwastraff trefol. Cafodd y ffigurau hynny eu sicrhau gan wasanaeth ymchwil yr Aelodau a chawsant eu hanfon ataf drwy neges testun. Bu cynnydd mewn gwastraff trefol: bu cynnydd o 15.3 y cant dros 10 mlynedd. Mae hynny'n gywir; mae'r wybodaeth honno newydd gyrraedd oddi wrth wasanaeth ymchwil yr Aelodau.

Gadewch inni ymdrin â'r materion, oherwydd mae hon yn ddadl bwysig ac yr oedd yna rai cyfraniadau defnyddiol. Cytunaf yn gryf â'r hyn a ddywedodd Lesley Griffiths am dri phen y bregeth—lleihau, aildefnyddio ac ailgylchu—pwynt yr oedd Brynle Williams yn ei wneud hefyd, mi gredaf. Mae gan Brynle Williams a minnau brofiad uniongyrchol o hyn, ynghyd â Mick Bates, pan oeddem ar y biniau gyda Biffa un haf. Yr oeddem allan yno mewn gwirionedd, yn profi sut y mae hyn yn cael ei wneud. Mae'n digwydd drwy gyfuniad o gymhellion a gweithredoedd i sicrhau bod rhywbeth yn cael ei ddilyn; yr ydych yn defnyddio'r dull moronen a ffon.

Mae angen inni edrych ar y cyfraddau ailgylchu. Yr oedd y Gweinidog, a bod yn gwbl onest, yn ofnadwy o hunanfodlon ynglŷn â hwy. Mae'r cyfraddau ailgylchu wedi codi, mae hynny yn sicr yn wir, ond nid ydynt cystal â'r goreuon yn Lloegr ac maent ymhell ar ôl y goreuon yn Llychlyn, yr Iseldiroedd a Ffrainc. Gallaf weld bod y Gweinidog yn cydnabod hynny, er clod iddi. Mae ffordd bell i fynd, ac ni chredaf imi glywed y Gweinidog yn dweud hynny. Mae'r goreuon yn ymgyrraedd at yr un lefel â rhai o'r cyfraddau cyfartalog yn Lloegr, ond mae ffordd bell i fynd. Wrth fôn y goeden y mae Caerdydd, sydd â ffordd bell iawn i fynd

gyda'i chyfraddau ailgylchu.

We need action to incentivise people to recycle. Unlike the Minister, I do not think that merely providing a facility is an incentive. It would be like saying, 'There is a pavement'—

Peter Black: Will you take an intervention?

Nick Bourne: In a minute, Peter; I presume that your intervention is on the Cardiff point. According to the Minister, the argument would go like this: there is an incentive to go to school because there is a pavement outside your front door. It is not an incentive, it is a facility. To incentivise, you have to make it attractive for people to recycle, as Mick Bates argued. You have to win hearts and minds. I will give way to Peter Black, very briefly.

Peter Black: Thank you, Nick. Would you acknowledge that despite the fact that Cardiff's recycling rate is very low, that rate has, effectively, doubled in the last four years, under the Liberal-Democrat-led council?

Nick Bourne: There has certainly been a Liberal Democrat council, but it is easy to double things from a very low base, so I do not think that you can take too much credit for that, Peter.

Let us move on to the issue of weekly collections. I was stunned to find that it is the policy of both coalition parties to have fortnightly collections. I had not realised that until today, but they defended it and said that it was the right approach. That stuns me. That is not the way to win hearts and minds. It is just unacceptable, because it presents a health hazard—

Alun Ffred Jones: Will you give way?

Nick Bourne: I do not have time, Alun Ffred. [*Interruption.*] I do not have time.

Fortnightly collections present a health hazard: you can see that in Cardiff when bin bags have been left out. It is a hazard to

Mae arnom angen gweithredu i ysgogi pobl i ailgylchu. Yn wahanol i'r Gweinidog, ni chredaf fod darparu cyfleuster yn unig yn gymhelliad. Byddai fel dweud, 'Mae palmant'—

Peter Black: A dderbyniwch chi ymyriad?

Nick Bourne: Ymhen munud, Peter; cymeraf eich bod yn ymyrryd ar y pwynt ynghylch Caerdydd. Yn ôl y Gweinidog, dyma fyddai'r ddadl: mae cymhelliad i fynd i'r ysgol oherwydd bod palmant y tu allan i'ch drws ffrynt. Nid yw'n gymhelliad, cyfleuster ydyw. I roi cymhelliad, rhaid ichi beri bod ailgylchu'n rhywbeth deniadol i bobl, fel y dadleuodd Mick Bates. Rhaid ichi ennill calonnau a meddyliau. Ildiaf i Peter Black, yn fyr iawn.

Peter Black: Diolch, Nick. A fydddech yn cydnabod, er bod cyfradd ailgylchu Caerdydd yn isel iawn, fod y gyfradd honno wedi dyblu, mewn gwirionedd, yn y pedair blynedd diwethaf, o dan y cyngor a arweinir gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol?

Nick Bourne: Yn sicr, bu cyngor dan arweiniad y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, ond mae'n hawdd dyblu pethau o sylfaen isel iawn, felly, ni chredaf y gallwch gymryd gormod o'r clod am hynny, Peter.

Gadewch inni symud ymlaen at fater casgliadau wythnosol. Cefais fy syfrdanu o weld mai polisi'r ddwy blaid yw cael casgliadau bob pythefnos. Nid oeddwn wedi sylweddoli hynny tan heddiw, ond y maent wedi amddiffyn y polisi a dweud mai hynny oedd y dull cywir. Mae hynny'n fy syfrdanu. Nid dyna'r ffordd i ennill calonnau a meddyliau. Mae'n annerbyniol, oherwydd mae'n berygl i iechyd—

Alun Ffred Jones: A wnewch chi ildio?

Nick Bourne: Nid oes gennyf amser, Alun Ffred. [*Torri ar draws.*] Nid oes gennyf amser.

Mae casgliadau bob pythefnos yn peryglu iechyd: gallwch weld hynny yng Nghaerdydd pan fydd bagiau biniau'n cael eu gadael allan.

children, and attracts seagulls and so on. Bins have to be emptied every week and we will certainly promote that policy. You need a combination of the carrot and the stick.

The Minister was complacent today; she is not usually, but she was today. There has been improvement, but we have a long way to go and we will achieve that, as I have said, by a combination of encouraging and winning hearts and minds. You will certainly not achieve that through a fortnightly bin collection. She said that food waste would be collected every week, but that is certainly not happening in some authorities in Wales now. I urge people to support this motion, in its entirety, unamended.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: We will defer voting on this item until voting time.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisiau tan yr amser pleidleisio.
Votes deferred until voting time.*

Dadl Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru Welsh Liberal Democrats Debate

Sut y Caiff Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus eu Darparu How Public Services are Delivered

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1, 3, 4, 5 and 6 in the name of William Graham, and amendment 2 in the name of Carwyn Jones.

Kirsty Williams: I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. believes that the needs of the service-user should be paramount when assessing how public services are delivered;

2. recognises that in some areas of both England and Wales, access to services on the other side of the border is beneficial to service users;

3. calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to take better account of the need for cross-border provision when developing new public service strategies. (NDM3890)

Mae'n berygl i blant, ac yn denu gwylanod ac yn y blaen. Rhaid i finiau gael eu gwagio bob wythnos, ac yn sicr byddwn ni'n hyrwyddo'r polisi hwnnw.

Yr oedd y Gweinidog yn hunanfodlon heddiw; ni fydd hi felly fel arfer, ond yr oedd hi heddiw. Fe fu gwelliant, ond mae gennym ffordd bell i fynd, a byddwn ni'n cyflawni hynny, fel y dywedais, drwy gyfuniad o anogaeth ac ennill calonau a meddyliau. Yn sicr, ni fyddwch yn cyflawni hynny drwy gasglu biniau bob pythefnos. Dywedodd y byddai gwastraff bwyd yn cael ei gasglu bob wythnos, ond yn sicr nid yw hynny'n digwydd mewn rhai awdurdodau yng Nghymru yn awr. Yr wyf yn annog pobl i gefnogi'r cynnig hwn, fel y mae, heb welliant.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Gohiriwn bleidleisio ar yr eitem hon tan yr amser pleidleisio.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 3, 4, 5 a 6 yn enw William Graham, a gwelliant 2 yn enw Carwyn Jones.

Kirsty Williams: Cynigiad fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. yn credu y dylid rhoi'r prif bwys ar anghenion y defnyddiwr gwasanaeth wrth asesu sut y caiff gwasanaethau cyhoeddus eu darparu;

2. yn cydnabod mewn rhai ardaloedd yng Nghymru a Lloegr, bod mynediad at wasanaethau ar ochr arall y ffin o fudd i ddefnyddwyr gwasanaeth;

3. yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ystyried yr angen am ddarpariaeth drawsffiniol yn well wrth ddatblygu strategaethau gwasanaethau cyhoeddus

newydd. (NDM3890)

We bring forward this debate at a time when the issue of cross-border services is high on the agenda for many in this Chamber—and not exclusively those who, like me, represent border constituencies—as well as the Welsh Affairs Select Committee in the House of Commons. While the Liberal Democrats are champions of the devolution cause and are keen to establish a Welsh model of public services that will deliver policy and practice tailored to the needs of the people of Wales, we do not believe in a Wales-only approach to public service delivery, an approach that puts ideology before the needs of individuals.

4.00 p.m.

In the past, this has been recognised by Assembly Governments. Only last weekend, attending a lunch in Aston-on-Clun of all places, I sat next to an elderly gentleman who celebrated the improved train services that he now enjoys as a result of investment in the rail service and the all-Wales rail franchise. Indeed, Shrewsbury station received money from the Welsh Assembly Government to improve the infrastructure there, because we knew that spending money on an English station would deliver benefits for Welsh patients.

In many parts of Wales, and particularly in my constituency, it simply makes sense to access some services in England. It reflects centuries of interaction. The opposite is also true, with people in England accessing services, cultural pursuits and employment opportunities in Wales. The fact is that we are simply not in the situation where Welsh people are leaving the country en masse to use English services and leaving Welsh services to rot. Neither are English residents flooding across our borders and draining resources away from Welsh services. There is a natural ebb and flow, and we should not be precious about this.

This should not be seen as an excuse not to develop new services and approaches in Wales, but we should acknowledge that the

Yr ydym yn cyflwyno'r ddadl hon ar adeg pan fydd gwasanaethau trawsffiniol yn uchel ar yr agenda i nifer yn y Siambr hon—ac nid yn unig i'r rheiny, fel fi, sy'n cynrychioli etholaethau ar y ffin—yn ogystal â'r Pwyllgor Dethol ar Faterion Cymreig yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin. Er bod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn hyrwyddo achos datganoli ac yn awyddus i sefydlu model Cymreig o wasanaethau cyhoeddus a fydd yn sicrhau polisi ac arfer sy'n addas i bobl Cymru, nid ydym yn credu mewn dull i Gymru'n unig o sicrhau gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, dull sy'n rhoi ideoleg o flaen anghenion unigolion.

Yn y gorffennol, mae Llywodraethau'r Cynulliad wedi cydnabod hyn. Wythnos diwethaf yn unig, pan oeddwn mewn cinio yn Aston-on-Clun o bob man, eisteddwn yn ymyl gŵr oedrannus a oedd yn dathlu'r gwasanaethau trên gwell y mae'n eu mwynhau'n awr yn sgil buddsoddi yn y gwasanaeth rheilffyrdd a'r fasnachfrait rheilffyrdd Cymru gyfan. Yn wir, cafodd gorsaf Amwythig arian gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wella'r seilwaith yno, oherwydd gwyddem y byddai gwario arian ar orsaf yn Lloegr yn sicrhau manteision i gleifion yng Nghymru.

Mewn llawer rhan o Gymru, ac yn enwedig yn fy etholaeth i, mae'n gwneud synnwyr defnyddio rhai gwasanaethau yn Lloegr. Mae'n adlewyrchu canrifoedd o ryngweithio. Mae'r gwrthwyneb hefyd yn wir, a phobl yn Lloegr yn defnyddio gwasanaethau, gweithgareddau diwylliannol a chyfleoedd cyflogaeth yng Nghymru. Y gwir yw nad ydym yn syml mewn sefyllfa lle mae pobl Cymru'n gadael y wlad yn un fflyd i ddefnyddio gwasanaethau yn Lloegr gan adael gwasanaethau yng Nghymru i bydru. Nid yw trigolion Lloegr ychwaith yn tyrru ar draws ein ffiniau ac yn draenio adnoddau oddi ar wasanaethau Cymru. Mae yna lanw a thrai naturiol, ac ni ddylem fod yn fursennaidd am hyn.

Ni ddylid meddwl am hyn fel esgus i beidio â datblygu gwasanaethau a dulliau newydd yng Nghymru, ond dylem gydnabod y dylai'r

individual should always be at the centre of any new developments. Unfortunately, over the past 10 months, that has not been the case. I have witnessed a worrying trend in my constituency casework that demonstrates that the needs of individuals are not being put before the desire to develop services only for Wales or some abstract notion of nation-building. Many of my constituents have long received their health services across the border without any difficulty or problems. However, as I said, over the past 10 months, this has become increasingly difficult. I wish to highlight the cases of four people, all of whom have agreed to be mentioned publicly today.

Mr Edward Narborough, an ex-mayor of Rhayader, has recently been told that his care is to be transferred to Wrexham. I am sure that the services in Wrexham are fine, but this decision has been taken without any consultation with Mr Narborough, who has happily been receiving care at the Belmont Abbey unit in Hereford since the amputation of a limb due to complications from diabetes. He has been going back and forth to Hereford quite happily for six years; the staff know him and he knows the staff, and the journey, although it takes about an hour, is just about manageable for him and his family, who take him there and back. He is now faced with the prospect of having to travel to Wrexham. The journey is much longer than that which he currently endures, he does not know the staff or the services, and he is very upset about the prospect of having the continuity of his care interrupted for what he sees as no good reason.

Ieuan Baynham is a young boy from Presteigne, in need of an operation on his face to remove a birthmark, who was turned away from Hereford hospital and told to join the waiting list in Swansea. A return journey of less than two hours from his home to Hereford now becomes a trek of more than four hours. Why can he not be treated in Hereford? It is not because the hospital was incapable of dealing with his case, but because he is a Welsh resident. As such, he must now receive his treatment in a Welsh hospital, regardless of how much more

unigolyn bob amser fod yn ganolbwynt i unrhyw ddatblygiadau newydd. Yn anffodus, dros y 10 mis diwethaf, nid dyna sut y bu pethau. Yr wyf wedi tystio i dueddiad sy'n peri pryder yn fy ngwaith ar achosion etholaethol, sy'n dangos na roddir anghenion unigolion o flaen yr awydd i ddatblygu gwasanaethau i Gymru'n unig, neu ryw amcan haniaethol o greu cenedl. Mae nifer o'm hetholwyr i wedi cael eu gwasanaethau iechyd ers amser ar draws y ffin heb ddim anhawster na phroblemau. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais, dros y 10 mis diwethaf mae hyn wedi mynd yn gynyddol anodd. Hoffwn dynnu sylw at achosion pedwar o bobl sydd, bob un, wedi cytuno imi eu crybwyll yn gyhoeddus heddiw.

Dywedwyd wrth Mr Edward Narborough, un o gyn-feiri Rhaeadr Gwy, yn ddiweddar y bydd ei ofal yn cael ei drosglwyddo i Wrecsam. Yr wyf yn sicr fod y gwasanaethau yn Wrecsam yn iawn, ond gwnaethpwyd y penderfyniad hwn heb ymgynghori o gwbl â Mr Narborough, sydd wedi cael gofal boddhaol yn uned Belmont Abbey yn Henffordd ers iddo gollu un o'i aelodau oherwydd cymhlethdodau diabetes. Bu'n mynd yn ôl ac ymlaen yn ddigon hapus i Henffordd ers chwe blynedd; mae'r staff yn ei adnabod ac mae ef yn adnabod y staff, ac mae modd gwneud y siwrnai, er ei bod yn cymryd tuag awr, heb anhawster mawr iddo ef a'i deulu, sy'n mynd ag ef yno ac yn ôl. Mae'n awr yn wynebu rhagolygon gorfod teithio i Wrecsam. Mae'r siwrnai'n hwy o lawer na'r siwrnai y mae'n ei dioddef yn awr, nid yw'n adnabod y staff na'r gwasanaethau, ac nid yw'n hapus o gwbl am y rhagolygon o dorri ar barhad ei ofal heb ddim rheswm da yn ei dyb ef.

Bachgen ifanc o Lanandras y mae arno angen llawdriniaeth ar ei wyneb i dynnu man geni yw Ieuan Baynham; cafodd ei wrthod yn ysbyty Henffordd a chael ei orchymyn i ymuno â'r rhestr aros yn Abertawe. Mae'r siwrnai ddwyffordd o lai na dwy awr o'i gartref yn Henffordd yn awr yn hirdaith o dros bedair awr. Pam na chaiff ei drin yn Henffordd? Nid oherwydd na all yr ysbyty ddelio â'i achos, ond oherwydd ei fod yn byw yng Nghymru. O'r herwydd, rhaid iddo'n awr gael ei driniaeth mewn ysbyty yng Nghymru, heb ystyried cymaint yn anos y mae'r

difficult that decision makes things for him and his family.

Owen Williams from Brecon, who suffers from a skeletal condition that I will not even attempt to pronounce, has been travelling regularly back and forth to Bath for the past 21 years for specialist pain relief, physiotherapy and rehabilitation services. He has been told that the service is no longer available to him and that he will have to be treated in a local service. He would have been quite happy to do that except there is no equivalent service local to him. The relationship that he has built up over the past 21 years is to be pushed to one side because he is a Welsh resident and must therefore receive treatment in a Welsh NHS setting. We appealed that case with Powys Local Health Board, and, fortunately, we won the day, so Owen will be off to Bath as usual later in the spring.

Perhaps most shocking of all is the case of patient J, a young woman who was born with a very rare genetic condition, which has led to multiple health problems. Since being a child, she has been under the care of a clinician in Bristol, who is Europe's leading specialist on this particular condition. However, Health Commission Wales, in all its wisdom, has denied ongoing care for patient J under this specialist. As a result, a much needed brain operation has been delayed as her case has been transferred to the University Hospital of Wales. Patient J has waited for a long time. Her parents are utterly in despair. She has gone from being reasonably fit-free to suffering two to three seizures a day. The quality of her life is hugely diminished. She has waited 300 per cent longer for her operation in Wales than had she been allowed to have the operation in Bristol.

Hereford hospital is crucial, not only for the delivery of services in Hereford, but also in helping to deliver services in Wales. The ongoing success of Llandrindod Wells community hospital is based on the ongoing relationship with clinicians who travel from

penderfyniad hwnnw'n gwneud pethau iddo ef a'i deulu.

Bu Owen Williams o Aberhonddu, sy'n dioddef o gyflwr ysgerbydol na cheisiaf ei ynganu hyd yn oed, wedi teithio'n rheolaidd yn ôl ac ymlaen i Gaerfaddon dros yr 21 mlynedd diwethaf am esmwythâd poen, ffisiotherapi a gwasanaethau adsefydlu arbenigol. Dywedwyd wrtho na fydd y gwasanaeth ar gael iddo mwyach ac y bydd yn rhaid iddo gael ei drin mewn gwasanaeth lleol. Byddai wedi bod yn ddigon hapus gwneud hynny, ond nid oes gwasanaeth cyfatebol yn lleol iddo. Mae'r berthynas yr oedd wedi'i meithrin dros yr 21 mlynedd diwethaf i gael ei gwthio o'r neilltu oherwydd ei fod yn byw yng Nghymru ac oherwydd ei bod yn rhaid iddo felly gael triniaeth yn un o sefydliadau'r GIG yng Nghymru. Apeliais yn yr achos hwnnw at Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Powys, ac yn ffodus enillwyd y dydd. Felly, bydd Owen yn mynd i Gaerfaddon fel arfer yn ddiweddarach yn y gwanwyn.

Yr achos mwyaf syfrdanol o'r cyfan, o bosibl, yw achos claf J, menyw ifanc a aned gyda chyflwr genynnol prin iawn sydd wedi achosi problemau iechyd niferus. Er pan oedd yn blentyn, bu dan ofal clinigwr ym Mryste sy'n brif arbenigwr Ewrop ar y cyflwr penodol hwn. Fodd bynnag, mae Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru, yn ei holl ddoethineb, wedi gwrthod gofal parhaus i'r claf hwn dan yr arbenigwr hwn. O'r herwydd, mae llawdriniaeth yr oedd arni ei hangen yn daer ar ei hymennydd wedi ei hoedi gan fod ei hachos wedi ei drosglwyddo i Ysbyty Prifysgol Cymru. Mae'r claf J yn aros ers amser maith. Mae ei rhieni mewn anobaith llwyr. Mae wedi mynd o fod prin yn dioddef dim ffitiau i ddioddef dwy neu dair y dydd. Mae ansawdd ei bywyd wedi dirywio'n aruthrol. Mae wedi aros 300 y cant yn hwy am ei llawdriniaeth yng Nghymru nag a fyddai pe caniateid iddi gael ei llawdriniaeth ym Mryste.

Mae ysbyty Henffordd yn hanfodol, nid yn unig i ddarparu gwasanaethau yn Henffordd, ond i helpu darparu gwasanaethau yng Nghymru. Mae llwyddiant parhaus ysbyty Llandrindod yn gwbl seiliedig ar y berthynas barhaus â chlinigwyr sy'n teithio o ysbyty

Hereford hospital to deliver services close to patients' homes, in Llandrindod Wells. Such services will be put at risk if this Government continues along the track of believing that the only way to deliver services in Wales is to close the border and to concentrate solely on what can be done here.

The Welsh Assembly Government should continue to strive to make services under its jurisdiction the best they can possibly be. However, the cause of nation-building should not be furthered at the expense of people such as patient J. The individual should be at the forefront of our thinking. Cross-border working, whether in the fields of health, education or transport, is a reality for so many of our citizens. Let us not put up this border, but let us work collaboratively with local authorities and governments across the border to ensure that we deliver for all our citizens.

Jonathan Morgan: I propose the following amendments in the name of William Graham. Amendment 1: insert at the end of point 1:

, and accepts that the principle of patient choice in the NHS should be advanced.

Amendment 3: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

accepts that the process of public consultation over public services reform needs strengthening.

Amendment 4: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

notes with concern the continued divergence in Welsh Assembly Government public service delivery policy.

Amendment 5: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to raise the standard of public services with a more innovative approach, drawing fully on the expertise available within the independent and voluntary/charitable sectors.

Henffordd i ddarparu gwasanaethau yn ymyl cartrefi cleifion yn Llandrindod. Bydd gwasanaethau felly mewn perygl os bydd y Llywodraeth hon yn parhau ar hyd y trywydd o gredu mai'r unig ffordd i ddarparu gwasanaethau yng Nghymru yw cau'r ffin a chanolbwyntio'n unig ar yr hyn y gellir ei wneud yma.

Dylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru barhau i ymdrechu i wneud gwasanaethau dan ei hawdurdodaeth yn wasanaethau o'r radd flaenaf bosibl. Er hynny, ni ddylid hyrwyddo creu cenedl ar draul pobl fel claf J. Dylai'r unigolyn fod ar flaen ein meddyliau. Mae gweithio ar draws ffiniau, boed ym meysydd iechyd, addysg neu drafnidiaeth, yn realiti i gynifer o'n dinasyddion. Gadewch inni beidio â chodi'r ffin hon, ond gadewch inni gydweithredu ag awdurdodau lleol a llywodraethau ar draws y ffin i sicrhau ein bod yn darparu ar gyfer ein holl ddinasyddion.

Jonathan Morgan: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw William Graham. Gwelliant 1: ychwanegu ar ddiwedd pwynt 1:

, ac yn derbyn y dylid hyrwyddo'r egwyddor o roi dewis i gleifion y GIG.

Gwelliant 3: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn derbyn bod angen cryfhau'r broses o ymgynghori cyhoeddus ynghylch diwygio gwasanaethau cyhoeddus.

Gwelliant 4: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn nodi â phryder y dargyfeirio parhaus ym mholisi darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Gwelliant 5: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i godi safon gwasanaethau cyhoeddus gyda dull gweithredu mwy arloesol, gan fanteisio'n llawn ar yr arbenigedd sydd ar gael yn y sectorau annibynnol a gwirfoddol/elusennol.

Amendment 6: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure that sufficient funding is made available to provide those living in less populated areas with the same level of service as those living in urban areas.

I welcome this debate today; it is a very good use of time, because we do not discuss often enough public services, how they are focused on users, and how users and patients can access those services, whether in Wales or elsewhere in the UK. I have always believed that, regardless of what devolution means to us, ultimately, it must mean providing public services that are not just different but better, and providing opportunities for people to access services outside Wales, if that is deemed necessary. We should be making good use of best practice outside Wales. I also welcome this debate in light of the fact that the Government has published its *Living in Wales* survey. I listened very carefully to the Minister for Finance and Public Service Delivery's interview this morning on Radio Wales on that very subject.

In moving the amendments in the name of William Graham, I wish to focus on three particular issues: the principle of patient choice in healthcare; the reform of the public consultation process on how services are redesigned; and the lack of engagement with the independent and voluntary sector.

The principle of patient choice and the involvement of the user in healthcare should be advanced. That statement should not come as a shock to Members; it is a principle that we have held dear for many years. The Government has nothing to fear by involving service users or by extending and advancing the principle of choice in healthcare to those who need particular services. The Minister for Finance and Public Service Delivery pointed out this morning that involving service users was essential. If you believe that, extending that to advancing patient choice in healthcare is a natural development.

Gwelliant 5: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau bod digon o arian ar gael i ddarparu'r un lefel o wasanaeth i'r rheiny sy'n byw mewn ardaloedd llai poblog â'r rheiny sy'n byw mewn ardaloedd trefol.

Croesawaf y ddadl hon heddiw; mae'n ffordd dda iawn i ddefnyddio amser, oherwydd nid ydym yn trafod digon ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus, sut y maent yn canolbwyntio ar ddefnyddwyr, a sut y gall defnyddwyr a chleifion gael y gwasanaethau hynny, boed yng Nghymru neu yn unman arall yn y DU. Yr wyf bob amser wedi credu, ni waeth beth y mae datganoli'n ei olygu inni, ei bod yn rhaid iddo yn y pen draw olygu darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus sydd nid yn unig yn wahanol, ond yn well, gan roi cyfle i bobl allu cael gwasanaethau y tu allan i Gymru, os tybir bod hynny'n angenrheidiol. Dylem fod yn defnyddio arferion da o'r tu allan i Gymru yn helaeth. Croesawaf y ddadl hon hefyd yng ngoleuni'r ffaith fod y Llywodraeth wedi cyhoeddi ei harolwg *Byw yng Nghymru*. Gwrandewais yn astud ar gyfweiliad y Gweinidog dros Gyllid a Chyflenwi Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus y bore yma ar Radio Wales ar yr union bwnc hwn.

Wrth gynnig y gwelliannau yn enw William Graham, hoffwn ganolbwyntio ar dri mater penodol, sef egwyddor rhoi dewis i gleifion ym maes gofal iechyd, diwygio'r broses ymgynghoriadau cyhoeddus a'r ffordd y caiff gwasanaethau eu hail-lunio, a'r diffyg ymgysylltu â'r sectorau annibynnol a gwirfoddol.

Dylid hybu'r egwyddor o roi dewis i gleifion a chynnwys y defnyddiwr mewn gofal iechyd. Ni ddylai'r datganiad hwnnw synnu Aelodau; mae'n egwyddor yr ydym wedi'i ffafrio ers blynyddoedd lawer. Nid oes gan y Llywodraeth ddim i'w ofni drwy gynnwys defnyddwyr gwasanaethau na thrwy ymestyn a hybu'r egwyddor o roi dewis ym maes gofal iechyd i'r rheiny y mae arnynt angen gwasanaethau penodol. Pwysleisiodd y Gweinidog dros Gyllid a Chyflenwi Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus y bore yma fod cynnwys defnyddwyr gwasanaethau'n hollbwysig. Os credwch hynny, yna mae

I hope that the Minister accepts that. In fact, it was the Labour Government between 2003 and 2007 that decided to give patients a choice as to whether or not they would wait longer on an NHS waiting list or accept the principle of the second-offer scheme and get private treatment somewhere in England. The Government has itself accepted the principle of patient choice in the NHS.

4.10 p.m.

I have heard the rhetoric about not liking the private sector or the internal market, and I know that that has come from the junior partners in the coalition, but there are plenty of examples to show where the Government has advanced the cause of patient choice and user involvement in the past to deliver better services to those who can make informed decisions about what healthcare they need and where they need it. I do not think that you can ignore that, and, on that basis alone, you have sure grounds for advancing the cause of patient choice and service user involvement. If you believe in involving service users, you should also believe in reforming the process of public consultation.

David Lloyd: We had a debate on keeping neurosurgery services at Swansea in the second Assembly. Some 105,000 patients signed a petition saying that that was what they wanted to happen. That was their choice, yet the Conservative line that day was that the decision should be up to Health Commission Wales and clinicians. You were oblivious to patient choice on that occasion, so what has happened since?

Jonathan Morgan: You are missing the point that there is a huge difference between which organisation physically takes the decision to redesign services and the means by which consultation is undertaken on reaching that decision. You will know that I have raised points on numerous occasions about the way in which public consultation has been undertaken. As I told the Minister for Health earlier, when you look at the

ymestyn hynny i hybu dewis i gleifion ym maes gofal iechyd yn ddatblygiad naturiol. Gobeithio bod y Gweinidog yn derbyn hynny. Yn wir, y Llywodraeth Lafur rhwng 2003 a 2007 a benderfynodd roi dewis i gleifion rhwng aros yn hwy ar restr aros y GIG a derbyn egwyddor cynllun yr ail gynnig, a chael triniaeth breifat rywle yn Lloegr. Mae'r Llywodraeth ei hun wedi derbyn yr egwyddor o roi dewis i gleifion yn y GIG.

Yr wyf wedi clywed y rhethreg am beidio â hoffi'r sector preifat na'r farchnad fewnol, a gwn fod hynny wedi dod gan bartneriaid iau y glymblaid. Ond mae digonedd o enghreifftiau sy'n dangos ymhle mae'r Llywodraeth, yn y gorffennol, wedi hybu rhoi dewis i gleifion a chynnwys defnyddwyr er mwyn darparu gwell gwasanaethau i'r bobl hynny a all wneud penderfyniadau deallus am y gofal iechyd y mae arnynt ei angen ac ymhle y mae arnynt ei angen. Ni chredaf y gallwch anwybyddu hynny, ac ar y sail honno'n unig mae gennych seiliau sicr i hybu rhoi dewis i gleifion a chynnwys defnyddwyr gwasanaethau. Os ydych yn credu mewn cynnwys defnyddwyr gwasanaethau, dylech hefyd gredu mewn diwygio'r broses ymgynghori cyhoeddus.

David Lloyd: Cawsom drafodaeth am gadw'r gwasanaethau niwrolawdriniaeth yn Abertawe yn yr ail Gynulliad. Llofnododd tua 105,000 o gleifion ddeiseb yn dweud mai dyna'r oeddent am ei weld yn digwydd. Dyna'u dewis hwy, ond llinell y Ceidwadwyr y diwrnod hwnnw oedd mai Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru a'r clinigwyr a ddylai benderfynu. Ni roesoch ddim sylw i roi dewis i gleifion bryd hynny, felly, beth sydd wedi digwydd ers hynny?

Jonathan Morgan: Yr ydych yn colli'r pwynt bod gwahaniaeth aruthrol rhwng pa sefydliadau sy'n ffisegol yn gwneud y penderfyniad i ail-lunio gwasanaethau a sut yr ymgynghorir am wneud y penderfyniad hwnnw. Gwyddoch fy mod wedi codi pwyntiau droeon am y ffordd y cynhelir ymgynghoriadau cyhoeddus. Fel y dywedais wrth y Gweinidog dros Iechyd gynnu, pan edrychwch ar yr holl adolygiadau annibynnol

independent reviews of all those decisions—whether on neurosurgery at Llandudno hospital, or Prince Philip, Prestatyn and Blaenau Ffestiniog hospitals—the overriding theme to emerge is the handling of the public consultation process. We need to be doing more to tighten up the public consultation process. We need to examine the guidance, and we need to reform how people are involved—and not just members of the public, but also the clinicians. They have to be well informed, a report has to be well consulted on, and people need the opportunity to state their view. My disagreement was with whether it should be this organisation's job to make such a decision, or whether it should be made at arm's length, but that debate is altogether different from the one about how we consult members of the public.

In saying that we need to reform the public consultation process, the Minister for Health confirmed that her predecessor had got public consultation dreadfully wrong. We should be engaging people more about how services are delivered.

My third point is about the lack of engagement with the independent and voluntary sectors. As a Government, you relied on the private sector to bail you out of long waiting times, and you relied on the voluntary and charitable sectors to increase capacity for cancer and mental health care, and palliative care—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Will you wind up, Jonathan?

Jonathan Morgan: I will.

The Government shows a worrying ignorance when it comes to mixed-sector provision in healthcare, and all that that could achieve for patients. The twenty-first model needs people involved other than those who are directly employed by the health service.

Jenny Randerson: I start by making it clear that we will not support the Conservative amendment on the divergence of policy. It is a necessary outcome of devolution that

o'r holl benderfyniadau hynny—boed am niwrolawdriniaeth yn ysbyty Llandudno, neu yn ysbytai'r Tywysog Philip, Prestatyn neu Flaenau Ffestiniog—y brif thema a ddaw i'r amlwg yw delio â phroses ymgynghori cyhoeddus. Mae angen inni fod yn gwneud rhagor i gryfhau'r broses ymgynghori cyhoeddus. Mae angen inni archwilio'r canllawiau, ac mae angen inni ddiwygio sut y cynhwysir pobl—ac nid y cyhoedd yn unig, ond hefyd y clinigwyr. Rhaid iddynt fod yn wybodus, rhaid ymgynghori'n helaeth am unrhyw adroddiad, ac mae ar bobl angen y cyfle i ddweud eu barn. Anghytuno'r oeddwn i ar y cwestiwn ai'r sefydliad hwn a ddylai wneud penderfyniad o'r fath, ynteu a ddylid ei wneud o hyd braich. Ond mae honno'n ddadl gwbl wahanol i'r ddadl am y ffordd yr ymgynghorwn â'r cyhoedd.

Drwy ddweud bod angen inni ddiwygio'r broses ymgynghori cyhoeddus, cadarnhaodd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd fod ei rhagflaenydd wedi methu'n echrydus gydag ymgynghori cyhoeddus. Dylem fod yn ymgysylltu mwy â phobl am y ffordd y darperir gwasanaethau.

Fy nhrydydd pwynt yw'r diffyg ymgysylltu â'r sector annibynnol a'r sector gwirfoddol. Fel Llywodraeth, yr oeddech yn dibynnu ar y sector preifat i'ch achub o safbwynt amseroedd aros maith, ac yn dibynnu ar y sector gwirfoddol ac elusennol i gynyddu capasiti mewn meysydd megis gofal canser a iechyd meddwl a gofal lliniarol—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. A wnewch chi ddirwyn i ben, Jonathan?

Jonathan Morgan: Gwnaf.

Mae'r Llywodraeth yn dangos anwybodaeth sy'n peri pryder o safbwynt darpariaeth sectorau cymysg ym maes gofal iechyd a phopeth y gallai hynny ei gyflawni i gleifion. Ym model yr unfed ganrif ar hugain, mae angen cynnwys pobl heblaw'r rheiny a gyflogir yn uniongyrchol gan y gwasanaeth iechyd.

Jenny Randerson: Dechreuaf drwy ddweud yn bendant na fyddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant y Ceidwadwyr ar ymwahanu polisiau. Un o ganlyniadau angenrheidiol datganoli yw y

policies in different countries start to diverge according to local needs. That diversity should be taking place at an even lower level. What is good for Merthyr is not necessarily good for Pembrokeshire, and is not what people want. Yesterday's spat between Ben Bradshaw and Edwina Hart underlined the tensions that such diversity appears to be creating, but it is not the case that that diversity is wrong. We should be concerned only about failing policies.

Jonathan Morgan: That displays a lack of understanding of what amendment 4 actually says.

'notes with concern the continued divergence in Welsh Assembly Government public service delivery policy'.

It does not actually mention divergence between Wales and England.

Jenny Randerson: I cannot enter into a question-and-answer session, but I might ask divergence from what? You have to diverge from something.

The Government's amendment asks us to recognise that it is already taking proper account of cross-border issues. I certainly cannot support that view. We would not have tabled the motion for debate had we thought that the Government was already on top of the issue. If the Government thinks that it is already taking proper account of cross-border issues, then I inform it that it is out of touch and seriously mistaken.

When the Minister for Health and Social Services announced her intention to force neurosurgery patients from north Wales to use south Wales hospitals, was she considering the needs of those north Wales patients? Last year, 660 patients from north Wales needed neurosurgical treatment. Of those, only 13 came to Swansea or Cardiff. The overwhelming majority—599 of them, in fact—went to Liverpool. More people went to Sheffield, Manchester or London than came to south Wales, largely because it is a lot easier to get to those cities than it is to get to south Wales. It makes no sense for people to travel for four or four and a half hours to

bydd polisïau mewn gwahanol wledydd yn dechrau ymwahanu yn ôl anghenion lleol. Dylai'r amrywiaeth hwnnw fod yn digwydd ar lefel is fyth. Nid yw'r hyn sy'n dda i Ferthyr o anghenraid yn dda i sir Benfro, ac nid dyna y mae ar bobl ei eisiau. Tanlinellodd y ffræ ddoe rhwng Ben Bradshaw ac Edwina Hart y tensiwn y mae amrywiaeth o'r fath yn ei greu i bob golwg, ond nid yw'n golygu bod yr amrywiaeth hwnnw'n anghyfiawn. Ni ddylem fod yn ymwneud yn unig â pholisïau sy'n methu.

Jonathan Morgan: Mae yna ddiffyg dealltwriaeth am yr hyn y mae gwelliant 4 yn ei ddweud mewn gwirionedd.

'yn nodi â phryder y dargyfeirio parhaus ym mholisi darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'.

Nid yw'n crybwyll mewn gwirionedd ymwahanu rhwng Cymru a Lloegr.

Jenny Randerson: Ni allaf ymuno â sesiwn holi ac ateb, ond rhaid imi ofyn: ymwahanu oddi wrth beth? Rhaid ichi ymwahanu oddi wrth rywbeth.

Mae gwelliant y Llywodraeth yn gofyn inni gydnabod ei bod eisoes yn rhoi ystyriaeth briodol i faterion trawsffiniol. Yn sicr ni allaf gefnogi'r farn honno. Ni fyddem wedi cyflwyno cynnig y ddadl hon pe baem yn credu bod y Llywodraeth eisoes yn feistr ar y mater hwn. Os yw'r Llywodraeth yn credu ei bod eisoes yn rhoi ystyriaeth briodol i faterion trawsffiniol, dywedaf wrthi ei bod yn fyddar ac yn camgymryd yn arw.

Pan gyhoeddodd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ei bwriad i orfodi cleifion niwrolawdriniaeth o'r gogledd i ddefnyddio ysbytai'r de, a oedd hi'n ystyried anghenion y cleifion gogleddol hynny? Y llynedd, yr oedd angen triniaeth niwrolawfeddygol ar 660 o gleifion o'r gogledd. O'r rhain, dim ond 13 a ddaeth i Abertawe neu Gaerdydd. Aeth y mwyafrif llethol—599 ohonynt, yn wir—i Lerpwl. Aeth mwy o bobl i Sheffield, Manceinion neu Lundain nag a ddaeth i'r de, yn bennaf oherwydd ei bod lawer yn haws cyrraedd y dinasoedd hynny na chyrraedd de Cymru. Nid yw'n gwneud dim synnwyr i bobl deithio

access neurosurgical treatment. It is only right, in our mind, that people in north Wales should be able to use services in Liverpool, because for many people in north Wales—for historical reasons as well as access to the A55—that is the natural focal point. If there is an identifiable clinical need for people to come to south Wales hospitals, then that is what should happen, but to force patients and their families to travel to south Wales adds another level of stress to what is, already, a difficult time for them.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): Mr Stephens, a constituent of mine from Monmouth, has a 14-year-old daughter with a bone abnormality in both feet who finds it difficult to walk. She has been receiving specialist care in Oxford, but was told by the Welsh Assembly Government central command that she had to go to Birmingham. On arrival in Birmingham, she was told that she should be seeing a specialist in Oxford. She went back to the Welsh Assembly Government central command, where she was told that she should be seeing someone in Cardiff. In Cardiff, she was told by specialist carers that she should be in Oxford. Is that the way to treat our patients?

Jenny Randerson: That is a truly disgraceful example. I strongly recommend, if you have not already done so, that you take it up with the Minister, because that is an inhuman way to treat anyone.

However, the reality is that it is not just a question of specialist care of the sort that Mike has just referred to—it is everyday stuff. Paul Murphy revealed in the House of Commons last week that 14,000 Welsh residents are registered with an English GP and that 19,000 English residents are registered with a Welsh GP. That is the natural ebb and flow of life in the borderlands. It is not anti-devolution for us to make this case. We are arguing for the devolution process to go further and for it to become more sophisticated and more sensitive. We are not arguing for the Welsh Assembly Government to make all the

am bedair awr neu bedair awr a hanner i gael triniaeth niwrolawfeddygol. Nid yw ond yn iawn, yn ein barn ni, y dylai pobl yn y gogledd allu defnyddio gwasanaethau yn Lerpwl, oherwydd i lawer o bobl yn y gogledd—am resymau hanesyddol yn ogystal â mynediad i'r A55—dyna'r canolbwynt naturiol. Os oes angen clinigol canfyddadwy i bobl ddod i ysbytai'r de, yna dyna a ddylai ddigwydd. Ond mae gorfodi cleifion a'u teuluoedd i deithio i'r de yn ychwanegu lefel arall o straen at yr hyn sydd eisoes yn adeg anodd iawn iddynt.

Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): Mae gan Mr Stephens, un o'm hetholwyr o Drefynwy, ferch 14 oed sydd ag abnormaledd yn esgyrn ei dwy droed, sy'n peri ei bod yn cael anhawster i gerdded. Mae wedi bod yn cael gofal arbenigol yn Rhydychen, ond dywedwyd wrthi gan uned reoli ganolog Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ei bod yn rhaid iddi fynd i Birmingham. Wedi iddi gyrraedd Birmingham, dywedwyd wrthi y dylai fod yn gweld arbenigwr yn Rhydychen. Aeth yn ôl at uned reoli ganolog Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, lle dywedwyd wrthi y dylai fod yn gweld rhywun yng Nghaerdydd. Yng Nghaerdydd, dywedwyd wrthi gan ofalwyr arbenigol y dylai fod yn Rhydychen. Ai dyna'r ffordd i drin ein cleifion?

Jenny Randerson: Mae hynny'n enghraifft wirioneddol warthus. Argymhellaf yn gryf, os nad ydych wedi gwneud hynny eisoes, y dylech godi'r mater gyda'r Gweinidog, oherwydd mae hynny'n ffordd annynol i drin unrhyw un.

Fodd bynnag, y realiti yw nad cwestiwn yn unig o ofal arbenigol o'r math y cyfeiriodd Mike ato yw hwn—mae'n ymwneud â phethau pob dydd. Datgelodd Paul Murphy yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin yr wythnos diwethaf fod 14,000 o drigolion Cymru wedi'u cofrestru gyda meddyg teulu yn Lloegr, a bod 19,000 o drigolion Lloegr wedi'u cofrestru gyda meddyg teulu yng Nghymru. Dyna lanw a thrai naturiol bywyd ar y gororau. Nid bod yn wrth-ddatganoli yr ydym wrth ddadlau'r achos hwn. Yr ydym yn dadlau dros i'r broses ddatganoli fynd ymhellach ac iddi ddod yn fwy soffistigedig a mwy sensitif. Nid ydym yn dadlau na ddylai Llywodraeth

decisions—ill-informed decisions in the case that Mike just mentioned—with no knowledge of the individual case or reality of local circumstances; those decisions should be made locally by the relevant local health board, the relevant local education authority, and so on.

Local decision-makers are far more in tune with the needs of local people and are best placed to determine the best service for them. As a general principle, health matters are rightly devolved to the Assembly, but there are certain types of specialist care that are impractical to deliver at a Wales-only level. Certain specialist treatments can only be dealt with at perhaps one, two or three dedicated centres in the whole of the UK. To try to replicate that in Wales will denude the rest of the health service of money that is desperately needed by a large number of patients.

Nick Bourne: I thank the Liberal Democrats for bringing forward this important debate. I will concentrate on healthcare, which is one aspect of public services. Wales is not an island—it is not a geographic island and it is not a health island. Many specialist services in Wales are available to people from England, such as burns services in Morriston Hospital. Therefore, I view with alarm the language sometimes used by Plaid Cymru Members, in particular—although they are not currently in the Chamber—who seem to think that spending money on the health service in England somehow represents a massive threat to us in Wales, rather than seeing it as providing a service to Welsh patients. It is as if Cheshire or Herefordshire represent some kind of military threat to Wales. That is true of one Member in particular, though she is not on the frontbench at the moment, so I will not enlarge on that. Jenny mentioned neurosurgery in Liverpool, and that must be available to Welsh patients—it is an absolute must.

4.20 p.m.

I will mention a slightly separate issue, and I am glad that the Minister for health is here to

Cynulliad Cymru wneud y penderfyniadau i gyd—penderfyniadau anwybodus yn yr achos a grybwyllodd Mike gynnu—heb ddim gwybodaeth am yr achos unigol nac am realiti'r amgylchiadau lleol; dylid gwneud y penderfyniadau hynny'n lleol gan y bwrdd iechyd lleol perthnasol, yr awdurdod addysg lleol perthnasol, ac ati.

Mae pobl sy'n gwneud penderfyniadau lleol lawer yn nes at anghenion pobl leol ac yn y sefyllfa orau i benderfynu'r gwasanaeth gorau ar eu cyfer. Fel egwyddor gyffredinol, mae'n iawn fod materion iechyd wedi'u datganoli i'r Cynulliad, ond mae rhai mathau o ofal arbenigol y mae'n anymarferol eu darparu ar lefel Cymru'n unig. Mae rhai triniaethau arbenigol na ellir delio â hwy ond mewn un, dwy neu dair canolfan benodol efallai yn y Deyrnas Unedig gyfan. Bydd ceisio atgynhyrchu hynny yng Nghymru'n amddifadu gweddill y gwasanaeth iechyd o arian y mae ei ddirfawr angen ar nifer fawr o gleifion.

Nick Bourne: Diolch i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol am gyflwyno'r ddadl bwysig hon. Yr wyf am ganolbwyntio ar ofal iechyd, sef un agwedd ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus. Nid ynys yw Cymru—nid ynys ddaearyddol mohoni ac nid ynys iechyd mohoni. Mae nifer o wasanaethau arbenigol yng Nghymru ar gael i bobl o Loegr, megis gwasanaethau llosgiadau yn Ysbyty Treforys. Felly, mae'r iaith a ddefnyddir weithiau gan Aelodau Plaid Cymru, yn arbennig—er nad ydynt yn y Siambr ar hyn o bryd—yn fy mrawychu. Maent fel pe baent yn credu bod gwario arian ar y gwasanaeth iechyd yn Lloegr rywsut yn fygythiad enfawr i ni yng Nghymru, yn hytrach na'i weld fel ffordd i ddarparu gwasanaeth i gleifion Cymru. Mae fel petai Swydd Caer neu Swydd Henffordd yn rhyw fath o fygythiad milwrol i Gymru. Mae hynny'n wir am un Aelod yn arbennig, er nad yw hi ar y fainc flaen ar hyn o bryd, felly, nid ymhelaethaf ar hynny. Soniodd Jenny am niwrolawfeddygaeth yn Lerpwl, a rhaid i hynny fod ar gael i gleifion o Gymru—mae'n rheidrydd.

Soniaf am fater ychydig yn wahanol, ac yr wyf yn falch fod y Gweinidog Iechyd yma i

hear this—I know that she has been working on this—namely the further centralisation of the services of the cancer network in Worcestershire, Herefordshire and Gloucestershire. One of the proposals is to place it in Cheltenham, which has the potential to deprive patients in Powys, whom I represent, of a radiotherapy unit within a reasonable travelling distance of their homes. The UK national cancer strategy recommends that no patient should have to travel more than 45 minutes for cancer treatment. That target will not be met if those services are centralised in Cheltenham, or even as far away as Worcester. We therefore support the development of a satellite radiotherapy centre at Hereford County Hospital to complement the chemotherapy services that are currently available there in the dedicated cancer centre to be known as the Charles Renton unit. That is important, and I have been in touch with the person leading on this issue in Herefordshire, Councillor Kay Swinburne, to put across our views; we have met to discuss the issue.

It is important that the Assembly supports what would be the first satellite radiotherapy centre in the UK, and given the rurality of the area, it is vital that this is centralised in Hereford and not at Cheltenham or Worcester. The support of the Welsh Assembly Government and commissioning authorities from Wales is important in achieving that. A journey to Cheltenham or Worcester would represent a massive distance for people from Rhayader, for example, who would already have a long way to go to Hereford. I hope that the Minister will take some action on that, and although I assume that Andrew Davies will respond to this debate, I would be grateful to the Minister for health for action on that. Perhaps she could let Members know what she is doing on that issue.

I will conclude by saying that this is an important issue, and we should not see the provision of services in England as a threat. We know that people access educational and health services across the border, in both directions. In the border areas, and sometimes beyond, we must recognise that it is natural for people to do that. I hope that we can nail that one, because sometimes Plaid Cymru, in

glywed hyn—gwn iddi fod yn gweithio ar hyn—sef y canoli pellach ar wasanaethau'r rhwydwaith canser yn Swydd Gaerwrangon, Swydd Henffordd a Swydd Gaerloyw. Un o'r cynigion yw ei leoli yn Cheltenham, a allai amddifadu cleifion ym Mhowys yr wyf fi'n eu cynrychioli o uned radiotherapi o fewn pellter teithio rhesymol i'w cartrefi. Mae strategaeth genedlaethol y Deyrnas Unedig ar gyfer canser yn argymhell na ddylai'r un claf orfod teithio mwy na 45 munud am driniaeth canser. Ni chyrhaeddir y targed hwnnw os canolir y gwasanaethau hynny yn Cheltenham, neu hyd yn oed mor bell i ffwrdd â Chaerwrangon. Felly, cefnogwn ddatblygu is-ganolfan radiotherapi yn Ysbyty Sirol Henffordd i ategu'r gwasanaethau cemotherapi sydd ar gael yno ar hyn o bryd, yn y ganolfan ganser arbennig a elwir yn uned Charles Renton. Mae hynny'n bwysig, ac yr wyf wedi bod mewn cysylltiad â'r person sy'n arwain ar y mater hwn yn Swydd Henffordd, y Cynghorydd Kay Swinbourne, i gyflwyno ein sylwadau; yr ydym wedi cwrdd i drafod y mater.

Mae'n bwysig i'r Cynulliad gefnogi is-ganolfan radiotherapi a fyddai'r gyntaf yn y Deyrnas Unedig, ac o gofio mor wledig yw'r ardal, mae'n hollbwysig canoli hon yn Henffordd ac nid yn Cheltenham neu Gaerwrangon. Mae cefnogaeth Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ac awdurdodau comisiynu o Gymru yn bwysig i sicrhau hynny. Byddai taith i Cheltenham neu Gaerwrangon yn bellter aruthrol i bobl o Raeadr Gwy, er enghraifft, a fyddai'n gorfod mynd cryn bellter yn barod i gyrraedd Henffordd. Gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn gweithredu ar hynny, ac er y tybiaf mai Andrew Davies a fydd yn ymateb i'r ddadl hon, byddwn yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog Iechyd am weithredu ar hynny. Efallai y gallai roi gwybod i Aelodau beth y mae hi'n ei wneud ar y mater hwnnw.

I gloi, dywedaf fod hwn yn fater pwysig, ac ni ddylem ystyried bod darparu gwasanaethau yn Lloegr yn fgythyad. Gwyddom fod pobl yn croesi'r ffin am wasanaethau addysgol ac iechyd, i'r ddau gyfeiriad. Yn ardaloedd y gororau, a thu hwnt weithiau, rhaid inni gydnabod ei bod yn naturiol i bobl wneud hynny. Gobeithio y gallwn roi caead ar y mater hwnnw,

particular, seem to treat Wales as if it were St Helena, thousands of miles from anywhere.

Eleanor Burnham: I believe that, in many ways, devolution and the development of our confident nation is progressing quite well. Dr Hywel Francis, chair of the Welsh Affairs Committee, said recently that

‘as a consequence of devolution and constitutional change, we have seen policy divergence in the delivery of public services across the UK, often leading to distinct and contradictory provision’.

That is exactly what the Liberal Democrats are trying to clarify. I make no apology for discussing health again. I believe that health provision for some of my north Wales constituents, as others have mentioned, is quite unfair. One lady in Connah’s Quay has been refused timely deep brain stimulation at Alton Hospital. I happen to know a bit about neurosurgery provision at Alton, because my sister is successfully recovering from a recent operation there, and has nothing but praise for the wonderful treatment that she received. I know that Edwina Hart is reviewing this, and I look forward to a positive outcome on the matter. However, there are other issues, such as transport.

Yr wyf yn deall bod gwelliannau yn digwydd yn Lloegr o 1 Ebrill, sy’n golygu y bydd rhai pobl yn gallu teithio am ddim, fel sy’n digwydd yng Nghymru. Ond mae dryswch, ac nid wyf yn siŵr a yw’r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog wedi deall effaith yr hyn sy’n digwydd yn Lloegr arnom ni yng Nghymru. Mae pobl o fy ardal i, yn yr Orsedd, yn teithio dros y ffin; yr ydym yn gallu mynd i Gaer neu Lerpwl yn eithaf hawdd ar y trê. Ond mae llawer o broblemau, ac yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd Ieuan Wyn Jones yn ymchwilio i’r mater hwn.

The Welsh Assembly Government needs to work with the UK Government to ensure that the kind of complications that can arise, cross border, leading to confusion for passengers, do not continue. On the one hand, we are

oherwydd weithiau mae’n ymddangos bod Plaid Cymru, yn arbennig, yn trin Cymru fel petai yn St Helena, filoedd o filltiroedd i ffwrdd o unman.

Eleanor Burnham: Mewn llawer ffordd, credaf fod datganoli a datblygiad ein cenedl hyderus yn mynd rhagddynt yn lled dda. Dywedodd Dr Hywel Francis, cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Materion Cymreig, yn ddiweddar

yn sgil datganoli a newid cyfansoddiadol, yr ydym wedi gweld dargyfeirio polisi wrth gyflwyno gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ar draws y Deyrnas Unedig, a hynny’n aml yn golygu darpariaeth wahanol a gwrthgyferbyniol.

Dyna’n union y mae’r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn ceisio’i wneud yn eglurach. Nid ymddiheuraf am drafod iechyd eto. Credaf fod y ddarpariaeth iechyd i rai o’r hetholwyr yn y gogledd, fel y soniodd eraill, yn gwbl annheg. Gwrthodwyd cyffroad ymenyddol dwfn amserol yn Ysbyty Alton i ddynes yng Nghei Connah. Yr wyf yn digwydd gwybod tipyn am y ddarpariaeth niwrolawfeddygol yn Alton, oherwydd mae fy chwaer yn gwella’n llwyddiannus wedi llawdriniaeth yno’n ddiweddar, ac nid oes ganddi ddim byd ond canmoliaeth o’r driniaeth fendigedig a gafodd. Gwn fod Edwina Hart yn adolygu hyn, ac edrychaf ymlaen at ganlyniad cadarnhaol ar y mater. Fodd bynnag, y mae yna faterion eraill, megis cludiant.

I understand improvements will take place in England from 1 April, which means that some people will be able to travel free of charge, as they do here in Wales. However, there is some confusion, and I am not entirely sure whether the Deputy First Minister has understood the effect on Wales of developments in England. People from my own area, in Rossett, are able to travel across the border—we can travel quite easily to Chester and Liverpool by train. However, there are some difficulties and I hope Ieuan Wyn Jones will look into this matter.

Mae angen i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru weithio gyda Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig i sicrhau y bydd diwedd ar y math o gymhlethdodau a all godi, ar draws y ffin, gan arwain at ddryswch i deithwyr. Ar y naill

pleased to have devolution and free travel, but on the other hand, some people get confused. Politicians get a bad reputation because people often say that we do not know what we are doing and are not helping people in general. Therefore, I urge the Government to support our motion and to consider these matters carefully. What we want is a developing devolution that benefits people across the whole of Wales and does not disadvantage them, particularly in terms of health.

Lesley Griffiths: As an Assembly Member who represents a constituency on the English border, I am pleased to be able to speak in this debate today. This morning, I met with the Deputy First Minister and Neil Scales, the chief executive and director general of Mersey Travel. The topic of our conversation was the electrification of the Wrexham to Bidston railway line, which is now known as the Borderlands line. This railway line is a strategically crucial project that would be mutually beneficial to my constituency and the neighbouring constituency of Carl Sargeant, and the whole of Merseyside. Indeed, if this project comes to fruition, it will be beneficial for the whole of north Wales. It is a prime example of sensible cross-border co-operation and collaboration, with the Welsh Assembly Government and Mersey Travel working together to fund the acceleration of a technical feasibility study into this line by Network Rail, the results of which are expected later this week. It proves that, where feasible, collaboration with our neighbours on common issues is not only important inter-regionally, but is plain common sense.

Sadly, in recent times, the term 'cross-border' has been hijacked by self-styled sceptics of devolution, and the phrase is now almost a metaphor for the lack of aspiration and ambition that is infecting the body politic in certain parts of Wales. It is a lack of aspiration that I do not share. In order to understand the train of thought that says that we should cling to neighbouring English regions as the sole providers of services, we should follow it through to its natural conclusion in policy terms.

law, yr ydym yn falch o gael datganoli a theithio am ddim, ond ar y llaw arall, mae rhai pobl yn drysu. Caiff gwleidyddion enw drwg oherwydd bydd pobl yn dweud yn aml nad ydym yn gwybod beth yr ydym yn ei wneud ac nad ydym yn helpu pobl yn gyffredinol. Felly, anogaf y Llywodraeth i gefnogi ein cynnig ac i ystyried y materion hyn yn ofalus. Yr hyn y mae arnom ei eisiau yw datganoli sy'n datblygu gan ddod â budd i bobl ar hyd a lled Cymru gyfan heb beri anfantais iddynt, yn enwedig o safbwynt iechyd.

Lesley Griffiths: Fel Aelod Cynulliad sy'n cynrychioli etholaeth ar y ffin â Lloegr, yr wyf yn falch cael siarad yn y ddadl hon heddiw. Y bore yma, cyfarfûm â'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a Neil Scales, prif weithredwr a chyfarwyddwr cyffredinol Mersey Travel. Pwnc ein trafodaeth oedd trydaneiddio lein rheilffordd Wrecsam i Bidston, a elwir erbyn hyn yn Lein y Gororau. Mae'r lein hon yn brosiect strategol allweddol a fyddai o les i'm hetholaeth i ac etholaeth Carl Sargeant nesaf ati, ac i Lannau Mersi i gyd. Yn wir, os gwireddir y prosiect hwn, bydd o les i ogledd Cymru'n gyfan. Mae'n enghraifft berffaith o gydweithredu a chydweithio call ar draws y ffin, lle mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a Mersey Travel yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd i dalu am gyflymu astudiaeth dichonolrwydd technegol ar y lein hon gan Network Rail, y disgwylir ei chanlyniadau'n ddiweddarach yr wythnos hon. Mae'n profi bod cydweithio gyda'n cymdogion ar faterion cyffredin, lle mae'n ymarferol, nid yn unig yn bwysig rhwng rhanbarthau ond yn synnwyr cyffredin plaen.

Yn anffodus, yn ddiweddar mae'r term 'trawsffiniol' wedi'i herwgipio gan y rhai sy'n galw'u hunain yn amheuwyr datganoli, ac mae'r ymadrodd bellach bron yn drosiad am y diffyg dyhead ac uchelgais sy'n heintio'r genedl wleidyddol mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru. Mae'n ddiffyg dyhead nad wyf fi'n ei rannu. Er mwyn deall y meddylfryd sy'n dweud y dylem gadw at ranbarthau cyfagos Lloegr fel unig ddarparwyr gwasanaethau, dylem ei ddilyn drwodd i'w gasgliad naturiol o ran polisi.

One question that it throws up is why bother trying to ensure that the North East Wales Institute of Higher Education in Wrexham achieves university status? Manchester, Liverpool and Keele universities are almost within one hour's drive of Wrexham. Why bother with economic development in Wrexham? The economic dynamos of Liverpool and Manchester are right on our doorstep. Why bother to attract inward investment to Wrexham when these cities are just over the border? We know that there is currently a huge debate about the lack of a prison in north Wales. We have Walton and Altcourse prisons in Liverpool, Strangeways in Manchester, and Styal in Cheshire—again, right on our doorstep—so why bother having one in north Wales? I could go on, but I will not, because the natural conclusion of this train of thought is not sustainable, unless there is an ulterior motive for it in the first place.

As other speakers have stated, it is in the provision of NHS services that this is most exposed. Ever since the Assembly was established, there has been a fractious and difficult working relationship between Welsh and English trusts, and it still goes on today. It is not as if, by aspiring to deliver our own services in Wales, we are disturbing some paradise-like equilibrium in the relationship between English trusts and the Assembly Government on the delivery of healthcare. The track record of English trusts in treating Welsh patients—my constituents—has not always been a happy one. We all know that Welsh patients were often shoved to the back of waiting lists for many years.

As I said at the start, sensible cross-border co-operation and collaboration is plain common sense, but we must not limit our vision as to what we can achieve in Wales, for Wales and for the people of Wales. I was not elected to the Assembly on a manifesto of limited and blinkered vision and handwringing; I was elected to deliver for the people of Wrexham a vision of what can be achieved by the Assembly on their behalf, and in their interest. That is my purpose and that is why I was elected.

Un cwestiwn y mae'n ei godi yw pam trafferthu ceisio sicrhau bod Athrofa Addysg Uwch Gogledd-ddwyrain Cymru yn Wrecsam yn ennill statws prifysgol? Mae prifysgolion Manceinion, Lerpwl a Keele bron o fewn siwrnai awr mewn car o Wrecsam. Pam trafferthu gyda datblygu economaidd yn Wrecsam? Mae deinamos economaidd Lerpwl a Manceinion ar garreg ein drws. Pam trafferthu denu buddsoddiad i mewn i Wrecsam, a'r dinasoedd hyn daflad carreg dros y ffin? Gwyddom fod dadl enfawr ar hyn o bryd ynghylch y diffyg carchar yn y gogledd. Mae gennym garchardai Walton ac Altcourse yn Lerpwl, Strangeways ym Manceinion, a Styal yn Swydd Gaer—eto, ar garreg ein drws—felly, pam trafferthu cael un yng ngogledd Cymru? Gallwn fynd ymlaen, ond ni wnaf, oherwydd nid yw casgliad naturiol y meddylfryd hwn yn gynaliadwy, oni bai fod cymhelliad cudd iddo yn y lle cyntaf.

Fel y dywedodd siaradwyr eraill, yn narpariaeth gwasanaethau'r GIG y mae hyn fwyaf amlwg. Byth ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad, bu perthynas weithio gecrus ac anodd rhwng ymddiriedolaethau Cymru a Lloegr, ac mae'n parhau hyd heddiw. Wrth anelu at ddarparu ein gwasanaethau ein hunain yng Nghymru, nid yw fel petaem yn tarfu ar ryw gydbwysedd paradwysaidd yn y berthynas rhwng ymddiriedolaethau Lloegr a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar ddarparu gofal iechyd. Nid yw record ymddiriedolaethau Lloegr o ran trin cleifion Cymru—fy etholwyr i—wedi bod yn un hapus bob tro. Gwyddom i gyd y byddai cleifion o Gymru'n cael eu gwthio'n ôl i gefn rhestri aros am flynyddoedd lawer.

Fel y dywedais ar y dechrau, synnwyr cyffredin yw cael cydweithredu a chydweithio call ar draws y ffin, ond rhaid inni beidio â chyfyngu ein gweledigaeth o ran yr hyn y gallwn ei gyflawni yng Nghymru, dros Gymru a thros bobl Cymru. Ni chefais fy ethol i'r Cynulliad ar fanifesto o ddiffyg gweledigaeth a gwasgu dwylo mewn anobaith; cefais fy ethol i wireddu dros bobl Wrecsam weledigaeth o'r hyn y gall y Cynulliad ei gyflawni ar eu rhan, ac er eu budd. Dyna fy mwriad a dyna pam y'm hetholwyd.

4.30 p.m.

Mark Isherwood: We must develop a health service that meets the needs of communities across Wales, and does not appear to be designed simply to satisfy the political aspirations of governing parties. While we accept that a Welsh health service must reflect the increasing demands placed upon it, it is vital that it also meets the needs of patients, communities and all the regions of Wales. North Wales is part of a health community shared with north-west England, and that has always been the case. However, in contrast with mature federal states, it seems that a slate curtain has descended between public services in England and Wales.

I have previously referred to concerns expressed by the Countess of Chester Hospital NHS Trust on the fact that Welsh patients must wait increasingly longer times, compared with their English counterparts. It is alien to the trust to have to operate different waiting times for patients according to their country of residence. It also highlighted the different funding regimes on different sides of the border. When I wrote to the Minister for Health and Social Services about this, she replied that the hospital's chief executive was 'not correct'. The chief executive now advises me that a compromise funding agreement with Flintshire is in place, but that an underlying funding deficit remains, which will need to be resolved in the longer term. Therefore, they will wish to return to the negotiating table this year. We have simply deferred the problem, not solved it. Patients should and must have local and accessible services. In her statement on 4 July 2007, the Minister stated that,

'in the case of adult neurosurgery, the approach that I now intend to adopt is one in which we will look as actively as possible at redirecting additional elective work generated inside Wales to the two centres at Swansea and Cardiff'.

There is no confusion there. However, as the

Mark Isherwood: Rhaid inni ddatblygu gwasanaeth iechyd sy'n ateb anghenion cymunedau ledled Cymru, gwasanaeth nad yw'n ymddangos fel petai wedi'i gynllunio'n unswydd i ddiwallu dyheadau gwleidyddol y pleidiau sy'n llywodraethu. Er ein bod yn derbyn ei bod yn rhaid i wasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru adlewyrchu'r galwadau cynyddol sydd arno, mae'n hollbwysig iddo hefyd ddiwallu anghenion cleifion, cymunedau a holl ranbarthau Cymru. Mae'r gogledd yn rhan o gymuned iechyd sy'n rhannu gyda gogledd-orllewin Lloegr, ac felly y bu hi erioed. Fodd bynnag, yn wahanol i daleithiau ffederal aeddfed, mae'n ymddangos bod llen o lechi wedi disgyn rhwng gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru a Lloegr.

Yr wyf wedi cyfeirio cyn hyn at bryderon a fynegwyd gan Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Ysbyty Countess of Chester ynglŷn â'r ffaith fod cleifion o Gymru yn gorfod disgwyl am gyfnodau sy'n mynd yn hirach o hyd, o'u cymharu â'u cymheiriaid yn Lloegr. Mae'n beth estron i'r ymddiriedolaeth orfod rhoi amseroedd aros gwahanol ar waith i gleifion yn ôl y wlad lle maent yn byw. Tynnodd sylw hefyd at y cyfundrefnau cyllido gwahanol y naill ochr a'r llall i'r ffin. Pan ysgrifennais at y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol am hyn, dywedodd nad oedd prif weithredwr yr ysbyty yn gywir. Dywed y prif weithredwr wrthyf bellach fod cytundeb cyllido cyfaddawd gyda sir y Fflint wedi ei sefydlu, ond bod diffyg cyllido gwaelodol yn parhau ac y bydd angen ei ddatrys yn y tymor hwy. Felly, maent am ddychwelyd at y bwrdd trafod eleni. Y cyfan a wnaethom yw gohirio'r broblem, nid ei datrys. Dylai fod gan gleifion wasanaethau lleol a chyfleus, a rhaid iddynt eu cael. Yn ei datganiad ar 4 Gorffennaf 2007, dywedodd y Gweinidog,

yn achos niwrolawdriniaeth i oedolion, y dull y bwriadaf ei fabwysiadu'n awr yw dull lle byddwn yn edrych mor fanwl ag y gallwn ar ailgyfeirio gwaith dewisol ychwanegol a gynhyrchir yng Nghymru i'r ddwy ganolfan yn Abertawe a Chaerdydd.

Nid oes yn ddryswch. Fodd bynnag, fel y

muscular dystrophy campaign stated, neuromuscular services are needed across Wales, in collaboration with existing centres and clinics across the UK. Patient care should be delivered by a hub-and-spoke arrangement on a cross-border basis. In that context, I have been invited to chair a neurological discussion day in Wrexham next month. The event is being organised by the Wales Neurological Alliance and the Walton Centre for Neurology and Neurosurgery on Merseyside in partnership. They will be highlighting their very real concerns, and they look forward to the Minister's reporting the outcome of the review on neurosurgery.

I ask again for a categorical statement that no matter what the outcome of the review, no-one will be compelled to travel outside their region for surgery against their wishes. The present cross-border system is creating a second class of patients, with patients from Wales who are travelling to England for treatment having to wait longer than patients in England. I have been contacted by many constituents who are waiting longer to be treated at Gobowen Hospital in Oswestry than patients living in England. The hospital advised me that, in England, the target is to reduce waiting times from referral to first definitive treatment to 18 weeks by December 2008; in Wales, by contrast, the target is a maximum wait of 26 weeks by December 2009. The Wales target of March 2008 is for no-one to wait more than 22 weeks. However, I have been contacted by a constituent, Mr Brian Fisher, who was still on the spinal operating list after 30 weeks. After I wrote to the hospital about this, Mr Fisher received a phone call telling him that his operation would not now meet the target waiting time, and asking him to transfer to Macclesfield Hospital in Cheshire for an operation in April, by which time the waiting time will be closer to 40 weeks.

Cross-border issues also affect our hospices. I am the ambassador in Wales for the Claire House Children's Hospice on the Wirral, which receives half of its patients from north Wales. It is developing a hospice in the

dywedodd ymgyrch dystroffi'r cyhyrau, mae angen gwasanaethau niwrogyhyrol ar draws Cymru, mewn cydweithrediad â chanolfannau a chlinigau presennol ar draws y DU. Dylai gofal i gleifion gael ei ddarparu drwy drefniant both-ac-adeiniau ar draws ffiniau. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, fe'm gwahoddwyd i gadeirio diwrnod trafod niwrolegol yn Wrecsam fis nesaf. Caiff y digwyddiad ei drefnu gan Gynghrair Niwrolegol Cymru a Chanolfan Niwroleg a Niwrolawdriniaeth Walton ar Lannau Mersi. Byddant yn lleisio'u pryderon real iawn, ac maent yn edrych ymlaen at weld y Gweinidog yn cyflwyno adroddiad am ganlyniad yr adolygiad o niwrolawdriniaeth.

Gofynnaf eto am ddatganiad pendant na fydd neb, waeth beth fydd canlyniad yr adolygiad, yn cael ei orfodi i deithio y tu allan i'w ranbarth i gael llawdriniaeth, yn groes i'w ddymuniadau. Mae'r system drawsffiniol bresennol yn creu ail ddsbarth o gleifion, a chleifion o Gymru sy'n teithio i Loegr i gael triniaeth yn gorfod aros yn hwy na chleifion yn Lloegr. Cysylltwyd â mi gan nifer o etholwyr sy'n aros yn hwy i gael triniaeth yn Ysbyty Gobowen yng Nghroesoswallt na chleifion sy'n byw yn Lloegr. Dywedodd yr ysbyty wrthyf mai'r targed er mwyn cwtogi amseroedd aros o'r adeg pan gaiff y claf ei gyfeirio tan y driniaeth swyddogol gyntaf yw 18 wythnos erbyn mis Rhagfyr 2008 yn Lloegr; yng Nghymru, i'r gwrthwyneb, y targed yw cyfnod aros o ddim mwy na 26 wythnos erbyn mis Rhagfyr 2009. Targed Cymru ym mis Mawrth 2008 yw na ddylai neb aros mwy na 22 wythnos. Fodd bynnag, cysylltwyd â mi gan un o'm hetholwyr, Mr Brian Fisher, a oedd yn dal ar y rhestr am lawdriniaeth ar y cefn ar ôl 30 wythnos. Ysgrifennais at yr ysbyty am hyn, a chafodd Mr Fisher alwad ffôn yn dweud wrtho na fyddai ei lawdriniaeth bellach yn bodloni'r amser aros targed, ac yn gofyn iddo drosglwyddo i Ysbyty Macclesfield yn Swydd Gaer i gael llawdriniaeth ym mis Ebrill. Erbyn hynny, bydd yr amser aros yn nes at 40 wythnos.

Mae materion trawsffiniol yn effeithio hefyd ar ein hosbisau. Fi yw llysgennad Cymru yn Hosbis Plant Claire House yng Nghilgwri. Daw hanner cleifion yr hosbis o ogledd Cymru. Mae'n datblygu hosbis yn y

community servicing north Wales and particularly the north-east, but it receives no funding from Wales. Similar concerns are expressed by the Hospice of the Good Shepherd in Chester, and similar issues apply to hospitals on the Welsh side of the border, which provide services to people who travel from England. We need to deliver core funding for hospitals in Wales on a par with England and Scotland, and we also need to plan and deliver provision on a cross-border basis, to reflect the real cross-border health community in which our health service operates.

The Welsh Assembly Government should take notice of the bishops of Monmouth and Hereford, who raised concerns in the Select Committee on Welsh Affairs yesterday that Assembly Government policy to provide all services from within Wales could run counter to its policy of putting patients first. They added that the Assembly Government's isolationist healthcare policy is misconceived and dangerous.

David Lloyd: Cross-border services are an obvious and necessary reality, and we need them now to fulfil health service provision for the people of Wales, especially those in border areas. However, we also need to develop our own services here in Wales, because access to treatment and its local availability is vital to patients wherever they live. Access times to urgent and emergency treatment are a defining factor in the degree of a patient's subsequent clinical recovery and, to be fair, health services have been developing in primary, secondary and tertiary care in Wales in recent years.

I started as a GP in 1984—before some of you were born, no doubt. In that year, one consultant cardiologist was shared between the whole of Swansea and Neath—half each for Swansea and Neath—despite the high prevalence of ischemic heart disease. In 1984, we had five consultant cardiologists for the whole of Wales when there were 31 consultant cardiologists for North East Thames and South East Thames in London, which had a far lower incidence of ischemic

gymuned i wasanaethu gogledd Cymru a'r gogledd-ddwyrain yn arbennig, ond nid yw'n cael cyllid o gwbl o Gymru. Mynegir pryderon tebyg gan Hosbis Good Shepherd yng Nghaer, ac mae ystyriaethau tebyg yn berthnasol i ysbytai ar ochr Cymru o'r ffin, sy'n darparu gwasanaethau i bobl sy'n teithio o Loegr. Mae angen inni ddarparu cyllid craidd i ysbytai yng Nghymru sy'n cyfateb i'r sefyllfa yn Lloegr a'r Alban, ac mae angen hefyd inni gynllunio a chyflwyno darpariaeth ar draws ffiniau, i adlewyrchu'r gymuned iechyd wirioneddol drawsffiniol lle mae ein gwasanaeth iechyd yn gweithredu.

Dylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gymryd sylw o eiriau esgobion Mynwy a Henffordd, a fynegodd bryderon yn y Pwyllgor Dethol ar Faterion Cymreig ddoe y gallai polisi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o ddarparu pob gwasanaeth o fewn Cymru fod yn groes i'w pholisi o roi cleifion yn gyntaf. Ychwanegwyd bod polisi gofal iechyd ymynsol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn annoeth a pheryglus.

David Lloyd: Mae gwasanaethau trawsffiniol yn realiti amlwg ac angenrheidiol, ac mae eu hangen arnom yn awr i sicrhau darparu gofal iechyd i bobl Cymru, yn enwedig y rheiny yn ardaloedd y gororau. Fodd bynnag, mae angen hefyd inni ddatblygu ein gwasanaethau ein hunain yma yng Nghymru, oherwydd mae gallu cael triniaeth a honno ar gael yn lleol yn hollbwysig i gleifion pa le bynnag y maent yn byw. Mae amseroedd cael triniaeth frys ac argyfwng yn ffactor diffiniol yng ngwellhad clinigol claf wedi hynny, ac i fod yn deg, mae'r gwasanaethau iechyd wedi bod yn datblygu ym maes gofal sylfaenol, eilaidd a thrydyddol yng Nghymru dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf.

Dechreuais i fel meddyg teulu yn 1984—cyn i rai ohonoch gael eich geni, mae'n siŵr. Y flwyddyn honno, yr oedd un cardiolegydd ymgynghorol yn cael ei rannu rhwng Abertawe a Chastell-nedd gyfan—hanner yr un i Abertawe a Chastell-nedd—er bod clefyd ischaemig y galon mor gyffredin. Yn 1984, yr oedd gennym bum cardiolegydd ymgynghorol i Gymru gyfan tra oedd 31 o gardiolegwyr ymgynghorol i Ogledd Ddwyrain Tafwys a De Ddwyrain Tafwys yn

heart disease. At that time, all cardiac surgery for patients from Wales was carried out in London and, therefore, all cardiac surgery was cross-border. We could not refer a number of people who would have benefited from cardiac surgery back then in the 1980s because it was so far away, in London. The only provision was cross-border. That was not just the case with cardiac services but, historically, with several different clinical fields. In Wales, we have suffered from the underprovision of treatments over the years and only slowly are we catching up now.

Since 1984, cardiac surgery has been developed in Cardiff and, in the past 10 years, at Murrison Hospital's excellent cardiac surgery centre. Patients in south Wales now get the treatment that they need and deserve far nearer to home. With continuing developments at the University Hospital of Wales, Cardiff and the new clinical school in Swansea, with its teaching hospital status, we are developing new services all the time—and not before time because, historically, Wales has been behind the rest of the United Kingdom in service provision despite its increased burden of illness. We have suffered from a double whammy of an increased burden of illness and less of a capacity to deal with it, medically. New services are also being developed in primary care, and there is a welcome move to decant more hospital services to the community, developing new clinics where before there were none.

Cross-border health provision is a reality. The last time I looked at the figures, 37,000 patients from Wales, of a total of just 2.9 million people, were being treated in hospitals in England. As Jenny Randerson said, many GP practices in the border counties straddle the border between Wales and England, and have many patients from both countries. Therefore, cross-border health services are a necessary and obvious reality, and that should remain the case for the sake of easy and local access to quality treatment.

Llundain, lle'r oedd clefyd ischaemig y galon yn llawer llai cyffredin. Bryd hynny, yr oedd yr holl lawdriniaeth gardiaidd i gleifion o Gymru yn digwydd yn Llundain, ac felly yr oedd yr holl lawdriniaeth gardiaidd yn digwydd ar draws y ffin. Ni allem gyfeirio nifer o bobl a fyddai wedi elwa o lawdriniaeth gardiaidd bryd hynny yn y 1980au gan ei bod mor bell i ffwrdd, yn Llundain. Yr oedd yr unig ddarpariaeth ar draws y ffin. Dyna oedd y sefyllfa nid yn unig o ran gwasanaethau cardiaidd ond, yn hanesyddol, mewn nifer o wahanol feysydd clinigol. Yng Nghymru, yr ydym wedi dioddef oherwydd tanddarparu triniaethau dros y blynyddoedd, ac yn araf yr ydym yn cau'r blwch yn awr.

Er 1984, mae llawdriniaeth gardiaidd wedi datblygu yng Nghaerdydd, ac yn y 10 mlynedd diwethaf yn y ganolfan llawdriniaeth gardiaidd ragorol yn Ysbyty Treforys. Bellach mae cleifion yn y de yn cael y driniaeth y mae ei hangen arnynt ac y maent yn ei haeddu lawer yn nes i gartref. Gyda'r datblygiadau sy'n parhau yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru, Caerdydd a'r ysgol glinigol newydd yn Abertawe, sydd â statws ysbyty addysgu, yr ydym yn datblygu gwasanaethau newydd drwy'r amser—ac nid cyn pryd oherwydd, yn hanesyddol, mae Cymru wedi bod ar ôl gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig o ran darparu gwasanaethau er bod ei baich salwch yn drymach. Yr ydym wedi dioddef dau aflwydd, sef baich trymach o salwch a llai o gapasiti i ddelio ag ef, yn feddygol. Mae gwasanaethau newydd yn cael eu datblygu hefyd ym maes gofal sylfaenol, ac mae yna symudiad sydd i'w groesawu i drosglwyddo mwy o wasanaethau ysbyty i'r gymuned, a datblygu clinigau newydd lle nad oedd rhai gynt.

Mae darpariaeth iechyd drawsffiniol yn realiti. Y tro diwethaf imi edrych ar y ffigurau, yr oedd 37,000 o gleifion o Gymru, o gyfanswm o ddim ond 2.9 miliwn o bobl, yn cael eu trin mewn ysbytai yn Lloegr. Fel y dywedodd Jenny Randerson, mae nifer o bractisau meddygon teulu yn pontio'r ffin rhwng Cymru a Lloegr, a chanddynt nifer o gleifion o'r naill wlad a'r llall. Felly, mae gwasanaethau iechyd trawsffiniol yn realiti angenrheidiol ac amlwg, a dylai hynny barhau er mwyn cael triniaeth o safon yn

hawdd ac yn lleol.

On the challenges to commissioning, Health Commission Wales has a less than perfect record in this area. We welcome the review into the workings of Health Commission Wales, because commissioning at secondary and tertiary levels needs to take into account the subtleties of cross-border patients' needs, and be able to respond flexibly to them.

However, we also need to keep developing services for our patients here in Wales. No longer must all our services be somewhere else because we cannot cope with any vaguely complicated illness. Let not the debate about cross-border service obfuscate the need to develop services in Wales. Much has been done; much more remains to be done.

Nick Ramsay: I agree that we often do not focus enough on the importance of cross-border services to the constituencies along the border with England. The needs of the service user should be paramount. The process of delivering public services should be citizen-focused, and it is up to the Assembly Government to provide the guidance and funding that is needed along with it, to enable local authorities to undertake that process effectively.

On the amendments, there is no Berlin wall between England and Wales. Believe it or not, in many parts of Wales, you can pass easily across the border and, if you miss the sign, you certainly would not immediately notice a dramatic change in your surroundings. You would not fall off the end of the Earth. Therefore, it is not surprising that, in service delivery terms, cross-border co-ordination is vital, and has to be built into a strategy from the start, not treated as some kind of add-on, which too often—as I know from discussions with local authorities—seems to be the case.

O ran yr heriau comisiynu, mae gan Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru record llai na pherffaith yn y maes hwn. Yr ydym yn croesawu'r adolygiad i'r ffordd y mae Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru yn gweithio, oherwydd mae angen i gomisiynu ar y lefelau eilaidd a thrydyddol adlewyrchu'r mân wahaniaethau yn anghenion cleifion trawsffiniol, a gallu ymateb yn hyblyg iddynt.

Fodd bynnag, mae angen hefyd inni ddal i ddatblygu gwasanaethau ar gyfer ein cleifion ni yma yng Nghymru. Nid oes rhaid mwyach i'n holl wasanaethau fod rywle arall am nad ydym yn gallu ymdopi ag unrhyw salwch sydd fymryn yn gymhleth. Peidiwch â gadael i'r ddadl am wasanaeth trawsffiniol gymylu'r angen am ddatblygu gwasanaethau yng Nghymru. Mae llawer wedi ei wneud; erys llawer iawn mwy i'w wneud.

Nick Ramsay: Cytunaf nad ydym yn aml yn canolbwyntio digon ar bwysigrwydd gwasanaethau trawsffiniol i'r etholaethau ar hyd y ffin â Lloegr. Dylai anghenion defnyddwyr gwasanaethau fod yn bennaf. Dylai'r broses o ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ganolbwyntio ar y dinesydd, a chyfrifoldeb Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yw darparu'r arweiniad a'r cyllid sy'n ofynnol law yn llaw â hynny, i alluogi awdurdodau lleol i ymgymryd â'r broses honno'n effeithiol.

O ran y gwelliannau, nid oes mur Berlin rhwng Cymru a Lloegr. Credwch hynny neu beidio, mewn llawer rhan o Gymru gallwch groesi'r ffin yn hawdd, ac os na welwch yr arwydd, yn sicr ni fydddech yn sylwi ar unwaith ar newid dramatig yn eich amgylchoedd. Ni fydddech yn disgyn oddi ar ben draw'r Ddaear. Felly, nid yw'n syndod, o safbwynt darparu gwasanaethau, fod cyd-drefnu trawsffiniol yn hollbwysig, a'i bod yn rhaid ei ymgorffori mewn strategaeth o'r cychwyn, nid ei drin fel rhywbeth a ychwanegir wedyn, sef yr hyn sydd—fel y gwn o drafodaethau gydag awdurdodau lleol—yn digwydd yn rhy aml yn ôl pob golwg.

4.40 p.m.

Developing cross-border services should be viewed positively, as the most efficient way of proceeding in many cases; it should not be viewed negatively, and certainly should not be sacrificed for some ideological view that there should be a one-size-fits-all model in Wales, although I take on board what Dai Lloyd said regarding the need for Wales to provide as many services as it possibly can.

Our amendments focus on choice and the importance of choice in accessing public services, particularly the national health service, where there is a sense that dogma often, though not always, overrules sensible decision-making—ruling out the private finance initiative across the board and not selectively, for instance. That is one reason why one of our amendments focuses on divergence. Divergence per se is not bad; it is a natural part of devolution, and can be positive. However, too often, the people who elect us to this place do not see it in that light; they see it as a way for parties to impose their dogma on them from above, without allowing local decision-making to be done from below.

Wales may not be the largest of countries, but it is diverse, as evidenced by the emerging Wales spatial plan. There is much greater cost to delivering local services in rural areas, and that is one aspect of sparsity. The local authorities that I deal with often do not believe that that issue is adequately addressed. I agreed with much of what Kirsty Williams said in her opening statements regarding the need to encourage and not undermine cross-border working. It can, in part, help to meet the costs of funding services in rural areas, which would otherwise find it hard to make ends meet.

My constituency is one of those that borders England. It is known as the gateway of Wales, and is linked by the Severn crossings. Many of my constituents cross those bridges regularly to access local services, particularly health services, in England. People do not consider there to be a hard-and-fast border

Dylid edrych ar ddatblygu gwasanaethau trawsffiniol fel rhywbeth cadarnhaol, fel y ffordd fwyaf effeithlon i symud ymlaen mewn llawer achos; ni ddylid edrych arno'n negyddol, ac yn sicr ni ddylai gael ei aberthu er mwyn rhyw farn ideolegol y dylid cael model sy'n gweddu i bawb yng Nghymru, er fy mod yn derbyn yr hyn a ddywedodd Dai Lloyd fod angen i Gymru ddarparu cynifer o wasanaethau ag y gall.

Mae ein gwelliannau ni yn canolbwyntio ar ddewis a phwysigrwydd dewis wrth allu cael gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, yn enwedig y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol, lle mae ymdeimlad fod dogma yn aml, er nad bob amser, yn drech na gwneud penderfyniadau synhwyrol—ymwrthod â'r fenter cyllid preifat yn ddiwahân yn hytrach nag yn ddedolus, er enghraifft. Dyna un rheswm pam y mae un o'n gwelliannau'n canolbwyntio ar ddargyfeirio. Nid yw dargyfeirio ynddo'i hun yn ddrwg; gall fod yn rhan naturiol o ddatganoli, a gall fod yn gadarnhaol. Fodd bynnag, yn rhy aml nid yw'r bobl sy'n ein hethol i'r man hwn yn ei weld yn y golau hynny; maent yn ei weld fel ffordd i bleidiau orfodi eu dogma arnynt oddi fri, heb ganiatáu gwneud penderfyniadau'n lleol oddi isod.

Efallai nad Cymru y mwyaf o wledydd, ond mae'n amrywiol, fel y dengys cynllun gofodol Cymru sy'n datblygu. Mae'n costio llawer mwy i ddarparu gwasanaethau lleol mewn ardaloedd gwledig, ac mae hynny'n un agwedd ar deneurwydd poblogaeth. Nid yw'r awdurdodau lleol y byddaf fi'n delio â hwy yn credu'n aml fod sylw digonol yn cael ei roi i'r mater hwnnw. Cytunaf â llawer o'r hyn a ddywedodd Kirsty Williams yn ei datganiadau agoriadol fod angen annog gweithio trawsffiniol a pheidio â'i danseilio. Yn rhannol gall helpu cwrdd â chostau cyllido gwasanaethau mewn ardaloedd gwledig, a fyddai fel arall yn ei chael hi'n anodd cael dau ben llinyn ynghyd.

Mae fy etholaeth i yn un o'r rheini sy'n ffinio â Lloegr. Fe'i gelwir yn borth i Gymru, a chaiff ei chysylltu gan bontydd Hafren. Bydd nifer o'm hetholwyr yn croesi'r pontydd hynny'n rheolaidd i gael gwasanaethau lleol, gwasanaethau iechyd yn arbennig, yn Lloegr. Nid yw pobl yn ystyried bod ffin bendant, ac

and, if we tried to impose one on them, they would feel that their choice was being questioned, which would not sit well with many of my constituents.

We have spoken about people crossing the border into England, but people also come the other way. They flood across, not surprisingly, as we have a lot to offer in Wales, and they are happy to come across to access services here. However, it is often our local authorities that end up picking up the tab, and they are not always clear about the guidance from above to provide the necessary funding for that tab.

Divergence is happening, which can be positive, but it is up to us, and the Assembly Government, to show that in the decision-making process. We must ensure that it is the values and aspirations of the people whom we represent that are being met, and not narrow party interests.

The Minister for Finance and Public Service Delivery (Andrew Davies): I propose amendment 2 in the name of Carwyn Jones. Delete point 3 and replace with:

recognises that the Welsh Assembly Government takes proper account of cross-border issues in relation to public services.

I have been trying to work out what exactly today's debate is about. On the one hand, we have the motion tabled by Kirsty Williams, which highlights the importance of cross-border issues, but the amendments in the name of William Graham, on behalf of the Conservative Party, deal with almost everything except that. However, given that this is the Liberal Democrats' nominated debate, I will concentrate on cross-border issues, and will cover the Conservative amendments briefly at the end. I am tempted to say that the Tories do not seem to get it, but then again, as the majority of Assembly Members know, that is not an unusual occurrence.

This is our second recent debate on cross-border services. The December debate, prompted by Karen Sinclair, emphasised that the interests and wellbeing of the people of

os ceisiwn orfodi un arnynt byddent yn teimlo bod eu dewis yn cael ei amau, ac ni fyddai hynny'n dderbyniol i lawer o'm hetholwyr.

Yr ydym wedi siarad am bobl yn croesi'r ffin i Loegr, ond mae pobl hefyd yn dod y ffordd arall. Maent yn llifo yma, nid yn annisgwyl, gan fod gennym lawer i'w gynnig yng Nghymru; ac maent yn hapus i ddod draw i gael gwasanaethau yma. Fodd bynnag, ein hawdurdodau lleol yn aml sy'n talu'r gost, ac nid ydynt bob amser yn glir ynglŷn â'r canllawiau oddi fry i ddarparu'r cyllid angenrheidiol i dalu'r gost honno.

Mae dargyfeirio yn digwydd, sy'n gallu bod yn beth cadarnhaol, ond mater i ni, a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yw dangos hynny yn y broses o wneud penderfyniadau. Rhaid inni sicrhau mai gwerthoedd a dyheadau'r bobl yr ydym yn eu cynrychioli sy'n cael eu bodloni, ac nid buddiannau pleidiol cul.

Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid a Chyflenwi Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus (Andrew Davies): Cynigiau welliant 2 yn enw Carwyn Jones.

yn cydnabod bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn rhoi ystyriaeth briodol i faterion trawsffiniol mewn perthynas â gwasanaethau cyhoeddus.

Yr wyf wedi bod yn ceisio deall beth yn union yw hanfod y ddadl heddiw. Ar y naill law, mae gennym y cynnig a gyflwynwyd gan Kirsty Williams, sy'n tanlinellu pwysigrwydd materion trawsffiniol, ond mae'r gwelliannau yn enw William Graham, ar ran y Blaid Geidwadol, yn delio â phopeth bron ar wahân i hynny. Fodd bynnag, o gofio mai dadl wedi'i henwebu gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yw hon, canolbwyntiaf ar faterion trawsffiniol, a byddaf yn ymdrin â'r gwelliannau Ceidwadol yn fyr ar y diwedd. Caf fy nhemtio i ddweud nad yw'r Toriaid fel per baent yn ei deall hi, ond eto, fel y gwyr y mwyafrif o Aelodau'r Cynulliad, nid yw hynny'n ddigwyddiad anarferol.

Hon yw ein hail ddadl yn ddiweddar ar wasanaethau trawsffiniol. Pwysleisiai'r ddadl ym mis Rhagfyr, a ysgogwyd gan Karen Sinclair, nad yw buddiannau a lles pobl

Wales do not stop at the English/Welsh border. It rightly stressed the importance of the networks and working arrangements that underpin cross-border working and collaboration.

Without accepting all of Kirsty Williams's points, to which I will return later, we agree with most of the motion that she has tabled. Jonathan Morgan referred to the *Living in Wales* survey, which was published this morning. That survey notes that our whole approach to public services should be centred on the needs and experience of the citizen, including cross-border access to services, where necessary.

The exception that we have to Kirsty Williams's motion is to point 3. There is an implication in some of Kirsty's comments that the Assembly Government is seeking to establish a sort of Celtic iron curtain on service delivery from Connah's Quay to Chepstow. That is far from the truth and ignores the calibre and range of arrangements that are now in place to ensure service quality and outcomes for those who are close to the border, which we are continuing to strengthen. We propose, in amendment 2, to amend the motion by replacing point 3 with:

'recognises that the Welsh Assembly Government takes proper account of cross-border issues in relation to public services.'

The whole point of devolution, as was said yesterday, is that it gives us the opportunity in Wales to shape the way in which services are designed and delivered so that, to use Kirsty's words, they address the needs of the service-user. This commitment to making the citizen central lay behind our decision to commission research that involved asking 7,500 people in Wales about their experiences of our public services, whether those were delivered and funded by the Assembly Government or by local government. The findings in the *Living in Wales* survey, which I launched this morning, point to a high level of satisfaction with public services in Wales. Depending on the service, between 70 per cent and 90 per cent of the Welsh public has very positive views

Cymru yn gorffen wrth y ffin rhwng Cymru a Lloegr. Yr oedd yn briodol yn pwysleisio pwysigrwydd y rhwydweithiau a'r trefniadau gwaith sy'n sylfaen i weithio a chydweithio trawsffiniol.

Heb dderbyn pwyntiau Kirsty Williams i gyd, a dychwelaf at hynny'n ddiweddarach, yr ydym yn cytuno â'r rhan fwyaf o'r cynnig y mae wedi'i gyflwyno. Cyfeiriodd Jonathan Morgan at arolwg *Byw yng Nghymru*, a gyhoeddwyd y bore yma. Mae'r arolwg hwnnw'n sylwi y dylai ein holl ddull o ymdrin â gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ganolbwyntio ar anghenion a phrofiad y dinesydd, gan gynnwys gallu cael gwasanaethau trawsffiniol lle bydd angen.

Ein gwrthwynebiad i gynnig Kirsty Williams yw pwynt 3. Mae goblygiad yn rhai o sylwadau Kirsty fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ceisio codi rhyw fath o len haearn Geltaidd wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau rhwng Cei Connah a Chas-gwent. Mae hynny ymhell o fod yn wir ac mae'n diystyru safon ac amrediad y trefniadau sydd ar waith yn awr i sicrhau safon gwasanaethau a chanlyniadau i'r rheini sy'n agos i'r ffin ac yr ydym yn dal i'w cryfhau. Yng ngwelliant 2, yr ydym yn cynnig diwygio'r cynnig drwy roi, yn lle pwynt 3:

yn cydnabod bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn rhoi sylw priodol i faterion trawsffiniol mewn cysylltiad â gwasanaethau cyhoeddus.

Holl bwrpas datganoli, fel y dywedwyd ddoe, yw ei fod yn rhoi cyfle i ni yng Nghymru ddylanwadu ar y modd y caiff gwasanaethau eu dylunio a'u darparu er mwyn iddynt, yng ngeiriau Kirsty, ymateb i anghenion y defnyddiwr gwasanaethau. Yr ymrwymiad hwn i roi lle canolog i'r dinesydd oedd sail ein penderfyniad i gomisiynu ymchwil a oedd yn golygu holi 7,500 o bobl yng Nghymru am eu profiadau o'n gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, boed wedi'u darparu a'u cyllido gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad neu gan lywodraeth leol. Mae'r canfyddiadau yn yr arolwg *Byw yng Nghymru*, a gyhoeddais y bore yma, yn dangos lefel uchel o fodlonrwydd â gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Yn ôl y gwasanaeth, mae barn gadarnhaol iawn ymhlith y cyhoedd yng

about the services that they use. However, no-one, certainly not the Assembly Government, is or should be complacent. There is still considerable room for improvement, but the signs are encouraging.

One challenge arising from devolution is how we manage cross-border arrangements, recognising their importance for those people living close to the border and for those whose location and requirements mean that they need to look outside of Wales for some services. More widely, we recognise that our lives, social networks, environmental assets and communications infrastructure do not stop at the border, and I am grateful to Nick Ramsay for pointing out the importance and the centrality of the Wales spatial plan to our formulation and delivery of policy as an Assembly Government.

The complex problems facing us include substance abuse, climate change, animal health and disease and sustainable development. Tackling these problems requires concerted efforts by central, devolved and local government, working across boundaries in a range of partnerships. For example, through the Wales spatial plan, in March 2007 we signed a memorandum of understanding with the West Midlands Regional Assembly. Its initial focus is on transport, but this will widen to include health and social care, community safety, access to services, skills development and a range of other issues. In the north-east of Wales there is the Mersey Dee Alliance, which brings together the Welsh local authorities with the West Cheshire, Merseyside and the Wirral areas, to work on priorities related to regeneration and economic development. As Lesley Griffiths pointed out, the Assembly Government and Merseytravel are jointly funding the feasibility study on the electrification of the Wrexham to Bidston line.

Officials on both sides of the border are fully

Nghymru, a honno'n amrywio rhwng 70 y cant a 90 y cant, am y gwasanaethau a ddefnyddiant. Fodd bynnag, ni ddylai neb fod yn ddfater, ac nid oes neb felly, ac yn sicr nid Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae cryn le i wella o hyd, ond mae'r arwyddion yn galonogol.

Un her sy'n deillio o ddatganoli yw'r modd yr ydym yn rheoli trefniadau trawsffiniol, gan gydnabod eu pwysigrwydd i'r bobl hynny sy'n byw'n agos i'r ffin ac i'r rheiny y mae eu lleoliad a'u hanghenion yn golygu bod angen iddynt chwilio y tu allan i Gymru am rai gwasanaethau. Yn fwy cyffredinol, yr ydym yn cydnabod nad yw ein bywydau, ein rhwydweithiau cymdeithasol, ein hasedau amgylcheddol a'n seilwaith cyfathrebu yn dod i ben wrth y ffin, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Nick Ramsay am dynnu sylw at bwysigrwydd cynllun gofodol Cymru a'r lle canolog sydd iddo wrth inni lunio a darparu polisi fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Ymhlith y problemau dyrys sy'n ein hwynebu y mae camddefnyddio sylweddau, newid yn yr hinsawdd, iechyd ac afiechyd anifeiliaid a datblygu cynaliadwy. Wrth fynd i'r afael â'r problemau hyn, mae angen ymdrech ar y cyd gan lywodraeth ganolog, llywodraeth ddatganoledig a llywodraeth leol, gan weithio ar draws ffiniau mewn amryw o bartneriaethau. Er enghraifft, drwy gynllun gofodol Cymru, ym Mawrth 2007 llofnodasom femorandwm cyd-ddealltwriaeth gyda Chynulliad Rhanbarthol Gorllewin Canolbarth Lloegr. Mae'n canolbwyntio'n gyntaf ar gludiant, ond bydd yn ehangu ei gwmpas i gynnwys iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol, diogelwch cymunedol, gallu cael gwasanaethau, datblygu sgiliau ac amryw o faterion eraill. Yng ngogledd-ddwyrain Cymru mae Cynghrair Mersi Dyfrdwy, sy'n dod ag awdurdodau lleol Cymru at ei gilydd ynghyd ag ardaloedd Gorllewin Swydd Gaer, Glannau Mersi a Chilgwri, i weithio ar flaenoriaethau'n ymwneud ag adfywio a datblygu economaidd. Fel y dangosodd Lesley Griffiths, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a Merseytravel yn cydariannu'r astudiaeth ddichonoldeb ar drydaneiddio'r rheilffordd rhwng Wrecsam a Bidston.

Mae swyddogion o bobtu'r ffin yn ymroi i'r

engaged with this crucial agenda, but strong political leadership will also be vital. Having regional UK Government lead Ministers in England, and spatial plan Ministers here in Wales, gives us a real opportunity to forge strong alliances. There are plenty of examples of permeable borders. The Welsh police forces are well used to working with forces across the border. For example, there is operation Tarian, on the threat posed by class-A drugs. We have multi-agency approaches to the policing of roads, involving various England and UK agencies, such as the Vehicle and Operator Services Agency, the Driver and Vehicle Licensing Agency in Swansea, and many others. In higher education, there are particularly strong connections between Wales and England. Some 20,000 Welsh students attend higher education institutions in the rest of the UK and nearly 30,000 students from elsewhere in the UK attend higher education institutions in Wales. School admissions also involve a two-way flow. All of this shows that there is a significant ebb and flow across our borders.

I will turn to health, which is an important issue, given that Powys, for example, does not have a district general hospital of its own. Both I and the Minister for Health and Social Services want to make it clear that there has been no change in our policy. It is appropriate, from the perspective of patient care, that patients should have access across the border to emergency care and, as Dai Lloyd pointed out, certain specialist treatments. To avoid issues arising from different legislative frameworks, there is a handling strategy between the Department of Health at a UK level and the Assembly Government to help commissioners and providers to manage cross-border flows.

4.50 p.m.

One key element is an interim protocol between local health boards and adjacent primary care trusts, which provide for someone living on one side of the border going to a GP on the other side. In addition, there are patient flows for other services. Reasons for receiving treatment across the

agenda hanfodol hon, ond bydd arweiniad gwleidyddol yn hollbwysig hefyd. O gael Gweinidogion rhanbarthol sy'n cael eu harwain gan Lywodraeth y DU yn Lloegr, a Gweinidogion y cynllun gofodol yma yng Nghymru, mae gennym gyfle gwirioneddol i ffurfio cynghreiriau cadarn. Mae yna ddigonedd o enghreifftiau o ffiniau hydraiddd. Mae heddluoedd Cymru wedi hen arfer â gweithio gyda heddluoedd ar draws y ffin. Er enghraifft, mae yna ymgyrch Tarian, mewn cysylltiad â bygythiad cyffuriau dosbarth A. Mae gennym ddulliau aml-asiantaeth o blismona ffyrdd, sy'n cynnwys amrywiol asiantaethau yn Lloegr a'r DU, fel yr Asiantaeth Gwasanaethau Cerbydau a Gweithredwyr, yr Asiantaeth Trwyddedu Gyrwyr a Cherbydau yn Abertawe, a llawer un arall. Ym maes addysg uwch, mae cysylltiadau arbennig o gryf rhwng Cymru a Lloegr. Mae tua 20,000 o fyfyrwyr o Gymru mewn sefydliadau addysg uwch yng ngweddill y DU a bron i 30,000 o fyfyrwyr o fannau eraill yn y DU mewn sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru. Mae trefniadau derbyn ysgolion hefyd yn golygu bod llif dwyffordd. Mae hyn oll yn dangos bod cryn fynd a dod ar draws ein ffiniau.

Trof at iechyd, sy'n fater pwysig, o gofio, er enghraifft, nad oes gan Bowys ei hysbyty cyffredinol dosbarth ei hun. Yr wyf fi a'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn dymuno egluro na fu unrhyw newid yn ein polisi. Mae'n briodol, o safbwynt gofal i gleifion, iddynt allu cael gwasanaethau gofal brys ar draws y ffin, ac fel y dywedodd Dai Lloyd, rhai triniaethau arbenigol. Er mwyn osgoi problemau sy'n codi o wahanol fframweithiau deddfwriaethol, mae yna strategaeth drafod rhwng yr Adran Iechyd ar lefel y DU a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i helpu comisiynwyr a darparwyr i reoli'r llif ar draws y ffin.

Un elfen allweddol yw protocol dros dro rhwng byrddau iechyd lleol ac ymddiriedolaethau gofal sylfaenol cyfagos, sy'n darparu i rywun sy'n byw ar un ochr i'r ffin allu mynd at feddyg teulu ar yr ochr arall. Yn ogystal â hynny, mae yna lifau cleifion am wasanaethau eraill. Ymysg y rhesymau

border range from the need to access highly specialised services and the patterns of provision of tertiary services, to routine referral patterns, as well as the taking into account of issues such as travel and convenience. In 2005, Brian Gibbons, then the Minister for Health and Social Services, confirmed that patients needing tertiary and specialist services should, wherever possible and clinically appropriate, be seen and treated in Wales.

I would like to turn briefly to the Conservative amendments, which are a miscellany, or, in fact, a ragbag of statements rather than a coherent position. Some of them, such as amendment 1, which refers to the Department of Health's patient choice policy, we reject as not relevant to Wales. Some of the others, such as that which refers to standards, innovation, and a mixed economy of service provision, would be fine were it not for the fact that they reflect existing Government policy.

Jonathan Morgan: I am grateful to the Minister for giving way. You say that patient choice is not relevant to Wales, but your party advocated patient choice with the second offer scheme. Therefore, why this hypocritical stance now?

Andrew Davies: You reference to patient choice is to a policy programme of the UK Government. It is not one to which we are signed up. That is different from a citizen-centred approach. The Tories' approach to patient choice, or citizen choice, is very exclusive. It is rather like saying that everyone has the right to dine at the Ritz—very few people can exercise that choice, given the resources at their disposal.

Nick Bourne: I am grateful to the Minister for giving way. It is instructive that he seems to think that access to an NHS hospital, which should be available to everyone, is like dining at the Ritz. That is, perhaps, a signal of what is happening under your Government; that it is becoming exclusive. It should be available to everyone, and that has always been our policy.

dros gael triniaeth ar draws y ffin y mae'r angen i allu cael gwasanaethau arbenigol iawn a phatrymau darparu gwasanaethau trydyddol, patrymau atgyfeirio arferol, yn ogystal ag ystyriaeth i faterion fel teithio a chyfleuster. Yn 2005, cadarnhaodd Brian Gibbons, y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar y pryd, y dylai cleifion sydd ag angen gwasanaethau trydyddol ac arbenigol gael eu gweld a'u trin yng Nghymru, ble bynnag y bydd hynny'n bosibl ac yn glinigol briodol.

Hoffwn droi'n fyr at welliannau'r Ceidwadwyr, sy'n gasgliad neu, yn wir, yn gybolfa o ddatganiadau yn hytrach na safbwynt cydlynol. Mae rhai ohonynt, fel gwelliant 1, sy'n cyfeirio at bolisi'r Adran Iechyd ar ddewis i gleifion, yr ydym yn eu gwrthod am eu bod yn amherthnasol i Gymru. Mae rhai o'r lleill, fel hwnnw sy'n cyfeirio at safonau, arloesi, a darparu gwasanaethau mewn economi gymysg, a fyddai'n iawn oni bai eu bod yn adlewyrchu polisi presennol y Llywodraeth.

Jonathan Morgan: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am ildio. Dywedwch nad yw dewis i gleifion yn berthnasol i Gymru, ond hyrwyddodd eich plaid chi ddewis i gleifion drwy gynllun yr ail gynnyg. Felly, pam y safbwynt rhagrithiol hwn yn awr?

Andrew Davies: Mae eich cyfeiriad at ddewis i gleifion yn cyfeirio at raglen bolisi o eiddo Llywodraeth y DU. Nid yw'n bolisi yr ydym ni wedi ei fabwysiadu. Mae hynny'n wahanol i ddull sy'n canolbwyntio ar y dinesydd. Mae dull y Torïaid o drafod dewis i gleifion, neu ddewis i ddinasyddion, yn gyfyngedig iawn. Mae fel dweud bod gan bawb hawl i gael cinio yn y Ritz—ychydig iawn o bobl sy'n gallu dewis hynny, o gofio'r modd sydd ganddynt.

Nick Bourne: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am ildio. Mae'n agoriad llygad ei fod fel petai'n credu bod gallu mynd i un o ysbytai'r GIG, a ddylai fod ar gael i bawb, yn debyg i giniawa yn y Ritz. Mae hynny, o bosibl, yn arwydd o'r hyn sy'n digwydd dan eich Llywodraeth; ei bod yn troi'n rhywbeth i'r dethol rai. Dylai fod ar gael i bawb, a hynny fu ein polisi ni erioed.

Andrew Davies: All I am saying is that your definition of patient choice takes a consumerist approach to the use of public services, whereas ours is about citizen choice. Most people want high-quality services that are as accessible as possible from where they live. Yours is a private sector, consumerist approach, with which we disagree. There is a clear, ideological difference between our position as a Government and yours.

The reality is not that we are putting up barriers to cross-border service provision: instead, we will continue to work to improve arrangements. My view is that cross-border working will go from strength to strength as long as the political commitment exists on both sides. I will conclude by asking Members to support amendment 2 in the name of Carwyn Jones and to oppose the Conservative amendments.

Kirsty Williams: I thank all of the Members who contributed to the debate this afternoon. It is perhaps not surprising that Members have been preoccupied with matters relating to the health service.

First, I would like to address the points made by Lesley Griffiths. I think that she was perhaps accusing my party colleagues and I of being unambitious for Wales. However, there is nothing about our programme for Wales that demonstrates poverty of ambition. Indeed, in debate after debate over the last 10 months, our party that has put forward ambitious projects, such as we did last week in the debate on smart meters, but your Government has lacked the courage to take those steps forward. You talked about the shoddy service that you believe English hospitals are giving some of your patients. Let me explain to you why Welsh patients are at the back of the queue in English hospitals: it is as a direct result of the waiting-list targets of the Welsh Assembly Government. English patients are inevitably treated more quickly, because the targets set by the Government in England demand that they are treated more quickly than the targets set by the Welsh Assembly Government demand that patients in Wales are treated. That is why

Andrew Davies: Y cyfan yr wyf yn ei ddweud yw bod eich diffiniad chi o ddewis i gleifion yn dangos ymagwedd prynwr at ddefnyddio gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, tra mae ein diffiniad ni'n ymwneud â dewis i ddinasyddion. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o bobl am gael gwasanaethau o safon uchel sydd mor gyfleus ag sy'n bosibl iddynt o'u cartrefi. Ymagwedd prynwrl y sector preifat yw'ch dull chi, ac nid ydym yn ei dderbyn. Mae gwahaniaeth ideolegol clir rhwng ein safbwynt ni fel Llywodraeth a'ch safbwynt chi.

Y gwir yw nad ydym yn gosod rhwystrau rhag darparu gwasanaethau ar draws y ffin: yn hytrach, byddwn yn parhau i ymdrechu i wella'r trefniadau. Fy marn i yw y bydd y gwaith trawsffiniol yn mynd o nerth i nerth cyhyd ag y bydd ymrwymiad gwleidyddol o'r ddwy ochr. Terfynaf drwy ofyn i Aelodau gefnogi gwelliant 2 yn enw Carwyn Jones a gwrthod gwelliannau'r Ceidwadwyr.

Kirsty Williams: Diolch i'r holl Aelodau a gyfrannodd at y ddadl y prynhawn yma. Nid yw'n syndod, efallai, mai materion yn ymwneud â'r gwasanaeth iechyd a oedd ym mlaen meddwl yr Aelodau.

Yn gyntaf, carwn ymdrin â'r pwyntiau a wnaeth Lesley Griffiths. Credaf ei bod efallai'n cyhuddo fy nghyd-Aelodau a minnau o ddiffyg uchelgais dros Gymru. Er hynny, nid oes dim ynghylch ein rhaglen ar gyfer Cymru sy'n dangos diffyg uchelgais. Yn wir, yn y naill ddadl ar ôl y llall dros y 10 mis diwethaf, mae ein plaid wedi rhoi prosiectau uchelgeisiol gerbron, fel y gwnaethom yr wythnos diwethaf yn y ddadl ar fesuryddion 'call', ond nid oedd eich Llywodraeth chi'n ddigon dewr i gymryd y camau hynny. Soniech am y gwasanaeth gwael y credwch fod ysbytai yn Lloegr yn ei roi i rai o'ch cleifion. Gadewch imi egluro pam y mae cleifion o Gymru'n cael eu gweld olaf mewn ysbytai yn Lloegr: mae'n ganlyniad uniongyrchol i dargedau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer rhestrau aros. Mae cleifion o Loegr yn sicr o gael eu trin yn gyflymach, gan fod y targedau a bennwyd gan y Llywodraeth yn Lloegr yn mynnu y cânt eu trin yn gyflymach nag y mae'r targedau a bennwyd gan Lywodraeth

English hospitals treat Welsh patients last: it is because that is the ambition that the Welsh Assembly Government has for its patients. I have spent the last 12 years of my life advocating the devolution project, and it does not make me feel good that the reality for my constituents is that were treated more quickly in Hereford before the advent of the Assembly. As a result of the waiting-list targets set by the Welsh Assembly Government, they now wait longer than they did previously.

I would like to address the points made by Nick Bourne, particularly those relating to radiotherapy services across the border. Today, and in questions last week to the Minister for Health and Social Services, Nick referred to a centralisation of services. The fact is that the services already exist in Cheltenham—the issue is about where we put the new, increased services. Capacity has run out in Cheltenham. The services have already been centralised there; the issue is about where they will put the new equipment. I share your desire for that equipment to be put in Hereford. That would be of huge benefit to patients living in Brecon and Radnorshire and other parts of mid Wales; it would give them access to a service that they would not be able to access in Cardiff, because of the capacity issues in radiotherapy services in Cardiff. If those patients were forced to come down to Cardiff for treatment, it would result in longer waiting times for even more patients.

Dai is right to say that this debate is not about developing new services in Wales, and you spoke eloquently about how we have seen services develop and flourish in Wales, which is to be celebrated. However, it is not acceptable for people who require services that are relatively routine services in medical terms, such as heart operations, not to be able to get those services in Wales. You also said that people deserved to be treated close to their homes, and I agree, but for my constituents treatment in an English hospital is often easier—it is easier for them to get to an English hospital than it is to get to centres in Wales. It is not that they do not want to be

Cynulliad Cymru yn mynnu y caiff cleifion yng Nghymru eu trin. Dyna pam y mae ysbytai yn Lloegr yn trin cleifion o Gymru yn olaf: am mai hynny yw uchelgais Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru dros ei chleifion. Yr wyf wedi treulio'r 12 mlynedd diwethaf yn dadlau dros y prosiect datganoli, ac nid yw o gysur gwybod bod fy etholwyr yn cael eu trin yn gyflymach yn Henffordd cyn dyfodiad y Cynulliad. O ganlyniad i'r targedau ar gyfer rhestrau aros a bennwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, maent bellach yn aros yn hwy nag o'r blaen.

Hoffwn ymdrin â'r pwyntiau a wnaeth Nick Bourne, yn enwedig y rheiny'n ymwneud â gwasanaethau radiotherapi ar draws y ffin. Heddiw, ac mewn cwestiynau yr wythnos diwethaf i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, cyfeiriodd Nick at ganoli gwasanaethau. Y gwir yw bod y gwasanaethau ar gael eisoes yn Cheltenham—y cwestiwn yw ble i roi'r gwasanaethau newydd mwy o faint. Nid oes lle ar ôl yn Cheltenham. Mae'r gwasanaethau wedi'u canoli yno eisoes; y cwestiwn yw ble y byddant yn rhoi'r cyfarpar newydd. Fel chithau, yr wyf yn dymuno i'r cyfarpar hwnnw gael ei osod yn Henffordd. Byddai hynny o fudd mawr i gleifion sy'n byw ym Mrycheiniog a sir Faesyfed ac mewn rhannau eraill o'r canolbarth; byddai'n golygu y gallent gael gwasanaeth na allent ei gael yng Nghaerdydd oherwydd yr anawsterau capasiti mewn gwasanaethau radiotherapi yng Nghaerdydd. Os gorfodid y cleifion hynny i ddod i lawr i Gaerdydd i gael triniaeth, byddai hynny'n arwain at amseroedd aros hwy i fwy byth o gleifion.

Mae Dai yn iawn wrth ddweud nad yw'r ddadl hon yn ymwneud â datblygu gwasanaethau newydd yng Nghymru, a soniech yn huawdl am y modd yr ydym wedi gweld gwasanaethau'n datblygu ac yn ffynnu yng Nghymru, ac mae hynny'n destun dathlu. Fodd bynnag, mae'n annerbyniol nad yw pobl y mae arnynt angen gwasanaethau meddygol sy'n gymharol gyffredin, fel llawdriniaeth ar y galon, yn gallu cael y gwasanaethau hynny yng Nghymru. Dywedech hefyd fod pobl yn haeddu cael eu trin yn agos i'w cartrefi, ac yr wyf yn cytuno. Ond yn achos fy etholwyr i mae'n haws yn aml iddynt gael triniaeth mewn ysbyty yn

treated in Wales, but, because of geographical disadvantage, it is easier for them to access services across the border. We want to see as many services as possible developed in Wales and delivered as close to people's homes as possible, and the NHS in England is part of delivering that agenda. Doctors and clinicians are coming out of Hereford hospital into Llandrindod Wells and are delivering their services using the facilities there, so that people do not have to travel.

I am grateful to the Minister for pointing out that neither of us were responsible for the Conservative amendments. Thank goodness for that—it was close for a minute. We are not responsible for what the Conservatives put on the agenda. However, the reality, Andrew, is that your Government is not doing enough to ensure that services are comprehensive. You say that there has been no stated change in the policy with regard to Health Commission Wales. Either you or Edwina need to talk to Health Commission Wales, because patients' experience over the last 10 months is that there has been a change in policy, and more and more people are being told that they cannot access services across the border, even when clinicians think that that is best for them. There are other areas in which we are not making the kind of progress that we would wish to make.

My party supports the devolution project. We are ambitious for Wales, Lesley Griffiths. You said that you were not elected to have poverty of ambition, but neither was I elected to set aside the needs of individual patients for the sake of some abstract notion of nation-building.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: We have three minutes until the designated voting time. Clerk, please ring the bell.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisiau tan yr amser pleidleisio.
Votes deferred until voting time.*

*Gohiriwyd y cyfarfod rhwng 16.52 p.m. a 5.02 p.m.
The meeting adjourned between 16.52 p.m. and 5.02 p.m.*

Lloegr—mae'n haws iddynt gyrraedd ysbyty yn Lloegr nag i gyrraedd canolfannau yng Nghymru. Nid ydynt yn erbyn cael eu trin yng Nghymru, ond oherwydd anfantais ddaearyddol mae'n haws iddynt allu cael gwasanaethau ar draws y ffin. Yr ydym am weld datblygu cynifer o wasanaethau ag sy'n bosibl yng Nghymru a'u darparu mor agos ag y bo modd i gartrefi pobl, ac mae i'r GIG yn Lloegr ran wrth ddarparu'r agenda honno. Bydd meddygon a chlinigwyr yn dod o ysbyty Henffordd i Landrindod ac yn darparu eu gwasanaethau gan ddefnyddio'r cyfleusterau sydd yno, fel na fydd pobl yn gorfod teithio.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am egluro nad oedd y naill na'r llall ohonom yn gyfrifol am welliannau'r Ceidwadwyr. Diolch byth am hynny—cael a chael oedd hi. Nid ydym yn gyfrifol am yr hyn y mae'r Ceidwadwyr yn ei roi ar yr agenda. Fodd bynnag, y gwir yw, Andrew, nad yw'ch Llywodraeth yn gwneud digon i sicrhau gwasanaethau cynhwysfawr. Dywedwch nad oes newid o gwbl wedi ei gyhoeddi yn y polisi mewn cysylltiad â Chomisiwn Iechyd Cymru. Mae angen i chi neu Edwina gael gair â Chomisiwn Iechyd Cymru, gan fod cleifion wedi gweld newid mewn polisi dros y 10 mis diwethaf, a dywedir wrth fwy a mwy o bobl na allant gael gwasanaethau ar draws y ffin, hyd yn oed os yw clinigwyr o'r farn mai hynny sydd orau iddynt. Mae yna feysydd eraill lle nad ydym yn gwneud y math o gynnydd y carem ei weld.

Mae fy mhlaid yn cefnogi'r prosiect datganoli. Mae gennym uchelgais i Gymru, Lesley Griffiths. Dywedech na chawsoch eich ethol i ddangos diffyg uchelgais, ond ni chefais i ychwaith fy ethol i ddiystyru anghenion cleifion unigol er mwyn rhyw syniad haniaethol o adeiladu cenedl.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae tair munud tan yr amser pleidleisio sydd wedi'i bennu. Glerc, canwch y gloch, os gwelwch yn dda.

Amser Pleidleisio Voting Time

*Gwelliant 1 i NDM3889: O blaid 31, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 17.
Amendment 1 to NDM3889: For 31, Abstain 0, Against 17.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Neagle, Lynne
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Mewies, Sandy
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 2 i NDM3889: O blaid 31, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 16.
Amendment 2 to NDM3889: For 31, Abstain 0, Against 16.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny

Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Mewies, Sandy
Neagle, Lynne
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wood, Leanne

Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 3 i NDM3889: O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 3 to NDM3889: For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Paul
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Mewies, Sandy
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Neagle, Lynne
Ramsay, Nick

Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 4 i NDM3889: O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 4 to NDM3889: For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Paul
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Mewies, Sandy
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Neagle, Lynne
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

Motion NDM3889 as amended: that

Cynnig NDM3889 fel y'i diwygiwyd: bod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to take urgent and practical action to address housing needs in Wales, drawing fully on the expertise available within the independent and voluntary/charitable sectors and endorses the Welsh Assembly Government's actions to date and the programme set out under 'One Wales';

1. yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gymryd camau brys ac ymarferol i roi sylw i'r anghenion tai yng Nghymru, gan fanteisio'n llawn ar yr arbenigedd sydd ar gael yn y sectorau annibynnol a gwirfoddol/elusennol ac yn cymeradwyo'r camau a gymerwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru hyd yma a'r rhaglen a amlinellwyd o dan 'Cymru'n Un';

2. calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to:

2. yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i:

review the regulation of registered social landlords so as to maximise the investment they are able to make in communities;

adolygu rheoleiddio landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig er mwyn cynyddu'r buddsoddiad y gallant ei wneud mewn cymunedau;

3. calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to:

3. yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i:

a) work more closely with local authorities to ensure that they make the maximum use of existing powers to secure a greater number of affordable homes for local people;

a) gweithio'n agosach gydag awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau eu bod yn defnyddio pwerau cyfredol i'r eithaf i sicrhau nifer fwy o gartrefi fforddiadwy ar gyfer pobl leol;

b) ensure that each local council has a robust housing needs survey and strategy so as to underpin effective action in the provision of affordable housing and in tackling homelessness;

b) sicrhau bod gan bob cyngor lleol arolwg a strategaeth anghenion tai cadarn er mwyn bod yn sylfaen i weithredu effeithiol ar gyfer darparu tai fforddiadwy a mynd i'r afael â digartrefedd;

c) review the provision of facilities and support for homeless people in each local authority and to provide additional resources where needed to bolster this.

c) adolygu'r ddarpariaeth o gyfleusterau a chefnogaeth ar gyfer pobl ddigartref ym mhob awdurdod lleol a darparu adnoddau ychwanegol lle bydd angen i ategu hyn.

Cynnig NDM3889 fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 32, Ymatal 6, Yn erbyn 10.

Motion NDM3889 as amended: For 32, Abstain 6, Against 10.

*Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:*

*Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:*

*Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun*

*Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark*

Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Mewies, Sandy
Neagle, Lynne
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce
Wood, Leanne

Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Ramsay, Nick
Williams, Brynle

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
German, Michael
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd cynnig NDM3889 fel y'i diwygiwyd.
Motion NDM3889 as amended carried.*

*Tynnwyd gwelliant 1 I NDM3888 yn ôl.
Amendment 1 to NDM3888 withdrawn.*

*Gwelliant 2 i NDM3888: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 32.
Amendment 2 to NDM3888: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 32.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene

Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Mewies, Sandy
Neagle, Lynne
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3 i NDM3888: O blaid 17, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 31.
Amendment 3 to NDM3888: For 17, Abstain 0, Against 31.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
Franks, Chris
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Mewies, Sandy
Neagle, Lynne
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM3888): O blaid 11, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 37.
Motion (NDM3888): For 11, Abstain 0, Against 37.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:

The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Ramsay, Nick
Williams, Brynle

The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
German, Michael
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Mewies, Sandy
Neagle, Lynne
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion carried.

Gwelliant 1 i NDM3890: O blaid 10, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 38.

Amendment 1 to NDM3890: For 10, Abstain 0, Against 38.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Ramsay, Nick
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
German, Michael
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley

Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Mewies, Sandy
Neagle, Lynne
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2 i NDM3890: O blaid 31, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 16.
Amendment 2 to NDM3890: For 31, Abstain 0, Against 16.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Mewies, Sandy
Neagle, Lynne
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 3 i NDM3890: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 32.
Amendment 3 to NDM3890: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 32.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Mewies, Sandy
Neagle, Lynne
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4 i NDM3890: O blaid 10, Ymatal 6, Yn erbyn 32.
Amendment 4 to NDM3890: For 10, Abstain 6, Against 32.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Ramsay, Nick
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene

Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Mewies, Sandy
Neagle, Lynne
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce
Wood, Leanne

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
German, Michael
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5 i NDM3890: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 32.
Amendment 5 to NMD3890: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 32.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Mewies, Sandy
Neagle, Lynne
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 6 i NDM3890: O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 6 to NDM3890: For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Paul
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Mewies, Sandy
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Neagle, Lynne
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

Motion NDM3890 as amended: that

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. believes that the needs of the service-user should be paramount when assessing how public services are delivered;

2. recognises that in some areas of both England and Wales, access to services on the other side of the border is beneficial to service users;

3. recognises that the Welsh Assembly Government takes proper account of cross-border issues in relation to public services;

4. calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure that sufficient funding is made available to provide those living in less populated areas with the same level of service as those living in urban areas.

Cynnig NDM3890 fel y'i diwygiwyd: bod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. yn credu y dylid rhoi'r prif bwys ar anghenion y defnyddiwr gwasanaeth wrth asesu sut y caiff gwasanaethau cyhoeddus eu darparu;

2. yn cydnabod mewn rhai ardaloedd yng Nghymru a Lloegr, bod mynediad at wasanaethau ar ochr arall y ffin o fudd i ddefnyddwyr gwasanaeth;

3. yn cydnabod bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn rhoi ystyriaeth briodol i faterion trawsffiniol mewn perthynas â gwasanaethau cyhoeddus;

4. yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau bod digon o arian ar gael i ddarparu'r un lefel o wasanaeth i'r rheiny sy'n byw mewn ardaloedd llai poblog â'r rheiny sy'n byw mewn ardaloedd trefol.

Cynnig NDM3890 fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 32, Ymatal 15, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion NDM3890 as amended: For 32, Abstain 15, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Mewies, Sandy
Neagle, Lynne
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Watson, Joyce
Wood, Leanne

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Ramsay, Nick
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd cynnig NDM3890 fel y'i diwygiwyd.
Motion NDM3890 as amended carried.*

Dadl Fer Short Debate

**Cynhwysiant Cymdeithasol ac Ymdrech ar y Cyd—Sialens Adfywio
Social Inclusion and Collective Endeavour—the Challenge of Regeneration**
The Deputy Presiding Officer: Members who are not staying should leave the Chamber quietly.
Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Dylai Aelodau nad ydynt yn aros ymadael â'r Siambr yn ddistaw.

Janice Gregory: I am grateful to Peter Black, Joyce Watson and Lorraine Barrett for asking to contribute to today's debate. I want to spend some time today talking about Robert Owen and his relevance to modern Wales. 2008 marks the hundred-and-fiftieth anniversary of Robert Owen's death, and, as most of you will know, he was born and brought up in Newtown, Powys. He is generally recognised as the father of the co-operative movement, a crucial figure in the development of socialism and a pioneer in fields such as education and the regulation of working conditions. As such, he has been one of the most internationally influential people in Welsh history, as well as being a key founding figure of the British Labour movement. I hope that this year will provide many opportunities to pay tribute to this towering individual and his many contributions to Wales and the world.

Janice Gregory: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Peter Black, Joyce Watson a Lorraine Barrett am ofyn am gael cyfrannu at y ddatl heddiw. Hoffwn dreulio ychydig amser heddiw yn sôn am Robert Owen a'i berthnasedd i'r Gymru gyfoes. Yn 2008 mae'n gan mlynedd a hanner ers marwolaeth Robert Owen, ac fel y gŵyr y rhan fwyaf ohonoch, cafodd ei eni a'i fagu yn y Drenewydd, Powys. Fe'i cydnabyddir yn gyffredinol fel tad y mudiad cydweithredol, ffigwr hollbwysig yn natblygiad sosialaeth ac arloeswr mewn meysydd fel addysg a rheoleiddio amodau gwaith. O'r herwydd, yr oedd yn un o'r bobl fwyaf eu dylanwad rhyngwladol yn hanes Cymru, yn ogystal â bod yn un o sylfaenwyr allweddol y mudiad Llafur ym Mhrydain. Gobeithio y llawer cyfle eleni i roi teyrnged i'r gŵr mawr hwn a'i gyfraniadau lu i Gymru a'r byd.

5.10 p.m.

Today, I wish to draw out the relevance of Robert Owen's key principles to the challenges that we face today in Wales. Robert Owen believed in creating circumstances in which all could flourish and lead happy and productive lives. He said:

'It is therefore, the interest of all, that every one, from birth, should be well educated, physically and mentally, that society may be improved in its character, that everyone should be beneficially employed, physically and mentally, that the greatest amount of wealth may be created and knowledge attained, that everyone should be placed in the midst of those external circumstances that will produce the greatest number of pleasurable sensations, through the longest life, that man may be made truly intelligent, moral and happy.'

Robert Owen was a practical entrepreneur as well as an idealist, and he drew from these principles a series of practical lessons that can still guide us today. He believed from the outset in the importance of education. He said:

'To train and educate the rising generation will at all times be the first object of society, to which every other will be subordinate.'

He emphasised that this was even more important in the case of those children from deprived homes, and he set up parenting classes in New Lanark. I believe that we are fulfilling Owen's vision today by raising educational standards and offering increased opportunities for training in Wales.

He believed in decent pay and working conditions. He said:

'Eight hours' daily labour is enough for any human being, and under proper arrangements sufficient to afford an ample supply of food, raiment and shelter, or the necessaries and comforts of life, and for the remainder of his time, every person is entitled to education, recreation and sleep.'

I am proud to be a member of the party that has crowned one and a half centuries of progress on workers' rights by introducing the minimum wage, working families' tax

Heddiw, hoffwn danlinellu perthnasedd egwyddorion allweddol Robert Owen i'r heriau sy'n ein hwynebu heddiw yng Nghymru. Credai Robert Owen mewn creu amgylchiadau lle gallai pawb ffynnu a byw bywyd hapus a chynhyrchiol. Meddai:

Felly, mae er lles pawb y dylai pob un, o'i enedigaeth, gael ei addysgu'n dda, yn gorfforol ac yn feddyliol, er mwyn gwella cymeriad cymdeithas, y dylai pob un gael cyflogaeth fuddiol, yn gorfforol a meddyliol, er mwyn creu'r cyfoeth mwyaf ac ennill y wybodaeth fwyaf, y dylid gosod pob un yng nghanol yr amgylchiadau allanol hynny a fydd yn cynhyrchu'r nifer mwyaf o deimladau pleserus, drwy'r oes hwyaf, er mwyn gwneud dyn yn wirioneddol ddeallus, moesol a hapus.

Yr oedd Robert Owen yn entrepreneur ymarferol yn ogystal â delfrydwr, a thynnodd o'r egwyddorion hynny gyfres o wersi ymarferol a all ein harwain heddiw o hyd. Credai o'r cychwyn ym mhwysigrwydd addysg. Meddai:

Hyfforddi ac addysgu'r genhedlaeth sy'n codi fydd nod cyntaf cymdeithas bob amser, a bydd pob nod arall yn israddol i hwnnw.

Pwysleisiodd fod hyn yn bwysicach fyth yn achos plant o gartrefi difreintiedig, a sefydlodd ddosbarthiadau ar fagu plant yn New Lanark. Credaf ein bod yn gwireddu gweledigaeth Owen heddiw drwy godi safonau addysgol a chynnig mwy o gyfleoedd hyfforddi yng Nghymru.

Credai mewn cyflog ac amodau gweithio teg. Meddai:

Mae wyth awr o lafur y dydd yn ddigon i unrhyw fod dynol, a than drefniadau priodol yn ddigon i allu fforddio cyflenwad digonol o fwyd, dillad a lloches, neu anghenion a chysuron bywyd, ac am weddill ei amser mae gan bob unigolyn hawl i addysg, adloniant a chwsg.

Yr wyf yn falch o fod yn aelod o blaid sydd wedi coroni canrif a hanner o gynnydd gyda hawliau gweithwyr drwy gyflwyno'r isafswm cyflog, credyd treth i deuluoedd sy'n

credit, limits on the hours that employees can be required to work, and the right to paid holidays and maternity and paternity leave.

Robert Owen claimed that he was ahead of his own time, and this is borne out in many areas of his life. For example, he called for women to be equal in education, rights, privileges and personal liberty. He advocated religious tolerance and laid down as a rule in New Lanark that

‘while each faithfully adheres to the principles which he most approves, at the same time all shall think charitably of their neighbours respecting their religious opinions and not presumptuously suppose that theirs alone are right’.

He argued for health, education and preventative medicine. He stated that everyone

‘should be taught the general and individual laws of health ... that he may know how to prevent the approach of disease’.

He said that parents in New Lanark were responsible for the behaviour of their children, but insisted that any resident who witnessed vandalism or anti-social behaviour should either step in and stop it or report it. We continue to work towards that combination of parental and community responsibility.

At a time when many saw air pollution as an inescapable symptom of progress, he emphasised the importance and benefits of clean air. Above all, Robert Owen was a believer in the rights of workers, the rights of consumers, and the power of co-operation as a means of extending the rights of both parties and creating a better life for all. He said:

‘There is but one mode by which man can possess in perpetuity all the happiness which his nature is capable of enjoying, that is by the union and cooperation of all for the benefit of each.... Union and co-operation in war obviously increase the power of the individual a thousand fold. Is there the shadow of a reason why they should not produce the same effects in peace; why the

gweithio, cyfyngu'r oriau y gellir gofyn i weithwyr weithio, a'r hawl i gael gwyliau a chyfnod mamolaeth a thadolaeth ar gyflog.

Honnai Robert Owen ei fod o flaen ei amser, a chaiff hyn ei gadarnhau mewn llawer agwedd ar ei fywyd. Er enghraifft, galwodd am gydraddoldeb i fenywod mewn addysg, hawliau, breintiau a rhyddid personol. Dadleuodd dros oddefgarwch crefyddol a gosododd reol yn New Lanark,

er y bydd pawb yn cadw'n ffyddlon at yr egwyddorion y mae'n eu cymeradwyo fwyaf, ar yr un pryd bydd angen i bawb feddwl yn gariadus am eu cymdogion gan barchu eu syniadau crefyddol heb dybio'n rhyfygus mai eu syniadau hwy yn unig sy'n iawn.

Dadleuodd dros iechyd, addysg a meddygaeth ataliol. Dywedodd y dylai pob un

gael dysgu deddfau cyffredinol ac unigol iechyd ... er mwyn iddo wybod sut i atal dyfodiad afiechyd.

Dywedodd fod rhieni yn New Lanark yn gyfrifol am ymddygiad eu plant, ond mynnodd y dylai unrhyw breswlydd a welai fandaliaeth neu ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol un ai gamu i mewn neu roi gwybod amdano. Yr ydym yn dal i weithio tuag at y cyfuniad hwnnw o gyfrifoldeb rhieni a chymuned.

Ar adeg pan oedd llawer yn gweld llygredd aer fel un o symptomau anochel cynnydd, pwysleisiodd bwysigrwydd a buddiannau awyr iach. Yn anad dim, yr oedd Robert Owen yn gredwr yn hawliau gweithwyr, hawliau defnyddwyr, a grym cydweithredu fel modd i ymestyn hawliau'r naill ochr a'r llall a chreu bywyd gwell i bawb. Meddai:

Un ffordd yn unig sydd i ddyn allu meddiannu yn fythol barhaus yr holl hapusrwydd y mae ei natur yn abl i'w fwynhau, sef drwy undeb a chydweithrediad pawb er lles pob un... Mae undeb a chydweithrediad mewn rhyfel yn amlwg yn cynyddu grym yr unigolyn ar ei filfed. A oes rhithyn o reswm pam na ddylent gynhyrchu'r un effeithiau mewn heddwch; pam na ddylai

principle of co-operation should not give to men the same superior powers, and advantages, ... in the creation, preservation, distribution and enjoyment of wealth?’

When we consider regeneration, I see a direct line running from Robert Owen’s ideas to today’s Wales. I celebrate the modern-day consumer co-operatives that descended from the work of the Rochdale Pioneers, begun in Robert Owen’s own lifetime, and the wider benefits of consumer rights, clear product labelling and healthier food, which were pushed through as the result of the co-operative challenge to the unscrupulous. I rejoice in the success of the collective endeavours of producer co-operatives, such as that at Tower colliery, and the many smaller community enterprises that it has inspired in recent years.

I look forward to the further spread of the credit unions, run according to co-operative principles, building on schemes such as the Co-op’s ‘mutuality loans’, providing a lifeline for many communities and holding the loan sharks at bay.

I welcome the time banking movement, exemplified in my constituency by a scheme at the Creation Development Trust in Blaengarw, under which members of the community, young and old, can exchange their work for services offered by other members. That idea goes back directly to Robert Owen’s establishment in the 1830s of an equitable labour exchange system.

Important as these points are when taken individually, it is the breadth of Robert Owen’s vision that should inspire us in the work of social regeneration. The vision of shared responsibility and collective endeavour that he shared and advocated provides an alternative to both Tory and Liberal free-market indifference to human beings as workers and consumers and the bureaucratic, top-down approach that led many to reject socialism in the past. Education and training, decent pay and conditions, equality and toleration, healthy individuals and a healthy environment,

egwyddor cydweithredu roi i ddynion yr un grymoedd uwch, a manteision, ... o ran creu, cadw, dosbarthu a mwynhau cyfoeth?

Pan ystyriwn adfywio, gwelaf linell uniongyrchol yn rhedeg o syniadau Robert Owen i Gymru heddiw. Yr wyf yn dathlu’r mudiadau defnyddwyr cydweithredol cyfoes sy’n ddisgynyddion i waith Arloeswyr Rochdale, a gychwynnwyd yn oes Robert Owen ei hun, a buddiannau lletach hawliau defnyddwyr, labelu nwyddau’n glir a bwyd iachach, a wthiwyd drwodd o ganlyniad i’r her gydweithredol i bobl ddiwegwyddor. Yr wyf yn ymlawenhau yn llwyddiant cydymdrechion cwmnïau cynhyrchu cydweithredol, fel hwnnw yng nglofa’r Tŵr, a’r nifer fawr o fentrau cymunedol llai a ysbrydolwyd ganddo yn y blynyddoedd diweddar.

Edrychaf ymlaen at ehangu’r undebau credyd ymhellach, yn cael eu rhedeg yn ôl egwyddorion cydweithredol, gan adeiladu ar gynlluniau fel ‘benthyciadau cydfuddiannol’ y Co-op, sy’n gymorth mawr i nifer o gymunedau ac sy’n cadw’r benthycwyr anghyfreithlon draw.

Yr wyf yn croesawu’r mudiad bancio amser, ac mae cynllun Ymddiriedolaeth Ddatblygu Creation ym Mlaengarw yn fy etholaeth i yn enghraifft o hyn, lle gall aelodau o’r gymuned, yn hen ac yn ifanc, gyfnewid eu gwaith am wasanaethau sy’n cael eu cynnig gan aelodau eraill. Mae’r syniad hwn yn deillio’n uniongyrchol o system deg o gyfnewid llafur a sefydlwyd gan Robert Owen yn y 1830au.

Er bod y pwyntiau hyn yn bwysig wrth edrych arnynt fesul un, ehangder gweledigaeth Robert Owen a ddylai fod yn ysbrydoliaeth inni o ran gwaith adfywio cymdeithasol. Mae’r weledigaeth o rannu cyfrifoldeb a chydymdrechu yr oedd yn ei rhannu ac yn ei choleddu yn ddewis arall yn lle difaterwch marchnad rydd y Torïaid a’r Rhyddfrydwyr at bobl fel gweithwyr a defnyddwyr a’r ymagwedd fiwrocraidaidd o’r brig i lawr sydd wedi golygu bod llawer wedi cefnu ar sosialaeth yn y gorffennol. Addysg a hyfforddiant, cyflog ac amodau teg, cydraddoldeb a goddefgarwch, unigolion iach

community action on anti-social behaviour, and co-operation and collective enterprise are, as Robert Owen saw, the goals of social regeneration and the means of achieving those goals.

I am happy to recognise and welcome the Deputy Minister's strong personal commitment to building the social economy. We should be proud to be part of the country that gave birth to Robert Owen and to which he returned at the end of his life, 150 years ago in 1858. We should be even prouder of the progress that we are making towards the fulfilment of his vision, here and now in the Wales of the twenty-first century.

Peter Black: I thank Janice for an entertaining and educational speech. The traditions that Robert Owen brought to Wales and to the United Kingdom illustrate the fact that he was well ahead of his time, and, certainly, huge progress has been made since his time. Where we stand now, with regard to social regeneration, is, in a sense, a tribute to his contribution. We must also recognise that self-help and communities standing up for themselves and working for themselves were important strands running through his philosophy. The role of Government in the regeneration process is very much that of empowering people, giving them opportunities and removing the barriers to them bettering themselves and their communities. I would hope that, in his response, the Deputy Minister acknowledges that that forms part of the Government's programme for social regeneration as well.

Joyce Watson: Thank you, Janice, for bringing this short debate on social inclusion and collective endeavour—two pillars of the Labour movement that have deeply influenced the political and social advancement of our country. As we heard from Janice and Peter, Robert Owen, a son of Montgomeryshire, was central to developing these principles, and he applied them to his personal and professional life, thereby influencing successive socialist thinkers and activists since.

ac amgylchedd iach, gweithredu cymunedol ar ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol, a chydweithredu a chyd fenter, fel y credai Robert Owen, yw amcanion adfywio cymdeithasol a'r modd i gyflawni'r amcanion hynny.

Yr wyf yn fodlon cydnabod a chrosawu ymrwymiad personol cryf y Dirprwy Weinidog i adeiladu'r economi gymdeithasol. Dylem fod yn falch o gael bod yn rhan o'r wlad lle ganwyd Robert Owen a'r wlad y dychwelodd iddi ar ddiwedd ei oes, 150 o flynyddoedd yn ôl yn 1858. Dylem fod yn falchach byth o'r cynnydd yr ydym yn ei wneud at gyflawni ei weledigaeth, yma heddiw yng Nghymru'r unfed ganrif ar hugain.

Peter Black: Diolch i Janice am araith ddiddorol ac addysgiadol. Mae'r traddodiadau a gyflwynwyd i Gymru ac i'r Deyrnas Unedig gan Robert Owen yn dangos ei fod ymhell o flaen ei amser, ac, yn sicr, mae cynnydd mawr wedi'i wneud ers ei ddyddiau ef. Mae ein sefyllfa heddiw, o ran adfywio cymdeithasol, yn deyrnged i'w gyfraniad, mewn ffordd. Rhaid inni gydnabod hefyd bod hunan gymorth a chymunedau sy'n sefyll ar eu traed eu hunain yn elfennau pwysig o'i athroniaeth. Rôl y Llywodraeth yn y broses adfywio yw grymuso pobl, rhoi cyfleoedd iddynt a chwalu'r rhwystrau sy'n eu hatal rhag gwella'u hunain a'u cymunedau. Byddwn yn gobeithio y bydd y Dirprwy Weinidog yn ei ymateb yn cydnabod bod hynny hefyd yn rhan o raglen y Llywodraeth ar gyfer adfywio cymdeithasol.

Joyce Watson: Diolch, Janice, am gyflwyno'r ddadl fer hon ar gynhwysiant cymdeithasol a chydymdrechu—dau o gonglfeini'r mudiad Llafur sydd wedi cael cymaint o ddylanwad ar ddatblygiad gwleidyddol a chymdeithasol ein gwlad. Fel y clywsom gan Janice a Peter, yr oedd Robert Owen, un o feibion sir Drefaldwyn, yn allweddol i ddatblygiad yr egwyddorion hyn, ac fe'u rhoddodd ar waith yn ei fywyd personol a phroffesiynol, a thrwy hynny dylanwadodd ar nifer o feddylwyr a gweithredwyr sosialaidd ers hynny.

Today, the influence of socialist pioneers such as Robert Owen resonates in the best of our community and political endeavours, in initiatives such as the brand new monetary project. At the launch of this scheme in Welshpool on Friday, I met representatives from the Robert Owen Credit Union, which today enshrines the same principles that the man himself propagated over 200 years ago. His principles encompassed moral economy, community responsibility and co-operation, as well as the idea that, by establishing structures that are of and for the community, you darn the fabric of community and enable society's most vulnerable to become self-supporting and independent. These are true Labour values.

Lorraine Barrett: Thank you, Janice, for bringing forward this debate. I was delighted to launch the Robert Owen exhibition just two weeks ago, which is now travelling Wales. My friend, the Deputy Minister for Regeneration, was there with me, and it really is an excellent exhibition.

Were he alive today, Robert Owen would be a great supporter of Fairtrade fortnight—we are currently in the second week of that celebration. I was saddened to read today a report by the Adam Smith Institute, which makes unsubstantiated claims that Fairtrade does more harm than good. I think that it was deliberately launched to coincide with Fairtrade fortnight—a time when thousands of volunteers across the UK are preparing events and trying to make a difference to global poverty by promoting Fairtrade products. That is an absolute insult to their efforts and commitment. I know that, were he here, Robert Owen would join me in that condemnation.

5.20 p.m.

The Deputy Minister for Regeneration (Leighton Andrews): I start by congratulating Janice Gregory on securing this debate and making an important contribution to celebrating the life of Robert Owen in Wales this year.

Heddiw, mae dylanwad arloeswyr sosialaidd megis Robert Owen i'w weld yn ein hymdrechion cymunedol a gwleidyddol gorau, mewn cynlluniau megis y prosiect ariannol newydd sbon. Pan lanswyd y cynllun hwn yn y Trallwng ddydd Gwener, cyfarfûm â chynrychiolwyr Undeb Credyd Robert Owen, sydd heddiw'n coleddu'r un egwyddorion ag yr oedd efe i hun yn eu hybu dros 200 mlynedd yn ôl. Yr oedd ei egwyddorion yn cwmpasu economi foesol, cyfrifoldeb cymunedol a chydweithredu, yn ogystal â'r syniad eich bod, drwy sefydlu strwythurau sy'n deillio o'r gymuned ar gyfer y gymuned, yn asio gwhead y gymuned ac yn galluogi pobl fwyaf bregus cymdeithas i sefyll ar eu traed eu hunain a bod yn annibynnol. Mae'r rheiny'n werthoedd Llafur gwirioneddol.

Lorraine Barrett: Diolch, Janice, am gyflwyno'r ddadl hon. Yr oedd yn bleser imi gael lansio arddangosfa Robert Owen gwta bythefnos yn ôl. Mae hi bellach ar daith o amgylch Cymru. Yr oedd fy nghyfaill, y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Adfywio, yno gyda mi ac mae'n arddangosfa ardderchog.

Petai'n fyw heddiw, byddai Robert Owen wedi mynegi ei gefnogaeth frwd i bythefnos Masnach Deg—yr ydym yn awr yn ail wythnos y dathliad hwnnw. Tristwech i mi oedd darllen adroddiad gan Sefydliad Adam Smith heddiw sy'n gwneud honiadau di-sail fod Masnach Deg yn gwneud mwy o ddrwg nag o dda. Credaf ei fod wedi'i lansio'n fwriadol i gyd-fynd â phythefnos Masnach Deg—adeg pan fydd miloedd o wirfoddolwyr ledled y DU yn paratoi ar gyfer digwyddiadau ac yn ceisio gwneud gwahaniaeth i dlodi byd-eang drwy hyrwyddo nwyddau Masnach Deg. Mae hyn yn sarhau eu hymdrechion a'u hymroddiad. Gwn, petai yma, y byddai Robert Owen yn ymuno â mi i'w condemnio.

Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Adfywio (Leighton Andrews): Yr wyf am ddechrau drwy longyfarch Janice Gregory am sicrhau'r ddadl hon ac am wneud cyfraniad pwysig at ddatlu bywyd Robert Owen yng Nghymru eleni.

As Janice said, 2008—November to be precise—marks the hundred-and-fiftieth anniversary of the death of Robert Owen, the father of the co-operative movement. I was delighted two weeks ago to be, with Lorraine Barrett, at the launch of the Robert Owen, ‘Legacies that Last’ exhibition that is funded by the heritage lottery fund and CyMAL: Museums Archives and Libraries Wales, and developed by the South Wales Miners’ Library.

Robert Owen’s legacy lives on in a number of institutions in Wales and elsewhere, for example, in the Robert Owen Memorial Museum and the Robert Owen credit union in Newtown in Montgomeryshire, which Joyce Watson mentioned earlier. I am pleased that the dayschool of Llafur, the Welsh People’s History Society, is taking place on co-operative history in July and that Swansea University is organising an academic conference on Robert Owen’s legacy in Gregynog in August.

Today, I am pleased to announce that I have approved funding of £96,000 over the next three years to enable the Robert Owen Community Banking Partnership to develop a full range of services. That is a small retail community development financial institution that will be able to lend to small and micro social enterprises. It will be the first organisation of its kind to operate in a rural area in Wales.

This year, we also celebrate the sixtieth anniversary of the NHS—another institution that you could say is derived from Robert Owen’s vision of co-operation. Aneurin Bevan modelled the NHS on the local community self-help scheme, run by the Tredegar workmen’s medical aid society, on which he served as a committee member in the 1920s. The Tredegar medical aid society, formed around 1890, was widely regarded as one of the best of its kind. Under this local health service, almost all of the town’s residents were covered by the scheme through subscriptions that entitled members and their dependents to the most comprehensive and the best medical, surgical and dental services in the country, according to need and free at the point of care. Allegedly when creating the NHS, Aneurin

Fel y dywedodd Janice, mae 2008—Tachwedd a bod yn fanwl gywir—yn nodi canrif a hanner ers marwolaeth Robert Owen, tad y mudiad cydweithredol. Yr oeddwn yn falch o fod gyda Lorraine Barrett bythefnos yn ôl wrth lansio’r arddangosfa ‘Etifeddiaeth sy’n Para’ ar Robert Owen. Mae’n cael ei hariannu gan gronfa dreftadaeth y loteri a CyMAL: Amgueddfeydd, Archifau a Llyfrgelloedd Cymru, a chafodd ei datblygu gan Lyfrgell Glowyr De Cymru.

Mae etifeddiaeth Robert Owen yn fyw mewn nifer o sefydliadau yng Nghymru a thu hwnt, er enghraifft, yn Amgueddfa Goffa Robert Owen ac undeb credyd Robert Owen yn y Drenewydd yn sir Drefaldwyn, y cyfeiriodd Joyce Watson ato’n gynharach. Yr wyf yn falch dweud y bydd ysgol ddydd Llafur, Cymdeithas Hanes Pobl Cymru, yn digwydd ar hanes y mudiad cydweithredol ym mis Gorffennaf, ac y bydd Prifysgol Abertawe yn trefnu cynhadledd academiaidd yng Ngregynog ar etifeddiaeth Robert Owen ym mis Awst.

Yr wyf yn falch cyhoeddi heddiw fy mod wedi cymeradwyo swm o £96,000 dros y tair blynedd nesaf i alluogi Partneriaeth Bancio Cymunedol Robert Owen i ddatblygu amrediad llawn o wasanaethau. Sefydliad manwerthu ariannol bach yw hwn ar ddatblygu cymunedol a fydd yn gallu rhoi benthyg arian i fentrau cymdeithasol bach a micro. Hwn fydd y mudiad cyntaf o’i fath i weithredu mewn ardal wledig yng Nghymru.

Eleni, yr ydym hefyd yn dathlu pen-blwydd y GIG yn drigain oed—sefydliad arall y gellid honni iddo ddeillio o weledigaeth Robert Owen o gydweithredu. Seiliodd Aneurin Bevan y GIG ar y cynllun hunan-gymorth cymunedol lleol, a oedd yn cael ei redeg gan gymdeithas cymorth meddygol y gweithwyr yn Nhredegar, mudiad y bu’n aelod o’i bwyllgor yn ystod y 1920au. Yr oedd cymdeithas cymorth meddygol Tredegar, a sefydlwyd tua 1890, yn cael ei chydabod yn un o’r goreuon o’i bath. O dan y gwasanaeth iechyd lleol hwn, yr oedd holl drigolion y dref, bron, yn gallu elwa ohoni drwy danysgrifiadau, a oedd yn galluogi aelodau a’u dibynyddion i gael y gwasanaethau meddygol, llawfeddygol a deintyddol gorau yn y wlad, yn ôl eu hangen ac yn ddi-dâl pan oedd ei angen. Honnir i Aneurin Bevan

Bevan said,

‘All I am doing is extending to the entire population of Britain the benefits that we had in Tredegar for a generation or more. We are going to ‘Tredegar-ise’ you’.

I am pleased that, today, the Minister for Health and Social Services and I announced the disposal of 13 acres of land in Ebbw Vale on the former steel works site for the £48 million Ysbyty Aneurin Bevan, which was signed and sealed this week.

Robert Owen’s is an international legacy. Lorraine mentioned the Fairtrade movement as we celebrate Fairtrade fortnight. I recall being in Chile in 1990 after—let me clarify this fact—the fall of Pinochet. We visited housing projects that had been funded by the charity that I worked for during the 1987 international year of shelter for the homeless. They were built by the people themselves with the aid of revolving loans, with credit to be repaid for others to use subsequently. The same principle of co-operation underpinned those.

The social enterprise strategy of the Assembly, launched by Edwina Hart in 2005, is now being reviewed and a systematic action plan will be published later this year. Social enterprises exist in many forms: co-operatives, community enterprises, housing associations, community housing mutuals, community interest companies and so on. They all offer an alternative model of doing business that is driven by a powerful need to meet social or environmental objectives. As a Government, we support the Wales Co-operative Centre to help us promote the sector. That is the largest co-operative development agency in the UK.

We also support the work of the Development Trust Association to raise awareness of, and to provide advice on, asset transfer legislation. We want to make it easier for public assets to be transferred to communities and social enterprises. I have

ddweud, adeg creu’r GIG,

Yr unig beth yr wyf yn ei wneud yw ymestyn y buddiannau a fu gennym yn Nhrefdeg ers cenhedlaeth a mwy i holl boblogaeth Prydain. Yr ydym yn mynd i’ch ‘Tredegar-eddio’ chi.

Yr wyf yn falch fod y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a minnau wedi cyhoeddi heddiw y bydd 13 erw o dir yn cael ei waredu yng Nglynebwy ar safle’r hen waith dur ar gyfer Ysbyty Aneurin Bevan, a fydd yn costio £48 miliwn. Cafodd y cytundeb ei gwblhau yr wythnos hon.

Mae etifeddiaeth Robert Owen yn un ryngwladol. Soniodd Lorraine am y mudiad Masnach Deg wrth inni ddatlu pythefnos Masnach Deg. Cofiaf fod yn Chile yn 1990—gadewch imi wneud hyn yn eglur—ar ôl cwymp Pinochet. Buom yn ymweld â phrosiectau tai a ariannwyd gan elusen y bûm yn gweithio iddi yn ystod blwyddyn ryngwladol lloches i’r digartref yn 1987. Cawsant eu hadeiladu gan y bobl eu hunain, gyda chymorth benthyciadau cylchol, a chredyd yn cael ei ad-dalu wedyn i eraill ei ddefnyddio. Yr oedd y rhain yn seiliedig ar yr un egwyddor o gydweithredu.

Mae strategaeth menter gymdeithasol y Cynulliad, a lanswyd gan Edwina Hart yn 2005, yn awr yn cael ei hadolygu a chaiff cynllun gweithredu systematig ei gyhoeddi’n ddiweddarach eleni. Mae mentrau cymdeithasol yn bod ar lawer ffurf: mentrau cydweithredol, mentrau cymunedol, cymdeithasau tai, cymdeithasau tai cydfuddiannol, cwmnïau buddiannau cymunedol, ac yn y blaen. Maent i gyd yn cynnig ffordd wahanol i gynnal busnes sy’n cael ei yrru gan angen cryf i gyflawni amcanion cymdeithasol neu amgylcheddol. Fel Llywodraeth, yr ydym yn cefnogi Canolfan Cydweithredol Cymru i’n cynorthwyo i hyrwyddo’r sector. Hon yw’r asiantaeth datblygu cydweithredol fwyaf yn y DU.

Yr ydym hefyd yn cefnogi gwaith y Gymdeithas Ymddiriedolaethau Datblygu i gynyddu ymwybyddiaeth, ac i ddarparu gwybodaeth am ddeddfwriaeth trosglwyddo asedau. Yr ydym am ei gwneud yn haws trosglwyddo asedau cyhoeddus i gymunedau

asked officials to do work on this and we should be in a position to engage with the sector on asset transfer later this year.

Where possible, we want procurement policies in the Welsh Assembly Government that allow social enterprises to compete effectively. The development of social enterprises will be a key element in the future of our Communities First programme. As Peter Black said, community empowerment is very much at the heart of our work on Communities First, and we are currently consulting on the future of Communities First, with a desire to see a real translation of power and wealth to people in our poorest communities in particular.

Janice specifically referred to credit unions, and I recall visiting Bridgend Lifesavers with her last year. Since 2000, we have invested £1.5 million in developing a strong and sustainable movement, and we now have 33 active credit unions covering most of Wales, with activity in 21 of our 22 local authority areas. The top five credit unions hold savings of over £1 million. We have promised another £1.75 million to deliver our 'One Wales' commitments on improving credit union coverage, access for secondary school pupils, and provision of child trust fund accounts. That is a significant commitment, and I believe that national credit union coverage will soon be a reality.

I would like to say a word about community benefit and regeneration, as that was very much part of what Janice was talking about. Earlier, I specifically mentioned community housing mutuals, and alongside those there are new registered social landlords, created in local authorities where tenants are balloted to transfer housing to community control. They are now investing in the achievement of the Welsh housing quality standard, and we want to ensure that we get the maximum local benefits through employment opportunities and supply chain links. We want to keep as much of the investment as possible within our communities, in order to create

a mentrau cymdeithasol. Yr wyf wedi gofyn i swyddogion weithio ar hyn, a dylem fod mewn sefyllfa i drafod trosglwyddo asedau gyda'r sector yn ddiweddarach eleni.

Pan fydd yn bosibl, yr ydym am weld polisiau prynu yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru sy'n caniatáu mentrau cymdeithasol yn cystadlu'n effeithiol. Bydd datblygu mentrau cymdeithasol yn elfen allweddol yn ein rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn y dyfodol. Fel y dywedodd Peter Black, mae grymuso cymunedau yn elfen ganolog o'n gwaith gyda Chymunedau yn Gyntaf, ac yr ydym yn ymgynghori ar hyn o bryd ar ddyfodol Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, gan obeithio gweld pŵer a chyfoeth yn cael eu trosglwyddo i bobl yn ein cymunedau tlotaf yn fwyaf arbennig.

Cyfeiriodd Janice yn benodol at undebau credyd, a chofiaf ymweld â Lifesavers Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr gyda hi y llynedd. Er 2000, yr ydym wedi buddsoddi £1.5 miliwn i ddatblygu mudiad cryf a chynaliadwy, ac y mae gennym bellach 33 o undebau credyd gweithredol yn y rhan fwyaf o Gymru, gyda gweithgarwch mewn 21 o'n 22 ardal awdurdod lleol. Mae gan y pum undeb credyd mwyaf gynilion gwerth dros £1 filiwn. Yr ydym wedi addo £1.75 miliwn arall i gyflawni ein hymrwymiaid yn 'Cymru'n Un' i wella dosbarthiad undebau credyd, eu hagor i ddisgyblion ysgolion uwchradd, a darparu cyfrifon cronfeydd ymddiriedolaeth i blant. Mae hwn yn ymrwymiad sylweddol, a chredaf y bydd y nod o gael undebau credyd ar raddfa genedlaethol yn cael ei wireddu cyn hir.

Hoffwn ddweud gair am les ac adfywio cymunedol, gan fod hynny'n berthnasol i'r hyn a ddywedodd Janice. Yn gynharach, soniais am gymdeithasau tai cydfuddiannol yn benodol, ac ochr yn ochr â'r rhain mae gennym landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig, sydd wedi ei creu mewn awdurdodau lleol lle mae tenantiaid yn cynnal pleidlais i drosglwyddo tai i reolaeth y gymuned. Maent yn awr yn buddsoddi i gyrraedd safon ansawdd tai Cymru, ac yr ydym am sicrhau ein bod yn cael cynifer â phosibl o fuddiannau lleol drwy gyfleoedd cyflogi a chysylltiadau'r gadwyn gyflenwi. Yr ydym am gadw cymaint â phosibl o'r

sustainable jobs for local tenants and residents, to promote mutual ownership models, to grow new and existing SMEs and micro-businesses, to support new and existing social enterprises, and to commit private contractors to social benefit clauses and community benefit funds. RCT Homes, for example, is a community housing mutual that has already held a seminar for Communities First groups that wish to become engaged in the process to ensure that the benefits are retained within their own communities.

We also want to use procurement intelligently. One example of this is the Value Wales community benefit pathfinder project, which has two simple aims: to search for added value from public sector procurement, and to gain maximum benefit from public sector spend, building on successful pilot schemes like the Porth-Rhondda Fach relief road. We are working to embed the community benefit approach in public sector procurement throughout Wales, and Value Wales has set up a community benefits project board to take this forward.

In summing up, I return to the commitment and pioneering work of Robert Owen—work that can be seen in Wales today. We recognise that social enterprises and credit unions have an important role to play in the regeneration of our communities. They are as relevant today as they were when Robert Owen was developing new forms of social ownership, and are at the heart of our support for communities and social inclusion. As a member of the Co-operative Party, I welcome this debate. It has been an opportunity to show how we are putting Robert Owen's principles into practice in Government here in Wales, to show how we are building the social economy, and building on his and our tradition of community socialism.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings today's business to a close.

buddsoddiad yn ein cymunedau, er mwyn creu swyddi cynaliadwy i denantiaid a phreswylwyr lleol, i hyrwyddo modelau cydberchnogaeth, i weld busnesau bach a chanolig a microfusnesau newydd a phresennol yn tyfu, ac i weld contractwyr preifat yn ymrwmo i gymalau lles cymdeithasol a chronfeydd lles cymunedol. Mae Cartrefi RhCT, er enghraifft, yn gymdeithas tai gydfuddiannol sydd eisoes wedi cynnal seminar ar gyfer grwpiau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf sy'n dymuno bod yn rhan o'r broses i sicrhau bod y buddiannau'n aros yn eu cymunedau eu hunain.

Yr ydym hefyd am ddefnyddio caffael mewn ffordd ddeallus. Un enghraifft o hyn yw'r prosiect braenaru ar gyfer budd i'r gymuned gan Gwerth Cymru, sydd â dau nod syml: chwilio am werth ychwanegol wrth gaffael yn y sector cyhoeddus, a sicrhau'r budd mwyaf posibl o wariant yn y sector cyhoeddus, gan adeiladu ar gynlluniau peilot llwyddiannus megis ffordd liniaru Porth-Rhondda Fach. Yr ydym yn gweithio i wreiddio'r dull budd cymunedol wrth gaffael yn y sector cyhoeddus ledled Cymru, ac mae Gwerth Cymru wedi sefydlu bwrdd prosiectau buddiannau cymunedol i fwrw ymlaen â'r gwaith hwn.

I gloi, dychwelaf at ymroddiad a gwaith arloesol Robert Owen—gwaith sydd i'w weld yng Nghymru heddiw. Yr ydym yn cydnabod bod gan fentrau cymdeithasol ac undebau credyd ran bwysig i'w chwarae wrth adfywio'n cymunedau. Maent mor berthnasol heddiw ag oeddent pan oedd Robert Owen yn datblygu mathau newydd o berchnogaeth gymdeithasol, ac maent wrth wraidd ein cefnogaeth i gymunedau a chynhwysiant cymdeithasol. Fel aelod o'r Blaid Gydweithredol, yr wyf yn croesawu'r ddadl hon. Mae wedi bod yn gyfle i ddangos sut yr ydym yn rhoi egwyddorion Robert Owen ar waith mewn Llywodraeth yma yng Nghymru, i ddangos sut yr ydym yn adeiladu'r economi gymdeithasol, ac yn adeiladu ar ei draddodiad ef a'n traddodiad ni o sosialaeth gymunedol.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.27 p.m.
The meeting ended at 5.27 p.m.*

Aelodau a'u Pleidiau

Members and their Parties

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
Asghar, Mohammad (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Burns, Angela (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Andrew R.T. (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Davies, Paul (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Evans, Nerys (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Franks, Chris (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
Griffiths, Lesley (Llafur – Labour)
Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
Jenkins, Bethan (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Gareth (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)
Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
Millar, Darren (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
Ramsay, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Watson, Joyce (Llafur – Labour)
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)