



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
The National Assembly for Wales**

**Cofnod y Trafodion
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mawrth, 24 Mehefin 2008
Tuesday, 24 June 2008**

Cynnwys
Contents

3	Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister
31	Datganiad a Chyhoeddiad Busnes Business Statement and Announcement
39	Datganiad am Argymhellion gan Grŵp Cyngori'r Gweinidog—Ymagwedd Newydd tuag at Ddatblygu Economaidd Statement on Recommendations from the Ministerial Advisory Group—A New Approach to Economic Development
55	Datganiad am Adroddiad Sue Essex ar Dai Statement on Sue Essex's Housing Report
68	Datganiad am yr Adolygiad Sicrwydd o'r Gwasanaeth Ambiwlans Statement on the Ambulance Service Assurance Review
90	Effeithiolrwydd Ysgolion School Effectiveness
109	Cyfnod Pleidleisio Voting Time

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.

Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) in the Chair.*

Y Llywydd: Galwaf y Cynulliad i drefn.

The Presiding Officer: I call the Assembly to order.

Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister

Sustainable Transport

Q1 Brynle Williams: Will the First Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's priorities for sustainable transport in north Wales? OAQ(3)1146(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan): Diolch am y cwestiwn, Brynle.

Our strategic vision for a sustainable integrated transport system was set out in the transport strategy, 'Connecting the Nation', published in May this year. That will be translated into regional priorities via the regional transport plans.

Brynle Williams: Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw.

The rail network is a vital asset for businesses in north Wales and one of the most sustainable forms of long-distance travel. We have seen the introduction of a new service between Wrexham and London this year but, regrettably, the cost of fares has gone from £65 to £200, while Virgin Trains has restricted the use of saver tickets on the west coast line. How can you and your Government hope to attract businesses to north Wales when the rail network is fast becoming unaffordable?

The First Minister: That was one of those franchise reinterpretations by Virgin Trains over which we have absolutely no control. My understanding of what happened is that the £65 offer was available in Wales but not outside Wales, and passengers were getting on in England who were then claiming that they had got on at Welsh stations and were eligible for the discount. The fare or revenue-maximising inspectors spotted that use of the

Trafnidiaeth Gynaliadwy

C1 Brynle Williams: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am flaenoriaethau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer trafndiaeth gynaliadwy yn y gogledd? OAQ(3)1146(FM)

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): Thank you for the question, Brynle.

Amlinellwyd ein gweledigaeth strategol ar gyfer system drafndiaeth integredig gynaliadwy yn y strategaeth drafndiaeth, 'Cysylltu'r Genedl', a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Mai eleni. Caiff honno ei throsi'n flaenoriaethau rhanbarthol drwy'r cynlluniau trafndiaeth rhanbarthol.

Brynle Williams: Thank you for that answer.

Mae'r rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd yn ased hanfodol i fusnesau'r gogledd ac yn un o'r mathau mwyaf cynaliadwy o deithio pellter hir. Cyflwynwyd gwasanaeth newydd rhwng Wrecsam a Llundain eleni ond, yn anffodus, mae pris tocyn wedi codi o £65 i £200, tra bo Virgin Trains wedi cyfyngu defnyddio tocynnau arbed arian ar reilffordd arfordir y gorllewin. Sut y gallwch chi a'ch Llywodraeth obeithio denu busnesau i'r gogledd pan mae'r rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd yn mynd yn llai a llai fforddiadwy?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr oedd hynny'n enghraifft o Virgin Trains yn ailddehongli masnachfaint, ac nid oes gennym reolaeth dros hynny. Yr wyf ar ddeall bod y cynnig £65 ar gael yng Nghymru ond nid y tu allan i Gymru, ac yr oedd teithwyr yn dod ar y trên yn Lloegr gan hawlio eu bod wedi dod ar y trên mewn gorsafoedd yng Nghymru a'u bod yn gymwys ar gyfer y gostyngiad. Gwelodd yr arolygwyr tocynnau neu'r arolygwyr

Welsh loophole by English passengers and said that they would put a stop to it. We do not have any control over that because it is not our franchise, but it disadvantages the passengers who were getting on earlier in Wales to the benefit of passengers getting on later in England, so it is not good.

Gareth Jones: Mae cytundeb ‘Cymru’n Un’ yn addo gwelliannau dramatig i drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus a fydd yn annog pobl i wneud llai o ddefnydd o’u ceir. Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunech fod y cynnydd dramatig diweddar a welwyd ym mhpris petrol a disel fwy neu lai yn gwneud y gwaith hwnnw ar ein rhan. Yn sgîl hynny, a yw’r Llywodraeth yn bwriadu prysuro ymlaen gyda’r addewid pellach a geir yn ‘Cymru’n Un’ i wella trafndiaeth ranbarthol a chenedlaethol?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych wedi gwneud pwynt pwysig dros ben, sef bod y farchnad yn gwasgu am yr hyn y mae Gweinidogion a grwpiau gwyrdd ac ati yn ei annog, sef i bobl beidio â defnyddio eu ceir os y gyrrwr yw’r unig berson yn y car. Mae pawb yn deall bod petrol a disel yn enwedig wedi mynd yn ddrud, felly mae’r farchnad yn gwneud y gwaith drosom, a dyna pam y gwelwn gynnydd yn nifer y bobl sy’n defnyddio’r trênn a’r bws yn lle eu ceir. Yn awr, rhaid inni geisio cyflymu’r broses honno, a rhaid osgoi sefyllfa lle na fydd pobl yn gallu defnyddio’r trênn am fod y trenau yn rhy fach neu, os yw’r trenau wedi’u hymestyn, am fod y platfformau’n rhy fyr, neu am nad yw’r system arwyddo yn gallu ymdopi â’r cynnydd yn nifer y trenau sy’n rhedeg. Felly, rhaid inni rasio i ddal lan gyda’r hyn sydd wedi digwydd oherwydd y cynnydd ym mhrisiau petrol a disel.

The Health of Welsh People

Q2 Jenny Randerson: Will the First Minister make a statement on his priorities for the health of Welsh people? OAQ(3)1142(FM)

The First Minister: This is a timely question, given that the sixtieth anniversary of the national health service—Wales’s

cynyddu refeniw fod teithwyr o Loegr yn cymryd mantais ar y cynnig hwn i deithwyr o Gymru, a dywedasant y byddent yn rhoi stop ar y peth. Nid oes gennym reolaeth dros hynny, gan mai nid ein masnachfrait ni ydyw, ond mae’n rhoi teithwyr a fu’n dod ar y trênn yn gynharach yng Nghymru dan anfantais ac yn rhoi mantais i’r teithwyr sy’n dod ar y trênn yn ddiweddarach yn Lloegr, felly nid yw’n beth da.

Gareth Jones: The ‘One Wales’ agreement promises dramatic improvements to the public transport system to encourage people to make less use of their cars. I am sure that you would agree that the recent dramatic increases in petrol and diesel prices are more or less doing that work for us. In light of that, does the Government intend to forge ahead with the latest pledge in ‘One Wales’, namely to improve transport on a regional and a national level?

The First Minister: You have made a vital point, namely that the market is forcing what Ministers and green organisations and so on are encouraging, namely for people not to use their cars if the driver is the only person in the car. Everyone appreciates that petrol and particularly diesel prices have become very expensive, and so the market is doing our work for us, which is why we are seeing an increase in the number of people who are using the train or the bus instead of their cars. We must now try to expedite that process, and we must avoid a situation in which people are unable to travel by train because there are not enough carriages or, if the trains are extended, because the platforms are not long enough, or because the signalling system cannot cope with the increase in demand. Therefore, we must race to catch up with the events caused by the increase in petrol and diesel prices.

Iechyd Pobl Cymru

C2 Jenny Randerson: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ei flaenoriaethau ar gyfer iechyd pobl Cymru? OAQ(3)1142(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae hwn yn gwestiwn amserol, ac ystyried bod chwe deg mlynedd wedi mynd heibio ers sefydlu’r gwasanaeth

greatest ever contribution to modern civilisation—is coming up next week. After 60 years, we now have to put more emphasis on that covenant between the citizen and the NHS and more emphasis on the walk and the fork as way of avoiding the scalpel and the stethoscope.

Jenny Randerson: That is an interesting approach, First Minister, and one that I wholeheartedly endorse.

The emphasis on prevention is important in modern medicine, and, in that context, I welcome the decision of the UK Government to introduce vaccinations to protect against cervical cancer—a decision that was also adopted in Wales. However, I am concerned that the Department of Health has decided to opt for a vaccine that does not protect against all four types of human papillomavirus, only two. It will not, for example, protect against genital warts. Was that decision made on cost grounds alone? I ask this because all other countries that have gone for this vaccine have opted for the one with the wider application. Specifically, did we have the opportunity in Wales to undertake our own cost/benefit analysis? Did we have the opportunity to introduce our own system, or are we bound by the Department of Health's decision?

The First Minister: I am afraid that you have introduced a subject that goes well beyond the level of erudition available to me, although I have no doubt that the person sitting to my right will be able to answer that question in full, in writing.

Ann Jones: You recently provided a foreword for the report on the uptake of the new pneumococcal conjugate vaccine that was introduced to the childhood immunisation schedule in September 2006. The report written by Wyeth, the vaccine manufacturer, shows that PCV has already delivered a reduction in life-threatening diseases such as meningitis, septicaemia and pneumonia. Ninety-five per cent of Welsh children are receiving the vaccine, which is some 6 per cent higher than the figure in England. Do you agree that that is a fantastic

iechyd gwladol—cyfraniad mwyaf Cymru erioed i wareiddiad fodern—yr wythnos nesaf. Ar ôl 60 mlynedd, rhaid inni'n awr roi mwy o bwyslais ar y cyfamod hwnnw rhwng y dinesydd a'r GIG a mwy o bwyslais ar ymarfer corff a deiet fel ffyrdd o osgoi'r gyllell a'r stethosgop.

Jenny Randerson: Mae honno'n agwedd ddiddorol, Brif Weinidog, ac yr wyf yn ei chymeradwyo o waelod calon.

Mae'r pwyslais ar atal yn bwysig mewn meddygaeth fodern, ac yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, croesawaf benderfyniad Llywodraeth y DU i gyflwyno brechiadau i amddiffyn yn erbyn canser ceg y groth—penderfyniad a fabwysiadwyd yng Nghymru hefyd. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn bryderus bod yr Adran Iechyd wedi penderfynu dewis brechlyn na fydd yn amddiffyn yn erbyn pob un o'r pedwar math o feirws papiloma dynol, dim ond dau ohonynt. Ni fydd, er enghraifft, yn amddiffyn yn erbyn defaid gwenerol. A wnaethpwyd y penderfyniad hwnnw ar sail costau'n unig? Yr wyf yn gofyn hyn am fod yr holl wledydd eraill sydd wedi mynd am y brechlyn hwn wedi dewis yr un â manteision mwy eang. Yn benodol, a gawsom y cyfle yng Nghymru i gynnal ein dadansoddiad costau/buddiannau ein hunain? A gawsom y cyfle i gyflwyno ein system ein hunain, ynteu a ydym ynghlwm wrth benderfyniad yr Adran Iechyd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae arnaf ofn eich bod wedi cyflwyno pwnc sy'n mynd ymhell y tu hwnt i'r lefel o wybodaeth sydd gennyf, ond nid oes amheuaeth gennyf y bydd yr unigolyn ar fy llaw dde'n gallu ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw'n llawn, yn ysgrifenedig.

Ann Jones: Yn ddiweddar, rhoesoch ragair ar gyfer yr adroddiad am y niferoedd sydd wedi derbyn y brechlyn niwmococol cyfun newydd a gyflwynwyd i'r rhestr imiwneiddio plant ym mis Medi 2006. Mae'r adroddiad a ysgrifennwyd gan Wyeth, y gwneuthurwr brechlynnau, yn dangos bod y brechlyn niwmococol cyfun eisoes wedi achosi lleihad yn niferoedd clefydau sy'n bygwth bywyd megis meningitis, septisemia a niwmonia. Mae naw deg pump y cant o blant Cymru'n derbyn y brechlyn, sydd tua 6 y cant yn uwch na'r ffigur yn Lloegr. A ydych yn cytuno bod

story for the NHS in Wales that we should celebrate? However, while this is good news, one child in six in Wales does not receive the booster dose at the age of 13 months. Will you make a statement on the maximisation of the uptake of that important vaccine?

The First Minister: This is a vaccine on which I have a little more information to hand. You are right to say that 95 per cent of Welsh children are receiving the PCV vaccine, which protects against meningitis, septicaemia and pneumonia. The comparable figure in England is 89 per cent, so there is more ground to make up in England. However, even we might be able to improve on our figure of 95 per cent. It is important that we persuade parents to vaccinate their children against measles and other diseases, not only for the protection of their own children but for the protection of what is known as 'herd immunity'. The closer to 100 per cent you get, the more likely it is that you can simply eliminate a disease. For example, smallpox and diphtheria were major killers in my grandparents' day, but they are now hardly heard of.

Jonathan Morgan: One of the great challenges facing the national health service—indeed, facing us all—is in the field of public health. You will know that, last week, the World Health Organization published a survey that showed that more young people under the age of 13 in Wales had been drunk on at least two occasions than in any other country in western Europe. I am sure that that figure is of concern to you, as it is to me. As a Government, I know that you have a substance misuse strategy, but in combating substance abuse—particularly alcohol abuse—among young teenagers, what will the Government do at a practical level to try to reduce the number of people in Wales using alcohol before the age of 18?

The First Minister: It is not just of concern; it is absolutely horrifying that we have the highest figures of teenage alcohol consumption—or at least the reported figures, as it is not absolutely clear that these are

honno'n stori ardderchog i'r GIG yng Nghymru ac y dylem ei dathlu? Fodd bynnag, er bod hynny'n newyddion da, nid yw un o bob chwe phlentyn yng Nghymru'n derbyn y dos atgyfnerthu yn 13 mis oed. A wnewch ddatganiad am gynyddu'r niferoedd sy'n derbyn y brechlyn pwysig hwnnw?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae gennyf ychydig mwy o wybodaeth wrth law am y brechlyn hwn. Yr ydych yn gywir pan ddywedwch fod 95 y cant o blant Cymru'n derbyn y brechlyn niwmococol cyfun, sy'n amddiffyn yn erbyn meningitis, septicemia a niwmonia. Mae'r ffigur cymharol yn Lloegr yn 89 y cant, felly mae mwy o le i wella yn Lloegr. Fodd bynnag, efallai y gallem ni hyd yn oed wella ar ein ffigur o 95 y cant. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn perswadio rhieni i frechu eu plant yn erbyn y frech goch a chlefydau eraill, nid yn unig er mwyn amddiffyn eu plant hwy ond er mwyn amddiffyn yr hyn a elwir yn 'imiwnedd haid'. Yr agosaf at 100 y cant yr ewch, y mwyaf tebygol ydyw y gallwch ddileu clefyd. Er enghraifft, yr oedd y frech wen a difftheria yn lladd llawer yn oes fy mam-gu a'm tad-cu, ond prin y bydd rhywun yn clywed amdanynt heddiw.

Jonathan Morgan: Mae un o'r heriau mawr sy'n wynebu'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol—yn ein hwynebu i gyd, yn wir—ym maes iechyd cyhoeddus. Byddwch yn gwybod bod Sefydliad Iechyd y Byd, yr wythnos diwethaf, wedi cyhoeddi arolwg a oedd yn dangos bod mwy o bobl ifanc dan 13 oed yng Nghymru wedi bod yn feddw o leiaf ddwywaith o'i gymharu ag unrhyw wlad arall yng ngorllewin Ewrop. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod y ffigur hwnnw'n peri pryder ichi, fel y mae i mi. Fel Llywodraeth, gwn fod gennych strategaeth camdefnyddio sylweddau, ond o ran mynd i'r afael â chamdefnyddio sylweddau—yn enwedig camdefnyddio alcohol—ymysg pobl ifanc yn eu harddegau, beth fydd y Llywodraeth yn ei wneud ar lefel ymarferol i geisio lleihau nifer y bobl yng Nghymru sy'n defnyddio alcohol cyn eu bod yn 18 mlwydd oed?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid dim ond peri pryder y mae; mae'n hollol erchyll bod gennym y ffigurau uchaf o ran defnyddio alcohol ymysg pobl ifanc yn eu harddegau—neu'r ffigurau yn yr adroddiad, beth bynnag, gan nad yw'n

comparable figures. We need to check on the extent to which there might be an element of bravado and boasting in the answers given as distinct from knowing that this is the actual consumption figure. I will look into this matter, to see whether our programmes are as effective as they can be, and to see what other possible explanation there could be for the variance between Wales and the rest of the UK in reported teenage abuse of alcohol at far too early an age for the liver or growing body to be able to cope with it, let alone the growing mind. We need to ask why that is, why it is easier for them to obtain alcohol and what it is that would make them want to abuse an alcohol at such an early age, and do something about it.

2.10 p.m.

Helen Mary Jones: I am sure that you will agree that family nurses working out of schools can have a big impact on several of the agendas that we have been talking about today, whether promoting vaccination among teenagers, as we will need to do with the cervical cancer vaccine, or helping young people to develop a sensible understanding of alcohol and its safe use. Can you confirm that it is still a priority for the One Wales Government to introduce, by the end of this Assembly, a family nurse working out of every secondary school, and that we would expect those nurses to have strong relationships with the primary schools that feed into those secondary schools also?

The First Minister: Indeed. There is an ongoing programme to define exactly how that commitment, which is a key plank of the 'One Wales' set of agreements on health, will be implemented. We have held four roadshows across Wales, trying to engage with children and young people to see what exactly they would want and how they see a school nurse as being of benefit to them. That will inform a wider consultation about how the school nursing role can be expanded to take account of modern family dynamics.

Priorities (South Wales Central)

Q3 Andrew R.T. Davies: What are the

gwbl glir bod y ffigurau hyn yn gymaradwy. Mae angen inni wirio i ba raddau y gallai fod elfen o ymffrostio a brolio yn yr atebion a roddwyd, yn hytrach na gwybod mai dyma'r ffigur defnyddio gwirioneddol. Edrychaf ar y mater hwn, i weld a yw ein rhaglenni mor effeithiol ag y gallant fod, ac i weld pa eglurhad posibl arall y gallai fod am y gwahaniaeth rhwng Cymru a gweddill y DU o ran ffigurau camddefnyddio alcohol ymysg pobl yn eu harddegau, sy'n llawer rhy ifanc i'r iau neu'r corff sy'n tyfu allu ymdopi ag ef, heb sôn am y meddwl sy'n tyfu. Mae angen inni ofyn pam mae hynny'n digwydd, pam ei bod yn haws iddynt gael gafael ar alcohol a beth fyddai'n gwneud iddynt fod ag eisiau camddefnyddio alcohol mor ifanc, ac wedyn, gwneud rhywbeth am y peth.

Helen Mary Jones: Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn cytuno y gall nyrsys teulu sy'n gweithio mewn ysgolion gael effaith fawr ar nifer o'r agendâu yr ydym wedi bod yn siarad amdanynt heddiw, boed hynny'n hybu brechu ymysg pobl ifanc yn eu harddegau, fel y bydd angen inni ei wneud gyda brechlyn canser ceg y groth, neu'n helpu pobl ifanc i ddatblygu dealltwriaeth gall o alcohol a'i ddefnyddio'n ddiogel. A allwch gadarnhau ei bod yn dal yn flaenoriaeth i Lywodraeth Cymru'n Un gyflwyno, erbyn diwedd y Cynulliad hwn, nyrs deulu sy'n gweithio ym mhob ysgol uwchradd, ac y byddem yn disgwyl i'r nyrsys hynny gael perthynas gref â'r ysgolion cynradd sy'n bwydo i'r ysgolion uwchradd hynny hefyd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn wir. Ceir rhaglen barhaus i ddiffinio'n union sut y caiff yr ymrwymiad hwnnw, sy'n elfen allweddol o gytundebau 'Cymru'n Un' ar iechyd, ei roi ar waith. Yr ydym wedi cynnal pedair sioe deithiol ledled Cymru, i geisio cysylltu â phlant a phobl ifanc i weld beth yn union y byddai ei eisiau arnynt a sut y byddai nyrs ysgol o fudd iddynt yn eu barn nhw. Bydd hynny'n sail i ymgynghoriad ehangach am sut y gellir ehangu'r rôl nyrsio ysgol i ystyried dynameg teuluoedd modern.

Blaenoriaethau (Canol De Cymru)

C3 Andrew R.T. Davies: Beth yw

Welsh Assembly Government's priorities in South Wales Central for the next six months? OAQ(3)1154(FM)

The First Minister: Among our priorities in South Wales Central is ensuring that the £30 million that we are investing in removing the various signalling frustrations in the Cardiff area fits in with Network Rail's £200 million investment in the Cardiff area on re-signalling the main line. That should lead to the decongestion of the network of commuter lines into and out of central Cardiff.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Figures published last week highlight sickness levels among the teaching profession in Wales. In South Wales Central, many headteachers highlight the disruption that long-term sickness has on staff planning and on their ability to build constructive dialogue with pupils. Nationally, 65 per cent of teachers have taken one day or more off sick over the last academic year, and the overall figure has increased by 17,000 days. What measures is the Government taking to address these issues to help headteachers in South Wales Central and particularly the pupils and parents, so that the environment in our schools is conducive for teachers to learn, to enable teachers to go forward in meeting their full, professional qualifications?

The First Minister: It is the teachers who teach, and the pupils who learn—at least, I hope so. That said, teachers no doubt engage in a learning process themselves, including learning how to manage their stress levels, perhaps. It is important to ensure that teachers have a reasonable work-life balance. They have long holidays, but they also need a huge amount of time for the preparation of homework and marking and so forth, which does make the job fairly stressful. When I discuss with teachers how I prepare for these question sessions, by balancing the brief on my knee while watching the news at 10 p.m., they always tell me that that they are also marking homework or doing something similar at 10 p.m.. Therefore, I understand the kind of stress that they are under, because there is an element of commonality in that

blaenoriaethau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yng Nghanol De Cymru ar gyfer y chwe mis nesaf? OAQ(3)1154(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Un o'n blaenoriaethau yng Nghanol De Cymru yw sicrhau bod y £30 miliwn yr ydym yn ei fuddsoddi i dynnu'r amrywiol signalau rhwystredig yn ardal Caerdydd yn cyd-fynd â buddsoddiad £200 miliwn Network Rail yn ardal Caerdydd i newid signalau'r brif reilffordd. Dylai hynny arwain at lai o dagfeydd ar y rhwydwaith o reilffyrdd cymudwyr i mewn i ganol Caerdydd ac oddi yno.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Mae'r ffigurau a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos diwethaf yn tynnu sylw at lefelau salwch ymysg y proffesiwn addysgu yng Nghymru. Yng Nghanol De Cymru, mae nifer o benaethiaid yn tynnu sylw at y tarfu a achosir gan salwch hirdymor ar gynllunio staff ac ar eu gallu i sefydlu deialog adeiladol â disgyblion. Yn genedlaethol, mae 65 y cant o athrawon wedi cymryd un diwrnod neu fwy i ffwrdd yn sâl dros y flwyddyn academaidd ddiwethaf, ac mae'r cyfanswm yn 17,000 diwrnod yn fwy. Pa fesurau y mae'r Llywodraeth yn eu cymryd i fynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn er mwyn helpu penaethiaid yng Nghanol De Cymru ac yn enwedig y disgyblion a'r rhieni, fel bod yr amgylchedd yn ein hysgolion yn addas i athrawon i ddysgu, er mwyn galluogi athrawon i fynd ymlaen i ddiwallu eu cymwysterau proffesiynol llawn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr athrawon sy'n addysgu, a'r disgyblion sy'n dysgu—yr wyf yn gobeithio hynny, o leiaf. Ond wedi dweud hynny, nid oes amheuaeth bod yr athrawon eu hunain mewn proses ddysgu, sy'n cynnwys dysgu sut i reoli eu lefelau straen, efallai. Mae'n bwysig sicrhau bod gan athrawon gydbwysedd rhesymol rhwng gwaith a bywyd. Maent yn cael gwyliau hir, ond mae arnynt hefyd angen llawer iawn o amser i baratoi gwaith cartref a marcio ac ati, sy'n golygu bod tipyn o straen ynghlwm wrth y swydd. Pan fyddaf yn trafod gydag athrawon sut y byddaf yn paratoi ar gyfer y sesiynau cwestiynau hyn, drwy gydbwysu'r briff ar fy mhen-glin wrth wylio'r newyddion am 10 p.m., byddant yn dweud wrthyf bob tro eu bod hwythau hefyd yn marcio gwaith cartref neu'n gwneud rhywbeth tebyg am 10

you take your work home with you. Teachers do not leave their work behind at 4 p.m. when they get in the car and drive home, as some people think. It is a stressful occupation, there is no doubt about it, and so there is an issue about burnout and stress, and thus a stress-management issue for headteachers and others to ensure that that kind of sickness is minimised.

Chris Franks: What assurances will you give regarding ambulance response times? Recent figures have shown that barely half of ambulances sent on emergency calls in the Vale of Glamorgan arrive within the eight-minute target. As you know, the accident-and-emergency unit at Barry hospital closes at around 5 p.m., so emergency patients have to travel to Cardiff or Bridgend.

The First Minister: I have the highest admiration for Barry ambulance station, having benefited from it this time last year. I shall never forget the outstanding service that I received. The figures that you quoted are quite right. I think that the Vale of Glamorgan is the third worst performer of the different health regions. The Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust as a whole has hit its target, just. It achieved 65.1 per cent, and the target is 65 per cent. Three areas are lagging well behind: Powys, Carmarthenshire and the Vale of Glamorgan.

While you can understand that in Powys and Carmarthenshire, as they are sprawling areas, it is less excusable in the Vale of Glamorgan, although it has a rural component. Jane Hutt and Llantwit Major councillors recently met the ambulance director for the Vale of Glamorgan to discuss the problem. However, the Vale of Glamorgan should be able to pick up its performance to provide a wonderful service—and not just to me but to the millions of others who live in the Vale.

The Leader of the Opposition (Nick Bourne): Good afternoon, First Minister. To return to the education theme, I want to ask

p.m.. Felly, gallaf ddeall y math o straen sydd arnynt, gan fod elfen yn gyffredin o ran mynd â'ch gwaith gartref gyda chi. Nid yw athrawon yn gadael eu gwaith ar ôl am 4 p.m. pan fyddant yn camu i'r car ac yn gyrru adref, fel y bydd rhai pobl yn credu. Mae'n alwedigaeth â straen, nid oes amheuaeth amdani, ac felly ceir elfen o orweithio a straen, a thrwy hynny mae penaethiaid a phobl eraill yn gorfod rheoli straen er mwyn sicrhau y caiff y math hwnnw o salwch ei leihau.

Chris Franks: Pa sicrwydd a roddwch o ran amseroedd ymateb ambiwlansys? Mae ffigurau diweddar wedi dangos mai prin hanner yr ambiwlansys a anfonir ar alwadau brys ym Mro Morgannwg sy'n cyrraedd o fewn y targed wyth munud. Fel y gwyddoch, mae uned damweiniau ac achosion brys ysbyty'r Barri yn cau tua 5 p.m., felly rhaid i gleifion brys deithio i Gaerdydd neu i Ben-y-bont ar Ogwr.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn edmygu gorsaf ambiwlans y Barri yn fawr, gan fy mod wedi cael budd ohoni yr adeg hon y llynedd. Ni wnaif byth anghofio'r gwasanaeth ardderchog a gefais. Mae'r ffigurau a ddyfynnwyd gennych yn ddigon cywir. Credaf mai Bro Morgannwg yw'r trydydd perfformiwr gwaethaf o'r gwahanol ranbarthau iechyd. Mae Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwllans Cymru ar y cyfan wedi taro'i tharged, ond cael a chael oedd hi. Cyflawnwyd 65.1 y cant, a'r targed yw 65 y cant. Mae tair ardal ymhell ar ei hôl hi, sef Powys, Sir Gaerfyrddin a Bro Morgannwg.

Er y gallwch ddeall hynny ym Mhowys ac yn sir Gaerfyrddin, am eu bod yn ardaloedd mor eang, ni ellir ei esgusodi i'r fath raddau ym Mro Morgannwg er bod elfen wledig yno. Yn ddiweddar, cyfarfu Jane Hutt a chynghorwyr Llanilltud Fawr gyda chyfarwyddwr ambiwlansys Bro Morgannwg i drafod y broblem. Fodd bynnag, dylai Bro Morgannwg allu gwella ei pherfformiad a darparu gwasanaeth gwyach—ac nid yn unig i mi, ond i'r miliynau o bobl eraill sy'n byw yn y Fro.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Nick Bourne): Prynawn da, Brif Weinidog. A dychwelyd at thema addysg, hoffwn ofyn am y cyfnod

about the foundation phase and the funding for it, given that there is clear concern about its underfunding. The foundation phase was an excellent idea—we included it in our manifesto, so we are wholly behind the idea—but we have a genuine concern about its funding. On your own figures, there is a £20 million shortfall over three years, but, on figures put forward by the teachers' unions, there is a shortfall of up to £100 million over three years. Where will you find the money to plug that gap, and when will you announce that you intend to plug that gap?

The First Minister: We believe that the roll-out in September will take place successfully, although there are six local authorities in Wales that have still not supplied us with the information on the numbers expected in the in-take, and we deprecate that practice. At the other end of the spectrum, we commend the six authorities of the 22 that have provided the information that we have asked for, which leaves 10 somewhere in the middle that have provided some information but not enough.

As regards budget bids for the other three years of the roll-out, 2009-10, 2010-11 and 2011-12, the better the information we have, the sooner we can solve the unknowns, which relate to pay levels, the number of learning support assistants in schools who are already dealing with the foundation phase age groups—not the three-year-olds, obviously, but the four, five and six-year-olds—and the number who are not available because they are covering special educational needs or raising attainment and individual standards in education in Wales programmes. There is a third unknown, which I have forgotten for the moment, but we require that information from local authorities if we are to get the budget right for 2009-10, 2010-11 and 2011-12.

Nick Bourne: I appreciate that there is a dispute about the shortfall, and I fully accept that it is the case that there are different sets of figures. However, I come back to the point that the First Minister did not address—or perhaps he is admitting that there is a

syllfaen a'r cyllid ar ei gyfer, ac ystyried y ceir pryder amlwg ynghylch y diffyg cyllid iddo. Yr oedd y cyfnod sylfaen yn syniad gwych—yr oedd wedi'i gynnwys yn ein manffesto, felly yr ydym yn cefnogi'r syniad yn llwyr—ond mae gennym bryder gwirioneddol ynglŷn â'i ariannu. Ar sail eich ffigurau eich hunain, ceir diffyg o £20 miliwn dros dair blynedd, ond, ar sail ffigurau a gyflwynwyd gan undebau'r athrawon, ceir diffyg o hyd at £100 miliwn dros dair blynedd. Ym mhle y dewch o hyd i'r arian i gau'r bwloch hwnnw, a pha bryd y byddwch yn cyhoeddi eich bod yn bwriadu cau'r bwloch hwnnw?

Y Prif Weinidog: Credwn y caiff y cynllun ei gyflwyno'n llwyddiannus ym mis Medi, er bod chwe awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru yn dal heb roi gwybodaeth inni ynghylch y niferoedd a ddisgwylir yn y mewnlif, ac nid ydym yn cymeradwyo'r arfer hwnnw. Ar ben arall y sbectrw, yr ydym yn cymeradwyo'r chwe awdurdod o'r 22 sydd wedi cyflwyno'r wybodaeth y gofynasom amdani, sy'n gadael 10 awdurdod rhywle yn y canol sydd wedi cyflwyno rhywfaint o wybodaeth, ond dim digon.

Ynghylch ceisiadau i'r gyllideb ar gyfer y tair blynedd arall, sef 2009-10, 2010-11 a 2011-12, gorau po fwyaf o wybodaeth sydd gennym o ran mynd ati'n gynt i ddatrys y materion anhysbys, sy'n ymwneud â lefelau cyflog, nifer y cynorthwywyr cymorth dysgu mewn ysgolion sydd eisoes yn delio â grwpiau oedran y cyfnod sylfaen—nid y plant tair oed, yn amlwg, ond y plant pedair, pump a chwech oed a'r nifer nad ydynt ar gael am eu bod yn ymdrin ag anghenion addysgol arbennig neu'n codi safonau cyrhaeddiad a safonau unigolion mewn rhaglenni addysg yng Nghymru. Ceir trydydd mater anhysbys, yr wyf wedi ei anghofio ar hyn o bryd, ond mae arnom angen y wybodaeth honno gan awdurdodau lleol os ydym am lunio cyllideb gywir ar gyfer 2009-10, 2010-11 a 2011-12.

Nick Bourne: Yr wyf yn gwerthfawrogi bod dadlau ynghylch y diffyg, ac yr wyf yn derbyn yn llwyr bod gwahanol setiau o ffigurau ar gael. Fodd bynnag, dychwelaf at y pwynt na roddodd y Prif Weinidog sylw iddo—neu efallai ei fod yn cyfaddef bod

shortfall. Even on his own figures, the amount that he is putting in this year rolled forward for the rest of the programme, we can see that more needs to be put in for the succeeding three years. Where will he find the money to make up that shortfall when that estimate is based on the most limited of figures, and so it could well be more than that? We are looking at a shortfall of £20 million, even on your figures. Where will that money come from?

The First Minister: The third unknown that I forgot a moment or two ago is the birth rate, which is rising. The 2007 figures, which came out just last week, of 34,500 births in Wales show a rise of 1,000 on the figures in 2006. They will be the children who come in during the second year that you are talking about. The issue, really, is this: until we can get an accurate estimate of the birth rate, the number of learning support assistants currently doing this work or currently employed but not available to do this kind of work, and the pay rate, local authorities will just have to give us their best estimates, and then it will be for Jane to make the budget bid, based on those best estimates. If the local authorities do not give Jane the bullets, she cannot fire the gun.

Nick Bourne: First Minister, I come back to the same point, although you have probably made my case for me. You have indicated a rise in the birth rate, which means more pupils in future, adding to the £20 million shortfall noted in the existing figures. The shortfall will be roughly in that ballpark although it may go slightly further afield—the teachers' union say that it is far more than that, but even accepting your budget figures it will be of the order of £20 million. I will ask you that question again. Where will you find the money to make up that shortfall? The £5 million that has been announced came out of the existing education budget. It was not new money for education; it was new money for this area. However, based on the most conservative estimates of the money needed, you will require an additional £20 million. Where will you get that from?

diffyg. Hyd yn oed ar sail ei ffigurau ei hun, sef y swm y bydd yn ei roi eleni a ddygwyd ymlaen o weddill y rhaglen, gallwn weld bod angen rhoi mwy i mewn ar gyfer y tair blynedd olynol. Ym mhle y bydd yn dod o hyd i'r arian i wneud iawn am y diffyg hwnnw, pan mae'r amcangyfrif hwnnw'n seiliedig ar ffigurau cyfyngedig iawn, ac felly mae'n ddigon posibl y bydd yn fwy na hynny? Yr ydym yn edrych ar ddiffyg o £20 miliwn, hyd yn oed ar sail eich ffigurau chi. O ble y daw'r arian hwnnw?

Y Prif Weinidog: Y trydydd mater anhysbys nad oeddwn yn ei gofio funud neu ddau yn ôl yw'r gyfradd geni, sy'n codi. Mae ffigurau 2007, a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos diwethaf, yn cynnwys 34,500 o enedigaethau yng Nghymru ac yn dangos cynnydd o 1,000 ers ffigurau 2006. Dyma'r plant yr ydych yn sôn amdanynt a ddaw'n rhan o'r cyfnod sylfaen yn ystod yr ail flwyddyn. Dyma'r mater, mewn gwirionedd: nes inni allu cael amcangyfrif cywir o'r gyfradd geni, nifer y cynorthwywyr cymorth dysgu sy'n gwneud y gwaith hwn ar hyn o bryd neu sy'n gyflogedig ar hyn o bryd ond nid ydynt ar gael i wneud y math hwn o waith, a chyfradd y cyflogau, bydd yn rhaid i awdurdodau lleol roi eu hamcangyfrifon gorau inni, ac yna bydd Jane yn llunio'r cais i'r gyllideb, ar sail yr amcangyfrifon gorau hynny. Os na ry'r awdurdodau lleol y bwledi i Jane, ni fydd yn bosibl iddi saethu'r gwn.

Nick Bourne: Brif Weinidog, dychwelaf at yr un pwynt, er y mae'n siŵr eich bod eisoes wedi dadlau fy achos drostaf. Yr ydych wedi sôn am gynnydd yn y gyfradd geni, sy'n golygu mwy o ddisgyblion yn y dyfodol, gan ychwanegu at y diffyg o £20 miliwn a nodwyd yn y ffigurau presennol. Oddeutu hynny fydd y diffyg yn fras, ond mae'n bosibl y bydd fymryn yn wahanol—yn ôl undeb yr athrawon, mae'n fwy na hynny o lawer, ond hyd yn oed os derbyniwn ffigurau eich cyllideb, bydd yn agos at £20 miliwn. Gofynnaf y cwestiwn hwnnw ichi unwaith eto. Ym mhle y dewch o hyd i'r arian i wneud iawn am y diffyg hwnnw? Daeth y £5 miliwn a gyhoeddwyd o'r gyllideb addysg bresennol. Nid arian newydd ar gyfer addysg ydoedd, arian newydd i'r maes hwn ydoedd. Fodd bynnag, ar sail yr amcangyfrifon mwyaf ceidwadol o'r arian angenrheidiol,

bydd arnoch angen £20 miliwn ychwanegol. O ble y cewch yr arian hwnnw?

The First Minister: A budget bid will be made by Jane Hutt, Edwina Hart, Brian Gibbons and all the Ministers. It will be for the spend during the academic year 2009-10 in Jane's case, and for roughly the same period for the other spending Ministers, too. The stronger their budget bid, the better chance they have of succeeding. At the moment, we are short of information along the lines that I have outlined, but I am pleased to have this avenue to tell those local authorities that are hanging back that if they do not provide the Minister for education with the information to enable her to draw up a carefully costed estimate of the costs of the foundation phase for 2009-10, 2010-11 and 2011-12, how can she be expected to persuade the Minister for Finance and Public Service Delivery to agree to her bid for more resources? She will not know the true figure without the information being supplied by local authorities. We hope that, over the next few weeks, they will understand this principle: if they give Jane Hutt the bullets to fire, she will fire them, and then she will be able to put in the best possible budget bid.

Y Prif Weinidog: Caiff cais i'r gyllideb ei lunio gan Jane Hutt, Edwina Hart, Brian Gibbons a'r holl Weinidogion. Bydd yn ymdrin â'r gwariant yn ystod blwyddyn academaidd 2009-10 yn achos Jane, a'r un cyfnod yn fras ar gyfer y Gweinidogion eraill sy'n gyfrifol am wario hefyd. Po gryfaf yw eu cais i'r gyllideb, y gorau fydd eu siawns o lwyddo. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r wybodaeth sydd gennym am yr hyn a amlinellwyd gennyf yn brin, ond yr wyf yn falch o gael y cyfrwng hwn i ddweud wrth yr awdurdodau lleol hynny sy'n dal yn ôl, os na fyddant yn cyflwyno'r wybodaeth i'r Gweinidog dros addysg i'w galluogi i lunio amcangyfrif sydd wedi'i gostio'n ofalus o gostau'r cyfnod sylfaen ar gyfer 2009-10, 2010-11 a 2011-12, sut y gellir disgwyl iddi berswadio'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid a Chyflenwi Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus i gytuno â'i chais am fwy o adnoddau? Ni fydd yn gwybod y ffigur cywir heb i awdurdodau lleol gyflwyno'r wybodaeth. Gobeithiwn y byddant, dros yr wythnosau nesaf, yn deall yr egwyddor hon: os rhônt y bwledi i Jane Hutt eu tanio, bydd hithau'n eu tanio, ac yna bydd modd iddi gyflwyno'r cais gorau posibl i'r gyllideb.

2.20 p.m.

Economic Priorities

Q4 Nick Ramsay: Will the First Minister outline his economic priorities for the next six months? OAQ(3)1136(FM)

The First Minister: They will be to press ahead with the defence training academy at St Athan, assisting in the massive build-up of employment opportunities at the Amazon development east of Swansea, and boosting Welsh exports and the health of Welsh manufacturers in the eurozone to take advantage of the opportunity presented to Welsh business by the change in exchange rates.

Nick Ramsay: To pick up on the last part of your answer, where you mentioned funding from the eurozone, I have been reading your letter in today's *Western Mail* regarding the

Blaenoriaethau Economaidd

C4 Nick Ramsay: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog amlinellu ei flaenoriaethau economaidd ar gyfer y chwe mis nesaf? OAQ(3)1136(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Y blaenoriaethau fydd bwrw ymlaen â'r academi hyfforddiant amddiffyn yn Sain Tathan, cynorthwyo gyda'r cynnydd anferth mewn cyfleoedd cyflogaeth yn y datblygiad Amazon i'r dwyrain o Abertawe, a hybu allforion o Gymru ac iechyd gweithgynhyrchwyr o Gymru yn Ardal yr Ewro er mwyn manteisio ar y cyfle a gyflwynir i fusnesau o Gymru yn sgil y newid yn y cyfraddau cyfnewid.

Nick Ramsay: A chydio yn rhan olaf eich ateb, lle soniasoch am gyllid o Ardal yr Ewro, bûm yn darllen eich llythyr yn y *Western Mail* heddiw ynglŷn â'r arian

£40 million windfall, over which there seems to have been some confusion, according to your letter. Can you clarify the position on that? Can we expect that the bulk of that £40 million funding will be used for the benefit of people living in Wales, as you say in your letter? Do you stand by your comment that the journalist who was peddling the story requires a 'reality check'? It seems to me that this area has been open to confusion, so can you tell us today whether that money will be spent?

The First Minister: You said that there is some confusion, but that confusion was sown by a journalist not present. I hope that I made the position clear this morning, because the tenor of his story was that we had run out of match funding and, therefore, could not use the £40 million and would have to send it back, whereas I said the opposite of that. I said that we would not be approving stretch projects using schemes that had worked fairly well and where we knew that the structure was still in place just because they had had match funding, but that we would be looking for projects that might be short of match funding but which represented the best strategic capacity for assisting the Welsh economy. We would then have to try to find the match funding, because we could not expect an ordinary sponsor to have had match funding in mind that it did not realise that it would need until we told it that we had an extra £40 million available and suggested that we try to use it.

David Lloyd: Hoffwn groesawu amcanion grŵp cynghori'r Gweinidog i sicrhau bod Cymru ar flaen y gad wrth fanteisio ar dueddiadau newydd yn y farchnad lafur yn ogystal ag ar dechnoleg newydd. Un o amcanion y grŵp cynghori fydd gwneud argymhellion ar ynni. Yn deillio o hynny, Brif Weinidog, gydag ynni a phrisiau ynni yn effeithio cymaint ar ein bywydau, a ydych yn cytuno y dylai pwerau dros brosiectau ynni dros 50MW gael eu trosglwyddo i'r Cynulliad?

annisgwyl gwerth £40 miliwn, arian y bu rhywfaint o ddryswch yn ei gylch, yn ôl eich llythyr. A allwch egluro'r sefyllfa ynghylch hynny? A allwn ddisgwyl y caiff swmp o'r cyllid £40 miliwn hwnnw ei ddefnyddio er budd pobl sy'n byw yng Nghymru, fel y dywedwch yn eich llythyr? A ydych yn glynu wrth eich sylw bod angen atgoffa'r newyddiadurwr a fu'n gwerthu'r stori am realiti'r sefyllfa? Ymddengys i mi fod y maes hwn wedi bod yn agored i ddryswch, felly a allwch ddweud wrthym heddiw a gaiff yr arian hwnnw ei wario?

Y Prif Weinidog: Dywedasoeh fod rhywfaint o ddryswch, ond heuwyd y dryswch hwnnw gan newyddiadurwr nad yw'n bresennol. Gobeithiaf fy mod wedi egluro'r sefyllfa'n glir y bore yma, oherwydd swm a sylwedd ei stori oedd ein bod wedi mynd yn brin o arian cyfatebol ac, felly, ni allem wario'r £40 miliwn a byddai'n rhaid inni ei anfon yn ôl, ond yr oedd yr hyn a ddywedais yn gwbl groes i hynny. Dywedais na fyddem yn cymeradwyo prosiectau ymestyn sy'n defnyddio cynlluniau a oedd wedi gweithio'n weddol dda a lle y gwyddem fod y strwythur yn dal ar waith dim ond am eu bod wedi cael arian cyfatebol, ond y byddem yn chwilio am brosiectau sydd efallai'n brin o arian cyfatebol ond yn cynrychioli'r gallu strategol gorau ar gyfer cynorthwyo economi Cymru. Yna, byddai'n rhaid inni geisio dod o hyd i'r arian cyfatebol, oherwydd ni allem ddisgwyl bod noddwr cyffredin wedi bod yn meddwl am arian cyfatebol, nad oedd yn sylweddoli y byddai arno ei angen, nes inni ddweud wrtho fod gennym £40 miliwn ychwanegol ar gael ac yn awgrymu y byddwn yn ceisio'i ddefnyddio.

David Lloyd: I would like to welcome the aims of the ministerial advisory group in ensuring that Wales is in the vanguard in terms of benefiting from new trends in the labour markets and from new technologies. One of the aims of the advisory group will be to make recommendations on energy. Following on from that, First Minister, given that energy and energy prices are having such an impact on our lives, do you agree that powers over energy projects of more than 50MW should be transferred to the Assembly?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae hynny'n parhau i fod yn ddyhead gennym, ond, fel y gwyddoch, yr ydym wedi bod yn cael ein bwrw yn ôl gan ystyfnigrwydd Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig ers chwe blynedd, er mai Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig a gynigiodd y syniad i ni yn y lle cyntaf yn ystod y stŵr mawr ynglŷn â fferm wynt Cefn Croes. Yn y cyfamser, mae cwestiwn mawr ynni niwclear wedi codi, ac mae Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig yn ofni rhyddhau'r pwerau sy'n rhoi'r gallu iddi wneud y Gorchmynion y mae'n credu sydd eu hangen o ran ynni niwclear.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): I will come back to the European matter in a moment, but I want to ask you about the green jobs strategy. Your Minister with responsibility for economic development has written to me today, saying that information on how many green jobs there are in Wales:

'is not presently available in a consistent format'.

He also said that the consultation later this year will work out whether you can find the data to find out how many green jobs there are in Wales. Will we have to wait until later in the year before we have even a starting point as to how we can progress green jobs in Wales? How long will it be before we are able to take action based on a green jobs strategy?

The First Minister: I do not think that we have to wait for a green jobs strategy for the statisticians to be able to say that they have a block of Government statistics that is sufficiently clear and sufficiently widely accepted for them to honestly say that they are up to the usual standard for Government statistics. I received the same briefing as the Deputy First Minister from our statisticians saying that this is very difficult. No-one has tried to define green jobs before. We will define them, but we do not have to hold up the whole programme because of that.

The First Minister: That continues to be our aspiration but, as you know, we have been rebuffed by the stubbornness of the United Kingdom Government over a period of six years, even though it was the United Kingdom Government that proposed the idea to us in the first place during the great Cefn Croes windfarm controversy. In the meantime, the question of nuclear energy has come up, and the United Kingdom Government is fearful of releasing the powers that will enable it to make the Orders that it believes are required in terms of nuclear energy.

Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): Byddaf yn ailgydio yn y mater Ewropeaidd yn y man, ond hoffwn ofyn ichi am y strategaeth swyddi gwyrdd. Ysgrifennodd eich Gweinidog â chyfrifoldeb dros ddatblygiad economaidd ataf heddiw, gan ddweud nad yw gwybodaeth am faint o swyddi gwyrdd a geir yng Nghymru:

ar gael ar hyn o bryd ar ffurf gyson.

Hefyd, dywedodd y bydd yr ymgynghoriad yn nes ymlaen eleni yn canfod pa un ai allwch ddod o hyd i'r data i wybod faint o swyddi gwyrdd a geir yng Nghymru. A fydd yn rhaid inni aros tan yn nes ymlaen yn y flwyddyn cyn inni gael man cychwyn, hyd yn oed, o ran sut y gallwn symud swyddi gwyrdd ymlaen yng Nghymru? Faint o amser y bydd yn rhaid inni ddisgwyl cyn y gallwn weithredu ar sail strategaeth swyddi gwyrdd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni chredaf fod yn rhaid inni aros am strategaeth swyddi gwyrdd nes bo'r ystadegwyr yn dweud bod ganddynt bloc o ystadegau'r Llywodraeth sy'n ddigon clir ac wedi'u derbyn yn ddigon eang iddynt ddweud yn onest eu bod yn cyrraedd y safon arferol ar gyfer ystadegau'r Llywodraeth. Rhoddwyd yr un wybodaeth imi ag a roddwyd i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog gan ein hystadegwyr yn dweud bod hyn yn anodd iawn. Nid oes neb wedi ceisio diffinio swyddi gwyrdd o'r blaen. Awn ati i'w diffinio, ond nid oes yn rhaid inni ddal y rhaglen gyfan yn ôl oherwydd hynny.

Michael German: Two years ago to this month, Labour AMs voted against a green jobs strategy. I am pleased that it is going to happen, although it is late. In that motion two years ago, it was suggested that you might want to look at the way things have been done in Scotland, where a strategy has been running for more than two years and where they have defined green jobs, and how they should be measured.

If we are going to have to wait two years to get a strategy in place, and then another year into the programme to calculate the base level, we are not going to make the striking start that will benefit the carbon footprint of Wales in a crucial area. Can you guarantee that action will be taken in the next 12 months?

The First Minister: I was saying precisely the opposite of what you have just claimed—I said that you would not have to wait until you have solved the statistical conundrums in relation to the definition of what is and what is not a green job before you can have a strategy in place. We can all pick figures out of the air, as well as projects, schemes and companies that employ people in green jobs, be it one, 100 or 1,000 jobs, but we want to know whether we have a set of rock-solid statistics that everybody finds acceptable. However, you do not have to wait for that statistical work to be done before you can engage in a strategy for expanding the number of green jobs.

Michael German: If you do not know what it is that you are measuring, you will not know whether you have been successful in improving the situation. That is the point that I am trying to make. Is it not the same as your targets for affordable homes? There are no published figures for those targets, and no-one can tell us how many affordable homes have been built this year by this Government.

The First Minister: You can argue that you should do nothing until you have agreement on the statistical definition of green jobs to

Michael German: Ddwy flynedd yn ôl i'r mis yma, pleidleisiodd aelodau Llafur y Cynulliad yn erbyn strategaeth swyddi gwyrdd. Yr wyf yn falch ei fod yn mynd i ddigwydd, er ei fod braidd yn hwyr. Yn y cynnig hwnnw ddwy flynedd yn ôl, awgrymwyd y byddech efallai'n awyddus i edrych ar y ffordd y gwnaethpwyd pethau yn yr Alban, lle mae strategaeth wedi bod ar waith ers mwy na dwy flynedd a lle y maent wedi diffinio swyddi gwyrdd, a sut y dylid eu mesur.

Os bydd yn rhaid inni aros am ddwy flynedd cyn cael strategaeth ar waith, ac yna blwyddyn arall yn y rhaglen i gyfrifo'r lefel sylfaen, nid ydym yn mynd i sicrhau'r dechrau trawiadol a fydd o fudd i ôl-troed carbon Cymru mewn ardal hollbwysig. A allwch warantu y caiff camau gweithredu eu cymryd yn ystod y 12 mis nesaf?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr oeddwn yn dadlau'r i'r gwrthwyneb yn union i'r hyn yr ydych newydd ei honni—dywedais na fyddai'n rhaid ichi aros nes ichi ddatrys y posau ystadegol yng nghyswllt diffiniad beth sy'n swydd werdd a beth nad yw'n swydd werdd cyn y gallwch roi strategaeth ar waith. Gall pob un ohonom enwi ffigurau ar hap, yn ogystal â phrosiectau, cynlluniau a chwmnïau sy'n cyflogi pobl mewn swyddi gwyrdd, pa un ai un, 100 ynteu 1,000 o swyddi yw hynny, ond mae arnom eisiau gwybod a oes gennym set o ystadegau cadarn y mae pawb yn eu hystyried yn dderbyniol. Fodd bynnag, nid oes yn rhaid ichi aros i'r gwaith ystadegol hwnnw gael ei gwblhau cyn y gallwch arddel strategaeth ar gyfer cynyddu nifer y swyddi gwyrdd.

Michael German: Os na wyddoch beth yr ydych yn ei fesur, ni fyddwch yn gwybod a ydych wedi gwella'r sefyllfa'n llwyddiannus. Dyna'r pwynt yr wyf yn ceisio'i wneud. Onid yw'r un fath â'ch targedau ar gyfer cartrefi fforddiadwy? Nid oes ffigurau wedi'u cyhoeddi ar gyfer y targedau hynny, ac ni all neb ddweud wrthym faint o gartrefi fforddiadwy a adeiladwyd eleni gan y Llywodraeth hon.

Y Prif Weinidog: Gallwch ddadlau na ddylech wneud dim nes ichi gael cytundeb ynghylch y diffiniad ystadegol o swyddi

the satisfaction of the Statistics Commission, which runs the rule over what are good, poor or indifferent Government figures. In my view, you do not have to wait to do that. We will have arguments over what the baseline is, and you will be able to argue that we have set the baseline too high to make the figures look good, or too low to make the expansion look good—we will have those arguments—but I do not believe that we should wait until we have a rock-solid set of statistics, as good as the usual statistics that you would expect from the Government.

Employment Security

Q5 Jonathan Morgan: Will the First Minister make a statement about the employment security of those employed by the Welsh Assembly Government and its executive agencies? OAQ(3)1143(FM)

The First Minister: Efficiency savings are a way of life, and have been since 1999-2000, particularly in the current difficult financial climate. However, we have a good record during mergers and other such moves in ensuring that we give an enormous amount of assistance to people during periods of change, and, wherever possible, we try to avoid making people redundant because their jobs have disappeared.

Jonathan Morgan: Your statement is news to me, because I understand that the Minister for Health and Social Services has already confirmed in a meeting with the chair of the local health boards that there will be no job losses as a result of the restructuring of the national health service. We have applauded a move away from the 22 local health boards, but it is inconceivable for the Welsh Assembly Government to be able to give a commitment that there will be no job losses at all. Are you able to say categorically that there will be no job losses from the local health boards, or the NHS trusts, as a result of the reorganisation plan?

The First Minister: I said the same thing in reply to Helen Mary Jones's question last week. You have said for a long period that

gwyrd sy'n bodloni'r Comisiwn Ystadegau, sef y corff sy'n penderfynu pa ffigurau'r Llywodraeth sy'n dda, yn wael neu'n ddifater. Yn fy marn i, nid oes yn rhaid ichi aros cyn gwneud hynny. Ceir dadleuon ynghylch beth yw'r man cychwyn, a bydd modd ichi ddadlau ein bod wedi pennu man cychwyn sy'n rhy uchel i beri i'r ffigurau edrych yn dda, neu'n rhy isel i beri i'r ehangiad edrych yn dda—bydd y dadleuon hynny'n codi—ond ni chredaf y dylem aros nes bod gennym set gadarn o ystadegau, sydd gystal â'r safonau arferol y byddech yn eu disgwyl gan y Llywodraeth.

Diogelwch Swyddi

C5 Jonathan Morgan: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ddiogelwch cyflogaeth y sawl a gyflogir gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'i hasiantaethau gweithredol? OAQ(3)1143(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae arbedion effeithlonrwydd yn rhan annatod o fywyd, ac mae hynny'n wir er 1999-2000, yn enwedig yn yr hinsawdd ariannol anodd bresennol. Fodd bynnag, yn ystod uno cwmnïau a newidiadau o'r fath, mae gennym enw da am sicrhau ein bod yn rhoi lefel anferth o gymorth i bobl yn ystod cyfnodau o newid, a phan fydd modd, byddwn yn ceisio osgoi peri i bobl golli eu swyddi am fod eu swyddi wedi diflannu.

Jonathan Morgan: Mae eich datganiad yn newydd imi, oherwydd yr wyf ar ddeall bod y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol eisoes wedi cadarnhau mewn cyfarfod gyda chadeirydd y byrddau iechyd lleol na fydd swyddi'n cael eu colli yn sgil ailstrwythuro'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Yr ydym wedi cymeradwyo symud oddi wrth y 22 bwrdd iechyd lleol, ond ni ellir amgyffred y gallai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru roi ymrwymiad na chaiff yr un swydd ei cholli o gwbl. A allwch ddweud yn bendant na chaiff yr un swydd ei cholli yn y byrddau iechyd lleol, neu ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG, yn sgil y cynllun ad-drefnu?

Y Prif Weinidog: Dywedais yr un peth wrth ateb cwestiwn Helen Mary Jones yr wythnos diwethaf. Yr ydych wedi dweud ers cryn

the plan for 22 local health boards was a high-cost option. If it had been, you could have expected major efficiency savings in significantly reducing the number of boards. However, as I said last week, it is not a high-cost option, because we have not had 22 chief executives, 22 finance directors, 22 medical directors and 22 heads of human resources—we have used groupings of those personnel. Therefore, when you reduce the number of local health boards, it does not necessarily mean that there will be a large amount of efficiency savings. That is not to say that you can guarantee that there will never be any redundancies. What we have done is to ensure that we can recycle people, and use natural wastage to protect people from being made redundant when their jobs cease to exist.

Joyce Watson: Last year, the Welsh Assembly Government signed a groundbreaking social partnership agreement with the Wales Trades Union Congress, NHS Wales, the Welsh Local Government Association and others in the wider devolved public services.

2.30 p.m.

The agreement refers to placing the workforce at the centre of the public service agenda and discusses job continuity, job security and fair pay systems. What does this agreement mean for those employed by the Welsh Assembly Government and for other stakeholders in Wales?

The First Minister: You are certainly right about the principle of empowering the staff to have a greater ability to plan their own jobs and make a bigger contribution. That is part of it, but it also relates to the answer that I gave earlier to Jonathan on the points that he referred to, which Edwina has made before now, in relation to forthcoming changes and whatever shape they finally take in health.

We always try to have a central postings pool. We will have a freeze on recruitment, and we will offer retraining possibilities for

amser bod y cynllun ar gyfer 22 bwrdd iechyd lleol yn ddewis cost uchel. Petasai'n ddewis cost uchel, gallasech ddisgwyl arbedion effeithlonrwydd sylweddol yn sgil lleihau nifer y byrddau yn sylweddol. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais yr wythnos diwethaf, nid yw'n ddewis cost uchel, oherwydd ni fu gennym 22 prif weithredwr, 22 cyfarwyddwr cyllid, 22 cyfarwyddwr meddygol na 22 pennaeth adnoddau dynol—yr ydym wedi defnyddio grwpiau o weithwyr yn y swyddi hynny. Felly, pan fyddwch yn lleihau nifer y byrddau iechyd lleol, nid yw o reidrwydd yn golygu y ceir nifer uchel o arbedion effeithlonrwydd. Ni olyga hynny y gallwch warantu na chaiff unrhyw swyddi eu colli o gwbl. Yr hyn yr ydym wedi'i wneud yw sicrhau y gallwn ailgylchu pobl, a defnyddio gwastraff naturiol i ddiogelu pobl rhag colli eu swyddi pan fydd eu swyddi'n peidio â bodoli.

Joyce Watson: Y llynedd, arwyddodd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gytundeb partneriaeth gymdeithasol arloesol gyda Chyngres Undebau Llafur Cymru, GIG Cymru, Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru a chyrrff eraill yn y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus datganoledig.

Mae'r cytundeb yn cyfeirio at roi'r gweithlu wrth galon yr agenda gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ac mae'n trafod parhad swyddi, diogelwch swyddi a systemau cyflog teg. Beth mae'r cytundeb hwn yn ei olygu i'r rhai sy'n cael eu cyflogi gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ac i randdeiliaid eraill yng Nghymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych yn sicr yn iawn am yr egwyddor o rymuso'r staff i gael mwy o allu i gynllunio eu swyddi eu hunain ac i wneud mwy o gyfraniad. Mae hynny'n rhan ohono, ond mae a wnelo hefyd â'r ateb a roddais yn gynharach i Jonathan ynglŷn â'r pwyntiau y cyfeiriodd atynt, y mae Edwina wedi eu gwneud cyn hyn, mewn perthynas â'r newidiadau sydd yn yr arfaeth a beth fydd eu ffurf yn y pen draw ym maes iechyd.

Yr ydym bob amser yn ceisio cael pwll canolog ar gyfer penodiadau. Byddwn yn atal recriwtio, a byddwn yn cynnig cyfleoedd

anyone whose job becomes redundant, because that does not mean that the human being doing the job must become redundant; people can be retrained to do another job or given good access to vacancies arising elsewhere in a large organisation.

ailhyfforddi i unrhyw un y mae ei swydd yn diflannu, oherwydd nid yw hynny'n golygu na all y sawl sy'n gwneud y swydd fod o ddefnydd; mae modd ailhyfforddi pobl i wneud swydd arall neu roi mynediad da iddynt at swyddi gweigion sy'n codi mewn mannau eraill mewn sefydliad mawr.

Flexsys

Q6 Janet Ryder: Will the First Minister make a statement regarding the future of Cefn-Mawr and the surrounding area in light of the Flexsys plant closure? OAQ(3)1157(FM)

The First Minister: You will be aware that chemical operations involving mainly phenol production have been undertaken at Flexsys for more than 100 years. For the next two years, the company has a contractual obligation to provide electricity and other site services to co-producers on site. We will assist the company and the employees during that time, and we will look at the future of the Cefn-Mawr operations in due course.

Janet Ryder: I have met with the Flexsys workers and union representatives, as has Ieuan Wyn Jones, to discuss alternatives for the workforce and the community. It is a chemical works site, and it needs to be cleaned up by the company so that it can be returned to community use. It has enormous potential; it is a 30 ha piece of land on the doorstep of a world heritage site at Froncysyllte. Do you agree that, although the company must be responsible for cleaning the site, the Assembly Government also has a central part to play in regenerating the area?

The First Minister: Yes, I think that you have described the situation accurately. There is no question in our mind that it is always the company that decides that it is going to terminate operations at a particular site that has the job of putting the site back into a fit state for any subsequent operations. Our officials are in ongoing discussions with Flexsys, Wrexham County Borough Council and the Environment Agency in north Wales to establish the exact facts on liability for clean-up operations for all of the previous

Flexsys

C6 Janet Ryder: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ddyfodol Cefn-Mawr a'r ardal gyfagos yng ngoleuni cau safle Flexsys? OAQ(3)1157(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Byddwch yn ymwybodol fod gweithrediadau cemegol sy'n cynnwys cynhyrchu ffenol yn bennaf wedi mynd rhagddynt yn Flexsys am dros 100 mlynedd. Am y ddwy flynedd nesaf, mae gan y cwmni ddyletswydd o dan gontract i ddarparu trydan a gwasanaethau safle eraill i gydgyhyrchwyr ar y safle. Byddwn yn helpu'r cwmni a'r gweithwyr yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw, a byddwn yn edrych ar ddyfodol busnesau Cefn-Mawr maes o law.

Janet Ryder: Yr wyf wedi cwrdd â gweithwyr Flexsys a'r cynrychiolwyr undeb, fel y gwnaeth Ieuan Wyn Jones, i drafod opsiynau amgen i'r gweithlu a'r gymuned. Safle gwaith cemegol ydyw, ac mae angen iddo gael ei lanhau gan y cwmni fel bod modd aildechrau ei ddefnyddio er budd y gymuned. Mae iddo botensial enfawr; mae'n ddarn 30 ha o dir yn agos iawn at safle treftadaeth byd Froncysyllte. A ydych yn cytuno, er ei bod yn rhaid i'r cwmni fod yn gyfrifol am lanhau'r safle, fod gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad hefyd ran ganolog i'w chwarae yn y gwaith o adfywio'r ardal?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ydwyf, credaf eich bod wedi disgrifio'r sefyllfa'n gywir. Yr ydym yn glir ein meddyliau mai'r cwmni sy'n penderfynu ei fod yn mynd i roi'r gorau i'w weithrediadau ar safle neilltuol sydd bob amser yn gyfrifol am adfer y safle i gyflwr addas ar gyfer unrhyw weithrediadau dilynol. Mae ein swyddogion yn dal i drafod gyda Flexsys, Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Wrecsam ac Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yng ngogledd Cymru i sefydlu'r union ffeithiau o ran atebolrwydd am y gweithrediadau glannau

site activities.

Mark Isherwood: Three weeks ago, I raised concerns about job losses, including those at Flexsys, with you in the Chamber. You accused me of being guilty of a ruthless search for bad news in the newspapers. Therefore, how do you respond to the following Flexsys employee who is being made unemployed? He e-mailed me and said that production started in 1867 and that the company has been a major employer ever since. He said that he feels that the impact on the community, when the site closes, will be devastating and that a lack of well-paid jobs and high property prices mean that many people will be unable to stay in the area. He went on to say that anything that you could do about the situation would be greatly appreciated. What assurance would you give to such people, given the concerns that he raised?

The First Minister: There is never a good time to lose your job. However, relatively speaking, there is a slightly less bad time to lose your job; employment in Wales is at a record high and employment in north-east Wales is at a reasonably healthy level compared with other parts of Wales. On that relative scale of how painful it will be to find other jobs, currently, if you are made unemployed in Wrexham through the closure of the company's operations, your chances of getting another job are not as bad as they would have been 20 or 10 years ago. It is not going to be easy placing people who may have specialist skills in chemicals and so on, but, on the other hand, we have a reasonably buoyant labour market situation in north-east Wales. That makes it not as bad, although it does not make it good.

Eleanor Burnham: To follow on from that, I appreciate that you are trying to do your best, but how much Welsh Assembly Government funding is going into the area? After all, we know that the Wrexham authority, like all local authorities, is under extreme financial pressure. How much money are you giving, and are you hopeful that these people will find other employment, because there are

yng nghyswllt yr holl weithgareddau blaenorol ar y safle.

Mark Isherwood: Dair wythnos yn ôl, codais pryderon ynglŷn â cholledion swyddi, yn cynnwys y rhai yn Flexsys, gyda chi yn y Siambr. Cyhuddasoch fi o fod yn euog o chwilio'n ddiostur am newyddion drwg yn y papurau newydd. Felly, sut ydych chi'n ymateb i'r gweithiwr canlynol o Flexsys sy'n cael ei wneud yn ddi-waith? Anfonodd e-bost ataf a dywedodd i'r gwaith cynhyrchu ddechrau yn 1867 a bod y cwmni wedi bod yn gyflogwr o bwys ers hynny. Dywed ei fod o'r farn y bydd yr effaith ar y gymuned, pan fydd y safle'n cau, yn niweidiol ofnadwy a bod diffyg swyddi â chyflogau da a phrisiau eiddo uchel yn golygu na fydd llawer o bobl yn medru aros yn yr ardal. Aeth yn ei flaen i ddweud y byddai unrhyw beth y gallech ei wneud ynglŷn â'r sefyllfa'n cael ei werthfawrogi'n fawr. Pa sicrwydd fydddech chi'n ei roi i bobl o'r fath, ac ystyried y pryderon a gododd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oes byth amser da i golli eich swydd. Fodd bynnag, yn gymharol, mae amser ychydig llai drwg i golli eich swydd; mae cyflogaeth yng Nghymru yn uwch nag y bu erioed ac mae cyflogaeth yng ngogledd-ddwyrain Cymru ar lefel gymharol iach o'i chymharu â rhannau eraill o Gymru. Ar y raddfa gymharol honno o ba mor boenus y bydd hi i ddod o hyd i swyddi eraill, ar hyn o bryd, os collwch chi eich swydd yn Wrecsam am fod eich cwmni'n rhoi'r gorau i'w weithrediadau, nid yw eich gobaith o gael swydd arall cynddrwg ag yr oedd 20 neu 10 mlynedd yn ôl. Ni fydd yn hawdd lleoli pobl sydd â sgiliau arbenigol ym maes cemegau ac ati, ond, ar y llaw arall, mae gennym farchnad lafur weddol fywiog yng ngogledd-ddwyrain Cymru. Mae hynny'n golygu nad yw cynddrwg, er nad yw'n golygu ei bod yn dda.

Eleanor Burnham: I ddilyn o hynny, yr wyf yn gwerthfawrogi eich bod yn ceisio gwneud eich gorau, ond faint o gyllid gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru sy'n mynd i'r ardal? Wedi'r cyfan, gwyddom fod awdurdod Wrecsam, fel pob awdurdod lleol, o dan bwysau ariannol eithriadol. Faint o arian ydych chi'n ei roi, ac a ydych yn obeithiol y gwnaiff y bobl hyn ganfod gwaith arall,

other issues to do with other companies in the area? In view of the increased price of fuel, there is a huge extra burden placed on people if they have to travel out of the area for new jobs.

The First Minister: There are different levels of buoyancy, in terms of employment levels, in different labour markets in Wales. The Wrexham and Flintshire area is reasonably buoyant in comparison with most parts of Wales and most experience over the past 20 years or so. In terms of money being put in, Wrexham and Cefn-Mawr are not in an assisted area. On the other hand, they are fairly close to the assisted area and opportunities will arise in that regard. Also, in the areas nearby that are assisted there is a lot of new investment being made, such as in Flintshire and other areas, like St Asaph, which are not too far away. Wrexham has a fair level of low unemployment and all of the symptoms of low unemployment, with people from eastern Europe coming in to take up jobs that local people do not want.

Cysylltiad Band Eang

C7 Alun Ffred Jones: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am yr hyn y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n ei wneud i sicrhau cysylltiad band eang cadarn drwy Gymru wledig? OAQ(3)1137(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn cydnabod bod ardaloedd yng nghefn gwlad Cymru lle nad oes band eang ar gael ar hyn o bryd. Ni wn beth yw'r Gymraeg am 'not spot'; tybed ai 'man gwan' neu 'gwan fan' fyddai'r term. Yr ydym yn cydweithio â'r rheolydd cyfathrebu, Ofcom, a'r diwydiant cyfathrebu i geisio gwael gared ar y rhwystrau, ac yn bwriadu cynnal proses gaffael ledled Cymru i ymdrin â'r broblem.

Alun Ffred Jones: Ers imi wneud fy sylwadau am y sefyllfa hon yn y papur newydd yn ddiweddar, mae ugeiniau o etholwyr, ynghyd â phobl y tu allan i'r etholaeth, wedi cysylltu â mi. Soniwch am y manau gwan, ond 'manau dim byd' ydynt mewn gwirionedd. Nid yn unig y lleoedd

oherwydd mae problemau'n ymwneud â chwmnïau eraill yn yr ardal? Ac ystyried pris uwch tanwydd, mae baich ychwanegol enfawr ar bobl os ydynt yn gorfod teithio o'r ardal i gael swyddi newydd.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae gwahanol lefelau o fywiogrwydd, o safbwynt lefelau cyflogaeth, mewn gwahanol farchnadoedd llafur yng Nghymru. Mae ardal Wrecsam a sir y Fflint yn weddol fywiog o'i chymharu â'r rhan fwyaf o rannau o Gymru a'r rhan fwyaf o brofiadau dros yr 20 mlynedd diwethaf yn fras. O safbwynt yr arian sy'n cael ei ddarparu, nid yw Wrecsam a Cefn-Mawr mewn ardal a gynorthwyr. Ar y llaw arall, maent yn weddol agos at yr ardal a gynorthwyr a'r cyfleoedd a fydd yn codi yn y cyswllt hwnnw. Hefyd, yn yr ardaloedd cyfagos sy'n cael cymorth, mae llawer o fuddsoddi newydd yn mynd rhagddo, megis yn sir y Fflint ac ardaloedd eraill, fel Llanelwy, nad ydynt yn rhy bell i ffwrdd. Mae gan Wrecsam lefel weddol isel o ddiweithdra a holl symptomau diweithdra isel, gyda phobl o ddwyrain Ewrop yn dod i mewn i gymryd swyddi nad yw'r bobl leol am eu cael.

Broadband Connection

Q7 Alun Ffred Jones: Will the First Minister make a statement on what the Welsh Assembly Government is doing to ensure broadband connection in rural Wales? OAQ(3)1137(FM)

The First Minister: I recognise that there are areas in rural Wales where broadband is currently unavailable. I am not sure of the Welsh term for 'not spot'; perhaps it is 'man gwan' or 'gwan fan'. We are working with the communications regulator, Ofcom, and the communications industry to try to overcome the barriers, and we are planning a Wales-wide procurement process to tackle the problem.

Alun Ffred Jones: Since I made comments about this situation in the newspaper recently, scores of constituents and people from outside the constituency have contacted me. You referred to these areas as weak spots—*manau gwan*—but they are actually areas where there is no broadband at all. It is not

hynny y gwyddom nad oes ganddynt gyswllt band eang yw'r broblem, ond y rheiny lle ceir cyswllt band eang gwael. Er bod pobl yn talu am y gwasanaeth, mae'n torri i lawr neu'n methu â gweithio o gwbl. A dderbyniwch fod methu â chael cysylltiad band eang mewn llawer o bentrefi—ac nid ym mhellafoedd cefn gwlad, ond mewn ardaloedd megis Arfon gyda'i hen bentrefi chwarel—erbyn hyn yn milwriaethu'n erbyn hyfywedd pentrefi a chymunedau o'r fath gan na fydd teuluoedd ifanc am symud i ardal lle nad oes cysylltiadau gweddol gadarn? A gytunwch hefyd fod hynny'n effeithio ar fusnesau lleol?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych yn eithaf cywir i gyfeirio at y pwynt nad sôn am y ffaith nad oes band eang o gwbl mewn mannau yn unig a wnawn, ond hefyd am gyflymder y gwasanaeth sy'n bodoli nad yw'n benigamp. Felly nid yw'n cymharu'n ffafriol â'r gystadleuaeth a geir pan archebir drwy gwmi mawr, ac mae'n amlwg y gall cwmnïau eraill ddarparu'n gyflymach ac yn symlach am fod ganddynt fand eang cyflymach.

Mae'r prosiect FibreSpeed yn parhau, a bydd yn ymdrin â'r 14 o brif barciau busnes ar draws arfordir gogledd Cymru. Mae strategaeth hefyd o ran y tyrau radio a fydd yn cysylltu'r 14 prif barc busnes strategol i barciau busnes llai drwy gyfrwng y biben band eang ar draws yr arfordir.

Darren Millar: Do you accept that lack of access to broadband can seriously disadvantage pupils and students from rural parts of Wales, such as Gwytherin in my constituency, as they cannot easily access the internet and its wonderful resources to supplement their education? What guidance is your Government issuing to teaching professionals in Welsh schools so that they take this into account when setting homework and coursework?

The First Minister: You are now getting into very detailed issues. I am not sure that I should be delving into the relationship between teachers and pupils as regards the setting of homework and whether pupils can use 'I couldn't get the broadband to work last night due to stormy weather' as an excuse along the lines of 'The dog ate my

just these broadband not spots that pose a problem, but those areas where there is a poor broadband connection. Although people are paying for the service, it either breaks down or does not work. Do you accept that not being able to receive a broadband connection in many villages—not in the depths of the countryside, but in areas such as Arfon with its old quarrying villages—now militates against the viability of such villages and communities because young families will not move to an area without fairly robust connections? Do you also agree that this affects local businesses?

The First Minister: You are quite right to say that we are not just talking about the fact that there is no broadband at all, but we are also talking about the speed of service where the service does exist but is not the best. Therefore it does not measure up to the competition that you get when people place orders through a major company, and it is obvious that other companies can deliver a service in a quicker and simpler way because they have a faster broadband connection.

The FibreSpeed project is ongoing, and it will deal with the 14 main business parks across the north Wales coast. There is also a radio tower strategy that will link the 14 main strategic business parks to smaller business parks through the broadband line across the coastline.

Darren Millar: A ydych yn derbyn bod diffyg mynediad at fand eang yn gallu golygu anfantais ddifrifol i ddisgyblion a myfyrwyr o rannau gwledig Cymru, megis Gwytherin yn f'etholaeth i, gan nad ydynt yn gallu cyrchu'n hawdd at y rhyngwrwd a'i hadnoddau rhagorol i ategu eu haddysg? Pa ganllawiau y mae eich Llywodraeth chi'n eu rhoi i athrawon yn ysgolion Cymru fel eu bod yn ystyried hyn pan fyddant yn gosod gwaith cartref a gwaith cwrs?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych yn sôn yn awr am faterion manwl iawn. Nid wyf yn siŵr a ddylwn fod yn turio i'r berthynas rhwng athrawon a disgyblion o ran gosod gwaith cartref a pha un a yw disgyblion yn gallu defnyddio 'Fedrwn i ddim cael y band eang i weithio neithiwr oherwydd y tywydd stormus' fel esgus tebyg i 'Mae'r ci wedi

homework'. It is not a matter for me. However, you are right that access to broadband not only affects business but can affect the use of broadband facilities for leisure and entertainment purposes and even for educational purposes. It is an important educational tool. We hope that, by a combination of the use of copper wire, which fades out after 5 km, and of satellite and wi-fi to fill the areas that you cannot reach through the copper wire system, we will be ensure continued good coverage: that is, a reduction in the number of not spots and an increase in speed where you have broadband.

2.40 p.m.

Kirsty Williams: There are a number of not spots in Brecon and Radnorshire, and one of the not spots that is currently causing the most concern is in the village of Tirabad, where constituents are at their wits' end about the inability to get broadband. Engineers who have visited the village say that the cable is 40 years old, with multiple breaks causing excessive losses. The whole village needs re-cabling, and, to add insult to injury, the poles that hold the wire above the ground have all been condemned and cannot be climbed, so workmen have to use a cherry picker.

In Scotland, the BT website advertises that BT can have broadband working quite successfully at 13 km. If BT can do that in Scotland, why can it not do that here? In reply to my most recent letter, BT wrote that it wants to fix the problem, but that discussions with the Welsh Assembly Government have not come to fruition, and, therefore, it cannot sort out the problems affecting villages such as Tirabad. When do you think that your discussions with BT will come to fruition, so that my constituents can enjoy the services that can be enjoyed in other parts of Wales and in rural parts of Scotland?

The First Minister: I have heard of the grass being greener on the other side, but I have never heard of copper wire working differently on the other side of a hill. What you are suggesting is that copper wire will transmit a broadband signal for 13 km in the

bwyta fy ngwaith cartref'. Nid yw'n fater i mi. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych yn iawn fod mynediad at fand eang yn effeithio nid yn unig ar fusnesau ond y gall effeithio ar ddefnyddio cyfleusterau band eang at ddibenion hamdden ac adloniant a hyd yn oed at ddibenion addysgol. Mae'n arf addysgol pwysig. Gobeithiwn, drwy gyfuno defnyddio gwifren gopr, sy'n gwanhau ar ôl 5 km, a lloeren a wi-fi i lenwi'r manau na allwch eu cyrraedd drwy'r system gwifren gopr, y byddwn yn sicrhau bod darpariaeth dda yn parhau: hynny yw, gostyngiad yn y nifer o ardaloedd digyswllt a chynnydd mewn cyflymder lle mae gennych fand eang.

Kirsty Williams: Mae nifer o ardaloedd digyswllt ym Mrycheiniog a sir Faesyfed, ac un o'r manau digyswllt sy'n achosi'r pryder mwyaf ar hyn o bryd yw pentref Tirabad, lle mae'r etholwyr ar ben eu tennyn ynglŷn â'r anallu i gael band eang. Dywed peirianwyr sydd wedi ymweld â'r pentref fod y cebl yn 40 oed, gyda nifer o doriadau sy'n achosi llawer gormod o golledion. Mae angen gosod ceblau newydd drwy'r pentref cyfan, ac, i rwbio halen yn y briw, mae'r polion sy'n dal y gwifrau uwchlaw'r ddaear i gyd wedi cael eu condemnio ac ni cheir eu dringo, felly rhaid i weithwyr ddefnyddio craen bach.

Yn yr Alban, mae gwefan BT yn hysbysebu y gall BT gael band eang i weithio'n ddigon llwyddiannus ar 13 km. Os gall BT wneud hynny yn yr Alban, pam na all wneud hynny yma? Mewn ymateb i'm llythyr diweddaraf, ysgrifennodd BT ei fod am gywiro'r broblem, ond nad yw trafodaethau gyda Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi dwyn ffrwyth, ac, felly, ni all ddatrys y problemau sy'n effeithio ar bentrefi fel Tirabad. Pryd dybiwch chi y bydd eich trafodaethau gyda BT yn dwyn ffrwyth, fel y gall fy etholwyr fwynhau'r gwasanaethau y mae modd eu mwynhau mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru ac yn rhannau gwledig yr Alban?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf wedi clywed am weld man gwyn fan draw, ond nid wyf erioed wedi clywed bod gwifren gopr yn gweithio'n wahanol yr ochr draw i'r bryn. Yr hyn yr ydych yn ei awgrymu yw y gwnaiff gwifren gopr drawsyrro signal band eang am 13 km

highlands, but will only do it for 5 km in Wales. That sounds a bit bizarre to me, but I will look into the matter. It is not just a matter of communications with BT. As the legacy company, BT has tended to be in the forefront when it comes to the issue of trying to fill in the holes in the broadband network throughout Wales, but communication with other providers is also important, particularly if, in the end, it is a matter for satellite and wi-fi, rather than for copper wires. It has to be done by a multiplicity of different technologies.

Joint Ministerial Committee

Q8 Lesley Griffiths: What discussions has the First Minister had with his counterparts in other devolved administrations regarding the work of the Joint Ministerial Committee? OAQ(3)1151(FM)

The First Minister: I will be meeting Alex Salmond and Peter Robinson tomorrow, as well as Jack Straw, who will be chairing the meeting, and Paul Murphy, who is co-ordinating the work of this meeting, which will be the first revamped Joint Ministerial Committee plenary session. We will have wide-ranging discussions on matters of mutual interest.

Lesley Griffiths: The administrative and structural arrangements that underpin devolution in the UK, namely the memorandum of understanding, the Joint Ministerial Committee and the concordats, are all necessary to make the various devolution settlements that we have in the UK function properly. However, from a Welsh perspective, some of those arrangements do not reflect the current settlement in Wales. For example, the memorandum of understanding was written in 2001, and consequently does not refer to the Government of Wales Act 2006. Do you agree that for all the constituent parts of the UK, at Executive level and within our respective legislatures, to fully understand, recognise and fulfil our respective roles, it is essential that these administrative arrangements are kept up to date? When the JMC meets in London tomorrow, will you consider asking for a review and modernisation of those arrangements to

yn Ucheldiroedd yr Alban, ond nad yw ond yn gwneud hynny am 5 km yng Nghymru. Mae hynny'n swnio'n rhyfedd braidd i mi, ond ymchwiliad i'r mater. Nid dim ond mater o gyfathrebu â BT mohono. Fel y cwmni etifeddol, mae BT wedi tueddu i fod ar flaen y gad o safbwynt ceisio llenwi'r bylchau yn y rhwydwaith band eang ledled Cymru, ond mae cyfathrebu â darparwyr eraill hefyd yn bwysig, yn enwedig os yw, yn y diwedd, yn golygu lloeren a wi-fi, yn hytrach na gwifrau copr. Rhaid i hyn gael ei wneud drwy nifer o dechnolegau gwahanol.

Cyd-bwyllgor y Gweinidogion

C8 Lesley Griffiths: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cael gyda'i gymheiriaid mewn gweinyddiaethau datganoledig eraill ynghylch gwaith Cyd-bwyllgor y Gweinidogion. OAQ(3)1151(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Byddaf yn cwrdd ag Alex Salmond a Peter Robinson yfory, yn ogystal â Jack Straw, a fydd yn cadeirio'r cyfarfod, a Paul Murphy, sy'n cyd-drefnu gwaith y cyfarfod hwn, sef cyfarfod llawn cyntaf Cyd-bwyllgor y Gweinidogion ar ei newydd wedd. Cawn drafodaethau eang eu cwmmpas am faterion o ddiddordeb i bob parti.

Lesley Griffiths: Mae'r trefniadau gweinyddol a strwythurol sy'n sylfaen i ddatganoli yn y DU, sef y memorandwm dealltwriaeth, Cydbwyllgor y Gweinidogion a'r concordatau, i gyd yn angenrheidiol i wneud i'r gwahanol setliadau datganoli sydd gennym yn y DU weithredu'n iawn. Fodd bynnag, o safbwynt Cymru, nid yw rhai o'r trefniadau hynny'n adlewyrchu'r setliad sydd gennym yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd. Er enghraifft, ysgrifennwyd y memorandwm dealltwriaeth yn 2001, ac nid yw felly'n cyfeirio at Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006. A ydych yn cytuno, er mwyn i bob elfen sy'n ffurfio'r DU, ar lefel Gweithrediaeth ac o fewn ein gwahanol ddeddfwrfeydd, ddeall, cydnabod a chyflawni ein gwahanol rolau'n llawn, ei bod yn hanfodol fod y trefniadau gweinyddol hyn yn cael eu diweddarau'n gyson? Pan fydd y Cyd-bwyllgor yn cwrdd yn Llundain yfory, a wnewch chi ystyried gofyn am adolygu a moderneiddio'r trefniadau hynny i sicrhau bod datganoli'n

ensure that devolution works more effectively and efficiently for the people of Wales?

The First Minister: As with all of these constitutional issues, it is important to ensure that what is of interest to the political classes—the chattering classes, the people who are Ministers, First Ministers and Deputy First Ministers—and what is of interest to ordinary people are brought together. We will probably not go into those areas of discussion tomorrow, but we will be trying to think how to make the JMC machinery work in the interests of ordinary people the length and breadth of the United Kingdom.

Angela Burns: I understand that you will be discussing the draft marine Bill tomorrow when you meet Jack Straw and other members of the Joint Ministerial Committee. There are Irish and Welsh concerns that differences in management could lead to distortions and unfair competition within the port industry between Wales and the rest of the UK. Would you please bring these concerns forward tomorrow and seek assurances that that will not be the case? The port industry and our relationship with Northern Ireland are important to the people of my constituency, Pembrokeshire, and also to Wales herself.

The First Minister: The marine Bill is certainly on the agenda, as is renewable energy—and also other matters that may arise as the mood takes us. However, those two items are fixed items on the agenda, and the different views that are taken in Wales, Northern Ireland and Scotland, because of the very different geographies, are important. There is an issue about how far you should extend the 12-mile limit, which is of great concern to the Scots. However, they do not have the same geography as we do.

If we extended the coastal limit from 12 miles outwards, which is what the Scots want to do, we would cover half of England and most of Ireland. Therefore, it is not as relevant to us, or it is not relevant in the same way. The main issue is to ensure that the way

gweithio'n fwy effeithiol ac effeithlon ar ran pobl Cymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Megis gyda'r holl faterion cyfansoddiadol hyn, mae'n bwysig sicrhau bod yr hyn sydd o ddiddordeb i'r dosbarthiadau gwleidyddol—y rhai sydd wedi cael addysg, y bobl sy'n Weinidogion, yn Brif Weinidogion ac yn Ddirprwy Brif Weinidogion—a'r hyn sydd o ddiddordeb i bobl gyffredin yn cael eu tynnu ynghyd. Nid yw'n debygol y byddwn yn trafod y meysydd hynny yfory, ond byddwn yn ceisio ystyried sut mae gwneud i beirianwaith y Cydbwyllgor weithio er budd pobl gyffredin ar hyd a lled y Deyrnas Unedig.

Angela Burns: Deallaf y byddwch yn trafod y Mesur morol drafft yfory pan fyddwch yn cwrdd â Jack Straw ac aelodau eraill o'r Cydbwyllgor Gweinidogol. Mae pryderon yn Iwerddon a Chymru ynglŷn â gwahaniaethau rheoli a allai arwain at lurgunio a chystadleuaeth annheg o fewn y diwydiant porthladdoedd rhwng Cymru a gweddill y DU. A wnewch chi os gwelwch yn dda ddod â'r pryderon hyn gerbron yfory a cheisio sicrwydd na fydd hynny'n digwydd? Mae'r diwydiant porthladdoedd â'n perthynas â Gogledd Iwerddon yn bwysig i bobl f'etholaeth i, sir Benfro, a hefyd i Gymru ei hun.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r Mesur morol yn sicr ar yr agenda, fel y mae ynni adnewyddadwy—a hefyd faterion eraill a allai godi fel y bydd yr awydd yn codi. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ddwy eitem hynny'n eitemau penodol ar yr agenda, ac mae'r safbwyntiau gwahanol yng Nghymru, Gogledd Iwerddon a'r Alban, oherwydd bod ein daearyddiaeth mor wahanol, yn bwysig. Mae cwestiwn ynglŷn â pha mor bell y dylech ymestyn y terfyn 12 milltir, sy'n destun pryder mawr i'r Albanwyr. Fodd bynnag, nid yw eu daearyddiaeth yr un fath â'n daearyddiaeth ni.

Petaem yn estyn y terfyn ar yr arfordir 12 milltir allan i'r môr, sef yr hyn y mae'r Albanwyr am ei wneud, byddem yn croesi terfyn hanner Lloegr a therfyn y rhan fwyaf o Iwerddon. Felly, nid yw mor berthnasol i ni, neu nid yw'n berthnasol yn yr un ffordd. Y

in which it is done is of benefit to the conservation of the marine environment and that there is effective exploitation in terms of fisheries, coast guard services and everything else involved in having an effective maritime environment.

Nerys Evans: Yr wyf yn aelod o Bwyllgor Darlledu'r Cynulliad. Yn amlwg, nid mater sydd wedi ei ddatganoli i'r Cynulliad yw hwn ond mae o ddiddordeb mawr i ni yn y Cynulliad ac i bobl Cymru. Fel y gwyddoch, nid oes rhaid i Weinidogion San Steffan ddod i roi tystiolaeth i bwyllgorau megis y Pwyllgor Darlledu, ac mae'r Gweinidog perthnasol wedi gwrthod cwrdd â'r pwyllgor. A gredwch fod hynny'n dderbyniol, ac a fydddech yn fodlon codi'r pwnc hwn yng nghyfarfod Cyd-bwyllgor y Gweinidogion? Byddai'n ein galluogi i gael trafodaethau ehangach ac eglurach ym mhwyllgorau'r Cynulliad.

Y Prif Weinidog: Os anfonwch nodyn ataf heddiw, ystyriaf a yw'n weddus i mi godi'r pwynt yng nghyfarfod cyntaf Cyd-bwyllgor y Gweinidogion yfory. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw ein bod yn derbyn bod agenda gweddol rydd gan y cyd-bwyllgor. Yr ydym yn ceisio ail-lansio cyfarfodydd y cyd-bwyllgor hwn yn gyfarfodydd lle y gallwn drafod materion yn eithaf agored ynddynt ac yn gyfarfodydd nad ydym yn gorfod paratoi papurau a chlirio popeth drwy'r swyddogion ar eu cyfer. Yr ydym am weld sut y gall y pedair Llywodraeth berthnasol ymdopi â'i gilydd, ac yr ydym am weld a allwn wneud i bethau weithio'n fwy effeithiol nag y gwnaethant dros y chwe blynedd diwethethaf.

Peter Black: One issue that is of concern to ordinary people is that the Assembly carries out its work in the most efficient and effective way possible. That includes effectively acquiring the powers that we seek through legislative competence Orders. In the light of that, do you think that it might be useful to revisit the protocols that Lesley Griffiths referred to so as to enable the misunderstandings that have arisen, certainly on the parliamentary side about the nature and purpose of those LCOs, to be overcome?

The First Minister: I do not think that that would be a suitable matter to discuss at the

prif fater dan sylw yw sicrhau bod y ffordd y caiff hyn ei wneud o fudd er mwyn gwarchod amgylchedd y môr a bod pysgodfeydd, gwasanaethau gwylwyr y glannau a phopeth arall sydd a wnelo â chael amgylchedd morol effeithiol yn cael eu datblygu'n effeithiol.

Nerys Evans: I am a member of the Assembly Broadcasting Committee. Obviously, this matter is not devolved to the Assembly but it is of great interest to us in the Assembly and to the people of Wales. As you know, Westminster Ministers do not have come to give evidence to committees such as the Broadcasting Committee, and the relevant Minister has refused to meet the committee. Do you think that that is acceptable, and would you be willing to raise this subject in the Joint Ministerial Committee? It would enable us to have wider and clearer discussions in the Assembly's committees.

The First Minister: If you send me a note today, I will consider whether it is appropriate for me to raise the point in the first meeting of the Joint Ministerial Committee tomorrow. We are trying to re-launch these committee meetings as meetings in which we can discuss matters quite openly and for which we do not have to prepare papers and clear everything through officials. We want to see how the four relevant Governments cope with each other, with a view to making things work more effectively than has been the case over the last six years.

Peter Black: Un peth sydd yn poeni pobl gyffredin yw bod y Cynulliad yn gwneud ei waith mor effeithlon ac effeithiol ag y bo modd. Mae hynny mewn gwirionedd yn golygu cael y pwerau yr ydym yn eu ceisio drwy gyfrwng Gorchmynion cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol. Yng ngoleuni hynny, a gredwch y gallai fod o fudd edrych eto at y protocolau y cyfeiriodd Lesley Griffiths atynt er mwyn gallu datrys y camddealltwriaethau sydd wedi codi, yn sicr o du'r senedd, ynglŷn â natur a phwrpas y Gorchmynion hynny.

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni chredaf y byddai hynny'n fater addas i'w drafod yng

Joint Ministerial Committee, because it is a bilateral issue between us and the Westminster Government. We are trying to establish a format tomorrow that will be as useful and practical to people across the UK to consider what the best way forward is for the Westminster Government, in terms of its UK function and its England-only function, and for Wales, Scotland and Northern Ireland too. We need to be able to kick things around and make decisions that will benefit ordinary people. Bilateral issues would get in the way of that.

European Funding

Q9 Michael German: Will the First Minister make a statement on the use of European funding in Wales? OAQ(3)1140(FM)

The First Minister: As I explained to the European and External Affairs Committee last week, as the 2000-06 programmes draw to a close, we are determined to extract the maximum benefit for Wales from the exchange rate £40 million windfall that is now available in the final phase and to get the new convergence programme up and running as quickly as possible.

Michael German: I want to make it absolutely clear that your words to the committee were that it would be a miracle if we could spend all of the £40 million. You also said that we would be very stretched to find the match funding. When the money is sent back—which it will be unless you are predicting a miracle—will it be because there are insufficient projects or because you cannot find the necessary match funding, or a mixture of both?

The First Minister: It will not be for either of those reasons. I explained this earlier when I corrected the rather hurried press release that you published almost before the meeting had finished. You misunderstood completely what I had said in your speed to write the press release. I said that there will inevitably be projects that do not get off the ground. That always happens with European structural funds, through no fault of the

Nghydbwyllgor y Gweinidogion, gan mai mater dwyochrog ydyw rhyngom ni a Llywodraeth San Steffan. Yr ydym yn ceisio sefydlu fformat yfory a fydd mor ddefnyddiol ac ymarferol i bobl ym mhob cwr o'r DU ystyried y ffordd orau i Lywodraeth San Steffan fwrw ymlaen, yng nghyd-destun ei swyddogaeth o ran y DU a'i swyddogaeth o ran Lloegr yn unig, ac o ran Cymru, yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon hefyd. Mae angen inni allu taflu pethau i'r pair a gwneud penderfyniadau a fydd o fudd i bobl gyffredin. Byddai materion dwyochrog yn tarfu ar hynny.

Cyllid Ewropeaidd

C9 Michael German: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ddefnyddio cyllid Ewropeaidd yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)1140(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Fel yr esboniais wrth y Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd ac Allanol yr wythnos diwethaf, wrth i raglenni 2000-06 dynnu i ben, yr ydym yn benderfynol o wasgu'r budd mwyaf i Gymru yn sgil yr hapdaliad gwerth £40 miliwn sydd ar gael inni yn awr yn y cyfnod olaf, yn sgil y gyfradd gyfnewid, ac o roi'r rhaglen cydgyfeirio ar waith cyn gynted ag y bo modd.

Michael German: Yr wyf am ei gwneud yn gwbl glir mai eich geiriau i'r pwyllgor oedd y byddai'n wyrth pe gallem wario'r £40 miliwn i gyd. Dywedasoeh hefyd y byddai'n dipyn o gamp inni ddod o hyd i'r arian cyfatebol. Pan ddychwelir yr arian—sef yr hyn a fydd yn digwydd onid ydych yn rhagweld gwyrrth—ai oherwydd nad oes digon o brosiectau y bydd hynny ynteu oherwydd na allwch ddod o hyd i'r arian cyfatebol angenrheidiol, ynteu gyfuniad o'r ddau?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oherwydd y naill reswm na'r llall. Esboniais hyn yn gynharach wrth gywiro'r datganiad i'r wasg, datganiad brysiog braidd a gyhoeddwyd gennych bron cyn i'r cyfarfod orffen. Gwnaethoch gamddeall yn llwyr yr hyn yr oeddwn wedi'i ddweud, gymaint oedd eich brys i ysgrifennu'r datganiad i'r wasg. Dywedais ei bod yn anochel na fydd rhai prosiectau'n mynd rhagddynt. Mae hynny bob tro'n

project sponsor's; sometimes they just do not manage to deliver the project. That money must then be recycled, very hurriedly sometimes. Likewise, the European auditors will be unhappy with other projects and they will demand repayment. Normally, we also try to recycle that money. It might be that 1 per cent of the money goes back for one reason and another 1 per cent goes back for audit reasons, and so on. On this occasion, because it is a windfall of £40 million, which is unalloyed good news for Wales, the issue is whether we choose projects simply because the match funding is available to them. I said to the committee last week that I do not think that it is a good idea to choose projects just because they can get match funding. We want to choose the projects that give the best strategic value to Wales, even if we have to help them find the match funding.

2.50 p.m.

Jeff Cuthbert: I was at the meeting that Mike German referred to. I was also at the All-Wales Programme Monitoring Committee for the new convergence and competitiveness programmes—and for Objective 1—just over two weeks ago, and I cannot understand how the report in the *Western Mail* could have been written in that way because, in my view, the issues were clear. I am sure that you will be pleased to hear that although the Objective 1 PMC was fraught with tensions in its early days—and I am sure that my colleague, Christine Chapman, could confirm that—at its last meeting over two weeks ago, it had turned itself around, even though the same people were present and the same partners were represented. They were applauding the work that we had done through Objective 1 in creating over 40,000 jobs and helping to create many small and medium-sized enterprises.

Do you agree that the new convergence and competitiveness programme that is worth around £1.5 billion—and £3 billion with match funding—will make a massive difference to skills levels in particular in

digwydd gyda chronfeydd strwythurol Ewrop, heb fai o gwbl ar noddwyr y prosiect; mae weithiau'n digwydd nad ydynt yn llwyddo i roi'r prosiect ar waith. Yna, rhaid ailgylchu'r arian hwnnw, ar frys mawr, weithiau. Yn yr un modd, bydd archwilwyr Ewrop yn anfodlon ar brosiectau eraill a byddant yn mynnu cael ad-daliad. Fel rheol, byddwn ninnau hefyd yn ceisio ailgylchu'r arian hwnnw. Efallai y dychwelir un y cant o'r arian am ryw reswm neu'i gilydd ac y dychwelir un y cant arall am resymau archwilio, ac ati. Y tro hwn, oherwydd mai hapdaliad o £40 ydyw, ac mae hynny'n bendant yn newyddion da i Gymru, y mater dan sylw yw a ddylem ddewis prosiectau dim ond am fod yr arian cyfatebol ar gael ar eu cyfer. Dywedais wrth y pwyllgor yr wythnos diwethaf nad wyf yn meddwl ei bod yn syniad da dewis prosiectau dim ond am eu bod yn gallu cael gafael ar arian cyfatebol. Yr ydym am ddewis y prosiectau sydd yn rhoi gwerth strategol i Gymru, hyd yn oed os oes rhaid inni eu helpu i ddod o hyd i'r arian cyfatebol.

Jeff Cuthbert: Yr oeddwn i yn y cyfarfod y bu i Mike German gyfeirio ato. Yr oeddwn i hefyd yn y cyfarfod Pwyllgor Monitro Rhaglenni Cymru Gyfan ar gyfer y rhaglenni cydgyfeirio a chystadleurwydd—ac ar gyfer Amcan 1—jyst dros bythefnos yn ôl, ac ni allaf ddeall sut y gallai'r adroddiad yn y *Western Mail* wedi'i ysgrifennu yn y ffordd honno, oherwydd, imi, yr oedd y materion yn glir. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn hapus i glywed, er i gyfarfodydd y pwyllgor fod yn llawn tensiwn yn y dyddiau cynnar—ac yr wyf yn siŵr y gallai fy nghydweithiwr, Christine Chapman, gadarnhau hynny—yr oedd yn amlwg o'r cyfarfod diwethaf ei fod wedi newid, er mai'r un bobl oedd yn bresennol a'r un partneriaid yn cael eu cynrychioli. Yr oeddynt yn cymeradwyo'r gwaith yr oeddem wedi'i wneud drwy Amcan 1 o ran creu dros 40,000 o swyddi a helpu i greu llawer o fentrau bach a chanolig eu maint.

A gytunwch y bydd y rhaglen gydgyfeirio a chystadleurwydd, sydd werth tua £1.5 biliwn—a £3 biliwn gydag arian cyfatebol—yn gwneud gwahaniaeth mawr i lefelau sgiliau yn enwedig yng Nghymru? Arweinir

Wales? That will be strategically led, but locally delivered, especially as a result of at least 60 per cent having to be referred to Lisbon-agenda-funded programmes.

The First Minister: Upskilling the Welsh workforce is a high priority for all parties in the Chamber. The world of business outside is also keen to see that re-skilling. If the exchange rate stays where it is today, then we will have 15 per cent more money over the next six or seven years. In the same way that we suddenly got this £40 million windfall of European funding, we will get an extra £300 million over the next six years, if the exchange rate stays where it is today. Although, of course, it will make it more stressful to find the match funding, so this is not unalloyed good news. However, it is good news and it means that you can do more provided that you can get the project up and running and delivered in the time period.

David Melding: None of us would condemn you for not being a clairvoyant, and I realise that spending to the last penny is a counsel of perfection, but the depreciation that we have seen in the pound of around 15 per cent against the euro was intimated last summer and started in early September last year. You have had time to manage this uncertainty. Can you assure us that the underspent money, if any, will be minimal and that you have managed this situation properly so that that windfall will benefit those areas of Wales that most need this investment?

The First Minister: It started in September, but its full effect was not felt until November. I think that it was at the end of the year, around December, that we were first given the calculation and realised that it would be around £40 million extra. Clearly, we have been getting our skates on since then to try to ensure, before they disperse to the four winds, that we work things through with the sponsors of the programmes that are still in existence or that still want to be in existence, because they also hope to access convergence funds. We have asked, 'If you can find the match funding or if we can find it, can you

hynny'n strategol ond bydd yn cael ei gyflawni yn lleol, yn enwedig achos bod o leiaf 60 y cant ohonynt yn gorfod cael eu cyfeirio at raglenni sydd yn cael eu cyllido gan yr agenda Lisbon.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae uwchraddio sgiliau gweithlu Cymru yn flaenoriaeth fawr i bob plaid yn y Siambr. Mae byd busnes y tu allan i'r Cynulliad hefyd yn awyddus i weld hynny. Os yw'r gyfradd gyfnewid yn aros fel ag y mae heddiw, bydd gennym 15 y cant yn fwy o arian dros y chwe neu saith mlynedd nesaf. Yn yr un modd ag y bu inni gael £40 miliwn yn fwy o arian Ewropeaidd, byddwn yn cael £300 miliwn yn ychwanegol dros y chwe mlynedd nesaf, os yw'r gyfradd gyfnewid yn aros fel ag y mae heddiw. Er wrth gwrs, bydd hynny'n ei gwneud yn anos cael arian cyfatebol, felly nid yw hwn yn newydd da i gyd. Fodd bynnag, mae'n newyddion da, ac mae'n golygu y gallwch wneud mwy, cyn bellech â'ch bod yn gallu cychwyn y prosiect a'i gyflwyno ar amser.

David Melding: Ni fyddai unrhyw un ohonom yn eich collfarnu am fod yn glirweledydd, ac yr wyf yn sylweddoli nad yw gwario pob ceiniog yn ddelfrydol, ond cafodd y dibrisiant o tua 15 y cant yng ngwerth y bunt yn erbyn yr ewro ei nodi yr haf diwethaf, ac fe gychwynnodd yn gynnar ym mis Medi y llynedd. Yr ydych wedi cael amser i reoli'r ansicrwydd hwn. A allwch roi sicrwydd y bydd y tanwariant, os oes tanwariant, yn cael ei gadw mor isel â phosibl a'ch bod wedi rheoli'r sefyddlfa hon yn briodol er mwyn i'r arian ychwanegol fod o fudd i'r rhannau hynny o Gyrmu sydd ei angen fwyaf?

Y Prif Weinidog: Cychwynnodd ym mis Medi, ond ni theimlwyd ei lawn effaith tan ganol Tachwedd. Yr wyf yn meddwl mai ar ddiwedd y flwyddyn, tua mis Rhagfyr, y cawsom y ffigurau cyntaf, gan ddeall y byddai'n rhyw £40 miliwn yn ychwanegol. Yn amlwg, yr ydym wedi bod yn gwneud ein gorau ers hynny i geisio sicrhau, cyn iddynt fynd i'r pedwar gwynt, ein bod yn gwneud ein gwaith gyda noddwyr y rhaglenni sydd dal yn bodoli neu sydd yn awyddus i barhau, gan eu bod yn dal i obeithio manteisio ar arian cydgyfeiriant. Yr ydym wedi gofyn, 'Os ydych yn gallu dod o hyd i arian cyfatebol,

stretch your funds so that you can use this extra £40 million, which means that you then will not need so much of the convergence funding or you can delay the need for it?'. However, you will find that that is not always the case because, on top of the audit problem, the SME projects sometimes fail because they just fail and that has always been the case.

We usually over-programme by 10 per cent, but as I said in my letter this morning and to the committee last week, had we known, we would have over-programmed by 20 per cent to allow not only for the fallout from some programmes and projects that do not happen but also for sterling going down against the euro. We did not foresee that.

Bethan Jenkins: I am sure that the First Minister would like to join me in congratulating the Deputy First Minister on the steps that he has taken to simplify the grants process for new businesses in Wales. I will further press the First Minister on whether he could make representations to the European officials on simplifying the support available for Welsh businesses from the European Union. It seems to me that the EU could learn a lot more from the Deputy First Minister on alleviating unnecessary bureaucratic burdens on small businesses.

The First Minister: I am sure that there is total unity on this subject, and I entirely agree with you.

The Heads of the Valleys Road

Q10 Mohammad Asghar: Will the First Minister make a statement on the progress being made to make the A465 Heads of the Valleys road in South Wales East a dual carriageway? OAQ(3)1156(FM)

The First Minister: A couple of weeks ago, on 22 May, the Abergavenny to Gilwern section of the A465 dual carriageway was opened. It is a 6 km stretch, or roughly four miles, and it completes two of the six phases

neu os ydym ni'n gallu dod o hyd iddo, a allwch chi estyn eich arian er mwyn defnyddio'r £40 miliwn ychwanegol hwn, sy'n golygu na fydd arnoch angen cymaint o arian cydgyfeiriant neu y gallwch ymdopi ag oedi cyn y bydd arnoch ei angen?'. Fodd bynnag, fe welwch nad yw hynny'n bosibl bob tro oherwydd, yn ychwanegol at y broblem archwilio, mae'r prosiectau i fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yn methu am resymau naturiol; bu hynny'n digwydd erioed.

Fel arfer, yr ydym yn gor-raglennu gan 10 y cant, ond, fel y dywedais yn fy llythyr y bore yma ac i'r pwyllgor wythnos diwethaf, pe baem wedi gwybod, byddem wedi gor-raglennu gan rhyw 20 y cant er mwyn caniatáu nid yn unig am y ffaith nad yw rhai rhaglenni a prosiectau'n digwydd ond hefyd am y ffaith y gall y bunt ostwng yn erbyn yr ewro. Nid oeddem wedi rhagweld hynny.

Bethan Jenkins: Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd y Prif Weinidog am ymuno â mi wrth longyfarch y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ar y camau y mae wedi eu cymryd i symleiddio'r broses grantiau ar gyfer busnesau newydd yng Nghymru. Pwysaf ymhellach ar y Prif Weinidog. A fydd modd iddo wneud cynrychioliadau i swyddogion Ewropeaidd ar symleiddio cefnogaeth Undeb Ewropeaidd sydd ar gael i fusnesau Cymreig? Mae'n ymddangos i mi y gall yr UE ddysgu llawer gan y Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog am leddfu ar y baich biwrocraataidd diangen ar fusnesau bach.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn siŵr bod undod llwyr ar y pwnc hwn, a chytunaf a chi yn llwyr.

Ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd

C10 Mohammad Asghar: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am y cynnydd a wnaethpwyd i wneud ffordd A465 Blaenau'r Cymoedd yn ffordd ddeuol yn Nwyrain De Cymru? OAQ(3)1156(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Ychydig wythnosau yn ôl, ar 22 Mai, agorwyd y rhan rhwng y Fenni a Gilwern ar ffordd ddeuol yr A465. Mae'n ddarn 6 km, neu rhyw 4 milltir, o hyd ac mae'n cwblhau dwy o chwe rhan cynllun

of the Heads of the Valleys scheme. The forthcoming national transport plan and review of the trunk road forward programme will provide details of the timing for the remaining sections.

Mohammad Asghar: I was with the Deputy First Minister at that opening ceremony, and it was a wonderful occasion. However, the campaign to dual the whole of the road has lasted almost 40 years, and people cannot blame the current Assembly Government for the perceived delays in the work. Could you tell us the latest on the plan for the stretch between Merthyr Tydfil and Hirwaun, and will you join me in hoping that the whole road is dualled as soon as possible?

The First Minister: I am not sure that you are right about the road being planned as a dual carriageway 40 years ago. I think that Jim Griffiths, the first Secretary of State for Wales, was very clear that it would be a three-lane carriageway when he announced it in 1965, I believe. The important thing is that modern safety standards mean that three-lane carriageways are not ideal, and therefore it should be converted into a dual carriageway. It then comes down to the complex engineering, the funds required and the statutory procedures. The Dowlais to Tredegar section was dualled first, and now the Abergavenny to Gilwern section is complete, and we expect further stages to be completed as the capital programme unfolds, and as we solve the funding problems.

William Graham: Could you give some thought to the fact that sections 2 and 3 have yet to be completed and that there is not even a date for their implementation and completion?

The First Minister: The dilemma is this: do you try to group the remaining four sections—namely sections 2, 3, 5 and 6—into a single building programme, and use an innovative method of financing to try to bring the completion of the whole shebang forward by making it one big construction project, or is it better to carry on as we have been doing, that is, building three miles here and four miles there every five years? It is not yet

Blaenau'r Cymoedd. Bydd y cynllun trafniadaeth cenedlaethol arfaethedig a'r adolygiad o gefnffyrdd yn rhoi'r manylion ar gyfer amseru'r rhannau sy'n weddill.

Mohammad Asghar: Yr oeddwn gyda'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn y seremoni agoriadol honno, ac yr oedd yn achlysur gwych. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ymgyrch i ddeuoli'r ffordd ar ei hyd wedi para bron 40 mlynedd ac ni all pobl weld bai ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad presennol am yr oedi rhagdybiedig yn y gwaith. A allech ddweud wrthym beth yw'r cynllun diweddaraf ar gyfer y rhan o'r ffordd rhwng Merthyr Tudful a Hirwaun, ac a wnewch ymuno â mi yn y gobaith y caiff yr holl ffordd ei deuoli cyn gynted â phosibl?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn sicr a ydych yn gywir i gredu mai fel ffordd ddeuol y bwriadwyd y ffordd 40 mlynedd yn ôl. Credaf fod Jim Griffiths, Ysgrifennydd Gwladol cyntaf Cymru, yn glir iawn y byddai yn ffordd tair lôn pan gyhoeddodd hynny yn 1965, fe gredaf. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw bod safonau diogelwch modern yn golygu nad yw ffyrdd tair lôn yn ddelfrydol, felly dylai gael ei thrawsnewid yn ffordd ddeuol. Yna, rhaid ystyried y peirianwaith cymhleth, yr arian fyddai ei angen a'r gweithdrefnau statudol. Cafodd y rhan o Ddowlais i Dredegar ei deuoli yn gyntaf a bellach mae'r rhan o'r Fenni i Gilwern wedi cael ei chwblhau a disgwyliwn i gamau pellach gael eu cwblhau wrth i'r rhaglen gyfalaf fynd rhagddi, ac wrth i ni ddatrys y problemau ariannu.

William Graham: A allech roi ystyriaeth i'r ffaith nad yw rhannau 2 a 3 wedi'u cwblhau hyd yn hyn ac nad oes dyddiad wedi ei bennu ar gyfer eu gweithredu a'u cwblhau?

Y Prif Weinidog: Y benbleth yw hyn: a ddylid ceisio grwpio'r pedwar rhan sy'n weddill—sef rhannau 2, 3, 5 a 6—i mewn i un rhaglen adeiladu, a defnyddio dull arloesol o ariannu er mwyn ceisio cwblhau'r holl sioe yn gynharach a'i wneud yn un prosiect adeiladu mawr, neu a yw'n well parhau fel yr ydym wedi dechrau, sef adeiladu tair milltir yma a phedair milltir acw, bob pum mlynedd? Nid yw'n glir ar hyn o bryd pa

clear, although it soon will be, which the better method is.

ddull yw'r un gorau, er y bydd yn glir cyn bo hir.

Datganiad a Chyhoeddiad Busnes Business Statement and Announcement

The Leader of the House and Counsel General (Carwyn Jones): There are no changes to report to this week's Government business, and business for the next three weeks is as set out in the draft business statement and announcement, which can be found in the agenda papers that are available to Members electronically.

Y Cwnsler Cyffredinol ac Arweinydd y Tŷ (Carwyn Jones): Nid oes unrhyw newidiadau i fusnes y Llywodraeth yr wythnos hon, ac mae'r busnes am y tair wythnos nesaf yn unol â'r hyn a nodir yn y datganiad a chyhoeddiad busnes drafft, y gellir dod o hyd iddo yn yr agenda sydd ar gael i Aelodau yn electronig.

David Melding: Presiding Officer, I hope that you will indulge me. I had intended to ask the Leader of the House for a statement in relation to situations that have arisen in terms of the monitoring of the Arriva Trains contract. I asked for a meeting with the Deputy First Minister, and I have just received a message to say that the Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport has agreed to meet with me, so I think that I should keep my powder dry until I have had that meeting. I am grateful that I have now had a response, but I give notice that the opposition will seek reassurance on this important public matter, and we may have to return to the Assembly and bring this issue before you again. However, for the moment, I hope that I will have a productive meeting with your colleague.

David Melding: Llywydd, maddeuwch i mi. Yr oeddwn wedi bwriadu gofyn i Arweinydd y Tŷ am ddatganiad mewn perthynas â sefyllfaoedd sydd wedi codi o ran arolygu contract Arriva Trains. Gofynnais am gyfarfod â'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog, ac rwyf newydd dderbyn neges yn dweud bod y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth wedi cytuno i gyfarfod â mi, felly yr wyf yn credu y dylwn ymatal nes ar ôl y cyfarfod hwnnw. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar fy mod erbyn hyn wedi cael ymateb, ond rwyf am rhoi hysbysiad y bydd yr wrthblaid yn chwilio am sicrwydd ar y mater hwn sydd o bwys cyhoeddus, ac efallai y bydd rhaid i ni ddychwelyd i'r Cynulliad a dod â'r mater hwn gerbron unwaith yn rhagor. Fodd bynnag, am y tro, gobeithiaf y bydd fy nghyfarfod a'ch cyd-aelod yn un ffrwythlon.

Carwyn Jones: I am grateful to David Melding, and I do not think that there is much that I can add.

Carwyn Jones: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i David Melding, ac nid wyf yn meddwl bod llawer y gallaf ei ychwanegu.

Christine Chapman: I note the earlier question to the First Minister, but I would like to have a statement from the Deputy First Minister regarding the dualling of the A465, particularly the stretch from Hirwaun to Merthyr. I am obviously pleased that there has been progress on the other parts but, as you know, there has been an increase in the number of tragic accidents in that area recently and there is also the problem of the continued roadworks. There is now a great deal of anger in my constituency and in the constituency of my colleague, Huw Lewis, and a feeling that something must be done to

Christine Chapman: Yr wyf yn nodi'r cwestiwn a ofynnwyd i'r Prif Weinidog yn gynharach, ond hoffwn ddatganiad gan y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog mewn perthynas â deuoli'r A465, yn enwedig y rhan o'r ffordd rhwng Hirwaun a Merthyr. Wrth gwrs, yr wyf yn bles i glywed bod cynnydd wedi bod mewn rhannau eraill ond, fel y gwyddoch, mae nifer o ddamweiniau trasig wedi digwydd yn yr ardal honno'n ddiweddar ac mae hefyd y broblem o weithfeydd parhaus ar y ffyrdd. Erbyn hyn, mae llawer o ddieter yn fy etholaeth i ac yn etholaeth fy nghyd-aelod Huw Lewis, a mae llawer yn teimlo y

alleviate these problems. We would also like to have a detailed statement on the timescales and regular updates.

Carwyn Jones: Of course, Christine. I can say that initial work on assessing procurement options for the delivery of the remaining sections of dualling has been completed, and the Deputy First Minister will be providing more details in Plenary. There is no question about recognising the importance of the Heads of the Valleys road as a major transport route for the whole of Wales. The recently published Wales transport strategy recognises the importance of improving the infrastructure of the Heads of the Valleys. Work is ongoing, and when it is completed there will be an announcement in Plenary.

3.00 p.m.

Eleanor Burnham: I am aware that the First Minister responded to a question about Flexsys earlier, but, as I mentioned when I asked the supplementary question, other manufacturers and companies in Flintshire and Wrexham are also experiencing difficulties. May we have a statement on the strategy and on what moneys are available? Wrexham and parts of Flintshire are not within the European Union convergence funding areas, and so it is important that we have an update on these serious matters. Perhaps a stitch in time would save nine in this instance, instead of our scrambling to help afterwards, which can sometimes be too late.

Carwyn Jones: I do not see the point in having a general statement on the economic situation in Flintshire and Wrexham; both parts of Wales continue to do well. They are outside the convergence funding area, but they have nevertheless prospered economically since the election of a Labour Government in 1997 and the establishment of the Assembly in 1999.

Bethan Jenkins: Although the Assembly seems to encourage young people to have a voice in the political process in Wales, it is

bod yn rhaid i rywbeth gael ei wneud i liniaru'r problemau hyn. Hoffwn hefyd gael datganiad manwl ar amserlenni a hoffwn hefyd gael clywed y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf yn gyson.

Carwyn Jones: Wrth gwrs, Christine. Gallaf ddweud bod y gwaith cychwynnol o asesu opsiynau caffael ar gyfer cyflawni'r gwaith deuli sy'n weddill wedi ei orffen, ac y bydd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn rhoi mwy o fanylion yn y Cyfarfod Llawn. Nid oes unrhyw amheuaeth o ran cydnabod pwysigrwydd ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd fel un o brif lwybrau trafnidiaeth ar gyfer pob rhan o Gymru. Mae'r strategaeth drafnidiaeth ar gyfer Cymru gyfan a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd gwella isadeiledd Blaenau'r Cymoedd. Mae gwaith yn mynd yn ei flaen, a bydd cyhoeddiad yn y Cyfarfod Llawn.

Eleanor Burnham: Yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod y Prif Weinidog eisoes wedi ateb cwestiwn am Flexsys, ond, fel y soniais wrth ofyn y cwestiwn ategol, mae gweithgynhyrchwyr a chwmnïau eraill yn sir y Fflint a Wrecsam hefyd yn wynebu anawsterau. A allwn gael datganiad am y strategaeth a chael gwybod pa arian sydd ar gael? Nid yw Wrecsam na rhannau o sir y Fflint o fewn ardaloedd cyllid cydgyfeirio'r Undeb Ewropeaidd, ac felly mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cael y newyddion diweddaraf am y materion pwysig hyn. Efallai y byddai pwyth mewn llaw yn arbed naw yn yr achos hwn, yn hytrach na sgrialu i helpu yn nes ymlaen, sydd weithiau'n gallu bod yn rhy hwyr.

Carwyn Jones: Nid wyf yn gweld pwynt cael datganiad cyffredinol am y sefyllfa economaidd yn sir y Fflint a Wrecsam; mae'r ddwy ran o Gymru'n parhau i wneud yn dda. Maent y tu allan i'r ardal cyllid cydgyfeirio, ond, er hynny, maent wedi ffynnu'n economaidd ers ethol Llywodraeth Lafur yn 1997 ac ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad yn 1999.

Bethan Jenkins: Er bod y Cynulliad i bob golwg yn annog pobl ifanc i gael llais yn y broses wleidyddol yng Nghymru, ni ellir

unjustifiable that the Prince of Wales is to open the youth chamber without young people in Wales having been consulted on that decision. Therefore, I wish to have a debate in the National Assembly about the future of the monarchy in Wales but involving young people so that we can discuss that viewpoint openly.

I also want to ask for a debate on eating disorders. A meeting of the cross-party group on eating disorders is to be held next week, but my request comes in light of a new diet patch on the market for young people, advertised on websites such as Facebook and Hotmail. It has been targeted at young people but it may result in more problems with eating disorders in future.

Carwyn Jones: Eating disorders are a growing problem. They are fuelled, at least in part, by what young girls particularly, although it is not exclusively confined to them, read about and see as the ideal body shape. I read recently that this is becoming an increasing concern again, with a thin body being seen as the body shape to aspire to. I am afraid that I have failed in that regard over time. However, it is a serious issue, and many Members will have had experience of dealing with many young girls and others who suffer from eating disorders. It is important that the cross-party group reports back to the Minister for Health and Social Services on what might be done to help to alleviate the situation. You are right to say that it is a problem that will not go away, and I am filled with some horror that what appears to be an unproven dieting technique is being heavily marketed to young people, which is worrying.

We do not have the power to abolish the monarchy in the National Assembly, so I do not see what benefit could be gained from having a debate on that issue at this stage.

Jonathan Morgan: In my capacity as Chair of the Health, Wellbeing and Local Government Committee, I ask the Leader of the House to make time available to consider the committee's report into the

cyfiawnhau'r ffaith bod Tywysog Cymru'n dod i agor y siambr pobl ifanc heb hyd yn oed ymgynghori â phobl ifanc yng Nghymru am y penderfyniad hwnnw. Felly, hoffwn gael trafodaeth yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol am ddyfodol y frenhiniaeth yng Nghymru, ond gan gynnwys pobl ifanc, fel y gallwn drafod y safbwynt hwnnw'n agored.

Hoffwn hefyd ofyn am drafodaeth am anhwylderau bwyta. Cynhelir cyfarfod y grŵp trawsbleidiol ar anhwylderau bwyta yr wythnos nesaf, ond cyflwynaf fy nghais oherwydd bod patshys deiet newydd ar y farchnad ar gyfer pobl ifanc, sy'n cael eu hysbysebu ar wefannau megis Facebook a Hotmail. Maent wedi eu targedu at bobl ifanc ond gallai arwain at fwy o broblemau gydag anhwylderau bwyta yn y dyfodol.

Carwyn Jones: Mae anhwylderau bwyta yn broblem gynyddol. Cânt eu hysgogi, o leiaf yn rhannol, gan yr hyn y mae merched ifanc yn arbennig, er ni chyfyngir hyn yn llwyr i ferched ifanc, yn ei ddarllen ac yn ei weld fel siâp corff delfrydol. Darllenais yn ddiweddar fod hwn yn fater sy'n peri pryder cynyddol unwaith eto, gyda'r ddelwedd o gorff tenau fel y siâp i anelu ato. Yr wyf yn ofni fy mod wedi methu yn hynny o beth dros amser. Fodd bynnag, mae'n fater difrifol, a bydd nifer o Aelodau wedi cael profiad o ddelio gyda llawer o ferched ifanc ac eraill sy'n dioddef o anhwylderau bwyta. Mae'n bwysig bod y grŵp trawsbleidiol yn adrodd yn ôl i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ynghylch beth y gellid ei wneud i helpu i liniaru'r sefyllfa. Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle wrth ddweud nad yw hon yn broblem a wnaiff diflannu, ac mae'n ddigon i'm dychryn bod techneg ar gyfer colli pwysau sydd heb ei brofi, yn ôl pob golwg, yn cael ei farchnata'n galed i bobl ifanc, ac mae hynny'n peri pryder.

Nid oes gennym bŵer i ddiddymu'r frenhiniaeth yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, felly ni welaf pa fantais fyddai inni drafod y mater hwnnw ar hyn o bryd.

Jonathan Morgan: Yn fy swyddogaeth fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd, Lles a Llywodraeth Leol, gofynnaf i Arweinydd y Tŷ ryddhau amser yn y Cyfarfod Llawn cyn toriad yr haf i ystyried adroddiad y pwyllgor

reconfiguration of health services in Plenary before the summer recess. I understand that the Minister for health will make a statement on 16 July, which we welcome. Would it therefore be possible to extend that to involve the consideration of our committee report, which might be useful in informing the debate?

Carwyn Jones: I will be guided by the Presiding Officer on that, but I do not know whether the committee report would be allocated time in any event. There is no room between now and the recess to discuss more business in Government time, as that has already been fully allocated, but I will investigate whether there is any way for the matter to be brought forward for debate.

Jenny Randerson: During First Minister's questions, I raised the issue of the choice of vaccine to protect against cervical cancer, and the First Minister was unable, quite understandably, to give me an answer about the details of the vaccine. However, it surprised me that he was unable to answer my question on whether we in Wales had the power to select a different vaccine from that chosen by the Department of Health in England. I would welcome the opportunity to question the Minister for health about the process and the choice of vaccine in this case. Would it be possible for her to make an oral statement in Plenary on this issue? Failing that, a written statement would be better than nothing on what is a vital aspect of the prevention of further disease in years to come.

Carwyn Jones: I hear what you say. Perhaps the best way forward in this matter would be for the Minister for health to provide you with further written communication. I will not claim to be an expert on which vaccine is most effective. If memory serves me correctly, the National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence has an approval process for drugs, and, although doctors do not necessarily have to prescribe drugs that have gone through the NICE process, the drugs do have to be shown to be safe for use in humans. We understand that, but it is for people who know more about the subject than I to get into a debate about the most effective drug. If there are issues that the

ar ad-drefnu gwasanaethau iechyd. Deallaf y bydd y Gweinidog dros iechyd yn gwneud datganiad ar 16 Gorffennaf, ac mae hynny i'w groesawu. A fyddai felly'n bosibl i ymestyn hwnnw ac ystyried adroddiad ein pwyllgor hefyd, oherwydd y gallai fod yn ddefnyddiol o ran cyfrannu at y drafodaeth?

Carwyn Jones: Dilynaf arweiniad y Llywydd ar hynny, ond nid wyf yn sicr y byddai amser yn cael ei neilltuo i'r adroddiad pwyllgor beth bynnag. Nid oes lle rhwng nawr a'r toriad i drafod mwy o fusnes yn amser y Llywodraeth, gan fod yr amser hwnnw eisoes wedi cael ei neilltuo'n llwyr, ond gwnaf ymholiadau i weld a ellir cyflwyno'r mater i'w drafod.

Jenny Randerson: Yn ystod cwestiynau'r Prif Weinidog, codais y mater am y dewis o frechlyn i amddiffyn yn erbyn canser ceg y groth, ac nid oedd y Prif Weinidog yn gallu rhoi ateb am fanylion y brechlyn, ac mae hynny'n ddigon dealladwy. Fodd bynnag, synnais nad oedd yn gallu ateb fy nghwestiwn p'un ai a oedd gennym y pŵer yng Nghymru i ddewis brechlyn gwahanol i'r hyn a ddewiswyd gan yr Adran Iechyd yn Lloegr. Byddwn yn croesawu'r cyfle i holi'r Gweinidog dros iechyd am y broses a'r dewis o frechlyn yn yr achos hwn. A fyddai'n bosibl iddi wneud datganiad llafar am y mater hwn i'r Cyfarfod Llawn? Os na, byddai datganiad ysgrifenedig yn well na dim oherwydd mae hwn yn agwedd hanfodol o ran atal clefydau pellach mewn blynyddoedd i ddod.

Carwyn Jones: Clywaf eich geiriau. Efallai mai'r ffordd orau ymlaen ar y mater hwn fyddai i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd anfon gohebiaeth ysgrifenedig bellach atoch. Nid wyf am honni fy mod yn arbenigwr ar ba frechlyn yw'r un mwyaf effeithiol. Os wyf yn cofio'n iawn, mae gan y Sefydliad Cenedlaethol dros Iechyd a Rhagoriaeth Glinigol broses gymeradwyo ar gyfer cyffuriau, ac, er nad oes rheidrwydd ar feddygon i ragnodi cyffuriau sydd wedi bod drwy'r broses NICE, rhaid dangos bod y cyffuriau'n ddiogel i bobl eu defnyddio. Yr ydym yn deall hynny, ond rhywbeth i'w drafod gan bobl sy'n gwybod mwy na mi am y pwnc yw pa gyffur yw'r un mwyaf

Minister for health can resolve by way of written communication, I am sure that she will wish to do so.

David Lloyd: A wnewch ymgynghori â'r Gweinidog iechyd am y materion pwysig sy'n codi o ran costau gofal nyrsio mewn cartrefi nyrsio preifat? Mae nifer o bobl yn talu am ofal nyrsio—neu mae eu teuluoedd yn gwneud—pan ddylai fod ar gael am ddim. Tynnwyd nifer o achosion felly at fy sylw, yn ysgrifenedig a thrwy gyfarfodydd yn Abertawe a Chastell Nedd.

Clywais yr hyn a ddywedwyd gennych am yr amserlen dynn o ran dadleuon yn amser y Llywodraeth, ond a fyddai modd ichi drefnu datganiad ysgrifenedig o leiaf am y ffordd ymlaen? Yr wyf eisoes wedi cyfarfod â'r Gweinidog iechyd, bythefnos yn ôl, a chytunodd fod angen diwygio neu o leiaf wella'r system o asesu pwy sy'n gymwys i gael gofal nyrsio am ddim a phwy fyddai'n gorfod talu amdano. Mae gwendidau yn y system bresennol o asesu pwy sy'n gymwys i gael y gofal hwn am ddim, ond yr hyn sy'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd yw bod bron pawb yn gorfod talu amdano, hyd yn oed gydag asesiad, a phan asesir nad oes rhaid iddynt dalu, cânt yr arian yn ôl wedyn—pan fydd yr achos prawf wedi mynd drwy'r llysoedd.

Mae'n fater pwysig, ac mae'n achosi cryn bryder. Mae 700,000 a mwy o dai wedi'u gwerthu yn y Deyrnas Gyfunol yn y ddegawd ddiwethaf dim ond er mwyn ariannu costau gofal hirdymor mewn cartrefi preswyl. Mae hyn yn golygu bod 40,000 a mwy o dai wedi'u gwerthu yng Nghymru, sef 2,000 o dai ymhob sir. Mae eu trigolion wedi gorfod eu gwerthu er mwyn ariannu gofal hirdymor i rywun yn y teulu. Mae pryder enfawr am y peth, ac mae'r pwnc yn deilwng o ddadl. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe baech, Arweinydd y Tŷ, yn gallu ystyried y pwynt hwnnw.

Carwyn Jones: Yr oedd eich cyfarfod ag Edwina Hart yn swnio'n un da gan ei fod wedi symud pethau yn eu blaen. Yn fy marn i, dyna sut y dylid delio â'r mater hwn. Mae o leiaf un achos llys yn mynd rhagddo sy'n cyffwrdd â'r pwynt hwn, a rhaid bod yn ofalus ynghylch y farn y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei mynegi ar y mater.

effeithiol. Os oes materion y gall y Gweinidog dros Iechyd eu datrys mewn gohebiaeth ysgrifenedig, yna yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yn dymuno gwneud hynny.

David Lloyd: Will you consult with the Minister for health on the important issues arising in relation to the cost of nursing care in private nursing homes? Many people are paying for nursing care—or their families are—when it should be available for free. Many such cases have been drawn to my attention, both by letter and in meetings in Swansea and Neath.

I heard what you just said about the tight schedule for debates in Government time, but would you be able to arrange for at least a written statement on the way forward? I have already met the Minister for health, a fortnight ago, and she agreed that the system of assessing who is eligible for free nursing care and who should have to pay for it, needs to be reformed, or improved at least. There are weaknesses in the current system of assessing who is eligible to receive that care for free, but what happens at present is that nearly everyone has to pay for it, even with an assessment, and, when it is assessed that they do not need to pay, they will get a rebate—when the test case has gone through the courts.

It is an important matter, and it is a cause of some concern. More than 700,000 houses have been sold in the United Kingdom in the past decade only to finance the cost of long-term care in residential homes. That means that more than 40,000 homes were sold in Wales, which amounts to 2,000 homes per county. The occupants had to sell them in order to finance the long-term care of a member of the family. There is enormous concern about that, and it is a matter worthy of debate. I would be grateful if you, Leader of the House, would consider that point.

Carwyn Jones: Your meeting with Edwina Hart sounded very good, given that it managed to move things forward. In my opinion, that is how this matter should be dealt with. At least one court case is under way that touches on this area, and we must be careful about any opinion that the Government states on the matter.

Gan fod cyfarfod eisoes wedi ei gynnal rhyngoch chi â'r Gweinidog iechyd, credaf mai dyna'r ffordd orau ymlaen ac nid drwy gynnal dadl yn y Siambr—nid ar hyn o bryd, o leiaf.

Mark Isherwood: As you will be aware, proposals for community legal advice networks exist for eight commissioning areas in Wales, and I understand that the first of these networks is planned to be established by April next year. Citizens' advice bureaux and Citizens Advice as a national body have expressed concern that the model being developed for commissioning and contracting do not reflect the wider value of the service provided to Welsh civil society, and that the loss of the single contract to them could be potentially terminal for the service in Wales, given that the loss of equivalent contracts in Hull and Leicester led to the decimation of the citizens' advice bureaux and the service in those areas.

3.10 p.m.

In addition to the services that the Legal Services Commission and these bodies would provide, many additional services provided by the citizens' advice bureaux would be lost. Could we please have a statement on this matter, giving Members the opportunity to raise their concerns on the many wider implications that, it appears, are not currently being considered?

My second and final point concerns a matter that I, and others, have raised many times regarding the closure of Her Majesty's Revenue and Customs offices. We are told that the major driver for this is efficiency savings, but the Public and Commercial Services Union has again written to all Members stating that the proposals are nothing less than a desire to centralise functions and staff, with little or no regard to other aspects of the service on the front line. As I have said many times, the former Paymaster General, Dawn Primarolo, and the present Financial Secretary to the Treasury, Jane Kennedy, have both committed the

Given that a meeting has already been held between you and the Minister for health, I feel that that would be the best way to proceed, rather than having a debate in the Chamber—at least not at present.

Mark Isherwood: Fel y byddwch yn ymwybodol, mae cynigion ar gyfer rhwydweithiau cyngor cyfreithiol cymunedol yn bodoli ar gyfer wyth ardal gomisiynu yng Nghymru, a deallaf fod bwriad i sefydlu'r rhwydwaith cyntaf erbyn mis Ebrill y flwyddyn nesaf. Mae canolfannau Cyngor ar Bopeth a Chyngor ar Bopeth fel corff cenedlaethol wedi mynegi pryder nad yw'r model sy'n cael ei ddatblygu ar gyfer comisiynu a chontractio yn adlewyrchu gwerth ehangach y gwasanaeth a ddarperir i gymdeithas sifil yng Nghymru, ac o'u safbwynt nhw, byddai colli'r contract sengl o bosibl yn ergyd farwol i'r gwasanaeth yng Nghymru, a chofio bod colli'r contractau cyfatebol yn Hull a Chaerlŷr wedi arwain at ddiddymu canolfannau cyngor ar bopeth a'r gwasanaeth yn llwyr yn yr ardaloedd hynny.

Yn ogystal â'r gwasanaethau y byddai'r Comisiwn Gwasanaethau Cyfreithiol a'r cyrff hyn yn eu darparu, byddai llawer o'r gwasanaethau ychwanegol a ddarperir gan ganolfannau cyngor ar bopeth yn cael eu colli. A allwn gael datganiad am y mater hwn os gwelwch yn dda, gan roi cyfle i Aelodau fynegi eu pryderon am y goblygiadau ehangach niferus nad ydynt yn cael eu hystyried, yn ôl pob golwg, ar hyn o bryd?

Mae fy ail bwynt, sef fy mhwynt olaf, yn ymwneud â mater yr wyf fi, a sawl un arall, wedi'i godi droeon, sef cau swyddfeydd Cyllid a Thollau Ei Mawrhydi. Dywedir wrthym mai arbedion effeithiolrwydd yw'r prif yrrwr yn hyn o beth, ond mae Undeb y Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus a Masnachol wedi ysgrifennu at yr holl aelodau unwaith eto yn datgan nad yw'r cynigion yn ddim llai nag awydd i ganoli swyddogaethau a staff, gan anwybyddu agweddau eraill ar y gwasanaeth ar y rheng flaen bron yn llwyr. Fel yr wyf wedi'i ddweud droeon, mae'r Tâl-feistr Cyffredinol blaenorol, Dawn Primarolo, ac Ysgrifennydd Ariannol presennol y

department to undertaking detailed and meaningful consultation with the Assembly Government to explore all possible alternatives to closure, relocation and centralisation. However, the union says that, during the Cardiff and Swansea urban centre reviews, consultation between HMRC and the Assembly Government was, at best, minimal and, at worst, virtually non-existent. The union fears that the level of meaningful consultation on the latest round of reviews will be equally low and appeals to politicians of all parties to urge the Government to meet its pledges for consultation. That is clearly a matter on which the Assembly Government needs to take ownership. It is not sufficient simply to state that this is not a devolved matter, and therefore I once again ask for a Government statement on this matter.

Carwyn Jones: As I have stated previously, meetings are taking place between Government officials and the HMRC change team. The last meeting was held on 13 June and more meetings are scheduled. Therefore, there has been regular engagement from the Assembly Government's end with HMRC. Notwithstanding the fact that it is not a devolved issue—and we all know that—there has been engagement on our part to ensure that our views are put forward on behalf of the people whom we represent.

Citizens' advice bureaux undoubtedly provide a broader service than that envisaged by the proposed community service. I do not doubt that many of us in the Chamber have had occasion to refer constituents to a citizens' advice bureau from time to time for advice on a particular issue. We need to make sure that there is more than adequate legal advice available to people who cannot afford it, and that, in providing that, we do not impinge on the ability of organisations like Citizens Advice to provide the advice that they give on a wide range of issues. I would hope that the two will run hand in hand.

Nick Ramsay: Could the Leader of the House arrange for a statement from the

Trysorlys, Jane Kennedy, ill dwy wedi ymrwymo'r adran i gynnal ymgynghoriad manwl ac ystyrllon gyda Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i archwilio pob dewis posibl arall yn hytrach na chau, ail-leoli a chanoli. Fodd bynnag, dywed yr undeb, yn ystod adolygiadau canolfannau trefol Abertawe a Chaerdydd, ar y gorau prin iawn oedd yr ymgynghori rhwng Cyllid a Thollau Ei Mawrhydi a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ond ar y gwaethaf yr oedd yn hollol absennol. Mae'r undeb yn ofni y bydd lefel yr ymgynghori ystyrllon yn y rownd ddiweddaraf o adolygiadau yr un mor isel ac maent yn apelio ar wleidyddion o bob plaid i annog y Llywodraeth i gadw at eu haddewidion i ymgynghori. Yn amlwg, mae hwnnw'n fater y mae angen i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad hawlio perchnogaeth drosto. Nid yw'n ddigon datgan yn syml nad yw hwn yn fater a ddatganolwyd, felly gofynnaf unwaith eto am ddatganiad gan y Llywodraeth am y mater hwn.

Carwyn Jones: Fel y dywedais o'r blaen, mae cyfarfodydd yn cael eu cynnal rhwng swyddogion o'r Llywodraeth a thîm newid Chyllid a Thollau Ei Mawrhydi. Cynhaliwyd y cyfarfod diwethaf ar 13 Mehefin ac mae mwy o gyfarfodydd wedi'u trefnu. Felly, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ymgysylltu'n rheolaidd â Chyllid a Thollau Ei Mawrhydi. Er gwaethaf y ffaith nad yw hwn yn fater a ddatganolwyd—ac yr ydym i gyd yn gwybod hynny—yr ydym wedi ymgysylltu i sicrhau bod ein safbwyntiau'n cael eu cyflwyno ar ran y bobl yr ydym yn eu cynrychioli.

Nid oes dwywaith bod canolfannau cyngor ar bopeth yn darparu gwasanaeth ehangach nag a ragwelwyd gan y gwasanaeth cymunedol arfaethedig. Nid wyf yn amau bod llawer ohonom yn y Siambr wedi cyfeirio etholwyr at ganolfan cyngor ar bopeth o bryd i'w gilydd i gael cyngor am fater penodol. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod cyngor cyfreithiol mwy na digonol ar gael i bobl nad ydynt yn gallu ei fforddio, ac nad ydym, wrth ddarparu hynny, yn tarfu ar allu mudiadau fel Cyngor ar Bopeth i ddarparu'r cyngor a roddant ar amrywiaeth eang o faterion. Byddwn yn gobeithio y bydd y ddau yn cyd-redeg.

Nick Ramsay: A allai Arweinydd y Tŷ drefnu bod y Gweinidog dros Faterion

Minister for Rural Affairs, giving an update on bluetongue in Wales? I have been contacted by a number of farmers who are concerned about delays in the roll-out of the vaccination due to faulty batches of vaccine and other reasons. I would very much appreciate it if we could have an update on that situation.

Carwyn Jones: I can tell you that the bluetongue restricted zone in Wales, as I informed the Assembly last week, has been amended to include Brecon market. On 19 December 2007, the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs ordered 22.5 million doses of vaccine, of which, 2.5 million doses were reserved for Wales. On 12 June, an order was placed for a further 13 million doses of vaccine, 5 million of which are for Wales, and they are expected to be delivered during the summer.

The batch of vaccine that was expected originally on 2 June has been delayed because it had to undergo further testing before it could be released. Consequently, the declaration of a protection zone in south-east Wales, which would then enable vaccination to take place, has had to be postponed until that vaccine is released. We hope that the vaccine will be available as quickly as possible.

Nick Bourne: There are a couple of issues that I could raise with the Leader of the House. The first concerns the national parks in Wales. Could we have a debate on the national parks in Government time? To be fair to the Minister for Environment, Sustainability and Housing, I know that she is looking at this issue, but there are issues of accountability for the way in which the parks are organised and planning issues concerning all three parks, but particularly the Brecon Beacons National Park. I realise that you, and indeed the Minister, cannot comment on individual cases, but there are some notorious cases, such as the Gilestone caravan park decision. Therefore, it is important that we look at this as an Assembly, and I would be grateful for your thoughts on that.

Gwledig yn gwneud datganiad er mwyn rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y tafod glas yng Nghymru? Mae nifer o ffermwyr wedi cysylltu â mi yn poeni am yr oedi wrth gyflwyno'r brechiad oherwydd bod nam ar sypiau o frechiadau ac am resymau eraill. Byddwn yn gwerthfawrogi'n fawr petaem yn gallu cael y newyddion diweddaraf am y sefyllfa.

Carwyn Jones: Gallaf ddweud wrthyf fod y parth dan gyfyngiadau oherwydd y tafod glas yng Nghymru, fel y dywedais wrth y Cynulliad yr wythnos diwethaf, wedi cael ei ddiwygio i gynnwys marchnad Aberhonddu. Ar 19 Rhagfyr 2007, archebodd Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig 22.5 miliwn dos o'r brechlyn ac yr oedd 2.5 miliwn dos wedi'u cadw ar gyfer Cymru. Ar 12 Mehefin, gwnaethpwyd archeb arall am 13 miliwn dos ychwanegol o'r brechlyn ac mae 5 miliwn ohono ar gyfer Cymru, a disgwylir y caiff y rhain eu danfon yn ystod yr haf.

Mae'r swp o frechlyn a oedd i gyrraedd yn wreiddiol ar 2 Mehefin wedi cael ei ohirio oherwydd bu'n rhaid cynnal rhagor o brofion arno cyn y gellid ei ryddhau. O ganlyniad, bu'n rhaid gohirio datgan parth gwarchod yn y de ddwyrain, a fyddai'n golygu y gellid rhoi'r brechiad, nes bo'r brechlyn hwnnw'n cael ei ryddhau. Gobeithiwn y bydd y brechlyn ar gael cyn gynted â phosibl.

Nick Bourne: Mae un neu ddau fater y gallwn eu codi gydag Arweinydd y Tŷ. Mae'r un cyntaf yn ymwneud â'r parciau cenedlaethol yng Nghymru. A allwn gael trafodaeth am y parciau cenedlaethol yn ystod amser y Llywodraeth? I fod yn deg i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynaliadwyedd a Thai, gwn ei bod yn edrych ar y mater hwn, ond mae materion yn ymwneud ag atebolrwydd yn y modd y caiff y parciau eu trefnu a materion cynllunio'n ymwneud â'r tri pharc, ond yn enwedig Parc Cenedlaethol Bannau Brycheiniog. Sylweddolaf na allwch chi, na'r Gweinidog yn wir, roi sylw ar achosion unigol, ond y mae ambell achos drwg-enwog, fel penderfyniad parc carafanau Gilestone. Felly, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn edrych ar hyn fel Cynulliad, a byddwn yn ddiolchgar am eich

sylwadau ar hynny.

Secondly, I wish to support Bethan Jenkins—although I am not sure whether she has the support of her own frontbench—on her desire for a debate on the monarchy. My party would very much welcome a debate on the monarchy's contribution to Wales. In common with many people, I strongly believe in the constitutional monarchy, as do many Plaid Cymru voters—or perhaps past Plaid Cymru voters—and at least one Plaid Cymru Assembly Member.

Yn ail, hoffwn gefnogi Bethan Jenkins—er nad wyf yn siŵr a oes ganddi gefnogaeth ei mainc flaen ei hun—yn ei hawydd am ddadl ar y frenhiniaeth. Byddai fy mhlaidd i'n croesawu'n fawr iawn ddadl ar gyfraniad y frenhiniaeth i Gymru. Yn gyffredin â llawer o bobl, credaf yn gryf yn y frenhiniaeth gyfansoddiadol, fel y gwna llawer o bleidleiswyr Plaid Cymru—neu efallai rai a bleidleisiodd dros Plaid Cymru yn y gorffennol—ac o leiaf un Aelod Cynulliad Plaid Cymru.

Carwyn Jones: As I have already mentioned, Government time is extremely limited between now and 15 July; it is open to the opposition parties to table a debate on anything that they believe that is relevant, and Nick has made that point. The same applies to the national parks. My colleague, Jane Davidson, has taken an active role in looking at many issues within the national parks, particularly in terms of planning. The national parks play an extremely important role in developing the countryside and the rural economy in Wales. Let us not forget that national parks—at least in the UK—are areas where people live and work, and it is important that any development is sensitive to people's needs, as well as the overriding statutory duty that is placed on the national parks due to the primary legislation that affects their governance.

Carwyn Jones: Fel y crybwyllais eisoes, mae amser y Llywodraeth yn eithriadol o gyfyngedig rhwng nawr a 15 Gorffennaf; mae'n agored i'r gwrthbleidiau gyflwyno dadl ar unrhyw beth y credant ei fod yn berthnasol, ac mae Nick wedi gwneud y pwynt hwnnw. Mae'r un peth yn wir am y parciau cenedlaethol. Mae fy nghyd-Weinidog, Jane Davidson, wedi cymryd rôl weithredol o ran edrych ar sawl mater o fewn y parciau cenedlaethol, yn enwedig yn nhermau cynllunio. Mae'r parciau cenedlaethol yn chwarae rhan eithriadol o bwysig yn natblygiad cefn gwlad a'r economi gwledig yng Nghymru. Na foed inni anghofio bod parciau cenedlaethol—yn y Deyrnas Unedig, o leiaf—yn ardaloedd lle mae pobl yn byw ac yn gweithio, ac mae'n bwysig fod unrhyw ddatblygiad yn sensitif i anghenion pobl, yn ogystal â'r ddyletswydd statudol hollbwysig a osodir ar y parciau cenedlaethol oherwydd y ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol sy'n effeithio ar eu rheolaeth.

**Datganiad am Argymhellion gan Grŵp Cynghori'r Gweinidog—Ymagwedd
Newydd tuag at Ddatblygu Economaidd
Statement on Recommendations from the Ministerial Advisory Group—A New
Approach to Economic Development**

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Mae gan Lywodraeth Cymru'n Un weledigaeth glir ar gyfer economi gref a mentrus, ynghyd â chyflogaeth lawn yn seiliedig ar swyddi o ansawdd. Ein dyhead yw creu mwy o gyfoeth i'r genedl hon a'i phobl, newid cydbwysedd ein patrymau cyflogaeth, canolbwyntio'n fanylach ar gymorth busnes, a rhoi i'n gweithlu y

The Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport (Ieuan Wyn Jones): The One Wales Government has a clear vision for a strong and enterprising economy and full employment based on quality jobs. Our aspiration is to increase the wealth of this nation and its people, to bring a rebalance to our employment patterns, to have a clearer focus to business support and to give our workforce

gefnogeth a'r sgiliau y mae arnynt hwy a'u diwydiannau eu hangen. Drwy wneud hyn, yr ydym yn cryfhau'r sector preifat.

the support and the skills they and their industries need. By doing this we strengthen the private sector.

Wrth reswm, bydd y diwydiannau traddodiadol yn parhau i chwarae rhan bwysig yn y dyfodol. Serch hynny, bydd yn rhaid i'r rôl hon fod yn rhan o economi amrywiol, gan sicrhau twf cynaliadwy yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain a thu hwnt. Bydd yn economi a all ymateb i anghenion a chyfleoedd lleol, cenedlaethol a byd-eang, ac wynebu amodau economaidd heriol.

Traditional industries will of course continue to play an important role in the future. However, this will have to be as part of a diverse economy, ensuring sustainable growth in the twenty-first century and beyond. It will be an economy that can respond to local, national and global needs and opportunities, and face challenging economic conditions.

Yr ydym am greu sefyllfa lle bydd Cymru yn ffynnu, yn hytrach na goroesi'n unig. Er mwyn cyflawni hyn, rhaid i ni ganolbwyntio mwy ar y sectorau a all sicrhau'r canlyniadau yr ydym am eu gweld a chreu'r cyfoeth mwyaf. Mae Cymru yn ddigon bach i allu ymateb yn gyflym ac ar frys i heriau o'r fath, ac mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn benderfynol o sbarduno newid a thwf er mwyn gwireddu ein gweledigaeth. Rhaid i ni dderbyn bellach nad yw bod yn gystadleuol yn golygu bod yn rhaid i ni gystadlu â marchnadoedd yn Asia a dwyrain Ewrop o ran costau isel. Ein nod yw ychwanegu gwerth at ein heconomi a gosod sylfeini cadarn ar gyfer y tymor hir. Mae angen i ni fod yn fwy craff a gwneud mwy na dim ond creu a diogelu swyddi beth bynnag fo'u gwerth.

We want to create a situation where the Welsh economy does not merely survive, but thrives. In order to achieve that, we have to be more focused on the sectors that can achieve the desired outcomes and generate the greatest wealth. Wales is small enough to respond with pace and urgency to such challenges, and the Assembly Government is determined to drive change and growth to deliver on our vision. We must now accept that being competitive does not mean that we have to rival emerging markets in Asia and eastern Europe on low cost. Our goal is to add value to our economy and lay strong foundations for the long term. We need to be cleverer than just creating and safeguarding jobs whatever their value.

Rhaid i'n huchelgais hefyd fod ynghlwm wrth y broses o roi argymhellion yr adolygiad o fasnacheiddio ar waith, a hynny mewn partneriaeth â phrifysgolion ac â'r sector preifat. Rhaid i ni fuddsoddi mwy ym maes ymchwil a datblygu yn ein sefydliadau, cadw at yr ymrwymadau a wnaethom yn 'Cymru'n Un' i hybu gwaith ymchwil, a sicrhau'r fantais fasnachol fwyaf. Ar yr un pryd, yr ydym am sicrhau bod pobl sydd ar hyn o bryd yn anweithgar yn economaidd yn gallu ymuno â'r farchnad lafur. Er mwyn cyrraedd ein nod o sicrhau bod 80 y cant mewn cyflogaeth lawn, yr ydym wrthi'n datblygu dull integredig o weithio ar draws Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Byddwn yn gweithio'n agos â Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig ar y mater hwn i weld ble a sut y gallwn ategu'r ddarpariaeth brif ffrwd.

Our ambition must also be linked with the implementation of the recommendations of the commercialisation review in partnership with universities and the private sector. We must increase research and development investment in our institutions, meet our 'One Wales' research commitments, and derive maximum commercial benefit. At the same time, we want to ensure that people who are currently economically inactive can enter the labour market. To meet our goal of full employment at a rate of 80 per cent, we are developing an integrated approach across the Assembly Government. We will work closely with the UK Government on this to find where and how we can complement mainstream provision.

Nid yw bod yn amrywiol yn golygu bod yn

Being diverse does not mean that we have to

rhaid i ni ragori ym mhob dim. Heb strategaeth glir sy'n canolbwyntio ar yr economi, byddem mewn perygl o fethu â chyrraedd ein potensial a sicrhau'r gwerth gorau am arian wrth fuddsoddi yn y sector cyhoeddus a'r sector preifat.

3.20 p.m.

Ein bwriad yw deall ein cryfderau a gwybod lle mae angen i ni ganolbwyntio ein hymdrechion at y dyfodol. Dyna pam mae grŵp cynghori'r Gweinidog ar yr economi a thrafnidiaeth wedi cynnal dadansoddiad trylwyr o economi Cymru. Ein nod fel Llywodraeth yw sicrhau bod Cymru mewn sefyllfa i fanteisio ar gyfleoedd newydd yn sgîl technolegau newydd a newidiadau byd-eang. Er mwyn cyflawni hyn, bu'r grŵp cynghori yn edrych ar berfformiad cyfredol, y rhagolygon hirdymor a thuaddiadau cymdeithasol, economaidd a gwleidyddol ehangach. Er mwyn hybu twf hirdymor a chynaliadwy, argymhellodd y grŵp y dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ganolbwyntio ar 14 sector allweddol.

I have considered the ministerial advisory group's advice carefully and discussed the detail at length with my officials and Cabinet colleagues. In light of those discussions, I have decided to accept the following recommendations. The agreed list of sectors starts with three core or enabling sectors, which are of significant importance to the economy and, therefore, our top priorities. They are: energy and the pursuit of clean and renewable energy generation and supply; environmental management based on the need to minimise energy use and maximise energy efficiency, both in industry and in domestic settings; and telecommunications and information and communications technology, which is the backbone and key enabler of the knowledge economy. Both are high-growth sectors in their own right.

Next are six sectors that are not necessarily enabling, but which are strategically important to Wales. These sectors are bioscience, health, financial services/products and professional services, creative industries, automotive and aerospace. Finally, five sectors have been identified that are

be good at everything. Without a clear, focused, strategy for the economy, we would risk failure to reach our potential and to obtain best value for money from both public sector and private sector investment.

Our intention is to understand where our strengths lie and where we need to focus our efforts for the future. That is why the ministerial advisory group on the economy and transport has undertaken an exhaustive analysis of the Welsh economy. Our aim as a Government is to ensure that Wales is positioned in such a way that we can take advantage of new opportunities as a result of emerging global changes and new technologies. In order to achieve this, the ministerial advisory group looked at current performance, long-term prospects and wider social, economic and political trends. In order to encourage long-term, sustainable growth, the group recommended that the Assembly Government should focus on 14 key sectors.

Yr wyf wedi ystyried cyngor grŵp cynghori'r Gweinidog yn ofalus, ac wedi trafod y manylion yn fanwl gyda fy swyddogion a'm cyd-Weinidogion. Yng ngoleuni'r trafodaethau hynny, yr wyf wedi penderfynu derbyn yr argymhellion canlynol. Mae rhestr y sectorau y cytunwyd arnynt yn dechrau gyda thri sector craidd neu sector galluogi, sydd o bwys mawr i'r economi ac yr ydym, felly, am roi'r brif flaenoriaeth iddynt. Y sectorau hynny yw: ynni a cheisio cynhyrchu a chyflenwi ynni glân ac adnewyddadwy; rheoli'r amgylchedd ar sail yr angen i ddefnyddio llai o ynni a'i ddefnyddio mewn ffordd mor effeithlon â phosibl mewn diwydiant ac yn ein cartrefi; a thelathrebu a thechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu, sef asgwrn cefn a phrif gyfrwng galluogi'r economi wybodaeth. Mae'r ddau yn sectorau twf uchel ynddynt eu hunain.

Yna daw chwe sector nad ydynt o anghenraid yn sectorau galluogi, ond sydd o bwys strategol i Gymru. Y sectorau hyn yw biowyddoniaeth, iechyd, gwasanaethau/cynnyrch ariannol a gwasanaethau proffesiynol, diwydiannau creadigol, y sector modurol a'r sector awyrafod. Yn olaf, mae

economically important to Wales and the world, but less strategic for developing our competitive advantage. These sectors are construction, food, defence, retail, and leisure and tourism. Focusing on these sectors does not close Wales for business in other sectors where there might be start-up, growth or inward investment opportunities. We recognise that there are already successful companies in other sectors, and we remain committed to supporting enterprise and innovation. We know that we will need to be flexible within the key sectors and keep the sectors list under review.

Having said that, let us not underestimate the change that this focus represents. The key sectors have been at the heart of the restructuring of my department. We now have dedicated sector teams for both policy and delivery. In our action plan, we have agreement across the Assembly Government on joining up our economic levers. As MAG recognised, joint working is particularly important, and it is rapidly becoming a key feature of the One Wales Government. Flexible support for business offers a new way of investing in our key sectors, from the single investment fund to the JEREMIE venture. However, flexibility requires breadth, and the message that I am getting from businesses in all sectors is that skills is a key issue. Guided by 'Skills That Work for Wales', we will listen to, and act on, the employer voice. My officials are working closely with Jane Hutt's officials to integrate skills within flexible support for business. The Welsh offer to investors is crucial, and the right skills mix is part of a package that includes infrastructure, natural assets and the built environment.

My other two priorities—in addition to business support and commercialisation—are regeneration and transport. We need to create an environment for growth, and ensure that it meets the needs of our key sectors.

pum sector wedi'u nodi sydd o bwys economaidd i Gymru a'r byd ond sydd yn llai strategol o ran datblygu ein mantais gystadleuol. Y rhain yw adeiladu, bwyd, amddiffyn, manwerthu a hamdden a thwristiaeth. Nid yw'r ffaith ein bod yn rhoi sylw i'r sectorau hyn yn golygu bod Cymru ar gau i fusnesau mewn sectorau eraill pan fydd cyfleoedd yn codi o ran dechrau busnes, twf neu fuddsoddi mewnol. Yr ydym yn cydnabod bod cwmnïau llwyddiannus eisoes yn bodoli mewn sectorau eraill, ac yr ydym yn dal yn benderfynol o gefnogi mentergarwch ac arloesed. Gwyddom y bydd angen i ni fod yn hyblyg o fewn y prif sectorau a chadw golwg ar restr y sectorau yn rheolaidd.

Wedi dweud hynny, ni ddylem ddiystyru'r newid sy'n digwydd yn sgil y ffocws hwn. Mae'r prif sectorau wedi chwarae rhan ganolog yn y broses o ailstrwythuro fy adran i. Bellach, mae gennym dimau sector wedi'u neilltuo ar gyfer llunio polisi a gweithredu'r polisi hwnnw. Yn ein cynllun gweithredu, mae gennym gytundeb ar draws Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gydgyssylltu'n dulliau o sbarduno'r economi. Fel yr oedd y grŵp cynghori yn cydnabod, mae cydweithio'n arbennig o bwysig, ac mae'n prysur ddod yn un o brif nodweddion Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un. Mae gwasanaeth cymorth hyblyg i fusnes yn cynnig ffyrdd newydd o fuddsoddi yn ein prif sectorau, o'r gronfa fuddsoddi sengl i fenter JEREMIE. Ond mae bod yn hyblyg yn gofyn am ehangder, a'r negeseuon yr wyf yn eu derbyn gan fusnesau ym mhob sector yw bod sgiliau yn fater allweddol. Dan arweiniad 'Sgiliau sy'n Gweithio i Gymru', byddwn yn gwrandao ar lais y cyflogwr ac yn gweithredu arno. Mae fy swyddogion i'n gweithio'n agos â swyddogion Jane Hutt i integreiddio sgiliau o fewn y gwasanaeth cymorth hyblyg i fusnes. Mae'r hyn y mae Cymru yn ei gynnig i fuddsoddwr yn fater o'r pwys mwyaf, ac mae'r cymysgedd cywir o sgiliau'n rhan o becyn sy'n cynnwys seilwaith, asedau naturiol a'r amgylchedd adeiledig.

Y ddau faes arall yr wyf am roi blaenoriaeth iddynt, ar wahân i gymorth busnes a masnacheiddio, yw adfywio a thrafnidiaeth. Mae angen i ni greu amgylchedd ar gyfer twf, a sicrhau ei fod yn diwallu anghenion ein prif sectorau.

Sustainability is extremely important in its own right, but also in economic terms—it can mean efficiency and being more attractive for customers and investors. I am working closely with Jane Davidson on our green jobs strategy and on ensuring that businesses can access high-quality advice and support on issues such as resource efficiency. We will also be working closely with the construction sector on sustainability.

They have a key role to play in helping us implement BREEAM standards and ensure high-quality housing and premises throughout Wales.

The sectoral approach cuts across all our portfolios: from health to heritage to housing, and from rural affairs to regeneration. The analysis has been completed, we have the appetite, and we have the tools. This is an ambitious agenda, but by working together across the Assembly Government and with businesses, we will deliver more and better jobs, and increased prosperity for the people of Wales.

David Melding: I thank the Deputy First Minister for his statement. I also welcome the work of the ministerial advisory group. Broadly, the recommendations are cogent. The whole approach allows us to focus on the outcomes, and progress will now be made towards forming an action plan. The broad strategic objectives are no different to those identified three or four years ago, or even nine years ago when the Assembly first came into being. Indeed, there is a large amount of political consensus on where our economy needs to grow, where it is weak and what the challenges are. There are some points of difference, which I will come to, but the broad direction of travel is accepted. However, there are problems with performance, and most of the critical indicators have moved in the wrong direction. There are some that are broadly better, but, overall, there are far too many indicators that are pointing in the wrong direction.

I was pleased to hear the Deputy First

Mae bod yn gynaliadwy nid yn unig yn hynod bwysig ynddo'i hun, ond hefyd o ran yr economi—gall olygu bod yn effeithlon ac yn fwy deniadol i gwsmeriaid a buddsoddwyr. Yr wyf yn gweithio'n agos â Jane Davidson ar ein strategaeth ar gyfer swyddi gwyrdd ac ar sicrhau y gall busnesau gael cyngor a chefnogaeth o ansawdd uchel ar faterion fel defnyddio adnoddau'n effeithlon. Byddwn hefyd yn gweithio'n agos gyda'r diwydiant adeiladu ar gynaliadwyedd.

Mae ganddynt ran allweddol i'w chwarae wrth ein helpu i roi safonau BREEAM ar waith ac i sicrhau bod gennym dai a safleoedd o safon ledled Cymru.

Mae'r ymagwedd sectoraidd hon yn berthnasol i bob un o'n portffolios: o amaethyddiaeth i adfywio, ac o drestadaeth i dai. Mae'r dadansoddiad wedi'i gwblhau, mae gennym yr awydd ac mae gennym yr arfau. Mae hon yn agenda uchelgeisiol, ond drwy gydweithio ar draws Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a chyda busnesau, byddwn yn sicrhau mwy o swyddi a swyddi gwell, a dyfodol mwy llewyrchus i bobl Cymru.

David Melding: Diolch i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog am ei ddatganiad. Yr wyf finnau hefyd yn croesawu gwaith grŵp cynghori'r Gweinidog. Yn gyffredinol, mae'r argymhellion yn rymus. Mae'r holl ymagwedd yn caniatáu inni ganolbwyntio ar y canlyniadau, a symudir ymlaen yn awr at ffurfio cynllun gweithredu. Nid yw'r amcanion strategol bras yn ddim gwahanol i'r rhai a nodwyd dair neu bedair blynedd yn ôl, neu hyd yn oed naw mlynedd yn ôl pan ddaeth y Cynulliad i fodolaeth gyntaf. Yn wir, mae cryn dipyn o gonsensws gwleidyddol ynghylch ble mae angen i'n heconomi dyfu, ble mae'n wan a beth yw'r heriau. Mae rhai pwyntiau o wahaniaeth, a deuaif at y rheini, ond derbynnir cyfeiriad cyffredinol y daith. Fodd bynnag, y mae problemau gyda pherfformiad, ac mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r dangosyddion critigol wedi symud i'r cyfeiriad anghywir. Ceir rhai sydd yn gyffredinol well, ond ar y cyfan, mae llawer gormod o ddangosyddion sydd yn pwyntio i'r cyfeiriad anghywir.

Yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed y Dirprwy Brif

Minister committing to strengthening the private sector. That is hugely important, and reflects widespread opinion in the business sector and among politicians of all parties. I would only urge him to go a little further. We need a stronger and larger private sector, generating more of our national wealth.

The importance of energy generation and conservation is something that we all agree on. However, the big issues before us are not being addressed, and perhaps it is not yet time to address them, because they are so sensitive. For instance, what part will the Assembly play in questions such as will we have nuclear generation in Wales and what will happen to the Severn barrage if that scheme is thought to be feasible? Will we be taking part in these decisions or will they all be made at an UK level?

The increase in research and development in our economy and exploiting technology is key to driving up productivity levels. In terms of skills, I agree with the Minister. The voices of employers and employees are vital in order to create the demand for the skills that will truly work for Wales.

I have specific points in relation to the action plan. On recommendation 2, on the skills lever, I would like some detail on how the strong voices of employers and employees will be heard. How far are you going to take the Webb recommendations? We need detail on this soon.

On recommendation 3, on getting the best value for the public pound for our economy, that is hugely important. So much of our economy is taken up by the public sector, but that in itself can be a driver for all sorts of economic change, transformation and improvement. It is the right approach to say that the lever has to be used. However, one hand is tied behind your back, Deputy First Minister, because this Government has committed itself to excluding the private sector from the largest portion of public spending, which is the spending on the health service. I would ask you, in the interest of the Welsh economy, to revisit this, or at least to

Weinidog yn ymrwymo i gryfhau'r sector preifat. Mae hynny'n aruthrol o bwysig, ac yn adlewyrchu'r farn a rennir gan lawer yn y sector busnes ac ymhlith gwleidyddion o bob plaid. Y cyfan a wnawn i fyddai ei annog i fynd ychydig ymhellach. Mae arnom angen sector cyhoeddus cryfach a mwy, yn cynhyrchu mwy o'n cyfoeth cenedlaethol.

Mae pwysigrwydd cynhyrchu ac arbed ynni yn rhywbeth yr ydym i gyd yn cytuno arno. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r materion mawr o'n blaenau yn cael sylw, ac efallai nad yw'n amser rhoi sylw iddynt eto, am eu bod mor sensitif. Er enghraifft, pa ran y bydd y Cynulliad yn ei chwarae mewn cwestiynau megis a gawn gynhyrchu niwclear yng Nghymru a beth fydd yn digwydd i forglawdd Hafren os bernir bod y cynllun hwnnw'n ddichonadwy? A fyddwn ni'n cymryd rhan yn y penderfyniadau hyn ynteu a gânt i gyd eu gwneud ar lefel y Deyrnas Unedig?

Mae'r cynnydd mewn ymchwil a datblygu yn ein heconomi a defnyddio technoleg yn allweddol i yrru lefelau cynhyrchiant i fyny. O ran sgiliau, cytunaf â'r Gweinidog. Mae lleisiau cyflogwyr a gweithwyr yn hollbwysig er mwyn creu'r galw am y sgiliau a wnaiff weithio i Gymru go iawn.

Mae gennyf bwyntiau penodol ynglŷn â'r cynllun gweithredu. Ar argymhelliad 2, ynglŷn â'r trosol sgiliau, hoffwn fanylion am sut y bydd lleisiau cryf cyflogwyr a gweithwyr yn cael eu clywed. Pa mor bell yr ydych yn bwriadu mynd ag argymhellion Webb? Mae angen manylion am hyn yn fuan.

Ar argymhelliad 3, ynghylch cael y gwerth gorau am y bunt gyhoeddus i'n heconomi, mae hynny'n aruthrol o bwysig. Mae cymaint o'n heconomi wedi'i gymryd gan y sector cyhoeddus, ond gall hynny ynddo'i hun fod yn ysgogiad dros bob math o newid, trawsnewid a gwelliant economaidd. Dweud bod yn rhaid defnyddio'r trosol yw'r ffordd iawn i fynd o'i chwmpas hi. Fodd bynnag, mae un llaw wedi'i chlymu y tu ôl i'ch cefn, Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog, oherwydd mae'r Llywodraeth hon wedi ymrwymo i eithrio'r sector preifat o'r gyfran fwyaf o wario cyhoeddus, sef y gwario ar y gwasanaeth iechyd. Gofynnaf ichi, er budd economi

ask the members of the ministerial advisory group to look at whether it now needs to be reappraised.

On recommendation 6, on investing in the potential for private funding solutions for our infrastructure, and in particular for transport, we are in danger of facing an infrastructure deficit compared to the rest of the UK, because of our reluctance to use public-private partnerships. We heard about it in the Confederation of British Industry annual lunch last week, and we must be careful. I know that this is in layer 2 of your response, but it does ask you to investigate the feasibility of using more private funding. I hope that you will do that as a matter of urgency.

3.30 p.m.

I agree with the members of the ministerial advisory group that we need to increase productivity. That is probably the biggest strategic goal ahead of us, and it will require better telecommunications, better professional and business services, better management skills—let us not forget that when we talk about skills, we also have to drive up leadership skills—and, to return to the previous point, better transport infrastructure.

The Deputy First Minister: Thank you for that largely positive response, David, and for welcoming the focus that we have on outcomes, as you clearly point out. There now appears to be consensus on the direction of travel, at least. I do not think that there were any problems about the Government's statement that we wish to strengthen the private sector; clearly, we have to do that if we are to generate the wealth that will enable everyone to become more prosperous. Nevertheless, I am not quite sure why that should always be at the expense of the public sector. We have a large public sector in Wales, but growing the private sector does not always have to be at the expense of the public sector, and that is what we are seeking to achieve.

You mentioned nuclear energy and the

Cymru, ailystyried hyn, neu o leiaf ofyn i aelodau grŵp cynghori'r Gweinidog edrych a oes angen ei ailasesu bellach.

Ar argymhelliad 6, ynglŷn â buddsoddi yn y potensial ar gyfer atebion cyllid preifat i'n hisadeiledd, ac yn enwedig i drafnidiaeth, yr ydym mewn perygl o wynebu diffyg isadeileddol o'i gymharu â gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig, oherwydd ein hamharodrwydd i ddefnyddio partneriaethau cyhoeddus-preifat. Clywsom am hyn yng nghinio blynyddol Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain yr wythnos diwethaf, a rhaid inni fod yn ofalus. Gwn fod hwn yn haen 2 o'ch ymateb, ond mae'n gofyn i chi ymchwilio i ddichonolrwydd defnyddio mwy o arian preifat. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y gwnewch hynny ar fyrder.

Yr wyf yn cytuno ag aelodau grŵp cynghori'r gweinidog bod angen inni gynyddu cynhyrchiant. Dyna'r amcan strategol mwyaf o bosibl sy'n ein hwynebu, a bydd angen gwell telathrebu, gwell gwasanaethau proffesiynol a busnes, gwell sgiliau rheoli—ac wrth siarad am sgiliau, peidiwch ag anghofio bod angen inni wella sgiliau arweinyddiaeth hefyd—a chan ddychwelyd at y pwynt blaenorol, gwell seilwaith trafnidiaeth.

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Diolch am ateb yn gadarnhaol ar y cyfan, David, ac am groesawu'r ffocws yr ydym yn ei roi ar ganlyniadau, fel yr ydych yn ei nodi'n eglur. Bellach ymddengys bod consensws ynghylch cyfeiriad y siwrnai, o leiaf. Ni chredaf y bu unrhyw broblemau ynghylch datganiad y Llywodraeth i'r perwyl ein bod yn dymuno atgyfnerthu'r sector preifat; mae'n amlwg bod angen inni wneud hynny os ydym am gynhyrchu'r cyfoeth a fydd yn galluogi pawb i fod yn fwy ffyniannus. Er hynny, nid wyf yn gwbl sicr pam y dylai hynny ddigwydd ar draul y sector cyhoeddus bob tro. Mae gennym sector cyhoeddus mawr yng Nghymru, ond nid oes rhaid i dwf sector preifat bob amser ddigwydd ar draul y sector cyhoeddus, a dyna yr ydym yn ceisio ei gyflawni.

Soniasoch am ynni niwclear a morglawdd

Severn barrage. We cannot take decisions on those issues in the Assembly, therefore, through the ministerial advisory group recommendations, we were trying to see what levers the Assembly can currently use to move that forward.

I agree that we need to develop research and development and exploit technology. In the short period that I have been a Minister, I have been encouraged by the new atmosphere within the higher education and private sectors, and in Government, with all working much more closely together on this particular agenda. Not only are the different sectors working together more, but the higher education sector itself is working together much more to deliver this. It is clear that if the Welsh economy is to be more resilient to downturns, not only does it need to have research and development in an academic sense, but that research and development has to be commercialised so that we can capture more innovation in business.

On the issue of skills, as I have indicated, I have already begun to listen to the key voice of employers—and, I agree, of employees. For example, last week I met members of the electronic forum, which said to me that skills are an important agenda for them. Along with Jane Hutt and John Griffiths, who have the responsibility for this area, I will be working with industry to identify the skills that it needs for the future, to identify where there is a current shortage of skills, and to see how we can develop courses for industry to take forward.

There are several ways of ensuring the best value for the public pound. Procurement is one area where we have agreed, as a Government, that we want to take that forward. David has to accept that there is a 'One Wales' commitment not to use the private sector within the national health service, and I do not foresee that changing. However, there is a great deal of willingness in the Government, particularly in my department, to work closely with the private sector to develop ways in which it can get involved in improving our economic performance. I am not sure whether that

Hafren. Ni allwn wneud penderfyniadau ynghylch y materion hynny yn y Cynulliad, ac, felly, drwy gyfrwng argymhellion grŵp cynghori'r gweinidog, yr oeddem yn ceisio gweld ym mha fodd y gallai'r Cynulliad ddefnyddio ei ddylanwad ar hyn o bryd i fwrw ymlaen â hynny.

Cytunaf fod angen inni ddatblygu ymchwil a datblygu a manteisio ar dechnoleg. Yn yr amser y byr yr wyf wedi bod yn Weinidog, yr wyf wedi fy nghalonogi gan yr awyrgylch newydd yn y sectorau addysg uwch a'r sectorau preifat, ac yn y Llywodraeth, a phawb yn cydweithio'n fwy clos ar yr agenda neilltuol hon. Nid yn unig y mae gwahanol sectorau'n cydweithio mwy, ond mae'r sector addysg uwch ei hun yn cydweithio llawer mwy i wireddu hyn. Mae'n amlwg os yw economi Cymru am fod yn fwy gwydn yn wyneb cyfnodau o ddirywiad, nid yn unig y mae arno angen ymchwil a datblygu yn yr ystyr academaidd, ond mae angen i'r ymchwil a datblygu fod yn fwy masnachol ei anian fel y medrwn sicrhau mwy o arloesedd mewn busnes.

Ynghylch mater sgiliau, ys dywedais, yr wyf eisoes wedi dechrau gwrandao ar lais allweddol y cyflogwyr—yn ogystal, cytunaf, â llais y gweithwyr. Er enghraifft, yr wythnos diwethaf cyfarfûm ag aelodau'r fforwm electronig, a ddywedodd wrthyf fod sgiliau'n agenda bwysig iddynt. Ar y cyd â Jane Hutt a John Griffiths, sy'n gyfrifol am y maes hwn, byddaf yn gweithio gyda'r diwydiant i nodi'r sgiliau y mae arno eu hangen at y dyfodol, i nodi ymhle y mae prinder sgiliau ar hyn o bryd, ac i weld sut y gallwn ddatblygu cyrsiau i ddiwydiant fwrw ymlaen â hwy.

Mae nifer o ffyrdd o sicrhau gwerth gorau am y bunt gyhoeddus. Mae caffael yn faes yr ydym wedi cytuno, fel Llywodraeth, ein bod yn dymuno bwrw ymlaen ag ef. Rhaid i David dderbyn bod ymrwymiad yn 'Cymru'n Un' i beidio â defnyddio'r sector preifat yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol, ac nid wyf yn rhagweld y bydd hynny'n newid. Fodd bynnag, mae parodrwydd mawr yn y Llywodraeth, yn enwedig yn fy adran, i weithio'n glos gyda'r sector preifat i ddatblygu ffyrdd y gall gymryd rhan i wella ein perfformiad economaidd. Nid wyf yn sicr ai dull traddodiadol y Mentrau Cyllid Preifat,

would always be best delivered by the traditional PFI method, which is now being questioned by many people. The adoption of international accounting rules by the Treasury, which has perhaps not yet been widely acknowledged, means that we may have to look for other ways in which that area can be developed.

Lesley Griffiths: I also welcome this statement, particularly the three-phase approach that has been adopted by the ministerial advisory group. I also thank Andrew Davies, in his absence, for initially igniting the Welsh Development Agency and the Wales Tourist Board bonfires in 2005.

3.35 p.m.

The performance of those bodies fell below the standards expected in the public sector, and the introduction of the ministerial advisory group to give the Government advice on these areas was an excellent idea proposed by Andrew, and the benefits of its deliberations are before us today. It is good to see that accountability, which previously was not present, is now central to the process; that is to be welcomed greatly. I was interested to see the emphasis in the report on the so-called critical and cross-cutting departmental themes, including environmental issues and skills. There are obvious indications there for other Government departments.

Finally, I wish to ask you, Minister, about the former Wales Tourist Board aspects of the ministerial advisory group's work. I have been concerned since we saw the end of the WTB that tourism in Wales should remain an economic development priority for and within Government. I believed then, and I am still of the opinion, that Welsh tourism lies more comfortably within the economic development function of the Welsh Assembly Government. Are you satisfied that tourism should remain as part of the heritage portfolio or should it have a harder economic edge as one of our main industries?

The Deputy First Minister: Let me say first of all that whatever the arguments were—and

y mae llawer o bobl yn codi amheuan yn eu cylch bellach, yw'r ffordd orau o sicrhau hynny. Mae'r ffaith bod y Trysorlys wedi mabwysiadu rheolau cyfrifyddu rhyngwladol, sy'n rhywbeth nad yw wedi cael ei gydnabod yn helaeth hyd yma, yn golygu o bosibl y bydd yn rhaid inni chwilio am ffyrdd eraill o ddatblygu'r maes hwnnw.

Lesley Griffiths: Yr wyf hefyd yn croesawu'r datganiad hwn, yn enwedig y dull tri cham sydd wedi ei fabwysiadu gan grŵp cynghori'r gweinidog. Hoffwn ddiolch hefyd i Andrew Davies, yn ei absenoldeb, am danio coelcerth Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a Bwrdd Croeso Cymru yn y lle cyntaf yn 2005.

Cwmpodd perfformiad y cyrff hynny'n llawer is na'r safonau sy'n ddisgwyliedig yn y sector cyhoeddus, ac yr oedd cyflwyno grŵp cynghori'r gweinidog i roi cyngor i'r Llywodraeth ynghylch y meysydd hyn yn syniad rhagorol a gynigiwyd gan Andrew, a ffrwyth llafur ei drafodaethau sydd ger ein bron heddiw. Da gweld bod atebolrwydd, nad oedd yn bodoli'n flaenorol, bellach yn ganolog i'r broses; dylem fod yn falch iawn o hynny. Diddorol imi oedd gweld y pwyslais a welir yn yr adroddiad ar y themâu critigol a thrawsbynciol adrannol bondigrybwyll, gan gynnwys materion amgylcheddol a sgiliau. Mae awgrymiadau amlwg yn hynny i adrannau eraill.

Yn olaf, hoffwn ofyn i chi, Weinidog, ynglŷn ag agweddau o waith grŵp cynghori'r gweinidog sy'n ymwneud â Bwrdd Croeso Cymru gynt. Ers i Fwrdd Croeso Cymru ddod i ben, roeddwn am weld twristiaeth yng Nghymru yn parhau'n flaenoriaeth datblygu economaidd i'r Llywodraeth ac yn y Llywodraeth. Credais bryd hynny, a chredaf o hyd, mai priod le twristiaeth Cymru yw o fewn swyddogaeth ddatblygu economaidd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. A ydych yn fodlon i dwristiaeth aros yn rhan o'r portffolio treftadaeth neu a ddylai fagu min economaidd caletach fel un o'n prif ddiwydiannau?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Yn gyntaf oll hoffwn ddweud, beth bynnag oedd y

there were considerable arguments at the time about whether the Welsh Development Agency and the Wales Tourist Board should be brought into Government—it is crystal clear that we would not be able to develop the kind of strategy that we have, in focusing on key sectors, had that not happened. There is no way that that could have happened, because the next stage after this announcement—and I am sure that Members recognise this—is the delivery mechanism. Before long, I will be able to announce that we will have sectoral leads in each of these areas, under the control of my department and officials, delivering on this agenda—developing policy and looking at opportunities to develop a particular sector. None of that could have been done with the Welsh Development Agency as an arm's-length body.

The way in which the Government's economic programme—and the fact that we want to have a more focused approach—can be challenged here in the Chamber shows that this is much more democratically accountable. You indicated that the cross-cutting themes are crucial. That is why I believe that there is no danger to the tourist sector in not being part of my department. If we are to adopt a cross-cutting approach and have cross-departmental working, it does not really matter whether tourism is part of my department or under the heritage portfolio. There is a great deal of synergy between the Department for Heritage in its totality and tourism, which enables us to be quite comfortable that it sits there.

Kirsty Williams: I thank the Minister for his statement. The group's report has many interesting things to say, although I do not know whether the title, 'A New Way Forward', is exactly how I would put it. The key areas identified for the economy are not hugely different from the key areas identified in 'Wales: A Vibrant Economy', which was the economic strategy for the previous Government. They pretty much mirror each other.

I note that the group started out paying specific attention to GVA per capita and participation levels in Wales and noted that we were behind on both of those markers.

dadleuon—a bu dadlau mawr ar y pryd ynglŷn ag a ddylid dwyn Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a Bwrdd Croeso Cymru i mewn i'r Llywodraeth—ei bod yn gwbl glir na allasem ddatblygu'r math o strategaeth â'r un sydd gennym wrth ganolbwyntio ar sectorau allweddol, pe na bai hynny wedi digwydd. Ni fyddai hynny wedi gallu digwydd, oherwydd y cam nesaf ar ôl y cyhoeddiad hwn—ac yr wyf yn siŵr bod yr Aelodau'n cydnabod hyn—yw'r ffordd y caiff hyn ei gyflawni. Cyn bo hir, gallaf gyhoeddi y bydd gennym arweiniad sectoraidd ym mhob un o'r meysydd hyn, dan reolaeth fy adran a'm swyddogion i gyflawni'r agenda hon—yn datblygu polisi ac yn ystyried cyfleoedd i ddatblygu sector neilltuol. Ni fuasai hyn wedi bod yn bosibl petai Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru yn gorff hyd braich.

Mae'r modd y gellir herio rhaglen economaidd y Llywodraeth yn y Siambur hon—a'r ffaith bod arnom eisiau dull mwy diffiniedig—yn dangos bod hyn yn llawer mwy atebol yn ddemocrataidd. Dywedasochn fod y themâu trawsbynciol yn allweddol. Dyna pam yr wyf yn credu nad oes perygl yn y ffaith nad yw'r sector twristiaeth yn rhan o'm hadran. O arfer dull trawsbynciol a gweithio'n drawsadrannol, nid yw o bwys mewn gwirionedd a yw twristiaeth yn rhan o'm hadran neu'n rhan o'r portffolio treftadaeth. Mae llawer iawn o synergedd rhwng yr Adran Dreftadaeth yn ei chyfanrwydd a thwristiaeth, ac oherwydd hynny gallwn deimlo'n eithaf cyffyrddus ei bod yn rhan o'r adran honno.

Kirsty Williams: Hoffwn ddiolch i'r Gweinidog am ei ddatganiad. Mae adroddiad y grŵp yn llawn o bethau diddorol, er nad wyf yn sicr a fyddwn wedi defnyddio'r teitl, 'Ffordd Newydd Ymlaen', yn union. Nid yw'r meysydd allweddol a nodwyd ar gyfer yr economi'n wahanol iawn i'r meysydd allweddol a nodwyd yn 'Cymru: Economi yn Ffynnu', sef strategaeth economaidd y Llywodraeth flaenorol. Maent yn adlewyrchu ei gilydd i raddau helaeth.

Sylwaf fod y grŵp wedi dechrau drwy roi sylw neilltuol i GYC y pen a lefelau cyfranogiad yng Nghymru a nodi ein bod ar ei hôl hi parthed y ddau fesur hynny. Er na

Although the group did not make any specific recommendations with regards to setting targets for GVA and participation levels, is it now the Government's intention to do that? In recent debates, the Deputy First Minister and the First Minister have belittled GVA as an indicator of strength in the Welsh economy, so it is interesting to see that the group put that at the forefront of its analysis. Either it is a proper and significant way of looking at the economy or it is not. I would be grateful to hear from the Minister how he regards GVA and whether we can look forward to the Government setting a target that it will be working to in that regard. It is recommended that the core sectors have a development strategy attached to each of them. Can the Deputy First Minister give me an idea as to when he believes that those strategies will be in place for the three core sectors identified in the report?

3.40 p.m.

Today, the Minister finally does skills. In response to questions in Plenary previously, he has said that skills are not a matter for him. [*Interruption.*] I think that the record will show that you have said that skills are not a matter for you, Minister, but a matter for John Griffiths. Therefore I am glad that, in your statement today, you give the skills agenda the attention that it deserves.

Will you now, therefore, think about setting level 3 skills as the benchmark to work towards? Evidence given to various committees has stated that that is desirable. The report before us states that there is abundant evidence demonstrating that higher skills economies have higher productivity. Given that acknowledgement by the group, do you accept that and will you therefore be looking to push the higher skills agenda forward in that way? You say that you will be working with the sector skills councils. In taking evidence, the Enterprise and Learning Committee has repeatedly heard concerns about the capacity of the sector skills councils to perform their roles, specifically within a Welsh context, because many of them do not have a great deal of support in Wales. There is often little infrastructure to

wnaeth y grŵp argymhellion penodol ynghylch gosod targedau ar gyfer GYC a'r lefelau cyfranogiad, a yw'r Llywodraeth bellach yn bwriadu gwneud hynny? Mewn dadleuon diweddar mae'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Prif Weinidog wedi bychanu GYC fel dangosydd cryfder economi Cymru, felly diddorol yw gweld bod y grŵp wedi rhoi lle blaenllaw iddo yn ei ddadansoddiad. Naill ai y mae'n ffordd briodol ac arwyddocaol o ystyried yr economi neu beidio. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar o glywed barn y Gweinidog ynglŷn â GYC a ph'un ai a allwn ddisgwyl gweld y Llywodraeth yn gosod targed y bydd yn ymgyrraedd ato yn hynny o beth. Argymhellir bod angen strategaethau datblygu ar gyfer pob un o'r sectorau craidd. A all y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog roi syniad imi ynglŷn â phryd y mae'n credu y bydd y strategaethau craidd hynny ar waith ar gyfer y tri sector craidd a nodir yn yr adroddiad?

Heddiw, mae'r Gweinidog wedi rhoi sylw i sgiliau o'r diwedd. Mewn atebion blaenorol yn y Cyfarfodydd Llawn, dywedodd nad mater iddo yntau yw sgiliau. [*Torri ar draws.*] Credaf y byddai'r cofnod yn dangos eich bod wedi dweud nad mater i chi yw sgiliau, Weinidog, ond, yn hytrach, mater i John Griffiths. Felly, yr wyf yn falch eich bod, yn eich datganiad heddiw, wedi rhoi sylw haeddiannol i'r agenda sgiliau.

Felly, a wnewch ystyried gosod sgiliau lefel 3 yn feincnod i weithio tuag ato? Mewn tystiolaeth a ddygwyd gerbron nifer o bwyllgorau dywedwyd y byddai hynny'n ddymunol. Mae'r adroddiad sydd ger ein bron yn dweud bod tystiolaeth helaeth yn dangos bod economïau sy'n meddu ar sgiliau uwch yn meddu ar gynhyrchiant uwch. O ystyried bod y grŵp wedi cydnabod hynny, a ydych yn derbyn hynny ac felly a ydych yn bwriadu gwthio'r agenda sgiliau uwch ymlaen yn y ffordd honno? Yr ydych yn dweud y byddwch yn gweithio gyda'r cynghorau sgiliau sector. Wrth dderbyn tystiolaeth, mae'r Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu wedi clywed pryderon lu ynglŷn â gallu'r cynghorau sgiliau sector i gyflawni eu rolau, yn benodol felly yng nghyd-destun Cymru, oherwydd nid oes gan nifer ohonynt lawer

support the individual trying to work for a sector skills council in a Wales context. Is it your intention therefore to beef up the Welsh capacity of the sector skills councils? There is real concern that the sector skills councils may not be able to work with you in the way that you have demonstrated today that you would like to work with them.

The report mentions planning, and it is in the list of recommendations that you will examine the issues around planning. It is widely accepted that one reason why the Government was successful in attracting the Amazon project, for instance, was that the planning decision by the planning authority was turned around very quickly. I have evidence, certainly within my constituency, of business people who have decided to invest in other parts of Europe because of the constraints of our planning system. That is not to say that business should circumnavigate the planning system—there are appropriate planning laws that people have to abide by—but there is a feeling in business that it often takes too long to get a planning decision. I met a business this morning that is at its wits' end with the planning department. A significant private sector investment in my constituency is under threat because the planning authority is not able to deal with matters promptly. I am sure that you will agree that none of us would want to lose out on precious investment because our planning departments are ill resourced or do not have the capacity to deal with applications promptly.

I welcome the Government's commitment to knowledge exploitation as a way of driving the economy forward. Lesley Griffiths waxed lyrically about Andrew Davies's contribution to the group. One thing that Andrew Davies did was to set up the Gibson review, which produced a worthwhile piece of work, with some very dynamic and interesting points about knowledge exploitation and commercialisation. The Minister has said previously that he is committed to delivering the recommendations of the Gibson review.

iawn o gefnogaeth yng Nghymru. Prin iawn yw'r seilwaith yn aml i gefnogi unigolyn sy'n ceisio gweithio i gyngor sgiliau sector yng nghyd-destun Cymru. Felly a ydych yn bwriadu atgyfnerthu gallu Cymru o fewn y cynghorau sgiliau sector? Mae pryder gwirioneddol na fydd y cynghorau sgiliau sector yn gallu gweithio gyda chi yn y modd yr ydych wedi ei ddangos heddiw yr hoffech chi weithio gyda nhw.

Mae'r adroddiad yn crybwyll cynllunio, a dywedwch yn y rhestr argymhellion y byddwch yn ymchwilio i'r materion sy'n ymwneud â chynllunio. Derbynnir yn eang mai un rheswm y bu'r Llywodraeth yn llwyddiannus yn ei hymdrechion i ddenu prosiect Amazon, er enghraifft, oedd oherwydd bod penderfyniad ynghylch cynllunio wedi'i wneud yn gyflym iawn gan yr awdurdod cynllunio. Mae gennyf dystiolaeth, o'm hetholaeth, o bobl fusnes sydd wedi penderfynu buddsoddi mewn rhannau eraill o Ewrop oherwydd cyfyngiadau ein system gynllunio. Nid dweud yr wyf y dylai busnesau allu anwybyddu gofynion y system gynllunio—mae rheolau cynllunio priodol y mae'n rhaid i bobl lynu wrthynt—ond ym myd busnes, teimlir bod penderfyniadau ynglŷn â chynllunio'n aml yn cymryd gormod o amser. Y bore yma, cyfarfûm â busnes sydd wedi cyrraedd pen ei dennyn gyda'r adran gynllunio. Mae bygythiad i fuddsoddiad sector preifat mawr yn fy etholaeth oherwydd nad yw'r awdurdod cynllunio'n gallu delio â materion yn brydlon. Yr wyf yn sicr y cytunwch na fyddai neb am golli buddsoddiad prin oherwydd bod ein hadrannau cynllunio heb ddigon o adnoddau neu oherwydd nad oes ganddynt y gallu i ddelio â cheisiadau'n brydlon.

Yr wyf yn croesawu ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth i ddefnyddio gwybodaeth i hybu'r economi. Bu Lesley Griffiths yn canu clodydd cyfraniad Andrew Davies at y grŵp. Un peth a wnaeth Andrew Davies oedd sefydlu adolygiad Gibson, a luniodd ddarn o waith gwerth chweil, a oedd yn cynnwys pwyntiau deinamig a diddorol iawn ynglŷn â defnyddio gwybodaeth a'i masnacheiddio. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi dweud o'r blaen ei fod wedi ymrwymo i gyflawni argymhellion adolygiad Gibson. A wnaiff ddatgan yn awr a

Will he now state whether he still intends to do that?

On procurement, a huge section of the economy is reliant on public sector procurement. However, this morning in the Proposed Healthy Eating in Schools Measure Committee we took evidence from people at the sharp end, who are in charge of budgets and who could be buying Welsh local produce to feed to our schoolchildren. They said that while there is a lot of talk about that being the right thing for them to do, there are not the levels of support to allow them to make the most of those opportunities or to assist them in doing so. Do you intend to reconsider the support that you are giving to the public sector to ensure that it is making the most of its buying ability to help the Welsh economy?

The Deputy First Minister: Thank you for the number of questions that you have asked, which I will try to deal with today. You asked whether this is a new way forward and you said that there are parts of the 'Wales: A Vibrant Economy' document that correspond with what I am saying today. The main difference, which is crucial, is that the Assembly Government has accepted that there needs to be a sectoral approach. There will be delivery right through the system. This is a major change. The key sectors, as I have indicated in my statement, will be at the heart of this. My department has been restructured to deliver on this agenda. We have dedicated sector teams for policy and delivery, which we have never had before. In our action plan, we have agreement across the Assembly Government on joining up our economic levers. The driver in my department will be to deliver on this sectoral approach. That is not to say that the other sectors that have been excluded will not be looked after, but priority will now be given to considering these key sectors. That is a major change in the way in which we do things, which should be broadly welcomed.

Kirsty must accept that the Government has not adopted a gross value added target. I am sure that she has read the 'One Wales' agreement, which is something that I do regularly, and the target that we have set

yw hynny dal yn fwriad ganddo?

O ran caffael, mae cyfran fawr o'r economi'n ddibynnol ar gaffael yn y sector cyhoeddus. Fodd bynnag, bore yma ym Mhwyllgor y Mesur Arfaethedig Bwyta'n Iach Mewn Ysgolion cawsom dystiolaeth gan bobl sydd yn ei chanol hi, sy'n gyfrifol am gyllidebau ac a allai fod yn prynu cynnyrch lleol o Gymru i fwydo ein plant ysgol. Er bod llawer iawn o siarad mai dyna'r peth iawn i'w wneud, dywedasant nad oes cefnogaeth ar gael iddynt fedru manteisio i'r eithaf ar y cyfleoedd hynny neu i'w cynorthwyo i wneud hynny. A ydych yn bwriadu ailystyried y gefnogaeth yr ydych yn ei rhoi i'r sector cyhoeddus er mwyn sicrhau ei fod yn gwneud y gorau o'i allu i brynu er mwyn helpu economi Cymru?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Diolch ichi am ofyn cynifer o gwestiynau. Yr wyf am geisio ymdrin â hwy heddiw. Gofynasoch a yw hon yn ffordd newydd o symud ymlaen, a dywedasoch fod rhannau o 'Cymru: Economi yn Ffynnu' yn gydnaws â'r hyn yr wyf yn ei ddweud heddiw. Y gwahaniaeth mwyaf, sy'n bwysig iawn, yw bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi derbyn bod angen ymagwedd sectoraidd. Byddwn yn cyflawni ym mhob rhan o'r system. Mae hyn yn newid mawr. Bydd y prif sectorau, fel yr wyf wedi dweud yn fy natganiad, yn ganolog i hyn. Mae fy adran i wedi cael ei had-drefnu er mwyn gweithredu'r agenda hon. Mae gennym dimau sector ar gyfer polisi a chyflawni, nad ydym wedi'u cael o'r blaen. Yn ein cynllun gweithredu, mae gennym gytundeb ar draws Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar uno'n mesurau economaidd. Y nod yn fy adran i fydd sicrhau'r ymagwedd sectoraidd hon. Nid yw hynny'n golygu na fydd y sectorau eraill nad ydynt wedi'u cynnwys yn cael sylw, ond rhoddir blaenoriaeth yn awr i ystyried y sectorau allweddol hyn. Mae hynny'n newid sylweddol o ran y ffordd yr ydym yn gwneud pethau, a dylai gael ei groesawu'n gyffredinol.

Rhaid i Kirsty dderbyn nad yw'r Llywodraeth wedi mabwysiadu targed gwerth ychwanegol crynswth. Yr wyf yn siŵr ei bod wedi darllen cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un', fel yr wyf fi'n gwneud yn rheolaidd, a'r targed yr ydym

ourselves in the agreement is to achieve full employment. We can disagree about whether or not that should be the target, but that is the target against which the Government's performance should be measured. We have decided that that is how we intend to do it. I have been fairly understanding regarding Kirsty's questions on skills in the past, but I must now make it clear that she clearly does not understand what being in Government means. I have made it clear that, as an issue, skills cuts across more than one department: it includes what I am doing in my department, and what John Griffiths and Jane Hutt are doing. It touches most Government departments. However, the detail of the delivery must be the responsibility of the relevant Minister. Therefore, the question on level 3 skills is a question for Jane Hutt or John Griffiths and not for me. I must repeat that until the message hits home. Everyone understands the importance of skills, but the detailed implementation must be the responsibility of the relevant Minister.

On planning, I have made it clear in my statement that I will be discussing with Jane Davidson ways in which the planning system can be reviewed to see whether we can make it much easier for local planning authorities to respond to it, and I have indicated that we will deliver on that.

On knowledge exploitation, there is common ground between us. You mentioned the Gibson review, and I said in my statement that our ambition must be linked with the implementation of the recommendations of the commercialisation review, in partnership with universities and the private sector. I said that to the committee, and I thought that the response that I promised the committee had been sent, but I will check that. I intended to provide the committee with details of all the recommendations in the report and of how I intend to carry those forward. If the response has not been sent, I will ensure that it is sent as soon as possible.

On procurement, yes, this is an important agenda. There are some important European Commission rules that must be considered,

wedi'i osod i ni'n hunain yn y cytundeb yw sicrhau cyflogaeth lawn. Gallwn anghytuno ynglŷn â phriodoldeb y targed hwnnw, ond dyna'r targed y dylid ei ddefnyddio er mwyn mesur perfformiad y Llywodraeth. Yr ydym wedi penderfynu mai dyna sut yr ydym yn bwriadu gwneud hynny. Yr wyf wedi bod yn bur amyneddgar gyda chwestiynau Kirsty ynglŷn â sgiliau yn y gorffennol, ond rhaid imi nodi'n glir yn awr ei bod yn amlwg nad yw'n deall beth y mae bod mewn Llywodraeth yn ei olygu. Yr wyf wedi nodi'n glir bod a wnelo sgiliau â mwy nag un adran: mae'n ymwneud â'r hyn yr wyf fi'n ei wneud yn fy adran i, a'r hyn y mae John Griffiths a Jane Hutt yn ei wneud. Mae'n cyffwrdd â'r rhan fwyaf o adrannau'r Llywodraeth. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i'r gwaith cyflenwi manwl fod yn gyfrifoldeb i'r Gweinidog perthnasol. Felly, cwestiwn i Jane Hutt neu John Griffiths yw'r cwestiwn ynglŷn â sgiliau lefel 3, ac nid cwestiwn i mi. Rhaid imi ailadrodd hynny nes bydd yn deall y neges. Mae pawb yn deall pa mor bwysig yw sgiliau, ond rhaid i'r gwaith gweithredu manwl fod yn gyfrifoldeb i'r Gweinidog perthnasol.

O ran cynllunio, yr wyf wedi nodi'n glir yn fy natganiad y byddaf yn trafod gyda Jane Davidson sut y gellir adolygu'r system gynllunio er mwyn gweld a allwn ei gwneud yn llawer haws i awdurdodau cynllunio lleol ymateb iddi, ac yr wyf wedi dweud y byddwn yn cyflawni hynny.

O ran datblygu gwybodaeth, mae gennym dir cyffredin. Cyfeiriasoch at adolygiad Gibson, a dywedais yn fy natganiad bod yn rhaid i'n huchelgais ni fod yn gysylltiedig â gweithredu argymhellion yr adolygiad o fasnacheiddio, mewn partneriaeth â phrifysgolion a'r sector preifat. Dywedais hynny wrth y pwyllgor, ac yr oeddwn yn credu bod yr ymateb a addewais i'r pwyllgor wedi cael ei anfon, ond byddaf yn ymchwilio i hynny. Yr oeddwn yn bwriadu rhoi manylion i'r pwyllgor ynglŷn â holl argymhellion yr adroddiad a sut yr wyf yn bwriadu eu gweithredu. Os nad yw'r ymateb wedi cael ei anfon, byddaf yn sicrhau ei fod yn cael ei anfon cyn gynted ag y bo modd.

O ran caffael, ydyw, mae hon yn agenda bwysig. Mae rhai rheolau pwysig gan y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd y mae'n rhaid eu

but it is the Government's intention, insofar as it is possible, to make procurement work for the benefit of companies in Wales so that they can share, if you like, in the way in which the public sector procures into the future.

Gareth Jones: Diolch am y datganiad. Mae nifer o Aelodau eisoes wedi cyfeirio at y pwyntiau yr hoffwn wneud. Hoffwn ategu un neu ddau o bwyntiau. Yr wyf yn hynod falch o weld eich gwledigaeth a'ch dehongliad o'r hyn sydd angen ei wneud i sicrhau bod cyfoeth yn cael ei greu a'i gynyddu yma yng Nghymru a bod Cymru'n ffynnu.

3.50 p.m.

Yr wyf hefyd yn falch eich bod wedi cyfeirio at y ffaith bod yn rhaid i ni sicrhau bod Cymru'n dod yn gystadleuol yn rhyngwladol. Hoffwn wybod sut y bydd y neges honno'n cael ei throsglwyddo fel ein bod yn deall pwysigrwydd hynny, oherwydd bod yn rhaid iddo ddiwydd. Croesawaf hefyd y ffaith, oherwydd y gyfundrefn newydd, fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn awyddus i yrru'r newid a'r twf i wireddu'r weledigaeth. Credaf y bydd y gyfundrefn newydd yn caniatáu gwneud hynny.

Ar yr adolygiad masnacheiddio a'i bwysigrwydd, fel y dywedodd Kirsty, yr ydym wedi derbyn eich ymateb, ac yr ydym yn dra diolchgar am hynny. Mae'n adroddiad o bwys, a chroesawaf yn fawr eich bod am weithredu ar yr argymhellion. Bydd y sector addysg uwch gyfan yn croesawu'r ffaith eich bod am fuddsoddi mwy yn y gwaith ymchwil a datblygu. Mae'r pwyntiau hynny i gyd yn gadarnhaol ac fe'u croesawaf.

Wrth ymateb i Kirsty, yr ydych newydd gyfeirio at bwysigrwydd uwchraddio sgiliau. Mae hwnnw'n fater o bwys. Yr wyf yn cydnabod ei fod yn fater trawsbynciol—mae'n cyffwrdd â llawer o wahanol adrannau—ond hoffwn i Lywodraeth Cymru fynd i'r afael a chynghorau sgiliau sector oherwydd y gellid gwella'r ddarpariaeth, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai Cymru'n cael budd o hynny.

Gorffennaf gydag un pwynt yr ydych eisoes wedi cyfeirio ato sydd yn ymwneud â

hystyried, ond bwriad y Llywodraeth, i'r graddau y mae hynny'n bosibl, yw gwneud gwaith caffael er budd cwmnïau yng Nghymru fel bod modd iddynt fod yn rhan, os dymunwch, o'r ffordd y mae'r sector cyhoeddus yn caffael ar gyfer y dyfodol.

Gareth Jones: Thank you for the statement. Several Members have already referred to points that I would like to make. I would like to support a couple of points. I am very pleased to see your vision and interpretation of what is needed to ensure that wealth is created and increased here in Wales and that Wales prospers.

I am also glad that you have referred to the fact that we must ensure that Wales becomes competitive internationally. I would like to know how that message will be conveyed so that we understand the importance of that, because it has to happen. I also welcome the fact that, because of the new regime, the Assembly Government is eager to drive the change and growth to realise the vision. I believe that the new regime will allow that to happen.

On the commercialisation review and its importance, as Kirsty said, we have received your response, and we are very grateful for that. It is an important report, and I greatly welcome the fact that you are to take action on the recommendations. The higher education sector as a whole will welcome the fact that you want to invest more in research and development work. Those points are all positive and I welcome them.

In responding to Kirsty, you have just referred to the importance of upgrading skills. That is an important matter. I recognise that it is a cross-cutting issue—it touches many different departments—but I would like the Welsh Government to get to grips with the sector skills councils because there is room for improvement with regard to provision, and I am sure that Wales would benefit from that.

I will finish with one point that you have already referred to; it is on procurement. I

chaffael. Deallaf fod yn rhaid i ni fanteisio ar fuddsoddiad yn y sector gyhoeddus a bod yn rhaid inni geisio gwneud hynny mewn ffordd sydd yn caniatáu i'r sector breifat gael budd hefyd, gan fod angen y cydbwysedd hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf ar ddeall—ac yr wyf wedi derbyn cwynion am hyn yn ddiweddar—fod y cytundebau fframwaith yn rhwystro busnesau lleol sydd gyda throsiant o lai na £5 miliwn rhag ymgymryd â phrosiectau fel hyn. Byddwn i'n gweld hynny fel rhwystr i'r tyniant yr ydych yn dyheu, fel pawb yma, i'w weld yng Nghymru. Gallaf rannu'r manylion a dderbyniais gyda chi, Dirprwy Brif Weinidog. A wnewch adolygu'r sefyllfa hon? Fodd bynnag, drwyddi draw, yn sicr, croesawaf eich datganiad.

Y Dirprwy Prif Weinidog: Diolch am eich geiriau. Yr ydym yn rhannu'r weledigaeth bod yn rhaid i ni weld Cymru yn genedl hyderus a ffyniannus lle y bydd buddsoddi mewn diwydiant, yn y sector arbennig hon, yn gwella ein perfformiad economaidd.

Bu i chi ofyn cwestiwn am Gymru fel gwlad sydd yn gystadleuol yn rhyngwladol, ac un o'r pethau yr oeddwn yn ymwybodol iawn ohono pan arweiniais ddirprwyaeth i Delhi Newydd, Mumbai ac i Efrog Newydd oedd nad Cymru yw'r unig genedl sy'n mynd allan i geisio gwerthu'r hyn sydd ganddi i'w gynnig. Felly, mae'n rhaid i ni ddangos bod gennym ryw beth gwahanol i'w gynnig. Mae nifer o bobl yn dweud wrthym eu bod yn hoffi sut y mae Llywodraeth Cymru'n gallu ymateb yn gyflym i anghenion cwmnïau ac yn y blaen. Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhaid iddo fod yn fwy na hynny ac wrth ganolbwyntio ar sectorau arbennig, mae ein *pitch* ni'n mynd i fod dipyn bach yn wahanol, a chredaf y bydd hynny'n fanteisiol i ni wrth i ni drafod buddsoddiad.

Soniais am Gymru fel gwlad sydd yn gystadleuol yn rhyngwladol, ond nid yw hynny wedi ei gyfyngu i fuddsoddiad mewnol. Yr ydym am weld cwmnïau o Gymru yn gallu cystadlu yn y farchnad rhyngwladol, a dyna pam mae'r broses o arwain dirprwyaeth yn gorfod bod yn broses ddwyffordd—fel bod y dau beth yn gallu digwydd.

Yr wyf yn falch o glywed fod yr ymateb i'r

understand that we must take advantage of investment in the public sector and that we must try to do so in a way that allows the private sector to benefit too, as that balance is needed. However, I understand—and I have received complaints about this recently—that the framework contracts preclude local businesses who have a turnover of less than £5 million from undertaking such projects. I would see that as a barrier to the growth that you, like everyone here, wish to see in Wales. I can share the details that I have received with you, Deputy First Minister. Would you review this situation? However, generally speaking, I certainly welcome your statement.

The Deputy First Minister: Thank you for your words. We share the vision that we have to see Wales as a confident and prosperous nation where investment in industry, in this particular sector, improves our economic performance.

You asked a question about Wales as a country that is competitive internationally, and one of the things that I was aware of when I led a delegation to New Delhi, Mumbai, and to New York was that Wales is not the only nation that goes out to try sell what it has to offer. Therefore, we must demonstrate that we have something different to offer. A number of people tell us that they like the way in which the Welsh Assembly Government can respond quickly to the needs of companies and so on. However, it has to be more than that and, in focusing on particular sectors, our pitch will be slightly different, and I believe that that will be advantageous to us as we discuss investment.

I spoke about Wales as a country that is competitive internationally, but that is not restricted to inward investment. We want to see companies from Wales being able to compete in the international market, and that is why the process of leading a delegation has to be a two-way process—so that both things can happen.

I am pleased to hear that the response to the

adolygiad masnacheiddio wedi cyrraedd. Mae'n rhan bwysig o'n rhaglen. Yr wyf yn derbyn bod yr agenda sgiliau yn hynod bwysig. Yr wyf eisoes wedi cael sgwrs â'r rhai sy'n cynrychioli'r cynghorau sgiliau, a byddwn yn gweithio hyd eithaf ein gallu i sicrhau ein bod yn gallu darparu'r sgiliau sydd eu hangen ar gyfer y blynyddoedd i ddod. Un peth sy'n eithaf amlwg yw mai nid rhywbeth tymor byr yn unig yw hwn; bydd yn dylanwadu ar pa mor gystadleuol yw'r economi Gymreig yn y blynyddoedd a'r degawdau i ddod.

Yr ydych wedi codi cwestiwn mwy penodol ar gaffael, ac yr wyf yn hapus i edrych ar enghreifftiau unigol. Andrew Davies sydd yn arwain ar ran y Llywodraeth yn y maes hwn, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'n fodlon derbyn unrhyw wybodaeth ynglŷn â phroblemau gyda'r cytundebau fframwaith ar hyn o bryd. Ein bwriad, yn unol â'r hyn a nodwyd yn 'Cymru'n Un', yw sicrhau bod cwmnïau bach a chanolig eu maint yng Nghymru yn gallu elwa o'r math o gytundebau caffael sydd ar gael yn y sector cyhoeddus.

commercialisation consultation has arrived. It is an important part of our programme. I accept that the skills agenda is exceptionally important. I have already spoken to the representatives of the skills councils, and we will do our utmost to ensure that we can provide the skills required in future years. One thing that has become apparent is that this is not just a short-term thing; it will influence the competitiveness of the Welsh economy in the ensuing years and decades.

You raised a more specific question on procurement, and I am happy to look at individual examples. Andrew Davies leads for the Government in this field, and I am certain that he will be willing to accept any information regarding problems that currently exist with the framework contracts. Our intention, as stated in 'One Wales', is to ensure that small and medium-sized enterprises in Wales are able to profit from the kind of procurement contract available in the public sector.

Datganiad am Adroddiad Sue Essex ar Dai Statement on Sue Essex's Housing Report

The Deputy Minister for Housing (Jocelyn Davies): After being appointed as the Deputy Minister for Housing, I spent my first weeks talking to as many housing practitioners as possible to find out how well we were meeting the housing challenges in Wales.

I spoke to the representative bodies of local authorities and housing associations, the staff and members of many different housing associations and local authorities across Wales, tenants' organisations, and professional bodies. Although it was clear that much good work was being done, it was not being delivered consistently across Wales. The point made to me time and again was that opportunities to provide homes, services and community regeneration were being lost because of a regulatory system that is no longer wholly appropriate, and because of micromanaged processes that slow down delivery and performance. There was also a

Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Dai (Jocelyn Davies): Treuliais yr wythnosau cyntaf ar ôl imi gael fy mhenodi'n Ddirprwy Weinidog dros Dai yn siarad gyda chynifer o ymarferwyr tai ag y gallwn. Fy mwriad oedd darganfod i ba raddau yr oeddem yn cyflawni'r heriau sy'n gysylltiedig â thai yng Nghymru.

Siaredais â chyrrff sy'n cynrychioli awdurdodau lleol a chymdeithasau tai, staff ac aelodau llawer o wahanol gymdeithasau tai ac awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru, sefydliadau tenantiaid, a chyrrff proffesiynol. Er ei bod yn amlwg bod llawer o waith da'n cael ei wneud, nid oedd y ddarpariaeth yn gyson ym mhob rhan o Gymru. Yr hyn a ddywedwyd wrthyf dro ar ôl tro oedd bod cyfleoedd i ddarparu cartrefi a gwasanaethau ac i adfywio cymunedau'n cael eu colli oherwydd system reoliadol nad yw'n gwbl briodol mwyach, ac oherwydd prosesau meicrooledig sy'n arafu'r broses o gyflawni ac yn amharu ar berfformiad. Yr oedd diffyg

lack of clarity in the roles and responsibilities of the three parties involved: the Welsh Assembly Government, local authorities and housing associations.

The Welsh Assembly Government does not build houses; it relies upon its partners to plan and deliver new social housing. Given the consistent messages that I was receiving, in October, I asked Sue Essex to chair a review of the current system. My vision was that we should all be working together to maximise the gain from the resources that we have, as well as from new investment made. Every partner should be challenged to contribute more to help meet the housing needs that we face. The systems and processes that we use should help us meet that objective.

The brief for the Essex review was to look at how we could gain the maximum from the assets already held by housing associations; to encourage greater collaboration between them, to become more effective in delivering new homes; to look at ways to accelerate the meeting of our climate change objectives when building new homes; and to ensure that each partner had a clear understanding of its roles and responsibilities. Together, those four components, properly implemented, will improve performance and ensure that we are better equipped to meet the growing housing challenges that we face.

Sue Essex and her colleagues, Dr Peter Williams and Dr Bob Smith, have spent the best part of six months challenging all those involved in the housing movement. They spoke directly to more than 100 individuals, and over 70 organisations. As well as speaking to those directly involved and their representative bodies, they also spoke to staff employed in the housing directorate, private lenders and those involved in the private sector.

By Christmas, they had recommended five quick wins—changes that headlined the way forward, could reduce bureaucracy, and could enable housing associations to borrow more against their current assets by adopting a

egllurder hefyd ynglŷn â rolau a chyfrifoldebau'r rhai sy'n ymwneud â'r gwaith: Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, awdurdodau lleol a chymdeithasau tai.

Nid yw Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n adeiladu tai; mae'n dibynnu ar ei phartneriaid i gynllunio a darparu tai cymdeithasol newydd. O ganlyniad i'r negeseuon cyson yr oeddwn yn eu cael, ym mis Hydref, gofynnais i Sue Essex gadeirio adolygiad o'r system gyfredol. Fy ngweledigaeth oedd y dylem i gyd weithio gyda'n gilydd er mwyn cael cymaint o fudd ag sy'n bosibl o'r adnoddau sydd gennym yn ogystal ag o fuddsoddiad newydd sy'n cael ei wneud. Dylid herio pob partner i gyfrannu mwy er mwyn helpu i ddiwallu'r angen am dai y byddwn yn ei wynebu. Dylai'r systemau a'r prosesau yr ydym yn eu defnyddio ein helpu i gyflawni'r amcan hwnnw.

Y briff ar gyfer adolygiad Essex oedd ystyried sut y gallem gael y budd mwyaf o'r asedau sydd gan gymdeithasau tai yn barod; annog mwy o gydweithio rhyngddynt, er mwyn bod yn fwy effeithiol wrth ddarparu cartrefi newydd; edrych ar ffyrdd o gyflymu'r broses o gyflawni amcanion sy'n ymwneud â newid yn yr hinsawdd wrth adeiladu cartrefi newydd; a sicrhau bod gan bob partner ddealltwriaeth glir o'i rolau a'i chyfrifoldebau. Gyda'i gilydd, bydd y pedair elfen hyn, o'u gweithredu'n briodol, yn gwella perfformiad ac yn sicrhau ein bod mewn sefyllfa well i allu cyflawni'r heriau cynyddol yr ydym yn eu hwynebu ym maes tai.

Mae Sue Essex, ynghyd â Dr Peter Williams a Dr Bob Smith, wedi treulio bron i chwe mis yn herio pob un sy'n ymwneud â'r mudiad tai. Buont yn siarad yn uniongyrchol â thros 100 o unigolion, a thros 70 o sefydliadau. Yn ogystal â siarad â'r rhai hynny sy'n uniongyrchol gysylltiedig, a'r cyrff sy'n eu cynrychioli, buont hefyd yn siarad â staff sy'n cael eu cyflogi yn y gyfarwyddiaeth dai, benthycwyr preifat a'r rhai hynny sy'n ymwneud â'r sector preifat.

Erbyn y Nadolig, yr oeddynt wedi argymhell pum ateb sydyn—newidiadau a oedd yn dangos y ffordd ymlaen, a allai leihau biwrocratiaeth, a galluogi cymdeithasau tai i fenthycu mwy yn erbyn eu hasedau cyfredol

more social enterprise approach. We consulted widely and were encouraged by the overwhelming support that we had for this approach. We are currently looking at how to make progress on these recommendations as quickly as possible.

I have recently received the final report of the Essex review. To rise to the challenge of meeting our many and varied housing challenges, it recommends a new strategic direction and calls for strong and purposeful leadership to achieve it.

4.00 p.m.

The review acknowledges the good work already being carried out and seeks to enable housing associations and local authorities to provide more homes and more community regeneration. To achieve that, it argues that a more comprehensive assessment of housing need across Wales is imperative. Resources should follow need, and my recently announced requirement for every planning authority to publish an affordable housing delivery plan with targets for delivery will provide a more focused and transparent mechanism to encourage higher levels of performance.

For housing associations, the report proposes a fundamental change in the regulatory system to encourage more innovation and greater freedom to use their not-for-profit status to invest more in their communities. To balance a less risk averse and more socially enterprising model, it recommends placing greater emphasis on governance and financial regulation, as well as continuing to deliver high-quality standards of management and maintenance for tenants.

Lastly, to ensure that the regulatory system remains fit for purpose, it suggests the establishment of a regulatory board, made up of key stakeholders, to take an overview and report to the Minister directly on the ability of the sector to deliver effectively.

The report also recommends incentivising faster progress to meet the climate change agenda in the new-build programme, and it

drwy fabwysiadu trefniadau tebycach i fenter gymdeithasol. Buom yn ymgynghori'n eang a chawsom ein calonogi gan y gefnogaeth aruthrol a gawsom i'r dull hwn. Yr ydym wrthi ar hyn o bryd yn ystyried sut y gallwn symud ymlaen â'r argymhellion hyn cyn gynted ag y bo modd.

Cefais gopi o adroddiad terfynol adolygiad Essex yn ddiweddar. Er mwyn derbyn yr her o ymateb i'r nifer mawr o heriau amrywiol sydd gennym ym maes tai, mae'n argymhell cyfeiriad strategol newydd ac yn galw am arweiniad cryf a phenderfynol i'w sicrhau.

Mae'r adolygiad yn cydnabod y gwaith da sy'n cael ei wneud eisoes ac yn ceisio galluogi cymdeithasau tai ac awdurdodau lleol i ddarparu mwy o gartrefi a mwy o adfywio cymunedol. Er mwyn cyflawni hynny, mae'n dadlau ei bod yn hollbwysig cael asesiad mwy cynhwysfawr o anghenion tai ledled Cymru. Dylai adnoddau ddilyn angen, a bydd y gofyniad a gyhoeddais yn ddiweddar i bob awdurdod cynllunio gyhoeddi cynllun cyflenwi tai fforddiadwy gyda thargedau ar gyfer ei gyflawni'n rhoi mecanwaith mwy manwl a thryloyw i hybu lefelau perfformiad uwch.

Ar gyfer cymdeithasau tai, mae'r adroddiad yn cynnig newid sylfaenol yn y system reoleiddio i hyrwyddo mwy o arloesi a mwy o ryddid i ddefnyddio eu statws di-elw i fuddsoddi mwy yn eu cymunedau. Er mwyn gwrthbwyso model sy'n llai gwrthwynebol i risg ac yn fwy cymdeithasol fentrus, mae'n argymhell rhoi mwy o bwyslais ar lywodraethu a rheoleiddio ariannol, yn ogystal â pharhau i sicrhau safonau uchel o ran rheoli a gwaith cynnal a chadw i denantiaid.

Yn olaf, er mwyn sicrhau y bydd y system reoleiddio'n dal yn addas, mae'n awgrymu sefydlu bwrdd rheoleiddio o randdeiliaid allweddol i gymryd trosolwg ac adrodd yn uniongyrchol i'r Gweinidog ar allu'r sector i fynd â'r maen i'r wal yn effeithiol.

Mae'r adroddiad hefyd yn argymhell rhoi cymhellion i symud ymlaen yn gynt i ymateb i'r agenda ar y newid yn yr hinsawdd yn y

suggests a new way to facilitate the improvement of housing stock in local authorities where tenants have voted against stock transfer. It also looks at ways to improve housing association consortia arrangements.

For anyone interested in housing in Wales, this is a seminal report. It is comprehensive and inclusive, and holds challenges for all those involved. For the Welsh Assembly Government, it challenges us to lead the change necessary. For local authorities, it challenges them to enable partnership working and to manage performance. For housing associations, it challenges them to become more innovative and to use their assets more effectively to increase investment.

Since this report was commissioned, the challenges have grown. When I took up office, our eyes were focused on 'One Wales' and our housing commitments. With the changes in the economy affecting the housing markets, the challenges are now much greater. This report is a comprehensive analysis of the current situation, and it proposes a coherent way of improving our ability to meet it. I now invite a wide-ranging debate on the report, its recommendations, and how we can work together to implement it.

Mark Isherwood: Thank you for your statement and for commissioning the report, Deputy Minister. I am grateful that you reminded me this morning—before I made any comments this afternoon—that I had called for the report. I also thank you for consulting me in confidence on the composition of the task and finish group, and I am also grateful to its members for inviting me to give evidence and for the pre-briefing given to me and Peter Black this morning. I add my thanks to Sue Essex, Peter Williams and Bob Smith for a timely and constructive report.

I welcome the fact that they have used the words 'housing crisis'. As the report states, which I think was on the projector this morning at the official launch, the current crisis serves to remind us that the bedrock of

rhaglen adeiladu newydd, ac mae'n awgrymu dull newydd o hwyluso'r broses o wella'r stoc dai mewn awdurdodau lleol lle y mae tenantiaid wedi pleidleisio yn erbyn trosglwyddo stoc. Mae hefyd yn ystyried dulliau o wella trefniadau consortia cymdeithasau tai.

I bawb sy'n ymddiddori ym maes tai yng Nghymru, mae hwn yn adroddiad arloesol. Mae'n gynhwysfawr ac yn gynhwysol, ac mae ynddo heriau i bawb sy'n gysylltiedig. O ran Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, mae'n ein herio i arwain y newid sy'n angenrheidiol. O ran awdurdodau lleol, mae'n eu herio i hwyluso gweithio mewn partneriaeth ac i reoli perfformiad. O ran cymdeithasau tai, mae'n eu herio i ddod yn fwy arloesol ac i ddefnyddio eu hasedau'n fwy effeithiol er mwyn buddsoddi rhagor.

Ers comisiynu'r adroddiad hwn, mae'r heriau wedi cynyddu. Pan ymgymerais â'm swydd, yr oeddem yn canolbwyntio ar 'Cymru'n Un' ac ar ein hymrwymiaadau o ran tai. Gan fod y newidiadau yn yr economi'n effeithio ar y marchnadoedd tai, mae'r heriau'n fwy o lawer yn awr. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn ddadansoddiad cynhwysfawr o'r sefyllfa bresennol, ac mae'n cynnig dull cydlynol o wella ein gallu i ymateb iddi. Gofynnaf yn awr am ddadl eang ar yr adroddiad, ei argymhellion, a'r modd y gallwn gydweithio i'w roi ar waith.

Mark Isherwood: Diolch i chi am eich datganiad ac am gomisiynu'r adroddiad, Ddirprwy Weinidog. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am ichi fy atgoffa y bore yma—cyn imi wneud unrhyw sylwadau y prynhawn yma—fy mod wedi galw am yr adroddiad. Diolchaf i chi hefyd am ymgynghori'n gyfrinachol â mi ynghylch cyfansoddiad y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen, ac yr wyf hefyd yn ddiolchgar i'w aelodau am fy ngwahodd i roi tystiolaeth ac am y briffio a roddwyd ymlaen llaw i mi ac i Peter Black y bore yma. Diolchaf hefyd i Sue Essex, Peter Williams a Bob Smith am adroddiad sy'n amserol ac yn adeiladol.

Croesawaf y ffaith eu bod wedi defnyddio'r geiriau 'argyfwng tai'. Fel y mae'r adroddiad yn dweud, a chredaf fod hyn ar y taflunydd y bore yma yn y cyfarfod lansio swyddogol, mae'r argyfwng presennol yn fodd i'n

affordable housing in sustainable communities is essential to the wellbeing of Wales and its people. As Sue Essex stated this morning, it is about delivery on housing need as that need changes. She emphasised that it is about three sector delivery across public, private and voluntary sector agencies, maximising the use of resources, be they financial, land, skills or expertise.

hatgoffa bod y sylfaen o dai fforddiadwy mewn cymunedau cynaliadwy'n hanfodol i les Cymru a'i phobl. Fel y dywedodd Sue Essex y bore yma, mae'n ymwneud â chyflenwi anghenion tai fel y mae'r anghenion hynny'n newid. Pwysleisiodd ei fod yn golygu cyflenwi gan dri sector ar draws asiantaethau'r sectorau cyhoeddus, preifat a gwirfoddol, defnyddio adnoddau i'r eithaf, boed hwy'n gyllid, yn dir, yn sgiliau neu'n arbenigedd.

How do you respond to the task and finish group's statement this morning that the Assembly Government's role must move from being one of command and control to one of strategically enabling delivery? Do you agree that the first thing that you need to do is call all the key players across the three sectors and get them around the table to agree on a change programme?

Beth yw'ch ymateb i ddatganiad y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen y bore yma bod rhaid i rôl Llywodraeth y Cynulliad newid o fod yn un sy'n gorchymyn ac yn rheoli i fod yn un sy'n hwyluso cyflenwi strategol? A ydych yn derbyn mai'r peth cyntaf y mae angen ichi ei wneud yw galw'r holl gyfranogion allweddol yn y tri sector a dod â hwy at y bwrdd i gytuno ar raglen ar gyfer newid?

Do you share the report's concern at the lack of a robust evidence base regarding the need for additional affordable housing at a national level in Wales? Do you agree with the report's finding that, while the commitment to build 6,500 new affordable homes by 2011 is welcome, it is unlikely to be sufficient fully to address the need?

A ydych yn rhannu'r pryder sydd yn yr adroddiad ynghylch diffyg sylfaen dystiolaeth gadarn am yr angen am dai fforddiadwy ychwanegol ar lefel genedlaethol yng Nghymru? A ydych yn derbyn y canfyddiad sydd yn yr adroddiad fod yr ymrwymiad i godi 6,500 o gartrefi fforddiadwy newydd erbyn 2011, er ei fod i'w groesawu, yn annhebygol o fod yn ddiog i ddiwallu'r angen?

How will you respond to the impact of the so-called 'credit crunch' given that you have been relying on section 106 agreements but that housing associations report that developers, and now mortgage lenders, are pulling out of such agreements?

Sut y byddwch yn ymateb i effaith y 'wasgfa gredyd' fel y'i gelwir o gofio'ch bod wedi dibynnu ar gytundebau adran 106 ond bod cymdeithasau tai'n rhoi gwybod bod datblygwyr, a benthycwyr morgeisi'n awr, yn tynnu'n ôl o gytundebau o'r fath?

As we just heard, the Essex report proposes a fundamental change in the regulatory system for housing associations. However, that is what housing associations have been calling for, and they will welcome this. Their assets, worth £3.2 billion, are being underused by the regulatory environment in which the associations operate, and perhaps one of the biggest concerns is that they have been prevented from developing homes for sale using cross-subsidy and the development of mixed tenure, which associations in England have been able to do. Deputy Minister, will you give urgent consideration to proposals regarding this in the report?

Fel yr ydym newydd glywed, mae adroddiad Essex yn cynnig newid sylfaenol yn y system reoleiddio i gymdeithasau tai. Fodd bynnag, dyna'r hyn y mae cymdeithasau tai wedi bod yn galw amdano, a byddant yn croesawu hyn. Mae eu hasedau, sy'n werth £3.2 biliwn, yn cael eu tanddefnyddio gan yr amgylchedd rheoleiddiol lle y mae'r cymdeithasau'n gweithredu, ac efallai mai un o'r testunau pryder mwyaf yw eu bod wedi'u hatal rhag datblygu cartrefi i'w gwerthu drwy draws-gymorthdaliadau a datblygu daliadaethau cymysg, sef yr hyn y mae cymdeithasau yn Lloegr wedi gallu gwneud. Ddirprwy Weinidog, a wnewch ystyried cynigion

Housing associations have also expressed concern that the current inspection programme that the Wales Audit Office runs as an agent of the Assembly Government is 'slow, process-dominated and expensive'. Will you therefore give serious consideration to proposals in the report for the Wales Audit Office contract to go out to tender, and for the introduction of a staged intervention process that will give housing associations, individually and together in consortia, greater priority in a new inspection regime?

Regarding proposals for a greater contribution of local authority land, how will you work with local authorities and the Welsh Local Government Association to acknowledge the practical barriers that they say exist given the pressure on their resources and their need to use their assets to deliver their statutory responsibilities, while encouraging those local authorities with poor records to bring more to the table?

A point that I raised with you in private last week, which you asked me to raise today, is that many housing associations say that they could increase the supply of affordable housing if they could procure private sector housing, including from house builders, perhaps from frozen developments due to the current economic environment. They say that they are receiving lots of calls from developers who want to do business, but the Assembly Government is telling them that they can do that only if the properties would meet the Welsh housing quality standard by 2012, and a problem arises over room sizes. Will you therefore give consideration to this matter? This was put to me by a major social housing group, not in north Wales but in Wales. If new-build houses are of a good enough quality for private sector sale, they are presumably of a good enough quality for people in the social and intermediate market as well.

Community Housing Cymru has indicated that housing associations can raise £112 million extra to support an expanded development programme, and that has been

ynghylch hyn sydd yn yr adroddiad ar fyrder?

Mae cymdeithasau tai wedi mynegi pryder hefyd fod y rhaglen arolygu bresennol y mae Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru yn ei rhedeg fel asiant i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn 'araf, yn ddrud ac yn rhoi'r lle blaenaf i brosesau'. Felly a wnewch ystyried o ddifrif gynigion sydd yn yr adroddiad i gynnig contract Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru ar dendr, ac i gyflwyno proses ymyrraeth fesul cam a fydd yn rhoi mwy o flaenoriaeth i gymdeithasau tai, yn unigol a chyda'i gilydd mewn consortia, mewn cyfundrefn arolygu newydd?

Ynghylch cynigion ar gyfer cyfrannu mwy o dir gan awdurdodau lleol, sut y byddwch yn gweithio gydag awdurdodau lleol a Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru i gydnabod y rhwystrau ymarferol y maent yn dweud eu bod yn bodoli o gofio'r pwysau ar eu hadnoddau a'r angen iddynt ddefnyddio eu hasedau i gyflawni eu cyfrifoldebau statudol, gan annog yr awdurdodau lleol hynny sydd â record wael i gynnig mwy?

Un pwynt a godais yn breifat gyda chi yr wythnos diwethaf, y gofynasoch imi ei godi heddiw, yw bod llawer o gymdeithasau tai'n dweud y gallent gyflenwi mwy o dai fforddiadwy pe gallent gaffael tai sector preifat, gan gynnwys rhai gan adeiladwyr tai, efallai o ddatblygiadau sydd wedi'u rhewi oherwydd yr amgylchedd economaidd presennol. Dywedant eu bod yn cael llawer o alwadau gan ddatblygwyr sydd am ddelio â hwy, ond bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn dweud wrthynt nad ydynt ond yn cael gwneud hynny os byddai'r adeiladau'n cwrdd â safon ansawdd tai Cymru erbyn 2012, ac mae problem yn codi ynghylch meintiau ystafelloedd. Felly a wnewch ystyried y mater hwn? Awgrymwyd hyn i mi gan grŵp tai cymdeithasol o bwys, nid yng ngogledd Cymru ond yng Nghymru. Os yw tai a godir yn newydd o ansawdd digon da i'w gwerthu gan y sector preifat, gellir cymryd eu bod o ansawdd digon da i bobl yn y farchnad gymdeithasol a chanolradd hefyd.

Mae Cartrefi Cymunedol Cymru wedi nodi y gall cymdeithasau tai godi £112 miliwn yn ychwanegol i gynnal rhaglen ddatblygu ehangach, ac ategwyd hynny yn yr adroddiad

supported in this report. Will you consider action now to move this forward prudently? The report also refers to a review of housing benefit announced by the UK Government in 2008. How do you respond to wider concerns that a reduction in the backdating period for housing benefit could lead to increased homelessness and therefore increased pressure on local authority housing budgets?

There are so many points to be raised, and I look forward to debating them with you in the future, but my final one for today is with regard to the intermediate housing market. How do you respond to the general feeling in the sector—and it has been referred to in this report—that low-cost home ownership needs recognition in the social housing grant, and that the grant's application needs to be more flexible and not restricted to the homebuy scheme or its variants but extended to other forms of low-cost ownership? That would enable housing associations, individually and collectively, to deliver better, higher volume and higher quality outcomes with the mix of resource available to them.

4.10 p.m.

Jocelyn Davies: I thank you for your generous support for the commissioning of the report, and Peter also gave such support. As Deputy Minister, I am not able to respond to any of the recommendations today. This is the launch of the report and I would have to give any of the recommendations serious consideration before responding. I am, however, happy to say that you need not worry about the One Wales Government providing strategic leadership. That is a commitment that I am happy to give to you, and I am surprised that you even question it.

On whether the 6,500 new affordable homes will be sufficient, there are people who say 'no' and there are people who say that the figure is very challenging. The truth is that we do not have reliable data and, of course, the report points that out. We will certainly be looking at that in some detail.

hwn. A wnewch ystyried cymryd camau'n awr i hyrwyddo hyn yn bwyllog? Mae'r adroddiad yn cyfeirio hefyd at adolygiad o fudd-dal tai a gyhoeddwyd gan Lywodraeth y DU yn 2008. Beth yw'ch ymateb i bryderon mwy cyffredinol y byddai lleihau'r cyfnod ôl-ddyddio ar gyfer budd-dal tai'n gallu arwain at fwy o ddigartrefedd a mwy o bwysau o ganlyniad ar gyllidebau tai awdurdodau lleol?

Mae cynifer o bwyntiau i'w codi, ac edrychaf ymlaen at eu trafod gyda chi yn y dyfodol, ond mae'r un olaf gennyf am heddiw'n ymwneud â'r farchnad dai canolradd. Beth yw'ch ymateb i'r ymdeimlad cyffredinol yn y sector—ac mae'r adroddiad hwn wedi cyfeirio at hyn—fod angen cydnabod perchentyaeth cost isel yn y grant tai cymdeithasol, a bod angen defnyddio'r grant yn fwy hyblyg a pheidio â'i gyfyngu i'r cynllun cymorth prynu neu'r gwahanol fersiynau ohono ond ei ymestyn i gynnwys mathau eraill o berchnogaeth gost isel? Byddai hynny'n galluogi cymdeithasau tai, yn unigol a chyda'i gilydd, i sicrhau canlyniadau gwell, gyda niferoedd mwy ac ansawdd uwch, gan ddefnyddio'r cymysgedd o adnoddau sydd ar gael iddynt.

Jocelyn Davies: Diolchaf i chi am eich cefnogaeth hael i gomisiynu'r adroddiad, a rhoddodd Peter gefnogaeth o'r fath hefyd. Fel Dirprwy Weinidog, nid wyf yn gallu ymateb i'r un o'r argymhellion heddiw. Lansio'r adroddiad yw hyn a byddai'n rhaid imi ystyried unrhyw un o'r argymhellion yn fanwl cyn ymateb. Er hynny, yr wyf yn falch o ddweud nad oes angen ichi boeni am ddarparu arweiniad strategol gan Lywodraeth Cymru'n Un. Mae hwnnw'n ymrwymiad yr wyf yn falch o'i roi i chi, ac yr wyf yn synnu ichi ei amau hyd yn oed.

Ynghylch a fydd y 6,500 o gartrefi fforddiadwy newydd yn ddigon, mae rhai sy'n dweud 'na fyddant' a rhai sy'n dweud bod y ffigur yn ymestynnol iawn. Y gwir yw nad oes gennym ddata dibynadwy ac, wrth gwrs, mae'r adroddiad yn tynnu sylw at hynny. Byddwn yn sicr o edrych ar hynny'n eithaf manwl.

On the section 106 agreements, as you know, we have always said that the 6,500 extra affordable homes cannot be secured with the social housing grant alone; we would be using the planning system, which has been underused in Wales. It is stated in the report that local authorities have missed opportunities to secure affordable housing using section 106 agreements. You quite rightly point out that if there is no development, there will not be as much room to use 106 agreements as there would have been in the past. However, you also pointed out that the credit crunch that we are experiencing means that developers are looking for opportunities with the Government to offload land and houses that they have already developed, perhaps at cheaper prices. I have to say to you, Mark, that why you would think that because a property is good enough for private sale it is good enough for social housing absolutely escapes me. The standard required for social housing is higher than that for private housing. I am sorry, as it could well be that the developers to whom you have spoken—

Mark Isherwood *rose*—

Jocelyn Davies: You cannot intervene, as I am making a statement.

The Presiding Officer: Order. I am grateful to the Deputy Minister. She is absolutely right. [*Laughter.*]

Jocelyn Davies: The standard for new-build social housing is very high, for very good reasons. The Welsh housing quality standard is also very high. We are considering giving housing associations extra time to meet the standard if they were to purchase property, but there is no question about bringing properties bought for social housing up to the required standard. Very often, Mark, when you look at new-build homes, you can see which part has been built for affordable housing, because, quite often, it is awful. That is not social housing. That is one very good reason why the Assembly needs control over building regulations. Then, all new properties would be of equal standard.

Ynghylch y cytundebau adran 106, fel y gwyddoch, yr ydym wedi dweud erioed na ellir sicrhau'r 6,500 o gartrefi fforddiadwy ychwanegol gan ddefnyddio'r grant tai cymdeithasol yn unig; byddem yn defnyddio'r system gynllunio, nad yw wedi'i defnyddio ddigon yng Nghymru. Dywedir yn yr adroddiad fod awdurdodau lleol wedi colli cyfleoedd i sicrhau tai fforddiadwy drwy ddefnyddio cytundebau adran 106. Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle wrth nodi na fydd cymaint o gyfle i ddefnyddio cytundebau adran 106 ag y buasai yn y gorffennol os nad oes unrhyw ddatblygu. Fodd bynnag, nodasoch hefyd fod y wasgfa greddyd yr ydym yn ei theimlo'n golygu bod datblygwyr yn chwilio am gyfleoedd gyda'r Llywodraeth i ddadlwytho tir a thai y maent wedi'u datblygu eisoes, efallai am brisiau rhatach. Rhaid imi ddweud wrthy, Mark, na allaf ddeall pam y credech fod eiddo'n ddigon da ar gyfer tai cymdeithasol am ei fod yn ddigon da i'w werthu'n breifat. Mae'r safon sy'n ofynnol ar gyfer tai cymdeithasol yn uwch na honno ar gyfer tai preifat. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, gan ei bod yn ddigon posibl bod y datblygwyr yr ydych wedi siarad â hwy—

Mark Isherwood *a gododd*—

Jocelyn Davies: Ni allwch ymyrryd, gan fy mod yn gwneud datganiad.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Dirprwy Weinidog. Mae'n hollol gywir. [*Chwerthin.*]

Jocelyn Davies: Mae'r safon ar gyfer tai cymdeithasol a godir yn newydd yn uchel iawn, a hynny am resymau da iawn. Mae safon ansawdd tai Cymru yn uchel iawn hefyd. Yr ydym yn ystyried rhoi mwy o amser i gymdeithasau tai i gwrdd â'r safon petaent yn prynu eiddo, ond nid oes dadl ynghylch codi eiddo a brynir ar gyfer tai cymdeithasol at y safon ofynnol. Yn aml iawn, Mark, pan edrychwch ar gartrefi sydd wedi'u codi'n newydd, gallwch weld pa ran a godwyd ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy, oherwydd, yn aml iawn, mae'n ofnadwy. Nid tai cymdeithasol yw'r rheini. Dyna un rheswm da pam y mae angen i'r Cynulliad gael rheolaeth dros reoliadau adeiladu. Wedyn, byddai'r holl dai newydd o'r un safon.

I will certainly take on board what you say. You make a very good point about inspection, because we do pay a great deal of money for the inspection of housing associations, and we need the inspectors to be inspecting the right thing. I will certainly give serious consideration to that.

You also mentioned the intermediate market and the idea of having sustainable communities by having mixed tenure; I would agree with you 100 per cent on that. Maybe we ought to be looking at tenure-neutral housing as a way forward. I intend to consult over the summer on the future of low-cost home ownership schemes in Wales.

Joyce Watson: I welcome the independent report that you commissioned and the fact that it highlights some good practice. That should be taken forward to provide some pragmatic solutions to this urgent and complex issue across Wales. That is what the people want us to do: find solutions. It is well documented that affordable housing is a real problem across rural Wales, but these practical steps will make a difference and play a role in the Welsh Assembly Government's anti-poverty agenda.

I welcome the report's commendation of good practice in Carmarthenshire and Powys. Carmarthenshire County Council has worked hard over recent years to bring empty properties into use and to drive policy direction through its affordable housing action plan, 'A Step on the Ladder'.

Meanwhile, Mid Wales Housing Association in Powys has developed the first scheme in Wales for moving across tenure, to encourage balanced communities, responding to the changing circumstance of households without the necessity of moving house. Therefore, will you drive forward these innovative approaches, which I believe lead the way to others? Will you press for them to be actioned for greater effect in other parts of Wales?

Jocelyn Davies: You rightly point out that it is solutions that we are looking for, which will need collaboration with partners, and a proper partnership approach. The report

Byddaf yn sicr o ystyried yr hyn a ddywedwch. Mae'r pwynt a wnaethoch am arolygu'n dda iawn, gan ein bod yn talu llawer iawn o arian am arolygu cymdeithasau tai, ac mae arnom angen i'r arolygwyr archwilio'r peth iawn. Byddaf yn sicr o ystyried hynny o ddifrif.

Cyfeiriasoch hefyd at y farchnad ganolradd ac at y syniad o gael cymunedau cynaliadwy drwy gael daliadaethau cymysg; byddwn yn llwyr gytuno â chi ar hynny. Efallai y dylem ystyried tai â daliadaeth niwtral fel ffordd ymlaen. Bwriadaf ymgynghori dros yr haf ynghylch dyfodol cynlluniau perchentyaeth cost isel yng Nghymru.

Joyce Watson: Croesawaf yr adroddiad annibynnol a gomisiynasoch a'r ffaith ei fod yn tynnu sylw at rai arferion da. Dylid datblygu hynny er mwyn cynnig rhai atebion ymarferol i'r mater cymhleth a brys hwn ledled Cymru. Dyna'r hyn y mae'r bobl am inni ei wneud: dod o hyd i atebion. Mae cryn dystiolaeth i ddangos bod tai fforddiadwy'n broblem wirioneddol ledled Cymru wledig, ond bydd y camau ymarferol hyn yn gwneud gwahaniaeth ac yn chwarae rhan yn agenda wrth-dlodi Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Croesawaf y ganmoliaeth sydd yn yr adroddiad i arferion da yn sir Gaerfyrddin a Phowys. Mae Cyngor Sir Caerfyrddin wedi gweithio'n galed dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf i ddefnyddio tai gwag a hyrwyddo polisi drwy ei gynllun gweithredu ar dai fforddiadwy, 'Cam ar yr Ysgol'.

Yn y cyfamser, mae Cymdeithas Tai Canolbarth Cymru ym Mhowys wedi datblygu'r cynllun cyntaf yng Nghymru ar gyfer symud ar draws deiliadaethau, i annog cymunedau cytbwys, gan ymateb i amgylchiadau cyfnewidiol aelwydydd heb orfod symud tŷ. Felly, a ewch ati i roi'r ymagweddau arloesol hyn ar waith, sy'n ymagweddau y credaf y byddant yn arwain y ffordd i eraill? A bwyswch iddynt gael eu gweithredu er gwell mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru?

Jocelyn Davies: Nodwch, a hynny'n gywir, mai am atebion yr edrychwn, atebion a fydd yn gofyn am gydweithio gyda phartneriaid ac ymagwedd bartneriaeth briodol. Mae'r

contains a chapter on good practice that can be found all over Wales, and you rightly point to the Carmarthen scheme of bringing empty properties back into use. You may recall a few weeks ago the Joseph Rowntree Foundation report that was commissioned about rural Wales, which found that there could be as many as 18,000 empty properties in rural Wales alone. Therefore, any local authority that is prepared to tackle the empty properties in its area will be able to use a resource that is, perhaps, being completely wasted at present. Local authorities have considerable powers in relation to empty properties, and very few of those powers have been used. However, I believe that Carmarthen is encouraging private owners to bring those properties back into use. You are right that we need to spread that good practice, because it works—it is good value for money, and it means that we are not wasting that resource.

Peter Black: I also welcome this authoritative and thorough report, and congratulate Sue Essex, Dr Peter Williams, and Dr Bob Smith on producing it. It is a credit to them, as well as to the Assembly Government for commissioning it, and I believe that it is a worthwhile exercise, which will hopefully lead to a huge improvement in the availability of affordable housing. I also welcome the principles that the report embraces, which reflect those in the Beecham report of cross-cutting work across sectors, and with partners, to try to deliver on the objectives of providing that housing, and enabling people to live affordably in Wales.

You dealt with Mark Isherwood's question, which I believe is also reflected in the report, namely, is 6,500 affordable homes enough? The question that this report poses, and which needs to be posed as part of the response to this report, is whether 6,500 can be achieved, and will we ever know whether they have been achieved. You made a promise to the Communities and Culture Committee not so long ago that you would come back to us by the end of this term with some idea as to how you would measure the number of affordable homes being built in Wales using social housing grant, local authority resources, as well as section 106 agreements and other means, so that we could properly assess this

adroddiad yn cynnwys pennod ar arferion da y gellir dod o hyd iddynt ym mhob cwr o Gymru, a chyfeiriwch at gynllun Caerfyrddin i aildechrau defnyddio eiddo gwag. Efallai y cofiwch ychydig wythnosau yn ôl adroddiad Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree a gomisiynwyd ar Gymru wledig, a ganfu y gallai fod cynifer â 18,000 eiddo gwag yng Nghymru wledig yn unig. Felly, bydd unrhyw awdurdod lleol sy'n barod i fynd i'r afael ag eiddo gwag yn ei ardal yn gallu defnyddio adnodd sydd, o bosibl, yn cael ei wastraffu'n llwyr ar hyn o bryd. Mae gan awdurdodau lleol gryn dipyn o bwerau yng nghyswllt eiddo gwag, ac ychydig iawn o'r pwerau hynny sydd wedi cael eu defnyddio. Fodd bynnag, credaf fod Caerfyrddin yn annog perchnogion preifat i aildefnyddio'r eiddo hynny. Yr ydych yn gywir i ddweud bod angen inni ledaenu'r arfer da hwnnw, oherwydd mae'n gweithio—mae'n werth da am arian, a golyga nad ydym yn gwastraffu'r adnodd hwnnw.

Peter Black: Croesawaf finnau hefyd yr adroddiad awdurdodol a thrylwyr hwn, a llongyfarchaf Sue Essex, Dr Peter Williams a Dr Bob Smith ar ei lunio. Mae'n glod iddynt hwy, yn ogystal ag i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad am ei gomisiynu, a chredaf ei fod yn ymarfer gwerth chweil a fydd, gobeithio, yn arwain at welliant mawr o ran faint o dai fforddiadwy sydd ar gael. Croesawaf hefyd egwyddorion yr adroddiad, sy'n adlewyrchu egwyddorion adroddiad Beecham o weithio ar draws sectorau, a chyda phartneriaid, i geisio cyflawni'r amcanion o ddarparu tai, a galluogi pobl i fyw yn gyfforddus yng Nghymru.

Atebasoch gwestiwn Mark Isherwood, y credaf y caiff ei adlewyrchu yn yr adroddiad hefyd, sef, a yw 6,500 o dai yn ddigon? Y cwestiwn a ofynnir yn yr adroddiad hwn, ac y mae angen ei ofyn fel rhan o'r ymateb i'r adroddiad hwn, yw a ellir sicrhau 6,500, ac a gawn wybod byth a gyflawnwyd hynny. Gwnaethoch addewid i'r Pwyllgor Cymunedau a Diwylliant yn ddiweddar y byddech, erbyn diwedd y tymor hwn, yn rhoi syniad inni sut y byddech yn mesur nifer y tai fforddiadwy a gaiff eu hadeiladu yng Nghymru drwy'r grant tai cymdeithasol, adnoddau awdurdodau lleol, yn ogystal â chytundebau adran 106 a dulliau eraill, er mwyn inni allu asesu'r targed hwn yn gywir.

target. Could you reaffirm that you still intend to do that, so that we can measure the impact of the Assembly Government's policies and the success of the measures in this report, as and when they are implemented?

You also mentioned the need to make better use of the planning system, with which I wholeheartedly concur. I accept that that is a major part of your strategy in terms of meeting your targets. However, the point has been made today—either in the report or in conversation—that, with the credit crunch and the downturn in the number of new houses being built, the potential to secure section 106 agreements, although greater than it is at present, is not as great as it once was in terms of meeting those targets. Therefore, what alternatives do you have in place to try to meet your target of 6,500 affordable homes by 2011 if those section 106 agreements—even with the best will and the best skills of the relevant local officers to deliver them—fall short because of the economic circumstances?

4.20 p.m.

In responding to this report, will you once again consider whether a key-worker scheme can be introduced in Wales? Will you consider the point that we should look at the regulations surrounding housing associations—this point was made well in the report—in an effort to release the resources that they are able to draw upon to deliver this agenda?

Jocelyn Davies: Thank you for that contribution, Peter, and for your support for the commissioning of this report. You rightly made the point that it is also based on 'Making the Connections'. You asked whether 6,500 homes are enough; the report says that that is a welcome start. You then questioned whether we will be able to meet that target, because we were partly relying on the planning system. We have done a great deal in order to train local authority officers and members in relation to the use of the planning system. You mentioned that this was our strategy, but it is a shame that it was not in the strategies of the local authorities,

A allech gadarnhau eich bod yn dal i fwriadu gwneud hynny, er mwyn inni allu mesur effaith polisiau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a llwyddiant y mesurau sydd yn yr adroddiad hwn wrth iddynt gael eu rhoi ar waith a phan gânt eu rhoi ar waith?

Soniasoch hefyd am yr angen i ddefnyddio'r system gynllunio'n well, a chytunaf yn llwyr â hynny. Derbyniaf fod hynny'n rhan bwysig o'ch strategaeth o ran cyrraedd eich targedau. Fodd bynnag, gwnaethpwyd y pwynt heddiw—naill ai yn yr adroddiad neu ar lafar—yn sgil yr argyfwng credyd a'r gostyngiad yn nifer y tai newydd sy'n cael eu hadeiladu, nad yw'r potensial i sicrhau cytundebau adran 106, er ei fod yn fwy nag y mae ar hyn o bryd, gymaint ag yr oedd yn y gorffennol o ran cyrraedd y targedau hynny. Felly, pa gynlluniau eraill sydd gennych i geisio cyrraedd eich targed o 6,500 o dai fforddiadwy erbyn 2011 os na fydd y cytundebau adran 106 hynny—hyd yn oed gydag ewyllys orau a sgiliau gorau swyddogion lleol perthnasol i'w cwblhau—yn cyrraedd y nod oherwydd yr amgylchiadau economaidd?

Wrth ymateb i'r adroddiad hwn, a ystyriwch unwaith eto a ellir cyflwyno cynllun gweithiwr allweddol yng Nghymru? A ystyriwch y pwynt y dylem edrych ar y rheoliadau sy'n gysylltiedig â chymdeithasau tai—gwnaethpwyd y pwynt hwn yn eglur yn yr adroddiad—mewn ymdrech i ryddhau'r adnoddau y gallant eu defnyddio i gyflawni'r agenda hon?

Jocelyn Davies: Diolch ichi am y cyfraniad hwnnw, Peter, ac am gefnogi comisiynu'r adroddiad hwn. Gwnaethoch y pwynt, a hynny'n briodol, ei fod hefyd yn seiliedig ar 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau'. Gofynasoch a yw 6,500 o dai yn ddigon; dywed yr adroddiad fod hynny'n ddechrau da. Yna gofynasoch a fyddwn yn gallu cyrraedd y targed hwnnw, gan ein bod yn dibynnu'n rhannol ar y system gynllunio. Yr ydym wedi gwneud llawer i hyfforddi swyddogion ac aelodau awdurdodau lleol o ran defnyddio'r system gynllunio. Soniasoch mai dyma oedd ein strategaeth, ond mae'n drueni nad oedd yn rhan o strategaethau awdurdodau lleol, sydd

which have now missed many opportunities. Those opportunities are gone, and the credit crunch will not last forever, so there will be a return to development.

You were quite right that, when I was last at the committee—I have checked the Record—I promised that I would bring you the information as soon as possible. I cannot bring it to you before I get it, but as soon as I get it, I will make it available. I cannot commit firmly to a date, such as next week or whenever. I think that the commitment that it would be ready before the recess was made by an official; I have not seen that information yet, but you will get it as soon as I do.

On key workers, if we hold a consultation on low-cost home ownership over the summer, we will certainly include that issue. If the planning system prevents us from realising affordable housing, the very reason that housing associations called for the review of regulation was so that they could release more assets in order to build more affordable homes and to do regeneration work. We intend to have affordable housing delivery plans, which will mean that local authorities will look to all the powers that they have in relation to housing, not just the planning powers, in order to secure affordable housing. I know that, under the empty housing properties scheme in Powys, for example, the authority made small grants available to the owners of empty properties in order to have nomination rights for tenants. There are good case studies in the report, and local authorities can do many different things to ensure that the supply of housing is increased.

Alun Ffred Jones: Diolch am yr adroddiad a'r datganiad. Mae nifer o'r argymhellion hyn i'w croesawu'n fawr, er mai mewn tair neu bedair blynedd y gwelwn y prawf, os byddwn wedi gallu adeiladu'r tai sydd yn angenrheidiol i ymateb i'r galw. Mae gennyf dri chwestiwn i'w gofyn i chi ar sail yr adroddiad. Mae un o'r argymhellion yn dweud y dylid cryfhau'r sylfaen staff yn yr is-adran tai, ac yn ddiweddarach yn yr un paragraff mae sôn am fod yn fwy hyblyg ac yn y blaen. Felly, pa gynlluniau sydd gennyf i wneud yr is-adran yn fwy addas ar

bellach wedi colli llawer o gyfleoedd. Mae'r cyfleoedd hynny wedi mynd, ac ni fydd yr argyfwng credyd yn parhau am byth, felly bydd datblygu eto.

Yr oeddech yn iawn i ddweud pan oeddwn yn y pwyllgor ddiwethaf—yr wyf wedi edrych ar y Cofnod—imi addo rhoi'r wybodaeth ichi cyn gynted â phosibl. Ni allaf ei rhoi ichi cyn imi ei chael, ond cyn gynted ag y'i caf, fe'i rhyddhaf. Ni allaf ymrwymo i ddyddiad pendant, fel yr wythnos nesaf neu bryd bynnag. Credaf i'r addewid y byddai'n barod cyn y toriad gael ei wneud gan swyddog; nid wyf wedi gweld y wybodaeth honno eto, ond fe'i cewch cyn gynted ag y daw i law.

O ran gweithwyr allweddol, os cynhaliwn ymgynghoriad ar berchentyaeth cost isel dros yr haf, byddwn yn sicr yn cynnwys hynny. Os system gynllunio sy'n ein hatal rhag sicrhau tai fforddiadwy, yr union reswm y galwodd cymdeithasau tai am adolygiad o'r rheoliad oedd er mwyn iddynt allu rhyddhau rhagor o asedau er mwyn adeiladu rhagor o dai fforddiadwy a gwneud gwaith adfywio. Bwriadwn greu cynlluniau i ddarparu tai fforddiadwy, a fydd yn golygu y bydd awdurdodau lleol yn defnyddio'r holl bwerau sydd ganddynt yng nghyswllt tai, nid y pwerau cynllunio yn unig, er mwyn sicrhau tai fforddiadwy. Gwn, dan y cynllun tai gwag ym Mhowys, er enghraifft, i'r awdurdod roi grantiau bach i berchnogion tai gwag er mwyn cael hawliau enwebu ar gyfer tenantiaid. Mae astudiaethau achos da yn yr adroddiad hwn, a gall awdurdodau lleol wneud llawer o bethau gwahanol i sicrhau cynnydd yn y cyflenwad tai.

Alun Ffred Jones: Thank you for the report and for the statement. Many of these recommendations are to be warmly welcomed, although the test will be in three or four years' time, when we see whether we have been able to build the houses required to respond to the demand. I have three questions to ask of you based on the report. One of the recommendations states that we should strengthen the staffing base of the housing division and, further on in the same paragraph, there is mention of being more flexible and so on. Therefore, what plans do

gyfer y dasg?

Yn ail, mae awgrym yn yr adroddiad bod angen rhyddhau mwy o dir a bod cael gafael ar dir sydd yn rhesymol ei bris yn un o'r heriau sydd yn wynebu llywodraeth leol a phawb sydd yn ymwneud â thai. Sut y byddwch yn cyflawni hyn? Pa newidiadau a wneir gennych er mwyn caniatáu i hynny ddigwydd? Yr oeddwn yn siarad â chynrychiolwyr y Comisiwn Coedwigaeth y diwrnod o'r blaen; mae'r comisiwn wedi cydnabod hyn yn dilyn cais gan y Gweinidog dros gefn gwlad ar y pryd am dir i adeiladu tai. Dair blynedd yn ddiweddarach, nid wyf yn credu bod unrhyw ddarn o dir wedi'i drosglwyddo na thai wedi'u hadeiladu, er bod y Comisiwn Coedwigaeth yn awyddus i weld hynny'n digwydd. Mae'n amlwg bod y drefn a'r broses hon yn hir a chymhleth a, rhywsut neu'i gilydd, mae angen ei hwyluso.

Y trydydd mater yw hwnnw y cyfeiriodd Peter Black ato, sef y drefn gynllunio wrth geisio cynyddu'r stoc dai. Gofynnaf ichi siarad â'r Gweinidog sydd â chyfrifoldeb uniongyrchol dros gynllunio ynghylch un agwedd ar gynllun unedol Cyngor Gwynedd. Yn ei gynllun drafft, yr oedd gan Gyngor Gwynedd gynllun penodol ar gyfer ardaloedd a phentrefi gwledig. O dan rai amodau, byddai modd caniatáu codi tai er mwyn ateb y galw'n lleol. Serch hynny, yn ei ddoethineb, mae'r arolygydd wedi tynnu'r awgrym hwnnw o'r cynllun yn gyfan gwbl, gan adael yr ardaloedd hynny, i bob pwrpas, yn ardaloedd lle na fydd unrhyw ddatblygu tai. Mae i hynny oblygiadau difrifol iawn o ran hyfywedd y cymunedau dan sylw. Sut yn y byd y gallwn sôn am gael cyfundrefn gynllunio hyblyg sy'n ateb y galw, pan fydd yr arolygiaeth gynllunio yn gweithredu'n hollol groes i hynny, ac yn tanseilio ymdrechion awdurdodau lleol i geisio sicrhau bod digon o dai ar gael ar gyfer anghenion lleol? Bydd yn rhaid i bob teulu na fydd yn gallu byw yn yr ardaloedd hynny symud i dai ar rent, neu geisio prynu tai ar y farchnad agored yn y trefi neu'r pentrefi mawr.

Jocelyn Davies: I will speak to the Minister for planning about that particular issue. In chapter 6 of the report, you will find an example of the use of the planning system

you have to make the division more fit for purpose?

Secondly, there is a suggestion in the report that more land needs to be released and that securing reasonably priced land is one of the challenges facing local government and everyone involved in housing. How will you do that? What changes will you introduce to allow that to happen? I was speaking to representatives of the Forestry Commission the other day; the commission has recognised this following the request of the Minister responsible for rural affairs at the time for land for house building. Three years later, I do not think that a single piece of land has been transferred and no houses have been built, although the Forestry Commission is very eager to see this happening. It is clear that this system and process is long and complex and that, somehow or other, we need to simplify it.

The third issue is one that Peter Black referred to, namely the role of the planning system in trying to increase the housing stock. I ask you to speak to the Minister with responsibility for planning regarding one aspect of Gwynedd Council's unitary development plan. In its draft plan, Gwynedd Council had a scheme for rural areas and villages. Under certain conditions, it would be possible to allow the building of homes to meet local need. However, the inspector, in his wisdom, has completely withdrawn that suggestion from the plan, leaving those areas, to all intents and purposes, with no housing development. That has very serious implications in terms of the viability of those communities. How on earth can we talk about having a flexible planning system that meets the needs when the planning inspectorate acts quite contrary to that, undermining the efforts of local authorities to try to ensure that there is an adequate number of houses available to respond to local needs? Every family that cannot be housed in those areas will have to move to rented accommodation or will have to try to buy a house on the open market in the larger villages or towns.

Jocelyn Davies: Siaradaf â'r Gweinidog dros gynllunio am y mater penodol hwnnw. Ym mhennod 6 yr adroddiad, gwelwch enghraifft o ddefnyddio'r system gynllunio mewn

around villages that illustrates the point that you are making.

On making publicly owned land available, we have a land disposal protocol, which is currently under review and is being strengthened. I will take your point up with the Deputy First Minister and with other Cabinet colleagues; the system may be failing us if it does not result in land being released. I am glad that the Minister for Health and Social Services is in the Chamber, because she also has a protocol for the release of land held by health trusts. That means that any surplus land must be considered for affordable housing purposes first. That is to be commended, and if you know of any health trust land that could be used for affordable housing, we would be glad to hear from you. However, we must ensure that the land ends up with affordable housing on it.

You are right, Alun Ffred, that these things do not happen overnight. We have a good report on which to base the context in which change—cultural change in particular—might happen. You mentioned my staff, and I have excellent and experienced staff. Most of them have worked in housing for a long time, and are more than capable of meeting the challenges that this report represents.

pentrefi sy'n egluro'r pwynt a wnewch.

O ran rhyddhau tir sy'n eiddo i'r cyhoedd, mae gennym brotocol gwaredu tir, sy'n cael ei adolygu ar hyn o bryd, ac yn cael ei gryfhau. Codaf eich pwynt gyda'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a chyd-Weinidogion eraill yn y Cabinet; efallai y bydd y system yn ein siomi os nad yw'n arwain at ryddhau tir. Yr wyf yn falch bod y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn y Siambr, oherwydd mae ganddi hithau hefyd brotocol ar gyfer rhyddhau tir sydd yng ngofal ymddiriedolaethau iechyd. Golyga hynny ei bod yn rhaid ystyried unrhyw dir dros ben at ddibenion tai fforddiadwy yn gyntaf. Mae hynny i'w ganmol, ac os gwyddoch am unrhyw dir ymddiriedolaeth iechyd y gellid ei ddefnyddio ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy, byddem yn falch o glywed gennych. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni sicrhau bod tai fforddiadwy yn cael ei adeiladu ar y tir.

Yr ydych yn gywir, Alun Ffred, pan ddywedwch nad yw'r pethau hyn yn digwydd dros nos. Mae gennym adroddiad da a fydd yn sail i'r cyd-destun ar gyfer newid—newid diwylliannol yn arbennig. Soniasoch am fy staff, ac mae gennyf staff rhagorol a phrofiadol. Mae'r rhan fwyaf ohonynt wedi gweithio yn y maes tai ers amser, ac yn fwy na chymwys i godi i'r heriau sydd yn yr adroddiad hwn.

Datganiad am yr Adolygiad Sicrwydd o'r Gwasanaeth Ambiwllans Statement on the Ambulance Service Assurance Review

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Edwina Hart): In November 2007, I announced that I had asked Stuart Fletcher, Chair of the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust, to lead a review of the Welsh ambulance service. I asked that the review consider the progress the trust had made against the recommendations of the Auditor General for Wales's report, published in December 2006, whether the Trust's plans for further modernisation are robust and deliverable, and the effectiveness of infection control and cleanliness in ambulance vehicles.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Edwina Hart): Ym mis Tachwedd 2007, cyhoeddais fy mod wedi gofyn i Stuart Fletcher, Cadeirydd Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwllans Cymru, arwain adolygiad o wasanaeth ambiwlans Cymru. Gofynnais i'r adolygiad ystyried y cynnydd yr oedd yr ymddiriedolaeth wedi'i wneud yn erbyn argymhellion adroddiad Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru, a gyhoeddwyd fis Rhagfyr 2006, p'un a yw cynlluniau'r Ymddiriedolaeth i foderneiddio ymhellach yn gadarn ac yn ymarferol, ac effeithiolrwydd rheoli heintiau a glendid mewn cerbydau ambiwlans.

My decision to request a review was based on my concerns at the continued poor response-time performance of the emergency ambulance service in some areas of Wales, and on the concerns raised with me by Assembly Members and members of the public about the delivery and performance of ambulance services in their areas.

4.30 p.m.

Many of you have continued to raise issues with me since I announced the review, and you will be aware of my disappointment at the poor performance in some local health board areas and the unacceptable variation in performance across Wales. I am determined to see improvements achieved in the responsiveness of ambulance services in Wales, and I expect to see significant improvement in the next six months.

I am grateful to Stuart Fletcher, David Galligan of Unison, Professor Morton Warner of the Welsh Institute for Health and Social Care, Dr Nick Looker of the National Public Health Service, and the Wales Audit Office, for the work that they have done in carrying out the review. I also thank the staff of the Welsh Ambulance Service NHS Trust and other organisations whose contributions have been invaluable in informing their work.

The report makes 16 recommendations for improvements across the service and provides further recommendations on the robustness of the trust's modernisation plan and infection control procedures.

On the issue of the progress that the trust has made against the recommendations of the Auditor General's report, the review found that the trust is in a stronger position than it was when the report was published. Overall performance has improved and the trust has made some progress in the first year of its modernisation programme.

While I am satisfied with the findings that the

Seiliwyd fy mhenderfyniad i ofyn am adolygiad ar fy mhryderon ynghylch perfformiad gwael parhaus o ran amser ymateb y gwasanaeth ambiwlans brys mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru, ac ar y pryderon a godwyd gyda mi gan Aelodau'r Cynulliad a'r cyhoedd ynghylch darpariaeth a pherfformiad y gwasanaethau ambiwlans yn eu hardaloedd.

Mae llawer ohonoch wedi parhau i godi materion gyda mi ers imi gyhoeddi'r adolygiad, a byddwch yn ymwybodol o'm siom ynghylch y perfformiad gwael yn ardaloedd rhai byrddau iechyd lleol a'r amrywiaeth annerbiniol mewn perfformiad ar draws Cymru. Yr wyf yn benderfynol o weld sicrhau gwelliannau yn ymatebolrwydd gwasanaethau ambiwlans yng Nghymru, a disgwyliaf weld gwelliant sylweddol yn y chwe mis nesaf.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Stuart Fletcher, David Galligan o Unsain, yr Athro Morton Warner o Athrofa Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol Cymru, Dr Nick Looker o'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cenedlaethol, a Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru, am eu gwaith yn cynnal yr adolygiad. Diolch hefyd i staff Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaeth Ambiwllans Cymru a chyrrff eraill y bu eu cyfraniadau'n anhepgor o ran cefnogi eu gwaith.

Mae'r adroddiad yn gwneud 16 o argymhellion ar gyfer gwelliannau ar draws y gwasanaeth ac yn darparu argymhellion pellach ar gadernid cynllun moderneiddio a gweithdrefnau rheoli haint yr ymddiriedolaeth.

Ar fater y camau ymlaen y mae'r ymddiriedolaeth wedi'u cymryd ar argymhellion adroddiad yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol, canfu'r adolygiad fod yr ymddiriedolaeth mewn sefyllfa gryfach nag yr oedd pan gyhoeddwyd yr adroddiad. Mae'r perfformiad cyffredinol wedi gwella ac mae'r ymddiriedolaeth wedi symud ymlaen rywfaint ym mlwyddyn gyntaf ei rhaglen foderneiddio.

Er fy mod yn fodlon â'r canfyddiadau bod yr

trust has made progress against the Auditor General's recommendations and that some improvements in performance have been achieved, response times in many areas of Wales are far from acceptable. I expect to see demonstrable improvement within the next six months, particularly in rural Wales, where too many people are still waiting too long for a response from the emergency ambulance service. I am particularly concerned about services in Powys. Performance is unacceptable and there is considerable public concern at the resources available in the region and the number of staff vacancies that have remained unfilled for many months. While we all recognise that there are different demands in delivering emergency services in sparsely populated areas, the people of Powys must be assured that when they have an emergency, the service will be there for them, and that they will receive the same of level of care as other residents in Wales.

The solution to delivering high-quality responsive emergency services in Powys goes wider than the Welsh Ambulance Service NHS Trust. I know that Powys Local Health Board and the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust are working with partner organisations to develop new models of care and I have asked officials to ensure that this work is progressed and to report back to me in six months' time.

A number of questions have also been raised with me about the role of rapid response vehicles in delivering improved performance. The review found that, in most cases, the use of rapid response vehicles has not been at the expense of ambulances being available to transport patients to hospital, and that it is for a small minority of calls, mainly in south-east Wales, where excessive delays are experienced. However, it is not acceptable for patients who need to be taken to hospital to experience long delays waiting for ambulance transport. I expect the trust to work in partnership with hospital trusts to address the issues that are impacting on emergency ambulance resources and to ensure that the incidence of long delays is reduced.

ymddiriedolaeth wedi symud ymlaen ar argymhellion yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol a bod rhai gwelliannau wedi'u sicrhau yn ei pherfformiad, mae amserau ymateb mewn sawl rhan o Gymru ymhell o fod yn dderbyniol. Disgwyliaf weld gwelliant amlwg o fewn y chwe mis nesaf, yn enwedig yn y Gymru wledig, lle mae gormod o bobl yn dal i aros yn rhy hir am ymateb gan y gwasanaeth ambiwlans brys. Yr wyf yn arbennig o bryderus am wasanaethau ym Mhowys. Mae'r perfformiad yn annerbyniol ac mae cryn bryder ymhlith y cyhoedd ynghylch yr adnoddau sydd ar gael yn y rhanbarth a nifer y swyddi gwag sydd wedi aros heb eu llenwi ers misoedd lawer. Er ein bod i gyd yn cydnabod bod gwahanol alwadau wrth gyflenwi gwasanaethau brys mewn ardaloedd tenau eu poblogaeth, rhaid rhoi sicrwydd i bobl Powys y bydd y gwasanaeth yno iddynt pan fydd ganddynt argyfwng, ac y cânt yr un lefel o ofal â thriogion eraill yng Nghymru.

Mae'r ateb i gyflenwi gwasanaethau ambiwlans ymatebol o safon uchel ym Mhowys yn mynd ymhellach nag Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwllans Cymru. Gwn fod Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Powys ac Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwllans Cymru yn gweithio gyda chyrrff sy'n bartneriaid i ddatblygu modelau gofal newydd ac yr wyf wedi gofyn i swyddogion sicrhau yr eir â'r gwaith hwn yn ei flaen a dod ag adroddiad yn ôl i mi ymhen chwe mis.

Codwyd nifer o gwestiynau gyda mi hefyd am rôl cerbydau ymateb buan o ran sicrhau perfformiad gwell. Canfu'r adolygiad, yn y rhan fwyaf o achosion, nad ar draul sicrhau bod ambiwlansiau ar gael i gludo cleifion i'r ysbyty y defnyddiwyd cerbydau ymateb buan, ac mai ar gyfer lleiafrif bychan o alwadau y gwnaed hynny, yn bennaf yn ne-ddwyrain Cymru, lle ceir oedi gormodol. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n dderbyniol fod cleifion sydd angen cael eu cludo i'r ysbyty'n profi oedi maith wrth aros am gludiant ambiwlans. Disgwyliaf i'r ymddiriedolaeth weithio mewn partneriaeth gydag ymddiriedolaethau ysbytai i ddatrys y materion sy'n effeithio ar adnoddau ambiwlansiau brys ac i sicrhau y ceir llai o achosion o oedi maith.

One issue impacting on ambulance resources is prolonged delays in handing over patients from ambulance crews to hospital staff. It is unacceptable for patients to wait in ambulances for admission to accident and emergency departments and for paramedics to be delayed in hospital car parks when there are patients in the community who need their services. Therefore, I have introduced a priority target this year to measure the time taken to hand over patients at major accident and emergency departments. NHS organisations should be clear that I will be taking a particular interest in performance against this target and will take action against organisations that fail to improve their service.

My concern about response-time performance does not reflect on ambulance crews, who work hard every day to provide the best service that they can for their communities. I am well aware of the dedication and professionalism shown by ambulance staff and of the difficult and demanding circumstances in which they often have to work. I want to see an ambulance service in Wales that supports its staff and provides them with the means to make the best use of their skills. I was therefore extremely concerned with the review's findings that there are significant problems with the culture of the organisation, leadership and management of staff. The report highlights that the number and speed of changes has had a serious adverse effect on staff morale, and that there are issues of poor people management and perceptions of a bullying culture. These findings are consistent with the trust's staff survey and with views expressed directly to me by some staff in the service.

The Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust must focus on the needs of its staff if it is to continue to improve and deliver a modernised ambulance service that meets the needs and expectations of the people of Wales. I expect the trust to address these serious issues urgently and I will be discussing with Stuart Fletcher how this will be taken forward.

Un mater sy'n effeithio ar adnoddau ambiwlans yw oedi estynedig wrth drosglwyddo cleifion oddi wrth griwiau ambiwlans i staff ysbyty. Mae'n annerbyniol i gleifion aros mewn ambiwlans i gael mynediad i adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys ac i barafeddygon gael eu dal mewn meysydd parcio ysbytai tra bod cleifion yn y gymuned sydd angen eu gwasanaethau. Felly, yr wyf wedi cyflwyno targed flaenoriaeth eleni i fesur yr amser a gymerir i drosglwyddo cleifion i adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys mawr. Dylai sefydliadau'r GIG wybod yn glir y byddaf yn cymryd diddordeb arbennig yn eu perfformiad yn erbyn y targed hwn ac y gweithredaf yn erbyn sefydliadau sy'n methu gwella'u gwasanaeth.

Nid yw fy mhryder ynghylch perfformiad amserau ymateb yn adlewyrchu ar griwiau ambiwlans, sy'n gweithio'n galed bob dydd i ddarparu'r gwasanaeth gorau a allant i'w cymunedau. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol iawn o'r ymroddiad a'r proffesiynoldeb a ddangosir gan staff ambiwlans ac o'r amgylchiadau anodd a chaled y mae'n rhaid iddynt weithio ynddynt yn aml. Mae arnaf eisiau gweld gwasanaeth ambiwlans yng Nghymru sy'n cefnogi ei staff ac yn darparu'r modd iddynt wneud y defnydd gorau o'u sgiliau. Yr oeddwn yn eithriadol o bryderus, felly, gyda chanfyddiadau'r adolygiad fod problemau arwyddocaol gyda diwylliant trefniadaeth, arweiniad a rheolaeth y staff. Mae'r adroddiad yn amlygu fod nifer a chyflymder newidiadau wedi cael effaith andwyol ddifrifol ar ysbryd y staff, a bod problemau gyda rheolaeth wael ar bobl a chanfyddiadau o ddiwylliant bwlio. Mae'r canfyddiadau hyn yn gyson ag arolwg staff yr ymddiriedolaeth ac â sylwadau a fynegwyd yn uniongyrchol i mi gan rai gweithwyr yn y gwasanaeth.

Rhaid i Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwllans Cymru ganolbwyntio ar anghenion ei staff os yw am barhau i wella a chyflenwi gwasanaeth ambiwlans modern sydd yn ateb anghenion a disgwyliadau pobl Cymru. Disgwyliaf i'r ymddiriedolaeth roi sylw ar fyrder i'r materion difrifol hyn a byddaf yn trafod gyda Stuart Fletcher sut y cymerir hyn yn ei flaen.

On the issue of whether the trust's modernisation plan is fit for purpose, the review found that the plan was robust, but that improvements should be made to the trust's programme management arrangements to ensure that the plan is effective in delivering change.

On the question of the effectiveness of infection control and cleanliness in ambulance vehicles, the review found that there is a strong and positive commitment to infection control in the trust and that there is a culture that supports improvement at the highest levels within the organisation. I am pleased that the review concluded that there is a clear commitment by staff on the ground to high standards of hygiene and that the design of the new ambulance vehicles, funded by the Welsh Assembly Government, supports infection control requirements.

I have supported the trust in taking forward its modernisation plans through the provision of additional capital and revenue funding. I want to satisfy myself that I am getting the most value out of the investment that I have made in the service, and I have therefore asked my finance director to work with the trust to assess the organisation's efficiency and spending plans.

I can assure Members today that I remain committed to improving ambulance services in Wales. It is essential that the trust takes on board the recommendations of this review and addresses the needs of its staff, the NHS community and the public it serves. I have told Stuart Fletcher that I expect to see substantial improvements in performance within six months. The recommendations set out the issues that must be tackled and I expect the board to provide strong leadership to ensure that the trust delivers a more responsive and effective service.

The Welsh Assembly Government has given the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust its support. I now expect the trust to take on the challenge before it and to deliver to the people of Wales an ambulance service of which we can all be proud.

Ar gwestiwn a ydyw cynllun moderneiddio'r ymddiriedolaeth yn addas i'r pwrpas, canfu'r adolygiad fod y cynllun yn gadarn, ond y dylid gwella trefniadau rheoli rhaglen yr ymddiriedolaeth i sicrhau bod y cynllun yn effeithiol o ran cyflenwi newid.

Ar gwestiwn effeithiolrwydd rheoli haint a glendid mewn cerbydau ambiwlans, canfu'r adolygiad fod ymrwymiad cryf a chadarnhaol i reoli haint yn yr ymddiriedolaeth a bod yno ddiwylliant sy'n cefnogi gwelliant ar y lefelau uchaf o fewn y sefydliad. Yr wyf yn falch fod yr adolygiad wedi dod i'r casgliad bod ymrwymiad clir gan staff ar y ddaear i safonau uchel o hylendid a bod dyluniad y cerbydau ambiwlans newydd, sydd wedi'u hariannu gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, yn ategu gofynion rheoli haint.

Yr wyf wedi cefnogi'r ymddiriedolaeth i fynd ymlaen â'i chynlluniau moderneiddio trwy ddarparu cyllid cyfalaf a refferniw ychwanegol. Mae arnaf eisiau fy modloni fy hun fy mod yn cael y gwerth mwyaf o'r buddsoddiad yr wyf wedi'i wneud yn y gwasanaeth, ac felly yr wyf wedi gofyn i'm cyfarwyddwr cyllid weithio gyda'r ymddiriedolaeth i asesu effeithlonrwydd a chynlluniau gwario'r sefydliad.

Gallaf sicrhau Aelodau heddiw fy mod yn parhau'n ymroddedig i wella gwasanaethau ambiwlans yng Nghymru. Mae'n hanfodol i'r ymddiriedolaeth dderbyn argymhellion yr adolygiad hwn a rhoi sylw i anghenion ei staff, cymuned y GIG a'r cyhoedd y mae'n eu gwasanaethu. Yr wyf wedi dweud wrth Stuart Fletcher fy mod yn disgwyl gweld gwelliannau sylweddol yn eu perfformiad o fewn chwe mis. Mae'r argymhellion yn amlinellu'r materion y mae'n rhaid mynd i'r afael â hwy a disgwyliaf i'r bwrdd roi arweiniad cryf i sicrhau bod yr ymddiriedolaeth yn cyflenwi gwasanaeth mwy ymatebol ac effeithiol.

Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi rhoi ei chefnogaeth i Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwllans Cymru. Disgwyliaf yn awr i'r ymddiriedolaeth ymgymryd â'r her sy'n ei hwynebu a chyflenwi i bobl Cymru wasanaeth

ambiwylans y gallwn i gyd ymfalchïo ynddo.

Jonathan Morgan: I thank the Minister for her statement. I welcome this report as a contribution to the continued improvement in the performance of the ambulance service. I hope that the Minister agrees that, although we want to see these recommendations being implemented quickly and to see performance improvement over the next six months, we also need a period of calm reflection on the recommendations. We need to decide how the Government and the NHS more widely can help the ambulance service to improve and to meet its performance targets, because we are not talking about a service that operates in isolation—it is a service that depends very heavily on the resources made available to it by the Assembly Government, and also on the way in which the whole of the emergency care system works.

First, I wish to deal with the issue of funding. We know that a large amount of money was provided for capital funding, and we know that the ambulance service sourced 119 new vehicles, which were ready and operational within six months. However, I am still concerned about the revenue funding, because I believe that there is a very big risk with regard to the revenue funding of the ambulance service. We know that, through the strategic change and efficiency programme recovery plan, through the efficiency savings, the trust paid back £12 million in 2006-07, £14 million in 2007-08, and it is due to pay back £17 million in this financial year. The financial years of 2006-07 and 2007-08 saw an improvement in the performance of the service at a time when the service was repaying money to the Assembly Government. I have a concern about the revenue because I can see that there are revenue problems, and the SCEP recovery plan creates what I would term as a risk to the ambulance service. It puts it in a very difficult position with regard to revenue. It is not just the SCEP pressures; there are pressures in the increase in fuel costs, and I assume that, because it happened elsewhere, the 'Agenda for Change' pay award was not fully funded. All of those issues need to be looked at, and I would urge the Government to consider the revenue funding problems that the ambulance service has.

Jonathan Morgan: Diolch i'r Gweinidog am ei datganiad. Yr wyf yn croesawu'r adroddiad hwn fel cyfraniad at y gwelliant parhaus ym mherfformiad y gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Gobeithio y cytuna'r Gweinidog, er bod arnom eisiau gweld gweithredu ar yr argymhellion hyn yn fuan a gweld gwella perfformiad dros y chwe mis nesaf, bod arnom angen cyfnod o fyfyrïo tawel ar yr argymhellion hefyd. Mae angen inni benderfynu sut y gall y Llywodraeth a'r GIG yn ehangach helpu'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans i wella ac i gyrraedd ei dargedau perfformiad, oherwydd nid ydym yn sôn am wasanaeth sy'n gweithredu ar ei ben ei hun—mae'n wasanaeth sy'n dibynnu'n drwm iawn ar yr adnoddau a ddarperir iddo gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, a hefyd ar y ffordd y mae'r cyfan o'r system gofal brys yn gweithio.

Yn gyntaf, hoffwn ddelio â chwestiwn cyllid. Gwyddom y darparwyd swm mawr o arian ar gyfer cyllid cyfalaf, a gwyddom i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans archebu 119 o gerbydau newydd, a oedd yn barod ac yn weithredol o fewn chwe mis. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn dal yn bryderus am y cyllid refeniw, oherwydd credaf fod perygl mawr iawn ynglŷn â chyllid refeniw'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Gwyddom fod yr ymddiriedolaeth, trwy gynllun adfer y rhaglen newid strategol ac effeithlonrwydd, trwy'r arbedion effeithlonrwydd, wedi adalu £12 miliwn yn 2006-07, £14 miliwn yn 2007-08, ac y bwriedir iddi dalu £17 miliwn yn ôl yn y flwyddyn ariannol hon. Gwelodd blynnyddoedd ariannol 2006-07 a 2007-08 welliant ym mherfformiad y gwasanaeth ar adeg pan oedd y gwasanaeth yn ad-dalu arian i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae gennyf bryder am y refeniw oherwydd gallaf weld bod problemau refeniw, ac mae cynllun adfer y rhaglen newid strategol ac effeithlonrwydd yn creu'r hyn y byddwn i'n ei alw'n risg i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Mae'n ei roi mewn safle anodd iawn o safbwynt refeniw. Nid pwysau'r rhaglen newid strategol ac effeithlonrwydd yn unig sydd yma; mae pwysau yn sgîl y cynnydd mewn costau tanwydd, ac yr wyf yn cymryd, oherwydd fe ddigwyddodd mewn man arall, na ddarparwyd cyllid llawn ar gyfer dyfarniad cyflog yr 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid'. Mae

angen edrych ar yr holl faterion hynny, ac anogaf y Llywodraeth i ystyried y problemau cyllid refeniw sydd gan y gwasanaeth ambiwlans.

In your report to us this afternoon, you have said that there is an unacceptable variation in performance across Wales. I agree with you on that. However, I would point out that in the annual operating framework for this year the equity target is different from the target from last year. This year's target requires that each LHB in each month of this year must meet the 60 per cent criterion. That target is fundamentally different from the target that you asked it to work to in the previous year, which said that this should be a 60 per cent criterion across Wales, with continued improvement in each LHB. Those two targets are very different. I would like to know this afternoon whether any new money or help was put aside for the ambulance service to meet that new target.

Yn eich adroddiad inni y prynhawn yma, yr ydych wedi dweud bod amrywiaeth annerbyniol mewn perfformiad ar draws Cymru. Cytunaf â chi ynglŷn â hynny. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn nodi bod y targed ecwiti yn y fframwaith gweithredu blynyddol am eleni'n wahanol i darged y llynedd. Mae targed eleni'n gofyn bod pob bwrdd iechyd lleol ym mhob mis o'r flwyddyn hon yn gorfod cyrraedd y maen prawf 60 y cant. Mae'r targed hwnnw'n sylfaenol wahanol i'r targed y gofynasoch iddo weithio ato yn y flwyddyn flaenorol, a ddywedai y dylai hwn fod yn faen prawf 60 y cant ar draws Cymru, gyda gwelliant parhaus ym mhob bwrdd iechyd lleol. Mae'r ddau darged hynny'n wahanol iawn. Hoffwn wybod y prynhawn yma a neilltuwyd unrhyw arian neu gymorth ychwanegol i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans i gyrraedd y targed newydd hwnnw.

4.40 p.m.

You have said—and I fully welcome and support this—that the trust has made some very good progress in its first year of the modernisation programme. We must recognise that some progress has been made. Can the Minister confirm that in 2007-08, ambulances responded within eight minutes to 7,500 more patients than in the previous year? If that is the case, we should congratulate the trust on that aspect of improved performance. We accept that performance across the board is variable when you compare one local health board area with another, but ambulances seem to be reaching more people quicker than in the previous year. If that is the case, and I hope for confirmation that it is, then we should congratulate the trust on that improvement in performance.

Yr ydych wedi dweud—ac yr wyf yn croesawu ac yn cefnogi hyn yn llawn—fod yr ymddiriedolaeth wedi cymryd camau da iawn ymlaen ym mlwyddyn gyntaf ei rhaglen foderneiddio. Rhaid inni gydnabod bod rhyw gymaint o symud ymlaen wedi digwydd. A all y Gweinidog gadarnhau yr ymatebodd ambiwlansiau, yn 2007-08, o fewn wyth munud i 7,500 yn fwy o gleifion nag yn y flwyddyn flaenorol? Os yw hynny'n wir, dylem longyfarch yr ymddiriedolaeth ar yr agwedd honno o welliant perfformiad. Derbyniwn fod perfformiad ar draws y bwrdd yn amrywiol pan gymharir un ardal bwrdd iechyd lleol ag un arall, ond mae'n ymddangos bod ambiwlansiau'n cyrraedd mwy o bobl yn gyflymach nag yn y flwyddyn flaenorol. Os yw hynny'n wir, a gobeithiaf am gadarnhad ei fod, yna dylem longyfarch yr ymddiriedolaeth am y gwelliant hwnnw mewn perfformiad.

You said that patients should not experience long delays in getting an ambulance to hospital, and, again, I agree. Looking at the figures, in 2007-08, I see that 6,500 more people got an ambulance within the target

Dywedasoch na ddylai cleifion brofi oedi hir wrth gael ambiwlans i'r ysbyty, ac, eto, cytunaf. O edrych ar y ffigurau, yn 2007-08, gwelaf fod 6,500 yn fwy o bobl wedi cael ambiwlans o fewn yr amser targed nag yn y

time than in the previous year. Again, I would appreciate confirmation that that is the case, because we should congratulate the trust on what appears to be an improvement in its performance on that front. More people seem to be getting an ambulance within the target time, although we know that some people are experiencing long delays.

As you pointed out in your statement, you have issued a new target to ensure that people are not sat in ambulances outside of hospitals when they need to be admitted to accident and emergency departments. We agree that people need to be admitted more quickly, but will you outline what steps the Government is taking to ensure that hospitals can help to get patients out of ambulances and into hospital? There is no point having a target just for the ambulance service, because the accident and emergency department itself has an impact. You cannot get people into an accident and emergency department if it does not have room to deal with them. So, could you outline what you are doing as Minister in this regard and how the delivering emergency care services strategy will help the hospital service to engage with the ambulance service to help get people out of ambulances and into accident and emergency departments more quickly?

In looking at this report, the delivering emergency care services strategy, and the capital resources that have been made available, and the challenge that exists for the ambulance service, while I am sure that the service wants to do better and will do better and that you as Minister will be ensuring that it gets on with the job of improving its performance, can you confirm that it is being adversely affected by systemic failures elsewhere in the emergency care system? The Government has to address those failures elsewhere in the NHS and in the emergency care system to ensure that the ambulance service can get on and do its job properly. Unless we address those other issues, the ambulance service will struggle to meet the key performance targets that you and I and everyone else here expect it to meet.

I am grateful for this review having been

flwyddyn flaenorol. Eto, gwerthfawrogwn gadarnhad fod hynny'n wir, oherwydd dylem longyfarch yr ymddiriedolaeth ar yr hyn sy'n ymddangos fel gwelliant yn ei pherfformiad yn hynny o beth. Mae'n ymddangos bod mwy o bobl yn cael ambiwlans o fewn yr amser targed, er y gwyddom fod rhai pobl yn profi oedi maith.

Fel y dywedsoch yn eich datganiad, yr ydych wedi cyhoeddi targed newydd i sicrhau nad yw pobl yn eistedd mewn ambiwlansiau y tu allan i ysbytai pan fo angen eu derbyn i adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys. Cytunwn fod angen derbyn pobl yn gyflymach, ond a wnewch chi amlinellu pa gamau y mae'r Llywodraeth yn eu cymryd i sicrhau y gall ysbytai helpu i gael cleifion allan o ambiwlansiau ac i mewn i'r ysbyty? Nid oes dim pwynt cael targed i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn unig, oherwydd mae'r adran ddamweiniau ac achosion brys ei hun yn effeithio ar hyn. Ni allwch gael pobl i mewn i adran ddamweiniau ac achosion brys os nad oes ganddi le i ddelio â hwy. Felly, a allech amlinellu beth yr ydych yn ei wneud fel Gweinidog ynglŷn â hyn a sut y bydd y strategaeth gyflenwi gwasanaethau gofal brys yn helpu'r gwasanaeth ysbytai i gydweithio â'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans i helpu cael pobl allan o ambiwlansiau ac i mewn i adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys yn gyflymach?

O edrych ar yr adroddiad hwn, y strategaeth gyflenwi gwasanaethau gofal brys, a'r adnoddau cyfalaf sydd wedi'u darparu, a'r her sy'n bodoli i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans, er fy mod yn siŵr bod ar y gwasanaeth eisiau gwneud yn well ac y gwnaiff yn well ac y byddwch chi fel Gweinidog yn sicrhau ei fod yn bwrw ati gyda'r gwaith o wella'i berfformiad, a allwch gadarnhau ei fod yn dioddef oherwydd methiannau systemaidd mewn rhannau eraill o'r system gofal brys? Rhaid i'r Llywodraeth roi sylw i'r methiannau hynny mewn rhannau eraill o'r GIG ac yn y system gofal brys i sicrhau y gall y gwasanaeth ambiwlans fwrw ati a gwneud ei waith yn iawn. Oni allwn ddatrys y materion eraill hynny, caiff y gwasanaeth ambiwlans anhawster i gyrraedd y targedau perfformiad allweddol yr ydych chi a mi a phawb arall yma'n disgwyl iddo'u cyrraedd.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar bod yr adolygiad hwn

commissioned. The ambulance service has struggled with a lack of leadership in the past. I hope that the chief executive, Alan Murray, has the confidence of the Assembly Government. I believe that he is capable of delivering a first-class service for Wales and I hope that you will confirm that the Government will do all that it can to help the service to deliver on its performance targets.

Edwina Hart: There is a limit to what Government can do in these areas. We have to acknowledge that the trust has a chief executive and a chair and that, ultimately, it is their responsibility to get on with managing that organisation and to do what they can within financial confines and so on. I have to be realistic about this. I am not an apologist for the service if it is not getting certain things right, and I never will be. Clearly, in some areas, the ambulance service is clearly not getting things right. Patients are being let down across Wales and we, as Assembly Members, constantly hear complaints in our surgeries about those difficulties.

To turn to some of the specific points that you made, there will have to be implementation of this report and a calm reflection at the same time. The service has to zoom in on the issues that it is still not tackling, which have been outlined in every report, and tackle them. At the moment, I feel that not enough weight is being given to tackling some of the issues that need to be tackled in the ambulance service. To refer to the NHS more widely, you are right that there are issues about how the ambulance service engages with the trusts at accident and emergency level across the piece. That work is successfully moving forward in discussions between the ambulance trust and the rest of the service, which is important. Hospitals have to get their position and admissions procedures correct, and the DECS strategy is starting to make good progress in some areas in terms of how hospitals want to change the format of how they get people in and how they deal with patients. That will start to deliver and will assist the ambulance trust in that regard.

wedi'i gomisiynu. Mae'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans wedi cael trafferthion gyda diffyg arweinyddiaeth yn y gorffennol. Gobeithio bod gan y prif weithredwr, Alan Murray, hyder Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Credaf y gall gyflenwi gwasanaeth o'r radd flaenaf i Gymru a gobeithio y gwnewch gadarnhau y gwnaiff y Llywodraeth bopeth a all i helpu'r gwasanaeth i gyrraedd ei dargedau perfformiad.

Edwina Hart: Dim ond hyn-a-hyn y gall y Llywodraeth ei wneud yn y meysydd hyn. Rhaid inni gydnabod bod gan yr ymddiriedolaeth brif weithredwr a chadeirydd ac mai eu cyfrifoldeb hwy, yn y pen draw, yw mynd ati i reoli'r corff hwnnw a gwneud yr hyn a allant o fewn cyfyngiadau ariannol ac ati. Rhaid imi fod yn realistig ynglŷn â hyn. Nid wyf yn gwneud esgusodion dros y gwasanaeth os nad yw'n gwneud rhai pethau'n iawn, ac ni wnaif hynny byth. Yn amlwg, mewn rhai ardaloedd, nid yw'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn gwneud pethau'n iawn. Mae cleifion yn cael eu siomi ar draws Cymru ac yr ydym ni, fel Aelodau Cynulliad, yn clywed cwynion o hyd yn ein cymorthfeydd am yr anawsterau hynny.

A throi at rai o'r pwyntiau penodol a wnaethoch, bydd yn rhaid cael gweithredu ar yr adroddiad hwn a chyfnod o fyfyrion tawel ar yr un pryd. Rhaid i'r gwasanaeth ganolbwyntio ar y materion nad yw eto'n mynd i'r afael â hwy, sydd wedi'u hamlinellu ym mhob adroddiad, a mynd i'r afael â hwy. Ar hyn o bryd, teimlaf nad oes digon o bwysau'n cael eu rhoi ar fynd i'r afael â rhai o'r materion y mae angen mynd i'r afael â hwy yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans. A chyfeirio at y GIG yn ehangach, yr ydych yn iawn fod problemau ynghylch y modd y mae'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn cydweithio â'r ymddiriedolaethau ar lefel adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys yn gyffredinol. Mae'r gwaith hwnnw'n symud ymlaen yn llwyddiannus mewn trafodaethau rhwng yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans a gweddill y gwasanaeth, sydd yn bwysig. Rhaid i ysbytai sicrhau bod eu safle a'u gweithdrefnau derbyn yn gywir, ac mae'r strategaeth cyflenwi gwasanaethau gofal brys yn dechrau gwneud gwaith da mewn rhai ardaloedd o ran y modd y mae ysbytai'n awyddus i newid patrwm y ffordd y cânt bobl i mewn a'r modd

y deliant â chleifion. Bydd hynny'n dechrau llwyddo ac yn helpu'r ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans yn hynny o beth.

On funding, you are right that there has been quite a lot of capital investment and you make the point about your concerns about the revenue funding issues, the fuel costs and 'Agenda for Change'. As I indicated in my statement, I have sent in my finance director to look at some of the financial issues in the ambulance trust and to make an honest appraisal for me. Every organisation in the NHS tells me that it wants more money and the purpose for which it wants it, and that organisation could have a list of reasons as long as our respective arms but, at the end of the day, I have to be certain that what I am being told is correct, and that is why I have asked my director of finance to go in to look again at the issues. He will report back to me, and if I think that there are issues with what is going on in the ambulance service that I need to address, with regard to the revenue and so on, I will try to deal with them within my budget.

O ran cyllid, yr ydych yn iawn y bu cryn dipyn o fuddsoddi cyfalaf a gwnewch y pwynt ynghylch eich pryderon am faterion sy'n ymwneud â chyllid refeniw, costau tanwydd ac 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid'. Fel y nodais yn fy natganiad, yr wyf wedi anfon fy nghyfarwyddwr cyllid i edrych ar rai o'r materion ariannol yn yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans ac i wneud arfarniad gonest ar fy rhan. Mae pob corff yn y GIG yn dweud wrthyf fod arno eisiau mwy o arian ac i ba ddiben y mae am ei gael, a gallai'r corff hwnnw fod â rhestr o resymau cyn hwyed â breichiau'r ddau ohonom ond, yn y pen draw, rhaid imi fod yn sicr bod yr hyn a ddywedir wrthyf yn gywir, a dyna pam yr wyf wedi gofyn i'm cyfarwyddwr cyllid fynd yno i ailedrych ar y materion sydd dan sylw. Bydd yn adrodd yn ôl i mi, ac os credaf fod ystyriaethau'n codi mewn cysylltiad â'r hyn sy'n mynd ymlaen yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans y mae angen imi roi sylw iddynt, mewn cysylltiad â'r refeniw ac yn y blaen, byddaf yn ceisio delio â hwy o fewn y gyllideb sydd gennyf.

On the various issues across Wales, you make a valid point about the targets. I believe that there is sufficient money within the system for those targets to be delivered. I acknowledge what you say about the other targets, but progress is definitely being made in these areas. I acknowledged in my statement the excellent work that the staff do in the service in delivering, but there is constant onward and upward pressure on this service, and we need to recognise that. We must have a service that is fit for purpose and, however it improves, there will always be room for further improvement.

Ynghylch y gwahanol faterion ledled Cymru, yr ydych yn gwneud pwynt dilys am y targedau. Credaf fod digon o arian yn y system i gyrraedd y targedau hynny. Yr wyf yn derbyn yr hyn a ddywedwch am y targedau eraill, ond gwneir cynnydd pendant yn y meysydd hyn. Cydnabûm yn fy natganiad y gwaith rhagorol y mae'r staff yn ei wneud yn y gwasanaeth o ran mynd â'r maen i'r wal, ond mae pwysau parhaus a chynyddol ar y gwasanaeth hwn, ac mae angen inni gydnabod hynny. Rhaid inni gael gwasanaeth sy'n addas, a pha bynnag welliant a geir ynddo, bydd lle i wella bob amser.

There are many challenges for the service, but the chair's report shows that he is certainly up to the challenges in the service. This is an exceptionally honest appraisal of the difficulties in the organisation by its chair, and I commend Stuart Fletcher for this honest report, which has gone to the heart of matters around the delivery of services within the ambulance trust.

Mae llawer o heriau i'r gwasanaeth, ond mae adroddiad y cadeirydd yn dangos ei fod yn sicr yn atebol i wynebu'r heriau sydd yn y gwasanaeth. Mae hyn yn arfarniad eithriadol o onest o'r anawsterau yn y corff gan ei gadeirydd, a chanmolaf Stuart Fletcher ar yr adroddiad gonest hwn, sydd wedi mynd at wraidd y materion sy'n ymwneud â chyflenwi gwasanaethau o fewn yr

ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans.

Helen Mary Jones: Thank you, Minister, for the review and for the statement. It is pleasing to see that some progress is being made, but I have grave concerns about some of the issues highlighted in this report, and you reflect those concerns in your statement to us today. I also would like to associate myself with what you and Jonathan Morgan said about the hard-working front-line staff who are committed to delivering a service and who really care about their patients. Almost all of us who have had any experience with paramedics and with the people working on the front line, know how caring and committed they are. They are, however, sometimes working in a system that does not facilitate delivery on that caring commitment, and I know, from what I see in my constituency, that no-one is more frustrated or concerned about that than the front-line staff themselves.

I want to ask two questions relating to specific recommendations, Minister. One relates to recommendation 3, which is about strategic planning capacity within the trust. It seems to me from reading the report that one of the ongoing issues is that we still do not necessarily have our ambulances waiting in the right places so that they can get to where they need to be at the right time. I have a concern—which is anecdotal, but, from talking to other Assembly Members, I know that they have also raised it with you—that the front-line knowledge of staff who have to drive these routes at different times of the day is not always fully taken into account. With regard to the implementation of recommendation 3 on strategic planning capacity, will you agree that the trust may need a logistics expert to take a fresh look at where our ambulances are when they are stationed, waiting for an emergency call out—not to look at where we have ambulance stations, although that needs to be looked at, but at where the ambulances need to be and how they could interface with other aspects of the emergency services, for example the fire service. That is my first question about logistics capacity.

Helen Mary Jones: Diolch i chi, Weinidog, am yr adolygiad ac am y datganiad. Mae'n braf gweld bod rhywfaint o gynnydd yn digwydd, ond mae gennyf bryderon dwys ynghylch rhai o'r materion y tynnwyd sylw atynt yn yr adroddiad hwn, ac yr ydych yn adlewyrchu'r pryderon hynny yn eich datganiad i ni heddiw. Byddwn hefyd yn hoffi fy nghysylltu fy hun â'r hyn a ddywedasoeh chi a Jonathan Morgan am y staff rheng flaen diwyd sydd wedi ymrwymo i gyflenwi gwasanaeth ac sy'n poeni o ddifrif am eu cleifion. Mae bron bob un ohonom sydd wedi cael unrhyw brofiad o fod gyda pharafeddygon a chyda'r rhai sy'n gweithio yn y rheng flaen yn gwybod pa mor ofalgar ac ymroddedig ydynt. Er hynny, maent yn gweithio mewn system nad yw ar brydiau'n hwyluso'r ymrwymiad gofalgar hwnnw, ac yr wyf yn gwybod, o'r hyn a welaf yn fy etholaeth, nad oes neb sy'n fwy rhwystredig neu bryderus am hynny na'r staff rheng flaen eu hunain.

Dymunaf ofyn dau gwestiwn ynghylch argymhellion penodol, Weinidog. Mae un ohonynt am argymhelliad 3, sy'n ymwneud â gallu cynllunio strategol yn yr ymddiriedolaeth. Mae'n ymddangos i mi o ddarllen yr adroddiad mai un o'r anawsterau presennol yw nad yw ein hambiwllansiau o reidrwydd yn aros yn y lleoedd iawn fel y gallant gyrraedd y man lle y mae angen iddynt fod ar yr adeg iawn. Yr wyf yn pryderu am un mater—sy'n un anecdotaidd, ond yn un y gwn, o siarad ag Aelodau eraill o'r Cynulliad, eu bod wedi'i godi gyda chi—na roddir ystyriaeth lawn bob amser i wybodaeth y staff rheng flaen sy'n gorfod gyrru ar hyd y llwybrau hyn ar wahanol adegau o'r dydd. Gyda golwg ar weithredu argymhelliad 3 ar allu cynllunio strategol, a wnewch gytuno y gallai fod ar yr ymddiriedolaeth angen arbenigwr ar logisteg i edrych o'r newydd ar leoliadau ein hawbiwlansiau pan fyddant yn aros am alwadau brys—nid i edrych ar leoliad gorsafedd ambiwlans, er bod angen gwneud hynny, ond ar y manau y mae angen i ambiwlansiau fod a sut y gallent ryngweithio ag agweddau eraill ar y gwasanaethau brys; y gwasanaeth tân, er enghraifft. Dyna fy nghwestiwn cyntaf am allu o ran logisteg.

My second question and second set of comments relate to recommendations 8 and 9 on staff relationships. I found this part grim reading. The fact that a public service of this importance does not have a proper evaluation and appraisal system in place, when that has persistently been identified as an issue, and was identified by the Audit Commission as an issue, and that there are issues around bullying and a lack of supportive management culture is a real problem, because, in the end, we depend on the staff to deliver the service. Our public services are only as good as the staff who are in them. We have all extended warm words towards ambulance front-line staff today and on many other occasions, but can you reassure us that delivering on recommendations 8 to 11 will be a priority? Getting those recommendations right is the key to getting some of the other recommendations right. If the staff are on board and motivated and know what they are doing and what is expected of them, other things will fall into place. I was pleased to hear that you will be having urgent discussions with the chair about how recommendations 8 to 11 can be implemented. Would you agree to share the outcome of those discussions, if appropriate, with the Assembly today, in whatever form you feel is most appropriate?

4.50 p.m.

To conclude, we have very good staff, but they need a better structure to work in, and I look forward to seeing these recommendations implemented in a speedy, timely and considered manner.

Edwina Hart: Thank you for your comments. One of the areas that worried me was the lack of strategic planning capacity within the trust. You are absolutely right about some of the complaints that have come in. Staff have said, for example, 'If we were asked, we could tell you the best location for rapid response vehicles, and where we should be situated'. Your suggestion that the trust uses a logistics expert is very good, and that expert could talk to the staff involved and ask them where, if they were starting from day 1, they would want to be located. We must

Mae'r ail gwestiwn sydd gennyf a'r ail set o sylwadau'n ymwneud ag argymhellion 8 a 9 ar gysylltiadau rhwng staff. Cefais y rhan hon yn un annymunol ei darllen. Mae'r ffaith nad yw gwasanaeth cyhoeddus mor bwysig â hwn yn meddu ar system werthuso ac arfarnu briodol, a hynny ar ôl ei nodi'n gyson fel problem, ac ar ôl ei nodi'n broblem gan y Comisiwn Archwilio, a bod trafferthion o ran bwlio a diffyg diwylliant rheoli cefnogol yn broblem wirioneddol, oherwydd, yn y pen draw, yr ydym yn dibynnu ar y staff i gyflenwi'r gwasanaeth. Nid yw ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ond cystal â'r staff sydd ynddynt. Yr ydym oll wedi dweud geiriau caredig am staff rheng flaen yr ambiwlansiau heddiw a llawer tro arall, ond a allwch ein sicrhau y rhoddir blaenoriaeth i weithredu argymhellion 8 i 11? Cael yr argymhellion hynny'n iawn yw'r allwedd i gael rhai o'r argymhellion eraill yn iawn. Os yw'r staff yn gefnogol ac yn frwdfrydig ac yn gwybod beth y maent yn ei wneud a'r hyn a ddisgwylir ganddynt, bydd pethau eraill yn disgyn i'w lle. Yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed y byddwch yn cael trafodaethau brys â'r cadeirydd ynghylch sut y gellir rhoi argymhellion 8 i 11 ar waith. A fydddech yn cytuno i rannu canlyniad y trafodaethau hynny â'r Cynulliad heddiw, os yw'n briodol, ar ba bynnag ffurf y teimlwch ei bod yn fwyaf addas?

I gloi, mae gennym staff da iawn, ond mae arnynt angen gwell strwythur i weithio ynddo, ac edrychaf ymlaen at weld yr argymhellion hyn yn cael eu rhoi ar waith yn fuan, yn amserol ac yn bwyllog.

Edwina Hart: Diolch i chi am eich sylwadau. Un o'r meysydd a barai bryder i mi oedd diffyg gallu cynllunio strategol o fewn yr ymddiriedolaeth. Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle ynghylch rhai o'r cwynion a gafwyd. Mae staff wedi dweud, er enghraifft, 'Pe gofynnid i ni, gallem ddweud wrthyhch beth yw'r lleoliad gorau i gerbydau ymateb cyflym, a lle y dylem gael ein lleoli'. Mae'r awgrym a wnaethoch i'r perwyl y dylai'r ymddiriedolaeth ddefnyddio arbenigwr ar logisteg yn un da iawn, a gallai'r arbenigwr hwnnw siarad â'r staff sy'n gysylltiedig a

accept that patterns of population have changed, and the way in which people access services at hospitals has changed, so that would be a good starting point, and I would be happy to look at that issue. Even though a lot of computer modelling is done on these things, it is sometimes important to speak to the person who does the job and knows the area, and we need to do more of that in the trust.

On staff recommendations 8 and 9, I have never read such a sorry tale about what is going on within an NHS organisation. We do lots of NHS surveys, and there are often complaints, but I have not seen anything like this before regarding staff relations, and the level of bullying that it is suggested goes on in the service. When I set up this group, I was keen to have Unison involved, via Dave Galligan, its senior officer. It indicated to me before we even started that the one thing that would come out would be the staffing issues that are affecting morale. So, that is one of the issues that I will discuss with Stuart Fletcher, but I will also discuss it with Dave Galligan. Staff need to be sure in their own minds that these recommendations will be implemented with their co-operation and with further discussion, and that is important in respect of recommendations 8 and 9. I would be more than happy, when I have had further discussions with Stuart Fletcher, to issue a letter to Assembly Members updating you about where we are going on this particular review and its implementation.

Jenny Randerson: I want to echo the comments of my colleagues by stating that nothing that I say here today reflects on the hard work and dedication of the many people involved in the ambulance service at all levels in Wales.

I want to start with the issues relating to rural areas, and in particular, the concerns about Powys, and the requirement—which I am sure we would all endorse—that there must be a big improvement in the next six months. However, you go on to say that, even in

gofyn iddynt ym mhle y byddent am gael eu lleoli, os oeddent yn cychwyn o'r newydd. Rhaid inni dderbyn bod patrymau poblogaeth wedi newid, a bod y modd y mae pobl yn cael mynediad i wasanaethau mewn ysbytai wedi newid, felly byddai hynny'n fan cychwyn da, a byddwn yn falch o ystyried y mater hwnnw. Er bod llawer o fodelu cyfrifiadurol yn cael ei wneud ar y pethau hyn, mae'n bwysig weithiau siarad â'r un sy'n gwneud y gwaith ac sy'n adnabod yr ardal, ac mae angen inni wneud mwy o hynny yn yr ymddiriedolaeth.

Ynghylch argymhellion 8 a 9 ar staff, nid wyf erioed wedi darllen y fath hanes trist am yr hyn sy'n mynd ymlaen yn un o gyrff y GIG. Yr ydym yn cynnal llawer o arolygon yn y GIG, ac mae cwynion yn aml, ond nid wyf wedi gweld dim byd tebyg i hyn o'r blaen am gysylltiadau rhwng staff, a lefel y bwlio yr awgrymir ei fod yn mynd ymlaen yn y gwasanaeth. Pan sefydlais y grŵp hwn, yr oeddwn yn awyddus i gynnwys Unison, drwy Dave Galligan, ei uwch swyddog. Dywedodd wrthyf cyn inni ddechrau hyd yn oed mai'r peth a ddeuai i'r amlwg oedd y materion staffio sy'n effeithio ar forâl. Felly, dyna un o'r materion y byddaf yn eu trafod â Stuart Fletcher, ond fe'i trafodaf hefyd â Dave Galligan. Mae angen i staff gael gwybod yn sicr y bydd yr argymhellion hyn yn cael eu rhoi ar waith gyda'u cydweithrediad a thrwy drafodaeth bellach, ac mae hynny'n bwysig mewn cysylltiad ag argymhellion 8 a 9. Byddwn yn fodlon iawn, wedi imi gael trafodaethau pellach â Stuart Fletcher, roi llythyr i Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn rhoi gwybod ichi am y datblygiadau mewn cysylltiad â'r cyfeiriad yr ydym yn mynd iddo ar yr adolygiad hwn ac ar ei weithredu.

Jenny Randerson: Dymunaf ategu sylwadau fy nghyd-Aelodau drwy ddweud nad yw dim a ddywedaf yma heddiw'n adlewyrchu ar waith caled ac ymroddiad y nifer mawr o bobl sy'n gysylltiedig â'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans ar bob lefel yng Nghymru.

Dymunaf ddechrau â'r materion sy'n ymwneud ag ardaloedd gwledig ac, yn benodol, y pryderon ynghylch Powys, a'r gofyniad—yr wyf yn siŵr y byddem oll yn ei gymeradwyo—am welliant mawr yn y chwe mis nesaf. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych yn mynd

south-east Wales, which is, by and large, intensely urban, there are excessive delays for a relatively small number of calls. If you look at the figures for the number of call outs in south-east Wales, you will see that they are far higher per member of staff than they are in north Wales, for example. I know that we have to take rurality into account, but I wanted to ask whether the funding, which is an issue that I will come back to in a moment, takes account of the relatively low number of call outs in rural areas, which is bound to be more expensive. I do not think that you will get Powys within the eight-minute timeframe without spending additional money.

There is also the in-built problem and the knock-on effects of the delays at accident and emergency departments. Despite your priority target on handover times, you acknowledged a couple of weeks ago in Plenary that things had not yet improved as you had hoped, and I know that the ambulance service believes that 7 per cent of its response-time performance is accounted for by waiting times outside accident and emergency departments. If we could add 7 per cent to the response time achievements, we would have a fairly tidy ambulance service, not quite as good as that in England, but it would be a lot better than it is now. I know that you cannot wave a magic wand to deal with the delays in accident and emergency departments, but given that you have indicated that you continue to be unhappy with the situation, what are you planning to do to assist accident and emergency units to achieve that 15 minute target?

Moving on to the culture of the organisation and the issues relating to staff morale and bullying, before all of this started—during the period of one of the earlier chief executives of the ambulance service, before we had that manic phase of musical chairs for a few months, and thank goodness it settled down—when I talked to paramedics, morale was rock bottom. They have been expected to go through a very difficult modernisation programme. Change is never easy for any of us; it always hits morale, and, although there

ymlaen i ddweud bod oedi gormodol, hyd yn oed yn ne-ddwyrain Cymru, sy'n drefol iawn at ei gilydd, yn achos nifer cymharol fach o alwadau. Os edrychwch ar y ffigurau am nifer y galwadau am ambiwlansiau yn y de-ddwyrain, gwelwch eu bod yn uwch o lawer am bob aelod staff nag y maent yn y gogledd, er enghraifft. Gwn fod rhaid inni ystyried natur wledig ardaloedd, ond yr oeddwn am ofyn a yw'r cyllid, sy'n fater y byddaf yn dod yn ôl ato mewn eiliad, yn darparu ar gyfer y nifer cymharol isel o alwadau am ambiwlansiau mewn ardaloedd gwledig, sy'n sicr o fod yn ddrutach. Nid wyf yn credu y byddwch yn sicrhau'r terfyn amser wyth munud ym Mhowys heb wario arian ychwanegol.

Yn ogystal â hynny, mae problem annatod ac effeithiau canlyniadol yr oedi mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys. Er gwaethaf eich targed blaenoriaethol ar amseroedd trosglwyddo, cydnabuoch bythefnos yn ôl yn y Cyfarfod Llawn nad oedd pethau wedi gwella eto fel yr oeddech wedi gobeithio, a gwn fod y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn credu bod 7 y cant o'i berfformiad ar amseroedd ymateb yn ganlyniad i amseroedd aros y tu allan i adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys. Pe gallem ychwanegu 7 y cant at y cyflawniadau o ran amseroedd ymateb, byddai gennym wasanaeth ambiwlans eithaf derbynol, nid un llawn cystal â'r un yn Lloegr, ond byddai'n well o lawer nag y mae'n awr. Gwn na allwch chwifio hudlath i ddelio â'r oedi mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys ond, gan eich bod wedi nodi eich bod yn dal yn anfodlon ar y sefyllfa, beth yr ydych yn bwriadu ei wneud i helpu unedau damweiniau ac achosion brys i gyrraedd y targed hwnnw o 15 munud?

Gan symud ymlaen at ddiwylliant y corff a'r materion sy'n ymwneud â morâl y staff a bwlio, cyn i hyn i gyd ddechrau—yn ystod cyfnod un o brif weithredwyr blaenorol y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, cyn inni gael y cyfnod lloerig hwnnw o chwarae newid cadeiriau am rai misoedd, a diolch byth bod hynny wedi tawelu—pan siaredais â pharafeddygon, yr oedd y morâl ar ei isaf. Disgwyliwyd iddynt fynd drwy raglen foderneiddio anodd iawn. Nid yw newid byth yn hawdd i'r un ohonom; mae bob amser yn

have been noticeable improvements in many ways—the improvements may not be as good as we would like, but they are there—there has not been the instant gratification of a complete revolution in target achievements, so it is not surprising that there is low morale. I have previously identified that the key issue that has been reported to me is capacity within middle management. The ambulance service has done a great deal to strengthen the higher levels of management, but it cannot transform its middle managers overnight, and I wish to have your assurance that there is now in place a proper training programme for middle managers. I am aware that a start has been made on it, but there needs to be a fairly intensive programme to train middle managers and to improve the situation, because that is where the culture of bullying and low morale seems to stem from, according to anecdotes that I have picked up on.

My final point relates to funding. I wish to emphasise the points that were made by Jonathan Morgan in relation to that. We are all grateful, and I know that the ambulance service greatly values the impact of the £27 million capital funding, because it means that it now has good ambulances. That improves the ability to deal with infection control, which is praised in the report. The key thing is to look at the position of the ambulance service in relation to its revenue. I welcome the fact that your finance director will look at this, and I would like your assurance that that work will compare the situation with that in some of the English trusts. I know that it is difficult to find a comparable trust because nowhere in England is as rural as Wales—perhaps you have to look to Scotland to make that type of comparison.

Jonathan has outlined the savings of £17 million that the ambulance trust in Wales has had to make under its strategic change and efficiency programme this year. That is 9 per cent of an overall budget of £136 million, which is a big chunk. It is proportionately the largest strategic change and efficiency programme in Wales as a percentage of its budget. That compares with England, where

amharu ar forâl, ac, er bod gwelliannau amlwg wedi bod ar lawer ystyr—efallai nad yw'r gwelliannau cystal ag y dymunem, ond fe'u cafwyd—ni chafwyd y boddhad parod o chwyldro llwyr o ran cyrraedd targedau, felly nid yw'n syndod bod y morâl yn isel. Yr wyf wedi nodi o'r blaen mai'r mater allweddol y rhoddwyd gwybod i mi amdano yw gallu ymhlith y rheolwyr canol. Mae'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans wedi gwneud llawer iawn i gryfhau'r lefelau rheoli uwch, ond ni all weddnewid ei reolwyr canol dros nos, a dymunaf gael sicrwydd gennych fod rhaglen hyfforddi briodol ar waith yn awr ar gyfer rheolwyr canol. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod y camau cyntaf wedi'u cymryd arni, ond mae angen rhaglen eithaf dwys i hyfforddi rheolwyr canol a gwella'r sefyllfa, gan ei bod yn ymddangos mai o'r fan honno y mae'r diwylliant o fwlio a morâl isel yn deillio, yn ôl anecdotes sydd wedi dod i'm sylw.

Mae'r pwynt olaf sydd gennyf yn ymwneud ag ariannu. Dymunaf bwysleisio'r pwyntiau a wnaeth Jonathan Morgan mewn cysylltiad â hynny. Yr ydym oll yn ddiolchgar, a gwn fod y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn tra gwerthfawrogi effaith y £27 miliwn o gyllid cyfalaf, gan ei fod yn golygu bod ganddo ambiwlansiau da yn awr. Mae hynny'n rhoi mwy o allu i reoli heintiau, ac mae'r adroddiad yn canmol hynny. Y peth allweddol yw ystyried sefyllfa'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans mewn cysylltiad â'i refeniw. Croesawaf y ffaith y bydd eich cyfarwyddwr cyllid yn edrych ar hyn, a hoffwn gael sicrwydd gennych y bydd y gwaith hwnnw'n cymharu'r sefyllfa â honno yn rhai o ymddiriedolaethau Lloegr. Gwn ei bod yn anodd dod o hyd i ymddiriedolaeth gymaradwy gan nad oes unman yn Lloegr sydd mor wledig â Chymru—efallai fod rhaid edrych tua'r Alban i dynnu cymhariaeth o'r math hwnnw.

Mae Jonathan wedi disgrifio'r arbedion o £17 miliwn y mae'r ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans yng Nghymru wedi gorfod eu gwneud dan ei rhaglen newid strategol ac effeithlonrwydd eleni. Dyna 9 y cant o gyllideb gyffredinol o £136 miliwn, ac mae hwnnw'n dalp mawr. Honno yw'r rhaglen newid strategol ac effeithlonrwydd fwyaf yng Nghymru, ar gyfartaledd, fel canran o'i chyllideb. Mae

the ambulance trusts have received up to 5 per cent of additional revenue in the last year. We used to think that the problems of the ambulance services were not innately financial, but if you compare the services with those in England—and they are in a situation of comparison across the border—you will see that they are now, relatively, not so well funded. On any official table, they would come out at slightly below average.

Therefore, I would like your assurance that you will look at the cross-border situation and that, when your finance director reports, you will consider awarding them some additional revenue funding.

5.00 p.m.

Edwina Hart: The purpose of sending my director of finance in was to look at some of the issues that have been raised in the debate today. Before I look at any future financial commitments to the ambulance service, I have to be assured that all money is being spent well, appropriately and, importantly, in the best interests of patients. I will need those assurances before I embark on anything to do with revenue funding in the ambulance service.

It is always easy for the service to blame a lack of cash for the fact that it has not delivered in certain areas, so I have to be sure in my own mind that that is not the case. However, I am happy to take up the points that have been made today and ask my finance director to look at them in the round.

One of the key points that you made, Jenny, relates to capacity and middle management, which goes across the piece. I know that not just as a Minister but as a constituency Member, because these issues are raised constantly with Assembly Members by ambulance staff whenever they come to see us. The training element does need to be looked at, but we also have to look at how people go into management and develop within the service. In my previous role, when

hynny'n cymharu â Lloegr, lle y mae'r ymddiriedolaethau ambiwlans wedi cael hyd at 5 y cant o refeniw ychwanegol yn y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Arferem feddwl nad oedd problemau'r gwasanaethau ambiwlans yn rhai ariannol yn eu hanfod, ond os cymharwch y gwasanaethau â'r rheini yn Lloegr—ac maent yn cael eu cymharu'n awr ar draws y ffin—gwelwch nad ydynt yn cael eu hariannu cystal. Ar unrhyw dabl swyddogol, byddent ychydig yn is na'r cyfartaledd.

Felly, hoffwn gael sicrwydd gennych y byddwch yn edrych ar y sefyllfa drawsffiniol ac y byddwch, pan fydd eich cyfarwyddwr cyllid yn cyflwyno'i adroddiad, yn ystyried rhoi rhywfaint o arian refeniw ychwanegol iddynt.

Edwina Hart: Pwrpas anfon fy nghyfarwyddwr cyllid yno oedd edrych ar rai o'r materion sydd wedi'u codi yn y ddatl heddiw. Cyn imi edrych ar unrhyw ymrwymadau ariannol i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn y dyfodol, rhaid imi fod yn sicr bod yr arian i gyd yn cael ei wario'n dda, yn briodol ac, yn bwysig, er budd gorau'r cleifion. Bydd angen y sicrwydd hwnnw arnaf cyn imi roi cychwyn ar ddim sy'n ymwneud ag arian refeniw yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans.

Mae bob amser yn hawdd i'r gwasanaeth feio diffyg arian am nad yw wedi llwyddo mewn meysydd penodol, felly, rhaid imi fod yn siŵr yn fy meddwl fy hun nad felly y mae. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn falch o roi sylw i'r pwyntiau sydd wedi'u codi heddiw a gofyn i'm cyfarwyddwr cyllid edrych arnynt yn eu crynswth.

Un o'r pwyntiau allweddol a wnaethoch, Jenny, oedd hwnnw ynglŷn â chapasiti a rheolaeth ganol sy'n ystyriaeth drwyddi draw. Gwn hynny, nid dim ond fel Gweinidog ond fel Aelod etholaeth, oherwydd bydd staff y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn codi'r materion hyn yn gyson gydag Aelodau'r Cynulliad pa bryd bynnag y dônt i'n gweld. Mae angen edrych ar yr elfen hyfforddi, ond mae angen inni edrych hefyd ar sut y bydd pobl yn mynd yn rheolwyr ac

I had responsibility for the fire service, I could see a clear pattern for development. There were examinations for leading fire fighters to sit and things that people had to do, but the same cannot be said of the ambulance trust. I think that you make a valid point in that regard, and I will ask Stuart Fletcher to pursue it in more detail as he implements the report's recommendations. Some of the most scathing things in this report are recommendations 8 and 9 about staff relationships.

I appreciate that this has been a particularly difficult modernisation programme for the ambulance service—others have been easier—and, given the combination of these issues, I have no doubt that staff morale can sometimes hit rock bottom. However, we have to build up their morale, and if we can do it in partnership with Unison, the major trade union for the ambulance service, we will see concrete results.

You are quite right about Powys and south-east Wales. Powys is a problematic area for us. I could say that I want to see improvements there within six months, but, hand on heart, I cannot tell you what level of improvement there will be. I have to be absolutely honest about the situation there, as there are issues with staffing and its rurality. We cannot pretend that we can solve the situation overnight, but we have to put the right mechanisms in place to solve it. My eagerness to set the same targets across Wales is because I want to ensure equality in treatment. However, perhaps I need to be more realistic and look for more intelligent targets for the delivery of services in that area, if the circumstances are as such. I am happy to do further work on that, because I realise how difficult it is in Powys. It is not fair on patients in Powys, however, that the service there is so out of line with the targets that are achieved in other areas. I find that highly worrying.

My director of finance will take up your point

yn datblygu yn y gwasanaeth. Yn fy swydd flaenorol, pan oeddwn yn gyfrifol am y gwasanaeth tân, gallwn weld patrwm datblygu clir. Yr oedd arholiadau i uwch ymladdwyr tân eu sefyll a phethau yr oedd yn rhaid i bobl eu gwneud, ond nid oes modd dweud yr un peth am yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans. Credaf eich bod yn codi pwynt dilys yn y cyswllt hwnnw, a gofynnaf i Stuart Fletcher fynd ar drywydd hyn yn fwy manwl wrth iddo roi argymhellion yr adroddiad ar waith. Rhai o'r pethau mwyaf deifiol yn yr adroddiad hwn yw argymhelliad 8 ac argymhelliad 9 ynglŷn â'r berthynas rhwng staff.

Yr wyf yn sylweddoli bod y rhaglen moderneiddio hon wedi bod yn un arbennig o anodd i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans—mae eraill wedi bod yn haws—ac, ac ystyried y cyfuniad hwn o broblemau, yr wyf yn sicr yn gall ysbryd y staff suddo i'r dyfnderoedd ar brydiau. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni feithrin eu hysbryd, ac os gallwn wneud hyn mewn partneriaeth ag Unsain, y prif undeb llafur ar gyfer y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, gwelwn ganlyniadau cadarn.

Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle ynglŷn â Phowys a de-ddwyrain Cymru. Mae Powys yn ardal sy'n broblem inni. Gallwn ddweud fy mod am weld gwelliannau yno o fewn chwe mis, ond, â'm llaw ar fy nghalon, ni allaf ddweud wrthych faint o wella a fydd. Mae'n rhaid imi fod yn gwbl onest ynglŷn â'r sefyllfa yno, gan fod problemau gyda staffio a natur wledig yr ardal. Ni allwn esgus y gallwn ddatrys y sefyllfa dros nos, ond rhaid inni sicrhau bod y mecanweithiau iawn yn eu lle i'w datrys. Yr wyf yn awyddus i osod yr un targedau ledled Cymru oherwydd fy mod am sicrhau triniaeth deg i bawb. Fodd bynnag, efallai fod angen imi fod yn fwy realistig a chwilio am dargedau mwy deallus ar gyfer darparu gwasanaethau yn yr ardal honno, gyda'r amgylchiadau fel y maent. Yr wyf yn hapus i wneud rhagor o waith ar hynny, oherwydd fy mod yn sylweddoli pa mor anodd ydyw ym Mhowys. Nid yw'n deg ar gleifion ym Mhowys, fodd bynnag, bod y cymaint o wahaniaeth rhwng y gwasanaeth yno a'r targedau a gyflawnir mewn ardaloedd eraill. Mae hynny'n boen mawr imi.

Bydd fy nghyfarwyddwr cyllid yn rhoi sylw

about funding and the associated issues of the balance of resources when he looks at those particular issues.

On the relationship between different NHS trusts, and what we are doing with the ambulance trust about its accident-and-emergency capacity, we have had quite a positive response from some of the culprits regarding the new measures that they intend to put in place. I have indicated to them that this is about providing capital in response to their bids, so that we can get on with any changes that would deliver a better service. When I do my further report on the delivering emergency care services strategy and its implementation to Plenary, I hope that I can pick up on those points to give some assurance to Members that matters are moving forward.

Trish Law: I welcome your statement, Minister, and the report by Stuart Fletcher, David Galligan and Morton Warner. I particularly welcome their recommendation 3, which calls for a clear plan to improve relative performance in South Wales East.

Based on my experiences in Blaenau Gwent, I am not surprised to learn that Wales has the worst record in the UK when it comes to ambulance response times to emergencies. Over many months, I have written a number of letters to Alan Murray, chief executive of the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust, and I have copied you in to most of them, Minister, to complain about response times or, in some cases, ambulances not turning up at all.

I was so concerned that I arranged to meet Mr Murray here in Cardiff bay just over two months ago to impress on him that I was not happy with 999 response times in Blaenau Gwent. It has to be said that those ambulance failures that do hit the headlines are in the minority, but that, and official statistics, do little to appease disgruntled members of the public who have had bad ambulance experiences. I very much regret that, despite

i'ch pwynt am gyllido a'r materion cysylltiedig sy'n ymwneud â mantoli adnoddau pan fydd yn edrych ar y materion penodol hynny.

O ran y berthynas rhwng gwahanol ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG, a'r hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud gyda'r ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans ynglŷn â'i chapasiti damweiniau ac achosion brys, yr ydym wedi cael ymateb eithaf cadarnhaol gan rai o'r tramgwyddwyr ynglŷn â'r camau newydd y bwriadant eu cyflwyno. Yr wyf wedi awgrymu wrthynt fod a wnelo hyn â darparu cyfalaf i ymateb i'w ceisiadau, er mwyn inni fwrw ymlaen ag unrhyw newidiadau a fyddai'n sicrhau gwell gwasanaeth. Wrth gyflwyno fy adroddiad pellach i'r Cyfarfod llawn ynglŷn â'r strategaeth ar gyfer darparu gwasanaethau gofal brys a'i rhoi ar waith, gobeithiaf y gallaf roi sylw i'r pwyntiau hynny er mwyn rhoi rhywfaint o sicrwydd i Aelodau bod pethau yn symud yn eu blaen.

Trish Law: Yr wyf yn croesawu'ch datganiad, Weinidog, a'r adroddiad gan Stuart Fletcher, David Galligan a Morton Warner. Croesawaf yn arbennig eu hargymhelliad 3, sy'n galw am gynllun clir i wella'r perfformiad cymharol yn Nwyrain De Cymru.

Ar sail fy mhrofiadau ym Mlaenau Gwent, nid yw'n syndod gennyf glywed mai Cymru sydd waethaf yn y DU o ran amserau ymateb ambiwlansiau i achosion brys. Dros fisoedd lawer, yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu nifer o lythyrau at Alan Murray, prif weithredwr Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwlsan Cymru, ac yr wyf wedi anfon copi atoch o'r rhan fwyaf ohonynt, Weinidog, i gwyno am amserau ymateb, neu, mewn ambell achos, ambiwlansiau'n methu â chyrraedd o gwbl.

Yr oeddwn yn poeni gymaint nes imi drefnu i gyfarfod â Mr Murray yma ym mae Caerdydd ychydig dros ddau fis yn ôl i bwysu arno nad oeddwn yn hapus â'r amserau ymateb 999 ym Mlaenau Gwent. Rhaid dweud mai lleiafrif yw'r methiannau hynny gan ambiwlansiau sy'n cael sylw yn y penawdau, ond nid yw hynny, na'r ystategau swyddogol, yn gwneud fawr i dawelu meddwl aelodau anfodlon y cyhoedd sydd

statistics showing an improvement, there is little sign of improvement on the ground.

In a letter dated 15 April 2008, Mr Murray gave an explanation for the non-arrival of an ambulance at the scene of a road traffic accident in Cwmtillery, when a 15-year-old girl had to be transported to hospital by the police, who were at the scene of the accident. Mr Murray went on to give me a reassurance that,

‘actions have been taken to mitigate against a similar situation arising in the future’.

Alas, very soon afterwards, on Sunday night, 4 May, there was an unacceptably long delay in paramedics treating a man who had been attacked outside the Tredegar Arms in Tredegar, and he died of his injuries in hospital several hours later.

What greatly concerns me is that there is a proposal to take one of Blaenau Gwent’s three ambulances out of the fleet. At my meeting with Mr Murray on 10 April, I failed to extract any assurance from him that this third ambulance would be retained. When the service in Blaenau Gwent is found so wanting, it is extremely worrying that a third of the ambulance cover stationed there could be decommissioned.

It was disappointing to read just a few days ago that ambulance response times to emergencies across Wales lag significantly behind those in the rest of the UK. While the 65 per cent target in Wales has just about been achieved, I do not consider the target to be particularly challenging compared with the service in the rest of the UK. Certainly, in my opinion and in my constituency, the ambulance trust has a long way to go before it can start talking about depleting the number of ambulances stationed in Blaenau Gwent.

Edwina Hart: Unfortunately, as the Minister with responsibility for the ambulance service, I have to concur with many of the comments that the Member has made in her contribution to the discussion. At the end of the day, if

wedi cael profiadau gwael gydag ambiwlansiau. Yr wyf yn gresynu’n fawr, er bod yr ystadegau’n dangos gwelliant, mai ychydig o arwydd gwella sydd ar lawr gwlad.

Mewn llythyr dyddiedig 15 Ebrill 2008, esboniodd Mr Murray pam na chyrhaeddodd ambiwlans ddamwain traffig ar y ffordd yng Nghwm Tyleri, pan fu’n rhaid i’r heddlu gludo merch 15 oed i’r ysbyty, a hwythau wedi cyrraedd y fan lle digwyddodd y ddamwain. Aeth Mr Murray yn ei flaen i dawelu fy meddwl drwy ddweud,

bod camau wedi’u cymryd i atal sefyllfa debyg rhag codi yn y dyfodol.

Yn anffodus, yn fuan iawn wedyn, nos Sul, 4 Mai, bu oedi annerbyniol o hir cyn i barafeddygon gyrraedd i drin dyn yr ymosodwyd arno y tu allan i’r Tredegar Arms yn Nhredeggar, a bu farw o’i anafiadau yn yr ysbyty ychydig o oriau’n ddiweddarach.

Yr hyn sy’n fy mhoeni’n fawr yw bod cynllun ar y gweill i dynnu un o dri ambiwlans Blaenau Gwent o’r fflyd. Yn fy nghyfarfod â Mr Murray ar 10 Ebrill, ni lwyddais i gael unrhyw sicrwydd ganddo y cedwid y trydydd ambiwlans hwn. A’r gwasanaeth ym Mlaenau Gwent mor ddiffygiol, mae’n destun pryder aruthrol y gellid dadgomisiynu traean o’r gwasanaeth ambiwlans a gedwir yno.

Yr oedd yn siom darllen brin ychydig ddiwrnodau’n ôl bod amserau ymateb ambiwlansiau i achosion brys ledled Cymru’n llusgo’n sylweddol ar ôl y rheini yng ngweddill y DU. Er inni bron â chyflawni’r targed 65 y cant yng Nghymru, ni chredaf fod y targed yn arbennig o uchelgeisiol o’i gymharu â’r gwasanaeth yng ngweddill y DU. Yn sicr, yn fy marn i, ac yn fy etholaeth, mae gan yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans ffordd bell i fynd cyn iddi allu sôn am leihau nifer yr ambiwlansiau a gedwir ym Mlaenau Gwent.

Edwina Hart: Yn anffodus, fel y Gweinidog sy’n gyfrifol am y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, rhaid imi gytuno â llawer o’r sylwadau’r Aelod yn ei chyfraniad at y drafodaeth. Maes o law, os nad yw’r cyhoedd yn ymddiried yn

there is no public confidence in the service and if such incidents continue, we can never get the service to deliver. Quite often, I hear examples such as the road traffic accident that you raised, which was followed by another incident. From my time in my previous role as Minister with responsibility for the fire and rescue service, I know that the service was gravely concerned about the fact that it rather than an ambulance was transporting people to hospital, simply because its officers were at the scene of an accident. They were less worried when I told them that I would cover them if anything happened, but the police have been worried for a long time about having to take patients to hospital and their liability if anything happened, despite the fact that they are doing it only because it is the right thing to do.

These incidents are real and they get out into the public domain, people discuss them, and they lead to a lack of confidence in the service. I am very disappointed in our figures in comparison with the rest of the UK, although I would like some more work done on them. I concur that the service itself has regarded this as a challenging figure, although, in many ways, it is not. This is just about trying to get equity within the system, with a common figure across Wales. I am due to meet the ambulance trust to discuss these issues, and I very much hope that we will secure the necessary improvements. We cannot allow such incidents to continue, and we certainly cannot allow the trust to reassure Members only for Members to see a repeat of such incidents in the future. That leads to no confidence in the management of the service.

Nick Bourne: I thank the Minister for her statement and I also thank Stuart Fletcher for the review that preceded it. I share with other Members unqualified praise for the staff who work in our ambulances; they are uniformly excellent, committed and passionate about what they do. The review does throw up some concerns, although I think that one must say that at least the direction of travel is the right direction. There have been some improvements.

y gwasanaeth ac os bydd digwyddiadau o'r fath yn parhau, ni allwn fyth gael y gwasanaeth i gyrraedd y nod. Yn weddol aml, clywaf enghreifftiau megis y ddamwain ffordd y soniasoch amdani, a'r digwyddiad arall wedyn. O'm cyfnod yn fy swydd flaenorol fel y Gweinidog a oedd yn gyfrifol am y gwasanaeth tân ac achub, gwn fod y gwasanaeth yn bryderus iawn mai ef, yn hytrach nag ambiwlans, a oedd yn cludo pobl i'r ysbyty, dim ond am fod ei swyddogion wedi cyrraedd safle damwain. Yr oeddent yn llai pryderus pan ddywedais wrthynt y byddwn yn ateb drostynt petai unrhyw beth yn digwydd, ond mae'r heddlu wedi bod yn poeni ers tro ynglŷn â gorfod mynd â chleifion i'r ysbyty a'u hatebolrwydd petai rhywbeth yn digwydd, er mai eu hunig reswm dros wneud hyn yw mai dyna'r peth iawn i'w wneud.

Mae'r digwyddiadau hyn yn real ac mae'r cyhoedd yn cael gwybod amdanynt. Bydd pobl yn eu trafod, ac maent yn arwain at ddiffyg hyder yn y gwasanaeth. Yr wyf yn siomedig iawn yn ein ffigurau o'u cymharu â ffigurau gweddill y DU, er yr hoffwn weld mwy o waith yn cael ei wneud arnynt. Cytunaf fod y gwasanaeth ei hun wedi ystyried y ffigur hwn yn ffigur uchelgeisiol, er nad ydyw, mewn sawl ffordd. Ceisio cael tegwch yn y system yw'r nod a'r un ffigur ar draws Cymru i gyd. Yr wyf ar fin cyfarfod â'r ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans i drafod y materion hyn, ac yr wyf yn gobeithio'n fawr y llwyddwn i sicrhau'r gwelliannau angenrheidiol. Ni allwn ganiatáu i ddigwyddiadau o'r fath barhau, ac yn sicr, ni allwn ganiatáu i'r ymddiriedolaeth dawelu meddwl Aelodau a'r Aelodau wedyn yn gweld yr un peth yn digwydd eto yn y dyfodol. Mae hynny'n arwain at ddiffyg hyder yn rheolwyr y gwasanaeth.

Nick Bourne: Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei datganiad a diolchaf hefyd i Stuart Fletcher am yr adolygiad a'i rhagflaenodd. Yr wyf finnau hefyd, fel Aelodau eraill, am ganmol yn ddiamod y staff sy'n gweithio yn ein hambiwllansiau; maent i gyd yn rhagorol, yn ymroddedig i'w gwaith ac ar dân yn ei gylch. Mae'r adolygiad yn codi nifer o bryderon, er fy mod yn meddwl ei bod yn rhaid dweud bod pethau o leiaf yn symud i'r cyfeiriad iawn. Mae ambell welliant wedi bod.

Like others, and Jenny Randerson in particular, I view with some concern the issue about middle management, and the evidence that there are problems there that need to be addressed, perhaps by training. We cannot take our eye off the ball on that, and it should not have significant cost implications. That needs to be addressed.

I remain concerned about Wales's poor position relative to Scotland and England. There is evidence that the trusts in our rural areas are not performing as well as those in rural areas of Scotland or England. I think that some comparisons can be made there, certainly with parts of Yorkshire and Scotland. That brings me to Powys, in particular, which obviously causes me some concern as a Member representing the region. I am glad that the Minister recognises the seriousness of the position; she described it as 'unacceptable' and said that improvements were certainly being sought. I do not think that we can accept a position in which Powys has materially different response times to those in other parts of Wales. There is no reason why people in rural Wales should not expect the same treatment as those in urban Wales receive. People in urban Wales are probably not getting the treatment that they need either.

5.10 p.m.

I will mention two instances, in the last week, that show what is happening in Powys, which concern me. First, a lady suffering anaphylactic shock in north Powys had to wait an hour for an ambulance. Had it not been for a neighbour who had access to the antidote pen, she would have been dead—that is widely accepted. When the ambulance finally arrived, she received excellent treatment, but that is totally unacceptable. Secondly, this week, Llanidloes ambulance station has cut the hours worked by people there. Trying to match those two specific examples up is not easy, as they do not make sense.

I can understand the Minister's position on funding; of course, she must be satisfied that

Fel pobl eraill, ac fel Jenny Randerson yn benodol, yr wyf yn poeni cryn dipyn am fater rheolwyr canol, a'r dystiolaeth bod problemau yno y mae angen mynd i'r afael â hwy, efallai drwy hyfforddi. Ni allwn dynnu ein llygad oddi ar y bêl o ran hynny, ac ni ddylai arwain at oblygiadau sylweddol o ran costau. Mae angen mynd i'r afael â hynny.

Yr wyf yn dal i boeni am sefyllfa wael Cymru o'i chymharu â'r Alban a Lloegr. Ceir dystiolaeth nad yw'r ymddiriedolaethau yn ein hardaloedd gwledig yn gwneud cystal â'r rheini yn ardaloedd gwledig yr Alban neu rai Lloegr. Credaf fod modd cymharu rhai pethau yno, yn sicr â rhannau o Swydd Efrog a'r Alban. Daw hynny â mi at Bowys, yn benodol. Mae'n amlwg yn peri tipyn o bryder imi a minnau'n Aelod sy'n cynrychioli'r rhanbarth. Yr wyf yn falch bod y Gweinidog yn cydnabod difrifoldeb y sefyllfa; dywedodd ei bod yn 'annerbyniol' a'i bod yn sicr yn disgwyl gweld gwelliannau. Ni chredaf y gallwn dderbyn sefyllfa lle mae'r amserau ymateb ym Mhowys yn sylweddol wahanol i'r amserau mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru. Nid oes rheswm pam na ddylai pobl y Gymru wledig ddisgwyl yr un driniaeth ag a gaiff pobl y Gymru drefol. Go brin bod pobl y Gymru drefol yn cael y driniaeth y mae ei hangen arnynt ychwaith.

Soniaf am ddwy enghraifft, yn yr wythnos diwethaf, sy'n dangos beth sy'n digwydd ym Mhowys, sy'n fy mhoeni. Yn gyntaf, bu'n rhaid i fenyw a oedd yn dioddef o sioc anaffylactig yng ngogledd Powys ddisgwyl awr am ambiwlans. Oni bai am gymydog a lwyddodd i gael gafael ar y pin gwrthwenwyn, byddai wedi marw—mae pawb fwy neu lai'n derbyn hynny. Pan gyraeddodd yr ambiwlans maes o law, cafodd driniaeth ragorol, ond mae hynny'n gwbl annerbyniol. Yn ail, yr wythnos hon, mae gorsaf ambiwlans Llanidloes wedi torri'r oriau y mae pobl yn eu gweithio yno. Nid yw'n hawdd cysoni'r ddwy enghraifft benodol hynny, gan nad ydynt yn gwneud synnwyr.

Gallaf ddeall safbwynt y Gweinidog ynglŷn â chyllid; wrth gwrs ei bod yn rhaid iddi fod

it will be properly used, and I agree with her about sending the finance director in to look at some of the issues. Perhaps some of the issues can be addressed without extra money, but I think that extra money will be needed for others. Do we have up-to-date satellite navigation location equipment, which is used elsewhere in the United Kingdom? I do not think that we have it in Wales and, if not, why not? I agree with what has been said about logistics, but that has to be viewed in the context of having up-to-date equipment and, I suspect, the proper use of more rapid-response vehicles.

We should not settle for second best in Wales. I cannot settle for third best on behalf of people in Powys, for something that is materially different from that in the rest of Wales. Therefore, we have to look at the financial issues, as well as some of the training issues. I would welcome the Minister's response on those specific points. I share her concern and her approach to this, and I applaud her for what she is trying to do, but the people of Powys need an assurance that they will not lag so far behind what is just an acceptable level of service elsewhere in Wales.

Edwina Hart: No-one in Wales—in Powys, or elsewhere—should have a different level of service. The key to this is how you deliver it. The time for delivery in some areas might be longer than it is in others, and I take on board your point about having the right tools for the job, which is one issue that I will be considering. We have provided ambulances, but do we need to add even more sophisticated equipment to them to make them more satisfactory? Therefore, I will have a look at that aspect.

On the financial issues, you understand what I am saying. If a case is made for additional financial resources, I will have to look at it in light of the overall NHS budget, given that I would have to decide where to take money from if more money were to go in to

yn fodlon y caiff yr arian ei ddefnyddio'n iawn, a chytunaf â hi ynglŷn ag anfon y cyfarwyddwr cyllid i mewn i edrych ar rai o'r materion dan sylw. Efallai y gellid datrys rhai o'r materion heb arian ychwanegol, ond credaf y bydd angen arian ychwanegol ar gyfer rhai eraill. A oes gennym yr offer lloeren diweddaraf i lywio i leoliadau, a ddefnyddir mewn mannau eraill yn y Deyrnas Unedig? Nid wyf yn meddwl ei fod gennym yng Nghymru ac, os nad yw, pam? Cytunaf â'r hyn sydd wedi'i ddweud am logisteg, ond rhaid gweld hynny yng nghyd-destun cael yr offer diweddaraf, ac, mi dybiaf, yng nghyd-destun ddefnyddio mwy o gerbydau ymateb brys yn y ffordd iawn.

Ni ddylem fodloni ar ail orau yng Nghymru. Ni allaf fodloni ar drydydd gorau ar ran pobl Powys, ar rywbeth sydd yn sylweddol wahanol i'r hyn a geir yng ngweddill Cymru. Felly, rhaid inni edrych ar y materion ariannol, yn ogystal ag ar rai o'r materion hyfforddi. Byddwn yn croesawu ymateb y Gweinidog i'r pwyntiau penodol hynny. Yr wyf finnau, fel hithau, yn bryderus ac yn cytuno â'i hagwedd at hyn, ac fe'i cymeradwyaf am yr hyn y mae'n ceisio'i wneud, ond mae angen sicrwydd ar bobl Powys na fyddant yn llusgo mor bell ar ei hôl hi o gymharu lefel y gwasanaeth â'r hyn a geir mewn mannau eraill yng Nghymru, a hwynnw brin yn dderbyniol.

Edwin Hart: Ni ddylai lefel y gwasanaeth a gaiff neb yng Nghymru fod yn wahanol—nac ym Mhowys nac yn unman arall. Yr allwedd i hyn yw sut mae cyrraedd y nod. Mae'n bosibl bod yr amser ar gyfer gwneud hynny mewn rhai ardaloedd yn hwy nag mewn ardaloedd eraill, a derbynïaf eich pwynt am sicrhau'r offer iawn ar gyfer y gwaith. Mae hwynnw'n un peth y byddaf yn ei ystyried. Yr ydym wedi darparu ambiwlansiau, ond a oes angen inni ychwanegu offer mwy soffistigedig eto i'w gwneud yn fwy boddhaol? Felly, edrychaf ar yr agwedd honno.

O ran y materion ariannol, yr ydych yn deall yr hyn yr wyf yn ei ddweud. Os cyflwynir dadl o blaid adnoddau ariannol ychwanegol, edrychaf arni yng ngoleuni cyllideb gyffredinol y GIG, ac ystyried y byddai'n rhaid imi benderfynu o ble i dynnu'r arian er

ambulances. There are all kinds of issues in that regard, which will have to be discussed in the future. However, I can assure you that I have an open mind on these issues, and that I am determined to get this service up to standard, to match the standards across our border and in Scotland. This service is not delivering the standard of service that I would expect across Wales as a nation.

Your point on middle-management training is the key. You followed on from Jenny's point, but the big point is that the training of managers should be a core activity. Training and developing personnel is core to any business's function; it is not an add-on. We should not even have to be discussing it in this day and age; it should be part and parcel of how a service is delivered that training from the bottom to the top is looked at, as well as the skills needed to enhance it. That malaise within middle management is also causing difficulties with staff morale, because they see people further up the scale not managing as they see fit, or not seeking their views about particular issues.

I agree with Nick that the direction of travel is right, but it seems to be a particularly long journey, and I want to speed it up.

mwyn rhoi mwy o arian i'r ambiwlansiau. Mae pob math o bethau i'w hystyried yn y cyswllt hwnnw, y bydd yn rhaid eu trafod yn y dyfodol. Fodd bynnag, gallaf eich sicrhau bod gennyf feddwl agored ynglŷn â'r materion hyn, ac fy mod yn benderfynol o godi safon y gwasanaeth hwn, er mwyn iddo fod cystal â'r safonau dros y ffin ac yn yr Alban. Nid yw'r gwasanaeth hwn yn darparu gwasanaeth o'r safon y byddwn yn ei ddisgwyl ledled Cymru fel cenedl.

Eich pwynt am hyfforddi rheolwyr canol yw'r allwedd. Yr oeddech yn dilyn trywydd pwynt Jenny, ond y pwynt mawr yw y dylai hyfforddi rheolwyr fod yn weithgarwch craidd. Mae hyfforddi a datblygu gweithwyr yn greiddiol i waith unrhyw fusnes; nid ategiad mohono. Ni ddylem hyd yn oed fod yn gorfod ei drafod yn yr oes hon; dylai fod yn rhan annatod o'r ffordd y darperir gwasanaeth bod hyfforddiant yn cael ei ystyried o'r gwraidd i'r brig, yn ogystal â'r sgiliau y mae eu hangen yn gefn i hynny. Mae'r llesgedd a welir ymhlith rheolwyr canol hefyd yn peri anawsterau o ran ysbryd y staff oherwydd eu bod yn gweld pobl yn uwch ar y raddfa'n rheoli fel y gwelont yn dda, neu heb geisio'u barn am faterion penodol.

Cytunaf â Nick fod pethau'n symud i'r cyfeiriad iawn, ond mae'r daith i bob golwg yn un arbennig o hir, ac yr wyf am gyflymu pethau.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd (Rosemary Butler) i'r Gadair am 5.13 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer (Rosemary Butler) took the Chair at 5.13 p.m.*

Effeithiolrwydd Ysgolion School Effectiveness

The Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1, 2, 4 and 5 in the name of Andrew R.T. Davies, and amendment 3 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

The Minister for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills (Jane Hutt): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. supports the development of the school

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2, 4 a 5 yn enw Andrew R.T. Davies, a gwelliant 3 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

Y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau (Jane Hutt): Cynigiad fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. yn cefnogi datblygiad y fframwaith

effectiveness framework;

2. *welcomes the commencement of pilot schemes in schools from September of this year.* (NDM3964)

I made an oral statement on 26 February advising Members of the publication and launch of the school effectiveness framework. I am pleased to have the opportunity for a Plenary debate on the Government's plans to improve school effectiveness through this framework.

The school effectiveness framework marks a step change in our approach to providing equality of opportunity for children and young people in Wales, equipping them for life in a rapidly changing world, and tackling the long tail of underachievement. I am aware that there is a significant difference in attainment—within schools, between schools, between local authorities, and between primary and secondary phases. The school effectiveness framework is designed to ensure that all our schools become effective places of learning, so that every child and young person in Wales has an equal opportunity to fulfil their potential.

With our 'One Wales' commitment to tackling child poverty, we know that research has long shown that social disadvantage is the single biggest obstacle to achievement in education. We have a range of innovative and effective education policies to address the link between poverty and underachievement, but the challenge is to integrate these strategies to maximise their impact.

The framework has a significant role to play in achieving the Welsh Assembly Government's objective of eliminating child poverty by 2020. Tri-level collaboration to find shared solutions to education challenges is essential in achieving greater equity of performance and in breaking the link between disadvantage and poor learning outcomes. The context for all of our policies for children and young people is the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child, and our resulting seven core aims for children and young

effeithiolrwydd ysgolion;

2. *yn croesawu cychwyn y cynlluniau peilot mewn ysgolion ym mis Medi eleni.* (NDM3964)

Gwneuthum ddatganiad llafar ar 26 Chwefror yn dweud wrth yr Aelodau bod y fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion wedi'i lansio. Yr wyf yn falch o gael y cyfle i gynnal dadl mewn Cyfarfod Llawn ynglŷn â chynlluniau'r Llywodraeth i wella effeithiolrwydd ysgolion drwy gyfrwng y fframwaith hwn.

Mae'r fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion yn dangos newid sylweddol yn ein hymagwedd at sicrhau cyfle cyfartal i blant a phobl ifanc yng Nghymru, gan eu harfogi ar gyfer bywyd mewn byd sy'n newid yn gyflym iawn, a mynd i'r afael â'r gynffon tangyflawni hir. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod gwahaniaeth sylweddol o ran cyrhaeddiad—o fewn ysgolion, rhwng ysgolion, rhwng awdurdodau lleol, a rhwng y cyfnod cynradd a'r cyfnod uwchradd. Bwriedir i'r fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion sicrhau bod ein hysgolion i gyd yn dod yn fannau dysgu effeithiol, er mwyn i bob plentyn a pherson ifanc yng Nghymru gael cyfle cyfartal i gyflawni ei botensial.

Gyda'n hymrwymiad yn 'Cymru'n Un' i fynd i'r afael â thlodi plant, gwyddom fod ymchwil wedi dangos ers tro mai anfantais gymdeithasol yw'r un rhwystr mawr rhag cyflawniad mewn addysg. Mae gennym amrywiaeth o bolisiau addysg arloesol ac effeithiol i fynd i'r afael â'r cysylltiad rhwng tlodi a thangyflawni, ond yr her yw integreiddio'r strategaethau hyn er mwyn sicrhau'r effaith fwyaf.

Mae gan y fframwaith ran sylweddol i'w chwarae o ran cyrraedd nod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o ddileu tlodi ymhlith plant erbyn 2020. Mae cydweithio ar dair lefel i ddod o hyd i atebion cyffredin i heriau addysg yn hanfodol er mwyn sicrhau gwell tegwch o ran perfformiad a thorri'r cysylltiad rhwng anfantais a chanlyniadau dysgu gwael. Cyd-destun ein holl bolisiau plant a phobl ifanc yw Confensiwn y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar Hawliau'r Plentyn, ac mae ein saith nod craidd ar gyfer plant a phobl ifanc yn gosod

people set out what children and young people should expect by right. The school effectiveness framework embodies those aims.

The alignment of policies, programmes and activities to focus their impact on children and young people's learning and wellbeing is central to improving outcomes. The tri-level approach will mean that all levels of the education system—schools, local authorities and the Welsh Assembly Government—are working together, with common goals and aspirations. Putting our school leaders first, in terms of their skills, experience and achievements, is a key part of the framework to develop a real partnership with schools and teachers, as well as with local authorities and the Assembly Government. Across Wales, classrooms and schools are too often islands of effective practice; sharing that practice is essential to ensure that we focus on what works in improving our schools. The focus for sustainable improvement is set out in six interdependent elements: leadership, working with others, networks of professional practice, intervention and support, improvement accountability, and curriculum and teaching. The framework describes the moral purpose of education in Wales as improving learning outcomes for all students in all settings, rather than for some students in some settings.

In a statement to the Assembly in February, I outlined the preparation and background to this internationally recognised approach to school effectiveness. The final framework was launched at conferences across Wales, attended by over 900 school leaders, representatives of national bodies, professional associations and unions, school improvement professionals, officials from the Welsh Assembly Government and children and young people themselves. The work is now being taken forward to begin rolling out the framework. I have been clear that this work needs to include children and young people themselves—they are the learners, and we have sought their opinions and advice. A young-person-friendly version of the school effectiveness framework will go to all school councils in Wales, demonstrating our firm

allan yr hawliau y dylai plant a phobl ifanc eu disgwyl. Mae'r fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion yn ymgorffori'r amcanion hynny.

Mae cyflunio polisiau, rhaglenni a gweithgareddau i ganolbwyntio ar ddysg a lles plant a phobl ifanc yn ganolog i wella canlyniadau. Bydd yr ymagwedd tair lefel yn golygu bod pob lefel y system addysg—ysgolion, awdurdodau lleol a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru—yn cydweithio, a bod ganddynt nodau a dyheadau cyffredin. Mae rhoi arweinwyr ein hysgolion yn gyntaf, o ran eu sgiliau, eu profiad a'u cyflawniadau, yn rhan allweddol o'r fframwaith i ddatblygu partneriaeth wirioneddol gydag ysgolion ac athrawon, yn ogystal â chydag awdurdodau lleol a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Ledled Cymru, yn rhy aml, mae dosbarthiadau ac ysgolion yn ynysoedd o ymarfer effeithiol; mae rhannu'r ymarfer hwnnw yn hanfodol er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn canolbwyntio ar yr hyn sy'n gweithio o ran gwella ein hysgolion. Caiff yr hyn sy'n ganolbwynt gwelliannau cynaliadwy ei osod allan mewn chwe elfen ryngddibynnol: arweinyddiaeth, gweithio gydag eraill, rhwydweithiau ymarfer proffesiynol, ymyriadau a chymorth, atebolrwydd dros welliannau, a'r cwricwlwm ac addysgu. Disgrifia'r fframwaith ddiben moesol addysg yng Nghymru fel gwella canlyniadau dysgu i bob myfyriwr ym mhob lleoliad, yn hytrach nag i rai myfyrwyr mewn rhai lleoliadau.

Mewn datganiad i'r Cynulliad fis Chwefror, amlinellais y gwaith paratoadol a chefndir yr ymagwedd hon at effeithiolrwydd ysgolion, sy'n ymagwedd a gydnabyddir yn rhyngwladol. Lansiodd y fframwaith terfynol mewn cynadleddau ledled Cymru, a fynychwyd gan dros 900 o arweinwyr ysgolion, cynrychiolwyr cyrff cenedlaethol, cymdeithasau proffesiynol ac undebau, gweithwyr proffesiynol gwella ysgolion, swyddogion Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'r plant a'r bobl ifanc eu hunain. Mae'r gwaith yn mynd rhagddo yn awr i ddechrau cyflwyno'r fframwaith. Yr wyf wedi pwysleisio bod angen i'r gwaith hwn gynnwys y plant a'r bobl ifanc eu hunain—hwy yw'r dysgwyr, ac yr ydym wedi gofyn am eu barn a'u cyngor. Anfonir fersiwn sy'n addas i bobl ifanc o'r fframwaith

commitment to listening and responding to children and young people and their experience of effectiveness in teaching and learning.

To support schools in engaging with the school effectiveness framework, five seconded headteachers and a seconded WLGA representative are working with my officials to launch a pilot phase in schools in September. The pilot phase will take place within local education authority consortia, and will comprise two distinct models. In the first model, experienced and effective headteachers or school improvement professionals will be training as associates to work with schools in a developmental capacity. They will work with individual schools on their school improvement agenda and will support the development of learning communities. They will support schools in sharing effective practice and effect improvement within and across schools.

The second model involves consortia developing their own programme for implementing the framework in pilot schools, building on school improvement activity that is already in place. This, too, will be delivered by school improvement professionals and serving headteachers, who will increase the capacity to deliver this work and support improvement programmes. These models will be tested and evaluated to ensure that the future roll-out of the framework is effective and fit for purpose, and to inform the roll-out of the framework to all schools in Wales over a three to five-year period. Training for the headteachers and school improvement professionals who will lead the work with pilot schools will take place in early July and will focus on the skills and competencies that are required for effective improvement work in schools.

I am aware of the need not to overload schools and to ensure that all practitioners enjoy a reasonable work-life balance. For this reason, the school workload advisory panel was consulted on the framework. Panel members view the initiative as a powerful

effeithiolrwydd ysgolion i bob cyngor ysgol yng Nghymru, sy'n dangos ein hymrwymiad cadarn i wrando ar blant a phobl ifanc a'u profiad o effeithiolrwydd dysgu ac addysgu, ac ymateb iddynt.

Er mwyn cefnogi ysgolion i ymgysylltu â'r fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion, mae pum pennaeth ar secondiad a chynrychiolydd o CLILC ar secondiad yn gweithio gyda'm swyddogion i lansio cyfnod treialu mewn ysgolion ym mis Medi. Cynhelir y cyfnod treialu o fewn consortia awdurdod addysg lleol, a bydd yn cynnwys dau fodel gwahanol. Yn y model cyntaf, bydd penaeithiaid neu weithwyr proffesiynol gwella ysgolion, a rheini'n brofiadol ac yn effeithiol, yn cael eu hyfforddi i fod yn swyddogion cyswllt i weithio gydag ysgolion ar waith datblygu. Byddant yn gweithio gydag ysgolion unigol ar eu hagenda gwella ysgol ac yn cynorthwyo gyda gwaith datblygu cymunedau dysgu. Byddant yn cynorthwyo ysgolion i rannu ymarfer effeithiol a gwneud gwelliannau o fewn ac ar draws ysgolion.

Mae'r ail fodel yn cynnwys consortia sy'n datblygu ei raglen ei hun ar gyfer gweithredu'r fframwaith mewn ysgolion peilot, gan adeiladu ar weithgaredd gwella ysgolion sydd eisoes ar waith. Bydd hyn hefyd yn cael ei gyflawni gan weithwyr proffesiynol gwella ysgolion a phenaethiaid, a fydd yn cynyddu'r gallu i gyflawni'r gwaith hwn a chefnogi rhaglenni gwella. Caiff y modelau hyn eu profi a'u gwerthuso i sicrhau bod y ffordd y caiff y fframwaith ei chyflwyno yn y dyfodol yn effeithiol ac yn addas at y pwrpas, ac i lywio'r broses cyflwyno'r fframwaith ym mhob ysgol yng Nghymru dros gyfnod o rhwng tair a phum mlynedd. Cynhelir hyfforddiant i bennaethiaid a gweithwyr proffesiynol gwella ysgolion a fydd yn arwain y gwaith gyda'r ysgolion peilot ddechrau fis Gorffennaf a bydd yn canolbwyntio ar y sgiliau a'r cymwyseddau y mae eu hangen ar gyfer gwaith gwella effeithiol mewn ysgolion.

Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r angen i beidio â gorlwytho ysgolion ac i sicrhau bod pob ymarferydd yn cael cydbwysedd rhesymol rhwng bywyd a gwaith. Oherwydd hynny, ymgynghorwyd â'r panel cynghori ar lwyth gwaith ysgolion ynghylch y fframwaith. Barn

tool for schools' self-evaluation and development. The seconded headteachers have developed profiling materials to support schools in engaging with the framework. Written by practitioners for practitioners, these materials will be a key tool in helping schools along their improvement journeys. Professionals from both pilot models will attend the training event and use the materials.

5.20 p.m.

The school effectiveness framework is on track to exceed its objectives for 2008-09. The number of pilot schools has been increased from 48 to over 90 schools and the number of project associates who will benefit from the training have been increased from 12 to 24. A total of 93 schools have put themselves forward and have been confirmed for the pilot phase. This clearly demonstrates the commitment that exists across all levels of education to the framework and the values that it embodies.

A school effectiveness project reference group has been established, consisting of Estyn, the General Teaching Council for Wales, headteachers, governors, the Welsh Local Government Association, local education authorities' consortia, and higher education institutions as well as relevant Welsh Assembly Government policy leads. The reference group will provide an ongoing forum for the teams engaged in the framework.

I do not support the amendments put forward today, but I know that there is a wide level of cross-party support for this long-term approach in supporting our schools, their leaders and our teachers to improve learner outcomes. I look forward to hearing views across the Chamber on this most important of policies: the delivery of effective education in Wales.

Andrew R.T. Davies: I propose the following amendments in my name. Amendment 1: replace 'supports' with 'notes'.

aelodau'r panel yw bod y fenter yn offeryn pwerus ar gyfer hunanwerthuso a datblygu ysgolion. Mae'r penaethiaid sydd ar secondiad wedi datblygu deunyddiau proffilio i gynorthwyo ysgolion i ymgysylltu â'r fframwaith. Mae'r deunyddiau hyn wedi cael eu hysgrifennu gan ymarferwyr ar gyfer ymarferwyr, a byddant yn allweddol i helpu ysgolion i gyflawni eu gwelliannau. Bydd gweithwyr proffesiynol o'r ddau fodel peilot yn mynychu'r hyfforddiant ac yn defnyddio'r deunyddiau.

Mae'r fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion ar y llwybr cywir i ragori ar ei amcanion ar gyfer 2008-09. Mae nifer yr ysgolion peilot wedi cynyddu o 48 i dros 90 o ysgolion ac mae nifer swyddogion cyswllt y prosiect a fydd yn elwa ar yr hyfforddiant wedi cynyddu o 12 i 24. Mae cyfanswm o 93 o ysgolion wedi gwirfoddoli ac wedi cael eu cadarnhau ar gyfer y cynnod peilot. Dengys hyn yn glir yr ymrwymiad a geir ar bob lefel ym myd addysg i'r fframwaith ac i'r gwerthoedd a ymgorfforir ynddo.

Sefydlwyd grŵp cyfeirio prosiect effeithiolrwydd ysgolion, sy'n cynnwys Estyn, Cyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol Cymru, penaethiaid, llywodraethwyr, Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, consortia awdurdodau addysg lleol a sefydliadau addysg uwch yn ogystal ag arweinwyr polisïau perthnasol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Bydd y grŵp cyfeirio yn darparu fforwm parhaus ar gyfer y timau sy'n ymgysylltu â'r fframwaith.

Ni chefnogaf y gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd heddiw, ond gwn fod cefnogaeth eang drawsbleidiol i'r ymagwedd hirdymor hon at gefnogi ein hysgolion, eu harweinwyr a'n hathrawon i wella canlyniadau i ddysgwyr. Edrychaf ymlaen at glywed barn ar draws y Siambr ar y polisi hollbwysig hwn: sicrhau y darperir addysg effeithiol yng Nghymru.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Cynigïaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn fy enw i. Gwelliant 1: yn lle 'cefnogi' rhoi 'nodi'.

Amendment 2: replace ‘welcomes’ with:

expresses concern about the level of funding available for.

Amendment 4: add a new point at the end of the motion:

expresses concern at the increase in teachers’ workloads resulting from these proposals.

Amendment 5: add a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to create a school environment where teachers have the freedom to exercise their professional judgment.

We would all subscribe to making the school environment a more effective place of learning. Like many other Assembly Members, I attended the CBI lunch on Friday, and one of the key messages to come across during questions to the Secretary of State for Wales, and during his address, was the need for us to have a highly educated and adaptable workforce, based on a foundation of good primary, secondary and higher education. Employers have grave doubts, as we go further into the twenty-first century, as to whether our education system will be able to deliver the graduates that we need to compete with other countries in attracting inward investment to make Wales a vibrant and prosperous place to live. The Republic of Ireland was mentioned several times for the way in which it has brought its education levels up to speed and has turned out a highly educated workforce that is appealing to companies. I do not believe that this framework will deliver that, and I do not believe that there has been enough consultation with teachers’ unions. I have some specific questions that I would like the Minister to answer during this debate.

When we consider the Government’s delivery on other initiatives—the foundation phase being a classic example, along with the lack of funding in further education—we have grave doubts about its ability to deliver on this initiative, given that there is no hard evidence that the finance has been put in

Gwelliant 2: yn lle ‘croesawu’ rhoi:

mynegi pryder ynghylch lefel y cyllid sydd ar gael ar gyfer.

Gwelliant 4: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn mynegi pryder ynghylch y cynnydd ym maich gwaith athrawon, sy’n deillio o’r cynigion hyn.

Gwelliant 5: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i greu amgylchedd ysgol lle mae gan athrawon y rhyddid i ymarfer eu barn broffesiynol.

Byddem oll yn cefnogi gwneud yr ysgol yn amgylchedd dysgu mwy effeithiol. Fel llawer Aelod arall o’r Cynulliad, euthum i ginio’r CBI ddydd Gwener, ac un o’r prif negeseuon a gyflëwyd yn ystod y cwestiynau i Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, ac yn ystod ei araith, oedd yr angen inni gael gweithlu addysgedig iawn a chanddo’r gallu i addasu, yn seiliedig ar addysg gynradd, uwchradd ac addysg uwch dda. Mae gan gyflogwyr bryderon dybryd, wrth i’r unfed ganrif ar hugain fynd rhagddi, ynghylch a fydd ein system addysg yn gallu darparu’r graddedigion y mae eu hangen arnom er mwyn cystadlu â gwledydd eraill i ddenu mewnfuddsoddiad i wneud Cymru’n lle bywiog a ffyniannus i fyw. Soniwyd am Weriniaeth Iwerddon droeon a’r ffordd y mae wedi gwella safonau addysg ac wedi cynhyrchu gweithlu addysgedig iawn sy’n apelio at gwmnïau. Ni chredaf y bydd y fframwaith hwn yn cyflawni hynny, ac ni chredaf yr ymgynghorwyd yn ddigonol ag undebau athrawon. Mae gennyf gwestiynau penodol yr hoffwn i’r Gweinidog eu hateb yn ystod y ddadl hon.

Pan ystyriwn berfformiad y Llywodraeth ar fentrau eraill—mae’r cyfnod sylfaen yn enghraifft berffaith, ynghyd â diffyg ariannu addysg bellach—mae gennym amheuon dybryd ynghylch ei gallu i gyflawni’r fenter hon, a chofio nad oes tystiolaeth gadarn bod y cyllid ar gael. Sonia’r Llywodraeth am

place. The Government talks about tri-working—local education authorities, schools and Government working together—but surely that is already happening. However, teachers in Rhondda Cynon Taf tell us that they have great difficulty in trying to understand how the local authority can seek a 1 per cent cut in its budget for so-called efficiency savings when its budget is increasingly stretched. The Welsh Assembly Government should be focusing on what it should be doing best, which is talking to schools and local education authorities, and allowing schools the independence to run their own affairs as they see fit.

Last week, we saw the figures on teachers' sickness rates, and learned about the stressful situations in schools as they try to ensure that teachers work in an environment that is conducive to allowing their professional qualifications to come to the fore. The education agenda should be driven by teachers, rather than by central diktat. The figures were quite astounding: 65 per cent of teachers profess to have had at least one day off sick in the last 12 months, and the average number of days off is 13. We should be focusing on the school environment, respecting the professionalism of teachers in allowing schools to run their own affairs, and ensuring that teachers are appreciated for the professional qualifications that they can bring into the classroom.

Turning to my specific questions, have the terms of reference for the associate headteachers been drawn up? Will they be involved in observer teaching? Has there been a full feasibility study with regard to the cost implications of introducing the framework? Will additional funds be made available to implement any developments suggested by the associate headteachers for more effective work? Has the Minister considered the implications of the workload on headteachers? School leaders are already engaged in a performance management assessment process, currently delivered by external assessors, and this framework will ask them to volunteer to do many of the same things again with a different person at a different time of year. I would be grateful if

weithio ar dair lefel—awdurdodau addysg lleol, ysgolion a'r Llywodraeth yn cydweithio—ond onid yw hynny'n digwydd eisoes? Fodd bynnag, dywed athrawon yn Rhondda Cynon Taf wrthym eu bod yn cael anawsterau mawr yn ceisio deall sut y gall yr awdurdod lleol geisio cwtdgi 1 y cant oddi ar ei gyllideb ar gyfer arbedion effeithlonrwydd bondigrybwyll pan fydd pwysau cynyddol ar ei gyllideb. Dylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru fod yn canolbwyntio ar yr hyn y dylai ei wneud orau, sef siarad ag ysgolion ac awdurdodau addysg lleol a rhoi annibyniaeth i ysgolion redeg pethau eu hunain fel y gwelant yn dda.

Yr wythnos diwethaf, gwelsom gyfraddau absenoldeb salwch athrawon, a chlywsom am y sefyllfaoedd sy'n achosi straen mewn ysgolion wrth iddynt geisio sicrhau bod athrawon yn gweithio mewn amgylchedd sy'n gydnaws â galluogi eu cymwysterau proffesiynol i ddod i'r amlwg. Athrawon a ddylai fod yn llywio'r agenda addysg, yn hytrach nag unben canolog. Yr oedd y ffigurau'n syfrdanol: mae 65 y cant o athrawon yn honni iddynt gael o leiaf ddiwrnod o'r gwaith yn sâl yn ystod y 12 mis diwethaf, a'r cyfartaledd yw 13 o ddiwrnodau o salwch. Dylem fod yn canolbwyntio ar amgylchedd yr ysgol, a pharchu proffesiynoldeb athrawon drwy ganiatáu i ysgolion fod yn gyfrifol am eu materion eu hunain, a sicrhau y gwerthfawrogir athrawon oherwydd y cymwysterau proffesiynol y gallant eu cyflwyno i'r ystafell ddosbarth.

Gan droi at fy nghwestiynau penodol, a yw'r cylch gorchwyl ar gyfer y penaethiaid cyswllt wedi ei lunio? A fyddant yn ymwneud ag addysgu arsylwyr? A gynhaliwyd astudiaeth ddichonoldeb lawn o ran goblygiadau cost cyflwyno'r fframwaith? A fydd arian ychwanegol ar gael i roi unrhyw ddatblygiadau a awgrymir gan benaethiaid cyswllt ar waith o ran gweithio'n fwy effeithiol? A yw'r Gweinidog wedi ystyried goblygiadau'r llwyth gwaith ar benaethiaid? Mae arweinwyr ysgolion eisoes yn rhan o broses asesu rheoli perfformiad, a gaiff ei chyflawni gan aseswyr annibynnol ar hyn o bryd, a bydd y fframwaith hwn yn gofyn iddynt wirfoddoli i wneud llawer o'r un pethau eto gyda rhywun gwahanol ar adeg wahanol o'r flwyddyn. Byddwn yn

you could address those specific questions in your response, Minister, because they have been raised with me by various representative bodies.

We should be concentrating on allowing schools to run their own agendas independently, and be brave enough to respect teachers' professionalism in their work environment. In that way, we will ensure that we have a modern, twenty-first century education network of which we can be proud, turning out the graduates of tomorrow who will achieve the economic prosperity that we need in Wales in order to be competitive and to provide public services. That is why I propose these amendments.

Peter Black: I propose amendment 3 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure that the delivery of the school effectiveness framework supports and encourages schools to improve their attainment levels.

In proposing the amendment and speaking on the issue generally, it is important to note that, in introducing this debate, the Minister referred to the wider context of school effectiveness, and particularly to the impact of child poverty and deprivation on the performance of schools. It is worth noting and emphasising that this programme cannot be taken in isolation; it must be taken in the context of the wider agenda of tackling child poverty and deprivation and the impact that those factors can have on a school's and a child's performance. The framework itself refers to this. It states:

'Education outcomes do not just depend on schools. They are influenced by a range of factors including poverty, family circumstances, housing and health'.

It goes on to say that:

'Poverty currently affects one in four children and young people in Wales. Research has long shown that social disadvantage is the

ddiolchgar pe gallech fynd i'r afael â'r cwestiynau penodol hynny yn eich ateb, Weinidog, oherwydd fe'u codwyd gyda mi gan amrywiol gyrff cynrychioliadol.

Dylem fod yn canolbwyntio ar ganiatáu i ysgolion fod yn gyfrifol am eu hagendaû eu hunain yn annibynnol, a bod yn ddigon dewr i barchu proffesiynoldeb athrawon yn eu hamgylchedd gwaith. Yn y ffordd honno, byddwn yn sicrhau bod gennym rwydwaith addysg modern, sy'n addas ar gyfer yr unfed ganrif ar hugain, y gallwn ymfalchïo ynddo, a fydd yn cynhyrchu graddedigion y dyfodol a wnaiff sicrhau'r ffyniant economaidd y mae ei angen arnom yng Nghymru er mwyn bod yn gystadleuol ac i ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Dyna pam y cynigïaf y gwelliannau hyn.

Peter Black: Cynigïaf welliant 3 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau bod darparu'r fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion yn cefnogi ac yn annog ysgolion i wella eu lefelau cyrhaeddiad.

Wrth gynnig y gwelliant a siarad ar y mater yn gyffredinol, mae'n bwysig cofio, wrth gyflwyno'r ddadl hon, i'r Gweinidog gyfeirio at gyd-destun ehangach effeithiolrwydd ysgolion, ac yn benodol at effaith tloedi ac amddifadedd ymhlith plant ar berfformiad ysgolion. Mae'n werth nodi a phwysleisio na ellir ystyried y rhaglen hon ar ei phen ei hun; rhaid ei hystyried yng nghyd-destun yr agenda ehangach o fynd i'r afael a thloedi ac amddifadedd ymhlith plant a'r effaith y gall y ffactorau hynny ei chael ar berfformiad ysgol a pherfformiad plentyn. Cyfeiria'r fframwaith ei hun at hyn. Dywed:

'Nid yw canlyniadau addysg yn dibynnu ar ysgolion yn unig. Dylanwadir arnynt gan amryw o ffactorau yn cynnwys tloedi, amgylchiadau teuluol, tai ac iechyd'.

Aiff ymlaen i ddweud:

'Ar hyn o bryd mae tloedi'n effeithio ar un o bob pedwar plentyn a pherson ifanc yng Nghymru. Dengys ymchwil mai anfantais

single biggest obstacle to achievement in education’.

We need to be aware of that context, and we need to be aware of the fact that the issue of making schools more effective in dealing with children’s education is not a matter that rests only in the Minister’s hands, but that other Ministers must play their part and that the UK Government, with regard to its agenda to deal with child poverty, must start to meet its targets and achieve what it has set out to do.

Having said that, that is not enough to let the Minister off the hook, because there are schools in deprived areas that achieve more than their peers and who buck the trend. The reason why they buck that trend has been identified in many reports over the years and certainly in reports of the Welsh Assembly Government as well as in other academic reports. The reason is the impact of leadership within those schools. A school that has an effective leader, delivering a focused agenda and taking forward the school’s improvement and effectiveness, can overcome even those sorts of trends and put itself on the map, so to speak. Again, the framework refers to this. It states that:

‘Leadership needs to be emotionally intelligent, purposeful, enabling, influencing, motivating and focused on building the skills, knowledge and personal attributes of all those involved within the structure’.

I would hope that, in dealing with this particular framework, the Minister does not lose sight of the impact that individual headteachers can have on this agenda or of the need for training and support for those headteachers in taking forward their leadership skills as well as helping them to learn from good practice in other schools. All of us will have seen cases where a new headteacher has taken over and made a marked difference to the performance of a school and to the confidence of parents and the community in how the school is delivering on its agenda and on results for its

gymdeithasol yw’r un rhwystr mwyaf i lwyddiant mewn addysg’.

Mae angen inni fod yn ymwybodol o’r cydestun hwnnw, ac mae angen inni fod yn ymwybodol o’r ffaith nad mater i’r Gweinidog yn unig yw sicrhau bod ysgolion yn ymdrin yn fwy effeithiol ag addysg plant, ond bod yn rhaid i Weinidogion eraill chwarae eu rhan a bod yn rhaid i Lywodraeth y DU, yng nghyswllt ei hagenda i ymdrin â thlodi ymhlith plant, ddechrau cyrraedd ei thargedau a chyflawni’r hyn y bwriadodd ei gyflawni.

Wedi dweud hynny, nid yw hynny’n ddigon i achub croen y Gweinidog, oherwydd ceir ysgolion mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig sy’n cyflawni mwy na’u cymheiriaid ac sy’n mynd yn groes i’r duedd. Nodwyd y rheswm pam eu bod yn mynd yn groes i’r duedd honno mewn amryw o adroddiadau dros y blynyddoedd ac yn sicr mewn adroddiadau gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ogystal ag adroddiadau academaidd eraill. Y rheswm yw effaith yr arweinyddiaeth yn yr ysgolion hynny. Gall ysgol a chanddi arweinydd effeithiol, sy’n cyflawni agenda ag iddi ffocws ac sy’n sicrhau gwelliannau ac effeithiolrwydd yn yr ysgol, oresgyn y tueddiadau hynny hyd yn oed a thorri ei chwys ei hun, fel petai. Unwaith eto, cyfeiria’r fframwaith at hyn. Noda:

‘Rhaid i arweinyddiaeth fod yn emosiynol ddeallus, yn bwrpasol, yn galluogi, yn dylanwadu, yn ysgogi ac yn canolbwyntio ar feithrin sgiliau, gwybodaeth a nodweddion personol pawb sy’n gysylltiedig o fewn y strwythur’.

Byddwn yn gobeithio, wrth ymdrin â’r fframwaith penodol hwn, na wnaiff y Gweinidog golli golwg ar yr effaith y gall penaethiaid unigol ei chael ar yr agenda hon nac ar yr angen am hyfforddiant a chymorth i’r penaethiaid hynny o ran datblygu eu sgiliau arweinyddiaeth yn ogystal â’u helpu i ddysgu o arferion da mewn ysgolion eraill. Bydd pawb ohonom wedi gweld achosion lle mae pennaeth newydd wedi cymryd yr awenau ac wedi gwneud gwahaniaeth sylweddol i berfformiad yr ysgol ac i hyder rhieni a’r gymuned o ran y ffordd y mae’r ysgol yn cyflawni ei hagenda ac yn sicrhau

children, and how it is adding value for its pupils. We should not ignore that.

On taking forward this agenda, the Minister should not overlook the local factors that are part of this. I was a bit concerned, listening to the Minister's speech and reading through her previous statements, that this agenda looks like a top-down initiative.

5.30 p.m.

The Assembly Government is putting in place a bureaucratic structure that may or may not prove to be effective, but which seems to be overlooking the roles that schools and local education authorities can play in delivering this agenda. We have to work in partnership with those bodies, allowing them to take the lead, where appropriate, and to put forward their own ideas as part of this initiative. In my view, the Assembly Government's role should be one of support and assistance.

We should also not take this out of the context of the other issues that impact on school effectiveness and which are often referred to in Estyn reports. I am thinking, in particular, of the condition of school buildings around Wales. That is often identified by Estyn inspectors as having a direct impact on schools' ability to deliver the curriculum and the improvements that are needed. I hope that the Minister will not put to one side the need to increase investment in the education system to improve school buildings in order to assist teachers and headteachers to deliver the curriculum.

Joyce Watson: Minister, I welcome this comprehensive framework, which I believe will unlock the talent and ensure the wellbeing of our young people in Wales. I do not want to repeat what has been said, because I know that you will answer the questions in due course, but I look forward to learning where the pilot schools will be and to following their progress. I welcome the Welsh Assembly Government's commitment to continuing to lift performance, to narrowing the gap between the best-performing and worst-performing schools,

canlyniadau ar gyfer ei phlant, a'r ffordd yr ychwanega werth i'w disgyblion. Ni ddylem anwybyddu hynny.

O ran datblygu'r agenda hon, ni ddylai'r Gweinidog anwybyddu'r ffactorau lleol sy'n rhan o hyn. Yr oeddwn braidd yn bryderus, o glywed araith y Gweinidog ac o ddarllen ei datganiadau blaenorol, bod yr agenda hon yn edrych yn debyg i fenter o'r brig i lawr.

Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn sefydlu strwythur biwrocraidaidd a allai fod yn effeithiol neu efallai ddim, ond mae'n debyg ei fod yn anwybyddu'r rolau y gall ysgolion ac awdurdodau addysg lleol eu chwarae i gyflawni'r agenda hon. Rhaid inni weithio mewn partneriaeth â'r cyrff hynny, gan ganiatáu iddynt gymryd yr awenau, lle bo'n briodol, a chyflwyno eu syniadau eu hunain yn rhan o'r fenter hon. Yn fy marn i, dylai rôl Llywodraeth y Cynulliad fod yn rôl o gymorth a chefnogaeth.

Ni ddylem ychwaith ystyried hyn allan o gyd-destun y materion eraill sy'n effeithio ar effeithiolrwydd ysgolion ac y cyfeirir atynt yn aml yn adroddiadau Estyn. Yr wyf yn meddwl, yn benodol, am gyflwr adeiladau ysgol ledled Cymru. Mae arolygwyr Estyn yn nodi'n aml fod hynny'n effeithio'n uniongyrchol ar allu ysgolion i gyflawni'r cwricwlwm a'r gwelliannau y mae eu hangen. Gobeithiaf na fydd y Gweinidog yn rhoi o'r neilltu'r angen i gynyddu buddsoddiad yn y system addysg i wella adeiladau ysgol er mwyn cynorthwyo athrawon a phenaethiaid i gyflawni'r cwricwlwm.

Joyce Watson: Weinidog, croesawaf y fframwaith cynhwysfawr hwn, yr wyf yn credu y bydd yn datgloi talent ac yn sicrhau lles ein pobl ifanc yng Nghymru. Nid wyf eisiau ailadrodd yr hyn a ddywedwyd eisoes, oherwydd gwn y byddwch yn ateb y cwestiynau maes o law, ond edrychaf ymlaen at glywed ymhle bydd yr ysgolion peilot a dilyn eu cynnydd. Croesawaf ymrwymiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i barhau i wella perfformiad, i gulhau'r bwlech rhwng yr ysgolion sy'n perfformio orau a'r ysgolion sy'n perfformio waethaf, ac i wella cysondeb

and to improving consistency in standards across Wales. I believe that this framework will build on our rising standards of school effectiveness. I ask the Minister for assurance that the needs of rural schools will be fully taken into account during the pilot phase.

Eleanor Burnham: I welcome this opportunity to speak briefly in this very important debate. Moving the agenda forward is so important and I commend the underlying principles according to which the school effectiveness debate is progressing, but, like others, I have some health warnings. Poverty, as we all know, is a barrier, along with health, diet and wellbeing. In the *Western Mail* earlier in the year, Professor David Reynolds mentioned the importance of good diet, fish oils and plenty of protein, water and exercise in helping young people to concentrate in school. Behavioural and emotional problems are further barriers to learning. Some people have chaotic lifestyles and need support. There is also the issue of Welsh-medium schools. Some people believe that not enough is being done to help Welsh-medium education, while others do not believe that enough is being done to teach English to people from other countries, such as migrant workers and asylum-seeker children and so on. So, those are a raft of concerns that I would like you to address, Minister.

The wonderful diagram in your framework of the system thinking circle is brilliant; it is an esoteric work of art. It will be interesting to see whether we can put that into practice. Frankly, being on a par with Croatia and Azerbaijan in the programme for international student assessments last December should prompt us to think carefully and outside of the box. When India and China come on-stream we will possibly not be ahead of the game, so what are you doing about that?

Estyn's report in February mentioned the gap between the worst and best performers. Clearly, not doing well enough is not good enough, and it is rather sad. Many of us have had the privilege of working in many excellent schools. On the other hand, we may have worked in schools that were not so

mewn safonau ledled Cymru. Credaf y bydd y fframwaith hwn yn gwella ein safonau effeithiolrwydd ysgolion ymhellach. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog sicrhau y bydd anghenion ysgolion gwledig yn cael eu hystyried yn llawn yn ystod y cyfnod peilot.

Eleanor Burnham: Croesawaf y cyfle hwn i siarad yn gyflym yn y ddadl bwysig iawn hon. Mae symud yr agenda yn ei blaen mor bwysig ac yr wyf yn cymeradwyo'r egwyddorion sylfaenol y mae'r ddadl effeithiolrwydd ysgolion yn symud ymlaen yn unol â hwy, ond, fel eraill, mae gennyf rai rhybuddion iechyd. Mae tlodi, fel y gwyddom oll, yn rhwystr, ynghyd ag iechyd, diet a lles. Yn y *Western Mail* yn gynharach eleni, soniodd yr Athro David Reynolds am bwysigrwydd diet da, olewau pysgod a digonedd o brotein, dŵr ac ymarfer corff i helpu pobl ifanc ganolbwyntio yn yr ysgol. Mae problemau ymddygiadol ac emosiynol yn rhwystrau pellach rhag dysgu. Mae gan rai pobl ffyrdd anhrefnus o fyw ac mae angen cefnogaeth arnynt. Mae hefyd mater ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg. Cred rhai pobl nad oes digon yn cael ei wneud i helpu addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, tra bo eraill yn credu nad oes digon yn cael ei wneud i addysgu Saesneg i bobl o wledydd eraill, fel gweithwyr mudol a phlant ceiswyr lloches ac yn y blaen. Mae'r rheini felly'n bentwr o bryderon yr hoffwn ichi roi sylw iddynt, Weinidog.

Mae'r diagram bendigedig yn eich fframwaith o'r cylch meddwl system yn wych; mae'n waith celf cudd. Diddorol fydd gweld a allwn roi hwnnw ar waith. A bod yn onest, dylai'r ffaith ein bod ar yr un gwastad â Croatia ac Azerbaijan yn y rhaglen ar gyfer asesiadau myfyrwyr rhyngwladol fis Rhagfyr diwethaf ein hysgogi i feddwl yn ofalus a meddwl yn agored. Pan ddaw India a Tsieina yn rhan o'r ffrwd ariannu efallai na fyddwn ar y blaen, felly beth ydych chi'n ei wneud ynghylch hynny?

Soniodd adroddiad Estyn ym mis Chwefror am y bwch rhwng y perfformwyr gwaethaf a'r rhai gorau. Yn amlwg, nid yw'n ddigon da nid gwneud yn ddigon da, ac mae'n eithaf trist. Mae llawer ohonom wedi cael y fraint o weithio mewn llawer o ysgolion ardderchog. Ar y llaw arall, efallai ein bod wedi gweithio

good, but they were all faced by the barriers that I mentioned earlier.

I am also concerned about continuity. We have all been lobbied by the FE sector, and rightly so, as there are huge problems there. I was talking to an interesting guy from Learn Direct just last week, and there are issues around basic skills, which is a provision for people who obviously have not had sufficient help in school. Frankly, the lack of funding for the foundation phase is an absolute disgrace. We all got very excited about it happening, but it is not up to scratch. The fact that you have apparently not negotiated profitably and positively with local authorities beggars belief. My understanding is that, the last time this was debated, my colleague Kirsty Williams mentioned the Welsh Local Government Association, saying that it would not co-operate with the requirements of this document because of the way in which the Minister was planning to implement it. That is one of the parameters for this tri-level working. If one level is not working, where on earth will we turn to?

Janet Ryder: Will you give way?

Eleanor Burnham: I do not have time to take an intervention—the Deputy Presiding Officer will be on my back. I think that you are a very optimistic person, as I am, and you are obviously trying hard to do something about this, but where is the money? That is always the issue. Where is the funding, and why is it not there? Having gone out of your way to say how wonderful the foundation phase was, but not funded it, I am now concerned every time you speak.

Jeff Cuthbert: I am delighted to be able to speak in this crucial debate. The school effectiveness framework is vital in providing a strategic overview for education services in Wales. The framework sets out a clear, joined-up approach to aligning all the educational projects, programmes and schemes to produce an overarching service enabling every pupil to fulfil their potential.

mewn ysgolion nad oedd cystal, ond yr oeddent oll yn wynebu'r rhwystrau y soniais amdanynt yn gynharach.

Yr wyf hefyd yn ymboeni am barhad. Mae'r sector AB wedi lobio pob un ohonom, a hynny'n ddigon teg, gan fod problemau enfawr yno. Yr oeddwn yn siarad â dyn diddorol o LearnDirect yr wythnos diwethaf, ac mae problemau ynghylch sgiliau sylfaenol, sef darpariaeth i bobl y mae'n amlwg nad ydynt wedi cael digon o gymorth yn yr ysgol. A dweud y gwir, mae'r diffyg cyllid i'r cyfnod sylfaen yn warth llwyr. Gwnaethom oll gyffroi'n llwyr amdano'n digwydd, ond nid yw'n ddigon da. Mae'n anodd credu ei bod yn ymddangos nad ydych wedi cyddrafod yn broffidiol nac yn gadarnhaol ag awdurdodau lleol. Deallaf, y tro diwethaf y dadleuwyd ynghylch hyn, soniodd fy nghyd-Aelod Kirsty Williams am Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, gan ddweud na fyddai'n cydweithredu â gofynion y ddogfen hon oherwydd y ffordd yr oedd y Gweinidog yn bwriadu ei gweithredu. Dyna yn o'r ffiniau ar gyfer y gwaith tair lefel hwn. Os nad yw un lefel yn gweithio, i ble yn y byd y trown?

Janet Ryder: A wnewch chi ildio?

Eleanor Burnham: Nid oes amser gennyf gymryd ymyriad —bydd y Dirprwy Lywydd ar fy nghefn. Credaf eich bod yn rhywun optimistaidd iawn, fel myfi, ac yr ydych yn amlwg yn ceisio'n galed iawn gwneud rhywbeth am hyn, ond ble mae'r arian? Dyna'r mater bob tro. Ble mae'r cyllid, a pham nad yw yno? Ar ôl ichi fynd i drafferth i ddweud pa mor fendigedig oedd y cyfnod sylfaen, ond nid ei ariannu, yr wyf yn poeni yn awr bob tro y siaradwch.

Jeff Cuthbert: Yr wyf wrth fy modd o allu siarad yn y ddadl allweddol hon. Mae'r fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion yn hanfodol i ddarparu trosolwg strategol i wasanaethau addysg yng Nghymru. Mae'r fframwaith yn gosod allan ymagwedd glir, gydgysylltiedig at gydredeg yr holl brosiectau, rhaglenni a chynlluniau addysg i gynhyrchu gwasanaeth cyffredinol sy'n galluogi pob disgybl i gyflawni hyd eithaf ei allu.

When you look at the sum of all the parts of our educational programme in Wales, it is clear that it is broadly in line with the goals and targets set out in the Webb and Leitch reviews, and the Gothenburg and Lisbon agendas. The SEF, being a tri-level reform, will need the co-operation of all the constituent parts, but I am confident that we have in place—or about to be put in place—the schemes to truly meet the challenges of tomorrow, and to equip our youngsters with the skills that they need. From Flying Start to work-based learning, we have more and more initiatives to ensure that every pupil gets a fair chance to learn, and in a way that suits them. There are also more safety nets in place to help those who experience difficulties from time to time. Flying Start will give children in disadvantaged areas a better start in life. The foundation phase will, through play, encourage children aged three to seven, with an educational process never seen before.

I accept that there are issues that we need to resolve, certainly in terms of funding. Nevertheless, the programmes are in place and the will is there. Hopefully, we will identify those who might fall into the NEET category—not in education, employment or training—and remove the barriers to learning. The raising attainment and individual standards in education in Wales programme—RAISE—also seeks to break the inherent link between disadvantaged pupils and educational under-achievement. Since its inception, the scheme has helped pupils in more than 648 schools, including the majority of secondary schools in my constituency. I am pleased to see that the lessons of the RAISE programme will feature prominently in the school effectiveness framework, thus demonstrating to all that poverty has serious implications for education, both in terms of resources for schools, and the situation of the families involved.

The Welsh Assembly Government commitment to school upgrading is part of a major capital investment programme that will exceed the sums provided over the last four years. From 2004 to 2007, the Labour-led Government invested £667 million in over

Pan edrychwch ar swm holl rannau ein rhaglen addysgol yng Nghymru, mae'n amlwg ei bod yn gyffredinol unol â'r nodau a'r targedau a osodwyd yn adolygiadau Webb a Leitch, ac agendâu Gothenburg a Lisbon. Ac ystyried mai diwygiad tair lefel ydyw, bydd angen ar y Fframwaith Effeithiolrwydd Ysgolion gydweithrediad yr holl gydrannau, ond yr wyf yn ffyddiog bod y cynlluniau ar waith gennym—neu ar fin cael eu rhoi ar waith—i ateb heriau yfory'n llwyr, ac i roi'r sgiliau sydd eu hangen arnynt i'n hieuenctid. O Gychwyn Cadarn i ddysgu yn y gwaith, mae gennym fwy a mwy o fentrau i sicrhau y caiff pob disgybl gyfle teg i ddysgu, ac mewn ffordd sy'n addas iddo. Mae hefyd mwy o rwydi diogelwch yn eu lle i helpu'r rheini sy'n cael anawsterau o bryd i'w gilydd. Bydd Cychwyn Cadarn yn rhoi gwell cychwyn ar fywyd i blant mewn ardaloedd o dan anfantais. Bydd y cyfnod sylfaen, drwy chwarae, yn annog plant tair i saith oed, gyda phroses addysgol na'i gwelwyd erioed o'r blaen.

Derbyniaf fod problemau y mae angen inni eu datrys, yn sicr o ran cyllid. Serch hynny, mae'r rhaglenni ar waith ac mae'r ewyllys yno. Gobeithio y byddwn yn nodi'r rheini a allai fod yn perthyn i gategori NEET—pobl nad ydynt mewn addysg, cyflogaeth na hyfforddiant—a chwalu'r rhwystrau rhag dysgu. Mae rhaglen codi cyrhaeddiad a safonau addysgol unigolion yng Nghymru—RHAGORI—hefyd yn ceisio torri'r cyswllt cynhenid rhwng disgyblion o dan anfantais a thangyflawniad addysgol. Ers dechrau'r cynllun, mae wedi helpu disgyblion mewn mwy na 648 o ysgolion, gan gynnwys mwyafrif yr ysgolion uwchradd yn fy etholaeth i. Yr wyf yn falch o weld y bydd gwersi rhaglen RHAGORI yn rhan flaenllaw o'r fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion, gan ddangos felly i bawb fod tloidi'n golygu pethau difrifol i addysg, o ran adnoddau i ysgolion a sefyllfa'r teuluoedd dan sylw.

Mae ymrwymiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i uwchraddio ysgolion yn rhan o raglen buddsoddi cyfalaf fawr a fydd yn rhagori ar y symiau a ddarparwyd yn ystod y pedair blynedd diwethaf. O 2004 i 2007, buddsoddodd y Llywodraeth dan

1,400 school building projects. If we make schools fit for purpose, then we remove one more barrier to learning that has often gone unnoticed.

Together, the 14-19 learning pathways and the Welsh baccalaureate are working to place a greater emphasis on vocational education, giving it parity with academic routes. Rightly so, because there can be no room for snobbery in education. Together with modern apprenticeships and other forms of work-based learning, learning pathways and the Welsh baccalaureate are helping those who choose to follow the vocational route into employment, and helping to round off a holistic approach to the educational process in Wales.

5.40 p.m.

I have already touched upon the level of co-operation needed in order for the school effectiveness framework to be effective, but to only touch upon it would be do it an injustice. It will take the collective political will of local education authorities, professional advisers from the Association of Directors of Education in Wales, the Welsh Local Government Association and the Welsh Assembly Government to put Wales on a clear and determined road to be truly competitive in the future global market.

Janet Ryder: I would hope that no-one would object to a programme that will put outcomes for learners first and foremost. There have been far too many examples, even within schools, of varying outcomes for learners. Much depends upon the type of teacher that the pupils have and individual circumstances. It has been a puzzle for some time why there is such variation in outcomes within schools and authorities, and I hope that this programme will go some way towards resolving that.

The programme must be based on the sharing of information, with good practice identified and shared. I do not agree with Andrew R.T. Davies that we should treat schools as independent little islands. They need to work with each other and share, within and between authorities, what works well with children. I hope that this programme will go a

arweinyddiaeth Llafur £667 miliwn mewn dros 1,400 o brosiectau adeiladau ysgol. Os gwnawn ysgolion yn addas at ddiben, yr ydym yn chwalu un rhwystr arall rhag dysgu a anwybyddwyd yn aml.

Gyda'i gilydd, mae'r llwybrau dysgu 14-19 a bagloriaeth Cymru yn gweithio i roi mwy o bwyslais ar addysg alwedigaethol, gan ei gwneud yn gydradd â llwybrau academiaidd. Mae hynny'n hollol briodol, gan na all fod lle i snobyddiaeth mewn addysg. Ynghyd â phrentisiaethau modern a mathau eraill o ddysgu yn y gwaith, mae llwybrau dysgu a bagloriaeth Cymru yn helpu'r rheini sy'n dewis dilyn y llwybr galwedigaethol i gyflogaeth, ac yn helpu i gwblhau ymagwedd gyfannol at y broses addysgol yng Nghymru.

Soniais eisoes am lefel y cydweithrediad y mae ei angen er mwyn i'r fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion fod yn effeithiol, ond ni fyddai sôn amdano'n unig yn gwneud cyfiawnder iddo. Bydd yn cymryd ewyllys wleidyddol gyfunol awdurdodau addysg lleol, cynghorwyr proffesiynol o Gymdeithas Cyfarwyddwyr Addysg Cymru, Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i roi Cymru ar lwybr clir a phenderfynol i fod yn gwbl gystadleuol ym marchnad fyd-eang y dyfodol.

Janet Ryder: Gobeithiwn na fyddai neb yn gwrthwynebu rhaglen a fydd yn rhoi canlyniadau i ddysgu uwchlaw pob dim. Bu llawer gormod o enghreifftiau, hyd yn oed mewn ysgolion, o ganlyniadau amrywiol i ddysgwyr. Mae llawer yn dibynnu ar y math o athro a gaiff y disgyblion ac amgylchiadau unigolion. Bu'n annealladwy ers cryn dipyn pam y mae canlyniadau mewn ysgolion ac awdurdodau'n amrywio cymaint, a gobeithiaf y bydd y rhaglen hon yn gwneud rhywfaint i ddatrys hynny.

Rhaid i'r rhaglen fod yn seiliedig ar rannu gwybodaeth, gan nodi a rhannu arfer da. Nid wyf yn cytuno ag Andrew R.T. Davies y dylem drin ysgolion fel ynysoedd bach annibynnol. Mae angen iddynt weithio gyda'i gilydd a rhannu, mewn awdurdodau a rhyngddynt, yr hyn sy'n gweithio'n dda gyda phlant. Gobeithiaf y bydd y rhaglen hon yn

long way towards identifying the good working practices that exist and which need to be shared.

This is an agreement across the three layers of delivery: schools, local education authorities and Government. I will highlight a few areas where a lack of co-ordination has prevented good practice from being put forward. We heard from a previous speaker about the foundation phase. That is a good example of where local education authorities in some instances did not co-operate with the Assembly in the development of the programme. They did not supply the statistics, which had a directly detrimental effect on their schools. If this programme is a proper tripartite agreement between the three layers, then I hope that all three will work together on the agreed outcomes and objectives in future.

The other aspect is to look at where initiatives—whether from local education authorities or the Government—can have an unintended impact. Jeff Cuthbert mentioned RAISE, and there is certainly a correlation between deprivation and educational outcomes. The purpose of RAISE was to improve the educational outcomes of people living in areas identified as areas of need. However, in some areas, the distribution mechanism for the RAISE grant had the effect of making some counties have to withdraw money from schools that they had already identified as being in need of support to raise standards because those schools did not fall into the categories for the distribution of the RAISE grant. The funding had to be withdrawn, and it was difficult to continue the support in those schools and so that had an impact different to that which the Minister at the time had intended. I hope that for this programme we will look carefully at the policies that we produce, and at how we distribute the money to support those policies to ensure that it achieves the intended outcome, which is to raise educational outcomes for everyone. It is stated clearly that the hope is to raise educational outcomes for everyone.

I am looking forward to the pilot schemes, but I am concerned that we should not duplicate work—I would not wish to see this

gwneud llawer iawn i nodi'r arferion gwaith da sy'n bodoli ac y mae angen eu rhannu.

Dyma gytundeb rhwng y tair haen cyflawni: ysgolion, awdurdodau addysg lleol a Llywodraeth. Byddaf yn amlygu ambell faes lle mae diffyg cydweithredu wedi atal pobl rhag rhannu arfer da. Clywsom gan siaradwr blaenorol am y cyfnod sylfaen. Dyna enghraifft dda o fethiant awdurdodau addysg lleol mewn rhai achosion i gydweithredu â'r Cynulliad i ddatblygu'r rhaglen. Ni wnaethant gyflenwi'r ystadegau, a gafodd effaith niweidiol uniongyrchol ar eu hysgolion. Os yw'r rhaglen hon yn gytundeb tridarn go iawn rhwng y tair haen, gobeithiaf y bydd bob un o'r tri'n gweithio gyda'i gilydd ar y canlyniadau a'r amcanion y cytunwyd arnynt yn y dyfodol.

Yr agwedd arall yw edrych ar y manau y gall mentrau—boed yn fentrau awdurdodau addysg lleol neu'r Llywodraeth—gael effaith anfwriadol. Soniodd Jeff Cuthbert am RHAGORI, ac mae cydberthynas bendant rhwng amddifadedd a chanlyniadau addysgol. Diben RHAGORI oedd gwella canlyniadau addysgol pobl sy'n byw mewn ardaloedd y nodwyd eu bod yn ardaloedd mewn angen. Fodd bynnag, mewn rhai ardaloedd, effaith mecanwaith dosbarthu grant RHAGORI oedd gorfodi rhai siroedd i dynnu arian oddi ar ysgolion yr oeddent eisoes wedi nodi bod angen cymorth arnynt i godi safonau gan nad oedd yr ysgolion hynny'n perthyn i'r categorïau ar gyfer dosbarthu grant RHAGORI. Rhaid oedd tynnu'r cyllid yn ôl, ac yr oedd yn anodd parhau'r cymorth yn yr ysgolion hynny ac felly cafodd hynny effaith wahanol i'r effaith yr oedd y Gweinidog ar y pryd wedi bwriadu ei chael. Ar gyfer y rhaglen hon, gobeithiaf y byddwn yn edrych yn ofalus ar y polisïau a luniwn, a sut y dosbarthwn yr arian i gefnogi'r polisïau hynny i sicrhau ei fod yn cyflawni'r canlyniad a fwriadwyd, sef codi canlyniadau addysgol i bawb. Nodir yn glir mai'r gobaith yw codi canlyniadau addysgol i bawb.

Yr wyf yn edrych ymlaen at y cynlluniau peilot, ond yr wyf yn pryderu na ddylem ddyblygu gwaith—ni ddymunwn weld hwn

duplicate bureaucracy and work for staff in schools—and that this should not be just another paper exercise. We must get the three layers working together to produce the right outcomes in our schools and get schools within authorities and across authority borders to work together to ensure that existing best practice is shared so that all of our pupils can improve.

Jane Hutt: This goes back to the very point that Janet made about our having a duty to ensure that that collaboration between schools, local education authorities and the Welsh Assembly Government delivers the outcomes that we aspire to, of putting our schools at the forefront.

Andrew, I accept that you are new to the job and are still catching up, but you obviously have not done your homework. Go back and look at my statement in February, Andrew. In fact, I must refer back to that statement, because I was delighted that William Graham, who is not in the Chamber at the moment, said at the time that he hoped that the school effectiveness framework would be a way of breaking down barriers, which is precisely what Janet and others have said today. It is a way of breaking down barriers, and I welcomed that at the time. Therefore, I do hope, Andrew, that you can take on board these ambitions, which have a strong measure of cross-party support. The teachers, the headteachers, the unions and professional associations are excited and motivated by the school effectiveness framework.

Andrew R.T. Davies: I asked you several specific questions, Minister. From my dialogue with headteachers, I know that they are clearly in the dark about many aspects of this. Instead of trying to knock the opposition, why do you not answer the questions that have been put to you? You seem to avoid answering whenever questions are put to you.

Jane Hutt: You would certainly have enjoyed—if not benefited from, given your new learning role—the regional conferences, attended by 900 headteachers and school practitioners, all of whom enthusiastically embraced the school effectiveness framework.

yn dyblygu biwrocratiaeth a gwaith i staff mewn ysgolion—ac nad ymarfer papur arall yn unig y dylai hwn fod. Mae'n rhaid inni gael y tair haen yn cydweithio i gynhyrchu'r canlyniadau cywir yn ein hysgolion a sicrhau bod ysgolion mewn awdurdodau ac ar draws ffiniau awdurdodau yn cydweithio i sicrhau bod arfer presennol yn cael ei rannu fel bod ein holl ddisgyblion yn gallu gwella.

Jane Hutt: Mae hyn yn mynd â ni'n ôl at yr union bwynt a wnaeth Janet fod gennym ddyletswydd i sicrhau bod y cydweithredu hwnnw rhwng ysgolion, awdurdodau addysg lleol a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn rhoi inni'r canlyniadau yr ydym am eu gweld, a bod ein hysgolion yn cael eu rhoi'n flaenaf.

Andrew, yr wyf yn derbyn eich bod yn newydd i'r swydd a'ch bod yn dal i gael eich traed oddi tanoch, ond yn amlwg nid ydych wedi gwneud eich gwaith cartref. Ewch yn ôl at fy natganiad ym mis Chwefror, Andrew. Yn wir, rhaid imi gyfeirio'n ôl at y datganiad hwnnw, oherwydd yr oeddwn wrth fy modd fod William Graham, nad yw yn y Siambr ar y funud, wedi dweud ar y pryd ei fod yn gobeithio y byddai'r fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion yn ffordd o ddymchwel rhwystrau, a chroesawais hynny ar y pryd. Felly, yr wyf yn gobeithio, Andrew, y gallwch groesawu'r dyheadau hyn, y mae iddynt lawer iawn o gefnogaeth drawsbleidiol. Mae'r athrawon, y penaethiaid, yr undebau a'r cymdeithasau proffesiynol wedi'u cyffroi a'u symbylu gan y fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Gofynnais sawl cwestiwn penodol ichi, Weinidog. O'm deialog i gyda phenaethiaid, gwn eu bod yn amlwg yn y tywyllwch ynglŷn â llawer o agweddau o hyn. Yn lle ceisio taro'r wrthblaid, pam nad ydych yn ateb y cwestiynau sydd wedi cael eu gofyn ichi? Mae fel petaech yn osgoi ateb pryd bynnag y gofynnir cwestiynau ichi.

Jane Hutt: Byddech yn sicr wedi mwynhau—ac efallai wedi elwa, o ystyried eich rôl ddysgu newydd—y cynadleddau rhanbarthol, y daeth 900 o bennaethiaid ac ymarferwyr ysgolion iddynt, a phawb ohonynt yn croesawu'r fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion yn frwd.

I will answer one of the points that you made. I explained the issue of the funding in February, with the announcement of £0.35 million for 2007-08, £1.3 million for 2008-09, £3.2 million for 2009-10, and £0.6 million for 2010-11. Therefore, the funding is in place for the school effectiveness framework. As I said in my opening remarks, we did consult, not only with the unions, but also with the school workload advisory panel. It is critical that we work—as we did over 15 months—with headteachers, local authority education directors, teaching unions, and national bodies. It is a shared endeavour, Andrew, and I think that you will soon begin to realise that, as you recognise the impact that it will have through the pilot schemes.

Peter, I am glad that you acknowledged the links that I made clearly between the schools effectiveness framework and its important contribution to narrowing the gap and raising the bar. We know of the link between low attainment and disadvantage and that is what we have to overcome. That is where the school effectiveness framework will be so valuable. It offers a real chance to empower teachers to ensure that we roll out good practice and share the successful outcomes across schools.

Peter Black *rose*—

Jane Hutt: Joyce, the pilot schools will be announced next week. Those schools are now working with their local authorities to take on board these responsibilities, and associates are being matched with schools. I will be announcing that next week. I have to stress that those schools were volunteering, which is the important point. There is a real enthusiasm for this transformational change.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Will you take an intervention?

Jane Hutt: Of course, but where is it coming from?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Behind you.

Atebaf un o'r pwyntiau a wnaethoch. Eglurais y mater ynglŷn â chyllid ym mis Chwefror, drwy gyhoeddi £0.35 miliwn ar gyfer 2007-08, £1.3 miliwn ar gyfer 2008-09, £3.2 miliwn ar gyfer 2009-10, a £0.6 miliwn ar gyfer 2010-11. Felly, mae'r cyllid wedi cael ei sefydlu ar gyfer y fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion. Fel y dywedais yn fy sylwadau agoriadol, gwnaethom ymgynghori, nid dim ond â'r undebau, ond hefyd â'r panel cynghori ar lwyth gwaith ysgolion. Mae'n dyngedfennol ein bod yn gweithio—fel y gwnaethom dros 15 mis—gyda phenaethiaid, cyfarwyddwyr addysg awdurdodau lleol, undebau athrawon, a chyrrff cenedlaethol. Mae'n ymdrech ar y cyd, Andrew, a chredaf y byddwch yn dechrau sylweddoli hynny cyn bo hir, wrth ichi weld yr effaith a gaiff drwy'r cynlluniau peilot.

Peter, yr wyf yn falch ichi gydnabod y cysylltiadau a wneuthum yn glir rhwng y fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion a'i gyfraniad pwysig tuag at gau'r bwlch a chodi'r bar. Gwyddom am y cyswllt rhwng cyrhaeddiad isel ac anfantais a dyna y mae rhaid inni ei oresgyn. Dyna ble bydd y fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion mor werthfawr. Mae'n cynnig cyfle gwirioneddol i rymuso athrawon i sicrhau ein bod yn cyflwyno arferion da ac yn rhannu canlyniadau llwyddiannus ar draws ysgolion.

Peter Black *a gododd*—

Jane Hutt: Joyce, caiff yr ysgolion peilot eu cyhoeddi yr wythnos nesaf. Mae'r ysgolion hynny'n gweithio'n awr gyda'u hawdurdodau lleol i ysgwyddo'r cyfrifoldebau hyn, ac mae swyddogion cyswllt yn cael eu paru ag ysgolion. Byddaf yn cyhoeddi hynny yr wythnos nesaf. Rhaid imi bwysleisio mai gwirfoddoli oedd yr ysgolion hynny, a dyna'r pwynt pwysig. Mae brwdfrydedd gwirioneddol o blaid y gweddnewidiad hwn.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. A gymerwch chi ymyriad?

Jane Hutt: Wrth gwrs, ond o ble y mae'n dod?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Y tu ôl ichi.

Peter Black: As you know, there was a report a few years ago called 'Narrowing the Gap in the Performance of Schools', which dealt with leadership and school improvement. Can you say how that report relates to your current framework?

Jane Hutt: It fed into this. This framework is based on international evidence and research as well as on that important Estyn report, 'Narrowing the Gap'. I know that your committee looked into that report closely, and that has fed in to the way forward.

Just to answer Joyce's point about the cross-section of pilot schools that will be engaged, they will include urban, rural, Welsh-medium, English-medium, bilingual, faith, primary, secondary, and voluntary-aided schools. We are looking across the board to get a clear picture and pattern of the school effectiveness framework and of how we can take it forward.

5.50 p.m.

I also welcome the points made by Jeff about the opportunities that we now have. Everything is coming together with our educational reforms. It is extraordinary, Eleanor, that you cannot welcome that. You say that I am an optimist, and I hope that you will be optimistic when you see the roll-out of the foundation phase, which is commencing in September. I am optimistic.

Eleanor Burnham *rose*—

Jane Hutt: This comes back to the point that has been made several times today: if we can move forward together on this tri-level reform and ensure that schools and local education authorities work with us to deliver the roll-out of that transformation or reform, I know that we will make the difference.

Eleanor Burnham: Minister, will you take an intervention?

Peter Black: Fel y gwyddoch, yr oedd adroddiad ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl o'r enw 'Cau'r Bwlch ym Mherfformiad Ysgolion', a oedd yn delio ag arweinyddiaeth a gwella ysgolion. A allwch ddweud beth yw'r berthynas rhwng yr adroddiad hwnnw â'ch fframwaith cyfredol?

Jane Hutt: Mae wedi bwydo i mewn i hwn. Mae'r fframwaith hwn wedi cael ei seilio ar dystiolaeth ac ymchwil rhyngwladol yn ogystal â'r adroddiad pwysig hwnnw gan Estyn, 'Cau'r Bwlch'. Gwn i'ch pwyllgor ymchwilio'n fanwl i'r adroddiad hwnnw, ac mae hynny wedi bwydo i mewn i'r ffordd ymlaen.

I ateb pwynt Joyce ynglŷn â'r trawstoriad o ysgolion peilot a fydd yn cymryd rhan, byddant yn cynnwys ysgolion trefol, gwledig, cyfrwng Cymraeg, cyfrwng Saesneg, dwyieithog, ffydd, cynradd, uwchradd ac ysgolion gwirfoddol a gynorthwyir. Yr ydym yn edrych ar ysgolion yn gyffredinol, i gael darlun a phatrwm clir o'r fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion a sut y gallwn ei symud ymlaen.

Croesawaf hefyd y pwyntiau a wnaethpwyd gan Jeff ynglŷn â'r cyfleoedd sydd gennym yn awr. Mae popeth yn dod ynghyd o ran ein diwygiadau addysgol. Mae'n rhyfedd, Eleanor, na allwch groesawu hynny. Dywedwch eich bod yn optimist, a gobeithiaf y byddwch yn optimist pan welwch y cyfnod sylfaen yn cael ei gyflwyno, ac mae hynny'n dechrau ym mis Medi. Yr wyf fi'n optimistaidd.

Eleanor Burnham *a gododd*—

Jane Hutt: Daw hyn yn ôl at y pwynt sydd wedi cael ei wneud sawl gwaith heddiw: os gallwn symud ymlaen gyda'n gilydd ar y diwygio tair lefel hwn a sicrhau bod ysgolion ac awdurdodau addysg lleol yn gweithio gyda ni i sicrhau bod y trawsnewid neu'r diwygio hwnnw'n cael ei gyflwyno, gwn y gwnawn ni'r gwahaniaeth.

Eleanor Burnham: Weinidog, a gymerwch chi ymyriad?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Eleanor, I do not think that the Minister is taking an intervention.

Jane Hutt: I do not have enough time, sorry. However, Eleanor, you made an important point, as did Peter and several others, about Estyn's role. I was pleased that Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education and Training in Wales has agreed that the new inspection framework for 2010 and beyond would be aligned with the school effectiveness framework. In fact, I made my statement on the day that his annual report for 2006-07 was published. Estyn sees that the school effectiveness framework is addressing the key issues that are coming forward, given the opportunities that we now have to narrow the gap and improve attainment.

As Janet said, we have to recognise that this is a real opportunity to show that we can deliver reform at that stage. To ensure that, we have to recognise that the school effectiveness framework is an internationally viewed project. We have had input from colleagues, headteachers and local authorities, and their commitment to the school effectiveness framework has taken on board the impact of RAISE, for example, as was described. It is important that we learn from that, because the targeting has been effective, but it has also left out some opportunities to improve attainment and to make a difference.

I would say that we are only at the start of the process, with the launch of the pilot phase in schools in September. Our thinking and approaches to this issue will, of course, involve consideration in the light of the pilots before the full roll-out across schools in Wales. This is a time when we pilot what works; it is not bureaucratic. This is about school leaders working with their associates across Wales to deliver change. It will be evaluated and analysed clearly.

The point has also been made that this is a

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Eleanor, ni chredaf fod y Gweinidog yn cymryd ymyriad.

Jane Hutt: Nid oes gennyf ddigon o amser, mae'n ddrwg gennyf. Fodd bynnag, Eleanor, gwnaethoch bwynt pwysig, fel y gwnaeth Peter a sawl un arall, ynglŷn â rôl Estyn. Yr oeddwn yn falch fod Prif Arolygydd Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ei Mawrhydi yng Nghymru wedi cytuno y byddai'r fframwaith arolygu newydd ar gyfer 2010 a'r tu hwnt yn cael ei wneud yn gydnaws â'r fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion. Yn wir, gwneuthum fy natganiad ar y diwrnod y cyhoeddodd ei adroddiad blynyddol am 2006-07. Mae Estyn yn gweld bod y fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion yn ymdrin â'r materion allweddol sy'n dod gerbron, ac ystyried y cyfleoedd sydd gennym yn awr i gau'r bwlch a gwella cyrhaeddiad.

Fel y dywedodd Janet, rhaid inni gydnabod bod hwn yn gyfle gwirioneddol i ddangos y gallwn ddarparu diwygiadau yn y cyfnod hwnnw. I sicrhau hynny, rhaid inni gydnabod bod y fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion yn brosiect sy'n cael ei wyllo'n rhyngwladol. Yr ydym wedi cael mewnbwn gan gydweithwyr, penaethiaid ac awdurdodau lleol, ac mae eu hymrwymiad hwy i'r fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion wedi adlewyrchu effaith Rhagori, er enghraifft, fel y disgrifiwyd. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn dysgu o hynny, oherwydd mae'r targedu wedi bod yn effeithiol, ond mae hefyd wedi hepgor rhai cyfleoedd i wella cyrhaeddiad a gwneud gwahaniaeth.

Byddwn yn dweud nad ydym ond ar ddechrau'r broses, gyda lansio'r cyfnod peilot ym mis Medi. Bydd ein syniadaeth a'n ffyrdd o ymdrin â'r mater hwn, wrth gwrs, yn cynnwys ystyried y fframwaith yng ngoleuni'r cynlluniau peilot cyn iddo gael ei gyflwyno'n llawn ar draws ysgolion Cymru. Mae hwn yn gyfnod o dreialu'r hyn sy'n gweithio; nid yw'n fiwrocraidaidd. Mae a wnelo ag arweinwyr ysgolion yn gweithio gyda'u swyddogion cyswllt ar draws Cymru i wireddu newid. Bydd yn cael ei werthuso a'i ddadansoddi'n glir.

Gwnaethpwyd y pwynt hefyd fod hwn yn

model for the effectiveness frameworks that will apply across other sectors, such as further education, and I know that Jeff and others will welcome that. It is only by continuing to work together in a tri-level partnership that we will build the education system that we want and that the children and young people in Wales deserve.

I go back to Jeff's point and, indeed, Andrew's at the beginning, with the Secretary of State's event, to say that our ambition is for Wales to be a world leader in education. The school effectiveness framework is designed to ensure that that ambition and vision are achieved so that we raise the bar and narrow the gap across schools in Wales.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: It is now past 4.30 p.m.. Does any Member wish the bell to be rung? I see that that is the case. Therefore, the bell will be rung, and we will adjourn the meeting for five minutes.

fodel ar gyfer y fframweithiau effeithiolrwydd a fydd yn gymwys mewn sectorau eraill, megis addysg bellach, a gwn fod Jeff ac eraill yn croesawu hynny. Dim ond drwy barhau i weithio gyda'n gilydd mewn partneriaeth tair lefel yr adeiladwn ni'r gyfundrefn addysg yr ydym am ei chael ac y mae plant a phobl ifanc Cymru yn eu haeddu.

Af yn ôl at bwynt Jeff ac, yn wir, bwynt Andrew ar y dechrau, ynglŷn â digwyddiad yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol, i ddweud mai ein huchelgais ni yw i Gymru fod yn arweinydd byd-eang ym maes addysg. Mae'r fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion wedi cael ei ddylunio i sicrhau bod yr uchelgais a'r weledigaeth honno'n cael ei chyflawni fel y gallwn godi'r bar a chau'r bwloch ar draws ysgolion yng Nghymru.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae'n hwyrach na 4.30 p.m.. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn dymuno i'r gloch gael ei chanu? Gwelaf fod. Felly, caiff y gloch ei chanu, a gohiriwn y cyfarfod am bum munud.

*Gohiriwyd y Cyfarfod Llawn rhwng 5.54 p.m. a 5.58 p.m.
Plenary adjourned between 5.54 p.m. and 5.58 p.m.*

Cyfnod Pleidleisio Voting Time

*Gwelliant 1 i NDM3964: O blaid 13, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 31.
Amendment 1 to NDM3964: For 13, Abstain 0, Against 31.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Burns, Angela
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw

Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Watson, Joyce
 Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2 i NDM3964: O blaid 12, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 31.
 Amendment 2 to NDM3964: For 12, Abstain 0, Against 31.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burns, Angela
 Davies, Andrew R.T.
 Davies, Paul
 German, Michael
 Isherwood, Mark
 Melding, David
 Millar, Darren
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Ramsay, Nick
 Randerson, Jenny

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Alun
 Evans, Nerys
 Franks, Chris
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Griffiths, Lesley
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jenkins, Bethan
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Watson, Joyce
 Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3 i NDM3964: O blaid 13, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 31.
 Amendment 3 to NDM3964: For 13, Abstain 0, Against 31.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Burns, Angela

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane

Davies, Andrew R.T.
 Davies, Paul
 German, Michael
 Isherwood, Mark
 Melding, David
 Millar, Darren
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Ramsay, Nick
 Randerson, Jenny

Davies, Alun
 Evans, Nerys
 Franks, Chris
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Griffiths, Lesley
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jenkins, Bethan
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Watson, Joyce
 Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4 i NDM3964: O blaid 9, Ymatal 4, Yn erbyn 31.
 Amendment 4 to NDM3964: For 9, Abstain 4, Against 31.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
 Burns, Angela
 Davies, Andrew R.T.
 Davies, Paul
 Isherwood, Mark
 Melding, David
 Millar, Darren
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Ramsay, Nick

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Alun
 Evans, Nerys
 Franks, Chris
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Griffiths, Lesley
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jenkins, Bethan
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Watson, Joyce
Wood, Leanne

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
German, Michael
Randerson, Jenny

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5 i NDM3964: O blaid 13, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 31.
Amendment 5 to NDM3964: For 13, Abstain 0, Against 31.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Burns, Angela
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig NDM3964: O blaid 31, Ymatal 4, Yn erbyn 9.
Motion NDM3964: For 31, Abstain 4, Against 9.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick
Burns, Angela
Davies, Andrew R.T.

Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Alun
 Evans, Nerys
 Franks, Chris
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Griffiths, Lesley
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jenkins, Bethan
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Watson, Joyce
 Wood, Leanne

Davies, Paul
 Isherwood, Mark
 Melding, David
 Millar, Darren
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Ramsay, Nick

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
 The following Members abstained:

Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 German, Michael
 Randerson, Jenny

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings today's proceedings to a close. **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 6 p.m.
The meeting ended at 6 p.m.

Aelodau a'u Pleidiau
Members and their Parties

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
 Asghar, Mohammad (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Burns, Angela (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, Andrew R.T. (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)

Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Davies, Paul (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Evans, Nerys (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Franks, Chris (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
 Griffiths, Lesley (Llafur – Labour)
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
 Jenkins, Bethan (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Gareth (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
 Millar, Darren (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
 Ramsay, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Watson, Joyce (Llafur – Labour)
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)