



Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
The National Assembly for Wales

Cofnod y Trafodion
The Record of Proceedings

Dydd Mercher, 21 Mai 2008
Wednesday, 21 May 2008

Cynnwys
Contents

- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Cwnsler Cyffredinol ac Arweinydd y Tŷ
Questions to the Counsel General and Leader of the House
- 4 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig
Questions to the Minister for Rural Affairs
- 25 Datganiad am Reoli Perygl Llifogydd ac Adolygiad Pitt
Statement on Flood Risk Management and the Pitt Review
- 40 Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cynaliadwyedd ar Leihau Allyriadau Carbon yn y Cartref
The Sustainability Committee's Report on Household Carbon Reduction
- 57 Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Iechyd, Lles a Llywodraeth Leol ar yr Ymchwiliad i Gynllunio
Gweithlu yn y Gwasanaeth Iechyd ac ym Maes Gofal Cymdeithasol
The Health, Wellbeing and Local Government Committee's Report into Workforce
Planning in the Health Service and Social Care
- 78 Dadl Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru: Addysg Uwch
Welsh Liberal Democrats Debate: Higher Education
- 107 Dadl Fer: Ysgol a Chymuned
Short Debate: School and Community
- 114 Amser Pleidleisio
Voting Time

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been
included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 12.30 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 12.30 p.m. with the Presiding Officer (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) in the Chair.*

Y Llywydd: Galwaf y Cynulliad i drefn.

The Presiding Officer: I call the Assembly to order.

Cwestiynau i'r Cwnsler Cyffredinol ac Arweinydd y Tŷ Questions to the Counsel General and Leader of the House

UK Government Consultations

Q1 Sandy Mewies: What responses has the Counsel General made to UK Government consultations? OAQ(3)0104(CGE)

It was nice to see you breaking off from your important duties, Counsel General, to welcome a school from your constituency, as I welcomed Argoed High School from my constituency.

The Counsel General and Leader of the House (Carwyn Jones): As Counsel General, I have responded to two UK Government public consultations, about judicial appointments and the role of the Attorney-General. Copies of both responses have been made available to Assembly Members.

Sandy Mewies: I am sure that you will agree that much work has been done to ensure that senior members of the judiciary properly reflect society in terms of age, gender and race. I know that this is not a devolved matter, but it still appears to be the case that, unintentionally, minimum entry requirements can still reduce the diversity of the candidate field. Can you give me an assurance that, in any discussions that you may have on judicial appointments, you will press the case for a truly reflective judiciary in Wales?

Carwyn Jones: Yes. That point is not lost on those who make judicial appointments in London. For some time now, great attempts have been made to assimilate more diversity in judicial appointments, because it is important, of course, that our judiciary and justice system closely reflect society as a whole.

Ymgynghoriadau Llywodraeth y DU

C1 Sandy Mewies: Pa ymatebion mae'r Cwnsler Cyffredinol wedi'u gwneud i ymgynghoriadau Llywodraeth y DU? OAQ(3)0104(CGE)

Yr oedd yn braf eich gweld yn torri'n rhydd oddi wrth eich dyletswyddau pwysig, Gwnsler Cyffredinol, i groesawu ysgol o'ch etholaeth, fel y croesewais Ysgol Uwchradd Argoed o'm hetholaeth.

Y Cwnsler Cyffredinol ac Arweinydd y Tŷ (Carwyn Jones): Fel Cwnsler Cyffredinol, yr wyf wedi ymateb i ddau o ymgynghoriadau cyhoeddus Llywodraeth y DU, ynghylch penodiadau barnwrol a rôl y Twrnai Cyffredinol. Mae copïau o'r ddau ymateb ar gael i Aelodau'r Cynulliad.

Sandy Mewies: Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn cytuno bod llawer o waith wedi'i wneud er mwyn sicrhau bod uwch aelodau'r farnwriaeth yn adlewyrchu cymdeithas yn briodol o ran oedran, rhyw a hil. Gwn nad yw hyn yn fater datganoledig, ond mae'n ymddangos o hyd, yn anfwriadol, y gall gofynion derbyn sylfaenol leihau amrywiaeth maes yr ymgeisydd. A allwch fy sicrhau y byddwch, mewn unrhyw drafodaethau a gewch efallai ar benodiadau barnwrol, yn gweithio'n galed i gael barnwriaeth gwbl adlewyrchol yng Nghymru?

Carwyn Jones: Gallaf. Nid yw'r bobl sy'n gwneud penodiadau barnwrol yn Llundain wedi anghofio am y pwynt hwnnw. Ers tro bellach, mae ymgais wych wedi'i gwneud i gymhathu mwy o amrywiaeth mewn penodiadau barnwrol, gan ei bod yn bwysig, wrth gwrs, bod ein barnwriaeth a'n system cyfiawnder yn adlewyrchu'r gymdeithas

drwyddi draw.

Chris Franks: You will be aware of the details of the Local Transport Bill that is currently going through the UK Parliament. One clause proposes the abolition of traffic commissioners for Wales, who are to be replaced with a heavily London-centred structure. You will also be aware that the Secretary of State for Transport will be able to appoint and direct, through a senior commissioner, matters relating to Wales. Do you agree that it is a retrograde step for Wales to be losing this important power? Are you able to have any discussions with the relevant UK Government Minister in this regard?

Carwyn Jones: This would not be a matter for me as Counsel General; it is a matter for the appropriate Minister—the Deputy First Minister and Minister for Economy and Transport, I suspect—to make such representations as he feels appropriate.

Chris Franks: Byddwch yn ymwybodol o fanylion y Mesur Trafnidiaeth Leol sy'n mynd drwy Senedd y DU ar hyn o bryd. Mae un cymal yn cynnig diddymu comisiynwyr traffig yng Nghymru, er mwyn eu disodli â strwythur sydd wedi'i ganoli'n bennaf yn Llundain. Byddwch hefyd yn ymwybodol y bydd yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Drafnidiaeth yn gallu penodi a chyfeirio, drwy uwch gomisiynydd, materion sy'n berthnasol i Gymru. A ydych yn cytuno bod colli'r pŵer pwysig hwn yn gam yn ôl i Gymru? A ydych yn gallu cynnal unrhyw drafodaethau gyda Gweinidog perthnasol Llywodraeth y DU i'r perwyl hwn?

Carwyn Jones: Ni fyddai hwn yn fater i mi fel Cwnsler Cyffredinol; mater i'r Gweinidog perthnasol—y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth, tybiaf—yw gwneud sylwadau o'r fath fel y bydd yn briodol iddo.

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig Questions to the Minister for Rural Affairs

Agricultural Diversification

Q1 Darren Millar: Will the Minister make a statement on agricultural diversification in Wales? OAQ(3)0325(RAF)

The Minister for Rural Affairs (Elin Jones): Taking advantage of market trends and consumer demand is key to maintaining successful farm enterprises. Whereas it is for farmers themselves to make decisions on the direction of their businesses, Farming Connect, under the rural development plan, is a support mechanism to advise on diversification options, improve business viability and access new markets.

Darren Millar: One avenue of diversification that is being considered by some Welsh farmers is the production of crops for biofuels. Given the benefits that a sustainable biofuels policy can deliver for the environment and the contribution that it can make in assisting the Welsh Assembly Government to meet its target to reduce

Arallgyfeirio Amaethyddol

C1 Darren Millar: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am arallgyfeirio amaethyddol yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)0325(RAF)

Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Elin Jones): Mae manteisio ar dueddiadau'r farchnad a galw defnyddwyr yn allweddol i gynnal mentrau fferm llwyddiannus. Er mai'r ffermwyr eu hunain sy'n gyfrifol am wneud penderfyniadau ar gyfeiriad eu busnesau, mae Cyswllt Ffermio, o dan y cynllun datblygu gwledig, yn ddull cefnogi sy'n rhoi cyngor ar opsiynau arallgyfeirio, gwella hyfywedd busnes a chael mynediad i farchnadoedd newydd.

Darren Millar: Un ffordd o arallgyfeirio sy'n cael ei hystyried gan rai ffermwyr yng Nghymru yw cynhyrchu cynydau ar gyfer biodanwydd. O wybod y buddiannau y gall polisi biodanwyddau cynaliadwy ei wneud i'r amgylchedd a'r cyfraniad y gall ei wneud o ran helpu Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gyrraedd ei tharged i leihau allyriadau nwyon

greenhouse gas emissions in areas of devolved competence, what action are you taking to support Welsh farmers who wish to enter this fledgling industry, such as BML Biofuels Ltd in my constituency?

Elin Jones: It is timely that you ask this question on the day following the announcement by the European Commission on the common agriculture policy health check, because one proposal that it announced yesterday is to end the premium for energy-crop production under the CAP as a result of the increased market opportunities and to allow the market to develop this sector. You will know that, under the 'One Wales' commitment, we have an aspiration to consider energy crops and support for energy-crop production. In the light of yesterday's proposal and the axis 2 review that we undertake under the rural development plan, I will be looking again at how and if we can provide support for this sector, and to ascertain whether it needs support or whether demand in the market will allow the sector to blossom without public intervention.

Lesley Griffiths: Despite the doom and gloom predicted by proponents of fox hunting, in that the rural economy and agriculture would suffer with the introduction of a ban on hunting with dogs, the reality could not be more different. Traditional trades such as those practised by farriers and saddlers have thrived since the ban, and even the Countryside Alliance is now saying that it got the economics of the hunting ban wrong. Do you agree that it would be dangerous for the rural economy in Wales to even contemplate flirting with David Cameron's pledge to overturn the Hunting Act 2004 and reintroduce the barbaric act of using dogs to kill foxes?

Elin Jones: I can confirm that I have had no representations from rural areas on this particular issue or on any decline that they have seen in the rural economy as a result of the ban on foxhunting. Should David Cameron ever get to be Prime Minister, and should he introduce such a Bill, it will be interesting to see whether he allows the National Assembly the right to make a

tŷ gwydr mewn meysydd sydd wedi'u datganoli, pa gamau gweithredu yr ydych yn eu cymryd i gefnogi ffermwyr yng Nghymru sydd am gael mynediad i'r diwydiant newydd hwn, fel BML Biofuels Cyf yn fy etholaeth?

Elin Jones: Mae'n amserol eich bod yn gofyn y cwestiwn hwn ddiwrnod ar ôl y cyhoeddiad gan y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd ar archwiliad iechyd y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin, oherwydd ymhlith un o'r cynigion a gyhoeddodd ddoe oedd rhoi'r gorau i'r premiwm ar gyfer cynhyrchu cnydau ynni o dan y PAC o ganlyniad i fwy o gyfleoedd yn y farchnad ac i alluogi'r farchnad i ddatblygu'r sector hwn. Byddwch yn gwybod, o dan un o ymrwymiadau 'Cymru'n Un', bod ystyried cnydau ynni a chefnogi cynhyrchu cnydau ynni yn un o'n huchelgeisiau. Yn sgil cynnig ddoe a'r adolygiad echel 2 yr ydym yn ei gyflawni o dan y cynllun datblygu gwledig, byddaf yn edrych eto p'un ai a allwn roi cefnogaeth i'r sector hwn, a sut, a phennu a oes angen cymorth arno neu a fydd y galw yn y farchnad yn galluogi'r sector i flodeuo heb ymyriad cyhoeddus.

Lesley Griffiths: Er gwaethaf y rhagdybiaethau negyddol gan y rhai a oedd o blaid hela llwynogod, sef y byddai'r economi wledig ac amaethyddiaeth yn dioddef ar ôl cyflwyno'r gwaharddiad ar hela gyda chŵn, mae'r realiti'n gwbl wahanol. Mae crefftau traddodiadol fel crefftau ffariers a chyfrwywyr wedi ffynnu ers y gwaharddiad, ac mae hyd yn oed y Gynghrair Cefn Gwlad yn cydnabod bellach eu bod yn anghywir o ran effaith economaidd y gwaharddiad ar hela. A ydych yn cytuno y byddai'n beryglus i'r economi wledig yng Nghymru hyd yn oed ystyried cynnig David Cameron i wrthdroi Deddf Hela 2004 ac ailgyflwyno'r weithred farbaraidd o ddefnyddio cŵn i ladd llwynogod?

Elin Jones: Gallaf gadarnhau nad wyf wedi cael dim sylwadau o ardaloedd gwledig ar y mater penodol hwn neu ar unrhyw ddirywiad y maent wedi'i weld yn yr economi wledig o ganlyniad i'r gwaharddiad ar hela llwynogod. Os caiff David Cameron y cyfle i fod yn Brif Weinidog ryw ddydd, a phe byddai'n cyflwyno Mesur o'r fath, byddai'n ddiddorol gweld p'un a fyddai'n caniatáu i'r Cynulliad

decision for itself about foxhunting.

Kirsty Williams: In your answer to Darren Millar, you said that it is important for farmers to look at market trends and respond to consumer demands. Two farming families in my constituency are trying to do just that with the development of an on-farm shop to supply local produce. However, as with so many diversification projects, they have fallen foul of planning regulations with regard to access to the trunk road. The authorities do not want farm shops in highly rural areas, because they say that small roads cannot cope with the traffic, and yet they do not want farm shops directly alongside trunk roads, because they say that that causes traffic issues. What kinds of farms are suitable for such businesses? There is demand for these shops—a business is waiting to be developed, and yet it has fallen foul of planning regulations and road traffic rules.

Elin Jones: I cannot comment on the individual applications to which you refer, but, in general, economic development opportunities in rural areas and on farms should be looked at positively by planning authorities. I believe that that is the case. With individual applications, of course, the test is on an individual application to prove its merits. If you wish to raise any general policy issues with me about this matter, I am happy for you to do that, either with me or with the Minister with the responsibility for planning, who has ultimate decision-making powers on this issue.

David Lloyd: What discussions have you had regarding the Competition Commission's proposals for an independent ombudsman to protect the interests of suppliers of locally sourced produce against the dominance of supermarket chains?

Elin Jones: During the Competition Commission's review of the grocery supply chain, I made representations last autumn advocating the need for greater transparency and greater certainty in the food supply chain for suppliers, processors and retailers. I was

Cenedlaethol gael yr hawl i wneud penderfyniad drosto'i hun ar hela llwynogod.

Kirsty Williams: Yn eich ateb i Darren Millar, dywedasoch ei bod yn bwysig i ffermwyr edrych ar dueddiadau'r farchnad ac ymateb i alw defnyddwyr. Mae dau deulu sy'n ffermio yn fy etholaeth yn ceisio gwneud hynny drwy ddatblygu siop ar y fferm yn gwerthu cynnyrch lleol. Fodd bynnag, fel sy'n wir gyda chynifer o brosiectau arallgyfeirio, maent wedi mynd yn groes i reoliadau cynllunio o ran mynediad i'r gefnffordd. Nid yw'r awdurdodau am weld siopau fferm mewn ardaloedd gwledig iawn, oherwydd dywedant na fyddai ffyrdd bach yn gallu ymdopi â'r traffig, ac eto nid ydynt am weld siopau fferm yn uniongyrchol ar ochr cefnffyrdd, oherwydd dywedant y byddai'n achosi problemau traffig. Pa fath o ffermydd sy'n addas ar gyfer busnesau o'r fath? Ceir galw am y siopau hyn—mae busnes yn gofyn am gael ei ddatblygu, ac eto mae wedi mynd yn groes i reoliadau cynllunio a rheolau traffig ffordd.

Elin Jones: Ni allaf roi sylwadau ar y ceisiadau unigol yr ydych yn cyfeirio atynt, ond, yn gyffredinol, dylai awdurdodau cynllunio ystyried cyfleoedd datblygu economaidd mewn ardaloedd gwledig ac ar ffermydd yn gadarnhaol. Credaf fod hynny'n digwydd. Gyda cheisiadau unigol, wrth gwrs, cyfrifoldeb y cais unigol yw profi ei rinweddau. Os hoffech godi unrhyw faterion polisi cyffredinol gyda mi ynglŷn â'r mater hwn, yr wyf yn fodlon ichi wneud hynny, naill ai gyda mi neu gyda'r Gweinidog sydd â'r cyfrifoldeb dros gynllunio, sydd â'r prif bwerau llunio penderfyniadau ar y mater hwn.

David Lloyd: Pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi'u cael ynghylch cynigion y Comisiwn Cystadlu i gael ombwdsmon annibynnol i ddiogelu buddiannau cyflenwyr cynnyrch lleol yn erbyn goruchafiaeth cadwyni archfarchnadoedd?

Elin Jones: Yn ystod adolygiad y Comisiwn Cystadlu o'r gadwyn cyflenwi bwyd, gwneuthum sylwadau hydref y llynedd yn hyrwyddo'r angen i fod yn fwy agored ac i warantu mwy o sicrwydd o ran y gadwyn cyflenwi bwyd i gyflenwyr, prosesyddion a

particularly pleased that the Competition Commission took up my idea—it was not exclusively my idea, I might say—to introduce the prospect of a statutory code for the grocery supply chain along with a supermarkets ombudsman.

Economic Development

Q2 Sandy Mewies: What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to promote the economic development of rural communities in Flintshire? OAQ(3)0339(RAF)

Elin Jones: ‘One Wales’ sets out the Government’s key aims to deliver a sustainable future for communities like those in rural Flintshire. Our strategic commitments are being delivered through general economic development, associated support measures and specific programmes that, under my portfolio, would include the rural development plan.

12.40 p.m.

Sandy Mewies: I am sure that you will agree that diversification of rural industry, including, and perhaps particularly, farming, is important. In my Delyn constituency, for example, I have a buffalo farmer, and other farmers support tourism. What discussions have you had with your ministerial colleagues, across portfolios, so that everyone encourages such activities?

Elin Jones: As I indicated in my initial response, economic development issues in rural communities cross various ministerial portfolio responsibilities—the Deputy First Minister leads on general economic development and business support, and the Minister for Heritage also has a specific interest in the important field of farm diversification into tourism opportunities. I am keen that farms and rural areas feel that they can access all Assembly Government measures of support, so that they can maximise their business opportunities, especially your buffalo farmer in Delyn.

manwerthwyr. Yr oeddwn yn arbennig o falch pan benderfynodd y Comisiwn Cystadlu fabwysiadu fy syniad—er nad fy syniad i yn unig ydoedd, y mae’n rhaid i mi gyfaddef—o gyflwyno’r cysyniad o god statudol ar gyfer y gadwyn cyflenwi bwyd ynghyd ag ombwdsmon archfarchnadoedd.

Datblygu Economaidd

C2 Sandy Mewies: Beth mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i hyrwyddo datblygiad economaidd cymunedau gwledig yn sir y Fflint? OAQ(3)0339(RAF)

Elin Jones: Mae ‘Cymru’n Un’ yn gosod allan prif nodau’r Llywodraeth i gyflwyno dyfodol cynaliadwy i gymunedau fel y cymunedau gwledig hynny yn sir y Fflint. Mae ein hymrwymiaid strategol yn cael eu cyflwyno drwy ddatblygu economaidd cyffredinol, mesurau cefnogi cysylltiol a rhaglenni penodol a fyddai, o dan fy mhortffolio, yn cynnwys y cynllun datblygu gwledig.

Sandy Mewies: Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn cytuno bod arallgyfeirio yn y diwydiant gwledig, gan gynnwys, ac yn arbennig efallai, ffermio, yn bwysig. Yn fy etholaeth, Delyn, er enghraifft, mae gennyf ffermwr byfflo, a ffermwyr eraill sy’n cefnogi twristiaeth. Pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi’u cael gyda’ch cyd-Weinidogion, ar draws y portffolios, er mwyn i bawb annog gweithgareddau o’r fath?

Elin Jones: Fel y nodais yn fy ateb gwreiddiol, mae materion datblygu economaidd mewn cymunedau gwledig yn cael eu cynnwys mewn amrywiaeth o gyfrifoldebau portffolio gweinidogol—y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog sy’n arwain ar ddatblygu economaidd cyffredinol a chymorth i fusnesau, ac mae gan y Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth hefyd ddi-ddordeb penodol ym maes pwysig arallgyfeirio ffermydd yn gyfleoedd twristaidd. Yr wyf yn awyddus bod ffermydd ac ardaloedd gwledig yn teimlo y gallant gael mynediad at holl fesurau cefnogi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, fel y gallant fanteisio i’r eithaf ar eu cyfleoedd busnes, yn

enwedig eich ffermwr byfflo yn Nelyn.

Mark Isherwood: Rural north Flintshire Communities First has a key role to play in the economic development of rural communities in Flintshire. A Wales Audit Office report states that Flintshire County Council's use of statistics in relation to this was flawed and inappropriate. The WAO believes that there is a wider issue in terms of the potential impact of the errors, which was not addressed at the time, and is still not addressed. It concludes its report by stating its understanding that the Assembly Government is now aware of the points, and that it is for it to decide whether to take action to address any adverse consequences as a result of the errors made by the council. What action can, or will, you undertake, with ministerial colleagues, to ensure that this is looked at, and that the roll-out of the next stage is undertaken in the most open, transparent and targeted way?

Elin Jones: I am not aware of that particular report. Communities First is not a matter for me directly as Minister; I am sure that you could address your questions and comments to the Deputy Minister for Regeneration, who has that responsibility. On a more general issue, I had a discussion recently with the Deputy Minister on regeneration opportunities in the rural context, including in Communities First areas in rural Wales, and the options for those areas into the future.

Janet Ryder: I am sure that you are aware that those rural communities in Flintshire fall under the north-east Wales, west Cheshire and Wirral spatial development plan, whose objective is to provide housing for the Wirral and west Cheshire. Will you ensure that those communities in that north-east section of Wales are not swamped, and do not just become dormitory villages providing housing for an overspill from Cheshire, but are developed to fulfil their own potential, and Wales's needs?

Mark Isherwood: Mae gan Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn ardal gwledig gogledd sir y Fflint rôl allweddol i'w chwarae o ran datblygiad economaidd cymunedau gwledig yn sir y Fflint. Mae adroddiad gan Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru yn nodi bod defnydd Cyngor Sir y Fflint o'r ystadegau hyn yn ddiffygiol ac yn amhrifodol. Mae'r swyddfa archwilio yn credu bod mater ehangach o ran effaith bosibl y camgymeriadau hyn, nad aethpwyd i'r afael â hwy ar y pryd, ac nad ydynt yn cael eu datrys o hyd. Mae'n cloi ei hadroddiad drwy nodi ei bod yn deall bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ymwybodol o'r pwyntiau bellach, ac mai ei chyfrifoldeb yw penderfynu gweithredu i fynd i'r afael ag unrhyw ganlyniadau anffafriol o ganlyniad i'r camgymeriadau a wnaethpwyd gan y cyngor. Pa gamau gweithredu y gallwch, neu y byddwch yn eu cymryd, gyda'ch cyd-Weinidogion, i sicrhau y caiff hyn ei ystyried, ac y bydd y broses o gyflwyno'r cam nesaf yn cael ei chyflawni yn y ffordd fwyaf agored, eglur ac wedi'i thargedu?

Elin Jones: Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o'r adroddiad penodol hwnnw. Nid yw Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn fater uniongyrchol i mi fel Gweinidog; yr wyf yn siŵr y gallech gyfeirio eich cwestiynau a'ch sylwadau at y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Adfywio, sy'n gyfrifol am hynny. Ar fater mwy cyffredinol, cefais drafodaeth yn ddiweddar gyda'r Dirprwy Weinidog ar gyfleoedd adfywio yn y cyd-destun gwledig, gan gynnwys ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yng nghefn gwlad Cymru, a'r opsiynau i'r ardaloedd hynny yn y dyfodol.

Janet Ryder: Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol bod y cymunedau gwledig hynny yn sir y Fflint yn dod o dan gynllun datblygu gofodol gogledd-ddwyrain Cymru, gorllewin swydd Gaer a Chilgwri, sydd â'r nod o ddarparu tai i Gilgwri a gorllewin swydd Gaer. A wnewch sicrhau na fydd y cymunedau hynny yn ardal gogledd-ddwyrain Cymru yn cael eu boddi, ac na fyddant yn dod yn bentrefi noswyl er mwyn darparu tai i'r gorlif o swydd Gaer, ond y cânt eu datblygu i gyflawni eu potensial eu hunain, ac anghenion Cymru?

Elin Jones: The lead ministerial responsibility for north-east Wales on spatial planning lies with my colleague Brian Gibbons. I am keen to emphasise that the aspiration of this Government is to ensure that the economic development potential of north-east Wales, along with every other part of Wales, is maximised to the full so that people feel that they can live and work in Wales.

The Presiding Officer: Order. Before I call Eleanor Burnham, I remind everyone that it is not a good use of Assembly time for Members to ask oral supplementary questions that are directed to the wrong Minister. I assume, Eleanor Burnham, that your question is directed to the Minister for Rural Affairs.

Eleanor Burnham: Gyda'ch caniatâd, Lywydd, yr oeddwn am ofyn am y cynllun datblygu gwledig.

Y Llywydd: Da iawn.

Eleanor Burnham: Mae sôn yn y cynllun am ddatblygu'r diwydiant twristiaeth. Clywais ddoe bod twristiaeth yng Nghymru wedi cael ei daro gan dywydd gwael, ac yn y blaen. Beth y gallwch ei wneud, Weinidog, i helpu twristiaeth i ddatblygu yn well yn sir y Fflint?

Elin Jones: Yr oedd rhan gyntaf eich cwestiwn yn dda, Eleanor, ond fy nghyfaill, Rhodri Glyn Thomas, sy'n bennaf gyfrifol am dwristiaeth. Fodd bynnag, mae twristiaeth yn bwysig i economi cefn gwlad. Fel yr wyf wedi sôn eisoes, mae twristiaeth yn arbennig o bwysig fel modd i rai ffermydd arallgyfeirio eu busnes i gynnwys elfen o incwm o dwristiaeth, yn ogystal ag incwm o ddulliau mwy traddodiadol o amaethu. Felly, yr wyf eisiau gweld hyn yn cael ei ddatblygu wrth i ni gychwyn ar y broses o ddefnyddio'r cyfleoedd y mae'r cynllun datblygu gwledig yn eu rhoi i ni.

Stimulating the Economy

Q3 Alun Davies: How is the Welsh Assembly Government working to stimulate the economy in rural areas?
OAQ(3)0346(RAF)

Elin Jones: Fy nghyd-Weinidog, Brian Gibbons, sydd â'r prif gyfrifoldeb gweinidogol o ran cynllunio gofodol ar gyfer gogledd-ddwyrain Cymru. Yr wyf yn awyddus i bwysleisio mai dyhead y Llywodraeth hon yw sicrhau y manteisir i'r eithaf ar ddatblygiad economaidd posibl gogledd-ddwyrain Cymru, ynghyd â phob rhan arall o Gymru, fel y gall pobl deimlo y gallant fyw a gweithio yng Nghymru.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Cyn i mi alw ar Eleanor Burnham, yr wyf yn atgoffa pawb nad yw gofyn cwestiynau llafar ategol sydd wedi'u cyfeirio at y Gweinidog anghywir yn ffordd effeithiol o ddefnyddio amser y Cynulliad. Yr wyf yn tybio, Eleanor Burnham, fod eich cwestiwn wedi'i gyfeirio at y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig.

Eleanor Burnham: With your permission, Presiding Officer, I was going to ask about the rural development plan.

The Presiding Officer: Well done.

Eleanor Burnham: There is reference in the plan to developing the tourism industry. I heard yesterday that tourism in Wales has been hit by bad weather, and so on. What can you do, Minister, to improve tourism development in Flintshire?

Elin Jones: The first part of your question was good, Eleanor, but it is my colleague, Rhodri Glyn Thomas, who is chiefly responsible for tourism. However, tourism is important to the rural economy. As I have already mentioned, tourism is particularly important as a means for some farms to diversify their business in order to include an element of income from tourism, as well as income from more traditional forms of agriculture. Therefore, I want to see this being developed as we begin the process of taking advantage of the opportunities that the rural development plan presents to us.

Ysgogi'r Economi

C3 Alun Davies: Sut mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gweithio i ysgogi'r economi mewn ardaloedd gwledig?
OAQ(3)0346(RAF)

Elin Jones: Mae 'Cymru'n Un' a'r cynllun gofodol yn rhoi amlinelliad o'r prif ymrwymïadau strategol ar gyfer Cymru gyfan. O fewn fy mhortffolio, mae cymorth o dan y cynllun datblygu gwledig yn ategu gwaith ar draws Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ddarparu dyfodol cynaliadwy ar gyfer Cymru wledig.

Alun Davies: Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw. Yr ydych yr un mor ymwybodol â minnau, Weinidog, o bwysigrwydd y diwydiant llaeth, yn arbennig yng ngorllewin Cymru. A wnewch chi roi'r manylion diweddaraf i ni o ran sut ydych yn gweld y strategaeth laeth yn datblygu? A ydych o'r farn ei bod yn cyrraedd ei hamcanion? A ydych o'r farn y bydd y strategaeth yn llwyddo i sicrhau bod gennym fwy o fuddsoddiad mewn ffatrïoedd prosesu llaeth, lle y bu inni golli allan yn y gorffennol?

Elin Jones: Yr wyf yn cytuno â chi ynglŷn â phwysigrwydd y diwydiant llaeth yng Nghymru gyfan, ond yn enwedig yn y de orllewin, yn hanesyddol. Mae'r angen i sicrhau bod llaeth yn cael ei gynhyrchu a'i brosesu yng Nghymru lawn mor bwysig. Yr oeddwn yn Hwlfordd ddydd Iau diwethaf yn agor ffatri brosesu newydd First Milk. Cafodd gymorth grant o fwy na £1 miliwn gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad er mwyn buddsoddi yn y ffatri. Ychydig wythnosau ynghynt, yr oeddwn ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr gyda Dairy Farmers of Britain, sy'n datblygu ei fuddsoddiad yn y fan honno. Felly, mae'n galonogol gweld proseswyr mawr a chwmnïau cydweithredol ym mherchnogaeth ffermwyr yn buddsoddi yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn awyddus i weld prosesu a datblygu cynnyrch newydd hefyd yng Nghymru. Mae honno'n elfen bwysig o'r strategaeth laeth, ac mae'n elfen bwysig o'r cydweithio rhwng y Llywodraeth, y proseswyr a'r ffermwyr.

Nick Ramsay: I thank the Minister for the meeting that she had yesterday with me and representatives of the pig industry in Wales. We have already heard from Alun Davies about the importance of the dairy industry, and I know that efforts to help that industry are welcomed. On the wider issue of the economy in rural areas, do you intend to do

Elin Jones: 'One Wales' and the spatial plan set out our key strategic commitments for all of Wales. Within my portfolio, support under the rural development plan complements work across the Assembly Government to provide for a sustainable future for rural Wales.

Alun Davies: Thank you for that answer. You are just as aware as I am, Minister, of the importance of the dairy industry, particularly to west Wales. Could you give us an update regarding how you see the dairy strategy developing? Do you think that it is fulfilling its objectives? Do you think that the strategy will succeed in ensuring that we attract greater investment in milk processing factories, which is where we have missed out in the past?

Elin Jones: I agree with you about the importance of the dairy industry for the whole of Wales, but particularly in south-west Wales, historically. It is just as important to ensure that milk is produced as well as processed in Wales. I was in Haverfordwest last Thursday, opening First Milk's new processing factory. It received grant assistance of more than £1 million from the Assembly Government to invest in the factory. A few weeks earlier, I was in Bridgend with Dairy Farmers of Britain, which is developing its investment there. It is therefore encouraging to see major processors as well as farmer-owned co-operative companies investing in Wales. I am also keen to see new products being processed and developed in Wales. That is an important element of the dairy strategy, and an important element of the collaboration between the Government, the processors and the farmers.

Nick Ramsay: Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am y cyfarfod a gafodd ddod gyda mi a chynrychiolwyr y diwydiant moch yng Nghymru. Yr ydym eisoes wedi clywed gan Alun Davies am bwysigrwydd y diwydiant llaeth, a gwn y croesewir ymdrechion i gynorthwyo'r diwydiant hwnnw. Ac edrych ar fater ehangach yr economi mewn

anything to help the Monmouthshire rural community action group in my area? I know that you are aware of this issue; it is due to lose its funding in 2009 as a result of the money being diverted into the rural development plan. I appreciate that that money was not guaranteed from the outset, but the group has done much good work with communities in my constituency over the last few years, and I would be grateful to hear whether or not you have plans to give further support to it or similar groups in the future.

Elin Jones: On the funding that has been supplied to rural community action, the proposal in future is that all of this work is to be undertaken under axis 3 and 4 of the rural development plan, and I am aware that Monmouthshire is an applicant under the axis 3 and 4 measures of the rural development plan. I hope to make a statement in June confirming the business applications for that funding stream under the rural development plan.

Alun Ffred Jones: Cyfeiriodd Alun Davies at ysgogi'r economi wledig, ond yr wyf yn eich cyfeirio at Fferm Pant Du yn nyffryn Nantlle, sydd wedi mynd ati i blannu gwinllan fawr a pherllannau ar y tir, gyda'r bwriad o gynhyrchu gwin a seidr, maes o law—rhyw fath o Château Nantlle. Pa gefnogaeth y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei chynnig i'r math hwn o ddatblygiad cyffrous? A wnewch chi dderbyn gwahoddiad i weld y cynllun ar waith ar lethrau hardd dyffryn Nantlle, pan fydd yn gyfleus?

Elin Jones: Ni allwn wrthod gwahoddiad i ymweld â'r llethrau yn nyffryn Nantlle a fydd yn cynhyrchu Château Nantlle yn y dyfodol. Byddwn yn hapus i dderbyn y gwahoddiad. Gobeithiaf y bydd y fferm a'r datblygwyr yn gweithio gyda fy adran i weld pa gyfleoedd sydd ar gael o ran cefnogaeth ar gyfer datblygiadau mewn meysydd newydd sydd o werth uchel. Yn y pen draw, bydd o fudd ac o fantais i'ch etholaeth.

ardaloedd gwledig, a ydych yn bwriadu gwneud unrhyw beth i gynorthwyo grŵp gweithredu cymunedol gwledig sir Fynwy yn fy ardal i? Gwn eich bod yn ymwybodol o'r mater hwn; ni fydd yn cael cyllid yn 2009 gan fod yr arian yn cael ei ddargyfeirio i'r cynllun datblygu gwledig. Sylweddolaf nad oedd yr arian hwnnw wedi'i warantu o'r dechrau, ond mae'r grŵp wedi gwneud llawer o waith da gyda chymunedau yn fy etholaeth dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf, a byddwn yn gwerthfawrogi clywed a oes gennych gynlluniau i roi cymorth ychwanegol ai peidio i'r grŵp hwn neu i grwpiau tebyg yn y dyfodol.

Elin Jones: O ran y cyllid a roddwyd i weithredu cymunedol gwledig, y cynnig yn y dyfodol yw bod yr holl waith hwn yn cael ei wneud dan echel 3 a 4 y cynllun datblygu gwledig, a gwn fod sir Fynwy yn ymgeisydd dan fesurau echel 3 a 4 y cynllun datblygu gwledig. Gobeithiaf wneud datganiad ym mis Mehefin yn cadarnhau'r ceisiadau busnes ar gyfer y ffrwd ariannu honno dan y cynllun datblygu gwledig.

Alun Ffred Jones: Alun Davies referred to regenerating the rural economy, and so I want to refer you to Fferm Pant Du in the Nantlle valley, which has planted a large vineyard as well as orchards on its land, with the intention of producing wine and cider in due course—some sort of Château Nantlle. What support is the Assembly Government offering to this kind of exciting development? Will you accept an invitation to visit the scheme in action on the beautiful slopes of the Nantlle valley, at a time that is convenient to you?

Elin Jones: How could I refuse such an invitation to visit the beautiful slopes of the Nantlle valley, which will produce Château Nantlle in the future? I would be happy to accept the invitation. I hope that the farm and its developers will work with my department to see what opportunities for support are available to such developments in new high-value areas. Eventually, that will be beneficial and advantageous to your constituency.

12.50 p.m.

Farm Incomes

Q4 David Melding: Will the Minister make a statement on farm incomes in South Wales Central? OAQ(3)0318(RAF)

Elin Jones: Farm income data are not available at a sub-regional level. The February statistical release of estimates for farm incomes in Wales 2007-08 showed that the average net farm income for all farm types is £11,800, which is down some 3 per cent compared to the previous year.

David Melding: Minister, you will know that there has been a decline since 1997 in farm incomes overall, which demonstrates the need to diversify the rural economy. Minister, you are perhaps the Minister most committed to the free market in the present Government, as you are constantly saying that we must respond to market trends and to customer demand—broadly a Thatcherite line, which we welcome. However, sometimes, you have to realise that the actions of Government and planning authorities can be an incubus on attempts to stimulate the rural economy—I am thinking of planning applications for things such as woodland burial, adventure sports and country sports. If I may, I will just give you one suggestion: if we are after high-value products, it is a great pity that we do not even have a Welsh winery in South Wales Central at the moment.

Elin Jones: Perhaps you can learn from the slopes of Snowdonia about the potential for wineries in South Wales Central. I agree that we need to have diversified agricultural production. That would mean that, in Wales, we would be able to provide a wide variety of good quality food to our public sector, the food service sector and our retail sector. This Government will look to support any effort made by landowners and farmers in Wales to diversify their products, recognising, of course, that Government does have a role in providing support, but decisions on individual businesses are a matter for them.

Incwm Ffermydd

C4 David Melding: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am incwm ffermydd yng Nghanol De Cymru? OAQ(3)0318(RAF)

Elin Jones: Nid yw data incwm ffermydd ar gael ar lefel is-ranbarthol. Dangosodd datganiad ystadegol mis Chwefror ar amcangyfrifon incwm ffermydd yng Nghymru 2007-08 mai £11,800 yw incwm net cyfartalog ffermydd o bob math. Mae'r swm hwnnw 3 y cant yn is o'i gymharu â'r flwyddyn flaenorol.

David Melding: Weinidog, byddwch yn gwybod y bu gostyngiad mewn incwm ffermydd yn gyffredinol er 1997, sy'n dangos bod angen arallgyfeirio'r economi wledig. Weinidog, efallai mai chi yw'r Gweinidog sydd wedi ymrwymo fwyaf i'r farchnad rydd yn y Lywodraeth bresennol, gan eich bod yn dweud yn gyson ei bod yn rhaid inni ymateb i dueddiadau yn y farchnad ac i ofynion y cwsmer—rhesymeg sydd bron â bod yn Thatcheriaid, a chrosawn hynny. Fodd bynnag, rhaid ichi sylweddoli weithiau y gall gweithredoedd y Llywodraeth ac awdurdodau cynllunio fod yn fwrn ar ymdrechion i ysgogi'r economi wledig—meddwl yr wyf am geisiadau cynllunio ar gyfer pethau megis claddu mewn coetiroedd, chwaraeon antur a chwaraeon gwledig. Rhoddaf un awgrym ichi os caf: os ydym am gael cynnyrch uchel ei werth, mae'n drueni mawr nad oes gennym hyd yn oed win-dŷ Cymreig yng Nghanol De Cymru ar hyn o bryd.

Elin Jones: Efallai y gallwch ddysgu gan lethrau Eryri am y potensial ar gyfer gwindaï yng Nghanol De Cymru. Cytunaf fod angen inni gael amrywiaeth o gynnyrch amaethyddol. Byddai hynny'n golygu y byddem, yng Nghymru, yn gallu darparu amrywiaeth eang o fwyd safonol i'n sector cyhoeddus, i'r sector gwasanaeth bwyd ac i'n sector manwerthu. Bydd y Llywodraeth hon yn ceisio cefnogi unrhyw ymdrech gan dirfeddianwyr a ffermwyr yng Nghymru i amrywio eu cynnyrch, gan gydnabod wrth gwrs, fod gan y Llywodraeth swyddogaeth o ran darparu cymorth, ond mai busnesau unigol sy'n gyfrifol am wneud eu penderfyniadau eu hunain.

Chris Franks: Minister, I am sure that you will agree that farmers' markets play a valuable role in increasing farm incomes. What measures is the One Wales Government taking to boost farm incomes? Would you agree that Cardiff County Council's 'A Capital Vision' agreement, which was signed by the new administration of Liberal Democrats and Plaid Cymru and which aims to encourage local farm produce and co-operatives, is a good way to help farmers?

Elin Jones: I have not yet had the opportunity to read Cardiff County Council's 'A Capital Vision'. However, the ambition to increase public procurement of Welsh food is a commitment of the One Wales Government and I am working on a strategy and a plan to develop that work further. I have had recent statistics on the procurement of Welsh food in the public sector and while the NHS has been performing well over the last two years and has increased public procurement of Welsh food by 15 per cent, the local authorities do not seem to be doing that well and, over the last two years, have decreased their procurement of Welsh food by 20 per cent. I hope that 'A Capital Vision' will look to improve on that in Cardiff and that we will see improvement throughout Wales.

Y Llywydd: Trosglwyddwyd cwestiwn 5, OAQ(3)0317(RAF), i'w ateb yn ysgrifenedig.

Foreign Beef Produce

Q6 William Graham: Will the Minister outline discussions held on the monitoring of food outlets to ensure that they are not labelling foreign beef produce as 'local' or 'Welsh'? OAQ(3)0316(RAF)

Elin Jones: The incorrect labelling of products is a matter for local authority trading standards officers. However, my officials are liaising with the other UK countries on the complex issue of country-of-origin labelling to see what can be done at a

Chris Franks: Weinidog, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn cytuno bod gan farchnadoedd ffermwyr swyddogaeth bwysig o ran cynyddu incwm ffermydd. Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un yn eu cymryd i roi hwb i incwm ffermydd? A fydddech yn cytuno bod cytundeb 'Prif Weledigaeth' Cyngor Sir Caerdydd, a lofnodwyd gan weinyddiaeth newydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a Phlaid Cymru ac sydd â'r nod o annog cynnyrch ffermydd lleol a chwmnïau cydweithredol, yn ffordd dda o gynorthwyo ffermwyr?

Elin Jones: Nid wyf wedi cael y cyfle eto i ddarllen 'Prif Weledigaeth' Cyngor Sir Caerdydd. Fodd bynnag, mae'r uchelgais i annog y cyhoedd i gaffael mwy o fwyd o Gymru yn un o ymrwymadau Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un, ac yr wyf yn gweithio ar strategaeth a chynllun i ddatblygu'r gwaith hwnnw ymhellach. Yr wyf wedi cael ystadegau diweddar ar gaffael bwyd o Gymru yn y sector cyhoeddus, a thra mae'r GIG wedi bod yn cyflawni'n dda dros y ddwy flynedd diwethaf ac wedi cynyddu 15 y cant ar lefelau caffael cyhoeddus bwyd o Gymru, nid yw'r awdurdodau lleol yn gwneud gystal â hynny i bob golwg a, dros y ddwy flynedd diwethaf, maent yn caffael 20 y cant yn llai o fwyd o Gymru. Gobeithiaf y bydd 'Prif Weledigaeth' yn anelu at wella hynny yng Nghaerdydd ac y gwelwn welliannau ledled Cymru.

The Presiding Officer: Question 5, OAQ(3)0317(RAF), has been transferred for written answer.

Cynnyrch Cig Eidion Tramor

C6 William Graham: A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu trafodaethau a gynhaliwyd ynghylch monitro allfeydd bwyd i sicrhau nad ydynt yn labelu cynnyrch cig eidion tramor fel cynnyrch 'lleol' neu 'Gymreig'? OAQ(3)0316(RAF)

Elin Jones: Mater i swyddogion safonau masnach awdurdodau lleol yw labelu cynnyrch yn anghywir. Fodd bynnag, mae fy swyddogion yn ymgysylltu â gwledydd eraill y DU ynghylch mater cymhleth nodi ar labeli o ba wlad y mae cynnyrch wedi tarddu i weld

European level to widen food labelling powers.

William Graham: You will know that the head of the imported food division at the Food Standards Agency said that labelling regulations are really complicated, especially for pre-packed and pre-prepared food. Minister, will you enter into urgent negotiations with your counterpart at Westminster to make as certain as possible that food that is bought as local is produced locally? There must be confidence in labelling, particularly when the label states 'Welsh', because there have been so many promotions to try to persuade people to buy Welsh produce in Wales.

Elin Jones: I am also getting the advice that food labelling is particularly complex and complicated, in terms of country of origin, whether that is a member state or a country within a member state, and in terms of the differentiation between processed and non-processed food. I am completely signed up to the aspiration of ensuring that we have the greatest possible labelling of origin in order to allow customers to make the informed choice that they would aspire to make on where their meat and food comes from. Incorrect labelling is a matter for trading standards officers, and one that I hope that they are taking up enthusiastically, because anyone out there who is incorrectly labelling food products is doing the Welsh food and farming industries a great disservice.

Leanne Wood: There is a growing awareness of how important it is to buy Welsh food and, specifically, to support the local procurement of food. Will you join me in commending Plaid Cymru's role in the government of Cardiff, whereby we have helped to secure a commitment to ensure the local procurement of food for schools?

Elin Jones: I am happy to do that, because it matches the aspiration of the One Wales Government to improve the procurement of local Welsh food by the public sector in all its forms in Wales. As I indicated in my earlier reply to Chris Franks, we have seen

beth y gellir ei wneud ar lefel Ewropeaidd i ymestyn pwerau sy'n ymwneud â labelu bwyd.

William Graham: Byddwch yn gwybod i bennaeth yr is-adran bwyd wedi'i fewnforio yn yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd ddweud bod rheoliadau labelu bwyd yn hynod o gymhleth, yn enwedig ar gyfer bwyd sydd wedi'i becynnu a'i baratoi'n barod. Weinidog, a wnewch ddechrau negodi yn ddiymdroi â'ch Gweinidog cyfatebol yn San Steffan i wneud mor siŵr ag y bo modd bod bwyd a brynir ar y sail ei fod yn lleol yn cael ei gynhyrchu'n lleol? Rhaid cael hyder mewn labelu, yn enwedig pan fydd y label yn dweud 'Cymreig', oherwydd bu cynifer o gynlluniau hybu i geisio perswadio pobl i brynu cynnyrch o Gymru yng Nghymru.

Elin Jones: Yr wyf finnau hefyd yn cael fy nghynghori bod labelu bwyd yn arbennig o gymhleth a dyrys, o ran y wlad y mae bwyd wedi tarddu ohoni, pa un ai o aelod-wladwriaeth neu wlad mewn aelod-wladwriaeth y daw, ac o ran gwahaniaethu rhwng bwyd sydd wedi'i brosesu a bwyd nad yw wedi'i brosesu. Yr wyf yn ymrwymo'n llwyr i'r dyhead o sicrhau bod y labeli gorau posibl gennym i ddangos o ble mae bwyd wedi tarddu er mwyn caniatáu i gwsmeriaid allu gwneud y dewis doeth yr hoffent ei wneud ynghylch o ble mae eu cig a'u bwyd yn dod. Mater i swyddogion safonau masnach yw labelu anghywir, a gobeithiaf ei fod yn fater y maent yn ymdrin ag ef yn frwd, oherwydd nid yw neb sy'n labelu cynnyrch bwyd yn anghywir yn gwneud cymwynas o gwbl â diwydiannau ffermio a bwyd Cymru.

Leanne Wood: Mae mwy a mwy o bobl yn ymwybodol o bwysigrwydd prynu bwyd o Gymru ac, yn benodol, cefnogi caffael bwyd yn lleol. A ymunwch â mi i gymeradwyo swyddogaeth Plaid Cymru yn llywodraeth Caerdydd, lle'r ydym wedi cynorthwyo i sicrhau ymrwymiad i wneud yn siŵr bod bwyd ysgolion yn cael ei gaffael yn lleol?

Elin Jones: Yr wyf yn falch o wneud hynny, oherwydd y mae'n cyd-fynd â dyhead Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un i annog y sector cyhoeddus i gaffael mwy o fwyd lleol o Gymru ar bob ffurf yng Nghymru. Fel y dywedais yn fy ateb i Chris Franks yn

over the last two years that there has been a decrease in the amount of Welsh food procured by local authorities, and we need to work as a Government with local authorities and the public sector bodies for which we are directly responsible to improve this significantly.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): One of the issues about adding 'Welsh' before the name of any food product is that that designation can be secured through European regulations. At the moment, we have Welsh lamb and Welsh beef, but what plans do you have to increase the range of produce that can be truly labelled as 'Welsh', and which no-one else can label as 'Welsh'?

Elin Jones: It is timely that you ask that question, because I had a discussion yesterday with Nick Ramsay and representatives of the Welsh pig industry on this very issue in terms of protecting the term 'Welsh pig' for the purposes of market opportunity. You may know that, since 1 April, Hybu Cig Cymru has taken on the responsibility for the promotion of the Welsh pig industry, and I look to it to see how it will develop the potential of that industry and of other food-producing industries in Wales.

Michael German: Action by you is required in order to ensure that we get that Welsh designation. Action in Europe is required, as well as a sustained approach, because it takes a long time to get such designations. Are we only looking at Welsh pork as a designation or are there any other products on your horizon for which you feel being labelled as 'Welsh' would sustain their development in the world marketplace and put us at the forefront in terms of having Welsh food in international markets?

Elin Jones: I have not any representations from any other agri-food sector on the development of Welsh product origination or work on that. I am open to persuasion if

gynharach, dros y ddwy flynedd diwethaf, yr ydym wedi gweld bod awdurdodau lleol yn caffael llai o fwyd o Gymru, ac mae angen inni weithio fel Llywodraeth gydag awdurdodau lleol a'r cyrff sector cyhoeddus yr ydym yn gyfrifol amdanynt yn uniongyrchol er mwyn gwella hyn yn sylweddol.

Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): Un mater i'w ystyried o ran ychwanegu 'Cymreig' neu 'Cymru' ar ôl enw unrhyw gynnyrch bwyd yw y gellir sicrhau o ble mae wedi tarddu drwy gyfrwng rheoliadau Ewropeaidd. Ar hyn o bryd, mae gennym gig oen Cymru a chig eidion Cymru, ond pa gynlluniau sydd gennych i gynyddu ystod y cynnyrch y gellir ei labelu'n gywir fel cynnyrch 'Cymreig', ac na all neb arall ei labelu fel cynnyrch 'Cymreig'?

Elin Jones: Mae'ch cwestiwn yn amserol oherwydd cefais drafodaeth ddoe â Nick Ramsay a chynrychiolwyr diwydiant moch Cymru ar yr union fater hwn o ran diogelu'r term 'mochyn Cymreig' at ddibenion cyfleoedd marchnad. Efallai y gwyddoch fod Hybu Cig Cymru, er 1 Ebrill, wedi ysgwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb o hybu diwydiant moch Cymru, a byddaf yn edrych ar sut y bydd yn datblygu potensial y diwydiant hwnnw a diwydiannau eraill sy'n cynhyrchu bwyd yng Nghymru.

Michael German: Mae angen ichi weithredu er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn cael yr enw tarddiad hwnnw sy'n dweud bod cynnyrch yn 'Gymreig'. Mae angen gweithredu yn Ewrop, yn ogystal â chael dull gweithredu parhaus, oherwydd mae'n cymryd cryn dipyn o amser i gael enwau tarddiad o'r fath. O ran enw tarddiad, ai dim ond ar borc o Gymru yr ydym yn edrych, ynteu a oes unrhyw gynhyrchion eraill ar y gorwel y byddech chi'n meddwl y byddai cael eu labelu fel cynhyrchion 'Cymreig' yn cynnal eu datblygiad ym marchnad y byd ac yn ein rhoi ar flaen y gad wrth gael bwyd o Gymru mewn marchnadoedd rhyngwladol?

Elin Jones: Nid oes gennyf ddim sylwadau gan unrhyw sector amaeth bwyd ynghylch datblygu enw tarddiad ar gyfer cynnyrch o Gymru na gwaith ar hynny. Mae croeso i

representatives of the various agri-food industries in Wales believe that their products would be best served and their markets best developed by having protected designation of origin status. Should I receive representations—perhaps you know of representations that need to be made to me—similar to those made to me yesterday by the Welsh pig sector, I will look at them carefully.

1.00 p.m.

Attacks on Livestock by Ravens

Q7 William Graham: Will the Minister make a statement about attacks on Welsh livestock by ravens? OAQ(3)0315(RAF)

Elin Jones: Ravens are protected under the Wildlife and Countryside Act 1981. However, farmers can apply for a licence from the Assembly Government to control them. All applications are subject to a site inspection from a wildlife inspector.

William Graham: You will be aware that, in certain years—and particularly this year—with early lambing and poor weather conditions, carrion is not available for ravens to feed upon. Incidentally, you will also know that carrion-crows are not protected, but ravens are. They attack lambs either as they are being born, or just after, and they go particularly for the eyes, the tongue and the tail. The animal therefore has no chance of further life. For a hobby farmer like me, it does not really matter, but it is particularly important for those whose lives depend upon it. Minister, I hope that you will look with some favour on applications to cull the birds. Could you also look at the system used in France, where, in Vercors National Park, carrion is exposed for birds of prey and ravens?

Elin Jones: Thank you for that vivid description of what happens on farms. Only two licences were sought by farmers last year to kill ravens. If my understanding is correct, three, four, or five ravens are usually killed per licence. My officials tell me that there has

gynrychiolwyr yr amrywiol ddiwydiannau amaeth bwyd yng Nghymru ddwyn perswâd arnaf os ydynt yn credu y byddai cael statws enw tarddiad gwarchoddedig yn sicrhau'r gorau i'w cynhyrchion ac i'w marchnadoedd. Petawn yn cael sylwadau—efallai y gwyddoch am sylwadau y mae angen eu cyflwyno imi—tebyg i'r rhai a gyflwynwyd imi ddoe gan sector moch Cymru, edrychaf arnynt yn ofalus.

Ymosodiadau ar Dda Byw gan Gigfrain

C7 William Graham: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ymosodiadau ar dda byw yng Nghymru gan gigfrain? OAQ(3)0315(RAF)

Elin Jones: Caiff cigfrain eu gwarchod dan Ddeddf Bywyd Gwyllt a Chefn Gwlad 1981. Fodd bynnag, caiff ffermwyr wneud cais am drwydded gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i'w rheoli. Mae pob cais yn amodol ar archwiliad safle gan archwilydd bywyd gwyllt.

William Graham: Byddwch yn gwybod mewn rhai blynyddoedd—ac yn enwedig eleni—gyda wyna cynnar ac amodau tywydd gwael, nad oes anifeiliaid marw ar gael bob amser i gigfrain eu bwyta. Gyda llaw, byddwch hefyd yn gwybod na chaiff brain tyddyn eu gwarchod, ond caiff cigfrain. Maent yn ymosod ar ŵyn naill ai wrth iddynt gael eu geni, neu'n fuan wedi hynny, ac maent yn mynd yn benodol am y llygaid, y tafod a'r gynffon. Nid oes gobaith i'r anifail fyw wedyn. Ar gyfer ffermwyr hobi fel fi, nid yw'n gwneud gwahaniaeth mewn gwirionedd, ond mae'n arbennig o bwysig i'r rheini y mae eu bywydau'n dibynnu arno. Weinidog, yr wyf yn gobeithio y byddwch yn edrych yn ffafriol ar geisiadau i ddifa'r adar. A allech hefyd edrych ar y system a ddefnyddir yn Ffrainc lle caiff anifeiliaid marw eu gosod ym Mharc Cenedlaethol Vercors ar gyfer adar ysglyfaethus a chigfrain?

Elin Jones: Diolch ichi am y disgrifiad byw hwnnw o'r hyn sy'n digwydd ar ffermydd. Dim ond dwy drwydded a geisiwyd gan ffermwyr y llynedd i ladd cigfrain. Os yr wyf yn deall yn iawn, fel rheol caiff tair, pedair neu bum cigfran eu lladd fesul trwydded.

not been an increase in the number of applications made by farmers, but, as I indicated in my original response, each application will be looked at individually and will be accompanied by an on-farm inspection by a wildlife inspector.

Next Generation of Farmers

Q8 The Leader of the Opposition (Nick Bourne): Will the Minister outline her policies for encouraging the next generation of farmers? OAQ(3)0337(RAF)

Elin Jones: The 'One Wales' commitment to young entrants is a key priority for my portfolio. A task and finish group has been set up to develop a support framework. I plan to consult shortly on proposals, the responses to which will help to inform my preparation of the final strategy.

Nick Bourne: I am grateful for that response. Minister, could you give more detail about how you will involve farmers in this consultation, because that is clearly crucial, not just in terms of keeping farmers on farms, but also in terms of keeping them in rural Wales. There are two strands to this. The first is the attraction of staying as a farmer; the second is that, in addition to its not always being viewed as the best profession or the best livelihood, there is the issue of local facilities being run-down. I appreciate that the Minister is not responsible for that across the Government, but I wonder what the Cabinet is doing to look at the running down of facilities, whether they are in healthcare or they are non-devolved facilities, such as police stations, or whether it is a question of a lack of affordable housing, and so on. What thinking is there across the Cabinet in terms of keeping people in rural Wales at all?

Elin Jones: The consultation on my plans to support young entrants into farming will be an open consultation and anyone will be able to comment on it. I am sure that several organisations representing farming interests as well as individual farmers will respond to that consultation. I have been particularly pleased with the people who took up my invitation to sit on the task and finish group.

Dywed fy swyddogion wrthyf na fu cynnydd yn nifer y ceisiadau a wnaethpwyd gan ffermwyr, ond, fel y dywedais yn fy ateb gwreiddiol, edrychir ar bob cais yn unigol a bydd archwiliad ar y fferm gan archwilydd bywyd gwyllt ynghlwm wrth bob cais.

Cenhedlaeth Nesaf o Ffermwyr

C8 Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Nick Bourne): A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu ei pholisïau ar gyfer annog y genhedlaeth nesaf o ffermwyr? OAQ(3)0337(RAF)

Elin Jones: Mae'r ymrwymiad yn 'Cymru'n Un' i newydd-ddyfodiaid ifanc yn flaenoriaeth allweddol yn fy mhortffolio. Sefydlwyd grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen i ddatblygu fframwaith cefnogi. Yr wyf yn bwriadu ymgynghori ar gynigion cyn bo hir. Bydd yr ymatebion yn helpu i gyfrannu at fy ngwaith i baratoi'r strategaeth derfynol.

Nick Bourne: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am yr ateb hwnnw Weinidog, a allech roi rhagor o fanylion am sut y byddwch yn cynnwys ffermwyr yn yr ymgynghoriad hwn, oherwydd bod hynny'n amlwg yn hanfodol, nid yn unig o ran cadw ffermwyr ar ffermydd ond hefyd o ran eu cadw yng Nghymru wledig. Mae dwy haen yn perthyn i hyn. Atyniad aros yn ffermwr yw'r cyntaf a'r ffaith bod cyfleusterau lleol yn dirywio yw'r ail, yn ychwanegol at y ffaith na chaiff bob amser ei ystyried fel y proffesiwn gorau na'r fywoliaeth orau. Yr wyf yn gwerthfawrogi nad yw'r Gweinidog yn gyfrifol am hynny ar draws y Llywodraeth, ond tybed beth mae'r Cabinet yn ei wneud i edrych ar gyfleusterau sy'n dirywio, boed hwy mewn gofal iechyd neu yn gyfleusterau nas datganolwyd, megis gorsafedd heddlu, neu a yw'n ymwneud â diffyg tai fforddiadwy, ac yn y blaen. Pa syniadau sydd yn y Cabinet o ran cadw pobl yng Nghymru wledig o gwbl?

Elin Jones: Bydd yr ymgynghoriad ar fy nghynlluniau i gefnogi newydd-ddyfodiaid ifanc i ffermio yn ymgynghoriad agored a bydd unrhyw un yn gallu cyflwyno sylwadau arno. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd nifer o sefydliadau sy'n cynrychioli buddiannau ffermwyr yn ogystal â ffermwyr unigol yn ymateb i'r ymgynghoriad hwnnw. Yr wyf wedi bod yn arbennig o falch o'r bobl a

They come from a wide variety of backgrounds and several pretty enterprising young farmers are also involved.

On affordable housing, the task and finish group and the Government are looking at technical advice note 6, the role that affordable housing has in ensuring that young people—especially young farmers—are able to live and work in rural areas. The aspiration to ensure the ability to live and work in rural areas indicates the Government's desire to see that rural areas are populated—are lived in and worked in—so that we can ensure that there remains a critical mass of people to support the services that you and I want to see continuing in rural areas.

Nerys Evans: Yr wythnos diwethaf, cefais y pleser o fynychu rali Ffermwyr Ifanc Sir Gaerfyrddin i weld y talent arbennig sy'n perthyn i'r mudiad. Daeth cannoedd o bobl ifanc at ei gilydd i gystadlu a chymdeithasu, ac yr oedd yn galonogol i weld yr holl bobl ifanc hyn yn bositif am ddyfodol y diwydiant yn yr ardal. A ydyw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno bod gwaith y mudiad yn allweddol i ddyfodol y diwydiant? Hefyd, a fydddech yn barod i ymuno â mi i ddymuno pob lwc i'r holl aelodau a fydd yn cystadlu yn Sioe Frenhinol Cymru yn dilyn y llwyddiant ar lefel sirol?

Elin Jones: Cytunaf â chi, Nerys, ynglŷn â phwysigrwydd y mudiad hwn i'r gymdeithas ifanc yng nghefn gwlad. Byddaf yn mynychu rali'r ffermwyr ifanc yn fy etholaeth, Ceredigion, mewn rhyw bythefnos. Yr wyf yn mynychu bob blwyddyn ac mae wastad yn gyfan gwbl ysbrydoledig i weld sut mae'r mudiad hwn yn ffynnu ac yn cynyddu yn ei weithgaredd a'i apêl i bobl ifanc o bob cefndir yng nghefn gwlad i ymwneud â'r mudiad. Mae'r mudiad yn ei weithgarwch yn bwysig i'r Llywodraeth hon, a dyna pam y bu inni gyfrannu £50,000 i ddatblygu ei ddyfodol, a bu imi gyhoeddi hynny yn ôl ym mis Mawrth. Mae'n fudiad sy'n hollbwysig i weithgaredd a llwyddiant Sioe Frenhinol Cymru. Bydd y sioe yn digwydd yng Ngorffennaf, a dymunaf bob lwc i bawb a

dderbyniodd fy ngwahoddiad i eistedd ar y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen. Maent yn dod o amrywiaeth eang o gefndiroedd ac mae nifer o ffermwyr ifanc eithaf mentrus ynghlwm wrtho hefyd.

Ac ystyried tai fforddiadwy, mae'r grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen a'r Llywodraeth yn edrych ar nodyn cyngor technegol 6, swyddogaeth tai fforddiadwy o ran sicrhau bod pobl ifanc—yn enwedig ffermwyr ifanc—yn gallu byw a gweithio mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Mae'r dyhead i sicrhau bod modd byw a gweithio mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn brawf o ddymuniad y Llywodraeth i weld bod ardaloedd gwledig yn boblog—bod pobl yn byw ac yn gweithio ynddynt—er mwyn inni allu sicrhau bod mas critigol o bobl i gefnogi'r gwasanaethau yr ydych chi a minnau eisiau eu gweld yn parhau mewn ardaloedd gwledig.

Nerys Evans: Last week, I had the pleasure of attending the Carmarthenshire Young Farmers' rally to see the considerable talent that the movement has. Hundreds of young people came together to compete and socialise, and it was encouraging to see all these young people being positive about the industry's future in the area. Does the Minister agree that the work done by the movement is vital to the industry's future? Will you also join me in wishing the best to all members who will compete in the Royal Welsh Show after succeeding at county level?

Elin Jones: I agree with you, Nerys, regarding the importance of this movement to young people in rural areas. I will be attending the young farmers' rally in my constituency, Ceredigion, in a fortnight or so. I attend every year and it is always thoroughly inspiring to see how this movement prospers and grows in its activities and how it appeals to young people of all backgrounds in rural areas to take part. The movement's activities are important to this Government, which is why we contributed £50,000 to develop its future, as I announced in March. It is a vital movement to the activities and the success of the Royal Welsh Show. The show will be held in July, and I wish all the best to all competitors at that show.

fydd yn cystadlu yn y sioe honno.

Improving Animal Welfare

Q9 Lorraine Barrett: Will the Minister outline any future plans for improving animal welfare in Wales under the Animal Welfare Act 2006? OAQ(3)0333(RAF)

Elin Jones: I have made £3 million available over the next three years to local authorities to develop an enhancement scheme for companion animal welfare. We are also finalising codes on cats, dogs, equines, cattle, sheep, pigs and laying hens and are fully evaluating the issues surrounding electric-shock dog collars.

Lorraine Barrett: Thank you for that response, particularly on the companion animal welfare grant funding. Yesterday, I had the dubious pleasure of being filmed by ITV Wales while being zapped on the hand by an electric-shock dog collar, as did a few other Members—and I can tell you, Minister, that it hurt. I believe that good dog owners and trainers can train their dogs with praise rather than punishment. What are your plans for banning such devices in Wales?

Elin Jones: I have refused the opportunity to be zapped by an electric-shock dog collar in case it influenced in any way my decision on legislation surrounding this issue. We have consulted, as you will know, on the banning of electric-shock dog collars in Wales. We received 173 responses to that consultation and we are currently reviewing the content of the consultation. I will make a statement on electric-shock dog collars before the summer recess.

Jonathan Morgan: I am delighted that you have been carrying out this consultation, but the evidence is pretty clear that electric-shock collars are cruel and there are plenty of alternative methods that could be employed to ensure that animals are well trained. Does the Minister agree that one of the most compelling arguments against the use of

Gwella Lles Anifeiliaid

C9 Lorraine Barrett: A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu unrhyw gynlluniau i'r dyfodol ar gyfer gwella lles anifeiliaid yng Nghymru dan y Ddeddf Lles Anifeiliaid 2006? OAQ(3)0333(RAF)

Elin Jones: Yr wyf wedi darparu £3 miliwn i awdurdodau lleol dros y tair blynedd nesaf i ddatblygu cynllun gwella lles anifeiliaid anwes. Yr ydym hefyd wrthi'n llunio fersiynau terfynol codau ar gathod, cŵn, ceffylau, gwartheg, defaid, moch ac ieir sy'n dodwy ac yr ydym yn cynnal gwerthusiad llawn o'r materion sy'n ymwneud â choleri cŵn sy'n rhoi sioc drydanol.

Lorraine Barrett: Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, yn enwedig ynghylch y cyllid grant lles anifeiliaid anwes. Ddoe, cefais bleser amheus cael fy ffilmio gan ITV Cymru wrth imi gael ergyd ar fy llaw o goler ci sy'n rhoi sioc drydanol, fel y cafodd ychydig o Aelodau eraill—a gallaf ddweud wrthyich, Weinidog, ei fod yn brifo. Yr wyf yn credu y gall perchnogion a hyfforddwyr cŵn da hyfforddi eu cŵn â chanmoliaeth yn hytrach na chosb. Beth yw eich cynlluniau ar gyfer gwahardd dyfeisiau o'r fath yng Nghymru?

Elin Jones: Yr wyf wedi gwrthod y cyfle i gael ergyd o goler ci sy'n rhoi sioc drydanol rhag ofn i hynny ddylanwadu ar fy mhenderfyniad ar ddeddfwriaeth sy'n ymwneud â'r mater hwn mewn unrhyw ffordd. Fel y gwyddoch, yr ydym wedi ymgynghori ar wahardd coleri cŵn sy'n rhoi sioc drydanol yng Nghymru. Cawsom 173 o ymatebion i'r ymgynghoriad hwnnw ac yr ydym yn adolygu cynnwys yr ymgynghoriad ar hyn o bryd. Byddaf yn gwneud datganiad am goler cŵn sy'n rhoi sioc drydanol cyn toriad yr haf.

Jonathan Morgan: Yr wyf wrth fy modd eich bod wedi bod yn cynnal yr ymgynghoriad hwn, ond mae'r dystiolaeth yn eithaf clir bod coleri sioc-drydanol yn greulon a bod digon o ddulliau eraill y gellid eu defnyddio i sicrhau bod anifeiliaid yn cael eu hyfforddi'n dda. A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno mai un o'r dadleuon cryfaf yn erbyn

electric-shock collars is that the most highly trained dogs, such as assistant dogs and police and armed forces dogs, are trained without the use of electric-shock collars?

Elin Jones: That argument has been used by a number of people who are in favour of banning electric-shock collars, but the results of the consultation have not all been in one direction. The consultation has revealed a mixed response, which will now be considered in full before I make a statement before the summer recess.

Bethan Jenkins: Credaf fod y Kennel Club wedi bod yn llobio'n effeithiol iawn. Yr wyf am ategu at yr hyn y mae'r siaradwyr eraill wedi'i ddweud ynglŷn â'r ffaith bod angen i'r ymgynghoriad ar y coleri sioc trydanol ddod gerbron y Cynulliad, a chroesawaf eich datganiad heddiw y bydd hynny'n digwydd. Mae'n hen bryd i hyn ddod i ben a'n bod yn sicrhau nad yw'n datblygu'n weithred normal fel ag y mae yn yr Amerig ar hyn o bryd.

Elin Jones: Yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod diddordeb ar draws y Siambr ynglŷn â'r pwnc hwn, ac mae nifer o Aelodau wedi ysgrifennu ataf i fynegi barn ar y mater. Felly mae'n briodol imi ddod â datganiad gerbron y Cynulliad pan fyddaf mewn sefyllfa i wneud hynny.

1.10 p.m.

Kirsty Williams: One of the excuses that some dog owners use for using these cruel dog collars is that it prevents their dogs from attacking other livestock when out walking. Do you agree that the simple answer to that is that responsible dog owners keep their dogs on a leash when walking them among sheep and other livestock? Could you also comment on the idea that some people see this as a cheap option in controlling their dog's behaviour, when, in fact, these devices cost a considerable amount of money and there are cost-effective courses that dog owners can take part in if they are truly responsible and serious about controlling the behaviour of their dogs?

Elin Jones: I am aware that your comments

defnyddio coleri sioc drydanol yw bod y cŵn sy'n cael eu hyfforddi fwyaf, megis cŵn cymorth a chŵn yr heddlu a'r lluoedd arfog, yn cael eu hyfforddi heb ddefnyddio coleri sioc-drydanol?

Elin Jones: Mae nifer o bobl sydd o blaid gwahardd coleri sioc-drydanol wedi defnyddio'r ddadl honno, ond nid yw canlyniadau'r ymgynghoriad i gyd wedi bod yn unochrog. Mae'r ymgynghoriad wedi datgelu ymateb cymysg, a fydd yn awr yn cael ei ystyried yn llawn cyn imi wneud datganiad cyn toriad yr haf.

Bethan Jenkins: I believe that the Kennel Club has lobbied effectively. I will endorse what the other speakers have said regarding the fact that the consultation on the electric-shock collars needs to come before the Assembly, and I welcome your statement today that that will happen. It is about time that this is stopped and that we ensure that it does not develop into common practice as it currently is in America.

Elin Jones: I am aware of the interest across the Chamber regarding this issue, and several Members have written to me to express their views on the matter. Therefore, it is appropriate that I make a statement before the Assembly when I am in a position to do so.

Kirsty Williams: Un o'r esgusodion y bydd rhai perchnogion cŵn yn ei ddefnyddio ar gyfer defnyddio'r coleri cŵn creulon hyn yw eu bod yn atal eu cŵn rhag ymosod ar dda byw eraill wrth fynd am dro. A ydych yn cytuno mai'r ateb syml i hynny yw bod perchnogion cŵn cyfrifol yn cadw eu cŵn ar dennyn wrth fynd am dro ymysg defaid a da byw eraill? A allech hefyd roi sylwadau ar y syniad bod rhai pobl yn gweld hwn fel dewis rhad i reoli ymddygiad eu ci, ond mewn gwirionedd rhaid talu swm sylweddol o arian am y dyfeisiau hyn ac mae cyrsiau cost-effeithiol ar gael y gall perchnogion cŵn gymryd rhan ynddynt os ydynt yn wirioneddol gyfrifol ac o ddifrif am reoli ymddygiad eu cŵn?

Elin Jones: Yr wyf yn gwybod bod eich

are the same as comments made during the consultation. In particular, comments were made about walking dogs on farm land in proximity to sheep and cattle, and there is clear guidance on how that should be done. Dogs should be on a lead at all times when they are in proximity to farmed animals. You are right to say that there are dog-training clubs throughout Wales. I am visiting one in my constituency in a couple of weeks' time to see its work. Such clubs are vital in ensuring that new dog owners or established dog owners with new dogs are able to train their dogs effectively.

Trish Law: Minister, I wrote to you at the end of April asking when you expected to deliver your verdict on the consultation that closed on 8 February 2008. You replied on 8 May, saying:

'There are those who are seeking a ban on the use of these devices, and there are those who do not wish to see a ban put in place.'

That, I would think, is stating the obvious. I feel that I have been fobbed off by the Minister. Ministers in England and Scotland have also put decisions off time and again. Will the Minister say whether she will resolve this issue with the same degree of urgency as demonstrated in her handling of the badger cull?

Elin Jones: I am sorry that you feel that you have been fobbed off. This is the only administration in the UK to have consulted on the idea of a ban on electronic dog collars. It has not happened in England. It is due process for the Minister to take time to look at the consultation responses. As I indicated in my letter to you and in my response to Jonathan Morgan, the responses are mixed, and we therefore need to consider the arguments presented by both sides. However, I have given a commitment here today that there will be a Government statement before the summer recess to move this forward.

sylwadau yr un sylwadau a wnaethpwyd yn ystod yr ymgynghoriad. Yn benodol, gwnaethpwyd sylwadau am fynd â chŵn am dro ar dir fferm ger defaid a gwartheg, a cheir arweiniad clir ynghylch sut y dylid gwneud hynny. Dylai cŵn fod ar dennyn bob amser pan fyddant wrth ymyl anifeiliaid fferm. Yr ydych yn iawn pan ddywedwch fod clybiau hyfforddi cŵn ar gael ledled Cymru. Byddaf yn ymweld ag un yn fy etholaeth mewn ychydig o wythnosau i weld ei waith. Mae clybiau o'r fath yn hanfodol i sicrhau bod perchnogion cŵn newydd neu berchnogion sydd wedi cadw cŵn ers tro byd yn gallu hyfforddi eu cŵn yn effeithiol.

Trish Law: Weinidog, ysgrifennais atoch ddiwedd mis Ebrill yn gofyn pryd yr oeddech yn disgwyl cyhoeddi eich dyfarniad ar yr ymgynghoriad a ddaeth i ben ar 8 Chwefror 2008. Yr oeddech wedi ateb ar 8 Mai, gan ddweud:

Ceir y rheini sydd eisiau gwahardd defnyddio'r dyfeisiau hyn, a cheir y rheini nad ydynt eisiau eu gwahardd.

Byddwn yn meddwl bod hynny'n gwbl amlwg. Yr wyf yn teimlo bod y Gweinidog wedi taflu llwch i'm llygaid. Mae Gweinidogion yn Lloegr a'r Alban hefyd wedi gohirio penderfyniadau dro ar ôl tro. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddweud a fydd yn datrys y mater hwn gyda'r un brys a ddangosodd wrth ddelio â difa moch daear?

Elin Jones: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf eich bod yn teimlo imi daflu llwch i'ch llygaid. Dyma'r unig weinyddiaeth yn y DU sydd wedi ymgynghori ynghylch syniad gwahardd coleri cŵn trydanol. Nid yw wedi digwydd yn Lloegr. Mae'n broses briodol i'r Gweinidog dreulio amser yn edrych ar yr ymatebion i'r ymgynghoriad. Fel y dywedais yn y fy llythyr atoch ac yn fy ateb i Jonathan Morgan, mae'r ymatebion yn gymysg, ac felly rhaid inni ystyried y dadleuon a gyflwynwyd gan y naill ochr a'r llall. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf wedi gwneud ymrwymiad yma heddiw y bydd datganiad gan y Llywodraeth cyn toriad yr haf i fynd â hwn rhagddo.

Joined-up Development

Q10 Mark Isherwood: What discussions has the Minister had with other Ministers about the joined-up development of the rural economy? OAQ(3)0349(RAF)

Elin Jones: I have regular discussions with my Cabinet colleagues about the rural economy and related issues.

Mark Isherwood: We know that many rural businesses depend on the tourism and visitor economy. I have been approached by a rural business in north Wales, which has told me that, of 703 visits to its website in the first two months of this year, only four came from the Assembly Government's Visit Wales website. It also said that, when it looked up 'holiday cottage Wales', Visit Wales came up on page 7; when it looked up 'self catering Wales', Visit Wales came up on page 7; and when it looked up 'Anglesey holiday cottages', it gave up on page 24. Given the impact that this has on the rural economy, will you engage with your ministerial colleagues to ensure that the Assembly Government's flagship website becomes a key source of business for the rural economy in Wales?

Elin Jones: I am more than happy to ensure that the Minister with responsibility for tourism is aware of the issues that you raise.

Protection of Badgers

Q11 Peter Black: Will the Minister make a statement on the protection of badgers in Wales? OAQ(3)0309(RAF)

Elin Jones: Badgers are protected under the Protection of Badgers Act 1992, which recognises the need to undertake activities that are normally prohibited when there is a need to prevent the spread of a serious disease, for example. In such circumstances, the Assembly Government may issue a licence to cull badgers.

Datblygiad Cydgysylltiedig

C10 Mark Isherwood: Pa drafodaethau mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael gyda Gweinidogion eraill am ddatblygu'r economi wledig mewn modd cydgysylltiedig? OAQ(3)0349(RAF)

Elin Jones: Byddaf yn cael trafodaethau rheolaidd gyda'm cyd-Weinidogion yn y Cabinet am yr economi wledig a materion cysylltiedig.

Mark Isherwood: Yr ydym yn gwybod bod nifer o fusnesau gwledig yn dibynnu ar yr economi dwristiaeth ac ymwelwyr. Mae busnes gwledig yn y gogledd wedi dod ataf a dweud i'w wefan gael 703 o ymweliadau yn ystod deufis cyntaf eleni ac mai dim ond pedwar o'r rheini a ddaeth o wefan Croeso Cymru Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Dywedodd hefyd, pan chwiliodd am 'holiday cottage Wales', i Croeso Cymru ymddangos ar dudalen 7; pan chwiliodd am 'self catering Wales', ymddangosodd Croeso Cymru ar dudalen 7; a phan chwiliodd am 'Anglesey holiday cottages', ymddangosodd ar dudalen 24. Ac ystyried yr effaith a gaiff hyn ar yr economi wledig, a wnewch ymgysylltu â'ch cyd-Weinidogion i sicrhau bod gwefan flaenllaw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn dod yn ffynhonnell allweddol o fusnes ar gyfer yr economi wledig yng Nghymru?

Elin Jones: Yr wyf yn fwy na bodlon sicrhau bod y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am dwristiaeth yn ymwybodol o'r materion yr ydych yn eu codi.

Gwarchod Moch Daear

C11 Peter Black: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am warchod moch daear yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)0309(RAF)

Elin Jones: Caiff moch daear eu gwarchod dan Ddeddf Gwarchod Moch Daear 1992, sy'n cydnabod yr angen i gynnal gweithgareddau sydd fel rheol yn cael eu gwahardd pan fydd angen atal lledaeniad clefyd difrifol, er enghraifft. Mewn amgylchiadau o'r fath, gall Llywodraeth y Cynulliad gyhoeddi trwydded i ddifa moch daear.

Peter Black: You will be aware of the incident in Pembrokeshire on 18 April in which four badgers were found dead in a field. It appeared that some people had taken the extermination of badgers into their own hands. Do you not think that your intention to exterminate badgers in a particular, limited area of Wales is encouraging people to do that? Can you send a clear message that this is not acceptable behaviour and that badgers should not be targeted in this way?

Elin Jones: I believe that I made that message perfectly clear in my statement, in the debate, and in my subsequent answer to you during my last oral questions. The badger remains a protected species in Wales, and only a licence from me, as the Minister for Rural Affairs, allows any culling of badgers, and even then it would be for the purpose of disease control. Dead badgers in Pembrokeshire are now a matter for police and not ministerial investigation.

Lorraine Barrett: On the protection of badgers, I have had representations from landowners from different parts of Wales, who are concerned that you might issue licences to kill badgers on their land. They want to be reassured that that would not happen without full and meaningful consultation with them as landowners.

Elin Jones: Landowners' consent was also a feature of the badger cull trials in England. Once we have identified an area for a badger cull, we need to be clear about what is involved and the role of landowners and land users in that area.

Working Conditions on Farms

Q12 Joyce Watson: What discussions has the Minister had with the Health and Safety Executive with regard to the working conditions of Welsh farm workers? OAQ(3)0319(RAF)

Elin Jones: Health and safety on the farm is a matter for farmers and landowners. However, the new farm advisory service, operating under the Farming Connect

Peter Black: Byddwch yn gwybod am y digwyddiad yn sir Benfro ar 18 Ebrill pan ddaethpwyd o hyd i bedwar mochyn daear marw mewn cae. Yr oedd yn ymddangos bod rhai pobl wedi ymorol am ddifa moch daear eu hunain. Onid ydych yn meddwl bod eich bwriad i ddifa moch daear mewn ardal benodol a chyfyngedig o Gymru yn annog pobl i wneud hynny? A allwch gyfleu neges glir nad yw hwn yn ymddygiad derbynol ac na ddylid targedu moch daear fel hyn?

Elin Jones: Credaf imi gyfleu'r neges honno'n gwbl glir yn fy natganiad, yn y ddadl, ac yn fy ateb dilynol i chi yn ystod fy nghwestiynau llafar diwethaf. Erys y mochyn daear yn rhywogaeth a warchodir yng Nghymru a dim ond trwydded gennyf fi, fel y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig, sy'n caniatáu i unrhyw foch daear gael eu difa, a hyd yn oed wedyn, dim ond er mwyn rheoli clefydau y caniateid hynny. Mater i'r heddlu yw moch daear marw yn sir Benfro yn awr, nid testun ymchwiliad gan Weinidog.

Lorraine Barrett: Parthed gwarchod moch daear, yr wyf wedi cael sylwadau gan dirfeddianwyr o wahanol ardaloedd yng Nghymru, sy'n poeni y byddwch efallai'n cyhoeddi trwyddedau i ladd moch daear ar eu tir. Mae arnynt eisiau tawelwch meddwl na fydd hynny'n digwydd heb ymgynghori â hwy, fel tirfeddianwyr, yn llawn ac yn ystyrlon.

Elin Jones: Yr oedd cydsyniad tirfeddianwyr yn nodwedd o'r profion difa moch daear yn Lloegr hefyd. Ar ôl inni ddynodi ardal ar gyfer difa moch daear, mae angen inni fod yn glir ynghylch beth mae hyn yn ei olygu a swyddogaeth tirfeddiannwr a defnyddwyr y tir yn yr ardal honno.

Amodau Gweithio ar Ffermydd

C12 Joyce Watson: Pa drafodaethau mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael gyda'r Awdurdod Gweithredol Iechyd a Diogelwch ynghylch amodau gweithio gweithwyr ar ffermydd yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)0319(RAF)

Elin Jones: Mater i ffermwyr a thirfeddianwyr yw iechyd a diogelwch ar y fferm. Fodd bynnag, bydd y gwasanaeth cynghori ffermwyr newydd, a fydd yn

programme, will offer advice to farmers on occupational health and safety. My officials are involved in ongoing discussions with the Health and Safety Executive to take this matter forward.

Joyce Watson: Thank you for that answer, Minister. I am sure that you are aware that the agriculture industry has one of the worst fatal accident and occupational ill health records of any major employment sector, accounting for 16 per cent of fatal injuries to workers, which is almost one per week on average across the UK, and has high levels of self-reported ill health. What action is the Welsh Assembly Government taking to improve health and safety in the industry, and how will the review of red tape take account of the need for better health and safety practices?

Elin Jones: As I indicated in my original response, the farm advisory service under Farming Connect will offer advice to farmers on occupational health and safety. I consider your points to be very important, because the record on on-farm accidents and fatalities is poor, and we need to ensure that, with the Health and Safety Executive and the guidance that we provide as an Assembly Government, farmers are fully aware of how they can undertake their daily work as safely as possible.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 13, OAQ(3)0344(RAF), yn ôl.

Tir Gofal Scheme

Q14 Chris Franks: What discussions has the Minister had regarding the Tir Gofal scheme? OAQ(3)0350(RAF)

Elin Jones: My aim is to continue the expansion of Tir Gofal under the rural development plan for 2007-13 by processing the 1,400 applications received in the last application round. In the longer term, decisions will depend on the outcome of the review of access to land management.

gweithredu dan raglen Cyswllt Ffermio, yn cynnig cyngor i ffermwyr am iechyd a diogelwch galwedigaethol. Mae fy swyddogion yn cymryd rhan mewn trafodaethau sy'n mynd rhagddynt gyda'r Awdurdod Gweithredol Iechyd a Diogelwch er mwyn symud y mater hwn yn ei flaen.

Joyce Watson: Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gwyddoch fod y diwydiant amaeth ymhlith y gwaethaf o unrhyw brif sector cyflogaeth o ran damweiniau angheuol ac iechyd galwedigaethol gwael. Bydd 16 y cant o ddamweiniau angheuol i weithwyr yn digwydd yn y diwydiant hwn, sydd bron yn un yr wythnos ar gyfartaledd ar draws y DU, ac mae ganddo lefelau uchel o salwch hunan-gofnodedig. Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn eu cymryd i wella iechyd a diogelwch yn y diwydiant, a sut y bydd yr adolygiad o fiwrocratiaeth yn ystyried yr angen i gael gwell arferion iechyd a diogelwch?

Elin Jones: Fel y dywedais yn fy ateb gwreiddiol, bydd y gwasanaeth cynghori ffermwyr dan raglen Cyswllt Ffermio yn cynnig cyngor i ffermwyr am iechyd a diogelwch galwedigaethol. Credaf fod eich pwyntiau yn hynod bwysig, oherwydd mae record damweiniau a thrychinebau ar y fferm yn wael, ac mae angen inni sicrhau bod ffermwyr, gyda'r Awdurdod Gweithredol Iechyd a Diogelwch a'r arweiniad a ddarparwn fel Llywodraeth Cynulliad, yn gwbl ymwybodol o sut y gallant ymgymryd â'u gwaith beunyddiol mor ddiogel â phosibl.

The Presiding Officer: Question 13, OAQ(3)0344(RAF), is withdrawn.

Cynllun Tir Gofal

C14 Chris Franks: Pa drafodaethau mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael ynghylch y cynllun Tir Gofal? OAQ(3)0350(RAF)

Elin Jones: Fy nod yw parhau i ehangu Tir Gofal dan y cynllun datblygu gwledig ar gyfer 2007-13, drwy brosesu'r 1,400 o geisiadau a ddaeth i law yn y cylch ymgeisio diwethaf. Yn y tymor hwy, bydd penderfyniadau'n dibynnu ar ganlyniad yr adolygiad o fynediad at reoli'r tir.

Chris Franks: A recent Wales Audit Office report raised some issues to do with Tir Gofal, such as the scoring system that prevents the One Wales Government from targeting local priorities. What discussions have you had to improve the environmental aspects of Tir Gofal?

Elin Jones: I am aware of the Wales Audit Office report, which raised several issues on the monitoring and evaluation of Tir Gofal. Under the rural development plan, we are undertaking a new tendering process to monitor the agri-environment schemes in Wales, and the issues that were raised by the Wales Audit Office will be incorporated into the new agri-environment monitoring.

Y Llywydd: Trosglwyddwyd cwestiwn 15, OAQ(3)0310(RAF), i'w ateb yn ysgrifenedig.

Chris Franks: Nododd adroddiad diweddar gan Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru rai materion yn ymwneud â Thir Gofal, megis y system sgorio sy'n atal Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un rhag targedu blaenoriaethau lleol. Pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi'u cael i wella agweddau amgylcheddol Tir Gofal?

Elin Jones: Gwn am yr adroddiad gan Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru, a nododd lu o faterion ynghylch monitro a gwerthuso Tir Gofal. O dan y cynllun datblygu gwledig, yr ydym yn ymgymryd â phroses dendro newydd i fonitro'r cynlluniau amaeth-amgylchedd yng Nghymru, a chaiff y materion a gododd Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru eu hymgorffori yn y system monitro amaeth-amgylchedd newydd.

The Presiding Officer: Question 15, OAQ(3)0310(RAF), has been transferred for written answer.

1.20 p.m.

Datganiad am Reoli Perygl Llifogydd ac Adolygiad Pitt Statement on Flood Risk Management and the Pitt Review

The Minister for Environment, Sustainability and Housing (Jane Davidson): I am delighted to take this opportunity to update you on progress since my statement on flooding in September, and to highlight the Assembly Government's response to Sir Michael Pitt's interim report on the summer 2007 floods.

The New Approaches programme is facilitating a change in the way we address flood and coastal risk in Wales. In November, I participated in workshops at which we debated options for the new approach, and they brought together a wide range of interested parties and demonstrated that there is enthusiasm and commitment to make this happen.

I commissioned pilot studies following severe localised flooding in Wales in 2007. These studies are now well under way, and are demonstrating how flood consequences can be managed through strong partnership working and close public engagement. The

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynaliadwyedd a Thai (Jane Davidson): Mae'n bleser gennyf fanteisio ar y cyfle hwn i roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf ichi am y cynnydd ers fy natganiad am lifogydd ym mis Medi, ac i roi sylw i ymateb Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i adroddiad interim Syr Michael Pitt am lifogydd haf 2007.

Mae'r rhaglen Dulliau Newydd yn hwyluso newid yn y modd yr awn i'r afael â pherygl i'r arfordir a llifogydd yng Nghymru. Cymerais ran mewn gweithdai ym mis Tachwedd lle buom yn dadlau am opsiynau ar gyfer y dull newydd. Daethant ag amrywiaeth eang o grwpiau a chanddynt ddiddordeb ynghyd, a dangos bod ymrwymiad a brwdfrydedd dros wireddu hyn.

Comisiynais astudiaethau peilot yn dilyn nifer o achosion difrifol o lifogydd lleol yng Nghymru yn 2007. Mae'r astudiaethau hyn yn mynd rhagddynt ers cryn amser bellach, ac yn dangos sut y gellir rheoli canlyniadau llifogydd drwy weithio mewn partneriaeth

experience gained will inform the development of guidance, which will benefit the whole of Wales.

The Pitt review published its interim report in December 2007. The report included a short list of urgent recommendations for immediate implementation, and a longer list of recommendations on which the review team sought comments. The final report will be published later in the summer. The review and its recommendations are focused on the experience in England, but there is a clear read-across to Wales. I have therefore considered the recommendations in detail, and an action plan, tailored for Wales, has been prepared and is being implemented through the Wales resilience framework, which provides the mechanism for dealing with emergency planning issues in Wales. My officials are working closely with colleagues across the Assembly Government, and with those bodies responsible for preparing emergency plans, in taking forward its implementation.

Two issues in particular were highlighted by last summer's events: the vulnerability of surface water drainage systems to extreme events, and the potential vulnerability of our general infrastructure. Historically, we have focused on flooding from rivers and the sea, largely overlooking the threat of urban flooding from surface water systems. Such flooding is extremely difficult to manage, because it happens quickly in response to localised weather conditions. For example, in recent weeks, localised thunderstorm conditions produced intense rainfall, resulting in flood flows that exceeded the capacity of local drainage systems and affected a number of properties. Our fire and rescue service personnel, who responded rapidly to calls for assistance, reported that floodwaters were receding by the time they arrived on site.

Such events are predicted to increase, both in frequency and intensity, as a result of climate change, but predicting where and when such events will occur is currently beyond our

gadarn a meithrin perthynas glòs gyda'r cyhoedd. Bydd y profiad a geir yn sail ar gyfer datblygu cyfarwyddyd, a fydd o fudd i Gymru gyfan.

Cyhoeddodd adolygiad Pitt ei adroddiad interim ym mis Rhagfyr 2007. Yr oedd yr adroddiad yn cynnwys rhestr fer o argymhellion brys i'w gweithredu'n ddiymdroi, a rhestr hwy o argymhellion y gwnaeth y tîm adolygu geisio sylwadau yn eu cylch. Cyhoeddir yr adroddiad terfynol yn ddiweddarach yn yr haf. Mae'r adolygiad a'i argymhellion yn canolbwyntio ar y profiad yn Lloegr, ond ceir cysondeb clir gyda Chymru. Felly, yr wyf wedi ystyried yr argymhellion yn fanwl, ac mae cynllun gweithredu, a deilwrwyd ar gyfer Cymru, wedi cael ei baratoi, ac yn cael ei weithredu drwy gyfrwng fframwaith Cymru gydnerth, sy'n darparu'r mecanwaith ar gyfer ymdrin â materion sy'n ymwneud â chynllunio ar gyfer argyfwng yng Nghymru. Mae fy swyddogion yn gweithio'n glòs gyda chyd-Aelodau ym mhob rhan o Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, a chyda'r cyrff hynny sy'n gyfrifol am baratoi cynlluniau argyfwng er mwyn bwrw ymlaen i'w weithredu.

Tynnodd digwyddiadau'r haf diwethaf sylw at ddau fater yn arbennig: bregusrwydd y systemau draenio dŵr wyneb mewn amgylchiadau eithafol, a bregusrwydd posibl ein seilwaith gyffredinol. Yn hanesyddol, yr ydym wedi canolbwyntio ar lifogydd o afonydd a'r môr, gan ddiystyru i raddau helaeth fygythiad llifogydd trefi o systemau dŵr wyneb. Mae'n eithriadol o anodd rheoli llifogydd o'r fath, oherwydd bydd yn digwydd ar raddfa gyflym wrth ymateb i amodau tywydd lleol. Er enghraifft, yn ystod yr wythnosau diwethaf, cynhyrchwyd glaw trwm yn sgil amodau stormydd mell t a tharanau, a arweiniodd at lif llifogydd a oedd yn drech na chapasiti systemau draenio lleol ac a effeithiodd ar nifer o adeiladau. Dywedodd personél ein gwasanaeth tân ac achub, a ymatebodd ar unwaith i'r galwadau am gymorth, bod y dŵr yn cilio erbyn iddynt gyrraedd y safle.

Proffwydir y bydd digwyddiadau o'r fath yn cynyddu, o ran eu hamlder a'u dwyster ill dau, yn sgil newid yn yr hinsawdd, ond mae proffwydo ble a phryd y digwydd

technological capability. To address this issue, I have established a Wales-wide group, the integrated surface water management group, comprising representatives from Dŵr Cymru, local authorities, the Environment Agency and the Assembly Government. Its first task will be to map areas known to be at risk from surface water flooding, highlighting those areas at greatest risk to emergency planning colleagues across Wales, raising their awareness of the risk, and supporting and informing the development of emergency plans to cope with those risks. This exercise has already commenced and the outputs will be shared over the summer. It will also identify what further work is needed to improve the understanding of our surface water drainage systems and their performance, and to help us to prioritise action.

Improving the management of such risks will not be achieved overnight. The results of this study will provide an early insight into the scale of the challenge that we face, and will focus action on where it is most needed. I will be consulting on surface water management more generally later this year, and I have asked the integrated surface water management group to consider the issues and to advise me of the options available to us. It is important that our strategic plans address flooding from all sources, and include action to improve the management of such risks. Catchment flood management plans covering the whole of Wales are being prepared. The Environment Agency, which is leading on this exercise, will include the results of the integrated surface water management group's findings within these plans.

Regarding the vulnerability of infrastructure to extreme events, it is important that operators are aware of the threat of flooding and have plans in place to manage those threats effectively. The Environment Agency has produced a database indicating infrastructure located in at-risk areas, and it will be shared with emergency planners shortly. Alongside the new challenges that

digwyddiadau o'r fath y tu hwnt i'n gallu technolegol ar hyn o bryd. Er mwyn mynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon, yr wyf wedi sefydlu'r grŵp Cymru gyfan, y grŵp rheoli dŵr wyneb integredig, sy'n cynnwys cynrychiolwyr o Dŵr Cymru, awdurdodau lleol, Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Ei dasg gyntaf fydd creu map o ardaloedd y gwyddys eu bod mewn perygl o ran dŵr wyneb yn creu llifogydd, gan dynnu sylw cydweithwyr sy'n cynllunio ar gyfer argyfwng ledled Cymru at yr ardaloedd hynny sy'n wynebu'r perygl mwyaf, codi'u hymwybyddiaeth o'r perygl, a chefnogi gwaith datblygu cynlluniau argyfwng i ddelio â'r peryglon hynny, a bod yn sail iddynt. Mae'r ymarferiad hwn eisoes ar waith, a chaiff y cynnyrch ei rannu yn ystod yr haf. Bydd hefyd yn canfod pa waith pellach sy'n angenrheidiol i wella'r ddealltwriaeth o'n systemau draenio dŵr wyneb a'u perfformiad, ac yn gymorth inni flaenoriaethu ein camau gweithredu.

Ni ellir gwella'r modd y rheolir peryglon o'r fath dros nos. Rhydd ganlyniadau'r astudiaeth hon ddarlun cynnar o raddfa'r her yr ydym yn ei hwynebu, a bydd yn ganolbwynt i gamau gweithredu ar lle y mae ei angen fwyaf. Byddaf yn ymgynghori ynghylch rheoli dŵr wyneb yn fwy cyffredinol yn ddiweddarach eleni, ac yr wyf wedi gofyn i'r grŵp rheoli dŵr wyneb integredig ystyried y materion a rhoi cyngor imi ynghylch yr opsiynau sydd ar gael inni. Mae'n bwysig i'n cynlluniau strategol fynd i'r afael â llifogydd o bob ffynhonnell, ac iddynt gynnwys camau i wella'r modd y rheolir peryglon o'r fath. Mae cynlluniau rheoli dalgylchoedd llifogydd ar gyfer Cymru gyfan yn cael eu paratoi. Bydd Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, sy'n arwain y ffordd gyda'r ymarferiad hwn, yn cynnwys canlyniadau canfyddiadau'r grŵp rheoli dŵr wyneb integredig o fewn y cynlluniau hyn.

O ran breugsrwydd seilwaith mewn amgylchiadau eithafol, mae'n bwysig bod gweithredwyr yn ymwybodol o fygythiad llifogydd a bod ganddynt gynlluniau ar waith i reoli'r bygythiadau hynny'n effeithiol. Mae Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd wedi cynhyrchu cronfa ddata sy'n nodi seilwaith a leolir mewn ardaloedd sydd mewn perygl, a chaiff ei rhannu'n fuan gyda'r rheini sy'n cynllunio

the summer floods have highlighted, we have an ongoing and serious challenge in managing climate change impacts along our coast. Sea levels are forecast to rise by up to 1m over the next 100 years, and storminess is also forecast to increase. Such increases could render some of our coastal communities unsustainable in the long term.

It is important that we understand current and future risks, that we are clear on our management options and their costs, and that we engage with those directly threatened, allowing them to help to shape the way forward. Fortunately, we do not think that communities will become unsustainable overnight. However, we need to commence engagement now if we are to be confident of developing long-term adaptation plans for our coast, and if we are to place those living and working on the coast at the heart of those plans.

Current shoreline management plans identify present policies for the management of the coast. My aim is for these plans to be refreshed by 2011 and will provide a basis on which to begin discussions about the longer term. In the meantime, I am funding the following, all of which will support the exercise to refresh existing plans: a study to map potential coastal erosion around the Welsh coast; the establishment of a national coastal monitoring centre hosted by Gwynedd Council; and an ongoing coastal monitoring programme. I will also be looking to take the opportunity posed by the recently announced draft UK Bill on water and flooding to consider what additional powers the Assembly Government needs to address this critical challenge.

Darren Millar: Thank you for your statement on this important issue. I, too, welcome the Pitt review and I am especially looking forward to the final report being published later this year. I think that most people would agree that the flooding experienced by much of the country last summer was a wake-up call to put our house in order, and that the commissioning of this review was the right decision. We need to

ar gyfer argyfwng. Ochr yn ochr â'r heriau newydd y tynnodd llifogydd yr haf sylw atynt, mae gennym her barhaus a difrifol wrth reoli effeithiau newid yn yr hinsawdd ar hyd ein harfordir. Proffwydir y bydd lefel y môr yn codi hyd at 1 fetr dros y 100 mlynedd nesaf, a rhagdybir y ceir rhagor o stormydd hefyd. Gallai codiadau a chynnydd o'r fath olygu y bydd rhai o'n cymunedau arfordirol yn anghynaliadwy yn y tymor hir.

Mae'n bwysig inni ddeall peryglon heddiw a pheryglon y dyfodol, ein bod yn glir yn ein hopsiynau rheoli a'u costau, a'n bod yn ymgysylltu â'r rheini sydd dan fygythiad yn uniongyrchol, gan adael iddynt gynorthwyo i lunio'r ffordd ymlaen. Wrth lwc, ni chredwn y daw cymunedau'n anghynaliadwy dros nos. Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni ddechrau ymgysylltu yn awr os ydym am fod yn hyderus ynghylch datblygu cynlluniau addasu tymor hir ar gyfer ein harfordir, ac os ydym am roi'r rheini sy'n byw ac yn gweithio ar yr arfordir wrth wraidd y cynlluniau hynny.

Mae'r cynlluniau cyfredol ar gyfer rheoli traethlin yn nodi polisiau cyfredol ar gyfer rheoli'r arfordir. Fy nod yw adnewyddu'r cynlluniau hyn erbyn 2011, a byddaf yn darparu sail i gychwyn trafodaethau am y tymor hwy. Yn y cyfamser, yr wyf yn ariannu'r canlynol, a bydd pob un ohonynt yn cefnogi'r ymarferiad i adnewyddu cynlluniau cyfredol: astudiaeth i fapio erydiad arfordirol posibl ar hyd arfordir Cymru; sefydlu canolfan genedlaethol monitro'r arfordir, dan arweiniad Cyngor Gwynedd; a rhaglen monitro'r arfordir yn barhaus. Byddaf hefyd yn ceisio manteisio ar y cyfle a gododd yn sgil Mesur drafft y DU ar ddŵr a llifogydd a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar, er mwyn ystyried pa bwerau ychwanegol y mae eu hangen ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad er mwyn mynd i'r afael â'r her allweddol hon.

Darren Millar: Diolch ichi am eich datganiad am y mater pwysig hwn. Yr wyf finnau hefyd yn croesawu adolygiad Pitt, ac yr wyf yn edrych ymlaen yn arbennig at gyhoeddi'r adroddiad terfynol yn ddiweddarach eleni. Credaf y byddai'r mwyafrif o bobl yn cytuno i'r llifogydd a gafwyd mewn nifer o rannau'r wlad yr haf diwethaf fod yn broc i roi trefn ar ein tŷ, a bod comisiynu'r adolygiad hwn yn

learn lessons.

Flooding is of serious concern to many of us in Wales, which is why we tabled a debate on the subject in September, to highlight many of the current risks, which are significant, considering that some 0.5 million people live and work on floodplains in Wales with more than £8 billion-worth of assets at risk. My concern on this matter also carries with it a personal sentiment, because of the memories of the 1990 Towyn floods, which are still strong in my mind. It was a catastrophic event for Towyn and Kinmel Bay, and my family and neighbours lost everything. Therefore, I am keen to ensure that we get this right, which is why I am pleased to recognise the inclusion in your statement that more must be done to ensure the resilience of surface water drainage in urban areas and the need for proper emergency planning. I was appalled to discover recently that emergency evacuation plans for schools in Towyn and Kinmel Bay are not even in place. Clearly, that must be addressed, given the history of the area.

You failed to mention resources in your statement. I have raised this with you on a number of occasions, but given that you have acknowledged that there is an increased risk of flooding due to climate change, could you explain why your Labour-Plaid Government still intends to cut capital expenditure on flood defences in Wales in each of the next three years? I think that the figure is approximately £21 million, which, as you know, could easily be spent in my constituency alone, not to mention the whole of Wales. Now is the time for that figure to be revisited, and these resources must be reconsidered.

The Pitt review also highlighted the need for greater interagency co-operation, stating that people are generally confused by the complex and numerous bodies involved in flood management, and that there is therefore a difficulty in assessing and recognising accountability. Perhaps you could also outline the measures that you will be taking

benderfyniad cywir. Mae angen inni ddysgu gwersi.

Mae llyfogydd yn peri pryder difrifol i nifer ohonom yng Nghymru, a dyna pam y cyflwynasom ddatl am y pwnc ym mis Medi, er mwyn tynnu sylw at nifer o'r peryglon cyfredol, sy'n beryglon sylweddol ac ystyried bod oddeutu 0.5 miliwn o bobl yn byw ac yn gweithio ar orlifdiroedd yng Nghymru, gyda gwerth dros £8 biliwn o asedau mewn perygl. Mae fy nheimpladau personol yn cyfrannu at fy mhryderon am y mater hwn oherwydd atgofion am lifogydd Tywyn yn 1990, sy'n dal yn fyw yn fy nghof. Yr oedd yn ddigwyddiad trychinebus i Dywyn a Bae Cinnel, a chollodd fy nheulu a'm cymdogion bopeth. Felly, yr wyf yn awyddus i sicrhau y cawn hyn yn iawn, a dyma pam yr wyf yn falch o gydnabod ichi ddweud yn eich datganiad bod yn rhaid gwneud mwy i sicrhau gwytnwch systemau draenio dŵr wyneb mewn ardaloedd trefol a bod angen cynllunio'n briodol ar gyfer argyfwng. Fe'm brawychwyd wrth ganfod yn ddiweddar nad yw cynlluniau gwagio mewn argyfwng ysgolion Tywyn a Bae Cinnel hyd yn oed wedi cael eu sefydlu eto. Yn amlwg, rhaid mynd i'r afael â hynny, ac ystyried hanes yr ardal.

Ni lwyddoch i grybwyll adnoddau yn eich datganiad. Yr wyf wedi codi hyn gyda chi droeon, ond gan ichi gydnabod y ceir perygl cynyddol o lifogydd yn sgil newid yn yr hinsawdd, a allech egluro pam mae eich Llywodraeth Llafur-Plaid yn dal yn bwriadu lleihau gwariant cyfalaf ar amddiffynfeydd rhag llyfogydd yng Nghymru yn ystod pob un o'r tair blynedd nesaf? Credaf mai oddeutu £21 miliwn yw'r ffigur y gellid, fel y gwyddoch, ei wario'n hawdd yn fy etholaeth i'n unig, heb sôn am Gymru gyfan. Dyma'r amser i ailedrych ar y ffigur hwnnw, a rhaid ailystyried yr adnoddau hyn.

Amlygodd adolygiad Pitt hefyd yr angen am fwy o gydweithredu rhwng asiantaethau, gan ddatgan bod y cyrff niferus a chymhleth sy'n gysylltiedig â rheoli llyfogydd yn peri dryswch i bobl yn gyffredinol, a'i bod felly'n anodd asesu a chydabod atebolrwydd. Efallai y gallech hefyd amlinellu'r camau y byddwch yn eu cymryd i sicrhau y caiff

to ensure that a much more joined-up approach is adopted in Wales. My party has proposed the establishment of a Welsh flood defence agency, for example, to bring the relevant parties together under one roof, so that there can be a totally co-ordinated approach to the work on the ground. Are you now prepared to consider that?

Finally, is it now time to revisit technical advice note 15, so that the planning guidance can be strengthened to ensure that there is proper protection in place? We are learning new lessons all the time, particularly from the problems that we experienced last summer. I know that your colleague, the Minister for Health and Social Services, has recently given the thumbs up for the redevelopment of Ysbyty Glan Clwyd in Bodelwyddan, which I welcome and support. However, I am concerned that the hospital will be sited on a floodplain, and should not be exposed to unreasonable levels of risk. Therefore, are you prepared to review technical advice note 15 in the light of what you have said today?

1.30 p.m.

Jane Davidson: How we respond to the challenges of flooding is a very important issue for the Assembly to face. I am pleased that you welcome the initiatives that we have introduced in the context of surface water flooding. Responsibilities for river water courses, sea flooding and coastal erosion were clearly divided between the Environment Agency and local authorities, and it was quite clear, in the context of surface water flooding, that people were concerned that they might have the wrong sort of flooding. That is utterly unacceptable, and I stand here today as the Minister with responsibility for overseeing the appropriate response in Wales, to state that any kind of flooding will be looked at by my department in terms of how we can prevent it. I also take note of what you have said about schools in Towyn not having emergency evacuation plans. I will discuss that with the First Minister, who chairs the Wales resilience forum. There are four fora across Wales specifically focused on how we tackle emergencies, and we must have appropriate

agwedd mwy cydlynol o lawer ei mabwysiadu yng Nghymru. Mae fy mhlaidd wedi cynnig sefydlu asiantaeth amddiffyn rhag llifogydd ar gyfer Cymru, er enghraifft, er mwyn dod â'r partion perthnasol ynghyd dan yr unto, er mwyn cael agwedd cwbl gydlynol at y gwaith ar lawr gwlad. A ydych yn barod i ystyried hynny'n awr?

Yn olaf, a yw bellach yn bryd ailedrych ar nodyn cyngor technegol 15, fel y gellir cryfhau'r cyfarwyddyd cynllunio er mwyn sicrhau bod cynlluniau amddiffyn priodol ar waith? Yr ydym yn dysgu gwersi newydd drwy'r amser, yn enwedig gan y problemau a gawsom yr haf diwethaf. Gwn bod eich cyd-Aelod, y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, wedi cymeradwyo'n ddiweddar aildatblygu Ysbyty Glan Clwyd ym Modelwyddan, ac yr wyf yn cefnogi hynny ac yn ei groesawu. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn pryderu y bydd yr ysbyty wedi'i leoli ar orlifdir, ac na ddylai fod yn agored i lefelau afresymol o berygl. Felly, a ydych yn barod i adolygu nodyn cyngor technegol 15 yng ngoleuni'r hyn yr ydych wedi'i ddweud heddiw?

Jane Davidson: Mae sut y byddwn yn ymateb i heriau llifogydd yn fater pwysig iawn i'r Cynulliad ei wynebu. Yr wyf yn falch eich bod yn croesawu'r cynlluniau yr ydym wedi'u cyflwyno yng nghyswllt llifogydd dŵr wyneb. Rhannwyd cyfrifoldebau am gyrsiau dŵr afon, llifogydd o'r môr ac erydiad arfordirol yn glir rhwng Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd ac awdurdodau lleol, ac yr oedd yn berffaith glir, yng nghydestun llifogydd dŵr wyneb, bod pobl yn bryderus y gallent fod wedi cael y math anghywir o lifogydd. Mae hynny'n gwbl annerbyniol, a safaf yma heddiw fel y Gweinidog sydd â chyfrifoldeb dros oruchwylio'r ymateb priodol yng Nghymru, i ddatgan y bydd fy adran yn edrych ar unrhyw fath o lifogydd yn nhermau sut y gallwn eu hatal. Sylwaf hefyd ar yr hyn yr ydych wedi'i ddweud am ysgolion yn Nhywyn heb gynlluniau gwagio mewn argyfwng. Trafodaf hynny gyda'r Prif Weinidog, sy'n cadeirio fforwm Cymru gydnerth. Mae pedwar fforwm ar draws Cymru sy'n canolbwyntio'n benodol ar sut yr awn i'r afael ag argyfyngau,

emergency evacuation plans in place for buildings where there will be large numbers of people. I will definitely take that up with the First Minister.

We have doubled the funding for flood and coastal defence since 1999. It is now up to £35 million and a convergence bid has been submitted in the context of possibly looking for a further £30 million over the next five years. There is, therefore, a dramatic increase in the funding. What we are doing with the New Approaches programme is moving away from the old defence-led approach to a risk-management-led approach, so that funding follows the advice not only of colleagues in the Assembly Government and the Environment Agency, but far more widely. The Foresight report that was published in 2004 noted that funding should be provided on a risk-management basis. Therefore, we have vastly increased funding, but it has moved away from the traditional areas.

Interestingly, the Environment, Food and Rural Affairs Committee looked at whether there should be a separate flood agency for England, and rejected the proposal. Similarly, we would reject the notion of a separate flood defence agency in Wales. It is crucial that the Assembly Government, as the strategic body in Wales, takes the strategic responsibility and, as I outlined in terms of the integrated surface water management group, works closely with the Environment Agency, local authorities and Dŵr Cymru. We need to ensure that drainage authorities and water companies are alongside the Environment Agency and local authorities in terms of delivery. We can get everyone in one room in Wales, so we do not need a separate agency when we want to see all our investment going on delivery mechanisms.

On issues around floodplains, TAN 15 is specific about the fact that there should be no building on floodplains unless it is to a very high standard of resilience, and that remains the policy of the Assembly Government.

Leanne Wood: Back in September 2007,

a rhaid inni gael cynlluniau gwagio priodol yn eu lle ar gyfer adeiladau lle ceir niferoedd mawr o bobl. Byddaf yn bendant yn codi hynny gyda'r Prif Weinidog.

Yr ydym wedi dyblu'r cyllid ar gyfer atal llifogydd ac amddiffyn yr arfordir er 1999. Mae bellach wedi codi i £35 miliwn ac mae cais cydgyfeirio wedi'i gyflwyno gan feddwl am edrych am £30 miliwn ychwanegol o bosibl dros y pum mlynedd nesaf. Ceir cynnydd dramatig yn yr arian, felly. Yr hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud gyda'r rhaglen Dulliau Newydd yw symud i ffwrdd oddi wrth yr hen ddull o ganolbwyntio ar amddiffynfeydd tuag at ddull rheoli risg, fel y bydd y cyllid yn dilyn cyngor nid yn unig gyd-Aelodau yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ac Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, ond yn llawer ehangach. Nododd yr adroddiad Rhagolwg a gyhoeddwyd yn 2004 y dylid darparu cyllid ar sail rheoli risg. Felly, yr ydym wedi cynyddu'r arian yn helaeth, ond fe'i symudwyd i ffwrdd o'r meysydd traddodiadol.

Yn ddiddorol, ystyriodd Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig a ddylid cael asiantaeth lifogydd ar wahân ar gyfer Lloegr, a gwrthododd y cynnig. Yn yr un modd, byddem ninnau'n gwrthod y syniad o gael asiantaeth amddiffyn rhag llifogydd ar wahân yng Nghymru. Mae'n hollbwysig fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, y corff strategol yng Nghymru, yn cymryd y cyfrifoldeb strategol a'i bod, fel yr amlinellais yn nhermau'r grŵp rheoli dŵr wyneb integredig, yn gweithio'n agos gydag Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, awdurdodau lleol a Dŵr Cymru. Mae angen sicrhau bod awdurdodau draenio a chwmnïau dŵr yn cyd-gamu gydag Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd ac awdurdodau lleol yn nhermau gweithredu. Gallwn gael pawb i un ystafell yng Nghymru, felly nid oes angen asiantaeth ar wahân a ninnau eisïau gweld ein holl fuddsoddiad yn mynd i fecanweithiau gweithredu.

Ar faterion ynghylch gorlifdiroedd, mae TAN 15 yn benodol yn glŷn â'r ffaith na ddylid adeiladu ar orlifdiroedd oni wneir hynny i safon uchel iawn o gadernid, a dyna bolisi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o hyd.

Leanne Wood: Yn ôl ym mis Medi 2007,

Plaid Cymru welcomed the New Approaches programme announcement. However, we were of the view that maintenance of defences should be a priority, that consideration should be given to the way in which we design urban areas, that due consideration should be given to the effect of farmland used for flood protection, and that co-ordination between the various agencies responsible for flooding was essential. The Pitt interim review has called for flooding to be treated like other emergencies, such as terrorism or a flu epidemic, where there are national frameworks in place. I would be grateful to hear, Minister, what progress has been made in working towards that recommendation.

The Welsh Local Government Association is calling for a statutory framework that would compel organisations to share information and prepare flood prevention plans. I would be grateful if you could tell me whether you have had any discussions with the WLGA and the other organisations that are involved in risk management on developing a more coherent plan.

We must change our thinking in responding to floods. Rather than focusing on the effects, we should be doing much more to tackle the causes of floods, such as the intensive farming of land, housing and industrial development in risky areas, the destruction of places where water can be temporarily stored, the destruction of rivers and their floodplains, and the wide-spread concreting of naturally absorbent land, such as gardens, which means that water runs off into sewers and river courses that are not meant to take so much water. You have partly answered my question, but is there any more that you can say to reassure us that the One Wales Government is prepared to be tough on the causes of floods?

Jane Davidson: I am very happy to start with that. You started your contribution by asking for more investment in defences. Some of the evidence that I am receiving from the Environment Agency, for example, shows that, in certain places in Wales, you could build defences that are so high that, if water came over them, it could kill the communities behind them. Therefore, the

croesawodd Plaid Cymru y cyhoeddiad am y rhaglen Dulliau Newydd. Fodd bynnag, yr oeddem o'r farn y dylid rhoi blaenoriaeth i gynnal amddiffynfeydd, y dylid ystyried y modd y dyluniwn ardaloedd trefol, y dylid rhoi ystyriaeth ddyledus i effaith defnyddio tir amaeth ar gyfer gwarchod rhag llifogydd, a bod cydgysylltu rhwng y gwahanol asiantaethau sy'n gyfrifol am lifogydd yn hanfodol. Mae adolygiad interim Pitt wedi galw am drin llifogydd fel argyfyngau eraill, fel terfysgaeth neu epidemig o'r fflw, lle mae fframweithiau cenedlaethol wedi'u sefydlu. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar o glywed, Weinidog, pa gynnydd a wnaethpwyd i weithio at yr argymhelliad hwnnw.

Mae Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru'n galw am fframwaith statudol a fyddai'n gorfodi sefydliadau i rannu gwybodaeth a pharatoi cynlluniau atal llifogydd. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech ddweud wrthyf a ydych wedi cael unrhyw drafodaethau gyda CLILC a'r cyrff eraill sy'n ymwneud â rheoli risg ynglŷn â datblygu cynllun mwy cydlynol.

Rhaid inni newid ein ffordd o feddwl wrth ymateb i lifogydd. Yn hytrach na chanolbwyntio ar yr effeithiau, dylem wneud llawer mwy i fynd i'r afael ag achosion llifogydd, fel ffermio dwys ar dir, datblygu tai a diwydiant mewn ardaloedd lle mae risg, dinistrio mannau lle gellir storio dŵr dros dro, dinistrio afonydd a'u gorlifdiroedd, a'r arfer cyffredin o goncritio tir naturiol amsugol, fel gerddi, sy'n golygu bod dŵr yn llifo i garthffosydd a chyrsgiau dŵr na fwriadwyd iddynt gymryd cymaint o ddŵr. Yr ydych wedi ateb fy nghwestiwn yn rhannol, ond a oes unrhyw beth mwy y gallwch ei ddweud wrthym i'n sicrhau bod Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un yn barod i fod yn galed ar achosion llifogydd?

Jane Davidson: Dechreuaf gyda'r pwynt hwnnw'n llawen. Ar gychwyn eich cyfraniad gofnasoch am fwy o fuddsoddi mewn amddiffynfeydd. Mae rhywfaint o'r dystiolaeth yr wyf yn ei chael oddi wrth Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, er enghraifft, yn dangos y gallech, mewn rhai lleoedd yng Nghymru, adeiladu amddiffynfeydd sydd mor uchel nes, pe deuai'r dŵr drostynt, y

whole point of the New Approaches programme is to consider issues around the cause of flooding and to take a wide approach to tackling them. That is why strategic management plans for flooding across Wales are being developed and why we plan to refresh the existing shoreline management plans, as I announced earlier.

In a number of schemes, most notably that in the Conwy valley, there is a very explicit proposal on utilising farmland to flood to ensure the protection of local communities and to diminish the risk for those communities. Although we are in the final process of sorting out the particular propositions, people are all signed up to the fact that that needs to happen to make it work in those areas. That is a crucial element of this.

We must operate a degree of honesty, which I do not think has been there so far. We talk a lot about global warming and climate change as if they are issues that we need to tackle in the ether. However, the effect of global warming and climate change will cause an increase in sea levels, for example, which will have its own consequences. That is why it is important that we have accurate maps, work with the Association of British Insurers, have strategic frameworks in place and that the Assembly Government provides a clear lead. I will be meeting the new environment spokespeople for the WLGA shortly and I will be raising with them their responsibilities in this regard.

Nick Ramsay: I welcome the Minister's comments, this statement and the findings of the Pitt review. I wanted to pick up on one element of what you said earlier, namely the renewed commitment to tackling different types of flooding, such as the run off of surface water, not to mention the whole issue of coastal flooding. There has been a lack of focus on that in the past. In your opening remarks you mentioned last winter's flooding. I visited a housing estate and I was knee-deep in water after heavy rain. The houses were not classed as being on a floodplain when they were bought, and the

gallai ladd y cymunedau y tu ôl iddynt. Felly, holl bwynt y rhaglen Dulliau Newydd yw ystyried materion o amgylch yr hyn sy'n achosi llifogydd a mynd ati i fynd i'r afael â hwy mewn dull eang. Dyna pam y datblygir cynlluniau rheoli strategol ar gyfer llifogydd ledled Cymru a pham y bwriadwn adnewyddu'r cynlluniau cyfredol ar gyfer rheoli traethlin, fel y cyhoeddais yn gynharach.

Mewn nifer o gynlluniau, yn fwyaf nodedig yn nyffryn Conwy, mae cynnig clir iawn ynghylch defnyddio tir amaeth i'w orlifo er mwyn sicrhau diogelwch cymunedau lleol a lleihau'r perygl i'r cymunedau hynny. Er ein bod yn y broses derfynol o gael trefn ar y cynigion penodol, mae pawb wedi derbyn y ffaith bod angen i hynny ddigwydd er mwyn i'r peth weithio yn yr ardaloedd hynny. Mae hynny'n elfen allweddol o hyn.

Rhaid inni arfer rhyw radd o onestrwydd, sydd heb fod yn bresennol hyd yma yn fy nhyb i. Siaradwn lawer am gynhesu byd-eang a newid yr hinsawdd fel petaent yn faterion y mae angen inni fynd i'r afael â hwy yn yr awyr. Fodd bynnag, bydd effaith cynhesu byd-eang a newid yn yr hinsawdd yn achosi cynnydd yn lefelau'r môr, er enghraifft, a gaiff ei ganlyniadau ei hun. Dyna pam y mae'n bwysig inni gael mapiau cywir, gweithio gyda Chymdeithas Yswirwyr Prydain, sefydlu fframweithiau strategol a bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cynnig arweiniad clir. Byddaf yn cwrdd â llefarwyr newydd CLILC dros yr amgylchedd cyn bo hir, a byddaf yn tynnu eu sylw hwy at eu cyfrifoldebau yn hyn o beth.

Nick Ramsay: Croesawaf sylwadau'r Gweinidog, y datganiad hwn a chanfyddiadau adolygiad Pitt. Yr oedd arnaf eisiau codi un elfen o'r hyn a ddywedasochnau, sef yr ymrwymiad o'r newydd i fynd i'r afael â gwahanol fathau o lifogydd, fel all-lif dŵr wyneb, heb sôn am holl gwestiwn llifogydd arfordirol. Bu diffyg canolbwytio ar hynny yn y gorffennol. Yn eich sylwadau agoriadol cyfeiriasoch at lifogydd y gaeaf diwethaf. Ymwelais â stad o dai ac yr oeddwn at fy mhengliniau mewn dŵr ar ôl glaw trwm. Nid oedd y tai wedi'u dosbarthu fel tai ar orliffdir pan brynwyd hwy, ac ni allai'r perchenogion

homeowners could not understand why the risk that they had incurred in moving there had not been highlighted to them. I welcome the renewed emphasis on this and seek your assurance that you will do everything that you can to progress this part of the plan and recognise that flooding does not just happen in coastal areas; we all know that it happens alongside rivers and streams and that you can be subject to flooding wherever you are.

Jane Davidson: You are absolutely right, and that is why it was important to set up the integrated surface water management group to consider the areas that are most at risk. One thing that puts areas at risk is the degree to which front or back gardens are concreted—if there is nowhere for the water to go. We also need to review the permitted development rights that have enabled people to do that in areas that might now be at risk. That is why it is important that we get the information so that we can take the appropriate legislative action on planning and other issues.

1.40 p.m.

Michael German: I welcome your statement, Minister, but I will place it in context. Some 500,000 people in Wales live or work on floodplains. Also, we have £8 billion worth of assets—about 150,000 homes are included in that—at risk from flooding. The prospect for our country in not getting this right is immense, so I welcome your statement. Also, it is right that we should have the appropriate responses.

I will question you about resources in a moment, but I will deal first with the issue of the national taskforce, or the national way of structuring this, which is so important. I would agree that, with emergencies such as flooding, we do not need a separate body, because it is a case of bringing together a wide range of responders. However, would you agree that there is a necessity for having a lead person or persons, or unit, at the top of that response team to take the lead when the various agencies respond to a situation? It is important that people know where to turn when there is the prospect of flooding. One

ddeall pam nad oedd y risg yr oeddent wedi'i gymryd wrth symud yno wedi cael ei bwysleisio wrthynt. Croesawaf y pwyslais a roddir o'r newydd ar hyn a gofynnaf am eich sicrwydd y gwnewch bopeth a allwch i hyrwyddo'r rhan hon o'r cynllun ac i gydnabod nad dim ond mewn ardaloedd arfordirol y mae llifogydd yn digwydd; gwyddom i gyd eu bod yn digwydd nesaf at afonydd a nentydd ac y gallwch ddiodeff llifogydd lle bynnag y boch.

Jane Davidson: Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle, a dyna pam yr oedd yn bwysig sefydlu'r grŵp rheoli dŵr wyneb integredig i ystyried yr ardaloedd sydd mewn mwyaf o berygl. Un peth sy'n peryglu ardaloedd yw'r graddau y mae gerddi o flaen neu'r tu ôl i dai wedi'u concretio—os nad oes unlle i'r dŵr fynd. Mae angen inni hefyd adolygu'r hawliau datblygu a ganiateir, sydd wedi galluogi pobl i wneud hynny mewn ardaloedd a allai fod mewn perygl erbyn hyn. Dyna pam y mae'n bwysig inni gael y wybodaeth fel y gallwn gymryd y camau deddfwriaethol priodol ynglŷn â chynllunio a materion eraill.

Michael German: Croesawaf eich datganiad, Weinidog, ond fe'i gosodaf mewn cyd-destun. Mae rhyw 500,000 o bobl yng Nghymru'n byw neu'n gweithio ar orlifdiroedd. Hefyd, mae gennym werth £8 biliwn o asedau—mae hynny'n cynnwys tua 150,000 o gartrefi—sydd mewn perygl o lifogydd. Mae'r rhagolygon i'n gwlad o beidio â chael hyn yn iawn yn aruthrol, felly croesawaf eich datganiad. Hefyd, mae'n iawn y dylem gael yr ymatebion priodol.

Fe'ch holaf ynglŷn ag adnoddau mewn munud, ond deliaf yn gyntaf â mater y tasglu cenedlaethol, neu'r ffordd genedlaethol o strwythuro hyn, sydd mor bwysig. Cytunwn, gydag argyfyngau fel llifogydd, nad oes angen corff ar wahân arnom, oherwydd mae'n fater o ddod ag amrediad eang o ymatebwyr ynghyd. Fodd bynnag, a gytunech fod angen cael rhywun neu rywrai, neu uned, ar ben y tîm ymateb hwnnw i arwain y ffordd pan fydd y gwahanol asiantaethau'n ymateb i sefyllfa? Mae'n bwysig bod pobl yn gwybod i ble i droi pan geir rhagolygon llifogydd. Un o 15 argymhelliad brys Syr Michael oedd y

of Sir Michael's 15 urgent recommendations was that, in England, DEFRA should develop the framework plan. I presume that, in Wales, that responsibility falls to you. What structure are you planning to ensure that a flooding taskforce of the various agencies is put together?

Local authorities represent the second area for which there are some key messages. They will be key in taking forward the Pitt review's recommendations. They will have to identify the main issues affecting their local areas, map the drainage systems, and work with the stakeholders to ensure better understanding of the causes of flooding so that the solutions can be identified to improve responses to future floods, but at a local level. In order to take that lead role, local authorities will need some clear guidance and a timetable for action. Can you tell us, from the work that you have done, identified in today's statement, whether in fact you are going to produce at the end of it more, and stronger, guidance for local authorities on how they should respond in these matters?

Just as the case is much stronger for local authorities, there has to be clarity about the role for each individual agency involved in dealing with floods, and a clear strategy should be in place at all levels of Government. I would be grateful if you could tell us whether the good working relationships that you need to ensure swift and responsible responses are in place.

The important issue, of course, is that of prioritisation. Can you tell us what, at the present moment, your first, second and third priorities are for dealing with these issues? Where do you expect that to be when the final draft of the Pitt report's recommendations is published?

I heard what you said about TAN 15—yes, it is in place, and yes, you do have a policy, but it will not necessarily be strongly managed by local authorities. Do you think that there is a role in this for some stronger guidance to local authorities on how they should assess applications for sites on floodplains? We have to remember, of course, that two thirds

dylai DEFRA yn Lloegr ddatblygu'r cynllun fframwaith yn Lloegr. Mae'n debyg gen i, yng Nghymru, mai arnoch chi y syrthia'r cyfrifoldeb hwnnw. Pa fframwaith yr ydych yn ei gynllunio i sicrhau y creir tasglu llifogydd o'r amryfal asiantaethau?

Awdurdodau lleol yw'r ail faes lle ceir rhywfaint o negeseuon allweddol. Byddant yn allweddol wrth weithredu argymhellion adolygiad Pitt. Bydd yn rhaid iddynt nodi'r prif faterion sy'n effeithio ar eu hardaloedd lleol, mapio'r systemau draenio, a gweithio gyda'r rhanddeiliaid i sicrhau gwell dealltwriaeth o achosion llifogydd fel y gellir canfod yr atebion i wella ymatebion i lifogydd yn y dyfodol, ond ar lefel leol. Er mwyn ymgymryd â'r rôl arweiniol honno, bydd ar awdurdodau lleol angen arweiniad clir ac amserlen ar gyfer gweithredu. A allwch ddweud wrthym, o'r gwaith yr ydych wedi'i wneud, a enwyd yn natganiad heddiw, a ydych mewn gwirionedd yn y diwedd yn mynd i gynhyrchu mwy o arweiniad, ac arweiniad cryfach, i awdurdodau lleol ynghylch sut y dylent ymateb yn y materion hyn?

Yn union fel y mae'r achos yn llawer cryfach dros awdurdodau lleol, rhaid wrth eglurder ynglŷn â swyddogaeth pob asiantaeth unigol a fydd yn ymwneud â delio â llifogydd, a dylid cael strategaeth glir ar bob lefel o Lywodraeth. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech ddweud wrthym a yw'r berthynas cydweithio dda sy'n angenrheidiol i sicrhau ymatebion buan a chyfrifol wedi'i sefydlu.

Y peth pwysig, wrth gwrs, yw gosod blaenoriaethau. A allwch ddweud wrthym beth, ar hyn o bryd, yw eich blaenoriaethau cyntaf, ail a thrydydd ar gyfer delio â'r materion hyn? Ble y disgwyliwch i hynny fod pan gyhoeddir drafft terfynol argymhellion adroddiad Pitt?

Clywais yr hyn a ddywedasoich am TAN 15—ydyw, y mae yn ei le, ac oes, y mae gennych bolisi, ond ni chaiff ei reoli'n gadarn o reidrwydd gan awdurdodau lleol. A ydych yn meddwl bod lle yma i arweiniad cryfach i awdurdodau lleol ynghylch sut y dylent asesu ceisiadau am safleoedd ar orlifdiroedd? Rhaid inni gofio, wrth gwrs, fod dau draean

of all the properties that will be around in 2050 have already been built. Do you think that stronger guidance is needed for local authorities as to what they might do with regard to those properties that are already built on floodplains?

Finally, I turn to the issue of resources. As you know, Hilary Benn announced the sum of £34.5 million—many people think that insufficient—to be targeted specifically at the Pitt recommendations. I have looked carefully, and apart from announcing that reviews and so on would be held and that working groups would be set up, you have not announced any funding to specifically deal with this issue in the way that Hilary Benn has done for England. Do you intend to identify and ring-fence money for the work that you have identified, for the outcomes that you anticipate from the work that you have been doing and in line with the further recommendations that we are likely to get from the Pitt review?

Jane Davidson: Sir Michael Pitt's first recommendation was about groundwater levels and that at times of high risk work should be undertaken by the Environment Agency to predict and mitigate further serious groundwater flooding from this winter onwards. That recommendation is not appropriate for Wales, and it indicates immediately that a very different kind of flooding is going on in the two countries.

However, Sir Michael Pitt's second recommendation was that

'the Environment Agency, supported by local authorities and water companies, should urgently identify areas at highest risk from surface water flooding where known, inform Local Resilience Forums and take steps to identify remaining high risk areas over the coming months.'

We took that recommendation on board immediately, and that is my highest priority. That is why I made this statement today, announcing the setting up of the integrated surface water management group.

Therefore, by July, we will have collated all

o'r holl eiddo a fydd o gwmpas yn 2050 eisoes wedi'u hadeiladu. A ydych yn meddwl bod angen arweiniad cryfach i awdurdodau lleol ynghylch beth y gallent ei wneud ynglŷn â'r adeiladau hynny sydd eisoes wedi'u codi ar orlifdiroedd?

Yn olaf, trof at gwestiwn adnoddau. Fel y gwyddoch, cyhoeddodd Hilary Benn y swm o £34.5 miliwn—mae llawer o bobl yn meddwl nad yw hynny'n ddigon—i'w dargedu'n benodol at argymhellion Pitt. Yr wyf wedi edrych yn ofalus, ac ar wahân i gyhoeddi y cynhelid adolygiadau ac ati ac y sefydlid gweithgorau, nid ydych wedi cyhoeddi dim cyllid i ddelio'n benodol â'r mater hwn fel y mae Hilary Benn wedi gwneud ar gyfer Lloegr. A ydych yn bwriadu neilltuo a chlustnodi arian ar gyfer y gwaith yr ydych wedi'i nodi, ar gyfer y canlyniadau yr ydych yn eu rhagweld o'r gwaith yr ydych wedi'i wneud ac yn unol â'r argymhellion pellach yr ydym yn debygol o'u cael gan adolygiad Pitt?

Jane Davidson: Yr oedd argymhelliad cyntaf Syr Michael Pitt yn ymwneud â lefelau dŵr daear ac yn datgan y dylai Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd ymgymryd â gwaith ar adegau o berygl mawr i ragweld a lliniaru llifogydd difrifol pellach oherwydd dŵr daear o'r gaeaf hwn ymlaen. Nid yw'r argymhelliad hwnnw'n briodol i Gymru, ac mae'n dangos yn syth bod math gwahanol iawn o lifogydd yn digwydd yn y ddwy wlad.

Fodd bynnag, ail argymhelliad Syr Michael Pitt oedd

y dylai Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, gyda chymorth awdurdodau lleol a chwmnïau dŵr, nodi ar frys ardaloedd sydd yn y perygl mwyaf oddi wrth lifogydd dŵr wyneb lle y maent yn hysbys, rhoi gwybod i Fforymau Gwrthsefyll Lleol a chymryd camau dros y misoedd i ddod i bennu gweddill yr ardaloedd sydd yn dal mewn perygl mawr.

Derbyniasom yr argymhelliad hwnnw ar unwaith, a hwnnw yw'r flaenoriaeth bennaf sydd gennyf. Dyna pam y gwneuthum y datganiad hwn heddiw, gan gyhoeddi sefydlu'r grŵp rheoli dŵr wyneb integredig.

Felly, erbyn mis Gorffennaf, byddwn wedi

the available information, we will have identified the known high-risk areas, and we will have presented that information to the Welsh local resilience fora to raise their awareness of those issues. By October, we will be able to map out the critical drainage areas for input into the Welsh strategic plans, we will consider what actions are needed to improve understanding of the vulnerabilities of urban drainage systems, and we will consider what actions are needed to improve the management of such systems. Therefore, there is a new focus to go along with the new approaches, with a specific set of actions attached.

When there is a flooding incident, and particularly in the lead-up to a flooding incident, the Environment Agency monitors conditions, inspects and operates the defence network. Local authorities would also do the same, in providing direct assistance to affected landowners. The Environment Agency also provides warnings in relation to flooding from rivers and the sea. Flood warnings are available directly to property owners and professional partners, and the agency also provides technical advice to support the development of emergency plans. This information is available on the Environment Agency website, so that people can see whether they are in an area that is at risk of flooding.

I am keen to see that information goes to all those who are in areas that are at risk of flooding, so that they can pick up information via Floodline and can take appropriate action in their properties. When we have moved from the possibility of flooding once every 100 years to knowing that, every year in Wales, we are going to have houses flooded somewhere, we need to ensure that people everywhere understand that they may need to take action in relation to their properties.

With regard to technical advice note 15, you are not an expert planner, and nor am I. We have put together a resilient and robust

casglu'r holl wybodaeth sydd ar gael, byddwn wedi enwi'r ardaloedd y gwyddys eu bod mewn perygl mawr, a byddwn wedi cyflwyno'r wybodaeth honno i'r fforymau gwrthsefyll lleol yng Nghymru er mwyn hybu eu hymwybyddiaeth o'r materion hynny. Erbyn mis Hydref, byddwn yn gallu mapio'r ardaloedd draenio critigol i'w cynnwys yn y cynlluniau strategol i Gymru, byddwn yn ystyried pa gamau y mae angen eu cymryd i ddeall y gwendidau mewn systemau draenio trefol yn well, a byddwn yn ystyried pa gamau y mae angen eu cymryd i wella'r modd y rheolir systemau o'r fath. Felly, mae pwyslais newydd i gyd-fynd â'r dulliau gweithredu newydd, a set benodol o gamau gweithredu yn gysylltiedig â hwy.

Pan fydd achos o lifogydd, ac yn enwedig yn y cyfnod cyn hynny, bydd Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn monitro amgylchiadau, yn archwilio ac yn rhedeg y rhwydwaith amddiffyn. Byddai awdurdodau lleol yn gwneud yr un peth hefyd, o ran rhoi cymorth uniongyrchol i dirfeddianwyr yr effeithir arnynt. Mae Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn rhoi rhybuddion hefyd mewn cysylltiad â llifogydd o afonydd ac o'r môr. Mae rhybuddion rhag llifogydd ar gael yn uniongyrchol i berchnogion eiddo ac i bartneriaid proffesiynol, ac mae'r asiantaeth hefyd yn cynnig cyngor technegol i ategu gwaith datblygu cynlluniau argyfwng. Mae'r wybodaeth hon ar gael ar wefan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, fel y gall pobl weld a ydynt mewn ardal sydd mewn perygl oddi wrth lifogydd.

Yr wyf yn awyddus i sicrhau y bydd gwybodaeth yn mynd at bawb sydd mewn ardaloedd sydd mewn perygl oddi wrth lifogydd, fel y gallant gael gwybodaeth drwy'r Llinell Llifogydd a chymryd camau priodol ar eu heiddo. A ninnau wedi symud o sefyllfa lle'r oedd posibilrwydd o gael llifogydd unwaith bob 100 mlynedd at un lle y gwyddom y bydd tai dan ddŵr yn rhywle yng Nghymru bob blwyddyn, mae angen inni sicrhau bod pobl ym mhobman yn deall y gallai fod angen iddynt gymryd camau mewn cysylltiad â'u heiddo.

Gyda golwg ar nodyn cyngor technegol 15, nid ydych chi na minnau'n gynlluniwr arbenigol. Yr ydym wedi llunio set o

planning set of advice in the context of that TAN. However, if it turns out, as a result of the work of the experts in the integrated surface water management group and others, that we need to change TAN 15, I would, of course, do so, because the planning system must support the policy of the Assembly Government, which is to ensure that we respond appropriately to these challenges.

The funding announced by Hilary Benn was particularly in the context of the flooding that happened in the Avon and Severn areas, and the Gloucester and Tewkesbury areas. We did not have that kind of flooding in Wales; we put funding into looking at the specific surface water incidents that we had in Wales, and that is contributing towards our national framework. We hope that we will be successful with our bid for £30 million of additional funding out of the convergence funds, to take forward the New Approaches agenda. However, having the data available will guide funding bids in each budget round, which I hope Members would support.

1.50 p.m.

Eleanor Burnham: I welcome your warm words and the Pitt review. I have been particularly concerned about the Almere and Trefalun flood area, and I was successful in persuading the Environment Agency to spend a considerable amount of money to help certain people. While I understand the funding pressures and your new emphasis, I am concerned that it takes away from the regular ongoing maintenance and clearing of sewers and highways, and even from dredging silt from rivers. We do not have time to go into the detail, but I could name some of the areas about which I have concerns. In Trefalun alone, one family has been badly affected, because the Environment Agency's work has helped some, but has left this particular family vulnerable. How do you answer these difficult questions, Minister, because you have not secured any extra funding? The Environment Agency tells me constantly that it does not have sufficient funding. I am

gynghorion ar gynllunio cadarn a gwrthsafol yng nghyd-destun y nodyn hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, os gwelir, o ganlyniad i waith gan yr arbenigwyr yn y grŵp rheoli dŵr wyneb integredig ac eraill, fod angen inni newid TAN 15, byddwn yn gwneud hynny, wrth gwrs, gan ei bod yn rhaid i'r system gynllunio ategu polisi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, sef sicrhau ein bod yn ymateb yn briodol i'r heriau hyn.

Yr oedd y cyllid a gyhoeddwyd gan Hilary Benn yn ymwneud yn benodol â'r llifogydd a fu yn ardaloedd afonydd Avon a Hafren, ac yn ardaloedd Caerloyw a Tewkesbury. Ni chawsom lifogydd o'r math hwnnw yng Nghymru; rhesom gyllid at y gwaith o ystyried yr achosion neilltuol a oedd yn ymwneud â dŵr wyneb a gawsom yng Nghymru, ac mae hwnnw'n cyfrannu at ein fframwaith cenedlaethol. Yr ydym yn gobeithio y byddwn yn llwyddo yn ein cais am £30 miliwn o gyllid ychwanegol o'r cronfeydd cydgyfeirio, i hyrwyddo agenda'r Dulliau Gweithredu newydd. Fodd bynnag, gan fod y data ar gael, bydd y rheini'n cynnig canllaw ar gyfer ceisiadau am gyllid ym mhob cylch cyllideb, a gobeithiaf y byddai Aelodau o blaid hynny.

Eleanor Burnham: Croesawaf eich geiriau twymgalon ac adolygiad Pitt. Bûm yn neilltuol o bryderus ynghylch ardal lifogydd Almere a Threfalun, a llwyddais i berswadio Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd i wario swm sylweddol o arian i helpu rhai pobl. Er fy mod yn deall y pwysau ar gyllid a'r pwyslais newydd sydd gennych, yr wyf yn pryderu bod hynny'n lleihau'r gwaith cynnal a chlirio arferol sy'n mynd ymlaen mewn carthffosydd ac ar briffyrdd, a hyd yn oed y gwaith o garthu gwaddod o afonydd. Nid oes gennym ddigon o amser i fanylu, ond gallwn enwi rhai o'r ardaloedd yr wyf yn pryderu yn eu cylch. Yn Nhrefalun yn unig, effeithiwyd yn ddifrifol ar un teulu, gan fod gwaith Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd wedi helpu rhai, ond wedi gadael y teulu arbennig hwn yn agored i niwed. Sut y byddwch yn ateb y cwestiynau anodd hyn, Weinidog, gan nad ydych wedi sicrhau unrhyw gyllid ychwanegol? Mae Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn dweud wrthyf o hyd nad oes ganddi

concerned that, while you have some new momentum, you might be leaving some people even more vulnerable. How do you address these concerns? In terms of the Conwy valley, for instance, there is a delay until April 2009, and several people have been in touch with me about that.

The Presiding Officer: Order. If people have been in touch with Assembly Members, I suggest that approaches should be made directly to the Minister.

Eleanor Burnham: I have already done so; I am reiterating my concern.

The Presiding Officer: This is a statement.

Eleanor Burnham: I am asking questions around my concern, with your leave, Presiding Officer. I shall leave it at that.

Jane Davidson: I return to the fact that the Foresight Future Flooding report in 2004 was the report that set out that the whole of the UK's arrangements should change in the light of global warming and climate change, and should look at taking a risk management approach to tackling flooding issues. We have moved to that new approach. It is not new as of last week, because I announced the new approach formally at the Royal Welsh Show last year. It has been formally supported by all of the agencies as the way forward. There is a huge amount of work going on to ensure that current defences are maintained and assessed for ongoing maintenance, and to look at what other action is needed to tackle these major issues.

I am grateful that, with the exception of a few, Members in general have not focused on flooding issues in their own areas. I am happy, as the Presiding Officer suggests, for you to write to me about any particular flooding issue in your area, Eleanor. I would point out that a number of Members, notably Gareth Jones as the Assembly Member for the Conwy valley area, have been working

ddigon o gyllid. Yr wyf yn pryderu, er eich bod yn cymryd rhai camau newydd, y gallech adael rhai pobl yn fwy agored byth i niwed. Sut y byddwch yn ymateb i'r pryderon hyn? Gyda golwg ar ddyffryn Conwy, er enghraifft, mae oedi tan fis Ebrill 2009, ac mae nifer o bobl wedi cysylltu â mi ynghylch hynny.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Os yw pobl wedi cysylltu ag Aelodau o'r Cynulliad, yr wyf yn awgrymu y dylid cysylltu'n uniongyrchol â'r Gweinidog.

Eleanor Burnham: Yr wyf wedi gwneud hynny eisoes; yr wyf yn ailddatgan y pryderon sydd gennyf.

Y Llywydd: Datganiad yw hwn.

Eleanor Burnham: Yr wyf yn gofyn cwestiynau ynghylch y pryderon sydd gennyf, gyda'ch caniatâd, Lywydd. Fe'i gadawaf ar hynny.

Jane Davidson: Dychwelaf at y ffaith mai'r adroddiad Foresight Future Flooding yn 2004 oedd yr adroddiad a osododd allan y dylai holl drefniadau'r DU newid yng nghydestun cynhesu byd-eang a'r newid yn yr hinsawdd, ac y dylid ystyried delio â materion sy'n ymwneud â llifogydd drwy ddulliau rheoli risg. Yr ydym wedi mabwysiadu'r dull gweithredu newydd hwnnw. Nid yr wythnos diwethaf y digwyddodd hynny, oherwydd cyhoeddais y dull gweithredu newydd yn ffurfiol yn Sioe Frenhinol Cymru y llynedd. Fe'i cefnogwyd yn ffurfiol gan yr holl asiantaethau fel y ffordd ymlaen. Mae llawer iawn o waith yn mynd ymlaen i sicrhau y caiff yr amddiffynfeydd presennol eu cynnal a'u hasesu ar gyfer gwaith cynnal parhaus, ac i ystyried pa gamau eraill y mae angen eu cymryd i ddelio â'r materion pwysig hyn.

Er bod rhai eithriadau, yr wyf yn ddiolchgar nad yw Aelodau at ei gilydd wedi canolbwyntio ar faterion sy'n ymwneud â llifogydd yn eu hardaloedd eu hunain. Yr wyf yn fodlon, fel y mae'r Llywydd yn awgrymu, ichi ysgrifennu ataf ynghylch unrhyw fater penodol sy'n ymwneud â llifogydd yn eich ardal, Eleanor. Byddwn yn nodi bod nifer o Aelodau, a Gareth Jones fel yr Aelod

extremely closely with the Environment Agency and Assembly Government officials in ensuring that the money that has already been designated is spent. *[Interruption.]*

The Presiding Officer: Order. When a Minister is answering questions, she must not be interrupted.

Eleanor Burnham: May I have a point of order?

The Presiding Officer: No, you may not have a point of order on this matter—there is no need.

Eleanor Burnham: I would like your advice on the fact that I am also the Member for the area that the Minister mentioned—

The Presiding Officer: Order. You are the regional Member for north Wales, as we know full well. Thank you, Minister.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd (Rosemary Butler) i'r Gadair am 1.54 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer (Rosemary Butler) took the Chair at 1.54 p.m.*

Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cynaliadwyedd ar Leihau Allyriadau Carbon yn y Cartref

The Sustainability Committee's Report on Household Carbon Reduction

Michael German: I propose that
the National Assembly for Wales:

notes the report of the Sustainability Committee, 'Residential Carbon Reduction in Wales: 1st report of the Sustainability Committee's Inquiry into Carbon Reduction in Wales', which was laid in the Table Office on 13 March 2008. (NDM3937)

I will start by giving the Assembly the background to the report. As we are all aware, climate change is an issue that concerns all of us and, as we experience its effects first hand, it impacts on all our lives. One of the biggest contributors to climate change is the emission of carbon dioxide into the atmosphere. Carbon dioxide emissions

Cynulliad dros ardal dyffryn Conwy yn enwedig, wedi bod yn cydweithio'n agos iawn â swyddogion Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i sicrhau bod yr arian sydd wedi'i ddyrannu eisoes yn cael ei wario. *[Torri ar draws.]*

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Pan fydd Gweinidog yn ateb cwestiynau, ni cheir torri ar ei thraws.

Eleanor Burnham: A gaf godi pwynt o drefn?

Y Llywydd: Na chewch, ni chewch godi pwynt o drefn ar y mater hwn—nid oes angen.

Eleanor Burnham: Hoffwn gael cyngor gennych ynghylch y ffaith fy mod hefyd yn Aelod dros yr ardal y soniodd y Gweinidog amdani—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Chi yw'r Aelod rhanbarthol dros ogledd Cymru, fel y gwyddom yn iawn. Diolch i chi, Weinidog.

Michael German: Cynigiaf fod
Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cynaliadwyedd, 'Lleihau Allyriadau Carbon Preswyl yng Nghymru: Adroddiad Cyntaf ar Ymchwiliad y Pwyllgor Cynaliadwyedd i Leihau Allyriadau Carbon yng Nghymru', a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Mawrth 2008. (NDM3937)

Dechreuaf drwy egluro cyd-destun yr adroddiad i'r Cynulliad. Fel yr ydym i gyd yn gwybod, mae'r newid yn yr hinsawdd yn fater sy'n berthnasol i bob un ohonom ac, wrth inni ddod dan ei effeithiau'n uniongyrchol, mae'n effeithio ar fywyd pob un ohonom. Un o'r pethau sy'n cyfrannu'n fwyaf at y newid yn yr hinsawdd yw allyrru

come from a variety of sources, but everything that we do has an impact on the amount of carbon dioxide that is released into the atmosphere. The Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change's latest report has moved from talking about avoiding dangerous climate change to avoiding abrupt and irreversible climate change, and emphasises that time is running out and that we need to act quickly.

As soon as the Sustainability Committee was established, it was unanimous in its view that its first priority should be to examine how Wales is contributing to the urgently needed task of reducing carbon emissions and contributing to national and international targets. Its terms of reference were to scrutinise the Welsh Assembly Government on its progress in contributing to the UK's carbon reduction targets and its proposals for meeting the 3 per cent per year carbon reduction target for Wales in 'One Wales'. The inquiry that the committee has undertaken is to be split into several parts, each focusing on a different aspect of carbon dioxide reduction. This one, and the report on transport, which is to be debated in the Chamber on 4 June, are the first two topics of inquiry that the committee has undertaken. The committee intends to publish four further reports and then a final report, comprising all six reports, early next year.

I will start with the key findings of the report and outline a few of the main recommendations and then I will move on to Minister's response. The first committee finding was that the residential sector is responsible for around a quarter of carbon dioxide emissions in Wales. Residential carbon dioxide emissions have risen in the UK as a whole by 5 per cent since 1997 and are forecast to continue rising as we buy more electronic devices for our homes. In Wales, a large proportion of our homes, 36 per cent—more than a third—are in the category that we call 'hard to heat'. They are hard-to-heat homes because they are old, they have solid walls and they are not on the mains gas network and therefore they are

carbon deuocsid i'r atmosffer. Mae allyriadau carbon deuocsid yn dod o amryw o ffynonellau, ond mae popeth yr ydym yn ei wneud yn effeithio ar faint y carbon deuocsid a ryddheir i'r awyr. Mae adroddiad diweddaraf y Panel Rhynglywodraethol ar y Newid yn yr Hinsawdd wedi rhoi'r gorau i sôn am osgoi newid peryglus yn yr hinsawdd ac yn sôn am osgoi newid sydyn a diwrthdro yn yr hinsawdd, ac mae'n pwysleisio bod amser yn prinhau a bod angen inni weithredu'n gyflym.

Cyn gynted ag y sefydlwyd y Pwyllgor Cynaliadwyedd, yr oedd yn unfryd mai'r hyn y dylai ei wneud yn gyntaf oedd edrych ar y modd y mae Cymru'n cyfrannu at y gwaith y mae taer angen amdano i leihau allyriadau carbon a chyfrannu at gyrraedd targedau cenedlaethol a rhyngwladol. Ei gylch gwaith oedd craffu ar waith Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o ran ei chynnydd ar gyfrannu at gyrraedd targedau'r DU ar gyfer lleihau carbon ac ar ei chynigion ar gyfer cyrraedd y targed i Gymru o leihau carbon 3 y cant y flwyddyn sydd yn 'Cymru'n Un'. Bydd ymchwiliad y pwyllgor yn cael ei rannu'n nifer o feysydd, a phob un yn canolbwyntio ar wahanol agwedd ar leihau carbon deuocsid. Yr adroddiad hwn, a'r un am drafnidiaeth, y ceir dadl arno yn y Siambr ar 4 Mehefin, yw'r ddau destun ymchwil cyntaf y mae'r pwyllgor wedi ymgymryd â hwy. Mae'r pwyllgor yn bwriadu cyhoeddi pedwar adroddiad pellach ac wedyn adroddiad terfynol, a fydd yn cynnwys pob un o'r chwe adroddiad, ddechrau'r flwyddyn nesaf.

Dechreuaf â phrif ganfyddiadau'r adroddiad ac amlinellu ychydig o'r prif argymhellion ac wedyn symud ymlaen at ymateb y Gweinidog. Canfyddiad cyntaf y pwyllgor oedd bod y sector preswyl yn gyfrifol am oddeutu chwarter yr allyriadau carbon deuocsid yng Nghymru. Mae allyriadau carbon deuocsid y sector preswyl wedi codi 5 y cant yn y DU gyfan er 1997 a rhagwelir y byddant yn dal i godi wrth inni brynu mwy o declynnau electronig i'n cartrefi. Yng Nghymru, mae cyfran fawr o'n cartrefi, 36 y cant—mwy nag un rhan o dair—mewn categori a alwn yn 'anodd eu gwresogi'. Maent yn gartrefi anodd eu gwresogi am eu bod yn hen, am fod eu waliau'n solet ac am nad ydynt yn cael nwy o'r prif gyflenwad, ac

hard to insulate and use electricity for heating.

The committee took evidence from around Wales, from the United Kingdom and also from Europe, not only in terms of views about how we are doing in Wales, but also in terms of good practice that has already developed elsewhere. The vast majority of witnesses to the committee said that the residential sector is an area where we already have the majority of powers needed to dramatically reduce carbon dioxide emissions, but that they are not being used effectively. The report and its recommendations concentrate on how the Welsh Assembly Government can use the powers it already has, rather than recommending a large range of new ones.

We have taken a novel approach to recommendations. The report outlines six headline recommendations that the committee thinks will have the most impact on carbon reduction and added an estimate of how much carbon could potentially be saved by each one. There are then a further 20 recommendations in the areas of new buildings, existing buildings, behavioural change and targets.

All of the committee's findings and recommendations are strongly evidence based. All of the evidence emphasised the importance of leadership in driving through change and supporting those delivering it. There were calls from several witnesses for the Welsh Assembly Government to show a strong lead in, and a commitment to, reducing carbon dioxide emissions and to support those tasked with achieving those reductions, especially local authorities. We heard evidence of good practice from several witnesses, including the London Borough of Merton Council and Woking Borough Council, and about the effectiveness of radical planning solutions to deliver not only low-carbon developments, but affordable housing. We consider it important that all new buildings in Wales be built to standards that mean that they will use much less fossil fuel energy in their construction and to heat and light them. That means not only having more stringent building standards but

felly mae'n anodd eu hinsiwleiddio a byddant yn defnyddio trydan i'w gwresogi.

Cymerodd y pwyllgor dystiolaeth o gwmpas Cymru, o'r Deyrnas Unedig a hefyd o Ewrop, nid yn unig ar ffurf barn am y modd yr ydym yn ymwneud â hyn yng Nghymru, ond hefyd am arferion da sydd eisoes wedi'u datblygu mewn mannau eraill. Dywedodd y mwyafrif helaeth o dystion y pwyllgor fod y sector preswyl yn faes lle'r ydym eisoes yn meddu ar y rhan fwyaf o'r pwerau y mae arnom eu hangen i leihau allyriadau carbon deuocsid yn sylweddol, ond nad ydynt yn cael eu defnyddio'n effeithiol. Mae'r adroddiad a'r argymhellion sydd ynddo'n ymdrin yn bennaf â'r modd y gall Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ddefnyddio'r pwerau sydd ganddi eisoes, yn hytrach nag argymhell nifer mawr o rai newydd.

Yr ydym wedi defnyddio dull newydd wrth gynnig argymhellion. Mae'r adroddiad yn amlinellu chwe phrif argymhelliad y mae'r pwyllgor yn credu y byddant yn cael yr effaith fwyaf o ran lleihau carbon ac wedi ychwanegu amcangyfrif o faint y carbon y gellid ei arbed drwy bob un. Wedyn mae 20 o argymhellion pellach ym meysydd adeiladau newydd, adeiladau presennol, newid ymddygiad a thargedau.

Mae holl ganfyddiadau ac argymhellion y pwyllgor wedi'u seilio'n gadarn ar dystiolaeth. Pwysleisiwyd yn yr holl dystiolaeth mor bwysig oedd arweinyddiaeth o ran creu newid a chefnogi'r rheini sy'n ei sicrhau. Yr oedd galwadau gan nifer o dystion am i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru roi arweiniad cadarn a dangos ymrwymiad o ran lleihau allyriadau carbon deuocsid a chefnogi'r rheini yr ymddiriedwyd iddynt y gwaith o sicrhau'r gostyngiadau hynny, yn enwedig awdurdodau lleol. Clywsom dystiolaeth am arferion da gan nifer o dystion, gan gynnwys Cyngor Bwrdeistref Merton yn Llundain a Chyngor Bwrdeistref Woking, ac am effeithiolrwydd atebion radical ym maes cynllunio i sicrhau nid yn unig ddatblygiadau sy'n arbed carbon, ond tai fforddiadwy. Credwn ei bod yn bwysig i bob adeilad newydd yng Nghymru gael ei adeiladu'n unol â safonau a fydd yn golygu y defnyddir llai o lawer o ynni o danwyddau ffosil wrth eu hadeiladu ac i'w gwresogi a'u

householders making more use of microgeneration and renewable energy.

goleuo. Mae hynny'n golygu nid yn unig cael safonau adeiladu mwy llym ond i ddeiliaid tai hefyd ddefnyddio mwy ar ficrogynhyrchu ac ynni adnewyddadwy.

2.00 p.m.

The committee is concerned that the main source of residential carbon dioxide emissions is existing buildings. While many carbon reduction initiatives have concentrated on new buildings, around two thirds of the housing stock that will be standing in Wales in 2050 is likely to have been built before 2005 and, therefore, will be less energy efficient. Re-cladding and refurbishing older properties can dramatically increase their carbon efficiency. Money is already being put into re-cladding older properties as part of the area renewal schemes, but if thermal insulation is included in such schemes, the costs can be reduced and greater benefits in the reduction of fuel bills can be passed on to residents. We urgently need to address this problem and to help and encourage the retrofitting of older buildings, so that they achieve greater energy efficiency.

Mae'r pwyllgor yn poeni mai prif ffynhonnell allyriadau carbon deuocsid o adeiladau preswyl yw'r adeiladau sydd gennym eisoes. Er bod llawer o gynlluniau i ostwng lefelau carbon wedi canolbwyntio ar adeiladau newydd, mae oddeutu dwy ran o dair o'r stoc tai a fydd yn sefyll yng Nghymru yn 2050 yn debygol o fod wedi'u hadeiladu cyn 2005, ac felly, byddant yn defnyddio ynni'n llai effeithlon. Gall rhoi cladin newydd ar eiddo hŷn a'u hadnewyddu eu gwneud yn llawer mwy effeithlon o ran carbon. Mae arian eisoes yn cael ei wario ar roi cladin newydd ar eiddo hŷn fel rhan o'r cynlluniau adnewyddu ardal, ond o gynnwys insiwleiddio thermol mewn cynlluniau o'r fath, gellir lleihau costau a throsglwyddo mwy o fanteision i'r trigolion ar ffurf biliau tanwydd llai. Mae angen inni fynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon ar frys a helpu ôl-addasu adeiladau hŷn ac annog hynny, er mwyn iddynt ddefnyddio ynni'n fwy effeithlon.

A recurring theme in the evidence that we were given was the lack of up-to-date, consistent and easily accessible information for householders about how to reduce energy consumption and the benefits of doing so. The one-stop-shop approach, such as that which committee members saw in Austria, makes a huge contribution to encouraging and informing householders and organisations about ways to reduce their carbon emissions.

Thema a gododd dro ar ôl tro yn y dystiolaeth a gawsom oedd diffyg gwybodaeth ddiweddar, gyson a hawdd ei chael i ddeiliaid tai ynglŷn â'r ffordd i ddefnyddio llai o ynni a manteision gwneud hynny. Mae'r dull siop-un-stop, megis hwnnw a welodd aelodau'r pwyllgor yn Awstria, yn cyfrannu'n aruthrol at annog deiliaid tai a sefydliadau i leihau eu hallyriadau carbon a dweud wrthynt sut mae gwneud hynny.

A key finding of the committee was that there is a shortage of skills and knowledge among planners and the building profession on the benefits of, and techniques available for, achieving low-carbon homes. Professional development, advice and information exchange need to be made available to them.

Un o'r pethau allweddol a ddarganfu'r pwyllgor oedd bod prinder sgiliau a gwybodaeth ymhlith cynllunwyr a'r proffesiwn adeiladu am fanteision cartrefi carbon-isel a'r technegau sydd ar gael i sicrhau cartrefi o'r fath. Mae angen sicrhau eu bod yn gallu cael datblygu proffesiynol, cyngor a chyfnewid gwybodaeth.

The ways in which carbon emissions are measured and recorded by local authorities are not well established and certainly not uniform. There is an urgent need to develop

Nid yw'r ffyrdd a ddefnyddir gan awdurdodau i fesur a chofnodi allyriadau carbon wedi bwrw gwreiddiau, ac yn sicr nid ydynt yn unffurf. Mae angen datblygu dulliau

robust ways of establishing a baseline figure against which carbon reduction can be measured along with consistent ways of monitoring and reporting progress.

There is also an urgent need to bring about behavioural change in Wales to encourage everyone to adopt lower-carbon lifestyles. The benefits of reducing energy consumption by having more energy-efficient homes, using renewable energy sources and reducing the energy consumption of appliances will not only have carbon reduction benefits but will also result in reduced energy bills for householders.

The issue of feed-in tariffs is important to encourage more uptake of microgeneration and renewable energy production at the local scale. Surplus energy being produced by renewable technology used by individual householders or area heating schemes should be fed back into the grid, and those producing it should get a market rate for that energy. In Austria, the committee saw a simple two-meter system for each household. One meter measured the amount of energy being put into the grid by the property and the other the amount taken out. The householder was billed on the difference by the energy company at the end of each month. Many people perceive the payback time on renewable energy as too long to justify the initial expenditure on solar panels or photovoltaic or wind energy installations. Feed-in tariffs would help to reduce the payback time and make the use of renewable technologies more attractive.

I welcome the steps that the Minister has taken to move the agenda forward, such as establishing the Climate Change Commission, and the committee looks forward to the Government's detailed plans on how it will achieve its 'One Wales' 3 per cent target. We welcome the positive tone of the Minister's response to the committee report and we welcome the fact that she has accepted 24 of the 26 recommendations, either in full, in part or in principle. However, we are disappointed that she has rejected the

cadarn yn ddi-oed i sefydlu ffigur llinell sylfaen er mwyn mesur i ba raddau y mae carbon yn gostwng ynghyd â dulliau cyson o fonitro a chofnodi cynnydd.

Hefyd, mae angen newid ymddygiad yng Nghymru yn ddiymdroi ac annog pawb i fabwysiadu ffordd o fyw sy'n cynyrchu llai o garbon. Drwy ddefnyddio llai o ynni, drwy gael cartrefi sy'n defnyddio ynni'n fwy effeithlon, drwy ddefnyddio ffynonellau ynni adnewyddadwy ac offer sy'n defnyddio ynni'n fwy darbodus, nid yn unig bydd yn lleihau'r carbon a ryddheir ond bydd biliau ynni deiliaid tai yn is hefyd.

Mae tariffiau bwydo-i'r-grid yn bwysig er mwyn annog mwy o bobl i fanteisio ar ficrogynhyrchu a chynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy ar raddfa leol. Dylid bwydo yn ôl i'r grid unrhyw ynni dros ben a gynhyrchir gan ddeiliaid tai unigol neu gan gynlluniau cynhesu ardal drwy gyfrwng technoleg adnewyddadwy, a dylai'r sawl sy'n ei gynhyrchu gael pris y farchnad am yr ynni hwnnw. Yn Awstria, gwelodd y pwyllgor system syml o ddau fesurydd gyfer pob aelwyd. Yr oedd y naill fesurydd yn mesur faint o ynni yr oedd yr eiddo'n ei gyfrannu at y grid a'r llall yn dangos faint a ddefnyddiwyd. Byddai'r cwmni ynni'n anfon bil am y gwahaniaeth at ddeiliad y tŷ ar ddiwedd bob mis. Mae llawer o bobl yn meddwl nad oes modd cael eich arian yn ôl yn ddigon cyflym i gyfiawnhau'r gwariant cychwynnol ar baneli solar neu offer ffotofoltaidd neu ynni'r gwynt wrth fuddsoddi mewn ynni adnewyddadwy. Byddai tariffiau bwydo-i'r-grid yn gymorth i gwtogi'r cyfnod talu'n ôl ac yn gwneud defnyddio technolegau adnewyddadwy yn fwy deniadol.

Rwy'n croesawu'r camau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cymryd i symud yr agenda yn ei blaen, megis sefydlu'r Comisiwn Newid yn yr Hinsawdd, ac mae'r pwyllgor yn edrych ymlaen at gynlluniau manwl y Llywodraeth ynglŷn â sut y bydd yn gwireddu ei tharged 3 y cant yn 'Cymru'n Un'. Yr ydym yn croesawu ysbryd cadarnhaol ymateb y Gweinidog i adroddiad y pwyllgor ac yn croesawu'r ffaith ei bod wedi derbyn 24 o'r 26 argymhelliad, naill ai'n llawn, yn rhannol neu o ran egwyddor. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym

two key recommendations that we thought would make a significant contribution to reducing carbon emissions from homes in Wales. I look forward to hearing what the Minister has to say about this later in the debate.

Finally, I thank the committee on behalf of Mick Bates, who I understand is recovering well and has taken heart from the messages of goodwill passed on to him; he is already asking questions about the committee and how it is progressing, so look forward to continual missives via e-mail. I thank the committee for its consensual approach to reaching decisions. I thank everyone who gave evidence to the committee for their openness and honesty and for sharing their ideas. We are not looking for quick fixes in our recommendations and we recognise that it will take time. However, if we are all committed to tackling climate change, we must bite that bullet.

To finish, I will give you a quote from Mick:

‘The Committee will probably not come up with all the answers but I hope that, at the end of our work, we will be nearer to knowing what actions all of us in Wales have to take to do our bit to leave a planet fit for our children’s children, after all, our future is not a gift but a reward for what we do now.’

The Minister for Environment, Sustainability and Housing (Jane Davidson): I would like to start by paying tribute to Mick Bates as Chair of the committee, and I encourage him to hop back into the Chamber as quickly as he can. I am grateful for Mike German’s introduction, but I do not think that we could have a more committed Chair than Mick Bates in terms of driving this particular agenda forward. I am sure that you will take our best wishes back to him, Mike.

I will respond to a couple of the challenges that you put to me in your contribution. We are keen to be seen as a strong leader in this agenda. Headline recommendations 1 and 2 are about using planning policy, and we are determined to use our planning policy and

yn siomedig iddi wrthod y ddau argymhelliad allweddol a fyddai, yn ein barn ni, yn cyfrannu’n sylweddol at leihau allyriadau carbon cartrefi yng Nghymru. Edrychaf ymlaen at glywed yr hyn sydd gan y Gweinidog i’w ddweud am hyn yn ddiweddarach yn y ddadl.

Yn olaf, diolchaf i’r pwyllgor ar ran Mick Bates sydd, fel y deallaf, yn gwella’n dda ac wedi’i galonogi gan y dymuniadau da a anfonwyd ato; mae eisoes yn holi am y pwyllgor a sut mae pethau’n mynd, felly edrychwch ymlaen at ohebiaeth ddi-dor dros yr e-bost. Diolch i’r pwyllgor am ei agwedd gonsensws at benderfynu. Diolch i bawb a roddodd dystiolaeth i’r pwyllgor am fod yn agored ac yn onest ac am rannu eu syniadau. Nid ydym yn chwilio am atebion rhwydd yn ein hargymhellion a sylweddolwn y bydd angen amser. Fodd bynnag, os ydym i gyd yn benderfynol o fynd i’r afael â newid yn yr hinsawdd, rhaid inni fynd â’r maen hwnnw i’r wal.

I orffen, dyma ddyfyniad gan Mick:

Go brin y bydd y Pwyllgor yn gallu cynnig yr atebion i gyd, ond gobeithio, pan ddaw ein gwaith i ben, y byddwn yn nes at wybod pa gamau y mae’n rhaid i bob un ohonom yng Nghymru eu cymryd i wneud ein rhan i adael planed sy’n deilwng i blant ein plant. Wedi’r cyfan, nid rhodd yw ein dyfodol ond gwobr am yr hyn a wnawn yn awr.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynaliadwyedd a Thai (Jane Davidson): Hoffwn ddechrau drwy roi teyrnged i Mick Bates fel Cadeirydd y pwyllgor ac fe’i hanogaf i hercian yn ôl i’r Siambr cyn gynted ag y gall. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am gyflwyniad Mike German, ond ni chredaf y gallem gael Cadeirydd mwy ymroddedig na Mick Bates o ran gyrru’r agenda arbennig hon yn ei blaen. Yr wyf yn siŵr y rhowch ein dymuniadau gorau iddo, Mike.

Ymatebaf i ychydig o’r heriau a roesoch imi yn eich cyfraniad. Yr ydym yn awyddus i gael ein gweld yn arweinydd cadarn yn yr agenda hon. Mae prif argymhellion 1 a 2 yn ymwneud â defnyddio polisi cynllunio, ac yr ydym yn benderfynol o ddefnyddio ein polisi

guidance. We are currently considering whether we should require a minimum production of renewable energy and/or a minimum reduction in carbon emissions for new buildings and developments via the planning system. I can therefore assure all Members, as I have already assured the Sustainability Committee, that we are considering the arguments for putting—at the least—a Merton-type rule in place. However, I am trying to look at a Merton-plus option, in a sense, so that we can pick up both the production and the reduction issues.

I am happy to accept the recommendation on the devolution of building regulations, because, of course, we have been leading on that for some time, and I am also happy to say that discussions on this issue are going well. I am also happy to accept the recommendation on the code for sustainable homes. I signalled our intention to adopt the code last year. I confirmed last month—to Mick Bates's pleasure—that we had not only adopted the code, but that I had formally announced it.

It is important to say why the Government felt that it had to reject recommendation 5 on the funding programme to retrofit all existing hard-to-heat homes so that they meet one of the agreed levels in the code for sustainable homes. We fully support the spirit behind it, but there must be a balance between helping householders who are able to pay and those who are effectively in fuel poverty. This Government feels that our emphasis must be on those in fuel poverty. It is important to say that the code has not been designed as a standard for existing homes and that, therefore, it is not the appropriate standard to read across directly. However, tackling hard-to-heat homes is an area that we will be looking at closely in the context of the national energy efficiency and savings plan. That will include the consideration of the effectiveness of existing support programmes and the scope to do more.

a'n canllawiau cynllunio. Yr ydym ar hyn o bryd yn ystyried a ddylem bennu safon ofynnol ar gyfer cynhyrchu hyn a hyn o ynni adnewyddadwy a/neu safon ofynnol ar gyfer lleihau allyriadau carbon o adeiladau a datblygiadau newydd drwy gyfrwng y system gynllunio. Gallaf felly sicrhau'r holl Aelodau, fel yr wyf eisoes wedi sicrhau'r Pwyllgor Cynaliadwyedd, ein bod yn ystyried y dadleuon o blaid sefydlu rheol debyg i reol Merton, fan lleiaf. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn ceisio edrych ar y dewis Merton-amwy, os caf ei roi felly, er mwyn inni roi sylw i'r agwedd gynhyrchu a'r agwedd gostwng allyriadau.

Yr wyf yn falch derbyn yr argymhelliad ynglŷn â datganoli rheoliadau adeiladu, oherwydd, wrth gwrs, yr ydym wedi bod yn arwain yn hynny ers tro, ac yr wyf hefyd yn falch dweud bod y trafodaethau ynglŷn â'r mater hwn yn mynd rhagddynt yn dda. Yr wyf hefyd yn falch derbyn yr argymhelliad ynglŷn â'r cod ar gyfer cartrefi cynaliadwy. Awgrymais ein bod yn bwriadu mabwysiadu'r cod y llynedd. Cadarnheais fis diwethaf—er mawr foddhad i Mick Bates—ein bod nid yn unig wedi mabwysiadu'r cod, ond fy mod wedi ei gyhoeddi'n ffurfiol.

Mae'n bwysig dweud pam mae'r Llywodraeth yn teimlo ei bod yn rhaid iddi wrthod argymhelliad 5 ynglŷn â'r rhaglen ariannu i ôl-addasu'r holl gartrefi anodd eu cynhesu sydd gennym eisoes, er mwyn iddynt gydymffurfio ag un o'r lefelau y cytunwyd arnynt yn y cod ar gyfer cartrefi cynaliadwy. Yr ydym yn llwyr gefnogi ysbryd yr argymhelliad, ond rhaid cadw'r ddesgl yn wastaf rhwng cynorthwyo deiliaid tai sy'n gallu talu a'r rheini sydd mewn gwirionedd yn dlawd o ran tanwydd. Teimla'r Llywodraeth hon ei bod yn rhaid inni roi'r pwyslais ar y tlawd o ran tanwydd. Mae'n bwysig dweud na fwriedid i'r cod fod yn safon ar gyfer cartrefi sydd gennym eisoes, ac felly nid hon yw'r safon briodol i'w throsglwyddo'n uniongyrchol. Fodd bynnag, mae mynd i'r afael â chartrefi sy'n anodd eu cynhesu yn faes y byddwn yn edrych yn ofalus arno yng nghyd-destun y cynllun cenedlaethol effeithlonrwydd ynni a chynilo. Bydd hynny'n cynnwys ystyried effeithiolrwydd y rhaglenni cymorth sydd ar gael eisoes a'r cyfle i wneud rhagor.

On headline recommendation 6 on additional grants for microgeneration, there would be clear and significant financial implications for the Assembly Government if we were to offer grants that were additional to the low-carbon building programme. As everyone in the field has said to me, it must be about adding value in improving the energy efficiency of existing stock. The energy efficiency issues must come first. We know that many homes in Wales are suitable for, but do not have, conventional energy efficiency measures. Measures such as loft and cavity wall insulation are the most cost-effective for improving energy efficiency and reducing carbon emissions. However, I am exploring the possibility of offering additional incentives to low-income households whose properties have already reached their energy efficiency potential to use microgeneration. Therefore, I hope that Members will be able to support that. We also want to look at what we can do with convergence funding.

2.10 p.m.

Recommendations 13 to 14 pick up on the skills issue that you raised. You were quite right to highlight that. I am discussing these issues with John Griffiths. They relate to the engagement with private developers in the social housing sector on zero-carbon house building techniques and we have a well-publicised aspiration in terms of achieving zero-carbon new builds from 2011. I have commissioned Sustainable Development Commission Wales to identify the key policy interventions that are needed to support that zero-carbon building and the contribution that the built environment can make to the 'One Wales' 3 per cent annual emissions reduction target, and part of that will include the skills issue. I am calling it the coalition of the willing because it is for all of those who really want to see this agenda move forward.

In closing, it is important to say that, with regards to recommendation 21, where you say that you want us to continue to fund the sustainable energy network, we have put

O ran prif argymhelliad 6 ynglŷn â grantiau ychwanegol ar gyfer microgynhyrchu, byddai goblygiadau ariannol clir a sylweddol i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad petaem yn cynnig grantiau ar ben y rhaglen adeiladu carbon-isel. Fel y mae pawb yn y maes wedi'i ddweud wrthyf, mae'n rhaid i hyn olygu ychwanegu gwerth wrth wella effeithlonrwydd ynni'r stoc bresennol. Rhaid i'r materion sy'n ymwneud â defnyddio ynni'n effeithlon ddod yn gyntaf. Gwyddom fod llawer o gartrefi yng Nghymru'n addas ar gyfer camau effeithlonrwydd ynni confensiynol, ond bod y camau hynny heb eu cymryd. Camau megis insiwleiddio'r atig a waliau ceudod yw'r ffyrdd mwyaf cost-effeithiol i wneud cartrefi'n fwy effeithiol o ran ynni ac i leihau allyriadau carbon. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn ystyried posiblirwydd cynnig cymhelliant ychwanegol i gartrefi isel eu hincwm sydd â'u heiddo eisoes wedi cyrraedd eu potensial o ran effeithlonrwydd ynni, i ddefnyddio microgynhyrchu. Felly, gobeithio y bydd modd i'r Aelodau gefnogi hynny. Yr ydym hefyd am edrych ar yr hyn y gallwn ei wneud gydag arian cydgyfeirio.

Mae argymhellion 13 i 14 yn cyfeirio at y mater sgiliau a godwyd gennych. Yr oeddech yn llygad eich lle'n pwysleisio hynny. Yr wyf yn trafod y materion hyn gyda John Griffiths. Maent yn ymwneud ag ymgysylltu â datblygwyr preifat yn y sector tai cymdeithasol ynglŷn â thechnegau adeiladu tai di-garbon, ac yr ydym wedi rhoi cryn gyhoeddusrwydd i'r ffaith ein bod yn awyddus i sicrhau bod adeiladau newydd yn ddi-garbon o 2011 ymlaen. Yr wyf wedi comisiynu Comisiwn Datblygu Cynaliadwy Cymru i weld pa ymyriadau polisi allweddol y mae eu hangen i gefnogi'r adeiladu di-garbon hwnnw, a'r cyfraniad y gall yr amgylchedd adeiledig ei wneud at y targed blynyddol o 3 y cant o yn 'Cymru'n Un' i ostnwg allyriannau a bydd sgiliau'n rhan o hynny. Yr wyf yn ei galw'n glymblaid y bodlon, oherwydd bydd hon i bawb sydd yn wir am weld yr agenda hon yn mynd rhagddi.

Wrth gloi, mae'n bwysig dweud, gyda golwg ar argymhelliad 21, lle'r ydych yn dweud eich bod am inni barhau i ariannu'r rhwydwaith ynni cynaliadwy, ein bod wedi

additional funding into that as an Assembly Government, and I am grateful that your committee has welcomed that. However, you ask that that network should be expanded and enhanced to encompass all of those organisations providing advice, including the Carbon Trust, into a one-stop shop. The majority of funding for the Energy Savings Trust comes from the UK Government, and its focus is on households, communities and micro-businesses, which is where I think that its focus needs to be. In fact, it is moving over into the fields of water and waste, and, therefore, it will be able to provide a one-stop shop in due course on energy, water and waste to households and communities and micro-businesses. That is a different function from the detailed advice that the Carbon Trust provides to big businesses, particularly in the context of the European Union emissions trading schemes, the carbon reduction commitments, and others. That is why we have rejected that recommendation. We want to bring all of these issues together in the context of householders, communities and micro-businesses. We all have the same intent, which is to ensure that everyone is well informed and is encouraged to access any grants available.

Darren Millar: I am grateful for the opportunity to participate in this debate. From the outset, I would like to make clear my support for all of the report's recommendations. Before I go any further, I would also like to take the opportunity to thank the committee clerks for their support in drawing up the report. I know that I speak for all of the members of the Sustainability Committee in saying that their efforts have been very much appreciated.

The conclusions in the report are all evidence based—and I know that the Minister appreciates an evidence base when arriving at conclusions. We went through a robust process of gathering the evidence in order to make those recommendations, and the report is a good example of cross-party work; there is a great deal of consensus around the recommendations. That is why I am pleased to see that the Minister, on the whole, has

rhoi arian ychwanegol i hwnnw fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar bod eich pwyllgor wedi croesawu hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych yn gofyn am ehangu'r rhwydwaith hwnnw a'i gryfhau i gynnwys yr holl gyrff hynny sy'n cynnig cyngor, gan gynnwys yr Ymddiriedolaeth Garbon, a chreu siop-un-stop. Daw'r rhan fwyaf o'r arian ar gyfer yr Ymddiriedolaeth Arbed Ynni gan Lywodraeth y DU, ac mae'n canolbwyntio ar aelwydydd, ar gymunedau ac ar ficrofusnesau, sef y pethau y dylai fod yn canolbwyntio arnynt, yn fy marn i. A dweud y gwir, mae'n symud i mewn i feysydd dŵr a gwastraff, ac felly bydd modd iddo ddarparu siop-un-stop maes o law ar gyfer ynni, dŵr a gwastraff i aelwydydd a chymunedau a microfusnesau. Mae'r swyddogaeth honno'n wahanol i'r cyngor manwl y mae'r Ymddiriedolaeth Garbon yn ei roi i fusnesau mawr, yn enwedig yng nghyd-destun cynlluniau masnachu allyriadau'r Undeb Ewropeaidd, ymrwymadau lleihau carbon, ac eraill. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi gwrthod yr argymhellad hwnnw. Yr ydym am ddwyn y materion hyn i gyd at ei gilydd yng nghyd-destun deiliaid tai, cymunedau a microfusnesau. Yr un bwriad sydd gennym i gyd, sef sicrhau bod pawb yn cael gwybodaeth a'u bod yn cael eu hannog i fanteisio ar unrhyw grantiau sydd ar gael.

Darren Millar: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle i gyfrannu at y ddadl hon. O'r cychwyn, hoffwn ei gwneud yn glir fy mod yn cefnogi holl argymhellion yr adroddiad. Cyn imi fynd ymhellach, hoffwn fanteisio ar y cyfle hefyd i ddiolch i glercod y pwyllgor am eu cymorth wrth lunio'r adroddiad. Gwn fy mod yn siarad ar ran holl aelodau'r Pwyllgor Cynaliadwyedd wrth ddweud ein bod wedi gwerthfawrogi eu hymdrechion yn fawr.

Mae casgliadau'r adroddiad i gyd wedi'u seilio ar dystiolaeth—a gwn fod y Gweinidog yn gwerthfawrogi sylfaen dystiolaeth wrth lunio casgliadau. Dilynwyd proses gadarn o gasglu tystiolaeth er mwyn llunio'r argymhellion hynny, ac mae'r adroddiad yn enghraifft dda o waith trawsbleidiol; mae llawer iawn o gonsensws ynglŷn â'r argymhellion. Dyna pam yr wyf yn falch gweld bod y Gweinidog, ar y cyfan, wedi

responded positively to the majority of the recommendations—albeit in a roundabout way with some of them—and has given a general acceptance to most of the proposed action points.

It is a shame that the Minister has chosen to reject a couple of the recommendations, one of which was recommendation 5, one of our headline recommendations, regarding the funding of a programme to retrofit all existing hard-to-heat homes. The committee made it clear that the implementation of this recommendation could result in a huge annual carbon reduction of about 98,000 tonnes per year if implemented between 2008 and 2017. In her written response to the committee on our report, the Minister seemed to indicate that, because the home energy efficiency scheme exists, there is already something similar in place and that the recommendation was already being fulfilled. While I recognise that HEES has a part to play—there is no doubt about that—its eligibility criteria is not sufficiently wide to suggest that it is fulfilling, in any way, the recommendation that was made.

I take on board the Minister's earlier comments about looking at opportunities for microgeneration schemes to be encouraged, perhaps in conjunction with HEES—although I am not sure how it will fit in—but it is a bit rich to sell the merits of HEES while cutting, in real terms, the funding over the next three years.

The Minister knows full well that that scheme is oversubscribed, with an ever-increasing waiting list. She knows that it can make a contribution towards cutting carbon dioxide emissions—and that it is making a contribution—and yet she allows the funding to be cut. It does not quite add up.

Headline recommendation 3, which the Minister talked about, concerns building regulations being devolved to the Welsh Assembly Government. I know that this is a matter that the Minister is seeking to progress, but I must ask how long we must wait before we see this 'One Wales' commitment fully realised. In the report, the

ymateb yn gadarnhaol i'r rhan fwyaf ohonynt—er iddi wneud hynny mewn ffordd gwmpasog gydag ambell un—a'i bod wedi derbyn yn gyffredinol y rhan fwyaf o'r pwyntiau gweithredu a gynigiwyd.

Mae'n drueni bod y Gweinidog wedi dewis gwrthod ambell un o'r argymhellion. Un o'r rheini oedd argymhelliad 5, un o'n prif argymhellion, ynglŷn ag ariannu rhaglen i ôl-addasu'r holl gartrefi anodd eu cynhesu sydd gennym. Gwnaeth y pwyllgor hi'n glir y gallai rhoi'r argymhelliad hwn ar waith rhwng 2008 a 2017 olygu gostyngiad blynyddol anferth yn y carbon a ryddheir, gostyngiad o oddeutu 98,000 tonnelli y flwyddyn. Yn ei hymateb ysgrifenedig i'r pwyllgor ynglŷn â'n hadroddiad, yr oedd y Gweinidog, i bob golwg, yn awgrymu, oherwydd bod y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref ar gael, bod rhywbeth tebyg ar gael eisoes a bod yr argymhelliad eisoes yn cael ei roi ar waith. Er fy mod yn sylweddoli bod gan HEES ran i'w chwarae—nid oes amheuaeth am hynny—nid yw ei feini prawf cymhwysedd yn ddigon eang i awgrymu ei fod mewn unrhyw ffordd yn cyflawni'r hyn sydd yn yr argymhelliad.

Derbyniaf sylwadau cynharach y Gweinidog ynglŷn â chwilio am gyfleoedd i annog cynlluniau microgynhrychu, ar y cyd â HEES efallai—er nad wyf yn siŵr sut y bydd y ddau'n cydweddu—ond mae gennych dipyn o wyneb yn ceisio gwerthu rhagoriaethau HEES a chithau ar yr un pryd, mewn termau real, yn tocio'i arian dros y tair blynedd nesaf.

Gŵyr y Gweinidog yn iawn fod gormod o geisiadau yn dod i law o dan y cynllun hwnnw, a bod y rhestr aros yn cynyddu'n barhaus. Gŵyr y gall gyfrannu at leihau allyriadau carbon deuocsid—a'i fod yn gwneud cyfraniad—ac eto mae'n caniatáu lleihau'r cyllid. Nid yw'n gwneud synnwyr.

Mae a wnelo prif argymhelliad 3, y siaradodd y Gweinidog amdano, â datganoli'r rheoliadau adeiladu i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Gwn fod hwn yn fater y mae'r Gweinidog yn ceisio ei symud ymlaen, ond rhaid imi ofyn pa mor hir y mae'n rhaid inni aros cyn y gwelwn yr ymrwymiad hwn yn 'Cymru'n Un' yn cael ei wireddu'n llawn. Yn

estimate was that this measure alone could result in an annual carbon reduction of just under 16,000 tonnes a year, from 2011 onwards. However, your Westminster colleagues, Minister, appear to be standing in the way.

It is now clear that the aspiration for zero-carbon new developments by 2011 will not be met. You will simply not get building regulations devolved in time or be allowed to tweak the regulations sufficiently to accommodate it. It is about time that hands were held up and that we heard an admission that that target will not be met. However, in the interim, it is vital that your existing powers to give guidance to local authorities are used. I am pleased that you are looking at introducing a Merton plus-type rule here in Wales.

With regard to recommendation 20, which deals with informing people about the benefits of reducing energy consumption, as we know, information and knowledge can empower people to make a difference where it actually matters. One thing that we did not pull out specifically in the report, but which is very important, is that we gathered evidence from the Energy Saving Trust about the need to improve education in schools to trigger people to take action. I would like to hear more about that in future.

Finally, paragraph 5.11 makes reference to the woefully inadequate implementation of the Home Energy Conservation Act 1995 by local authorities in Wales. I appreciate that the Welsh Assembly Government has acknowledged that, in this respect, local authorities have been poor. However, the policing on the part of the Welsh Assembly Government has also been poor, and, if local authorities are to take their role seriously in this respect, it is crucial that there is better policing in future.

Leanne Wood: Most people now understand the serious threat that has resulted from our excessive consumption and the resultant excessive emissions. Our homes are responsible for 27 per cent of our carbon

yr adroddiad, yr amcangyfrif oedd y gallai'r mesur hwn yn unig arwain at ostyngiad blynyddol mewn carbon o ychydig llai na 16,000 tonnall y flwyddyn, o 2011 ymlaen. Fodd bynnag, mae'n ymddangos, Weinidog, fod eich cyd-Weinidogion yn San Steffan yn rhwystro hyn.

Mae'n glir erbyn hyn na fydd y dyhead i gael datblygiadau newydd di-garbon erbyn 2011 yn cael ei wireddu. Ni chewch y rheoliadau adeiladu wedi'u datganoli mewn pryd ac ni chaniateir ychwaith ichi ailwampio'r rheoliadau'n ddigonol i alluogi hynny. Mae'n bryd i bobl roi eu dwylo i fyny ac inni glywed addefiad na chaiff y targed ei gyrraedd. Fodd bynnag, yn y cyfamser, mae'n hanfodol bod eich pwerau presennol i roi arweiniad i'r awdurdodau lleol yn cael eu defnyddio. Yr wyf yn falch eich bod yn ystyried cyflwyno math o reol Merton-a-mwy yng Nghymru.

O ran argymhelliad 20, sy'n delio â rhoi gwybod i bobl am fanteision defnyddio llai o ynni, fel y gwyddom gall gwybodaeth roi'r grym i bobl i wneud gwahaniaeth lle mae hynny'n wirioneddol bwysig. Un peth na thynasom sylw ato'n benodol yn yr adroddiad, ond sy'n bwysig iawn, yw inni gasglu tystiolaeth oddi wrth yr Ymddiriedolaeth Arbed Ynni am yr angen i wella addysg mewn ysgolion er mwyn ysgogi pobl i weithredu. Hoffwn glywed rhagor am hynny yn y dyfodol.

Yn olaf, mae paragraff 5.11 yn cyfeirio at y ffordd affwysol o annigonol y mae Deddf Arbed Ynni yn y Cartref 1995 wedi ei gweithredu gan awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru. Sylweddolaf fod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi cydnabod, yn y cyswllt hwn, fod awdurdodau lleol wedi bod yn wael. Fodd bynnag, mae'r plismona ar ran Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru hefyd wedi bod yn wael, ac, os yw'r awdurdodau lleol i gymryd eu rôl o ddifrif yn y cyswllt hwn, mae'n hanfodol cael gwell plismona yn y dyfodol.

Leanne Wood: Mae'r rhan fwyaf o bobl erbyn hyn yn deall y bygythiad difrifol sydd wedi deillio o'n defnydd gormodol a'r allyriadau gormodol yn sgil hynny. Mae ein cartrefi'n cyfrif am 27 y cant o'n hallyriadau

emissions. At the same time, according to Energywatch, 22 per cent of households are experiencing fuel poverty in Wales. I am a great supporter of the One Wales Government's commitment to reduce carbon emissions by 3 per cent a year, but, throughout the committee's review, many witnesses queried whether the target would be met using the current methods. The recommendations in the committee report offer a means of achieving the target of 3 per cent, and the residential sector is an area in which the Welsh Assembly Government has the power to influence carbon reduction. Therefore, this is a sector that has the potential to make a larger contribution than just the 3 per cent target.

Zero-carbon new developments cannot be achieved by the Assembly without the devolution of powers over building regulations. Minister, I know that you have stated your support on numerous occasions for that, but do you have any more information for the Assembly about progress on that matter? As other speakers in this debate have already said, the devolution of powers over building regulations is crucial.

I, too, am disappointed that the Government is not able to support recommendation 5. By 2050, we will still be living in two thirds of the energy-inefficient homes that we live in today. Therefore, our existing stock is vital to carbon reduction in Wales. We must set out effective policies to reduce significantly the emissions from the homes that we already live in. I know, Minister, that you have pointed to the lack of provision in existing budgets, but, as the Stern review pointed out, it would be much more economical to invest now than to wait and respond to the problems caused by climate change. Delay will make this much more expensive in the long run.

2.20 p.m.

You have also stated, Minister, that you want to focus on the home energy efficiency scheme to deal with the issue. I am aware of the good work being carried out under that scheme: 34,000 homes have had heating support, and 54,000 have received insulation

carbon. Ar yr un pryd, yn ôl Golwg ar Ynni, mae 22 y cant o aelwydydd yn byw mewn tloidi tanwydd yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn gadarn o blaid ymrwymiad Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un i ostwng allyriadau carbon 3 y cant y flwyddyn, ond drwy gydol adolygiad y pwyllgor mae llawer o dystion wedi holi a fyddai'r targed yn cael ei gyrraedd drwy ddefnyddio'r dulliau presennol. Mae'r argymhellion yn adroddiad y pwyllgor yn cynnig ffordd i gyrraedd y targed o 3 y cant, ac mae'r sector preswyl yn faes y mae gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru y pŵer ynddo i ddylanwadu ar ostwng lefelau carbon. Felly, mae hwn yn sector sydd â'r potensial i wneud cyfraniad mwy na dim ond y targed 3 y cant.

Ni all datblygiadau newydd di-garbon gael eu gwireddu gan y Cynulliad heb ddatganoli'r pwerau dros y rheoliadau adeiladu. Weinidog, gwn eich bod wedi datgan eich cefnogaeth i hynny droeon, ond a oes gennych ragor o wybodaeth i'r Cynulliad am y cynnydd ar y mater hwnnw? Fel y mae siaradwyr eraill yn y ddadl hon wedi dweud eisoes, mae datganoli pwerau dros y rheoliadau adeiladu yn hollbwysig.

Yr wyf fi hefyd yn siomedig na all y Llywodraeth gefnogi argymhelliad 5. Erbyn 2050, byddwn yn dal i fyw mewn dwy ran o dair o'r cartrefi aneffeithlon o ran ynni yr ydym yn byw ynddynt heddiw. Felly, mae ein stoc presennol yn hollbwysig i ostwng lefelau carbon yng Nghymru. Rhaid inni osod allan bolisiau effeithiol i leihau'n sylweddol yr allyriadau o'r cartrefi lle'r ydym yn byw yn awr. Gwn, Weinidog, eich bod wedi tynnu sylw at y diffyg darpariaeth yn y cyllidebau presennol, ond fel y nododd adolygiad Stern, byddai'n llawer mwy economaidd buddsoddi'n awr yn hytrach na disgwyl ac ymateb i'r problemau a achosir gan newid yn yr hinsawdd. Bydd oedi'n gwneud hyn yn ddrutach o lawer yn y pen draw.

Yr ydych hefyd wedidweud, Weinidog, eich bod am ganolbwyntio ar y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref i ddelio â'r mater hwn. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r gwaith da sy'n cael ei wneud o dan y cynllun hwnnw: mae 34,000 o gartrefi wedi cael

measures. However, demand exceeds the funding available, and there is a waiting list. Increased fuel prices mean that more people are becoming fuel-poor. I would be grateful to hear how the shortfall in HEES budget can be met.

I will finish by commending to Members the Friends of the Earth report, 'Home Truths'. It contends that not only is an 80 per cent reduction in household emissions achievable, but that it can be done in a fair and equitable way that wipes out fuel poverty and enables every citizen to live in a warm and comfortable home. That clearly fits in with the One Wales Government's priorities. It recommends an integrated strategy with legally binding targets for housing emissions and minimum legal standards for homes, giving local authorities the responsibility to respond on a local level. It also recommends the rolling out of low and zero-carbon technologies. I would be grateful to hear the Minister's views on that report.

Lorraine Barrett: Much of what I would have said has already been said, but I would like to contribute, as a member of the Sustainability Committee. I found this review fascinating. It was one of our first inquiries, which shows the importance that we place, across parties, on trying to do our bit to address climate change. As others have said, our home is our castle, and it is often a draughty old castle. However, all of us are learning how to cut our energy costs by lowering our energy consumption.

As an aside, I was talking this week to a double-glazing salesman—as you do. He said that the Government was banging on about cutting energy and tackling climate change, and so when he installs new double-glazing, he has to use K-glass, which goes on the inside. He said that he had installed it for a mate, who said it was like living in a sauna. Therefore, the message is getting home to double-glazing salesmen. The Minister mentioned energy efficiency, and so I was

cymorth gwresogi, ac mae 54,000 wedi cael mesurau insiwleiddio. Fodd bynnag, mae'r galw'n fwy na'r cyllid sydd ar gael, ac mae rhestr aros. Mae prisiau tanwydd uwch yn golygu bod mwy o bobl yn disgyn i dlodi tanwydd. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar clywed sut y gellir bodloni'r diffyg yng nghyllideb y cynllun.

Gorffennaf drwy gymeradwyo adroddiad Cyfeillion y Ddaear, 'Home Truths', i'r Aelodau. Mae'n honni nid yn unig bod dichon sicrhau gostyngiad o 80 y cant yn allyriadau aelwydydd, ond bod modd gwneud hynny mewn ffordd deg a chyfiawn sy'n cael gwared â thlodi tanwydd ac sy'n galluogi pob dinesydd i fyw mewn cartref cynnes a chyfforddus. Mae hynny'n cyd-fynd yn amlwg â blaenoriaethau Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un. Mae'n argymhell strategaeth integredig gyda thargedau sy'n gyfreithiol rwympol o ran allyriadau tai a safonau cyfreithiol gofynnol i gartrefi, gan roi'r cyfrifoldeb i awdurdodau lleol i ymateb ar lefel leol. Mae hefyd yn argymhell cyflwyno technolegau carbon isel a di-garbon yn raddol. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar clywed barn y Gweinidog ar yr adroddiad hwnnw.

Lorraine Barrett: Mae llawer o'r hyn y byddwn i wedi'i ddweud eisoes wedi ei ddweud, ond hoffwn gyfrannu, fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor Cynaliadwyedd. Yr oedd yr adolygiad hwn yn hynod o ddiddorol imi. Dyma oedd un o'n hymchwiliadau cyntaf, sy'n dangos y pwyslais a roddwn, ar draws y pleidiau, ar geisio gwneud yr hyn a allwn i fynd i'r afael â newid yn yr hinsawdd. Fel y mae eraill wedi dweud, ein cartref yw ein castell, ac yn aml mae'n hen gastell drafftio. Fodd bynnag, mae pob un ohonom yn dysgu sut i ostwng ein costau ynni drwy ddefnyddio llai o ynni.

Wrth fynd heibio hoffwn ddweud fy mod wedi siarad yr wythnos hon â gwerthwr gwydr dwbl—fel y byddwn. Dywedodd fod y Llywodraeth yn rhygnu ymlaen am ddefnyddio llai o ynni a mynd i'r afael â'r newid yn yr hinsawdd, ac felly pan fydd ef yn gosod gwydr dwbl newydd, rhaid iddo ddefnyddio gwydr K, sy'n mynd ar y tu mewn. Dywedodd ei fod wedi'i osod i ffrind, a oedd yn dweud ei bod fel byw mewn sawna. Felly, mae'r neges yn cael ei chyfleu i

cheered to know that there are simple ways and means to ensure energy efficiency. I was quite surprised to learn from listening to the evidence that simple energy efficiency schemes can be more productive than the microgeneration schemes, and cheaper as well.

Like others, I was very much taken with the Merton council example, and I would like that model to be spread throughout Wales. The Welsh Local Government Association was rather sceptical about it, and said that it would not work in Wales as developers would not want to develop their homes in that way. However, the evidence that we took on that Merton model showed something completely different.

Along with other Members, I express my disappointment at the Minister's reluctance to accept recommendation 5 on retrofitting all these hard-to-heat homes. The Minister has said that the cost would be prohibitive, but I wonder whether the Minister could provide any figures on that, at some point—and the committee could have done this—to give us some idea of the cost. It is easy for us to criticise the Minister on her response, given that retrofitting is a good idea. It is a good idea, but let us be practical and find out what it would cost and where that funding might come from.

Therefore, I look forward to many of these recommendations being implemented and to working together across parties. I think that we all have the same aim, namely to do our bit in Wales. In 2004, according to my figures, we had the twelfth highest carbon dioxide emissions per capita in the world, and so we all need to do our bit to improve things in Wales.

Finally, I know that I have mentioned the renewal area schemes and HEES in previous debates, but when the Assembly Government issues grants to local authorities, those grants provide people with the opportunity to have new windows and doors, roof spaces and insulation and what have you, which is good. However, I want to keep on the agenda the possibility of using some of that renewal area

werthwyr gwydr dwbl. Soniodd y Gweinidog am effeithlonrwydd ynni, ac felly fe'm calonogwyd i wybod bod ffyrdd a dulliau syml o sicrhau effeithlonrwydd ynni. Synnais braidd o wrando ar y dystiolaeth fod cynlluniau effeithlonrwydd ynni syml yn gallu bod yn fwy cynhyrchiol na'r cynlluniau microgynhyrchu, a'u bod hefyd yn rhatach.

Fel pobl eraill, gwnaeth esiampl cyngor Merton argraff fawr arnaf, a byddwn yn hoffi gweld y model hwnnw'n cael ei ledaenu ledled Cymru. Yr oedd Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru braidd yn amheus ohono, a dywedodd na fyddai'n gweithio yng Nghymru gan na fyddai datblygwyr am ddatblygu eu cartrefi yn y ffordd honno. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd y dystiolaeth a gymerasom am fodel Merton yn dangos rhywbeth hollol wahanol.

Ynghyd ag Aelodau eraill, mynegaf fy siom am amharodrwydd y Gweinidog i dderbyn argymhellad 5 ar sefydlu rhaglen ôl-osod ar gyfer yr holl gartrefi hynny sy'n anodd eu gwresogi. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi dweud y byddai'r gost yn ormodol, ond tybed a allai'r Gweinidog ddarparu ffigurau ar hynny, ryw dro—a gallai'r pwyllgor fod wedi gwneud hynny—i roi rhyw syniad inni o'r gost. Mae'n hawdd inni feirniadu'r Gweinidog am ei hymateb, o gofio bod ôl-osod yn syniad da. Mae yn syniad da, ond gadewch inni fod yn ymarferol a gweld beth fyddai'r gost ac o ble y gallai'r cyllid hwnnw ddod.

Felly, edrychaf ymlaen at weld nifer o'r argymhellion hyn yn cael eu gweithredu ac at weithio gyda'n gilydd ar draws y pleidiau. Credaf mai'r un nod sydd gennym bob un, sef gwneud ein rhan yng Nghymru. Yn 2004, yn ôl fy ffigurau i, ein hallyriadau carbon deuocsid ni oedd y deuddegfed uchaf y pen yn y byd, felly, mae angen ini bob un wneud ein rhan i wella pethau yng Nghymru.

Yn olaf, gwn fy mod wedi crybwyll y cynlluniau ardaloedd adnewyddu a HEES mewn dadleuon blaenorol, ond pan fydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn rhoi grantiau i awdurdodau lleol, mae'r grantiau hynny'n rhoi'r cyfle i bobl gael ffenestri a drysau newydd, lle yn y to ac insiwleiddio ac yn y blaen, sy'n beth da. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf am gadw ar yr agenda y posibilrwydd o

scheme funding for energy efficiency or microgeneration schemes.

Jane Davidson: Since Members focused on headline recommendation 5, I think that I need to reiterate, for the Record, what it states and what my response is, because I have now heard three interpretations of my response that do not correspond to what was actually written.

'Headline Recommendation 5: The Committee recommends that the Welsh Assembly Government should fund a programme of retrofitting of all existing hard to heat homes so that they meet one of the agreed levels in the Code for Sustainable Homes.'

In rejecting it, I said:

'I support the underlying aim of the recommendation to promote improvements in the energy efficiency performance of existing stock, and particularly hard to heat homes. However there is a balance to be made between helping householders who are able to pay and those that are effectively in fuel poverty.'

I still strongly believe that the Assembly Government's duty is to focus on those in the greatest need. I see that people are nodding, and I am grateful for that, but that is not what your recommendation states. It states 'all', and every large detached stone house in Wales is hard to heat. We want to focus on all those hard-to-heat homes of people who are also in fuel poverty. We also point out that the code has not been designed as a standard for existing homes and is therefore difficult to read across directly. Therefore, we have no problem with the principle behind this recommendation, but I had to reject it in that form.

In my remaining 20 seconds, I will just say that all schools becoming eco-schools will be critical in this area. I thank the committee for its fantastic piece of work.

ddefnyddio rhywfaint o arian y cynllun ardaloedd adnewyddu ar gyfer cynlluniau effeithlonrwydd ynni neu ficrogynhyrchu.

Jane Davidson: Gan fod yr Aelodau wedi canolbwyntio ar brif argymhelliad 5, credaf fod angen imi ailadrodd, ar gyfer y Cofnod, yr hyn y mae'n ei ddweud a beth yw fy ymateb, oherwydd yr wyf erbyn hyn wedi clywed tri dehongliad o'm hymateb nad ydynt yn cyfateb i'r hyn a ysgrifennwyd mewn gwirionedd.

Prif Argymhelliad 5: Mae'r Pwyllgor yn argymhell y dylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gyllido rhaglen ôl-osod ar yr holl gartrefi presennol sy'n anodd eu gwresogi er mwyn i ni gyrraedd un o'r lefelau y cytunwyd arnynt yn y Cod ar gyfer Cartrefi Cynaliadwy.

Wrth ei wrthod, dywedais:

Rwy'n cefnogi nod gwaelodol yr argymhelliad, sef hyrwyddo gwelliannau effeithlonrwydd ynni yn y stoc presennol, yn enwedig cartrefi sy'n anodd eu gwresogi. Fodd bynnag, rhaid cael cydbwysedd rhwng deiliaid tai sydd â'r gallu i dalu a'r rheini sydd, i bob pwrpas, mewn tloidi tanwydd.

Yr wyf yn dal i gredu'n bendant mai dyletswydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yw canolbwyntio ar y rhai sy'n fwyaf eu hangen. Gwelaf bobl yn amneidio, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am hynny, ond nid dyna y mae eich argymhelliad yn ei ddweud. Mae'n dweud 'yr holl', ac mae pob tŷ carreg sengl mawr yng Nghymru yn anodd ei wresogi. Yr ydym am ganolbwyntio ar yr holl gartrefi anodd eu gwresogi hynny sy'n perthyn i bobl sydd hefyd mewn tloidi tanwydd. Tynnwn sylw hefyd at y ffaith nad yw'r cod wedi ei gynllunio fel safon ar gyfer cartrefi presennol ac mae felly'n anodd darllen ar draws yn uniongyrchol. Felly, nid oes gennym broblem gyda'r egwyddor sydd wrth wraidd yr argymhelliad hwn, ond yr oedd yn rhaid imi ei wrthod ar y ffurf honno.

Yn yr 20 eiliad sydd gennyf yn weddill, ni wnaf ond dweud y bydd cael pob ysgol ddod yn eco-ysgol yn dyngedfennol yn y maes hwn. Diolchaf i'r pwyllgor am ei ddarn

gwyb o waith.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I now call on Mike German, the temporary Chair of the Sustainability Committee, to respond to the debate.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Galwaf yn awr ar Mike German, Cadeirydd dros dro y Pwyllgor Cynaliadwyedd, i ymateb i'r ddadl.

Michael German: I will focus on recommendation 5. While the Minister is correct in saying that she has focused her response on fuel poverty—and the committee would support her in that—you have to strike a balance between those who are in fuel poverty and those who cannot afford to pay for improvements. There is a distinction. Not being in fuel poverty does not mean that you can afford improvements and that you have money to spare. This recommendation was not only about helping people with their fuel bills—although that was a welcome side effect—it was also about sending out a clear message that the Welsh Assembly Government is committed to reducing carbon emissions in one of the largest sectors over which it has the devolved powers to do so. When speaking here this afternoon, committee members have pointed out that the resources available to the Minister for doing the job have been cut back. Therefore, if there is to be additional work in this area, there needs to be additional work. If we are to make that seismic change and try to shift towards that 3 per cent target, we cannot do it with just the existing resources. You will need to put in additional resources, which is missing from the Minister's remarks.

Michael German: Canolbwytiaf ar argymhelliad 5. Er bod y Gweinidog yn iawn wrth ddweud ei bod wedi hoelio ei hymateb ar tlodi tanwydd—a byddai'r pwyllgor yn ei chefnogi yn hynny o beth—rhaid ichi gadw'r ddesg yn wastad rhwng y rheini sydd mewn tlodi tanwydd a'r rheini na allant fforddio talu am welliannau. Mae yna wahaniaeth. Nid yw peidio â bod mewn tlodi tanwydd yn golygu y gallwch fforddio gwelliannau a bod gennych arian i'w sbario. Yr oedd a wnelo'r argymhelliad hwn nid yn unig â helpu pobl gyda'u biliau tanwydd—er bod hynny yn sgil effaith i'w chroesawu—yr oedd a wnelo hefyd â chyfleu neges glir fod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ymrwymo i leihau allyriadau carbon yn un o'r sectorau mwyaf y mae ganddi bwerau datganoledig drosto i wneud hynny. Wrth siarad yma y prynhawn yma, mae aelodau'r pwyllgor wedi tynnu sylw at y ffaith fod yr adnoddau sydd ar gael i'r Gweinidog i wneud y gwaith wedi eu cwtogi. Felly, os oes gwaith ychwanegol i gael ei wneud yn y maes hwn, mae angen gwaith ychwanegol. Os ydym i wneud y newid seismig hwnnw a cheisio symud i gyfeiriad y targed 3 y cant, ni allwn wneud hynny gyda'r adnoddau presennol yn unig. Bydd angen ichi ddarparu adnoddau ychwanegol, ac mae hynny ar goll yn sylwadau'r Gweinidog.

The Minister and Members also referred to the one-stop shop mentioned in recommendation 21. We have to take our evidence from the witnesses, who appeared before the committee and represented a broad spectrum of knowledgeable people and those who have an impact on this area. The witnesses emphasised without fail that there was a lack of coherent, consistent and easily accessible information from one central point, and said that that was a barrier to individuals, businesses, homeowners, and, indeed, everyone engaging with carbon reduction issues. Therefore, I do not think that the committee would be minded to support a view that there are different

Cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog ac Aelodau hefyd at y siop-un-stop a grybwyllir yn argymhelliad 21. Rhaid inni gymryd ein tystiolaeth oddi wrth y tystion, a ymddangosodd gerbron y pwyllgor ac a oedd yn cynrychioli sbectrum eang o bobl wybodus a'r rheini sy'n cael effaith ar y maes hwn. Pwysleisiodd y tystion yn ddi-ffael fod diffyg gwybodaeth gydlynol, gyson a hawdd ei chael o un man canolog, a dywedent fod hynny'n rhwystr i unigolion, i fusnesau, i berchnogion cartrefi, ac yn wir i bawb sy'n ymddiddori mewn materion gostwng lefelau carbon. Felly, ni chredaf y byddai'r pwyllgor yn awyddus i gefnogi barn fod gwahanol asiantaethau yn darparu adnoddau gwahanol.

agencies providing different resources.

It was precisely that point that the committee wanted to make: having one overarching agency responsible for this area in Wales is important. That was demonstrated to the committee when it went to Austria and saw a single agency, administered and funded by a regional government, delivering reductions in carbon dioxide for a region that is widely acknowledged to be the leader in carbon reduction in Europe.

2.30 p.m.

It works well with both large industrial processes and individual householders; it brings all sides together. I would strongly recommend that the Minister and the Deputy Minister make contact with their counterparts in the regional Government of upper Austria as swiftly as possible in order to see how that recommendation came about.

It is worth mentioning headline recommendation 1, that the Government requires developments of over five dwellings to meet 10 per cent of their energy requirements on site. The Minister asked us to consider whether the committee saw a conflict between recommendations 1 and 2. The recommendations contained in the report were all evidence-based. An independent assessment of the Greater London Authority, which is already using the 10 per cent rule, said that a 23 per cent reduction was achieved in new buildings through increased energy efficiency measures alone, and a further 5 per cent from the use of renewable resources. At least 25 per cent of all new homes built had exceeded the 25 per cent reduction in carbon emissions.

In conclusion, we welcome the Minister's positive response in some areas, but it is important that those two key headlines should be part of the recommendations that she picks up. I thank the staff who have assisted the committee, not just with the production of this report, but in all the arrangements for the witnesses who came to take part in this first stage of what will probably be one of the

Dyna'r union bwynt yr oedd y pwyllgor am ei wneud: mae cael un asiantaeth hollgynhwysol sy'n gyfrifol am y maes hwn yng Nghymru yn bwysig. Cafodd hynny ei ddangos i'r pwyllgor pan aeth i Awstria a gweld un asiantaeth, yn cael ei gweinyddu a'i chyllido gan lywodraeth ranbarthol, yn llwyddo i ostwng lefelau carbon deuocsid mewn rhanbarth sy'n cael ei gydnabod yn eang fel yr arweinydd o ran gostwng lefelau carbon yn Ewrop.

Mae'n gweithio'n dda gyda phrosesau diwydiannol mawr a deiliaid tai unigol; mae'n dod â phob ochr at ei gilydd. Byddwn yn argymhell yn gryf y dylai'r Gweinidog a'r Dirprwy Weinidog gysylltu â'u cymheiriaid yn Llywodraeth ranbarthol Awstria uchaf cyn gynted ag y bo modd er mwyn gweld sut y gwnaethpwyd yr argymhelliad hwnnw.

Mae'n werth crybwyll prif argymhelliad 1, sef y dylai'r Llywodraeth ei gwneud yn ofynnol i ddatblygiadau o fwy na phum annedd gynhyrchu 10 y cant o'u gofynion ynni ar y safle. Gofynnodd y Gweinidog inni ystyried a oedd y pwyllgor yn gweld gwrthdaro rhwng argymhellion 1 a 2. Yr oedd argymhellion yr adroddiad i gyd yn seiliedig ar dystiolaeth. Dywedodd asesiad annibynnol o Awdurdod Llundain Fwyaf, sydd eisoes yn defnyddio'r rheol 10 y cant, fod gostyngiad o 23 y cant wedi'i sicrhau mewn adeiladau newydd dim ond drwy gyflwyno mwy o fesurau effeithlonrwydd ynni, a bod 5 y cant arall wedi'i sicrhau drwy ddefnyddio adnoddau adnewyddadwy. Yr oedd o leiaf 25 y cant o'r holl gartrefi newydd a adeiladwyd wedi rhagori ar y gostyngiad o 25 y cant mewn allyriadau carbon.

I gloi, yr ydym yn croesawu ymateb cadarnhaol y Gweinidog mewn rhai meysydd, ond mae'n bwysig i brif argymhellion 1 a 2 fod yn rhan o'r argymhellion a wneir ganddi. Hoffwn ddiolch i'r staff sydd wedi cynorthwyo'r pwyllgor i gynhyrchu'r adroddiad hwn, a hefyd wrth wneud yr holl drefniadau ar gyfer y tystion a ddaeth i gymryd rhan yn y cam cyntaf hwn

largest reports to come before the Assembly. The committee deliberated for so long over this issue as it is of such significance to our country. However, we would not have been able to do so without our dedicated and supportive staff.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The proposal is to note the committee's report. Does any Member object? I see that there are no objections. Therefore, the motion is agreed in accordance with Standing Order No. 7.35.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

**Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Iechyd, Lles a Llywodraeth Leol ar yr Ymchwiliad i
Gynllunio Gweithlu yn y Gwasanaeth Iechyd ac ym Maes Gofal Cymdeithasol
The Health, Wellbeing and Local Government Committee's Report into
Workforce Planning in the Health Service and Social Care**

Jonathan Morgan: I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

notes the report of the Health, Wellbeing and Local Government Committee on workforce planning in the health service and in social care, laid in the Table Office on 13 March 2008. (NDM3944)

I am pleased to be able to open this debate on the committee's report on its first inquiry into workforce planning in the NHS and social care in Wales. I am sure that I am not alone in saying that workforce planning is probably not the first subject that you would think of if you wanted to stir up a passionate debate in the pubs and clubs of Wales, nor, for that matter, in the National Assembly for Wales, but it is an extremely important issue. Health is the biggest spending department within the Assembly Government, representing the largest chunk of the Assembly Government's overall budget, and a great deal of that is spent on staff. The NHS and social care services in Wales currently employ around 140,000 people, which is around 10 per cent of those in work in Wales today. So, while the subject might be a bit dry, it is certainly one that is of considerable importance to those people working in the NHS, and to

o'r hyn a fydd, mae'n debyg, yn un o'r adroddiadau mwyaf i ddod gerbron y Cynulliad. Treuliodd y pwyllgor lawer iawn o amser yn trafod y mater hwn gan ei fod mor bwysig i'n gwlad. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddem wedi gallu gwneud hynny heb ein staff ymroddedig a chefnogol.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Y cynnig yw nodi adroddiad y pwyllgor. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad. Felly, caiff y cynnig ei dderbyn yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.35.

Jonathan Morgan:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Iechyd, Lles a Llywodraeth Leol ar gynllunio'r gweithlu yn y gwasanaeth iechyd ac ym maes gofal cymdeithasol, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Mawrth 2008. (NDM3944)

Yr wyf yn falch gallu agor y ddadl hon ar adroddiad y pwyllgor ar ei ymchwiliad cyntaf i gynllunio gweithlu yn y GIG ac ym maes gofal cymdeithasol yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn siŵr nad fi yw'r unig un sy'n dweud nad cynllunio gweithlu, mae'n debyg, yw'r pwnc cyntaf y byddech yn meddwl amdano petai arnoch eisiau ysgogi dadl ffyrnig yn nhafarnau a chlybiau Cymru, nac, o ran hynny, yng Nghynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, ond mae'n fater pwysig iawn. Iechyd yw'r adran wariant fwyaf yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae'n gyfrifol am y gyfran fwyaf o gyllideb gyfan Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ac mae swm sylweddol o'r gyfran honno'n cael ei wario ar staff. Mae'r GIG a gwasanaethau gofal cymdeithasol Cymru'n cyflogi tua 140,000 o bobl ar hyn o bryd, sy'n cyfateb i tua 10 y cant o'r bobl sydd mewn gwaith yng Nghymru heddiw. Felly, er nad yw'r pwnc yn un diddorol iawn efallai, mae'n sicr yn un

those people who receive services in both health and social care.

Our findings were quite specific. We undertook a huge amount of evidence-gathering, and, as a result, the committee has come up with a number of recommendations. As a general observation, the committee was concerned that workforce planning is too often based on historic patterns rather than on future needs, particularly the need to develop more community-based services, such as the community-based nursing services that were envisaged in 'Designed for Life'. I should make clear at the outset that the committee accepted that the Assembly Government has recognised the need to make improvements and has already started this process. The new integrated workforce planning system described in our report was still being implemented when we took evidence, but it clearly appears to offer an improved approach for the future. How that will work, time will tell. I will mention specific aspects of the Minister's response to our report later, but the fact that she has accepted most of the recommendations is further recognition of the need to move forward.

Turning to some of the specific issues in the report, the committee was concerned that local health boards do not have the staff resources or the strategic perspective to contribute meaningfully to workforce planning. This is extremely worrying, as they are supposed to be the key commissioners of a range of health and social care services. I am glad that the Minister has accepted our recommendation that this issue should be addressed, although I am not convinced that this is simply an issue of more training, or working more closely with other bodies. The fact that some LHBs may simply not be big enough to contribute meaningfully to effective workforce planning is an issue, and since the report was published, the Minister has launched her own consultation on the reorganisation of the NHS. I hope that workforce planning arrangements will be fully taken into account by the Minister when she makes decisions on the future configuration and number of LHBs.

pwysig iawn i'r rheini sy'n gweithio yn y GIG, ac i'r rheini sy'n cael gwasanaethau iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol.

Yr oedd ein darganfyddiadau'n bur benodol. Casglwyd llawer iawn o dystiolaeth, ac o ganlyniad mae'r pwyllgor wedi gwneud nifer o argymhellion. Fel sylw cyffredinol, yr oedd y pwyllgor yn bryderus fod cynllunio gweithlu, yn aml iawn, yn seiliedig ar batrymau hanesyddol yn hytrach nag ar anghenion y dyfodol, yn enwedig yr angen i ddatblygu mwy o wasanaethau cymunedol, megis y gwasanaethau nyrsio cymunedol a ragwelwyd yn 'Cynllun Oes'. Dylwn wneud yn glir ar y dechrau fod y pwyllgor wedi derbyn bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cydnabod bod angen gwneud gwelliannau a'i bod eisoes wedi dechrau ar y broses hon. Yr oedd y system cynllunio gweithlu integredig newydd sy'n cael ei disgrifio yn ein hadroddiad yn dal i gael ei chyflwyno pan oeddem yn clywed dystiolaeth, ond mae'n amlwg ei bod yn ymddangos yn cynnig gwell dull o weithredu ar gyfer y dyfodol. Amser a ddengys sut y bydd hynny'n gweithio. Soniaf am agweddau penodol ar ymateb y Gweinidog i'n hadroddiad yn nes ymlaen, ond mae'r ffaith ei bod wedi derbyn y rhan fwyaf o'r argymhellion yn gydnabyddiaeth bellach fod angen symud ymlaen.

I droi at rai o'r materion penodol sydd yn yr adroddiad, yr oedd y pwyllgor yn bryderus nad yw byrddau iechyd lleol yn meddu ar yr adnoddau staff na'r persbectif strategol i gyfrannu'n ystyrion at gynllunio gweithlu. Mae hyn yn peri pryder mawr, gan eu bod i fod yn brif gomisiynwyr ystod o wasanaethau iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Yr wyf yn falch bod y Gweinidog wedi derbyn ein hargymhelliad y dylid rhoi sylw i'r mater hwn, er nad wyf yn argyhoeddedig mai mater yn unig ydyw o ddarparu mwy o hyfforddiant, neu weithio mewn cysylltiad agosach â chyrrff eraill. Mae'r ffaith nad yw rhai BILau yn ddigon mawr i gyfrannu'n ystyrion at gynllunio gweithlu effeithiol yn broblem, ac ers cyhoeddi'r adroddiad mae'r Gweinidog wedi lansio'i hymgyngoriad ei hun ar ad-drefnu'r GIG. Gobeithio y bydd trefniadau cynllunio gweithlu'n cael eu hystyried yn llawn gan y Gweinidog pan fydd yn gwneud penderfyniadau ar gyfluniad a nifer y BILau yn y dyfodol.

Before the inquiry started, committee members were made aware of a number of concerns among organisations representing allied health professionals: physiotherapists, speech and language therapists and occupational therapists. They all expressed concerns about potential shortcomings in workforce planning. These concerns came through in our inquiry, and the committee agrees that more needs to be done to ensure that the experience of these key professionals is fully represented at all levels of workforce planning in future.

The National Leadership and Innovation Agency for Healthcare is the organisation with responsibility for workforce planning in the NHS. I accept that it is a relatively new concept, but one of our biggest concerns was that NLIAH is not properly equipped for its role. When we took evidence from NLIAH, it had only one full-time, fully trained workforce planner in its workforce development unit. This seemed a remarkably small resource for planning matters that have multi-billion pound, long-term implications for the nation. There are staffing and capacity issues in the body that is charged with workforce planning. We have recommended that this be addressed urgently, and I am glad that additional staff have now been recruited, as set out in the Minister's response.

Turning to some of the other professions within Wales, there is general recognition that there is a shortage of dentists. That was certainly the evidence that we received, and the report calls for a significant increase in the numbers being trained—a need recognised in the Minister's response.

Turning to the numbers of doctors in the NHS, the position is slightly more complicated. We generally train enough doctors to meet our needs, but we have difficulty in hanging on to them once they have qualified. The committee was also made aware that the number of undergraduates from Wales was low, and that the number of postgraduates who stay in Wales after completing their training is as low as 20 per

Cyn i'r ymchwiliad ddechrau, hysbyswyd aelodau'r pwyllgor am nifer o bryderon ymhlith sefydliadau a oedd yn cynrychioli gweithwyr proffesiynol perthynol i iechyd: ffisiotherapyddion, therapyddion iaith a lleferydd a therapyddion galwedigaethol. Mynegwyd pryder gan bob un ohonynt am ddiffygion posibl yn ymwneud â chynllunio gweithlu. Daeth y pryderon hyn i'r amlwg yn ein hymchwiliad, ac mae'r pwyllgor yn cytuno bod angen gwneud mwy i sicrhau bod profiad y gweithwyr proffesiynol allweddol hyn yn cael ei ystyried yn llawn ar bob lefel wrth gynllunio gweithlu yn y dyfodol.

Asiantaeth Genedlaethol Arwain ac Arloesi mewn Gofal Iechyd yw'r sefydliad sy'n gyfrifol am gynllunio gweithlu yn y GIG. Derbyniaf ei fod yn gysyniad cymharol newydd, ond un o'n pryderon mwyaf oedd nad oes gan yr Asiantaeth adnoddau priodol ar gyfer ei rôl. Pan glywsom dystiolaeth gan yr Asiantaeth, dim ond un cynlluniwr gweithlu amser llawn wedi ei hyfforddi'n llawn oedd ganddi yn ei huned datblygu gweithlu. Yr oedd hyn yn ymddangos yn adnodd bach iawn ar gyfer materion cynllunio sydd â goblygiadau hirdymor ac sy'n werth biliynau o bunnoedd i'r wlad. Mae problemau staffio a chapasiti yn y corff sy'n gyfrifol am gynllunio gweithlu. Yr ydym wedi argymhell y dylid rhoi sylw i'r mater hwn ar frys, ac yr wyf yn falch bod mwy o staff wedi eu recriwtio erbyn hyn, fel y gosodwyd allan yn ymateb y Gweinidog.

I droi at rai o'r proffesiynau eraill yng Nghymru, cydnabyddir yn gyffredinol fod prinder deintyddion. Dyna'n sicr y dystiolaeth a glywsom ni, ac mae'r adroddiad yn galw am gynnydd sylweddol yn y nifer sy'n cael eu hyfforddi—angen a gydnabuwyd yn ymateb y Gweinidog.

I droi at nifer y meddygon sydd yn y GIG, mae'r sefyllfa ychydig yn fwy cymhleth. Yn gyffredinol yr ydym yn hyfforddi digon o feddygon i ddiwallu ein hanghenion, ond yn cael trafferth i'w cadw ar ôl iddynt ennill cymhwyster. Hysbyswyd y pwyllgor hefyd fod nifer yr israddedigion o Gymru yn isel, a bod nifer yr israddedigion sy'n aros yng Nghymru ar ôl cwblhau eu hyfforddiant cyn ised ag 20 y cant. Fel yn achos deintyddion,

cent. As with dentists, shortages are more acute in some parts of Wales than others.

The report calls on the Assembly Government to investigate using bursaries or other incentives to encourage more students from Wales to train, and then to stay and work, in Wales—particularly in the locations where they are most needed. I will be interested to hear what the Minister has to say on this point, as she has neither accepted nor rejected these recommendations in her response.

The fact is that shortages of both doctors and dentists are more acute in some parts of Wales than in others—rural mid Wales and the Valleys, for instance. Therefore, we have called on the Assembly Government to encourage local health boards to employ more salaried doctors and dentists to help address this issue in those areas, and I am pleased that the Minister has responded positively to that.

However, there has also been an issue around the number of nurses. We know that there has been a significant increase in nursing staffing levels in recent years, but this masks a decline in some categories, such as district nurses and health visitors, where numbers have actually decreased by as much as 10 per cent. These are the very professionals that the Assembly Government says, in ‘Designed for Life’, that we will need more of in order to deliver more services in the community. We have called for more investment to increase the numbers of community-based nurses in line with the enhanced role that is envisaged for them, and although the Minister has said in her response that more community nurses will now be trained, this seems to be through new training arrangements rather than any extra resources. I hope that the need for extra resources will be kept under review by the Minister and her officials.

One of the biggest issues that we encountered was the co-operation—or, in some cases, the lack of co-operation—between health and

mae'r prinder yn waeth mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru na'i gilydd.

Mae'r adroddiad yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i ymchwilio i bosibilrwydd defnyddio bwrsariau neu gymhellion eraill i annog mwy o fyfyrwyr o Gymru i gael eu hyfforddi, ac yna i aros a gweithio yng Nghymru—yn enwedig yn yr ardaloedd lle y mae eu hangen fwyaf. Edrychaf ymlaen at glywed beth fydd gan y Gweinidog i'w ddweud ar y pwynt hwn, gan nad yw wedi derbyn na gwrthod yr argymhellion hyn yn ei hymateb.

Y gwir amdani yw bod prinder meddygon a deintyddion yn waeth mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru na'i gilydd—yn ardaloedd gwledig y canolbarth ac yn y Cymoedd, er enghraifft. Felly, yr ydym wedi galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i annog byrddau iechyd lleol i gyflogi mwy o feddygon a deintyddion cyflogedig i helpu rhoi sylw i'r broblem hon yn yr ardaloedd hynny, ac yr wyf yn falch fod y Gweinidog wedi ymateb yn gadarnhaol i hynny.

Fodd bynnag, mae nifer y nyrsys wedi bod yn broblem hefyd. Gwyddom fod cynnydd sylweddol wedi bod yn lefelau staffio nyrsys yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, ond mae hyn yn cuddio gostyngiad mewn rhai categorïau, megis nyrsys ardal ac ymwelwyr iechyd, lle mae'r niferoedd mewn gwirionedd wedi gostwng cymaint â 10 y cant. Dyma'r union weithwyr proffesiynol y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn dweud, yn ‘Cynllun Oes’, y bydd arnom angen mwy ohonynt i ddarparu mwy o wasanaethau yn y gymuned. Yr ydym wedi galw am fwy o fuddsoddiad er mwyn cynyddu nifer y nyrsys sy'n gweithio yn y gymuned yn unol â'r rôl ehangach a ragwelir ar eu cyfer, ac er bod y Gweinidog wedi dweud yn ei hymateb y bydd mwy o nyrsys cymunedol yn cael eu hyfforddi yn awr, ymddengys mai drwy drefniadau hyfforddi newydd y bydd hyn yn hytrach na rhagor o adnoddau. Gobeithio y bydd yr angen am adnoddau ychwanegol yn cael ei adolygu'n rheolaidd gan y Gweinidog a'i swyddogion.

Un o'r problemau mwyaf a welsom oedd y cydweithio—neu, mewn rhai achosion, y diffyg cydweithio—rhwng darparwyr iechyd

social care providers. This report is not just about the NHS—we also looked at workforce planning in the social care sector, and there are considerable differences in the way that services are delivered. It is common ground that there is a pressing need for better integration and co-operation on workforce planning between health and social care providers. The Assembly Government has recognised this in its new workforce planning arrangements.

2.40 p.m.

Unfortunately, the implementation timetable does not envisage that this greater opportunity for co-operation will start until 2009. We think that action is needed now to help improve that co-operation. The Minister's response indicates that work has started in this area, but I hope that the Government will accept that we need early improvements to get that better co-operation between health and social care.

Elsewhere in social care, there are long-standing issues regarding the recruitment and retention of social workers. While we do not underestimate the difficulties in that regard, we think that harmonising the pay and conditions of social workers in Wales would help with poor staff retention rates and improve the stability of the service offered to the public.

Another issue that we discovered during the review was the lack of information and data available to assess how social care could be delivered and how we need to recruit people into the sector. We discovered that the data available to social care workers, in particular, was not good enough to provide a strong basis for sound workforce planning. The committee has, therefore, recommended that a national minimum data set, which sets out the basic minimum information needed, should be established by the Government to help improve workforce planning. We know that this will not be a straightforward task and will require some effort, but we think that that effort could be worthwhile.

To go back to the health service for a

a darparwyr gofal cymdeithasol. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn ymwneud â mwy na'r GIG yn unig—buom yn edrych ar gynllunio gweithlu yn y sector gofal cymdeithasol hefyd, ac mae gwahaniaethau mawr yn y ffordd y darperir gwasanaethau. Mae'r ffaith fod gwir angen am well integreiddio a chydweithio ar gynllunio gweithlu rhwng darparwyr iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yn dir cyffredin. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cydnabod hyn yn ei threfniadau newydd ar gyfer cynllunio gweithlu.

Yn anffodus, nid yw'r amserlen weithredu'n rhagweld y bydd y cyfle hwn i gydweithio'n dechrau tan 2009. Credwn fod angen cymryd camau yn awr i helpu gwella'r cydweithredu hwnnw. Mae ymateb y Gweinidog yn dangos bod gwaith wedi dechrau yn y maes hwn, ond gobeithio y bydd y Llywodraeth yn derbyn bod arnom angen gwelliannau buan er mwyn cael gwell cydweithredu rhwng iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol.

Ym maes gofal cymdeithasol, mae recriwtio a chadw gweithwyr cymdeithasol wedi bod yn broblem ers tro byd. Er nad ydym yn bychanu'r anawsterau yn y cyswllt hwnnw, credwn y byddai cysoni cyflogau ac amodau gweithwyr cymdeithasol yng Nghymru yn helpu gyda'r cyfraddau isel o ran cadw staff ac yn gwella sefydlogrwydd y gwasanaeth a gynigir i'r cyhoedd.

Problem arall a welsom yn ystod yr adolygiad oedd prinder gwybodaeth a data er mwyn asesu sut y gellid darparu gofal cymdeithasol a sut y mae angen inni recriwtio pobl i'r sector. Gwelsom nad oedd y data a oedd ar gael i weithwyr gofal cymdeithasol, yn fwyaf arbennig, yn ddigon da i ddarparu sylfaen gref ar gyfer gwaith cynllunio gweithlu cadarn. O ganlyniad, mae'r pwyllgor wedi argymhell y dylai'r Llywodraeth sefydlu set ddata sylfaenol genedlaethol, a fydd yn gosod allan y wybodaeth sylfaenol y mae ei hangen i helpu gwella gwaith cynllunio gweithlu. Gwyddom na fydd hyn yn dasg hawdd ac y bydd yn golygu cryn dipyn o ymdrech, ond credwn y gallai'r ymdrech honno fod o fudd.

Os caf fynd yn ôl at y gwasanaeth iechyd am

moment, while still staying with the subject of the availability of information and data, we were very concerned to find out that GPs are no longer under any contractual obligation to provide data on staffing levels. Consequently, NLIAH has very little information available to it on the staff employed by GP practices. I recognise the difficulties here, which the Minister has alluded to in her response, but I really hope that progress can be made, so that GPs must at least provide basic information to help with sound planning.

In the time available today it is not possible to go through all the report's recommendations in any detail. However, among the other issues covered in the report are: the need to simplify funding arrangements for medical and dental training and to make them more coherent; the need for a longer, five-year cycle for commissioning medical training places; the need to improve social workers' professional development to make arrangements clearer and more consistent; the need for more help and guidance for local authorities, and voluntary and private sector care providers, to help them to contribute effectively in workforce planning; and the need for appropriate provision to be made for Welsh-speaking staff where they are required.

I have already mentioned some aspects of the Minister's response to the report. I will not go through her response in detail, as she will have an opportunity to do that, but I am very pleased that the Minister has accepted most of our recommendations, even if that is only in part or in principle in some cases.

I thank all those who contributed to this very worthwhile review. Effective workforce planning needs to take account of a wide range of complex and variable factors, where the effects of decisions taken today may not become clear for many years. It was very clear to the committee during the course of this inquiry that we have highly committed, hard-working and professional staff running

eiliad, gan aros gyda phwnc y wybodaeth a'r data sydd ar gael, yr oeddem yn bryderus iawn gweld nad oes gan feddygon teulu ddim ymrwymiad dan gontract bellach i ddarparu data am lefelau staffio. O ganlyniad, ychydig iawn o wybodaeth sydd ar gael i'r Asiantaeth Genedlaethol Arwain ac Arloesi mewn Gofal Iechyd am y staff sy'n cael eu cyflogi gan bractisiau meddygon teulu. Yr wyf yn cydnabod yr anawsterau yn y cyswllt hwn, a chyfeiriodd y Gweinidog atynt yn ei hymateb, ond gobeithio'n wir y gellir gwneud cynnydd, fel y bydd yn rhaid i feddygon teulu ddarparu gwybodaeth sylfaenol o leiaf i helpu creu cynlluniau cadarn.

Nid oes gennym ddigon o amser heddiw i edrych yn fanwl ar holl argymhellion yr adroddiad. Fodd bynnag, mae'r materion eraill yr ymdrinnir â hwy yn yr adroddiad yn cynnwys: yr angen i symleiddio trefniadau cyllido ar gyfer hyfforddiant meddygol a deintyddol ac i'w gwneud yn fwy ystyrlon; yr angen am gylch hwy, dros gyfnod o bum mlynedd ar gyfer comisiynu lleoedd hyfforddiant meddygol; yr angen i wella datblygiad proffesiynol gweithwyr cymdeithasol er mwyn gwneud trefniadau'n gliriach ac yn fwy cyson; yr angen am fwy o gymorth ac arweiniad i awdurdodau lleol, a darparwyr gofal yn y sectorau gwirfoddol a phreifat, i'w helpu i gyfrannu'n effeithiol ym maes cynllunio gweithlu; a'r angen i wneud darpariaeth briodol ar gyfer staff sy'n siarad Cymraeg lle mae eu hangen.

Yr wyf wedi cyfeirio'n barod at rai agweddau ar ymateb y Gweinidog i'r adroddiad. Nid wyf am fynd drwy ei hymateb yn fanwl, oherwydd bydd cyfle iddi hi wneud hynny, ond yr wyf yn falch iawn fod y Gweinidog wedi derbyn y rhan fwyaf o'n hargymhellion, hyd yn oed os yw hynny'n rhannol neu mewn egwyddor yn unig mewn rhai achosion.

Hoffwn ddiolch i bawb a gyfrannodd at yr adolygiad hynod fuddiol hwn. Mae angen i gynllunio gweithlu effeithiol ystyried ystod eang o ffactorau cymhleth ac amrywiol, lle na fydd effeithiau penderfyniadau sy'n cael eu gwneud heddiw yn amlwg am rai blynyddoedd efallai. Yr oedd yn amlwg iawn i'r pwyllgor yn ystod yr ymchwiliad hwn fod ein gwasanaethau iechyd a gofal

our health and social care services. Workforce planning may not be an issue that excites as much debate as other issues in health and social care, but we entrust the care of some of our most vulnerable people to these services and all of us depend on them when we are at our most vulnerable. It is of fundamental importance, therefore, that the system for planning the staff needs of our health and social care services is as rigorous and robust as possible. I commend the report of our first inquiry to the Assembly.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Edwina Hart): The committee will already be aware that I have welcomed this report and the focus that the committee has given to this important issue. Workforce planning is not an exact science, and there are quite a number of subjective issues within it, which obviously create problems.

I will cut to the chase in terms of some of the recommendations that have been mentioned in Jonathan's contribution. Recommendation 6 is about the current academic components of how we deal with training. The academic components of the first four years of medical and dental training are funded through the education budget via the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales, and the clinical components are funded by NHS Wales via the service increment for training allocations. Both components are funded by NHS Wales in the fifth and sixth years of training, and this has caused problems in determining the initial numbers of students entering training. I have initiated work between Jane Hutt's department and my own to discuss numbers and trends. We are now reviewing how we can take forward the issues that have arisen from the particular report. That is a further update on the back of my written response.

On recommendation 8, which is about dental training places, additional student places for

cymdeithasol yn cael eu rhedeg gan staff proffesiynol, hynod ymroddedig sy'n gweithio'n galed iawn. Efallai nad yw cynllunio gweithlu'n bwnc sy'n ysgogi cymaint o ddadlau â materion eraill ym maes iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol, ond yr ydym yn ymddiried yn y gwasanaethau hyn i ofalu am rai o'r bobl fwyaf agored i niwed yn ein cymdeithas, ac yr ydym i gyd yn dibynnu ar y gwasanaethau hyn pan fyddwn fwyaf agored i niwed. Mae'n hanfodol bwysig, felly, i'r system ar gyfer cynllunio anghenion staff ein gwasanaethau iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol fod gadarn a thrwyadl ag sy'n bosibl. Yr wyf yn cymeradwyo adroddiad ein hymchwiliad cyntaf i'r Cynulliad.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Edwina Hart): Bydd y pwyllgor eisoes yn ymwybodol fy mod wedi croesawu'r adroddiad hwn a'r sylw y mae'r pwyllgor wedi'i roi i'r mater pwysig hwn. Nid yw cynllunio gweithlu yn wyddor fanwl, ac mae cryn nifer o faterion goddrychol ymhlyg ynddo, sydd wrth reswm yn achosi problemau.

Yr wyf am fynd at wraidd y mater o ran rhai o'r argymhellion y cyfeiriwyd atynt yng nghyfraniad Jonathan. Mae argymhelliad 6 yn ymwneud â'r cydrannau academaidd presennol a'r ffordd yr ydym yn ymdrin â hyfforddiant. Mae cydrannau academaidd y pedair blynedd cyntaf mewn hyfforddiant meddygol a deintyddol yn cael eu cyllido drwy'r gyllideb addysg, drwy Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru, a'r cydrannau clinigol yn cael eu cyllido gan GIG Cymru drwy'r gynyddran gwasanaeth ar gyfer dyraniadau hyfforddiant. Caiff y ddwy gydran eu cyllido gan GIG Cymru ym mhumed a chweched flwyddyn yr hyfforddiant, ac mae hyn wedi achosi problemau wrth geisio pennu nifer cychwynnol y myfyrwyr sy'n cychwyn cwrs hyfforddi. Yr wyf wedi rhoi cychwyn ar waith rhwng adran Jane Hutt a'm hadran i i drafod niferoedd a thueddiadau. Yr ydym yn awr yn adolygu sut y gallwn weithredu ar y materion sydd wedi codi o'r adroddiad penodol. Mae hynny'n ddiweddiariad ychwanegol i'm hymateb ysgrifenedig.

O ran argymhelliad 8, sy'n ymwneud â lleoedd hyfforddi deintyddion, cytunwyd ar

dental students have been agreed, and those will be available from 2010 onwards. An analysis is currently being undertaken to determine the required numbers of hygienists and therapists, and the findings will be presented at the workforce stakeholders' board meeting in September prior to education commissioning decisions. That strand of work is also going forward.

Turning to recommendation 9 on financial incentives, there is currently no shortage of applications to medical schools in Wales. Many applications come from outside Wales, which was Jonathan's point. Some of these students will stay in Wales after graduating, and medical students who are domiciled in Wales when training do receive support from the NHS in Wales in the final years of training. However, financial and non-financial incentives could influence the quality and geographical origin of applications, and therefore this matter is currently being investigated to ensure that Wales is seen as an attractive training environment, so that sufficient applications are received from all parts of Wales. The deanery has confirmed that this work is progressing, and I will have a report on the matter in due course.

In recommendation 10, the committee looked at the issue of offering additional bursaries or other financial incentives to newly qualified doctors. I have considered these issues quite recently in discussions with my officials, and the deanery has confirmed that there is an issue with applications to foundation programmes in Wales, and I have asked it to do further work in this regard. The deanery is involving the BMA, and one issue that they will explore is that of incentives. I will be happy, in due course, to report back to Members about how discussions are proceeding.

On recommendation 11, which is about the further employment of directly salaried GPs and dentists, my officials are currently preparing a discussion paper on the development of salaried general medical service. A lot of research has been done, with

leoedd ychwanegol ar gyfer myfyrwyr deintyddol, a bydd y rheini ar gael o 2010 ymlaen. Mae dadansoddiad ar y gweill i benderfynu nifer yr hylenwyr a'r therapyddion y mae eu hangen, a chyflwynir y darganfyddiadau yng nghyfarfod bwrdd rhanddeiliaid y gweithlu ym mis Medi cyn i benderfyniadau comisiynu addysg gael eu gwneud. Mae'r maes gwaith hwnnw hefyd yn mynd yn ei flaen.

I droi at argymhelliad 9 ar gymhellion ariannol, ar hyn o bryd nid oes prinder ceisiadau i ysgolion meddygol yng Nghymru. Daw nifer o geisiadau o'r tu allan i Gymru, sef pwynt Jonathan. Bydd rhai o'r myfyrwyr hyn yn aros yng Nghymru ar ôl graddio, ac mae myfyrwyr meddygol sy'n byw yng Nghymru tra byddant yn hyfforddi yn cael cymorth gan y GIG yng Nghymru yn ystod blynyddoedd olaf eu hyfforddiant. Fodd bynnag, gallai cymhellion ariannol a chymhellion eraill ddylanwadu ar ansawdd a tharddiad daearyddol ceisiadau, ac felly ymchwilir i'r mater hwn ar hyn o bryd i sicrhau bod Cymru'n cael ei hystyried yn amgylchedd hyfforddi deniadol, er mwyn denu digon o geisiadau o bob rhan o Gymru. Mae'r ddeoniaeth wedi cadarnhau bod y gwaith hwn yn mynd rhagddo, a bydd gennyf adroddiad ar y mater maes o law.

Yn argymhelliad 10, ystyriodd y pwyllgor gynnig bwrsariaethau ychwanegol neu gymhellion ariannol eraill i feddygon sydd newydd ennill cymhwyster. Yr wyf wedi ystyried y materion hyn yn gymharol ddiweddar mewn trafodaethau gyda'm swyddogion, ac mae'r ddeoniaeth wedi cadarnhau bod problem gyda cheisiadau ar gyfer rhaglenni sylfaen yng Nghymru, ac yr wyf wedi gofyn iddi wneud rhagor o waith ar hynny. Mae'r ddeoniaeth yn cynnwys Cymdeithas Feddygol Prydain yn y gwaith hwn, ac un mater y byddant yn ymchwilio iddo yw cymhellion. Byddaf yn fodlon rhoi adroddiad i'r Aelodau, maes o law, ar y cynnydd gyda'r trafodaethau.

O ran argymhelliad 11, sef cyflogi rhagor o feddygon teulu a deintyddion yn uniongyrchol, mae fy swyddogion wrthi'n paratoi papur trafod ar ddatblygu gwasanaeth meddygol cyffredinol cyflogedig. Mae llawer o waith ymchwil wedi ei wneud, gyda

information from key stakeholders. The likely conclusion is that there is no reason, in principle, why we cannot directly deliver GMS. There was, however, no support for a move to 100 per cent salaried service, and we have been strongly cautioned against taking any measures that might damage the leading GMS practices. There are many issues involved. However, I am considering our position in this regard as I think that it may help us in Wales.

With regard to recommendation 13, we are considering and costing options for a centrally-managed clearing house system to develop new posts and guaranteed employment. I should have that report in June 2008, and that will help to address some of those issues.

On recommendation 15, the workforce planning implementation project includes two work streams that are dealing with this issue: the medical and dental work stream and the information work stream, which I think will progress matters well.

Recommendation 18 about the Care Council for Wales and the development of the local workforce partnerships, the CCW and regional partnerships have established a working group to explore the options for implementing this recommendation. The next meeting, due to take place in September 2008, is to agree a way forward.

Recommendation 20 will be taken forward by the 'Fulfilled Lives, Supportive Communities' work on commissioning. There is no timescale for that work as yet, but the Deputy Minister will be keeping a close eye on it.

On recommendation 22, England has presented its minimum data set model to a Welsh audience, and the social service directors and the Care Council for Wales are progressing work in relation to a national minimum data set for social workers to actively start to inform social worker training requirements, which is essential.

gwybodaeth gan randdeiliaid allweddol. Y casgliad tebygol yw nad oes rheswm, mewn egwyddor, pam na allwn ddarparu gwasanaethau meddygol cyffredinol yn uniongyrchol. Fodd bynnag, nid oedd cefnogaeth i symud i wasanaeth cwbl gyflogedig, ac yr ydym wedi cael rhybudd cryf rhag cymryd unrhyw fesurau a allai niweidio'r practisau gwasanaethau meddygol cyffredinol arweiniol. Mae llawer o broblemau'n gysylltiedig â hyn. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn ystyried ein sefyllfa yng nghyswllt hyn a chredaf y gallai ein helpu ni yng Nghymru.

O ran argymhelliad 13, yr ydym yn ystyried ac yn costio dewisiadau ar gyfer system glirio sy'n cael ei rheoli'n ganolog i ddatblygu swyddi newydd ac i sicrhau cyflogaeth. Dylai'r adroddiad hwnnw ddod i law ym mis Mehefin 2008, a bydd hwnnw'n helpu mynd i'r afael â rhai o'r problemau hynny.

O ran argymhelliad 15, mae'r prosiect gweithredu cynllunio gweithlu yn cynnwys dwy ffrwd waith sy'n ymdrin â'r mater hwn: y ffrwd waith feddygol a deintyddol a'r ffrwd waith gwybodaeth, a chredaf y bydd hynny'n sicrhau cynnydd da.

Mae argymhelliad 18 yn ymwneud â Chyngor Gofal Cymru a datblygu'r partneriaethau gweithlu lleol. Mae'r Cyngor Gofal a phartneriaethau rhanbarthol wedi sefydlu gweithgor i ymchwilio i'r dewisiadau ar gyfer rhoi'r argymhelliad hwn ar waith. Yn y cyfarfod nesaf, a gynhelir fis Medi 2008, bwriedir cytuno ar ffordd ymlaen.

Gweithredir argymhelliad 20 gan y gwaith 'Bywydau Bodlon, Cymunedau Cefnogol' ar gomisiynu. Nid oes amserlen ar gyfer y gwaith hwnnw hyd yma, ond bydd y Dirprwy Weinidog yn cadw llygad fanwl arno.

O ran argymhelliad 22, mae Lloegr wedi cyflwyno ei model o set ddata sylfaenol i gynulleidfa Gymreig, ac mae'r cyfarwyddwyr gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a Chyngor Gofal Cymru yn gwneud cynnydd gyda'r gwaith yng nghyswllt set ddata sylfaenol i weithwyr cymdeithasol er mwyn dechrau llywio gofynion hyfforddiant gweithwyr cymdeithasol, sy'n hanfodol.

On recommendation 23, progress is being made, with more post-qualifying programmes being approved.

On recommendation 26, we have extended the membership of the group doing work in this regard to include the chief executive order of the care council and Graham Williams, the new director of the Social Services Inspectorate for Wales. A draft work plan for social care has been developed. Therefore, there is real progress on that agenda.

Turning to the comments made about LHBs, I should draw to your attention the fact that recommendations 1 and 3 will be addressed as part of my ongoing consultation on changes in organisational structures in the NHS.

2.50 p.m.

This is a challenging report for me to implement in many ways. It requires a lot of work in the department, and it will require an awful lot of looking at the structures that currently exist in the NHS. However, I have been pleased this year with the progress that we have made in workforce planning. We have the integrated workforce planning and implementation programme, which is working well. We are also looking at the update on the requirements of planning guidance, and how we are going to develop those aspects.

In 2008-09, we will focus on key areas, which will include establishing a credible baseline of knowledge about the existing workforce, identifying why key workforce changes are required, whether this means growth, reduction, increased productivity, new roles, or new skills and competencies. We will also focus on training key senior corporate planners and clinicians in workforce planning and the use of workforce planning decision support tools. Therefore, there much is being done in 2008-09 to improve matters. We are also agreeing a process for the integration of medical workforce planning. There are many areas there about the alignment of the workforce planning cycle with the existing service and

O ran argymhelliad 23, mae yna gynnydd, ac mae mwy o raglenni ôl-gymhwyso'n cael eu cymeradwyo.

O ran argymhelliad 26, yr ydym wedi ehangu aelodaeth y grŵp sy'n gwneud y gwaith hwn i gynnwys prif swyddog gweithredol y cyngor gofal a Graham Williams, cyfarwyddwr newydd Arolygiaeth Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru. Mae cynllun gwaith drafft ar gyfer gofal cymdeithasol wedi ei ddatblygu. Felly, mae cynnydd gwirioneddol gyda'r agenda honno.

I droi at y sylwadau a wnaethpwyd am BILlau, dylwn dynnu eich sylw at y ffaith y byddaf yn mynd i'r afael ag argymhellion 1 a 3 fel rhan o'm hymgyngori parhaus ar newidiadau mewn strwythurau sefydliadol yn y GIG.

Mae hwn yn adroddiad heriol imi ei roi ar waith ar lawer cyfrif. Mae'n gofyn am lawer o waith yn yr adran, a bydd yn gofyn am edrych yn fanwl iawn ar y strwythurau sy'n bodoli yn y GIG ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf wedi fy mhlesio eleni gyda'r cynnydd a wnaethpwyd gennym o ran cynllunio'r gweithlu. Yr ydym wedi integreiddio cynllunio'r gweithlu a'r rhaglen weithredu, ac mae'n gweithio'n dda. Yr ydym hefyd yn edrych ar y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am ofynion canllawiau cynllunio, a sut y bwriadwn ddatblygu'r agweddau hynny.

Yn 2008-09, byddwn yn canolbwyntio ar feysydd allweddol, a fydd yn cynnwys sefydlu llinell sylfaen gredadwy o wybodaeth am y gweithlu presennol, a nodi pam y mae angen newidiadau allweddol yn y gweithlu, p'un a fydd hyn yn cynnwys twf, gostyngiad, mwy o gynhyrchiant, swyddogaethau newydd, neu sgiliau a chymwyseddau newydd. Byddwn hefyd yn canolbwyntio ar hyfforddi uwch gynllunwyr corfforaethol a chlinigwyr allweddol yn y gwaith o gynllunio'r gweithlu ac ar ddefnyddio offer cymorth ar gyfer gwneud penderfyniadau cynllunio yng nghyswllt cynllunio'r gweithlu. Felly, mae llawer yn cael ei wneud yn 2008-09 i wella'r sefyllfa. Yr ydym hefyd yn cytuno ar broses i integreiddio cynllunio'r

financial planning cycles.

Finally, I will mention an issue that has been consistently raised, namely nurses and community nursing. We were able to resolve the training issues this year. However, there is an ongoing piece of work here, because, as we develop our focus on primary care, and change the balance, we will require more community nurses, and we have to consider what skills they require and what we need in training for them.

I welcome the report. This is not a glamorous issue, but it is essential to the future of the NHS in Wales. I am pleased that, in the main, I have been able to accept fully all of the committee's recommendations. I will be delighted, at some stage, to publish a written statement, perhaps in the autumn, updating everyone on where I have taken this work further forward.

Nick Ramsay: Thank you for your comments, Minister. I listened with interest to your contribution. As you said, this is not a glamorous subject, but it became clear during the course of the review that is one that is incredibly important to the future of the NHS in Wales. Other committees have tackled this subject before, and the fact that this is the first report delivered by the Health, Wellbeing and Local Government Committee shows the importance that we attach to this subject.

I was particularly interested, reading through the list of the recommendations that have been accepted—and I am pleased that the bulk of them have been accepted—to note the recommendations that have not been accepted fully. With regard to the recruitment and retention of junior doctors and other medical specialists, which is important for patients and the workforce, I was disappointed to note that you have not placed as much importance on that as I think could be placed upon on it. However, I accept that many aspects of other recommendations feed into that.

gweithlu meddygol. Mae nifer o feysydd yn ymwneud ag alinio cylch cynllunio'r gweithlu gyda'r cylchoedd cynllunio gwasanaethau a chynllunio ariannol presennol.

Yn olaf, soniaf am fater sydd wedi ei godi'n gyson, sef nyrsys a nyrsio cymunedol. Llwyddwyd i ddatrys y problemau hyfforddi eleni. Fodd bynnag, mae gwaith yn mynd rhagddo yma, oherwydd wrth inni ddatblygu ein ffocws ar ofal sylfaenol, a newid y cydbwysedd, bydd arnom angen mwy o nyrsys cymunedol, a rhaid inni ystyried pa sgiliau y mae arnynt eu hangen a beth y mae ei angen ar eu cyfer o ran hyfforddiant.

Croesawaf yr adroddiad. Nid yw hwn yn fater deniadol, ond mae'n hanfodol i ddyfodol y GIG yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn falch fy mod, ar y cyfan, wedi gallu derbyn yn llawn holl argymhellion y pwyllgor. Bydd yn bleser gennyf, ryw bryd, gyhoeddi datganiad ysgrifenedig, hwyrach yn yr hydref, i roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i bawb am y cynnydd y byddaf wedi'i wneud gyda'r gwaith hwn.

Nick Ramsay: Diolch ichi am eich sylwadau, Weinidog. Gwrandewais gyda diddordeb ar eich cyfraniad. Fel y dywedech, nid pwnc deniadol mo hwn, ond daeth yn glir yn ystod yr adolygiad ei fod yn bwnc sy'n hynod bwysig i ddyfodol y GIG yng Nghymru. Mae pwyllgorau eraill wedi mynd i'r afael â'r pwnc hwn o'r blaen, ac mae'r ffaith mai dyma'r adroddiad cyntaf i gael ei gynhyrchu gan y Pwyllgor Iechyd, Lles a Llywodraeth Leol yn dangos y pwys a roddwn ar y pwnc hwn.

Wrth ddarllen drwy'r rhestr o'r argymhellion sydd wedi eu derbyn—ac yr wyf yn falch bod y rhan fwyaf ohonynt wedi eu derbyn—yr oedd yn ddiddorol iawn nodi'r argymhellion nad ydynt wedi eu derbyn yn llawn. O ran recriwtio a chadw meddygon iau ac arbenigwyr meddygol eraill, sy'n bwysig i gleifion ac i'r gweithlu, yr oeddwn yn siomedig gweld nad ydych wedi rhoi cymaint o bwys ar hynny ag y credaf y gellid bod wedi'i roi iddo. Fodd bynnag, derbyniaf fod llawer agwedd ar argymhellion eraill yn cyfrannu at hynny.

On your more general comments regarding LHBs, I concur with what Jonathan Morgan said earlier, in that this was a timely review, given that the announcement on the merger of LHBs will have a big impact on the future delivery of health services in Wales. I look forward to hearing what you have to say in future, as that unfolds, about how you believe that will impact on workforce planning in Wales. The comments on dental services are of major importance to my constituents, and to the constituents of Members across Wales.

What became clear throughout this review is that there are, as you said, a plethora of issues here, which are difficult to separate out—it is much easier to see them as a whole. It was certainly difficult, in discussing our recommendations, to think what would be workable in practice, and which recommendations should be prioritised. Above all, what came out of the review is the importance of having better data than we have at the moment. I am not sure that the data that are currently held—and this was the view of the witnesses who gave us evidence on this—are sufficient to allow us to address the problems that are being experienced in the NHS. However, there were also some positives from the committee's review, in that during the course of the review we found out that efforts are being made to improve data collection.

The opening statement by the Chair of the committee addressed the nub of what we wish to see. Ultimately, workforce planning is going to be a difficult problem. While not an intractable problem, it is nearly so, and I welcome your and your Government's attempt to get to grips with the issues. It has been good to work on this with the committee, and I look forward to working with you in the future, in the hope that we can deal with these real problems.

Val Lloyd: I think that a previous speaker said that workforce planning is not a sexy subject—and it is far from it—but it is essential to the organisation of the NHS if we are to provide the right care to patients at the right time.

O ran eich sylwadau mwy cyffredinol ynghylch BILlau, cytunaf â'r hyn a ddywedodd Jonathan Morgan yn gynharach, sef bod hwn yn adolygiad amserol, o gofio y caiff y cyhoeddiad ar uno BILlau effaith fawr ar y ffordd y darperir gwasanaethau iechyd yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol. Edrychaf ymlaen at glywed yr hyn sydd gennych i'w ddweud yn y dyfodol, wrth i hynny ddatblygu, am y ffordd y credwch y bydd hynny'n effeithio ar gynllunio'r gweithlu yng Nghymru. Mae'r sylwadau ar wasanaethau meddygol yn bwysig iawn i'm hetholwyr i, ac i etholwyr Aelodau ym mhob rhan o Gymru.

Yr hyn a ddaeth yn amlwg drwy gydol yr adolygiad hwn yw bod lluo o broblemau yma, fel y soniech, sy'n anodd eu gwahanu—mae'n haws o lawer eu gweld yn eu crynswth. Yr oedd yn sicr yn anodd, wrth drafod ein hargymhellion, meddwl beth fyddai'n gweithio'n ymarferol, a pha argymhellion y dylid rhoi blaenoriaeth iddynt. Yn anad dim, yr hyn a ddeilliodd o'r adolygiad yw pwysigrwydd gwell data na'r hyn sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd. Nid wyf yn siŵr bod y data sydd ar gael ar hyn o bryd—a dyma farn tystion a roddodd dystiolaeth ar hyn—yn ddigonol i ganiatáu inni ymdrin â'r problemau a brofir yn y GIG. Fodd bynnag, deilliodd rhai pwyntiau cadarnhaol o adolygiad y pwyllgor—darganfuwyd yn ystod yr adolygiad fod ymdrechion yn cael eu gwneud i wella casglu data.

Aeth datganiad agoriadol Cadeirydd y pwyllgor at wraidd yr hyn yr hoffem ei weld. Yn y pen draw, bydd cynllunio'r gweithlu yn broblem anodd. Er nad yw'n broblem na ellir ei goresgyn, mae hynny o'r braidd, a chroesawaf eich ymdrech chi a'ch Llywodraeth i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau hyn. Bu'n braf gweithio ar hyn gyda'r pwyllgor, ac edrychaf ymlaen at weithio gyda chi yn y dyfodol, yn y gobaith y gallwn fynd i'r afael â'r problemau gwirioneddol hyn.

Val Lloyd: Credaf fod siaradwr blaenorol wedi dweud nad yw cynllunio'r gweithlu yn bwnc deniadol—a gwir y gair—ond mae'n hanfodol i drefniadaeth y GIG os ydym i ddarparu'r gofal cywir i gleifion ar yr amser cywir.

I found the inquiry conducted by the committee to be hugely informative. The evidence that we gathered from various organisations highlighted numerous areas where change is needed if workforce planning is to be effective as it should be. It clearly is not so at the moment; it is very much in its infancy. I am pleased that the Minister in her response to the committee's report has accepted so many of the recommendations.

I will focus my remarks on recommendations 12 and 13, which call on the Assembly Government to identify the necessary increase in the number of community nurses as a priority, and also to look at introducing a guaranteed employment or internship scheme for newly-qualified nurses and allied health professionals similar to the Scottish system.

As someone mentioned, there is currently a shift in the way that patients receive care. The focus is moving away from acute hospital care towards increased community care, and this trend is highly likely to continue and gain momentum. That means that community-based nurses and a range of other professionals, such as physiotherapists and occupational therapists, are playing an even more important role than previously.

I am aware of the recent review of community nursing in Wales, and I look forward to the results of that work, because the community workforce must be equipped with the right skills to ensure the best quality care for patients. That is an important element of workforce planning. Courses should provide nurses and therapists with the right skills mix to empower, support and educate patients, all of which, as I have said, is an essential component of workforce planning and contributes to the whole.

As became apparent during the course of the committee's inquiry, joint courses with other health professionals must be an option for consideration. Thus I welcome the Government's commitment to increase the number of health professionals working in the community, and believe that we must

Yr oedd yr ymchwil a wnaed gan y pwyllgor yn ddefnyddiol iawn. Dangosodd y dystiolaeth a gasglwyd gennym gan amrywiol sefydliadau nifer o feysydd lle mae angen newidiadau os ydym am sicrhau y bydd cynllunio'r gweithlu mor effeithiol ag y dylai fod. Mae'n amlwg nad yw hynny'n wir ar hyn o bryd; mae'n sicr yn ei fabandod. Yr wyf yn falch bod y Gweinidog, yn ei hymateb i adroddiad y pwyllgor, wedi derbyn cynifer o'r argymhellion.

Canolbwyntiaf fy sylwadau ar argymhellion 12 a 13, sy'n galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i nodi'r cynnydd angenrheidiol yn nifer y nyrsys cymunedol fel blaenoriaeth, a hefyd i ystyried cyflwyno cynllun swyddi preswyl neu sicrwydd cyflogaeth i nyrsys sydd newydd ennill cymhwyster a gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol cysylltiedig, yn debyg i'r system a geir yn yr Alban.

Fel y soniodd rhywun, ar hyn o bryd mae'r ffordd y mae cleifion yn cael gofal yn newid. Mae'r ffocws yn symud o ofal aciwt mewn ysbytai i fwy o ofal yn y gymuned, ac mae'r duedd hon yn debygol iawn o barhau a chyflymu. Mae hynny'n golygu bod gan nyrsys yn y gymuned, ac ystod o weithwyr proffesiynol eraill fel ffisiotherapyddion a therapyddion galwedigaethol, ran bwysicach hyd yn oed nag o'r blaen.

Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r adolygiad yn ddiweddar o nyrsio cymunedol yng Nghymru, ac edrychaf ymlaen at ganlyniadau'r gwaith hwnnw, oherwydd rhaid i'r gweithlu cymunedol gael y sgiliau cywir i sicrhau bod cleifion yn cael gofal o'r ansawdd gorau. Mae hynny'n elfen bwysig o gynllunio'r gweithlu. Dylai cyrsiau roi'r gymysgedd gywir o sgiliau i nyrsys a therapyddion er mwyn grymuso, cynorthwyo ac addysgu cleifion, ac mae'r cyfan, fel y dywedais, yn elfen hanfodol o gynllunio'r gweithlu ac yn cyfrannu at y darlun cyflawn.

Fel y gwelwyd yn ystod ymchwiliad y pwyllgor, rhaid i gyrsiau a gynhelir ar y cyd â gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol eraill fod yn ddewis i'w ystyried. Felly, croesawaf ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth i gynyddu nifer y gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol sy'n gweithio yn y gymuned, a chredaf ei bod yn rhaid inni

continue to look at innovative ways of training to allow all such professionals to deal with their increasingly varied and fast-changing caseload.

Finally, I am pleased that the Government has accepted in principle the need to look at ways in which to address the problem of unemployment of newly-qualified nurses and therapists, and that an option appraisal is being carried out. I await the conclusion of that work with interest. I note that some much-needed changes are already afoot, and I look forward to the full implementation of the committee report.

Jenny Randerson: It is worth noting that our interest in this issue as a committee was probably first sparked by the Royal College of Nursing and the Chartered Society of Physiotherapists, which told us about the large numbers of fully trained physiotherapists who could not get a job, although we all know of constituents who cannot get physiotherapy. That is at the crux of many of the issues thrown up by this thorough review.

Probably the most startling revelation for the committee was about the amazing lack of capacity in the workforce development unit of the National Leadership and Innovation Agency for Healthcare, which has already been referred to. The fact that there is only one fully trained workforce planner leaves that organisation appallingly vulnerable and unable to cope in the event of holidays and illness. That one person faces an impossible task. That the whole planning process for the very many thousands of people employed by the NHS in Wales hangs on one person and his or her expertise is completely ridiculous in a modern national health service.

3.00 p.m.

The other issue that was referred to on numerous occasions as we took evidence was the lack of capacity in local health boards to commission and to fulfil their roles in terms of workforce planning. I hope that the Minister will take that issue on board when she considers the responses to the current

edrych ar ffyrdd arloesol o hyfforddi er mwyn caniatáu i bob gweithiwr proffesiynol o'r fath ymdrin â'i faich achosion, sy'n amrywio fwyfwy ac sy'n newid yn gyflym.

Yn olaf, yr wyf yn falch bod y Llywodraeth wedi derbyn mewn egwyddor fod angen edrych ar ffyrdd i fynd i'r afael â phroblem diweithdra ymysg nyrsys a therapyddion sydd newydd ennill cymhwyster, ac y cynhelir gwerthusiad o'r dewisiadau. Disgwyliaf yn eiddgar i'r gwaith hwnnw gael ei gwblhau. Sylwaf fod rhai newidiadau y mae eu hangen yn ddybryd eisoes ar y gweill, ac edrychaf ymlaen at weld gweithredu adroddiad y pwyllgor yn llawn.

Jenny Randerson: Mae'n werth nodi i'n diddordeb ni fel pwyllgor yn y mater hwn gael ei ennyn gyntaf gan Goleg Brenhinol y Nyrsys a Chymdeithas Siartredig y Ffisiotherapyddion, a ddywedodd wrthym am y nifer fawr o ffisiotherapyddion cymwys nad oeddent yn gallu cael swyddi, er y gwyddom i gyd am etholwyr sy'n methu cael ffisiotherapi. Dyna graidd nifer o'r materion a ddeilliodd o'r adolygiad trylwyr hwn.

Mae'n debyg mai'r datgeliad a synnodd y pwyllgor fwyaf oedd y diffyg capasiti rhyfeddol yn uned datblygu'r gweithlu yn yr Asiantaeth Genedlaethol Arwain ac Arloesi mewn Gofal Iechyd, y cyfeiriwyd ati eisoes. Mae'r ffaith mai un cynllunydd gweithlu'n unig sydd yno wedi'i hyfforddi'n llawn yn golygu bod y sefydliad mewn sefyllfa fregus iawn ac na all ymdopi yn ystod cyfnodau gwyliau a salwch. Mae'r unigolyn hwnnw'n wynebu tasg amhosibl. Mae'r ffaith fod yr holl broses gynllunio i'r miloedd lawer o bobl a gyflogir gan y GIG yng Nghymru yn dibynnu ar un unigolyn a'i arbenigedd ef neu hi yn gwbl chwerthinllyd mewn gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol modern.

3.00 p.m.

Y mater arall y cyfeiriwyd ato droeon wrth inni gymryd tystiolaeth oedd y prinder capasiti mewn byrddau iechyd lleol i gomisiynu a chyflawni eu rolau o ran cynllunio gweithlu. Gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn ystyried y mater hwnnw pan fydd yn rhoi sylw i'r ymatebion i'r adolygiad

review on structures in the health service, because any new structure has to have sufficient capacity for workforce planning. It is also worth mentioning at this point that there is also a capacity issue in many of our local authorities in terms of workforce planning for social care. There needs to be a much more holistic approach that looks at the issues as a whole, rather than dividing them up within each local authority and within each aspect of the whole patient pathway.

The committee and I are particularly concerned about evidence from the allied health professionals—from the therapists, in particular—that stated that the numbers employed are based on historic data and practice and financial constraints, not on real need. One set of evidence showed a large and realistic assessment of need, but that had been boiled down to a tiny number of posts to be created at the end of a financial planning round, which bore no relation to real need at all. The problem here is not just about financial constraints, it is also about moving the minds of those who do the commissioning and who deal with the employment on to place emphasis on the importance of moving from acute care to community care.

I will briefly mention the complexity of some of these issues. Cross-border issues are an example because people will move from one country to another for employment. There is also complexity in incorporating the voluntary sector into plans. There is a need to find imaginative ways to encourage those who have trained in Wales to stay in Wales, in employment.

We received significant evidence on the gaps in the data that we have. There is a need for a much more realistic and effective data-gathering exercise in relation to the number of staff that GPs employ and the vacancy rates within the NHS.

Finally, the information that the Minister gave us yesterday about the inspection in Gwent pinpoints the problem at the crux of the issue, which is the gap between what health organisations can afford and the number of staff that they should be able to

presennol ar strwythurau yn y gwasanaeth iechyd, oherwydd rhaid i unrhyw strwythur newydd gael digon o gapasiti ar gyfer cynllunio gweithlu. Mae'n werth crybwyll hefyd ar y pwynt hwn fod problem capasiti hefyd mewn nifer o'n hawdurdodau lleol o ran cynllunio gweithlu ar gyfer gofal cymdeithasol. Mae angen agwedd lawer mwy holistig sy'n ystyried y materion yn eu cyfanrwydd, yn hytrach na'u rhannu o fewn pob awdurdod lleol ac o fewn pob agwedd ar yr holl lwybr cleifion.

Mae'r pwyllgor a mi yn pryderu'n arbennig am dystiolaeth gan y proffesiynau iechyd perthynol—gan y therapyddion, yn arbennig—a oedd yn dweud bod y niferoedd a gyflogir wedi'u seilio ar ddata ac ymarfer hanesyddol a chyfyngiadau ariannol, nid ar wir angen. Mewn un set o dystiolaeth, dangoswyd asesiad mawr a realistig o angen, ond yr oedd yr asesiad hwnnw wedi'i grynhoi i nifer fach o swyddi a oedd i gael eu creu ar ddiwedd cylch cynllunio ariannol, nad oedd unrhyw gysylltiad o gwbl rhyngddo â gwir angen. Nid problem cyfyngiadau ariannol yn unig sydd yma: mae hi hefyd yn ymwneud â symud meddyliau'r rhai sy'n comisiynu ac yn delio â'r cyflogi ymlaen i roi pwyslais ar bwysigrwydd symud o ofal aciwt i ofal yn y gymuned.

Crybwyllaf yn fyr gymhlethdod rhai o'r materion hyn. Mae materion trawsffiniol yn enghraifft oherwydd bydd pobl yn symud o un wlad i'r llall i gael eu cyflogi. Ceir cymhlethdod hefyd wrth gorffori'r sector gwirfoddol mewn cynlluniau. Mae angen dod o hyd i ffyrdd dyfeisgar i annog y rheini sydd wedi'u hyfforddi yng Nghymru i aros yng Nghymru, mewn cyflogaeth.

Cawsom dystiolaeth arwyddocaol ynghylch y bylchau yn y data sydd gennym. Mae angen ymarfer casglu data sy'n ymarfer llawer mwy realistig ac effeithiol o ran nifer y staff y mae meddygon teulu'n eu cyflogi a chyfraddau'r swyddi gwag o fewn y GIG.

Yn olaf, mae'r wybodaeth a roddodd y Gweinidog inni ddoe am yr arolygiad yng Ngwent yn nodi'n union graidd y mater, sef y bwlch rhwng yr hyn y mae cyrff iechyd yn gallu ei fforddio a nifer y staff y dylent allu ei fforddio os ydynt i gael rhagoriaeth

afford if they are to have professional excellence.

Helen Mary Jones: I welcome the opportunity to take part in this debate on a committee report that took a lot of work and time. I would like to add my thanks to those already expressed to all those who gave evidence and who participated in the inquiry. Personally, I learned a great deal, and a great deal of what I learned was not desperately encouraging. In that context, I am pleased that the Government accepts most of our recommendations and I look forward to scrutinising their implementation through the committee. Obviously, if we cannot get our workforce right, we cannot get our care right; it is as simple and basic as that.

I wish to focus my comments on two of the recommendations with regard to social care that the Government has not fully accepted—recommendations 19–24. Recommendation 19 asks the Welsh Assembly Government to provide further support to voluntary and independent sector social care providers and service-user groups to enhance their ability to engage with the workforce planning process. The Government accepts this recommendation in principle, but goes on in its comments to refer to the need to address this locally and regionally and to retain local leadership. Given the complexity of the sector, it is self-evidently true that co-ordination will have to happen locally and on the ground. However, all the evidence that we took as a committee about this matter suggested that practice in terms of involving independent and voluntary sector providers, let alone service users, in planning and developing the workforce is patchy at best in social care, and often non-existent.

Would the Minister be able to look, if not at that specific recommendation, at the issue again? Although extra resources are going in, as the Government response states—and, obviously, we welcome that—I do not believe that funding alone will crack this problem. There is a cultural issue about

broffesiynol.

Helen Mary Jones: Croesawaf y cyfle i gymryd rhan yn y ddatl hon ar adroddiad pwyllgor a olygodd lawer o waith ac a gymerodd lawer o amser. Hoffwn ychwanegu fy niolchiadau at y rheini a fynegwyd eisoes i bawb a roddodd dystiolaeth ac a gymerodd ran yn yr ymchwiliad. Yn bersonol, dysgais lawer, ac nid oedd llawer o'r hyn a ddysgais yn galonogol tu hwnt. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, yr wyf yn falch fod y Llywodraeth yn derbyn y rhan fwyaf o'n hargymhellion, ac yr wyf yn edrych ymlaen at graffu ar eu gweithredu drwy'r pwyllgor. Yn amlwg, os na allwn sicrhau bod ein gweithlu'n iawn, ni allwn sicrhau bod ein gofal yn iawn; mae mor syml a sylfaenol â hynny.

Yr wyf yn dymuno canolbwyntio fy sylwadau ar ddau o'r argymhellion o ran gofal cymdeithasol nad yw'r Llywodraeth wedi'u derbyn yn llawn—argymhellion 19 a 24. Mae argymhelliad 19 yn gofyn i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru roi cefnogaeth bellach i ddarparwyr gofal cymdeithasol yn y sectorau gwirfoddol ac annibynnol a grwpiau defnyddwyr gwasanaeth, i gynyddu eu gallu i ymgysylltu â'r broses cynllunio gweithlu. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn derbyn yr argymhelliad hwn mewn egwyddor, ond mae'n mynd rhagddi yn ei sylwadau i gyfeirio at yr angen i fynd i'r afael â hyn yn lleol ac yn rhanbarthol ac i gadw arweinyddiaeth leol. O gofio cymhlethdod y sector, mae'n hunanamlwg o wir y bydd yn rhaid cael cydlynw yn lleol ac ar lawr gwlad. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd yr holl dystiolaeth a gymerwyd gennym fel pwyllgor ynghylch y mater hwn yn awgrymu bod yr arfer—o ran cynnwys darparwyr yn y sectorau annibynnol a gwirfoddol, heb sôn am ddefnyddwyr gwasanaethau, wrth gynllunio a datblygu'r gweithlu—yn anwastad ar y gorau mewn gofal cymdeithasol, ac yn aml heb fod ar gael o gwbl.

A fyddai'r Gweinidog yn gallu ystyried y mater eto, os nad yr argymhelliad penodol hwnnw? Er bod adnoddau ychwanegol yn mynd i mewn, fel y mae ymateb y Llywodraeth yn ei ddweud—ac yn amlwg yr ydym yn croesawu hynny—ni chredaf y bydd ariannu yn unig yn datrys y broblem hon.

needing local authorities to be proactive in working with the independent sector that provides so much of their care and in working with voluntary organisations in particular. There is resistance to that, and it will take strong national leadership to kick-start the local leadership that the Government rightly says we need to make this happen. It is vital that it happens, because it is precisely those independent and voluntary providers that provide most of the day-to-day care for some of the most vulnerable people in our communities. It is essential that we find ways for service users' voices to be heard. Therefore, if it is not appropriate for the Government to support, more than it is doing, independent and voluntary sector providers directly to participate, perhaps it might be appropriate for the Government to issue strong guidance to local authorities to spread what good practice exists and then to monitor what is done.

Without the involvement of those front-line providers, particularly those carers who are not qualified at the moment—and we are just getting to the point when we will register them—we will not be able to undertake adequately workforce planning, which may lead to our having to rely on temporary staff and large numbers of staff coming in from other countries. They are very welcome, but they do not always have the training, the background—as we heard—and the language skills to be able to look after people. Therefore, I ask the Government to look again at the principle behind that recommendation, if it cannot go further than accepting the detail in principle.

Moving on to recommendation 24, I should perhaps declare what is at least an emotional interest as a former social worker and youth and community worker. The recommendation is:

'We recommend that the Welsh Assembly Government undertakes work with partners in local government to harmonise the terms and conditions of employment of social workers'.

Mae mater diwylliannol yn gysylltiedig â'r angen i awdurdodau lleol fod yn rhagweithiol wrth weithio gyda'r sector annibynnol sy'n darparu cymaint o'u gofal ac wrth weithio gyda chyrff gwirfoddol yn arbennig. Mae yna wrthwynebiad i hynny, a bydd yn rhaid cael arweinyddiaeth genedlaethol gadarn i ddechrau'r arweinyddiaeth leol y mae'r Llywodraeth yn dweud yn gywir fod arnom ei hangen i wneud i hyn ddigwydd. Mae'n allweddol i hyn ddigwydd, oherwydd yr union ddarparwyr annibynnol a gwirfoddol hynny sy'n rhoi'r rhan fwyaf o'r gofal o ddydd i ddydd i rai o'r bobl sydd fwyaf agored i niwed yn ein cymunedau. Mae'n angenrheidiol inni ddod o hyd i ffyrdd i leisiau defnyddwyr y gwasanaethau gael eu clywed. Felly, os nad yw'n briodol i'r Llywodraeth gefnogi, yn fwy nag a wnaiff ar hyn o bryd, y darparwyr annibynnol a gwirfoddol i gymryd rhan uniongyrchol, efallai y byddai'n briodol i'r Llywodraeth ddarparu arweiniad cadarn i awdurdodau lleol i ledaenu'r arfer da sydd ar gael eisoes ac yna i fonitro'r hyn a wneir.

Heb i'r darparwyr rheng flaen hynny gael eu cynnwys, yn arbennig y gofalywyr hynny nad oes ganddynt gymwysterau ar hyn o bryd—ac yr ydym ar fin cyrraedd y pwynt pan fyddwn yn eu cofrestru—ni fyddwn yn gallu ymgymryd yn ddigonol â chynllunio gweithlu, a gallai hynny arwain at sefyllfa lle byddem yn gorfod dibynnu ar staff dros dro neu niferoedd mawr o staff yn dod i mewn o wledydd eraill. Mae croeso mawr iddynt, ond nid oes ganddynt bob amser yr hyfforddiant, y cefndir—fel y clywsom—na'r sgiliau iaith i allu gofalu am bobl. Felly, gofynnaf i'r Llywodraeth ailystyried yr egwyddor sydd y tu ôl i'r argymhelliad hwnnw, os nad yw'n gallu mynd ymhellach na derbyn y manylyn mewn egwyddor.

I symud ymlaen at argymhelliad 24, dylwn efallai ddatgan yr hyn sydd o leiaf yn ddiddordeb emosiynol imi fel cyn-weithiwr cymdeithasol a gweithiwr ieuencid a gweithiwr cymunedol. Yr argymhelliad yw:

Yr ydym yn argymhell bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n ymgymryd â gwaith gyda phartneriaid mewn llywodraeth leol i gysoni telerau ac amodau cyflogaeth gweithwyr cymdeithasol.

To make a comparison, if you are a teacher in Wales, you will know that wherever you work, depending on your experience and responsibilities, you will be guaranteed certain levels of pay, you will know what your holidays will be, and you will know what your terms and conditions are. That used to be true of social workers, but it is not true any more. The Government neither accepts nor rejects our recommendation, but it says that it will pass it on to the Welsh Local Government Association. Technically, of course this is a matter for the Welsh Local Government Association, but I would submit that the fact that the recruitment and retention of social workers remains a major problem in some areas, despite improvement, is a matter for us all, and particularly for Ministers. It is particularly a matter for us all that, as we heard in evidence, some authorities are struggling and levels of vacancies or posts filled by temporary staff are dangerously high—I do not use the word ‘dangerously’ lightly—particularly in high-pressure roles, such as those connected with child protection.

Terms and conditions are not the sole solution to these problems, but, as others have mentioned, the evidence that we took suggested that they play a part. As a nation, we need to send a message to social workers that we value them. Pay and conditions are part of how you know as a professional whether you are valued or not. Technically, of course this is a matter for the Welsh Local Government Association, but it has not managed to resolve it over many years. Our recommendation acknowledges that and urges the Welsh Assembly Government to work with partners in local government.

I believe that the Assembly Government has a role to play in leading and in encouraging and persuading local government in this regard. I ask the Minister to reconsider the response to that recommendation. I ask her not simply to invite the Welsh Local Government Association to consider this

I gymharu, os ydych yn athro yng Nghymru, byddwch yn gwybod, ble bynnag y byddwch yn gweithio, yn ôl eich profiad a'ch cyfrifoldebau, y bydd lefelau penodol o dâl yn cael eu gwarantu ichi, byddwch yn gwybod faint o wyliau a gewch, a byddwch yn gwybod beth fydd eich telerau a'ch amodau. Arferai hynny fod yn wir am weithwyr cymdeithasol, ond nid yw'n wir bellach. Nid yw'r Llywodraeth yn derbyn nac yn gwrthod ein hargymhelliad, ond dywed y bydd yn ei anfon ymlaen at Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru. Yn dechnegol, wrth gwrs, mater i Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru yw hwn, ond byddwn yn dadlau bod y ffaith bod recriwtio a chadw gweithwyr cymdeithasol yn dal yn broblem fawr mewn rhai ardaloedd, er gwaethaf gwelliannau, yn fater inni i gyd, ac yn arbennig i Weinidogion. Mae'n fater inni i gyd, yn arbennig, fod rhai awdurdodau, fel y clywsom mewn tystiolaeth, yn cael anhawster a bod lefelau swyddi gwag neu swyddi sy'n cael eu llenwi gan staff dros dro yn beryglus o uchel—nid wyf yn defnyddio'r gair ‘peryglus’ yn ysgafn—yn arbennig mewn rolau lle mae llawer o bwysau, megis y rheini sy'n gysylltiedig ag amddiffyn plant.

Nid telerau ac amodau yw'r unig ateb i'r problemau hyn, ond fel y mae eraill wedi crybwyll, yr oedd y dystiolaeth a gymerwyd gennym yn awgrymu bod ganddynt ran. Fel cenedl, mae angen inni anfon neges at weithwyr cymdeithasol ein bod yn eu gwerthfawrogi. Mae tâl ac amodau yn rhan o'r modd y gwyddoch fel unigolyn proffesiynol a ydych yn cael eich gwerthfawrogi ai peidio. Yn dechnegol, wrth gwrs, mater i Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru yw hwn, ond nid yw wedi llwyddo i'w ddatrys dros nifer o flynyddoedd. Mae ein hargymhelliad yn cydnabod hynny ac yn annog Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i weithio gyda phartneriaid mewn llywodraeth leol.

Credaf fod gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad rôl i'w chwarae o ran arwain ac annog a pherswadio llywodraeth leol yn hyn o beth. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ailstyried yr ymateb i'r argymhelliad hwnnw. Gofynnaf iddi nid yn unig wahodd Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru i ystyried yr

recommendation but perhaps to consider being proactive in persuading it not just to consider it, but to implement it.

3.10 p.m.

With those reservations, I welcome once again the Government's overall support for our recommendations and look forward to seeing them implemented.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Edwina Hart): I fully understand Helen Mary's contribution and the Care Council for Wales will be undertaking work in that particular area. However, I will ask my Deputy Minister, Gwenda Thomas, to review the evidence that the committee took on those aspects, because you made some forceful points, Helen Mary, about what we need to do, in conjunction with our partners in local government, to ensure the delivery of services. I hope that you will accept my assurance on that matter.

Nick's was the first contribution—apart from that from Jonathan—and it opened the general debate. You are right about the data issue, Nick. That is key to the development of better workforce planning, and we certainly have to do more work in that area. I hope that we will see improvements in the workforce planning issues this year as we look at data.

Val concentrated on key issues about internship and community nurses. I think that we may crack some of the community nursing issues, but we certainly have to look at how we can deal with some of those other issues.

The key point is capacity within the NHS—and local government, in relation to linked services—to undertake workforce planning. The committee has considered that in detail as part of its report. This has kick-started my thinking about what more I need to do, over and above giving additional resources to the National Leadership and Innovation Agency For Healthcare.

argymhelliad hwn ond efallai ystyried bod yn rhagweithiol wrth berswadio CLILC nid yn unig i'w ystyried, ond i'w weithredu.

Gyda'r amodau hynny, yr wyf yn croesawu unwaith eto gefnogaeth gyffredinol y Llywodraeth i'n hargymhellion, ac edrychaf ymlaen at weld eu gweithredu.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Edwina Hart): Yr wyf yn deall yn llawn gyfraniad Helen Mary a bydd Cyngor Gofal Cymru yn gwneud gwaith yn y maes penodol hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, gofynnaf i'm Dirprwy Weinidog, Gwenda Thomas, adolygu'r dystiolaeth a gymerodd y pwyllgor ar yr agweddau hynny, oherwydd gwnaethoch rai pwyntiau cryf, Helen Mary, am yr hyn y mae angen inni ei wneud, ar y cyd â'n partneriaid mewn llywodraeth leol, i sicrhau bod gwasanaethau'n cael eu darparu. Gobeithio y byddwch yn derbyn fy sicrwydd ar y mater hwnnw.

Gan Nick y cafwyd y cyfraniad cyntaf—ar wahân i gyfraniad Jonathan—a hwnnw a agorodd y ddadl gyffredinol. Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle ynghylch y mater data, Nick. Mae hynny'n allweddol i ddatblygu cynllunio'r gweithlu yn well, ac yn sicr rhaid inni wneud mwy o waith yn y maes hwnnw. Gobeithio y gwelwn welliannau ym materion cynllunio'r gweithlu eleni wrth inni ystyried y data.

Canolbwyntiodd Val ar faterion allweddol ynghylch lleoedd hyfforddi a nyrsys cymunedol. Credaf y byddwn, efallai, yn datrys rhai o'r materion nyrsio cymunedol, ond yn sicr rhaid inni ystyried sut y gallwn ddelio â rhai o'r materion eraill hynny.

Y pwynt allweddol yw capasiti o fewn y GIG—a llywodraeth leol, o ran gwasanaethau cyswllt—i ymgymryd â chynllunio'r gweithlu. Mae'r pwyllgor wedi ystyried hynny'n fanwl fel rhan o'i adroddiad. Mae hyn wedi ysgogi fy syniadau am yr hyn yn rhagor y mae angen imi ei wneud, yn ychwanegol at roi mwy o adnoddau i'r Asiantaeth Genedlaethol Arwain ac Arloesi mewn Gofal Iechyd.

I will review the content of this debate and think about whether I can be more helpful in terms of the committee's report, as I take matters forward. I assure the Chamber and the committee that I take this report seriously and I am grateful for the work that the committee has undertaken, which will help Government policy.

Jonathan Morgan: I thank all members of the committee who have contributed this afternoon and generally welcome the Minister's response.

The Minister referred to recommendation 10, and we accept that we have good numbers of doctors in Wales, but we also think that the idea of incentivising people once they have qualified is worth while. I am pleased that you are open to that. On recommendation 13, we look forward to seeing the outcome of the report to the Minister, and I welcome the offer that you made of providing a written statement in the autumn.

Nick Ramsay rightly referred to the quality of data. The data currently available to social care providers in particular are not of a high quality and they are not comprehensive enough for workforce planning to be based on them. With a new workforce planning system being introduced in the NHS, now would be a good time to review the base of information that we have in the health service. That is one of the fundamental problems in the monitoring, collection, and use of data. If we improve that, we would hopefully see improvements in the way in which services are planned in the future.

Val Lloyd, with her background in nursing, made the important point about community nurses. If we are going to see more services being developed and delivered away from the acute sector, community nursing numbers and support for their role in an active way in the community will be vital.

Jenny Randerson was right to point out that it was the Royal College of Nursing and the Chartered Society of Physiotherapy that sparked our interest in the area of workforce

Byddaf yn adolygu cynnwys y ddatl hon ac yn ystyried a allaf gynorthwyo rhagor o ran adroddiad y pwyllgor, wrth imi symud materion ymlaen. Yr wyf yn sicrhau'r Siambr a'r pwyllgor fy mod yn cymryd yr adroddiad hwn o ddifrif, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y gwaith y mae'r pwyllgor wedi'i wneud, gwaith a fydd yn helpu polisi'r Llywodraeth.

Jonathan Morgan: Diolch i holl aelodau'r pwyllgor a gyfrannodd y prynhawn yma, a chroesawaf yn gyffredinol ymateb y Gweinidog.

Cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog at argymhelliad 10, ac yr ydym yn derbyn bod gennym niferoedd da o feddygon yng Nghymru, ond credwn hefyd bod y syniad o roi cymhelliad i bobl ar ôl ennill cymhwyster yn werth chweil. Yr wyf yn falch eich bod yn agored i hynny. O ran argymhelliad 13, edrychwn ymlaen at weld canlyniad yr adroddiad i'r Gweinidog, ac yr wyf yn croesawu'r cynnig a wnaethoch i ddarparu adroddiad ysgrifenedig yn yr hydref.

Cyfeiriodd Nick Ramsay yn gywir at ansawdd y data. Nid yw'r data sydd ar gael ar hyn o bryd i ddarparwyr gofal cymdeithasol yn arbennig o safon uchel, and nid yw'r data'n ddigon cynhwysfawr i fod yn sail i gynllunio gweithlu. Gan fod system newydd o gynllunio gweithlu yn cael ei chyflwyno yn y GIG, byddai nawr yn amser da i adolygu sail y wybodaeth sydd gennym yn y gwasanaeth iechyd. Dyna un o'r problemau sylfaenol wrth fonitro, casglu a defnyddio data. Petaem yn gwella hynny, gobeithio y byddem yn gweld gwelliannau yn y ffordd y caiff gwasanaethau eu cynllunio yn y dyfodol.

Gwnaeth Val Lloyd, gyda'i chefnidir mewn nyrsio, y pwynt pwysig am nyrsys cymunedol. Os ydym am weld mwy o wasanaethau'n cael eu datblygu a'u darparu y tu allan i'r sector aciwt, bydd niferoedd y rhai sy'n nyrsio yn y gymuned a'r gefnogaeth a roddir i'w rôl yn y gymuned mewn ffordd weithredol yn allweddol.

Dyweddodd Jenny Randerson yn gwbl gywir mai Coleg Brenhinol y Nyrsys a'r Gymdeithas Siartredig Ffisiotherapi a ysgogodd ein diddordeb ym maes cynllunio'r

planning. We had quite a shock when we started to look at the lack of capacity within the health service, particularly in NLIAH, where, we discovered, there was only one fully trained workforce planner. She was very good, but she was very much on her own. I felt awfully sorry for her when I realised the size of her task in trying to undertake workforce planning for the NHS in Wales. However, the capacity of the NHS to plan effectively was a problem. We found that to be the case in local health boards, local government, and in NLIAH. Jenny Randerson was right to point to maternity services in Gwent as an example of the lack of workforce planning causing a problem for the delivery of services.

Helen Mary Jones was right to point to recommendations 19 and 24. We need to be better at engaging the voluntary and private sectors in workforce planning. Local government representatives were quite keen to do what they could to help in this area, but they recognise their own problems of capacity. Therefore, there has to be better engagement between local government and the voluntary and private sectors.

On recommendation 24, the harmonisation of social workers' conditions and pay, the evidence was absolutely clear and robust. It is not just a matter for the Welsh Local Government Association. The recommendation calls on the Assembly Government to work with the WLGA, but it is also a matter for us, because, if we accept that teachers and medical staff are part of a standardised framework in Wales, surely social workers should also have that opportunity, if we are to improve the standing of social workers.

I welcome the way in which this debate was conducted, and the positive way in which the Government responded to the recommendations. Finally, I thank all those who gave evidence, our research team, our clerks and secretariat, and members of the committee for the way in which its work was

gweithlu. Cawsom gryn sioc pan ddechreusom edrych ar y diffyg capasiti yn y gwasanaeth iechyd, yn arbennig yn yr Asiantaeth Genedlaethol Arwain ac Arloesi mewn Gofal Iechyd. Gwelsom mai un cynlluniwr gweithlu'n unig wedi'i hyfforddi'n llawn oedd yno. Yr oedd hi'n dda iawn, ond yr oedd ar ei phen ei hun yn llwyr. Teimlais drueni mawr drosti pan sylweddolais faint oedd ei thasg wrth iddi geisio ymgymryd â chynllunio'r gweithlu ar gyfer y GIG yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd capasiti'r GIG i gynllunio'n effeithiol yn broblem. Gwelsom fod hynny'n wir mewn byrddau iechyd lleol, llywodraeth leol, ac yn yr Asiantaeth Genedlaethol Arwain ac Arloesi mewn Gofal Iechyd. Yr oedd Jenny Randerson yn gywir wrth sôn am wasanaethau mamolaeth yng Ngwent fel enghraifft o ddiffyg cynllunio gweithlu yn achosi problem mewn darparu gwasanaethau.

Yr oedd Helen Mary Jones yn gywir wrth dynnu sylw at argymhellion 19 a 24. Mae angen inni fod yn well wrth gynnwys y sectorau gwirfoddol a phreifat mewn gwaith cynllunio gweithlu. Yr oedd cynrychiolwyr llywodraeth leol yn eithaf awyddus i wneud yr hyn a allent i gynorthwyo yn y maes hwn, ond maent yn cydnabod eu problemau eu hunain ynglŷn â chapasiti. Felly, rhaid cael gwell ymwneud rhwng llywodraeth leol a'r sectorau gwirfoddol a phreifat.

O ran argymhelliad 24, sef cysoni amodau a chyflog gweithwyr cymdeithasol, yr oedd y dystiolaeth yn gwbl glir a chadarn. Nid mater i Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru yn unig ydyw. Mae'r argymhelliad yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i weithio gyda CLILC, ond mae hefyd yn fater i ni, oherwydd os derbyniwn fod athrawon a staff meddygol yn rhan o fframwaith safonedig yng Nghymru, siawns na ddylai gweithwyr cymdeithasol hefyd gael y cyfle hwnnw, os ydym i wella safle gweithwyr cymdeithasol.

Croesawaf y modd y cynhaliwyd y ddadl hon, a'r modd cadarnhaol yr ymatebodd y Llywodraeth i'r argymhellion. Yn olaf, diolchaf i bawb a roddodd dystiolaeth, i'n tîm ymchwil, i'n clerod ac i'n hysgrifenyddiaeth, ac i aelodau'r pwyllgor am y modd y cwblhawyd ei waith. Gwyddom

concluded. We know that workforce planning is exceptionally complex, but, if we want high-quality staff, with the right skills and in the right numbers running our health and social care services, we need to ensure that the workforce planning framework for collecting data is as robust as possible. If it is not, we will be giving up one of the basic tools to help to improve services for those people in Wales who need them, and, quite frankly, we cannot afford to do that.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The proposal is to note the report of the Health, Wellbeing and Local Government Committee. Does any Member object? I see that there are no objections. The motion is therefore agreed in accordance with Standing Order No. 7.35.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

fod cynllunio gweithlu'n fater dyrys dros ben, ond os ydym am gael staff o safon uchel, gyda'r sgiliau iawn ac yn y niferoedd iawn yn rhedeg ein gwasanaethau gofal cymdeithasol ac iechyd, mae angen inni sicrhau bod y fframwaith cynllunio gweithlu ar gyfer casglu data mor gadarn â phosibl. Os nad ydyw, byddwn yn ildio un o'r cyfryngau sylfaenol i helpu gwella gwasanaethau i'r bobl hynny yng Nghymru y mae arnynt eu hangen, ac i ddweud y gwir, ni allwn fforddio gwneud hynny.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Y cynnig yw nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Iechyd, Lles a Llywodraeth Leol. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf nad oes dim gwrthwynebiadau. Cytunir y cynnig felly yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.35.

Dadl Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru Welsh Liberal Democrats Debate

Addysg Uwch Higher Education

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1, 3 and 5 in the name of Jonathan Morgan, and amendments 2 and 4 in the name of William Graham.

Kirsty Williams: I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. notes the contribution that higher education makes to the economy of Wales;

2. notes the significant contribution that part time learners make to higher education;

3. notes with concern that, according to Higher Education Funding Council for Wales (HEFCW), the higher education funding gap between Welsh and English HEIs has grown to £61 million;

4. calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to:

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 3 a 5 yn enw Jonathan Morgan, a gwelliannau 2 a 3 yn enw William Graham.

Kirsty Williams: Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. yn nodi'r cyfraniad y mae addysg uwch yn ei wneud i economi Cymru;

2. yn nodi'r cyfraniad sylweddol y mae dysgwyr rhan amser yn ei wneud i addysg uwch;

3. yn nodi â phryder bod y bwlch cyllido addysg uwch rhwng sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru ac yn Lloegr wedi tyfu i £61 miliwn yn ôl Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru;

4. yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i:

a) address the funding gap between Welsh and English HEIs; and

b) ensure that there is a parity of esteem for part-time learners in HE, especially in the areas of fees and student support. (NDM3943)

I remind colleagues that, in 2004, the Welsh Assembly Government's Nexus report concluded that our universities were vital players in delivering our objectives of creating a healthier, wealthier and smarter nation. For the individual, the financial return on education for graduates is over 50 per cent more than that for individuals with A-levels alone. To their immediate localities, higher education institutions are significant employers and consumers of local goods and services. They provide teaching, cultural and sporting facilities for their own students and the community as a whole, and, collectively, their contribution to the nation's economy is significant and is growing. According to figures from the University of Strathclyde, the higher education sector had a turnover of £918 million in 2005-06, and, for every £1 million invested in higher education by the National Assembly for Wales in that year, the sector contributed £5.3 million to the nation's economy. When the direct multiplier effects are included, the HE sector generated £2 billion-worth output to the Welsh economy as a whole. It attracted £121 million in total research grants and £205 million from contracts, services and other income streams. Therefore, we cannot underestimate our universities as crucial economic players, regionally and nationally. This force must be successfully harnessed to address the ongoing weaknesses in the Welsh economy, because Wales is currently at the bottom of the UK wealth league table, behind every English region, Scotland and Northern Ireland.

The economic research advisory panel report, again for this Welsh Assembly Government, suggested that low productivity was the key weakness, because even when you factored out inactivity levels, Wales still had the lowest level of productivity of any British

a) rhoi sylw i'r bwlch cyllido rhwng sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru ac yn Lloegr; a

b) sicrhau bod parch cydradd ar gyfer dysgwyr rhan amser mewn addysg uwch, yn enwedig ym meysydd ffioedd a chefnogaeth i fyfyrwyr. (NDM3943)

Atgoffaf fy nghyd-Aelodau fod adroddiad Plethwaith Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, yn 2004, wedi dod i'r casgliad fod ein prifysgolion yn chwaraewyr hollbwysig i gyflawni ein hamcanion, sef creu cenedl iachach, gyfoethocach a chraffach. I'r unigolyn, mae'r enillion ariannol o addysg i raddedigion dros 50 y cant yn fwy nag i unigolion gyda chymhwyster Safon Uwch yn unig. I'w hardaloedd cyfagos, mae sefydliadau addysg uwch yn gyflogwyr pwysig ac yn ddefnyddwyr gwasanaethau a nwyddau lleol. Maent yn darparu cyfleusterau chwaraeon, diwylliannol ac addysgu i'w myfyrwyr eu hunain ac i'r gymuned yn gyffredinol, a chyda'i gilydd mae eu cyfraniad at economi'r wlad yn sylweddol ac yn tyfu. Yn ôl ffigurau o Brifysgol Strathclyde, cafodd y sector addysg uwch drosiant o £918 miliwn yn 2005-06, ac am bob £1 filiwn a fuddsoddodd Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru mewn addysg uwch y flwyddyn honno cyfrannodd y sector £5.3 miliwn at economi'r wlad. Pan gynhwysir effeithiau uniongyrchol y lluosydd, cynhyrchodd y sector AU gynnyrch gwerth £2 biliwn i economi Cymru gyfan. Denodd gyfanswm o £121 miliwn o grantiau ymchwil a £205 miliwn o gontractau, gwasanaethau a llifau incwm eraill. Felly, ni allwn danbriso ein prifysgolion fel chwaraewyr economaidd hanfodol, yn rhanbarthol ac yn genedlaethol. Rhaid harneisio'r grym hwn yn llwyddiannus er mwyn rhoi sylw i'r gwendid parhaus yn economi Cymru, oherwydd mae Cymru ar hyn o bryd ar waelod tabl cynghrair cyfoeth y DU, y tu ôl i bob rhanbarth yn Lloegr, yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon.

Awgrymai adroddiad y panel cynghori ar ymchwil economaidd, unwaith eto ar gyfer y Llywodraeth hon, mai cynhyrchiant isel oedd y gwendid allweddol, oherwydd hyd yn oed wrth ichi ddileu ffactorau lefelau anweithgarwch, yng Nghymru o hyd yr oedd

region. It is low attainment levels of higher qualifications that can go some way towards explaining that, and it is the attainment of high-level skills that are most significant in influencing productivity levels within an economy. Despite this picture, the opportunities to do more in this regard from the higher education sector is under significant threat from the policies being pursued by the Government and its inability to admit, let alone address, the growing funding gap between Welsh universities and their counterparts in England and Scotland.

We have to look at that in the wider picture, because it becomes even more serious when you note that the UK as a whole does not have a great track record in this area. Public investment in the UK in higher education runs at 0.8 per cent of the gross domestic product, which is less than the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development and EU averages of 1.1 per cent of a nation's GDP being invested in this sector.

3.20 p.m.

In Wales, the latest figures from HEFCW—and let us remind ourselves that it is a Government body, and not some partisan think tank—show that the gap between England and Wales has increased by 53 per cent in just one year, from £40 million in 2004-05 to £61 million in 2005-06. If you compare that with Scotland, you find that it is a staggering jump of 64 per cent. That gap is forecast to rise again to £70 million for 2006-07. The consequences were starkly illustrated in the Enterprise and Learning Committee meeting this morning, when two eminent chemistry professors stated that the current gap jeopardised the ability of the higher education sector to contribute to the Welsh economy.

Higher education is now a global market, with fierce competition to attract staff and students. Welsh universities need investment to be able to recruit the best research teams and to provide them with the best equipment and most up-to-date facilities. Failing to do

y lefelau cynhyrchiant isaf mewn unrhyw ranbarth ym Mhrydain. Gall lefelau cyrhaeddiad isel mewn cymwysterau uwch esbonio hynny i raddau helaeth, a'r ffactor mwyaf arwyddocaol sy'n dylanwadu ar lefelau cynhyrchiant mewn economi yw meithrin sgiliau lefel uchel. Er gwaethaf y darlun hwn, mae'r cyfle i wneud rhagor i'r perwyl hwn o du'r sector addysg uwch dan fygythiad sylweddol oherwydd y polisïau y mae'r Llywodraeth yn mynd ar eu trywydd ynghyd â'i hanallu i gyfaddef bod bwlch cyllido cynyddol rhwng prifysgolion Cymru a'u sefydliadau cyfatebol yn Lloegr a'r Alban, heb sôn am roi sylw i hwnnw.

Rhaid inni edrych ar hynny yn y darlun ehangach, oherwydd ei bod yn mynd yn fwy difrifol fyth pan sylwch nad oes gan y DU yn gyffredinol enw da yn y maes hwn. Mae buddsoddiadau cyhoeddus yn y DU ym maes addysg uwch ar hyn o bryd yn 0.8 y cant o'r cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth, ac mae hyn yn llai na ffigurau cyfartalog y Sefydliad ar gyfer Cydweithrediad a Datblygiad Economaidd a'r UE sef bod 1.1 y cant o CMC gwlad yn cael ei fuddsoddi yn y sector hwn.

Yng Nghymru, mae'r ffigurau diweddaraf gan CCAUC—a gadewch inni atgoffa'n hunain mai corff Llywodraethol ydyw, nid rhyw seiat syniadau ddallbleidol—yn dangos bod y bwlch rhwng Lloegr a Chymru wedi cynyddu 53 y cant mewn blwyddyn yn unig, o £40 miliwn yn 2004-05 i £61 miliwn yn 2005-06. Os cymharwch hynny â'r Alban, gwelwch ei bod yn naid aruthrol o 64 y cant. Rhagwelir y bydd y bwlch hwnnw'n cynyddu eto i £70 miliwn ar gyfer 2006-07. Esboniwyd y canlyniadau'n groyw yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu'r bore yma, pan ddywedodd dau athro cemeg amlwg fod y bwlch presennol yn peryglu gallu'r sector addysg uwch i gyfrannu at economi Cymru.

Mae addysg uwch yn awr yn farchnad fyd-eang, gyda chystadleuaeth ffyrnig i ddenu staff a myfyrwyr. Mae ar brifysgolion Cymru angen buddsoddiadau er mwyn gallu recriwtio'r timau ymchwil gorau a darparu iddynt y cyfarpar gorau a'r cyfleusterau

so will mean that our universities cannot adequately compete for research income, not only from UK sources, but European and world sources. The impact on students is also beginning to be felt. To date, Welsh universities have scored highly in student satisfaction surveys. Our university towns are some of the best places to pursue your higher education. Lampeter is ranked seventh, Aberystwyth is ranked eighth, and Swansea, Glamorgan, Bangor and Newport are all up there among the very best places in which to pursue your higher education. Conversely, when it comes to spending on facilities for students, such as information technology and library resources, it is only Bangor that bucks the trend and finds itself at the higher end of the averages. The rest are below the national average.

In 2005, the severity of the situation was acknowledged by all parties in the National Assembly for Wales. I remind my colleagues of no-named day motion 2491, debated that year, and unanimously supported by everyone in the Chamber. Point 3 of that motion sought an undertaking to address any funding gap between Welsh higher education institutions and comparable institutions. That day, Ieuan Wyn Jones said that it was absolutely crucial that that gap be addressed if Welsh universities were to continue to prosper. It was so important that, in October 2007, Plaid Cymru's website trumpeted the news that it and it alone had secured a commitment from the Government to address that funding gap. The only problem, it seems, was that Plaid Cymru forgot to tell either the Finance Minister or the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills at the time, and it certainly forgot to tell the higher education institutions in Wales, because, as we have seen, that gap continues to grow. Far from being sorted, it is getting worse.

As a result of the poor settlement that your Government has provided in the budget that you guys in Plaid Cymru signed up to this year, in real terms, the teaching grant in

diweddaraf. Bydd methu gwneud hynny'n golygu na all ein prifysgolion gystadlu'n ddigonol am incwm ymchwil, nid yn unig o ffynonellau'r DU, ond o ffynonellau Ewropeaidd a byd-eang. Mae'r effaith ar fyfyrwyr hefyd yn dechrau dod i'r amlwg. Hyd yma, mae prifysgolion Cymru wedi sgorio'n uchel mewn arolygon o foddhad myfyrwyr. Mae ein trefi prifysgol yn rhai o'r lleoedd gorau i fynd ar drywydd eich addysg uwch. Mae Llanbedr Pont Steffan yn y seithfed safle, mae Aberystwyth yn wythfed, ac mae Abertawe, Morgannwg, Bangor a Chasnewydd i gyd yn sefyll ochr yn ochr â'r lleoedd gorau oll ar gyfer mynd ar drywydd eich addysg uwch. I'r gwrthwyneb, o safbwynt gwario ar gyfleusterau i fyfyrwyr, megis technoleg gwybodaeth ac adnoddau llyfrgell, Bangor yn unig sy'n wahanol i'r tueddiad ac yn ei chael ei hun ym mhen uchaf y ffigurau cyfartalog. Mae'r gweddill yn is na'r ffigur cyfartalog cenedlaethol.

Yn 2005, cydnabu pob plaid yng Nghynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ddifrifoldeb y sefyllfa. Atgoffaf fy nghyd-Aelodau o gynnig heb ddyddiad trafod 2491, a drafodwyd y flwyddyn honno ac a gefnogwyd yn unfrydol gan bawb yn y Siambr. Ceisiai pwynt 3 yn y cynnig hwnnw gael ymrwymiad i roi sylw i unrhyw fwch cyllido rhwng sefydliadau addysg uwch Cymru a sefydliadau tebyg. Y diwrnod hwnnw, dywedodd Ieuan Wyn Jones ei bod yn gwbl hanfodol rhoi sylw i'r bwch hwnnw os oedd prifysgolion Cymru am barhau i ffynnu. Yr oedd mor bwysig nes oedd gwefan Plaid Cymru, ym mis Hydref 2007, yn cyhoeddi'r newyddion ei bod hi, a hi'n unig, wedi sicrhau ymrwymiad gan y Llywodraeth i roi sylw i'r bwch cyllido hwnnw. Mae'n ymddangos mai'r unig broblem oedd bod Plaid Cymru wedi anghofio dweud wrth naill ai'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid na'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau ar y pryd, ac yr oedd yn bendant wedi anghofio dweud wrth y sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru oherwydd, fel y gwelsom, mae'r bwch hwnnw'n dal i dyfu. Yn hytrach na'i fod wedi ei setlo, mae'n gwaethygu.

O ganlyniad i'r setliad gwael y mae eich Llywodraeth wedi'i ddarparu yn y gyllideb yr ymrwymodd Plaid Cymru a chithau iddi eleni, mewn gwirionedd bydd y grant

Wales in 2008-09 will be cut, while, in England, it will increase. The Department for Innovation, Universities and Skills in England has guaranteed a real terms increase. There has been no such pledge here on the part of the Welsh Assembly Government. What do we have instead? Well, what do you do when you do not know what to do? You create a committee. The Minister is going to form a committee to sort all this out. I am sure that that committee may be able to garner some extra cash for some of those funding streams. However, the Minister and her Government are kidding themselves if they expect that something such as convergence funding alone will make up the shortfall.

Therefore, Minister, I call on you to acknowledge that there is a gap, as stated by HEFCW, and that it needs to be addressed by your Government. The problems in education funding are piling up at your and your Government's door, whether they relate to the foundation phase for our three-year-olds or to the funding gap for higher education for our older learners. You are seriously short-changing them and the people who teach them. Carwyn Jones and Jane Davidson must be glad that they bailed out, and left you holding the baby.

The Minister for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills (Jane Hutt): I propose the following amendments in the name of Carwyn Jones. Amendment 1: in point 3, delete 'with concern'.

Amendment 3: in point 4, delete (a) and replace with:

investigate innovative ways to ensure the fairest allocation of funding between institutions and students.

Amendment 5: add a new point at end of motion:

endorses the Welsh Assembly Government's commitment to 'Developing adult learning', as set out in the 'One Wales' programme.

Alun Cairns: I propose the following

addysgu yng Nghymru yn 2008-09 yn cael ei gwtogi, tra bydd yn cynyddu yn Lloegr. Mae'r Adran Arloesedd, Prifysgolion a Sgiliau yn Lloegr wedi sicrhau cynnydd mewn termau real. Ni fu addewid o'r fath yma gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Beth sydd gennym ni yn hytrach? Wel, beth wnewch chi pan na wyddoch beth i'w wneud? Creu pwyllgor. Mae'r Gweinidog yn bwriadu ffurfio pwyllgor i roi trefn ar hyn i gyd. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd y pwyllgor hwnnw hwyrach yn gallu casglu rhyw gymaint o arian ychwanegol ar gyfer rhai o'r ffrydiau ariannu hynny. Er hynny, mae'r Gweinidog a'i Llywodraeth yn eu twyllo'u hunain os ydynt yn disgwyl i rywbeth fel arian cydgyfeirio'n unig wneud iawn am y diffyg.

O'r herwydd, Weinidog, galwaf arnoch i gydnabod bod yna fwlch, fel y dywedodd CCAUC, a bod angen i'ch Llywodraeth roi sylw iddo. Mae'r problemau ym maes cyllid addysg yn pentyrru wrth eich drws chi a drws eich Llywodraeth, p'un a ydynt yn ymwneud â'r cyfnod sylfaen i'n plant tair oed ynteu â'r bwlch cyllido ar gyfer addysg uwch i'n dysgwyr hŷn. Yr ydych yn eu twyllo hwy'n ddifrifol a'r bobl sy'n eu dysgu. Mae Carwyn Jones a Jane Davidson yn sicr o fod yn falch nad ydynt yn gysylltiedig â hyn mwyach, a'u bod wedi gadael y baban yn eich gofal chi.

Y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau (Jane Hutt): Cynigiad y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Carwyn Jones. Gwelliant 1: ym mhwynt 3, dileu 'â phryder'.

Gwelliant 3: ym mhwynt 4, dileu (a) ac yn ei le rhoi:

ymchwilio i ddulliau arloesol o sicrhau bod cyllid yn cael ei rannu yn y modd mwyaf teg rhwng sefydliadau a myfyrwyr.

Gwelliant 5: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn cymeradwyo ymrwymiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i 'Ddatblygu dysgu ymhlith oedolion', fel y nodir yn rhaglen 'Cymru'n Un'.

Alun Cairns: Cynigiad y gwelliannau

amendments in the name of William Graham. Amendment 2: insert as new point 4 and renumber accordingly:

expresses concern over the fall in the numbers of applications to Welsh HEIs during the coming academic term and the implications this will have on their financial capacity, investment in excellence, as well as the consequential detriment to the overall economy;

Amendment 4: add new sub point after sub point b):

to explain their policy for funding Welsh students studying courses elsewhere in the UK, which are not available in Wales.

I am pleased that the Welsh Conservative Party supports this motion. It is important to have this debate because at least we can recognise, as does the Enterprise and Learning Committee in conducting its review, the importance of higher education. I look forward to the report that will, no doubt come to the Assembly in time, because it recognises the importance and potential of higher education to our communities, the economy, to lifestyle and to the quality of life in Wales. Who could imagine Aberystwyth without a university, or the impact that it would have if it were to close tomorrow? Not that I am projecting, or predicting that it will. That underlines the importance of that university to the community in Aberystwyth. Think how Newport is expanding along with its university, since the college there was awarded university status some years ago. There are also Swansea and Cardiff universities and all the other HE institutions throughout Wales, with the excellence that they bring to the economy and to Wales, and their flag-waving in Europe and around the globe.

The key to successful higher education institutions is excellence no matter what the field. Excellence can only be delivered through good management, effective use of resources and appropriate funding. That is why this motion is so important: it underlines the funding gap. Often, we hear from politicians that private funds need to be

canlynol yn enw William Graham. Gwelliant 2: cynnwys pwynt 4 newydd ac ail-rifo'r pwyntiau sy'n dilyn:

yn mynegi pryder ynghylch y cwmp yn nifer y ceisiadau i sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru yn ystod y tymor academaidd nesaf a goblygiadau hyn i'w gallu ariannol, i'w buddsoddiad mewn rhagoriaeth, a'r golled i'r economi gyffredinol yn sgil hynny;

Gwelliant 4: ychwanegu is-bwynt newydd ar ôl is-bwynt b):

egluro eu polisi ar gyfer cyllido myfyrwyr o Gymru sy'n astudio cyrsiau mewn mannau eraill yn y DU, nad ydynt ar gael yng Nghymru.

Yr wyf yn falch fod Plaid y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig yn cefnogi'r cynnig hwn. Mae'n bwysig cael y ddadl hon oherwydd o leiaf gallwn gydnabod pwysigrwydd addysg uwch, fel y gwna'r Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu drwy gynnal ei adolygiad. Edrychaf ymlaen at yr adroddiad a fydd, heb os, yn dod gerbron y Cynulliad maes o law, oherwydd mae'n cydnabod pwysigrwydd a photensial addysg uwch i'n cymunedau, i'r economi, i ffordd o fyw ac i ansawdd bywyd yng Nghymru. Pwy a allai ddychmygu Aberystwyth heb brifysgol, neu'r effaith y byddai'n ei chael pe byddai'n cau yfory? Nid fy mod yn rhagamcanu, nac yn darogan y bydd yn cau. Mae hynny'n tanlinellu pwysigrwydd y brifysgol honno i'r gymuned yn Aberystwyth. Meddyliwch sut y mae Casnewydd yn ehangu ochr yn ochr â'i phrifysgol, ers rhoi i'r coleg yno statws prifysgol rai blynyddoedd yn ôl. A dyna hefyd brifysgol Abertawe a phrifysgol Caerdydd a'r holl sefydliadau AU eraill ledled Cymru, gyda'r rhagoriaeth y maent yn ei dwyn i'r economi ac i Gymru, gan chwifio'r faner yn Ewrop a ledled y byd.

Yr allwedd i sefydliadau addysg uwch llwyddiannus yw rhagoriaeth, ni waeth pa faes sydd dan sylw. Gellir sicrhau rhagoriaeth drwy reoli da yn unig, defnyddio adnoddau'n effeithiol a chyllid priodol. Dyna pam y mae'r cynnig hwn mor bwysig: mae'n tanlinellu'r bwch cyllido. Yn aml, clywn gan wleidyddion fod angen denu arian preifat.

levered in. I accept that that is important and that HE institutions in Wales have more to do to attract private funds. However, in credit to those organisations, they can lever in private funds only if they are competing on a level playing field with other higher education institutions across the rest of the UK, particularly England and Scotland. We cannot continue to fund universities £2,000 less per student compared with Scotland and £1,000 less per student compared with England. It is obvious that the funding gap will lead to less research and less capital investment to deliver and drive up those economic opportunities that come from applied research and blue-sky thinking.

If we are really to appreciate and recognise the full benefits that higher education has to offer, we must recognise that investment needs to be at least equivalent to that in HE institutions in England and the rest of Europe, because that is the market that we compete in. Such is the difference in funding, which is mentioned in the motion and was just mentioned by Kirsty Williams, that the gap is now more than £60 million and is growing to £70 million, and the aggregate gap from 2003-04 to now is £190 million.

Janet Ryder: You are the only one who has put a figure on this. Kirsty did not bother to. On this extra money, you also called for £25 million for the foundation phase a fortnight ago, so, in just over two weeks, you have called for more than £90 million of new money for education alone. Where is that money coming from? Is it from public service cuts? We know that the Tories have now said 'yes' to tuition fees, so I presume that you would impose tuition fees on students in Wales and pay for these schemes through that.

3.30 p.m.

Alun Cairns: Let us blow the first claim out of the water to begin with: the Conservative Party certainly has not accepted tuition fees in Wales, because that is not the Welsh Conservative Party policy.

Derbyniaf fod hynny'n bwysig a bod gan sefydliadau AU yng Nghymru ragor i'w wneud i ddenu arian preifat. Fodd bynnag, er clod i'r sefydliadau hynny, gallant ddenu arian preifat dim ond os ydynt yn cystadlu ar lwyfan cystadlu teg â sefydliadau addysg uwch eraill ar draws gweddill y DU, yn enwedig yn Lloegr a'r Alban. Ni allwn barhau i ariannu prifysgolion £2,000 yn llai i bob myfyriwr o'i gymharu â'r Alban a £1,000 yn llai i bob myfyriwr o'i gymharu â Lloegr. Mae'n amlwg y bydd y bwlch cyllido yn arwain at lai o ymchwil a llai o fuddsoddi cyfalaf i ychwanegu at y cyfleoedd economaidd hynny a ddaw o ymchwil gymhwysol ac o feddwl yn baradwysaidd.

Os ydym yn wirioneddol i werthfawrogi a chydabod y manteision llawn sydd gan addysg uwch i'w cynnig, rhaid inni gydnabod bod angen i'r buddsoddiad fod o leiaf yn gyfwerth â'r buddsoddiad mewn sefydliadau addysg uwch yn Lloegr a gweddill Ewrop, oherwydd dyma'r farchnad y cystadlwn ynddi. Cymaint yw'r gwahaniaeth mewn cyllid, fel y crybwyllir yn y cynnig ac fel y crybwyllodd Kirsty Williams yn awr, fel y bydd y bwlch yn awr dros £60 miliwn ac yn tyfu i £70 miliwn, ac mae'r bwlch cyfanredol rhwng 2003-04 ac yn awr yn £190 miliwn.

Janet Ryder: Chi yw'r unig un a roddodd ffigur ar hwn. Ni thrafferthodd Kirsty. O safbwynt yr arian ychwanegol hwn, galwech hefyd am £25 miliwn ar gyfer y cyfnod sylfaen bythefnos yn ôl, felly, mewn ychydig dros bythefnos, yr ydych wedi galw am dros £90 miliwn o arian newydd i addysg yn unig. O ble y daw'r arian hwnnw? Ai o doriadau mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus? Gwyddom fod y Toriaid wedi dweud 'ie' i ffioedd dysgu, felly yr wyf yn rhagdybio y byddech yn codi ffioedd dysgu ar fyfyrwyr yng Nghymru ac yn talu am y cynlluniau hyn gyda'r rheini.

Alun Cairns: Gadewch inni ddangos diffyg hygredd yr honiad cyntaf i ddechrau: yn sicr nid yw'r Blaid Geidwadol wedi derbyn ffioedd dysgu yng Nghymru, oherwydd nid yw hynny'n bolisi gan Blaid Geidwadol Cymru.

Janet Ryder: Will the Member give way?

Alun Cairns: I will in a moment.

You will remember well that it was a Welsh Conservative motion that led to the abolition of top-up fees here in Wales. We were happy to have your support, of course—the motion would not have passed without it—but you will remember that it was a Conservative motion that you were supporting.

Janet Ryder: I certainly do, but you are in total disagreement with your party leader, David Cameron, who, in January, said that we needed tuition fees and that they had to stay. Do we now have a totally separate party in Wales? Is David Cameron no longer your leader?

Alun Cairns: It is extremely strange that Janet Ryder is seeking to push that line when we are in a devolved administration. I would certainly support the principles behind David Cameron's policies, but we have the means to implement policies differently here in Wales. You will remember that it was a Welsh Conservative motion, which you chose to support, that took it away and that is the reality, whether we like it or not.

I am conscious of the time and that there is little opportunity to develop the debate further, which is regrettable. However, if we are going to achieve anything in this debate, because the source of funding is another debate, I ask the Minister to do one thing. [*Laughter.*] Will the Minister, in the first instance, acknowledge the funding gap? If we acknowledge the funding gap, we can have a debate on the source of that funding. End-of-year flexibility, for example, would be one effective way of doing it; that is £600 million, which is a starting point. Will you, at least, acknowledge, in the first instance, Minister, that this gap exists? We will then happily have a debate on where that funding should come from.

Peter Black: I note that Alun, in his last point, is asking the Government to acknowledge the fact that there is a £61

Janet Ryder: A wnaiff yr Aelod ildio?

Alun Cairns: Ildiaf mewn munud.

Cofiwch yn dda mai cynnig gan y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig a arweiniodd at ddiddymu ffioedd dysgu atodol yma yng Nghymru. Yr oeddem yn hapus i gael eich cefnogaeth, wrth gwrs—ni fyddai'r cynnig wedi'i dderbyn heb y gefnogaeth honno—ond cofiwch mai cynnig y Ceidwadwyr yr oeddech yn ei gefnogi.

Janet Ryder: Cofiaf yn iawn, ond yr ydych yn anghytuno'n llwyr ag arweinydd eich plaid, David Cameron, a ddywedodd ym mis Ionawr fod arnom angen ffioedd dysgu a bod yn rhaid iddynt barhau. A oes gennym yn awr blaidd gwbl ar wahân yng Nghymru? Onid David Cameron yw eich arweinydd?

Alun Cairns: Mae'n rhyfedd iawn fod Janet Ryder yn ceisio pwysleisio hynny a ninnau mewn gweinyddiaeth ddatganoledig. Byddwn yn sicr yn cefnogi'r egwyddorion sydd wrth wraidd polisiau David Cameron, ond mae gennym y modd i weithredu polisiau mewn ffordd wahanol yma yng Nghymru. Cofiwch mai cynnig gan y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig y dewisoch chi ei gefnogi a ddiddymodd hwn, a dyna'r gwir, p'un a ydym yn hoffi hynny ai beidio.

Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r amser ac nad oes llawer o gyfle i ddatblygu'r ddadl ymhellach, sy'n anffodus. Fodd bynnag, os ydym am gyflawni unrhyw beth yn y ddadl hon, oherwydd bod ffynhonnell cyllid yn ddadl arall, gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog wneud un peth. [*Chwerthin.*] A wnaiff y Gweinidog, yn gyntaf oll, gydnabod y bwlch cyllido? Os ydym yn cydnabod y bwlch cyllido, bydd modd inni gael dadl ar ffynhonnell y cyllid hwnnw. Byddai hyblygrwydd diwedd blwyddyn, er enghraifft, yn un ffordd effeithiol i wneud hynny; mae hynny'n £600 miliwn, sy'n fan cychwyn. A wnewch chi o leiaf gydnabod, yn gyntaf oll, Weinidog, fod y bwlch hwn yn bod? Wedyn byddwn yn ddigon hapus i gael dadl ar ffynhonnell yr arian hwnnw.

Peter Black: Sylwaf fod Alun, yn ei bwynt diwethaf, yn gofyn i'r Llywodraeth gydnabod bod gennym fwllch cyllido o £61 miliwn. Ar

million funding gap. From reading the Government amendments, it is quite clear that it is prepared to leave paragraph 3 in the motion—in the hope that we would then vote for it—with one exception: it wants to take out the words ‘with concern’. That is quite a fatuous amendment. The Government is prepared to acknowledge that there is a £61 million funding gap between higher education institutions in Wales and those in England, but it does not seem to have any concern that that is the case. One wonders why that concern has suddenly disappeared if it was there when we had all-party agreement to start addressing that funding gap. Presumably, Plaid Cymru will be supporting the Government amendment. As Kirsty pointed out earlier, Ieuan Wyn Jones told the Assembly in a previous debate that addressing that gap was crucial. Now, that crucial element has disappeared and he is not even concerned—it seems that Plaid Cymru is not concerned—about the fact that there is a £61 million funding gap between the various higher education institutions—

David Lloyd: How do you propose that the Liberal Democrats would address this funding gap—top-up fees or cuts in public services?

Peter Black: You offer a very stark choice, Dai, and it is very nice of you to write the budgets for us. You know, as well as I do, that when the parties came up with an agreement on this—Plaid Cymru signed up to that as well—we all agreed that we would address this funding gap over time. You cannot just conjure up £61 million out of thin air—I accept that—but we should be working towards eradicating that funding gap over a period of time, even if that period of time is a fairly lengthy one. We do not even seem to have that commitment from the Government or from Plaid Cymru, who were once gung-ho about how crucial it was to address that funding gap. [*Interruption.*]

We would address it over a period of time by directing resources that are available to the Government already, such as the huge amount of reserves you have, the end-of-year flexibility and the whole list of freebies that

ôl darllen gwelliannau'r Llywodraeth, mae'n amlwg ei bod yn barod i adael paragraff 3 yn y cynnig—yn y gobaith y byddwn wedyn yn pleidleisio drosto—gydag un eithriad; mae am ddileu'r geiriau 'â phryder'. Mae hwnnw'n welliant disynnwyr braidd. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn barod i gydnabod bod bwlech cyllido o £61 miliwn rhwng sefydliadau addysg uwch Cymru a'r rheini yn Lloegr, ond nid yw fel petai'n malio o gwbl am hynny. Ni allwn lai na dyfalu pam mae'r pryder hwnnw wedi diflannu'n sydyn; yr oedd yno pan gafwyd cytundeb hollbleidiol i ddechrau rhoi sylw i'r bwlech cyllido hwnnw. Mae'n debygol y bydd Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi gwelliant y Llywodraeth. Fel y dywedodd Kirsty yn gynharach, dywedodd Ieuan Wyn Jones wrth y Cynulliad mewn dadl gynharach fod rhoi sylw i'r bwlech cyllido hwnnw'n hanfodol. Yn awr mae'r elfen hanfodol honno wedi diflannu ac nid yw'n malio hyd yn oed—ymddengys nad yw Plaid Cymru yn malio—am y ffaith fod bwlech cyllido o £61 miliwn rhwng y gwahanol sefydliadau addysg uwch—

David Lloyd: Sut ydych chi'n awgrymu y byddai'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn rhoi sylw i'r bwlech cyllido hwn—ffioedd atodol ynteu doriadau mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus?

Peter Black: Yr ydych yn cynnig dewis plaen iawn, Dai, a chwarae teg ichi am lunio'r cyllidebau ar ein rhan. Gwyddoch chi, fel finnau, pan gytunodd y pleidiau ar hyn—yr oedd Plaid Cymru'n rhan o'r cytundeb hefyd—ein bod i gyd yn gytûn y byddem yn rhoi sylw i'r bwlech cyllido hwn dros amser. Ni allwch gonsurio £61 miliwn o ddim—yr wyf yn derbyn hynny—ond dylem fod yn gweithio i ddileu'r bwlech cyllido hwn dros gyfnod o amser, hyd yn oed os yw'r amser hwnnw'n gyfnod gweddol faith. Nid yw'n ymddangos ein bod yn cael yr ymrwymiad hwnnw gan y Llywodraeth, na chan Plaid Cymru, a oedd ar un adeg mor uchel ei chloch ynghylch pwysigrwydd rhoi sylw i'r bwlech cyllido. [*Torri ar draws.*]

Byddem yn rhoi sylw iddo dros amser drwy gyfeirio adnoddau sydd eisoes ar gael i'r Llywodraeth, megis y cronfeydd arian wrth gefn enfawr sydd gennych, yr hyblygrwydd diwedd blwyddyn a'r rhestr gyfan o bethau

you have included in your policies, [Laughter.] We would start to direct some of that resource to dealing with this funding gap. It is all very well to mock, but at least we have not given up the ghost on this, Dai, as Plaid Cymru has done. Plaid Cymru is prepared to let higher education institutions in Wales rot without the proper funding that they need to deliver the education that the students need, and that our economy needs for its future prosperity.

Alun Cairns: Does Peter Black think that the Government is like a flock of ostriches—sticking their heads in the sand choosing not to acknowledge that the gap exists? That is what Dai Lloyd said in 2005.

Peter Black: That supports what I have been saying over the last three minutes. The Government is no longer even concerned about the gap; Government Members are prepared to stick their heads in the sand and just try to ignore it.

David Lloyd *a gododd*—

Peter Black: I want to move on now.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I do not think that he is taking any more interventions.

Peter Black: I have already taken interventions from you, Dai. Frankly, you do not seem to have anything constructive to say, so I will move on to talk about part-time students, who also make up an important part of this motion.

In Wales, 46 per cent of enrolments were from part-time students. Given that we have an ageing population, and that we have Leitch and Webb calling for the need to up-skill the workforce, the number of part-time learners is set to increase. We need to prepare for that and we need to encourage it. Part-time students, particularly adults, are penalised by a system that unfairly favours full-time students. Many part-time students receive no support during their studies and face huge financial difficulties during their degree course and afterwards. The majority

am ddim yr ydych wedi eu cynnwys yn eich polisïau. [Chwerthin.] Byddem yn dechrau cyfeirio rhai o'r adnoddau hynny i ddelio â'r bwlech cyllido hwn. Mae'n hawdd iawn gwatwar, ond o leiaf nid ydym ni wedi rhoi'r ffidil yn y to o ran hyn, Dai, fel y mae Plaid Cymru wedi'i wneud. Mae Plaid Cymru yn barod i adael i sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru bydru heb y cyllid y mae arnynt ei angen i ddarparu'r addysg y mae ei angen ar y myfyrwyr a'i angen ar ein heconomi os yw am ffynnu yn y dyfodol.

Alun Cairns: A yw Peter Black yn credu bod y Llywodraeth fel haid o estrys—yn claddu eu pennau yn y tywod a dewis peidio â chydabod bod y bwlech cyllido'n bodoli? Dyna a ddywedodd Dai Lloyd yn 2005.

Peter Black: Mae hynny'n cadarnhau'r hyn yr wyf wedi bod yn ei ddweud am y tri munud diwethaf. Nid yw'r Llywodraeth yn malio bellach am y bwlech; mae Aelodau'r Llywodraeth yn barod i gladdu eu pennau yn y tywod a gwneud eu gorau i'w anwybyddu.

David Lloyd *rose*—

Peter Black: Yr wyf am symud ymlaen yn awr.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Nid wyf yn credu ei fod yn derbyn mwy o ymyriadau.

Peter Black: Yr wyf eisoes wedi derbyn ymyriad gennych, Dai. A bod yn onest, nid yw'n ymddangos bod gennych ddim byd adeiladol i'w dweud, felly, yr wyf am symud ymlaen i sôn am fyfyrwyr rhan-amser, sydd hefyd yn rhan bwysig o'r cynnig hwn.

Yng Nghymru, yr oedd 46 y cant o'r myfyrwyr sydd wedi cofrestru yn rhai rhan-amser. O gofio bod gennym boblogaeth sy'n heneiddio, a bod Leitch a Webb yn galw am wella sgiliau'r gweithlu, mae nifer y dysgwyr rhan-amser yn debygol o gynyddu. Mae angen inni baratoi ar gyfer hynny ac mae angen inni ei annog. Mae myfyrwyr rhan-amser, yn enwedig oedolion, yn cael eu cosbi gan system sy'n annheg gan ei bod yn ffafrio myfyrwyr amser llawn. Nid yw llawer o fyfyrwyr rhan-amser yn cael dim cymorth yn ystod eu hastudiaethau ac maent yn wynebu

of part-timers are studying for skills-related reasons—job progression, professional updating, career change or re-entering the job market. Part-time learning supports them to enhance their employability and to build and demonstrate key soft skills. Given the Government's commitment to upskilling the workforce, and given the need for it, the support that we give to part-timers is crucial, as is the support that we put into further education, which also plays a key role in providing skills to enable people to progress in their careers and to enable our economy to flourish by making sure that people have the skills that employers want. In that way, we can attract the high-value employers that will deliver high-quality, highly paid jobs, which will improve the gross domestic product of Wales as a country.

I would hope that the Government, at the very least, could withdraw its amendment deleting the words 'with concern', and maybe reconsider its support for this motion as it is set out at present. Higher education institutions in Wales need that support, but above all, they need the funding if they are to compete on a level playing field with higher education institutions elsewhere in the world. If they do not receive that funding, they will also be in trouble.

Alun Davies: We have seen an example this afternoon of an opposition writing a motion but not being able to answer the questions. Alun Cairns saved me from the terrible embarrassment of being in the position of having to agree with him this afternoon, by copping out on a fundamental issue that runs through this motion, namely how you pay for higher education. Higher education institutions and the Government are facing some enormous challenges at present. Those in higher education talk about the spending gap between Wales and England, but the reality is that Welsh higher education is probably, for the first time, not simply facing competition from across the border but competition from around the world. It is one

anawsterau ariannol mawr yn ystod eu cwrs gradd ac wedi hynny. Mae mwyafrif y myfyrwyr rhan-amser yn astudio am resymau'n ymwneud â sgiliau—i gael dyrchafiad yn eu gwaith, diweddarau eu gwybodaeth broffesiynol, newid gyrfa neu ailymuno â'r farchnad waith. Mae dysgu rhan-amser yn eu cynorthwyo i ddod o hyd i waith ac i ddysgu a dangos sgiliau meddal allweddol. A chofio ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth i uwchsgilio'r gweithlu, ac o gofio'r angen am hynny, mae'r cymorth yr ydym yn ei roi i fyfyrwyr rhan-amser yn hanfodol, fel yn achos y gefnogaeth a rown i addysg bellach, sydd hefyd yn chwarae rôl allweddol drwy ddarparu sgiliau i alluogi pobl i fynd ymlaen yn eu gyrfa a galluogi ein heconomi i ffynnu drwy sicrhau bod gan bobl y sgiliau y mae eu hangen ar eu cyflogwyr. Drwy wneud hynny, gallwn ddenu cyflogwyr gwerthfawr a fydd yn cynnig swyddi o safon uchel sy'n talu cyflogau da ac a fydd yn gwella cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth Cymru fel gwlad.

Gobeithio y bydd Llywodraeth o leiaf yn tynnu'n ôl ei gwelliant sy'n dileu'r geiriau 'â phryder', ac efallai'n ailystyried ei chefnogaeth i'r cynnig hwn fel y mae wedi'i gyflwyno ar y funud. Mae angen y gefnogaeth honno ar sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru, ond yn fwy na dim, mae arnynt angen yr arian os ydynt i gael chwarae teg i gystadlu â sefydliadau addysg uwch mewn rhannau eraill o'r byd. Os na chânt yr arian hwnnw, byddant hwy hefyd mewn trafferthion.

Alun Davies: Gwelsom enghraifft y prynhawn yma o wrthblaid yn llunio cynnig ond heb fedru ateb y cwestiynau. Mae Alun Cairns wedi fy achub o'r cywilydd mawr o fod yn y sefyllfa o orfod cytuno ag ef y prynhawn yma, drwy wrthod wynebu mater sylfaenol sy'n rhan anhepgor o'r cynnig hwn, sef sut i dalu am addysg uwch. Mae sefydliadau addysg uwch a'r Llywodraeth yn wynebu heriau enfawr ar hyn o bryd. Mae'r rheini mewn addysg uwch yn sôn am y bwlch cyllido rhwng Cymru a Lloegr, ond y gwir amdani yw nad yw addysg uwch yng Nghymru, am y tro cyntaf, efallai, yn wynebu cystadleuaeth y tu hwnt i'r ffin yn unig ond cystadleuaeth o bob cwr o'r byd. Mae'n un maes mewn gweithgarwch cyhoeddus sydd

area of public activity that has been seriously globalised, but the opposition parties do not seem to have an idea that that has happened, let alone how they will react to it.

Alun Cairns: Will you give way?

Alun Davies: I will come back to you but I would like to develop my argument for one moment.

At present, Wales probably punches above its weight in terms of the prizes and contracts won by our higher education institutions. If we are serious about innovation and driving forward a knowledge-based economy, it comes at a price, which cannot be ducked. The mechanisms for funding higher education cannot be ducked either. The reality is that we all know that there are far too few headquarter companies in Wales and that there is far too little research and development work happening in Wales. That means that higher education has a far greater role to play in our economy than is the case in other places.

We also know that Government action is supporting higher education. Kirsty was at the Enterprise and Learning Committee meeting this morning, and heard the people from Bangor saying how impressed they were with the work done and actions taken by the Welsh Assembly Government to improve and develop innovation from our university sector. We also know, from simply taking a look at the economy of the United Kingdom, that the only place in the United Kingdom where there is a globally confident and competitive cluster of university-generated economic activity is around Cambridge in East Anglia, where you have the Silicon Fen, which truly competes on a global basis. No other part of the United Kingdom is able to do that—not even the area of Oxfordshire where I used to work. So, there are very real means by which the Government must take action to continue to support higher education in a global environment.

3.40 p.m.

Alun Cairns: I am grateful to Alun Davies

bellach yn gwbl fyd-eang, ond nid yw'n ymddangos bod gan y gwrthbleidiau ddim syniad bod hynny wedi digwydd, heb sôn am sut y byddant yn ymateb iddo.

Alun Cairns: A wnewch chi ildio?

Alun Davies: Dof yn ôl atoch, ond hoffwn ddatblygu fy nadl am ychydig.

Ar hyn o bryd, mae'n debygol bod Cymru'n gwneud yn rhyfeddol o dda o ystyried ei maint o ran y gwobrau a'r contractau y mae ein sefydliadau addysg uwch wedi'u hennill. Os ydym o ddifrif ynghylch arloesi a datblygu'r economi wybodaeth, rhaid talu pris am hynny, ac ni ellir gwadu hynny. Ni ellir gwadu ychwaith y mecanweithiau ar gyfer ariannu addysg uwch. Y gwir yw ein bod i gyd yn gwybod nad oes hanner digon o bencadlysoedd cwmnïau yng Nghymru a bod rhy ychydig o lawer o waith ymchwil a datblygu'n digwydd yng Nghymru. Mae hynny'n golygu bod gan addysg uwch rôl fwy o lawer i'w chwarae yn ein heconomi nag mewn manau eraill.

Gwyddom hefyd fod gwaith y Llywodraeth yn cefnogi addysg uwch. Yr oedd Kirsty yn bresennol yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu y bore yma, a chlywodd y bobl o Fangor yn dweud mor falch oeddent o'r gwaith a wnaethpwyd a'r camau a gymerwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wella a datblygu arloesedd yn ein sector prifysgol. Gwyddom hefyd, drwy gymryd cipolwg yn unig ar economi'r Deyrnas Unedig, mai'r unig lle yn y Deyrnas Unedig lle mae clwstwr o weithgarwch economaidd a gynhyrchir gan brifysgol sy'n hyderus ac yn gallu cystadlu ar raddfa fyd-eang yw ardal Caer-grawnt yn East Anglia, lle mae'r Ffen Silicon, sy'n gallu cystadlu ar lefel wirioneddol fyd-eang. Ni all yr un rhan arall o'r Deyrnas Unedig wneud hynny—ddim hyd yn oed y rhan o swydd Rydychen lle'r oeddwn yn arfer gweithio. Felly, mae yna ddulliau real iawn y mae'n rhaid i'r Llywodraeth eu defnyddio os yw am barhau i gefnogi addysg uwch mewn hinsawdd fyd-eang.

Alun Cairns: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Alun

for taking this intervention. I noted the way in which he sought to avoid the problem that he originally highlighted, by moving on before giving way. For the sake of removing the tension, I will say that we agree with much of what he has said. However, will he acknowledge that the funding gap needs to be closed? If he does that, we can debate where those resources should come from. It is difficult for every Government—there are different priorities—but if you acknowledge that the gap needs to be closed, let us have the debate about where the money should come from. If you do not acknowledge it, the gap and the missed opportunities will continue.

Alun Davies: I am trying to say that, by focusing on any perceived gap between Wales and England, you are missing the point of higher education in the future. I will come on, in my conclusion, to address those issues, because I believe that it is a serious challenge for Government.

I am old-fashioned enough to stick to the Robbins principle: all those who would benefit from higher education should be entitled to it. I stick to that, and I am sorry that the Conservative Government of 1970 changed that. When Thatcher entered Government, one of her first actions was to put the Robbins principle to one side, although Conservatives Members want to forget that. We need to ensure participation from all sections of the community, including the poorest, and from all sorts of different communities within Wales and elsewhere. However, we also need to ensure excellence, and this, Alun, comes back to the point that I was making, although you seemed to forget it: excellence in teaching, research and opportunity demands fresh thinking from Government, and from all the political parties represented here. It is not good enough to say that you want the best higher education in the world, and then to deny it the funding opportunities available to deliver that. If we are to compete on a global stage, we have to ensure that it is not only Government that funds higher education, but that there is also room for students, and others who benefit from it, to play a part in its funding. There should be scope for industry to work with universities to provide funding and research

Davies am dderbyn yr ymyriad hwn. Sylwais sut y ceisiod osgoi'r broblem y tynnodd sylw ati'n wreiddiol, drwy symud ymlaen cyn ildio. Er mwyn lleddfu'r tensiwn, dywedaf ein bod yn cytuno â llawer o'r hyn a ddywedodd. Fodd bynnag, a yw am gydnabod bod angen cau'r bwllch cyllido? Os yw'n fodlon gwneud hynny, gallwn ddadlau o ble y dylai'r adnoddau hynny ddod. Mae'n anodd i bob Llywodraeth—mae yna wahanol flaenoriaethau—ond os ydych yn cydnabod bod angen cau'r bwllch, gadewch inni ddadlau o ble y dylai'r arian ddod. Os nad ydych yn cydnabod hyn, bydd y bwllch a'r cyfleoedd a gollir yn parhau.

Alun Davies: Yr wyf yn ceisio dweud, drwy ganolbwyntio ar unrhyw fwllch tybiedig rhwng Cymru a Lloegr, eich bod yn colli holl bwynt addysg uwch yn y dyfodol. Wrth gloi, byddaf yn rhoi sylw i'r materion hynny, oherwydd credaf fod hynny'n her ddirifol i'r Llywodraeth.

Yr wyf yn ddigon hen ffasiwn i gadw at egwyddor Robbins: dylai pawb a fyddai'n elwa o addysg uwch gael yr hawl i fanteisio arni. Yr wyf yn cadw at hynny, ac mae'n edifar gennyf fod Llywodraeth Geidwadol 1970 wedi newid hynny. Pan ymunodd Thatcher â'r Llywodraeth, un o'i gweithredoedd cyntaf oedd rhoi egwyddor Robbins o'r neilltu, er y byddai'n well gan yr Aelodau Ceidwadol anghofio hynny. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod pob carfan o'r gymuned yn cyfranogi, gan gynnwys y tlotaf, a phobl o bob math o wahanol gymunedau yng Nghymru a thu hwnt. Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni hefyd sicrhau rhagoriaeth, ac mae hyn, Alun, yn dod â ni'n ôl at y pwynt yr oeddwn yn ei wneud, er ei bod yn ymddangos ichi ei anghofio: mae rhagoriaeth mewn dysgu, ymchwil a chyfleoedd yn mynnu meddwl gwreiddiol gan y Llywodraeth, a chan yr holl bleidiau sy'n cael eu cynrychioli yma. Nid yw'n ddigon da dweud eich bod am gael yr addysg uwch orau yn y byd, ac yna gwadu iddi'r cyfleoedd cyllido sydd ar gael i gyflawni hynny. Os ydym am gystadlu ar y llwyfan byd-eang, rhaid inni sicrhau nad y Llywodraeth yn unig sy'n ariannu addysg uwch, ond bod cyfle i fyfyrwyr, ac i eraill sy'n elwa ohoni, chwarae rhan yn y cyllido. Dylai fod cyfle i

opportunities.

It is time to move away from rhetoric. It is unfortunate that the opposition parties tabled this motion this week but wrote their speeches 10 years ago. It is important to think afresh about the way in which we fund higher education, and move forward globally, ensuring that our higher education has the support that it needs to complete at that level.

Eleanor Burnham: Alun Davies has mostly been contradicting himself throughout his utterances. I remember going to the inauguration of Cherie Blair, during the first term of the Labour Government that was elected in 1997—she was being inaugurated as chancellor of Liverpool John Moores University—and she had the cheek to talk about ‘education, education, education’. I do not think that we have made much headway in education since then, quite frankly.

There are wonderful people working in all sectors of education, and Members meet them regularly—we met some more here last night, from the fields of science and chemistry—and I am extremely proud of the higher education institutions that we have across north Wales. However, in many respects, the Government is constantly contradicting itself. If Labour is so keen on achieving the excellence that we all know that we deserve in Wales, why does it not fund higher education properly? It is all very well aspiring to move 50 per cent of young people willy-nilly into higher education, while the basic foundation phase is underfunded—

Janet Ryder: Will you take an intervention?

Eleanor Burnham: No, thank you, I think that you have made enough interventions this afternoon.

The foundation phase has been underfunded, further education colleges are being starved, and as someone who has had the privilege of dipping in and out of education all my life, I think that it is important to look at the FE sector, as well as the HE sector that we are

ddiwydiant weithio gyda phrifysgolion i ddarparu cyllid a chyfleoedd ymchwil.

Mae'n bryd cefnu ar y rithreg. Mae'n anffodus fod y gwrthbleidiau wedi cyflwyno'r cynnig hwn yr wythnos hon ond wedi ysgrifennu eu hareithiau 10 mlynedd yn ôl. Mae'n bwysig meddwl o'r newydd sut yr ydym yn ariannu addysg uwch, a symud ymlaen mewn ffordd fyd-eang, gan sicrhau bod ein haddysg uwch yn cael y gefnogaeth y mae ei angen arni i gystadlu ar y lefel honno.

Eleanor Burnham: Mae Alun Davies wedi gwrth-ddweud ei hun drwy gydol ei araith. Cofiaf fynd i gyfarfod sefydlu Cherie Blair, yn ystod tymor cyntaf y Llywodraeth Lafur a etholwyd yn 1997—yr oedd yn cael ei sefydlu'n ganghellor Prifysgol John Moores, Lerpwl—ac yr oedd yn ddigon beiddgar i siarad am ‘addysg, addysg, addysg’. Nid wyf yn credu ein bod wedi gwneud llawer o gynnydd ym myd addysg ers hynny, a dweud y gwir.

Mae pobl wych yn gweithio ym mhob sector o'r byd addysg—a bydd Aelodau'n cwrdd â hwy'n rheolaidd—cawsom gyfarfod gyda rhagor ohonynt yma neithiwr, o feysydd gwyddoniaeth a chemeg—ac yr wyf yn falch iawn o'r sefydliadau addysg uwch sydd gennym ar hyd a lled y gogledd. Fodd bynnag, mewn llawer ystyr mae'r Llywodraeth yn gwrth-ddweud ei hun yn barhaus. Os yw Llafur mor awyddus i sicrhau'r rhagoriaeth y gwyddom i gyd ein bod yn ei haeddu yng Nghymru, pam nad yw'n ariannu addysg uwch yn ddigonol? Un peth yw dyhead i symud 50 y cant o bobl ifanc o fodd neu anfodd i addysg uwch, a hynny ar adeg pan nad yw'r cyfnod sylfaen yn cael digon o arian—

Janet Ryder: A dderbyniwch ymyriad?

Eleanor Burnham: Na, dim diolch, credaf eich bod wedi ymyrryd digon y prynhawn yma.

Nid yw'r cyfnod sylfaen wedi ei ariannu'n ddigonol, mae colegau addysg bellach yn cael eu hamddifadu, ac fel rhywun a gafodd y fraint o fynd i mewn ac allan o addysg drwy gydol fy oes, credaf ei bod yn bwysig edrych ar y sector addysg bellach, yn ogystal â'r

concentrating on this afternoon.

Alun Ffred Jones: Will you take an intervention?

Eleanor Burnham: No, thank you—not today. [*Laughter.*]

Quite frankly, we need to be more constructive. I thank Alun Davies—he has made our points for us by saying that we need to be creative, to revisit this issue, and to look for a better future for funding in a more positive way. However, I have not seen that in Wales any more than in England. My two offspring, like many others, have huge debts—what is that all about? Students end up so much in debt before even having a mortgage. They have a mortgage-like debt when they are teenagers or in their early 20s.

My daughter is 28 and she is still paying off her debt. My son is 25 and he is still paying off his debt. Labour has been extremely muddled about higher education as well as other issues. Poor old Plaid Cymru now is aghast, is it not? It is caught in that muddle. Minister, do look again to see what you can do to be a little more constructive so that we can get the foundation phase properly funded, and so that we can get basic skills improved. After all, so many employers talk about graduates who, although wonderful in certain ways, cannot write properly or are innumerate. On that basis, I urge the Government to think constructively and creatively, and to do its best for the HE sector, otherwise it will be sunk.

Mark Isherwood: For the Assembly Government to state in its amendments that the growth in the funding gap between Welsh and English higher education institutions to £61 million is not a matter for concern is arrogant complacency that is bordering on contempt. Once again, Labour and Plaid Cymru are burying their collective heads in the sand and pretending that the real world is not passing by.

As we have heard, the investment gap between the higher education sectors in

sector addysg uwch yr ydym yn canolbwyntio arno'r prynhawn yma.

Alun Ffred Jones: A dderbyniwch ymyriad?

Eleanor Burnham: Na, ddim diolch—dim heddiw. [*Chwerthin.*]

A dweud y gwir, mae angen inni fod yn fwy adeiladol. Diolch i Alun Davies—mae wedi cyfleu ein pwyntiau ar ein rhan drwy ddweud bod angen inni fod yn greadigol, edrych o'r newydd ar y mater hwn, a chwilio am ddyfodol gwell ar gyfer cyllido mewn ffordd fwy cadarnhaol. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf wedi gweld mwy o hynny yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr. Mae gan fy nau blentyn i, fel llawer un arall, ddyledion enfawr—beth yw ystyr hynny? Mae gan fyfyrwyr gymaint o ddyled cyn cael morgais hyd yn oed. Mae ganddynt ddyled i faint morgais a hwythau yn eu harddegau neu yn eu 20au cynnar.

Mae fy merch yn 28 ac mae'n dal i dalu ei dyled. Mae fy mab yn 25 ac mae'n dal i dalu ei ddyled. Mae Llafur wedi bod yn eithriadol o ddryslyd ynglŷn ag addysg uwch yn ogystal â materion eraill. Mae Plaid Cymru druan yn arswydo yn awr, onid yw? Mae wedi'i dal yn y dryswch hwnnw. Weinidog, da chi edrychwch eto i weld beth y gallwch ei wneud i fod ychydig yn fwy adeiladol fel y gallwn wella sgiliau sylfaenol. Wedi'r cyfan, mae cynifer o gyflogwyr yn sôn am raddedigion sydd, er eu bod yn wych mewn rhai ffyrdd, yn methu ysgrifennu'n iawn neu'n methu rhifo. Ar y sail honno, anogaf y Llywodraeth i feddwl yn adeiladol ac yn greadigol, ac i wneud ei gorau dros y sector AU, neu bydd wedi canu arno.

Mark Isherwood: Mae clywed Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn dweud yn ei gwelliannau nad yw'r twf yn y bwlch cyllido rhwng sefydliadau addysg uwch Cymru a Lloegr i £61 miliwn yn destun pryder yn hunanfodddhad trahaus sy'n ymylu ar fod yn ddirmyg. Unwaith eto, mae Llafur a Phlaid Cymru gyda'i gilydd yn claddu eu pennau yn y tywod ac yn esgus nad yw'r byd go iawn yn mynd heibio.

Fel y clywsom, cynyddodd y bwlch buddsoddi rhwng y sectorau addysg uwch

Wales and England increased by 53 per cent in just one year, 2005-06, from £40 million to £61 million. That equates to 19 per cent of the total higher education grant in Wales. As we heard, the gap is expected to have risen to £70 million by the end of last year.

As we heard, when Wales is compared to Scotland, the gap has increased from £92 million to £151 million—a 64 per cent increase. Thirty four per cent of Scotland's population have higher level skills, that is, a foundation degree or above, compared to just 26 per cent in Wales. Higher Education Wales calculates that the aggregate investment gap between Wales and England reached a staggering £190 million between 2003 and 2007. Even worse, a comparison of higher education funding in Wales, Scotland and England as a result of the comprehensive spending review to 2011 shows that universities in Wales have received the worst settlement. Indeed, the poor higher education funding settlement in Wales may well mean that the teaching grant for this year will be cut in real terms, at a time when the unit of resource is increasing in real terms in England. As we have heard, the Department for Innovation, Universities and Skills in England has guaranteed year-on-year, real-terms increases in the unit of resource for universities up to 2011, but no such pledge has been forthcoming from the Assembly Government, despite all political parties in the Assembly agreeing to address the issue of the funding gap back in June 2005, when the student fees settlement was reached.

Janet Ryder: When we signed up to that—and all parties did—it was to prevent top-up fees from being introduced in Wales. Your party, led by David Cameron, has now said that top-up fees are here to stay. Is he right, or is he wrong?

Mark Isherwood: I am an Assembly Member in the National Assembly for Wales, a devolved administration. I am not a Member of Parliament. We are a devolved part of a wider unionist party.

yng Nghymru a Lloegr 53 y cant mewn blwyddyn yn unig yn 2005-06, o £40 miliwn i £61 miliwn. Mae hynny'n cyfateb i 19 y cant o gyfanswm y grant addysg uwch yng Nghymru. Fel y clywsom, y disgwyl yw y bydd y bwlch wedi cynyddu i £70 miliwn erbyn diwedd y llynedd.

Fel y clywsom, pan gaiff Cymru ei chymharu â'r Alban, mae'r bwlch wedi cynyddu o £92 miliwn i £151 miliwn—cynnydd o 64 y cant. Mae gan 34 y cant o boblogaeth yr Alban sgiliau lefel uwch, hynny yw, gradd sylfaen neu uwch, o'u cymharu â dim ond 26 y cant yng Nghymru. Mae Addysg Uwch Cymru yn cyfrif bod y bwlch buddsoddi cyfun rhwng Cymru a Lloegr wedi cyrraedd y swm syfrdanol o £190 miliwn rhwng 2003 a 2007. Yn waeth fydd, dengys cymhariaeth o gyllid addysg uwch yng Nghymru, yr Alban a Lloegr o ganlyniad i'r adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant hyd at 2011 mai prifysgolion yng Nghymru sydd wedi cael y setliad gwaethaf. Yn wir, mae'n bosibl iawn y bydd y setliad cyllido addysg uwch gwael yng Nghymru yn golygu y caiff y grant addysgu ar gyfer eleni ei dorri mewn termau real, ar adeg pan yw'r uned adnoddau'n cynyddu mewn termau real yn Lloegr. Fel y clywsom, mae'r Adran Arloesedd, Prifysgolion a Sgiliau yn Lloegr wedi gwarantu cynnydd mewn termau real, o flwyddyn i flwyddyn, yn yr uned adnoddau i brifysgolion hyd at 2011, ond ni chafwyd unrhyw adduned o'r fath gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, er i bob plaid wleidyddol yn y Cynulliad gytuno i fynd i'r afael â mater y bwlch cyllido ym mis Mehefin 2005, pan gyrhaeddwyd y setliad ynglŷn â ffioedd myfyrwyr.

Janet Ryder: Pan ymrwymasom i hynny—a gwnaeth pob plaid hynny—y diben oedd atal cyflwyno ffioedd atodol yng Nghymru. Mae eich plaid chi, dan arweiniad David Cameron, wedi dweud erbyn hyn fod ffioedd atodol yma am byth. A yw'n iawn, ynteu a yw'n anghywir?

Mark Isherwood: Yr wyf yn Aelod Cynulliad yng Nghynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gweinyddiaeth ddatganoledig. Nid Aelod Seneddol mohonof. Yr ydym ni'n rhan ddatganoledig o blaid unoliaethol ehangach.

Alun Cairns: Mark, would you recognise that, while I am sure that top-up fees are there to stay, that is, of course, in England and has nothing to do with Wales or the Assembly?

Alun Cairns: Mark, a fyddech yn cydnabod, er fy mod yn sicr fod ffioedd atodol yma am byth, hynny yw, wrth gwrs, yn Lloegr ac nad oes a wnelont o gwbl â Chymru na'r Cynulliad?

Mark Isherwood: Absolutely. In fact, the investment gap has emerged since 2001-02, entirely under Labour-led Assembly Governments.

Mark Isherwood: Yn bendant. Yn wir, mae'r bwlch buddsoddi wedi ymddangos er 2001-02, yn gyfan gwbl o dan Lywodraeth Cynulliad o dan arweiniad Llafur.

Bethan Jenkins: Will you take an intervention?

Bethan Jenkins: A gymerwch chi ymyriad?

Mark Isherwood: Sorry, I have taken two interventions already, and we are getting a bit short of time.

Mark Isherwood: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, yr wyf eisoes wedi cymryd dau ymyriad, ac yr ydym yn mynd yn brin o amser.

The consequence is that Wales will not be able to create a growing knowledge-based economy when the key sector to effect such a transformation is burdened by chronic underinvestment. That represents a short-sighted and politically illiterate failure to recognise that universities in Wales make up an increasing share of our national economy, generating £5.3 million for every £1 million invested by the Assembly Government.

Y canlyniad yw na fydd Cymru'n gallu creu economi'n seiliedig ar wybodaeth sy'n tyfu, gan fod y sector allweddol ar gyfer sicrhau trawsnewid o'r fath yn cael ei lethu gan danfuddsoddi cronig. Mae hynny'n fethiant annoeth a gwleidyddol anllythrennog i gydnabod bod prifysgolion yng Nghymru i gyfrif am ran gynyddol o'n heconomi genedlaethol, yn cynhyrchu £5.3 miliwn am bob £1 miliwn a fuddsoddir gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad.

In the debate on higher education funding on 22 June 2005, after the student fees settlement was agreed by the four parties, following Labour's defeat in a Welsh Conservative opposition debate, I stated that we must also have clarification of the entitlement to maintenance grants for Welsh domiciled students studying in England. A commitment to helping Welsh students applying to universities outside Wales for courses that are not available in Welsh higher education institutions is crucial when in all other respects this agreement will, regrettably, but of necessity, penalise Welsh domiciled students who wish to study in England.

Yn y ddadl ar gyllido addysg uwch ar 22 Mehefin 2005, ar ôl i'r pedair plaid gytuno ar y setliad ffioedd myfyrwyr, wedi i Lafur gael ei threchgu mewn dadl wrthblaid yn enw Ceidwadwyr Cymru, dywedais ei bod yn rhaid inni hefyd gael eglurhad o'r hawl i grantiau cynhaliaeth i fyfyrwyr o Gymru sy'n astudio yn Lloegr. Mae ymrwymiad i helpu myfyrwyr o Gymru sy'n ymgeisio am leoedd mewn prifysgolion y tu allan i Gymru am gyrsiau nad ydynt ar gael yn sefydliadau addysg uwch Cymru yn hanfodol pan fydd y cytundeb hwn, ym mhob ystyr arall, yn anffodus, ond o reidrwydd, yn cosbi myfyrwyr o Gymru sy'n dymuno astudio yn Lloegr.

3.50 p.m.

Almost three years later, the funding gap between students in England and Wales has also increased. The Assembly Government's amendment 3 states that it will investigate innovative ways to ensure the fairest allocation of funding between institutions and

Bron i dair blynedd yn ddiweddarach, mae'r bwlch cyllido rhwng myfyrwyr yng Nghymru a Lloegr hefyd wedi cynyddu. Dywed gwelliant 3 gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad y bydd yn ymchwilio i ddulliau arloesol i sicrhau bod cyllid yn cael ei ddyrannu yn y

students. However, there is nothing fair in the fact that full-time students in England, from families with household incomes of up to £25,000, are entitled to the maximum grant, whereas full grant in Wales stops at household incomes of just £17,920. Furthermore, partial grants in Wales stop at household incomes of only £38,325, compared with £60,000 in England. As one constituent told me, this makes a real difference to people's lives.

Labour claims a commitment to adult learning. Some 211 MPs, including 86 Labour MPs, signed a cross-party early-day motion expressing concern about the UK Government's £100 million cuts to 'second chance' education, which particularly affect part-time students and mothers returning to work. Despite this, 62 Labour MPs, including Welsh Labour MPs Paul Flynn, Martyn Jones and Betty Williams, who had signed the early-day motion then cynically voted against an identical motion that was put to the vote in the House of Commons in January.

As Ieuan Wyn Jones said in November 2006,

'Wales is being short changed and Welsh schools and colleges are not being given the same help as their counterparts in England.'

Before the last election, he said that he would not prop up a failing Labour Government. Plaid Cymru Members must look to their consciences today.

Janet Ryder: I am pleased that Kirsty underlined in her opening remarks that the Minister is addressing this situation—she is reviewing the situation. As Alun Davies said, there is growing concern about how this would be funded. Over the past fortnight, we have heard the Liberal Democrats demand £25 million in new money for the foundation phase. Today, they have asked for £60 million to £65 million in new money for higher education. Yesterday, Mike German wanted £190 million for further education. Where on earth will this more than £200

modd tecaf rhwng sefydliadau a myfyrwyr. Fodd bynnag, nid oes dim yn deg yn y ffaith fod gan fyfyrwyr amser llawn yn Lloegr, o deuluoedd sydd ag incwm teulu o hyd at £25,000, hawl i gael uchafswm grant, tra mae'r grant llawn yng Nghymru yn gorffen ar incwm teulu o ddim ond £17,920. At hynny, mae grantiau rhannol yng Nghymru yn gorffen ar incwm teulu o ddim ond £38,325, o'i gymharu â £60,000 yn Lloegr. Fel y dywedodd un etholwr wrthyf, mae hyn yn gwneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol i fywydau pobl.

Mae Llafur yn honni ymrwymiad i ddysgu i oedolion. Llofnododd rhyw 211 o ASau, gan gynnwys 86 o ASau Llafur, gynnig trawsbleidiol cynnar-yn-y-dydd yn mynegi pryder am y toriadau o £100 miliwn gan Lywodraeth y DU mewn addysg 'ail gyfle', sy'n effeithio'n arbennig ar fyfyrwyr rhan-amser a mamau sy'n dychwelyd i weithio. Er gwaethaf hyn, yn sinigaidd iawn pleidleisiodd 62 o ASau Llafur, gan gynnwys yr ASau Llafur o Gymru Paul Flynn, Martyn Jones a Betty Williams, a oedd wedi llofnodi'r cynnig cynnar-yn-y-dydd, yn erbyn cynnig yn union yr un fath y pleidleisiwyd arno yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin ym mis Ionawr.

Fel y dywedodd Ieuan Wyn Jones ym mis Tachwedd 2006,

'Mae Cymru'n cael ei thrin yn sâl ac nid yw ysgolion a cholegau Cymru yn cael yr un help â'u cymheiriaid yn Lloegr.'

Cyn yr etholiad diwethaf, dywedodd na fyddai'n cynnal Llywodraeth Lafur sy'n methu. Rhaid i Aelodau Plaid Cymru archwilio eu cydwybod heddiw.

Janet Ryder: Yr wyf yn falch fod Kirsty wedi tanlinellu yn ei sylwadau agoriadol fod y Gweinidog yn mynd i'r afael â'r sefyllfa hon—mae hi'n adolygu'r sefyllfa. Fel y dywedodd Alun Davies, mae pryder cynyddol ynglŷn â'r ffordd y câi hyn ei gyllido. Dros y pythefnos diwethaf, clywsom y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn galw am £25 miliwn o arian newydd ar gyfer y cyfnod sylfaen. Heddiw, maent wedi gofyn am £60 miliwn i £65 miliwn o arian newydd ar gyfer addysg uwch. Ddoe, yr oedd Mike German am gael £190 miliwn ar gyfer addysg bellach.

million of new money come from? You never tell us that.

Michael German: That figure of £190 million is a bit of an exaggeration—I was asking for £3 million.

Janet Ryder: I am referring to your question to the First Minister yesterday about new money for FE. My understanding was that you asked for a much higher sum than £3 million, but, even so, what you are asking for is, collectively, nigh on £100 million of new money, and you have never said from where that will come.

You have all referred back to the agreement that was made across the parties in June 2005—

Jenny Randerson: We are happy to tell you where we would get it from. We would not have given free prescriptions to everyone, and we would not give free parking to everyone, regardless of whether they need it or not. That gives you a starting point. We also would not be providing free laptops.

Janet Ryder: I cannot believe that you would question £5 million to cover car parking charges for people who repeatedly have to go hospital for cancer treatment, or to visit dying relatives.

Alun Cairns: Will you take an intervention?

Janet Ryder: I have already taken two interventions, Alun. We must also remember that the Liberal Democrats were going to give free toothbrushes to everyone. However, again, that does not come anywhere near to matching the amounts of money that you are demanding.

Going back to that 2005 debate, we all agreed that we had a huge pot of extra money coming from Westminster for higher education. In England, the decision was taken to give that money to higher education institutions, and to allow them to raise top-up fees on top of that. This year, £74 million will be going into student fee relief. That decision was taken by everyone in this Chamber; it is a decision that is included in

O ble yn y byd y daw'r dros £200 miliwn hwn o arian newydd? Nid ydych byth yn dweud hynny wrthym.

Michael German: Mae'r ffigur hwnnw o £190 miliwn yn dipyn o or-ddweud—yr oeddwn yn gofyn am £3 miliwn.

Janet Ryder: Yr wyf yn cyfeirio at eich cwestiwn i'r Prif Weinidog ddoe ynglŷn ag arian newydd ar gyfer AB. Deallais eich bod yn gofyn am swm llawer mwy na £3 miliwn, ond hyd yn oed felly, mae'r hyn yr ydych yn gofyn amdano, gyda'i gilydd, bron yn £100 miliwn o arian newydd, ac nid ydych erioed wedi dweud o ble y daw hwnnw.

Yr ydych i gyd wedi cyfeirio'n ôl at y cytundeb a wnaed rhwng y pleidiau ym mis Mehefin 2005—

Jenny Randerson: Yr ydym yn hapus i ddweud wrthyech o ble y byddem yn ei gael. Ni fyddem ni wedi rhoi presgripsiynau am ddim i bawb, ac ni fyddem wedi rhoi parcio am ddim i bawb, p'un a oes ei angen arnynt ai peidio. Dyna fan cychwyn ichi. Ni fyddem ychwaith yn darparu gliniaduron am ddim.

Janet Ryder: Ni allaf gredu y byddech yn cwestiynu £5 miliwn gogyfer â'r taliadau parcio i bobl sy'n gorfod mynd i'r ysbyty dro ar ôl tro i gael triniaeth am ganser, neu i ymweld â pherthnasau sy'n marw.

Alun Cairns: A gymerwch chi ymyriad?

Janet Ryder: Yr wyf eisoes wedi cymryd dau ymyriad, Alun. Rhaid inni gofio hefyd fod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn mynd i roi brwshys dannedd am ddim i bawb. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny eto'n dod yn agos at gyrraedd y symiau o arian yr ydych chi'n galw amdanynt.

I fynd yn ôl at y ddadl honno yn 2005, cytunodd pawb ohonom fod gennym gronfa enfawr o arian ychwanegol yn dod o San Steffan ar gyfer addysg uwch. Yn Lloegr, penderfynwyd rhoi'r arian hwnnw i sefydliadau addysg uwch, a chaniatáu iddynt godi ffioedd atodol ar ben hynny. Eleni, bydd £74 miliwn yn mynd ar ffurf rhyddhau o ffioedd myfyrwyr. Gwnaed y penderfyniad hwnnw gan bawb yn y Siambr hon; mae'n

'One Wales', and Labour and Plaid Cymru are still signed up to it in order to do the best that we can to tackle student debt. Student debt in England is really starting to mount up now, as students face, year on year, increasingly high fees.

The fact remains that the amount of funding in our system in Wales is comparable to that in England; the extra funding comes from top-up fees. Therefore, the opposition parties must tell us today from where that they would get that extra money. Will it be from top-up fees? David Cameron has said that, if you want those things—and as we all know, we also have to keep taxes down in this country—the money must come from somewhere, and that students will have to make a contribution. David Cameron, who I thought was the leader of the Conservative and Unionist Party, and therefore your leader, has said that.

The Liberal Democrats are going to turn their back on students—they will either introduce top-up fees—

Kirsty Williams *rose*—

Janet Ryder: You can respond when you are summing up, Kirsty. The Liberal Democrats will either introduce top-up fees or cut public services. Given the amounts of extra money that you are demanding, tell us where else in the budget that money will come from.

Kirsty Williams *rose*—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I am sorry, Kirsty, but Janet is not taking any more interventions, so you can stop popping up and down.

Janet Ryder: I am afraid that it is a stark fact that you have to face. We need to know where the extra money will come from.

Bethan Jenkins: This is an important debate for us to have in Wales, given that there will be a review in Westminster in 2009 of top-up

benderfyniad sydd wedi'i gynnwys yn 'Cymru'n Un', ac mae Llafur a Phlaid Cymru yn dal wedi ymrwymo iddo er mwyn gwneud y gorau a allwn i fynd i'r afael â dyledion myfyrwyr. Mae dyledion myfyrwyr yn Lloegr yn dechrau cronni o ddifrif erbyn hyn, wrth i fyfyrwyr wynebu ffioedd cynyddol uwch, o flwyddyn i flwyddyn.

Erys y ffaith fod y swm o arian yn ein system ni yng Nghymru yn cymharu â'r hyn sydd gan Loegr; daw'r cyllid ychwanegol o'r ffioedd atodol. Felly, rhaid i'r gwrthbleidiau ddweud wrthym heddiw o ble y byddent yn cael yr arian ychwanegol hwnnw. Ai o ffioedd atodol? Mae David Cameron wedi dweud, os ydych am gael y pethau hynny—ac fel y gwyddom i gyd, rhaid inni gadw'r trethi i lawr hefyd yn y wlad hon—ei bod yn rhaid i'r arian ddod o rywle, ac y bydd yn rhaid i fyfyrwyr gyfrannu. David Cameron, yr oeddwn i'n credu ei fod yn arweinydd y Blaid Geidwadol ac Unoliaethol, ac felly yn arweinydd arnoch chi, sydd wedi dweud hynny.

Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn mynd i droi eu cefnau ar fyfyrwyr—un ai byddant yn cyflwyno ffioedd atodol—

Kirsty Williams *a gododd*—

Janet Ryder: Gallwch ymateb wrth i chi grynhoi, Kirsty. Bydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol un ai'n cyflwyno ffioedd atodol ynteu'n cwtogi gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. O gofio'r symiau o arian ychwanegol yr ydych yn galw amdanynt, dywedwch wrthym o ble arall yn y gyllideb y daw'r arian hwnnw.

Kirsty Williams *a gododd*—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Kirsty, ond nid yw Janet yn cymryd rhagor o ymyriadau, felly, gallwch roi'r gorau i neidio i fyny ac i lawr.

Janet Ryder: Mae arnaf ofn ei bod yn ffaith galed y mae'n rhaid ichi ei hwynebu. Mae angen inni wybod o ble y daw'r arian ychwanegol.

Bethan Jenkins: Mae hon yn ddadl bwysig inni ei chael yng Nghymru, o gofio y bydd adolygiad o ffioedd atodol yn San Steffan yn

fees. I want to clarify the point that Janet Ryder made about funding in Wales. It is interesting that we are so ready to compare what is happening in England in terms of funding, but are not ready to compare the policies of different parties across the United Kingdom. We are receiving less as a Barnett consequential because we do not have top-up fees in Wales. Therefore, it is a difficult to continue to compare the situation with regard to funding for higher education institutions in Wales with that in England, and, in some respects, it is not fair to do so. That is the point that I wish to make to people such as Alun Cairns, who obviously do not understand the system.

Alun Cairns: I am grateful to Bethan Jenkins for that, because it allows me to clarify that with regard to UK policy—and it is at a UK level where the Barnett formula would generally be decided upon—it has been agreed by George Osborne that the next Conservative Government will look at the Barnett formula to see how it can be made fairer.

Bethan Jenkins: We will await that Barnett review, then, but I do not understand why your party says at one level that it is for top-up fees, while, in Wales, you have been given carte blanche to go in a different way. As you belong to a unionist party, I would have thought that you would be the first person to support your leader in London.

The concerns that I wish to raise are from the student movement point of view, specifically issues that NUS Wales has raised with me. I understand that there will be a review of the Assembly learning grant, but I wish to ask the Minister whether such a review could take place in line with the review of top-up fees at Westminster. A disjointed picture of what is happening could be created if those reports are not taken at the same pace. We could have a situation where top-up fees are increased in England but not in Wales, and we need to ensure that we are substantially mitigating the effects on students in Wales.

The One Wales Government has ruled out the introduction of top-up fees during this

2009. Yr wyf am egluro'r pwynt a wnaeth Janet Ryder am gyllido yng Nghymru. Mae'n ddi-ddorol ein bod mor barod i gymharu'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn Lloegr o safbwynt cyllido, ond nad ydym yn barod i gymharu polisïau gwahanol bleidiau ar draws y Deyrnas Unedig. Yr ydym yn cael llai fel swm Barnett canlyniadol oherwydd nad oes gennym ffioedd atodol yng Nghymru. Felly, mae'n anodd parhau i gymharu'r sefyllfa o ran cyllido sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru â'r sefyllfa yn Lloegr, ac mewn rhai ffyrdd nid yw'n deg gwneud hynny. Dyna'r pwynt yr wyf am ei wneud wrth bobl fel Alun Cairns, nad ydynt yn amlwg yn deall y system.

Alun Cairns: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Bethan Jenkins am hynny, oherwydd mae'n caniatáu imi egluro, o ran polisi'r DU—ac ar lefel y DU y byddid fel arfer yn penderfynu fformiwla Barnett—fod George Osborne wedi cytuno y bydd y Llywodraeth Geidwadol newydd yn edrych ar fformiwla Barnett i weld sut y gellir ei gwneud yn decach.

Bethan Jenkins: Disgwylw'n am yr adolygiad hwnnw o Barnett, felly, ond ni allaf ddeall pam y mae eich plaid yn dweud ar un lefel ei bod o blaid ffioedd atodol, tra ydych chi, yng Nghymru, wedi cael carte blanche i fynd i gyfeiriad gwahanol. Gan eich bod yn perthyn i blaid unoliaethol, byddwn wedi tybio mai chi fyddai'r person cyntaf i gefnogi eich arweinydd yn Llundain.

Daw'r pryderon yr wyf am eu codi o safbwynt y mudiad myfyrwyr, yn benodol materion y mae NUS Cymru wedi'u codi gyda mi. Deallaf y bydd adolygiad o grant dysgu'r Cynulliad, ond hoffwn ofyn i'r Gweinidog a ellid cynnal adolygiad o'r fath yn unol â'r adolygiad o ffioedd atodol yn San Steffan. Gallai darlun darniog gael ei greu o'r hyn sy'n digwydd pe na bai'r adroddiadau hynny'n symud ar yr un cyflymdra. Gallen gael sefyllfa lle caiff ffioedd atodol eu cynyddu yn Lloegr ond nid yng Nghymru, ac mae angen inni sicrhau ein bod yn lliniaru'r effeithiau ar fyfyrwyr yng Nghymru yn sylweddol.

Mae Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un wedi gwrthod cyflwyno ffioedd atodol yn ystod y Cynulliad

Assembly, and we need to build on that consensus. We have recently shown that we can do things differently in Wales, with Edwina Hart's declaration that she will fund NHS provision for asylum seekers in Wales awaiting deportation. That is a fundamental difference of policy that we can maintain in Wales.

If we look at other countries, the Scottish Nationalist Party has scrapped its graduate endowment scheme for students in Scotland, and Ireland has given grants from 1996 onwards, so we must also look at these new ideas.

On the other element of the motion, with regard to part-time study, as someone who was a member of the Graham review into part-time study, I urge the Minister to look again at its recommendations, specifically with regard to the child poverty agenda in terms of encouraging people with children to access higher education. Another interesting idea that emerged from that report was an entitlement scheme for those who want to take higher education courses but who do not have the finances to pay for the initial start-up courses, and perhaps providing a series of free courses that they could tap into.

To conclude, it is important that we acknowledge that a gap exists in higher education—we are not denying that. That has much to do with the fact that the Barnett formula must be looked at again, and I am glad that the Liberal Democrats and the Tories are willing to do that with us, as we can then we can work together to find a solution to this funding situation.

4.00 p.m.

The Minister for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills (Jane Hutt): Kirsty, I welcome your positive and constructive opening remarks on the role played by, and the contribution, of higher education in Wales. I was pleased to announce, in Plenary last week, my proposal to establish a task and finish group for higher education, chaired by Professor Merfyn Jones, vice-chancellor of Bangor University and chair of Higher Education Wales. With

hwn, ac mae angen inni adeiladu ar y consensws hwnnw. Yr ydym wedi dangos yn ddiweddar y gallwn wneud pethau'n wahanol yng Nghymru, gyda datganiad Edwina Hart y bydd yn cyllido darpariaeth GIG i geiswyr lloches yng Nghymru sy'n disgwyl cael eu hanfon o'r wlad. Mae hwnnw'n wahaniaeth polisi sylfaenol y gallwn ei gynnal yng Nghymru.

Os edrychwn ar wledydd eraill, mae Plaid Genedlaethol yr Alban wedi dileu ei chynllun gwaddol graddedigion i fyfyrwyr yn yr Alban, ac mae Iwerddon wedi rhoi grantiau er 1996, felly, rhaid i ni hefyd edrych ar y syniadau newydd hyn.

O ran yr elfen arall yn y cynnig, o safbwynt astudio rhan-amser, fel rhywun a oedd yn aelod o adolygiad Graham i astudio rhan-amser, anogaf y Gweinidog i edrych eto ar ei argymhellion, yn benodol yng nghyd-destun yr agenda tlodi plant o safbwynt annog pobl sydd â phlant i droi at addysg uwch. Syniad diddorol arall a ddaeth o'r adroddiad hwnnw oedd cynllun hawl i bobl sydd am ddilyn cyrsiau addysg uwch ond nad oes ganddynt arian i dalu am y cyrsiau dechreuol cychwynnol, ac efallai ddarparu cyfres o gyrsiau am ddim y gallent fanteisio arnynt.

I gloi, mae'n bwysig inni gydnabod bod yna fwch mewn addysg uwch—nid ydym yn gwadu hynny. Mae a wnelo hynny lawer â'r ffaith ei bod yn rhaid edrych eto ar fformiwla Barnett, ac yr wyf yn falch fod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a'r Torïaid yn barod i wneud hynny gyda ni, oherwydd wedyn gallwn weithio gyda'n gilydd i gael ateb i'r sefyllfa gyllido hon.

Y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau (Jane Hutt): Kirsty, yr wyf yn croesawu eich sylwadau agoriadol cadarnhaol ac adeiladol am rôl addysg uwch yng Nghymru ac am ei chyfraniad. Yr oeddwn yn falch cyhoeddi, yn y cyfarfod Llawn yr wythnos diwethaf, fy nghynnig i sefydlu grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar gyfer addysg uwch, dan gadeiryddiaeth yr Athro Merfyn Jones, is-ganghellor Prifysgol Bangor a chadeirydd Addysg Uwch Cymru. Gyda'i

his colleagues, the members of that group, he will take a fresh and constructive look at the innovative and wide-ranging approach that we can take when exploring the options that are open to higher education institutions in Wales in terms of funding opportunities.

If you look at the strategic priorities that we recently set out for higher education in Wales—with a budget allocation of almost £440 million for 2008-09, which is a significant contribution from the Assembly Government—you will see that we also included, as I am sure that you are aware, contributions to relieve pay pressures in higher education institutions, including those related to our commitment to, and recognition, of equal pay. Of course, that has come at a time of a very tight settlement, which we recognise, and difficult choices had to be made across all sectors in Wales. Let us not forget that institutional funding and student finance in Wales, taken together, are on a par with the levels in England. We should focus our energies on the positives and build on the success of higher education, to avoid creating instability in the sector.

Alun Cairns: I am grateful to the Minister for giving way. Does the Minister accept the fact that if you have a new liability or a new outgoing, you need to increase your income in order to satisfy that. If you do not do that, the real-terms funding for HE becomes a real-terms cut?

Jane Hutt: You address this by looking at the positives and building on the successes in higher education. I am pleased that Alun Davies recognised that in his positive endorsement of the role of higher education in Wales, recognising the challenges in the global context and the issues in terms of widening access.

On the economic contribution of HE, a lot of good work has been done in recent years to make the most of higher education in the Welsh economy. I know that Kirsty Williams quoted these figures. The income of Welsh HEIs in 2006-07 was just over £1 billion and their direct economic impact was probably

gyd-aelodau ar y grŵp hwnnw, bydd yn cymryd golwg ffres ac adeiladol ar yr agwedd arloesol ac eang ei chwmpas y gallwn ei chymryd wrth astudio'r dewisiadau sydd ar gael i sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru o ran cyfleoedd ariannu.

Os edrychwch ar y blaenoriaethau strategol a bennwyd gennym yn ddiweddar ar gyfer addysg uwch yng Nghymru—gyda dyraniad cyllideb o bron £440 miliwn am 2008-09, sydd yn gyfraniad sylweddol gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad—fe welwch ein bod wedi cynnwys hefyd, fel y sylweddolwch, mae'n siŵr, gyfraniadau i liniaru pwysau cyflogau mewn sefydliadau addysg uwch, gan gynnwys rhai cysylltiedig â'n hymrwymiad a'n cydnabyddiaeth i gyflog cyfartal. Wrth gwrs, mae hynny wedi dod ar adeg setliad tynn iawn, a sylweddolwn hynny, a bu raid gwneud dewisiadau anodd ar draws pob sector yng Nghymru. Nac anghofiwn fod cyllid i sefydliadau a chyllid myfyrwyr yng Nghymru, o'u cymryd gyda'i gilydd, ar yr un lefelau ag yn Lloegr. Dylem ganolbwyntio ein hegnïon ar y pethau cadarnhaol ac adeiladu ar lwyddiant addysg uwch, i osgoi creu ansefydlogrwydd yn y sector.

Alun Cairns: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am ildio. A yw'r Gweinidog yn derbyn y ffaith, os oes gennych rwymedigaeth newydd neu swm newydd yn mynd allan, fod angen ichi gynyddu eich incwm i fodloni hynny? Os na wnewch hynny, bydd y cyllid mewn termau real i addysg uwch yn troi'n gwtogi mewn termau real.

Jane Hutt: Rhaid delio â hyn drwy edrych ar y pwyntiau cadarnhaol ac adeiladu ar y llwyddiannau mewn addysg uwch. Yr wyf yn falch fod Alun Davies wedi cydnabod hynny yn ei gymeradwyaeth bositif i rôl addysg uwch yng Nghymru, gan gydnabod yr her yn y cyd-destun byd-eang a'r problemau o ran ehangu mynediad.

Ynglŷn â chyfraniad economaidd addysg uwch, mae llawer o waith da wedi'i wneud yn y blynyddoedd diweddar i wneud y gorau o addysg uwch yn economi Cymru. Gwn fod Kirsty Williams wedi dyfynnu'r ffigurau hyn. Yr oedd incwm sefydliadau addysg uwch Cymru yn 2006-07 ychydig dros £1 biliwn

over twice that much. As has been recognised, in Wales as a whole and locally in our communities, the relationship with business and research is key.

Again, let us use this debate as an opportunity to acknowledge the success. We have achieved a great deal and our institutions have strong relationships with businesses in Wales. For example, Swansea University's Institute of Life Science involves a major collaboration with IBM and Boots, and the North East Wales Institute of Higher Education has developed a foundation degree in aerospace engineering with Airbus UK and Deeside College. Let us get that on the Record today in terms of the positives and of addressing the financial challenges. Alun, they are challenges.

Kirsty Williams: Minister, I did my best in my contribution to paint a picture of what the university sector is currently achieving in Wales. The thrust of my debate is that that success will fundamentally be put at risk unless we can address the issue of funding. It is absolutely ridiculous for Plaid Cymru and Government members to turn around and say that this funding does not put that at risk; it does. That is a u-turn on their behalf because this used to be important to them, but now it is not. It is not even a question of addressing the shortfall, because you are not even keeping pace with England. Your Government has to take the policy agenda forward if we are going to address the issue of funding. At the moment, you are doing nothing but setting up another committee.

Jane Hutt: Kirsty, I think that you are not prepared to recognise the achievements of, and the developments in, higher education. I will give you the facts and figures from the latest UK higher education-business and community interaction survey. It indicates that Welsh higher education accounted for 6.8 per cent of the UK's income and turnover, through the links between business and higher education. That is what we need to recognise and build on. By undermining the opportunities, you are not building on that. Of course, you recognise the need for us

a'u heffaith economaidd uniongyrchol yn fwy na dwywaith hynny mae'n debyg. Fel sydd wedi'i gydnabod, yng Nghymru'n gyffredinol ac yn lleol yn ein cymunedau, mae'r berthynas â busnes ac ymchwil yn allweddol.

Eto, gadewch inni ddefnyddio'r ddadl hon fel cyfle i gydnabod y llwyddiant. Yr ydym wedi cyflawni llawer iawn ac mae gan ein sefydliadau gysylltiadau cryf â busnesau yng Nghymru. Er enghraifft, mae Sefydliad Gwyddor Bywyd Prifysgol Abertawe'n ffrwyth cydweithio pwysig gydag IBM a Boots, ac mae Athrofa Addysg Uwch Gogledd-ddwyrain Cymru wedi datblygu gradd sylfaen mewn peirianeg aerofod gydag Airbus UK a Choleg Glannau Dyfrdwy. Gadewch inni roi hynny ar y Cofnod heddiw o ran y pethau positif ac o ran wynebu'r heriau ariannol. Alun, y maent yn heriau.

Kirsty Williams: Weinidog, gwneuthum fy ngorau yn fy nghyfraniad i beintio darlun o'r hyn y mae'r sector prifysgol yn ei gyflawni ar hyn o bryd yng Nghymru. Ergyd fy nadl yw y peryglir y llwyddiant hwnnw'n sylfaenol oni allwn ddatrys cwestiwn cyllid. Mae'n gwbl chwerthinllyd i aelodau Plaid Cymru a'r Llywodraeth droi atom a dweud nad yw'r cyllid hwn yn peryglu hynny; y mae'n gwneud. Tro pedol ar eu rhan hwy yw hynny oherwydd arferai hyn fod yn bwysig iddynt, ond nid yw felly mwyach. Nid yw hyd yn oed yn gwestiwn o roi sylw i'r diffyg, oherwydd nid ydych hyd yn oed yn cadw'n gyfartal â Lloegr. Rhaid i'ch Llywodraeth fynd â'r agenda polisi yn ei blaen os ydym i ddatrys cwestiwn cyllid. Ar hyn o bryd, nid ydych yn gwneud dim ond sefydlu pwyllgor arall.

Jane Hutt: Kirsty, tybiaf nad ydych yn barod i gydnabod yr hyn a gyflawnwyd gan addysg uwch a'r datblygiadau ynddi. Dyma i chi'r ffeithiau a'r ffigurau o'r arolwg diweddaraf o'r berthynas rhwng addysg uwch a busnes a'r gymuned yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Maent yn dangos bod addysg uwch Cymru yn gyfrifol am 6.8 y cant o incwm a throsiant y Deyrnas Unedig, trwy'r cysylltiadau rhwng busnes ac addysg uwch. Dyna y mae angen inni ei gydnabod ac adeiladu arno. Drwy danseilio'r cyfleoedd nid ydych yn adeiladu ar hynny. Wrth gwrs, yr ydych yn cydnabod bod angen

to promote high-quality research, and we need it in volume. That is why 'Reaching Higher' was established, namely to support reconfiguration, collaboration and capacity building in that way. The Wales Institute of Cognitive Neuroscience is a perfect example of this. That is an exciting opportunity to develop an internationally recognised, world-leading institute.

Alun, you mentioned Aberystwyth, where there are top levels of student satisfaction. We cannot talk about world-leading projects without highlighting the Institute of Biological, Environmental and Rural Sciences, and I look forward to Elin's reception that will shortly be held in the Senedd, and where we will not only welcome IBERS, which brings together the Institute of Grassland and Environmental Research and Aberystwyth University, but we will also welcome back the world-leading scientist and Welshman, Professor Wayne Powell, who is returning to lead that institute, showing his confidence in the Welsh higher education sector.

Alun Cairns: Will you give way?

Jane Hutt: No; I have already given way to you. Do we see that kind of confidence among the opposition? I only see a great deal of muddle in the opposition's approach to this debate.

I want to respond positively to what Peter and Bethan said about the contribution of part-timers. I welcome that part of your motion, Kirsty, because the Graham review, which the Welsh Assembly Government commissioned and which was published in 2006, offered several options in terms of the complexity of the part-time higher education sector. The review group was adamant that whatever arrangements were put in place, they should promote parity of esteem between part-time learners in higher education and their full-time counterparts. That is a critical commitment that I would like to hear more about. I would like to have more questions—[*Interruption.*]

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. She has already said that she is not taking any more interventions.

inni hyrwyddo ymchwil o safon uchel, ac mae angen llawer ohono. Dyna pam y sefydlwyd 'Ymgeisio yn Uwch', sef cefnogi ad-drefnu, cydweithio ac adeiladu gallu fel hynny. Mae Sefydliad Niwrowyddoniaeth Wybyddol Cymru yn enghraifft berffaith o hyn. Mae hwnnw'n gyfle cyffrous i ddatblygu sefydliad a gydnbyddir yn rhyngwladol ac a all arwain y byd.

Alun, cybwyllwyd Aberystwyth gennych, lle mae lefelau uchel o foddhad myfyrwyr. Ni allwn sôn am brosiectau sy'n arwain y byd heb dynnu sylw at y Sefydliad Gwyddorau Biolegol, Amgylcheddol a Gwledig, ac edrychaf ymlaen at dderbyniad Elin a gynhelir cyn hir yn y Senedd, a lle byddwn nid yn unig yn croesawu IBERS, sy'n dod â'r Sefydliad Ymchwil Tir Glas a'r Amgylchedd a Phrifysgol Aberystwyth ynghyd, ond hefyd yn estyn croeso'n ôl i'r gwyddonydd bydenwog a'r Cymro, yr Athro Wayne Powell, sy'n dychwelyd i arwain y sefydliad hwnnw, gan ddangos ei hyder yn y sector addysg uwch yng Nghymru.

Alun Cairns: A wnewch chi ildio?

Jane Hutt: Na wnaif; yr wyf eisoes wedi ildio ichi. A yw'r math hwnnw o hyder i'w weld ymhlith y gwrthbleidiau? Ni welaf ddim ond llawer iawn o ddryswch yn agwedd y gwrthbleidiau at y ddadl hon.

Mae arnaf eisiau ymateb yn gadarnhaol i'r hyn a ddywedodd Peter a Bethan am gyfraniad myfyrwyr rhan-amser. Croesawaf y rhan honno o'ch cynnig, Kirsty, oherwydd yr oedd adolygiad Graham, a gomisiynwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ac a gyhoeddwyd yn 2006, yn cynnig nifer o ddewisiadau gyda chymhlethdod y sector addysg uwch rhan-amser. Yr oedd y grŵp adolygu'n bendant y dylai pa bynnag drefniadau a sefydlid hybu cydraddoldeb parch rhwng dysgwyr rhan-amser mewn addysg uwch a'u cymheiriaid amser llawn. Mae hynny'n ymrwymiad hanfodol yr hoffwn glywed mwy amdano. Hoffwn gael mwy o gwestiynau—[*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae hi eisoes wedi dweud nad yw am gymryd rhagor o ymyriadau.

Jane Hutt: I would like to have more questions about how we are delivering the Graham review. The package of student support that we have made available to part-time students includes additional grants, for example, grants for issues such as childcare.

To conclude, I have referred to the muddle that I hear from the opposition; it is a bottomless pit of contradictory commitments. Janet Ryder eloquently exposed the political flaws of our opposition. Alun Cairns has today invented a new party in Wales of which we were not aware. Although he clings on to David Cameron's coat tails at any opportunity, we now hear of a new party that is ditching David Cameron's commitment in terms of top-up fees.

Kirsty, what we want is action, not rhetoric. I am proud that I have appointed one of the leading vice-chancellors in Wales to lead the ministerial advisory group and I am proud of what the higher education sector has achieved by working together, seizing opportunities, maximising effectiveness and making the best use of resources available. I agree with Bethan and Janet that the ability to learn, not the ability to pay, should be the most important factor for students, and that is what we should be tackling.

Jenny Randerson: I could not have said it better myself. The Minister has just said that what we need is action, not rhetoric. If only there was some action.

I want to browse briefly through this fascinating debate. Kirsty started by emphasising, rightly, the importance of the size and growth of the funding gap and the importance of the HE sector to the Welsh economy and to the future of Wales, which is what we are talking about. I am pleased that the Minister also emphasised the importance of the sector to our economy and our future. Alun Cairns talked about it from a similar viewpoint, namely that of investment in Wales. I found Janet Ryder's hypocrisy absolutely breathtaking—

Janet Ryder: Will you give way?

Jane Hutt: Hoffwn gael mwy o gwestiynau am y modd yr ydym yn gweithredu adolygiad Graham. Mae'r pecyn cefnogaeth myfyrwyr yr ydym wedi'i ddarparu i fyfyrwyr rhan-amser yn cynnwys grantiau ychwanegol, er enghraifft, grantiau at bethau fel gofal plant.

I gloi, yr wyf wedi cyfeirio at y dryswch a glywaf gan y gwrthbleidiau; mae'n bwl diwaelod o ymrwymadau croes. Dinoethodd Janet Ryder wallau gwleidyddol ein gwrthwynebwyr yn huawdl. Mae Alun Cairns heddiw wedi dyfeisio plaid newydd yng Nghymru nad oeddem yn ymwybodol ohoni. Er ei fod yn cydio'n dynn yng nghynffon côt David Cameron ar bob cyfle, clywn yn awr am blaid newydd sy'n cefnu ar ymrwymiad David Cameron ar ffioedd atodol.

Kirsty, gweithredu sydd arnom ei eisiau, nid rhethreg. Yr wyf yn falch o fod wedi penodi un o brif is-gangellorion Cymru i arwain y grŵp cynghori gweinidogion, ac yr wyf yn falch o'r hyn y mae'r sector addysg uwch wedi'i gyflawni drwy gydweithio, bachu ar gyfleoedd, cynyddu effeithiolrwydd i'r eithaf a defnyddio'r adnoddau sydd ar gael yn y ffordd orau posibl. Cytunaf â Bethan a Janet mai'r gallu i ddysgu, nid y gallu i dalu, ddylai'r ffactor pwysicaf fod i fyfyrwyr, a dyna y dylem fynd i'r afael ag ef.

Jenny Randerson: Ni allwn fod wedi ei ddweud yn well fy hun. Mae'r Gweinidog newydd ddweud mai gweithredu sydd ei angen, nid rhethreg. O na fyddai ychydig weithredu.

Mae arnaf eisiau pori'n frysiog trwy'r ddadl hynod ddifyr hon. Dechreuodd Kirsty drwy bwysleisio, yn gywir, bwysigrwydd maint a thwf y bwlch cyllido a phwysigrwydd y sector addysg uwch i economi Cymru ac i ddyfodol Cymru, sef yr hyn yr ydym yn ei drafod. Yr wyf yn falch fod y Gweinidog hefyd wedi pwysleisio pwysigrwydd y sector i'n heconomi a'n dyfodol. Siaradodd Alun Cairns amdano o safbwynt tebyg, sef o safbwynt buddsoddi yng Nghymru. Yr oedd rhagrith Janet Ryder, i mi, yn gwbl syfrdanol—

Janet Ryder: A wnewch chi ildio?

Jenny Randerson: To quote from Janet Ryder in early July last year—notice that it was early July—speaking to the First Minister:

‘I am sure that you would agree that given that HEFCW has produced a report that shows this gap, your Government now has a duty to address the situation’.

4.10 p.m.

A Plaid website said, last October, that Plaid had secured a commitment from the Government to close the funding gap. How?

Janet Ryder: On that point, I think that you have just heard the Minister outline how she intends to address that.

Mike German said that you have talked about £3 million. I took an intervention from him yesterday. I have looked at the Record, and he said:

‘That represents a backlog of £92 million and £200 million in new funding missing for Wales. When do you think the further education sector should expect you to be able to close that gap...?’.

Those are the ballpark figures: £290 million for further education, plus this. Where is it coming from?

Jenny Randerson: Janet, you have just made our point for us about the massive funding gap. I hardly need to sum up; you are doing our job for us.

Alun Davies spoke consistently in favour of the motion, but I have no doubt that he will vote against it; it has never bothered him in the past. Bethan has invented an amazing—

Alun Davies: Will you give way?

Jenny Randerson: I am sorry, I do not have time.

Bethan has invented some kind of amazing,

Jenny Randerson: I ddyfynnu geiriau Janet Ryder yn gynnar yng Ngorffennaf y llynedd—sylwer mai yn gynnar yng Ngorffennaf yr oedd hi—wrth siarad â’r Prif Weinidog:

‘Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunech, o gofio bod y cyngor cyllido wedi cynhyrchu adroddiad sydd yn dangos bwlch o’r fath, ei bod bellach yn ddyletswydd ar eich Llywodraeth ddelio â’r sefyllfa’.

Dywedodd gwefan gan Plaid, fis Hydref diwethaf, fod Plaid wedi sicrhau ymrwymiad gan y Llywodraeth i gau’r bwlch cyllido. Sut?

Janet Ryder: Ar y pwynt hwnnw, credaf eich bod newydd glywed y Gweinidog yn amlinellu sut y mae’n bwriadu delio â hynny.

Dywedodd Mike German eich bod wedi sôn am £3 miliwn. Cymerais ymyriad ganddo ef ddoe. Yr wyf wedi edrych ar y Cofnod, a dywedodd:

‘Mae hynny’n cynrychioli ôl-groniad o £92 miliwn a £200 miliwn mewn cyllid coll ar gyfer Cymru. Pryd ydych yn meddwl y dylai’r sector addysg bellach ddisgwyl ichi allu cau’r bwlch hwnnw...?’.

Dyna’r ffigurau bras: £290 miliwn i addysg bellach, ynghyd â hyn. O ble mae’n dod?

Jenny Randerson: Janet, yr ydych newydd wneud ein pwynt drosom ynglŷn â’r bwlch cyllido enfawr. Prin fod angen imi grynhoi; yr ydych yn gwneud ein gwaith drosom.

Siaradodd Alun Davies yn gyson o blaid y cynnig, ond nid oes gennyf amheuaeth o gwbl na fydd yn pleidleisio yn ei erbyn; nid yw erioed wedi cael traferth gwneud hynny yn y gorffennol. Mae Bethan wedi dyfeisio—

Alun Davies: A wnewch chi ildio?

Jenny Randerson: Mae’n ddrwg gennyf, nid oes gennyf amser.

Mae Bethan wedi dyfeisio rhyw fath o siarad

new doublespeak. Suddenly, it is not fair to compare education in England and Wales—even though Plaid Cymru made a full-time job of comparing funding in England and Wales in the last Assembly—because of the approach of the Barnett formula. That is turning Plaid Cymru's *raison d'être* on its head. I will take a brief intervention.

Alun Davies: Thank you, Jenny, for your optimistic interpretation of my words. The point that I was trying to make was that your motion misses the point at every single level and that, if Welsh higher education is to compete in the future, we will have to have different funding mechanisms. If all you are offering are car park charges, it is a wholly inadequate response.

Jenny Randerson: Your Labour Party has had the best part of 10 years in Wales—one way or another; with the help of one party or another—to tackle this issue and it has failed, since 2003, to make any progress. At the end of the partnership Government with the Liberal Democrats, the funding gap was £2 million; it is now £69 million. We were worried that we had only reduced it to £2 million, but it is now spiralling out of control. The problem lies in the denial. Plaid is trying to forget its past and its history, and is trying to rewrite the Assembly record—if only it could get into the computer systems and do it—because it is a constant source of embarrassment to it. Janet is shouting at me about the size of the fee funding gap; I wish you would keep shouting about the size of that gap, as it is massive.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Jenny, if people speak from their chairs, you should ignore what they say; they are not standing up. Members, you may not agree with what Jenny is saying, but I want to hear her. Please carry on.

Jenny Randerson: The issues are serious and difficult. Alun says that we missed the point. In that case, the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales and the university vice-chancellors have all missed the point.

dwbl newydd rhyfeddol. Yn sydyn, nid yw'n deg cymharu addysg yng Nghymru a Lloegr—er i Plaid Cymru wneud gwaith amser llawn o gymharu cyllid yng Nghymru a Lloegr yn y Cynulliad diwethaf—oherwydd dyfodiad fformiwla Barnett. Gwyrdroi rheswm Plaid Cymru dros fodoli yw hynny. Cymeraf ymyriad byr.

Alun Davies: Diolch, Jenny, am eich dehongliad optimistaidd o'm geiriau. Y pwynt yr oeddwn yn ceisio'i wneud oedd bod eich cynnig yn colli'r pwynt ar bob un lefel, ac os yw addysg uwch Cymru am allu cystadlu yn y dyfodol bydd yn rhaid inni gael mecanweithiau cyllido gwahanol. Os codi tâl mewn meysydd parcio yw'r cwbl a ginigwch, mae'n ymateb cwbl annigonol.

Jenny Randerson: Mae eich Plaid Lafur wedi cael y rhan orau o 10 mlynedd yng Nghymru—un ffordd neu'i gilydd; gyda chymorth un blaid neu'i gilydd—i fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn ac mae wedi methu, ers 2003, â symud ymlaen o gwbl. Ar ddiwedd y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth gyda'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, yr oedd y bwlch cyllido yn £2 filiwn; erbyn hyn mae'n £69 miliwn. Yr oeddem ni'n poeni mai dim ond wedi ei ostwng i £2 filiwn yr oeddem, ond bellach mae'n cynyddu allan o reolaeth. Y gwadu yw'r broblem. Mae Plaid yn ceisio anghofio'i gorffennol a'i hanes, ac yn ceisio ailysgrifennu Cofnod y Cynulliad—pe gallai fynd i mewn i'r systemau cyfrifiadurol a gwneud hynny—oherwydd ei fod yn destun embaras cyson iddi. Mae Janet yn gweiddi arnaf am faint bwlch cyllido ffioedd; byddai'n dda gennyf petaech yn dal i weiddi am faint y bwlch hwnnw, gan ei fod yn enfawr.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Jenny, os bydd pobl yn siarad o'u seddi, dylech anwybyddu'r hyn a ddywedant; nid ydynt ar eu traed. Aelodau, efallai na chytunwch â'r hyn y mae Jenny yn ei ddweud, ond mae arnaf fi eisiau ei chlywed. Ewch ymlaen, os gwelwch yn dda.

Jenny Randerson: Mae'r materion yn ddifrifol ac yn anodd. Dywed Alun ein bod wedi colli'r pwynt. Os felly, mae Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru ac is-gangellorion y prifysgolion i gyd wedi colli'r

The issue is that the Government has had many years to find new sources of income. It has known that it would have to face this problem. The writing has been on the wall for many years, ever since we decided, on a cross-party basis, that we would not follow England and impose top-up fees. However, it has failed to come up with anything to solve the problem.

The denial was underlined by the written reply that I received from the First Minister yesterday to a question that we did not get to in Plenary. The question asked whether he had had discussions with the UK Government about lifting the cap on top-up fees. His reply was that, until the review in 2009 commences, there would be little purpose in such discussions. How about dealing with the issue with the UK Government in advance? How about putting your case?

However, the Government here does not intend to look ahead in any way, because it is blinded, like a rabbit in the headlights, by the funding problems that it has, and yet it still goes on scattering freebies as though it had the budget the size of Scotland's and probably 10 per cent extra.

Finally, if you want evidence of the problems, look at the hysteria underlying some of the Plaid Cymru contributions this afternoon and their attempts to rewrite history. I predict serious funding problems in education, from the foundation phase right up to higher education. We are seeing a black hole ahead.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The proposal is to agree amendment 1. Does any Member object? I see that are objections, and so we will defer voting until voting time.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisiau tan yr amser pleidleisio.
Votes deferred until voting time.*

pwynt. Y pwynt yw bod y Llywodraeth wedi cael blynyddoedd lawer i ddod o hyd i ffynonellau incwm newydd. Mae wedi gwybod y byddai'n rhaid iddi wynebu'r broblem hon. Mae'r ysgrifen ar y mur ers blynyddoedd lawer, byth er inni benderfynu, ar sail drawsbleidiol, na fyddem yn dilyn Lloegr a chodi ffioedd atodol. Fodd bynnag, mae wedi methu cyflwyno unrhyw beth i ddatrys y broblem.

Tanlinellwyd y gwadu gan yr ateb ysgrifenedig a gefais gan y Prif Weinidog ddoe i gwestiwn na chyrrhaeddwyd ato yn y cyfarfod Llawn. Y cwestiwn oedd a oedd wedi cael trafodaethau gyda Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig ynglŷn â chodi'r cap ar ffioedd atodol. Ei ateb oedd na fyddai fawr o bwrpas cael trafodaethau o'r fath nes i'r adolygiad ddechrau yn 2009. Beth am ddelio â'r mater gyda Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig ymlaen llaw? Beth am gyflwyno'ch achos?

Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r Llywodraeth yn y fan hon yn bwriadu edrych ymlaen o gwbl, gan ei bod wedi'i dallu, fel cwningen yng ngolau car, gan y problemau sydd ganddi o ran ariannu. Ac eto mae'n dal i rannu rhoddion fel pe byddai ganddi gyllideb o faint cyllideb yr Alban a 10 y cant ar ben hynny, i bob tebyg.

Yn olaf, os ydych am gael tystiolaeth o'r problemau, edrychwch ar yr hysteria a oedd yn rhedeg drwy rai o'r cyfraniadau gan Blaid Cymru y prynhawn yma a'u hymdrechion i ailysgrifennu hanes. Rhagwelaf y bydd problemau difrifol o ran ariannu ym maes addysg, o'r cyfnod sylfaen hyd at addysg uwch. Yr ydym yn gweld twll du o'n blaen.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Y cynnig yw derbyn gwelliant 1. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf fod gwrthwynebiadau, ac felly byddwn yn gohirio pleidleisio tan amser pleidleisio.

Dadl Fer Short Debate

Ysgol a Chymuned School and Community

Gareth Jones: Yr wyf wedi caniatáu amser i Alun Ffred wneud cyfraniad byr ar ôl imi siarad.

Yr wyf wedi dewis 'Ysgol a Chymuned' yn bwnc i'r ddadl fer heddiw er mwyn pwysleisio'r angen i ni fel Cynulliad feddwl o'r newydd am y pwnc. Mae'n hen bryd inni gydnabod y graddau y mae'r naill yn dibynnu ar y llall, ac ystyried ysgol a chymuned gyda'i gilydd yn gyfannol yn hytrach na phethau ar wahân, fel sy'n dueddol o ddigwydd ar hyn o bryd. Mae'n amlwg nad yw'r cyhoedd yn ystyried bod modd gwahanu ysgol a chymuned. Dadl a glywn yn aml yw mai ysgol yw calon cymuned, a bu hynny'n achos dadlau ffyrnig. Bydd yn her fawr i bob plaid ymateb i ddyheadau rhieni a chymunedau.

Slogan y sylwais arni gan ymgyrchwyr dros gadw ysgolion bach oedd, 'Dim ysgol, dim cymuned'. Mae sŵn plant yn chwarae ar iard yn rhoi teimlad o fywyd i bob cymuned. O ystyried y sefyllfa'n ddyfnach, efallai y byddai'n fwy manwl gywir dweud, 'Dim cymuned, dim ysgol'. Y ffaith syml amdani yw nad oes modd i ysgolion fyw mewn gwagle, a, heb inni sicrhau dyfodol cynaliadwy i'n cymunedau, bregus fydd dyfodol ein hysgolion hefyd.

Y drwg ar hyn o bryd yw bod addysg a datblygu cymunedol yn cael eu hystyried fel pe baent yn ddau beth cwbl ar wahân. Mae ein harbenigwyr addysg yn cydnabod bod gan rieni a theuluoedd reswm dros eu teyrngarwch i'w hysgolion bach lleol. Yn ei adroddiad 'Ysgolion Cynradd Bach yng Nghymru' yn 2006, dywedodd Estyn,

'At ei gilydd, ychydig o wahaniaeth sydd yn y safonau a gyflawnir gan ddisgyblion neu yn ansawdd yr addysg a ddarperir gan ysgolion bach o'u cymharu ag ysgolion eraill.'

Gareth Jones: I have given Alun Ffred permission to make a brief contribution after I have spoken.

I have chosen 'School and Community' as the topic of today's short debate to emphasise the need for the Assembly to think afresh about the issue. It is high time that we acknowledged the extent to which one depends on the other, and started thinking about the school and the community holistically, rather than separately, which tends to happen at present. It is apparent that the public sees the school and the community as being inseparable. A claim that we hear often is that schools are the heart of communities; that has been the subject of fierce debate. It will be a huge challenge for all parties to respond to the aspirations of parents and communities.

One slogan which I noticed being used by campaigners to keep small schools open was 'No school, no community'. The sound of children playing on the yard gives each community a sense of vitality. To look at the picture in more detail, perhaps it would be more accurate to say, 'No community, no school'. The simple fact is that schools cannot exist in a vacuum, and unless we secure a sustainable future for our communities, the future of our schools will also be in jeopardy.

The trouble at present is that education and community development are considered as if they were two separate concepts. Our educational experts acknowledge that parents and families have good reason to feel an allegiance towards their small local schools. In its 2006 report, 'Small Primary Schools in Wales', Estyn stated that,

'Overall, there is little difference in the standards achieved by pupils or in the quality of education provided by small schools when compared with other schools.'

Mae agweddau ar yr adroddiad hwnnw yn tanlinellu'r hyn yr wyf yn ei ddweud, sef bod tueddiad i edrych ar addysg mewn gwagle, gyda'r pwyslais ar gadw ysgol yn agored yn hytrach na buddsoddi yn y gymuned. Mae'r cynllun trefniadaeth ysgolion, a gyhoeddwyd yng Ngorffennaf 2002 gan Lywodraeth Cymru, yn dangos hyn yn amlycach byth. Nid oes ynddo ddim asesu datblygu cymunedol pellach i'r dyfodol, sy'n golygu ei fod yn gwbl amddifad o unrhyw weledigaeth hirdymor. Yn wir, ym mharagraff 2.2, ar dudalen 20, crybwyllir cau ysgolion hyd yn oed yn yr ardaloedd hynny sy'n cael cyllid adfywio. Yn sicr ddigon, nid yw cau ysgolion yn gyson ag adfywio cymunedol.

Nid oes dwywaith bod rhai o'n polisïau addysg hefyd yn cyfrannu at gadw ysgol a chymuned ar wahân. Mae'r polisi ariannu ysgolion, yn enghraifft, yn caniatáu i ddisgyblion fynychu ysgolion y tu allan i'w dalgylch a mynd â'r arian gyda nhw. Mae hynny'n gwanychu'r ysgol, yn achosi i'r rhieni golli ffydd ac efallai symud o'r gymuned, gan ychwanegu at y dirywiad. Rhaid cael polisi ariannu sy'n seiliedig ar boblogaeth y gymuned a'r ddarpariaeth addysgol gyffredinol, megis y cwricwlwm a phrofiadau dysgu, yn hytrach na pholisi sy'n seiliedig ar y disgybl unigol. Hynny yw, rhaid adnabod anghenion y gymuned a buddsoddi yn y gymuned gyfan ac nid mewn un rhan ohoni yn unig. Dylai'r pwyslais fod ar fuddsoddi arian yn yr hirdymor yn lle gwario arian yn y tymor byr.

4.20 p.m.

Araf hefyd fu llywodraeth leol yn gweld y cysylltiad rhwng ysgol a chymuned. Mae papur ymgynghorol gan awdurdod Conwy yn gwbl seiliedig ar faterion addysgol a phrin yw'r cyfeiriad at gymuned. Mae fel pe bai'n ystyried y gymuned—gan gynnwys gwasanaethau fel cludiant, siopau, swyddfa'r post ac ati—fel atodiad yn hytrach na rhywbeth sydd wedi'i gysylltu â'r ysgol. Eto i gyd mae ambell lygedyn gobeithiol yma ac acw, fel cynllun canolog sir Ddinbych, sy'n cydnabod y berthynas rhwng gwahanol feysydd er mwyn sicrhau bod cymunedau gwledig yn economaidd, cymdeithasol a diwylliannol weithgar.

Some aspects of that report serve to emphasise my point, namely that there is a tendency to look at education in a vacuum, with the emphasis placed on keeping a school open rather than on investing in the community. The school organisation plan, published in July 2002 by the Government of Wales, throws this into even sharper relief. There is nothing in it to assess community development for the future, which means that it is entirely devoid of any long-term vision. Indeed, in paragraph 2.2, on page 20, mention is made of closing schools even in those areas that are in receipt of regeneration funding. Clearly, school closures do not sit comfortably with community regeneration.

There is no doubt that some of our education policies also contribute to keeping schools and communities separate. The policy on school funding, for example, allows pupils to attend schools outside their catchment area and take the funding with them. That weakens schools, and parents become disillusioned and may move away from a community, thus contributing to its decline. We need a funding policy which is based upon a community's population and upon general educational provision, such as the curriculum and learning experiences, rather than being based upon the individual pupil. In other words, we must identify the needs of the community and invest in the community as a whole, not in one part of it only. The emphasis should be on investment in the long term rather than expenditure in the short term.

Local government has also been slow to see the link between school and community. A consultation paper by Conwy council is based entirely on educational matters and little reference is made to community. It is as though it sees the community—including services such as transport, shops, the post office and so on—as an addendum rather being linked to the school. However, there is a glimmer of hope here and there, such as Denbighshire's central plan, which acknowledges the relationship between various areas in order to ensure that rural communities are economically, socially and culturally active.

Rhaid croesawu ymchwiliad Is-bwyllgor Datblygu Gwledig y Cynulliad i ad-drefnu ysgolion gwledig. Bydd yn ystyried y darlun cymdeithasol ac addysgol ehangach a'r effaith a gaiff unrhyw ad-drefnu ar gymunedau gwledig, teuluoedd a phlant.

The review by the Assembly Rural Development Sub-committee into the reorganisation of rural schools is to be welcomed. It will consider the broader social and educational picture and the effect any reorganisation will have on rural communities, families and children.

Fis Medi y llynedd, cefais y ffrainc o siarad yng nghyfarfod canmlwyddiant a hanner Ysgol Ysbyty Ifan. Mae'n ysgol fach arbennig iawn a'i phlant i gyd yn dod o aelwydydd Cymraeg, ac mae'n chwarae rhan bwysig ym mywyd cymdeithasol y gymuned. Fodd bynnag, mae bron yn gyfan gwbl ddibynnol ar y diwydiant amaeth. Heb fywoliaeth ar ffermydd ucheldir Cymru, ni fyddai gobaith o gwbl i ysgol o'r fath. Os ydym am sicrhau dyfodol hirdymor iddi, y cam cyntaf amlwg yw sicrhau dyfodol economaidd a chymdeithasol i'r ardal honno.

Last September, I had the privilege of speaking in the one-hundred-and-fiftieth anniversary of Ysgol Ysbyty Ifan. It is a very special small school whose children all come from Welsh-speaking homes, and it plays a vital part in the fabric of the community. However, it is almost entirely dependent on the agricultural industry. Without being able to make a living on Wales's hill farms, there would be no hope at all for such a school. If we want to ensure that it has a long-term future, the first and obvious step is to ensure an economic and social future for that area.

Yr wyf yn cydnabod ymdrech y Cynulliad i feddwl yn drawsbynciol. Enghraifft o hynny yw'r ffordd y mae'r pwyllgorau craffu ar eu newydd wedd yn gweithio. Hefyd, gwnaed datganiad diweddar gan y Gweinidog am gynllun partneriaeth llywodraeth leol, a gwnaed cryn ddefnydd ganddi o'r gair 'integreiddio' o ran gwasanaethau. Mae'r pwyslais arbennig yn y papur hwnnw i'w groesawu. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n nodwedd amlwg o ddulliau gweithredu Llywodraeth y Cynulliad eto.

I acknowledge the Assembly's efforts to think in a cross-cutting way. The way the new scrutiny committees work is an example of that. The Minister made a statement recently about the local government partnership scheme, and she made much use of the word 'integration' in relation to services. The special emphasis in that paper is to be welcomed. However, it is not yet an obvious feature of the Welsh Assembly Government's way of working.

Nid oes dim diben i ni fel gwleidyddion ddadlau dros hybu a diogelu cydlyniant cymdeithasol ac adfywio cymdeithasol os oes gennym bolisiâu mewn grym sy'n tanseilio'r gwedd allweddol hwnnw. Er ein holl adroddiadau, faint o weithredu cydlynol sy'n digwydd mewn gwirionedd? Yr hyn sy'n digwydd ar lawr gwlad yw bod strategaethau yn pentyrru—er enghraifft, strategaeth iechyd, strategaeth ysgolion, strategaeth cludiant integredig a strategaeth i'r henoed—a phrin iawn eu cysylltiad â'i gilydd, yn aml. Mae'r strategaethau hynny oll yn bwysig ond rhaid eu hintegreiddio.

There is no point in our arguing, as politicians, for the promotion and protection of social cohesion and community regeneration if we have policies in place that undermine that essential social fabric. Given all our reports, how much co-ordinated action takes place in reality? What happens at the grass-roots level is that strategies are piling up—such as a health strategy, a schools strategy, an integrated transport strategy and an older persons' strategy—but there is very little to connect them, very often. Those strategies are all important, but they need to be integrated.

Mae ein strategaethau iechyd a chludiant yn pwysleisio'r angen i bawb ohonom, yn enwedig plant a phobl ifanc, gerdded mwy a theithio ar feiciau. Fodd bynnag, sut y gall cau ysgolion, gan olygu mwy o bellteroedd

Our health and transport strategies emphasise the need for each and every one of us, particularly children and young people, to walk more and to use bicycles. However, how can school closures be consistent with

teithio, fod yn gyson â hwnnw? Mae'r system gynllunio hefyd yn tanseilio rhai o amcanion 'Cymru'n Un' o ran adfywio cymunedau, ac mae'n rhwystr i sicrhau dyfodol i ysgolion bach mewn sawl cymuned.

Rhaid cael system gynllunio sy'n hyrwyddo cymunedau drwy alluogi datblygiadau bychain o dai fforddiadwy i bobl leol. Yn sicr, ni ddylem roi penrhwyddid i ddatblygwyr adeiladu tai drudfawr ar y farchnad agored na all neb ond pobl o'r dinasoedd sydd wedi ymdeol eu fforddio. Fodd bynnag, gallai rhwystru pob datblygiad y tu allan i ffiniau pentref achosi problemau hefyd. Mae angen system gynllunio sy'n addas i anghenion cymunedau Cymru. Rhaid caniatáu i bobl ifanc adeiladu ar ffermydd os dyna'r unig ffordd iddynt gael byw yng nghefn gwlad.

Os ydym o ddifrif am achub ysgolion ein cymunedau a sicrhau dyfodol hirdymor iddynt, rhaid sicrhau cynhaliaeth i deuluoedd yn y cymunedau hynny. Y ffaith amdani yw bod yr holl ddafl am ysgol a chymuned yn rhybudd clir fod llawer o'n cymunedau, gan gynnwys llawer o'n hardaloedd Cymreiciaf, yn teimlo eu bod o dan fygythiad.

Rhaid inni rymuso cymunedau lleol, fel yr oedd y cynllun Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf yn llwyddo i'w wneud, i raddau. Rhaid ymgynghori â'r gymuned ar ddyfodol eu hysgolion, a meddwl hefyd am ddyfodol y cymunedau eu hunain. Sut fath o ddyfodol y maent eisiau ei weld? Sut cawn ni ddigon o ddisgyblion yno i gynnal yr ysgol?

I grynhoi, yr hyn yr wyf yn gofyn amdano yw newid sylfaenol yn y ffordd yr ydym yn edrych ar gynllunio cymunedol. Rhaid inni fwrw ati o'r newydd i fynd i'r afael â'r dirywiad economaidd, cymdeithasol a diwylliannol sydd o'n cwmpas. Mae'n her i bawb ohonom sy'n ymwneud â pholisi cyhoeddus yng Nghymru gynnig gweledigaeth amgenach i'r dyfodol. Gadewch inni fynd ati gyda'n gilydd i sicrhau cymunedau cynaliadwy a fydd, yn eu tro, yn sicrhau dyfodol hirdymor i'n hysgolion hefyd.

Alun Ffred Jones: Diolch, Gareth, am

that aim, given that it will only add to travel distances? The planning system also undermines some of the objectives in 'One Wales' for community regeneration, and it prevents safeguarding the future of small schools in many communities.

We must have a planning system which promotes communities, by enabling small developments of affordable homes for local people. We certainly should not give developers carte blanche to build expensive houses for the open market which no-one except retired people from our cities can afford. However, preventing all developments beyond the boundaries of a village could also cause problems. We need a planning system which is fit for the needs of Welsh communities. We must permit young people to build on farmland if that is the only way for them to live in rural areas.

If we are serious about saving our schools and communities and ensuring a long-term future for them, we must ensure that the families living in those communities can earn a living. The plain fact is that the whole debate about school and community is a clear warning that many of our communities, including many where the Welsh language is strongest, feel under threat.

We must empower local communities, as the Communities First programme succeeded in doing, to a degree. We must consult with communities on the future of their schools, and think also about the future of those communities. What kind of future do they want to see? How can we get adequate numbers of pupils to maintain the school?

In summary, what I am asking for is a fundamental change to the way we view community planning. We need a renewed vigour in getting to grips with the economic, social and cultural decline surrounding us. It is a challenge to each and every one of us involved in public policy in Wales to offer an alternative vision for the future. Let us work together to ensure sustainable communities that will, in turn, also ensure a long-term future for our schools.

Alun Ffred Jones: Thank you, Gareth, for

ganiatáu imi gyfrannu. Yn sicr, ategaf dy gri inni gael gweld y sefyllfa yn ei chyfanrwydd. Mae'n ffaith bod llawer o gymunedau gwledig yn teimlo eu bod o dan fygythiad. Ar y llaw arall, rhaid inni gydnabod y newid sylweddol a welwyd yn y patrwm cymdeithasol, gyda gostyngiad rhwng 30 a 50 y cant yn niferoedd y plant mewn llawer o ardaloedd gwledig. Mae'r newid hwnnw yn awgrymu imi y bydd rhaid addasu ein sefydliadau hefyd. Rhaid cofio'r hyn sy'n digwydd yng Ngheredigion, lle mae rhieni a theuluoedd yn ardal Synod wedi dod at eu gilydd ac wedi cytuno cau tair ysgol fach er mwyn sefydlu un ysgol ardal i 100 o blant a mwy. Gwelant y manteision o wneud hynny. Yn ddiddorol, yr oeddent wedi gwrthwynebu cynllun i greu ysgol enfawr o 350 o ddisgyblion i lawr y lôn, yn Llannarth, ond gwelsant y manteision o greu un ysgol a fydd yn cyflogi pedwar neu bump o athrawon. Mae'r enghraifft honno yn rhoi gobaith inni: mae newidiadau yn cychwyn o'r ddaear, o blith pobl, yn hytrach na'u bod yn cael eu gosod oddi uchod.

Y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau (Jane Hutt): Diolch, Gareth. Yr wyf yn falch iawn o allu ateb y ddadl y prynhawn yma.

I am pleased to respond to the debate, because there is so much that one can say about the role that we would like schools to play in our communities. We have been constant in our vision of schools as institutions that have a vital role to play in building stronger communities and that act as a focus for the delivery of services, a focus for their communities. Schools and communities have long been acknowledged to be mutually beneficial partners that must work together. As you say, Gareth, education and community development must not be seen as separate. You talked about Communities First, and a key part of the agenda for Communities First partnerships has been the input from the older cohorts of pupils, which will continue to be important as we move towards Communities Next. I think that we all agree that schools should be at the centre of the life of the communities that they serve, drawing on the community to support and enrich the school and providing services

allowing me to contribute. I certainly support your call for us to look at the situation as a whole. It is a fact that many rural communities feel that they are under threat. On the other hand, we must acknowledge the substantial change that has occurred in the composition of society, with a reduction of between 30 and 50 per cent in the numbers of children living in many rural areas. That shift suggests to me that we will have to modify our institutions, too. We must remember what is happening in Ceredigion, where parents and families in Synod Inn have come together and agreed to close three small schools in order to establish one area school of over 100 children. They see the advantages of doing that. Interestingly, those same parents opposed a plan to create a huge school of over 350 pupils down the road in Llannarth, but they could see the advantage of coming together to create a school which would employ four or five teachers. That example gives us hope, since it shows that change happens from the grass roots, from people, rather than from being imposed from above.

The Minister for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills (Jane Hutt): Thank you, Gareth. I am very pleased to be able to respond to this debate this afternoon.

Yr wyf yn falch ymateb i'r ddadl, gan fod cymaint y gall rhywun ei ddweud am y rhan y carem weld ysgolion yn ei chwarae yn ein cymunedau. Yr ydym wedi dal yn gyson at weledigaeth o ysgolion fel sefydliadau sydd â rhan hanfodol i'w chwarae wrth adeiladu cymunedau cadarnach ac sydd yn ganolbwynt ar gyfer darparu gwasanaethau, yn ganolbwynt i'w cymunedau. Mae ysgolion a chymunedau wedi'u hen gydnabod yn bartneriaid sy'n llesol i'w gilydd, a rhaid iddynt gydweithio. Fel y dywedwch, Gareth, rhaid peidio ag edrych ar addysg a datblygu cymunedol fel pethau ar wahân. Soniasoch am Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, ac un rhan allweddol o'r agenda i bartneriaethau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf fu'r mewnbwn gan ddisgyblion hŷn, a fydd yn dal yn bwysig wrth inni symud ymlaen at Cymunedau Nesaf. Credaf ein bod i gyd yn gytún y dylai ysgolion fod yng nghanol bywyd y cymunedau y maent yn eu gwasanaethu, gan ddenu'r gymuned i gefnogi a chyfoethogi'r

to support the community and raise the status of learning.

I want to say a few words about our community focused schools programme. The aim is to provide a range of services to meet the needs of the pupils, their families and the wider community, within and outside school hours. Increasing the community role and focus of all schools—small or large—has been central to our schools policy for several years. It emerged partly from the work done on the Narrowing the Gap project. The community focused schools guidance states that,

‘Schools play an important and pivotal role in the community. Schools not only provide education for pupils and create a community spirit amongst parents, but they also have the opportunity and often the facilities to reach out to the whole community.’

There was funding with the programme to develop community focused schools. The funding is currently £3.9 million a year. A substantial proportion of that—£1.6 million—is ring-fenced for use in small schools. That allows us to support varied community projects, such as technology, libraries, healthy living centres, theatre clubs, and Welsh classes for parents, and play schemes. Those are just some examples. We are supporting and promoting that role. More than £12 million has been made available to assist these developments between now and 2011.

Much has been said about schools being lost to communities and the heart of the community being lost when a school closes. I acknowledge your contribution to this important debate this afternoon, because, although the provision of facilities and formal meeting places can contribute towards thriving communities, as you say, and picking up on what Alun Ffred said, the most essential ingredient is the people and their involvement and participation.

4.30 p.m.

Like it or not, many communities have shrunk, as Alun Ffred said, and the most essential ingredient for a viable, thriving

ysgol a darparu gwasanaethau i gynnal y gymuned a chodi statws dysgu.

Dymunaf ddweud ychydig eiriau am ein rhaglen ysgolion bro. Y nod yw darparu amrediad o wasanaethau i ddiwallu anghenion y disgyblion, eu teuluoedd a'r gymuned ehangach, y tu mewn a'r tu allan i oriau ysgol. Mae'r nod o gynyddu rôl a phwyslais cymunedol pob ysgol—bach a mawr—wedi bod yn rhan ganolog o'n polisi ysgolion ers nifer o flynyddoedd. Cododd yn rhannol o'r gwaith a wnaethpwyd ar y prosiect Cau'r Bwlch. Mae'r arweiniad ar ysgolion bro yn dweud,

Mae ysgolion yn rhan bwysig a chanolog yn y gymuned. Yn ogystal â darparu addysg i ddisgyblion a chreu ysbryd cymunedol ymhlith rhieni, mae gan ysgolion hefyd y cyfle, a'r cyfleusterau yn aml, i ddarparu ar gyfer y gymuned gyfan.

Yr oedd cyllid gyda'r rhaglen i ddatblygu ysgolion bro. Y cyllid ar hyn o bryd yw £3.9 miliwn y flwyddyn. Mae cyfran sylweddol o hwnnw—£1.6 miliwn—wedi'i chlustnodi i'w defnyddio mewn ysgolion bach. Mae hynny'n caniatáu inni gefnogi amryw o brosiectau cymunedol, fel technoleg, llyfrgelloedd, canolfannau byw'n iach, clybiau theatr, a dosbarthiadau Cymraeg i rieni, a chynlluniau chwarae. Dim ond rhai enghreifftiau yw'r rheini. Yr ydym yn hybu ac yn hyrwyddo'r rôl honno. Mae dros £12 miliwn wedi'i ddarparu i hybu'r datblygiadau hyn, o hyn tan 2011.

Mae llawer wedi'i ddweud am gymunedau'n colli ysgolion ac am golli calon y gymuned pan fydd ysgol yn cau. Yr wyf yn cydnabod eich cyfraniad i'r ddadl bwysig hon y prynhawn yma, oherwydd er bod darparu cyfleusterau a manau cyfarfod ffurfiol yn gallu cyfrannu at greu cymunedau ffyniannus, fel y dywedwch, a chan fynd ar drywydd yr hyn a ddywedodd Alun Ffred, yr elfen bwysicaf un yw cyfranogiad pobl.

P'un a ydych yn ei hoffi ai peidio, mae nifer o gymunedau wedi crebachu, fel y dywedodd Alun Ffred, a disgyblion yw'r elfen bwysicaf

school is pupils. We cannot get away from the fact that we have fewer children in the school system and we must look at the innovative models that are developing across Wales. Those models are being taken into account when we look at our revision of guidance in terms of school reorganisation.

Again, we must remember that, since 2000, the number of primary school pupils has decreased by around 20,000 across Wales. There has been a slight increase in birth rates and migration recently in certain areas, but the number of pupils in primary schools is due to continue to decline for the next few years before stabilising. In many areas, the pattern of school provision dates from over 100 years ago, reflecting the needs, mobility and population of the communities that existed then. In many areas, school buildings have not changed much since the 1890s and are increasingly less suited for the pupils and communities of today. However, I was delighted to be at the centenary anniversary of Newton Primary School in your constituency, Carwyn. I saw how the school has developed new facilities as part of the refurbishment of an old building. The history of that school was laid out in an exhibition and children are benefiting from that, as is the community.

We want pupils in all areas to have the best possible opportunities. We need to ensure that we also address issues in relation to the curriculum and that extended activities involving the community can be included. I will also consider the action that local authorities must take in terms of how many schools they need for their local population and where they should be, to ensure that school buildings, wherever possible, can be hubs of education and community activities for the future. It may no longer be possible for every community to have a school, but every school has its community and should play a vibrant role within that community, whether the community includes one village, six villages, a small town or part of a city.

Alun Ffred also drew attention to the authorities that successfully organised

ar gyfer ysgol hyfyw a ffyniannus. Ni allwn osgoi'r ffaith fod gennym lai o blant yn y system ysgol a'i bod yn rhaid inni edrych ar y modelau arloesol sy'n datblygu ledled Cymru. Caiff y modelau hynny eu hystyried wrth inni edrych ar ein diwygiad o arweiniad o ran ad-drefnu ysgolion.

Unwaith eto, rhaid inni gofio bod nifer y disgyblion cynradd wedi disgyn oddeutu 20,000 ar draws Cymru er 2000. Bu cynnydd bach mewn cyfraddau geni a mudo yn ddiweddar mewn rhai ardaloedd, ond bydd nifer y disgyblion mewn ysgolion cynradd yn parhau i ddisgyn dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf cyn sefydlogi. Mewn llawer ardal, mae patrwm y ddarpariaeth ysgol yn mynd yn ôl dros 100 mlynedd, gan adlewyrchu anghenion, symudedd a phoblogaeth y cymunedau a oedd yn bodoli bryd hynny. Mewn llawer ardal, nid yw adeiladau ysgolion wedi newid llawer ers yr 1890au ac yn mynd yn gynyddol anaddas i ddisgyblion a chymunedau heddiw. Fodd bynnag, yr oeddwn wrth fy modd cael dathlu canmlwyddiant Ysgol Gynradd Newton yn eich etholaeth chi, Carwyn. Gwelais sut y mae'r ysgol wedi datblygu cyfleusterau newydd drwy ailwampio hen adeilad. Yr oedd hanes yr ysgol honno i'w weld mewn arddangosfa ac mae plant yn elwa o hynny, fel y mae'r gymuned.

Mae arnom eisiau i ddisgyblion ym mhob ardal gael y cyfleoedd gorau posibl. Mae angen inni sicrhau ein bod hefyd yn rhoi sylw i faterion yng nghyswllt y cwricwlwm a bod modd cynnwys gweithgareddau estynedig sy'n cynnwys y gymuned. Byddaf hefyd yn ystyried y camau y mae'n rhaid i awdurdodau lleol eu cymryd o ran faint o ysgolion y mae eu hangen arnynt ar gyfer eu poblogaeth leol a lle y dylent fod, i sicrhau bod adeiladau ysgol, pan fydd hynny'n bosibl, yn ganolfannau ar gyfer addysg a gweithgareddau cymunedol ar gyfer y dyfodol. Efallai na fydd yn bosibl mwyach i bob cymuned gael ysgol, ond mae gan bob ysgol ei chymuned a dylai chwarae rhan egniol yn y gymuned honno, boed y gymuned yn cynnwys un pentref, chwe phentref, tref fach neu ran o ddinas.

Tynnodd Alun Ffred sylw hefyd at yr awdurdodau sydd wedi llwyddo i drefnu

schools, providing either new or refurbished community-focused schools to take the place of others. There are good models in urban and rural areas. Pupil and community engagement is crucial in taking this forward, and we must recognise that in terms of some of the issues around difficult and disputed school closure proposals, where I must take account of the extent to which the school is currently serving the wider community. It is about providing and facilitating, as you said, Gareth, additional new services and introducing services to that hub. We must always look for evidence of how authorities will continue to provide for those services in the event of a school closing, and I am heartened to see that, increasingly, authorities are considering this responsibility very carefully. Our guidance on school reorganisation already makes clear that authorities should consider the effect of a school closure on communities.

Our current policy works well, but it must be updated and that is what we are doing in our review of guidance at the moment in terms of the circular. We look to your guidance, consultation and input; yours has been very valuable this afternoon, Gareth. I am also looking to strengthen the guidance as far as the community is concerned. Above all else, we should be looking to provide excellent opportunities for all children in community-focused schools, large or small, leading inevitably to enriched communities. In conclusion, schools have an enormous capacity to be important pivots in the community, but they need to be strong, sustainable pivots around which other networks, services and the whole community are sustained.

ysgolion, gan ddarparu naill ai ysgolion bro newydd neu rai wedi'u hailwampio i ddisodli rhai eraill. Mae yna fodelau da mewn ardaloedd trefol a gwledig. Mae ymwneud disgyblion a chymunedau yn hanfodol i fynd â hyn yn ei flaen, a rhaid inni gydnabod hynny o ran rhai o'r materion sy'n ymwneud â chynigion anodd i gau ysgolion a lle mae gwrthwynebiad, lle mae'n rhaid imi ystyried y graddau y mae'r ysgol yn gwasanaethu'r gymuned ehangach ar hyn o bryd. Mae'n ymwneud â darparu a hwyluso gwasanaethau newydd ychwanegol a chyflwyno gwasanaethau i'r canolbwynt hwnnw, fel y dywedech, Gareth. Rhaid inni bob amser chwilio am dystiolaeth sut y bydd awdurdodau'n parhau i ddarparu ar gyfer y gwasanaethau hynny os bydd ysgol yn cau, ac mae'n dda gennyf weld bod mwy a mwy o awdurdodau'n ystyried y cyfrifoldeb hwn yn ofalus iawn. Mae ein harweiniad ar ad-drefnu ysgolion eisoes yn egluro y dylai awdurdodau ystyried effaith cau ysgol ar gymunedau.

Mae ein polisi cyfredol yn gweithio'n dda, ond rhaid ei ddiweddarau a dyna yr ydym yn ei wneud yn ein hadolygiad o arweiniad ar hyn o bryd o ran y cylchlythyr. Yr ydym yn edrych ar eich arweiniad, eich ymgynghoriad a'ch mewnbwn; yr oedd eich mewnbwn chi yn werthfawr iawn y prynhawn yma, Gareth. Yr wyf hefyd yn bwriadu cryfhau'r arweiniad yng nghyswllt y gymuned. Yn anad dim, dylem fod yn edrych ar ddarparu cyfleoedd gwych i bob plentyn mewn ysgolion bro, yn fach neu'n fawr, gan arwain yn anochel at gymunedau cyfoethocach. I gloi, mae gan ysgolion allu enfawr i fod yn golynnau pwysig yn y gymuned, ond mae angen iddynt fod yn golynnau cryf a chynaliadwy sy'n gallu cynnal rhwydweithiau a gwasanaethau eraill a'r gymuned gyfan.

Amser Pleidleisio Voting Time

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Voting time today was to be no earlier than 4.30 p.m. It is now past 4.30 p.m. I have spoken to business managers and they are content for the bell not to be rung. Are Members happy with that? I see that they are.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr oedd amser pleidleisio heddiw i'w gynnal ar ôl 4.30 p.m. Mae hi wedi troi 4.30 p.m. erbyn hyn. Yr wyf wedi siarad â rheolwyr busnes ac maent yn fodlon peidio â chanu'r gloch. A yw Aelodau yn fodlon â hynny? Gwelaf eu bod.

*Gwelliant 1 i NDM3943: O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 12.
Amendment 1 to NDM3943: For 29, Abstain 0, Against 12.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Asghar, Mohammad
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Gwenda
Watson, Joyce

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Graham, William
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 2 i NDM3943: O blaid 12, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.
Amendment 2 to NDM3943: For 12, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Graham, William
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Asghar, Mohammad
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin

Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Gwenda
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3 i NDM3943: O blaid 30, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 12.
Amendment 3 to NDM3943: For 30, Abstain 0, Against 12.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Asghar, Mohammad
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Gwenda
Watson, Joyce

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Graham, William
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 4 i NDM3943: O blaid 13, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.
Amendment 4 to NDM3943: For 13, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Asghar, Mohammad
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane

Davies, Paul
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Millar, Darren
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Ramsay, Nick
 Randerson, Jenny
 Williams, Kirsty

Davies, Alun
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Evans, Nerys
 Franks, Chris
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Griffiths, Lesley
 Hutt, Jane
 James, Irene
 Jenkins, Bethan
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5 i NDM3943: O blaid 30, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 13.
 Amendment 5 to NDM3943: For 30, Abstain 0, Against 13.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
 Asghar, Mohammad
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Chapman, Christine
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Alun
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Evans, Nerys
 Franks, Chris
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Griffiths, Lesley
 Hutt, Jane
 James, Irene
 Jenkins, Bethan
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Watson, Joyce

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Andrew R.T.
 Davies, Paul
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Millar, Darren
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Ramsay, Nick
 Randerson, Jenny
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

Motion NDM3943 as amended: that
the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynnig NDM3943 fel y'i diwygiwyd: bod
Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. notes the contribution that higher education makes to the economy of Wales;

1. yn nodi'r cyfraniad y mae addysg uwch yn ei wneud i economi Cymru;

2. notes the significant contribution that part time learners make to higher education;

2. yn nodi'r cyfraniad sylweddol y mae dysgwyr rhan amser yn ei wneud i addysg uwch;

3. notes that, according to Higher Education Funding Council for Wales (HEFCW), the higher education funding gap between Welsh and English HEIs has grown to £61 million;

3. yn nodi bod y bwlch cyllido addysg uwch rhwng sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru ac yn Lloegr wedi tyfu i £61 miliwn yn ôl Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru;

4. calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to:

4. yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i:

a) investigate innovative ways to ensure the fairest allocation of funding between institutions and students;

a) ymchwilio i dulliau arloesol o sicrhau bod cyllid yn cael ei rannu yn y modd mwyaf teg rhwng sefydliadau a myfyrwyr;

b) ensure that there is a parity of esteem for part-time learners in HE, especially in the areas of fees and student support;

b) sicrhau bod parch cydradd ar gyfer dysgwyr rhan amser mewn addysg uwch, yn enwedig ym meysydd ffioedd a chefnogaeth i fyfyrwyr;

5. endorses the Welsh Assembly Government's commitment to 'Developing adult learning', as set out in the 'One Wales' programme.

5. yn cymeradwyo ymrwymiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i 'Ddatblygu dysgu ymhlith oedolion', fel y nodir yn rhaglen 'Cymru'n Un'.

*Cynnig NDM3943 fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 30, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 13.
Motion NDM3943 as amended: For 30, Abstain 0, Against 13.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Asghar, Mohammad
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jenkins, Bethan

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Graham, William
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Watson, Joyce

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion carried.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â
 today's proceedings to a close. thrafodion heddiw i ben.

Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 4.35 p.m.

The meeting ended at 4.35 p.m.

Aelodau a'u Pleidiau

Members and their Parties

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
 Asghar, Mohammad (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Burns, Angela (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, Andrew R.T. (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Davies, Paul (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Evans, Nerys (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Franks, Chris (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
 Griffiths, Lesley (Llafur – Labour)
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
 Jenkins, Bethan (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Gareth (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)

Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)
Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
Millar, Darren (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
Ramsay, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Watson, Joyce (Llafur – Labour)
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)