



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
The National Assembly for Wales**

**Cofnod y Trafodion
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mawrth, 10 Mehefin 2008
Tuesday, 10 June 2008**

Cynnwys
Contents

- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog
Questions to the First Minister
- 33 Datganiad a Chyhoeddiad Busnes
Business Statement and Announcement
- 40 Datganiad am Ddatblygu Cynaliadwy
Statement on Sustainable Development
- 53 Datganiad am Adolygiad o Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru
Statement on the Review of Health Commission Wales
- 70 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Comisiynydd Pobl Hŷn Cymru (Diwygio) 2008
Approval of the Commissioner for Older People in Wales (Amendment) Regulations
2008
- 72 Dehongli a Mynediad i Dreftadaeth
Heritage Interpretation and Access
- 89 Cyfnod Pleidleisio
Voting Time

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been
included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) in the Chair.*

Y Llywydd: Galwaf y Cynulliad i drefn.

The Presiding Officer: I call the Assembly to order.

Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister

Residents in South Wales Central

Q1 Andrew R.T. Davies: What difference is the Welsh Assembly Government making to the lives of residents in South Wales Central? OAQ(3)1085(FM)

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): As I mentioned to you last week, despite the current concerns about rapidly escalating fuel and food prices and mortgage problems, residents of South Wales Central will have shared fully in the increase in gross domestic household income in Wales between 1999 and 2006, the latest year for which figures are available. That increase was higher in Wales than in any other part of the United Kingdom.

Andrew R.T. Davies: One town that has, sadly, not benefited from Objective 1 funding but which would benefit if it were in another location is Barry. Many of its residents, sadly, live in a very challenging economic and social climate. Pride in Barry, ably led by Paul Haley, has been seeking Welsh Assembly Government support for the retention of moneys raised by the sale of waterfront development land. As Barry is a town that has, sadly, missed out on the opportunity of many grants, especially Objective 1, due to its location, will the First Minister engage in meaningful dialogue with Paul Haley and his colleagues in Pride in Barry to seek to redress this imbalance through these moneys, which have been raised within the town, so that the ambitions of the people of Barry and the local authority can be realised and the quality of life in Barry improved?

The First Minister: I have had a dialogue with Paul Haley about this issue, as have other Ministers. The problem is that he, or

Trigolion Canol De Cymru

C1 Andrew R.T. Davies: Pa wahaniaeth y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i fywydau trigolion Canol De Cymru? OAQ(3)1085(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan): Fel y dywedais wrthy ch yr wythnos diwethaf, er gwaethaf y pryderon presennol am brisiau tanwydd a bwyd sy'n codi'n gyflym a phroblemau sy'n ymwneud â morgaeisi, bydd trigolion Canol De Cymru wedi cael eu cyfran lawn o'r cynnydd mewn incwm aelwydydd domestig crynswth yng Nghymru rhwng 1999 a 2006, sef y flwyddyn ddiwethaf lle mae ffigurau ar gael. Yr oedd y cynnydd hwnnw'n uwch yng Nghymru nag mewn unrhyw ran arall o'r Deyrnas Unedig.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Un dref sydd, yn anffodus, heb elwa o gyllid Amcan 1 ond a fyddai'n elwa petai mewn lleoliad arall yw'r Barri. Yn anffodus, mae nifer o'i thrigolion yn byw mewn hinsawdd economaidd a chymdeithasol heriol iawn. Mae Pride in Barry, dan arweiniad medrus Paul Haley, wedi bod yn ceisio cefnogaeth Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gadw arian a godwyd drwy werthu tir datblygu ar y glannau. Gan fod y Barri'n dref sydd, yn anffodus, wedi methu'r cyfle i gael nifer o grantiau, yn enwedig Amcan 1, oherwydd ei lleoliad, a wnaiff y Prif Weinidog gael sgwrs ystyrlon gyda Paul Haley a'i gydweithwyr yn Pride in Barry i geisio gwneud iawn am yr anghydbwysedd hwn drwy'r arian hwn, a godwyd o fewn y dref, fel y gellir gwireddu uchelgeisiau pobl y Barri a'r awdurdod lleol a gwella ansawdd bywyd yn y Barri?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf wedi siarad â Paul Haley am y mater hwn, ac mae Gweinidogion eraill wedi gwneud hynny

Pride in Barry, seems to believe that there is an imbalance—and you used the word yourself—between the treatment of Barry and the treatment of other areas of Wales. That is strongly contested by officials and the various Ministers who have looked at this in detail. The difference between the local authorities in, for instance, Newport and Swansea and that in Barry is that, in the case of Newport and Swansea, the local authorities invested money in urban regeneration and therefore could expect to share in some of the benefits when the regeneration went well and land values rose and so on, but the Vale of Glamorgan Council did not invest in the urban regeneration of Barry. That investment was made by Associated British Ports and the former Land Authority for Wales, later the Welsh Development Agency, and then, following the merger, the Assembly Government. Therefore, the situations are not comparable. The council did not make an investment, so it could not expect a share of the moneys coming back out.

Chris Franks: One way in which we can make a real difference to residents in South Wales Central is to introduce learning through play, the foundation phase, in our schools. Plaid welcomes this progressive plan. I have been lobbied hard by headteachers across South Wales Central on the foundation phase. What would be your response to the teachers' leader who has said that a lack of investment would spell disaster for this great scheme?

The First Minister: Everyone will have noted the outcome of yesterday's stakeholder meeting, chaired by Jane Hutt, the Minister for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills, which led to her decision to roll out the foundation phase over four years instead of three. There is a significant degree of disappointment about having to do that, but, on the other hand, it is the biggest single injection of new money into education in Wales ever. It is also the biggest ever break with the traditional way of doing things, which does let children down. It is a break with 125 years of British educational tradition, so it is important to get it right.

Jenny Randerson: The report by Professor

hefyd. Y broblem yw ei bod yn ymddangos ei fod ef, neu Pride in Barry, yn credu bod anghydbwysedd—a defnyddiasoch y gair eich hun—rhwng y ffordd y caiff y Barri ei thrin a'r ffordd y caiff ardaloedd eraill Cymru eu trin. Mae swyddogion a'r gwahanol Weinidogion sydd wedi edrych yn fanwl ar hyn yn anghytuno'n gryf â hynny. Y gwahaniaeth rhwng yr awdurdodau lleol yn, er enghraifft, Casnewydd ac Abertawe a rhai'r Barri yw bod awdurdodau lleol Casnewydd ac Abertawe wedi buddsoddi arian mewn adfywio trefol ac felly yr oeddent yn gallu disgwyl rhannu rhai o'r buddiannau pan aeth yr adfywio'n dda a phan gododd gwerthoedd tir ac ati, ond ni wnaeth Cyngor Bro Morgannwg fuddsoddi mewn adfywio trefol yn y Barri. Gwnaethpwyd y buddsoddiad hwnnw gan Associated British Ports a'r cyn-Awdurdod Tir Cymru, yna gan Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, ac yna, ar ôl yr uno, gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Felly, ni ellir cymharu'r sefyllfaoedd. Ni wnaeth y cyngor fuddsoddi, felly ni allai ddisgwyl cyfran o'r arian a ddaeth yn ôl allan.

Chris Franks: Un ffordd y gallwn wneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol i drigolion Canol De Cymru yw cyflwyno dysgu drwy chwarae, y cyfnod sylfaen, yn ein hysgolion. Mae Plaid yn croesawu'r cynllun blaengar hwn. Mae penaethiaid ledled Canol De Cymru wedi bod yn llobio'n galed wrthyf am y cyfnod sylfaen. Beth fyddai eich ymateb i'r arweinydd athrawon sydd wedi dweud y byddai diffyg buddsoddiad yn drychinebus i'r cynllun gwych hwn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Bydd pawb wedi sylwi ar ganlyniad cyfarfod rhanddeiliaid ddoe, a gadeiriwyd gan Jane Hutt, y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau, a arweiniodd at ei phenderfyniad i gyflwyno'r cyfnod sylfaen dros bedair blynedd yn hytrach na thair. Ceir cryn dipyn o siom am orfod gwneud hynny, ond, ar y llaw arall, dyma'r un buddsoddiad mwyaf erioed o arian newydd i addysg yng Nghymru. Hwn hefyd yw'r gwyriad mwyaf erioed o'r ffordd draddodiadol o wneud pethau, sy'n gadael plant i lawr. Mae'n torri 125 mlynedd o draddodiad addysgol Prydeinig, felly mae'n bwysig ein bod yn ei wneud yn iawn.

Jenny Randerson: Cyhoeddwyd adroddiad

Aylward on Health Commission Wales was published at 1 p.m. today. Over the past five years, I have been contacted by a significant number of constituents whose lives have been adversely affected by the decisions of Health Commission Wales. The report paints a picture of confusion and underfunding. Many of its conclusions could have been predicted some years ago. How long has your Government known that Health Commission Wales was not working, and why have you not done something about it before?

The First Minister: Every Assembly Member will have had individual complaints from people attending their surgeries, saying that they have been unable to access a particular type of treatment and that they believe that Health Commission Wales could take a different view. We have all put in our pleas on behalf of those patients, sometimes successfully and sometimes unsuccessfully. I am sure that we all share that experience. Edwina Hart commissioned the Mansel Aylward report last October not because of the complaints that individual Assembly Members had raised but simply because she wanted to get straight the best way of doing specialist and tertiary commissioning, and that includes the invidious job of occasionally having to say 'no' to treatments, because they are thought to be poor value for money, unaffordable or whatever it might be for the individual patient commissioning. I have not yet had the opportunity to read the Mansel Aylward report. Edwina Hart has read it and says that it makes sobering reading. I will have a sobering read of it as soon as I can—tonight, preferably.

On the future of Health Commission Wales, we all recognise that someone has to do this difficult job. Only about 5 per cent of Health Commission Wales's work relates to those difficult, individual patient decisions, and many people have had a satisfactory service from Health Commission Wales without even being aware that it was involved in their treatment. I intend to have a sobering read of that report, and I am told that it is not pleasant reading, but that is the best way to approach it. Either Edwina or I will respond to any individual issues that you have.

yr Athro Aylward ar Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru am 1 p.m. heddiw. Dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf, mae nifer sylweddol o etholwyr wedi cysylltu â mi ar ôl i benderfyniadau Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru effeithio'n anffafriol ar eu bywydau. Mae'r adroddiad yn rhoi darlun o ddryswch a thanwario. Gellid bod wedi rhagweld nifer o'i gasgliadau rai blynyddoedd yn ôl. Ers pa mor hir y mae eich Llywodraeth wedi gwybod nad oedd Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru yn gweithio, a pham na wnaethoch rywbeth am y peth yn gynharach?

Y Prif Weinidog: Bydd holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad wedi cael cwynion unigol gan bobl sy'n mynychu eu cymorthfeydd, yn dweud nad ydynt wedi gallu cael math penodol o driniaeth a'u bod yn credu y gallai Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru newid ei safbwynt. Yr ydym oll wedi pledio ar ran y cleifion hynny, weithiau'n llwyddiannus ac weithiau'n aflwyddiannus. Yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod oll wedi rhannu'r profiad hwnnw. Comisiynwyd adroddiad Mansel Aylward gan Edwina Hart fis Hydref diwethaf, nid oherwydd y cwynion a godwyd gan Aelodau unigol y Cynulliad ond am ei bod am ganfod y ffordd orau o gomisiynu gwasanaethau arbenigol a thrydyddol, ac mae hynny'n cynnwys y gwaith annymunol o orfod dweud 'na' wrth driniaethau ar brydiau, gan yr ystyrir nad ydynt yn rhoi gwerth da am arian, nad ydynt yn fforddiadwy neu ba bynnag reswm ar gyfer comisiynu'r claf unigol. Nid wyf eto wedi cael cyfle i ddarllen adroddiad Mansel Aylward. Mae Edwina Hart wedi'i ddarllen, ac mae'n dweud ei fod yn ddigon digalon. Byddaf yn ei ddarllen cyn gynted â phosibl—heno, os gallaf.

O ran dyfodol Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru, yr ydym oll yn cydnabod ei bod yn rhaid i rywun wneud y gwaith anodd hwn. Dim ond tua 5 y cant o waith Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru sy'n ymwneud â'r penderfyniadau anodd hynny am gleifion unigol, ac mae nifer o bobl wedi cael gwasanaeth boddhaol gan Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru heb hyd yn oed fod yn ymwybodol ei fod wedi ymwneud â'u triniaeth. Yr wyf yn bwriadu darllen yr adroddiad hwnnw, a dywedir wrthyf nad yw'n bleserus i'w ddarllen, ond dyna'r ffordd orau o fynd o'i chwmpas hi. Bydd Edwina neu finnau'n ymateb i unrhyw gwestiynau

unigol sydd gennych.

Wales as a Tourism Destination

Q2 Angela Burns: Will the First Minister make a statement on promoting Wales as a tourism destination? OAQ(3)1094(FM)

The First Minister: Visit Wales has a wide range of marketing campaigns and activities within the UK and overseas. During 2006, the value added for the Welsh economy by Visit Wales's marketing activities was estimated at about £200 million. It is believed that the 2007 campaigns will have delivered similar levels of value added for the tourism industry.

Angela Burns: Last Friday, I had the pleasure of co-hosting an event on Amroth beach, at which the Royal Lifesaving Society UK and I taught a number of children from Carmarthenshire and Pembrokeshire how to save lives and give the kiss of life. We specifically picked Amroth beach because, despite its unblemished record for 15 years, it has now lost its blue-flag status. What can you or the Welsh Assembly Government do to help a beach such as that in Amroth and people such as those living in the community there who fear that their livelihoods will take a hell of a dive because of the beach having lost that blue-flag status?

The First Minister: I saw a television item on Amroth beach. I did not see you on the item, much to my regret, Angela, but that is one of those things. I remember there being reference to the fact that the blue flag had been lost and the concerns expressed by tourism operators in Amroth and surrounding resort areas, such as Saundersfoot. I think that the report said that the problem was on the way to being solved if it had not already been solved. Perhaps I am wrong about that—and I see that you are shaking your head vigorously—because I was not paying full attention to the television; I rarely do. I will make inquiries about how quickly we can get Amroth's blue flag back, or to see why Amroth lost it so suddenly, having had it for more than a decade.

Irene James: This year, Cwmcarn forest drive was the setting for the British student

Cymru fel Cyrchfan i Dwristiaid

C2 Angela Burns: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am hyrwyddo Cymru fel cyrchfan dwristiaeth? OAQ(3)1094(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae gan Groeso Cymru amrywiaeth eang o ymgyrchoedd a gweithgareddau marchnata o fewn y DU a thramor. Yn ystod 2006, amcangyfrifwyd bod y gwerth ychwanegol a roddwyd i economi Cymru gan weithgareddau Croeso Cymru tua £200 miliwn. Credir y bydd ymgyrchoedd 2007 wedi rhoi lefelau tebyg o werth ychwanegol i'r diwydiant twristiaeth.

Angela Burns: Ddydd Gwener diwethaf, cefais y pleser o gyd-gynnal digwyddiad ar draeth Amroth, lle dysgodd Cymdeithas Frenhinol Achub Bywydau y DU a minnau nifer o blant o sir Gaerfyrddin a sir Benfro sut i achub bywydau a rhoi cusan adfer. Dewiswyd traeth Amroth yn benodol gennym oherwydd, er gwaethaf ei hanes di-fai am 15 mlynedd, ei fod yn awr wedi colli ei statws baner las. Beth a allwch chi neu Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ei wneud i helpu traeth megis traeth Amroth a phobl megis y rheini sy'n byw yn y gymuned yno sy'n ofni y bydd eu bywoliaethau'n dioddef yn enbyd am fod y traeth wedi colli'r statws baner las hwnnw?

Y Prif Weinidog: Gwelais eitem ar y teledu am draeth Amroth. Ni welais mohonoch chi ar yr eitem, mae'n flin gennyf, Angela, ond felly y mae hi. Cofiaf glywed cyfeirio at y ffaith bod y faner las wedi'i cholli a'r pryderon a fynegwyd gan weithredwyr twristiaeth yn Amroth a'r ardaloedd gwyliau cyfagos, megis Saundersfoot. Credaf y dywedodd yr adroddiad fod y broblem wrthi'n cael ei datrys, os nad oedd wedi'i datrys eisoes. Efallai fy mod yn anghywir am hynny—a gwelaf eich bod yn ysgwyd eich pen yn egniol—oherwydd nid oeddwn yn rhoi fy sylw llawn i'r teledu; anaml y byddaf yn gwneud hynny. Ymholaf pa mor gyflym y gallwn gael baner las Amroth yn ôl, neu gael gwybod pam y collwyd hi mor gyflym, ar ôl bod yno am dros ddegawd.

Irene James: Eleni, cynhaliwyd pencampwriaethau beicio mynydd myfyrwyr

mountain bike championships and, despite poor weather conditions, participants raced down the famous Cwmcarn trail, which is regarded as one of the UK's best mountain bike trails. This week marks the beginning of Bike Week 2008, which offers a host of cycling activities across Wales. Will you join me in congratulating the race participants, and agree with me that these events help to promote Wales as an excellent destination for cycling tourism?

The First Minister: I think that we would all agree that the nature of tourism in Wales has changed substantially over the past 30 years, since being a place that offered the traditional fortnight's bucket-and-spade holiday by the sea. That kind of holiday has migrated to places with a better guarantee of sunshine, given that there is now cheap air travel—although that may soon be a thing of the past, we do not know. However, that has been the history of the past 30 years. People have gone to Spain, Greece, Turkey, north Africa, or wherever for their main summer holidays and we have to replace that with specialist tourism events that exploit Wales's virtues as a location for extreme sports.

2.10 p.m.

It is said to be up there with New Zealand and California—probably even better—for extreme sports, but facilities in New Zealand and California are located over a distance of about 800 miles from north to south, while in Wales you are talking about some 150 miles. Undoubtedly, that is part of the future for tourism in Wales.

Gareth Jones: Mae adroddiad terfynol diweddar yr adolygiad o dwristiaeth ddiwylliannol yng Nghymru, sy'n cynnwys chwaraeon, wedi cadarnhau pwysigrwydd twristiaeth i economi Cymru—ac mae hynny'n wir yn Aberconwy, lle mai twristiaeth yn un o ddiwydiannau pwysicaf yr economi leol. Nifer fach o'r hyn a ystyrir yn eiconau cymdeithasol sydd gan Gymru, ond mae'r adroddiad hefyd yn nodi ei bod yn hanfodol gwneud y gorau o effaith y rhai

Prydain yng nghoedwig Cwmcarn ac, er gwaethaf tywydd gwael, bu'r cyfranogwyr yn rasio i lawr trywydd enwog Cwmcarn, a ystyrir yn un o drywyddion beicio mynydd gorau'r DU. Yr wythnos yma, bydd Wythnos Beicio 2008 yn dechrau, gan gynnig lluo o weithgareddau seiclo ledled Cymru. A ymunwch â mi i longyfarch y rheini a gymerodd ran yn y ras, ac a gytunwch â mi bod y digwyddiadau hyn yn helpu i hyrwyddo Cymru fel cyrchfan ragorol ar gyfer twristiaeth seiclo?

Y Prif Weinidog: Credaf y byddem oll yn cytuno bod natur twristiaeth yng Nghymru wedi newid yn sylweddol dros y 30 mlynedd diwethaf, ers bod yn lle a oedd yn cynnig y gwyliau traddodiadol o bythefnos ar lan y môr gyda bwced a rhaw. Mae'r math hwnnw o wyliau wedi mudo i leoedd â gwell gwarant o heulwen, ac ystyried y gellir teithio'n rhad mewn awyrennau—er y gallai hynny ddod i ben cyn bo hir, nid ydym yn gwybod. Fodd bynnag, dyna fu hanes y 30 mlynedd diwethaf. Mae pobl wedi mynd i Sbaen, i wlad Groeg, i Dwrci, i ogledd Affrica, neu i ble bynnag, am eu prif wyliau haf, a rhaid inni gymryd lle hynny gyda digwyddiadau twristiaeth arbenigol sy'n manteisio ar rinweddau Cymru fel lleoliad ar gyfer campau eithafol.

Dywedir ei bod cystal â Seland Newydd a Chalifornia—gwell, hyd yn oed, mae'n debyg—ar gyfer campau eithafol, ond mae'r cyfleusterau yn Seland Newydd a Chalifornia wedi'u lleoli dros bellter o tua 800 milltir o'r de i'r gogledd, tra bo'r pellter yng Nghymru tua 150 milltir. Yn ddiamau, mae hynny'n rhan o ddyfodol twristiaeth yng Nghymru.

Gareth Jones: The recent final report of the inquiry into cultural tourism in Wales, which includes sports, has confirmed the importance of tourism to Wales's economy. This is true in Aberconwy, where tourism is one of the most important industries to the local economy. Wales does not have many of those who can be considered social icons, but the report also states that it is crucial to make the most of the impact of the ones that do exist, including our famous personalities. To

sydd gennym, gan gynnwys ein personoliaethau enwog. I'r perwyl hwn, a fyddai'r Prif Weinidog yn ymuno â mi i groesawu taith golff hŷn Ewrop wrth iddi gyrraedd Clwb Golff Conwy am yr ail flwyddyn yn olynol? Yr wyf yn gyfarwydd iawn â'r clwb hwnnw, sydd yn fy etholaeth yn Aberconwy. A fyddai'r Prif Weinidog yn ymuno â mi i ddymuno pob llwyddiant i un o eiconau chwaraeon Cymru, sef capten tîm Cwpan Ryder Ewrop, cyn-enillydd y Meistri Americanaidd, un sydd wedi ennill 29 o weithiau ar y prif daith Ewropeaidd, cyn-rif 1 y byd ac enillydd diweddar yng ngwlad Pwyl? Mae'n ddyn bach o gorff ond yn gawr gwirioneddol ym myd golff—sôn yr wyf am yr anfarwol Ian Woosnam.

Y Prif Weinidog: Cytunaf â phob gair ynglŷn â maint a chysondeb ein buddsoddiad yn y gornestau golff i bobl hŷn, dros eu 60 neu 50 oed—ac nid wyf yn cofio'r oedran ieuengaf i gymryd rhan. Yr oeddwn yn falch o weld bod Ian Woosnam wedi trosglwyddo ei alluoedd di-ben-draw i'r gornestau i bobl hŷn, ac yntau wedi gwneud mor dda yn gynnar iawn yn ei yrfa. Yr wyf hefyd am longyfarch Clwb Golff Conwy ar groesawu'r ornest hon. Mae ein buddsoddiad yn rhan o'r fargen yr ydym wedi'i tharo â'r gylchdaith Ewropeaidd i noddi gornest flynyddol i fenywod ym Machynys a gornest i golffwyr hŷn, sy'n symud o gwrs i gwrs yn unol â'r ceisiadau a ddaw i law.

The Welsh Economy

Q3 Nick Ramsay: Will the First Minister make a statement on the current performance of the Welsh economy? OAQ(3)1084(FM)

The First Minister: The official data indicate that the economy in Wales is showing commendable resilience in the face of recent world-wide economic turbulence. The latest employment figures, of 1,350,000 people in January to March 2008, are up 8,000 on the previous year, and are close to the record level seen in April to June 2007.

Nick Ramsay: I welcome your commendable resilience in supporting the current situation contrary to the evidence.

that end, will the First Minister join me in welcoming the European seniors golf tour as it arrives in Conwy Golf Club for the second successive year? I am very familiar with that club, which is in my constituency in Aberconwy. Will the First Minister join me in wishing every success to one of Wales's sporting icons, who is the captain of the European Ryder Cup team, a former winner of the US Masters, a winner of 29 titles on the main European tour, a former world No. 1 and a recent winner in Poland? He is a man small in stature but a true giant in the golfing world—I am referring, of course, to the legendary Ian Woosnam.

The First Minister: I agree with every word regarding the consistency and the amount of our investment in golfing tournaments for senior citizens, over 60 or 50 years old—I do not recall the minimum age for participating. I was pleased to see that Ian Woosnam had transferred his boundless talents to the senior tour, having done so well early on in his career. I will also congratulate Conwy Golf Club on hosting this tournament. Our investment is part of the deal that we have struck with the European tour to sponsor an annual tournament for women in Machynys as well as a tournament for senior golfers, which moves from one course to another in line with the applications received.

Economi Cymru

C3 Nick Ramsay: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am berfformiad economi Cymru ar hyn o bryd? OAQ(3)1084(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r data swyddogol yn dynodi bod economi Cymru'n dangos gwytnwch clodwiw yn wyneb yr ansefydlogrwydd economaidd byd-eang diweddar. Mae'r ffigurau cyflogaeth diweddaraf, sef 1,350,000 o bobl o fis Ionawr i fis Mawrth 2008, 8,000 yn uwch na'r flwyddyn flaenorol, ac yn agos at y lefel uchaf erioed a welwyd o fis Ebrill i fis Mehefin 2007.

Nick Ramsay: Croesawaf eich gwytnwch clodwiw wrth gefnogi'r sefyllfa bresennol yn groes i'r dystiolaeth. Mae eich Llywodraeth

Your Government has said that we face challenging times, and I appreciate that the UK and global economies are entering choppy waters than has been the case in the past, but I have a specific question about the Welsh economy in the context of the UK economy. Regardless of your answer to my original question, whatever measure you use—the housing market, unemployment figures, or gross value added figures, which your Government does not like us referring to, even though they are an internationally recognised measure of economic competitiveness—you will find that we are clearly in a poor position, relative to that in other parts of the United Kingdom. Do you not agree that your Government has resolutely failed over the past 10 years, during the economic good times, to ensure that the Welsh economy was able to perform as well as it should for the people of Wales as we enter these lean times? Will you apologise to the people of Wales for not having put procedures in place—

The Presiding Officer: Order. It may be your birthday, but that does not allow you to ask that many questions.

The First Minister: There is the usual litany of over-coloured adjectives: will we apologise for ‘poor’ or ‘failed’ services and so on. However, you do not look at the facts. I mentioned the facts and gave them to you, but you ignored them. I will not repeat them now. The fact that I mentioned earlier to Andrew R.T. Davies was that the rise in gross domestic household income in Wales since devolution is higher than that seen in any of the nine individual regions of England, Scotland or Northern Ireland. You do not like that fact, but we did not produce it; the Office for National Statistics did. It shows that the rise in prosperity in Wales is higher than that in England, Scotland and Ireland but also than that in any of the nine individual regions of England, Scotland and Ireland. If you read this morning’s paper, you will see that the Royal Bank of Scotland purchasing managers’ index shows a more favourable picture for Wales than for the rest of the United Kingdom. If you looked at Manpower’s employment outlook survey, you would find the same. Surveys are only surveys, but when two come out on the same

wedi dweud ein bod yn wynebu cyfnod heriol, ac yr wyf yn gwerthfawrogi’r ffaith bod economi’r DU a’r economi fyd-eang yn wynebu amseroedd anos nag a wnaethant yn y gorffennol, ond mae gennyf gwestiwn penodol am economi Cymru yng nghydestun economi’r DU. Er gwaethaf eich ateb i fy nghwestiwn gwreiddiol, pa bynnag fesur a ddefnyddiwyd—y farchnad dai, ffigurau diweithdra, neu ffigurau gwerth ychwanegol crynswth—nid yw eich Llywodraeth yn hoff o’n clywed yn cyfeirio at y rheini, er eu bod yn fesur cystadleurwydd economaidd a gaiff ei gydnabod yn rhyngwladol—gwelwch ein bod yn amlwg mewn sefyllfa wael, o’i chymharu â sefyllfa rhannau eraill o’r Deyrnas Unedig. Onid ydych yn cytuno bod eich Llywodraeth wedi methu’n lân dros y 10 mlynedd diwethaf, yn ystod yr adegau economaidd da, â sicrhau bod economi Cymru’n gallu perfformio cystal ag y dylai wrth inni gyrraedd yr adegau hyn o brinder? A ymddiheurwch wrth bobl Cymru am beidio â bod wedi sefydlu gweithdrefnau—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Efallai ei bod yn ben-blwydd arnoch, ond nid yw hynny’n golygu y cewch ofyn cynifer â hynny o gwestiynau.

Y Prif Weinidog: Dyna’r llith arferol o ansoddeiriau gorliwgar: a ymddiheurwn am wasanaethau ‘gwael’ neu wasanaethau sydd ‘wedi methu’ ac yn y blaen. Fodd bynnag, nid ydych yn edrych ar y ffeithiau. Cyfeiriais at y ffeithiau, a’u rhoi ichi, ond aethoch ati i’w hanwybyddu. Ni fyddaf yn eu hailadrodd yn awr. Y ffaith y soniais amdani wrth Andrew R.T. Davies yn gynharach oedd bod y twf yn incwm aelwydydd domestig crynswth yng Nghymru ers datganoli yn uwch na’r hyn a welwyd yn unrhyw un o’r naw rhanbarth unigol yn Lloegr, yr Alban neu Ogledd Iwerddon. Nid ydych yn hoff o’r ffaith honno, ond nid ni a’i cynhyrchodd; y Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol a’i cynhyrchodd. Mae’n dangos bod y twf mewn llewyrch yng Nghymru yn uwch na’r twf yn Lloegr, yr Alban ac Iwerddon ond hefyd yn uwch na’r twf yn unrhyw un o’r naw rhanbarth unigol yn Lloegr, yr Alban ac Iwerddon. Os darllenwch bapur newydd y bore yma, gwelwch fod mynegai rheolwyr prynu Banc Brenhinol yr Alban yn dangos darlun mwy ffafriol ar gyfer Cymru nag ar gyfer gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig. Pe

day both indicating that the position in Wales is stronger than that elsewhere in the UK, you cannot ignore them both. You might ignore just one survey, but you could have paid some passing attention to two, at least to recognise that they do not share your view.

The Leader of the Opposition (Nick Bourne): I do not think that many people would recognise the picture of the economic Shangri-la being painted by the First Minister in those comments. He was closer to the truth in his first answer, when he admitted that we face massive increases in energy and food prices and so on. That is the truth, as we have seen over the past year. In that time, there has been an 11 per cent increase in wholesale food inflation, and a 28.5 per cent increase in the price of petrol. The First Minister should not be proud of that, although I accept that that applies across the United Kingdom, of course, and not just to Wales. However, he has responsibility for Wales, if we may refresh his memory. What is he doing about the Welsh position? Has he made any assessment of it? What is he doing to help the people of Wales who cannot meet their council tax bills, their mortgage repayments or even the cost of living? What is he doing about that, given that he is First Minister?

The First Minister: What a corkscrew question, even for you, Nick. I have never heard such a confused question. You said that you agreed with the answer that I gave to Andrew R.T. Davies, then you said that I had described a Shangri-la, which is an absurd caricature, even for you, and then, at the end, you asked all those questions relating to the rise in the standard of living and Wales, and you said that some people cannot meet their council tax bills. That may be so, but we have run an economy in which household income has risen more rapidly than in any part of England, Scotland or Northern Ireland. Surely we cannot be doing everything wrong, Nick, can we?

edrychech ar arolwg rhagolygon cyflogaeth Manpower, byddech yn gweld yr un peth. Nid yw arolygon yn ddim ond arolygon, ond pan gyhoeddir dau ar yr un diwrnod sydd ill dau'n dangos bod y sefyllfa yng Nghymru yn gryfach na'r sefyllfa mewn rhannau eraill o'r DU, ni allwch anwybyddu'r ddau ohonynt. Mae'n bosibl ichi anwybyddu un arolwg, ond gallasech roi rhywfaint o sylw i ddau er mwyn cydnabod, o leiaf, nad ydynt yn rhannu'r un safbwynt â chi.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Nick Bourne): Ni chredaf y byddai llawer o bobl yn adnabod y darlun o'r Shangri-la economaidd a gyflëwyd gan y Prif Weinidog yn y sylwadau hynny. Yr oedd yn nes at y gwir yn ei ateb cyntaf, pan gyfaddefodd ein bod yn wynebu codiadau anferth mewn prisiau ynni a bwyd ac yn y blaen. Dyna'r gwir, fel yr ydym wedi gweld dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw, bu cynnydd o 11 y cant mewn chwyddiant cyfanwerthu bwyd, a chynnydd o 28.5 y cant ym mhpris petrol. Ni ddylai'r Prif Weinidog fod yn falch o hynny, er fy mod yn derbyn bod hynny'n berthnasol ledled y Deyrnas Unedig, wrth gwrs, ac nid i Gymru'n unig. Fodd bynnag, mae ganddo gyfrifoldeb dros Gymru, os cawn roi proc i'w gof. Beth y mae'n ei wneud ynghylch y sefyllfa yng Nghymru? A yw wedi cynnal asesiad ohoni? Beth y mae'n ei wneud i helpu pobl Cymru na allant dalu eu biliau treth cyngor, eu had-daliadau morgais neu hyd yn oed gostau byw? Beth y mae'n ei wneud ynghylch hynny, ac ystyried mai ef yw'r Prif Weinidog?

Y Prif Weinidog: Am gwestiwn troellog, hyd yn oed gennych chi, Nick. Nid wyf wedi clywed cwestiwn mor ddryslyd erioed. Dywedasoeh eich bod yn cytuno â'r ateb a roddais i Andrew R.T. Davies, yna dywedasoeh fy mod wedi disgrifio Shangri-la, sy'n wawd afresymol, hyd yn oed gennych chi, ac yna, ar y diwedd, gofynasoeh yr holl gwestiynau hynny ynghylch y twf mewn safonau byw a Chymru, a dywedasoeh na all rhai pobl dalu eu biliau treth cyngor. Efallai fod hynny'n wir, ond yr ydym wedi rhedeg economi lle mae incwm aelwydydd wedi codi'n gyflymach nag yn unrhyw ran o Loegr, yr Alban neu Ogledd Iwerddon. Nid oes posibl ein bod yn gwneud popeth yn anghywir, Nick, ynteu a oes?

Nick Bourne: It is hard to know where to begin with the First Minister, because he just does not recognise that there is a problem. I find it hard to believe that, given the current circumstances, he is not getting the same e-mails, letters and phone calls as the rest of us. There is a serious economic situation. Week in, week out, I ask what the First Minister is doing to help people in debt. Is he helping them by providing extra assistance? I know what he is doing on the mortgages front, and I welcome that, having pushed for it for the past three weeks. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.'] Well, I have. Consult the Record if you do not believe it. However, a sum of £5 million will not touch the sides. It is not just the people who own houses who are having difficulties; it is also people who have to pay the bills of everyday living, including meeting energy costs and paying food bills. Much of the increase in the cost of petrol and fertiliser has not fed through to the shopping basket yet, but, when it does, the position will become even more serious. I repeat the question that I keep asking the First Minister week in, week out: what is he and his Government doing to help people who find themselves in debt and who cannot meet the costs of everyday living?

The First Minister: Nick, you have already said that you agree with what we are doing to assist, namely offering debt relief, so I do not know what that final pseudo-flourish was all about. You have said that you agree with what I said to Andrew R.T. Davies. We all recognise that the economy is entering choppy waters than have been seen for more than 10 years, possibly a dozen, and we are doing everything possible, within our devolved powers, to ameliorate the situation for those who are caught at the sharp end: those on debt relief, and so forth. Why you will not recognise that household incomes have gone up more rapidly in Wales than elsewhere in the United Kingdom during our stewardship, I do not know. It must have something to do with your party-political determination to run the Welsh economy down, and to try to pretend that things are worse in Wales than they are in reality.

Nick Bourne: Mae'n anodd gwybod lle i ddechrau gyda'r Prif Weinidog, oherwydd nid yw'n cydnabod y ceir problem. Yr wyf yn ei chael yn anodd credu, ac ystyried yr amgylchiadau presennol, nad yw'n cael yr un negeseuon e-bost, llythyrau a galwadau ffôn â'r gweddill ohonom. Ceir sefyllfa economaidd ddifrifol. O'r naill wythnos i'r llall, gofynnaf beth mae'r Prif Weinidog yn ei wneud i helpu pobl mewn dyled. A yw'n eu helpu drwy ddarparu cymorth ychwanegol? Gwn beth mae'n ei wneud ynghylch morgeisi, a chroesawaf hynny, gan fy mod wedi gwthio am hynny dros y tair wythnos diwethaf. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.'] Wel, mae hynny'n wir. Edrychwch ar y Cofnod os na chredwch hynny. Fodd bynnag, ni fydd swm o £5 yn cyffwrdd â'r ochrau. Nid y bobl sy'n berchen ar dai yn unig sy'n cael anawsterau, mae pobl sy'n gorfod talu biliau bywyd bob dydd, gan gynnwys talu costau ynni a thalu biliau bwyd hefyd yn cael anawsterau. Nid yw rhan helaeth o'r cynnydd mewn prisiau petrol a gwrtaith wedi ymdreiddio i'r fasedd siopa eto, ond, pan fydd yn gwneud hynny, bydd y sefyllfa'n fwy difrifol fyth. Ailadroddaf y cwestiwn y byddaf yn ei ofyn i'r Prif Weinidog bob wythnos: beth mae ef a'i Lywodraeth yn ei wneud i helpu pobl sy'n canfod eu hunain mewn dyled ac yn methu talu costau bywyd bob dydd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nick, yr ydych eisoes wedi dweud eich bod yn cytuno â'r hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud i gynorthwyo, sef cynnig cymorth gyda dyledion, felly ni wn beth oedd diben yr iaith flodeuog honno ar y diwedd. Yr ydych wedi dweud eich bod yn cytuno â'r hyn a ddywedais wrth Andrew R.T. Davies. Yr ydym i gyd yn cydnabod bod yr economi yn wynebu dyfroedd mwy garw nag a welwyd ers dros 10 mlynedd, dwsin o bosibl, ac yr ydym yn gwneud popeth y gallwn, o fewn ein pwerau datganoledig, i wella'r sefyllfa i'r rheini sydd wedi'u dal ar y rheng flaen: y rheini sy'n cael cymorth gyda dyledion, ac yn y blaen. Ni wn pam na wnewch gydnabod bod incwm aelwydydd wedi codi'n gyflymach yng Nghymru nag yn unrhyw ran arall o'r Deyrnas Unedig dan ein gofal. Mae'n rhaid bod a wnelo hynny â'ch penderfyniad, yn enw gwleidyddiaeth plaid, i ladd ar economi Cymru, a cheisio cymryd

arnoch fod pethau'n waeth yng Nghymru nag yr ydynt mewn gwirionedd.

2.20 p.m.

On the broad economic position, a rebalancing of the economy is under way, with a move away from finance, retail and building buy-to-let apartment blocks—we know that—and a move towards the net-trade sector and manufacturing. Fortunately, if you read the business page of today's *Western Mail*, the Manpower survey or the Royal Bank of Scotland purchasing managers' index for Wales, you will see the evidence that that is under way. There is a switch from retail, finance, buy-to-let mortgages and other house-building construction to manufacturing and net trade. That is exactly what the Welsh and British economies need and it plays to one of Wales's strengths, namely the export of manufactured goods. Those sectors are now growing in a very healthy way as part of a long-overdue rebalancing of the economy.

Nick Bourne: Your answer had nothing to do with the question that I asked, and you should be addressing that question: have you read the e-mails that you are receiving, which I and others are also receiving, about meeting the cost of living? I did not ask what was in the *Western Mail*; I asked what you are doing about debt advice. At least you admit that there is a problem, but what are you doing to help ordinary people across Wales, whether or not they own houses, to meet the increased cost of living that is being caused by an increase of 15 per cent in electricity and gas prices, an increase of 28 per cent in petrol prices, and an increase of 11 per cent in the price of wholesale food since the beginning of the year? These are the problems that people in Wales are facing every day. They are not interested in your ivory tower stuff. Address yourself to concrete action to help those people.

The First Minister: I think that Nick is taking part in a eurovision hand-wringing championship. [*Laughter.*] He has no idea what would happen in the unlikely event that

Ynghylch y sefyllfa economaidd ehangach, mae'r gwaith o ail-gydbwysu'r economi yn mynd rhagddo, gan symud oddi wrth gyllid, manwerthu ac adeiladu blociau o fflatiau prynu i osod—gwyddom hynny—a symud at y sector masnach net a gweithgynhyrchu. Yn ffodus, os darllenwch dudalen fusnes yr *Western Mail* heddiw, arolwg Manpower neu fynegai rheolwyr prynu Banc Brenhinol yr Alban ar gyfer Cymru, gwelwch y dystiolaeth fod hynny ar waith. Ceir symudiad oddi wrth fanwerthu, cyllid, morgeisi prynu i osod a mathau eraill o waith adeiladu cartrefi ac at weithgynhyrchu a masnach net. Dyna'n union y mae ar economïau Cymru a Phrydain ei angen ac mae'n manteisio ar un o gryfderau Cymru, sef allforio nwyddau wedi'u gweithgynhyrchu. Mae'r sectorau hynny yn awr yn tyfu mewn ffordd iach iawn fel rhan o broses i ail-gydbwysu'r economi y mae galw amdano ers tro byd.

Nick Bourne: Nid oedd a wnelo eich ateb â'r cwestiwn a ofynnais o gwbl, a dylech fod yn rhoi sylw i'r cwestiwn hwnnw: a ydych wedi darllen y negeseuon e-bost a anfonir atoch, sef negeseuon a anfonir ataf innau ac at Aelodau eraill, ynglŷn â thalu costau byw? Ni ofynnais beth a oedd yn y *Western Mail*; gofynnais beth yr ydych yn ei wneud ynghylch cyngor am ddyledion. Yr ydych, o leiaf, yn cyfaddef y ceir problem, ond beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i helpu pobl gyffredin ar draws Cymru, pa un ai a ydynt berchen ar eu tai eu hunain ai peidio, i dalu'r costau byw sydd wedi codi yn sgil cynnydd o 15 y cant mewn prisiau trydan a nwy, cynnydd o 28 y cant mewn prisiau petrol, a chynnydd o 11 y cant mewn prisiau bwyd a werthir drwy gyfanwerthu ers dechrau'r flwyddyn? Dyma'r problemau y mae pobl yng Nghymru yn eu hwynebu bob dydd. Nid os ganddynt ddiddordeb yn eich sylwadau ysgolheigaidd. Ymgymrwch â chammau gweithredu ymarferol i helpu'r bobl hynny.

Y Prif Weinidog: Credaf fod Nick yn cymryd rhan mewn pencampwriaeth gwasgu dwylo eurovision. [*Chwerthin.*] Nid oes ganddo ddim syniad beth a fyddai'n digwydd

David Cameron and George Osborne become responsible for economic affairs in this country. With two years to go before a general election, do we have any idea what they would do? Does Nick Bourne have any idea about whether they would be pumping money into any of these areas? No, he does not. All that he is trying to say is, 'Let us see whether the Tories can suddenly make themselves slightly less unpopular in Wales', by pretending to shed these crocodile tears for people who are affected by high fuel prices.

What I am saying is that the direction of the economy is changing and there will be a lot of pain during that restructuring towards manufactured goods and manufacturing export. The one advantage that we can take from that is the fact that that is undoubtedly one of Wales's traditional strengths.

Jeff Cuthbert: I am sure that you will recall that Nick Ramsay, in his question, said that we are experiencing lean times. I am sure that you will agree that he and his party should know about lean times, because that is exactly what they gave the people of Wales when they were in charge in the 1980s and 1990s. Do we not remember all too well the 130,000 people unemployed in Wales, which we have dramatically reduced by at least 100,000? You will be pleased to know, First Minister, that I recently commended the work that Objective 1 has done in creating 40,000 jobs and safeguarding many more in Wales. Do you agree that when the Tories simply criticise and try to do down the Welsh economy, we will be using European structural funds in a planned and focused way to raise skill levels in Wales? We will see the people of Wales through any economic crisis whereas they are only concerned about talking us into difficulties.

The First Minister: That is my big fear. If you talk to people in industry, house building, finance or credit, they will say that there is a danger of Wales and Britain talking

pe digwyddai'r sefyllfa annhebygol bod David Cameron a George Osborne yn dod yn gyfrifol am faterion economaidd yn y wlad hon. Gyda dwy flynedd i fynd cyn etholiad cyffredinol, a oes gennym unrhyw syniad beth y byddent yn ei wneud? A oes gan Nick Bourne unrhyw syniad pa un ai a fyddent yn rhoi arian i mewn i unrhyw un o'r meysydd hyn? Nac oes, nid oes ganddo syniad. Y cyfan y mae'n ceisio'i ddweud yw, 'Dewch inni gael gweld a all y Torïaid, mwyaf sydyn, wneud eu hunain fymryn yn llai amhoblogaidd yng Nghymru', drwy esgus colli'r dagrau nionod hyn dros bobl yr effeithir arnynt gan brisiau tanwydd uchel.

Yr hyn yr wyf yn ei ddweud yw bod cyfeiriad yr economi yn newid a cheir llawer o boen yn ystod y broses honno o ailstrwythuro at nwyddau wedi'u gweithgynhyrchu ac allforion gweithgynhyrchu. Yr un fantais y gallwn ei gymryd o hynny yw'r ffaith mai hynny, yn ddiamau, yw un o gryfderau traddodiadol Cymru.

Jeff Cuthbert: Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn cofio i Nick Ramsay ddweud, yn ei gwestiwn, ein bod yn wynebu cyfnod o brinder. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn cytuno y dylai ef a'i blaid wybod am gyfnodau o brinder, oherwydd dyna'n union y rhoddasant i bobl Cymru pan oeddent mewn grym yn yr 1980au hwyr a'r 1990au. Oni chofiw, yn rhy dda o lawer, y 130,000 o bobl a oedd yn ddi-waith yng Nghymru, sef nifer yr ydym wedi'i ostwng yn syfrdanol o 100,000 o leiaf? Byddwch yn falch o wybod, Brif Weinidog, fy mod, yn ddiweddar, wedi cymeradwyo'r gwaith y mae Amcan 1 wedi'i wneud i greu 40,000 o swyddi ac i ddiogelu mwy o lawer yng Nghymru. A ydych yn cytuno, pan fydd y Ceidwadwyr yn beirniadu ac yn ceisio bychanu economi Cymru, y byddwn yn defnyddio cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd mewn ffordd fwriadol sydd â ffocws pendant i godi lefelau sgiliau yng Nghymru? Byddwn yn arwain pobl Cymru drwy unrhyw argyfwng economaidd, ond eu hunig fwriad hwy yw ein harwain i drafferthion drwy siarad.

Y Prif Weinidog: Hynny yw fy mhryder mawr. Os siaradwch â phobl ym myd diwydiant, adeiladu tai, cyllid neu greyd, byddant yn dweud y ceir perygl y bydd

themselves into a recession. People need to be conscious of that. That is what I hear from industry.

On the issue of the lean times that are associated with the Tories, you are being a bit kind, Jeff, because the word 'lean' implies that there is still some meat left, whereas the Tories actually cut into the bone of the Welsh economy during the two massive recessions that occurred when they were last in power.

On Objective 1, you are right to point out that employment levels in Britain as a whole during this Assembly's existence have increased by 7 per cent and that they have increased by 9 per cent in Wales. In Objective 1 Wales, they rose by 11 per cent, which shows that the direction of travel for Objective 1 during the first seven-year period was right and gave us additional growth in jobs in two-thirds of Wales.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):

Despite the pain and misery that you have just predicted that we will experience in Wales—those were your words—there is one little gleam of hope, namely that the pound has fallen against the euro. We now have an extra £40 million to spend before the end of December that we did not think that we would have. Given that the pound was worth less than €1.30 by 1 January 2008, when did you first realise that you had an extra £40 million to spend and on what will you spend it?

The First Minister: The issue of the drop in the value of the pound relative to the euro came with great swiftness last autumn—from memory, it was in September or October, possibly November, last year. By the time that the pound had dropped from the high €1.40s to about €1.30, and subsequently to €1.25, it was plain that we were receiving advice that there would be some additional windfall. However, I do not think that we had any indication of that meaning that we had to get our boots on in order to ensure that we could spend that additional money to avoid any decommitment risk before the new year.

Cymru a Phrydain yn achosi dirwasgiad drwy siarad. Mae angen i bobl fod yn ymwybodol o hynny. Dyna a glywaf o fyd diwydiant.

Ynghylch mater y cyfnodau o brinder a gysylltir â'r Ceidwadwyr, yr ydych yn bod braidd yn garedig, Jeff, oherwydd mae'r gair 'prinder' yn awgrymu bod rhywfaint o gig ar ôl, ond mewn gwirionedd, nid oedd dim cig ar asgwrn economi Cymru yn sgil y Torïaid, yn ystod y ddau ddirwasgiad anferth a ddigwyddodd y tro diwethaf yr oeddent mewn grym.

Ynghylch Amcan 1, yr ydych yn gywir pan ddywedwch fod lefelau diweithdra ym Mhrydain ar y cyfan yn ystod bodolaeth y Cynulliad hwn wedi codi 7 y cant a'u bod wedi codi 9 y cant yng Nghymru. Yn ystod cyfnod Amcan 1 yng Nghymru, codasant 11 y cant, sy'n dangos bod Amcan 1 wedi symud yn y cyfeiriad cywir yn ystod y saith mlynedd cyntaf ac wedi rhoi twf ychwanegol mewn swyddi mewn dwy ran o dair o Gymru.

Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):

Er gwaethaf y boen a'r trallod yr ydych newydd ragweld a gawn yng Nghymru—dyna oedd eich geiriau—ceir un llygedyn bach o obaith, sef bod y bunt wedi disgyn yn erbyn yr ewro. Mae gennym yn awr £40 miliwn ychwanegol i'w wario cyn diwedd mis Rhagfyr nad oeddem yn meddwl a fyddai gennym. Ac ystyried bod y bunt yn werth llai na €1.30 erbyn 1 Ionawr 2008, pryd y bu ichi sylwi am y tro cyntaf bod gennych £40 miliwn ychwanegol i'w wario ac ar beth y byddwch yn ei wario?

Y Prif Weinidog: Digwyddodd y gwmp yng ngwerth y bunt o'i chymharu â'r ewro yn gyflym iawn hydref diwethaf—os cofiaf yn iawn, yr oedd ym mis Medi neu fis Hydref neu o bosibl mis Tachwedd y llynedd. Erbyn yr adeg yr oedd y bunt wedi disgyn o'r €1.40au uchel i oddeutu €1.30, ac wedyn i €1.25, yr oedd hi'n amlwg ein bod yn cael cyngor y ceid rhywfaint o arian ychwanegol. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn meddwl inni gael unrhyw arwydd bod hynny'n golygu bod yn rhaid inni roi trefn ar bethau er mwyn sicrhau y gallem wario'r arian ychwanegol hwnnw i osgoi unrhyw risg dadneilltuo cyn y

That is speaking from memory. If I am wrong, I shall correct myself in writing to you, Mike.

The issue is therefore about extending the programmes that provided very good value for money and where the structures are still in place to spend the additional money—some £40 million I believe. It is then a case of being aware of the match funding implications of that for the sponsors of those schemes and, likewise, the need for additional match funding for the sponsors of the incoming schemes, because if you project forward a value for sterling as being roughly what it is today—although it could go back into reverse again—there is an additional requirement for match funding and, as a last resort, for match funding from us. There is also a need to ensure that we do not decommit on the old programmes.

Michael German: It is the last point that you make that I am worried about, First Minister, because the N+2 regulations apply as much to the old programmes as to the new. There is £40 million, so Welsh Assembly Government officials say, that must be spent before 31 December this year. That is £40 million that will require £40 million in match funding. Most people, looking at the doom and gloom and pain and misery that you have just described as being our economy in Wales would say, 'Here is an opportunity to do more. At least we have some cash in our hands to do something with'. At the same time, nearly 30 staff in the Wales Council for Voluntary Action have been put on warning of redundancy because the European programmes are not under way. Surely, we could spend this money now and take the opportunity to at least bring some relief to the doom and gloom you have been talking about.

The First Minister: You are using the expression 'doom and gloom'; I do not think that I used that expression. You have attributed the word 'misery' to me; I do not think I used that word. I referred to the rebalancing of the economy towards the net-trade sector as involving some pain. Undoubtedly, any restructuring involves

flwyddyn newydd. Yr wyf yn siarad o'm cof yn awr. Os wyf yn anghywir, cywiraf fy hun ar bapur ichi, Mike.

Mae'r mater felly'n ymwneud ag ymestyn y rhaglenni a oedd yn darparu gwerth da iawn am arian a lle mae'r strwythurau'n dal ar waith i wario'r arian ychwanegol—oddeutu £40 miliwn yr wyf yn meddwl. Mae wedyn yn ymwneud â bod yn ymwybodol o oblygiadau hynny o ran arian cyfatebol ar gyfer noddwyr y cynlluniau hynny ac, yn yr un modd, yr angen am arian cyfatebol ychwanegol ar gyfer noddwyr y cynlluniau sydd ar ddod, oherwydd os ydych yn rhagamcanu y bydd gwerth sterling oddeutu'r hyn ydyw heddiw—er y gallai fynd yn ôl eto—ceir gofyniad ychwanegol ar gyfer arian cyfatebol ac, os daw hi i'r pen, ar gyfer arian cyfatebol gennym ni. Mae hefyd angen sicrhau nad ydym yn dadneilltuo ar yr hen raglenni.

Michael German: Y pwynt diwethaf a wnewch yr wyf yn poeni amdano, Brif Weinidog, oherwydd mae'r rheoliadau N+2 yr un mor berthnasol i'r hen raglenni ag ydynt i'r rhaglenni newydd. Ceir £40 miliwn, yn ôl swyddogion Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, y mae'n rhaid ei wario cyn 31 Rhagfyr eleni. Mae hynny'n £40 miliwn a fydd yn gofyn am £40 miliwn o arian cyfatebol. Wrth edrych ar y gofid a gwae a'r boen a'r trallod yr ydych wedi'u darlunio i ddisgrifio ein heconomi yng Nghymru, byddai'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yn dweud, 'Dyma gyfle i wneud rhagor. O leiaf mae gennym rywfaint o arian mewn llaw i'w ddefnyddio i wneud rhywbeth'. Ar yr un pryd, mae bron i 30 o staff yng Nghyngor Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Cymru wedi cael rhybudd y gallent golli eu swydd oherwydd nad yw'r rhaglenni Ewropeaidd ar waith. Siawns y gallem wario'r arian hwn yn awr a manteisio ar y cyfle i liniaru o leiaf rywfaint ar y gofid a gwae yr ydych wedi bod yn siarad amdano.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych yn defnyddio'r ymadrodd 'gofid a gwae'; ni chredaf imi ddefnyddio'r ymadrodd hwnnw. Yr ydych wedi priodoli'r gair 'trallod' imi; ni chredaf imi ddefnyddio'r gair hwnnw. Yr oeddwn wedi sôn y byddai ail-gydbwyso'r economi at y sector masnach net yn golygu rhywfaint o boen. Yn ddiau, mae unrhyw ailstrwythuro'n

pain. Luckily, it is a pain that is going to give you some gain as the economy rebalances away from finance, retail and too much investment in buy-to-let property towards manufacturing and manufactured exports and other net trades. That is what everybody says is going to happen. Luckily, that plays to Wales's strengths. Therefore, the doom and gloom is you talking, not me, and you are trying to attribute it to me because you think that there is somehow a bonus for Liberal Democrats who can catch out the First Minister saying things such as 'doom and gloom'; you think, 'Oh great', but I did not say it.

On the issue of £40 million of match funding, we had a meeting yesterday to discuss the extent to which we can find the right sponsors of the existing programmes that still have the structures in place that can spend this money. Clearly, the match funding is a problem, but is it a problem because the programmes do not have time to find it or because they are last-resort funders? If they are, they can come to us, but the question is then whether there is last-resort money on our side or whether the normal rule applies, that it is the responsibility of the sponsors themselves to find match funding.

Michael German: I wrote down the words 'pain' and 'misery', which you said, so I stand by those. On the issue of the £40 million that needs to be spent by the end of the year, it must be more or less doubled up, so that is £80 million to inject into the Welsh economy before the end of December, which is crucial. The point that I made to you right at the beginning was that, as you say, it happened in the autumn. We have known for some time that that would be the benefit of the pound bottoming out against the euro; it has been bouncing along the bottom for months now, so we should have known that this money was coming. However, people who have been making use of this Welsh Assembly Government money to help in the third sector through voluntary organisations are now under threat of redundancy. Surely, the thing to do is to ensure that we do not have that threat, use the money effectively and ensure that we bring this money to the

golygu poen. Yn ffodus, mae'n boen a fydd yn dod â rhywfaint o fudd ichi wrth i'r economi ail-gydbwyso o gyllid, manwerthu a gormod o fuddsoddi mewn eiddo prynu i'w osod at weithgynhyrchu ac allforion wedi'u gweithgynhyrchu a masnachau net eraill. Dyna'r hyn a ddywed pawb sy'n mynd i ddiwydd. Yn ffodus, mae hynny o fudd i gryfderau Cymru. Felly, chi sydd yn siarad am ofid a gwae, nid fi, ac yr ydych yn ceisio'i briodoli i mi oherwydd eich bod yn meddwl rhywsut bod bonws i Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol sy'n gallu ennyn y Prif Weinidog i ddweud pethau fel 'gofid a gwae'; yr ydych yn meddwl, 'O grêt', ond ni ddywedais hynny.

Ac ystyried y £40 miliwn o arian cyfatebol, cawsom gyfarfod ddoe i drafod i ba raddau y gallwn ddod o hyd i'r noddwyr iawn ar gyfer y rhaglenni cyfredol sydd â'r strwythurau ar waith i allu gwario'r arian hwn. Yn amlwg, mae'r arian cyfatebol yn broblem, ond a yw'n broblem oherwydd nad oes gan y rhaglenni amser i ddod o hyd iddo neu oherwydd eu bod yn gyllidwyr yn niffyg dim arall? Os ydynt, gallant ddod atom ni, ond wedyn y cwestiwn yw a oes arian yn niffyg dim arall ar gael ar ein hochr ni ynteu a yw'r rheol arferol yn berthnasol, sef mai'r noddwyr eu hunain sy'n gyfrifol am ddod o hyd i arian cyfatebol.

Michael German: Ysgrifennais y gair 'poen' a 'thralod' a ddywedaso, felly yr wyf yn glynu wrth y rheini. Ac ystyried y £40 miliwn y mae angen ei wario erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn, yn fwy neu lai mae'n rhaid ei ddyblu, felly mae hynny'n hwb o £80 miliwn ar gyfer economi Cymru cyn diwedd mis Rhagfyr, sy'n hanfodol. Y pwynt a wneuthum ichi ar y cychwyn cyntaf oedd, fel y dywedwch, digwyddodd yn yr hydref. Yr ydym wedi gwybod ers tro byd y ceid mantais y bunt yn cyrraedd ei phwynt isaf o'i chymharu â'r ewro; mae wedi bod yn sbocio ar hyd y gwaelod ers misoedd nawr, felly dylem fod wedi gwybod bod yr arian hwn yn dod. Fodd bynnag, mae pobl sydd wedi bod yn defnyddio'r arian hwn gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i helpu yn y trydydd sector drwy fudiadau gwirfoddol yn awr yn cael eu bygwth â cholli eu swyddi. Siawns, y peth iawn i'w wneud yw sicrhau nad yw'r bygythiad hwnnw gennym, defnyddio'r arian

people of Wales, rather than having to send it back to Europe having lost all of its benefit.

The First Minister: I have this wonderful image of Mike German standing there writing down my words, and if I say a word such as ‘pain’ he will say, ‘Oh, I can have a tee-hee moment now—the First Minister said the word ‘pain’’. I am grateful that you are recording my words for posterity, Mike. I am astonished that you cannot think of your own ideas; perhaps you think you can borrow them from me because I have used a key word. You think, ‘Oh, the Lib Dems have had a bonus—write down the fact that the First Minister said ‘pain’.’ Isn’t that wonderful?.

2.30 p.m.

To return to the question, which I have already answered, it was, I think, in November that we and officials were conscious of the fact that, if the pound remained at a low level relative to the euro, there would be a windfall gain. That is overwhelmingly good news, but you want to turn it into bad news. The rules remain: it is up to the sponsors of existing programmes whether they can extend those programmes—not merely because they are capable of being extended, they have to be very good value programmes. We are trying to take the best of the programmes and to extend them and are saying, ‘Okay, can you find the match funding and spend the money, because it has to be spent before 31 December?’. Likewise, for the new programmes, if we project now that the rate of sterling relative to the euro will remain roughly where it is today, there will be an additional match funding requirement for all sponsors, including the last-resort sponsor—us in some cases—extended over the next seven years.

Fuel Poverty

Q4 Nick Bourne: Will the First Minister make a statement on fuel poverty in Wales?

yn effeithiol a sicrhau ein bod yn dod â'r arian hwn i bobl Cymru, yn hytrach na gorfod ei anfon yn ôl i Ewrop a cholli ei holl fudd.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae gennyf ddelwedd wych o Mike German yn sefyll yn y fan honno'n ysgrifennu fy ngeiriau, ac os byddaf yn dweud gair megis ‘poen’ bydd yn dweud, ‘O, caf gyfle i chwerthin yn awr—dywedodd y Prif Weinidog y gair ‘poen’’. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar eich bod yn cofnodi fy ngeiriau ar gyfer y dyfodol, Mike. Yr wyf wedi fy synnu na allwch feddwl am eich syniadau eich hun; efallai eich bod yn meddwl y gallwch eu benthyg gennyf oherwydd fy mod wedi defnyddio gair allweddol. Yr ydych yn meddwl, ‘O, mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wedi cael bonws—ysgrifennwch y ffaith bod y Prif Weinidog wedi dweud ‘poen’.’ Onid yw hynny'n rhyfeddol?.

A dychwelyd at y cwestiwn, sydd eisoes wedi'i ateb gennyf, mis Tachwedd ydoedd, mi gredaf, pryd yr daethom ni a swyddogion yn ymwybodol o'r ffaith, pe arhosai'r bunt ar lefel isel mewn cymhariaeth â'r ewro, y ceid elw annisgwyl. Newydd da ofnadwy yw hynny, ond yr ydych chi'n awyddus i'w droi'n newydd drwg. Mae'r rheolau'n aros: mater i noddwyr rhaglenni presennol yw penderfynu a allant estyn y rhaglenni hynny—nid dim ond am fod modd eu hestyn, rhaid iddynt fod yn rhaglenni sydd yn rhoi gwerth da iawn. Yr ydym yn ceisio cymryd y gorau o'r rhaglenni a'u hymestyn ac yr ydym yn dweud, ‘Iawn, a allwch chi ganfod yr arian cyfatebol a gwario'r arian, oherwydd mae'n rhaid ei wario cyn 31 Rhagfyr?’. Yn yr un modd, i'r rhaglenni newydd, os proffwydwn yn awr y bydd cyfradd y bunt mewn perthynas â'r ewro'n aros yn fras fel y mae heddiw, bydd gofyniad arian cyfatebol ychwanegol ar bob noddwr, gan gynnwys y noddwr munud olaf—sef ni mewn ambell achos—wedi'i ymestyn dros y saith mlynedd nesaf.

Tlodi Tanwydd

C4 Nick Bourne: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am dlodi tanwydd yng Nghymru?

OAQ(3)1082(FM)

The First Minister: As you are aware, we have an objective to try to remove fuel poverty from Wales by 2018. We have some interim targets on the way to that overall goal, which would be extremely challenging to meet if fuel prices remain as they are today. We are currently playing catch-up as the price of oil rises even more than anyone thought possible almost on a weekly basis. There is the occasional wobble in the opposite direction, but, broadly, it is going a rapidly upward direction. The issue, therefore, is to ensure that we use the UK Government programmes and the home energy efficiency scheme, which is our responsibility, but does not duplicate.

Nick Bourne: I will refresh the First Minister's memory about the interim target, which is for 2010—two years away—to totally eradicate fuel poverty in vulnerable households. The number of vulnerable households in fuel poverty doubled between 2004 and 2006, which was before the current round of increased fuel prices kicked in. Therefore, the latest figures for 2006 showed that roughly 200,000 vulnerable households were in fuel poverty. That number will almost certainly have gone up in 2007 and again in 2008. I have asked the First Minister about this before, and I want to know whether he is looking to revise the targets. The target is not just extremely challenging; it is not achievable. If he intends to revise the target, when will he do so? If he does not, why not?

The First Minister: The interim targets on fuel poverty—vulnerable households by 2010, social housing by 2012, and all households by 2018—are extremely challenging. We would all have to accept that, and they become much more challenging given the recent rise in oil prices, which has dragged up electricity, gas and coal prices. We are currently trying to make sure that we extract the maximum benefit from our home insulation schemes, boiler improvement schemes and so on. We try to concentrate those schemes on the most vulnerable households, while at the same time avoiding duplication of the UK Government's schemes, to make sure that

OAQ(3)1082(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Fel y gwyddoch, mae gennym nod i geisio dileu tlodi tanwydd o Gymru erbyn 2018. Mae gennym ambell darged interim ar y ffordd i gyflawni'r prif nod hwnnw, y byddai'n her eithriadol eu cyflawni os erys prisiau tanwydd fel y maent heddiw. Yr ydym ar hyn o bryd yn ceisio dal i fyny wrth i bris olew godi'n fwy hyd yn oed nag y tybiai neb y byddai'n bosibl, a hynny bron yn wythnosol. Yn achlysurol bydd yn simsanu i'r cyfeiriad arall, ond, yn gyffredinol, mae'n mynd ar i fyny'n gyflym. Yr angen, felly, yw sicrhau y defnyddiwn raglenni Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig a'r cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref, sef ein cyfrifoldeb ni, ond heb ddyblygu.

Nick Bourne: Atgoffaf y Prif Weinidog am y targed interim, sydd ar gyfer 2010—ddwy flynedd i ffwrdd—i ddileu tlodi tanwydd yn llwyr mewn cartrefi bregus. Dyblodd nifer y cartrefi bregus sydd mewn tlodi tanwydd rhwng 2004 a 2006, sef cyn i'r cylch cyfredol o brisiau tanwydd cynyddol ddod i rym. Felly, dangosai ffigurau diweddaraf 2006 fod tua 200,000 o gartrefi bregus yn byw mewn tlodi tanwydd. Bydd y nifer honno bron yn sicr wedi cynyddu yn 2007 ac eto yn 2008. Yr wyf wedi holi'r Prif Weinidog am hyn o'r blaen, ac mae arnaf eisiau gwybod a ydyw'n meddwl am ddiwygio'r targedi. Mae'r targed yn fwy na her eithriadol; mae'n amhosibl ei gyrraedd. Os ydyw'n bwriadu diwygio'r targed, pa bryd y gwnaiff hynny? Os nad ydyw, pam ddim?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r targedau interim ar dlodi tanwydd—cartrefi bregus erbyn 2010, tai cymdeithasol erbyn 2012, a phob cartref erbyn 2018—yn gosod her eithriadol. Byddai'n rhaid i bob un ohonom dderbyn hynny, ac maent yn llawer mwy o her yn sgil y cynnydd diweddar ym mhrisiau olew, sydd wedi llusgo prisiau trydan, nwy a glo i fyny. Ar hyn o bryd yr ydym yn ceisio gwneud yn siŵr y cawn y budd mwyaf posibl o'n cynlluniau insiwleiddio cartrefi, ein cynlluniau gwella bwyleri ac ati. Ceisiwn ganolbwyntio'r cynlluniau hynny ar y cartrefi mwyaf bregus, gan osgoi dyblygu cynlluniau Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig, er mwyn gwneud yn siŵr y caiff cartrefi bregus

vulnerable households are assisted to the greatest degree possible. If there is to be a review of the targets, because they prove to be unachievable, I—or the relevant Minister—will make a statement in the usual way.

Janet Ryder: I am sure that you are aware that in some cases there is a difference in the basic tariff charged for electricity in England and in Wales. In some parts of Wales, people can pay as much as 18 per cent more for electricity than is paid in England. What discussions have your officials or your Government had with energy companies to address this issue, and to ensure that people in Wales are paying the same price as is paid elsewhere in the United Kingdom?

The First Minister: With regard to electricity, people are paying 10 per cent more. I do not know whether that is true of the Manweb area, but it is certainly true of the old Swalec area in south and mid Wales, which has two thirds of the population of Wales. I believe that those areas are the worst affected. I am meeting Sir John Mogg, the chairman of Ofgem, in three weeks' time on 3 July. Jane Davidson participated in the Ofgem summit, which took place a week or so ago, in which all of these activities were discussed. What is it that the energy companies now do that causes households in Wales to be unable to access the cheapest tariffs? They can be on social tariffs, but those are sometimes not the lowest tariffs. There is also the problem with prepayment meters, which are popular in some areas of Wales, in that the rate per unit for electricity and gas is higher than that paid by people who have a traditional quarterly bill. There is a range of activities where we believe we can ameliorate the situation. What we cannot do, of course, is bring down the price of oil, much as we would love to see that happen. However, we can ameliorate the situation by getting the energy supply companies, our programmes and those of the Westminster Government to dovetail with each other. At the moment, they do not; many of them overlap.

Peter Black: In answer to Nick Bourne last week, you said that your Government would

gymaint o gymorth ag sy'n bosibl. Os bydd diwygio ar y targedi, oherwydd iddynt brofi'n rhai amhosibl eu cyrraedd, gwnaf fi—neu'r Gweinidog perthnasol—ddatganiad yn y modd arferol.

Janet Ryder: Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol fod gwahaniaeth mewn rhai achosion yn y pris sylfaenol a godir am drydan yn Lloegr ac yng Nghymru. Mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru, gall pobl dalu cymaint â 18 y cant yn fwy am drydan nag a delir yn Lloegr. Pa drafodaethau y mae eich swyddogion neu eich Llywodraeth wedi'u cael gyda chwmnïau ynni i ddatrys y mater hwn, ac i sicrhau bod pobl yng Nghymru'n talu'r un pris ag a delir mewn rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig?

Y Prif Weinidog: O ran trydan, mae pobl yn talu 10 y cant yn fwy. Ni wn a yw hynny'n wir am ardal Manweb, ond yn sicr mae'n wir am hen ardal Swalec yn y de a'r canolbarth, lle mae dau draean o boblogaeth Cymru'n byw. Credaf mai'r ardaloedd hynny sy'n dioddef yr effaith waethaf. Byddaf yn cyfarfod â Syr John Mogg, cadeirydd Ofgem, ymhen tair wythnos ar 3 Gorffennaf. Cymerodd Jane Davidson ran yn uwch-gynhadledd Ofgem, a gynhaliwyd ryw wythnos yn ôl, lle trafodwyd y gweithgareddau hyn i gyd. Beth mae'r cwmnïau ynni'n ei wneud yn awr sy'n peri na all cartrefi yng Nghymru gael y tariffau rhataf? Gallant fod ar dariffau cymdeithasol, ond nid y rheini yw'r tariffau isaf weithiau. Ceir problem hefyd gyda mesuryddion talu ymlaen llaw, sy'n boblogaidd mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru, sef bod y gyfradd am uned o drydan a nwy'n uwch nag a delir gan bobl sy'n cael bil chwarterol traddodiadol. Mae amryfal weithgareddau lle credwn y gallwn wella'r sefyllfa. Yr hyn na allwn ei wneud, wrth gwrs, yw dod â phris olew i lawr, er cymaint yr hoffem weld hynny'n digwydd. Fodd bynnag, gallwn wella'r sefyllfa drwy gael y cwmnïau cyflenwi ynni, ein rhaglenni ni a rhaglenni Llywodraeth San Steffan i asio i'w gilydd. Ar hyn o bryd, nid yw hynny'n digwydd; mae llawer ohonynt yn goryffwrdd.

Peter Black: Wrth ateb Nick Bourne yr wythnos diwethaf, dywedasoich y byddai'n

have to look at its targets to see the extent to which they would be wrecked by the sharp and sudden rise in fuel prices worldwide. We all accept that that rise is outside the control of the Government. However, the amount of money that the Assembly Government is spending on trying to tackle fuel poverty is within your control, as is how it is spent. As you know, the home energy efficiency scheme has very been successful and over £50 million has been spent on helping people to become more fuel efficient. However, only 29 per cent of those helped were classed as being fuel poor. Therefore, to what extent have you revised that scheme to try to improve the hit rate, as it were, to ensure that that money is better directed at those who need it the most?

The First Minister: You are right: the home energy efficiency scheme has never been targeted only at vulnerable households; it has always had a less means-tested element within it, if you want to put it that way. We are trying to ensure that we spend the money in a way that does not duplicate the special concession schemes that are overseen by Ofgem and run by the energy supply companies themselves. We want to ensure that there is not duplication between the schemes that we do not control and those that we do, and that we reach vulnerable households, while at the same time trying to persuade the fuel supply companies to cease penalising people in Wales—or at least those in south and mid Wales—by operating higher tariffs, and getting consumers to use to the full their ability to play the market, which people in Wales have been remarkably reluctant to do. Most people in Wales have stuck with Swalec and the inheritor gas company, Centrica, because they do not like change and they do not believe in switching. However, we have to persuade them to do it if it will help to stop this situation whereby fuel bills are 10 per cent higher in Wales despite wages being lower.

GP Practices

Q5 Leanne Wood: What discussions has the First Minister had regarding GP practices in

rhaid i'ch Llywodraeth edrych ar ei thargedau i weld i ba raddau y caent eu dryllio gan y cynnydd mawr sydyn ym mhrisiau tanwydd ledled y byd. Yr ydym i gyd yn derbyn bod y cynnydd hwnnw y tu allan i reolaeth y Llywodraeth. Fodd bynnag, mae faint o arian y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei wario ar geisio mynd i'r afael â thlodi tanwydd o fewn eich rheolaeth, ynghyd â'r modd y caiff ei wario. Fel y gwyddoch, bu'r cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref yn llwyddiannus iawn ac mae dros £50 miliwn wedi'i wario ar helpu pobl i ddefnyddio tanwydd yn fwy effeithlon. Fodd bynnag, dim ond 29 y cant o'r rhai a gynorthwywyd a oedd yn y dosbarth tanwydd dlawd. Felly, i ba raddau'r ydych wedi diwygio'r cynllun hwnnw i geisio gwella'r gyfradd lwyddo, fel petai, i sicrhau y caiff arian ei gyfeirio'n well at y rhai sydd â mwyaf o'i angen?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych yn iawn: nid yw'r cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref erioed wedi'i dargedu at gartrefi bregus yn unig; mae bob amser wedi cynnwys elfen lai dibynnol ar brawf modd, os ydych am ei roi felly. Yr ydym yn ceisio sicrhau y gwariwn yr arian mewn modd nad yw'n dyblygu'r cynlluniau consesiwn arbennig a oruchwylir gan Ofgem ac a redir gan y cwmnïau cyflenwi ynni eu hunain. Mae arnom eisiau sicrhau nad oes dyblygu rhwng y cynlluniau na reolir gennym a'r rhai a reolir gennym, a'n bod yn cyrraedd cartrefi bregus, gan geisio perswadio'r cwmnïau cyflenwi tanwydd ar yr un pryd i beidio â chosbi pobl yng Nghymru—neu o leiaf bobl yn y de a'r canolbarth—trwy weithredu tariffau uwch, a chael cwsmeriaid i fanteisio i'r eithaf ar eu gallu i chwarae'r farchnad, rhywbeth y mae pobl yng Nghymru wedi bod yn hynod o gyndyn o'i wneud. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yng Nghymru wedi aros gyda Swalec a'r cwmni nwy etifeddol, Centrica, am nad ydynt yn hoffi newid ac am nad ydynt yn credu mewn cyfnewid. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni eu darbwyllo i wneud hynny os gwnaiff hynny helpu i roi terfyn ar y sefyllfa hon lle mae prisiau tanwydd 10 y cant yn uwch yng Nghymru er bod cyflogau'n is.

Meddygyfeydd Teulu

C5 Leanne Wood: Pa drafodaethau mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cael ynghylch

South Wales Central? OAQ(3)1081(FM)

meddygfeydd teulu yng Nghanol De Cymru?
OAQ(3)1081(FM)

The First Minister: I have had no such discussions recently.

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf wedi cael dim trafodaethau o'r fath yn ddiweddar.

Leanne Wood: Some people in my region have to wait three weeks, sometimes more, to see their GP, while others within the region can see their GP on the same day. Do you think that that is acceptable? Can you tell us what the One Wales Government is doing to ensure that everyone in Wales has equal access to GP services?

Leanne Wood: Mae rhai pobl yn fy rhanbarth yn gorfod aros tair wythnos, a mwy weithiau, i weld eu meddyg teulu, tra mae eraill yn yr un rhanbarth yn gallu gweld eu meddyg teulu ar yr un diwrnod. A ydych yn meddwl bod hynny'n dderbyniol? A allwch ddweud wrthym beth y mae Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un yn ei wneud i sicrhau y caiff pawb yng Nghymru fynediad cydradd at wasanaethau meddygon teulu?

The First Minister: The guarantee—which, as far as I am aware, is being kept—is that you can see a member of the primary healthcare team within 24 hours of making the request. That is not quite the same as being able to do so at an hour of your choosing, and you may not always get to see the GP, but instead see the practice nurse—who may be more relevant—or a physiotherapist or another member of the paramedical primary care team. It may be that people want to see a specific GP—perhaps a female or male GP, for obvious reasons, or the GP that they are most used to, for continuity of care for a sick child or whatever—or to see a GP at an hour convenient to them. Negotiations are ongoing between the Minister for Health and Social Services and doctors' representatives to see what can be done to enable people, especially those who work, to have the flexibility to see a GP before the week is out, or whatever, at a time of their choosing that does not interfere with their work obligations.

Y Prif Weinidog: Y warant—sydd, hyd y gwn i, yn cael ei chadw—yw y cewch weld aelod o'r tîm gofal iechyd sylfaenol o fewn 24 awr i wneud y cais. Nid yw hynny'n union gyfystyr â gallu gwneud hynny ar amser o'ch dewis, ac efallai na lwyddwch bob amser i weld y meddyg teulu, ond yn hytrach y gwelwch y nyrs practis—a all fod yn fwy perthnasol—neu ffisiotherapydd neu aelod arall o'r tîm gofal sylfaenol parafeddygol. Efallai fod pobl yn awyddus i weld meddyg penodol—meddyg gwrywaidd neu fenywaidd, hwyrach, am resymau amlwg, neu'r meddyg y maent yn fwyaf cyfarwydd ag ef neu hi, er mwyn dilyniant gofal i blentyn claf neu beth bynnag—neu i weld meddyg ar awr gyfleus iddynt hwy. Mae trafodaethau ar droed rhwng y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a chynrychiolwyr meddygon i weld beth y gellir ei wneud i alluogi pobl, yn enwedig rhai sy'n gweithio, i gael yr hyblygrwydd i weld meddyg teulu cyn pen yr wythnos, neu beth bynnag, ar adeg o'u dewis nad yw'n tarfu ar eu dyletswyddau gwaith.

David Melding: In some Valleys areas, about half of the GP practices need renovation as the capital estate is so poor. Your Government has brought forward a much-welcomed initiative to improve the primary care estate as a matter of priority, but can you respond to recent reports in the *Western Mail* and elsewhere, which are the result of freedom of information requests, that state that this funding is being drawn down very slowly by local health boards at the moment? What will be done to increase

David Melding: Mewn rhai ardaloedd yn y Cymoedd, mae angen adnewyddu tua hanner y meddygfeydd teulu am fod yr ystâd gyfalaf mor wael. Mae eich Llywodraeth wedi cyflwyno cynllun y mae croeso mawr iddo i wella'r ystâd gofal sylfaenol fel mater o flaenoriaeth, ond a allwch ymateb i adroddiadau diweddar yn y *Western Mail* a manau eraill, yn sgil ceisiadau rhyddid gwybodaeth, sy'n datgan mai yn araf iawn y mae byrddau iechyd lleol yn tynnu'r arian hwn i lawr ar hyn o bryd? Beth a wneir i

the take-up of this vital funding stream so that all people have access to outstanding modern buildings where outstanding staff can treat them?

gynyddu faint a ddefnyddir ar y ffrwd arian hanfodol hon fel y gall pawb gael mynediad i adeiladau modern gwych lle cânt eu trin gan staff gwych?

2.40 p.m.

The First Minister: GP premises clearly need to be fit for purpose for the twenty-first century, because the primary care system in the UK—and this is no less the case in Wales—is the great glory of the British healthcare system. What distinguishes the British system from others is that, while elsewhere GPs merely refer you to a consultant almost without thinking about it, in Britain, they use their medical training to try to figure out what is wrong with you first and see whether they can help more directly to give you that extra continuity of care. Ensuring that you can do that, and have the right battery of tests that GPs and others need in primary healthcare premises, is part of the commitment that we made in the National Health Service (General Medical Services—Premises Costs) (Wales) Directions 2004. The directions imply that, in Wales, we must have a strategic approach, not an ad hoc one. Previously, if a GP wanted to improve the premises, it was simply a matter of whether the money was available or not, but now we want a strategic decision on where and how, and how premises can be grouped together so that the battery of tests can be provided for more than one practice, perhaps, on the same health centre site. All of those strategic issues are now supposed to be taken on board.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn amlwg mae angen i adeiladau fod yn addas i ddibenion yr unfed ganrif ar hugain, oherwydd y system ofal sylfaenol yn y Deyrnas Unedig—ac mae hyn yr un mor wir yng Nghymru—yw gogoniant mawr cyfundrefn gofal iechyd Prydain. Yr hyn sy'n gwahaniaethu cyfundrefn Prydain oddi wrth eraill yw, tra mae meddygon teulu mewn mannau eraill yn eich cyfeirio at ymgynghorydd bron heb feddwl, ym Mhrydain defnyddiant eu hyfforddiant meddygol i geisio penderfynu beth sy'n bod arnoch yn gyntaf a gweld a allant helpu'n fwy uniongyrchol i roi mwy o ddilyniant gofal ichi. Mae sicrhau y gellir gwneud hynny, a chael y gyfres iawn o brofion y mae ar feddygon teulu ac eraill eu hangen mewn adeiladau gofal iechyd, yn rhan o'r ymrwymiad a wnaethom yng Nghyfarwyddiadau Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Meddygol Cyffredinol—Costau Adeiladau) (Cymru) 2004. Mae'r cyfarwyddiadau'n ymhlygu ei bod yn rhaid i ni yng Nghymru fynd ati mewn modd strategol, nid ad hoc. Gynt, os byddai ar feddyg teulu eisiau gwella'r adeilad, yr oedd yn fater syml o benderfynu a oedd yr arian ar gael ai peidio, ond yn awr y mae arnom eisiau penderfyniad strategol ynghylch ble a sut, a sut y gellir grwpio adeiladau â'i gilydd fel y gellir darparu'r gyfres o brofion ar gyfer mwy nag un practis, efallai, ar safle'r un ganolfan iechyd. Mae'r holl faterion strategol hynny bellach i fod i gael eu hystyried.

Energy Prices

Q6 William Graham: Will the First Minister make a statement on Welsh Assembly Government policies to address the impact on communities in Wales arising from the increase in energy prices? OAQ(3)1079(FM)

The First Minister: We are reviewing our policies as part of our work on a national energy efficiency and savings plan to ensure

Prisiau Ynni

C6 William Graham: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am bolisiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i roi sylw i effaith y cynnydd mewn prisiau ynni ar gymunedau yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)1079(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym yn adolygu ein polisiau fel rhan o'n gwaith ar gynllun arbedion ac effeithlonrwydd ynni

that we optimise assistance to households affected by fuel poverty. I will not repeat the long answer that I gave to Peter Black a minute ago, but I am also very pleased that Wales will be part of the low carbon buildings programme and the fuel poverty pilot programme.

William Graham: I want to ask you specifically about the problems that are being experienced as a result of increases in the price of gas, which has never been higher. The recent 5 per cent rise has made gas the most expensive that it has ever been. At this time of the year, gas is traditionally cheap, but now it is the most expensive it has ever been. By next year, that will have had an enormous impact on household budgets in Wales. What can you do about this?

The First Minister: We have assisted in the provision of alternative gas supplies. Energy policy is not devolved, but, although it was not universally popular in all parts of Wales—including in villages that I have a close family connection with—there was an area in which to put in a gas pipeline to enable Britain to be connected from Milford Haven, through various counties in Wales, to the main backbone north-south gas terminal, which is at Rugby, I think. That enables gas to be made, in principle. However, when the vessels carrying liquefied gas are half way across the Pacific or the south Atlantic on their way to deliver gas to Milford Haven and are suddenly told that there is a higher price for the gas in China and Japan, they can turn around and go to China or Japan. That is happening at the moment. Therefore, the pipeline does not solve all of the problems, but we now have adequate gas infrastructure to cope with the fact that we are no longer self-sufficient in gas—which we have been for 30 years—because the North sea gas and Morecambe bay gas is running out.

Alun Ffred Jones: Yn dilyn sylwadau Janet Ryder, un o'r ffeithiau syfrdanol a ddaeth i'r amlwg yn ystod ymchwiliad y Pwyllgor Cynaliadwyedd i bris ynni oedd bod hanner y teuluoedd sy'n dioddef o dlodi tanwydd yng Nghymru yn dod o'r gogledd. Y casgliad anochel, felly, yw bod tlodi tanwydd yn fwy

enedlaethol i sicrhau y rhoddwn y cymorth mwyaf i gartrefi sy'n dioddef effaith tlodi tanwydd. Nid ailadroddaf yr ateb hir a roddais i Peter Black funud yn ôl, ond yr wyf yn falch iawn hefyd y bydd Cymru'n rhan o'r rhaglen adeiladau carbon isel a'r rhaglen beilot ar dlodi tanwydd.

William Graham: Mae arnaf eisiau eich holi'n benodol am y problemau a brofir o ganlyniad i godiadau ym mhris nwy, sydd yn uwch nag erioed. Yn sgil y cynnydd 5 y cant diweddar mae nwy'n ddrutach nag y bu erioed. Ar yr adeg hon o'r flwyddyn, mae nwy yn draddodiadol yn rhad, ond yn awr mae'n ddrutach nag y bu erioed. Erbyn y flwyddyn nesaf, bydd hynny wedi cael ardrawiad aruthrol ar gyllidebau cartrefi yng Nghymru. Beth y gallwch ei wneud am hyn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym wedi cynorthwyo gyda darparu cyflenwadau nwy amgen. Nid yw polisi ynni wedi'i ddatganoli, ond, er nad oedd yn boblogaidd gan bawb ym mhob rhan o Gymru—gan gynnwys mewn pentrefi lle mae gennyf gysylltiad teuluol agos—yr oedd ardal lle gellid gosod pibell nwy i alluogi cysylltu Prydain o Aberdaugleddau, drwy amryfal siroedd yng Nghymru, â phrif derfynfa nwy'r asgwrn cefn rhwng de a gogledd, sydd yn Rugby, fe gredaf. Mae hynny'n galluogi gwneud nwy, mewn egwyddor. Fodd bynnag, pan fydd y llongau sy'n cario nwy hylif hanner ffordd ar draws y Môr Tawel neu dde'r Iwerydd ar eu ffordd i gludo nwy i Aberdaugleddau ac y dywedir wrthynt yn sydyn fod pris uwch am y nwy yn Tsieina a Japan, gallant droi ar eu sawdl a mynd i Dsieina neu Japan. Mae hynny'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd. Felly, nid yw'r bibell yn datrys y problemau i gyd, ond bellach mae gennym isadeiledd nwy digonol i ymdopi â'r ffaith nad ydym mwyach yn hunan gynhaliol mewn nwy—fel y buom ers 30 mlynedd—oherwydd bod nwy Môr y Gogledd a nwy bae Morecambe yn rhedeg allan.

Alun Ffred Jones: Following Janet Ryder's comments, one of the startling facts that came to light during the Sustainability Committee's inquiry into energy prices was that half of the families who suffer from fuel poverty in Wales are from north Wales. The inevitable conclusion, therefore, is that fuel

cyffredin mewn ardaloedd gwledig nag ydyw mewn ardaloedd trefol sy'n dioddef o amddifadedd. A wnewch sicrhau bod unrhyw fesurau sy'n cael eu hyrwyddo gan y Llywodraeth i helpu teuluoedd sy'n dioddef fel hyn yn berthnasol i Gymru gyfan? Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r anawsterau, ond rhaid inni gydnabod bod y broblem hon—ac yr wyf yn sôn yn benodol am ardaloedd gwledig, pentrefi, ac yn y blaen—yn effeithio ar bob rhan o Gymru.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae dwy ffactor sy'n gweithio yn erbyn ei gilydd o ran y gymhariaeth rhwng y gogledd a'r de. Fel y dywedais, nid wyf yn credu bod hen ardal Manweb yn dioddef yn yr un modd ag y mae hen ardal Swalec yn dioddef, lle mae costau trydan yn 10 y cant yn uwch na'r cyffredin ym Mhrydain Fawr. Efallai fy mod yn anghywir, ond dyna fel yr wyf ar ddeall. Mae lle yr ydych yn byw hefyd yn ffactor. Os ydych yn byw yn rhy bell oddi wrth y prif gyflenwad nwy, byddech yn dibynnu ar olew. Bob tro mae pris rhyngwladol olew crai yn cynyddu, caiff ei adlewyrchu 100 y cant ym mhris olew i danio'ch bwyler cartref. Byddai'n effeithio 50 y cant ar bris trydan a nwy, dyweder, ond 100 y cant ar bris olew ar gyfer bwyler, felly os oes mwy o gartrefi yn y gogledd nag yn y de yn dibynnu ar olew oherwydd eu bod yn rhy bell o'r prif gyflenwad nwy, byddech yn disgwyl yr hyn yr ydych wedi ei ddisgrifio. Felly, mae'n ffactor bwysig.

Adolygiadau Iechyd

Q7 Paul Davies: Will the First Minister make a statement on the progress of health reviews in Wales? OAQ(3)1073(FM)

The First Minister: The majority of health reviews initiated by Edwina Hart, the Minister for Health and Social Services, have now been completed, and she has made statements to Plenary on all of those completed reviews. On 3 June, she made a statement on Alan Axford's review of services for Ceredigion and Professor Michael Williams's review of mental health services across Wales.

poverty is more common in rural areas than in urban areas that suffer from deprivation. Will you ensure that any measures that are promoted by the Government to help families who suffer in this way are relevant to the whole of Wales? I am aware of the difficulties, but we must acknowledge that this problem—and I am talking specifically about rural areas, villages, and so on—affects the whole of Wales.

The First Minister: Two factors work against each other in the comparison between north and south Wales. As I said, I do not believe that the former Manweb area suffers in the same way as the former Swalec area, where electricity costs are 10 per cent higher than the average in Great Britain. Perhaps I am wrong, but that is my understanding. Where you live is also a factor. If you live too far from the main gas supply, you would depend on oil. Every time the international price of crude oil increases, it is reflected 100 per cent in the price of oil to fire up your boiler at home. It would affect the price of electricity and gas 50 per cent, say, but the price of oil for a boiler 100 per cent, and so if there are more homes in north Wales than in south Wales that are dependent on oil because they are too far from the main gas supply, you would expect that which you have described. Therefore, it is an important factor.

Health Reviews

C7 Paul Davies: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am gynnydd adolygiadau iechyd yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)1073(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r rhan fwyaf o adolygiadau iechyd a ddechreuwyd gan Edwina Hart, y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, wedi cael eu cwblhau erbyn hyn, ac mae hi wedi cyflwyno datganiadau gerbron y Cyfarfod Llawn ar yr holl adolygiadau hynny a gwblhawyd. Ar 3 Mehefin, rhoddodd ddatganiad am adolygiad Alan Axford o wasanaethau ar gyfer Ceredigion ac adolygiad yr Athro Michael Williams o wasanaethau iechyd meddwl ledled Cymru.

Paul Davies: Fel y byddai'r Prif Weinidog yn gwybod, mae cynghorau iechyd cymuned yn chwarae ran bwysig yn ein cymunedau o ran cynrychioli pobl â phroblemau iechyd. Mae'r cynghorau hefyd yn chwarae rhan allweddol o ran codi ymwybyddiaeth iechyd yn ein hardaloedd. Yn sgîl y ffaith bod rhai ymddiriedolaethau wedi diflannu, mae rôl y cynghorau iechyd cymuned wedi dod hyd yn oed yn bwysicach. Er enghraifft, byddai gwaredu Cyngor Iechyd Cymuned Sir Benfro yn gam anghyfrifol, yn fy marn i. O dan yr amgylchiadau, a wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddweud wrthym a yw ef a'i Lywodraeth o blaid uno cynghorau iechyd cymuned ar yr un lefel ag ymddiriedolaethau?

Y Prif Weinidog: Penderfynwyd tua saith mlynedd yn ôl i gadw'r cynghorau iechyd cymuned yng Nghymru pan gafwyd gwared arnynt yn Lloegr, oherwydd y rhesymau yr ydych newydd eu disgrifio, sef mai llais y cleifion ydynt. Nid ydym wedi gwneud penderfyniad ynglŷn â chanlyniadau i'r cynghorau iechyd cymuned yn sgîl unrhyw gasgliadau gan Edwina Hart a'r Cabinet cyfan o ran strwythur y gwasanaeth iechyd. Nid ydym wedi trafod y mater hwnnw hyd yn hyn.

Kirsty Williams: First Minister, earlier today I joined protesters outside a special meeting of the board of Powys County Council, which was discussing the issue of Crossfield House. It is the only Royal British Legion home in Wales that provides residential, nursing and vital elderly mentally ill beds, as well as being the largest employer in the town. The Royal British Legion in London is threatening to close that home unless there is a significant increase in the fees paid to it by Powys County Council. To date, it has ignored all of the overtures from Powys County Council to establish a joint working relationship with it, and it has only given the local community a 30-day consultation period to respond to its plans. The Royal British Legion is holding its trustees' meeting only three days after the close of that consultation, which makes you wonder whether or not there is any point in having a consultation at all. Do you agree that it is unthinkable that the Royal British Legion in London would turn its back not only on Rhayader but also on Wales, given

Paul Davies: As the First Minister will know, community health councils play an important role in our communities in representing people who have health problems. The councils also play a crucial role in raising awareness of health issues in our areas. Given that some trusts have disappeared, the role of the community health councils has become even more important. For instance, getting rid of Pembrokeshire Community Health Council would be an irresponsible step, in my opinion. In the circumstances, will the First Minister tell us whether he and his Government are in favour of merging community health councils at the same level as the trusts?

The First Minister: A decision was taken about seven years ago to retain community health councils in Wales when they were abolished in England, for the reasons you have just described: they give patients a voice. We have not made a decision on the consequences for community health councils that will follow any conclusions made by Edwina Hart and the Cabinet as a whole about the structure of the health service. We have not discussed that issue as yet.

Kirsty Williams: Brif Weinidog, yn gynharach heddiw ymunais â phrotestwyr y tu allan i gyfarfod arbennig bwrdd Cyngor Sir Powys a oedd yn trafod Tŷ Crossfield. Dyma unig gartref y Llang Frenhinol Brydeinig yng Nghymru sy'n darparu gwelyau preswyl, nyrsio a salwch meddwl henoed hanfodol, ac mae hynny ar ben bod yn gyflogwr mwyaf y dref. Mae'r Llang Frenhinol Brydeinig yn Llundain yn bygwth cau'r cartref hwnnw oni bai fod cynnydd sylweddol yn y ffioedd a delir iddo gan Gyngor Sir Powys. Hyd yn hyn, mae wedi anwybyddu'r holl gynigion gan Gyngor Sir Powys i sefydlu perthynas weithio ar y cyd â hi, a dim ond cyfnod ymgynghori 30 diwrnod o hyd a roddodd i'r gymuned leol i ymateb i'w chynlluniau. Mae'r Llang Frenhinol Brydeinig yn cynnal ei chyfarfod ymddiriedolwyr gwta dri diwrnod ar ôl i'r ymgynghoriad hwnnw ddod i ben, sy'n gwneud ichi bendroni a oes diben cael ymgynghoriad o gwbl. A ydych yn cytuno ei bod y tu hwnt i amgyffred y byddai'r Llang Frenhinol Brydeinig yn Llundain yn troi ei

the contribution that this country has made to the armed services over the centuries? Will you join me in making the strongest possible representations to the Royal British Legion in London on the fact that its behaviour is not acceptable, and that it needs to think again before it closes this home? If it is determined to turn its back on Wales in this way, will you do what you can to support that community and Powys County Council in ensuring that that care home is kept open in Rhayader?

The First Minister: I am happy to support everything that you have said, because you have made a powerful set of points about why that home should be kept open. However, I am not sure that we are in a position to arbitrate between the Royal British Legion and Powys County Council on fee levels, because that is a matter between those two parties. However, if you put the case in the way that you have just done, including any additional points that you did not have time to include here, I am sure that we would want to support you and other campaigners to keep the home open and in making that appeal to the Royal British Legion headquarters in London.

Codi Proffil Cymru Dramor

C8 Bethan Jenkins: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am waith Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o ran codi proffil Cymru dramor? OAQ(3)1093(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Rhoddaf yr enghreifftiau mwyaf perthnasol yn y cyfnod presennol. Yr oedd yn bleser i mi a Rhodri Glyn, fel y Gweinidog Treftadaeth, gyhoeddi mai Cymru yw'r wlad a ddewiswyd i fod yn brif wlad yn yr ŵyl Interceltique, sef yr ŵyl gerddoriaeth Geltaidd a gynhelir yn wythnos gyntaf mis Awst, yr un wythnos â'r eisteddfod genedlaethol, yn Llydaw. Yn 2009, efallai mai'r peth mwyaf arwyddocaol yw'r ffaith mai Cymru, unwaith eto, yw'r wlad sy'n cael ei hystyried yn brif wlad yn yr ŵyl Smithsonian, sef gŵyl werin a gynhelir yn yr Unol Daleithiau, yn y National Mall yn Washington.

chefn nid yn unig ar Rhaeadr Gwy ond hefyd ar Gymru, ac ystyried y cyfraniad y mae'r wlad hon wedi'i wneud i'r lluoedd arfog dros y canrifoedd? A wnewch ymuno â mi i roi'r sylwadau cryfaf posibl i'r Llang Frenhinol Brydeinig yn Llundain ar y ffaith nad yw ei hymddygiad yn dderbyniol, a bod angen iddi ailfeddwl cyn cau'r cartref hwn? Os yw'n benderfynol ei bod am droi ei chefn ar Gymru yn y modd hwn, a wnewch yr hyn y gallwch ei wneud i gefnogi'r gymuned honno a Chyngor Sir Powys i sicrhau bod y cartref gofal hwnnw'n aros ar agor yn Rhaeadr Gwy?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn fodlon cefnogi popeth yr ydych wedi'i ddweud, oherwydd eich bod wedi cyflwyno cyfres gref o bwyntiau ynghylch pam y dylid cadw'r cartref ar agor. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn siŵr a ydym mewn sefyllfa i gyflafareddu rhwng y Llang Frenhinol Brydeinig a Chyngor Sir Powys ar lefelau ffioedd, oherwydd ei fod yn fater rhwng y naill barti a'r llall. Fodd bynnag, os cyflwynwch yr achos yn y modd yr ydych newydd ei wneud, gan gynnwys unrhyw bwyntiau ychwanegol na chawsoch amser i'w cynnwys yma, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddem eisiau eich cefnogi chi ac ymgyrchwyr eraill i gadw'r cartref yn agored ac apelio i bencadlys y Llang Frenhinol Brydeinig yn Llundain

Raising the Profile of Wales Abroad

Q8 Bethan Jenkins: Will the First Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's work in raising the profile of Wales abroad? OAQ(3)1093(FM)

The First Minister: I will give the most relevant examples from the current period. It was a pleasure for me and Rhodri Glyn, as the Minister for Heritage, to announce that Wales is the country chosen to be a featured country at the Interceltique festival, which is the Celtic music festival held in Brittany during the first week of August, the same week as the National Eisteddfod. In 2009, perhaps the most significant thing is the fact that Wales, once again, is the country being considered as a featured country in the Smithsonian festival, a folk festival held in the United States, at the National Mall in Washington.

2.50 p.m.

Bethan Jenkins: Diolch am y llu o enghreifftiau hynny. I godi pwynt arall, mae cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un' yn cynnwys ymrwymiad i hybu aelodaeth Cymru ar gyrff rhyngwladol. A gytunwch, felly, o fewn cyddestun Cymru ddatganoledig, ac o ystyried y ffaith bod Cymru yn awr yn edrych ymlaen fel cenedl, y dylai'r Llywodraeth ymgeisio am statws sylwedydd ar Gynulliad Cyffredinol y Cenhedloedd Unedig er mwyn ceisio hybu ymrwymiad Cymru fel rhan o brosesau rhyngwladol ac er mwyn i ni hybu ein gwaith ar lefel economaidd a diwylliannol yn rhyngwladol?

Y Prif Weinidog: A oes cynsail i wneud y fath beth? Nid wyf yn siŵr. Yr ydym wedi bod yn ymladd—ac yn llwyddo o bryd i'w gilydd—i gael statws o'r fath y tu fewn i Gyngor y Gweinidogion yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Mae hynny wedi mynd yn ei flaen yn eithaf sylweddol yn ystod y naw mlynedd diwethaf gydag eithaf tipyn o gefnogaeth gan Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig—llawer mwy na'r gefnogaeth y mae Llywodraeth Ffrainc yn ei rhoi, er enghraifft. Yn ddiweddar, mae Llywodraeth Sbaen wedi ymateb yn yr un ffordd tuag at Gatalwnia a Gwlad y Basg. Nid wyf yn siŵr bod cynsail i'r fath beth, ond gwnaf ymholiadau i weld a oes cynsail o ran statws 'sylwedydd' o fewn y Cenhedloedd Unedig.

Alun Cairns: Do you agree that international sporting events offer a fantastic opportunity to market and sell Wales abroad, particularly when Wales is involved in such events? The England and Wales cricket team will be involved in the Ashes, which will provide a great opportunity to market Cardiff and Wales across a five-day event. Although, its name is the England cricket team, it is in fact the England and Wales cricket team. Will you put your full support behind the England cricket team? When I raised this with Rhodri Glyn Thomas, your Minister for Heritage, last week, I began to question whether he was fully committed to supporting that team simply because it is called the England team. Do you agree that unless Ministers of the Crown, such as you and Rhodri Glyn Thomas, give the England cricket team your

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you for that range of examples. To raise another point, the 'One Wales' agreement includes a commitment to promote Wales's membership of international bodies. Do you agree, therefore, within the context of a devolved Wales, and given the fact that Wales is now looking forward as a nation, that the Government should apply for an observer status in the General Assembly of the United Nations in order to promote Wales's commitment as part of international processes and in order for us to promote our work at an economic and cultural level internationally?

The First Minister: Is there any precedent for doing such a thing? I am not sure. We have been fighting—and occasionally succeeding—for that kind of status within the Council of Ministers in the European Union. That has progressed quite significantly during the past nine years with quite a lot of support from the UK Government—much more than the support given by the French Government, for example. Recently, the Spanish Government has taken the same attitude toward Catalonia and the Basque Country. I am not sure that there is a precedent for doing such a thing, but I will make inquiries as to whether there is a precedent with regard to an 'observer' status within the United Nations.

Alun Cairns: A ydych yn cytuno bod digwyddiadau chwaraeon rhyngwladol yn cynnig cyfle gwych i farchnata a gwerthu Cymru dramor, yn enwedig pan fydd Cymru'n ymwneud â digwyddiadau o'r fath? Bydd tîm criced Cymru a Lloegr yn ymwneud â Chyffres y Lludw, a fydd yn rhoi cyfle gwych i farchnata Caerdydd a Chymru dros ddigwyddiad pum niwrnod o hyd. Er mai tîm criced Lloegr yw ei enw, tîm criced Cymru a Lloegr ydyw mewn gwirionedd. A wnewch gefnogi tîm criced Lloegr yn llwyr? Pan godais hyn gyda Rhodri Glyn Thomas, eich Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth, yr wythnos diwethaf, dechreuais gwestiynu a oedd wedi ymrwymo'n llwyr i gefnogi'r tîm hwnnw oherwydd mai tîm criced Lloegr yw ei enw. A ydych yn cytuno oni bai fod Gweinidogion y Goron, megis chi a Rhodri Glyn Thomas,

full support, it could overshadow a fantastic occasion and a great opportunity to market Wales not only to Australia, but also to the rest of the cricketing world?

The First Minister: I agree strongly with the last part of your remark, but you should not look for trouble where none exists. I seem to remember that when I was a kid England used to play under the banner of the Marylebone Cricket Club. Cricket is full of such anomalies. It was not even called the England team, but the MCC. It then became the England team, even though that means the United Kingdom team, and that does not just mean that its members are only players from England and Wales as a few Scottish players and at least one Northern Ireland player have played for England. I take the same view as Robert Croft. He is a passionate Welsh patriot who regarded playing for Glamorgan County Cricket Club and winning his county cap as the equivalent of playing for Wales in rugby or football and playing for England to be the equivalent of being selected for the British Lions. The name may be different, but the idea is exactly the same.

Lesley Griffiths: One way of raising Wales's profile abroad is for it to host a major sporting event, which would create an immense amount of global exposure. Do you share my optimism at remarks, seemingly attributed to the Scottish First Minister at the weekend, that there is now a possibility of there being political will for Wales and Scotland to submit a joint bid to co-host the UEFA European Football Championship in 2016? Will you take the opportunity to meet with Alex Salmond as soon as possible to work together on this project providing, of course, that the Scottish and Welsh football associations wish to submit a joint bid to UEFA?

The First Minister: Yes. It would not be the first joint bid because the European championship is being played in two countries this year; nor would it be the first World Cup joint bid because Japan and South Korea did the same. I understand that there is a change of view in Scotland and that a joint bid with Wales might be a possibility.

yn cefnogi tîm criced Lloegr yn llawn, y gallai fwrw cysgod dros achlysur ffantastig a chyfle gwych i farchnata Cymru nid i Awstralia yn unig, ond gweddill y byd criced hefyd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn cytuno'n gryf â rhan olaf eich sylw, ond ni ddylech fynd i chwilio am helynt pan nad oes helynt ar gael. Yr wyf yn cofio pan oeddwn yn blentyn yr arferai Lloegr chwarae dan faner Clwb Criced Marylebone. Mae criced yn llawn anghysonderau o'r fath. Nid oedd hyd yn oed yn cael ei alw yn dîm criced Lloegr, ond yr MCC. Cafodd ei alw yn dîm criced Lloegr wedyn, er bod hynny'n golygu tîm y Deyrnas Unedig, ac nid yw hynny'n golygu mai chwaraewyr o Gymru a Lloegr yn unig yw ei aelodau gan fod rhai ohonynt yn chwaraewyr o'r Alban ac mae o leiaf un chwaraewr o Ogledd Iwerddon wedi chwarae i Loegr. Yr wyf o'r un farn â Robert Croft. Mae'n Gymro i'r carn a oedd yn ystyried bod chwarae i Glwb Criced Sir Morgannwg ac ennill ei gap dros ei sir yr un fath â chwarae rygbi neu bêl-droed dros Gymru a bod chwarae i Loegr yr un fath â chael ei ddewis ar gyfer Llewod Prydain. Efallai fod yr enw'n wahanol ond mae'r syniad union yr un fath.

Lesley Griffiths: Un ffordd o godi proffil Cymru dramor yw cynnal digwyddiad chwaraeon mawr, a fyddai'n creu llawer o sylw ym mhedwar ban byd. A ydych yn rhannu fy optimistiaeth ynghylch sylwadau, a briodolwyd i bob golwg i Brif Weinidog yr Alban dros y penwythnos, ei bod nawr yn bosibl bod ewyllys gwleidyddol i Gymru a'r Alban gyflwyno cais ar y cyd i gynnal Pencampwriaeth Pêl-droed Ewropeaidd UEFA yn 2016? A wnewch achub ar y cyfle i gwrdd ag Alex Salmond cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl i gydweithio ar y prosiect hwn ar yr amod, wrth gwrs, bod cymdeithasau pêl-droed Cymru a'r Alban yn dymuno cyflwyno cais ar y cyd i UEFA?

Y Prif Weinidog: Gwnaf. Nid dyma fyddai'r cais cyntaf ar y cyd oherwydd mae'r bencampwriaeth Ewropeaidd yn cael ei chwarae mewn dwy wlad eleni; ni fyddai'n gynnig ar y cyd cyntaf i Gwpan y Byd ychwaith oherwydd i Japan a De Corea wneud yr un peth. Caf ar ddeall bod newid barn yn yr Alban ac y gallai cais ar y cyd â

Clearly, that has to start with the Scottish Football Association and the Football Association of Wales agreeing that it is a good idea. They then need to approach both Governments to ask what the strategic and financial implications of working jointly on such a bid, and put the bid together.

UK Media

Q9 Alun Davies: Will the First Minister make representations to major media groups on how news from Wales is covered in the UK media? OAQ(3)1097(FM)

The First Minister: In making representations on this matter, I will wish to draw attention to the ongoing difficulty that many UK media organisations have in distinguishing between England, Great Britain and the United Kingdom. The announcement last week about free swimming for older people and young people during school holidays in England is an exact case in point. It is an issue for us, more so than for Scotland, because one way or another, media organisations pay at least lip service to covering Scottish issues, but they do not even pay lip service as regards Wales.

Alun Davies: In many ways, the broadcast media is regulated and we are able to make representations to it. However, the print media is largely unregulated, and we know that the vast majority of people in Wales receive newspapers that are produced and edited outside Wales. Coverage of Wales in the print media is pitiful. Would you and your Government be prepared to make representations to all the major media groups and print media owners in the United Kingdom, to ask them to increase their coverage of Wales, and the quality of their coverage of Wales?

The First Minister: Yes, I will ring Rupert Murdoch tonight and upbraid him. [*Laughter.*] Seriously, the important thing is that we recognise our limitations in persuading big media organisations that they must do this or that; it is more a matter of persuasion, of trying to say that there are important things going on in Wales, such as

Chymru fod yn bosibl. Yn amlwg, rhaid i hynny ddechrau gyda Chymdeithas Pêl-droed yr Alban a Chymdeithas Pêl-droed Cymru yn cytuno bod hwn yn syniad da. Wedyn mae angen iddynt fynd at y ddwy Lywodraeth i holi ynghylch goblygiadau strategol ac ariannol cydweithio ar gais o'r fath, a rhoi'r cais at ei gilydd.

Cyfryngau'r DU

C9 Alun Davies: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog roi sylwadau i grwpiau cyfryngau mawr ynghylch y sylw a gaiff newyddion o Gymru yng nghyfryngau'r DU? OAQ(3)1097(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Wrth wneud sylwadau ar y mater hwn, hoffwn dynnu sylw at anhawster parhaus a gaiff nifer o sefydliadau cyfryngau yn y DU o ran gwahaniaethu rhwng Lloegr, Prydain Fawr a'r Deyrnas Unedig. Mae'r cyhoeddiad yr wythnos diwethaf am nofio am ddim i bobl hŷn ac i bobl ifanc yn ystod gwyliau'r ysgol yn Lloegr yn enghraifft berffaith o hynny. Mae'n fwy o fater i ni nag i'r Alban oherwydd mewn un ffordd neu llall, mae sefydliadau cyfryngau o leiaf yn talu gwasanaeth gwefusau i roi sylw i faterion yn yr Alban, ond nid ydynt hyd yn oed yn gwneud hynny yng nghyswllt Cymru.

Alun Davies: Mewn nifer o ffyrdd, caiff y cyfryngau darlledu eu rheoleiddio a gallwn gyflwyno sylwadau iddynt. Fodd bynnag, i raddau helaeth ni chaiff y cyfryngau argraffu eu rheoleiddio, a gwyddom fod y rhan fwyaf o bobl yng Nghymru yn cael papurau newydd sy'n cael eu cynhyrchu a'u golygu y tu allan i Gymru. Mae'r sylw a gaiff Cymru yn y cyfryngau argraffu yn druenus. A fyddech chi a'ch Llywodraeth yn fodlon rhoi sylwadau i'r holl brif grwpiau cyfryngau a pherchnogion cyfryngau argraffu yn y Deyrnas Unedig, i ofyn iddynt gynyddu faint o sylw a roddant i Gymru ac ansawdd y sylw a roddant i Gymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Gwnaf, rhoddaf ganiad i Rupert Murdoch heno a'i geryddu. [*Chwerthin.*] O ddifrif, yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw ein bod yn cydnabod ein cyfyngiadau o ran darbwyllo sefydliadau cyfryngau mawr bod yn rhaid iddynt wneud hyn neu fod yn rhaid iddynt wneud y llall; mae'n ymwneud yn fwy â dwyn perswâd, ceisio dweud bod

the foundation phase, which is the biggest and most important initiative in British education for the last one hundred years. They should be covering that; specialist educational publications will cover it, but other than that, it is not widely understood by the media. The media does not yet understand how devolution works, and that is sad. Whether we can persuade the media to go back to the days of having correspondents in Wales, I do not know. They are usually hunched over a screen, but they do not bother to tap the key to find out what is happening in Wales. That is the problem—they retain a London-centric bias.

Paul Davies: Mae'n hollbwysig bod y cyfryngau'n adrodd digwyddiadau yma yng Nghymru yn llawn ac yn gywir. Yr oedd yn ddi-ddorol iawn nodi yn ystod etholiadau'r Cynulliad y llynedd i'r cyfryngau Prydeinig adrodd fawr ddim am y digwyddiadau yma. Yr oedd hynny hefyd yn wir wedi'r etholiadau. Yr oedd llawer o drafod rhwng y pleidiau ynglŷn â ffurfio Llywodraeth, ond nid oedd fawr ddim o adroddiadau am hynny yn y cyfryngau Prydeinig.

Yr wyf yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor Darlledu, ac yr ydym wrthi'n cymryd tystiolaeth ddi-ddorol oddi wrth wahanol grwpiau ac unigolion ynglŷn â dyfodol darlledu cyhoeddus. Beth yw barn y Prif Weinidog am ddyfodol darlledu cyhoeddus yng Nghymru? A yw'n credu ei bod yn hanfodol parhau â lluosogrydd mewn darpariaeth newyddion yn y dyfodol?

Y Prif Weinidog: Y broblem yw diffinio 'darlledu cyhoeddus', yn enwedig o ran ITV a fyddai, fel sianel, wrth ei bodd yn peidio â chael ei hystyried yn ddarlledwr cyhoeddus a chanddi gyfrifoldebau i gynhyrchu 8, 9 neu 10 awr o raglenni lleol sydd wedi'u cynhyrchu yng Nghymru, ar ran pobl Cymru—rhaglenni sydd wedi'u cynhyrchu gyda'r ddealltwriaeth sydd ar flaenau bysedd rhywun lleol o ran yr hyn sy'n bwysig yn y wlad neu'r rhanbarth honno. Credaf fod ITV ar ei cholled o esgeuluso'r cyfrifoldebau hynny. Byddai rheolwyr y sianel yn ystyried bod y cwmni dan bwysau mawr i fod yn fwy masnachol, a byddent wrth ei bodd yn cael gwared ar y cyfrifoldebau sydd gan y cwmni

pethau pwysig yn digwydd yng Nghymru, megis y cyfnod sylfaen, sef y fenter fwyaf a phwysicaf mewn addysg ym Mhrydain dros y can mlynedd diwethaf. Dylent fod yn rhoi sylw i hynny; bydd cyhoeddiadau addysgol arbenigol yn rhoi sylw iddo, ond ac eithrio hynny, nid yw'r cyfryngau'n ei ddeall yn eang. Nid yw'r cyfryngau eto'n deall sut y mae datganoli'n gweithio, ac mae hynny'n drist. A allwn ddarbwylllo'r cyfryngau i fynd yn ôl i'r dyddiau o gael gohebwr yng Nghymru, ni wn. Fel rheol maent yn pwysu dros sgrin, ond nid ydynt yn trafferthu pwysu'r fysell i weld beth sy'n digwydd yng Nghymru. Dyna yw'r broblem—maent yn tueddu i ganolbwyntio ar Lundain.

Paul Davies: It is vital that the media reports events here in Wales fully and accurately. It was interesting to note during the Assembly elections last year that the British media hardly reported any of the events here. That was also true following the elections. There were many discussions between the political parties about forming a Government, but there was hardly any coverage of it in the British media.

I am a member of the Broadcasting Committee, and we are taking interesting evidence from various groups and individuals about the future of public broadcasting. What is the opinion of the First Minister on the future of public broadcasting in Wales? Does he believe that it is crucial to continue with plurality in news provision in the future?

The First Minister: The problem is in defining 'public broadcasting', especially with regard to ITV, which would, as a channel, be more than happy if it was not considered to be a public broadcaster with a responsibility to produce 8, 9 or 10 hours of local programmes produced in Wales, for the people of Wales—programmes produced with the knowledge that is at the fingertips of a local person with regard to what is important in that country or region. I believe that ITV is losing out in not fulfilling those responsibilities. Its controllers would consider that the company is under great pressure to be more commercial, and they would be more than happy to dispose of the

fel y mae'r Ddeddf wedi'i geirio yn awr.

company's responsibilities under the Act's current wording.

Mae Ofcom wrthi'n cynnal ymgynghoriad, ac mae'n bwysig ein bod i gyd yn ceisio dylanwadu ar Ofcom i gadw'r dyletswyddau ar ITV.

Ofcom is now undertaking a consultation, and it is important that we all attempt to influence Ofcom to ensure that ITV retains those duties.

Eleanor Burnham: A ydych yn rhannu ein siom ni yng Nghymru? Beth allwch chi ei wneud i roi mwy o bwysau ar y BBC, er enghraifft? Yn fy marn i, a barn llawer o bobl eraill, mae gan BBC Cymru fonopoli, mwy neu lai, yng Nghymru, ac mae'n siom mawr bod David Dimbleby yn cael anghofio am Gymru, gan ddweud bod neb yn deall. Wrth gwrs, ni fydd pobl yn deall materion Cymru os na chawn y cyfle i grybwyll yr hyn sy'n digwydd yma. Dylech gymharu hynny â brwydr Boris Johnson a Ken Livingstone am faeryddiaeth Llundain—rhoddwyd rhaglen o awr iddynt wneud eu hachos. Gobeithio y gallwch roi pwysau ar y BBC o ran y mater pwysig hwn.

Eleanor Burnham: Do you share our disappointment in Wales? What can you do to put more pressure on the BBC, for instance? In my opinion, and the opinion of many other people, BBC Wales has what is almost a monopoly in Wales, and it is hugely disappointing that David Dimbleby was allowed to discount Wales, saying that no-one understood. Of course, no-one will understand Welsh issues if we are not given the opportunity to mention what is happening here. Compare that with Boris Johnson and Ken Livingstone's battle to be mayor of London—they were given an hour's programme to make their case. I hope you can ensure that you place pressure on the BBC on that important matter.

3.00 p.m.

Y Prif Weinidog: Dyna ddwy enghraifft diddorol dros ben, ac un enghraifft berffaith o'r broblem yw'r hyn a ddywedodd David Dimbleby bythefnos yn ôl, hyd y deallaf. Pan heriwyd ef o'r gynulleidfa yn ystod y *Question Time* diwethaf o Gaerdydd, dywedodd rywbeth i'r perwyl, 'We do not want to get onto the Welsh Assembly because people outside Wales will not understand it'. Ni welais y rhaglen ei hun; yr oeddwn yn gwneud rhywbeth llawer mwy diddorol.

The First Minister: Those were two very interesting examples, and what David Dimbleby said a fortnight ago, as I understand it, is a perfect example of the problem. When he was challenged from the audience during the last *Question Time* from Cardiff, he said something along the lines of, 'We do not want to get onto the Welsh Assembly because people outside Wales will not understand it'. I did not see the programme itself; I was doing something far more interesting.

Rhoesoch enghraifft berffaith arall o ran Llundain. Mae ei phoblogaeth ddwywaith a hanner maint ein poblogaeth ni, ond, o gymharu'r ohebiaeth a gafodd y frwydr rhwng Ken Livingstone a Boris Johnson dros dair wythnos yr ymgyrch, a'r ohebiaeth a gafodd ein hetholiadau ni y llynedd, gallech gredu bod poblogaeth Llundain 100 waith maint poblogaeth Cymru.

You gave another perfect illustration with London. Its population is two and a half times the size of ours, but, if you compared the coverage that was given to the battle between Ken Livingstone and Boris Johnson over that three-week campaign with what was given to our elections last year, you would be forgiven for thinking that the population of London was 100 times that of Wales.

The Commercialisation of Knowledge

Masnacheiddio Gwybodaeth

Q10 David Melding: Will the First Minister make a statement on measures in place to

C10 David Melding: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am y camau sydd ar

promote the commercialisation of knowledge in Wales? OAQ(3)1090(FM)

waith i hyrwyddo masnacheiddio gwybodaeth yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)1090(FM)

The First Minister: As you will have seen through references this week to ShakerScope and Tiny Lab, and other products and companies that have spun out from the health service or universities in Wales, we continue actively to support initiatives that encourage knowledge commercialisation. There is the Academic 4 Business, or A4B, programme, there are research and development grants such as those awarded by SMARTCymru, and there was recent support on a larger scale for Swansea's Institute of Life Sciences and the technium network generally.

Y Prif Weinidog: Fel y byddwch wedi gweld drwy gyfeiriadau yr wythnos hon at ShakerScope a Tiny Lab, a chynhyrchion a chwmnïau eraill sydd wedi deillio o'r gwasanaeth iechyd neu brifysgolion yng Nghymru, yr ydym yn dal i gefnogi cynlluniau sy'n annog masnacheiddio gwybodaeth yn ddiwyd. Mae gennym raglen Academic 4 Business, neu A4B, mae grantiau ymchwil a datblygu megis y rhai a ddyfernir gan SMARTCymru, a bu cymorth ar raddfa fwy yn ddiweddar i Athrofa Gwyddorau Bywyd Abertawe a'r rhwydwaith canolfannau technium yn gyffredinol.

David Melding: While I commend all those particular examples of good practice, I wonder whether you agree with Professor Brian Morgan's recent call for a step change in the links between higher education and businesspeople, particularly those with extensive experience in promoting enterprise. That was also one of the key recommendations of the Gibson review, in developing advisory panels between internationally experienced businesspeople and the higher education sector in Wales. What advance has been made on that excellent suggestion?

David Melding: Er fy mod yn cymeradwyo'r holl enghreifftiau neilltuol hynny o ymarfer da, tybed a fydddech yn cytuno â galwad yr Athro Brian Morgan yn ddiweddar am newid sylweddol yn y cysylltiadau rhwng addysg uwch a phobl fusnes, yn enwedig y rhai sydd â phrofiad helaeth yn hyrwyddo menter. Yr oedd hynny hefyd yn un o argymhellion allweddol adolygiad Gibson, wrth ddatblygu panelau chynghori rhwng pobl fusnes sy'n brofiadol yn rhyngwladol a'r sector addysg uwch yng Nghymru. Pa gynnydd sydd wedi cael ei wneud o ran yr awgrym rhagorol hwnnw?

The First Minister: Reports always call for step changes; it is almost a ritual, and you could almost write that in before you have commissioned the report. Going back to the Gibson report, he had some strong words, deriving from his own experiences of running an exceptionally successful venture capital fund. If I remember what he said last week rightly, he started out with £25,000 and now has a realisation value of \$10.8 billion—and I think that that was in dollars, but it is in the billions, in any case—and that was amassed over less than a 10-year period. That is remarkable. On the other hand, he also says that many more people should be doing what he and Wesley Clover are doing, and that universities and health authorities, which have much of the expertise as we can see with Tiny Lab, should be encouraging those staff who have commercially capable ideas to

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae adroddiadau bob amser yn galw am newidiadau sylweddol; mae bron iawn yn ddefod, a bron iawn y gallech ysgrifennu hynny cyn ichi gomisiynu'r adroddiad. A mynd yn ôl at adroddiad Gibson, yr oedd ganddo eiriau cryf, yn deillio o'i brofiadau ef yn rhedeg cronfa cyfalaf menter eithriadol o lwyddiannus. Os cofiaf yr hyn a ddywedodd yr wythnos diwethaf yn iawn, dechreuodd gyda £25,000 ac erbyn hyn mae ganddo werth sylweddoli o \$10.8 biliwn—a chredaf mai mewn doleri yr oedd hynny, ond mae yn y biliynau, beth bynnag—a chafodd y swm hwnnw ei gronni dros gyfnod llai na 10 mlynedd. Mae hynny'n rhyfeddol. Ar y llaw arall, dywed y dylai llawer rhagor o bobl fod yn gwneud yr hyn y mae ef a Wesley Clover yn ei wneud, ac y dylai prifysgolion ac awdurdodau iechyd, sydd â llawer o'r

get involved in venture capital, to see whether they can commercialise them in that way.

arbenigedd fel y gallwn ei weld gyda Tiny Lab, fod yn annog yr aelodau staff hynny sydd â syniadau y gellid manteisio arnynt yn fasnachol i gamu i faes cyfalaf menter, i weld a allant eu masnacheiddio yn y ffordd honno.

Nerys Evans: Un o'r ffyrdd amlycaf o chwilio am wybodaeth yw drwy'r we, ond mae diffyg enfawr yn y gwasanaeth band eang mewn sawl ardal o hyd. Mae'r grŵp trawsbleidiol wedi cwrdd â chi a'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ar sawl achlysur i drafod y mater hwn. A allwch roi'r diweddaraf i ni ynghylch yr hyn y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i sicrhau bod band eang ar gael ar draws Cymru?

Nerys Evans: One of the most obvious ways of searching for information is on the web, but there is still a huge deficit in the broadband service available in many areas. The cross-party group has met you and the Deputy First Minister on several occasions to discuss this matter. Could you give us an update on what the Government is doing to ensure that broadband is available throughout Wales?

Y Prif Weinidog: Byddai'n well gennyf ysgrifennu atoch neu ofyn i'r Gweinidog perthnasol wneud—ac mae mwy nag un, gan fod y mater yn pontio cyfrifoldebau gwahanol; fe benderfynwn rhyngom pa un ohonom yw'r mwyaf perthnasol i ateb—yn amlinellu'r hyn sydd wedi digwydd i geisio datrys y problemau sydd, yn enwedig yn y canolbarth a Maldwyn, o ran cael band eang o'r radd flaenaf, fel y gall pobl ddechrau, cynnal neu barhau i gynyddu busnesau bach mewn ardal wledig.

The First Minister: I would prefer to write to you or to ask the relevant Minister to do so—and there are more than one, as this spans different responsibilities; we will decide between us which of us is best placed to answer—to outline what is happening on trying to resolve the problems, particularly in mid Wales and Montgomery, with access to broadband of the highest quality, so that people can start up, maintain or continue to grow their small businesses in rural areas.

Datganiad a Chyhoeddiad Busnes Business Statement and Announcement

The Counsel General and Leader of the House (Carwyn Jones): There are no changes to report to this week's Government business. Business for the next three weeks is as set out in the draft business statement and announcement, which can be found among the agenda papers available to Members electronically.

Y Cwnsler Cyffredinol ac Arweinydd y Tŷ (Carwyn Jones): Nid oes newidiadau i'w hadrodd i fusnes y Llywodraeth yr wythnos hon. Mae'r busnes am y tair wythnos nesaf wedi'i nodi yn y datganiad busnes drafft a'r cyhoeddiad, sydd i'w canfod ymysg y papurau agenda sydd ar gael i Aelodau yn electronig.

Nick Bourne: The Leader of the House will have heard comments made by the First Minister during First Minister's questions on the Royal British Legion home in Rhayader. This is a serious issue, and I wonder whether he would consider giving time for us to express a united voice in this Chamber regarding the proposed closure, which involves the withdrawal of 60 beds in Rhayader. It has been in Rhayader since 1974. Its withdrawal would mean that there was no Royal British Legion home in Wales. It would have a dreadful impact on the

Nick Bourne: Bydd Arweinydd y Tŷ wedi clywed sylwadau a wnaethpwyd gan y Prif Weinidog yn ystod cwestiynau'r Prif Weinidog ynglŷn â chartref y Llang Brydeinig Frenhinol yn Rhaeadr Gwy. Mae hwn yn fater difrifol, ac ys gwn i a fyddai'n ystyried rhoi amser inni i fynegi llais unedig yn y Siambr hon ynglŷn â'r cau arfaethedig, sy'n golygu tynnu 60 o welyau yn Rhaeadr Gwy yn ôl. Mae wedi bod yn Rhaeadr Gwy er 1974. Bydd dileu'r ddarpariaeth yn golygu na fydd gan y Llang Brydeinig Frenhinol gartref yng Nghymru. Byddai'n cael effaith

residents, many of whom have family and friends in that area, and many of whom have made it their home, having come to the area. It is an urgent issue, because the consultation period is due to end, and the Royal British Legion, which I have visited in London, will not extend that consultation period. Therefore, we need the opportunity in the Chamber to express a united view, I hope, on that issue.

I wish to raise a second issue with the Leader of the House, namely the post office closure programme. I appreciate that this matter is driven from Westminster rather than here, and the Leader of the House and his party, as well as the other coalition partners, may want to distance themselves from that closure programme. However, would it not be beneficial to be able to debate that programme here, as it currently affects the area that he represents? In south and west Wales, 40 branches are under threat, 21 are threatened with closure, and 19 are threatened with outreach programmes. Would he consider making time available so that we can debate that too in the Chamber?

Carwyn Jones: I do not think that anyone would dispute the strong feelings that have arisen as a result of the proposed closure of the Royal British Legion home in Rhayader. I do not think that anyone in the Chamber would disagree with what you said and the words that you used. However, it would not be appropriate to have a debate on the issue, important though it is, as we would all agree. The opportunity is there to raise the matter with the appropriate Minister to gauge the Government's view, and to make that view known to the Royal British Legion.

On the post office closure programme, I do not think that you can accuse the Assembly of having swept the issue under the carpet; it has been debated on many occasions in the Chamber over the past few weeks, and the issues have been examined at great length. I do not see what use a further debate in Government time would be, although it is open to individual Members to make the representations that they see as appropriate with regard to their own local post offices.

ofnadwy ar y trigolion, y mae gan lawer ohonynt deulu a ffrindiau yn yr ardal honno, ac y mae llawer ohonynt wedi gwneud eu cartref yno, ar ôl dod i'r ardal. Mae'n fater brys, oherwydd mae'r cyfnod ymgynghori ar fin gorffen, ac ni fydd y Lleng Brydeinig Frenhinol, yr wyf wedi ymweld â hi yn Llundain, yn ymestyn y cyfnod ymgynghori hwnnw. Felly, mae angen inni gael cyfle yn y Siambr i fynegi barn unedig, gobeithiaf, ar y mater hwnnw.

Hoffwn godi ail fater gydag Arweinydd y Tŷ, sef y rhaglen i gau swyddfeydd post. Yr wyf yn sylweddoli mai mater sy'n cael ei yrru o San Steffan yn hytrach nag yma yw hwn, ac efallai y bydd Arweinydd y Tŷ a'i blaid, yn ogystal â'r partneriaid eraill yn y glymblaid, am ymbellhau oddi wrth y rhaglen gau. Fodd bynnag, oni fyddai'n llesol gallu trafod y rhaglen honno yma, gan ei bod ar hyn o bryd yn effeithio ar yr ardal y mae ef yn ei chynrychioli? Yn ne a gorllewin Cymru, mae 40 o ganghennau o dan fygythiad, mae bygythiad i gau 21, ac mae 19 yn cael eu bygwth â rhaglenni allgymorth. A fyddai'n ystyried darparu amser fel y gallwn drafod hynny hefyd yn y Siambr?

Carwyn Jones: Ni chredaf y byddai unrhyw un yn amau'r teimladau cryf sydd wedi codi o ganlyniad i'r bwriad i gau cartref y Lleng Brydeinig Frenhinol yn Rhaeadr Gwy. Ni chredaf y byddai unrhyw un yn y Siambr yn anghytuno â'r hyn a ddywedasoeh ac â'r geiriau a ddefnyddiasoeh. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddai'n briodol cael dadl ar y mater, er mor bwysig ydyw, fel y byddem i gyd yn cytuno. Mae'r cyfle yna i godi'r mater gyda'r Gweinidog priodol i fesur barn y Llywodraeth, ac i wneud y farn honno'n hysbys i'r Lleng Brydeinig Frenhinol.

O ran y rhaglen i gau swyddfeydd post, ni chredaf y gallwch gyhuddo'r Cynulliad o fod wedi ysgubo'r mater o dan y carped; mae wedi cael ei drafod droeon yn y Siambr dros yr wythnosau diwethaf, ac mae'r materion wedi cael eu harchwilio'n drylwyr iawn. Ni welaf pa ddiben y byddai dadl bellach yn amser y Llywodraeth yn ei ateb, er ei bod yn agored i Aelodau unigol gyflwyno'r sylwadau y maent hwy'n eu hystyried yn briodol mewn perthynas â'u swyddfeydd post lleol eu hunain.

Michael German: Leader of the House, would you be prepared to ask the Minister for Health and Social Services to make a statement in the Chamber about ambulance response times in Monmouthshire? Last week, the rapid-response unit was withdrawn from the ambulance station in Abergavenny, which serves Blaenau Gwent and northern Monmouthshire, as well as parts of Powys. The ambulance service in that area does not currently meet the eight-minute response time target; indeed, it meets that target in only just over half of its call-outs. Having instituted that important service, it is a great shock to the communities in that area to find that it is being withdrawn, which means that they will have to suffer the consequence of having worse ambulance response times than expected and worse than those that they were getting from the response unit, which was there for the previous month.

Carwyn Jones: This issue can be raised with the Minister for Health and Social Services, who, I am sure, will give you an appropriate response.

Bethan Jenkins: Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn poeni gymaint â mi am yr ystadegau a gyhoeddwyd heddiw sy'n nodi bod tlodi plant wedi codi 100,000 ym Mhrydain. Ai dyma'r amser, felly, i gael trafodaeth frys yn y Cynulliad am hyn?

Yr wyf yn cydnabod nad oes pŵer gennym dros fenthyciadau na chredydau treth yng Nghymru, ond mae goblygiadau egwyddorol arnom i geisio mynd i'r afael â'r sefyllfa hon. Mae'n edrych yn bur annhebyg y gallwn wneud hynny heb i Lywodraeth San Steffan wneud llawer mwy o waith ar dlodi plant. Mae pobl wedi dweud bod angen £3 biliwn o arian ychwanegol i fynd i'r afael ag ef. Erfyniaf arnoch felly, fel aelod o'r Llywodraeth, i fynd â'r neges hon yn syth at y Llywodraeth yn San Steffan.

Carwyn Jones: Yr ydym wedi ystyried y ffigurau hyn, sy'n dangos pa mor bwysig ydyw i sicrhau ein bod yn parhau â'r frwydr yn erbyn tlodi. Y ffigurau ar gyfer Prydain

Michael German: Arweinydd y Tŷ, a fydddech yn barod i ofyn i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wneud datganiad yn y Siambr am amseroedd ymateb ambiwlansys yn sir Fynwy? Yr wythnos diwethaf, cafodd uned ymateb cyflym ei thynnu'n ôl o'r orsaf ambiwlansys yn y Fenni, sy'n gwasanaethu Blaenau Gwent a gogledd sir Fynwy, yn ogystal â rhannau o Bowys. Nid yw'r gwasanaeth ambiwlansys yn yr ardal honno yn cyrraedd y targed ymateb wyth munud ar hyn o bryd; yn wir, dim ond mewn mymryn dros hanner yr achosion pan gaiff ei alw allan y mae'n cyrraedd y targed hwnnw. Gan fod y gwasanaeth pwysig hwnnw wedi cael ei sefydlu, mae'n sioc enfawr i'r cymunedau yn yr ardal honno i ganfod ei fod yn cael ei dynnu'n ôl, sy'n golygu y bydd yn rhaid iddynt ddioddef y canlyniad o gael amseroedd ymateb gwaeth na'r disgwyl gan ambiwlansys a gwaeth na'r rhai yr oeddent yn eu cael gan yr uned ymateb, a oedd yno dros y mis blaenorol.

Carwyn Jones: Gellir codi'r mater hwn gyda'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithas a fydd, yr wyf yn siŵr, yn rhoi ymateb priodol ichi.

Bethan Jenkins: I am sure that you are as concerned as I am about the statistics published today, which note that child poverty has increased 100,000 in Britain. Is now, therefore, the time to hold urgent talks in the Assembly on this?

I appreciate that we do not have power in Wales over loans and borrowing or tax credits, but we have a moral obligation to try to tackle this situation. It looks fairly unlikely that we can do that without the Government at Westminster doing much more work on child poverty. It has been said that an additional £3 billion is needed to get to grips with it. I appeal to you therefore, as a member of the Government, to take that message straight to the Government at Westminster.

Carwyn Jones: We have considered these figures, which reveal how important it is to ensure that we keep up the fight against poverty. It is the figures for Britain as a

gyfan yr ydym wedi eu gweld heddiw, hyd y deallaf. Fodd bynnag, fel yr wyf wedi ei ddweud sawl gwaith yn y Siambr, mae sawl rhaglen ar waith gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i sicrhau bod flodi ymhlith plant Cymru yn gostwng ac yn diflannu, gobeithio, yn y dyfodol.

3.10 p.m.

William Graham: I ask the Leader of the House to bring forward a statement on the possible cost of the construction of an access road from the A449 to the Celtic Manor Resort and the cost of the possible construction of an underpass at junction 24 of the M4 motorway. For the avoidance of doubt, I have already asked the Deputy First Minister and he has refused to reply to my question, through the Members' research service.

Carwyn Jones: I have not seen the correspondence between you and the Deputy First Minister, but I can certainly investigate the matter, and I will communicate my response to you.

Eleanor Burnham: Would it be possible to have a Government statement and an emergency debate on the state of the A55 trunk road, which is causing chaos and misery for so many people, and not only individuals, but businesses? Only last week, there were about three major disruptions and, as soon as I got off the A55 near Llandudno, there was another major disruption. Quite frankly, it is absolutely impossible for some of us to get around to conduct our business. Businesses are losing an enormous amount of money, wasting a lot of very expensive fuel, and causing huge pollution.

There is another matter that I would like to bring to your attention. Considering that Network Rail, Arriva Trains Wales and the Deputy First Minister were parading around last week talking about improvements to the railway, I was very shocked to experience yet another disruption in Wrexham yesterday because of a points failure, or something similar, in this vulnerable infrastructure of ours on the train service between north and south. Those are two very important issues. Could we have a statement on them soon and

whole that we have seen today, I understand. However, as I have said many times before in the Chamber, the Assembly Government has several programmes in place to ensure that levels of child poverty in Wales decrease and then disappear, we hope, in future.

William Graham: Gofynnaf i Arweinydd y Tŷ ddod â datganiad gerbron ynglŷn â chost bosibl adeiladu ffordd fynediad o'r A449 i Westy Hamdden y Celtic Manor a'r gost o adeiladu tanffordd o bosibl ar gyffordd 24 o draffordd yr M4. I osgoi amheuaeth, yr wyf eisoes wedi gofyn i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ac mae ef wedi gwrthod ateb fy nghwestiwn, drwy wasanaeth ymchwil yr Aelodau.

Carwyn Jones: Nid wyf wedi gweld yr ohebiaeth rhyngoch chi a'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog, ond gallaf yn sicr ymchwilio i'r mater, ac anfonaf fy ymateb atoch.

Eleanor Burnham: A fyddai'n bosibl cael datganiad gan y Llywodraeth a dadl frys am gyflwr cefnffordd yr A55, sy'n achosi anhrefn a phoendod i gynifer o bobl, ac nid dim ond unigolion, ond busnesau? Yr wythnos diwethaf yn unig, yr oedd tarfu mawr mewn tua tri man a, chyn gynted ag y gadewais yr A55 gerllaw Llandudno, yr oedd tarfu mawr arall yno. A bod yn gwbl onest, mae'n hollol amhosibl i rai ohonom deithio o le i le i gynnal ein busnes. Mae busnesau'n colli symiau enfawr o arian, yn gwastraffu llawer o danwydd drud iawn, ac yn achosi llygredd aruthrol.

Mae mater arall yr hoffwn ei ddwyn i'ch sylw. Ac ystyried bod Network Rail, Trenau Arriva Cymru a'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn gwneud sioe yr wythnos diwethaf yn sôn am welliannau i'r rheilffordd, cefais ysgytwad o orfod wynebu tarfu ar y gwasanaeth eto yn Wrecsam ddoe am fod y pwyntiau wedi methu, neu rywbeth tebyg, ar y seilwaith bregus hwn sydd gennym i'r gwasanaeth trenau rhwng y gogledd a'r de. Mae'r rheini'n ddau fater pwysig iawn. A gawn ni ddatganiad amdanynt yn fuan ac yn sicr rai

certainly some improvements?

Carwyn Jones: You will forgive me, Eleanor, for saying that you are not a fortunate traveller. You have eloquently expressed your views on the railway service many times on the floor of the Assembly, we have heard about the tribulations that you have experienced when you have flown internally, and now we find that you are experiencing difficulties on the A55. I am sure that the Deputy First Minister will have heard what you have said and will be able to provide you with answers to your queries. Do remind me never to travel with you, if I can possibly avoid it. [*Laughter.*]

Leanne Wood: Leader of the House, I am sure that you are aware of the recent report from the four UK children's commissioners that claims that the UK Government is responsible for demonising young people, and that soaring numbers of young children are being unfairly criminalised amid a hardening public attitude towards young people. Similar concerns were raised by the former chair of the Youth Justice Board for England and Wales, Rod Morgan, who claims that the youth prison population has doubled in a decade. Our new Children's Commissioner for Wales has called for the devolution of youth justice services and the creation of a Welsh youth justice board, which I fully support. You will be aware that 'One Wales' includes an aspiration to have a fair system of youth and criminal justice, in which the people of Wales can have every confidence. Therefore, can you provide time for the Assembly to debate the joint report of the children's commissioners and the Government's response to it, so that we can start the process of creating a fair system of youth justice, which can focus on tackling the root causes of problematic behaviour, prioritise prevention, and move away from the demonising and punitive criminal justice agenda that is currently being pursued by the UK Government?

Carwyn Jones: I am sure that my colleague will be formulating a response to the views of the children's commissioners, and that response will be made known to Members.

gwelliannau?

Carwyn Jones: Maddeuwch imi, Eleanor, am ddweud nad ydych yn deithiwr lwcus iawn. Yr ydych wedi mynegi eich barn am y gwasanaeth rheilffordd droeon ar lawr y Cynulliad; yr ydym wedi clywed am yr helyntion yr ydych wedi'u cael wrth hedfan yn fewnol, ac yn awr yr ydym yn canfod eich bod yn cael anawsterau ar yr A55. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog wedi clywed yr hyn a ddywedasochoch ac y gall ddarparu atebion i'ch cwestiynau. Atgoffwch mi i beidio byth â theithio gyda chi, os oes modd o gwbl imi osgoi hynny. [*Chwerthin.*]

Leanne Wood: Arweinydd y Tŷ, yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol o'r adroddiad diweddar gan bedwar comisiynydd plant y DU sy'n honni bod Llywodraeth y DU yn gyfrifol am gythreulio pobl ifanc, a bod y nifer o bobl ifanc sy'n cael eu labelu'n droseddwr yn annheg yn cynyddu ar garlam wrth i agwedd y cyhoedd at bobl ifanc galedi. Codwyd pryderon tebyg gan gyn gadeirydd Bwrdd Cyfiawnder Ieuentid Cymru a Lloegr, Rod Morgan, sy'n honni bod poblogaeth pobl ifanc y carchardai wedi dyblu mewn degawd. Mae Comisiynydd Plant newydd Cymru wedi galw am ddatganoli'r gwasanaethau cyfiawnder ieuentid ac am greu bwrdd cyfiawnder ieuentid i Gymru, a chefnogaf hynny'n llwyr. Byddwch yn ymwybodol fod 'Cymru'n Un' yn cynnwys dyhead i gael cyfundrefn deg o gyfiawnder ieuentid a chyfiawnder troseddol, cyfundrefn y gall pobl Cymru fod â phob ffydd ynddi. Felly, a allwch ddarparu amser i'r Cynulliad i drafod cyd adroddiad y comisiynwyr plant ac ymateb y Llywodraeth iddo, fel y gallwn ddechrau ar y broses o greu cyfundrefn cyfiawnder ieuentid deg, a all ganolbwyntio ar fynd i'r afael ag achosion gwaelodol ymddygiad problemus, blaenoriaethu'r camau atal, a symud oddi wrth y cythreulio a'r agenda o gyfiawnder troseddol sy'n cosbi y mae Llywodraeth y DU yn ei rhoi ar waith ar hyn o bryd?

Carwyn Jones: Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd fy nghyd-Weinidog yn llunio ymateb i farn y comisiynwyr plant, ac y caiff yr ymateb hwnnw ei ryddhau i'r Aelodau. Mae

There is also a commitment in 'One Wales' to examine the evidence for the devolution of the criminal justice system, and that examination is ongoing.

Nick Ramsay: I concur with the comments made earlier by Mike German regarding the withdrawal of the rapid-response unit from Abergavenny. I ask the Leader of the House to bring forward a discussion on that issue, which is important to constituents in south-east Wales.

Secondly, could you make time available for further discussion on the further education funding situation in Wales? As the Leader of the House will be aware, 18 FE institutions are facing a below-inflation increase in their budgets compared with last year, and Coleg Gwent, in my constituency, is one of those. We have a good story to tell in relation to our FE colleges and I am sure that the Minister for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills would agree with that: 90 per cent of lessons are graded 'good' to 'excellent', so we have a good-news story there. However, there is a very real concern among the FE colleges that their efforts to be as socially inclusive as they would like are being jeopardised by the current funding situation and that pupils from poorer backgrounds, particularly, will be less able to apply than they were previously because of this. Can you find time for these matters to be debated here?

Carwyn Jones: These matters can be considered in committees, and through questions and correspondence with the appropriate Minister. If that is felt not to be sufficient, it is always open to opposition parties to raise the matter in Plenary themselves.

Chris Franks: Are you as disappointed as I am that the new kings of Britain stamps, featuring Owain Glyndŵr, will not be for general use by the Welsh public? Is this yet another example of an organisation failing to respond to devolution? Will you ensure that a statement is made on this?

Carwyn Jones: The Royal Mail produces

ymrwymiad hefyd yn 'Cymru'n Un' i archwilio'r dystiolaeth o blaid datganoli'r gyfundrefn cyfiawnder troseddol, ac mae'r archwiliad hwnnw'n mynd rhagddo.

Nick Ramsay: Cytunaf â'r sylwadau a wnaethpwyd yn gynharach gan Mike German ynglŷn â thynnu'r uned ymateb cyflym yn ôl o'r Fenni. Gofynnaf i Arweinydd y Tŷ ddod â thrafodaeth gerbron ar y mater hwnnw, sy'n bwysig i etholwyr yn ne-ddwyrain Cymru.

Yn ail, a allech ddarparu amser ar gyfer trafodaeth bellach ar y sefyllfa o ran cyllido addysg bellach yng Nghymru? Fel y bydd Arweinydd y Tŷ yn gwybod, mae 18 o sefydliadau AB yn wynebu cynnydd islaw chwyddiant yn eu cyllidebau o'u cymharu â'r flwyddyn diwethaf, ac mae Coleg Gwent, yn f'etholaeth i, yn un o'r rheini. Mae gennym stori dda i'w hadrodd am ein colegau AB ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'r Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau yn cytuno â hynny: caiff 90 y cant o'r gwersi eu graddio'n 'dda' i 'ragorol', felly mae gennym stori newyddion da yno. Fodd bynnag, mae gwir bryder ymysg y colegau AB bod eu hymdrechion i fod mor gymdeithasol gynhwysol ag y carent fod yn cael eu bygwth oherwydd y sefyllfa bresennol o ran ariannu ac y bydd llai o allu i ymgeisio nag o'r blaen gan ddisgyblion o gefndiroedd tlotach, yn benodol, oherwydd hyn. A allwch neilltuo amser i gael dadl am y materion hyn yn y fan hon?

Carwyn Jones: Gellir ystyried y materion hyn mewn pwyllgorau, a thrwy gwestiynau a gohebu â'r Gweinidog priodol. Os teimlir nad yw hynny'n ddigonol, mae cyfle bob amser gan wrthbleidiau i godi'r mater yn y Cyfarfod Llawn eu hunain.

Chris Franks: A ydych mor siomedig â minnau na fydd y stampiau newydd o frenhinoedd Prydain, sy'n cynnwys Owain Glyndŵr, yn rhai a fydd ar gael i'w defnyddio'n gyffredinol gan y cyhoedd yng Nghymru? A yw hyn yn un enghraifft arall o gorff sy'n methu ag ymateb i ddatganoli? A wnewch sicrhau y gwneir datganiad am hyn?

Carwyn Jones: Mae'r Post Brenhinol yn

new-issue stamps during the course of the year, and it still sells first day covers, which a lot of people collect. The commemorative stamps that are produced every so often during the course of the year are meant to be for a limited period only, but they are available for the general public to use, even though people tend have to ask for them over the counter. It is gratifying to think that recognition has been given to a figure from Welsh history in this series of commemorative stamps, but the message is that, if people want to use the stamps, they only have to ask at the counter of their local post office.

Kirsty Williams: Will the Leader of the House give some consideration to tabling a statement or a debate by the Minister for Health and Social Services on the availability of new cancer drugs? I have a number of constituents who are diagnosed with advanced cancer who are not able to get a prescription for Sutent on the NHS. Their families are at their wits' end. It is the only hope that these families now have for a cure or, at least, for the prolonging of life of their relatives. Some are already paying privately for this drug at huge expense, yet they know that there are people in other parts of Wales and parts of England who are getting this drug for free. Will you please ask the Minister to explain to the Assembly how the Government intends to ensure that people have access to cancer treatment when they need it?

Carwyn Jones: Everyone would sympathise with your constituents and with anyone who is in a position where they have cancer—a frightening illness—and feel that they are unable to receive the treatment that they feel is appropriate. I suggest that you raise the matter with the Minister for health, who I know will take the issue very seriously and will do what she can to provide some assistance for your constituents.

Jenny Randerson: I have two issues to raise with the Leader of the House in relation to potential job losses in my constituency. The first relates to the potential for up to 40 redundancies at Coleg Glan Hafren, following its poor funding settlement, and it is not alone among further education colleges

cynhyrchu stampiau a gyhoeddir o'r newydd yn ystod y flwyddyn, ac mae'n dal i werthu amlenni diwrnod cyntaf, y mae llawer o bobl yn eu casglu. Mae'r stampiau coffa a gynhyrchir bob hyn a hyn yn ystod y flwyddyn wedi'u bwriadu ar gyfer cyfnod byr yn unig, ond maent ar gael i'w defnyddio gan y cyhoedd, er bod pobl yn gorfod gofyn amdanynt dros y cownter fel arfer. Mae'n braf meddwl bod ffigwr o hanes Cymru wedi'i gydnabod yn y gyfres hon o stampiau coffa, ond y neges yw, os ydyw pobl am ddefnyddio'r stampiau, nid oes ond rhaid iddynt ofyn wrth gownter eu swyddfa bost leol.

Kirsty Williams: A wnaiff Arweinydd y Tŷ roi rhyw ystyriaeth i gyflwyno datganiad neu ddadl gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol am argaeledd cyffuriau canser newydd? Mae gennyf nifer o etholwyr y canfuwyd bod canser datblygedig arnynt nad ydynt yn gallu cael presgripsiwn am Sutent dan y GIG. Nid yw eu teuluoedd yn gwybod beth i'w wneud nesaf. Hwn yw'r unig obaith sydd gan y teuluoedd hyn yn awr i gael gwellhad neu, o leiaf, i ymestyn oes eu perthnasau. Mae rhai sydd eisoes yn talu'n breifat am y cyffur hwn ar gost aruthrol, ac eto gwyddant fod pobl mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru a rhannau o Loegr sy'n cael y cyffur hwn am ddim. A wnewch ofyn i'r Gweinidog egluro i'r Cynulliad sut y mae'r Llywodraeth yn bwriadu sicrhau y caiff pobl fynediad at driniaeth ar gyfer canser pan fydd arnynt ei hangen, os gwelwch yn dda?

Carwyn Jones: Byddai pawb yn cydymdeimlo â'ch etholwyr ac unrhyw un sydd â chanser—sy'n afiechyd brawychus—ac yntau'n teimlo na all gael y driniaeth y mae'n teimlo ei bod yn briodol. Yr wyf yn awgrymu y dylech godi'r mater gyda'r Gweinidog dros iechyd, y gwn y bydd yn rhoi ystyriaeth ddifrifol iawn i'r mater ac y gwnaiff bopeth yn ei gallu i roi rhyw gymorth i'ch etholwyr.

Jenny Randerson: Mae gennyf ddau fater i'w codi gydag Arweinydd y Tŷ mewn cysylltiad â'r posibilrwydd o golli swyddi yn fy etholaeth. Mae'r cyntaf yn ymwneud â'r posibilrwydd o ddiswyddo hyd at 40 yng Ngholeg Glan Hafren, yn dilyn ei setliad ariannu gwael, ac nid ef yw'r unig un ymysg

in Wales. I have asked for a meeting with the Minister, but have not yet been able to secure one. Therefore, I ask that we have an oral statement, at the very least, and preferably a debate, to allow us to thrash out the real issues behind this funding settlement.

Secondly, I ask for a statement from the Minister on the potential for 300 redundancies in Cardiff, which currently accommodates the headquarters of International Baccalaureate; it has confirmed today that it is considering moving its headquarters from Cardiff. You will know that Cardiff has developed a good reputation as a centre of excellence for learning. These are high-quality jobs and it would be tragic if we lost them from Wales.

3.20 p.m.

Carwyn Jones: To deal first with the issue of Coleg Glan Hafren, it is for the college to justify why it feels the need to make up to 40 people redundant. It must provide you with that explanation. On the 300 jobs at International Baccalaureate, I am familiar with the organisation but it is not an integral part of the Welsh education system, although some institutions in Wales carry the qualification. I know the organisation well as my wife worked there several years ago; I am familiar with its headquarters in St Mellons. It is concerning that 300 jobs might be lost, but I am sure that, following today's announcement, my colleagues will be carefully considering what might be done to try to save the headquarters.

y colegau addysg bellach yng Nghymru. Yr wyf wedi gofyn am gael cyfarfod â'r Gweinidog, ond nid wyf wedi gallu sicrhau un eto. Felly, gofynnaf am roi datganiad llafar i ni, o leiaf, a dadl, os oes modd, i ganiatáu inni fynd at wraidd yr ystyriaethau gwirioneddol sydd y tu ôl i'r setliad ariannu hwn.

Yn ail, gofynnaf am ddatganiad gan y Gweinidog am y posibilrwydd o ddiswyddo 300 yng Nghaerdydd, sydd ar hyn o bryd yn gartref i bencadlys International Baccalaureate; mae wedi cadarnhau heddiw ei fod yn ystyried symud ei bencadlys o Gaerdydd. Gwyddoch fod Caerdydd wedi meithrin enw da fel canolfan ragoriaeth ar gyfer dysgu. Mae'r rhain yn swyddi o ansawdd uchel a byddai'n drist petai Cymru'n eu colli.

Carwyn Jones: Er mwyn delio'n gyntaf â mater Coleg Glan Hafren, mater i'r coleg yw cyfiawnhau pam mae'n teimlo'r angen i ddiswyddo cynifer â 40 o bobl. Rhaid iddo roi'r eglurhad hwnnw i chi. Ynghylch y 300 o swyddi yn International Baccalaureate, yr wyf yn gyfarwydd â'r corff ond nid yw'n rhan annatod o system addysg Cymru, er bod rhai sefydliadau yng Nghymru'n darparu ar gyfer y cymhwyster. Yr wyf yn adnabod y corff yn dda gan fod fy ngwraig wedi gweithio yno rai blynyddoedd yn ôl; yr wyf yn gyfarwydd â'i bencadlys yn Llaneirwg. Mae'n destun pryder y gellid colli 300 o swyddi, ond yr wyf yn siŵr, yn dilyn y cyhoeddiad heddiw, y bydd fy nghyd-Weinidogion yn ystyried beth y gellid ei wneud i geisio cadw'r pencadlys.

Datganiad am Ddatblygu Cynaliadwy Statement on Sustainable Development

The Minister for Environment, Sustainability and Housing (Jane Davidson): Last month, I announced my decision to remake the Assembly Government's sustainable development scheme. I am proud that the Assembly Government is one of the few administrations in the world that has made sustainable development central to its statute. We remain committed to this principle as the watchword

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynaliadwyedd a Thai (Jane Davidson): Y mis diwethaf, cyhoeddais fy mhenderfyniad i ail-wneud cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Yr wyf yn falch bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn un o'r ychydig weinyddiaethau yn y byd sydd wedi rhoi lle canolog i ddatblygu cynaliadwy yn ei statud. Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo o hyd i'r egwyddor hon fel yr arwyddair i raglen y

of this administration's programme.

The current sustainable development scheme was made in 2004 and sets the overarching strategic framework and vision of a sustainable future for all of Wales. It highlights the commitments made by the Assembly Government towards sustainable development, the principles that it observes and the processes that it applies in promoting sustainable development in all its work. A great deal has been achieved in recent years, and the last annual report on sustainable development highlighted the good work that we have done on sustainability in health, education, procurement and other policy areas, including the Wales for Africa programme and fair trade. Over the last year or so, we have been taking a broad look at our work on sustainable development over the last four years and consulting widely with stakeholders. A debate in Plenary was held on this issue in October last year. Several pieces of work have formed the basis of our comprehensive assessment of our delivery of sustainable development.

In line with our statutory duty, we commissioned a review of the effectiveness of the sustainable development scheme, which looked at the outward-facing aspect of how well the vision set out in the scheme has been achieved. I intend to publish and lay this report in the coming weeks. Cynnal Cymru has also undertaken a piece of work on civil society's views on sustainable development issues in Wales, following on from its programme of events with a wide range of stakeholders. Also, internally within the Assembly Government, the Wales Audit Office is considering the integration of sustainable development in the business decision-making processes. All of this work provides a comprehensive assessment of our work on sustainable development and a good platform from which to take this work to the next level. The emerging findings and recommendations from the various workstreams give strong messages. In particular, there is a clear appetite for more action on sustainable development and there

weinyddiaeth hon.

Gwnaethpwyd y cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy presennol yn 2004 ac mae'n pennu'r fframwaith strategol cyffredinol a gweledigaeth o ddyfodol cynaliadwy i Gymru gyfan. Mae'n tynnu sylw at yr ymrwymadau a wnaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad er mwyn datblygu cynaliadwy, yr egwyddorion y mae'n eu dilyn a'r prosesau y mae'n eu defnyddio wrth hyrwyddo datblygu cynaliadwy ym mhob agwedd ar ei gwaith. Mae llawer iawn wedi'i gyflawni yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf, a thynnwyd sylw yn yr adroddiad blynyddol diwethaf am ddatblygu cynaliadwy at y gwaith da yr ydym wedi'i wneud ar gynaliadwyedd ym maes iechyd, addysg, caffael a meysydd polisi eraill, gan gynnwys y rhaglen Cymru o blaid Affrica a masnach deg. Dros y flwyddyn neu ddwy ddiwethaf, yr ydym wedi bod yn edrych yn gyffredinol ar ein gwaith ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy dros y pedair blynedd diwethaf ac yn ymgynghori'n eang â rhanddeiliaid. Cynhaliwyd dadl yn y Cyfarfod Llawn am y mater hwn fis Hydref y llynedd. Mae nifer o eitemau gwaith wedi bod yn sail i'n hasesiad cynhwysfawr o'r modd yr ydym yn cyflenwi datblygu cynaliadwy.

Yn unol â'n dyletswydd statudol, gwnaethom gomisiynu adolygiad o effeithiolrwydd y cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy, a ystyriodd i ba raddau y mae'r weledigaeth a nodwyd yn y cynllun wedi'i gwireddu ar y tu allan. Yr wyf yn bwriadu cyhoeddi'r adroddiad hwn a'i gyflwyno yn yr wythnosau nesaf. Mae Cynnal Cymru wedi ymgymryd â gwaith hefyd ar farn cymdeithas sifil am faterion sy'n ymwneud â datblygu cynaliadwy yng Nghymru, yn dilyn ei raglen ddigwyddiadau gyda llawer math o randdeiliaid. Hefyd, o fewn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, mae Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru yn ystyried integreiddio datblygu cynaliadwy â'r prosesau penderfynu. Mae'r holl waith hwn yn cynnig asesiad cynhwysfawr o'n gwaith ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy a man cychwyn da i fynd â'r gwaith hwn i'r lefel nesaf. Mae'r canfyddiadau a'r argymhellion sy'n codi o'r gwahanol ffrydiau gwaith yn cyfleu negeseuon pendant. Yn benodol, mae awydd amlwg am fwy o weithredu ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy ac mae llawer mwy i'w wneud.

is much more to be done.

A new sustainable development scheme will provide an opportunity to respond to the review work and, building on this appetite and enthusiasm, will enable us to set an updated and modern vision for sustainable development in Wales, with clear milestones and objectives. Sustainable development is about achieving all of our economic, social and environmental objectives in a balanced way, while also recognising our impact on the earth's resources.

'One Wales' sets out our commitment to deliver these improvements. Therefore, the new sustainable development scheme will not be separate to, or work alongside, our 'One Wales' agenda; it will be a strategic framework document that sets out how our current policies and commitments will contribute to the wellbeing of the people of Wales and make a lasting difference within our communities, particularly our least well-off communities.

Specifically, our new sustainable development scheme will centre on demonstrating how our policies promote social justice, with themes such as: a healthy future with improved quality of life for all; a prosperous society within which we move towards a low carbon economy; living communities that contribute to health and wellbeing; learning for life whereby every learner is engaged in sustainable development and global citizenship; a sustainable environment that addresses climate change; and a fair and just society that celebrates our rich and diverse culture, building on my announcement on Friday that Wales has become the world's first fair trade nation.

We are calling our new scheme 'One Wales: One Planet', to highlight the fact that we will be seeking to show how we can achieve our aims using only our fair share of the earth's resources. At the moment, Wales uses almost three planets' worth of resources. I launched a report that recalculates Wales's ecological footprint at the Hay Festival recently. It shows that our ecological footprint is 5.16 global hectares per person—that is the lowest

Bydd cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy newydd yn rhoi cyfle i ymateb i waith yr adolygiad, a thrwy adeiladu ar sail yr awydd a'r brwdfrydedd hwn, bydd yn ein galluogi i bennu gweledigaeth newydd a modern ar gyfer datblygu cynaliadwy yng Nghymru, gyda cherrig milltir ac amcanion clir. Mae datblygu cynaliadwy'n ymwneud â chyflawni pob un o'n hamcanion economaidd, cymdeithasol ac amgylcheddol mewn modd cytbwys, gan gydnabod ein heffaith ar adnoddau'r ddaear hefyd yr un pryd.

Mae 'Cymru'n Un' yn egluro ein hymrwymiad i sicrhau'r gwelliannau hyn. Felly, ni fydd y cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy newydd yn sefyll ar wahân i'n hagenda yn 'Cymru'n Un', neu'n gweithio ochr yn ochr â hi; bydd yn ddogfen fframwaith strategol sy'n dangos sut y bydd ein polisiau a'n hymrwymadau presennol yn cyfrannu at les pobl Cymru ac yn gwneud gwahaniaeth parhaol yn ein cymunedau, yn enwedig ein cymunedau lleiaf cefnog.

Yn benodol, bydd ein cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy newydd yn canolbwyntio ar ddangos sut y mae ein polisiau'n hyrwyddo cyfiawnder cymdeithasol, gyda themâu fel: dyfodol iach gyda gwell ansawdd bywyd i bawb; cymdeithas ffyniannus lle'r ydym yn symud tuag at economi carbon isel; cymunedau byw sy'n cyfrannu at iechyd a lles; dysgu ar gyfer bywyd fel bod pob dysgwr yn ymwneud â datblygu cynaliadwy a dinasyddiaeth fyd-eang; amgylchedd cynaliadwy sy'n ymateb i newid yn yr hinsawdd; cymdeithas deg a chyfiawn sy'n dathlu ein diwylliant cyfoethog ac amrywiol, gan adeiladu ar sail y cyhoeddiad a wneuthum ddydd Gwener fod Cymru wedi dod yn wlad masnach deg gyntaf y byd.

Yr enw yr ydym yn ei roi ar ein cynllun newydd yw 'Cymru Un Blaned', er mwyn tynnu sylw at y ffaith y byddwn yn ceisio dangos sut y gallwn gyrraedd ein nodau gan ddefnyddio dim ond ein cyfran deg o adnoddau'r ddaear. Ar hyn o bryd, mae Cymru'n defnyddio gwerth bron dair planed o adnoddau. Lansiais adroddiad sy'n ail gyfrifo ôl-troed ecolegol Cymru yng Ngŵyl y Gelli'n ddiweddar. Mae'n dangos mai ein

figure among the four nations of the UK, but it is still at an unsustainable level. The case for reducing our ecological footprint to sustainable levels is urgent and compelling and the report shows us how we can reduce it. We are already doing a great deal. The 'One Wales' agenda takes forward high profile initiatives in each of the three key areas that, together, account for around two thirds of the footprint: transport, which is 18 per cent; housing, which is 25 per cent; and food, which is 20 per cent. The 'One Wales' agenda should therefore create a platform for stabilising or even reducing our footprint further by 2020. The challenge of the new sustainable development scheme will be to improve the quality of people's lives, while reducing our use of the earth's resources.

The new scheme will be a scheme for Wales—real and relevant for people and communities in Wales. People will understand it and feel a part of making it work for them. I want to build on the great appetite to do more on sustainable development, within the Assembly Government and more broadly across Wales. I will be looking to work with our existing partners and stakeholders to ensure that our 'One Wales: One Planet' agenda is collectively supported and implemented. I want to see real partnership working—across Government, across the public and private sectors and with communities and individuals—to build real consensus on the big issues and collectively implement change.

Over the coming months, officials will develop the new scheme in consultation with policy colleagues across the Assembly Government and our stakeholders. This will be subject to full public consultation in the autumn, and I will be looking to come back to Plenary at that time for further views.

To conclude, a new sustainable development scheme offers the prospect of setting out a clear journey to make Wales more sustainable in the context of 'One Wales'. Through this, we can deliver real and lasting

hól-troed ecolegol yw 5.16 o hectarau byd-eang y pen—sef y ffigur isaf o blith pedair gwlad y DU, ond mae'n dal ar lefel anghynaliadwy. Mae'r ddadl dros leihau ein hól-troed ecolegol fel ei fod ar lefelau cynaliadwy'n un daer a grymus ac mae'r adroddiad yn dangos i ni sut y gallwn ei leihau. Yr ydym yn gwneud llawer iawn eisoes. Mae agenda 'Cymru'n Un' yn hyrwyddo cynlluniau pwysig ym mhob un o'r tri maes allweddol sydd, gyda'i gilydd, yn gyfrifol am oddeutu dwy ran o dair o'r ôl-troed: trafnidiaeth, sy'n 18 y cant; tai, sy'n 25 y cant; a bwyd, sy'n 20 y cant. Felly dylai agenda 'Cymru'n Un' fod yn fodd i sefydlogi neu hyd yn oed leihau ein hól-troed ymhellach erbyn 2020. Yr her yn y cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy newydd fydd gwella ansawdd bywyd pobl, gan leihau ein defnydd o adnoddau'r ddaear.

Bydd y cynllun newydd yn gynllun i Gymru—un dilys a pherthnasol i bobl a chymunedau yng Nghymru. Bydd pobl yn ei ddeall ac yn teimlo eu bod yn cymryd rhan wrth beri iddo weithio drostynt hwy. Yr wyf am fanteisio ar yr awydd mawr i wneud mwy ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy, o fewn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ac yn fwy cyffredinol ledled Cymru. Byddaf yn disgwyl gweithio gyda'n partneriaid a'n rhanddeiliaid presennol i sicrhau y caiff ein hagenda 'Cymru Un Blaned' ei chefnogi a'i gweithredu ganddynt ar y cyd. Yr wyf am weld gwaith partneriaeth gwirioneddol—ar draws Llywodraeth, ar draws y sectorau cyhoeddus a phreifat a chyda chymunedau ac unigolion—i greu consensws go-iawn ar y materion pwysig a chydweithio i sicrhau newid.

Dros y misoedd nesaf, bydd swyddogion yn datblygu'r cynllun newydd gan ymgynghori â chymheiriaid ym maes polisi ym mhob rhan o Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a chyda'n rhanddeiliaid. Bydd ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus llawn ar hyn yn yr hydref, a byddaf yn disgwyl dod yn ôl i'r Cyfarfod Llawn bryd hynny i gael barn bellach.

I gloi, mae cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy newydd yn cynnig y gobaith o bennu llwybr clir er mwyn gwneud Cymru'n fwy cynaliadwy yng nghyd-destun 'Cymru'n Un'. Drwy hyn, gallwn sicrhau newidiadau

changes to transform people's lives across Wales and the lives of future generations. I hope that you will support this important development, and I welcome your views.

Darren Millar: Thank you for your statement, Minister. We support the revamping and revitalising of the sustainable development scheme, particularly given the fact that it is four years since it has been looked at and the growing evidence of the need to go further and move more quickly to address the world's environmental concerns. The title of the new scheme echoes the WWF Cymru One Planet Wales campaign, something that I know we both endorse fully. I also put on record how proud I am that Wales has become the first fair trade nation, and I congratulate the Wales Fair Trade Forum on that remarkable achievement.

In your statement, you say that you will be working with the Wales Audit Office to integrate sustainable development in the business decision-making process in the Welsh Assembly Government. That is crucial, given some of the remarkable and bizarre decisions made by the Assembly Government over the past 12 months that have seemed to fly in the face of sustainability, such as the Minister for Health and Social Services' decision to make people travel further for hospital treatment, and for neurosurgery in particular. I know that that decision is under review, but an announcement on that matter was made in the Chamber. Therefore, when do you hope to complete the integration of sustainable development to the business decision-making process in the Welsh Assembly Government?

You also mentioned the need for clear milestones and objectives in the new scheme, which, again, are crucial. We need to know where we are now; we need to be able to ensure that we are making progress; and we need to be able to measure progress in future. I know that there is an annual statement to Members on sustainable development and progress of the scheme, but will you look at reviewing the frequency with which you report to Members in the Chamber on progress against those objectives, particularly

gwirioneddol a pharhaol er mwyn trawsnewid bywydau pobl ledled Cymru a bywydau cenedlaethau'r dyfodol. Gobeithiaf y byddwch yn cefnogi'r datblygiad pwysig hwn, a byddaf yn falch o gael eich barn.

Darren Millar: Diolch i chi am eich datganiad, Weinidog. Yr ydym o blaid ailwampio ac adfywio'r cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy, yn enwedig a chofio'r ffaith bod pedair blynedd ers ei ystyried a bod tystiolaeth gynyddol o'r angen i fynd ymhellach a symud yn gynt i ymateb i bryderon amgylcheddol y byd. Mae enw'r cynllun newydd yn adleisio ymgyrch Cymru Un Blaned WWF Cymru, sy'n rhywbeth y gwn fod y ddau ohonom yn ei lwyr gefnogi. Dywedaf ar goedd hefyd mor falch yr ydwyf bod Cymru wedi dod yn wlad masnach deg gyntaf, a llongyfarchaf Fforwm Masnach Deg Cymru ar y cyflawniad rhyfeddol hwnnw.

Yn eich datganiad, dywedwch y byddwch yn cydweithio â Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru i integreiddio datblygu cynaliadwy â'r broses benderfynu busnes yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Mae hynny'n hollbwysig, ac ystyried rhai o'r penderfyniadau hynod a rhyfeddol a wnaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad dros y 12 mis diwethaf y mae wedi ymddangos eu bod yn mynd yn groes i gynaliadwyedd, fel penderfyniad y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i beri i bobl deithio ymhellach i gael triniaeth mewn ysbyty, ac i gael niwrolawdriniaeth yn benodol. Gwn fod y penderfyniad hwnnw'n cael ei adolygu, ond gwnaethpwyd cyhoeddiad am y mater hwnnw yn y Siambr. Felly, pa bryd yr ydych yn gobeithio cwblhau'r camau i integreiddio datblygu cynaliadwy â'r broses benderfynu busnes yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru?

Soniasoch hefyd am yr angen am gerrig milltir ac amcanion clir yn y cynllun newydd, sydd, unwaith eto, yn hollbwysig. Mae angen inni wybod ble'r ydym arni'n awr; mae angen inni allu sicrhau ein bod yn gwneud cynnydd; ac mae angen inni allu mesur cynnydd yn y dyfodol. Gwn fod datganiad blynyddol i Aelodau am ddatblygu cynaliadwy a hynt y cynllun, ond a wnewch ystyried adolygu pa mor aml yr ydych yn adrodd i Aelodau yn y Siambr am gynnydd tuag at yr amcanion hynny, yn enwedig os

if there are clear milestones that fall within an Assembly year?

oes cerrig milltir clir sy'n dod o fewn un o flynyddoedd y Cynulliad?

Finally, there is no mention in your statement of the Welsh Climate Change Commission, which, again, is something that this party supports. You say that you want some consensus on action on sustainable development in future, so what role, if any, do you anticipate the Climate Change Commission having in developing the new sustainable development scheme and in its monitoring thereafter?

Yn olaf, nid oes sôn yn eich datganiad am Gomisiwn Newid yn yr Hinsawdd Cymru, sydd, unwaith eto, yn rhywbeth y mae'r blaidd hon yn ei gefnogi. Dywedwch eich bod am gael rhywfaint o gonsensws ar weithredu ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy yn y dyfodol, felly pa ran yr ydych yn ei rhagweld i'r Comisiwn Newid yn yr Hinsawdd, os bydd un o gwbl, wrth ddatblygu'r cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy newydd ac wrth ei fonitro ar ôl hynny?

3.30 p.m.

Jane Davidson: The statutory duty on sustainable development requires the Assembly to make a sustainable development scheme, to publish annual reports on progress in implementing the scheme, and, every four years, following each election, to publish an additional report on the effectiveness of what has been done to keep the scheme under review and to consider whether the scheme should be remade or revised.

Jane Davidson: Mae'r ddyletswydd statudol ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy yn golygu ei bod yn rhaid i'r Cynulliad lunio cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy, cyhoeddi adroddiadau blynyddol ynghylch y cynnydd a wnaethpwyd o ran gweithredu'r cynllun, a, bob pedair blynedd, yn dilyn pob etholiad, cyhoeddi adroddiad arall ynghylch effeithiolrwydd yr hyn sydd wedi ei wneud i gadw'r cynllun dan adolygiad ac ystyried a ddylid ail-lunio'r cynllun neu'i ddiwygio.

My statement fully lays out that not only have we complied with our statutory duty, but, in remaking the scheme, we are looking at taking on more reviews than our statutory duty requires in how we move forward. In my statement, I said explicitly that, over the coming months, officials will develop the new scheme in consultation with policy colleagues across the Assembly Government and our stakeholders. It will be subject to full consultation in the autumn, and I will look to come back to Plenary at that time for further views. Therefore, the timetable is clearly laid out.

Mae fy natganiad yn gosod nid yn unig y ffaith inni gydymffurfio â'r ddyletswydd statudol sydd gennym, ond, ein bod, o ail-lunio'r cynllun, yn ystyried cynnal mwy o adolygiadau na'r hyn sy'n ofynnol dan ein dyletswydd statudol o ran y ffordd y byddwn yn symud ymlaen. Yn fy natganiad, dywedais yn agored y bydd y swyddogion yn ystod y misoedd nesaf yn datblygu'r cynllun newydd gan ymgynghori â chyd-Aelodau ym maes polisi ar draws Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ac â'n rhanddeiliaid. Bydd ymgynghori llawn yn ei gylch yn yr hydref, a bwriadaf ddychwelyd i'r Cyfarfod Llawn y pryd hynny i geisio rhagor o safbwyntiau. Felly, mae'r amserlen wedi ei gosod yn glir.

In terms of the previous scheme, 96 per cent of the actions in the sustainable development action plan have either been met or are in progress. We already have a mechanism by which we report annually in terms of looking at previous actions. The general consensus, from the reviews that have already been undertaken, is that rather than our having a separate action plan, there needs to be a

O ran y cynllun blaenorol, mae 96 y cant o gamau gweithredu'r cynllun gweithredu datblygu cynaliadwy naill ai wedi eu cyflawni neu maent ar waith. Mae gennym ddull eisoes o gyflwyno adroddiadau blynyddol o ran bwrw golwg dros gamau gweithredu blaenorol. Yn ôl y consensws cyffredinol a gododd o'r adolygiadau sydd eisoes wedi eu cynnal, yn hytrach na

strategic framework that impacts on everything that the Assembly Government does. That is why we are taking the framework approach forward.

You must not confuse climate change with sustainable development. That is why the Climate Change Commission is not referred to in this statement. Climate change is a consequence of unsustainable development. When we consult, members of the Climate Change Commission will have an opportunity to contribute to the sustainable development scheme, which will impact on the whole of the Government agenda.

Leanne Wood: I welcome the statement, particularly the emphasis on the need to live within our means—the ‘One Wales: One Planet’ agenda. What consideration has been given to the principles of WWF’s One Planet Wales campaign as the vision for a sustainable Wales? Will the new scheme reflect the urgency and importance of the new evidence of climate change, which was not available prior to the development of the current scheme? How will the new scheme reflect that new evidence?

It has been argued that sustainable development has not yet been mainstreamed across all Government departments. A new sustainable development scheme needs to drive fully all of the Welsh Assembly Government’s policies and programmes and should require all strategies and policies to include a published assessment of their contribution towards sustainable development. Will the new scheme require such assessments or not?

Jane Davidson: The intention of the new scheme is that it will cover all programmes, rather than being a separate strategy running alongside other strategies, so that it becomes the overarching framework. The ecological footprint work is incredibly important here, because the ecological footprint is one of the five high-level indicators in sustainable development. As I said in my statement, there are three areas of work taking on almost two thirds of our ecological footprint for which, if

chynllun gweithredu ar wahân, yr hyn y mae ei angen yw fframwaith strategol a fydd yn effeithio ar bopeth y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei wneud. Dyna pam yr ydym yn bwrw ymlaen â’r dull fframwaith.

Peidiwch â chamgymryd newid yn yr hinsawdd am ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Dyna pam nad oes sôn am y Comisiwn ar y Newid yn yr Hinsawdd yn y datganiad hwn. Mae newid yn yr hinsawdd yn digwydd o ganlyniad i ddatblygu anghynaliadwy. Pan ymgynghorwn ag aelodau’r Comisiwn ar y Newid yn yr Hinsawdd cawn gyfle i gyfrannu at y cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy, a fydd yn effeithio ar holl agenda’r Llywodraeth.

Leanne Wood: Yr wyf yn croesawu’r datganiad, yn enwedig y pwyslais ar yr angen i beidio â byw’n uwch na’n modd, yn arbennig felly’r pwyslais ar—agenda ‘Cymru’n Un: Un Blaned’. Pa ystyriaeth a roddwyd i egwyddorion Cymru Un Blaned yr WWF fel gweledigaeth ar gyfer Cymru gynaliadwy? A fydd y cynllun newydd yn adlewyrchu pwysigrwydd dybryd y dystiolaeth newydd dros y newid yn yr hinsawdd, nad oedd ar gael cyn i’r cynllun presennol gael ei ddatblygu? Ym mha fodd y bydd y cynllun newydd yn adlewyrchu’r dystiolaeth newydd honno?

Dadleuwyd nad yw datblygu cynaliadwy wedi ei ddwyn i brif ffrwd holl adrannau’r Llywodraeth. Mae angen i gynllun datblygu cynaliadwy newydd fod yn sylfaen i holl bolisiau a rhaglenni Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a dylai fynnu bod yr holl strategaethau a pholisiau’n cynnwys asesiad cyhoeddiedig o’u cyfraniad at ddatblygu cynaliadwy. A fydd y fath asesiadau’n ofynnol dan y cynllun newydd ai peidio?

Jane Davidson: Bwriedir i’r cynllun newydd gynnwys pob rhaglen, yn hytrach na’i fod yn strategaeth ar wahân a fyddai’n rhedeg ochr yn ochr â’r strategaethau eraill, fel y bydd yn mynd yn fframwaith cyffredinol. Mae’r gwaith ar yr ôl-troed ecolegol yn hynod bwysig yn hyn o beth, oherwydd mae’r ôl-troed ecolegol ymhlith y pum dangosydd lefel uchel ym maes datblygu cynaliadwy. Fel y dywedais yn fy natganiad, mae tri maes gwaith yn gyfrifol am ddau draean bron o’n

we took our 'One Wales' agenda forward, we would be able to stabilise our footprint, but we would have to do a great deal more to reduce it. The ecological footprint work, the work of the Climate Change Commission, the work that we will do in terms of the 3 per cent reduction, the work that we will do in the context of a national energy efficiency and savings plan, the work that we are doing through the environment strategy and the areas in my department, will also be reflected in the work that has been done and will be done in other departments to drive this agenda forward.

I was privileged to launch the WWF work on One Planet Wales. I am delighted that the work that we have done to date is strongly supported by the WWF and others, because it is taking us in the direction that One Planet Wales spelled out. It is a direction that I hope that all Assembly Members will be prepared to support and share in.

Michael German: On behalf of the Welsh Liberal Democrats, I also thank the Minister for her statement today, particularly for her focus on behavioural change, which is crucial if we are to make an impact in terms of reaching our targets. We need to change attitudes to realise our aims and ambitions for the future. I also pay tribute to the work of WWF. You must have made the organisation very happy today, because the title of the scheme, 'One Wales: One Planet', is almost the same as the title it has used for its campaign. That is a sign that its use of the ecological footprint is becoming a worldwide method for measuring progress. The work that it has done lays out a clear pathway for us, and an ambition that is much greater than that we may have had in the past.

This is the second time that the scheme has been remade, and I am grateful that it is being remade. It would be silly not to have a scheme. However, our speed of travel towards our goal needs to accelerate dramatically. In the report it is stated that, in 2001, the ecological footprint for Wales was

hól-troed ecolegol, a phetaem yn bwrw ymlaen ag agenda 'Cymru'n Un', gallem sefydlogi ein hól-troed, ond byddai'n rhaid inni wneud llawer mwy i'w leihau. Caiff y gwaith ar yr ôl-troed ecolegol, gwaith y Comisiwn ar y Newid yn yr Hinsawdd, y gwaith a wnawn o ran y gostyngiad 3 y cant, y gwaith a wnawn parthed cynllun arbedion ac effeithlonrwydd ynni cenedlaethol, y gwaith yr ydym yn ei wneud drwy'r strategaeth amgylcheddol a'r meysydd yn fy adran innau, hefyd eu hadlewyrchu yn y gwaith sydd wedi ei wneud a'r gwaith a gaiff ei wneud mewn adrannau eraill i symud yr agenda hon yn ei blaen.

Bu'n ffrainc imi lansio gwaith yr WWF ar Un Blaned Cymru. Yr wyf wrth fy modd bod y gwaith a wnaethom hyd yma wedi ennyn cefnogaeth frwd gan yr WWF ac eraill, oherwydd mae'n ein dwyn i'r cyfeiriad a osodwyd yn Un Blaned Cymru. Mae hwnnw'n gyfeiriad y gobeithiaf fod holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn barod i'w gefnogi a'i rannu.

Michael German: Ar ran Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, hoffwn ddiolch i'r Gweinidog am ei datganiad heddiw, yn enwedig am ei ffocws ar newid ymddygiad, sy'n hanfodol os ydym am gyflawni rhywbeth o ran cyrraedd y targedau sydd gennym. Mae angen inni newid agweddau er mwyn gwireddu'r nodau a'r uchelgeisiau sydd gennym ar gyfer y dyfodol. Rhoddaf deyrnged hefyd i waith yr WWF. Rhaid eich bod wedi gwneud y corff hwnnw'n hapus iawn heddiw, oherwydd mae teitl y cynllun, 'Cymru'n Un:Un Blaned', bron yr un fath â'r teitl a ddefnyddiodd yntau ar gyfer ei ymgyrch. Dyma arwydd bod defnyddio'r ôl-troed ecolegol ganddo'n dod yn ddull byd eang ar gyfer mesur cynnydd. Mae'r gwaith y mae wedi ei wneud yn gosod llwybr clir inni, ac uchelgais llawer mwy na dim oll a fu gennym o'r blaen.

Dyma'r eildro i'r cynllun gael ei ail-lunio, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ei fod yn cael ei ail-lunio. Byddai'n hurt o beth pe na bai gennym gynllun. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gyflymu'n ddirfawr yn ein hymgais i gyrraedd y nod. Yn yr adroddiad dywedir bod ôl-troed ecolegol Cymru yn 2001 yn 5.25 ha i bob unigolyn.

5.25 ha per person. It is now 5.16 ha, based on the 2003 figures, which have been provided by the same institute. If that is our rate of progress, then we will certainly not reach a 75 per cent reduction in our resource use by 2050, which is where we want to be. We need a reduction of 3.5 per cent per year, but 'One Wales' talks about 3 per cent per year. Are you prepared to increase that target now? I know that that is a minimum reduction of 3 per cent, but we need a 3.5 per cent reduction to achieve the ambition.

I would like to focus on two aspects of the work done by the Stockholm Environment Institute at York. Its report estimates that a 6.4 per cent reduction in the footprint for housing alone is possible by 2020. It states that this could be secured by retrofitting 5 per cent of the existing housing stock per year. From the work that has been done by the Sustainability Committee, you will know that that is a challenge that the committee would like you to pick up. If we are to achieve a 30 per cent reduction in relation to buildings, there will need to be a lot of retrofitting. Building regulations will need to be devolved to go with that. Can you give a timescale for your scheme now? When do you expect to accelerate the programme of retrofitting, and when do you expect to get building regulations devolved?

The second issue that I want to raise is microgeneration. We all remember the previous schemes where grant aid applications would open at 12 a.m., and, a minute later, the allocation for the month would be swallowed up. What will you be able to offer in the future to encourage greater use of microgeneration and to ensure a payback time that is sufficiently short that people are encouraged to install it? That implies work on feed-in tariffs, which I know that you are committed to.

You face many issues in the future, and I hope that you will be guided somewhat by the Sustainability Committee's work and its reports on housing and transport. Those areas alone account for 43 per cent of Wales's ecological footprint. Therefore, tackling the issues raised in those two reports would lead to some progress. I note that you have

Bellach mae'n 5.16 ha, yn ôl ffigurau 2003, a gafwyd gan yr un sefydliad. Os dyna'r cynnydd yr ydym yn ei gyflawni, yna mae'n sicr na fyddwn yn cyflawni gostyngiad o 75 y cant yn y defnydd a wnawn ar adnoddau erbyn 2050, sef yr hyn sy'n nod inni. Mae angen gostyngiad o 3.5 y cant y flwyddyn, ond yn 'Cymru'n Un' ceir sôn am 3 y cant y flwyddyn. A ydych yn fodlon cynyddu'r targed hwnnw bellach? Gwn mai gostyngiad sylfaenol o 3 y cant yw ystyr hynny, ond mae arnom angen gostyngiad o 3.5 y cant i gyflawni'r uchelgais.

Hoffwn ganolbwyntio ar ddwy agwedd ar waith Sefydliad Amgylcheddol Stockholm yng Nghaerefrog. Yn ei adroddiad amcangyfrifir y byddai'n bosibl cyflawni gostyngiad o 6.4 y cant yn ôl-troed tai erbyn 2020. Dywedir y gellid cyflawni hyn drwy ôl-ffitio 5 y cant o'r stoc dai bresennol bob blwyddyn. Yn ôl y gwaith a wnaethpwyd gan y Pwyllgor Cynaliadwyedd, gwyddoch y byddai'r pwyllgor hwnnw'n dymuno i chi dderbyn yr her honno. Os ydym am gyflawni gostyngiad o 30 y cant mewn adeiladau, bydd angen gwneud llawer iawn o waith ôl-ffitio. Bydd angen datganoli'r rheoliadau adeiladau i gyd-daro â hynny. A allwch roi amserlen inni yn awr ar gyfer eich cynllun? Pryd ydych yn disgwyl cyflymu'r rhaglen ôl-ffitio, a phryd ydych yn disgwyl y caiff y rheoliadau adeiladu eu datganoli?

Mae a wnelo'r ail fater yr wyf am ei godi â microgynhyrchu. Mae pawb yn cofio am y cynlluniau blaenorol lle byddai ceisiadau am grantiau'n agor am 12 a.m., ac yna, funud yn ddiweddarach, byddai dyraniad y mis wedi ei lyncu. Beth allwch gynnig at y dyfodol i annog defnyddio mwy ar ficrogynhyrchu a sicrhau cyfnod talu'n ôl a fydd yn ddigon byr i annog pobl i'w osod? Mae hynny'n awgrymu gwaith ar dollau bwydo mewn, yr hwn y gwn eich bod wedi ymrwymo iddo.

Yr ydych yn wynebu nifer o faterion at y dyfodol, a gobeithiaf y cewch eich tywys i ryw raddau gan waith y Pwyllgor Cynaliadwyedd a'i adroddiadau ynghylch tai a thrafnidiaeth. Mae'r meysydd hynny'n unig yn gyfrifol am 43 y cant o ôl-troed ecolegol Cymru. Felly, pe gellid mynd i'r afael â'r materion a godir yn y ddau adroddiad hynny

accepted most of the recommendations in these reports, but we would like you to look again at the recommendations to see whether you can be more precise about how you will take forward those key areas that I have mentioned—support for microgeneration and retrofitting—which account for so much of the problem that we will need to deal with in Wales.

Jane Davidson: There are several points that I want to make in response. You said that I face many issues in the future, although perhaps by ‘you’ you meant the Welsh Assembly Government. I would say ‘we’, because every Member in this Chamber has to take responsibility for this agenda if we are to take it forward. There are huge challenges for us. The ecological footprint work is a contributing factor in terms of the sustainable development scheme and I am delighted that the lead that Wales has shown in this work has been recognised publicly by the European commissioner. He has blogged about the importance of what a small country such as Wales can do in leading the way in this area.

3.40 p.m.

You talked about the importance of energy efficiency. I have already said that that issue will be picked up not just in the narrow environment of the current HEES legislation, which we have found is not fit for purpose and therefore needs to be reviewed, but also in the context of a wider agenda about every single action that this Assembly Government can support or innovate in the context of a national energy and efficiency savings plan, which will come out for consultation in the autumn.

I have reported on building regulations before. The dialogue is continuing and our timeline for the devolution of building regulations remains within 2008. On microgeneration, we have taken a number of initiatives as an Assembly Government to take forward this agenda. We have changed

byddai hynny'n peri rhywfaint o gynnydd. Sylwaf eich bod wedi derbyn y rhan fwyaf o argymhellion yr adroddiadau hyn, ond hoffem petaech yn bwrw golwg eto dros yr argymhellion i weld a allwch fod yn fwy manwl ynglŷn â sut y byddwch yn bwrw ymlaen â'r meysydd allweddol hynny a grybwyllais—cefnogi microgynhyrchu ac ôl-ffitio—sy'n gyfrifol am gynifer o'r problemau y bydd angen inni ymdrin â hwy yng Nghymru.

Jane Davidson: Yr wyf am wneud nifer o bwyntiau fel ymateb. Dywedasoch fy mod yn wynebu nifer o faterion at y dyfodol, er efallai mai'r hyn a olygwch yn hynny o beth yw Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Dywedwn innau mai cyfrifoldeb i ni ydyw oherwydd mae'n rhaid i bob Aelod o'r Siambr hon dderbyn cyfrifoldeb dros yr agenda hon os ydym am fwrw ymlaen â hi. Mae heriau enfawr yn ein hwynebu. Mae'r gwaith ar yr ôl-troed ecolegol yn un ffactor cyfranogol o ran y cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy ac yr wyf wrth fy modd bod yr arweiniad y mae Cymru wedi ei ddangos yn y gwaith hwn wedi ei gydnabod yn gyhoeddus gan y comisiynydd Ewropeaidd. Bu yntau'n blogio ynghylch pwysigrwydd yr hyn y gall gwlad fechan fel Cymru ei wneud o ran arwain y ffordd yn y maes hwn.

Cyfeiriasoch at bwysigrwydd effeithlonrwydd ynni. Dywedais eisoes y caiff y mater sylw nid yn unig o ran amgylchfyd cyfyng y ddeddfwriaeth gyfredol sy'n ymwneud â HEES, y cafwyd nad yw'n addas at y diben ac y mae angen ei adolygu o'r herwydd, ond hefyd o ran agenda ehangach sy'n ymwneud â phob gweithred y gall Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ei chefnogi neu'i rhoi ar waith yng nghyd-destun cynllun cenedlaethol effeithlonrwydd ynni ac arbed ynni, y bydd ymgynghori yn ei gylch yn yr Hydref.

Yr wyf wedi cyflwyno adroddiadau ynghylch y rheoliadau adeiladu o'r blaen. Mae'r trafod yn parhau ac mae'r amserlen ar gyfer datganoli'r rheoliadau adeiladu'n dal i fod o fewn 2008. O ran microgynhyrchu yr ydym wedi cychwyn nifer o fentrau fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i fwrw ymlaen â'r

our planning propositions, which will lead to regulations in the autumn. We strongly support feed-in tariffs and we are participating in the low carbon building pilot programme, for which I have allocated an additional £1 million on top of the £1 million that we have been given by the UK Government for taking that forward. We currently have pilot schemes in terms of renewable energy for HEES customers and we are looking at convergence funding, additionally topping up on microgeneration, where appropriate, in the context of regeneration. We will continue to look at opportunities for microgeneration.

There are major challenges for us all and we will continue, as an Assembly Government, to focus on social justice. When I have recommendations from the committee that are focused on social justice, rather than a blanket approach in terms of retrofitting, and ensure that we can focus our resources most effectively, then, as I have said previously, I would be happy to consider them.

Alun Davies: Minister, thank you for your statement. I think that everyone on all sides of the Chamber will welcome your statement this afternoon.

As a member of the Sustainability Committee, I would like to carry on with questions on that subject. Minister, how do you see the relationship developing between the sustainable delivery programme and the rest of the public sector? A key issue that the committee identified in our work on carbon reduction is that the public sector has a key role to play as an exemplar of good practice and that it also has a leadership role. When I refer to the public sector, I not only mean the Welsh Assembly Government in Cardiff, but also the whole of local government and the rest of the Welsh public service, which has an important role in providing local leadership, regional leadership and sectoral leadership in different areas of public life.

Jane Davidson: Local government is committed to working in the context of

agenda hon. Yr ydym wedi newid ein cynigion parthed cynllunio, a bydd hynny'n esgor ar reoliadau yn yr hydref. Cefnogwn yn frwd y tollau bwydo mewn ac yr ydym yn cymryd rhan yn y rhaglen beilot ar adeiladau carbon isel, yr hon yr wyf wedi dyrannu £1 miliwn yn ychwanegol ati ar ben yr hyn a gawsom gan Lywodraeth y DU i fwrw ymlaen â hynny. Ar hyn o bryd mae gennym gynlluniau peilot o ran ynni adnewyddadwy ar gyfer cwsmeriaid HEES ac yr ydym yn chwilio am gyllid cydgyfeirio, gan roi arian ychwanegol at ficrogynhyrchu, lle bydd yn briodol, yng nghyd-destun adfywio. Byddwn yn parhau i ystyried cyfleoedd i ficrogynhyrchu.

Mae heriau mawr yn ein hwynebu ni oll a byddwn yn dal i ganolbwyntio, fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ar gyfiawnder cymdeithasol. Pan gaf argymhellion gan y pwyllgor sy'n seiliedig ar gyfiawnder cymdeithasol, yn hytrach na syniadau cyffredinol ynglŷn ag ôl-ffitio, gan sicrhau y gallwn ganolbwyntio ein hadnoddau yn y dull mwyaf effeithiol, yna, fel y dywedais o'r blaen, byddwn yn falch o'u hystyried.

Alun Davies: Weinidog, diolch am eich datganiad. Credaf fod pawb ar bob tu i'r Siambr yn croesawu eich datganiad y prynhawn yma.

Fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor Cynaliadwyedd, hoffwn ofyn cwestiynau ar y pwnc hwnnw. Weinidog, sut yr ydych yn meddwl y bydd y berthynas yn datblygu rhwng y rhaglen cyflenwi cynaliadwy a gweddill y sector cyhoeddus? Un o'r materion allweddol y bu i'r pwyllgor nodi yn ein gwaith ar leihau carbon yw bod rôl allweddol gan y sector cyhoeddus i'w chwarae fel enghraifft o arferion da a bod iddo rôl arweiniol hefyd. Pan wyf yn cyfeirio at y sector cyhoeddus, nid Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ym Mae Caerdydd yn unig a olygaf, ond yn hytrach lywodraeth leol yn ei chyfanrwydd a gweddill gwasanaeth cyhoeddus Cymru, sydd â rôl bwysig i'w chwarae o ran rhoi arweiniad lleol, arweiniad yn rhanbarthol ac arweiniad i sectorau mewn gwahanol feysydd o fywyd cyhoeddus.

Jane Davidson: Mae llywodraeth leol wedi ymrwymo i weithio yng nghyd-destun

sustainable development. We are leading by example: 80 per cent of the electricity in our core estate comes from renewable sources and the 57 largest NHS sites in Wales are using zero-carbon rated green tariffs to supply their grid electricity. The building that we are in now has a Building Research Establishment environmental assessment method 'excellent' rating and has won the sustainability award at the Royal Institution of Chartered Surveyors awards. The Wales for Africa framework contributes towards international development and 'Making our Money Talk' is promoting and implementing sustainable procurement through Value Wales. There is a critical role for the public sector in sustainable procurement, which fits strongly with that fantastic announcement that I was able to make last week, due to the work of the Wales Fair Trade Forum, and I am glad that so many Members have commended that announcement. For Wales to be the first fair-trade nation in the world is an extraordinary achievement, and I am hoping that that commitment to fair trade will also lead our public sector to be committed to the contribution that it can make in terms of sustainable procurement more widely.

Mark Isherwood: Given the widely accepted definition that sustainable development must meet the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their needs, I will start by apologising for my glasses, which are a sustainable alternative to my normal reading glasses, which I lost at the weekend. [*Laughter.*]

Moving on from that, what role do you foresee public consultation playing in not just the development of the strategy, but also in the component parts when they manifest themselves in people's areas in terms of planning applications or otherwise? I am conscious of several Public Services Ombudsmen for Wales's recent decisions that have questioned the degree of local consultation on certain planning applications.

What role do you see environmental impact assessments and health impact assessments having, given the findings of certain recent

datblygu cynaliadwy. Yr ydym yn arwain drwy esiampl: mae 80 y cant o'r trydan yn ein hystad graidd yn dod o adnoddau adnewyddadwy ac mae 57 safle mwyaf y GIG yn defnyddio tollau gwyrdd di-garbon i gyflenwi eu trydan grid. Mae'r adeilad yr ydym ynddo ar hyn o bryd wedi ei raddio'n 'rhagorol' gan y Sefydliad Ymchwil Adeiladau drwy'r dull asesu amgylcheddol ac enillodd wobr cynaliadwyedd yng ngwobrau Sefydliad Brenhinol y Syrfewyr Siartredig. Mae fframwaith Cymru dros Affrica'n cyfrannu at ddatblygu rhyngwladol ac mae 'Gwneud i'n Hariar Siarad' yn hybu ac yn gweithredu caffael cynaliadwy drwy Gwerth Cymru. Mae i'r sector cyhoeddus rôl hollbwysig o ran caffael cynaliadwy, sy'n gydnaws iawn â'r datganiad gwych hwnnw y medrais ei wneud yr wythnos diwethaf, oherwydd gwaith Fforwm Masnach Deg Cymru, ac yr wyf yn falch bod cynifer o Aelodau wedi cymeradwyo'r datganiad hwnnw. Mae'n dipyn o gamp mai Cymru yw gwlad masnach deg gyntaf y byd, ac yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd yr ymrwymiad hwn i fasnach deg yn peri i'r sector cyhoeddus ymrwymo'n fwy eang i'r cyfraniad y gall ei wneud o safbwynt caffael cynaliadwy.

Mark Isherwood: Ac ystyried y diffiniad a dderbynnir yn gyffredinol ei bod yn rhaid i ddatblygu cynaliadwy fodloni anghenion y presennol heb gyfaddawdu gallu cenedlaethau'r dyfodol i fodloni'u hanghenion hwy, dechreuaf drwy ymddiheuro am fy sbectol, sy'n ddewis arall cynaliadwy yn lle fy sbectol ddarllen arferol y bu imi'i cholli'r wythnos diwethaf. [*Chwerthin.*]

Gan symud ymlaen oddi wrth hynny, pa rôl y rhagwelwch y bydd ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus yn ei chwarae nid yn unig i lunio'r strategaeth, ond hefyd yn y cydrannau wrth iddynt ymddangos yn ardaloedd pobl o safbwynt ceisiadau cynllunio neu fel arall? Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o amryw o benderfyniadau diweddar Ombwdsmon Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Cymru sydd wedi codi cwestiynau am raddau'r ymgynghori lleol ar geisiadau cynllunio penodol.

Pa rôl y credwch y bydd gan asesiadau o'r effaith ar yr amgylchedd ac asesiadau o'r effaith ar iechedd, ac ystyried canfyddiadau

public inquiries and concerns expressed publicly on a number of matters, as other political agendas have sometimes taken priority over protected species or other environmental systems?

Finally, on my pet issue, I firmly believe—and I am sure that you have heard this before—that housing is key to sustainable regeneration development and social justice. I note that it is not mentioned specifically how many other areas are in your statement, so could you comment on that, not only in terms of the need for the seismic shift in terms of supply referred to in the Joseph Rowntree Foundation report last week, but also in terms of planning, so that we can tackle those local supply issues where land that falls outside the current technical advice notes is available?

I will also briefly refer to energy efficiency. I understand that Wales has the highest proportion of hard-to-treat houses in the UK, and that 70 per cent of the houses that will exist in 2050 already exist today. Therefore, merely focusing on the other 30 per cent will not be sufficient to tackle the sustainability goals that we all share.

Jane Davidson: As the ecological footprint work shows, housing is the biggest contributor, as it accounts for 25 per cent, so it is a full quarter of our ecological footprint. Therefore, it is important that we look at this issue extremely seriously. The report commends the Assembly Government for its ambition in having the aspiration of having zero carbon buildings from 2011 onwards, because that is a potent statement about the Assembly Government's commitment to wanting to ensure that future buildings are built as sustainably as possible. The committee has done important work and taken a huge amount of evidence on issues related to carbon reduction in particular, which leads us to issues around energy efficiency, which will be picked up in the national energy efficiency and savings plan. I think that you can see from the work that has been done so far by this new administration that housing is an important part of our agenda, and will be increasingly so as we

rhai ymchwiliadau cyhoeddus diweddar a'r pryderon a fynegwyd yn gyhoeddus ynghylch nifer o faterion, gan fod agendâu gwleidyddol eraill weithiau wedi cymryd blaenoriaeth dros rywogaethau a warchodir neu systemau amgylcheddol eraill?

Yn olaf, o safbwynt fy hoff fater, credaf yn bendant—ac yr wyf yn sicr ichi glywed hyn o'r blaen—fod tai yn allweddol i ddatblygu adfywio cynaliadwy a chyfiawnder cymdeithasol. Sylwaf na chrybwyllir yn benodol faint o ardaloedd eraill sydd yn eich datganiad, felly a allech wneud sylw am hynny, nid yn unig o ran yr angen am y symudiad seismig mewn cyflenwad y cyfeirir ato yn adroddiad Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree yr wythnos diwethaf, ond hefyd o ran cynllunio, fel y gallwn fynd i'r afael â'r materion cyflenwi lleol hynny pan fydd tir sy'n syrthio y tu allan i'r nodiadau cyngor technegol cyfredol ar gael?

Cyfeirir yn sydyn hefyd at effeithlonrwydd ynni. Deallaf mai yng Nghymru y mae'r gyfran uchaf o dai anodd-eu-trin yn y DU, a bod 70 y cant o'r tai a fydd yn bodoli yn 2050 eisoes yn bodoli heddiw. Felly, ni fydd canolbwyntio ar y 30 y cant arall yn unig yn ddigonol i fynd i'r afael â'r nodau cynaliadwyedd yr ydym oll yn eu rhannu.

Jane Davidson: Fel y dengys y gwaith ar ôl-traed ecolegol, tai yw'r cyfrannwr mwyaf, oherwydd mai dyma sydd i gyfrif am 25 y cant, felly mae'n chwarter cyflawn o'n hól-troed ecolegol. Felly, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn edrych ar y mater hwn yn ddifrifol dros ben. Mae'r adroddiad yn canmol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad am ei huchelgais o gael y dyhead o fod ag adeiladau dim carbon o 2011 ymlaen, oherwydd bod hwnnw'n ddatganiad grymus am ymrwymiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i fod eisiau sicrhau bod adeiladau'r dyfodol yn cael eu hadeiladu mor gynaliadwy â phosibl. Mae'r pwyllgor wedi gwneud gwaith pwysig ac wedi cymryd llawer iawn o dystiolaeth am faterion sy'n ymwneud â lleihau carbon yn enwedig, gan ein harwain at faterion sy'n ymwneud ag effeithlonrwydd ynni, materion y cyfeirir atynt yn y cynllun arbedion ac effeithlonrwydd ynni cenedlaethol. Credaf y gallwch weld o'r gwaith a wnaethpwyd cyn belled gan y weinyddiaeth newydd hon bod

move to ensure that those people across Wales in social housing, for example, are served well by the Welsh housing quality standard in improving energy efficiency in their homes.

We must remember that some 93,000 homes have already been helped by the home energy efficiency scheme, and the dramatic increase in investment required from the energy suppliers in the new carbon emissions reduction target arrangements means that we are going to see many more homes insulated. On 3 July, I will launch a householders' guide to climate change, which will be made available in planning offices so that people can look at the types of changes that they should be making to their homes to improve their sustainability. Therefore, we are looking at several ways across the Assembly Government to pick up this agenda.

tai yn rhan bwysig o'n agenda, a bydd yn gynyddol bwysig wrth inni symud i sicrhau bod y bobl hynny ledled Cymru mewn tai cymdeithasol, er enghraifft, yn cael eu gwasanaethu'n dda gan safon ansawdd tai Cymru drwy wella effeithlonrwydd ynni yn eu cartrefi.

Rhaid inni gofio bod oddeutu 93,000 o gartrefi eisoes wedi cael eu helpu gan y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref, a bod y cynnydd aruthrol mewn buddsoddiad sy'n ofynnol oddi wrth y cwmnïau cyflenwi ynni yn nhrefniadau newydd y targed lleihau allyriadau carbon yn golygu y byddwn yn gweld llawer yn rhagor o dai'n cael eu hinswleiddio. Ar 3 Gorffennaf, byddaf yn lansio arweiniad i ddeiliaid tai ar y newid yn yr hinsawdd; bydd ar gael mewn swyddfeydd cynllunio fel y gall pobl edrych ar y mathau o newidiadau y dylent fod yn eu gwneud yn eu cartrefi i wella'u cynaliadwyedd. Felly, yr ydym yn edrych ar nifer o ffyrdd ar draws Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o gyflymu'r agenda hon.

Datganiad am Adolygiad o Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru Statement on the Review of Health Commission Wales

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Edwina Hart): In October 2007, I asked Professor Mansel Aylward CB, chair of the Wales Centre for Health, to undertake a thorough review of the role and remit of Health Commission Wales. That request was not the result of any widespread anxiety or public agitation about the organisation; rather, it arose from concerns that were raised with me, as Health Minister, in discussions with patients and clinicians and in correspondence received at my office.

3.50 p.m.

The review has been published this morning and I am, of course, immensely grateful to Professor Aylward and his team for the work that they have undertaken. The report makes sober reading. It confirms that this Assembly was correct to have established a national organisation to undertake the commissioning of specialised and tertiary services in Wales. However, it suggests that the commission laboured, from the outset, under a number of

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Edwina Hart): Ym mis Hydref 2007, gofynnais i'r Athro Mansel Aylward CB, cadeirydd Canolfan Iechyd Cymru, gynnal adolygiad trylwyr o rôl a chylch gorchwyl Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru. Ni ddeilliodd y cais hwnnw o unrhyw bryder cyffredinol nac anniddigrwydd o blith y cyhoedd am y sefydliad; yn hytrach, cododd o bryderon a godwyd gyda mi, fel Gweinidog dros Iechyd, mewn trafodaethau gyda chleifion a chlinigwyr ac mewn gohebiaeth a ddaeth i'm swyddfa.

Cyhoeddwyd yr adolygiad y bore yma ac yr wyf, wrth gwrs, yn ddiolchgar dros ben i'r Athro Aylward a'i dîm am y gwaith a wnaethant. Mae'n adroddiad sobreiddiol. Mae'n cadarnhau bod y Cynulliad hwn yn iawn i fod wedi sefydlu corff cenedlaethol i gomisiynu gwasanaethau arbenigol a thrydyddol yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, mae'n awgrymu i'r comisiwn lafurio, o'r dechrau, dan nifer o anawsterau cynhenid a

inherent difficulties that hindered it from discharging its duties as effectively as both it and I would have wished.

The review's major purpose is to inform thinking for the future. I will concentrate, in this statement, on its conclusions and recommendations. To understand those proposals, however, it is important to set out the four key ways in which Professor Aylward believes the current functioning of HCW to have been affected by systemic difficulties. Before doing so, however, I will quote from the foreword to the report, which pays tribute to,

'the industry, commitment and devotion of the staff at Health Commission Wales'.

Nothing that I have to say this afternoon should be taken as criticism of individual staff members. Thanks to their efforts, the report concludes that:

'A very large number of patients have accessed successfully specialised services commissioned by Health Commission Wales without encountering any problems. Indeed the very great majority of these patients will have been unaware of the pivotal role of HCW in securing the specialist treatments for them.'

However, against that background, real and avoidable difficulties were experienced throughout the commission's history. The report traces five specific difficulties. First, it identifies flaws in HCW's governance arrangements. While it had a publicly appointed and independent chair, that post was advisory and unsupported by independent non-executive directors. The report sets out the further steps that could have been taken to reinforce the independence of the organisation in the eyes of the public and in terms of how it went about its task.

Secondly, the report concludes that HCW was never sufficiently funded to undertake the burgeoning work that fell to its responsibility. In part, the organisation suffered from a failure to review the allocation of these responsibilities between

fu'n ei atal rhag cyflawni'i ddyletswyddau mor effeithiol ag y byddai ef a minnau wedi dymuno.

Diben mawr yr adolygiad yw cyfrannu at syniadau ar gyfer y dyfodol. Canolbwyntiaf, yn y datganiad hwn, ar ei gasgliadau a'i argymhellion. I ddeall y cynigion hynny, fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig gosod allan y pedair ffordd allweddol y cred yr Athro Aylward y bu i anawsterau systemig effeithio ar weithrediad cyfredol CIC. Cyn gwneud hynny, fodd bynnag, dyfynnaf o ragair yr adroddiad, sy'n rhoi teyrnged i,

ddiwydiant, ymrwymiad ac ymroddiad y staff yng Nghomisiwn Iechyd Cymru.

Ni ddylai ddim sydd gennyf i'w ddweud y prynhawn yma gael ei gymryd fel beirniadaeth o aelodau staff unigol. Diolch i'w hymdrechion, mae'r adroddiad yn dod i'r casgliad bod:

Nifer fawr iawn o gleifion wedi llwyddo i gael mynediad at wasanaethau arbenigol wedi'u comisiynu gan Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru heb gael unrhyw broblemau. Yn wir ni fydd mwyafrif helaeth y cleifion hyn wedi bod yn ymwybodol o rôl ganolog CIC wrth sicrhau'r triniaethau arbenigol iddynt.

Fodd bynnag, yn erbyn y cefndir hwnnw, wynebwyd anawsterau gwirioneddol ac anochel gydol hanes y comisiwn. Mae'r adroddiad yn amlinellu pump o anawsterau penodol. I ddechrau, mae'n nodi diffygion yn nhrefniadau llywodraethu CIC. Er bod ganddo gadeirydd annibynnol a benodir yn gyhoeddus, swydd ymgynghorol ydoedd ac nis cefnogwyd gan gyfarwyddwyr anweithredol annibynnol. Mae'r adroddiad yn gosod allan y camau pellach y gellid bod wedi'u cymryd i atgyfnerthu annibyniaeth y sefydliad yn llygaid y cyhoedd ac o safbwynt y modd yr aeth i'r afael â'i dasgau.

Yn ail, mae'r adroddiad yn dod i'r casgliad na chafodd CIC erioed ei ariannu'n ddigonol i gyflawni'r gwaith cynyddol a syrthiai'n gyfrifoldeb iddo. Yn rhannol, dioddefodd y sefydliad gan fethiant i adolygu dyraniad y cyfrifoldebau hyn rhwng gwahanol lefelau'r

different levels of the NHS. Some treatments that were new in 2003 have become routine five years later, but no mechanism existed through which responsibilities could be amended to reflect such changes. The report also records how new infusions of funding have been provided to HCW at different intervals in its history. Its conclusion, however, is that a mismatch between funding and responsibilities has been a recurring feature of the organisation's history.

The third of the report's major findings is that staffing was over-reliant on agency personnel and short-term contracts because of HR practices prevalent in the Welsh Assembly Government at the time. The burden on a small number of permanent staff has been considerable, creating, the report concludes,

'considerable stress and personal anxiety'.

As a result of these shortcomings, the report reaches a fourth conclusion that fractured lines of communication between HCW and local health boards had a direct impact on the service provided to some individual patients and to some patient groups, especially those with eating disorders and those accommodated in medium secure mental health units.

Finally, the report records the impact on HCW's work of unanticipated heavy volumes of referral for individual patient commissioning. Throughout the past five years, the impact of making decisions in individual cases has been felt both in terms of strain on the budget and the disproportionately heavy drain that dealing with these highly emotive conditions has on staff time and other resources. Professor Aylward concludes that the position was exacerbated by a process that was,

'not sufficiently transparent, easily understood or accessible to patients or clinicians'.

I hope to return to that point at the conclusion of this statement.

The analysis included in the report is thorough-going and shines a harsh light on

GIG. Mae rhai triniaethau a oedd yn newydd yn 2003 wedi dod yn rhai arferol bum mlynedd yn ddiweddarach, ond ni fodolai ddim peirianwaith y gellid ei ddefnyddio i addasu'r cyfrifoldebau i adlewyrchu newidiadau o'r fath. Cofnoda'r adroddiad hefyd fel y darparwyd arllwysyadau newydd o gyllid i CIC ar wahanol adegau yn ei hanes. Ei gasgliad, er hynny, yw y bu camgymhariad rhwng cyllid a chyfrifoldebau yn nodwedd fynych yn hanes y sefydliad.

Y trydydd canfyddiad mawr yn yr adroddiad yw bod staffio yn or-ddibynnol ar bersonél asiantaethau a chontractau tymor byr oherwydd arferion adnoddau gweithlu a oedd yn gyffredin yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar y pryd. Bu'r baich ar nifer fechan o staff parhaol yn sylweddol, gan greu, fel y casgla'r adroddiad,

orbryder personol a straen sylweddol.

O ganlyniad i'r diffygion hyn, daw'r adroddiad i bedwerydd casgliad y cafodd y llinellau cyfathrebu drylliedig rhwng CIC a'r byrddau iechyd lleol effaith uniongyrchol ar y gwasanaeth a ddarparwyd i rai cleifion unigol ac i rai grwpiau cleifion, yn enwedig i'r rheini ag anhwylderau bwyta a'r rheini a dderbyniwyd i unedau iechyd meddwl diogelwch canolig.

Yn olaf, mae'r adroddiad yn cofnodi'r effaith y bu i'r niferoedd mawr annisgwyl o atgyfeiriadau am gomisiynu ar gyfer cleifion unigol ei chael ar waith CIC. Gydol y pum mlynedd diwethaf, yr oedd effaith gwneud penderfyniadau mewn achosion unigol i'w themlo fel straen ar y gyllideb ac fel y dreth anghymesur o drwm y mae'r cyflyrau emosïynol iawn hyn yn ei rhoi ar amser staff ac adnoddau eraill. Mae'r Athro Aylward yn dod i'r casgliad bod y sefyllfa wedi'i gwaethygu gan broses,

nad oedd yn ddigon tryloyw, yn hawdd ei deall nac yn hygyrch i gleifion na chlinigwyr.

Gobeithiaf ddychwelyd at y pwynt hwnnw ar ddiwedd y datganiad hwn.

Mae'r dadansoddiad a gynhwysir yn yr adroddiad yn drylwyr iawn ac mae'n taflu

the inner workings of the organisation. However, the purpose for doing so is to allow us to look forward with more confidence. The key part of the team's work is to be found in the recommendations that arise from the analysis. This afternoon, I want to highlight some of the major points made and inform Assembly Members how I intend to respond to them.

The report's core conclusions flow from its understanding of HCW's difficulties. For the future it calls for a system of planning and contracting for specialist services that is truly at arm's length from Government and set up with a set of transparent internal business arrangements, which is possessed of sufficient and permanent expert staffing, is allocated a budget that is subject to regular review, is informed by an urgently revised list of specialist services and which has sufficient flexibility to respond to both innovation and mainstreaming in the future, as conditions change, as appropriate. Finally, and importantly, the report recommends a new, all-Wales system for appeals in relation to individual patient commissioning.

In relation to the first four recommendations, my intention is to respond to them as part of the general consultation on NHS reform, which I launched at the end of March. In that consultation document, I made reference to Professor Aylward's review, and the need for its conclusions to be fed into the debate on future structures, particularly in relation to the format adopted for a national board. That can now take place, and I have asked the director of the NHS in Wales to draw the report to the attention of all those who have already responded to the consultation, and to invite them to respond specifically to its contents by 30 June.

I particularly welcome the proposals that the report makes about individual patient commissioning. As I noted earlier, it is this aspect of HCW's work that has proved to be both highly contentious and has had the highest impact on staff morale. The solution that Professor Aylward's team proposes is one of far greater direct patient and public engagement in a clear and open decision-

goleuni'n ddiostur ar weithrediad mewnol y sefydliad. Fodd bynnag, diben gwneud hyn yw caniatáu inni edrych ymlaen gyda mwy o hyder. Mae'r rhan allweddol o waith y tîm i'w gweld yn yr argymhellion a gyfyd o'r dadansoddiad. Y prynhawn yma, hoffwn amlygu rhai o'r pwyntiau mwyaf a wnaethpwyd a hysbysu Aelodau'r Cynulliad o sut y bwriadaf ymateb iddynt.

Mae casgliadau craidd yr adroddiad yn llifo o'i ddealltwriaeth o anawsterau CIC. Ar gyfer y dyfodol mae'n galw am system o gynllunio a chontractio ar gyfer gwasanaethau arbenigol sydd yn wirioneddol ar hyd braich oddi wrth y Llywodraeth ac sydd wedi'i sefydlu gyda set o drefniadau busnes mewnol tryloyw, sy'n meddu ar staffio arbenigol parhaol a digonol, y dyrennir iddi gyllideb a adolygir yn rheolaidd, y dylanwadir arni gan restr o wasanaethau arbenigol a adolygir ar frys ac sydd â hyblygrwydd digonol i ymateb i arloesi a phrif ffrydio i'r dyfodol, wrth i gyflyrau newid, fel sy'n briodol. Yn olaf, ac yn bwysig, mae'r adroddiad yn argymhell system Gymru-gyfan, newydd ar gyfer apelïadau yng nghyswllt comisiynu ar gyfer cleifion unigol.

O safbwynt y pedwar argymhelliad cyntaf, fy mwriad yw ymateb iddynt fel rhan o'r ymgynghoriad cyffredinol ar ddiwygio'r GIG, ymgynghoriad a lansiais ddiwedd Mawrth. Yn y ddogfen ymgynghori honno, cyfeiriais at adolygiad yr Athro Aylward, a'r angen am i'w gasgliadau gael eu bwydo i'r ddadl ar strwythurau'r dyfodol, yn enwedig o safbwynt y fformat a fabwysiadir ar gyfer bwrdd cenedlaethol. Gall hynny ddigwydd yn awr, ac yr wyf wedi gofyn i gyfarwyddwr y GIG yng Nghymru dynnu sylw pawb sydd eisoes wedi ymateb i'r ymgynghoriad at yr adroddiad, a'u gwahodd i ymateb yn benodol i'w gynnwys erbyn 30 Mehefin.

Croesawaf yn arbennig y cynigion a wna'r adroddiad am gomisiynu ar gyfer cleifion unigol. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, yr agwedd hon ar waith CIC a fu'n gwbl gynhennus ac a gafodd yr effaith fwyaf ar forâl staff. Mae'r ateb a gynigia tîm yr Athro Aylward yn cynnig llawer mwy o gyswllt uniongyrchol gyda'r cleifion a'r cyhoedd mewn proses gwneud penderfyniadau glir ac

making process.

I am not one of those who believe that lay people cannot be trusted to be involved in these sorts of decisions. Undoubtedly, individual patient commissioning rests at the cutting edge of medical science, but the decisions that have to be made draw on issues of morality as well as of money and medicine, and rely as much on our shared understanding of what a national health service can be expected to provide as it does on technical intricacy. I am convinced that a substantially increased lay engagement, together with proper legal and medical representation in these profoundly difficult decisions, will lead to improved public confidence in both the process and its outcomes.

I can therefore say that I have already accepted this aspect of the report's work and have asked Professor Aylward and his team to provide me with one further piece of advice, consulting widely with patient groups, community health councils, clinicians and others to turn their recommendations into a set of detailed working proposals to take this forward.

Jonathan Morgan: I join the Minister in thanking Professor Mansel Aylward for this report. It is thorough and detailed and highlights the problems that Health Commission Wales has had in delivering on the agenda that was set for it. I also welcome the fact that Professor Aylward accepts that there is a strong argument for commissioning specialist and tertiary services at an all-Wales level and, as the Minister says, that fits in nicely with the review that she has commissioned into the structures of the national health service. I assume that some functions currently undertaken by Health Commission Wales will have to be undertaken by some form of organisation or another.

For several years, the fractures in the commissioning responsibilities of Health Commission Wales and local health boards have had a detrimental impact on the treatment of patients. That has been

agored.

Nid wyf fi'n un o'r rheini sy'n credu na ellir ymddiried mewn pobl leyg i fod yn gysylltiedig â'r mathau hyn o benderfyniadau. Heb amheuaeth, mae comisiynu ar gyfer cleifion unigol yn ddatblygiad blaengar ym myd gwyddoniaeth feddygol, ond mae'r penderfyniadau y mae'n rhaid eu gwneud yn ymwneud â moesoldeb yn ogystal ag arian a meddyginiaeth, ac mae'n dibynnu cymaint ar ein cydddealltwriaeth o'r hyn y gellir disgwyl i wasanaeth iechyd gwladol ei ddarparu ag y mae ar astrusi technegol. Yr wyf yn argyhoeddedig y bydd cynnydd sylweddol mewn ymgysylltiad lleyg, ynghyd â chynrychiolaeth gyfreithiol a meddygol briodol yn y penderfyniadau anodd aruthrol hyn, yn arwain at well hyder cyhoeddus yn y broses a'i chanlyniadau, fel ei gilydd.

Gallaf ddweud felly fy mod eisoes wedi derbyn yr agwedd hon ar waith yr adroddiad ac yr wyf wedi gofyn i'r Athro Aylward a'i dîm ddarparu imi un darn pellach o gyngor, gan ymgynghori'n eang â grwpiau cleifion, cynghorau iechyd cymuned, clinigwyr ac eraill er mwyn troi'u hargymhellion yn set o gynigion gweithredol manwl i roi hwn ar waith.

Jonathan Morgan: Ymunaf â'r Gweinidog i ddiolch i'r Athro Mansel Aylward am yr adroddiad hwn. Mae'n drylwyr ac yn fanwl ac yn amlygu'r problemau a gafodd Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru wrth gyflawni ar yr agenda a bennwyd iddo. Croesawaf hefyd y ffaith bod yr Athro Aylward yn derbyn bod dadl gref dros gomisiynu gwasanaethau arbenigol a thrydyddol ar lefel Cymru-gyfan ac, fel y dywed y Gweinidog, mae hynny'n cyd-fynd yn daclus â'r adolygiad y mae wedi'i gomisiynu i strwythurau'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Tybiaf y bydd yn rhaid i rai o'r swyddogaethau y mae Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru yn eu cyflawni ar hyn o bryd gael eu cyflawni gan ryw fath o sefydliad neu'i gilydd.

Am flynyddoedd lawer, mae'r craciadau yng nghyfrifoldebau comisiynu Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru a'r byrddau iechyd lleol wedi cael effaith andwyol ar driniaethau i gleifion. Ategwyd hynny gan amrywiol adroddiadau

underpinned by a variety of reports by the Public Services Ombudsman for Wales, and this report confirms what I have long believed: that there have been problems with Health Commission Wales, and that includes those in terms of its structure, budget, remit, and its relationship with the Assembly Government. There has also been a lack of understanding about its responsibilities, and that has led to a pretty poor patient experience, but also to a difficult set of circumstances for those people who work at Health Commission Wales. I join the Minister in paying tribute to the staff who work at Health Commission Wales—many of them are extremely capable and dedicated, and this is not a criticism of them. However, I am afraid that the report is a direct criticism of the Assembly Government, and of how it set up Health Commission Wales in the first place.

You rightly identify that the report points out problems with the governance arrangements. It was the Assembly Government that decided on the type of agency that it would be—one that would not be at arm's length—and as the reports makes clear, the creation and constitution of the national commissioning advisory board did not meet the board model recommended by Treasury guidelines. What was recommended was not what was in the guidance from the Treasury. Clearly, the structure and governance arrangement, which were decided and approved by the former Minister for health, were not sufficient to ensure that Health Commission Wales could do an effective job.

4.00 p.m.

You also agreed with the report in that Health Commission Wales was never sufficiently funded to undertake the work for which it was responsible. Professor Aylward notes in his report the resource-mapping exercise undertaken by the Assembly Government immediately prior to setting up Health Commission Wales. His view leaves little doubt that that initial exercise was incomplete and therefore fundamentally flawed. That is another criticism of how the Assembly Government handled the setting up of Health Commission Wales. It showed a lack of

gan Ombwdsmon Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Cymru, ac mae'r adroddiad hwn yn cadarnhau'r hyn yr wyf wedi'i gredu ers talwm: y bu problemau gyda Chomisiwn Iechyd Cymru, a bod hynny'n cynnwys problemau gyda'i strwythur, ei gyllideb, ei gylch gorchwyl, a'i berthynas â Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Bu hefyd ddiffyg dealltwriaeth am ei gyfrifoldebau, ac mae hynny wedi arwain at brofiad eithaf gwael i gleifion, ond hefyd at set o amgylchiadau anodd i'r bobl hynny sy'n gweithio yng Nghomisiwn Iechyd Cymru. Ymunaf â'r Gweinidog i roi teyrnged i'r staff sy'n gweithio yng Nghomisiwn Iechyd Cymru—mae llawer ohonynt yn ymroddedig ac yn alluog dros ben ac nid eu beirniadu hwy a wneir yma. Er hynny, yr wyf yn ofni bod yr adroddiad yn feirniadaeth uniongyrchol o Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, ac o'r modd y sefydlodd Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru yn y lle cyntaf.

Nodwch yn gwbl deg fod yr adroddiad yn tynnu sylw at broblemau gyda'r trefniadau llywodraethu. Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a benderfynodd ar ba fath o asiantaeth y byddai—un na fyddai ar hyd braich—ac fel y gwna'r adroddiadau'n glir, nid oedd creu a chyfansoddi'r bwrdd cynghori cenedlaethol ar gomisiynu yn bodloni'r model bwrdd a argymhellwyd yng nghanllawiau'r Trysorlys. Nid yr hyn a argymhellwyd oedd yr hyn a oedd yn y canllawiau gan y Trysorlys. Mae'n amlwg nad oedd y strwythur a'r trefniant llywodraethu, yr oedd y cyn Weinidog dros Iechyd wedi penderfynu arnynt a'u cymeradwyo, yn ddigonol i sicrhau y gallai Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru wneud ei waith yn effeithiol.

Cytunasoch hefyd pan ddywed yr adroddiad na chafodd Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru erioed ddigon o arian i wneud y gwaith yr oedd yn gyfrifol amdano. Nododd yr Athro Aylward yn ei adroddiad yr ymarfer mapio adnoddau a gynhaliwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn fuan cyn sefydlu Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru. Yn ei farn ef nid oes amheuaeth nad oedd yr ymarfer rhagarweiniol hwnnw'n anghyflawn a'i fod felly'n sylfaenol ddiffygiol. Dyna feirniadaeth arall ar y modd yr aeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ati i sefydlu Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru. Dangosodd ddiffyg

understanding of the budget implications, based on a lack of understanding of its responsibilities, which resulted in Health Commission Wales having an insufficient budget to start with.

Minister, based on what I have just referred to in Professor Aylward's report, do you accept that this report is a stark criticism of the way in which the previous Minister for health established Health Commission Wales in the first place, demonstrating a lack of understanding on the part of the Government about the roles, functions and responsibilities of that organisation and the budget consequences for it?

You pointed out in your statement that there were problems with regard to agency personnel and short-term contracts, but you failed to point out—although Professor Aylward outlines it in his report—that because of the close relationship between the Assembly Government and Health Commission Wales, HCW was, effectively, treated as just another Government department, which meant that, to all intents and purposes, it had to compete with other Government departments when recruiting staff. Consequently, it had to rely on agency personnel and short-term contracts. How staff recruitment to Health Commission Wales was envisaged represents the third biggest failure in the setting up of that organisation. Three fundamental failures are listed for which the Assembly Government was responsible.

I seek your assurance, Minister, that you are looking to restructure the NHS in Wales to reduce the number of organisations and, hopefully, to introduce a more streamlined system, and you have our support in that. Will you give us an assurance that lessons will be learned from this? If we cannot learn from the mistakes that your party made back in 2003, any new bodies, executive agencies or special health authorities that you set up in future may have the same sorts of flaws, if they are modelled on anything close to this.

The final assurance that I am seeking this

dealltwriaeth o'r goblygiadau cyllidebol, yn seiliedig ar ddiffyg dealltwriaeth o'i chyfrifoldebau, a olygai nad oedd gan Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru gyllideb ddigonol o'r cychwyn.

Weinidog, yn seiliedig ar yr hyn yr wyf newydd gyfeirio ato yn adroddiad yr Athro Aylward, a ydych yn derbyn bod yr adroddiad hwn yn feirniadaeth ddi flewyn ar dafod ar sut yr aeth y Gweinidog dros Iechyd blaenorol ati i sefydlu Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru yn y lle cyntaf, gan ddangos diffyg dealltwriaeth ar ran y Llywodraeth o rolau, swyddogaethau a chyfrifoldebau'r sefydliad hwnnw ac o'r canlyniadau cyllidebol iddo?

Dywedasoch yn eich datganiad bod problemau o ran personél asiantaethau a chytundebau tymor byr, ond nid ydych wedi cyfaddef—er bod yr Athro Aylward yn ei amlinellu yn ei adroddiad—bod CIC, oherwydd y berthynas agos rhwng Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a Chomisiwn Iechyd Cymru, yn cael ei drin fwy neu lai fel adran arall o'r Llywodraeth, a oedd yn golygu bod yn rhaid iddo, i bob pwrpas, gystadlu ag adrannau eraill y Llywodraeth pan oedd yn recriwtio staff. Oherwydd hyn, yr oedd yn rhaid iddo ddibynnu ar bersonél asiantaethau a chontractau tymor byr. Y ffordd yr edrychwyd ar recriwtio staff i Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru oedd y trydydd methiant mawr wrth sefydlu'r sefydliad hwnnw. Rhestrir tri methiant sylfaenol a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad oedd yn gyfrifol am bob un ohonynt.

Gofynnaf am gael sicrwydd gennych, Weinidog, eich bod yn bwriadu ailstrwythuro'r GIG yng Nghymru i ostwng nifer y sefydliadau a, gobeithio y byddwch yn cyflwyno system symlach, ac yr ydym yn eich cefnogi yn hynny o beth. A wnewch ein sicrhau y bydd gwersi'n cael eu dysgu yn sgil hyn? Os na allwn ddysgu oddi wrth y camgymeriadau a wnaethpwyd gan eich plaid yn 2003, mae perygl y bydd unrhyw gyrff, asiantaethau gweithredol neu awdurdodau iechyd arbennig y byddwch yn eu sefydlu yn y dyfodol yn cynnwys yr un math o wendidau, os byddant yn seiliedig ar unrhyw beth sy'n debyg i hyn.

Mae'r sicrwydd olaf yr hoffwn ei gael

afternoon is for the good number of staff working in Health Commission Wales. These are people with considerable expertise, although their work has been hampered by the structure and the budget, and by a lack of understanding of their responsibilities. They have years of dedication and expertise, and we will need them in any NHS of the future. If you are to have an all-Wales body that commissions tertiary and specialist services, we will need those staff. I hope that you can give an assurance that those who have a part to play in Wales have a certain future in Wales.

Edwina Hart: This has not been an easy report for me to read, as a Government Minister; however, I did commission it. I was perfectly aware of some of the underlying issues with regard to Health Commission Wales when I commissioned the report from Professor Aylward. He has taken evidence from witnesses in an exemplary manner, and has been absolutely honest in his dealings with us in the Government during the production of his report.

Like you, one of my principal concerns was for staff. I am pleased that they had the opportunity to be briefed by Professor Aylward yesterday about the report's contents. They welcomed the review, and they also welcomed the acknowledgement that HCW had been under-resourced and that there had been difficulties from the start for the staff involved. Therefore, I think that the staff have been reassured. I do not wish to lose valuable staff who have experience of commissioning from the NHS, and that thought will be foremost in my mind when I consider any restructuring issues in the national health service.

Lessons will be learned from the report. I had anticipated that something would come out of this report, and I was more than prepared to learn the lessons. That is the important message: as a Minister in this Government, I am prepared to take forward what Professor Aylward has said, to ensure that we learn lessons for the future in whatever emerges from the restructuring of the national health

gennyh y prynhawn yma'n ymwneud â'r nifer dda o staff sy'n gweithio yng Nghomisiwn Iechyd Cymru. Mae'r rhain yn bobl sy'n meddu ar gryn arbenigedd, er bod eu gwaith wedi cael ei rwystro gan y strwythur a'r gyllideb, a chan ddiffyg dealltwriaeth o'u cyfrifoldebau. Mae ganddynt flynyddoedd o ymroddiad ac arbenigedd, a bydd eu hangen arnom mewn unrhyw GIG yn y dyfodol. Os ydych am gael corff Cymru gyfan sy'n comisiynu gwasanaethau trydyddol ac arbenigol, bydd angen y staff hynny arnom. Gobeithiaf y gallwch sicrhau y bydd gan y rheini sydd â rhan i'w chwarae yng Nghymru ddyfodol diogel yng Nghymru.

Edwina Hart: Ni fu hwn yn adroddiad hawdd ei ddarllen imi, fel Gweinidog yn y Llywodraeth; fodd bynnag, fi oedd yn gyfrifol am ei gomisiynu. Yr oeddwn yn gwbl ymwybodol o rai o'r problemau sylfaenol a oedd yn effeithio ar Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru pan gomisiynais yr adroddiad gan yr Athro Aylward. Mae wedi gwrandao ar dystiolaeth gan dystion mewn ffordd deg, ac mae wedi bod yn gwbl onest gyda ni yn y Llywodraeth pan oedd yn cynhyrchu'i adroddiad.

Fel chwithau, un o fy mhryderon mwyaf oedd dros y staff. Yr wyf yn falch eu bod wedi cael cyfle i gael eu briffio gan yr Athro Aylward ddoe ynghylch cynnwys yr adroddiad. Yr oeddent yn croesawu'r adolygiad, ac yr oeddent hefyd yn croesawu'r gydnabyddiaeth nad oedd CIC wedi derbyn adnoddau digonol a bod y staff wedi profi anawsterau o'r cychwyn. Felly, credaf fod ofnau'r staff wedi'u tawelu. Nid wyf am golli staff gwerthfawr sydd â phrofiad o gomisiynu oddi wrth y GIG, a bydd hynny'n flaenllaw yn fy meddwl pan fyddaf yn ystyried unrhyw fater sy'n ymwneud ag ailstrwythuro'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol.

Bydd gwersi'n cael eu dysgu yn dilyn yr adroddiad hwn. Yr oeddwn wedi rhagweld y byddai rhywbeth yn deillio o'r adroddiad ac yr oeddwn yn fwy na pharod i ddysgu'r gwersi. Dyna'r neges bwysig: fel Gweinidog yn y Llywodraeth hon, yr wyf yn barod i weithredu ar yr hyn a ddywedodd yr Athro Aylward, i sicrhau ein bod yn dysgu gwersi ar gyfer y dyfodol o ran pa beth bynnag fydd

service. It is important that all these difficulties are aired in public, particularly the issues to do with patients and individual panels and getting more transparency in the system. That is the only way that we will get back confidence in the system. However, even though this report made sombre—not even sober—reading in many respects, it identifies ways forward for me, and I must now take those matters forward.

We can all dwell on history and say what should have been done differently, but we must recognise that HCW was set up at a time when other restructuring was going on in the national health service, and we must recognise how services were commissioned before. However, if I am to engage on another restructuring as a result of the exercise, I must learn the lessons from this. I can assure you that this hard-hitting report has been welcomed by me, and I welcome the discussion that there will be about it. The important thing is that lessons are learned and that we take them forward, and that we use the staff who are currently employed in Health Commission Wales to full effect.

Helen Mary Jones: May I begin my response to this statement by congratulating the Minister on commissioning this report in the first place? We were all aware of the serious concerns, and she could have anticipated that it would make sobering reading, as she has rightly said. I take this as a clear example of the One Wales Government's being prepared to face up to the mistakes of the past, and being prepared to put them right, and I am proud to offer the Minister my support in her endeavour today.

I also thank Professor Aylward and his team, as well as all those who contributed and who gave evidence. Professor Aylward was kind enough to give the opposition spokesperson and me a briefing on the report, and he commented on the high percentage of Health Commission Wales staff members who had been prepared to contribute, which indicates their positive attitude and commitment to

yn deillio yn sgil ailstrwythuro'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Mae'n bwysig bod yr holl anawsterau hyn yn cael eu trafod yn gyhoeddus, yn enwedig materion sy'n ymwneud â chleifion a phanelau unigol ac i wneud y system yn fwy tryloyw. Dyna'r unig ffordd o adennill hyder yn y system. Fodd bynnag, er bod darllen yr adroddiad hwn yn brofiad syber—os nad sobr hyd yn oed—mewn nifer o ffyrdd, mae'n dangos ffyrdd ymlaen imi, a bydd yn rhaid imi yn awr fynd ati i fwrw ymlaen â hwy.

Gallwn i gyd edrych yn ôl ar hanes a dweud beth ddylid fod wedi ei wneud yn wahanol, ond rhaid inni gydnabod bod CIC wedi'i sefydlu ar adeg pan oedd gwaith ailstrwythuro arall yn digwydd yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol, a rhaid inni gydnabod sut yr oedd gwasanaethau'n cael eu comisiynu yn y gorffennol. Fodd bynnag, os wyf am ddechrau ailstrwythuro o'r newydd o ganlyniad i'r ymarfer, rhaid imi ddysgu'r gwersi sy'n deillio o hyn. Gallaf eich sicrhau fy mod wedi croesawu'r adroddiad di flewyn ar dafod hwn, ac yr wyf yn croesawu'r drafodaeth a geir arno. Y peth pwysig yw bod gwersi'n cael eu dysgu a'n bod yn gweithredu arnynt, a'n bod yn manteisio i'r eithaf ar y staff a gyflogir gan Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru ar hyn o bryd.

Helen Mary Jones: A gaf gychwyn fy ymateb i'r datganiad hwn drwy longyfarch y Gweinidog am gomisiynu'r adroddiad hwn yn y lle cyntaf? Yr oeddem i gyd yn ymwybodol o'r pryderon difrifol, a gallai fod wedi rhagweld y byddai ei ddarllen yn brofiad syber, fel y dywedodd eisoes. Gwelaf hyn fel enghraifft amlwg o barodrwydd Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un i wynebu camgymeriadau'r gorffennol, a bod yn barod i'w cywiro, ac yr wyf yn falch o gael cynnig fy nghefnogaeth i'r Gweinidog yn ei hymdrechion heddiw.

Diolchaf hefyd i'r Athro Aylward a'i dîm, yn ogystal ag i bawb sydd wedi cyfrannu ac wedi rhoi tystiolaeth. Yr oedd yr Athro Aylward yn ddigon caredig i friffio llefarydd yr wrthblaid a minnau am yr adroddiad, a thynnodd sylw at y canran uchel o staff Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru a oedd yn barod i gyfrannu, sy'n arwydd o'u hagwedd gadarnhaol a'u hymrwymiad i weld hyn yn

want to make this work, for which we should all be grateful.

The report makes sobering reading; it does not contain a great deal of surprises. However, like the Minister and others, I think that it is right that I highlight what Professor Aylward has to say about the hard work and commitment of Health Commission Wales staff. They did what they could within a flawed framework and with inadequate resources. We are all aware of when things went wrong, but there were many more cases, particularly with individual commissioning, in which, thanks to staff endeavours, things were got right despite the difficulties. We owe them our gratitude, and I associate myself with what Jonathan Morgan said about wanting to ensure that we retain those gifted and committed individuals to work in what will be a much more positive structure and environment in the future, hopefully.

Like the Minister and others, I wish to highlight that Professor Aylward does not conclude that the successful commissioning of services at a national level in Wales is impossible. In some discussions that I have had, about commissioning advocacy services for example, it has been suggested that Health Commission Wales proves that it is not possible to commission services adequately at a national level. However, I submit that, in a country of between 3 million and 4 million people, we must be able to do that where appropriate, and Professor Aylward's report makes that clear. The problem was that Health Commission Wales's structure and budget did not allow that commissioning work to be done as effectively as it should have been, and not that national commissioning was not the right way to go.

Minister, can you confirm that, when you consider the first four groups of recommendations that you mention in your statement, in the context of overall reform, you will give due weight to recommendations 7 and 8, which highlight the need to map the specialist services that we have properly?

llwyddo, a dylem i gyd fod yn ddiolchgar iddynt am hynny.

Mae cynnwys yr adroddiad yn ddigon i'n sobreiddio; nid yw'n cynnwys llawer sy'n annisgwyl. Fodd bynnag, fel y Gweinidog ac eraill, credaf ei bod yn briodol imi gyfeirio at yr hyn sydd gan yr Athro Aylward i'w ddweud am waith caled ac ymroddiad staff Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru. Gwnaethant yr hyn a allent o fewn fframwaith diffygiol a chydag adnoddau annigonol. Yr ydym i gyd yn ymwybodol o ba bryd yr aeth pethau o chwith, ond yr oedd llawer mwy o achosion, yn enwedig gyda chomisiynu unigol, lle cafwyd llwyddiannau er gwaethaf yr anawsterau, diolch i ymdrechion y staff. Yr ydym yn ddyledus iddynt am hynny, ac yr wyf yn cyd-fynd â'r hyn a ddywedodd Jonathan Morgan ynghylch yr angen i sicrhau ein bod yn cadw'r unigolion galluog ac ymroddedig hynny i weithio yn yr hyn a fydd, gobeithio, yn strwythur ac amgylchedd llawer mwy cadarnhaol yn y dyfodol.

Fel y Gweinidog ac eraill, hoffwn bwysleisio nad yw'r Athro Aylward yn dod i'r casgliad nad yw comisiynu gwasanaethau'n llwyddiannus ar lefel genedlaethol yng Nghymru'n amhosibl. Mewn rhai trafodaethau a gefais, ynghylch comisiynu gwasanaethau eirioli er enghraifft, awgrymwyd bod Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru yn profi nad yw'n bosibl comisiynu gwasanaethau'n ddigonol ar lefel genedlaethol. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn derbyn, mewn gwlad gyda phoblogaeth rhwng 3 a 4 miliwn, ei bod yn rhaid inni fedru gwneud hynny pan fydd yn briodol, ac mae adroddiad yr Athro Aylward yn gwneud hynny'n glir. Y broblem oedd nad oedd strwythur a chyllideb Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru yn caniatáu i'r gwaith comisiynu hwnnw gael ei wneud mor effeithiol ag y dylai gael ei wneud, ac nid nad oedd comisiynu cenedlaethol yn rhywbeth na ellid ei wneud.

Weinidog, a allwch gadarnhau, pan fyddwch yn ystyried y pedwar grŵp cyntaf o argymhellion yr ydych wedi'u crybwyll yn eich datganiad, yng nghyd-destun diwygio cyffredinol, y byddwch yn rhoi sylw dyledus i argymhellion 7 ac 8, sy'n tynnu sylw at yr angen i fapio'n briodol y gwasanaethau

That would highlight the gaps, and would enable us to be much clearer in future about which specialist services need to be commissioned and at which level. As Professor Aylward highlighted, the lack of transparency has been one of the most difficult things for members of the public, particularly patients, to understand, and I am sure that we can take this opportunity to put that right in future.

In your response to Jonathan Morgan, you were clear that lessons would be learned. May I suggest to you that it may also be wise to discuss the implications of this report with ministerial colleagues across portfolios? There may be lessons to be learned across Government about how best to address these kinds of issues when the Assembly Government is thinking of planning services, potentially at a national level, in different portfolios.

4.10 p.m.

In the short term, is it possible for action to be taken to address some of the pressure that Health Commission Wales staff are struggling with today? I am thinking in particular about the vacancy rates that Professor Aylward highlights and the dependency on agency staff. I realise that, in the fairly short term, you will be looking to put this in the context of the restructuring of the whole of the NHS, but, in the meantime, those staff members are having to deal with cases daily, particularly individual patient commissioning, and so could your department do anything to support them in the short term?

At this stage, would it be possible for you to give us an indicative timeframe for establishing the independent appeals process for individual patient commissioning? I very much welcome the fact that you have invited Professor Aylward to give you further advice on this, and I fully appreciate the need to consult about exactly how that work should be done, but I submit that we should also not look for too much delay.

Edwina Hart: I will start with your last point first, Helen Mary, because the independent appeals process is one thing that we really

arbenigol sydd gennym? Byddai hynny'n amlygu'r bylchau, a byddai'n ein galluogi i fod yn llawer mwy eglur yn y dyfodol ynghylch pa wasanaethau arbenigol y mae angen eu comisiynu ac ar ba lefel. Fel yr amlygwyd gan yr Athro Aylward, y diffyg tryloywder oedd un o'r pethau anoddaf i'r cyhoedd, yn enwedig cleifion, ei ddeall, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y gallwn fanteisio ar y cyfle hwn i gywiro hynny yn y dyfodol.

Yn eich ymateb i Jonathan Morgan, yr oeddech yn bendant y byddem yn dysgu gwersi. A gaf awgrymu ichi y gallai fod yn ddoeth hefyd trafod goblygiadau'r adroddiad hwn gyda'ch cyd-Weinidogion ar draws portffolios? Gellir dysgu gwersi ar draws y Llywodraeth ar y ffordd orau i roi sylw i faterion o'r fath pan fydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn meddwl am gynllunio gwasanaethau, ar lefel genedlaethol o bosibl, mewn gwahanol bortffolios.

Yn y tymor byr, a oes modd cymryd camau i roi sylw i beth o'r straen y mae staff Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru yn ceisio ymgodymu ag ef heddiw? Yr wyf yn meddwl yn fwyaf arbennig am nifer y swyddi gwag y tynnwyd sylw atynt gan yr Athro Aylward a'r ddibyniaeth ar staff asiantaeth. Yr wyf yn sylweddoli y byddwch, yn y tymor gweddol fyr, yn ceisio rhoi hyn yng nghyd-destun ailstrwythuro'r GIG yn ei gyfanrwydd, ond, yn y cyfamser, mae'r staff hynny'n gorfod deilio ag achosion yn ddyddiol, yn enwedig comisiynu cleifion unigol, ac felly a oes unrhyw beth y gallai'ch adran ei wneud i'w cynorthwyo yn y tymor byr?

Ar yr adeg hon, a fyddai modd ichi roi awgrym o amserlen inni ar gyfer sefydlu proses apelio annibynnol ar gyfer comisiynu cleifion unigol? Yr wyf yn croesawu'n gynnes y ffaith eich bod wedi gwahodd yr Athro Aylward i roi cyngor pellach ichi ar hyn, ac yr wyf yn llawn sylweddoli'r angen i ymgynghori ynghylch sut y dylid gwneud y gwaith hwnnw, ond yr wyf yn derbyn na ddylem ychwaith ganiatáu oedi gormodol.

Edwina Hart: Hoffwn ddelio â'ch pwynt olaf yn gyntaf, Helen Mary, oherwydd bod y broses apelio annibynnol yn rhywbeth y

have to move on. I am in Professor Aylward's hands, as it will be for him to look at his timescales, but I very much hope to have something to share with colleagues in Plenary, and on which to issue another statement, by the autumn so that we can give the public confidence about having a more transparent system. Therefore, I would think that the deadline on that will be early autumn, as opposed to late autumn.

I intend to go to meet HCW staff and hold a question-and-answer session with them, but I am already aware, from my formal discussions with the trades unions, of concerns about the pressure within the existing set-up and about morale issues as a result of the publication of this report. I may say what I want about staff, as may Professor Aylward, Jonathan Morgan, and you, Helen Mary, but there will always be people who ask, 'How on earth did this happen?'. Therefore, you make a valid point and I will discuss it with Ann Lloyd, the director of health for the Assembly Government.

You are also quite right about the lessons to be learned across portfolios, because what has come out of this is that an executive agency was established that lacked orthodox governance arrangements. If you are to establish agencies or anything nationally, you have to look very carefully at what arrangements you put in place to protect your position in the future. I am sure that my ministerial colleagues in the Chamber will have heard that point today and will, of course, take it up when they read the Record of this discussion.

The most important thing of all has been the transparency issue. It is quite clear that we, as Assembly Members, have also had to muddle through our discussions with Health Commission Wales on behalf of our constituents. That has been the most difficult area for us.

In relation to recommendations 7 and 8, a proper mapping-out exercise will have to be carried out, which is a key issue. As we map

mae'n rhaid inni weithredu arni. Yr wyf yn nwylo'r Athro Aylward, gan mai ef fydd yn edrych ar ei amserlenni, ond gobethiaf yn fawr y bydd gennyf rywbeth i'w rannu gyda fy nghyd-Aelodau yn y Cyfarfod Llawn, ac mae hyn yn fater y byddwn yn cyhoeddi datganiad arall amdano, erbyn yr hydref er mwyn ennyn hyder y cyhoedd ynghylch cael system fwy tryloyw. Felly, credaf mai'r dyddiad ar gyfer cwblhau hynny fydd dechrau'r hydref, yn hytrach na diwedd yr hydref.

Yr wyf yn bwriadu cwrdd â staff CIC a chynnal sesiwn holi ac ateb gyda hwy, ond yr wyf yn ymwybodol, yn dilyn fy nhrafodaethau ffurfiol gyda'r undebau llafur, o'r pryderon ynghylch y pwysau o fewn y drefn bresennol ac ynghylch morâl o ganlyniad i gyhoeddi'r adroddiad hwn. Gallaf ddweud yr hyn a fynnaf am y staff, fel y gall yr Athro Aylward, Jonathan Morgan, a chwithau, Helen Mary, ond bydd pobl yn parhau i ofyn, 'Sut yn y byd y digwyddodd hyn?' Felly, yr ydych yn codi pwynt dilys a byddaf yn ei drafod gydag Ann Lloyd, cyfarwyddwr iechyd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle ynghylch dysgu gwersi ar draws portffolios, oherwydd beth sydd wedi deillio o hyn yw bod asiantaeth weithredol wedi'i sefydlu heb drefniadau llywodraethu arferol. Os ydych am sefydlu asiantaethau neu unrhyw beth yn genedlaethol, rhaid ichi edrych yn ofalus iawn ar y trefniadau yr ydych yn eu rhoi ar waith er mwyn diogelu eich lle yn y dyfodol. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd fy nghyd-Weinidogion yn y Siambr wedi clywed y pwynt hwnnw heddiw a byddant, wrth gwrs, yn cymryd sylw ohono pan fyddant yn darllen y Cofnod o'r drafodaeth hon.

Y peth pwysicaf oll yw'r mater o dryloywder. Mae'n amlwg ein bod ni, fel Aelodau Cynulliad, hefyd wedi gorfod brwydro drwy ein trafodaethau gyda Chomisiwn Iechyd Cymru ar ran ein hetholwyr. Hwn fu'r maes anoddaf inni.

O ran argymhellion 7 ac 8, bydd yn rhaid cynnal ymarfer mapio trylwyr, ac mae hyn yn fater allweddol. Wrth inni fapio'r

the service, we may be able to find the shortfalls where we have to look strategically at the future services that will be required to commission, and at the investment that we will have to put in to get those services up to a sufficient standard. That will prove to be an exceptionally useful exercise.

The first four points will be taken into account in the consultation, and I very much hope to make an initial statement before we go into the summer recess on the direction of travel for NHS reform, taking up some more of these points. There will have to be far more detailed work at the end of the consultation process about how commissioning patterns work and what future arrangements should look like. There is a degree of urgency. For me, Professor Aylward's report has really focused attention on the key issues and the lessons to be learned to ensure that no such mistakes are made in future.

Jenny Randerson: I start by thanking Professor Aylward and his team, to echo the words of my colleagues. This report is remarkably thorough and perceptive, and we can all learn a great deal from it. Beyond that, it is a case of wondering where we should start, because there is so much to talk about.

I want to express some surprise that, in the opening paragraph of your statement, Minister, you state that the request to investigate Health Commission Wales was not made as the result of any widespread anxiety or public agitation. However, the issue was raised time and again in the Chamber, by me and many colleagues. Health Commission Wales was unwieldy, underfunded and was not making good decisions. If there was no public anxiety about that, there jolly well should have been. Each time we had a case highlighted in the press, for example, it was brought home to us that the organisation was not fit for purpose.

This report produces a picture of muddle, of systemic underfunding and of opaque processes. From my dealings with Health Commission Wales on behalf of constituents, I was aware that I could never get to grips

gwasanaeth, efallai y gallwn ganfod y diffygion ac y bydd yn rhaid inni edrych yn strategol ar y gwasanaethau y bydd angen eu comisiynu yn y dyfodol, ac ar y buddsoddiad y bydd ei angen i godi'r gwasanaethau hynny i gyrraedd safonau digonol. Byddai hwnnw'n ymarfer defnyddiol dros ben.

Bydd y pedwar pwynt cyntaf yn cael eu hystyried yn yr ymgynghoriad, ac yr wyf yn gobeithio'n fawr y gallaf wneud datganiad rhagarweiniol cyn toriad yr haf ar ffurf y diwygiadau i'r GIG, gan ymgorffori rhagor o'r pwyntiau hyn. Bydd yn rhaid gwneud gwaith llawer mwy manwl ar ddiwedd y broses ymgynghori ar sut y bydd patrymau comisiynu'n gweithio a pha ffurf y dylai trefniadau'r dyfodol eu cymryd. Mae elfen o frys ynghlwm wrth hyn. I mi, mae adroddiad yr Athro Aylward wedi hoelio'n sylw ar y prif faterion a'r gwersi mae'n rhaid inni eu dysgu i sicrhau na fydd camgymeriadau o'r fath yn cael eu gwneud yn y dyfodol.

Jenny Randerson: Yr wyf am ddechrau drwy ddiolch i'r Athro Aylward a'i dîm, i adleisio geiriau fy nghyd-Aelodau. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn un eithriadol o drylwyr a sylwgar, a gallwn i gyd ddysgu llawer oddi wrtho. Yn fwy na hynny, mae'n fater o ddyfalu ym mhle y dylem ddechrau, gan fod cymaint i'w drafod.

Yr wyf am fynegi peth syndod eich bod, ym mharagraff agoriadol eich datganiad, Weinidog, yn datgan na wnaethpwyd cais i ymchwilio i Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru o ganlyniad i unrhyw bryderon cyffredinol nac anniddigrwydd o blith y cyhoedd. Er hynny, codwyd y mater dro ar ôl tro yn y Siambr, gennyf fi a chan llawer o gyd-Aelodau. Yr oedd Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru yn drwsgl, heb arian digonol ac nid oedd yn gwneud penderfyniadau da. Os nad oedd y cyhoedd yn anniddig yn ei gylch, yna dylent fod wedi bod yn anniddig. Pob tro y tynnwyd sylw at achos yn y wasg, er enghraifft, daeth yn gwbl amlwg inni nad oedd y sefydliad yn addas i'w bwrpas.

Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn cyfleu darlun o ddryswch, tanariannu systemig a phrosesau didraidd. Wrth ymdrin â Chomisiwn Iechyd Cymru ar ran etholwyr, yr oeddwn yn ymwybodol na allwn byth fynd i'r afael ag ef

with it as an organisation—I could never understand the system. I now realise why; it was because there was no system. I have looked at the diagram in the report and it is so complex that anyone who tried to use it would find themselves very confused, having taken several wrong turns on the way.

I want to emphasise what my colleagues have said, namely that the whole set-up was basically flawed. You have emphasised that the governance structure was totally inadequate, Minister, and that the lack of independent advice was the key issue. The report says that it was a unique organisation within the health service. Was your Government aware that this was unique, and that it was out of kilter with Treasury advice and all the other organisations of a similar nature—there are hundreds of them—throughout the UK?

One criticism is that, basically, the organisation has been too close a part of the Welsh Assembly Government structure. It also draws attention to staff criticisms of the lack of leadership from the Welsh Assembly Government. My second question, Minister, is this: how will you learn the lessons for the future? I am acutely aware that one of the three options in your health service reorganisation proposals is for a special health authority, but that the other two options are very much along similar lines—on a superficial reading—to the Health Commission Wales set-up. The key issues are the advisory nature of the chair, the lack of external advice, and the closeness of the Minister to the decision making of Health Commission Wales. Can we have your assurance that you will learn those lessons and take them to heart, so that those mistakes are not made again?

In my turn, I pay tribute to the staff. I was staggered to find that there were approximately 50 members of staff dealing with a budget of £540 million. It is a difficult and complex budget, and they are under immense stress, because they are dealing with life and death issues when they make their decisions, yet there is a 20 per cent vacancy rate. Can we have your assurance that you will not wait for the next stage of NHS reform, that you will deal with that

fel sefydliad—ni allwn ddeall y system. Nawr sylweddolaf pam; nid oedd system yn bodoli. Yr wyf wedi edrych ar y diagram yn yr adroddiad ac mae mor gymhleth fel y byddai unrhyw un a geisiai ei ddefnyddio yn drysu'n lân, ar ôl cymryd nifer o gamau gwag ar hyd y daith.

Hoffwn bwysleisio'r hyn a ddywedodd fy nghyd-Aelodau, sef bod y sefydliad cyfan yn ddiffygiol. Yr ydych wedi pwysleisio bod y strwythur llywodraethu'n gwbl annigonol, Weinidog, ac mai diffyg cyngor annibynnol oedd y prif fater. Dywed yr adroddiad ei fod yn sefydliad unigryw yn y gwasanaeth iechyd. A oedd eich Llywodraeth yn ymwybodol fod hyn yn unigryw, a'i fod yn groes i gyngor y Trysorlys a'r holl sefydliadau eraill o natur debyg—mae cannoedd ohonynt—ledled y DU?

Un feirniadaeth yw bod y sefydliad wedi bod yn rhy agos at strwythur Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Tynna sylw hefyd at feirniadaeth y staff am ddiffyg arweinyddiaeth gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Fy ail gwestiwn, Weinidog, yw hwn: sut y dysgwch wersi ar gyfer y dyfodol? Yr wyf yn ymwybodol iawn mai un o'r tri opsiwn yn eich cynigion i ad-drefnu'r gwasanaeth iechyd yw sefydlu awdurdod iechyd arbennig, ond bod y ddau opsiwn arall yn debyg iawn—ar yr olwg gyntaf—i strwythur Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru. Y prif faterion yw natur gynghorol y cadeirydd, diffyg cyngor allanol, ac agosrwydd y Gweinidog at broses gwneud penderfyniadau Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru. A allwch ein sicrhau y byddwch yn dysgu'r gwersi hynny ac yn eu cymryd o ddifrif er mwyn sicrhau na fydd y camgymeriadau hynny'n cael eu gwneud eto?

Yn fy nhro, rhoddaf deyrnged i'r staff. Cefais fy syfrdanu o wybod bod tua 50 o aelodau o staff yn ymdrin â chyllideb o £540 miliwn. Mae'n gyllideb anodd a chymhleth, ac maent dan bwysau mawr, oherwydd maent yn ymdrin â bywyd neu farwolaeth pan wnânt eu penderfyniadau, ond eto mae 20 y cant o swyddi gwag. A allwch ein sicrhau na fyddwch yn aros am gam nesaf diwygio'r GIG, y byddwch yn ymdrin â'r mater hwnnw ar fyrder, ac y byddwch hefyd yn ymdrin ar

issue urgently, and that you will also deal urgently with the issue of the lack of staff training and personal development? These staff cannot be allowed to stay in the black hole that they have been in over the last five years. I want to thank them for their desperate efforts over that five-year period.

I now turn to funding and the fact that the organisation has been underfunded from the start—an issue that the Welsh Assembly Government should have taken up a long time ago. The brachytherapy scandal last year drew attention to it, but that was only one of a whole series of issues that alerted us to the underfunding of Health Commission Wales. The report suggests that there should be an urgent review of the responsibilities of Health Commission Wales and that those responsibilities should be updated frequently. Are you going to institute that as a matter of urgency, rather than waiting for the next stage of reorganisation?

4.20 p.m.

Can you tell us whether previous Ministers have ever undertaken an internal review of Health Commission Wales? Is this the Welsh Assembly Government's first effort in this regard or have there been previous reviews as alerts have come through?

Finally, I raise the issue of the individual patients and commissioning for those patients, which has taken up 25 per cent of staff time but only 4 per cent of HCW's funding, and the lack of an appeals process. I was relieved to hear your response to Helen Mary Jones and I am sure that an independent appeals process will be set up pretty rapidly. Can I have your assurance that it will have the appropriate transparency, which is a key issue? We also need an urgent review of the situation facing mental health patients who have, basically, been stuck in medium secure accommodation because local health boards refuse to take on the funding responsibility for them in low secure accommodation. This is a scandalous infringement of people's rights and it destroys their quality of life. Will you please issue instructions to local health boards in the interim, before the

fyrder â diffyg hyfforddiant a datblygiad personol y staff? Ni ellir caniatáu i'r staff hyn aros yn y twll du y maent wedi bod ynddo dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf. Hoffwn ddiolch iddynt am eu hymdrechion glew dros y pum mlynedd hynny.

Trof yn awr at ariannu a'r ffaith nad yw'r sefydliad wedi cael ei ariannu'n ddigonol o'r cychwyn—mater y dylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru fod wedi mynd i'r afael ef ers peth amser. Tynnodd y sgandal ynghylch brachitherapi sylw at hynny y llynedd, ond dim ond un mater o blith llawer oedd hwnnw a dynnodd ein sylw at y ffaith nad oedd Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru'n cael ei ariannu'n ddigonol. Awgryma'r adroddiad y dylid cynnal adolygiad o gyfrifoldebau Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru ar fyrder ac y dylid diweddarau'r cyfrifoldebau hynny'n gyson. A ydych yn bwriadu gweithredu ar hynny ar fyrder, yn hytrach nag aros am gam nesaf yr ad-drefnu?

A allwch ddweud wrthym a yw Gweinidogion blaenorol wedi cynnal adolygiad mewnol o Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru erioed? Ai dyma ymdrech gyntaf Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn hyn o beth ynteu a gynhaliwyd adolygiadau blaenorol wrth i'r problemau godi?

Yn olaf, codaf y mater o gleifion unigol a chomisiynu ar gyfer y cleifion hynny, maes y treuliodd staff CIC 25 y cant o'u hamser arno ond maes lle y gwariodd dim ond 4 y cant o'i gyllid arno, a'r diffyg proses apelio. Yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed eich ymateb i Helen Mary Jones ac yr wyf yn siŵr y caiff proses apêl annibynnol ei rhoi ar waith yn eithaf cyflym. A allwch fy sicrhau y bydd yn dryloyw, sy'n fater allweddol? Yn ogystal mae angen adolygiad o'r sefyllfa sy'n wynebu cleifion iechyd meddwl arnom ar fyrder. Maent wedi cael eu cadw mewn llety diogelwch canolig oherwydd bod byrddau iechyd lleol yn gwrthod cymryd y cyfrifoldeb dros eu hariannu mewn llety diogelwch isel. Mae hyn yn achos gwarthus o dramgwyddo hawliau pobl ac mae'n dinistrio ansawdd eu bywydau. A roddwch gyfarwyddyd i fyrdau iechyd lleol yn y cyfamser, cyn yr ad-drefnu,

reorganisation, that they must take on their responsibilities so that a solution can be found to this terrible situation?

Edwina Hart: One of the most serious aspects of the report is the issue regarding secure services. I have already asked Ted Unsworth to undertake a review for me, which will be available in the summer, I understand, and will contain recommendations. I regard this as one of the most serious issues to have appeared in the report.

On your other points about wanting my assurances that I will take action, I would not have commissioned this report if I were not certain that I would have to take action on this. Some actions will be immediate, I will have to reflect on others, and some will be dealt with by way of long-term strategies to deal with the NHS. As I have already said in response to Helen Mary Jones, I will immediately consider staff levels, because there is a relevant point about pressure on staff and the need to get things right, even in the short term. There are also other issues regarding staffing, in that we need to ensure that we have the appropriate staff in place to be able to give the necessary advice on these issues. Therefore, I will obviously pursue these issues.

The responsibilities flowing from this report do not just lie with me as a Government Minister, although I accept that I am fully responsible for what has been included in Professor Aylward's report and I am prepared to take that on the chin. It would have been much easier for me not to have come here with this report and to have carried on with itsy-bitsy changes to Health Commission Wales without having had this public discussion about it. However, I thought that this would be an honest way to approach it, because there are so many issues that have been raised by patients, Assembly Members, MPs and others. We therefore decided to do it in a very public manner. I am sorry that you are unhappy with the opening remarks of my statement but, in general, most of the people who have engaged with Health Commission Wales have been satisfied. We need to recognise that it has done a solid

bod yn rhaid iddynt ymgymryd â'u cyfrifoldebau er mwyn dod o hyd i ateb i'r sefyllfa ofnadwy hon?

Edwina Hart: Un o'r agweddau mwyaf difrifol ar yr adroddiad hwn yw'r mater sy'n ymwneud â gwasanaethau diogel. Yr wyf eisoes wedi gofyn i Ted Unsworth gynnal adolygiad ar fy rhan, a fydd ar gael yn yr haf, fel y deallaf, a bydd yn cynnwys argymhellion. Ystyriaf hyn fel un o'r materion mwyaf difrifol sydd wedi ymddangos yn yr adroddiad.

O ran eich pwyntiau eraill ynghylch gofyn am sicrwydd gennyf y byddaf yn cymryd camau, ni fyddwn wedi comisiynu'r adroddiad hwn pe na bawn yn sicr y byddai'n rhaid imi gymryd camau. Bydd rhai camau yn cael eu cymryd ar unwaith, bydd rhaid imi feddwl am rai, a bydd yn rhaid ymdrin ag eraill drwy strategaethau hirdymor i ymdrin â'r GIG. Fel y dywedais eisoes syn fy ymateb i Helen Mary Jones, byddaf yn ystyried lefelau staffio ar unwaith, oherwydd mae pwynt perthnasol ynghylch y pwysau ar staff a'r angen i unioni pethau, hyd yn oed yn y tymor byr. Mae materion eraill yn ymwneud â staffio hefyd, sef bod angen inni sicrhau bod y staff priodol ar gael er mwyn rhoi'r cyngor angenrheidiol ar y materion hyn. Felly, byddaf yn amlwg yn mynd ar drywydd y materion hyn.

Nid fy nghyfrifoldeb i yn unig, fel Gweinidog, yw'r cyfrifoldebau sy'n deillio o'r adroddiad hwn, ond derbyniaf fy mod yn gwbl gyfrifol am yr hyn sydd wedi cael ei gynnwys yn adroddiad yr Athro Aylward ac yr wyf yn fodlon ei dderbyn yn ddi-gŵyn. Byddai wedi bod yn llawer haws imi beidio â dod yma gyda'r adroddiad hwn a pharhau i wneud mân newidiadau yng Nghomisiwn Iechyd Cymru heb gael y drafodaeth gyhoeddus hon. Fodd bynnag, credais y byddai hon yn ffordd onest i fynd ati, oherwydd bod cynifer o faterion wedi cael eu codi gan gleifion, Aelodau'r Cynulliad, ASau ac eraill. Felly penderfynasom wneud hynny mewn ffordd gyhoeddus iawn. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf eich bod yn anfodlon â sylwadau agoriadol fy natganiad ond, yn gyffredinol, mae'r rhan fwyaf o bobl sydd wedi ymdrin â Chomisiwn Iechyd Cymru wedi cael eu bodloni. Mae angen inni gydnabod ei fod

body of work for the majority of individuals. It is only these other incidents that we are aware of as Members that have really focused my attention on this issue.

There are big issues here, and it is right to have a properly costed budget and to provide for horizon scanning. We need to consider that as part of the budget process, whatever the arrangements may be. We must also have a sufficient number of permanent and expert staff, which is important, and we must have an effective and transparent communication strategy for individuals. In response to all the points that you have made today, I can say, 'Yes, I will take these forward as part of the implementation of the Health Commission Wales review as speedily as possible'. However, you must recognise that there will be implications in terms of how we deal with commissioning as a result of the NHS reforms. It is important that I get things right in the short term, but I am also preparing for the long term.

Like you, I am relieved in many ways that this is out in the public domain and that we have a document and recommendations to discuss. Taking things forward with openness and transparency is the only way forward in order to progress policy in any area. One of the key issues for me is not what has happened historically or who has managed this; I have done this on my watch and I take responsibility for it.

Bethan Jenkins: I have a short contribution to make, specifically with regard to eating disorders, because that is one of my main interests in the reform of Health Commission Wales. I ask the Minister to urgently manage the change and to plan any transition from the responsibilities of HCW to accommodate a more comprehensive strategy and service delivery model across the risk and complexity domain for eating disorders. I have received a response from you regarding the care pathway but I believe that, if HCW is to be changed, we must consider where the other responsibilities lie in terms of service commissioning, be it on a primary care basis or on a trust basis, so that those in the field are aware of what will happen before those

wedi gwneud gwaith cadarn i'r mwyafrif o unigolion. Dim ond y digwyddiadau eraill hyn yr ydym yn ymwybodol ohonynt fel Aelodau sydd wedi hoelio fy sylw ar y mater hwn.

Ceir problemau mawr yma, a dylid cael cyllideb sydd wedi'i chostio'n briodol ac sy'n edrych i'r dyfodol. Rhaid inni ystyried hynny fel rhan o broses y gyllideb, beth bynnag fydd y trefniadau. Rhaid inni hefyd gael nifer ddigonol o staff parhaol ac arbenigol, sy'n bwysig, a rhaid inni gael strategaeth gyfathrebu effeithiol a thryloyw i unigolion. Mewn ymateb i'r holl bwyntiau yr ydych wedi eu gwneud heddiw, gallaf ddweud, 'Byddaf yn gweithredu ar y rhain fel rhan o'r broses o roi'r adolygiad o Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru ar waith cyn gynted â phosibl'. Fodd bynnag, rhaid ichi gydnabod y bydd goblygiadau o ran sut y byddwn yn ymdrin â chomisiynu o ganlyniad i ddiwygio'r GIG. Mae'n bwysig sicrhau bod pethau'n iawn yn y tymor byr, ond yr wyf hefyd yn paratoi ar gyfer yr hirdymor.

Fel chithau, mae'n rhyddhad imi mewn nifer o ffyrdd bod yr adroddiad hwn yn un cyhoeddus a bod gennym ddogfen ac argymhellion i'w trafod. Symud ymlaen yn agored ac yn dryloyw yw'r unig ffordd o ddatblygu polisi mewn unrhyw faes. Un o'r prif faterion i mi yw nid beth sydd wedi digwydd yn hanesyddol na phwy sydd wedi rheoli hyn; yr wyf wedi gwneud hyn yn ystod fy nghyfnod i yn y swydd a chymeraf gyfrifoldeb drosto.

Bethan Jenkins: Mae gennyf gyfraniad byr i'w wneud, yn benodol mewn perthynas ag anhwylderau bwyta, oherwydd dyna un o'm prif ddiddordebau o ran diwygio Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog reoli'r newid ar fyrder a chynllunio unrhyw newid yng nghyfrifoldebau CIC i gynnwys strategaeth a model darparu gwasanaethau mwy cynhwysfawr i gwmpasu risg a chymhlethdod anhwylderau bwyta. Yr wyf wedi cael ymateb gennych ynghylch llwybr gofal ond credaf, os bwriedir newid CIC, ei bod yn rhaid inni ystyried pwy sy'n ysgwyddo'r cyfrifoldebau eraill o ran comisiynu gwasanaethau, boed yn y maes gofal sylfaenol neu mewn ymddiriedolaeth, er mwyn i'r rheini yn y maes fod yn

key changes take place.

HCW is also currently involved in a formal pathfinder project with Gwent Local Health Board to try to find a more collaborative and evidence-based process for planning and evaluating the commissioning of individual tertiary services for eating disorder patients. Where exactly will those projects find themselves within the broader context of reforming HCW and in reforming the NHS in general?

Edwina Hart: I will respond to your last point first. Any worthwhile work that has been undertaken, and is currently being undertaken, in Gwent will continue. I cannot say at present how these projects will continue, because we have not finished the consultation on how we will deal with future NHS structures, but I can assure you that we do not want to lose all of the good stuff in any change.

On eating disorders, it is clear that we do not have a structured approach for commissioning across the piece. Vulnerable people go back into the primary care system, where they have no support; they need specialist care, but where do they go? One of the challenges of the new system will be to get the care pathways absolutely correct, with a seamless service for patients as they are identified, go through the system and, if they have to go into hospital, as they are supported in primary care when they are discharged. It is interesting to note that, of the issues to emerge from this, eating disorders have featured strongly in Professor Aylward's report.

ymwybodol o'r hyn fydd yn digwydd cyn i'r newidiadau allweddol hynny ddigwydd.

Yn ogystal, mae CIC yn rhan o brosiect llwybro ffurfiol gyda Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Gwent i geisio dod o hyd i broses fwy cydweithiol sy'n seiliedig ar dystiolaeth ar gyfer cynllunio a gwerthuso'r ffordd y caiff gwasanaethau trydyddol unigol ar gyfer cleifion a chanddynt anhwylderau bwyta eu comisiynu. Beth yn union fydd sefyllfa'r prosiectau hynny yng nghyd-destun diwygio CIC a diwygio'r GIG yn gyffredinol?

Edwina Hart: Ymatebaf i'ch pwynt olaf yn gyntaf. Bydd unrhyw waith gwerth chweil a wnaethpwyd, ac sy'n cael ei wneud ar hyn o bryd, yng Ngwent yn parhau. Ni allaf ddweud ar hyn o bryd sut y bydd y prosiectau hyn yn parhau, oherwydd nid ydym wedi gorffen yr ymgynghoriad ynghylch sut y byddwn yn ymdrin â strwythurau'r GIG yn y dyfodol, ond gallaf eich sicrhau nad ydym am golli'r holl bethau da o ganlyniad i newid.

O ran anhwylderau bwyta, mae'n amlwg nad oes gennym ymagwedd strwythuredig at gomisiynu yn gyffredinol. Mae pobl sy'n agored i niwed yn dychwelyd i'r system gofal sylfaenol, lle nad oes ganddynt unrhyw gymorth; mae angen gofal arbenigol arnynt, ond i le yr ânt? Un o'r heriau ar gyfer y system newydd fydd sicrhau bod y llwybrau gofal yn gwbl gywir, gyda gwasanaeth di-dor i gleifion wrth iddynt gael eu nodi, wrth iddynt fynd drwy'r system ac, os oes rhaid iddynt fynd i'r ysbyty, wrth iddynt gael cymorth gan ofal sylfaenol pan gânt eu rhyddhau. Mae'n ddiddorol nodi, o blith y materion sy'n deillio o hyn, bod anhwylderau bwyta yn elfen gref yn adroddiad yr Athro Aylward.

Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Comisiynydd Pobl Hŷn Cymru (Diwygio) 2008 Approval of the Commissioner for Older People in Wales (Amendment) Regulations 2008

Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Wasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Gwenda Thomas): Cynigïaf fod

The Deputy Minister for Social Services (Gwenda Thomas): I propose that

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 24.4:

the National Assembly for Wales; in accordance with Standing Order No. 24.4

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Is-ddeddfwriaeth a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Mai 2008 mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Comisiynydd Pobl Hŷn Cymru (Diwygio) 2008; a

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Comisiynydd Pobl Hŷn Cymru (Diwygio) 2008, yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:

(a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 30 Ebrill 2008; a

(b) y memorandwm esboniadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 30 Ebrill 2008. (NDM3951)

David Lloyd: Yr wyf am siarad yn fyr o blaid y rheoliadau hyn, sy'n cyflwyno mân welliannau technegol i Reoliadau Comisiynydd Pobl Hŷn Cymru 2007, yn sgîl gweithredu Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006. Mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn nodi'n fanwl y bobl hynny sy'n dod o dan rymoedd y comisiynydd pobl hŷn, gan gadarnhau pwerau'r comisiynydd ac, felly, gryfhau ei rôl. Byddai peidio â phasio'r rheoliadau hyn yn gwneud rôl y comisiynydd yn llai clir, gan fod Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006 yn awr mewn grym ac wedi esgor ar rai newidiadau deddfwriaethol y mae angen eu cysoni â Rheoliadau Comisiynydd Pobl Hŷn Cymru 2007. Felly, nid dyma'r lle i drafod rôl y comisiynydd; dyma'r lle i wneud y diwygiadau technegol i'r rheoliadau.

Eleanor Burnham: Cymeradwyaf yr hyn a ddywedodd Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Is-ddeddfwriaeth; yr wyf innau'n aelod o'r pwyllgor hwnnw. Edrychaf ymlaen yn fawr at weld ffrwyth gwaith y comisiynydd.

Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Wasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Gwenda Thomas): Croesawaf y cyfle i gael y ddadl hon ar y gwelliannau i'r rheoliadau presennol.

The draft Commissioner for Older People in Wales (Amendment) Regulations 2008 do not change the substance of the regulations.

1. considers the report of the Subordinate Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 13 May 2008 in relation to the draft Commissioner for Older People in Wales (Amendment) Regulations 2008; and

2. approves that the draft Commissioner for Older People in Wales (Amendment) Regulations 2008 is made in accordance with:

(a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 30 April 2008; and

(b) the explanatory memorandum laid in the Table Office on 30 April 2008. (NDM3951)

David Lloyd: I wish to speak briefly in support of these regulations, which introduce some minor technical amendments to the Commissioner for Older People in Wales Regulations 2007, as a result of the enactment of the Government of Wales Act 2006. These regulations give details of the people covered by the powers of the older people's commissioner. They confirm the commissioner's powers, thereby strengthening the role. Failure to carry these regulations would make the commissioner's role less clear, given that the Government of Wales Act 2006 is now in force, leading to some legislative changes that need to be reconciled with the Commissioner for Older People in Wales Regulations 2007. Therefore, this is not the place to discuss the commissioner's role; this is the place to make these technical amendments to the regulations.

Eleanor Burnham: I endorse what the Chair of the Subordinate Legislation Committee said; I am a member of that committee. I look forward to seeing the fruits of the commissioner's labour.

The Deputy Minister for Social Services (Gwenda Thomas): I welcome the opportunity to have this debate on the amendments to the current regulations.

Nid yw Rheoliadau drafft Comisiynydd Pobl Hŷn Cymru (Diwygio) 2008 yn newid sylwedd y rheoliadau. Maent yn egluro'r

They bring clarity to the face of the regulations and, therefore, I commend the motion.

rheoliadau ac, felly, cymeradwyaf y cynnig.

Y Llywydd: Y cynnig yw bod y cynnig yn cael ei dderbyn. A oes gwrthwynebiad? Gwelaf nad oes. Yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.35, felly, caiff y cynnig ei dderbyn.

The Presiding Officer: The proposal is that the motion be agreed. Is there any objection? I see that there is not. In accordance with Standing Order No. 7.35, the motion is therefore agreed.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd (Rosemary Butler) i'r Gadair am 4.29 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer (Rosemary Butler) took the Chair at 4.29 p.m.*

Dehongli a Mynediad i Dreftadaeth Heritage Interpretation and Access

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1 and 2 in the name of William Graham and amendments 3, 4 and 5 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 2 yn enw William Graham a gwelliannau 3, 4 a 5 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

Y Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth (Rhodri Glyn Thomas): Cynigiad fod

The Minister for Heritage (Rhodri Glyn Thomas): I propose that

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. yn cydnabod ymrwymiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wneud amgylchedd hanesyddol Cymru'n haws i'w gyrchu'n ddeallusol ac yn ffisegol drwy ddatblygu gwell mynediad a dehongliad o dreftadaeth;

1. acknowledges the Welsh Assembly Government's commitment to making the Welsh historic environment more intellectually and physically accessible by developing better access and heritage interpretation;

2. yn croesawu cynlluniau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gyflawni ei hymrwymiad yn 'Cymru'n Un' i adeiladu ar lwyddiant mynediad am ddim i amgueddfeydd ac orielau cenedlaethol drwy ganiatáu mynediad am ddim i bensiynwyr a phlant Cymru i safleoedd treftadaeth o dan ofal Cadw o 1 Medi 2008. (NDM3952)

2. welcomes the Welsh Assembly Government's plans to fulfill its 'One Wales' commitment to build on the success of free entry to national museums and galleries by allowing Welsh pensioners and Welsh children free entry to heritage sites under the care of Cadw from 1 September 2008. (NDM3952)

4.30 p.m.

Mae'n bleser cael y cyfle heddiw i gyflwyno cynlluniau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i sicrhau mynediad i'n treftadaeth ar gyfer cynulleidfa ehangach. Mae fy ngweledigaeth i'n cyfleu'r angen i amddiffyn ein hamgylchedd hanesyddol ac i sicrhau mynediad iddo. Mae'n briodol i werthfawrogi ein hamgylchedd am yr hyn y mae'n ei

It is a pleasure to have the opportunity today to introduce the plans of the Assembly Government to secure access to our heritage for a wider audience. My vision conveys the need to protect our historic environment as well as to secure access to it. It is appropriate that we should appreciate our environment for what it represents, and it is important to

gynrychioli, ond mae'n bwysig cydnabod y cyfraniad y gall ei wneud tuag at adfywio economaidd a chymunedol. Gall rhwystrau o ran mynediad i safleoedd treftadaeth fod yn rwystrau gorfforol, deallusol ac ariannol. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, drwy Cadw, yn paratoi rhaglen waith gynhwysfawr i fynd i'r afael â'r rhwystrau ac i fanteisio'n llawn ar ein hamgylchedd hanesyddol.

Mae Cadw wedi ymateb i Ddeddf Gwahaniaethu ar sail Anabledd 2005 drwy gyhoeddi strategaeth mynediad sy'n cyfrannu at raglen waith ar fynediad corfforol i'r 127 o safleoedd yng ngofal Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Oherwydd eu natur, adeiladwyd cestyll i gadw pobl allan, ac y maent felly yn cynrychioli cryn her o ran mynediad. Mae gwaith helaeth wedi ei gyflawni i roi mynediad yn Llys yr Esgob, Tyddewi yn sir Benfro ac yng nghastell Cydweli a chastell Cas-gwent. Yng ngogledd Cymru, mae Cadw wedi agor mynediad i adrannau ychwanegol o furiau tref Conwy ac y mae, ar hyn o bryd, yn gwella'r fynedfa i gastell Caernarfon drwy adeiladu pont gyfoes o'r ansawdd uchaf. Mae Cadw hefyd yn gweithio gyda phartneriaid lleol i drefnu mynediad i furiau'r dref yng Nghaernarfon er mwyn iddynt fod yn atyniad yn y dref unwaith eto.

Mae safleoedd eraill wedi eu trawsnewid dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf, drwy raglenni o gynhaliath a mynediad i'r cyhoedd, yn cynnwys rhai o gestyll tywysogion Cymru, megis cestyll Dinefwr, Dryslwyn a Dolforwyn. Mae cymorthdaliadau i leoliadau a safleoedd sydd y tu hwnt i ofal Cadw fel arfer yn cynnwys adran sy'n cyfeirio at ddarparu mynediad i'r cyhoedd.

Cadw has a strong track record in the provision of interpretation panels, publications and exhibitions. It is now developing innovative approaches, including the use of modern technology, to attract new audiences and to keep current visitors satisfied. Cadw has responded with the development of a major heritage tourism and interpretation project. It will allow individuals, communities and visitors to enjoy and engage with our heritage. Recently, I have visited some of those major new projects, including Castell Coch and Plas Mawr in Conwy, where groundbreaking

acknowledge the contribution that it can make to economic and community regeneration. Barriers to accessing heritage sites can be physical, intellectual and financial. Through Cadw, the Assembly Government is preparing a comprehensive work programme to tackle the obstacles and to take full advantage of our historic environment.

Cadw has responded to the Disability Discrimination Act 2005 by publishing an access strategy that feeds into the programme of work on physical access to the 127 sites in the care of the Welsh Assembly Government. By their very nature, castles were built to keep people out, and therefore pose quite a challenge in terms of access. Massive access works have been undertaken at the St David's Bishop's Palace in Pembrokeshire and at Kidwelly castle and Chepstow castle. In north Wales, Cadw has opened up access to additional sections of the Conwy town walls and is currently improving the entrance to Caernarfon castle by building a contemporary bridge of the highest quality. Cadw is also working with local partners to arrange access to the town walls in Caernarfon so that they can become an attraction in the town once more.

Other sites have been transformed over the past few years, through maintenance and public access programmes. These include some of the castles of the Welsh princes, such as Dinefwr, Dryslwyn and Dolforwyn castles. Grants for sites and locations that are outside of the remit of Cadw usually include a section referring to the provision of public access.

Mae gan Cadw record gref o ran darparu panelau dehongli ac arddangosfeydd. Bellach mae'n datblygu dulliau arloesol, yn cynnwys defnyddio technoleg fodern, i ddenu cynulleidfaoedd newydd ac i gadw ymwelwyr cyfredol yn fodlon. Mae Cadw wedi ymateb drwy ddatblygu prosiect mawr twristiaeth treftadaeth a dehongli. Bydd yn caniatáu i unigolion, cymunedau ac ymwelwyr fwynhau ac ymgysylltu â'n treftadaeth. Yn ddiweddar, yr wyf wedi ymweld â rhai o'r prosiectau mawr newydd hynny, gan gynnwys Castell Coch a Phlas Mawr yng Nghonwy, lle mae arddangosfeydd

hands-on displays have been established. Unusually, visitors are encouraged to touch relief models, listen to audio presentations and use touch-screen technology.

We also aware of the need to engage families in the process of discovery and learning. At Conwy castle, a new detective trail is being trialled that allows children and parents to work together. At Raglan castle, we are now using Bluetooth technology to enable visitors to download audio stories to their mobile phones for free.

Blaenavon ironworks is a major success story. The new interpretation of our social history at the associated ironworks cottages featured in BBC Wales's *Coal House* series. This forms part of the Blaenavon world heritage site and has made a major contribution towards revitalising the community.

We should not forget the new initiatives that continue to be developed at those heritage attractions run by partner organisations. For example, I wish to welcome the opening tomorrow of the new Cardiff castle interpretation centre. This major investment by the local authority is an example of the commitment made by partner organisations to the provision of improved intellectual and physical access to the historic environment.

Wales's future is its young people, and we need to ensure that we instil lasting and genuine interest in and ownership of the historic environment for future generations. Cadw is now developing an educational programme that will capture the imagination of our children and encourage adult visitors to find out more about their heritage. Together with its partners, Cadw is also increasing opportunities for local community engagement and participation in archaeological excavations and conservation projects.

I now move to the final piece of the jigsaw, which will help to open up the historic environment to a wider audience. Recent research commissioned by Cadw indicated that, despite the value that respondents placed

cyffwrdd sy'n torri tir newydd wedi cael eu sefydlu. Yn anarferol, caiff ymwelwyr eu hannog i gyffwrdd modelau cerfweddol, i wrando ar gyflwyniadau sain ac i ddefnyddio technoleg sgriniau cyffwrdd.

Yr ydym hefyd yn ymwybodol o'r angen i gynnwys teuluoedd yn y broses o ddarganfod a dysgu. Yng nghastell Conwy, mae llwybr ditectif newydd yn cael ei dreialu sy'n caniatáu i blant a rheini weithio gyda'i gilydd. Yng nghastell Rhaglan, yr ydym bellach yn defnyddio technoleg Bluetooth i alluogi ymwelwyr i lawrlwytho storïau sain i'w ffonau symudol am ddim.

Mae gwaith haearn Blaenafon wedi bod yn llwyddiant mawr. Ymddangosodd y dehongliad newydd o'n hanes cymdeithasol yn y bythynnod a oedd ynghlwm wrth y gwaith haearn ar gyfres *Coal House* BBC Cymru. Mae hyn yn rhan o safle treftadaeth byd Blaenafon ac mae wedi cyfrannu'n fawr tuag at adfywio'r gymuned.

Ni ddylem anghofio'r cynlluniau newydd sy'n dal i gael eu datblygu yn yr atyniadau treftadaeth hynny sy'n cael eu rhedeg gan gyrff partner. Er enghraifft, hoffwn groesawu agor canolfan ddehongli newydd castell Caerdydd yfory. Mae'r buddsoddiad mawr hwn gan yr awdurdod lleol yn enghraifft o'r ymrwymiad a wnaethpwyd gan gyrff partner i ddarparu gwell mynediad deallusol a chorfforol i'r amgylchedd hanesyddol.

Ei phobl ifanc yw dyfodol Cymru, ac mae angen inni sicrhau ein bod yn sefydlu diddordeb gwirioneddol, a fydd yn para, yn yr amgylchedd hanesyddol, ac yn y berchenogaeth arno, ar gyfer cenedlaethau'r dyfodol. Erbyn hyn mae Cadw yn datblygu rhaglen addysgol a fydd yn dal dychymyg ein plant ac yn annog oedolion sy'n ymweld i ganfod mwy am eu treftadaeth. Gyda'i bartneriaid, mae Cadw hefyd yn cynyddu'r cyfleoedd i weithio gyda'r gymuned leol a'i galluogi i gymryd rhan mewn cloddiadau archeolegol a phrosiectau cadwraeth.

Symudaf yn awr at y darn olaf yn y jig-so, a fydd yn help i agor yr amgylchedd hanesyddol i gynulleidfa ehangach. Dangosodd ymchwil diweddar a gomisiynwyd gan Cadw nad oedd bron i

on heritage, nearly half had not visited a heritage site in Wales for at least a year. The greatest factor in deterring those potential visitors was an entrance fee. I want to help to remove a major obstacle to a crucial section of our society being able to visit heritage sites. Following the success story of the National Museum Wales, I want to provide free entry for Welsh children and pensioners to Cadw sites from 1 September 2008. We will fulfil our 'One Wales' commitment, and this follows my announcement in Plenary in February that entrance to Blaenavon mine works would be free from Easter 2008. I also want to announce that there will be free entry for all at Caerleon Roman fortress baths from 1 September 2008. As at Blaenavon, the current charging policy at the Roman baths is confusing, because the National Roman Legion Museum site is free, as are the amphitheatre and barracks. This is deterring visitors from gaining a full understanding of the wider historic context of the monuments.

The increase in visits to National Museum Wales sites since the introduction of free entry has encouraged a wider interest in museums. I believe that this new initiative will spark a similar rise in interest in the wider historic environment and therefore encourage more people to visit our heritage attractions.

O ran y gwelliannau, byddaf yn gwrthwynebu gwelliant 1 am ei fod yn galw am adroddiad blynyddol. Mae gennym ddatganiad sylweddol yn 'Datganiad Sefyllfa Amgylchedd Hanesyddol Cymru 2007'. Nid wyf am ddyblygu'r gwaith sydd wedi ei gyflawni eisoes yn yr adroddiad hwnnw, a fydd yn parhau.

Yr wyf hefyd am wrthod gwelliant 2, sydd eto yn enw William Graham, oherwydd bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, yn ôl yr argymhelliad yn 'Cymru'n Un', wedi comisiynu adroddiad dichonolrwydd i edrych ar y posibilrwydd o greu oriel genedlaethol i Gymru.

hanner y rhai a ymatebodd, er gwaethaf y gwerth a roddant ar dreftadaeth, wedi ymweld â safle treftadaeth yng Nghymru ers blwyddyn o leiaf. Y ffactor mwyaf sy'n atal yr ymwelwyr posibl hynny oedd ffi mynediad. Yr wyf am helpu i gael gwared â rhwystr mawr sy'n atal carfan hollbwysig o'n cymdeithas rhag gallu ymweld â safleoedd treftadaeth. Yn dilyn y llwyddiant a gafwyd gydag Amgueddfa Genedlaethol Cymru, yr wyf am ddarparu mynediad am ddim i blant Cymru a phensiynwyr i safleoedd Cadw o 1 Medi 2008. Yr ydym yn benderfynol o wireddu'r ymrwymiad yn 'Cymru'n Un, ac mae hyn yn dilyn fy nghyhoeddiad mewn Cyfarfod Llawn ym mis Chwefror y byddai mynediad i weithfeydd Blaenafon yn rhad ac am ddim o Basg 2008. Yr wyf hefyd am gyhoeddi y bydd mynediad am ddim i bawb i faddonau'r gaer Rufeinig yng Nghaerllion o 1 Medi 2008. Megis ym Mlaenafon, mae'r polisi presennol i godi tâl yn y baddonau Rhufeinig yn peri dryswch, oherwydd mae Amgueddfa Genedlaethol y Lleng Rufeinig yn rhad ac am ddim, fel y mae'r amffitheatr a'r barics. Mae hyn yn atal ymwelwyr rhag meithrin dealltwriaeth lawn o gyd-destun hanesyddol ehangach yr henebion hyn.

Mae'r cynnydd mewn ymweliadau â safleoedd Amgueddfa Genedlaethol Cymru ers cyflwyno mynediad am ddim wedi annog diddordeb ehangach mewn amgueddfeydd. Credaf y bydd y cynllun newydd hwn yn ysgogi cynnydd tebyg mewn diddordeb yn yr amgylchedd hanesyddol ehangach ac y bydd felly yn annog rhagor o bobl i ymweld â'n hatyniadau treftadaeth.

In terms of the amendments, I object to amendment 1 as it calls for an annual report. We have a substantial statement in 'The 2007 Welsh Historic Environment Position Statement'. I do not wish to duplicate the work that has already been done in this report, which will continue.

I also object to amendment 2, which has also been tabled in the name of William Graham, because the Welsh Assembly Government, according to the recommendation in 'One Wales', has commissioned a feasibility report to consider the possibility of creating a national gallery for Wales.

Yr wyf am wrthwynebu gwelliant 3 yn enw Kirsty Williams oherwydd y bu i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gyhoeddi yn ddiweddar strategaeth drafnidiaeth, sef 'Cymru'n Un: Cysylltu'r Genedl—Strategaeth Drafnidiaeth Cymru', sy'n gosod allan yr hyn sy'n cael ei geisio yng ngwelliant 3.

Yr wyf am wrthod gwelliant 4, sydd hefyd wedi ei osod yn enw Kirsty Williams. Pe bai'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wedi siarad â chefnogwyr llinell rheilffordd Calon Cymru, byddent yn gwybod nad oedd y cyfeillion a'r chefnogwyr hynny am weld tocynnau yn rhad ac am ddim yn yr haf gan fod hynny'n golygu bod y trên yn llawn wrth adael Abertawe ac nad oes lle i unrhyw un arall ar y trên, gan greu pob math o broblemau yn ystod yr haf.

O ran gwelliant 5, sydd eto yn enw Kirsty Williams, yr wyf am wrthwynebu'r gwelliant gan ei fod yn gwbl amherthnasol i'r hyn yr ydym yn ei drafod y prynhawn yma.

Paul Davies: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw William Graham. Gwelliant 1: cynnwys pwynt 2 newydd ac ailrifo'r pwyntiau sy'n dilyn:

yn mynnu bod y Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth yn cynhyrchu adroddiad blynyddol i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru am y cynnydd a wnaethpwyd o ran gwneud amgylchedd hanesyddol Cymru o fewn cyrraedd rhagor o bobl yn ddeallusol ac yn gorfforol.'

Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn gresynu at y ffaith bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi methu â gosod amserlen i sefydlu oriel gelf genedlaethol benodol ar gyfer Cymru.

Mae'n bleser gennyf gymryd rhan yn y ddadl hon a chynnig y gwelliannau yn enw William Graham ar ran y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig. Mae gan Gymru rai o'r cofgolofnau hanesyddol a hynafol gorau yn y Deyrnas Unedig, ac mae gennym sefydliadau diwylliannol eang i'w cynnig i'r byd; fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, mae gennym gestyll a golygfeydd hyfryd. Yn nhermau'r farchnad dramor, mae gan Gymru

I oppose amendment 3 in the name of Kirsty Williams because the Welsh Assembly Government recently announced a transport strategy, namely 'One Wales: Connecting the Nation—Wales Transport Strategy', which sets out what is sought in amendment 3.

I reject amendment 4, which has been tabled in the name of Kirsty Williams. If the Liberal Democrats had consulted with the supporters of the Heart of Wales line, they would know that the friends and supporters of that line do not wish to see free summer passes because that means that the train is full when it departs from Swansea and that there is no room for anyone else on the train, which creates all sorts of problems during the summer months.

I also reject amendment 5, which is also in the name of Kirsty Williams, as it is totally irrelevant to the topic of discussion this afternoon.

Paul Davies: I propose the following amendments in the name of William Graham. Amendment 1: add as a new point 2 and renumber accordingly:

requires the Minister for Heritage to produce an annual report to the National Assembly for Wales on the progress made in making the Welsh historic environment more intellectually and physically accessible.

Amendment 2: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

regrets that the Welsh Assembly Government has failed to set a timetable to establish a dedicated national art gallery for Wales.

It is a pleasure to participate in this debate and to propose the amendments in the name of William Graham on behalf of the Welsh Conservatives. Wales has some of the best historic and ancient monuments in the United Kingdom and we have cultural institutions that can offer a great deal to the world; as the Minister mentioned, we have wonderful castles and vistas. In terms of the foreign

safleoedd treftadaeth, amgueddfeydd ac orielau sy'n bwysig i ddenu pobl yma yn y lle cyntaf.

market, Wales has heritage sites, museums and galleries that are important in attracting people here in the first place.

4.40 p.m.

Yr wyf yn croesawu'r ffaith bod y Llywodraeth wedi ymrwymo i wella mynediad i bawb i'n safleoedd treftadaeth. Llongyfarchaf y Gweinidog am gynnig bod pensiynwyr a phlant yn cael mynediad am ddim o fis Medi ymlaen i'r safleoedd treftadaeth sydd o dan gyfrifoldeb Cadw. Bydd hynny'n hwb sylweddol i'r safleoedd hynny ac yn sicrhau bod gan bensiynwyr a phlant y cyfle i ymweld â rhai o'n safleoedd hanesyddol heb ofidio am y gost. Bydd hynny'n addysgiadol allweddol oherwydd, gobeithio, bydd yn rhoi cyfle i fwy o ysgolion ymweld â'r safleoedd pwysig hynny. Mae sgôp enfawr i hybu ein safleoedd diwylliannol ymhellach drwy dargedu ein buddsoddiadau a sicrhau marchnata gwell i'r dyfodol.

I welcome the fact that the Government is committed to ensuring better access for all to our heritage sites. I congratulate the Minister for proposing that children and pensioners should have free access from September onwards to the heritage sites under the remit of Cade. This will be a great boost to these sites and will ensure that these groups have the opportunity to see some of our historic sites without being worried about the cost. In terms of education, this too will be crucial, because I hope that it will give more schools an opportunity to visit these important sites. There is great scope to further promote our cultural sites through targeting our investment and ensuring better marketing in the future.

Mae'n bwysig annog Cadw i wneud ei safleoedd yn fwy atyniadol i bawb drwy werthu tocynnau ar y rhyngwyd ac mewn ffyrdd eraill. Mae'n hollbwysig ein bod, yn ogystal â rhoi mynediad am ddim i blant a phensiynwyr, yn cynnig tocynnau rhatach a thocynnau arbennig i deuluoedd a myfyrwyr. Gobeithiaf y bydd hynny'n cynnig mwy o gyfle i bobl ymweld â'n safleoedd arbennig, a sicrhau bod mwy o bobl yn dysgu am ein hanes cyfoethog. Byddai gwneud mynediad i'n safleoedd yn haws hefyd yn codi proffil ein treftadaeth, ac felly yn denu rhagor o bobl. Gobeithiaf y bydd hyn yn cael effaith ehangach drwy ddenu ymwelwyr i rai o'r safleoedd hyn hefyd.

It is important that we encourage Cadw to make its sites more attractive to all by selling tickets on the internet and in other ways. It is vital that, as well as giving free access to children and pensioners, we offer discounted tickets or special packages to families and students. I hope that this will provide further opportunities for people to visit our sites and ensure that more people learn about our rich history. Making it easier for people to access our sites would also raise the profile of our heritage, thereby attracting more people. I hope that this will have a broader impact by attracting tourists to some of these sites also.

Er mwyn gweld effaith y cynlluniau hyn ar ein hamgylchedd hanesyddol, credaf y byddai o fudd i'r Gweinidog gyhoeddi adroddiad blynyddol i'r Cynulliad. Byddai adroddiad o'r fath yn ein galluogi, fel Cynulliad, i weld cynnydd. Fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, mae'r ffigurau yn cael eu casglu beth bynnag, ond byddai adroddiad o'r fath yn sicrhau ymateb ffurfiol. Hefyd, byddai'r fath adroddiad ar gael i bawb, a gobeithiwn y byddai'n lledaenu neges bositif a chodi proffil y sefydliadau hanesyddol hyn ymhellach. Efallai y gallai hyd yn oed ddenu

In order to see the impact of these plans on our historic environment, I believe that it would be beneficial for the Minister to publish an annual report to the Assembly. Such a report would enable us, as an Assembly, to see progress. As the Minister said, the figures are already gathered, but such a report would formalise the process. Also, such a report would be available to all, and I hope that that would send a positive message and raise the profile of these historic sites even further; it could, perhaps, even attract more foreign visitors to our country.

mwy o ymwelwyr o dramor.

Er mwyn denu mwy o bobl i'n safleoedd treftadaeth, mae'n rhaid bod gennym sefydliadau o safon byd-eang, a dyna pam mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn sefydlu oriel genedlaethol i Gymru cyn gynted â phosibl. Yr wyf yn cydnabod bod hyn yn un o ymrwymadau Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un, ond yr wyf yn siomedig bod y Gweinidog wedi methu â sefydlu amserlen ar ei chyfer hyd yn hyn; efallai y byddai mor garedig ag ehangu ar y mater hwn wrth ymateb i'r ddadl. Gallai oriel o'r fath fod yn gysylltiedig â'r rhwydwaith o orielau ac amgueddfeydd ar draws Cymru. Mae'n hollbwysig bod storfeydd diogel a digonol ar gyfer gwaith celf, a byddai oriel genedlaethol yn gallu sicrhau hynny. Yn bwysicach, byddai oriel genedlaethol yn sicrhau bod llawer o'r gweithiau celf sydd mewn storfeydd ar draws Cymru ar hyd o bryd yn cael eu harddangos. Yn anffodus, mae'r gweithiau hyn yn mynd yn wastraff ar hyn o bryd, ac nid yw'r cyhoedd yn cael y cyfle i fwynhau ein cyfoeth o gelfyddyd.

Ailadroddaf, ar ran yr wrthblaid, ein cefnogaeth i ymrwymadau'r Llywodraeth i wneud amgylchedd hanesyddol Cymru yn fwy hygrych, yn ddeallusol ac yn gorfforol, drwy wella mynediad. Byddai mynediad gwell yn sicr o gymorth wrth farchnata ein safleoedd hanesyddol a'n treftadaeth. Yn y pen draw, hyderaf y bydd hyn yn golygu bod mwy o bobl yn ymweld â'n sefydliadau hanesyddol a bod pobl o bob cefndir yn cael y cyfle i fwynhau ein hanes cyfoethog.

Yr wyf yn croesawu'r ddadl ac yn cefnogi'r hyn y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ceisio'i gyflawni, ond er mwyn sicrhau bod nifer y bobl sy'n mynychu ein safleoedd treftadaeth yn cynyddu, mae'n bwysig bod y Llywodraeth yn cyhoeddi adroddiad blynyddol. Gobeithiaf, felly, y bydd Aelodau yn cefnogi ein gwelliannau heddiw.

Peter Black: I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 3: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to

In order to attract more people to our heritage sites, we need world-class institutions, and that is why it is crucial that we establish a national gallery for Wales as soon as possible. I acknowledge that this is a One Wales Government commitment, but I am disappointed that the Minister has failed to set a timetable for this; I would be grateful if he could expand on this in his response to the debate. Such a gallery could be linked to the network of galleries and museums across Wales. It is vital that there we have safe and adequate storage for our artworks, and a national gallery could secure that. More importantly, a national gallery would ensure that many of the artworks currently held in storage throughout Wales were exhibited. Unfortunately, many of these works are going to waste, and the public do not have an opportunity to enjoy our rich artistic heritage.

I repeat, on behalf of the opposition, that we support the Government's commitment to ensuring that the Welsh historic environment is more accessible, both intellectually and physically, by developing better access. Better access would certainly assist in marketing our historic sites and our heritage. At the end of the day, I am confident that this will mean that more people visit our historic sites, and that people from all backgrounds will have an opportunity to enjoy our rich history.

I welcome this debate and support the Government's aims, but, in order to ensure an increase in the numbers visiting our heritage sites, it is important that the Government publishes an annual report. I hope, therefore, that Members support our amendments today.

Peter Black: Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 3: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i

ensure that all improvements to accessibility must be accompanied by adequate provision of public transport to ensure the Welsh historic environment is available to all.

Amendment 4: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

notes with regret that Welsh pensioners and disabled people will be significantly disadvantaged in enjoying Welsh heritage at the best time to do so due to the withdrawal of their free passes on the Heart of Wales line throughout the summer period.

Amendment 5: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

would welcome plans to allow Welsh children free entry to the heritage sites in Cadw care once all other WAG spending commitments for Welsh children have been met.

I will start by agreeing with the Minister that it is vital that access, both physical and intellectual, to the Welsh historic environment is achieved, and I am pleased that he and the Government are taking this seriously. Improving accessibility is a huge and important task, and we hope that this will be properly funded. I emphasise that as we have seen plenty of evidence in recent months of the Welsh Assembly Government making some laudable commitments and getting hopes up, but failing to properly fund them. I hope that the Minister has ensured that the budget is in place to deliver exactly what he is promising to children and pensioners around Wales, because, otherwise, once again, they will find themselves disappointed by the Government's failures to deliver on what it has offered.

A particularly important issue in improving access to Wales's historic environment is public transport to and from such places. It is all well and good to say that the physical and intellectual access to places has been improved to make these places attractive and accessible for all, but you could argue that it is money wasted if no-one can get there. My party believes that local authorities need to

sicrhau bod yn rhaid i'r holl welliannau i hygyrchedd ddod gyda darpariaeth ddigonol o drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus i sicrhau bod amgylchedd hanesyddol Cymru ar gael i bawb.

Gwelliant 4: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn nodi gan resynu y bydd pobl anabl a phensiynwyr Cymru dan anfantais sylweddol o ran mwynhau treftadaeth Cymru ar yr adeg orau i wneud hynny oherwydd bod eu tocynnau i deithio am ddim ar reilffordd Calon Cymru'n cael eu diddymu drwy gydol cyfnod yr haf.

Gwelliant 5: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn croesawu cynlluniau i roi mynediad am ddim i blant Cymru ar gyfer safleoedd treftadaeth dan ofal Cadw ar ôl diwallu holl ymrwymadau gwario eraill Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer plant Cymru.

Dechreuaf drwy gytuno â'r Gweinidog ei bod yn hollbwysig fod mynediad, corfforol a deallusol, i amgylchedd hanesyddol Cymru yn cael ei sicrhau, ac yr wyf yn falch ei fod ef a'r Llywodraeth yn cymryd hyn o ddifrif. Mae gwella hygyrchedd yn dasg bwysig ac anferth, a gobeithiwn y caiff hyn ei ariannu'n briodol. Pwysleisias hynny gan ein bod wedi gweld digon o dystiolaeth yn y misoedd diwethaf o wneud rhai ymrwymadau canmoladwy gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a chodi gobeithion, ond methu â'u hariannu'n briodol. Yr wyf yn gobeithio bod y Gweinidog wedi sicrhau bod cyllideb ddigonol ar gael i gyflawni'r union beth y mae'n ei addo i blant a phensiynwyr o gwmpas Cymru, oherwydd, fel arall, byddant wedi'u siomi gan fethiannau'r Llywodraeth i gyflawni'r hyn y mae wedi'i gynnig.

Un mater neilltuol o bwysig o ran gwella mynediad i amgylchedd hanesyddol Cymru yw trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus yn ôl ac ymlaen i leoedd o'r fath. Mae'n ddigon hawdd dweud bod y mynediad ffisegol a deallusol i leoedd wedi'i wella i wneud y lleoedd hyn yn ddeniadol ac yn hygyrch i bawb, ond gallech ddadlau bod yr arian wedi'i wastraffu os na all neb gyrraedd y fan. Mae fy mhlaidd i'n

take cultural factors into account when planning local transport, housing and education schemes. These types of improvements to Wales's historic environment cannot be looked at in isolation, and they need to run in tandem with local plans. For example, many of Wales's train stations are not accessible to disabled people. Are there additional bus routes in rural areas that travel regularly to and from these sites? I do not believe that there are. It is all very well for the Minister to say that we have a transport strategy that has been recently published, but I do not recall a particular chapter in the transport strategy on how we should access historic sites and how the Welsh Assembly Government would invest in that. So, the planning is partly down to local authorities, but it is also down to the Welsh Assembly Government and Cadw. When we start to open these sites more to make them more accessible for disabled people and to make them more accessible in terms of the cost of accessing them, in other words, offering them free to children and pensioners, we must also ensure that, as part of those plans, there is a transport plan to ensure that people can get to the sites and use those concessions. If we do not have that, the whole exercise becomes fairly meaningless.

We welcome the free access that is mooted in the motion. When the Welsh Liberal Democrats were in Government, we introduced free access to museums and we are only too happy to endorse the extension to those plans to allow Welsh pensioners and Welsh children free entry to heritage sites under the care of Cadw from 1 September of this year. However, as our amendment states, we would welcome this proposal once all other Welsh Assembly Government spending commitments for Welsh children have been met. We heard on the news today that the Minister has changed course on the foundation phase. We know that funding for that particular scheme is not in place to deliver what the Welsh Assembly Government wants to deliver, that we do not have all of the funding in place to deliver the

credu bod angen i awdurdodau lleol ystyried ffactorau diwylliannol wrth gynllunio trafnidiaeth leol, tai a chynlluniau addysg. Ni ellir edrych ar welliannau o'r mathau hyn yn amgylchedd hanesyddol Cymru fel rhywbeth ar wahân, ac mae angen iddynt fynd law yn llaw â chynlluniau lleol. Er enghraifft, mae llawer o orsafoedd trenau yng Nghymru nad ydynt yn hygyrch i bobl anabl. A oes llwybrau bws ychwanegol mewn ardaloedd gwledig sy'n rhedeg yn ôl ac ymlaen yn rheolaidd i'r safleoedd hyn? Nid wyf yn meddwl bod rhai o'r fath. Mae'n ddigon hawdd i'r Gweinidog ddweud bod gennym strategaeth drafnidiaeth sydd wedi'i chyhoeddi'n ddiweddar, ond nid oes gennyf gof bod pennod neilltuol yn y strategaeth drafnidiaeth sy'n sôn am y modd y dylem gael mynediad i safleoedd hanesyddol a sut y byddai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn buddsoddi yn hynny. Felly, mae'r cynllunio'n fater i awdurdodau lleol yn rhannol, ond mae hefyd yn fater i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a Cadw. Pan ddechreuwn agor y safleoedd hyn ymhellach i'w gwneud yn fwy hygyrch i bobl anabl a'u gwneud yn fwy hygyrch o ran y gost o gael mynediad iddynt, mewn geiriau eraill, eu cynnig am ddim i blant a phensiynwyr, rhaid inni hefyd sicrhau, fel rhan o'r cynlluniau hynny, fod cynllun trafnidiaeth i sicrhau bod pobl yn gallu cyrraedd y safleoedd a manteisio ar y gostyngiadau hynny. Os na fydd hynny gennym, bydd yr holl ymdrech yn mynd yn eithaf diystyr.

Croesawn y mynediad di-dâl sydd wedi'i grybwyll yn y cynnig. Pan oedd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn y Llywodraeth, cyflwynasom fynediad am ddim i amgueddfeydd ac yr ydym yn fodlon iawn cefnogi'r bwriad i ymestyn y cynlluniau hynny i ganiatáu mynediad am ddim i bensiynwyr a phlant yng Nghymru i safleoedd treftadaeth sydd dan ofal Cadw o 1 Medi eleni. Er hynny, fel y mae ein gwelliant yn nodi, byddem yn croesawu'r cynnig hwn ar ôl cyflawni'r holl ymrwymadau eraill ar wariant gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer plant yng Nghymru. Clywsom ar y newyddion heddiw fod y Gweinidog wedi newid cyfeiriad ar y cyfnod sylfaen. Gwyddom nad yw cyllid ar gael ar gyfer y cynllun hwnnw i wireddu bwriad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, nad yw'r holl

improvements needed to schools around Wales, and that we still lack funds for further education and higher education.

Therefore, it is a question of priorities. This is one priority among many. The Assembly Government is putting forward a whole raft of priorities in terms of how it will use its limited budget. We often hear from the opposite side of the Chamber how limited the settlement was and how difficult it is to make ends meet because of the Barnett formula and the fact that the UK Government was not particularly generous this year, but money is still being found for other schemes when the core services that we need for education are not being properly funded. The Minister says that amendment 5 is irrelevant, but if the Minister thinks that funding the foundation phase and funding schools properly is irrelevant, there is something wrong with the Government's priorities.

On prioritising, the Minister spoke against our amendment on the Heart of Wales line because he said that people did not want to have free passes in the summer as the trains fill up at Swansea and local people are not able to use them. That underlines the Assembly Government's attitude towards transport. If you want people to use the Heart of Wales line, you should invest in the rolling stock and ensure that we can make use of the free passes, but do not do away with the free passes, because people rely on them all around the mid Wales area.

4.50 p.m.

Alun Davies: I thank the Minister for putting this on the agenda this afternoon. I welcome both your statement and your opening remarks about striking a balance between intellectual and physical accessibility, Minister.

For many of us, our heritage means much more than bricks and stones. Our heritage can be the beguiling, haunting and enchanting places where people made our history—

gyllid ar gael gennym i wneud y gwelliannau angenrheidiol mewn ysgolion o gwmpas Cymru, a'n bod yn dal yn brin o arian ar gyfer addysg bellach ac addysg uwch.

Felly, mae'n fater o flaenoriaethau. Mae hon yn un flaenoriaeth ymysg llawer. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cyflwyno nifer mawr o flaenoriaethau yng nghyd-destun y modd y bydd yn defnyddio ei chyllideb gyfyngedig. Clywn yn aml o ochr arall y Siambr pa mor gyfyngedig oedd y setliad a pha mor anodd yw cael deupen llinyn ynghyd oherwydd fformiwla Barnett a'r ffaith nad oedd Llywodraeth y DU yn neilltuol o hael eleni, ond deuir o hyd i arian, er hynny, ar gyfer cynlluniau eraill er nad yw'r gwasanaethau craidd y mae arnom eu hangen ar gyfer addysg yn cael eu hariannu'n briodol. Dywed y Gweinidog fod gwelliant 5 yn amherthnasol, ond os yw'r Gweinidog yn credu bod ariannu'r cyfnod sylfaen ac ariannu ysgolion yn briodol yn amherthnasol, mae rhywbeth o'i le ar flaenoriaethau'r Llywodraeth.

Ynghylch blaenoriaethu, dadleuodd y Gweinidog yn erbyn ein gwelliant ar reilffordd Calon Cymru am ei fod o'r farn nad oedd pobl am gael tocynnau am ddim yn yr haf am fod y trenau'n llenwi yn Abertawe ac nad yw pobl leol yn gallu eu defnyddio. Mae hynny'n amlygu ymagwedd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad at drafnidiaeth. Os ydych yn dymuno i bobl ddefnyddio rheilffordd Calon Cymru, dylech fuddsoddi yn y cerbydau a sicrhau ein bod yn gallu defnyddio'r tocynnau am ddim, ond peidiwch â chael gwared â'r tocynnau am ddim, gan fod pobl yn dibynnu arnynt ym mhob rhan o ganolbarth Cymru.

Alun Davies: Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am roi hyn ar yr agenda y prynhawn yma. Croesawaf eich datganiad a'ch sylwadau agoriadol am ddal y ddysgl yn wastad rhwng hygyrchedd deallusol a hygyrchedd ffisegol, Weinidog.

Yng ngolwg llawer ohonom, mae ein treftadaeth yn golygu llawer mwy na brics a cherrig. Gall ein treftadaeth fod yn lleoedd hudolus, swynol a chyfareddol lle y creodd

where people worked, lived, fought and struggled, forging the communities in which we live today. The Minister mentioned Blaenavon and, as many of you will know, I grew up in the shadow of the Sirhowy ironworks, which was part of that great arc of foundries that helped to create the industrial revolution in the northern part of the south Wales coalfield. It shaped the world. As a child, I played near the spot where the Chartists started their march to Newport. I remember talking in history lessons about the Scotch cattle that dominated the Sirhowy valley. That is a place in history that we can never forget. I believe that we have a responsibility to the people who fought for many of the rights that we enjoy today to ensure that that history is not simply forgotten. Many people throughout our communities are keeping the history alive.

Today, these communities have changed. Where we used to have tramlines, we now have cycle routes; where the canals used to be the heart of our communications structures, we now have footpaths. I walk on drovers' paths and follow in the footsteps of people who created a different economy, and a very different Wales. It is memories that give us our understanding and our cultural reference points, and which create a sense of belonging and a sense of place. I would like to see Cadw have a far greater remit—not simply to create museums, and to act as a curator, but to be a remembrancer, if you like, ensuring that we do not just preserve our heritage, but bring it to life. I see no purpose in protecting stones or preserving a site without, at the same time, investing in public understanding and public access to that site.

I believe that we can go further, and that is why I welcome the Minister's announcement this afternoon of free access for children and pensioners to Cadw sites. That will create new opportunities and new visitors. It is a huge and welcome step forward, and it will be appreciated across the whole of this country. I hope that the driving ambition behind the Assembly Government's policies remains. Our heritage belongs equally to all of us, and it is our responsibility to ensure

pobl ein hanes—lle'r oedd pobl yn gweithio, yn byw, ym ymladd ac yn ymdrechu, gan greu'r cymunedau yr ydym yn byw ynddynt heddiw. Cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog at Flaenafon ac, fel y gwyr llawer ohonoch, tyfais yng nghysgod gwaith haearn Sirhowy, a oedd yn rhan o'r gromlin hir honno o ffowndriau a helpodd i greu'r chwyldro diwydiannol yn rhan ogleddol maes glo de Cymru. Dylanwadodd ar y byd. Yn blentyn, chwaraewn ger y fan lle y cychwynnodd y Siartwyr ar eu gorymdaith i Gasnewydd. Yr wyf yn cofio sôn mewn gwersi hanes am y teirw Scotch a dra-arglwyddiaethai ar gwm Sirhywi. Dyna le mewn hanes na allwn byth ei anghofio. Yr wyf yn credu bod gennym gyfrifoldeb tuag at y bobl a frwydrodd dros gael llawer o'r hawliau yr ydym yn eu mwynhau heddiw i sicrhau nad anghofir yr hanes hwnnw. Mae llawer o bobl ym mhob un o'n cymunedau'n cadw'r hanes yn fyw.

Heddiw, mae'r cymunedau hyn wedi newid. Lle gynt y bu gennym dramffyrdd, mae gennym lwybrau beicio'n awr; lle gynt yr oedd camlesi wrth graidd ein strwythurau cyfathrebu, mae gennym lwybrau troed yn awr. Byddaf yn cerdded llwybrau porthmyn ac yn dilyn yn ôl traed pobl a greodd economi wahanol, a Chymru wahanol iawn. Atgofion sy'n rhoi i ni ein crebwyll a'n cyfeirbwyntiau diwylliannol, ac sy'n creu ymdeimlad o berthyn ac ymdeimlad o le. Carwn weld Cadw yn cael cylch gwaith ehangach o lawer—nid yn unig i greu amgueddfeydd, ac i weithredu fel curadur, ond i fod yn gofiadur, os caf ei roi felly, gan sicrhau ein bod nid yn unig yn cadw ein treftadaeth, ond yn dod ag ef yn fyw hefyd. Ni welaf ddiben mewn diogelu cerrig neu gadw safle heb fuddsoddi, yr un pryd, mewn dealltwriaeth gyhoeddus a mynediad cyhoeddus i'r safle hwnnw.

Yr wyf yn credu y gallwn fynd ymhellach, a dyna pam y croesawaf gyhoeddiad y Gweinidog y prynhawn yma am fynediad am ddim i blant a phensiynwyr i safleoedd Cadw. Bydd hynny'n creu cyfleoedd newydd ac yn denu ymwelwyr newydd. Mae'n gam mawr ymlaen sydd i'w groesawu, ac fe'i gwerthfawrogir ledled y wlad. Yr wyf yn gobeithio bod y prif uchelgais sy'n sail i bolisiau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn parhau. Mae ein treftadaeth yn eiddo i bob un

that access to our history is not limited either by the size of someone's wallet, or by their background or historical knowledge. Ours must be a shared history. We can change the way in which we do that. Technology is changing the way in which we can help people to understand this history and heritage. I hope that the Government will work with Cadw to ensure that new technology—whether it is podcasting, audio downloads, or whatever—is used to improve our understanding of the people who came before us.

I know that, at the works at Ebbw Vale, the Assembly Government is already investing in a unique, multimillion pound, high-tech visitor centre for the Heads of the Valleys region. It is technology-driven, but simple to use, and it will enable tens of thousands of people to access their own history, while providing a real boost for the local economy. We know that we can help people physically to access these different places, whether that is by providing inclines instead of steps or by helping those who have fears that these sorts of historical places are for others and not for them, overcome those fears.

In some places, history is spoken about in terms of kings and queens; we can talk about our history in very different terms. We can talk about real people who came before us and who fought for the rights that we enjoy today, and that is a history that I hope we will celebrate. I also hope that we will make it more accessible. It is a history of all of the people of this country, who created the whole of this country, and it will be made equally accessible to everyone.

Nerys Evans: Diolch am y cyfle i gyfrannu i'r ddadl y prynhawn yma. Cyn i mi sôn am dreftadaeth yn fwy eang, hoffwn ganolbwyntio ychydig ar ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth i wneud ein hamgylchedd hanesyddol yn haws i'w ddeall ac i wella'r dehongliad o'n treftadaeth i bobl Cymru.

ohonom i'r un graddau, a'n cyfrifoldeb ni yw sicrhau na chyfyngir ar fynediad at ein hanes un ai oherwydd maint cyfoeth rhywun, neu oherwydd ei gefndir neu ei wybodaeth am hanes. Rhaid i'n hanes ni fod yn hanes i bawb. Gallwn newid y modd yr ydym yn gwneud hynny. Mae technoleg yn newid y modd yr ydym yn gallu helpu pobl i ddeall yr hanes a'r dreftadaeth sydd gennym. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd y Llywodraeth yn cydweithio â Cadw i sicrhau y defnyddir technoleg newydd—boed yn bodlediadau, yn ffeiliau clywedol a lawrlwythir, neu beth bynnag—i'n helpu i ddeall yn well y bobl a aeth o'n blaen.

Gwn fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad eisoes yn buddsoddi, yn y gwaith yng Nglynebwy, mewn canolfan ymwelwyr unigryw, uwch-dechnoleg, werth rhai miliynau o bunnoedd ar gyfer rhanbarth Blaenau'r Cymoedd. Mae wedi'i gyrru gan dechnoleg, ond yn hawdd ei defnyddio, a bydd yn galluogi degau o filoedd o bobl i gael mynediad at eu hanes eu hunain, gan roi hwb gwirioneddol i'r economi leol. Gwyddom y gallwn helpu pobl i gael mynediad ffisegol i'r gwahanol leoedd hyn, boed hynny drwy ddarparu goleddfau yn lle grisiau neu drwy helpu'r rheini sy'n ofni bod lleoedd hanesyddol o'r mathau hyn yn fannau i bobl eraill ac nid iddynt hwy, i drechu'r ofn hwnnw.

Mewn rhai mannau, sonnir am hanes yng nghyd-destun brenhinoedd a breninesau; gallwn ni sôn am ein hanes mewn cyd-destun gwahanol iawn. Gallwn sôn am bobl go iawn a aeth o'n blaen ac a frwydrodd dros gael yr hawliau yr ydym yn eu mwynhau heddiw, ac mae hwnnw'n hanes yr wyf yn gobeithio y byddwn yn ei ddathlu. Yr wyf hefyd yn gobeithio y byddwn yn ei wneud yn fwy hygyrch. Mae'n hanes i holl bobl y wlad hon, a greodd y cyfan o'r wlad hon, ac fe'i gwneir yr un mor hygyrch i bawb.

Nerys Evans: Thank you for the opportunity to contribute to the debate this afternoon. Before I talk about heritage in its broader sense, I would like to concentrate a little on the Government's commitment to make our historic environment easier to understand and to improve the interpretation of our heritage for the people of Wales.

Mae gwaith da wedi'i wneud o ran gwella mynediad corfforol i adeiladau hanesyddol, megis y gwaith a wneir yn Llys yr Esgob yn Nhyddewi i wella profiad yr ymwelwyr o ran ehangu'r rhannau mae ymwelwyr yn gallu cael mynediad iddynt—clywsom fanylion am hynny gan y Gweinidog.

Mae'n hollbwysig, er hynny, fel y soniodd Alun Davies, fod y gwaith yn cael ei wneud i ddod â hanes yn fyw drwy ddefnyddio ffyrdd gwahanol o ryngweithio â'r bobl. Gyda mwy a mwy o opsiynau o ran sut yr ydym yn treulio ein hamser hamdden, mae'n hanfodol na cholli cyfle i gyfleu straeon ein hanes a'n treftadaeth drwy ein hadeiladau hanesyddol a thrwy gofleidio gwahanol dechnolegau.

Mae'n rhaid cydnabod bod gwaith da'n digwydd yn y maes hwn ac ar rai safleoedd, megis y datblygiad o adnoddau aml synhwyraidd yng Nghastell Coch. Mae'n bwysig hefyd edrych ar hyn yn ehangach ac i estyn y defnydd o dechnoleg i wella profiad ymwelwyr ac i ddenu mwy o ymwelwyr i safleoedd.

Wrth edrych ar hyrwyddo hanes a threftadaeth Cymru, mae'n rhaid inni hefyd edrych ar y dreftadaeth yr ydym yn ei hyrwyddo eisoes. Mae'r broses adeiladu cenedl yn seiliedig ar gofio o le yr ydym ni, fel cenedl ac fel Cymry, yn dod. Mae'n bwysig felly ein bod yn cydnabod a dathlu ein hanes fel Cymry. Ymwelais â Bryn Glas ym Mhowys, safle brwydr enwog yn 1402, lle maeddodd llu Owain Glyndŵr fyddin fwy o lawer y Saeson o dan Mortimer. Cefais fy siomi'n fawr nad oes unrhyw gydnabyddiaeth o bwysigrwydd hanesyddol ac arwyddocâd y digwyddiad ar y safle. Weinidog, pwy sy'n penderfynu pa elfennau o'n hanes sy'n cael cydnabyddiaeth? Mae penderfyniadau o'r math hwn yn holl bwysig, gan eu bod yn effeithio ar ba hanes sy'n cael ei drosglwyddo o genhedlaeth i genhedlaeth. Felly, a wnewch edrych ar y pwnc hwn ar frys i weld a oes modd cynnwys safleoedd megis Bryn Glas yn strategaeth hyrwyddo ein treftadaeth a'n hanes fel y ceir darlun llawnach o'n hanes fel cenedl?

Wrth sôn am dreftadaeth, mae hefyd yn bwysig ystyried mwy na safleoedd ac

Good work has been done on improving physical access to historic buildings, such as the work done in Bishop's Palace in St David's to improve the visitor experience by expanding the areas that visitors can have access to—we heard details about that from the Minister.

However, it is crucial, as Alun Davies said, that work is done to bring history to life by using different means of interacting with people. At a time when there are more and more options in terms of ways to spend our leisure time, it is crucial that an opportunity to convey the stories of our heritage and history through our historic buildings, by embracing different technologies, is not missed.

We must acknowledge that good work is taking place in this area on some sites, such as the development of multisensory resources in Castell Coch. It is also important to look at this more widely and to extend the use of technology to improve the visitor experience and to attract more visitors to sites.

In looking at promoting the history and heritage of Wales, we must also look at the heritage that we already promote. The process of nation building is based on remembering where we, as a nation and as Welsh people, come from. It is therefore important that we acknowledge and celebrate our history as Welsh people. I visited Bryn Glas in Powys, the site of a famous battle in 1402, where Owain Glyndŵr's army beat a much larger, English army under Mortimer. I was greatly disappointed that there was no acknowledgement of the historic importance and significance of the event on the site. Minister, who decides which elements of our history are recognised? Such decisions are vital as they affect which history is transferred from one generation to the next. Therefore, will you look at this issue as a matter of urgency to see whether sites such as Bryn Glas can be included in the strategy to promote our heritage and history so that there is a fuller picture of our history as a nation?

In talking about heritage, it is also important to consider more than just sites and buildings,

adeiladau yn unig, fel y soniodd Alun Davies. Yr wyf wedi bod yn rhan o ymgyrch gan gwrwglwyr afonydd Tywi a Theifi sydd yn ymladd yn erbyn y penderfyniad i leihau nifer y trwyddedau ar yr afonydd. Mae tystiolaeth ysgrifenedig i ddangos bod cwryglau wedi'u gwneud a'u defnyddio ers yr Oes Efydd. Bellach, dim ond ar ychydig afonydd yng Nghymru y gwelir cwrwgl, sef y Tywi, y Teifi a'r Taf. Maent yn cael eu creu yn awr yn union yr un ffordd ag yr oeddynt ganrifoedd yn ôl. Mae'n bwysig, wrth benderfynu ar y nifer y trwyddedau, fod cydnabyddiaeth ac ystyriaeth teilwng o'n hanes a'n traddodiadau o ran y ffordd hon o bysgota.

Atef y pwynt felly ei bod yn bwysig nad yw unrhyw drafodaeth gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ynghylch treftadaeth ynghlwm yn unig wrth adeiladau a safleoedd ond ei bod yn edrych yn ehangach ar ein treftadaeth ac yn ystyried mesurau i'w diogelu a'i hyrwyddo.

Alun Ffred Jones: Croesawn ddatganiad y Gweinidog; mae'n newyddion da yn gyffredinol ac i Gaernarfon yn benodol. Mae niferoedd yr ymwelwyr i'r castell wedi bod yn gostwng dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf, ac os bydd y cam hwn yn annog rhagor o bobl i ddod i'r castell, bydd yn newyddion da i'r dref ac i'r ardal. Mae angen hefyd edrych ar agor rhai o hen furiau'r dref, fel sydd wedi digwydd mewn trefi eraill sydd â chestyll o'r fath. Byddai gwneud hynny, tybiaf, yn gwella ac ehangu profiadau ymwelwyr a phobl sydd â diddordeb yn ein treftadaeth.

Beth yw cost y cynllun hwn? Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd hyn yn golygu gostyngiad yn refeniw Cadw, a gallai hynny effeithio ar gynlluniau eraill.

Mae'r holl drafodaeth dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf ynghylch twristiaeth ddiwylliant yn ddiddorol. Mae'n bwysig ein bod ni yng Nghymru yn manteisio'n llawn ar ein hanes cyfoethog a'r diwylliant amrywiol sydd wedi bodoli, ac sydd yn bodoli, yng Nghymru. Yn hynny o beth, mae'n holl bwysig bod Cadw'n cydweithio'n agos â chyrff eraill, megis Amgueddfa Cymru, Croeso Cymru a chyrff megis cynghorau sir.

as Alun Davies said. I have been a part of a campaign by coracle-men of the Tywi and Teifi rivers, which is fighting against the decision to reduce the number of licences on the rivers. There is written evidence to show that coracles have been made and used since the Bronze Age. These days, we only see coracles on a few rivers in Wales, namely the Tywi, the Teifi and the Taff. They are made today in exactly the same way as they were centuries ago. It is important that, when decisions on the number of licences are taken, there is proper recognition and consideration of our history and heritage with regard to this way of fishing.

I therefore endorse the point that it is important that any Assembly Government discussion about heritage is not confined to buildings and sites only but that it looks more widely at our heritage and considers measures to safeguard and promote it.

Alun Ffred Jones: I welcome the Minister's statement; it is good news in general and for Caernarfon in particular. Visitor numbers to the castle have been declining over the past years and if this step encourages more people to come to the castle, it will be good news for the town and for the area. There is also a need to look at opening some of the old town walls, as has happened in other towns that have such castles. I imagine that that would improve and expand the experiences of visitors and people who have an interest in our heritage.

What is the cost of this plan? I am sure that this will mean a decrease in Cadw's revenue, and that could impact on other schemes.

The whole discussion over the past years about cultural tourism is interesting. It is important that we in Wales take full advantage of our rich history and the diverse culture that has existed, and which continues to exist, in Wales. In that context, it is crucial that Cadw collaborates closely with other bodies, such as National Museum Wales, Visit Wales and bodies such as county councils.

O sôn am gydweithio, hoffwn glywed sylwadau'r Gweinidog am ffyrdd mwy dychmygus o fanteisio ar y dreftadaeth gyfoethog hon. Mae rhywun yn meddwl er enghraifft am y diwydiant chwarelyddol yn y gogledd-orllewin, ac yng Ngwynedd yn arbennig.

5.00 p.m.

Os edrychwch ar ffigurau ymwelwyr yr atyniadau hynny, sy'n cynnwys amgueddfeydd preifat a chyhoeddus, y rheilffyrdd a gawsant eu hadeiladu oherwydd y diwydiant llechi, a'r canolfannau sydd bellach wedi eu lleoli ar safleoedd hen chwareli, fel y Ganolfan Dechnoleg Amgen, ceuach fod dros 1 filiwn o bobl y flwyddyn yn mynd i'r ardal i'w mwynhau. Mae cyfleoedd anferth yno, o ran edrych yn ôl ar yr hanes a chyplysu hanes gweithwyr y diwydiant hwnnw a'r diwylliant a oedd ynghlwm wrth hwnnw, sy'n dal i fodoli.

Dyma gyfle i gael rhaglen farchnata. Drwy ddefnyddio'r cyfryngau cyfoes fel y we, gellir cyfleu llawer o gyfoeth hanes Cymru mewn ffordd newydd a chyfoes sy'n ennyn diddordeb pobl y tu allan i Gymru. Byddai hynny'n rhoi syniad o hanes Cymru iddynt a hefyd synnwyr o'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn y bröydd hynny heddiw. Mae lawn cyn bwysiced rhoi'r profiad unigryw hwnnw yr ydym yn sôn amdano o hyd wrth sôn am ymwelwyr yn dod i Gymru. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog pe bai'n ymateb i'r sylwadau hynny.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Diolchaf i'r pum Aelod sydd wedi siarad ac sydd, ar y cyfan, wedi croesawu'r datganiad hwn yn fawr. Cyfeiriodd Paul at nifer o bethau y byddai'n dymuno eu gweld yn ychwanegol at y datganiad, gan ei dderbyn a'i groesawu. Cytunaf yn llwyr â'r syniad o farchnata yr hyn sydd gennym mewn ffordd mwy cyffrous ac o gynnwys cynigion arbennig fel bod pobl yn gallu mynd i fwy nag un safle. Mae cynnig ar hyn o bryd sy'n galluogi pobl i brynu tocyn ar gyfer y tri chastell yng nghyffiniau Caerdydd ar yr un pryd, gyda gostyngiad ym mhreis y tocynnau unigol.

Cyfeiriodd Paul unwaith eto at adroddiad blynyddol ar gyfer Cadw. Os oes angen

In talking about collaboration, I would like to hear the Minister's comments on more imaginative ways of taking advantage of this rich heritage. One thinks, for example, of the quarrying history of the north-west, and in Gwynedd in particular.

If you look at the visitor figures for those attractions, which include public and private museums, the railways that were built because of the slate industry, and the centres that have since been located on the sites of former quarries, such as the Centre for Alternative Technology, you will find that more than 1 million people a year visit the area to enjoy them. There are enormous opportunities to be had there, to look back at the history and to marry the history of the workers of that industry with the associated culture of the time, which still exists.

This is an opportunity to get a marketing programme. By using modern media such as the web, a vast amount of Wales's wealth of history could be conveyed in such a way as to entice the interest of people outside Wales. That would give them an idea of Wales's history and also a sense of what goes on in those areas today. It is just as important to give that unique experience that we are always talking about when we speak about visitors to Wales. I would be grateful to the Minister if he would respond to those comments.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I thank the five Members who have spoken and who have, on the whole, greatly welcomed this statement. Paul referred to a number of things that he would wish to see in addition to the statement, while accepting and welcoming it. I agree entirely with the idea of marketing what we have in a more exciting way, and to include special offers so that people can visit more than one site. There is a special offer available at the moment, which enables people to buy a ticket for the three castles in the Cardiff vicinity at the same times, making a saving on the price of the individual tickets.

Paul referred once more to an annual report for Cadw. If you are in need of some reading

deunydd darllen arnat, Paul, mae gennyf gopi o 'Amgylchedd Hanesyddol Cymru: Datganiad Sefyllfa 2007' yma. Awgrymaf dy fod yn gweithio dy ffordd drwy hwnnw yn gyntaf ac os wyt ti o hyd yn teimlo'r angen am fwy o wybodaeth, edrychaf eto ar yr achos o ran adroddiad blynyddol.

O ran yr oriel genedlaethol, cytunaf â'r dyhead, a cheir ymrwymiad yn 'Cymru'n Un' i edrych ar hynny. Ni allaf roi amserlen cyn i'r asesiad dichonolrwydd gael ei gwblhau; byddai hynny'n tanseilio holl bwrpas yr asesiad. Fodd bynnag, adroddaf yn ôl i'r Cynulliad wedi i ni ei dderbyn.

Dylwn nodi mai cynnig yw hwn i blant o dan 16 oed o Gymru ac i oedolion dros 60 oed yng Nghymru. Bu i nifer o'r siaradwyr godi'r pwynt hwnnw.

Peter Black asked about the funding for this project, as did Alun Ffred Jones. A budget of £737,000 has been allocated in the first year, for 2008-09, and £653,000 has been allocated in the subsequent two financial years. So, it is carefully costed and fully funded. The transport strategy talks about making connections between all parts of Wales, and so the issue that Peter raised on transport is addressed in that strategy.

You talked about priority and yet you referred to the fact that it was a Liberal Democrat Minister who introduced free admission to museums in Wales. Free admission was a priority then, but it now seems to be less of a priority for heritage sites. It is interesting to see that the Liberal Democrats seem to have a policy of transferring money from the heritage budget to other budgets. I will tell the arts, sports and tourism sectors in Wales that you are actively promoting the idea that my budget and their budgets be cut to supplement other budgets. This settlement was made in October; other Ministers had their fair share of it and I had my fair share. I will defend my share of that because I think that the work that we do is very important.

material, Paul, I have a copy of 'The Welsh Historic Environment: Position Statement 2007' here. I suggest that you work your way through that first and, if you still feel the need to have more information, I will look again at the case for an annual report.

On the national gallery, I agree with that ambition, and 'One Wales' contains a commitment to look at that. I cannot give a timescale for that until the feasibility study has been completed, as that would undermine its very purpose. However, I will report back to the Assembly when we have received it.

I should note that this proposal is limited to children aged under 16 from Wales and for adults aged over 60 in Wales. Many speakers raised that point.

Holodd Peter Black, ac Alun Ffred Jones yntau, ynglŷn â'r cyllid ar gyfer y prosiect hwn. Mae cyllideb o £737,000 wedi'i dyrannu yn y flwyddyn gyntaf, ar gyfer 2008-09, ac mae £653,000 wedi'i dyrannu yn y ddwy flynedd wedi hynny. Felly, mae wedi'i gostio'n ofalus a'i ariannu'n llawn. Mae'r strategaeth drafnidiaeth yn sôn am wneud cysylltiadau rhwng pob rhan o Gymru, ac felly caiff y mater a gododd Peter ynghylch trafndiaeth sylw yn y strategaeth honno.

Soniasoch am flaenoriaeth ac eto cyfeiriasoch at y ffaith mai Gweinidog o'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a gyflwynodd fynediad am ddim i amgueddfeydd yng Nghymru. Yr oedd mynediad am ddim yn flaenoriaeth bryd hynny, ond erbyn hyn mae'n ymddangos yn llai o flaenoriaeth i safleoedd treftadaeth. Mae'n ddiddorol gweld ei bod yn ymddangos fod gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol bolisi o drosglwyddo arian o'r gyllideb dreftadaeth i gyllidebau eraill. Yr wyf am ddweud wrth sectorau'r celfyddydau, chwaraeon a thwristiaeth yng Nghymru eich bod wrthi'n hyrwyddo'r syniad o gwtogi fy nghyllideb a'u cyllideb hwy i ategu cyllidebau eraill. Gwnaethpwyd y setliad hwn ym mis Hydref; cafodd Gweinidogion eraill eu cyfran deg ohono a chefais innau fy nghyfran deg i. Amddiffynnaf fy nghyfran o hynny oherwydd yr wyf yn meddwl bod y gwaith a wnawn yn bwysig iawn.

Alun Davies raised many important issues on our heritage. I will certainly look at Cadw's remit in light of his concept of bringing history to life.

Lorraine Barrett: This is a timely intervention, because I wanted to come in on Alun's point on heritage and access. Part of our heritage lies with the black and minority ethnic communities in Wales, but they can feel that access to all these wonderful sites is somehow not possible for them, or that it is not for them. Can you therefore bear that in mind and consider it as you move on with this? It is important to include those people from black and minority ethnic communities in this, who have played a huge part in Wales's heritage.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I concur with you on that important point. We are trying to address all barriers to access, and I will certainly consider that point.

Alun also spoke about a shared history and the contribution that our history and heritage can make to regenerating our communities. Nerys and Alun Ffred also referred to that. Nerys raised the important question of what kind of history we are communicating to the children and young people of Wales. That is an important point that we need to address through the interpretation of our history.

Mae dehongli ein hanes mewn ffordd gadarnhaol yn rhoi balchder cenedlaethol i ni, yn adfywio ein cymunedau, ac yn rhoi cyfeiriad i'n bywydau heddiw. Soniodd Alun Ffred am hyn yng nghyd-destun y diwylliant chwareli yn y gogledd, a soniodd Nerys am gyfraniad y cwryglau yn y de orllewin. Rhaid i ni edrych yn llawer mwy creadigol ar sut ydym yn cyfleu'r hanesion hynny, nid yn unig yng nghyd-destun y gorffennol ond drwy edrych at y dyfodol hefyd.

Yr wyf yn falch o gael cyflwyno'r pecyn hwn ger eich bron y prynhawn yma. Byddwn yn parhau i edrych ar ffyrdd o sicrhau bod gan bawb yng Nghymru—ac y mae'r cynnig hwn wedi ei gyfyngu i bobl o Gymru—fwy a mwy o fynediad at ein hanes, ein treftadaeth, a'n diwylliant.

Cododd Alun Davies lawer o bwyntiau pwysig am ein treftadaeth. Byddaf yn sicr yn edrych ar gylch gorchwyl Cadw yng ngoleuni ei gysyniad ynghylch dod â hanes yn fyw.

Lorraine Barrett: Mae hwn yn ymyriad amserol, oherwydd yr oedd arnaf eisiau dod i mewn ar bwynt Alun ynghylch treftadaeth a mynediad. Mae rhan o'n treftadaeth yn gorwedd gyda'r cymunedau ethnig du a lleiafrifol yng Nghymru, ond gallant hwy deimlo nad oes modd iddynt hwy rywsut fynd i'r holl safleoedd bendigedig hyn, neu nad peth iddynt hwy mohono. A allwch gadw hynny mewn cof felly a'i ystyried wrth ichi symud ymlaen gyda hyn? Mae'n bwysig cynnwys y bobl hynny o gymunedau ethnig du a lleiafrifol yn hyn, a hwythau wedi chwarae rhan enfawr yn nhreftadaeth Cymru.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yr wyf yn cyd-fynd â chi ar y pwynt pwysig hwnnw. Yr ydym yn ceisio rhoi sylw i bob rhwystr i fynediad, a byddaf yn bendant yn ystyried y pwynt hwnnw.

Soniodd Alun am hanes a rennir rhyngom a'r cyfraniad y gall ein hanes a'n treftadaeth ei wneud i adfywio ein cymunedau. Cyfeiriodd Nerys ac Alun Ffred at hynny hefyd. Cododd Nerys gwestiwn pwysig pa fath o hanes yr ydym yn ei gyfleu i blant a phobl ifanc Cymru. Dyna bwynt pwysig y mae angen inni roi sylw iddo wrth ddehongli ein hanes.

Interpreting our history in a positive way gives us national pride, regenerates our communities, and gives us direction in our lives today. Alun Ffred talked about that in the context of the culture of the quarries of north Wales, and Nerys talked of the contribution of coracles in the south west. We need to look much more creatively at how we convey these histories, not only in the context of the past, but also by looking towards the future.

I am pleased to be able to present this package to you this afternoon. We will continue to look at ways of ensuring that everyone in Wales—and this proposal is limited to people from Wales—has increased access to our history, heritage and our culture.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: We have now gone past the time agreed for voting time, and I understand that business managers are content not to ring the bell, and so we will proceed.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr ydym wedi mynd heibio'r amser y cytunwyd arno ar gyfer pleidleisio bellach, a deallaf fod rheolwyr busnes yn fodlon peidio â chanu'r gloch, ac felly awn yn ein blaenau.

Cyfnod Pleidleisio Voting Time

Gwelliant 1 i NDM3952: O blaid 10, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.

Amendment 1 to NDM3952: For 10, Abstain 0, Against 27.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Law, Trish
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

Gwelliant 2 i NDM3952: O blaid 14, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.

Amendment 2 to NDM3952: For 14, Abstain 0, Against 30.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley

Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Law, Trish
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3 i NDM3952: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.
Amendment 3 to NDM3952: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Law, Trish
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

5.10 p.m.

*Gwelliant 4 i NDM3952: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 31.
Amendment 4 to NDM3952: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 31.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Trish
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5 i NDM3952: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 31.
Amendment 5 to NDM3952: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 31.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Ramsay, Nick
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin

Jones, Gareth
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Trish
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig NDM3952: O blaid 41, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion NDM3952: For 41, Abstain 5, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Cairns, Alun
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Paul
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Isherwood, Mark
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Trish
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Ramsay, Nick
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
German, Michael
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â
today's proceedings to a close. chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.10 p.m.
The meeting ended at 5.10 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
Asghar, Mohammad (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Burns, Angela (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Andrew R.T. (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Davies, Paul (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Evans, Nerys (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Franks, Chris (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
Griffiths, Lesley (Llafur – Labour)
Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
Jenkins, Bethan (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Gareth (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)
Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)

Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
Millar, Darren (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
Ramsay, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Watson, Joyce (Llafur – Labour)
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)