



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
The National Assembly for Wales**

**Cofnod y Trafodion  
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mercher, 7 Mai 2008  
Wednesday, 7 May 2008**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- |     |   |
|-----|---|
| 3   | Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol<br>Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services  |
| 21  | Cwestiynau i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth<br>Questions to the Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport   |
| 41  | Datganiad am y Cyfnod Sylfaen<br>Statement on Foundation Phase  |
| 60  | Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc ynghylch Gwasanaethau Eirioli ar gyfer Plant a Phobl Ifanc yng Nghymru<br>The Children and Young People Committee's Report into Advocacy Services for Children and Young People in Wales |
| 82  | Dadl yn Ceisio Caniatâd y Cynulliad i Gyflwyno Mesur Arfaethedig Aelod ynghylch Ailgylchu<br>Debate Seeking the Assembly's Leave to Introduce a Member Proposed Measure on Recycling  |
| 101 | Dadl Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru: Toiledau Cyhoeddus<br>Welsh Liberal Democrats Debate: Public Toilets   |
| 120 | Dadl Fer: Lymffoedema—yr Angen am Wasanaeth Gwell<br>Short Debate: Lymphoedema—the Need for an Improved Service   |

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 12.30 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 12.30 p.m. with the Presiding Officer (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) in the Chair.*

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf y Cynulliad i drefn.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call the Assembly to order.

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services**

### **Responding to 999 Calls**

**Q1 Kirsty Williams:** Will the Minister make a statement on the contribution made by co-responders in responding to 999 calls? OAQ(3)0542(HSS)

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Edwina Hart):** Co-responders complement the Welsh ambulance service by providing valuable life-saving support in an emergency until an ambulance arrives.

**Kirsty Williams:** You will be aware that, in rural areas, it can take considerable time for an ambulance to arrive at a scene. Therefore, the role of co-responders is vital. Yet, there is some concern in my constituency that the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust will limit the number of calls that co-responders can respond to. Will you take this opportunity to state that you will investigate these claims and worries, and that you value the work of the co-responders in rural areas?

**Edwina Hart:** Co-responders do an excellent job, and they are there to complement the ambulance service. I will make inquiries of the ambulance service about the issues that you have raised with me today.

**William Graham:** Will you join me in acknowledging the work of the first responders' group in Usk? This was one of the first such groups to be founded, in 2004, and works directly with the ambulance service to provide treatment to patients before ambulances are able to attend. The Minister will be sadly aware that the South Wales East region consistently records the

### **Ymateb i Alwadau 999**

**C1 Kirsty Williams:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y cyfraniad a wneir gan gydymatebwyr wrth ymateb i alwadau 999? OAQ(3)0542(HSS)

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Edwina Hart):** Mae cydymatebwyr yn ategu gwasanaeth ambiwlans Cymru drwy ddarparu cefnogaeth werthfawr nes bydd ambiwlans yn cyrraedd, a honno'n gefnogaeth sy'n achub bywydau mewn argyfwng.

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae'n siŵr y gwyddoch y gall gymryd cryn dipyn o amser i ambiwlans gyrraedd lleoliad mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Felly, mae swyddogaeth cydymatebwyr yn hanfodol. Eto, ceir rhywfaint o bryder yn fy etholaeth y bydd Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwllans Cymru yn cyfyngu nifer y galwadau y caiff cydymatebwyr ymateb iddynt. A fanteisiwch ar y cyfle hwn i ddweud y byddwch yn ymchwilio i'r honiadau a'r pryderon hyn, a'ch bod yn gweld gwerth yng ngwaith y cydymatebwyr mewn ardaloedd gwledig?

**Edwina Hart:** Mae cydymatebwyr yn gwneud gwaith ardderchog, ac maent yn ategu gwaith y gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Holaf y gwasanaeth ambiwlans am y materion yr ydych wedi'u codi â mi heddiw.

**William Graham:** A ymunwch â mi i gydnabod gwaith y grŵp ymatebwyr cyntaf ym Mrynbuga? Hwn oedd un o'r grwpiau cyntaf o'i fath i gael ei sefydlu, yn 2004, ac mae'n gweithio'n uniongyrchol gyda'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans i roi triniaeth i gleifion cyn i'r ambiwlans allu cyrraedd. Gŵyr y Gweinidog mai gan ranbarth Dwyrain De Cymru, yn anffodus, y mae'r

lowest ambulance response times. Will you publicise the work done by this group, given that it is currently looking to recruit new volunteers?

**Edwina Hart:** Thank you for asking me that question. I am delighted to acknowledge the excellent work that the group does and to encourage people to volunteer for such work. I also sympathise with your concerns about ambulance waiting times in the South Wales East region; they are still of great concern to me. There have been improvements, but not sufficient improvements to benefit patients and the public.

### Priorities for the NHS

**Q2 Angela Burns:** Will the Minister outline her priorities for the NHS in Wales over the next six months? OAQ(3)0547(HSS)

**Edwina Hart:** My priorities for the NHS in Wales include reconfiguration to support better health services, ensuring access, improving patient experience and supporting social care. I provided an update to the Health, Wellbeing and Local Government Committee on 16 April 2008 on my priorities.

**Angela Burns:** My question relates to your interaction with a fellow Minister. Recently, the National Assembly's Enterprise and Learning Committee expressed concerns about the funding fog, which has become so complicated that schools are losing out on funding for essential services for the protection of our children's health, such as clean toilets and classrooms. Estyn has criticised school toilets in 54 per cent of its inspection reports. What effect will that have on our children's health, and what discussions have you had with the Minister for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills on this matter?

**Edwina Hart:** We discuss children's issues in the Cabinet sub-committee on children, which my deputy regularly attends. I understand the issues that you have raised on

amseroedd ymateb ambiwlansys isaf dro ar ôl tro. A roddwch gyhoeddusrwydd i'r gwaith a wnaethpwyd gan y grŵp hwn, a chofio ei fod ar hyn o bryd yn bwriadu recriwtio gwirfoddolwyr newydd?

**Edwina Hart:** Diolch ichi am ofyn y cwestiwn hwnnw imi. Mae'n bleser gennyf gydnabod y gwaith ardderchog y mae'r grŵp yn ei wneud ac annog pobl i wirfoddoli ar gyfer gwaith o'r fath. Yr wyf hefyd yn cytuno â'ch pryderon am amseroedd ymateb ambiwlansys yn rhanbarth De Ddwyrain Cymru; maent yn dal yn peri cryn bryder imi. Cafwyd gwelliannau, ond nid digon o welliannau i fod o fudd i gleifion ac i'r cyhoedd.

### Blaenoriaethau ar gyfer y GIG

**C2 Angela Burns:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu ei blaenoriaethau ar gyfer y GIG yng Nghymru dros y chwe mis nesaf? OAQ(3)0547(HSS)

**Edwina Hart:** Mae fy mlaenoriaethau ar gyfer y GIG yng Nghymru yn cynnwys ad-drefnu i gefnogi gwell gwasanaethau iechyd, sicrhau mynediad, gwella profiadau cleifion a chefnogi gofal cymdeithasol. Ar 16 Ebrill 2008, rhoddais y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd, Lles a Llywodraeth Leol am fy mlaenoriaethau.

**Angela Burns:** Mae fy nghwestiwn yn ymwneud â'r modd yr ydych yn rhyngweithio â chyd-Weinidog. Yn ddiweddar, mynegodd Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol bryderon am y niwl cyllido, sydd mor gymhleth erbyn hyn bod ysgolion yn colli'r cyfle i gael cyllid ar gyfer gwasanaethau hanfodol i ddiogelu iechyd ein plant, megis toiledau ac ystafelloedd dosbarth glân. Mae Estyn wedi beirniadu toiledau ysgol yn 54 y cant o'i adroddiadau arolygu. Pa effaith a gaiff hynny ar iechyd ein plant, a pha drafodaethau yr ydych wedi'u cael gyda'r Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau ar y mater hwn?

**Edwina Hart:** Byddwn yn trafod materion yn ymwneud â phlant yn is-bwyllgor y Cabinet ar blant, y bydd fy nirprwy yn ei fynychu'n rheolaidd. Deallaf y problemau a

school toilets; that is a common issue across constituencies. Local government does not seem to make this a priority in terms of the funds that it makes available. However, I will discuss this further with Gwenda Thomas now that you have raised it with me.

**Joyce Watson:** A major priority for the NHS in Wales is protecting our children through the national immunisation programme. Last night, I attended an event here that celebrated the introduction of the childhood immunisation schedule for a new vaccine to combat life-threatening diseases such as meningitis, septicemia and pneumonia that is saving lives across Wales. A report from Wyeth, the manufacturers of the vaccine, showed how well it is being received. The vaccine is delivered in three doses—at two months, four months and 13 months. While uptake rates are generally good in Wales, there is a drop off in the uptake of the 13-month booster, which is worrying, as all three are needed to immunise properly. Could you write to me on what can be done to improve the uptake of the 13-month booster dose of the pneumococcal conjugate vaccine?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I do not think that it is appropriate to use an Assembly oral question to ask what could be put in correspondence. You asked the Minister to write to you, but you could e-mail the Minister to ask her to write to you, and she would presumably do so.

**Jenny Randerson:** Minister, I am sure that you are aware of the variability in care across Wales for asthma sufferers. Are you aware, however, that a child with asthma in Swansea is more than twice as likely to be admitted to hospital than a child living in Merthyr Tydfil? That suggests that the care in one area is considerably better than that in another. There is a target that, by September 2008, all asthma sufferers are to have a personal asthma action plan, but, at the moment, only 16 per cent of sufferers have one. Are you confident that you will reach

godwyd gennych ynghylch toiledau ysgol; mae honno'n broblem gyffredin ym mhob etholaeth. Nid yw'n ymddangos bod llywodraeth leol yn rhoi blaenoriaeth i hyn o ran yr arian y mae'n ei ddarparu. Fodd bynnag, trafodaf hyn ymhellach gyda Gwenda Thomas, gan ichi ei godi â mi.

**Joyce Watson:** Un o brif flaenoriaethau'r GIG yng Nghymru yw amddiffyn ein plant drwy'r rhaglen imiwneiddio genedlaethol. Neithiwr, bûm mewn digwyddiad yma a oedd yn dathlu cyflwyno'r rhaglen imiwneiddio plant ar gyfer brechlyn newydd a fydd yn mynd i'r afael â chlefydau sy'n peryglu bywyd, megis llid yr ymennydd, septicemia a niwmonia. Mae'n achub bywydau ym mhob cwr o Gymru. Yr oedd adroddiad gan Wyeth, gweithgynhyrchwyr y brechlyn, yn dangos mor dda y'i derbynnir. Rhoddir y brechlyn mewn tair dogn—pan fydd y plentyn yn ddau fis, yn bedwar mis ac yn 13 mis oed. Er bod y niferoedd sydd wedi mynd i gael y brechlyn yn gyffredinol dda yng Nghymru, mae'r nifer sydd wedi mynd i gael y pigiad atgyfnerthu yn 13 mis oed wedi gostwng. Mae hynny'n destun pryder oherwydd mae angen cael y tri er mwyn imiwneiddio'n briodol. A allech ysgrifennu ataf ynghylch yr hyn y gellir ei wneud i sicrhau bod mwy o blant yn cael pigiad atgyfnerthu'r brechlyn niwmococol cyfun pan fyddant yn 13 mis oed?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid wyf yn meddwl ei bod yn briodol defnyddio cwestiwn llafar y Cynulliad i ofyn yr hyn y gellid ei roi mewn gohebiaeth. Gofynasoch i'r Gweinidog ysgrifennu atoch, ond byddech yn gallu anfon e-bost at y Gweinidog yn gofyn iddi ysgrifennu atoch, ac yn ôl pob tebyg byddai'n gwneud hynny.

**Jenny Randerson:** Weinidog, yr wyf yn siŵr y gwyddoch faint mae gofal ar gyfer dioddefwyr asthma yn amrywio ledled Cymru. A ydych yn gwybod, fodd bynnag, fod plentyn o Abertawe a chanddo asthma dros ddwywaith yn fwy tebygol o gael ei dderbyn i ysbyty na phlentyn sy'n byw ym Merthyr Tudful? Mae hynny'n awgrymu bod y gofal mewn un ardal gryn dipyn yn well na'r gofal mewn ardal arall. Ceir targed, erbyn Medi 2008, y bydd gan bawb sy'n dioddef o asthma gynllun gweithredu personol ar asthma, ond, ar hyn o bryd, dim

that target?

**Edwina Hart:** Yes. I understand that Asthma UK held a very successful event in the Assembly yesterday, hosted by Dr Dai Lloyd. I am well aware of the statistics that are applicable across Wales. I very much hope that I reach this target, and I have asked officials to try to prioritise the work so that the target is met by September, because asthma is a very serious disease.

**Jenny Randerson:** At that event yesterday, Asthma UK drew my attention to the respiratory illnesses service development document and the commissioning directives. It currently costs us at least £50 million to treat asthma sufferers in hospitals in Wales. Is any money attached to the service development document and the directives?

**Edwina Hart:** I will have to check my budget lines to see what exactly will be attached; I will write to you with the details.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Will you outline the steps that you will be taking in the next six months to achieve the One Wales Government's target of having a school nurse for every family of schools by the end of this term?

**Edwina Hart:** We are currently undertaking quite a lot of work on this issue, and a lot of discussions are taking place within the profession. I very much hope that we will be on target with our 'One Wales' commitment. It is about more than having a school nurse; the concept is to have family nurses who are available, not only during the school term, but 52 weeks a year, and can help with a whole range of issues that are on our health agenda.

### Older People

**Q3 Joyce Watson:** Will the Minister make a statement on what the Welsh Assembly Government is doing to promote the interests

of 16 y cant o ddiodefwyr sydd ag un. A ydych yn hyderus y byddwch yn cyrraedd y targed hwnnw?

**Edwina Hart:** Ydw. Deallaf i Asthma UK gynnal digwyddiad hynod lwyddiannus yn y Cynulliad ddoe, gyda Dr Dai Lloyd yn ei gynnal. Yr wyf yn llwyr ymwybodol o'r ystadegau sy'n berthnasol ledled Cymru. Gobeithiaf yn fawr y cyrraeddaf y targed hwn, ac yr wyf wedi gofyn i swyddogion geisio blaenoriaethu'r gwaith er mwyn cyrraedd y targed erbyn Medi, oherwydd mae asthma yn glefyd difrifol iawn.

**Jenny Randerson:** Yn y digwyddiad hwnnw ddoe, tynnodd Asthma UK fy sylw at y ddogfen datblygu gwasanaeth yng nghyswllt salwch anadlu ac at y cyfarwyddbau comisiynu. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'n costio £50 miliwn i drin diodefwyr asthma mewn ysbytai yng Nghymru. A oes unrhyw arian ynghlwm wrth y ddogfen datblygu gwasanaeth a'r cyfarwyddbau?

**Edwina Hart:** Bydd yn rhaid imi edrych ar linellau fy nghyllideb i weld beth yn union fydd ynghlwm; ysgrifennaf atoch gyda'r manylion.

**Helen Mary Jones:** A amlinellwch y camau a gymerwch yn y chwe mis nesaf i gyrraedd targed Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un sef cael nyrs ysgol ar gyfer pobl ysgol sydd yn yr un teulu erbyn diwedd y tymor hwn?

**Edwina Hart:** Ar hyn o bryd yr ydym yn gwneud cryn dipyn o waith ar y mater hwn, ac mae llawer o drafod yn digwydd yn y proffesiwn. Gobeithiaf yn fawr y byddwn ar ben ffordd o ran cyrraedd ein targed gyda'n hymrwymiad 'Cymru'n Un'. Mae mwy iddi na chael un nyrs ysgol; y cysyniad yw cael nyrsys teulu sydd ar gael, nid yn ystod tymor yr ysgol yn unig, ond 52 wythnos y flwyddyn, a'r rheini'n gallu cynorthwyo gydag amrywiaeth eang o faterion sydd ar ein agenda iechyd.

### Pobl Hŷn

**C3 Joyce Watson:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am yr hyn mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n ei wneud i hyrwyddo

of older people in Wales? OAQ(3)0489(HSS)

buddiannau pobl hŷn yng Nghymru?  
OAQ(3)0489(HSS)

**The Deputy Minister for Social Services (Gwenda Thomas):** The implementation of our groundbreaking strategy for older people continues to make good progress, and a wide range of policies and programmes have resulted from this. Following extensive evaluation and consultation, phase 2 of the strategy was launched on 13 March 2008. We have also established a fully independent commissioner for older people.

**Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Wasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Gwenda Thomas):** Mae'r gwaith o weithredu ein strategaeth arloesol ar gyfer pobl hŷn yn dal yn gwneud cynnydd da, ac mae ystod eang o bolisiâu a rhaglenni wedi deillio o hyn. Yn dilyn ymgynghori a gwerthuso dwys, lansiyd cam 2 y strategaeth ar 13 Mawrth 2008. Yr ydym hefyd wedi sefydlu comisiynydd cwbl annibynnol ar gyfer pobl hŷn.

**Joyce Watson:** I will take this opportunity to welcome Ruth Marks to the post of Commissioner for Older People in Wales. I was pleased to learn recently, and it may please a few of our colleagues to learn, that new research suggests that exercise benefits the elderly even more than young people and it even appears to lower your biological age. If 40 per cent of the population are likely to be over the age of 50 by 2030, our attitude to getting older is inevitably changing and becoming more positive. Ill health is no longer synonymous with old age. How will the £20 million phase 2 of the older people's strategy promote healthy living for older people? What new initiatives, such as free swimming, can be expected in light of the strategy?

**Joyce Watson:** Manteisiaf ar y cyfle hwn i groesawu Ruth Marks i'w swydd fel Comisiynydd Pobl Hŷn Cymru. Yn ddiweddar, yr oeddwn yn falch o ddeall, ac efallai y bydd ambell un o'n cyd-Aelodau'n falch o ddeall, fod ymchwil newydd yn awgrymu bod ymarfer corff hyd yn oed yn fwy manteisiol i bobl hŷn nag ydyw i bobl ifanc, ac ymddengys ei fod hyn yn oed yn lleihau'ch oed biolegol. Os disgwylir i 40 y cant o'r boblogaeth fod yn hŷn na 50 oed erbyn 2030, mae'n anochel bod ein hagwedd at heneiddio'n newid ac yn mynd yn fwy cadarnhaol. Nid yw henaint yn cael ei gysylltu â gwaeledd mwyach. Sut y bydd cam 2 y strategaeth ar gyfer pobl hŷn, sy'n werth £20 miliwn, yn hyrwyddo byw'n iach i bobl hŷn? Pa fentrau newydd, megis nofio am ddim, y gellir eu disgwyl yn sgil y strategaeth?

**Gwenda Thomas:** The strategy has been evaluated and updated. As I stated, phase 2, entitled 'Living Longer Living Better', has been launched. This phase concentrates on four strategic cross-cutting themes, namely valuing older people, the economic status of older people, health and wellbeing—which has a bearing on what you said—and independence. All these initiatives are supported by 24 priority issues. I would be more than pleased to write to you with the details of those priorities.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Mae'r strategaeth wedi cael ei gwerthuso a'i diweddarau. Fel y dywedais, mae cam 2, sy'n dwyn y teitl 'Byw'n Hirach Byw'n Well', wedi cael ei lansio. Mae'r cam hwn yn canolbwyntio ar bedair thema strategol trawsbynciol, sef gwerthfawrogi pobl hŷn, statws economaidd pobl hŷn, iechyd a lles—sy'n ymwneud â'r hyn a ddywedaso—ac annibyniaeth. Mae pob un o'r mentrau hyn yn cael eu cefnogi gan 24 blaenoriaeth. Byddwn yn dra pharod i ysgrifennu atoch gyda manylion y blaenoriaethau hynny.

12.40 p.m.

**Darren Millar:** As the Member for what is demographically the oldest constituency in Wales, I am concerned at the current plans to reduce the number of stroke rehabilitation

**Darren Millar:** Fel yr Aelod dros etholaeth hynaf Cymru o ran demograffeg, yr wyf yn bryderus am y cynlluniau presennol i leihau nifer y gwelyau yn fy ardal leol ar gyfer

beds in my locality when the current services are relocated from H. M. Stanley Hospital in St Asaph to Ysbyty Glan Clwyd in Bodelwyddan. What assurance can you give my constituents and their families that they will get the best care possible from the Welsh NHS after suffering from a stroke?

**Gwenda Thomas:** I will discuss this matter with the Minister, as this comes under her portfolio, but the strategy that I have already mentioned focuses on stroke services. It is very much a part of that. We are meeting with the Stroke Association and others in the voluntary sector to see to it that, on the point of discharge, there is continuing care, which is where my portfolio clicks in.

**Chris Franks:** I am sure that you are aware of a recent poll, commissioned by Age Concern Cymru, which found that 57 per cent of people believe that little is being done by local government regarding the supply of care services for the older population. What discussions have you had with councils and other providers regarding care for the elderly? What talks have you had with the NHS and local government to ensure that patients who have finished their medical treatment can be discharged from hospitals?

**Gwenda Thomas:** These talks, involving both the Minister and me, are ongoing. I meet regularly with the Association of Directors of Social Services Cymru, the Welsh Local Government Association and individual local authorities. Commissioning these services is a matter for local authorities, but I refer again to the annual report of the chief inspector, in which he identified consistency of provision and commissioning as a major issue for us. We are having ongoing talks on the matter, which I intend to continue.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** Two in five women over the age of 50 in Wales suffer from osteoporosis; it also affects a significant number of males. That condition can be helped by simple medication, yet we only have a handful of specialist nurses and a spread-out set of clinics to deal with this

adsefydlu ar ôl strôc, pan gaiff y gwasanaethau presennol eu symud o Ysbyty H. M. Stanley yn Llanelwly i Ysbyty Glan Clwyd ym Modelwyddan. Pa sicrwydd y gallwch ei roi i fy etholwyr a'u teuluoedd y byddant yn cael y gofal gorau posibl gan y GIG yng Nghymru ar ôl dioddef strôc?

**Gwenda Thomas:** Trafodaf y mater hwn gyda'r Gweinidog, gan ei fod yn rhan o'i phortffolio, ond mae'r strategaeth yr wyf eisoes wedi'i chrybwyll yn canolbwyntio ar wasanaethau strôc. Mae'n rhan sylweddol o hynny. Yr ydym yn cyfarfod â'r Gymdeithas Strôc ac eraill yn y sector gwirfoddol i sicrhau y ceir gofal parhaus pan fydd cleifion yn cael eu rhyddhau, a dyna lle mae fy mhorthffolio i yn dod iddi.

**Chris Franks:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y gwyddoch am arolwg barn diweddar, a gomisiynwyd gan Age Concern Cymru, a ganfu fod 57 y cant o bobl yn credu mai ychydig iawn sy'n cael ei wneud gan lywodraeth leol i gyflenwi gwasanaethau gofal ar gyfer y boblogaeth hŷn. Pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi'u cael gyda chynghorau a chyda darparwyr eraill ynghylch gofal i bobl hŷn? Pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi'u cael gyda'r GIG a llywodraeth leol i sicrhau y gellir rhyddhau cleifion sydd wedi cwblhau'u triniaeth feddygol o ysbytai?

**Gwenda Thomas:** Mae'r trafodaethau hyn, yr wyf fi a'r Gweinidog yn rhan ohonynt, yn parhaus. Byddaf yn cyfarfod yn rheolaidd â Chymdeithas Cyfarwyddwyr Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru, Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ac awdurdodau lleol unigol. Mater i'r awdurdodau lleol yw comisiynu'r gwasanaethau hyn, ond cyfeiriaf eto at adroddiad blynyddol y prif arolygydd, lle dywedodd fod cysondeb darpariaeth a chomisiynu yn fater o bwys inni. Yr ydym yn cael trafodaethau parhaus ar y mater, a bwriadaf ddal ati â hwy.

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Mae dwy ym mhob pum menyw dros 50 oed yng Nghymru yn dioddef o osteoporosis; mae hefyd yn effeithio ar nifer sylweddol o ddynion. Gellir cynorthwyo'r cyflwr gyda meddyginiaeth syml, ond eto, dim ond llond llaw o nyrsys arbenigol a chlinigau ar wasgar



matter. What plans do you have to ensure that there is comprehensive coverage for people in Wales by both specialist nurses and clinics to deal with this issue?

**Gwenda Thomas:** This again overlaps with the Minister for health's portfolio, but I recognise Jenny Randerson's initiative with regard to the toolkit and identifying the needs of individual constituencies. It is a positive step. I will consult with the Minister to answer your question in detail, and I am sure that the Minister will respond to that in writing.

### Well Person Clinics

**Q4 Janice Gregory:** Will the Minister make a statement on the role of well person clinics in general practice? OAQ(3)0506(HSS)

**Edwina Hart:** Well person clinics are not included as part of the general medical services contract. They can be commissioned locally by local health boards to meet the needs of the population.

**Janice Gregory:** It seems clear that a range of quite simple tests, many of which can be administered by practice nurses with GP back-up as required, can offer the opportunity for the early diagnosis and treatment of a wide range of conditions that might otherwise become more serious for the patient, and more expensive for the NHS. Do you agree that there are strong arguments for requiring all LHBs and GP practices to recognise the importance of this work?

**Edwina Hart:** I concur with your comments, Janice. Health promotion is part of the core GMS contract and every practice is supposed to do it. GMS practices also have a key role in preventative work, such as cervical cancer screening, child health surveillance, vaccinations and immunisation. Therefore, they have an important role to play. There might also be a role for well person clinics that LHBs need to look at.

**Jonathan Morgan:** One of the reasons for the new GMS contract was to increase access

sydd gennym i ddelio â'r mater hwn. Pa gynlluniau sydd gennych i sicrhau bod digon o glinigau a nyrsys arbenigol yng Nghymru i ddelio â'r mater hwn?

**Gwenda Thomas:** Mae fy mhortffolio i a phortffolio'r Gweinidog dros iechyd yn gorgyffwrdd eto yn hyn o beth, ond yr wyf yn cydnabod menter Jenny Randerson o ran y pecyn cymorth ac adnabod anghenion etholaethau unigol. Mae'n gam cadarnhaol. Ymgynghoraf â'r Gweinidog i ateb eich cwestiwn yn fanwl, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y Gweinidog yn ateb i hynny yn ysgrifenedig.

### Clinigau Lles

**C4 Janice Gregory:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gyflwyno clinigau lles mewn practis cyffredinol? OAQ(3)0506(HSS)

**Edwina Hart:** Nid yw clinigau lles yn rhan o'r contract gwasanaethau meddygol cyffredinol. Gellir eu comisiynu'n lleol gan fyrdau iechyd lleol i ddiwallu anghenion y boblogaeth.

**Janice Gregory:** Ymddengys yn glir y gall ystod o brofion eithaf syml, amryw ohonynt y gellir eu gweinyddu gan nyrsys practis gyda chefnogaeth meddygon teulu yn ôl y gofyn, roi cyfle i ddiagnosisio a thrin amrywiaeth eang o gyflyrau yn fuan—cyflyrau a allai fel arall fynd yn fwy difrifol i'r claf ac yn fwy drud i'r GIG. A gytunwch y ceir dadleuon cadarn dros ofyn i bob bwrdd iechyd lleol a phractis meddyg teulu gydnabod pwysigrwydd y gwaith hwn?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf yn cytuno â'ch sylwadau, Janice. Mae hybu iechyd yn rhan o'r contract craidd ar gyfer gwasanaethau meddygol cyffredinol ac mae pob practis i fod i'w wneud. Mae gan bractisiau gwasanaethau meddygol cyffredinol swyddogaeth allweddol i'w chwarae mewn gwaith ataliol, megis sgrinio am ganser ceg y groth, cadw golwg ar iechyd plant, brechu ac imiwneiddio. Mae ganddynt, felly, swyddogaeth bwysig. Efallai y ceir hefyd swyddogaeth ar gyfer clinigau lles y mae angen i BILlau edrych arnynt.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Un o'r rhesymau dros y contract newydd ar gyfer gwasanaethau

to primary care. You will know that Gwent Community Health Council held a survey of practices in the Gwent area and found that the improvement in access to primary care had not come about, given limited opening hours, less than positive access to a GP when the GP was required—a whole range of problems were identified in the thorough survey that was done. Do you think that Gwent is typical of the rest of Wales?

**Edwina Hart:** You have asked me a question about an issue that I was discussing with the British Medical Association this morning, when I raised concerns about the report from Gwent. The BMA's position has been made quite clear publicly: it wants best practice everywhere in how things are dealt with. I have therefore been discussing with it and my officials what fuller information I might need to see whether there is a similar pattern across Wales. I have a funny feeling that it will occur in other parts of Wales.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I am grateful to the Minister for being so frank and honest with us this afternoon, because I know that some Assembly Government officials were not keen to admit that Gwent could be typical of the rest of Wales, bearing in mind that Gwent has a rural part, a very much urban part and also a series of Valleys communities, which represent other parts of Wales. If you are keen to see the picture throughout Wales, what work will you be doing with the community health councils to assist them in their work? They are keen to ensure that surveys and investigations are done throughout Wales to assess the impact of the GMS contract. Will you be working closely with them to ensure that we get the right pattern of information?

**Edwina Hart:** I already work closely with the community health councils and I very much value their work in this regard. I will also be working closely with the BMA around issues concerning GP practices. I did

meddygol cyffredinol oedd cynyddu mynediad at ofal sylfaenol. Byddwch yn gwybod i Gyngor Iechyd Cymuned Gwent gynnal arolwg o bractisiau yn ardal Gwent ac iddo ganfod nad oedd y gwelliannau yng nghyswllt mynediad at ofal sylfaenol wedi'u gwireddu, ac ystyried oriau agor cyfyngedig, mynediad at feddyg teulu heb fod yn gadarnhaol pan oedd angen gweld un—canfuwyd llw o broblemau yn yr arolwg trylwyr a gynhaliwyd. A ydych yn credu bod yr hyn sy'n digwydd yng Ngwent yn nodweddiadol o weddill Cymru?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr ydych wedi gofyn cwestiwn imi am fater yr oeddwn yn ei drafod y bore yma gyda Chymdeithas Feddygol Prydain, pan godais bryderon am yr adroddiad o Went. Mae safbwynt Cymdeithas Feddygol Prydain wedi cael ei wneud yn glir yn gyhoeddus: mae am weld arfer gorau ymhobman o ran sut y caiff pethau eu trin. Felly, yr wyf wedi bod yn cael trafodaethau gyda'r gymdeithas a'm swyddogion ynghylch pa wybodaeth lawnach y gallai fod angen arnaf er mwyn gweld a oes patrwm tebyg ledled Cymru. Mae gennyf deimlad rhyfedd y bydd yn codi mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am fod mor ddi-flewyn ar dafod ac onest â ni y prynhawn yma, oherwydd gwn nad oedd rhai swyddogion Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn awyddus i gyfaddef y gallai Gwent fod yn nodweddiadol o weddill Cymru, a chofio bod gan Went ardal wledig, ardal drefol iawn a hefyd cyfres o gymunedau yn y Cymoedd, sy'n cynrychioli rhannau eraill o Gymru. Os ydych yn awyddus i weld y darlun ledled Cymru, pa waith y byddwch yn ei wneud gyda'r cynghorau iechyd cymuned i'w cynorthwyo â'u gwaith? Maent yn awyddus i sicrhau bod arolygon ac ymchwiliadau'n cael eu cynnal ledled Cymru i asesu effaith y contract ar gyfer gwasanaethau meddygol cyffredinol. A fyddwch yn gweithio'n agos gyda nhw i sicrhau ein bod yn cael y patrwm cywir o wybodaeth?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf eisoes yn gweithio'n agos gyda'r cynghorau iechyd cymuned a gwerthfawrogaf eu gwaith yn hyn o beth yn fawr. Byddaf hefyd yn gweithio'n agos gyda Chymdeithas Feddygol Prydain ar faterion yn

not use the word 'typical', but there are bound to be other examples across Wales of the bad practice that has emerged in Gwent. However, we also have to recognise that the vast majority of GP practices fulfil their obligations wonderfully, are well respected in their communities and the patients value their services. We are talking about a minority, but we have to deal with that minority.

**David Lloyd:** As we have heard from Jenny Randerson, it was World Asthma Day yesterday, and further to the discussion about the need to increase the percentage of treatment plans, you will be aware that it is obligatory in the GP contract to provide an annual asthma check-up in the surgery for all asthmatic patients. In relation to improving asthma care, would you therefore join me, Minister, in stressing that people should not smoke in front of their asthmatic children, that these clinics should be held in GP surgeries—as we have heard, they are not—and that patients should attend routine asthma check-ups when they are called to do so?

**Edwina Hart:** I thank Dai for putting that so concisely as a clinician. I agree with all of his comments.

### Support for Hospices

**Q5 Mark Isherwood:** Will the Minister make a statement on support for hospices in Wales? OAQ(3)0516(HSS)

**Edwina Hart:** I have met with Viv Sugar, who is chairing the Wales palliative care planning group, and she is finalising her report. I hope that her draft report will be sent out to Members and to the hospice movement shortly for comment before I make any final decisions.

**Mark Isherwood:** At the first meeting of the all-party group on hospices, concern was raised about the quality of service provided by one of the major recipients of central Assembly Government funding for hospices. What assurances can you give that the

ymwneud â phractisau meddygon teulu. Ni ddefnyddiais y gair 'nodweddiadol', ond mae'n siŵr y bydd enghreifftiau eraill ledled Cymru o'r arfer gwael sydd wedi codi'i ben yng Ngwent. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni hefyd gydnabod bod y rhan fwyaf o bractisau meddygon teulu'n cyflawni eu hymrwymiaidau'n wych, cânt eu parchu yn eu cymunedau ac mae'r cleifion yn gwerthfawrogi eu gwasanaethau. Yr ydym yn sôn am leiafrif, ond rhaid inni ddelio â'r lleiafrif hynny.

**David Lloyd:** Fel yr ydym wedi clywed gan Jenny Randerson, yr oedd yn Ddiwrnod Asthma y Byd ddoe, ac yn ogystal â'r drafodaeth ynghylch yr angen i gynyddu canran y cynlluniau triniaeth, gwyddoch ei bod yn ofynnol yn y contract i feddygon teulu ddarparu archwiliad asthma blynyddol yn y feddygfa ar gyfer yr holl gleifion ag asthma. O ran gwella gofal asthma, a fydddech felly yn ymuno â mi, Weinidog, i bwysleisio na ddylai pobl ysmygu o flaen plant ag asthma, y dylai'r clinigau hyn gael eu cynnal mewn meddygfeydd meddygon teulu—gan nad ydynt, fel ag yr ydym wedi clywed—ac y dylai cleifion fynychu archwiliadau asthma rheolaidd pan ofynnir iddynt wneud hynny?

**Edwina Hart:** Diolchaf i Dai am fynegi hynny mor gryno fel clinigwr. Cytunaf â'i holl sylwadau.

### Cefnogaeth i Hosbisau

**C5 Mark Isherwood:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gefnogaeth i hosbisau yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)0516(HSS)

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf wedi cyfarfod â Viv Sugar, sy'n cadeirio grŵp cynllunio gofal lliniarol Cymru, sydd wrthi'n cwblhau ei hadroddiad. Gobeithiaf anfon ei hadroddiad drafft at Aelodau ac i'r mudiad hosbisau cyn bo hir, er mwyn iddynt gyflwyno sylwadau arno, cyn y dof i unrhyw benderfyniadau terfynol.

**Mark Isherwood:** Yng nghyfarfod cyntaf y grŵp hollbleidiol ar hosbisau, mynegwyd pryder am ansawdd y gwasanaeth a ddarparwyd gan un o brif dderbynwyr cyllid canolog Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer hosbisau. Pa sicrwydd y gallwch ei roi y

distribution of money to independent hospices in Wales in future will be linked to scrutiny of the quality of services provided and to the correct clinical and corporate governance of that service?

**Edwina Hart:** When I commissioned the report, I had some of the comments that you have made very much in mind. It is important that when public money is used, it is used properly, and that there is proper scrutiny. Also, there are issues around clinical governance that have to be adhered to. After my discussions with Viv Sugar yesterday, I think that that will be the direction of travel.

**Lesley Griffiths:** In March, I chaired the inaugural meeting of the cross-party hospice interest group, which Mark Isherwood just referred to, which was attended by seven Assembly Members. The purpose of this new group is to promote awareness of the contribution made by, and the issues facing, hospices in the provision of palliative and end-of-life care in Wales. Among the many issues discussed, it was agreed that the group would examine funding and where hospices fit in with other parties and agencies involved in the commissioning process in Wales. Minister, will you please accept my invitation to meet with the group in the not too distant future to share with us your vision of the role that hospices play in providing the wonderful service that they do?

**Edwina Hart:** Thank you for your kind invitation. I would be delighted to attend a future meeting of the group, and, by that time, Viv Sugar's report will have been published. I think that will prove to be an interesting discussion on how the palliative care agenda should move forward.

12.50 p.m.

**Eleanor Burnham:** As a former hospice fundraiser, I am very concerned about the huge challenges that hospices face. I believe that we are not treating them with the due respect that they deserve and there are many creative ways in which local health boards, as they currently stand, and local hospitals could

bydd yr arian a ddsberthir i hosbisau annibynnol yng Nghymru i'r dyfodol yn gysylltiedig â phroses graffu ar ansawdd y gwasanaethau a ddarparwyd ac ar lywodraethu corfforaethol a chlinigol cywir y gwasanaeth hwnnw?

**Edwina Hart:** Pan gomisiynais yr adroddiad, yr oedd gennyf rai o'r sylwadau a wnaethoch ym mlaen fy meddwl. Pan ddefnyddir arian cyhoeddus mae'n bwysig y caiff ei ddefnyddio'n briodol ac y craffir arno'n briodol. Hefyd, mae materion yn ymwneud â llywodraethu clinigol y mae'n rhaid glynu wrthynt. Ar ôl fy nhrafodaeth â Viv Sugar ddoe, credaf mai dyma fydd y llwybr a ddilynir.

**Lesley Griffiths:** Ym mis Mawrth, cadeiriais gyfarfod cyntaf y grŵp trawsbleidiol â diddordeb mewn hosbisau, y cyfeiriodd Mark Isherwood ato gynnu, ac yr oedd saith Aelod Cynulliad yn bresennol. Pwrpas y grŵp newydd hwn yw hyrwyddo ymwybyddiaeth o'r cyfraniad a wnaethpwyd gan hosbisau wrth ddarparu gofal lliniarol a diwedd oes yng Nghymru a'r materion sy'n eu hwynebu. Ymysg y materion lu a drafodwyd, cytunwyd y byddai'r grŵp yn archwilio'r cyllid ac yn edrych ar swyddogaeth hosbisau yng nghyswllt partïon ac asiantaethau eraill sydd ynghlwm wrth y broses gomisiynu yng Nghymru. Weinidog, a wnewch dderbyn fy ngwahoddiad i gwrdd â'r grŵp yn y dyfodol agos i rannu eich gweledigaeth am swyddogaeth hosbisau o ran darparu'r gwasanaeth aruthrol a wnânt?

**Edwina Hart:** Diolch am eich gwahoddiad caredig. Byddwn wrth fy modd yn mynychu cyfarfod o'r grŵp yn y dyfodol, ac erbyn hynny, bydd adroddiad Viv Sugar wedi cael ei gyhoeddi. Credaf y bydd honno'n drafodaeth ddiddorol am sut y dylid mynd â'r agenda gofal lliniarol rhagddi.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Fel un sydd wedi codi arian i hosbis yn y gorffennol, yr wyf yn poeni'n arw am yr heriau sy'n wynebu hosbisau. Credaf nad ydym yn eu trin â'r parch sy'n ddyledus iddynt ac mae nifer o ffyrdd creadigol y gallai byrddau iechyd lleol, fel ag y maent ar hyn o bryd, ac ysbytai lleol

enter into service level agreements. Are you aware that Nightingale House in Wrexham, for instance, receives funding for non-palliative issues and healthcare related to lymphoedema, which is welcome, but that hospices such as St Kentigern in St Asaph provide their premises free of charge to carry out lymphoedema treatments for non-palliative care patients? What financial help do you have for them?

**Edwina Hart:** I would not like to think that the hospice movement as a whole is not treated with respect by every Assembly Member. We have all had dealings with the hospice movement, and the NHS has regular dealings with the sector. The NHS very much recognises the role of the hospice movement in assisting with end-of-life issues in particular. The issue for the hospice movement is its arrangements with the NHS. It is about what type of service level agreements hospices can have, and how they can perhaps get additional money for the other services that they provide that are not on the palliative care side, such as lymphoedema treatments, as you mentioned, and so on. Once the report is produced, it is a question of taking that through constructively, looking at implementing that report, if it is acceptable, and then looking at the funding streams that underlie it, to get a clear picture across Wales and an even playing field.

**Janet Ryder:** Further to that response, Minister, I am sure that you are aware that the geographical position of some hospices affects how they are dealt with by LHBs; hospices are not dealt with equitably across Wales. As LHBs are now facing change, can you give me an assurance that funding for palliative care services, particularly those provided by independent hospices, will be taken fully into account in any future restructuring of the NHS in Wales?

**Edwina Hart:** Yes. I will have to look at palliative care services in terms of restructuring, with regard to how the money flows and what types of agreements there need to be. I believe that Viv Sugar's report

lunio cytundebau lefel gwasanaeth. A ydych yn ymwybodol bod Tŷ'r Eos yn Wrexham, er enghraifft, yn cael cyllid ar gyfer pethau nad ydynt yn lliniarol ac am ofal iechyd sy'n ymwneud â lymffodema, a chroesawn hynny, ond mae hosbisau megis St Kentigern yn Llanelwy yn darparu lle yn rhad ac am ddim er mwyn cynnal triniaethau lymffodema ar gleifion nad ydynt yn cael gofal lliniarol? Pa gymorth ariannol sydd ar gael gennych iddynt?

**Edwina Hart:** Ni fyddwn yn hoffi meddwl nad yw'r mudiad hosbisau yn ei gyfanrwydd yn cael ei drin â pharch gan bob Aelod Cynulliad. Mae pob un ohonom wedi cael cysylltiad â'r mudiad hosbisau, ac mae'r GIG mewn cysylltiad rheolaidd â'r sector. Mae'r GIG wir yn cydnabod swyddogaeth y mudiad hosbisau o ran cynorthwyo â materion diwedd oes yn benodol. Ei drefniadau â'r GIG yw'r mater dan sylw i'r mudiad hosbisau. Mae'n ymwneud â pha fath o gytundebau lefel gwasanaeth y gall hosbisau eu cael, a sut y gallant efallai gael arian ychwanegol ar gyfer y gwasanaethau eraill a ddarparant, sef y rheini nad ydynt yn ymwneud â gofal lliniarol, megis y triniaethau lymffodema y soniasoch amdanynt, ac yn y blaen. Ar ôl cyhoeddi'r adroddiad, mae'n fater o fynd â hwnnw rhagddo'n adeiladol, ceisio gweithredu'r adroddiad hwnnw, os yw'n dderbyniol, ac yna chwilio am ffynonellau cyllido sy'n sail iddo, i gael darlun clir ledled Cymru a chreu sefyllfa deg i bawb.

**Janet Ryder:** Yn dilyn yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog, yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol bod lleoliad daearyddol rhai hosbisau yn effeithio ar sut y cânt eu trin gan y BILlau; ni chaiff hosbisau eu trin yn gyfartal ledled Cymru. Gan fod BILlau yn awr yn wynebu newidiadau, a allwch fy sicrhau y bydd cyllid ar gyfer gwasanaethau gofal lliniarol, yn enwedig y rheini a ddarperir gan hosbisau annibynnol, yn cael eu hystyried yn llawn wrth ailstrwythuro'r GIG yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol?

**Edwina Hart:** Gallaf. Bydd rhaid imi edrych ar wasanaethau gofal lliniarol wrth ailstrwythuro, o ran sut y mae'r arian yn llifo a pha fath o drefniadau y mae eu hangen. Credaf y bydd adroddiad Viv Sugar yn rhoi

will form a basis for us to look at some of those funding mechanisms.

When we are talking about hospices, we are talking about the independent hospice movement in terms of the support that Government is trying to give. However, we must also ensure a balance, because it wants to keep its distance from us, at the same time as receiving money from us. Some of the hospices that I have visited across Wales have stressed that independence to me. I visited Nightingale House with Lesley Griffiths, and one issue that was raised was about that balance between the funding from the LHB and the relationship with the trust, and independence in fundraising. It is a difficult juggling act for the sector, but we must get certainty into the process where Government money is concerned.

#### **Gwasanaeth Ambiwylans yn ystod y Nos**

**Q6 Bethan Jenkins:** Will the Minister make a statement on night-time ambulance service provision in Neath Port Talbot? OAQ(3)0520(HSS)

**Edwina Hart:** The Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust deploys emergency vehicles based on predicted demand and resource levels in the locality. The current level of performance in Neath Port Talbot is unsatisfactory, and I have asked for action to address this.

**Bethan Jenkins:** I am glad that you have asked for action to address this. I have had quite a lot of correspondence from residents in the Glynneath area relating to ambulance provision Mondays to Fridays at night. In the event of the capacity being limited, due to staff illness and so on, can the Minister assure us that the ambulance stations in the area have the necessary minimum capacity to provide a service to their communities, and that there is not an over-reliance on the use of ambulance cars?

**Edwina Hart:** Thank you for that question. That is an issue that my Deputy Minister, Gwenda Thomas, has raised with me as an Assembly Member, with regard to concerns about Pontardawe; those concerns have

sail inni er mwyn edrych ar rai o'r mecanweithiau cyllido hynny.

Wrth siarad am hosbisau, yr ydym yn siarad am y mudiad hosbisau annibynnol a'r gefnogaeth y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ceisio'i rhoi iddynt. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gael cydbwysedd, oherwydd mae'r mudiad am gadw lled braich oddi wrthym a chael arian gennym ar yr un pryd. Mae rhai o'r hosbisau yr wyf wedi ymweld â hwy ledled Cymru wedi pwysleisio'r annibyniaeth hynny imi. Ymwelais â Thŷ'r Eos gyda Lesley Griffiths, ac un mater a godwyd oedd y cydbwysedd hwnnw rhwng cael cyllid gan y BILl a'r berthynas â'r ymddiriedolaeth, ac annibyniaeth o ran codi arian. Mae cael cydbwysedd yn fater anodd iawn i'r sector, ond rhaid inni gyflwyno sefydlogrwydd i'r broses os defnyddir arian y Llywodraeth.

#### **Night-time Ambulance Service**

**C6 Bethan Jenkins:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddarpariaeth gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn ystod y nos yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot? OAQ(3)0520(HSS)

**Edwina Hart:** Mae Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwylans Cymru yn trefnu cerbydau argyfwng yn seiliedig ar ragamcan o'r galw ac ar lefelau adnoddau yn yr ardal leol. Mae'r perfformiad ar hyn o bryd yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot yn anfoddfaol, ac yr wyf wedi gofyn iddynt gymryd camau i fynd i'r afael â hyn.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi gofyn iddynt gymryd camau i fynd i'r afael â hyn. Yr wyf wedi cael cryn dipyn o ohebiaeth gan drigolion yn ardal Glyn-nedd ynghylch darpariaeth ambiwlans o ddydd Llun i ddydd Gwener yn y nos. Petai'r gallu wedi'i gyfyngu, o ganlyniad i salwch staff ac yn y blaen, a all y Gweinidog ein sicrhau bod gan orsafoedd ambiwlans yn yr ardal o leiaf y gallu angenrheidiol i ddarparu gwasanaeth i'w cymunedau, ac nad oes gorddibyniaeth ar ddefnyddio ceir ambiwlans?

**Edwina Hart:** Diolch am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Mae'n fater y mae fy Nirprwy Weinidog, Gwenda Thomas, wedi'i godi â mi fel Aelod Cynulliad, yn sgil pryderon am Bontardawe; mae'n siŵr eich bod wedi

probably also been raised with you. There are issues about relief capacity when people are ill, or are on holiday, and we hope that a new annual leave policy, and other measures, will assist in addressing such shortage issues. Like you, I believe that you have to have the right vehicle for the incident. I am extremely dissatisfied with what is going on in the Neath Port Talbot area, and I expect the ambulance service to rectify the situation as soon as possible. If Members for that area have other concerns about specific situations, I would be glad to receive that correspondence.

**Alun Cairns:** Will the Minister recognise that there is general concern about the future of smaller ambulance stations, and that there is a reported drive towards super-stations? When you consider the time that it takes to travel from these super-stations, it raises many questions in rural areas. In some instances, for whatever reason, two, three or even four hours to respond are not unheard of at the moment, even when the smaller stations remain open.

**Edwina Hart:** I fully understand those concerns and I know that they have been expressed to Stuart Fletcher, who is undertaking a review of the ambulance service at the moment, in the light of the audit report and the problems that we had with the service. We have to recognise that there is a specific need in rural areas and you cannot always tie it up in terms of in pounds, shillings and pence and what it may look like. We have to look at the needs of the population and I am quite determined that the ambulance trust will be run in that manner in the future: it will be looking at the needs and requirements of the population.

### English Hospitals

**Q7 William Graham:** Will the Minister make a statement on the determination of patient funding for people living in cross-border areas who required treatment in English hospitals? OAQ(3)0529(HSS)

**Edwina Hart:** The Welsh Assembly

clywed y pryderon hynny hefyd. Ceir materion ynghylch staff llanw pan mae pobl yn sâl, neu ar eu gwyliau, a gobeithiwn y bydd polisi gwyliau blynyddol newydd, a mesurau eraill, yn cynorthwyo i fynd i'r afael â materion tebyg yn ymwneud â phrinder. Yr wyf fi, fel chi, yn credu ei bod yn rhaid ichi gael y cerbyd cywir ar gyfer y digwyddiad. Yr wyf yn hynod anfodlon â'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn ardal Castell-nedd Port Talbot, a disgwyliaf i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans ddatrys y sefyllfa cyn gynted â phosibl. Os oes gan Aelodau dros yr ardal honno bryderon eraill am sefyllfaoedd penodol, byddwn yn falch iawn o gael yr ohebiaeth hynny.

**Alun Cairns:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog gydnabod bod pryder cyffredinol am ddyfodol gorsafoedd ambiwlans llai, a bod ymgyrch yn ôl y sôn tuag at arch-orsafoedd? Pan fyddwch yn ystyried yr amser a gymer i deithio o'r arch-orsafoedd hyn, mae'n codi llawer o gwestiynau mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Mewn rhai enghreifftiau ar hyn o bryd, am ba reswm bynnag, nid yw'n anarferol clywed bod dwy, tair neu hyd yn oed pedair awr wedi mynd heibio cyn iddynt ymateb, a hynny pan mae'r gorsafoedd llai yn dal i fod ar agor.

**Edwina Hart:** Deallaf y pryderon hynny'n llawn a gwn eu bod wedi cael eu mynegi i Stuart Fletcher, sy'n cynnal adolygiad o'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans ar hyn o bryd, yn sgil yr adroddiad archwilio a'r problemau yr ydym wedi'u cael â'r gwasanaeth. Rhaid inni gydnabod bod angen penodol mewn ardaloedd gwledig ac ni allwch bob amser ei ddatrys yn nhermau hyn a hyn o arian a'r patrwm posibl. Rhaid inni edrych ar anghenion y boblogaeth ac yr wyf yn benderfynol y caiff yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans ei rhedeg felly yn y dyfodol: bydd yn edrych ar anghenion a gofynion y boblogaeth.

### Ysbytai yn Lloegr

**C7 William Graham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am bennu cyllid cleifion ar gyfer pobl sy'n byw mewn ardaloedd trawsffiniol yr oedd eisiau triniaeth mewn ysbytai yn Lloegr arnynt? OAQ(3)0529(HSS)

**Edwina Hart:** Mae gan Lywodraeth

Government has a national agreement in place with the Department of Health that requires local health boards and English trusts to agree locally the costs of treating Welsh patients in England.

**William Graham:** You will know of the concern generated among some patients in south-east Wales by the recent memorandum issued by the North Bristol NHS Trust that it would not book follow-up appointments for Welsh residents or list them for surgery, owing to the difficulties produced by non-payment for treatment provided to Welsh residents. Have you expressed to English NHS trusts the necessity of not denying patient services to Welsh residents?

**Edwina Hart:** I have checked on this matter with officials and we are not aware of any disputes or refusals to treat patients at English hospitals, including those run by the North Bristol NHS Trust. I have asked Ann Lloyd, as the director of health and social services, to keep a sharp eye on these cross-border issues and to report any future problems to me.

### Chronic and Long-term Conditions

**Q8 Val Lloyd:** What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to help people deal with chronic and long-term conditions? OAQ(3)0545(HSS)

**Edwina Hart:** I have asked the health communities across Wales to develop local plans by 16 May, in line with our chronic conditions management strategy. I have committed £15 million to drive service improvements across Wales over the next three years.

**Val Lloyd:** You know that the service development and commissioning directives set out in 'Designed for Life' for people with arthritis and similar chronic conditions spell out a number of key actions—in particular, an audit and review of services and population needs and the establishment of a

Cynulliad Cymru gytundeb cenedlaethol mewn grym â'r Adran Iechyd sy'n mynnu bod byrddau iechyd lleol ac ymddiriedolaethau yn Lloegr yn cytuno'n lleol ar gostau trin cleifion o Gymru yn Lloegr.

**William Graham:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r pryder a achoswyd i rai cleifion yn ne-ddwyrain Cymru yn sgil y memorandwm diweddar a gyhoeddwyd gan Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gogledd Bryste a oedd yn datgan na fyddai'n trefnu apwyntiadau dilynol i drigolion Cymru na'u rhestru ar gyfer llawdriniaeth, oherwydd yr anawsterau a gododd gyda thriniaethau i drigolion Cymru nas talwyd amdanynt. A ydych wedi dweud wrth ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG yn Lloegr pa mor bwysig yw peidio â gwrthod darparu gwasanaethau i gleifion o Gymru?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf wedi holi fy swyddogion am y mater hwn ac nid ydym yn ymwybodol o unrhyw anghydfod nac unrhyw wrthodiad i drin cleifion mewn ysbytai yn Lloegr, gan gynnwys y rheini sy'n cael eu rhedeg gan Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gogledd Bryste. Yr wyf wedi holi Ann Lloyd, cyfarwyddwraig yr adran iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, i gadw llygad barcud ar y materion trawsffiniol hyn ac i adrodd wrthyf am unrhyw broblemau.

### Cyflyrau Cronig a Thymor Hir

**C8 Val Lloyd:** Beth mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n ei wneud i helpu pobl i ddelio â chyflyrau cronig a thymor hir? OAQ(3)0545(HSS)

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf wedi gofyn i gymunedau iechyd ledled Cymru lunio cynlluniau lleol erbyn 16 Mai, yn unol â'n strategaeth rheoli cyflyrau cronig. Yr wyf wedi ymrwymo £15 miliwn i yrru gwelliannau mewn gwasanaethau ledled Cymru dros y tair blynedd nesaf.

**Val Lloyd:** Gwyddoch fod y cyfarwyddbau comisiynu a datblygu gwasanaeth a nodwyd yn 'Cynllun Oes' ar gyfer pobl ag arthritis a chyflyrau cronig tebyg yn pennu nifer o gamau allweddol—yn benodol, archwiliad ac adolygiad o wasanaethau ac anghenion y boblogaeth, yn ogystal â sefydlu grŵp



joint service advisory group. I know that relevant patient groups are keen to see progress. Could you therefore update me on progress across Wales on those two key actions?

**Edwina Hart:** It might be opportune, in response to your question, to issue a written statement to update Assembly Members on the chronic condition issues that I have been dealing with, once I have the plans in on 16 May. I think that that would be the appropriate course of action, Presiding Officer, if the Member is agreeable to that.

**Angela Burns:** Minister, many children become diabetic in their early teens and struggle to come to terms with that because of mental health issues, inadequate support from the parental home or social peer pressure—all their mates are going out and having fun and they perceive that they cannot do so. I have several constituents who are having enormous problems with this, particularly with the mental health issues. Do you have any plans to re-evaluate the provision of care for children who have been diagnosed with diabetes and to target additional support at those in particularly tricky circumstances?

**Edwina Hart:** Thank you for your question. It is the first time that I have been made aware of these particular difficulties. I will look at my diabetes strategy and at what has been allocated currently. It might be helpful for me to meet your constituents with these problems; I would be happy to do so, if you wish. There could then be further discussions on these important issues that you have raised.

**Alun Davies:** Minister, I am sure that you will agree that people who have to receive long-term treatments are better off receiving that treatment close to home, as that involves less stress and less travelling, and will achieve a better outcome. In that context, we all welcome the new renal facility in Glangwili hospital. It is a wonderful facility, providing fantastic new treatment for people in Carmarthenshire. However, people from

cynghori gwasanaethau ar y cyd. Gwn fod grwpiau cleifion perthnasol yn awyddus i weld cynnydd. A allwch felly roi'r newyddion diweddaraf am y cynnydd ledled Cymru ar y ddau gam allweddol hynny?

**Edwina Hart:** Efallai y byddai'n gyfle da, wrth ateb eich cwestiwn, i gyhoeddi datganiad ysgrifenedig i roi'r newyddion diweddaraf i Aelodau Cynulliad o ran materion yn ymwneud â'r cyflyrau cronig yr wyf wedi bod yn delio a hwy, ar ôl imi gael y cynlluniau ar 16 Mai. Credaf mai dyna fyddai'r cam mwyaf priodol, Lywydd, os yw'r Aelod yn cytuno â hynny.

**Angela Burns:** Weinidog, mae llawer o blant yn cael diabetes yn eu harddegau cynnar ac yn ei chael yn anodd dod i delerau â hynny oherwydd materion iechyd meddwl, cefnogaeth annigonol gartref neu bwysau cymdeithasol gan eu cyfoedion—mae eu ffrindiau i gyd yn mynd allan i gael hwyl ond maent yn credu na allant wneud hynny eu hunain. Mae gennyf lawer o etholwyr sy'n wynebu problemau enfawr gyda hyn, yn enwedig o ran materion iechyd meddwl. A oes gennych unrhyw gynlluniau i ailwerthuso darpariaeth gofal i blant y canfyddir bod ganddynt ddiabetes ac i dargedu cefnogaeth ychwanegol at y rheini sydd mewn amgylchiadau anodd iawn?

**Edwina Hart:** Diolch am eich cwestiwn. Dyma'r tro cyntaf imi glywed am yr anawsterau penodol hyn. Bwriadaf daro golwg dros fy strategaeth diabetes ac ar yr hyn sydd wedi cael ei ddyrannu ar hyn o bryd. Efallai y byddai'n ddefnyddiol imi gwrdd â'ch etholwyr sy'n wynebu'r problemau hyn; byddwn yn fwy na pharod i wneud hynny, os dymunwch. Yna, gellid cael trafodaethau pellach am y materion pwysig hyn yr ydych wedi'u codi.

**Alun Davies:** Weinidog, yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnewch gytuno ei bod yn well i bobl sy'n gorfod cael triniaethau tymor hir gael y driniaeth honno yn agos at eu cartref, gan achosi llai o straen a llai o deithio, a bydd hynny'n arwain at well canlyniad. Yn y cyddestun hwnnw, mae pob un ohonom yn croesawu'r cyfleuster arenol newydd yn ysbyty Glangwili. Mae'n gyfleuster gwych, yn darparu triniaeth newydd fendigedig i bobl

Pembrokeshire still have to travel to Carmarthen for renal dialysis. I would welcome your assurance that, with the advent of the new Hywel Dda NHS Trust, we will see a renewed effort to locate a renal dialysis unit in Withybush Hospital, to provide treatment closer to home for people living in Pembrokeshire.

**Edwina Hart:** Matters are already in hand to put the appropriate unit in Withybush. It is a question now of agreeing the timescale for it and how we are going to deal with it. It is quite important for patients in Pembrokeshire because of travel times.

**Gareth Jones:** Mae fy nghwestiwn yn dilyn ymlaen o'r pwynt hwnnw. Weinidog, a wnewch ystyried sefydlu gwasanaeth symudol i ymdrin â dialysis arenol yn y rhannau mwy gwledig o Gymru, er enghraifft, yn etholaeth Aberconwy?

1.00 p.m.

**Edwina Hart:** I have asked the renal network to give me advice on the use of mobile units, and it is currently considering priorities in that area. I need to look at where the permanent units are, and where I can use mobile units. Therefore, I hope that, by the end of the summer, I will have a clear way forward, and I will then be able to answer your question more fully.

### Local Health Boards

**Q9 Nick Ramsay:** Will the Minister make a statement on the importance of local health boards to the healthcare system in Wales? OAQ(3)0530(HSS)

**Q10 Nick Ramsay:** Will the Minister make a statement on the proposed restructuring of local health boards in Wales? OAQ(3)0531(HSS)

**Edwina Hart:** On 2 April, I launched a consultation on proposals to change the structure of the NHS in Wales. It would be inappropriate for me to answer these questions until that consultation has ended.

yn sir Gaerfyrddin. Fodd bynnag, mae pobl sir Benfro yn dal i orfod teithio i sir Gaerfyrddin i gael dialysis yr arenau. Byddwn yn croesawu eich sicrhad, gyda dyfodiad yr Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Hywel Dda newydd, y byddwn yn gweld ymdrech o'r newydd i leoli uned dialysis yr arenau yn Ysbyty Llwynhelyg, er mwyn darparu triniaeth yn agosach at gartref i bobl sy'n byw yn sir Benfro.

**Edwina Hart:** Mae materion eisoes ar droed i leoli'r uned briodol yn Ysbyty Llwynhelyg. Bellach, mae'n gwestiwn o gytuno ar amserlen ar ei chyfer a sut yr ydym yn mynd i ddelio â hi. Mae'n bwysig iawn i gleifion yn sir Benfro oherwydd amserau teithio.

**Gareth Jones:** My question follows on from that point. Minister, will you consider establishing a mobile renal dialysis service in the most rural parts of Wales, for example, in the constituency of Aberconwy?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf wedi gofyn i'r rhwydwaith arenau roi cyngor imi ynghylch defnyddio unedau symudol, ac mae'n ystyried blaenoriaethau yn y maes hwnnw ar hyn o bryd. Mae angen imi edrych ym mhle mae'r unedau parhaol, ac ym mhle y gallaf ddefnyddio unedau symudol. Felly, erbyn diwedd yr haf, gobeithiaf y bydd gennyf ffordd glir ymlaen, ac yna gallaf ateb eich cwestiwn yn fanylach.

### Byrddau Iechyd Lleol

**C9 Nick Ramsay:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am bwysigrwydd byrddau iechyd lleol i'r system gofal iechyd yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)0530(HSS)

**C10 Nick Ramsay:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y cynnig i ailstrwythuro byrddau iechyd lleol yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)0531(HSS)

**Edwina Hart:** Ar 2 Ebrill, lansiais ymgynghoriad ar gynigion i newid strwythur y GIG yng Nghymru. Byddai'n anaddas imi ateb y cwestiynau hyn cyn i'r ymgynghoriad hwnnw ddod i ben.

**Nick Ramsay:** Thank you for that response, Minister. I want to ask you about the role of local health boards in promoting public health through immunisation. I believe that Joyce Watson raised the question with you earlier. We both attended the Wyeth-hosted event last night on the pneumococcal conjugate vaccine and the uptake of that in Wales, which is good compared to the uptake in England. We welcome that. However, there is an issue about local health boards and the variation between them in this area. Have you had discussions with local health boards about the importance of immunisation?

**Edwina Hart:** No, I have not had direct discussions with the chairs of the local health boards about the importance of immunisation. However, my officials discuss at every opportunity the issues around immunisation and the importance of getting the message across. The Chief Medical Officer has been particularly active in looking at these issues, because, as we know, there are enormous health benefits to be gained by children who are immunised. I will certainly look at what further work can be done in this area. It might be helpful if I were to provide Members with a note on some of the issues around immunisation. It may be of interest to them, and they may be able to use it in their constituencies in discussions with health professionals and others.

**Nick Ramsay:** Thank you, Minister. The report that has been produced on this issue is quite helpful. Therefore, I urge you to read it and to take on board its recommendations. One issue that came to the fore in yesterday's meeting was that immunisation is so much an accepted part of the health system that we focus on the bad news stories, forgetting the huge benefits that vaccination provides for our children, and indeed, for future generations as certain diseases, for example polio, may be wiped out, as smallpox was wiped out in the past. I would be grateful if you would look closely at the report and do what you can to ensure that there is a

**Nick Ramsay:** Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Yr wyf am eich holi am swyddogaeth byrddau iechyd lleol yng nghyswllt hyrwyddo iechyd y cyhoedd drwy imiwneiddio. Credaf i Joyce Watson godi'r cwestiwn gyda chi'n gynharach. Yr oedd y ddau ohonom yn bresennol yn y digwyddiad a gynhaliwyd gan Wyeth neithiwr ynghylch y brechiad cyfunedig niwmococol, a faint sy'n manteisio ar hwnnw yng Nghymru—sy'n dda o'i gymharu â'r nifer sy'n manteisio arno yn Lloegr. Croesawn hynny. Fodd bynnag, ceir problem yn ymwneud â byrddau iechyd lleol a'r amrywiaeth rhyngddynt yn y maes hwn. A ydych wedi cael trafodaethau gyda byrddau iechyd lleol ynghylch pwysigrwydd imiwneiddio?

**Edwina Hart:** Naddo, nid wyf wedi cael trafodaethau uniongyrchol gyda chadeiryddion y byrddau iechyd lleol ynghylch pwysigrwydd imiwneiddio. Fodd bynnag, bydd fy swyddogion yn trafod y materion sy'n gysylltiedig ag imiwneiddio a phwysigrwydd cyfleu'r neges ar bob cyfle posibl. Mae'r Prif Swyddog Meddygol wedi bod yn arbennig o weithgar wrth edrych ar y materion hyn, oherwydd, fel y gwyddom, mae imiwneiddio plant yn dwyn manteision iechyd aruthrol. Byddaf yn bendant yn edrych ar ba waith pellach y gellir ei wneud yn y maes hwn. Efallai y byddai'n ddefnyddiol imi ddarparu nodyn i Aelodau am rai o'r materion sy'n ymwneud ag imiwneiddio. Efallai y byddai o ddiddordeb iddynt, ac efallai y gallant ei ddefnyddio yn eu hetholaethau wrth drafod gyda gweithwyr proffesiynol ym maes iechyd ac eraill.

**Nick Ramsay:** Diolch, Weinidog. Mae'r adroddiad a gynhyrchwyd ar y mater hwn yn bur ddefnyddiol. Felly, fe'ch anogaf i'w ddarllen ac i ystyried ei argymhellion. Un mater a ddaeth i'r amlwg yn y cyfarfod ddoe oedd, gan fod imiwneiddio wedi hen ennill ei blwyf fel rhan o'r system iechyd, ein bod yn canolbwyntio ar y storïau newyddion drwg ac yn anghofio'r buddiannau enfawr y mae brechu'n eu rhoi i'n plant, ac yn wir, i genedlaethau'r dyfodol, wrth i glefydau penodol, er enghraifft polio, gael eu diddymu, yn yr un modd ag y diddymwyd y frech wen yn y gorffennol. Byddwn yn gwerthfawrogi petaech yn edrych ar yr adroddiad yn fanwl,

consistent level of uptake across Wales and that people get the benefits that these vaccinations can deliver.

**Edwina Hart:** I thank the Member for that question and for the positive way in which he addressed the immunisation issue. There is a positive news story here, and we are duty-bound to talk about the positive elements of this agenda. I will certainly look at that report; I know that my officials monitor all reports published on the issue carefully.

**Alun Fred Jones:** I understand your difficulty in discussing local health boards while the consultation is proceeding, but do you agree that it is important, as we look forward to a future with perhaps far fewer LHBs, that localisation is given due prominence in future discussions about the pattern that might emerge?

**Edwina Hart:** I do not think that that strays into the area of the consultation, because localism is a key issue. If organisations become larger, in many ways, they become more administratively efficient, but we must look at the local input that is possible. It is my view that we are not local enough in some of our discussions about health issues; we need a much more local focus, even on the boundaries of the local health boards with local authorities. I believe that that will emerge in the consultation process.

**The Presiding Officer:** Before we move to the next set of questions, I wish to remind Members of what it says in the white book on procedural rulings and precedents relating to Standing Order No. 7.55 on oral and supplementary questions. I am reminded that, on 9 July 2002, and again on 2 February 2005, I made a ruling on the inappropriateness of Members leaving the Chamber during the time when supplementary questions to the oral question that they have tabled are being asked by other Members. That is still a discourtesy.

ac yn gwneud yr hyn y gallwch i sicrhau bod lefel gyson o bobl yn manteisio ar hyn ledled Cymru, ac y caiff pobl y buddiannau y gall y brechiadau hyn eu darparu.

**Edwina Hart:** Diolchaf i'r Aelod am y cwestiwn hwnnw, ac am y modd cadarnhaol yr aeth i'r afael ag imiwneiddio. Ceir stori newyddion gadarnhaol yma, ac mae'n ddyletswydd arnom i sôn am elfennau cadarnhaol yr agenda hon. Byddaf yn siŵr o edrych ar yr adroddiad hwnnw; gwn fod fy swyddogion yn monitro'n fanwl pob adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd ar y mater.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Deallaf ei bod yn anodd ichi drafod byrddau iechyd lleol tra mae'r ymgynghoriad yn mynd rhagddo, ond wrth inni edrych ymlaen at ddyfodol gyda llai o lawer o BILlau o bosibl, a gytunwch ei bod yn bwysig rhoi amlygrwydd haeddiannol i frogarwch mewn trafodaethau yn y dyfodol ynghylch y patrwm a allai ddod i'r amlwg?

**Edwina Hart:** Ni chredaf fod hynny'n crwydro i faes yr ymgynghoriad, oherwydd mae brogarwch yn fater o bwys. Os bydd sefydliadau yn ehangu, byddant yn fwy effeithlon yn weinyddol ar lawer ystyr, ond rhaid inni edrych ar y cyfraniad lleol posibl. Yn fy marn i, nid yw rhai o'n trafodaethau am faterion iechyd yn ddigon lleol; mae angen inni ganolbwyntio llawer mwy ar fod yn lleol, hyd yn oed yng nghyd-destun ffiniau byrddau iechyd lleol gydag awdurdodau lleol. Credaf y daw hynny i'r amlwg yn y broses ymgynghori.

**Y Llywydd:** Cyn inni symud ymlaen at y gyfres nesaf o gwestiynau, dymunaf atgoffa'r Aelodau o'r hyn a ddywedir yn y llyfr gwyn am gynseiliau a dyfarniadau trefniadol yng nghyswllt Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.55 ynghylch cwestiynau atodol a llafar. Fe'm hatgoffir imi ddyfarnu ar 9 Gorffennaf 2002 ac eto ar 2 Chwefror 2005, pa mor amhriodol ydyw i Aelodau adael y Siambr pan fydd cwestiynau atodol i'r cwestiwn llafar y maent wedi'i gyflwyno yn cael eu gofyn gan Aelodau eraill. Mae hynny'n dal yn anghwrtais.

**Cwestiynau i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth**  
**Questions to the Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport**

**Manufacturing**

**Q1 David Melding:** Will the Minister make a statement on Welsh Assembly Government support for manufacturing in Wales? OAQ(3)0487(ECT)

**The Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** I will shortly be publishing a written statement on the ministerial advisory group recommendations. That will set out how we intend to support manufacturing and other key industries through a new strategic approach focusing on key sectors.

**David Melding:** You will know that manufacturing in the whole of the United Kingdom—and Wales has not been any different—over the last 30 years has declined as other economies, particularly in the far east, have grown. However, we can still realistically preserve and see expansion in the high-value manufacturing sector. Given that, 30 years ago, manufacturing would have been some 30 per cent plus of our economy, and is now some 15 per cent, will you set an objective for the size of the manufacturing sector that you want to see in Wales during this Government's term and those of future Governments?

**The Deputy First Minister:** In my response to the original question, I indicated that we were going to take a more sectoral approach to this whole area in the future. Although I am not in a position to make a full disclosure of what is in the ministerial advisory group recommendations today, I can say that manufacturing will be covered as an important part of that sectoral approach. We should not underplay it; even with the contraction that we have seen in recent years, manufacturing still plays an important role in the Welsh economy. For example, we have 155,000 jobs in the sector in Wales, which contributes over 18 per cent to our GVA. We should also remember that we are currently

**Gweithgynhyrchu**

**C1 David Melding:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gefnogaeth Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i weithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)0487(ECT)

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Byddaf yn cyhoeddi datganiad ysgrifenedig cyn bo hir ynghylch argymhellion grŵp cynghori'r Gweinidog. Bydd hynny'n gosod allan sut y bwriadwn gefnogi gweithgynhyrchu a diwydiannau allweddol eraill gyda dull strategol newydd a fydd yn canolbwyntio ar sectorau allweddol.

**David Melding:** Gwyddoch fod gweithgynhyrchu ledled y Deyrnas Unedig—ac ni fu'n Cymru'n eithriad—wedi dirywio dros y 30 mlynedd diwethaf wrth i economïau eraill dyfu, yn enwedig yn y dwyrain pell. Fodd bynnag, mae'n dal yn realistig inni gadw'r sector gweithgynhyrchu hwnnw, sector sy'n uchel ei werth, a'i weld yn ehangu. A chofio mai gweithgynhyrchu fyddai dros 30 y cant o'n heconomi 30 mlynedd yn ôl, ac mai 15 y cant ydyw bellach, a osodwch darged ar gyfer maint y sector gweithgynhyrchu y dymuneh ei weld yng Nghymru yn ystod tymor y Llywodraeth hon, a thymhorau Llywodraethau'r dyfodol?

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Yn fy ateb i'r cwestiwn gwreiddiol, dywedais ein bod yn mynd i arddel agwedd mwy sectoraidd at y maes hwn drwyddo draw yn y dyfodol. Er nad wyf mewn sefyllfa i ddatgelu'n llwyr beth sydd wedi'i gynnwys yn argymhellion grŵp cynghori'r Gweinidog heddiw, gallaf ddweud y rhoddir sylw i weithgynhyrchu fel rhan bwysig o'r agwedd sectoraidd honno. Ni ddylem ei danseilio; er gwaethaf y cwtogi a welwyd yn ystod y blynyddoedd diweddar, mae gweithgynhyrchu yn dal i chwarae rhan bwysig yn economi Cymru. Er enghraifft, mae gennym 155,000 o swyddi yn y sector yng Nghymru, sy'n cyfrannu dros 18 y cant at ein gwerth ychwanegol crynswth. Dylem

doing extremely well in terms of exports from Wales. Therefore, there is a good news story but, in future, we need a much more focused and sectoral approach.

**David Melding:** I partly welcome what the Deputy First Minister has said in terms of setting higher ambitions, because it is important that we send out a message that Wales is in the game to manufacture high-value products. That is what we want to do. Can you commit the Government to starting to expand that? I am not saying that you will achieve it instantly, but the message has to be that we want to see an increase in the manufacturing sector. It would be crucial to develop universities to identify the intellectual property that could lead to marketable products, and we need to see things like business support finance being given in smaller packets seeded around our economy so that those ideas that will take off get that chance. It is difficult to pick winners. An idea winning and getting to the marketplace is due to all sorts of factors. However, we need to send out the message that we see manufacturing increasing in the next generation.

**The Deputy First Minister:** I was trying to think whether there was anything that I could disagree with in David's question, and I was struggling. I think that we both share this aspiration of looking for high added value growth in research and development, in particular, and for the commercialisation of research, working through the recommendations of the Gibson report and so on. There is considerable common ground in these things. I hope that when we introduce our ministerial advisory group recommendations, there will be support for that approach and for the joint working that Jane Hutt and I are doing with the higher education sector. We have to remember that, historically, the higher education sector and the private sector have not worked closely enough. We have to ensure that that changes if we are to capture a greater percentage of research funding together with an increase in

hefyd gofio ein bod yn gwneud yn arbennig o dda ar hyn o bryd yng nghyd-destun allforio o Gymru. Felly, ceir stori newyddion da, ond yn y dyfodol, bydd angen ymdrin â hyn mewn ffordd llawer mwy sectoraidd a chyda ffocws pendant.

**David Melding:** Croesawaf yn rhannol yr hyn y mae'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog wedi'i ddweud yng nghyswllt pennu nodau uwch, oherwydd mae'n bwysig inni gyfleu neges bod Cymru o ddifrif ynghylch gweithgynhyrchu cynnyrch sy'n uchel ei werth. Dyna yr ydym yn dymuno ei wneud. A allwch ymrwymo'r Llywodraeth i ddechrau ehangu hynny? Nid wyf yn dweud y byddwch yn ei gyflawni ar unwaith, ond y neges y mae'n rhaid ei chyfleu yw ein bod yn dymuno gweld cynnydd yn y sector gweithgynhyrchu. Byddai'n hanfodol datblygu prifysgolion i ganfod yr eiddo deallusol a allai arwain at gynhyrchion y gellid eu masnachu, ac mae angen inni weld pethau megis cyllid cymorth busnes yn cael eu cynnig mewn pecynnau llai ac yn cael eu gwasgaru ar draws ein heconomi er mwyn i'r syniadau hynny a allai lwyddo gael y cyfle. Mae'n anodd dewis enillwyr. Mae llwyddiant syniad a'r syniad yn cyrraedd y farchnad yn dibynnu ar bob math o ffactorau. Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni gyfleu'r neges ein bod yn credu y bydd gweithgynhyrchu ar gynnydd yn y genhedlaeth nesaf.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Yr oeddwn yn ceisio meddwl a oedd unrhyw beth y gallwn anghytuno ag ef yng nghwestiwn David, ac yr oeddwn yn straffaglu. Credaf fod y ddau ohonom yn rhannu'r dyhead hwn o edrych am dwf gwerth ychwanegol uchel, ym maes ymchwil a datblygu yn arbennig, ac yng nghyswllt masnacholi ymchwil, gan weithio drwy argymhellion adroddiad Gibson ac ati. Mae llawer o bethau'n gyffredin yn hyn o beth. Pan fyddwn yn cyflwyno argymhellion grŵp cynghori'r Gweinidog, gobeithiaf y cefnogir hynny, a'r gwaith ar y cyd a wneir rhwng Jane Hutt a minnau yng nghyd-destun y sector addysg uwch. Rhaid inni gofio nad yw'r sector addysg uwch a'r sector preifat wedi gweithio'n ddigon clòs yn y gorffennol. Rhaid inni sicrhau y bydd hynny'n newid os ydym am gael canran uwch o gyllid ymchwil, ynghyd â chynnydd yn ein gallu i weithgynhyrchu. Yr ydym eisoes yn dechrau

our manufacturing capacity. We are already beginning to see some of the advantages of that new agenda, because we are now beginning to see some clustering effects around, for example, the Institute of Life Sciences in Swansea, which is a pointer to the future.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** O ran gweithgynhyrchu nad oes iddo werth uchel, byddwch yn ymwybodol bod gwaith brics Caernarfon wedi cau yn ddiweddar, gyda 50 o swyddi wedi'u colli. Dyna'r gwaith brics olaf yng Nghymru. Pan ofynnais y cwestiwn ynglŷn â pha gefnogaeth y gellid ei rhoi i'n sector gweithgynhyrchu, dywedodd y Prif Weinidog, yn hollol gywir, nad oedd yn bosibl rhoi amodau mewn cytundeb er mwyn gorfodi cyrff i ddefnyddio cynnyrch o Gymru. Serch hynny, mae'n anodd credu y byddai'r Almaen neu Ffrainc yn caniatáu i sefyllfa ddatblygu lle nad oes unrhyw waith brics yn y gwledydd hynny. Felly, pa weithredu ymarferol y gall y Llywodraeth ei wneud i geisio sicrhau bod cynnyrch o Gymru yn cael ei ddefnyddio gan adeiladwyr a phawb arall sy'n codi adeiladau neu yn gwneud defnydd o ddeunydd a gynhyrchir yng Nghymru?

1.10 p.m.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn cydnabod yr effaith a gaiff colli swyddi fel hyn ar ardal fel Caernarfon. Un maes lle gallwn helpu yw o fewn y trefniadau pwrcasu newydd gan y sector cyhoeddus yn benodol. Andrew Davies sydd yn arwain yn y maes hwn. Mae'n braf clywed ein bod yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf wedi gallu codi'r canran o bethau y gellir eu prynu yn lleol o dan gytundebau pwrcasu; yr oedd y ffigur tua 30 y cant ac mae bellach yn tynnu tuag at 50 y cant. Yr hyn yr hoffwn ei weld—ac mae'r Llywodraeth yn derbyn hyn—yw'r canran hwnnw yn prysuro fel bod mwy o gyfle inni gael cytundebau pwrcasu lleol. Mae hynny yn dda nid yn unig i'r economi, ond hefyd i'r holl agenda amgylcheddol.

### Transport Network

**Q2 The Leader of the Opposition (Nick Bourne):** Will the Minister outline his vision

gweld rhai o fanteision yr agenda newydd honno, oherwydd yr ydym yn awr yn dechrau gweld rhai o effeithiau clystyru, er enghraifft, yr Athrofa Gwyddorau Bywyd yn Abertawe, sy'n rhoi syniad inni am y dyfodol.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** With regards to low value-added manufacturing, you will be aware that the Caernarfon brickworks has recently closed, with the loss of 50 jobs. That was the last brickworks in Wales. When I asked a question about the support that could be given to the manufacturing sector, the First Minister, quite correctly, said that it was not possible to insert conditions in agreements to enforce the use of products from Wales. Even so, it is difficult to believe that Germany or France would allow a situation to develop where there were no brickworks in those countries. Therefore, what practical action can the Government take to try to ensure that Welsh products are used by builders and everybody else that constructs buildings or makes use of materials produced in Wales?

**The Deputy First Minister:** I acknowledge the impact that job losses like these have on areas such as Caernarfon. One area where we can help is through the new purchasing arrangements in the public sector particularly. Andrew Davies is leading the work in this area. It is pleasing to hear that in recent years we have been able to increase the percentage of products that can be bought locally through purchasing agreements; the figure was around 30 per cent and it is now closer to 50 per cent. What I would like to see—and the Government acknowledges this—is an increase in that percentage so that there are more opportunities for us to have local purchasing agreements. That is not only beneficial for the economy, but also for the whole environmental agenda.

### Rhwydwaith Trafnidiaeth

**C2 Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Nick Bourne):** A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu ei

for an all-inclusive transport network?  
OAQ(3)0539(ECT)

**The Deputy First Minister:** My strategic vision for an all-inclusive transport network is set out in the document ‘Connecting the Nation’, which was published yesterday. For the first time, we have a framework that sets out the role of transport in facilitating our responsibilities with regard to the environment and the social justice agenda and our commitment to equality of opportunity and economic policy.

**Nick Bourne:** I am grateful to you for that outline. Do you agree that an emphasis should be placed on the development of public transport? What priority are you giving to integrated ticketing, for example, moving from bus to train or vice versa, and how are you progressing that particular area of policy?

**The Deputy First Minister:** That is an important point. If we are going to integrate transport fully between buses and trains, we need to do two things. The first thing—and I think that this is an aspiration that we should be working towards—to do is ensure that there is a one-stop shop for information for those services. That does not currently exist, and I am working with my officials to see how we can make progress on that, so that people know that, when they are using a bus, there is a train to which they can connect, and that they get the information from one point.

The second point that you made, which is also important, is that they should also be able to use the same ticket on that journey. We are working on a scheme that I hope we will make some announcements on in the not too distant future. Those two things in themselves would be a tremendous boost to the policy of integrated transport.

### Rail Transport Provision

**Q3 Huw Lewis:** Will the Minister make a statement on rail transport provision in south-east Wales? OAQ(3)0523(ECT)

weledigaeth ar gyfer rhwydwaith trafndiaeth holl gynhwysol? OAQ(3)0539(ECT)

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Mae fy ngweledigaeth strategol ar gyfer rhwydwaith trafndiaeth holl gynhwysol wedi’i gosod allan yn y ddogfen ‘Cysylltu’r Genedl’, a gyhoeddwyd ddoe. Am y tro cyntaf, mae gennym fframwaith sy’n gosod allan swyddogaeth trafndiaeth wrth hwyluso ein cyfrifoldebau o ran yr agenda cyfiawnder cymdeithasol a’r amgylchedd a’n hymrwymiad i bolisi economaidd a chyfle cyfartal

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am yr amlinelliad hwnnw. A gytunwch y dylid rhoi pwyslais ar ddatblygu trafndiaeth gyhoeddus? Pa flaenoriaeth a roddwch i docynnu integredig, er enghraifft, symud o fws i drên ac i’r gwrthwyneb, a sut yr ydych yn symud y maes polisi penodol hwnnw yn ei flaen?

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Mae hwnnw’n bwynt pwysig. Os ydym am integreiddio trafndiaeth yn llwyr rhwng bysiau a threnau, mae angen inni wneud dau beth. Y peth cyntaf—a chredaf fod hwn yn ddyhead y dylem anelu ato—yw sicrhau y ceir siop-un-stop i gael gwybodaeth am y gwasanaethau hynny. Nid yw hynny’n bodoli ar hyn o bryd, ac yr wyf yn gweithio gyda’r swyddogion i weld sut y gallwn wneud cynnydd yn hynny o beth, er mwyn i bobl wybod pan fyddant yn defnyddio bws y gallant fynd ar drên cysylltiol, ac y gallant gael y wybodaeth mewn un lle.

Yr ail bwynt a wnaethoch, ac mae hwn hefyd yn bwynt pwysig, yw y dylent hefyd allu defnyddio’r un tocyn ar y siwrnai honno. Yr ydym yn gweithio ar gynllun, a gobeithiaf y gwnawn rai cyhoeddiadau yn ei gylch yn y dyfodol agos. Byddai’r ddau beth hynny eu hunain yn hwb eithriadol i bolisi trafndiaeth integredig.

### Darpariaeth Trafndiaeth Rheilffyrdd

**C3 Huw Lewis:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddarpariaeth trafndiaeth rheilffyrdd yn y de-ddwyrain? OAQ(3)0523(ECT)



**The Deputy First Minister:** The Wales rail planning assessment, published last summer, identified that the highest passenger growth will occur in this region. The Assembly Government is already funding additional carriages for Valleys services and the new Ebbw Valley service. A rail forward programme will be published in the next 12 months.

**Huw Lewis:** You will be aware of Welsh Labour's pledge to deliver a half-hourly train service between Merthyr and Cardiff. Engineering work on that vital investment is almost completed and, as far as I can see, it is just awaiting ministerial approval to proceed. When will the people of the Merthyr valley get their new train service?

**The Deputy First Minister:** This is also a Government priority. The capital infrastructure works will be completed by the summer of this year. I am working hard with my officials so that we can make an announcement about the additional service frequencies.

**William Graham:** Do you think that this half-hourly train service will be in operation for the Status Quo concert planned at Cyfarthfa Castle on 26 July?

**The Deputy First Minister:** It depends on whether or not I get a ticket, I suppose, William. [*Laughter.*] However, I cannot give you that assurance. The infrastructure works will be completed, but you may have to go to see the concert under your own steam on that particular occasion.

**Mohammad Asghar:** I have met the people who are campaigning for better facilities at the Severn Tunnel Junction station. I have raised some issues with you, Deputy First Minister, and I was pleased to have a positive response. Could you please let me know what progress is being made to improve the station, and to integrate bus and rail services there?

**The Deputy First Minister:** I have also met the action group that is working towards

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Nododd asesiad cynllunio rheilffyrdd Cymru, a gyhoeddwyd yr haf diwethaf, mai yn y rhanbarth hwn y bydd y cynnydd mwyaf yn nifer y teithwyr. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad eisoes yn ariannu cerbydau ychwanegol ar gyfer gwasanaethau'r Cymoedd a gwasanaeth newydd Glyn Ebwy. Caiff blaenraglen rheilffyrdd ei chyhoeddi yn ystod y 12 mis nesaf.

**Huw Lewis:** Byddwch yn gwybod am addewid Llafur Cymru i ddarparu gwasanaeth trên bob hanner awr rhwng Merthyr a Chaerdydd. Mae'r gwaith peirianeg ar y buddsoddiad allweddol hwnnw wedi'i gwblhau bron, a hyd y gwn i, dim ond caniatâd y Gweinidog y mae ei angen arno i fwrw ymlaen. Pryd gaiff pobl Merthyr eu gwasanaeth trên newydd?

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Mae hwn hefyd yn un o flaenoriaethau'r Llywodraeth. Bydd y seilwaith cyfalaf wedi'i gwblhau erbyn haf eleni. Yr wyf yn gweithio'n galed gyda'm swyddogion er mwyn inni allu gwneud cyhoeddiad ynghylch amllder y gwasanaeth ychwanegol.

**William Graham:** A gredwch y bydd y gwasanaeth trên bob hanner awr hwn yn weithredol erbyn cyngerdd Status Quo sydd wedi'i drefnu yng Nghastell Cyfarthfa ar 26 Gorffennaf?

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Mae'n dibynnu a gaf i docyn ai peidio mae'n siŵr, William. [*Chwerthin.*] Fodd bynnag, ni allaf eich sicrhau yn hynny o beth. Bydd y seilwaith wedi'i gwblhau, ond efallai y bydd yn rhaid i chi fynd i weld y cyngerdd ar eich liwt eich hun ar yr achlysur penodol hwnnw.

**Mohammad Asghar:** Yr wyf fi wedi cwrdd â'r bobl sy'n ymgyrchu dros gyfleusterau gwell yng ngorsaf Cyffordd Twannel Hafren. Yr wyf fi wedi codi rhai materion gyda chi, Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog, ac yr oeddwn yn falch o gael ymateb cadarnhaol. A allech roi gwybod imi pa gynnydd sy'n cael ei wneud i wella'r orsaf, ac i integreiddio gwasanaethau bysiau a rheilffyrdd yno?

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Yr wyf i hefyd wedi cwrdd â'r grŵp gweithredu sy'n

improving facilities at the Severn Tunnel Junction, and I heard about its exciting plans for the area. I was pleased to receive a report indicating that Network Rail plans to improve and upgrade facilities at the station, which will mean that more people use it.

We must see how far we can integrate the bus and rail services there, because the patronage of the services from that station is very high indeed; there is a high level of commuter traffic in both directions. I have promised that my officials and I will look for ways of doing that, once the infrastructure works at the station are complete. We will have discussions with Arriva Trains Wales about this issue, as we are responsible for its franchise, but I know that Arriva will also hold discussions with the Department of Transport about the First Great Western franchise.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** I am grateful for the information that you have sent me recently about the lengthening of trains on the Rhymney valley line to six cars. It seems that that will happen in the not too distant future. I am also pleased to see the work of lengthening platforms to allow for the six-car trains nearing completion. However, when I spoke to you some months ago about the issue at Cardiff Queen Street station, and whether the rail bridge over Newport road would be widened to allow three tracks as opposed to two, I received a letter from your officials and was told that it was a matter that would be kept under consideration. I wonder whether there has been any further consideration of that issue. With all the enhanced trains now converging on Queen Street station, we cannot maintain the status quo unless we have a wider bridge.

**The Deputy First Minister:** I recognise that the work that needs to be done at Queen Street station is a constraint in developing services, as you have described. I am not in a position to give you an oral update today, but in view of the fact that this is such an important part of the project to deliver better services, I promise to send you a full update

gweithio i wella cyfleusterau yng Nghyffordd Twannel Hafren, ac yr wyf wedi clywed am ei gynlluniau cyffrous ar gyfer yr ardal. Yr oeddwn yn falch o gael adroddiad a oedd yn datgan bod Network Rail yn bwriadu gwella ac uwchraddio cyfleusterau yn yr orsaf, a fydd yn golygu y bydd rhagor o bobl yn ei defnyddio.

Rhaid inni weld i ba raddau y gallwn integreiddio'r gwasanaethau bysiau a rheilffyrdd yno, oherwydd bod nifer fawr iawn o bobl yn defnyddio'r gwasanaethau o'r orsaf honno; ceir lefel uchel o draffig cymudwyr yn y naill gyfeiriad a'r llall. Yr wyf fi wedi addo y bydd fy swyddogion a minnau'n chwilio am ffyrdd o wneud hynny, ar ôl i'r gwaith seilwaith yn yr orsaf gael ei gwblhau. Byddwn yn cynnal trafodaethau gyda Threnau Arriva Cymru ynghylch y mater hwn, gan ein bod yn gyfrifol am ei fasnachfaint, ond gwn y bydd Arriva hefyd yn cynnal trafodaethau gyda'r Adran Drafnidiaeth ynghylch y fasnachfaint First Great Western.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y wybodaeth yr oeddech wedi'i hanfon ataf yn ddiweddar ynghylch cynyddu hyd trenau ar reilffordd cwm Rhymni i chwe cherbyd. Mae'n ymddangos y bydd hynny'n digwydd cyn bo hir. Yr wyf hefyd yn falch o weld bod y gwaith i gynyddu hyd platfformau i wneud lle i'r trenau chwe cherbyd bron â dod i ben. Fodd bynnag, pan siaradais â chi rai misoedd yn ôl am y mater yng ngorsaf Heol y Frenhines yng Nghaerdydd, ac a fyddai'r bont rheilffordd dros heol Casnewydd yn cael ei lledu i wneud lle i dri thrac yn lle dau, cefais lythyr gan eich swyddogion a oedd yn dweud ei fod yn fater y byddai'n rhaid parhau i'w ystyried. Tybed a yw'r mater hwnnw wedi cael ei ystyried ymhellach. Gyda'r holl drenau gwell nawr yn cyrraedd gorsaf Heol y Frenhines, ni allwn gynnal y *status quo* oni bai fod gennym bont letach.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn cydnabod bod gwaith y mae angen ei wneud yng ngorsaf Heol y Frenhines yn rhwystr rhag datblygu gwasanaethau, fel yr ydych wedi'i ddisgrifio. Nid wyf mewn sefyllfa i roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i chi ar lafar heddiw, ond ac ystyried y ffaith bod hon yn rhan mor bwysig o'r prosiect i ddarparu

by letter as soon as I have had an opportunity to discuss the matter further with my officials.

**Irene James:** Many of my constituents have taken advantage of the popular Ebbw valley service since its reintroduction in February. However, one issue that has arisen is the frequency and timing of trains. For many commuters finishing work at 5.30 p.m., it is unrealistic to get to the station in time for the train that departs at 5.35 p.m.. That leaves them with an hour's wait, which encourages them to choose the easy option of driving. Will you offer me an assurance that you will investigate that issue on the Ebbw valley rail line?

**The Deputy First Minister:** I am not in a position to give you that assurance today, because the current service is extremely well used. We have reached the 100,000 mark in passenger numbers recently, and discussions that I have had indicate that it is a well used service. Therefore, it is a little too early to talk about increasing the frequency of trains at this juncture, but I can assure you that the matter is being kept under review.

### Cefnogi'r Economi

**C4 Paul Davies:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gynlluniau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gefnogi'r economi? OAQ(3)0495(ECT)

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Cynlluniwyd ein polisiau economaidd i'n galluogi i ymateb mewn modd hyblyg i heriau lleol a byd eang, er mwyn inni roi cymorth i economi Cymru, a'i helpu i dyfu a dod yn fwy cystadleuol. Ymhlith fy mlaenoriaethau o ran datblygu economaidd y mae rhoi cymorth i fusnesau, masnacheiddio ymchwil, gwella trafndiaeth ac adfywio.

**Paul Davies:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am yr ateb, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn cytuno mai busnesau bach yw asgwrn cefn unrhyw economi leol. Yn fy etholaeth i, mae busnesau bach yn sicr yn

gwasanaethau gwell, yr wyf yn addo anfon y wybodaeth lawn ddiweddaraf atoch drwy lythyr cyn gynted ag y byddaf wedi cael cyfle i drafod y mater ymhellach gyda'm swyddogion.

**Irene James:** Mae nifer o'r m hetholwyr wedi manteisio ar y gwasanaeth poblogaidd yng Nglyn Ebwy ers ei ailgyflwyno ym mis Chwefror. Fodd bynnag, un mater sydd wedi dod i'r fei yw amllder ac amseru'r trenau. Ar gyfer nifer o gymudwyr sy'n gorffen gweithio am 5.30 pm, mae'n afrealistig cyrraedd yr orsaf erbyn i'r trêen adael am 5.35pm. Mae hynny'n golygu bod ganddynt awr i aros, sy'n eu hannog i droi at y car sy'n haws. A wnewch fy sicrhau y byddwch yn ymchwilio i'r mater hwnnw ar reilffordd Glyn Ebwy?

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Nid wyf mewn sefyllfa i'ch sicrhau ynghylch hynny heddiw, oherwydd mae'r gwasanaeth cyfredol yn cael ei ddefnyddio'n arbennig o dda. Yr ydym wedi cyrraedd y marc 100,000 o ran niferoedd y teithwyr yn ddiweddar, ac mae'r trafodaethau yr wyf fi wedi'u cael yn dangos bod y gwasanaeth yn boblogaidd. Felly, mae ychydig yn rhy gynnar siarad am gynyddu amllder y trenau ar hyn o bryd, ond gallaf eich sicrhau bod y mater yn cael ei adolygu'n gyson.

### Supporting the Economy

**Q4 Paul Davies:** Will the Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's plans to support the economy? OAQ(3)0495(ECT)

**The Deputy First Minister:** Our economic policies are designed to allow us to respond flexibly to local and global challenges so that we support the Welsh economy, and help it to grow and to become more competitive. Among my priorities for economic development are: providing support to business; the commercialisation of research; improving transport; and regeneration.

**Paul Davies:** I am grateful for that response, and I am sure that the Deputy First Minister would agree that small businesses are the backbone of any local economy. In my constituency, small businesses certainly play

chwarae rhan hanfodol yn economi sir Benfro.

a crucial role in the Pembrokeshire economy.

1.20 p.m.

Ar hyn o bryd, mae busnesau, yn enwedig y rhai yng nghefn gwlad Cymru, yn ei chael yn anodd oherwydd y cynnydd cyffredinol mewn costau. Fel y gwyddom, mae pris olew yn rhoi pwysau aruthrol ar fusnesau, gan gynnwys gorsafoedd petrol. Deallaf fod grant penodol ar gael yn yr Alban i helpu gorsafoedd petrol mewn ardaloedd gwledig. O dan yr amgylchiadau, a fyddai'r Gweinidog yn fodlon ystyried cyflwyno cynllun grant penodol i orsafoedd petrol gwledig fel a geir yn yr Alban?

At present, businesses, particularly in rural Wales, find it hard because of the increases in costs generally. As we know, the price of oil is putting huge pressures on businesses, including petrol stations. I understand that there is a specific grant available in Scotland to assist petrol stations in rural areas. Under the circumstances, would the Minister be willing to consider introducing a specific grant scheme for rural petrol stations here in Wales as there is in Scotland?

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Nid ydym yn ystyried cynllun penodol, ond bydd y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol yn ymgynghori yn fuan ar gynllun i helpu busnesau bach mewn ardaloedd gwledig â'r dreth fusnes. Os yw Paul yn teimlo y byddai'r cynllun hwnnw o gymorth i'r sector, awgrymaf iddo gymryd rhan yn yr ymgynghoriad, gan ein bod eisoes wedi rhoi £7 miliwn yn ychwanegol yn y gyllideb i helpu busnesau bach gyda'r dreth fusnes.

**The Deputy First Minister:** There are no specific plans under consideration at the moment, but the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government will be consulting quite soon on a scheme to help small businesses in rural areas with business rates. If Paul feels that that particular sector could be assisted under that scheme, then I would suggest that he participates in that consultation, because we have already allocated an additional £7 million to assist small businesses with business rates.

**Alun Davies:** The 'One Wales' agreement contains a commitment to creating a positive climate for businesses and a commitment to environmental sustainability. What is your vision for creating a low-carbon economy? What specific actions do you propose taking to stimulate a different sort of economic growth?

**Alun Davies:** Mae'r cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un' yn cynnwys ymrwymiad i greu hinsawdd gadarnhaol i fusnesau ac ymrwymiad i gynaliadwyedd amgylcheddol. Beth yw eich gweledigaeth ar gyfer creu economi carbon isel? Pa gamau gweithredu penodol yr ydych yn cynnig eu cymryd er mwyn ysgogi math gwahanol o dwf economaidd?

**The Deputy First Minister:** Apart from the general vision that you have explained, 'One Wales' contains a particular commitment to developing a green jobs strategy. As I see it, that strategy has a number of strands, the first of which is looking at how we can make existing jobs greener. There is then the creation of jobs in the green sector, particularly with regard to environmental issues, waste treatment and so on. The Government is committed to that, and an announcement will be made in the not too distant future on that strategy, which is being developed jointly by Jane Davidson and me.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Ar wahân i'r weledigaeth gyffredinol yr ydych wedi'i hegluro, mae 'Cymru'n Un' yn cynnwys ymrwymiad penodol i ddatblygu strategaeth swyddi gwyrdd. Yn fy marn i, mae gan y strategaeth honno lawer o haenau, ac mae'r cyntaf ohonynt yn ystyried sut y gallwn wneud swyddi presennol yn fwy gwyrdd. Yna ceir y broses o greu swyddi yn y sector gwyrdd, gan ystyried materion amgylcheddol, trin gwastraff ac ati yn arbennig. Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi'i hymrwymo i wneud hynny, a chaiff cyhoeddiad ei wneud ar y strategaeth honno yn y dyfodol agos, sy'n cael ei datblygu ar y

cyd gan Jane Davidson a minnau.

The other area in which we can help to reduce emissions is the transport sector. Yesterday, I set out a clear vision for how transport should play its part in reducing carbon-dioxide emissions. I am sure that, taken with what we are doing on the economy on green jobs, that makes a significant contribution to the agenda that you outlined.

**Kirsty Williams:** Do you agree with me—and with the many people who have given evidence to the Enterprise and Learning Committee—that, if the Welsh economy is to develop, we need to upskill our workforce? If you agree, what discussions have you had with the Deputy Minister for Skills, John Griffiths, to persuade him that we need to accept the Leitch report's recommendations and that we should be working towards a level 3 qualification for the Welsh workforce rather than the lesser qualifications that he is currently advocating?

**The Deputy First Minister:** This is clearly a matter for the Deputy Minister. However, I will say that the Government takes the skills agenda seriously, because we know that developing our economy is not just a matter of bricks and mortar, or buildings or grants; it is about giving people the skills that they need to take up the employment opportunities that are available. The Government is fully committed to that, although we may disagree on the precise way in which that is delivered. Apart from that particular skills agenda, we must also make sure that research, where you have high-level skills, is commercialised, and the Government is keen to ensure that that is fully supported.

**Kirsty Williams:** That is absolutely hopeless. How can skills not be a matter for the Minister for economic development? How can you simply pass the buck to one of your Cabinet colleagues? Without adequate skills, the economy is going nowhere. How can you believe that permanently condemning the Welsh workforce to having lower skills than their English counterparts will help us to catch up with the rest of the

Y maes arall y gallwn helpu i leihau allyriadau ynddo yw'r sector trafniadaeth. Ddoe, gosodais allan weledigaeth glir ar gyfer sut y dylai trafniadaeth gymryd rhan i leihau allyriadau carbon deuocsid. Yr wyf yn sicr, ac ystyried yr hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud i'r economi gyda swyddi gwyrdd, bod hynny'n gwneud cyfraniad sylweddol i'r agenda yr ydych wedi'i hamlinellu.

**Kirsty Williams:** A ydych yn cytuno â mi—a gyda'r nifer sydd wedi rhoi tystiolaeth i'r Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu—y bydd angen inni wella sgiliau ein gweithlu os yw'r economi yng Nghymru i ddatblygu? Os ydych yn cytuno, pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi'u cynnal gyda'r Dirprwy Weinidog dros Sgiliau, John Griffiths, i'w berswadio bod angen inni dderbyn argymhellion adroddiad Leitch ac y dylem fod yn gweithio at gymhwyster lefel 3 ar gyfer y gweithlu yng Nghymru yn hytrach na'r cymwysterau is y mae'n eu hyrwyddo ar hyn o bryd?

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Mae hyn yn amlwg yn fater i'r Dirprwy Weinidog. Fodd bynnag, credaf fod y Llywodraeth yn ystyried yr agenda sgiliau o ddifrif, oherwydd gwyddom nad brics a mortar, nac adeiladau a grantiau yn unig sy'n gyfrifol am ddatblygu ein heconomi; y bwriad yw arfogi pobl â'r sgiliau y mae eu hangen arnynt er mwyn manteisio ar y cyfleoedd cyflogaeth sydd ar gael. Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi'i hymrwymo'n llwyr i hynny, er ein bod efallai yn anghytuno ar y ffordd benodol y cyflwynir hynny. Ar wahân i'r agenda sgiliau benodol honno, mae'n rhaid inni hefyd sicrhau y caiff ymchwil, lle mae sgiliau da o dan sylw, ei fasnacheiddio, ac mae'r Llywodraeth yn awyddus i sicrhau y caiff hynny ei gefnogi'n llwyr.

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae hynny'n gwbl anobeithiol. Sut na all sgiliau fod yn fater i'r Gweinidog dros ddatblygu economaidd? Sut y gallwch daflu'r baich i un o'ch cyd-Weinidogion yn y Cabinet? Heb sgiliau digonol, nid yw'r economi'n mynd i unman. Sut y gallwch gredu y bydd condemnio'r gweithlu yng Nghymru o hyd am fod â sgiliau is na'r gweithlu yn Lloegr yn ein helpu i fodystal â gweddill y DU?

UK?

**The Deputy First Minister:** The only hopeless thing that I have seen in this Chamber is the Liberal Democrats' failure to understand what the Government is trying to do. I have never heard such—no, I suppose I had better not say what I think about the Liberal Democrats' policy for the economy. However, I will say that we are fully committed to the agenda of improving skills. In fact, there is a new Cabinet committee dedicated to that. I chair it and John Griffiths is a key member of it. We will develop this agenda carefully over the coming years. However, I stress that we must recognise the importance of upskilling the workforce at the top level. You have to think about how to upskill the existing workforce throughout the economy, from the high level to attacking basic skills. That is all part of an agenda to which the Government is committed.

**Kirsty Williams:** I do not understand how you expect the Welsh economy to develop when you are condemning our workforce to be less qualified than its counterpart across the border. If you had listened to the committee this morning, you would have heard Corus, the top Welsh-listed company, saying that it is essential that the Welsh workforce be qualified to level 3. I do not understand how you can take the economy forward when you are condemning us to be less qualified than England or Scotland.

**The Deputy First Minister:** I have discussed this issue with Corus. What is interesting is that, as you discuss this agenda with employers, regardless of which part of the United Kingdom you are in, the same issue arises. They all say the same thing: we have to upskill our workforce. I accept that. We are doing it in a particular way, and you do not agree with that. Let us see who is right, at the end of four years.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Yr unig beth anobeithiol yr wyf wedi'i weld yn y Siambr hon yw methiant y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol i ddeall yr hyn y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ceisio'i wneud. Nid wyf erioed wedi clywed—a dweud y gwir, byddai'n well i mi beidio â dweud yr hyn yr wyf yn ei feddwl am bolisi'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ar gyfer yr economi. Fodd bynnag, dywedaf ein bod wedi'n hymrwymo'n llwyr i'r agenda o wella sgiliau. Yn wir, mae pwyllgor Cabinet newydd wedi'i sefydlu sydd wedi ymrwmo i hynny. Yr wyf fi'n gadeirydd ar y pwyllgor ac mae John Griffiths yn aelod allweddol ohono. Byddwn yn datblygu'r agenda hon yn ofalus dros y blynyddoedd nesaf. Fodd bynnag, pwysleisiaf ei bod yn rhaid inni gydnabod pwysigrwydd gwella sgiliau'r gweithlu ar y lefel uchaf. Mae'n rhaid ichi ystyried sut mae gwella sgiliau'r gweithlu presennol drwy'r economi, o'r lefel uchaf i fynd i'r afael â'r sgiliau sylfaenol. Mae hyn oll yn rhan o agenda y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi ymrwmo iddi.

**Kirsty Williams:** Nid wyf yn deall sut yr ydych yn disgwyl i economi Cymru ddatblygu tra'r ydych yn condemnio ein gweithlu am fod yn llai cymwys na'r gweithlu dros y ffin. Petaech wedi gwrando ar y pwyllgor y bore yma, byddech wedi clywed Corus, un o brif gwmnïau Cymru, yn dweud ei bod yn hanfodol i'r gweithlu yng Nghymru fod yn gymwys at lefel 3. Nid wyf yn deall sut y gallwch fynd â'r economi yn ei blaen tra'r ydych yn ein condemnio i fod yn llai cymwys na Lloegr neu'r Alban.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Yr wyf wedi trafod y mater hwn gyda Corus. Yr hyn sy'n ddiddorol yw, wrth ichi drafod yr agenda hon gyda chyflogwyr, waeth ba bynnag ran o'r Deyrnas Unedig yr ydych yn byw ynddi, mae'r un mater yn codi. Maent oll yn dweud yr un fath: mae'n rhaid inni wella sgiliau ein gweithlu. Yr wyf yn derbyn hynny. Yr ydym yn gwneud hynny mewn ffordd benodol, ac nid ydych yn cytuno â'r ffordd honno. Cawn weld pwy fydd yn iawn ar ddiwedd y pedair blynedd.

**Janet Ryder:** I am sure that you are aware of the Gibson report and the many recommendations that it made on the development of intellectual property in higher education. How are you taking those recommendations forward?

**The Deputy First Minister:** We very much welcome the Gibson recommendations, because they give us an insight into how higher education and the private sector should be working together to commercialise the opportunities for research. I have met Simon Gibson since the report was published, and we had a good meeting. My officials and he will be working very closely to ensure that the agenda that was set out in the report is followed. I now want to ensure that both he and we, as a Government, fully understand the commitment that I have made to ensure that this is one of the biggest priorities of my department.

### School Transport

**Q5 Leanne Wood:** Will the Minister make a statement on the safety of school transport? OAQ(3)0543(ECT)

**The Deputy First Minister:** Stage 1 of the Proposed Learner Travel (Wales) Measure was approved in Plenary on 29 April after discussion of the general principles. The Measure and my recent non-statutory guidance will help to improve safety on school transport across Wales. I am also committed to seeking extra powers in some areas.

**Leanne Wood:** I have recently met some small bus operators in the Rhondda, who raised concerns with me about new school bus contracts, which include some provision for new safety measures, which I fully support. These companies claim that only the larger, often non-local, bus companies will be able to tender successfully for new contracts as it is not possible for the smaller firms to source new buses quickly. Will you agree to ask your officials to look at this matter to see whether any support can be provided to small bus operators so that they can compete for contracts on a level playing field with the larger companies?

**Janet Ryder:** Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol o adroddiad Gibson a'r holl argymhellion a wnaeth ar ddatblygu eiddo deallusol mewn addysg uwch. Sut yr ydych yn llywio'r argymhellion hynny?

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Yr ydym yn croesawu argymhellion Gibson yn fawr iawn, gan eu bod yn rhoi darlun inni o sut y dylai addysg uwch a'r sector preifat fod yn cydweithio i fasnacheiddio'r cyfleoedd ar gyfer ymchwil. Yr wyf wedi cyfarfod â Simon Gibson ers i'r adroddiad gael ei gyhoeddi, a chawsom gyfarfod cadarnhaol. Bydd fy swyddogion ac yntau yn gweithio'n agos iawn er mwyn sicrhau y dilynir yr agenda a osodwyd allan yn yr adroddiad. Yr wyf bellach am sicrhau ei fod ef a ni, fel Llywodraeth, yn deall yn llwyr yr ymrwymiad yr wyf wedi'i wneud er mwyn sicrhau mai dyma un o brif flaenoriaethau fy adran.

### Cludiant i'r Ysgol

**C5 Leanne Wood:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddiogelwch cludiant i'r ysgol? OAQ(3)0543(ECT)

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Cafodd Cam 1 y Mesur Arfaethedig ynghylch Teithio gan Ddysgwyr (Cymru) ei gymeradwyo ar 29 Ebrill ar ôl trafodaeth ar yr egwyddorion cyffredinol. Bydd y Mesur a'm cyfarwyddyd anstatudol diweddar yn helpu i wella diogelwch ar gludiant i'r ysgol ledled Cymru. Yr wyf hefyd wedi ymrwymo i geisio pwerau ychwanegol mewn rhai meysydd.

**Leanne Wood:** Yr wyf wedi cyfarfod â rhai cwmnïau bysiau bach yn y Rhondda yn ddiweddar, a fynegodd eu pryderon am y contractau bysiau ysgol newydd, sy'n cynnwys rhywfaint o ddarpariaeth ar gyfer mesurau diogelwch newydd, ac yr wyf yn cefnogi hynny'n llwyr. Mae'r cwmnïau hyn yn honni mai dim ond y cwmnïau mwy, nad ydynt yn lleol, a fydd yn gallu tendro yn llwyddiannus ar gyfer y contractau newydd gan nad yw'n bosibl i'r cwmnïau llai gael bysiau newydd ar fyr rybudd. A wnech gytuno i ofyn i'ch swyddogion ystyried y mater hwn i weld p'un a ellir rhoi cymorth i gwmnïau bysiau bach fel y gallant gystadlu

am contractau ar yr un lefel â'r cwmnïau mwy?

**The Deputy First Minister:** We want to ensure that there is an opportunity for everyone to bid for these contracts; nevertheless, we should not compromise the safety of our children. We have made it clear that, although there are currently no statutory guidelines that I can introduce, I have introduced non-statutory guidelines that indicate the kind of things that we want to see being addressed, such as discouraging the three-for-two seating arrangements, encouraging the use of seat belts, installing closed-circuit television on school buses, and so on. That is an important part of our agenda. If there are issues that mean that some bus operators are unable to comply with those new conditions immediately, I would be more than happy to discuss them, but I am not prepared to compromise on safety.

**Peter Black:** A huge amount of work has been done on improving safety on school buses, and I believe that we have made some significant progress in improving the situation. However, the one glaring omission remains of service buses that take children to school. These are buses that are not contracted, but are normal buses. Do you have any plans to seek additional powers from the Westminster Government to try to improve the safety of these buses, particularly double-decker buses that have caused accidents in the past?

1.30 p.m.

**The Deputy First Minister:** It is difficult for the Welsh Assembly Government to seek powers over service buses, because they are outside the contractual arrangements that the learner travel Measure seeks to address. That is an issue that we need to look at. All that I can do in relation to those service buses is to issue the guidance that I have issued for the other services generally.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Yr ydym am sicrhau bod cyfle i bawb wneud cynnig am y contractau hyn; fodd bynnag, ni ddylem beryglu diogelwch ein plant. Yr ydym wedi nodi'n glir, er nad oes canllawiau statudol y gallaf eu cyflwyno ar hyn o bryd, yr wyf wedi cyflwyno canllawiau anstatudol yn nodi'r math o bethau yr ydym am eu gweld yn cael sylw, megis anghymell y trefniadau eistedd tri mewn sedd i ddau, annog defnyddio gwregys diogelwch, gosod teledu cylch cyfyng ar fysiau ysgolion, ac ati. Mae hyn yn rhan bwysig o'n hagenda. Os oes materion sy'n golygu nad yw rhai cwmnïau bysiau'n gallu cydymffurfio â'r amodau newydd hyn ar unwaith, byddem yn fwy na pharod i'w trafod, ond nid wyf yn barod i roi diogelwch yn y fantol.

**Peter Black:** Mae llawer iawn o waith wedi'i gyflawni er mwyn gwella diogelwch ar fysiau ysgolion, a chredaf ein bod wedi gwneud cynnydd sylweddol o ran gwella'r sefyllfa. Fodd bynnag, mae un peth amlwg ar goll sef y bysiau gwasanaeth sy'n mynd â phlant i'r ysgol. Nid yw'r bysiau hyn dan gontract, bysiau arferol ydynt. A oes gennych unrhyw gynlluniau i geisio cael pwerau ychwanegol gan y Llywodraeth yn San Steffan i geisio gwella diogelwch y bysiau hyn, yn enwedig bysiau deulawr sydd wedi achosi damweiniau yn y gorffennol?

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Mae'n anodd i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru geisio pwerau dros fysiau gwasanaeth, oherwydd maent y tu allan i'r trefniadau contractio y mae'r Mesur teithio gan ddysgwyr yn ceisio rhoi sylw iddynt. Mae hynny'n fater y mae angen inni edrych arno. Y cwbl y gallaf ei wneud mewn perthynas â'r bysiau gwasanaeth hynny yw cyhoeddi'r cyfarwyddyd yr wyf wedi'i gyhoeddi i'r gwasanaethau eraill yn gyffredinol.

#### Transport Infrastructure

#### Seilwaith Trafnidiaeth

**Q6 Andrew R.T. Davies:** Will the Minister

**C6 Andrew R.T. Davies:** A wnaiff y



make a statement on his plans to improve transport infrastructure in South Wales Central? OAQ(3)0492(ECT)

**The Deputy First Minister:** My strategic vision for improving transport infrastructure is outlined in 'Connecting the Nation', which was published yesterday. The national transport plan and the regional transport plans will provide more detailed plans and programmes for delivering the strategy.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** There is a small paragraph in 'Connecting the Nation' on Cardiff international airport, which is one of our key assets in South Wales Central. I appreciate and support your ambition for an environmentally sustainable transport model, and there is a debate to be had about air travel, but the fact of the matter is that air travel is experiencing massive growth in the whole of Europe, and sadly, Cardiff airport is not joining in that growth. It is experiencing modest growth, but not real growth, compared with its neighbouring airports in Bristol and Birmingham. What are you doing to secure an international carrier to operate out of Cardiff international airport, to help spur on that growth, so that the community of South Wales Central and beyond can be part of the expansion of aviation?

**The Deputy First Minister:** My officials are in regular contact with Cardiff airport about the introduction of new services, and I know that it takes a close interest in the different possibilities. I receive regular reports on those discussions, which are very much ongoing. My officials are very engaged with Cardiff international airport.

There are, however, a number of constraints, as Andrew will know, one of which is getting to and from the airport. I am looking at plans to ensure that that aspect is improved; in particular, I am asking my officials to see how we can improve public transport arrangements to the airport. That will also form part of the discussion that I will be having with the defence training academy, which will be based in St Athan. Substantial work needs to be done to ensure that the needs of travellers are properly catered for,

Gweinidog ddatganiad am ei gynlluniau ar gyfer gwella seilwaith trafndiaeth yng Nghanol De Cymru? OAQ(3)0492(ECT)

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Amlinellir fy ngweledigaeth strategol ar gyfer gwella seilwaith trafndiaeth yn 'Cysylltu'r Genedl', a gyhoeddwyd ddoe. Bydd y cynllun trafndiaeth cenedlaethol a'r cynlluniau trafndiaeth rhanbarthol yn rhoi cynlluniau a rhaglenni manylach ar gyfer gweithredu'r strategaeth.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Ceir paragraff bach yn 'Cysylltu'r Genedl' am faes awyr rhyngwladol Caerdydd, sydd yn un o'n prif asedau yng Nghanol De Cymru. Gwerthfawrogaf a chefnogaf eich uchelgais ar gyfer model trafndiaeth amgylcheddol gynaliadwy, ac mae dadl i'w chael ynghylch teithio awyr, ond y ffaith yw bod teithio yn yr awyr yn tyfu'n aruthrol yn Ewrop gyfan, ac ysywaeth, nid yw maes awyr Caerdydd yn ymuno yn y twf hwnnw. Mae'n profi twf cymedrol, ond nid twf go iawn, o'i gymharu â'r meysydd awyr agosaf ato ym Mryste a Birmingham. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i sicrhau cariwr rhyngwladol i weithio allan o faes awyr rhyngwladol Caerdydd, i helpu i hybu'r twf hwnnw, fel y gall cymuned Canol De Cymru a thu hwnt fod yn rhan o ehangiad teithio awyr?

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Mae fy swyddogion mewn cysylltiad rheolaidd gyda maes awyr Caerdydd ynghylch cyflwyno gwasanaethau newydd, a gwn ei fod yn cymryd diddordeb manwl yn y gwahanol bosibiliadau. Caf adroddiadau rheolaidd am y trafodaethau hynny sydd yn mynd rhagddynt o hyd. Mae fy swyddogion yn ymwneud cryn dipyn â maes awyr rhyngwladol Caerdydd.

Mae, fodd bynnag, nifer o gyfyngiadau, fel y gŵyr Andrew, a theithio i'r maes awyr ac oddi yno yw un ohonynt. Yr wyf yn edrych ar gynlluniau i sicrhau gwelliant yn yr agwedd honno; yn enwedig, yr wyf yn gofyn i'm swyddogion weld sut y gallwn wella trefniadau cludiant cyhoeddus i'r maes awyr. Bydd hynny hefyd yn ffurfio rhan o'r drafodaeth a gaf gyda'r academi hyfforddiant amddiffyn, a gaiff ei leoli yn Sain Tathan. Mae angen gwneud gwaith sylweddol i sicrhau y darperir yn iawn ar gyfer anghenion

including at the airport. It is not only an issue of attracting more business to the airport; it is also about ensuring that passengers can get to and from the airport safely and swiftly.

### Provision of Sustainable Transport

**Q7 Chris Franks:** Will the Minister make a statement on the provision of sustainable transport in South Wales Central? OAQ(3)0544(ECT)

**The Deputy First Minister:** I set out my strategic vision for a sustainable transport system in the transport strategy, 'Connecting the Nation', which was published yesterday. The South East Wales Transport Alliance regional transport plan will translate this into regional priorities, including those for South Wales Central.

**Chris Franks:** I recently had the pleasure of seeing the Lady Windsor cycle track in Ynysybwl. What discussions has your department had with Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council and other bodies to further develop cycle tracks in South Wales Central?

**The Deputy First Minister:** I agree that developing cycle tracks is very important. I am sure that you will have noticed, from the transport strategy that we published yesterday, that this will very much be a priority for the Government. If we are going to give people opportunities to be more environmentally aware and to promote healthy living, then we must provide greater walking and cycling facilities. It is up to local authorities to put bids forward for these programmes, and I am pretty sure that local authorities in the area will be using the opportunity provided by the drawing up of the regional transport plan to ask for schemes to be included from 2009 onwards.

**David Melding:** As someone who is about to buy a bicycle—[*Laughter.*] I am doing the research at this very moment. I have never been a very keen motorist and the price of petrol is now so high that what enthusiasm I had for motoring is evaporating, like the petrol from my tank. I am looking forward to

teithwyr, gan gynnwys yn y maes awyr. Nid mater o ddenu mwy o fusnes i'r maes awyr yn unig ydyw; mae'n fater hefyd o sicrhau y gall teithwyr fynd i'r maes awyr ac oddi yno'n ddiogel ac yn gyflym.

### Darparu Trafnidiaeth Gynaliadwy

**C7 Chris Franks:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddarparu trafndiaeth gynaliadwy yng Nghanol De Cymru? OAQ(3)0544(ECT)

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Amlinellais fy ngweledigaeth strategol ar gyfer system drafndiaeth gynaliadwy yn y strategaeth drafndiaeth, 'Cysylltu'r Genedl', a gyhoeddwyd ddoe. Bydd cynllun trafndiaeth rhanbarthol Cynghrair Trafnidiaeth De-ddwyrain Cymru yn trosi hyn yn flaenoriaethau rhanbarthol, gan gynnwys rhai ar gyfer Canol De Cymru.

**Chris Franks:** Yn ddiweddar cefais y pleser o weld lôn feics Lady Windsor yn Ynysybwl. Pa drafodaethau y mae eich adran wedi'u cael gyda Chyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf a chyrrff eraill i ddatblygu lonydd beics ymhellach yng Nghanol De Cymru?

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Cytunaf ei bod yn bwysig iawn datblygu lonydd beicio. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch wedi sylwi, o'r strategaeth drafndiaeth a gyhoeddusom ddoe, y bydd hyn yn flaenoriaeth eithaf pwysig i'r Llywodraeth. Os ydym am roi cyfleoedd i bobl fod yn fwy amgylcheddol ymwybodol ac am hybu byw'n iach, yna rhaid inni ddarparu mwy o gyfleusterau cerdded a seiclo. Mater i awdurdodau lleol yw cyflwyno ceisiadau am y rhaglenni hyn, ac yr wyf yn eithaf siŵr y bydd awdurdodau lleol yn yr ardal yn defnyddio'r cyfle a ddarperir wrth lunio'r cynllun trafndiaeth rhanbarthol i ofyn am gael cynnwys cynlluniau o 2009 ymlaen.

**David Melding:** Fel un sydd ar fin prynu beic—[*Chwerthin.*] Yr wyf wrthi'n gwneud yr ymchwil y funud yma. Nid wyf erioed wedi bod yn fodurwr brwd iawn ac mae pris petrol bellach mor uchel nes bod hynny o frwdfrydedd a fu gennyf dros foduro'n prysur fynd i'r gwynt, fel y petrol o'm tanc. Yr wyf

the day when I cycle from Penarth around the south of the bay to the Assembly building; I understand that this will be possible very soon. However, a very practical consideration is that, if people cycle into work, they may need changing and showering facilities. These things have to be thought about—it is not just about a matter of providing the cycle paths. We need to do much better than designating them and making them safe. It is possible for more communities to use bicycles, but there are wider issues to consider, such as what to do when you arrive at the office, for example, and need to change.

**The Deputy First Minister:** I agree entirely with David and I wish him well in riding his bike. I am sure that we will all be there to support him in the photo opportunity.

I have been talking to Cardiff County Council about the provision of more bus and cycle routes in the city. We could do something exciting here, demonstrating what could be done in the rest of Wales. The recent local elections have prevented us from taking this programme forward, but I hope to meet the council again in the not-too-distant future. I agree that, if we could make safer provision for people to use bicycles in places like Cardiff, people would use them, providing environmental and health benefits.

**Irene James:** It has recently been brought to my attention that children in my constituency are having to pay as much as £1 for a single two-mile bus journey. Given that we are trying to encourage a shift from private to public transport, these fares can deter children from using buses at the time when their consumer habits are being formed. Will you assure me that you will look into the issue of child bus fares across Wales?

**The Deputy First Minister:** We have a number of schemes, the first of which is concessionary fares for pensioners. There are also pilot schemes for 16 to 18-year-olds, and concessionary fares on some of our train services. I cannot give you an assurance

yn edrych ymlaen at y dydd pryd y caf seiclo o Benarth o gwmpas de'r bae at adeilad y Cynulliad; deallaf y bydd hyn yn bosibl yn fuan iawn. Fodd bynnag, un ystyriaeth ymarferol iawn yw, os daw pobl i'r gwaith ar gefn beic, efallai y bydd arnynt angen cyfleusterau newid a chawodydd. Mae'n rhaid meddwl am y pethau hyn—nid mater o ddarparu'r llwybrau beicio yn unig yw hyn. Mae angen inni wneud llawer mwy na'u dynodi a sicrhau eu bod yn ddiogel. Mae'n bosibl i ragor o gymunedau ddefnyddio beiciau, ond y mae materion ehangach i'w hystyried, fel beth y dylech ei wneud wrth gyrraedd y swyddfa, er enghraifft, a chithau ag angen newid dillad.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Cytunaf yn llwyr â David a dymunaf yn dda iddo wrth iddo reidio'i feic. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwn i gyd yno i'w gefnogi pan ddaw'r wasg i dynnu ei lun.

Yr wyf wedi bod yn siarad â Chyngor Sir Caerdydd ynghylch darparu mwy o lwybrau bysiau a beiciau yn y ddinas. Gallem wneud rhywbeth cyffrous yma, gan ddangos beth y gellid ei wneud yng ngweddill Cymru. Mae'r etholiadau lleol diweddar wedi'n hatal rhag mynd â'r rhaglen hon yn ei blaen, ond gobeithiaf gwrdd â'r cyngor eto yn y dyfodol agos. Cytunaf pe gallem wneud darpariaeth fwy diogel i bobl ddefnyddio beiciau mewn lleoedd fel Caerdydd, y byddai pobl yn eu defnyddio, er budd i'r amgylchedd ac i'w hiechyd.

**Irene James:** Yn ddiweddar daeth i'm sylw fod plant yn f'etholaeth yn gorfod talu cymaint â £1 am daith fws ddwy filltir un ffordd. A ninnau'n ceisio annog symudiad oddi wrth drafnidiaeth preifat at drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus, gall y prisiau hyn beri i blant beidio â defnyddio bysiau ar yr adeg pan mae eu harferion fel defnyddwyr yn cael eu ffurfio. A wnewch fy sicrhau yr ymchwiliwch i gwestiwn prisiau tocynnau bws i blant ar draws Cymru?

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Mae gennym nifer o gynlluniau, gan ddechrau gyda gostyngiadau i bensiywyr. Mae cynlluniau peilot hefyd i bobl ifanc 16 i 18 mlwydd oed, a gostyngiadau prisiau ar rai o'n gwasanaethau trên. Ni allaf eich sicrhau

today on children's fares, as that is primarily an issue for bus operators. However, we want everyone to be given the opportunity to easily access good public transport, which is clear from the statement that I made yesterday.

### **Small and Medium-Sized Enterprises**

**Q8 Michael German:** What plans does the Welsh Assembly Government have to support the development of small and medium-sized enterprises in Wales? OAQ(3)0514(ECT)

**The Deputy First Minister:** Last month, I launched the flexible support for business, including the single investment fund. We plan to introduce, over the next few months, enhanced support for start-ups and SMEs, jointly working with the wider public and private sectors.

**Michael German:** I was thinking of asking whether you were prepared to support a small enterprise in Penarth that issues cycle helmets, but I will resist the temptation and ask about Assembly investment grant application forms. You currently have a two-page application form, which enables many companies to deal with applications swiftly without having to go through many hoops. Will that situation continue or will your new regime on grant applications make this a more onerous task for small companies?

**The Deputy First Minister:** You make an important point; you have raised it previously in another context. I have discussed this with my officials, because we clearly do not want the new system of business support to be more bureaucratic for small businesses. We are finalising the tender process for start-up services post 1 June this year. In other words, we are rolling out the single investment fund as we go along. I have made it clear that, when we deal with start-ups, specifically, where small amounts of money may need to be made available, and the applications are for smaller sums of money, I want the process to be much more streamlined. Incidentally, David Melding might also invite you to the press launch.

heddiw ynglŷn â phrisiau i blant, gan mai mater i gwmnïau bysiau yw hynny'n bennaf. Fodd bynnag, mae arnom eisiau i bawb gael y cyfle i gael mynediad rhwydd at drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus dda, sydd yn eglur o'r datganiad a wneuthum ddoe.

### **Busnesau Bach a Chanolig eu Maint**

**C8 Michael German:** Pa gynlluniau sydd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gefnogi datblygu busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)0514(ECT)

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Y mis diwethaf, lansiais y cymorth hyblyg i fusnes, gan gynnwys y gronfa fuddsoddi sengl. Bwriadwn gyflwyno, dros yr ychydig fisoedd nesaf, gymorth gwell i fusnesau sy'n cychwyn a busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint, gan weithio ar y cyd gyda'r sectorau cyhoeddus a phreifat ehangach.

**Michael German:** Yr oeddwn yn meddwl am ofyn a fydddech yn barod i gefnogi busnes bach ym Mhenarth sy'n gwneud helmedi seiclo, ond ymataliaf rhag y demtasiwn a holaf ynghylch y ffurflenni cais am grant buddsoddi'r Cynulliad. Ar hyn o bryd mae gennych ffurflen gais ddwy dudalen, fel y gall llawer o gwmnïau ddelio â cheisiadau'n gyflym heb orfod neidio drwy lawer o gylchoedd. A wnaiff y sefyllfa honno barhau ynteu a fydd eich trefn newydd ar gyfer ceisiadau am grant yn peri bod hyn yn dasg fwy beichus i gwmnïau bach?

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Yr ydych yn gwneud pwynt pwysig; yr ydych wedi'i godi o'r blaen mewn cyd-destun arall. Yr wyf wedi trafod hyn gyda fy swyddogion, oherwydd yn amlwg nid oes arnom eisiau i'r system cymorth busnes newydd fod yn fwy biwrocraidd i fusnesau bach. Yr ydym yn gorffen llunio'r broses dendro i fusnesau sy'n dechrau wedi 1 Mehefin eleni. Mewn geiriau eraill, yr ydym yn graddol gyflwyno'r gronfa fuddsoddi sengl wrth inni fynd ymlaen. Yr wyf wedi dweud yn glir, pan ddeliwn â busnesau sy'n cychwyn, ac yn benodol lle gall fod angen sicrhau bod symiau bach o arian ar gael, ac mai am symiau llai o arian y mae'r ceisiadau, bod arnaf eisiau i'r broses fod yn llawer symlach. Gyda llaw, efallai y

gwnâi David Melding eich gwahodd chithau i lansiad y wasg.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** In answer to a question on skills levels, you said that level 3 was the target for intermediate skills; I agree with the general principle that level 3 should be the target. However, in some occupational areas, a greater profiling of skills may be necessary, and level 2 may be more appropriate for certain industries. In the case of small and medium-sized enterprises, one of the great difficulties is arranging for the training and development needs of staff, which are often small in number. Do you agree that key drivers in this regard should be the sector skills councils in Wales, which have responsibilities for the occupational areas and sectors?

1.40 p.m.

While some, such as ConstructionSkills and the Sector Skills Council for Science, Engineering and Manufacturing Technologies, are well organised and resourced, the work of others is patchy. Do you agree that the sector skills councils, which are generally organised on a UK-wide basis, need to ensure that they are properly resourced in Wales to meet the needs of small and medium-sized enterprises?

**The Deputy First Minister:** That is a very good answer, rather than a question, because I agree with what you said. The sector skills councils—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. It was not an answer, because it was in the form of a question. Do you wish to ask a question, Deputy First Minister?

**The Deputy First Minister:** I probably forgot for a millisecond that I was answering questions today. *[Laughter.]* That was a very good question, Jeff, to which I cannot add anything in my answer.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** One of the big constraints that is currently holding back many small and medium-sized enterprises in Wales is the increase in fuel costs that many hauliers have to, or try to, pass back to

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Wrth ateb cwestiwn am lefelau sgiliau, dywedasoch mai lefel 3 oedd y nod ar gyfer sgiliau canolraddol; cytunaf â'r egwyddor gyffredinol y dylid anelu at lefel 3. Fodd bynnag, mewn rhai meysydd galwedigaethol, gall fod angen mwy o broffilio sgiliau, a gall lefel 2 fod yn fwy priodol i rai diwydiannau. Yn achos busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint, un o'r anawsterau mawr yw trefnu ar gyfer anghenion hyfforddi a datblygu staff, a dim ond nifer fach ohonynt yn aml. A ydych yn cytuno mai'r ysgogwyr allweddol yn hyn o beth ddylai fod y cynghorau sgiliau sector yng Nghymru, sydd yn gyfrifol am y meysydd a'r sectorau galwedigaethol?

Er bod rhai, fel SgiliauAdeiladu a'r Cyngor Sgiliau Sector dros Wyddoniaeth, Peirianeg a Thechnolegau Gweithgynhyrchu, wedi'u trefnu'n dda a chydag adnoddau da, mae gwaith eraill yn anghyson. A ydych yn cytuno bod angen i'r cynghorau sgiliau sector, sydd yn gyffredinol wedi'u trefnu ar sail y DU gyfan, sicrhau y cânt adnoddau priodol yng Nghymru i ateb anghenion busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint?

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Mae hynny'n ateb da iawn, yn hytrach na chwestiwn, oherwydd yr wyf yn cytuno â'r hyn a ddywedasoch. Mae'r cynghorau sgiliau sector—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid ateb ydoedd, oherwydd yr oedd ar ffurf cwestiwn. A ydych chi'n dymuno gofyn cwestiwn, Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog?

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Mae'n debyg imi anghofio am ennyd fy mod yn ateb cwestiynau heddiw. *[Chwerthin.]* Yr oedd hwnnw'n gwestiwn da iawn, Jeff, ac ni allaf ychwanegu dim ato yn fy ateb.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Un o'r cyfyngiadau mawr sy'n dal llawer o fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yng Nghymru yn ôl ar hyn o bryd yw'r cynnydd mewn costau tanwydd y mae llawer o gludwyr yn gorfod, neu'n

businesses. What representations has the Welsh Assembly Government made to Westminster to try to deal with the numerous issues that the Road Haulage Association and the Freight Transport Association have highlighted to me, such as taxation, which is obviously not an issue for this institution, and employment, given the fact that eastern European drivers are coming in and undercutting the rates that Welsh hauliers are trying to charge to bring money to the Welsh economy?

**The Deputy First Minister:** I very much recognise the difficulties that small hauliers, in particular, are facing given massive increases in fuel duty, and so on. We recognise that that is causing some real pain for them, and many who are self-employed are finding it difficult in the current climate. Perhaps I need to discuss this with the Minister for Finance and Public Service Delivery to see what representations should be made to the Treasury in that regard, although I understand that the Treasury is now considering whether or not it will impose increases later on this year. I very much agree with you that this is an important part of the economy in Wales, which is highlighted in the freight strategy that I will be announcing later this month.

**Gareth Jones:** Yn ystod ymchwiliad y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu ar gyfraniad economaidd addysg uwch, dywedodd sawl tyst, wrth gyfeirio at rôl a datblygiad busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint, fod gagendor cyfathrebu rhyngddynt a sefydliadau addysg uwch. Dyfynnwyd nifer o resymau dros hynny, ond ni roddwyd bai ar y naill ochr na'r llall. Pa gyfraniad all Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un ei wneud i geisio pontio'r gagendor amlwg hwn sy'n bodoli ar hyn o bryd, sy'n tanseilio datblygiad a photensial yr economi yng Nghymru?

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Yr ydych wedi codi pwynt hynod o bwysig sy'n dangos, yn hanesyddol, na fu perthynas dda rhwng y sector busnes—a'r sector busnesau bach yn arbennig—a'r sector addysg uwch, na'r sector addysg bellach yn draddodiadol, er bod rhai enghrefftiau clodwiw sy'n

ceisio, eu trosglwyddo'n ôl i fusnesau. Pa sylwadau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi'u gwneud i San Steffan i geisio delio â'r materion niferus y mae'r Gymdeithas Gludo Nwyddau ar y Ffyrdd a'r Sefydliad Trafnidiaeth Cludo Nwyddau wedi tynnu fy sylw atynt, fel trethiant, nad yw wrth reswm yn fater i'r sefydliad hwn, a chyflogaeth, ac ystyried bod gyrywyr o ddwyrain Ewrop yn dod i mewn ac yn codi prisiau is na'r hyn y mae cludwyr Cymru'n ceisio'i godi i ddod ag arian i economi Cymru?

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn ymwybodol iawn o'r anawsterau y mae cludwyr bychain, yn enwedig, yn eu hwynebu ac ystyried y codiadau aruthrol ar dreth ar danwydd, ac ati. Sylweddolwn fod hyn yn achosi gwir boendod iddynt, a bod llawer sy'n hunangyflogedig yn ei chael yn anodd yn yr hinsawdd sydd ohoni. Efallai fod angen imi drafod hyn gyda'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid a Chyflenwi Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus i weld pa sylwadau y dylid eu cyflwyno i'r Trysorlys yn hynny o beth, er y deallaf fod y Trysorlys bellach yn ystyried a wnaiff gyflwyno codiadau ai peidio yn ddiweddarach eleni. Cytunaf i'r carn â chi fod hon yn rhan bwysig o'r economi yng Nghymru, a ddangosir yn glir yn y strategaeth ar gludo nwyddau y byddaf yn ei chyhoeddi'n ddiweddarach y mis yma.

**Gareth Jones:** During the Enterprise and Learning Committee's inquiry into the economic contribution of higher education, a number of witnesses, in referring to the role and development of small and medium-sized enterprises, said that a communication gulf exists between them and higher education institutions. Many reasons were quoted for that, but the blame was not placed on either side. What contribution can the One Wales Government make to try and bridge this clear gulf, which undermines the development and the potential of the Welsh economy?

**The Deputy First Minister:** You have raised an extremely important issue that demonstrates, historically, that there has not been a good relationship between the business sector—particularly the small business sector—and the higher education sector or the further education sector

gwrthddweud hynny. Mae gennym ymrwymiad i sicrhau y datblygir yr agenda hon, a bu Jane Hutt a minnau yn gweithio'n agos i sicrhau bod gwell cysylltiad rhwng y sector addysg bellach a'r sector addysg uwch a busnesau er mwyn i'r ddwy ochr elwa ohono.

### Mathau Iach o Drafnidiaeth

**C9 David Lloyd:** Pa gamau mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n eu cymryd i hybu mathau iach o drafnidiaeth? OAQ(3)0484(ECT)

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Mae strategaeth drafnidiaeth Cymru, 'Cysylltu'n Un', yn annog pobl i gerdded a beicio mwy, ac i wneud mwy o ddefnydd o drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus, i helpu i leihau yr effeithiau ar yr amgylchedd, i wella iechyd ac i hyrwyddo lles a ffordd iachach o fyw.

**David Lloyd:** Pan gaiff David Melding ei feic, nid yn unig y bydd yn beicio i'r Cynulliad ond, wrth fynd i leoedd eraill, bydd angen iddo barcio ei feic mewn man diogel, er mwyn iddo allu ei ganfod wedyn. Pa gamau mae'r Llywodraeth yn eu cymryd i hybu datblygiad gorsafoedd beiciau diogel sydd dan glo yn nhrefi a dinasoddd Cymru, gan ddilyn patrwm yr hyn sy'n digwydd mewn dinasoddd ar y cyfandir?

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn siŵr fod gan bob un ohonom ddiddordeb mawr yn hynt a helynt David a'i feic. Yr ydych yn gwneud pwynt hynod bwysig. Credaf fod David wedi cyfeirio nid yn unig at y ffaith bod angen llwybrau diogel i feicio arnynt, ond bod angen cyfleusterau ymolchi a newid ar ben y daith hefyd ar gyfer beicwyr. Gwnaeth Dai bwynt pwysig hefyd, sef bod angen cadw'r beic yn ddiogel ar ddiwedd y daith. Mae cynlluniau gwych yn bodoli. Os ewch i rai o ddinasoddd Ewrop—Amsterdam, Paris ac eraill—gwelwch fod y defnydd o feiciau wedi codi'n sylweddol yno, oherwydd bod polisi cynhwysfawr. Yr wyf am weld hynny'n digwydd yng Nghymru ac yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd y Llywodraeth yn gallu sicrhau hyn drwy drafodaethau. Mater i awdurdodau lleol i'w cyflawni yw hwn, ond yr wyf am sicrhau cefnogaeth gan

traditionally, although there are commendable examples to contradict that. We are committed to ensuring that this agenda is developed, and Jane Hutt and I have been working closely to ensure that there are better links between the further education and higher education sectors and businesses, so that both sides can benefit.

### Healthy Forms of Transport

**Q9 David Lloyd:** What steps is the Welsh Assembly Government taking to encourage healthy forms of transport? OAQ(3)0484(ECT)

**The Deputy First Minister:** The Wales transport strategy, 'Connecting the Nation', encourages greater use of walking, cycling and public transport to help reduce environmental impacts and improve health, as well as promote wellbeing and a healthier lifestyle.

**David Lloyd:** When David Melding gets his bicycle, not only will he cycle to the Assembly but, in going elsewhere, he will need to park his bike in a secure location, so that he can find it afterwards. What steps are the Government taking to promote the development of secure bicycle stations and lockers in the towns and cities of Wales, following the pattern that exists in cities on the continent?

**The Deputy First Minister:** I am sure that we are all very interested in the saga of David and his bicycle. You are making an extremely important point. I believe that David not only referred to the need for safe cycle routes, but to the fact that cyclists also need showering and changing facilities at the end of the journey. Dai also made an important point, which is the need to keep the bike safe at the end of the journey. There are some excellent schemes. If you visit some European cities—Amsterdam, Paris and others—you will see that the use of bikes has risen substantially, because there is a comprehensive policy. I would like to see that happening in Wales and I hope that, through discussions, the Government will be able to ensure that. It is, of course, a matter for local authorities to deliver, but I would like to ensure the Assembly Government's support in order for

Lywodraeth y Cynulliad er mwyn i'r cynlluniau hyn datblygu ymhellach.

**Darren Millar:** I was pleased to hear the emphasis in your statement yesterday on the need for more sustainable transport, including walking and cycling and their obvious health benefits. However, given that we spend £200 per citizen in Wales on roads, compared with just £4 per citizen on walking and cycling, what are you going to do to redress this serious imbalance in funding?

**The Deputy First Minister:** There has been an increase in funding in recent times, and you will now find that about 50 per cent of the funding is spent on roads, and the other 50 per cent is spent on public transport, including by road and rail, and walking and cycling. So there is a fair balance there. We could perhaps talk about what is happening around the edges, but that is the current balance. I recognise that we need improvements in relation to walking and cycling, and I will be discussing that with my officials to see how we can carry that out. However, it is clear to me that there is a great deal of willingness on the part of the Government and, hopefully, on the part of the newly elected local authorities, to develop this agenda. I hope that the regional transport consortia will see this as a priority for them, and that they will come forward with some imaginative schemes.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yr wyf yn feiciwr arall, ac wedi bod yn beicio drwy fy oes o gwmpas Rosset a Chynwyd ac yn y blaen, ond nid wyf yn meddwl y gallaf gystadlu ag Alun Ffred Jones, sy'n mynd ar daith fawr iawn ar ran Ysbyty Walton—da iawn, Alun Ffred. Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog, nid wyf yn siŵr a ydych wedi craffu ar ein manifesto diwethaf; yr oeddem yn sôn ynddo am gael yr hyn a elwir yn '*cycling demonstration towns*' yng Nghymru. A ydych wedi meddwl am hyn, a beth yn union y gallwch ei wneud i helpu pobl, fel fi, sydd yn seiclo? Nid wyf yn dda iawn, ond yr wyf yn gwneud fy ngorau. Mae rheswm difrifol am ofyn y cwestiwn hwn. Os ydych ar lwybr beicio ac wedyn mae'n diflannu, mae'n anodd gwybod sut i gario ymlaen a gall hynny fod yn eithaf peryglus.

these schemes to develop further.

**Darren Millar:** Yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed y pwyslais yn eich datganiad ddoe ar yr angen am fwy o drafnidiaeth gynaliadwy, gan gynnwys cerdded a beicio a'u manteision amlwg ar gyfer iechyd. Fodd bynnag, a chofio ein bod yn gwario £200 y dinesydd yng Nghymru ar ffyrdd, o'i gymharu â dim ond £4 y dinesydd ar gerdded a beicio, beth yr ydych am ei wneud i unioni'r anghydbwysedd difrifol hwn o ran ariannu?

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Mae'r arian wedi cynyddu'n ddiweddar, a gwelwch yn awr fod oddeutu 50 y cant o'r arian yn cael ei wario ar ffyrdd, a'r 50 y cant arall yn cael ei wario ar drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus, gan gynnwys trafnidiaeth ar y ffyrdd a'r rheilffyrdd, a cherdded a beicio. Felly, mae'r cydbwysedd yn deg yn y fan honno. Gallem sôn efallai am yr hyn sy'n digwydd o gwmpas yr ymylon, ond dyna'r cydbwysedd ar hyn o bryd. Sylweddolaf fod angen inni wella pethau o ran cerdded a beicio, a byddaf yn trafod hynny gyda'm swyddogion i weld sut mae gwneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg i mi bod cryn barodrwydd ar ran y Llywodraeth a, gobeithio, ar ran yr awdurdodau lleol sydd newydd eu hethol, i ddatblygu'r agenda hon. Gobeithiaf y bydd y consortia trafnidiaeth rhanbarthol yn gweld hyn yn flaenoriaeth iddynt, ac y byddant yn cyflwyno cynlluniau llawn dychymyg.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I am another cyclist, and have been cycling all my life around Rosset and Cynwyd and so on, but I do not think that I can compete with Alun Ffred Jones, who will be embarking on a very long journey on behalf of Walton Hospital—well done, Alun Ffred. Deputy First Minister, I am not sure whether you have looked at our last manifesto in which we mention having in Wales what are called '*cycling demonstration towns*'. Have you thought about this, and what exactly you could do to help people, like me, who are cyclists? I am not very good, but I try my best. There is a serious purpose to this question. If you are on a cycle path that then disappears, it is difficult to know how to carry on and it can be quite dangerous.



**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Yr wyf i'n cofio seiclo drwy Gynwyd hefyd, ond nid wyf yn cofio gweld Eleanor ar y daith—[*Torri ar draws.*] Nid wyf yn siŵr a oeddwn yn lwcus neu beidio; mater i bobl eraill i benderfynu yw hynny. Mae'n ardal hyfryd i seiclo ynddi. Gobeithio bydd Eleanor yn maddau imi pan ddywedaf nad wyf wedi darllen maniffesto'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn fanwl. Fodd bynnag, mae gennym gynlluniau drwy ein menter trefi cynaliadwy. Pan fyddwn yn ei gyhoeddi, bydd y math o bethau y cyfeiriasoch atynt yn cael eu cynnwys yn y rhaglen yr ydym am ei datblygu.

**The Deputy First Minister:** I remember cycling through Cynwyd also, but I do not remember seeing Eleanor on that journey—[*Interruption.*] I am not sure whether I was fortunate or not; that is an issue for other people to decide. It is a beautiful area for cycling. I hope Eleanor will forgive me when I say that I have not read the Liberal Democrats' manifesto in detail. However, we do have schemes through our sustainable towns initiative. When that is published, the kinds of things that you refer to will be included in the programme that we wish to develop.

### **Datganiad am y Cyfnod Sylfaen Statement on Foundation Phase**

**The Minister for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills (Jane Hutt):** The foundation phase is one of the most significant reforms that the Welsh Assembly Government is introducing in the 'One Wales' programme. Its aim is to change the approach to the education of our three to seven-year-olds to provide the best possible start to their learning. Fully evaluated, the foundation phase reforms have been widely welcomed by local authorities, schools and parents. In my written statement of 29 April, I reported that additional funding would be required, over and above the £25 million grant secured in the 2008-09 budget for the roll-out of the foundation phase from September.

**Y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau (Jane Hutt):** Y cyfnod sylfaen yw un o'r diwygiadau pwysicaf y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n ei gyflwyno yn rhaglen 'Cymru'n Un'. Ei nod yw newid yr agwedd at addysgu ein plant rhwng tair a saith oed er mwyn rhoi'r cychwyn gorau posibl iddynt wrth iddynt ddysgu. Mae diwygiadau'r cyfnod sylfaen wedi cael eu gwerthuso'n llawn, ac mae awdurdodau lleol, ysgolion a rhieni wedi rhoi croeso eang iddynt. Yn fy natganiad ysgrifenedig ar 29 Ebrill, adroddais y byddai angen arian ychwanegol, ar ben y grant o £25 miliwn a sicrhawyd yng nghyllideb 2008-09 er mwyn cyflwyno'r cyfnod sylfaen o fis Medi ymlaen.

I would like to make it clear that local authorities were asked to undertake an audit in 2006 in preparation for the roll-out of the foundation phase; there was a disappointing response. On the evidence of the information provided to date, some authorities have a clear picture of how they will move forward already, but others do not. However, I pay tribute to those authorities that already have the information and have built a clear foundation phase strategy as a result.

Hoffwn ei gwneud yn glir y gofynnwyd i awdurdodau lleol ymgymryd ag archwiliad yn 2006 i baratoi ar gyfer cyflwyno'r cyfnod sylfaen; yr oedd yr ymateb yn siomedig. Ar sail tystiolaeth y wybodaeth a roddwyd hyd yn hyn, mae gan rai awdurdodau ddarlun clir eisoes o sut y byddant yn bwrw ymlaen, ond nid felly awdurdodau eraill. Fodd bynnag, talaf deyrnged i'r awdurdodau hynny y mae'r wybodaeth ganddynt eisoes ac sydd wedi datblygu strategaeth glir ar gyfer y cyfnod sylfaen yn sgil hynny.

I am committed to rolling out the 1:8 adult to child ratio for three to five-year-olds from September 2008. The information that local authorities have now provided demonstrates that a significant amount of progress can be

Yr wyf wedi ymrwymo hefyd i ledaenu'r gymhareb 1:8 ar gyfer oedolion a phlant tair i bump oed o fis Medi 2008 ymlaen. Mae'r wybodaeth y mae awdurdodau lleol wedi'i darparu'n awr yn dangos bod modd gwneud

made towards achieving the 1:8 ratio in the 2008-09 school year.

1.50 p.m.

In order to safeguard the successful pilots and their continuity during roll-out, I am able to announce today an additional £5 million for this financial year, which will be found from within my existing departmental budget. It will be ring-fenced to provide full support for the pilot and early start schools across Wales. Provision will be made in finalising my budget for 2009-10 for this transitional support to continue for the summer term 2009. This additional funding will do two things. First, it will ensure that the pilot and early start schools can maintain their staffing for the foundation phase, to provide high-quality learning for their children and act as champions of good practice for other schools and settings in their authority. It also means that, during the 2008-09 transition school year, local authorities will not have to support these schools for the autumn and spring terms from the £25 million already secured for this financial year. My expectation is that, as a result of this additional funding, local authorities will use more of the £25 million to fund additional staff for the roll-out in their other schools. How many additional staff there will be compared with their current calculations will vary from authority to authority, depending on the costs involved in each pilot and early start school.

As a condition of the foundation phase grant, I am requiring all local authorities to provide the Welsh Assembly Government with their final plans for use of the grant by 30 May. Authorities will be expected to notify schools of their allocations by the end of May to enable them to recruit staff for September. My officials will be assisting authorities in finalising their plans and it is essential that, in turn, local authorities involve their schools. Our tri-level approach is based on a commitment to partnership working. Schools are clearly at the forefront and pupils are at the heart of all that we do.

cynnydd sylweddol at sicrhau'r gymhareb 1:8 ym mlwyddyn ysgol 2008-09.

Er mwyn diogelu'r cynlluniau peilot llwyddiannus a'u dilyniant yn ystod y cyfnod cyflwyno, gallaf gyhoeddi heddiw £5 miliwn ychwanegol ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol hon, a bydd hyn yn dod o gyllideb bresennol fy adran. Caiff ei neilltuo er mwyn darparu cymorth llawn ar gyfer yr ysgolion peilot a'r ysgolion dechrau'n gynnar ledled Cymru. Wrth bennu fy nghyllideb derfynol ar gyfer 2009-10, darperir arian i barhau â'r cymorth pontio hwn ar gyfer tymor yr haf 2009. Bydd yr arian ychwanegol hwn yn gwneud dau beth. Yn gyntaf, bydd yn sicrhau bod modd i'r ysgolion peilot a'r ysgolion dechrau'n gynnar gynnal eu staffio ar gyfer y cyfnod sylfaen, er mwyn iddynt ddarparu addysgu o safon uchel i'w plant a bod yn esiampl o arferion da i ysgolion a lleoliadau eraill yn eu hawdurdod. Mae'n golygu hefyd, yn ystod y flwyddyn ysgol bontio 2008-09, na fydd yn rhaid i awdurdodau lleol ddefnyddio arian o'r £25 miliwn a sicrhawyd eisoes ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol hon i gefnogi'r ysgolion hyn yn ystod tymor yr hydref a thymor y gwanwyn. Yr wyf yn disgwyl, yn sgil yr arian ychwanegol hwn, y bydd awdurdodau lleol yn defnyddio mwy o'r £25 miliwn i dalu am staff ychwanegol i gyflwyno'r cyfnod sylfaen yn eu hysgolion eraill. Bydd faint o staff ychwanegol y bydd eu hangen o'i gymharu â'u cyfrifiadau presennol yn amrywio o'r naill awdurdod i'r llall ac yn dibynnu ar gostau pob ysgol beilot a phob ysgol dechrau'n gynnar.

Un o amodau'r grant ar gyfer y cyfnod sylfaen fydd y bydd gofyn i bob awdurdod lleol gyflwyno'u cynlluniau terfynol ar gyfer defnyddio'r grant i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru erbyn 30 Mai. Disgwylir i awdurdodau hysbysu ysgolion ynglŷn â'u dyraniadau erbyn diwedd mis Mai er mwyn eu galluogi i recriwtio staff ar gyfer mis Medi. Bydd fy swyddogion yn cynorthwyo awdurdodau i lunio'u cynlluniau terfynol ac mae'n hollbwysig bod yr awdurdodau lleol, yn eu tro, yn cynnwys eu hysgolion. Seilir ein hagwedd dair lefel ar ymrwymiad i waith partneriaeth. Mae'n amlwg bod ysgolion ar y pen blaen ac mae disgyblion wrth galon

popeth a wnawn.

I can also report that, yesterday, I chaired the first meeting of the foundation phase implementation task and finish group, which includes representatives of the key stakeholders—the Welsh Local Government Association, the Association of Directors of Education in Wales, the teachers' unions, early years experts and Estyn. The meeting was positive, with all around the table committed to seeking the successful roll-out of the foundation phase and welcoming the partnership approach to achieving that.

I am also requiring authorities to collect data by the end of June regarding the current position in their schools. This will confirm the workforce currently available to deliver the foundation phase and give an estimate of the total number of three to five-year-olds projected to be in each school in September. The Welsh Assembly Government will work with local authorities to conduct an audit of these data in order to provide a baseline against which to judge progress made in September. The £5 million that I am making available this year will be assessed against this information in reaching conclusions about future resource levels. Close monitoring will be maintained throughout the roll-out, working alongside the WLGA and ADEW. The Assembly Government will also review the January 2008 pupil level annual school census data with local authorities, together with the PLASC requirements for 2009, in order to secure improved information and to achieve an educationally and financially sustainable roll-out in future years.

I will conclude with a brief mention of the expectations of schools and the part that Estyn has to play. We are supporting the 1:8 ratio because we believe that the delivery of the new statutory curriculum for three to five-year-olds will be better as a result. However, the ratio itself is not statutory; it is the quality of teaching and learning that is key to success. Estyn has confirmed to me that the advice to inspectors will be to base their judgments on the effective use by the school

Gallaf ddweud hefyd imi gadeirio cyfarfod cyntaf grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen gweithredu'r cyfnod sylfaen ddoe. Mae'n cynnwys cynrychiolwyr y prif randdeiliaid—Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, Cymdeithas Cyfarwyddwyr Addysg Cymru, undebau'r athrawon, arbenigwyr blynyddoedd cynnar ac Estyn. Yr oedd y cyfarfod yn un adeiladol, gyda phawb a oedd o gwmpas bwrdd wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau bod y cyfnod sylfaen yn cael ei gyflwyno'n llwyddiannus ac yn croesawu'r agwedd bartneriaeth at wireddu hynny.

Yr wyf hefyd yn gofyn i awdurdodau gasglu data erbyn diwedd Mehefin ynglŷn â'r sefyllfa bresennol yn eu hysgolion. Bydd hyn yn cadarnhau'r gweithlu sydd ar gael ar hyn o bryd i gyflawni'r cyfnod sylfaen ac yn cynnig amcangyfrif ynglŷn â chyfanswm nifer y disgyblion rhwng tair a phump oed a ragwelir ym mhob ysgol ym mis Medi. Bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gweithio gydag awdurdodau lleol i gynnal archwiliad o'r data hyn er mwyn darparu llinell sylfaen i bwysu a mesur y cynnydd a wneir ym mis Medi. Asesir y £5 miliwn yr wyf yn ei ddarparu eleni ar sail y wybodaeth hon wrth lunio casgliadau ynglŷn â lefelau adnoddau yn y dyfodol. Bydd y cyfan yn cael ei fonitro'n ofalus drwy gydol y cyfnod cyflwyno, gan weithio ochr yn ochr â CLILC a Chymdeithas Cyfarwyddwyr Addysg Cymru. Bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad hefyd yn adolygu data cyfrifiad ysgolion blynyddol ar lefel disgyblion Ionawr 2008 gydag awdurdodau lleol, ynghyd â gofynion PLASC ar gyfer 2009, er mwyn cael gwell gwybodaeth a sicrhau cyflwyniad sy'n ariannol ac yn addysgol gynaliadwy yn y blynyddoedd a ddaw.

Caeaf ben y mwdwl drwy sôn yn fras am yr hyn a ddisgwylir gan ysgolion a'r rhan y mae gan Estyn i'w chwarae. Yr ydym yn cefnogi'r gymhareb 1:8 oherwydd ein bod yn credu y bydd cyflawni'r cwricwlwm statudol newydd ar gyfer plant rhwng tair a phump oed yn well yn sgil hynny. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r gymhareb ei hun yn statudol; ansawdd yr addysgu a'r dysgu yw'r allwedd i lwyddiant. Mae Estyn wedi cadarnhau mai'r cyngor a roddir i arolygwyr fydd iddynt seilio'u barn

of the available resources and on the quality of teaching and learning, not on whether or not the ratio has been achieved. The advice will also reflect the fact that it will take time, in any event, for the foundation phase to bed down. I have spoken with the chief inspector of Estyn, who will be writing to local education authorities to set out Estyn's position in relation to the inspection of the foundation phase from September 2008.

I am grateful for the support across this Chamber for the foundation phase. There is much still to be done, but I believe that if the Welsh Assembly Government, local authorities, schools and their representatives continue to work together in the ways that I have indicated, we will see significant progress in rolling out the foundation phase in September—progress that we will build on in future years to secure this fundamental and far-reaching change in early years education.

**Alun Cairns:** Two weeks ago, the Minister said that there was no need for additional funding. Last week, the Minister conceded to a u-turn, and today she has announced an additional £5 million out of existing money. However, the call from teachers, headteachers, parents, pupils and governors has been for £15 million. Let us be clear: as the Minister said in her statement, this money is only to support the pilot schools. Not one additional penny of that £5 million will go to the other schools across Wales for which this foundation phase will become statutory, and their parents, pupils, teachers, governors and headteachers. There is a statutory requirement to introduce the foundation phase. The success of the pilot scheme was based on the 1:8 ratio, but that 1:8 ratio will not be able to be delivered given the funding that the Welsh Assembly Government has made available. I have a letter from the chairman of governors of a local school that states:

'The reality is that the governing body will only be able to meet the staffing requirements'—

the 1:8 ratio that we are talking about—

ar i ba raddau y mae'r ysgol yn defnyddio'r adnoddau sydd ar gael yn effeithiol ac ar ansawdd yr addysgu a'r dysgu, yn hytrach nag ar lwyddo i sicrhau'r gymhareb. Bydd y cyngor hefyd yn adlewyrchu'r ffaith y bydd angen amser, beth bynnag, i'r cyfnod sylfaen fwrw gwreiddiau. Yr wyf wedi siarad â phrif arolygydd Estyn, a fydd yn ysgrifennu at awdurdodau addysg lleol i egluro safbwynt Estyn o ran arolygu'r cyfnod sylfaen o fis Medi 2008 ymlaen.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y gefnogaeth i'r cyfnod sylfaen ar draws y Siambr hon. Mae llawer i'w wneud eto, ond credaf, os bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, awdurdodau lleol, ysgolion a'u cynrychiolwyr yn parhau i gydweithio yn y ffyrdd a grybwyllais, y gwelwn gynnydd sylweddol o ran cyflwyno'r cyfnod sylfaen ym mis Medi—cynnydd y byddwn yn adeiladu arno yn y blynyddoedd a ddaw er mwyn sicrhau'r newid sylfaenol a phellgyrhaeddol hwn ym maes addysg blynyddoedd cynnar.

**Alun Cairns:** Bythefnos yn ôl, dywedodd y Gweinidog nad oedd angen arian ychwanegol. Yr wythnos diwethaf, ildiodd y Gweinidog a gwneud tro pedol, a heddiw, mae wedi cyhoeddi £5 miliwn ychwanegol o blith arian sy'n bodoli eisoes. Fodd bynnag, mae athrawon, penaethiaid, rhieni, disgyblion a llywodraethwyr wedi bod yn galw am £15 miliwn. Gadewch inni fod yn glir: fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog yn ei datganiad, dim ond i gefnogi'r ysgolion peilot y mae'r arian hwn. Ni fydd yr un geiniog ychwanegol o'r £5 miliwn hwnnw'n mynd i'r ysgolion eraill ledled Cymru lle daw'r cyfnod sylfaen hwn yn statudol, nac i'w rhieni, i'w disgyblion, i'w hathrawon, i'w llywodraethwyr na'u penaethiaid. Mae cyflwyno'r cyfnod sylfaen yn ofyniad statudol. Seiliwyd llwyddiant y cynllun peilot ar y gymhareb 1:8, ond ni fydd modd gwireddu'r gymhareb 1:8 honno ac ystyried yr arian y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi'i ddarparu. Mae gennyf lythyr oddi wrth gadeirydd llywodraethwyr ysgol leol sy'n dweud:

Y gwir yw na fydd y corf llywodraethu ond yn gallu gwireddu'r gofynion staffio—

y gymhareb 1:8 yr ydym yn sôn amdani—

‘by redirecting staff from special educational needs support.’

That is the reality, not only in that school, but in the schools in your constituency, Minister, where the headteachers unanimously supported a policy to reject the money that was being made available, because it was wholly insufficient to deliver this statutory requirement. We will see learning support assistants for special needs pupils taken away in order to introduce this foundation phase. We all know what that will result in—more challenges through SEN tribunals, more legal costs, and more criticism of your administration.

Minister, you are fast losing the respect and confidence of the teaching profession, of parents and of governors in Wales. If you are not to lose their confidence, please heed their calls. Let us give schools the £15 million that they say that they need this financial year, and let us give it as new money, not out of existing resources, which were cut in the first instance.

**Jane Hutt:** Perhaps it was too much to hope that Alun, as the opposition spokesman for education, would be constructive in his response. As his voice got louder, we saw increasingly that he had lost the argument, and I detected very few questions.

The point that I wanted to get over clearly in my statement is that this is a fundamental and far-reaching change in early years education. In terms of the £25 million that we have secured for this year, in response, learning from the experience of the last few weeks in ensuring that we have funding in place, I have secured another £5 million to protect the pilot and early start schools in the non-maintained and maintained sector.

That is good news. It is good news for all those 84 pilots and non-maintained settings that have, for the last four years, been champions of the foundation phase. That is ring-fenced money to support and secure the

drwy ailgyfeirio staff sydd ar hyn o bryd yn darparu cymorth anghenion addysgol arbennig.

Dyna'r gwir, nid dim ond yn yr ysgol honno, ond yn yr ysgolion yn eich etholaeth chi, Weinidog, lle yr oedd penaethiaid yn unfryd o blaid polisi i wrthod yr arian a oedd yn cael ei ddarparu, am ei fod yn gwbl annigonol i wireddu'r gofyniad statudol hwn. Byddwn yn gweld tynnu cynorthwywyr cymorth dysgu oddi ar ddisgyblion anghenion arbennig er mwyn cyflwyno'r cyfnod sylfaen hwn. Gwyddom i gyd beth fydd canlyniad hynny—mwy o heriau drwy dribiwnlysoedd AAA, mwy o gostau cyfreithiol, a mwy o feirniadaeth ar eich gweinyddiaeth.

Weinidog, yr ydych yn prysur golli parch ac ymddiriedaeth y proffesiwn addysgu, rhieni a llywodraethwyr yng Nghymru. Er mwyn ichi beidio â cholli eu hymddiriedaeth, da chi, gwrandewch arnynt. Gadewch inni roi'r £15 miliwn i'r ysgolion y maent yn dweud y mae ei angen arnynt yn y flwyddyn ariannol hon, a gadewch inni ei roi ar ffurf arian newydd, nid o blith yr adnoddau sydd ar gael eisoes, a'r rheini'n adnoddau a dorrwyd yn y lle cyntaf.

**Jane Hutt:** Efallai ei bod yn ormod gobeithio y byddai Alun, ac yntau'n llefarydd addysg yr wrthblaid, yn adeiladol yn ei ymateb. Wrth i'w lais godi, gwelsom fwyfwy iddo golli'r ddadl, ac ychydig iawn o gwestiynau a glywais.

Y pwynt yr oeddwn am ei gyfleu'n glir yn fy natganiad yw bod y newid hwn ym maes addysg blynyddoedd cynnar yn newid sylfaenol a phellgyrhaeddol. O ran y £25 miliwn yr ydym wedi'i sicrhau ar gyfer eleni, i ymateb, gan ddysgu yn sgil profiad yr ychydig wythnosau diwethaf o ran sicrhau bod yr arian gennym yn ei le, yr wyf wedi sicrhau £5 miliwn arall er mwyn gwarchod yr ysgolion peilot a'r ysgolion dechrau'n gynnar yn y sector nas cynhelir a'r sector a gynhelir.

Mae hynny'n newyddion da. Mae'n newyddion da i bob un o'r 84 cynllun peilot hynny a'r lleoliadau nas cynhelir sydd, ers y pedair blynedd diwethaf, wedi bod yn hyrwyddo'r cyfnod sylfaen. Mae'r arian

teaching staff, the learning support assistants and the classroom assistants in all those settings from April this year, through this financial year. That is progress. I got support from around the table from the teaching unions, early years experts, the Welsh Local Government Association, and directors of education. It is the support and responses from those stakeholders that I take account of.

**Janet Ryder:** I welcome the extra money that has been made available. There is a tight financial settlement all around, and it is good that you have been able to find the extra money. What is concerning, however, is the poor initial response from local government. Some local government areas did not respond at all, did not get their plans in, and did not know the figures that they were basing this on, which makes it hard to calculate differences.

2.00 p.m.

You have given assurances in your statement that your officials will work with those local government areas that, at present, still do not have plans in place as to how they are going to roll out the foundation phase. Will you give me an assurance, Minister, that you will come back to the Chamber before the end of the summer term and report on the progress made and, if necessary, name those authorities that are still reluctant to put their plans in place or still do not have the ability to put them in place? Will you give an assurance that, if necessary, once those authorities have made a proper assessment of their future needs, you will look again, if possible, at the financial situation in the light of the firm figures and plans that will have come forward from local authorities? At the end of the day, all of this falls on the schools to implement and it is a great pity that many schools have not received the support that they should have been able to expect from their local authorities in rolling out this new phase.

With regard to the fact that the foundation phase will become part of the Estyn

hwnnw'n arian sydd wedi'i neilltuo i gefnogi a sicrhau'r staff addysgu, y cynorthwywyr cymorth dysgu a'r cynorthwywyr dosbarth ym mhob un o'r lleoliadau hynny o fis Ebrill eleni ymlaen, drwy gydol y flwyddyn ariannol hon. Mae hynny'n gynydd. Cefais gefnogaeth o gwmpas y bwrdd gan yr undebau addysgu, arbenigwyr blynyddoedd cynnar, Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, a chyfarwyddwyr addysg. Cefnogaeth ac ymateb y rhanddeiliaid hynny yw'r rhai yr wyf yn rhoi sylw iddynt.

**Janet Ryder:** Croesawaf yr arian ychwanegol sydd wedi'i ddarparu. Mae'r setliad ariannol yn un tyn ym mhob cwr, ac mae'n dda ichi allu dod o hyd i'r arian ychwanegol. Yr hyn sy'n destun pryder, fodd bynnag, yw'r ymateb cychwynnol gwael gan lywodraeth leol. Nid ymatebodd ardaloedd rhai awdurdodau lleol o gwbl, ni chyflwynwyd eu cynlluniau, ac nid oeddent yn gwybod ar ba ffigurau yr oeddent yn seilio hyn, sy'n ei gwneud yn anodd cyfrifo gwahaniaethau.

Yr ydych wedi rhoi sicrwydd yn eich datganiad y bydd eich swyddogion yn gweithio gyda'r ardaloedd awdurdod lleol hynny nad oes ganddynt gynlluniau ar hyn o bryd, o ran sut y maent yn mynd i gyflwyno'r cyfnod sylfaen. A wnewch chi fy sicrhau, Weinidog, y deuwch yn ôl i'r Siambr cyn diwedd tymor yr haf a rhoi adroddiad am y cynnydd a wnaethpwyd, ac os bydd enwi'r awdurdodau hynny sy'n dal yn amharod i roi eu cynlluniau ar waith neu sydd heb yn gallu eto i'w rhoi ar waith? A wnewch chi sicrhau, os bydd angen, y byddwch yn ailedrych, os oes modd, ar y sefyllfa ariannol, wedi i'r awdurdodau hynny wneud asesiad priodol o'u hanghenion yn y dyfodol, yng ngoleuni'r ffigurau a'r cynlluniau pendant y bydd awdurdodau lleol wedi'u rhoi gerbron? Yn y pen draw, yr ysgolion sy'n gorfod rhoi hyn i gyd ar waith, ac mae'n drueni mawr bod llawer o ysgolion heb gael y cymorth y dylent fod wedi gallu disgwyl ei gael gan eu hawdurdodau lleol wrth gyflwyno'r cyfnod newydd hwn.

O ran ar y ffaith y bydd y cyfnod sylfaen yn rhan o gyfundrefn arolygu Estyn o fis Medi

inspection regime from September, I welcome the discussions that you have had with Estyn and the fact that an allowance will be made when schools are inspected. They will be inspected on the quality of the teaching to begin with. You said in your statement that a letter will go from Estyn to local authorities, telling them of any change in advice to inspectors. Will you ensure, Minister, that that letter will also go to the schools so that they are aware, when they are inspected, of what the inspectors will be looking for, given this change in advice? Will this in any way affect the roll out of your school effectiveness programme for the whole of Wales?

Finally, I welcome the re-look at the pupil level annual school census data and how they are collected. It was partly the inability of those data to show the detail required that caused some of these problems, because they have not identified clearly the difference between various classroom assistants and the roles that they perform. Thank you, also, Minister, for the extra funding.

**Jane Hutt:** Thank you for acknowledging that we had a poor response from local government. I made that clear in my statement. When I again scrutinised the returns in the middle of March, we had received responses from only five local authorities, after we had asked them again for adequate information and data on their projections and estimates. This is going to be delivered, substantially, by local government working in partnership with its schools. We are here to provide the funding and the guidance and to lead the reforms, but it is the local authorities that are going to have to deliver at the sharp end. I am grateful for your question because the audit process is rigorous—and I will not go over again what I have requested. The grant conditions are tight in that we will not be giving money unless it is drawn down on the basis of adequate data and proof of spend in terms of supporting the foundation phase. I give that assurance today. Working in partnership, alongside the WLGA and the Association of Directors of Education in Wales, is crucial, but we have to get local authorities to play their part rigorously to

ymlaen, croesawaf y trafodaethau yr ydych wedi'u cael gydag Estyn a'r ffaith y rhoddir ystyriaeth i hyn pan fydd gaiff ysgolion eu harolygu. Fe'u harolygir ar sail ansawdd yr addysgu i ddechrau. Dywedasoeh yn eich datganiad y bydd Estyn yn anfon llythyr at awdurdodau lleol i roi gwybod iddynt am unrhyw newid yn y cyngor i arolygwyr. A wnewch chi sicrhau, Weinidog, yr anfonir y llythyr hwnnw hefyd i'r ysgolion er mwyn iddynt fod yn ymwybodol, pan gânt arolygiad, o'r hyn y bydd yr arolygwyr yn chwilio amdano, o gofio'r newid hwn yn y cyngor? A fydd hyn yn effeithio mewn unrhyw fodd ar y camau i roi ar waith eich rhaglen effeithiolrwydd ysgolion i Gymru gyfan?

Yn olaf, croesawaf edrych eto ar y data o'r cyfrifiad ysgolion blynyddol ar lefel disgybl a'r modd y cânt eu casglu. Anallu'r data hynny i ddangos y manylion gofynnol a oedd yn rhannol gyfrifol am rai o'r problemau hyn, am nad ydynt wedi dangos yn glir y gwahaniaeth rhwng amrywiol gynorthwywyr ystafell ddosbarth a'r rolau y maent yn eu cyflawni. Diolch i chi hefyd, Weinidog, am y cyllid ychwanegol.

**Jane Hutt:** Diolch ichi am gydnabod ein bod wedi cael ymateb gwael gan lywodraeth leol. Eglurais hynny yn fy natganiad. Pan edrychais eto ar y ffurflenni ganol Mawrth, yr oeddem wedi cael ymatebion gan bum awdurdod lleol yn unig, wedi inni ofyn iddynt eto am wybodaeth a data digonol am eu hamcanestyniadau a'u hamcangyfrifon. Rhoddir hyn ar waith, i raddau helaeth, gan lywodraeth leol drwy weithio mewn partneriaeth â'i hysgolion. Ein gwaith ni yw darparu'r cyllid a'r arweiniad a llywio'r diwygiadau, ond yr awdurdodau lleol a fydd yn gorfod mynd â'r maen i'r wal yn lleol. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich cwestiwn gan fod y broses archwilio'n un drwyadl—ac nid af drwy'r hyn yr wyf wedi gofyn amdano eto. Mae'r amodau grant yn llym i'r graddau na fyddwn yn rhoi arian oni chaiff ei dynnu i lawr ar sail data digonol a phrawf o wario ar gynnal y cyfnod sylfaen. Rhoddaf y sicrwydd hwnnw heddiw. Mae gwaith mewn partneriaeth, ochr yn ochr â Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru a Chymdeithas Cyfarwyddwyr Addysg Cymru, yn hollbwysig, ond rhaid inni gael awdurdodau

deliver this.

In response to your question about Estyn, I will say that Estyn was represented at the working group yesterday. It was also able to reassure the teaching unions that were represented that it would be looking, as you said, at how it could inspect the effectiveness of a school's use of the available resources and the quality of the teaching and learning in relation to the foundation phase curriculum. I will ask the chief inspector to ensure that that letter goes directly to the schools.

On the final point that you made, Janet, this is about a crucial reform that involves schools, the Welsh Assembly Government and local authorities. That is the basis of our school effectiveness framework. As far as I am concerned, the foundation phase has to be the starting point, demonstrating that we can deliver that kind of fundamental change for our early-years education as a result of that partnership.

**Kirsty Williams:** I thank the Minister for the advance copy of her statement this afternoon. I will begin by, once again, expressing Welsh Liberal Democrat support for the principle of the foundation phase. I welcome the announcement in your statement that when schools are being inspected, they will not be penalised for your Government's failure to fund them adequately. As recently as 16 April, Minister, you were denying that there was a funding problem. I welcome the fact that, today, you have finally woken up to what most people have been saying since last summer, namely that the money that you were going to allocate to the foundation phase was woefully inadequate.

Janet Ryder can try her best to hide Plaid's shame, but she knows that this £5 million goes nowhere near far enough towards plugging the gap. Although she may try to blame those local authorities, she would do well to remember that the local education authorities' expenditure sub-group submitted quite clear costings in September 2007, which this Government—your Government—has failed to honour.

lleol i chwarae eu rhan yn llawn er mwyn cyflawni hyn.

I ymateb i'ch cwestiwn am Estyn, dywedaf fod Estyn wedi'i gynrychioli yn y gweithgor ddoe. Yr oedd hefyd yn gallu sicrhau'r undebau addysgu a oedd wedi'u cynrychioli y byddai'n edrych, fel y dywedech, ar y modd y gallai arolygu effeithiolrwydd ysgolion wrth ddefnyddio'r adnoddau sydd ar gael, ac ar ansawdd yr addysgu a'r dysgu mewn cysylltiad â chwricwlwm y cyfnod sylfaen. Gofynnaf i'r prif arolygydd sicrhau anfon y llythyr hwnnw'n uniongyrchol i'r ysgolion.

Ynghylch y pwynt olaf a wnaethoch, Janet, mae hyn yn ymwneud â diwygio hollbwysig sy'n cynnwys ysgolion, Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ac awdurdodau lleol. Dyna yw sail ein fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion. O'm rhan i, rhaid i'r cyfnod sylfaen fod yn fan cychwyn, sy'n dangos ein bod yn gallu darparu newid sylfaenol o'r fath ar gyfer addysg y blynyddoedd cynnar o ganlyniad i'r bartneriaeth honno.

**Kirsty Williams:** Diolch i'r Gweinidog am y blaengopi o'i datganiad y prynhawn yma. Dechreuaf drwy ddatgan, unwaith eto, gefnogaeth Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru i egwyddor y cyfnod sylfaen. Croesawaf y cyhoeddiad yn eich datganiad na chosbir ysgolion, pan gânt eu harolygu, oherwydd methiant eich Llywodraeth i'w hariannu'n ddigonol. Mor ddiweddar ag 16 Ebrill, Weinidog, yr oeddech yn gwadu bod problem o ran ariannu. Croesawaf y ffaith eich bod, heddiw, wedi agor eich llygaid o'r diwedd i'r hyn y mae'r rhan fwyaf o bobl wedi ei ddweud ers yr haf diwethaf, sef bod yr arian yr oeddech yn mynd i'w ddyrannu i'r cyfnod sylfaen yn druenus o annigonol.

Gall Janet Ryder wneud ei gorau i guddio cywilydd Plaid, ond gŵyr fod y £5 miliwn hwn ymhell o fod yn ddigon i gau'r bwll. Er y bydd efallai'n ceisio rhoi'r bai ar yr awdurdodau lleol hynny, byddai'n dda iddi gofio bod is-grŵp gwariant yr awdurdodau addysg lleol wedi cyflwyno prisiadau eithaf clir ym Medi 2007, a'r Llywodraeth hon—eich Llywodraeth chi—wedi methu â'u hanrhydeddu.



The fact is that the £5 million is still woefully inadequate. You say that you have made it available to support the ongoing work of the pilot schools. The reality is that the pilot schemes have cost £10 million; we are already £5 million down on what it has cost to run the schemes. So, I guess that those people already employed in Pembrokeshire and in Neath Port Talbot who have received or are about to receive their redundancy notices can expect little joy, because you are not actually covering the full cost of the pilot. If you add up the shortfalls that county councils have collectively reported on the foundation phase, you find that the figure of £5 million covers the shortfalls for just five unitary authorities. I guess that you expect the rest to just go hang, Minister.

Y gwir amdani yw bod y £5 miliwn yn dal yn druenus o annigonol. Dywedwch eich bod wedi'i ddarparu i gynnal gwaith presennol yr ysgolion peilot. Y gwir yw bod y cynlluniau peilot wedi costio £10 miliwn; yr ydym eisoes £5 miliwn yn brin o'r hyn y mae wedi'i gostio i redeg y cynlluniau. Felly, mae'n debyg gennyf mai prin fydd disgwyliadau'r bobl hynny sydd eisoes wedi'u cyflogi yn sir Benfro a'r rheini yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot sydd wedi cael neu sydd ar fin cael hysbysiadau diswyddo, am nad ydych mewn gwirionedd yn talu cost lawn y cynllun peilot. Os rhwch y diffygion y mae cynghorau sir wedi rhoi gwybod amdanynt ar gyfer y cyfnod sylfaen at ei gilydd, gwelwch nad yw'r ffigur o £5 miliwn ond yn talu am ddiffygion pum awdurdod unedol. Mae'n debyg gennyf eich bod yn disgwyl i'r gweddill fynd i'w crogi, Weinidog.

Can you explain how you have come up with the figure of £5 million? It does not bear any resemblance to the costings that have been sent to your department for how much it will actually cost to roll out the foundation phase this year. Therefore, can you explain why you feel that £5 million is adequate?

A allwch egluro sut yr ydych wedi meddwl am y ffigur o £5 miliwn? Nid yw'n ddim byd tebyg i'r prisiadau sydd wedi'u hanfon i'ch adran ar gyfer gwir gost rhoi'r cyfnod sylfaen ar waith eleni. Felly, a allwch egluro pam y teimlwch fod £5 miliwn yn ddigonol?

Did you ask Andrew Davies for additional money? If so, what was his answer? This money is coming out of your existing budget, so I can only assume that the Minister said 'no'. That does not give us very much confidence, when Andrew Davies is holding all the money for the single investment fund and the Minister said, quite boastfully, a couple of months ago that she was first in the queue to get her hands on the cash. Given that the £5 million for the foundation phase is coming out of your existing budget, can you identify which lines of your budget will be cut by that amount?

A ofynsoch i Andrew Davies am arian ychwanegol? Os gwnaethoch, beth oedd ei ateb? Mae'r arian hwn yn dod o'ch cyllideb bresennol, felly, ni allaf ond cymryd bod y Gweinidog wedi gwrthod. Nid yw hynny'n rhoi llawer o reswm inni hyderu, gan fod Andrew Davies yn dal yr holl arian ar gyfer y gronfa fuddsoddi sengl a dywedodd y Gweinidog, yn eithaf ymffrostgar, ychydig fisoedd yn ôl, ei bod hi ar flaen y rhes o bobl sy'n disgwyl eu tro i gael gafael ar yr arian. Gan fod y £5 miliwn ar gyfer y cyfnod sylfaen yn dod o'ch cyllideb bresennol, a allwch enwi'r llinellau yn eich cyllideb a fydd yn colli'r swm hwnnw?

When do you now expect schools to meet the staffing ratio of 1:8? Your statement does not say when you expect all pupils in the three to five-year-old age group to have that ratio. When do you expect that to happen? In your Government's famous tick chart of all the things that you are doing to fulfil your 'One Wales' commitments, you said that that would be achieved by the end of this year.

Pa bryd yr ydych yn disgwyl bellach i ysgolion gyrraedd y gymhareb staffio o 1:8? Nid yw'ch datganiad yn dweud pa bryd y disgwyliwch i'r holl ddisgyblion yn y grŵp oed rhwng tair a phump oed gael y gymhareb honno. Pa bryd yr ydych yn disgwyl y bydd hynny'n digwydd? Yn siart dicio enwog eich Llywodraeth o'r holl bethau yr ydych yn eu gwneud i gyflawni'ch ymrwymadau yn

Can you confirm that that is still the case? If it is not, how will you ensure that there is equality of opportunity for all children in Wales given that you seem quite happy for some authorities to be working with the 1:8 ratio while other authorities are not?

Can you also address the issue of whether there will be any additional funding for capital requirements in the foundation phase? The concerns expressed by teachers' unions have all related to resources to meet the staffing ratio. This money does not go anywhere near meeting the capital and training requirements; it is just for employing the staff.

Finally, why have you left it so late? You expect councils to have their plans in by the end of the month, and yet you have taken months and months to wake up to the disastrous situation that was staring you in the face. Do you think that it is acceptable to make demands on local authorities when you and your officials acknowledged that this programme was in difficulty as recently as two months ago? You now expect teachers, school leaders and governing bodies to pull it out of the bag because you did not put them in a position to sort it out earlier.

2.10 p.m.

**Jane Hutt:** That was cheap opposition, as opposed to constructive opposition. You even started scaremongering on the position of teachers in our pilot schemes and early start schools across Wales. I know that they will welcome the news of the £5 million specifically identified to support those pilot schemes and early start schools for this financial year. We have done the calculations. I do not know where your pocket calculator is, Kirsty, but it is clearly not a pocket calculator that has been found in every local authority in Wales that has not given us the information that we needed to plan in partnership, which is how we do it in Wales. Your scaremongering and cheap opposition do not shed more light, but I will

'Cymru'n Un', dywedech y byddai hynny'n cael ei gyflawni erbyn diwedd eleni. A allwch gadarnhau mai felly y mae o hyd? Os na, sut y byddwch yn sicrhau y bydd cyfle cyfartal i'r holl blant yng Nghymru gan ei bod yn ymddangos eich bod yn eithaf bodlon i rai awdurdodau ddefnyddio'r gymhareb 1:8 tra bydd awdurdodau eraill yn peidio â gwneud?

A allwch droi hefyd at y cwestiwn a fydd unrhyw gyllid ychwanegol ar gyfer anghenion cyfalaf yn y cyfnod sylfaen? Mae'r holl bryderon a fynegwyd gan undebau athrawon wedi ymwneud ag adnoddau i gyrraedd y gymhareb staffio. Mae'r arian hwn ymhell o fod yn ddigon i fodloni'r anghenion o ran cyfalaf a hyfforddiant; talu am gyflogi'r staff yn unig y mae.

Yn olaf, pam yr ydych wedi gadael hyn mor hwyr? Yr ydych yn disgwyl i gynghorau fod wedi anfon eu cynlluniau i mewn erbyn diwedd y mis, ac eto yr ydych wedi cymryd misoedd lawer i agor eich llygaid i'r sefyllfa drychinebus a oedd mor amlwg. A ydych yn credu ei bod yn dderbyniol mynnu i awdurdodau lleol wneud pethau a chithau a'ch swyddogion wedi cydnabod bod y rhaglen hon mewn trafferthion mor ddiweddar â dau fis yn ôl? Yr ydych yn awr yn disgwyl i athrawon, arweinwyr ysgolion a chyrrff llywodraethu fynd â'r maen i'r wal am na roesoch hwy mewn sefyllfa i ddatrys hyn yn gynharach.

**Jane Hutt:** Gwrthwynebiad diwerth oedd hynny, yn hytrach na gwrthwynebiad adeiladol. Yr oeddech hyd yn oed yn dechrau codi bwganod ynghylch sefyllfa athrawon yn ein cynlluniau peilot a'n hysgolion dechrau'n gynnar ledled Cymru. Gwn y byddant yn croesawu'r newydd am y £5 miliwn sydd wedi'i neilltuo i gynnal y cynlluniau peilot hynny a'r ysgolion dechrau'n gynnar am y flwyddyn ariannol hon. Yr ydym wedi gwneud y cyfrifiadau. Ni wn ymhle y mae'ch cyfrifiannell boced chi, Kirsty, ond mae'n amlwg nad yw'n gyfrifiannell boced a gafwyd ym mhob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru nad yw wedi rhoi inni'r wybodaeth yr oedd arnom ei hangen i gynllunio mewn partneriaeth, sef y

seek to answer the questions that you put.

modd yr ydym yn gwneud hyn yng Nghymru. Nid yw'ch codi bwganod a'ch gwrthwynebiad diwerth yn taflu mwy o oleuni, ond ceisiaf ateb y cwestiynau a ofynasoch.

My first priority was to argue for additional funding for the foundation phase from the Finance Minister during the budget planning round. As Janet said, it was a very difficult budget planning round in respect of the comprehensive spending review, and we got that additional funding. This has nothing to do with the strategic capital investment board, as you well know, Kirsty. That is an another agenda and issue entirely.

Y flaenoriaeth gyntaf gennyf oedd dadlau dros gael cyllid ychwanegol ar gyfer y cyfnod sylfaen gan y Gweinidog Cyllid yn ystod y cylch cynllunio cyllideb. Fel y dywedodd Janet, yr oedd yn gylch cynllunio cyllideb anodd iawn yng nghyd-destun yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant, a chawsom y cyllid ychwanegol hwnnw. Nid oes a wnelo hyn ddim â'r bwrdd buddsoddi cyfalaf strategol, fel y gwyddoch yn iawn, Kirsty. Mae hwnnw'n agenda ac yn fater cwbl wahanol.

I can maturely sit around the table with people who are at the sharp end representing headteachers and teachers across Wales and discuss the importance of our commitment to getting the 1:8 adult to pupil ratio in a responsible and sustainable roll-out of the foundation phase. However, I go back to the One Wales Government's delivery plan and to the point that the First Minister responded to weeks ago when we made it quite clear that this was:

Gallaf eistedd fel rhywun aeddfed o gylch y bwrdd gyda phobl sydd yn y llinell flaen yn cynrychioli penaethiaid ysgolion ac athrawon ledled Cymru a thrafod pwysigrwydd ein hymrwymiad i sicrhau'r gymhareb o 1:8 oedolyn i ddisgybl wrth gyflwyno'r cyfnod sylfaen mewn modd cyfrifol a chynaliadwy. Fodd bynnag, af yn ôl at gynllun darparu Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un ac at y pwynt yr ymatebodd y Prif Weinidog iddo wythnosau'n ôl pan roddodd ar ddeall yn eithaf clir fod hyn:

'To be achieved through the roll out of Foundation Phase, which is planned from September 2008 for 3 - 5 year olds'.

i'w gyflawni drwy roi'r Cyfnod Sylfaen ar waith, fel y bwriedir ei wneud o Fedi 2008 ar gyfer plant 3 i 5 oed.

That is what the delivery plan states and that is what we are delivering on.

Dyna y mae'r cynllun cyflenwi yn ei ddatgan a hynny yr ydym yn ei gyflawni.

You made an important point about training. We have already invested £3 million to train and prepare staff for the introduction of the foundation phase, and initial plans show that local education authorities will be allocating almost £3 million to training as part of the allocation for 2008-09. I also remind you of the other preparation that is taking place in terms of the additional 677 places in the early-years care and education category for 2007-08. Our work-based learning providers do not want to hear this negative opposition or rant today from the Welsh Conservatives or the Liberal Democrats; they want to know that the planning that we have done with our further education institutions, to ensure that

Gwnaethoch bwynt pwysig am hyfforddiant. Yr ydym eisoes wedi buddsoddi £3 miliwn i hyfforddi a pharatoi staff ar gyfer cyflwyno'r cyfnod sylfaen, ac mae'r cynlluniau cyntaf yn dangos y bydd awdurdodau addysg lleol yn dyrannu bron £3 miliwn at hyfforddi fel rhan o'r dyraniad ar gyfer 2008-09. Yr wyf hefyd yn eich atgoffa o'r gwaith paratoi arall sy'n digwydd o ran y 677 o leoedd ychwanegol yng nghategori gofal ac addysg y blynyddoedd cynnar ar gyfer 2007-08. Nid yw ein darparwyr dysgu'n seiliedig ar waith am glywed y gwrthwynebiad negyddol neu'r brygowthan hwn heddiw gan y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig neu'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol; maent am wybod y bydd y cynllunio a

they have the capacity to deliver additional learning through their grant from a funded route, which we are providing, will deliver a whole new early-years workforce to support training and young people.

Therefore, Kirsty, can we not move on to a more constructive and optimistic recognition and scrutiny of what we will take forward in terms of the £5 million that is in addition to the £25 million for rolling out the foundation phase, in accordance with our One Wales delivery plan?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** I am pleased to read your statement because many primary schools in my constituency have been in touch with me expressing their concerns. I have sought to placate them by pointing out that a further statement was to be made and that you were meeting with local education authorities and other key players. As you have said, you chaired the foundation phase implementation task and finish group yesterday, which had a positive response. Therefore, I trust that the extra resources that you have identified and mentioned in your statement will prove to be adequate and I hope that they will be properly used. That must be part of the continuing work.

I also refer to one of those key players, namely the teaching unions, and to the embargoed statement that we had yesterday from NUT Cymru, headed, 'NUT Welcome Sensible Decision'.

There is a clear message in that embargoed press release from a key player that we are heading in the right direction. No-one is suggesting that everything is rosy and everything is fine. That is never the case with important new initiatives in education, and close monitoring will be essential.

I endorse the points that you made about Estyn ensuring that staff training and continuing professional development be part of this process, and I welcome the fact that you will return to us, in the fullness of time, to satisfy us that a consistent approach is being taken across LEAs in Wales in this

wnaethom gyda'n sefydliadau addysg bellach, i sicrhau eu bod yn gallu darparu dysgu ychwanegol drwy eu grant o lwybr wedi'i ariannu sy'n cael ei ddarparu gennym, yn creu gweithlu cwbl newydd ar gyfer y blynyddoedd cynnar i gynnal hyfforddiant a phobl ifanc.

Felly, Kirsty, oni allwn symud ymlaen at gydnabyddiaeth fwy adeiladol a gobeithiol ac at graffu ar yr hyn y byddwn yn ei gyflawni yng nghyd-destun y £5 miliwn sy'n ychwanegol at y £25 miliwn i roi'r cyfnod sylfaen ar waith, yn unol â chynllun cyflenwi Cymru'n Un?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Yr wyf yn falch darllen eich datganiad, oherwydd mae nifer o ysgolion cynradd yn fy etholaeth i wedi cysylltu â mi gan fynegi eu pryderon. Yr wyf wedi ceisio eu tawelu drwy nodi bod datganiad pellach i gael ei wneud a'ch bod yn cwrdd ag awdurdodau addysg lleol a phartion allweddol eraill. Fel yr ydych wedi'i ddweud, yr oeddech yn cadeirio grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen gweithredu'r cyfnod sylfaen ddoe, a chafodd ymateb cadarnhaol. Felly, hyderaf y bydd yr adnoddau ychwanegol yr ydych wedi'u pennu a'u crybwyll yn eich datganiad yn ddigonol ac yr wyf yn gobeithio y cânt eu defnyddio'n briodol. Rhaid i hynny fod yn rhan o'r gwaith sy'n mynd ymlaen.

Cyfeiriaf hefyd at un o'r partion allweddol hynny, sef yr undebau addysgu, ac at y datganiad dan embargo a gawsom ddoe gan NUT Cymru, dan y pennawd, 'Yr NUT yn croesawu penderfyniad doeth'.

Mae neges glir yn y datganiad hwnnw i'r wasg, sydd dan embargo, gan chwaraewr allweddol ein bod yn mynd i'r cyfeiriad iawn. Nid oes neb yn awgrymu bod popeth yn obeithiol a phopeth yn iawn. Nid yw hynny byth yn wir gyda chynlluniau newydd pwysig ym maes addysg, a bydd monitro agos yn hanfodol.

Cefnogaf y pwyntiau a wnaethoch fod Estyn yn sicrhau bod hyfforddiant staff a datblygiad proffesiynol parhaus yn rhan o'r broses hon, ac yr wyf yn croesawu'r ffaith y byddwch yn dod yn ôl atom, maes o law, i'n sicrhau bod dull cyson o weithredu yn cael ei roi ar waith ar draws yr AALlau yng Nghymru yn y

regard.

I share your concerns about the slowness of some LEAs in coming forward with the necessary figures for the calculations to be made. I endorse the remarks made earlier by Janet Ryder that, if there is not clear improvement, you should name those authorities so that we know where the blame, or at least part of it, lies.

Could you also advise us of whether there will be clear monitoring of good practice as it develops from one LEA to another, and that that is disseminated across Wales in a structured way, so that all LEAs can learn from the good work—and, indeed, the problems—of other LEAs? That will ensure that those resources, limited though they may be, can always be targeted to best effect.

**Jane Hutt:** That final point is important. The pilot schools and the early starts, in the maintained and the non-maintained sector, have been the champions across Wales for the past four years. In every local authority area, they have held open days and invited headteachers and staff to come in to see the positive benefits of the foundation phase. This is where the excitement of the foundation phase comes through so strongly, and I urge every Member to visit a pilot school or early start in this summer term to see the difference that it is making to children's lives. A teaching expert said to me yesterday that this is about developing Welsh children as thinkers; it is about developing their skills from the early years, and building on the £45 million-worth of investment in Flying Start for the age group from birth to three.

This is an exciting time for education in Wales, and this will make a difference. It will have an impact on skills and development through to further and higher education, improving job opportunities and enhancing people's role in the economy and in their communities. Let us focus on that. Jeff, I can assure you that the Estyn approach is wholly appropriate. It is about ensuring that it judges schools on the basis of teaching and learning, on the outcomes in connection with the resources available. We have already

cyswllt hwn.

Fel chithau, yr wyf yn pryderu am arafwch rhai AALlau cyn cyflwyno'r ffigurau angenrheidiol er mwyn gwneud y cyfrifiadau. Cefnogaf y sylwadau a wnaethpwyd yn gynharach gan Janet Ryder y dylech enwi'r awdurdodau hynny, os na fydd gwelliant clir, er mwyn i ni wybod ymhle mae'r bai, neu o leiaf ran ohono.

A allech hefyd ddweud wrthym a fydd monitro clir ar arferion da wrth iddynt ddatblygu o un AALl i'r llall, a bod hynny'n cael ei ledaenu ar draws Cymru mewn ffordd strwythuredig, er mwyn i bob AALl allu dysgu o waith da—ac, yn wir, o broblemau—AALlau eraill? Bydd hynny'n sicrhau bod modd targedu'r adnoddau hynny, er yn gyfyngedig, efallai, i'r diben gorau bob amser.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae'r pwynt olaf hwnnw'n bwysig. Yr ysgolion peilot a'r dechreuwyd cynnar, yn y sector a gynhelir a'r sector na chynhelir, fu'r hyrwyddwyr ar draws Cymru am y pedair blynedd diwethaf. Ym mhob ardal awdurdod lleol, maent wedi cynnal diwrnodau agored ac wedi gwahodd penaethiaid a staff i ddod yno i weld manteision positif y cyfnod sylfaen. Yno mae cyffro'r cyfnod sylfaen i'w deimlo mor gryf, ac anogaf bob Aelod i ymweld ag ysgol beilot neu ysgol cychwyn cynnar yn nhymor yr haf i weld y gwahaniaeth y mae'n ei wneud i fywydau plant. Dywedodd arbenigwr addysgu wrthyf ddoe mai datblygu plant Cymru fel meddylwyr yw hanfod hyn; yr hanfod yw datblygu eu sgiliau o'r blynyddoedd cynnar, ac adeiladu ar y buddsoddiad o £45 miliwn yn Dechrau'n Deg i'r grŵp oedran o ddim i dair oed.

Mae hon yn adeg gyffrous i addysg yng Nghymru, a bydd hyn yn gwneud gwahaniaeth. Bydd yn cael effaith ar sgiliau a datblygiad hyd at addysg bellach ac uwch, gan wella cyfleoedd swyddi a chynyddu rôl pobl yn yr economi ac yn eu cymunedau. Gadewch inni ganolbwyntio ar hynny. Jeff, gallaf eich sicrhau bod dull gweithredu Estyn yn gwbl briodol. Mae'n golygu sicrhau ei fod yn barnu ysgolion ar sail yr addysgu a'r dysgu, ar y canlyniadau yng nghyswllt yr adnoddau sydd ar gael. Yr ydym eisoes wedi

evaluated the pilot, and proved that the 1:8 ratio of adult to pupil and the full roll-out of the foundation phase will be effective.

**Nick Ramsay:** I thank the Minister for her statement. President Harry S. Truman was famous for having a plaque on his desk that read, 'The buck stops here', and, having read and listened to the Minister's statement, I think that we should club together and get the Minister a plaque for her own desk saying, 'The buck stops somewhere else'.

I suppose that it was naive of us not to realise that local authorities would once again get the blame for the debacle of this scheme. They received an incredibly lousy settlement, they were not consulted properly, and now we are being told quite candidly by the Minister that she believes that the problems with this scheme were the fault of local authorities for not getting back to her sooner with the figures. If there are to be any further u-turns regarding promises of further funding, could the Minister let local authorities know what is expected of them well in advance, so that they have time to plan and prepare, which they were not able to do this time?

Regarding the Minister's comments on the foundation phase, as she said, she has total support here. Part of her speech dealt with the benefits of encouraging children to think in a different way, which we hope will help them in future years. We all agree with that, and it is a noble aim. However, ideas without funding are problematic. You can have all the ideas and good intentions in the world, as many people have had in the past, but without the necessary framework and money in place, local authorities and LEAs will not be able to deliver.

2.20 p.m.

I think that Jeff Cuthbert's comments regarding the need for local education authorities to share good practice were very good, and I notice that they were taken on board. However, that is a separate issue from

gwerthuso'r peilot, ac wedi profi y bydd y gymhareb oedolion i ddisgyblion o 1:8 a'r gwaith o gyflwyno'r cyfnod sylfaen drwyddi draw yn effeithiol.

**Nick Ramsay:** Diolch i'r Gweinidog am ei datganiad. Yr oedd yr Arlywydd Harry S. Truman yn enwog am gael plac ar ei ddesg a oedd yn dweud, 'The buck stops here', ac ar ôl darllen a gwranddo ar ddatganiad y Gweinidog credaf y dylem gasglu arian ymysg ein gilydd a chael plac i'r Gweinidog ar gyfer ei desg hi sy'n dweud, 'The buck stops somewhere else'.

Mae'n siwr ein bod yn naif nad oeddem wedi sylweddoli mai'r awdurdodau lleol fyddai unwaith eto yn cael y bai am y llanestr gyda'r cynllun hwn. Cawsant setliad rhyfeddol o wael, a bellach mae'r Gweinidog yn dweud wrthym yn blwmp ac yn blaen ei bod yn credu mai'r awdurdodau lleol oedd ar fai am y problemau gyda'r cynllun hwn am na ddaethant yn ôl ati'n gynharach gyda'r ffigurau. Os oes troeon pedol pellach i'w disgwyl o ran addewidion am ragor o gyllid, a allai'r Gweinidog roi gwybod i'r awdurdodau lleol beth a ddisgwylir ganddynt mewn da bryd, er mwyn iddynt gael amser i gynllunio a pharatoi, rhywbeth nad oedd modd iddynt ei wneud y tro hwn?

O ran sylwadau'r Gweinidog am y cynllun sylfaen, fel y dywedodd, mae ganddi gefnogaeth lawn yma. Ymdriniai rhan o'i haraith â manteision annog plant i feddwl mewn ffordd wahanol, a gobeithio yn bydd hynny'n help iddynt yn y blynyddoedd i ddod. Yr ydym i gyd yn cytuno â hynny, ac mae'n nod ardderchog. Fodd bynnag, mae syniadau heb gyllid yn creu problemau. Gallwch gael pob syniad a bwriad da yn y byd, fel y gwnaeth llawer o bobl yn y gorffennol, ond heb y fframwaith angenrheidiol a'r cyllid yn ei le ni fydd yr awdurdodau lleol a'r AALau yn gallu cyflawni.

Credaf fod sylwadau Jeff Cuthbert am yr angen i awdurdodau addysg lleol rannu arferion da yn dda iawn, a sylwaf iddynt gael eu nodi. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny'n fater ar wahân i'r cyfnod sylfaen; serch hynny, yr

the foundation phase; nonetheless, it was a point that should be encouraged.

On the £5 million, I do not want to get into an argument over whether it was additional funding or not, but the fact is that it was not provided when it should have been provided, and it has left local authorities and schools in an almighty mess. One wonders whether this will end up as the Minister's own 10p tax moment; a pretty similar decision taken—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This is not a general debate on the economy or on fiscal powers; it is a statement by the Minister, and I wish to hear a few questions.

**Nick Ramsay:** I have a few simple questions for the Minister. When will we see further returns, Minister, leading to more money being made available? Can local authorities be warned of that in advance? Linked to that, are you confident that the £5 million will be sufficient? You seemed to be confident that the last sum of money promised was sufficient, but that is clearly not the case now.

**Jane Hutt:** Nick, I will not give air time to your feeble contribution, given the recognition that you went on to give to the importance of the foundation phase. I have announced an extra £5 million on top of the £24 million—[*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. If the opposition parties wish to scrutinise in the form of giving it to the Minister, they will have to take it from the Minister as well.

**Jane Hutt:** Thank you very much, Llywydd. The £5 million has been costed on the basis of the pilot schemes and the early start schools, but you are trying to undermine that. Local authorities are acting on that information to ensure that teachers, pilot schemes and early start schools are safeguarded by the extra money that I am making available. You do not know about or understand, Nick, the partnership working that has gone on over the past four years, with the pilots and the early starts. We have invested in an evaluation of the pilots, which has come out in clear support of the direction

oedd yn bwynt a ddylai gael ei annog.

O ran y £5 miliwn, nid wyf am ddechrau dadlau a oedd hwn yn arian ychwanegol ai peidio, ond y ffaith yw na chafodd ei ddarparu pan ddylai fod wedi ei ddarparu, ac mae wedi gadael awdurdodau lleol ac ysgolion mewn anhrefn llwyr. Mae rhywun yn dyfalu ai hon fydd moment treth 10c y Gweinidog hwn; penderfyniad digon tebyg a wnaethpwyd—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid dadl gyffredinol am yr economi nac am bwerau ariannol yw hon; datganiad ydyw gan y Gweinidog, ac yr wyf am glywed cwestiynau.

**Nick Ramsay:** Mae gennyf rai cwestiynau syml i'r Gweinidog. Pryd y gwelwn ni droeon pedol pellach, Weinidog, yn arwain at ddarparu rhagor o arian? A ellir rhybuddio'r awdurdodau lleol am hynny ymlaen llaw? Yn gysylltiedig â hynny, a ydych yn hyderus y bydd y £5 miliwn yn ddigonol? Yr oeddech yn ymddangos yn hyderus fod y swm diwethaf o arian a addawyd yn ddigonol, ond nid yw hynny'n wir erbyn hyn yn amlwg.

**Jane Hutt:** Nick, nid wyf am wastraffu amser ar eich cyfraniad pitw, o gofio'r gydnabyddiaeth a roesoch chi i bwysigrwydd y cyfnod sylfaen. Yr wyf wedi cyhoeddi £5 miliwn ychwanegol ar ben y £24 miliwn—[*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Os yw'r gwrthbleidiau am graffu drwy ei rhoi hi i'r Gweinidog, bydd yn rhaid iddynt ei chymryd hi gan y Gweinidog hefyd.

**Jane Hutt:** Diolch yn fawr iawn, Lywydd. Mae'r £5 miliwn wedi ei gostio ar sail y cynlluniau peilot a'r ysgolion dechrau'n gynnar, ond yr ydych yn ceisio tansilio hynny. Mae'r awdurdodau lleol yn gweithredu ar y wybodaeth honno i sicrhau bod athrawon, cynlluniau peilot ac ysgolion dechrau'n gynnar yn cael eu diogelu gan yr arian ychwanegol yr wyf yn ei ddarparu. Nick, nid ydych yn deall nac yn gwybod am y gwaith partneriaeth sydd wedi mynd ymlaen dros y pedair blynedd diwethaf, gyda'r cynlluniau peilot a'r ysgolion dechrau'n gynnar. Yr ydym wedi buddsoddi

that we are taking in reforming the early years.

This is about ensuring that the auditing and provision of data will be undertaken from now on. I have already mentioned in my statement that we will review the pupil-level annual school census, because if it is not giving us or local authorities appropriate information, we have to review it as a vehicle. I have made that announcement; that is what we will do. This is major reform, and its roll-out was never going to be without its teething troubles. I repeat that I am working alongside and in partnership with local government, but it also has a role to play in giving us the data and in recognising that we must audit the funding that goes from the Welsh Assembly Government to it, to support the money at the sharp end for the foundation phase.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Thank you for your statement, Minister. I represent the South Wales Central region, and you, Minister, are one of the constituency Members for the Vale of Glamorgan—

**The First Minister:** She is the only one.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** I hear the First Minister offer us yet another of his many contributions as an aside to this statement, but if he could listen to a few remarks from these benches, he might find a bit more solace—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. You may be my neighbour, but you are not the Presiding Officer. I will deal with this matter in an orderly way.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Please accept my apologies, Presiding Officer.

Given that I am also a school governor of Llanfair Primary School, I feel that I am at the cutting edge of the foundation phase. I support the initiative, and we in the primary school sector have looked forward to it, but the underfunding and the lack of direction are now becoming apparent. Through your

mewn gwerthuso'r cynlluniau peilot, sydd wedi rhoi cefnogaeth glir i'r cyfeiriad yr ydym yn mynd iddo wrth ddiwygio'r blynyddoedd cynnar.

Mae a wnelo hyn â sicrhau y bydd yr archwilio a'r darparu data yn cael ei wneud o hyn ymlaen. Yr wyf eisoes wedi crybwyll yn fy natganiad y byddwn yn adolygu'r cyfrifiad ysgolion blynyddol ar lefel disgyblion, oherwydd os nad yw'n rhoi gwybodaeth briodol i ni neu i'r awdurdodau lleol, rhaid inni ei adolygu fel cyfrwng. Yr wyf wedi gwneud y cyhoeddiad hwnnw; dyna fyddwn yn ei wneud. Mae hwn yn ddiwygiad mawr, ac ni fyddai'n bosibl ei gyflwyno heb drafferthion cychwynnol. Ailadroddaf fy mod yn gweithio ochr yn ochr ac mewn partneriaeth â llywodraeth leol, ond mae ganddi hithau rôl o ran rhoi'r data inni a chydabod ei bod yn rhaid inni archwilio'r cyllid a gaiff oddi wrth Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, i gefnogi'r arian yn y tu blaen ar gyfer y cyfnod sylfaen.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Diolch ichi am eich datganiad, Weinidog. Yr wyf yn cynrychioli rhanbarth Canol De Cymru, ac yr ydych chi, Weinidog, yn un o'r Aelodau etholaeth dros Fro Morgannwg—

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Hi yw'r unig un.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Clywaf y Prif Weinidog yn cynnig un arall eto fyth o'i gyfraniadau niferus wrth fynd heibio at y datganiad hwn, ond pe gallai wrando ar rai sylwadau o'r meinciau hyn, efallai y câi ychydig mwy o gysur—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Efallai eich bod yn gymydog imi, ond nid chi yw'r Llywydd. Deliaf â'r mater hwn mewn ffordd drefnus.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Derbyniwch fy ymddiheuriadau, Lywydd.

O gofio fy mod hefyd yn llywodraethwr ar Ysgol Gynradd Llanfair, teimlaf fy mod ar flaen y gad o ran y cyfnod sylfaen. Yr wyf yn cefnogi'r cynllun, ac yr ydym ni yn y sector ysgolion cynradd wedi edrych ymlaen ato, ond mae'r tangyllido a'r diffyg cyfeiriad yn dod yn amlwg erbyn hyn. Drwy eich



statement, you seem to be passing some, if not a great deal, of that responsibility to local government.

Of the five authorities that replied to the initial audit, how many authorities in the South Wales Central area—and there are only three—met the audit target for you to move it forward? If there is no satisfactory answer and not one of those authorities came through with the information, why is it the headteachers and not the political people, who are making those remarks? It is not people who are just trying to make trouble who mention this, but the headteachers and the parents at the sharp end.

They are saying that the money is not there to deliver the foundation phase in its entirety. When I attend the next governors' meeting at Llanfair school, what shall I tell them will make up that shortfall? That school is not one of the pilot schools, Minister. I am sure that the governors will be keen to know that the Minister for education, who is charged with delivering the foundation phase, has to tell parents why teachers are not in the classrooms delivering the foundation phase, which was to be delivered this year.

**Jane Hutt:** I am proud to be the only Assembly Member representing the constituency of the Vale of Glamorgan. I have close contact with my schools and headteachers, and I was pleased to visit the pilot school of Holton Primary School in Barry recently. As you can imagine, I have had contact with many headteachers over the past few weeks. I am their elected representative as well as the Minister for education.

You are out of date, Andrew, and that is the problem with the opposition. You do not bother to find out from headteachers at the sharp end how they recognise that the changes that we are introducing, and the extra money that I am announcing today will make a difference. The pilot schools in my constituency and, I am sure, in the rest of South Wales Central will be delighted by today's news, because we know that it safeguards jobs and it enables them to play

datganiad, yr ydych fel petaech yn trosglwyddo rhywfaint o'r cyfrifoldeb hwnnw, os nad llawer iawn, i lywodraeth leol.

O'r pum awdurdod a ymatebodd i'r archwiliad cychwynnol, sawl awdurdod yn ardal Canol De Cymru—ac nid oes ond tri—a gyrhaeddodd y targed archwilio er mwyn ichi ei symud ymlaen? Os nad oes ateb boddhaol ac os na chyflwynodd yr un o'r awdurdodau hynny yr wybodaeth, pam mai'r penaethiaid ac nid y bobl wleidyddol sy'n gwneud y sylwadau hynny? Nid pobl sy'n syml yn ceisio creu trwbl sy'n crybwyll hyn, ond y penaethiaid a'r rhieni ar y talcen glo.

Maent yn dweud nad yw'r arian yno i roi'r cyfnod sylfaen ar waith yn ei gyfanrwydd. Pan af i gyfarfod nesaf y llywodraethwyr yn ysgol Llanfair, beth ddylwn i ei ddweud wrthynt fydd yn gwneud iawn am y diffyg hwnnw? Nid yw'r ysgol honno'n un o'r ysgolion peilot, Weinidog. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y llywodraethwyr yn awyddus i wybod bod y Gweinidog dros addysg, sy'n gyfrifol am roi'r cyfnod sylfaen ar waith, yn gorfod dweud wrth rieni pam nad yw athrawon yn yr ystafelloedd dosbarth i ddarparu'r cyfnod sylfaen, a oedd i gael ei ddarparu eleni.

**Jane Hutt:** Yr wyf yn falch mai fi yw'r unig Aelod Cynulliad sy'n cynrychioli etholaeth Bro Morgannwg. Mae gennyf gysylltiad agos â'm hysgolion a'm penaethiaid, ac yr oeddwn yn falch ymweld ag ysgol gynradd beilot Holton yn y Barri yn ddiweddar. Fel y gallwch ddychmygu, yr wyf wedi cysylltu â llawer o benaethiaid dros yr ychydig wythnosau diwethaf. Fi yw eu cynrychiolydd etholedig yn ogystal â'r Gweinidog dros addysg.

Yr ydych ar ei hôl hi, Andrew, a dyna'r broblem gyda'r gwrthbleidiau. Nid ydych yn trafferthu darganfod gan benaethiaid yn y llinell flaen sut y maent yn cydnabod y bydd y newidiadau yr ydym yn eu cyflwyno, a'r arian ychwanegol yr wyf yn ei gyhoeddi heddiw, yn gwneud gwahaniaeth. Bydd yr ysgolion peilot yn fy etholaeth i, ac yng ngweddill Canol De Cymru, mae'n sicr gennyf, wrth eu bodd o glywed y newyddion heddiw, oherwydd gwyddom fod hyn yn

their role as champions of the foundation phase, as we roll it out to the rest of the schools in the Vale of Glamorgan.

You are jumping the gun, Andrew, because neither the governing body of your school, of which you are a member, nor that of schools across Wales yet knows what impact the £5 million that I have announced will have. There will be a new allocation as a result of this announcement. I challenge you to say what it will be, Andrew. We have to be sure that, when we get the estimated figures from local authorities, they are sound. The data must be sound for us to pay the ring-fenced grants. You would accept, as would everyone else, that the data have to be sound; otherwise, I would be abrogating my governance responsibilities and my financial accountability.

As of today, the £5 million has been announced, and local authorities will now hear what their allocation will be, but they have to produce robust plans and data. I am working in partnership with them, as I do with the Association of Directors of Education in Wales and the teachers unions. We are meeting again early next month to assess progress and to move forward.

**William Graham:** You will be aware of the comment yesterday made by David Evans, secretary of NUT Cymru:

‘Everyone connected with education in Wales has been concerned about the lack of clarity regarding the Foundation Phase implementation.’

We welcome your statement, and you will recall that at the previous education committee, this particular project was welcomed by all parties and practitioners in education. The concern remains about financing. What assurances can you give—or rather, what pertinent comments can you give? Can you give true assurance to practitioners that sufficient money will be available? People are waiting, literally, today, on what you say and for the money that you make available as soon as possible.

diogelu swyddi ac yn eu galluogi i chwarae eu rôl fel hyrwyddwyr y cyfnod sylfaen, wrth inni ei gyflwyno yng ngweddill yr ysgolion ym Mro Morgannwg.

Yr ydych yn rhoi'r drol o flaen y ceffyl, Andrew, oherwydd nid yw corff llywodraethu eich ysgol chi, yr ydych yn aelod ohono, na chyrrff llywodraethu ysgolion ar draws Cymru yn gwybod eto pa effaith a gaiff y £5 miliwn yr wyf wedi'i gyhoeddi. Bydd dyraniad newydd o ganlyniad i'r cyhoeddiad hwn. Fe'ch heriaf i ddweud beth fydd hwnnw, Andrew. Rhaid inni fod yn siŵr, pan gawn y ffigurau amcangyfrifedig gan yr awdurdodau lleol, eu bod yn gadarn. Rhaid i'r data fod yn gadarn er mwyn inni dalu'r grantiau sydd wedi'u neilltuo. Byddech yn derbyn, fel pawb arall, ei bod yn rhaid i'r data fod yn gadarn, neu byddwn yn cefnu ar fy nghyfrifoldebau llywodraethu a'm hatebolrwydd ariannol.

O heddiw ymlaen, mae'r £5 miliwn wedi ei gyhoeddi, a bydd awdurdodau lleol yn clywed yn awr beth fydd eu dyraniad, ond rhaid iddynt gynhyrchu cynlluniau a data cryf. Yr wyf yn gweithio mewn partneriaeth gyda hwy, fel yr wyf gyda Chymdeithas Cyfarwyddwyr Addysg Cymru a'r undebau athrawon. Byddwn yn cwrrd eto yn gynnar fis nesaf i asesu'r cynnydd ac i symud ymlaen.

**William Graham:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r sylw a wnaethpwyd ddoe gan David Evans, ysgrifennydd NUT Cymru:

Mae pawb sy'n gysylltiedig ag addysg yng Nghymru wedi bod yn poeni am y diffyg eglurder ynglŷn â gweithredu'r Cyfnod Sylfaen.

Yr ydym yn croesawu'ch datganiad, a chi gofiwch i'r prosiect neilltuol hwn, yn y pwyllgor addysg blaenorol, gael ei groesawu gan bob plaid ac ymarferydd ym myd addysg. Mae'r pryder ynglŷn â chyllid yn aros. Pa sicrwydd allwch chi ei roi—neu yn hytrach, pa sylwadau bachog y gallwch eu gwneud? A allwch roi sicrwydd gwirioneddol i ymarferwyr y bydd arian digonol ar gael? Mae pobl yn disgwyl, yn llythrennol, heddiw am yr hyn sydd gennych i'w ddweud ac am yr arian y byddwch yn ei ddarparu cyn

gynted â phosibl.

**Jane Hutt:** Thank you for the quiet voice of authority from the Welsh Conservatives, William. I did read a press release, but it was the one that Jeff Cuthbert referred to, which reads 'NUT Welcome Sensible Decision'. That is the news that is important today in light of the £5 million that I have announced. I have been specific today—I have not just said that £5 million will go in the pot, have I? I have said that it is £5 million to fund directly the pilot schools and the early starts, both in non-maintained and maintained schools. We know the costs, because we have been funding them for four years. I am making that clear with my announcement today.

**Jane Hutt:** Diolch ichi am lais tawel awdurdodol gan Geidwadwyr Cymru, William. Yr wyf wedi darllen datganiad i'r wasg, ond yr un y cyfeiriodd Jeff Cuthbert ato oedd hwnnw, sy'n dweud 'Yr NUT yn Croesawu Penderfyniad Synhwyrol'. Dyna'r newyddion pwysig heddiw yng ngoleuni'r £5 miliwn yr wyf wedi'i gyhoeddi. Yr wyf wedi bod yn benodol heddiw—nid dweud yn unig y bydd £5 miliwn yn mynd i'r pot a wneuthum, nage? Yr wyf wedi dweud ei fod yn £5 miliwn i gyllido'r ysgolion peilot a'r cynlluniau dechrau'n gynnar, mewn ysgolion na chynhelir a rhai a gynhelir, yn uniongyrchol. Gwyddom am y costau, oherwydd buom yn eu cyllido ers pedair blynedd. Yr wyf yn gwneud hynny'n glir gyda'm cyhoeddiad heddiw.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Whatever assurances you have tried to give us this afternoon—

**Jonathan Morgan:** Pa sicrwydd bynnag yr ydych wedi ceisio'i roi inni y prynhawn yma—

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** She will not answer you.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Ni fydd hi'n eich ateb.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I did say 'tried to give'.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Dywedais 'wedi ceisio'i roi'.

2.30 p.m.

Many schools will still be none the wiser as to whether they will see additional funds allocated to them for September to fulfil the required 1:8 ratio of adult to child for reception classes. You have received a letter from the chair of the governing body of Eglwys Newydd Primary School in Whitchurch, in my constituency, saying that the school is extremely concerned that it will not be able to meet its obligations under the foundation phase. It says that the resources allocated will not enable governors to provide that statutory 1:8 adult to child ratio for reception classes. The letter goes on to say that the foundation phase cannot be properly implemented if these ratios are not provided, and that, as a consequence, the whole project would be undermined, risking its failure.

Ni fydd llawer o ysgolion ddim callach pa un a welant ddyrannu arian ychwanegol iddynt ar gyfer mis Medi er mwyn gwireddu'r gymhareb ofynnol o 1:8 oedolyn i bob plentyn mewn dosbarthiadau derbyn. Cawsoch lythyr gan gadeirydd corff llywodraethu Ysgol Gynradd yr Eglwys Newydd yn fy etholaeth i, i ddweud bod yr ysgol yn bryderus iawn na fydd yn gallu bodloni ei rhwymedigaethau dan y cyfnod sylfaen. Dywed na fydd yr adnoddau a ddyrennir yn galluogi llywodraethwyr i ddarparu'r gymhareb statudol honno o 1:8 oedolyn i bob disgybl ar gyfer dosbarthiadau derbyn. Aiff y llythyr yn ei flaen i ddweud na ellir rhoi'r cyfnod sylfaen ar waith yn iawn oni chaiff y cymarebau hyn eu darparu, ac o ganlyniad y byddai'r holl brosiect yn cael ei danseilio, gan ei roi yn y fantol.

Regardless of the additional money that you have allocated to the pilot schools, there is

Waeth faint o arian ychwanegol yr ydych wedi'i ddyrannu i'r ysgolion peilot, mae yna

still a very real concern among other schools that they will still not have the necessary resources in their budgets from September to implement your foundation phase. They may be proved wrong in the coming months, as the figures become clearer, but if the concerns are still there as we enter the summer recess, and over the summer period, will you agree to meet with primary school headteachers from Cardiff North so that those concerns can be discussed?

**Jane Hutt:** I am grateful for that constructive contribution. I am fully committed to achieving the 1:8 ratio for three to five-year-olds as soon as possible; in fact, I refer you to a letter signed jointly by my officials and the Welsh Local Government Association, issued on 19 March, clearly stating that the foundation phase will be implemented over a four-year period. The expectation is that the relevant ratios will be achieved universally by the end of the four-year funding cycle. The 1:8 ratio only applies to nursery and reception classes, and, as I said, it is not statutory in terms of obligations on governors. I hope that this statement has been able to clarify points for governors; it is the curriculum that is statutory, not the 1:8 adult to pupil ratio. The assurances that I have been given from Estyn, and letters from the chief inspector, also endorse that point. I am working with teachers' union representatives, the Welsh Local Government Association and the Association of Directors of Education in Wales, to ensure that this information gets to schools and governing bodies. My oral statement today about the additional £5 million will also give that assurance.

bryder gwirioneddol o hyd ymysg ysgolion eraill na fydd ganddynt yr adnoddau angenrheidiol o hyd yn eu cyllidebau o fis Medi ymlaen i weithredu eich cyfnod sylfaen. Efallai y gwelant eu bod yn anghywir dros y misoedd nesaf, wrth i'r ffigurau ddod yn gliriach. Ond os bydd y pryderon yn parhau wrth inni gyrraedd toriad yr haf, a thros yr haf, a gytunwch i gwrdd â phenaethiaid ysgolion cynradd o Ogledd Caerdydd er mwyn trafod y pryderon hynny?

**Jane Hutt:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfraniad adeiladol hwnnw. Yr wyf wedi ymrwymo'n llwyr i gyflawni'r gymhareb 1:8 ar gyfer plant tair i bum mlwydd oed cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl; mewn gwirionedd, cyfeiriai chi at lythyr a lofnodwyd ar y cyd gan fy swyddogion a chan Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ac a gyhoeddwyd ar 19 Mawrth, yn datgan yn glir y bydd y cyfnod sylfaen yn cael ei roi ar waith dros gyfnod o bedair blynedd. Y disgwyliad yw y caiff y cymarebau perthnasol eu cyflawni'n gyffredinol erbyn diwedd y cylch cyllido o bedair blynedd. Mae'r gymhareb 1:8 yn berthnasol i ddsbarthiadau meithrin a derbyn yn unig, ac fel y dywedais, nid yw'n statudol o ran rhwymedigaethau llywodraethwyr. Gobeithio bod y datganiad hwn wedi gallu egluro rhai pwyntiau i lywodraethwyr; y cwricwlwm sy'n statudol, nid y gymhareb 1:8 rhwng oedolion a disgyblion. Mae'r sicrwydd a gefais gan Estyn, a llythyrau gan y prif arolygydd, hefyd yn ategu'r pwynt hwnnw. Yr wyf yn gweithio gyda chynrychiolwyr o'r undebau athrawon, Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru a Chymdeithas Cyfarwyddwyr Addysg Cymru i sicrhau bod y wybodaeth hon yn cyrraedd ysgolion a chyrff llywodraethu. Bydd fy natganiad llafar heddiw am y £5 miliwn ychwanegol hefyd yn rhoi'r sicrwydd hwnnw.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd (Rosemary Butler) i'r Gadair am 2.32 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer (Rosemary Butler) took the Chair at 2.32 p.m.*

**Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc ynghylch Gwasanaethau Eirioli ar  
gyfer Plant a Phobl Ifanc yng Nghymru  
The Children and Young People Committee's Report into Advocacy Services for  
Children and Young People in Wales**

**Helen Mary Jones:** I propose that

**Helen Mary Jones:** Cynigiad fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*notes the report of the Children and Young People Committee on advocacy services for children and young people in Wales laid in the Table Office on 5 March 2008. (NDM3930)*

It is a great pleasure and privilege to present to the Chamber today the first report of our Children and Young People's Committee. In doing so, I thank all of those who participated in this policy review, including Committee members who gave a great deal of extra time to undertake visits over and above their attendance at Committee meetings, Committee staff and all who gave evidence, particularly the children and young people who spoke to us. Their honesty and openness was much appreciated and assisted us greatly. I also thank the Minister and Deputy Minister, who have been generous with their time and in providing information to our Committee that arose out of previous consultations undertaken by the Government.

In commending this report in its entirety to the Assembly, there is no need for me to reiterate the importance of access to independent advocacy services for children and young people. These are matters that we have debated in the Chamber many times. I am grateful that the Government has accepted in whole, or in part, most of the recommendations of this report. In my initial contribution to this debate, I will concentrate on those recommendations that the Government is not fully accepting, specifically recommendation 1 and 2.

I will start with recommendation 2, which suggests that children and young people should be involved in deciding who provides advocacy services. I am glad that the Government has agreed to this in principle, but an 'in principle' acceptance is not good enough. The evidence that we have taken has shown that children and young people, especially vulnerable children and young people who have had extensive contact with the system, need to have faith that the providers of advocacy services are on their

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc ar wasanaethau eiriolaeth ar gyfer plant a phobl ifanc yng Nghymru a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 5 Mawrth 2008. (NDM3930)*

Mae'n bleser ac yn ffrainc cyflwyno adroddiad cyntaf ein Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc gerbron y Siambr heddiw. Wrth wneud hynny, yr wyf yn diolch i bawb a gymerodd ran yn yr adolygiad polisi hwn, gan gynnwys aelodau'r Pwyllgor a roddodd yn hael o'u hamser i gynnal ymweliadau a oedd yn ychwanegol at eu presenoldeb yng nghyfarfodydd y Pwyllgor, staff y Pwyllgor a phawb a roddodd dystiolaeth, yn enwedig y plant a'r bobl ifanc a siaradodd â ni. Yr oeddem yn gwerthfawrogi eu gonestrwydd a'u didwylledd yn fawr ac yr oedd yn help mawr inni. Yr wyf hefyd yn diolch i'r Gweinidog a'r Dirprwy Weinidog, a fu'n hael gyda'u hamser ac yn darparu gwybodaeth i'n Pwyllgor a oedd wedi deillio o ymgynghoriadau blaenorol a gynhaliwyd gan y Llywodraeth.

Wrth gymeradwyo'r adroddiad hwn yn ei gyfanrwydd i'r Cynulliad, nid oes angen imi ailadrodd pwysigrwydd mynediad at wasanaethau eirioli ar gyfer plant a phobl ifanc. Mae'r rhain yn faterion yr ydym wedi'u trafod yn y Siambr droeon. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar bod y Llywodraeth wedi derbyn yn llwyr, neu'n rhannol, y rhan fwyaf o argymhellion yr adroddiad hwn. Yn fy nghyfraniad cychwynnol at y ddadl hon, byddaf yn canolbwyntio ar yr argymhellion hynny nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn eu derbyn yn llawn, yn enwedig argymhelliad 1 a 2.

Dechreuaf gydag argymhelliad 2, sy'n awgrymu y dylai plant a phobl ifanc fod yn rhan o'r broses o benderfynu pwy sy'n darparu gwasanaethau eirioli. Yr wyf yn falch bod y Llywodraeth wedi cytuno ar hyn mewn egwyddor, ond nid yw ei dderbyn 'mewn egwyddor' yn ddigon da. Mae'r dystiolaeth a gawsom wedi dangos bod angen i blant a phobl ifanc, yn enwedig plant a phobl ifanc agored i niwed sydd wedi cael cyswllt helaeth â'r system, fod yn ffyddiog bod y darparwyr gwasanaethau eirioli ar eu

side. What better way to reassure them of that than to involve them in deciding who those providers are. Since the Government seems to be determined to stick to a regional or local commissioning model, of which I will say more shortly, I urge the Ministers today, through the national advocacy unit, to issue specific guidance to children and young people's partnerships, requiring them to involve children and young people in the letting of advocacy contracts and telling them how they should go about it. This might help to ameliorate the worst effects of the Government's decision not to accept the committee's first recommendation.

In expressing my profound disappointment, and that of the whole committee, that the Government has not accepted this, which is our core recommendation, I want to begin by saying that I do not question the personal commitment of either the Minister or the Deputy Minister to the promotion of children's rights and the protection of vulnerable children. Gwenda Thomas's track record speaks for itself and is second to none. I have known the Minister professionally and personally for over 20 years and I have seen her demonstrate that commitment time and again. I appreciate the steps that have been taken since the committee began to debate the Government's advocacy proposals to address some of the concerns that were being raised as the process went forward. The national independent advocacy board is certainly a step forward, as is the strengthening of the role of the national advocacy unit. The specific reference to advocacy in the National Assembly for Wales (Legislative Competence) (No.3) Order 2007 (Relating to Vulnerable Children) is also welcome, although we would have liked that reference to be strengthened and broadened. Whatever it says in its written response about partial acceptance, the Government has rejected our key recommendation that advocacy services should be commissioned nationally by the Welsh Assembly Government and provided locally by existing providers. It has rejected it, and was wrong to do so and, in doing so, it has failed to put in place the very best structures to protect vulnerable children.

hochr hwy. Pa well ffordd o'u sicrhau o hynny na'u cynnwys yn y broses o benderfynu pwy fydd y darparwyr hynny. Gan fod y Llywodraeth i bob golwg yn benderfynol o lynu wrth fodel comisiynu rhanbarthol neu leol, a dywedaf fwy am hynny maes o law, yr wyf yn annog y Gweinidogion heddiw, drwy'r uned eiriolaeth genedlaethol, i gyhoeddi cyfarwyddyd penodol i bartneriaethau plant a phobl ifanc, yn mynnu eu bod yn cynnwys plant a phobl ifanc wrth osod contractau eiriolaeth a dweud wrthynt sut y dylent fynd o'i chwmpas hi. Gallai hyn helpu i liniaru effeithiau gwaethaf penderfyniad y Llywodraeth i beidio â derbyn argymhelliad cyntaf y pwyllgor.

Wrth fynegi fy siom dwys, a siom yr holl bwyllgor, nad yw'r Llywodraeth wedi derbyn hwn, sef ein hargymhelliad craidd, hoffwn ddechrau drwy ddweud nad wyf yn cwestiynu ymrwymiad personol y Gweinidog na'r Dirprwy Weinidog i hyrwyddo hawliau plant ac amddiffyn plant agored i niwed. Mae enw da Gwenda Thomas yn siarad cyfrolau a heb ei ail. Yr wyf yn adnabod y Gweinidog yn broffesiynol ac yn bersonol ers dros 20 mlynedd ac yr wyf wedi'i gweld yn dangos yr ymrwymiad hwnnw dro ar ôl tro. Yr wyf yn gwerthfawrogi bod camau wedi cael eu cymryd ers i'r pwyllgor ddechrau trafod cynigion eiriolaeth y Llywodraeth i roi sylw i rai o'r pryderon a oedd yn cael eu codi wrth i'r broses fynd rhagddi. Mae'r bwrdd cenedlaethol eiriolaeth annibynnol yn sicr yn gam ymlaen, yn yr un modd â chryfhau swyddogaeth yr uned eiriolaeth genedlaethol. Croesewir hefyd y cyfeiriad penodol at eiriolaeth yng Ngorchymyn (Cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol) (Rhif 3) Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru 2007 (Ynghylch Plant Agored i Niwed), er y byddem wedi hoffi gweld y cyfeiriad hwnnw'n cael ei gryfhau a'i ehangu. Beth bynnag a ddywed yn ei hymateb ysgrifenedig am dderbyn yn rhannol, mae'r Llywodraeth wedi gwrthod ein hargymhelliad allweddol y dylai gwasanaethau eirioli gael eu comisiynu'n genedlaethol gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'u darparu'n lleol gan ddarparwyr sydd eisoes yn bod. Mae wedi ei wrthod, ac yr oedd yn anghywir i wneud hynny, a thrwy wneud hynny mae wedi methu rhoi'r strwythurau gorau ar waith i amddiffyn plant sy'n agored i niwed.

In taking evidence, our committee heard time and again from the Office of the Children's Commissioner for Wales, Children in Wales, the Assembly cross-party group on looked-after children, from many—though not all—advocacy providers, and, most importantly, from children and young people, particularly those who had used or needed advocacy services, that advocacy services must be and must be believed to be totally independent from service providers. If children and young people need an advocate's support—whether to raise a complaint, to ask for a change in how they are cared for or educated, or for anything whatsoever—that child needs to know that their advocate is just that: theirs; uncompromised by any formal relationship with service providers. Thankfully, most of the children in our nation have the best possible advocates—parents who love and care for them—but there are children in our communities who do not have someone who is so comprehensively theirs, and they need their advocate to take that role.

I want to share with the Assembly one quotation that was typical of what children and young people said to us in the course of our inquiry. A young woman said:

'I've been in care long enough to tell the difference between a social worker and a so-called independent person, and the woman I had wasn't independent. Her wages were paid by the same people as social workers'.

She wanted to know how she could be sure that she would really stick up for her. We heard comments like that time and again.

Many young people have had positive experiences of using advocacy services, and some service providers are perfectly happy with their arm's-length relationship with local authorities. However, we heard many other accounts of young people refusing even

Wrth gymryd tystiolaeth, clywodd ein pwyllgor dro ar ôl tro gan Swyddfa Comisiynydd Plant Cymru, Plant yng Nghymru, grŵp trawsbleidiol y Cynulliad ar blant sy'n cael gofal, gan nifer—er nad y cwbl—o ddarparwyr eiriolaeth, ac yn bwysicach na neb, gan blant a phobl ifanc, yn enwedig y rheini a oedd wedi defnyddio gwasanaethau eirioli, neu'r rheini yr oedd angen gwasanaethau eirioli arnynt, ei bod yn rhaid i wasanaethau eirioli fod yn hollol annibynnol ar ddarparwyr gwasanaethau a'i bod yn rhaid credu eu bod felly hefyd. Os bydd ar blant a phobl ifanc angen cefnogaeth eiriolwr—boed hynny ar gyfer cwyno, gofyn am newid y ffordd y gofalir amdanynt neu am y ffordd y cânt eu haddysgu, neu am unrhyw beth o gwbl—mae angen i'r plentyn hwnnw wybod bod ei eiriolwr yn eiriolwr iddo ef a neb arall; ac nad oes ganddynt unrhyw berthynas ffurfiol gyda darparwyr gwasanaeth. Diolch byth, mae gan y rhan fwyaf o'r plant yn ein gwlad yr eiriolwyr gorau posibl—rhieni sy'n eu caru ac yn gofalu amdanynt—ond mae plant yn ein cymunedau nad oes ganddynt neb sydd ar eu cyfer nhw yn llwyr, ac felly mae angen eu heiriolwr arnynt i ysgwyddo'r swyddogaeth honno.

Mae arnaf eisiau rhannu â'r Cynulliad un dyfyniad a oedd yn nodweddiadol o'r hyn yr oedd plant a phobl ifanc yn ei ddweud wrthym yn ystod ein hymchwiliad. Meddai un fenyw ifanc:

Yr wyf wedi bod mewn gofal yn ddigon hir i allu dweud y gwahaniaeth rhwng gweithiwr cymdeithasol a rhywun sydd i fod yn annibynnol, ac nid oedd y fenyw a oedd gennyf fi yn annibynnol. Yr oedd ei chyflog hi'n cael ei dalu gan yr un bobl ag a oedd yn talu'r gweithwyr cymdeithasol.

Yr oedd arni eisiau gwybod sut y gallai fod yn siŵr y byddai'n sefyll yn gadarn drosti. Clywsom sylwadau fel hynny dro ar ôl tro.

Mae nifer o bobl ifanc wedi cael profiadau cadarnhaol o ddefnyddio gwasanaethau eirioli, ac mae rhai darparwyr gwasanaeth yn gwbl fodlon â'u perthynas hyd braich ag awdurdodau lleol. Fodd bynnag, clywsom nifer o straeon eraill am bobl ifanc yn

to access advocacy services—they saw no point in doing so as they did not believe that the advocacy service would be independent. We also heard from advocacy service providers who believed that they had lost contracts because they were perceived by local authorities to be too challenging. Our committee believes that this has to stop and that a nationally funded, locally provided service would be the answer, because the Assembly Government is not a direct provider of services that a child or young person may need an advocate's support to challenge.

There were voices supporting either the status quo or the Government's proposed regional model. Who were they? Some were advocacy service providers that were concerned that national commissioning might lead to over-centralisation. That was a concern that we understood as a committee, but we felt that it could be addressed by the national unit commissioning locally provided services. Then, of course, there was the powerful voice of the Welsh Local Government Association, which was insistent on retaining local authority control of advocacy. We listened very carefully to what they had to say, and we fully accepted that the current arrangements work perfectly well much of the time. However, sometimes they do not work perfectly well, and when they do not, and when advocacy providers are seen to be—or are—compromised by being paid for by local government, children and young people do not get the advocacy support that they need and they suffer. Therefore, we came to the conclusion that independence was best secured by full separation.

It saddens me profoundly that the Government has chosen to ignore the advice of the children's commissioner, Sir Ronald Waterhouse, Children in Wales, our committee and, worst of all, of children and young people. It saddens me that there are those who are openly saying that the Government that I am usually proud to support has, on this vital matter, caved in to vested interests. I hope that the Government

gwrthod hyd yn oed defnyddio gwasanaethau eirioli—nid oeddent yn gweld diben gwneud hynny am na chredent y byddai'r gwasanaeth eirioli'n annibynnol. Clywsom hefyd gan ddarparwyr gwasanaeth eirioli a oedd yn credu iddynt golli contractau oherwydd bod awdurdodau lleol o'r farn eu bod yn rhy heriol. Mae ein pwyllgor yn credu ei bod yn rhaid i hyn ddod i ben ac mai gwasanaeth a fyddai'n cael ei gyllido'n genedlaethol a'i ddarparu'n lleol fyddai'r ateb, oherwydd nad yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ddarparwr gwasanaethau uniongyrchol y gallai fod angen cefnogaeth eiriolwr ar blentyn neu unigolyn ifanc er mwyn eu herio.

Yr oedd rhai lleisiau'n cefnogi naill ai'r *status quo* neu fodel rhanbarthol arfaethedig y Llywodraeth. Pwy oeddent? Yr oedd rhai'n ddarparwyr gwasanaethau eirioli a oedd yn poeni y gallai comisiynu cenedlaethol arwain at ormod o ganoli. Yr oedd hwnnw'n bryder yr oeddem yn ei ddeall fel pwyllgor, ond teimlem y gellid rhoi sylw i hyn wrth i'r uned genedlaethol gomisiynu gwasanaethau a ddarperir yn lleol. Wedyn, wrth gwrs, yr oedd llais pwerus Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru a oedd yn benderfynol ynghylch cadw rheolaeth dros eiriolaeth mewn awdurdodau lleol. Yr oeddem wedi gwranddo'n ofalus ar yr hyn yr oedd ganddynt i'w ddweud, ac yr oeddem yn derbyn yn llwyr bod y trefniadau cyfredol yn gweithio'n iawn y rhan fwyaf o'r amser. Fodd bynnag, ambell waith nid ydynt yn gweithio'n iawn, a phan na fyddant yn gweithio'n iawn, a phan welir bod darparwyr eiriolaeth—neu pan fydd darparwyr eiriolaeth—yn cael eu cyfaddawdu oherwydd mai llywodraeth leol sy'n talu amdanynt, ni fydd plant a phobl ifanc yn cael y gefnogaeth eiriolaeth y mae ei hangen arnynt, ac maent yn dioddef. Felly, daethom i'r casgliad mai gwahanu'n llwyr oedd y ffordd orau i sicrhau annibyniaeth.

Mae'n dristwch mawr imi fod y Llywodraeth wedi penderfynu anwybyddu cyngor y comisiynydd plant, Syr Ronald Waterhouse, Plant yng Nghymru, ein pwyllgor ni, ac yn waeth na dim, plant a phobl ifanc. Mae'n dristwch imi fod y rheini sy'n dweud yn agored bod y Llywodraeth, yr wyf fel rheol yn falch o'i chefnogi, ar y mater hollbwysig hwn wedi plygu oherwydd diddordebau personol. Gobeithio y bydd y Llywodraeth



might reconsider following today's debate, but I am not sanguine.

2.40 p.m.

The Government cites the statutory duties of local authorities under section 26A of the Children Act 1989 to make arrangements for looked-after children to access advocacy services when making complaints as one reason why some level of local commissioning remains essential. Currently, arrangements are made by commissioning services from the voluntary sector, so, arguably, they are not providing those services directly. Our legal advice as a committee suggested that they could make arrangements equally well by ensuring that children and young people had access to centrally provided and centrally funded local services. However, I do not want to go into legal minutiae.

This is a matter of principle to our committee—the principle that advocacy services should be independent of service providers so that children can trust them. It is as simple as that. Independence is an absolute state; as a nationalist, I should know that better than many. One cannot be sufficiently independent or a bit independent; one is either independent or one is not. The Government's decision not to accept our recommendation 1 and to stick with local or regional commissioning leaves us with advocacy services that are ultimately not independent. I will return, with your permission, Deputy Presiding Officer, to where that leaves us now when I respond to this debate. In the meantime, I commend this report in its entirety to the Assembly and I look forward to the debate.

**The Minister for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills (Jane Hutt):** I welcome the Children and Young People Committee's work on advocacy and the commitment of Members to this important subject. As you know, the Government's response was made available to Members last week. I look forward to hearing the debate and will respond later.

efallai'n ailystyried yn dilyn y ddadl heddiw, ond nid wyf yn hyderus.

Mae'r Llywodraeth yn dyfynnu dyletswyddau statudol awdurdodau lleol dan adran 26A Deddf Plant 1989 i drefnu bod plant sy'n cael gofal yn gallu cael gwasanaethau eirioli wrth wneud cwynion fel un rheswm pam y mae rhyw lefel o gomisiynu lleol yn dal yn hanfodol. Ar hyn o bryd caiff trefniadau eu gwneud drwy gomisiynu gwasanaethau gan y sector gwirfoddol, felly, gellir dadlau nad ydynt yn darparu'r gwasanaethau hynny'n uniongyrchol. Yr oedd ein cyngor cyfreithiol fel pwyllgor yn awgrymu y gallent wneud trefniadau lawn cystal drwy sicrhau bod gan blant a phobl ifanc fynediad at wasanaethau lleol a oedd yn cael eu darparu'n ganolog a'u cyllido'n ganolog. Fodd bynnag, nid oes arnaf eisiau trafod y manylion cyfreithiol.

Mae hwn yn fater o egwyddor i'n pwyllgor—yr egwyddor y dylai gwasanaethau eirioli fod yn annibynnol ar y darparwyr gwasanaeth er mwyn i blant allu ymddiried ynddynt. Mae cyn symled â hynny. Mae annibyniaeth yn gyflwr absoliwt; fel cenedlaetholwraig, dylwn wybod hynny'n well na llawer. Ni all rhywun fod yn ddigon annibynnol neu ychydig yn annibynnol; yr ydych naill ai'n annibynnol ynteu nid ydych. Mae penderfyniad y Llywodraeth i beidio â derbyn ein hargymhelliad 1 a glynu wrth gomisiynu lleol neu ranbarthol yn rhoi inni wasanaethau eirioli nad ydynt mewn gwirionedd yn annibynnol. Gyda'ch caniatâd, Ddirprwy Lywydd, dychwelaf i ble mae hynny'n ein gadael ni nawr wrth ymateb i'r ddadl hon. Yn y cyfamser, yr wyf yn cymeradwyo'r adroddiad hwn yn ei gyfanrwydd i'r Cynulliad ac edrychaf ymlaen at y ddadl.

**Y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau (Jane Hutt):** Yr wyf yn croesawu gwaith y Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc ar eiriolaeth ac ymrwymiad yr Aelodau i'r pwnc pwysig hwn. Fel y gwyddoch, cafodd ymateb y Llywodraeth ei ddarparu i'r Aelodau'r wythnos diwethaf. Edrychaf ymlaen at glywed y ddadl a byddaf yn ymateb yn ddiweddarach.

**Angela Burns:** First I thank Helen Mary and other members and supporters of this committee for the hard work that went into this report. As a new Assembly Member, I was proud to be a part of this committee, and when the report—a copy of which I have here—was published, I felt that it was a good piece of work that had been done on a cross-party basis. I think that that is what gave me such strength and encouragement: all of us believed strongly in its recommendations.

I know that the Minister has a genuine heart; she willingly came with Gwenda Thomas to our meetings to present the Government's views on a number of the issues that we discussed. In many of the expert witnesses, we also met people with whom I had not had many dealings in the past, such as the children's commissioner, Voices from Care and so on. They struck me as being people who understood their subject and who, between them, had hundreds of years of experience in their subject. So, I am puzzled as to why the Government has chosen to ignore a key recommendation of our report. We made 12 or 13 recommendations, but the most important was a recommendation that we arrived at as a result of listening to experts such as Voices from Care, the National Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Children and the children's commissioner, all saying that we needed a fully independent advocacy service. Above all, we listened to the children.

I can do away with half my speech, because Helen Mary has so cleverly voiced my concerns, so I will just present two brief and true stories; I will just change the names. Two children in my constituency have had an appalling time at the hands of care workers in the social services departments of the two county councils that I interact with: Pembrokeshire County Council and Carmarthenshire County Council.

The first is a girl who was up for adoption and did not have an independent advocate. She was dealt with by the fostering team, then the adoption team and then a social worker. She had the most dreadful time and

**Angela Burns:** Yn gyntaf, yr wyf yn diolch i Helen Mary ac aelodau a chefnogwyr eraill y pwyllgor hwn am y gwaith caled a wnaethpwyd ar gyfer yr adroddiad hwn. Fel Aelod Cynulliad newydd, yr oeddwn yn falch o fod yn rhan o'r pwyllgor hwn, a phan gyhoeddwyd yr adroddiad—mae gennyf gopi ohono yma—yr oeddwn yn teimlo'i fod yn ddarn da o waith a wnaethpwyd ar sail drawsbleidiol. Credaf mai hynny a roddodd gymaint o gryfder ac anogaeth i mi; yr oedd pob un ohonom yn credu'n gryf yn ei argymhellion.

Gwn fod gan y Gweinidog galon gywir; daeth yn fodlon, gyda Gwenda Thomas, i'n cyfarfodydd i gyflwyno safbwyntiau'r Llywodraeth ar nifer o'r materion y buom yn eu trafod. Yr oedd nifer o'r tystion arbenigol y cyfarfuom â hwy yn bobl nad oeddwn wedi ymwneud llawer â hwy yn y gorffennol, megis y comisiynydd plant, Voices from Care, ac yn y blaen. Yr oeddent yn fy nharo fel pobl a oedd yn deall eu pwnc a bod ganddynt, rhyngddynt, gannoedd o flynyddoedd o brofiad o'u pwnc. Felly, yr wyf drysu wrth ddyfalu pam mae'r Llywodraeth wedi dewis anwybyddu un o argymhellion allweddol ein hadroddiad. Yr oeddem wedi gwneud 12 neu 13 o argymhellion, ond y pwysicaf oedd argymhelliad y daethom iddo o ganlyniad i wrando ar arbenigwyr megis Voices from Care, y Gymdeithas Genedlaethol er Atal Creulondeb i Blant a'r comisiynydd plant, a oedd i gyd yn dweud bod arnom angen gwasanaeth eirioli cwbl annibynnol. Yn anad dim, buom yn gwrandao ar y plant.

Gallaf hepgor hanner fy araith oherwydd bod Helen Mary wedi mynegi fy mhryderon cystal, felly, y cyfan a wnaaf fydd adrodd dau hanesyn byr a gwir; yr wyf am newid yr enwau. Mae dau blentyn yn fy etholaeth wedi cael amser echrydus oherwydd gweithwyr gofal yn adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol y ddau gyngor sir y byddaf yn ymwneud â hwy: Cyngor Sir Penfro a Chyngor Sir Caerfyrddin.

Mae'r cyntaf yn ferch a oedd i gael ei mabwysiadu ac nid oedd ganddi eiriolwr annibynnol. Cafodd ei thrin gan y tîm maethu, wedyn y tîm mabwysiadu ac wedyn gweithiwr cymdeithasol. Cafodd amser

was unhappy in her placement. However, no-one was prepared to go to the social services department of Pembrokeshire County Council on her behalf to say that things were not right, that she was uncomfortable where she was and that life was going badly. This child came to me via a former foster carer—she had had three or four foster carers since then—who really cared about her and acted as a lay advocate. Gradually, we have managed to get some sense knocked into the county council and this child has now been moved.

The second case that I wish to talk about involves a young man aged around 20, who has lived in foster care all his life. He has some mental health issues, but he has never displayed any overtly sexual behaviour or aggressive tendencies. His foster carer wanted to get rid of him, as her life circumstances had changed enormously, and so she complained that he had made sexual advances towards one of the other children in her care. That poor lad was whipped out of that foster home so fast his feet did not touch the floor. He was bunged into St David's Hospital in Carmarthen, which is for people with mental health issues. A doctor whom he had never met before tippy-tapped in on her high-heeled shoes, interviewed him for half an hour and declared him to be a menace to society and someone who was about to go out and rape and murder young girls left, right and centre. This poor lad was then locked up. His case was brought to me by a neighbour and an independent advocate based in Carmarthenshire has got involved and is now fighting for his rights. He is now slowly being brought back out of this terrible situation.

Those two examples emphasise why it is so important to have independent advocacy because, in both cases, the advocates and social workers of the children were all part of the same team, and they all had coffee together and talked about their cases, both formally and informally. Without independent people stepping in to rescue those children, they would be in the most dreadful straits.

ofnadwy ac yr oedd yn anhapus yn ei lleoliad. Fodd bynnag, nid oedd neb yn fodlon mynd at adran gwasanaethau cymdeithasol Cyngor Sir Penfro ar ei rhan i ddweud nad oedd pethau'n iawn, ei bod yn anghyfforddus lle'r oedd hi ac nad oedd pethau'n mynd yn dda iddi. Daeth y plentyn hwn ataf drwy gyn ofalwr maeth—mae wedi cael tri neu bedwar o ofalwyr maeth ers hynny—a oedd yn gofalu amdani'n dda ac yn gweithredu fel eiriolwyr lleyg. Yr ydym yn raddol wedi llwyddo i wneud i'r cyngor ddod at ei goed ac mae'r plentyn hwn bellach wedi ei symud.

Mae'r ail achos yr hoffwn sôn amdano yn ymwneud â dyn ifanc sydd oddeutu 20 oed ac sydd wedi byw mewn gofal maeth drwy gydol ei oes. Mae ganddo rai problemau iechyd meddwl, ond nid yw erioed wedi dangos ymddygiad rhywiol na thueddiadau ymosodol amlwg. Yr oedd ei ofalwr maeth am gael gwared arno, gan fod ei hamgylchiadau wedi newid yn sylweddol, ac felly gwnaeth gwyn ei fod wedi gwneud awgrymiadau rhywiol wrth un o'r plant eraill yn ei gofal. Cafodd y bachgen druan hwnnw ei symud o'r cartref maeth hwnnw mor gyflym fel na chyffyrddodd ei draed â'r llawr. Cafodd ei roi yn Ysbyty Dewi Sant yng Nghaerfyrddin, sy'n ysbyty ar gyfer pobl â phroblemau iechyd meddwl. Daeth meddyg hunanbwysig mewn sodlau main ato, nad oedd erioed wedi ei gweld o'r blaen, a'i gyfworld am hanner awr a chyhoeddi ei fod yn fygythiad i gymdeithas ac yn rhywun a oedd ar fin mynd allan i dreisio a llofruddio merched ifanc ar bob cyfle. Yna cafodd y bachgen hwn druan ei roi dan glo. Dygwyd ei achos i'm sylw gan gymydog, ac mae eiriolwr annibynnol yng Nghaerfyrddin yn ymwneud â'r achos bellach ac yn ymladd dros ei hawliau. Mae'r sefyllfa ofnadwy hon bellach yn cael ei newid yn raddol.

Mae'r ddwy enghraifft honno'n pwysleisio pam y mae eiriolaeth annibynnol mor bwysig, oherwydd yn y ddau achos yr oedd eiriolwyr a gweithwyr cymdeithasol y plant i gyd yn rhan o'r un tîm, a byddent i gyd yn cael coffi gyda'i gilydd ac yn siarad am eu hachosion, yn ffurfiol ac yn anffurfiol. Heb bobl annibynnol yn camu i'r bwch i achub y plant hynny, byddent mewn trafferthion dybryd.

Minister, I ask you to stand up for these children, to stand up to those in the Welsh Local Government Association who I know have enormous vested interests in this, to listen to the cross-party group on looked-after children and the children's commissioner and, above all, to listen to the children and revisit your decision.

**Christine Chapman:** As a member of the Children and Young People Committee, I will start by saying how valuable this inquiry has been; it has been an absolute privilege to be part of this, particularly as it was the first piece of work for the committee. It has raised the profile of quality advocacy services for children and young people in Wales. We heard some extremely powerful evidence from partners such as Children in Wales and Voices from Care about the need for advocacy, but the most poignant and thought-provoking evidence was that given by the children and young people themselves. I wish to pay tribute to those whom I met at my rapporteur meeting with the Merthyr Tydfil advocacy and participation group. I know that other Members visited other parts of Wales, but I wish to put that on record.

Although there has been an acknowledgement of the differences of opinion as far as the committee and the Welsh Assembly Government are concerned, which Helen Mary and others have outlined, I want to further press the point that the national independent advisory board should be truly representative of children and young people. I wish to ask the Minister about that. There are differences of opinion but, as a committee, I am sure that we would like to keep this issue under scrutiny for future reference. We might need to return to this issue. I would welcome the Minister's comments on whether she agrees that it is imperative that the board includes children and young people from all sectors of society, including the most vulnerable. We know from speaking to children and young people themselves how vulnerable some of them are. Their voices must be heard in this process because, unless that happens, the process could be meaningless.

Weinidog, gofynnaf ichi achub cam y plant hyn, herio'r rheini yng Nghymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru y gwn fod ganddynt fuddiannau personol mawr yn hyn, gwranddo ar y grŵp trawsbleidiol ar blant sy'n cael gofal a'r comisiynydd plant, ac yn anad dim gwranddo ar y plant ac ailystyried eich penderfyniad.

**Christine Chapman:** Fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor ar Blant a phobl Ifanc, dechreuaf drwy ddweud mor werthfawr fu'r ymchwiliad hwn; mae bod yn rhan o hyn wedi bod yn fraint wirioneddol, yn arbennig gan mai dyma'r darn cyntaf o waith i'r pwyllgor ei gyflawni. Mae wedi codi proffil gwasanaethau eirioli o safon i blant a phobl ifanc yng Nghymru. Clywsom dystiolaeth gref iawn gan bartneriaid fel Plant yng Nghymru a Voices from Care am yr angen am eiriolaeth, ond rhoddwyd y dystiolaeth fwyaf ingol gan y plant a'r bobl ifanc eu hunain, a oedd yn peri i rywun feddwl. Hoffwn roi teyrnged i'r rhai y cyfarfûm â hwy yn fy nghyfarfod rapporteur gyda grŵp eirioli a chyfranogi Merthyr Tudful. Gwn fod Aelodau eraill wedi ymweld â rhannau eraill o Gymru, ond hoffwn gofnodi hynny.

Er bod gwahaniaeth barn rhwng y pwyllgor a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ei gydnabod, fel yr amlinellodd Helen Mary ac eraill, hoffwn bwysleisio ymhellach y dylai'r bwrdd cenedlaethol cyngori annibynnol fod yn gwbl gynrychioliadol o blant a phobl ifanc. Hoffwn holi'r Gweinidog ynghylch hynny. Mae yna wahaniaeth barn, ond fel pwyllgor yr wyf yn siŵr yr hoffem barhau i graffu ar y mater hwn ar gyfer y dyfodol. Efallai y bydd angen inni ddychwelyd at y mater hwn. Byddwn yn croesawu sylwadau'r Gweinidog ynghylch a yw'n cytuno ei bod yn hanfodol i'r bwrdd gynnwys plant a phobl ifanc o bob sector o gymdeithas, gan gynnwys y rhai sydd fwyaf agored i niwed. Gwyddom drwy siarad â phlant a phobl ifanc eu hunain pa mor agored i niwed yw rhai ohonynt. Rhaid i'w lleisiau gael eu clywed yn y broses hon, oherwydd oni ddigwydd hynny, gallai'r broses fod yn ddiystyr.

Finally, I welcome the fact that our report referred to the need for three-year funding to ensure stability and continuity. I am pleased that the Government has agreed to this recommendation because, if we do this, we can ensure that we retain the right people in this very important role of advocacy. I know, as I have spoken to people involved in this field, that the people are there, but if there is a lot of uncertainty that makes things very difficult, therefore, I again welcome this recommendation, which has been accepted by the Welsh Assembly Government.

2.50 p.m.

**David Melding:** Helen Mary made one of the most eloquent speeches that I have heard in the Chamber and perfectly described the committee's view in relation to the importance of independent advocacy. It is difficult when a Member has to speak partly against a Government that he or she is supporting on a party basis, but Helen drew on cross-party support and certainly on the view of the all-party group on looked-after children that I chair. As Helen was speaking, I suddenly thought that if there were a secret ballot in the Chamber—I know that it is not the way that we ever operate—I have no doubt that the vote would overwhelmingly be for the model recommended by the Children and Young People Committee. For whatever reason, the Government has found itself in a situation in which it is proposing something that is manifestly less robust than separating the service providers out from the advocacy groups that will protect the most vulnerable people in society.

These are people who have their whole lifetime in front of them. Should their lives be ruined at an early age, they will have to live with the consequences and society will also suffer the consequences. We are talking about a group of people who often cannot speak for themselves; in the past, when they did speak up, they were not believed. We need a gold standard here. If we are to have a gold standard in one area above all others, surely it should be in this one.

When I have heard the Minister speaking on this, I have never really been convinced that

Yn olaf, croesawaf y ffaith fod ein hadroddiad wedi cyfeirio at yr angen am gyllid dros dair blynedd i sicrhau sefydlogrwydd a pharhad. Yr wyf yn falch bod y Llywodraeth wedi cytuno i'r argymhelliad hwn, oherwydd os gwnawn hyn gallwn sicrhau ein bod yn cadw'r bobl gywir yn y rôl eiriolaeth bwysig hon. Gwn, gan fy mod wedi siarad â phobl sy'n gweithio yn y maes hwn, fod y bobl yno, ond os bydd llawer o ansicrwydd mae hynny'n gwneud pethau'n anodd iawn. Felly, unwaith eto, croesawaf yr argymhelliad hwn, sydd wedi ei dderbyn gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

**David Melding:** Gwnaeth Helen Mary un o'r areithiau mwyaf huawdl imi ei chlywed erioed yn y Siambr, a disgrifiodd yn berffaith farn y pwyllgor ar bwysigrwydd eiriolaeth annibynnol. Mae'n anodd pan fydd yn rhaid i Aelod siarad yn rhannol yn erbyn Llywodraeth y mae'n ei chefnogi ar sail plaid, ond tynnodd Helen ar gefnogaeth drawsbleidiol ac yn sicr ar farn y grŵp hollbleidiol ar blant sy'n cael gofal yr wyf fi'n ei gadeirio. Pan oedd Helen yn siarad, meddyliais yn sydyn, petai pleidlais gudd yn y Siambr—gwn nad dyma'r ffordd yr ydym yn gweithredu—nid oes amheuaeth na fyddai'r bleidlais yn unfrydol o blaid y model a argymhellwyd gan y Pwyllgor ar Blant a Phobl Ifanc. Am ba bynnag reswm, mae'r Llywodraeth mewn sefyllfa lle y mae'n cynnig rhywbeth sy'n llai cadarn o lawer na gwahanu darparwyr gwasanaethau oddi wrth grwpiau eirioli a fydd yn diogelu'r bobl sydd fwyaf agored i niwed yn ein cymdeithas.

Mae'r rhain yn bobl sydd â'u bywydau cyfan o'u blaenau. Os caiff eu bywydau eu difetha pan fyddant yn ifanc, bydd yn rhaid iddynt fyw gyda'r canlyniadau a bydd cymdeithas hefyd yn dioddef y canlyniadau. Yr ydym yn sôn am grŵp o bobl sy'n aml yn methusiarad drostynt eu hunain; yn y gorffennol, wrth godi eu nid oes neb wedi eu credu. Mae arnom angen safon aur yma. Os ydym am gael safon aur mewn un maes yn fwy nag unrhyw un arall, dyma'r maes yn sicr.

Pan glywaf y Gweinidog yn siarad am hyn, nid wyf wedi cael fy argyhoeddi o ddifrif fod

her heart is in what she has to propose. I suspect that, in a secret ballot, even the Minister would have second thoughts about supporting the current Government line on this. My mind wanders back to when we established the Children's Commissioner for Wales and the best practice that Jane Hutt then promoted, as the Minister responsible, in getting all of the parties together, including my party, which had no track record of supporting the idea of the children's commissioner but had recently changed its policy. She brought everyone in and then established an absolutely gold standard of best practice, which has been partly emulated in the rest of the UK, although not fully. It still stands as a more robust model than the Children's Commissioner for England, and, in Westminster, we hear English MPs sometimes referring to the model that we have in Wales and challenging the Government to strengthen the powers of the Children's Commissioner for England. I wish that the Government would take a deep breath and be courageous, because I think that once it broke through, it would find that it has not broken its relationships with local authorities or some current advocacy providers, but would have set up a system that would endure for generations, because it is so clearly robust and separates out the different functions.

At the moment, the Minister has come up with some ingenious mechanisms to make her model as fit for purpose as possible. If the outcome is that we must work with the Minister's model, I hope that those mechanisms will be employed fully, because some of them certainly have merit. They do attempt to strengthen the system, but they are trying to put right what inevitably flows from having a service provider also provide the advocacy services that reflect on the basic provision that that authority is providing to some of the most vulnerable children in society. It seems to me that you cannot reconcile that basic contradiction. We need to cut through this and realise what is staring us in the face. It is not as if we have had a wide range of evidence from children's organisations and children and young people themselves. Their voice is very clear: they want independent advocacy.

ei chalon yn yr hyn sydd ganddi i'w gynnig. Amheuf y byddai hyd yn oed y Gweinidog, mewn pleidlais gudd, yn ailfeddwl ynghylch cefnogi safbwynt presennol y Llywodraeth ar hyn. Â fy meddwl yn ôl i'r amser pan sefydlwyd Comisiynydd Plant Cymru a'r arferion gorau a hyrwyddwyd gan Jane Hutt bryd hynny, fel y Gweinidog cyfrifol, i ddod â'r holl bleidiau ynghyd, gan gynnwys fy mhleid i, nad oedd ganddi hanes o gefnogi'r syniad o gomisiynydd plant ond a oedd wedi newid ei pholisi'n ddiweddar. Llwyddodd i ennyn cefnogaeth pawb ac yna sefydlodd safon aur o arfer gorau, sydd wedi ei hefelychu'n rhannol, ond nid yn gyfan gwbl, yng ngweddill y DU. Mae'n parhau'n fodel mwy cadarn na Chomisiynydd Plant Lloegr, ac yn San Steffan clywn ASau Lloegr weithiau'n cyfeirio at y model sydd gennym yng Nghymru ac yn herio'r Llywodraeth i gryfhau pwerau Comisiynydd Plant Lloegr. Byddai'n dda gennyf petai'r Llywodraeth yn anadlu'n ddwfn ac yn bod yn ddewr, oherwydd ar ôl iddi sefydlu hyn, credaf y byddai'n gweld nad yw wedi torri ei pherthynas ag awdurdodau lleol neu rai o'r darparwyr gwasanaethau eirioli presennol. Yn hytrach, byddai wedi sefydlu system a fyddai'n parhau am genedlaethau, oherwydd mae'n amlwg yn gwbl gadarn ac yn gwahanu'r gwahanol swyddogaethau.

Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r Gweinidog wedi cynnig dulliau dyfeisgar i sicrhau bod ei model mor addas at y pwrpas â phosibl. Os bydd y canlyniad yn golygu ei bod yn rhaid inni weithio gyda model y Gweinidog, gobeithio y defnyddir y dulliau hynny'n llawn, oherwydd mae i rai ohonynt rinwedd yn sicr. Maent yn ceisio cryfhau'r system, ond maent yn ceisio unioni'r hyn sy'n deillio'n anochel o gael darparwr gwasanaethau sydd eisoes yn darparu'r gwasanaethau eirioli sy'n adlewyrchu'r ddarpariaeth sylfaenol y mae'r awdurdod hwnnw'n ei darparu i rai o'r plant sydd fwyaf agored i niwed yn ein cymdeithas. Ymddengys i mi na allwch unioni'r gwrthgyferbyniad sylfaenol hwnnw. Mae angen inni dorri drwy hyn a sylweddoli beth sydd o dan ein trwynau. Nid ydym wedi cael ystod eang o dystiolaeth gan sefydliadau plant a chan blant a phobl ifanc eu hunain. Mae eu llais yn glir iawn: maent am gael gwasanaeth eirioli annibynnol.

The message that we have heard in the last 12 months when we have reflected on all of these matters is that the Government genuinely wants to see effective advocacy. In its discussions—I think that they were with local government, principally; we will never know, I suppose, unless the Minister tells us—some vested interests have been brought to the fore. A compromise has then been worked upon and the Government has then tried to set in place mechanisms to make that compromise as palatable as possible. However, I think that the Government needs to go back now—especially given the change in local government; it is not as if any one party dominates in local government anymore—to say that we have to get advocacy right and that only the best is good enough.

**Eleanor Burnham:** A minnau'n aelod o'r pwyllgor, hoffwn ddiolch i'r Cadeirydd, i'r staff, i'r tystion ac i'r grwpiau y buom yn cyfarfod â hwy ym Methesda ac yn Wrecsam—yr oedd yn bleser mawr i gael siarad â phobl ifanc ym Methesda a chyda'r grwpiau yn Wrecsam. Yr oeddwn yn falch o gael bod yn rhan o'r trafodaethau sensitif hyn, oherwydd yr wyf yn cytuno'n llwyr bod hyn yn bwysig iawn, ac mae'r mater yn fwy byw nag erioed o ystyried yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd yn Jersey ac yn Awstria.

Nid wyf yn credu ein bod wedi symud ymlaen yn y pum mlynedd diwethaf ers i'r Llywodraeth edrych ar sut i wella eiriolaeth. Mae wyth mlynedd wedi pasio ers adroddiad Waterhouse ac mae problemau a phryderon dwys o hyd. Yr oeddwn yn mawr obeithio y byddai'r Llywodraeth yn gweithredu ar yr argymhellion, yn enwedig ar yr un ar annibyniaeth eiriolaeth, sydd mor bwysig.

Sadly, the issue of young people's rights is highly topical, given what has recently been discovered in Austria and in Jersey. I believe that the Government's response is flawed. The independence that others have referred to is key and the only real issue for me, because, throughout our deliberations, as others have said, the need for the independence of advocacy was the clear message that was given to us. I do not believe that the Government's model is effective. Access to

Y neges yr ydym wedi'i chlywed yn ystod y 12 mis diwethaf wrth fyfyrion ar yr holl faterion hyn yw bod y Llywodraeth o ddifrif am gael gwasanaeth eirioli effeithiol. Yn ei thrafodaethau—gyda llywodraeth leol yn bennaf, mi gredaf; ni wyddom byth, mae'n debyg, oni ddywed y Gweinidog wrthym—daeth rhai buddiannau personol i'r amlwg. Yna daethpwyd i gyfaddawd ac mae'r Llywodraeth wedyn wedi ceisio rhoi dulliau ar waith i sicrhau bod y cyfaddawd hwnnw mor ddymunol â phosibl. Fodd bynnag, credaf fod angen i'r Llywodraeth fynd yn ôl yn awr—yn arbennig o gofio'r newid mewn llywodraeth leol; nid oes yr un blaid yn llywodraethu llywodraeth leol bellach—i ddweud ei bod yn rhaid inni gael pethau'n iawn gydag eiriolaeth ac mai'r gorau'n unig sy'n ddigon da.

**Eleanor Burnham:** As a member of the committee, I should like to thank the Chair, the staff, the witnesses and the groups we met at Bethesda and Wrexham—it was a great privilege to speak with young people in Bethesda and with the groups in Wrexham. I was pleased to be part of these sensitive discussions, because I agree entirely that this is important, and the issue is more alive than ever, considering what has happened in Jersey and in Austria.

I do not believe we have progressed in the last five years since the Government considered how to improve advocacy. Eight years have passed since the publication of the Waterhouse report and serious problems and serious concerns remain. I was hopeful that the Government would act upon the recommendations, particularly on independent advocacy, which is so important.

Yn anffodus, mae hawliau pobl ifanc yn bwnc cyfoes iawn, o gofio'r hyn a ddarganfuwyd yn ddiweddar yn Awstria ac yn Jersey. Credaf fod ymateb y Llywodraeth yn ddiffygiol. Mae'r annibyniaeth y cyfeiriodd eraill ati yn allweddol a dyma'r unig fater o bwys i mi, oherwydd drwy gydol ein trafodaethau, fel y dywedodd eraill, yr angen am eiriolaeth annibynnol oedd y neges glir a gyflëwyd inni. Ni chredaf fod model y Llywodraeth yn effeithiol. Onid yw

an independent advocacy service is surely a right for all of these vulnerable children and young people. Quality assurance and monitoring should surely be done independently and at arm's length from the providers. I agree with the vision of the children's commissioner that there should be a national advocacy service that is truly independent, centrally funded and quality assured and monitored, with local bases acting as a one-stop shop for all children. Although the committee came to this conclusion, that does not mean that we did not praise—I certainly do, and others have alluded to this—the wonderful work of some local partnerships. I would envisage that they would continue to be central to the provision of the service.

With regard to recommendation 2, on the need for skilled advocates, I do not believe that the Government has seen this point clearly either. Could the Minister clarify what the difference is between agreeing and agreeing in principle? I think that that is a play on words that does not befit her wonderful commitment, of which I am well aware and which others have alluded to. Voices from Care suggested that advocates should possess listening and counselling skills, but noted that it should not be essential for them to have social work degrees or academic qualifications, because that could limit the potential pool of positive advocates whom we know are working out there. You either agree to act on the recommendation or you do not, so I want to know the difference between agreeing and agreeing in principle.

The Minister is well aware of article 12 of the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child, on children's right to express their views freely. She is to be commended for overseeing the involvement of some wonderful young people in the appointment of the existing children's commissioner. I cannot see the difference between agreeing and agreeing in principle and I think that it is splitting hairs a little. I welcome the Government's willingness to agree with recommendation 4, calling for the national advocacy unit to make arrangements for the provisions of training courses. Children,

mynediad at wasanaeth eirioli annibynnol yn hawl i bob un o'r plant a'r bobl ifanc hyn sy'n agored i niwed? Oni ddylai sicrhau ansawdd a monitro fod yn brosesau annibynnol hyd braich oddi wrth y darparwyr? Cytunaf â gweledigaeth y comisiynydd plant y dylai gwasanaeth eirioli cenedlaethol fod ar gael sy'n wirioneddol annibynnol, a ariennir yn ganolog, sydd wedi'i sicrhau o ran ansawdd ac sy'n cael ei fonitro, gyda chanolfannau lleol yn gweithredu fel siop-un-stop ar gyfer pob plentyn. Er i'r pwyllgor ddod i'r casgliad hwn, nid yw hynny'n golygu nad oeddem yn canmol—yr wyf fi, yn sicr, ac mae eraill wedi cyfeirio at hyn—y gwaith gwych gan rai partneriaethau lleol. Byddwn yn rhagweld y byddent yn parhau'n ganolog i'r gwasanaeth.

O ran argymhelliad 2, am yr angen am eiriolwyr medrus, ni chredaf fod y Llywodraeth wedi gweld y pwynt hwn yn glir ychwaith. A allai'r Gweinidog egluro'r gwahaniaeth rhwng cytuno a chytuno mewn egwyddor? Credaf mai chwarae ar eiriau yw hynny ac nid yw'n cyd-fynd â'i hymrwymiad gwych yr wyf yn ymwybodol iawn ohono ac y cyfeiriodd eraill ato. Awgrymodd Voices from Care y dylai eiriolwyr feddu ar sgiliau gwranddo a chynghori personol, ond dywedodd hefyd na ddylai fod yn hanfodol iddynt feddu ar raddau mewn gwaith cymdeithasol neu gymwysterau academaidd, oherwydd gallai hynny gyfyngu'r gronfa o eiriolwyr cadarnhaol y gwyddom eu bod yn gweithio. Yr ydych naill ai'n cytuno i weithredu ar yr argymhelliad ynteu nad ydych, felly, hoffwn wybod y gwahaniaeth rhwng cytuno a chytuno mewn egwyddor.

Mae'r Gweinidog yn llwyr ymwybodol o erthygl 12 yng Nghonfensiwn y Cenedloedd Unedig ar Hawliau'r Plentyn, ar hawl plant i fynegi eu barn. Dylid ei chanmol am oruchwylio cyfraniad pobl ifanc wych yn y broses o benodi'r comisiynydd plant presennol. Ni allaf weld y gwahaniaeth rhwng cytuno a chytuno mewn egwyddor a chredaf mai holli blew yw hynny braidd. Croesawaf barodrwydd y Llywodraeth i gytuno ag argymhelliad 4, sy'n galw am uned eiriolaeth genedlaethol i wneud trefniadau ar gyfer darparu cyrsiau hyfforddi. Mae plant, yn arbennig plant diamddiffyn, yn



especially vulnerable children, use those who are closest to them. I have worked in various schools where some of these vulnerable young people were much happier speaking to the dinner lady, for instance, and even to the caretaker or the cleaning staff. Therefore, these people are an important link in the chain, whether you call them advocates, lay advocates, or whatever. Peer advocates also need to be trained, because in this day and age peer advocates are more listened to than many other people.

3.00 p.m.

Recommendation 10 raises another important issue about service level agreements, set by the advocacy units. The NSPCC and Voices from Care recommend this. At some of the rapporteur meetings, young people emphasised the need for confidentiality, which this recommendation would ensure.

I can see that I am being asked to wind, so, finally, I ask the Minister to reconsider, as others have done, because I believe that she is missing the central point about the independence that these vulnerable young people so desperately need.

**Mark Isherwood:** In Wales, we have a higher proportion of whistleblowers than anywhere else in the United Kingdom—these are good, honest people, who have raised legitimate concerns, through official channels, and whose lives have been damaged because of it. It is for that reason that victims and accused need a proper system of independent advocacy. As the all-party group on looked-after children has stated, we believe that good advocacy is the foundation for better service provision, and for ensuring better outcomes for looked-after children. We want children and young people to be able to access independent support when they need it, which is why advocacy is essential in honouring the rights of young people.

The word ‘independent’ is defined as not being influenced or controlled by others in matters of opinion or conduct, and not being subject to another’s authority or jurisdiction

defnyddio’r rhai sydd agosaf atynt. Yr wyf wedi gweithio mewn amrywiol ysgolion lle’r oedd rhai o’r bobl ifanc hyn sy’n agored i niwed lawer yn hapusach yn siarad â’r fenyw ginio, er enghraifft, a hyd yn oed â’r gofalwr neu’r staff glanhau. Felly, mae’r bobl hyn yn ddolen bwysig yn y gadwyn, p’un a gânt eu galw’n eiriolwyr, yn eiriolwyr lleyg, neu beth bynnag. Mae angen hyfforddi eiriolwyr cymheiriaid hefyd, oherwydd yn yr oes sydd ohoni gwrandewir yn fwy ar eiriolwyr cymheiriaid nag ar lawer o bobl eraill.

Mae Argymhelliad 10 yn codi mater pwysig arall am gytundebau lefel gwasanaeth a bennir gan yr unedau eiriolaeth. Mae NSPCC a Voices From Care yn argymhell hyn. Mewn rhai cyfarfodydd rapporteur pwysleisiodd y bobl ifanc yr angen am gyfrinachedd, rhywbeth y byddai’r argymhelliad hwn yn ei sicrhau.

Gwela fy mod yn cael gorchymyn i ddirwyn i ben, felly, yn olaf, gofynaf i’r Gweinidog ailystyried, fel y gwnaeth eraill, oherwydd credaf ei bod yn methu’r pwynt canolog am yr annibyniaeth y mae cymaint o’i angen ar y bobl ifanc hyn sy’n agored i niwed.

**Mark Isherwood:** Yng Nghymru, mae gennym gyfran uwch o chwythwyr chwiban nag yn unman arall yn y Deyrnas Unedig—mae’r rhain yn bobl dda, onest sydd wedi mynegi pryderon dilys, drwy sianelau swyddogol, ac yn bobl y mae eu bywydau wedi’u niweidio o’r herwydd. Am y rheswm hwnnw y mae ar ddiodefwrwr a’r rhai a gyhuddir angen system briodol o eiriolaeth annibynnol. Fel y dywedodd y grŵp hollbleidiol ar blant sy’n cael gofal, credwn mai eiriolaeth dda yw’r sylfaen ar gyfer gwell darpariaeth gwasanaethau, ac er mwyn sicrhau gwell canlyniadau i blant sy’n cael gofal. Mae arnom eisiau i blant sy’n cael gofal allu cael cefnogaeth annibynnol pan fydd arnynt ei hangen, a dyna pam y mae eiriolaeth yn hanfodol i anrhydeddu hawliau pobl ifanc.

Diffinnir y gair ‘annibynnol’ fel peidio â chael eich dylanwadu gan eraill na’ch rheoli ganddynt o safbwynt barn nac ymddygiad, a pheidio â bod yn rhwym wrth awdurdod nac

or influenced by the thought or actions of others. Contrary to the Assembly Government's claims, its model for advocacy services will not provide sufficient distance between the service and advocacy provider, and will therefore not deliver an independent service that empowers and supports children and young people in their times of need. The Assembly Government fails to recognise that a service is either independent or it is not—it is either independent or is destined to suffer from conflicts of interest.

After the Assembly Government rejected calls for independent advocacy for our most vulnerable children and young people in March, the chair of the Waterhouse child abuse inquiry, Sir Ronald Waterhouse, described its decision as 'remarkable'. He claimed that a child would not have confidence that what he or she says to the advocate would be treated in confidence, adding,

'I simply do not know why they have done this'.

The Assembly Government's decision is challenged by this Children and Young People Committee's report, which calls, as we have heard, for an independent advocacy service for young people to be established as soon as possible. It also recommends that a centrally funded, national advocacy unit should be established.

As we have heard, children and young people should be involved when determining which advocacy providers should be awarded contracts for local areas. Advocacy must be a stand-alone, independent service, free from local authority influence. The only way to avoid conflict of interest is to have advocacy services that are not funded, directly or indirectly, by the authorities that they are meant, on occasion, to challenge.

As a Flintshire resident, who has spoken to witnesses and accused in the Waterhouse inquiry, I am concerned about the Assembly

awdurdodaeth rhywun arall na chael eich dylanwadu gan syniadau na gweithredoedd unigolion eraill. Yn groes i honiadau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ni fydd ei model ar gyfer gwasanaethau eirioli yn darparu pellter digonol rhwng y gwasanaeth a'r darparwr eiriolaeth, ac ni fydd felly'n darparu gwasanaeth annibynnol sy'n grymuso nac yn cefnogi plant a phobl ifanc ar adegau pan fyddant mewn angen. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn methu cydnabod bod gwasanaeth naill ai'n annibynnol ynteu nid ydyw—mae naill ai'n annibynnol ynteu'n siŵr o ddioddef oherwydd gwrthdaro rhwng buddiannau.

Ar ôl i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad wrthod galwadau am eiriolaeth annibynnol i'n plant a'n pobl ifanc fwyaf agored i niwed ym Mawrth, disgrifiodd cadeirydd ymchwiliad Waterhouse i gam-drin plant, Syr Ronald Waterhouse, ei phenderfyniad fel un 'hynod'. Haerai na fyddai plentyn yn hyderus y byddai'r hyn y mae ef neu hi'n ei ddweud wrth yr eiriolwr yn cael ei drin yn gyfrinachol, gan ychwanegu,

Ni wn yn wir pam y maent wedi gwneud hyn.

Mae penderfyniad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cael ei herio gan yr adroddiad hwn gan y Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc, adroddiad sy'n galw, fel y clywsom, am i wasanaeth eirioli annibynnol i bobl ifanc gael ei sefydlu cyn gynted â phosibl. Mae hefyd yn argymhell y dylid sefydlu uned eiriolaeth genedlaethol yn cael ei hariannu'n ganolog.

Fel y clywsom, dylai plant a phobl ifanc fod yn rhan o'r penderfyniad ynghylch pa ddarparwyr eiriolaeth y dylid dyfarnu contractau iddynt ar gyfer ardaloedd lleol. Rhaid i eiriolaeth fod yn wasanaeth annibynnol, unigol, heb fod dan ddylanwad awdurdodau lleol. Yr unig ffordd i osgoi gwrthdaro rhwng buddiannau yw cael gwasanaethau eirioli nad ydynt yn cael eu hariannu, yn uniongyrchol nac yn anuniongyrchol, gan yr awdurdodau y maent, ar adegau, i fod i'w herio.

Fel un o drigolion sir y Fflint, sydd wedi siarad â thystion a chyhuddedigion yn ymchwiliad Waterhouse, yr wyf yn bryderus

Government's decision, and its motivation. As Voices From Care Cymru has argued, only advocacy that is truly independent will have the capacity to improve the currently scandalous outcomes of looked-after children. It adds that advocacy services that are funded either directly or indirectly by local authorities are compromised and cause confusion for children and young people, who then opt out of advocacy services and complaints systems.

We also know that the former children's commissioner for Wales, Peter Clarke, was a strong supporter of true, independent advocacy. He highlighted concerns about the degree of real independence enjoyed by advocates when they are directly beholden to their paymasters. Not one of the young people leaving care who had contacted his office felt that their personal advisers had represented their views, or had negotiated on their behalf. He added that the risks of not acting were likely to be great. He was at a loss to understand why the Welsh Assembly Government had not pursued these matters more rigorously.

3.05 p.m.

Referring to these comments in the debate on the children's commissioner's 2006-07 annual report, I said that it is a matter of grave concern that the children's commissioner states that he has serious concerns about the proposed model, which appears to espouse a model for commissioners, rather than attempting to meet the need for advocacy for children and young people. The Assembly Government must acknowledge the need for robust and transparent independence in the commissioning of independent services for children and young people, by acting on this report and establishing a centrally funded unit to commission independent advocacy services in local areas. If, as reported, the Minister is to reject this on the grounds that Assembly Government funding will provide no greater independence, then God help us all.

ynghylch penderfyniad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, a'i chymhelliant. Fel y dadleuodd Voices From Care Cymru, eiriolaeth wirioneddol annibynnol yn unig a fydd â'r gallu i wella'r canlyniadau i blant sy'n cael gofal, canlyniadau sydd ar hyn o bryd yn warthus. Mae'n ychwanegu bod gwasanaethau eirioli sy'n cael eu hariannu naill ai'n uniongyrchol neu'n anuniongyrchol gan awdurdodau lleol yn cael eu peryglu ac yn peri dryswch i blant a phobl ifanc, gan olygu bod y plant a'r bobl ifanc hyn wedyn yn troi eu cefnau ar wasanaethau eirioli a systemau cwynion.

Gwyddom hefyd fod cyn-gomisiynydd plant Cymru, Peter Clarke, yn gefnogwr brwd i eiriolaeth wirioneddol annibynnol. Tynnodd sylw at bryderon am raddau'r annibyniaeth wirioneddol a gaiff eiriolwyr pan fyddant yn uniongyrchol ddyledus i'w meistri cyflog. Nid oedd yr un o'r bobl ifanc a oedd yn gadael gofal ac a gysylltodd â'i swyddfa yn teimlo bod eu cynghorwyr personol wedi cynrychioli eu safbwyntiau nac wedi negodi ar eu rhan. Ychwanegodd fod peryglon peidio â gweithredu yn debygol o fod yn sylweddol. Ni allai ddeall pam nad oedd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi mynd ar drywydd y materion hyn yn fwy grymus.

Gan gyfeirio at y sylwadau hyn yn y ddadl ar adroddiad blynyddol 2006-07 gan y comisiynydd plant, dywedais ei fod yn peri cryn bryder bod y comisiynydd plant yn dweud ei fod yn pryderu'n ddybryd am y model arfaethedig, sy'n ymddangos ei fod yn arddel model ar gyfer comisiynwyr, yn hytrach na cheisio bodloni'r angen am eiriolaeth i blant a phobl ifanc. Rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad gydnabod yr angen am annibyniaeth gadarn a thryloyw wrth gomisiynu gwasanaethau annibynnol i blant a phobl ifanc, drwy weithredu ar yr adroddiad hwn a sefydlu uned sy'n cael ei hariannu'n ganolog i gomisiynu gwasanaethau eirioli annibynnol mewn ardaloedd lleol. Os bydd y Gweinidog, fel yr adroddwyd, yn gwrthod hyn ar y sail na fydd cyllid Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn darparu dim mwy o annibyniaeth, yna Duw a'n helpo i gyd.

**The Minister for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills (Jane Hutt):**

The Welsh Assembly Government welcomes the Children and Young People's Committee's thoughtful and robust examination of this important topic, and Assembly Members' commitment to strengthening the voice of children and young people. Our full response to the committee's report was made available to Assembly Members on 29 April.

The Welsh Assembly Government has a long-standing commitment to provide universal access to effective independent advocacy services as part of a wider commitment to secure the rights and entitlements of children and young people. This is a matter of social justice and inclusion, as well as a matter of the rights of children to receive the best-quality personal, educational and health services.

David, I do seek the gold standard that you proposed for protecting our most vulnerable children and young people. I accept that we will be held to account on the delivery of this new service framework. As you know, we have already agreed that we should do a review of our proposed arrangements in terms of this framework. I will get on to the point about independence later in my contribution.

We had a careful and lengthy process of evidence gathering of our own, which included the work that Gwenda Thomas undertook as part of her safeguarding vulnerable children review, 'Keeping Us Safe'. At the time, the Assembly accepted and responded positively to her report. The children's commissioner participated in that review, as did a group of children who had been looked after, who worked for two years together, with the support of the NSPCC, to guide and assist the deliberations. Our evidence gathering also included the work of the task group that was established in response to the Clywch inquiry and we then consulted on a new integrated service framework for advocacy services last summer. The consultation that we undertook included the views of over 1,000 children and young people. The framework that was

**Y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau (Jane Hutt):**

Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n croesawu archwiliad cadarn ac ystyriol y Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc o'r mater pwysig hwn, ynghyd ag ymrwymiad Aelodau'r Cynulliad i gryfhau llais plant a phobl ifanc. Rhyddhawyd ein hymateb llawn i adroddiad y pwyllgor i Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 29 Ebrill.

Mae gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ymrwymiad hirfaith i ddarparu mynediad cyffredinol i wasanaethau eirioli annibynnol effeithiol fel rhan o ymrwymiad ehangach i sicrhau hawliau a haeddiannau plant a phobl ifanc. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â chyfiawnder cymdeithasol a chynhwysiant, yn ogystal â hawliau plant i gael gwasanaethau personol, addysgol ac iechyd o'r ansawdd gorau.

David, yr wyf yn ceisio cyrraedd y safon aur yr oeddech yn ei chynnig i amddiffyn ein plant a'n pobl ifanc sydd fwyaf agored i niwed. Derbyniaf y cawn ein dwyn i gyfrif am ddarparu'r fframwaith gwasanaeth newydd hwn. Fel y gwyddoch, yr ydym eisoes wedi cytuno y dylem gynnal adolygiad o'n trefniadau arfaethedig o ran y fframwaith hwn. Symudaf ymlaen at y pwynt am annibyniaeth yn ddiweddarach yn fy nghyfraniad.

Yr oedd gennym broses ofalus a hirfaith o gasglu tystiolaeth ein hunain, proses a gynhwysai'r gwaith a wnaeth Gwenda Thomas fel rhan o'i hadolygiad o ddiogelu plant sy'n agored i niwed, 'Ein Cadw'n Ddiogel'. Ar y pryd, derbyniodd y Cynulliad ei hadroddiad ac ymatebodd yn gadarnhaol iddo. Cyfranogodd y comisiynydd plant yn yr adolygiad hwnnw, felly hefyd grŵp o blant a fu'n cael gofal, a buont yn gweithio am ddwy flynedd gyda'i gilydd, gyda chefnogaeth yr NSPCC, i arwain a chynorthwyo'r trafodaethau. Yr oedd ein proses o gasglu tystiolaeth hefyd yn cynnwys gwaith grŵp gorchwyl a sefydlwyd mewn ymateb i ymchwiliad Clywch, ac yna buom yn ymgynghori ar fframwaith gwasanaeth integredig newydd ar gyfer gwasanaethau eirioli yr haf diwethaf. Yr oedd yr ymgynghori a gynhaliwyd yn cynnwys

developed aimed to improve quality and local access through an integrated, one-stop advocacy service, which would be commissioned through the children and young people's partnerships. The outcome of the consultation was published in December and made available to Assembly Members.

In a statement to Plenary in March, I summarised the Government's thinking on the future direction of advocacy services, based on the consultation responses and on the task group reports, but I deferred any final decision until the newly established Children and Young People's Committee had concluded its scrutiny. I welcome the establishment of the committee and the appointment of Helen Mary Jones as the Chair. She is an appropriate champion to take on that role. I wanted to defer a decision until the committee had concluded and reported on its scrutiny of, at that stage, our consultation proposals.

It has been acknowledged in this debate that the Government has responded positively to the wide range of recommendations in the committee's report. The committee's influence has been reflected in our final decisions on the future provision of advocacy services for children and young people in Wales. We strongly welcome the committee's comprehensive examination of each of the key themes. Members here, including Christine Chapman and Angela Burns, have contributed through their positive engagement in the committee. Those themes, which we subscribe to, are: the need for independent advocacy; the need for skilled advocates; the need for an accessible advocacy service; and, the need for continuity of service.

The Government fully accepts the committee's recommendations 3, 4, 5, 6, and 7 in respect of the need for skilled advocates, the regulation of the service, the workforce, and the strengthening of inspection arrangements. We are particularly pleased to see that the committee accords with us in recognising the important role of promoting system and cultural change to ensure that advocacy is most effective. This new service framework has to deliver that kind of change.

safbwyntiau dros 1,000 o blant a phobl ifanc. Nod y fframwaith a luniwyd oedd gwella ansawdd a mynediad lleol drwy gyfrwng gwasanaeth eirioli un-stop, integredig a fyddai'n cael ei gomisiynu drwy gyfrwng y partneriaethau plant a phobl ifanc. Cyhoeddwyd canlyniad yr ymgynghoriad yn Rhagfyr a'i ddarparu i Aelodau'r Cynulliad.

Mewn datganiad gerbron Cyfarfod Llawn ym Mawrth, crynhoais feddyliau'r Llywodraeth am gyfeiriad gwasanaethau eirioli i'r dyfodol, ar sail yr ymatebion i'r ymgynghoriad ac ar adroddiadau'r grŵp gorchwyl. Ond gohiriais unrhyw benderfyniad terfynol nes i'r Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc newydd orffen ei waith craffu. Croesawaf sefydlu'r pwyllgor a phenodi Helen Mary Jones yn Gadeirydd. Mae hi'n hyrwyddwr priodol i ysgwyddo'r rôl honno. Yr oeddwn am ohirio penderfyniad nes i'r pwyllgor orffen craffu ar gynigion ein ymgynghoriad, bryd hynny, ac adrodd ar hynny.

Cydnabuwyd yn y ddadl hon fod y Llywodraeth wedi ymateb yn gadarnhaol i'r ystod eang o argymhellion yn adroddiad y pwyllgor. Adlewyrchwyd dylanwad y pwyllgor yn ein penderfyniadau terfynol ar ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau eirioli i blant a phobl ifanc yng Nghymru i'r dyfodol. Croesawn yn eiddgar archwiliad cynhwysfawr y pwyllgor o bob un o'r themâu allweddol. Mae Aelodau yma, gan gynnwys Christine Chapman ac Angela Burns, wedi cyfrannu drwy ymgysylltu'n gadarnhaol â'r pwyllgor. Y themâu hynny, yr ydym yn cytuno â hwy, yw: yr angen am eiriolaeth annibynnol; yr angen am eiriolwyr medrus; yr angen am wasanaeth eirioli hygyrch; a'r angen am wasanaeth di-dor.

Mae'r Llywodraeth yn derbyn yn llwyr argymhellion 3, 4, 5, 6, a 7 gan y pwyllgor o safbwynt yr angen am eiriolwyr medrus, am reoleiddio'r gwasanaeth, y gweithlu, ac am gryfhau'r trefniadau arolygu. Yr oeddem yn arbennig o falch gweld bod y pwyllgor yn cyd-fynd â ni gan gydnabod y rôl bwysig sydd i hyrwyddo newid yn y system a newid diwylliant er mwyn sicrhau bod yr eiriolaeth ar ei mwyaf effeithiol. Rhaid i'r fframwaith gwasanaeth newydd hwn gyflawni'r math

If it is to be fully effective, it must be developed and delivered alongside growing awareness and understanding of children's and young people's rights, particularly where this might mean children and young people being supported to advocate for themselves.

hwnnw o newid. Os yw am fod yn gwbl effeithiol, rhaid ei lunio a'i gyflawni ochr yn ochr ag ymwybyddiaeth o hawliau plant a phobl ifanc a dealltwriaeth ohonynt, yn enwedig os bydd hyn yn gallu golygu bod plant a phobl ifanc yn cael eu cefnogi i eiriol drostynt eu hunain.

3.10 p.m.

Taking all available evidence into account, we propose that the future provision of children's advocacy services should comprise, first and probably most importantly, the establishment of an independent national advocacy board, which would oversee the arrangements that we propose to put in place. I completely take on board the concerns expressed today and the committee's concerns about independence. I want to assure Christine Chapman and others that the board will include children and young people; that it will consist of non-Executive members; that it will take an independent, strategic overview of the development of advocacy services at all levels in Wales; that it will make recommendations to the Assembly on a range of matters relating to advocacy; that it will comment on commissioning arrangements made at local and regional levels, and that it will keep those under review; and that it will provide independent scrutiny of the new arrangements.

Gan ystyried yr holl dystiolaeth sydd ar gael, cynigiwn y dylai darparu gwasanaethau eirioli plant yn y dyfodol gynnwys, yn gyntaf ac efallai yn anad dim arall, sefydlu bwrdd eirioli cenedlaethol annibynnol, a fyddai'n goruchwyllo'r trefniadau y bwriadwn eu sefydlu. Derbyniaf yn llwyr y pryderon a fynegwyd heddiw ynghyd â phryder y pwyllgor am annibyniaeth. Hoffwn sicrhau Christine Chapman ac eraill y bydd y bwrdd yn cynnwys plant a phobl ifanc; y bydd yn cynnwys aelodau anweithredol; y bydd yn rhoi trosolwg annibynnol, strategol ar ddatblygiad gwasanaethau eirioli ar bob lefel yng Nghymru; y bydd yn cyflwyno argymhellion i'r Cynulliad ar ystod o faterion sy'n ymwneud ag eiriolaeth; y bydd yn rhoi sylwadau ar y trefniadau comisiynu a wneir ar lefel leol a rhanbarthol, ac y bydd yn adolygu'r rheini'n rheolaidd; ac y bydd yn craffu'n annibynnol ar y trefniadau newydd.

As far as we can identify, there is no such body of this kind in Europe; it is going to be a fundamentally new vehicle. The important role of children and young people—looking at recommendation 2, which we support in principle—is key to making this work, and I will reflect on that in looking at local commissioning arrangements.

Cyn belled ag y gallwn weld, nid oes dim corff o'r fath yn Ewrop; bydd yn yn gyfrwng sylfaenol newydd. Mae rôl bwysig plant a phobl ifanc—gan edrych ar argymhelliad 2, argymhelliad yr ydym yn ei gefnogi mewn egwyddor—yn allweddol i wneud i hyn weithio, a byddaf yn myfyrio ar hwnnw wrth edrych ar y trefniadau comisiynu lleol.

That leads me to the second point, which concerns the development of an advocacy development and performance unit to be set up in my department. We see that unit as having a key role in regulating advocacy services under the Care Standards Act 2000, ensuring that people working in the service have the necessary skills and training and are suitable to work with children and young people. The unit will also commission the national advocacy and advice service,

Mae hynny'n fy arwain at yr ail bwynt, sy'n ymwneud â sefydlu uned datblygu eiriolaeth a pherfformiad a gaiff ei sefydlu yn fy adran. Ystyriwn fod i'r uned honno rôl allweddol mewn rheoleiddio gwasanaethau eirioli dan Ddeddf Safonau Gofal 2000, gan sicrhau bod gan bobl sy'n gweithio yn y gwasanaeth y sgiliau a'r hyfforddiant angenrheidiol a'u bod yn addas i weithio gyda phlant a phobl ifanc. Bydd yr uned hefyd yn comisiynu'r gwasanaeth eirioli a chyngori cenedlaethol,

reporting on standards and outcomes, and commissioning, for example, specialist advocacy services for groups such as asylum seekers. We had a useful meeting yesterday with Refugee Voice Wales with Mark Isherwood, in which we recognised the need for those services.

The third important development is the national advocacy advice telephone service, which is to be available to all children and young people in Wales. This in line with recommendation 8 of the committee's report. The national advocacy and advice service will come into operation to provide a single point of contact via telephone, text and e-mail, seven days a week for all young people in Wales. We all agree that that is the way forward—linking with other support services.

Fourthly, there will be local and regional specialist integrated services for vulnerable children, to be commissioned through the children and young people's partnerships. At this point, I wish to say to Helen Mary and David that this is not about breaking the relationship with local government; it is about providing a local and regional integrated specialist advocacy service across health, social care and education, with a particular focus on statutory advocacy and broader support to assist vulnerable children and young people who wish to raise a concern or to make a complaint. It will include support for young people who want to appeal to the Special Educational Needs Tribunal for Wales.

This proposed new framework model would make the link between the voice of the child or young person and the services that they use and need. It will integrate and steer provision across Wales without undermining local responsibility.

Eleanor, recommendation 10 on service level agreements has been accepted, as has recommendation 12. We fully take on board the concept of three-year contracting, which will strengthen the independence of providers. Thank you, Christine and Helen Mary for raising that key point.

gan adrodd ar safonau a chanlyniadau, a chomisiynu, er enghraifft, wasanaethau eirioli arbenigol ar gyfer grwpiau megis ceiswyr lloches. Cawsom gyfarfod defnyddiol ddoe gyda Llais Ffoaduriaid Cymru gyda Mark Isherwood, lle cydnabuom yr angen am y gwasanaethau hynny.

Y trydydd datblygiad pwysig yw'r gwasanaeth teleffon cenedlaethol ar gyfer eiriolaeth a chyngor a fydd ar gael i'r holl blant a'r bobl ifanc yng Nghymru. Mae hyn yn unol ag argymhelliad 8 adroddiad y pwyllgor. Daw'r gwasanaeth ffôn eiriolaeth a chyngor cenedlaethol i rym i ddarparu un pwynt cyswllt drwy gyfrwng teleffon, negeseuon testun ac e-bost, saith niwrnod yr wythnos i'r holl bobl ifanc yng Nghymru. Cytunwn i gyd mai dyma'r ffordd ymlaen—gan gysylltu â gwasanaethau cymorth eraill.

Yn bedwerydd, bydd gwasanaethau integredig arbenigol lleol a rhanbarthol i blant sy'n agored i niwed, i gael eu comisiynu drwy'r partneriaethau plant a phobl ifanc. Ar y pwynt hwn, hoffwn ddweud wrth Helen Mary a David nad ymwneud â chwalu'r berthynas gyda llywodraeth leol y mae hyn; mae'n ymwneud â darparu gwasanaeth eirioli arbenigol integredig lleol a rhanbarthol ar draws meysydd iechyd, gofal cymdeithasol ac addysg, gyda ffocws penodol ar eiriolaeth statudol a chefnogaeth ehangach i gynorthwyo plant a phobl ifanc sy'n agored i niwed ac sy'n dymuno mynegi pryderon neu gwyno. Bydd yn cynnwys cefnogaeth i bobl ifanc sydd am apelio i Dribiwnlys Anghenion Addysgol Arbennig Cymru.

Byddai'r model hwn ar gyfer y fframwaith newydd arfaethedig yn gwneud y cysylltiad rhwng llais y plentyn neu'r unigolyn ifanc a'r gwasanaethau y mae'n eu defnyddio ac y mae arno'u hangen. Bydd yn integreiddio'r ddarpariaeth ac yn ei llywio ledled Cymru heb danseilio'r cyfrifoldeb lleol.

Eleanor, mae argymhelliad 10 ar gytundebau lefel gwasanaeth wedi'i dderbyn, felly hefyd argymhelliad 12. Derbyniwn yn llwyr y cysyniad o gontractio tair blynedd, gan gryfhau annibyniaeth darparwyr. Diolch ichi Christine a Helen Mary am godi'r pwynt allweddol hwnnw.

There continues to be a difference in views about what constitutes independence. We are committed to a review, but no-one has shown me that a nationally commissioned service would be more independent. That is the nub of this—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Please wind up your speech, Minister.

**Jane Hutt:** The Government and the Assembly have an enviable record of ensuring that the voice of children and young people is heard. The advocacy service that we, as a Government, are putting in place, with a review and scrutiny, is a further significant step towards realising children's and young people's rights in action.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I thank all Members for their thought-provoking and serious contributions to the debate on this serious matter. I do not have time to respond to everything that everyone has said. However, I wish to thank David Melding in particular for his kind words.

I agree with him that, if we had a secret ballot in this Chamber, the outcome would be in no doubt. I also agree with his comments about this opportunity to provide a gold-standard service and to be radical, as we were in our work on the children's commissioner. It is a matter of regret that the Government has not decided to do that.

I particularly want to pick up on Mark Isherwood's comments about the meaning of independence. It means not being subject to the control of others. We have a saying in Welsh, '*Diwedd y gân yw'r geiniog*', which means, literally, at the end of the song comes the penny, and is the equivalent of the saying 'He who pays the piper calls the tune'. After everything that the Minister has said today and our many discussions over recent months—for which I am grateful—I still do not understand how she cannot see that, if a service is paid for by service providers, it is not independent; moreover, it may not be perceived to be independent, which may be equally important.

Mae gwahaniaeth barn o hyd am yr hyn yw annibyniaeth. Yr ydym wedi ymrwmo i adolygiad, ond nid oes neb wedi dangos y byddai gwasanaeth a gomisiynir yn genedlaethol yn fwy annibynnol. Dyma hanfod hyn—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Dowch â'ch araith i ben, os gwelwch yn dda, Weinidog.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae gan y Llywodraeth a'r Cynulliad record i fod yn eiddigeddus ohoni wrth sicrhau bod llais plant a phobl ifanc i'w glywed. Mae'r gwasanaeth eirioli yr ydym ni, fel Llywodraeth, yn ei sefydlu, gyda phroses adolygu a chraffu, yn gam sylweddol pellach at wireddu hawliau plant a phobl ifanc ar waith.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Diolch i'r holl Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau crafog a difrifol i'r ddadl ar y mater difrifol hwn. Nid oes gennyf amser i ymateb i bopeth a ddywedodd pawb. Er hynny, hoffwn ddiolch i David Melding yn enwedig am ei eiriau caredig.

Cytunaf ag ef na fyddai dim amheuaeth ynglŷn â'r canlyniad petaem yn cynnal pleidlais gudd yn y Siambr hon. Cytunaf hefyd â'i sylwadau ynglŷn â'r cyfle hwn i gynnig gwasanaeth o'r radd flaenaf ac i fod yn radical, fel y buom yn ein gwaith ar y comisiynydd plant. Mae'n destun gofid nad yw'r Llywodraeth wedi penderfynu gwneud hynny.

Hoffwn yn benodol fynd ar drywydd sylwadau Mark Isherwood ynglŷn ag ystyr annibyniaeth. Yr hyn a olyga yw peidio â bod dan reolaeth eraill. Mae gennym ddywediad yn y Gymraeg, '*Diwedd y gân yw'r geiniog*', sy'n cyfateb i'r dywediad Saesneg '*He who pays the piper calls the tune*'. Wedi popeth y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i ddweud heddiw a'n trafodaethau lawer dros y misoedd diwethaf—ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar amdanynt—nid wyf yn deall eto sut na all hi weld nad yw gwasanaeth yn annibynnol os darparwyr gwasanaethau sy'n talu amdano; at hynny, mae'n bosibl na fydd yn ymddangos yn annibynnol, a gallai hynny fod yr un mor bwysig.



I want to respond briefly to a couple of points raised in the Minister's contribution. I am grateful for her positive comments about the committee's work, and for agreeing to delay the final decision until we undertook our review. When she refers to the previous consultation, she may remember that one reason why many organisations felt that our review was necessary was because the Government's consultation had not offered any options on commissioning. Therefore there was a question mark over whether organisations had been able to express their views fully.

The Minister expressed the Government's commitment to independent services, but she is still putting in place a model that does not deliver that, because children and young people's partnerships are partnerships of service providers. In our debate today, we have tended to focus on the most vulnerable children, or looked-after children, and that is understandable, but there is a range of other issues to consider. Angela Burns touched on mental health issues, for example, where young people need independent advocacy, and I am not yet convinced that that is what we are being offered. I am grateful that the Minister reiterated her commitment to reviewing this model, and I trust that when she undertakes that review, the Government will be prepared to look again at national commissioning.

It is clear that the Government will not currently move on national commissioning, but I very much welcome its commitment to include children and young people on the national board. I also suggest to Ministers that no active commissioners and no current service providers be present on that board, because if they are, it will simply not be able to act in an independent manner. That is essential.

I do not think that this debate is over. The Government has committed itself to carrying out a review, and I can assure the Minister that, although our committee will work

Hoffwn ymateb yn fyr i rai pwyntiau a godwyd yng nghyfraniad y Gweinidog. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am ei sylwadau cadarnhaol ynglŷn â gwaith y pwyllgor, ac am gytuno i ohirio'r penderfyniad terfynol nes inni gynnal ein hadolygiad. Wrth iddi gyfeirio at yr ymgynghoriad blaenorol, efallai ei bod yn cofio mai un rheswm pam yr oedd llawer o sefydliadau'n teimlo bod angen ein hadolygiad ni oedd oherwydd nad oedd ymgynghoriad y Llywodraeth wedi cynnig unrhyw opsiynau o ran comisiynu. Felly yr oedd amheuaeth am y cwestiwn a oedd sefydliadau wedi gallu mynegi eu safbwyntiau'n llawn.

Mynegodd y Gweinidog ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth i wasanaethau annibynnol, ond mae hi'n dal ati i gyflwyno model nad yw'n gwireddu hynny, oherwydd partneriaethau â ddarparwyr gwasanaethau yw'r partneriaethau plant a phobl ifanc. Yn ein dadl heddiw, yr ydym wedi tueddu i ganolbwyntio ar y plant sydd fwyaf agored i niwed, neu blant y gofelig amdanynt, ac mae hynny'n ddealladwy, ond mae yna amrywiaeth o faterion eraill i'w hystyried. Soniodd Angela Burns am faterion iechyd meddwl, er enghraifft, lle mae ar bobl ifanc angen eiriolaeth annibynnol, ac ni chefais fy argyhoeddi eto mai dyna'r hyn sy'n cael ei gynnig inni. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar bod y Gweinidog wedi ategu ei hymrwymiad i adolygu'r model hwn, a hyderaf, pan fydd hi'n cynnal yr adolygiad hwnnw, y bydd y Llywodraeth yn barod i ailedrych ar gomisiynu cenedlaethol.

Mae'n amlwg nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn fodlon symud ar gomisiynu cenedlaethol ar hyn o bryd, ond croesawaf yn fawr ei hymrwymiad i gynnwys plant a phobl ifanc ar y bwrdd cenedlaethol. Awgrymaf hefyd wrth y Gweinidogion na ddylai unrhyw gomisiynwyr gweithredol nac unrhyw ddarparwyr gwasanaethau presennol gael eu cynnwys ar y bwrdd hwnnw, oherwydd os cânt eu cynnwys ni fydd modd iddo weithredu'n annibynnol. Mae hynny'n hanfodol.

Ni chredaf fod y ddadl hon ar ben. Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi ymrwymo i gynnal adolygiad, a gallaf sicrhau'r Gweinidog, er y bydd ein pwyllgor yn gweithio mewn modd

constructively to try to make her model work, none of us believes that it will, and we will scrutinise carefully the outcomes of this model. I fully understand that there is work to be done on providing clarity, in sorting out who will provide the national helpline, and so on. If there is anything that our committee can do to support the Government in that, we will.

If any child, young person, or professional finds that the independence of their advocacy service, whether they receive or provide it, is compromised—and I fear that they will—I invite them to contact our committee, because we will be ready to listen. I would not go as far as to say that our committee will be all over the Government like a rash, but we will certainly be keeping it under close scrutiny.

I understand the Minister's commitment, but I do not understand why she is making this decision today. We will work with her to make this model work, if we can, but we reserve the right to come back and make it clear if it does not.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The proposal is to note the report of the Children and Young People Committee. Are there any objections? I see that there are none. In accordance with Standing Order No. 7.35, the motion is therefore agreed.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Dadl yn Ceisio Caniatâd y Cynulliad i Gyflwyno Mesur Arfaethedig Aelod ynghylch Ailgylchu**  
**Debate Seeking the Assembly's Leave to Introduce a Member Proposed Measure on Recycling**

**Nerys Evans:** Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 23.103:*

*yn caniatáu i Nerys Evans gyflwyno Mesur arfaethedig Aelod er mwyn gweithredu'r wybodaeth cyn y balot a gyflwynwyd ar 15 Chwefror 2008 dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif*

adeiladol i geisio gwneud i'w model hi weithio, nad oes yr un ohonom yn credu y bydd yn gweithio, ac y byddwn yn craffu'n ofalus ar ganlyniadau'r model hwn. Deallaf yn llwyr bod gwaith i'w wneud o ran rhoi eglurder, trefnu pwy fydd yn darparu'r llinell gymorth genedlaethol, ac yn y blaen. Os oes unrhyw beth y gall ein pwyllgor ni ei wneud i gefnogi'r Llywodraeth â hynny, fe'i gwawn.

Os bydd unrhyw blentyn, person ifanc neu weithiwr proffesiynol yn gweld bod annibyniaeth ei wasanaeth eirioli dan fygythiad, p'un a fydd yn ei gael ynteu'n ei ddarparu—ac ofnaf y bydd hyn yn wir—fe'u gwahoddaf i gysylltu â'n pwyllgor, oherwydd byddwn yn fodlon gwranddo. Ni fyddwn yn mynd mor bell â dweud y bydd ein pwyllgor yn cadw golwg ar bob symudiad o eiddo'r Llywodraeth, ond byddwn yn sicr yn craffu'n fanwl arni.

Gallaf ddeall ymrwymiad y Gweinidog, ond nid wyf yn deall pam y mae'n gwneud y penderfyniad hwn heddiw. Byddwn yn gweithio gyda hi i wneud i'r model hwn weithio, os gallwn, ond yr ydym yn cadw'r hawl i ddod yn ôl os nad yw'n gweithio a dweud hynny'n eglur.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Y cynnig yw nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc. A oes gwrthwynebiad? Gwelaf nad oes. Yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.35, felly, caiff y cynnig ei dderbyn.

**Nerys Evans:** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order No. 23.103:*

*grants leave for Nerys Evans to introduce a Member proposed Measure to give effect to the pre-ballot information tabled on 15 February 2008 under Standing Order No.*

23.102. (NDM3891)

Mae'n bleser gennyf gyflwyno'r cynnig hwn am Fesur arfaethedig gerbron y Cynulliad heddiw, a hoffwn ddiolch am y cyfle i wneud hynny. Dechreuaf drwy ddiolch i'r sawl sydd wedi fy nghefnogi wrth ddatblygu'r Mesur hwn, yn benodol swyddog gwleidyddol grŵp Plaid Cymru, Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad, a gwasanaeth ymchwil yr Aelodau a'r cyfreithwyr yn arbennig.

3.20 p.m.

Diben y Mesur arfaethedig yw gwneud y broses ailgylchu gwastraff yng Nghymru yn fwy tryloyw ac agored, drwy osod dyletswydd ar ein hawdurdodau lleol i adrodd yn flynyddol ar ble a sut y caiff ein gwastraff ei ailgylchu. Ar hyn o bryd, nid oes dyletswydd ar awdurdodau lleol i gadw cofnod o sut a ble y caiff ein gwastraff ei ailgylchu, i roi adroddiad i drigolion ardal yr awdurdod lleol am yr wybodaeth benodol honno, nac ychwaith i ystyried yr effaith ehangach. Heddiw, yr ydym yn trafod egwyddor y Mesur arfaethedig.

Mae'r cyngor cyfreithiol a gefais yn dangos yn glir fod gan y Cynulliad y pŵer i weithredu'r Mesur hwn. Nid yw'n ddibynnol ar y Gorchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol am reoli gwastraff sydd ar y gweill ar hyn o bryd. Ni allwn gyflwyno Mesurau sy'n ddibynnol ar gymhwysedd deddfwriaethol gan Orchmynion y gellir eu pasio yn y dyfodol. Rhaid i'r Mesurau y dymunwn eu cyflwyno ddod o dan cymhwysedd presennol y Cynulliad. Wedi dweud hynny, gallai unrhyw Fesur arfaethedig a gyflwynir o dan y mater perthnasol gael ei ddiwygio a'i gryfhau pe bai'r Gorchymyn ar reoli gwastraff yn dod i rym cyn i'r gwaith o ystyried y Mesur arfaethedig ddod i ben.

Daw'r Mesur hwn o dan fater 12.5(a):

Darparu ar gyfer ac o ran—

(a) trefniadau gan yr awdurdodau Cymreig perthnasol i sicrhau gwelliannau yn y modd y maent yn arfer eu swyddogaethau.

Wrth gyflwyno'r Mesur hwn, yr ydym wedi

23.102. (NDM3891)

It is a pleasure for me to present this motion for a proposed Measure before the Assembly today, and I am grateful for the opportunity to do so. I begin by thanking those who have supported me in developing the Measure, specifically the Plaid Cymru group's political officer, the Assembly Parliamentary Service, and particularly the Members' research service and lawyers.

The aim of the proposed Measure is to make the waste recycling process in Wales more transparent and open, by placing a duty on our local authorities to report annually on where and how they get their waste recycled. At the moment, local authorities have no duty to keep records of how and where their waste is recycled, to give residents of the local authority area a report outlining that specific information, or to consider the wider repercussions. Today, we are discussing only the principle of the proposed Measure.

The legal advice that I have been given states clearly that the Assembly already has the power to implement this Measure. It is not subject to the legislative competence Order on waste management that is currently in the pipeline. We are not permitted to introduce Measures that rely on getting legislative competence from Orders that could be passed in future. The Measures that we want to introduce must come within the Assembly's existing competence. Having said that, any proposed Measure introduced under the relevant matter could be amended and reinforced if the LCO on waste management were enacted before the work of scrutinising the proposed Measure was complete.

This Measure comes under matter 12.5(a):

'Provision for and in connection with—

(a) the making of arrangements by relevant Welsh authorities to secure improvement in the way in which their functions are exercised'.

In introducing this Measure, we have held in-

trafod yn helaeth gyda chyfreithwyr ynglŷn â manylder y Mesur a'i effaith mewn realiti ar weithredoedd ein hawdurdodau lleol. Y gobaith yw y bydd y Mesur, gyda chefnogaeth y Cynulliad, yn canolbwyntio ar sicrhau bod ein llywodraethau lleol yn casglu gwybodaeth oddi wrth y cwmnïau y maent yn anfon eu gwastraff atynt, sef y proseswyr, o ran ble a sut yn union y caiff y gwastraff ei ailgylchu.

Hoffwn nodi dau bwynt cyn dechrau ar y drafodaeth. Caiff llawer o wastraff Cymru ei allforio i wledydd megis Tsieina, Brasil ac India, ac mae'n anghenraid o dan reoliadau Ewrop i'r cwmnïau hyn gadw'r wybodaeth am leoliad y gwaith ailgylchu. Hoffwn hefyd esbonio un pwynt hanfodol yn y ddadl hon. Nid yw hwn mewn unrhyw fodd yn ymosodiad ar ein hawdurdodau lleol am allforio ailgylchu, nac ychwaith ydyw'r Mesur hwn yn fecanwaith i geisio atal allforio. Mewn nifer o achosion, allforio yw'r unig ddewis o ran ailgylchu.

Mae ystyriaethau masnachol yn bwysig i'r ddadl, ac yr ydym yn derbyn llongau enfawr yn llawn nwyddau rhad o'r gwledydd hyn, ac mae modd dadlau ei bod yn werth llenwi'r llongau gyda gwastraff i'w ailgylchu cyn eu hanfon yn ôl, yn hytrach na'u hanfon yn ôl yn wag. Mae'n ddadl werdd gref iawn y mae angen ei hystyried. Felly, nid wyf o reidrwydd yn erbyn yr egwyddor o allforio gwastraff i'w ailgylchu, a rhaid cofio bod gwastraff yn cael ei drin fel cynwydd. Dyma ymgais i wneud y broses yn fwy tryloyw ac agored.

Hoffwn esbonio pa reoliadau sydd ar waith cyn symud ymlaen i drafod y Mesur mewn manylder. Yr ydym mewn sefyllfa i geisio normaleiddio ailgylchu, ac mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi gosod targedau heriol yn y maes hwn. Mae'r Llywodraeth am weld Cymru yn datblygu i fod yn fodel o reoli gwastraff yn gynaliadwy, ac mae ganddi darged i ailgylchu 40 y cant o'n gwastraff erbyn 2010. Yn 2002-03, 12.7 y cant oedd y gyfradd ailgylchu yng Nghymru, ond yr oedd wedi codi i 27.6 y cant erbyn 2006-07. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn gobeithio cynyddu ar y targed hwn ar ôl 2010, ac mae angen ei llongyfarch ar osod y targed heriol hwn.

depth discussions with lawyers about the detail of the Measure and what it would mean in reality for our local authorities' operations. I hope the Measure, with the Assembly's approval, will concentrate on ensuring that our local government gathers information from the companies to whom they send their waste, namely the processors, about exactly where and how that waste gets recycled.

I wish to note two points before commencing the discussion. A great deal of Wales's waste is shipped to countries such as China, Brazil and India, and it is a requirement of European regulations that those companies keep data about the recycling sites. I want to explain one critical point in this debate. This is not in any way an attack on our local authorities for exporting waste for recycling, nor is the Measure a mechanism to try to prevent exports. In several cases, export is the only option for recycling.

Commercial considerations are important to this debate, and we accept that huge shipments full of cheap goods arrive on the shores of this country, and it is could be argued that it would be better to fill those ships with waste for recycling on their way back than to send them back empty. That is a very strong green argument that needs to be given consideration. Therefore, I am not necessarily opposed to the principle of exporting waste for recycling, and we must bear in mind that waste can be treated as fuel. This is merely an attempt to make the process more transparent and open.

I want to explain which regulations are in force before moving on to discuss the Measure in detail. We are in the position of trying to normalise recycling, and the Assembly Government has set challenging targets in this area. The Government wants Wales to develop to be a model of sustainable waste management, and it has a target of recycling 40 per cent of our waste by 2010. In 2002-03, Wales recycled 12.7 per cent of its waste, but that figure had increased to 27.6 per cent by 2006-07. The Government hopes to increase that target again after 2010, and so we must congratulate it on setting such a demanding target.

Mae newid meddylfryd am ailgylchu yn hanfodol, a chredaf ein bod wedi dod ymhell o ran normaleiddio ailgylchu. Mae'n siŵr ein bod oll yn gyfarwydd â hysbysebion teledu Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd ynglŷn ag ailgylchu, 'Dyma'n dyfodol ni. Peidiwch â'i wastraffu'. Mae'n neges bwerus a chryf ac mae'n effeithiol wrth beri i bobl feddwl am eu gwastraff yng nghyd-destun ehangach newid yn yr hinsawdd a dyfodol ein plant.

Gwelsom awdurdodau yn derbyn y sialens hon ac yn magu perchnogaeth o'r mater o ailgylchu. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r darlun yn gyson drwy Gymru. Mae rhai ardaloedd yn anodd eu cyrraedd oherwydd cost neu resymau tebyg. Yn anffodus, yn amlach na pheidio, ardaloedd gwledig yw'r rhain. Mae'n siŵr gennyf fod Aelodau Cynulliad sy'n cynrychioli ardaloedd gwledig, yn enwedig, wedi derbyn gohebiaeth yn gofyn am fwy o ddarpariaeth ailgylchu, neu, mewn rhai achosion, darpariaeth ailgylchu gyffredinol y mae pobl mewn ardaloedd trefol yn ei chymryd yn ganiataol.

Ar un agwedd, mae'n codi calon rhywun i weld bod angen cyfleusterau ailgylchu ar ein cymunedau, ond mae'n peri pryder bod rhwystredigaethau yn y system sy'n golygu nad yw pawb yng Nghymru yn cael yr un safon o ran gwasanaeth ailgylchu. Ceir enghreifftiau o bobl yn ein cymunedau yn cydweithio i hwyluso'r gwaith o ailgylchu. Mae prosiect ailgylchu yn Nhrefdraeth yn enghraifft wych o bobl leol yn gweld yr angen am gyfleustra ailgylchu lleol yn sgîl diffyg gwasanaeth gan yr awdurdod lleol. Cychwynnodd y cynllun yn mis Ionawr, ac mae wedi denu mwy na 250 o aelodau yn y ddau fis cyntaf—dros draean o boblogaeth y pentref—ac mae wedi ailgyfeirio 4 tonnell o wastraff o dirlenwi.

Dechreuodd y cynllun ar ôl i drigolion y pentref deimlo rhwystredigaeth gan nad oedd gogledd sir Benfro yn rhan o gynllun casglu gwastraff i'w ailgylchu Cyngor Sir Penfro, nac yn rhan o'i gynlluniau ailgylchu yn y dyfodol ychwaith. Mae'r cynllun yn cael ei redeg yn annibynnol gan cwmni preifat o bentref cyfagos yn Eglwyswrw, ac mae'r bagiau yn cael eu darparu gan Planed drwy

Changing people's mindset about recycling is essential, and I believe we have come a long way towards normalising recycling. Surely, we are all familiar with the Environment Agency's television advertisements, 'It's our future. Please don't throw it away'. It is a powerful and strong message, and is effective in making people think about their waste in the wider context of climate change and our children's future.

We have seen authorities rise to this challenge, and take ownership over the issue of recycling. However, that picture is not consistent across Wales. Some areas are harder to reach because of costs or similar reasons. Unfortunately, more often than not, those are rural areas. I am sure that particularly those Assembly Members who represent rural areas will have received correspondence asking for more recycling provision, or, in some cases, for the general recycling provision that people who live in urban areas take for granted.

In one respect, it is encouraging that there is a clear need in our communities for recycling facilities, but it is a cause of concern that there are frustrations within the system which mean that not everyone in Wales receives the same standard of recycling services. There are examples of people in our communities collaborating to make recycling easier. There is a recycling project in Newport, Pembrokeshire, which is an excellent example of local people seeing the need for local facilities because of a lack of service from the local authority. The scheme started in January, and attracted more than 250 members in the first two months—more than a third of the population of the village—and it has redirected 4 tons of waste away from landfill.

The scheme started as a result of a feeling of frustration within the community, because north Pembrokeshire was not part of Pembrokeshire County Council's recycling scheme, nor was there any intention that it should become part of it in the future. The scheme is run independently by a private company in the nearby village of Eglwyswrw, and the bags are provided by

gynllun strategol ailgylchu y Cynulliad. Dylid canmol trigolion Trefdraeth am y cynllun hwn, ac mae'n dangos yn glir fod yr angen yn bodoli yn ein cymunedau i fod yn gydwytbodol ac i ymgymryd yn rhagweithiol ag ailgylchu. Mae dyletswydd arnom i wneud ailgylchu mor hawdd â phosibl i bobl Cymru.

Planned through the Assembly's strategic recycling scheme. The people of Newport should be praised for this scheme, which shows clearly that there is a need in our communities to engage proactively in terms of recycling. We have a duty to make recycling as easy as possible for the people of Wales.

Mae gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ddyletswydd i osod targedau ailgylchu, ac mae gan awdurdodau lleol ddyletswydd i ddarparu'r gwasanaethau priodol, ond, yn y pen draw, mae ailgylchu yn ddyletswydd personol.

The Assembly Government has a duty to set recycling targets, and local authorities are duty bound to provide appropriate services, but, ultimately, recycling is a personal duty.

Mae'r egwyddor gyffredinol ynglŷn ag ailgylchu yn hollbwysig, ac mae'n cael cydnabyddiaeth a phwyslais ar lefel Ewropeaidd, Prydeinig a hefyd o fewn y Cynulliad. Mae'r egwyddor yn syml, sef y dylid delio â gwastraff mor agos â phosibl i'r man lle cafodd ei greu. Mae'r egwyddor agosrwydd yn hanfodol, a rhaid ei chadw mewn cof wrth ddatblygu'r Mesur, gyda chaniatâd y Cynulliad.

The general principle of recycling is vital, as is recognised and emphasised on a European, British and Assembly level. The principle is simple: waste should be dealt with as close as possible to where it is created. The proximity principle is vital, and must be borne in mind as we develop this Measure, with the Assembly's agreement.

Mae budd clir i'w gael o ddatblygu diwydiant ailgylchu yng Nghymru. Dengys ystadegau'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd fod llawer mwy o swyddi yn cael eu creu ym maes ailgylchu o'i gymharu â maes tirlenwi, a, dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf, mae cyfradd y twf o ran swyddi yn y maes hwn yn fwy nag yn sectorau diwydiannau eraill.

There are obvious benefits in developing recycling industries in Wales. European Commission statistics show that far more jobs are created in recycling than in landfill, and, over the last few years, the growth rate in this area in terms of jobs has been higher than in other industrial sectors.

Pan gynigir prisiau is i awdurdodau lleol am allforio eu gwastraff, dylem ganmol y rheiny sy'n defnyddio cwmnïoedd lleol pan fo'n addas. Fodd bynnag, ffactor bwysig yn y ddadl ailgylchu yng Nghymru yw'r gallu i ailgylchu. Mae'r sefyllfa ar hyn o bryd yn golygu nad oes gennym y cyfleusterau yng Nghymru na'r Deyrnas Unedig i ailgylchu ein holl wastraff.

When local authorities face lower costs for exporting waste, we should applaud those that use local companies, where appropriate. However, an important factor in this argument about recycling in Wales is the ability to recycle. The current position means that we do not have the facilities in Wales or in the United Kingdom to recycle all of our waste.

Un o oblygiadau'r Mesur yw y bydd yn datgelu lleoliadau ailgylchu ein gwastraff, ac felly byddwn yn gwybod yn union beth sydd yn mynd i ba le, faint ohono yn union sy'n mynd yno, a'r math o wastraff sy'n cael ei allforio. Y gobaith felly yw y bydd y Mesur yn agor y ddadl o ran adeiladu a datblygu'r cyfleusterau hynny yng Nghymru.

One of the implications of the Measure is that, in revealing the location of the recycling of our waste, we will know exactly where waste goes, how much is recycled and what kind of waste is exported. It is hoped, therefore, that this will generate a debate on building and developing these facilities in Wales.

Mae'n ddyhead gan sawl cwmni ailgylchu yng Nghymru a'r Deyrnas Unedig ymestyn a datblygu, ac mae'r potensial ganddynt i wneud hynny, ond gan nad oes ffigurau clir a chadarn i ddangos i ble y mae ein gwastraff yn mynd a sut mae'n cael ei ailgylchu, nid ydynt yn gwybod yn erbyn pwy y maent yn cystadlu, na pha wastraff sy'n mynd i ble. Nid bwriad y Mesur yw atal ailgylchu—rhaid pwysleisio hynny—ac nid wyf o reidrwydd yn erbyn allforio gwastraff, ond bydd gwneud y broses yn fwy agored yn rhoi cyfle i gwmnïoedd o Gymru gystadlu.

Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn gydwybodol o ran prosesau'r gwledydd hynny sy'n ailgylchu ein gwastraff. Yr ydym oll wedi clywed straeon am reolau llafur llac ac amheus yn rhai o'r gwledydd hyn, ac mae llawer o ymchwil i ddangos bod prosesu gwastraff mewn rhai gwledydd sy'n datblygu yn beryglus i iechyd y gweithwyr. Ni fyddai neb yn dymuno meddwl am blant a phobl mewn gwledydd eraill yn cael eu hecsbloetio er mwyn i'n gwastraff ni gael ei ailgylchu am bris rhad. Mae ymchwil a wnaed gan Plaid Cymru y llynedd yn dangos bod rhai awdurdodau lleol yn gwybod i ble mae eu gwastraff ailgylchu'n mynd i gael ei brosesu, ond nad yw rhai eraill yn gwybod i ble mae'n mynd.

Yn ôl y disgwyl, mae sawl rheoliad o Ewrop yn y maes hwn, ac un o'r rhai mwyaf sylfaenol yw'r rheoliad ar symud gwastraff. Mae un elfen o'r rheoliad hwnnw yn galluogi gwrthwynebu allforio gwastraff i'w ailgylchu i wlad sydd â safonau trin is na'r wlad sy'n ei allforio. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cydymffurfio â'r rheoliadau hynny. Yn sgîl y rheoliadau, mae rôl bwysig gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd. Mae angen ystyried hefyd allforio gwastraff yn anghyfreithlon i'w ailgylchu. Mae hynny'n cynyddu, yn ôl ystadegau o Ewrop.

Oherwydd y dyletswyddau hyn, gellid trafod y manylder o ran asesiadau o effaith amgylcheddol a chymdeithasol yng Nghyfnod nesaf y Mesur, os yw'r Cynulliad yn cytuno ag egwyddor y Mesur. Edrychaf ymlaen at drafod y manylion, gyda chaniatâd y Cynulliad.

Several recycling companies in Wales and the United Kingdom are aspiring to expand and develop, and they have the potential to do that, but as there are no clear and firm figures to show where our waste goes and how it is recycled, they do not know whom they are competing against, or which waste goes where. The Measure's intention is not to prevent recycling—that must be emphasised—and I am not necessarily against exporting waste, but making the process more open will give companies from Wales more opportunity to compete.

It is important that we are conscientious with regard to the processes used by those countries that recycle our waste. We have all heard stories about lax and dubious labour regulations in some of these countries, and there is a lot of research to show that processing waste in some developing countries is dangerous to workers' health. Nobody wants to think that children and people in other countries are being exploited so that our waste is recycled cheaply. Research done by Plaid Cymru last year shows that, while some local authorities know where their recyclable waste goes to be processed, others do not.

As one might expect, there are many European regulations in this area, and one of the most fundamental is the regulation on moving waste. One element in that regulation means that there can be opposition to exporting waste for recycling to a country which has lower standards for dealing with it than the exporting country. It is important that we conform to those regulations. As a result of the regulations, the Environment Agency has an important role. There is also a need to consider the illegal export of waste to be recycled. That is increasing, according to European statistics.

As a result of these duties, we could discuss the details of environmental and social impact assessments during the next Stage of the Measure, if the Assembly agrees in principle to the Measure. I look forward to discussing the details, with the Assembly's agreement.

3.30 p.m.

A report can be generated by local authorities, detailing the proportion of each type of recyclable waste sent for recycling overseas, and to which country it is dispatched. The information must legally be held by the dispatch agents, so collecting it, particularly where it is in electronic form, should not be problematic or time-consuming for local authorities. The cost and bureaucracy of fulfilling the Measure's requirements will decrease over time as processes become streamlined. I have received a great deal of support from various organisations for the principle of the Measure, for which I am grateful. I will end with a quotation from Cylch, a recycling organisation based in Cardiff, which sums up the principle behind the Measure well:

'Cylch is very pleased that the Assembly is discussing making the destination of Wales's waste resources an important issue. We don't want our valuable materials, worth £50 per tonne and rising for the mixture we collect, being sent half way round the world to Chinese or Indian markets when we could make better use of them here for the benefit of Welsh people. We want to see value being added here, creating Welsh jobs and creating Welsh wealth'.

**The Minister for Environment, Sustainability and Housing (Jane Davidson):** Thank you, Nerys, for your thoughtful proposition. The Government very strongly supports the principle of ensuring the highest possible social and environmental standards for the recycling of waste generated in Wales. We also fully support transparency, and believe that it is in everyone's interest to know what is happening to the waste, particularly when they have diligently separated it out for recycling. We want to strongly endorse the principle of the Measure proposed here today.

It is important to demonstrate how far we have come in what is a very short time. Nerys, you mentioned the figure of 26 per cent for the latest full-year performance of

Gall awdurdodau lleol lunio adroddiad, yn rhoi manylion am gyfran pob math o wastraff i'w ailgylchu sy'n cael ei anfon dramor i'w ailgylchu, ac i ba wlad y caiff ei anfon. Mae'r gyfraith yn nodi ei bod yn ofynnol i asiantau sy'n anfon gwastraff gadw'r wybodaeth hon, felly ni ddylai ei chasglu, yn enwedig os yw ar ffurf electronig, fod yn broblem i awdurdodau lleol, ac ni ddylai gymryd llawer o amser. Bydd y gost a'r fiwrocratiaeth sy'n gysylltiedig â chyflawni gofynion y Mesur yn lleihau ymhén amser wrth i'r prosesau gael eu symleiddio. Yr wyf wedi cael llawer o gefnogaeth gan amrywiol sefydliadau i egwyddor y Mesur, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am hynny. Yr wyf am gloi gyda dyfyniad gan Cylch, sefydliad ailgylchu yng Nghaerdydd, sy'n crynhoi'n dda yr egwyddor y mae'r Mesur yn seiliedig arni:

Mae Cylch yn falch iawn fod y Cynulliad yn trafod i ble mae adnoddau gwastraff Cymru'n cael eu hanfon a gwneud hynny'n fater pwysig. Nid oes arnom eisiau gweld ein deunydd gwerthfawr, gwerth £50 y dunnell am y gwahanol eitemau yr ydym yn eu casglu, ac yn codi o hyd, yn cael eu hanfon hanner y ffordd o amgylch y byd i farchnadoedd yn Tsieina neu India, pan allem wneud gwell defnydd ohonynt yma er budd pobl Cymru. Mae arnom eisiau gweld ychwanegu gwerth yma, gan greu swyddi a chyfoeth yng Nghymru.

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynaliadwyedd a Thai (Jane Davidson):** Diolch, Nerys, am eich cynnig meddylgar. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn cefnogi'n gryf iawn yr egwyddor o sicrhau'r safonau cymdeithasol ac amgylcheddol uchaf posibl ar gyfer ailgylchu gwastraff a gynhyrchir yng Nghymru. Yr ydym hefyd yn gwbl gefnogol i eglurder, a chredwn ei bod o fudd i bawb wybod beth sy'n digwydd i'r gwastraff, yn enwedig pan fyddant wedi ei ddidoli'n ofalus ar gyfer ei ailgylchu. Yr ydym yn awyddus i gefnogi'n gryf egwyddor y Mesur sy'n cael ei gynnig yma heddiw.

Mae'n bwysig dangos pa mor bell yr ydym wedi dod mewn cyfnod byr iawn. Cyfeiriech, Nerys, at y ffigur o 26 y cant ar gyfer perfformiad blwyddyn lawn diweddaraf



local authorities. In fact, looking at the half-year figures from last year, we are already up to 33 per cent, so we are seeing quite dramatic increases in recycling. I am consulting with local government over future waste management targets, and the Assembly will know already that I am looking to a recycling rate of 70 per cent. If we want to move towards that kind of rate, we need to be very clear about what we do with our recyclate.

It is part of our strategy to ensure that we have the capacity to deal with those higher levels of recycling and treatment of waste. You have identified, and we have identified in work on the waste strategy, that that capacity is not there at the moment. However, work is going on apace with local authority consortia to procure recycling services and plant. Members will be aware that substantial additional funding has been put in place to support this work, including £182 million over the next three years through the sustainable waste management grant, £15 million through the regional capital access fund over two years and millions of additional pounds of support through Waste Awareness Wales and other initiatives.

In order to avoid the potential creation of recyclate mountains with no outlet for the material, it is crucial that we find adequate markets for the recyclate separated out by Welsh householders. The example that you gave of the village of Newport in Pembrokeshire, which has had the support of Planed, clearly demonstrates that a village can rise to the challenge in terms of recycling. We know that a number of Welsh businesses can already use Welsh recyclate and would want to do more. These businesses include the UPM Shotton paper mill and the Excel Industries Ltd factory in Rhymney. We have provided additional money for an automated plastic bottle sorter to help Welsh manufacturing companies that need high-quality segregated plastic waste. There are many industrial operations in Wales already using recyclate from Wales and from the rest of the UK, and sometimes from abroad, such as Corus, Celsa Steel UK Ltd, IMCO Recycling UK Ltd and Kronospan Holdings

awdurdodau lleol. Mewn gwirionedd, o edrych ar y ffigurau hanner blwyddyn ers y llynedd, yr ydym eisoes wedi cyrraedd 33 y cant, felly, yr ydym yn gweld cynnydd dramatig iawn yn y ganran ailgylchu. Yr wyf yn ymgynghori â llywodraeth leol ynglŷn â thargedau rheoli gwastraff yn y dyfodol, a bydd y Cynulliad eisoes yn gwybod fy mod yn awyddus i sicrhau cyfradd ailgylchu o 70 y cant. Os ydym i sicrhau cyfradd o'r fath, mae angen inni fod yn glir iawn ynglŷn â'r hyn a wnawn â'n deunydd ailgylchu.

Rhan o'n strategaeth yw sicrhau bod gennym y gallu i ymdopi â mwy o waith ailgylchu a thrin gwastraff. Yr ydych wedi nodi, ac yr ydym ninnau wedi nodi mewn gwaith ar y strategaeth wastraff, nad oes gennym y gallu ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer iawn o waith wedi ei wneud gyda chonsortia awdurdodau lleol er mwyn caffael gwasanaethau a chyfarpar ailgylchu. Bydd yr Aelodau'n ymwybodol bod swm sylweddol o arian ychwanegol wedi'i neilltuo i gefnogi'r gwaith hwn, gan gynnwys £182 miliwn yn ystod y tair blynedd nesaf drwy'r grant rheoli gwastraff cynaliadwy, £15 miliwn drwy'r gronfa defnyddio cyfalaf rhanbarthol dros ddwy flynedd, a miliynau o bunnoedd o gymorth ychwanegol drwy'r Cynllun Craff am Wastraff a chynlluniau eraill.

Er mwyn osgoi posibilrwydd creu mynyddoedd o ddeunydd ailgylchu nad oes unman iddo fynd, mae'n bwysig iawn inni ddod o hyd i ddigon o farchnadoedd ar gyfer y deunydd ailgylchu sy'n cael ei ddioli gan ddeiliaid tai yng Nghymru. Mae'r enghraifft y cyfeiriasoch ati ym mhentref Trefdraeth yn sir Benfro, sydd wedi cael cefnogaeth Planed, yn dangos yn glir y gall pentref ateb yr her sy'n gysylltiedig ag ailgylchu. Gwyddom fod nifer o fusnesau Cymru eisoes yn gallu defnyddio deunydd ailgylchu o Gymru ac y byddent yn hoffi gwneud mwy. Mae'r busnesau hyn yn cynnwys melin bapur UPM yn Shotton a ffatri Excel Industries Ltd yn Rhymni. Yr ydym wedi darparu arian ychwanegol ar gyfer didolwr poteli plastig awtomatig i helpu cwmnïau gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru sydd ag angen gwastraff plastig ar wahân o safon uchel arnynt. Mae llawer o gwmnïau diwydiannol yng Nghymru sydd eisoes yn defnyddio deunydd ailgylchu o Gymru ac o weddill y DU, ac weithiau o

Ltd. We are also planning to invest further in creating greater markets for recyclate in Wales and a new recyclate market development plan is currently under development.

We have put additional resources into the waste and resources action programme to create and expand markets for recyclate in Wales, and it is envisaged that regional selective assistance, Assembly investment grants and convergence funding can also provide grant support where required. However, it is a fact that some of the successful increases in recycling in the short-term in Wales have only been possible because of overseas recycling market capacity. We will need to continue to rely on that capacity for several years to come, so I am grateful to you, Nerys, for clarifying that your Measure, as proposed, is not looking to stem the export market but make it even more responsible. We fully accept that—we want to make sure that Welsh recyclate that is sent abroad is handled according to high environmental and social standards. We have a statutory duty to promote sustainable development in everything that we, and those that we fund, do. Legal mechanisms are already in place in respect of the environmental angle, as you outlined, but it is equally important that we ensure that workers handling Welsh recyclate abroad are adequately protected and that there is no exploitation of child labour. We and our local authorities must make a stand in this matter.

We also need to ensure that, in maximising the use by Welsh businesses, we have high quality recyclate. We know that this is achieved most sustainably through source separation. We need the right infrastructure, we need to achieve best value for money, and we need to provide this in a joined-up way. As you said, this needs to be done according to the proximity principle of it being as local as possible. We also need higher-value markets for recyclate. We need to work

wledydd tramor, megis Corus, Celsa Steel UK Ltd, IMCO Recycling UK Ltd a Kronospan Holdings Ltd. Yr ydym hefyd yn bwriadu buddsoddi mwy o arian i greu marchnadoedd mwy ar gyfer deunydd ailgylchu yng Nghymru, ac mae cynllun newydd i ddatblygu marchnad ar gyfer deunydd ailgylchu'n cael ei baratoi ar hyn o bryd.

Yr ydym wedi darparu adnoddau ychwanegol ar gyfer y rhaglen weithredu ar wastraff ac adnoddau i greu ac ehangu marchnadoedd ar gyfer deunydd ailgylchu yng Nghymru, a disgwylir y gall cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol, grantiau buddsoddi'r Cynulliad a'r gronfa gydgyfeirio hefyd ddarparu cymorth grant lle mae angen. Fodd bynnag, y gwir amdani yw bod rhywfaint o'r cynnydd llwyddiannus mewn ailgylchu yn y tymor byr yng Nghymru wedi bod yn bosibl oherwydd y farchnad ailgylchu dramor yn unig. Bydd angen inni barhau i ddibynnu ar y farchnad honno am flynyddoedd eto, felly, yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi, Nerys, am egluro nad ceisio atal y farchnad allforio yw bwriad eich Mesur chi, fel y mae wedi'i gynnig, ond ei gwneud yn fwy cyfrifol fyth. Derbyniwn hynny'n llwyr—yr ydym yn awyddus i sicrhau bod deunydd ailgylchu o Gymru sy'n cael ei anfon dramor yn cael ei drin yn ôl safonau amgylcheddol a chymdeithasol uchel. Mae gennym ddyletswydd statudol i hybu datblygu cynaliadwy ym mhopeth a wnawn ni a'r rheini yr ydym yn eu hariannu. Mae mecanweithiau cyfreithiol wedi'u llunio ar gyfer yr agwedd amgylcheddol, fel y soniech, ond mae hi lawn mor bwysig inni sicrhau bod gweithwyr sydd dramor yn trin deunydd ailgylchu o Gymru yn cael eu diogelu'n ddigonol, ac na chaiff plant eu defnyddio i wneud y gwaith. Rhaid i ni a'n hawdurdodau lleol wneud safiad ar y mater hwn.

Yn ogystal â hyn, wrth gynyddu'r defnydd a wneir gan fusnesau Cymreig, mae angen inni sicrhau bod gennym ddeunydd ailgylchu o safon uchel. Gwyddom mai'r ffordd fwyaf cynaliadwy i wneud hyn yw drwy ddioli'r deunydd yn y ffynhonnell. Mae arnom angen y seilwaith priodol, mae angen inni sicrhau'r gwerth gorau am arian, ac mae angen inni ddarparu hyn mewn ffordd gydgyssylltiedig. Fel y dywedech, mae angen gwneud hyn yn unol ag egwyddor cadw pethau'n lleol, a

closely with business to ensure a market for recyclates in Wales and a sufficient supply of recyclates for that market.

In the context of the Measure itself, WasteDataFlow—the national municipal waste database managed by the Environment Agency—already exists to monitor flows of municipal waste materials up to a point. The database is used by local authorities to demonstrate that they are meeting the legal requirements of the Landfill Allowances Scheme (Wales) Regulations 2004. For example, the paper and card that they report as being recycled on the database must in fact have been recycled. Local authorities experience difficulty in providing adequate information on recyclate that is sent abroad. We will be working with the Environment Agency and with local authorities to ensure that better information is provided about the ultimate destination and fate of the materials that are sent for recycling, and a summary of this information will be made available to the public for each local authority.

The shipment of recyclates overseas for recovery is subject to regulatory controls, particularly through the Transfrontier Shipment of Waste Regulations 2007. I am concerned about the potential for improper, and potentially illegal, export of municipal wastes from Wales to EU countries or to developing countries. The illegal shipment of waste abroad is totally unacceptable, and I take the matter extremely seriously.

Some opportunities already exist for us to help improve compliance with controls on the export of waste for recycling. These include a duty of care, together with an expansion of policing, monitoring and prosecuting those who abuse the existing legislation, and we are reviewing that legislation on the duty of care in partnership with the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs. This will include placing a general duty of care on

chadw'r deunydd mor lleol ag sy'n bosibl. Mae arnom hefyd angen marchnadoedd gwerthu uwch ar gyfer deunydd ailgylchu. Mae angen inni weithio'n agos gyda busnesau i sicrhau marchnad ar gyfer deunydd ailgylchu yng Nghymru a chyflenwad digonol o ddeunyddiau ailgylchu ar gyfer y farchnad honno.

Yng nghyd-destun y Mesur ei hun, mae WasteDataFlow—y gronfa ddata genedlaethol ar gyfer gwastraff trefol, sy'n cael ei rheoli gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd—eisoës yn bod er mwyn monitro llif deunyddiau gwastraff trefol at ryw bwynt. Defnyddir y gronfa ddata gan awdurdodau lleol er mwyn dangos eu bod yn bodloni gofynion cyfreithiol Rheoliadau'r Cynllun Lwfansau Tirlenwi (Cymru) 2004. Er enghraifft, rhaid i'r papur a'r cardiau y maent yn eu cofnodi yn y gronfa ddata fel rhai sy'n cael eu hailgylchu fod wedi'u hailgylchu mewn gwirionedd. Mae'n anodd i awdurdodau lleol ddarparu digon o wybodaeth am ddeunydd ailgylchu sy'n cael ei anfon dramor. Byddwn yn gweithio gydag Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd ac awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau darparu gwell gwybodaeth am gyrchfan derfynol a thynged y deunyddiau sy'n cael eu hanfon i'w hailgylchu, a bydd crynodeb o'r wybodaeth hon ar gyfer pob awdurdod lleol ar gael i'r cyhoedd.

Mae deunydd ailgylchu sy'n cael ei anfon dramor i'w drin yn dod dan reoliadau, yn fwyaf arbennig Rheoliadau Cludo Gwastraff ar Longau Trawsffiniol 2007. Yr wyf yn bryderus ynglŷn â'r posibilrwydd y gallai gwastraff trefol amhriodol, ac anghyfreithlon o bosibl, gael ei allforio o Gymru i wledydd yr UE neu i wledydd sy'n datblygu. Mae cludo gwastraff anghyfreithlon dramor yn gwbl annerbyniol, ac yr wyf yn ystyried y mater yn ddifrifol iawn.

Mae gennym rai cyfleoedd eisoës i helpu gwella cydymffurfio â rheolaethau'n ymwneud ag allforio gwastraff i'w ailgylchu. Mae'r rhain yn cynnwys dyletswydd gofal, ynghyd â chynyddu plismona, monitro ac erlyn y rheini sy'n torri'r ddeddfwriaeth bresennol, ac yr ydym yn adolygu'r ddeddfwriaeth honno ar y ddyletswydd gofal mewn partneriaeth ag Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig. Bydd hyn yn

those involved in the export of waste and the possibility of a specific offence in relation to transferring waste in which the person transferring it knows, or ought to reasonably suspect, that it is being or will be illegally exported.

In strongly endorsing the principle, I would highlight a number of issues that will need to be explored further as we move towards a Measure. Any new proposals need to be workable and enforceable. For example, we will need to consider how to factor in the difficulties of tracking the onward movement of materials once they have left Wales. Trade between China, the Philippines and Vietnam, for example, could not be monitored under Welsh legislation. As part of our strategy to achieve higher rates of recycling and treatment of waste, we need to continue to use overseas recycling facilities while we also look at the issue of how to create more of our own.

A number of environmental and sustainable development arguments support the use of European-derived recycle in Asia, which you have outlined. Much of the material incorporated in products made in Asia ends up as waste in Europe, and it makes sound environmental sense for these products to go back to Asia.

In closing, I hope that Members will take into account the improvements that we are already proposing. These include a grant requirement for local authorities to require their contractors to report destination information, the publication of the information via WasteDataFlow, and a grant requirement for local authorities to include an ethical standard in their contracts for the management of the recycle that they collect from households. Putting this on a statutory basis would be an excellent example of the Assembly Government and local authorities implementing our statutory sustainable development duty and an example of Wales leading the way in the UK. I welcome the proposal.

cynnwys gosod dyletswydd gofal gyffredinol ar y rheini sy'n ymwneud ag allforio gwastraff, a phosibilrwydd creu tramgwydd penodol yn ymwneud â throsglwyddo gwastraff lle mae'r sawl sy'n ei drosglwyddo'n gwybod, neu lle dylai amau o fewn rheswm, ei fod neu y bydd yn cael ei allforio'n anghyfreithlon.

Wrth gefnogaeth'r egwyddor yn gryf, hoffwn dynnu sylw at nifer o faterion y bydd angen ymchwilio ymhellach iddynt wrth inni symud tuag at Fesur. Mae angen i unrhyw gynigion newydd fod yn gynigion y gellir eu gweithredu a'u gorfodi. Er enghraifft, bydd angen inni ystyried sut i gynnwys yr anawsterau wrth geisio olrhain symud deunyddiau ymlaen ar ôl iddynt adael Cymru. Ni ellid monitro masnach rhwng Tsieina, Ynysoedd y Philipinos a Fiet-nam, er enghraifft, dan ddeddfwriaeth Cymru. Fel rhan o'n strategaeth i sicrhau cyfraddau uwch o ailgylchu a thrin gwastraff, mae angen inni barhau i ddefnyddio cyfleusterau ailgylchu tramor ac ystyried hefyd sut y gallwn greu mwy o'n cyfleusterau ein hunain.

Mae nifer o'r dadleuon ym maes datblygu amgylcheddol a chynaliadwy'n cefnogi defnyddio deunydd ailgylchu o Ewrop yn Asia, ac amlinellwyd y rhain gennych. Mae llawer o'r deunydd a ddefnyddir mewn cynhyrchion yn Asia yn dod i ddiwedd eu hoes fel gwastraff yn Ewrop, ac mae'n gwneud synnwyr, o safbwynt yr amgylchedd, i'r cynhyrchion hyn fynd yn ôl i Asia.

Cyn cloi, yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd yr Aelodau'n ystyried y gwelliannau yr ydym eisoes yn eu cynnig. Mae'r rhain yn cynnwys amod yn y grant i awdurdodau lleol sy'n ei gwneud yn ofynnol i'w contractwyr ddarparu gwybodaeth am gyrchfan deunyddiau, a chyhoeddi'r wybodaeth drwy WasteDataFlow. Mae amod grant hefyd ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol i gynnwys safon foesegol yn eu contractau ar gyfer rheoli'r deunydd ailgylchu a gasglant o gartrefi. Byddai rhoi hyn ar sail statudol yn enghraifft wych lle byddai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ac awdurdodau lleol yn cyflawni ein dyletswydd statudol ym maes datblygu cynaliadwy, ac yn enghraifft lle byddai Cymru'n arwain y ffordd yn y DU. Yr wyf yn croesawu'r cynnig.

3.40 p.m.

**Darren Millar:** Yr wyf yn falch o'r cyfle i gyfrannu at y ddadl hon ar ailgylchu. Mae'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig yn hapus i gefnogi'r Mesur arfaethedig, ac yr ydym yn croesawu'r cynnig yn fawr. Mae ymdrech fawr yn cael ei gwneud i ddelio â gwastraff ailgylchu, felly, dylai pobl Cymru cael gwybod yn union beth sy'n digwydd i'r gwastraff hwnnw.

If nothing else, there is a pressing need at least to develop a structure of transparent accountability with regard to the end destination of our recyclable waste. At present, the end result is somewhat cloudy. We have all, quite rightly, encouraged and promoted recycling over the years, but there is now a real danger that, unless the outcome of these efforts is clarified, the positive message that has so far been so successful, particularly at a domestic level, could find itself in serious trouble. With more and more people concerned about the environment and willing to take meaningful steps to reduce the size of our collective ecological footprint, there is more of a need to be responsible and to ensure that the whole process is working and is transparent from start to finish.

People are slowly becoming aware of the fact that much of our recyclable waste is being processed abroad, in countries such as Turkey, China, India—and Nerys Evans also mentioned Brazil. One national newspaper recently devoted an article to the so-called farce of Britain's recycled waste that is exported thousands of miles across the globe. I accept that there has to be some exporting of waste, where necessary, particularly while we build up our capacity to process that waste here. Nearly 13 million tonnes of recyclable waste was shipped to 75 countries from the UK last year and people will become much more interested in what is happening to their recycled plastic bottles, paper, and so on, in the future as awareness of recycling increases. However, it was not reassuring to read recently that, while a fair proportion of councils in Wales acknowledge that at least a proportion of their recyclable waste is exported, a fair number also seemed to indicate, as Nerys pointed out, that they

**Darren Millar:** I am pleased to be able to contribute to this debate on recycling. The Welsh Conservatives are happy to support the proposed Measure, and we very much welcome the proposal. There is considerable effort to deal with recyclable waste, therefore, the people of Wales should know exactly what happens to that waste.

Yn anad dim, mae gwir angen inni o leiaf ddatblygu strwythur atebolrwydd eglur ar gyfer cyrchfan derfynol ein gwastraff sy'n cael ei ailgylchu. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r canlyniad terfynol braidd yn aneglur. Mae pob un ohonom, yn gwbl briodol, wedi annog a hybu ailgylchu dros y blynyddoedd, ond mae perygl gwirioneddol yn awr, oni chaiff canlyniad yr ymdrechion hyn yn cael ei egluro, y gallai'r neges gadarnhaol sydd wedi bod mor llwyddiannus hyd yn hyn, yn enwedig ar lefel ddomestig, fod mewn trafferthion difrifol. Gyda mwy a mwy o bobl yn poeni am yr amgylchedd ac yn barod i gymryd camau ystyrlon i leihau maint ein hól troed ecolegol cyfunol, mae mwy o angen inni fod yn gyfrifol a sicrhau bod y broses gyfan yn gweithio, a'i bod yn eglur o'r dechrau i'r diwedd.

Mae pobl yn dod yn ymwybodol yn raddol o'r ffaith fod llawer o'n gwastraff ailgylchu yn cael ei brosesu dramor, mewn gwledydd fel Twrci, Tsieina, India—a Brasil hefyd, yn ôl Nerys Evans. Neilltuodd un papur newydd cenedlaethol erthygl yn ddiweddar i ffars honedig gwastraff ailgylchu Prydain sy'n cael ei allforio filoedd o filltiroedd ar draws y byd. Yr wyf yn derbyn ei bod yn rhaid allforio rhywfaint o wastraff, lle mae angen, yn enwedig wrth inni ddatblygu ein gallu i brosesu'r gwastraff hwnnw yma. Cludwyd bron i 13 miliwn o dunelli o wastraff ailgylchu mewn llongau o'r DU i 75 o wledydd y llynedd, a bydd gan bobl lawer iawn mwy o ddiddordeb yn yr hyn sy'n digwydd i'r poteli plastig, y papur ac ati a anfonant i'w hailgylchu yn y dyfodol wrth i ymwybyddiaeth gynyddu am ailgylchu. Fodd bynnag, darllenais yn ddiweddar fod cyfran dda o gynghorau Cymru yn cydnabod bod cyfran o leiaf o'u gwastraff ailgylchu'n cael ei allforio, ond yn anffodus fod nifer

did not know where their waste was ending up.

If the Measure is supported and handled correctly, it could be used as an incentive to encourage waste producers to recycle more, allowing members of the public and businesses to see precisely where their recyclable waste is going. Hopefully, it will help us to meet the challenging targets that have been set by the Welsh Assembly Government. As Nerys Evans also said, it could help Welsh businesses to develop indigenous additional capacity to process recyclable waste—companies such as Omnia Recycling, which is establishing itself in my constituency.

However, one area of concern—and it is an area where careful thought must be given—is the administration of such a proposal. With local government already swamped under ridiculous amounts of red tape and record keeping, much care needs to be taken to ensure that, if a Measure is forthcoming, it will not increase the bureaucratic burden on local authorities. Unfortunately, the Welsh Assembly Government has a poor reputation when it comes to layering additional bureaucracy on local authorities. For this proposal to succeed, we need to ensure that local authorities are consulted and that they will not have to suffer a further drain on their resources and that any system that is put in place will be effective, both in terms of management and results if the Measure moves forward. Many good ideas and what should be simple procedures have been lost in the complicated tangle of red tape, and that is something that I would not support. Therefore, while I support the proposed Measure, as does my party, care must be taken not to complicate the matter.

The proposal before us has the potential to provide us with important information that we currently lack, and could help us all in Wales to have more confidence in the recycling process from beginning to end.

Gobeithiaf y bydd y cynnig hwn yn rhoi mwy o hyder i Gymru ynglŷn ag ailgylchu. Mae angen gwybodaeth er mwyn sicrhau bod y broses o ailgylchu yn cyflawni ei phwrpas.

gweddol, fel y dywedodd Nerys, nad oeddent yn gwybod i ble yr oedd eu gwastraff yn mynd.

Petai'r Mesur yn cael ei gefnogi a'i drafod yn briodol, gellid ei ddefnyddio fel cymhelliant i annog cynhyrchwyr gwastraff i ailgylchu mwy, er mwyn i'r cyhoedd a busnesau allu gweld i ble'n union y mae eu gwastraff ailgylchu'n mynd. Bydd hyn, gobeithio, yn ein helpu i gyrraedd y targedau heriol sydd wedi eu gosod gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Fel y dywedodd Nerys Evans hefyd, gallai helpu busnesau Cymru i ddatblygu'r gallu i brosesu gwastraff ailgylchu yma yng Nghymru—cwmnïau fel Omnia Recycling, sy'n cael ei sefydlu yn fy etholaeth i.

Fodd bynnag, un agwedd sy'n peri pryder—ac mae'n agwedd y mae angen ei hystyried yn ofalus—yw sut y caiff cynnig o'r fath ei weinyddu. Mae llywodraeth leol eisoes yn boddhi dan domennydd o dâp coch a gwaith cadw cofnodion, ac mae angen bod yn ofalus iawn i sicrhau, os cyflwynir Mesur, na fydd yn ychwanegu at faich biwrocraidaidd awdurdodau lleol. Yn anffodus, mae gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru enw gwael am ychwanegu at faich biwrocraidaidd awdurdodau lleol. Er mwyn i'r cynnig hwn lwyddo, mae angen inni sicrhau ein bod yn ymgynghori ag awdurdodau lleol. Rhaid sicrhau nad oes mwy o bwysau ar eu hadnoddau, ac y bydd unrhyw system a gyflwynir yn effeithiol, o ran rheolaeth a chanlyniadau, os bydd y Mesur yn mynd yn ei flaen. Mae llawer o syniadau da, a threfniadau a ddylai fod yn rhai syml, wedi eu colli yn nryswch cymhleth y tâp coch, ac mae hynny'n rhywbeth na fyddwn yn ei gefnogi. Felly, er fy mod i a'm plaid yn cefnogi'r Mesur arfaethedig, rhaid inni fod yn ofalus i beidio â chymhlethu'r mater.

Gallai'r cynnig sydd ger ein bron roi gwybodaeth bwysig inni nad yw gennym ar hyn o bryd, a gallai helpu pob un ohonom yng Nghymru i fod yn fwy hyderus yn y broses ailgylchu o'i dechrau i'w diwedd.

I hope this proposal gives Wales more confidence on recycling issues. Information is required in order to ensure that the recycling process fulfils its intentions.

Felly, cefnogaf y cynnig hwn.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I am delighted that Welsh Labour is welcoming this Measure on recycling. Many people would not have been aware of the information that you have provided, Nerys. All of the hard work and effort that goes into recycling is ruined by the thought of the exploitation and possible health and safety hazards in poorer parts of the world. Therefore, I congratulate you on this proposed Measure and for the work that you are doing on it. We will be happy to support it all of the way through.

The recycling record across all local authorities in Wales is very varied. My constituency crosses two authorities, so I can see the vast difference in the recycling targets achieved. In the Vale of Glamorgan, 18.75 per cent of municipal waste was recycled last year, but in Cardiff, our capital city, only 8.19 per cent was recycled, so Cardiff remains at the bottom of the recycling league in Wales. That is despite the multi-million pound investment in the state-of-the-art recycling plant on our doorstep, at Lamby Way. I understand that some waste is being shipped to the far east for treatment; I was not previously aware of that. That is shameful. While I accept that we may not have the capacity to deal with all of the recycling, I cannot accept that people would not be aware of that and not be able to do something about it. It is an ethical issue for me, as it should be for all of our councils—they should not think it is right to do that. Here we are in Cardiff, possibly exposing children—research that we have undertaken shows that child labour and cheap labour is used for this—to our rubbish, which can be contaminated.

I am a great champion of autoclaving—which means that all your rubbish can be put out together, and it is then cleaned, sterilised and sorted mechanically—but until we get such a system, without manual handling, we must try to keep recyclable waste separate and not contaminate it. I have read that in some countries, children sort through this stuff. Who knows what they are handling: there could be broken glass, and it could be

Therefore, I support the proposal.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Yr wyf yn falch iawn bod Llafur Cymru'n croesawu'r Mesur hwn ar ailgylchu. Mae llawer o bobl na fyddent yn ymwybodol o'r wybodaeth a ddarparwyd gennych, Nerys. Mae'r holl waith caled a'r ymdrech i ailgylchu yn cael eu difetha gan y syniad o gamfanteisio a pheryglon iechyd a diogelwch posibl mewn rhannau tlotach o'r byd. Felly, yr wyf yn eich llongyfarch ar y Mesur arfaethedig hwn a'r gwaith yr ydych yn ei wneud. Byddwn yn falch o'i gefnogi bob cam ar ei daith.

Mae record ailgylchu pob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru yn amrywiol iawn. Mae fy etholaeth i'n croesi dau awdurdod, felly, gallaf weld y gwahaniaeth enfawr yn y targedau ailgylchu a gyrhaeddir. Ym Mro Morgannwg, cafodd 18.75 y cant o wastraff dinesig ei ailgylchu y llynedd, ond yng Nghaerdydd, ein prifddinas, dim ond 8.19 y cant a gafodd ei ailgylchu. Felly, mae Caerdydd yn dal ar waelod y cynghrair ailgylchu yng Nghymru., a hynny er gwaethaf y buddsoddiad gwerth miliynau yn y gwaith ailgylchu diweddaraf ar stepen ein drws, yn Lamby Way. Deallaf fod rywfaint o wastraff yn cael ei gludo mewn llongau i'r dwyrain pell i'w drin; ni wyddwn i hynny. Mae hynny'n warth. Er fy mod yn derbyn nad yw'r gallu gennym efallai i ddelio â'r holl ailgylchu, ni allaf dderbyn na fyddai pobl yn ymwybodol o hynny ac na allent wneud rhywbeth yn ei gylch. Mae'n fater moesegol i mi, fel y dylai fod i'n cynghorau i gyd—ni ddylent feddwl ei bod yn iawn gwneud hynny. Dyma ni yng Nghaerdydd, o bosibl yn caniatáu i blant—mae ymchwil a wnaed gennym yn dangos bod llafur plant a llafur rhad yn cael eu defnyddio ar gyfer hyn—ddod i gysylltiad â'n sbwriel ni, a allai fod wedi ei halogi.

Yr wyf yn gryf o blaid awtoclafio—sy'n golygu bod modd rhoi eich sbwriel i gyd allan gyda'i gilydd, a'i fod yn cael ei lanhau, ei ddiheintio a'r ddidoli'n fecanyddol wedyn—ond nes cawn ni system o'r fath, heb drin â llaw, rhaid inni geisio cadw gwastraff ailgylchadwy ar wahân a pheidio â'i halogi. Yr wyf wedi darllen bod plant, mewn rhai gwledydd, yn didoli'r deunydd hwn. Pwy a wŷr beth y maent yn ei drafod: gallai fod

contaminated with all sorts of waste products. If we are exploiting these countries and encouraging the use of child labour, then all of the effort that we put into recycling is just not worth the price. We need to ensure that our rubbish meets a clean and ethical end and I hope that this Measure will go a long way towards ensuring that.

**Paul Davies:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar o gael y cyfle i gyfrannu i'r ddadl hon. Hoffwn hefyd longyfarch Nerys am ddod â'r Mesur pwysig hwn gerbron y Cynulliad. Fel y dywedodd Darren, yr ydym ni ar yr ochr hwn o'r Siambr yn gefnogol iawn o'r Mesur.

Credaf mai newid yn yr hinsawdd yw un o'r heriau mwyaf yr ydym yn ei wynebu ac mae'n debygol o gael effaith difrifol yn y ganrif hon. Mae gan bob un ohonom ran i'w chwarae—y Llywodraeth, cymunedau, teuluoedd, cwmnïau ac unigolion. Byddwn oll yn elwa o amgylchedd gwyrddach a glanach. Mae'n amlwg bod gormod o wastraff yn mynd i safleoedd tirlenwi. Mae angen i ni ailgylchu gwastraff yn fwy effeithiol a lleihau ar y deunydd pacio sy'n mygu cymaint o gynnyrch. Yr wyf yn falch bod y Mesur hwn yn cael ei gyflwyno: mae'n bryd cynnal adolygiad cyffredinol o ailgylchu yng Nghymru a chredaf y bydd y Mesur hwn yn arwain at hynny.

Yn anffodus, mae'n amlwg o'r dystiolaeth gan gynghorau lleol bod ein gwastraff i'w ailgylchu yn cael ei allforio i wledydd datblygol heb i ni wybod canlyniadau hynny. Nid yw hynny'n gwneud synnwyr o ran lleihau allyriadau carbon. Am rhy hir, mae cynghorau lleol—ac fel y dywedodd Nerys, ni allwn eu beio nhw'n unig—wedi bod yn allforio gwastraff i wledydd eraill gan fod pwysau arnynt gan y cyhoedd i ailgylchu, ac, mewn rhai amgylchiadau, nad oes dewis arall.

Mae hefyd yn amlwg nad yw'r arian wedi ei fuddsoddi mewn technoleg i drin gwastraff i'w ailgylchu yng Nghymru. Mae'n hanfodol bod llywodraethau ar bob lefel yn buddsoddi arian digonol mewn cynyddu gwasanaethau ailgylchu. Wrth anfon y gwastraff hwn dramor, nid oes un ohonom yn gwybod pa effaith y bydd yn ei gael ar ein hamgylchedd.

gwydr wedi torri yno, a gallai fod wedi'i halogi â phob math o gynnyrch gwastraff. Os ydym yn ymwela ar y gwledydd hyn ac yn eu hannog i ddefnyddio llafur plant, yna nid yw ein holl ymdrech i ailgylchu yn werth y pris. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod ein sbwriel yn cyrraedd pen draw glân a moesegol i'w daith, a gobeithio y bydd y Mesur hwn yn mynd ymhell tuag at sicrhau hynny.

**Paul Davies:** I am grateful for the opportunity to contribute to this debate. I also wish to congratulate Nerys for bringing this important Measure before the Assembly. As Darren has said, we, on this side of the Chamber, are very supportive of the Measure.

I believe climate change is one of the biggest challenges facing us and it is likely to have a serious effect on this century. All of us have a role to play—the Government, communities, families, companies and individuals. We will all benefit from a greener and cleaner environment. It is obvious that too much waste goes to landfill sites. We need to recycle waste more effectively and reduce the amount of packaging used with so much produce. I am glad that this Measure has been introduced: it is high time to conduct a general review of recycling in Wales, and I believe this Measure will lead to that.

Unfortunately, it is obvious from the evidence from local councils that our recyclable waste is exported to developing countries without us knowing the results of that. It does not make sense in terms of reducing carbon emissions. For far too long, local councils—and as Nerys said, we cannot blame them alone—have been exporting waste to other countries due to public pressure on them to recycle, and in some cases there is no other option.

It is also obvious that the money has not been invested in technology in Wales to deal with recyclable waste. It is crucial that governments on all levels invest sufficient funding to increase recycling services. In sending this waste abroad, none of us can know what effect this will have on our environment. In fact, I am sure that many



Yn wir, yr wyf yn siŵr nad yw llawer o bobl yn gwybod bod ein gwastraff yn cael ei anfon dramor. Ni wyddom am yr effaith y mae hyn yn ei gael ar yr amgylchedd, nac am ei effaith yn gymdeithasol. Ni wyddom am yr amodau y mae'r bobl sy'n gorfod trin ein gwastraff ym mhen draw'r byd yn gorfod eu dioddef.

3.50 p.m.

A ydyw'r amodau hynny'n dderbyniol? Yn syml, nid ydym yn gwybod. Credaf fod gennym gyfrifoldeb moesol i wybod pa effaith a gaiff hyn ar y bobl sy'n gorfod ymdrin â'n gwastraff ni ym mhen draw'r byd. Nid oes yr un ohonom yn ymwybodol o ansawdd yr ailgylchu yn rhai o'r gwledydd tramor hyn ychwaith. A ydyw'r ansawdd yn dderbyniol o ran ein safonau ni? Unwaith eto, nid ydym yn gwybod. Beth yw'r pwynt i ni yng Nghymru gredu ein bod yn gyfrifol pan ydym, mewn realiti, yn hollol anghyfrifol drwy adael i'n gwastraff fynd dramor heb wybod beth yw'r canlyniadau? Mae'n hanfodol ein bod oll yn meddwl yn hollfydol ac yn gweithredu'n lleol. Mae'r Mesur hwn yn hollbwysig gan y byddai'n sicrhau bod ein cynghorau lleol yn gweithredu'n gyfrifol. Mae gennym oll yr hawl i wybod pa effaith y mae ein gwastraff yn ei gael ar yr amgylchedd a'r byd. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r broses fasnachu hon yn cael ei chynnal heb i ni wybod beth yw'r costau amgylcheddol a chymdeithasol yma a thramor. Felly, mae'n hen bryd ein bod oll yn cael gwybod beth yw'r effaith ar ein hamgylchedd er mwyn ein plant a dyfodol y blaned. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd y Mesur hwn yn egluro'r effaith hwn ac felly yn ein gorfodi i newid ein dulliau a sut yr ydym yn ymdrin â'n gwastraff.

Llongyfarchaf Nerys am gyflwyno'r Mesur hwn, a byddaf yn ei gefnogi gant y cant, a gobeithiaf y bydd pob Aelod Cynulliad yn gwneud yr un peth.

**Michael German:** I welcome this Measure, and I thank Nerys for bringing it forward. It is absolutely right that Members who bring Measures forward at this stage should be given the right to develop their proposals. I am pleased that the Minister has accepted it in that spirit, although I wish to reflect on some of what she has said, because when the Measure is produced, there are some test beds

people are unaware that our waste is actually sent abroad. We do not know what effect this has environmentally or socially. We do not know what type of conditions people who deal with waste on the other side of the world have to suffer.

Are those conditions acceptable? We simply do not know. I believe we have a moral responsibility to know what effect this has on the people who have to deal with our waste on the other side of the world. None of us is aware of the quality of recycling in some of these foreign countries. Is the quality acceptable in terms of our standards? Once again, we do not know. What is the point of us in Wales believing that we are being responsible when, in reality, we are being completely irresponsible in letting our waste to go abroad without knowing the implications? It is crucial that we all think globally and act locally. This Measure is so important in that it will make sure that our local councils will act responsibly. We all have the right to know what effect our waste has on the environment and on the world. At present, this commercial process goes ahead without us knowing what the environmental and social effects are here and abroad. Therefore, it is high time that we all find out what the implications are for the environment, for our children and for the future of this planet. I hope that this Measure will clarify this effect and therefore force us to change the way we deal with waste.

I congratulate Nerys on introducing this Measure, and I will support it 100 cent. I hope all Assembly Members will do likewise.

**Michael German:** Croesawaf y Mesur hwn, a diolchaf i Nerys am ddo ag ef gerbron. Mae'n hollol iawn y dylai Aelodau sy'n dod â Mesurau gerbron yn y cyfnod hwn gael yr hawl i ddatblygu eu cynigion. Yr wyf yn falch fod y Gweinidog wedi ei dderbyn yn yr ysbryd hwnnw, er fy mod am bwysu a mesur rhywfaint o'r hyn y mae wedi'i ddweud, oherwydd pan gaiff y Mesur ei gynhyrchu,

that I know that she will be looking for, and which we may also be looking for.

The issue of sending recyclable waste abroad first came to the public eye in 2004 when *The Guardian* published that infamous article that stated that a third of the UK's rubbish was being dumped in China. I do not know whether *The Guardian* got its numbers right, but it gave the issue a public profile. There is a danger that if we do not consider this in a cold light we will not see what is happening to what we place outside our front doors for recycling.

I agree with some of the comments made by Labour Party here, but I wish to reflect on what the Minister said. She referred to an ethical framework for sending waste out of the country. It is perfectly reasonable to send waste to other countries if it is going to be used by those countries or in neighbouring countries. If it will be used in the manufacturing processes in those developing countries, and will help their industries or be used in products, there may well be a very strong ethical reason for doing that. Therefore, it would be unwise to rule this out.

I was told the other day by people who export old ambulances from Wales that if you go to Jamaica or many parts of Africa, you will find Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust ambulances being used to provide services in those countries. It is a perfectly reasonable for us to do that: we are recycling a product that we do not want and it is being used in other countries. We must therefore be careful about what we say about exporting waste, and must consider the consequences in full.

In Nerys's Measure I would also look for a direction of travel for the Welsh Assembly Government. One of the big problems with having 22 local authorities is that all of them are doing their own thing in terms of recycling. Thank you for the notice about Cardiff: of course, the great news is that it is now fourth from the bottom of the list—in

mae yna rai meinciau arbrofi y gwn y bydd yn chwilio amdanynt, a hwyrach y byddwn ni hefyd yn chwilio amdanynt.

Daeth mater anfon gwastraff ailgylchadwy dramor i olwg y cyhoedd gyntaf yn 2004 pan gyhoeddodd *The Guardian* yr erthygl ddrwg-enwog honno a ddywedodd fod traean sbwriel y DU yn cael ei ddympio yn Tsieina. Ni wn a oedd ffigurau *The Guardian* yn gywir, ond rhoddodd broffil cyhoeddus i'r mater. Mae perygl, onid ystyriwn ni hyn mewn golau oer, na welwn yr hyn sy'n digwydd i'r hyn a roddwn y tu allan i ddrws y ffrynt i gael ei ailgylchu.

Cytunaf â rhai o'r sylwadau a wnaethpwyd gan y Blaid Lafur yma, ond hoffwn bwysu a mesur yr hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog. Cyfeiriodd at fframwaith moesegol o ran anfon gwastraff o'r wlad. Mae'n gwbl resymol anfon gwastraff i wledydd eraill os caiff ei ddefnyddio gan y gwledydd hynny neu mewn gwledydd cyfagos. Os caiff ei ddefnyddio yn y prosesau gweithgynhyrchu yn y gwledydd hynny sy'n datblygu, ac os bydd yn help i'w diwydiannau neu'n cael ei ddefnyddio mewn cynnyrch, mae'n dra phosibl fod rheswm moesegol cryf dros wneud hynny. Felly, byddai'n annoeth diystyru hyn.

Dywedwyd wrthyf y dydd o'r blaen gan bobl sy'n allforio hen gerbydau ambiwlans o Gymru, os ewch chi i Jamaica neu lawer rhan yn Affrica y gwelwch chi gerbydau ambiwlans Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwllans Cymru yn cael eu defnyddio i ddarparu gwasanaethau yn y gwledydd hynny. Mae'n hollol resymol inni wneud hynny: yr ydym yn ailgylchu cynnyrch nad oes arnom ei eisiau ac mae'n cael ei ddefnyddio mewn gwledydd eraill. Rhaid inni fod yn ofalus, felly, am yr hyn a ddywedwn am allforio gwastraff, a rhaid inni ystyried y canlyniadau'n llawn.

Ym Mesur Nerys byddwn hefyd yn chwilio am gyfeiriad teithio i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Un o'r problemau mawr o gael 22 o awdurdodau lleol yw bod pob un ohonynt yn dilyn ei drywydd ei hun o ran ailgylchu. Diolch ichi am y rhybudd am Gaerdydd: wrth gwrs, y newyddion da yw ei bod bellach yn bedwerydd o waelod y rhestr—yn yr hen

the old days, I might have said that the three below it were all Labour councils, but now there are fewer than three, and I do not know which councils are below Cardiff. Progress is being made, but if the authorities are doing what they can to recycle, they will find their own markets for what they are doing, which could be in Kent, as was said, or any part of the country. The regional waste strategies for collecting together and finding marketplaces for the recyclate are therefore crucial. There is a role here for the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure that the regional waste strategies deal with the recyclate in a way that ensures its best and most appropriate use. I hope that Nerys will reflect on that in what she is attempting to do in this Measure.

It is absolutely right that we should count waste and know where it is sent. However, it may be almost impossible to track some of this waste when it has passed through two or three hands. There are companies in Cardiff that are recycling waste from other Welsh authorities, and sending it on to other companies in the United Kingdom. That goes to other companies in turn, and eventually might go outside of the country. There is a route that can be tracked, but it is a complicated one, and I hope that Nerys's Measure will describe how those exporting waste at third or fourth hand will be able to report back to the source local authority. I hope that that part of the Measure will come into force, and will be clear, because it is important that we know this.

I support the idea of there being an ethical process for sending our recyclable waste abroad, but we need a broader statement of what is ethical, which would encompass the waste sent to a country being used by that country and being seen to benefit the economy of that country, and there being no child labour involved and so on. That is crucial. We can try to do our best to ensure that that is included in the Government's process.

Therefore, I welcome this stage of the Measure. I welcome the opportunity for

ddyddiau, efallai y byddwn wedi dweud bod y tri o dani i gyd yn gynghorau Llafur, ond bellach mae llai na thri, ac ni wn pa gynghorau sydd islaw Caerdydd. Mae yna gynnydd, ond os yw'r awdurdodau'n gwneud yr hyn a allant i ailgylchu, byddant yn dod o hyd i'w marchnadoedd eu hunain ar gyfer yr hyn y maent yn ei wneud, a allai fod yng Nghaint, fel y dywedwyd, neu unrhyw ran o'r wlad. Mae'r strategaethau gwastraff rhanbarthol ar gyfer casglu deunydd eildro ynghyd a dod o hyd i farchnadoedd iddo yn dyngedfennol, felly. Mae rôl yma i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau bod y strategaethau gwastraff rhanbarthol yn delio â deunydd eildro mewn ffordd sy'n sicrhau ei ddefnyddio yn y ffordd orau a mwyaf priodol. Gobeithio y bydd Nerys yn ystyried hynny yn yr hyn y mae'n ceisio'i wneud yn y Mesur hwn.

Mae'n hollol iawn y dylem gyfrif gwastraff a gwybod i ble y caiff ei anfon. Fodd bynnag, efallai y bydd bron yn amhosibl olrhain rhywfaint o'r gwastraff hwn pan fydd wedi mynd drwy ddau neu dri pâr o ddwylo. Mae cwmnïau yng Nghaerdydd sy'n ailgylchu gwastraff oddi wrth awdurdodau eraill yng Nghymru, ac yn ei anfon ymlaen i gwmnïau eraill yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae hwnnw'n mynd i gwmnïau eraill yn eu tro, a maes o law gallai fynd allan o'r wlad. Mae yna lwybr y gellir ei olrhain, ond mae'n un cymhleth, a gobeithio y bydd Mesur Nerys yn disgrifio sut y gall y rheini sy'n allforio gwastraff am y drydedd neu'r bedwaredd waith adrodd yn ôl i'r awdurdod lleol y tarddodd y gwastraff ohono. Gobeithio y daw'r rhan honno o'r Mesur i rym ac y bydd yn glir, oherwydd mae'n bwysig inni wybod hyn.

Cefnogaf y syniad y dylid cael proses foesebol i anfon ein gwastraff ailgylchu dramor, ond mae arnom angen datganiad ehangach ar yr hyn sy'n foesebol, a fyddai'n cwmpasu defnyddio gwastraff sy'n cael ei anfon i wlad gan y wlad honno a'i fod yn amlwg o fudd i economi'r wlad honno, ac na ddefnyddir llafur plant yn y broses, ac ati. Mae hynny'n hollbwysig. Gallwn geisio gwneud ein gorau i sicrhau bod hynny'n cael ei gynnwys ym mhroses y Llywodraeth.

Felly, croesawaf y cam hwn o'r Mesur. Croesawaf y cyfle i Nerys ei ddatblygu

Nerys to further develop it, but I share some of the concerns expressed by the Minister in that the details must be tied up, and I look forward to seeing them in the document that will follow.

**Nerys Evans:** I thank you all for your contributions. Thank you, Minister, for your support for the principle of the Measure. As you mentioned, transparency is key to the Measure. I am pleased that recycling has increased from the figures that I have for 2006-07. As you said, the investment from the Welsh Assembly Government in this is substantial and that is why it is important to identify gaps in the market in order to make the best use of Welsh Assembly Government funds in Wales. The principle of making the Measure workable and enforceable is vital. We do not want to make Measures in Wales for the sake of it. Those two important principles should underlie the process of developing this Measure.

Darren, llongyfarchiadau ar dy gyfraniad gwych yn y Gymraeg—da iawn ti.

You mentioned companies in your constituency, and we should be looking at this from a Wales-wide perspective. The burden on local government is a concern, but I believe that the benefits outweigh the concerns that you raised. It is a legal requirement that information is held about where processors send their waste, therefore, as I mentioned in my opening speech, it should not be too burdensome to track where the waste is sent.

Lorraine and Paul both mentioned the ethical issue and that people recycle in good faith, but are not aware of where their waste is being recycled at the moment. If local authorities cannot tell us where their waste is being recycled, it is no wonder that the people of Wales do not know and are shocked to hear the statistics. On the other hand, we do not want to deter anyone from recycling. That is not the objective of the Measure. It is an opportunity to get a fuller picture and to develop the recycling industry in Wales.

Mike, you mentioned the details. Obviously,

ymhellach, ond yr wyf yn deall rhai o'r pryderon a fynegwyd gan y Gweinidog ei bod yn rhaid rhoi trefn ar y manylion, ac edrychaf ymlaen at eu gweld yn y ddogfen a fydd yn dilyn.

**Nerys Evans:** Diolch ichi bob un am eich cyfraniadau. Diolch ichi, Weinidog, am eich cefnogaeth i egwyddor y Mesur. Fel y soniech, mae eglurder yn allweddol i'r Mesur. Yr wyf yn falch fod ailgylchu wedi cynyddu ers y ffigurau sydd gennyf am 2006-07. Fel y dywedech, mae buddsoddiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn hyn yn sylweddol, a dyna pam y mae'n bwysig nodi bylchau yn y farchnad er mwyn gwneud y defnydd gorau o arian Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yng Nghymru. Mae'r egwyddor o wneud y Mesur yn ddichonadwy ac yn orfodadwy yn hollbwysig. Nid ydym am wneud Mesurau yng Nghymru er mwyn eu gwneud. Dylai'r ddwy egwyddor bwysig hynny fod yn sail i'r broses o ddatblygu'r Mesur hwn.

Darren, congratulations on your excellent contribution in Welsh—well done.

Cyfeiriec at gwmnïau yn eich etholaeth chi, a dylem fod yn edrych ar hyn o safbwynt Cymru gyfan. Mae'r baich ar lywodraeth leol yn peri pryder, ond credaf fod y manteision yn fwy na'r pryderon a godwyd gennych. Mae'n ofyniad cyfreithiol i gadw gwybodaeth ble mae proseswyr yn anfon eu gwastraff, felly, fel y crybwyllais yn fy araith agoriadol, ni ddylai fod yn rhy feichus olrhain i ble y caiff y gwastraff ei anfon.

Crybwyllodd Lorraine a Paul y mater moesegol a bod pobl yn ailgylchu gydag ewyllys da, ond nad ydynt yn gwybod ble mae eu gwastraff yn cael ei ailgylchu ar hyn o bryd. Os na all awdurdodau lleol ddweud wrthym ble mae eu gwastraff yn cael ei ailgylchu, nid yw'n syndod nad yw pobl Cymru yn gwybod a'u bod yn cael braw o glywed yr ystadegau. Ar y llaw arall, nid ydym am atal neb rhag ailgylchu. Nid dyna yw amcan y Mesur. Mae'n gyfle i gael darlun llawnach ac i ddatblygu'r diwydiant ailgylchu yng Nghymru.

Mike, soniech am y manylion. Yn amlwg,

the details will be worked out during the passage of the Measure. There is potential for a wide debate on this, because European regulations cover many of these issues. You mentioned that there are problems with tracking where waste is being recycled, with it being exported at third and fourth hand, but I do not think that that should deter us. In fact, it should be even more of an incentive to do this, because we do not know the conditions in which the waste is being recycled if we can only track the first or second processors or recyclers. That is even more of a reason for us to pursue this Measure and to get a fuller picture of where our waste is being recycled.

Diolchaf i bawb am y cyfle i ddod â'r Mesur gerbron heddiw. Diolch am eich cyfraniadau cadarnhaol a chefnogol. Fel y soniodd y Gweinidog, gobeithiaf y gall Cymru fod ar y blaen yn y maes hwn.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The proposal is to agree the motion. Does any Member object? I see that no-one does. The motion is therefore agreed in accordance with Standing Order No. 7.35.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

### **Dadl Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru Welsh Liberal Democrats Debate**

#### **Toiledau Cyhoeddus Public Toilets**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Carwyn Jones.

**Kirsty Williams:** I propose that  
*the National Assembly for Wales*

*1) recognises the vital contribution well managed public toilets can have on both the quality of life of local residents and on the image a place makes on visitors; and*

*2) calls on the Assembly Government to bring forward a strategy for public toilet provision, location and distribution that is*

caiff y manylion sylw yn ystod hynt y Mesur. Mae potensial i ddadl eang ar hyn, oherwydd mae rheoliadau Ewrop yn cwmpasu llawer o'r materion hyn. Dywedasochoch fod problemau o rhan olrhain ble mae gwastraff yn cael ei ailgylchu, a'i fod yn cael ei allforio'r drydedd a'r bedwaredd waith, ond ni chredaf y dylai hynny ein rhwystro. Yn wir, dylai fod yn fwy fyth o gymhelliad i wneud hyn, oherwydd ni wyddom o dan ba amodau y mae'r gwastraff yn cael ei ailgylchu os gallwn olrhain y proseswyr neu'r ailgylchwyr cyntaf neu'r ail yn unig. Mae hynny'n fwy fyth o reswm i ddyfalbarhau â'r Mesur hwn ac i gael darlun llawnach ble mae ein gwastraff yn cael ei ailgylchu.

I thank everyone for the opportunity to bring this Measure before you today. Thank you for your positive contributions, which were supportive. As the Minister mentioned, I hope Wales can lead the way in this field.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Y cynnig yw derbyn y cynnig. A oes gwrthwynebiad? Gwelaf nad oes. Yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.35, felly, caiff y cynnig ei dderbyn.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Carwyn Jones.

**Kirsty Williams:** Cynigiaf fod  
*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*1) yn cydnabod y cyfraniad hanfodol y gall toiledau cyhoeddus a reolir yn dda ei gael ar ansawdd bywyd trigolion lleol ac ar yr argraff a gaiff ymwelwyr ar le; a*

*2) yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i gyflwyno strategaeth ar gyfer darpariaeth, lleoliad a dosbarthiad toiledau cyhoeddus a*

*mainstreamed into all strategic level urban policy making. (NDM3929)*

4.00 p.m.

Recent research has revealed to the Welsh Liberal Democrats that the number of public toilets in Wales has fallen by some 16 per cent in the last 10 years. A few of my colleagues have sniggered at the idea that we should be having a debate about loos in the Chamber today, but, as a mother of young children, I know how difficult it can be if, suddenly, when out and about, one of those children needs to use a public convenience.

Many years ago, when the Assembly was looking at establishing the older person's strategy, one of the major responses from older people to that strategy was that they often found it difficult, or were disincentivised from, leaving their homes because they were often unable to reach a public convenience when they were about their daily business. Therefore, the Welsh Liberal Democrats are calling upon the National Assembly to recognise how important public toilets are to the dignity and lives of individual Welsh citizens and to the tourism industry of this country, and to bring forward a strategy to ensure that public toilets are safeguarded and improved.

Many people spend a lot of time driving along the A470, and I am sure that those who make that journey have noticed the public toilets at Erwood, in my constituency, where residents recently scaled the building to place a banner calling for those toilets to be saved. The good news is that those toilets are still open, courtesy of a grant from the Assembly. However, my constituency has seen a large number of public conveniences closed, which has caused a great deal of distress to many local communities. For instance, in Cwmdu, the public toilets have been closed and villagers have had to put up with the spectacle of coach loads of visitors pulling up at the lay-by by those toilets, expecting them to be open, and then relieving themselves—and indeed reveal themselves—in adjacent fields. This is causing a great deal of distress to local residents who do not want to see their village being used in this way.

*fydd yn cael ei phrif ffrydio i bob polisi trefol ar lefel strategol. (NDM3929)*

Mae ymchwil a datgelwyd yn ddiweddar i Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru wedi dangos bod nifer y toiledau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru wedi gostwng tuag 16 y cant yn ystod y 10 mlynedd diwethaf. Mae rhai o fy nghyd-Aelodau wedi cilwenu ar y syniad o gael dadl am dai bach yn y Siambr heddiw, ond fel mam i blant ifanc gwn mor anodd y gall fod os bydd ar un o'r plant hynny yn sydyn angen defnyddio cyfleusterau cyhoeddus.

Flynnyddoedd yn ôl, pan oedd y Cynulliad yn edrych ar sefydlu strategaeth ar gyfer pobl hŷn, un o'r prif ymatebion gan bobl hŷn i'r strategaeth honno oedd eu bod yn aml yn ei chael yn anodd neu'n anfodlon gadael eu cartref am eu bod yn aml yn methu cyrraedd cyfleuster cyhoeddus wrth fynd o gwmpas eu busnes pob dydd. Felly, mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn galw ar y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i gydnabod pwysigrwydd toiledau cyhoeddus i urddas a bywyd dinasyddion Cymru ac i'r diwydiant twristiaeth yn y wlad, ac i gyflwyno strategaeth i sicrhau bod toiledau cyhoeddus yn cael eu diogelu a'u gwella.

Bydd llawer o bobl yn treulio cryn amser yn teithio ar hyd yr A470, ac yr wyf yn siŵr bod y rheini sy'n gwneud y daith honno wedi sylwi ar y toiledau cyhoeddus yn Erwd, yn fy etholaeth i, lle dringodd y trigolion i ben y to yn ddiweddar i godi baner yn galw am arbed y toiledau. Y newyddion da yw bod y toiledau hynny'n dal ar agor, diolch i grant gan y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, mae nifer fawr o gyfleusterau cyhoeddus wedi cau yn fy etholaeth, sydd wedi achosi anghyfleuster mawr i lawer o gymunedau lleol. Er enghraifft, yng Nghwm-du, mae'r toiledau cyhoeddus wedi cau a'r pentrefwyr wedi gorfod dioddef gweld bws ar ôl bws o ymwelwyr yn aros yn y gilfan ger y toiledau hynny, gan ddisgwyl iddynt fod ar agor, ac yna'n gwneud eu busnes—ac yn wir yn arddangos eu hunain—yn y caeau cyfagos. Mae hyn yn achosi trallod mawr i drigolion lleol, sy'n anhapus iawn o weld eu pentref yn

cael ei ddefnyddio fel hyn.

The public convenience in the wonderful village of Llanfrynach, a jewel in the heart of the Brecon Beacons National Park, which is placed strategically on the Taff trail and on the canal walks along the Brecon and Monmouthshire canal, has also been closed. Therefore, members of the public who want to come to enjoy the village facilities and to walk along the canal or on the Taff trail, find that there is no longer a public convenience for them to use. What kind of message does that send out to visitors to the Brecon Beacons National Park?

Having access to a public convenience is a basic human right, and to take that away from people, as I said, makes it difficult for some people to leave their homes and get out and about and lead a full and active life. It inconveniences some of our most vulnerable in society and it is simply not portraying a great image for Wales as a tourist destination.

In the last 10 years, the number of public conveniences across Wales has declined from 806 in 1998 to 677. However, it is not enough simply to provide public conveniences; they also have to be well maintained. The majority of public toilets are, frankly, disgraceful. I am sure that we have all been to public conveniences that are not what we would have liked to have visited. Numerous studies have concluded that the public find public conveniences to be dark, dank and dirty places, which often do not have proper baby changing facilities and are not accessible for disabled people.

The cuts in Powys County Council have been as a direct consequence of the poor local government settlements in recent years and the fact that there is no statutory responsibility placed on local government to provide public conveniences. I believe that, with tight council settlements, councils will look to cut back on costs where they can, and public conveniences are often seen as a service that is not provided for local people but for visitors and, therefore, councils ask why they should spend resources in that way. However, we have seen some councils in the

Mae'r cyfleuster cyhoeddus ym mhentref bendigedig Llanfrynach, perl Parc Cenedlaethol Bannau Brycheiniog, sydd mewn man strategol ar Daith Taf ac ar deithiau cerdded ar hyd camlas Aberhonddu a sir Fynwy, hefyd wedi cau. Felly, bydd y bobl hynny sydd am ddod i fwynhau cyfleusterau'r pentref a cherdded ar hyd y gamlas neu Daith Taf yn cael nad oes cyfleuster cyhoeddus yno mwyach ar eu cyfer. Pa fath o neges y mae hynny'n ei chyfleu i bobl sy'n ymweld â Pharc Cenedlaethol Bannau Brycheiniog?

Mae gallu cael cyfleusterau cyhoeddus yn hawl dynol sylfaenol, ac mae diddymu'r hawl hwnnw, fel y dywedais, yn ei gwneud yn anodd i rai pobl adael eu cartrefi a mynd allan a byw bywyd llawn a bywiog. Mae'n anghyfleus iawn i rai o'r bobl sydd fwyaf agored i niwed mewn cymdeithas, ac nid yw'n cyfleu delwedd wych iawn o Gymru fel cyrchfan i dwristiaid.

Yn y 10 mlynedd diwethaf, mae nifer y cyfleusterau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru wedi gostwng o 806 yn 1998 i 677. Fodd bynnag, nid yw darparu cyfleusterau cyhoeddus eu hunain yn ddigon; rhaid eu cynnal mewn cyflwr derbyniol hefyd. Mae mwyafrif y toiledau cyhoeddus yn warthus, a bod yn onest. Yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod i gyd wedi bod mewn cyfleusterau cyhoeddus y byddai'n well gennym fod heb eu defnyddio. Mae nifer o astudiaethau wedi dod i'r casgliad bod y cyhoedd yn ystyried cyfleusterau cyhoeddus fel manau tywyll, anghynnes a budr, sy'n aml heb gyfleusterau priodol i newid babanod na mynediad i bobl anabl.

Mae'r toriadau yng Nghyngor Sir Powys yn ganlyniad uniongyrchol i setliadau llywodraeth leol annigonol yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, a'r ffaith nad oes cyfrifoldeb statudol ar lywodraeth leol i ddarparu cyfleusterau cyhoeddus. Gyda'r setliadau tynn i gynghorau, credaf y bydd cynghorau'n ceisio cwtogi ar gostau lle bynnag y bydd hynny'n bosibl, ac ystyrir cyfleusterau cyhoeddus yn aml fel gwasanaeth nad yw'n cael ei ddarparu ar gyfer pobl leol ond ar gyfer ymwelwyr, ac felly mae cynghorau'n gofyn pam y dylent

UK taking a more proactive approach. In my constituency, in the town of Crickhowell, the public conveniences have been rebuilt and re-provided as part of a service level agreement with a voluntary organisation that runs the local resource centre; that is working out well. Richmond council in outer London has developed a scheme whereby it remunerates local businesses that are willing to allow members of the public to use the toilets in their building. They display a large, visible sign that indicates to members of the public that those toilets are accessible to all, so there is no danger of having to pop into the pub and purchasing half a pint of lager so that you feel able to use that pub's conveniences. Local businesses complain to me that other people are not as scrupulous as that, and just come in and use them anyway, regardless of whether they purchase a drink.

Therefore, this scheme remunerates businesses for allowing members of the public to use their conveniences. They are paid a small honorarium for their troubles, usually around £600 a year. I am sure that, up and down Wales, there are businesses in more remote or rural areas, or indeed in inner cities, that are not located near a public convenience, which would be willing to offer that service if they were rewarded in some way.

As Assembly Members, we should encourage our councils to take a more proactive role in this area, and we should have a debate about whether it should become a statutory requirement on local authorities to provide public conveniences of this sort. If not, I would like to hear from the Government this afternoon how else we can encourage local authorities to move towards a more adequate provision of public toilets throughout the country.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call on the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government to formally propose the amendment tabled in the name of Carwyn Jones.

**The Minister for Social Justice and Local**

wario adnoddau ar hynny. Fodd bynnag, gwelsom rai cynghorau yn y DU yn mabwysiadu dull mwy rhagweithiol. Yn nhref Crucywel, yn fy etholaeth i, mae'r cyfleusterau cyhoeddus wedi eu haildeiladu a'u hailddarparu fel rhan o gytundeb lefel gwasanaeth gyda mudiad gwirfoddol sy'n rhedeg y ganolfan adnoddau leol; ac mae hynny'n gweithio'n dda. Mae cyngor Richmond yn Llundain allanol wedi datblygu cynllun lle mae'n digolledu busnesau sy'n barod i ganiatáu i'r cyhoedd ddefnyddio'r toiledau yn eu hadeilad. Maent yn arddangos arwydd mawr, gweladwy, sy'n dangos i'r cyhoedd bod y toiledau hynny'n agored i bawb, felly nid oes perygl gorfod mynd i'r dafarn a phrynu hanner pint o gwrw er mwyn teimlo bod gennych hawl i ddefnyddio toiledau'r dafarn. Mae busnesau lleol yn cwyno wrthyf nad yw pawb mor gydwybodol â hynny, ac yn dod i mewn a'u defnyddio beth bynnag, a hynny heb drafferthu prynu diod.

Felly, mae'r cynllun hwn yn digolledu busnesau am ganiatáu i'r cyhoedd ddefnyddio'u cyfleusterau. Cânt gydnabyddiaeth fach am eu trafferth, tua £600 y flwyddyn fel rheol. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai busnesau ar hyd a lled Cymru, mewn ardaloedd mwy diarffordd neu wledig, neu yn wir yng nghanol dinasoedd, nad ydynt yn agos at gyfleusterau cyhoeddus ac fyddai'n barod i gynnig gwasanaeth o'r fath petaent yn cael eu cydnabod mewn rhyw ffordd.

Fel Aelodau'r Cynulliad, dylem annog ein cynghorau i fabwysiadu rôl fwy rhagweithiol yn y maes hwn, a dylem gael dadl i drafod a ddylai fod yn ofyniad statudol ar awdurdodau lleol i ddarparu cyfleusterau cyhoeddus o'r fath. Os na wneir hynny, hoffwn glywed gan y Llywodraeth y prynhawn yma pa ffordd arall sydd i annog awdurdodau lleol i fynd ati i ddarparu cyfleusterau cyhoeddus digonol ar hyd a lled y wlad.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Galwaf ar y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol i gynnig yn ffurfiol y gwelliant a gyflwynir yn enw Carwyn Jones.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder**



**Government (Brian Gibbons):** I propose amendment 1 in the name of Carwyn Jones. Delete point 2 and replace with:

*welcomes the Assembly Government's initiative to encourage local authorities to determine and provide the level of toilet provision that meets their individual local requirements, and to involve local businesses in the provision of this service.*

**Nick Ramsay:** It is a pleasure to contribute to the debate on this important subject. Kirsty Williams said that there had been some sniggering about the topic of this debate, but it is an important issue. Public toilets are not just for the benefit of people living in local authority areas across Wales, they are also for the benefit of tourists, and many different issues relate to this subject. It is easy to underestimate the importance of ensuring a sufficient number of appropriate toilet facilities across Wales. The fact is that you take these things for granted until they are not there.

There probably is not a single person in this Chamber who has not been in the position that Kirsty Williams mentioned, when you are looking in vain for a public toilet, and you are forced to go into a pub or a hotel, and you have to have half a beer; sometimes I take the opportunity to have a whole pint of beer—you might as well make the most of the facilities while you are there.

**Alun Davies:** That is terrible. [*Laughter.*]

You may say that, Alun; if you want to intervene, I will gladly take your contribution. I see that he is staying seated for once—he is at a loss for words; we did have a late night last night.

We have already heard some figures on the decline in public toilet facilities in Wales over the last 10 or 20 years. In 1995, there were approximately 762 public toilets in Wales; by 2005, the estimated number had declined to 671. Therefore, there has clearly been a decline, which has not been arrested. The Minister will hopefully tell us how the Assembly Government intends to address this

**Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol (Brian Gibbons):** Cynigiaf welliant 1 yn enw Carwyn Jones. Dileu pwynt 2 ac yn ei le rhoi:

*yn croesawu menter Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i annog awdurdodau lleol i bennu a darparu lefel y ddarpariaeth toiledau sy'n diwallu eu hanghenion lleol eu hunain, ac i gynnwys busnesau lleol yn narpariaeth y gwasanaeth hwn.*

**Nick Ramsay:** Mae'n bleser cael cyfrannu at y ddadl ar y pwnc pwysig hwn. Dywedodd Kirsty Williams fod rhai wedi cilwenu ar bwnc y ddadl hon, ond mae hwn yn fater pwysig. Nid yw toiledau cyhoeddus ar gael yn unig er mwyn pobl sy'n byw mewn ardaloedd awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru: maent yno hefyd er mwyn twristiaid, ac mae nifer o wahanol broblemau'n gysylltiedig â'r mater hwn. Mae'n hawdd diystyru pwysigrwydd sicrhau nifer digonol o doiledau priodol ar draws Cymru. Y gwir yw eich bod yn cymryd y pethau hyn yn ganiataol tan ichi sylwi nad ydynt ar gael mwyach.

Mae'n debyg nad oes yr un unigolyn yn y Siambr hon heb fod mewn sefyllfa debyg i'r hyn a ddisgrifiwyd gan Kirsty, pan fyddwch yn chwilio'n ofer am doiled cyhoeddus ac yn cael eich gorfodi i fynd i dafarn neu westy ac yn prynu hanner pint o gwrw; weithiau byddaf yn manteisio ar y cyfle i gael pint cyfan o gwrw—waeth ichi heb â gwneud y gorau o'r cyfleusterau gan eich bod yno.

**Alun Davies:** Mae hynny'n sobor. [*Chwerthin.*]

**Nick Ramsay:** Gallwch ddweud hynny, Alun; os ydych am ymyrryd, byddaf yn falch clywed eich cyfraniad. Gwelaf ei fod yn dal i eistedd am unwaith—ni all feddwl am ddim i'w ddweud; cawsom noson hwyr neithiwr.

Yr ydym eisoes wedi clywed rhai ffigurau ar y gostyngiad yn nifer y toiledau cyhoeddus dros y 10 neu 20 mlynedd diwethaf. Yn 1995 yr oedd oddeutu 762 o doiledau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru; erbyn 2005 amcangyfrifid bod y nifer wedi gostwng i 671. Felly, mae'n amlwg bod y nifer wedi gostwng, ac nid yw'r gostyngiad hwnnw wedi arafu. Gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn dweud wrthym sut y

issue.

My authority—and you would expect to me to get a plug in for Monmouthshire County Council—has a good record on providing public toilet facilities. In fact, there is one not far from where I live; when I was having my bathroom refitted, it was exceptionally useful. [*Laughter.*] It is a fine facility. We have all been in facilities that do not make the grade, but I am pleased to say that this one in Raglan, Monmouthshire, certainly does make the grade. There is a toilet attendant who comes along in the morning to open it up—you can set your watch by him, in fact—and he comes around in the evening. However, that costs money, and we are going to have to put money in at the front end if we are going to provide such facilities, which we all benefit from. This is important for vulnerable people, older people, and people who cannot travel any distance without using such facilities. It is a serious matter. These are part of a public service infrastructure that you do not realise that you need until it is not there.

4.10 p.m.

The Minister for local government is here. It is a serious issue that is tied into the local government settlement because, across the board, local authorities are unable to provide funding for all sorts of things that are required. As I said, this is not simply an issue for the residents of our authority areas; it is also an issue for tourists. If we really want Wales to be a leader in tourism and to present a good image to other countries, although these issues might seem minor on the face of it, even issues such as providing public conveniences should be at the top of the agenda. I look forward to hearing what the Minister has to say in that area.

This is about providing financial incentives to businesses—hotels, pubs and petrol stations—to allow the public to use toilets where they cannot be provided by the public purse. There are various proposals, and I have been looking through some of the schemes that have been proposed. One is

mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn bwriadu rhoi sylw i'r mater hwn.

Mae gan fy awdurdod lleol i—a byddech yn disgwyl imi wneud y gorau o'r cyfle i ganmol Cyngor Sir Fynwy—record dda ar ddarparu toiledau cyhoeddus. Yn wir, mae yna un nid nepell o'r lle yr wyf yn byw; pan oeddwn yn cael ystafell ymolchi newydd, yr oedd yn hynod o ddefnyddiol. [*Chwerthin.*] Mae'n gyfleuster gwerth chweil. Yr ydym i gyd wedi bod mewn cyfleusterau sy'n methu cyrraedd y safon, ond yr wyf yn falch dweud bod hwn yn Rhaglan, sir Fynwy, yn bendant yn cyrraedd y safon. Bydd gweithiwr yn galw heibio yn y bore i'w agor—gallwch osod eich cloc wrth ei brydlondeb—ac yn galw heibio eto fin nos. Mae hynny, fodd bynnag, yn costio, a bydd yn rhaid inni roi arian yn y tu blaen os ydym am ddarparu cyfleusterau o'r fath, rhai y gallwn i gyd elwa ohonynt. Mae hyn yn bwysig i bobl sy'n agored i niwed, pobl hŷn, a phobl na allant deithio ymhell heb ddefnyddio cyfleusterau o'r fath. Mae'n fater difrifol. Mae'r rhain yn rhan o seilwaith gwasanaeth cyhoeddus na fyddwch yn sylweddoli bod arnoch ei angen nes iddo beidio â bod ar gael.

Mae'r Gweinidog dros lywodraeth leol yn bresennol. Mae'n fater pwysig sy'n gysylltiedig â'r setliad llywodraeth leol oherwydd, yn gyffredinol, nid oes gan awdurdodau lleol yr arian ar gyfer popeth y mae ei angen. Fel y dywedais, nid rhywbeth i drigolion ardaloedd ein hawdurdodau lleol yn unig yw hyn; mae'n fater i dwristiaid hefyd. Os ydym o ddifrif am weld Cymru'n arwain mewn twristiaeth ac yn rhoi delwedd ffafriol i wledydd eraill, ac er bod hyn yn gallu ymddangos yn fater bach ar yr wyneb, dylai hyd yn oed materion fel darparu cyfleusterau cyhoeddus fod ar frig yr agenda. Edrychaf ymlaen at glywed beth fydd gan y Gweinidog i'w ddweud ar y mater.

Mae'n fater o gynnig cymhellion i fusnesau lleol—gwestai, tafarndai a gorsafoedd petrol—i ganiatáu i'r cyhoedd ddefnyddio toiledau mewn achosion lle na all y pwrs cyhoeddus eu darparu. Mae nifer o gynigion ar gael, ac yr wyf wedi edrych ar rai o'r cynlluniau sydd wedi'u cynnig. Enw un yw'r

called the sat lav scheme, and it allows members of the public to obtain information on the location of their nearest public toilet via text message. We need to remove the inconsistencies in legislation to allow councils to compete with private firms, even if that would involve charging a small fee for the use of toilets on their land. Many schemes involve interesting ideas, but at the end of the day it will all come down to funding.

I am pleased to have been able to contribute to the debate and I look forward to hearing what the Government has to say in response. This is an important issue that the Liberal Democrats have raised and we are happy to support the motion.

**Michael German:** I notice that the Government has tabled an amendment to this motion, which is a serious motion. Having heard the figures about local facilities not being available in Wales, I wonder whether the Government would accept, in pursuing its amendment—assuming that it still wants to pursue it—that if the number of public conveniences has fallen, as we have said that it has, from 806 in 1998 to about 670 today, it should take an increase in that number of 670, as a measure of its success, so that, if we brought back this agenda item next year or the year after, the Government could stand up and say, ‘We have achieved what our amendment sought to do, which was to increase the numbers in Wales’?

There are issues relating to location. What amazes me is that if you look at any map or guide, you will find examples of where you can find something to eat, where you will find a post office, where the station is and where there is a bus stop, but you will not see where you can find public conveniences. There is no directory of public toilets accessible in Wales at all. That means, of course, that it is not part of our tourism project. It is not part of what we see as being important for people. The quality of public conveniences can vary immensely.

I am always amazed that the only toilet in Wrexham station, which now has a service to London, which we all portray as being an

cynllun ‘sat lav’, sy’n caniatáu i’r cyhoedd gael gwybodaeth am leoliad eu toiled cyhoeddus agosaf drwy gyfrwng neges testun. Mae angen cael gwared ar yr anghysonderau mewn deddfwriaeth i ganiatáu i gynghorau gystadlu â chwmnïau preifat, hyd yn oed petai hynny’n golygu codi tâl bach am ddefnyddio toiledau ar eu tir. Mae nifer o gynlluniau’n cynnwys syniadau diddorol, ond diwedd y gân fydd y geiniog.

Yr wyf yn falch o fod wedi cyfrannu at y ddatl, ac edrychaf ymlaen at glywed beth sydd gan y Llywodraeth i’w ddweud mewn ymateb. Mae hwn yn fater pwysig a godwyd gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ac yr ydym yn hapus i gefnogi’r cynnig.

**Michael German:** Sylwaf fod y Llywodraeth wedi cyflwyno gwelliant i’r cynnig hwn, sydd yn gynnig difrifol. Ar ôl clywed y ffigurau ar gyfleusterau lleol nad ydynt ar gael yng Nghymru, tybed a fyddai’r Llywodraeth yn derbyn, wrth ddilyn ei gwelliant-a bwrw ei bod yn dymuno’i ddilyn o hyd-os yw nifer y cyfleusterau cyhoeddus wedi gostwng, fel y dywedwyd, o 806 yn 1998 i oddeutu 670 heddiw, y dylai dderbyn cynnydd yn y nifer hwnnw o 670, fel mesur o’i llwyddiant, er mwyn i’r Llywodraeth, pe baem yn dod â’r eitem agenda hon yn ôl flwyddyn nesaf neu’r flwyddyn wedyn allu sefyll ar ei thraed a dweud, ‘Yr ydym wedi cyflawni’r hyn yr oedd ein gwelliant yn ceisio’i gyflawni, sef cynyddu’r niferoedd yng Nghymru’?

Mae yna broblemau’n ymwneud â lleoliad. Yr hyn sy’n fy rhyfeddu yw hyn: os edrychwch ar unrhyw fap neu lyfr tywys, gwelwch enghreifftiau o fannau lle cewch rywbeth i’w fwyta, lle gallwch ddod o hyd i swyddfa bost, lleoliad yr orsaf a lle gallwch ddal bws, ond ni welwch leoliad dim cyfleusterau cyhoeddus. Nid oes yr un cyfeirlyfr o’r toiledau cyhoeddus sy’n agored yng Nghymru. Mae hynny’n golygu, wrth gwrs, nad yw’n rhan o’n prosiect twristiaeth. Nid yw’n rhan o’r hyn a ystyriwn y n bwysig i bobl. Gall ansawdd cyfleusterau cyhoeddus amrywio’n sylweddol iawn.

Byddaf yn rhyfeddu bob amser mai’r unig doiled yng ngorsaf Wrecsam, sydd bellach â gwasanaeth i Lundain yr ydym i gyd yn ei

extremely good service and a big development for Wrexham, is a disabled toilet, which is only available when you go to ask for the key, and that key is only available when the ticket office is open. In effect, if you happen to be catching a train when the ticket office is closed, you will not be able to use the toilet, even if you are disabled. If you are not disabled, it is always closed to you. You have to travel all the way to Shrewsbury on a train before you can find a public convenience that is available to you on a platform. That is not sending a strong and powerful message to the tourists who visit our country.

We should have a fully worked-up scheme to tell us where public conveniences are on all the trunk roads that we use in Wales. It is no good for the Government to say, 'Yes, we are going to encourage local authorities' because, as you know, that costs money and if it is part of the tourism product, there has to be a source of funding to make it happen. I look forward to what the Minister is going to say as he hurriedly looks at his satellite navigation system for the nearest public convenience. I am interested to know whether the Government is going to put any cash behind this encouragement because, otherwise, in my view, its words are hollow.

An area of major concern is disabled access to public toilets because that is one group in our society that is absolutely disadvantaged. If you can find a local public house and do what I guess most people here would do, which is pay for a drink and then use the public convenience, that is fine. I noticed that some people in this room seemed to indicate that they would not pay their money and would just sneak in through the back door.

However, I hope that that is not the attitude of most Assembly Members and that, unless the toilets are genuinely for public use, we would buy a drink. That is the normal way of doing things, and I hope that that will continue. However, why do we not develop grants and give assistance to public houses to make their facilities public? Because that demands initiative and action with some cash behind it.

bortreadu fel gwasanaeth da dros ben ac yn ddatblygiad mawr i Wrecsam, yw toiled i bobl anabl, ac i ddefnyddio hwnnw rhaid ichi fynd i ofyn am yr allwedd, ac mae'r allwedd honno ar gael pan fydd y swyddfa docynnau ar agor yn unig. Felly, os digwydd i chi fod yn dal trên pan fydd y swyddfa docynnau ar gau, ni alwlch ddefnyddio'r toiled, hyd yn oed os ydych yn anabl. Os nad ydych yn anabl, mae ar gau ichi bob amser. Rhaid ichi deithio bob cam i Amwythig cyn cael cyfleuster cyhoeddus sydd ar gael ichi ar blatfform. Nid yw hynny'n cyfleu neges gref a phwerus i'r twristiaid sy'n ymweld â'n gwlad.

Dylem gael cynllun cydlynus sy'n rhoi gwybod inni am eoliad pob toiled cyhoeddus ar y cefnffyrdd a ddefnyddir gennym yng Nghymru. Nid yw'n ddigon da i'r Llywodraeth ddweud, 'Ydym, yr ydym yn mynd i annog awdurdodau lleol' oherwydd, fel y gwyddoch, mae hynny'n costio arian ac os yw'n rhan o'r pecyn twristiaeth, rhaid cael ffynhonnell o arian i'w wireddu. Edrychaf ymlaen at glywed beth fydd y Gweinidog yn ei ddweud wrth iddo edrych yn frisiog ar ei system llywio lloeren i ddod o hyd i'r cyfleusterau cyhoeddus agosaf. Hoffwn wybod a yw'r Llywodraeth yn mynd i roi arian at yr anogaeth hon, oherwydd fel arall i mi nid yw'n ddim ond geiriau gwag.

Pryder mawr arall yw galluogi pobl anabl i ddefnyddio toiledau cyhoeddus, oherwydd dyma un garfan yn ein cymdeithas sydd dan anfantais fawr. Os gallwch ddod o hyd i dafarn a gwneud yr hyn y credaf y byddai'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yma'n ei wneud, sef talu am ddiod ac yna defnyddio'r cyfleusterau cyhoeddus, popeth yn iawn. Sylwais fod rhai pobl yn yr ystafell fel petaent yn awgrymu na fyddent yn talu ac yn sleifio i mewn drwy'r drws cefn.

Fodd bynnag, gobeithio nad hyn yw agwedd y rhan fwyaf o Aelodau'r Cynulliad ac y byddem yn prynu diod, os nad yw'r toiledau mewn gwirionedd ar gael i'r cyhoedd eu defnyddio. Dyna'r ffordd arferol o wneud pethau, a gobeithio y bydd hynny'n parhau. Fodd bynnag, pam nad ydym yn datblygu grantiau a rhoi cymorth i dafarndai i ganiatáu i'w cyfleusterau fod ar gael i'r cyhoedd? Oherwydd bod hynny'n mynnu menter a

chamau gweithredu ac arian yn gefn iddynt.

Given that the Minister is convinced that the amendment in his name is right, he can tell us why the action that the Government is taking has led to the decline in the number of public toilets in Wales. If anything is clear, it is that this policy is failing. We need a successful policy. This is not a small matter; it is an issue of great importance to a great number of people, but they may not be the vociferous people who would speak out. However, when you ask people in the street and visitors what attracts them to visit a place, you will find that toilets are one of the features that matter, particularly to elderly people and disabled people. We can do much more to attract people to Wales if we take on board the fact that this is a problem for us to deal with. If we put ourselves ahead of the game and ahead of what is being done in England and Scotland, it will be to the benefit of our economy. Therefore, I look forward to the Minister's telling me why and how that amendment would guarantee us more success.

**David Lloyd:** I am pleased to be able to contribute to this valuable debate. At the end of the day, the debate is about enablement and dignity. The provision of public toilets is vital. I am reminded of the time when the diminished availability of public toilets in Maesteg whipped up a huge public row in Maesteg and its environs. Therefore I am certainly well aware of the strong feeling aroused by the issue of the lack of availability of public toilets. It is not just an issue of their availability; they need to be clean, accessible and well maintained.

Changing Places toilets are designed specifically for use by severely disabled people and their carers, and they should certainly be far more widely available. People with disabilities need the facilities to deal with all of their needs. At the moment, they appear to be sidelined and have to make a specific fuss to get their needs addressed. That should not be the case; Changing Places toilets should be far more widely available, and there should be specific planning requirements to ensure wider provision for the severely disabled.

O gofio bod y Gweinidog wedi ei argyhoeddi bod y gwelliant yn ei enw yn gywir, gall ddweud wrthym pam y mae'r camau gweithredu y mae'r Llywodraeth yn eu cymryd wedi arwain at ostyngiad yn nifer y toiledau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Os oes unrhyw beth yn glir, methiant y polisi hwn yw hwnnw. Mae arnom angen polisi llwyddiannus. Nid mater bach yw hwn; mae'n fater o bwysigrwydd mawr i nifer fawr o bobl, ond efallai nad hwy yw'r bobl uchel eu cloch a fyddai'n dweud eu dweud. Fodd bynnag, pan ofynnwch i bobl ar y stryd ac i ymwelwyr beth sy'n eu denu i ymweld â lle, gwelwch mai toiledau yw un o'r nodweddion sy'n cyfrif, yn arbennig i bobl hŷn a phobl anabl. Gallwn wneud llawer mwy i ddenu pobl i Gymru os rhown sylw i'r ffaith fod hon yn broblem inni ymdrin â hi. Os rhown ein hunain ar flaen y gad ac o flaen yr hyn a wneir yn Lloegr a'r Alban, bydd hynny'n lles i'n heconomi. Felly, yr wyf yn edrych ymlaen at glywed y Gweinidog yn dweud wrthym pam a sut y byddai'r gwelliant hwnnw'n sicrhau mwy o lwyddiant inni.

**David Lloyd:** Yr wyf yn falch gallu cyfrannu at y ddadl werthfawr hon. Yn y pen draw, dadl ydyw am alluogi ac urddas. Mae darparu toiledau cyhoeddus yn hanfodol. Caf fy atgoffa o'r adeg pan ysgogwyd ffrae gyhoeddus anferth ym Maesteg a'r cylch oherwydd bod llai o doiledau cyhoeddus ar gael ym Maesteg. Felly, yn sicr, yr wyf yn gwbl ymwybodol o'r teimladau cryf a achosir pan na fydd toiledau cyhoeddus ar gael. Nid bod toiledau ar gael yw'r unig fater dan sylw; mae angen iddynt fod yn lân ac yn gyfleus a chael eu cadw'n dda.

Mae toiledau Lleoedd Newid wedi'u cynllunio'n benodol i gael eu defnyddio gan bobl anabl iawn a'u gofalwyr, ac yn sicr dylent fod ar gael yn ehangach. Mae pobl ag anableddau angen y cyfleusterau i ddelio â'u holl anghenion. Ar hyn o bryd, i bob golwg, maent yn cael eu gwthio i'r cyrion, ac yn gorfod creu ffwdan benodol i gael rhywun i ymdrin â'u hanghenion. Ni ddylai hynny fod yn digwydd; dylai toiledau Lleoedd Newid fod ar gael yn llawer ehangach, a dylid cael gofynion cynllunio penodol i sicrhau bod y ddarpariaeth yn ehangach i bobl anabl iawn.

In the same vein, the issue of incontinence is a widespread problem. Urinary incontinence affects around 10 million people in the United Kingdom. It is very much a silent epidemic, because people are embarrassed to raise the issue with their GP, feeling that the GP might snigger—and we have heard quite a bit of sniggering here this afternoon. However, urinary incontinence will remain a silent epidemic while people are too embarrassed to talk about it, to confront it, and to demand that something be done about it. The frequent soiling of your clothing or the threat of that can lead people to feel stigmatised socially. The need to frequently void the bladder or bowels and to change your clothing while out in public adds to that feeling of social stigma.

Therefore, the availability of fuss-free public toilets would enhance the experience of many people who suffer from urinary incontinence, because they are otherwise afraid to go out. People affected by this just do not go out or, if they do, they certainly do not go out for prolonged periods without knowing where the nearest public toilet is. They need to be used to using a toilet somewhere, and know that it will not be locked and is nice, clean and well maintained. That sort of public toilet is not freely available everywhere. It is a blight on the lives of many people who have to deal with urinary incontinence that, on top of that, they have to deal with the diminished provision of public facilities, which could enhance their social experience.

4.20 p.m.

Those comments about urinary incontinence also apply to elderly people, who are often forced to curtail their social lives for fear of embarrassment or discomfort. It is nice and great to be able to joke in a light-hearted manner about these issues when we are not suffering from any urinary or faecal incontinence problems ourselves, but they are real issues for an awful lot of people in this country, who prefer to keep those issues hidden, because it is an embarrassing and uncomfortable condition.

Yn yr un modd, mae anymataliad yn broblem eang. Mae anymataliad wrinol yn effeithio ar oddeutu 10 miliwn o bobl yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Yn sicr, epidemig distaw ydyw, oherwydd bod pobl yn teimlo'n rhy swil i drafod y mater gyda'u meddyg teulu, gan deimlo y byddai'r meddyg teulu efallai yn cilchwerthin—clywsom dryn dipyn o gilchwerthin yma brynhawn heddiw. Fodd bynnag, bydd anymataliad wrinol yn parhau'n epidemig distaw tra bydd pobl yn teimlo'n rhy swil i siarad amdano, ei wynebu, a mynnu bod rhywbeth yn cael ei wneud ynglŷn ag ef. Gall difwyno'ch dillad yn aml neu fygythiad hynny beri i bobl deimlo'u bod wedi'u stigmatiddio'n gymdeithasol. Mae'r angen i wagio'r bledren neu'r perfedd yn aml a'r angen i newid eich dillad tra ydych allan yn gyhoeddus yn ychwanegu at y teimlad hwnnw o stigma cymdeithasol.

Felly, byddai cael toiledau cyhoeddus ar gael yn ddiffwdan yn gwella profiad llawer o bobl sy'n dioddef o anymataliad wrinol, oherwydd eu bod fel arall yn ofni mynd allan. Mae pobl yr effeithir arnynt gan hyn yn gwrthod mynd allan, neu os gwnânt hynny, yn sicr ni fyddant yn mynd allan yn hir heb wybod ble mae'r toiled cyhoeddus agosaf. Mae angen iddynt fod wedi arfer defnyddio toiled rywle, a gwybod na fydd wedi'i gloi a'i fod yn ddymunol, yn lân ac wedi'i gadw'n dda. Nid yw toiled cyhoeddus o'r fath ar gael yn hawdd ym mhobman. Malltod ar fywydau llawer o bobl sy'n gorfod delio ag anymataliad wrinol yw ei bod yn rhaid iddynt ddelio, yn ychwanegol at hynny, â nifer llai o gyfleusterau cyhoeddus, a allai wella'u profiad cymdeithasol.

4.20 p.m.

Mae'r sylwadau hynny am anymataliad wrinol yn berthnasol hefyd i bobl hŷn, sy'n aml yn cael eu gorfodi i gyfyngu eu bywyd cymdeithasol am eu bod yn ofni chwithdod neu anghysur. Hyfryd a gwych yw gallu cellwair yn siriol am y materion hyn pan nad ydym ni ein hunain yn dioddef gan ryw broblemau anymataliad wrinol neu anymataliad ymgarthol. Ond maent yn faterion go-iawn i nifer fawr iawn o bobl yn y wlad hon, pobl y mae'n well ganddynt gadw'r materion hynny'n guddiedig am ei

fod yn gyflwr chwithig ac anghyfforddus.

Decrepit, dirty, and disgusting toilets are incredibly off-putting not just for those who suffer incontinence and disabled people, but also for ordinary people, and visitors to the locality, and will colour the visitor's view of your locality for ever more, regardless of whether that relates to toilets in motorway service areas, railway stations or bus stations. Local authorities face many challenges and public toilets are yet another. Community councils could also usefully make public toilets in their areas a priority.

Mae toiledau budr, atgas wedi eu difrodi yn sobor o annymunol, nid yn unig i bobl sy'n dioddef o anymataliad a phobl anabl, ond hefyd i bobl gyffredin, a phobl sy'n ymweld â'r ardal, a bydd yn lliwio barn yr ymwelydd am yr ardal am byth wedyn, boed yn gysylltiedig â thoiledau mewn mannau gwasanaeth ar draffyrdd, gorsafoedd rheilffordd neu orsafoedd bysiau. Mae awdurdodau lleol yn wynebu llawer her, ac mae toiledau cyhoeddus yn her arall eto. Defnyddiol hefyd fyddai i gynghorau cymuned beri bod toiledau cyhoeddus yn eu hardal yn flaenoriaeth.

I am pleased that this issue has given me a chance to highlight the misfortune of the silent epidemic of urinary incontinence, and to raise awareness of it and of the need for the far better provision of public toilets.

Yr wyf yn falch bod y mater hwn wedi rhoi cyfle imi dynnu sylw at aflwydd epidemig distaw anymataliad wrinol, ac i gynyddu ymwybyddiaeth amdano ac am well darpariaeth o ran toiledau cyhoeddus.

**Brynle Williams:** We have heard the humorous aspect of this debate. We have joked and laughed about it, but we have also seen the serious aspect that Dai has just presented. We have heard how this can affect people who have urinary problems, and we have heard from Kirsty, a young mother with a family. We have also seen the tourism aspect of this. It is a serious subject. We have all laughed and sniggered about it, but something has to be done. We are pushing the onus on private businesses; we have heard that, when people feel compelled, they go into a restaurant, shop or bar to use the toilet. The issue is that public toilets have closed down over the past four or five years. We must do something about this. There is an onus on all councils to provide this basic convenience for men and women: a clean toilet in an accessible area that people can use. Living in the countryside, I am fed up of seeing busloads of people pulling up in lay-bys to use nearby hedges. I am sorry, but it is a fact of life, and yet we do not have the facilities that are needed.

**Brynle Williams:** Clywsom agwedd ddigrif y ddadl hon. Yr ydym wedi cellwair a chwerthin am yr agwedd honno, ond gwelsom hefyd yr agwedd ddifrifol y mae Dai newydd ei chyflwyno. Clywsom sut y gall hyn effeithio ar bobl sydd â phroblemau wrinol, a chlywsom gan Kirsty, mam ifanc gyda theulu. Gwelsom hefyd yr agwedd dwristaidd ar hyn. Mae'n bwnc difrifol. Yr ydym i gyd wedi chwerthin a chilchwerthin yn ei gylch, ond rhaid gwneud rhywbeth. Yr ydym yn gwthio'r cyfrifoldeb ar fusnesau preifat; clywsom fod pobl, pan gânt eu gorfodi, yn mynd i mewn i dŷ bwyta, siop neu far i ddefnyddio'r toiled. Y mater yw bod toiledau cyhoeddus wedi cau dros y pedair neu bum mlynedd diwethaf. Rhaid inni wneud rhywbeth ynglŷn â hyn. Mae'n gyfrifoldeb ar bob cyngor i ddarparu'r cyfleuster sylfaenol hwn i ddynion ac i fenywod: toiled glân mewn man cyfleus y gall pobl ei ddefnyddio. Gan fy mod yn byw yn y wlad, yr wyf wedi syrffedu ar weld pobl yn aros mewn cilfannau i ddefnyddio gwrychoedd gerllaw. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ond mae'n un o ffeithiau bywyd, ac eto nid oes gennym y cyfleusterau angenrheidiol.

For one, I am pleased that the Liberal Democrats have brought this debate forward today, and I am pleased to support it. Once again, Dr Dai Lloyd has given the serious

Yn un peth, yr wyf yn falch bod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wedi cyflwyno'r ddadl hon heddiw, ac yr wyf yn falch o'i chefnogi. Unwaith eto, y mae Dr Dai Lloyd

aspect of this: many thousands of people are suffering in silence. Thankfully—or hopefully—that does not include any of us.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Does Brynle agree that, while we all want public toilets, they have to be clean, and so people have to keep them clean? Does he therefore agree that we should acknowledge the work of many people who clean public toilets, probably on the minimum wage? Maybe we should think about paying them a little more, because we expect clean toilets, but would we want to clean them ourselves?

**Brynle Williams:** I agree, but, as I said, clean toilets are a basic essential. We could also continue to discuss the problems that arise from using dirty toilets. However, as you say, someone has to clean them. Regrettably, we tend to employ people to do so on low pay. You need to pay a sensible wage, as we have a basic fundamental right to clean toilets.

**The Minister for Social Justice and Local Government (Brian Gibbons):** There are certain stereotypes of what it means to be British: the royal family, a cup of tea, the crack of leather on willow, the stiff upper lip, and the general reluctance of polite society to discuss bodily functions in a serious way, not least in matters pertaining to toilets and public conveniences. Indeed, when toilets do make it into the public domain at all, it is generally along the lines of the saucy holiday postcard, or the double entendres favoured by the *Carry On* films. However, that does a great disservice to an important issue, and the contributions of Members bear that out. The attitude that we have towards these important issues prevents the subject from getting a proper airing, not least because of personal embarrassment, or the potential of being the subject of ridicule. It is almost part of the British way of life.

However, public toilets are an important public service, and one that is becoming increasingly important as the population gets

wedi rhoi'r agwedd ddifrifol ar hyn: mae miloedd lawer o bobl yn dioddef yn ddistaw. Diolch byth—neu gobeithio—nid yw hynny'n cynnwys neb ohonom ni.

**Lorraine Barrett:** A yw Brynle yn cytuno, er ein bod i gyd am weld toiledau cyhoeddus, ei bod yn rhaid iddynt fod yn lân, ac felly ei bod yn rhaid i bobl eu cadw'n lân? A yw'n cytuno felly y dylem gydnabod gwaith llawer o bobl sy'n glanhau toiledau cyhoeddus, ar isafswm cyflog, debyg? Efallai y dylem ystyried talu ychydig mwy iddynt, oherwydd ein bod yn disgwyl i doiledau fod yn lân, ond a fyddem eisiau eu glanhau ein hunain?

**Brynle Williams:** Yr wyf yn cytuno, ond fel y dywedais, anghenraid sylfaenol yw toiledau glân. Gallem hefyd barhau i drafod y problemau sy'n codi o ddefnyddio toiledau budr. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedwch, mae'n rhaid i rywun eu glanhau. Gwaetha'r modd, yr ydym yn tueddu i gyflogi pobl i wneud hynny am dâl isel. Mae angen ichi dalu cyflog synhwyrol, gan fod gennym hawl sylfaenol a hanfodol i doiledau glân.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol (Brian Gibbons):** Mae rhai stereoteipiau ynghlwm wrth yr ystyr o fod yn Brydeinig: y teulu brenhinol, cwpanaid o de, clec lledr ar helyg, ffrwyno teimladau, ac amharodrwydd cyffredinol cymdeithas fonheddig i drafod gweithredoedd y corff mewn modd difrifol, yn enwedig mewn materion sy'n gysylltiedig â thoiledau a chyfleusterau cyhoeddus. Yn wir, pan fydd toiledau'n cyrraedd y parth cyhoeddus o gwbl, mae'r driniaeth yn gyffredinol yn debyg i gerdyn post digywilydd, neu'r ystyron dwbl y mae'r ffilmiau *Carry On* mor hoff ohonynt. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny'n gwneud anghymwynas fawr â mater pwysig, ac mae cyfraniadau'r Aelodau yn cadarnhau hynny. Mae ein hagwedd at y materion pwysig hyn yn atal y pwnc rhag cael ei wyntyllu'n iawn, yn enwedig oherwydd chwithdod personol, neu bosibilrwydd bod yn destun gwawd. Mae bron â bod yn rhan o'r ffordd Brydeinig o fyw.

Fodd bynnag, mae toiledau cyhoeddus yn wasanaeth cyhoeddus pwysig, ac yn un sy'n gynyddol bwysig wrth i'r boblogaeth



older and people suffer from a wider range of chronic diseases affecting continence, and, as Kirsty pointed out, people travel further from their home to access a wider range of everyday activities. Therefore, I welcome the opportunity to have this debate. I urge support for the first part of the motion, and for the amendment in the name of Carwyn Jones to point 2 of the motion, as it proposes a practical way forward.

Being able to use clean and accessible toilets is important to everyone, and it is important that they are accessible to all sections of society, including people with disabilities and special needs, and families with young children. This means that they need to be located where they are most needed, in town and village centres, where tourists visit and congregate, and at regular intervals along trunk roads. In this context, I fully welcome Mencap's Changing Places campaign, which provides advice and guidance on how to cater for the specific needs of disabled people, and which urges local authorities and businesses to take full account of the requirements of disabled people routinely when upgrading existing facilities or providing new ones.

There is a further dimension to this. Adequate provision benefits the whole community as it reduces the incidence of anti-social behaviour through street fouling and poor hygiene standards. This is an unacceptable type of anti-social behaviour that seems to have become more widespread over recent years, particularly in our high streets at the weekend. It is one of the elements that we are looking at in an overall review of the night-time economy here in Wales.

As Members have said, it is also essential that public toilets meet hygiene standards by having proper cleaning regimes and adequate facilities such as running water, liquid soap and hand dryers. Local authorities are best placed to play a leading role in ensuring that local people and visitors can access good-quality public toilets in their areas, particularly at times of high demand, although, as things stand, and as Members

heneiddio ac wrth i bobl ddiodeff o amrediad ehangach o afiechydon cronig sy'n effeithio ar ymataliaeth, ac fel y dangosodd Kirsty, mae pobl yn teithio ymhellach o'u cartrefi i allu cael amrywiaeth ehangach o weithgareddau pob dydd. Felly, yr wyf yn croesawu'r cyfle i gael y ddadl hon. Anogaf chi i gefnogi rhan gyntaf y cynnig, ac i'r gwelliant yn enw Carwyn Jones i bwynt 2 yn y cynnig, gan ei fod yn cynnig ffordd ymarferol ymlaen.

Mae gallu defnyddio toiledau glân a hwylus yn bwysig i bawb, ac mae'n bwysig iddynt fod hyn hwylus i bob rhan o'r gymdeithas, gan gynnwys pobl ag anableddau ac anghenion arbennig, a theuluoedd â phlant ifanc. Mae hyn yn golygu bod angen eu gosod lle mae eu hangen fwyaf, yng nghanol trefi a phentrefi, lle mae twristiaid yn ymweld ac yn ymgynnull, ac mewn mannau rheolaidd ar hyd efnffyrdd. Yn y cyd-destun hwn, yr wyf yn croesawu'n llwyr ymgyrch Lleoedd Newid Mencap, sy'n rhoi cyngor a chanllawiau ar ddarparu ar gyfer anghenion penodol pobl anabl, ac sy'n annog awdurdodau lleol a busnesau i ystyried yn llawn anghenion pobl anabl, fel mater o drefn, wrth uwchraddio cyfleusterau presennol neu ddarparu rhai newydd.

Mae dimensiwn pellach i hyn. Mae darpariaeth ddigonol o fudd i'r gymuned gyfan gan ei bod yn lleihau nifer yr achosion o ymddwyn gwrthgymdeithasol drwy faeddu strydoedd a safonau hylendid gwael. Mae hyn yn fath annerbyniol o ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol sydd wedi cynyddu, mae'n ymddangos, dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf, yn arbennig yn ein prif strydoedd ar y penwythnos. Mae'n un o'r elfennau yr ydym yn eu hystyried mewn adolygiad cyffredinol o economi'r nos yma yng Nghymru.

Fel y mae Aelodau wedi'i ddweud, mae'n hanfodol hefyd i doiledau cyhoeddus fodloni safonau hylendid drwy gael cyfundrefnau glanhau trylwyr a chyfleusterau digonol megis dŵr rhedeg, sebon hylif a sychwyr dwylo. Awdurdodau lleol sydd yn y sefyllfa orau i allu arwain drwy sicrhau bod pobl leol ac ymwelwyr yn gallu defnyddio toiledau cyhoeddus o safon dda yn eu hardaloedd, yn arbennig ar adegau o alw uchel, er nad oes

have pointed out, there is no statutory requirement for them to do so. Many of the facilities that are available have deteriorated over time, are difficult to maintain to acceptable standards, and have become prone to vandalism as a consequence.

There are some perverse incentives in the system, and a legal anomaly dating back to 1936. However, I am pleased that the UK Government has now recognised that anomaly, and is putting in place the necessary changes to allow public toilets to charge a fee. Until now, it has been possible to charge only for toilets, and not for urinals. Hopefully, this legislative change will bring some equality to this issue, and will go some way towards meeting the challenge to local authorities of affordability. All Members who have contributed to this debate have mentioned the public's willingness to pay a reasonable amount to use these facilities. I hope that the legal change that the UK Government is proposing will help.

As communities have developed and patterns of travel and settlement have changed, so too have the requirements for the siting of public conveniences. Replacing some of these facilities with more conveniently located and better quality public toilets must be an option for local authorities. However, there are occasions when alternative provision must be made, and I want to see an increase in the number and quality of these facilities throughout Wales. Local businesses should be encouraged to allow greater public access to their facilities. I want to encourage partnership approaches that frees up access to a greater range of well maintained and suitably equipped toilet facilities, which are already provided by retail, entertainment, and commercial operators across the community—a flexible approach that responds to the needs and expectations of different people, in different places, at different times of the day. Local government should develop strategies to identify the location and capacity where required, and for defining and delivering the standards in terms of accessibility, safety and cleanliness. This requires them to adopt an innovative and forward-looking approach and look beyond

gofyn statudol iddynt wneud hynny, fel mae pethau ar hyn o bryd, ac fel y dangosodd Aelodau. Mae llawer o'r cyfleusterau sydd ar gael wedi dirywio dros amser, yn anodd eu cynnal i safonau derbyniol, ac wedi tueddu i gael eu fandaleiddio o ganlyniad.

Mae rhai cymhellion gwrthnysig yn y system, ac anghysondeb cyfreithiol sy'n mynd yn ôl i 1936. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn falch bod Llywodraeth y DU wedi cydnabod yr anghysondeb hwnnw erbyn hyn ac yn sefydlu'r newidiadau angenrheidiol i ganiatáu i doiledau cyhoeddus godi tâl. Hyd yn hyn, bu'n bosibl codi tâl am doiledau'n unig, ac nid wrinalau. Bydd y newid deddfwriaethol hwn, gobeithio, yn dod â rhywfaint o gydraddoldeb i'r mater hwn, ac yn gam tuag at ymateb i'r her sy'n wynebu awdurdodau lleol wrth ymdrin â fforddiadwyedd. Mae pob Aelod sydd wedi cyfrannu at y ddatl hon wedi crybwyll parodrwydd y cyhoedd i dalu swm rhesymol am ddefnyddio cyfleusterau. Gobeithio y bydd y newid deddfwriaethol y mae Llywodraeth y DU yn ei gynnig yn gymorth.

Wrth i gymunedau newid ac wrth i batrymau teithio a ymsefydlu newid, felly hefyd y gofynion o ran lleoliad cyfleusterau cyhoeddus. Rhaid i newid rhai o'r cyfleusterau hyn a rhoi toiledau mewn lleoliadau gwell ac o safon well yn eu lle fod yn un dewis i awdurdodau lleol. Fodd bynnag, ar adegau bydd rhaid rhoi darpariaeth amgen, ac yr wyf am weld cynnydd yn nifer a safon y cyfleusterau hyn ledled Cymru. Dylid annog busnesau lleol i ganiatáu i fwy o'r cyhoedd ddefnyddio'u cyfleusterau. Mae arnaf eisiau annog dulliau partneriaeth sy'n darparu mynediad i amrywiaeth ehangach o gyfleusterau toiledau sy'n cael eu cynnal yn dda ac sydd â chyfarpar addas, sydd eisoes yn cael eu darparu gan weithredwyr ym meysydd manwerthu, adloniant a masnach ar draws y gymuned—dull hyblyg sy'n ymateb i anghenion a disgwyliadau gwahanol bobl, mewn gwahanol leoedd, ar wahanol adegau o'r dydd. Dylai llywodraeth leol ddatblygu strategaethau i nodi'r lleoliad a'r gallu lle bydd angen, ac ar gyfer diffinio a chyflawni'r safonau o ran hwylustod, diogelwch a glendid. Mae hyn yn gofyn iddynt fabwysiadu agwedd arloesol a blaengar ac

traditional approaches by working in partnership with a wider range of interests.

4.30 p.m.

As part of the 'One Wales' agreement, the Assembly Government is looking at new ways in which business rates can promote business and service quality. In pursuance of this, we have started to explore how this scheme can promote greater access to public toilet facilities. In developing our proposals, we are aware that the Government in England has produced guidance for local authorities on this, and it is encouraging to see areas such as Richmond implementing creative local solutions. Schemes such as that in Richmond are based on financial assistance to businesses that provide greater public access, and we are exploring how our business rate relief scheme, or possibly an alternative grant scheme, can deliver similar objectives. Such a scheme should provide publicity for participating businesses and improve their footfall, as well as providing a good supply of facilities that are safe, accessible and maintained, while providing value for money for local council tax payers.

In short, this is an initiative that should be beneficial to businesses, visitors, residents and council tax payers. My objective is that each local authority should develop a strategy to identify their public toilet provision requirements to meet the needs of the present and future, and to encourage the involvement of local businesses in the process. We are already in the process of establishing a working group of officials from the Assembly Government and from five local authorities to examine how best the Assembly Government can work with local authorities to facilitate the development of local, robust strategies. I will be making some funding available next year to help with this process, particularly with the launch of a number of pilot schemes that will test a range of options. I look forward to the deliberations of the working group and the outcomes of the pilot scheme, as well as the legislative changes, to put in place a more resilient and robust service provision for what is a very

edrych y tu hwnt i ddulliau traddodiadol drwy weithio mewn partneriaeth ag amywiaeth ehangach o fuddiannau.

Fel rhan o gytundeb 'Cymru'n Un', mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn edrych ar ffyrdd newydd y gall ardrethi busnes hybu safon busnesau a gwasanaethau. I'r perwyl hwn, yr ydym wedi dechrau archwilio sut y gall y cynllun hwn hyrwyddo gwell mynediad i gyfleusterau toiledau cyhoeddus. Wrth ddatblygu ein cynigion, yr ydym yn ymwybodol fod y Llywodraeth yn Lloegr wedi cyhoeddi canllawiau i awdurdodau lleol ar hyn, ac mae'n galonogol gweld ardaloedd fel Richmond yn rhoi atebion lleol creadigol ar waith. Mae cynlluniau fel hwnnw yn Richmond yn seiliedig ar gymorth ariannol i fusnesau sy'n darparu mwy o fynediad i'r cyhoedd, ac yr ydym yn archwilio sut y gall ein cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi busnes, neu gynllun grant arall, efallai, gyflawni amcanion tebyg. Dylai cynllun o'r fath roi cyhoeddusrwydd i fusnesau sy'n cymryd rhan a sicrhau y gwnânt well argraff, yn ogystal â darparu cyflenwad da o gyfleusterau sy'n ddiogel, yn hwylus ac yn cael eu cynnal, gan roi gwerth am eu harian i bobl sy'n talu treth gyngor yn lleol.

Yn fyr, mae hon yn fenter a ddylai fod o fudd i fusnesau, ymwelwyr, trigolion a phobl sy'n talu treth gyngor. Fy amcan yw i bob awdurdod lleol ddatblygu strategaeth i nodi ei ofynion o ran darparu toiledau cyhoeddus i fodloni anghenion y presennol a'r dyfodol, ac i annog busnesau lleol i gyfranogi yn y broses. Yr ydym eisoes wrthi'n sefydlu gweithgor o swyddogion o Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ac o bum awdurdod lleol i archwilio sut orau y gall Llywodraeth y Cynulliad weithio gydag awdurdodau lleol i hwyluso datblygu strategaethau cadarn, lleol. Byddaf yn darparu rhywfaint o arian y flwyddyn nesaf i helpu gyda'r broses hon, yn enwedig gyda lansio nifer o gynlluniau peilot a fydd yn profi nifer o ddewisiadau. Yr wyf yn edrych ymlaen at drafodaethau'r gweithgor a chanlyniadau'r cynllun peilot, yn ogystal â'r newidiadau deddfwriaethol, i sefydlu darparu gwasanaethau fwy grymus a chadarn ar gyfer yr hyn sy'n fater pwysig iawn.

important matter.

**Eleanor Burnham:** This is not a sexy topic. As we have heard, there can be some hilarity, but it is a very serious issue. I am pleased to sum up the discussion on what has been an interesting and sometimes funny, but otherwise sad and difficult, topic.

We propose that the National Assembly for Wales recognises the vital contribution that well managed public toilets can make to both the quality of life of local residents and to the image that visitors have of a place, and calls on the Assembly Government to bring forward a strategy for public toilet provision, location and distribution, mainstreamed into all strategic level urban policy-making. It sounds very simple, but as we have heard, it is not. There are all kinds of issues, and huge demands are made on the ever-decreasing purse of local authorities. If I remember correctly, Conwy, which had a bad settlement from the Assembly Government, was loath to, but had to, cut some public convenience provision in my region of north Wales. There are many other stories to tell.

Kirsty mentioned dignity and security, and basic human rights. She also mentioned the needs of parents and older people and regaled us with examples of local instances where cuts have resulted in toilet closures, but that is very sad. On the other hand, she also mentioned Crickhowell, where there is a service level agreement and where volunteers have built a very fine public convenience; that is absolutely brilliant. Mike mentioned disability and the non-access to public toilets. I use the Wrexham station, and you all laugh when I mention lavatories on trains, but they are all part of the issue that is so very important when people are travelling away from home. I do not mind being laughed at, but I am also keen for us to consider the serious aspect of this so that we can move to improve. Wrexham suffers from junkies using the station lavatory provision. My understanding is that, with the new train service, we are going to have a much more secure provision in the new café, which will be brilliant. However, the issue about Wrexham railway station—I am only using it as an example; this is also applicable to many

**Eleanor Burnham:** Nid yw hwn yn bwnc deniadol. Fel y clywsom, gall beri cryn ddigrifwch, ond mae'n fater difrifol iawn. Yr wyf yn falch crynhoi'r drafodaeth ar bwnc sydd wedi bod yn ddiddorol ac weithiau'n ddoniol, ond fel arall yn drist ac yn anodd.

Cynigiwn fod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn cydnabod y cyfraniad hanfodol y gall toiledau cyhoeddus wedi'u rheoli'n dda ei wneud i ansawdd bywyd trigolion lleol ac i'r ddelwedd a gaiff ymwelwyr o le, a'i fod yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i gyflwyno strategaeth ar gyfer darparu toiledau cyhoeddus, eu lleoli a'u dosbarthu, wedi'i phrif-ffrydio ym mhob gwaith llunio polisi trefol ar lefel strategol. Mae'n swnio'n syml iawn, ond fel y clywsom, nid ydyw. Mae pob math o broblemau, ac mae galwadau enfawr ar bwrs awdurdodau lleol, a hwnnw'n lleihau o hyd. Os cofiaf yn iawn, yr oedd Conwy, a gafodd setliad gwael gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn anfoddog wedi gorfod cwtogi rhyw ddarpariaeth cyfleusterau cyhoeddus yn fy rhanbarth i o'r Gogledd. Mae llawer o straeon eraill i'w hadrodd.

Soniodd Kirsty am urddas a diogelwch, a hawliau dynol sylfaenol. Soniodd hefyd am anghenion rhieni a phobl hŷn, a rhoddodd enghreifftiau inni o achosion lleol lle mae toriadau wedi arwain at gau toiledau, ond mae hynny'n drist dros ben. Ar y llaw arall, soniodd hefyd am Grucywel, lle mae cytundeb lefel gwasanaeth a lle mae gwirfoddolwyr wedi adeiladu cyfleuster cyhoeddus da iawn; mae hynny'n hollol wych. Soniodd Mike am anabledd a methu mynd i mewn i doiledau cyhoeddus. Byddaf fi'n defnyddio gorsaf Wrecsam, ac mae pawb ohonoch yn chwerthin pan soniaf am doiledau ar drenau, ond maent i gyd yn rhan o'r pwnc sydd mor bwysig pan fydd pobl yn teithio oddi cartref. Nid oes ots gennyf os bydd pobl yn chwerthin ar fy mhen, ond yr wyf yn awyddus hefyd inni ystyried yr agwedd ddifrifol ar hyn fel y gallwn symud tuag at wella. Mae Wrecsam yn dioddef oherwydd bod jyncis yn defnyddio darpariaeth toiledau'r orsaf. Fy nealltwriaeth i yw ein bod, gyda'r gwasanaeth trên newydd, i gael darpariaeth lawer mwy diogel yn y caffî newydd, a fydd yn wych. Fodd

other stations—is that those disabled toilets are fine when the junkies are not there. It is difficult in many respects—

**Ann Jones:** Will you take an intervention?

**Eleanor Burnham:** If you insist, Ann.

**Ann Jones:** I do insist, Eleanor. Will you reconsider the terminology that you have used twice, and think of another name for them?

**Eleanor Burnham:** If you feel that I need to revisit what I have said, I apologise profusely—I meant no harm. I will talk about people who use substances that you and I would, perhaps, not use. They avail themselves of a provision that would otherwise be a public convenience, and it is not convenient when they leave syringes there; they are sometimes asleep there, which is obviously a big issue.

Moving on, Nick mentioned the sniggering but also said that it is a serious issue. He said that it is easy to underestimate the need for appropriate facilities. Brynle mentioned the onus being on private provision as opposed to public provision.

Lorraine mentioned toilet cleaners in her intervention, which was a very important point. After all, they are an unseen army of wonderful people who help us to avail ourselves of these public conveniences.

Dr Lloyd mentioned the seriousness of incontinence—something that none of us want to think about; certainly not yet—which is obviously a serious medical condition. I am pleased that he brought it to our attention, because he said that 10 million people suffer from it and that it is a silent epidemic.

Our other medical doctor, the Minister, Dr Brian Gibbons, also mentioned the proper airing of a potential subject of ridicule. He talked about anti-social behaviour on streets. I had the pleasure and privilege of being with

bynrag, y peth am orsaf reilffordd Wrecsam—nid wyf ond yn ei defnyddio fel enghraifft; mae hyn yn wir hefyd am lawer gosaf arall—yw bod y toiledau anabl hynny'n iawn pan nad yw'r jyncis yno. Mae'n anodd mewn llawer ffordd—

**Ann Jones:** A wnewch chi gymryd ymyriad?

**Eleanor Burnham:** Os mynnwch, Ann.

**Ann Jones:** Yr wyf yn mynnu, Eleanor. A wnewch chi ailystyried y derminoleg yr ydych wedi'i defnyddio ddwywaith, a meddwl am enw arall iddynt?

**Eleanor Burnham:** Os ydych yn teimlo bod angen imi ailystyried yr hyn a ddywedais, ymddiheuraf o waelod calon—nid oeddwn yn bwriadu dim drwg. Siaradaf am bobl sy'n defnyddio sylweddau na fyddech chi a mi, efallai, yn eu defnyddio. Maent yn manteisio ar ddarpariaeth a fyddai fel arall yn gyfleuster cyhoeddus, ac nid yw'n gyfleus pan adawant chwistrelli yno; weithiau byddant yn cysgu yno, sy'n amlwg yn broblem fawr.

I symud ymlaen, soniodd Nick am y piffian chwerthin, ond dywedodd hefyd fod hwn yn bwnc difrifol. Dywedodd ei bod yn hawdd tanbriso'r angen am gyfleusterau priodol. Soniodd Brynle mai am ddarpariaeth breifat y dylid pwyso yn hytrach na darpariaeth cyhoeddus.

Soniodd Lorraine am lanhawyr toiledau yn ei hymyriad, a oedd yn bwynt pwysig iawn. Wedi'r cwbl, maent yn fyddin anweledig o bobl ryfeddol sy'n ein helpu ni oll i fanteisio ar y cyfleusterau cyhoeddus hyn.

Soniodd Dr Lloyd am ddifrifoldeb anymataledd—rhywbeth nad oes ar neb ohonom eisiau meddwl amdano; yn sicr, ddim eto—sydd, wrth reswm, yn gyflwr meddygol difrifol. Yr wyf yn falch iddo ddod â hynny i'n sylw, oherwydd dywedodd fod 10 miliwn o bobl yn dioddef ganddo a'i fod yn epidemig distaw.

Soniodd ein meddyg arall, y Gweinidog, Dr Brian Gibbons, hefyd am roi sylw agored i destun gwawd posibl. Soniodd am ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol ar strydoedd. Cefais y pleser a'r fraint o fod gyda'r heddlu

the police when they introduced a water bowser in Wrexham. It was quite hilarious, but it was very interesting nonetheless. I was with the police when two very large Australians, who had peed on the streets, were invited to mop it up with a bucket and mop. It was a very interesting experience. It was quite late at night, and I thought that it was brilliant. It defused an anti-social incident: they might have punched the policemen, but they found it mildly amusing to be invited instead to mop it up. They left having been reminded that they should not urinate in a public place in future.

Leonard Cheshire Disability has shown, through its 'Bog Standard' study, how serious this issue is, but with some hilarity. It gives the example of a person on a train who asked the conductor about a toilet, only to be told to get off the train at the next station and go behind some bushes, before waiting for the next train, although it was dark and he was travelling alone. I had to restrain myself from laughing. It is so funny that it is farcical, but this is in Leonard Cheshire Disability's study—it is not my imagination. This is quite serious.

I have strong feelings about train lavatories—they are quite hideous most of the time. Apart from the issue of having to use them on a long journey, it is embarrassing to think that they are someone's first impression of Wales. Whether on trains or in the public arena, in terms of the facilities that we offer to residents and visitors, we should be thinking about the highest possible standard.

On that basis, I thank everyone who has taken part in a debate that has been very serious, full of gravitas but also full of hilarity. I hope that we can persuade the Government to help local authorities that have found it difficult and have had to curtail some of their public conveniences. Ultimately, this is a very serious issue.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The proposal is to agree the amendment. Does any Member object? I see that there is an objection. As it is past 4.30 p.m. I intend to

pan gyflwynwyd trochwr dŵr ganddynt yn Wrecsam. Yr oedd yn ddoniol dros ben, ond yn ddiddorol iawn serch hynny. Yr oeddwn gyda'r heddlu pan wahoddwyd dau ddyn mawr iawn o Awstralia, a oedd wedi gwneud pi-pi ar y strydoedd, i'w lanhau â bwced a mop. Yr oedd yn brofiad diddorol dros ben. Yr oedd yn lled hwyr yn y nos, ac yr oeddwn yn meddwl ei fod yn wych. Tynnodd y ffiws ar ddigwyddiad gwrthgymdeithasol: gallent fod wedi rhoi dyrnod i'r plismyn, ond profiad ychydig yn ysmala iddynt oedd cael eu gwahodd yn hytrach i lanhau'r llanast. Gadawsant wedi eu hatgoffa na ddylent wneud dŵr mewn lle cyhoeddus yn y dyfodol.

Mae Leonard Cheshire Disability wedi dangos, drwy ei astudiaeth 'Bog Standard', mor ddifrifol yw'r mater hwn, ond gyda chryn ddigrifwch. Mae'n rhoi'r enghraifft o rywun ar drên a holodd y tocynnwr ynglŷn â thoiled, a chael yr ateb y dylai fynd oddi ar y trên yn yr orsaf nesaf a gwneud y tu ôl i ryw lwydni, cyn aros am y trên nesaf, er ei bod yn dywyll ac yntau'n teithio ar ei ben ei hun. Prin y gallwn ymatal rhag chwerthin. Mae mor ddigrif nes ymylu ar ffars, ond mae hyn yn astudiaeth Leonard Cheshire Disability—nid fy nychymyg i ydyw. Mae hyn yn eithaf difrifol.

Mae gennyf deimladau cryf am doiledau ar drenau—maent yn gwbl ffaidd y rhan fwyaf o'r amser. Ar wahân i'r broblem o orfod eu defnyddio ar daith hir, mae'n embaras meddwl mai dyna'r argraff gyntaf a gaiff rhywun o Gymru. Boed ar drenau ynteu yn y maes cyhoeddus, o ran y cyfleusterau a gynigiwn i drigolion ac ymwelwyr, dylem fod yn meddwl am y safon uchaf posibl.

Ar y sail honno, diolch i bawb sydd wedi cymryd rhan mewn dadl a fu'n ddifrifol iawn, yn llawn dwyster ond hefyd yn llawn doniolwch. Gobeithio y gallwn berswadio'r Llywodraeth i helpu awdurdodau lleol sydd wedi'i chael yn anodd ac sydd wedi gorfod cwtogi rhai o'u cyfleusterau cyhoeddus. Yn y pen draw, mae hwn yn fater difrifol iawn.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Y cynnig yw y dylid cytuno'r gwelliant. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf fod gwrthwynebiad. Gan ei bod wedi 4.30 p.m. bwriadaf fynd yn

go straight into the vote. Is everyone content? I see that you are.

syth at y bleidlais. A yw pawb yn fodlon? Gwelaf eich bod.

*Gwelliant i 1 NDM3929: O blaid 33, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 12.  
Amendment 1 to NDM3929: For 33, Abstain 0, Against 12.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
James, Irene  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ramsay, Nick  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

4.40 p.m.

Motion NDM3929 as amended: that

*the National Assembly for Wales*

*1) recognises the vital contribution well managed public toilets can have on both the quality of life of local residents and on the image a place makes on visitors; and*

*2) welcomes the Assembly Government's initiative to encourage local authorities to determine and provide the level of toilet provision that meets their individual local requirements, and to involve local businesses*

Cynnig NDM3929 fel y'i diwygiwyd: bod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*1) yn cydnabod y cyfraniad hanfodol y gall toiledau cyhoeddus a reolir yn dda ei gael ar ansawdd bywyd trigolion lleol ac ar yr argraff a gaiff ymwelwyr ar le; a*

*2) yn croesawu menter Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i annog awdurdodau lleol i bennu a darparu lefel y ddarpariaeth toiledau sy'n diwallu eu hanghenion lleol eu hunain, ac i gynnwys busnesau lleol yn narpariaeth y*

*in the provision of this service.*

*gwasanaeth hwn.*

*Cynnig NDM3929 fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 40, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.*

*Motion NDM3929 as amended: For 40, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Paul  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Ramsay, Nick  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:

The following Members voted against:

Burnham, Eleanor  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Melding, David  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig NDM3929 fel y'i diwygiwyd.*

*Motion NDM3929 as amended carried.*

### **Dadl Fer Short Debate**

#### **Lymffoedema—yr Angen am Wasanaeth Gwell Lymphoedema—the Need for an Improved Service**

**Janice Gregory:** If time permits—and I hope that it does—I have agreed that Lesley Griffiths, Lorraine Barrett, Nerys Evans, **Janice Gregory:** Os bydd amser yn caniatáu—a gobeithio y bydd—yr wyf wedi cytuno y caiff Lesley Griffiths, Lorraine



David Melding and Eleanor Burnham can each make a contribution.

It is not often that we get the chance to talk about an improved service that would enhance the lives of patients and save the NHS money. I am glad of the opportunity to do just that this afternoon. Lymphoedema is a chronic condition that affects one in 500 of the population. At a conservative estimate, there are 5,500 sufferers in Wales. The prevalence of lymphoedema is four times greater among the over-65s, and five times greater among the over-75s. Patients who suffer a number of conditions, including impaired mobility, obesity, recurrent skin infections or disease, deep vein thrombosis or who have undergone cancer treatment, are at risk of developing lymphoedema. This condition can affect anyone at any age at any time.

Oedema can occur in any part of the body, but it is most commonly seen in the arms and legs. The term 'elephantiasis' has often been used of untreated lymphoedema based on the size of the limb and the appearance and texture of the skin.

I asked one of the professionals working in this field to explain the effects on an individual patient, and she asked me to imagine what it would be like to have one leg 10 times the size of the other. You cannot get any clothes or shoes to fit. Everyone stares, making you feel embarrassed. It is hard to walk. Your job opportunities, your social life, and your whole quality of life are limited. Your skin cracks and leaks fluid, which soils your mattress and your clothes. On top of that, your risk of developing an acute infection is increased by 57 per cent. If that happens, you will have to be admitted to hospital for intravenous antibiotics, and in the meantime your leg will be painful and more swollen. The costs in terms of quality of life, dignity and hope are clearly huge, but there are also serious resources implications for the NHS in Wales for as long as a consistent, effective approach to treatment is not in place.

Where lymphoedema services are lacking, patients are frequently, and inappropriately,

Barrett, Nerys Evans, David Melding ac Eleanor Burnham wneud cyfraniad bob un.

Nid yn aml y cawn y cyfle i siarad am wasanaeth gwell a fyddai'n cyfoethogi bywydau cleifion ac yn arbed arian i'r GIG. Yr wyf yn falch o'r cyfle i wneud hynny'n union y prynhawn yma. Mae Lymffoedema yn gyflwr cronig sy'n effeithio ar un o bob 500 o'r boblogaeth. Mae amcangyfrif cyfyngedig yn dweud bod 5,500 o ddioddefwyr yng Nghymru. Mae lymffoedema bedair gwaith yn fwy cyffredin ymysg pobl dros 65, a phum gwaith yn fwy cyffredin ymysg pobl dros 75. Mae cleifion sy'n dioddef o sawl cyflwr, gan gynnwys diffyg symudedd, gordewdra, heintiau neu afiechyd dychweliadol ar y croen, thrombosis gwythien ddofn neu wedi cael triniaeth at ganser, mewn perygl o ddatblygu lymffoedema. Gall y cyflwr hwn effeithio ar unrhyw un o unrhyw oed unrhyw bryd.

Gall oedema ddigwydd mewn unrhyw ran o'r corff, ond fe'i gwelir amlaf yn y breichiau a'r coesau. Mae'r term 'eliffantiasis' wedi'i ddefnyddio'n aml am lymffoedema heb ei drin oherwydd maint yr aelod a golwg a gwedd y croen.

Gofynnais i wraig broffesiynol sy'n gweithio yn y maes hwn egluro'r effeithiau ar glaf unigol, a gofynnodd imi ddychmygu sut beth fyddai cael un goes 10 gwaith yn fwy na'r llall. Ni allwch gael dim dillad nac esgidiau i'ch ffitio. Mae pawb yn syllu arnoch, gan beri ichi deimlo'n chwithig. Mae'n anodd cerdded. Cyfyngir ar eich cyfleon swydd, eich bywyd cymdeithasol, a holl ansawdd eich bywyd. Mae eich croen yn cracio ac yn gollwng hylif, sy'n baeddu eich matres a'ch dillad. At hynny, mae perygl ichi ddatblygu haint aciwt yn cynyddu 57 y cant. Os digwydd hynny, rhaid ichi fynd i'r ysbyty i gael gwrthfotigau mewnwythiennol, ac yn y cyfamser bydd eich coes yn boenus ac yn fwy chwyddedig. Mae'r gost o ran ansawdd bywyd, urddas a gobaith yn amlwg yn enfawr, ond mae goblygiadau difrifol hefyd o ran adnoddau i'r GIG yng Nghymru cyhyd ag y bydd dull cyson, effeithiol o drin heb ei sefydlu.

Lle nad oes gwasanaethau lymffoedema, cyfeirir cleifion yn aml, ac yn amhriodol, at

referred to dermatology, vascular surgery, orthopaedics, plastic surgery and surgical appliances departments for management of their condition. These specialties do not treat lymphoedema—patients are seen and then referred on to another clinic. This wastes time and resources, and it lengthens waiting times for other patients. Some patients are repeatedly prescribed inappropriate diuretics, Tubigrip support bandages and wound dressings, all of which could actually exacerbate the condition.

adrannau dermatoleg, llawfeddygaeth fasgwlar, orthopedeg, llawfeddygaeth blastig ac offerynnau llawfeddygol ar gyfer rheoli eu cyflwr. Nid yw'r arbenigeddau hyn yn trin lymffoedema—caiff cleifion eu gweld ac yna'u cyfeirio ymlaen i glinig arall. Mae hyn yn gwastraffu amser ac adnoddau, ac yn ymestyn amserau aros i gleifion eraill. Rhoir diwretigion, rhwymynnau cynnal Tubigrip a gorchuddion clwyf yn amhriodol dro ar ôl tro i rai cleifion, a'r rheini y gyd yn bethau a allai waethygu'r cyflwr.

*Daeth y Llywydd i'r Gadair am 4.44 p.m.  
The Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.44 p.m.*

When patients suffer an infection requiring hospital admission and antibiotics, the average hospital stay is seven days, at a cost of £350 a day. Research has shown that timely and appropriate lymphoedema management would reduce the incidence of infections from 57 to 9 per cent. Failure to treat lymphoedema effectively leads to longer hospital stays and more visits to GPs and district nurses. The ripples spread out as other patients suffer longer waiting times at all levels of the NHS.

Pan fydd cleifion yn dioddef haint sy'n galw am fynd i'r ysbyty a gwrthfotigau, byddant yn aros yn yr ysbyty am saith diwrnod ar gyfartaledd, am gost o £350 y dydd. Mae ymchwil wedi dangos y byddai rheol lymffoedema yn gynnar ac yn briodol yn lleihau canran yr heintiadau o 57 i 9 y cant. Os na thrinir lymffoedema'n effeithiol, mae'n arwain at aros yn hwy yn yr ysbyty a mwy o ymweliadau â meddygon teulu a nyrsys ardal. Mae'r crychdonnau'n ymledu wrth i gleifion eraill orfod aros am amser hwy ar bob lefel o'r GIG.

It is important to be clear that the case for an improved lymphoedema service is not primarily about throwing more money at the problem. It is about using resources more wisely. The improvements for which professionals are calling are not particularly hi-tech or cost intensive; they are primarily about applying common sense and harnessing the experience of those who specialise in this field. They emphasise the importance of ensuring that all NHS staff are aware of lymphoedema and the best approaches to its treatment. Given the wide range of conditions that can give rise to it, every medical professional needs to know how to recognise it and what treatment is available.

Mae'n bwysig bod yn glir nad yw'r achos dros wasanaeth lymffoedema gwell yn ymwneud yn bennaf â thaflu mwy o arian at y broblem. Mae'n ymwneud â defnyddio adnoddau'n ddoethach. Nid yw'r gwelliannau y mae gweithwyr proffesiynol yn galw amdanynt yn rhai arbennig o dechnolegol na drud; mae a wnelont yn bennaf â defnyddio synnwyr cyffredin a manteisio ar brofiad pobl sy'n arbenigo yn y maes hwn. Pwysleisiant bwysigrwydd sicrhau bod holl staff y GIG yn ymwybodol o lymffoedema ac o'r dulliau gorau i'w drin. O gofio'r ystod eang o gyflyrau sy'n gallu ei achosi, mae angen i bob gweithiwr meddygol proffesiynol wybod sut i'w adnabod a pha driniaeth sydd ar gael.

It has been shown in practice that a collaborative approach between lymphoedema services and community nurses improves patient care and is an effective use of resources. The effectiveness of a range of treatments including specialised manual lymphatic drainage massage, multi-layered lymphoedema bandaging, skin care

Dangoswyd drwy ymarfer fod dull cydweithredol rhwng gwasanaethau lymffoedema a nyrsys cymunedol yn gwella gofal cleifion a'i fod yn fodd effeithiol i ddefnyddio adnoddau. Dangoswyd effeithiolrwydd amryw o driniaethau gan gynnwys tylino arbenigol â'r dwylo ar gyfer draenio lymffatig, rhwymynnau lymffoedema

and the use of compression bandages has been demonstrated, as has the value of self-massage and improving patients' knowledge and ability to help themselves. The advantages for patients are obvious and dramatic. A 53-year-old Wrexham woman had received a variety of treatments over many years to no effect. After years of distress, she had reached the point where she could not work, depended on benefits and was confined to her house. Following the right treatment, she lost 7 stone, and was able to drive, go shopping and attend tai chi. She says that had she been diagnosed the first time she queried the size of her legs, when she was 18, her life would have been much different and the NHS could have been saved a lot of money and time. She could have been working all that time, paying taxes and national insurance, spending more money and helping the economy—if only. After two weeks of having her legs wrapped, her wounds had healed.

The sheer human costs of failing to provide a better service—the unhappiness, suffering and missed opportunities—should make us all think hard about what needs to be done. The positive approach of people like this patient from Wrexham should be an inspiration to everyone. However, as she recognised, the costs are financial as well as personal. A case study in an article in the *British Journal of Community Nursing* demonstrates that the cost of one woman's treatment over 10 years was more than £205,000. By contrast, collaborative treatment by the lymphoedema service and community nurses, involving 15 sessions of multi-layer bandaging and the fitting of compression garments, cost just over £1,200 all told. Not only was this patient's quality of life immeasurably improved, but the huge costs to the NHS were brought to a halt. Looking at the bigger picture, a study of hospitals in Swansea showed that 1,364 bed days could have been saved—worth a total of £410,000 to the NHS.

Sometimes when we are dealing with health issues, we are looking at difficult choices that need to be made between the needs of particular patients and the wider demands on NHS resources. In this case, a win-win

aml-haen, gofal i'r croen a defnyddio rhwymynnau cywasgu, yn ogystal â gwerth hunandylino a gwella gwybodaeth y claf a'i allu i'w helpu ei hun. Mae'r manteision i gleifion yn amlwg ac yn drawiadol. Yr oedd menyw 53 oed o Wrecsam wedi cael amryw o driniaethau dros flynyddoedd lawer heb lwyddiant. Ar ôl blynyddoedd o ofid, yr oedd wedi cyrraedd man lle na allai weithio, yr oedd yn dibynnu ar fudd-daliadau ac yn gaeth i'w thŷ. Ar ôl cael y driniaeth briodol, collodd 7 stôn, ac yr oedd yn gallu gyrru, siopa a mynd i sesiynau tai-chi. Dywed y buasai ei bywyd yn wahanol iawn petai wedi cael diagnosis y tro cyntaf wrth holi ynghylch maint ei choesau, pan oedd yn 18 oed, ac y buasai modd arbed llawer o amser ac arian i'r GIG. Gallasai fod yn gweithio drwy gydol yr amser hwnnw, yn talu trethi ac yswiriant gwladol, yn gwario mwy o arian ac yn helpu'r economi—oni bai am hynny. Wedi pythefnos o gael lapio ei choesau, yr oedd ei chlwyfau wedi gwella.

Dylai'r costau mawr i bobl o fethu â darparu gwasanaeth gwell—yr anhapusrwydd, y dioddef a'r cyfleodd a gollir—fod yn achos i bob un ohonom feddwl yn galed am yr hyn y mae angen ei wneud. Dylai agwedd gadarnhaol pobl fel y claf hwn o Wrecsam fod yn ysbrydoliaeth i bawb. Fodd bynnag, fel y cydnabu, mae yna gostau ariannol yn ogystal â chostau personol. Mae astudiaeth achos mewn erthygl yn y *British Journal of Community Nursing* yn dangos bod y driniaeth i un fenyw dros 10 mlynedd wedi costio dros £205,000. I'r gwrthwyneb, yr oedd triniaeth gydweithredol gan y gwasanaeth lymffoedema a nyrsys cymunedol, a oedd yn cynnwys 15 sesiwn o osod rhwymynnau aml-haen a gwisgo dillad cywasgu, wedi costio cyfanswm o ychydig dros £1,200. Cafodd nid yn unig ansawdd bywyd y claf hwn ei wella, rhyfeddol, ond rhoddwyd pen ar y costau aruthrol i'r GIG. I edrych arni hyn yn gyffredinol, dangosodd astudiaeth o ysbytai yn Abertawe y gellid bod wedi arbed 1,364 o ddiwrnodau gwely—gwerth cyfanswm o £410,000 i'r GIG.

Weithiau, pan fyddwn yn delio â materion iechyd, yr ydym yn ystyried dewisiadau anodd y mae angen eu gwneud rhwng anghenion cleifion penodol a'r galwadau cyffredinol ar adnoddau'r GIG. Yn yr achos

situation is on offer. By spending quite limited amounts of money and staff time on a range of proven treatment methods, and ensuring that all NHS staff are aware that those methods are available, we can make a dramatic change for the better in the lives of a large number of patients while, at the same time, saving money and releasing NHS resources for the treatment of other patients. It is not often that you get an offer like that in politics; I believe that we should grab with both hands.

At present, there is a great variety of provision across Wales. Where you live will make a huge difference to the treatment available to you if you suffer from lymphoedema. What we now need is leadership from the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure that the NHS throughout Wales recognises the importance of this work. Minister, knowing your compassion for individuals and your keen interest in value for money, I hope that I can look forward to an encouraging response this afternoon.

**Lesley Griffiths:** Thank you, Janice, for choosing this important topic for your short debate and for allowing me to speak. Unfortunately, it is also my experience that lymphoedema services across Wales are patchy, and there is no firm commitment from commissioners to discuss service delivery or the development of services.

In my constituency of Wrexham, the delivery and development of lymphoedema services is funded and provided by Nightingale House Hospice, which is a local hospice. I have met several constituents, including the one to whom you referred earlier, whose lives have been completely changed following treatment for this debilitating and chronic condition. I know, from my meetings and discussions with them, that the chief executive and the chair of the hospice find it extremely difficult to have dialogue with the local commissioner, Wrexham Local Health Board, on current service provision, let alone further development. That frustrates them greatly.

With that in mind, Minister, do you agree that we should recognise lymphoedema as a core

hwn, cynigir sefyllfa lle all pawb fod ar eu hennill. Drwy wario symiau digon bach a neilltuo cyfnodau digon byr o amser staff ar amrywiol ddulliau trin profedig, a sicrhau bod holl staff y GIG yn ymwbodol bod y dulliau hynny ar gael, gallwn wella bywydau nifer mawr o gleifion yn sylweddol, ac ar yr un pryd arbed arian a rhyddhau adnoddau'r GIG i drin cleifion eraill. Nid yn aml y cewch gynnig o'r fath mewn gwleidyddiaeth; credaf y dylem ei dderbyn yn selog.

Ar hyn o bryd, mae darpariaeth amrywiol iawn ledled Cymru. Bydd y driniaeth sydd ar gael i chi os ydych yn dioddef gan lymffoedema yn dibynnu i raddau helaeth iawn ar y man lle'r ydych yn byw. Yr hyn y mae arnom ei angen yn awr yw arweiniad gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau bod y GIG ledled Cymru yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd y gwaith hwn. Weinidog, o wybod am eich tosturi tuag at unigolion a'ch diddordeb mawr mewn cael gwerth am arian, yr wyf yn gobeithio y gallaf edrych ymlaen at gael ymateb calonogol y prynhawn yma.

**Lesley Griffiths:** Diolch i chi, Janice, am ddewis y pwnc pwysig hwn ar gyfer eich dadl fer ac am ganiatáu imi siarad. Gwaetha'r modd, yr wyf finnu wedi gweld bod gwasanaethau lymffoedema ledled Cymru yn anghyson, ac nid oes ymrwymiad pendant gan gyrff comisiynu i drafod darparu neu ddatblygu gwasanaethau.

Yn fy etholaeth i, sef Wrecsam, caiff y broses o ddarparu a datblygu gwasanaethau lymffoedema ei hariannu a'i darparu gan Hosbis Tŷ'r Eos, sy'n hosbis lleol. Yr wyf wedi cwrdd â nifer o etholwyr, gan gynnwys yr un y cyfeiriech ati'n gynharach, sydd â'u bywydau wedi'u trawsnewid ar ôl cael triniaeth am y cyflwr gwanychol a chronig hwn. Gwn o'm cyfarfodydd a'm trafodaethau gyda hwy fod prif weithredwr a chadeirydd yr hosbis yn ei chael yn anodd iawn cael deialog â'r corff comisiynu lleol, Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Wrecsam, am y ddarpariaeth gwasanaeth ar hyn o bryd, heb sôn am ddatblygu pellach. Mae hynny'n eu gwneud yn rhwystredig iawn.

Gan gadw hynny mewn cof, Weinidog, a ydych yn derbyn y dylem gydnabod y

NHS service and that we should have an all-Wales strategy in line with the Richmond report of 2003, which was reviewed in 2006.

gwasanaeth lymffoedema fel un o wasanaethau craidd y GIG ac y dylem gael strategaeth i Gymru gyfan yn unol ag adroddiad Richmond yn 2003, a adolygwyd yn 2006?

4.50 p.m.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I thank Janice for raising this serious issue. I know that for many women who have had mastectomies due to breast cancer, lymphoedema can cause more distress than the mastectomy because of the long-term visual impact of the condition. As has been said, people who suffer from it are unable to wear certain clothes and it is painful and uncomfortable. I know that treatment and access to treatment has improved over the years, but my message is that any treatment, whether massage or bandage treatment, must be available to all. Even more important than that is the fact that women who undergo mastectomies, in particular, should be alerted to the possibility of developing lymphoedema and be supported if they get the condition because it can be a bit of a shock, once you get over the initial treatment for the breast cancer, to have to face lymphoedema which is often a lifelong condition.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Diolch i Janice am godi'r mater difrifol hwn. Gwn yn achos nifer o fenywod sydd wedi cael mastectomi oherwydd canser y fron y gall lymffoedema achosi mwy o ofid na'r mastectomi oherwydd effaith weledol hirdymor y cyflwr. Fel y dywedwyd, nid yw pobl sy'n dioddef yn gallu gwisgo rhai mathau o ddillad ac mae'n boenus ac yn annifyr. Gwn fod triniaeth a gallu cael triniaeth wedi gwella dros y blynyddoedd, ond y neges sydd gennyf yw ei bod yn rhaid i unrhyw driniaeth fod ar gael i bawb, boed yn dylino ynteu'n driniaeth â rhwymynnau. Yn bwysicach na hynny hyd yn oed, dylid rhybuddio menywod sy'n cael mastectomi, yn benodol, o bosibilrwydd cael lymffoedema ac y dylid eu cefnogi os cânt y cyflwr, oherwydd gall achosi tipyn o fraw, wedi ichi wella ar ôl y driniaeth gyntaf am ganser y fron, ichi orfod wynebu lymffoedema sy'n aml yn para gydol eich oes.

**Nerys Evans:** Diolch am ganiatáu i mi gyfrannu at y ddadl. Byddaf yn cadw fy nghyfraniad yn fyr. Yr wyf am atgyfnerthu pwysigrwydd gwasanaethau lymffoedema. Mae rhai mannau yng Nghymru'n dioddef o ddiffyg gwasanaethau hyn, fel y dywedwyd heddiw. Yng Ngheredigion, mae'r gwasanaeth hwn yn cael ei ddarparu gan un aelod o'r staff nyrsio yn Ysbyty Cyffredinol Dosbarth Bronglais sydd wedi cael, fel mae'n digwydd, hyfforddiant ychwanegol yn y maes. Os neu pryd mae'r nyrs honno yn gadael, ni fydd gan yr ardal wasanaeth wedi ei gyllido ar gyfer lymffoedema, ac mae'n amlwg bod esiamplau eraill o hyn ar draws Cymru. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn edrych i sicrhau dyfodol i'r gwasanaeth ymhob rhan o Gymru.

**Nerys Evans:** Thank you for allowing me to contribute to the debate. I will keep my contribution brief. I want to reinforce the importance of lymphoedema services. Some areas in Wales suffer from a lack of these services, as has been said today. In Ceredigion, this service is provided by one member of nursing staff in Bronglais District General Hospital who happens to have received additional training in the field. If or when that nurse leaves, the area will not have a funded lymphoedema service, and it is clear that there are other examples of this across Wales. I hope the Minister will seek to ensure a future for the service in every part of Wales.

**David Melding:** A quarter of the Assembly's Members have stayed to hear Janice's short debate, which is something of a record. We all have examples of casework that can show what a problem we have in this area. Two of

**David Melding:** Mae chwarter Aelodau'r Cynulliad wedi aros i glywed dadl fer Janice, ac mae hynny'n record o ryw fath. Mae gan bob un ohonom enghreifftiau o waith achos sy'n gallu dangos cymaint o broblem sydd

the most distressing pieces of casework that I ever had were related to non-cancer-related lymphoedema. I did not get a positive outcome; those patients remained untreated. One, as far as I know, still regularly travels to Germany to get treatment, and the NHS is absent there.

People are sometimes confused about lymphoedema because it is often associated with cancer—but not all the time. I do not care how we deliver this service, whether it is through Velindre NHS Trust or cancer hospitals, but lymphoedema services need to be available to those who have non-cancer-related lymphoedema. It is long overdue that these people with a distressing condition get proper treatment.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Thank you, Janice, for raising this issue and for allowing me to speak briefly. Earlier, I asked the Minister about the hospice that Lesley referred to, namely Nightingale House Hospice, and I also refer to St Kentigern Hospice in St Athan, which allows the use of its premises free of charge. This is an important issue for any service level agreement because it makes the best use of moneys already available in the NHS. I am sure that our creative Minister will help us along and ensure that hospices such as St Kentigern Hospice and Nightingale House Hospice and others across north Wales and the rest of Wales will be able to offer this service—they already offer palliative care—on the NHS so that they have the moneys to offer care for this most distressing condition.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Edwina Hart):** I thank Janice for raising the issue of this debilitating and painful condition. I take on board David Melding's point on the attendance of Members to hear the short debate today. As AMs, we have all had casework relating to this condition and some of those cases are of a distressing nature.

I fully agree with Janice's statement. The development of lymphoedema services has not been progressing fast enough and the availability of services across Wales remains

gennym yn y maes hwn. Yr oedd dwy o'r enghreifftiau mwyaf torcalonnus o waith achos a gefais erioed yn ymwneud â lymffoedema a oedd heb gysylltiad â chanser. Ni chefais ganlyniad cadarnhaol; ni chafodd y cleifion hynny eu trin. Mae un, hyd y gwn i, yn dal i deithio'n rheolaidd i'r Almaen i gael triniaeth, ac nid yw'r GIG ar gael yno.

Mae pobl yn drysu weithiau oherwydd lymffoedema gan ei fod yn cael ei gysylltu'n aml â chanser—ond nid ym mhob achos. Nid yw o bwys gennyf sut y byddwn yn darparu'r gwasanaeth hwn, bydded drwy Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Felindre ynteu drwy ysbytai canser, ond mae angen i wasanaethau lymffoedema fod ar gael i'r rheini sydd â lymffoedema nad yw'n gysylltiedig â chanser. Mae'n hen bryd rhoi triniaeth briodol i'r bobl hyn sydd â chyflwr poenus.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Diolch i chi, Janice, am godi'r mater hwn ac am ganiatáu imi siarad yn fyr. Yn gynharach, holais y Gweinidog am yr hosbis y cyfeiriodd Lesley ato, sef Hosbis Tŷ'r Eos, a chyfeiriaf hefyd at Hosbis Cyndeyrn Sant yn Sain Tathan, sy'n caniatáu defnyddio ei adeiladau'n rhad ac am ddim. Mae hyn yn ystyriaeth bwysig ar gyfer unrhyw gytundeb lefel gwasanaeth oherwydd mae'n defnyddio'r arian sydd eisoes ar gael yn y GIG yn y ffordd orau. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd ein Gweinidog dyfeisgar yn ein helpu i fynd ymlaen a sicrhau y bydd hosbisau fel Hosbis Cyndeyrn Sant a Hosbis Tŷ'r Eos ac eraill ledled y gogledd a thrwy weddill Cymru yn gallu cynnig y gwasanaeth hwn—maent eisoes yn cynnig gofal lliniarol—dan y GIG fel y cânt yr arian angenrheidiol i gynnig gofal am y cyflwr hwn sy'n un poenus iawn.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Edwina Hart):** Diolch i Janice am godi mater y cyflwr gwanychol a phoenus hwn. Derbyniaf y pwynt a wnaeth David Melding am bresenoldeb Aelodau i glywed y ddadl fer heddiw. Fel Aelodau o'r Cynulliad, yr ydym i gyd wedi cael gwaith achos sy'n ymwneud â'r cyflwr hwn ac mae rhai o'r achosion hynny'n dorcalonnus.

Yr wyf yn cyd-fynd yn llwyr â datganiad Janice. Nid yw gwasanaethau lymffoedema wedi datblygu'n ddigon cyflym ac gallu cael y gwasanaethau ledled Cymru yn dal yn

patchy. However, excellent services, as indicated by Lesley, are provided through the voluntary sector and there is also an excellent service in Swansea.

Lymphoedema was first brought to the Assembly Government's attention in 2003, and the cancer service co-ordinating group undertook a review of lymphoedema services in Wales, providing recommendations and guidance to local health boards and to trusts on the development of these services. I recently met with representatives of the Welsh Association of Lymphoedema Specialists to discuss the provision of lymphoedema services in Wales. They gave me an excellent presentation on those services, highlighting the incidence of cancer and non-cancer-related lymphoedema, the treatments currently available, the training requirements and the cost savings to the national health service if patients are treated appropriately—and Janice gave us some excellent illustrations of those today. What was immediately clear from the presentation was that there has been an increase in patients presenting with non-cancer-related lymphoedema in recent years. Over 50 per cent of all lymphoedema patients seen in Wales are suffering from the non-cancer-related form of the disease.

I have now asked officials to set up a task and finish group for lymphoedema to establish what constitutes a standard lymphoedema service, and to ensure that lymphoedema services are more entrenched in both chronic disease management and cancer plans. This group will be chaired by the deputy chief medical officer. Its remit will be to develop a programme of work on lymphoedema to ensure that all cancer-related and non-cancer-related lymphoedema patients receive equitable and prompt access to high quality assessment and treatment. The strategy will specifically address prevention and raising the awareness of health professionals and the public. We need to raise awareness because, as we heard from Janice, people with lymphoedema can be referred inappropriately. It will also address referral guidance, training and workforce development, the care pathways and measuring the quality of care.

anwastad. Er hynny, mae gwasanaethau rhagorol yn cael eu darparu drwy'r sector gwirfoddol, fel y dywedodd Lesley, ac mae gwasanaeth rhagorol hefyd yn Abertawe.

Tynnwyd lymffoedema i sylw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad gyntaf yn 2003, ac gwnaeth y grŵp cydgysylltu gwasanaethau canser adolygiad o wasanaethau lymffoedema yng Nghymru, gan roi argymhellion ac arweiniad i fyrdau ieched lleol ac i ymddiriedolaethau ar ddatblygu'r gwasanaethau hyn. Cyfarfûm yn ddiweddar â chynrychiolwyr Cymdeithas Arbenigwyr Lymffoedema Cymru i drafod darparu gwasanaethau lymffoedema yng Nghymru. Rhosant gyflwyniad rhagorol i mi ar y gwasanaethau hynny, gan dynnu sylw at amllder yr achosion o lymffoedema sydd â chysylltiad â chanser a'r rheini sydd heb gysylltiad â chanser, y triniaethau sydd ar gael ar hyn o bryd, yr anghenion o ran hyfforddi, a'r arbed costau i'r gwasanaeth ieched gwladol os caiff cleifion eu trin yn briodol—a rhoddodd Janice rai enghreifftiau rhagorol o'r rheini i ni heddiw. Yr hyn a oedd yn amlwg ar unwaith o'r cyflwyniad oedd bod cynnydd yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf yn nifer y cleifion a welir sydd â lymffoedema sydd heb gysylltiad â chanser. Mae dros 50 y cant o'r holl gleifion lymffoedema a welir yng Nghymru yn dioddef gan y ffurf ar y clefyd sydd heb gysylltiad â chanser.

Yr wyf wedi gofyn yn awr i swyddogion sefydlu grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar lymffoedema i bennu'r hyn yw gwasanaeth lymffoedema safonol, ac i sicrhau bod gwasanaethau lymffoedema wedi'u cynnwys i raddau helaethach mewn cynlluniau i reoli clefydau cronig a chynlluniau canser. Cadeirydd y grŵp hwn fydd y dirprwy brif swyddog meddygol. Ei gylch gorchwyl fydd datblygu rhaglen waith ar lymffoedema i sicrhau bod yr holl gleifion sy'n dioddef gan lymffoedema, boed â chysylltiad â chanser neu beidio, yn gallu cael asesiad a thriniaeth o safon uchel yn deg ac yn brydlon. Bydd y strategaeth yn ymdrin yn benodol ag atal a hybu ymwybyddiaeth ymysg gweithwyr ieched proffesiynol a'r cyhoedd. Mae angen inni hybu ymwybyddiaeth oherwydd, fel y clywsom gan Janice, gellir atgyfeirio pobl sydd â lymffoedema mewn modd amhriodol. Bydd hefyd yn ymdrin ag arweiniad ar atgyfeirio, hyfforddiant a datblygiad y

gweithlu, y llwybrau gofal a mesur ansawdd gofal.

I have asked the task group to develop a strategy to embed the planning and development of these services as part of the effective management of services for people with chronic conditions. I expect the strategy to take a holistic approach to lymphoedema services, looking at prevention measures, referral guidelines, care pathways and so on. Lymphoedema services should be planned to accommodate the requirements of both cancer and non-cancer patients.

Yr wyf wedi gofyn i'r grŵp gorchwyl ddatblygu strategaeth i wreiddio'r broses o gynllunio a datblygu'r gwasanaethau hyn yn y gwaith o reoli gwasanaethau i bobl sydd â chyflyrau cronig mewn modd effeithiol. Yr wyf yn disgwyl i'r strategaeth edrych yn gyfannol ar wasanaethau lymffoedema, gan ystyried mesurau atal, canllawiau ar atgyfeirio, llwybrau gofal, ac yn y blaen. Dylid cynllunio gwasanaethau lymffoedema er mwyn iddynt ddarparu ar gyfer anghenion cleifion cancer a chleifion eraill.

On David's point, historically, lymphoedema services have been planned by regional cancer networks, and the networks have made significant strides in recent years. However, we need further improvements in this area and we need to recognise the extent of the issue. Given the increase in non-cancer-related lymphoedema, NHS bodies now need to address the service requirements as part of a much wider framework for what we need to do for individuals.

Ynghylch y pwynt a wnaeth David, yn hanesyddol mae gwasanaethau lymffoedema wedi'u cynllunio gan rwydweithiau cancer rhanbarthol, ac mae'r rwydweithiau wedi cymryd camau mawr ymlaen yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Er hynny, mae arnom angen gwelliannau pellach yn y maes hwn ac mae angen inni gydnabod graddau'r mater sydd dan sylw. O gofio'r cynnydd yn nifer yr achosion o lymffoedema sydd heb gysylltiad â chanser, mae angen yn awr i gyrff y GIG roi sylw i anghenion y gwasanaeth yng nghyd-destun fframwaith llawer ehangach ar gyfer yr hyn y mae angen inni ei wneud dros unigolion.

Better prevention and early detection will address all the issues around what happens with hospital beds and the other services that are required. It is a win-win situation for the patient and for the national health service, because lymphoedema can cause people living with the condition considerable physical and psychological distress and it is important that that is recognised in the health sector.

Bydd camau gwell i atal a darganfod y cyflwr yn gynnar yn fodd i ymateb i'r holl broblemau'n ymwneud â defnyddio gwelyau mewn ysbytai a'r gwasanaethau eraill sy'n angenrheidiol. Yn y sefyllfa hon bydd y claf a'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol ar eu hennill, gan fod lymffoedema yn gallu achosi poen corfforol a seicolegol sylweddol i'r rheini sy'n dioddef gan y cyflwr, ac mae'n bwysig cydnabod hynny yn y sector iechyd.

I have published a chronic conditions management model and framework and a supporting service improvement plan to improve the overall planning management and delivery of care for those chronic conditions. In the first instance, I will ask LHBs to use this when considering future lymphoedema services, as the other work progresses.

Yr wyf wedi cyhoeddi model a fframwaith ar gyfer rheoli cyflyrau cronig, a chynllun gwella gwasanaeth i'w hategu er mwyn gwella'r dull cyffredinol o gynllunio, rheoli a darparu gofal ar gyfer y cyflyrau cronig hynny. Yn y lle cyntaf, byddaf yn gofyn i BILLau ddefnyddio hyn wrth ystyried gwasanaethau lymffoedema ar gyfer y dyfodol, wrth i'r gwaith arall fynd ymlaen.

On Lesley's and Nerys's points, I want to get the task and finish group working around this

Ynghylch y pwyntiau a wnaeth Lesley a Nerys, yr wyf am sicrhau y bydd y grŵp



area, but I also need it to put in a strategy for the development of services, to say what type of arrangements it wants—whether, for example, it wants service level agreements that the voluntary sector provides and whether we need the service across the piece. When we look at its report, we will look at the budgetary considerations year by year in terms of improving the service, because, at the end of the day, we must improve the quality of life of the patients suffering from this condition.

This condition has been largely ignored, but when you meet a constituent who has lymphoedema and they talk to you about how they feel about themselves, you realise that we have a duty to provide this service on the national health service effectively and efficiently.

**Y Llywydd:** Dyna ddiwedd ein trafodion am heddiw.

gorchwyl a gorffen yn gweithio o gwmpas y maes hwn, ond mae arnaf angen iddo hefyd gynnwys strategaeth ar gyfer datblygu gwasanaethau, i ddweud pa fath o drefniadau y mae am eu gweld—a yw am gael cytundebau lefel gwasanaeth y bydd y sector gwirfoddol yn eu darparu, er enghraifft, ac a oes arnom angen gwasanaeth cyffredinol. Pan edrychwn ar ei adroddiad, byddwn yn edrych ar yr ystyriaethau cyllidebol o flwyddyn i flwyddyn o ran gwella'r gwasanaeth, oherwydd yn y pen draw rhaid inni wella ansawdd bywyd y cleifion sy'n dioddef gan y cyflwr hwn.

Mae'r cyflwr hwn wedi'i anwybyddu i raddau helaeth, ond pan fyddwch yn cwrdd ag etholwr sydd â lymffoedema ac yntau'n sôn am ei deimladau amdano'i hun, byddwch yn sylweddoli ei bod yn ddyletswydd arnom i ddarparu'r gwasanaeth hwn dan y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol mewn modd effeithiol ac effeithlon.

**The Presiding Officer:** That brings today's proceedings to a close.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 4.57 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 4.57 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau  
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
Asghar, Mohammad (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Burns, Angela (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
Davies, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
Davies, Andrew R.T. (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Davies, Paul (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Evans, Nerys (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Franks, Chris (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
Griffiths, Lesley (Llafur – Labour)  
Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)

Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jenkins, Bethan (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Gareth (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Millar, Darren (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
 Ramsay, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Watson, Joyce (Llafur – Labour)  
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)