



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
The National Assembly for Wales**

**Cofnod y Trafodion  
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mawrth, 7 Hydref 2008  
Tuesday, 7 October 2008**

**Cynnwys  
Contents**

3	Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister
34	Datganiad a Chyhoeddiad Busnes Business Statement and Announcement
39	Sgiliau Skills
67	Yr Amgylchedd Hanesyddol The Historic Environment
89	Ailstrwythuro'r GIG NHS Restructuring
118	Cyfnod Pleidleisio Voting Time

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 1.30 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 1.30 p.m. with the Presiding Officer (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) in the Chair.*

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf y Cynulliad i drefn.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call the Assembly to order.

## **Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister**

### **Further Education Colleges**

**Q1 Eleanor Burnham:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the provision of further education colleges in north Wales? OAQ(3)1324(FM)

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** Good collaborative progress is now being made to secure the future of further education provision in horticulture in north Wales. Supporting the governing body of the Welsh College of Horticulture through this process will be one of the Assembly Government's priorities over the next 12 months.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I am sure that you understand that, despite excellent Estyn inspection reports for all of north Wales's further education colleges, some are feeling the pinch more than others. In particular, are you aware that, during the summer, 23 senior managers were made redundant at Wrexham's Yale College as a result of a funding freeze? That is just one example. What will you and your Government do to stem this haemorrhage?

**The First Minister:** I am not sure that you have the most up-to-date figures. Mike German has put this question to me before now, but I do not think that the facts are correct. All of the colleges in north Wales have a wish to ensure that the 14-19 curriculum is developed strongly and that mergers between sixth form provision and tertiary college provision take place where appropriate. There is a major project under way in Rhyl. The potential merging of the back-office functions of some north Wales colleges and the Welsh College of Horticulture is now under consideration. That is a very healthy development, which will reduce costs.

### **Colegau Addysg Bellach**

**C1 Eleanor Burnham:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ddarpariaeth colegau addysg bellach yn y gogledd? OAQ(3)1324(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan):** Mae cynnydd da'n cael ei wneud ar y cyd yn awr i sicrhau dyfodol darpariaeth addysg bellach ym maes garddwriaeth yn y gogledd. Bydd cefnogi corff llywodraethu Coleg Garddwriaeth Cymru drwy'r broses hon yn un o flaenoriaethau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad dros y 12 mis nesaf.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn deall, er gwaethaf adroddiadau arolygu rhagorol gan Estyn ar gyfer holl golegau addysg bellach y gogledd, fod yr esgid yn gwasgu mwy i rai ohonynt na'i gilydd. Yn benodol, a ydych yn ymwybodol bod 23 uwch reolwr wedi'u diswyddo yng Ngholeg Iâl Wrecsam yn ystod yr haf o ganlyniad i rewi cyllid? Dim ond un enghraifft yw honno. Beth a wnewch chi a'ch Llywodraeth i atal y gwaedlif hwn?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn siŵr a yw'r ffigurau diweddaraf gennych. Mae Mike German wedi gofyn y cwestiwn hwn imi cyn heddiw, ond nid wyf yn credu bod y ffeithiau'n gywir. Mae pob coleg yn y gogledd yn dymuno sicrhau bod y cwricwlwm 14-19 yn cael ei ddatblygu'n gryf a bod darpariaeth chweched dosbarth a darpariaeth coleg trydyddol yn cael eu cyfuno lle bynnag y bydd yn briodol. Mae prosiect mawr ar y gweill yn y Rhyl. Mae'r posibilrwydd y gellir uno swyddogaethau cefn swyddfa rhai o golegau'r gogledd a Choleg Garddwriaeth Cymru yn cael ei ystyried. Mae hwnnw'n ddatblygiad iach iawn, a fydd yn lleihau costau.

**Sandy Mewies:** You will be aware that I recently chaired a mock European Council debate in the Assembly that drew together schools and colleges, including Deeside College from Flintshire. I have to mention that college or I will not be allowed to return to Flintshire. The schools and colleges gave an excellent performance when playing the role of member states. They came from all over Wales and had researched impeccably; many of the students studied politics, some by way of the Welsh baccalaureate. Their research and presentation, as I am sure you will agree, were excellent. Will you join me in congratulating everyone involved on their efforts, which made that a fantastic day?

**The First Minister:** It was indeed a fantastic day. I was pleased to be able to take part in the first hour of the day, although I know that others were there for much longer than that. The event was a classic demonstration of the way in which colleges of further education are no longer seen as being in some way inferior to sixth forms. We have abolished the difference of esteem between sixth forms and colleges of further education, and we now have parity of esteem, which means that all those who attend colleges of further education and those in sixth forms are expected to play an equal part in citizenship education. The mock European Council meeting was a superb example of that.

**Mark Isherwood:** You have said that the Welsh College of Horticulture is now moving forward. There have been discussions with Mike Scott of Glyndŵr University and David Jones of Deeside College. Informal discussions involving other colleges are taking place with principals and governing bodies. Do you agree that we must respect the spirit of governing bodies' incorporation, as contained in current education Acts, and ensure that this is an evolutionary process that represents their wishes and desires, provided that they are financially sound, rather than being an imposition upon them?

**Sandy Mewies:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol fy mod yn ddiweddar wedi cadeirio ffug ddadl y Cyngor Ewropeaidd yn y Cynulliad a ddaeth ag ysgolion a cholegau at ei gilydd, gan gynnwys Coleg Glannau Dyfrdwy yn sir y Fflint. Rhaid imi grybwyll y coleg hwnnw, neu ni chaf ddychwelyd i sir y Fflint. Rhoddodd yr ysgolion a'r colegau berfformiad rhagorol wrth chwarae rhan yr aelod wladwriaethau. Daethant o bob rhan o Gymru ac yr oeddent wedi gwneud gwaith ymchwil ardderchog; yr oedd llawer o'r myfyrwyr yn astudio gwleidyddiaeth, a rhai ohonynt drwy gyfrwng bagloriaeth Cymru. Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch fod eu gwaith ymchwil a'u cyflwyniadau yn rhagorol. A ymunwch â mi i longyfarch pawb a gymerodd ran am eu hymdrechion, a arweiniodd at ddiwrnod penigamp?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr oedd yn wir yn ddiwrnod penigamp. Bu'n bleser gennyf allu cymryd rhan yn awr gyntaf y diwrnod, er fy mod yn gwybod bod eraill wedi bod yno am lawer hwy na hynny. Yr oedd y digwyddiad yn ffordd wych o ddangos na chaiff colegau addysg bellach eu hystyried yn israddol mwyach o'u cymharu â'r chweched dosbarth. Yr ydym wedi diddymu'r gwahaniaeth o ran bri rhwng y chweched dosbarth a cholegau addysg bellach, ac mae gennym bellach barch cydradd, sy'n golygu bod disgwyl i bawb sy'n mynychu colegau addysg bellach a'r rhai yn y chweched dosbarth chwarae rhan gyfartal mewn addysg dinasyddiaeth. Yr oedd ffug gyfarfod y Cyngor Ewropeaidd yn enghraifft wych o hynny.

**Mark Isherwood:** Yr ydych wedi dweud bod Coleg Garddwriaeth Cymru yn symud ymlaen erbyn hyn. Bu trafodaethau gyda Mike Scott o Brifysgol Glyndŵr a David Jones o Goleg Glannau Dyfrdwy. Mae trafodaethau anffurfiol sy'n cynnwys colegau eraill yn digwydd gyda phrifathrawon a chyrrff llywodraethu. A gytunwch fod yn rhaid inni barchu ysbryd corfforiad cyrff llywodraethu, fel y'i cynhwysir yn y Deddfau addysg presennol, a sicrhau bod hon yn broses esblygol sy'n cynrychioli eu dymuniadau a'u dyheadau, cyn belled â'u bod yn gadarn yn ariannol, yn hytrach na'i bod yn cael ei gorfodi arnynt?

**The First Minister:** John Griffiths, the Deputy Minister for Skills, who has been leading for us on this issue, shares that view and has led the whole process of securing a solution that did not seem possible 12 months ago. It retains the Welsh College of Horticulture brand, it secures, as I understand it, the dissolving of the college under its present form while retaining the brand, and brings in Glyndŵr University—the North East Wales Institute of Higher Education as was—and Deeside College to take control of the campus. That will carry horticultural education forward in a way that deals with the financial viability problems that the Welsh College of Horticulture was facing.

**Janet Ryder:** Can the First Minister give us an update on the progress made in finalising the funding for the much-needed skills centre at Caia park, Wrexham, which has been developed through Yale College?

**The First Minister:** I am pleased to note that the 14-19 network in Wrexham has been granted special funding from us to progress the initial stages of this project. It will be led by Yale College and the local education authority, Wrexham County Borough Council, and it will involve the development of a full 14-19 skills centre in Wrexham. Substantial capital investment will be involved: about £5 million. I cannot give you the full details on the funding of that £5 million, but I will ensure that you get a letter from John Griffiths on the details.

### Cefnogi Busnesau

**C2 Paul Davies:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog amlinellu cynlluniau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gefnogi busnesau lleol Cymru? OAQ(3)1300(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ar ben datblygu Cymorth Hyblyg i Fusnes a'r gronfa fuddsoddi sengl, sy'n symleiddio'r broses o ddarparu cymorth ac sy'n lleihau cymhlethdod a dryswch y systemau gwahanol a oedd ar gael o'r blaen, yr ydym yn disgwyl gallu cyhoeddi manylion y system gyda Banc Buddsoddi Ewrop a Cyllid Cymru cyn bo hir.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae John Griffiths, y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Sgiliau, sydd wedi bod yn arwain drosom o ran y mater hwn, yn cyd-fynd â'r farn honno, ac mae wedi arwain yr holl broses o sicrhau ateb nad oedd yn ymddangos yn bosibl 12 mis yn ôl. Mae'n cadw brand Coleg Garddwriaeth Cymru, mae'n sicrhau, yn ôl a ddeallaf, fod y coleg yn ei ffurf bresennol yn cael ei ddiddymu gan gadw'r brand, ac yn cynnwys Prifysgol Glyndŵr—a elwid gynt yn Athrofa Addysg Uwch Gogledd Ddwyrain Cymru—a Choleg Glannau Dyfrdwy i reoli'r campws. Bydd hynny'n hyrwyddo addysg arddwriaethol mewn modd sy'n delio â'r problemau o ran hyfywedd ariannol yr oedd Coleg Garddwriaethol Cymru yn eu hwynebu.

**Janet Ryder:** A all y Prif Weinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf inni am y cynnydd a wnaethpwyd o ran sicrhau'r cyllid ar gyfer y ganolfan sgiliau y mae ei hangen yn fawr ym Mharc Caia, Wrecsam, a ddatblygwyd drwy Goleg Iâl?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n bleser gennyf nodi bod y rhwydwaith 14-19 yn Wrecsam wedi cael cyllid arbennig gennym i fwrw ymlaen â chymau cyntaf y prosiect hwn. Caiff ei arwain gan Goleg Iâl a'r awdurdod addysg lleol, Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Wrecsam, a bydd yn cynnwys datblygu canolfan sgiliau 14-19 lawn yn Wrecsam. Bydd hyn yn golygu buddsoddiad cyfalaf sylweddol: tua £5 miliwn. Ni allaf roi'r manylion llawn ichi am y cyllid ar gyfer y £5 miliwn hwnnw, ond sicrhaf eich bod yn cael llythyr gan John Griffiths am y manylion.

### Supporting Businesses

**Q2 Paul Davies:** Will the First Minister outline the Welsh Assembly Government's plans to support Wales's local businesses? OAQ(3)1300(FM)

**The First Minister:** In addition to the development of Flexible Support for Business and the single investment fund, which simplify the process of providing support and reduce the complexity and confusion in the different systems that were available previously, we expect to be able to announce details of the system with the European Investment Bank and Finance

Wales before long.

**Paul Davies:** Mae'n bwysig bod sefydliadau sy'n cefnogi busnesau bach yn cael yr help y maent yn ei haeddu. Yn anffodus, mae Pembrokeshire Business Initiative, yn fy etholaeth i, yn y broses o gwtogi ar ei staff yn sylweddol oherwydd diffyg arian. Mae'r sefydliad yn cynnig cyngor hanfodol i fusnesau lleol i'w helpu i ddatblygu. Mae sefyllfa ariannol bresennol PBI wedi codi am nad yw wedi cael y cyfle i gynnig am arian cydgyfeirio ac, fel y gwyddom oll, dylai cwmnïoedd fod wedi gallu cael mynediad at yr arian hwnnw ymhell cyn hyn. A all y Prif Weinidog ddweud wrthym pam mae'r sefyllfa hon yn bod a phryd y bydd yr arian ar gael i sefydliadau megis PBI?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni allaf sôn yn fanwl yma heddiw am yr hyn a ddigwyddodd gyda PBI. Weithiau, mae rhai o'r cyrff cyfryngol hyn sy'n rhoi cymorth i fusnes ond sy'n dibynnu ar arian cyhoeddus i allu cyflogi staff penodol yn colli contract neu'n canfod nad ydynt yn gymwys i gystadlu yn gorff cyfryngol a ariennir yn gyhoeddus. Nid wyf yn siŵr beth a ddigwyddodd o ran PBI, ond yr wyf yn gyfarwydd â'r cwmni.

Yn gyffredinol, mae'r system o sicrhau bod busnesau yn gallu cael pecyn sy'n eu siwtio ac sydd wedi'i addasu at eu gofynion ariannol a chyffredinol yn gryfach o lawer nag ydoedd o'r blaen.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Ategap yr hyn y mae Paul newydd ei ddweud. Mae sefydliadau yn fy etholaeth i sy'n dioddef yn yr un modd â'r sefydliad y bu iddo gyfeirio ato. Yr oeddech yn sôn, Brif Weinidog, am sicrhau bod busnesau yn cael y gefnogaeth a'r cyngor y mae arnynt eu hangen, ac mae gwefan Cymorth Hyblyg i Fusnes yn gymorth arbennig o bwysig i fusnesau bach. Fodd bynnag, fel yr ydym wedi trafod sawl gwaith yn y Siambr, mae sawl ardal yn fy etholaeth i ac mewn etholaethau eraill na allant dderbyn gwasanaeth band eang ac felly ni allant gael y cymorth uniongyrchol hwn sydd ar y wefan. Beth mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i gynorthwyo'r busnesau hynny, yn enwedig busnesau bach sy'n hanfodol i'r economi leol, yn y sefyllfa economaidd hynod anodd sydd ohoni?

**Paul Davies:** It is vital that organisations that support small businesses get the help that they deserve. Unfortunately, Pembrokeshire Business Initiative in my constituency is in the process of substantially reducing its staff numbers because of a shortage of funds. That organisation offers essential advice to local businesses to help them to develop. PBI's current financial situation arose because it was unable to bid for convergence funding, and, as we all know, companies should have been permitted access to that money long before now. Can the First Minister tell us why this situation prevails and when that money will be available to companies such as PBI?

**The First Minister:** I cannot speak in any great detail here about what happened with PBI. Sometimes, some of these intermediaries that give support to business but which rely on public money to be able to employ specific staff lose a contract or discover that they are not qualified to compete as a publicly funded intermediary body. I am not sure what happened with PBI, although I am familiar with the company.

Generally speaking, the system of ensuring that businesses can access a package that suits them and that has been tailored to their financial and general needs is far more robust than it was previously.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I endorse what Paul has just said. There are organisations in my constituency that suffer in much the same way as that to which he referred. First Minister, you talked about ensuring that businesses get the support and advice that they need, and the Flexible Support for Business website is a vital tool for small businesses. However, as we have discussed several times in the Chamber, there are many areas in my constituency and in others that cannot receive broadband services, and so cannot access directly the support available on that website. What is the Government doing to assist those businesses, particularly small businesses, which are essential to the local economy, given the extremely difficult economic circumstances that are prevailing at present?

1.40 p.m.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Heblaw am y pwyntiau yr wyf eisoes wedi cyfeirio atynt, fel yr oeddwn yn dweud yn gynharach, yr ydym yn disgwyl gallu gwneud cyhoeddiad arloesol ynghylch dod â Banc Buddsoddi Ewrop i mewn i'r broses a chyfuno hynny â'r hyn yr ydym yn ei ddarparu yn barod drwy Cyllid Cymru, y banc a sefydlwyd 20 mlynedd yn ôl yn y sector cyhoeddus er mwyn rhoi cymorth i fusnesau sydd eisiau buddsoddi.

**Mick Bates:** Many small renewable energy suppliers in Wales are disadvantaged when compared with larger businesses, as they cannot benefit from schemes such as carbon trading. Does the First Minister agree that one simple step that the Welsh Assembly Government could take to aid producers would be to pay renewable energy suppliers an amount per unit of carbon that they reduce? That could include microgeneration, which would offer a large incentive for homeowners to use it, and would also be a great way for the Assembly Government to collect accurate data on the renewable energy capacity of Wales. Will the First Minister give his support to such a scheme, which would reward producers for carbon saved, rather than wasting money on consultations for projects that sometimes never get off the ground, such as the renewable energy route-map?

**The First Minister:** I can undertake to provide moral support, but the people whom you have been talking to are probably more interested in practical support. So that I do not say something that cannot be followed up, I need to check where our responsibilities begin and where those of the Westminster Government and of some of the specialist agencies, such as the Carbon Trust, end. I know that it has long been thought that microgeneration industries and their potential customer relationships are not as effective as they could be. I will write to you about the particular point that you raised.

**Joyce Watson:** Small businesses contribute a

**The First Minister:** Apart from the points that I have already referred to, as I was saying earlier, we expect to be able to make an innovative announcement about bringing the European Investment Bank into the process and combining it with what we are already providing through Finance Wales, the bank that was established 20 years ago in the public sector to assist businesses that wish to invest.

**Mick Bates:** Mae nifer o gyflenwyr ynni adnewyddadwy bach yng Nghymru dan anfantais o'u cymharu â busnesau mwy, gan na allant fanteisio ar gynlluniau megis masnachu carbon. A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn cytuno mai un cam syml y gallai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ei gymryd i gynorthwyo cynhyrchwyr fyddai talu swm i gyflenwyr ynni adnewyddadwy am bob uned o garbon y byddant yn ei lleihau? Gallai hynny gynnwys microgynhyrchu, a fyddai'n cynnig cymhelliad mawr i berchenogion cartrefi ei ddefnyddio, a byddai hefyd yn ffordd wych i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad gasglu data cywir am allu Cymru i gynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy. A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog roi ei gefnogaeth i gynllun o'r fath, a fyddai'n gwobrwyo cynhyrchwyr am y carbon y byddant yn ei arbed, yn hytrach na gwastraffu arian ar ymgynghoriadau ar gyfer prosiectau na fyddant byth yn llwyddo i ddechrau weithiau, megis y trywydd ynni adnewyddadwy?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gallaf addo rhoi cefnogaeth foesol, ond mae'n debygol bod gan y bobl y buoch yn siarad â hwy fwy o ddi-ddordeb mewn cefnogaeth ymarferol. Rhag imi ddweud rhywbeth na allaf weithredu arno, bydd angen imi cael cadarnhad beth yw ein cyfrifoldebau ni a beth yw cyfrifoldebau Llywodraeth San Steffan a rhai o'r asiantaethau arbenigol, megis yr Ymddiriedaeth Garbon. Gwn fod pobl yn credu ers cryn amser nad yw diwydiannau microgynhyrchu a'u cysylltiadau â chwsmeriaid posibl mor effeithiol ag y gallent fod. Ysgrifennaf atoch am y pwynt penodol a godasoch.

**Joyce Watson:** Mae busnesau bach yn

huge amount to rural communities by way of jobs and income, so supporting them and helping them to grow, and creating the right conditions for them to start up, especially in these tough times, should be a priority. The announcement last month of a £7 million-worth package of rate relief, which will support around 10,500 smaller businesses, shows that the Welsh Assembly Government is fully committed to supporting small businesses. Can the First Minister please report on the progress of another avenue of support, which was a pledge in the Labour manifesto, namely the single investment fund for businesses?

**The First Minister:** I am glad that you referred to the small business rate relief package, which will have a widespread beneficial effect across a large range of businesses that pay business rates. Clearly, many businesses do not pay business rates because they are start-ups or do not have premises, and, if you do not pay rates in the first place, you cannot then have rate relief. We believe that around one third of business do not pay business rates, but, of the two thirds that do pay them, if they are small businesses and eligible, the rate relief scheme will give them a boost.

The single investment fund was one of Andrew Davies's pet projects when he was the Minister for Economy and Transport. It has been brought up to scratch and made part of the new system of Flexible Support for Business. The whole single investment fund and Flexible Support for Business package is now as good a package as you can get anywhere in the UK, and is probably better than most.

### Long-term Unemployment

**Q3 David Melding:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the rate of long-term unemployment in Wales? OAQ(3)1312(FM)

**The First Minister:** According to the latest figures, for the year to March 2008, 18,000 people in Wales had been unemployed for more than 12 months, which accounts for 23 per cent of all unemployed people in Wales. In the UK as a whole, long-term

cyfrannu llawer iawn at gymunedau gwledig drwy gyfrwng swyddi ac incwm, felly dylai eu cefnogi a'u helpu i dyfu, a chreu'r amodau cywir iddynt gychwyn, fod yn flaenoriaeth, yn enwedig yn ystod y cyfnod dyrys hwn. Y mis diwethaf, cyhoeddwyd pecyn gwerth £7 miliwn o ryddhad ardrethi, a fydd yn cefnogi tua 10,500 o fusnesau bach, sy'n dangos bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ymrwymo'n llwyr i gefnogi busnesau bach. A all y Prif Weinidog roi adroddiad am hynt ffynhonnell arall o gymorth, a oedd yn addewid ym maniffesto Llafur, sef y gronfa fuddsoddi sengl i fusnesau?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi cyfeirio at y pecyn rhyddhad ardrethi i fusnesau bach, a fydd o gryn fudd i amrywiaeth eang o fusnesau sy'n talu ardrethi busnes. Yn amlwg, ceir llawer o fusnesau nad ydynt yn talu ardrethi busnes am eu bod newydd gychwyn neu am nad oes ganddynt adeiladau, ac os nad ydych yn talu ardrethi yn y man cyntaf, ni allwch gael rhyddhad ardrethi. Yr ydym yn credu nad yw tua un rhan o dair o fusnesau yn talu ardrethi busnes, ond, o'r ddwy ran o dair sy'n eu talu, os ydynt yn fusnesau bach ac yn gymwys, bydd y cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi'n rhoi hwb iddynt.

Un o hoff brosiectau Andrew Davies oedd y gronfa fuddsoddi sengl pan oedd yn Weinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth. Mae wedi'i hailwampio a'i gwneud yn rhan o'r system newydd, Cymorth Hyblyg i Fusnes. Mae holl becyn y gronfa fuddsoddi sengl a Chymorth Hyblyg i Fusnes erbyn hyn yn gystal pecyn ag y gallwch ei gael yn unrhyw le yn y DU, ac mae'n siŵr ei fod yn well na'r rhan fwyaf ohonynt.

### Diweithdra Hirdymor

**C3 David Melding:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am gyfradd diweithdra hirdymor yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)1312(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn ôl y ffigurau diweddaraf, ar gyfer y flwyddyn hyd at fis Mawrth 2008, yr oedd 18,000 o bobl Cymru wedi bod yn ddi-waith ers mwy na 12 mis, sy'n 23 y cant o holl bobl ddi-waith Cymru. Yn y DU yn gyffredinol, mae diweithdra



unemployment comprises 25 per cent of total unemployment.

**David Melding:** We are in very difficult economic times, and many economists believe that western economies will suffer an increase in unemployment. Do you agree that, through this difficult phase, we must retain a policy of reducing long-term unemployment as a matter of the highest priority? Have you been made aware of recent studies, which I believe emanate from Cardiff University, that describe long-term unemployment as one of the greatest known risks to public health? The immediate lever that we have at our disposal is perhaps the European structural funds, to ensure that we get to that important group so that their economic, social and health status improves in general.

**The First Minister:** Indeed. Edwina Hart, the Minister for Health and Social Services, and I had a meeting on precisely that subject with Professor Mansel Aylward and Professor Don Berwick of Harvard Medical School last Friday. There is no doubt that long-term unemployment is a health problem as well as an economic problem. It is important that we get the balance right between preventing people from becoming long-term unemployed and trying to plough the ground with today's generation of long-term unemployed people to get them active and back into the labour market. I should mention the ReACT scheme, which has been extremely successful at ensuring that we catch people as they register their unemployed status, and recycle them back into the labour market quickly. If they do that quickly, they will not suffer employment problems or the health problems that are a consequence of becoming long-term unemployed.

**Ann Jones:** Rhodri, I welcome your statement, which was issued earlier today, about the intention to award the contract for the construction of the Government's flagship Llandudno Junction office. I also welcome the commitment that that shows to the people of north Wales. Will you provide

hirdymor yn 25 y cant o gyfanswm diweithdra.

**David Melding:** Yr ydym mewn cyfnod economaidd anodd iawn, ac mae llawer o economegwyr yn credu y bydd cynnydd mewn diweithdra yn economïau'r gorllewin. A ydych yn cytuno, drwy'r cyfnod anodd hwn, fod yn rhaid inni gadw polisi o leihau diweithdra hirdymor fel mater sy'n cael y flaenoriaeth uchaf? A ydych yn ymwybodol o astudiaethau'n ddiweddar, yn tarddu o Brifysgol Caerdydd, fe gredaf, sy'n disgrifio diweithdra hirdymor fel un o'r peryglon mwyaf y gwyddys amdanynt i iechyd cyhoeddus? Efallai mai'r dull o ddyllanwadu ar y sefyllfa sydd ar gael inni ar unwaith yw'r cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd, i sicrhau ein bod yn cael gafael ar y grŵp pwysig hwnnw er mwyn i'w statws economaidd, eu statws cymdeithasol a'u statws o ran iechyd wella'n gyffredinol.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn wir. Cafodd Edwina Hart, y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, a minnau gyfarfod ar yr union bwnc hwnnw gyda'r Athro Mansel Aylward a'r Athro Don Berwick o Ysgol Feddygol Harvard ddydd Gwener diwethaf. Nid oes dim amheuaeth nad yw diweithdra hirdymor yn broblem iechyd yn ogystal â phroblem economaidd. Mae'n bwysig inni sicrhau'r cydbwysedd cywir rhwng atal pobl rhag bod yn ddi-waith yn y tymor hir a cheisio braenaru'r tir gyda'r genhedlaeth bresennol o bobl sy'n ddi-waith yn y tymor hir i sicrhau eu bod yn weithgar ac yn ailymuno â'r farchnad lafur. Dylwn sôn am y cynllun ReACT, sydd wedi bod yn llwyddiannus dros ben o ran sicrhau ein bod yn dal pobl wrth iddynt gofrestru eu statws di-waith, a'u hailgylchu'n ôl i'r farchnad lafur yn gyflym. Os byddant yn gwneud hynny'n gyflym, ni fyddant yn dioddef problemau diweithdra na'r problemau iechyd a geir yn sgîl bod yn ddi-waith yn y tymor hir.

**Ann Jones:** Rhodri, croesawaf eich datganiad, a gyhoeddwyd yn gynharach heddiw, ynghylch y bwriad i ddyfarnu'r contract ar gyfer adeiladu un o brif swyddfeydd y Llywodraeth yng Nghyffordd Llandudno. Yr wyf hefyd yn croesawu'r ymrwymiad y mae hynny'n ei ddangos i bobl

us with details of the contractors and of the employment opportunities for people in north Wales?

**The First Minister:** That announcement was made in response to a written question, published a few hours ago. We have said that we intend to award the contract to Pochin's Plc of Middlewich in Cheshire. That firm is extremely well known in north Wales, as well as in north-west England. Part of the reason why it did so well, and why we intend to award it the contract—subject to the 10-day standstill period that we have to go through, for legal reasons—is that it scored highly on sustainability and on community benefit, which was part of the contract-awarding procedure. We hope that many of the sub-contractors that Pochin's frequently uses will come from north Wales. Likewise, we hope that as many people as possible from north Wales will be employed in building that building, which shows our commitment to north Wales.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Nick Bourne):** First Minister, you will have seen the reports—indeed, you commented on them—in the Sunday newspapers of the abolition of the free prescriptions policy. Is that being considered, particularly given that it is undoubtedly a subsidy for many people who can afford to pay for their prescriptions, although I fully appreciate that many people cannot, including the long-term unemployed and the chronically ill? At a time when resources are so scarce, should we not consider putting the money contributed by those who can afford to pay for their prescription medicines into the new drugs budget, for example, to put towards the new drugs and treatments that are coming online, which we cannot currently afford?

**The First Minister:** No. Sorry, but the reports made in the *News of the World* are absolute bilge. They were rebutted on the day. We do not know where they came from. Looking again at the free prescriptions policy may be a policy that you support, but we

gogledd Cymru. A rowch fanylion inni ynghylch y contractwyr a'r cyfleoedd cyflogaeth i bobl yn y gogledd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gwnaethpwyd y cyhoeddiad hwnnw mewn ateb i gwestiwn ysgrifenedig, a gyhoeddwyd ychydig oriau'n ôl. Yr ydym wedi dweud ein bod yn bwriadu dyfarnu'r contract i Pochin's Plc o Middlewich yn swydd Gaer. Mae'r cwmni hwnnw'n adnabyddus dros ben yng ngogledd Cymru, yn ogystal ag yng ngogledd-orllewin Lloegr. Rhan o'r rheswm pam yr oedd mor llwyddiannus, a pham y bwriadwn ddyfarnu'r contract iddo—yn amodol ar y cyfnod dim symud o 10 diwrnod y mae'n rhaid inni lynu wrtho, am resymau cyfreithiol—yw am iddo sgorio'n uchel o ran cynaliadwyedd ac o ran budd cymunedol, a oedd yn rhan o'r weithdrefn ar gyfer dyfarnu'r contract. Gobeithiwn y bydd llawer o'r iscontractwyr a ddefnyddir yn gyson gan Pochin's yn dod o ogledd Cymru. Yn yr un modd, gobeithiwn y bydd cynifer o bobl ag sy'n bosibl o ogledd Cymru'n cael eu cyflogi i adeiladu'r adeilad hwnnw, sy'n dangos ein hymrwymiad i ogledd Cymru.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Nick Bourne):** Brif Weinidog, byddwch wedi gweld yr adroddiadau—yn wir, gwnaethoch sylw arnynt—yn y papurau newydd ddydd Sul ynglŷn â diddymu'r polisi presgripsiynau am ddim. A yw hynny'n cael ei ystyried, yn enwedig o gofio ei fod, yn sicr, yn gymhorthdal i lawer o bobl a all fforddio talu am eu presgripsiynau, er fy mod yn llwyr sylweddoli na all llawer o bobl dalu amdanynt, gan gynnwys pobl sy'n ddi-waith yn y tymor hir a phobl sydd â salwch cronig? Ar adeg pan yw adnoddau mor brin, oni ddylem ystyried rhoi'r arian a gyfrennir gan y rhai a all fforddio talu am eu meddyginiaeth ar bresgripsiwn yn y gyllideb cyffuriau newydd, er enghraifft, i helpu i dalu am y cyffuriau a'r triniaethau newydd sy'n cael eu cyflwyno, na allwn eu fforddio ar hyn o bryd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Na ddylem. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ond sothach llwyr yw'r adroddiadau yn y *News of the World*. Cawsant eu gwrthbrofi y diwrnod hwnnw. Ni wyddom o ble y daethant. Efallai fod edrych eto ar y polisi presgripsiynau am ddim yn bolisi yr

have no intention of doing so.

**Nick Bourne:** We certainly pledged in our last manifesto to review it in the light of circumstances. Given the current economic crisis that we are in, and given that we need money to put into the affordable housing budget and the budget for new drugs and treatments—and the First Minister no doubt saw, as I did, the announcement about the new breakthrough vaccine for breast cancer, which will hopefully become available soon—does it really make sense to subsidise the middle class? If people can afford to make a contribution to the cost of their prescription medicines—and I am not suggesting that they pay the full cost—would it not be better to channel that money to the sharp end so that we have money for treatments that we cannot currently afford?

**The First Minister:** If you had the political responsibility, you would have the opportunity to ‘review’, as you put it, or even to get rid of the free prescriptions policy. As it is, you may put the question to us. I can tell you why we went for free prescriptions. The first reason was the complexity of the existing system, in which only some long-term conditions got free prescriptions. Secondly, we felt that revising the list of conditions eligible for free prescriptions would serve only to create further anomalies. Thirdly, in the circumstances that prevailed in the run-up to the 2003 elections, it was of huge benefit to those people who were in paid work, but who earned the national minimum wage or just over it—typically, cleaners, caterers and carers—and who had multiple health conditions, requiring four or five prescription items. If they came off benefits and went to work for low wages, at entry-level employment, they could retain the benefit of having free prescriptions, which they would have had if they were claiming benefits and out of work.

ydych yn ei gefnogi, ond nid yw'n fwriad o gwbl gennym ni wneud hynny.

**Nick Bourne:** Yn sicr, addawsom yn ein maniffesto diwethaf y byddem yn ei adolygu yng ngoleuni'r amgylchiadau. O ystyried yr argyfwng economaidd sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd, a bod angen arian arnom i'w roi yn y gyllideb tai fforddiadwy a'r gyllideb ar gyfer cyffuriau a thriniaethau newydd—ac yn ddiamau gwelodd y Prif Weinidog, fel y gwelais innau, y cyhoeddiad ynghylch y brechlyn sy'n torri tir newydd ar gyfer canser y fron, a fydd ar gael cyn hir, gobeithio—a yw rhoi cymhorthdal i'r dosbarth canol yn gwneud synnwyr mewn gwirionedd? Os gall pobl fforddio gwneud cyfraniad at gost eu meddyginiaeth ar bresgripsiwn—ac nid wyf yn awgrymu y dylent dalu'r gost yn llawn—oni fyddai'n well sianelu'r arian hwnnw i'r maes lle y mae gwir angen fel y bydd gennym arian ar gyfer triniaethau na allwn eu fforddio ar hyn o bryd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Petai'r cyfrifoldeb gwleidyddol gennych, byddai'r cyfle gennych i 'adolygu'r' polisi presgripsiynau am ddim, fel y dywedaso, neu hyd yn oed gael gwared arno. Y sefyllfa ar hyn o bryd yw y cewch ofyn y cwestiwn i ni. Gallaf ddweud wrthy ch pam y dewisom bresgripsiynau am ddim. Y rheswm cyntaf oedd cymhlethdod y system ar y pryd, a dim ond pobl â rhai cyflyrau hirdymor yn cael presgripsiynau am ddim. Yn ail, teimlem mai'r hyn a wnâi adolygu'r rhestr o gyflyrau sy'n gymwys i gael presgripsiynau am ddim fyddai creu rhagor o anghysondebau. Yn drydydd, dan yr amgylchiadau a gafwyd yn y cyfnod cyn etholiad 2003, yr oedd o fudd anferth i'r bobl hynny a oedd mewn gwaith cyflogedig, ond yn ennill yr isafswm cyflog cenedlaethol, neu fymryn mwy na hynny—glanhawyr, arlwywyr a gofalwyr fel arfer—ac yr oedd amryw o gyflyrau iechyd ganddynt, oedd yn peri bod arnynt angen pedair neu bum eitem ar bresgripsiwn. Petaent yn peidio â chael budd-daliadau, ac yn dechrau gweithio am gyflogau isel, mewn cyflogaeth ar y lefel mynediad, gallent barhau i fanteisio ar gael presgripsiynau am ddim, y byddent wedi'u cael petaent yn hawlio budd-daliadau ac yn ddi-waith.

1.50 p.m.

**Nick Bourne:** Nobody is against free prescriptions for the chronically ill. Indeed, free prescriptions for those who require repeat prescriptions could easily be taken care of by other means. What is at issue here is a subsidy for those like you and me who might need a prescription once in a while—although you qualify as a pensioner, so let us say that I need a prescription once in a while. At the moment, I cannot pay towards the cost of that prescription. If I could, the money raised could be channelled back into the health service to be used for treatments that are coming online and that cannot be afforded. We know that doctors are issuing prescriptions for over-the-counter items such as milk of magnesia, which people are going in for—

**David Lloyd:** That is bilge.

**Nick Bourne:** It is absolutely true that people are doing this.

**David Lloyd:** Change your researcher.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The leader of the opposition has a right to be heard in silence, as indeed do other Members.

**Nick Bourne:** I am grateful, Llywydd.

There is evidence—I am not saying that it is widespread—of people getting things that they could buy over the counter. The real issue is, however, that those people who previously made a contribution towards a prescription cost are now unable to do so. Money raised in that way could be channelled back into the national health service to be used on treatments that we currently cannot afford, such as the new drugs that are coming online for cancer, such as the new drug to treat breast cancer that I referred to yesterday, and Alzheimer's disease. Would that not be a better way of approaching things when we are in an economic crisis? As we will see from the budget when it is issued, we are unable to afford to do many of the things that we would like to do as a country.

**Nick Bourne:** Nid oes neb yn erbyn presgripsiynau am ddim i'r rhai sydd ag afiechydon cronig. Yn wir, gellid talu am bresgripsiynau i'r rhai y mae angen presgripsiynau amlroddadwy arnynt yn hawdd drwy ddulliau eraill. Yr hyn sydd dan sylw yma yw cymhorthdal i'r rhai fel chi a mi y bydd angen presgripsiwn arnynt o bryd i'w gilydd efallai—er eich bod chi'n bensiyntwr, felly beth am ddweud bod angen presgripsiwn arnaf fi o bryd i'w gilydd. Ar hyn o bryd, ni allaf gyfrannu at gost y presgripsiwn hwnnw. Pe gallwn wneud hynny, gellid sianelu'r arian a godid yn ôl i'r gwasanaeth iechyd i'w ddefnyddio ar gyfer triniaethau a gyflwynir na ellir eu fforddio. Gwyddom fod meddygon yn rhoi presgripsiynau ar gyfer eitemau sydd ar gael dros y cownter, megis llaeth magnesia, y mae pobl yn dewis eu cael—

**David Lloyd:** Rwts yw hynny.

**Nick Bourne:** Mae'n gwbl wir bod pobl yn gwneud hyn.

**David Lloyd:** Newidiwch eich ymchwilydd.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae gan Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid, fel pob Aelod arall, hawl i gael ei glywed mewn tawelwch.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar, Lywydd.

Ceir tystiolaeth—nid wyf yn dweud ei fod yn gyffredin—fod pobl yn cael pethau y gallent eu prynu dros y cownter. Yr hyn dan sylw mewn gwirionedd, fodd bynnag, yw na all y bobl hynny a oedd gynt yn cyfrannu at gost presgripsiwn wneud hynny ar hyn o bryd. Gellid sianelu arian a godid yn y ffordd honno yn ôl i'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol i'w ddefnyddio ar driniaethau na allwn eu fforddio ar hyn o bryd, megis y cyffuriau newydd sy'n cael eu cyflwyno ar gyfer canser, megis y cyffur newydd i drin canser y fron y cyfeiriais ato ddoe, a chlefyd Alzheimer. Oni fyddai hynny'n ffordd well o fynd ati i wneud pethau, a ninnau mewn argyfwng economaidd? Fel y gwelwn o'r gyllideb pan gaiff ei chyhoeddi, ni allwn fforddio gwneud llawer o'r pethau yr hoffem eu gwneud fel gwlad.

**The First Minister:** You say that this is something for the middle classes—you originally said that it was for you and me, but I am exempt anyway on grounds of age. We have heard this before. Middle class people can be old, and I do not think that even you are proposing that middle class people aged over 60 should have their free prescriptions withdrawn or reconsidered—or perhaps you are; I do not know. In any case, I need not declare an interest in this matter, as I have no interest in it because of my age. I have had free prescriptions now for nine years, and I am middle class.

What you say is wrong. The people for whom it makes a difference are those who are earning the minimum wage or just above, or those who might be considering whether it would be better for them to stay on benefits or to get a job and lose many of the benefits, be they council tax benefit, housing benefit or whatever else it might be. Edwina Hart has already announced her proposals to take forward the wicked issue of very expensive wonder drugs, which are coming on to the market, and she is considering exactly how we will deal with that difficult issue. You are talking about going down the road of saying that having some long-term, chronic conditions should entitle you to free prescriptions, whether or not you are middle class, as you would put it, while having other long-term conditions should not. Those conditions have not been reviewed since 1968, as I recall, and diabetics used to have free prescriptions, but cancer sufferers did not, and that was a nonsense. Even if you add to them, as the Westminster Government now proposes, and you say, ‘Okay, we’ll put cancer on the list’, even then HIV/AIDS will not be on the list, I understand. You will always have these invidious issues. We wanted to get rid of all of those anomalous problems by getting rid of the prescription charge.

**Gareth Jones:** Brif Weinidog, gan fod y

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dywedwch mai rhywbeth i bobl dosbarth canol yw hyn—yn wreiddiol, dywedasoch mai rhywbeth ar ein cyfer ni’n dau ydoedd, ond fe’m heithrir oherwydd fy oedran. Yr ydym wedi clywed hyn o’r blaen. Gall pobl dosbarth canol fod yn hen, ac ni chredaf eich bod chi, hyd yn oed, yn cynnig y dylid diddymu neu ailystyried presgripsiynau pobl dosbarth canol 60 oed a hŷn—neu efallai eich bod yn cynnig hynny; ni wn. Beth bynnag, nid oes angen imi ddatgan buddiant yn y mater hwn, am nad oes gennyf fuddiant ynddo oherwydd fy oedran. Yr wyf wedi cael presgripsiynau am ddim ers naw mlynedd erbyn hyn, ac yr wyf yn aelod o’r dosbarth canol.

Mae’r hyn a ddywedwch yn anghywir. Y bobl y mae hyn yn gwneud gwahaniaeth iddynt yw’r rhai sy’n ennill yr isafswm cyflog neu fymryn mwy na hynny, neu’r rhai sydd efallai’n ystyried a fyddai’n well iddynt aros ar fudd-daliadau neu gael swydd a cholli llawer o’r budd-daliadau, boed y rheini’n fudd-dal y dreth gyngor, budd-dal tai neu beth bynnag arall y gallent fod. Mae Edwina Hart eisoes wedi cyhoeddi ei chynigion i ddatblygu’r mater enbyd ynghylch cyffuriau gwyrthiol drud iawn, sydd wrthi’n dod ar y farchnad, ac mae’n ystyried sut yn union y byddwn yn delio â’r mater anodd hwnnw. Yr ydych yn sôn am ddweud y dylai rhai cyflyrau hirdymor, cronig, beri bod hawl ichi gael presgripsiynau am ddim, ni waeth a ydych yn aelod o’r dosbarth canol, fel y byddech yn eu disgrifio, ai peidio, tra na ddylai cyflyrau hirdymor eraill roi’r hawl honno. Nid yw’r cyflyrau hynny wedi’u hadolygu ers 1968, os cofiaf yn iawn, ac yr oedd pobl â diabetes yn arfer cael presgripsiynau am ddim, ond nid oedd pobl â chanser yn eu cael, ac yr oedd hynny’n hurt. Hyd yn oed os byddwch yn ychwanegu atynt, fel y mae Llywodraeth San Steffan yn cynnig ar hyn o bryd, ac yn dweud, ‘O’r gorau, rhown ganser ar y rhestr’, hyd yn oed wedyn ni fydd HIV/AIDS ar y rhestr, yn ôl a ddeallaf. Bydd y cwestiynau annymunol hyn gennyh bob amser. Yr oedd arnom eisiau cael gwared ar yr holl broblemau anghyson hynny drwy gael gwared ar y tâl am bresgripsiynau.

**Gareth Jones:** First Minister, given that this

cwestiwn hwn yn ymwneud â diweithdra tymor hir, ategaf yr hyn ddywedodd Ann Jones a chrosawaf eich datganiad am yr adeilad newydd yng Nghyffordd Llandudno.

Mae'r ardal honno, fel y gwyddoch, wedi dioddef cryn dipyn dros y blynyddoedd, ac mae diweithdra yno. A wnewch ystyried gwneud yr adeilad, pan ddaw, yn ganolbwynt i adfywiad ardal Cyffordd Llandudno? Mae dyfodiad yr adeilad ynddo ei hun yn beth calonogol y gallwn edrych ymlaen ato ac efallai gynllunio ar ei gyfer, nid yn unig o ran yr adeilad ond o ran y gymuned, sydd mor awyddus i weld gwelliannau.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Wrth gwrs. Mae gwendid wedi bod yn economi leol Cyffordd Llandudno ers i'r ffatri Hotpoint gau. Yr ydym wedi penderfynu lleoli ein gwasanaethau yn y gogledd ar y groesffordd hon—ac wrth siarad am groesffordd, nid yr A55 a'r A470 yn unig a olygir; mae'n groesffordd i'r system reilffyrdd hefyd, gan fod lein dyffryn Conwy a'r lein fawr o Gaergybi i'r dwyrain yn mynd heibio i'r safle. Mae tir ar gael ger y safle hwn a bydd pencadlys newydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad mewn lle amlwg, lle gall pobl y sector preifat sydd yn teithio ar fws neu drên ei weld, a bydd yn denu pobl—bydd fel chwifio baner—i ddatblygu'r parc busnes newydd sydd gerllaw.

**Kirsty Williams:** First Minister, unemployment figures rose by 3,000 during the past three months. Those are the worst jobless figures that Wales has seen during the past decade, and that is before the financial crisis really hits the economy, which many commentators say is inevitable. Do you agree that what Welsh employers need to keep people in work is a cut in interest rates and an end to the uncertainty in the financial markets? What discussions have you had with your colleagues in London on hurrying up with the plan to stabilise the banking system in this country and to extend the remit of the Bank of England so that it looks at the general wellbeing of the economy, rather than just at inflation rates?

**The First Minister:** I agree with most of

question is about long-term unemployment, I support what Ann Jones said, and welcome your statement about the new building in Llandudno Junction.

That area, as you know, has suffered quite a bit over the years, and there is unemployment there. Will you consider making the building, when it is built, a focus for the regeneration of the Llandudno Junction area? The new building in itself is encouraging; it is something that we can look forward to and, perhaps, plan for, not only as a building but for the community, which is so keen to see improvements.

**The First Minister:** Of course. The Llandudno Junction local economy has been weak since the closure of the Hotpoint factory. We have decided to locate our services in north Wales on this crossroads—and in talking about a crossroads, we do not only mean the A55 and the A470; it is also a crossroads for the rail system, given that the Conwy valley line and the mainline from Holyhead to the east pass the site. Land is available close to this site and the Assembly Government's new headquarters will be visible to people from the private sector travelling by bus or train, and it will attract people—it will be like flying a flag—to develop the neighbouring business park.

**Kirsty Williams:** Brif Weinidog, mae ffigurau diweithdra wedi codi 3,000 dros y tri mis diwethaf. Y rheini yw'r ffigurau diweithdra gwaethaf a welwyd yng Nghymru yn ystod y degawd diwethaf, ac mae hynny cyn i'r argyfwng ariannol gael effaith wirioneddol ar yr economi, sef rhywbeth sy'n anochel yn ôl llawer o sylwebyddion. A gytunwch mai'r hyn y mae ar gyflogwyr Cymru ei angen i gadw pobl mewn gwaith yw torri cyfraddau llog a rhoi terfyn ar yr ansicrwydd yn y marchnadoedd ariannol? Pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi'u cynnal gyda'ch cyd-aelodau yn Llundain ynglŷn â phrysu'r cynllun i sefydlogi'r system fancio yn y wlad hon ac ymestyn cylch gwaith Banc Lloegr er mwyn iddo edrych ar les cyffredinol yr economi, yn hytrach nag ar gyfraddau chwyddiant yn unig?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cytunaf â'r rhan fwyaf o'r

those propositions, Kirsty. Something quite catastrophic happened between the end of the second quarter and the beginning of the third quarter in June or July, where orders seemed to fall off a cliff not merely in property, construction and financial services, but also in the wider economy. On whether or not a cut in interest rates on its own would do very much to kick-start the banking system, the banking system has gone into lockdown: banks are simply not lending and building societies are not negotiating mortgages any longer, because they are fearful of a run on the bank or building society. That is why three of the four big, high street clearing banks—every one that is British owned; not HSBC, which is not British owned—went to the Chancellor of the Exchequer last night to ask whether he could help them to recapitalise so that they could start lending to each other, the general public and to business once again, by taking, say, 10 per cent of shares. You need something to solve this constipation problem in the banking system. Banks are so worried about their capital adequacy that they are not lending to anyone. At the moment, the banks are like French peasants hoarding the money in a sock under the mattress and not lending money to business or householders, and we must find a way of releasing that money.

### School Transport

**Q4 Chris Franks:** What discussions has the First Minister had regarding school transport in South Wales Central? OAQ(3)1322(FM)

**The First Minister:** In south Wales, central or otherwise, as in the rest of Wales, the Assembly Proposed Learner Travel (Wales) Measure, which was passed in Plenary last week as our second major piece of legislation, is now before the Privy Council for approval. Regulations will be published for consultation, and the aim is to bring them into force in the spring of next year. Pupils using school transport across south Wales and elsewhere will benefit from its increased set of entitlements from next September.

gosodiadau hynny, Kirsty. Digwyddodd rhywbeth eithaf trychinebus rhwng diwedd yr ail chwarter a dechrau'r trydydd chwarter ym mis Mehefin neu ym mis Gorffennaf, pan fu gostyngiad syfrdanol mewn archebion, yn ôl pob golwg, nid yn unig ym meysydd eiddo, adeiladu a gwasanaethau ariannol, ond hefyd yn yr economi ehangach. O ran a fyddai torri cyfraddau llog ar ei ben ei hun yn gwneud llawer i roi hwb i'r system fancio, mae'r system fancio'n ddisymud: nid yw banciau'n rhoi benthyg arian ac nid yw cymdeithasau adeiladu'n negodi morgeisi bellach, am fod arnynt ofn y bydd galw mawr ar y banc neu'r gymdeithas adeiladu. Dyna pam yr aeth tri o'r pedwar banc clirio mawr ar y stryd fawr—pob un sydd â pherchenogion o Brydain; nid HSBC, nid perchennog o Brydain sydd ganddo—at Ganghellor y Trysorlys neithiwr i ofyn a allai roi cymorth iddynt i ailgyfalafu er mwyn iddynt allu dechrau rhoi benthyg arian i'w gilydd, i'r cyhoedd ac i fusnesau unwaith eto, drwy gymryd, dyweder, 10 y cant o gyfranddaliadau. Mae angen rhywbeth arnoch i ddatrys problem y diffyg symud yn y system fancio. Mae banciau'n poeni cymaint ynghylch cael digon o gyfalaf fel nad ydynt yn rhoi benthyg arian i neb. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r banciau fel gwerinwyr o Ffrainc yn cronni'r arian mewn hosan dan y fatres ac yn peidio â rhoi benthyg arian i fusnesau nac i berchenogion tai, a rhaid inni ddod o hyd i ffordd o ryddhau'r arian hwnnw.

### Cludiant i'r Ysgol

**C4 Chris Franks:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cael ynghylch cludiant i'r ysgol yng Nghanol De Cymru? OAQ(3)1322(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn ne Cymru, yn y canol neu yn unrhyw ran arall, fel yng ngweddill Cymru, mae Mesur Arfaethedig y Cynulliad ynghylch Teithio gan Ddysgwyr (Cymru), a basiwyd mewn Cyfarfod Llawn yr wythnos diwethaf, fel ein hail brif ddarn o ddeddfwriaeth, gerbron y Cyfrin Gyngor i gael ei gymeradwyo ar hyn o bryd. Caiff rheoliadau eu cyhoeddi ar gyfer ymgynghori, a'r nod yw eu rhoi ar waith yn y gwanwyn y flwyddyn nesaf. Bydd disgyblion sy'n defnyddio cludiant i'r ysgol ledled de Cymru ac mewn ardaloedd eraill yn elwa o'r set

ehangach o hawliau o fis Medi nesaf ymlaen.

**Chris Franks:** You will be aware of the debacle that occurred in the school transport system at the beginning of term in Rhondda Cynon Taf and the disclosure of children's personal details on the council's website. Hirwaun councillor, Karen Morgan, is still receiving complaints about the lack of consultation with parents. What pressure will you exert on Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council cabinet to ensure that any investigations into the fiasco are truly independent? What further discussions have you had regarding the overcrowding on school buses?

**Chris Franks:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r chwalfa a ddigwyddodd yn y system cludiant i'r ysgol ddechrau'r tymor yn Rhondda Cynon Taf a datgelu manylion personol plant ar wefan y cyngor. Mae Karen Morgan, un o gynghorwyr Hirwaun, yn dal i gael cwynion ynglŷn â'r diffyg ymgynghori â rhieni. Pa bwysau a rowch ar gabinet Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf i sicrhau bod unrhyw ymchwiliadau i'r llastr yn gwbl annibynnol? Pa drafodaethau pellach yr ydych wedi'u cynnal ynghylch gorlenwi bysiau ysgol?

**The First Minister:** Until you mentioned the councillor by name, I was going to say that you should get in touch with councillors in Rhondda Cynon Taf. Clearly, you have already done so, or they have been in touch with you. I do not think that I have a function when councillors are taking up this issue internally. We understand that the council has ordered an investigation into the privacy issue, as well as the other issue, and will publish details of the outcome of the investigation in due course. If you want to raise the issue again, if you are dissatisfied with the investigation, we will cross that bridge when we come to it.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nes ichi enwi'r cynghorydd, yr oeddwn yn mynd i ddweud y dylech gysylltu â chynghorwyr yn Rhondda Cynon Taf. Yn amlwg, yr ydych eisoes wedi gwneud hynny, neu maent hwy wedi cysylltu â chi. Ni chredaf fod gennyf swyddogaeth pan yw cynghorwyr yn ymgymryd â'r mater hwn yn fewnol. Yr ydym yn cael ar ddeall bod y cyngor wedi gorchymyn ymchwiliad i'r mater ynglŷn â phreifatrwydd, yn ogystal â'r mater arall, ac y byddant yn cyhoeddi manylion canlyniad yr ymchwiliad maes o law. Os ydych yn awyddus i godi'r mater eto, os ydych yn anfodlon ar yr ymchwiliad, deliwn â'r mater hwnnw pan fydd yn codi.

**Jonathan Morgan:** First Minister, many pupils walk to school and, for those who do, particularly in built-up areas, where the school is perhaps on a main road, it could be hazardous because of the speed of traffic. Does the Government plan to re-evaluate the success of the Safe Routes to School initiative, which has had some success in various parts of Wales, where routes to school have been improved, particularly for very young children? Does the Government plan to re-evaluate the scheme to see where it could be improved, and where additional resources may be allocated?

**Jonathan Morgan:** Brif Weinidog, mae llawer o ddisgyblion yn cerdded i'r ysgol ac, i'r rhai sy'n gwneud, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd adeiledig, lle y mae'r ysgol ar briffordd, o bosibl, gallai fod yn beryglus oherwydd cyflymder y traffig. A yw'r Llywodraeth yn bwriadu ailwerthuso llwyddiant y fenter Llwybrau Diogel i'r Ysgol, sydd wedi cael rhywfaint o lwyddiant mewn amryw rannau o Gymru, lle y mae llwybrau i'r ysgol wedi'u gwella, yn enwedig i blant ifanc iawn? A yw'r Llywodraeth yn bwriadu ailwerthuso'r cynllun i weld ym mhle y gellid ei wella, ac ym mhle y gellir dyrannu adnoddau ychwanegol?

**The First Minister:** I entirely agree with you, and I am grateful for your favourable references to the Safe Routes to School initiative. There is a health, as well as a safety, benefit to this. It is important for people who live in inner-city areas, where

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cytunaf yn llwyr â chi, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich cyfeiriadau ffafriol at y fenter Llwybrau Diogel i'r Ysgol. Ceir mantais o ran iechyd, yn ogystal â diogelwch, yn sgîl hyn. Mae'n bwysig i bobl sy'n byw mewn ardaloedd yng nghanol



there is traffic, or in rural areas where there can be dangerous levels of traffic, and who do not want their children to be driven to school because it is not good for the development of their heart and lung functions, as we all know. On the other hand, it is not good if they are unsafe either. Safe Routes to School has been a very valuable initiative. It is not just about walking, but cycling, and some children even go to school on scooters. It is very important that children are protected and safe when travelling to school, and this is a great initiative.

dinasoedd lle y ceir traffig, neu mewn ardaloedd gwledig lle y gellir cael lefelau peryglus o draffig, a phobl nad ydynt yn awyddus i'w plant gael eu gyrru i'r ysgol oherwydd nad yw'n beth da iawn ar gyfer datblygiad eu calon a'u hysgyfaint, fel y gwyddom. Ar y llaw arall, nid yw'n beth da iawn os nad ydynt yn ddiogel chwaith. Mae Llwybrau Diogel i'r Ysgol wedi bod yn fenter werthfawr iawn. Nid yw'n canolbwyntio ar gerdded yn unig, ond hefyd ar seiclo ac mae rhai plant hyd yn oed yn mynd i'r ysgol ar sgwteri. Mae'n bwysig i blant gael eu gwarchod ac iddynt fod yn ddiogel wrth deithio i'r ysgol, ac mae hon yn fenter ardderchog.

2.00 p.m.

### Empty Properties

**Q5 Peter Black:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the number of empty properties in Wales? OAQ(3)1310(FM)

**The First Minister:** The Essex review set out ways in which local authorities could do more than they do at present to bring empty properties in public and private ownership back into beneficial use. The scope for further action is illustrated by the latest figures for 2006-07, which show that 17,634 private sector properties in Wales had been vacant for more than six months.

**Peter Black:** Thank you for that answer. I am pleased that your Government recognises that there is scope for more action and that the number of empty properties in Wales is, quite frankly, a scandal that must be dealt with. Do you not accept that local authorities would benefit from having additional powers with regard to empty properties, and particularly the power to vary council tax in a more flexible way so as to penalise those who leave properties empty for several years? Would you consider drawing up an empty properties strategy for your Government to help to deal with the issue and giving those additional powers to local councils?

### Eiddo Gwag

**C5 Peter Black:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am nifer yr eiddo gwag yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)1310(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Amlinellodd adolygiad Essex sut y gallai awdurdodau lleol wneud mwy nag y maent yn ei wneud ar hyn o bryd i wneud defnydd buddiol o eiddo gwag sydd mewn perchenogaeth gyhoeddus a phreifat. Dangosir y posibilïadau ar gyfer camau pellach gan y ffigurau diweddaraf ar gyfer 2006-07, sy'n dangos bod 17,634 eiddo yn y sector preifat wedi bod yn wag ers dros chwe mis.

**Peter Black:** Diolch yn fawr am yr ateb hwnnw. Yr wyf yn falch bod eich Llywodraeth yn cydnabod bod lle i gymryd mwy o gamau a bod nifer yr eiddo gwag yng Nghymru, a siarad yn ddiflwyn ar dafod, yn sefyllfa warthus y mae'n rhaid mynd i'r afael â hi. Onid ydych yn derbyn y byddai'n fanteisiol i awdurdodau lleol gael pwerau ychwanegol i ddelio ag eiddo gwag, ac un pŵer penodol fyddai rhoi pŵer iddynt amrywio'r dreth gyngor mewn modd mwy hyblyg er mwyn cosbi'r rhai sy'n gadael eiddo'n wag am flynyddoedd? A fydddech yn ystyried llunio strategaeth ar eiddo gwag er mwyn i'ch Llywodraeth helpu i ddelio â'r mater a rhoi'r pwerau ychwanegol hynny i gynghorau lleol?

**The First Minister:** We are gathering information at the moment on the empty homes strategies of Welsh local authorities in order to establish what constitutes best practice in this regard and whether we can get local authorities to spread best practice among each other. That is running hand in hand with a Shelter Cymru project that we are funding, with the overall purpose of supporting local authorities in their efforts to make more effective use of the existing housing stock. That goes beyond any initiatives that may exist through which private sector projects that have been built and cannot now be sold can be considered for other uses, including use in the semi-public sector or registered landlord sector.

**Janice Gregory:** I welcome your replies today. However, given the developing international economic crisis, there is a real danger that more families will be at risk of becoming homeless or finding difficulty in paying their mortgages. What steps is the Welsh Assembly Government taking to support these families?

**The First Minister:** A range of measures has been announced by the Government, by Jocelyn Davies, the Deputy Minister for Housing, and Jane Davidson, the Minister with overall responsibility for the environment. It is a comprehensive, but perhaps not yet complete, set of measures to deal with the problem of the risk of people falling into homelessness on account of being overdue with their mortgage payments as a result of job losses or other financial problems. We are anxious to get in early and protect those people before they fall out of the safety net that is provided by some of the building societies and banks. Some finance companies are harder than others; some are really quite tough on this issue and will take people to court immediately with a view to eviction. That is not a sensible way of going about this, and we are trying to ensure that they do not follow such hardline policies, because they are pretty self-defeating even for the finance companies in the end.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym yn casglu gwybodaeth ar hyn o bryd am strategaethau awdurdodau lleol Cymru ar gyfer cartrefi gwag er mwyn sefydlu beth yw'r arferion gorau yn y maes hwn ac i weld a allwn gael gan awdurdodau lleol rannu arferion gorau ymysg ei gilydd. Mae hynny'n cyd-fynd â phrosiect gan Shelter Cymru yr ydym yn ei gyllido, gyda'r bwriad cyffredinol o gefnogi awdurdodau lleol yn eu hymdrechion i wneud defnydd mwy effeithiol o'r stoc dai bresennol. Mae hynny'n mynd y tu hwnt i unrhyw gynlluniau a all fodoli lle y mae prosiectau'r sector preifat sydd wedi cael eu hadeiladu ond na ellir eu gwerthu mwyach yn gallu cael eu hystyried ar gyfer defnydd arall, gan gynnwys eu defnyddio yn y sector lledgyhoeddus neu yn y sector landlordiaid cofrestredig.

**Janice Gregory:** Yr wyf yn croesawu eich atebion heddiw. Fodd bynnag, o gofio'r argyfwng economaidd rhyngwladol sy'n datblygu, ceir perygl gwirioneddol y bydd mwy o deuluoedd yn mynd yn ddigartref neu'n ei chael yn anodd talu eu morgais. Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn eu cymryd i gefnogi'r teuluoedd hyn?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae amrywiol fesurau wedi cael eu cyhoeddi gan y Llywodraeth, gan Jocelyn Davies, y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Dai, a chan Jane Davidson, y Gweinidog sy'n ysgwyddo cyfrifoldeb cyffredinol dros yr amgylchedd. Mae'n gyfres o fesurau sy'n gynhwysfawr, er nad ydynt yn gyflawn eto, sy'n mynd i'r afael â'r broblem lle y ceir perygl y bydd pobl yn cael eu hunain yn ddigartref oherwydd eu bod ar ei hôl hi gyda'u taliadau morgais am eu bod wedi colli swydd neu oherwydd problemau ariannol eraill. Yr ydym yn awyddus i gamu i mewn yn gynnar ac amddiffyn y bobl hynny cyn eu bod yn disgyn drwy'r rhwyd ddiogelwch a ddarperir gan rai cymdeithasau adeiladu a banciau. Mae rhai cwmnïau cyllid yn fwy llym nag eraill; mae rhai'n galed iawn ar y mater hwn ac yn mynd â phobl i'r llys yn syth gyda'r bwriad o'u troi allan o'u cartrefi. Nid yw hynny'n ddull synhwyrol o ymdrin â hyn, ac yr ydym yn ceisio sicrhau nad ydynt yn dilyn polisiâu digyfaddawd o'r fath, oherwydd nad oes neb yn ennill yn y diwedd, hyd yn oed y cwmnïau cyllid.

**William Graham:** You may know that there are about 750 people in the city of Newport who are unintentionally homeless and deemed to be in priority need of housing. I ask you to revitalise your scheme and to look in particular at those migrant families who are often denied benefits, which makes finding housing even more difficult.

**The First Minister:** We have become somewhat reliant on churches and charities to assist migrant families, asylum-seeker families and so on, who are denied access to the range of benefits that may be available to non-migrant families in the same situation. In the case of asylum seekers, as they are not allowed to work, they have no other means of support, and they therefore become reliant on charities and churches. In the case of asylum seekers, certain houses are taken over by the agency on behalf of the Home Office and managed by the local authority; the properties are from local authority stock but reserved for use by asylum seekers. There are probably half a dozen or more such properties in Cardiff, and smaller numbers elsewhere in Wales. Aside from that, there is the wider issue of migrants who are not asylum seekers but whose status is not clear. What is important to note is that, by and large, migrants often get into overcrowded housing but are not homeless.

You will hear stories of overcrowded conditions in houses in multiple occupation or former council houses that have been resold four or five times and may be providing accommodation for 15 or 20 people who arrive as single units and are being bussed every day to work at a slaughter house or wherever. That is not a particularly good way of mopping up the housing stock. We would deprecate that practice of overcrowding.

**Nerys Evans:** Yn ôl adroddiad gan Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree, mae 18,000 o dai gwag yng Nghymru wledig yn unig ac mae digartrefedd yng Nghymru wledig wedi cynyddu o 309 y cant rhwng 1978 a 2005 o gymharu â 129 y cant yn yr ardaloedd trefol. A oes gennyhch unrhyw gynlluniau fel

**William Graham:** Efallai eich bod yn gwybod bod tua 750 o bobl yn ninas Casnewydd sy'n ddigartref yn anfwriadol y bernir bod arnynt angen tai, a bod blaenoriaeth yn cael ei rhoi i'r angen hwnnw. Gofynnaf i chi adfywio eich cynllun ac edrych yn benodol ar y teuluoedd mudol hynny y gwrthodir rhoi budd-daliadau iddynt yn aml, sy'n gwneud dod o hyd i dŷ yn anos byth.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym wedi mynd braidd yn ddibynnol ar eglwysi ac elusennau i roi cymorth i deuluoedd mudol ac yn y blaen, nad ydynt yn cael yr amrywiol fudd-daliadau sydd ar gael efallai i deuluoedd yn yr un sefyllfa ond nad ydynt yn fudol. Yn achos ceiswyr lloches, gan nad ydynt yn cael gweithio, nid oes ganddynt ddim arall i'w cynnal, felly maent yn mynd yn ddibynnol ar elusennau ac eglwysi. Yn achos ceiswyr lloches, caiff rhai tai eu trosglwyddo i'r asiantaeth ar ran y Swyddfa Gartref a chânt eu rheoli gan yr awdurdod lleol; mae'r eiddo yn rhan o stoc yr awdurdod lleol ond cânt eu cadw i'w defnyddio gan geiswyr lloches. Mae'n debyg bod tua hanner dwsin neu fwy o dai o'r fath yng Nghaerdydd, a niferoedd llai mewn lleoedd eraill yng Nghymru. Yn ogystal â hynny, mater ehangach yw mudwyr nad ydynt yn geiswyr lloches ac nad yw'n glir beth yw eu statws. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig ei nodi yw bod mudwyr, at ei gilydd, yn aml yn byw mewn tai gorlawn ond nad ydynt yn ddigartref.

Byddwch yn clywed straeon am amodau gorlawn mewn tai amlfeddiannaeth neu hen dai cyngor sydd wedi'u hailwerthu bedair neu bum gwaith sydd efallai'n darparu llety i 15 neu 20 o bobl sy'n cyrraedd fel unedau sengl ac sy'n cael eu cludo mewn bws bob dydd i weithio mewn lladd-dy neu beth bynnag y bo. Nid yw hynny'n ffordd dda iawn o ddefnyddio'r hyn sydd ar ôl o'r stoc dai. Ni fyddem yn cymeradwyo'r arfer hwnnw o orlenwi tai.

**Nerys Evans:** According to a Joseph Rowntree Foundation report, there are 18,000 empty homes in rural Wales alone and homelessness in rural Wales increased by 309 per cent between 1978 and 2005 compared with 129 per cent in urban areas. Do you have any plans as a Government to monitor

Llywodraeth i fonitro'r broblem yng Nghymru wledig yn benodol wrth edrych ar bwerau gorfodaeth sydd gan awdurdodau lleol nad ydynt yn eu defnyddio, a hefyd drwy edrych ar reoliadau cynllunio ar gyfer ail dai?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n bwysig bod pob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru yn gorfod gosod ei flaenoriaethau ynglŷn â sut y bydd yn ateb ei broblemau o ran digartrefedd neu dai gwag ac ati. Drwy'r Gorchymyn Tai (Gorchmynion Rheoli Anheddau Gwag) (Eithriadau a Gofynion Rhagnodedig) (Cymru) 2006, yr ydym wedi sefydlu system o orchmynion ynglŷn â sut mae gofalu am dai gwag, ac mae hynny'n galluogi awdurdod lleol i osod ei flaenoriaethau. Felly os oes gwahaniaeth rhwng y galw yng Nghymru wledig a'r galw yng Nghymru drefol, mater i'r awdurdod lleol yw hynny.

Caf ar ddeall bod Sir Gâr, er enghraifft, wedi bod yn arloesol wrth gyfrif pob tŷ a fflat gwag yn y sir. Mae wedi eu rhoi ar restr gan ddatgan yr hyn y mae'n bwriadu ei wneud yn eu cylch. Dylai pob awdurdod lleol arall ddarllen am yr hyn a wnaed yn Sir Gâr i weld a fyddai'n bosibl ei efelychu yn eu hardaloedd hwy.

### Cwpan Ryder 2010

**C6 Gareth Jones:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am Gwpan Ryder 2010? OAQ(3)1317(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Bydd sylw'r byd ar Gymru ymhen dwy flynedd pan fyddwn ni, Casnewydd a'r Celtic Manor Resort yng Nghasnewydd yn cynnal Cwpan Ryder 2010. Mae ein buddsoddiadau ni fel Llywodraeth ar gyrion y cwrs ei hun, a'n cynlluniau ar gyfer y digwyddiad yn mynd rhagddynt yn dda. Byddwn yn defnyddio'r gwersi a ddysgwyd yn Kentucky i fireinio ein cynlluniau.

**Gareth Jones:** Dywedasoeh mewn datganiad yn ddiweddar, cyn i chi ymweld â Kentucky, y byddai cyrsiau golff y gogledd yn elwa o gystadleuaeth Cwpan Ryder 2010. Cyfeiriasoch at becynnau arbennig a fydd ar gael i ymwelwyr â chyrsiau golff Conwy, Maesdu, Caernarfon, Bull Bay, Nefyn,

the problem in rural Wales specifically by looking at the mandatory powers that local authorities have but do not use, and also by looking at the planning regulations for second homes?

**The First Minister:** It is important that every local authority in Wales has to set its own priorities regarding how it addresses its problems with regard to homelessness or empty houses and so on. Through the Housing (Empty Dwelling Management Orders) (Prescribed Exceptions and Requirements) (Wales) Order, we have established a system of orders around how to look after empty dwellings, and that enables a local authority to set its own priorities. Therefore, if there is a difference between the demand in rural Wales and that in urban Wales, it is a matter for the local authority.

I understand that Carmarthenshire, for example, has been innovative in counting every empty house and flat in the county. It has put them on a list and has stated what it intends to do about them. Every other local authority should read about what has been done in Carmarthenshire to see whether it can be replicated in their areas.

### Ryder Cup 2010

**Q6 Gareth Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on the Ryder Cup 2010? OAQ(3)1317(FM)

**The First Minister:** The eyes of the world will be on Wales in just two years' time when we, Newport and the Celtic Manor Resort in Newport will host the 2010 Ryder Cup. Our investment as a Government on the outskirts of the course and our planning for the event are making good progress. We will be taking on board the lessons that we have learned from Kentucky to fine-tune our plans.

**Gareth Jones:** You said in a recent statement, before your visit to Kentucky, that north Wales golf courses would benefit from the 2010 Ryder Cup. You mentioned specific packages that will be available for visitors to the courses at Conwy, Maesdu, Caernarfon, Bull Bay, Nefyn and Harlech and so on. I am

Harlech ac ati. Yr wyf yn aelod o Glwb Golff Conwy ac yn awyddus i weld y manteision hyn yn dod i'r Gogledd—peidiwch â gofyn beth yw fy *handicap*. A allwch gadarnhau bod Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un yn gwneud popeth sydd yn bosibl i sicrhau y bydd cyrsiau golff y gogledd yn elwa i'r eithaf o'r fenter hon?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dywedodd y cwmnïau yn America wrthym pan oeddem yn Kentucky ynglŷn â'r trefniadau y maent wedi'u gwneud eisoes i werthu mwy o becynnau gwyliau golff yng Nghymru, ac mai pecyn y gogledd a oedd wedi gwerthu fwyaf, gan fod y profiad yn fwy gwahanol. Hyd yn oed ar ôl 40 mlynedd o chwarae golff yn America, ni chaech y math o brofiadau y gallech eu cael yn Nefyn, er enghraifft. Dangosir llun o Nefyn a'r twll enwog, a'r dafarn islaw'r twll, fel bod chwaraewyr yn dweud, 'Dyna lle'r wyf am fynd'. Mae hynny'n helpu'r gwerthiant ar y pecynnau hyn.

Felly, y gogledd sydd wedi elwa fwyaf hyd yn hyn oherwydd y gwahaniaeth rhwng y math o brofiad a geir wrth chwarae golff yng Nghymru a chwarae golff yn America. Mae'n eironi mewn un ffordd gan fod y cyrsiau yn eithaf pell o Gasnewydd, ond mae golffwyr America yn disgwyl profiad cwbl wahanol wrth ddod i'r ochr hon i fôr Iwerydd.

2.10 p.m.

**Alun Cairns:** If the whole of Wales is to share in the benefits from the Ryder Cup, particularly west Wales, good access to Newport, and, probably more importantly, good access from Newport, is important. William Hague made a commitment in 1996 to an M4 relief road south of Newport. Do you regret that Peter Hain cancelled that in 1997-98, which means that that vital access road to western parts of Wales will not be ready in time? As a result, do you not accept that there is a fear that much of the business that it was intended should come to this part of the United Kingdom will end up on the eastern side of Newport and that, sadly, much of it will be in England?

**The First Minister:** You could say that there has been a delay, but we do not have any idea

a member of the Conwy Golf Club and am keen to see these benefits coming to north Wales—do not ask me what my handicap is. Can you confirm that the One Wales Government is doing everything possible to ensure that north Wales golf clubs maximise the benefits of this venture?

**The First Minister:** When we were in Kentucky American companies told us about the arrangements that they have already made to sell more golfing package holidays to Wales, and said that it was those to north Wales that had sold the most, given that it is those that offer the most different experience. Even after 40 years of playing golf in America, you would not get the kind of experience that you would get in Nefyn, for example. Pictures are shown of Nefyn with its famous hole, with the pub below, so that players say, 'That is where I want to go'. That helps when selling these packages.

Therefore, it is north Wales that has benefited the most to date, because of the different experience of playing golf in Wales as compared with playing golf in America. It is ironic, in a way, given that the courses are quite far from Newport, but American golfers expect a completely different experience on this side of the Atlantic.

**Alun Cairns:** Os yw Cymru gyfan, yn enwedig y gorllewin, yn mynd i fanteisio ar Gwpan Ryder, mae'n bwysig cael mynediad da i Gasnewydd, ac yn bwysicach mae'n debyg, mynediad da o Gasnewydd. Gwnaeth William Hague ymrwymiad yn 1996 i greu ffordd liniaru'r M4 i'r de o Gasnewydd. A ydych yn gresynu bod Peter Hain wedi diddymu'r ymrwymiad hwnnw yn 1997-98, sy'n golygu na fydd ffyrdd mynediad hanfodol i ardaloedd gorllewinol Cymru yn barod mewn pryd? O ganlyniad, onid ydych yn derbyn bod pryder y bydd llawer o'r busnes a fwriadwyd ar gyfer y rhan hon o'r Deyrnas Unedig yn mynd i'r dwyrain o Gasnewydd, ac y bydd llawer ohono'n mynd i Loegr, yn anffodus?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gallech ddweud bod oedi wedi digwydd, ond nid oes gennym syniad pa

as to how quickly the proposal to proceed with the M4 relief road would have progressed had, by some miracle, the Conservatives held on to power in 1997 and William Hague remained as Secretary of State for Wales for the following five years. Who knows what would have happened? What is clear is that the M4 relief road is in the Government's programme. We know that there are enormous financing and environmental problems to be surmounted. The preparatory work continues and attempts to find a method of achieving it at, as I think that Andrew Davies said, no cost to the taxpayer are also continuing against the difficult background that all public finance initiative schemes are inevitably facing at the present moment.

**Rosemary Butler:** The prospect of holding the Ryder Cup in Wales is very exciting, and it should deliver great benefits across the whole of the country. You have just said that, so far, north Wales has benefited more than anywhere else. I am particularly concerned that the people of Newport should reap the benefits of being the host city for this world-class sporting event. Can you assure us that, through your officials, you will ensure that Newport City Council develops a specific and, importantly, viable tourism strategy that will be in place in time for the Ryder Cup and will provide spin-off business beyond 2010?

**The First Minister:** What I was referring to in response to Gareth Jones was the amount of golf packages sold rather than the wider economic benefits, such as from inward investment or wider tourism. It certainly provides an enormous opportunity for Newport, as our third city, to capitalise upon, not just at the time of the Ryder Cup but for years afterwards, as one of the Ryder Cup cities. On the question of infrastructure provision, we have mentioned the differences between Louisville and Newport. Louisville has its own airport but does not have a railway station, which Newport does, and I hope that it will soon have the first brand new, space-age railway station to be constructed in the United Kingdom, even though it does not have an airport. Taking full advantage of the opportunity by showing

mor gyflym y byddai'r cynnig i fwrw ymlaen â ffordd liniaru'r M4 wedi datblygu, petai'r Ceidwadwyr, drwy ryw ryfedd wyrth, wedi dal gafael ar eu grym yn 1997 a William Hague wedi parhau'n Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Gymru am y pum mlynedd wedi hynny. Pwy a wŷr beth fyddai wedi digwydd? Yr hyn sy'n amlwg yw bod ffordd liniaru'r M4 yn rhaglen y Llywodraeth. Gwyddom fod problemau ariannol ac amgylcheddol anferth i'w goresgyn. Mae'r gwaith paratoi'n parhau yn ogystal ag ymdrechion i ddod o hyd i ddull o gyflawni'r gwaith heb gost i'r trethdalwyr, fel y dywedodd Andrew Davies, fe gredaf, gan gofio'r cefndir anodd y mae'n anochel bod pob cynllun menter cyllid cyhoeddus yn ei wynebu ar hyn o bryd.

**Rosemary Butler:** Mae'n gyffrous iawn bod y Cwpan Ryder am gael ei gynnal yng Nghymru, a dylai esgor ar fanteision sylweddol yn ei sgîl ledled y wlad. Yr ydych newydd ddweud bod y gogledd, hyd yn hyn, wedi elwa mwy nag unrhyw le arall. Yr hyn sy'n fy mhoeni'n benodol yw y dylai pobl Casnewydd elwa o gynnal y digwyddiad chwaraeon hwn sydd o safon fyd-eang yn y ddinas. A allwch ein sicrhau, drwy eich swyddogion, y bydd Cyngor Dinas Casnewydd yn llunio strategaeth dwristiaeth benodol, ac yn bwysicach, strategaeth hyfyw a fydd mewn grym erbyn Cwpan Ryder ac a fydd yn esgor ar fusnes sy'n deillio o hynny ar ôl 2010?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr hyn yr oeddwn yn cyfeirio ato yn fy ateb i Gareth Jones oedd faint o becynnau golff a werthwyd yn hytrach na'r manteision economaidd ehangach, megis yn sgîl mewnfuddsoddi neu fwy o dwristiaeth. Yn sicr, mae'n cynnig cyfle anferth i Gasnewydd, fel ein trydedd ddinas, i fanteisio arno, nid yn ystod Cwpan Ryder yn unig, ond am flynyddoedd wedyn, fel un o ddinasoedd Cwpan Ryder. O ran y cwestiwn ynghylch darparu seilwaith, yr ydym wedi sôn am y gwahaniaethau rhwng Louisville a Chasnewydd. Mae gan Louisville ei maes awyr ei hun ond nid oes ganddi orsaf drenau, ac er nad oes gan Gasnewydd faes awyr mae ganddi orsaf drenau, a gobeithiaf y bydd ganddi orsaf drenau newydd sbon cyn bo hir, yr un gyntaf o'i bath i gael ei hadeiladu yn y DU sy'n defnyddio technoleg arloesol. Bydd

our best face to the world will rebound for the benefit of Newport for decades after the Ryder Cup has come and gone.

manteisio i'r eithaf ar y cyfle drwy arddangos ein gwedd orau i'r byd yn esgor ar fanteision i Gasnewydd am ddegawdau ar ôl i Gwpan Ryder ddod i ben.

### **The Current Economic Crisis**

**Q7 Angela Burns:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the effects of the current economic crisis on Wales? OAQ(3)1311(FM)

**The First Minister:** The position that we face in Wales, and more widely, is that a banking crisis could turn into a crisis for the wider economy. As banks are now in lockdown mode, concentrating on rebuilding their own capital adequacy rather than lending to others, the danger of a freeze in the activity in the real economy is becoming ever more apparent.

**Angela Burns:** We are all aware that the budget will be laid today, and in last year's budget the Labour-Plaid coalition forecast inflation as running at 2.7 per cent. As you know, today it is coming up to 5 per cent and it is forecast to worsen. In real terms, based on last year's budget, that means that areas such as health and social services will face a real-terms cut in funding of almost 2 per cent. Do you agree that it is now time to focus on key areas such as funding the care of older people rather than frittering money away on projects such as free laptops or free prescriptions for all, even those who can afford it? Surely we need to stabilise the basics before we start venturing on costly blue-sky projects.

**The First Minister:** I do not recognise that description at all. Once you start using words such as 'frittering', you are accepting that you do not have a strong argument; you are hoping that using pejorative words such as 'frittering' might make people accept that you do not have to argue the case. However, you have to do so, Angela, and you need a much better argument than that. The choice

### **Yr Argyfwng Economaidd Presennol**

**C7 Angela Burns:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am effeithiau'r argyfwng economaidd presennol ar Gymru? OAQ(3)1311(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Y sefyllfa a wynebwn yng Nghymru, ac yn ehangach, yw y gallai'r argyfwng yn y diwydiant bancio droi'n argyfwng i'r economi yn ehangach. Gan fod banciau bellach wedi cloi eu drysau ac yn canolbwyntio ar ailadeiladu cyfalaf digonol iddynt eu hunain yn hytrach na rhoi benthyg i eraill, mae'r perygl y bydd gweithgarwch yn dod i ben yn yr economi go iawn yn dod yn fwyfwy amlwg.

**Angela Burns:** Yr ydym i gyd yn ymwybodol y caiff y gyllideb ei chyflwyno heddiw, ac yn y gyllideb y llynedd, yr oedd y glymblaid rhwng Llafur a Phlaid Cymru yn rhagweld y byddai chwyddiant yn 2.7 y cant. Fel y gwyddoch, erbyn heddiw mae chwyddiant bron â chyrraedd 5 y cant a rhagwelir y bydd yn gwaethygu. O ran termau real, yn seiliedig ar gyllideb y llynedd, golyga hynny y bydd meysydd megis iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn wynebu toriad real o bron 2 y cant. A ydych yn cytuno mai yn awr yw'r amser i ganolbwyntio ar feysydd allweddol megis cyllido gofal i bobl hŷn yn hytrach na gwastraffu arian ar brosiectau megis gliniaduron am ddim neu bresgripsiynau am ddim i bawb, hyd yn oed i'r rhai sy'n gallu fforddio'u talu? Onid oes angen inni sefydlogi'r pethau sylfaenol cyn inni ddechrau ymhél â phrosiectau anymarferol costus?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn cydnabod y disgrifiad hwnnw o gwbl. Pan fyddwch yn dechrau defnyddio geiriau megis 'gwastraffu', yr ydych yn derbyn nad oes gennych ddadl gref; yr ydych yn gobeithio y gallai defnyddio geiriau difriol megis 'gwastraffu' beri i bobl dderbyn nad oes rhaid i chi ddadlau'r achos. Fodd bynnag, rhaid ichi wneud hynny, Angela, ac mae

of its priorities is the most important act of any Government, and the choice of how they scrutinise is the most important act of opposition parties. We welcome the scrutiny that will occur in the budget process in the usual way.

The rate of inflation is expected to increase to maybe just over 5 per cent before coming back down with a pretty thumping crash, we understand. As we have seen from the passing out of the system of the big increases in food and fuel, once those 12 months are over, the consequences on the inflation rate are quite sharp. This is leaving aside the effect on the economy of a drop in the price of oil linked with the international expectation of a downturn in economic activity, which would have a further effect on reducing inflation during the next 12 months at a certain point, but do not ask me exactly when. Guessing the inflation rate was done in good faith at the time. Obviously, I will ask for my economists' advice on the relevance of the inflation prediction and will write to you on that matter.

**Alun Davies:** First Minister, the economic difficulties will clearly have an impact on the whole of Wales. Can you tell me what steps the Government is taking to ensure that economic development continues through these difficult times, particularly in some of the western Valleys areas that I represent in Carmarthenshire and south Powys?

**The First Minister:** I mentioned earlier that there is a general system of business support in place—with a preference towards mid and west Wales, which is about half or maybe more of your region, Alun—and it is much improved. We believe that it is flexible and is much clearer for businesses to use, especially for small and medium-sized firms. In addition to this, we hope to make an announcement shortly about the availability of funding backed by the European Investment Bank, which is what everyone wants these days, because it is a state-guaranteed form of funding. This will be in conjunction with Finance Wales, our state-owned—in the sense that we own it—merchant bank, which gives us the leverage,

arnoch angen gwell dadl o lawer na hynny. Dewis blaenoriaethau yw gweithred bwysicaf unrhyw Lywodraeth, a dewis sut y maent yn craffu ar hynny yw gweithred bwysicaf y gwrthbleidiau. Yr ydym yn croesawu'r craffu a wneir ar broses y gyllideb yn y ffordd arferol.

Cawn ar ddeall y disgwylir y bydd cyfradd chwyddiant yn cynyddu i fymryn dros 5 y cant o bosibl, cyn dod yn ôl i lawr yn glewt. Fel y gwelsom wrth i'r codiadau mawr ym mhrisiau bwyd a thanwydd basio allan o'r system, wedi i'r 12 mis hynny ddod i ben, mae'r canlyniadau o ran graddfa chwyddiant yn eithaf llym. Mae hyn heb sôn am effaith cwmp ym mhris olew ar yr economi, yn gysylltiedig â'r disgwyl yn rhyngwladol y bydd gostyngiad mewn gweithgaredd economaidd, a gâi effaith bellach ar leihau chwyddiant yn ystod y 12 mis nesaf ar ryw adeg, ond peidiwch â gofyn i mi pryd yn union. Cafodd graddfa chwyddiant ei dyfalu'n ddidwyll ar y pryd. Yn amlwg, gofynnaf am gyngor fy economegwyr ynghylch perthnasedd y broffwydoliaeth ynghylch chwyddiant ac ysgrifennaf atoch ynglŷn â'r mater hwnnw.

**Alun Davies:** Brif Weinidog, bydd yr anawsterau economaidd yn amlwg yn taro Cymru gyfan. A allwch ddweud wrthyf pa gamau y mae'r Llywodraeth yn eu cymryd i sicrhau y bydd datblygu economaidd yn parhau drwy'r cyfnod anodd hwn, yn enwedig yn rhai o ardaloedd y Cymoedd gorllewinol yr wyf yn eu cynrychioli yn sir Gaerfyrddin a de Powys?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Soniais yn gynharach fod gennym system gyffredinol o gymorth i fusnes—gyda blaenoriaeth i'r canolbarth a'r gorllewin, sef tua hanner eich rhanbarth chi neu fwy efallai, Alun—ac mae wedi'i gwella'n fawr. Credwn ei bod yn hyblyg ac yn llawer cliriach i fusnesau ei defnyddio, yn enwedig i gwmnïau bach a chanolig. Ar ben hyn, gobeithiwn wneud cyhoeddiad yn fuan ynghylch cyllid a fydd ar gael gyda chefnogaeth Banc Buddsoddi Ewrop, sef yr hyn y mae ar bawb ei eisiau y dyddiau hyn, am ei fod yn gyllid a warentir gan y wladwriaeth. Bydd hyn ar y cyd â Cyllid Cymru, ein banc masnachol sydd ym meddiant y wladwriaeth—yn yr ystyr mai ni piau'r banc—sy'n rhoi'r grym, gyda chyllid



with EIB funding, of being able to provide substantial additional assistance, both for survival purposes and for investment purposes, to small and medium-sized firms. Particular preference will be given to convergence areas in Wales, which are those parts of Wales that do not lie alongside the English border.

**Helen Mary Jones:** First Minister, do you agree that some of the housing related problems that we are facing now as a result of the credit crunch have been partially brought about by the rush to demutualise building societies and turn them into speculative banks? Will you join me in congratulating the Principality building society in particular, which has resisted that trend and has remained mutual and Wales-based? It also has a history of responsible lending. Will you also join me in encouraging people who are exploring mortgage options during these very insecure times to consider choosing mutual building societies, where the terms of your loan may be more stringent, but where your loan and your savings may be safer?

**The First Minister:** If I have said it—privately and in public—once, I have said it a thousand times over the past few months: thank God the Principality building society did not demutualise. It is a sad fact that, following the recent events in the financial services industry, not one of the demutualised building societies continues in existence in an independent form. You cannot really believe that an institution of the size, rank and status of the Halifax no longer exists in independent form—or rather, it is about to cease to exist. If you look at them, Halifax, Bradford and Bingley, Bristol and West, Cheltenham and Gloucester and the Alliance and Leicester have all gone. Thank God the Principality did not go down that road. There are many virtues, which have come to the fore recently, of the building societies that decided not to demutualise. Of course, their directors and senior managers get far less pay than is the case in the Northern Rocks, the Bradford and Bingleys and so on, so they do not have the greed factor. It is a sad fact of life that not one of those demutualised building societies now exists in independent form.

Banc Buddsoddi Ewrop, inni allu darparu cymorth ariannol sylweddol, at ddibenion goroesi ac at ddibenion buddsoddi, i gwmnïau bach a chanolig. Rhoddir blaenoriaeth arbennig i ardaloedd cydgyfeirio yng Nghymru, sef y rhannau hynny o Gymru nad ydynt ar hyd y ffin â Lloegr.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Brif Weinidog, a ydych yn cytuno bod rhai o'r problemau tai yr ydym yn eu hwynebu'n awr yn sgîl y wasgfa gredyd wedi'u hachosi'n rhannol gan y rhuthr i ddadgydfuddiannu cymdeithasau adeiladu a'u troi'n fanciau hapfasnachol? A wnewch ymuno â mi i longyfarch cymdeithas adeiladu'r Principality yn arbennig, sydd wedi gwrthsefyll y duedd honno ac wedi parhau'n gydfuddiannol a'i chanolfan yng Nghymru? Mae ganddi hanes o fenthyca cyfrifol hefyd. A wnewch ymuno â mi hefyd i annog pobl sy'n ymchwilio i opsiynau o ran morgais yn ystod y cyfnod ansicr iawn hwn i ystyried dewis cymdeithasau adeiladu cydfuddiannol, lle y mae telerau eich benthyciad yn fwy caeth efallai, ond lle y gall eich benthyciad a'ch cynilion fod yn fwy diogel?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Os wyf wedi dweud hyn—yn breifat ac ar goedd—unwaith, yr wyf wedi ei ddweud filwaith dros y misoedd diwethaf: diolch i Dduw na ddadgydfuddiannwyd cymdeithas adeiladu'r Principality. Mae'n ffaith drist, yn dilyn y digwyddiadau'n ddiweddar yn y diwydiant gwasanaethau ariannol, nad oes yr un o'r cymdeithasau adeiladu a ddadgydfuddiannwyd yn parhau mewn bodolaeth yn annibynnol. Ni allwch gredu, mewn gwirionedd, nad yw sefydliad o faint, safle a statws yr Halifax yn bodoli mwyach ar ffurf annibynnol—neu'n hytrach, ei fod ar fin peidio â bodoli. Os edrychwch arnynt, mae Halifax, Bradford and Bingley, Bristol and West, Cheltenham and Gloucester a'r Alliance and Leicester i gyd wedi mynd. Diolch i Dduw nad aeth y Principality ar hyd y llwybr hwnnw. Mae llawer o rinweddau, sydd wedi dod i'r amlwg yn ddiweddar, i'r cymdeithasau adeiladu a benderfynodd beidio â dadgydfuddiannu. Wrth gwrs, caiff eu cyfarwyddwyr a'u huwch reolwyr dâl llawer llai nag a geir yn y Northern Rocks, y Bradford and Bingleys ac yn y blaen, felly nid yw ffactor trachwant ganddynt. Un o

ffeithiau trist bywyd yw nad oes dim un o'r cymdeithasau adeiladu dadgyfuddianedig hynny'n bodoli bellach ar ffurf annibynnol.

**William Graham:** I would like to bring to your attention the fact that the Derbyshire Building Society and the Cheshire Building Society, neither of which was demutualised, had to take the protection of the Nationwide. The truth of the matter is that, when your colleagues the Prime Minister and the Chancellor of the Exchequer said that Northern Rock was safe, the queues of people waiting to withdraw their money grew longer and longer. That is the reality of it. Is it not time to take a bold approach and to restore confidence for the everyday people in Wales who are concerned about their savings, their mortgages and their jobs in the future?

2.20 p.m.

**The First Minister:** It is all very well asking that question, and I can understand your sensitivity on the matter of the demutualisation of the building societies, which was a flagship policy of the Conservative Government, and none of them now exist. It is sad, in one way, but the seeds of the greed were sown in the legislation, which I tried to stop as a member of the committee. Building societies could demutualise before—indeed, Abbey National demutualised before the legislation—but the legislation legalised the payment of a bribe to the members of the building society. That is when greed got going among the members, who said, 'I want my £1,000; I would have been against demutualisation before, but now that I will get that, yes, I am going for it'. That sanctioned the greed of the directors.

What is evident from the pleas of the high-street banks that are British owned—HSBC is not British owned—is that they want the Government to stand behind them by participating as a direct shareholder. I do not know how Alistair Darling will respond to that, because it is a big ask, under current circumstances, for him to find £50 billion, or whatever they are asking for, to take 10 per cent of the share capital. They are asking, in a way, for a reversal of the demutualisation

**William Graham:** Hoffwn dynnu eich sylw at y ffaith bod Cymdeithas Adeiladu Swydd Derby a Chymdeithas Adeiladu Swydd Gaer, y naill na'r llall wedi'i dadgyfuddiannu, wedi gorfod cael eu diogelu gan Nationwide. Y gwir amdani yw, pan ddywedodd eich cyfeillion y Prif Weinidog a Changhellor y Trysorlys fod Northern Rock yn ddiogel, fod y rhesi o bobl a oedd yn aros i godi eu harian wedi tyfu'n hwy ac yn hwy. Dyna a ddigwyddodd. Onid yw'n bryd cymryd agwedd eofn ac adfer hyder i'r bobl gyffredin yng Nghymru sydd yn pryderu am eu cynilion, eu morgeisi a'u swyddi yn y dyfodol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Digon hawdd gofyn y cwestiwn hwnnw, a gallaf ddeall eich sensitifrwydd o ran dadgyfuddiannu'r cymdeithasau adeiladu, a oedd yn bolisi blaenllaw gan y Llywodraeth Geidwadol, a dim un ohonynt yn bodoli mwyach. Mae'n drist, ar ryw olwg, ond heuwyd hadau'r trachwant yn y ddeddfwriaeth, y ceisiais ei hatal fel aelod o'r pwyllgor. Gallai cymdeithasau adeiladu ddadgyfuddiannu o'r blaen—yn wir, dadgyfuddiannodd Abbey National cyn y ddeddfwriaeth—ond cyfreithlonodd y ddeddfwriaeth dalu llwgrwobrwy i aelodau'r gymdeithas adeiladu. Dyna pryd y tyfodd trachwant ymysg yr aelodau, a ddywedodd, 'Mae arnaf eisiau fy £1,000; byddwn wedi bod yn erbyn dadgyfuddiannu o'r blaen, ond a minnau'n awr yn mynd i gael hynny, ydwyf, yr wyf o'i blaid'. Rhoes hynny gymeradwyaeth i drachwant y cyfarwyddwyr.

Yr hyn sy'n amlwg yn sgîl pledion banciau'r stryd fawr sydd â pherchenogion o Brydain—nid perchennog o Brydain sydd gan HSBC—yw bod arnynt eisiau i'r Llywodraeth sefyll y tu cefn iddynt drwy gyfranogi fel cyfranddaliwr uniongyrchol. Ni wn sut y gwnaiff Alistair Darling ymateb i hynny, oherwydd y mae'n beth mawr i'w ofyn, dan yr amgylchiadau cyfredol, iddo ef ddod o hyd i £50 biliwn, neu beth bynnag y maent yn gofyn amdano, i gymryd 10 y cant o'r cyfalaf

policy, and for the Government to nationalise 10 per cent of the shares. However, the Government may find it necessary to do that, because you cannot go to the private sector to recapitalise the banks.

**Leanne Wood:** Are you prepared to carry out an assessment of how public finance initiatives, public-private partnerships and housing stock transfer projects will be affected by the increased cost of borrowing as a result of the credit crunch? Would you be prepared to make a statement on that?

**The First Minister:** The increased cost of borrowing is one thing, but it is the unavailability of borrowing that is the big problem. I have mentioned it before, but I will say it again, the banks—including the building societies—are in lock-down mode and they are not lending. They are worried, because every day they get a phone call from the regulator and are asked, ‘How much money do you have in the bank and are you meeting your capital adequacy ratio?’. They are so terrified of that phone call coming in at 5 p.m. every day that they will not lend to anyone. They are protecting their capital until they see a sign that liquidity is starting to move back into the system, or, in the case of banks, that someone will lend them more capital, so that they have a little comfort on the capital adequacy ratio. They have asked for that to be done by state funding, but that is for Alistair Darling to consider.

Kirsty asked earlier about a cut in interest rates; we all earnestly hope that there is a substantial cut in interest rates. However, if all that happens after a substantial cut in interest rates is that the banks use it to improve their profitability and still do not start lending, what use is that for business customers or for those wanting mortgages? First-time buyers are back in the estate agents’ premises, which is great, as they think that houses are now of a reasonable price, but they cannot get a mortgage until the books start opening up again, and that will not happen until banks and building societies feel able to start lending. For that to

cyfranddaliadau. Maent yn gofyn, mewn ffordd, am wrthdroi’r polisi dadgyfuddiannu, ac i’r Llywodraeth wladoli 10 y cant o’r cyfranddaliadau. Fodd bynnag, efallai y gwêl y Llywodraeth fod angen gwneud hynny, oherwydd ni ellir mynd at y sector preifat i ailgyfalafu’r banciau.

**Leanne Wood:** A ydych yn barod i gynnal asesiad o sut yr effeithir ar fentrau cyllid cyhoeddus, partneriaethau cyhoeddus-preifat a phrosiectau trosglwyddo stoc dai gan gost uwch benthycia yn sgîl y wasgfa gredyd? A fydddech yn barod i wneud datganiad ynglŷn â hynny?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae cost uwch benthycia’n un peth, ond yr anallu i gael benthycia yw’r broblem fawr. Yr wyf wedi ei grybwyll o’r blaen, ond fe’i dywedaf eto, mae’r banciau—gan gynnwys y cymdeithasau adeiladu—wedi cau eu drysau ac nid ydynt yn rhoi benthycia. Maent yn poeni, oherwydd bob dydd cânt alwad ffôn gan y rheoleiddiwr sy’n holi, ‘Faint o arian sydd gennych yn y banc ac a ydych yn cyflawni’ch cymhareb digonolrwydd cyfalaf?’. Maent yn arswydo cymaint rhag cael yr alwad ffôn honno am 5 o’r gloch bob prynhawn nes peri nad ydynt yn fodlon rhoi benthycia i neb. Maent yn gwarchod eu cyfalaf nes gwelant arwydd bod hylifedd yn dechrau dychwelyd i’r system, neu, yn achos banciau, fod rhywun am roi benthycia mwy o gyfalaf iddynt, fel bod ganddynt ychydig o gysur o ran y gymhareb digonolrwydd cyfalaf. Maent wedi gofyn am i hynny gael ei wneud drwy ariannu gan y wladwriaeth, ond mater i Alistair Darling ei ystyried yw hynny.

Holodd Kirsty’n gynharach ynglŷn â chwtogi cyfraddau llog; yr ydym i gyd yn gobeithio’n daer y ceir toriad sylweddol yng nghyfraddau llog. Fodd bynnag, os mai’r cyfan sy’n digwydd ar ôl toriad sylweddol yng nghyfraddau llog yw bod y banciau’n ei ddefnyddio i’w gwneud eu hunain yn fwy proffidiol ac yn dal i beidio â rhoi benthycia, pa les yw hynny i gwsmeriaid busnes neu i bobl y mae arnynt eisiau morgaeisi? Mae prynwyr am y tro cyntaf yn dychwelyd at y gwerthwyr tai, sydd yn wych, gan eu bod yn meddwl bod prisiau tai bellach yn rhesymol, ond nid ydynt yn gallu cael morgaeis nes i’r llyfrau ddechrau agor eto, ac ni wnaiff hynny

happen, their liquidity needs to be back to somewhere near normal.

**Mark Isherwood:** I must ask a question, given that I was an employee of one of the building societies mentioned this afternoon, which proudly remained mutual. One reason for remaining mutual was that we imposed restrictions on windfall payments for new members after a cut-off date. Do you share my concern that the credit rating of many of these mutual societies has been trashed? Their capital bases are weak, as a result of the credit crunch; you have mentioned the capital adequacy ratio—or insolvency ratio methodology; it is the same principle. There is also the concern that the regulatory environment, even in the mutual sector, has not kept a sufficiently close an eye on the commercial aspect of their lending, which even the mutual sector has been undertaking.

**The First Minister:** I will not try to compete with your inside knowledge of building societies, because you worked there, Mark. I agree with the broad thrust of what you are saying. As I mentioned in answer to Leanne, banks and building societies are currently terrified of that daily phone call. However, the reason for that daily phone call is simple, although there is always overcompensation in the system. The Financial Services Authority fell asleep on the job and did not do anything about Northern Rock's unsustainable business model—there should have been daily phone calls to Northern Rock, but there were not—so it is now making too many phone calls. It has sacked the people who fell asleep on the job, but it is overcompensating, probably, in terrifying the banks and building societies over the capital adequacy ratio. As a result, banks are now going to the Government and asking it to buy their shares so that they can rebuild their capital base. Even the big three high street banks are doing so, which no-one could have foreseen as recently as last July.

ddigwydd nes bydd banciau a chymdeithasau adeiladu'n teimlo y gallant ddechrau rhoi benthyg. Er mwyn i hynny ddigwydd, mae angen i'w hylifedd fod yn ôl yn agos at fod yn normal.

**Mark Isherwood:** Rhaid imi ofyn cwestiwn, a minnau'n gyn-weithiwr i un o'r cymdeithasau adeiladu a enwyd y prynhawn yma, a arhosodd yn gydfuddiannol gyda balchder. Un rheswm dros barhau'n gydfuddiannol oedd ein bod wedi gosod cyfyngiadau ar daliadau arian annisgwyl i aelodau newydd ar ôl dyddiad penodedig. A ydych chi'n pryderu fel yr wyf fi fod statws credyd llawer o'r cymdeithasau cydfuddiannol wedi'i chwalu? Mae eu sylfeini cyfalaf yn wan, o ganlyniad i'r wasgfa gredyd; yr ydych wedi sôn am y gymhareb digonolrwydd cyfalaf—neu fethodoleg cymhareb ansolfedd; yr un egwyddor ydyw. Mae pryder hefyd nad yw'r amgylchedd rheoleiddio, hyd yn oed yn y sector cydfuddiannol, wedi cadw golwg digon manwl ar yr agwedd fasnachol ar eu benthyca, rhywbeth y mae hyd yn oed y sector cydfuddiannol wedi bod yn ei wneud.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni cheisiaf gystadlu â'ch gwybodaeth fewnol am gymdeithasau adeiladu, oherwydd buoch yn gweithio yno, Mark. Cytunaf â'r hyn yr ydych yn ei ddweud at ei gilydd. Fel y soniais wrth ateb Leanne, mae banciau a chymdeithasau adeiladau'n arswydo rhag yr alwad ffôn ddyddiol honno ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, mae'r rheswm dros yr alwad ffôn ddyddiol honno'n syml, er bod tuedd bob amser yn y system i or-wneud. Aeth yr Awdurdod Gwasanaethau Ariannol i gysgu wrth ei waith ac ni wnaeth ddim oll ynghylch model busnes anghynaliadwy Northern Rock—dylai Northern Rock fod wedi cael galwadau ffôn yn ddyddiol, ond ni chafodd—felly erbyn hyn mae'n gwneud gormod o alwadau ffôn. Mae wedi diswyddo'r bobl a fu'n hepian wrth eu gwaith, ond mae'n gor-wneud, mae'n debyg, wrth godi arswyd ar y banciau a'r cymdeithasau adeiladu ynghylch y gymhareb digonolrwydd cyfalaf. O ganlyniad, mae banciau bellach yn mynd at y Llywodraeth ac yn gofyn iddi brynu eu cyfranddaliadau fel y gallant ailadeiladu eu sylfaen gyfalaf. Mae hyd yn oed tri banc mawr y stryd fawr yn gwneud hynny, rhywbeth na allai neb fod

wedi'i ragweld mor ddiweddar â mis Gorffennaf diwethaf.

### Dualling the A465

**Q8 Trish Law:** Will the First Minister provide an update on progress made in dualling the A465 Heads of the Valleys trunk road? OAQ(3)1314(FM)

**The First Minister:** You know the drill. The draft budget is due to be laid this afternoon, as soon as these questions are over, and I know that you will want to carefully study what it has to say in relation to provision for making progress on the next stages of the Heads of the Valleys trunk road.

**Trish Law:** I sometimes question your Government's commitment to the regeneration of the Heads of the Valleys. In a letter dated 25 November 2003, the then-Minister for the Economy, Innovation and Networks referred to the Gilwern to Brynmawr and Brynmawr to Tredegar sections as possibly being ready for work to begin in March 2008. Seven months on, we still have not had a date for the start of work on these two sections. When will you be in a position to announce a start date?

**The First Minister:** I will not anticipate the draft budget. You will have to wait to look at that in a few minutes' time. What is important is that we realise that there is a long-standing commitment to the dualling of the Heads of the Valleys road, and that parts of the road have been dualled already. Other parts are just about to be completed, and will open shortly, I understand—although there has been some cost and time overrun. Beyond that, you will have to read the draft budget in a few minutes' time.

**Huw Lewis:** The Welsh Assembly Government's pledge on the dualling of the Heads of the Valleys road, taken together with the Heads of the Valleys strategy, probably constitute the biggest regenerative commitment that the public sector has ever

### Deuoli'r A465

**C8 Trish Law:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddarparu'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y cynnydd a wnaethpwyd o ran deuoli cefnffordd A465 Blaenau'r Cymoedd? OAQ(3)1314(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gwyddoch beth yw'r drefn. Mae'r gyllideb ddrafft i fod i gael ei chyflwyno y prynhawn yma, yn syth wedi'r cwestiynau hyn, a gwn y bydd arnoch eisiau edrych yn ofalus ar yr hyn sydd ganddi i'w ddweud ynglŷn â darpariaeth ar gyfer bwrw ymlaen â chamau nesaf cefnffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd.

**Trish Law:** Weithiau byddaf yn amau ymroddiad eich Llywodraeth i adfywio Blaenau'r Cymoedd. Mewn llythyr dyddiedig 25 Tachwedd 2003, cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog dros yr Economi, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau ar y pryd at y rhannau rhwng Gilwern a Bryn-mawr a Bryn-mawr a Thredegar fel rhai a fyddai o bosibl yn barod i waith ddechrau arnynt ym Mawrth 2008. Saith mis wedi hynny, nid ydym byth wedi cael dyddiad ar gyfer dechrau'r gwaith ar y ddwy ran hyn. Pryd y byddwch yn gallu cyhoeddi dyddiad dechrau?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid achubaf y blaen ar y gyllideb ddrafft. Bydd yn rhaid ichi aros i edrych ar honno ymhen ychydig funudau. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw ein bod yn sylweddoli bod ymrwymiad ers tro byd i ddeuoli ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd, a bod rhannau o'r ffordd wedi'u deuoli'n barod. Mae rhannau eraill ar fin cael eu cwblhau, a byddant yn agor cyn bo hir, yn ôl a ddeallaf—er bod y gwaith wedi costio rhywfaint yn ychwanegol ac wedi cymryd mwy o amser nag a ddisgwylid. Ar wahân i hynny, bydd yn rhaid ichi ddarllen y gyllideb ddrafft ymhen ychydig funudau.

**Huw Lewis:** Mae'n debyg mai addewid Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ynghylch deuoli ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd, ynghyd â strategaeth Blaenau'r Cymoedd, yw'r ymrwymiad mwyaf y mae'r sector cyhoeddus erioed wedi'i wneud o ran adfywio yn

made in the Heads of the Valleys region. However, as constituents in my area of Merthyr Tydfil and Rhymney wait for the next section of the timetable to be made public, the road is rapidly becoming a death trap. Since I last asked the Deputy First Minister on 9 July about progress on a timetable for dualling, there have been three deaths on this stretch of the A465. I am sure that you accept that my constituents deserve to know when the timetable will be made public. Uppermost in their minds is the question of when the Hirwaun to Cefncoedycymer stretch will be completed—it is by far the most dangerous stretch of road in Wales.

**The First Minister:** We have all driven along the Heads of the Valleys road on occasions too numerous to count. When it was designed by the old Welsh Office in its infancy under Jim Griffiths from 1964-66, a three-lane trunk road seemed perfectly reasonable. We know that the three-lane design has resulted in many accident blackspots, sometimes leading to fatalities. That is one of the reasons why it was decided that it should be made into a four-lane dual carriageway, to remove the risk of head-on collisions as the centre lane switches from westbound to eastbound, or vice versa. The other reason is the economic regeneration benefit. For the details of the timetable, read the budget when it is made available shortly.

**William Graham:** You will know that an integrated transport structure is the way to release potential in the Heads of the Valleys. We have been grateful for the small crumbs of funding that have been put into the Ebbw Vale to Cardiff railway, but it still does not link to Newport, and I would like confirmation on when it will—I have been asking that for years. Equally, we need to know when the Heads of the Valleys road will be completed. It is a vital link for communities in that area, and if an industrialist wanted to move his business there, he would need to be certain that he can get his raw materials in and his manufacturing goods out.

**The First Minister:** I must tell you that I am familiar with calls for integrated transport

rhanbarth Blaenau'r Cymoedd. Fodd bynnag, wrth i etholwyr yn fy ardal i, sef Merthyr Tudful a Rhymni, aros i adran nesaf yr amserlen gael ei chyhoeddi, mae'r ffordd yn prysur droi'n lle sy'n berygl bywyd. Ers imi holi'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ddiwethaf ar 9 Gorffennaf ynglŷn â'r cynnydd o ran amserlen ar gyfer deuoli, cafwyd tair marwolaeth ar y darn hwn o'r A465. Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn derbyn bod fy etholwyr yn haeddu cael gwybod pryd y cyhoeddir yr amserlen. Yr hyn sydd flaenaf yn eu meddyliau yw'r cwestiwn pryd y cwblheir y darn o Hirwaun i Gefncoedycymer—dyma'r darn ffordd peryclaf yng Nghymru o bellffordd.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym i gyd wedi gyrru ar hyd ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd ormod o weithiau i'w cyfrif. Pan gafodd ei dylunio gan yr hen Swyddfa Gymreig yn ei babandod dan Jim Griffiths o 1964-66, ymddangosai cefnffordd dair lôn yn berffaith resymol. Gwyddom fod y dyluniad tair lôn wedi creu llawer o fannau peryglus o ran damweiniau, sydd weithiau wedi arwain at farwolaethau. Dyna un o'r rhesymau pam y penderfynwyd y dylid ei gwneud yn ffordd ddeuol bedair lôn, i ddileu'r perygl i wrthdrawiadau benben ddigwydd wrth i'r lôn ganol newid o lôn orllewinol i un ddwyreiniol, neu fel arall. Y rheswm arall yw'r budd o ran adfywio economaidd. Am fanylion yr amserlen, darllenwch y gyllideb pan fydd ar gael toc.

**William Graham:** Gwyddoch mai strwythur trafnidiaeth integredig yw'r ffordd i ryddhau potensial ym Mlaenau'r Cymoedd. Yr ydym wedi bod yn ddiolchgar am y briwsion bach o gyllid sydd wedi'u rhoi at reilffordd Glynebwy i Gaerdydd, ond nid yw eto'n cysylltu â Chasnewydd, a hoffwn gael cadarnhad ynghylch pryd y bydd yn gwneud hynny—yr wyf wedi bod yn gofyn hynny ers blynyddoedd. Yn yr un modd, mae angen inni gael gwybod pryd y cwblheir ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd. Mae'n ddolen gyswllt hollbwysig i gymunedau yn yr ardal honno, a phetai diwydiannwr yn dymuno symud ei fusnes yno, byddai angen iddo fod yn sicr y gall gael ei ddefnyddiau crai i mewn a'i nwyddau gweithgynhyrchu allan.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Rhaid imi ddweud wrthyfch yf mod yn gyfarwydd â galwadau

planning through my attendance at Labour Party conferences, and Wales Trades Union Congress conferences, over 30 or 40 years. I do not always expect to hear such calls from the Conservative spokesman on these matters, but I welcome your party's conversion.

2.30 p.m.

It is almost being implied that there have been no transport developments in this area, but the Dowlais to Tredegar section was opened in 2004, the Gilwern to Abergavenny section was opened earlier this year—and we had to fund quite a considerable cost overrun of £9 million on that one—the Cwm bypass was opened some time ago in the southward approaches to Ebbw Vale, and £30 million was spent on the new Ebbw valley line. Therefore, you would not say that we have not been investing. We know that it is not the complete picture, but we have been making an awful lot of progress in the Heads of the Valleys generally and in the Blaenau Gwent area.

#### **Caniatâd Tybiedig ar gyfer Rhoi Organau**

**C9 David Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ganiatâd tybiedig ar gyfer rhoi organau? OAQ(3)1303(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym yn gobeithio cyflawni mwy na chyfraith newydd yn unig. Byddai creu cyfraith newydd i sefydlu'r egwyddor o ragdybio caniatâd yn gwneud hanner y job yn unig. Yr ydym hefyd yn ceisio newid y diwylliant ymhlith y bobl, sef '*Sea change in public attitude*' ys dywed y Sais. Dyna sy'n angenrheidiol os yw'r gyfraith hon i weithio.

**David Lloyd:** Mae arolygon yn dangos bod rhyw 90 y cant o bobl yn cytuno â'r syniad o roi eu horganau wedi iddynt farw, ond dim ond rhyw 22 y cant o bobl sydd wedi cofrestru o dan y system bresennol o ddewis cofrestru. Mae pobl sydd ar restr aros am aren yn marw. Felly, onid ydych yn cytuno'n sylfaenol y byddai system o ganiatâd tybiedig—hynny yw, system o eithrio'ch hun os nad ydych yn cytuno—yn adlewyrchiad tecach o ewyllys y bobl na'r system

am gynllunio trafndiaeth integredig am fy mod yn mynychu cynadleddau'r Blaid Lafur, a chynadleddau Cyngres Undebau Llafur Cymru, ers dros 30 neu 40 mlynedd. Nid wyf bob amser yn disgwyl clywed galwadau o'r fath gan lefarydd y Ceidwadwyr ar y materion hyn, ond yr wyf yn croesawu tröedigaeth eich plaid.

Bron nad ydych yn awgrymu nad oes datblygiadau trafndiaeth wedi bod yn yr ardal hon, ond agorwyd y darn rhwng Dowlais a Thredegar yn 2004, agorwyd y darn rhwng Gilwern a'r Fenni yn gynharach eleni—a bu'n rhaid inni ddod o hyd i £9 miliwn, sef y costau ychwanegol sylweddol ar hwnnw—agorwyd ffordd osgoi'r Cwm dipyn yn ôl ar gyrion deheuol Glynebwy, a gwariwyd £30 miliwn ar reilffordd newydd Glyn Ebwy. Felly, ni fyddech yn dweud nad ydym wedi bod yn buddsoddi. Gwyddom nad yw'r darlun yn gyflawn, ond yr ydym wedi bod yn cymryd camau breision ym Mlaenau'r Cymoedd yn gyffredinol ac yn ardal Blaenau Gwent.

#### **Presumed Consent to Organ Donation**

**Q9 David Lloyd:** Will the First Minister make a statement on presumed consent to organ donation? OAQ(3)1303(FM)

**The First Minister:** We are looking at achieving more than just passing a new law. Creating a new law setting out the principle of presumed consent would do only half the job. We are also trying to change the culture and public attitudes. A 'sea change in public attitude', as we say, is essential if this new law is to work.

**David Lloyd:** Surveys show that some 90 per cent of people agree with the idea of donating their organs after their death but, under the current system of opting in, only some 22 per cent of people have registered. People on the waiting list for a kidney are dying. Therefore, do you not fundamentally agree that a system of presumed consent—that is, a system of opting out if you do not consent—would be a fairer reflection of the will of the people than the current system is?

bresennol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Credaf y byddai'n adlewyrchiad tecach, a dweud y gwir. Tra ydym yn aros am newid yn y gyfraith ac mewn diwylliant, yr ydym yn bwrw ymlaen yn llwyddiannus dros ben gyda'r gofrestr sy'n dangos eich bod eisoes wedi rhoi eich caniatâd. Yr wyf wedi cofrestru, ac yr wyf yn cario'r cerdyn yn fy mhoced bob amser. Dylem annog pawb i wneud hynny. Yr ydym newydd gyrraedd y garreg filltir o gael 800,000 o bobl yng Nghymru ar y gofrestr, a chredaf mai James Herbert, myfyriwr offthalmoleg ym Mhrifysgol Caerdydd, oedd yr wythcanmilfed person i gofrestru. Yr ydym yn bwrw ymlaen at 1 filiwn yn awr, tra ydym hefyd yn anelu at ddeddfwriaeth newydd.

**Jonathan Morgan:** First Minister, you will know that the Health, Wellbeing and Local Government Committee did a very in-depth review of presumed consent and the whole framework for organ donation. As a preface to my remarks, I place on record my thanks to every member of the committee for the considerable amount of work that was put in on a tricky and complicated subject. Bearing in mind that the committee did not rule out—and it certainly did not rule in—the need to move towards a legislative competence Order, is it now Government policy that we have a legislative competence Order and that we move towards that over the next 12 months?

**The First Minister:** Yes. We will pursue legislative competence for presumed consent to reinforce the progress that has already been made, including reaching the milestone of having 800,000 people on the register, when only 3 million people live in Wales. There are probably 2.25 million adults in Wales—and I presume that it is only adults who can consent to this—which means that about 40 per cent of adults have given their consent. We are taking the twin-track approach of trying to achieve a sea change in public attitude side by side with securing a change in the law. The law will not work without that sea change in public attitude.

**The First Minister:** I think that it would be a fairer reflection, to be honest. While we wait for a change in the law and in people's attitudes, we are making extremely good progress with the register that proves that you have given your prior consent to organ donation. I have registered, and I always carry the donor card in my pocket. We should be encouraging everyone to do that. We have just reached the milestone of getting 800,000 people in Wales on the register. I think that James Herbert, an ophthalmology student at Cardiff University, was the eight-hundred-thousandth person to register. We are forging ahead towards the 1 million mark now, while also aiming for the new legislation.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Brif Weinidog, gwyddoch i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd, lles a Llywodraeth Leol gynnal adolygiad manwl ar ganiatâd tybiedig a'r holl fframwaith ar gyfer rhoi organau. Fel rhagymadrodd i'm sylwadau, yr wyf yn dweud ar goedd fy mod yn diolch i bob aelod o'r pwyllgor am y gwaith sylweddol a wnaethpwyd ar bwnc dyrys a chymhleth. A chofio bod y pwyllgor heb benderfynu yn erbyn—nac o blaid yn sicr—yr angen i symud tuag at Orchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol, ai polisi'r Llywodraeth bellach yw ein bod yn cael Gorchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol a'n bod yn symud tuag at hynny yn ystod y 12 mis nesaf?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ie. Byddwn yn mynd ati i gael cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol ar gyfer caniatâd tybiedig er mwyn atgyfnerthu'r cynnydd sydd wedi'i wneud eisoes, gan gynnwys cyrraedd y garreg filltir o gael 800,000 o bobl ar y gofrestr, pan nad oes ond 3 miliwn o bobl yn byw yng Nghymru. Mae'n siŵr bod 2.25 miliwn o oedolion yng Nghymru—a thybiaf mai dim ond oedolion a gaiff roi eu caniatâd ar gyfer hyn—sy'n golygu bod tua 40 y cant o oedolion wedi rhoi eu caniatâd. Yr ydym yn dilyn y trywydd deublyg, sef ceisio sicrhau newid mawr yn agwedd y cyhoedd ochr yn ochr â sicrhau newid yn y gyfraith. Ni wnaiff y gyfraith honno weithio heb y newid mawr hwnnw yn agwedd y cyhoedd.



**Jenny Randerson:** First Minister, I am delighted that your Government and the Minister for Health and Social Services decided to look so closely at the evidence that the committee heard at some considerable length, and decided to take such a bold interpretation of it and then to pursue a public consultation. Whatever our views on organ donation, I think that we would all agree that the public consultation is fundamental. However, given that well over 400 people are on the waiting list for organ transplantation in Wales, I am concerned—and I could probably be forgiven for it—that time is of the essence. I would be grateful if you could give us some outline of the anticipated timetable for the public consultation before you intend to press ahead with an LCO, if that is what you eventually decide to do.

**The First Minister:** I do not have a timetable here. We pay tribute to the committee's work. However, we did not come to the same conclusion. That demonstrates the differences of view that you can have between the legislative and executive branches of the Assembly. We believe that the use of community health councils is critical to try to secure public views and public involvement. There are several options open to us, including the soft and hard systems of presumed consent, where you do or do not take account of relatives' views as well as the wishes of the deceased person. The consultation will be about that kind of issue, to see whether we can get the maximum number of people on board, while also trying to reach 1 million people, as that would mean that almost half of all adults in Wales were registered, and we would commend that. The best thing of all would be if everyone was on the register, because then we would not need a new law. However, let us face it: that is not going to happen.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch yn fawr i'r Prif Weinidog am ateb ei holl gwestiynau.

**Jenny Randerson:** Brif Weinidog, yr wyf wrth fy modd bod eich Llywodraeth a'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wedi penderfynu edrych mor ofalus ar y dystiolaeth a glywodd y pwyllgor dros gyfnod maith, a'u bod wedi penderfynu ei dehongli mewn ffordd mor feiddgar ac yna mynd ati i ymgynghori â'r cyhoedd. Beth bynnag yw ein barn am roi organau, credaf y byddem i gyd yn cytuno bod ymgynghori â'r cyhoedd yn hollbwysig. Fodd bynnag, o gofio bod ymhell dros 400 o bobl ar y rhestr aros ar gyfer trawsblannu organ yng Nghymru, yr wyf yn poeni—ac mae'n debyg y gellid maddau imi am hynny—fod amser yn brin. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech roi rhyw syniad inni am yr amserlen a ragwelir ar gyfer ymgynghori â'r cyhoedd cyn eich bod yn bwriadu bwrw ymlaen â Gorchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol, os mai hynny fydd eich penderfyniad yn y pen draw.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid oes gennyf amserlen yma. Rhoddwn deymged i waith y pwyllgor. Fodd bynnag, nid yr un oedd ein casgliad ni. Mae hynny'n dangos y gwahaniaeth barn y gallwch ei gael rhwng cangen ddeddfwriaethol a changen weithredol y Cynulliad. Credwn ei bod yn hanfodol defnyddio cynghorau iechyd cymuned er mwyn ceisio sicrhau barn y cyhoedd a bod y cyhoedd yn cael eu cynnwys. Mae sawl dewis ar gael inni, gan gynnwys y system caniatâd tybiedig lac a'r system gaeth. Mae'r naill yn ystyried barn y perthnasau yn ogystal â dymuniadau'r ymadawedig ac nid yw'r llall yn gwneud hynny. Dyna'r math o beth y bydd yr ymgynghori'n ymwneud ag ef, er mwyn gweld a allwn gael cefnogaeth y nifer fwyaf posibl, gan geisio cyrraedd 1 miliwn o bobl yr un pryd, gan y golygai hynny fod bron hanner holl oedolion Cymru wedi'u cofrestru, a byddem yn cymeradwyo hynny. Y peth gorau un fyddai petai pawb ar y gofrestr, oherwydd wedyn, ni fyddai angen cyfraith newydd arnom. Fodd bynnag, gadewch inni wynebu'r peth: nid yw hynny'n mynd i ddiwydd.

**The Presiding Officer:** I thank the First Minister for answering all his questions.

## Datganiad a Chyhoeddiad Busnes Business Statement and Announcement

**The Counsel General and Leader of the House (Carwyn Jones):** There are no changes to report to this week's planned Government business. Business for the next three weeks is as set out in the business statement and announcement, which can be found in the agenda papers that are available to Members electronically.

**Jonathan Morgan:** The Leader of the House will know that, over the weekend, the Assembly Government said that the United Kingdom Government was wrong to say that the Welsh Assembly Government would have to scrap its free prescriptions policy to recoup some of the money, because it could not afford the policy in the short or longer term. I understand that the source of that story was a senior individual at Westminster. Concern is now being expressed by Assembly Members over whether there is a substantial difference of opinion between the Assembly's Minister for Health and Social Services and the Secretary of State for Health, Alan Johnson. We need a Government statement setting out what discussions have taken place with the Department of Health in London on the viability of the free prescriptions policy.

**Carwyn Jones:** It was a senior Whitehall source, not a senior Westminster source, which suggests a civil servant to me. Let us examine what the Conservatives are asking us to believe. They are asking us to believe that the Welsh Assembly Government has a secret plan to do away with free prescriptions—a plan that neither party in the coalition has discussed, either among themselves or in their party conferences—and that the method that we would use to communicate that change of policy is a civil servant in Whitehall leaking the story to the *News of the World*. That shows you how ridiculous the story is. It is a fact that there is a difference in policy between Wales and England on prescription charges. We know that free prescriptions have been a popular policy, welcomed by the people of Wales

**Y Cwnsler Cyffredinol ac Arweinydd y Tŷ (Carwyn Jones):** Nid oes gennyf newidiadau i sôn amdanynt yn y busnes sydd wedi'i drefnu gan y Llywodraeth yr wythnos hon. Mae'r busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y mae wedi'i nodi yn y datganiad a chyhoeddiad busnes, y gellir ei weld ym mhapurau'r agenda sydd ar gael i'r Aelodau ar ffurf electronig.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Bydd Arweinydd y Tŷ'n gwybod bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, dros y penwythnos, wedi dweud bod Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig yn cyfeiliorni wrth honni y byddai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gorfod dod â'i pholisi presgripsiynau am ddim i ben, a hynny er mwyn adennill rhywfaint o'r arian, gan nad oedd yn gallu fforddio'r polisi yn y tymor byr na'r tymor hwy. Deallaf mai unigolyn mewn swydd uchel yn San Steffan oedd ffynhonnell y stori honno. Mae Aelodau'r Cynulliad bellach yn bryderus bod gwahaniaeth barn sylweddol rhwng y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn y Cynulliad ac Alan Johnson, yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Iechyd. Mae angen datganiad gan y Llywodraeth i ddweud pa drafodaethau sydd wedi'u cynnal gyda'r Adran Iechyd yn Llundain ynghylch hyfywedd y polisi presgripsiynau am ddim.

**Carwyn Jones:** Rhywun mewn swydd uchel yn Whitehall, yn hytrach nag yn San Steffan, oedd y ffynhonnell, ac mae hynny'n awgrymu gwas sifil i mi. Gadewch inni edrych ar yr hyn y mae'r Ceidwadwyr am inni ei gredu. Maent am inni gredu bod gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gynllun cyfrinachol i gael gwared â phresgripsiynau am ddim—cynllun nad oes yr un o'r pleidiau yn y glymblaid wedi'i drafod gyda'i gilydd nac yng nghynadledau eu pleidiau—ac y byddem yn defnyddio gwas sifil yn Whitehall i gyfleu'r stori am y newid polisi hwnnw drwy ei datgelu i'r *News of the World*. Mae hynny'n dangos ichi mor chwerthinllyd yw'r stori. Mae'n wir bod gwahaniaeth polisi rhwng Cymru a Lloegr ynghylch codi tâl am bresgripsiynau. Gwyddom fod presgripsiynau am ddim wedi bod yn bolisi poblogaidd, a

over the past few years.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Leader of the House, you and your ministerial colleagues will be well aware of the work that the Disabled Children Matter Wales campaign has been doing with the Department for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills to address some of the issues that it raised in a public campaign a year or so ago. Would the Government be prepared to make Government time available for a statement on the progress of that work, how close we are to delivering an action plan, and whether the Government can resource some elements of that work directly?

**Carwyn Jones:** I can tell you that consideration is being given to a statement on that issue this week.

**Jenny Randerson:** Leader of the House, I am sure that you will be well aware of stories this week about the problems within the ambulance service in south-east Wales and other parts of Wales. It is important that the Minister for Health and Social Services comes to Plenary to provide us with an oral statement that focuses on the financial problems of the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust. The trust is required to save more than £17 million this year, which comes as an additional burden on top of the cost pressures that every organisation in Wales faces but which are particularly acute in the ambulance service, given the increased cost of fuel, which no-one could have foreseen.

**Carwyn Jones:** The Minister for health takes these issues seriously. However, without having specific details on the alleged incidents, it is difficult to investigate the claims. It is ultimately for the management of the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust to ensure that it has the appropriate staffing levels across Wales to meet demand. The Minister has asked officials to seek assurance from the trust that that is the case.

bod pobl Cymru wedi'i groesawu dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Arweinydd y Tŷ, byddwch chi a'ch cyd-Weinidogion yn ymwybodol iawn o'r gwaith y mae ymgyrch Plant Anabl yn Cyfri Cymru wedi bod yn ei wneud gyda'r Adran dros Blant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau i roi sylw i rai o'r materion a godwyd ganddo mewn ymgyrch gyhoeddus ryw flwyddyn yn ôl. A fyddai'r Llywodraeth yn barod i neilltuo amser y cynnydd gyda'r gwaith hwnnw, pa mor agos yr ydym at gael cynllun gweithredu, ac a fydd y Llywodraeth yn gallu darparu adnoddau ar gyfer rhai elfennau o'r gwaith yn uniongyrchol?

**Carwyn Jones:** Gallaf ddweud wrthyf fod rhoi datganiad am y mater hwnnw wrthi'n cael ei ystyried yr wythnos hon.

**Jenny Randerson:** Arweinydd y Tŷ, yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol iawn o'r storïau yr wythnos hon am y problemau yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn y de-ddwyrain ac mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru. Mae'n bwysig i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol roi datganiad llafar inni yn y Cyfarfod Llawn sy'n canolbwyntio ar broblemau ariannol Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwllans Cymru. Mae angen i'r ymddiriedolaeth arbed dros £17 miliwn eleni, sy'n faich arall ar ben y pwysau ariannol a wynebir gan bob sefydliad yng Nghymru, ond sy'n arbennig o ddifrifol yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, o ystyried y costau tanwydd uwch, na allai neb fod wedi'u rhagweld.

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae'r Gweinidog dros iechyd yn rhoi pwys mawr ar y materion hyn. Fodd bynnag, heb fanylion penodol am y digwyddiadau dan sylw, mae'n anodd ymchwilio i'r honiadau. Yn y pen draw, rheolwyr Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaeth Ambiwllans Cymru sy'n gyfrifol am sicrhau bod y lefelau staffio priodol ganddi drwy Gymru i ateb y galw. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi gofyn i'w swyddogion ofyn am sicrwydd gan yr ymddiriedolaeth mai dyna'r sefyllfa.

2.40 p.m.

**Lesley Griffiths:** You will be aware that, last Friday, the United Nations Committee on the Rights of the Child published its concluding observations on its report on the United Kingdom. The report, as media coverage over the weekend demonstrated, raised some serious issues relating to children in the UK in 2008. The issues relate to how children are portrayed in our media and our approach to youth and juvenile justice, asylum, physical punishment, disabled children and mental health for children. The recommendations are too lengthy for me to detail here. However, given that the implications of the report are so important and far-reaching for the Assembly, would you give consideration to setting aside Government time to discuss the report so that we can properly consider it and what steps we should take next?

**Carwyn Jones:** Thank you for raising the issue. The Minister will make an oral statement on the Government's response to the report in November.

**Darren Millar:** Can you find time for a statement from the Deputy First Minister and Minister for Economy and Transport on any discussions that the Assembly Government has had on the re-establishment of a direct rail link between Llandudno and Liverpool and Wrexham and Liverpool by investing in a 2-mile stretch of railway known as the Halton curve, which is in Cheshire? The current economic climate means that there should be opportunities to improve the economy of north Wales through such a direct link to Liverpool. Could you accommodate a statement on that?

**Carwyn Jones:** I am sure that the matter can be raised with the appropriate Minister. It is a fact that a substantial amount of investment has gone into rail regeneration by the Assembly Government over the years, culminating in the recent announcement of a faster rail service between north and south Wales.

**Chris Franks:** Will the Leader of the House

**Lesley Griffiths:** Byddwch yn gwybod bod Pwyllgor y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar Hawliau'r Plentyn wedi cyhoeddi ei gasgliadau terfynol ar ei adroddiad yn y Deyrnas Unedig ddydd Gwener diwethaf. Fel y gwelwyd yn y cyfryngau dros y penwythnos, yr oedd yr adroddiad yn gofyn cwestiynau pwysig iawn ynghylch plant yn y DU yn 2008. Mae'r materion hyn yn ymwneud â sut y mae plant yn cael eu portreadu yn y cyfryngau a sut yr ydym yn ymdrin â chyfiawnder ieuenedig a phlant, rhoi lloches i blant, cosbi plant yn gorfforol, plant anabl ac iechyd meddwl plant. Mae'r argymhellion yn rhy faith imi fanylu arnynt yma. Fodd bynnag, o ystyried bod goblygiadau'r adroddiad mor bwysig a phellgyrhaeddol i'r Cynulliad, a fyddech yn barod i neilltuo amser y Llywodraeth i drafod yr adroddiad fel y gallwn ei ystyried o ddifrif a phenderfynu beth i'w wneud nesaf?

**Carwyn Jones:** Diolch am godi'r mater. Bydd y Gweinidog yn gwneud datganiad llafar am ymateb y Llywodraeth i'r adroddiad ym mis Tachwedd.

**Darren Millar:** A allwch neilltuo amser ar gyfer datganiad gan y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth ynghylch unrhyw drafodaethau y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi'u cynnal ynglŷn ag ailgyflwyno gwasanaeth trenau uniongyrchol rhwng Llandudno a Lerpwl a rhwng Wrecsam a Lerpwl, a hynny drwy fuddsoddi mewn darn 2 filltir o reilffordd a elwir yn dro Halton, yn swydd Gaer? Mae'r sefyllfa economaidd bresennol yn golygu y dylai fod cyfleoedd i wella economi'r gogledd drwy gael gwasanaeth uniongyrchol o'r fath i Lerpwl. A allech neilltuo amser ar gyfer datganiad ynglŷn â hynny?

**Carwyn Jones:** Yr wyf yn sicr y gellir codi'r mater â'r Gweinidog perthnasol. Mae'n ffaith bod buddsoddiad sylweddol wedi'i wneud gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad dros y blynyddoedd i adfywio'r rheilffyrdd, gan arwain at y datganiad yn ddiweddar ynghylch gwasanaeth trenau cyflymach rhwng y gogledd a'r de.

**Chris Franks:** A wnaiff Arweinydd y Tŷ

find Government time to make a statement on the impact of the credit crunch, market mayhem and the rising cost of living for ordinary people? How is the One Wales Government helping the nation to weather the storm in uncertain times?

Furthermore, could the Minister for planning make a statement on the high concentration of shared student homes in university towns? I have been working with the Treforest Residents Association, which is worried about the concentration of students in the community. Students can bring huge economic benefits to towns, but is there a way through the planning process to ensure that communities thrive all year round?

**Carwyn Jones:** The credit crunch is uppermost in the minds of Ministers here, across Europe and the world. We try to ensure that we hear about difficulties, such as any firms that may be in difficulty across Wales, and seek to provide help as quickly as possible. It would not be useful to make a general statement on the credit crunch given that the fiscal responsibility lies with the Bank of England and with Westminster. Nevertheless, it is appropriate that Members express their concerns here at the appropriate times.

On shared homes, I doubt whether it is possible to introduce planning regulations stating that you cannot rent your house to students. However, I accept the point that, in an age when student numbers have increased so much, you can sometimes see areas of towns that are inhabited mainly by students and are therefore quiet when those students are not there. We should look at it more in the round: when the students are there, they introduce a lot of money into the local economy, particularly in some of the smaller university towns. It is quieter when students are not there, but, taking the year as a whole, the advantage of having a large number of students, particularly for towns like Aberystwyth and Lampeter, is great and contributes towards the economic viability of those towns.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Could you arrange for a Government statement or debate on the

neilltuo amser i wneud datganiad am effaith y wasgfa gredyd, yr anhrefn ar y farchnad a'r costau byw cynyddol i bobl gyffredin? Sut y mae Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un yn helpu'r genedl i ddygymod â'r storm ar adeg ansicr?

At hynny, a all y Gweinidog dros gynllunio wneud datganiad am y nifer fawr o gartrefi sy'n cael eu rhannu gan fyfyrwyr mewn trefi prifysgol? Yr wyf wedi bod yn gweithio gyda Chymdeithas Trigolion Treforest, sy'n bryderus ynghylch cyfran uchel y myfyrwyr yn y gymuned. Gall myfyrwyr ddod â manteision economaidd enfawr i drefi, ond a oes modd defnyddio'r broses gynllunio i sicrhau bod cymunedau'n ffynnu drwy gydol y flwyddyn?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae'r wasgfa gredyd yn pwyso ar feddyliau Gweinidogion yma, drwy Ewrop a'r byd. Yr ydym yn ceisio gofalu ein bod yn clywed am anawsterau, megis unrhyw gwmnïau a all fod mewn trafferthion yng Nghymru, a byddwn yn ceisio rhoi cymorth iddynt cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl. Ni fyddai gwneud datganiad cyffredinol am y wasgfa gredyd o fudd gan mai gan Fanc Lloegr a San Steffan y mae'r cyfrifoldeb ariannol. Serch hynny, mae'n briodol i'r Aelodau fynegi eu pryderon yma ar yr adegau priodol.

Ynghylch cartrefi sy'n cael eu rhannu, yr wyf yn amheus a yw'n bosibl cyflwyno rheoliadau cynllunio sy'n datgan na chewch osod eich tŷ ar rent i fyfyrwyr. Fodd bynnag, mewn oes lle mae niferoedd myfyrwyr wedi cynyddu cymaint, derbyniaf y pwynt y gallwch weithiau weld ardaloedd mewn trefi sy'n rhoi llety i lawer o fyfyrwyr ac sydd felly'n dawel pan na fydd y myfyrwyr hynny yno. Dylem edrych ar y darlun mwy cyflawn: pan fydd y myfyrwyr yno, byddant yn dod â llawer o arian i'r economi leol, yn enwedig yn rhai o'r trefi prifysgol llai. Mae'n dawelach pan na fydd y myfyrwyr yno, ond, ac edrych ar y flwyddyn drwyddi draw, mae trefi fel Aberystwyth a Llanbedr Pont Steffan yn elwa'n fawr o gael nifer fawr o fyfyrwyr, ac mae hynny'n cyfrannu at hyfywedd economaidd y trefi hynny.

**Eleanor Burnham:** A allech drefnu datganiad gan y Llywodraeth neu ddadl

distribution of European funding? A company that is based not too far from my constituency office is having to lay off its workers. It says that the blockage is due to the distribution of the funding by the Welsh Assembly Government. I understand that this has repercussions for the Wales Council for Voluntary Action, which cannot get the funding in time. I am concerned about that, particularly given that vital jobs are being lost during the credit crunch.

**Carwyn Jones:** It is very difficult to give an opinion on the situation without knowing the name of the company or any details regarding the situation. This is a specific issue and it is best to take it up with the appropriate Minister.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Could we have a statement from the Minister for Rural Affairs? Last Thursday was the benchmark date for setting the value of single farm payment moneys from Europe. Given that the monetary situation has changed in our favour in terms of currency conversion—I am sure that you remember that, during your time as Minister for Rural Affairs, it was the other way round—there should be a windfall into the Government's coffers in relation to the modulated money that the Government takes out of the single farm payment. What measures does the Assembly Government have in mind for this additional source of income that has come about via the currency correction that happened last Tuesday, 30 September?

**Carwyn Jones:** That is something that could be taken up with the Minister for Rural Affairs, either in correspondence, in questions or in committee. You are correct; I remember a time at the beginning of the decade when the pound was so strong against the euro that we often went to Brussels asking for money to help our farmers. It has gone the other way now, and farmers in Wales and elsewhere in the UK have benefited from that. If there is extra money available via modulation to go into schemes funded under the rural development plan, that money will be distributed according to priorities. Those priorities can be investigated by questioning the appropriate Minister.

ynghylch dosbarthu cyllid Ewropeaidd? Mae cwmni sydd wedi'i leoli'n weddol agos at swyddfa fy etholaeth yn gorfod diswyddo rhai o'i weithwyr dros dro. Mae'r cwmni'n dweud mai'r modd y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn dosbarthu'r arian sy'n gyfrifol am hyn. Deallaf fod hyn yn effeithio ar Gyngor Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Cymru, nad yw'n gallu cael yr arian mewn pryd. Yr wyf yn pryderu ynghylch hynny, yn enwedig gan fod swyddi hanfodol yn cael eu colli yn ystod y wasgfa gredyd.

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae'n anodd iawn datgan barn am y sefyllfa heb wybod enw'r cwmni na dim manylion ynghylch y sefyllfa. Mae hwn yn fater penodol a'r peth gorau yw ei godi gyda'r Gweinidog priodol.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** A allem gael datganiad gan y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig? Dydd Iau diwethaf oedd y dyddiad ar gyfer pennu gwerth yr arian ar gyfer taliadau senl o Ewrop. Gan fod y sefyllfa ariannol wedi troi o'n plaid o ran newid arian—yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn cofio, yn ystod eich cyfnod yn Weinidog dros Faterion Gwledig, ei bod fel arall—dylai arian annisgwyl fynd i goffrau'r Llywodraeth mewn cysylltiad â'r arian wedi'i fodiwleiddio y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei dynnu o'r taliad senl. Pa fesurau sydd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad mewn golwg ar gyfer y ffynhonnell incwm ychwanegol hon sydd wedi'i chreu drwy'r cywiriad ariannol a ddigwyddodd ddydd Mawrth diwethaf, 30 Medi?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae hynny'n rhywbeth y gellid ei godi gyda'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig, un ai drwy ohebu, mewn cwestiynau neu yn y pwyllgor. Yr ydych yn iawn; yr wyf yn cofio adeg ar ddechrau'r degawd pan oedd y bunt mor gryf o'i chymharu â'r ewro fel yr aem yn aml i Frwsel i ofyn am arian i helpu ein ffermwyr. Fel arall y mae erbyn hyn, ac mae ffermwyr yng Nghymru ac mewn mannau eraill yn y DU wedi elwa o hynny. Os yw arian ychwanegol ar gael drwy fodiwleiddio i fynd at gynlluniau sydd wedi'u hariannu dan y cynllun datblygu gwledig, dosberthir yr arian hwnnw'n unol â blaenoriaethau. Gellir ymchwilio i'r blaenoriaethau hynny drwy

holi'r Gweinidog priodol.

**Peter Black:** I ask once again for an oral statement on the development of neurosurgery services in south Wales. As you know, the report that was published on the subject was fairly contradictory in respect of its ultimate outcome. That has been further contradicted by the Minister's written statement. It would be useful if she could come to the Chamber and answer questions on that review and give us some clarity as to which way she envisages neurosurgery developing in south Wales.

**Carwyn Jones:** The Minister comes here each month to answer questions. It is entirely appropriate for such questions to be directed to her on a Wednesday afternoon when she is taking questions. I do not see the point of having an extra statement on that, given that there are ample opportunities to raise these issues through ministerial questions.

**Peter Black:** Gofynnaf unwaith eto am ddatganiad llafar ar ddatblygu gwasanaethau niwrolawdriniaeth yn y de. Fel y gwyddoch, yr oedd yr adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd am y pwnc yn eithaf anghyson o ran ei ganlyniad terfynol. Mae datganiad ysgrifenedig y Gweinidog wedi ei wrth-ddweud ymhellach. Byddai'n fuddiol pe gallai ddod i'r Siambr ac ateb cwestiynau am yr adolygiad hwnnw a rhoi rhywfaint o eglurhad i ni am y modd y mae'n rhagweld y bydd niwrolawdriniaeth yn datblygu yn y de.

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae'r Gweinidog yn dod yma bob mis i ateb cwestiynau. Mae'n gwbl briodol cyfeirio cwestiynau o'r fath ati ar brynhawn Mercher pan yw'n cymryd cwestiynau. Ni welaf beth fyddai diben cael datganiad ychwanegol ar hynny, gan fod digon o gyfleoedd i godi'r materion hyn drwy gwestiynau i'r Gweinidog.

## Sgiliau Skills

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2, 3 a 4 yn enw William Graham a gwelliant 5 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

**The Deputy Minister for Skills (John Griffiths):** I propose that

*the National Assembly:*

1. *welcomes the skills and employment strategy, 'Skills That Work for Wales', published on 15 July 2008; and*

2. *recognises its importance to the future of Wales. (NDM4017)*

We will be supporting amendment 3 but opposing the others.

It is the duty of Government to unlock the talent of people and businesses in every community. Only by providing a wide choice of high-quality learning, recognising the needs of the economy, can we ensure that people of working age have the skills that they need to succeed in the globalised Welsh

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1, 2, 3 and 4 in the name of William Graham and amendment 5 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

**Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Sgiliau (John Griffiths):** Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:*

1. *yn croesawu'r strategaeth sgiliau a chyflogaeth, 'Sgiliau sy'n Gweithio i Gymru', a gyhoeddwyd ar 15 Gorffennaf 2008;*

2. *yn cydnabod ei phwysigrwydd i ddyfodol Cymru. (NDM4017)*

Byddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant 3 ond yn gwrthwynebu'r lleill.

Mae'n ddyletswydd ar Lywodraeth ryddhau doniau pobl a busnesau ym mhob cymuned. Dim ond drwy ddarparu dewis eang o ddysgu o ansawdd uchel, gan gydnabod anghenion yr economi, y gallwn sicrhau bod pobl o oedran gweithio'n meddu'r sgiliau y mae arnynt eu hangen i lwyddo mewn economi sydd wedi'i

economy, benefiting individuals, communities and our country as a whole.

That is why we put so much weight on our skills and employment strategy, 'Skills That Work for Wales', which we launched in July. I am delighted to take this opportunity to update members on progress towards delivering the 'Skills That Work for Wales' strategy and action plan.

This strategy is vital to Wales and our 'One Wales' vision of a strong economy with full employment and high-quality jobs, taking a demand-led approach and making hard connections between skills, employment and business development. Funding reforms such as the introduction of a fees policy and a sector priorities fund will ensure that we target public investment where it is most needed and makes the biggest impact, and our transformation plans will help to develop a more effective delivery system.

The draft budget, which has just been published today, shows that public finances are tight and are likely to remain so. That means that we have to extract the maximum value from the funds that will be available for post-16 and post-19 education and training.

'Skills That Work for Wales' focuses on the messages delivered by Sandy Leitch and Adrian Webb. This month, I will make a statement and publish a full response to the Webb report's 136 recommendations. Responding to its main thrust, we recently published our policy on transforming education and training provision in Wales, giving a strong lead on changes to the ways in which post-16 learning is delivered, and requiring local submissions that meet our strategic framework by January.

2.50 p.m.

'Skills That Work for Wales' is being driven forward on many fronts in line with the published action plan. Last week, we published a consultation setting out our

globaleiddio yng Nghymru, gan ddod â budd i unigolion, cymunedau a'n gwlad yn gyffredinol.

Dyna pam yr ydym yn rhoi cymaint o bwys ar ein strategaeth sgiliau a chyflogaeth, 'Sgiliau sy'n Gweithio i Gymru', a gyhoeddassom ym mis Gorffennaf. Yr wyf yn falch o achub y cyfle hwn i roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i'r Aelodau am gynnydd tuag at wireddu strategaeth a chynllun gweithredu 'Sgiliau sy'n Gweithio i Gymru'.

Mae'r strategaeth hon yn hollbwysig i Gymru a'n gweledigaeth yn 'Cymru'n Un' o economi gref gyda chyflogaeth lawn a swyddi o ansawdd uchel, gan ddilyn y galw a chreu cysylltiadau pendant rhwng sgiliau, cyflogaeth a datblygu busnes. Bydd diwygiadau mewn ariannu megis cyflwyno polisi ffioedd a chronfa blaenoriaethau sector yn sicrhau ein bod yn targedu buddsoddiadau cyhoeddus lle y mae'r angen mwyaf amdanynt a lle y cânt yr effaith fwyaf, a bydd ein cynlluniau gweddnewid yn helpu i ddatblygu system gyflenwi fwy effeithiol.

Mae'r gyllideb ddrafft, sydd newydd ei chyhoeddi heddiw, yn dangos bod sefyllfa dynn o ran arian cyhoeddus a'i bod yn debygol o aros felly. Oherwydd hynny, rhaid inni gael y gwerth mwyaf posibl o'r arian a fydd ar gael i addysg a hyfforddiant ôl-16 ac ôl-19.

Mae 'Sgiliau sy'n Gweithio i Gymru' yn canolbwyntio ar y negeseuon a roddwyd gan Sandy Leitch ac Adrian Webb. Y mis hwn, byddaf yn gwneud datganiad ac yn cyhoeddi ymateb llawn i'r 136 o argymhellion yn adroddiad Webb. Gan ymateb i'w brif fyrdd, cyhoeddassom ein polisi'n ddiweddar ar weddnewid darpariaeth addysg a hyfforddiant yng Nghymru, gan roi arweiniad cryf ar newidiadau yn y dulliau o gyflenwi dysgu ôl-16, a galw am gyflwyniadau lleol sy'n bodloni ein fframwaith strategol erbyn mis Ionawr.

Mae 'Sgiliau sy'n Gweithio i Gymru' yn cael ei hyrwyddo mewn llawer maes yn unol â'r cynllun gweithredu a gyhoeddwyd. Yr wythnos diwethaf, cyhoeddassom



proposed new approach to adult community learning, including a more strategic approach to planning, delivery and funding. The wide-ranging review of careers information, advice and guidance services is under way, to determine how well placed Careers Wales is to respond to policy developments and imperatives, particularly those in respect of work-related education, learning pathways, the skills agenda and changes to the benefits system, as well as demographic changes and economic conditions.

We have published our delivery plan for improving leadership and management development support in Wales to drive forward business growth and employer investment in skills in the workforce. Following successful consultation, we are now finalising our policy to tackle the problem of those who are not in education, employment or training, and we hope to publish that before the end of the year.

In line with our commitment to maximise the drawing down of convergence funding, we have secured ESF funding of £110 million. Combined with match funding, that makes a gross project value of £201 million. These resources will help to support apprenticeships and, crucially, to tackle economic inactivity.

We are working on four key strategic interventions: the Skillbuild project, the Genesis Cymru project, the Want to Work project, in association with Jobcentre Plus, and the recently approved, new ReAct programme, which will help redundant people back into work. This work on economic inactivity supports the Assembly's strategic regeneration programme and Communities First.

In 'Skills That Work for Wales', we have set out a sector-based approach to skills development in support of the Welsh Assembly Government's strategy for economic development. We have negotiated

ymgyngoriad gan egluro ein dull newydd arfaethedig o ymdrin â dysgu oedolion yn y gymuned, gan gynnwys dull mwy strategol o gynllunio, cyflenwi ac ariannu. Mae'r adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wybodaeth am yrfaedd, gwasanaethau cyngor a chanllawiau yn mynd rhagddo, i ganfod i ba raddau y mae Gyrfa Cymru mewn sefyllfa dda i ymateb i ddatblygiadau ac anghenion o ran polisi, yn enwedig y rhai sy'n ymwneud ag addysg gysylltiedig â gwaith, llwybrau dysgu, yr agenda sgiliau a newidiadau yn y system fudd-daliadau, yn ogystal â newidiadau demograffig ac amodau economaidd.

Yr ydym wedi cyhoeddi ein cynllun cyflenwi i wella'r cymorth ar gyfer datblygu arweinyddiaeth a rheoli yng Nghymru er mwyn hyrwyddo twf busnesau a buddsoddi gan gyflogwyr mewn sgiliau yn y gweithlu. Yn dilyn ymgynghoriad llwyddiannus, yr ydym bellach yn cwblhau ein polisi i fynd i'r afael â phroblem y rhai nad ydynt mewn addysg, cyflogaeth na hyfforddiant, ac yr ydym yn gobeithio cyhoeddi hwnnw cyn diwedd y flwyddyn.

Yn unol â'n hymrwymiad i dynnu i lawr hynny a ellir o arian cydgyfeirio, yr ydym wedi sicrhau £110 miliwn o gyllid gan Gronfa Gymdeithasol Ewrop. Gydag arian cyfatebol, mae hynny'n creu gwerth prosiect crynswth o £201 miliwn. Bydd yr adnoddau hyn o gymorth i gynnal prentisiaethau ac, yn hollbwysig, i fynd i'r afael ag anweithgarwch economaidd.

Yr ydym yn gweithio ar bedwar ymyriad strategol allweddol: prosiect Adeiladu Sgiliau, prosiect Genesis Cymru, prosiect Yn Awyddus i Weithio, ar y cyd â Chanolfan Byd Gwaith, a'r rhaglen newydd ReAct sydd wedi'i chymeradwyo'n ddiweddar, a fydd yn helpu pobl ddi-waith i aildechrau gweithio. Mae'r gwaith hwn ar anweithgarwch economaidd yn ategu rhaglen adfywio strategol y Cynulliad a Cymunedau yn Gyntaf.

Yn 'Sgiliau sy'n Gweithio i Gymru', yr ydym wedi amlinellu dull o ddatblygu sgiliau sy'n seiliedig ar sectorau i hyrwyddo strategaeth Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer datblygu economaidd. Yr ydym wedi

hard to ensure that in order to achieve re-licensed status, each UK sector skills council must demonstrate the confidence, support and influence of employers within its sector, be they in the private sector, the public sector or the third sector.

We recently published the Wales union learning fund prospectus with an expanded budget, and we have just approved revised criteria for the provision of selective and discretionary funding support to businesses participating in the successful workforce development programme of the Department for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning. This programme is now fully aligned to our Department for Economy and Transport's recently developed Flexible Support for Business model, which is more evidence of successful, joined-up delivery.

In line with its remit, the new Wales Employment and Skills Board, chaired by Adrian Webb, is also playing an active role in supporting and challenging the thinking behind, and real-world implementation of, the strategy. The board's annual report, which I look forward to receiving in April next year, will deliver an independent assessment of progress, and we welcome the insight and challenge that that will bring.

We should celebrate the great success of Welsh education and training over the last 10 years, which has driven up quality of provision and achievement, while at the same time remaining determined about the major task ahead. The global economic context requires us to focus our minds ever more keenly on actions and interventions, making much more effective and efficient use of precious public funding, and in doing so, realising the potential of Wales's greatest asset: our people.

**David Melding:** I propose the following amendments in the name of William Graham. Amendment 1: replace 'welcomes' with 'notes'.

Amendment 2: add a new point at the end of the motion:

negodi'n galed i sicrhau bod yn rhaid i bob cyngor sgiliau sector yn y DU brofi, er mwyn cael ei aildrwyddedu, fod cyflogwyr yn ei sector yn hyderus, yn gefnogol ac yn ddylanwadol, boed hwy yn y sector preifat, y sector cyhoeddus neu'r trydydd sector.

Yn ddiweddar, cyhoeddasom brosbectws cronfa ddysgu undebau Cymru gyda chyllideb fwy, ac yr ydym newydd gymeradwyo meini prawf diwygiedig ar gyfer darparu cymorth ariannol dethol a dewisol i fusnesau sy'n cymryd rhan yn rhaglen lwyddiannus yr Adran Plant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ar gyfer datblygu'r gweithlu. Mae'r rhaglen hon wedi'i chysoni'n llwyr bellach â'r model Cymorth Hyblyg i Fusnes a ddatblygwyd yn ddiweddar gan Adran yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth, sy'n brawf eto o ddull cyflenwi cydgysylltiedig, llwyddiannus.

Yn unol â'i gylch gwaith, mae'r bwrdd newydd, Bwrdd Cyflogaeth a Sgiliau Cymru, dan gadeiryddiaeth Adrian Webb, yn chwarae rhan weithredol hefyd o ran hyrwyddo a herio'r syniadau sy'n sail i'r strategaeth, a'r gweithredu arni yn y byd go-iawn. Bydd adroddiad blynyddol y bwrdd, yr edrychaf ymlaen at ei gael fis Ebrill y flwyddyn nesaf, yn rhoi asesiad annibynnol o gynnydd, ac yr ydym yn croesawu'r mewnwlediad a'r her a fydd ynglŷn â hynny.

Dylem ddathlu llwyddiant mawr addysg a hyfforddiant yng Nghymru dros y 10 mlynedd diwethaf, sydd wedi gwella ansawdd o ran darparu a chyflawni, ac aros yn benderfynol yr un pryd ynghylch y dasg fawr sydd o'n blaen. Mae'r cyd-destun economaidd byd-eang yn mynnu ein bod yn canolbwyntio mwy byth ar gamau gweithredu ac ymyriadau, gan ddefnyddio arian cyhoeddus amhrisiadwy yn fwy effeithiol ac effeithlon ac, wrth wneud hynny, gwireddu potensial yr ased mwyaf sydd gan Gymru: ein pobl.

**David Melding:** Cynigiad y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw William Graham. Gwelliant 1: yn lle 'yn croesawu' rhoi 'yn nodi'.

Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*regrets the Welsh Assembly Government's reluctance to set the longer term benchmark for intermediate skills at level 3.*

Amendment 3: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*notes the importance of the skills agenda to the EU structural programmes, especially in the reduction of economic inactivity.*

Amendment 4: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls upon the Welsh Assembly Government to strengthen the employers voice by developing a direct commissioning role for the business sector.*

As the Minister sits down, I can tell him that he will receive our support for every method that he proposes to use to improve the efficient use of public resources. We have talked about this throughout the life of the Assembly. It is important that we spend well and, therefore, turn spending into effective investment; it does not happen by magic. There are a few areas on which I want specifically to question the Minister, because even at this early stage we are not seeing a robust response from the Government.

The Minister was right to refer to the economic crisis that we are in, because it may be necessary to re-assess much of this strategy because of the changing circumstances—some jobs may not be available in existing quantities in the immediate future in areas such as construction, finance and business skills, because some of the anticipated investments may be much harder to achieve. The Government needs to think carefully about holding a general review of where we are in a year or so, when we hope this crisis will finally be resolved. We will not condemn any Government that revisits a policy early because of such remarkable events in the international economy. However, many things are likely to stay the same in terms of the challenges that we face. The skills lever is probably the most effective lever we have on economic development in the medium to

*yn gresynu at amharodrwydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i osod y meincnod tymor hwy ar gyfer sgiliau canolradd yn lefel 3.*

Gwelliant 3: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn nodi pwysigrwydd yr agenda sgiliau i raglenni strwythurol yr UE, yn enwedig o ran lleihau anweithgarwch economaidd.*

Gwelliant 4: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gryfhau llais cyflogwyr drwy ddatblygu swyddogaeth gomisiynu uniongyrchol ar gyfer y sector busnes.*

Wrth i'r Gweinidog eistedd, gallaf ddweud wrtho y byddwn yn ei gefnogi ym mhob dull y mae'n bwriadu ei roi ar waith i ddefnyddio adnoddau cyhoeddus yn fwy effeithlon. Yr ydym wedi sôn am hyn drwy gydol oes y Cynulliad. Mae'n bwysig inni wario'n ddoeth a thrwy hynny droi gwariant yn fuddsoddi effeithiol; nid yw'n digwydd drwy hudoliaeth. Mae ychydig o feysydd y dymunaf holi'r Gweinidog yn eu cylch yn benodol, oherwydd hyd yn oed yn y cyfnod cynnar hwn nid ydym yn gweld ymateb cadarn gan y Llywodraeth.

Yr oedd yn briodol i'r Gweinidog gyfeirio at yr argyfwng economaidd yr ydym ynndo, oherwydd gallai fod yn angenrheidiol ailasesu llawer sydd yn y strategaeth hon oherwydd yr amgylchiadau sy'n newid—efallai na fydd rhai swyddi ar gael yn eu niferoedd presennol yn y dyfodol agos mewn meysydd fel adeiladu, cyllid a sgiliau busnes, gan y gall fod yn llawer anos sicrhau'r buddsoddiadau a ragwelwyd. Mae angen i'r Llywodraeth feddwl yn ofalus ynghylch cynnal adolygiad cyffredinol o'n sefyllfa ymhen tua blwyddyn, pan fydd yr argyfwng hwn wedi'i ddatrys o'r diwedd, yr ydym yn gobeithio. Ni chollfarnwn unrhyw Lywodraeth sy'n ailystyried polisi'n gynnar oherwydd y fath ddigwyddiadau hynod yn yr economi ryngwladol. Er hynny, mae llawer o bethau'n debygol o aros yr un fath o ran yr heriau a wynebwn. Mae'n debyg mai ym maes sgiliau y mae'r dull mwyaf effeithiol

longer term, so we do not want to be put off these longer-term objectives; that is important. However, we need to be fleet of foot if necessary.

On the amendments, I am disappointed that the Government will still not commit to having level 3 as a benchmark for intermediate skills in the longer term, which was a clear objective of the Leitch review. It slightly contradicts Government policy in terms of modern apprenticeships, where the Government is more ambitious. There are some promising signs in that the range of modern apprenticeships will go from two to four, which is appropriate, and the Confederation of British Industry commended the fact that there would be flexibility and this range in modern apprenticeships. I do not think that the Government would suffer from setting an objective to be achieved sometime between 2015 and 2020 for our intermediate skills to be at benchmark level 3. So, even at this late stage, I hope that the Government will think seriously about that.

I am sorry that our amendment on the way to ensure that we have a strong employers' voice has not been supported, because the Government accepted an amendment—although it was a less specific amendment—that we brought to a previous debate. I want to be measured here. The employers' voice—and that is not always in the private sector—is important in focusing on the efficient use of resources. The customer's voice—the people who are getting trained and are thinking about where their career paths may lead them—is also important, but employers have a key role to play. I commend the Government's choice with regard to the members of the Wales Employment and Skills board. I thought that I might have to make a speech condemning the fact that there are not people with sufficient private sector and general employment expertise on the board, but I think that there is a good skills mix on that board. However, getting employers to have a direct commissioning role would be going the extra mile. There are many ways in which that can be done, and I will not commend a particular one. Unless

sydd gennym o ddylanwadu ar ddatblygu economaidd yn y tymor canolig a hwy, felly nid ydym am golli golwg ar yr amcanion hyn ar gyfer y tymor hwy; mae hynny'n bwysig. Er hynny, mae angen inni symud yn gyflym os yw hynny'n angenrheidiol.

Ynghylch y gwelliannau, yr wyf yn siomedig na wnaiff y Llywodraeth ymrwymo byth i gael lefel 3 yn feincnod ar gyfer sgiliau canolradd yn y tymor hwy, a oedd yn amcan pendant yn adolygiad Leitch. Mae'n mynd yn groes braidd i bolisi'r Llywodraeth yng nghyd-destun prentisiaethau modern, lle y mae'r Llywodraeth yn fwy uchelgeisiol. Mae rhai arwyddion addawol y bydd y dewis o brentisiaethau modern yn codi o ddwy i bedair, sy'n briodol, a chafwyd cymeradwyaeth gan Gydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain i'r ffaith y byddai hyblygrwydd, a'r dewis hwn o brentisiaethau modern. Nid wyf yn credu y byddai'r Llywodraeth ar ei cholled o bennu amcan i'w gyflawni rywdro rhwng 2015 a 2020 ar gyfer cyraedd meincnod 3 yn ein sgiliau canolradd. Felly, hyd yn oed mor hwyr â hyn, yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd y Llywodraeth yn ystyried hynny o ddifrif.

Mae'n ddrwg gennyf nad yw ein gwelliant ar y modd i sicrhau llais cryf i gyflogwyr wedi'i gefnogi, oherwydd derbyniodd y Llywodraeth welliant—er ei fod yn welliant llai penodol—a gyflwynasom mewn dadl flaenorol. Yr wyf am fod yn bwyllog yn hyn o beth. Mae llais y cyflogwyr—ac nid yw hwnnw yn y sector preifat ym mhob achos—yn bwysig o ran canolbwyntio ar ddefnyddio adnoddau'n effeithlon. Mae llais y cwsmer—y bobl sy'n cael eu hyfforddi ac yn meddwl ynghylch lle y gall llwybrau eu gyrfa eu harwain—yn bwysig hefyd, ond mae rhan allweddol i'w chwarae gan gyflogwyr. Cymeradwyaf ddewis y Llywodraeth o ran aelodau Bwrdd Cyflogaeth a Sgiliau Cymru. Yr oeddwn yn credu y byddai'n rhaid imi efallai roi araith yn collfarnu'r ffaith nad oes pobl a chanddynt ddigon o arbenigedd yn y sector preifat ac mewn cyflogaeth gyffredinol ar y bwrdd, ond credaf fod cymysgedd da o ran sgiliau ar y bwrdd hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, byddai sicrhau rôl comisiynu uniongyrchol i gyflogwyr yn well byth. Mae llawer dull o wneud hynny, ac ni chymeradwyaf un penodol. Oni bai fod ganddynt ryw faint o

they have some control over the commissioning process, spending will not be at its most effective.

I am pleased that the Government supports our amendment emphasising the importance of European Union structural funds in delivering our skills agenda. In a recent meeting that I had with members of the European Commission, I found that they regarded driving up skills as the biggest factor in transforming the economic regions that are currently depressed in terms of the European average. It is a key area, and if these objectives are achieved, many other general objectives will follow.

We are in economically difficult times, and it is important that young people retain an enthusiasm for entrepreneurship and a business career. We want the next generation to fully consider an exciting career in business and not be put off by what is a temporary economic storm.

3.00 p.m.

Again, I commend the Government on bringing forward some proposals to ensure that entrepreneurship is in the curriculum. The details will have to be followed through to make sure that that is effective. We can at least welcome some of the progress that we are seeing, and it is needed in schools and in the further and higher education sectors to remind people that entrepreneurship brings great value to a community and can give great purpose and enjoyment and a full business career.

**Kirsty Williams:** I propose amendment 5 in my name. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure that adequate planning and preparation is undertaken to guarantee that the strategy succeeds.*

This is a time of unprecedented pressure on the economy and, as I raised in questions to

reolaeth dros y broses gomisiynu, ni cheir y dull gwario mwyaf effeithiol.

Yr wyf yn falch bod y Llywodraeth yn cefnogi ein gwelliant sy'n pwysleisio pwysigrwydd cronfeydd strwythurol yr Undeb Ewropeaidd wrth gyflawni ein hagenda sgiliau. Mewn cyfarfod a gefais yn ddiweddar ag aelodau'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd, cefais eu bod yn ystyried mai gwella sgiliau yw'r ffactor pwysicaf o ran gweddnewid rhanbarthau economaidd sy'n ddirwasgedig ar hyn o bryd o ran y cyfartaledd Ewropeaidd. Mae'n faes allweddol, ac os cyflawnir yr amcanion hyn, bydd llawer o amcanion cyffredinol eraill yn dilyn.

Yr ydym mewn cyfnod economaidd anodd, ac mae'n bwysig i bobl ifanc aros yn frwdfrydig ynghylch entrepreneuriaeth a gyrfa ym myd busnes. Yr ydym am i'r genhedlaeth nesaf lawn ystyried gyrfa gyffrous ym myd busnes a pheidio â gadael i storm economaidd dros dro eu troi yn erbyn hynny.

Unwaith eto, yr wyf yn canmol y Llywodraeth am gyflwyno rhywfaint o gynigion er mwyn sicrhau bod entrepreneuriaeth yn y cwricwlwm. Bydd yn rhaid ystyried y manylion i sicrhau bod hynny'n effeithiol. Gallwn o leiaf groesawu rhywfaint o'r cynnydd yr ydym yn ei weld, ac mae ei angen mewn ysgolion ac yn y sectorau addysg bellach ac uwch i atgoffa pobl bod entrepreneuriaeth yn dod â gwerth mawr i gymuned, ac y gall roi llawer o bwrpas a mwynhad, ynghyd â gyrfa lawn ym myd busnes.

**Kirsty Williams:** Cynigiau welliant 5 yn fy enw. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau y gwneir digon o waith cynllunio a pharatoi er mwyn gwarantu y bydd y strategaeth yn llwyddo.*

Mae hwn yn gyfnod o bwysau na welwyd ei debyg o'r blaen ar yr economi ac, fel y

the First Minister earlier, unemployment in Wales is at a 10-year high. With long-term and youth unemployment increasing, as well as economic inactivity, never have we needed such an emphasis on skills. It is particularly important to focus on economic inactivity. The rates of economic inactivity that we have seen in Wales for many years have dogged the Welsh economy, and have kept Wales at the bottom of many league tables for wealth and economic growth. Investing in skills is undoubtedly one way in which we can protect our workforce from the current pressures and the immediate economic crisis, and from the longer-term challenges to our economy from other countries.

I am sure that the Deputy Minister has done his best, but I am afraid that 'Skills That Work For Wales' will not be the radical transformation that I believe that we need to drive the Welsh economy forward. I will therefore focus on a few areas.

First, the Deputy Minister is well aware of my continued frustration at the poverty of ambition that he demonstrates in relation to levels of attainment. We will therefore support the Conservatives' amendment 2. I still fail to understand how setting a lesser long-term benchmark for intermediate skills than level 3 will drive the Welsh economy forward when, all around us, in England, Scotland and the rest of the world, much more emphasis is being placed on higher level skills. Not setting the benchmark at level 3 consigns Wales to being at the bottom of the pile and to playing catch-up with our competitors. I know the answer that the Deputy Minister will trot out. He will say that we have to start from where we are, that it is a bridge too far and that we have to walk before we can run. However, working on our current skills levels, which are low, and setting an ambitious target for the future, are not mutually exclusive. Those aims can go together in this document. I join in David Melding's call for this Government to change its mind, even at this late stage, and to set a higher standard for the skills levels that we

dywedais yn y cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog yn gynharach, mae diweithdra yng Nghymru yn uwch nag y mae wedi bod ers 10 mlynedd. Gyda chynnydd mewn diweithdra hirdymor a diweithdra ymhlith pobl ifanc, yn ogystal ag anweithgarwch economaidd, mae angen pwyslais ar sgiliau heddiw yn fwy nag erioed. Mae'n bwysig iawn inni ganolbwyntio ar anweithgarwch economaidd. Mae'r cyfraddau anweithgarwch economaidd yr ydym wedi eu gweld yng Nghymru ers blynyddoedd lawer wedi llethu economi Cymru, ac wedi cadw Cymru ar waelod llawer o dablau cynghrair ar gyfer cyfoeth a thwf economaidd. Mae buddsoddi mewn sgiliau yn sicr yn un ffordd o ddiogelu'n gweithlu rhag y pwysau presennol a'r argyfwng economaidd sydd ar hyn o bryd, a rhag yr heriau hirdymor i'n heconomi o du gwledydd eraill.

Yr wyf yn siŵr bod y Dirprwy Weinidog wedi gwneud ei orau, ond mae arnaf ofn na fydd 'Sgiliau sy'n Gweithio i Gymru' yn arwain at y gweddnewidiad radical y credaf fod arnom ei angen i yrru economi Cymru yn ei blaen. O ganlyniad, yr wyf am ganolbwyntio ar ychydig o feysydd.

Yn gyntaf, mae'r Dirprwy Weinidog yn ymwybodol iawn fy mod yn dal i deimlo'n rhwystredig ynglŷn â'i ddiffyg uchelgais yng nghyswllt lefelau cyrhaeddiad. Byddwn felly'n cefnogi gwelliant 2 y Ceidwadwyr. Yr wyf yn dal i fethu â deall sut y bydd gosod meincnod hirdymor is na lefel 3 ar gyfer sgiliau canolradd yn hybu economi Cymru pan fydd pawb arall o'n cwmpas, yn Lloegr, yr Alban a gweddill y byd, yn rhoi llawer mwy o bwyslais ar sgiliau lefel uwch. Mae peidio â gosod y meincnod ar lefel 3 yn golygu y bydd Cymru ar waelod y tabl ac y bydd yn ymlafnio i ennill tir er mwyn dal pawb arall. Gwn beth fydd ateb y Dirprwy Weinidog. Bydd yn dweud bod yn rhaid inni gychwyn o'n safle presennol, fod hyn yn gam rhy fawr a bod yn rhaid cropian cyn cerdded. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bosibl inni weithio ar ein lefelau sgiliau presennol, sy'n isel, a gosod targed uchelgeisiol ar gyfer y dyfodol. Gall y nodau hynny fynd law yn llaw yn y ddogfen hon. Yr wyf yn ategu cais David Melding i'r Llywodraeth hon newid ei meddwl, er ei bod yn hwyr, a gosod safon uwch ar gyfer y lefelau sgiliau yr ydym yn

hope to achieve.

Secondly, the Deputy Minister made great play in his opening speech of the success of many of our educational institutions. Indeed, we have much of which to be proud. Our colleges of further education deliver tremendous results. However, their reward for delivering the Government's targets is to have to sack staff and cut courses. I often feel that their success is despite the actions of this Government, rather than because of them.

'Skills That Work For Wales' states that colleges should be the skills drivers in their areas. However, it is difficult to see how colleges can deliver that, given the financial situation that they have enjoyed this year. The Deputy Minister has an advantage over me, in that I have yet to see the budget announcement from Andrew Davies, but the Deputy Minister has couched all of his comments this afternoon in certain terms, telling us how tough the public spending settlement is and how resources are few and far between. I think that that is code for the fact that further education colleges, and education as a whole, should not look forward to a windfall in the budget. There is a shortfall in both revenue and capital funding for further education in Wales. If we want further education colleges to be the skills drivers in their areas, we have to look at how we can prioritise their needs.

Perhaps the Deputy Minister could answer a specific question with regard to the sector priority fund, which is mentioned in the document. How that fund will be paid for is not mentioned in the document. The Minister is in the middle of a transformation of the educational arena for 14 to 19-year-olds. This is one of the largest changes that we have seen for many years, and the Minister will know already of the huge concern that has been expressed in the Proposed Learning and Skills Measure Committee, which is currently looking at that piece of legislation. There is huge anxiety about the plans that the Minister is bringing forward. Unless we get that right, we will not deliver on the agenda here.

gobeithio'u sicrhau.

Yn ail, tynnodd y Dirprwy Weinidog sylw yn ei araith agoriadol at lwyddiant llawer o'n sefydliadau addysgol. Yn wir, mae gennym lawer i ymfalchïo ynddo. Mae ein colegau addysg bellach yn cael canlyniadau gwych. Fodd bynnag, eu gwobr am gyrraedd targedau'r Llywodraeth yw gorfod diswyddo staff a chynnig llai o gyrisiau. Byddaf yn teimlo'n aml eu bod yn llwyddo er gwaethaf y Llywodraeth hon, ac nid o'i herwydd.

Mae 'Sgiliau sy'n Gweithio i Gymru' yn datgan mai colegau ddylai fod yn gwella sgiliau yn eu hardaloedd. Fodd bynnag, mae'n anodd gweld sut y gall colegau wneud hynny, o ystyried y sefyllfa ariannol y maent wedi bod ynddi eleni. Mae gan y Dirprwy Weinidog fantais drosof, gan nad wyf eto wedi gweld cyhoeddiad Andrew Davies ynglŷn â'r gyllideb, ond mae'r Dirprwy Weinidog wedi mynegi ei holl sylwadau y prynhawn yma mewn ffordd arbennig, gan ddweud wrthym mor anodd yw'r setliad gwariant cyhoeddus ac mor brin yw adnoddau. Credaf mai ystyr hynny yw na ddylai colegau addysg bellach, ac addysg yn gyffredinol, edrych ymlaen at arian annisgwyl yn y gyllideb. Mae prinder cyllid refeniw a chyfalaf ar gyfer addysg bellach yng Nghymru. Os ydym yn dymuno i golegau addysg bellach wella sgiliau yn eu hardaloedd, rhaid inni ystyried sut y gallwn flaenoriaethu eu hanghenion.

Efallai y gallai'r Dirprwy Weinidog ateb cwestiwn penodol ynglŷn â'r gronfa blaenoriaethau sector, y cyfeirir ati yn y ddogfen. Nid yw'r ddogfen yn dweud o ble y daw'r arian ar gyfer y gronfa honno. Mae'r Gweinidog ar ganol gweddnewid addysg ar gyfer pobl ifanc 14 i 19 oed. Mae hyn yn un o'r newidiadau mwyaf yr ydym wedi'i weld ers blynyddoedd, a bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol yn barod o'r pryder aruthrol sydd wedi cael ei fynegi yn y Pwyllgor ar y Mesur Arfaethedig ynghylch Dysgu a Sgiliau, sy'n edrych ar y ddeddfwriaeth honno ar hyn o bryd. Mae pryder aruthrol ynglŷn â'r cynlluniau sy'n cael eu cyflwyno gan y Gweinidog. Os nad ydym yn gwneud hynny'n iawn, ni fyddwn yn cyflawni'r agenda yn y cyswllt hwn.

The Minister is also currently holding a consultation exercise on a paper looking at adult and community education that seems to bear very little relationship to the things that are talked about in 'Skills That Work for Wales'. Somehow, there seems to be a huge gap with regard to how those documents fit together. However, given the demographics, we have to spend more time looking at older people and reskilling and retraining them if we are to keep our workforce going. Simply due to demographics, it will be more a case of people who are already in work filling job vacancies than youngsters coming through the education system.

Finally, Presiding Officer, I beg your indulgence, because I would like to talk about a specific community, namely the black and minority ethnic community in Wales. I am thinking specifically of people coming into our country and the long waiting list for English-language courses in Wales. There are many people who want to take these courses, but the waiting list for them in colleges up and down Wales is huge. There is also a pool of people who have come to this country with skills, and it is a tragedy that we are not using those for the benefit of the Welsh economy. We find people who have come to live in Wales who have high-level qualifications from their home countries driving taxis around our cities. The previous Minister for Health and Social Services had a fantastic scheme—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The Member has been speaking for six minutes and 17 seconds.

**Kirsty Williams:** I was away last week, Presiding Officer, so I shall make up for the time I did not take last week.

**The Presiding Officer:** It does not work like that.

**Kirsty Williams:** The Minister had a very good scheme for utilising the skills of medical professionals who come to live in this country. There are people from other

Mae'r Gweinidog hefyd yn cynnal ymgynghoriad ar bapur sy'n edrych ar addysg oedolion ac addysg gymunedol, maes nad yw'n ymddangos bod llawer o gysylltiad rhyngddo a'r pethau sy'n cael eu trafod yn 'Sgiliau sy'n Gweithio i Gymru'. Rywsut neu'i gilydd, nid yw'n ymddangos bod llawer o gysylltiad rhwng y dogfennau hyn. Fodd bynnag, am resymau'n ymwneud â demograffeg, mae'n rhaid inni dreulio mwy o amser yn edrych ar bobl hŷn, a dysgu sgiliau newydd iddynt a'u hailhyfforddi os ydym am gadw'n gweithlu wrth eu gwaith. Oherwydd demograffeg yn unig, bydd yn fwy o fater o bobl sydd eisoes mewn gwaith yn llenwi swyddi gweigion na phobl ifanc yn dod drwy'r system addysg.

Yn olaf, Lywydd, maddeuwch imi, ond hoffwn siarad am gymuned benodol, sef cymuned y bobl dduon a'r lleiafrifoedd ethnig yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn meddwl yn benodol am bobl sy'n dod i'n gwlad a'r rhestr aros faith sydd am gyrsiau Saesneg yng Nghymru. Mae llawer o bobl yn dymuno dilyn y cyrsiau hyn, ond mae'r rhestr aros amdanynt mewn colegau ledled Cymru'n hir iawn. Yn ychwanegol at hyn mae rhai pobl sydd wedi dod i'r wlad hon yn meddu ar sgiliau, ac mae'n drueni nad ydym yn defnyddio'r rheini er budd economi Cymru. Deuwn o hyd i bobl sydd wedi dod i fyw yng Nghymru, a chanddynt gymwysterau da o'u gwledydd genedigol, yn gyrru tacsis o amgylch ein dinasoedd. Yr oedd gan y Gweinidog blaenorol dros lechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol gynllun rhagor—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'r Aelod wedi bod yn siarad am chwe munud a 17 eiliad.

**Kirsty Williams:** Nid oeddwn yma yr wythnos diwethaf, Lywydd, felly gwnaf iawn am yr amser na ddefnyddiais yr wythnos diwethaf.

**Y Llywydd:** Nid yw'n gweithio felly.

**Kirsty Williams:** Yr oedd gan y Gweinidog gynllun da iawn ar gyfer defnyddio sgiliau gweithwyr proffesiynol meddygol sy'n dod i fyw yn y wlad hon. Mae pobl o broffesiynau



professions who have skills that we could utilise, and I hope that the Minister will say in his winding-up speech how we can best utilise those skills across the board.

**Lesley Griffiths:** First, I welcome the general thrust of the strategy and action plan, which was published in July. The priorities that have been addressed in the strategy are, I believe, an accurate distillation of the themes and policies that have been advocated and debated by Members from across the Chamber over the past couple of years. These priorities are also what I have been hearing from those people I have spoken to in the business sector who are involved in training on the ground and in trade unions since I was elected to the Assembly.

The priorities are to ensure that everyone has the skills essential for taking up employment and maintaining their employability in the labour market, to increase the demand of intermediate and high-level skills in Wales, to address skills gaps and shortages in priority sectors, to support economic development through our investment in post-19 skills, to establish effective and efficient learning provision in Wales, and to improve the levels of basic literacy and numeracy in the workforce. I would like to focus on the last priority. It is precisely what employers, the Confederation of British Industry and the Institute of Directors have been wanting to see addressed for some time. I am pleased to see that Government has been listening to these voices and that it is now prepared to deliver on improving basic literacy and numeracy in the workforce through this strategy and action plan.

I shall now turn to further education colleges and their role in delivering the skills revolution that is being proposed. There are many reasons why I am particularly proud to represent Wrexham in the Assembly, one of which is Yale College—not only because it is a progressive and forward-looking college under the excellent stewardship of its principal, Paul Croke, but because of its fantastic results. Indeed, the north-east Wales

eraill sydd â sgiliau y gallem eu defnyddio, ac yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn dweud yn ei sylwadau wrth gloi sut y gallwn wneud y defnydd gorau o'r sgiliau hynny ym mhob maes.

**Lesley Griffiths:** Yn gyntaf, yr wyf yn croesawu byrdwn cyffredinol y strategaeth a'r cynllun gweithredu, a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Gorffennaf. Credaf fod y blaenoriaethau y rhoddwyd sylw iddynt yn y strategaeth yn adlewyrchiad cywir o'r themâu a'r polisiau sydd wedi cael eu cefnogi a'u trafod gan Aelodau ar draws y Siambr yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Yn ogystal â hynny, y blaenoriaethau hyn yw'r hyn yr wyf wedi bod yn ei glywed gan y bobl hynny yr wyf wedi bod yn siarad â hwy yn y sector busnes sy'n ymwneud â hyfforddi ar lawr gwlad ac mewn undebau llafur ers pan gefais fy ethol i'r Cynulliad.

Y blaenoriaethau yw sicrhau bod pawb yn meddu ar y sgiliau sy'n hanfodol er mwyn cael gwaith a pharhau'n gyflogadwy yn y farchnad lafur, cynyddu'r galw am sgiliau canolradd ac uwch yng Nghymru, rhoi sylw i fylchau mewn sgiliau a phrinder mewn sectorau blaenoriaeth, cefnogi datblygiad economaidd drwy'n buddsoddiad mewn sgiliau ôl-19, sefydlu darpariaeth ddysgu effeithiol ac effeithlon yng Nghymru, a gwella lefelau llythrennedd a rhifedd sylfaenol yn y gweithlu. Hoffwn ganolbwyntio ar y blaenoriaeth olaf. Dyma'r union beth y mae cyflogwyr, Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain a Sefydliad y Cyfarwyddwyr wedi bod yn dymuno'i weld yn cael sylw ers tro. Yr wyf yn falch o weld bod y Llywodraeth wedi bod yn gwrandao ar y lleisiau hyn a'i bod yn barod yn awr i geisio gwella llythrennedd a rhifedd sylfaenol yn y gweithlu drwy'r strategaeth a'r cynllun gweithredu hwn.

Hoffwn droi yn awr at golegau addysg bellach a'u rôl yn y gwaith o sicrhau'r chwyldro sgiliau sy'n cael ei gynnig. Yr wyf yn falch o gynrychioli Wrecsam yn y Cynulliad am lawer o resymau, ac un o'r rhain yw Coleg Iâl—nid yn unig oherwydd ei fod yn goleg blaengar sy'n edrych tua'r dyfodol dan arweiniad rhagorol ei brifathro, Paul Croke, ond hefyd oherwydd ei ganlyniadau gwych. Yn wir, mae colegau

colleges of Yale College in Wrexham and Deeside College in my colleague, Carl Sargeant's constituency, have delivered superb performances in recent years. I am sure that I also speak on Carl's behalf in saying that both colleges have provided steady and increasing progress for the people of our constituencies.

It is worth making the point that, if other further education colleges across Wales are looking for a template of excellence to follow, they need look no further than Yale College in Wrexham. From its co-operation with schools in the area to its association with learndirect, to the new multi-million-pound redevelopment of its engineering and construction course skills centre, half-funded by the Assembly Government, Yale College is setting an example to the rest of Wales of what can be achieved in skills training.

3.10 p.m.

Finally, it is obvious that the Government has taken on board the views of Welsh employers in its approach to the skills that are required and are central to this strategy. Long gone are the days when the Conservatives claimed that they were somehow the party of business. We are the ones who are listening to Welsh business and Welsh employers about skills, and we are delivering for Welsh business and Welsh employers on skills and offering the best opportunities for Welsh companies to flourish with a skilled workforce and to ensure that Wales comes out of its current economic difficulties as unscathed as possible.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** It is a pleasure to speak in this debate on skills, which are so vital to the development of our workforce for the twenty-first century. There are various facets to this debate, but, in particular, I would like to touch on the Government's inability to support our amendment 2, which looks to set the benchmark at level 3. If the Government has that lack of ambition for 2015 and 2020, as my colleague, David Melding, mentioned, then you have to worry about the rest of the 'Skills That Work for

gogledd-ddwyrain Cymru, sef Coleg Iâl yn Wrecsam a Choleg Glannau Dyfrdwy yn etholaeth fy nghyd-Aelod, Carl Sargeant, wedi sicrhau perfformiadau rhagorol yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai Carl yn cytuno â mi fod y ddau goleg wedi sicrhau bod pobl yn ein hetholaethau'n gwneud mwy a mwy o gynnydd cyson.

Mae'n werth dweud, os yw colegau addysg bellach mewn gwahanol rannau o Gymru'n chwilio am batrwm rhagoriaeth i'w ddilyn, nad oes angen iddynt chwilio ymhellach na Choleg Iâl yn Wrecsam. O'i gydweithrediad ag ysgolion yn yr ardal i'w gysylltiad â *learndirect*, a'r buddsoddiad newydd gwerth miliynau o bunnoedd i ailddatblygu canolfan sgiliau ar gyfer cyrsiau peirianeg ac adeiladu, gyda hanner yr arian yn cael ei ddarparu gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, mae Coleg Iâl yn dangos i weddill Cymru beth y gellir ei gyflawni ym maes hyfforddiant sgiliau.

Yn olaf, mae'n amlwg bod y Llywodraeth wedi gwrandao ar farn cyflogwyr Cymru wrth ystyried y sgiliau y mae eu hangen a bod hynny'n rhan ganolog o'r strategaeth hon. Mae'r dyddiau pan oedd y Ceidwadwyr yn honni mai hwy rywsut oedd plaid busnes wedi hen fynd heibio. Ni yw'r blaid sy'n gwrandao ar fusnesau Cymru ac ar gyflogwyr Cymru wrth iddynt sôn am sgiliau, ac yr ydym yn cyflawni ym maes sgiliau er budd busnesau Cymru a chyflogwyr Cymru ac yn cynnig y cyfleoedd gorau i gwmnïau Cymru ffynnu gyda gweithlu medrus, gan sicrhau bod Cymru'n dod drwy'r anawsterau economaidd presennol mor ddianaf ag sy'n bosibl.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Mae'n bleser cael siarad yn y ddadl hon am sgiliau, sydd mor hanfodol er mwyn datblygu'n gweithlu ar gyfer yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Mae'r ddadl hon yn cynnwys nifer o elfennau, ond hoffwn gyfeirio, yn arbennig, at anallu'r Llywodraeth i gefnogi'n gwelliant 2, sy'n ymwneud â gosod y meincnod ar lefel 3. Os yw'r diffyg uchelgais hwnnw gan y Llywodraeth ar gyfer 2015 a 2020, fel y soniodd fy nghyd-Aelod, David Melding, yna rhaid ichi boeni ynglŷn â gweddill y rhaglen 'Sgiliau sy'n Gweithio i

Wales' programme. If you set an ambitious benchmark, you can reflect on what has happened if you do not achieve it, and if you do achieve it, you can take great satisfaction in creating a workforce with skills suited to the twenty-first century and the economy that we need in order to provide the public services that are so desperately needed by the people of Wales.

What I find particularly depressing is the lack of engagement with small and medium-sized businesses to provide the resources that they need in these difficult times. We are in an economic downturn at the moment, and a lot of organisations, even in the third sector, are looking to cut back on training and upgrading skills, because it is an easy hit. Those companies are trying to get through today and are not concerned about what will happen tomorrow. To use an example from the agricultural industry, when the Government ran out of money it took away Farming Connect, and so one of the benchmarks used to deliver skills and training. In these times of recession, it will be vital for the Government to back up its rhetoric with facilitators who can work with businesses, including SMEs, to ensure that they are aware of the programmes available to upskill their workforces and to retain the skills that we need as we go further into the twenty-first century.

I will also touch on the difficulties that people with special needs have in attaining the skills needed to enter the workforce. I recently visited Craig-y-Parc School in Pentyrch. The headteacher and his staff do admirable work there, but they bemoaned the lack of opportunity for students on leaving Craig-y-Parc to try to build a career. Admittedly, many of those students have challenging disabilities, but with today's technology, many can play an important part in building the society that we all aspire to have in Wales. As part of its benchmarking, the Government should ensure that the skills base and 'Skills That Work for Wales' include all sections of society. We want to engender a strong entrepreneurial culture in

Gymru'. Os ydych yn gosod meincnod uchelgeisiol, gallwch bwysu a mesur beth sydd wedi digwydd os nad ydych yn ei gyrraedd, ac os ydych yn ei gyrraedd, gallwch ymfalchïo eich bod wedi creu gweithlu sydd â sgiliau addas ar gyfer yr unfed ganrif ar hugain a'r economi y mae arnom ei hangen er mwyn darparu'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus y mae ar bobl Cymru gymaint o'u hangen.

Yr hyn sy'n fy niallonni'n fwy na dim yw'r diffyg ymgysylltu â busnesau bach a chanolig i ddarparu'r adnoddau y mae arnynt eu hangen yn y cyfnod anodd hwn. Yr ydym mewn cyfnod o ddirywiad economaidd ar hyn o bryd, ac mae llawer o sefydliadau, hyd yn oed yn y trydydd sector, yn ystyried toriadau ym meysydd hyfforddi ac uwchraddio sgiliau, gan eu bod yn dargedau hawdd. Mae'r cwmnïau hynny'n ceisio ymdopi â phroblemau heddiw ac nid ydynt yn poeni beth fydd yn digwydd yfory. Os caf ddefnyddio enghraifft o'r diwydiant amaethyddol, pan ddaeth yr arian i ben gan y Llywodraeth diddymodd Cyswllt Ffermio ac, o ganlyniad, un o'r meincnodau a ddefnyddid i ddarparu sgiliau a hyfforddiant. Yn y cyfnod hwn o ddirywiad economaidd, bydd yn hanfodol i'r Llywodraeth gefnogi ei rhethreg â hwyluswyr a all weithio gyda busnesau, gan gynnwys busnesau bach a chanolig, er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn ymwybodol o'r rhaglenni sydd ar gael i ddatblygu sgiliau eu gweithluoedd a chadw'r sgiliau y mae arnom eu hangen wrth inni gamu ymhellach i'r unfed ganrif ar hugain.

Yr wyf am gyfeirio hefyd at yr anawsterau y mae pobl sydd ag anghenion arbennig yn eu hwynebu wrth geisio cael y sgiliau y mae eu hangen i ymuno â'r gweithlu. Ymwelais yn ddiweddar ag Ysgol Craig-y-Parc ym Mhenyrch. Mae'r pennaeth a'i staff yn gwneud gwaith rhagorol yno, ond yr oeddent yn cwyno nad oedd digon o gyfleoedd i fyfyrwyr geisio datblygu gyrfa ar ôl gadael Craig-y-Parc. Rhaid cyfaddef bod ymateb i'r anableddau sydd gan lawer o'r myfyrwyr hynny'n dipyn o her, ond gyda'r dechnoleg sydd ar gael heddiw, gall llawer ohonynt chwarae rhan bwysig yn y gwaith o ddatblygu'r gymdeithas y mae pob un ohonom yn awyddus i'w gweld yng Nghymru. Fel rhan o'i gwaith meincnodi,

Wales, and we should do so. Entrepreneurs are good at finding routes and solving problems themselves, however; it is the less fortunate in society who desperately need the help that 'Skills that Work for Wales' should offer to the workplace and employers. I hope, Minister, that you will address in your response what you will seek to do to help those who feel excluded from the skills sector.

We also heard recently in the Enterprise and Learning Committee of the inability of the third sector to attract people with the right skills in Wales. The Royal Society for the Protection of Birds highlighted the fact that many providers shut out the third sector because it is not perceived as attractive in terms of sourcing funding from the Government for courses. This is a valuable tool that we could use to address the third sector's needs. Let us look at the financial settlement. On 18 June, the Minister described the last financial settlement as 'tight and challenging'. In fact, probably 15 colleges will have to close, with 2,500 full and part-time learners affected. Will you give an assurance today, Minister, that the new financial settlement has addressed that difficult climate? The draft budget is out now, and I am sure that you have been negotiating on it.

It is a fat lot of good producing reams of paper and numerous initiatives unless the Government is prepared to resource those initiatives so that they deliver on the ground for enterprises, the third sector and the people of Wales who will need this upskilling as we go further into the twenty-first century. I look forward to your response to this debate, Deputy Minister. You have a big challenge ahead of you. Your ambition in trying to deliver the Learning and Skills Measure at great speed means that it could be another foundation phase. I hope that you will bring

dylai'r Llywodraeth sicrhau bod y sylfaen sgiliau a 'Sgiliau sy'n Gweithio i Gymru' yn cynnwys pob rhan o'r gymdeithas. Yr ydym yn awyddus i feithrin diwylliant entrepreneuriaidd cryf yng Nghymru, ac mae hynny'n rhywbeth y dylem ei wneud. Mae entrepreneuriaid yn rhai da am ddarganfod ffyrdd a datrys problemau eu hunain, fodd bynnag; ar y bobl lai ffodus yn ein cymdeithas, yn fwy na neb, y mae angen y cymorth y dylai 'Sgiliau sy'n Gweithio i Gymru' ei gynnig i'r gweithle ac i gyflogwyr. Yr wyf yn gobeithio, Weinidog, y byddwch yn dweud yn eich ymateb beth y byddwch yn ceisio'i wneud er mwyn helpu'r rhai sy'n teimlo eu bod wedi cael eu cau allan o'r sector sgiliau.

Clywsom hefyd yn ddiweddar yn y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu am anallu'r trydydd sector i ddenu pobl sydd â'r sgiliau priodol yng Nghymru. Tynnodd y Gymdeithas Frenhinol er Gwarchod Adar sylw at y ffaith bod llawer o ddarparwyr yn anwybyddu'r trydydd sector gan nad yw'n cael ei weld fel dewis atyniadol o ran cael cyllid gan y Llywodraeth ar gyfer cyrsiau. Mae hwn yn ddull defnyddiol y gallem ei ddefnyddio er mwyn rhoi sylw i anghenion y trydydd sector. Gadewch inni edrych ar y setliad ariannol. Ar 18 Mehefin, disgrifiodd y Gweinidog y setliad ariannol diwethaf fel un a oedd 'yn dynn a heriol'. Mewn gwirionedd, mae'n debyg y bydd 15 coleg yn gorfod cau, a bydd hyn yn effeithio ar 2,500 o ddysgwyr llawnamser a rhan-amser. A wnewch sicrhau heddiw, Weinidog, fod y setliad ariannol newydd wedi rhoi sylw i'r hinsawdd anodd honno? Mae'r gyllideb ddrafft wedi ei chyhoeddi yn awr, ac yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod wedi bod yn trafod ei thelerau.

Nid oes fawr o ddiben cynhyrchu pentyrrau o bapur a llu o gynlluniau oni bai fod y Llywodraeth yn barod i ddarparu adnoddau ar gyfer y cynlluniau hynny fel y gallant gyflawni ar lawr gwlad i fentrau, y trydydd sector a phobl Cymru, y bydd angen yr uwchsgilio hwn arnynt wrth inni gamu ymhellach i'r unfed ganrif ar hugain. Edrychaf ymlaen at eich ymateb i'r ddadl hon, Ddirprwy Weinidog. Mae gennych her fawr o'ch blaen. Mae eich uchelgais wrth geisio cyflwyno'r Mesur Dysgu a Sgiliau yn dra chyflym yn golygu y gallai fod yn gyfnod

your ambition forward and accept our amendment 3 so that we can benchmark for success and have ambition in Wales for the people who have the drive and the energy.

**Janet Ryder:** Members from every party who have spoken this afternoon have shown support for the basic idea behind this: the vision is right, it is the way in which you deliver that vision that may create some issues. Everyone has talked about skills, and yet everyone has talked about skills at a different level. Some have talked about the need to deliver basic skills, others have talked about the need to deliver higher level skills, and Adrian Webb talked about the need to deliver transferable skills. In the economic situation that we are in at the moment, perhaps it is those transferable skills that will become the most valuable to people as they seek employment, seek to retain employment and, perhaps, seek to change employment.

However, whatever level of skill you are looking at—whether it is higher level, intermediate, transferable or basic—it is the way in which you deliver it that is crucial. One element underlying all of this—you highlighted it yourself, Deputy Minister—is the change in the system regarding the way in which we deliver the training that we have at the moment: whether you deliver it to people in their workplace, through a provider or through a college or a school. Everyone has concentrated on the college side today, but this sector covers the school section as well, because that is where the foundations are laid very early on, particularly with the basic skills, and then developed through the system.

In her contribution, Kirsty Williams touched upon some of the issues that have been highlighted in the Proposed Learning and Skills Measure Committee, where a number of areas have been highlighted. The one thing that everyone has said is that they all support the general idea. They all accept that this is the way that we have to get there. How we get to the end of it is a challenge to you, Deputy Minister. One thing that will cause a major problem in getting there, as Andrew

syllfaen arall. Gobeithiaf y byddwch yn fwy uchelgeisiol ac y derbyniwch ein gwelliant 3 fel y gallwn feincnodi ar gyfer llwyddiant a bod yn uchelgeisiol yng Nghymru dros y bobl sydd â'r ysgogiad a'r egni.

**Janet Ryder:** Mae Aelodau o bob plaid sydd wedi siarad y prynhawn yma wedi dangos cefnogaeth i'r syniad sylfaenol wrth wraidd hyn: mae'r weledigaeth yn gywir, ond y ffordd yr ydych yn rhoi'r weledigaeth honno ar waith fydd yn creu problemau efallai. Mae pawb wedi siarad am sgiliau, ond mae pawb wedi siarad am sgiliau ar lefel wahanol. Mae rhai wedi siarad am yr angen i ddarparu sgiliau sylfaenol, mae eraill wedi siarad am yr angen i ddarparu sgiliau lefel uwch, a siaradodd Adrian Webb am yr angen i ddarparu sgiliau trosglwyddadwy. Yn y sefyllfa economaidd yr ydym ynnddi ar hyn o bryd, efallai mai'r sgiliau trosglwyddadwy hynny fydd yn fwyaf gwerthfawr i bobl wrth iddynt chwilio am waith, ceisio cadw gwaith ac, efallai, ceisio newid gwaith.

Fodd bynnag, pa lefel bynnag o sgiliau yr ydych yn edrych arni—boed hynny ar lefel uwch, canolradd, trosglwyddadwy neu sylfaenol—y ffordd y byddwch yn darparu hynny sy'n dyngedfennol. Un elfen waelodol yn hyn oll—tynasoch sylw ati eich hun, Ddirprwy Weinidog—yw'r newid yn y system o ran y ffordd yr ydym yn darparu'r hyfforddiant sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd: pa un a ydych yn ei ddarparu i bobl yn eu gweithle, drwy ddarparwr neu drwy goleg neu ysgol. Mae pawb wedi canolbwyntio ar ochr y colegau heddiw, ond mae'r sector hwn yn cwmpasu'r adran ysgolion hefyd, oherwydd yno y caiff y seiliau eu gosod yn gynnar iawn, yn enwedig gyda'r sgiliau sylfaenol, ac yna cânt eu datblygu drwy'r gyfundrefn.

Yn ei chyfraniad, crybwyllodd Kirsty Williams rai materion sydd wedi cael eu hamlygu yn y Pwyllgor ar y Mesur Arfaethedig ynghylch Dysgu a Sgiliau, lle y mae nifer o feysydd wedi cael eu hamlygu. Yr un peth y mae pawb wedi'i ddweud yw eu bod i gyd yn cefnogi'r syniad cyffredinol. Maent i gyd yn derbyn mai dyma'r ffordd o gyrraedd y nod. Mae sut y mae cyrraedd pen y daith yn her i chi, Ddirprwy Weinidog. Un peth a fydd yn achosi problem fawr o ran

R.T. Davies underlined, is the way in which we fund it. Many of the respondents have said that it is not about the amount of money that is in the system, but about the way in which it is distributed. At the moment, we are attempting to use a system of funding that is creating competition between colleges, as each individual institution fights for its funding—which means attracting students to study with them—and between schools and colleges, as schools' funding depends on the number of pupils that they have. So, we have a funding mechanism that creates competition, which is a legacy of the Tory Government. I hope that we can move away from that, and create a system that will fund different parts of Wales to teach the curriculum that they see as being right for their area.

One of the aims in your document relates to responsiveness. You say that you will be:

'responsive to the unique needs of our customers. Being responsive means giving our customers real influence over our programmes, funding and delivery. Our customers are employers, learners and communities across Wales'.

Even in that, you could have a conflict of interest, particularly when it comes to employers. We have heard a lot about delivering the skills that employers need, which is quite right; we do have to deliver the skills that business needs, and the skills need to be right for the specific work that businesses are doing. Whether this means that each individual employer can come to you with a different set of skills that they may need for their business to thrive, or whether it is generic business skills that can be transferable needs to be debated. However, we also need to consider those higher management skills that Adrian Webb underlined as the area that we need to look at, because we need those higher-level management skills to drive the economy forward. Employers should consider their needs now; it is the Government's job to look to the needs for the future and to spot these. That is your job, Deputy Minister, and you will need the skills to spot those needs in the future and show how you change this funding

cyrraedd y nod, fel y pwysleisiodd Andrew R.T. Davies, yw'r ffordd y byddwn yn cyllido hyn. Mae llawer o'r rhai a ymatebodd wedi dweud mai nid faint o arian sydd yn y system yw'r peth pwysig yn hyn o beth, ond y ffordd y caiff ei ddosbarthu. Ar hyn o bryd, yr ydym yn ceisio defnyddio system gyllido sy'n creu cystadleuaeth rhwng colegau, wrth i bob sefydliad unigol ymladd am ei gyllid—sy'n golygu denu myfyrwyr i astudio gyda hwy—a rhwng ysgolion a cholegau, gan fod cyllid ysgolion yn dibynnu ar nifer y disgyblion sydd ganddynt. Felly, mae gennym fecanwaith cyllido sy'n creu cystadleuaeth, rhywbeth a etifeddwyd gan y Llywodraeth Doriaidd. Gobeithiaf y gallwn symud oddi wrth hynny, a chreu system a fydd yn cyllido gwahanol rannau o Gymru i addysgu'r cwricwlwm sy'n iawn yn eu barn hwy i'w hardal hwy.

Mae a wnelo un o'r amcanion yn eich dogfen â pharodrwydd i ymateb. Dywedwch y:

'byddwn yn ymateb i anghenion unigryw ein cwsmeriaid. Mae bod yn ymatebol yn golygu rhoi dylanwad gwirioneddol i'n cwsmeriaid dros ein rhaglenni, arian a darpariaeth. Ein cwsmeriaid yw cyflogwyr, dysgwyr a chymunedau ledled Cymru'.

Hyd yn oed yn hynny o beth, gallai fod gennych wrthdaro buddiannau, yn enwedig o ran cyflogwyr. Yr ydym wedi clywed llawer am ddarparu'r sgiliau y mae ar gyflogwyr eu hangen, sy'n hollol iawn; rhaid inni ddarparu'r sgiliau y mae ar fusnesau eu hangen, a rhaid i'r sgiliau fod yn iawn ar gyfer y gwaith penodol y mae busnesau yn ei wneud. Mae angen trafod a yw hyn yn golygu y gall pob cyflogwr unigol ddod atoch gyda set wahanol o sgiliau y mae ei hangen arnynt er mwyn i'w busnes ffynnu, ynteu ai sgiliau busnes generig sy'n gallu bod yn drosglwyddadwy a olygir. Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni ystyried yn ogystal y sgiliau rheoli uwch hynny a bwysleiswyd gan Adrian Webb fel y maes y mae angen inni edrych arno, oherwydd y mae angen y sgiliau rheoli lefel uwch hynny arnom i sbarduno'r economi. Dylai cyflogwyr ystyried eu hanghenion yn awr; gwaith y Llywodraeth yw ystyried anghenion y dyfodol a chanfod beth ydynt. Eich gwaith chi yw hynny, Ddirprwy Weinidog, a bydd angen y sgiliau

system, which, with collaboration, will change the system into that collaborative system in each area, perhaps based around schools or colleges, but certainly delivering the skills that have been identified for that area, and ensuring that everyone has equal access to that training.

3.20 p.m.

However, there is inequality of access through the medium of Welsh. There is little Welsh provision in the colleges, and even less in training providers; that does need to be looked at. I ask, Deputy Minister, that you pay particular attention to this issue. As Kirsty underlined with regard to the teaching of English as a second language, we need to look at the teaching of Welsh. That could be as people's first language, but certainly it should be delivered more in the workplace and, as we are looking to re-skill, free of chagre to adults.

**Trish Law:** I generally welcome the publication of this report, but I have some reservations and scepticism that all that is promised here can be achieved.

I concur with the view expressed in the report that basic skills are essential for social inclusion and as a platform for further learning, and that people who lack these skills are at serious risk of being marginalised in a changing economy. Indeed, more than a quarter of people in Blaenau Gwent have no qualifications at all; that is the highest proportion of unqualified people in Wales. My constituency, therefore, has a high percentage of young people who are classed as not in employment, education or training, which is probably the highest percentage in Wales. There is evidence to suggest that young people who are NEET are more likely to come from workless backgrounds, and Blaenau Gwent has the highest unemployment rate in Wales.

I acknowledge that economic inactivity is strongly related to a lack of skills, so this

arnoch i allu canfod yr anghenion hynny yn y dyfodol a dangos sut y mae newid y system gyllido hon, a fydd, gyda chydweithio, yn newid y system i'r system gydweithredol honno ym mhob ardal, wedi'i seilio ar ysgolion neu golegau efallai, ond yn sicr yn darparu'r sgiliau sydd wedi cael eu nodi ar gyfer y maes hwnnw, ac yn sicrhau bod pawb, fel ei gilydd, yn gallu cael yr hyfforddiant hwnnw.

Fodd bynnag, nid oes mynediad cyfartal drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Nid oes fawr o ddarpariaeth Gymraeg yn y colegau, a llai fyth gan ddarparwyr hyfforddiant, ac mae angen edrych ar hynny. Gofynnaf, Ddirprwy Weinidog, ichi roi sylw arbennig i'r mater hwn. Fel y pwysleisiodd Kirsty yng nghyswllt addysgu Saesneg fel ail iaith, mae angen inni edrych ar addysgu Cymraeg. Gallai hyn fod fel iaith gyntaf pobl, ond yn sicr dylid gwneud mwy i'w chyflwyno yn y gweithle ac, a ninnau'n ystyried ailsgilio, dylai gael ei chyflwyno'n ddi-dâl i oedolion.

**Trish Law:** Yn gyffredinol yr wyf yn croesawu cyhoeddi'r adroddiad hwn, ond mae gennyf rai amheuan a ellir gwireddu popeth sy'n cael ei addo yma.

Cytunaf â'r farn a fynegir yn yr adroddiad fod sgiliau sylfaenol yn hanfodol ar gyfer cynhwysiant cymdeithasol ac fel sylfaen ar gyfer dysgu pellach, a bod perygl difrifol i'r bobl nad yw'r sgiliau hyn ganddynt gael eu gwthio i'r cyrion mewn economi sy'n newid. Yn wir, nid oes dim cymwysterau o gwbl gan fwy na chwarter y bobl ym Mlaenau Gwent; dyna'r gyfran uchaf o bobl heb gymwysterau yng Nghymru. Mae gan fy etholaeth, felly, ganran uchel o bobl ifanc sy'n cael eu hystyried fel pobl nad ydynt mewn cyflogaeth, addysg na hyfforddiant, ac mae'n debyg mai dyna'r ganran uchaf yng Nghymru. Mae tystiolaeth sy'n awgrymu bod pobl ifanc nad ydynt mewn cyflogaeth, addysg na hyfforddiant yn fwy tebygol o ddod o gefndiroedd di-waith, a Blaenau Gwent sydd â'r gyfradd diweithdra uchaf yng Nghymru.

Yr wyf yn cydnabod bod cysylltiad cryf rhwng anweithgarwch economaidd a diffyg

report holds some hope that access to training will be improved, and that the training itself will be more relevant to today's changing employment market. Having said that, and while new skills needs are emerging, we cannot ignore or forget the traditional industries that have been the foundation stone of our economy for many years. Those traditional industries still play a significant role in our economy.

I will refer to one training provider, Blaenau Gwent County Borough Council, which successfully teaches skills to 200-plus, mainly young, people a year at its training centre at Tafarnaubach. The centre has been providing vocational learning opportunities for 25 years and, in recent times, thanks to new management and training structures, has been hitting targets and improving performance. However, the council has hit a significant funding gap in running its training centre, because of inadequate resources from the Welsh Assembly Government. I share the council's dismay that continuous improvement and an increase in outcomes at the training centre has resulted in a reduced contract award from 1 August 2008 to 31 July 2009, which restricts the delivery of qualifications in manufacturing. It appears that the reason for the reduced contract award is that your department, Deputy Minister, has defined manufacturing as a non-priority sector.

That presents particular difficulties for Blaenau Gwent, where manufacturing still represents about 30 per cent of the skills base. I therefore take issue with reference in the report to providers being expected to respond to the national priorities within the national learning and skills assessment when allocating resources and producing their provision development and delivery plans. I hope that you will acknowledge the need for providers in Blaenau Gwent, and elsewhere, to also respond to local priorities.

Talking of priorities, I welcome the report's

sgiliau, felly mae'r adroddiad hwn yn cynnig rhyw obaith y bydd y gallu i gael hyfforddiant yn gwella, ac y bydd yr hyfforddiant ei hun yn fwy perthnasol i'r farchnad gyflogaeth heddiw, a honno'n farchnad sy'n newid. Wedi dweud hynny, ac er bod anghenion sgiliau newydd yn datblygu, ni allwn anwybyddu nac anghofio'r diwydiannau traddodiadol sydd wedi bod yn garreg sylfaen i'n heconomi ers blyneddoddd lawer. Mae'r diwydiannau traddodiadol hynny'n dal i chwarae rhan o bwys yn ein heconomi.

Cyfeiriaf at un darparwr hyfforddiant, Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Blaenau Gwent, sy'n addysgu sgiliau'n llwyddiannus i 200 a mwy o bobl, pobl ifanc gan mwyaf, y flwyddyn yn ei ganolfan hyfforddi yn Nhafarnau-bach. Mae'r ganolfan wedi bod yn darparu cyfleoedd dysgu galwedigaethol ers 25 mlynedd ac, yn ddiweddar, diolch i strwythurau rheoli a hyfforddi newydd, mae wedi bod yn cyrraedd ei thargedau ac yn gwella'i pherfformiad. Fodd bynnag, mae'r cyngor yn wynebu bwlch cyllidol sylweddol o ran rhedeg ei ganolfan hyfforddi, oherwydd adnoddau annigonol gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Yr wyf finnau, fel y cyngor, yn siomedig bod gwelliant parhaus a chynnydd yng nghanlyniadau'r ganolfan hyfforddi wedi arwain at ddyfarnu contract llai o 1 Awst 2008 tan 31 Gorffennaf 2009, sy'n cyfyngu ar ddarparu cymwysterau mewn gweithgynhyrchu. Mae'n ymddangos mai'r rheswm dros ddyfarnu contract llai yw bod eich adran chi, Ddirprwy Weinidog, wedi diffinio gweithgynhyrchu fel sector na roddir blaenoriaeth iddo.

Mae hynny'n achosi cryn anawsterau ym Mlaenau Gwent, lle y mae gweithgynhyrchu tua 30 y cant o'r sylfaen sgiliau o hyd. Yr wyf yn anghytuno felly â'r cyfeiriad sydd yn yr adroddiad at ddisgwyl i ddarparwyr ymateb i'r blaenoriaethau cenedlaethol o fewn yr asesiad cenedlaethol dysgu a sgiliau wrth ddyrannu adnoddau a chynhyrchu eu cynlluniau datblygu a chyflwyno darpariaeth. Gobeithiaf y byddwch yn cydnabod yr angen i ddarparwyr ym Mlaenau Gwent, a manau eraill, gydnabod blaenoriaethau lleol yn ogystal.

O sôn am flaenoriaethau, yr wyf yn



assertion that we should prioritise funding and learner support to help people at risk of exclusion get the minimum platform of skills necessary to find a sustainable job. However, the one big reservation that I have is the availability of sustainable jobs.

More than a quarter of the working-age population in Blaenau Gwent is economically inactive. You have more chance of finding gold in the hills of Blaenau Gwent than you have of finding good, sustainable jobs. Blaenau Gwent, I am afraid, is far removed from the 'One Wales' vision of a strong and enterprising economy, with full employment based on high-quality, highly skilled jobs. However, I look forward to the Welsh Assembly Government rising to the challenge of addressing the basic skills deficit in Blaenau Gwent, which, in turn, let us hope, might help lift Blaenau Gwent out of the unemployment doldrums by unlocking people's potential and encouraging businesses to grow, thereby creating desperately needed new jobs.

Finally, you may wonder why I have not previously raised my concerns about the training situation in Blaenau Gwent. I have. I wrote to you on 19 August and I am disappointed that, seven weeks later, you still have not replied. I just hope that you address the issues in 'Skills That Work for Wales' with greater urgency.

**Huw Lewis:** I thank John for bringing forward this debate today. John knows well that there are some areas in the skills debate where I would like to see us take a bolder approach—particularly in relation to the career ladders proposals, as outlined in our manifesto. However, the overall strategic aims and the Government focus on this crucial area deserve strong support from Assembly Members today. It is right that we should focus our efforts on reducing economic inactivity, most particularly in our deprived areas. There is no greater sheet anchor dragging on the Welsh economy than the thousands of people locked out of the

croesawu'r datganiad yn yr yr adroddiad y dylem roi blaenoriaeth i ddarparu cyllid a chymorth i ddysgwyr i helpu pobl y mae perygl iddynt gael eu hallgáu i ennill y sgiliau gofynnol sy'n angenrheidiol i gael swydd gynaliadwy. Fodd bynnag, yr un amheuaeth fawr sydd gennyf yw faint o swyddi cynaliadwy sydd ar gael.

Mae dros chwarter y boblogaeth o oedran gweithio ym Mlaenau Gwent yn anweithgar yn economaidd. Mae gennych fwy o obaith o ddod o hyd i aur ym mryniau Blaenau Gwent nag sydd gennych o ganfod swyddi cynaliadwy, da. Mae Blaenau Gwent, mae arnaf ofn, ymhell oddi wrth weledigaeth 'Cymru'n Un' o economi gref a mentrus, gyda chyflogaeth lawn a hynny'n seiliedig ar swyddi tra medrus, o ansawdd uchel. Fodd bynnag, edrychaf ymlaen at weld Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ymateb i'r her o fynd i'r afael â'r diffyg sgiliau sylfaenol ym Mlaenau Gwent. Efallai y gwnaiff hynny, yn ei dro, gadewch inni obeithio, godi Blaenau Gwent o afael diweithdra drwy ddatgloi potensial pobl ac annog busnesau i dyfu, gan greu swyddi newydd y mae angen dirfawr amdanynt drwy hynny.

Yn olaf, efallai eich bod yn ceisio dyfalu pam tybed nad wyf wedi codi fy mhryderon ynglŷn â'r sefyllfa o ran hyfforddi ym Mlaenau Gwent cyn hyn. Yr wyf wedi gwneud. Ysgrifennais atoch ar 19 Awst ac yr wyf yn siomedig nad ydych byth wedi ateb, saith wythnos yn ddiweddarach. Ni allaf ond gobeithio y byddwch yn mynd i'r afael â'r materion yn 'Sgiliau sy'n Gweithio i Gymru' gyda mwy o frys.

**Huw Lewis:** Diolchaf i John am gyflwyno'r ddadl hon heddiw. Gŵyr John yn dda fod rhai meysydd yn y ddadl sgiliau lle'r hoffwn ein gweld yn gweithredu'n fwy eofn—yn enwedig yng nghyswllt y cynigion ynghylch grisiau gyrfa, fel yr amlinellwyd yn ein maniffesto. Fodd bynnag, mae'r amcanion strategol cyffredinol a ffocws y Llywodraeth ar y maes hollbwysig hwn yn haeddu cefnogaeth gref gan Aelodau'r Cynulliad heddiw. Mae'n iawn inni ganolbwyntio ein hymdrechion ar leihau anweithgarwch economaidd, yn enwedig yn ein hardaloedd difreintiedig. Nid oes dim sy'n amharu mwy ar economi Cymru na'r miloedd o bobl sydd

workforce because of caring duties, a lack of basic skills or low aspiration. It is an intensive, expensive business to properly tackle the most intractable social barriers to work. We well remember the message that the Tories had for our people in dealing with this problem: get on your bike. It did not really cut it, as was shown by the unprecedented boom in benefits claimants under the last Tory Government. We must take Tory comments today in that context.

That is why I want to particularly welcome the recent announcement on Genesis II. It is a £70 million follow-on to the original programme that has run over the last three years, helping 15,000 hard-to-reach people in accessing childcare and providing training. In addition to the roll-out of the foundation phase, Flying Start and the unprecedented schools building programme, this announcement shows that the Labour-led Assembly Government recognises that the answer to the skills challenge tomorrow lies in today's schools, with investment in early years being crucial. Addressing the concerns of the Enterprise and Learning Committee around the issue of the worsening gender gap in formal education is also important. I know that this is something that colleagues from all parties will recognise, and I would be interested to hear the Deputy Minister explain how the new 14 to 19 strategy could help to address the issue. As recent evidence from Estyn suggests, it is in the early teens that, every year, a cohort of boys goes missing. They are Wales's lost boys, and the social, economic and human cost of that loss is difficult to measure. It is my hope that a more flexible learning programme can be tailored to meet that specific issue.

The skills debate does not stop and start at the school gates, however. Over two-thirds of the Welsh workforce of 2020 is in employment already. Allied with the fact that up to one-third of adults of working age in constituencies like mine are without basic

wedi cael eu cloi allan o'r gweithlu oherwydd dyletswyddau gofalu, diffyg sgiliau sylfaenol neu ddyheadau isel. Mae'n fusnes dwys, costus, mynd i'r afael yn iawn â'r rhwystrau cymdeithasol mwyaf anhydrin rhag cael gwaith. Cofiw'n yn iawn neges y Torïaid i'n pobl wrth ddelio â'r broblem hon: ar eich beic. Nid oedd hynny'n ateb mewn gwirionedd, fel y dangoswyd gan y cynnydd na chafwyd ei debyg yn y niferoedd a oedd yn hawlio budd-daliadau o dan y Llywodraeth Dorïaidd ddiwethaf. Rhaid inni ystyried sylwadau'r Torïaid heddiw yn y cyddestun hwnnw.

Dyna pam yr wyf am roi croeso'n arbennig i'r cyhoeddiad yn ddiweddar ynghylch Genesis II yn arbennig. Mae'n ddilyniant gwerth £70 miliwn i'r rhaglen wreiddiol a fu'n weithredol am y tair blynedd diwethaf, gan helpu 15,000 o bobl anodd eu cyrraedd o ran cael gofal plant a darparu hyfforddiant. Yn ogystal â graddol gyflwyno'r cyfnod sylfaen, Dechrau'n Deg a'r rhaglen adeiladu ysgolion na welwyd ei thebyg, mae'r cyhoeddiad hwn yn dangos bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad dan arweiniad Llafur yn cydnabod bod yr ateb i her sgiliau yfory yn ysgolion heddiw, a bod buddsoddi yn y blynyddoedd cynnar yn dyngedfennol. Mae ymdrin â phryderon y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu ynglŷn â'r bwlech sy'n cynyddu rhwng y rhywiau mewn addysg ffurfiol yn bwysig hefyd. Gwn fod hyn yn rhywbeth y bydd cyd-Aelodau o bob plaid yn ei gydnabod, a byddai gennyf ddiddordeb mewn clywed y Dirprwy Weinidog yn esbonio sut y gallai'r strategaeth 14 i 19 newydd helpu i fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn. Fel y mae tystiolaeth gan Estyn yn ddiweddar yn awgrymu, ym mlynnyddoedd cynnar yr arddegau y mae carfan o fechgyn yn mynd ar goll, bob blwyddyn. Y nhw yw bechgyn coll Cymru, ac mae cost gymdeithasol, economaidd a dynol y golled honno'n anodd ei mesur. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y gellir llunio rhaglen ddysgu fwy hyblyg i ymateb i'r mater penodol hwnnw.

Nid wrth glwyd yr ysgol y mae'r ddadl sgiliau'n gorffen ac yn dechrau, fodd bynnag. Mae dros ddwy ran o dair o weithlu Cymru yn 2020 mewn cyflogaeth yn barod. Ynghyd â'r ffaith bod hyd at un rhan o dair o oedolion o oedran gweithio mewn etholaethau fel fy

literacy and numeracy skills, we can see that the challenge to create a knowledge economy over the coming years is colossal. This is, therefore, a debate for the workplace as well, and I am glad to hear that a new Welsh union learning fund project, Connecting Learners, is coming forward this month. In relation to work-based learning, I would still like to see more movement on returning to the proposed career ladders programme, the initial in-work training model pioneered by sections of the national health service and supported by Unite and the TUC in Wales. I would welcome the Deputy Minister's thoughts on that matter today.

Finally, I turn to my own constituents. The establishment of Merthyr as a university town—another manifesto pledge—has the potential to be the most transformational offer ever made by the Assembly to that part of Wales. The lifelong learning campus will be the physical embodiment of Labour's pledge to the people of the Heads of the Valleys that education is for all, and that it is never too late to better your skills and find better work. I would, therefore, welcome from the Deputy Minister some timescales relating to the completion of this work. He will understand that the local community is impatient to see the promised investment become a reality. The skills strategy deserves support, but it will not work if it does not work in the Valleys, and it will not work in the Valleys if it does not work in Merthyr.

3.30 p.m.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I presume that that could be applied to my region of north Wales as well. In north Wales, we have a cohort of excellent FE colleges that is, unfortunately, being starved of funding. I hope that the Deputy Minister can address that issue, which was rather complacently glossed over in response to a question that I tried to ask earlier. It is interesting that we are discussing 'Skills That Work for Wales'. The Leitch review showed that the prize for improving skills will be a more prosperous society with higher rates of employment, lower levels of poverty and reduced inequality. Reduced inequality is what we are all aiming for,

un i heb sgiliau llythrennedd a rhifedd sylfaenol, gallwn weld bod yr her o greu economi wybodaeth dros y blynyddoedd nesaf yn un enfawr. Mae hon, felly, yn ddadl am y gweithle hefyd, ac yr wyf yn falch o glywed bod prosiect newydd cronfa ddysgu undebau Cymru, Connecting Learners, yn dod yn weithredol y mis hwn. O ran addysg seiliedig ar waith, byddwn yn hoffi gweld rhagor o symud o hyd o ran dychwelyd at y rhaglen arfaethedig ynghylch grisiau gyrfa, y model hyfforddiant cychwynnol mewn gwaith y rhoddwyd cynnig arno gyntaf gan rannau o'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol ac a gefnogwyd gan Unite a'r TUC yng Nghymru. Byddwn yn croesawu syniadau'r Dirprwy Weinidog ar y mater hwnnw heddiw.

Yn olaf, trof at fy etholwyr fy hun. Gallai sefydlu Merthyr yn dref brifysgol—addewid manifesto arall—gynnig y gweddnewidiad mwyaf erioed a wnaethpwyd gan y Cynulliad i'r rhan honno o Gymru. Y campws dysgu gydol oes fydd yr ymgorfforiad ffisegol o addewid Llafur i bobl Blaenau'r Cymoedd fod addysg i bawb, ac nad yw byth yn rhy hwyr i wella'ch sgiliau a dod o hyd i well gwaith. Byddwn, felly, yn croesawu amserlenni gan y Dirprwy Weinidog ynglŷn â chwblhau'r gwaith hwn. Bydd yn deall bod y gymuned leol yn ddiamynedd o ran ei hawydd i weld y buddsoddiad a addawyd yn cael ei wireddu. Mae'r strategaeth sgiliau yn haeddu cael cefnogaeth, ond ni fydd yn gweithio os nad yw'n gweithio yn y Cymoedd, ac ni fydd yn gweithio yn y Cymoedd os nad yw'n gweithio ym Merthyr.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Tybiaf y gellid dweud hynny am fy rhanbarth i yn y gogledd hefyd. Yn y gogledd, mae gennym garfan o golegau addysg bellach rhagorol sydd, yn anffodus, yn cael eu hamddifadu o gyllid. Gobeithiaf y gall y Dirprwy Weinidog fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwnnw, a gafodd sylw eithaf hunanfodlon mewn ymateb i gwestiwn y ceisiais ei ofyn yn gynharach. Mae'n ddiddorol ein bod yn trafod 'Sgiliau sy'n Gweithio i Gymru'. Dangosodd adolygiad Leitch mai'r wobwr am wella sgiliau fydd cymdeithas fwy ffyniannus gyda chyfraddau uwch o gyflogaeth, lefelau is o dlodi a llai o anghydraddoldeb. Lleihau anghydraddoldeb

whichever part of Wales we represent.

yw nod pob un ohonom, pa ran bynnag o Gymru a gynrychiolwn.

Investment in skills is crucial in Wales. The third paragraph of the executive summary of the strategy says the following.

Mae buddsoddi mewn sgiliau yn hanfodol yng Nghymru. Yn ôl trydydd paragraff crynodeb gweithredol y strategaeth,

‘The skills of the Welsh workforce lag behind more prosperous regions of the UK and compare poorly to the world’s leading advanced countries. Economic inactivity—strongly related to a lack of skills—remains stubbornly higher than the UK average. We must do more for those who face the biggest challenges in finding work and escaping from poverty.’

‘Mae sgiliau’r gweithlu yng Nghymru yn waeth na sgiliau rhanbarthau mwy ffyniannus y DU ac maent yn cymharu’n wael â gwledydd datblygedig blaenllaw’r byd. Mae anweithgarwch economaidd—sydd â chyswllt cryf â diffyg sgiliau—yn parhau i fod yn ystyfnig o uwch na chyfartaledd y DU. Mae’n rhaid i ni wneud mwy i’r rhai sy’n wynebu’r heriau mwyaf o ran dod o hyd i waith a dianc rhag tlodi.’

That is the crux of the whole debate. We all know about the skills gaps from our constituency work and from talking to people during the summer recess and so on. I commend the Government on its ongoing commitment, but there is a gap between the rhetoric and the reality. Basic skills levels—numeracy, literacy, communication and even linguistic skills—are really very low. We are in a global economy that is more relevant now than ever. We know that there are lots of problems in the UK, but the credit crunch is also linked to global matters. Given the emerging economies of China and India in particular, we have a very long way to go.

Hynny yw craidd yr holl ddadl. Gŵyr pob un ohonom am y bylchau mewn sgiliau yn sgîl ein gwaith yn ein hetholaethau a thrwy siarad â phobl yn ystod toriad yr haf ac yn y blaen. Yr wyf yn canmol y Llywodraeth am ei hymrwymiad sy’n parhau, ond mae bwlch rhwng y rhethreg a’r realiti. Mae lefelau sgiliau sylfaenol—rhifedd, llythrennedd, cyfathrebu a hyd yn oed sgiliau ieithyddol—yn isel iawn, iawn mewn gwirionedd. Yr ydym mewn economi fyd-eang sy’n fwy perthnasol yn awr nag erioed. Gwyddom fod llawer o broblemau yn y DU, ond mae’r wasgfa gredyd yn gysylltiedig hefyd â materion byd-eang. O gofio am yr economïau sy’n datblygu yn Tsieina ac India yn arbennig, mae gennym gryn dasg o’n blaenau.

I am also concerned about the personal debt of the people who become higher education students in this day and age. What happens to them after graduation is just as important when it comes to improving their working experience. Many of them cannot find relevant jobs because they are overqualified. That is another issue that needs to be addressed on behalf of our young people.

Yr wyf yn pryderu hefyd ynghylch dyledion personol pobl sy’n mynd yn fyfyrwyr addysg uwch y dyddiau hyn. Mae’r hyn sy’n digwydd iddynt ar ôl iddynt raddio yr un mor bwysig yng nghyd-destun gwella’u profiad o weithio. Ni all llawer ohonynt ddod o hyd i swyddi perthnasol oherwydd bod ganddynt ormod o gymwysterau. Mae hynny’n fater arall y mae angen mynd i’r afael ag ef ar ran ein pobl ifanc.

I am also concerned about European funding. I tried to ask a question about this earlier, too. There is a company close to my constituency office that tries to help older people back into work. It helps them to re-skill, and gets them working opportunities. That company is now at a standstill. It is losing its staff and the

Yr wyf yn pryderu hefyd ynghylch arian Ewropeaidd. Ceisiais ofyn cwestiwn am hyn yn gynharach, hefyd. Mae cwmni ger swyddfa fy etholaeth sy’n ceisio helpu pobl hŷn i fynd yn ôl i’r gwaith. Mae’n eu helpu i ddysgu sgiliau newydd ac yn rhoi cyfleoedd i weithio iddynt. Erbyn hyn mae gweithgarwch

office is shutting, so not only will the staff be unable to help those people whom they have helped to date, but they are also losing their own positions. Apparently, that is because the Welsh Assembly Government is stubbornly refusing to distribute speedily the EU funding that should go through the Wales Council for Voluntary Action and others. I hope that we can get an answer on that vital question.

Closeness to business and employers is also an issue, and all the relevant players—the Federation of Small Businesses, the Confederation of British Industry, and the various chambers of commerce—are very concerned. I hope that John can tell us how he is addressing all of this, because past experiences of partnerships have not always been as successful as they should have been. I commend the Government on what it is trying to do, but, given the credit crunch, it is increasingly vital that we upskill as many of our people as possible, whether they are youngsters or older people. I look forward to not seeing the complacent, blasé and resting-on-laurels attitudes that some people have adopted during this debate. We still have a long way to go, particularly in relation to our global competitiveness.

**The Deputy Minister for Skills (John Griffiths):** On David Melding's points, when I refer to funding, I think that I will be addressing the points made by a number of Members. We are, as David said, very much about making better use of public funding, and everybody would be in favour of that.

We are putting new systems in place that will do that, through the transformation agenda, which will no doubt lead to mergers and economies of scale. The Measure will tackle duplication, which is long overdue. We have a variety of strategies and policies to ensure the badly needed better use of precious public resource. At the same time, we always strive to increase the funding available. However, on the current economic difficulties that several Members referred to, we are all aware

y cwmni hwnnw'n dod i ben. Mae'n colli ei staff ac mae'r swyddfa ar fin cau, felly yn ogystal â'r ffaith na fydd y staff yn gallu helpu'r bobl hynny y maent wedi eu helpu hyd yma, maent hefyd yn colli eu swyddi eu hunain. Mae'n debyg mai'r rheswm am hynny yw bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ystyfnig ac yn gwrthod dosbarthu arian Ewropeaidd, a ddylai fynd drwy Gyngor Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Cymru ac eraill, yn gyflym. Gobeithio y gallwn gael ateb i'r cwestiwn hollbwysig hwnnw.

Mae agosrwydd at fusnesau a chyflogwyr yn broblem hefyd, ac mae pawb sy'n ymwneud â hyn—Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach, Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain, a'r amrywiol siambrau masnach—yn bryderus iawn. Gobeithio y gall John ddweud wrthym sut y mae'n mynd i'r afael â hyn oll, oherwydd nid yw'r profiadau gyda phartneriaethau yn y gorffennol bob amser wedi bod mor llwyddiannus ag y dylent fod. Yr wyf yn canmol y Llywodraeth am yr hyn y mae'n ceisio'i wneud, ond, o gofio'r wasgfa gredyd, mae'n gynyddol bwysig inni uwchsgilio cynifer o'n pobl ag sy'n bosibl, boed y rheini'n bobl ifanc neu'n bobl hŷn. Edrychaf ymlaen at beidio â gweld yr agweddau hunanfodlon a didaro, a hwythau'n gorffwys ar eu bri, sydd wedi bod gan rai pobl yn ystod y ddadl hon. Mae cryn dasg o'n blaenau o hyd, yn arbennig o ran ein gallu i gystadlu'n fyd-eang.

**Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Sgiliau (John Griffiths):** O ran pwyntiau David Melding, pan gyfeiriai at gyllid, credaf y byddaf yn mynd i'r afael â'r pwyntiau a wnaethpwyd gan nifer o Aelodau. Yr ydym, fel y dywedodd David, yn gryf o blaid defnyddio arian cyhoeddus yn well, a byddai pawb o blaid hynny.

Yr ydym yn rhoi systemau newydd ar waith a fydd yn gwneud hynny, drwy'r agenda gweddnewid, a fydd yn ddi-os yn arwain at uno ac arbedion maint. Bydd y Mesur yn mynd i'r afael â dyblygu, ac mae'n hen bryd i hynny ddigwydd. Mae gennym amrywiaeth o strategaethau a pholisïau i sicrhau bod adnoddau cyhoeddus gwerthfawr yn cael eu defnyddio'n well, rhywbeth y mae ei angen yn ddybryd. Ar yr un pryd, ceisiwn gynyddu'r cyllid sydd ar gael bob amser.

that we are in difficult circumstances and that they are likely to continue for some time.

Several Members also mentioned the need to be ambitious, and to strive for a level 3 benchmark. Our view has been clearly stated before, and we need to be flexible. We have a big basic skills problem in Wales, which we need to tackle ever more effectively, but we also aspire to higher level qualifications, including level 4 apprenticeships. We are tasking the Wales Employment and Skills Board with the work on that agenda, to consider future targets, and to advise us on the most appropriate levels to prioritise. I very much look forward to receiving the board's advice on those matters.

**David Melding:** It would help us with our scrutiny if we were told why the Welsh Assembly Government disagrees with Lord Leitch, who said in his review that the immediate challenge is low-level skills. That is where Britain has a particular problem by any international standard, and, by 2020, we should get to an intermediate benchmark for level 3 skills.

**John Griffiths:** As an Assembly Government, we need to deal with the distinctive position in Wales. Leitch's work was UK wide, and, understandably, it paid considerable attention to the south east of England, given the economic importance of that region. We have to look at our particular circumstances in Wales, which is why the Wales Employment and Skills Board is well placed to assist us with that task.

I welcome what David Melding said about entrepreneurship in the curriculum and engagement with business. It is true to say that we have made a deal of progress on that front, but there is much yet to do. Kirsty raised several issues, some of which I have already dealt with. I agree with Kirsty that economic inactivity is a key concern for us, and, indeed, with the other priorities that she

Fodd bynnag, o ran yr anawsterau economaidd presennol y cyfeiriodd amryw o Aelodau atynt, yr ydym oll yn ymwybodol ein bod mewn amgylchiadau anodd a'u bod yn debygol o barhau am gryn amser.

Soniodd amryw o Aelodau hefyd am yr angen i fod yn uchelgeisiol, ac anelu at feincnod lefel 3. Mae ein barn wedi'i datgan yn glir o'r blaen, ac mae angen inni fod yn hyblyg. Mae gennym broblem gyda sgiliau sylfaenol yng Nghymru, ac mae angen inni fynd i'r afael â hynny'n fwy effeithiol, ond yr ydym yn anelu hefyd at gymwysterau lefel uwch, gan gynnwys prentisiaethau lefel 4. Yr ydym wedi gofyn i Fwrdd Cyflogaeth a Sgiliau Cymru wneud y gwaith ar yr agenda honno, i ystyried targedau ar gyfer y dyfodol, ac i roi cyngor inni ynghylch y lefelau mwyaf priodol i'w blaenoriaethu. Edrychaf ymlaen yn fawr iawn at gael cyngor y bwrdd ar y materion hynny.

**David Melding:** Byddai o gymorth inni gyda'r broses graffu pe dywedid wrthym pam y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn anghytuno â'r Arglwydd Leitch, a ddywedodd yn ei adolygiad mai'r her ar hyn o bryd yw sgiliau lefel is. Dyna'r maes lle y mae gan Brydain broblem benodol yn ôl unrhyw safon ryngwladol, ac, erbyn 2020, dylem gyrraedd meincnod canolradd ar gyfer sgiliau lefel 3.

**John Griffiths:** Fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, mae angen inni ymdrin â'r sefyllfa unigryw yng Nghymru. Yr oedd gwaith Leitch yn ymwneud â'r DU gyfan, ac, yn ddealladwy, rhoddodd lawer o sylw i ddeddwyrain Lloegr, o gofio pwysigrwydd economaidd y rhanbarth hwnnw. Rhaid inni edrych ar ein hamgylchiadau penodol ni yng Nghymru, a dyna pam mae Bwrdd Cyflogaeth a Sgiliau Cymru mewn sefyllfa dda i'n cynorthwyo gyda'r gorchwyl hwnnw.

Yr wyf yn croesawu'r hyn a ddywedodd David Melding am entrepreneuriaeth yn y cwricwlwm ac ymgysylltu â busnesau. Mae'n wir dweud ein bod wedi gwneud llawer iawn o gynnydd yn hynny o beth, ond mae llawer ar ôl i'w wneud. Cododd Kirsty amryw o faterion, ac yr wyf eisoes wedi ymdrin â rhai ohonynt. Yr wyf yn cytuno â Kirsty fod anweithgarwch economaidd yn bryder

mentioned. On some of the specific points, transformation policy is vital in driving greater efficiencies, and having a much more fit-for-purpose system, as is the Measure. We also expect FE colleges to lever in other sources of funding, and there is much progress to be made on that front.

**Kirsty Williams:** Will you confirm whether one source of funding that FE colleges should look to is an increase in fees for the courses that they run? I know that you are due to go out to consultation on the fee regime for FE, but will you guarantee that you will not use that fee regime to make up the shortfall in your Government's spending on FE, thereby driving out people who could enjoy those courses?

**John Griffiths:** In no way are we about driving out people who could benefit from provision in Wales. What the contributions policy will seek to do is lever in more funding when that is more appropriate, namely when there is a more direct return to employers and individuals, perhaps by the acquisition of bespoke skills for companies, or higher level, marketable skills for individuals, rather than more basic education and training.

On Kirsty's question about the sector priority fund, we are putting in Welsh Assembly Government funding. We are looking at having a pilot scheme, funded jointly by further education institutions, the Welsh Assembly Government, and business, and possibly match-funded by European funds. Work is being done on that front.

3.40 p.m.

Adult community learning fits in with 'Skills That Work for Wales' and we believe that there is a close correlation. We want to get older people back into work, and the strategy for older people in Wales as well as the policies of the Department for Work and Pensions together with its current Green Paper are very much a part of that agenda.

allweddol inni, ac, yn wir, â'r blaenoriaethau eraill y soniodd amdanynt. O ran rhai o'r pwyntiau penodol, mae polisi gweddnewid yn hollbwysig o ran sicrhau mwy o arbedion effeithlonrwydd, a chael system sy'n llawer mwy addas i'r diben, ac felly hefyd y Mesur. Yr ydym hefyd yn disgwyl i golegau addysg bellach ddenu arian o ffynonellau ariannu eraill, ac mae llawer o gynnydd i'w wneud yn hynny o beth.

**Kirsty Williams:** A gadarnhewch mai un ffynhonnell ariannu y dylai colegau addysg bellach ei hystyried yw codi ffioedd ar gyfer y cyrsiau a gynigir ganddynt? Gwn eich bod ar fin cynnal ymgynghoriad ar y gyfundrefn ffioedd ar gyfer addysg bellach, ond a roddwch sicrwydd na ddefnyddiwch y gyfundrefn ffioedd honno i dalu am y diffyg yng ngwariant eich Llywodraeth ar addysg bellach, gan beri nad yw'r rhai a allai fwynhau'r cyrsiau hynny'n gallu eu dilyn?

**John Griffiths:** Nid ydym yn bwriadu gwneud hynny i'r bobl a allai elwa o'r ddarpariaeth yng Nghymru o gwbl. Nod y polisi cyfraniadau fydd denu mwy o gyllid pan fydd hynny'n fwy priodol, hynny yw pan fydd mwy o fudd uniongyrchol i gyflogwyr ac unigolion, efallai drwy gael sgiliau penodol i gwmnïau, neu sgiliau ar lefel uwch y gellir eu marchnata i unigolion, yn hytrach nag addysg a hyfforddiant mwy sylfaenol.

O ran cwestiwn Kirsty ynghylch y gronfa blaenoriaethau sector, yr ydym yn defnyddio arian Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Yr ydym yn ystyried cynnal cynllun peilot, wedi ei ariannu ar y cyd gan sefydliadau addysg uwch, Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, a busnesau, ac arian cyfatebol o gronfeydd Ewropeaidd o bosibl. Mae gwaith yn cael ei wneud ar hynny.

Mae dysgu oedolion yn y gymuned yn cydfynd â 'Sgiliau sy'n Gweithio i Gymru' a chredwn fod cydberthynas glòs. Yr ydym am i bobl hŷn fynd yn ôl i weithio, ac mae'r strategaeth ar gyfer pobl hŷn yng Nghymru yn ogystal â pholisïau'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau ynghyd â'i Phapur Gwyrdd presennol yn rhan fawr o'r agenda honno.

English for speakers of other languages is part of our contribution to the policy, and we want to ensure that provision is of top quality. In no way do we intend to arrive at a situation where those who are vulnerable do not receive the provision that they need. Kirsty made a good point about the progress being made in the health service in Wales by using the highly skilled economic migrants and asylum seekers. We will look at how we can widen that approach to include other sectors.

Lesley is right to say that Deeside College and Yale College, Wrexham are excellent providers. They are a good example in Wales, and we are always keen to point that out and recognise the excellence of their provision. It is vital that we listen to the employer voice, as I mentioned earlier. We intend to drive that forward.

Andrew, it is vital that we train through economic difficulties. I am glad that you made that point at this time, because history shows that employers who take that enlightened view now prosper some way down the road. The Department for Work and Pensions is having a big push on assisting people on incapacity benefit back to work, through its Green Paper, and there is a range of activities around that. We want to integrate our skills provision with such employment policies so that we can benefit those people. The third sector also has a strong role to play, which will increase.

On Janet Ryder's point, a strong element of co-operation is being driven by the Measure, which will lead to the sort of collaboration that we want to see, when you look at it in the context of funding.

A Welsh-language development unit is driving our Welsh-medium education policies at the moment, which all have to sit within 'Iaith Pawb'. I have made this point many times: until we get to where we want to be—a bilingual nation—we will always have difficulties providing the kind of access to public services through the medium of Welsh that we want to see. There is much work to

Mae Saesneg ar gyfer siaradwyr ieithoedd eraill yn rhan o'n cyfraniad i'r polisi, ac yr ydym am sicrhau bod y ddarpariaeth o'r radd flaenaf. Nid yw'n fwriad gennym o gwbl gyrraedd sefyllfa lle nad yw'r rhai sy'n agored i niwed yn cael y ddarpariaeth y mae ei hangen arnynt. Gwnaeth Kirsty bwynt da ynghylch y cynnydd a wneir yn y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru drwy ddefnyddio'r mewnfudwyr a'r ceiswyr lloches hyfedr. Edrychwn ar sut y gallwn ehangu hynny i gynnwys sectorau eraill.

Mae Lesley'n gywir wrth ddweud bod Coleg Glannau Dyfrdwy a Choleg Iâl, Wrecsam, yn ddarparwyr rhagorol. Maent yn esiampl dda yng Nghymru, ac yr ydym bob amser yn awyddus i dynnu sylw at hynny a chydabod rhagoriaeth eu darpariaeth. Mae'n hanfodol inni wrando ar lais y cyflogwr, fel y soniais yn gynharach. Bwriadwn ddatblygu hynny.

Andrew, mae'n hanfodol inni hyfforddi yn ystod anawsterau economaidd. Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi gwneud y pwynt hwnnw ar yr adeg hon, oherwydd dengys hanes fod cyflogwyr sy'n coleddu'r farn oleuedig honno yn awr yn ffynnu yn ddiweddarach. Mae gan yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau ymgyrch i gynorthwyo pobl sy'n cael budd-dal analluogrwydd i ddychwelyd i'r gwaith, drwy ei Phapur Gwyrdd, ac mae ystod o weithgareddau'n gysylltiedig â hynny. Yr ydym am integreiddio ein darpariaeth sgiliau gyda pholisïau cyflogaeth o'r fath er mwyn i'r bobl hynny allu elwa. Mae gan y trydydd sector rôl flaenllaw i'w chwarae hefyd, a fydd yn cynyddu.

O ran pwynt Janet Ryder, mae elfen gref o gydweithio yn y Mesur, a bydd yn arwain at y math o gydweithio yr ydym am ei weld, pan edrychwch arno yng nghyd-destun ariannu.

Mae uned datblygu'r iaith Gymraeg yn llywio ein polisïau addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg ar hyn o bryd, y mae'n rhaid i bob un ohonynt gysylltu ag 'Iaith Pawb'. Yr wyf wedi gwneud y pwynt hwn droeon: hyd nes cyrhaeddwn y nod—cenedl ddwyieithog—byddwn bob amser yn cael anawsterau o ran darparu'r math o fynediad at wasanaethau cyhoeddus drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yr



do in that regard, but we have provided funding and will continue to do so to expand the provision of Welsh-medium education and training. The 14-19 learning networks are also taking forward policies on that front.

Trish, I do not think it true to say that jobs are rarer than gold in the hills of Blaenau Gwent, but I recognise that there are considerable problems with economic inactivity in the area. An awful lot of Welsh Assembly Government investment is going into Blaenau Gwent. I was in Ebbw Vale just the other week, looking around the local FE college there as well as the site for the new lifelong learning centre, hospital, housing and much else. A tremendous amount is being invested by the Welsh Assembly Government and we have to drive that forward. Whenever you prioritise one thing, whatever you did not prioritise can be given as an example of something that did not get attention. However, we look at that constantly and review the situation, and I can say that manufacturing remains at the top of this Government's overall list of priorities. I will look into the issue of the letter, Trish. I cannot recall having seen it, so I will make inquiries and get back to you as quickly as possible.

Huw, thank you for welcoming our overall strategy and aims, and for recognising the progress made. As you rightly say, in many respects, the Valleys represent the acid test for all of our policies and strategies and I accept that.

On Genesis II and early years intervention, all of the policies and strategies that you mentioned are extremely important in achieving the aims set out in 'Skills That Work for Wales'. The challenge is to implement them fully and properly.

The strategy relating to those who are not in employment, education or training is about early identification. We have yet to finalise that policy and action plan, but we hope that it will identify those boys who are disengaging at an early age and address why that is. As part of that, the greater vocational

ydym oll am ei weld. Mae llawer o waith i'w wneud yn hynny o beth, ond yr ydym wedi darparu cyllid i ehangu'r ddarpariaeth addysg a hyfforddiant cyfrwng Cymraeg a byddwn yn parhau i wneud hynny. Mae'r rhwydweithiau dysgu 14-19 hefyd yn datblygu polisiau yng nghyswllt hynny.

Trish, ni chredaf ei bod yn wir dweud bod swyddi'n brinnach nag aur ym mryniau Blaenau Gwent, ond yr wyf yn cydnabod bod problemau mawr gydag anweithgarwch economaidd yn yr ardal. Mae llawer iawn o arian Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cael ei fuddsoddi ym Mlaenau Gwent. Yr oeddwn yng Nglynebwy yr wythnos o'r blaen, yn edrych o amgylch y coleg addysg bellach lleol yno yn ogystal â'r safle ar gyfer y ganolfan dysgu gydol oes newydd, yr ysbyty, tai a llawer mwy. Mae swm aruthrol o arian yn cael ei fuddsoddi gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a rhaid inni barhau â hynny. Pan roddwch flaenoriaeth i un peth, gellir defnyddio'r hyn na roesoch flaenoriaeth iddo fel enghraifft o rywbeth na chafodd sylw. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym edrych yn barhaus ar hynny ac yn adolygu'r sefyllfa, a gallaf ddweud bod gweithgynhyrchu yn parhau ar ben rhestr o flaenoriaethau cyffredinol y Llywodraeth hon. Edrychaf ar y mater yn ymwneud â'r llythyr, Trish. Ni chofiaf ei weld, felly gwnaf ymholiadau a chysylltaf â chi cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl.

Huw, diolch ichi am groesawu ein strategaeth a'n hamcanion cyffredinol, ac am gydnabod y cynnydd a wnaethpwyd. Fel y dywedwch, a hynny'n gywir, ar sawl ystyr, y Cymoedd yw'r gwir brawf ar gyfer ein holl bolisiau a'n strategaethau ac yr wyf yn derbyn hynny.

O ran Genesis II ac ymyriad y blynyddoedd cynnar, mae'r holl bolisiau a'r strategaethau y soniasoch amdanynt yn bwysig iawn o ran cyflawni'r amcanion a amlinellir yn 'Sgiliau sy'n Gweithio i Gymru'. Yr her yw eu rhoi ar waith yn llawn ac yn iawn.

Mae a wnelo'r strategaeth sy'n ymwneud â'r rhai nad ydynt mewn cyflogaeth, addysg na hyfforddiant â chanfod pobl yn gynnar. Nid yw'r polisi a'r cynllun gweithredu hwnnw ar ei ffurf derfynol eto, ond gobeithiwn y bydd yn canfod y bechgyn hynny sy'n ymddieithrio'n ifanc ac yn ystyried pam y

offer in the Measure will be important in widening choice, giving options that were not there before, to boys in particular. Hopefully, we will then get that engagement.

I recognise the strong interest that you have always taken in Careers Ladder Wales. It is going to be very much about in-work support. We have the workforce development programme in place to assist in upskilling the existing workforce. The Wales union learning fund schemes are very important; the union learning representatives are doing a great job. I am glad that you have recognised that.

Finally, making Merthyr a university town, as you say, will be hugely beneficial to Merthyr, as will establishing the lifelong learning campus. We have invested substantially in that, Huw, in terms of funding the studies, pathfinder projects, and business cases. We now hope that the business case that is currently being evaluated will be dealt with by December. There will be ongoing processes from that point. We are committed to achieving all of that as quickly as we possibly can.

Llywydd, I think that I have probably exceeded the time that I should have taken. Thank you for your indulgence. 'Skills That Work for Wales' and everything around it, will lead to the much better use of precious public resource that we are all committed to.

**Y Llywydd:** Y cynnig yw bod gwelliant 1 yn cael ei dderbyn. A oes gwrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod. Felly, gohiriwn y bleidlais tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisiau tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.  
Votes deferred until voting time.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd (Rosemary Butler) i'r Gadair am 3.46 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer (Rosemary Butler) took the Chair at 3.46 p.m.*

maent yn ymddieithrio. Fel rhan o hynny, bydd y ddarpariaeth alwedigaethol fwy yn y Mesur yn bwysig o ran ehangu dewis, gan roi opsiynau nad oeddent yno o'r blaen, i fechgyn yn arbennig. Gobeithio y cawn yr ymgysylltu hwnnw wedyn.

Yr wyf yn cydnabod y diddordeb cryf yr ydych bob amser wedi'i ddangos yn Grisïau Gyrfa Cymru. Mae'n mynd i ddibynnu llawer ar gefnogaeth yn y gwaith. Mae rhaglen datblygu'r gweithlu ar waith gennym i helpu i uwchsgilio'r gweithlu presennol. Mae cynlluniau cronfa ddysgu undebau Cymru'n bwysig iawn; mae cynrychiolwyr dysgu'r undebau'n gwneud gwaith gwych. Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi cydnabod hynny.

Yn olaf, bydd gwneud Merthyr yn dref brifysgol, fel y dywedwch, o fudd enfawr i Ferthyr, ynghyd â sefydlu'r campws dysgu gydol oes. Yr ydym wedi buddsoddi'n sylweddol yn hynny, Huw, o ran ariannu'r astudiaethau, y prosiectau braenaru, a'r achosion busnes. Ein gobaith yn awr yw y caiff yr achos busnes sy'n cael ei werthuso ar hyn o bryd ei drafod erbyn mis Rhagfyr. Bydd prosesau parhaus o hynny ymlaen. Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i gyflawni hynny i gyd cyn gyflymed ag y gallwn.

Lywydd, mae'n debyg fy mod wedi cymryd mwy o amser nag a ddylaswn. Diolch am eich goddefgarwch. Bydd 'Sgiliau sy'n Gweithio i Gymru' a phopeth sy'n gysylltiedig â hynny, yn arwain at ddefnyddio adnoddau cyhoeddus gwerthfawr yn well o lawer, rhywbeth yr ydym i gyd wedi ymrwymo iddo.

**The Presiding Officer:** The proposal is that amendment 1 be agreed. Is there any objection? I see that there is. Therefore, the vote will be deferred until voting time.

## Yr Amgylchedd Hanesyddol The Historic Environment

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1, 2 and 3 in the name of Kirsty Williams and amendments 4, 5 and 6 in the name of William Graham.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2 a 3 yn enw Kirsty Williams a gwelliannau 4, 5 a 6 yn enw William Graham.

**Y Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth (Alun Ffred Jones):** Cynigiau fod

**The Minister for Heritage (Alun Ffred Jones):** I propose that

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*yn croesawu ymrwymiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gefnogi ymwneud cymunedau â'u hamgylchedd hanesyddol, gan gynnwys cyhoeddi bron £1.5 miliwn o fuddsoddiad mewn prosiectau cadwraeth lleol. (NDM4013)*

*welcomes the Welsh Assembly Government's commitment to supporting communities' engagement with their historic environment, including the announcement of nearly £1.5 million investment in local conservation projects. (NDM4013)*

Mae'n bleser gennyf gyflwyno'r cynnig hwn ger eich bron. Gall pawb ohonom yn y Siambr heddiw, ac, yn bwysicach, unigolion a chymunedau ar hyd a lled Cymru, uno y tu ôl i'r cynnig hwn. Ein hamcan ni fel Llywodraeth yw sicrhau bod ein treftadaeth amgylcheddol, sy'n cynnwys tirwedd ac adeiladau, yn cael ei gwarchod, a bod pobl Cymru a thu hwnt yn cael y cyfle i'w mwynhau. Yr ydym am i bobl ymweld â'n henebion er mwyn deall stori ein cenedl yn well ac i ymfalchïo yn y stori honno. Mae hyn yn arbennig o bwysig o ran y ffordd yr ydym ni, pobl Cymru, yn gweld ein hunain. Gall hefyd fod o gymorth wrth adfywio cymunedau, ac mae'n rhan bwysig o'n diwydiant twristiaeth. Mae'n cyfoethogi profiad ymwelwyr a'r cyhoedd yn gyffredinol.

It is a pleasure to propose this motion. Every one of us in the Chamber today—and, more importantly, individuals and communities throughout Wales—can unite behind this motion. Our aim as a Government is to ensure that our environmental heritage, which includes landscape and buildings, is protected, and that the people of Wales and beyond have the opportunity to enjoy it. We want people to visit our monuments in order to understand the story of our nation better and to take pride in that story. This is particularly important in terms of how we, the people of Wales, view ourselves. It can also be of assistance in regenerating communities and it is an important part of our tourism industry. It enriches visitor experience and the experience of the public in general.

Gallaf ddweud yn hyderus ein bod wedi ffarwelio â'r dyddiau pan oedd gwleidydd amlwg o Gymru yn gallu dweud ar goedd nad oedd y fath beth yn bod â hanes Cymru. Yr wyf yn derbyn nad un dehongliad o hanes sydd; mae mwy nag un stori yn hanes amryliw Cymru. Ni ellir adrodd hanes cestyll Edward, sef cestyll Caernarfon, Harlech, Conwy, Rhuddlan a Biwmares, heb adrodd stori tywysogion Gwynedd a rhan hanes cestyll fel Dolbadarn a Dolwyddelan yn y stori honno. Wedi'r cwbl, oni bai am y cestyll hynny a'r hyn a ddigwyddai yno, ni fyddai Edward wedi mynd ati i godi ei gestyll

I can say with confidence that we have said goodbye to the days when a prominent politician from Wales could say publicly that there was no such thing as Welsh history. I accept that there is not just one interpretation of history; there is more than one story in the multifaceted history of Wales. The story of Edward's castles, namely those of Caernarfon, Harlech, Conwy, Rhuddlan and Beaumaris, cannot be told without the story of the princes of Gwynedd and the role of castles such as those of Dolbadarn and Dolwyddelan in that story being told. After all, if it were not for those castles and what

ei hun. Drwy'r adeiladau hanesyddol hyn, mae angen adrodd stori'r bobl. Yn hynny o beth, mae'n werth ystyried pennod gyntaf cyfrol feistrolgar yr hanesydd diweddar Rees Davies ar Owain Glyndŵr. Yn dilyn un o'i arwyr ei hun, yr hanesydd cymdeithasol o Ffrainc, Marc Bloch, mae Rees Davies yn darlunio bywyd gwerin gwlad Cymru fel cefndir a chyd-destun i wrthryfel Glyndŵr. Yr wyf yn credu mai felly y dylem ninnau ddehongli ein treftadaeth adeiledig ac adrodd y straeon hyn am ein cefndir fel Cymry.

went on there, Edward would not have erected his own castles. Through these historic buildings, we need to tell the story of our people. In that respect, it is worth considering the first chapter of the excellent volume on Owain Glyndŵr by the late historian Rees Davies. Following one of his own heroes, the French social historian, Marc Bloch, Rees Davies depicts the life of the people of Wales as a background and context to the Glyndŵr uprising. I believe that that is how we should interpret our built heritage and tell these stories about our background as Welsh people.

Cyfeiriaf at rai o'r camau sydd wedi'u cymryd i roi'r polisïau hyn ar waith. Fis yn ôl, cyflwynwyd mynediad am ddim i holl safleoedd Cadw i bensynwyr ac i blant a phobl ifanc dan 16. Mae'r arwyddion cynnar yn galonogol; yr ydym wedi cael 500 cais am docynnau rhad eisoes.

I will refer to some of the steps that have been taken to implement these policies. A month ago, free entry to all Cadw sites was introduced for pensioners and for children and young people under 16. The early signs are encouraging; we have already received 500 applications for free tickets.

3.50 p.m.

Mae cais am arian cydgyfeirio i ddatblygu safleoedd amrywiol drwy Gymru, gyda rhai ohonynt mewn perchenogaeth breifat ac eraill yn eiddo i'r trydydd sector. Wrth ddatblygu rhai o'r safleoedd hyn, yr ydym yn gobeithio y gallwn eu diogelu at y dyfodol a sicrhau mynediad i'r cyhoedd iddynt. Dylent hefyd fod yn rhan o adfywio cymdeithasol a chymunedol.

There is a bid for convergence funding to develop various sites across Wales, some of which are in private ownership and others of which are in the hands of the third sector. In developing some of these sites, we hope that we can safeguard them for the future and ensure access to them for the public. They should also be part of social and community regeneration.

Mae CyMAL a'i bartneriaid, yr amgueddfa genedlaethol a'r llyfrgell genedlaethol, yn datblygu Casgliad y Bobl a fydd yn galluogi mynediad rhyngwryd i'r cyfoeth treftadol sydd yn ein meddiant. Mae esiamplau o'r cyfoeth hwn yn bodoli mewn pob math o sefydliadau ar hyd a lled Cymru. Mae esiamplau hefyd gan unigolion a grwpiau sydd wedi dod ynghyd i greu casgliadau lleol, a bydd y rhai hynny hefyd ar gael fel rhan o Casgliad y Bobl. Mae hyn yn ddatblygiad arbennig o gyffrous a, maes o law, byddwn yn gallu cysylltu'r holl wybodaeth sydd gennym o'r casgliadau unigol, o gasgliadau'r amgueddfa genedlaethol a'r llyfrgell genedlaethol, ac o gasgliadau eraill.

CyMAL and its partners, the national museum and the national library, are developing The People's Collection, which will ensure internet access to the wealth of heritage that we have. Examples of this wealth exist in all sorts of institutions throughout Wales. There are also examples belonging to individuals and groups that have come together to create local collections, and those will also be available as part of The People's Collection. This is a very exciting development and, in time, we will be able to link all of the information that we have available from these individual collections, from the collections of the national museum and the national library, and from other collections.

Bydd datganiad strategol ar yr amgylchedd hanesyddol y flwyddyn nesaf, a byddwn yn

There will be a strategic statement on the historic environment next year, and we will

cynnal trafodaeth ar y cynlluniau a'r syniadau hyn mewn cynhadledd treftadaeth y mis yma.

Yr wyf hefyd wedi cyhoeddi grantiau yn ddiweddar gwerth £1.5 miliwn i warchod adeiladau hanesyddol ym mhob rhan o Gymru. Ar 2 Medi, lanswyd rhaglen yr Olympiad Diwylliannol. Bydd y rhaglen honno yn cael ei gweithredu mewn partneriaeth gan Cadw, cyngor y celfyddydau ac wyth cymuned leol o ardaloedd ar hyd a lled y wlad. Bydd yn rhaglen gyffrous am y pedair blynedd nesaf, a bydd yn sicr o roi'r cyfle i bobl ifanc o wahanol gymunedau, a bydd amryw ohonynt yn gymunedau difreintiedig, i fod yn rhan o berfformiadau fydd, heb os, yn arloesol, yn gyffrous, ac yn gofiadwy. Mae nifer o'r digwyddiadau hyn yn digwydd o fewn muriau rhai o'n hadeiladau hanesyddol, a bydd hynny, gobeithio, yn gwneud yr adeiladau hyn yn fwy perthnasol i genhedlaeth newydd.

Mae swyddogion Croeso Cymru'n arwain ar greu cynllun gweithredu twristiaeth ddiwylliannol, fydd yn cynnwys, wrth gwrs, ein treftadaeth adeiledig hanesyddol.

Mae hynny'n dangos cyfoeth y gweithgaredd sy'n digwydd o fewn yr adran ac mewn partneriaeth â mudiadau a chyrrff y tu allan i reolaeth uniongyrchol y Llywodraeth a chyda phartneriaid yn y trydydd sector a phobl ar lawr gwlad. Drwy gyfuno'r sefydliadau hyn o dan un weledigaeth, credaf fod gennym gyfle i gadarnhau pwysigrwydd ein treftadaeth ddiwylliannol ym meddyliau ein pobl ein hunain, a thrwy wneud hynny, i roi profiad i ymwelwyr a fydd yn cyfoethogi eu harhosiad yng Nghymru, gan obeithio eu denu yn ôl.

Turning to the six amendments, three of which are in the name of Kirsty Williams on behalf of the Welsh Liberal Democrats. I am sorry to say that I suggest opposing them. The first amendment proposes that the National Assembly 'notes with concern' that 10 per cent of Wales's listed buildings are at risk. Well, I am doing more than noting listed buildings at risk. The grants that I recently announced demonstrate that specific action to help historic building repair and restoration, and other actions, are in hand.

hold a discussion on these plans and ideas at a heritage conference this month.

I have also recently announced grants worth £1.5 million to protect historic buildings in all parts of Wales. On 2 September, the Cultural Olympiad programme was launched. That programme will be implemented in partnership by Cadw, the arts council, and eight local communities from throughout Wales. It will be an exciting programme for the next four years, and it will certainly give young people from different communities, some of which will be deprived communities, the opportunity to become part of performances that will no doubt be innovative, exciting and memorable. Several of these events are to be staged within the walls of some of our historic buildings, and that will, I hope, make these buildings more relevant to a new generation.

Visit Wales officials are leading on creating a cultural tourism action plan, which will include, of course, our historic built heritage.

That demonstrates the wealth of activity that is taking place within the department and in partnership with organisations and bodies outside the direct control of the Government and with partners in the third sector and people at grass-roots level. By combining these institutions under one vision, I believe that we have an opportunity to confirm the importance of our cultural heritage in the minds of our own people and, in so doing, to give visitors an experience that will enrich their stay in Wales and will hopefully attract them back.

A throi at y chwe gwelliant, tri ohonynt yn enw Kirsty Williams ar ran Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf ddweud fy mod yn awgrymu eu gwrthwynebu. Mae'r gwelliant cyntaf yn cynnig bod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn 'nodi â phryder' fod 10 y cant o adeiladau rhestredig Cymru mewn perygl. Wel, yr wyf yn gwneud mwy na nodi adeiladau rhestredig sydd mewn perygl. Mae'r grantiau a gyhoeddais yn ddiweddar yn dangos bod camau penodol i helpu i atgyweirio ac adfer adeiladau hanesyddol, a chamau eraill, ar y

	gweill.
Amendment 2	Mae gwelliant 2
‘calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to develop a coherent marketing strategy to promote the historic environment to tourists.’	‘yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ddatblygu strategaeth farchnata gydlynol i hyrwyddo’r amgylchedd hanesyddol i dwristiaid.’
As I said, the steering group of key cultural stakeholders is preparing a two-year costed action plan to develop cultural tourism in Wales. Therefore the amendment is unnecessary.	Fel y dywedais, mae’r grŵp llywio o randdeiliaid diwylliannol allweddol yn paratoi cynllun gweithredu wedi’i gostio dros ddwy flynedd i ddatblygu twristiaeth ddiwylliannol yng Nghymru. Felly mae’r gwelliant yn ddiangen.
Amendment 3:	Mae gwelliant 3
‘calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure that all historic sites are fully accessible by public transport.’	‘yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau bod modd cyrraedd pob safle hanesyddol gyda thrafnidiaeth gyhoeddus.’
That is a fine aspiration, and I have no problem with it. However, it is slightly unrealistic, rather like the Welsh Liberal Democrats themselves. [ <i>Laughter.</i> ] Sorry about that; I could not resist it. It calls on the Government to make all historic sites in Wales accessible by public transport. What about Bardsey island? Do you seriously think that we should run a daily water bus to Bardsley island from Porth Meudwy, and a Land Rover to take people down to Porth Meudwy? As an aspiration, it is fine, but as a proposal for action, we need to be slightly more realistic.	Mae hynny’n ddyhead clodwiw, ac nid yw’n peri problem imi. Fodd bynnag, mae ychydig yn afrealistig, yr un fath â Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru eu hunain braidd. [ <i>Chwerthin.</i> ] Mae’n ddrwg gennyf am hynny; ni allwn beidio. Mae’n galw ar y Llywodraeth i sicrhau bod modd cyrraedd pob safle hanesyddol yng Nghymru gyda thrafnidiaeth gyhoeddus. Beth am Ynys Enlli? A ydych o ddifrif yn meddwl y dylem redeg bws dŵr dyddiol i Ynys Enlli o Borth Meudwy, a Land Rover i fynd â phobl i lawr i Borth Meudwy? Fel dyhead, mae’n wych, ond fel cynnig ar gyfer gweithredu, mae angen inni fod ychydig yn fwy realistig.
To turn to the three amendments in the name of William Graham, amendment 4	Trof at y tri gwelliant yn enw William Graham. Mae gwelliant 4
‘calls on the Minister for Heritage to publish an annual report’.	‘yn galw ar y Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth i gyhoeddi adroddiad blynyddol’.
However, an annual report on the state of the historic environment in Wales has been published for the last two years, and another report is due next spring, so that amendment is unnecessary.	Fodd bynnag, mae adroddiad blynyddol ar gyflwr yr amgylchedd hanesyddol yng Nghymru wedi’i gyhoeddi ers dwy flynedd bellach, a chyhoeddir un arall y gwanwyn nesaf, felly mae’r gwelliant hwnnw’n ddiangen.
Amendment 5	Mae gwelliant 5
‘calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to engage in meaningful consultation with local	‘yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gynnal ymgynghoriad ystyrlon â grwpiau

conservation groups in Wales.’

Again, this amendment is unnecessary as we are in regular consultation with a wide range of national and local groups, and we are always willing to have discussions with new groups, as I know full well from my dealings as a local Assembly Member in Caernarfon.

#### Amendment 6

‘calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to enlarge the number of statutory consultees regarding conservation projects, for example, to include the Welsh Historic Gardens Trust.’

Again, the amendment is unnecessary. The Government has already given a commitment to include the Welsh Historic Gardens Trust as one of the amenity groups to be consulted by local authorities on proposed developments potentially affecting historic parks and gardens.

I commend the motion to Members, and I look forward to their comments.

**Peter Black:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 1: after ‘conservation projects’, insert:

*but notes with concern that more than 10 per cent of listed buildings in Wales are at risk and a further 17 per cent are vulnerable.*

Amendment 2: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to develop a coherent marketing strategy to promote the historic environment to tourists.*

Amendment 3: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure that all historic sites are fully accessible by public transport.*

Judging by Alun Ffred’s response to the

cadwraeth lleol yng Nghymru.’

Eto, mae’r gwelliant hwn yn ddiangen gan ein bod yn ymgynghori’n rheolaidd ag ystod eang o grwpiau cenedlaethol a lleol, ac yr ydym bob amser yn barod i gynnal trafodaethau â grwpiau newydd, fel y gwn yn burion yn sgîl fy ngwaith fel Aelod Cynulliad lleol yng Nghaernarfon.

#### Mae gwelliant 6

‘yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gynyddu nifer yr ymgynghoreion statudol o ran prosiectau cadwraeth, er enghraifft, i gynnwys Ymddiriedolaeth Gerddi Hanesyddol Cymru.’

Eto, mae’r gwelliant yn ddiangen. Mae’r Llywodraeth eisoes wedi rhoi ymrwymiad i gynnwys Ymddiriedolaeth Gerddi Hanesyddol Cymru fel un o’r grwpiau amwynder y dylai awdurdodau lleol ymgynghori â hwy ynghylch datblygiadau arfaethedig a allai effeithio ar barciau a gerddi hanesyddol.

Cymeradwyaf y cynnig i’r Aelodau, ac edrychaf ymlaen at eu sylwadau.

**Peter Black:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 1: ar ôl ‘prosiectau cadwraeth lleol’, rhoi

*ond yn nodi â phryder bod dros 10 y cant o adeiladau rhestredig yng Nghymru mewn perygl a bod 17 y cant arall yn fregus.*

Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ddatblygu strategaeth farchnata gydlynol i hyrwyddo’r amgylchedd hanesyddol i dwristiaid.*

Gwelliant 3: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau bod modd cyrraedd pob safle hanesyddol gyda thrafnidiaeth ghoeddus.*

A barnu yn ôl ymateb Alun Ffred i’r

amendments, he has consigned his sense of humour to the historic environment. That was not an adequate response to the amendments that we proposed.

The purpose of proposing these amendments is twofold. First, we believe that we need to better protect our historic monuments and in doing so, ensure that the grants and support that is available to the various communities and other bodies to deal with that are coherent, easy to understand and simple to access. Secondly, although we value the historic environment in which we live in terms of landscape and monuments, we do not feel that, as a country, we sell those particularly well to the outside world and encourage visitors to come in to see the huge history of which we are proud that we have on show and which is available to help people to learn about the history of Wales. For that matter, I do not think that we sell it that well to people living in Wales either, and access is an important part of that.

Alun Ffred's comments about Bardsey island and other monuments are taken, but the principle is that people who wish to visit these monuments and experience and enjoy the landscape and our historic environment should be able to get into the general vicinity of them, and public transport is a key part of that.

4.00 p.m.

There are affordability issues in this regard, particularly in terms of people who rely on a pension and have a small income, but who, nevertheless, enjoy going out and experiencing what is on offer in the countryside. Whether they are going for a walk along a historic canal or in the hills, they have to get there in the first place. It is important that, as part of the strategy on the historic environment, provision is made to enable them to do so. I would not envisage a bus service all the way up to Castell Carreg Cennen, but getting people to the base is probably a good idea and people may then want to walk the rest of the way and enjoy the scenery and landscape, providing, of course, that the weather allows them to do so, which is looking increasingly unlikely these

gwelliannau, mae wedi bwrw ei synnwyr digrifwch i'r amgylchedd hanesyddol. Nid oedd hwnnw'n ymateb digonol i'r gwelliannau a gynigiwyd gennym.

Mae amcan deublyg i gynnig y gwelliannau hyn. Yn gyntaf, credwn fod angen inni warchod ein henebion yn well, ac wrth wneud hynny, sicrhau bod y grantiau a'r cymorth sydd ar gael i'r amryfal gymunedau a chyrrff eraill i ddelio â hynny yn gydllynol, yn hawdd eu deall ac yn hawdd cael gafael arnynt. Yn ail, er ein bod yn gwerthfawrogi'r amgylchedd hanesyddol yr ydym yn byw ynddo o ran tirwedd a henebion, nid ydym yn teimlo ein bod, fel gwlad, yn gwerthu'r pethau hynny'n arbennig o dda i'r byd y tu allan ac yn annog ymwelwyr i ddod i mewn i weld yr hanes aruthrol yr ydym yn falch ohono ac sydd gennym i'w ddangos ac sydd ar gael i helpu pobl i ddysgu am hanes Cymru. O ran hynny, nid wyf yn meddwl ein bod yn ei werthu cystal â hynny i bobl sy'n byw yng Nghymru ychwaith, ac mae mynediad yn rhan bwysig o hynny.

Derbynnir sylwadau Alun Ffred am Ynys Enlli a henebion eraill, ond yr egwyddor yw y dylai pobl sy'n dymuno ymweld â'r henebion hyn a phrofi a mwynhau'r dirwedd a'n hamgylchedd hanesyddol allu cyrraedd yn weddol agos atynt, ac mae cludiant cyhoeddus yn rhan allweddol o hynny.

Mae problemau yn hyn o beth o ran y gallu i'w fforddio, yn enwedig i bobl sy'n dibynnu ar bensiwn ac sydd ar incwm bach, ond sydd, serch hynny, yn mwynhau mynd allan a phrofi'r hyn sydd ar gael yng nghefn gwlad. Ni waeth a ydynt yn mynd am dro ar hyd camlas hanesyddol neu yn y bryniau, mae'n rhaid iddynt gyrraedd yno yn y lle cyntaf. Mae'n bwysig, fel rhan o strategaeth yr amgylchedd hanesyddol, i ddarpariaeth gael ei gwneud i'w galluogi i wneud hynny. Ni fyddwn yn rhagweld gwasanaeth bws yr holl ffordd i fyny i Gastell Carreg Cennen, ond mae'n debyg ei bod yn syniad da cael pobl at y godre ac wedyn efallai y bydd arnynt awydd cerdded gweddill y ffordd a mwynhau'r olygfa a'r dirwedd, ar yr amod, wrth gwrs, fod y tywydd yn caniatáu iddynt



days.

Looking through the 2007 Welsh historic environment position statement, it is clear that a relatively large number of grants and bodies are being dealt with. My party and I believe that there is a case for simplifying this system and reducing the number of different grants available and bringing them together in a package that people are able to work with and apply for easily. Many projects are community based. It would be of assistance to those communities to make the process of obtaining grants simpler and would also cut down on administrative duplication. The simplification of grants is a principle that the Assembly has adopted since the beginning, and it has been applied in other fields for which we are responsible. For that reason, I would hope that the Minister would consider doing something similar in relation to the historic environment.

A lot of money is distributed to local authorities for scheduled ancient monuments. However, the distribution of that money does not appear to be very even. For example, despite the fact that there are 490 scheduled ancient monuments in Gwynedd, the county only received £646 in grants for those monuments in 2006-07, while Caerphilly County Borough Council received £28,000, although it has fewer monuments. I am not saying the distribution process is unfair, but there is clearly an issue about whether people are applying for grants in the first place and taking advantage of the opportunities available to them. Simplification of the process would go some way towards dealing with that issue.

Only 8 per cent of visits to staffed Cadw sites are for educational purposes, which means that, for the other 92 per cent of visits, people are visiting of their own accord for recreational or leisure purposes. Only 24 per cent of visitors are from Wales, so a considerable number of people from outside of Wales visit these sites. This is where marketing comes in, in making sure that we promote what we have. Everyone has seen the tourism advertisements about how Wales has good mud, and how you can get lost in Wales, but we rarely see something to say,

wneud hynny, sy'n ymddangos yn fwyfwy annhebygol y dyddiau hyn.

Wrth edrych drwy ddatganiad sefyllfa 2007 ar amgylchedd hanesyddol Cymru, mae'n amlwg bod nifer cymharol fawr o grantiau a chyrrff dan sylw. Mae fy mhlaid a minnau'n credu bod dadl dros symleiddio'r system hon a lleihau nifer y gwahanol grantiau sydd ar gael a dod â hwy ynghyd mewn pecyn y gall pobl weithio gydag ef ac ymgeisio amdano'n hawdd. Mae llawer o brosiectau'n rhai cymunedol. Byddai o gymorth i'r cymunedau hynny pe gwneid y broses o gael grantiau'n symlach a byddai hefyd yn lleihau dyblygu gweinyddol. Mae symleiddio grantiau'n egwyddor y mae'r Cynulliad wedi'i mabwysiadu ers y dechrau, ac mae wedi'i dilyn mewn meysydd eraill y mae gennym gyfrifoldeb drostynt. Am y rheswm hwnnw, gobeithio y byddai'r Gweinidog yn ystyried gwneud rhywbeth tebyg mewn perthynas â'r amgylchedd hanesyddol.

Dosberthir llawer o arian i awdurdodau lleol ar gyfer henebion cofrestredig. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n ymddangos bod yr arian hwnnw'n cael ei ddsbarthu'n wastad iawn. Er enghraifft, er bod 490 o henebion cofrestredig yng Ngwynedd, dim ond £646 a gafodd y sir mewn grantiau at yr henebion hynny yn 2006-07, tra cafodd Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili £28,000, er bod ganddo lai o henebion. Nid wyf yn dweud bod y broses ddsbarthu'n annheg, ond yn amlwg mae lle i gwestiynu a ydyw pobl yn ymgeisio am grantiau yn y lle cyntaf ac yn manteisio ar y cyfleoedd sydd ar gael iddynt. Byddai symleiddio'r broses yn cyfrannu cryn dipyn at ddelio â'r mater hwnnw.

Dim ond 8 y cant o ymweliadau â safleoedd Cadw sydd â staff ynddynt sydd at ddibenion addysgol, sy'n golygu, o ran y 92 y cant arall o ymweliadau, fod pobl yn ymweld o'u pen a'u pastwn eu hunain at ddibenion hamdden neu adloniant. Dim ond 24 y cant o ymwelwyr sydd o Gymru, felly daw nifer sylweddol o bobl o'r tu allan i Gymru i ymweld â'r safleoedd hyn. Dyma lle y mae marchnata'n bwysig, i sicrhau ein bod yn hyrwyddo'r hyn sydd gennym. Mae pawb wedi gweld yr hysbysebion twristiaeth sy'n dweud bod llaid da gan Gymru, a bod

'Look at this spectacular scenery; look at this important historic monument and come to see it and learn more about Wales'. We believe that that needs to be done. I hope that the Minister will reconsider his attitude towards these amendments and think seriously about supporting them so that we can start to move the strategy in that direction.

**Paul Davies:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw William Graham. Gwelliant 4: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar y Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth i gyhoeddi adroddiad blynyddol i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ar effaith prosiectau cadwraeth yn ein cymunedau lleol a'u rôl mewn meysydd fel datblygu economaidd ac addysg.*

Gwelliant 5: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gynnal ymgynghoriad ystyrlon â grwpiau cadwraeth lleol yng Nghymru.*

Gwelliant 6: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gynyddu nifer yr ymgynghoreion statudol o ran prosiectau cadwraeth, er enghraifft, i gynnwys Ymddiriedolaeth Gerddi Hanesyddol Cymru.*

Mae'n bleser cael cymryd rhan yn y ddadl hon a chynnig y gwelliannau yn enw William Graham ar ran y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig.

Mae gan Gymru rai o'r henebion hanesyddol gorau yn y Deyrnas Unedig ac mae gennym sefydliadau diwylliannol eang ac arbennig i'w cynnig i'r byd, megis ein cestyll a'n golygfeydd hyfryd. Mae'r atyniadau hyn a'n hamgylchedd hanesyddol yn enwog ledled y byd. Rhydd y ddadl hon gyfle imi fynegi'r angen i amddiffyn ein hamgylchedd hanesyddol ac i gefnogi ymwneud cymunedau â'u hamgylchedd hanesyddol.

Cymru'n lle da i fynd ar goll, ond anaml y gwelwn rywbeth sy'n dweud, 'Edrychwch ar y golygfeydd godidog hyn; edrychwch ar yr adeilad hanesyddol pwysig hwn a dewch i'w weld a dysgu mwy am Gymru'. Credwn fod angen gwneud hynny. Gobeithio y gwnaiff y Gweinidog ailystyried ei agwedd at y gwelliannau hyn a meddwl o ddifrif am eu cefnogi fel y gallwn ddechrau symud y strategaeth i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw.

**Paul Davies:** I propose the following amendments in the name of William Graham. Amendment 4: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Minister for Heritage to publish an annual report to the National Assembly for Wales on the impact of conservation projects in our local communities and the role they have in areas such as economic development and education.*

Amendment 5: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to engage in meaningful consultation with local conservation groups in Wales.*

Amendment 6: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to enlarge the number of statutory consultees regarding conservation projects, for example, to include the Welsh Historic Gardens Trust.*

It is a pleasure to participate in this debate and to propose the amendments in the name of William Graham on behalf of the Welsh Conservatives.

Wales has some of the best ancient monuments in the United Kingdom and we have diverse and special cultural institutions to offer the world, such as our wonderful castles and scenery. These attractions and our historic environment are famous across the world. This debate gives me the opportunity to defend our historic environment and to support communities' involvement with their historic environment.

Mae'n briodol gwerthfawrogi ein hamgylchedd am yr hyn y mae'n ei gynrychioli ond mae hefyd yn bwysig cydnabod y cyfraniad y gall ei wneud tuag at adfywio economaidd a chymunedol.

Croesawaf y ffaith bod y Llywodraeth yn buddsoddi £1.5 miliwn mewn prosiectau cadwraeth lleol. Mae'n siŵr gennyf y bydd y safleoedd sy'n elwa o'r buddsoddiad hwnnw yn haeddu'r arian, a bod y gwaith a wnânt yn cyfrannu'n helaeth at ddyfodol llwyddiannus y safleoedd. Fodd bynnag, er mwyn asesu effaith y buddsoddiad hwn, hoffwn ailbwybleisio'r ffaith y byddai o fudd inni weld y Gweinidog yn cyhoeddi adroddiad blynyddol i'r Cynulliad am effaith prosiectau cadwraeth yn ein cymunedau lleol, a'u rôl mewn meysydd megis datblygu economaidd ac addysg. Gwn fod ei ragflaenydd wedi gwrthod hynny mewn trafodaeth ym mis Mehefin, a dadleuodd fod y ddogfen, 'Amgylchedd Hanesyddol Cymru: Datganiad Sefyllfa 2007', yn ddigonol. Fodd bynnag, credaf y byddai trosglwyddo'r wybodaeth honno i adroddiad penodol a fyddai hefyd yn asesu effaith ein prosiectau a'n safleoedd o fudd mawr. Byddai'n ein galluogi i fonitro ein llwyddiannau a'n gallu i ddenu ymwelwyr i'n hamgylchedd hanesyddol.

Hyderaf y byddai'r adroddiad hefyd yn ein galluogi i fonitro'r strategaeth farchnata, a chanolbwyntio ar hybu ein hatyniadau cadwraeth yn fwy effeithiol. Byddai cyhoeddi adroddiad o'r fath yn golygu bod yr wybodaeth ar gael i bawb, a gobeithiaf y byddai hynny'n cyfleu neges bositif, gan godi proffil y safleoedd hanesyddol hyn ymhellach. Gallai hyd yn oed helpu i ddenu mwy o ymwelwyr o dramor.

Mae'n hanfodol sicrhau bod ymrwymiad effeithiol rhwng cymunedau a'r sefydliadau sy'n gysylltiedig â phrosiectau cadwraeth. Byddai sicrhau cyfathrebu a chydweithredu gwell rhwng y Llywodraeth a grwpiau cadwraeth lleol yn ein galluogi i weld y manteision a'r anfantais o hybu atyniadau yn well, a gobeithio y byddai hynny'n arwain at gynllun hybu mwy grymus o ganlyniad. Byddai trafodaethau ystyrlon rhwng Llywodraethau a grwpiau lleol yn annog mwy o bobl i gyfranogi gyda'u hamgylchedd hanesyddol. Wrth annog cymunedau lleol i

It is appropriate to appreciate our environment for what it represents, but it is also important that we recognise the contribution that it could make towards community and economic regeneration.

I welcome the fact that the Government has invested £1.5 million in local conservation projects. I am sure that the sites that benefit from that investment are deserving of the funding, and that the work that they do contributes substantially to the success of those sites for the future. However, to assess the impact of that investment, I reiterate the fact that it would be beneficial to us if the Minister were to publish an annual report to the Assembly on the impact of conservation projects in our local communities, and their role in areas such as economic development and education. I know that his predecessor in that post rejected that in a discussion in June, and he argued that the 'Welsh Historic Environment: Position Statement 2007' document was adequate. However, I believe that transferring this information to a specific report that would also assess the impact of our projects and sites would be of great benefit as it would enable us to monitor our successes and our ability to attract visitors to our historic environment.

I am sure that the report would also enable us to monitor the marketing strategy and focus on promoting our conservation attractions more effectively. Publishing such a report would make the information available to everyone, and I hope that that would send a positive message and raise the profile of these historic sites further. It could even help to attract more foreign visitors.

It is essential to ensure that there is an effective connection between communities and those organisations involved in conservation projects. Ensuring better communication and collaboration between the Government and local conservation groups would enable us to recognise better the benefits and disbenefits of promoting attractions, and, hopefully, would culminate in a more powerful marketing strategy. More meaningful discussions between the Government and local groups would encourage more people to engage with their

ryngweithio gyda'u hanes diwylliannol, byddai'n siŵr o greu mwy o falchder yn ein treftadaeth, drwy greu syniad o gydnabyddiaeth unol, a gallai hynny ddatblygu ysbryd cymunedol gwell. Mae cydnabod a diogelu ein hanes yn sicr yn ein huno fel cenedl, ac yn gwella ein hysbryd cymunedol. Gallwn ddathlu ein hanes cyfoethog gydag ymwelwyr o agos ac o bell. Mae gwella mynediad at ein hatyniadau yn sylfaenol, felly, i gadwraeth lwyddiannus.

Ar ran yr wrthblaid, croesawaf ymrwymiad parhaol y Llywodraeth i gefnogi ymwneud cymunedau â'u hamgylchedd hanesyddol. Bydd buddsoddi mewn prosiectau cadwraeth yn sicrhau gwell mynediad at ein treftadaeth, yn ddeallusol ac yn gorfforol. Croesawaf y ddadl hon heddiw a'r hyn y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ceisio ei gyflawni, ond os ydym am sicrhau yr effaith y gall prosiectau cadwraeth ei chael ar ein cymunedau lleol, a'u rôl mewn meysydd megis datblygu economaidd ac addysg, mae'n bwysig bod y Llywodraeth yn cyhoeddi adroddiad blynyddol ar hyn. Mae hefyd yn bwysig bod yr adroddiad yn rhoi manylion am nifer yr ymwelwyr i safleoedd cadwraeth a threftadaeth, a bod y niferoedd hynny yn mynd i'r cyfeiriad iawn. Gobeithiaf, felly, y bydd Aelodau yn cefnogi'r gwelliannau sydd gerbron.

**Alun Davies:** I welcome the debate and the motion. We all understand that the built environment is possibly the single part of our everyday lives that we both take for granted and that provides a very real, living and unspoken link with the breadth of the history that created our communities. When we speak about the historic environment, all too often, we make the mistake of thinking of the buildings that were built in the last century or the century before when, of course, it stretches back to pre-history, from the earliest human settlements in this part of the world, to the development of those settlements through to the modern day. It is an integral part of our cultural identity and it creates a very real sense of place, and, whether that is local, regional or national, it combines to create the communities in which we live today.

historic environment. Encouraging local communities to interact with their own cultural history would surely create greater pride in our heritage, by creating a sense of joint recognition, which could, in turn, develop a better community spirit. Acknowledging and safeguarding our history certainly unifies us as a nation and improves our community spirit. We can celebrate our rich history with visitors from near and far. Improving access to our attractions is fundamental to successful conservation.

On behalf of the opposition, I welcome the Government's continuing commitment to support communities' involvement with their historic environment. Investment in conservation projects will ensure that there is better access to our heritage, both intellectually and physically. I welcome today's debate and what the Government is trying to achieve, but if we are to ensure that conservation projects can have the maximum impact on our local communities, and can play a role in economic development and education, it is essential that the Government publishes an annual report on this. It is also important that the report details the number of visitors to the sites, and that those figures move in the right direction. Therefore, I hope that Members will support the amendments that we have presented to them.

**Alun Davies:** Yr wyf yn croesawu'r ddadl a'r cynnig. Yr ydym i gyd yn deall mai'r amgylchedd adeiledig o bosibl yw'r un rhan o'n bywydau bob dydd a gymerwn yn ganiataol ac sy'n darparu cysylltiad byw, real iawn, er nad oes sôn amdano, â thrwy hanes a greodd ein cymunedau. Pan siaradwn am yr amgylchedd hanesyddol, yn llawer rhy aml, gwnawn y camgymeriad o feddwl am yr adeiladau a godwyd yn y ganrif ddiwethaf neu'r ganrif cyn hynny, er ei fod, wrth reswm, yn ymestyn yn ôl i gynhanes, o'r aneddiadau dynol cynharaf yn y rhan hon o'r byd, i ddatblygiad yr aneddiadau hynny hyd at ein dyddiau ni. Mae'n rhan annatod o'n hunaniaeth ddiwylliannol ac mae'n creu ymdeimlad real iawn o le, a boed hynny'n lleol, yn rhanbarthol neu'n genedlaethol, mae'n cyfuno i greu'r cymunedau yr ydym yn byw ynddynt heddiw.

Ensuring that people understand this and have very real access to it is the vision that drove the ambition outlined in Welsh Labour's 2007 manifesto. We said that we wanted to build on the success of free entry to museums and galleries to give Welsh pensioners free entry to Assembly-funded heritage sites and to continue to offer free entry to school parties and provide vouchers for children and their families. We in Welsh Labour are driven by a commitment to create and deliver policies and initiatives to guarantee that far more of Wales's rich historic environment is available to us all. Our ambition is to support local conservation efforts and to celebrate the outstanding heritage that we have throughout Wales. In light of that, I will say a word of sympathy with the amendments proposed by the Liberal Democrats. The Minister made a very good point about Bardsey Island, but that is the exception, not the rule. It is important for access that public transport should bring our historic environment within everyone's reach and a statement from the Government on that would help.

4.10 p.m.

It is also important that we have a reporting system. The Minister has said this afternoon that he will provide annual reports to the Assembly, and that is important, because it is only through reports and policies that we as a legislature are able to hold the Executive to account. Therefore, I hope that we will continue to see reports and analyses of the Government's actions and their impact.

All of the speakers this afternoon have focused on the economic, educational, cultural and regeneration impact that our historic environment can make, but it is important that we do not lose sight of its intrinsic value. We should move beyond a debate about price and trying to assign a monetary value to the historic environment, and state as a point of absolute principle that the history of how our communities have developed has a value beyond a monetary value, and that we will protect it, enhance it and ensure that it is open to all because of its intrinsic value. I remember being taught

Sicrhau bod pobl yn deall hyn ac yn cael mynediad go iawn ato yw'r weledigaeth a sbardunodd yr uchelgais a amlinellwyd ym manifesto 2007 Llafur Cymru. Dywedasom ein bod yn awyddus i adeiladu ar lwyddiant mynediad di-dâl i amgueddfeydd ac orielau i roi mynediad di-dâl i bensynwyr Cymru i safleoedd treftadaeth a noddir gan y Cynulliad ac i barhau i gynnig mynediad di-dâl i bartïon ysgol a darparu talebau i blant a'u teuluoedd. Yr ydym ni yn Llafur Cymru yn cael ein sbarduno gan ymrwymiad i greu a gweithredu polisiau a mentrau i warantu bod llawer mwy o amgylchedd hanesyddol cyfoethog Cymru ar gael inni i gyd. Ein uchelgais yw cefnogi ymdrechion cadwraeth lleol a dathlu'r dreftadaeth arbennig sydd gennym drwy Gymru gyfan. Yng ngoleuni hynny, dywedaf air o gydymdeimlad â'r gwelliannau a gynigir gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Gwnaeth y Gweinidog bwynt da iawn am Ynys Enlli, ond yr eithriad yw honno, nid y rheol. Mae'n bwysig er mwyn mynediad i gludiant cyhoeddus ddod â'n hamgylchedd hanesyddol o fewn cyrraedd i bawb a byddai datganiad gan y Llywodraeth ynghlŷn â hynny yn helpu.

Mae'n bwysig hefyd inni gael system adroddiadau. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi dweud y prynhawn yma y bydd yn darparu adroddiadau blynyddol i'r Cynulliad, ac mae hynny'n bwysig, oherwydd dim ond drwy adroddiadau a pholisïau y gallwn ni fel deddfwrfa ddal y Weithrediaeth yn atebol. Felly, gobeithio y parhawn i weld adroddiadau a dadansoddiadau o weithredoedd y Llywodraeth a'u heffaith.

Mae pob un o'r siaradwyr y prynhawn yma wedi canolbwyntio ar yr effaith y gall ein hamgylchedd hanesyddol ei chael o safbwynt economaidd, addysgol, diwylliannol ac adfywio, ond mae'n bwysig inni beidio â cholli golwg ar ei werth cynhenid. Dylem symud y tu hwnt i ddadl ynghylch y pris ac ymgais i briodoli gwerth ariannol i'r amgylchedd hanesyddol, a datgan fel pwynt o egwyddor bur fod gan hanes datblygiad ein cymunedau werth y tu hwnt i werth ariannol, ac y byddwn yn ei warchod, yn ei wella ac yn sicrhau ei fod yn agored i bawb oherwydd ei werth cynhenid. Cofiaf gael fy addysgu am

about the value of the environment in Tredegar, the ironworks and the coal mines, and also visiting quarries elsewhere and looking back at the way that humans had interacted with the natural environment of the Heads of the Valleys and created the people living there today. That is, in itself, of enormous importance and value.

I celebrate free access to Cadw sites for pensioners and children, which is built on a pioneering approach from the Assembly Government. Free entry to national museums and galleries make some of the most outstanding national treasures available to everyone. We already know that the free entry guaranteed by the Government has enormously helped people, particularly those from disadvantaged communities and new visitors, to enjoy the culture and environment that their ancestors created here. It will maximise benefits to communities across Wales. I welcome the policy and the statements made by the Government this afternoon and the investment made to ensure that sufficient resources are provided to ensure that the essential work to protect and preserve some of our most important historic buildings is done. We will find difficulties in reconciling the need to conserve sometimes fragile sites with the need for access and interpretation, but I hope that the Assembly Government will continue its current policies to ensure that we guarantee access to all.

**Mark Isherwood:** As the great philosopher, Edmund Burke, said,

‘People will not look forward to posterity who never look backward to their ancestors’.

We must grasp the importance of history and of our historic environment, recognising that the past informs the future. If we do not learn from the past, we are doomed to repeat its mistakes. As Churchill said,

‘The farther backward you can look, the farther forward you are likely to see’.

werth yr amgylchedd yn Nhrefegar, y gwaith haearn a'r pyllau glo, ac ymweld â chwareli mewn mannau eraill hefyd ac edrych yn ôl ar y ffordd yr oedd dynion wedi rhyngweithio ag amgylchedd naturiol Blaenau'r Cymoedd a chreu'r bobl sy'n byw yno heddiw. Mae hynny, ynddo'i hun, o werth a phwysigrwydd aruthrol.

Yr wyf yn dathlu mynediad di-dâl i safleoedd Cadw i bensiynwyr a phlant, sy'n seiliedig ar agwedd flaengar gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae caniatáu mynediad di-dâl i amgueddfeydd ac orielau cenedlaethol yn sicrhau bod rhai o'r trysorau cenedlaethol mwyaf arbennig ar gael i bawb. Gwyddom yn barod fod y mynediad di-dâl a warantwyd gan y Llywodraeth wedi helpu pobl yn aruthrol, yn enwedig pobl o gymunedau difreintiedig ac ymwelwyr newydd, i fwynhau'r diwylliant a'r amgylchedd a grëwyd gan eu hynafiaid yma. Bydd yn dod â'r budd mwyaf i gymunedau ledled Cymru. Yr wyf yn croesawu'r polisi a'r datganiadau a wnaethpwyd gan y Llywodraeth y prynhawn yma a'r buddsoddiad a wnaethpwyd i sicrhau bod digon o adnoddau'n cael eu darparu i sicrhau bod y gwaith sy'n hanfodol i warchod a chadw rhai o'n hadeiladau hanesyddol pwysicaf yn cael ei wneud. Fe gawn anawsterau o ran cysoni'r angen i gadw safleoedd sydd weithiau'n fregus â'r angen am fynediad a dehongli, ond gobeithiaf y gwnaiff Llywodraeth y Cynulliad barhau ei pholisiau presennol i sicrhau ein bod yn gwarantu mynediad i bawb.

**Mark Isherwood:** Fel y dywedodd yr athronydd mawr, Edmund Burke,

Ni wnaiff pobl na fyddant byth yn edrych yn ôl at eu hynafiaid edrych ymlaen at y dyfodol.

Rhaid inni ddeall pwysigrwydd hanes a'n hamgylchedd hanesyddol, gan gydnabod bod y gorffennol yn ysbrydoli'r dyfodol. Os na ddysgwn yn sgîl y gorffennol, yr ydym wedi'n tynghedu i ailadrodd ei gamgymeriadau. Fel y dywedodd Churchill,

Po bellaf yn ôl y gallwch edrych, po bellaf ymlaen yr ydych yn debygol o weld.

‘A nation that forgets its past has no future.’

Nid oes dyfodol gan genedl sy'n anghofio'i gorffennol.

‘If we open a quarrel between the past and the present, we shall find that we have lost the future’.

O agor cweryl rhwng y gorffennol a'r presennol, canfyddwn ein bod wedi colli'r dyfodol.

In 1997, A Society For the Friends of Gwrych, for the friends of Gwrych Castle near Abergele in north Wales, was founded. In 2001, it became a registered charity called the Gwrych Castle Preservation Trust. The society was founded to raise awareness of the plight of the castle and to find possible solutions for the conservation and preservation of the site. This trust was started by a schoolboy called Mark Baker. Although he was still at school, he somehow managed to persuade those in authority and to rally support from those who were legally able to administer the trust. He even got the support of the Prince of Wales and the then Prime Minister, Tony Blair. The trust is now set to maintain a watching brief on the development of the castle, and Mark, who is now a postgraduate studying historic buildings and heritage, has never wavered in his focus over the years. His determination has led to his trust becoming one of the largest building preservation trusts in Wales, with a worldwide following.

Yn 1997, ffurfiwyd Cymdeithas Cyfeillion Gwrych, i gyfeillion Castell Gwrych ger Abergele yn y gogledd. Yn 2001, daeth yn elusen gofrestredig o'r enw Ymddiriedolaeth Gwarchod Castell Gwrych. Sefydlwyd y gymdeithas i godi ymwybyddiaeth o gyflwr y castell ac i ganfod atebion posibl ar gyfer cadw a gwarchod y safle. Dechreuwyd yr ymddiriedolaeth hon gan fachgen ysgol o'r enw Mark Baker. Er ei fod yn dal yn yr ysgol, rywsut llwyddodd i berswadio'r bobl mewn awdurdod ac i ennyn cefnogaeth gan rai a allai weinyddu'r ymddiriedolaeth yn gyfreithlon. Llwyddodd hyd yn oed i gael cefnogaeth Tywysog Cymru a Phrif Weinidog Prydain ar y pryd, Tony Blair. Mae'r ymddiriedolaeth erbyn hyn yn cadw golwg ar ddatblygiad y castell, ac nid yw Mark, sydd bellach yn fyfyrwr ôl-raddedig yn astudio adeiladau hanesyddol a threftadaeth, erioed wedi simsanu yn ei nod dros y blynyddoedd. Mae ei benderfyniad wedi peri i'w ymddiriedolaeth fod yn un o'r ymddiriedolaethau gwarchod adeiladau mwyaf yng Nghymru, gyda dilyniant byd-eang.

I have a letter from a trustee of the Gwrych Castle Preservation Trust, who is also the chairman of the Welsh Historic Gardens Trust, Michael Tree, to Conwy County Borough Council. By working together, they have succeeded in that Gwrych Castle has, at last, been put up for sale. They have highlighted a repeat problem at Hafodunos Hall, which has also now been put up for sale. The trust is now providing a draft planning brief for consideration and amendment by the council, as it sees fit.

Mae gennyf lythyr oddi wrth un o ymddiriedolwyr Ymddiriedolaeth Gwarchod Castell Gwrych, sydd hefyd yn gadeirydd Ymddiriedolaeth Gerddi Hanesyddol Cymru, Michael Tree, at Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy. Drwy gydweithio, maent wedi llwyddo, gan fod Castell Gwrych, o'r diwedd, ar werth. Maent wedi amlygu problem debyg yn Hafodunos Hall, sydd hefyd ar werth erbyn hyn. Mae'r ymddiriedolaeth bellach yn darparu briff cynllunio drafft i'w ystyried a'i ddiwygio gan y cyngor, fel y gwêl orau.

I have the history of Hafodunos Hall in front of me; it can be seen as a martyr for the cause of historic buildings in Wales. It was empty and neglected for years and then, one night in October 2004, it burnt down. It was recognised by Cadw and by the Victorian Society as being one of the most important

Mae hanes Hafodunos Hall gennyf o'm blaen; gellir ei ystyried yn ferthyr dros achos adeiladau hanesyddol yng Nghymru. Bu'n wag ac fe'i hesgeuluswyd am flynyddoedd ac yna, un noson ym mis Hydref 2004, llosgodd i'r llawr. Yr oedd Cadw a'r Gymdeithas Fictoraidd yn ei gydnabod yn un o'r

examples of Gilbert Scott's domestic architecture in Wales. It was grade I listed, but, despite this, like many others across Wales, it was allowed to fall into a state of decay.

Another, more recent, example can be found in Rhyl, where the Victorian Society, the national campaigning body for Victorian and Edwardian historic environment in England and Wales, is calling for support to act quickly to secure the grade II listed Grange Hotel after the building was seriously damaged in a blaze in March. In a model of community engagement, I and other politicians of many parties, worked with Rhuddlan residents earlier this year against a planning application for a Rhuddlan community recycling centre on marshland directly in front of the national monument, Rhuddlan castle, which had 40,000 visitors last year. This is a castle that Cadw is promoting as a tourist destination and the castle where Edward presented his baby son as the prince who spoke no English. Although the planning application was subsequently withdrawn, I suggest that it should never have been considered.

Community engagement with the historic environment matters. Therefore, we owe it to future generations to conserve our, and their, historic building heritage. In so doing, we must directly engage with local authorities as key agents, with voluntary organisations as expert advisers and statutory consultees. We must also recognise the precedent in north Wales for private individuals to come forward with schemes of repair. With the input of all sectors, the issue is not so much about the headline sums of money that the Assembly Government has allocated, but about what positive outcomes can be achieved, working together.

**Huw Lewis:** I welcome the opportunity to discuss the historic environment in Wales, because, among other things, I believe it to be our least-utilised economic driver when it comes to our tourism industry. Many of the points that I want to raise today go back to the contribution that I made on the subject of

enghreifftiau pwysicaf o bensaernïaeth ddomestig Gilbert Scott yng Nghymru. Yr oedd yn adeilad rhestredig gradd 1, ond, er gwaethaf hyn, fel llawer o rai eraill ledled Cymru, caniatwyd iddo fynd â'i ben iddo.

Gellir gweld enghraifft arall, fwy diweddar, yn y Rhyl, lle y mae'r Gymdeithas Fictoraidd, y corff ymgyrchu cenedlaethol ar gyfer amgylchedd hanesyddol Fictoraidd ac Edwardaidd yng Nghymru a Lloegr, yn galw am gymorth i weithredu'n gyflym i ddiogelu Gwesty'r Grange, sy'n adeilad rhestredig gradd II, ar ôl iddo gael ei ddifrodi'n sylweddol gan dân ym mis Mawrth. Drwy fodel o ymgysylltu â'r gymuned, gweithiais i a gwleidyddion eraill o sawl plaid, gyda thrigolion Rhuddlan yn gynharach eleni yn erbyn cais cynllunio i greu canolfan ailgylchu cymunedol Rhuddlan ar gorstir yn union o flaen yr heneb genedlaethol, castell Rhuddlan, yr ymwelodd 40,000 o bobl ag ef y llynedd. Mae hwn yn gastell y mae Cadw yn ei hybu fel cyrchfan i dwristiaid ac yn gastell lle y cyflwynodd Edward ei fab bach fel y tywysog nad oedd yn siarad gair o Saesneg. Er i'r cais cynllunio gael ei dynnu'n ôl wedyn, awgrymaf na ddylai byth fod wedi cael ei ystyried.

Mae ymgysylltiad y gymuned â'r amgylchedd hanesyddol yn bwysig. Felly, mae'n ddyletswydd arnom er mwyn cenedlaethau'r dyfodol warchod ein treftadaeth ni a'u treftadaeth hwythau o ran adeiladau hanesyddol. Wrth wneud hynny, rhaid inni ymgysylltu'n uniongyrchol ag awdurdodau lleol fel asiantau allweddol, gyda sefydliadau gwirfoddol fel cynghorwyr arbenigol ac ymgyngoreion statudol. Yn ogystal rhaid inni gydnabod y cynsail yn y gogledd i unigolion preifat gyflwyno cynlluniau atgyweirio. Gyda chyfraniad pob sector, mae a wnelo'r mater â'r canlyniadau cadarnhaol a all ddeillio o gydweithio yn fwy na'r prif symiau o arian y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi eu dyrannu.

**Huw Lewis:** Yr wyf yn croesawu'r cyfle i drafod amgylchedd hanesyddol Cymru, oherwydd, ymysg pethau eraill, credaf mai dyma'r ffactor economaidd a ddefnyddir leiaf yn ein diwydiant twristiaeth. Mae llawer o'r pwyntiau yr wyf am eu codi heddiw yn deillio o'r cyfraniad a wneuthum ynghylch



more imaginative interpretation and better marketing during the cultural tourism debate that was held earlier this year. There is a great deal of crossover between these two subjects that should be recognised in the debate today.

We need to do much more if we are to make our history come alive to the Playstation generation. Old, worn-out display panels full of text such as those that still adorn too many of our castles and other historic buildings will just not cut it with today's young people. While modernisation regarding the communication of history is necessary, we should also remember that interactivity does not refer only to podcasts or touch-screen computer panels; most of all, it refers to human interaction. Some of the most popular and informative historic sites that I have visited in the UK and Europe, and that we can think of further afield, depend almost entirely on full-time guides and interpreters being able to recreate for visitors a real sense of the past. History is much more about people than it is about buildings. For our built environment to mean something, it requires a human touch, such as that exhibited at Big Pit in Blaenavon; once experienced, this is never forgotten. This is not so much because of the pit itself, but because of the interpretation of the staff, who were real-life miners.

While I welcome the announcement that precipitated today's debate—I thank you, Alun Ffred, in particular for the £4,800 for new windows at the Engine House in Dowlais; it cannot do any harm—I was disappointed to see, overall, how few industrial sites have benefited from this round of grants, and every round of grants that has gone before.

4.20 p.m.

It is our industrial past, after all, which marks Wales out as truly remarkable, yet we still struggle to present that part of our history. Even at Blaenavon, a world heritage site where much has been done, there are insufficient links between Big Pit and other parts of the town—particularly the iron works, a site of enormous historical value.

dehongliad mwy dychmygus a gwell marchnata yn ystod y ddadl ar dwristiaeth ddiwylliannol a gynhaliwyd yn gynharach eleni. Mae llawer o orgyffwrdd rhwng y ddau bwnc hyn y dylid ei gydnabod yn y ddadl hon heddiw.

Mae angen inni wneud llawer mwy os ydym am ddod â'n hanes yn fyw i genhedlaeth y Playstation. Ni fydd paneli arddangos, hen, anniben ac amleiriog fel y rhai sy'n parhau i fodoli mewn gormod o'n cestyll a'n hadeiladau hanesyddol eraill yn apelio at bobl ifanc heddiw. Er bod angen moderneiddio'r dull o gyfleu hanes, dylem gofio hefyd nad at bodlediadau neu baneli cyfrifiadurol sgrin gyffwrdd yn unig y mae rhyngweithio yn cyfeirio; yn bennaf oll, mae'n cyfeirio at rhyngweithio rhwng pobl. Mae rhai o'r safleoedd hanesyddol mwyaf poblogaidd a difyr yr wyf wedi ymweld â hwy yn y DU ac Ewrop, a'r rhai y gallwn feddwl amdanynt mewn gwledydd eraill, yn dibynnu bron yn gyfan gwbl ar dywyswyr a dehonglwyr llawnamser yn gallu ail-greu ymdeimlad gwirioneddol o'r gorffennol i'r ymwelwyr. Mae a wnelo hanes lawer mwy â phobl nag adeiladau. Er mwyn i'n hamgylchedd adeiledig olygu rhywbeth, mae angen pobl, fel yr hyn a welir yn y Pwll Mawr ym Mlaenafon; mae'r profiad hwn yn fythgofiadwy, nid yn gymaint oherwydd y pwll glo ei hun, ond oherwydd dehongliad y staff, a arferai fod yn lowyr go iawn.

Er fy mod yn croesawu'r cyhoeddiad a ragflaenodd y ddadl hon heddiw—diolchaf ichi Alun Ffred, yn arbennig am y £4,800 ar gyfer y ffenestri newydd yn y Cwt Injan yn Nowlais; ni all wneud dim drwg—yr oeddwn yn siomedig o weld cyn lleied o safleoedd diwydiannol, yn gyffredinol, sydd wedi elwa o'r cylch grantiau hwn, a phob cylch grantiau cyn hyn.

Ein gorffennol diwydiannol, wedi'r cyfan, sy'n gwneud Cymru'n wlad wirioneddol hynod, ond eto yr ydym yn ei chael yn anodd cyflwyno'r rhan honno o'n hanes. Hyd yn oed ym Mlaenafon, safle trefnadaeth y byd lle y mae llawer wedi cael ei wneud, nid oes digon o gysylltiadau rhwng y Pwll Mawr a rhannau eraill o'r dref—yn arbennig y gwaith

Compare New Lanark in Scotland, another world heritage site, based around a restored eighteenth-century cotton mill, and the site of Robert Owen's model village. At New Lanark, the visitor experience is enhanced by proper transport links, there is the opportunity to stay within the world heritage site in the Mill Hotel, where I understand that there is excellent dining, and there are spending opportunities for visitors of all ages. Across the pond in colonial Williamsburg in the USA, an entire village has been recreated, attracting millions of visitors, to experience the Virginia of the 1770s. A range of hotels and nearby attractions maximise the economic benefit to the community.

This is not cloud-cuckoo-land stuff. There are real and achievable examples that we could be following in Wales. The economic rewards are there to be seen in towns like Carcassonne, in France, which has a population of just 44,000, but needs its own airport to deal with the demand from tourists who want to come and see the regenerated medieval walled town and its castle. It is a quite remarkable visitor attraction, and again, the emphasis is on the interpretation of history, using people to communicate the story of the town.

We are rightly proud of the historic environment in Wales, but there are weaknesses in our approach. It is all far too cosy. The Scots have a great word for it—it is too couthy. First, we lack imagination and fairness when it comes to what constitutes heritage in the first place. A medieval castle or a church is automatically recognised as being an important part of the Welsh historic environment, but a miners institute has to fight to make its case. People from industrial Wales are just as proud of their heritage as people in any other part of the country; the difference is that they are watching their historic environment crumble before their eyes.

Secondly, we need to release our imaginations and learn from the best when it comes to interpretation and visitor experience. We should ensure that the first beneficiaries of investment are not the

haearn, sy'n safle o werth hanesyddol enfawr. Cymharwch New Lanark yn yr Alban, un arall o safleoedd treftadaeth y byd, sy'n seiliedig ar felin gotwm o'r ddeunawfed ganrif wedi ei hadnewyddu, a safle pentref model Robert Owen. Yn New Lanark, cyfoethogir profiad yr ymwelwyr drwy gysylltiadau trafndiaeth priodol, a cheir cyfle i aros yn safle treftadaeth y byd yng Ngwesty'r Mill, lle y mae'r bwyd yn ardderchog yn ôl y sôn, a cheir cyfleoedd i wario i ymwelwyr o bob oed. Dros y dŵr yng ardal drefedigaethol Williamsburg yn UDA, mae pentref cyfan wedi cael ei ail-greu, ac mae'n denu miliynau o ymwelwyr i gael profiad o Virginia yn yr 1770au. Mae amryw o westai ac atyniadau cyfagos yn sicrhau'r budd economaidd mwyaf i'r gymuned.

Nid breuddwydion ffôl yw'r rhain. Mae enghreifftiau go iawn a chyraeddadwy y gallem fod yn eu hefelychu yng Nghymru. Gellir gweld y manteision economaidd mewn trefi fel Carcassonne, yn Ffrainc, a chanddi boblogaeth o ychydig dros 44,000, ond y mae arni angen ei maes awyr ei hun er mwyn ymdopi â'r galw gan dwristiaid sydd am ddod i weld y dref gaerog ganoloesol wedi'i hadfywio a'i chastell. Mae'n atyniad twristiaeth hynod, ac eto, mae'r pwyslais ar ddehongli hanes, gan ddefnyddio pobl i gyfleu hanes y dref.

Ymfalchïwn yn amgylchedd hanesyddol Cymru, a hynny'n briodol, ond mae gwendidau yn ein dull o fynd ati. Mae'n rhy gysurus o lawer. Mae gan yr Albanwyr air gwych amdano—mae'n rhy *couthy*. I ddechrau, nid oes digon o ddychymyg a thegwch gennym o ran diffinio treftadaeth yn y lle cyntaf. Caiff castell neu eglwys ganoloesol eu cydnabod ar unwaith fel rhan bwysig o amgylchedd hanesyddol Cymru, ond rhaid i sefydliad glowyr frwydro i gyflwyno'i achos. Mae pobl o Gymru ddiwydiannol yr un mor falch o'u treftadaeth â phobl mewn unrhyw ran arall o'r wlad; y gwahaniaeth yw eu bod yn gwylio eu hamgylchedd hanesyddol hwy'n diflannu o flaen eu llygaid.

Yn ail, mae angen inni ryddhau ein dychymyg a dysgu oddi wrth y gorau o ran dehongli a phrofiad ymwelwyr. Dylem sicrhau nad y rhai sy'n frwd dros hanes sy'n mynd o'r naill safle i'r llall sy'n elwa gyntaf

enthusiasts for history who go from site to site; they should not be the first beneficiaries, although they are very welcome. The first beneficiary should be the community in which that heritage site is embedded.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I praise the Minister, and thank him for his gracious way of dealing with my party's aspirations. Plaid Cymru has had aspirations for many years, and they are now being realised here in the Assembly, so I am sure that ours can also be realised, in the shape of our transport amendment. After all, it is based on the fact that many of the attractive elements of our history—as eloquently put by the previous speaker—are linked to tourism, which in turn is linked to economic development. It is all about the marketing of Wales for everyone's benefit, including those who are employed here and live here.

Transport is just one piece of the jigsaw in bringing people from other areas to the more secluded sites of historic interest in Wales. My cousin Peter Hope Jones has written about Ynys Enlli on many occasions, taking some wonderful photographs, some of which appeared in R.S. Thomas's last collection—Ynys Enlli is not appropriate for public transport, but I believe that our point remains valid. Consider the fact that there are a staggering 886 scheduled ancient monuments in Powys, compared with 26 in Cardiff; there are 490 in Gwynedd, and 496 in Pembrokeshire, and yet they are not the most accessible areas of Wales. When you look at the greening of our economy, and of our everyday lives, it is fair to ask the Minister to think beyond the box, tangentially, and discuss improving public transport with his counterparts in other portfolios. Until we have that aspirational transport system, many people will still be forced to use their cars. Did the Minister, back in the good old days when he was leader of Gwynedd Council, not aspire to a green transport system through Snowdonia? I am sure that he will be able to tell us whether or not that materialised.

o'r buddsoddiad; nid y rhain ddylai elwa gyntaf, er bod croeso mawr iddynt. Y gymuned lle y mae'r safle treftadaeth wedi'i wreiddio ynddi ddylai elwa gyntaf.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yr wyf yn canmol y Gweinidog, ac yn diolch iddo am y ffordd hynaws yr ymdriniodd â dyheadau fy mhlaidd. Bu dyheadau gan Blaid Cymru ers blynyddoedd lawer, ac maent bellach yn cael eu gwireddu yma yn y Cynulliad, felly yr wyf yn siŵr y gall ein rhai ni gael eu gwireddu hefyd, ar ffurf ein gwelliant yn ymwneud â thrafnidiaeth. Wedi'r cyfan, mae'n seiliedig ar y ffaith bod llawer o elfennau atyniadol ein hanes—fel y dywedodd y siaradwr blaenorol mor huawdl—yn gysylltiedig â thwristiaeth, sydd yn ei dro yn gysylltiedig â datblygiad economaidd. Mae a wnelo â marchnata Cymru er budd pawb, gan gynnwys rhai sy'n gweithio yma ac yn byw yma.

Dim ond un darn o'r jig-so yw trafndiaeth o ran dod â phobl o ardaloedd eraill i'r safleoedd o ddiddordeb hanesyddol mewn rhannau mwy diarffordd o Gymru. Mae fy nghefnider, Peter Hope Jones, wedi ysgrifennu am Ynys Enlli droeon, a thynnu lluniau gwych, ac ymddangosodd rhai ohonynt yng nghasgliad olaf R.S. Thomas—nid yw Ynys Enlli yn briodol ar gyfer trafndiaeth gyhoeddus, ond credaf fod ein pwynt yn dal yn ddilys. Ystyriwch y ffaith bod swm anhygoel, 886 o henebion cofrestredig, ym Mhowys, o'i gymharu â 26 yng Nghaerdydd; mae 490 yng Ngwynedd, a 496 yn sir Benfro, ac eto nid hwy'r ardaloedd mwyaf hygyrch yng Nghymru. Wrth ystyried gwneud ein heconomi a'n bywydau bob dydd yn fwy gwyrdd, mae'n deg gofyn i'r Gweinidog feddwl yn ehangach, mewn meysydd sy'n gysylltiedig, a thrafod gwella trafndiaeth gyhoeddus gyda'i gyd-Weinidgion mewn portffolios eraill. Hyd nes cawn y system drafnidiaeth honno yr ydym yn dyheu amdani, bydd llawer o bobl yn parhau i gael eu gorfodi i ddefnyddio'u ceir. Onid oedd y Gweinidog, yn y dyddiau da pan oedd yn arweinydd Cyngor Gwynedd, yn dyheu am gael system drafnidiaeth werdd drwy Eryri? Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yn gallu dweud wrthym a ddigwyddodd hynny ai peidio.

Access is not the only issue; there are also issues of preservation, as other speakers have eloquently said, for the next generation. There are, apparently, 30,000 listed buildings in Wales, including almost 500 grade I listed buildings. I will only refer to one of those—I can see that the clock is ticking—namely Pontcysyllte aqueduct. As many of you know, Pontcysyllte aqueduct recently celebrated its bicentenary and it has a wonderful fraternity who live, or who take holidays, on narrow boats along it, including, recently, two of my cousins from New Zealand. There is the most fantastic marketing of that wonderful waterway that runs in my region, on which British Waterways has spent a considerable amount of money.

Let us hope that we can make these sites more accessible, that our Minister will take our aspiration on board and that we can improve the public transport system to ensure that many more people can come to see our wonderful historic environment.

**Nerys Evans:** Mae llawer o fy mhwyntiau wedi'u crybwyll eisoes yn y ddadl, ond mae mwy yr hoffwn ei ychwanegu.

Mae'n hanfodol, wrth inni drafod ein hamgylchedd hanesyddol, ein bod yn edrych ar ba hanes yr ydym am ei gofio a sut yr ydym am gofio'r hanes hwnnw. Mae'r broses o adeiladu cenedl yn seiliedig ar gofio o ble yr ydym wedi dod a chofio a dathlu'n hanes fel cenedl.

Yr oeddwn yn falch iawn o weld y buddsoddiad gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad o £1.5 miliwn sydd wedi'i grybwyll ar gyfer 35 o brosiectau cadwraeth ledled Cymru yn ddiweddar, gan gynnwys 13 yng Nghanolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru. Yr wyf hefyd yn falch o weld gwireddu ymrwymiad 'Cymru'n Un' i ganiatáu i blant a phensiynwyr ymweld â safleoedd Cadw am ddim.

Fodd bynnag, mae lle i'r Llywodraeth wneud mwy yn y maes hwn. Er bod y buddsoddiad i'w goesawu, gellid gwneud llawer heb lawer o fuddsoddiad, nid o ran cadwraeth safleoedd, ond o ran hyrwyddo a marchnata. Ymwelais â Bryn Glas ym Mhowys yn

Nid mynediad yw'r unig fater dan sylw; mae materion yn ymwneud â chadwraeth hefyd, fel y mae siaradwyr eraill wedi dweud yn huawdl, ar gyfer y genhedlaeth nesaf. Yn ôl pob tebyg mae 30,000 o adeiladau rhestredig yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys bron 500 o adeiladau rhestredig gradd 1. Dim ond at un o'r rheini y cyfeiriai—gallaf weld bod amser yn brin—sef traphont ddŵr Pontcysyllte. Fel y gŵyr llawer ohonoch, dathlodd traphont ddŵr Pontcysyllte ei daucanmlwyddiant yn ddiweddar, ac mae brawdoliaeth wych sy'n byw, neu sy'n mynd ar wyliau arni ar fadau hir, gan gynnwys dau o'm cefndryd o Seland Newydd yn ddiweddar. Caiff y ddyfrffordd wych honno yn fy rhanbarth ei marchnata'n rhagorol, ac mae Dyfrffyrdd Prydain wedi gwario cryn dipyn o arian ar hynny.

Gadewch inni obeithio y gallwn wneud y safleoedd hyn yn fwy hygrych, y bydd ein Gweinidog yn ystyried ein dyhead ac y gallwn wella'r system trafniadaeth gyhoeddus i sicrhau y gall llawer mwy o bobl ddod i weld ein hamgylchedd hanesyddol gwych.

**Nerys Evans:** Many of my points have already been raised in this debate, but there is more that I would like to add.

It is essential, as we discuss our historic environment, that we consider the history that we want to remember and how we want to go about doing that. The nation building process is based on remembering where we have come from and celebrating our history as a nation.

I was very pleased to see the Assembly Government's recent £1.5 million investment, which has already been mentioned, for the 35 conservation projects across Wales, including 13 in Mid and West Wales. I am also pleased to see the 'One Wales' promise to allow free access for children and pensioners to Cadw sites being realised.

However, there is scope for the Government to do more in this field. Although the investment is to be welcomed, much could be done for little investment, not in terms of site conservation, but in terms of promotion and marketing. I recently visited Bryn Glas in

ddiweddar, lle maeddodd Owain Glyndŵr y Saeson—er bod ganddynt fwy o filwyr, o dan Mortimer—yn 1402 mewn brwydr enwog, ac yr oeddwn yn siomedig o weld nad oedd unrhyw gydnabyddiaeth ar y safle i'r digwyddiad. Hoffwn gefnogi ac ategu sylwadau Huw Lewis y bydd ymestyn ein hymwybyddiaeth o'n hamgylchedd hanesyddol, drwy ychwanegu at nifer y safleoedd sy'n cael eu cydnabod, yn gam enfawr ymlaen inni fel cenedl. Ni fyddai hynny, o reidrwydd, yn cymryd llawer o fuddsoddiad.

Mae'r penderfyniad ynglŷn â pha hanes sy'n cael ei gydnabod yn hollbwysig, gan ei fod yn effeithio ar ba hanes sy'n cael ei drosglwyddo o un genhedlaeth i'r llall. Felly, hoffwn ofyn i'r Gweinidog edrych ar y mater hwn, ac ar bwy sy'n gwneud y penderfyniadau ar beth y dylem ei gofio ac ar ba sail, ac i ailedrych ar y strategaeth.

Hoffwn hefyd gymryd y cyfle i sôn am y gwaith mae Llyfrgell Genedlaethol Cymru yn ei wneud yn y maes. Cawsom lansiad arbennig yr wythnos diwethaf yn y Cynulliad ar gyfer strategaeth newydd y llyfrgell genedlaethol o lunio'r dyfodol, a fydd yn ei wneud yn un o lyfrgelloedd mawr y byd, drwy gasglu a darparu mynediad at wybodaeth gofnodedig ym mhob cyfrwng, bron—o lyfrau, i lawysgrifau, archifau a mapiau. Uchelgais mawr y llyfrgell yw digido cof y genedl, gan gynyddu'r ystod o wybodaeth sydd ar gael a gwneud Cymru y wlad gyntaf yn y byd i fod yn gwbl ar-lein, gan agor cyfleoedd mewn meysydd arbennig ac amrywiol. Rhaid inni ganmol y gwaith hwn ac edrych ymlaen at rywbeth y gallwn fod yn falch ohono am flynyddoedd i ddod.

**Val Lloyd:** On a national level, an appreciation of history gives us an understanding of who we are. On a local level, a shared past shown in local architecture can foster a sense of community. In no other aspect of our localities is history so strongly concentrated as it is in our buildings.

In the nineteenth century, the large port and abundant coal made Swansea an excellent location to establish copper smelting works. The city soon became defined by this

Powys, the site of Owain Glyndŵr's great victory over the English—who had more soldiers, led by Mortimer—in the battle of 1402; I was disappointed to see that the battle was not commemorated there. I support and endorse what Huw Lewis said, that extending our awareness of our historic environment, by adding to the number of sites that are recognised, will be a huge step forward for us as a nation. That would not necessarily mean a huge investment.

The decision on what history to recognise is vital, as it influences the history that is transferred from one generation to the next. Therefore, I would like to ask the Minister to look at that issue, and to consider who makes the decision on what we should remember and why, and to reconsider the strategy.

I would like to take advantage of this opportunity to mention the work done by the National Library of Wales in this field. The national library's new strategy for the future was launched at an excellent event in the Assembly last week; this will make it one of the world's greatest libraries, collecting and providing access to recorded information in nearly all formats—from books to manuscripts, archives and maps. The library's main ambition is to digitise the nation's past, increasing the range of material available and making Wales the first country in the world to be fully online, opening up specific and varied opportunities. We must praise this work and look forward to something of which we can be proud for years to come.

**Val Lloyd:** Yn genedlaethol, drwy werthfawrogi hanes yr ydym yn deall pwy ydym. Yn lleol, gall rhannu gorffennol sy'n cael ei ddangos mewn pensaernïaeth leol feithrin ymdeimlad o gymuned. Nid yw hanes mor gryf ag ydyw yn ein hadeiladau mewn dim un agwedd arall ar ein hardaloedd.

Yn y bedwaredd ganrif ar bymtheg, gwnaeth y porthladd mawr a'r doreth o lo Abertawe yn lleoliad rhagorol ar gyfer sefydlu gwaith toddi copr. Cyn pen dim dechreuodd y

industry, and even today local residents are still benefiting from its legacy of affluence and progression through the buildings built during that period.

4.30 p.m.

Swansea waterfront as a whole continues to prosper as a tourist hot spot, offering employment and new opportunities for future growth. The expansion of the SA1 quarter, part of the former docks—to follow on from some of the comments that Huw made—will provide further opportunity for the development of the historic environment, adapting buildings such as the former ice house and the J Shed for more modern usages, but preserving their frontages.

The Tawe river navigation heritage trail—a new initiative developed by the Swansea Community Boat Trust—illustrates the extent to which history can be capitalised on as an effective tourist attraction. Swansea residents and visitors will call at 37 places of interest around the waterfront and then upstream along the Tawe, discovering how the Swansea valley achieved its status and the moniker ‘Copperopolis’. This is an excellent example of past industrial successes, our historic environment, feeding into future achievements, and it reiterates the importance of learning from the past to help to shape a better future for our local communities. I thank the Minister for agreeing to launch that heritage trail leaflet next month.

Turning to a different facet of the historic environment, the jubilee project is a major and significant regeneration proposal for St Mary’s church in the centre of Swansea. St Mary’s will next year celebrate its golden jubilee, as it will be 50 years since it was rebuilt following its destruction during the war, but it has a history going back to well before the eleventh century. The church stands as a reminder of past struggles and represents the changes that have taken place in the city. A proposed revival of the St Mary’s venue is intended to be incorporated in the larger redevelopment plans for the city

diwydiant hwn ddiffinio’r ddinas, a hyd yn oed heddiw, mae’r trigolion lleol yn dal i elwa o’i waddol, sef cyfoeth a chynnydd, yn sgîl yr adeiladau a godwyd yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw.

Mae holl ardal glannau Abertawe yn dal i ffynnu fel atynfa i dwristiaid, gan gynnig cyflogaeth a chyfleoedd newydd ar gyfer twf yn y dyfodol. Drwy ehangu ardal SA1, rhan o’r hen ddociau—a dilyn rhai o sylwadau Huw—ceir mwy o gyfle i ddatblygu’r amgylchedd hanesyddol, drwy addasu adeiladau megis yr hen dŷ rhew a Sied J i’w defnyddio at ddibenion mwy cyfoes, ond gan gadw eu tu blaen.

Mae llwybr treftadaeth mordwyo afon Tawe—menter newydd a ddatblygwyd gan Ymddiriedolaeth Cychod Cymuned Abertawe—yn dangos i ba raddau y gellir manteisio ar hanes fel atyniad effeithiol i dwristiaid. Bydd trigolion Abertawe ac ymwelwyr yn galw heibio i 37 o fannau o ddi-ddordeb o gwmpas y glannau ac wedyn i fyny’r afon ar hyd afon Tawe, gan ddarganfod sut y llwyddodd cwm Tawe i ennill ei statws a’r llysenw ‘Copperopolis’. Mae hyn yn enghraifft ragorol o lwyddiannau diwydiannol y gorffennol, ein hamgylchedd hanesyddol, yn cyfrannu at lwyddiannau’r dyfodol, ac mae’n ategu pwysigrwydd dysgu o’r gorffennol er mwyn cynorthwyo i greu gwell dyfodol i’n cymunedau lleol. Yr wyf yn diolch i’r Gweinidog am gytuno i lansio taflen y llwybr treftadaeth hwnnw y mis nesaf.

A throi at agwedd wahanol ar yr amgylchedd hanesyddol, mae prosiect y jiwbilî yn gynllun adfywio mawr a sylweddol ar gyfer eglwys y Santes Fair yng nghanol Abertawe. Y flwyddyn nesaf, bydd y Santes Fair yn dathlu ei jiwbilî aur, oherwydd bydd 50 mlynedd wedi mynd heibio ers iddi gael ei hailgodi ar ôl ei dinistrio yn ystod y rhyfel, ond mae ei hanes yn mynd yn ôl ymhell cyn yr unfed ganrif ar ddeg. Mae’r eglwys yn dal i’n hatgoffa am frwydrau’r gorffennol ac mae’n adlewyrchu’r newidiadau sydd wedi digwydd yn y ddinas. Bwriedir cynnwys adfywio canolfan y Santes Fair yn y cynlluniau

centre, and so the old historic environment will merge with the new, to offer future generations a range of services that cater to their specialised needs, while also retaining them and investing them with a sense of history.

At a special meeting, last month, a local housing association in Swansea discussed the importance of redesigning city landmarks to adapt them to modern use while retaining their historic character. Several churches, chapels and other notable buildings throughout Swansea East have already gone down that path, mainly providing new, innovative units of housing. I am pleased that that vital aspect of social cohesion, linking the old with the new, provides further excellent examples of supporting the engagement of communities with their historic environment.

**Y Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth (Alun Ffred Jones):** Yr ydym wedi cael trafodaeth yn hytrach na dadl y prynhawn yma. Yr wyf yn croesawu'r sylwadau a wnaed a chyfeiriaf yn gryno at rai ohonynt.

Cyfeiriodd Alun Davies at y gwerthoedd sydd ynghlwm wrth ein hanes diwylliannol a'n treftadaeth sy'n ymwneud â sut yr ydym yn diffinio ein hunain, a dywedodd fod gwerth i hynny sydd uwchlaw unrhyw werth ariannol. Cytunaf ag ef yn hynny o beth. Cyfeiriodd hefyd at welliant 3 y Rhyddfrydwyr Democratiaid sy'n gofyn am drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus i sicrhau mynediad at safleoedd hanesyddol. Wrth gwrs y byddai hynny'n ddymunol, a buaswn yn cefnogi hynny lle bo'n bosibl, ond credaf fod angen inni fod yn realistig. Wedi'r cyfan, gyda'r arian prin sydd ar gael, mae'n trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus i fod i wasanaethu'n cymunedau a'n pobl yn gyntaf ac yn bennaf, ac yn ail y dylem edrych am gyfleoedd i hyrwyddo mynediad at safleoedd fel y rhai a drafodwyd heddiw.

Bu i Paul Davies sôn eto bod angen adroddiad cynhwysfawr. Fel yr wyf wedi dweud, gwnaed dau ddatganiad yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf a bydd yr un nesaf yn y gwanwyn. Bydd hwnnw'n rhoi mwy o sylw

ailldatblygu mwy ar gyfer canol y ddinas, ac felly, bydd yr hen amgylchedd hanesyddol yn asio â'r newydd, i gynnig amrywiaeth o wasanaethau i genedlaethau'r dyfodol sy'n darparu ar gyfer eu hanghenion arbenigol, ac sydd eto'n eu cadw ac yn rhoi ymdeimlad o hanes iddynt.

Mewn cyfarfod arbennig, y mis diwethaf, trafododd cymdeithas dai leol yn Abertawe bwysigrwydd ailddylunio tirnodau'r ddinas i'w haddasu i'w defnyddio at ddibenion cyfoes ond gan gadw eu cymeriad hanesyddol. Mae sawl eglwys, capel ac adeilad nodedig arall ledled Dwyrain Abertawe eisoes wedi dilyn y llwybr hwnnw, a'r rheini gan mwyaf yn darparu unedau tai newydd, arloesol. Yr wyf yn falch bod yr agwedd hollbwysig honno ar gydlyniant cymdeithasol, cysylltu'r hen a'r newydd, yn cynnig rhagor o enghreifftiau rhagorol o gefnogi ymwneud cymunedau â'u hamgylchedd hanesyddol.

**The Minister for Heritage (Alun Ffred Jones):** We have had a discussion rather than a debate this afternoon. I welcome the comments that have been made and I will refer briefly to some of them.

Alun Davies referred to the fact that there are values attached to our cultural history and heritage that relate to the way in which we define ourselves and that they have an intrinsic value that is above and beyond any financial value. I agree with him in that regard. He also referred to the Liberal Democrats' amendment 3 requesting public transport to access historic sites. Of course that would be desirable, and I would support that if it were possible, but I think that we need to be realistic. After all, given the limited funds that are available, our public transport system is supposed to serve our communities and our people first and foremost, and only secondly should we look for opportunities to promote access to sites such as those that we have been discussing today.

Paul Davies again mentioned the need for a comprehensive report. As I have said, two statements have been made in recent years and the next one will be in the spring. That statement will give more attention to the

i effaith y safleoedd hyn ar ein cymunedau ac ar economïau'r cymunedau hynny. Gallaf roi'r sicrwydd hwnnw i chi. Os byddwch yn teimlo nad yw'r adroddiad yn ddigon cynhwysfawr bryd hynny, Paul, gadewch i ni drafod hynny wedyn.

Peter Black has mentioned the simplification of the grant process. That is always to be desired and I am quite willing to consider that matter.

Huw Lewis made several interesting and important statements about our industrial past. It is true to say that our castles and great houses may previously have had priority over our industrial past, but I believe that those days are well and truly over. The promotion of the developments at Blaenafon and Big Pit show that we have moved on, and that we certainly do not underestimate or undervalue that past.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yn y cyd-destun hwn, hoffwn ddiolch i chi am yr arian mae eich adran wedi ei gynnig i'r hen dŷ pwmpio yn Llanelli, sy'n adeilad pwysig yn hanes diwydiannol y dref. Edrychaf ymlaen at weld yr adeilad hwnnw wedi ei adfer.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Ni allaf ychwanegu dim at eich sylwadau. Diolch yn fawr iawn.

Huw Lewis went on to talk about the interpretation of our past and the fact that we have to be ahead of the game, moving away from traditional displays. The television programme, *Coal House*, is an innovative way of presenting, defining, and exploring our history. I gather that the new series started yesterday. It is an example of the kind of experience that Huw was talking about. There is also the work that is being done by guides in the industrial museums at Llanberis, Llechwedd, Big Pit, and so on, which adds to the experiences of those who visit.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Will you ensure that Butetown History and Arts Centre is recognised for having a treasure trove of artefacts from what was the biggest coal-exporting port in the world? Will you also do what you can to support the links between the industrial heritage that you and Huw Lewis

effect that these sites have on our communities and on the economies of those communities. I can give you that commitment. If you feel that the report is not comprehensive enough at that time, Paul, let us discuss it then.

Mae Peter Black wedi sôn am symleiddio'r broses grantiau. Mae hynny bob tro'n beth dymunol ac yr wyf yn eithaf parod i ystyried hynny.

Gwnaeth Huw Lewis amryw o ddatganiadau diddorol a phwysig am ein gorffennol diwydiannol. Mae'n wir dweud bod ein cestyll a'n plastai wedi cael blaenoriaeth dros ein gorffennol diwydiannol cyn hyn efallai, ond credaf fod y dyddiau hynny ar ben am byth. Dengys hyrwyddo'r datblygiadau ym Mlaenafon a'r Pwll Mawr ein bod wedi camu ymlaen, ac nad ydym yn tanwerthfawrogi nac yn dibrisio'r gorffennol hwnnw yn sicr.

**Helen Mary Jones:** In this context, I would like to thank you for the money that your department has offered for Llanelli's old pumphouse, which is an important building for the town's industrial history. I look forward to seeing that building restored.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I cannot add anything to your comments. Thank you very much.

Aeth Huw Lewis yn ei flaen i sôn am ddehongli ein gorffennol a'r ffaith bod yn rhaid inni fod ar flaen y gad, gan symud oddi wrth arddangosfeydd traddodiadol. Mae'r rhaglen deledu, *Coal House*, yn ffordd arloesol o gyflwyno, o ddiffinio, ac o archwilio'n hanes. Caf ar ddeall fod y gyfres newydd wedi dechrau ddoe. Mae'n enghraifft o'r math o brofiad yr oedd Huw'n sôn amdano. Hefyd, mae'r gwaith y mae'r tywyswyr yn yr amgueddfeydd diwydiannol yn ei wneud yn Llanberis, yn Llechwedd, yn y Pwll Mawr, ac yn y blaen, sy'n ychwanegu at brofiadau'r rhai sy'n ymweld.

**Lorraine Barrett:** A wnewch sicrhau bod Canolfan Hanes a Chelfyddydau Butetown yn cael ei chydabod yn sgîl ei thrysorfa o arteffactau'r ddinas a oedd unwaith yn borthladd allforio glo mwyaf y byd? Yn ogystal a wnewch hynny a allwch i gefnogi'r cysylltiadau rhwng y dreftadaeth



talked about, particularly in the Valleys, and Cardiff, because Cardiff was built on the industrial heritage of the Valleys? I would ask you to remember places like that, which are important when we talk about preserving and conserving our heritage.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I accept your comments, and I will keep an eye on those aspects.

As I come to the end of my remarks, I wish to acknowledge the comments and contributions made this afternoon. There are many exciting opportunities for our communities, and communities of interest, to be involved and to shape the way in which we conserve, protect, celebrate and interpret our heritage. I look forward to pursuing this dialogue at the Treftadaeth conference next month.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The proposal is to agree amendment 1. Does any Member object? I see that they do. I will therefore defer all voting on this item until voting time.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisiau tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.  
Votes deferred until voting time.*

### **Ailstrwythuro'r GIG NHS Restructuring**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1, 3, 4, 8, 9 and 10 in the name of Kirsty Williams and amendments 2, 5, 6 and 7 in the name of William Graham. If amendment 2 is agreed, amendment 3 will be deselected.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Edwina Hart):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. welcomes the progress in the programme of reform in the Welsh NHS, as set out in the Minister's statement of 30 September;*

*2. endorses the 'One Wales' commitment to the abolition of the internal market which the programme takes forward;*

ddiwydiannol y soniasoch chi a Huw Lewis amdani, yn enwedig yn y Cymoedd, a Chaerdydd, oherwydd bod Caerdydd wedi'i chodi ar sail treftadaeth ddiwydiannol y Cymoedd? Hoffwn ofyn ichi gofio manau fel hynny, sy'n bwysig pan fyddwn yn sôn am gadw a gwarchod ein treftadaeth.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Derbyniaf eich sylwadau, a chadwaf olwg ar yr agweddau hynny.

Wrth imi ddod at ddiwedd fy sylwadau, dymunaf gydnabod y sylwadau a'r cyfraniadau a gafwyd y prynhawn yma. Mae llawer o gyfleoedd cyffrous i'n cymunedau, ac i gymunedau diddordeb, fod yn rhan o bethau a llunio'r ffordd y byddwn yn cadw, yn gwarchod, yn dathlu ac yn dehongli'n treftadaeth. Edrychaf ymlaen at fynd ar drywydd y drafodaeth hon yng nghynhadledd Treftadaeth y mis nesaf.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Y cynnig yw bod gwelliant 1 yn cael ei dderbyn. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod. Felly, gohiriwn yr holl bleidleisio ar yr eitem hon tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 3, 4, 8, 9 a 10 yn enw Kirsty Williams a gwelliannau 2, 5, 6 a 7 yn enw William Graham. Os derbynnir gwelliant 2, caiff gwelliant 3 ei ddad-ddethol.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Edwina Hart):** Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn croesawu cynnydd y rhaglen i ddiwygio GIG Cymru, fel y'i nodwyd yn natganiad y Gweinidog ar 30 Medi;*

*2. yn cymeradwyo ymrwymiad 'Cymru'n Un' i ddileu'r farchnad fewnol, y mae'r rhaglen yn bwrw ati i'w wneud;*

3. looks forward to the release of resources to front-line services which the rationalisation of health management arrangements will achieve;

4. confirms the continuing commitment to a preventative and primary care led National Health Service in Wales. (NDM4018)

Today's debate is an opportunity to sum up all that has been decided so far, to place that in a wider political context, and to look ahead at what must now follow with the restructuring. This motion sets out some key principles, which have, on a cross-party basis, set the fundamental direction of health policy in Wales for as long as the Assembly has been in operation.

We knew well before Derek Wanless decided to endorse our views that a strategy based simply on chasing demand for acute services would never be adequate to Welsh needs and circumstances. Our emphasis on preventative, primary and community services is a simple recognition that the NHS of the future has to be driven by keeping people well for as long as possible, not waiting until illness strikes. That remains the driving ambition of the current reform programme, and it is why I announced last week that the responsibility for these services will be held at the most senior board level of seven new organisations. That is why this motion explicitly reaffirms our commitment to putting them in the driving seat.

4.40 p.m.

The motion also makes clear that we remain firmly on track to put into practice the outcome of the consultation exercise carried out earlier in the year. The reforms will simplify the system, remove organisational boundaries created by the internal market and help to improve the continuity of care. Those are not my words, but those of the NHS Confederation in welcoming last week's announcement. The reforms will send a clear message that the health service in Wales is accountable to the Minister and, ultimately, to the people. Again, those are not my words,

3. yn edrych ymlaen at weld rhyddhau adnoddau ar gyfer gwasanaethau rheng flaen, y bydd rhesymoli'r trefniadau rheoli iechyd yn ei sicrhau;

4. yn cadarnhau'r ymrwymiad parhaus i Wasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol yng Nghymru sy'n ataliol ac yn cael ei arwain gan ofal sylfaenol. (NDM4018)

Mae'r ddadl heddiw'n gyfle i grynhoi popeth sydd wedi'i benderfynu hyd yn hyn, i roi hynny mewn cyd-destun gwleidyddol ehangach, ac i edrych ymlaen at yr hyn a fydd yn gorfod dilyn yn awr gyda'r ailstrwythuro. Mae'r cynnig hwn yn amlinellu rhai egwyddorion allweddol, sydd, ar sail drawsbleidiol, wedi pennu cyfeiriad sylfaenol polisi iechyd yng Nghymru ers pan yw'r Cynulliad ar waith.

Gwyddem ymhell cyn i Derek Wanless benderfynu ategu ein barn na fyddai strategaeth sydd wedi'i seilio'n unig ar ymateb i'r galw am wasanaethau aciwt byth yn ddigon i ddiwallu anghenion ac amgylchiadau Cymru. Mae ein pwyslais ar wasanaethau ataliol, sylfaenol a chymunedol yn cydnabod yn syml fod yn rhaid i GIG y dyfodol ganolbwyntio ar gadw pobl yn iach cyhyd ag sy'n bosibl, yn hytrach nag aros nes iddynt fynd yn sâl. Hynny yw'r uchelgais sy'n sbarduno'r rhaglen ddiwygio bresennol o hyd, a dyna pam y cyhoeddais yr wythnos diwethaf mai byrddau'r saith sefydliad newydd, ar y lefel uchaf, a fydd yn gyfrifol am y gwasanaethau hyn. Dyna pam y mae'r cynnig hwn yn cadarnhau'n bendant ein hymrwymiad i'w rhoi hwy wrth y llyw.

Mae'r cynnig yn ei gwneud yn glir hefyd ein bod yn dal yn debygol iawn o lwyddo i roi canlyniad yr ymgynghoriad a gynhaliwyd yn gynharach eleni ar waith. Bydd y diwygiadau'n symleiddio'r system, yn dileu ffiniau rhwng sefydliadau a grëwyd gan y farchnad fewnol ac yn gymorth i wella parhad o ran gofal. Nid fy ngeiriau i yw'r rheini, ond geiriau Cydffederasiwn y GIG wrth groesawu'r cyhoeddiad yr wythnos diwethaf. Bydd y diwygiadau'n anfon neges glir bod y gwasanaethau iechyd yng Nghymru'n atebol i'r Gweinidog, ac, yn y

but those of the Royal College of Nursing in Wales.

Health professionals and health administrators agree, and it is only politicians who have attempted to make mischief with some of the proposals. As far as I can tell, there is common ground between the opposition parties, and their objections focus on my decision to chair the national advisory board. I am sure that we will discuss that further in today's debate.

Jenny Randerson has gone further. She objects to the notion that I might hold the seven local bodies to account. I imagine that she is aware that that is exactly the model followed in Scotland, which was instituted when her party was in Government there. I understand that that was a long time ago, when the Liberal Democrats believed in increasing rather than slashing public expenditure, and in maintaining rather than abandoning the independence of the Bank of England. Nonetheless, it remains the case that the model that I have decided to follow is one that works well and has broad multiparty support in the Scottish context. Far from being an outlandish or power-grabbing device, it is a way to ensure that local populations can see the dialogue that goes on between Ministers and local deliverers in the field of health. I thought that that was the sort of local engagement that the Liberal Democrats wanted to support. Perhaps not.

I understand totally the position of the main opposition party. Theirs is all about winning a general election and putting a note on my door that reads 'Gone away'. Sometimes, I feel that the Conservatives' opposition to my chairing the national board has more to do with the fact that they would like to ask me questions that would get the response, 'Sorry, that has nothing to do with me; it is a matter for the strategic health authority'. That is absurd because my chairing the national board is about making my decision-making more transparent. The advice that I receive will be open to the public, and I think that

pen draw, i'r bobl. Unwaith eto, nid fy ngeiriau i yw'r rheini, ond geiriau Coleg Brenhinol y Nyrsys yng Nghymru.

Mae gweithwyr proffesiynol ym maes iechyd a gweinyddwyr iechyd yn cytuno, a dim ond gwleidyddion sydd wedi ceisio gwneud drygau gyda rhai o'r cynigion. Hyd y gwelaf, mae'r gwrthbleidiau'n gytûn ynglŷn â rhai pethau, ac mae eu gwrthwynebiadau'n canolbwyntio ar fy mhenderfyniad i gadeirio'r bwrdd cynghori cenedlaethol. Yr wyf yn siŵr y trafodwn hynny eto yn y ddadl heddiw.

Mae Jenny Randerson wedi mynd gam ymhellach. Mae'n gwrthwynebu'r syniad y gallwn ddal y saith corff lleol yn atebol. Yr wyf yn dyfalu ei bod yn ymwybodol mai dyna'r union fodel a ddilynir yn yr Alban, a sefydlwyd pan oedd ei phlaid hi'n llywodraethu yno. Deallaf fod hynny ymhell yn ôl, pan oedd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn credu mewn cynyddu gwariant cyhoeddus yn hytrach na'i docio'n llym, ac yn credu mewn cynnal annibyniaeth Banc Lloegr yn hytrach na rhoi'r gorau i hynny. Fodd bynnag, y gwir yw bod y model yr wyf wedi penderfynu ei ddilyn yn fodel sy'n gweithio'n dda ac yn un a gefnogir yn gyffredinol gan bob plaid yng nghyd-destun yr Alban. Nid dyfais anghonfensiynol neu ddyfais i fachu grym ydyw o gwbl, ond ffordd o sicrhau bod pobl leol yn gallu gweld y deialog sy'n digwydd rhwng Gweinidogion a darparwyr lleol ym maes iechyd. Yr oeddwn yn meddwl mai dyna'r math o feithrin cysylltiadau'n lleol yr oedd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol am ei gefnogi. Efallai nad felly y mae.

Deallaf yn llwyr safbwynt y brif wrthblaid. Mae a wnelo'u safbwynt hwy ag ennill etholiad cyffredinol a rhoi nodyn ar fy nrws sy'n dweud 'Wedi mynd i ffwrdd'. Weithiau, byddaf yn teimlo bod a wnelo gwrthwynebiad y Ceidwadwyr imi gadeirio'r bwrdd cenedlaethol fwy â'r ffaith y byddent yn hoffi gofyn cwestiynau imi a gâi'r ymateb, 'Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, nid oes a wnelo hynny ddim â mi, mater i'r awdurdod iechyd strategol ydyw'. Mae hynny'n hurt oherwydd pwrpas fy ngwneud i'n gadeirydd y bwrdd cenedlaethol yw gwneud fy mhenderfyniadau'n fwy tryloyw. Bydd y

this is a new way of doing things.

cyngor a gaf yn agored i'r cyhoedd, a chredaf fod hyn yn ffordd newydd o wneud pethau.

The important thing to recognise about these reforms is that they are about getting a service that is streamlined in its bureaucracy. At the end of the day, they will enable more money to reach the front-line services. That is the important message that I wish to get across today. I recognise that there is a considerable number of amendments and that there will be considerable discussion on this, so I will reserve the majority of my remarks for when I respond to the debate, when I have my right to reply.

Y peth pwysig i'w sylweddoli ynglŷn â'r diwygiadau hyn yw mai cael gwasanaeth symlach ei fiwrocratiaeth yw'r bwriad. Yn y pen draw, byddant yn galluogi mwy o arian i gyrraedd gwasanaethau'r rheng flaen. Dyna'r neges bwysig yr wyf am ei chyfleu heddiw. Sylweddolaf fod nifer sylweddol o welliannau ac y bydd cryn drafodaeth ynglŷn â hyn, felly cadwaf y rhan fwyaf o'm sylwadau nes byddaf yn ymateb i'r ddadl, pan fydd gennyf hawl i ymateb.

**Jenny Randerson:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 1: in point 1, delete 'welcomes the progress in the programme of reform in the Welsh NHS, as set out in' and replace with 'notes'.

**Jenny Rancerson:** Cynigïaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 1: ym mhwynt 1, dileu 'yn croesawu cynnydd y rhaglen i ddiwygio GIG Cymru, fel y'i nodwyd yn natganiad' a rhoi 'yn nodi datganiad' yn ei le.

Amendment 3: in point 2, replace 'endorses' with 'notes'.

Gwelliant 3: ym mhwynt 2, dileu 'yn cymeradwyo' a rhoi 'yn nodi' yn ei le.

Amendment 4: delete point 3 and replace with:

Gwelliant 4: dileu pwynt 3 a rhoi:

*believes that the best way to deliver effective front-line services is to ensure that, wherever possible, decisions are taken locally, underlined by a guaranteed national standard of service.*

*yn credu mai'r ffordd orau o gyflawni gwasanaethau rheng flaen effeithiol yw sicrhau, lle bynnag y bo'n bosibl, bod penderfyniadau'n cael eu cymryd yn lleol, gyda safon genedlaethol warantedig o wasanaeth yn sail iddynt.*

Amendment 8: add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 8: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*believes the programme will lead to a system that is over-centralised and introduces unprecedented political control over the day-to-day running of the NHS.*

*yn credu y bydd y rhaglen yn arwain at system sy'n rhy ganoledig ac sy'n cyflwyno rheolaeth wleidyddol nas gwelwyd erioed o'r blaen dros y gwaith beunyddiol o redeg y GIG.*

Amendment 9: add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 9: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*believes that certain models of non-government financing can play a role in developing capital projects within the NHS.*

*yn credu y gall rhai modelau cyllido nad ydynt yn gysylltiedig â'r llywodraeth chwarae rôl mewn datblygu prosiectau cyfalaf yn y GIG.*

Amendment 10: add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 10: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*believes that community health councils should be empowered and strengthened to provide a local voice within the NHS.*

You have pre-empted some of my remarks, Minister, and you are clearly prepared for the fact that key aspects of your proposals will not find support here. While I pay tribute to your energy and ability, I believe that you are taking us in the wrong direction. If our amendments are carried, they will begin to put right some key mistakes in that direction.

We will also support some of the Conservatives' amendments as I am minded to think that shadow organisations are a good idea, as they allow organisations to bed in. I also think it important that the Government sets out how much it intends to save and where that money will be spent, in order to reassure NHS staff.

The Government as a whole is creating a dangerous future for Wales, built on dogma, not on ideas. The worst aspects of socialism in my eyes are those that relate to centralised control—the one-size-fits-all approach. That is deaf to what people want, which is less not more meddling in the NHS. Clinicians want to work for a better service, not for some kind of naming-and-shaming ceremony.

Amendment 4 deletes point 3, because we believe that point 3 includes self-congratulatory, woolly words—we are so used by now to that mould of self-congratulation here. We replace that with a statement that we all, I hope, believe to be true here. If we do not believe in localism, if we do not believe in different solutions for different problems, how can we believe in this institution at all? We may as well return our powers to London and go home.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I think that you have hit on something important there. However,

*yn credu y dylid grymuso a chryfhau cynghorau iechyd cymuned er mwyn darparu llais lleol yn y GIG.*

Yr ydych wedi achub y blaen ar rai o'm sylwadau, Weinidog, ac yr ydych yn amlwg yn barod am y ffaith nad oes cefnogaeth i agweddau allweddol ar eich cynigion yma. Er fy mod yn canmol eich egni a'ch gallu, credaf eich bod yn ein tywys i'r cyfeiriad anghywir. Os derbynnir ein gwelliannau, byddant yn dechrau cywiro rhai o'r camgymeriadau allweddol i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw.

Byddwn hefyd yn cefnogi rhai o welliannau'r Ceidwadwyr gan fy mod yn tueddu i feddwl bod cyrff cysgodol yn syniad da, gan eu bod yn rhoi cyfle i sefydliadau fwrw gwreiddiau. Credaf hefyd ei bod yn bwysig i'r Llywodraeth ddweud faint y mae'n bwriadu ei arbed ac ym mhle y gwerir yr arian hwnnw, er mwyn tawelu meddwl staff y GIG.

Mae'r Llywodraeth drwyddi draw'n creu dyfodol peryglus i Gymru, dyfodol sydd wedi'i adeiladu ar ddogma, yn hytrach nag ar syniadau. Yr agweddau gwaethaf ar sosialaeth yn fy ngolwg i yw'r rhai sy'n ymwneud â rheoli pethau o'r canol—y dull sy'n golygu bod yr un peth yn gwneud y tro i bawb. O wneud hynny, ni wrandewir ar yr hyn y mae pobl yn dymuno'i gael, ac mae'n golygu mwy o ymyrryd â'r GIG, nid llai. Mae clinigwyr am weithio i gael gwasanaeth gwell, nid i gael rhyw fath o seremoni enwi a chodi cywilydd.

Mae gwelliant 4 yn dileu pwynt 3, oherwydd credwn fod pwynt 3 yn cynnwys geiriau niwlog, hunan-ganmoliaethus—yr ydym wedi arfer cymaint â'r math hwnnw o hunanlongyfarch yma. Yn lle hynny, rhown ddatganiad yr ydym i gyd yma, gobeithio, yn credu ei fod yn wir. Os nad ydym yn credu mewn cyfundrefn leol yma, os nad ydym yn credu mewn atebion gwahanol i broblemau gwahanol, sut y gallwn gredu yn y sefydliad hwn o gwbl? Byddai man a man inni ddychwelyd ein pwerau i Lundain a mynd adref.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Credaf eich bod wedi taro ar rywbeth pwysig yn hynny o beth.

what is the balance between localism and a postcode lottery in a country of 3.5 million to 4 million people?

**Jenny Randerson:** I think that you avoid the concept of a postcode lottery, which is a grossly over-used phrase, by having a minimum standard of service. You do not avoid it by having uniformity, whether you are living in north or south Wales, in rural Wales or in a city centre.

Amendment 9 covers the thorny issue of capital finance. I would never argue in favour of using conventional private finance initiative schemes, which the Minister's comrades in London have espoused so enthusiastically. I believe that it has failed to achieve anything close to value for money. However, we have to accept that the Treasury funds us on the assumption that we are using private sector finance. Therefore, we are now facing a huge shortfall. If anyone doubts that, I urge you to look at the Finance Committee's report on this issue. There are alternative ways in which we can unlock huge amounts of money. I urge my Plaid Cymru colleagues to consider the case of the Scottish Futures Trust that is being set up by the Scottish National Party. I hope that the Government will change its mind regarding private and non-Government money in general within the NHS and recognise that we are missing out in Wales.

I am delighted that the Minister has suggested that community health councils will continue to be coterminous with local authority boundaries, with the exception of Powys, which will have two. The idea of CHCs providing a local voice will only work if their powers and finances are strengthened. I hope that the Minister and I are at one on this. They have to have real teeth. They have to be able to demand answers from the health delivery bodies—or whatever you will wish to call them eventually—rather than just be able to ask for them, as the situation is now. Since the Minister is asking for unprecedented power over the service, it is only right that that power is shared with the people, as represented by the CHCs.

Fodd bynnag, beth yw'r cydbwysedd rhwng cyfundrefn leol a loteri cod post mewn gwlad o 3.5 miliwn i 4 miliwn o bobl?

**Jenny Randerson:** Credaf eich bod yn osgoi'r cysyniad o loteri cod post, sy'n ymadrodd sy'n cael ei orddefnyddio'n fawr iawn, drwy fod â safon ofynnol o wasanaeth. Nid ydych yn ei osgoi drwy gael unffurfiaeth, pa un a ydych yn byw yn y gogledd neu yn y de, yng nghefn gwlad Cymru neu yng nghanol dinas.

Mae gwelliant 9 yn ymdrin â mater anodd cyllid cyfalaf. Ni fyddwn byth yn dadlau o blaid defnyddio cynlluniau menter cyllid preifat confensiynol, y mae cymrodyr y Gweinidog yn Llundain wedi'u pleidio mor frwdfrydig. Credaf eu bod wedi methu cyflawni gwerth am arian o fath yn y byd. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni dderbyn bod y Trysorlys yn ein cyllido ar sail y rhagdybiaeth ein bod yn defnyddio cyllid y sector preifat. Felly, yr ydym yn awr yn wynebu diffyg enfawr. Os oes unrhyw un yn amau hynny, fe'ch anogaf i edrych ar adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyllid ar y mater hwn. Mae ffyrdd eraill posibl inni gael gafael ar symiau enfawr o arian. Anogaf fy nghyd-Aelodau ym Mhlaid Cymru i ystyried achos Ymddiriedolaeth Dyfodol yr Alban sy'n cael ei sefydlu gan Blaid Genedlaethol yr Alban. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Llywodraeth yn newid ei meddwl ynglŷn ag arian preifat ac arian nad yw'n arian y Llywodraeth yn gyffredinol yn y GIG ac yn cydnabod ein bod ar ein colled yng Nghymru.

Yr wyf wrth fy modd bod y Gweinidog wedi awgrymu y bydd y cynghorau iechyd cymuned yn parhau i rannu'r un ffiniau â'r awdurdodau lleol, ar wahân i Bowys, a fydd â dau. Dim ond os caiff eu pwerau a'u cyllid eu cryfhau y gwnaiff y syniad o CICau'n darparu llais lleol weithio. Gobeithiaf fod y Gweinidog a minnau'n gytûn ar hynny. Rhaid iddynt gael dannedd gwirioneddol. Rhaid iddynt allu mynnu atebion gan y cyrff cyflenwi iechyd—neu beth bynnag y byddwch am eu galw maes o law—yn hytrach na dim ond gallu gofyn amdanynt, sef y sefyllfa ar hyn o bryd. Gan fod y Gweinidog yn gofyn am bŵer na chafwyd dim tebyg iddo o'r blaen dros y gwasanaeth, mae'n hollol iawn i'r pŵer hwnnw gael ei

rannu gyda'r bobl, fel y'u cynrychiolir gan y CICau.

Finally, on health bodies' public meetings, as you know, Minister, health bodies already hold public meetings.

Yn olaf, o ran cyfarfodydd cyhoeddus cyrff iechyd, fel y gwyddoch, Weinidog, mae cyrff iechyd eisoes yn cynnal cyfarfodydd cyhoeddus.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I propose the following amendments in the name of William Graham. Amendment 2: delete point 2.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Cynigiad y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw William Graham. Gwelliant 2: dileu pwynt 2.

Amendment 5: add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 5: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*calls on the Minister to abandon her plans to chair the new advisory board.*

*yn galw ar y Gweinidog i roi'r gorau i'w chynlluniau i gadeirio'r bwrdd cynghori newydd.*

Amendment 6: add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 6: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to establish shadow authorities prior to the implementation of the changes.*

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sefydlu awdurdodau cysgodol cyn rhoi'r newidiadau ar waith.*

Amendment 7: add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 7: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to outline what the projected cost savings are and what the cost of restructuring will be.*

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i amlinellu beth yw'r arbedion cost tebygol a beth fydd cost ailstrwythuro.*

We welcome the debate this afternoon and we welcome the refocus of some of the responsibilities within the NHS. It was right to look at restructuring; we have long argued that the NHS was far too bureaucratic and had far too many bodies. Our position on that has been stable since your party decided to introduce 22 local health boards five years ago, Minister. We see this debate and this restructuring as an opportunity to create a more streamlined, clinically-led, patient-responsive service. We will be judging the proposed restructuring against these principles and on whether we, as Welsh Conservatives and the official opposition here, feel that this is the right restructuring programme to pursue.

Yr ydym yn croesawu'r ddadl y prynhawn yma a chroesawn y canolbwyntio o'r newydd ar rai o'r cyfrifoldebau yn y GIG. Yr oedd yn iawn edrych ar ailstrwythuro; yr ydym wedi dadlau ers tro fod y GIG yn llawer rhy fiwrocataidd a bod iddo lawer gormod o gyrff. Mae ein safbwynt ynghylch hynny wedi bod yn gyson ers i'ch plaid chi benderfynu cyflwyno 22 bwrdd iechyd lleol bum mlynedd yn ôl, Weinidog. Yr ydym yn gweld y ddadl hon a'r ailstrwythuro hwn fel cyfle i greu gwasanaeth symlach, dan arweiniad clinigol, sy'n ymateb i'r cleifion. Byddwn yn barnu'r ailstrwythuro arfaethedig yn ôl yr egwyddorion hyn ac ar sail a ydym ni fel Ceidwadwyr Cymreig a'r wrthblaid swyddogol yma, yn teimlo mai dyma'r rhaglen ailstrwythuro iawn i'w dilyn.

We supported the abolition of those 22 local health boards, and our view has not changed, as you know. We felt that the local health

Cefnogasom ddileu'r 22 bwrdd iechyd lleol hynny, ac nid yw ein barn wedi newid, fel y gwyddoch. Teimlem fod y byrddau iechyd

boards were unnecessary, that they did not have sufficient capacity and that, for a nation of around 3 million people, having 22 mini boards was simply unacceptable. We support the argument that many more services could be better co-ordinated and delivered locally, regardless of whether some services are commissioned nationally, by an all-Wales board, or regionally, in a sense, by one of the seven integrated boards.

4.50 p.m.

With regard to our amendment 2, I am saddened that first-class patient care was not the basis on which this reorganisation and restructuring was started. If you look at any of the documents issued by the Assembly Government's Department of Health and Social Services, you will see that it was undertaken on one basis alone, which was somehow to get rid of an internal market that had never really existed in the Welsh NHS in the first place. I am saddened that, when you read the Minister's foreword to that document, or any of the background information on why the restructuring was being pursued, you see that the delivery of first-class services to deliver first-class patient care was never the rationale cited. That is sad, because it sends the wrong message. It says to the people of Wales that this restructuring was being done purely because of some ideological misunderstanding of what the internal market was and whether we had an internal market operating at all in the NHS. The Government should have started from the point of view of undertaking restructuring to deliver better patient care. That would have been important, and I am sorry that the Government chose not to take that particular route. That is why we tabled our first amendment.

Our amendment 5 is on the role of the Minister. She will not be surprised that I reiterate my concern about the Minister chairing the all-Wales advisory board. The proposal for her to chair that board may fit with her own personal attitude as Minister, and it may fit with her personal approach to how the relationship between Government and the NHS needs to develop, but I am

lleol yn ddianghenraid, nad oedd ganddynt gapasiti digonol ac, i genedl o ryw 3 miliwn o bobl, fod 22 o fyrddau bach yn annerbyniol yn wir. Cefnogasom y ddadl y gallai llawer mwy o wasanaethau gael eu cyd-drefnu a'u cyflwyno'n well yn lleol, ni waeth a yw rhai gwasanaethau'n cael eu comisiynu'n genedlaethol, gan fwrdd Cymru gyfan, neu'n rhanbarthol, ar ryw ystyr, gan un o'r saith bwrdd integredig.

O ran gwelliant 2, mae'n fy nhristáu nad gofal o'r radd flaenaf i gleifion oedd y sylfaen y cychwynwyd yr ad-drefnu a'r ailstrwythuro hwn arni. Os edrychwch ar unrhyw rai o'r dogfennau a gyhoeddwyd gan Adran Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, gwelwch mai ar un sail yn unig yr ymgwymerwyd ag ef, sef i gael gwared rywsut neu'i gilydd â marchnad fewnol nad yw erioed wedi bodoli mewn difrif yn GIG Cymru yn y lle cyntaf. Mae'n fy nhristáu, pan ddarllenwch ragair y Gweinidog i'r ddogfen honno, neu unrhyw ran o'r wybodaeth gefndir am y rhesymau pam yr oeddid yn mynd ati i ailstrwythuro, o weld nad cyflenwi gwasanaethau o'r radd flaenaf er mwyn cyflenwi gofal i gleifion o'r radd flaenaf oedd y sail resymegol a gynigiwyd erioed. Mae hynny'n drist, oherwydd y mae'n anfon y neges anghywir. Mae'n dweud wrth bobl Cymru mai dim ond oherwydd rhyw gamddealltwriaeth ideolegol ynghylch beth oedd y farchnad fewnol ac a oedd gennym farchnad fewnol yn gweithredu o gwbl yn y GIG yr aethpwyd ati i ailstrwythuro. Dylai'r Llywodraeth fod wedi dechrau o'r safbwynt ei bod yn mynd ati i ailstrwythuro er mwyn darparu gwell gofal i gleifion. Byddai hynny wedi bod yn bwysig, ac mae'n flin gennyf i'r Llywodraeth ddewis peidio â dilyn y trywydd hwnnw. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi cyflwyno ein gwelliant cyntaf.

Mae a wnelo gwelliant 5 gennym â rôl y Gweinidog. Ni fydd yn synnu fy mod yn ailadrodd fy mhryder ynglŷn â'r Gweinidog yn cadeirio bwrdd cynghori Cymru gyfan. Efallai fod y cynnig ei bod hi'n cadeirio'r bwrdd hwnnw yn cyd-fynd â'i hagwedd bersonol hi fel Gweinidog, ac efallai ei fod yn cyd-fynd â'r ffordd y mae hi'n credu y dylai'r berthynas rhwng y Llywodraeth a'r



afraid that it will allow further politicisation of the health service. This situation is unhealthy, it misunderstands the crucial relationship between Government and the NHS, it misunderstands the fundamentals of the workings of the national health service, and it misunderstands the role of Minister for health, or of any other Minister, in the Assembly Government.

Minister, I strongly believe that you ought to concentrate on the big public health challenges that we have in Wales, such as the challenges of delivering better cancer services, of tackling obesity and diabetes, of people drinking too much, and of children taking too little exercise, instead of signing off the order forms for the paper clips that will be needed in the daily running of the national health service. You fail to understand the relationship between Government and the NHS, as well as your role in setting the overall strategy. In chairing this board, you will find it difficult to focus on the other big public health challenges that you, as Minister, need to be concerned about.

Our amendment 6 is on the timetable. I said to you last week that I felt that next April was unrealistic. I am not saying that you cannot reach it, as you could well reach it, but we could see some of the mistakes that we saw in Health Commission Wales being repeated if this new, big reorganisation programme is rushed through. That is why we urge the Government to look at a shadow period. I know that that in itself can be complicated, but it would allow some additional time for the Government, clinicians and managers to get used to what the NHS will look like from next year onwards. We urge the Government to be cautious, otherwise it will end up with a huge number of problems, as was the case with Health Commission Wales.

Finally, I point out my concern about the costs. You have already said that you will write off the £40 million debt for the Hywel Dda NHS Trust, provided that it breaks even

GIG ddatblygu, ond mae arnaf ofn y bydd yn caniatáu gwleidyddoli pellach ar y gwasanaeth iechyd. Mae'r sefyllfa hon yn afiach, mae'n camddeall y berthynas hanfodol rhwng y Llywodraeth a'r GIG, mae'n camddeall yr hanfodion o ran sut y mae'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yn gweithio, ac mae'n camddeall rôl y Gweinidog dros iechyd, neu unrhyw Weinidog arall, yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Weinidog, credaf yn gryf y dylech ganolbwyntio ar yr heriau mawr ym maes iechyd cyhoeddus sydd gennym yng Nghymru, megis heriau darparu gwell gwasanaethau canser, mynd i'r afael â gordewdra a diabetes, pobl yn yfed gormod, a phlant yn cael rhy ychydig o ymarfer corff, yn hytrach na llofnodi ffurflenni archeb am y clipiau papur y bydd eu hangen wrth redeg y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol o ddydd i ddydd. Nid ydych yn deall y berthynas rhwng y Llywodraeth a'r GIG, yn ogystal â'ch rôl chi o ran pennu'r strategaeth gyffredinol. Wrth gadeirio'r bwrdd hwn, byddwch yn ei chael yn anodd canolbwyntio ar yr heriau mawr eraill ym maes iechyd cyhoeddus y dylech chi, fel Gweinidog, fod yn poeni amdanynt.

Mae a wnelo gwelliant 6 gennym â'r amserlen. Dywedais wrthyhch yr wythnos diwethaf fy mod yn teimlo bod mis Ebrill nesaf yn afrealistig. Nid wyf yn dweud na allwch ei gyrraedd, gan ei bod yn bosibl iawn y gwnewch ei gyrraedd, ond gallem weld rhai o'r camgymeriadau a welsom yng Nghomisiwn Iechyd Cymru yn cael eu haildrodd os caiff y rhaglen ad-drefnu fawr, newydd hon ei gweithredu ar frys. Dyna pam yr ydym yn annog y Llywodraeth i ystyried cyfnod cysgodol. Gwn fod hynny ynddo'i hun yn gallu bod yn gymhleth, ond byddai'n caniatáu rhywfaint o amser ychwanegol i'r Llywodraeth, y clinigwyr a'r rheolwyr i ymgyfarwyddo â phatrwm y GIG o'r flwyddyn nesaf ymlaen. Anogwn y Llywodraeth i fod yn wyladwrus, neu gallai wynebu nifer enfawr o broblemau, fel a ddigwyddodd gyda Chomisiwn Iechyd Cymru.

Yn olaf, yr wyf yn tynnu sylw at fy mhryder ynglŷn â'r costau. Yr ydych eisoes wedi dweud y byddwch yn dileu'r ddyled o £40 miliwn ar gyfer Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Hywel

at the end of this financial year. Are you doing the same for other merged trusts? Are you writing off local health boards' debts? Will you write off the Health Commission Wales's debt? What will the cost outlay of this restructuring be, and what will the cost savings be, if any? We need to know what the cost of the programme will be. That is fundamentally important.

I am grateful for the opportunity to contribute to this debate. We do not feel that this restructuring goes far enough to put clinicians in the driving seat. It does not make the NHS more innovative, and it does nothing to expand patient choice. We shall not support the motion if it is not amended.

**Val Lloyd:** One of the NHS's strengths continues to be its ability to adapt to the changing needs of patients. I therefore welcome the recent evaluation of existing service operations under the 'One Wales' agreement. I welcome even more the abolition of the remnants of competitive tendering, and the increased emphasis on co-operation for the benefit of patients. I hope that that is the last that we will hear of competitive tendering.

I agree with the desirability of the six benefits sought from restructuring, as discussed in the Minister's paper, and I see those as being allied to the quality of service delivery for patients across the country.

There are many components necessary for a truly effective health service, including the need for the opinions of those who use it to be adequately considered. I see these opinions as facilitating the creation of a refined Welsh NHS system and the effective development of the seven unified delivery bodies. I hope that the date of April 2009 is realistic, and I would value the Minister's comments, not necessarily today, but in the near future on that subject.

Last week, when the Minister made a statement on this reorganisation, I sought

Dda, ar yr amod y bydd yn mantoli'r cyfrifon ar ddiwedd y flwyddyn ariannol hon. A ydych yn gwneud hynny hefyd i ymddiriedolaethau eraill sydd wedi uno? A ydych yn dileu dyledion byrddau iechyd lleol? A wnewch ddileu dyled Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru? Beth fydd cost yr ailstrwythuro hwn, a beth fydd yr arbedion o ran costau, os bydd rhai? Mae angen inni wybod beth fydd cost y rhaglen. Mae hynny'n sylfaenol bwysig.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle i gyfrannu at y ddatl hon. Nid ydym yn teimlo bod yr ailstrwythuro hwn yn mynd yn ddigon pell i beri mai clinigwyr sydd wrth y llyw. Nid yw'n gwneud y GIG yn fwy arloesol, ac nid yw'n gwneud dim i ehangu'r dewis i gleifion. Ni fyddwn yn cefnogi'r cynnig oni chaiff ei newid.

**Val Lloyd:** Un o gryfderau'r GIG o hyd yw ei allu i ymaddasu i anghenion cleifion, a'r rheini'n anghenion sy'n newid. Yr wyf felly'n croesawu'r gwerthusiad yn ddiweddar o'r gweithrediadau gwasanaeth presennol o dan gytundeb 'Cymru'n Un'. Yr wyf yn rhoi mwy fyth o groeso i ddileu gweddillion tendro cystadleuol, a'r pwyslais cynyddol ar gydweithredu er budd cleifion. Gobeithiaf na chlywn eto am dendro cystadleuol.

Cytunaf fod y chwe mantais a geisir drwy ailstrwythuro, fel y'u trafodir ym mhapur y Gweinidog, yn fanteision i'w dymuno, a gwelaf berthynas rhyngddynt ac ansawdd y gwasanaethau a ddarperir i gleifion ar draws y wlad.

Rhaid wrth lawer o elfennau i gael gwasanaeth iechyd gwirioneddol effeithiol, gan gynnwys yr angen i farn y rhai sy'n defnyddio'r gwasanaeth gael ei hystyried yn ddigonol. I mi, mae barn y bobl hynny yn hwyluso creu gwell cyfundrefn GIG i Gymru a datblygiad effeithiol y saith corff cyflenwi unedig. Gobeithiaf fod mis Ebrill 2009 yn ddyddiad realistig, a byddwn yn gwerthfawrogi sylwadau'r Gweinidog, nid heddiw o reidrwydd, ond yn y dyfodol agos ar y pwnc hwnnw.

Yr wythnos diwethaf, pan wnaeth y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar yr ad-drefnu hwn,

assurances on how the seven new health bodies would avoid the pitfalls of the previous five large area health authorities, especially their clear lack of basic involvement with the views of service users and an increasingly autocratic approach. I was pleased to hear directly from the Minister that, under the new initiative, annual accountability meetings will be held in public. For me, a public meeting means something different to an annual accountability meeting and, of course, the stakeholder boards will potentially be established, merging patients with professionals. I look forward to a robust exchange of views at the annual meetings, and I hope that a climate will be created that will encourage such debate on both sides.

I welcome the fact that community health councils will have an enhanced role to help to identify the specific needs of their areas, and that there will be an according response.

Also of concern to me was the relative importance of primary and secondary healthcare under the new system. Under previous unified health authorities, secondary healthcare was consistently prioritised at the expense of primary healthcare, but they are equally important. I am keen to see that this attitude does not remain as a legacy of the old health network, and I was delighted to learn that Dr Chris Jones, the current chair of Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Health Board, has been asked to look at the primary and community care agenda and to offer guidance on the importance of preventative primary care. I look forward to hearing the results of his work. We all recognise the pivotal role of preventative healthcare that will be central to the success of the new organisations.

I believe that the key to bridging the gap between an impressive proposal on paper and effective practical implementation is ensuring that we achieve a balance across the seven boards. That must be achieved in terms of providing the direct services needed in adequate quantities and by improving patient

gofynnais am sicrwydd ynglŷn â sut y byddai'r saith corff iechyd newydd yn osgoi peryglon y pum awdurdod iechyd ardal mawr blaenorol, yn enwedig oherwydd y diffyg cysylltiad clir rhyngddynt a barn defnyddwyr gwasanaethau a'u ffordd gynyddol unbenaethol o weithredu. Yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed gan y Gweinidog y bydd cyfarfodydd atebolrwydd blynyddol yn cael eu cynnal yn gyhoeddus, o dan y cynllun newydd. I mi, mae cyfarfod cyhoeddus yn golygu rhywbeth gwahanol i gyfarfod atebolrwydd blynyddol ac, wrth gwrs, mae'n bosibl y caiff y byrddau rhanddeiliaid eu sefydlu, gan uno cleifion â gweithwyr proffesiynol. Edrychaf ymlaen at gyfnewid barn yn ddiflwyn ar dafod yn y cyfarfodydd blynyddol, a gobeithiaf y creir hinsawdd a fydd yn annog dadl o'r fath ar y naill ochr a'r llall.

Yr wyf yn croesawu'r ffaith y bydd gan y cyngorau iechyd cymuned rôl ehangach i helpu i ganfod anghenion penodol eu hardaloedd, ac y bydd ymateb yn unol â hynny.

Peth arall a oedd yn peri pryder imi oedd pwysigrwydd cymharol gofal iechyd sylfaenol ac eilaidd o dan y system newydd. O dan yr awdurdodau iechyd unedig blaenorol, yr oedd gofal iechyd eilaidd yn cael ei flaenoriaethu'n gyson ar draul gofal iechyd sylfaenol, ond maent yr un mor bwysig â'i gilydd. Yr wyf yn awyddus i weld nad yw'r agwedd hon yn parhau, wedi'i hetifeddu o'r hen rwydwaith iechyd, ac yr oeddwn wrth fy modd o glywed bod Dr Chris Jones, cadeirydd presennol Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Rhondda Cynon Taf, wedi cael cais i edrych ar yr agenda gofal sylfaenol a chymunedol a chynnig arweiniad ynghylch pwysigrwydd gofal iechyd ataliol. Edrychaf ymlaen at glywed canlyniadau ei waith. Yr ydym i gyd yn cydnabod rôl ganolog gofal iechyd ataliol a fydd yn dyngedfennol i lwyddiant y cyrff newydd.

Credaf mai'r allwedd i bontio'r bwlch rhwng cynnig trawiadol ar bapur a gweithredu ymarferol effeithiol yw sicrhau ein bod yn cael cydbwysedd ar draws y saith bwrdd. Rhaid i hynny gael ei gyflawni o safbwynt darparu digon o'r gwasanaethau uniongyrchol y mae eu hangen a hefyd drwy

and care provider mediation. Governance of the new organisations will need to ensure effective corporate management while continuing to engage users and other stakeholders in their decision-making processes.

From what I understand of the NHS restructuring process so far, the need for improved communication on all fronts has been centralised as a vital component, and, for me, that is a cause for optimism.

**Mark Isherwood:** Like most people, my family relies on a universal, comprehensive national health service that is funded by taxpayers and is free at the point of delivery. However, patient service and resource efficiency can only be achieved when clinical judgment is free of political control. Furthermore, the priority must be smart spending and best outcomes for patients, whichever sector—public, private or voluntary—may deliver them as agents of our national health service.

The submission on NHS restructuring by Conwy and Denbighshire NHS Trust rightly said that the national board's role should be to translate Assembly Government policy imperatives into policy direction, and to advise the Assembly Government on the consequent development of future policy. It added that local boards should develop local policy in the light of national board requirements and deliver services accordingly.

The submission by the North East Wales NHS Trust rightly expressed a belief in a national board that would clearly distinguish policy from delivery, providing clarity on roles and responsibilities in terms of the Assembly Government and the NHS.

As the Minister's statement acknowledged, the majority of respondents—the front-line experts—believe in an arm's-length relationship between the Minister and the NHS. Simply to state that she disagrees and that she will take the chair of a national advisory board therefore raises serious questions about her judgment.

wella'r cyfryngu i gleifion a darparwyr gofal. Bydd angen i drefn lywodraethu'r cyrff newydd sicrhau rheolaeth gorfforaethol effeithiol ac, ar yr un pryd, parhau i roi llais i ddefnyddwyr a rhanddeiliaid eraill yn eu prosesau penderfynu.

Yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf am broses ailstrwythuro'r GIG hyd yma, mae'r angen am well cyfathrebu ym mhob agwedd wedi cael ei ganoli fel elfen hanfodol, ac, i mi, mae hynny'n achos optimistaeth.

**Mark Isherwood:** Fel y rhan fwyaf o bobl, mae fy nheulu'n dibynnu ar wasanaeth iechyd gwladol cynhwysfawr, i bawb, a gyllidir gan drethdalwyr ac sy'n rhad ac am ddim yn y man darparu. Fodd bynnag, dim ond pan na fydd rheolaeth wleidyddol ynglŷn â barnu clinigol y gellir sicrhau gwasanaeth i gleifion ac effeithlonrwydd o ran adnoddau. Ar ben hynny, rhaid rhoi'r flaenoriaeth i wario'n ddoeth a chael y canlyniadau gorau i gleifion, pa sector bynnag—cyhoeddus, preifat neu wirfoddol—sy'n eu darparu fel asiantau'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol.

Dywedodd cyflwyniad Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Conwy a Sir Ddinbych ar ailstrwythuro'r GIG yn gwbl gywir mai'r hyn a ddylai fod yn briod rôl i'r bwrdd cenedlaethol ydyw trosi gorchmynion polisi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gyfeiriad polisi, a rhoi cyngor i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ynghylch datblygu polisi'r dyfodol yn sgîl hynny. Ychwanegodd y dylai byrddau lleol ddatblygu polisi lleol yng ngoleuni gofynion y bwrdd cenedlaethol a darparu gwasanaethau yn unol â hynny.

Mynegodd cyflwyniad gan Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gogledd Ddwyrain Cymru yn gwbl gywir gred mewn bwrdd cenedlaethol a fyddai'n gwahaniaethu'n glir rhwng polisi a darparu, gan roi eglurder ynglŷn â rolau a chyfrifoldebau o safbwynt Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r GIG.

Fel yr oedd datganiad y Gweinidog yn cydnabod, mae mwyafrif y rhai a ymatebodd—yr arbenigwyr rheng flaen—yn credu mewn perthynas hyd braich rhwng y Gweinidog a'r GIG. Mae dweud ei bod hi'n anghytuno ac y bydd hi'n cadeirio bwrdd cynghori cenedlaethol o'r herwydd yn codi cwestiynau difrifol ynghylch ei barn.

5.00 p.m.

**Gareth Jones:** If we had had an accessible Minister or a system that would have allowed us to access the Minister in terms of accountability and the advisory group, we would have avoided the chaos that ensued from the hospital reconfiguration. Surely, you must see that there is some benefit in this restructuring.

**Mark Isherwood:** There clearly is some benefit to restructuring but I state again that doing this by way of a centralised government diktat—there is a risk of that and it will certainly be perceived in that way—will not be conducive to a positive outcome.

If the Minister believes that her powerful presence will generate objective and independent debate among board-members, then she is living in cloud-cuckoo-land.

Although the Minister has confirmed that the boards of the seven unified delivery bodies will be appointed under normal public appointment procedures, there must also be concern that she will lead the appointment of chairs and vice-chairs and that she will personally appoint a vice-chair to each body responsible for primary, community and mental health services. These de facto powers of patronage cannot be conducive to the independent thought and action needed.

As the former North East Wales NHS Trust has stated, the priority must be to ensure the integration of community mental health and acute services. It also stated that there must be a balance between the tight responsibilities of the boards and the need for local and community engagement.

The Minister states that independent members will be recruited on the basis of their experience in local government, the voluntary sector and the social partners. Let us hope that the social partners will include the private sector if that is where the

**Gareth Jones:** Petai gennym Weinidog hawdd cael gafael arni neu system a fuasai'n caniatáu inni gael gafael ar y Gweinidog o ran atebolrwydd a'r grŵp cynghori, byddem wedi osgoi'r anrhefn a ddaeth yn sgil ad-drefnu'r ysbytai. Mae'n rhaid eich bod yn gweld y daw rhyw fudd o'r ailstrwythuro hwn.

**Mark Isherwood:** Mae'n amlwg bod ailstrwythuro'n cynnig rhyw fudd ond ailadroddaf na fydd gwneud hyn drwy fodd dictad llywodraeth wedi'i ganoli—ceir risg o hynny a bydd yn sicr yn cael ei weld yn y modd hwnnw—yn arwain at ganlyniad cadarnhaol.

Os cred y Gweinidog y bydd ei phresenoldeb pwerus yn cynhyrchu dadl wrthrychol ac annibynnol ymhlith aelodau bwrdd, mae â'i phen yn y cymylau.

Er bod y Gweinidog wedi cadarnhau y bydd byrddau'r saith corff darparu unedig yn cael eu penodi o dan weithdrefnau penodi cyhoeddus arferol, mae'n rhaid bod pryder hefyd y bydd hithau'n arwain gwaith penodi cadeiryddion ac is-gadeiryddion ac y bydd hithau'n bersonol yn penodi is-gadeirydd i bob corff sy'n gyfrifol am wasanaethau iechyd sylfaenol, cymunedol ac iechyd meddwl. Ni all y pwerau nawdd mewn ffaith hyn arwain at y meddwl a'r gweithredu annibynnol y mae eu hangen.

Fel y dywedodd Ymddiriedolaeth GIG flaenorol Gogledd Ddwyrain Cymru, mae'n rhaid rhoi blaenoriaeth i sicrhau bod gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl ac aciwt cymunedol yn cael eu cyfannu. Nododd hefyd ei bod yn rhaid cael cydbwysedd rhwng cyfrifoldebau tynn y byrddau a'r angen am ymgysylltu lleol ac ymgysylltu â'r gymuned.

Dywed y Gweinidog y bydd aelodau annibynnol yn cael eu recriwtio ar sail eu profiad mewn llywodraeth leol, y sector gwirfoddol a'r partneriaid cymdeithasol. Gadewch inni obeithio y bydd y partneriaid cymdeithasol yn cynnwys y sector preifat os

expertise is. In responding to the Minister's statement, hospices have expressed concern that the voice of the voluntary sector should not be lost within a bigger organisation. Similarly, the Wales Neurological Alliance has stated that it would like the voluntary sector to choose its representatives on the national advisory board and for mechanisms to be in place to ensure that those representatives reflect the concerns of the sector as equitably as possible. The alliance also asks for reassurance that people living with specialist conditions will still be heard and provided for within these larger regional structures, and that there will be parity for the social care that needs to go hand-in-hand with the healthcare for these types of conditions.

While welcoming the report on adult neuroscience services in north Wales, the alliance questions the proposal for non-complex spinal surgery services in north Wales, as a centre of excellence exists across the border. Wider cross-border issues, such as the dispute over funding arrangements highlighted by the Countess of Chester Hospital, must be acknowledged and addressed. Questions also remain about the practical integration of the North West Wales NHS Trust into the new North Wales NHS Trust.

Following last week's debate on community pharmacy, the Royal Pharmaceutical Society has stated that NHS restructuring in Wales must ensure that the expertise of the pharmacy profession is recognised at the highest level within the new organisations. Population increases mean that earlier recommendations on neonatal care in north Wales need to be reconsidered.

We must also ask the Minister to address the unfairness in her announcement that historic debts will be cancelled if the Hywel Dda NHS Trust breaks even, but that the North Wales NHS Trust will need to achieve a £3 million surplus if its historic debts are to be cancelled—presumably that money would have to come from front-line services.

dyna ymhle mae'r arbenigedd. Wrth ymateb i ddatganiad y Gweinidog, mae hosbisau wedi mynegi pryder na ddylid colli llais y sector gwirfoddol mewn sefydliad mwy. Yn yr un modd, mae Cynghair Niwrolegol Cymru wedi datgan yr hoffai petai'r sector gwirfoddol yn dewis ei gynrychiolwyr ar y bwrdd cynghori cenedlaethol a phetai mecanweithiau ar waith i sicrhau bod y cynrychiolwyr hynny'n adlewyrchu pryderon y sector mor deg â phosibl. Mae'r gynghair hefyd yn gofyn am sicrhau y bydd pobl sy'n byw â chyflyrau arbenigol yn cael eu clywed o hyd ac y darperir ar eu cyfer o hyd yn y strwythurau rhanbarthol mwy hyn, ac y bydd cydraddoldeb ar gyfer y gofal cymdeithasol y mae angen iddo fynd law yn llaw â'r gofal iechyd ar gyfer y mathau hyn o gyflyrau.

Er bod y gynghair yn croesawu'r adroddiad am wasanaethau niwrowyddoniaeth oedolion yn y gogledd, mae'n cwestiynu'r cynnig am wasanaethau llawdriniaeth sbinol heb fod yn gymhleth yn y gogledd, gan fod canolfan ragoriaeth ar gael dros y ffin. Mae'n rhaid cydnabod a mynd i'r afael â materion trawsffiniol ehangach, fel yr anghydfod ynghylch trefniadau cyllid a amlygwyd gan Ysbyty Iarllles Caer. Mae cwestiynau o hyd ynghylch cyfannu Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gogledd Orllewin Cymru yn ymarferol yn Ymddiriedolaeth GIG newydd Gogledd Cymru.

Ar ôl dadl yr wythnos diwethaf am fferylliaeth gymunedol, mae'r Gymdeithas Fferyllol Frenhinol wedi nodi ei bod yn rhaid i'r gwaith i ailstrwythuro'r GIG yng Nghymru sicrhau bod arbenigedd y proffesiwn fferylliaeth yn cael ei gydnabod ar y lefel uchaf yn y sefydliadau newydd. Mae twf yn y boblogaeth yn golygu bod angen ailystyried argymhellion cynharach am ofal newyddenedigol yn y gogledd.

Mae'n rhaid hefyd inni ofyn i'r Gweinidog fynd i'r afael â'r annhegwch yn ei chyhoeddiad y bydd dyledion hanesyddol yn cael eu diddymu os bydd Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Hywel Dda yn adennill ei chostau, ond y bydd yn rhaid i Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gogledd Cymru gyflawni gwarged o £3 miliwn er mwyn diddymu ei dyledion hanesyddol—gellid tybio y byddai'n rhaid i'r arian hwnnw ddod o wasanaethau rheng

flaen.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I am pleased to support this motion and warmly welcome the Minister's restructuring proposals.

The effect of these reforms will be to reduce bureaucracy and to put in place clear, accountable, democratic and transparent decision making in our health service. It will further release resources from administration to front-line care, and it will enable the Minister to ensure the delivery of the 'One Wales' commitment to preventative and primary care.

There are issues that will need to be addressed and the opposition and other Members in this Chamber have been right to raise these. For example, we must ensure that the reforms do not weaken links between health and social care where good links have been established. We must further ensure that, where these links have not been established, they are established as a matter of urgency, by ring-fencing resources if necessary.

We must ensure that disruption is kept to a minimum as these reforms are introduced, and that the real changes on the ground that the One Wales Government is delivering in our health services, such as the major investment in the breast care centre at Prince Phillip Hospital, Llanelli are not delayed. We must ensure that the voice of communities in the health service is strengthened through strengthening and empowering community health councils.

The Minister has been quite clear that she is well aware of these challenges and is taking steps to address them. She has been particularly clear about an enhanced role for community health councils, so I am somewhat at a loss in trying to understand the hostile reaction to some of these reforms that has come from the opposition. Of course, we should expect the Tories to mourn the demise of their quangos and the end of the wasteful and, as Jonathan Morgan has acknowledged, in Wales, largely ineffective, market mechanisms that their ideologically driven health policy put in place in the 1980s.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yr wyf yn falch o gefnogi'r cynnig hwn ac yn croesawu cynigion ailstrwythuro'r Gweinidog yn frwd.

Effaith y diwygiadau hyn fydd lleihau biwrocratiaeth a gosod prosesau penderfynu clir, atebol, democrataidd a thryloyw yn ein gwasanaeth iechyd. Bydd yn rhyddhau adnoddau pellach o waith gweinyddu i ofal rheng flaen, a bydd yn galluogi'r Gweinidog i sicrhau y cyflawnir ymrwymiad 'Cymru'n Un' i ofal ataliol a gofal sylfaenol.

Mae angen mynd i'r afael â rhai materion a bu'r wrthblaid ac Aelodau eraill yn y Siambr hon yn gywir i godi'r rhain. Er enghraifft, mae'n rhaid inni sicrhau nad yw'r diwygiadau'n gwanhau cysylltiadau rhwng iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol lle bydd cysylltiadau da wedi'u sefydlu. Mae'n rhaid inni sicrhau ymhellach fod y cysylltiadau hyn yn cael eu sefydlu ar frys, os na chawsant eu sefydlu eisoes, a hynny drwy neilltuo adnoddau os oes angen.

Mae'n rhaid inni sicrhau cyn lleied â phosibl o aflonyddwch wrth gyflwyno'r diwygiadau hyn, a sicrhau na fydd oedi gyda'r newidiadau gwirioneddol ar lawr gwlad y mae Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un yn eu cyflawni yn ein gwasanaethau iechyd, fel y buddsoddiad mawr yn y ganolfan gofal y fron yn Ysbyty Tywysog Phillip, Llanelli. Mae'n rhaid inni sicrhau bod llais cymunedau yn y gwasanaeth iechyd yn cael ei gryfhau drwy gryfhau a grymuso cynghorau iechyd cymuned.

Bu'r Gweinidog yn eithaf clir ei bod yn gwbl ymwybodol o'r heriau hyn a'i bod yn cymryd camau i fynd i'r afael â hwy. Bu'n benodol glir ynghylch rôl uwch i gynghorau iechyd cymuned, felly yr wyf yn drysu rhywfaint wrth geisio deall yr ymateb gwrthwynebus i rai o'r diwygiadau hyn sydd wedi dod o'r wrthblaid. Wrth reswm, dylem ddisgwyl i'r Torïaid alaru dros dranc eu cwangos a diwedd y mecanweithiau marchnad gwastraffus ac, fel y cydnabu Jonathan Morgan, yng Nghymru, aneffeithiol i raddau helaeth a weithredodd eu polisi iechyd dan ddylanwad ideoleg yn y 1980au. Fodd

However, I simply cannot understand why they and the Liberal Democrats are apparently so shocked at the idea of open, democratic decision making.

In my previous incarnation as shadow Minister for health and as a representative of local communities, I have in the past frequently been driven almost to distraction by the stock response to every health question: 'That is an operational matter for such and such a health quango.', a response that begged the following questions. Who appointed the trust board members? Who decided on the structures of the local health boards? Who set the targets for the service? Who controlled all the budgets? The answer to those questions has always been 'Ministers; politicians', but, in the past, Ministers were able to hide behind quangos, deny responsibility and pass the buck. In the past, I have believed that the Liberal Democrats and Conservatives have shared that frustration about the lack of clear accountability. Now, we have a Minister and a Government that are ready to step forward and take responsibility, to take the flak when the flak comes and to say clearly that the buck stops here. However, when the Minister steps forward to do that, she is vilified as a control freak.

**David Melding:** We have all been in the position of having to take up very difficult cases on behalf of our constituents. The current protocol is that you write to the chief executive of the health body concerned and ask for an explanation of why this has happened in these operational areas. From now on, you will be writing to the Minister: is that your understanding?

**Helen Mary Jones:** My understanding is that one would approach the local delivery board in the first instance. However, if you found that you were not getting a satisfactory answer, you would be able to ask the question, as one has in the past, in the Chamber, only now, instead of the Minister saying that it is an operational matter for the delivery board, she or he will be answerable. I think that that is a step forward. I know, David Melding, that you have been as frustrated as I have by ministerial buck-

bynag, ni allaf ddeall o gwbl pam y maent hwy a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn ymddangos mor syn ynghylch syniad penderfyniadau agored, democrataidd.

Yn fy ymgnawdoliad blaenorol fel Gweinidog yr wrthblaid dros iechyd ac fel cynrychiolydd cymunedau lleol, fe'm gyrrwyd bron yn wallgof yn aml yn y gorffennol gan yr hen ymateb i bob mater iechyd: 'Mater gweithredol yw hwnnw i ba bynnag gwango iechyd', ymateb a oedd yn codi'r cwestiynau canlynol. Pwy a benododd aelodau bwrdd yr ymddiriedolaeth? Pwy a benderfynodd ar strwythurau'r byrddau iechyd lleol? Pwy a osododd y targedau i'r gwasanaeth? Pwy a reolodd yr holl gyllidebau? Yr ateb bob amser i'r cwestiynau hynny fu 'Gweinidogion; gwleidyddion', ond, yn y gorffennol, gallai Gweinidogion guddio y tu ôl i gwangos, gwadu cyfrifoldeb a thaflu'r baich. Yn y gorffennol, credais fod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a'r Ceidwadwyr wedi rhannu'r rhwystredigaeth honno am y diffyg atebolrwydd clir. Erbyn hyn, mae gennym Weinidog a Llywodraeth sy'n barod i gamu ymlaen a chymryd cyfrifoldeb, derbyn y feirniadaeth pan ddaw a dweud yn glir mai yma mae'r cyfrifoldeb. Fodd bynnag, pan fydd y Gweinidog yn camu ymlaen i wneud hynny, caiff ei diffrïo fel cythraul rheoli.

**David Melding:** Buom i gyd yn y sefyllfa o orfod cyflwyno achosion anodd iawn ar ran ein hetholwyr. Y protocol cyfredol yw eich bod yn ysgrifennu at brif weithredwr y bwrdd iechyd dan sylw ac yn gofyn iddo egluro pam y mae hyn wedi digwydd yn y meysydd gweithredol hyn. O hyn ymlaen, byddwch yn ysgrifennu at y Gweinidog: ai dyna eich dealltwriaeth?

**Helen Mary Jones:** Caf ar ddeall y byddai rhywun yn mynd at y bwrdd darparu lleol yn y lle cyntaf. Fodd bynnag, pe byddech yn canfod nad oeddech yn cael ateb boddhaol, gallech ofyn y cwestiwn, fel y mae rhywun wedi'i wneud yn y gorffennol, yn y Siambr, ond yn awr, yn hytrach na'r Gweinidog yn dweud mai mater gweithredol i'r bwrdd darparu ydyw, bydd ef neu hi'n atebol. Yr wyf yn credu mai cam ymlaen yw hynny. Gwn, David Melding, y buoch mor anfodlon â minnau ar y taflu baich gweinidogol yn y



passing in the past on several very important health and care issues.

So, we have our Minister being vilified as a control freak, but I need to ask the opposition who they think should be making decisions in health. Of course, the staff have and always will have a key role to play. In terms of day-to-day clinical decision making, it is the clinical staff who must make the decisions, not number-crunchers and bureaucrats.

**Jenny Randerson:** Do you not acknowledge, from your perspective as a constituency Assembly Member, that when constituents come to you in future it will be more difficult to persuade them that any issues and problems they have with regard to, say, waiting lists can be explained as an issue of clinical priorities, when they can see overt political control?

**Helen Mary Jones:** I do not accept that, because the political control—and I will come to this shortly—has always been there any way. It has been a case of people hiding behind the arm's-length principle and not being prepared to make decisions. Of course, there will always be difficult decisions to make on priorities in the NHS, but I think that politicians should take responsibility for those. I am sure that the Minister will ensure that the advice of staff is heard and is right at the heart of key clinical decision making and strategic decision making. However, we cannot allow staff alone to determine the overall strategic direction. The term for that is 'provider-capture', and anyone who has ever worked in the public services or knows anything about them knows how dangerous that can be.

So, should it be professional managers and nominated boards who make those decisions? Again, they will have a vital role to play in future under the Minister's proposals. However, in the end, to whom are they answerable? In truth, they have always been answerable, covertly, to those who appoint them, and those who appoint them are politicians. Now, that will be clear and transparent. The Minister is being clear about

gorffennol ar nifer o faterion iechyd a gofal pwysig iawn.

Felly, caiff ein Gweinidog ei difrio am fod yn gythraul rheoli, ond mae angen imi ofyn i'r wrthblaid bwy y mae'n credu y dylai fod yn gwneud penderfyniadau mewn iechyd. Wrth reswm, mae gan y staff rôl allweddol i'w chwarae, rôl a fydd ganddynt bob amser. O ran gwneud penderfyniadau clinigol bob dydd, y staff clinigol sy'n gorfod gwneud y penderfyniadau, nid y rhai sy'n ymhél â ffigurau na biwrocratiaid.

**Jenny Randerson:** Onid ydych yn cydnabod, o'ch safbwynt chi fel Aelod Cynulliad etholaeth, y bydd yn anos pan ddaw etholwyr atoch yn y dyfodol i'w perswadio y gellir egluro unrhyw faterion a phroblemau sydd ganddynt ynghylch, dyweder, rhestri aros fel mater o flaenoriaethau clinigol, pan allant weld rheolaeth wleidyddol eglur?

**Helen Mary Jones:** Nid wyf yn derbyn hynny, oherwydd bu'r rheolaeth wleidyddol—a byddaf yn dod at hyn cyn hir—yno erioed beth bynnag. Bu pobl yn cuddio y tu ôl i'r egwyddor hyd braich heb fod yn barod i wneud penderfyniadau. Wrth reswm, bydd penderfyniadau anodd eu gwneud bob amser am flaenoriaethau yn y GIG, ond credaf y dylai gwleidyddion fod yn gyfrifol am y rheini. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd y Gweinidog yn sicrhau y caiff cyngor staff ei glywed a'i fod wrth wraidd penderfyniadau clinigol allweddol a phenderfyniadau strategol. Fodd bynnag, ni allwn ganiatáu i staff yn unig bennu'r cyfeiriad strategol cyffredinol. Y term am hynny yw 'dal darparwr', ac mae unrhyw un a weithiodd erioed yn y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus neu'n gwybod unrhyw beth amdanynt yn gwybod pa mor beryglus y gall hynny fod.

Felly, ai rheolwyr proffesiynol a byrddau enwebedig a ddylai wneud y penderfyniadau hynny? Eto, bydd ganddynt rôl hanfodol i'w chwarae yn y dyfodol o dan gynigion y Gweinidog. Fodd bynnag, yn y pen draw, i bwy y maent yn atebol? Mewn gwirionedd, buont erioed yn atebol, dan gél, i'r rheini sy'n eu penodi, a gwleidyddion sy'n eu penodi. Erbyn hyn, bydd hynny'n glir ac yn dryloyw. Mae'r Gweinidog yn glir am bwy y mae'n ei

whom she appoints and how she appoints them, and I think that that is a step forward. Of course, managers and nominated boards will have a role to play, but, for me, the key point is that it has not been possible to question them and they cannot be removed by the people.

5.10 p.m.

Only politicians can be removed by the people and that is why it is right and proper that strategic decisions should be made by politicians, whom the people can sack. It is right for the Minister to chair the national board, and it saddens me to hear the opposition using the words 'political' and 'politics' as if they are somehow grubby and disreputable; if we swap 'politics' for 'democracy', we get a different feel.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You are out of time, Helen Mary, even allowing for your taking two interventions. You have one sentence.

**Helen Mary Jones:** It was a political decision that established the NHS, and a series of political decisions from Tory market mechanisms to London New Labour target mania have nearly ruined it. This political decision and others made by the One Wales Government have restored the NHS to its true purpose of serving people and communities, and I urge the Chamber to support the motion.

**Kirsty Williams:** As you know, Minister, Powys is different. Its health structure has been unique since the last reorganisation; it has been both a commissioner and a provider of services for many years, and has faced the challenge of delivering for a relatively small population across a huge geographic area. Powys does not have its own district general hospital, which has led to complex commissioning arrangements with organisations across its borders, including with organisations in England. Instead, we have a range of much loved community hospitals.

benodi a sut y mae'n ei benodi, a chredaf fod hynny'n gam ymlaen. Wrth reswm, bydd gan reolwyr a byrddau enwebedig rôl i'w chwarae, ond, i mi, yr hyn sy'n allweddol yw na fu'n bosibl eu cwestiynu ac ni all y bobl gael gwared â hwy.

Dim ond gwleidyddion y gall y bobl gael gwared â hwy a dyna pam y mae'n gywir ac yn briodol y dylai penderfyniadau strategol gael eu gwneud gan wleidyddion, y gall y bobl eu diswyddo. Mae'n gywir bod y Gweinidog yn cadeirio'r bwrdd cenedlaethol, ac mae'n fy nicalonni clywed yr wrthblaid yn defnyddio'r geiriau 'gwleidyddol' a 'gwleidyddiaeth' fel petaent rywfodd yn frwnt ac yn warthus; os newidiwn 'wleidyddiaeth' am 'ddemocratiaeth', yr ydym yn cael gwahanol deimlad.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae eich amser ar ben, Helen Mary, hyd yn oed ac ystyried eich bod wedi cymryd dau ymyriad. Mae gennych un frawddeg.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Penderfyniad gwleidyddol a sefydlodd y GIG, ac mae cyfres o benderfyniadau gwleidyddol gan fecanweithiau marchnad Torïaidd i obsesiwn Llafur Newydd Llundain â thargedau bron wedi'i ddifetha. Mae'r penderfyniad gwleidyddol hwn ac eraill a wnaethpwyd gan Lywodraeth Cymru'n Un wedi adfer y GIG i'w wir ddiben o wasanaethu pobl a chymunedau, ac yr wyf yn erfyn ar y Siambr i gefnogi'r cynnig.

**Kirsty Williams:** Fel y gwyddoch, Weinidog, mae Powys yn wahanol. Bu ei strwythur iechyd yn unigryw ers yr ad-drefnu diwethaf; bu'n gomisiynydd ac yn ddarparwr gwasanaethau ers blynyddoedd lawer, ac mae wedi wynebu'r her o ddarparu ar gyfer poblogaeth gymharol fach ar draws ardal ddaeryddol enfawr. Nid oes gan Powys ei hysbyty cyffredinol dosbarth ei hun, sydd wedi arwain at drefniadau comisiynu cymhleth gyda sefydliadau ar draws ei ffiniau, gan gynnwys sefydliadau yn Lloegr. Yn hytrach, mae gennym amrywiaeth o ysbytai cymunedol tra hoff.

The system in Powys has not been without its problems and difficulties. The issues around clinical governance are well known, and the board is beginning to address them. There have also been considerable financial pressures. However, whatever the problems have been, they have been our problems. They have been managed by local people on behalf of the rest of the population of Powys. My constituents have been greatly reassured by the fact that the board members making decisions on behalf of their health service are local people who understand the uniqueness of Powys. I believe that you also recognise the uniqueness of Powys, and that it will continue to be recognised in the new structures that you are proposing. However, I am sure you will agree that, potentially, Powys could become a small part of a much larger jigsaw, and I seek your assurance that any national board will consider the needs of my constituents, those of my colleague Mick Bates and of the others who have been elected by the people of the Powys and take forward their concerns in its decision-making process.

It is not good enough to assume that all services can be delivered by a district general hospital. I look for assurance that services will continue to be delivered as locally as possible. I note with interest your decisions with regard to paying off the debts of some NHS organisations. Can you clarify the situation with regard to the debts of Powys Local Health Board? I would also welcome your taking the opportunity today to reaffirm your support for the principle that, for some patients in Powys, treatment across the border in hospitals such as Hereford and Shrewsbury will continue to be the best option in terms of ease of access.

Finally, Minister, I believe that, last week, when I was not here, you gave a commitment regarding the community health councils in my area. I know that you are keen to look at the coterminosity of CHCs, but, from the conversations that we have had, I think that you recognise that, in Powys, it is important that we keep the community health council that covers my constituency of Brecon and Radnorshire as well as that which covers Montgomeryshire. If we are to continue to ensure that local people feel that they have a

Ni fu'r system ym Mhowys heb ei phroblemau na'i hanawsterau. Mae'r materion ynghylch llywodraethu clinigol yn hysbys iawn, ac mae'r bwrdd yn dechrau mynd i'r afael â hwy. Bu hefyd pwysau ariannol sylweddol. Fodd bynnag, pa broblemau bynnag a fu, ein problemau ni oeddent. Cawsant eu rheoli gan bobl leol ar ran gweddill poblogaeth Powys. Mae'r ffaith bod aelodau'r bwrdd sy'n gwneud penderfyniadau ar ran eu gwasanaeth iechyd yn bobl leol sy'n deall unigrywiaeth Powys wedi tawelu meddyliau fy etholwyr yn fawr. Yr wyf yn credu eich bod chi hefyd yn cydnabod unigrywiaeth Powys, ac y bydd yn parhau i gael ei chydabod yn y strwythurau newydd a gynigiwch. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch y gallai Powys, efallai, ddod yn rhan fechan o jig-so lawer mwy, a cheisiaf eich sicrhad y bydd unrhyw fwrdd cenedlaethol yn ystyried anghenion fy etholwyr, etholwyr fy nghyd-Aelod Mick Bates ac eraill a etholwyd gan bobl Powys ac yn cyflwyno eu pryderon yn ei broses benderfynu.

Nid yw'n ddigon da tybio y gall ysbyty cyffredinol dosbarth ddarparu pob gwasanaeth. Edrychaf am sicrhad y bydd gwasanaethau'n parhau i gael eu darparu mor lleol â phosibl. Sylwaf â diddordeb ar eich penderfyniadau ynghylch ad-dalu dyledion rhai sefydliadau GIG. A allwch egluro sefyllfa dyledion Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Powys? Byddwn hefyd yn falch o'ch gweld yn achub ar y cyfle heddiw i gadarnhau eto eich cefnogaeth i'r egwyddor mai triniaeth dros y ffin mewn ysbytai fel Henffordd ac Amwythig fydd y dewis gorau o hyd, i rai cleifion ym Mhowys, o ran mynediad hwylus.

Yn olaf, Weinidog, yr wyf yn credu, yr wythnos diwethaf, pan nad oeddwn yma, ichi roi ymrwymiad ynghylch y cynghorau iechyd cymuned yn fy ardal. Gwn eich bod yn awyddus i edrych ar natur gydffiniol cynghorau iechyd cymuned, ond, o'r sgrysiâu a gawsom, yr wyf yn credu eich bod yn cydnabod ei bod yn bwysig, ym Mhowys, inni gadw'r cyngor iechyd cymuned sy'n ymdrin â'm hetholaeth i yn Aberhonddu a Sir Faesyfed yn ogystal â hwnnw sy'n ymdrin â Sir Drefaldwyn. Er mwyn inni barhau i

local connection and that their concerns can be dealt with locally, it is important that that structure, which has worked well for many years and was recognised by the previous Minister for health as being what is needed by Powys, will continue to operate.

**Joyce Watson:** I am confused by the thrust of the opposition parties' arguments this afternoon. The Lib Dems seem unable to grasp why a nationally funded national health service should receive national and accountable direction and the Tories, as amendment 2 clearly shows, seem to want to preserve their corrosive commitment to the destructive internal market in the national health service. Reorganisation of the NHS offers us an opportunity to remove the last vestiges of the internal market and remove the inequality that it necessarily creates.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Will you give way?

**Joyce Watson:** No, I will not.

The Minister told the Assembly in a statement last week that the seven organisations will operate in a way that conforms far more closely to a national pattern, so that local health service arrangements in one part of Wales are recognisably the same as those in other parts of Wales. I want to highlight today—this is why I will not give way; I am going to use my time productively—an example of where better conformity is needed. The Stroke Association runs two rehabilitation services called family and carer support and communication and support, which are funded by the local council or the health board, or both. At the moment, in my area, there is a postcode lottery. Pembrokeshire has a commission to deliver the communication support, while Powys is without either service. The rationalisation of NHS services and the abolition of boundaries between LHBs and trusts, and between on-the-ground care services, will promote more joined-up service provision and will go a long way towards dismantling postcode inequalities. In north Wales, local health boards have already grouped together to deliver these particular

sicrhau bod pobl leol yn teimlo bod ganddynt gysylltiad lleol ac y gellir delio â'u pryderon yn lleol, mae'n bwysig y bydd y strwythur hwnnw, sydd wedi gweithio'n dda am flynyddoedd lawer ac a gydnabuwyd gan y Gweinidog blaenorol ar gyfer iechyd fel yr hyn y mae ei angen ar Bowys, yn parhau i weithredu.

**Joyce Watson:** Mae ergyd dadleuon y gwrthbleidiau wedi fy nrysu'r prynhawn yma. Mae'n debyg nad yw'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn gallu deall pam y dylai gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol a ariennir yn genedlaethol gael cyfarwyddyd cenedlaethol ac atebol ac mae'n debyg bod ar y Toriaid, fel y dengys gwelliant 2 yn amlwg, eisiau diogelu eu hymrwymiad cyrydol i'r farchnad fewnol ddistrywiol yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Mae ad-drefnu'r GIG yn rhoi cyfle inni waredu olion diwethaf y farchnad fewnol a dileu'r anghydraddoldeb y mae'n sicr o'i greu.

**Jonathan Morgan:** A wnewch ildio?

**Joyce Watson:** Na wnaif.

Dywedodd y Gweinidog wrth y Cynulliad mewn datganiad yr wythnos diwethaf y bydd y saith corff yn gweithredu mewn modd sy'n fwy cyson o lawer â phatrwm cenedlaethol, fel y gellir gweld bod trefniadau gwasanaethau iechyd lleol mewn un rhan o Gymru yr un fath â'r rheini mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru. Yr wyf am dynnu sylw heddiw—dyma pam na wnaif ildio; yr wyf am ddefnyddio'r amser sydd gennyf yn fuddiol—at enghraifft lle y mae angen gwell cydymffurfio. Mae'r Gymdeithas Strôc yn rhedeg dau wasanaeth adsefydlu o'r enw cymorth i deuluoedd a gofalwyr a chyfathrebu a chymorth, a ariannir gan y cyngor lleol neu'r bwrdd iechyd, neu'r ddau. Ar hyn o bryd, yn fy ardal i, mae loteri codau post. Mae gan sir Benfro gomisiwn i gyflenwi'r cymorth cyfathrebu, tra nad oes gan Bowys y naill wasanaeth na'r llall. Drwy resymoli gwasanaethau GIG a dileu ffiniau rhwng BILlau ac ymddiriedolaethau, a rhwng gwasanaethau gofal yn y maes, hyrwyddir dull mwy cydgysylltiedig o ddarparu gwasanaethau a chymerir camau bras tuag at ddileu anghydraddoldebau o ran codau post. Yn y gogledd, mae byrddau iechyd lleol wedi

services, something that the Steers review of adult neurosciences recognises as being important. Will the Minister reassure me that, with reorganisation, we can expect better joined-up services, like the one that I have just highlighted?

**Nick Bourne:** I agreed with one point that the Minister made in her typically robust introduction, when she said that we are looking forward to the general election—we certainly are, along with millions of other people, I suspect. If you can believe Helen Mary's figures, up to 4 million people in Wales are taking advantage of free prescriptions—I suspect that they are NHS tourists, given that she inflated the population.

I will concentrate on two aspects of the Minister's proposals. The Minister has always been accountable for the health service. Helen Mary attacked the Conservatives for the direction that we took in office—that is her political view, and she is entitled to it—but it was the direction that we were giving the health service. We were politically responsible then, just as a succession of Ministers have been in this Government. Therefore, I cannot see how chairing this advisory board is necessary. It is not suggested—at least, I hope it is not—that Gordon Brown or Alistair Darling should become the governor of the Bank of England; we would be in an even bigger mess were that the case. Of course they are ultimately responsible for the state of the economy, but they do not act as the governor of the Bank of England, and this is very much the same. Yes, the strategic framework has to be set by the Government—we will agree with some of it and disagree with other bits; that is the way things are—but you do not have that day-to-day control, which we think will happen with chairing this advisory board. That is a massive concern.

I will reinforce the point that Kirsty Williams quite rightly made about the debt arrangements with Powys. It is a concern; there is talk of having to write those off over

dod at ei gilydd eisoes i gyflenwi'r gwasanaethau hyn, sy'n rhywbeth y mae adolygiad Steers o niwrowyddorau ar gyfer oedolion yn derbyn ei fod yn bwysig. A wnaiff y Gweinidog fy sicrhau y byddwn, drwy ad-drefnu, yn gallu disgwyl cael gwasanaethau cydgysylltiedig gwell, fel yr un yr wyf newydd dynnu sylw ato?

**Nick Bourne:** Cytunais ag un pwynt a wnaeth y Gweinidog yn ei rhagymadrodd nodweddiadol o egniol, pan ddywedodd ein bod yn edrych ymlaen at yr etholiad cyffredinol—yr ydym ni'n sicr, ynghyd â miliynau o bobl eraill, yr wyf yn amau. Os gallwch gredu ffigurau Helen Mary, mae hyd at 4 miliwn o bobl yng Nghymru'n manteisio ar bresgripsiynau am ddim—yr wyf yn amau mai twristiaid y GIG ydynt, gan ei bod wedi chwyddo'r boblogaeth.

Canolbwyntiaf ar ddwy agwedd ar gynigion y Gweinidog. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi bod yn atebol erioed am y gwasanaeth iechyd. Ymosododd Helen Mary ar y Ceidwadwyr oherwydd y cyfeiriad yr aethom iddo pan oeddem mewn grym—ei barn wleidyddol yw honno, ac mae ganddi hawl i'w harddel—ond hwnnw oedd y cyfeiriad yr oeddem yn ei roi i'r gwasanaeth iechyd. Yr oeddem yn wleidyddol gyfrifol bryd hynny, yn union fel y bu y naill Weinidog ar ôl y llall yn y Llywodraeth hon. Ni allaf weld pam y mae angen cadeirio'r bwrdd cynghori hwn. Nid oes awgrym—yr wyf yn gobeithio nad oes, beth bynnag—y dylai Gordon Brown neu Alistair Darling ddod yn llywodraethwr Banc Lloegr; byddem mewn helynt fwy byth pe digwyddai hynny. Wrth gwrs, maent yn gyfrifol yn y pen draw am gyflwr yr economi, ond nid ydynt yn gweithredu fel llywodraethwr Banc Lloegr, ac mae hyn yn debyg iawn. Oes, mae'n rhaid i'r fframwaith strategol gael ei bennu gan y Llywodraeth—cytunwn â rhywfaint ohono ac anghytuno â rhannau eraill; felly y mae—ond nid oes gennych y rheolaeth honno o ddydd i ddydd a fydd yn digwydd, yr ydym yn credu, drwy gadeirio'r bwrdd cynghori hwn. Mae hynny'n destun pryder mawr.

Ategef y pwynt a wnaeth Kirsty Williams yn gwbl briodol am y trefniadau ar gyfer dyledion gyda Phowys. Mae'n destun pryder; mae sôn am orfod eu dileu dros y flwyddyn

the next year; it is not remotely possible.

The last point that I would like to make is an important one and relates to the community health councils. I welcome what Jenny Randerson said today, because it is slightly different from what she has said previously. There was no qualification about Powys when you first responded to this. You welcome coterminosity, full stop. However, if you are qualifying that now and saying except for Powys, that is a movement.

**Jenny Randerson:** It is certainly not a movement; I made it absolutely clear that I wanted the status quo. I have said so on numerous occasions in the Chamber.

**Nick Bourne:** If you consult the Record, you will see that you welcomed coterminosity. However, let us move forward; you are clear now that Powys should be exempt. In addition—this has not been mentioned—there is concern in Meirionydd, where it is not coterminous with the local authority boundaries. I know that the Minister is looking at this. She has not said that they must be coterminous, but there are very real concerns in parts of rural Wales that are depopulated, where public transport is often non-existent, and communications are difficult. Where the system is working well, I suggest that we have to look at what works and keep it if it does work. There is no reason why we have to have a hard and fast blueprint that we adopt for every single CHC throughout Wales. I can see that the Minister is nodding, and I welcome that. With those two or three important points, I will sit down and let someone else speak.

5.20 p.m.

**Alun Davies:** I thank the Minister for her statement on this restructuring. I support the announcement that was made last week and the streamlining of management that, I believe, will lead to far better front-line care for patients in mid and west Wales. Minister, I welcome not only the policy and the new ways of working that you have announced, but also the philosophy that underpins it.

nesaf; nid yw hynny'n bosibl o gwbl.

Mae'r pwynt olaf y carwn ei wneud yn un pwysig ac mae'n ymwneud â'r cynghorau iechyd cymuned. Croesawaf yr hyn a ddywedodd Jenny Randerson heddiw, gan ei fod ychydig yn wahanol i'r hyn y mae wedi'i ddweud o'r blaen. Nid oedd unrhyw amodi ynghylch Powys pan ymatebasoch i hyn yn gyntaf. Yr ydych yn croesawu cydffinioldeb, a dyna hi. Fodd bynnag, os ydych yn amodi hynny'n awr ac yn dweud heblaw am Bowys; mae hynny'n newid.

**Jenny Randerson:** Nid yw'n newid, yn sicr; fe'i gwneuthum yn berffaith glir fy mod am gadw'r sefyllfa bresennol. Yr wyf wedi dweud hynny droeon yn y Siambr.

**Nick Bourne:** Os edrychwch ar y Cofnod, gwelwch eich bod wedi croesawu cydffinioldeb. Fodd bynnag, gadewch inni symud ymlaen; yr ydych yn glir yn awr y dylid eithrio Powys. Ar ben hynny—ni fu sôn am hyn—mae pryder ym Meirionydd, lle nad yw'n cydffinio â ffiniau'r awdurdod lleol. Gwn fod y Gweinidog yn edrych ar hyn. Nid yw wedi dweud ei bod yn rhaid iddynt gydffinio, ond mae pryderon gwirioneddol mewn rhannau o Gymru wledig sydd wedi'u diblogi, lle na cheir trafniadaeth gyhoeddus yn aml, a lle y mae cyfathrebu'n anodd. Lle y mae'r system yn gweithio'n dda, yr wyf yn awgrymu ei bod yn rhaid inni edrych ar yr hyn sy'n gweithio a'i gadw os yw'n gweithio. Nid oes rheswm pam y mae'n rhaid inni gael patrwm digyfnawid a fabwysiadwn ar gyfer pob cyngor iechyd cymuned ledled Cymru yn ddiwahân. Gallaf weld bod y Gweinidog yn nodio, a chroesawaf hynny. Wedi gwneud y ddau neu dri phwynt pwysig hynny, eisteddaf a gadael i rywun arall siarad.

**Alun Davies:** Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei datganiad am yr ailstrwythuro hwn. Cefnogaf y cyhoeddiad a wnaethpwyd yr wythnos diwethaf a'r symleiddio ar reoli a fydd yn arwain, yr wyf yn credu, at ofal gwell o lawer yn y rheng flaen i gleifion yng Nghanolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru. Weinidog, croesawaf nid yn unig y polisi a'r dulliau gweithio newydd yr ydych wedi'u cyhoeddi, ond hefyd yr athroniaeth sy'n sail iddo.

We have heard from the Tories this afternoon about their opposition to various parts of this policy. They were able to tear apart the national health service with their ruthless and destructive competitive market ethos, because they did not, and do not, understand its ethos and the principles behind it. They voted against it and, ever since, they have systematically sought to undermine it. I thoroughly enjoyed Jonathan Morgan's contribution to this afternoon's debate, particularly when he talked about the politicisation of the national health service. Jonathan clearly did not campaign in mid and west Wales last year, or, if he did, he must have speed-read Tory leaflets and did not quite understand what was written in them. In that way, perhaps he is indeed qualified to lead that rabble.

The Conservatives, not only for what they have done in this debate, but also for the way in which they have undermined the confidence of people in the delivery of NHS services, should hang their heads in shame. I welcome the renewed emphasis that this statement places on co-operation within the NHS, to replace the competition that was imposed on the NHS by a Conservative Government, which has led to NHS front-line services suffering. Today, we are seeing the restoration of effective management and services within the national health service, which I very much welcome.

I hope, Minister, that you will be able, in your response to this debate, to spend time on accountability. National health service policy was one of the most centralised followed by the Conservatives in the 1980s. Local management, accountability and transparency was torn out of the national health service; in their place, we had bureaucrats, chief executives and quangos. What we did not have under the Conservative Government was any sense of democratic accountability in the national health service. That is why I welcome the news that the national board will meet in public, that its decisions will be transparent, that there will be a strengthened role for community health councils and that there will be opportunities for local people to

Yr ydym wedi clywed gan y Torïaid y prynhawn yma am eu gwrthwynebiad i wahanol rannau o'r polisi hwn. Yr oeddent yn gallu rhwygo'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yn ddarnau â'u hethos dinistriol a didostur mewn cysylltiad â'r farchnad gystadleuol, am nad oeddent ac nad ydynt yn deall ei ethos a'r egwyddorion sy'n sail iddo. Pleidleisiasant yn ei erbyn a, byth ers hynny, maent wedi ceisio'i danseilio'n systematig. Llwyf fwynheais y cyfraniad gan Jonathan Morgan i'r ddadl hon y prynhawn yma, yn enwedig pan soniodd am wleidyddoli'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Mae'n amlwg na wnaeth Jonathan ymgyrchu yng Nghanolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru y llynedd, neu, os gwnaeth, rhaid ei fod wedi bryddarllen taflenni'r Torïaid a heb ddeall yn hollol beth a oedd wedi'i ysgrifennu ynddynt. Yn hynny o beth, efallai ei fod yn wir yn gymwys i arwain y giwed honno.

Dylai'r Ceidwadwyr ostwng eu pennau gan gywilydd, nid yn unig am yr hyn y maent wedi'i wneud yn y ddadl hon, ond hefyd am y modd y maent wedi tanseilio hyder pobl yn y cyflenwi ar wasanaethau GIG. Croesawaf y pwyslais y mae'r datganiad hwn yn ei roi o'r newydd ar gydweithredu o fewn y GIG, yn lle'r cystadlu a orfodwyd ar y GIG gan Lywodraeth Geidwadol, sydd wedi amharu ar wasanaethau rheng flaen y GIG. Heddiw, yr ydym yn gweld adfer rheoli a gwasanaethau effeithiol o fewn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol, a chroesawaf hynny'n fawr.

Yr wyf yn gobeithio, Weinidog, y byddwch, yn eich ymateb i'r ddadl hon, yn gallu rhoi amser at drafod atebolrwydd. Polisi'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol oedd un o'r rhai mwyaf canoledig a ddilynwyd gan y Ceidwadwyr yn y 1980au. Rhwygwyd rheoli, atebolrwydd a thryloywder lleol o'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol; yn eu lle, cawsom fiwrocratiaid, prif weithredwyr a chwangos. Yr hyn na cawsom dan y Llywodraeth Geidwadol oedd unrhyw ymdeimlad o atebolrwydd democrataidd yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Dyna pam y croesawaf y newydd y bydd y bwrdd cenedlaethol yn cwrdd yn gyhoeddus, y bydd ei benderfyniadau'n dryloyw, ac y bydd rôl gryfach i gynghorau iechyd cymuned ac y

understand not only the decisions that are taken, but also the facts and the information that lie behind those decisions. That will mean that never again will the people that I represent be so badly misled and so poorly served by a political party as they were at the last general election.

What that means, I hope, Minister, is that accountability will be restored in the national health service. We will have a unitary service where the nonsense and fiction of provider and commissioner will be relegated to history and where there will be a focus on delivering front-line services in some of the most vulnerable and fragile communities in this country. At the end of the day, people pay their taxes to get those front-line services, not to create and service structures that never work and were never intended for the national health service.

Minister, in responding, I hope that you will, like me, be able to focus on guaranteeing a structure of healthcare that represents and reflects the needs, aspirations and ambitions of the communities of Wales for the future.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Politicians should have an important role and voice in the development of the NHS, but the public has shown in many polls that they do not want political meddling or day-to-day interference in the running of the NHS. I believe that we want a national health service, not a national Hart service.

I believe that the main plank should be our community health councils, which provide a local voice on development and monitoring. I certainly agree that commissioning and delivery should be the responsibility of a single body, as is proposed. However, most respondents to the consultation argued that the national board should operate at arm's length from the Minister. It is unfortunate that Edwina rejected that approach, which is the cause of great angst to my party. Personally, I will not be sorry to see the demise of competitive market forces, nor local health boards. In north Wales, many

bydd cyfleoedd i bobl leol ddeall nid yn unig y penderfyniadau a wneir, ond hefyd y ffeithiau a'r wybodaeth sy'n sail i'r penderfyniadau hynny. Bydd hynny'n golygu na fydd y bobl a gynrychiolaf byth eto'n cael eu camarwain mor ddrwg a'u gwasanaethu mor wael gan blaid wleidyddol fel y cawsant yn yr etholiad cyffredinol diwethaf.

Ystyr hyn, yr wyf yn gobeithio, Weinidog, yw yr adferir atebolrwydd yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Bydd gennym wasanaeth unedol lle y bydd nonsens ac anwiredd y darparwr a'r comisiynydd yn cael eu gollwng dros gof a lle y canolbwyntir ar gyflenwi gwasanaethau rheng flaen yn rhai o'r cymunedau sy'n fwyaf bregus ac yn fwyaf agored i niwed yn y wlad hon. Yn y pen draw, mae pobl yn talu eu trethi i gael y gwasanaethau rheng flaen hynny, nid i greu a gwasanaethu strwythurau nad ydynt byth yn gweithio ac nad oeddent erioed wedi'u bwriadu ar gyfer y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol.

Weinidog, wrth ymateb, yr wyf yn gobeithio y byddwch chi, fel minnau, yn gallu canolbwyntio ar warantu strwythur gofal iechyd sy'n cynrychioli ac yn adlewyrchu anghenion, dyheadau ac uchelgeisiau cymunedau Cymru ar gyfer y dyfodol.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Dylai gwleidyddion fod â rôl a llais pwysig wrth ddatblygu'r GIG, ond mae'r cyhoedd wedi dangos mewn llawer o etholiadau nad ydynt am weld busnesu gwleidyddol neu ymyrraeth o ddydd i ddydd yn y gwaith o redeg y GIG. Credaf fod arnom angen gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol, nid gwasanaeth Hart gwladol.

Yr wyf yn credu y dylai ein cyngorau iechyd cymuned fod yn brif sylfaen, gan eu bod yn darparu llais lleol ar ddatblygu a monitro. Yr wyf yn sicr yn cytuno y dylai comisiynu a chyflenwi fod yn gyfrifoldeb i un corff, fel y cynigir. Fodd bynnag, dadleuai'r rhan fwyaf o'r ymatebwyr i'r ymgynghoriad y dylai'r bwrdd cenedlaethol weithredu ar hyd braich oddi wrth y Gweinidog. Mae'n anffodus bod Edwina wedi gwrthod y dull gweithredu hwnnw, gan ei fod yn achosi llawer o ing i'm plaid. Yn bersonol, ni fydd yn ddrwg gennyf weld diwedd grymoedd marchnad cystadleuol, na



perverse proposals have come from LHBs, against the wishes and better judgment of local people. When north Wales is represented by a single body, we should consider basing its headquarters around Bangor University in the north-west, so that the local economy can benefit from the support and development that that would bring to the area.

The main aim is to streamline, and provide the best of care for patients. How often do people forget the patients? We also want the best value for money. My ultimate aspiration would be to join health with social care to provide a seamless, joined-up NHS—but I suppose that that is an argument for another day. I regret that the Minister will be at the centre of the new structure, but let us hope that some Government Members will see sense and support some of our amendments.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Edwina Hart):** I am not sure whether I misheard part of the last contribution from Eleanor Burnham. She seemed to say that she was pleased that LHBs were being abolished. I assume that the position outlined by Jenny Randerson is the correct version of Liberal Democrat policy, as Jenny has always been keen on LHBs, and has urged me in debate to ensure that the best practices of LHBs are carried over to any new structure. I am sure that we will receive clarification on that point.

I thank Alun Davies for his contribution on the philosophical debate around taking the health service forward. I will explain to the leader of the opposition a little about the national body that I will chair. There is no point in pretending that there will ever be a meeting of minds between the opposition parties and the Government parties on this issue. However, let me make it clear that I will lead the national advisory board; the chief executive of the NHS will lead the delivery board, which will set out the strategic direction for the seven organisations. That is a democratic and accountable way to deal with this. At the moment, I am in charge of the NHS, and I

byrddau iechyd lleol. Yn y gogledd, cafwyd llawer o gynigion gwrthnysig gan BILlau, yn groes i ddymuniadau a doethineb pobl leol. Pan gynrychiolir gogledd Cymru gan un corff, dylem ystyried lleoli ei bencadlys yng nghyffiniau Prifysgol Bangor yn y gogledd-orllewin, fel y gall yr economi leol elwa o'r gefnogaeth a'r datblygu a ddeuai i'r ardal yn sgil hynny.

Y prif nod yw symleiddio, a darparu'r gofal gorau i gleifion. Pa mor aml y mae pobl yn anghofio'r cleifion? Yr ydym hefyd am gael y gwerth gorau am arian. Fy nyhead pennaf fyddai uno gwasanaethau iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol i ddarparu GIG di-fwlch, cydgysylltiedig—ond mae'n debyg gennyf mai dadl ar gyfer diwrnod arall yw honno. Mae'n ofid imi y bydd y Gweinidog ar ganol y strwythur newydd, ond gadewch inni obeithio y bydd rhai o Aelodau'r Llywodraeth yn gweld synnwyr ac yn cefnogi rhai o'n gwelliannau.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Edwina Hart):** Nid wyf yn sicr a wneuthum gamglywed rhan o'r cyfraniad diwethaf gan Eleanor Burnham. Yr oedd yn ymddangos ei bod yn dweud ei bod yn falch bod y BILlau'n cael eu dileu. Cymeraf mai'r safbwynt a ddisgrifiwyd gan Jenny Randerson yw'r fersiwn gywir o bolisi'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, gan fod Jenny wedi bod yn gefnogol i BILlau erioed, ac wedi fy annog mewn dadleuon i sicrhau trosglwyddo arferion gorau BILlau i unrhyw strwythur newydd. Yr wyf yn siŵr y cawn eglurhad ar y pwynt hwnnw.

Diolchaf i Alun Davies am ei gyfraniad ar y ddadl athronyddol ynghylch mynd â'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn ei flaen. Rhoddaf ychydig o eglurhad i arweinydd yr wrthblaid am y corff cenedlaethol y byddaf yn ei gadeirio. Nid oes diben cymryd arnom y bydd byth gytundeb rhwng y gwrthbleidiau a phleidiau'r Llywodraeth ar y mater hwn. Er hynny, gadewch imi egluro y byddaf yn arwain y bwrdd cynghori cenedlaethol; prif weithredwr y GIG a fydd yn arwain y bwrdd cyflenwi, a fydd yn pennu'r cyfeiriad strategol i'r saith corff. Mae hynny'n ddull democrataidd ac atebol i ddelio â hyn. Ar hyn o bryd, yr wyf yn gyfrifol am y GIG, a byddaf yn gwneud y penderfyniadau ac yn

make the decisions and sign off the various submissions in my office on the fifth floor of Tŷ Hywel. Now, I am opening up the process, and that is what this is all about.

I will also nail a few incorrect points that have been made. I will do everything via public appointment, whether that is for local government members, voluntary sector members, trade union members or social partner members. They will all be recruited by public appointment, and that will become clear. I will not be appointing chairs and vice-chairs; there will be a public appointments process, in which I might well be involved, as I currently am, but the trust chairs will conduct the process. I want to assure Members on all those points, particularly those that Mark Isherwood raised in his contribution.

The leader of the opposition also mentioned the debt arrangements. There is obviously concern across Wales about the debt of some of the existing organisations. Nick Bourne and Kirsty Williams raised particular concerns about Powys, and I am mindful of that as we go into restructuring. It is not a closed door—these discussions are ongoing. That is the level of assurance that I can give at the moment.

Nick Bourne also raised the issue of coterminosity, and I have been mindful of that. I think that it was the leader of the opposition who raised with me in July the issue of Powys, and I take that on board. However, I want to strengthen the position of the community health councils, and that could well involve resource issues, or changes in their size. There are many such issues to deal with, because as well as large organisations, we need local organisations that are fit for purpose.

I assure Joyce that the reorganisation is patient-focused. It is intended to ensure better joint-working, as she illustrated. LHBs currently work together on various proposals, and that is what we must continue to do as part of this restructuring. Kirsty also mentioned the Powys situation, and we all recognise that it is different—there is no

cymeradwyo'r gwahanol geisiadau yn fy swyddfa ar bumed llawr Tŷ Hywel. Yn awr, yr wyf yn agor y broses, a dyna holl bwrpas yr hyn sydd dan sylw.

Gwnaf hefyd gywiro ychydig o bwyntiau gwallus sydd wedi'u gwneud. Gwnaf bopeth drwy benodiadau cyhoeddus, boed hynny ar gyfer aelodau llywodraeth leol, aelodau'r sector gwirfoddol, aelodau undebau llafur neu aelodau partneriaid cymdeithasol. Byddant i gyd yn cael eu recriwtio drwy benodiadau cyhoeddus, a bydd hynny'n glir. Ni fyddaf yn penodi cadeiryddion ac is-gadeiryddion; bydd proses benodiadau cyhoeddus, y mae'n ddigon posibl y byddaf yn cymryd rhan ynddi, fel y gwnaf ar hyn o bryd, ond cadeiryddion yr ymddiriedolaethau a fydd yn cynnal y broses. Yr wyf am roi sicrwydd i Aelodau ar yr holl bwyntiau hynny, yn enwedig y rheini a gododd Mark Isherwood yn ei gyfraniad.

Soniodd arweinydd yr wrthblaid hefyd am y trefniadau ar gyfer dyledion. Mae'n amlwg bod pryder ledled Cymru ynghylch dyled rhai o'r cyrff presennol. Cododd Nick Bourne a Kirsty Williams bryderon neilltuol ynghylch Powys, ac yr wyf yn ymwybodol o hynny wrth inni ddechrau ailstrwythuro. Nid yw'r drws wedi'i gau—mae'r trafodaethau hyn yn parhau. Dyna faint y sicrwydd y gallaf ei roi ar hyn o bryd.

Gwnaeth Nick Bourne hefyd godi mater cydffinioldeb, a bŵm yn ymwybodol o hynny. Yr wyf yn credu mai arweinydd yr wrthblaid a gododd fater Powys gyda mi ym mis Gorffennaf, ac ystyriaf hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf am gryfhau sefyllfa cynghorau iechyd cymuned, ac mae'n ddigon posibl y gallai hynny godi ystyriaethau ynghylch adnoddau, neu newidiadau yn eu maint. Mae llawer o faterion o'r fath i'w trafod oherwydd, yn ogystal â chyrrff mawr, mae arnom angen cyrff lleol sy'n addas.

Yr wyf yn sicrhau Joyce bod yr ad-drefnu'n canolbwyntio ar y claf. Ei fwriad yw sicrhau gwell cydweithio, fel y dangosodd. Ar hyn o bryd, mae BILlau'n cydweithio ar amryw o gynigion, a rhaid inni barhau â hynny fel rhan o'r ailstrwythuro hwn. Soniodd Kirsty hithau am sefyllfa Powys, ac yr ydym i gyd yn derbyn ei bod yn wahanol—nid oes ysbyty

district general hospital. There have been trials and tribulations in Powys, but there has to be a recognition at the centre that you are dealing with an area that is geographically different in many ways.

There are no district general hospitals and the links are to English services and hospitals, because they are the closest places for people to go. I do recognise all the points that you made in your contribution.

5.30 p.m.

**Gareth Jones:** On regionalisation, would you agree that the ongoing discussions on establishing a medical school in north Wales are important as a step forward in developing specialism in that region?

**Edwina Hart:** Yes, I have been particularly pleased with how the discussions have gone with Bangor University about extending medical training in north Wales and looking at the issues. I look forward to continuing developments in that area, because we want people to come to different parts of Wales and stay in Wales. That is essential to the future development of the NHS in Wales.

As a member of one of the coalition parties, I thank Helen Mary Jones for her support on many of the issues in developing this strategy. What Helen has tried to make abundantly clear is that this is about opening up the process, having accountability, and letting people see where decisions are made within the NHS. That is a particularly important message.

On Mark Isherwood's contribution, I think that I put to rest the notion of public appointments. The words 'social partners' refer to trade unions and professional organisations, not the private sector. Clinical judgment prevails throughout the health service at the moment, and matters will always be taken forward on the basis of clinical judgment.

I was particularly taken with Val's points about local involvement. When we were

cyffredinol dosbarth. Bu trafferthion ym Mhowys, ond rhaid cael cydnabyddiaeth yn y canol eich bod yn delio ag ardal sy'n wahanol o ran daearyddiaeth ar lawer ystyr.

Nid oes ysbytai cyffredinol dosbarth ac mae'r cysylltiadau â gwasanaethau ac ysbytai yn Lloegr, oherwydd mai dyma'r lleoedd agosaf i bobl fynd iddynt. Yr wyf yn cydnabod yr holl bwyntiau a wnaethoch yn eich cyfraniad.

**Gareth Jones:** Parthed rhanbartholi, a fydech yn cytuno bod trafodaethau sydd yn mynd rhagddynt ar sefydlu ysgol feddygol yng ngogledd Cymru yn bwysig fel cam ymlaen i ddatblygu arbenigedd yn y rhanbarth hwnnw?

**Edwina Hart:** Byddwn, yr wyf wedi fy mhlesio'n arw gyda'r trafodaethau â Phrifysgol Bangor ynghylch ymestyn hyfforddiant meddygol yng ngogledd Cymru ac edrych ar y materion. Yr wyf yn edrych ymlaen at barhau â datblygiadau o'r fath, oherwydd ein bod am weld pobl yn dod i wahanol rannau o Gymru ac yn aros yng Nghymru. Mae hynny'n hanfodol i ddatblygiad y GIG yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol.

Fel aelod o un o'r clymbleidiau, carwn ddiolch i Helen Mary Jones am ei chefnogaeth ynghylch nifer o'r materion wrth ddatblygu'r strategaeth hon. Yr hyn y mae Helen wedi ceisio ei gyfleu'n gwbl glir yw bod hyn yn ymwneud ag agor y broses, bod yn atebol, a gadael i bobl weld ymhle y caiff penderfyniadau eu gwneud yn y GIG. Mae honno'n neges bwysig iawn.

Parthed cyfraniad Mark Isherwood, credaf fy mod wedi setlo'r mater ynghylch penodiadau cyhoeddus. Mae'r geiriau 'partneriaid cymdeithasol' yn cyfeirio at undebau llafur a chyrrff proffesiynol, nid y sector preifat. Mae barn glinigol yn llywodraethu yn y gwasanaeth iechyd drwyddo draw ar hyn o bryd, a thrafodir materion bob amser ar sail barn glinigol.

Cafodd pwyntiau Val am gyfranogiad lleol argraff fawr arnaf. Pan oeddem yn trafod yr

discussing this last week, David Melding made the point about having local boards. The important thing is that the boards of the seven bodies are to be recruited via public appointment. The boards will include people with expertise in finance and IT and such areas, but also a lot of stakeholders involved, which Val alluded to. That is so that we can get the voices of the people heard as part of the main decision-making process. That will have to be fleshed out quite a lot, to ensure that we have the type of involvement that we want. Among the most important points that Val made was that on the balance between primary and secondary care. It is a key area for us to make sure that we maintain the correct financial balance between primary and secondary care if we are to get the agenda that we require.

Jonathan, everything is based on delivering a first-class service. We have to recognise that this is all about service delivery. You have welcomed the establishment of the seven organisations, and I hope that they will increase the level of delivery. They will also mean that we can cut down on bureaucracy within organisations and allow more money to get to the front-line services.

When Jenny made her contribution, she spoke about reassuring NHS staff. I can assure her that the staff remain totally reassured. I meet their trade unions and professional bodies regularly. They know where they are going with their jobs. I am sorry that Jenny could not pay me the compliment of calling me a socialist this week, because I really enjoyed that last week, and I would have liked a further compliment of that nature. However, I did concur with her comments about the community health councils and local involvement. They will be the key. I welcome any contributions from Members on this before I go out to consultation, because we have to get that element right.

I now turn to the amendments. Amendments 1 and 3 seek to replace the words 'welcomes' and 'endorses' in the motion with 'notes'. If you think that I am going to 'note' rather than 'welcome' my own policy, Kirsty, I am

wythnos diwethaf, gwnaeth David Melding y sylw ynghylch cael byrddau lleol. Y peth pwysig yw y bydd byrddau'r saith corff yn cael eu recriwtio drwy benodiadau cyhoeddus. Bydd y byrddau'n cynnwys pobl sydd ag arbenigedd ym maes cyllid a TG a chyfryw feysydd, ond hefyd lawer o randdeiliaid sy'n gysylltiedig, y cyfeiriodd Val atynt. Diben hyn yw ein bod yn gallu sicrhau bod lleisiau'r bobl yn cael eu clywed fel rhan o'r brif broses penderfynu. Bydd yn rhaid datblygu hynny cryn dipyn, er mwyn sicrhau bod gennym y math o gyfranogiad yr ydym yn dymuno ei gael. Un o'r pwyntiau pwysicaf a wnaeth Val oedd ynghylch cael cydbwysedd rhwng gofal sylfaenol a gofal eilaidd. Mae'n faes allweddol inni sicrhau ein bod yn cynnal y cydbwysedd ariannol priodol rhwng gofal sylfaenol a gofal eilaidd os ydym am gael yr agenda a fynnwn.

Jonathan, mae popeth yn seiliedig ar ddarparu gwasanaeth o'r radd flaenaf. Mae'n rhaid inni sylweddoli mai darparu gwasanaeth yw pwrpas hyn oll. Yr ydych wedi croesawu sefydlu saith corff, a gobeithiaf y byddant yn cynyddu lefel y ddarpariaeth. Golyga hyn hefyd y gallwn leihau ar fiwrocratiaeth yn y cyrff a chaniatáu i fwy o arian gyrraedd y gwasanaethau rheng flaen.

Yn ei chyfraniad, soniodd Jenny am roi sicrwydd i staff y GIG. Gallaf ei sicrhau bod y staff yn gwbl dawel eu meddwl. Yr wyf yn cwrdd â'u hundebau llafur a'u cyrff proffesiynol yn rheolaidd. Maent yn gwybod beth fydd yn digwydd i'w swyddi. Gresyn na allai Jenny roi teyrnged i mi drwy fy ngalw'n sosialydd yr wythnos hon, gan imi fwynhau hynny'n fawr iawn yr wythnos diwethaf a byddwn wedi hoffi cael canmoliaeth arall o'r natur honno. Fodd bynnag, cytunais â'i sylwadau am y cynghorau iechyd cymuned a chyfranogiad lleol. Hwy fydd yr allwedd. Croesawaf unrhyw gyfraniadau gan Aelodau parthed hyn cyn imi ddechrau ymgynghori yn ei gylch, oherwydd mae'n rhaid inni gael yr elfen honno'n gywir.

Trof yn awr at y gwelliannau. Mae gwelliannau 1 a 3 am osod y gair 'nodi' yn lle 'croesawu' a 'cymeradwyo'. Os ydych yn meddwl fy mod am 'nodi yn hytrach na 'croesawu' fy mholisi fy hun, Kirsty, yr

afraid that you are living in cloud-cuckoo-land.

I cannot accept amendment 2 in the name of William Graham. That is the line that we need to draw in the sand, and I think that the Conservatives realise that we will oppose that amendment.

We cannot accept amendment 4 on effective front-line services and national standards of service because it seeks to delete point 3 of the motion. However, I can understand the reasoning behind the amendment, and I will take that into account when we develop other issues.

On amendment 5, asking me to abandon my plans to chair the national board, I think that we have already agreed to disagree on that.

I will oppose amendment 6 about the shadow authorities, not because I am not interested in it, but because I want further time to consider the operation and timescales in the light of last week's and today's discussion. I will be taking further advice on that. I am not closing the door; I just do not want to accept it at this stage, but I will certainly come back to it.

Amendment 7 is about the projected cost savings and the cost of restructuring, and I can predict that the rationalisation of NHS organisations will lead to administration-cost savings because that work will not be duplicated. However, I am not yet in a position to outline the projected costs of the restructuring. I am honest about that and, therefore, I will be opposing the amendment at this stage. I will need to look at that in future in light of the financial consequences of anything that I undertake.

We do not support amendment 8. I am responsible for the NHS. I have outlined the structures, and I believe that we are secure in the structures that I am delivering, so I do not support that amendment.

On amendment 9, 'One Wales' is clear about the public funding of the NHS. That is the policy position, so we will be rejecting that

ydych yn byw mewn byd ffansi, mae gennyf ofn.

Ni allaf dderbyn gwelliant 2 yn enw William Graham. Mae'n rhaid inni dynnu llinell derfyn yn rhywle, a chredaf fod y Ceidwadwyr yn sylweddoli y byddwn yn gwrthwynebu'r gwelliant hwnnw.

Ni allwn dderbyn gwelliant 4 ar wasanaethau rheng-flaen effeithiol a safonau gwasanaeth cenedlaethol oherwydd ei fod yn ceisio dileu pwynt 3 y cynnig. Fodd bynnag, gallaf ddeall y rhesymeg y tu ôl i'r gwelliant, a byddaf yn ystyried hynny wrth inni ddatblygu materion eraill.

Parthed gwelliant 5, sy'n gofyn imi roi'r gorau i'm bwriad i gadeirio'r bwrdd cenedlaethol, yr wyf yn credu ein bod eisoes wedi cytuno i anghytuno ynghylch hynny.

Gwrthwynebaf welliant 6 ynghylch yr awdurdodau cysgodol, nid am nad oes gennyf ddiddordeb ynddo, ond oherwydd bod angen mwy o amser arnaf i ystyried y broses weithredu a'r amserlenni yng ngoleuni trafodaethau heddiw a'r wythnos diwethaf. Byddaf yn ceisio cyngor pellach ynghylch hynny. Nid wyf yn cau'r drws; ond nid wyf yn dymuno ei dderbyn ar hyn o bryd, a byddaf yn sicr yn dod yn ôl ato.

Mae gwelliant 7 yn ymwneud â'r arbedion cost tebygol a chost ailstrwythuro, a gallaf ragfynegi y bydd rhanbartholi cyrff y GIG yn arwain at arbedion cost gweinyddol gan na fydd y gwaith hwnnw'n cael ei ddyblygu. Serch hynny, nid wyf mewn sefyllfa ar hyn o bryd i amlinellu costau tebygol yr ailstrwythuro. Yr wyf yn onest ynghylch hynny ac, felly, gwrthwynebaf y gwelliant ar hyn o bryd. Bydd angen imi edrych ar hynny yn y dyfodol yng ngoleuni canlyniadau ariannol unrhyw beth a wnaif.

Nid ydym yn cefnogi gwelliant 8. Yr wyf yn gyfrifol am y GIG. Yr wyf wedi amlinellu'r strwythurau, a chredaf ein bod yn ddiogel o ran y strwythurau yr wyf yn eu darparu, felly nid wyf yn cefnogi'r gwelliant hwnnw.

Parthed gwelliant 9, mae 'Cymru'n Un' yn glir ynghylch cyllido'r GIG ag arian cyhoeddus. Dyna yw'r polisi, felly byddwn

amendment.

I am pleased to support amendment 10 in the name of Kirsty Williams, because it fits in nicely with the statements that I have made on this.

Therefore, we will oppose all the amendments except amendment 10 from Kirsty Williams. I thank Members for their contributions today. I will read the Record and take into account the issues that Members have raised with me.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Based on what the Minister has said, it is clear that there will be objections to the amendments, and therefore we will move straight to voting time, unless a Member requests that the bell be rung. I see that no such request is being made.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisiau tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.  
Votes deferred until voting time.*

yn gwrthod y gwelliant hwnnw.

Mae'n bleser gennyf gefnogi gwelliant 10 yn enw Kirsty Williams, am ei fod yn cyd-fynd yn dda â'r datganiadau a wneuthum ynghylch hyn.

Felly, byddwn yn gwrthwynebu pob gwelliant ac eithrio gwelliant 10 gan Kirsty Williams. Diolchaf i'r Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau heddiw. Byddaf yn darllen y Cofnod ac yn ystyried y materion a gododd yr Aelodau â mi.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Ar sail yr hyn y mae'r Gweinidog newydd ei ddweud, mae'n glir y bydd gwrthwynebiad i'r gwelliannau, felly awn yn syth at y cyfnod pleidleisio, os nad oes Aelod yn dymuno i'r gloch gael ei chanu. Gwelaf nad oes neb yn dymuno gwneud cais o'r fath.

### Cyfnod Pleidleisio Voting Time

*Gwelliant 1 i NDM4017: O blaid 14, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 31.  
Amendment 1 to NDM4017: For 14, Abstain 0, Against 31.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Melding, David  
Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Ryder, Janet

Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2 i NDM4017: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 2 to NDM4017: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Law, Trish  
Melding, David  
Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3 i NDM4017: O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 3 to NDM4017: For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew

Davies, Andrew R.T.  
 Davies, Paul  
 Evans, Nerys  
 Franks, Chris  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Trish  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Millar, Darren  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 4 i NDM4017: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
 Amendment 4 to NDM4017: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Burns, Angela  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, Andrew R.T.  
 Davies, Paul  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Law, Trish  
 Melding, David  
 Millar, Darren  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davies, Alun  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Evans, Nerys  
 Franks, Chris  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David



Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Watson, Joyce  
 Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5 i NDM4017: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
 Amendment 5 to NDM4017: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Burns, Angela  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, Andrew R.T.  
 Davies, Paul  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Law, Trish  
 Melding, David  
 Millar, Darren  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davies, Alun  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Evans, Nerys  
 Franks, Chris  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Watson, Joyce  
 Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

Motion NDM4017 as amended: that

*the National Assembly:*

*1. welcomes the skills and employment strategy, 'Skills That Work for Wales', published on 15 July 2008; and*

*2. recognises its importance to the future of Wales;*

Cynnig NDM4017 fel y'i diwygiwyd: bod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:*

*1. yn croesawu'r strategaeth sgiliau a chyflogaeth, 'Sgiliau sy'n Gweithio i Gymru', a gyhoeddwyd ar 15 Gorffennaf 2008;*

*2. yn cydnabod ei phwysigrwydd i ddyfodol Cymru;*

3. notes the importance of the skills agenda to the EU structural programmes, especially in the reduction of economic inactivity. 3. yn nodi pwysigrwydd yr agenda sgiliau i raglenni strwythurol yr UE, yn enwedig o ran lleihau anweithgarwch economaidd.

*Cynnig NDM4017 fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 31, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 15.*

*Motion NDM4017 as amended: For 31, Abstain 0, Against 15.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Melding, David  
Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd cynnig NDM4017 fel y'i diwygiwyd.*

*Motion NDM4017 as amended carried.*

*Gwelliant 1 i NDM4013: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.*

*Amendment 1 to NDM4013: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Law, Trish  
Melding, David

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley

Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2 i NDM4013: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 2 to NDM4013: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Law, Trish  
Melding, David  
Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3 i NDM4013: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 31.  
Amendment 3 to NDM4013: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 31.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Melding, David  
Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4 i NDM4013: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 31.  
Amendment 4 to NDM4013: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 31.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Melding, David  
Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw

Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Watson, Joyce  
 Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5 i NDM4013: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
 Amendment 5 to NDM4013: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Burns, Angela  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, Andrew R.T.  
 Davies, Paul  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Law, Trish  
 Melding, David  
 Millar, Darren  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davies, Alun  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Evans, Nerys  
 Franks, Chris  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Watson, Joyce  
 Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 6 i NDM4013: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
 Amendment 6 to NDM4013: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Burns, Angela  
 Cairns, Alun

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davies, Alun  
 Davies, Andrew

Davies, Andrew R.T.  
 Davies, Paul  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Law, Trish  
 Melding, David  
 Millar, Darren  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Evans, Nerys  
 Franks, Chris  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Watson, Joyce  
 Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig NDM4013: O blaid 40, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 1.  
 Motion NDM4013: For 40, Abstain 5, Against 1.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Burns, Angela  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davies, Alun  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Andrew R.T.  
 Davies, Paul  
 Evans, Nerys  
 Franks, Chris  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Millar, Darren

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Law, Trish

Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Williams, Brynle  
Wood, Leanne

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

5.40 p.m.

*Gwelliant 1 i NDM4018: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 31.  
Amendment 1 to NDM4018: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 31.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Melding, David  
Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2 i NDM4018: O blaid 10, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 36.  
Amendment 2 to NDM4018: For 10, Abstain 0, Against 36.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Melding, David  
Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3 i NDM4018: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 31.  
Amendment 3 to NDM4018: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 31.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Melding, David  
Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane



Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4 i NDM4018: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 31.  
Amendment 4 to NDM4018: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 31.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Melding, David  
Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5 i NDM4018: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 31.  
Amendment 5 to NDM4018: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 31.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Melding, David  
Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 6 i NDM4018: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 31.  
Amendment 6 to NDM4018: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 31.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Melding, David  
Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw

Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Watson, Joyce  
 Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 7 i NDM4018: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 31.  
 Amendment 7 to NDM4018: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 31.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Burns, Angela  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, Andrew R.T.  
 Davies, Paul  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Melding, David  
 Millar, Darren  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davies, Alun  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Evans, Nerys  
 Franks, Chris  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Trish  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Watson, Joyce  
 Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 8 i NDM4018: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 31.  
 Amendment 8 to NDM4018: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 31.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Burns, Angela

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davies, Alun

Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, Andrew R.T.  
 Davies, Paul  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Melding, David  
 Millar, Darren  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Davies, Andrew  
 Evans, Nerys  
 Franks, Chris  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Trish  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Watson, Joyce  
 Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 9 i NDM4018: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
 Amendment 9 to NDM4018: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Burns, Angela  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, Andrew R.T.  
 Davies, Paul  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Melding, David  
 Millar, Darren  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davies, Alun  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Evans, Nerys  
 Franks, Chris  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Trish  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Watson, Joyce

Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 10 i NDM4018: O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 10 to NDM4018: For 44, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

Motion NDM4018 as amended: that

Cynnig NDM4018 fel y'i diwygiwyd: bod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. welcomes the progress in the programme* *1. yn croesawu cynnydd y rhaglen i ddiwygio*

- |  |  |
|--|--|
| <i>of reform in the Welsh NHS, as set out in the Minister's statement of 30 September;</i>   | <i>GIG Cymru, fel y'i nodwyd yn natganiad y Gweinidog ar 30 Medi;</i>  |
| <i>2. endorses the 'One Wales' commitment to the abolition of the internal market which the programme takes forward;</i>                             | <i>2. yn cymeradwyo ymrwymiad 'Cymru'n Un' i ddileu'r farchnad fewnol, y mae'r rhaglen yn bwrw ati i'w wneud;</i>                                  |
| <i>3. looks forward to the release of resources to front-line services which the rationalisation of health management arrangements will achieve;</i> | <i>3. yn edrych ymlaen at weld rhyddhau adnoddau ar gyfer gwasanaethau rheng flaen, y bydd rhesymoli'r trefniadau rheoli iechyd yn ei sicrhau;</i> |
| <i>4. confirms the continuing commitment to a preventative and primary care led National Health Service in Wales;</i>                                | <i>4. yn cadarnhau'r ymrwymiad parhaus i Wasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol yng Nghymru sy'n ataliol ac yn cael ei arwain gan ofal sylfaenol;</i>            |
| <i>5. believes that community health councils should be empowered and strengthened to provide a local voice within the NHS.</i>                      | <i>5. yn credu y dylid grymuso a chryfhau Cyngorau Iechyd Cymuned er mwyn darparu llais lleol yn y GIG.</i>  |

*Cynnig NDM4018 fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 31, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 10.*

*Motion NDM4018 as amended: For 31, Abstain 5, Against 10.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Wood, Leanne

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Melding, David  
Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Williams, Brynle

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd cynnig NDM4018 fel y'i diwygiwyd.  
 Motion NDM4018 as amended carried.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â  
 today's proceedings to a close. chlyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.43 p.m.  
 The meeting ended at 5.43 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau  
 Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
 Asghar, Mohammad (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Burns, Angela (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew R.T. (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Paul (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Evans, Nerys (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Franks, Chris (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, Lesley (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jenkins, Bethan (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Gareth (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Millar, Darren (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)

Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
Ramsay, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Watson, Joyce (Llafur – Labour)  
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)