



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
The National Assembly for Wales**

**Cofnod y Trafodion  
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mawrth, 26 Chwefror 2008  
Tuesday, 26 February 2008**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- |    |   |
|----|---|
| 3  | Atal Rheolau Sefydlog<br>Suspension of Standing Orders  |
| 3  | Ethol a Sefydlu'r Pwyllgor ar y Gorchymyn Arfaethedig ynghylch Diogelwch Tân yn y Cartref<br>Establishment and Election of the Proposed Domestic Fire Safety LCO Committee                        |
| 4  | Ethol a Sefydlu'r Pwyllgor ar y Gorchymyn Arfaethedig ynghylch Gwasanaethau Iechyd Meddwl<br>Establishment and Election of the Proposed Mental Health Services LCO Committee                      |
| 4  | Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog<br>Questions to the First Minister   |
| 35 | Datganiad a Chyhoeddiad Busnes<br>Business Statement and Announcement   |
| 42 | Datganiad am y Fframwaith Effeithiolrwydd Ysgolion<br>Statement on the School Effectiveness Framework   |
| 59 | Datganiad am Ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i Adroddiad Blynyddol y Comisiynydd Plant<br>Statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's Response to the Children's Commissioner's Annual Report |
| 84 | Twristiaeth Ddiwylliannol<br>Cultural Tourism   |

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) in the Chair.*

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf y Cynulliad i drefn.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call the Assembly to order.

### **Atal Rheolau Sefydlog Suspension of Standing Orders**

**Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan):** Cynigiaf fod

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** I propose that

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 35.6 a 35.8:*

*the National Assembly for Wales in accordance with Standing Orders Nos. 35.6 and 35.8:*

*yn atal Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.18(i) a'r rhan honno o Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.10 sy'n ei gwneud yn ofynnol bod y cyhoeddiad wythnosol o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.3 yn darparu'r amserlen ar gyfer busnes yn y Cyfarfod Llawn yr wythnos ganlynol, er mwyn caniatáu i'r cynigion o dan eitem 1 a 2 gael eu hystyried yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ddydd Mawrth 26 Chwefror 2008. (NNDM3875)*

*suspends Standing Order No. 7.18(i) and that part of Standing Order No. 6.10 that requires the weekly announcement under Standing Order No. 6.3 to constitute the timetable for business in Plenary for the following week, to allow the motions under items 1 and 2 to be considered in Plenary on Tuesday 26 February 2008. (NNDM3875)*

**Y Llywydd:** A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu'r cynnig? Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad. Yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.35, felly, caiff y cynnig ei dderbyn.

**The Presiding Officer:** Does any Member object to the motion? I see that there are no objections. In accordance with Standing Order No. 7.35, the motion is therefore agreed.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

### **Ethol a Sefydlu'r Pwyllgor ar y Gorchymyn Arfaethedig ynghylch Diogelwch Tân yn y Cartref Establishment and Election of the Proposed Domestic Fire Safety LCO Committee**

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cynigiaf fod

**The First Minister:** I propose that

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 21.1, yn sefydlu Pwyllgor i ystyried y Gorchymyn arfaethedig, Gorchymyn Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Cymhwysedd Deddfwriaethol) (Rhif 7) 2008 mewn perthynas â diogelwch tân yn y cartref a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 21 Chwefror 2008, ac i gyflwyno adroddiad arno.*

*the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order No. 21.1, establishes a committee to consider and report on the proposed National Assembly for Wales (Legislative Competence) (No. 7) Order 2008 in relation to domestic fire safety, laid in the Table Office on 21 February 2008.*

*Bydd y pwyllgor yn dod i ben pan gaiff y Gorchymyn drafft cysylltiedig ei gyflwyno yn*

*The committee shall cease to exist once the related draft Order has been introduced*

*unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 22.31. (NNDM3878)*

Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 10.3, yn ethol Huw Lewis (Llafur), Sandy Mewies (Llafur), Janet Ryder (Plaid Cymru), Mark Isherwood (Ceidwadwyr), a Peter Black (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol) yn aelodau o'r Pwyllgor ar y Gorchymyn Arfaethedig ynghylch Diogelwch Tân yn y Cartref. (NNDM3879)*

**Y Llywydd:** A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu'r cynigion? Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad. Yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.35, felly, caiff y cynigion eu derbyn.

*Derbyniwyd y cynigion.  
Motions carried.*

**Ethol a Sefydlu'r Pwyllgor ar y Gorchymyn Arfaethedig ynghylch  
Gwasanaethau Iechyd Meddwl  
Establishment and Election of the Proposed Mental Health Services LCO  
Committee**

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 21.1, yn sefydlu Pwyllgor i ystyried y Gorchymyn arfaethedig, Gorchymyn Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Cymhwysedd Deddfwriaethol) (Rhif 6) 2008 mewn perthynas â gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Chwefror 2008, ac i gyflwyno adroddiad arno.*

*Bydd y pwyllgor yn peidio â bod ar ôl i'r Gorchymyn drafft cysylltiedig gael ei gyflwyno yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 22.31. (NNDM3876)*

Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 10.3, yn ethol Janice Gregory (Llafur), Val Lloyd (Llafur), Bethan Jenkins (Plaid Cymru), David Melding (Ceidwadwyr), a Jenny Randerson (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol) yn aelodau o'r Pwyllgor ar y Gorchymyn Arfaethedig*

*under Standing Order No. 22.31. (NNDM3878)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order No. 10.3, elects Huw Lewis (Labour), Sandy Mewies (Labour), Janet Ryder (Plaid Cymru), Mark Isherwood (Conservative) and Peter Black (Liberal Democrat) as members of the Proposed Domestic Fire Safety LCO Committee. (NNDM3879)*

**The Presiding Officer:** Does any Member object to the motions? I see that there are no objections. In accordance with Standing Order No. 7.35, the motions are therefore agreed.

**The First Minister:** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order No. 21.1, establishes a committee to consider and report on the proposed National Assembly for Wales (Legislative Competence) (No. 6) Order 2008 in relation to mental health services, laid in the Table Office on 18 February 2008.*

*The committee shall cease to exist once the related draft Order has been introduced under Standing Order No. 22.31. (NNDM3876)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order No. 10.3, elects Janice Gregory (Labour), Val Lloyd (Labour), Bethan Jenkins (Plaid Cymru), David Melding (Conservative) and Jenny Randerson (Liberal Democrat) as members of the Proposed Mental Health Services LCO*

*ynghylch Gwasanaethau Iechyd Meddwl. Committee. (NNDM3877)*  
(NNDM3877)

**Y Llywydd:** A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu'r cynigion? Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad. Yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.35, felly, caiff y cynigion eu derbyn.

**The Presiding Officer:** Does any Member object to the motions? I see that there are no objections. In accordance with Standing Order No. 7.35, the motions are therefore agreed.

*Derbyniwyd y cynigion.*  
*Motions carried.*

### **Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog** **Questions to the First Minister**

#### **The New Ysbyty Ystrad Fawr**

**Q1 Jeff Cuthbert:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the progress being made on the new Ysbyty Ystrad Fawr? OAQ(3)0761(FM)

**The First Minister:** Gwent Healthcare NHS Trust is continuing to develop the full business case. We therefore expect to reach the last stage of the three-stage approval process in a few months' time. In the meantime, essential enabling works have begun on the site of the new hospital.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Thank you for that statement, First Minister. As you said, enabling works on the ground have begun, and that tangible beginning to the new hospital is a matter of great pleasure for residents in the mid-Rhymney valley, in particular. The new hospital will bring massive benefits to people in the whole of the Caerphilly borough. As you are aware, the hospital will be the first of its kind in Wales, with separate bedrooms for all patients. The days of wards will be over and patients will have individual rooms. There will be a dedicated mental health unit for the first time in the borough. Do you agree that this venture marks an excellent stage in partnership working between the Welsh Assembly Government, the national health service in Gwent, and, of course, the Labour-controlled Caerphilly County Borough Council?

**The First Minister:** It is a unique contract, because it also involves the new county

#### **Ysbyty Newydd Ystrad Fawr**

**C1 Jeff Cuthbert:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am y cynnydd a wneir ar ysbyty newydd Ystrad Fawr? OAQ(3)0761(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gofal Iechyd Gwent yn parhau i ddatblygu'r achos busnes llawn. Felly, yr ydym yn disgwyl cyrraedd cam olaf y broses gymeradwyo dri cham mewn ychydig fisoedd. Yn y cyfamser, mae gwaith galluogi hanfodol wedi dechrau ar safle'r ysbyty newydd.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Diolch am y datganiad hwnnw, Brif Weinidog. Fel y dywedaso, mae gwaith galluogi wedi dechrau ar y tir, ac mae'r dechreuad pendant hwnnw i'r ysbyty newydd yn destun pleser mawr i breswylwyr canol cwm Rhymni, yn benodol. Daw'r ysbyty newydd â buddiannau enfawr i bobl ym mwrdeistref Caerffili drwyddi draw. Fel yr ydych yn ymwybodol, yr ysbyty hwn fydd y cyntaf o'i fath yng Nghymru, gydag ystafelloedd gwely ar wahân i'r holl gleifion. Daw dyddiau wardiau i ben a bydd gan gleifion ystafelloedd unigol. Ceir uned iechyd meddwl bwrpasol yn y fwrdeistref am y tro cyntaf. A gytunwch fod y fenter hon yn marcio cyfnod rhagorol o waith partneriaeth rhwng Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Ngwent, ac, wrth gwrs, Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili, a reolir gan Lafur?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n gontract unigryw, gan ei fod hefyd yn cynnwys y pencadlys

headquarters, the occupation of which is very slightly delayed, which therefore means that there are a few delays in the demolition of the old Ystrad Fawr National Coal Board headquarters and the present Caerphilly County Borough Council headquarters. However, as soon as that happens, the new hospital construction project can proceed, bringing to an end a wait of over 40 years for that mid-Valleys hospital, which was first promised in the 1960s.

**William Graham:** First Minister, listening to what you have said today, I wonder whether you will take particular interest in the fact that, as I said, there has been a wait of over 40 years for this new hospital. As Jeff has said, it is excellent that it will have the first dedicated mental health unit for Caerphilly. However, you should also be aware that a hospice for the Valleys and Ebbw Vale has been sadly delayed, for one reason or another, over many years. Can you be certain this time that this hospital will be delivered on cost and on time?

**The First Minister:** We all accept that the people of the mid-Valleys area of the Glamorgan and Gwent Valleys have been waiting for far too long. I hope that when the hospital finally opens in 2011 we will regard the wait as having been worthwhile, because of the unique new standards that will be set. I have described it on many occasions—quite rightly, I think—as the first twenty-first century hospital to be built in Wales, and possibly in the UK. By that, I mean a far higher standard, but possibly far smaller numbers, of in-patient beds and twice the amount of out-patient activity, because that is the more flexible type of unit that everyone says is required in twenty-first century hospital design. The Caerphilly borough will get the first of this new generation of hospitals.

**Mohammad Asghar:** We are all pleased that we will have this new hospital at Ystrad Mynach. However, when the new hospital opens and the local community hospital closes, there will be a reduction of about 30 in the number of beds. Given the increasing elderly population, the shortage of beds for

sirol newydd, er bod oedi byr cyn dechrau ei ddefnyddio, sy'n golygu bod rhywfaint o oedi cyn dymchwel hen bencadlys Bwrdd Glo Cenedlaethol Ystrad Fawr a phencadlys presennol Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili. Fodd bynnag, cyn gynted ag y bydd hynny'n digwydd, gellir bwrw ymlaen â'r prosiect o adeiladu'r ysbyty newydd, gan ddod â dros 40 mlynedd o aros am yr ysbyty hwnnw yng nghanol y Cymoedd i ben, ysbyty a addawyd am y tro cyntaf yn y 1960au.

**William Graham:** Brif Weinidog, o wrando ar yr hyn yr ydych wedi'i ddweud heddiw, tybed a gymerwch ddiddordeb penodol yn y ffaith, fel y dywedais, y bu'n rhaid aros dros 40 mlynedd am yr ysbyty newydd hwn. Fel y dywedodd Jeff, mae'n ardderchog y bydd yr ysbyty'n cynnwys uned iechyd meddwl bwrpasol gyntaf Caerffili. Fodd bynnag, dylech hefyd fod yn ymwybodol bod hosbis i'r Cymoedd a Glynebwy yn anffodus wedi'i gohirio, am un rheswm neu'i gilydd, dros flynyddoedd lawer. A allwch fod yn sicr y tro hwn y caiff yr ysbyty hwn ei ddarparu'n unol â'r costau a'r amserlen arfaethedig?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym oll yn derbyn bod pobl ardal canol y Cymoedd yng Nghymoedd Morgannwg a Gwent wedi bod yn aros yn rhy hir o lawer. Gobeithiaf, pan fydd yr ysbyty'n agor o'r diwedd yn 2011, y byddwn yn ystyried y bu'n werth aros, oherwydd y safonau newydd unigryw a osodir. Yr wyf wedi'i ddisgrifio ar nifer o achlysuron—yn ddigon teg, credaf—fel yr ysbyty cyntaf wedi'i adeiladu ar gyfer yr unfed ganrif ar hugain yng Nghymru, ac o bosibl yn y DU. Yr hyn a olygaf drwy hynny yw safon lawer uwch, ond efallai niferoedd llawer is, o welyau cleifion mewnol a dwywaith cymaint o weithgarwch cleifion allanol, oherwydd dyna'r math mwy hyblyg o uned y dywed pawb ei bod yn ofynnol wrth ddylunio ysbytai yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Bwrdeistref Caerffili fydd yn cael y cyntaf o'r genhedlaeth newydd hon o ysbytai.

**Mohammad Asghar:** Yr ydym oll yn falch y byddwn yn cael yr ysbyty newydd hwn yn Ystrad Mynach. Fodd bynnag, pan fydd yr ysbyty newydd yn agor, a'r ysbyty cymuned lleol yn cau, bydd lleihad o tua 30 yn nifer y gwelyau. Ac ystyried y boblogaeth oeddrannus sy'n tyfu, y prinder gwelyau i'r henoed eiddil

the elderly mentally infirm in local residential homes and the increasing problem of delayed transfers of care, can the First Minister assure us that sufficient beds will be available at the new hospital to meet the needs of the local population?

**The First Minister:** There are some 15, or even 20, small hospital units in the area for which the main provision in the future will be based at the new Ystrad Fawr, Caerphilly borough hospital. There will also be out-station, community-based hospitals—some six new hospitals will replace the present provision of small, traditional community hospitals. So, there will be considerable rationalisation.

However, the future of hospital services will be based on out-patient and community-based rehabilitation, more hospital at home, and minimal in-patient stays. That is what everybody says we should be using as a basis for future hospital services. People will, of course, be worried. When I say that it will have half the in-patient beds and twice the out-patient activity of what you would expect, people will ask, ‘How can you make plans for having fewer beds and more out-patient facilities?’. However, all those involved in the design of good hospital practice say that that is the way in which we must go. Organising it is a massive challenge—there is no doubt about that. I hope that we can reassure people that it is not done in order to minimise the number of hospital beds; it ought to provide patient services in the way in which patients want them. That will mean community-based rehabilitation, home-based rehabilitation, hospital at home, where the hospital comes to you, rather than you going into hospital, to the maximum extent that is practicable.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** Seeing the trees and so on being cleared from this site is very welcome, but would you care to comment on the difficulties that the Caerphilly Local Health Board will have in meeting its obligations in the next financial year? It thought that the costs of the Grogan

eu meddwl mewn cartrefi preswyl lleol a phroblem gynyddol oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal, a all y Prif Weinidog ein sicrhau y bydd digon o welyau ar gael yn yr ysbyty newydd i ddiwallu anghenion y boblogaeth leol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ceir oddeutu 15, neu 20, o unedau ysbyty bach yn yr ardal, a bydd prif ddarpariaeth y rhain yn y dyfodol wedi’i lleoli yn ysbyty newydd bwrdeistref Caerffili, yn Ystrad Fawr. Hefyd, bydd ysbytai eraill wedi’u lleoli yn y gymuned—bydd rhyw chwech ysbyty newydd yn disodli’r ddarpariaeth bresennol o ysbytai cymuned bach, traddodiadol. Felly, ceir rhesymoli sylweddol.

Fodd bynnag, bydd dyfodol gwasanaethau ysbyty’n seiliedig ar adsefydlu cleifion allanol ac adsefydlu yn y gymuned, mwy o ysbyty yn y cartref, a llai o arosiadau cleifion mewnol. Dyna’r hyn y mae pawb yn dweud y dylem fod yn ei ddefnyddio fel sail ar gyfer gwasanaethau ysbyty yn y dyfodol. Wrth gwrs, bydd pobl yn pryderu. Pan ddywedaf y bydd nifer y gwelyau i gleifion mewnol yn haneru ac y bydd gweithgarwch cleifion allanol yn dyblu o’u cymharu â’r hyn y byddech yn ei ddisgwyl, bydd pobl yn gofyn, ‘Sut y gallwch gynllunio ar gyfer llai o welyau a mwy o gyfleusterau cleifion allanol?’. Fodd bynnag, mae pawb sy’n ymwneud â chynllunio arfer da mewn ysbytai’n dweud mai dyma sut y mae’n rhaid i bethau fod. Mae ei drefnu’n her enfawr—nid oes amheuaeth am hynny. Gobeithiaf y gallwn dawelu meddyliau pobl nad diben hyn yw lleihau nifer y gwelyau mewn ysbytai; dylai ddarparu gwasanaethau i gleifion yn y ffordd y mae cleifion yn dymuno eu cael. Bydd hynny’n golygu adsefydlu yn y gymuned, adsefydlu yn y cartref, ysbyty yn y cartref, lle mae’r ysbyty’n dod atoch chi, yn hytrach na’ch bod chi’n mynd i’r ysbyty, cyn belled ag y bo hynny’n ymarferol.

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Mae gweld y coed ac ati’n cael eu clirio o’r safle hwn yn rhywbeth i’w groesawu’n fawr, ond a hoffech roi sylw am yr anawsterau a gaiff Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Caerffili i gyflawni ei ymrwymadau yn y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf? Yr oedd yn meddwl bod Llywodraeth

settlement were to be paid by the Welsh Assembly Government, but it was informed a short while ago that those payments will not be made. As a result, it will be £2.5 million in deficit by the end of next month. That means that it will have to make £2.5 million-worth of savings in the next financial year. Can you assure me that that money will be built into the programme, as was originally promised?

**The First Minister:** I do not think that I am ever in a position, here, to answer a specific question about the budget of one unit of the NHS, or about the budget of any organisation that depends on public money from us. It would be wholly inappropriate for you to ask me, 'Can Caerphilly LHB have an extra £2.5 million?', and for me to say. 'Oh, yes, of course it can, now that you have asked, Mike'. That would be a bad way of doing business, and I never do it, as a matter of principle. If Caerphilly LHB has particular complaints about the budgetary provision, I am sure that it would be able to put them directly to Edwina Hart. That is the right way of going about it.

**Michael German:** This is a much bigger problem than just Caerphilly, of course. In my area alone, there is now a £2.6 million deficit in Torfaen, and there will be a £2.5 million deficit by the end of next month in Newport. This picture must be being replicated across Wales. Each local health board chair has told me that the problem is caused by the fact that it costs more money to provide more care as a result of the Grogan settlement. However, the Welsh Assembly Government promised that that funding would be made available. None budgeted for going into deficits of this nature, but they are now having to make up those savings. While you may not be able to answer specifically about Caerphilly, Torfaen and Newport—the situation is the same in Blaenau Gwent, by the way, and, presumably, in many other parts of Wales—could you assure me that this budget change, brought about by your Government's taking money away from the local health boards and making them foot the bill, will not be replicated next year, and that these local health boards will not have to make savings to put back into key services

Cynulliad Cymru am dalu costau setliad Grogan, ond dywedwyd wrtho'n ddiweddar na chaiff y taliadau hynny eu gwneud. O ganlyniad, bydd ganddo ddiffyg o £2.5 miliwn erbyn diwedd y mis nesaf. Mae hynny'n golygu y bydd yn rhaid iddo wneud gwerth £2.5 miliwn o arbedion yn y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf. A allwch fy sicrhau y caiff yr arian hwnnw ei gynnwys yn y rhaglen, fel yr addawyd yn wreiddiol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn meddwl fy mod byth mewn sefyllfa, yma, i ateb cwestiwn penodol am gyllideb un o unedau'r GIG, nac am gyllideb unrhyw sefydliad sy'n dibynnu ar arian cyhoeddus gennym ni. Byddai'n gwbl amhriodol ichi ofyn imi, 'A gaiff Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Caerffili £2.5 miliwn ychwanegol?', ac i minnau ddweud, 'O, caiff, wrth gwrs, gan eich bod wedi gofyn, Mike'. Byddai hynny'n ffordd ddrwg o wneud busnes, ac nid wyf byth yn gwneud hynny, fel mater o egwyddor. Os oes gan Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Caerffili gwynion penodol am y ddarpariaeth gyllidebol, yr wyf yn siŵr y gallai eu cyflwyno'n uniongyrchol i Edwina Hart. Dyna'r ffordd gywir o wneud hynny.

**Michael German:** Mae hon yn broblem lawer mwy na Chaerffili'n unig, wrth gwrs. Yn fy ardal yn unig, ceir diffyg o £2.6 miliwn bellach yn Nhor-faen, a bydd diffyg o £2.5 miliwn erbyn diwedd y mis nesaf yng Nghasnewydd. Mae'n rhaid bod y darlun hwn yn cael ei ailadrodd ledled Cymru. Mae pob cadeirydd bwrdd iechyd lleol wedi dweud wrthyf bod y broblem yn cael ei hachosi am ei bod yn costio mwy i ddarparu mwy o ofal o ganlyniad i setliad Grogan. Fodd bynnag, addawodd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru y byddai'r cyllid hwnnw ar gael. Ni wnaeth dim un ohonynt gyllidebu ar gyfer mynd i'r mathau hyn o ddiffygion, ond yn awr rhaid iddynt wneud yr arbedion hynny. Efallai na allwch ateb yn benodol am Gaerffili, Tor-faen a Chasnewydd—mae'r sefyllfa'r un fath ym Mlaenau Gwent, gyda llaw, a, cymeraf, mewn nifer o rannau eraill o Gymru—a allech fy sicrhau na chaiff y newid cyllideb hwn, a achoswyd drwy i'ch Llywodraeth gymryd arian oddi ar y byrddau iechyd lleol a'u gorfodi i dalu'r costau, ei ailadrodd y flwyddyn nesaf, ac na fydd yn rhaid i'r byrddau iechyd lleol hyn wneud



again next year?

**The First Minister:** Clearly, when a court makes a judgment, all units of Government have to make appropriate budget switches to deal with the award made and its implications for other areas. People in circumstances similar to the Grogan case will expect to have the flow of money redirected so that it follows the Grogan judgment.

2.10 p.m.

We believe that we have made the appropriate changes to the budget provision to allow local government and the health service to cope with the consequences of the Grogan judgment, though those consequences are only now emerging and are not yet absolutely clear. We believe that we have made quite a good and appropriate adjustment, to the best of our ability, to understand the exact implications of Grogan. If it emerges that we do not have it quite right, it will have to be tweaked further, but the picture is not quite as precise as you paint it.

**Michael German:** The four local health boards that I mentioned will be £10 million in deficit as a direct result of the Grogan court case. The chairs of each of those local health boards have told me that they were promised that they would not have to meet those costs this year, as they would be met by the Welsh Assembly Government. Now that they have been informed that those costs will not be met by the Government—and they were told that only about eight or nine weeks ago—they are all forced to go into deficit, which will have to be paid for by making cuts to health services in Caerphilly, Blaenau Gwent, Newport and Torfaen, and probably many other areas.

**The First Minister:** Those points have not been put to me in that precise a manner before. In the run-up to the commencement of a new financial year, when budgets are being settled, it is not uncommon for chairs of LHBs and the leaders and treasurers of local authorities to put the point pretty

arbedion i'w rhoi'n ôl i wasanaethau allweddol eto y flwyddyn nesaf?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn amlwg, pan fydd llys yn gwneud dyfarniad, rhaid i holl unedau'r Llywodraeth wneud newidiadau cyllideb priodol er mwyn ymdrin â'r dyfarniad a wneir a'i oblygiadau mewn meysydd eraill. Bydd pobl mewn amgylchiadau tebyg i achos Grogan yn disgwyl i'r llif arian gael ei ailgyfeirio, fel ei fod yn dilyn dyfarniad Grogan.

Credwn ein bod wedi gwneud y newidiadau priodol i'r ddarpariaeth gyllideb i alluogi llywodraeth leol a'r gwasanaeth iechyd i ymdopi â chanlyniadau dyfarniad Grogan, er mai dim ond dechrau dod i'r amlwg y mae'r canlyniadau hynny ac nad ydynt yn gwbl glir eto. Credwn ein bod wedi gwneud addasiad eithaf da a phriodol, hyd eithaf ein gallu, er mwyn deall union oblygiadau Grogan. Os daw i'r amlwg nad ydym wedi'i gael yn hollol gywir, bydd yn rhaid ei addasu ymhellach, ond nid yw'r darlun bron mor amlwg ag y dywedwch ei fod.

**Michael German:** Bydd y pedwar bwrdd iechyd lleol a grybwyllais yn wynebu diffyg o £10 miliwn o ganlyniad uniongyrchol i achos llys Grogan. Mae cadeiryddion pob un o'r byrddau iechyd lleol hynny wedi dweud wrthyf eu bod wedi cael addewid na fyddai'n rhaid iddynt dalu'r costau hynny eleni, gan y byddai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n eu talu. A hwythau bellach wedi cael gwybod na fydd y Llywodraeth yn talu'r costau hynny—a dim ond rhyw wyth neu naw wythnos yn ôl y dywedwyd hynny wrthynt—gorfodir pob un ohonynt i fynd i ddiffyg, a bydd yn rhaid talu am y diffyg hwnnw drwy wneud toriadau i wasanaethau iechyd yng Nghaerffili, Blaenau Gwent, Casnewydd a Thor-faen, ac mewn nifer o ardaloedd eraill, mae'n debyg.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid yw'r pwyntiau hynny wedi cael eu cyflwyno imi mewn modd mor eglur â hynny o'r blaen. Yn y cyfnod cyn dechrau blwyddyn ariannol newydd, pan fydd cyllidebau'n cael eu setlo, nid yw'n anghyffredin i gadeiryddion byrddau iechyd lleol ac arweinwyr a thrysoryddion

forcibly that they would prefer to get bigger budgetary allocations. It is all part of the standard procedure at this time of year. As you mentioned, perhaps it was even more relevant eight or nine weeks ago, when they thought that the budget would be coming on-stream fairly soon, and they were looking for any politician to whom they could say, 'We would be better off if we got a bigger sum of money, as we might have a bit of a problem next year'. Somehow that has been interpreted as, 'Well, we have been short-changed by a specific sum of money'. I do not think that anyone yet knows the exact consequences of the Grogan judgment, concerning who is obliged to pay for what, and thus who should get more and who should get less of a budget. Costs previously thought to be in one budget will be taken away from that budget, and the obligation to make payments to people whose care is now covered by the NHS rather than by social services means less money from one pocket and more to another. However, it is not yet absolutely clear who falls into which category.

### The Fire Service

**Q2 Mohammad Asghar:** What representations has the Welsh Assembly Government received regarding the fire service in South Wales East? OAQ(3)0764(FM)

**The First Minister:** We have received no specific representations, although the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government, Brian Gibbons, has a regular dialogue with the three Welsh fire and rescue authorities. Indeed, he had one of his meetings with them a week ago today.

**Mohammad Asghar:** There was a terrible fire in Newport not long ago, and the firefighters are brave heroes and heroines. I have received a letter from the Fire Brigades Union, which is concerned about changes to the pension arrangements of firefighters who are injured at work. The relevant Minister in Scotland is taking a different line from that of the UK Government, and is to revert to the guidance as it was before it was changed in 2006. Will the First Minister acknowledge

awdurdodau lleol fynegi eu pwynt yn eithaf grymus y byddai'n well ganddynt gael dyraniadau cyllidebol mwy. Mae i gyd yn rhan o'r weithdrefn safonol yr adeg hon o'r flwyddyn. Fel y dywedasoeh, efallai fod hyn hyd yn oed yn fwy perthnasol wyth neu naw wythnos yn ôl, pan yr oeddent yn meddwl y byddai'r gyllideb yn dod yn rhan o'r ffrwd ariannu'n eithaf buan, ac yn chwilio am unrhyw wleidydd i ddweud wrtho 'Byddem mewn gwell sefyllfa petaem yn cael mwy o arian, oherwydd gallem wynebu problem y flwyddyn nesaf'. Rywsut, mae hynny wedi'i ddehongli fel, 'Wel, yr ydym ar ein colled o swm penodol o arian'. Nid wyf yn meddwl bod neb eto'n gwybod union ganlyniadau dyfarniad Grogan, o ran pwy sy'n gorfod talu am beth, ac felly pwy ddylai gael mwy a phwy ddylai gael llai o gyllideb. Caiff costau y tybiwyd yn flaenorol eu bod mewn un gyllideb eu tynnu o'r gyllideb honno, a bydd yr ymrwymiad i wneud taliadau i bobl y mae'r GIG bellach yn talu am eu gofal yn hytrach na'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn golygu llai o arian o un boced a mwy i boced arall. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n gwbl glir eto pwy sydd ym mha categori.

### Y Gwasanaeth Tân

**C2 Mohammad Asghar:** Pa sylwadau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi'u derbyn ynghylch y gwasanaeth tân yn Nwyrain De Cymru? OAQ(3)0764(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid ydym wedi cael dim sylwadau penodol, er bod y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol, Brian Gibbons, yn siarad yn rheolaidd â thri awdurdod tân ac achub Cymru. Yn wir, cafodd un o'i gyfarfodydd â hwy wythnos yn ôl i heddiw.

**Mohammad Asghar:** Bu tân ofnadwy yng Nghasnewydd yn ddiweddar, ac mae'r diffoddwyr tân yn arwyr dewr. Yr wyf wedi cael llythyr gan Undeb y Brigadau Tân, sy'n pryderu am newidiadau yn nhrefniadau pensiwn diffoddwyr tân sy'n cael eu hanafu wrth eu gwaith. Mae'r Gweinidog perthnasol yn yr Alban wedi cymryd agwedd wahanol i un Llywodraeth y DU, a bydd yn troi'n ôl at y cyfarwyddyd fel yr oedd cyn y cafodd ei newid yn 2006. A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog

that there is no UK-wide approach to this matter, and follow the lead of the Scottish-National-Party-led Government in Scotland, to give our firefighters the justice they deserve?

**The First Minister:** It is a fairly 50:50 situation. Power over firefighters' pensions is devolved, so we do not have to follow what the Department of Communities and Local Government is doing, although we tend to do so, as does Scotland, usually, given that pay and conditions are pan-UK, although pensions are devolved. Therefore, we could do something different. The DCLG has established a high-level review group to examine the levels of ill health and early retirements among firefighters, and the need to have a pensions system that covers the ill health that firefighters tend to have, which arises from the occupational risks that they face. As the redeployment of firefighters to non-dangerous jobs, if they are in poor health, is quite limited, it is a major problem, as we all recognise. That is why a high-level review group has been set up, which will report back to the DCLG. We will be aware of that report, and we can then make the appropriate provision. We are attending that group, and I think that the first meeting was held last week.

**Huw Lewis:** I was pleased to visit the Merthyr Tydfil fire station last week to see for myself the good work being undertaken there. Working in partnership with Merthyr Tydfil County Borough Council, the fire service has identified 4,000 vulnerable council properties that have a higher risk of fire, and is taking preventative action. Firefighters are in the process of visiting these homes, identifying the areas at risk, offering advice, and providing free smoke alarms, as well as checking the batteries of existing smoke alarms. However, the service has the capacity to visit only a tiny fraction of the homes identified, which leaves many vulnerable people at risk. It could take years for the service to cover the 4,000 homes identified. Will the First Minister agree to consider ways in which the Welsh Assembly

gydnabod nad oes dull gan y DU gyfan i ymdrin â'r mater hwn, a dilyn arweiniad Llywodraeth yr Alban, dan arweiniad Plaid Genedlaethol yr Alban, i roi'r cyfiawnder y mae ein diffoddwyr tân yn ei haeddu iddynt?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hon yn sefyllfa 50:50. Mae pŵer dros bensiynau diffoddwyr tân wedi'i ddatganoli, felly nid oes rhaid inni ddilyn yr hyn y mae'r Adran Cymunedau a Llywodraeth Leol yn ei wneud, er ein bod yn tueddu i wneud hynny, fel y gwna'r Alban, fel arfer, ac ystyried bod tâl ac amodau gwaith yr un fath ledled y DU, er bod pensiynau wedi'u datganoli. Felly, gallem wneud rhywbeth gwahanol. Mae'r Adran Cymunedau a Llywodraeth Leol wedi sefydlu grŵp adolygu ar lefel uchel i archwilio lefelau afiechyd ac ymddeol cynnar ymysg diffoddwyr tân, ac unrhyw angen am system bensiynau sy'n addas ar gyfer yr afiechyd y mae diffoddwyr tân yn tueddu i'w gael, o ganlyniad i'r risgiau galwedigaethol y maent yn eu hwynebu. Gan fod adleoli diffoddwyr tân i swyddi nad ydynt yn beryglus, os yw eu hiechyd yn wael, yn eithaf cyfyngedig, mae hyn yn broblem fawr, ac yr ydym oll yn cydnabod hynny. Dyna pam mae grŵp adolygu ar lefel uchel wedi'i sefydlu, a bydd y grŵp yn adrodd yn ôl i'r Adran Cymunedau a Llywodraeth Leol. Byddwn yn ymwybodol o'r adroddiad hwnnw, ac yna gallwn wneud y ddarpariaeth briodol. Yr ydym yn mynychu'r grŵp hwnnw, a chredaf i'r cyfarfod cyntaf gael ei gynnal yr wythnos diwethaf.

**Huw Lewis:** Bu'n bleser gennyf ymweld â gorsaf dân Merthyr Tudful yr wythnos diwethaf i weld â'm llygaid fy hun y gwaith da a wneir yno. Drwy weithio mewn partneriaeth â Chyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Merthyr Tudful, mae'r gwasanaeth tân wedi dod o hyd i 4,000 o adeiladau cyngor sy'n agored i berygl a chanddynt risg uwch o dân, ac mae'n cymryd camau ataliol. Mae diffoddwyr tân yn y broses o ymweld â'r cartrefi hyn, dod o hyd i'r ardaloedd lle ceir risg, cynnig cyngor, a darparu larymau mwg am ddim, yn ogystal â phrofi batris larymau mwg a ddefnyddir eisoes. Fodd bynnag, gall y gwasanaeth ond ymweld â chanran fechan iawn o'r cartrefi a ganfuwyd, sy'n peri risg i lawer o bobl sy'n agored i niwed. Gallai gymryd blynyddoedd i'r gwasanaeth ymweld â'r 4,000 o gartrefi a ganfuwyd. A wnaiff y

Government can support this innovative and life-saving initiative, and increase capacity to carry out this work?

**The First Minister:** I will ask Brian Gibbons to reply in detail to you. It is my understanding that there is £38 million in the budget for the coming financial year to cover the kind of initiative that you are referring to. However, it is not the only initiative that the £38 million has to cover; it covers preventative community fire safety, which is what you are talking about, the Firelink radio system, the New Dimension programme capabilities, and school sprinklers. Therefore, there is a whole programme to be covered. The question is how much is being put into the preventative fire safety programme, which deals with high-risk properties, particularly social housing? I will make sure that Brian reads the Record and responds to you on that point.

**Nick Ramsay:** We are all well aware of the debt that we owe our fire and rescue professionals and of the risks that they take to protect our communities. I concur with some of the sentiments raised regarding the firefighters' pension scheme. It will not necessarily happen in every case, but there is potential for a firefighter injured in the course of duty not to be redeployed in the sphere with which he or she is familiar, or may not be able to receive a pension at that time. I appreciate that a review is under way, but this is a serious issue, so will you commit your Government to doing everything possible to make sure that our firefighters, who are there when we need them and do so much to protect us, get the support that they deserve?

**The First Minister:** I entirely agree with everything that you said. We are committed to trying to make sure that there is appropriate provision of ill-health pensions for firefighters. It is my understanding that, even though opportunities for redeployment to less physically demanding jobs are limited—the surface jobs, to use old coalmining language, that do not involve running up and down ladders or handling

Prif Weinidog gytuno i ystyried ffyrdd y gall Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gefnogi'r fenter arloesol hon sy'n achub bywydau, a chynyddu'r capasiti i wneud y gwaith hwn?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gofynnaf i Brian Gibbons roi ateb manwl ichi. Yr wyf ar ddeall bod £38 miliwn yn y gyllideb ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf i dalu am y math o fenter yr ydych yn cyfeirio ati. Fodd bynnag, nid honno yw'r unig fenter y mae'n rhaid i'r £38 miliwn ei hariannu; mae'n ariannu'r rhaglen ataliol ar gyfer diogelwch tân cymunedol, sef y rhaglen yr ydych yn sôn amdani, y system radio Firelink, galluoedd rhaglen y Dimensiwn Newydd, a systemau chwistrellu mewn ysgolion. Felly, ceir rhaglen gyfan y mae'n rhaid ei hariannu. Y cwestiwn yw faint o arian a roddir i'r rhaglen ataliol ar gyfer diogelwch tân, sy'n delio ag adeiladau â risg uchel, yn enwedig tai cymdeithasol? Byddaf yn sicrhau bod Brian yn darllen y Cofnod ac yn ymateb ichi ynghylch y pwynt hwnnw.

**Nick Ramsay:** Yr ydym i gyd yn ymwybodol o'r ddyled sydd arnom i'r gweithwyr proffesiynol ym maes tân ac achub, ac o'r risgiau y cymerant i amddiffyn ein cymunedau. Cytunaf â rhai o'r syniadau a godwyd yn ymwneud â chynllun pensiwn y diffoddwyr tân. Ni fydd o reidrwydd yn digwydd ymhob achos, ond mae'n bosibl na chaiff diffoddwr tân a anafir wrth weithio ei adleoli yn y maes y mae ef neu hi yn gyfforddus ynddo, ac mae'n bosibl na all gael pensiwn yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw. Yr wyf yn gwerthfawrogi bod adolygiad ar waith ar hyn o bryd, ond mae hwn yn fater difrifol, felly a wnewch ymrwymo eich Llywodraeth i wneud popeth sy'n bosibl i sicrhau y bydd ein diffoddwyr tân, sydd ar gael pan fydd eu hangen arnom ac yn gwneud cymaint i'n hamddiffyn, yn cael y gefnogaeth y maent yn ei haeddu?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn cytuno'n llwyr â phopeth a ddywedwyd gennych. Yr ydym yn ymroddedig i geisio sicrhau y ceir darpariaeth briodol o bensiynau ar sail salwch i ddifoddwyr tân. Yr wyf ar ddeall, er bod cyfleoedd adleoli i swyddi llai corfforol ymdrechgar yn brin—y swyddi ar yr wyneb, fel y'u gelwir yn hen iaith y pyllau glo, nad ydynt yn golygu dringo i fyny ac i lawr ysgolion neu drafod offer pwmpio enfawr, ac

huge pumping equipment, and so on—and because a person cannot sometimes get an ill-health pension because they are not quite ill enough, there is no other compensation scheme available for someone who cannot carry on in the job as a result of an injury received in the course of duty. That is recognised as a problem, and the review intends to make recommendations in this regard. It is a devolved issue in principle, but we would prefer, if possible, to keep unity on pay and conditions, and terms of employment, for firefighters, so that they are on a par throughout the United Kingdom.

**Irene James:** There is a huge problem with the recruitment of retained firefighters at the Abercarn fire station in my constituency, even though several advertisements have been taken out in the local press. What more can the Welsh Assembly Government do to encourage individuals to train as retained firefighters?

**The First Minister:** You have switched the subject; everything that I said in answer to the previous question did not cover retained firefighters, as you are probably aware, Irene. I will have to ask Brian to write to you about the issue of a fire station based on the use of retained, rather than the so-called 'regular', firefighters. I was not aware of a recruitment problem, and it is sad to hear that there is such a problem. People have taken a good, healthy and community-oriented attitude towards being employed as retained firefighters, and if the supply of potential retained firefighters is, for any reason, starting to slip, that is a rather sad commentary on modern life. We will have to see what we can do about it.

### Economic Development

**Q3 David Melding:** Will the First Minister make a statement on how the business scheme set out in section 75 of the Government of Wales Act 2006 will affect the Welsh Assembly Government's priorities for economic development?  
OAQ(3)0754(FM)

**The First Minister:** We have gone out to

yn y blaen—ac am na all unigolyn gael pensiwn ar sail salwch weithiau am nad yw'n ddigon sâl, nad oes cynllun iawndal arall ar gael i rywun na all aros yn ei swydd yn sgil anaf a gafwyd wrth weithio. Ceir cydnabyddiaeth bod hynny'n broblem, a bwriad yr adolygiad yw cyflwyno argymhellion yn y cyswllt hwn. Mewn egwyddor, mae hwn yn fater wedi'i ddatganoli ond byddai'n well gennym, os yw'n bosibl, gadw undod ynghylch tâl ac amodau, a thelerau cyflogaeth, ar gyfer diffoddwyr tân, er mwyn iddynt fod ar yr un lefel ledled y Deyrnas Unedig.

**Irene James:** Ceir problem enfawr wrth recriwtio diffoddwyr tân wrth gefn yng ngorsaf dân Abercarn yn fy etholaeth, er bod llawer o hysbysebion wedi'u cyhoeddi yn y wasg leol. Beth yn rhagor a all Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ei wneud i annog unigolion i hyfforddi fel diffoddwyr tân wrth gefn?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych wedi newid y pwnc; fel y gwyddoch, mae'n debyg, Irene, nid oedd a wnelo dim o'r hyn a ddywedais wrth ateb y cwestiwn blaenorol â diffoddwyr tân wrth gefn. Bydd yn rhaid imi ofyn i Brian ysgrifennu atoch ynglŷn â gorsaf dân sy'n seiliedig ar ddefnyddio diffoddwyr tân wrth gefn, yn hytrach na diffoddwyr tân 'arferol'. Nid oeddwn yn ymwybodol o broblem gyda recriwtio, ac mae'n drist clywed y ceir problem o'r fath. Mae gan bobl agwedd dda ac iach, sy'n canolbwyntio ar y gymuned, tuag at gael swyddi fel diffoddwyr tân wrth gefn, ac os yw cyflenwad y diffoddwyr tân wrth gefn posibl yn dechrau lleihau, am unrhyw reswm, mae hynny'n ddelwedd drist iawn o fywyd cyfoes. Bydd yn rhaid inni weld beth y gallwn wneud ynghylch y broblem.

### Datblygu Economaidd

**C3 David Melding:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am sut y bydd y cynllun busnes, a nodwyd yn adran 75 Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006, yn effeithio ar flaenoriaethau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer datblygu economaidd?  
OAQ(3)0754(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym wedi bod allan

consultation on the new business scheme, but, of itself, it will not affect our economic development priorities. Those priorities include continuing to push the Welsh economy ever onwards and upwards into the knowledge economy.

2.20 p.m.

I was able to celebrate that in Brussels last night with people from the Optronics technium at St Asaph. It was wonderful that they received one of the five gold medal awards for outstanding innovation in regional development policy. I was pleased to be there on the stage with David Rimmer and Janice Burnie to celebrate their getting that award. That needs to be reflected throughout Wales, to get us into the knowledge economy.

**David Melding:** You will know that the analogous schemes for the voluntary sector and local government have been up and running since the autumn. Your Government has recently, and belatedly, gone out to consultation on the business scheme. Do you not agree that this dilatory action by your Government demonstrates an underlying coolness towards the private sector?

**The First Minister:** That is anything but the case. It is not dilatory action on our part. We are committed to a new scheme. When we did have one, the last time that a Tory Assembly Member attended—and Members were fully entitled to attend—was two and a half years ago. So you did not make a big and song dance about attendance. We started consultation on 1 February, and it will finish in April. That does not prevent us from meeting the private sector. Ieuan Wyn Jones and I had lunch with captains of industry in Wales two weeks ago. That was extremely useful, and we will carry on having meetings and good contacts with the private sector.

**Lesley Griffiths:** Do you agree that the basis for the business scheme is to provide some joined-up thinking and working within Wales with the principal aim of delivering prosperity for Welsh businesses and workers

yn ymgynghori ynghylch y cynllun busnes newydd, ond, ar ei ben ei hun, ni fydd yn effeithio ar ein blaenoriaethau o ran datblygu economaidd. Mae'r blaenoriaethau hynny'n cynnwys parhau i wthio'r economi Gymreig yn ei blaen ac ar i fyny at yr economi wybodaeth.

Gallais ddathlu hynny ym Mrwsel neithiwr gyda phobl o'r technium Optroneg yn Llanelwy. Yr oedd yn wych eu bod wedi ennill un o'r pum gwobr medal aur am arloesi eithriadol mewn polisi datblygu rhanbarthol. Yr oeddwn yn falch o fod yno ar y llwyfan gyda David Rimmer a Janice Burnie i ddathlu eu bod wedi cael y wobwr honno. Rhaid adlewyrchu hynny ledled Cymru, er mwyn inni ymuno â'r economi wybodaeth.

**David Melding:** Gwyddoch fod y cynlluniau cydweddol ar gyfer y sector gwirfoddol a llywodraeth leol wedi bod ar waith ers yr hydref. Yn ddiweddar, a hynny'n hwyr, bu eich Llywodraeth allan yn ymgynghori ynghylch y cynllun busnes. Oni chytunwch fod y gweithredu araf hwn gan eich Llywodraeth yn dangos agwedd sylfaenol oeraidd at y sector preifat?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hynny ymhell o fod yn wir. Nid gweithredu araf ar ein rhan mohono. Yr ydym yn ymroddedig i gynllun newydd. Pan oedd gennym gynllun o'r fath, y tro diwethaf y bu Aelod Cynulliad Ceidwadol yn bresennol—ac yr oedd pob hawl gan Aelodau fod yn bresennol—oedd dwy flynedd a hanner yn ôl. Felly, nid oeddech yn mynnu pwysleisio pwysigrwydd presenoldeb. Dechreuasom ymgynghori ar 1 Chwefror, a bydd yn dod i ben ym mis Ebrill. Nid yw hynny'n ein rhwystro rhag cyfarfod â'r sector preifat. Cafodd Ieuan Wyn Jones a minnau ginio gydag unigolion blaenllaw o fyd diwydiant yng Nghymru bythefnos yn ôl. Yr oedd hynny'n ddefnyddiol dros ben, a byddwn yn parhau i gynnal cyfarfodydd a chysylltiadau da gyda'r sector preifat.

**Lesley Griffiths:** A ydych yn cytuno mai sail y cynllun busnes yw darparu rhywfaint o feddwl a gweithio ar y cyd yng Nghymru, gyda'r brif nod o ddarparu ffyniant i fusnesau a gweithwyr o Gymru yn y dyfodol? A ydych

in the future? Do you also agree that this partnership can only be achieved via the kind of thorough and ongoing consultation between Ministers and social partners throughout Wales that is outlined in the business scheme?

**The First Minister:** Yes. The purpose of holding the consultation between 1 February and 25 April is to design the scheme to meet what business wants. Was business really happy with what we had before in the business partnership council? It was at the beginning, but towards the end it was beginning to express doubts about whether it really was the appropriate model. That is why we are consulting, to know what business wants. Obviously, it is not something for us, but for the stakeholders, for the business sector in every respect. We hope that the ideas thrown around during the 12-week consultation will come up with the right model for the period from 2008 onwards.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Nick Bourne):** There are many people in the business sector who are concerned that the partnership council has not met over the last year, almost. The argument that you gave could equally apply to the local government partnership council and the voluntary partnership council. Bilateral meetings take place, but this is in addition to those. I want to address you particularly to the issue of Welsh prosperity and employment rates, rather than unemployment rates. We all have a great desire to ensure that the economy buzzes and to get our gross value added per capita rates up to the level of the rest of the United Kingdom. I know that you, and certainly Labour at Westminster, have acknowledged that there is an issue to address in relation to incapacity benefit and the number of people on that benefit and not in employment, and that there is an aim to help them into employment. It is a particular problem in Wales. What are you doing to address that particular issue, perhaps in conjunction with Westminster, and how do you think that that will alter our GVA position compared to that of the rest of the United Kingdom?

yn cytuno hefyd mai'r unig ffordd o sicrhau'r bartneriaeth hon yw drwy gael y math o ymgynghori trylwyr a pharhaus rhwng Aelodau a'r partneriaid cymdeithasol ledled Cymru, fel yr amlinellir yn y cynllun busnes?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ydw. Pwrpas cynnal yr ymgynghoriad rhwng 1 Chwefror a 25 Ebrill yw er mwyn dylunio'r cynllun yn unol â'r hyn y mae ar fyd busnes ei eisiau. A oedd byd busnes wir yn fodlon â'r hyn a oedd gennym o'r blaen dan y cyngor partneriaeth busnes? Yr oedd yn fodlon ar y cychwyn, ond tua'r diwedd yr oedd yn dechrau mynegi amheuan nad oedd y model yn un addas. Dyna pam yr ydym yn ymgynghori, er mwyn gwybod beth y mae ar fyd busnes ei eisiau. Yn amlwg, nid rhywbeth inni yw hwn, ond rhywbeth i'r rhanddeiliaid, i'r sector busnes ym mhob agwedd. Yr ydym yn gobeithio y bydd y syniadau a awgrymir yn ystod yr ymgynghoriad 12 wythnos o hyd yn llunio'r model cywir ar gyfer y cyfnod o 2008 ymlaen.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Nick Bourne):** Mae llawer o bobl yn y sector busnes yn pryderu nad yw'r cyngor partneriaeth wedi cwrdd dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, bron. Gallai'r ddadl a roddwyd gennych fod yr un mor berthnasol i'r cyngor partneriaeth llywodraeth leol ac i'r cyngor partneriaeth wirfoddol. Caiff cyfarfodydd dwyochrog eu cynnal, ond mae hyn yn ychwanegol at y rheini. Yr wyf am godi mater ffyniant Cymru a chyfraddau cyflogaeth yn benodol gyda chi, yn hytrach na chyfraddau diweithdra. Yr ydym i gyd yn hynod awyddus i sicrhau y ceir cynnwrf yn yr economi, ac i godi ein cyfraddau gwerth ychwanegol crynswth y pen hyd at lefel gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol eich bod chi, ac yn sicr y Blaid Lafur yn San Steffan, wedi cydnabod y ceir mater y dylid rhoi sylw iddo yng nghyswllt budd-dal analluogrwydd a nifer y bobl sy'n cael y budd-dal hwnnw nad ydynt yn gweithio, ac y ceir bwriad i'w helpu i gael swyddi. Mae'n broblem yng Nghymru yn arbennig. Beth ydych yn ei wneud i roi sylw i'r mater penodol hwnnw, o bosibl ar y cyd â San Steffan, a sut, yn eich tyb chi, y bydd hynny'n newid ein safle o ran GYC o gymharu â safle gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig?

**The First Minister:** Welfare to work schemes are extremely important. Generally speaking, they are led by the Westminster Government, because we cannot change the benefits system—that is very much a matter for the Westminster Government. The issue is always whether you can preserve access to benefits for a transitional period for those who have become pretty much dependent on the benefits system and whom you are trying to winkle out into having a go in the labour market. If access to benefits suddenly ceases, people are reluctant to try out a job that they are not sure that they can cope with, or will last. Getting at least 13 weeks of transitional aid, so that people can have access to at least some benefits, is important. We participate in Pathways to Work, Want to Work, and there may be other schemes in this respect that we are working on now, with a view to using convergence funding, that will continue to close the gap. The gap between Wales and the UK, in terms of the participation rate in the economy, used to be 6 full percentage points; it is now 3 percentage points, so we have halved the gap. However, we need to perhaps quarter it, and then close it altogether.

**Nick Bourne:** That is certainly true, particularly in some Valleys communities; Merthyr Tydfil and Blaenau Gwent are two of the areas with the most serious problems in the UK—they are in the top three, or the bottom three, depending on how you look at it. It is essentially about trying to get people into work for their sake and for the sake of the economy.

I will move the First Minister onto two issues that relate to employment, namely childcare and flexitime working, on which we made manifesto commitments. We stated that we would give business rate relief to those businesses that run a crèche or use a crèche in their locality. Many women find that having no childcare provision is a barrier to going to work. What are you doing on that? Flexible working would help not just women, necessarily, but also men, and carers on a broader front, as flexible working helps those people with caring responsibilities as well as

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae cynlluniau ‘o fudd-dal i waith’ yn bwysig dros ben. Yn gyffredinol, Llywodraeth San Steffan fydd yn eu harwain, am na allwn newid y system budd-daliadau—mae hwnnw’n sicr yn fater i Lywodraeth San Steffan. Bob tro, y cwestiwn fydd a ellir gwarchod mynediad at fudd-daliadau am gyfnod trosiannol i’r rheini sydd wedi dod yn ddibynnol, i bob pwrpas, ar y system budd-daliadau, sef y rheini yr ydych yn ceisio’u gorfodi i roi cynnig arni yn y farchnad lafur. Os bydd mynediad at fudd-daliadau’n dod i ben yn sydyn, bydd pobl yn gyndyn o roi cynnig ar swydd nad ydynt yn siŵr a allant ymdopi â hi ai peidio, neu swydd nad ydynt yn siŵr a fydd yn para. Mae cael o leiaf 13 wythnos o gymorth trosiannol, er mwyn i bobl gael mynediad at rywfaint o fudd-daliadau o leiaf, yn bwysig. Yr ydym yn cymryd rhan yn y cynlluniau Llwybrau at Waith ac Eisiau Gweithio, ac efallai y bydd cynlluniau eraill yn y cyswllt hwn yr ydym yn gweithio arnynt ar hyn o bryd, gyda’r bwriad o gael cyllid cydgyfeirio, yn parhau i gau’r bwlch. Yr oedd y bwlch rhwng Cymru a’r DU o ran cyfradd gyfranogi yn yr economi yn 6 pwynt canran o’r blaen; 3 pwynt canran ydyw erbyn hyn, felly yr ydym wedi hanneru’r bwlch. Fodd bynnag, mae arnom angen ei chwarteru o bosibl, ac yna ei gau’n gyfan gwbl.

**Nick Bourne:** Mae hynny’n sicr yn wir, yn enwedig yn rhai o gymunedau’r Cymoedd; Merthyr Tudful a Blaenau Gwent yw dwy o’r ardaloedd sydd â’r problemau mwyaf difrifol yn y DU—maent yn y tri uchaf, neu’r tri isaf, gan ddibynnu ar sut yr edrychwch arnynt. Y nod hanfodol yw ceisio cael pobl i weithio er eu lles eu hunain ac er lles yr economi.

Symudaf y Prif Weinidog ymlaen at ddau fater sy’n ymwneud â chyflogaeth, sef gofal plant a gweithio oriau hyblyg. Gwnaethom addewidion ynghylch y materion hyn yn ein maniffesto. Dywedasom y byddwn yn rhoi rhyddhad ardrethi busnes i’r busnesau hynny sy’n rhedeg crèche neu’n defnyddio crèche yn eu hardal leol. Mae diffyg darpariaeth gofal plant yn rhwystr i nifer o fenywod rhag mynd i weithio. Beth ydych yn ei wneud ynghylch hynny? Byddai gweithio oriau hyblyg nid yn unig yn helpu’r menywod, o reidrwydd, ond dynion hefyd, a gofalwyr ar



those with young children. What is the Government doing to try to help those people so that there is a beneficial impact on the Welsh economy?

**The First Minister:** In the first Objective 1 programme, which we are now translating into the new convergence fund programme, one of the most successful flagship schemes was the Genesis project, which started in the Rhondda and was rolled out to the whole of Rhondda Cynon Taf. That project is based on the mentoring of, and provision of childcare for, lone parents so that you remove the childcare barrier to them participating in work. It is quite labour intensive, from the mentoring point of view, when you start such a programme, which is a bit of an experiment, but as you get better at doing it, it gets less labour intensive and you can afford to roll it out to a wider area of Objective 1 Wales. That is precisely what we did at the end of the Genesis project. It has been so successful that we are hoping to make it a fundamental part of the convergence programme. We very much look forward to that having an impact on the number of lone parents contributing to the economy.

Flexible working would probably have much the same effect, but you must remember that, as with childcare, it depends on the area. There is a big difference between the market for flexible working and the provision of childcare in Kensington and Chelsea, say, and the market in Merthyr Tydfil and Blaenau Gwent—it is colossal. There is no paid-for market in the Heads of the Valleys, but there will be informal childcare systems. It is about trying to ensure that childcare is available, and that it is not just provided by grandmothers, neighbours or relatives. We are trying to provide better systems, and sometimes you must start with a public subsidy.

**Nick Bourne:** I fully accept that the position will be different in different parts of Wales, but that is why we need to consider how we can help people in some Valleys

lefel ehangach, gan fod gweithio oriau hyblyg yn helpu'r rheini sydd â chyfrifoldebau gofalu yn ogystal â'r rhieni sydd â phlant ifanc. Beth mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i geisio helpu'r bobl hynny er mwyn sicrhau effaith sydd o fudd i'r economi Gymreig?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn y rhaglen Amcan 1 gyntaf, yr ydym yn awr yn ei throsi i raglen newydd y gronfa gydyfeirio, un o'r cynlluniau arloesol oedd prosiect Genesis, a ddechreuodd yn y Rhondda, cyn cael ei gyflwyno i weddill Rhondda Cynon Taf. Mae'r prosiect hwnnw'n seiliedig ar fentora rhieni sengl, a darparu gofal plant ar eu cyfer, er mwyn diddymu'r rhwystr gofal plant sy'n eu hatal rhag gweithio. Mae'n broses eithaf llafurus, o ran y mentora, pan fyddwch yn cychwyn rhaglen o'r fath, sy'n arbrawf i raddau, ond wrth ichi ddechrau ei wneud yn well, mae'n dod yn llai llafurus a gallwch fforddio ei gyflwyno i ardal ehangach Amcan 1 Cymru. Dyna'n union a wnaethom ar ddiwedd prosiect Genesis. Mae wedi bod mor llwyddiannus nes ein bod yn gobeithio ei wneud yn rhan annatod o'r rhaglen gydyfeirio. Yr ydym yn edrych ymlaen yn fawr at gael effaith ar nifer y rhieni sengl sy'n cyfrannu at yr economi.

Mae'n debyg y byddai gweithio oriau hyblyg yn cael yr un effaith, ond rhaid ichi gofio bod hynny'n dibynnu ar yr ardal, fel y mae gofal plant hefyd. Ceir gwahaniaeth mawr rhwng y farchnad ar gyfer gweithio oriau hyblyg a darpariaeth gofal plant yn Kensington a Chelsea, er enghraifft, a'r farchnad ym Merthyr Tudful a Blaenau Gwent—mae'n anferth. Ni cheir marchnad daledig ym Mlaenau'r Cymoedd, ond ceir systemau gofal plant anffurfiol. Dylid ceisio sicrhau bod gofal plant ar gael, ac nid yw'n cael ei ddarparu gan neiniau, cymdogion neu berthnasau'n unig. Yr ydym yn ceisio darparu systemau gwell, ac weithiau mae'n rhaid cychwyn gyda chymhorthdal cyhoeddus.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn derbyn yn llwyr y bydd y sefyllfa'n wahanol mewn gwahanol rannau o Gymru, ond dyna pam mae angen inni ystyried sut y gallwn helpu pobl yn rhai

communities. I appreciate that, if the project is being piloted in some areas, it will be rolled out to other areas if it is a proven success, and that you will learn lessons. Will you be considering a national scheme, such as that which we suggested on providing rebates on business rates for businesses? I appreciate that this could only apply to those businesses paying business rates, if they have a workplace nursery directly on their premises, or use a local nursery, if they are a small employer. Flexitime working could also apply not only in the business sector but more widely, if you consider a national scheme of business rate relief, which would apply to the whole of Wales rather than just to some areas.

**The First Minister:** I agree. We will consider a wide range of possibilities for the better provision of childcare and to move from this informal system where childcare is based on grandmothers and neighbours caring for children, which is very common in less-well-off areas where people cannot afford to take a big chunk out of their wages; wages will be too low for them to afford the full market price of good-quality, formal childcare. What do you do in those circumstances? What we have done, generally, is to provide an initial public subsidy, as is the case with Genesis, to ensure that childcare is not an obstacle. There is a market for childcare in Kensington and Chelsea, as people are on good wages that are sufficient to pay for it. That will not be the case in some parts of Wales. The same applies to tax breaks. What is the point of having a tax break if you are not paying tax? What is the point of small business rate relief if childcare is not provided on the premises by a small business? You have to adapt it to a particular area. You probably understand that the situation is very different in the Heads of the Valleys.

**Nick Bourne:** I accept that no parts of Wales are similar to Kensington and Chelsea. The point that I am trying to make is that I agree that there are informal arrangements in Wales, but, very often these days,

o gymunedau'r Cymoedd. Yr wyf yn gwerthfawrogi, os caiff y prosiect ei dreialu mewn rhai ardaloedd, y caiff ei gyflwyno i ardaloedd eraill os yw'n llwyddiant, ac y byddwch yn dysgu gwersi. A fyddwch yn ystyried cynllun cenedlaethol, fel yr un a awgrymwyd gennym ar gyfer ad-dalu ardrethi busnes i fusnesau? Yr wyf yn gwerthfawrogi mai dim ond i'r busnesau hynny sy'n talu ardrethi busnes y gallai hyn fod yn berthnasol, os oes ganddynt feithrinfa yn eu gweithle, neu os ydynt yn defnyddio meithrinfa leol, neu os ydynt yn gyflogwyr bach. Gallai gweithio oriau hyblyg hefyd fod yn berthnasol nid yn unig yn y sector busnes, ond yn ehangach, os byddwch yn ystyried cynllun cenedlaethol ar gyfer rhyddhad ardrethi busnes, a fyddai'n berthnasol i Gymru gyfan yn hytrach nac i rai ardaloedd yn unig.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cytunaf. Byddwn yn ystyried ystod eang o bosibiliadau ar gyfer gwell darpariaeth gofal plant a symud o'r system anffurfiol hon lle mae gofal plant yn seiliedig ar neiniau a chymdogion yn gofalu am blant, sy'n gyffredin iawn mewn ardaloedd llai cefnog lle na all pobl fforddio i roi rhan fawr o'u cyflog; bydd cyflogau'n rhy isel iddynt fforddio pris llawn y farchnad am ofal plant ffurfiol o ansawdd da. Beth y gellir ei wneud dan yr amgylchiadau hynny? Yr hyn yr ydym wedi'i wneud, yn gyffredinol, yw darparu cymhorthdal cyhoeddus cychwynnol, fel sy'n wir yn achos Genesis, i sicrhau nad yw gofal plant yn rhwystr. Ceir marchnad ar gyfer gofal plant yn Kensington a Chelsea, am fod pobl ar gyflogau da sy'n ddigon i dalu amdano. Ni fydd hynny'n wir mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru. Mae hynny hefyd yn berthnasol yng nghyswllt manteision treth. Beth yw pwrpas cael manteision treth os nad ydych yn talu treth? Beth yw pwrpas rhyddhad ardrethi i fusnesau bach os na ddarperir gofal plant yn y gweithle gan fusnes bach? Rhaid ichi ei addasu ar gyfer ardal benodol. Mae'n siŵr eich bod yn deall bod y sefyllfa'n wahanol iawn ym Mlaenau'r Cymoedd.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn derbyn nad oes un rhan o Gymru yn debyg i Kensington a Chelsea. Y pwynt yr wyf yn ceisio'i wneud yw fy mod yn cytuno y ceir trefniadau anffurfiol yng Nghymru, ond, yn aml iawn y

grandmothers will also be in the job market. Therefore, we must consider a national scheme; we cannot rely on these informal networks. I welcome any proposals that you are going to bring forward.

dyddiau hyn, bydd neiniau hefyd yn y farchnad lafur. Felly, rhaid inni ystyried cynllun cenedlaethol; ni allwn ddibynnu ar y rhwydweithiau anffurfiol hyn. Yr wyf yn croesawu unrhyw gynigion yr ydych yn mynd i'w cyflwyno.

2.30 p.m.

**The First Minister:** That is what I am saying. We are moving from the informal networks to the formal networks, but it cannot be based only on market solutions in areas where the salaries are too low to justify the salary of the carer, if the carer is a formal carer and is not a granny or a neighbour. That is the problem. We have been devoting our efforts to trying to find a way around it. Genesis is an outstandingly successful project; that is why we want to roll it out.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dyna ydwyf yn ei ddweud. Yr ydym yn symud oddi wrth y rhwydweithiau anffurfiol at y rhwydweithiau ffurfiol, ond ni all gael ei seilio ar atebion y farchnad yn unig mewn ardaloedd lle mae'r cyflogau'n rhy isel i gyfiawnhau cyflog y gofawr, os yw'r gofawr yn ofalwr ffurfiol ac nid yn fam-gu neu'n gymydog. Dyna yw'r broblem. Yr ydym wedi bod yn canolbwyntio ein hymdrechion ar geisio canfod ffordd o oresgyn hynny. Mae Genesis yn brosiect eithriadol o lwyddiannus; dyna pam yr ydym am ei gyflwyno'n gyffredinol.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Ar wahân i dwf economaidd, mae gostwng allyriant carbon hefyd yn hollbwysig i'r Llywodraeth. Mae'r CBI wedi cynnig tystiolaeth i'r Pwyllgor Cynaliadwyedd. Yn eu sesiwn dystiolaeth hwy, yr oedd BT a Marks and Spencer hefyd yn sôn am yr hyn sydd wedi ei grybwyll yn barod, sef gweithio hyblyg i staff, sydd wedi gostwng lefelau allyriant carbon, neu leihau eu hól-troed carbon. A fyddai'r Llywodraeth yn barod i ystyried rhai o'r mesurau hyn a'u mabwysiadu er mwyn cyrraedd yr un nod?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Apart from economic growth, reducing carbon emissions is also vital to the Government. The CBI has given evidence to the Sustainability Committee. In their evidence session, BT and Marks and Spencer also referred to what has already been mentioned, namely flexible working for staff. This has reduced carbon emission levels, or their carbon footprint. Would the Government be prepared to consider some of these measures and adopt them to reach the same goal?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf wedi clywed BT yn cwyno bod pobl yng Nghymru yn llai parod i gymryd y cam a fyddai'n amlwg yn gostwng lefelau carbon, sef gweithio yn y cartref gyda chyfrifiadur a chysylltiad band eang, gan wneud eu gwaith felly heb deithio a heb ddefnyddio carbon wrth deithio. Mae hynny'n gam pwysig ond, am ryw reswm, nid yw'r parodrwydd a ddisgwyliwyd gan BT yn bodoli. Efallai nad yw BT yn gwerthu'r syniad yn ddigon da, ond dyna'i gwyn ynglŷn â Chymru, sef fod angen newid cymdeithasol er mwyn annog mwy o bobl i weithio gartref mewn ffordd hyblyg, a hynny efallai er mwyn gofalu am blant neu oherwydd bod ganddynt gyfrifoldebau gofalu eraill. Byddai hynny'n osgoi'r gost o deithio i'r gwaith ac yn arbed defnyddio carbon.

**The First Minister:** I have heard BT complain that people in Wales are less willing to take the one step that would clearly reduce carbon levels, namely working at home with a computer and broadband connection—working without travelling and without using carbon in the process. That is an important step but, for some reason, the willingness that BT expected to see does not exist. Perhaps BT has not sold the idea well enough, but that is its complaint about Wales: that social change is required in order to encourage more people to work from home in a flexible way, perhaps in order to care for children or because they have other caring responsibilities. That would avoid the cost of travelling to work and would avoid the use of carbon.

**Kirsty Williams:** First Minister, to go back to the issue of economic activity levels, despite the long list of programmes that you said your Government is involved in delivering, the latest statistics show that our economic activity levels are worse than they were a year ago. Therefore, we are not catching up; we are falling behind our previous position. Given that a large percentage of people who are on incapacity benefit have diagnosed mental health issues, what is your Government doing to address the fact that we need specific, dedicated programmes with skilled staff to get those people who suffer from mental health problems back into the workplace? Those people are often among the most difficult to place in employment. They need ongoing support rather than one-off support. I am concerned that the kind of companies that we see working in this market are not necessarily skilled enough to help those particular individuals.

**The First Minister:** I think that you are making the right point in the wrong context. Overall, since the Assembly came into existence, we have halved the gap between the UK employment rate and the Welsh employment rate. It used to be 6 percentage points, but it is now 3 percentage points.

You made a good point about mental health. The Department for Work and Pensions does not see it as a specifically Welsh issue, because, in this respect, it sees London and the south-east as the major problem and not Wales. However, there has been a rapid increase in the number of cases where mental health problems are being quoted as a reason for receiving incapacity benefit. Taking Wales as a whole, we used to have astronomical levels of dependence on incapacity benefit, but the levels have now fallen considerably. In England, the levels used to be modest, but they are now rising, not falling. The reason that they are rising is that mental health is being quoted as the main reason for receiving incapacity benefit. People are baffled by that in the DWP. However, it is not seen as the Welsh issue; it is seen as an issue in London and south-east.

**Kirsty Williams:** Brif Weinidog, i fynd yn ôl at fater lefelau gweithgarwch economaidd, er gwaethaf y rhestr hir o raglenni y dywedasoeh y mae eich Llywodraeth yn cyfrannu at eu rhoi ar waith, mae'r ystadegau diweddaraf yn dangos bod ein lefelau gweithgarwch economaidd yn waeth nag oeddent flwyddyn yn ôl. Felly, nid ydym yn dal i fyny; yr ydym yn disgyn yn ôl o'n safle blaenorol. Ac ystyried bod canran fawr o'r bobl sydd ar fudd-dal analluogrwydd wedi cael eu diagnosio â phroblemau iechyd meddwl, beth mae eich Llywodraeth chi'n ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â'r ffaith bod angen rhaglenni penodol, pwrpasol, gyda staff medrus i gael y bobl hynny sy'n dioddef problemau iechyd meddwl yn ôl i'r gweithle? Mae'r bobl hynny yn aml y mysq y mwyaf anodd i'w lleoli mewn cyflogaeth. Mae angen cymorth parhaus arnynt yn hytrach na chymorth unwaith yn unig. Yr wyf yn pryderu nad yw'r math o gwmnïau a welwn yn gweithio yn y farchnad hon o reidrwydd yn ddigon medrus i helpu'r unigolion neilltuol hyn.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Credaf eich bod yn gwneud y pwynt iawn yn y cyd-destun anghywir. Drwyddi draw, ers i'r Cynulliad ddod i fodolaeth, yr ydym wedi haneru'r bwlch rhwng cyfradd gyflogaeth y DU a chyfradd gyflogaeth Cymru. Arferai fod yn 6 phwynt canran, ond erbyn hyn mae'n 3 phwynt canran.

Gwnaethoch bwynt da am iechyd meddwl. Nid yw'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau'n yn ei weld fel problem i Gymru'n benodol, oherwydd, yn y cyswllt hwn, mae'n gweld Llundain a'r de-ddwyrain fel y brif broblem, nid Cymru. Fodd bynnag, bu cynnydd cyflym yn nifer yr achosion lle mae problemau iechyd meddwl yn cael eu rhoi fel rheswm am gael budd-dal analluogrwydd. Ac edrych ar Gymru gyfan, arferai fod gennym lefelau aruthrol o ddibyniaeth ar fudd-dal analluogrwydd, ond mae'r lefelau wedi gostwng yn sylweddol erbyn hyn. Yn Lloegr, arferai'r lefelau fod yn gymedrol, ond maent yn codi bellach, nid yn disgyn. Y rheswm pam maent yn codi yw bod iechyd meddwl yn cael ei roi fel y prif reswm dros gael budd-dal analluogrwydd. Mae pobl yn y DWP yn methu deall hynny. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n cael ei gweld fel problem Cymru; mae'n cael

ei gweld fel problem yn Llundain a'r de-ddwyrain.

### Seilwaith Ffyrdd

**C4 Paul Davies:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am seilwaith ffyrdd yn y gorllewin? OAQ(3)0763(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae seilwaith ffyrdd y gorllewin, yn gyffredinol, yn ateb y galw. Fel sy'n wir gydag unrhyw rwydwaith, mae targedau i wella safonau diogelwch, gwella llif y traffig, a helpu i sicrhau na fydd problemau ar y ffyrdd yn effeithio ar eich amser teithio. Mae Trafnidiaeth Cymru yn gwneud gwelliannau tebyg ar sawl rhan o'r rhwydwaith.

**Paul Davies:** Yr wyf yn siŵr bod y Prif Weinidog yn ymwybodol bod gwefan Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cyfaddef mai, ar hyn o bryd, yr A40 yng ngorllewin Cymru yw'r rhan isaf ei safon o'r rhwydwaith ffordd draws-Ewrop yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae'r Prif Weinidog hefyd yn ymwybodol fy mod o blaid troi'r A40 i sir Benfro yn ffordd ddeuol. Hyd yn hyn, mae'r Llywodraeth wedi gwrthod ystyried y pwynt.

Mae Abergwaun, sydd ar ddiwedd yr A40, wedi dioddef problemau'n ddiweddar oherwydd bod lorïau mawr yn methu â mynd drwy ran o'r dref. Er mwyn osgoi hynny, ac o ystyried bod y Llywodraeth yn gwrthod deoli'r ffordd, a fyddai'r Prif Weinidog yn fodlon ystyried ffordd osgoi i'r dref, yn enwedig gogledd y dref?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn adnabod Abergwaun yn dda. Mae'n arbennig o anodd gyrru drwy'r dref oherwydd y ffordd igamogam drwy Abergwaun isaf lan i ben y tyle, lawr yr ochr draw, lan i ben y tyle arall, ac yn y blaen. Fodd bynnag, yn gyffredinol, wrth ddefnyddio'r wialen fesur arferol wrth ystyried y galw am ffordd ddeuol ac absenoldeb ffordd ddeuol, nid yw'r traffig ar yr A40 yn cyrraedd y lefel a fyddai'n cyfiawnhau buddsoddi mewn ffordd ddeuol. Yr ydym yn credu, felly, mai ffyrdd osgoi i Robeston Wathen a Llanddewi Felfre yw'r flaenoriaeth ar hyn o bryd.

**Alun Davies:** First Minister, you have pre-

### Road Infrastructure

**Q4 Paul Davies:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the road infrastructure in west Wales? OAQ(3)0763(FM)

**The First Minister:** The road infrastructure in west Wales is generally able to deal with the demand. As with any network, there are targets to improve safety, traffic flow, and help to ensure that there are no problems on the roads that might affect your journey time. Transport Wales is involved in such improvements on many parts of the network.

**Paul Davies:** I am sure that the First Minister is aware that the Assembly Government's website admits that the A40 in west Wales is currently the part of the UK's trans-European road network that is of the lowest quality. The First Minister is also aware that I am in favour of dualling the A40 to Pembrokeshire. So far, the Government has refused to consider the matter.

Fishguard, where the A40 ends, has suffered problems recently because large lorries are unable to travel through one part of the town. In order to avoid this, and given that the Government's refusal to dual the road, would the First Minister be prepared to consider a bypass for the town, especially the north of the town?

**The First Minister:** I am familiar with Fishguard. Driving through the town is extremely difficult due to the winding road through lower Fishguard to the top of the hill, down the other side, to the top of the next hill, and so forth. However, generally, in terms of the usual measuring stick for considering the demand for a dual carriageway and the absence of a dual carriageway, traffic on the A40 does not reach the level that would justify investing in a dual carriageway. Therefore, we believe that bypasses for Robeston Wathen and Llanddewi Velfrey is the current priority.

**Alun Davies:** Brif Weinidog, yr ydych wedi

empted me with your statement that you will support the by-passes at Robeston Wathen and Llanddewi Velfrey. Will you confirm that as we continue to upgrade the A40—and many of the points that have been made about the importance of the A40 to Pembrokeshire are very real—we will make provision for a dual carriageway for some time in the future, when the business case justifies it?

**The First Minister:** Yes. I am not saying that there will never be sufficient traffic on the A40 to justify a dual carriageway; what we are saying is that, by the present measurement tools and standards, you cannot justify investment in a dual carriageway now. Therefore, any by-passes that are designed are designed so as not to inhibit the provision of a dual carriageway in the future.

#### Information and Communication Technology

**Q5 Sandy Mewies:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the provision of ICT for all age groups in Wales? OAQ(3)0755(FM)

**The First Minister:** I recognise the transformational potential of ICT for the people of Wales. I look forward to becoming proficient in ICT myself at some point in the future. Supporting people like me, and people who are a lot younger than me, in how they learn, work and use their free time is important to us, which is why we have a range of programmes to try to prevent digital exclusion.

**Sandy Mewies:** As you suggest, First Minister, being able to learn or to brush up on your computer and communications skills is not always easy in today's world. I was, therefore, delighted to open the Futures@Holywell outreach training centre at Deeside College in Holywell recently. The place was buzzing with people of all ages, including young mums, older people who had never tried to use a computer before, and younger people learning new skills; it was fantastic, and they could also have a cup of tea there. Perhaps you would like to visit one day, First Minister, and I am sure that they

achub y blaen arnaf gyda'ch datganiad y byddwch yn cefnogi'r ffyrdd osgoi yn Robeston Wathen a Llanddewi Felffre. A wnewch chi gadarnhau y byddwn, wrth inni barhau i uwchraddio'r A40—ac mae llawer o'r pwyntiau sydd wedi cael eu gwneud am bwysigrwydd yr A40 i sir Benfro yn real iawn—yn darparu ar gyfer ffordd ddeuol ryw dro yn y dyfodol, pan fydd yr achos busnes yn cyfiawnhau hynny?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gwnaf. Nid wyf yn dweud na fydd byth ddigon o draffig ar yr A40 i gyfiawnhau ffordd ddeuol; yr hyn yr ydym yn ei ddweud yw na allwch, yn ôl y dulliau mesur a'r safonau presennol, gyfiawnhau buddsoddi mewn ffordd ddeuol ar hyn o bryd. Felly, mae unrhyw ffyrdd osgoi sy'n cael eu dylunio yn cael eu dylunio fel nad ydynt yn llesteirio darparu ffordd ddeuol yn y dyfodol.

#### Technoleg Gwybodaeth a Chyfathrebu

**C5 Sandy Mewies:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ddarpariaeth TGCh i bob grŵp oedran yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)0755(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn cydnabod potensial TGCh i weddnewid bywydau pobl Cymru. Edrychaf ymlaen at feistroli TGCh fy hun ryw dro yn y dyfodol. Mae cynorthwyo pobl fel fi, a phobl sydd lawer yn iau na mi, yn y ffordd y maent yn dysgu, yn gweithio ac yn defnyddio eu hamser rhydd yn bwysig inni, a dyna pam mae gennym ystod o raglenni i geisio atal allgáu digidol.

**Sandy Mewies:** Fel yr ydych yn awgrymu, Brif Weinidog, nid yw gallu dysgu neu wella eich sgiliau cyfrifiadurol a chyfathrebu bob amser yn hawdd yn y byd sydd ohoni heddiw. Yr oeddwn, felly, wrth fy modd yn agor canolfan hyfforddiant allgymorth Dyfodol@Treffynnon, rhan o Goleg Glannau Dyfrdwy, yn Nhreffynnon yn ddiweddar. Yr oedd y lle yn brysur gyda phobl o bob oedran, gan gynnwys mamau ifanc, pobl hŷn nad oedd erioed o'r blaen wedi ceisio defnyddio cyfrifiadurol, a phobl ifanc yn dysgu sgiliau newydd; yr oedd yn wych, ac yr oeddent yn gallu cael cwpanaid o de yno

would be able to move your skills on as well. Would you join me in congratulating Deeside College, the partner organisations, and the college principle, David Jones, who, incidentally, recently won the public sector organisations Leading Wales award, on bringing this great facility to Holywell?

**The First Minister:** I am not surprised that Deeside College has brought an outstanding facility to Holywell, because that is the hallmark of its work; if it is not the best further education college in Wales, it is certainly in the top two or three, which we all recognise. It is outstandingly well led and well organised, and the work that it does through outreach and on the main campus is outstanding. When I am next in Holywell, I will take you up on the invitation to a cup of tea and beginning the beginner's course, which is probably what I need; perhaps we will spend a few hours there.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** The internet is a great source of information and a great access point for many people; 10 years ago, most people would not even have dreamt of where we are with the internet today. However, sadly, it also has other uses, including criminality, and there is also abuse on the internet.

2.40 p.m.

I had the good fortune to engage with the Internet Watch Foundation not so long ago, which promotes specific protocols to try to safeguard internet users, particularly in the public domain. How is the Welsh Assembly Government engaging in safeguarding the use of information technology provision throughout its estate, because I have found that my own local authorities are engaging and developing the programme? We need to be aware of this point across all portfolios to ensure that everyone is protected from all sorts of angles in their use of the internet.

**The First Minister:** That is an important point. I will ask the Permanent Secretary to

hefyd. Efallai yr hoffech ymweld ryw ddiwrnod, Brif Weinidog, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y gallent wella eich sgiliau chithau hefyd. A wnewch chi ymuno â mi i longyfarch Coleg Glannau Dyfrdwy, y cyrff partner, a phrifathro'r coleg, David Jones, a enillodd wobwr Arwain Cymru i gyrff sector cyhoeddus, gyda llaw, yn ddiweddar, ar ddod â'r cyfleuster ardderchog hwn i Dreffynnon?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn synnu bod Coleg Glannau Dyfrdwy wedi dod â chyfleuster arbennig i Dreffynnon, oherwydd dyna sy'n nodweddu ei waith; os nad ef yw'r coleg addysg bellach gorau yng Nghymru, mae'n sicr ymysg y dau neu'r tri gorau, ac yr ydym i gyd yn cydnabod hynny. Mae'n cael ei arwain a'i drefnu'n eithriadol o dda, ac mae'r gwaith a wna drwy allgymorth ac ar y prif gampws yn eithriadol. Y tro nesaf y byddaf yn Nhreffynnon, derbynaf eich gwahoddiad i gwpanaid o de a dechrau ar y cwrs i ddechreuwyd, sef yr hyn y mae ei angen arnaf yn ôl pob tebyg; efallai y treuliwn ychydig oriau yno.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Mae'r rhyngwyd yn ffynhonnell arbennig o wybodaeth ac yn fan mynediad gwych i lawer o bobl; 10 mlynedd yn ôl, ni fyddai'r rhan fwyaf o bobl wedi breuddwydio hyd yn oed am y fan lle'r ydym heddiw gyda'r rhyngwyd. Fodd bynnag, yn anffodus, mae iddi hefyd ddefnyddiau eraill, gan gynnwys troseddu, a cheir cam-drin hefyd ar y rhyngwyd.

Bûm mor ffodus â chael gweithio gyda'r Internet Watch Foundation ychydig yn ôl. Mae'n hyrwyddo protocolau penodol i geisio diogelu'r rhai sy'n defnyddio'r rhyngwyd, yn enwedig yn y maes cyhoeddus. Sut mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn mynd ati i ddiogelu'r defnydd ar ddarpariaeth technoleg gwybodaeth ledled ei hystâd, oherwydd yr wyf wedi canfod bod fy awdurdodau lleol i yn gwneud hynny ac yn datblygu'r rhaglen? Mae angen inni fod yn ymwybodol o'r pwynt hwn ar draws pob portffolio i sicrhau bod pawb yn cael ei warchod o bob math o ongl yn eu defnydd o'r rhyngwyd.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hwnnw'n bwynt pwysig. Gofynnaf i'r Ysgrifennydd Parhaol

write to you to inform you of the secure firewalls that we use to prevent either hacking into our systems, or inappropriate use outwards by a civil servant or anyone else, and of any interference with our work through internet crime, which is important. The security of people's computer systems is a huge business, but it needs to be a huge business because the abuse of the internet has, unfortunately, enormous capacity to intrude on our lives.

**Janet Ryder:** As has been said, the internet offers great opportunities but can also bring great danger. Young people and children in particular do not always know who exactly is at the other end of a conversation that they may be having over the internet. I am sure that you are aware that the children's commissioner's report, on which we will have a statement later today, calls on the Government to instigate lessons and provide advice and support for young people in schools, to ensure that they are properly educated and are intelligent about how to use the internet, how to get the best out of it, and how to be safe while doing so. What plans does your Government have to bring that forward?

**The First Minister:** I know that I am an old fuddy-duddy, but I always find this question of the chatroom to be one of the most difficult phenomena to empathise with, with young people believing that it is a form of social intercourse like going to a youth club, as it would have been in my day. I know that that is just me showing my age and a refusal to accept modern technology. I consider this practice to be not only terribly sad, but highly dangerous if it is not well regulated to ensure that the chatroom is not being exploited by someone who is trying to groom a vulnerable person for nefarious purposes. It is terribly sad that that can happen. That does not mean that you can ban chatrooms, because clearly you cannot, but they must be regulated in some way in order to prevent a nefarious adult from exploiting gullible youngsters at sensitive periods of their development, as teenagers' self-esteem can go up and down like a yo-yo. Unfortunately, people can exploit that fact, using the latest technology for the saddest and most dreadful of

ysgrifennu atoch i'ch hysbysu am y muriau gwarchod diogel yr ydym yn eu defnyddio i rwystro un ai hacio i mewn i'n systemau, neu ddefnydd amhriodol tuag allan gan was sifil neu unrhyw un arall, ac unrhyw ymyrryd â'n gwaith ar ffurf troseddu dros y rhyngwrwd, sy'n bwysig. Mae diogeledd systemau cyfrifiadurol pobl yn fusnes enfawr, ond mae angen iddo fod yn fusnes enfawr oherwydd, yn anffodus, mae gan gamddefnyddio'r rhyngwrwd gapasiti enfawr i darfu ar ein bywydau.

**Janet Ryder:** Fel y dywedwyd, mae'r rhyngwrwd yn cynnig cyfleoedd gwych ond gall hefyd ddod â pherygl mawr. Nid yw pobl ifanc a phlant yn arbennig bob amser yn gwybod pwy'n union sydd ar ben arall sgwrs y maent yn ei chael dros y rhyngwrwd. Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol fod adroddiad y comisiynydd plant, y cawn ddatganiad arno yn ddiweddarach heddiw, yn galw ar i'r Llywodraeth sefydlu gwersi a darparu cyngor a chymorth i bobl ifanc mewn ysgolion, i sicrhau eu bod yn cael eu haddysgu'n iawn a'u bod yn ddeallus o ran sut i ddefnyddio'r rhyngwrwd, sut i gael y gorau ohoni, a sut i fod yn saff tra maent yn gwneud hynny. Pa gynlluniau sydd gan eich Llywodraeth i gyflwyno hynny?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gwn fy mod ar ei hôl hi, ond yr wyf wastad yn teimlo bod y cwestiwn hwn ynglŷn ag ystafelloedd sgwrsio yn un o'r ffenomenau anoddaf i gydymdeimlo ag ef, gyda phobl ifanc yn credu ei fod yn fath o gyfathrach gymdeithasol fel mynd i glwb ieuenctid, fel y byddai'n digwydd yn fy nghyfnod i. Gwn fy mod yn dangos fy oed ac yn gwrthod derbyn technoleg fodern. Yr wyf yn ystyried yr arfer hwn nid yn unig yn ofnadwy o drist, ond yn hynod o beryglus oni bai ei fod yn cael ei reoleiddio'n dda i sicrhau nad yw'r ystafell sgwrsio'n cael ei chamddefnyddio gan rywun sy'n ceisio paratoi person sy'n agored i niwed at bwrpasau ysgeler. Mae'n ofnadwy o drist fod hynny'n gallu digwydd. Nid yw hynny'n golygu y gallwch wahardd ystafelloedd sgwrsio, oherwydd yn amlwg ni allwch, ond rhaid iddynt gael eu rheoleiddio mewn rhyw ffordd er mwyn atal oedolion ysgeler rhag camfanteisio ar bobl ifanc hygoelus ar adegau sensitif yn eu datblygiad, gan fod hunan-barch pobl ifanc yn eu harddegau yn gallu



purposes.

**Mick Bates:** One element of information and communication technology is internet access, and we are all aware of the benefits that it offers, including, for example, access to public services and community information, or simply helping people to keep in touch with one another.

A recent report by the Welsh Consumer Council said that a quarter of people over 65 years of age do not have a home internet connection. Regardless of whether you are six or 65, you cannot access these services unless you have a good internet connection and, as you know, this is a huge problem in my constituency. What are you doing to improve internet access across Wales, so that people of all ages are not left behind in what is a technological revolution?

**The First Minister:** I am not sure whether you mean that 25 per cent of people over the age of 65 cannot get internet access, even though they have asked for it, or whether that figure combines those who do not want it and those who do want it but who cannot get it. Perhaps you could clarify that by sending me a note on that point, to enable me to give a fuller reply.

I have met you and other Assembly Members to discuss particular concerns about mid Wales, therefore I am aware of the prevalence of not spots, and of the ongoing argument with BT about whether it is doing everything that it should under the regional innovative broadband support project to cover the not spots through a mixture of technologies—some Wi-Fi, some satellite cover, some special provision of wires, and so forth. The wires will not do it everywhere, and I think that we all accept that because of the sparsity of population in central Wales. However, we have to try to cover that gap because we want to encourage more people to use the internet to set up businesses and to prevent businesses from fading away, which can happen if those businesses cannot go

mynd i fyny ac i lawr fel io-io. Yn anfodds, gall pobl fanteisio ar y ffaith honno, gan ddefnyddio'r dechnoleg ddiweddaraf i'r pwrpasau tristaf a mwyaf ofnadwy.

**Mick Bates:** Un elfen o dechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu yw mynediad rhynggrwyd, ac yr ydym i gyd yn ymwybodol o'r manteision y mae'n eu cynnig, gan gynnwys, er enghraifft, mynediad at wasanaethau cyhoeddus a gwybodaeth gymunedol, neu helpu pobl i gadw mewn cysylltiad â'i gilydd.

Dywedodd adroddiad diweddar gan Gyngor Defnyddwyr Cymru nad oes gan chwarter y bobl dros 65 oed gysylltiad rhynggrwyd gartref. Pa un a ydych yn chwech ynteu'n 65, ni allwch gyrchu at y gwasanaethau hyn oni bai fod gennych gysylltiad rhynggrwyd da ac, fel y gwyddoch, mae hyn yn broblem enfawr yn fy etholaeth i. Beth ydych chi'n ei wneud i wella mynediad rhynggrwyd ar draws Cymru, fel nad yw pobl o bob oedran yn cael eu gadael ar ôl yn yr hyn sydd yn chwyldro technolegol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn siŵr a ydych yn golygu bod 25 y cant o bobl dros 65 oed yn methu cael mynediad rhynggrwyd, er eu bod wedi gofyn amdano, ynteu a yw'r ffigur hwnnw'n cyfuno'r rhai nad ydynt am gael mynediad a'r rhai sydd am ei gael ond sy'n methu ei gael. Efallai y gallech egluro hynny drwy anfon nodyn ataf ar y pwynt hwnnw, i'm galluogi i roi ateb llawnach.

Yr wyf wedi cwrdd â chi ac Aelodau Cynulliad eraill i drafod pryderon arbennig ynglŷn â'r canolbarth, felly yr wyf yn gwybod mor gyffredin yw'r ardaloedd digyswllt, ac yn ymwybodol o'r ddadl barhaus gyda BT pa un a yw'n gwneud popeth a ddylai o dan y prosiect cymorth band eang arloesol rhanbarth i gynnig darpariaeth mewn ardaloedd digyswllt drwy gymysgedd o dechnolegau—rhywfaint o ddi-wifr, darpariaeth lloeren mewn mannau, darpariaeth gwifrau arbennig weithiau, ac yn y blaen. Ni fydd gwifrau'n tycio ym mhobman, a chredaf ein bod i gyd yn derbyn hynny gan fod poblogaeth y canolbarth mor denau. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni geisio rhychwantu'r bwlch hwnnw oherwydd yr ydym am annog rhagor o bobl i ddefnyddio'r

online, as they cannot either send orders or get on tender lists. So many companies now, such as Ford and Siemens, require you to be online if you want to order from them; otherwise, you cannot even start the process. You just cannot get on the tender list. It would be sad if there were areas of Wales in which large numbers of businesses simply faded away for that reason.

**Janice Gregory:** Will the First Minister join me in congratulating pupils of Ynysawdre Comprehensive School on winning the UK Formula One in Schools Technology Challenge competition—snappily titled, I know—which required them to demonstrate a range of cutting-edge ICT skills? Will he also join me in wishing them success at next month's international competition in Malaysia, where they will represent Wales for the second year running? In the 2009 international competition, they will be representing the UK. Pupils from Ynysawdre school are here today to demonstrate their project, as are pupils from Blaencaerau Junior School, which is one of only three primary schools in Wales to take part in the primary project. I invite you, First Minister, and all Members who have not already done so, to visit the stand in the Neuadd before 3.30 p.m..

**The First Minister:** Or even to join them in Malaysia perhaps, to give them a bit of support. I always celebrate Welsh success, and I did so last night with Technium OpTIC, based in St Asaph. I will join you in congratulating Ynysawdre Comprehensive School on winning the UK Formula One in Schools Technology Challenge. I am sure that the school will do as well in Malaysia as Wales did against Italy at the rugby on Saturday.

### Drug and Alcohol Rehabilitation

**Q6 Peter Black:** What discussions has the First Minister had with the Home Office, local authorities and the voluntary sector in order to increase the number of drug and alcohol rehabilitation services?  
OAQ(3)0760(FM)

rhyngwyd i sefydlu busnesau ac i atal busnesau rhag diflannu, sy'n gallu digwydd os nad yw'r busnesau hynny'n gallu mynd ar-lein, gan nad ydynt yn gallu anfon archebion na mynd ar restrau tendro. Mae cynifer o gwmnïau erbyn hyn, megis Ford a Siemens, yn mynnu eich bod ar-lein er mwyn archebu ganddynt; fel arall, ni chewch hyd yn oed ddechrau'r broses. Nid oes modd ichi gael lle ar y rhestr tendro. Byddai'n drist petai ardaloedd o Gymru lle byddai nifer fawr o fusnesau'n diflannu oherwydd hynny.

**Janice Gregory:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ymuno â mi i longyfarch disgyblion Ysgol Gyfun Ynysawdre ar ennill cystadleuaeth Her Technoleg Fformiwla Un Ysgolion y DU—teitl bachog, mi wn—lle'r oedd gofyn iddynt ddangos ystod o sgiliau TGCh o'r radd flaenaf? A wnaiff hefyd ymuno â mi i ddymuno llwyddiant iddynt yn y gystadleuaeth ryngwladol fis nesaf ym Maleisia, lle byddant yn cynrychioli Cymru am yr ail flwyddyn o'r bron? Yng nghystadleuaeth ryngwladol 2009, byddant yn cynrychioli'r DU. Mae disgyblion o ysgol Ynysawdre yma heddiw i ddangos eu prosiect, ac mae disgyblion o Ysgol Iau Blaencaerau yma hefyd, sef un o'r tair ysgol gynradd yn unig yng Nghymru i gystadlu yn y prosiect cynradd. Fe'ch gwahoddaf, Brif Weinidog, a'r holl Aelodau nad ydynt eisoes wedi gwneud hynny, i ymweld â'r stonddin yn y Neuadd cyn 3.30 p.m.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Neu hyd yn oed i ymuno â hwy ym Maleisia efallai, i roi ychydig o gefnogaeth iddynt. Byddaf bob amser yn dathlu llwyddiant Cymru, a gwneuthum hynny neithiwr gyda Technium OpTIC, sydd a'i ganolfan yn Llanelwy. Ymunaf â chi i longyfarch Ysgol Gyfun Ynysawdre ar ennill Her Technoleg Fformiwla Un Ysgolion y DU. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnaiff yr ysgol gystal ym Maleisia ag y gwnaeth Cymru yn erbyn yr Eidal yn y rygbi ddydd Sadwrn.

### Adsefydlu oherwydd Cyffuriau ac Alcohol

**C6 Peter Black:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cynnal â'r Swyddfa Gartref, awdurdodau lleol a'r sector gwirfoddol er mwyn cynyddu nifer y gwasanaethau adsefydlu cyffuriau ac alcohol?  
OAQ(3)0760(FM)

**The First Minister:** None, because it is a devolved service. As a result of the substantial investment that we have made, 1,480 additional treatment places have been created in South Wales West alone since 2003-04, and more than 10,000, across Wales as a whole.

**Peter Black:** I should have included a health aspect to that question. Tier 4 services provide residential beds to help people to get off drugs and alcohol. There is a huge problem in certain parts of Wales, where the number of such beds is very small, particularly in Swansea and Neath Port Talbot, where there are just three or four to cover the area, I think. What plans does your Government have to increase the number of beds available for tier 4 services?

**The First Minister:** You are quite right that it has become clear that not enough of the significant increase in funding that we have put in place has found its way to funding in-patient detox and residential rehabilitation places. That is why we have commissioned a review of tier 4 services, to cover that gap. The clear message in the report is that tier 4 services are patchy, and need to be managed more effectively to ensure a seamless transition to detox services in every part of Wales. It is important to remember that not everybody needs in-patient detox, and therefore it should be provided across Wales, and not on the patchy basis that it is at present.

**Leanne Wood:** I would be grateful to know what discussions the One Wales Government has had regarding the implementation of an all-Wales alcohol reduction strategy. I would also like to know what progress has been made to integrate that with harm-reduction models, particularly by considering the adoption of the pilot programmes currently under way under the Home Office in parts of England.

**The First Minister:** Alcohol is clearly a priority in the new substance misuse strategy,

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dim, oherwydd mae'r gwasanaeth hwn wedi'i ddatganoli. Yn sgil ein buddsoddiad sylweddol, crëwyd 1,480 o leoedd triniaeth ychwanegol yng Ngorllewin De Cymru'n unig er 2003-04, a dros 10,000, yng Nghymru drwyddi draw.

**Peter Black:** Dylwn fod wedi cynnwys agwedd iechyd ar y cwestiwn hwnnw. Mae gwasanaethau Haen 4 yn darparu gwelyau preswyl i helpu pobl i roi'r gorau i gyffuriau ac alcohol. Mae problem anferth mewn rhannau penodol o Gymru, lle mae gwelyau o'r fath yn brin iawn, yn enwedig yn Abertawe ac yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot, lle na cheir ond rhyw dri neu bedwar i wasanaethu'r ardal, hyd y gwn i. Pa gynlluniau sydd gan eich Llywodraeth i gynyddu nifer y gwelyau sydd ar gael ar gyfer gwasanaethau haen 4?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle ei bod wedi dod yn amlwg nad oes digon o'r arian ychwanegol sylweddol a ddarparwyd gennym wedi cael ei ddefnyddio i dalu am leoedd dadwenwyno i gleifion mewnol a lleoedd adsefydlu preswyl. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi comisiynu adolygiad o wasanaethau haen 4, er mwyn llenwi'r bwlch hwnnw. Y neges glir yn yr adroddiad yw bod angen eu rheoli'n fwy effeithiol er mwyn sicrhau pont ddi-fwlch at wasanaethau dadwenwyno ym mhob rhan o Gymru. Mae'n bwysig cofio nad oes angen gwasanaeth dadwenwyno i gleifion mewnol ar bawb, ac felly, dylid ei ddarparu ledled Cymru, ac nid yma ac acw fel y mae ar hyn o bryd.

**Leanne Wood:** Byddwn yn ddiolchgar o gael gwybod pa drafodaethau y mae Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un wedi'u cynnal ynglŷn â rhoi strategaeth lleihau alcohol ar waith drwy Gymru gyfan. Hoffwn wybod hefyd pa gynnydd sydd wedi'i wneud o ran integreiddio hynny â modelau lliniaru niwed, yn enwedig drwy ystyried mabwysiadu'r rhaglenni peilot sydd ar waith ar hyn o bryd gan y Swyddfa Gartref mewn rhannau o Loegr.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae alcohol yn amlwg yn flaenoriaeth yn y strategaeth camddefnyddio

which will be underpinned by an alcohol action plan and a framework for tackling alcohol-related crime and disorder, through better management of the evening and night-time economy. We are funding four pilot projects to develop best practice in managing the evening and night-time economy, including one currently running in Bridgend.

**Darren Millar:** Would you agree that the limited Welsh Assembly Government resources that are available for addressing substance misuse must be focused to achieve maximum value for the taxpayer? Would you also agree that the decision of the previous Assembly Government, which you led, to back an unpopular needle-vending machine project in Colwyn Bay in my constituency, and to waste money by funding the purchase of that machine before the planning application for it had been submitted, was wholly wrong?

**The First Minister:** Sometimes, there are sensible questions—and we have had a lot of sensible ones today—but then the session can begin to fall apart, which is what you have started, Darren. I cannot comment, and you know that I cannot comment, because a planning appeal is pending. We must leave that matter, and perhaps you could read the Record tomorrow. The procedure for assessing bids for capital funding has always involved asking whether planning permission is required, but, in this case, there was a misunderstanding by the community safety partnership. That is one of those things that happens, and, if the partnership gets it wrong, that will all come out in time. However, a planning appeal is pending, so I cannot comment on that.

2.50 p.m.

#### Communities@One

**Q7 Trish Law:** Will the First Minister provide an update on the work being done by the Welsh Assembly Government's Communities@One initiative?  
OAQ(3)0748(FM)

**The First Minister:** Communities@One

sylweddau newydd ac yn sail i honno, bydd cynllun gweithredu ar alcohol a fframwaith ar gyfer mynd i'r afael â throseddau ac anhrefn sy'n gysylltiedig ag alcohol, drwy reoli economi'r hwyr a'r nos yn well. Yr ydym yn ariannu pedwar prosiect peilot i feithrin arferion da wrth reoli economi'r hwyr a'r nos, gan gynnwys un sydd ar waith ar hyn o bryd ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr.

**Darren Millar:** A fyddech yn cytuno ei bod yn rhaid canolbwyntio'r adnoddau sydd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer mynd i'r afael â chamddefnyddio sylweddau er mwyn sicrhau'r gwerth gorau i'r trethdalwr? A fyddech yn cytuno hefyd bod penderfyniad Llywodraeth flaenorol y Cynulliad, llywodraeth yr oeddech chi'n ei harwain, i gefnogi prosiect amhoblogaidd i ddarparu peiriant nodwyddau ym Mae Colwyn yn fy etholaeth, ac i wastraffu arian drwy dalu am brynu'r peiriant cyn cyflwyno cais cynllunio ar ei gyfer, yn benderfyniad cwbl anghywir?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Weithiau, bydd pobl yn gofyn cwestiynau call—ac yr ydym wedi cael sawl un call heddiw—ond yna, gall y sesiwn ddechrau dadfeilio, a dyna'r broses yr ydych chi wedi rhoi cychwyn arni, Darren. Ni allaf sôn am hyn, a gwyddoch na allaf, oherwydd bod apêl cynllunio ar y gweill. Rhaid inni adael y mater, ac efallai y gallech ddarllen y Cofnod yfory. Wrth asesu ceisiadau am arian cyfalaf, mae gofyn a oes angen caniatâd cynllunio wedi bod yn rhan o'r weithdrefn erioed, ond yn yr achos hwn, bu camddealltwriaeth ar ran y bartneriaeth diogelwch cymunedol. Mae'n un o'r pethau hynny sy'n digwydd, ac, os bydd y bartneriaeth yn gwneud camgymeriad, daw'r cyfan i'r fei ymhen hir a hwyr. Fodd bynnag, mae apêl cynllunio ar y gweill, felly ni allaf sôn am hynny.

#### Cymunedau@Ei Gilydd

**C7 Trish Law:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddarparu'r newyddion diweddaraf am y gwaith a wneir gan gynllun Cymunedau@Ei Gilydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad?  
OAQ(3)0748(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae Cymunedau@Ei

continues to make excellent progress. The initiative, which operates in Communities First areas across Wales, has now awarded £6.6 million to 212 projects. These projects have all contributed to tackling the digital exclusion among the less well-off in Wales.

**Trish Law:** I congratulate the Welsh Assembly Government on the initiative, which has enabled almost 20 social and community groups in Blaenau Gwent to benefit, mainly from one-off grants to provide computer equipment. However, a small number of organisations, like the Gwent Association for the Blind, has been providing valuable IT training to visually impaired people based on a programme that will not be completed by the end of the current financial year, when this initiative ceases. Will the First Minister agree to look at any incomplete training programmes with a view to accommodating them under another budget head?

**The First Minister:** There are two budget heads, as I understand it: Communities First and Objective 1. Some of these projects are covered by those two possible funding streams. However, the Wales Co-operative Centre is working on developing proposals for a successor project to Communities@One, but there is currently a problem with match funding that we are trying to cover through discussion with the Wales Co-operative Centre. Therefore, there is match funding, Communities First funding, and funding through the structural funds. We are trying to ensure that a successor project is in place when the current round finishes in June 2008.

**Chris Franks:** You may recall that Plaid Cymru supported your last budget in the second Assembly and, as a result, Communities@One funding was protected for community radio stations in Rhondda Cynon Taf. Do you agree that the community stations that benefited from funding, such as Dapper FM, Radio Cymru and Rhys Radio, and the many volunteers who help to run them do an excellent job and provide an excellent service to the community? Do you further agree that the establishment of an additional fund for such community radio

Gilydd yn dal i wneud cynnydd ardderchog. Mae'r cynllun, sydd ar waith yn ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ledled Cymru, erbyn hyn wedi dyfarnu £6.6 miliwn i 212 o brosiectau. Mae'r prosiectau hyn i gyd wedi cyfrannu at fynd i'r afael ag allgáu digidol ymhlith pobl lai cefnog yng Nghymru.

**Trish Law:** Llongyfarchaf Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar y cynllun, sydd wedi galluogi bron i 20 o grwpiau cymdeithasol a chymunedol ym Mlaenau Gwent i elwa arno, a hynny'n bennaf yn sgil grantiau untro i ddarparu offer cyfrifiadurol. Fodd bynnag, mae nifer fach o fudiadau, megis Cymdeithas y Deillion yng Ngwent, wedi bod yn darparu hyfforddiant TG gwerthfawr i bobl â nam ar eu golwg drwy gyfrwng rhaglen na chaiff ei gwblhau cyn diwedd y flwyddyn ariannol hon, pan ddaw'r cynllun hwn i ben. A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog gytuno i edrych ar unrhyw raglenni hyfforddi anghyflawn gyda golwg ar eu cynnwys dan bennawd arall yn y gyllideb?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Fel y caf ar ddeall, ceir dau bennawd yn y gyllideb: Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ac Amcan 1. Mae rhai o'r prosiectau hyn yn cael eu hariannu gan y ddwy ffrwd ariannu bosibl hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae Canolfan Cydweithredol Cymru'n gweithio i ddatblygu cynigion ar gyfer prosiect i olygu Cymunedau@Ei Gilydd, ond ar hyn o bryd, mae arian cyfatebol yn broblem. Yr ydym yn ceisio datrys hyn drwy drafod gyda Chanolfan Cydweithredol Cymru. Felly, ceir arian cyfatebol, arian Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ac arian drwy gyfrwng y cronfeydd strwythurol. Yr ydym yn ceisio sicrhau y bydd prosiect olynau ar waith pan ddaw'r rownd bresennol i ben ym mis Mehefin 2008.

**Chris Franks:** Efallai y cofiwch i Blaid Cymru gefnogi'ch cyllideb ddiwethaf yn yr ail Gynulliad, ac, yn sgil hynny, gwarchodwyd arian Cymunedau@Ei Gilydd ar gyfer gorsafoedd radio cymunedol yn Rhondda Cynon Taf. A gytunwch fod y gorsafoedd cymunedol a elwodd yn sgil yr ariannu hwnnw, megis Dapper FM, Radio Cymru a Radio Rhys, a'r llu o wirfoddolwyr sy'n helpu i'w cynnal yn gwneud gwaith rhagorol ac yn darparu gwasanaeth rhagorol ar gyfer y gymuned? A gytunwch hefyd fod sefydlu cronfa ychwanegol ar gyfer radio

was an important change to last year's draft budget?

**The First Minister:** Yes, community radio provides a community—frequently serving less well-off people—with the opportunity to express itself in a way that would never happen if it were left to market-based solutions. I have visited many community radio stations and find them inspiring, because the volunteers get such an enormous kick out of being part of a radio station, whether they are the broadcasters, the technicians, or whatever. The volunteers are of a very high calibre, and are highly motivated people. Some of them often go on to get jobs, but not always, and some are retired people who do not want jobs. However, they all have the opportunity to express themselves through community radio, and I am pleased that we continue to fund some good community radio schemes.

**Mark Isherwood:** Last night, I attended a meeting in Cardiff with the National Black Women's Network, which was chaired by the shadow Secretary of State for Wales. We learned about problems with accessing internet technology for black and minority ethnic women in certain communities, and the impact of that on their chances to enter the world of work. What consideration is your Government giving to that, and how will it be addressed as you amend the programme in the future?

**The First Minister:** It would depend on where they were, because they would not be entitled to as much structural funding if they were not in the tier 1 area, namely west Wales and the Valleys, although the competitiveness programme might enable them to access funding. However, they might come under Communities First, because many projects would probably cover areas of high ethnic minority population in areas like Newport, Barry and Cardiff, which are not in the Objective 1 area. I will look into the specific details and write to you, or get the appropriate Minister to do so.

cymunedol o'r fath yn newid pwysig yng nghyllideb ddrafft y llynedd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ydwyf. Mae radio cymunedol, sy'n aml yn gwasanaethu pobl lai cefnog, yn rhoi cyfle i gymuned ei mynegi ei hun mewn ffordd na fyddai byth yn digwydd pe gadewid pethau i'r farchnad. Yr wyf wedi ymweld â llawer o orsafoedd radio cymunedol a'u cael yn ysbrydoliaeth, oherwydd bod y gwirfoddolwyr yn cael cymaint o hwb o fod yn rhan o orsaf radio, boed hynny fel darlledwyr, fel technegwyr neu beth bynnag. Mae'r gwirfoddolwyr hyn o safon uchel iawn, ac yn bobl sy'n llawn cymhelliant. Bydd rhai ohonynt yn aml yn mynd yn eu blaen i gael swyddi, ond nid bob tro, ac mae rhai ohonynt yn bobl sydd wedi ymddeol nad oes eisiau swydd arnynt. Fodd bynnag, caiff pob un ohonynt y cyfle i'w mynegi eu hunain drwy gyfrwng radio cymunedol, ac yr wyf yn falch ein bod yn dal i ariannu nifer o gynlluniau radio cymunedol da.

**Mark Isherwood:** Neithiwr, euthum i gyfarfod yng Nghaerdydd gyda Rhwydwaith Menywod Du Cymru, dan gadeiryddiaeth Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yr Wrthblaid dros Gymru. Cawsom ddysgu am broblemau menywod du a menywod lleiafrifoedd ethnig mewn cymunedau penodol o ran cael gafael ar dechnoleg y rhynggrwyd, ac effaith hynny ar eu cyfle i ymuno â byd gwaith. Sut y mae'ch Llywodraeth yn rhoi sylw i hyn, a sut yr ewch i'r afael â'r mater wrth ichi ddiwygio'r rhaglen yn y dyfodol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Byddai'n dibynnu ym mhle yr oeddent, oherwydd ni fyddai ganddynt yr hawl i gymaint o arian strwythurol pe na baent yn ardal haen 1, sef gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd, er y gallent o bosibl gael gafael ar arian drwy'r rhaglen cystadleurwydd. Fodd bynnag, efallai y byddent yn dod o dan raglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, oherwydd mae'n debyg y byddai llawer o brosiectau'n ymwneud ag ardaloedd lle mae'r boblogaeth lleiafrifoedd ethnig yn fawr mewn ardaloedd megis Casnewydd, y Barri a Chaerdydd, nad ydynt yn ardal Amcan 1. Edrychaf ar y manylion penodol ac ysgrifennu atoch, neu ofyn i'r Gweinidog priodol wneud hynny.

**Access to NHS Services**

**Q8 Angela Burns:** Will the First Minister make a statement on what will be done to improve access to NHS services in Wales over the next 12 months? OAQ(3)0743(FM)

**The First Minister:** Improving access to NHS services in rural areas in particular will be a key consideration for the group set up to prepare our rural health plan. I am sure that we are all delighted that Lord Elystan-Morgan of Aberteifi has agreed to chair the group, assisted by Jane Jeffs, the former chief executive of various community health councils in Wales and Marc Clement, the vice chancellor of the University of Wales.

**Angela Burns:** I have grave concerns that many young people are unclear about their rights to access NHS services under their own steam, and that is borne out from my role as chair of the Carmarthenshire Junior Community Health Council. Do you agree that rectifying this position is key to the individuals' wellbeing, and that it would allow peer group mentoring, which will help vulnerable adults? As Carmarthenshire Junior Community Health Council is the only junior community health council of its type in Wales, will you come to one of our meetings to hear for yourself their concerns about the lack of availability of NHS services for them?

**The First Minister:** Indeed. I am sorry to hear that some young people do not know the limits of their rights. Perhaps it is natural that there would be an element of doubt on their part as to what is and is not covered by the NHS. I commend the work of the junior community health council on promoting the availability of NHS services, and the right of young people who may harbour those doubts to access NHS services. If it can be fitted in my diary, I will certainly try to attend a meeting.

**Joyce Watson:** The current Labour-led Assembly Government recognises the need for a dramatic overhaul of unscheduled care in Wales, and has therefore implemented a

**Mynediad at Wasanaethau'r GIG**

**C8 Angela Burns:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am yr hyn a gaiff ei wneud i wella mynediad at wasanaethau'r GIG yng Nghymru dros y 12 mis nesaf? OAQ(3)0743(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Bydd gwella'r mynediad at wasanaethau'r GIG mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn benodol yn ystyriaeth allweddol i'r grŵp a sefydlwyd i baratoi ein cynllun iechyd gwledig. Yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod i gyd wrth ein bodd bod yr Arglwydd Elystan Morgan o Aberteifi wedi cytuno i gadeirio'r grŵp, gyda chymorth Jane Jeffs, cyn brif weithredwr sawl cyngor iechyd cymuned yng Nghymru a Marc Clement, dirprwy ganghellor Prifysgol Cymru.

**Angela Burns:** Yr wyf yn bryderus iawn bod llawer o bobl ifanc yn ansicr ynglŷn â'r hawliau sydd ganddynt fel unigolion i fanteisio ar wasanaethau'r GIG, a daeth hynny'n amlwg imi yn rhinwedd fy swyddogaeth fel cadeirydd Cyngor Iechyd Cymuned Iau Sir Gaerfyrddin. A gytunwch fod unioni'r sefyllfa hon yn allweddol er lles unigolion, ac y byddai'n caniatáu ar gyfer mentora gan gyfoedion, a fydd yn gymorth i oedolion agored i niwed? Gan mai Cyngor Iechyd Cymuned Iau Sir Gaerfyrddin yw'r unig gyngor iechyd cymuned iau o'i fath yng Nghymru, a wnewch ddod i un o'n cyfarfodydd i glywed drosoch eich hun yr hyn sy'n eu poeni o ran y diffyg gwasanaethau GIG sydd ar gael iddynt?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Wrth gwrs. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf glywed nad yw rhai pobl ifanc yn gwybod hyd a lled eu hawliau. Efallai ei bod yn naturiol iddynt fod yn ansicr braidd ynglŷn â'r hyn y mae'r GIG yn ei ddarparu a'r hyn nad ydyw. Cymeradwyaf waith y cyngor iechyd cymuned iau o ran hyrwyddo'r gwasanaethau sydd ar gael dan y GIG, a hawliau'r bobl ifanc sydd o bosibl yn ansicr fel hyn, i gael gafael ar wasanaethau'r GIG. Yn sicr, os oes modd trefnu dyddiad, ceisiaf ddod i gyfarfod.

**Joyce Watson:** Mae Llywodraeth bresennol y Cynulliad a arweinir gan Lafur yn cydnabod bod angen ailwampio'n ddramatig y system gofal heb ei drefnu yng Nghymru ac

scheme to tackle some of the massive variations in the quality of care available. The Pembrokeshire and Derwen NHS Trust was chosen to be the first trust in Wales to deliver the new emergency and urgent care plans, and hospitals in the region are being renovated and equipped with technology, such as the MRI scanner in Withybush Hospital that was opened this year. Diagnosis is the first tool that any doctor possesses to help with treatment, and such a scanner will help to diagnose an extra 2,000 patients per year. The emergency care provision in Withybush Hospital is part of the £39 million-worth improvement drive for local services, and treatment levels have quadrupled thanks to that investment. Therefore, do you agree that removing artificial barriers to patient care is particularly relevant to the provision of emergency and unscheduled care?

**The First Minister:** The key aim of the delivering emergency care strategy is to rebalance the unscheduled care system so that people can access care at the level appropriate to their need, whether it be NHS Direct, attendance at an accident and emergency department, ringing 999, or going to their GP out of hours. People are confused as to which part of the unscheduled care system they should access. Therefore, getting that strategy right is extremely important for us. DECS was launched two weeks ago by Edwina Hart, and we expect its implementation to start in the financial year beginning 1 April.

**Jenny Randerson:** First Minister, last week's Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust statistics showed that it is failing once again to meet its targets, with problems seen in south-east Wales especially. The ambulance service blamed the delays on accident and emergency departments being full to capacity. When they are full, the subsequent delays have a knock-on effect along the M4 corridor, because ambulances work across trust boundaries. Setting up urgent care centres is a part of the delivering emergency care strategy, and the Minister for

felly, mae wedi rhoi cynllun ar waith i fynd i'r afael â rhai o'r amrywiadau aruthrol yn ansawdd y gofal sydd ar gael. Dewiswyd Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Sir Benfro a Derwen fel yr ymddiriedolaeth gyntaf i roi'r cynlluniau newydd ar waith ar gyfer gofal argyfwng a brys ac mae ysbytai'r rhanbarth wrthi'n cael eu hadnewyddu gan ddarparu technoleg ar eu cyfer megis y sganiwr MRI yn Ysbyty Llwynhelyg a agorwyd eleni. Diagnosis yw'r cyfrwng cyntaf sydd ar gael i unrhyw feddyg i helpu gyda thriniaeth, a bydd sganiwr o'r fath yn gymorth i roi diagnosis i 2,000 o gleifion ychwanegol bob blwyddyn. Mae'r ddarpariaeth gofal brys yn Ysbyty Llwynhelyg yn rhan o'r ymgyrch gwella sy'n werth £39 miliwn ar gyfer gwasanaethau lleol, ac mae dros bedair gwaith y cleifion yn cael triniaeth, diolch i'r buddsoddiad hwnnw. Felly, a gytunwch fod dileu rhwystrau artiffisial rhag gofalu am gleifion yn arbennig o berthnasol o ran darparu gofal argyfwng a gofal heb ei drefnu?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Prif nod y strategaeth darparu gofal brys yw adfer cydbwysedd y system gofal heb ei drefnu er mwyn i bobl gael gafael ar ofal ar y lefel sy'n briodol i'w hangen, boed hynny drwy wasanaeth Galw Iechyd Cymru, mynd i adran damweiniau ac achosion brys, ffonio 999, neu fynd at eu meddyg teulu y tu allan i oriau arferol. Mae pobl wedi'u drysu ynglŷn â pha ran o'r system gofal heb ei drefnu y dylent ei defnyddio. Felly, mae sicrhau bod y strategaeth yn iawn yn eithriadol o bwysig inni. Lanswyd CGGB bythefnos yn ôl gan Edwina Hart, a disgwyliwn weld dechrau ei rhoi ar waith yn y flwyddyn ariannol sy'n dechrau 1 Ebrill.

**Jenny Randerson:** Brif Weinidog, yr wythnos diwethaf, yr oedd ystadegau Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwllans Cymru yn dangos ei bod yn methu â chyrraedd ei thargedau unwaith eto, a bod problemau i'w gweld yn y de ddwyrain yn arbennig. Taflodd y gwasanaeth ambiwlans y bai ar adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys am eu bod dan eu sang. Pan fydd yr adrannau hynny'n llawn, caiff yr oedi dilynol sgil-effaith ar hyd coridor yr M4 oherwydd bod ambiwlansys yn gweithio ar draws ffiniau ymddiriedolaethau. Mae



Health and Social Services has said that such centres have the potential to take the pressure off accident and emergency departments. However, I am told that the Minister is currently not considering setting up any pilot projects along the M4 corridor. Do you agree that there is potential here to deal with ambulance response times, as well as with the pressure on accident and emergency departments via the provision of an urgent care centre somewhere along the M4 corridor—in Cardiff, I hope? Will you have a quiet word with the Minister for health and put the case for Cardiff or the M4 corridor placement in general?

**The First Minister:** I am not sure whether your starting premise is correct. There was deterioration in the performance of the ambulance service last month, and it was extremely worrying, but that was after a period of improvement, so the situation is the reserve of what you were implying. It is certainly disappointing to see that happening, but the service now has new targets to meet from April, and accident and emergency departments will need to help the service to meet those targets. No-one should be kept for longer than 15 minutes in an ambulance on the forecourt of an accident and emergency department, but we know that many people have had to wait much longer than that, because of problems in accident and emergency departments.

3.00 p.m.

Whatever the reason for those problems, it must stop, and enable ambulances to be used for the function for which they are designed, namely fetching and carrying, not to act as temporary outstations of overflowing accident and emergency departments. That must stop. There must be a much better organisation and flow of patients from ambulances into accident and emergency departments, and from there into wards, and from the wards back out into the community. That is all part of good hospital management. I am sure that there will be an appropriate selection of good pilot schemes, which will

sefydlu canolfannau gofal brys yn rhan o wireddu'r strategaeth gofal brys, ac mae'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wedi dweud y gallai canolfannau o'r fath liniaru'r pwysau ar adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys. Fodd bynnag, caf ar ddeall nad yw'r Gweinidog yn ystyried sefydlu'r un prosiect peilot ar hyd coridor yr M4. A gytunwch fod potensial yma i ddelio ag amserau ymateb ambiwlansys, yn ogystal ag â'r pwysau ar adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys drwy ddarparu canolfan gofal brys rywle ar hyd coridor yr M4—yng Nghaerdydd, gobeithio? A gewch sgwrs dawl â'r Gweinidog dros iechyd a phledio'r ddadl dros leoli un yng Nghaerdydd neu ar goridor yr M4 yn gyffredinol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn siŵr a yw man cychwyn eich dadl yn gywir. Gwaethygodd perfformiad y gwasanaeth ambiwlans fis diwethaf, ac yr oedd hynny'n destun pryder difrifol, ond digwyddodd hynny ar ôl cyfnod o wella, felly mae'r sefyllfa'n groes i'r hyn yr oeddech yn ei awgrymu. Mae'n wir ei bod yn siomedig gweld hynny'n digwydd, ond mae gan y gwasanaeth dargedau newydd i'w cyrraedd yn awr o fis Ebrill ymlaen, a bydd angen i adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys helpu'r gwasanaeth i gyrraedd y targedau hynny. Ni ddylai neb gael ei gadw'n aros yn hwy na 15 munud mewn ambiwlans wrth fynedfa adran damweiniau ac achosion brys, ond gwyddom fod llawer o bobl wedi gorfod yn aros yn hwy o lawer na hynny, oherwydd problemau mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys.

Beth bynnag fo'r rheswm dros y problemau hynny, rhaid iddo ddod i ben, a galluogi ambiwlansys i gael eu defnyddio ar gyfer yr hyn y'i bwriadwyd, sef cludo pobl, nid gweithredu fel rhagorsafoedd dros dro ar gyfer adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys. Rhaid i hynny ddod i ben. Rhaid cael gwell trefn a gwell llif cleifion o ambiwlansys i adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys, ac oddi yno i wardiau, ac o'r wardiau yn ôl allan i'r gymuned. Mae hynny i gyd yn rhan o reoli ysbyty yn dda. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd detholiad priodol o gynlluniau peilot da, a fydd o gymorth, a byddant ym mhob rhan o

help, and they will be in all parts of Wales. I think that there was somewhat of an implication in what you said that somehow the M4 corridor was being ignored. If you believe that, perhaps you should write a letter trying to make that case to Edwina Hart and copy it to me.

**Helen Mary Jones:** First Minister, you may be aware of the case of my constituent, Mr Alan Francis, who has been refused, by Health Commission Wales, the funding that he needs to enable him to access a bone marrow transplant. Without that transplant he is almost certain, sadly, to lose his life. That refusal has been made without a proper or adequate explanation being given to either Mr Francis or his clinicians. Without asking you to comment on the individual case—I put on record that I am grateful to the Minister for Health and Social Services for having already agreed to look at that individual case for me—do you share my concern that the ongoing lack of transparency in decision making by Health Commission Wales is getting to the point where it is bringing the health service into disrepute? Will you commit your Government to a radical shake-up of decision making about highly specialised health provision?

**The First Minister:** I do not suppose that there is an Assembly Member in the Chamber who has not written many letters to Health Commission Wales on behalf of individual constituents. I do not envy Health Commission Wales its job: it has to make invidious decisions in saying ‘That is not a high priority’, or ‘That is not good value for money’. However, it will not be seen that way by the individual concerned, the GP or the family—or by the Assembly Member, when we are working in our representational capacity. I have had discussions about this recently with the Minister for Health and Social Services, and she is trying to get a system whereby HCW is itself defended from some of those difficult, invidious decisions. In turn, it must accept that there must be a more open and transparent system by which everyone can agree on the priorities, so HCW can avoid the accusation that, somehow, it favours one patient over another, when to that individual patient, the family or the GP, it may be seen as a life-or-death decision.

Gymru. Credaf fod rhywfaint o oblygiad yn yr hyn a ddywedasoch, sef bod coridor yr M4 yn cael ei anwybyddu rhywsut. Os credwch hynny, efallai y dylech ysgrifennu llythyr i gyflwyno’r achos hwnnw i Edwina Hart ac anfon copi ohono ataf fi.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Brif Weinidog, efallai eich bod yn ymwybodol o achos un o’r hetholwyr, Mr Alan Francis, y gwrthododd Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru roi’r arian y mae ei angen arno er mwyn cael trawsblaniad mêr esgyrn. Heb y trawsblaniad hwnnw mae bron yn sicr o golli ei fywyd, yn anffodus. Gwrthodwyd y cais hwnnw heb roi esboniad priodol na digonol i Mr Francis na’i glinigwyr. Heb ofyn ichi wneud sylwadau ar yr achos unigol—hoffwn gofnodi fy mod yn ddiolchgar i’r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol sydd eisoes wedi cytuno i edrych ar yr achos unigol hwnnw ar fy rhan—a rannwch fy mhryder fod y diffyg tryloywder parhaus yn y ffordd y mae Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru yn gwneud penderfyniadau wedi cyrraedd sefyllfa lle y mae’n dwyn anfri ar y gwasanaeth iechyd? A ymrwymwch eich Llywodraeth i ad-drefnu’n radical y ffordd y gwneir penderfyniadau am ddarpariaeth iechyd arbenigol iawn?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Tybiaf nad oes yr un Aelod Cynulliad yn y Siambr nad yw wedi ysgrifennu sawl llythyr i Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru ar ran etholwyr unigol. Ni chenfigennaf wrth waith Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru: rhaid iddo wneud penderfyniadau annymunol gan ddweud ‘Nid yw hynny’n flaenoriaeth uchel’, neu ‘Nid yw hynny’n werth da am arian’. Fodd bynnag, ni fydd yr unigolyn dan sylw, y meddyg teulu na’r teulu—neu Aelod o’r Cynulliad pan fyddwn yn gweithredu fel cynrychiolwyr, yn ei weld felly. Yr wyf wedi cael trafodaethau am hyn yn ddiweddar gyda’r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, ac mae’n ceisio sefydlu system i sicrhau bod CIC ei hun yn cael ei amddiffyn rhag rhai o’r penderfyniadau anodd, annymunol hynny. Yn ei dro, rhaid iddo dderbyn bod yn rhaid cael system fwy agored a thryloyw a fydd yn galluogi pawb i gytuno ar y blaenoriaethau, fel y gall CIC osgoi’r cyhuddiad ei fod, rhyw ffordd, yn ffafrio un claf dros glaf arall, pan fydd y claf unigol, y teulu neu’r meddyg

teulu yn ei ystyried o bosibl fel penderfyniad sy'n golygu bwyd neu farwolaeth.

### **Datganiad a Chyhoeddiad Busnes Business Statement and Announcement**

**The Counsel General and Leader of the House (Carwyn Jones):** There is one change to tomorrow's business. The Minister for Health and Social Services will be making a statement on health service reconfiguration in north Wales. Otherwise, business is as laid out in the business statement that is available to Members electronically.

**Nick Bourne:** I thank the Leader of the House for the business statement. Will he consider bringing forward a debate on the arts outside Cardiff? I know that there are concerns among many Members about the funding, or rather lack of funding, for organisations, consequent on the Arts Council of Wales's decisions. I appreciate that individual decisions are taken at arm's length, but I know that there is concern about this in probably all parts of Wales outside Cardiff. Given the large amount of money that went into the Wales Millennium Centre and the cutbacks that there have been outside Cardiff, people will naturally make a connection. Therefore, will he consider bringing forward a debate or perhaps a statement on the arts outside Cardiff? I visited several of the institutions affected, such as the Wyeside Arts Centre in Builth Wells, which is still getting funding but which needs more in order to survive, and the Centre for Performance Research in Aberystwyth, which is an organisation with worldwide significance and an international reputation whose funding will be totally stopped in July and which will therefore cease to operate. There are concerns here that are important for all of Wales, not just for the localities where these institutions are based.

**Carwyn Jones:** It has been argued in the Chamber, not least by the party opposite, that the arm's-length principle is important when it comes to arts council funding. On that basis, it is for the arts council to justify any decisions that it takes in relation to funding a particular project or institution. I am sure that

**Y Cwnsler Cyffredinol ac Arweinydd y Tŷ (Carwyn Jones):** Mae un newid i fusnes yfory. Bydd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn gwneud datganiad ar ailgyflunio'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn y gogledd. Fel arall, mae'r busnes fel yr amlinellir yn y datganiad busnes sydd ar gael i'r Aelodau yn electronig.

**Nick Bourne:** Diolchaf i Arweinydd y Tŷ am y datganiad busnes. A wnaiff ystyried cyflwyno dadl ar y celfyddydau y tu allan i Gaerdydd? Gwn fod pryderon ymysg llawer o Aelodau ynghylch ariannu sefydliadau, neu ddiffyg ariannu yn hytrach, sy'n dibynnu ar benderfyniadau Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru. Gwerthfawrogaf y caiff penderfyniadau unigol eu gwneud o hyd braich, ond gwn fod pryderon ynghylch hyn ym mhob rhan o Gymru y tu allan i Gaerdydd fwy na thebyg. A chofio'r swm mawr o arian a fuddsoddiwyd yng Nghanolfan Mileniwm Cymru a'r toriadau a welwyd y tu allan i Gaerdydd, bydd pobl yn naturiol yn gwneud y cysylltiad. Felly, a wnaiff ystyried cyflwyno dadl neu efallai ddatganiad ar y celfyddydau y tu allan i Gaerdydd? Ymwelais â sawl sefydliad yr effeithir arno, fel Canolfan Gelfyddydau Glannau Gwy yn Llanfair-ym-muallt, sy'n parhau i gael arian ond y mae angen rhagor arni er mwyn goroesi, a'r Ganolfan Ymchwil i Berfformio yn Aberystwyth, sy'n sefydliad a chanddo arwyddocâd byd-eang ac enw da rhyngwladol y bydd ei arian yn dod i ben yn gyfan gwbl fis Gorffennaf ac o ganlyniad bydd yn rhoi'r gorau i weithredu. Ceir yma bryderon sy'n bwysig i Gymru gyfan, nid dim ond i'r ardaloedd y mae'r sefydliadau hyn wedi'u lleoli ynddynt.

**Carwyn Jones:** Dadleuwyd yn y Siambr, a hynny gan y blaid gyferbyn â mi, bod egwyddor hyd braich yn bwysig o ran ariannu drwy gyngor y celfyddydau. Ar y sail honno, cyfrifoldeb cyngor y celfyddydau yw cyfiawnhau unrhyw benderfyniad a wna yng nghyswllt ariannu prosiect neu sefydliad

the issue of funding generally can be covered in questions to the appropriate Minister or through correspondence.

**Lesley Griffiths:** On 8 March, we will again be celebrating International Women's Day in Wales. The Welsh Assembly Government is one of few governments in the world to support this day, using it to address social, economic and political barriers and to celebrate the achievements of women, not just in Wales, but across the world.

Along with the Governments of Australia, New Zealand and the US, Wales is backing International Women's Day as a day for promoting women's rights and their participation in political and economic processes. The theme for this year will be celebrating the heritage of women in Wales. We have a great deal to be proud of in Wales, so will you please ask the appropriate Minister to make a statement on what the Government is doing to mark this day?

**Carwyn Jones:** Indeed, I will. We have a good record over the years that the Assembly has been in existence. We have an excellent record as an institution, of course, for ensuring that we have, if no longer numerical equality, unfortunately, at least a higher percentage of women members than is the case in many legislatures. There is more to be done—the party opposite is an example of that, of course; I can see its members smiling as I say that. It is important that we do what we can as a Government to mark International Women's Day, and I am sure that the appropriate Minister will be looking to do so.

**Kirsty Williams:** I asked you last week to ask the Deputy First Minister to make a statement to the Chamber on his decision not to cover the impact of increases in fuel duty on bus companies, thereby, in effect, taxing bus companies for the very first time since the Assembly came into existence. That never happened under previous Labour or Labour-Liberal Democrat administrations. There is increasing evidence that bus companies will either pass this increase on to

penodol. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gall cyllid yn gyffredinol gael ei gwmpasu mewn cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog priodol neu drwy ohebiaeth.

**Lesley Griffiths:** Ar 8 Mawrth, byddwn unwaith eto'n dathlu Diwrnod Rhyngwladol y Menywod. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn un o'r ychydig lywodraethau yn y byd sy'n cefnogi'r diwrnod hwn, ac mae'n ei ddefnyddio i fynd i'r afael â rhwystrau cymdeithasol, economaidd a gwleidyddol ac i ddatlu llwyddiannau menywod, nid dim ond yng Nghymru, ond ar draws y byd.

Ynghyd â Llywodraethau Awstralia, Seland Newydd a'r Unol Daleithiau, mae Cymru yn cefnogi Diwrnod Rhyngwladol y Menywod fel diwrnod ar gyfer hybu hawliau menywod a'u cyfranogiad mewn prosesau gwleidyddol ac economaidd. Y thema eleni fydd dathlu treftadaeth menywod yng Nghymru. Mae gennym lawer iawn i ymfalchïo ynddo yng Nghymru, felly a ofynnwch i'r Gweinidog priodol wneud datganiad ar yr hyn y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i gofio'r diwrnod hwn?

**Carwyn Jones:** Gwnaf, yn wir. Mae gennym record dda dros y blynyddoedd ers dyfodiad y Cynulliad. Mae gennym record ragorol fel sefydliad, wrth gwrs, am sicrhau bod gennym, os nad niferoedd cyfartal bellach, yn anffodus, o leiaf ganran uwch o aelodau benywaidd nag sydd mewn sawl deddfwrfa. Mae mwy i'w wneud—mae'r blaidd gyferbyn yn enghraifft o hynny, wrth gwrs; gallaf weld ei haelodau'n gwenu wrth imi ddweud hynny. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn gwneud popeth yn ein gallu fel Llywodraeth i nodi Diwrnod Rhyngwladol y Menywod, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y Gweinidog priodol yn gwneud hynny.

**Kirsty Williams:** Gofynnais ichi yr wythnos diwethaf i ofyn i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog wneud datganiad i'r Siambr ar ei benderfyniad i beidio â sôn am effaith cynnydd mewn treth tanwydd ar gwmnïau bysys a fydd, yn ei hanfod, yn trethu cwmnïau bysys am y tro cyntaf ers dyfodiad y Cynulliad. Ni ddigwyddodd hynny erioed o dan weinyddiaethau blaenorol Llafur neu Lafur a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Mae tystiolaeth gynyddol y bydd cwmnïau bysys

passengers or cut services. I have some specific questions. Did you ask the Minister to make such a statement? If you did, what was his reply? If it was 'no', why was that the case?

**Carwyn Jones:** I gave you the answer last week. This will be examined when the scheduled review takes place. That was the answer that I gave at the time.

**Leanne Wood:** I ask for a debate on the future of Remploy in Treforest. The factory is due to close at the start of next month. Will you join me in condemning Remploy for removing furniture ahead of the factory's closure, with some of the work to be transferred to a company that employs able-bodied employees in Birmingham? I would like a debate to be held so that the Assembly can condemn the heartless closure of this factory by the Westminster Government, and so that we can discuss what we can do to help to find work for the employees who will be made redundant.

**Carwyn Jones:** I understand that, as far as Treforest is concerned, discussions are taking place with a Yorkshire-based company with a view to reopening, or keeping open, the Treforest site. If that proposal were to come to fruition, I understand that we are looking at a maximum of around 20 workers. The indications so far from Remploy suggest that discussions are progressing well. I would hope, as I am sure that all of us in the Chamber would, that those discussions come to a successful conclusion and that the factory is able to reopen, albeit with a reduced number of employees.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Two weeks ago, the South Wales Fire and Rescue Service came under attack in the St Mellons area of Cardiff. The fire service believes that a fire was started deliberately in order to lure the fire crew to the scene. When the fire crew arrived, objects were thrown at the firefighters' vehicles. Such attacks seem to be becoming a regular occurrence, whether against the fire service or the ambulance service. Is it not time that we had a debate in Government time so that the Government can outline the measures that are being taken to

naill ai'n trosglwyddo'r cynnydd hwn i deithwyr neu'n cwtogi ar wasanaethau. Mae gennyf gwestiynau penodol. A ofynasoch i'r Gweinidog wneud datganiad o'r fath? Os felly, beth oedd ei ateb? Os 'na' oedd ei ateb, pam hynny?

**Carwyn Jones:** Rhoddais yr ateb ichi yr wythnos diwethaf. Edrychir ar hyn pan gynhelir yr adolygiad arfaethedig. Dyna'r ateb a roddais bryd hynny.

**Leanne Wood:** Gofynnaf am ddatl ar ddyfodol Remploy yn Nhrefforest. Mae'r ffatri'n bwriadu cau ddechrau fis nesaf. A ymunwch â mi i gondemnio Remploy am symud dodrefn oddi yno cyn i'r ffatri gau, a'r bwriad i drosglwyddo rhywfaint o'r gwaith i gwmni sy'n cyflogi cyflogeion nad ydynt yn anabl yn Birmingham? Hoffwn weld dadl yn cael ei chynnal er mwyn i'r Cynulliad allu condemnio penderfyniad creulon Llywodraeth San Steffan i gau'r ffatri hon, ac er mwyn inni allu trafod yr hyn y gallwn ei wneud i helpu i ddod o hyd i waith i gyflogeion a fydd yn colli eu swyddi.

**Carwyn Jones:** Deallaf, o ran Trefforest, fod trafodaethau'n cael eu cynnal gyda chwmni o Swydd Efrog gyda'r bwriad o ailagor safle Trefforest, neu ei gadw ar agor. Pe bai'r cynnig hwnnw'n dwyn ffrwyth, deallaf ein bod yn edrych ar uchafswm o oddeutu 20 o weithwyr. Mae'r arwyddion gan Remploy hyd yma yn awgrymu bod trafodaethau'n mynd yn eu blaen yn dda. Byddwn yn gobeithio, fel y gwna pob un ohonom yn y Siambr hon mae'n siŵr, y daw'r trafodaethau hynny i gasgliad llwyddiannus ac y bydd y ffatri yn gallu ailagor, er mai gyda nifer lai o gyflogeion y bydd hynny.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Bythefnos yn ôl, ymosodwyd ar Wasanaeth Tân ac Achub De Cymru yn ardal Llaneirwg yng Nghaerdydd. Cred y gwasanaeth tân i dân gael ei gynnu'n fwriadol er mwyn denu'r criw i'r ardal. Pan gyrhaeddodd y criw, taflwyd gwrthrychau at gerbydau'r dynion tân. Ymddengys bod ymosodiadau o'r fath yn digwydd yn rheolaidd, p'un a ydynt yn ymosodiadau ar y gwasanaeth tân neu'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Onid yw'n bryd inni gael dadl yn amser y Llywodraeth er mwyn i'r Llywodraeth allu amlinellu'r mesurau a gymerir i gefnogi'r

support the emergency services and so that we, as Members, can support you in those measures, and so that the people of Wales, and those in the fire and ambulance services in particular, are then in no doubt that we support them in their work? We should stand up to support them in the face of the yobbish behaviour that we are now seeing all too frequently.

**Carwyn Jones:** The behaviour that you described is utterly preposterous and anti-social. Nobody could possibly condone attacking an emergency crew under any circumstances. I do not think that we need a debate to emphasise that, but I am sure that I speak for all Members when I say that it is the Government's view and, I am sure, every Member's view, that such attacks are to be condemned in the strongest possible fashion. There is no excuse whatsoever for them, they put lives in danger and they are, frankly, an occupation for those who are particularly mindless. Unfortunately, it is something that we deal with. We know that ambulance crews have faced this problem in Grangetown in previous months and we hear of instances regularly. It has been the case for many years that fires are sometimes started deliberately. I do not believe that we need a debate, however. I am sure that we would all agree that such attacks are to be condemned without reservation.

3.10 p.m.

**Chris Franks:** Can you arrange for a debate about the importance of parks and playgrounds in the communities of Wales? I draw your attention to Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council's closure for three months of a playground serving the Mountain View estate in Tonyrefail. Do you agree that it would be worth including in that debate a discussion about how Rhondda Cynon Taf council can leave a park closed for three months simply because a plank was missing from a climbing frame? Do you further agree that we should debate how the council could seek to blame the developers for the closure of the playground when it failed to ask them to repair the site for six weeks?

**Carwyn Jones:** We cannot have a debate on

gwasanaethau brys ac er mwyn i ni, fel Aelodau, allu cefnogi'r mesurau hynny, ac er mwyn sicrhau nad oes gan bobl Cymru, a'r rhai sy'n gweithio i'r gwasanaethau tân ac ambiwlans yn arbennig, unrhyw amheuaeth ein bod yn eu cefnogi yn eu gwaith? Dylem ddangos ein bod yn eu cefnogi yn wyneb yr ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol a welwn yn llawer rhy aml erbyn hyn.

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae'r ymddygiad a ddisgrifiwyd gennych yn ymddygiad cwbl afresymol a gwrthgymdeithasol. Ni allai neb gymeradwyo ymosod ar griw gwasanaeth brys mewn unrhyw amgylchiadau. Ni chredaf fod angen dadl arnom i bwysleisio hynny, ond yr wyf yn siŵr fy mod yn siarad ar ran pob Aelod pan ddywedaf mai barn y Llywodraeth ac, yr wyf yn siŵr, barn pob Aelod, yw y dylid condemnio ymosodiadau o'r fath mor gryf â phosib. Nid oes esgus o gwbl drostynt, maent yn peryglu bywydau ac, yn wir, yn rhywbeth a wneir gan y rhai sy'n arbennig o ddifeddwl. Yn anffodus, mae'n rhywbeth yr ydym yn ymdrin ag ef. Gwyddom fod criwiau ambiwlans wedi wynebu'r broblem hon yn Grangetown yn ystod y misoedd a aeth heibio a chlywn am achosion yn rheolaidd. Ers blynyddoedd caiff tanau eu cynnau'n fwriadol ambell waith. Ni chredaf fod angen dadl arnom, fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddem oll yn cytuno y dylid condemnio ymosodiadau o'r fath yn ddi-os.

**Chris Franks:** A allwch drefnu i ddadl gael ei chynnal ar bwysigrwydd parciau a meysydd chwarae yng nghymunedau Cymru? Tynnaf eich sylw at y ffaith bod Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf wedi cau maes chwarae sy'n gwasanaethu ystâd Montain View yn Nhonyrefail am dri mis. A gytunwch y byddai'n werth cynnwys yn y ddadl honno drafodaeth ynghylch sut y gall cyngor Rhondda Cynon Taf gau parc am dri mis dim ond oherwydd bod darn o bren ar goll ar ffrâm ddringo? Oni chytunwch hefyd y dylem gael dadl ar sut y gallai'r cyngor geisio beio datblygwyr am gau'r maes chwarae pan na ofynnodd iddynt drwsio'r safle am chwe wythnos?

**Carwyn Jones:** Ni allwn gael dadl ar gau un

the closure of one park in one local authority. That is a local matter for the local authority. I am not familiar with the circumstances surrounding the closure of this park, but it is important to emphasise that children's safety must come first. If the local authority felt that, in order to secure children's safety, it was necessary to close the park, I see no reason to gainsay it. I understand that substantial investment has been made in parks in Rhondda Cynon Taf and I am sure that, where parks are closed, that is only under the most extreme circumstances, when there is no other alternative.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I asked you last week to ask the Deputy First Minister for at least a statement, if not a debate, on trains. Like my colleague, Kirsty Williams, I wonder whether you asked him about that. What was his reply? I see in our wonderful north Wales rag, the *Daily Post*, that proposals to improve the services have been put on hold again—they are in the sidings in Wolverhampton, as far as I know. There was a proposal to improve the trains. We are not asking for much; we are just asking for a decent, clean, reliable, improved and comfortable service to north Wales. That is not just for me; some of you seem to think that I am asking for it for myself. That is certainly not the case. This is terribly important and if the article in yesterday's *Daily Post* is true, it is absolutely scandalous that we have beautiful rolling stock stuck in sidings in Wolverhampton while we are waiting for them to be used. How on earth are we going to get a greener, cleaner Wales if we are all careering up to north Wales and back in our cars, when we should be on decent trains?

**Carwyn Jones:** I do not recall saying that I would talk to the Deputy First Minister about having a debate on trains last week. The answer that I gave you last week was that a substantial amount of investment has gone into train services. I explained about the work that is being carried out in station improvements and that we now have a two-hourly north-south service, whereas in the past we had one train a day. You are also aware that investigations are taking place into improving the service again, and that was done by way of a statement by the Deputy First Minister before Christmas. I do not

parc mewn un awdurdod lleol. Mater lleol i'r awdurdod lleol yw hynny. Nid wyf yn gyfarwydd â'r amgylchiadau sy'n ymwneud â chau'r parc hwn, ond mae'n bwysig pwysleisio ei bod yn rhaid i ddiogelwch plant gael blaenoriaeth. Os oedd yr awdurdod lleol yn teimlo ei bod yn angenrheidiol cau'r parc er mwyn sicrhau diogelwch plant, ni welaf reswm i wrth-ddweud hynny. Deallaf fod buddsoddiad sylweddol wedi'i wneud mewn parciau yn Rhondda Cynon Taf ac yr wyf yn siŵr, pan gaiff parciau eu cau, mai dim ond yn yr amgylchiadau mwyaf eithafol y gwneir hynny, pan nad oes dewis arall.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yr wythnos diwethaf, gofynnais ichi ofyn i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog am ddatganiad o leiaf, os nad dadl, ar drenau. Fel fy nghyd-Aelod, Kirsty Williams, hoffwn wybod a wnaethoch ofyn iddo am hynny. Beth oedd ei ateb? Gwelaf yn rhecsyn y gogledd, y *Daily Post*, fod y cynigion i wella'r gwasanaethau wedi cael eu hoedi unwaith eto—maent yn y seidins yn Wolverhampton, hyd y gwn i. Yr oedd cynnig i wella'r trenau. Ni ofynnwn am lawer; y cyfan y gofynnwn amdano yw gwasanaeth safonol, glân, dibynadwy, gwell a chyfforddus i'r Gogledd. Nid dim ond i mi y mae hynny; mae rhai ohonoch yn meddwl fy mod yn gofyn amdano i mi fy hunan. Nid yw hynny'n wir o gwbl. Mae hyn yn hollbwysig ac os yw'r erthygl yn y *Daily Post* ddoe yn wir, mae'n warthus bod gennym gerbydau sy'n aros yn seidins yn Wolverhampton tra yr ydym yn aros iddynt gael eu defnyddio. Sut yn y byd y gallwn sicrhau Cymru fwy gwyrdd a glân os ydym oll yn teithio yn ôl ac ymlaen o'r gogledd yn ein ceir, pan ddylem fod ar drenau o safon?

**Carwyn Jones:** Ni chofiaf ddweud y byddwn yn siarad â'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ynghylch cael dadl ar drenau yr wythnos diwethaf. Yr ateb a roddais ichi yr wythnos diwethaf oedd bod llawer o fuddsoddiad wedi cael ei wneud mewn gwasanaethau trenau. Eglurais y gwaith sy'n cael ei wneud i wella gorsafydd a bod gennym bellach wasanaeth bob dwy awr rhwng y de a'r gogledd. Yn y gorffennol dim ond un trê'n y dydd oedd gennym. Yr ydych hefyd yn ymwybodol bod ymchwiliadau'n cael eu gwneud i wella'r gwasanaeth ymhellach, a gwnaethpwyd hynny drwy ddatganiad gan y Dirprwy Brif

believe that there is anything else to add. I do not believe that the proposals are in the sidings, as you put it. We all want to see an improvement in train services. That has happened during the life of this Assembly Government and previous Assembly Governments and it has to be emphasised that the service has improved greatly and will continue to improve in the future.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Bûm ar ymweliad â ffatri Remploi yn Ystradgynlais ddoe gyda'r Cynghorydd Alun Llewelyn i gwrdd â'r gweithwyr yno ac i drafod eu dyfodol. Mae wedi dod i'r pwynt lle bydd y gweithwyr yn gorfod symud i Faglan ond ni chafwyd ymateb o unrhyw werth gan Guy Phillips na Bob Warner ynglŷn â thrafnidiaeth i'w cludo i Faglan na'r ffaith nad yw rhai o'r gweithwyr sydd yn derbyn lwfans dyletswydd ychwanegol yn siŵr beth yw'r sefyllfa o ran hynny. Mae'n rhaid iddynt lofnodi cytundebau newydd erbyn 6 Mawrth, felly erfyniaf amoch chi a'r Cabinet i drafod hyn gyda Remploi. Yr wyf yn eilio'r hyn a ddywedodd Leanne Wood o ran cael trafodaeth gyda'r Llywodraeth, gan fod y system wedi dod i'r pwynt lle na ellir trafod ymhellach.

Hefyd, hoffwn bwysleisio bod y grŵp trawsbleidiol newydd yn lansio ei amcanion ar anhwylderau bwyta yfory, a hoffwn weld y Llywodraeth yn cefnogi unrhyw strategaeth a ddaw o'r grŵp newydd hwn.

**Carwyn Jones:** O ran eich ail bwynt, byddwn yn edrych i weld pa amcanion a ddaw o'r grŵp, a hefyd pa fath o strategaeth y bydd y grŵp yn ei drafftio.

O ran y sefyllfa yn Ystradgynlais a Brynaman, mae'n wir i ddweud bod gwaith yn mynd rhagddo ar hyn o bryd gan Gyngor Sir Gâr a Chyngor Sir Powys i edrych ar ddatblygu'r safleoedd; er enghraifft, maent yn ystyried a oes ffordd o gael rhyw fath o ganolfan hyfforddi neu ganolfan ailgylchu i greu swyddi ar y safle, yn unol â'r drefn bresennol. Felly, mae gobaith o weld y safleoedd yn cael eu datblygu a dod o hyd i ddull arall o gyflogi pobl leol. Deallaf y bydd cyfarfod yn cael ei gynnal yr wythnos nesaf i edrych ar bob opsiwn sydd ar gael. Deallaf

Weinidog cyn y Nadolig. Ni chredaf fod unrhyw beth arall i'w ychwanegu. Ni chredaf fod y cynigion yn y seidins, fel y dywedasoch. Yr ydym oll am weld gwelliant yn y gwasanaethau trên. Mae hynny wedi digwydd yn ystod oes Llywodraeth y Cynulliad hwn a Llywodraethau blaenorol y Cynulliad a rhaid pwysleisio bod y gwasanaeth wedi gwella'n sylweddol ac y bydd yn parhau i wella yn y dyfodol.

**Bethan Jenkins:** I visited the Ystradgynlais Remploi factory yesterday with Councillor Alun Llewelyn to meet with workers there to discuss their future. It has now come to the point where the workers will have to move to Baglan but, at present, there has been no response of any value from Guy Phillips or Bob Warner regarding the transport system that will take them to Baglan and neither has anything been said about the fact that some of the workers in receipt of extra duty allowance are unsure as to whether that will continue. They must sign the new contracts by 6 March, so I urge you and the Cabinet to discuss this with Remploi. I endorse what Leanne Wood said about having a discussion with the Government, as the system has come to the point where we cannot discuss this any further.

I would also emphasise that the new cross-party group will launch its aims on eating disorders tomorrow, and I would like to see the Government supporting any strategy that comes from this new group.

**Carwyn Jones:** Regarding your second point, we will look at the aims of the group, and at what kind of strategy is drafted by the group.

As regards the position in Ystradgynlais and Brynaman, it is true to say that Carmarthenshire County Council and Powys County Council are carrying out work in looking at developing the sites; for example, they are looking at whether it is possible to set up some kind of training centre or recycling centre to create jobs on the site as it stands at present. Therefore, there is hope that the sites will be developed and that alternative means will be found of employing local people. I understand that a meeting will be held next week to consider all the



fod Remploy yn obeithiol, ar hyn o bryd, y bydd yn gallu mabwysiadu hyn. Y gobaith yw y bydd y safleoedd—Brynaman yn enwedig—yn cael eu datblygu yn y dyfodol. Felly, mae gobaith ynglŷn â dod o hyd i ddulliau eraill o ddefnyddio'r safleoedd, a fydd yn fodd o ddarparu cyflogaeth i bobl.

**Nick Ramsay:** Could the Leader of the House find time for a statement on cancer screening, specifically bowel cancer screening? You will be aware of Cancer Research UK's new campaign, *Screening Matters*, which speaks of the importance of screening as a way of dealing with this disease. I have been contacted by a constituent who lost her husband to bowel cancer in his early 30s. There are a number of concerns regarding the extent to which the screening programme will be implemented, in which areas it will be implemented, whether there will be enough experts to deal with it, and how we will encourage participation. Will the Leader of the House find time for this important subject?

**Carwyn Jones:** Like any cancer, bowel cancer is an important subject. We know that cancer is the second-biggest killer in Wales—I believe that heart disease is a bigger killer, but, nevertheless, some estimates suggest that up to a third of the population will contract cancer at some point in their lives. Of those, statistically, approximately half will not live for more than five years, which is the usual definition of being cured of cancer. The best way forward with the questions that you have asked would, perhaps, be to write to the Minister for Health and Social Services or to put those questions to her. In that way, the answers to what are questions on an important topic can be made clear to you.

**David Lloyd:** Could the Leader of the House arrange for a debate on the importance of openness and transparency in local government? For example, concerns have been raised in the press regarding the appointment of a head of strategy at Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council without the proper appointments process being followed. Serious questions have been raised by Councillor Pauline Jarman, who has called

available options. I understand that Remploy is, at present, hopeful that it will be able to take this forward. It is hoped that the sites—particularly at Brynaman—will be developed in the future. There is hope, therefore, of finding alternative uses for the sites, that will lead to job opportunities.

**Nick Ramsay:** A allai Arweinydd y Tŷ neilltuo amser ar gyfer datganiad am sgrinio am ganser, neu sgrinio am ganser y coluddyn yn benodol? Byddwch yn ymwybodol o ymgyrch newydd Cancer Research y DU, *Screening Matters*, sy'n sôn am bwysigrwydd sgrinio fel ffordd o ddelio â'r clefyd hwn. Mae etholydd, a gollodd ei gŵr yn ei dridegau cynnar i ganser y coluddyn, wedi cysylltu â mi. Ceir cryn bryderon ynghylch y ffordd y caiff y rhaglen sgrinio ei rhoi ar waith, ym mha ardaloedd y caiff ei rhoi ar waith, a fydd digon o arbenigwyr ar gael i ddelio â'r rhaglen, a sut y byddwn yn annog pobl i gymryd rhan ynddi. A wnaiff Arweinydd y Tŷ neilltuo amser ar gyfer y pwnc pwysig hwn?

**Carwyn Jones:** Fel unrhyw fath o ganser, mae canser y coluddyn yn bwnc pwysig. Gwyddom mai clefyd y galon yn unig, yr wyf yn credu, sy'n lladd mwy o bobl yng Nghymru na chanser, ond, er hynny, mae rhai amcangyfrifon yn awgrymu y bydd hyd at draean y boblogaeth yn cael canser rhywbryd yn ystod eu bywyd. O'r rheini, yn ystadegol, ni fydd hanner ohonynt yn byw mwy na phum mlynedd, sef y diffiniad arferol eich bod wedi gwella o ganser. Y ffordd orau ymlaen o ran y cwestiynau yr ydych wedi'u gofyn fyddai, efallai, ysgrifennu at y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol neu gyflwyno'r cwestiynau hynny iddi. Drwy wneud hyn, gellir egluro'r atebion i'ch cwestiynau ar y pwnc pwysig hwn.

**David Lloyd:** A allai Arweinydd y Tŷ drefnu dadl am bwysigrwydd bod yn agored ac yn dryloyw mewn llywodraeth leol? Er enghraifft, codwyd amheuan yn y wasg ynghylch penodi pennaeth strategaeth yng Nghyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf heb ddilyn y broses benodi briodol. Mae'r Cynghorydd Pauline Jarman wedi codi cwestiynau difrifol ac wedi galw ar yr archwilydd cyffredinol i ymchwilio i'r achos.

for the auditor general to investigate the case. Will you, therefore, agree to a timely Plenary debate on these, and related, matters?

**Carwyn Jones:** This is a matter for Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council and those who investigate such matters on its behalf. I do not see how a debate would add to this, because it is a matter for the investigating authorities to examine whether any of the rules that may have been put in place on behalf of that council have been breached. It is a matter for Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council.

**Peter Black:** As you know, the Minister for Environment, Sustainability and Housing has published a renewable energy route-map, and has also indicated to the Assembly that she is considering a pilot scheme for a tidal lagoon in Wales. In light of that, would it be possible to have a statement or a debate on tidal lagoons and the associated technology, so that we can establish some clarity as to the future direction of the Government on this matter?

3.20 p.m.

**Carwyn Jones:** I cannot go beyond the statement that was made by Jane Davidson last week. As you say, she suggested that there should be a pilot scheme and when such a scheme is proposed, and a location found, I am sure that she will make the appropriate announcement at the right time.

A wnewch, felly, gytuno i ddadl mewn Cyfarfod Llawn maes o law am y materion hyn a materion cysylltiedig eraill?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae hwn yn fater i Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf a'r rheini sy'n ymchwilio i faterion o'r fath ar ei ran. Ni welaf sut y byddai dadl yn ychwanegu at hyn, oherwydd mater i'r awdurdodau sy'n ymchwilio yw edrych i weld a dorrwyd unrhyw reolau a allai fod wedi'u rhoi mewn grym ar ran y cyngor hwnnw. Mater ydyw i Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf.

**Peter Black:** Fel y gwyddoch, mae'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynaliadwyedd a Thai wedi cyhoeddi trywydd ynni adnewyddadwy, ac hefyd wedi awgrymu wrth y Cynulliad ei bod yn ystyried cynllun peilot ar gyfer morlyn llanw yng Nghymru. A chofio hynny, a fyddai'n bosibl cael datganiad neu ddadl am forlynoedd llanw a'r dechnoleg gysylltiedig, fel y gallwn ganfod yn glir i ba gyfeiriad y mae'r Llywodraeth yn mynd ar y mater hwn i'r dyfodol?

**Carwyn Jones:** Ni allaf ddweud mwy na'r datganiad a wnaethpwyd gan Jane Davidson yr wythnos diwethaf. Fel y dywedasoeh, awgrymodd y dylid cael cynllun peilot a phan gaiff cynllun o'r fath ei gynnig, a deuir o hyd i leoliad, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yn gwneud y cyhoeddiad priodol ar yr amser cywir.

### **Datganiad am y Fframwaith Effeithiolrwydd Ysgolion Statement on the School Effectiveness Framework**

**The Minister for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills (Jane Hutt):** I want to advise Members of the publication and launch of the school effectiveness framework, which the Assembly Government has developed in collaboration with the Welsh Local Government Association, the Association of Directors of Education in Wales, headteachers and other key stakeholders. The framework is designed to ensure that all our schools become effective places of learning.

**Y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau (Jane Hutt):** Hoffwn roi gwybod i Aelodau am gyhoeddiad a lansiad y fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion, a luniwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ar y cyd â Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, Cymdeithas Cyfarwyddwyr Addysg Cymru, penaethiaid, a rhanddeiliad allweddol eraill. Lluniwyd y fframwaith i sicrhau bod ein holl ysgolion yn datblygu i fod yn lleoedd dysgu effeithiol.

The Chief Inspector of Education and Training in Wales's annual report for 2006-07, which was published today, concludes that there is much to celebrate: the amount of good work in primary schools has increased by 3 percentage points since last year, and 29 percentage points over the six-year period since the schools were last inspected, and, in secondary schools, standards have improved by 6 percentage points since last year and 20 percentage points over the six years. However, the rate of improvement has not been uniformly sustained in all parts of the service: attainment at the end of key stages 1, 2 and 3 is levelling off and the examination indicators at age 16 have not risen. I am pleased that an increasing number of schools show excellence, grade 1, across all areas of work inspected. However, Estyn concludes that, over a six-year period, schools that were identified as weak in 2000-01 have found it difficult to improve in many instances. We must continue to lift performance and narrow the gap between our best-performing and worst-performing schools, and improve consistency in standards across Wales.

The results of the programme for international student assessment for 2006 give a snapshot of our international standing. In science, we are on a par with big hitters like Germany, the United States and 11 of our other EU neighbours. However, there are less positive findings on mathematics and reading. We have to reflect on these outcomes, but we should not see PISA 2006 as the main catalyst for a drive to improve standards. We are already implementing policies that will result in improved learner outcomes, as described in 'The Learning Country: Vision into Action'; the 'One Wales' programme reiterates those commitments.

Given our ambition for Wales to be a world-class leader in education and our commitment to ensuring that all children and young people in Wales receive high-quality education, we cannot leave anything to chance. We want to provide education that meets their needs and

Mae adroddiad blynyddol y Prif Arolygydd dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant yng Nghymru 2006-07, a gyhoeddwyd heddiw, yn dod i'r casgliad bod gennym lawer i fod yn falch ohono: mae'r gwaith da a wneir mewn ysgolion cynradd wedi codi 3 phwynt canran ers y llynedd, a 29 pwynt canran dros y cyfnod chwe blynedd ers i'r ysgolion gael eu harolygu diwethaf, ac, yn yr ysgolion uwchradd, mae safonau wedi gwella 6 phwynt canran ers y llynedd ac 20 pwynt canran dros y chwe blynedd. Fodd bynnag, ni chynhaliwyd y gyfradd gwella hon yn unffurf ym mhob rhan o'r gwasanaeth: mae cyrhaeddiad ar ddiwedd cyfnodau allweddol 1, 2 a 3 yn arafu ac nid yw'r dynodyddion arholiadau yn 16 oed wedi codi. Yr wyf yn falch bod nifer gynyddol o ysgolion yn dangos rhagoriaeth, sef gradd 1, ar draws yr holl feysydd gwaith a arolygwyd. Fodd bynnag, daw Estyn i'r canlyniad, dros gyfnod o chwe blynedd, bod nifer o enghreifftiau o ysgolion, y dynodwyd eu bod yn wan yn 2000-01, wedi'i chael yn anodd gwella. Rhaid inni barhau i godi perfformiad a lleihau'r bwlch rhwng ein hysgolion sy'n perfformio orau a'r rheini sy'n perfformio waethaf, a gwella cysondeb mewn safonau ledled Cymru.

Mae canlyniadau rhaglen ryngwladol asesu myfyrwyr 2006 yn rhoi braslun rhyngwladol o'n sefyllfa. Mewn gwyddoniaeth, yr ydym lawn cystal â'r gwledydd mawrion yn y maes megis yr Almaen, yr Unol Daleithiau, ac 11 o'n cymdogion yn yr UE. Fodd bynnag, mewn mathemateg a darllen, nid yw'r canfyddiadau mor gadarnhaol. Rhaid inni bwysu a mesur y canlyniadau hyn, ond ni ddylem ddefnyddio rhaglen ryngwladol asesu myfyrwyr 2006 fel y prif gatalydd mewn ymgyrch i wella safonau. Yr ydym eisoes yn rhoi polisïau ar waith a fydd yn arwain at well canlyniadau i ddysgwyr, fel y disgrifiwyd yn 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu: Gweledigaeth ar Waith'; mae rhaglen 'Cymru'n Un' hefyd yn ategu'r ymrwymïadau hynny.

A chofio ein huchelgais ar gyfer Cymru fel arweinydd o'r radd flaenaf mewn addysg a'n hymrwymiad i sicrhau y bydd holl blant a phobl ifanc Cymru yn cael addysg o safon uchel, ni allwn adael yr un dim i hap a damwain. Yr ydym am ddarparu addysg sy'n

enables them to achieve their potential and become engaged and economically active citizens.

The school effectiveness framework is based on tri-level reform; that is, schools, local authorities and the Assembly Government working together and aligning their programmes to improve the wellbeing and learning of young people. School effectiveness requires an ethos where children and young people are expected to achieve a personal standard of excellence. Schools need to work on developing their own and interdependent approaches to effectiveness, capturing existing good practice and knowledge, and finding new solutions to old and emerging challenges. This will maximise future opportunities and support the creation of a high-performance culture. The framework will bring together the activity necessary to develop effective schools. It describes the most important elements in our education system as they operate at each level, ultimately affecting learning outcomes and wellbeing. The contribution of each of the levels is key, as is collaboration across and between levels.

The framework has been under development for over a year. The initial work was done by a group of academics, drawing on international evidence of what works. That group involved the WLGA, ADEW, headteachers and other partner organisations, including the General Teaching Council for Wales and Estyn. That work was built on and tested in workshops that were held across Wales in the summer and autumn of 2007. The framework document is now available at [www.wales.gov.uk](http://www.wales.gov.uk) and will be launched at four regional conferences between 28 February and 10 March. These will be the first large-scale opportunities to share the framework with headteachers, local authorities, teachers' unions, professional associations and partner organisations.

diwallu eu hanghenion ac yn eu galluogi i wireddu eu potensial a datblygu i fod yn ddinasyddion sy'n cyfrannu ac sy'n economaidd weithredol.

Seilir y fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion ar ddiwygio ar dair lefel; hynny yw, ysgolion, awdurdodau lleol a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cydweithio ac yn cysoni eu rhaglenni i wella lles pobl ifanc a'u dysgu. Er mwyn i ysgol fod yn effeithiol, mae angen ethos lle mae'r plant a'r bobl ifanc yn disgwyl cyflawni safon bersonol o ragoriaeth. Mae angen i ysgolion weithio ar ddatblygu eu dulliau eu hunain a dulliau rhyngddibynnol o effeithiolrwydd, y mae angen iddynt gasglu gwybodaeth ac arfer da sydd eisoes yn bodoli, a dod o hyd i atebion newydd ar gyfer hen heriau a heriau newydd sy'n codi'u pen. Bydd hyn yn defnyddio cyfleoedd i'r dyfodol i'r eithaf ac yn cefnogi'r broses o greu diwylliant perfformiad uchel. Bydd y fframwaith yn tynnu ynghyd y gweithgaredd angenrheidiol er mwyn datblygu ysgolion effeithiol. Mae'n disgrifio'r elfennau pwysicaf yn ein system addysg a sut y maent yn gweithio ar bob lefel, ac yn y pen draw eu heffaith ar ganlyniadau dysgu a lles. Mae cyfraniad pob un lefel yn allweddol, yn ogystal â chydweithio ar draws lefelau a rhyngddynt.

Mae gwaith wedi bod yn mynd rhagddo ar lunio'r fframwaith bellach ers dros flwyddyn. Gwnaethpwyd y gwaith cychwynnol gan grŵp o academyddion, a edrychodd ar dystiolaeth ryngwladol am yr hyn sy'n gweithio. Yr oedd y grŵp hwnnw'n cynnwys Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, Cymdeithas Cyfarwyddwyr Addysg Cymru, penaethiaid a mudiadau partner eraill, gan gynnwys Cyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol Cymru ac Estyn. Datblygwyd ar y gwaith hwnnw a'i brofi mewn gweithdai a gynhaliwyd ledled Cymru yn ystod haf a hydref 2007. Bellach, mae'r ddogfen fframwaith ar gael yn [www.cymru.gov.uk](http://www.cymru.gov.uk) a chaiff ei lansio mewn pedair cynhadledd ranbarthol rhwng 28 Chwefror a 10 Mawrth. Dyma fydd y cyfle cyntaf ar raddfa fawr i rannu'r fframwaith ymhlith penaethiaid, awdurdodau lleol, undebau athrawon, cymdeithasau proffesiynol a mudiadau partner.

The framework is a developmental tool for all schools to apply in their own circumstances. It is about consistency and improving the performance of all schools. It is not about targeting particular schools or imposing a new accountability regime. It has six interdependent core elements: leadership, curriculum and teaching, working with others, networks of professional practice, intervention and support, and improvement and accountability. Existing policies and programmes are mapped into the framework and future policies will be measured against their contribution to school effectiveness.

The Assembly Government is working with the four ADEW consortia of local authorities. Each consortium will shortly be asked to identify schools that will pilot the framework from September 2008. We will be looking for a mix of primary, secondary and special schools, urban and rural schools, church schools, and schools that operate through the medium of Welsh. We will be piloting different approaches. In two of the consortia areas, specially trained headteachers and local authority school improvement professionals—which will be called ‘associates’—will be released for 25 per cent of their time to work with participating schools. In the other two consortia, we will be inviting the authorities to integrate the work into their existing programmes for school improvement. Throughout the pilot year, use of the framework will be monitored and assessed. When the assessment has been considered, the framework will be rolled out from mid 2009 over a period of around three years. I hope that schools will quickly see its advantage as a developmental tool and use it to move forward.

Five seconded headteachers from primary, special and secondary schools are working with my department to develop materials to be used by the pilot schools. Funding of £5.1 million is available over the next three years to develop and roll out the framework. I am also making available £0.5 million in each of the next three years to support applied

Offeryn datblygu yw'r fframwaith y gall pob ysgol ei ddefnyddio yn unol â'u hamgylchiadau eu hunain. Mae'n fater o gysondeb a gwella perfformiad pob ysgol. Nid yw'n fater o dargedu ysgolion penodol na gosod trefn atebolrwydd newydd. Mae ynddo chwe elfen graidd ryngddibynnol: arweinyddiaeth, y cwricwlwm ac addysgu, gweithio gydag eraill, rhwydweithiau ymarfer proffesiynol, ymyrraeth a chefnogaeth, a gwelliant ac atebolrwydd. Caiff polisiau a rhaglenni sydd eisoes yn bodoli eu mapio yn y fframwaith a chaiff polisiau i'r dyfodol eu mesur yn erbyn eu cyfraniad i effeithiolrwydd ysgolion.

Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gweithio â'r pedwar consortiwm awdurdod lleol Cymdeithas Cyfarwyddwyr Addysg Cymru. Cyn bo hir, gofynnir i bob un consortiwm bennu'r ysgolion a fydd yn treialu'r fframwaith o fis Medi 2008 ymlaen. Byddwn yn chwilio am gymysgedd o ysgolion cynradd, ysgolion uwchradd, ysgolion arbennig, ysgolion trefol, ysgolion gwledig, ysgolion eglwys, ac ysgolion sy'n gweithredu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Byddwn yn treialu gwahanol ddulliau o weithio. Mewn dwy ardal gonsortiwm, rhoddir hyfforddiant arbennig i benaethiaid a gweithwyr proffesiynol gwella ysgolion awdurdod lleol—fe'u gelwir yn 'swyddogion cyswllt'—a byddant yn cael eu rhyddhau am 25 y cant o'u hamser i weithio â'r ysgolion sy'n cymryd rhan. Yn y ddau gonsortiwm arall, byddwn yn gwahodd yr awdurdodau i integreiddio'r gwaith i'w rhaglenni cyfredol ar gyfer gwella ysgolion. Drwy gydol y flwyddyn beilot, caiff y ffordd y defnyddir y fframwaith ei monitro a'i hasesu. Ar ôl pwyso a mesur yr asesiad, caiff y fframwaith ei gyflwyno o ganol 2009 dros gyfnod o oddeutu tair blynedd. Gobeithiaf y bydd ysgolion yn gweld ei fantais fel offeryn datblygu ac yn ei ddefnyddio wrth symud ymlaen.

Mae pum pennaeth wedi'u secondio o ysgolion cynradd, ysgolion arbennig ac ysgolion uwchradd i weithio â'm hadran i ddatblygu deunyddiau a gaiff eu defnyddio gan yr ysgolion peilot. Bydd £5.1 miliwn ar gael dros y tair blynedd nesaf i ddatblygu a chyflwyno'r fframwaith. Yr wyf hefyd yn rhyddhau £0.5 miliwn ym mhob un o'r tair

educational research, which will include the monitoring and evaluation associated with implementation of the framework.

There will be a full debate on the framework in July. In the meantime, I hope that Members will take the opportunity to read the framework document. It describes a made-in-Wales policy that is drawn from the best international evidence on school effectiveness, which is designed to address the challenges that schools face in Wales.

**William Graham:** The Minister may be surprised to hear me asking questions on this issue, but I am speaking on behalf of my colleague, Alun Cairns, who is attending an important conference on elected Members' pensions in Edinburgh, which I am sure will be of interest to all Members.

I also pay tribute to the continuing good work of the chief inspector and Estyn generally. We often hear criticism of them, but, occasionally, it is worthwhile to record the work that they do on the behalf of the children of Wales in particular.

It is interesting that you have focused on tri-level reform in your statement. You will well know that, for many years, a silo mentality was apparent in education. Hopefully, this will be one way of breaking down those barriers so that all interested parties can make a decent contribution. On the funding, will you be making £6.6 million available over the period, or does the £0.5 million come out of the £5.1 million? I also note that you will bring forward a full debate in July to coincide with the end of the first six months referred to in the framework.

Finally, although everyone here would like to do something different in Wales, what we do must make things better.

**Jane Hutt:** Thank you for those constructive comments. We are building on substantial international evidence, which we are using for the purposes of our ambitions to ensure

blynedd nesaf i gefnogi ymchwil addysgol gymwysedig, a fydd yn cynnwys y gwaith monitro ac arfarnu sy'n gysylltiedig â rhoi'r fframwaith ar waith.

Cynhelir dadl lawn ar y fframwaith ym mis Gorffennaf. Yn y cyfamser, gobeithiaf y bydd Aelodau'n manteisio ar y cyfle i ddarllen dogfen y fframwaith. Mae'n disgrifio polisi a grëwyd yng Nghymru, sy'n deillio o'r dystiolaeth ryngwladol orau ar effeithiolrwydd ysgolion, ac a luniwyd i fynd i'r afael â'r heriau y mae ysgolion yng Nghymru'n eu hwynebu.

**William Graham:** Efallai y bydd y Gweinidog yn synnu fy mod yn gofyn cwestiwn am y pwnc hwn, ond yr wyf yn siarad ar ran fy nghyd-Aelod, Alun Cairns, sy'n mynychu cynhadledd bwysig am bensïynau Aelodau etholedig yng Nghaeredin, a fydd o ddiddordeb i'r holl Aelodau yr wyf yn siŵr.

Hoffwn hefyd roi teyrnged i waith da parhaus y prif arolygydd ac Estyn yn gyffredinol. Clywn feirniadaeth ohonynt yn aml, ond, weithiau, mae'n werth cofnodi'r gwaith a wnânt ar ran plant Cymru'n benodol.

Mae'n ddiddorol eich bod wedi canolbwyntio ar y diwygio ar dair lefel yn eich datganiad. Gwyddoch yn iawn fod agwedd gulfrydig wedi bodoli mewn addysg ers llawer o flynyddoedd. Gobeithio, bydd hwn yn un ffordd o chwalu'r rhwystrau hynny fel y gall pob un sydd â diddordeb wneud cyfraniad teilwng. O ran y cyllid, a fyddwch yn rhyddhau £6.6 miliwn dros y cyfnod hwn, ynteu a yw'r £0.5 miliwn yn dod o'r £5.1 miliwn? Sylwaf hefyd y byddwch yn cyflwyno dadl lawn ym mis Gorffennaf a fydd yn cyd-daro â diwedd y chwe mis cyntaf y cyfeiriwyd ato yn y fframwaith.

I gloi, er y byddai pawb yma'n hoffi gwneud rhywbeth gwahanol yng Nghymru, mae'n rhaid i beth bynnag a wnawn wneud pethau'n well.

**Jane Hutt:** Diolch yn fawr am y sylwadau adeiladol hynny. Yr ydym yn datblygu ar swmp o dystiolaeth ryngwladol, tystiolaeth a ddefnyddiwn at ddibenion ein huchelgeisiau i

that education excels in Wales. What is seen clearly in the international evidence and research is that, if we want to secure improved outcomes for learners, the whole education community must work collaboratively. That is the evidence and that is what we will take forward. That means, in terms of tri-level reform, as you say, that schools, local authorities and the Assembly Government must ensure that their key areas of activity and responsibilities are linked together. We must also learn how we can drive forward improving outcomes for learners across Wales. That will mean that some systems need to change and that we will need to ensure that all levels of the school system are aligned and collaborating as a cohesive whole.

You mentioned cost and budget allocations. In fact, although we are coming to the end of this financial year, we have already allocated £0.35 million for the preparation of the framework. We will allocate £1.3 million for the pilot phase in 2008-09, £3.2 million for the roll-out in 2009-10, and £0.6 million for the roll-out in 2010-11. Clearly, we will have an opportunity when we debate the issue in July to consider the framework further in terms of what it means for all the partners. I am grateful for your comments.

3.30 p.m.

**Janet Ryder:** Thank you for making this statement today. As you said, the Estyn report shows that, while there has been an improvement, there are still areas for concern. It is appropriate that this statement is being made today, to show that the Government is ready to face the challenges that that will bring. It is important that, as we face those challenges, no-one feels stigmatised in any way. Every level, whether a school, a local authority, or the Assembly, has something to learn with regard to the policies that are put in place to make our education system effective and to ensure that it improves.

There is a slight difference between how we achieve effective schools and improving schools. We can look at schools and wonder

sicrhau bod addysg yn rhagori yng Nghymru. Yr hyn a welir yn glir o'r ymchwil a'r dystiolaeth ryngwladol yw, os ydym am sicrhau gwell canlyniadau i ddysgwyr, rhaid i'r gymuned addysgol weithio ar y cyd. Dyna yw'r dystiolaeth a dyna beth y byddwn yn ei yrru ymlaen. Golyga hynny, o ran diwygio ar dair lefel, fel y dywedwch, ei bod yn rhaid i ysgolion, i awdurdodau lleol ac i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad sicrhau bod eu meysydd gweithgaredd a'u dyletswyddau allweddol yn gydgyssylltiedig. Hefyd, rhaid inni ddysgu sut y gallwn fynd â'r broses o wella canlyniadau i ddysgwyr ledled Cymru rhagddi. Golyga hynny y bydd angen i rai systemau newid a bydd angen inni sicrhau bod pob lefel o'r system ysgolion wedi'u cysoni ac yn cydweithio fel un cyfan.

Soniasoch am gostau a'r dyraniadau cyllideb. A dweud y gwir, er ein bod yn dod at derfyn y flwyddyn ariannol hon, yr ydym eisoes wedi dyrannu £0.35 miliwn ar gyfer paratoi'r fframwaith. Byddwn yn dyrannu £1.3 miliwn ar gyfer y cyfnod peilot yn 2008-09, £3.2 miliwn ar gyfer cyflwyno'r fframwaith yn 2009-10, a £0.6 miliwn ar gyfer ei gyflwyno yn 2010-11. Yn amlwg, bydd gennym gyfle wrth gynnal dadl ar y mater ym mis Gorffennaf i bwysu a mesur y fframwaith ymhellach o ran yr hyn y mae'n ei olygu i'r holl bartneriaid. Gwerthfawrogaf eich sylwadau.

**Janet Ryder:** Diolch yn fawr am wneud y datganiad hwn heddiw. Fel y dywedasoch, mae adroddiad Estyn yn dangos, er y cafwyd gwelliant, bod pethau sy'n peri pryder o hyd. Mae'n briodol bod y datganiad hwn yn cael ei wneud heddiw, i ddangos bod y Llywodraeth yn barod i wynebu'r heriau a ddaw yn sgil hynny. Mae'n bwysig, wrth inni wynebu'r heriau hynny, nad oes neb yn teimlo eu bod yn cael eu cyhuddo mewn unrhyw ffordd. Mae gan bob lefel, boed ysgol, awdurdod lleol, neu'r Cynulliad, rywbeth i'w ddysgu ynglŷn â'r polisiau a sefydlir i wneud ein system addysg yn effeithiol ac i sicrhau ei bod yn gwella.

Mae mymryn o wahaniaeth rhwng sut mae sicrhau ysgolion effeithiol a gwella ysgolion. Gallwn edrych ar ysgolion a phendroni pam y

why children from similar backgrounds with similar abilities can achieve quite different results at different schools. Having said that, different results can emerge from different departments within the same school. There are lessons to be learned all around. As you made clear in your statement, this will depend on how we manage that change, how we spread good practice, and how we change a culture, which has perhaps become embedded over a number of years, into one that is more open and more co-operative, and one that shares facilities within schools, across institutions, within authorities and across authorities, so that we can spread that good practice.

I look forward to the debate in July. It will be interesting, because, by then, we should hopefully have some feedback from the two pilots that are being put in place. I would ask the Minister, in that debate, to share the feedback on the pilots as they are being developed and to tell us exactly what is happening to them. They take slightly different approaches. The results will frame the whole thing. This is still in development and we have yet to see which approach works best—is it better to allow professionals time off to go into other institutions to spread that good practice on a more national, equitable basis, or is it perhaps better for authorities to come forward with ideas for improving structures more locally? We may end up with a mix of the two. However, it will be interesting to see which you favour, and I hope that we will have feedback on that in July.

This is a step that we need to take as a country. We have started to plateau and perhaps even slip back in certain areas, which cannot be allowed to happen. There are big changes to the curriculum through the foundation phase and the 14-19 learning pathways. This has to be matched with changes in management and in structures. We look forward to the outcome of this programme.

**Jane Hutt:** Thank you very much, Janet. I would like to take the opportunity to

mae plant o gefndiroedd tebyg yn gallu cael canlyniadau hollol wahanol mewn gwahanol ysgolion. Wedi dweud hynny, gall canlyniadau gwahanol ddod o wahanol adrannau o fewn yr un ysgol. Mae gwersi i'w dysgu ym mhobman. Fel y dywedasoch yn glir yn eich datganiad, bydd hyn yn dibynnu ar sut y rheolwn y newid hwnnw, sut y lledaenwn arfer da, a sut y newidiwn ddiwylliant sydd, efallai, wedi gwreiddio dros nifer o flynyddoedd, i fod yn un sy'n fwy agored ac yn fwy cydweithredol, un sy'n rhannu cyfleusterau o fewn ysgolion, ar draws sefydliadau, o fewn awdurdodau ac ar draws awdurdodau, er mwyn inni allu lledaenu'r arfer da hwnnw.

Yr wyf yn edrych ymlaen at y ddadl ym mis Gorffennaf. Bydd yn ddiddorol, oherwydd, erbyn hynny, dylem, gobeithio, fod wedi cael adborth o'r ddau gynllun peilot sy'n cael eu sefydlu. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog, yn y ddadl honno, rannu'r adborth o'r cynlluniau peilot wrth iddynt gael eu datblygu a dweud wrthym yn union beth sydd yn digwydd iddynt. Maent yn mynd ati o gyfeiriadau ychydig yn wahanol. Bydd y canlyniadau'n fframio'r holl beth. Mae hyn yn dal i gael ei ddatblygu ac nid ydym wedi gweld eto pa ddull sy'n gweithio orau—a ydyw'n well caniatáu amser rhydd i athrawon i fynd i sefydliadau eraill i ledaenu'r arfer da hwnnw ar sail decach, fwy cenedlaethol, ynteu a ydyw'n well efallai i awdurdodau ddod ymlaen â syniadau ar gyfer gwella strwythurau'n fwy lleol? Efallai mai cymysgedd o'r ddau a ddewiswn yn y diwedd. Fodd bynnag, bydd yn ddiddorol gweld pa un a fydd yn well gennych chi, a gobeithiaf y cawn adborth ar hynny ym mis Gorffennaf.

Dyma gam y mae angen inni ei gymryd fel gwlad. Yr ydym wedi dechrau lefelu allan a hyd yn oed lithro'n ôl efallai mewn rhai meysydd, ac ni ellir caniatáu i hynny ddigwydd. Mae newidiadau mawr i'r cwricwlwm drwy'r cyfnod sylfaen a'r llwybrau dysgu 14-19. Rhaid wrth newidiadau ym maes rheolaeth ac mewn strwythurau i gyfateb i hyn. Yr ydym yn edrych ymlaen at ganlyniad y rhaglen hon.

**Jane Hutt:** Diolch yn fawr, Janet. Hoffwn gymryd y cyfle i groesawu'r prif arolygwr



welcome the new chief inspector, Dr Bill Maxwell, to Wales. Estyn published its annual report today, which we will have an opportunity to debate. As you said, Janet, the publication of the report and my statement today represent a timely way of bringing together the Government's response to the concerns that arise from the Estyn report. The report shows continuing improvement, and it shows substantial improvement in the six years since the last inspection. However, it also shows that there is more to be done where schools do not make that step change; where they perhaps just maintain the level that they achieved under the previous inspection. We want to make that step change as a result of this collaborative agenda and in terms of this tri-level reform. Building on the good outcomes of the Estyn inspection provides us with a platform for the conferences, starting this week, which will launch the school effectiveness programme. Having checked today, I know that over 800 people have already signed up to the four conferences that are being held over the next week or so. Every headteacher has been invited, and the teaching unions, the professionals, the academics, and the local authorities are all on board.

It may be a bit early to look at how the pilot is developing, and to assess its outcomes, in the July debate. However, by that time, there may be more of an understanding of what the school effectiveness framework will mean for our schools, because there will be information in the public and policy domain. Many Members are, of course, engaged with schools in their constituencies, and some are also engaged through their work as governors.

Research has been undertaken by Professor Michael Fullan from Canada. There has been a considerable improvement in schools as a result of his work, and he has come to Wales to advise us. He and others have clearly demonstrated the links between tri-level working and improved outcomes for children and young people. They say that serving professionals learning from other serving professionals is particularly effective when it

newydd, Dr Bill Maxwell, i Gymru. Cyhoeddodd Estyn ei adroddiad blynyddol heddiw, a chawn gyfle i'w drafod. Fel y dywedaso, Janet, mae cyhoeddi'r adroddiad ynghyd â'm datganiad innau heddiw'n rhoi cyfle amserol inni gydlyn ymateb y Llywodraeth i'r pryderon sy'n codi o adroddiad Estyn. Mae'r adroddiad yn dangos gwellhad parhaus, ac mae'n dangos gwelliant sylweddol yn y chwe mis oddi ar yr arolwg diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, mae'n dangos hefyd fod mwy i'w wneud lle nad yw ysgolion yn gwneud y newid sylweddol hwnnw; lle nad ydynt ond yn cynnal y lefel a gawsant dan yr arolwg blaenorol, efallai. Mae arnom eisiau gwneud y newid sylweddol hwnnw yn sgil yr agenda cydweithiol hwn ac yn nhermau'r diwygiad tair lefel hwn. Bydd adeiladu ar ganlyniadau da arolwg Estyn yn darparu llwyfan inni ar gyfer y cynadleddau, gan ddechrau'r wythnos hon, a fydd yn lansio'r rhaglen effeithiolrwydd ysgolion. Wedi edrych heddiw, gwn fod dros 800 o bobl eisoes wedi rhoi eu henwau i lawr ar gyfer y pedair cynhadledd a gynhelir yn yr wythnos nesaf. Mae pob prifathro neu brifathrawes wedi cael gwahoddiad, ac mae undebau'r athrawon, aelodau'r proffesiwn, yr academyddion a'r awdurdodau lleol i gyd yda ni.

Efallai y bydd braidd yn gynnar i edrych ar y modd y mae'r cynllun peilot yn dod yn ei flaen, ac asesu ei ganlyniadau, yn nadl mis Gorffennaf. Fodd bynnag, erbyn yr adeg honno, efallai y bydd mwy o ddealltwriaeth am yr hyn y bydd y fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion yn ei olygu i'n hysgolion, oherwydd bydd gwybodaeth ar gael ym maes polisi ac yn gyhoeddus. Mae llawer o Aelodau, wrth gwrs, yn ymwneud ag ysgolion yn eu hetholaethau, ac mae rhai'n ymwneud hefyd drwy eu gwaith fel llywodraethwyr.

Mae ymchwil wedi'i wneud gan yr Athro Michael Fullan o Ganada. Cafwyd cryn welliant mewn ysgolion yn sgil ei waith, ac mae wedi dod i Gymru i roi cyngor inni. Mae ef ac eraill wedi dangos yn glir y cysylltiadau rhwng gweithio ar dair lefel a gwella canlyniadau i blant a phobl ifanc. Dywedant fod cael athrawon i ddysgu oddi wrth athrawon eraill yn arbennig o effeithiol o ran gwella ysgolion. Gwyddom felly pan fydd

comes to school improvement. We know therefore that when teachers make those changes, and when headteachers are leaders who see the development in schools, they are often in the best position to support schools that need to move forward in raising expectations and opportunities.

It is therefore about the leadership from schools, with the support of the local authority. We need to bear in mind that the school is at the heart of a community and that there are other social factors to be considered. The work on the children and young people's plans, and the partnerships, are crucial in terms of the wider factors of children's services, to enable a school to be effective. The impact on school performance is powerful and deep; it affects practice, attitudes, and, ultimately, outcomes in terms of the learning and wellbeing of children and young people—that is what the framework will achieve.

**Kirsty Williams:** I thank the Minister for her statement and for the copy of the school effectiveness framework that she has supplied this afternoon.

The programme for international student assessment results were a wake-up call for everyone in Wales who thought that we were making the progress that we should be making when based on international comparisons. If we are to compete economically in the world of work, we need to ensure that our children attain the highest levels of qualifications, as compared with their international counterparts, and the PISA results showed that, in many areas, we are not doing that. Today's Estyn report worryingly points to the fact that those institutions that are struggling are those very institutions that find it most difficult to move up a gear and to deliver better for their children. There are many schools where improvements can be pointed out. However, those schools that are struggling the most find it the most difficult to change, and we need to concentrate on what we can do to support those institutions to make the changes that they want to make on behalf of their children.

However, school effectiveness frameworks

athrawon yn gwneud y newidiadau hynny, a phan fydd prifathrawon yn arweinwyr sydd yn gweld y datblygiad mewn ysgolion, mai hwy yn aml sydd yn y sefyllfa orau i gefnogi ysgolion y mae angen iddynt symud ymlaen o safbwynt codi disgwyliadau a chreu cyfleon.

Mae a wnelo hyn felly â'r arweinyddiaeth o'r ysgolion, gyda chefnogaeth yr awdurdod lleol. Mae angen cofio bod yr ysgol wrth galon y gymuned a bod ffactorau cymdeithasol eraill i'w hystyried. Mae'r gwaith ar y cynlluniau plant a phobl ifanc, a'r partneriaethau, yn hanfodol yn nhermau ffactorau lletach gwasanaethau plant, i alluogi ysgol i fod yn effeithiol. Mae'r effaith ar berfformiad ysgol yn rymus a dwfn; mae'n effeithio ar ymarfer, agweddau ac, yn y pen draw, canlyniadau yn nhermau dysg a lles plant a phobl ifanc—dyna beth y gwnaiff y fframwaith ei gyflawni.

**Kirsty Williams:** Diolch i'r Gweinidog am ei datganiad ac am y copi o'r fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion y mae hi wedi'i ddarparu inni y prynhawn yma.

Roedd canlyniadau'r Rhaglen Ryngwladol Asesu Myfyrwyr yn ysgytwad i bawb yng Nghymru a oedd yn meddwl ein bod yn symud ymlaen fel y dylem yn seiliedig ar gymariaethau rhyngwladol. Os ydym am gystadlu'n economaidd ym myd gwaith, mae angen inni sicrhau y caiff ein plant y lefelau uchaf o gymwysterau, o gymharu â'u cymheiriaid mewn gwledydd eraill, a dangosodd canlyniadau'r Rhaglen Ryngwladol nad ydym, mewn llawer maes, yn gwneud hynny. Mae adroddiad Estyn heddiw yn peri pryder wrth amlygu'r ffaith mai'r sefydliadau sydd yn cael trafferth yw'r union sefydliadau hynny sy'n ei chael hi'n anodd symud i fyny gêr a rhoi gwell darpariaeth i'w plant. Mae llawer o ysgolion lle gellir nodi gwelliannau. Fodd bynnag, yr ysgolion hynny sydd mewn mwyaf o helynt yw'r rhai sy'n ei chael hi'n anoddaf newid, ac mae angen inni ganolbwyntio ar ystyried beth y gallwn ei wneud i gefnogi'r sefydliadau hynny i wneud y newidiadau y mae arnynt eisiau eu gwneud ar ran eu plant.

Fodd bynnag, dim ond rhan o'r darlun yw

are only a part of the picture in driving up attainment levels in Wales. The Minister will be all too aware of successive Welsh Assembly Government reports that have made the link between levels of disadvantage and academic achievement and attainment. Until this Government cracks the problem of child poverty, we will be limited in our ability to achieve the improvements in levels of attainment that I am sure Members across the Chamber would like to see.

I looked carefully at the wording of the framework document. It notes that,

‘educational reform is most effective when designed and implemented collaboratively and coherently through all levels of the system’.

In her statement, the Minister failed to tell us about the background to this framework document. Despite the warm words about collaboration and coherence through all the different levels, the fact is that, only a fortnight ago, Welsh local government was saying that it would not co-operate with the requirements of this document because of the way in which the Minister was planning to implement it. Only a fortnight ago, local government went back to the Minister’s officials to say, ‘We will not have anything to do with it unless you change the way in which you plan to implement it’. So much for co-operation through the various levels of government.

I appreciate that the Minister has, to put it politely, ‘overcapacity issues’ within the Department for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills as a result of the mergers of outside bodies with the Assembly Government. However, those overcapacity issues cannot be used to duplicate services that are already being delivered by local government. Therefore, will the Minister confirm this afternoon that she has scrapped the idea of regional educational area improvement teams, that they will not be put in place, and that, instead, she will work with local government to create a joint-governed organisation, at a national level, to achieve the implementation of this framework? Will she also confirm that those people involved

fframweithiau effeithiolrwydd ysgolion o ran codi lefelau cyrhaeddiad yng Nghymru. Bydd y Gweinidog yn gwybod yn iawn am gyfres o adroddiadau gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru sydd wedi gwneud y cysylltiad rhwng lefelau anfantais a chyflawniad a chyrrhaeddiad academaidd. Oni all y Llywodraeth hon ddatrys problem tlodi plant, bydd cyfyngiad ar ein gallu i sicrhau’r gwelliannau mewn lefelau cyrhaeddiad yr wyf yn siŵr yr hoffai Aelodau ar draws y Siambr eu gweld.

Edrychais yn fanwl ar eiriad y ddogfen fframwaith. Mae’n nodi bod,

‘diwygiad addysgol yn fwyaf effeithiol pan gaiff ei ddylunio a’i weithredu ar y cyd ac yn gydlynol drwy bob lefel o’r system’.

Yn ei datganiad, ni ddywedodd y Gweinidog wrthym am y cefndir i’r ddogfen fframwaith hon. Er gwaethaf y geiriau cynnes am gydweithio a chydlynu drwy’r holl wahanol lefelau, y ffaith yw bod llywodraeth leol Cymru, gwta bythefnos yn ôl, yn dweud na wnâi gydweithredu â gofynion y ddogfen hon oherwydd y ffordd yr oedd y Gweinidog yn bwriadu ei gweithredu. Dim ond bythefnos yn ôl, aeth llywodraeth leol yn ôl at swyddogion y Gweinidog i ddweud, ‘Ni chawn ddim i’w wneud â hi oni newidiwch y modd y bwriadwch ei gweithredu’. Dyna werth y sôn am gydweithredu drwy wahanol lefelau llywodraeth.

Sylweddolaf fod gan y Gweinidog, a’i roi yn gwrtais, ‘broblemau capasiti gormodol’ o fewn yr Adran Plant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau o ganlyniad i uno cyrff allanol â Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, ni ellir defnyddio’r problemau capasiti gormodol hynny i ddyblygu gwasanaethau sydd eisoes yn cael eu darparu gan lywodraeth leol. Felly, a wnaiff y Gweinidog gadarnhau y prynhawn yma ei bod hi wedi rhoi’r gorau i’r syniad o sefydlu timau gwella ardaloedd addysgol rhanbarthol, na chânt eu sefydlu, ac, yn lle hynny, y gwnaiff hi weithio gyda llywodraeth leol i greu sefydliad a lywodraethir ar y cyd, ar lefel genedlaethol, i sicrhau y gweithredir y fframwaith hwn? A wnaiff hi gadarnhau

in the implementation of this framework will have the level of expertise and recent classroom and front-line experience to command the respect that they will need to command when working with local authorities? It is difficult for front-line professionals to take lessons on how to improve their services from people who, perhaps, were last in a classroom when they were in school themselves.

3.40 p.m.

The Minister must ensure that there is no duplication of roles. The document clearly states the responsibility of the individual school, the responsibility of the individual local education authority and the role and responsibility of the National Assembly for Wales. Those responsibilities are distinct, so there is no need for some of the ways in which the Minister was planning to implement the framework, and I hope that she will state again today that she is not planning to go down that road.

Finally, while I welcome the new money provided to support the implementation of the framework, I would raise the issue of further education. Not all of our young people are being educated in the school environment, as many are educated post 16 in the further education sector in various colleges. I have repeatedly asked the Minister and the Deputy Minister what plans the Assembly Government have to implement a FE effectiveness framework to ensure that those young people studying in FE institutions get the opportunity to study in institutions that are targeted in the same ways as schools. We have the money and the framework for schools, and there is money and a framework available for FE in England, yet, despite repeated questions, I cannot get any answers from the Minister or the Deputy Minister about their plans for FE. Hearing that the Minister has similar plans for the FE sector would be welcome.

**Jane Hutt:** Thank you, Kirsty. I am glad that we will have a passionate supporter of our school effectiveness framework from among the Liberal Democrats; I would not expect

hefyd y bydd y bobl a fydd yn ymwneud â gweithredu'r fframwaith hwn yn meddu ar y lefel arbenigedd a'r profiad diweddar yn yr ystafell ddosbarth a'r rheng flaen i hawlio'r parch y bydd angen iddynt ei hawlio wrth weithio gydag awdurdodau lleol? Mae'n anodd i weithwyr proffesiynol y rheng flaen gymryd gwersi ar sut i wella'u gwasanaethau gan bobl a fu mewn ystafell ddosbarth ddiwethaf, efallai, pan oeddent hwy'n blant ysgol eu hunain.

Rhaid i'r Gweinidog sicrhau na ddyblygir swyddogaethau. Mae'r ddogfen yn datgan yn glir beth yw cyfrifoldeb yr ysgol unigol, cyfrifoldeb yr awdurdod addysg lleol unigol a rôl a chyfrifoldeb Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Mae'r cyfrifoldebau hynny ar wahân, felly nid oes dim angen am rai o'r dulliau yr oedd y Gweinidog yn bwriadu eu defnyddio i weithredu'r fframwaith, a gobeithio y gwnaiff hi ddatgan eto heddiw nad oes ganddi gynlluniau i fynd i lawr y ffordd honno.

Yn olaf, er fy mod yn croesawu'r arian newydd a ddarperir i gynnal gweithrediad y fframwaith, hoffwn godi cwestiwn addysg bellach. Nid pawb o'n pobl ifanc sydd yn cael eu haddysgu mewn ysgolion, gan fod llawer yn cael eu haddysgu ôl-16 yn y sector addysg bellach mewn amryfal golegau. Yr wyf wedi gofyn dro ar ôl tro i'r Gweinidog a'r Dirprwy Weinidog pa gynlluniau sydd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i weithredu fframwaith effeithiolrwydd i addysg bellach i sicrhau bod pobl ifanc sydd yn astudio mewn sefydliadau addysg bellach yn cael y cyfle i astudio mewn sefydliadau a dargedir yn yr un modd ag ysgolion. Mae'r arian a'r fframwaith gennym ar gyfer ysgolion, ac mae arian a fframwaith ar gael ar gyfer addysg bellach yn Lloegr, eto, er gofyn dro ar ôl tro, ni allaf gael unrhyw atebion gan y Gweinidog na'r Dirprwy Weinidog am eu cynlluniau ar gyfer addysg bellach. Croesewid gwybodaeth fod gan y Gweinidog gynlluniau tebyg ar gyfer y sector addysg bellach.

**Jane Hutt:** Diolch, Kirsty. Yr wyf yn falch y bydd gennym gefnogwr angerddol i'n fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion o blith y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol; ni ddisgwyliwn

anything less.

I will start with your point about the PISA results because they are key in this. You may have heard Professor Ken Reid on *Good Morning Wales* this morning talking about his national behaviour and attendance review, which he and his team have been working on over the last few years. The review will come forward to the Assembly as the subject of a statement and a debate. He was saying how important it is that we now use that benchmark in Wales and that we are part of that international benchmark. The school effectiveness framework has been developed in recognition of the need to ensure that we move forward, particularly in relation to literacy and mathematics, in terms of the benchmark that is now applied to us.

You make an important point, Kirsty, about the fact that the issues are wider issues of the One Wales Government, and they have a particular impact in relation to our priorities on tackling child poverty. Education outcomes do not depend only on schools, and, as the framework highlights, in terms of the context, they are influenced by a range of factors that includes poverty, family circumstances, housing and health. We recognise that researchers have long shown that social disadvantage is the single biggest obstacle to achievement in education, and I want to repeat that today: social disadvantage is the biggest obstacle to achievement in education in Wales. That is why we invested in the RAISE programme, and that investment is having a significant impact in targeting those children. Local authorities, therefore, must be part of the tri-level reform, because they are responsible not just for education, but for social services and economic development, and they have responsibilities in relation to the wider issues that impact on children, such as health. Therefore, those links are important in terms of the tri-level approach.

The collaboration agenda is proven and we will take that forward. However, I have to put the record straight in terms of the issues relating to a separate discussion with the Welsh Local Government Association in

ddim llai.

Dechreuaf gyda'ch pwynt am ganlyniadau'r Rhaglen Ryngwladol Asesu Myfyrwyr, oherwydd maent yn allweddol yn hyn. Efallai i chi glywed yr Athro Ken Reid ar *Good Morning Wales* y bore yma'n sôn am ei adolygiad cenedlaethol o ymddygiad a phresenoldeb, y mae ef a'i dîm wedi bod yn gweithio arno am yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf. Daw'r adolygiad ymlaen i'r Cynulliad yn destun datganiad a dadl. Dweud yr oedd mor bwysig yw hi ein bod yn defnyddio'r meincnod hwnnw'n awr yng Nghymru a'n bod yn rhan o'r meincnod rhyngwladol. Mae'r fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion wedi'i ddatblygu gan gydnabod yr angen i sicrhau ein bod yn symud ymlaen, yn enwedig yng nghyswllt llythrennedd a mathemateg, yn nhermau'r meincnod sydd bellach yn berthnasol i ni.

Gwnaethoch bwynt pwysig, Kirsty, am y ffaith bod y cwestiynau'n gwestiynau ehangach am Lywodraeth Cymru'n Un, ac y cânt effaith arbennig o ran ein blaenoriaethau ar fynd i'r afael â thlodi plant. Nid yw canlyniadau addysg yn dibynnu ar ysgolion yn unig, ac, fel y dengys y fframwaith, yn nhermau'r cyd-destun, dylanwedir arnynt gan amrediad o ffactorau sy'n cynnwys tlodi, amgylchiadau teuluol, tai ac iechyd. Cydnabyddwn fod ymchwilwyr wedi dangos ers tro mai anfantais gymdeithasol yw'r un rhwystr mwyaf i gyflawni mewn addysg, ac mae arnaf eisiau ailadrodd hynny heddiw: anfantais gymdeithasol yw'r rhwystr mwyaf i gyflawni mewn addysg yng Nghymru. Dyna pam y bu inni fuddsoddi yn rhaglen Rhagori, ac mae'r buddsoddiad hwnnw'n cael effaith arwyddocaol ar dargedu'r plant hynny. Rhaid i awdurdodau lleol, felly, fod yn rhan o'r diwygiad tair lefel, oherwydd maent yn gyfrifol nid yn unig am addysg, ond am wasanaethau cymdeithasol a datblygu economaidd, ac mae ganddynt gyfrifoldebau o ran materion ehangach sydd yn effeithio ar blant, fel iechyd. Felly, mae'r cysylltiadau hynny'n bwysig yn nhermau'r dull tair lefel.

Mae'r agenda cydweithio wedi'i brofi ac awn ymlaen â hynny. Fodd bynnag, rhaid imi gofnodi'r gwirionedd o ran y materion yn ymwneud â thrafodaeth ar wahân gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru

relation to our joint ambitions for improving education in Wales. We have a school effectiveness framework that the Welsh Local Government Association and the Association of Directors of Education in Wales are fully signed up to. I am also pleased to have had many robust and positive meetings with Councillor John Davies and colleagues on this matter.

There have been some issues about the reorganisation of my Department for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills, but that is totally separate from the issue of the school effectiveness framework, and I want to put that on the record today. I want to reassure you, Kirsty, that there have been some positive discussions in very recent days about how to ensure that the resources of my department, and of local authorities, can be used to our mutual advantage. That is the point. You have made it, and I am reiterating it today: it is about getting mutual advantage from the resources and the skills that we have. My department must share those with the local education authorities, so that we work in partnership, not just to deliver the school effectiveness framework, but also to ensure that we are moving forward across the board on those wider issues that will deliver better outcomes. I hope that I have set the record straight. I will keep you updated on the positive discussions that I have had with the Welsh Local Government Association on this matter.

Kirsty asked an important question, and I have talked extensively about the importance of professionals learning from and supporting each other, and about taking that forward with the school leaders. We now have five full-time equivalents of headteachers working in the Assembly Government, alongside the civil servants, to help us to work out how to drive this programme forward across Wales, in partnership with the consortia. We will then train a number of associates—and I described them as school improvement professionals, or headteachers in my statement. We want to reach the successful people in our schools in Wales and ask them to come to work with us, because they are the ones who can give schools the lift that they need, and show them how to make improvements. We can then take the people

ynghlŷn â'n cyd-uchelgais i wella addysg yng Nghymru. Mae gennym fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion y mae Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru a Chymdeithas y Cyfarwyddwr Addysg yn aelodau llawn ohono. Yr wyf yn falch hefyd o fod wedi cael sawl cyfarfod bywiog a chadarnhaol gyda'r Cynghorydd John Davies a chyd-Aelodau ynghlŷn â'r mater hwn.

Cafwyd rhai materion ynghylch ad-drefnu fy Adran Plant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau, ond mae hwnnw'n gwbl annibynnol ar y mater fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion, ac yr wyf am i hynny gael ei gofnodi heddiw. Yr wyf am eich sicrhau, Kirsty, y cafwyd rhai trafodaethau cadarnhaol yn y dyddiau diweddar iawn ynghlŷn â sut i sicrhau y gellir defnyddio adnoddau fy adran, a rhai awdurdodau lleol, er budd y naill a'r llall. Dyna'r pwynt. Yr ydych wedi'i wneud ac fe'i hategaf heddiw: mae'n ymwneud â chael cyd-fudd o'r adnoddau a'r sgiliau sydd gennym. Rhaid i'm hadran rannu'r rheini gyda'r awdurdodau addysg lleol, er mwyn inni weithio mewn partneriaeth, nid dim ond i gyflawni'r fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion, ond hefyd i sicrhau ein bod yn symud ymlaen ar draws y bwrdd gyda'r materion ehangach hynny a fydd yn cyflawni gwell canlyniadau. Gobeithio fy mod wedi esbonio'r sefyllfa. Fe'ch hysbysaf yn rheolaidd o'r trafodaethau cadarnhaol yr wyf wedi eu cael gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ynghylch y mater hwn.

Gofynnodd Kirsty gwestiwn pwysig, ac yr wyf wedi siarad yn helaeth ynghlŷn â pha mor bwysig yw hi i aelodau'r proffesiwn ddysgu oddi wrth, a chefnogi, ei gilydd ac ynghlŷn â gweithredu ar hynny gydag arweinwyr yr ysgolion. Mae gennym yn awr yr hyn sydd gyfwerth â phum pennaeth yn gweithio llawn amser yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ochr yn ochr â'r gweision sifil, i'n helpu i ganfod sut i yrru'r rhaglen hon yn ei blaen ledled Cymru, mewn partneriaeth â'r consortia. Byddwn wedyn yn hyfforddi nifer o gysylltwyr—ac fe'u disgrifiais fel gweithwyr gwella ysgolion proffesiynol, neu benaethiaid yn fy natganiad. Mae arnom eisiau cyrraedd y bobl lwyddiannus yn ein hysgolion yng Nghymru a gofyn iddynt ddod i weithio gyda ni, oherwydd hwy yw'r bobl sy'n gallu rhoi'r hwb y mae ei angen ar ysgolion, a dangos

at the sharp end and train them. We will trial the schools effectiveness framework in pilot schools during the 2008-09 school year, and our funding enables those associates to spend 25 per cent of their time with the pilot schools to offer developmental support. That had to be funded to ensure that their own schools were not disadvantaged.

It is always great to start a day, as I am sure you all know, with a visit to a successful school like Maes yr Haul Primary School in Bridgend, and to see the impact an effective headteacher can have on the spirit and development of a whole school. Maes yr Haul is an incredible school, with eight new, extended classrooms, and a school hall. I saw a schools council meeting of future politicians that could have put us all in the shade. There was a school choir, and children who told Carwyn Jones and me about a business that they had set up. We know what makes an effective school, and so do these professionals, so we must give them the money, the time, the tools and the backing that they need. I think that Members from across the Assembly will give that backing during our discussion on this statement.

We want every school to be like the school that I visited today. Every school must have that opportunity, wherever it is. If a school needs extra resources because of social disadvantage, we must give it that. However, it is not enough just to put in the resources; you also need the leadership to turn this around. Therefore, the resources and the leadership must go hand in hand.

Your point about further education is perhaps for another day and another debate, because today's statement is on the schools effectiveness framework. However, I will draw attention to the very good results in the chief inspector's report today. There are some very positive messages about further education, and it is important that we acknowledge the outstanding work that is being done. The chief inspector refers to

iddynt sut i sicrhau gwelliannau. Gallwn wedyn gymryd y bobl yn y rheng flaen a'u hyfforddi. Byddwn yn treialu'r fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion mewn ysgolion peilot ym mlwyddyn ysgol 2008-09, ac mae ein cyllid yn caniatáu i'r cysylltwyr hynny dreulio 25 y cant o'u hamser gyda'r ysgolion peilot yn cynnig cefnogaeth ddatblygu. Yr oedd yn rhaid cyllido ar gyfer hynny er mwyn sicrhau nad oedd eu hysgolion eu hunain yn cael eu gosod dan anfantais.

Mae bob amser yn wych dechrau diwrnod, fel yr wyf yn sicr y gŵyr pob un ohonoch, gydag ymweliad ag ysgol lwyddiannus megis Ysgol Gynradd Maes yr Haul ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, a gweld yr effaith y gall pennaeth effeithiol ei chael ar ysbryd a datblygiad ysgol gyfan. Mae Maes yr Haul yn ysgol anhygoel, gydag wyth dosbarth newydd, estynedig, a neuadd ysgol. Gwelais gyfarfod cyngor ysgol gyda gwleidyddion y dyfodol a fyddai wedi gallu dysgu gwers neu ddwy i ni. Yr oedd côr ysgol yno, a phlant a soniodd wrth Carwyn Jones a minnau am fusnes a sefydlwyd ganddynt. Gwyddom beth sy'n creu ysgol effeithiol, ac mae'r aelodau hyn o'r proffesiwn yn gwybod hefyd, felly rhaid inni roi iddynt yr arian, yr amser, y cyfarpar a'r gefnogaeth y mae eu hangen arnynt. Credaf y bydd Aelodau ar draws y Cynulliad yn rhoi'r gefnogaeth honno wrth inni drafod y datganiad hwn.

Yr ydym am i bob ysgol fod fel yr un yr ymwelais â hi heddiw. Rhaid i bob ysgol gael y cyfle hwnnw, lle bynnag y mae. Os oes angen adnoddau ychwanegol ar ysgol oherwydd anfantais cymdeithasol, rhaid inni roi hynny iddi. Fodd bynnag, nid yw cyfrannu adnoddau yn ddigon ynddo'i hun; mae angen yr arweiniad hefyd i newid y sefyllfa. O'r herwydd, rhaid i'r adnoddau a'r arweiniad fynd law yn llaw â'i gilydd.

Efallai fod eich pwynt am addysg bellach yn rhywbeth i'w drafod ar ddiwrnod arall ac mewn dadl arall, oherwydd mae datganiad heddiw yn glŷn â'r fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion. Fodd bynnag, tynnaf sylw at y canlyniadau da iawn yn adroddiad y prif arolygydd heddiw. Ceir rhai negeseuon cadarnhaol iawn am addysg bellach, ac mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cydnabod y gwaith aruthrol sy'n cael ei

colleges of further education exceeding the Welsh Assembly Government's targets, so let us put that on the record. So many colleges achieved grades 1 and 2 in their delivery of further education. The Webb report includes more opportunities to improve the delivery and effectiveness of further education, but, today, let us congratulate further education, and acknowledge the achievements that have been publicised in the Estyn report.

3.50 p.m.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** I welcome this report. I agree with many of the points made by other Members, so I do not need to repeat those. When I listened to the lunchtime radio programme today, if I heard him correctly, a spokesperson from NUT Cymru referred to the framework plan as being punitive rather than supportive. I do not quite understand why he made that point, particularly having listened to your statement now. However, will you confirm that this is not a punitive plan, but one that will build on good practice as it is identified? Will you involve practitioners at a high level, as well as representatives of LEAs and other educational establishments, so that it is not a matter of lecturing to teaching professionals, but one of drawing on their good practice and good work and ensuring that it is spread out?

If I were to agree with just one point in Kirsty's statement, it would be that on the importance of taking disadvantage into account in any realistic framework. That radio programme drew a comparison between Oakdale Comprehensive School in the Caerphilly borough and Cardiff High School, but the reporter failed to mention the significant differences between them, in terms of parental income, parental support, and the social advantages in Cardiff as compared with the Caerphilly borough. However, those issues must be taken into account if the plan is to be realistic, as must collaboration between learning providers. As the 14-19 learning pathways programme is rolled out, it will not only be schools that are involved in the delivery of learning, so we must ensure proper, joined-up thinking

wneud. Cyfeiria'r prif arolygydd at golegau addysg bellach yn rhagori ar dargedau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, felly gadewch inni gofnodi hynny. Cyrhaeddodd cynifer o golegau raddau 1 a 2 wrth ddarparu addysg bellach. Mae adroddiad Webb yn cynnwys mwy o gyfleoedd i wella darpariaeth ac effeithiolrwydd addysg bellach, ond, heddiw, gadewch inni longyfarch addysg bellach, a chydabod y cyflawniadau a gyhoeddwyd yn adroddiad Estyn.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn. Cytunaf â nifer o'r pwyntiau a godwyd gan Aelodau eraill, felly nid oes angen imi eu hailadrodd. Wrth wrando ar y rhaglen radio amser cinio heddiw, os clywais ef yn gywir, cyfeiriodd llefarydd ar ran Undeb Cenedlaethol yr Athrawon, Cymru at y cynllun fframwaith fel rhywbeth a oedd yn cosbi nid yn cefnogi. Nid wyf yn llawn ddeall pam iddo wneud y pwynt hwnnw, yn enwedig ar ôl clywed eich datganiad yn awr. Fodd bynnag, a wnewch gadarnhau nad yw hwn yn gynllun cosbol, ond yn un a fydd yn adeiladu ar arferion da wrth iddynt gael eu canfod? A wnewch gynnwys ymarferwyr ar lefel uchel, yn ogystal â chynrychiolwyr AALlau a sefydliadau addysgol eraill, er mwyn sicrhau nad yw'n fater o roi darlithoedd i aelodau'r proffesiwn addysgu, ond yn un o ddefnyddio eu harferion da a'u gwaith da a sicrhau ei fod yn cael ei daenu?

Pe bawn yn cytuno ag ond un pwynt yn natganiad Kirsty, hwnnw fyddai pwysigrwydd ystyried anfantais mewn unrhyw fframwaith realistig. Yr oedd y rhaglen radio honno yn cymharu Ysgol Gyfun Oakdale ym mwrdeistref Caerffili ac Ysgol Uwchradd Caerdydd, ond methodd y newyddiadurwr â sôn am y gwahaniaethau sylweddol rhyngddynt, o ran incwm rhieni, cefnogaeth rhieni, a manteision cymdeithasol Caerdydd o'i gymharu â bwrdeistref Caerffili. Fodd bynnag, rhaid ystyried y materion hynny os yw'r cynllun i fod yn realistig, yn ogystal â chydweithredu rhwng darparwyr dysgu. Wrth i'r rhaglen llwybrau dysgu 14-19 gael ei chyflwyno, nid dim ond ysgolion fydd yn ymwneud â darparu dysgu, felly rhaid inni sicrhau athroniaeth ddi-dor, briodol rhwng colegau AB a darparwyr dysgu



between FE colleges and work-based learning providers where they collaborate with local schools in the provision of education, training and learning.

Finally, do you agree that we must get this right, because education is arguably the best weapon that we have to break that link between where you are born and what you can achieve?

**Jane Hutt:** On your first point, I did not hear the interview on the radio at lunchtime, but I assure you that the teaching unions have been fully involved. Meetings have been held with the unions to discuss the framework, and they were well represented at the roadshows last week. I ensured that our social partners were engaged, as they are part of the tri-level reform, as far as I am concerned. I also know that many unions are sending representatives to the conferences. They have been invited and the seconded headteachers are discussing the framework in meetings and briefings throughout Wales. Our teachers are crucial: it is they who will make the difference and make the changes. In my meetings with the teaching unions to discuss the school effectiveness framework, and when I have spoken at their national conferences, that has been a key part of my speech and consultation with them, because it is about the contributions that they can make.

I am glad to have the opportunity to say that this is not about blaming or targeting schools. The school effectiveness framework is about ensuring that our approach is about building relationships across levels, to put the learner at the heart of education policy and to help schools to succeed. Some have tried to say that this is about targeting failing schools. However, the whole ethos of tri-level reform is that failure is the failure of the system as a whole, which is why we are talking about reform at those levels. This is not about establishing hit lists or setting new targets; it is about building relationships across the board, and ensuring that we have a new way of thinking about schools to make them more effective.

On Kirsty's contribution, it is crucial that we recognise the link with social disadvantage. I

seiliedig ar waith lle byddant yn cydweithredu gydag ysgolion lleol i ddarparu addysg, hyfforddiant a dysgu.

Yn olaf, a gytunwch ei bod yn rhaid inni daro'r nod gyda hyn, oherwydd gellir dadlau mai addysg yw'r arf gorau a feddwn i dorri'r cyswllt hwnnw rhwng man eich geni a'r hyn y gallwch ei gyflawni?

**Jane Hutt:** O ran eich pwynt cyntaf, ni chlywais y cyfweiliad ar y radio amser cinio, ond gallaf eich sicrhau bod yr undebau dysgu wedi cael eu cynnwys yn llawn. Cynhaliwyd cyfarfodydd gyda'r undebau i drafod y fframwaith, a chawsant gynrychiolaeth dda yn y sioeau teithiol yr wythnos diwethaf. Sicrheais fod ein partneriaid cymdeithasol wedi cael eu cynnwys, gan eu bod yn rhan o'r diwygio tair-lefel, yn fy marn i. Estynnwyd gwahoddiad iddynt ac mae'r penaethiaid a secondiwyd yn trafod y fframwaith mewn cyfarfodydd a briffiau ledled Cymru. Mae ein hathrawon yn hollbwysig: hwyntwy fydd yn gwneud y gwahaniaeth ac yn gwneud y newidiadau. Yn fy nghyfarfodydd â'r undebau llafur i drafod y fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion, a phan siaredais yn eu cynadleddau cenedlaethol, bu hynny'n rhan allweddol o fy araith a'm hymgyngori â hwy, oherwydd mae'n ymwneud â'r cyfraniadau y gallant eu gwneud.

Yr wyf yn falch o'r cyfle i ddweud nad yw hyn yn ymwneud â beio na thargedu ysgolion. Mae'r fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion yn ymwneud â sicrhau bod ein hagwedd yn ymwneud ag adeiladu perthnasau ar draws lefelau, i osod y dysgwr wrth galon polisi addysg a helpu ysgolion i lwyddo. Mae rhai wedi ceisio dweud bod hyn yn ymwneud â thargedu ysgolion sy'n methu. Fodd bynnag, ethos cyfan diwygio tair-lefel yw bod methiant yn fethiant ar ran y system yn ei chyfanrwydd, a dyna pam ein bod yn trafod diwygio ar y lefelau hynny. Nid yw hyn yn ymwneud â chreu rhestr daro, na gosod targedau newydd; mae'n ymwneud â chreu perthnasau ar draws y bwrdd, a sicrhau bod gennym ffordd newydd o feddwl am ysgolion i'w gwneud yn fwy effeithiol.

O ran cyfraniad Kirsty, mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn cydnabod y cyswllt gydag anfantais

do not have to say that; it is proven. However, as a Labour Minister for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills, it is my priority to break that link, to narrow the gap, and to raise the bar. That is why we have to make local authorities a part of the picture.

The Welsh Assembly Government has commitments to tackling child poverty, which I will go on to in the next statement that I make, on the report of the Office of the Children's Commissioner for Wales. We must have, as we already do, innovative and effective education policies, such as raising attainment and individual standards in education in Wales, to address the link between poverty and underachievement. That means a commitment to resources and policy.

Jeff, you may have my assurance that this is about enabling all our schools to maximise their potential with our support. That support means resources to tackle social disadvantage, as well as our wider policies on tackling child poverty. It also means looking to ensure that we are backing community-focused schools, and it is about collaboration between the Welsh Assembly Government, schools and our communities. Local authorities have a crucial role to play in that.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Minister, from time to time, the Estyn reports on the primary school sector talk about the fabric of school buildings holding back the ability of the teaching professionals in those schools to raise standards and achievement levels. Estyn has a crucial and important role to play, and it fulfils a valuable role. However, how can we expect schools to implement the recommendations of Estyn's reports when they may face massive buildings costs as a result—as you know, those costs are the principal responsibility of local authorities? How can we ensure that those schools move from the Estyn reports to ensuring that the recommendations of those reports are implemented? Unless we can find a mechanism of achieving that, those schools will face the same criticism as they would

cymdeithasol. Nid oes rhaid imi ddweud hynny; mae wedi'i brofi. Fodd bynnag, fel Gweinidog Llafur dros Blant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau, fy mlaenoriaeth yw torri'r cyswllt hwnnw, lleihau'r bwlch a chodi'r bar. Dyna pam ei bod yn rhaid inni gynnwys awdurdodau yn y llun.

Mae gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ymrwymadau i fynd i'r afael â thlodi plant, a symudaf ymlaen i'r mater hwnnw yn y datganiad nesaf a wnaf, ar adroddiad Swyddfa Comisiynydd Plant Cymru. Rhaid inni gael, fel sydd gennym eisoes, bolisiau addysg arloesol ac effeithiol, megis codi cyflawniad a safonau unigol mewn addysg yng Nghymru, er mwyn mynd i'r afael â'r cyswllt rhwng tlodi a thangyflawni. Mae hynny'n golygu ymrwymiad i adnoddau a pholisi.

Jeff, cewch sicrwydd gennyf fod hyn yn ymwneud â galluogi ein holl ysgolion i fanteisio i'r eithaf ar eu potensial gyda'n cefnogaeth ni. Mae'r gefnogaeth honno'n golygu adnoddau i fynd i'r afael ag anfantais cymdeithasol, yn ogystal â'n polisiau ehangach ynghylch mynd i'r afael â thlodi plant. Golyga hefyd geisio sicrhau ein bod yn cefnogi ysgolion sy'n canolbwyntio ar y gymuned, ac mae'n ymwneud â chydweithredu rhwng Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, ysgolion a'n cymunedau. Mae gan awdurdodau lleol ran allweddol i'w chwarae yn hynny o beth.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Weinidog, o bryd i'w gilydd, mae adroddiadau Estyn ar y sector ysgol gynradd yn cyfeirio at ffabrig adeiladau ysgol yn llesteirio gallu aelodau'r proffesiwn addysgu yn yr ysgolion hynny i godi safonau a lefelau cyflawniad. Mae gan Estyn rôl hanfodol a phwysig i'w chwarae, ac mae'n cyflawni swyddogaeth bwysig. Fodd bynnag, sut gallwn ddisgwyl i ysgolion weithredu argymhellion adroddiadau Estyn pan allent wynebu costau adeiladu aruthrol yn sgil hynny—fel y gwyddoch, prif gyfrifoldeb awdurdodau lleol yw'r costau hynny. Sut gallwn sicrhau bod yr ysgolion hynny yn symud o adroddiadau Estyn i sicrhau bod argymhellion yr adroddiadau hynny'n cael eu gweithredu? Oni allwn ganfod mecanwaith i gyflawni hynny, bydd yr ysgolion hynny'n wynebu'r un feirniadaeth ag y byddent wedi'i

have faced in their previous inspection report. hwynebu yn eu hadroddiad arolygu flaenorol.

**Jane Hutt:** The fact is that the school effectiveness framework is supported by the other important priorities and policies of the Welsh Assembly Government, which are addressing those very issues. Why do we have a school buildings investment grant? So that we can ensure that we bring our school buildings up to twenty-first century standards. Consider the £657 million that has been spent on our school buildings in the past three years, and the £708 million that will be spent over the next three years. We have committed ourselves in the 'One Wales' programme of government to improve and increase the funding on school capital investment.

However, it is not just the Welsh Assembly Government that is doing this, but local authorities, too. We had a very good seminar with the Welsh Local Government Association only two weeks ago, where we looked at the best practice of those authorities that are making a difference. They are investing their own resources strategically, in partnership with the Welsh Assembly Government. They are making a difference to school buildings, such as that which I saw today when opening an extension at Maes yr Haul school in Bridgend. We will see changes and improvements over the coming year, alongside the delivery of the school effectiveness framework.

**The Presiding Officer:** Diolch yn fawr. Minister, would you like to pause to draw breath, or are you prepared to go straight onto your next statement? I see that you are happy to move on.

### **Datganiad am Ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i Adroddiad Blynyddol y Comisiynydd Plant**

#### **Statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's Response to the Children's Commissioner's Annual Report**

**The Minister for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills (Jane Hutt):** In presenting the Assembly Government's formal response to the children's commissioner's annual review, I once again wish to thank Maria Battle, the deputy

**Jane Hutt:** Y ffaith yw bod y fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion yn cael ei gynnal gan flaenoriaethau a pholisïau pwysig eraill Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, sy'n mynd i'r afael â'r union faterion hynny. Pam bod gennym grant buddsoddi mewn adeiladau ysgol? Er mwyn inni allu sicrhau ein bod yn dod ag adeiladau ein hysgolion at safonau'r unfed ganrif ar hugain. Ystyriwch yr £657 miliwn a wariwyd ar adeiladau ein hysgolion dros y tair blynedd diwethaf, a'r £708 miliwn a warir dros y tair blynedd nesaf. Yr ydym wedi ein hymrwymo ein hunain yn y rhaglen lywodraethu 'Cymru'n Un' i wella a chynyddu'r cyllid ar fuddsoddiad cyfalaf ysgolion.

Fodd bynnag, nid dim ond Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru sy'n gwneud hyn, ond awdurdodau lleol hefyd. Cawsom seminar dda iawn gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru gwta bythefnos yn ôl, lle'r oeddem yn edrych ar arferion gorau'r awdurdodau hynny sy'n gwneud gwahaniaeth. Maent yn buddsoddi eu hadnoddau eu hunain yn strategol, mewn partneriaeth â Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Maent yn gwneud gwahaniaeth i adeiladau ysgol, fel yr hyn a welais heddiw wrth agor estyniad i ysgol Maes yr Haul ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr. Gwelwn newidiadau a gwelliannau dros y flwyddyn i ddod, ochr yn ochr â chyflawni'r fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch yn fawr. Weinidog, a hoffech oedi i gael eich gwynt atoch neu a ydych yn fodlon mynd yn syth i'ch datganiad nesaf? Gwelaf eich bod yn hapus i symud ymlaen.

**Y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau (Jane Hutt):** Wrth gyflwyno ymateb ffurfiol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i adolygiad blynyddol y comisiynydd plant, carwn ddiolch unwaith yn rhagor i Maria Battle, y dirprwy

commissioner, and her staff for their hard work in maintaining the office of the commissioner following the untimely death of Peter Clarke. The annual review provides us with clear evidence of their dedication to maintaining Peter's legacy.

I look forward to working with Peter's successor, Keith Towler, who takes up office very shortly. The Government remains committed to its rights-based approach to policy-making for children and young people, and it appreciates the contribution that the commissioner can make to ensure that Wales's children and young people receive their proper rights and entitlements. The Assembly can be proud of its achievements in this regard. While recognising that much remains to be done, we have made far greater progress than most other countries in Europe towards promoting the active citizenship of our young people.

Our formal response concentrates on the 16 issues addressed by the deputy commissioner in section 5 of the annual review. The review raised the deputy commissioner's concerns about the provision of advocacy services for children and young people. As well as being an essential safeguard for children in care and other vulnerable groups, advocacy has a powerful role to play in enabling the voice of all children to be heard on matters that affect them.

4.00 p.m.

The Government is awaiting the final report of the Children and Young People Committee on this subject, and will shortly put forward proposals that take into account the full range of evidence that has been presented to us on this subject. Our unequivocal intention is to make arrangements for a comprehensive, accessible and effective service, recognising the importance of independence and that the service will be subject to regular inspection and review.

Following on from the 'Clywch' report, which raised questions about the provision of counselling services in schools and the independent investigation of allegations against school staff, the Assembly

gomisiynydd, a'i staff am eu gwaith caled yn cynnal swydd y comisiynydd yn dilyn marwolaeth anhymig Peter Clark. Mae'r adolygiad blynyddol yn brawf amlwg i ni o'u hymroddiad i gynnal cymynrodd Peter.

Edrychaf ymlaen at weithio gydag olynydd Peter, Keith Towler, a fydd yn camu i'r swydd yn fuan iawn. Erys y Llywodraeth yn ymroddedig i'w hagwedd seiliedig-ar-hawliau tuag at lunio polisïau ar gyfer plant a phobl ifanc, ac mae'n gwerthfawrogi'r cyfraniad y gall y comisiynydd ei wneud i sicrhau bod plant a phobl ifanc Cymru yn cael eu hawliau a'u hawliadau priodol. Gall y Cynulliad ymhyfrydu yn ei gyflawniadau yn hyn o beth. Wrth gydnabod bod llawer eto i'w wneud, yr ydym wedi gwneud llawer mwy o gynnydd na'r rhan fwyaf o wledydd Ewrop o ran hyrwyddo dinasyddiaeth fyw ymhlith ein pobl ifanc.

Mae ein hymateb ffurfiol yn canolbwyntio ar yr 16 mater y cyfeiria'r dirprwy gomisiynydd atynt yn adran 5 yr adolygiad blynyddol. Yr oedd yr adolygiad yn codi pryderon y dirprwy gomisiynydd ynghylch darparu gwasanaethau eiriolaeth ar gyfer plant a phobl ifanc. Yn ogystal â bod yn rhagofal hanfodol ar gyfer plant mewn gofal a grwpiau agored i niwed eraill, mae gan eiriolaeth ran bwerau i'w chwarae yn galluogi llais pob plentyn i gael ei glywed ynghylch materion sy'n effeithio arnynt.

Mae'r Llywodraeth yn aros am adroddiad terfynol y Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc am y pwnc hwn, a bydd yn cyflwyno cynigion cyn bo hir sy'n ystyried ystod lawn y dystiolaeth a gyflwynwyd inni am y pwnc. Ein bwriad diamwys yw trefnu ar gyfer gwasanaeth cynhwysfawr, agored ac effeithiol, gan gydnabod pwysigrwydd annibyniaeth ac y bydd y gwasanaeth yn destun archwilio ac adolygu rheolaidd.

Yn sgil adroddiad 'Clywch' a gododd gwestiynau am ddarparu gwasanaethau cwnsela mewn ysgolion ac ymchwilio'n annibynnol i honiadau yn erbyn staff ysgolion, sefydlodd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad

Government set up an independent investigation service that is proving its value, particularly to school governing bodies. We have also consulted on proposals for a national and independent schools counselling strategy, and our final proposals will be issued shortly, backed by £6.1 million over the next three years. Once those arrangements are in place, the Assembly Government will have implemented all 16 of the 'Clywch' recommendations for which we are directly responsible. That is a further example of the Government's commitment to ensuring that children access services on their terms and in ways that meet their needs.

Last November's Plenary debate on the commissioner's review raised a number of points on the provision of child and adolescent mental health services, which remains a key health priority of the Assembly Government, and we have taken a number of steps to strengthen those services, as set out in detail in our formal response. The independent CAMHS review carried out by the Wales Audit Office and Health Commission Wales, which is due to be published later this year, will inform our planning for future provision.

Our investment in services for looked-after children has been significant, and the review recognises the Assembly Government's hard work to improve outcomes for this vulnerable group of children and young people. We will consult this spring on an ambitious and radical strategy for vulnerable children, including looked-after children and care leavers, to encompass new forms of service, innovative delivery mechanisms and ideas for further workforce development. A significant programme of development work in respect of the strategy is being developed and there is considerable interest in the ideas that are emerging among partners across the children's sector. We fully acknowledge that more is needed to achieve improved outcomes for looked-after children, and I am grateful for the contribution of the all-party group in raising awareness of these issues.

wasanaeth ymchwilio annibynnol sy'n profi ei werth, yn enwedig i gyrff llywodraethu ysgolion. Yr ydym hefyd wedi ymgynghori ynglŷn â chynigion ar gyfer strategaeth cwnsela genedlaethol ac annibynnol i ysgolion, a chyhoeddir ein cynigion terfynol cyn bo hir, gyda £6.1 miliwn yn gefn i hynny dros y tair blynedd nesaf. Pan fydd y trefniadau hynny ar waith, bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi gweithredu pob un o 16 argymhelliad adroddiad 'Clywch' yr ydym yn uniongyrchol gyfrifol amdanynt. Dyna enghraifft arall o ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth i sicrhau bod plant yn cael gafael ar wasanaethau ar eu telerau hwy eu hunain a thrwy ffyrdd sy'n diwallu eu hanghenion.

Yn nadl y Cyfarfod Llawn fis Tachwedd diwethaf am adolygiad y comisiynydd, codwyd nifer o bwyntiau am y ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl i blant a'r glasoed. Mae hynny'n dal yn un o flaenoriaethau iechyd allweddol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Yr ydym wedi cymryd nifer o gamau i gryfhau'r gwasanaethau hynny a nodir y rhain yn fanwl yn ein hymateb ffurfiol. Bydd adolygiad annibynnol Gwasanaethau Iechyd Meddwl Plant a'r Glasoed (CAMHS) a gynhaliwyd gan Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru a Chomisiwn Iechyd Cymru, sydd i'w gyhoeddi'n ddiweddarach eleni, yn goleuo'n cynllunio ar gyfer y ddarpariaeth yn y dyfodol.

Yr ydym wedi buddsoddi'n sylweddol mewn gwasanaethau ar gyfer plant sy'n derbyn gofal, ac mae'r adolygiad yn cydnabod gwaith caled Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i wella canlyniadau i'r grŵp hwn o blant a phobl ifanc agored i niwed. Yn y gwanwyn, byddwn yn ymgynghori ynglŷn â strategaeth uchelgeisiol a radical ar gyfer plant agored i niwed, gan gynnwys plant sy'n derbyn gofal a'r rhai sy'n gadael gofal. Bydd honno'n cwmpasu ffurfiau newydd ar wasanaethau, dulliau arloesol o'u cyflwyno a syniadau ar gyfer datblygu'r gweithlu ymhellach. Mae rhaglen sylweddol o waith datblygu ar y gweill ar gyfer y strategaeth ac mae diddordeb sylweddol yn y syniadau sy'n eginio ymhlith partneriaid ar draws y sector plant. Cydnabyddwn yn llwyr fod angen mwy er mwyn gwella canlyniadau i blant sy'n derbyn gofal, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am gyfraniad y grŵp pob plaid o ran codi

ymwybyddiaeth o'r materion hyn.

Reducing child poverty remains at the heart of the Government's agenda for children and young people. We are increasing efforts to maximise family incomes, expanding benefit and debt advisory services and access to credit unions. This Government is determined to tackle the legacy of poor provision, low expectation and structural inequalities that can conspire to deprive children and young people of the opportunity to achieve their potential. The Government intends to publish a comprehensive account of our progress towards meeting our targets to reduce poverty as part of a new national monitor of child wellbeing that will be published in the autumn. We are introducing a top-up to the child trust fund, with more for children on the lowest incomes. Using our new powers, a legal duty will be placed on public bodies to demonstrate their commitment to tackling child poverty. The recent statement by the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government lays out the programme for action to be taken forward across all portfolios.

I turn to another issue raised with me in last November's debate, namely the need to consult children on school reorganisation. We are committed to article 12 of the United Nations convention, and are aware that current guidance on participation over statutory proposals of this nature requires revision. Evidence indicates that pupils are more frequently involved in such considerations at secondary school level than in primary schools, and so we are revising our guidance in this respect, including the need to use methods that are age-appropriate. In the autumn, we will see the submission of the UK's periodic report to the United Nations Committee on the Convention on the Rights of the Child. Wales's influence on this process has been significant. Accepting that the forward agenda is a substantial and challenging one, this is further evidence of the leadership that the Government and the Assembly have shown in making children and young people's rights a reality.

Mae lleihau tlodi plant yn dal wrth galon agenda'r Llywodraeth ar gyfer plant a phobl ifanc. Yr ydym yn dyblu'n hymdrechion i sicrhau bod incwm teuluoedd cyn uchod ag y gall fod, gan ehangu gwasanaethau cynghori am fudd-daliadau a dyled a mynediad at undebau credyd. Mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn benderfynol o fynd i'r afael â gwaddol darpariaeth wael, disgwyliadau isel ac anghydraddoldebau yn y strwythur sy'n gallu cynllwynio i amddifadu plant a phobl ifanc o'r cyfle i wireddu eu potensial. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn bwriadu cyhoeddi cofnod cynhwysfawr o'n cynnydd at gyrraedd ein targedau i leihau tlodi fel rhan o drefn genedlaethol newydd i fonitro lles plant. Cyhoeddir hyn yn yr hydref. Yr ydym yn cyflwyno ychwanegiad at y gronfa ymddiriedolaeth plant, sy'n golygu y bydd mwy ar gael i'r plant isaf eu hincwm. Gan ddefnyddio'n pwerau newydd, byddwn yn ei gwneud yn ddyletswydd ar gyrrff cyhoeddus i ddangos eu hymrwymiad i fynd i'r afael â thlodi plant. Mae'r datganiad diweddar gan y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol yn disgrifio'r rhaglen ar gyfer gweithredu ar draws pob portffolio.

Trof at fater arall a godwyd gyda mi yn ystod y ddadl fis Tachwedd diwethaf, sef bod angen ymgynghori â phlant ynglŷn ag ad-drefnu ysgolion. Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i erthygl 12 confensiwn y Cenhedloedd Unedig, ac yn ymwybodol bod angen diwygio'r canllawiau presennol ynglŷn â chymryd rhan mewn cynigion statudol o'r natur hwn. Dengys tystiolaeth fod disgyblion yn ymwneud yn amlach ag ystyriaethau o'r fath ar lefel ysgolion uwchradd nag ar lefel ysgolion cynradd, ac felly, yr ydym yn adolygu ein canllawiau yn y cyswllt hwn, gan gynnwys yr angen i ddefnyddio dulliau sy'n briodol ar gyfer oedran. Yn yr hydref, cyflwynir adroddiad cyfnodol y DU i Bwyllgor y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar y Confensiwn ar Hawliau'r Plentyn. Mae Cymru wedi dylanwadu'n sylweddol ar y broses hon. A derbyn bod agenda'r dyfodol yn un sylweddol ac yn un sy'n gosod cryn her, dyma ragor o dystiolaeth o'r arweiniad y mae'r Llywodraeth a'r Cynulliad wedi'i ddangos wrth wireddu hawliau plant a phobl ifanc.

In responding to the commissioner's report, I acknowledge where we have work still to do, but I also want to recognise our achievements. This is a Government and an Assembly committed to protecting, promoting and delivering children and young people's rights and entitlements, and the work of the Children's Commissioner for Wales plays a key role in meeting that goal.

**David Melding:** I pay tribute to the Minister's stamina, not that it was much in doubt, as she has been a doughty performer in the Chamber over the years. This is a very important subject. I begin by congratulating Maria Battle on her outstanding performance as acting commissioner—it is always difficult to act up, and she performed with great alacrity. I take this final opportunity to pay tribute to Peter Clarke, and I wish the new children's commissioner, Keith Towler, every success when he starts his duties in a week or so.

There is much that we can agree with in the Government's response to the annual report of the children's commissioner. I just want to drill down to some detail and remind the Minister of the areas that we as an opposition will scrutinise. I do not expect exhaustive answers to these points.

The advocacy point is paramount at the moment. Access to an advocacy service is one of the most pressing needs for the most vulnerable children. The right for children to have access to a universal service is a noble secondary ambition, but an advocacy service that will help to protect the most vulnerable is essential, and it will have to be independent and effective. When the Children and Young People Committee reports, I am sure that it will emphasise that to you, and we will have to have a system that is demonstrably robust.

On child and adolescent mental health services, we can only welcome the fact that there will be a review, and that you are committed to improving services. However, I

Wrth ymateb i adroddiad y comisiynydd, cydnabyddaf fod meysydd o hyd lle mae angen gwaith, ond yr wyf hefyd am gydnabod ein llwyddiannau. Dyma Lywodraeth a Chynulliad sydd wedi ymrwymo i ddiogelu, hyrwyddo a gwireddu hawliau a haeddiannau plant a phobl ifanc ac mae i waith Comisiynydd Plant Cymru rôl allweddol o ran cyrraedd y nod hwnnw.

**David Melding:** Rhoddaf deyrnged i wytnwch y Gweinidog, nid bod neb yn amau hynny, gan iddi fod yn berfformwraig bybyr yn y Siambr dros y blynyddoedd. Mae'r pwnc hwn yn un pwysig iawn. Dechreuaf drwy longyfarch Maria Battle ar ei pherfformiad rhagorol fel comisiynydd dros dro—mae bob amser yn anodd llenwi bwloch mewn swydd uwch, a gwnaeth hynny gyda pharodrwydd mawr. Achubaf ar y cyfle olaf hwn i roi teyrnged i Peter Clarke, a dymunaf bob llwyddiant i'r comisiynydd plant newydd, Keith Towler, pan fydd yn cychwyn ar ei ddyletswyddau ymhen rhyw wythnos.

Gallwn gytuno ynglŷn â llawer yn ymateb y Llywodraeth i adroddiad blynyddol y comisiynydd plant. Hoffwn fanylu'n benodol ar ambell beth ac atgoffa'r Gweinidog am y meysydd hynny y byddwn ni'r gwrthbleidiau'n craffu arnynt. Nid wyf yn disgwyl atebion cyflawn i'r pwyntiau hyn.

Mae'r pwynt ynglŷn ag eiriolaeth yn hollbwysig ar hyn o bryd. I'r plant mwyaf agored i niwed, gallu cael gafael ar wasanaeth eiriolaeth yw un o'u hanghenion pennaf. Mae'r hawl i blant allu cael gafael ar wasanaeth sydd ar gael i bawb ym mhobman yn uchelgais eilaidd clodwiw, ond mae gwasanaeth eiriolaeth a fydd yn gymorth i amddiffyn y rhai mwyaf agored i niwed yn hanfodol, a bydd yn rhaid iddo fod yn annibynnol ac yn effeithiol. Pan fydd y Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc yn cyflwyno'i adroddiad, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yn pwysleisio hynny wrthych, a bydd yn rhaid inni gael system sy'n amlwg yn system gadarn.

O ran iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasoed, ni allwn ond croesawu'r ffaith y cynhelir adolygiad a'ch bod wedi ymrwymo i wella gwasanaethau. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiaf nad

hope that I am not too jaundiced in reminding you that it is now nearly seven years since the CAMHS strategy was launched by the then partnership Government, as I think that it was, at the turn of the millennium. It is a 10-year strategy to revolutionise service provision in this area. All the evidence since has shown that this area is particularly important, and yet we still do not have effective services that we can rely on. There is plenty of good practice, but we have not yet been able to provide consistent, comprehensive services.

When I asked the Minister for Health and Social Services a few months ago how many children were in adult mental health acute beds, we did not have those data, although she is committed to gathering that information. That shows you where we are.

The Government should also be commended on developing a vulnerable children's strategy that focuses on the most vulnerable—care leavers are certainly among that group. We look forward to responding to the strategy when it is opened up for consultation. The educational attainment of vulnerable children, particularly care leavers, will be a key area.

There is much to agree about on child poverty, but improving economic activity rates will be a key means of reducing child poverty. There is no doubt that our GVA per capita will rise if we can just get more people into work and support them in work.

I do not expect detailed answers to these points, I am just outlining the areas that we as an opposition party will be developing and scrutinising.

I will finish on the UN convention. There are several things that we could do in that regard that would take us a step forward. First, the Children's Commissioner for Wales, his office, and the underpinning regulations, will, at some point over the next year or so,

wyf yn rhy angharedig wrth eich atgoffa bod saith mlynedd bron wedi mynd heibio bellach ers lansio strategaeth CAMHS gan y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth fel yr oedd ar y pryd, oherwydd, credaf mai ar droad y mileniwm yr oedd hynny. Strategaeth 10-mlynedd ydyw i chwyldroi'r ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau yn y maes hwn. Mae'r holl dystiolaeth ers hynny wedi dangos bod y maes hwn yn arbennig o bwysig, ac eto i gyd, nid oes gennym wasanaethau effeithiol o hyd y gallwn ddibynnu arnynt. Mae digon o arferion da ar waith, ond nid ydym eto wedi gallu darparu gwasanaethau cyson, cynhwysfawr.

Pan ofynnais i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ychydig fisoedd yn ôl faint o blant a oedd mewn gwelyau iechyd meddwl aciwt i oedolion, nid oedd y data hynny gennym, er ei bod wedi ymrwymo i gasglu'r wybodaeth honno. Mae hynny'n dangos ichi ymhle yr ydym arni.

Dylid llongyfarch y Llywodraeth hefyd am ddatblygu strategaeth ar gyfer plant agored i niwed sy'n canolbwyntio ar y rhai mwyaf agored i niwed—mae'r sawl sy'n gadael gofal yn sicr ymhlith y grŵp hwnnw. Edrychwn ymlaen at ymateb i'r strategaeth pan gaiff ei hagor ar gyfer ymgynghori. Bydd cyrhaeddiad addysgol plant agored i niwed, yn enwedig y rhai sy'n gadael gofal, yn faes allweddol.

Gallwn gytuno ynglŷn â llawer ym maes tlodi plant, ond gwella cyfraddau gweithgarwch economaidd fydd un o'r dulliau allweddol o leihau tlodi plant. Nid oes amheuaeth na fydd ein GYC y pen yn codi os gallwn gael mwy o bobl yn ôl i'r gwaith a'u cefnogi yn eu gwaith.

Nid wyf yn disgwyl atebion manwl i'r pwyntiau hyn. Y cyfan yr wyf yn ei wneud yw sôn yn fras am y meysydd y byddwn ni, fel gwrthblaid, yn eu datblygu ac yn craffu arnynt.

Gorffennaf drwy sôn am gonfensiwn y CU. Mae nifer o bethau y gallem eu gwneud yn y cyswllt hwnnw a fyddai'n gam ymlaen. Yn gyntaf, bydd Comisiynydd Plant Cymru, ei swyddfa, a'r rheoliadau sy'n sail iddynt, rywbryd yn ystod y flwyddyn neu ddwy



probably be devolved to us in terms of Measure-making powers. I hope that we will see a Measure that will make the appointment of the children's commissioner the duty of the Assembly rather than of the Welsh Assembly Government, and I also hope that another provision of that Measure will be to establish a statutory committee to monitor the aspects of the convention that relate to our devolved responsibilities, which will report to the Assembly rather than to the Welsh Assembly Government, although it should influence the Government, I would say.

Finally, I offer a suggestion, and it is meant as such, without any hidden agenda. Next year is the twentieth anniversary of the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child, and I think that it would be wonderful for the Welsh Assembly Government, in collaboration with the commissioner's office—remembering that we were the first nation to establish a children's commissioner in the UK—to hold an international conference on how sub-state governments can implement the UN convention in areas in which they have competence.

4.10 p.m.

**Jane Hutt:** I am very willing to take up and pursue your last proposal. It would be an excellent way to recognise the twenty-first anniversary of the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child, which underpins all of our policies, and which we have taken forward in terms of the appointment of the children's commissioner and securing the opportunity to establish the children's commissioner in the old days of the Queen's Speech route for legislation. What you have suggested would be appropriate. It is the young people who tell me that we are getting things right in Wales. Young people from Funky Dragon go to the conferences and say that they are quite proud of the fact that they come from Wales and recognise that progress is being made. However, we cannot be complacent and we have a great deal to learn and to improve upon as we look at the points that you have made.

I thank you for your tributes to Peter and to Maria Battle for her stewardship as deputy

nesaf, mae'n debyg, yn cael eu datganoli inni o ran pwerau creu Mesurau. Gobeithiaf y gwelwn Fesur a fydd yn gwneud penodi'r comisiynydd plant yn ddyletswydd i'r Cynulliad yn hytrach nag i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, a gobeithiaf hefyd mai un arall o ddarpariaethau'r Mesur hwnnw fydd sefydlu pwyllgor statudol i fonitro'r agweddau ar y confensiwn sy'n berthnasol i'n cyfrifoldebau datganoledig, a fydd yn adrodd i'r Cynulliad yn hytrach nag i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, er y dylai, byddwn yn dadlau, ddylanwadu ar y Llywodraeth.

Yn olaf, cynigiaf awgrym, ac felly y'i bwriedir, heb ddim agenda gudd. Y flwyddyn nesaf, dethlir ugeinfed pen-blwydd Confensiwn y CU ar Hawliau'r Plentyn, a chredaf y byddai'n wych petai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, drwy gydweithredu â swyddfa'r comisiynydd—gan gofio mai ni oedd y genedl gyntaf i sefydlu comisiynydd plant yn y DU—yn cynnal cynhadledd ryngwladol ar sut y gall llywodraethau is-wladwriaethol roi confensiwn y CU ar waith yn y meysydd y mae ganddynt hawl i ddeddfu ynddynt.

**Jane Hutt:** Yr wyf yn barod iawn i ystyried eich cynnig diwethaf a dilyn ei drywydd. Byddai'n ffordd ragorol o gydnabod unfed pen-blwydd ar hugain Confensiwn y CU ar Hawliau'r Plentyn, sy'n sail i'n holl bolisiau. Yr ydym wedi bwrw ymlaen â hyn drwy benodi'r comisiynydd plant a sicrhau'r cyfle i sefydlu'r swydd honno yn hen ddyddiau llwybr deddfu Araith y Frenhines. Byddai'r hyn yr ydych wedi'i awgrymu'n briodol. Y bobl ifanc sy'n dweud wrthyf ein bod ar y trywydd iawn yng Nghymru. Mae pobl ifanc y Ddraig Ffynici'n mynd i'r cynadleddau ac yn dweud eu bod yn eithaf balch o'r ffaith eu bod yn dod o Gymru ac maent yn cydnabod bod pethau'n gwella. Fodd bynnag, ni allwn orffwys ar ein rhwyfau ac mae gennym lawer iawn i'w ddysgu ac i wella arno wrth inni edrych ar y pwyntiau yr ydych wedi'u codi.

Diolchaf ichi am eich teyrngedau i Peter ac i Maria Battle am ei stiwardiaeth fel dirprwy

over this period. The report is substantively hers, of course. The point about advocacy is paramount; it is your priority and I am glad that you have put it there. We look forward to the report of the Children and Young People Committee in taking that forward.

In terms of child and adolescent mental health services, I feel very responsible in terms of monitoring and scrutinising as the chair of the Cabinet sub-committee, and as the former Minister for Health and Social Services who launched 'Everybody's Business'. In support of the current Minister, we must note the changes that have taken place not only since 'Everybody's Business' but also since the national service framework on children, young people and maternity services, which also addressed CAMHS.

I have already talked about the review, which we await, but we also need to look at some of the issues that have been taken forward in terms of the range of services, such as community intensive therapy teams. I remember meeting child psychiatrists who said that these intensive therapy teams would make a great difference. We are developing these services. We are also developing a forensic adolescent consultation and treatment service in north and south Wales. We also have cross-cutting links with the youth justice system and other policy areas, including education. Also, the self-assessment audit tool that has come out of the national service framework indicates areas of national strong performance in terms of significant improvements in 2005-06. More funding has gone into CAMHS as a result of the service and financial framework, and each year we see that in the input and investment from across the health service. The three health regional CAMHS networks are also important. Those three health commissioning networks, since 2005, have had £1.2 million, £1.6 million and £1.5 million respectively to fund regional development across agencies. In line with the 'One Wales' commitment, an additional £4.8 million has been allocated to child and adolescent mental health services for 2008-09 to 2010-11.

dros y cyfnod hwn. Ei hadroddiad hi, wrth gwrs yw hwn yn ei hanfod. Mae'r pwynt am eiriolaeth yn hollbwysig; mae'n flaenoriaeth i chi, ac yr wyf yn falch ichi ei gwneud yn flaenoriaeth o'r fath. Edrychwn ymlaen at adroddiad y Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc wrth fwrw ymlaen â hynny.

O ran gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasoed, teimlaf yn gyfrifol iawn o ran monitro a chraffu, a minnau'n gadeirydd is-bwyllgor y Cabinet, a gan mai fi oedd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a lansiodd 'Busnes Pawb'. Gan gefnogi'r Gweinidog presennol, rhaid inni nodi'r newidiadau sydd wedi bod nid dim ond ers 'Busnes Pawb' ond hefyd ers y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer plant, pobl ifanc a gwasanaethau mamolaeth, a oedd hefyd yn mynd i'r afael â CAMHS.

Yr wyf eisoes wedi sôn am yr adolygiad yr ydym yn disgwyl amdano, ond mae angen inni hefyd edrych ar rai o'r materion y bwriwyd ymlaen â hwy o ran ystod y gwasanaethau, megis timau therapi dwys yn y gymuned. Yr wyf yn cofio cyfarfod â seiciatryddion plant a ddywedodd y byddai'r timau therapi dwys hyn yn gwneud gwahaniaeth mawr. Yr ydym yn datblygu'r gwasanaethau hyn. Yr ydym hefyd yn datblygu gwasanaeth ymgynghori a thriniaeth fforensig i'r glasoed yn y gogledd ac yn y de. Mae gennym hefyd gysylltiadau trawsbynciol â'r system cyfiawnder ieuentid ac â meysydd polisi eraill, gan gynnwys addysg. Hefyd, mae'r pecyn archwilio hunanasesu sydd wedi codi yn sgil yn fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol yn dangos meysydd lle mae'r perfformiad cenedlaethol yn gryf o ran sicrhau gwelliannau sylweddol yn 2005-06. Mae rhagor o arian wedi'i roi i CAMHS yn sgil y fframwaith gwasanaeth a'r fframwaith ariannol, a bob blwyddyn, gwelwn hynny yn y mewnbwn a'r buddsoddi a geir ym mhob cwr o'r gwasanaeth iechyd. Mae'r tri rhwydwaith CAMHS iechyd rhanbarthol yn bwysig hefyd. Mae'r tri rhwydwaith comisiynu iechyd hynny, ers 2005, wedi cael £1.2 miliwn, £1.6 miliwn ac £1.5 miliwn i dalu am ddatblygiadau rhanbarthol ar draws asiantaethau. Yn unol â'r ymrwymiad yn 'Cymru'n Un', dyrannwyd £4.8 miliwn arall i wasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasoed ar gyfer

2008-09 i 2010-11.

Therefore, our priority, as the Welsh Assembly Government, is delivering the change. It may not be fast enough, but it is a priority and it is important. Scrutiny and the highlighting of this by the children's commissioner are important.

The issue that I wanted to pick up, particularly in relation to looked-after children, relates to the important educational opportunities that we have. We talked about poverty and disadvantage. The raising attainment and individual standards in education in Wales funding, in which we allocated £1 million of ring-fenced money for looked-after children, has been maintained year on year in the budget and is continuing into next year. We are particularly looking at ways in which local authorities can use that money for extra support for looked-after children approaching their external examinations at age 16. That is where children and young people, who are looked after—and we, after all, are corporate parents, as are local authorities—could miss out in terms of educational outcomes if we do not invest and learn how to do this, using, for example, the Children Act 2004 as a key vehicle for delivering changes. The changes that we introduced in 'Towards a Stable Life and a Brighter Future' will help improve the health and education of looked-after children, and we build on those through the strategy for vulnerable children, which is coming through.

On child poverty, you are right about improving economic activity. We know that it is in workless families that child poverty is found. That is why we take forward a cross-Government child poverty action strategy in the One Wales Government, and why we have to use the convergence funding. Again, this is recognised by Europe—it has the strands, not just in terms of convergence funding in relation to tackling economic inactivity but also on gender, for example. The First Minister was talking about the Genesis project earlier on and we have secured the funding to bridge, hopefully, between Objective 1 structural funds and taking forward convergence funding on that

Felly, ein blaenoriaeth, fel Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, yw sicrhau newid. Efallai nad yw'n digwydd yn ddigon cyflym, ond mae'n flaenoriaeth, ac mae'n bwysig. Mae'n bwysig bod y comisiynydd plant yn craffu ar hyn ac yn ei bwysleisio.

Y mater yr oeddwn am ei godi, yn enwedig o ran plant sy'n derbyn gofal yw hwnnw sy'n ymwneud â'r cyfleoedd addysgol pwysig sydd gennym. Soniasom am dlodi ac anfantais. Llwyddwyd i gynnal yr arian ar gyfer codi cyrhaeddiad a safonau unigol mewn addysg yng Nghymru. Dyrannwyd £1 miliwn o arian wedi'i neilltuo ar gyfer plant sy'n derbyn gofal, flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn yn y gyllideb, a bydd yn parhau i'r flwyddyn nesaf. Yr ydym yn edrych yn benodol ar sut y gall awdurdodau lleol ddefnyddio'r arian hwnnw i roi cefnogaeth ychwanegol i blant sy'n derbyn gofal wrth iddynt agosáu at eu harholiadau allanol yn 16 oed. Dyna'r adeg y gallai plant a phobl ifanc sy'n derbyn gofal—ac yr ydym ni, wedi'r cyfan, yn rhieni corfforaethol iddynt, fel y mae awdurdodau lleol—fod ar eu colled o ran canlyniadau addysgol onid ydym yn buddsoddi ac yn dysgu sut mae gwneud hyn, gan ddefnyddio, er enghraifft, Ddeddf Plant 2004 fel cyfrwng allweddol i sefydlu newidiadau. Bydd y newidiadau a gyflwynasom yn 'Tuag at Fywyd Sefydlog a Dyfodol Gwell' yn help i wella iechyd ac addysg plant sy'n derbyn gofal, ac yr ydym yn adeiladu ar y rheini drwy'r strategaeth ar gyfer plant sy'n agored i niwed, sydd ar y ffordd.

O ran tlodi plant, yr ydych yn iawn am wella gweithgarwch economaidd. Gwyddom mai mewn teuluoedd di-waith y ceir tlodi plant. Dyna pam yr ydym yn symud strategaeth weithredu draws-Lywodraethol ar dlodi plant ymlaen yn Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un, a pham mae'n rhaid inni ddefnyddio'r cyllid cydgyfeirio. Eto, caiff hyn ei gydnabod gan Ewrop—mae ganddi'r llinynnau, nid dim ond o ran cyllid cydgyfeirio yng nghyd-destun mynd i'r afael ag anweithgarwch economaidd ond hefyd o ran rhyw, er enghraifft. Yr oedd y Prif Weinidog yn siarad am brosiect Genesis yn gynharach ac yr ydym wedi sicrhau cyllid i bontio, gobeithio, rhwng cronfeydd strwythurol Amcan 1 a symud

aspect. That has dramatically improved the economic activity of parents, and that is not just in relation to women but young men too. It has had an impact in relation to the provision of childcare, training and flexible support, which links to the work that we do with the Department for Work and Pensions.

On your final point about whether or not changes should be made in the reporting relationship between the Assembly Government and the children's commissioner, when the legislative competence Order on vulnerable children has been passed, it might be possible to bring forward Assembly Measures to deal with that. We would have to have consultation on a way forward if that was seen to be appropriate. It is important that the Assembly Government is held to account on these policies, so, to a large extent, it is important that the children's commissioner reports to the Welsh Assembly Government. However that is a debate that we need to have.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I thank the Minister for her statement. It gives me great pleasure to respond to this statement as Chair of our new Children and Young People Committee. It has been a recommendation of the commissioner in the past that we should have such a cross-cutting committee, and it gives me great pleasure to be taking that work forward with my committee colleagues.

I echo what the Minister and David Melding said about the excellent work of Maria Battle and her team in what was a difficult time. This is perhaps the last occasion on which it is appropriate for us all to mention and remember Peter, who will be a tough act to follow. It will be a challenge but I am confident that, in Keith Towler, we have identified a worthy successor. Committee members and I were grateful that Keith, prior to taking up his post officially, was able to attend our committee and discuss with us the way in which he saw himself taking forward the work of the commissioner's office. We appreciated that.

In that same meeting last week, the committee had an opportunity to discuss the

cyllid cydgyfeirio ymlaen o ran yr agwedd honno. Mae hynny wedi gwella gweithgarwch economaidd rhieni'n ddramatig, ac nid dim ond o ran menywod y mae hynny, ond dynion ifanc hefyd. Mae wedi cael effaith yng nghyswllt darpariaeth gofal plant, hyfforddiant a chymorth hyblyg, sy'n cysylltu â'r gwaith yr ydym yn ei wneud gyda'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau.

O ran eich pwynt olaf, pa un y dylid gwneud newidiadau yn y berthynas adrodd rhwng Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r comisiynydd plant ai peidio, pan fydd y Gorchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol ynglŷn â phlant sy'n agored i niwed wedi cael ei basio, efallai y byddai'n bosibl dod â Mesurau Cynulliad gerbron i ddelio â hynny. Byddai'n rhaid inni ymgynghori ar ffordd ymlaen, petai hynny'n cael ei ystyried yn briodol. Mae'n bwysig fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cael ei dal i gyfrif ar y polisiau hyn, felly, i raddau helaeth, mae'n bwysig fod y comisiynydd plant yn adrodd i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Fodd bynnag, mae honno'n ddadl y mae angen inni ei chael.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei datganiad. Mae'n bleser mawr gennyf ymateb i'r datganiad hwn fel Cadeirydd ein Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc newydd. Mae wedi bod yn argymhelliad gan y comisiynydd yn y gorffennol y dylai fod gennym bwyllgor trawsbynciol, ac mae'n bleser mawr gennyf symud y gwaith hwnnw ymlaen gyda'm cyd-Aelodau ar y pwyllgor.

Adleisiaf yr hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog a David Melding am waith rhagorol Maria Battle a'i thîm ar adeg anodd iawn. Efallai mai hwn yw'r achlysur olaf pan fydd yn briodol inni i gyd grybwyll a chofio Peter, a bydd llenwi ei esgidiau ef yn dipyn o gamp. Bydd yn her ond yr wyf yn hyderus ein bod, yn Keith Towler, wedi canfod olynnydd teilwng. Yr oedd aelodau'r Pwyllgor a minnau yn ddiolchgar fod Keith, cyn ymgymryd â'i swydd yn swyddogol, wedi gallu dod i'n pwyllgor a thrafod gyda ni y ffordd y gwelai ef ei hun yn symud gwaith swyddfa'r comisiynydd ymlaen. Yr oeddem yn gwerthfawrogi hynny.

Yn y cyfarfod hwnnw yr wythnos diwethaf, cafodd y pwyllgor gyfle i drafod adroddiad y

commissioner's report with the acting commissioner and key leading staff members. We touched on a wide range of issues, of which I can only mention a few today; there will be issues on which we will write, as a committee, to the Minister for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills and to other Ministers as a result of the concerns raised by the commissioner's office. The committee was concerned that, when surveyed, so few children and young people were aware of the children's commissioner and his office and their rights under the UN charter. Minister, is it possible to consider what more could be done, particularly through schools, to promote awareness of the commissioner's work and of the UN charter? I am aware that good work is being done by individual schools but is there any action that it would be appropriate for the Assembly Government to take to encourage all schools to make their pupils aware of the children's commissioner and his work?

4.20 p.m.

With regard to advocacy issues, the Minister will be pleased to hear that the committee will be able to publish its report next week and we look forward, very much, to the Minister's response. Without pre-empting the publication of the report, I would echo what David Melding has said about the importance of the independence of any advocacy service; not only must that service be independent, but we must be able to make children and young people—those who may have the most reason to be suspicious of the system—believe that it is independent. The report addresses these issues in some detail and, as I have said, we look forward to the Minister's response to it.

The Minister has already responded to David Melding on the child and adolescent mental health issues, but these were a major concern for the committee and I beg the Assembly's indulgence to raise them again. I put it to the Minister that this has, of course, been a matter of priority for successive Assembly Governments and I acknowledge that good

comisiynydd gyda'r comisiynydd dros dro ac aelodau staff blaenllaw, allweddol. Cyffyrddasom ag ystod eang o faterion, na allaf ond crybwyll rhai ohonynt heddiw; bydd materion y byddwn, fel pwyllgor, yn ysgrifennu amdanynt at y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau ac at Weinidogion eraill o ganlyniad i'r pryderon a godwyd gan swyddfa'r comisiynydd. Yr oedd y pwyllgor yn pryderu bod cyn lleied o blant a phobl ifanc, pan gynhaliwyd arolwg yn eu mysg, yn ymwybodol o'r comisiynydd plant a'i swyddfa a'u hawliau hwy o dan siarter y Cenhedloedd Unedig. Weinidog, a ellir ystyried beth yn rhagor y gellid ei wneud, drwy ysgolion yn arbennig, i hyrwyddo ymwybyddiaeth o waith y comisiynydd ac o siarter y Cenhedloedd Unedig? Yr wyf yn ymwybodol fod gwaith da'n cael ei wneud gan ysgolion unigol ond a oes unrhyw gamau y byddai'n briodol i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad eu cymryd i annog pob ysgol i wneud ei disgyblion yn ymwybodol o'r comisiynydd plant a'i waith?

O ran materion eiriolaeth, bydd y Gweinidog yn falch o glywed y bydd y pwyllgor yn gallu cyhoeddi ei adroddiad yr wythnos nesaf ac edrychwn ymlaen, yn fawr iawn, at ymateb y Gweinidog. Heb ddweud gormod cyn i'r adroddiad gael ei gyhoeddi, hoffwn adleisio'r hyn a ddywedodd David Melding am bwysigrwydd annibyniaeth unrhyw wasanaeth eiriolaeth; nid yn unig y mae'n rhaid i'r gwasanaeth hwnnw fod yn annibynnol, ond rhaid inni allu gwneud i blant a phobl ifanc—y rhai sydd â'r mwyaf o reswm efallai i fod yn ddrwgdybus o'r system—gredu ei fod yn annibynnol. Mae'r adroddiad yn ymdrin â'r materion hyn mewn manylder ac, fel yr wyf wedi dweud, edrychwn ymlaen at ymateb y Gweinidog iddo.

Mae'r Gweinidog eisoes wedi ymateb i David Melding ynglŷn â'r materion iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasged, ond yr oedd y rhain yn bryder mawr i'r pwyllgor ac erfyniaf am faddeuant y Cynulliad wrth imi eu codi eto. Awgrymaf wrth y Gweinidog fod hwn, wrth gwrs, wedi bod yn fater o flaenoriaeth i un Llywodraeth Cynulliad ar ôl y llall ac yr

work is being done, as the Minister has said, but I am sure that she would agree that there is a real issue about delivery across the board. There is some very good practice, but we have not yet succeeded in spreading that to all communities across Wales. I ask the Minister to assure the Assembly that, when we come to debate the new commissioner's first report, the commissioner will be able to report on real progress across the board and that we will not find ourselves in this position in which we, as an Assembly, have found ourselves repeatedly: we give a high-level national priority to child and adolescent mental health issues, yet too many children and young people are still being failed by the system.

Specifically, the committee was concerned when the acting commissioner informed us that there are still parts of Wales where young people who are not in education or training are being denied access to child and adolescent mental health services. I am sure that the Minister will find that quite shocking. The acting commissioner has evidence on that and I know that she has written to the Minister for Health and Social Services on it. I ask the Minister to undertake to discuss this point with the Minister for health, with a view to ensuring that this practice is brought to an end. I fully appreciate that a review is under way and that many policy changes will need to wait for that, but I hope that the Minister will agree with me and fellow committee members that this cannot be right and that she will work with the Minister for health to ensure that that practice is brought to an end.

Committee members were concerned, and the Minister has mentioned this, about the continuing poor outcomes for looked-after children. I am pleased to acknowledge the work that is set out in the Government's response to the commissioner's report, but I would stress, again, that there are discrepancies between the good, solid, national policies and the outcomes at a local level. What arrangements are in place to monitor the effectiveness of the new regulations that came into force on 1 July

wyf yn cydnabod bod gwaith da yn cael ei wneud, fel y mae'r Gweinidog wedi dweud, ond yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'n cytuno bod cwestiwn gwirioneddol ynglŷn â'r gweithredu yn gyffredinol. Mae rhai arferion da iawn, ond nid ydym eto wedi llwyddo i ledaenu'r rheini i bob cymuned ar draws Cymru. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog roi sicrwydd i'r Cynulliad y bydd y comisiynydd, pan ddown i drafod adroddiad cyntaf y comisiynydd newydd, yn gallu adrodd am gynnydd gwirioneddol ym mhob man ac na fyddwn yn ein cael ein hunain yn y sefyllfa hon lle'r ydym, fel Cynulliad, wedi cael ein hunain dro ar ôl tro: yr ydym yn rhoi blaenoriaeth genedlaethol lefel uchel i faterion iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasod, ond mae'r system yn dal i siomi gormod o blant a phobl ifanc.

Yn benodol, yr oedd y pwyllgor yn poeni pan hysbysodd y comisiynydd dros dro ni fod rhannau o Gymru o hyd lle nad yw pobl ifanc nad ydynt mewn addysg nac hyfforddiant yn cael manteisio ar wasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasod. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y Gweinidog yn arswydo at hynny. Mae gan y comisiynydd dros dro dystiolaeth ynglŷn â hynny a gwn ei bod wedi ysgrifennu at y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn ei gylch. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ymrwymo i drafod y pwynt hwn gyda'r Gweinidog dros iechyd, gyda golwg ar sicrhau y rhoddir terfyn ar yr arfer hwn. Yr wyf yn llwyr werthfawrogi bod adolygiad ar waith ac y bydd angen i lawer o newidiadau polisi ddisgwyl am hwnnw, ond gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn cytuno â mi a chyd-aelodau'r pwyllgor nad oes modd fod hyn yn iawn ac y bydd yn gweithio gyda'r Gweinidog dros iechyd i sicrhau y rhoddir terfyn ar yr arfer hwn.

Yr oedd aelodau'r pwyllgor yn bryderus, ac mae'r Gweinidog wedi crybwyll hyn, ynglŷn â'r canlyniadau gwael sy'n dal i ddod i ran plant sy'n derbyn gofal. Yr wyf yn falch o gydnabod y gwaith sydd wedi'i nodi yn ymateb y Llywodraeth i adroddiad y comisiynydd, ond byddwn yn pwysleisio, eto, fod anghysondebau rhwng y polisiâu cenedlaethol da, cadarn a'r canlyniadau ar lefel leol. Pa drefniadau sydd wedi'u sefydlu i fonitro effeithiolrwydd y rheoliadau newydd a ddaeth i rym ar 1 Gorffennaf 2007, yr wyf

2007, which I am sure that all Assembly Members would support and welcome? What plans does the Government have to address any underperformance by local authorities that these monitoring mechanisms may identify?

The committee raised a range of concerns about other issues, as I have already said, including disabled children and young people, child poverty—the Minister will be aware that that is to be the subject of our next major piece of work as a committee— asylum-seeking children and neonatal care. I will be writing to the Minister for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills and to other Ministers in relation to those concerns.

Finally, in future years, the committee will wish to scrutinise Ministers in more detail about the issues raised in the commissioner's reports. We will also wish to scrutinise the new commissioner on the work of his office. I would like to ask the Minister whether she agrees that the key problem identified in this, and other commissioner's reports, is not to do with policy. We have some excellent policies at national level in relation to children and young people—policies that have received broad support not only in the Chamber, but beyond—but the problem is with the local delivery of those policies; that local delivery is, of course, what actually changes children and young people's lives. Will the Minister commit today to prioritising action to drive forward that delivery, rather than looking, necessarily, at new policy, so that, in future years, the new commissioner will not have to report on the same concerns year after year, which, I am sure that the Minister will acknowledge, has been the case too often in the past?

**Jane Hutt:** I congratulate the Children and Young People Committee, which you chair. The committee was brought forward from the Assembly—indeed, from the children's commissioner's previous report—and is already doing excellent work. I think that the committee will have a useful role in

yn siŵr y byddai holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn eu cefnogi ac yn eu croesawu? Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Llywodraeth i fynd i'r afael â'r tanberfformio gan awdurdodau lleol y gallai'r mecanweithiau monitro hyn eu dangos?

Cododd y pwyllgor nifer o bryderon am faterion eraill, fel yr wyf eisoes wedi dweud, gan gynnwys plant a phobl ifanc anabl, tlodi plant—bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol mai dyna fydd testun ein darn mawr nesaf o waith fel pwyllgor—plant sy'n ceisio lloches a gofal newyddenedigol. Byddaf yn ysgrifennu at y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau ac at Weinidogion eraill ynglŷn â'r pryderon hynny.

Yn olaf, yn y blynyddoedd i ddod, bydd y pwyllgor am graffu'n fanylach ar Weinidogion ynglŷn â'r materion a godir yn adroddiadau'r comisiynydd. Byddwn hefyd am graffu ar y comisiynydd newydd o ran gwaith ei swyddfa. Hoffwn ofyn i'r Gweinidog a yw hi'n cytuno nad â pholisi y mae a wnelo'r broblem allweddol a nodir yn hwn, ac mewn adroddiadau eraill gan y comisiynydd. Mae gennym bolisiau rhagorol ar lefel genedlaethol yn ymwneud â phlant a phobl ifanc—polisiau sydd wedi cael cefnogaeth eang nid yn unig yn y Siambr hon, ond y tu hwnt—ond mae a wnelo'r broblem â rhoi'r polisiau hynny ar waith yn lleol; y gweithredu lleol hwnnw, wrth gwrs, yw'r hyn sy'n newid bywydau plant a phobl ifanc mewn gwirionedd. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ymrwymo heddiw i flaenoriaethu camau i yrru'r gweithredu hwnnw ymlaen, yn hytrach nag edrych, o reidrwydd, ar bolisi newydd, fel na fydd y comisiynydd newydd, mewn blynyddoedd i ddod, yn gorfod cyflwyno adroddiadau am yr un pryderon flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn, oherwydd dyna, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y Gweinidog yn cydnabod, sydd wedi digwydd yn rhy aml yn y gorffennol?

**Jane Hutt:** Llongyfarchaf y Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc, yr ydych chi'n ei gadeirio. Datblygodd y pwyllgor o'r Cynulliad—yn wir, o adroddiad blaenorol y comisiynydd plant—ac mae eisoes yn gwneud gwaith rhagorol. Credaf y bydd gan y pwyllgor rôl ddefnyddiol yn craffu ar Weinidogion o ran y

scrutinising Ministers on this and other issues relating to children and young people. That is precisely why it is important that we have an impact across the Assembly in terms of the way in which we move forward with scrutinising the Government and holding it to account. I look forward to the expansion and development of the role of the committee.

You referred to the concerns that you raised in committee about a lack of awareness of the children's commissioner's office and of the UN convention. That is an issue that the Government is concerned about, particularly in terms of our reporting on the convention. I think that this will come through the school effectiveness framework. When you have an opportunity to read the framework, you will see that the UN convention is mentioned on the first page. I do not think that you will see that mentioned in many other educational documents of this kind, not just in the UK, but in other parts of Europe. It is fundamental that we underpin what we are doing in terms of school effectiveness with the framework. What is interesting is that the convention comes through the framework in many of the areas that we want the tri-level reform to take forward. The framework considers the issue of tackling learner disadvantage, additional learning needs, inclusion, variation in performance, and the congruence between the school and the home. It needs to lead to the design of effective learning programmes to improve the health and wellbeing of children and young people in different contexts, in terms of looking at their need to develop healthy lifestyles and to access local health services. This is all in the framework, and that is why we will find that it will be a reforming tool and vehicle. I hope that the committee and the children's commissioner will find it to be of benefit in terms of tackling issues such as reducing the number of young people who are not in education, training or employment.

We look forward to the report on advocacy. I mentioned in my brief remarks the importance of independence. On CAMHS, we must look for national consistency in relation to national standards. You can get that with the regional commissioning that is developing with CAMHS, and the national

mater hwn a materion eraill yn ymwneud â phlant a phobl ifanc. Dyna'n union pam y mae'n bwysig ein bod yn creu argraff ar draws y Cynulliad o ran y ffordd yr ydym yn symud ymlaen yn y gwaith o graffu ar y Llywodraeth a'i dal i gyfrif. Edrychaf ymlaen at weld rôl y pwyllgor yn ehangu a datblygu.

Cyfeiriasoch at y pryderon a godasoch yn y pwyllgor ynglŷn â diffyg ymwybyddiaeth o swyddfa'r comisiynydd plant a chonfensiwn y Cenedloedd Unedig. Mae hwnnw'n fater y mae'r Llywodraeth yn pryderu yn ei gylch, yn enwedig o safbwynt cyflwyno adroddiadau ar y confensiwn. Credaf y daw hyn drwy'r fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion. Pan gewch chi gyfle i ddarllen y fframwaith, gwelwch fod confensiwn y Cenedloedd Unedig yn cael ei grybwyll ar y dudalen gyntaf. Ni chredaf y gwelwch ef yn cael ei grybwyll mewn llawer o ddogfennau addysgol eraill o'r math hwn, nid dim ond yn y DU, ond mewn rhannau eraill o Ewrop. Mae'n hollbwysig ein bod yn sefydlu'r fframwaith yn sylfaen i'r hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud o safbwynt effeithiolrwydd ysgolion. Yr hyn sy'n ddi-ddorol yw bod y confensiwn yn dod drwy'r fframwaith mewn llawer o'r meysydd yr ydym am i'r diwygio tair lefel eu symud ymlaen. Mae'r fframwaith yn ystyried mater mynd i'r afael â dysgwyr dan anfantais, anghenion dysgu ychwanegol, cynhwysiant, amrywiadau perfformiad, a'r cytgord rhwng yr ysgol a'r cartref. Mae angen iddo arwain at ddylunio rhaglenni dysgu effeithiol er mwyn gwella iechyd a lles plant a phobl ifanc mewn gwahanol gyd-destunau, o safbwynt edrych ar eu hangen i ddatblygu ffyrdd iach o fyw a chyrchu at wasanaethau iechyd lleol. Mae hyn i gyd yn y fframwaith, a dyna pam y byddwn yn canfod y bydd yn arf ac yn gyfrwng diwygio. Gobeithiaf y bydd y pwyllgor a'r comisiynydd plant yn canfod ei fod o fudd o ran mynd i'r afael â materion megis gostwng nifer y bobl ifanc nad ydynt mewn addysg, hyfforddiant na chyflogaeth.

Edrychwn ymlaen at yr adroddiad ar eiriolaeth. Soniais yn fy sylwadau byr am bwysigrwydd annibyniaeth. O ran CAMHS, rhaid inni chwilio am gysondeb cenedlaethol o ran safonau cenedlaethol. Gallwch gael hynny gyda'r comisiynu rhanbarthol sy'n datblygu gyda CAMHS, ac mae'r fframwaith



service framework is already driving that forward.

On delivery, the framework responds to the changes that we have brought forward in terms of looked-after children. The developments in this area, outlined in 'Towards a Stable Life and a Brighter Future', were designed to improve the health and education of looked-after children and are uniquely Welsh. The delivery and monitoring of those developments will show the improved outcomes for those children. They are underpinned by the Children Act 2004, which places a duty on local authorities to promote the education of looked-after children and is a vehicle for recognising the health issues, as well as the education issues, of looked-after children.

You made the point about where we will be this time next year in terms of the commissioner's report. I hope that the report will be positive, but of course there will still be shortcomings. We will never be perfect, although we may feel that we are striving for that in terms of our priorities. The key issue is to ensure that this Government has the right priorities. Every issue raised by the children's commissioner is at the top of our agenda. If we work in partnership with those who deliver services, including local authorities, non-governmental organisations, the voluntary sector and the health service, we can deliver the improved outcomes for children and young people.

**Mark Isherwood:** I add my thanks to the acting children's commissioner and her team, and I look forward to working with Keith Towler. I also thank the Welsh Scout Council for coming to the Assembly today to promote its Kids Outdoors scheme, which is very much focused on the good work that it is doing in terms of the health and wellbeing of the children of Wales.

You refer in your statement to advocacy services for children and young people, which Members have already referred to, and to your intention to make arrangements for a comprehensive, accessible and effective service that recognises the importance of independence, inspection and review.

gwasanaeth cenedlaethol eisoes yn gyrru hynny ymlaen.

O ran gweithredu, mae'r fframwaith yn ymateb i'r newidiadau sydd wedi cael eu cyflwyno o safbwynt plant sy'n derbyn gofal. Cynlluniwyd y datblygiadau yn y maes hwn, a amlinellwyd yn 'Tuag at Fywyd Sefydlog a Dyfodol Gwell', i wella iechyd a lles plant sy'n derbyn gofal ac mae'n unigryw i Gymru. Bydd rhoi'r datblygiadau hynny ar waith a'u monitro yn dangos gwell canlyniadau i'r plant hynny. Yn sylfaen iddynt mae Deddf Plant 2004, sy'n rhoi dyletswydd ar awdurdodau lleol i hyrwyddo addysg plant sy'n derbyn gofal ac mae'n gyfrwng i gydnabod ystyriaethau iechyd, yn ogystal ag ystyriaethau addysg, plant sy'n derbyn gofal.

Gwnaethoch y pwynt ynglŷn â ble byddwn yr adeg hon y flwyddyn nesaf o safbwynt adroddiad y comisiynydd. Gobeithiaf y bydd yr adroddiad yn un cadarnhaol, ond wrth gwrs bydd diffygion o hyd. Ni fyddwn byth yn berffaith, er ein bod yn teimlo efallai ein bod yn ymgyrraedd at hynny o ran ein blaenoriaethau. Y mater allweddol yw sicrhau bod gan y Llywodraeth hon y blaenoriaethau iawn. Mae pob mater a godir gan y comisiynydd plant ar frig ein hagenda. Os gweithiwn mewn partneriaeth â'r rhai sy'n cyflenwi gwasanaethau, gan gynnwys awdurdodau lleol, cyrff anllywodraethol, y sector gwirfoddol a'r gwasanaeth iechyd, gallwn wireddu gwell canlyniadau i blant a phobl ifanc.

**Mark Isherwood:** Ychwanegaf finnau fy niolch i'r comisiynydd plant dros dro a'i thîm, ac edrychaf ymlaen at weithio gyda Keith Towler. Diolchaf hefyd i Gyngor Sgowntiaid Cymru am ddod i'r Cynulliad heddiw i hyrwyddo ei gynllun Kids Outdoors, sy'n canolbwyntio'n fawr iawn ar y gwaith da y mae'n ei wneud o safbwynt iechyd a lles plant Cymru.

Cyfeiriwch yn eich datganiad at wasanaethau eiriolaeth i blant a phobl ifanc, y mae Aelodau eisoes wedi cyfeirio ato, ac at eich bwriad i wneud trefniadau ar gyfer gwasanaeth cynhwysfawr, hygrych ac effeithiol sy'n cydnabod pwysigrwydd annibyniaeth, arolygu ac adolygu.

4.30 p.m.

How do you respond to the statements in the children's commissioner's report that, although the consultation document was an improvement on the draft, it still does not meet the needs of children in Wales and that regional commissioning does not provide real independence, as advocacy providers will still be funded by those they have to challenge?

You said that final proposals for a national independent schools counselling strategy should be with us shortly. Acknowledging the outcome of the UNICEF league table referred to in the children's commissioner's report—in which the UK, including Wales, is twenty-first out of 21 countries in relation to children's wellbeing—will you provide assurance, as requested by the children's commissioner, that the next step will be to ensure that the strategy is funded, so that children have another person to whom they can turn in times of need?

You rightly said that CAMHS remains a key health priority, and a review will be published later this year that will inform your planning for future provision. However, you will note that the commissioner's report—for the second year—said that CAMHS in Wales is still in crisis. How will you address the funding shortfall that it identifies, the unacceptable delays in decision making about treatment and placements for ill children whose health deteriorates while they wait for a decision to be made, the exclusion from CAMHS of children and young people with learning disabilities or certain mental health problems, and the exclusion of young people between the ages of 16 and 18 who are not in full-time education? I would also relate to that the concerns raised by the National Autistic Society at the launch of the I Exist campaign last week, which I hosted, that people with an autistic spectrum disorder who develop mental health problems currently experience difficulties accessing CAMHS. It said a lot more than that, but it is worrying that it still has to raise these concerns in the context of the long-awaited action plan.

Sut yr ydych yn ymateb i'r datganiadau yn adroddiad y comisiynydd plant bod y ddogfen ymgynghori, er ei bod yn welliant o'r drafft, yn dal i fethu â diwallu anghenion plant yng Nghymru, ac nad yw comisiynu rhanbarthol yn darparu annibyniaeth wirioneddol, gan y bydd darparwyr eiriolaeth yn dal i gael eu hariannu gan y rhai hynny y mae'n ofynnol iddynt eu herio?

Dywedasoch y dylai'r cynigion terfynol ar gyfer strategaeth genedlaethol, annibynnol ar gwrsela mewn ysgolion fod yn barod cyn bo hir. Gan gydnabod canlyniad tabl cynghrair UNICEF, y cyfeirir ato yn adroddiad y comisiynydd plant—lle mae'r DU, gan gynnwys Cymru, yn unfed ar hugain allan o 21 o wledydd yng nghyswllt lles plant—a wnewch chi roi sicrwydd, yn unol â chais y comisiynydd plant, mai'r cam nesaf fydd sicrhau bod y strategaeth yn cael ei hariannu, fel y bydd gan blant rywun arall y gallant droi ato pan fyddant mewn angen?

Yr ydych wedi dweud yn gwbl briodol bod CAMHS yn flaenoriaeth bwysig ym maes iechyd o hyd, a bydd adolygiad yn cael ei gyhoeddi yn ddiweddarach eleni a fydd yn eich helpu i gynllunio darpariaeth ar gyfer y dyfodol. Fodd bynnag, byddwch yn sylwi bod adroddiad y comisiynydd wedi dweud—am yr ail flwyddyn—bod CAMHS mewn argyfwng o hyd yng Nghymru. Sut y byddwch yn rhoi sylw i'r diffyg cyllid y mae'n cyfeirio ato, yr oedi annerbyniol cyn gwneud penderfyniadau ynglŷn â thriniaeth a lleoliadau i blant gwael y mae eu hiechyd yn dirywio tra maent yn aros am benderfyniad, y ffaith nad yw plant a phobl ifanc sydd ag anableddau dysgu neu broblemau iechyd penodol yn cael eu cynnwys yn y strategaeth CAMHS, na phobl ifanc rhwng 16 a 18 oed nad ydynt mewn addysg amser llawn? Byddwn hefyd yn ychwanegu'r pryderon a fynegwyd gan Gymdeithas Genedlaethol Awtistiaeth yr wythnos diwethaf wrth lansio ymgyrch Rwy'n Bodoli. Cefais gyfle i arwain y lansiad, a dywedodd y Gymdeithas ei bod yn pryderu bod pobl ag anhwylder yn y sbectrwm awtistig sy'n datblygu problemau iechyd meddwl yn ei chael yn anodd i gael CAMHS ar hyn o bryd. Dywedodd lawer

mwy na hynny, ond mae'r ffaith ei bod yn dal i orfod mynegi'r pryderon hyn yng nghydestun y cynllun gweithredu hirddisgwyliedig yn peri gofid.

You said that you will consult on a strategy for vulnerable children. I am pleased that you acknowledge that more needs to be done to achieve improved outcomes for looked-after children. How will you address the particular concerns raised in the report that the children's commissioner is still contacted for advice about children's health needs when they are in placements away from home; the broader concerns that you referred to, such as the high numbers of those not in education, employment or training; and the concerns raised in the 2006 English report, which we understood would be reflected in Wales and which states that a large number of young people leaving care become homeless, go to prison, or even enter prostitution?

Dywedasoch y byddwch yn ymgynghori ar strategaeth ar gyfer plant agored i niwed. Yr wyf yn falch eich bod yn cydnabod bod angen gwneud mwy er mwyn sicrhau gwell canlyniadau ar gyfer plant sy'n derbyn gofal. Sut y byddwch yn rhoi sylw i'r pryderon penodol a godwyd yn yr adroddiad bod y comisiynydd plant yn dal i gael ceisiadau am gyngor ynglŷn ag anghenion ieched plant pan fyddant mewn lleoliadau oddi cartref; y pryderon ehangach y cyfeiriasoch atynt, megis y niferoedd uchel nad ydynt mewn addysg, cyflogaeth na hyfforddiant; a'r pryderon a godwyd yn adroddiad 2006 ar gyfer Lloegr, y deallwn y byddent yn cael eu hadlewyrchu yng Nghymru, ac sy'n datgan bod nifer fawr o bobl ifanc sy'n gadael gofal yn canfod eu hunain yn ddiartref, yn mynd i'r carchar, neu hyd yn oed yn mynd yn buteiniaid?

Child poverty has widely been referred to today. You said that you will publish an account of progress made on meeting targets to reduce poverty. This is against a backdrop of levels of family poverty in Wales being higher than those elsewhere and of economic inactivity levels having risen. I understand from colleagues in Westminster that new child poverty figures in England and Wales show that poverty has increased over the past two years. Will you acknowledge that work is the key route out of poverty, if we are to tackle the causes as well as the symptoms, and that looking at the most successful practices in relation to economic and social regeneration in the UK and abroad will need the private and voluntary sectors to be at the centre? As 60 per cent of our economy currently is based in the public sector, we have an unsustainable mix.

Cyfeiriwyd llawer at dlodi plant heddiw. Dywedasoch y byddwch yn cyhoeddi adroddiad ar y cynnydd sydd wedi'i wneud er mwyn cyrraedd targedau lleihau tlodi. Mae hyn ar adeg pan yw lefelau tlodi ymhlith teuluoedd yn uwch yng Nghymru nag yn unman arall a lefelau anweithgarwch economaidd wedi codi. Deallaf gan gyd-Aelodau yn San Steffan fod ffigurau newydd ar gyfer tlodi plant yng Nghymru a Lloegr yn dangos bod tlodi wedi cynyddu yn ystod y ddwy flynedd diwethaf. A wnewch chi gydnabod mai cael gwaith yw'r ffordd orau o ddianc o afael tlodi, os ydym am roi sylw i'r achosion yn ogystal â'r symptomau, a hefyd, ac edrych ar y dulliau gweithredu mwyaf llwyddiannus ym maes adfywio economaidd a chymdeithasol yn y DU a thramor, y bydd angen rhoi lle canolog i'r sectorau preifat a gwirfoddol? Gan fod 60 y cant o'n heconomi yn y sector cyhoeddus ar hyn o bryd, mae gennym gyfuniad anghynaliadwy.

With regard to anti-social behaviour, how do you respond to the need to develop cross-generational work in particular? I am thinking not only of projects that involve young people in isolation, but of projects that build that bridge across the generation with

O ran ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol, sut yr ydych yn ymateb i'r angen, yn fwyaf penodol, i ddatblygu gwaith a fydd yn pontio'r cenedlaethau? Yr wyf yn meddwl am brosiectau sy'n ymwneud yn gyfan gwbl â phobl ifanc, a hefyd am brosiectau sy'n

older people and engages people of all ages in community strategies. I refer particularly to the work of Flintshire neighbourhood watch. In relation to the problem of bullying, there is a call not only for peer mentoring, which I know is being rolled out in some schools in Wales, but for young people to share the social responsibility in their own communities alongside the adults in those communities.

In terms of fingerprint identification in schools, the children's commissioner expresses concern at the use of this technology on children and young people and refers to guidance from the information commissioner that states that schools should inform and consult fully the school community, including parents and pupils, prior to installing such a system. How do you respond, therefore, to a letter received by parents in one north Wales county on 23 January, telling them that biometric and PIN systems were being installed? In fact, the systems had already been installed in the school; parents had to tick a box and return the form to the school by the following Monday morning, which was 28 January. The overwhelming majority of those parents knew nothing about it and had not been consulted. Would you agree that that is not clear and transparent consultation, and that it risks breaching the human rights of the children concerned? I have already referred the matter to the children's commissioner.

Finally, on children and young people seeking asylum in Wales, you are right to say that they are among the poorest and most vulnerable in Wales. At the request of Refugee Voice Wales, I wrote to your colleague, Brian Gibbons, some time ago, asking whether he would meet Refugee Voice Wales; I would be grateful if you could confirm that you or colleagues would be agreeable to taking that meeting forward. Working with Higher Education Wales, I facilitated a meeting between it and Refugee Voice Wales to raise concerns—some of which are referred to in today's report, and others apply across other sectors—about the impact on refugee children in the fields of

adeiladu'r bont honno rhwng y ddwy genhedlaeth ac sy'n cael pobl o bob oedran i ymwneud â strategaethau cymunedol. Yr wyf yn cyfeirio'n benodol at waith gwarchod cymdogaeth sir y Fflint. O ran y broblem fwlio, mae galw am fentora gan gyfoedion, y gwn ei fod yn cael ei roi ar waith fesul cam mewn rhai ysgolion yng Nghymru, ac mae galw hefyd ar bobl ifanc i rannu'r cyfrifoldeb cymdeithasol yn eu cymunedau eu hunain ochr yn ochr â'r oedolion yn y cymunedau hynny.

O ran adnabod olion bysedd mewn ysgolion, mae'r comisiynydd plant yn mynegi pryder ynglŷn â defnyddio'r dechnoleg hon gyda phlant a phobl ifanc ac mae'n cyfeirio at arweiniad gan y comisiynydd gwybodaeth sy'n dweud y dylai ysgolion hysbysu ac ymgynghori'n llawn â chymuned yr ysgol, gan gynnwys rhieni a disgyblion, cyn cyflwyno system o'r fath. Sut yr ydych yn ymateb, felly, i lythyr a gafodd rhieni mewn un sir yn y gogledd ar 23 Ionawr, yn dweud wrthynt bod systemau biometreg a rhifau adnabod personol yn cael eu gosod? Mewn gwirionedd, yr oedd y systemau wedi cael eu gosod yn yr ysgol yn barod; yr oedd yn rhaid i rieni roi tic mewn blwch a dychwelyd y ffurflen i'r ysgol erbyn y bore Llun canlynol, sef 28 Ionawr. Nid oedd y mwyafrif llethol o'r rhieni hynny'n gwybod dim amdano ac nid oedd neb wedi ymgynghori â hwy. A fydech yn cytuno nad yw hynny'n ymgynghoriad clir a thryloyw, a bod perygl ei fod yn groes i hawliau dynol y plant dan sylw? Yr wyf wedi cyfeirio'r mater hwnnw i sylw'r comisiynydd plant yn barod.

Yn olaf, o ran plant a phobl ifanc sy'n ceisio lloches yng Nghymru, yr ydych yn llygad eich lle wrth ddweud eu bod ymhlith y rhai tlotaf a mwyaf agored i niwed yng Nghymru. Ar gais Llais Ffoaduriaid Cymru, ysgrifennais at eich cyd-Aelod, Brian Gibbons, ychydig yn ôl, gan ofyn a fyddai'n fodlon cyfarfod Llais Ffoaduriaid Cymru; byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech gadarnhau y byddech chi neu gyd-Aelodau'n fodlon mynychu'r cyfarfod hwnnw. Drwy weithio gydag Addysg Uwch Cymru, hwylusais gyfarfod rhwng Addysg Uwch Cymru a Llais Ffoaduriaid Cymru er mwyn mynegi pryderon—cyfeirir at rai ohonynt yn yn adroddiad heddiw, ac mae eraill yn ymwneud

education and health, as well as their access to sport and youth participation; they are keen, for example, to qualify to represent Wales and the United Kingdom in the forthcoming Olympic Games.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I advise you to answer two of those questions, Minister.

**Jane Hutt:** I was only going to answer the ones that I had not already fully responded to.

On counselling, I wanted to reassure you that the £6.1 million that we are implementing via the national school-based counselling system comes as a result of extensive consultation. This year, we are already funding those schools and organisations that have established counselling services, or that have advanced plans for such a service, to boost delivery. In relation to child poverty, we must address the issue of economic inactivity. I have already responded to that, but I remind Mark of our commitments to top-up the child trust fund as a result of Welsh Assembly Government policies, and of the requirement that we are going to put on public bodies to demonstrate their contribution to tackling child poverty. That will make a difference. The £46 million that we are investing between 2005 and 2008 to support disadvantaged children in their early years will also make a difference.

Finally, you raised important points about Refugee Voice Wales. We are now moving to a point where we will have separate sets of guidance—one for further education institutions and the other for higher education institutions, as well as for young people themselves—on how to ensure access to further and higher education for refugees and unaccompanied asylum seekers in Wales. Other Assembly Members have also raised this issue, and I am sure that you will agree, Mark, that that is a step forward. I would love to meet Refugee Voice Wales to discuss this.

â sectorau eraill—ynglŷn â'r effaith ar addysg ac iechyd plant ffoaduriaid, yn ogystal â'u cyfle i gymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon a chyfranogiad ieuenctid; maent yn awyddus, er enghraifft i fod yn gymwys i gynrychioli Cymru a'r Deyrnas Unedig yn y Gemau Olympaidd a fydd yn cael eu cynnal ymhen ychydig flynyddoedd.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr wyf yn eich cynghori i ateb dau o'r cwestiynau hynny, Weinidog.

**Jane Hutt:** Dim ond y cwestiynau hynny nad oeddwn wedi ymateb yn llawn iddynt yn barod yr oeddwn yn bwriadu eu hateb.

O ran cwnsela, yr oeddwn yn awyddus i'ch sicrhau bod y £6.1 miliwn yr ydym yn ei fuddsoddi yn y system genedlaethol ar gyfer cwnsela mewn ysgolion yn seiliedig ar ymgynghori helaeth. Eleni, yr ydym yn rhoi arian yn barod i'r ysgolion a'r sefydliadau hynny sydd wedi sefydlu gwasanaethau cwnsela, neu sydd wedi datblygu cynlluniau ar gyfer gwasanaeth o'r fath, er mwyn hybu'r ddarpariaeth. O ran tlodi plant, rhaid inni roi sylw i fater anweithgarwch economaidd. Yr wyf wedi ymateb i hynny'n barod, ond hoffwn atgoffa Mark ynglŷn â'n hymrwymiaid i ychwanegu at y gronfa ymddiriedolaeth plant o ganlyniad i bolisiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, a'r ffaith ein bod yn mynd i'w gwneud yn ofynnol i gyrrff cyhoeddus ddangos sut y maent yn helpu i fynd i'r afael â thlodi plant. Bydd hynny'n gwneud gwahaniaeth. Bydd y £46 miliwn a fuddsoddir gennym rhwng 2005 a 2008 er mwyn cefnogi plant difreintiedig yn eu blynyddoedd cynnar yn gwneud gwahaniaeth hefyd.

Yn olaf, codwyd pwyntiau pwysig gennych ynglŷn â Llais Ffoaduriaid Cymru. Yr ydym yn agosáu at bwynt yn awr lle bydd gennym ddwy set o ganllawiau—y naill ar gyfer sefydliadau addysg bellach a'r llall ar gyfer sefydliadau addysg uwch, yn ogystal â'r bobl ifanc eu hunain—ynglŷn â sut y gallwn sicrhau bod ffoaduriaid a phobl ifanc ar eu pen eu hunain sy'n ceisio lloches yn gallu cael mynediad at addysg bellach ac uwch yng Nghymru. Mae Aelodau Cynulliad eraill wedi codi'r mater hwn hefyd, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn cytuno, Mark, bod hynny'n gam ymlaen. Byddwn wrth fy modd

yn cyfarfod Llais Ffoaduriaid Cymru i drafod hyn gyda hwy.

**Christine Chapman:** Thank you for your statement, Minister. I am pleased that Members have raised so many issues regarding this important report.

I wish to highlight one issue where, sadly, progress has been slower as compared with progress on other issues, namely young people who display sexually harmful behaviour, which was pinpointed by the commissioner's report this year and last. As the annual report states, there are very few teams providing specialist services to groups of children who have been abused or who display sexually harmful behaviour. In fact, recent NSPCC research indicates that as many as one child in eight will have experienced some form of abuse during their childhood—a startling statistic. Many of those children who have been abused suffer mental health problems and, as a result, display sexually harmful behaviour in adulthood. I am aware that this issue is not talked about enough, other than to condemn it, and it is important that we raise this.

4.40 p.m.

Little progress has been made in Wales on scoping and planning models of intervention. Would you therefore agree, Minister, that what is needed is a more co-ordinated, consistent approach to delivering services for these children and young people, involving all agencies? What plans do you have to bring together the relevant agencies to examine how we can provide specialist services to work with those children and young people who need help? In the long term, this would lower the level of child sexual abuse and help those children who have been abused not to develop sexually harmful behaviour. Consideration must also be given to how we increase capacity building among professionals to ensure that all children and young people receive the appropriate response that they deserve.

**Christine Chapman:** Diolch ichi am eich datganiad, Weinidog. Yr wyf yn falch bod yr Aelodau wedi codi cynifer o faterion yn ymwneud â'r adroddiad pwysig hwn.

Hoffwn dynnu sylw at un maes lle mae'r cynnydd, yn anffodus, wedi bod yn araf iawn o'i gymharu â chynnydd mewn meysydd eraill, sef pobl ifanc sy'n arddangos ymddygiad rhywiol niweidiol. Tynnwyd sylw at hyn yn adroddiad y comisiynydd eleni a'r llynedd. Fel y mae'r adroddiad blynyddol yn nodi, ychydig iawn o dimau sy'n darparu gwasanaethau arbenigol i grwpiau o blant sydd wedi cael eu cam-drin neu sy'n arddangos ymddygiad rhywiol niweidiol. Mewn gwirionedd, dengys gwaith ymchwil a gwblhawyd yn ddiweddar gan yr NSPCC y bydd cynifer ag un o bob wyth plentyn wedi dioddef rhyw fath o gamdriniaeth yn ystod ei blentyndod—sy'n ystadegyn brawychus. Mae gan lawer o'r plant hynny sydd wedi cael eu cam-drin broblemau iechyd meddwl ac, o ganlyniad, maent yn arddangos ymddygiad rhywiol niweidiol pan fyddant yn oedolion. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol nad ydym yn siarad digon am y mater hwn, ac eithrio'i gondemnio, ac mae'n bwysig ein bod yn rhoi sylw iddo.

Ychydig iawn o gynnydd sydd wedi'i wneud yng Nghymru o ran ymchwilio i ddulliau ymyrryd a'u cynllunio. A fydddech yn cytuno felly, Weinidog, mai'r hyn y mae ei angen yw dull mwy cydgysylltiedig a chyson o ddarparu gwasanaethau i'r plant a'r bobl ifanc hyn, a hwnnw'n ddull sy'n cynnwys yr holl asiantaethau? Pa gynlluniau sydd gennych er mwyn dod â'r asiantaethau perthnasol at ei gilydd i edrych sut y gallwn ddarparu gwasanaethau arbenigol er mwyn gweithio gyda'r plant a'r bobl ifanc hyn y mae angen cymorth arnynt? Yn yr hirdymor, byddai hyn yn lleihau nifer y plant sy'n cael eu cam-drin yn rhywiol ac yn helpu'r plant hynny sydd wedi cael eu cam-drin i beidio â datblygu ymddygiad rhywiol niweidiol. Rhaid inni hefyd ystyried sut yr ydym yn helpu i feithrin gallu gweithwyr proffesiynol er mwyn sicrhau bod pob plentyn a pherson

ifanc yn cael yr ymateb priodol y mae'n ei haeddu.

**Jane Hutt:** Tackling the sexual abuse of children is a priority and, last year, it was the focus of the annual workshops for the area child protection committees of Wales, which are now the local safeguarding children boards. We have the national service framework for children and young people as the vehicle for tackling this issue, and we intend to review therapeutic services for children who have been abused, or who have abused others, to establish the strengths and weaknesses in terms of service and policy planning. That will enable a refocusing of the policy to ensure that the most vulnerable children and young people will have access to high-quality, equitable and responsive services. I am glad that you have raised that, Chris, as a key point.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae mynd i'r afael â cham-drin plant yn rhywiol yn flaenoriaeth, a rhoddwyd lle canolog i'r mater y llynedd yng ngweithdai blynyddol pwyllgorau ardal amddiffyn plant Cymru, sef y byrddau lleol ar gyfer diogelu plant erbyn hyn. Mae'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer plant a phobl ifanc gennym fel ffordd o fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn, a bwriadwn adolygu gwasanaethau therapiwtig ar gyfer plant sydd wedi cael eu cam-drin, neu sydd wedi cam-drin eraill, er mwyn canfod y cryfderau a gwendidau o ran gwasanaeth a chynllunio polisi. Bydd hynny'n golygu bod modd newid pwyslais y polisi er mwyn sicrhau bod y plant a'r bobl ifanc mwyaf agored i niwed yn gallu manteisio ar wasanaethau teg ac ymatebol o safon uchel. Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi codi hynny, Chris, fel pwynt pwysig.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I will have to keep my comments and questions brief at the end of this important debate—

**Eleanor Burnham:** Bydd yn rhaid imi gadw fy sylwadau a'm cwestiynau'n fyr ar ddiwedd y ddadl bwysig hon—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This is not a debate.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid dadl yw hon.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I am sorry; I should have said at the end of this statement.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf; dylwn fod wedi dweud ar ddiwedd y datganiad hwn.

**The Presiding Officer:** Although one might have thought otherwise earlier. [*Laughter.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Er y byddai'n hawdd i rywun feddwl yn wahanol yn gynharach. [*Chwerthin.*]

**Eleanor Burnham:** Perhaps that is where the confusion arose. Thank you for your indulgence, Llywydd.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Efallai mai dyna wnaeth imi ddrysu. Diolch ichi am eich goddefgarwch, Lywydd.

I would like to thank Maria Battle, because we know that Peter was a hard act to follow. I welcome the Minister's comments and the Welsh Assembly Government's response. I am delighted that you assert that reducing child poverty remains at the heart of the Government's agenda, because it is the crux of so many of these matters.

Hoffwn ddiolch i Maria Battle, oherwydd gwyddom ei bod yn anodd iawn dilyn Peter. Yr wyf yn croesawu sylwadau'r Gweinidog ac ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Yr wyf yn falch iawn eich bod yn mynnu bod lleihau tlodi plant yn rhan greiddiol o agenda'r Llywodraeth o hyd, oherwydd mae'n ganolog i gynifer o'r materion hyn.

On Saturday, during our conference, we had a presentation from Children in Wales and Citizens Advice about poverty and how it

Ddydd Sadwrn, yn ystod ein cynhadledd, cawsom anerchiad gan Blant yng Nghymru a'r Chyngor ar Bopeth ar dlodi a sut y mae'n

affects young children. They were particularly concerned—and I am sure that they have raised it with you and your department, Minister—about free school meals, school uniforms, and other important issues that stigmatise children as a result of poverty. As a member of the Children and Young People Committee, I was particularly concerned, on receiving the review and during the discussion that ensued, to learn about the most prevalent issues and cases that are brought to the attention of the children's commissioner. It appears from the chart on page 9 of the report that special educational needs and complaints relating to education feature at the top of the list of issues brought to the attention of the office. Looking towards the proposed additional learning needs legislative competence Order and its progress—it has been renamed and I cannot think of the name at this moment in time—it is important that we consider this point so that we can make some progress. I wonder, Minister, whether you can inform us of the timescale so that, when it comes back, we will be allowed to improve on it.

I also wonder, Minister, what kind of influence you can bring to bear on the system of taxation, tax credits, and benefits. We know that it is an UK system but it does impinge on Wales as much as anywhere else, because it is, from many people's point of view, a complete shambles. What exactly can you do so that we can hopefully improve the situation as regards poverty, which I believe is the biggest issue for children and young people?

**Jane Hutt:** Child poverty rates in Wales are down and are now below the Great Britain average. Mark has left the Chamber now, but I wanted to put the record straight on that. However, we have so much more to do and I have already expanded on a certain number of policies, but your issue about helping the poorest families in Wales to maximise their income is about expanding benefit and debt advice services. It is also about improving financial education and ensuring access to credit unions, for example, and we are now expanding that to every secondary school student in Wales. Local authorities are developing this work, and the Assembly has supported ways in which they can do that.

effeithio ar blant ifanc. Yr oeddent yn bryderus iawn—ac yr wyf yn siŵr eu bod wedi dwyn y mater i'ch sylw chi a'ch adran, Weinidog—yn glŷn â phrydau am ddim, gwisg ysgol, a materion pwysig eraill sy'n difrio plant o gefndiroedd tlawd. Fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc, yr oeddwn yn bryderus iawn, pan gawsom yr adolygiad, ac yn ystod y drafodaeth a gafwyd yn dilyn hynny, yn glŷn â'r materion a'r achosion mwyaf cyffredin sy'n cael eu dwyn i sylw'r comisiynydd plant. Mae'n ymddangos o'r siart sydd ar dudalen 9 yn yr adroddiad mai materion anghenion addysgol arbennig a chwynion ym ymwneud ag addysg sy'n cael eu dwyn i'w sylw amlaf. Ac ystyried y Gorchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol arfaethedig ar anghenion dysgu ychwanegol a'i gynnydd—cafodd deitl newydd ond ni allaf gofio beth ydyw yr eiliad hon—mae'n bwysig ein bod yn ystyried y pwynt hwn fel bod modd inni wneud rhywfaint o gynnydd. Tybed, Weinidog, a allwch ddweud wrthym beth yw'r amserlen ar gyfer hwnnw er mwyn inni, pan ddaw yn ôl atom, allu gwneud gwelliannau?

Tybed hefyd, Weinidog, pa fath o ddylanwad y gallwch ei gael ar y system drethi, credydau treth, a budd-daliadau? Gwyddom ei bod yn gyfundrefn ar gyfer y DU, ond mae'n effeithio cymaint arnom ni yng Nghymru ag y mae ar rannau eraill o'r DU, oherwydd, ym marn llawer o bobl, mae'n llanastr llwyr. Beth yn union y gallwch ei wneud fel y bydd modd, gobeithio, inni leihau tloidi, sef y broblem fwyaf, yn fy marn i, sy'n wynebu plant a phobl ifanc?

**Jane Hutt:** Mae cyfraddau tloidi plant yng Nghymru wedi gostwng ac maent bellach yn is na chyfartaledd Prydain. Mae Mark wedi gadael y Siambr erbyn hyn, ond yr oeddwn yn awyddus i gywiro'r pwynt hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, mae cymaint o waith i'w wneud eto ac yr wyf eisoes wedi ehangu nifer penodol o bolisiau, ond mae eich pwynt yn glŷn â helpu'r teuluoedd tlotaf yng Nghymru i gynyddu eu hincwm yn ymwneud ag ehangu gwasanaethau sy'n cynnig cyngor yn glŷn â budd-daliadau a dyledion. Mae'n ymwneud hefyd â gwella addysg ariannol a sicrhau mynediad at undebau credyd, er enghraifft, ac yr ydym yn ymestyn hynny yn awr i bob myfyriwr ysgol uwchradd yng Nghymru.



The UK Government also has a responsibility, through the Department for Work and Pensions, and we are taking that forward with it.

I will come back to you on the complaints issue, particularly in relation to special educational needs. Thank you for your questions and comments in relation to the work of the commissioner.

**Lynne Neagle:** Thank you for your statement, Minister. I want to touch briefly on two items. First, in relation to the ongoing work to identify the Welsh priorities for additional investment in services for disabled children, I remind you of my concern that the task and finish group established to identify new spending priorities should not be allowed to become all task and no finish. It was with great concern that I learned that the group has met only once so far, with the next meeting not scheduled until April. As you know, Minister, disabled children's services are failing now, today, and this speed of progress in halting that failure is unacceptable. Can you please ensure that some urgency is returned to this priority?

Secondly, to be brief, I would be grateful for the same urgency to be applied to the ongoing work on neonatal care in Wales. As you know, there has been a delay in the publication and implementation of the neonatal review. It was identified as an issue by the children's commissioner, with some pretty grave warnings about the current service being underfunded, underdeveloped and underresourced. Minister, can you provide some assurances in relation to the urgent action that is clearly needed in this important area?

**Jane Hutt:** I met with Keith Bowen from Contact a Family Wales, who is playing a key role in the Disabled Children Matter campaign. I met him last week and at our conference, and I agreed that we needed to meet sooner than April, because I was also concerned to ensure that we make progress on the Assembly Government's

Mae awdurdodau lleol yn datblygu'r gwaith hwn, ac mae'r Cynulliad wedi cefnogi ffyrdd o wneud hynny. Mae gan Lywodraeth y DU gyfrifoldeb hefyd, drwy'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau, ac yr ydym yn ceisio symud ymlaen yn y cyswllt hwnnw gyda hi.

Byddaf yn cysylltu â chi drachefn ynghylch mater y cwynion, yn enwedig ynghylch anghenion addysgol arbennig. Diolch am eich cwestiynau a'ch sylwadau ynglŷn â gwaith y comisiynydd.

**Lynne Neagle:** Diolch am eich datganiad, Weinidog. Yr wyf am gyfeirio at ddwy eitem yn fyr. Yn gyntaf, o ran y gwaith sy'n mynd rhagddo i nodi blaenoriaethau Cymru parthed buddsoddi mwy mewn gwasanaethau i blant anabl, hoffwn eich atgoffa am y pryder sydd gennyf na ddylid caniatáu i'r grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen a sefydlwyd i nodi blaenoriaethau gwariant newydd fynd yn llawn gorchwylion heb ddim gorffen iddynt. Bu'n bryder mawr imi glywed nad yw'r grŵp wedi cwrdd ond unwaith hyd yma, ac nid oes cyfarfod arall wedi'i drefnu tan fis Ebrill. Fel y gwyddoch, Weinidog, mae gwasanaethau plant anabl yn methu yn awr, heddiw, ac mae'r cynnydd i roi terfyn ar y methiant hwnnw'n annerbyniol. A allwch sicrhau bod y flaenoriaeth hon yn cael sylw a hynny ar fyrder?

Yn ail, ac yn fyr, byddwn yn ddiolchgar petai modd rhoi'r un sylw brys i'r gwaith sy'n mynd rhagddo ar ofal newyddenedigol yng Nghymru. Fel y gwyddoch, bu oedi o ran cyhoeddi a gweithredu'r adolygiad ar faterion newyddenedigol. Fe'i nodwyd fel ystyriaeth gan y comisiynydd plant, gyda rhybuddion difrifol iawn nad yw'r gwasanaeth cyfredol yn cael digon o gyllid, ei fod heb ei ddatblygu'n ddigonol ac nad oes ganddo ddigon o adnoddau. Weinidog, a allwch ein sicrhau ynglŷn â'r gweithredu brys sy'n angenrheidiol yn y maes pwysig hwn?

**Jane Hutt:** Cyfarfŵm â Keith Bowen o Gyswllt Teulu Cymru, sy'n chwarae rhan allweddol yn yr Ymgyrch Plant Anabl yn Cyfri Cymru. Cyfarfŵm ag ef yr wythnos diwethaf yn ein cynhadledd, a chytunais fod angen inni gwrdd cyn mis Ebrill, oherwydd yr oeddwn yn awyddus inni wneud cynnydd ar ymrwymiaidau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad,

commitments, not only to improve services for disabled children and young people, but also to deliver on the commitments already in the national service framework in relation to disabled children and young people. Although we have already managed to spend £1 million on early support materials, and on Mencap's Changing Places campaign, for which £250,000 has been allocated from the current budget, I will be taking forward plans for future spend, and I will be meeting with them shortly.

On neonatal care, I met with the officials responsible for taking this forward in the children and young people's specialised services project. The all-Wales standards documents are for each specialism, some of which are cross-cutting, including neonatal care in its widest sense. Those standards are due to be published and launched this year, and I would be happy to report back on that development, as soon as the information becomes available.

**Janet Ryder:** I just wish to raise one or two matters with you, Minister. The independent investigation service, which was set up following the Clywch inquiry, is not the system that Peter Clarke proposed; it is a different approach. It has been in operation for a year, and it has dealt with a number of cases, but there are still doubts about the capacity of governing bodies to deal with the cases that are coming forward. As we are now a year into the service, can we have a debate on that, and on the follow-up to the Clywch inquiry? We are now six or seven years post Clywch, and it is very sad still to see statements about the final proposals for counselling services for schools being issued 'shortly'. That really needs to be dealt with, and yet we just seem to get statements from Government that the proposals will be issued shortly. I know that we have to get the system right, but it is stretching it far too much to take six or seven years just to put the proposals forward.

I also ask you to bring a debate to the Chamber on the increasing use of fingerprinting in schools as a means of identifying children and borrowing library

nid yn unig i wella gwasanaethau i blant anabl a phobl ifanc, ond hefyd i gyflawni'r ymrwymadau sydd eisoes yn rhan o'r fframwaith gwasanaethau cenedlaethol o ran plant anabl a phobl ifanc. Er ein bod eisoes wedi llwyddo i wario £1 miliwn ar ddeunyddiau cymorth cynnar, ac ar ymgyrch Lleoedd Newid Mencap, y dyrannwyd £250,000 iddi o'r gyllideb gyfredol, byddaf yn cyflwyno cynlluniau ar gyfer gwariant at y dyfodol, a byddaf yn cwrdd â hwy maes o law.

Parthed gofal newyddenedigol, cyfarfûm â'r swyddogion sy'n gyfrifol am gyflwyno hyn ym mhrosiect gwasanaethau arbenigol y plant a'r bobl ifanc. Mae dogfennau safonau Cymru gyfan ar gyfer pob arbenigedd, y mae rhai ohonynt yn drawsffiniol, gan gynnwys gofal newyddenedigol yn yr ystyr ehangaf. Bydd y safonau hynny'n cael eu cyhoeddi a'u lansio eleni, a byddwn yn falch o gyflwyno adroddiad ynglŷn â'r datblygiad hwnnw, cyn gynted ag y bydd y wybodaeth ar gael.

**Janet Ryder:** Hoffwn godi un neu ddau o bwyntiau gyda chi, Weinidog. Nid y system a gynigiwyd gan Peter Clarke yw'r gwasanaeth ymchwilio annibynnol a sefydlwyd yn dilyn ymchwiliad Clywch; mae ei ddulliau'n wahanol. Bu'n gweithredu am flwyddyn, ac mae wedi ymdrin â nifer o achosion, ond mae amheuan o hyd ynglŷn â gallu'r cyrff llywodraethu i ymdrin â'r achosion sy'n codi. Gan fod blwyddyn wedi mynd heibio ers sefydlu'r gwasanaeth, a allwn gael trafodaeth ynglŷn â hynny, ac ynglŷn â'r dilyniant i ymchwiliad Clywch? Mae chwech neu saith o flynyddoedd wedi mynd heibio ers Clywch, a thrist iawn yw gweld datganiadau sy'n dweud y bydd y cynigion terfynol parthed gwasanaethau cwnsela ar gyfer yr ysgolion yn cael eu cyhoeddi 'maes o law'. Mae angen delio â hynny, ond y cwbl a welwn yw datganiadau gan y Llywodraeth y bydd y cynigion yn cael eu cyhoeddi maes o law. Gwn ei bod yn bwysig sicrhau bod y system yn iawn, ond yn sicr mae chwech neu saith o flynyddoedd i gyflwyno'r cynigion yn y lle cyntaf yn llawer rhy hir.

Gofynnaf hefyd i chi ddod â dadl gerbron y Siambr ynglŷn â defnyddio rhagor ar olion bysedd mewn ysgolion fel ffordd o adnabod plant a benthyg llyfrau o'r llyfrgell, ac o

books, and of introducing biometric pass cards to pay for school meals. There has been much debate about the introduction of identity cards for adults, and yet these measures seem to be introduced in an increasing number of schools without any debate. I think that we need to have that debate. We need to know how that information is collected, who has access to it, and how exactly it is used.

4.50 p.m.

**Jane Hutt:** On your points about the recommendations of the 'Clywch' report, I want to assure you that this is not 'just about to happen', or 'shortly to be published'. The fact that the £6.1 million is now in the budget is important, as is the fact that we have a national counselling service.

I know that some concerns have been raised about the independent investigation service. We have issued three guidance letters, for education, social services and health sectors particularly, to clarify how the service operates. I would certainly want to find an appropriate time to discuss, inform or debate these issues, in taking forward the 'Clywch' report's recommendations. The counselling service is crucial to the way forward. It is the final part of our responsibility to deliver on 'Clywch'.

On the other issue that you raised, I am aware of the issues around the use of fingerprinting, but it is important that we deliver, as we are looking at how to de-stigmatise pupils' access to school meals. We need to have that debate, and I hope that I can discuss that further in the Chamber or in committee.

**Val Lloyd:** My remarks are an extension of Christine's pertinent comments. Research shows that three quarters of sexually abused children do not tell anyone about the abuse at the time it happens. Two years ago, the NSPCC's Don't Hide It campaign called on the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure that every child and young person who had experienced abuse could access a therapeutic service. I have visited the NSPCC's

gyflwyno cardiau biometrig i dalu am brydau ysgol. Bu cryn ddadlau am gyflwyno cardiau adnabod ar gyfer oedolion, ond eto i gyd ymddengys fod y mesurau hyn yn cael eu cyflwyno mewn nifer cynyddol o ysgolion heb ddadl o gwbl. Credaf fod angen y ddadl honno arnom. Mae angen inni wybod sut y caiff y wybodaeth honno ei chasglu, pwy sy'n cael ei gweld, a sut yn union y caiff ei defnyddio.

**Jane Hutt:** O ran eich pwyntiau ynglŷn ag argymhellion adroddiad 'Clywch', hoffwn eich sicrhau nad rhywbeth sydd 'ar fin digwydd' neu 'am gael ei gyhoeddi maes o law' yw hyn. Mae'r ffaith bod y £6.1 miliwn bellach yn y gyllideb yn bwysig, fel y mae'r ffaith bod gennym wasanaeth cynghori cenedlaethol.

Gwn fod rhai pryderon wedi eu codi ynglŷn â'r gwasanaeth ymchwilio annibynnol. Yr ydym wedi cyhoeddi tri llythyr cyfarwyddyd, ar gyfer y sectorau addysg, gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ac iechyd yn neilltuol, i egluro sut y mae'r gwasanaeth yn gweithio. Yn sicr byddwn am bennu amser priodol i drafod y materion hyn a dysgu a dadlau yn eu cylch, o ran cyflwyno argymhellion adroddiad 'Clywch'. Mae'r gwasanaeth cynghori'n allweddol i'r ffordd ymlaen. Dyna yw'r rhan olaf o'r cyfrifoldeb sydd gennym i gyflawni 'Clywch'.

O ran y mater arall a godasoch, gwn am y materion sy'n ymwneud â defnyddio olion bysedd, ond mae'n bwysig cyflawni, gan ein bod yn ceisio dileu'r stigma sydd ynghlwm wrth hawl disgyblion i brydau ysgol am ddim. Mae angen y ddadl honno arnom, a gobeithiaf y medrwn drafod rhagor ar hynny yn y Siambr neu mewn pwyllgor.

**Val Lloyd:** Yr wyf am ehangu ar sylwadau perthnasol Christine. Dengys ymchwil nad yw tri chwarter y plant sy'n cael eu cam-drin yn rhywiol yn dweud dim wrth neb am eu camdriniaeth yn yr amser ar ôl iddo ddigwydd. Ddwy flynedd yn ôl, galwodd ymgyrch yr NSPCC, Peidiwch â'i gelu, ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau y byddai pob plentyn ac unigolyn ifanc sydd wedi'i gam-drin yn gallu cael gwasanaeth

therapeutic service in Swansea and heard at first hand of the service and support that are given to users. Is it possible to give the commitment that the Welsh Assembly Government will do all that it can to ensure that children and young people who have experienced abuse have access to a children-centred therapeutic service, such as that in Swansea?

**Jane Hutt:** I, too, have visited that service, Val. The NSPCC is an exemplar of good practice, and I hope that we can learn lessons from it for the rest of Wales.

therapiwtig. Bûm yn ymweld â gwasanaeth therapiwtig yr NSPCC yn Abertawe a chlywais drosof fy hun am y gwasanaeth a'r cymorth a roddir i'r defnyddwyr. A oes modd ymrwymo y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n gwneud popeth o fewn ei allu i sicrhau y bydd plant a phobl ifanc sydd wedi cael eu cam-drin yn cael gwasanaeth therapiwtig pwrpasol at ddibenion plant, megis yr un yn Abertawe?

**Jane Hutt:** Yr wyf innau hefyd wedi ymweld â'r gwasanaeth hwnnw, Val. Mae'r NSPCC yn esiampl o arfer da, a gobeithiaf y medrwn ddysgu gwersi ganddynt ar gyfer gweddill Cymru.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd (Rosemary Butler) i'r Gadair am 4.52 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer (Rosemary Butler) took the Chair at 4.52 p.m.*

### **Twristiaeth Ddiwylliannol Cultural Tourism**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of William Graham.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw William Graham.

**Y Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth (Rhodri Glyn Thomas):** Cynigiaf fod

**The Minister for Heritage (Rhodri Glyn Thomas):** I propose that

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*yn nodi gwaith Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ddatblygu rhagor ar botensial ein diwylliant unigryw er mwyn hyrwyddo Cymru gartref ac mewn marchnadoedd allanol. (NDM3869)*

*notes the Welsh Assembly Government's work on further developing the potential of our unique culture to promote Wales both at home and in external markets. (NDM3869)*

Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn nodi geiriau'r cynnig gan fod gwelliant Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn cynnig dileu pob peth ar ôl y geiriau 'Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru'. Rhagdybiwn, felly, nad yw Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn dymuno ein gweld yn datblygu rhagor ar botensial ein diwylliant unigryw er mwyn hyrwyddo Cymru gartref ac mewn marchnadoedd allanol. Mae hynny'n dweud rhywbeth am weledigaeth ac uchelgais Ceidwadwyr Cymru ar gyfer Cymru a sut yr ydym yn ei hyrwyddo.

It is important that we note the wording of the motion and that the Welsh Conservatives' amendment proposes to delete everything after the words 'National Assembly for Wales'. We must assume, therefore, that the Welsh Conservatives do not want to see us further developing the potential of our unique culture to promote Wales both at home and in external markets. That says something about the vision and ambition that the Welsh Conservatives have for Wales and for how we promote it.

Mae'r gwaith o geisio sicrhau ein bod yn denu ymwelwyr i Gymru a'n bod yn anfon negeseuon cadarnhaol am Gymru dramor yn

The work of trying to ensure that we attract visitors to Wales, and that we send positive messages abroad about Wales requires us to

golygu ein bod yn gorfod ceisio datblygu llawer mwy ar ein diwylliant, ein treftadaeth a'n hanes fel pobl, a cheisio sicrhau, pan fydd pobl yn ymweld â Chymru, eu bod yn cael profiad unigryw nad ydyw ar gael yn unman arall yn y byd. Golyga hynny nid yn unig eu bod yn mwynhau'r profiad o ymweld â Chymru a gwerthfawrogi'r hyn sydd gan Gymru i'w gynnig, ond hefyd eu bod yn debygol o ddychwelyd i Gymru.

Rhaid cydnabod bod y farchnad dwristiaeth yn hynod o gystadleuol. Mae miloedd lawer o leoliadau yn Ewrop yn unig i bobl eu dewis dros Gymru. Felly, os nad yw Cymru yn cynnig rhywbeth gwahanol sy'n pwysleisio ein gwerthoedd fel cenedl, eithriadol o anodd fydd cystadlu â'r lleoliadau eraill hynny.

Mae gennym lawer i'w gynnig, fel ein safleoedd treftadaeth. Yr ydym eisoes yn gallu denu 1.2 miliwn o bobl i safleoedd treftadaeth Cadw. A dim ond y safleoedd hynny sydd wedi eu staffio sydd wedi'u nodi yn y ffigur hwnnw; mae 800,000 mwy o bobl yn ymweld â safleoedd yr Ymddiriedolaeth Genedlaethol.

Mae gennym amgueddfeydd ac orielau yng Nghymru, a hwyrach y bu i rai ohonoch weld y ffigurau a gyhoeddwyd heddiw sy'n dangos bod cannoedd ar filoedd o bobl wedi ymweld â saith safle Amgueddfa Cymru. Mae gennym orielau ac amgueddfeydd lleol hefyd sy'n gwneud y gwaith pwysig o gyflwyno hanes lleol i ymwelwyr.

Mae gerddi gennym, fel Gardd Fotanegol Genedlaethol Cymru yn Llanarthne, gardd Aberglasne, gerddi Bodnant yn y gogledd, a gerddi Erddig, sy'n denu pobl i Gymru i werthfawrogi'r hyn sydd ganddynt i'w gynnig.

Mae gennym ein tirlun arbennig, ac yr ydym bellach yn gweld y cyfle i ddatblygu llwybrau i gerdded ac i feicio, sydd eto yn denu pobl i Gymru i werthfawrogi ein tirlun.

Mae gennym wyliau cenedlaethol, gan gynnwys eisteddfodau a sawl un arall, megis Gŵyl y Faenol a Gŵyl Jazz Aberhonddu. Mae lleoliadau i'r celfyddydau gael eu

try to develop our culture, our heritage and our history as people much more, and to try to ensure that, when people do visit Wales, they get a unique experience that is not available anywhere else in the world. That will mean not only that they enjoy the experience of visiting Wales while they are here and appreciate what Wales has to offer, but that they are also more likely to return to Wales.

We must acknowledge that the tourism market is exceptionally competitive. There are many thousands of locations in Europe alone for people to pick over Wales, and so, unless Wales offers something different, which emphasises our values as a nation, it will be extremely difficult for us to compete with those other places.

We do have a great deal to offer; our heritage sites, for instance. We are already able to attract 1.2 million people to Cadw's heritage sites in Wales. And it is only those sites that are staffed that are included in that figure; 800,000 more people visit the sites of the National Trust.

We have museums and galleries in Wales, and no doubt some of you will have seen the figures released today that show that hundreds of thousands of people have visited the seven sites of National Museum Wales. We also have local galleries and museums, which carry out the important work of presenting local history to visitors.

We have gardens, such as the National Botanic Garden of Wales in Llanarthne, Aberglasne garden, Bodnant garden in north Wales, and Erddig garden, which attract people to Wales to appreciate all that they have to offer.

We have our distinctive landscape, and we have now realised the opportunity that we have to develop walking and cycling routes, which also attract people to enjoy our landscape.

We have national festivals, including eisteddfodau and many others, such as the Faenol Festival and the Brecon Jazz Festival. We have locations in which to put our arts on

harddangos, megis Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru ym mae Caerdydd, Venue Cymru yn Llandudno, a llu o ganolfannau drwy Gymru sy'n cynnig ystod eang o weithgareddau celfyddydol.

Mae gennym hefyd ein chwaraeon. Ar hyn o bryd, yr ydym yn dathlu llwyddiant ein tîm rygbi cenedlaethol, ond byddwn hefyd yn gallu denu pobl i Gymru i fwynhau pencampwriaeth rygbi'r byd dan 20, sydd eleni. Ym myd criced, cynhelir gêm brawf cyfres y Llundw rhwng Lloegr ac Awstralia yma y flwyddyn nesaf, ac, wrth gwrs, mae Cwpan Ryder y byd golff yn dod i Gasnewydd yn 2010.

Mae gennym gyfleoedd i ddenu pobl hefyd i fwynhau'r cynnyrch sydd gan Gymru i'w gynnig, fel ein bwydydd a'n diodydd lleol. Ar ben hynny, mae gennym rywbeth sy'n unigryw i'n gwlad, sef y Gymraeg, sy'n ychwanegu at brofiad pobl sy'n dod i Gymru.

Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn nodi gwerth hyn oll i economi Cymru. Mae pobl sy'n dod i Gymru i fwynhau gwyliau diwylliannol yn unig yn cyfrannu £120 miliwn at yr economi; mae pobl sy'n dod yma ac sydd hefyd yn cynnwys gweithgaredd diwylliannol yn eu gwyliau yn cyfrannu £465 miliwn at yr economi.

Fel yr amlinellwyd gennyf, yr ydym eisoes yn gwneud cryn dipyn, ond mae llawer eto yr ydym am ei wneud. Dyna pam yr ydym am ddatblygu'r potensial sydd gennym yng Nghymru i gynnig gwyliau diwylliannol. Yr ydym yn cydweithio ar hyn o bryd â'r diwydiant a'r gynghrair dwristiaeth yng Nghymru, ac yr ydym wedi sefydlu partneriaeth twristiaeth ddiwylliannol. Byddwn yn cydweithio â'r diwydiant i sicrhau ei fod yn rhan allweddol o'r broses hon o ddatblygu y math hwn o wyliau.

Ar ben hynny, Cymru oedd yn gyfrifol am sefydlu Rhwydwaith Twristiaeth Ddiwylliannol Ewrop, a chefais gyfle i fynd i Barcelona y llynedd i sôn am yr hyn yr ydym eisoes wedi'i gyflawni yng Nghymru, a'r hyn y byddwn yn ceisio ei gyflawni yn ychwanegol at y dyfodol. Dyma gyfle gwirioneddol. Gobeithiwn y byddai Aelodau o bob plaid yn y Cynulliad yn cefnogi'r

show, such as the Wales Millennium Centre in Cardiff bay, Venue Cymru in Llandudno, and a whole host of other centres throughout Wales that exhibit a broad range of arts-based activities.

We also have our sports. At the moment, we are celebrating the success of our national rugby team, but we will also be able to attract people to Wales to enjoy the under-20 rugby world championship, being held this year. In cricket, the Ashes series test match between England and Australia will be held here this year, and, of course, golf's Ryder Cup will be coming to Newport in 2010.

We also have opportunities to attract people here to enjoy the produce that Wales has to offer, such as our local foods and drinks. On top of that, we have something unique to our country, namely the Welsh language, which adds to the experience of visitors to Wales.

It is important that we note the value of all that to the economy of Wales. People who come to Wales only to enjoy cultural holidays contribute £120 million to the economy; people who come here and who also include a cultural activity as part of their holiday contribute £465 million to the economy.

As I have outlined, we are already doing a good deal, but we still want to do a lot more. That is why we want to develop the potential that we have in Wales to offer cultural holidays. We are currently in collaboration with the industry and the tourism alliance in Wales, and we have established a cultural tourism partnership. We will be working jointly with the industry to ensure that it plays a crucial part in this process of developing those kinds of holidays.

On top of that, Wales was responsible for establishing the European Cultural Tourism Network, and I had the opportunity to go to Barcelona last year to talk about all that we have achieved in Wales, and all that we will seek to achieve in future. Here is a genuine opportunity. I had hoped that Members of all parties in the Assembly would support this effort to ensure that we offer an experience of

ymgais hon i sicrhau ein bod yn cynnig profiad o'r safon uchaf i bobl sy'n ymweld â Chymru, a hwnnw'n brofiad wedi'i seilio ar ein treftadaeth, ein diwylliant a'n hanes fel pobl, ac yn un a fydd, gobeithio, yn eu denu yn ôl i fwynhau mwy o'r pethau sydd gan ein gwlad i'w cynnig iddynt.

the highest quality to people visiting Wales, one that is based on our heritage, our culture, and our history as a people, and one which will, we hope, attract them back to Wales to enjoy more of the things that our nation has to offer them.

5.00 p.m.

Mae'n bleser cyflwyno'r cynnig hwn. Dylwn gyfeirio at y gwelliant a gynigiwyd. Mae'r gwelliant yn enw William Graham yn nodi gyda gofid

It is a pleasure to propose this motion. I should refer to the amendment that has been tabled. The amendment in the name of William Graham refers to regret at

'gyllid annigonol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer y celfyddydau a llenyddiaeth'.

'the Welsh Assembly Government's inadequate funding of the arts and literature'.

Mae'r gyllideb ar gyfer cyngor y celfyddydau wedi cynyddu i dros £25 miliwn i hyrwyddo'r pethau hyn. Nid wyf yn deallaf pan fo cyllideb wedi cynyddu o fewn setliad tynn iawn, pam y cyflwynir gwelliant sy'n sôn am resynu ynglŷn â chyllid annigonol. Yn ogystal â hynny, yr ydym hefyd wedi darparu swm ychwanegol o bron i £2.5 miliwn ar gyfer sefydlu theatr genedlaethol Saesneg i Gymru, a £4.5 miliwn ar gyfer cronfa newydd ar gyfer syniadau newydd ynglŷn â gwobrwyo rhagoriaeth. Y mae ein buddsoddiad yng Nghanolfan y Mileniwm ac yn Ngardd Fotaneg Genedlaethol Cymru yn ychwanegol i hynny hefyd. Felly, nid oes gennyf y syniad lleiaf pam eich bod yn sôn am gyllid annigonol. O ystyried realiti y setliad ariannol, yr ydym, fel Llywodraeth, wedi buddsoddi'n helaeth yn y celfyddydau.

The budget for the arts council for has increased to over £25 million to promote these very things. I do not understand how, when the budget has been increased within a tight settlement, an amendment that refers to regret at inadequate funding can be tabled. In addition to that, we have also provided an additional sum of almost £2.5 million for the establishment of a national English-language theatre, and £4.5 million for a new fund for new ideas on rewarding excellence. Our investment in the Wales Millennium Centre and the National Botanic Garden of Wales also comes on top of that. Therefore, I do not have the slightest idea as to why you should talk about inadequate funding. Given the reality of the financial settlement, we, as a Government, have invested substantially in the arts.

Mae ail ran y gwelliant yn sôn am yr angen i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru

The second part of the amendment talks about the need for the Welsh Assembly Government

'gryfhau'r gefnogaeth a roddir i'r iaith Gymraeg, sy'n gwneud cyfraniad enfawr at ddiwydiant twristiaeth ddiwylliannol Cymru.'

'to strengthen the support given to the Welsh language, which makes a huge contribution to Wales' cultural tourist industry'.

Wrth gwrs ei fod, ac wrth gwrs ein bod ni'n gwneud hynny. Mae nifer helaeth o ymrwymadau yn 'Cymru'n Un' sy'n sail i weithgareddau'r Llywodraeth hon mewn perthynas â'r iaith Gymraeg. Yr wyf eisoes wedi gwneud datganiadau am hyn: ychydig o wythnosau yn ôl, gwnes ddatganiad ynglŷn â

Of course it does, and of course we are doing that. There are a great many commitments in 'One Wales' that form the basis for this Government's activities in relation to the Welsh language. I have already made statements about this: a few weeks ago I made a statement about an investment of

buddsoddiad o £600,000 yn y wasg Cymraeg.

£600,000 in the Welsh-language print media.

Mae trydedd ran y gwelliant:

The third part of the amendment:

‘yn nodi gyda gofid bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi methu â sicrhau buddion sylweddol i Gymru yn sgil statws Lerpwl fel dinas diwylliant Ewrop’.

‘notes with regret that the Welsh Assembly Government has failed to secure significant benefits for Wales from Liverpool’s status as European city of culture’.

Cefnogom gais dinas Caerdydd, ond yr ydym hefyd wedi sicrhau bod cydweithredu rhwng siroedd gogledd Cymru â Lerpwl, a bydd y bartneriaeth twristiaeth yng ngogledd Cymru yn gwneud pob defnydd o’r wyl hon i ddenu ymwelwyr i Gymru. Felly, ni allaf dderbyn y gwelliant na’r rhesymeg, neu’n hytrach y diffygydd rhesymeg, y tu ôl iddo.

We supported Cardiff’s bid, but we have also ensured co-operation between counties in north Wales and Liverpool, and the tourism partnership in north Wales will make all possible use of this event to attract visitors to Wales. Therefore, I cannot support the amendment or the rationale, or rather lack of it, behind it.

**Paul Davies:** Cynigaf welliant 1 yn enw William Graham. Dileu popeth ar ôl ‘Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru’, a rhoi’r pwyntiau a ganlyn yn lle hynny:

**Paul Davies:** I propose amendment 1 in the name of William Graham. Delete all after ‘National Assembly for Wales’ and replace with:

*1. yn nodi gyda gofid y bydd cyllid annigonol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer y celfyddydau a llenyddiaeth yn cael effaith andwyol ar ddatblygu rhagor ar y potensial i hyrwyddo Cymru a’n diwylliant unigryw gartref ac mewn marchnadoedd allanol;*

*1. notes with regret that the Welsh Assembly Government’s inadequate funding of the arts and literature will have a detrimental effect on further developing the potential to promote Wales and our unique culture both at home and in external markets;*

*2. yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gryfhau’r gefnogaeth a roddir i’r iaith Gymraeg, sy’n gwneud cyfraniad enfawr at ddiwydiant twristiaeth ddiwylliannol Cymru;*

*2. calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to strengthen the support given to the Welsh language, which makes a huge contribution to Wales’s cultural tourism industry;*

*3. yn nodi gyda gofid bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi methu â sicrhau buddion sylweddol i Gymru yn sgil statws Lerpwl fel dinas diwylliant Ewrop.*

*3. notes with regret that the Welsh Assembly Government has failed to secure significant benefits for Wales from Liverpool’s status as European city of culture.*

Mae’n bleser cymryd rhan yn y ddadl y prynhawn yma a chynnig y gwelliant. Cytunaf gyda’r Gweinidog bod gan Gymru rai o’r cofgolofnau hanesyddol a hen gorau yn y Deyrnas Unedig, ond rhaid inni gyflwyno a marchnata ein cynnyrch twristiaeth ddiwylliannol yn llawer mwy effeithiol. Mae gennym sefydliadau dwristiaeth ddiwylliannol eang i’w cynnig i’r byd, fel ein castelli a’n golygfeydd hyfryd. Yn nhermau’r farchnad dramor, fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, mae gan Gymru safleoedd treftadaeth, amgueddfeydd ac orielau sy’n bwysig o ran denu pobl i Gymru yn y lle cyntaf.

It is a pleasure to take part in this afternoon’s debate and to propose the amendment. I agree with the Minister that Wales has some of the best historic and ancient monuments in the United Kingdom, but we have to present and market our cultural tourism much more effectively. We have a wide variety of cultural tourism attractions to offer the world, such as our wonderful castles and landscapes. In terms of the overseas market, as the Minister said, Wales has heritage sites, museums and galleries that are important in attracting people to Wales in the first place.



Croesawaf yr adolygiad a gyhoeddwyd gan y Llywodraeth y llynedd ynglŷn â datblygu ac hybu twristiaeth ddiwylliannol, a gobeithio y bydd canlyniadau'r adolygiad hwn yn cael eu cyhoeddi cyn bo hir. Yr wyf hefyd yn croesawu'r ffaith fod gan Gymru strategaeth twristiaeth ddiwylliannol. Nid oes strategaethau o'r fath yn bodoli mewn llawer o rannau eraill o Ewrop. Ers lansio'r strategaeth hon yn 2003, mae datblygiadau positif wedi digwydd, megis yr ardd fotaneg a'r datganiad i greu theatr genedlaethol Saesneg.

Mae'n glir o'r papur a gyhoeddwyd gan y Llywodraeth, ac yr ydym yn ei drafod heddiw, bod llawer o waith i'w wneud i hybu ymhellach y sector twristiaeth ddiwylliannol. Mae angen integreiddio polisiau a phrosesau rhwng adrannau'r Llywodraeth a chyrrff cyhoeddus eraill. Hefyd, mae angen i'r sectorau twristiaeth a diwylliant ddeall yn well yr anghenion a'r sialensiau y maent yn eu hwynebu. Mae hefyd yn glir bod angen i lywodraeth ar bob lefel ymrwymo'n fwy gyda'r sector breifat. Mae cyfle enfawr i hybu ymhellach ein twristiaeth ddiwylliannol drwy dargedu ein buddsoddiadau a sicrhau gwell marchnata yn y dyfodol.

Mae'n hanfodol annog chwaraeon yng nghyd-destun twristiaeth. Mae gan Gymru amrywiaeth enfawr o amgylcheddau naturiol, gyda'r golygfeydd a'r arfordiroedd gorau yn y byd. Gyda chystadlaethau megis Cwpan Ryder, a gynhelir yn y Celtic Manor yn 2010, mae digon o gyfleoedd eraill i godi cyhoeddusrwydd. Gall gweithgareddau fel hyn godi proffil Cymru ymhellach.

Mae gennym leoliadau ffantastig megis Stadiwm y Mileniwm, ac felly mae'n bwysig ein bod yn eu marchnata cymaint â phosibl, yn enwedig yn ystod y Gemau Olympaidd yn 2012. Fodd bynnag, fel y clywsom gan y Gweinidog, mae'n bosibl y bydd Cymru ar ei cholled o ryw £70 miliwn o achos y Gemau Olympaidd. Felly, mae'n hanfodol bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn sicrhau y caiff y sefydliadau diwylliannol hyn eu hariannu'n ddigonol. Dylid defnyddio fformiwla Barnett yng nghyd-destun y Gemau Olympaidd i sicrhau na fydd ein sefydliadau diwylliannol a chelfyddydol yn dioddef. Anogaf y

I welcome the review announced by the Government last year into developing and promoting cultural tourism and hope that the results of that review will be published soon. I also welcome the fact that Wales has a cultural tourism strategy. Such strategies do not exist in many other parts of Europe. Since the launch of this strategy in 2003, positive developments have taken place, such as the botanic garden and the announcement of the intention to create a national English-language theatre.

It is clear from the paper that the Government has published, and which we are discussing today, that there is still much work to do to further promote the cultural tourism sector. There is a need to integrate policies and processes between Government departments and other public bodies. Also, the tourism and cultural sectors need to better understand the needs and challenges that they face. It is also clear that there is a need for government at all levels to work more closely with the private sector. There is great scope for us to further promote our cultural tourism through targeting our investments and ensuring better marketing in future.

It is essential that we promote sport in the context of tourism. Wales has a huge variety of natural environments, with some of the best views and coasts in the world. With competitions such as the Ryder Cup, which will be held in the Celtic Manor in 2010, there are many opportunities to raise publicity. Activities such as this can raise Wales's profile further.

We have fantastic venues such as the Millennium Stadium, and therefore it is important that we market them as much as possible, particularly during the Olympic Games in 2012. However, as we heard from the Minister, it is possible that Wales could lose up to £70 million because of the Olympic Games. Therefore, it is essential that the Assembly Government ensures that these cultural institutions are adequately funded. The Barnett formula should be used in the context of the Olympic Games to ensure that our cultural and national institutions do not suffer. I urge the Minister to put pressure on

Gweinidog i bwysu ar Lywodraeth y DU i weithredu ar y mater hwn. Byddai methu ariannu'r sefydliadau hyn yn ddigonol yn cael effaith anferth ar hybu Cymru fel gwlad sy'n cynnig cyfleusterau/atyniadau gwych.

Fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, mae'r iaith Gymraeg yn chwarae rhan hynod bwysig yn hybu ein diwylliant i dwristiaid, a dyna pam ei bod yn hanfodol bod y Llywodraeth yn sicrhau bod yr iaith yn ffynnu, a bod pobl yn cael y cyfle i ddysgu'r Gymraeg. Er hynny, wedi clywed datganiad diweddar y Gweinidog am ariannu'r wasg Gymraeg, mae rhai'n amau ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth hon. Teimla rhai nad yw'r cyllid yn ddigon i sefydlu papur dyddiol Cymraeg, a gall hynny felly fod yn niweidiol i'r Gymraeg yn y dyfodol.

Mae'r eisteddfod genedlaethol a'r eisteddfod ryngwladol ymysg y digwyddiadau diwylliannol mwyaf a gynhelir yn Ewrop. Mae eisteddfod yr Urdd yn ddathliad gwych o ddiwylliant ieuenctid. Felly, mae'n hynod bwysig i'r dathliadau diwylliannol eiconig hyn dderbyn cymorth ariannol dibynadwy oddi wrth Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru er mwyn sicrhau manteisio ar gyfleoedd o ran twristiaeth ac adfywiad economaidd. Mae twristiaeth ddiwylliannol ymysg y sectorau sy'n tyfu gyflymaf yn Ewrop, ac felly y mae'n holl bwysig bod Cymru'n manteisio ar hyn.

**Alun Davies:** I welcome the opportunity to speak in this debate—I enjoyed the Minister's introduction to it. I hope, in my contribution, to address two themes. The first is how we define cultural tourism, and the second concerns the role of Government in promoting cultural tourism.

Many find culture a fluid and problematic concept to deal with, and that makes cultural tourism all the more difficult. One of our great strengths in Wales—although I am not sure that this is a strength for tourists—is the ability to argue at great length about culture without reaching any conclusion whatsoever. I hope that, as a Monmouthshire boy, I will be forgiven for quoting a tradition of Raymond Williams in trying to define

the UK Government with regard to this matter. A failure to adequately fund these establishments would have a massive effect on marketing Wales as a country that offers fantastic attractions.

As the Minister said, the Welsh language plays an extremely important part in promoting our culture to tourists, and that is why it is essential that the Government ensures that the language prospers, and that people have an opportunity to learn Welsh. Having said that, having heard the Minister's recent statement on funding the printed press, some people are concerned about the commitment of this Government. Some people feel that the commitment is not sufficient to establish a daily Welsh newspaper, and that could also be damaging to the Welsh language in the future.

The national eisteddfod and the international eisteddfod are among the largest cultural events held anywhere in Europe. The Urdd eisteddfod is a fantastic celebration of youth culture. Therefore, it is extremely important that these iconic cultural events should receive dependable funding from the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure that we take advantage of tourism opportunities and economic regeneration. Cultural tourism is among the fastest growing sectors in Europe, and therefore it is crucial that Wales takes advantage of this.

**Alun Davies:** Croesawaf y cyfle i siarad yn y ddadl hon—mwynheais gyflwyniad y Gweinidog iddi. Gobeithiaf, yn fy nghyfraniad, fynd i'r afael â dwy thema. Y gyntaf yw sut yr ydym yn diffinio twristiaeth ddiwylliannol, ac mae'r ail yn ymwneud â swyddogaeth y Llywodraeth yn hyrwyddo twristiaeth ddiwylliannol.

I lawer, mae diwylliant yn gysyniad hyblyg ac anodd delio ag ef, ac mae hynny'n gwneud twristiaeth ddiwylliannol yn anos byth. Un o'n cryfderau mawr yng Nghymru—er nad wyf yn siŵr a yw'n gryfder i dwristiaeth—yw'r gallu i ddadlau'n ddiddiwedd am ddiwylliant heb ddod i gasgliad o fath yn y byd. Fel crwt o sir Fynwy, gobeithio y maddeuir i mi am ddyfynnu un o draddodiadau Raymond Williams wrth geisio

cultural identity. Williams spoke about a particular sense of place and of life, of a particular community of experience, and of a characteristic colour. For me, cultural tourism is about seeking out the special character of a place, and perhaps that amorphous, intangible, nebulous and unsatisfactory description is the best way of avoiding an even longer debate this afternoon.

If we are to promote cultural tourism, I would like us to redefine our cultural inheritance and the cultural tourism that we have perhaps promoted in the past. We all recognise and appreciate the traditional interpretation and representation of the past, from castles to cathedrals, but we also recognise the place of the arts, whether the theatre, concerts, galleries, festivals or events. However, we also need to understand and ensure that the growth of cultural tourism is not simply a rural phenomenon, which includes visits to historic sites and little else.

In the same way that culture defines everything about a community, I would like to see cultural tourism include the regenerated industrial and waterfront developments, urban arts and heritage attractions, contemporary cultural festivals, theatrical events, concerts and performances. I would like to see a cultural tourism that is focused on sport, art galleries, film locations and participation in craft classes and cookery schools as well as in the events and literary occasions that others have already described.

5.10 p.m.

If we redefine cultural inheritance in that way, the industrial heritage of the Valleys—although I accept that it will only be the Valleys—will play a central part in the growth of cultural tourism in Wales and promote a wider understanding of our social and political history. Our own understanding of our own history through the designation of Blaenavon as a world heritage site has begun this transformation. By our extending the definition to include the whole cultural experience of our people, Big Pit will become

diffinio hunaniaeth ddiwylliannol. Siaradai Williams am ymdeimlad arbennig o le ac o fywyd, o gymuned benodol o brofiad, ac o liw nodweddiadol. I mi, mae twristiaeth ddiwylliannol yn ymwneud â cheisio canfod cymeriad arbennig lle, ac efallai mai'r disgrifiad amorffaidd, anniriaethol, amwys ac anfoddhaol hwnnw yw'r ffordd orau o osgoi dadl hyd yn oed hwy y prynhawn yma.

Os ydym i hyrwyddo twristiaeth ddiwylliannol, hoffwn inni ailddiffinio ein hetifeddiaeth ddiwylliannol a'r dwristiaeth ddiwylliannol y bu inni, o bosibl, ei hyrwyddo yn y gorffennol. Yr ydym, un ac oll, yn cydnabod ac yn gwerthfawrogi'r dehongliad a'r darlun traddodiadol o'r gorffennol, o gestyll i gadeirlannau, ond yr ydym hefyd yn cydnabod lle'r celfyddydau, boed hynny'n theatr, cyngherddau, orielau, gwyliau neu ddigwyddiadau. Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni hefyd ddeall a sicrhau nad ffenomenon gwledig yn unig mo twf twristiaeth ddiwylliannol, sy'n cynnwys ymweliadau â safleoedd hanesyddol a fawr ddim arall.

Yn yr un modd ag y mae diwylliant yn diffinio popeth am gymuned, carwn weld twristiaeth ddiwylliannol yn cynnwys y datblygiadau diwydiannol a glan-dŵr adfywiedig, celfyddydau trefol ac atyniadau treftadaeth, gwyliau celfyddydol cyfoes, digwyddiadau theatrig, cyngherddau a pherfformiadau. Carwn weld twristiaeth ddiwylliannol sy'n canolbwyntio ar chwaraeon, orielau celf, lleoliadau ffilm a chyfranogi mewn dosbarthiadau crefft ac ysgolion coginio yn ogystal ag yn y digwyddiadau ac achlysuron llenyddol y mae eraill eisoes wedi'u disgrifio.

O ail-ddiffinio etifeddiaeth ddiwylliannol fel hynny, bydd treftadaeth ddiwydiannol y Cymoedd—er fy mod yn derbyn mai dim ond y Cymoedd fydd hynny—yn chwarae rhan ganolog yn nhwf twristiaeth ddiwylliannol yng Nghymru ac yn hyrwyddo dealltwriaeth ehangach o'n hanes cymdeithasol a gwleidyddol. Mae ein dealltwriaeth ein hunain o'n hanes ein hunain drwy ddynodi Blaenafon yn safle treftadaeth y byd wedi dechrau'r gweddnewidiad hwn. Drwy inni ehangu'r diffiniad i gynnwys holl brofiad

as much a part of cultural tourism as the cathedral at St David's.

**Jenny Randerson:** I welcome that your comments relate to a broad definition of cultural tourism. Do you share my astonishment and considerable disappointment that a leaflet produced last week by VisitWales, and distributed throughout the United Kingdom via *The Guardian* and other newspapers, divided Wales up into regions, failed to indicate that Cardiff was the capital city, and failed to provide any details about the tourism projects in the capital city? Do you agree that if we cannot manage to include the capital city of Wales in such promotions, we deserve to be treated as the tourist backwater that, I regret to say, a large number of organisations in the UK as a whole tend to treat Wales?

**Alun Davies:** I do not regard Wales as a tourist backwater. We have an opportunity to do far better and I hope that we will do far better in years to come. If we adopt a different vision of our own civilization and how we define it, it takes us far away from stereotypes and past perceptions.

The second theme that I would like to address is that of the role of Government. I see two clear roles for Government. The first is to shape and provide a framework for the proposition that tourists are offered if they come to Wales, linking histories and experiences. The second is in creating an infrastructure that gives life to the ambitions that we have all discussed in different ways this afternoon. For me, shaping the proposition is absolutely essential. It is no longer good enough simply to promote isolated and individual attractions. We need to be able to create a story, a narrative, and an identity for different places, and to create the context for the importance of particular historical places and experiences. That means linking the quarries of Meirionnydd and Arfon to the history of the chartists in Newport, and to the lead mines in Ceredigion, and, at the same time, linking the Christian heritage from the pilgrims at Tintern to St David's and the pathways of the

diwylliannol ein pobl, daw Pwll Mawr yn gymaint rhan o dwristiaeth ddiwylliannol â chadeirlan Tyddewi.

**Jenny Randerson:** Croesawaf y ffaith bod eich sylwadau'n cyfeirio at ddiffiniad eang o dwristiaeth ddiwylliannol. A rannwch fy syndod a'm siomedigaeth enbyd bod taflen a gynhyrchwyd yr wythnos diwethaf gan Groeso Cymru, a'i dosbarthu ledled y Deyrnas Unedig drwy *The Guardian* a phapurau newydd eraill, yn rhannu Cymru'n rhanbarthau, yn methu â nodi mai Caerdydd oedd y brifddinas ac yn methu â rhoi unrhyw fanylion am y prosiectau twristiaeth yn y brifddinas? A gytunwch, oni allwn lwyddo i gynnwys prifddinas Cymru mewn ymgyrchoedd o'r fath, ein bod yn haeddu cael ein trin fel y merddwr twristiaeth, mae'n gas gen i ddweud, y mae nifer o fawr o gyrff yn y DU yn ei chyfanrwydd yn dueddol o drin Cymru?

**Alun Davies:** Nid wyf yn ystyried Cymru yn ferddwr twristiaeth. Mae gennym gyfle i wneud yn llawer gwell, a gobeithio y gwnawn yn llawer gwell yn y blynyddoedd i ddod. O fabwysiadu gweledigaeth wahanol ynghylch ein gwareiddiad a sut byddwn yn ei ddiffinio, cawn gyfle i gefnu ar stereoteipiau a thybiaethau a fu.

Yr ail thema yr hoffwn ymdrin â hi yw rôl y Llywodraeth. Gwelaf ddwy rôl glir i'r Llywodraeth. Y gyntaf yw llunio a darparu fframwaith ar gyfer yr hyn a gynigir i dwristiaid os ydynt yn dod i Gymru, gan gysylltu hanesion a phrofiadau. Yr ail yw creu seilwaith sy'n rhoi anadl einioes i'r uchelgeisiau yr ydym oll wedi eu trafod mewn gwahanol ffyrdd y prynhawn yma. I mi, mae llunio'r cynnig yn gwbl hanfodol. Nid yw bellach yn ddigon da hyrwyddo atyniadau ynysig ac unigol yn unig. Mae angen inni allu creu stori, naratif a hunaniaeth i wahanol leoedd, a chreu cyd-destun ar gyfer pwysigrwydd lleoedd hanesyddol a phrofiadau. Mae hynny'n golygu cysylltu chwareli Meirionnydd ac Arfon â hanes y siartwyr yng Nghasnewydd, ac â'r pyllau plwm yng Ngheredigion, gan, yr un pryd, gysylltu'r dreftadaeth Gristnogol o'r pererinion yn Nhyndyrn i Dyddewi a llwybrau'r saint o Ystrad Fflur i Ynys Enlli. Os gallwn wneud hynny, byddwn yn creu

saints from Strata Florida to Bardsey island. If we are able to do that we will create a new perception of the importance of cultural tourism. That means that we need to create an infrastructure for cultural tourism that will sustain the ambitions that we have for it.

I welcome the £5 million that Leighton Andrews announced last month for the Heads of the Valleys project. I also welcome John Griffiths's announcement on the training opportunities at Bluestone in my region of Mid and West Wales. By creating an infrastructure we will be able to fulfil the ambitions that we all share.

**David Melding:** Despite admiring the late Raymond Williams, particularly his work, *Culture and Society*, I do not quite share the existential angst of Alun Davies. However, I think that he has hit on a great truth in saying that we do not appreciate the rich diversity of our national heritage. I thought that his criticism was made in tactful terms, but it was a pretty central criticism, and one that I share nevertheless. The Minister took us on a somewhat bucolic tour around our national heritage without telling us anything about what is actually now being done, in critical terms, to market that great resource and to sell it to the people of the world, and Europe in particular. That will have great knock-on effects, because many people who will establish businesses probably will get to know Wales in the first instance after flying with British Airways perhaps and seeing what were the Welsh Development Agency advertisements praising Wales as an industrial and business location. That is important.

We have heard that Cardiff is not always prominent in our literature, even in the material that we control and generate. It is true that we do not realise—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Thank you for allowing me to intervene, David. I would not normally do so, as I will be closing the debate.

In case the point that Jenny raised is repeated time and again in this debate, that leaflet was

darlun newydd o bwysigrwydd twristiaeth ddiwylliannol. Golyga hynny bod angen inni greu seilwaith ar gyfer twristiaeth ddiwylliannol a fydd yn cynnal yr uchelgeisiau sydd gennym ar ei chyfer.

Croesawaf y £5 miliwn a gyhoeddodd Leighton Andrews fis diwethaf ar gyfer y prosiect Blaenau'r Cymoedd. Croesawaf hefyd gyhoeddiad John Griffiths ynghylch y cyfleoedd hyfforddi yn Bluestone, yn fy rhanbarth i, sef Canolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru. Drwy greu seilwaith, byddwn yn gallu cyflawni'r dyheadau a rannwn, un ac oll.

**David Melding:** Er fy mod yn edmygu'r diweddar Raymond Williams, yn enwedig ei waith, *Culture and Society*, nid wyf yn gallu rhannu'r un ing dirfodol ag Alun Davies. Fodd bynnag, credaf iddo daro ar wirionedd mawr pan ddywed nad ydym yn gwerthfawrogi amrywiaeth cyfoethog ein treftadaeth genedlaethol. Credais iddo leisio ei feirniadaeth mewn ffordd ddoeth, ond yr oedd yn feirniadaeth bur ganolog, ac yn un a rannaf, er hynny. Aeth y Gweinidog â ni am daith weddol wledig o amgylch ein treftadaeth genedlaethol heb ddweud dim wrthym am yr hyn sydd wir yn cael ei wneud ar hyn o bryd, mewn termau beirniadol, i farchnata'r adnodd gwych hwnnw a'i werthu i bobl y byd, ac Ewrop yn benodol. Bydd hynny'n cael effaith ddilynol sylweddol, oherwydd bydd nifer o bobl a fydd yn sefydlu busnesau, mae'n debyg, yn dod i adnabod Cymru i ddechrau ar ôl hedfan gyda *British Airways*, o bosibl, a gweld hysbysebion Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, fel yr oedd, yn canmol Cymru fel lleoliad da ar gyfer diwydiant a busnes. Mae hynny'n bwysig.

Yr ydym wedi clywed nad yw Caerdydd bob amser yn amlwg yn ein llenyddiaeth, hyd yn oed yn y deunydd a reolwn ac a gynhyrchwn. Mae'n wir nad ydym yn sylweddoli—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Diolch am ganiatáu imi ymyrryd, David. Ni wnawn hynny fel arfer, gan mai myfi fydd yn cau'r ddadl.

Rhag ofn y caiff y pwynt hwn a gododd Jenny ei ailadrodd dro ar ôl tro yn y ddadl

paid for by local authorities. If a local authority does not contribute to it, it can hardly expect to be included in it.

**David Melding:** I hope that your special adviser is right and that that is the nature of the document.

We do not appreciate the glory of Cardiff as a Victorian and Edwardian city. Given the size of Cardiff, there is not really an architectural equivalent anywhere in the Commonwealth. There is the wonderful neo-Baroque of City Hall and the extraordinary Pre-Raphaelite design of Cardiff Castle, and Cathedral Road is probably one of the most outstanding late nineteenth century/early twentieth century roads in the world, but there is not a single building that you can visit there that demonstrates how it was lived in when that was the centre of much of world commerce on the export of coal. That is disappointing and what does our not valuing this great resource tell people who we want to come to visit Wales?

St German's in Roath is probably one of the greatest Oxford movement churches in Britain. It has recently been renovated and I congratulate the previous Government on giving it a handsome grant. It is amazing. However, we do not sell ourselves effectively. I recently had some American visitors and they could not believe the wonder of Cardiff's arcades through which you can wander. They called them the 'original malls'—however you pronounce that word. We need to do more to market ourselves. The marketing budget has been cut recently, not as a direct consequence of a Government decision but because of the way in which we can spend European moneys now. What are we going to do about that? How are we going to make up the shortfall? I would like a bit of detail from the Government on that.

The Minister said that current funding is adequate—I believe that that is a justified inference, because he attacked the amendment in the name of William Graham

hon, talwyd am y daflen honno gan awdurdodau lleol. Os nad yw awdurdod lleol yn cyfrannu ati, go brin y gall ddisgwyl cael ei gynnwys ynddi.

**David Melding:** Gobeithiaf fod eich cynghorydd arbennig yn iawn ac mai dyna natur y ddogfen.

Nid ydym yn gwerthfawrogi gogoniant Caerdydd fel dinas Fictoriaidd ac Edwardaidd. Ac ystyried maint Caerdydd, nid oes unman cyfatebol o ran pensaerniaeth yn unlle yn y Gymanwlad, a dweud y gwir. Dyna ichi arddull neo-Faróc bendigedig Neuadd y Ddinas a chynllun Cyn-Raffaëlaidd hynod Castell Caerdydd, ac mae'n debyg fod Ffordd yr Eglwys Gadeiriol yn un o'r hynotaf yn y byd o ffyrdd diwedd y bedwaredd ganrif ar bymtheg/dechrau'r ugeinfed ganrif, ond nid oes yr un adeilad yn y ddinas y gallwch fynd iddo i weld sut yr oedd bywyd yno pan oedd y lle'n ganolbwynt llawer o fasnach y byd wrth allforio glo. Mae hynny'n siom, a beth mae ein diffyg gwerthfawrogiad ni o'r adnodd pwysig hwn yn ei ddweud wrth bobl yr ydym yn awyddus iddynt ddod i ymweld â Chymru?

Mae'n debyg fod eglwys Sant German yn y Rhath yn un o eglwysi mwyaf mudiad Rhydychen ym Mhrydain. Cafodd ei hadnewyddu'n ddiweddar ac yr wyf yn llongyfarch y Llywodraeth flaenorol am roi grant hael iddi. Mae'n rhyfeddol. Fodd bynnag, nid ydym yn gwerthu'n hunain yn effeithiol. Yn ddiweddar cefais ymwelwyr o America ac ni allent gredu rhyfeddod arcedau Caerdydd, y gallwch grwydro drwyddynt. Yr 'original malls' oedd eu henw hwy arnynt—sut bynnag y mae ynganu'r gair hwnnw. Mae angen inni wneud mwy i farchnata'n hunain. Cafodd y gyllideb farchnata ei thorri'n ddiweddar, nid o ganlyniad uniongyrchol i benderfyniad gan y Llywodraeth ond oherwydd y ffordd y cawn wario arian Ewrop bellach. Beth yr ydym yn mynd i'w wneud am hynny? Sut yr ydym ni'n mynd i wneud iawn am y diffyg? Hoffwn ychydig o fanylion gan y Llywodraeth am hynny.

Dywedodd y Gweinidog fod y cyllid cyfredol yn ddigonol—credaf fod cyfiawnhad dros gasglu hynny, oherwydd ymosododd ar y gwelliant yn enw William Graham a

that criticised the lack of funding. He has obviously not listened to the vast amount of lobbying that is now going on as a result of the Arts Council of Wales's decision to cut funding. For example, St Donat's art centre in the Vale of Glamorgan, and the wonderful international storytelling festival that is based there, which is the largest in the UK, is internationally renowned and a wonderful outreach facility for schools, is now in danger of being lost because of the cutbacks. They are happening and you were hopelessly complacent in dismissing that, Minister.

You mentioned jazz. The Welsh Jazz Society is losing its grant. Brecon jazz festival will survive, probably, because it has such an outstanding international reputation, but there are others festivals all around Wales. Wales is becoming known as something of a jazz nation and now we propose to cut that grant. The Cowbridge jazz festival is a good example of something that has been developed more recently, taking inspiration from Brecon.

There was a lack of—

**Darren Millar:** You referred to our international reputation. Do you agree that, given Liverpool's status as European Capital of Culture, we are not taking the opportunity to market north Wales, in particular, with its strong links, historically, to Liverpool? As a result, towns such as Colwyn Bay, in my constituency, and Llandudno just over the border, are losing out on incredible tourism opportunities. That is on the back of the Government's lack of impact in dragging business across the border.

**David Melding:** That is a good point. Liverpool—and I am going to use a politically incorrect word now—was the second great city of the empire and, for many years, it did not market itself at all well. It is now recovering. We need to do that too.

Wales as a whole, but particularly north Wales, is the most castellated country on Earth, perhaps second to Palestine, and that is a debatable point. Yet, I do not believe that most people in north America have a clue

feirniadau'r diffyg cyllid. Yn amlwg nid yw wedi gwranddo ar y lobïo helaeth sy'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd yn sgil penderfyniad Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru i gwtogi cyllid. Er enghraifft, mae canolfan gelf Sain Dunwyd ym Mro Morgannwg, a'r wyl adrodd straeon ryngwladol wych a gynhelir yno, sydd y fwyaf yn y Deyrnas Unedig, yn enwog yn rhyngwladol ac yn gyfleuster allanol gwych i ysgolion, mewn perygl bellach o gael ei cholli oherwydd y toriadau. Maent yn digwydd ac yr oeddech yn anobeithiol o hunan-fodlon yn wffio at hynny, Weinidog.

Sonioch am jazz. Mae Cymdeithas Jazz Cymru'n colli ei grant. Bydd gŵyl jazz Aberhonddu'n goroesi, mae'n debyg, am fod ganddi enw rhyngwladol mor arbennig, ond mae gwyliau eraill o gwmpas Cymru. Mae Cymru'n dod i fri fel tipyn o genedl jazz, ac yn awr yr ydym yn bwriadu torri'r grant hwnnw. Mae gŵyl jazz y Bont-faen yn enghraifft dda o rywbeth sydd wedi datblygu'n fwy diweddar, gan gymryd ysbrydoliaeth oddi wrth Aberhonddu.

Yr oedd diffyg—

**Darren Millar:** Cyfeiriasoch at ein henw rhyngwladol. A ydych yn cytuno, ac ystyried statws Lerpwl fel Prifddinas Diwylliant Ewrop, nad ydym yn manteisio ar y cyfle i farchnata'r gogledd, yn arbennig, a'i gysylltiadau cryf, yn hanesyddol, â Lerpwl? O ganlyniad, mae trefi fel Bae Colwyn, yn f'etholaeth i, a Llandudno dros y ffin, yn colli cyfleon twristaidd anhygoel. Mae hynny ar ben diffyg llwyddiant y Llywodraeth i lusgo busnes dros y ffin.

**David Melding:** Mae hwnnw'n bwynt da. Lerpwl—ac yr wyf yn mynd i ddefnyddio gair gwleidyddol anghywir yn awr—oedd ail ddinas fawr yr ymerodraeth ac, am flynyddoedd lawer, ni farchnatodd ei hun yn dda o gwbl. Mae'n dod dros hynny bellach. Mae angen i ninnau wneud hefyd.

Cymru yn ei chyfanrwydd, ond y gogledd yn arbennig, yw'r wlad fwyaf castellolog ar y Ddaear, yn ail efallai i Balesteina, a gellir dadlau ynghylch hynny. Eto, nid wyf yn credu bod gan y rhan fwyaf o bobl yng

that that is what distinguishes that phase of our history. They would come here if we could market that resource more effectively as well as all the others.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Wind up, please.

**David Melding:** Wales is one of the places where the industrial revolution started and we need to blow our own trumpet with much greater force than we have in the past.

5.20 p.m.

**Peter Black:** First of all, I welcome the fact that we are having this debate today. I am sure that it is no coincidence that we are having it in the week before St David's Day. It is important that we recognise that the cultural legacy and assets that Wales has are an important part of the product that we can sell to the outside world, in terms of tourism and getting people into Wales, not just to learn about our past, but to appreciate and enjoy what we have on offer and, hopefully, to come back to experience it again.

In many ways, talking about cultural tourism in isolation from the whole tourism product seems to me to be very difficult, in the sense that you cannot really isolate it in that way. Culture is important. All the buildings and festivals that we have are important for people living in Wales and people visiting Wales; however, in terms of the tourism product as a whole, it forms just one part of the whole package that people will enjoy when they come to Wales. They come to Wales not just to enjoy our heritage, buildings and festivals, but to enjoy our scenery, our weather—when we have good weather—and the whole package that is on offer. That is why I think that marketing is so important in terms of how we deal with this issue. We must ensure that we market the package as a whole, not just different elements in isolation.

We must ensure that when Visit Wales

ngogledd America syniad mai dyna sydd yn nodweddu'r cyfnod hwnnw yn ein hanes. Deuent yma pe gallem farchnata'r adnodd hwnnw'n fwy effeithiol yn ogystal â'r lleill i gyd.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. A wnewch chi ddirwyn i ben, os gwelwch yn dda.

**David Melding:** Cymru yw un o'r manau lle dechreuodd y chwyldro diwydiannol ac mae angen inni chwythu ein corn ein hunain yn llawer cryfach nag yr ydym wedi'i wneud yn y gorffennol.

**Peter Black:** Yn gyntaf oll, croesawaf y ffaith ein bod yn cael y ddadl hon heddiw. Yr wyf yn siŵr nad cyd-ddigwyddiad ydyw ein bod yn ei chael yn yr wythnos cyn Gŵyl Ddewi. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn sylweddoli bod yr etifeddiaeth ddiwylliannol a'r asedau sydd gan Gymru'n rhan bwysig o'r cynnyrch y gallwn ei werthu i'r byd y tu allan, yn nhermau twristiaeth a chael pobl i mewn i Gymru, nid yn unig i ddysgu am ein gorffennol, ond i werthfawrogi a mwynhau'r hyn sydd gennym i'w gynnig a, gobeithio, i ddod yn ôl i'w brofi eto.

Mewn sawl ffordd, mae'n ymddangos i mi ei bod yn anodd iawn siarad am dwristiaeth ddiwylliannol ar wahân i'r cynnyrch twristaidd cyfan, yn yr ystyr nad oes modd mewn gwirionedd ei ynysu fel yna. Mae diwylliant yn bwysig. Mae'r holl adeiladau a gwyliau sydd gennym yn bwysig i bobl sy'n byw yng Nghymru ac i bobl sy'n ymweld â Chymru; fodd bynnag, yn nhermau'r cynnyrch twristaidd yn ei gyfanrwydd, mae'n ffurfio un rhan yn unig o'r pecyn cyfan y bydd pobl yn ei fwynhau pan ddeuant i Gymru. Deuant i Gymru nid yn unig i fwynhau ein treftadaeth, ein hadeiladau a'n gwyliau, ond i fwynhau ein golygfeydd, ein tywydd—pan gawn dywydd da—a'r pecyn cyfan sydd ar gynnig. Dyna pam yr wyf yn meddwl bod marchnata mor bwysig o ran sut y deliwn â'r mater hwn. Rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn marchnata'r pecyn yn ei gyfanrwydd, nid yn wahanol elfennau ar wahân.

Rhaid inni sicrhau pan fydd Croeso Cymru'n



promotes Wales that it is talking about not just the culture that we have on offer, but the whole range of activities that people can enjoy. If we can get the product right, in terms of what is on offer once people get here, we can then encourage them to come back to experience it again. That is certainly my experience when I go to other countries around the world as a tourist, whether it is to a European city, across the water to Ireland or to America. When I go somewhere, I try to enjoy the whole experience, including the scenery and the weather, as well as the cultural assets that are on show. That is why I hope that, in debating cultural tourism in this way, we are not thinking that this is more important than other aspects. It has to be part of an entire package.

In terms of the cultural package that is on offer, it always seems to me that, when we come to market and promote it, we never get the interpretation quite right. Often, when people come to a visitor attraction, they want assistance in terms of putting that attraction into context. I know that the National Museum Wales does a particularly good job in that respect and, if you go to one of its centres, you will know exactly what you are visiting, what its importance is, and the context in which it is set. However, other attractions, which are not necessarily Government attractions, are not always put into context.

A good example is the American interest in Dylan Thomas. The Minister lives not too far from Laugharne, but, until not so long ago, the town of Laugharne did not have a website on which it could promote itself to the many Americans who are particularly interested in coming to find out more about its most famous poet. I Googled Laugharne this morning and found a very good website, which I think is a fairly recent acquisition; it tells you everything that you would want to know about the township of Laugharne, about the accommodation, the restaurants and the history, and it tells you how to go about finding Dylan Thomas. That is a major asset for those Americans and others who have an interest in Dylan Thomas, who want to come to that township. The village of Mumbles,

hyrwyddo Cymru y sonia nid yn unig am y diwylliant sydd gennym i'w gynnig, ond yr holl amrediad o weithgareddau y gall pobl eu mwynhau. Os gallwn gael y cynnyrch yn iawn, o ran yr hyn sydd ar gael unwaith y daw pobl yma, yna gallwn eu hannog i ddod yn ôl i'w brofi eto. Dyna fy mhrofiad i yn sicr pan af i wledydd eraill o gwmpas y byd fel ymwelydd, boed i ddinas Ewropeaidd, dros y dŵr i Iwerddon neu i America. Pan af i rywle, ceisiaf fwynhau'r profiad cyfan, gan gynnwys y golygfeydd a'r tywydd, yn ogystal â'r asedau diwylliannol sydd ar ddangos. Dyna pam yr wyf yn gobeithio, wrth inni drafod twristiaeth ddiwylliannol fel hyn, nad ydym yn meddwl bod hyn yn bwysicach nag agweddau eraill. Mae'n rhaid iddi fod yn rhan o becyn cyfan.

O ran y pecyn diwylliannol sydd ar gynnig, mae'n ymddangos i mi bob amser, pan ddeuwn i'w farchnata a'i hyrwyddo, na fyddwn byth yn cael y dehongliad yn hollol iawn. Yn aml, pan ddaw pobl i atyniad i ymwelwyr, mae arnynt eisiau cymorth o ran rhoi'r atyniad hwnnw yn ei gyd-destun. Gwn fod Amgueddfa Genedlaethol Cymru'n gwneud gwaith arbennig o dda yn hynny o beth ac, os ewch i un o'i chanolfannau, cewch wybod yn union beth yr ydych yn ei weld, beth yw ei bwysigrwydd, a'r cyd-destun y mae wedi'i osod ynddo. Fodd bynnag, nid yw atyniadau eraill, nad ydynt o reidrwydd yn atyniadau o eiddo'r Llywodraeth, bob amser yn cael eu rhoi mewn cyd-destun.

Enghraifft dda yw diddordeb yr Americanwyr yn Dylan Thomas. Mae'r Gweinidog yn byw nid nepell o Dalacharn, ond tan yn weddol ddiweddar, nid oedd gan dref Talacharn wefan lle gallai hyrwyddo'i hun i'r nifer fawr o Americanwyr sydd â diddordeb arbennig mewn dod i ddarganfod mwy am ei bardd enwocaf. Gwglais Dalacharn y bore yma a chefais hyd i wefan dda iawn, sydd yn rhywbeth eithaf diweddar, mi dybiaf; mae'n dweud popeth wrthych y byddai arnoch eisiau ei wybod am dref Talacharn, am y llety, y tai bwyta a'r hanes, a sut i fynd ati i ddarganfod Dylan Thomas. Mae hynny'n ased mawr i'r Americanwyr hynny ac eraill sy'n ymddiddori yn Dylan Thomas, ac sydd eisiau dod i'r dref honno. Mae gan bentref y Mwmbwls, y tu allan i

just outside Swansea, also has an excellent website—it must be said that it had it a few years before Laugharne had its website. Our web presence is very important for marketing purposes. I also think that we have to encourage those areas that have a particular cultural identity, such as Laugharne, to do more to promote themselves and to ensure that people understand what it is that they are visiting and why they should go to that area as part of their visit to Wales.

I know that the review that took place on cultural tourism made a number of recommendations and that a great deal more has to be done in that respect. I hope that the review's recommendations will be taken up by the Minister and taken forward with all the vigour and enthusiasm that the Minister showed when he gave us his tour of Wales and the list of places that we are going to visit in Wales. I hope that that is part of the Welsh Assembly Government strategy.

**Nerys Evans:** Croesawaf y ddadl a'r cyfle i gyfrannu. Fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, mae twristiaeth yn ddiwydiant cystadleuol iawn. Un peth hanfodol o ran gwerthu Cymru i'r farchnad ryngwladol yw pwysigrwydd gwerthu'r elfennau a'r diwylliant sy'n unigryw i Gymru. Mae angen gwerthu a hyrwyddo Cymru fel lleoliad ar gyfer digwyddiadau diwylliannol. Mae gennym record gref yn y maes hwn, oherwydd digwyddiadau megis eisteddfodau, yr Urdd, Eisteddfod Gerddorol Ryngwladol Llangollen a gŵyl jazz Aberhonddu. Mae angen inni hyrwyddo'r elfennau sy'n unigryw i Gymru i bobl sy'n dewis treulio amser yn y wlad ar wyliau. Unwaith y bydd pobl yn dewis ymweld â Chymru, mae'n bwysig eu bod yn dychwelyd adref wedi cael profiadau gwahanol a'u bod yn teimlo eu bod wedi ymweld â gwlad wahanol, hyfyw, ac nid â rhanbarth arall o'r Deyrnas Unedig yn unig.

Mae gwaith da yn cael ei wneud yn y maes hwn mewn rhai lleoedd, megis y cynllun Gallu yng ngorllewin Cymru, sy'n galluogi pobl i ddatblygu'r sgiliau sydd eu hangen i weithio yn y diwydiant twristiaeth drwy weithio gyda busnesau bach lleol sy'n gallu darparu hyfforddiant. Fodd bynnag, mae lle o

Abertawe, yntau wefan ragorol—rhaid dweud bod honno'n bodoli rai blynyddoedd cyn i Dalacharn gael ei gwefan. Mae ein presenoldeb ar y we'n bwysig iawn i ddibenion marchnata. Credaf hefyd fod yn rhaid inni annog yr ardaloedd hynny sydd â hunaniaeth ddiwylliannol arbennig, fel Talacharn, i wneud mwy i hybu'u hunain ac i sicrhau bod pobl yn deall beth y maent yn ymweld ag ef a pham y dylent fynd i'r ardal honno fel rhan o'u hymweliad â Chymru.

Gwn fod yr adolygiad a wnaethpwyd ar dwristiaeth ddiwylliannol wedi gwneud nifer o argymhellion a bod yn rhaid gwneud llawer mwy yn hynny o beth. Gobeithiaf y derbynnir argymhellion yr adolygiad gan y Gweinidog ac y gwnaiff fwrw ymlaen â hwy gyda'r holl egni a brwdfrydedd a ddangosodd y Gweinidog pan roddodd ei gylchdaith o Gymru inni a'r rhestr o lefydd yr ydym yn mynd i ymweld â hwy yng Nghymru. Gobeithio bod hynny'n rhan o strategaeth Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

**Nerys Evans:** I welcome this debate, and the opportunity to contribute. As the Minister said, tourism is a very competitive industry. One crucial element in terms of selling Wales on the international market is the importance of using our unique assets and culture. We must sell and promote Wales as a location for cultural events. We have a strong record in this respect, in terms of events such as eisteddfodau, the Urdd, the Llangollen International Musical Eisteddfod and the Brecon jazz festival. We must promote Wales's unique elements to those who choose to spend their holidays here. Once people choose to visit Wales, it is important that they have experiences that are different and that they are aware that they have visited a different and viable country, and not just another region of the United Kingdom.

Good work is being done in this field in some areas, such as the Gallu scheme in west Wales, which enables people to develop skills that are required by the tourism industry, by working with small local businesses to provide training. However, there is always room to expand this work to

hyd i ymestyn y gwaith hwn i sicrhau y caiff ymwelwyr â Chymru y profiadau gorau.

ensure that our visitors have the best experiences.

Hoffwn ganolbwyntio ar welliant y Ceidwadwyr—ni wn lle i ddechrau. Mae'r pwynt cyntaf, sy'n cyfeirio at gyllid annigonol, yn hollol anghredadwy. Bu ichi roi croeso gwan iawn i ddatganiad y Gweinidog cyn y Nadolig i roi arian ychwanegol i Ganolfan Mileniwm Cymru, ond ym mhob dadl ers hynny sy'n cyfeirio at ariannu, yr ydych wedi cwyno am yr arian a roddwyd i'r ganolfan. Mae'n rhaid ichi gofio bod yr arian hwnnw yn arian ychwanegol sydd wedi dod yn sgîl tanwariant. Mae eich pwynt cyntaf yn wan iawn.

I will now turn to the Conservative amendment—where do I start? The first point, on inadequate funding, is quite incredible. You gave a very weak welcome to the Minister's statement before Christmas that he would provide additional funding for the Wales Millennium Centre, but in every debate since then that has referred to funding, you have complained about the funding given to the centre. You must bear in mind that that is additional funding that has come about as a result of underspend. Your first point is very weak.

Mae'r ail bwynt yn cyfeirio at gryfhau'r gefnogaeth i'r iaith. Hoffwn ddyfynnu Paul Davies, a ddywedodd:

The second point refers to strengthening support for the language. I will quote Paul Davies, who said:

'Businesses should be encouraged, though not compelled, to make maximum use of the Welsh language, not erect barriers to it',

Dylid annog busnesau, heb eu gorfodi, i wneud defnydd llawn o'r iaith Gymraeg, yn hytrach na chodi rhwystrau iddi,

wrth ymateb i'r ffiasgo ynghylch Thomas Cook.

in response to the Thomas Cook fiasco.

Mae 'Cymru'n Un' yn glir o blaid ymestyn deddfwriaeth ieithyddol ar sail gwasanaethau. Beth yw eich safbwynt ar hyn? Yr ydym yn gwybod bod y Ceidwadwyr yn Ewrop yn gwrthod symudiadau i alluogi pobl i siarad ieithoedd lleiafrifol yn Senedd Ewrop. Yn ystod taith Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006 drwy San Steffan, gwrthododd y Ceidwadwyr welliannau Plaid Cymru i gryfhau rhannau'r Ddeddf sy'n cyfeirio at yr iaith—fel galluogi'r Cynulliad i gael pŵer Rhan 4 ym maes yr iaith Gymraeg pan ddaw pŵer Rhan 3 i rym.

'One Wales' is clearly in favour of extending language legislation to cover services. Where do you stand on that? We know that the Conservatives in Europe are rejecting moves to allow the use of minority languages in the European Parliament. During the passage of the Government of Wales Act 2006 through Westminster, the Conservatives rejected all Plaid Cymru amendments to strengthen the parts of the Act that referred to the language—such as giving Wales Part 4 powers on the Welsh language when Part 3 comes into force.

Mae'r Gweinidog wedi crybwyll trydydd pwynt gwelliant y Ceidwadwyr, felly cyfeiriau yn olaf at Ddydd Gŵyl Dewi. Hoffwn gymryd y cyfle i ganmol gwaith trefnwyr gorymdaith Dydd Gŵyl Dewi, sy'n ddigwyddiad ffantastig. Anogaf bob Aelod i gymryd rhan yn yr orymdaith gan ei fod yn rhywbeth y dylem oll ei gefnogi.

The Minister has already mentioned the third point of the Conservative amendment, so I will finish by referring to St David's Day. I take this opportunity to applaud the work done by the organisers of the St David's Day march, which is an excellent event. I encourage all Members to attend, as it is something that we should all support.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Cultural tourism can be defined as tourism that is based on local and regional cultural resources and traditions. If that is the case, Wales should be one of the

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Gellir diffinio twristiaeth ddiwylliannol fel twristiaeth sy'n seiliedig ar draddodiadau ac adnoddau diwylliannol lleol a rhanbarthol. Os yw hynny'n wir, dylai

richest destinations for cultural tourism. You would be hard-pushed to find someone from the rugby world who did not know about the Millennium Stadium, or a historian who did not know about our abundance of castles. If you scratch a little deeper, you will find a wealth of cultural sights, activities and traditions in Wales that the average traveller may not know about. We have not always been very good in Wales at promoting ourselves and opening ourselves up to the outside world. Some might say that we are a little insular, but I am pleased to see that this is changing. Wales is now one of a select few regions in Europe to have a cultural tourism strategy, and it is through this that we can truly start to sell ourselves.

I am very privileged to have a wealth of cultural tourism attractions in my constituency. I was privileged to attend the unveiling of the Tommy Cooper statue in Caerphilly—

**David Melding:** Just like that. [*Laughter.*]

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Or was it ‘Just like this’? It was unveiled by Sir Anthony Hopkins at the weekend. As you may be aware, Caerphilly is the birthplace of the comic genius that was Tommy Cooper, and the statue, which is an addition to the Tommy Cooper walk that runs through the centre of Caerphilly, is a welcome reminder of that. I congratulate the Tommy Cooper Society in Caerphilly on its hard work in securing the £45,000 to build such a fitting memorial to the man. I should have worn my fez. [*Laughter.*]

5.30 p.m.

Opposite the statue is Caerphilly castle, which is one of the finest medieval castles in Europe, and indeed the second largest castle in Europe. It now boasts a tower that leans more than the tower of Pisa, thanks largely to Oliver Cromwell, and to the residents of Caerphilly just over 100 years ago, who pinched a lot of the stone to build their own cottages.

In the north of my constituency lies the fine

Cymru fod yn un o'r cyrchfannau cyfoethocaf ar gyfer twristiaeth ddiwylliannol. Byddai'n anodd ichi ganfod rhywun o'r byd rygbi na wyddai am Stadiwm y Mileniwm, neu hanesydd na wyddai am ein cestyll niferus. Os crafwch ychydig dyfnach, gwelwch gyfoeth o olygfeydd, gweithgareddau a thraddodiadau diwylliannol yng Nghymru nad yw'r teithiwr cyffredin efallai'n gwybod amdanynt. Nid ydym bob amser wedi bod yn dda iawn yng Nghymru am hyrwyddo'n hunain ac ymagor i'r byd y tu allan. Gallai rhai ddweud ein bod ychydig yn ynysol, ond yr wyf yn falch o weld bod hyn yn newid. Erbyn hyn mae Cymru'n un o ychydig o ranbarthau dethol yn Ewrop sydd â strategaeth ar gyfer twristiaeth ddiwylliannol, a thrwy hyn y gallwn ni ddechrau gwerthu'n hunain o ddifrif.

Yr wyf yn freintiedig iawn o gael cyfoeth o atyniadau twristiaeth ddiwylliannol yn fy etholaeth. Cefais y ffrainc o fynychu dadorchuddiad cerflun Tommy Cooper yng Nghaerffili—

**David Melding:** ‘Just like that’. [*Chwerthin.*]

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Ynteu ai ‘Just like this’ oedd hi? Fe'i dadorchuddiwyd gan Syr Anthony Hopkins dros y Sul. Fel y gwyddoch, efallai, Caerffili yw tref enedigol y diweddar athrylith comig Tommy Cooper, ac mae'n dda cael y cerflun, sy'n ychwanegiad i'r llwybr Tommy Cooper sy'n mynd drwy ganol Caerffili, i'n hatgoffa o hynny. Yr wyf yn llongyfarch Cymdeithas Tommy Cooper yng Nghaerffili am ei gwaith caled yn sicrhau'r £45,000 i adeiladu cofeb mor deilwng o'r dyn. Dylaswn fod wedi gwisgo fy fez. [*Chwerthin.*]

Gyferbyn â'r cerflun mae castell Caerffili, sy'n un o'r cestyll canoloesol gwychaf yn Ewrop, ac yn wir y castell mwyaf ond un yn Ewrop. Bellach gall ymfalchïo mewn tŵr sy'n gwyro fwy na thŵr Pisa diolch yn bennaf i Oliver Cromwell, a phreswylwyr Caerffili ychydig dros 100 mlynedd yn ôl, a ddygodd lawer o'r cerrig er mwyn adeiladu eu bythynnod eu hunain.

Yng ngogledd fy etholaeth ceir tŷ Tuduraidd

Tudor house of Llancaiach Fawr, one of the most popular tourist attractions in Wales, which provides an excellent example of living history—or of a haunted house, for those who are more adventurous. To the south of the constituency lies the stunning relic of Ruperra castle, to which we have referred previously in the Chamber. The castle was burned out during the second world war on the same day as the attack on Pearl Harbor—although not, I trust, by a stray bomb. It is an echo of a very different time.

My fellow Labour Party members will know that the south Wales Valleys were the cradle of the industrial revolution and the driving force of empire. The south Wales Valleys in particular are teeming with places of huge social significance that are, on the whole, an untapped commodity. The introduction of regional tourism partnerships will, I hope, address this issue. The greater involvement of local authorities and local businesses, and the development of localised tourism plans, should enable them to target specific sites within their region that may appeal to the market. This should, in theory, see many places capitalise on their industrial past, which was once a scar on the community. The regional tourism partnership for south-east Wales—Capital Region Tourism—will continue to develop tourism at a regional level, developing initiatives such as the Wisdom and Walks project, which allows you to discover the truth about the heroes of the industrial revolution, hear stories of haunted houses, or find out if you have Welsh roots, like Caerphilly's own Tommy Cooper. I hope that this new regional approach to tourism in Wales will help to remind the world just how important the Welsh Valleys and their people were to the entire industrial revolution and, indeed, the wider world. The sacrifices of the Valleys people must not be forgotten and, with the help of a people's museum, can be properly remembered.

It is also important not to look only at the past. There are long-standing traditions in Wales that are ongoing and things yet to come that will only deepen our cultural richness. My constituency hosts the annual Big Cheese festival, which attracts numerous

gwyh Llancaiach Fawr, un o'r atyniadau ymwelwyr mwyaf poblogaidd yng Nghymru, sy'n enghraifft wych o hanes byw—neu o dŷ â bwganod, i'r rhai sy'n fwy anturus. Yn ne'r etholaeth mae murddun hardd castell Ruperra, yr ydym eisoes wedi cyfeirio ato yn y Siambr. Cafodd y castell ei losgi yn ystod yr ail ryfel byd ar yr un diwrnod â'r ymosodiad ar Pearl Harbour—ond nid gan fom a fethodd ei tharged, hyderaf. Mae'n adlais o gyfnod gwahanol iawn.

Gŵyr fy nghyd-aelodau yn y Blaid Lafur mai cymoedd y de oedd tarddle'r chwyldro diwydiannol a grym yr ymerodraeth. Yng nghymoedd y de yn arbennig ceir llu o leoedd o arwyddocâd cymdeithasol enfawr sydd, ar y cyfan, yn nwyddau na fanteisir arnynt. Gobeithiaf y bydd cyflwyno partneriaethau twristiaeth rhanbarthol yn mynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn. Dylai cynnwys awdurdodau lleol a busnesau lleol yn ehangach, a datblygiad cynlluniau twristiaeth lleol, eu galluogi i dargedu safleoedd penodol o fewn eu rhanbarth a allai apelio at y farchnad. Dylai hyn, yn ddamcaniaethol, arwain at sicrhau bod sawl lle yn elwa o'u gorffennol diwydiannol, a oedd ar un adeg yn graith ar y gymuned. Bydd y bartneriaeth twristiaeth ranbarthol ar gyfer y de-ddwyrain—Uwch Ranbarth Twristiaeth—yn parhau i ddatblygu twristiaeth ar lefel ranbarthol, gan ddatblygu mentrau fel y prosiect Wisdom and Walks, sy'n eich galluogi i ddarganfod y gwir am arwyr y chwyldro diwydiannol, clywed hanesion tai bwganod, neu ddarganfod a oes gennych wreiddiau Cymreig, fel Tommy Cooper o Gaerffili. Gobeithiaf y bydd yr ymagwedd ranbarthol newydd hon at dwristiaeth yng Nghymru yn helpu i atgoffa'r byd pa mor bwysig oedd Cymoedd Cymru a'u pobl i'r chwyldro diwydiannol cyfan ac, yn wir, i'r byd ehangach. Ni ddylid anghofio aberth pobl y cymoedd a, chyda help amgueddfa'r bobl, gellir cofio am hynny'n briodol.

Mae hefyd yn bwysig edrych ar bethau eraill yn ogystal â'r gorffennol. Ceir traddodiadau maith yng Nghymru sy'n parhau, a phethau sydd eto i ddod a fydd yn dyfnhau ein cyfoeth diwylliannol. Mae fy etholaeth i yn cynnal gŵyl y Caws Mawr, sy'n denu llu o

visitors from around the world to celebrate the people and the place, not to mention the cheese of Caerphilly. However, it seems that there is still some distance to go. For example, later this year, Wales will host the very first under-20 rugby world cup, which will be hosted across Wales. This has the potential to bring a vast number of visitors and considerable revenue to Wales. As this is a youth event, there is a strong chance that the visitors may return in the future if we host the competition properly. However, I am not yet impressed with the level of awareness among the Welsh public. I hope that this can be rectified over the coming weeks.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Gan ein bod ar drothwy Dydd Gŵyl Dewi, hoffwn nodi y dylai'r Gweinidog sicrhau ein bod yn cael diwrnod o wyliau i ddathlu Dewi Sant. Tybed a fydd yn medru ymateb i'r pwynt pigog hwnnw.

Credaf fod yr eisteddfod genedlaethol yn allweddol i Gymru. Gobeithiaf y gwnaiff y Gweinidog ei orau i sicrhau bod ganddi ddyfodol cadarn o safbwynt cyllido a marchnata.

It is interesting to look at the Visit Wales site, which my former colleague, Lisa Francis, referred to continually. In memory of Lisa Francis, I have been looking at the Visit Wales website, but I question whether it has improved since she raised the issue last year. For example, we are discussing cultural tourism, but I do not see an icon for cultural tourism on the Visit Wales site, which I have open on the screen in front of me. I believe that there is much to be done. Will you put your mind to it, so that I can tell Lisa Francis that you have made these improvements?

There is much to discuss in relation to tourism. I do not think that we are the best at promoting ourselves, as others have mentioned. I agree with many of those who raised the European Capital of Culture 2008 competition. We could have made much more of what is going on in Liverpool, because, after all, whether we like it or not, Liverpool has been referred to as the alternative cultural capital of north Wales.

ymwelwyr o bob cwr o'r byd i ddathlu'r bobl a'r lle, heb sôn am gaws Caerffili. Fodd bynnag, ymddengys bod ffordd bell i fynd o hyd. Er enghraifft, yn ddiweddarach eleni, bydd Cymru'n cynnal cystadleuaeth gyntaf erioed cwpan rygbi'r byd i dimau dan 20 oed, a gaiff ei chynnal ledled Cymru. Mae yma botensial i ddenu nifer fawr o ymwelwyr a refeniw sylweddol i Gymru. Gan mai digwyddiad i ieuenctid yw hwn, mae posibilrwydd cryf y gall yr ymwelwyr ddychwelyd yn y dyfodol os cynhaliwn y gystadleuaeth yn gywir. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r ymwybyddiaeth ymysg y cyhoedd yng Nghymru wedi creu fawr o argraff arnaf hyd yma. Gobeithiaf y gellir unioni hyn dros yr wythnosau nesaf.

**Eleanor Burnham:** As we approach St David's Day, I would like to suggest that the Minister should ensure that we have a day's holiday to celebrate St David. I wonder whether he can respond to that contentious issue.

I believe that the national eisteddfod is crucial to Wales. I hope that the Minister will do his best to ensure that the institution has a firm future in financial and marketing terms.

Mae'n ddiddorol edrych ar wefan Croeso Cymru, y cyfeiriodd fy nghyn gyd-Aelod, Lisa Francis, ati'n barhaus. Er cof am Lisa Francis, yr wyf wedi bod yn edrych ar wefan Croeso Cymru, ond a yw wedi gwella ers iddi drafod y mater y llynedd? Er enghraifft, yr ydym yn trafod twristiaeth ddiwylliannol, ond ni welaf eicon ar gyfer twristiaeth ddiwylliannol ar wefan Croeso Cymru, sydd ar y sgrîn o'm blaen. Credaf fod llawer i'w wneud. A roddwch eich meddwl ar waith, er mwyn imi allu dweud wrth Lisa Francis eich bod wedi gwneud y gwelliannau hyn?

Mae llawer i'w drafod yng nghyd-destun thwristiaeth. Ni chredaf ein bod gyda'r gorau am hyrwyddo ein hunain, fel y soniodd eraill. Cytunaf â llawer o'r rhai a soniodd am gystadleuaeth Prifddinas Diwylliant Ewrop 2008. Byddem wedi gallu manteisio llawer mwy ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn Lerpwl, oherwydd, wedi'r cyfan, p'un a ydym yn hoffi hynny ai peidio, cyfeiriwyd at Lerpwl fel prifddinas diwylliant amgen y gogledd.

What are you doing to encourage local authorities to work together? Marketing and promotion has not been as effective as it should have been. How are you helping local authorities in terms of finance and encouragement? Activity tourism is also a part of the cultural dimension of Wales, as well as our linguistic and festival activities. What are you doing to promote all that? Many people believe that many holidays are weather dependent, and even the Minister cannot do anything about that—only God can. However, I am sure that you are doing your best, and I am sure that you will tell us how you are ensuring that there is a lengthening of the traditional tourism season.

I am sure that there are all kinds of possibilities, such as developing breweries, restaurants and markets, many of which have already been referred to; I do not believe that we do enough to market those. That is the crunch of my request to the Minister—to do his best. We know that it must be difficult to be the Minister for Heritage at present. I feel sorry for you, Minister; you have lost so much money, and the UK Government has put you at a huge disadvantage. The Olympic Games have sucked and vacuumed a great deal of community lottery funding that was used to fund many small festivals, and so on, and, in that regard, I commiserate with you. Therefore, how will you deal with some of the issues that I have asked you about—to improve marketing, and so on, and to make the most of what we have to offer in Wales?

**David Lloyd:** Mae'r diffiniad o dwristiaeth ddiwylliannol yn eang, fel y dywedwyd eisoes, gan ei bod yn cwmpasu ystod eang o weithgareddau a diddordebau. Mae gennym strategaeth yn y maes hwn yn deillio o 2003, ond mae angen adeiladu ar hyn.

Fel y clywsom eisoes, mae byd twristiaeth yn fyd cystadleuol. O safbwynt marchnata, os oes gennych bwynt gwerthu unigryw, mae gennych elfen gref o'ch plaid—yr ydych ar flaen y gad. Ein pwynt gwerthu unigryw ni yng Nghymru yw'r iaith Gymraeg a'n diwylliant. Mae'n rhaid i ni ymfalchïo yn ein heniath, bod yn hyderus yn ei defnyddio, ac adeiladu busnesau sy'n denu ymwelwyr ar

Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i annog awdurdodau lleol i gydweithio? Nid yw marchnata a hyrwyddo wedi bod mor effeithiol ag y dylai. Sut yr ydych yn helpu awdurdodau lleol o ran cyllid ac anogaeth? Mae twristiaeth gweithgareddau hefyd yn rhan o ddimensiwn diwylliannol Cymru, yn ogystal â'n gweithgareddau ieithyddol a'n gwyliau. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i hyrwyddo hynny? Cred llawer o bobl fod llawer o wyliau'n dibynnu ar y tywydd, ac ni all y Gweinidog hyd yn oed wneud dim am hynny—mae hynny yn nwylo Duw. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siŵr y dywedwch wrthym sut yr ydych yn sicrhau bod y tymor twristiaeth traddodiadol yn cael ei ymestyn.

Yr wyf yn siŵr bod pob math o bosibiliadau, fel datblygu bragdai, bwytai a marchnadoedd, y cyfeiriwyd at lawer ohonynt eisoes; ni chredaf ein bod yn gwneud digon i farchnata'r rheini. Dyna graidd fy nghais i'r Gweinidog—iddo wneud ei orau. Gwyddom ei bod siŵr o fod yn anodd bod yn Weinidog dros Dreftadaeth ar hyn o bryd. Teimlaf drueni drosoch, Weinidog; yr ydych wedi colli cymaint o arian, ac mae Llywodraeth y DU wedi eich rhoi o dan anfantais enfawr. Mae'r Gemau Olympaidd wedi sugno cymaint o arian cymunedol o loteri a ddefnyddiwyd i ariannu llawer o wyliau bach, ac yn y blaen, ac, yn hynny o beth, cydymdeimlaf â chi. Felly, sut y byddwch yn ymdrin â rhai o'r materion yr wyf wedi eich holi amdanynt—i wella marchnata, ac ati, ac i fanteisio i'r eithaf ar yr hyn sydd gennym i'w gynnig yng Nghymru?

**David Lloyd:** The definition of cultural tourism is broad, as we have heard, as it encompasses a wide range of activities and interests. We have a tourism strategy from 2003, but we need to build on that.

As we have heard, the tourism world is very competitive. In terms of marketing, if you have a unique selling point, you have a strong element in your favour—you will be ahead of the game. Our unique selling point in Wales is the Welsh language and culture. We should take pride in our language, be confident in its use, and build businesses that attract visitors as a result of that confidence.

gefn yr hyder hwnnw.

Fel y dywedais eisoes, mae hwn yn faes eang, ac mae nifer o weithgareddau yn cyfrif fel twristiaeth ddiwylliannol. Mae gennym bwynt gwerthu unigryw, ond mae angen ffocws penodol i'r holl weithgareddau gwahanol sy'n adeiladu ar y pwynt gwerthu hwnnw. Y ffocws, neu'r llwyfan, i hyn ddylai fod cyhoeddi Dydd Gŵyl Dewi Sant yn ddydd gŵyl banc. Buasai hynny'n rhoi'r brand ymarferol i'n gwahanol fudiadau ymfalchïo ynddo ac yn hybu'n hiaith a'n diwylliant yn rheolaidd ac yn flynyddol.

Mae cael gŵyl swyddogol ar ddiwrnod eich nawddsant wedi bod yn llwyddiannus ar draws y byd; mae'n hybu twristiaeth, yr economi a hyder pobl yn gyson. Ystyriwch esiampl Iwerddon a'r dathliadau swmpus yno am ddyddiau lawer ganol fis Mawrth bob blwyddyn. Mae Padrig ei hun yn dod o'r Banwen yn fy rhanbarth i. Mynnwn Ddydd Gŵyl Dewi Sant yn ŵyl banc. Mae'r Cynulliad wedi cytuno ar hyn ers 2000; ceisiwn y pwerau i wireddu'r dyhead hwnnw, yn yr un modd â'r Alban o safbwynt Dydd Gŵyl Andreas.

O gael ffocws penodol fel Dydd Gŵyl Dewi Sant yn ŵyl banc, ac o gael pwynt gwerthu unigryw, rhaid i ni wneud y mwyaf posibl o'n hiaith, ein diwylliant a'n hanes. Mae angen i ni godi mwy o ymwybyddiaeth, er enghraifft, o'n heisteddfodau. Eisteddfod Genedlaethol Cymru yw gŵyl symudol fwyaf Ewrop, ac Eisteddfod Genedlaethol yr Urdd yw gŵyl ieuenctid fwyaf Ewrop. Mae'r ddwy eisteddfod hon cynnig gwasanaeth cyfieithu llawn fel y gall pawb eu mwynhau.

Mae angen codi ymwybyddiaeth hefyd o'n treftadaeth Gristnogol, sy'n denu Cristnogion o bob rhan o'r byd. Y tu allan i Gapel Moriah, Casllwchwr, mae cofeb i Evan Roberts, arweinydd diwygiad 1904-05; chwilia pobl o bedwar ban byd am ei gapel, ond a ydyw'n hawdd dod o hyd iddo? Dechreuodd Griffith Jones Llanddowror yr ysgolion Sul, dros ddau can mlynedd yn ôl—yr ysgolion Sul a ddaeth yn gysail i'n hysgolion dyddiol ledled Prydain. Bydd y Gweinidog yn gwybod lle mae Llanddowror, ond sawl un arall ohonom sy'n gwybod?

As I have already mentioned, this is a broad area and a number of activities come into the realm of cultural tourism. We have a unique selling point, but we need a specific focus to all of those activities which tries to build on that selling point. The focus, or platform, for this should be the announcement of St David's Day as a bank holiday. That would give us a brand that various organisations could take pride in, and it would promote our language and culture on a regular, annual basis.

Having an official holiday on the day of your patron saint has proven successful across the world; it promotes tourism and the economy, and it enhances people's confidence. Think of Ireland and the elaborate celebrations held over several days in mid March each year. Patrick himself came from Banwen in my region. We must insist on St David's Day being made a bank holiday. The Assembly has been in agreement on this issue since 2000; we must seek the powers to realise this aspiration, just as Scotland has done in the case of St Andrew's Day.

Having a focus such as a St David's Day bank holiday, and having a unique selling point, means that we must make the most of our language, culture and history. We need to raise awareness, for example, of our eisteddfodau. The National Eisteddfod of Wales is the largest mobile festival in Europe, and the Urdd National Eisteddfod is Europe's largest youth festival. Both of these events offer a comprehensive translation service that allows everyone to participate.

We also need to raise awareness of our Christian heritage, which attracts Christians from all parts of the world. A monument commemorating Evan Roberts, the leader of the 1904-05 revival, stands outside Moriah chapel in Loughor; people from all over the world come to look for his chapel, but is it easy to find? Griffith Jones from Llanddowror started the Sunday school movement over 200 years ago, and these schools became the foundation on which schools throughout Britain were built. The Minister will know where Llanddowror is, but do the rest of us know?



5.40 p.m.

Beth am bererindod Mari Jones dros y mynydd i'r Bala am Feibl, a ysgogodd Gymdeithas y Beibl, sy'n gymdeithas fyd-eang? Cofiw'n hefyd am yr emynydd godidog, Ann Griffiths, a'i chartref yn Nolwar Fach—ble mae'r ymwybyddiaeth ohoni hi? Mae nifer o esiamplau tebyg. O fyd y celfyddydau, mae Dylan Thomas, fel y dywedodd Peter Black, yn teilyngu llawer mwy o sylw swyddogol a gwybodaeth safonol am ei fywyd. Dylai'r wybodaeth fod yn hawdd i'w chael yn Abertawe ac yn sir Gâr, er mwyn ei gwneud yn hawdd i'r holl ymwelwyr Americanaidd ddarganfod y bardd.

I gloi, wrth nodi'r gwaith sydd wedi'i wneud eisoes, mae gwaith eto i'w wneud i adeiladu ar ein hiaith a'n hetifeddiaeth unigryw.

**Huw Lewis:** I am pleased that the position paper for this debate kicks off by stating that there is so much more that we can do in Wales to boost our cultural tourism offer. Never were truer words spoken, because I would contend that there are great yawning gaps in marketing, in terms of quality and in terms of the variety of visitor experience that we currently offer in Wales.

As I frequently find myself saying in this Chamber, we should not be afraid to pinch ideas from the best on this issue. One example I can point to in terms of how we could better exploit our medieval history—and a lot this afternoon's debate has concentrated on that, and rightly so—is the case of Carcassonne in the south of France, a town whose economic lifeblood has been driven by the restoration of its medieval castle and its fortifications. The town holds seven festivals every year, and its international airport, which has connections with countries across Europe, feeds a constant stream of tourists into the town. This town has a population of just 44,000 people, and a large chunk of the population is employed through the tourism offer of the castle. Which one of our medieval castled

What about the pilgrimage of Mari Jones over the mountain to Bala to get a Bible, which encouraged the establishment of the global Bible Society? We also remember Ann Griffiths, a hymn writer of note, and her home in Dolwar Fach—how aware are people of her story? There are several such examples. In the arts world, Dylan Thomas, as Peter Black mentioned, deserves far more official attention, and far more reliable information about his life should be made available. This information should be readily available in Swansea and Carmarthenshire, so that the numerous American tourists who visit the area can learn about the poet without much effort.

In conclusion, while noting the work that has already been done, further work needs to be done to build on our language and unique heritage.

**Huw Lewis:** Yr wyf yn falch bod y papur sefyllfa ar gyfer y ddadl hon yn dechrau drwy ddatgan bod cymaint mwy y gallwn ei wneud yng Nghymru i hybu'r dwristiaeth ddiwylliannol a gynigiwn. Gwir fo'r gair, oherwydd byddwn yn dadlau bod bylchau mawr mewn marchnata, o ran ansawdd ac o ran amrywiaeth o brofiadau yr ydym yn eu cynnig i ymwelwyr yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd.

Fel y dywedaf yn gyson yn y Siambr hon, ni ddylem ofni dwyn syniadau gan y gorau yn hyn o beth. Un enghraifft y gallaf ei nodi o ran sut y gallwn fanteisio'n well ar ein hanes canoloesol—ac mae llawer o'r drafodaeth y prynhawn yma wedi canolbwyntio ar hynny, a hynny'n briodol—yw achos Carcassonne yn ne Ffrainc, tref y mae ei heconomi wedi cael ei llywio gan y gwaith o adfer ei chestyll canoloesol a'i chaerau. Cynhelir saith gwyl yn y dref bob blwyddyn, ac mae gan y dref faes awyr rhyngwladol a chanddo gysylltiadau â gwledydd ledled Ewrop, yn bwydo llif cyson o dwristiaid i'r dref. Dim ond poblogaeth o 44,000 sydd gan y dref hon, a chyflogir cyfran fawr o'r boblogaeth drwy'r atyniad i dwristiaid, sef y castell. Pa dref yng Nghymru a chanddi gastell canoloesol a chaerau all ddweud bod ei chastell canoloesol

and fortified towns in Wales can say that its medieval castle is a major employer in the community? We should be able to say that, but we cannot.

In thinking about the situation of Carcassonne, I recall the beautiful spring morning that I spent last year at Caernarfon castle, entirely alone, without one tourist, save myself, to be seen, and with the nearby shops and cafes in a state of disrepair. There is also the castle that I once visited in west Wales—I will not name it for fear of upsetting the National Trust too much—gaining entry to which means having to knock on someone's door in the village and asking for a key. I do not say this as a criticism of Caernarfon or elsewhere—

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I will not disagree with the tenor of your remarks, except to say that stating that all of the cafes and shops in the vicinity of Caernarfon castle are in a state of disrepair is overstating the case slightly, if I can put it like that. There have been improvements in the square, and hopefully there will be more improvements soon.

**Huw Lewis:** I hope that my brief six weeks as Deputy Minister for social justice, when I made a strong case for Caernarfon's Castle Square, will have had some ripple effect in terms of the regeneration that the area needs.

However, there is no comparison. If you compare the energy, the offer and the sheer delight of towns like Carcassonne or an Italian hill town with the state of decay that we have allowed so many proud towns like Caernarfon to fall into, it is evident that we have done something wrong over many years, and I realise that work is being done now to put that right. This is not a criticism of Caernarfon or elsewhere, or of the local authorities, but it is an example of the untapped potential that we have in Wales. We have to think more imaginatively.

Jeff mentioned the Big Cheese festival in Caerphilly, and, in some ways, he was too modest. Do you know that it is one of

yn un o brif gyflogwyr y gymuned? Dylem allu dweud hynny, ond ni allwn.

Wrth ystyried sefyllfa Carcassonne, cofiaf y bore braf o wanwyn a dreuliais y llynedd yng nghastell Caernarfon, ar fy mhen fy hun, heb yr un ymwelydd, ar wahân i mi, i'w weld yn unman, gyda'r siopau a'r caffis cyfagos mewn cyflwr gwael. Cofiaf hefyd y castell yr ymwelais ag ef unwaith yn y gorllewin—ac nid enwaf ef rhag imi bechu gormod ar yr Ymddiriedolaeth Genedlaethol—lle yr oedd yn rhaid ichi guro ar ddrws rhywun yn y pentref a gofyn am yr allwedd os oeddech am gael mynediad i'r castell. Ni ddywedaf hynny fel beirniadaeth ar Gaernarfon nag unrhyw le arall—

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Nid anghytunaf â'ch sylwadau, ac eithrio i ddweud bod disgrifio'r holl gaffis a'r siopau ger castell Caernarfon fel rhai mewn cyflwr gwael yn or-ddweud braidd, os gallaf ei ddweud felly? Mae gwelliannau wedi cael eu gwneud i'r sgwâr, a gobeithio y bydd rhagor o welliannau cyn bo hir.

**Huw Lewis:** Gobeithiaf fod fy chwe wythnos fer fel Dirprwy Weinidog dros gyfiawnder cymdeithasol, pan gyflwynais achos cryf dros y Maes yng Nghaernarfon, wedi cael rhyw sgîl-effaith o ran yr adfywio y mae ei angen ar yr ardal honno.

Fodd bynnag, nid oes cymhariaeth. Os cymharwch yr egni, yr hyn sydd ar gael ac atyniad pur trefi fel Carcassonne neu dref ar fryn yn yr Eidal gyda'r cyflwr gwael yr ydym wedi caniatáu i gymaint o drefi balch fel Caernarfon ddirywio iddo, mae'n amlwg ein bod wedi gwneud rhywbeth o'i le dros flynyddoedd lawer, a sylweddolaf fod gwaith yn cael ei wneud yn awr i unioni hynny. Nid beirniadaeth ar Gaernarfon nag unman arall, nac ar yr awdurdodau lleol, yw hyn. Mae'n enghraifft o'r potensial sydd gennym yng Nghymru nad ydym wedi manteisio arno eto. Rhaid inni ddefnyddio mwy ar ein dychymyg.

Soniodd Jeff am ŵyl Caws Mawr Caerffili, ac mewn rhai ffyrdd yr oedd yn rhy wylaidd. A wyddech fod yr atyniad hwnnw'n un o'r

Wales's biggest visitor attractions by a factor of three or four? It is one of the largest tourist draws in our country, and it is because there is an interpretation of a marvellous visual offer, in terms of Caerphilly castle. Why cannot we do a bit more of that?

If you Google Carcassonne, be prepared for a fantastic website that engages you immediately and draws your imagination with some fantastic visual depictions of the town. However, if you Google Caernarfon castle, Caerphilly castle or that castle in west Wales, which was not a million miles away from Cilgerran, you will find something quite different that could only conceivably appeal to the most committed of medieval architecture anoraks. There are not too many of those around, you know, and we will not make a living from tourism if we appeal only to those people.

The position paper is useful, but it focuses on big events like the Ryder Cup, the Ashes test match, and the Wales Rally GB. It is all fantastic stuff, but we will not maximise those opportunities unless the brown road signs are in the right place, unless we provide grants for improving the look of places like Caernarfon square, and unless we produce exciting websites that engage children as well as adults. As a parent, I increasingly find that holiday destinations are as much driven by children as by the parents. If children are engaged and want to visit, that is a major plus for a family.

Finally, I make a renewed pitch for a museum of people's history, which has been mentioned already. It is an idea that had the backing of the former Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport, Alun Pugh, and that of the present Minister for Heritage, as well as cross-party support, and yet it remains an unfulfilled pledge. It would be a unique selling point for Wales, and it must have a home—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Can you please wind up?

**Huw Lewis:** I will wind up. It must have a

atyniadau ymwelwyr mwyaf o ffactor o dri neu bedwar? Mae'n un o atyniadau ymwelwyr mwyaf ein gwlad, ac mae hynny oherwydd bod dehongliad o rywbeth gweledol gwych ar gael, sef castell Caerffili. Pam na allwn wneud ychydig mwy o hynny?

Os teipiwch Carcassonne i mewn i Google, byddwch yn barod am wefan wych sy'n denu eich sylw ar unwaith, a chaiff eich dychymyg ei gipio ar unwaith i ddarluniau gweledol gwych o'r dref. Fodd bynnag, os teipiwch gastell Caernarfon, castell Caerffili neu'r castell hwnnw yn y gorllewin nepell o Gilgerran i mewn i Google, cewch rywbeth tra gwahanol, a allai ond apelio at yr anorac pensaernïaeth ganoloesol mwyaf selog. Nid oes gormod o'r rheini i'w cael, wyddoch chi, ac ni wnawn fywoliaeth o dwristiaeth os byddwn yn apelio at y bobl hynny yn unig.

Mae'r papur sefyllfa'n ddefnyddiol, ond mae'n canolbwyntio ar ddigwyddiadau mawr fel Cwpan Ryder, gêm brawf y Llundw, a Rali Cymru Prydain Fawr. Mae'r rhain i gyd yn ddigwyddiadau bendigedig, ond ni fanteisiwn i'r eithaf ar y cyfleoedd hynny oni fydd yr arwyddion ffordd brown yn y lle cywir, oni ddarparwn grantiau i wella golwg lleoedd fel maes Caernarfon, ac oni chynhyrchwn wefannau cyffrous sy'n ennyn diddordeb plant yn ogystal ag oedolion. Fel rhiant, yr wyf yn canfod mwyfwy bod cyrchfannau gwyliau'n cael eu hysgogi cymaint gan blant ag y maent gan rieni. Os yw plant yn dangos diddordeb ac eisiau ymweld, mae hynny'n fantais fawr i deulu.

Yn olaf, yr wyf yn gwneud cais o'r newydd am amgueddfa hanes pobl, y soniwyd amdani eisoes. Mae'n syniad a gafodd gefnogaeth y cyn-Weinidog dros Ddiwylliant, yr Iaith Gymraeg a Chwaraeon, Alun Pugh, a chefnogaeth y Gweinidog presennol dros Dreftadaeth, yn ogystal â chefnogaeth drawsbleidiol, ac eto mae'n parhau'n addewid heb ei wireddu. Byddai'n bwynt gwerthu unigryw i Gymru, ac mae'n rhaid iddi gael cartref—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. A allwch ddirwyn i ben os gwelwch yn dda?

**Huw Lewis:** Byddaf yn dirwyn i ben. Mae'n

home made of bricks and mortar; a virtual home is not good enough.

**Val Lloyd:** I will add to the already rich tapestry of tourism attractions outlined by previous speakers by focusing on the contribution to cultural tourism made by the waterways and canals of Wales, which have not been mentioned so far. Wales's waterways have been closely linked to the country's economic development. In the late nineteenth century, for example, Swansea port, supported by a network of local canals, was the biggest exporter of copper in the world. Today, these industries are a thing of the past, but the network of canals in Wales is a powerful reminder of our industrial heritage. Importantly, waterways and canals have adapted to a changing market, and today form part of the rich and diverse cultural tourism offer.

The opening of the Llangollen mooring basin has had a positive impact on the local economy. Many businesses have reported a build-up in trade due to the higher number of visitors in the town, and the basin is now seen as a key part of the tourism offer in the area. Most importantly, it has extended the tourism season, as it has attracted visitors outside the peak period. That is a huge benefit, given that, traditionally, Wales has a short tourist season—mainly due to the weather. The Llangollen canal is one of the biggest in the UK, and I very much hope that the nearby Pontcysyllte aqueduct achieves the world heritage site status that it well deserves, which would be a further boost to cultural tourism in Wales.

**Karen Sinclair:** Would you join me in encouraging the Minister to push the Countryside Council for Wales to extend the boundary of the nearby area of outstanding natural beauty right down to the aqueduct to increase the tourism offer? The CCW has sat on this issue for many years, and I do not know why; it really would complete the picture in Llangollen.

**Val Lloyd:** That argument speaks for itself. I

rhaid iddi gael cartref o frics a mortar; nid yw rhith-gartref yn ddigon da.

**Val Lloyd:** Ychwanegaf at y tapestri sydd eisoes yn gyforiog o atyniadau twristiaeth a amlinellwyd gan siaradwyr blaenorol drwy ganolbwyntio ar y cyfraniad at dwristiaeth ddiwylliannol a wna dyfrffyrdd a chamlesi Cymru, na soniwyd amdanynt hyd yma. Bu cysylltiad agos rhwng dyfrffyrdd Cymru a datblygiad economaidd y wlad. Tua diwedd y bedwaredd ganrif ar bymtheg, er enghraifft, porthladd Abertawe, a gefnogwyd gan rwydwaith o gamlesi lleol, oedd yr allforiwr copr mwyaf yn y byd. Erbyn hyn, mae'r diwydiannau hyn yn perthyn i'r gorffennol, ond mae'r rhwydwaith o gamlesi yng Nghymru yn rhywbeth pwerus i'n hatgoffa am ein treftadaeth ddiwydiannol. Yn bwysig, mae dyfrffyrdd a chamlesi wedi addasu i farchnad newidiol, ac maent heddiw'n rhan o'r arlwy twristiaeth ddiwylliannol gwych ac amrywiol.

Mae agor basn angori Llangollen wedi cael effaith gadarnhaol ar yr economi leol. Mae llawer o fusnesau wedi adrodd bod masnach ar gynnydd oherwydd nifer uwch yr ymwelwyr yn y dref, ac ystyrir bellach bod y basn yn rhan allweddol o arlwy twristiaeth yr ardal. Yn bwysicaf oll, mae wedi estyn y tymor twristiaeth, gan ei fod wedi denu ymwelwyr y tu allan i'r cyfnod brig. Mae hynny'n fudd enfawr, ac ystyried bod gan Gymru, yn draddodiadol, dymor twristiaeth byr—yn bennaf oherwydd y tywydd. Mae camlas Llangollen ymhlith y mwyaf yn y DU, a gobeithiaf yn fawr iawn fod traphont ddŵr Pontcysyllte gerllaw'n cyflawni'r statws safle treftadaeth y byd y mae'n ei haeddu'n fawr, a fyddai'n hwb pellach i dwristiaeth ddiwylliannol yng Nghymru.

**Karen Sinclair:** A fydddech yn ymuno â mi i annog y Gweinidog i wthio Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru i ymestyn ffin yr ardal o harddwch naturiol eithriadol gerllaw yr holl ffordd i lawr i'r draphont ddŵr i gynyddu'r cynnig twristiaeth? Mae Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru wedi eistedd ar y mater hwn ers blynnyddoedd lawer, ac ni wn paham; byddai'n wirioneddol yn cwblhau'r darlun yn Llangollen.

**Val Lloyd:** Mae'r ddadl honno'n siarad

would be happy to add my voice to that call. Perhaps you would like to come and talk about that at the next meeting of the cross-party group on waterways and canals.

The Monmouthshire and Brecon canal is another example of how the regeneration of a waterway has transformed communities. [*Interruption.*] Do you wish to intervene, Brynle?

**Brynle Williams:** I just have one point to make—on a positive note, for once. Do you agree that one of the best attractions of visitors from Wales and overseas is the Royal Welsh Show? Regrettably, I do not think that anyone has mentioned it. It attracts more than 0.25 million visitors over four days, including more than 6,000 from overseas. It just goes to show that Wales is a leading tourism destination, and that tourism is developing well in Wales.

**Val Lloyd:** It would be even better if you could get there by canal, would it not? [*Laughter.*]

I was talking about the Mon and Brec canal, which was originally a very busy artery carrying the lifeblood of the industrial revolution. It is now a rich asset to the visitor economy in the area, and is the base for thriving boating companies that attract visitors from the UK and overseas.

5.50 p.m.

Goytre wharf, just south of Abergavenny, is another popular visitor attraction, and a recent investment in the terminus of the canal at Brecon has resulted in the picturesque setting for Theatr Brycheiniog. I am not the only one saying this; there is evidence to back it up. A report by British Waterways on the economic costs and benefits of the Welsh canal network highlights that, for a yearly investment of £3.3 million, the inland canals of Wales support an annual spend of £34 million going into the national economy. I make that a tenfold return on the outlay, which is fantastic, not to mention that it supports 800 full-time jobs. That same report

drosti ei hun. Byddwn yn hapus ychwanegu fy llais at yr alwad honno. Efallai yr hoffech ddod i siarad am hynny yng nghyfarfod nesaf y grŵp trawsbleidiol ar ddyfrffyrdd a chamlesi.

Mae camlas Sir Fynwy ac Aberhonddu'n enghraifft arall o'r ffordd y mae adfywio dyfrffordd wedi trawsnewid cymunedau. [*Torri ar draws.*] A hoffech ymyrryd, Brynle?

**Brynle Williams:** Dim ond un pwynt sydd gennyf i'w wneud—ar nodyn cadarnhaol, am unwaith. A ydych yn cytuno mai Sioe Frenhinol Cymru yw un o'r atyniadau gorau i ymwelwyr o Gymru a thramor? Yn anffodus, nid wyf yn credu bod neb wedi sôn amdani. Mae'n denu mwy na chwarter miliwn o ymwelwyr dros bedwar diwrnod, gan gynnwys mwy na 6,000 o dramor. Mae'r cyfan yn dangos bod Cymru'n gyrcffan twristiaeth blaenllaw, a bod twristiaeth yn datblygu'n dda yng Nghymru.

**Val Lloyd:** Oni fyddai'n well byth pe gallech gyrraedd yno ar gamlas? [*Chwerthin.*]

Yr oeddwn yn sôn am gamlas Sir Fynwy ac Aberhonddu, a oedd yn wreiddiol yn brif wythien brysur iawn yn cludo enaid y chwyldro diwydiannol. Mae bellach yn ased gwych i'r economi ymwelwyr yn yr ardal, a'r canolbwynt ar gyfer cwmnïau cychod ffyniannus sy'n denu ymwelwyr o'r DU a thramor.

Mae glanfa Goetre, ychydig i'r de o'r Fenni, yn atyniad poblogaidd arall i ymwelwyr, ac mae buddsoddiad diweddar yn nherfynfa'r gamlas yn Aberhonddu wedi arwain at y safle darluniadwy ar gyfer Theatr Brycheiniog. Nid myfi yw'r unig un sy'n dweud hyn; ceir tystiolaeth i'w gefnogi. Mae adroddiad gan Ddyfrffyrdd Prydain am fuddion a chostau economaidd rhwydwaith camlesi Cymru yn amlygu bod camlesi mewndirol Cymru, am fuddsoddiad blynyddol o £3.3 miliwn, yn cefnogi gwariant blynyddol o £34 miliwn sy'n mynd i mewn i'r economi genedlaethol. Tybiaf fod hynny'n dychwelyd deg gwaith y gost, sy'n

also shows that the benefits of visits to Welsh canals are currently estimated to be more than £7.5 million per year, and that waterside businesses continue to develop.

I am pleased that you have allowed me to contribute to highlight the substantial contribution made by the network of Welsh canals to cultural tourism, and more widely to sustainable community regeneration. If you want to know more about both of those, do come to the next meeting of the cross-party group on waterways and canals.

**The Minister for Heritage (Rhodri Glyn Thomas):** I will refer first to Val's well made points on waterways. That was an important contribution, as was Peter's contribution about marketing the product. Quite a few speakers, including Jeff, Huw and others, referred to the importance of the industrial Valleys. Alun Davies made that point powerfully. I was at Blaenavon this morning and I can announce that, from 23 March, entry to the ironworks there will be free, which means that the entire heritage site now has free admission. I hope that that will be a stimulus for more and more people to visit it, to appreciate what is there and what it signifies for the history of Wales and its development, economically.

Nerys, Dai and Eleanor referred to the importance of St David's Day. I will certainly be on the march on Saturday, and I look forward to seeing representatives from all the political parties there. It is an important day for Wales: a day for us to celebrate our nationhood.

Paul started his speech by welcoming the debate itself and many of the things that I had said. However, he then went on to say that the Welsh Conservatives, as I understand it, would like to fund a Welsh daily newspaper. As I recall, Paul welcomed my announcement about *Y Byd* when I made it, and made no call for more money at that time, and yet now he wants to fully finance a Welsh daily newspaper. I take it that Paul is talking about the more than £1 million

ardderchog, heb sôn am y ffaith ei fod yn cefnogi 800 o swyddi amser llawn. Mae'r un adroddiad hwnnw hefyd yn dangos yr amcangyfrif ar hyn o bryd fod buddion ymweliadau â chamlesi Cymru yn fwy na £7.5 miliwn y flwyddyn, a bod busnesau ar lan y dŵr yn parhau i ddatblygu.

Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi gadael imi gyfrannu at amlygu'r cyfraniad sylweddol a wna rhwydwaith camlesi Cymru at dwristiaeth ddiwylliannol, ac yn ehangach at adfywio cymunedol cynaliadwy. Os hoffech wybod mwy am y ddau beth hynny, mae croeso ichi ddod i gyfarfod nesaf y grŵp trawsbleidiol ar ddyfrffyrdd a chamlesi.

**Y Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth (Rhodri Glyn Thomas):** Cyfeiriai yn gyntaf at bwyntiau croyw Val am ddyfrffyrdd. Yr oedd hwnnw'n gyfraniad pwysig, fel yr oedd cyfraniad Peter am farchnata'r cynnyrch. Mae eithaf tipyn o siaradwyr, gan gynnwys Jeff, Huw ac eraill, wedi cyfeirio at bwysigrwydd y Cymoedd diwydiannol. Gwnaeth Alun Davies y pwynt hwnnw'n bwerus. Yr oeddwn ym Mlaenafon y bore yma a gallaf gyhoeddi y bydd mynediad i'r gwaith haearn yno yn rhad ac am ddim o 23 Mawrth ymlaen, sy'n golygu bod mynediad am ddim i'r safle treftadaeth cyfan bellach. Gobeithiai y bydd hynny'n ysgogi mwy a mwy o bobl i ymweld ag ef, i werthfawrogi'r hyn sydd yno a'r hyn y mae'n ei olygu i hanes Cymru a'i datblygiad, yn economaidd.

Cyfeiriodd Nerys, Dai ac Eleanor at bwysigrwydd Dydd Gŵyl Dewi. Byddaf yn sicr ar yr orymdaith ddydd Sadwrn, ac edrychaf ymlaen at weld cynrychiolwyr o'r holl bleidiau gwleidyddol yno. Mae'n ddiwrnod pwysig i Gymru: diwrnod inni ddathlu ein cenedligrwydd.

Dechreuodd Paul ei araith drwy groesawu'r ddadl ei hun a llawer o'r pethau yr oeddwn i wedi'u dweud. Fodd bynnag, aeth ymlaen wedyn i ddweud yr hoffai'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig, fel y'i deallaf, ariannu papur newydd dyddiol Cymraeg. Fel y cofiai, croesawodd Paul fy nghyhoeddiad am *Y Byd* pan y'i gwneuthum, ac ni alwodd am unrhyw arian yn rhagor bryd hynny, ac eto erbyn hyn mae eisiau cyllido papur newydd dyddiol Cymraeg yn llawn. Yr wyf yn cymryd bod

required in set-up costs for that newspaper, the £600,000 annual revenue grant required, a guarantee of £400,000 worth of advertising in that paper from the Government of Wales and the Assembly, and of £400,000 of advertising from other sources. That comes to around £2.5 million. Paul, if you want to stand up and guarantee that amount of money for a daily newspaper, you are welcome to do so, if that is what you are talking about. Time and again, the Welsh Conservatives bandy around these sums of money. Brynle Williams told us last week that the funds announced by the Minister for Rural Affairs were not sufficient and that the Welsh Conservatives would have provided that money were it in Government. Every week, we hear these commitments. If you want to stand up and make that guarantee, fair enough, but, if not, do not make such comments.

The normally sure-footed David Melding managed to score three own goals in his short contribution. He wanted me to tell him exactly what we would do with the strategy even before I had received it or had an opportunity to look at it. Do you want me to pre-empt the recommendations of the strategy, David? [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.'] Wait for the other two own goals.

He then supported Jenny Randerson in saying that Cardiff had been let down by Visit Wales, but that leaflet was paid for by local authorities. If Cardiff did not want to contribute to that leaflet, why should it expect to be mentioned in it—and that on a day when you were highly critical of Cardiff. Cardiff was said to be the seventh best capital to visit in the whole of Europe.

**David Melding** *rose*—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** No, I have one more own goal for you, David. You then supported Darren Millar in saying that we were not taking advantage of Liverpool's European Capital of Culture status. If Darren talks to staff at the tourism partnership in north Wales, they will tell him what they are doing

Paul yn siarad am fwy na'r £1 miliwn y mae ei angen i sefydlu'r papur newydd hwnnw, y grant refeniw blynyddol o £600,000 y mae ei angen, a sicrhau gwerth £400,000 o hysbysebion yn y papur hwnnw gan Lywodraeth Cymru a'r Cynulliad, a £400,000 o hysbysebion o ffynonellau eraill. Daw hynny i ryw £2.5 miliwn. Paul, os hoffech godi ar eich traed a sicrhau'r swm hwnnw o arian ar gyfer papur newydd dyddiol, mae croeso ichi wneud hynny, os hynny yr ydych yn sôn amdano. Dro ar ôl tro, mae'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig yn sôn am y symiau arian hyn. Dywedodd Brynle Williams wrthym yr wythnos diwethaf nad oedd y cyllid a gyhoeddwyd gan y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig yn ddigonol ac y buasai'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig yn darparu'r arian hwnnw petai yn y Llywodraeth. Bob wythnos, yr ydym yn clywed yr ymrwymadau hyn. Os hoffech sefyll i fyny a sicrhau hynny, digon teg, ond, os na, peidiwch â gwneud sylwadau o'r fath.

Mae David Melding, sydd fel arfer mor sicr ar ei draed, wedi llwyddo i sgorio tair gôl i'w rwyd ei hun yn ei gyfraniad byr. Yr oedd eisiau imi ddweud wrtho beth yn union y byddem yn ei wneud gyda'r strategaeth hyd yn oed cyn imi ei chael neu cyn imi gael cyfle i edrych arni. A ydych chi eisiau imi ragatal argymhellion y strategaeth, David? [AELODAU CYNULLIAD: 'O.'] Arhoswch am y ddwy gôl arall i'w rwyd ei hun.

Wedyn, cefnogodd Jenny Randerson yn dweud bod Croeso Cymru wedi siomi Caerdydd, ond talwyd am y daflen honno gan awdurdodau lleol. Os nad oedd Caerdydd eisiau cyfrannu at y daflen honno, pam y dylai ddisgwyl gael ei chrybwyll ynddi—a hynny ar ddiwrnod yr oeddech yn beirniadu Caerdydd yn fawr. Dywedwyd mai Caerdydd oedd y seithfed brifddinas orau i ymweld â hi yn Ewrop gyfan.

**David Melding** *a gododd*—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Na, mae gennyf un gôl arall i'ch rhwyd eich hun, David. Wedyn, yr oeddech yn cefnogi Darren Millar yn dweud nad oeddem yn manteisio ar statws Prifddinas Diwylliant Ewrop Lerpwl. Petai Darren yn siarad â staff yn y bartneriaeth dwristiaeth yn y gogledd, byddent yn dweud

to attract business down from Liverpool.

**David Melding** *rose—*

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Actually, I have also noticed a fourth own goal by you, David. You asked what we were doing to get more money for marketing and tourism in Wales. Look at the Welsh European Funding Office website. The plans are already there. Do your research.

**David Melding:** The debate has sharpened up, so I will respond in style. The heart of what I am saying, Rhodri, is that you need to get a better grip and give some direction to your portfolio.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I do not think that someone who has just scored four own goals should tell other people to get a grip. Do your research before you come here and make spurious comments about something on which you obviously know nothing about.

I thank everyone for their contribution. Cultural tourism is an important issue, as Huw Lewis said. More needs to be done, and we need to learn from best practice throughout the world, but we are going in the right direction. It is important to tell people who come to Wales the story of the people of Wales, and that is how we will attract them here again. Diolch yn fawr.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The proposal is to agree amendment 1. Are there any objections? I see that there are, and so we proceed to a vote.

*Gwelliant 1 i NDM3869: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 37.  
Amendment 1 NDM3869: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 37.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
German, Michael  
Graham, William

wrtho beth y maent yn ei wneud i ddenu busnes o Lerpwl.

**David Melding** *a gododd—*

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A dweud y gwir, yr wyf hefyd wedi sylwi ar eich pedwaredd gôl i'ch rhwyd eich hun, David. Gofynasoch beth yr oeddem yn ei wneud i gael mwy o arian ar gyfer marchnata a thwristiaeth yng Nghymru. Edrychwch ar wefan Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru. Mae'r cynlluniau yno eisoes. Gwnewch eich gwaith ymchwil.

**David Melding:** Mae'r ddadl wedi miniogi, felly ymatebaf yn yr un ffordd. Wrth wraidd yr hyn a ddywedaf, Rhodri, yw bod angen ichi gael gwell gafael a rhoi rhyw gyfeiriad i'ch portffolio.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Nid wyf yn credu y dylai rhywun sydd newydd sgorio pedair gôl yn ei rwyd ei hun ddweud wrth bobl eraill i gael gafael arni. Gwnewch eich gwaith ymchwil cyn ichi ddod yma a gwneud sylwadau annilys am rywbeth yr ydych yn amlwg yn gwybod dim amdano.

Diolchaf i bawb am eu cyfraniad. Mae twristiaeth ddiwylliannol yn fater pwysig, fel y dywedodd Huw Lewis. Mae angen gwneud mwy, ac mae angen inni ddysgu o arfer gorau ledled y byd, ond yr ydym yn mynd i'r cyfeiriad cywir. Mae'n bwysig dweud wrth bobl sy'n dod i Gymru beth yw hanes pobl Cymru, a dyna sut y byddwn yn eu denu yma eto. Diolch yn fawr.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Y cynnig yw cytuno gwelliant 1. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiadau? Gwelaf fod, ac felly awn ymlaen i bleidlais.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Asghar, Mohammad  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew



Isherwood, Mark  
 Melding, David  
 Millar, Darren  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Ramsay, Nick  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Davies, Jocelyn  
 Evans, Nerys  
 Franks, Chris  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 James, Irene  
 Jenkins, Bethan  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Law, Trish  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Watson, Joyce  
 Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM3869): O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 10.  
 Motion (NDM3869): For 42, Abstain 0, Against 10.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Asghar, Mohammad  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Alun  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Evans, Nerys  
 Franks, Chris  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 James, Irene  
 Jenkins, Bethan  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Burns, Angela  
 Davies, Andrew R.T.  
 Davies, Paul  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Melding, David  
 Millar, Darren  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Ramsay, Nick  
 Williams, Brynle

Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings today's business to a close. **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.57 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 5.57 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau  
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
Asghar, Mohammad (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Burns, Angela (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
Davies, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
Davies, Andrew R.T. (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Davies, Paul (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Evans, Nerys (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Franks, Chris (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
Griffiths, Lesley (Llafur – Labour)  
Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
Jenkins, Bethan (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)

Jones, Gareth (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)  
Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
Millar, Darren (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
Ramsay, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Watson, Joyce (Llafur – Labour)  
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)