



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
The National Assembly for Wales**

**Cofnod y Trafodion
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mercher, 2 Rhagfyr 2009
Wednesday, 2 December 2009**

Cynnwys
Contents

- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol
Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services
- 22 Cwestiynau i'r Dirprwy Prif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog Dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth
Questions to the Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport
- 42 Datganiad am y Cynllun Iechyd Gwledig
Statement on the Rural Health Plan
- 58 Datganiad: Y Wybodaeth Ddiweddaraf am Ffliw Moch
Statement: Update on Swine Influenza
- 69 Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Iechyd, Lles a Llywodraeth Leol ar Wasanaethau Iechyd
Meddwl
The Health, Wellbeing and Local Government Committee's Report on Mental Health
Services
- 99 Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu ar ei Ymchwiliad i Gyfraniad Economaidd
Addysg Uwch yng Nghymru
Debate on the Enterprise and Learning Committee's Report on its Inquiry into the
Economic Contribution of Higher Education in Wales
- 122 Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig: Rhyddhad Ardrethi Busnes
Welsh Conservatives Debate: Business Rate Relief
- 145 Cyfnod Pleidleisio
Voting Time
- 148 Dadl Fer a Ohiriwyd o 15 Gorffennaf 2009: Rhagdybiaeth yn erbyn Cloddio Glo Brig
yng Nghymru?
Short Debate Postponed from 15 July 2009: A Presumption against Opencast Mining in
Wales?
- 163 Dadl Fer: Plant â'u Traed yn Rhydd
Short Debate: Free Range Kids

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been
included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 1.30 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 1.30 p.m. with the Presiding Officer (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) in the Chair.*

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services

Health Promotion in Hospitals

Q1 Jonathan Morgan: Will the Minister make a statement on the implementation of the health promoting hospital vending directions 2008? OAQ(3)1315(HSS)

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Edwina Hart): The local health boards were given clear guidance on the implementation of the directions, and a review of the progress made during the first 12 months will be completed shortly.

Jonathan Morgan: I was pleased to hear you say a few weeks ago in answer to a question tabled by my colleague, Nick Ramsay, that you would be examining the directions with a view to deciding before the end of the year whether to amend them. Before the regulations were introduced this time last year, no consultation took place with the Automatic Vending Association, which represents the vended food and drink industry in the UK. Led by the AVA, the Vending Choice Coalition was formed in December 2008 to create a single body representative of all parties active in UK vending with which the Government should consult on matters specific to vending, as all its members are experts in the various vending disciplines. Will the Minister guarantee to meet with the Vending Choice Coalition before making any final decisions on reviewing those directions?

Edwina Hart: I apologise to Members, as I had hoped that we would have completed the 12-month review by now, but unfortunately it has been delayed slightly given the need to chase up the caterers to help us with the questionnaire on the issues of vending. I am aware of that organisation, and I am sure that my officials will consider the possibilities of meeting it to have discussions.

Hybu Iechyd mewn Ysbytai

C1 Jonathan Morgan: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am weithredu cyfarwyddiadau ar werthu sy'n hybu iechyd mewn ysbytai 2008? OAQ(3)1315(HSS)

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Edwina Hart): Rhoddwyd canllawiau clir i'r byrddau iechyd lleol ar weithredu'r cyfarwyddiadau, a bydd adolygiad o'r cynnydd a wnaed yn ystod y 12 mis cyntaf yn cael ei gwblhau cyn hir.

Jonathan Morgan: Yr oeddwn yn falch eich clywed yn dweud ychydig wythnosau'n ôl mewn ymateb i gwestiwn a gyflwynwyd gan fy nghydweithiwr, Nick Ramsay, y byddech yn archwilio'r cyfarwyddiadau gyda'r bwriad o benderfynu cyn diwedd y flwyddyn a ddylid eu diwygio ai peidio. Ni chafwyd dim ymgynghori â'r Gymdeithas Gwerthu Awtomatig, sy'n cynrychioli'r diwydiant gwerthu bwyd a diod yn y DU, cyn i'r rheoliadau gael eu cyflwyno yr adeg hon y llynedd. Dan arweiniad AVA, ffurfiwyd y Gynghrair Dewis Gwerthu ym mis Rhagfyr 2008 i greu un corff i gynrychioli pawb sy'n weithgar ym maes gwerthu yn y DU, y dylai'r Llywodraeth ymgynghori ag ef ar faterion sy'n ymwneud yn benodol â gwerthu, gan fod holl aelodau'r gynghrair yn arbenigwyr yn y gwahanol ddisgyblaethau gwerthu. A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi sicrwydd y bydd yn cwrdd â'r Gynghrair Dewis Gwerthu cyn gwneud unrhyw benderfyniadau terfynol ar adolygu'r cyfarwyddiadau hynny?

Edwina Hart: Ymddiheuraf i'r Aelodau, oherwydd yr oeddwn wedi gobeithio y byddem wedi cwblhau'r adolygiad 12 mis erbyn hyn, ond yn anffodus bu rhywfaint o oedi oherwydd bod angen mynd ar ôl yr arlwywyr i'n helpu gyda'r holiadur ar faterion gwerthu. Gwn am y sefydliad hwnnw, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd fy swyddogion yn ystyried posibilrwydd cwrdd

â'r sefydliad i drafod.

The Draft Budget

Q2 Nick Ramsay: Will the Minister make a statement on the implications of the draft budget for the health and social services portfolio? OAQ(3)1350(HSS)

Edwina Hart: The draft budget shows an overall increase of £79.767 million in 2010-11 as compared with 2009-10 for the health and social services main expenditure group.

Nick Ramsay: Thank you for that response, Minister. At this point in time, when the recession is having an implication on all budgets, not just in Wales but across the UK, there are some serious and real pressures on your budget. Do you share my concerns, and those raised by the Finance Committee in the Assembly, regarding spending within the health budget? Paul Davies spoke only recently about the £1 billion that he thought was potentially not being spent effectively. In addition, are you concerned about the issues of workforce planning in the health service, because a rather large cut—a £1.6 million reduction—is being proposed in that area this year? There are real concerns in the health service about the effect that that will have on health services. I would be grateful to hear your thoughts.

Edwina Hart: This will be a difficult year, and I will consider carefully all the comments made to the Finance Committee, as my colleague, Andrew Davies, has done on various issues. As I have indicated, I will be meeting with Chairs again tomorrow. I have told them that if their finance directors feel that there is any wastage in the system, I certainly hope that they are getting on with the task of ensure that it is removed, so that that money can go into front-line services.

We must recognise the importance of continuing to train and develop staff, even when we are in a recession, and those issues are very much on my mind. In the final budget, I have been able to put additional

Y Gyllideb Ddrafft

C2 Nick Ramsay: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am oblygiadau'r gyllideb ddrafft i bortffolio iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol? OAQ(3)1350(HSS)

Edwina Hart: Mae'r gyllideb ddrafft yn dangos cynnydd cyffredinol o £79.767 miliwn yn 2010-11 o'i chymharu â 2009-10 ar gyfer y prif grŵp gwariant iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol.

Nick Ramsay: Diolch am eich ymateb, Weinidog. Ar hyn o bryd, a'r dirwasgiad yn effeithio ar bob cyllideb, nid yng Nghymru'n unig ond ar draws y DU, mae pwysau difrifol a gwirioneddol ar eich cyllideb. A ydych, fel finnau, yn pryderu am waraint yn gyllideb iechyd, yr un fath â Phwyllgor Cyllid y Cynulliad? Bu Paul Davies yn siarad yn ddiweddar iawn am yr £1 biliwn nad oedd efallai'n cael ei wario'n effeithiol yn ei farn ef. Yn ogystal, a ydych yn pryderu am faterion cynllunio gweithlu'r gwasanaeth iechyd, oherwydd mae toriad eithaf mawr—gostyngiad o £1.6 miliwn—yn cael ei gynnig yn y maes hwnnw eleni? Mae pryderon gwirioneddol yn y gwasanaeth iechyd am effaith hynny ar wasanaethau iechyd. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar am glywed eich barn.

Edwina Hart: Bydd hon yn flwyddyn anodd, a byddaf yn ystyried yn ofalus yr holl sylwadau a wnaed i'r Pwyllgor Cyllid, fel y mae fy nghydweithiwr, Andrew Davies, wedi ei wneud ar wahanol faterion. Fel yr wyf wedi'i nodi, byddaf yn cyfarfod â'r Cadeiryddion yfory eto. Yr wyf wedi dweud wrthynt, os yw eu cyfarwyddwyr cyllid yn teimlo bod arian yn cael ei wastraffu mewn unrhyw fodd yn y system, fy mod yn gobeithio'n fawr eu bod yn bwrw ymlaen â'r dasg o sicrhau bod hynny'n dod i ben, fel y gellir gwario'r arian ar wasanaethau rheng flaen.

Rhaid inni gydnabod pwysigrwydd parhau i hyfforddi a datblygu staff, hyd yn oed mewn cyfnod o ddirwasgiad, ac y mae'r materion hynny'n pwysu llawer ar fy meddwl. Yn y gyllideb derfynol, yr wyf wedi gallu rhoi

resources into some key areas, which I hope will be welcomed, particularly IVF treatment, and money in respect of children services and cancer services.

Helen Mary Jones: Minister, I think that you will be more aware than any of us of the fact that the intentions of successive Assembly Governments as regards improving delivery in child and adolescent mental health services have not delivered fully to date. There will be a concern about funding mental health services because, in the past, at times of pressure, those cinderella services—to use a cliché—have tended to suffer at the expense of more high-profile services, such as cancer services. Can you assure us today that your Government will continue to invest substantially in child and adolescent mental health services, as well as taking the other steps that you outline about ensuring that the new health boards deliver on this important agenda?

Edwina Hart: Your points are well made, and I agree that, in the past, it has been quite a cinderella service. The moves that we have made to ring-fence the finance will help, and the CAMHS targets for the national health service are exacting. The annual operating framework requires that consultation, advice and training be provided for professionals in primary, universal and front-line services. The number of primary healthcare workers has been increased as a part of it, and access times are tightened across the range of child and adolescent mental health services. The finance is being looked at with a view to finding funding for the development of forensic CAMHS services on an all-Wales basis, the development of a CAMHS learning disability service, and to ensure that all 18-year-olds who need in-patient CAMHS services are appropriately accommodated. There is also the issue of suicide awareness training, as a result of the suicide prevention action plan that was developed following the tragic events that took place earlier in the year in Wales. That is being treated with the necessary priority, but we must be watchful of how LHBs continue to deliver these

adnoddau ychwanegol i rai meysydd allweddol, sy'n gam a gaiff ei groesawu, gobeithio, yn enwedig o ran triniaeth IVF ac arian ar gyfer gwasanaethau plant a gwasanaethau canser.

Helen Mary Jones: Weinidog, credaf y byddwch yn fwy ymwybodol na'r un ohonom fod un Llywodraeth ar ôl y llall yn y Cynulliad wedi methu hyd yma â gwireddu'n llawn eu bwriadau o ran gwella'r modd y caiff gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasod eu darparu. Bydd pobl yn pryderu ynghylch gwaith cyllido gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl, oherwydd yn y gorffennol, ar adegau o bwysau, mae'r gwasanaethau hynny a gaiff eu hystyried yn israddol wedi tueddu i ddiodef ar draul gwasanaethau sydd â phroffil uwch, megis gwasanaethau canser. A allwch roi sicrwydd inni heddiw y bydd eich Llywodraeth yn parhau i fuddsoddi'n sylweddol mewn gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasod, yn ogystal â chymryd y camau eraill yr ydych wedi'u hamlinellu i sicrhau bod y byrddau iechyd newydd yn sicrhau canlyniadau yng nghyswllt yr agenda bwysig hon?

Edwina Hart: Yr ydych wedi gwneud eich pwyntiau'n dda, a chytunaf fod y gwasanaethau hynny, yn y gorffennol, wedi eu hystyried yn wasanaethau israddol i raddau. Bydd y camau yr ydym wedi'u cymryd i neilltuo'r arian yn helpu, ac y mae targedau'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng nghyswllt gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasod yn llym. Dan y fframwaith gweithredu blynyddol, rhaid darparu gwasanaeth ymgynghori, cyngor a hyfforddiant i weithwyr proffesiynol mewn gwasanaethau sylfaenol, cyffredinol a rheng flaen. Cynyddwyd nifer y gweithwyr gofal iechyd sylfaenol fel rhan o hynny, a thynhawyd amseroedd mynediad ar draws yr holl wasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasod. Yr ydym yn edrych ar yr ochr ariannol gyda'r bwriad o gael gyllid i ddatblygu gwasanaethau CAMHS fforensig i Gymru gyfan, datblygu gwasanaeth anabledd dysgu CAMHS, a sicrhau bod lle priodol ar gael i bawb sy'n 18 oed sydd ag angen gwasanaethau CAMHS arnynt fel cleifion mewnol. Mae hyfforddiant i gynyddu ymwybyddiaeth o hunanladdiad yn fater arall, o ganlyniad i'r cynllun gweithredu i atal

services, and prioritise them in what is a difficult financial period for us all.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Minister, when planning the budget, you are informed by the various views and representations made to you. An ongoing issue is the ability of wheelchair services across Wales. You will be aware that the Health, Wellbeing and Local Government Committee is currently undertaking a review of wheelchair services. Sadly, the body that you charged with reporting back to you by last spring has not yet done so. Last week, it was indicated that you would provide Assembly Members with an update this week. Therefore, I would be grateful if you could give us an idea of when this review will be reporting so that you are informed and can make financial provision available should a recommendation be made in relation to it, given the budgetary discussions that have taken place.

Edwina Hart: I took a great deal of interest in the evidence that was presented to the Health, Wellbeing and Local Government Committee by organisations and various parties. I have taken it into account in my final discussion with officials on the submission, which I do have now, namely the report. There was so much work involved that the report was delayed, and I very much regret that. However, I hope to make it available to Members later this week.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Minister, given that you spent so much time looking at the evidence—and I am sure that organisations will be glad of that—do you not regret what the representative of the Office of the Children’s Commissioner for Wales indicated when he came before us last week? There were two things that I think most

achosion o hunanladdiad, a ddatblygwyd yn dilyn y digwyddiadau trasig a welwyd yng Nghymru yn gynharach eleni. Yr ydym yn rhoi’r flaenoriaeth angenrheidiol i’r mater hwnnw, ond rhaid inni gadw golwg ar y modd y mae byrddau iechyd lleol yn parhau i ddarparu a blaenoriaethu’r gwasanaethau hyn, mewn cyfnod ariannol sy’n anodd iawn inni bob un.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Weinidog, bydd y gwahanol safbwyntiau a’r sylwadau a gaiff eu cyflwyno ichi yn llywio eich gwaith o gynllunio’r gyllideb. Un broblem sy’n parhau yw gallu gwasanaethau cadeiriau olwyn ledled Cymru. Byddwch yn gwybod bod y Pwyllgor Iechyd, Lles a Llywodraeth Leol wrthi’n gwneud adolygiad o wasanaethau cadeiriau olwyn ar hyn o bryd. Yn anffodus, nid yw’r corff y gofynasoch iddo adrodd yn ôl ichi erbyn y gwanwyn diwethaf wedi gwneud hynny eto. Yr wythnos diwethaf, awgrymwyd y byddech yn rhoi’r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i Aelodau’r Cynulliad yr wythnos hon. Felly, byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech roi syniad inni pryd y bydd yr adolygiad hwn yn adrodd yn ôl fel y bydd y wybodaeth gennych ac y gallwch sicrhau bod darpariaeth ariannol ar gael pe bai argymhelliad yn cael ei wneud ynghylch hynny, o gofio’r trafodaethau sydd wedi’u bod ar y gyllideb.

Edwina Hart: Yr oedd gennyf ddiddordeb mawr yn y dystiolaeth a gyflwynwyd i’r Pwyllgor Iechyd, Lles a Llywodraeth Leol gan sefydliadau a gwahanol garfanau. Yr wyf wedi ystyried y dystiolaeth honno yn fy nhrafodaeth derfynol gyda swyddogion am yr hyn a fyddai’n cael ei gyflwyno, ac sydd wedi’i gyflwyno imi erbyn hyn, sef yr adroddiad. Oherwydd bod cymaint o waith i’w wneud, bu oedi wrth gyflwyno’r adroddiad, er mawr ofid imi. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd ar gael i’r Aelodau yn ddiweddarach yn yr wythnos.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Weinidog, o gofio eich bod wedi treulio cymaint o amser yn edrych ar y dystiolaeth—ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y sefydliadau’n falch o hynny—onid ydych yn gofidio am yr hyn a ddywedodd cynrychiolydd Swyddfa Comisiynydd Plant Cymru pan ddaeth ger ein bron yr wythnos diwethaf? Credaf fod dau beth wedi

Members found disturbing: first, that the office of the children's commissioner was not asked to provide evidence to the review; and secondly that, when questioned, he implied that—well, more than that, he used the words—there was an element of rationing wheelchair services in Wales. Do you recognise that description of the service, and that there is an element of rationing because of its inability to meet the demands of the users?

Edwina Hart: I have looked at all the evidence that has been given to the health committee, and I am cognisant of the children's commissioner's view on this issue. However, I am still taking a final look at the papers that have been put before me, and so I would not like to make any further comments on this matter until I issue my statement.

Peter Black: Minister, returning to child and adolescent mental health services, Helen Mary referred to the issues that have arisen with these services in the past. However, the recent report published by the Wales Audit Office notes that, even now, services are still failing many children and young people. Given that we have still not had a statement from you—and I understand that you may make one in the new year—could you give us an indication of how you will respond to the report?

Edwina Hart: It is important that I ensure that I am cognisant of all reports placed before me. I have never been one to suggest that child and adult mental health services are perfect, in any shape or form. However, I can tell you in Plenary today that we are giving this the necessary priority within the LHBs and we are looking at making investment in the service. It is important that I look at the recommendations that come forward to see whether anything further can be done within the context and confines of my budget.

Peter Black: Thank you for that, Minister. I hope that you are able to give us a statement in the new year so that we can question you

anesmwytho ar fwyafrif yr Aelodau: yn gyntaf, y ffaith na ofynnwyd i swyddfa'r comisiynydd plant ddarparu tystiolaeth i'r adolygiad; ac yn ail, pan gafodd ei holi, awgrymodd—wel, gwnaeth fwy nag awgrymu, defnyddiodd y geiriau—fod elfen o ddogni gwasanaethau cadeiriau olwyn yng Nghymru. A ydych yn cydnabod y disgrifiad hwnnw o'r gwasanaeth, ac yn cydnabod bod elfen o ddogni oherwydd bod y gwasanaeth yn methu ateb galwadau'r defnyddwyr?

Edwina Hart: Yr wyf wedi edrych ar yr holl dystiolaeth a gyflwynwyd i'r pwyllgor iechyd, ac yr wyf yn ymwybodol o farn y comisiynydd plant ar y mater hwn. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn dal i fwrw golwg derfynol ar y papurau sydd wedi'u cyflwyno imi, ac nid wyf am wneud dim sylwadau pellach ar y mater hwn, felly, nes imi gyhoeddi fy natganiad.

Peter Black: Weinidog, i ddychwelyd at wasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasod, cyfeiriodd Helen Mary at y materion sydd wedi codi gyda'r gwasanaethau hyn yn y gorffennol. Fodd bynnag, mae'r adroddiad diweddar a gyhoeddwyd gan Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru'n dweud bod y gwasanaethau, hyd yn oed yn awr, yn dal i fetu â diwallu anghenion llawer o blant a phobl ifanc. O ystyried nad ydym wedi cael datganiad gennyhych o hyd—a deallaf y byddwch efallai'n gwneud datganiad yn y flwyddyn newydd—a allech roi awgrym inni sut y byddwch yn ymateb i'r adroddiad?

Edwina Hart: Mae'n bwysig imi sicrhau fy mod yn gyfarwydd â'r holl adroddiadau sydd wedi'u cyflwyno imi. Nid wyf erioed wedi awgrymu bod gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasod yn berffaith, mewn unrhyw fodd. Fodd bynnag, gallaf ddweud wrthyhych yn y Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw fod y mater hwn yn cael y flaenoriaeth angenrheidiol yn y byrddau iechyd lleol, ac yr ydym yn gobeithio buddsoddi yn y gwasanaeth. Mae'n bwysig imi edrych ar yr argymhellion a gyflwynir, er mwyn gweld a oes modd gwneud unrhyw beth arall o fewn cyd-destun a chyfyngiadau fy nghyllideb.

Peter Black: Diolch am hynny, Weinidog. Gobeithio y gallwch roi datganiad inni yn y flwyddyn newydd fel y gallwn eich holi

further on this. However, one issue that we have identified with child and adult mental health services is that of joint working between local authorities and the health boards, which is crucial. It is clear that a lot of the money under the joint-working grant currently made available to local councils, which I understand will be abolished in the future, is spent on child and adult mental health services. However, once that grant is abolished or ceases—however you wish to term it—the money will no longer be available to local councils and there will be a diminution in the resources available for the service. How you will address that shortfall?

Edwina Hart: Local authorities have to recognise their responsibilities to the group to which you refer, as they have responsibilities in that area, too, and not just to the health service.

NHS Workers

Q3 Brynle Williams: Will the Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's plans to support NHS workers in North Wales? OAQ(3)1345(HSS)

Edwina Hart: My plan is to carry on supporting NHS workers in North Wales so that they can help to create a world-class health service for the people of Wales.

1.40 p.m.

Brynle Williams: Thank you very much for that answer, Minister. You will be aware of a constituent of mine who, after working for the NHS for many years in north Wales, is deeply concerned that backpay owed to her by the previous NHS trust, under a review being conducted at that time, was lost during the recent merger. Can you provide assurances to me that NHS workers in north Wales who are in a similar position as a result of the merger will be treated fairly and will be paid for the work that they have done in full?

Edwina Hart: We will not go into the details of that particular case here, Brynle. However,

ymhellach am hyn. Fodd bynnag, un mater yr ydym wedi'i nodi o ran gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant ac oedolion yw mater cydweithio rhwng awdurdodau lleol a'r byrddau iechyd, sy'n hanfodol. Mae'n amlwg bod llawer o'r arian dan y grant ar gyfer cydweithio sydd ar gael i gynghorau lleol ar hyn o bryd, a deallaf y bydd yn cael ei ddileu yn y dyfodol, yn cael ei wario ar wasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant ac oedolion. Fodd bynnag, pan fydd y grant hwnnw'n cael ei ddileu neu'n dod i ben—pa eiriau bynnag y dymunwch eu defnyddio—ni fydd yr arian ar gael mwyach i gynghorau lleol, a bydd yr adnoddau sydd ar gael ar gyfer y gwasanaeth yn lleihau. Sut y byddwch yn mynd i'r afael â'r diffyg hwnnw?

Edwina Hart: Rhaid i awdurdodau lleol gydnabod eu cyfrifoldebau i'r grŵp o bobl y cyfeiriwch atynt, oherwydd mae ganddynt hwythau gyfrifoldebau yn y maes hwnnw hefyd, ac nid y gwasanaeth iechyd yn unig.

Gweithwyr y GIG

C3 Brynle Williams: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gynlluniau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gefnogi gweithwyr y GIG yng Ngogledd Cymru? OAQ(3)1345(HSS)

Edwina Hart: Fy mwriad yw parhau i gefnogi gweithwyr y GIG yn y gogledd fel y gallant helpu creu gwasanaeth iechyd o'r radd flaenaf i bobl Cymru.

Brynle Williams: Diolch yn fawr ichi am eich ateb, Weinidog. Byddwch yn gwybod am achos un o'm hetholwyr sydd, ar ôl gweithio i'r GIG am flynyddoedd lawer yn y gogledd, yn poeni'n fawr bod ôl-gyflog a oedd yn ddyledus iddi gan yr ymddiriedolaeth GIG flaenorol, dan adolygiad a oedd yn mynd ymlaen ar y pryd, wedi'i golli yn ystod yr uno diweddar. A allwch roi sicrwydd imi y bydd gweithwyr y GIG yn y gogledd, sydd mewn sefyllfa debyg o ganlyniad i'r uno, yn cael eu trin yn deg ac yn cael eu talu'n llawn am y gwaith y maent wedi'i wneud?

Edwina Hart: Nid wyf am roi sylw i fanylion yr achos penodol hwnnw yma,

it is fair to say that every effort must be made to ensure that there is fairness and equity, and that everything is being properly done in the health service in Wales as a whole and north Wales in particular. Personnel staff are aware of these matters in north Wales, but I will also ensure that my director of personnel takes an interest in the matter.

Janet Ryder: Minister, could you tell me what help is available to neonatal staff in north Wales who, because of understaffing, are having to close special care baby units to new admissions on an unfortunately regular basis?

Edwina Hart: I had the opportunity yesterday of meeting Jean Matthes, a consultant in the Abertawe Bro Morgannwg University Local Health Board, to discuss various neonatal issues, given that I am due to report back to Members on neonatal transport services. We are taking further work forward, and we discussed the availability of cots in north and west Wales. We are making progress on those issues, and I hope to send out a letter to Assembly Members giving the updated position at the end of this week or the beginning of next week.

Eleanor Burnham: I hope that I heard correctly, Minister, but I presume that you are alluding to a group that has also been in touch with me, comprising bank NHS staff who have been waiting six years for a pay rise that was awarded to be implemented. Perhaps we can discuss that later.

One reason why our NHS is so precious is the staff, and the public appreciates them. Nurses are taking on more responsibilities and are studying to gain more degree-level qualifications. As Minister for health, what are you doing to ensure that pay agreements and increases are always implemented in a timely manner?

Edwina Hart: I can assure you that if arrangements are put in place as a result of national pay bargaining, we will implement

Brynle. Fodd bynnag, mae'n deg dweud ei bod yn rhaid gwneud pob ymdrech i sicrhau bod pobl yn cael eu trin yn deg ac yn gyfartal, a bod popeth yn cael ei wneud yn iawn yn y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru'n gyffredinol ac yn y gogledd yn benodol. Mae staff personél yn ymwybodol o'r materion hyn yn y gogledd, ond byddaf yn sicrhau hefyd fod fy nghyfarwyddwr personél yn cymryd diddordeb yn y mater.

Janet Ryder: Weinidog, a allech ddweud wrthyf pa gymorth sydd ar gael i staff sy'n gweithio gyda babanod newydd-anedig yn y gogledd? Oherwydd diffyg staffio digonol, gwaetha'r modd, maent yn gorfod gwrthod derbyn achosion newydd i unedau gofal arbennig yn rheolaidd.

Edwina Hart: Ddoe cefais gyfle i gyfarfod â Jean Matthes, meddyg ymgynghorol ym Mwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Abertawe Bro Morgannwg, i drafod gwahanol faterion yn ymwneud â babanod newydd-anedig, o gofio bod disgwyl imi adrodd yn ôl i'r Aelodau am wasanaethau cludiant i'r newydd-anedig. Yr ydym yn datblygu gwaith pellach, a buom yn trafod nifer y crudiau sydd ar gael yn y gogledd a'r gorllewin. Yr ydym yn gwneud cynnydd yng nghyswllt y materion hynny, ac yr wyf yn gobeithio anfon llythyr at Aelodau'r Cynulliad i egluro'r sefyllfa ddiweddaraf ddiwedd yr wythnos hon neu ddechrau'r wythnos nesaf.

Eleanor Burnham: Gobeithio imi glywed yn iawn, Weinidog, ond cymeraf eich bod yn cyfeirio at grŵp o bobl sydd wedi cysylltu â mi hefyd, sy'n cynnwys staff cronfa'r GIG sydd wedi bod yn aros chwe blynedd i gael codiad cyflog a gafodd ei ddyfarnu iddynt. Efallai y gallwn drafod hynny wedyn.

Y staff yw un o'r rhesymau pam mae ein GIG mor werthfawr a'r cyhoedd yn eu gwerthfawrogi. Mae nyrsys yn cymryd mwy o gyfrifoldebau ac yn astudio i ennill mwy o gymwysterau ar lefel gradd. Fel y Gweinidog dros iechyd, beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i sicrhau bod cytundebau a chodiadau cyflog yn cael eu gweithredu'n brydlon bob amser?

Edwina Hart: Gallaf eich sicrhau, os oes trefniadau'n cael eu rhoi ar waith o ganlyniad i drafodaethau cenedlaethol ar gyflogau, y

them, as agreed—as was the case when the nurses' pay award came through. The problem is that it has been a very complex time following 'Agenda for Change'. Some people are still not satisfied with their bandings, some groups still exist who do not feel as though they were dealt with properly, and others feel that there are differences among the LHBs. These are all matters that have to be addressed with the trade unions, their members and employers. It would be very unwise of me to make general comments. However, I will just say that I will try to ensure that everything is dealt with in a proper and professional manner as regards the staff, because they are the most valuable asset of the service.

Gwasanaethau Cancer

C4 David Lloyd: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am anghenion pobl sy'n byw gyda chanser neu ar ôl cael canser? OAQ(3)1314(HSS)

Edwina Hart: I am awaiting a report from the cancer services co-ordinating group on the needs of cancer survivors. The report will reflect our policy on chronic disease management and the final version of the draft national standards on rehabilitation for cancer patients.

David Lloyd: Thank you for that answer, Minister. The survivorship agenda, to which you have referred, is increasingly important, given that thousands of people survive cancer and wish to return to work. Macmillan Cancer Support and others are campaigning to improve conditions for those returning to work and particularly to promote flexible working hours with employers. What discussions are you having on that agenda of promoting the increased use of flexible working hours so that people can more readily return to work and stay in work following a diagnosis of cancer?

Edwina Hart: Some of these issues are not devolved to us, such as the wider employment issues or anything related to the benefits agenda and so on for cancer patients. However, like you, I feel that it is important to look at this issue, and at how much

byddwn yn eu gweithredu, fel y cytunwyd—fel y digwyddodd pan gytunwyd ar y codiad cyflog i nyrsys. Y broblem yw bod y cyfnod yn dilyn 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' wedi bod yn gymhleth iawn. Mae rhai pobl yn anffodlon â'u bandiau cyflog o hyd, mae rhai grwpiau sy'n teimlo na chawsant eu trin yn iawn, ac y mae eraill yn teimlo bod gwahaniaethau rhwng y byrddau iechyd lleol. Mae'r rhain i gyd yn broblemau y mae angen rhoi sylw iddynt gyda'r undebau llafur, eu haelodau a'u cyflogwyr. Annoeth iawn fyddai imi wneud sylwadau cyffredinol. Fodd bynnag, y cyfan a ddywedaf yw y byddaf yn ceisio sicrhau bod yr holl faterion staff yn cael eu trin mewn modd priodol a phroffesiynol, gan mai'r staff yw adnodd mwyaf gwerthfawr y gwasanaeth.

Cancer Services

Q4 David Lloyd: Will the Minister make a statement on the needs of people living with or after cancer in Wales? OAQ(3)1314(HSS)

Edwina Hart: Yr wyf yn disgwyl adroddiad gan y grŵp cydlynu gwasanaethau canser ar anghenion pobl sydd wedi goroesi canser. Bydd yr adroddiad yn adlewyrchu ein polisi ar reoli clefydau cronig a fersiwn terfynol y safonau cenedlaethol drafft ar adsefydlu cleifion canser.

David Lloyd: Diolch am eich ateb, Weinidog. Mae'r agenda ar gyfer pobl sydd wedi goroesi canser, fel yr oeddech yn cyfeirio, yn gynyddol bwysig, o gofio bod miloedd o bobl yn goroesi canser ac yn dymuno dychwelyd i'r gwaith. Mae Cymorth Canser Macmillan ac eraill yn ymgyrchu i wella amodau ar gyfer y rhieni sy'n dychwelyd i'r gwaith, ac yn ymgyrchu'n benodol i hybu oriau gwaith hyblyg ymhlith cyflogwyr. Pa drafodaethau yr ydych yn eu cael ar hybu mwy o ddefnyddio oriau gwaith hyblyg, fel y gall pobl dychwelyd i'r gwaith yn haws a pharhau i weithio wedi iddynt gael gwybod bod canser arnynt?

Edwina Hart: Nid yw rhai o'r materion hyn wedi'u datganoli inni, megis y materion cyflogaeth ehangach neu unrhyw beth sy'n ymwneud â'r agenda fudd-daliadau ac yn y blaen ar gyfer cleifion canser. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf fi, fel chithau, yn teimlo'i bod yn

employers invest in individuals during their working lives. If employees have a period off because of ill health but they want to go back to work, it would be a good investment on the part of employers to get them back somehow, perhaps by considering part-time working. I can assure you that I will ask the national health service to look positively at this issue in respect of its own personnel policies.

Darren Millar: Minister, you will be aware that there is also a campaign by Macmillan Cancer Support to support cancer patients with their fuel bills over the winter period. Many cancer patients feel the cold a lot more than they did when they were not having cancer treatment and, as many cancer patients are out of work, they do not have the levels of income that they previously enjoyed. What action are you taking to address that, in conjunction with the Minister responsible for fuel poverty here in the Assembly?

Edwina Hart: We have had representations from Macmillan Cancer Support about this wide range of issues. I have asked my officials to look at them in a positive light to see what we can do within our devolved responsibilities.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats (Kirsty Williams): Minister, I begin by thanking you for your announcement earlier this week of the creation of a kidney dialysis unit at Llandrindod Wells Hospital. This means that kidney dialysis patients will no longer need to travel so far and will make a huge difference to those patients. Having secured this service, do you acknowledge that, for cancer patients, travelling for chemotherapy treatment is equally draining and difficult? Recent research has shown that the average distance that a Powys patient will travel in one direction for chemotherapy services is 35 miles. What steps can we now take to establish chemotherapy services for those patients for whom it is appropriate to be delivered closer to home, in such places as Brecon, Llandrindod and Welshpool—either

bwysig edrych ar y mater hwn, ac ar faint mae cyflogwyr yn ei fuddsoddi mewn unigolion yn ystod eu blynyddoedd gweithio. Os yw gweithwyr yn cael cyfnod i ffwrdd o'r gwaith oherwydd salwch ond yn dymuno dychwelyd i'r gwaith, byddai'n fuddsoddiad da i'r cyflogwyr i'w cael yn ôl rywsut, trwy ystyried gwaith rhan-amser efallai. Gallaf eich sicrhau y byddaf yn gofyn i'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol ystyried y mater hwn yn gadarnhaol o ran ei bolisiâu personél ei hun.

Darren Millar: Weinidog, byddwch yn gwybod bod gan Gymorth Cancer Macmillan ymgyrch hefyd i gynorthwyo cleifion cancer gyda'u biliau tanwydd dros gyfnod y gaeaf. Bydd nifer o gleifion cancer yn teimlo'r oerfel yn waeth o lawer na chyn iddynt gael triniaeth am ganser, a chan nad yw llawer o gleifion cancer yn gweithio, nid oes ganddynt yr un incwm ag a oedd ganddynt yn flaenorol. Pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd i fynd i'r afael â hynny, ar y cyd â'r Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am dlodi tanwydd yma yn y Cynulliad?

Edwina Hart: Yr ydym wedi cael sylwadau gan Gymorth Cancer Macmillan am yr ystod eang hon o faterion. Yr wyf wedi gofyn i'm swyddogion eu hystyried mewn modd cadarnhaol i weld beth y gallwn ei wneud o fewn y cyfrifoldebau sydd wedi'u datganoli inni.

Arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Kirsty Williams): Weinidog, hoffwn ddechrau drwy ddiolch ichi am eich cyhoeddiad yn gynharach yr wythnos hon, sef y bydd uned dialysis yr arenau'n cael ei chreu yn Ysbyty Llandrindod. Golyga hynny na fydd angen mwyach i gleifion dialysis yr arenau deithio mor bell, a bydd yn gwneud gwahaniaeth enfawr i'r cleifion hynny. Ar ôl sicrhau'r gwasanaeth hwn, a ydych yn cydnabod bod teithio i gael triniaeth cemotherapi yr un mor anodd a blinedig i gleifion cancer? Dengys ymchwil yn ddiweddar fod taith unffordd i glaf o Bowys i gael gwasanaethau cemotherapi yn 35 milltir ar gyfartaledd. Pa gamau y gallwn eu cymryd yn awr i sefydlu gwasanaethau cemotherapi ar gyfer y cleifion hynny y mae'n addas iddynt gael y driniaeth yn nes i'w cartref, mewn mannau megis Aberhonddu,

in our community hospital network or by working in conjunction with the mobile units of charities such as Tenovus?

Edwina Hart: I concur with your comments, and this is one of the key areas that we need to develop. I had discussions with Dr Chris Jones about his views on developments in primary health care, and one issue that we discussed was how, in some areas, chemotherapy could be delivered in community hospitals and by other mechanisms. This certainly is an issue, and I will be asking the cancer networks to have a look at it, because I think that we need to prioritise this.

NHS Staff

Q5 Angela Burns: Will the Minister make a statement on the current system for the recruitment of NHS staff in Wales? OAQ(3)1329(HSS)

Edwina Hart: The current system for the recruitment of staff in Wales is the NHS job website for healthcare staff and the Welsh deanery for consultants, doctors and dentists. The deanery commissions the provision of education and training for 2,600 doctors and dentists in postgraduate training posts in the NHS across Wales.

Angela Burns: You and I have previously discussed the difficulty in recruiting junior doctors to Whithybusch General Hospital. Now we have a situation throughout west Wales where we are having trouble getting specialists in mental health for adolescents. I wanted to bring it to your attention that we only have one tier 2 specialist for the whole of Llanelli west and my part of Ceredigion. That specialist left due to sickness, and was not replaced. There is only one person left in Ceredigion, whom they do not intend to replace, and the last tier 2 specialist in Haverfordwest is trying to cover the entire area and she cannot cope with her workload. I have constituents who cannot get help because of this. I wondered, Minister, if you could address this issue, and tell the Chamber what you will be able to do to increase the

Llandrindod a'r Trallwng—naill ai yn ein rhwydwaith o ysbytai cymunedol neu drwy weithio mewn cydweithrediad â'r unedau symudol sydd gan elusennau megis Tenovus?

Edwina Hart: Yr wyf yn cytuno â'ch sylwadau, ac y mae hwn yn un o'r meysydd allweddol y mae angen inni ei ddatblygu. Cefais drafodaethau gyda Dr Chris Jones am ei safbwyntiau ar ddatblygiadau yn y sector gofal iechyd sylfaenol, ac un mater y buom yn ei drafod oedd sut y gallai cemotherapi gael ei ddarparu gan ysbytai cymunedol a thrwy ddulliau eraill mewn rhai ardaloedd. Mae hynny'n sicr yn broblem, a byddaf yn gofyn i'r rhwydweithiau canser edrych ami, oherwydd credaf fod angen inni roi blaenoriaeth iddi.

Staff y GIG

C5 Angela Burns: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y system bresennol ar gyfer recriwtio staff y GIG yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)1329(HSS)

Edwina Hart: Y system bresennol ar gyfer recriwtio staff yng Nghymru yw gwefan swyddi'r GIG ar gyfer staff gofal iechyd a deoniaeth Cymru ar gyfer meddygon ymgynghorol, meddygon a deintyddion. Mae'r ddeoniaeth yn comisiynu addysg a hyfforddiant i 2,600 o feddygon a deintyddion mewn swyddi hyfforddi ôl-raddedig yn y GIG ledled Cymru.

Angela Burns: Yr ydych chi a mi wedi trafod cyn hyn yr anhawster wrth recriwtio meddygon iau i Ysbyty Cyffredinol Llwynhelyg. Yn awr, mae gennym sefyllfa ar draws y gorllewin i gyd lle'r ydym yn cael anhawster cael arbenigwyr ym maes iechyd meddwl y glasod. Yr oeddwn am dynnu eich sylw at y ffaith mai un arbenigwr haen 2 yn unig sydd gennym ar gyfer holl ardal gorllewin Llanelli a'm rhan i o Geredigion. Gadawodd yr arbenigwr hwnnw oherwydd afiechyd, ac ni chafodd y swydd ei llenwi. Nid oes ond un unigolyn ar ôl yng Ngheredigion, ac nid ydynt yn bwriadu cael neb yn ei le, ac y mae'r arbenigwr haen 2 olaf yn Hwlfordd yn ceisio ymdrin â'r ardal i gyd ac yn methu ag ymdopi â'i llwyth gwaith. Mae gennyf etholwyr sy'n methu cael help oherwydd hyn. Ysgwn i, Weinidog, a allech

rate of recruitment for these specialist posts within our health service in Wales.

Edwina Hart: I was discussing with the deanery yesterday these difficult issues about further recruitment, and what more I should do to encourage those who train in Wales to remain in Wales, especially in west and north-west Wales. We are having some positive discussions about further placements to encourage them in. I will speak to the chief executive of the NHS about the issues that you have raised today, and get back to you with a substantive response.

Irene James: Recently, I joined you and Jeff Cuthbert at the topping-off ceremony for the new hospital at Ystrad Fawr. Can you assure me that systems are in place to ensure that all posts within this state-of-the-art hospital will be filled in time for the opening?

Edwina Hart: That is the responsibility of the LHB. I will answer 'yes', and then we will ensure that it will be done.

Bethan Jenkins: I have been contacted by a number of constituents in my region who are concerned that only two midwives cover the whole of the upper Neath valley, and antenatal appointments are cancelled if a midwife has to attend to a birth. What changes are you making to ensure that this situation does not happen again and that general midwifery coverage across Wales is improved? I know that we are conducting an Audit Committee inquiry into this issue, but I think that it is something that we need to develop quickly.

Edwina Hart: There have been concerns across the piece about maternity and midwifery services across Wales. We have had issues in the Royal Gwent Hospital and issues in the Cardiff and Vale University Local Health Board, and issues have been brought to my attention within the Abertawe Bro Morgannwg University Local Health Board.

roi sylw i'r mater hwn, a dweud wrth y Siambr beth fyddwch yn gallu ei wneud i gynyddu'r gyfradd recriwtio i'r swyddi arbenigol hyn yn ein gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru?

Edwina Hart: Yr oeddwn yn trafod yr anawsterau hyn o ran recriwtio ymhellach gyda'r ddeoniaeth ddoe, a beth arall y dylwn ei wneud i annog y rheini sy'n cael hyfforddiant yng Nghymru i aros yng Nghymru, yn enwedig yn y gorllewin a'r gogledd-orllewin. Yr ydym yn cael rhai trafodaethau cadarnhaol ar leoliadau gwaith pellach i'w hannog i ymuno â'r gweithlu. Byddaf yn siarad â phrif weithredwr y GIG am y materion yr ydych wedi'u codi heddiw, a chysylltaf â chi gydag ymateb pendant.

Irene James: Yn ddiweddar, ymunais â chi a Jeff Cuthbert yn y seremoni i osod carreg gopa ar yr ysbyty newydd yn Ystrad Fawr. A allwch roi sicrwydd imi fod systemau ar waith i sicrhau y bydd yr holl swyddi yn yr ysbyty hwn, sydd o'r radd flaenaf, wedi'u llenwi erbyn i'r ysbyty agor?

Edwina Hart: Cyfrifoldeb y bwrdd iechyd lleol yw hynny. Dywedaf y gallaf, ac yna byddwn yn sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd.

Bethan Jenkins: Yr wyf wedi clywed gan nifer o etholwyr yn fy rhanbarth, sy'n pryderu mai dwy fydwraig yn unig sy'n gweithio ar draws cwm Nedd uchaf i gyd, a bod penodiadau gofal cyn geni yn cael eu canslo os bydd bydwaig yn gorfod bod yn bresennol mewn genedigaeth. Pa newidiadau yr ydych yn eu gwneud i sicrhau nad fydd y sefyllfa hon yn codi eto, a bod y ddarpariaeth bydwragedd yn gyffredinol ar draws Cymru yn gwella? Gwn fod y Pwyllgor Archwilio'n gwneud ymchwiliad i'r mater hwn, ond credaf ei fod yn rhywbeth y mae angen inni ei ddatblygu'n gyflym.

Edwina Hart: Cafwyd pryderon cyffredinol am wasanaethau mamolaeth a bydweigiaeth ar draws Cymru. Cawsom broblemau yn Ysbyty Brenhinol Gwent a phroblemau ym Mwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Caerdydd a'r Fro, ac y mae problemau wedi'u dwyn i'm sylw ym Mwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Abertawe a Bro Morgannwg.

1.50 p.m.

The chief nursing officer has been looking at these issues, and I have asked a senior official to draw the strands together, because it is important that we have the necessary coverage within the community. We have found that community midwives are so well regarded that more and more mothers are utilising their services. We therefore have to get the service up to scratch across the piece. I will be frank with you: there is a lot more work to do in that area.

Mae'r prif swyddog nyrzio wedi bod yn edrych ar y materion hyn, ac yr wyf wedi gofyn i uwch-swyddog dynnu'r elfennau ynghyd, oherwydd mae'n bwysig fod gennym y ddarpariaeth angenrheidiol yn y gymuned. Cymaint yw'r parch at fydwragedd cymunedol nes ein bod wedi gweld mwy a mwy o famau'n defnyddio'u gwasanaethau. Rhaid inni sicrhau, felly, fod y gwasanaeth yn cyrraedd y safon ofynnol ym mhobman. A siarad yn blaen: mae llawer mwy o waith i'w wneud yn y maes hwnnw.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 6, OAQ(3)1325(HSS), yn ôl.

The Presiding Officer: Question 6, OAQ(3)1325(HSS), has been withdrawn.

Immunisation Rates

Cyfraddau Imiwneiddio

Q7 Mohammad Asghar: Will the Minister make a statement on immunisation rates in Gwent? OAQ(3)1306(HSS)

C7 Mohammad Asghar: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gyfraddau imiwneiddio yng Ngwent? OAQ(3)1306(HSS)

Edwina Hart: Immunisation rates for children in Gwent are generally good to excellent, as evidenced by the 2008-09 cover of vaccination evaluated rapidly statistics, although the teenage vaccination rates need to be improved. Aneurin Bevan Local Health Board is planning to raise uptake both through a systematic approach and by encouraging opportunistic vaccination by GP practices. Swine flu rates are expected later this month, and I will be able report to Members about the success of that by the end of this year.

Edwina Hart: At ei gilydd, mae cyfraddau imiwneiddio plant yng Ngwent yn dda neu'n ardderchog, fel y dangoswyd gan yr ystadegau gwerthuso cyflym yn 2008-09 o'r rhaglen frechu, er bod angen gwella'r cyfraddau brechu ymhlith pobl yn eu harddegau. Mae Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Aneurin Bevan yn bwriadu mynd ati i gynyddu'r nifer trwy ddefnyddio dull systematig a thrwy annog practisau meddygon teulu i gynnig brechiadau i bobl sy'n mynd i'r feddygfa am resymau eraill. Disgwylir y bydd gwybodaeth am gyfraddau brechu rhag y fflw moch ar gael yn ddiweddarach yn y mis, a gallaf adrodd i'r Aelodau am lwyddiant y rhaglen honno erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn.

Mohammad Asghar: You will be aware of the launch of STRIFE, which is the strategy to raise immunisation and vaccination rates for everyone. The project aims to increase the uptake of vaccinations in the area, as uptake of the MMR jab in particular is low in Gwent. I am sure that you will join me in welcoming the strategy. What is your department doing to increase the uptake of vaccines among young people across Wales?

Mohammad Asghar: Byddwch yn gwybod am lansio STRIFE, y strategaeth i godi cyfraddau imiwneiddio a brechu pobl o bob oed. Nod y prosiect yw cynyddu nifer y bobl sy'n cael eu brechu yn yr ardal, gan fod y nifer sy'n cael y brechiad MMR yn benodol yn isel yng Ngwent. Yr wyf yn siŵr yr ymunwch â mi i groesawu'r strategaeth. Beth mae eich adran yn ei wneud i gynyddu nifer y bobl ifanc yng Nghymru sy'n cael eu brechu?

Edwina Hart: The MMR vaccine has had an

Edwina Hart: Mae hanes y brechlyn MMR

unfortunate history, and we heard those stories in the press, which did enormous damage across the piece. The uptake of the first dose of MMR ranged from 87.7 per cent to 92.1 per cent, compared with the average in Wales of 88.2 per cent. As for the percentage of children immunised by their second birthday in 2008-09, the uptake of the second dose ranged from 81.4 per cent to 87 per cent, compared with the Wales average of 82.1 per cent. Therefore, some areas are doing better. There is a big issue for public health in trying to get the messages across to parents of young children about what they should be doing, as well as to parents of young teenage girls about other vaccinations. We are keeping up the pressure with regard to campaigns. We are seeing a rise, and let us hope that it can be maintained.

William Graham: Minister, you have mentioned figures that show a good uptake, but I note with some regret that in Blaenau Gwent and Caerphilly children's uptake of vaccines for diphtheria, tetanus and polio is, frankly, extremely bad: it is 5.3 per cent in Blaenau Gwent and 7 per cent in Caerphilly. That contrasts with the figure for your constituency, which is 77.5 per cent. What can be done to improve those figures?

Edwina Hart: The chief medical officer and the National Public Health Service for Wales are extremely concerned about those issues. A lot more work has to be done at a local level, through primary and community healthcare, to get the messages out clearly. We have to recognise that vaccination provides safety not only for the child but for the community as a whole. We need to keep the pressure up in respect of how we deal with this issue through publicity and discussion.

We have found it useful for the CMO and the staff in that department to take part in local radio stations' phone-ins on particular issues, as we have done on swine flu. There might be a possibility to look at doing that to get the message across, as people could ring in about their problems and issues. We could be positive and more proactive in that way. I

wedi bod yn anffodus, a chlywsom y straeon hynny yn y wasg a wnaeth niwed mawr yn gyffredinol. Yr oedd y ganran a gafodd ddos cyntaf y brechlyn MMR yn amrywio o 87.7 y cant i 92.1 y cant, o'i chymharu â chyfartaledd o 88.2 y cant yng Nghymru. O ran canran y plant a oedd wedi'u himiwneddio erbyn eu pen-blwydd yn ddwy oed yn 2008-09, yr oedd y ganran a gafodd yr ail ddos yn amrywio o 81.4 y cant i 87 y cant, o'i chymharu â chyfartaledd o 82.1 y cant yng Nghymru. Felly, mae rhai ardaloedd yn gwneud yn well. Mae ceisio cyfleu'r negeseuon i rieni plant ifanc am yr hyn y dylent fod yn ei wneud, a rhieni merched ifanc yn eu harddegau am frechiadau eraill, yn fater pwysig i'r sector iechyd cyhoeddus. Yr ydym yn dal i roi pwysau ar bobl trwy ymgyrchoedd. Yr ydym yn gweld y cyfraddau'n codi, a gobeithio y bydd modd cynnal hynny.

William Graham: Weinidog, yr ydych wedi crybwyll ffigurau sy'n dangos bod nifer dda yn cael eu brechu, ond sylwaf gydag ychydig ofid fod nifer y plant ym Mlaenau Gwent a Chaerffili sy'n cael eu brechu rhag difftheria, tetanws a pholio yn wael iawn, a siarad yn blaen: mae'r ffigur yn 5.3 y cant ym Mlaenau Gwent ac yn 7 y cant yng Nghaerffili. Mae hynny'n wahanol iawn i'r ffigur ar gyfer eich etholaeth chi, sy'n 77.5 y cant. Beth ellir ei wneud i wella'r ffigurau hynny?

Edwina Hart: Mae'r materion hynny'n peri gofid mawr i'r prif swyddog meddygol ac i wasanaeth iechyd cyhoeddus cenedlaethol Cymru. Rhaid gwneud llawer mwy o waith ar lefel leol, trwy ofal iechyd sylfaenol a chymunedol, i gyfleu'r negeseuon yn glir. Rhaid inni gydnabod bod brechu'n diogelu nid yn unig y plentyn, ond y gymuned gyfan. Mae angen inni barhau i roi pwysau ar bobl o ran sut yr ydym yn ymdrin â'r mater hwn trwy gyhoeddusrwydd a thrwy drafod.

Gwelsom ei bod yn ddefnyddiol i'r prif swyddog meddygol a'r staff yn yr adran honno gymryd rhan mewn sesiynau ffonio gan orsafoedd radio lleol ar faterion penodol, fel yr ydym wedi'i wneud gyda'r fflw moch. Gallai fod yn bosibl ystyried gwneud hynny er mwyn cyfleu'r neges, oherwydd gallai pobl ffonio am eu problemau a'u pynciau

will report back to Plenary about any further work that needs to be undertaken on that.

Nutrition for Hospital Patients

Q8 Alun Davies: Will the Minister provide an update on Welsh Assembly Government initiatives to improve nutrition for hospital patients? OAQ(3)1309(HSS)

Edwina Hart: Working towards the 'One Wales' commitment to improve hospital food, the all-Wales nutrition care pathway and food charts were introduced in October 2009. In addition, a nutrition awareness campaign for hospital staff started in September 2008, promoting the message that the provision of food is as important as medication—and perhaps more important, in many ways, than medication.

Alun Davies: I very much concur with your final statement in reply to my question. You will be aware that patients, particularly those who are receiving longer-term care in hospital and those who are suffering from chronic illnesses, require nourishment to maintain their recovery. You also know that there have been instances where patients have received neither the nutrition that they need nor the help, care and attention to ensure that they are able to eat the meals provided for them and that those meals are finished, in order that they do have the best chances of recovery. Could you give us an update on the effectiveness of the tools that you have introduced over the last few months to ensure that nutrition is taken seriously by healthcare professionals in hospitals across Wales and to ensure that the nutrition that patients require is given to them and that they are able to take it.

Edwina Hart: Malnutrition is a problem across the UK. Older people are particularly vulnerable, as malnutrition predisposes people to disease, delays their recovery and adversely affects the way in which their bodies function. A nutrition care pathway was completed in May 2008. That work is

trafod. Gallem fod yn gadarnhaol ac yn fwy rhagweithiol yn y cyswllt hwnnw. Byddaf yn adrodd yn ôl i'r Cyfarfod Llawn am unrhyw waith pellach y mae angen ei wneud ar hynny.

Maeth ar gyfer Cleifion mewn Ysbyty

C8 Alun Davies: A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am gynlluniau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wella maeth ar gyfer cleifion mewn ysbyty? OAQ(3)1309(HSS)

Edwina Hart: Gan weithio tuag at gyflawni'r ymrwymiad yn 'Cymru'n Un' i wella bwyd ysbytai, cyflwynwyd siartiau bwyd a llwybr gofal maeth Cymru gyfan ym mis Hydref 2009. Yn ogystal â hynny, dechreuodd ymgyrch i gynyddu ymwybyddiaeth staff ysbytai am faeth ym mis Medi 2008, gan hybu'r neges fod darparu bwyd yr un mor bwysig â darparu meddyginiaeth—ac yn bwysicach na darparu meddyginiaeth mewn llawer ffordd, hwyrach.

Alun Davies: Yr wyf yn cytuno'n llwyr â'ch datganiad olaf wrth ymateb i'm cwestiwn. Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod angen maeth ar gleifion, yn enwedig y rheini sy'n cael gofal tymor hwy yn yr ysbyty a'r rheini sydd â salwch cronig, i'w helpu i barhau i wella. Gwyddoch hefyd fod achosion wedi bod lle nad yw cleifion wedi cael y maeth y mae arnynt ei angen, na'r cymorth, y gofal a'r sylw i sicrhau eu bod yn gallu bwyta'r prydau a ddarperir ar eu cyfer ac yn bwyta'r prydau hynny i gyd, fel y bydd ganddynt y cyfle gorau posibl i wella. A allech roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf inni am effeithiolrwydd y dulliau yr ydych wedi'u cyflwyno dros y misoedd diwethaf i sicrhau bod gweithwyr gofal iechyd proffesiynol mewn ysbytai ar draws Cymru yn cymryd maeth o ddifrif, ac yn sicrhau bod cleifion yn cael y maeth y mae arnynt ei angen a'u bod yn gallu bwyta'r bwyd a roddir iddynt.

Edwina Hart: Mae diffyg maeth yn broblem ar draws y DU. Mae pobl hŷn yn arbennig o agored i niwed, gan fod diffyg maeth yn golygu y bydd pobl yn fwy tebygol o gael afiechyd, eu bod yn cymryd mwy o amser i wella a'i fod yn effeithio'n andwyol ar y modd y mae eu corff yn gweithio. Cafodd

now being implemented across Welsh hospitals. The nutrition awareness campaign in September 2008 was well supported by the Royal College of Nursing's Nutrition Now campaign. It has been positive with regard to the way in which it has dealt with the issues relating to nutrition with nurses in Wales.

The final draft of the all-Wales food chart for community health settings is due this month. We have continuing campaigns among staff, best practice events and other measures taking place across Wales. A scoping exercise for national nutritional standards for patient food is due to be completed next spring. Therefore, we are making good progress in this area. However, it is important that we ensure that we have the necessary staff available on the wards to assist with nutrition issues. Hospital staff are busy, so we have to ensure that staff have the time to provide help to those who require assistance to eat or who need a little bit of encouragement, otherwise we will not be able to deal with the issues properly.

David Melding: The last point needs to be emphasised repeatedly: much good food is not eaten. I had a recent case of an old lady who had become blind who had not been given help to eat, and another of a highly arthritic lady who had just had operations on her elbows who was not given any assistance to eat. Staff, when they take away food that has not been eaten, have to report to someone and say what is happening. Being able to eat is as important to the patient experience as being warm and feeling safe in hospital. It has a huge impact on health.

Edwina Hart: I totally concur. We have been grateful for the support that we have had from the Royal College of Nursing and health professionals about dealing with this issue. Sometimes, in a busy environment, people just get on with it and think, 'That sandwich has not been eaten; off I go'. In trying to deal with the issues, we are trying to educate staff, talk to staff, run the seminars,

llwybr gofal maeth ei gwblhau ym mis Mai 2008. Erbyn hyn, mae'r gwaith hwnnw'n cael ei weithredu yn holl ysbytai Cymru. Cafodd yr ymgyrch i gynyddu ymwybyddiaeth o faeth ym mis Medi 2008 ei chefnogi'n dda gan ymgyrch y Coleg Nyrsio Brenhinol, Nutrition Now. Mae wedi bod yn gadarnhaol yn y modd y mae wedi ymdrin â'r materion yn ymwneud â maeth ymysg nyrsys yng Nghymru.

Disgwylir i ddrafft terfynol siart fwyd Cymru gyfan ar gyfer lleoliadau iechyd cymunedol gael ei gyhoeddi'r mis hwn. Yr ydym yn cynnal ymgyrchoedd parhaus ymhlith staff, digwyddiadau ar arfer gorau a champau eraill ar hyd a lled Cymru. Disgwylir i ymarfer cwmpasu ar safonau maeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer bwyd cleifion gael ei gwblhau yn ystod y gwanwyn. Felly, yr ydym yn gwneud cynnydd da yn y maes hwn. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig inni sicrhau bod gennym y staff angenrheidiol ar y wardiau i helpu gyda materion maeth. Mae staff mewn ysbytai'n brysur, felly, rhaid inni sicrhau bod ganddynt amser i helpu'r bobl hynny y mae arnynt angen cymorth i fwyta neu angen ychydig anogaeth. Fel arall, ni fyddwn yn gallu mynd i'r afael â'r problemau'n iawn.

David Melding: Mae angen pwysleisio'r pwynt olaf dro ar ôl tro: mae llawer o fwyd da'n cael ei adael heb ei fwyta. Yn ddiweddar, cefais wybod am hen wraig a oedd wedi colli ei golwg ac nad oedd wedi cael help i fwyta'i bwyd, a gwraig arall ag arthritis difrifol a oedd newydd gael llawdriniaeth ar ei phenelinoedd ac na chafodd ddim cymorth i fwyta'i bwyd. Pan fydd staff yn clirio bwyd nad yw wedi'i fwyta, rhaid iddynt roi gwybod i rywun a dweud beth sy'n digwydd. Mae gallu bwyta yr un mor bwysig i brofiad y claf â bod yn gynnes neu deimlo'n ddiogel yn yr ysbyty. Mae'n effeithio'n fawr iawn ar iechyd.

Edwina Hart: Yr wyf yn cytuno'n llwyr. Yr ydym wedi bod yn ddiolchgar am y gefnogaeth a gawsom gan y Coleg Nyrsio Brenhinol a gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol wrth ymdrin â'r mater hwn. Weithiau, mewn amgylchedd prysur, bydd pobl yn mynd ymlaen â'u gwaith gan feddwl, 'Dyw'r frechdan hon ddim wedi'i bwyta; bant â fi'. Wrth geisio mynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn,

and get this holistic approach to ensure that staff are aware that they should think twice when something like this happens and recognise that someone is not always turning away the food, that there are other issues. Sometimes, people do not recognise the difficulties that some patients have and some patients will not complain or ask, they will just say, for example, 'Don't worry, I will be all right if my daughter comes in later'. We have to watch all of the time to try to improve this.

Chris Franks: From my experience in the Heath hospital, the standard of care in this respect is first class. Can you tell me what Government support has been given to encourage the purchase of local food for Welsh hospitals? A letter that I have received from the Cardiff and Vale University Local Health Board indicates that the board makes extensive use of local suppliers. What talks has the Minister had with health bodies regarding the Government's local sourcing action plan? Do you agree, Minister, that, in the era of climate change, food security will become even more important?

Edwina Hart: I know that food security is an issue that my colleague, the Minister for Rural Affairs, Elin Jones, takes particularly seriously, hence the 'One Wales' commitment to the initiative to increase the sourcing of local food and drink. The local sourcing action plan, Food and Drink for Wales, was launched by Elin Jones earlier this year. My officials are supporting health boards to work with Welsh companies to develop and supply products to the healthy vending machines and to increase the supply of local food and drink to public sector organisation. That work is ongoing across the whole of the national health service.

Protect NHS Staff against Violence

Q9 Rosemary Butler: Will the Minister provide an update on Welsh Assembly Government initiatives to protect NHS staff against violence? OAQ(3)1295(HSS)

yr ydym yn ceisio addysgu staff, siarad â staff, cynnal seminarau, a sefydlu'r dull gweithredu cyfannol hwn er mwyn sicrhau bod staff yn gwybod y dylent feddwl ddwywaith pan fydd rhywbeth fel hyn yn digwydd, a sylweddoli nad yw rhywun yn gwrthod y bwyd bob tro, a bod yna broblemau eraill. Weithiau nid yw pobl yn sylweddoli'r anawsterau sydd gan rai cleifion, a bydd rhai cleifion yn amharod i gwyno neu ofyn. Er enghraifft, byddant yn dweud, 'Peidiwch â phoeni, fe fydda i'n iawn os daw fy merch yn ddiweddarach'. Rhaid inni gadw llygad ar y sefyllfa drwy'r amser er mwyn ceisio gwella hyn.

Chris Franks: O'm profiad i yn ysbyty'r Waun, mae safon y gofal yn y cyswllt hwn o'r radd flaenaf. A allwch ddweud wrthyf pa gymorth y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi'i roi i annog prynu bwyd lleol ar gyfer ysbytai Cymru? Mae llythyr a gefais gan Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Caerdydd a'r Fro yn dweud bod y bwrdd yn defnyddio cyflenwyr lleol yn helaeth. Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael gyda chyrff iechyd ar gynllun gweithredu cyrchu lleol y Llywodraeth? A ydych yn cytuno, Weinidog, y bydd diogelu cyflenwadau bwyd yn dod yn bwysicach fyth mewn cyfnod o newid yn yr hinsawdd?

Edwina Hart: Gwn fod diogelu cyflenwadau bwyd yn fater y mae fy nghydweithiwr, y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig, Elin Jones, yn ei gymryd o ddifrif, a hynny sydd i gyfrif am yr ymrwymiad yn 'Cymru'n Un' i'r fenter i brynu mwy o fwyd a diod yn lleol. Cafodd y cynllun gweithredu ar brynu'n lleol, Bwyd a Diod i Gymru, ei lansio gan Elin Jones yn gynharach eleni. Mae fy swyddogion yn cynorthwyo byrddau iechyd i weithio gyda chwmnïau Cymreig i ddatblygu a chyflenwi cynnyrch i'r peiriannau gwerthu iach ac i gynyddu'r cyflenwad o fwyd a diod lleol i sefydliadau'r sector cyhoeddus. Mae'r gwaith hwnnw'n parhau ar draws y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol i gyd.

Amddiffyn Staff y GIG rhag Trais

C9 Rosemary Butler: A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am gynlluniau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i amddiffyn staff y GIG rhag trais?

OAQ(3)1295(HSS)

Edwina Hart: I am determined to protect NHS staff. I signed a memorandum of understanding with the police in September; a pilot scheme of high-quality closed circuit television in four accident and emergency departments and five ambulances commences in December; and a business case for personal safety alarms for lone workers will hopefully be with me shortly.

Rosemary Butler: As you said this afternoon in response to an earlier question, the national health service's most valuable asset is its staff. Those staff need protection not only in work, but going to and from work on hospital premises.

2.00 p.m.

I understand that closed-circuit television cameras were installed in the Royal Gwent Hospital's accident and emergency department last September. Can you tell us whether this has led to a reduction in violence towards staff and, if not, do you have any further plans that would help to make hospitals safer places for staff and patients?

Edwina Hart: The systems will be operational from December and we will be looking at this then. We want them to gather information for the prosecution of people who are aggressive towards NHS staff. That hospital is one of the trial sites and we will be looking at the images to see how we can proceed with the Crown Prosecution Service and go ahead with prosecutions. I recently spent a few hours, late into the night, in Cardiff in the Heath hospital. I was amazed at the way that people spoke to staff and at what ambulance staff had to put up with, with ambulances being hammered as they went down a road by people demanding to be picked up. Staff would take what I regard as dreadful language and a dreadful way to speak to someone as just a normal part of life. I am not saying that we saw absolute violence, although we did see a couple of

Edwina Hart: Yr wyf yn benderfynol o amddiffyn staff y GIG. Llofnodais femorandwm cyd-ddealltwriaeth â'r heddlu ym mis Medi; bydd cynllun peilot sy'n defnyddio teledu cylch cyfyng o safon uchel mewn pedair adran ddamweiniau ac achosion brys a phum ambiwlans yn dechrau ym mis Rhagfyr; a gobeithio y caiff achos busnes ei gyflwyno imi cyn hir dros roi larymau diogelwch personol i bobl sy'n gweithio ar eu pen eu hunain.

Rosemary Butler: Fel yr oeddech yn ei ddweud y prynhawn yma mewn ymateb i gwestiwn cynharach, adnodd mwyaf gwerthfawr y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yw ei staff. Mae angen amddiffyn y staff hynny, nid yn unig yn y gwaith, ond wrth iddynt fynd yn ôl ac ymlaen i'w gwaith ar dir ysbytai.

Deallaf fod camerâu teledu cylch cyfyng wedi'u gosod yn adran ddamweiniau ac achosion brys Ysbyty Brenhinol Gwent ym mis Medi. A allwch ddweud wrthym a yw hynny wedi arwain at leihau'r trais y mae staff yn ei ddiodef, ac os nad ydyw, a oes gennych unrhyw gynlluniau pellach a fyddai'n helpu gwneud ysbytai'n fwy diogel i staff a chleifion?

Edwina Hart: Bydd y systemau ar waith o fis Rhagfyr ymlaen, a byddwn yn edrych ar y mater bryd hynny. Yr ydym am iddynt gasglu gwybodaeth er mwyn gallu erlyn pobl sy'n ymddwyn yn ymosodol tuag at staff y GIG. Mae'r ysbyty hwnnw'n un o'r safleoedd sy'n rhan o'r cynllun peilot, a byddwn yn edrych ar y lluniau i weld sut y gallwn symud ymlaen gyda Gwasanaeth Erlyn y Goron ac erlyn pobl. Yn ddiweddar, treuliais ychydig oriau, yn hwyr yn y nos, yn ysbyty'r Waun yng Nghaerdydd. Synnais at y modd yr oedd pobl yn siarad â'r staff a'r hyn yr oedd yn rhaid i staff ambiwlans ei oddef, a'r cerbydau'n cael eu dyrnu wrth yrru i lawr ffordd gan bobl a oedd yn mynnu bod yr ambiwlans yn eu codi. Byddai'r staff yn derbyn bod yr hyn y byddwn i'n ei ystyried yn iaith ofnadwy, ac yn ffordd ofnadwy o siarad â rhywun, yn rhan o'u bywyd arferol.

incidents, but the way that people were behaving was incredible. These were not necessarily people who were fuelled by drugs or alcohol either; in some cases, it was just general discourtesy. This is a really big issue for us. We have set our policy at the centre, but I was disturbed to hear staff say, 'That is all very well, but what happens when an incident takes place?' A member of staff said, 'An incident took place that involved me, but what has happened? Nobody has been prosecuted and nothing has happened'. That will guide me over the next 12 months, and I will ensure that people are dealt with when we get evidence against them, so that staff are reassured that action will be taken, because I do not think that they feel that it will be taken at the moment.

Jonathan Morgan: A deficiency identified by both the Auditor General for Wales and the Audit Committee was that only three out of 17 CCTV systems were capable of providing good quality pictures for the Crown Prosecution Service to use as evidence. You have already said that steps have been taken to improve on that. Can the Government give a timescale for when all of those CCTV systems will be replaced so that patients and staff can have confidence in the security arrangements in those hospitals?

Edwina Hart: I cannot give you a date for that today, Jonathan, but I will be discussing where we are going on this with David Francis, who heads up this work stream as the chair of Cardiff and Vale University Local Health Board. I will be happy to make a statement to Plenary in the new year giving an update on these issues, which I know are of enormous concern across all parties in the Chamber.

Leanne Wood: In the Audit Committee's report on this in July, staff reporting was identified as being inadequate, therefore, it is difficult to have much confidence in the

Nid wyf yn dweud ein bod wedi gweld trais llwyr, er inni weld un neu ddau ddigwyddiad, ond yr oedd y ffordd yr oedd pobl yn ymddwyn yn anghredadwy. Nid pobl wedi bod yn yfed neu'n cymryd cyffuriau oedd y rhain o angenrheidrwydd ychwaith; mewn rhai achosion anghwrteisi cyffredinol ydoedd, a dim arall. Mae hon yn broblem fawr iawn inni. Yr ydym wedi gosod ein polisi yn y canol, ond yr oeddwn yn poeni clywed staff yn dweud, 'Popeth yn iawn, ond beth sy'n digwydd pan fydd rhywbeth yn digwydd?' Dywedodd un aelod o staff, 'Fe fues i'n rhan o ddigwyddiad, ond beth sydd wedi ei wneud? Does neb wedi ei erlyn, a does dim wedi ei wneud'. Bydd hynny'n llywio fy ngwaith dros y 12 mis nesaf, a byddaf yn sicrhau ein bod yn ymdrin â phobl pan fydd gennym dystiolaeth yn eu herbyn, er mwyn i staff gael sicrwydd y bydd camau'n cael eu cymryd, oherwydd ni chredaf eu bod yn teimlo y bydd camau'n cael eu cymryd ar hyn o bryd.

Jonathan Morgan: Un gwendid a nodwyd gan Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru a'r Pwyllgor Archwilio oedd mai tair system yn unig allan o 17 o systemau teledu cylch cyfyng a oedd yn gallu darparu lluniau o safon y gallai Gwasanaeth Erlyn y Goron eu defnyddio fel tystiolaeth. Yr ydych eisoes wedi dweud bod camau wedi'u cymryd i wella hynny. A all y Llywodraeth roi amserlen pryd y bydd systemau teledu cylch cyfyng newydd yn cael eu gosod yn lle'r systemau diffygiol hynny, er mwyn i gleifion a staff fod yn hyderus yn nhrefniadau diogelwch yr ysbytai hynny?

Edwina Hart: Ni allaf roi dyddiad ichi ar gyfer hynny heddiw, Jonathan, ond byddaf yn trafod y cyfeiriad yr ydym yn symud iddo gyda David Francis, sy'n arwain y ffrwd waith hon fel cadeirydd Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Caerdydd a'r Fro. Byddaf yn fodlon gwneud datganiad mewn Cyfarfod Llawn yn y flwyddyn newydd er mwyn rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y materion hyn y gwn eu bod yn destun pryder enfawr i bob plaid yn y Siambr.

Leanne Wood: Yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor Archwilio ar y mater hwn ym mis Gorffennaf, nodwyd bod trefniadau adrodd gan staff yn annigonol, a'i bod felly'n anodd

information that has already been collected on the number of incidents. One problem is that there is no national list of assaults or of what action was taken to deal with those assaults, such as prosecutions. You mentioned that a new system is coming in that aims to increase prosecutions. Do you know, at this stage, how many prosecutions there have been, and would you be prepared to consider establishing a national unit that had the aim of increasing the number of prosecutions? The Audit Committee's report also found that lone-working monitoring was not in place. Could you tell us whether there has been any progress on that?

Edwina Hart: I am due to provide a formal update to the Public Accounts Committee by the end of December on all the points that the Audit Committee, as it was known, has raised with me. The Datix incident and reporting system is now operating throughout the NHS in Wales. The NHS has been operating that system and doing the incident recording calls since 1 October 2009. As part of what we have done in response to the committee's recommendations, we have ensured that occupational health departments see staff within three days of an assault, which is an improvement. It has also been agreed that each LHB will have a dedicated post for the role of case manager on this, which should improve the information gathering process. We have Welsh Health Estates developing guidance for LHBs looking at the security design, how it relates to violence against staff and how we can do better in terms of design. We are also looking at the model of the 'All Wales NHS Violence and Aggression Training Passport and Information Scheme'. That is under development—we should be launching that and that should become live, in complete form, by April 2010. So some of the issues that were raised in the Audit Committee report are being brought forward and I will ensure that Members have an update on that within the timescales that have been agreed. This is an exceptionally serious issue and unless people speak to staff they will not realise the enormous pressure that this puts NHS staff under. We tend to think of it as happening in accident and emergency departments and to ambulance staff, but it

ymddiried ryw lawer yn y wybodaeth sydd eisoes wedi'i chasglu am nifer y digwyddiadau. Un broblem yw'r ffaith nad oes rhestr genedlaethol o ymosodiadau a'r camau a gymerwyd i ymdrin â hwy, megis camau i erlyn pobl. Soniech fod system newydd yn cael ei chyflwyno a fydd yn ceisio cynyddu nifer y bobl sy'n cael eu herlyn. A wyddoch, ar hyn o bryd, faint o erlyniadau sydd wedi bod, ac a fydddech yn barod i ystyried sefydlu uned genedlaethol i geisio cynyddu nifer yr erlyniadau? Yr oedd adroddiad y Pwyllgor Archwilio hefyd yn nodi nad oedd pobl sy'n gweithio ar eu pen eu hunain yn cael eu monitro. A allwch ddweud wrthym a oes unrhyw gynnydd wedi bod ar hynny?

Edwina Hart: Disgwylir imi roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf yn ffurfiol i'r Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus erbyn diwedd mis Rhagfyr am yr holl bwyntiau y mae'r Pwyllgor Archwilio, fel yr arferai gael ei alw, wedi'u codi gyda mi. Mae system ddigwyddiadau ac adrodd Datix bellach ar waith trwy'r GIG yng Nghymru. Mae'r GIG wedi bod yn gweithredu'r system honno ac wedi bod yn gwneud y galwadau cofnodi digwyddiadau er 1 Hydref 2009. Fel rhan o'r hyn yr ydym wedi'i wneud i ymateb i argymhellion y pwyllgor, yr ydym wedi sicrhau bod adrannau iechyd galwedigaethol yn gweld staff cyn pen tridiau ar ôl ymosodiad, sy'n welliant. Cytunwyd hefyd y bydd gan bob bwrdd iechyd lleol swydd benodol ar gyfer rheolwr achosion, a ddylai wella'r broses casglu gwybodaeth. Mae Ystadau Iechyd Cymru'n datblygu canllawiau ar gyfer byrddau iechyd lleol, sy'n ystyried dylunio diogel, sut mae'n ymwneud â thrais yn erbyn staff, a sut y gallwn wneud yn well o ran dylunio. Yr ydym yn edrych hefyd ar fodel 'Pasbort Hyfforddiant a Chynllun Gwybodaeth Cymru Gyfan ar Drais ac Ymddygiad Ymosodol'. Mae hynny'n cael ei ddatblygu ar hyn o bryd—dylem fod yn lansio'r cynllun a dylai fod ar waith erbyn mis Ebrill 2010. Felly, mae gwaith yn cael ei wneud ar rai o'r materion a godwyd yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor Archwilio, a byddaf yn sicrhau bod yr Aelodau'n cael y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am hynny cyn y terfynau amser y cytunwyd arnynt. Mae hwn yn fater eithriadol o ddifrifol, ac oni fydd pobl yn siarad â staff, ni fyddant yn sylweddoli'r

happens across the piece. The way in which some people speak to primary care staff and their attitude when they come in is totally unacceptable: it is verbal use. That can drag down staff morale and can cause staff enormous health problems in the long term. It is an issue on which I would be pleased to report back and to provide a full statement on in the new year.

pwysau enfawr y mae'n ei roi ar staff y GIG. Tueddwn i feddwl ei fod yn digwydd mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys ac i staff y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, ond mae'n digwydd ym mhobman. Mae agwedd rhai pobl wrth ddod i'r ysbyty a'r ffordd y maent yn siarad â staff gofal sylfaenol yn hollol annerbyniol: mae'n gyfystyr â thrais geiriol. Gall hynny ddigalonni staff ac achosi problemau iechyd difrifol iddynt yn y tymor hir. Mae'n fater y byddwn yn falch adrodd yn ôl arno a darparu datganiad llawn ichi yn y flwyddyn newydd.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you for those answers to the questions, Minister.

Y Llywydd: Diolch am eich atebion i'r cwestiynau, Weinidog.

Cwestiynau i'r Dirprwy Prif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog Dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth

Questions to the Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport

Employment

Q1 William Graham: Will the Minister make a statement on the employment opportunities for young people in South Wales East? OAQ(3)1253(ECT)

The Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Young people have an important role to play in the Welsh economy, and our policies, such as the youth enterprise and entrepreneurship strategy and the young person's guarantee, are providing opportunities to enable them to fulfil that role.

William Graham: Thank you for that answer, Minister. You will have no doubt seen the recent report by Reed in Partnership UK on the impact of the recession on 18 to 24-year-olds. The report highlighted that young people in Wales were the most willing to undertake a paid internship, at 87 per cent against a national average of 75 per cent. Bearing in mind the strong work ethic and adaptability of young people in Wales, how is the Welsh Government liaising with local employers in south-east Wales to examine ways of improving and providing more paid and unpaid internships for young people to gain career experience at a time when many

Cyflogaeth

C1 William Graham: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y cyfleoedd cyflogaeth ar gyfer pobl ifanc yn Nwyrain De Cymru? OAQ(3)1253(ECT)

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Mae gan bobl ifanc rôl bwysig yn economi Cymru. Mae ein polisiau, fel y strategaeth menter ac entrepreneuriaeth ieuencid a'r gwarant i bobl ifanc, yn darparu cyfleoedd i'w galluogi i wireddu'r rôl honno.

William Graham: Diolch ichi am eich ateb, Weinidog. Mae'n siŵr eich bod wedi gweld yr adroddiad yn ddiweddar gan Reed in Partnership UK ar effaith y dirwasgiad ar bobl ifanc 18 i 24 oed. Yr oedd yr adroddiad yn tynnu sylw at y ffaith mai pobl ifanc Cymru oedd fwyaf parod i ymgymryd â chyfleoedd profiad gwaith am dâl, gyda chanran o 87 y cant, o'i chymharu â chyfartaledd cenedlaethol y DU o 75 y cant. O gofio etheg waith gref pobl ifanc Cymru a'u gallu i addasu, sut mae Llywodraeth Cymru'n cysylltu â chyflogwyr lleol yn y de-ddwyrain i archwilio ffyrdd i wella a darparu mwy o gyfleoedd profiad gwaith am dâl a di-

companies are reducing their numbers of staff?

The Deputy First Minister: I think that we share a concern about the impact of the recession on that particular age group. We recognise that it is has hit that age group particularly hard, which is why we have initiatives, as I mentioned, such as the youth enterprise and entrepreneurship strategy and the young person's guarantee, which is linked with the Future Jobs fund and which will give young people an opportunity to work in the workplace. I am prepared to take away your suggestion and look at it, and perhaps I could write to you with a formal response in due course.

Jeff Cuthbert: Minister, in today's meeting of the Enterprise and Learning Committee we talked about the manufacturing strategy. I made particular reference to the report from Engineering UK that stated that there will be a need for about 600,000 engineers over the next seven years in the UK. Wales will need a big proportion of that figure because of the strength of its manufacturing base. Although learning is not directly your responsibility, do you agree that there must be greater collaboration between employers and the education sector to ensure that engineering needs are addressed, and that engineering as a career is seen as attractive by young people?

The Deputy First Minister: I very much agree with that approach, Jeff. A key way in which we can drag Wales out of the recession is to have much closer links between business and the higher education sector, in particular, and between further education colleges and employers. That will be a key link as we come out of the recession, and that is why we have also made it clear in our research and development priority that opportunities for engineers will be crucial as we build the economy and put it in a much stronger and more resilient position.

Mohammad Asghar: As ever, Deputy First Minister, I congratulate you on the work that you are doing to help communities to weather the current recession, and also on the steps

dâl er mwyn i bobl ifanc ennill profiad gyrfa ar adeg pan fo nifer o gwmnïau'n lleihau niferoedd eu staff?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Credaf ein bod ni i gyd yn poeni am effaith y dirwasgiad ar y grŵp oed penodol hwnnw. Yr ydym yn cydnabod bod y dirwasgiad wedi effeithio'n fawr iawn ar y grŵp oed hwnnw'n enwedig, a dyna pam y mae gennym fentrau, fel y soniais, megis y strategaeth menter ac entrepreneuriaeth ieuenticid a'r gwarant i bobl ifanc, sydd wedi'i chysylltu â chronfa Swyddi'r Dyfodol a fydd yn rhoi cyfle i bobl ifanc weithio yn y gweithle. Yr wyf yn barod i ystyried eich awgrym, ac efallai y gallwn ysgrifennu atoch gydag ymateb ffurfiol yn y man.

Jeff Cuthbert: Weinidog, yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu heddiw, buom yn siarad am y strategaeth gweithgynhyrchu. Cyfeiriais yn benodol at yr adroddiad gan Engineering UK a ddywedai y bydd angen tua 600,000 o beirianwyr yn y DU yn ystod y saith mlynedd nesaf. Bydd angen cyfran fawr o'r ffigur hwnnw ar Gymru oherwydd cryfder ei sylfaen gweithgynhyrchu. Er nad yw dysgu'n un o'ch cyfrifoldebau uniongyrchol chi, a gytunwch fod angen mwy o gydweithredu rhwng cyflogwyr a'r sector addysg i sicrhau bod anghenion peirianeg yn cael sylw, a bod peirianeg yn cael ei hystyried yn yrfa ddeniadol gan bobl ifanc?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn cytuno'n gryf â'r dull hwnnw o weithredu, Jeff. Un ffordd hollbwysig inni allu tynnu Cymru o'r dirwasgiad yw sicrhau cysylltiadau nes o lawer rhwng busnesau a'r sector addysg uwch, yn arbennig, a rhwng colegau addysg bellach a chyflogwyr. Bydd hwnnw'n gyswllt allweddol wrth inni ddod allan o'r dirwasgiad, a dyna pam yr ydym wedi nodi'n glir yn ein blaenoriaeth ymchwil a datblygu y bydd cyfleoedd i beirianwyr yn hanfodol wrth inni ddatblygu'r economi a sicrhau ei bod mewn sefyllfa lawer cryfach a chadarnach.

Mohammad Asghar: Fel bob amser, Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog, hoffwn eich llongyfarch am y gwaith yr ydych yn ei wneud i helpu cymunedau i ddod drwy'r

that you have taken to build a firm foundation for future prosperity. The limitations of the Assembly's powers are well-documented, but will you consider exploring the possibility of providing grants towards national insurance contributions to companies in Wales that employ people aged between 18 and 25? That could act as a real incentive for businesses in Wales to take on young workers and could go some way towards addressing youth unemployment in Wales.

The Deputy First Minister: It is accepted that youth unemployment is a major issue, and it is a concern across the political spectrum in Wales. It is an issue for us in relation to businesses, as well as in relation to the FE sector and the HE sector. I recently announced the economic renewal programme, and some of the ideas that we are hearing across Wales will be fed into that. The idea that you have suggested will also feed into that work. Then we will see how we think some of those good ideas can be fed into the new policy instruments that we believe will be useful for Wales when we come out of the recession.

2.10 p.m.

Current Economic Conditions

Q2 Lorraine Barrett: Will the Minister make a statement on any recent discussions he has held with the UK Government to respond to current economic conditions? OAQ(3)1302(ECT)

The Deputy First Minister: The most recent discussions that I have had about the economy with the UK Government and other members were at the British-Irish Council meeting in Jersey on 13 November. The Secretary of State for Wales also attends the economic summits, the ninth of which is taking place in Aberystwyth tomorrow.

Lorraine Barrett: Thank you for that response. You may be aware that, last week, we launched the cross-party group on co-

dirwasgiad presennol, a hefyd am y camau yr ydych wedi'u cymryd i greu sylfaen gadarn ar gyfer ffyniant yn y dyfodol. Rhoddwyd llawer o sylw i'r cyfyngiadau ar bwerau'r Cynulliad, ond a wnewch chi ystyried archwilio posibilrwydd darparu grantiau tuag at gyfraniadau yswiriant gwladol i gwmnïau yng Nghymru sy'n cyflogi pobl ifanc rhwng 18 a 25 oed? Gallai hynny fod yn gymhelliant gwirioneddol i fusnesau yng Nghymru gyflogi gweithwyr ifanc, a gallai fod o gymorth i fynd i'r afael â diweithdra ymhlith pobl ifanc yng Nghymru.

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Derbynnir bod diweithdra ymhlith pobl ifanc yn broblem fawr, ac y mae'n peri pryder ar draws y sbectwm gwleidyddol yng Nghymru. Mae'n broblem i ni o ran busnesau yn ogystal â'r sector addysg bellach a'r sector addysg uwch. Yn ddiweddar, cyflwynais raglen adnewyddu'r economi, a bydd rhai o'r syniadau a glywsom ledled Cymru yn ychwanegu at y rhaglen honno. Bydd y syniad a awgrymwyd gennych hefyd yn cyfrannu at y gwaith hwnnw. Yna byddwn yn ystyried sut y gellir cynnwys rhai o'r syniadau da hynny yn yr offerynnau polisi newydd a fydd, yn ein barn ni, yn ddefnyddiol i Gymru pan ddown allan o'r dirwasgiad.

Amodau Economaidd Presennol

C2 Lorraine Barrett: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am unrhyw drafodaethau y mae wedi'u cynnal yn ddiweddar gyda Llywodraeth y DU er mwyn ymateb i'r amodau economaidd presennol? OAQ(3)1302(ECT)

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Y trafodaethau diweddaraf imi eu cael am yr economi gyda Llywodraeth y DU, ac aelodau eraill, oedd y rheini yng nghyfarfod y Cyngor Prydeinig-Wyddelig yn Jersey ar 13 Tachwedd. Mae Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru hefyd yn mynd i'r uwchgynadleddau economaidd, a chynhelir y nawfed o'r rhain yn Aberystwyth yfory.

Lorraine Barrett: Diolch ichi am eich ateb. Efallai eich bod yn ymwybodol ein bod wedi lansio'r grŵp trawsbleidiol ar gwmnïau

operatives and mutual organisations. I wonder whether the chair, David Melding, might send you an invitation to come to speak to that group. With that in mind, can you say something about any discussions that you have had with the UK Government on co-operative models for businesses and companies that are having to cope with the current economic climate?

The Deputy First Minister: I would be happy to accept an invitation from the chair of that group. The cross-party working that is clearly demonstrated among some Members will go a long way towards addressing issues that are fundamental to improving the performance of the Welsh economy. You made an extremely valuable point about the need to look at new models in order to strengthen the Welsh economy, such as the use of co-operatives or social enterprises. They can address some of the fundamental problems that some people face in accessing the workplace, particularly people with disabilities. Both those models offer excellent prospects in that regard. I would be happy to discuss that with you and the group.

David Melding: The invitation is in the post, Deputy First Minister, I assure you. However, I want to talk about something else that is of great concern at the moment, namely the future of the manufacturing industry and the fact that Wales has a proportionally larger manufacturing base than the rest of Britain does. The UK strategy, which, I know, concentrates mostly on England, but which contains macro elements that cover the whole of the UK, was published in autumn 2008. What contact have you had with the UK Government since then, as it has adapted its strategy, so that the Welsh manufacturing sector has an input into the broader policy?

The Deputy First Minister: I have not had particular discussions with UK Ministers on the manufacturing strategy. The majority of our discussions have been around how we can assist companies with finance across the board and how we can ensure that the introduction of various schemes, such as the enterprise guarantee scheme, are working to benefit Welsh companies. Ideas for inclusion

cydweithredol a sefydliadau cydfuddiannol yr wythnos diwethaf. Tybed a allai'r cadeirydd, David Melding, anfon gwahoddiad ichi ddod i annerch y grŵp hwnnw? Gyda hynny mewn golwg, a allwch ddweud rhywbeth am unrhyw drafodaethau yr ydych wedi'u cael gyda Llywodraeth y DU ar fodelau cydweithredol i fusnesau a chwmnïau sy'n gorfod ymdopi â'r hinsawdd economaidd sydd ohoni?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Byddwn yn falch derbyn gwahoddiad gan gadeirydd y grŵp hwnnw. Bydd y gwaith trawsbleidiol sy'n amlwg ymhlith rhai Aelodau yn cyfrannu'n fawr at y gwaith o fynd i'r afael â materion sy'n hanfodol i wella perfformiad economi Cymru. Gwnaethoch bwynt gwerthfawr iawn fod angen edrych ar fodelau newydd er mwyn cryfhau economi Cymru, megis defnyddio cwmnïau cydweithredol neu fentrau cymdeithasol. Gallant fynd i'r afael â rhai o'r problemau sylfaenol sy'n wynebu rhai pobl o ran cael mynediad i'r gweithle, yn arbennig pobl ag anabledau. Mae'r ddau fodel hyn yn cynnig rhagolygon gwych o ran hynny. Byddwn yn fodlon trafod hynny gyda chi a'r grŵp.

David Melding: Mae'r gwahoddiad yn y post, Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog, gallaf eich sicrhau. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn drafod rhywbeth arall sy'n peri pryder mawr ar hyn o bryd, sef dyfodol y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu a'r ffaith fod gan Gymru, o ystyried ei maint, sylfaen weithgynhyrchu fwy na gweddill Prydain. Cyhoeddwyd strategaeth y DU, sydd, mi wn, yn canolbwyntio ar Loegr yn bennaf, ond sy'n cynnwys elfennau macro sy'n cynnwys y DU i gyd, yn ystod hydref 2008. Pa gyswllt yr ydych wedi'i gael â Llywodraeth y DU ers hynny, wrth iddi addasu ei strategaeth, i sicrhau bod sector gweithgynhyrchu Cymru'n cael cyfrannu at y polisi ehangach?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Nid wyf wedi cael trafodaethau penodol gyda Gweinidogion y DU ar y strategaeth gweithgynhyrchu. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o'n trafodaethau wedi canolbwyntio ar y ffordd y gallwn roi cymorth ariannol i gwmnïau'n gyffredinol a sicrhau bod cyflwyno cynlluniau amrywiol, megis y cynllun gwarant menter, yn gweithio er budd

in the manufacturing strategy that is currently being drawn up in Wales will be drawn from a variety of sources, including the UK strategy.

David Melding: I agree that both finance and credit guarantees are hugely significant and largely driven at the UK level, so I am glad that we have had some input there. However, why was the Welsh manufacturing strategy not published in tandem with the UK strategy, as, I think, was the original intention? Indeed, the Enterprise and Learning Committee was told by your officials this morning that the Welsh strategy was fit for purpose in autumn 2008, but that you made a decision not to proceed with it and publish it then. Why have you taken such a different approach from that of the UK Government?

The Deputy First Minister: As I made clear when a number of questions were put to me on this, it was essential that the Welsh Assembly Government put all available resources into dealing with the recession. We did that successfully through the introduction of a number of schemes, on which we worked with both sides of industry in the economic summits. Many of the ideas that we have pursued have come out of the economic summits. When it was clear that we had all the things that we thought were necessary to deal with the recession in place, we turned our attention to the manufacturing strategy, and we are now in the process of finalising that with the sector.

David Lloyd: Pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi eu cynnal gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol, Peter Hain, wedi ymateb tila'r Trysorlys i adroddiad Holtham, a gadarnhaodd dangyllido enbyd ar gyfer Cymru, fel y gwyddoch? Addawodd Peter Hain yr wythnos diwethaf y byddai Nerys Evans yn hapus â'i ymateb i adroddiad Holtham. Fodd bynnag, nid yw Nerys na neb arall yn hapus. Pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi'u cynnal i geisio gwneud rhywbeth am y sefyllfa enbyd hon?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Mae'r **The Deputy First Minister:** Those

cwmnïau yng Nghymru. Bydd syniadau i'w cynnwys yn y strategaeth gweithgynhyrchu, sy'n cael ei llunio yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd, yn dod o amrywiol ffynonellau, gan gynnwys strategaeth y DU.

David Melding: Cytunaf fod y gwarant cyllid a'r gwarant credyd yn arwyddocaol iawn a'u bod yn gweithredu'n bennaf ar lefel y DU, felly, yr wyf yn falch ein bod wedi cyfrannu rywfaint at y rheini. Fodd bynnag, pam na chafodd strategaeth gweithgynhyrchu Cymru ei chyhoeddi yr un pryd â strategaeth y DU fel y bwriadwyd yn wreiddiol, mi gredaf? Yn wir, dywedodd eich swyddogion wrth y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu y bore yma fod strategaeth Cymru'n addas at y diben yn hydref 2008, ond eich bod wedi penderfynu peidio â symud ymlaen a'i chyhoeddi bryd hynny. Pam yr ydych wedi mabwysiadu dull gweithredu mor wahanol i ddull Llywodraeth y DU?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Fel yr eglurais pan gyfeiriwyd nifer o gwestiynau ataf ar y mater hwn, yr oedd yn hanfodol i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ddefnyddio'r holl adnoddau a oedd ar gael i fynd i'r afael â'r dirwasgiad. Gwnaethom hynny'n llwyddiannus drwy gyflwyno nifer o gynlluniau y buom yn gweithio arnynt gyda'r ddwy ochr mewn diwydiant yn yr uwchgynadleddau economaidd. Mae nifer o'r syniadau yr ydym wedi bod yn eu datblygu wedi deillio o'r uwchgynadleddau economaidd. Pan oedd yn glir ein bod wedi rhoi ar waith yr holl bethau angenrheidiol i ymdrin â'r dirwasgiad, troesom ein sylw at y strategaeth gweithgynhyrchu, ac yr ydym yn awr wrthi'n cwblhau honno gyda'r sector.

David Lloyd: What discussions have you had with the Secretary of State, Peter Hain, following the Treasury's weak response to the Holtham report, which confirmed that Wales is seriously underfunded, as you know? Peter Hain promised last week that Nerys Evans would be happy with his response to the Holtham report. However, neither Nerys nor anyone else is happy with it. What discussions have you had to try to do something about this dire situation?

trafodaethau hynny wedi cael eu cynnal yn benodol gyda'r Prif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid a Chyflenwi Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus. Fodd bynnag, mae'r mater hefyd yn rhan o drafodaethau'r Cabinet. O leiaf mae'r Trysorlys wedi cydnabod bod problem, ond yr hyn yr ydym am ei wneud yn awr yw sicrhau bod ateb i'r broblem honno. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol y bydd trafodaethau pellach yn digwydd er mwyn sicrhau bod y Trysorlys yn sylweddoli pwysigrwydd cael setliad teg i Gymru. Fel yr awgrymodd Holtham, ar hyn o bryd yr ydym yn cael ein tangyllido gan o leiaf 2 y cant, a fyddai, hyd yn oed ar y lefel bresennol, yn ychwanegu £300 miliwn at gyllid y Llywodraeth. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth y dylem ei drafod ymhellach gyda'r Trysorlys.

Jenny Randerson: Another problem for us is the toll to cross the Severn bridge because it is perceived that it costs money to enter Wales. The Freight Transport Association has warned that jobs are drifting across the bridge into England. The UK Government recently decided that it would freeze the tolls on the Humber bridge until 2011, and the UK Minister of State for Transport said that the Government

'is committed to doing everything it can to protect communities and businesses from economic downturn'.

What discussions have you had with the UK Government about a similar process for the tolls on the Severn bridge?

The Deputy First Minister: The responsibility for setting and raising the tolls rests with the the UK Government; they are not devolved matters. There have been a number of discussions with the Department for Transport in relation to the Severn bridge, most recently on making it easier for people to pay the tolls, and I am sure that there will be an announcement about that fairly soon.

Jenny Randerson: I am well aware that it is not a devolved issue; that is why my question was on the discussions that you may have had with the UK Government. I accept that you do not have direct control, but you have

discussions have been held specifically with the First Minister and the Minister for Finance and Public Service Delivery. However, the matter is also being discussed in Cabinet. At least the Treasury has acknowledged that there is a problem, but what we want to do now is ensure that there is a solution to that problem. I am aware that further discussions will take place in order to ensure that the Treasury realises the importance of a fair settlement for Wales. As Holtham suggested, we are currently being underfunded by at least 2 per cent, which would, even at the current level, add £300 million to the Government's budget. That is something that we should discuss further with the Treasury.

Jenny Randerson: Problem arall sydd gennym yw'r doll i groesi pont Hafren, oherwydd mae'n gwneud i bobl deimlo'i bod yn costio arian i ddod i mewn i Gymru. Mae'r Sefydliad Trafnidiaeth Cludo Nwyddau wedi ein rhybuddio bod swyddi'n symud dros y bont i Loegr yn araf. Penderfynodd Llywodraeth y DU yn ddiweddar y byddai'n rhewi'r tollau ar bont Humber tan 2011, a dywedodd Gweinidog Gwladol y DU dros Drafnidiaeth fod y Llywodraeth

wedi ymrwymo i wneud popeth yn ei gallu i ddiogelu cymunedau a busnesau rhag dirywiad economaidd.

Pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi'u cael gyda Llywodraeth y DU am broses debyg ar gyfer y tollau ar bont Hafren?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Llywodraeth y DU sy'n gyfrifol am bennu a chodi tollau; nid ydynt yn faterion sydd wedi'u datganoli. Cafwyd nifer o drafodaethau gyda'r Adran Drafnidiaeth am bont Hafren. Yr oedd y trafodaethau diweddaraf yn canolbwyntio ar ei gwneud yn haws i bobl dalu'r tollau, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd cyhoeddiad cyn hir ar hynny.

Jenny Randerson: Gwn yn iawn nad yw'n fater sydd wedi'i ddatganoli; dyna pam y gofynnais pa drafodaethau y gallech fod wedi'u cael gyda Llywodraeth y DU. Yr wyf yn derbyn nad oes gennych reolaeth

considerable influence and the power to persuade. In discussing this, have you compared the situation of the Humber bridge with that of the Severn bridge, which is, after all, proportionately more expensive than the Humber bridge to cross? Have you given any consideration to a different structure for vehicles in terms of the toll, namely to have a lower charge for greener vehicles?

Y Dirprwy Prif Weinidog: These, again, are matters on which I cannot make any decisions, because they are matters for the UK Government. However, I am happy to raise issues in relation to climate change proposals, which was one of your points, and I will consider that carefully with my officials to see whether we can make that kind of recommendation, or, at least, that kind of lobbying with the Department for Transport.

Draft Budget

Q3 Peter Black: Will the Minister make a statement on the effect of the draft budget on his priorities? OAQ(3)1295(ECT)

The Deputy First Minister: The allocation of funds to my department in the draft budget enables me to deliver my priorities. I have recently commissioned an economic renewal programme, which will inform future budget alignment.

Peter Black: Thank you for that answer, Minister. It is not just your own budget that has an impact on your priorities, but also the budgets of other departments, in particular the impact on skills and on the developing of a workforce fit for the future to bring Wales out of the recession. What discussions have you had with other Ministers about the 5 per cent cut in higher and further education budgets, which is hampering that agenda?

The Deputy First Minister: That is not strictly a matter for me; that is a question for the Minister for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills. However, I can tell you that the learner provision budget line for funding further education and for sixth forms has been increased this year, and two

uniongyrchol dros hyn, ond y mae gennych gryn ddyllanwad sylweddol a'r pŵer i ddarbwyllo. Wrth drafod hyn, a ydych wedi cymharu sefyllfa pont Humber â sefyllfa pont Hafren sydd, wedi'r cyfan, yn ddrutach i'w chroesi na phont Humber ar gyfartaledd? A ydych wedi ystyried strwythur gwahanol ar gyfer cerbydau o ran y doll, megis codi tâl is ar gyfer cerbydau mwy gwyrdd?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Mae'r rhain, unwaith eto, yn faterion na allaf wneud dim penderfyniadau yn eu cylch, gan eu bod yn faterion i Lywodraeth y DU. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf fodlon codi materion yn ymwneud â chynigion newid yn yr hinsawdd, a oedd yn un o'ch pwyntiau, a byddaf yn ystyried hynny'n ofalus gyda'm swyddogion i weld a allwn wneud y math hwnnw o argymhelliad, neu o leiaf geisio dylanwadu ar yr Adran Drafnidiaeth fel hynny.

Cyllideb Ddrafft

C3 Peter Black: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am effaith y gyllideb ddrafft ar ei flaenoriaethau? OAQ(3)1295(ECT)

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Mae'r arian a ddyrannwyd i'm hadran yn y gyllideb ddrafft yn fy ngalluogi i gyflawni fy mlaenoriaethau. Yr wyf wedi comisiynu rhaglen yn ddiweddar i adnewyddu'r economi, a bydd yn ychwanegu at alinio'r gyllideb yn y dyfodol.

Peter Black: Diolch ichi am eich ateb, Weinidog. Nid eich cyllideb chi'n unig sy'n cael effaith ar eich blaenoriaethau, ond cyllidebau adrannau eraill hefyd, yn enwedig yr effaith ar sgiliau ac ar ddatblygu gweithlu sy'n addas i'r dyfodol er mwyn dod â Chymru allan o'r dirwasgiad. Pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi'u cael gyda Gweinidogion eraill am y toriad o 5 y cant yng nghyllidebau addysg uwch ac addysg bellach, sy'n llesteirio'r agenda honno?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Nid mater i mi yw hynny mewn gwirionedd; mae'n gwestiwn i'r Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau. Fodd bynnag, gallaf ddweud wrthy'ch fod llinell wariant y ddarpariaeth dysgwyr ar gyfer ariannu addysg bellach a dosbarthiadau chwech wedi

new budget lines, worth some £20 million, have been opened, which will fund additional training and employability support during the economic downturn. The Minister has also increased the budget for Reaching Higher from £22.82 million to £28.814 million, which shows that this Government is fully committed to ensuring that sufficient resources are available for the HE and training sectors.

2.20 p.m.

Chris Franks: In view of the tight financial settlement imposed by Westminster, can you confirm that you have the tools within our confined powers to tackle the impact of the recession? I am particularly concerned about the future of Bosch, and the proposal by Gordon Brown's Government to part-privatise the Royal Mint at Llantrisant. You briefly touched on this, but had the findings of the Holtham Commission been enacted, we would now have more funds to protect our economy. As it is, Wales is being short-changed. Do you agree?

The Deputy First Minister: I have answered the question relating to Holtham in response to Dai Lloyd, so I will not repeat that. I am satisfied that, even within the constraints of a tight budget round, I have sufficient resources to carry out the priorities that I have set. The proportion per head spent in Wales on economic development is higher than Scotland and Northern Ireland, and higher than comparable regions in England. Economic development gets a good deal from this Government, and in addition to the resources at my disposal through the department I have allocated strategic capital investment fund money and European aid money to add another £80 million to my budget.

Alun Cairns: If the Minister has all the money that he needs to deliver prosperity in Wales, why are we the poorest part of the United Kingdom? There is no prospect in that.

Manufacturing is a key element in developing prosperity, and the meeting of the Enterprise and Learning Committee this

cynyddu eleni, ac y mae dwy linell wariant newydd wedi'u hagor, gwerth tuag £20 miliwn, a fydd yn ariannu hyfforddiant ychwanegol a chymorth i wneud pobl yn fwy cyflogadwy yn ystod y dirywiad economaidd. Mae'r Gweinidog hefyd wedi cynyddu'r gyllideb ar gyfer Ymgeisio yn Uwch o £22.82 miliwn i £28.814 miliwn, sy'n dangos bod y Llywodraeth hon wedi ymrwymo'n llwyr i sicrhau bod adnoddau digonol ar gael ar gyfer y sectorau AU a hyfforddiant.

Chris Franks: O ystyried y setliad ariannol tynn a bennwyd gan San Steffan, a allwch gadarnhau bod gennych yr arfau o fewn ein pwerau cyfyngedig i fynd i'r afael ag effaith y dirwasgiad? Yr wyf yn poeni'n arbennig am ddyfodol Bosch, a'r cynnig gan Lywodraeth Gordon Brown i rannol breifateiddio'r Bathdy Brenhinol yn Llantrisant. Soniwyd gennych am hyn yn fyr, ond pe bai darganfyddiadau Comisiwn Holtham wedi'u gweithredu, byddai gennym fwy o arian yn awr i ddiogelu ein heconomi. Fel y mae, mae Cymru ar ei cholled. A ydych yn cytuno?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Yr wyf wedi ateb y cwestiwn ar Holtham mewn ymateb i Dai Lloyd, felly, nid wyf am ailadrodd hynny. Hyd yn oed o fewn cyfyngiadau cyllideb dynn, yr wyf yn fodlon fod gennyf adnoddau digonol i gyflawni'r blaenoriaethau yr wyf wedi'u pennu. Mae'r gyfran y pen sy'n cael ei gwario ar ddatblygu economaidd yng Nghymru yn uwch na'r gyfran yn yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon ac yn uwch na rhanbarthau tebyg yn Lloegr. Mae datblygu economaidd yn cael pob chwarae teg gan y Llywodraeth hon, ac yn ogystal â'r adnoddau sydd ar gael imi drwy'r adran, yr wyf wedi dyrannu arian o'r gronfa buddsoddi cyfalaf strategol ac arian cymorth Ewropeaidd i ychwanegu £80 miliwn arall at fy nghyllideb.

Alun Cairns: Os oes gan y Gweinidog yr holl arian sydd ei angen arno i sicrhau ffyniant yng Nghymru, pam mai ni yw'r rhan dlotaf yn y Deyrnas Unedig? Nid oes dim gobaith yn hynny.

Mae gweithgynhyrchu'n elfen hollbwysig o ddatblygu ffyniant, a dangosodd cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu y bore yma fod

morning showed that there is some confusion over the reason for the delay with the manufacturing strategy. If it was ready to go last year, but the recession has now impacted upon it, is it not the case that the strategy should get us through the recession, and a good strategy would be capable of coping with a downturn—even a downturn of this degree? The real reason for the delay is either that you are dithering in developing a policy, or you do not have the money to deliver it. When it is published in March, will the money be available to deliver the strategy that our manufacturing sector needs and demands?

The Deputy First Minister: I am not sure that I could deliver that if there were a Conservative victory at the next general election. With all the cuts proposed by Mr Osborne, I would probably not be able to deliver the strategy in the way that I wanted. Once again Mr Cairns is talking Wales down. He wants us to remain poor because it suits his rhetoric. Why do we not work together, Alun Cairns, to improve the economic performance of Wales? Why do you not adopt the same approach as that of his colleagues who want to work with us, instead of always looking to complain?

A470

Q4 Kirsty Williams: Will the Minister make a statement on roadworks on the A470? OAQ(3)1285(ECT)

The Deputy First Minister: There are ongoing roadworks at various locations on the A470. In addition, routine maintenance and resurfacing works will continue as necessary to maintain the integrity and improve the safety of the road.

Kirsty Williams: I am sure that you are aware that, over a year ago, a lorry came off the A470 on the stretch between Rhayader and Llangurig near the Bryn Titli wind farm, and as a result of that accident, the A470 has been reduced to a single lane ever since. Work had been due to start in March, but because of delays with the Welsh Assembly Government approving the geotechnical certificate, it has not yet begun. I understand

ychedig ddryswch ynglŷn â'r rheswm dros yr oedi gyda'r strategaeth gweithgynhyrchu. Os oedd yn barod i'w chyhoeddi y llynedd, ond bod y dirwasgiad wedi effeithio arni erbyn hyn, oni ddylai'r strategaeth allu ein tywys drwy'r dirwasgiad, ac oni fyddai strategaeth dda yn gallu ymdopi â dirywiad—hyd yn oed dirywiad o'r maint hwn? Y gwir reswm dros yr oedi yw eich bod naill ai'n petruso wrth ddatblygu polisi, neu nad oes gennych yr arian i roi'r polisi ar waith. Pan gaiff y strategaeth ei chyhoeddi ym mis Mawrth, a fydd yr arian ar gael i wireddu'r strategaeth y mae ar ein sector gweithgynhyrchu ei hangen ac yn galw amdani?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn siŵr a fyddai'n bosibl imi ei gwireddu pe bai'r Ceidwadwyr yn ennill yr etholiad cyffredinol nesaf. Gyda'r holl doriadau a arfaethir gan Mr Osborne, mae'n annhebygol y gallwn wireddu'r strategaeth fel yr hoffwn ei wneud. Unwaith eto, mae Mr Cairns yn lladd ar Gymru. Mae am inni barhau'n dlawd am fod hynny'n cyd-fynd â'i rethreg. Pam na allwn gydweithio, Alun Cairns, i wella perfformiad economaidd Cymru? Pam na wnewch chi fabwysiadu'r un dull gweithredu â'ch cydweithwyr sy'n awyddus i weithio gyda ni, yn hytrach na cheisio cwyno drwy'r amser?

A470

C4 Kirsty Williams: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y gwaith ffordd ar yr A470? OAQ(3)1285(ECT)

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Mae gwaith ffordd parhaus yn cael ei wneud mewn amrywiol fannau ar yr A470. Yn ogystal, bydd gwaith cynnal a chadw rheolaidd a gwaith i roi arwyneb newydd ar y ffordd yn parhau yn ôl yr angen i gynnal dilysrwydd y ffordd a gwella diogelwch.

Kirsty Williams: Gwyddoch, mae'n sicr, fod lori wedi dod oddi ar yr A470 dros flwyddyn yn ôl, ar y darn o'r ffordd rhwng Rhaeadr a Llangurig ger fferm wynt Bryn Titli, ac o ganlyniad i'r ddamwain honno mae'r A470 wedi'i chyfyngu i un lôn byth er hynny. Yr oedd disgwyl i'r gwaith ddechrau ym mis Mawrth, ond oherwydd oedi o du Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wrth gymeradwyo'r dystysgrif geodechnegol, nid yw'r gwaith

that the finance is in place to carry out the work, and it is just a case of your signing the geotechnical certificate. When will that be done, and when can we anticipate work starting to alleviate the congestion on this part of the A470?

The Deputy First Minister: A report on the options to resolve the current edge support problem has been completed, and we have now identified a preferred option. It involves the construction of a new embankment on the downhill side of the trunk road, and engineering feasibility is being investigated. Once this process has been completed, the land necessary for construction will need to be acquired prior to the work starting. I hope that the work will start as soon as practicable. In the meantime, the traffic signals will remain in place for safety reasons.

Andrew R.T. Davies: One of the things that facilitate movement of traffic along the A470 and its feeder roads is preparedness for adverse weather conditions. Last year, when we had a small snowfall, there were various issues around the stockpiling of salt for roads that feed the A470. I appreciate that this is a local government responsibility, but the A470 and trunk roads are the responsibility of the Welsh Assembly Government. What discussions have your department had to ensure that bad-weather provision is in place and that salt stocks are at a sufficient level so that we will not arrive at the situation that we found ourselves in, in some areas, last year?

The Deputy First Minister: There were lessons to be learnt from what happened last year, particularly the relationship between the requirements on local authorities in respect of county roads and the Government in respect of trunk roads. I cannot recall any problems in relation to the trunk road network during the bad weather last year, but I will want to be satisfied that adequate arrangements are in place this year. I will write to you to confirm the Government's position.

Brynle Williams: Esgusodwch fy mhwsodwch—yr wyf yn meddwl fy mod yn dal yn fyw. [*Chwerthin.*] O ran yr A470, a allwch

wedi dechrau eto. Deallaf fod yr arian ar gael i wneud y gwaith, ac mai'r cyfan y mae ei angen yw ichi lofnodi'r dystysgrif geodechnegol. Pryd y bydd hynny'n cael ei wneud, a phryd y gallwn ddisgwyl i'r gwaith ddechrau i leddfu'r tagfeydd traffig ar y rhan hon o'r A470?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Mae adroddiad wedi'i gwblhau ar y dewisiadau sydd ar gael i ddatrys y broblem bresennol o ran cynnal ymyl y ffordd, ac yr ydym bellach wedi dewis y llwybr sy'n cael ei ffafrio. Mae'n golygu adeiladu arglawdd newydd ar ochr waered y gefnffordd, ac y mae dichonoldeb hynny o safbwynt peirianyddol yn cael ei archwilio. Ar ôl cwblhau'r broses hon, bydd angen prynu'r tir angenrheidiol ar gyfer y gwaith adeiladu cyn i'r gwaith ddechrau. Gobeithio y bydd y gwaith yn dechrau cyn gynted ag y bydd yn ymarferol. Yn y cyfamser, bydd y goleuadau traffig yn parhau i gael eu defnyddio am resymau diogelwch.

Andrew R. T. Davies: Un o'r pethau sy'n hwyluso llif traffig ar hyd yr A470 a'i ffyrdd cyswllt yw bod yn barod ar gyfer tywydd gwael. Y llynedd, pan gawsom ychydig eira, cafwyd amrywiol broblemau yn gysylltiedig â storio halen ar gyfer ffyrdd sy'n cysylltu â'r A470. Derbyniaf mai cyfrifoldeb llywodraeth leol yw hyn, ond Llywodraeth y Cynulliad sy'n gyfrifol am yr A470 a chefnffyrdd. Pa drafodaethau y mae eich adran wedi'u cael i sicrhau bod darpariaeth yn barod ar gyfer tywydd gwael a bod y cyflenwadau halen yn ddigonol i sicrhau na fyddwn yn wynebu'r un sefyllfa ag yr oeddem ynddi mewn rhai ardaloedd y llynedd?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Yr oedd gwersi i'w dysgu o'r hyn a ddigwyddodd y llynedd, yn enwedig y berthynas rhwng y gofynion ar awdurdodau lleol o ran ffyrdd sirol a'r gofynion ar y Llywodraeth o ran cefnffyrdd. Ni allaf gofio am ddim broblemau gyda'r rhwydwaith cefnffyrdd yn ystod y tywydd gwael y llynedd, ond byddaf yn awyddus i sicrhau bod trefniadau digonol ar waith eleni. Byddaf yn ysgrifennu atoch i gadarnhau safbwynt y Llywodraeth.

Brynle Williams: Excuse my cough—I think I am still alive. [*Laughter.*] Regarding the A470, could you look at what is happening in

edrych ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn y Drenewydd? Mae'r gwaith yn mynd rhagddo ar yr archfarchnad newydd, ond mae wedi achosi helynt am y tri mis diwethaf, o leiaf. Am faint y bydd y sefyllfa hon yn parhau? Yr oedd cwynion mawr yn Ffair Aeaf Frenhinol Cymru ddoe bod pobl wedi bod yn aros am o leiaf awr a hanner yn ceisio gyrru drwy'r Drenewydd. Cefais brofiad tebyg fy hun dair wythnos yn ôl. A allwch edrych i mewn i hyn? Mae'n bwysig ofnadwy gan mai dyma'r brif ffordd i lawr i'r de, fel y gwyddoch.

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Nid yw'r Drenewydd, wrth gwrs, wedi ei lleoli ar yr A470—

Brynle Williams: Mae'n ddigon agos.

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn falch iawn, gyda llaw, eich bod yn dal i fod gyda ni ac yr wyf yn hapus i glywed bod eich iechyd yn dda. Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi bod yn cynnal ymgynghoriad ar ffordd osgoi y Drenewydd. Mae'r gwaith hwnnw yn mynd rhagddo, ac unwaith y cwblheir y gwaith hwnnw, byddaf yn cymryd y camau nesaf. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r problemau sydd yn y Drenewydd. Codwyd y mater ynghylch Tesco gennyh, ac yr wyf yn meddwl bod unrhyw broblemau ynglŷn â hynny wedi eu setlo gyda'r cwmni. Gobeithiaf ymateb ymhellach i'r Cynulliad pan fydd yr ymgynghoriad ar y ffordd osgoi wedi cael ei gwblhau.

Mesur Economi Ddigidol

C5 Nerys Evans: Pa drafodaethau diweddar mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cael am y Mesur Economi Ddigidol? OAQ(3)1294(ECT)

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Mae fy swyddogion wedi bod yn gweithio gyda thîm y Mesur Economi Ddigidol. Mae'r Mesur yn gysylltiedig â'r camau yn adroddiad terfynol 'Prydain Ddigidol' sy'n gofyn am ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol. Mae'n cynnwys amrywiaeth eang o feysydd—gan gynnwys pwerau Ofcom, darlledu, diwygio hawlfraint, sbectrum ac eraill—a'r cyfan yn canolbwyntio ar ddyfodol digidol y DU.

Nerys Evans: Fel y soniasoch, mae nifer o elfennau pwysig yn y Mesur hwn. Hoffwn

Newtown? Work is under way on the new supermarket, but it has been causing difficulties for the last three months at least. How long will this situation continue? There were many complaints at the Royal Welsh Winter Fair yesterday that people had been waiting for at least an hour and a half trying to drive through Newtown. I had a similar experience myself three weeks ago. Could you look in to this? It is very important since this is the main route down to south Wales, as you know.

The Deputy First Minister: Newtown, of course, is not on the A470—

Brynle Williams: It is close enough.

The Deputy First Minister: Incidentally, I am very glad you are still with us, and I am pleased to hear that you are in good health. The Government has been consulting on the Newtown bypass. That work is ongoing, and when it is completed I will take the next steps. I am aware of the problems that exist in Newtown. You raised the issue regarding Tesco, and I think any problems regarding that have been resolved with the company. I hope to provide a further response to the Assembly when the consultation on the bypass has been completed.

Digital Economy Bill

Q5 Nerys Evans: What recent discussions has the Minister had regarding the Digital Economy Bill? OAQ(3)1294(ECT)

The Deputy First Minister: My officials have been working with the Digital Economy Bill team. The Bill relates to the actions in the 'Digital Britain' final report that need primary legislation. It covers a wide range of areas—including Ofcom's powers, broadcasting, copyright reform, spectrum and others—all of which are focused on the UK's digital future.

Nerys Evans: As you mentioned, there are many important elements in this Bill. I should

eich holi ymhellach ynglŷn â'r ymrwymadau sy'n ymwneud â band eang. Mae'r Mesur yn sôn am ymrwymiad i ddarparu gwasanaeth band eang o 2MB i bawb. Diffiniad band eang ar hyn o bryd yw 0.5MB. Gwyddom fod ymestyn band eang i'r mannau gwan ym mhob rhan o Gymru yn flaenoriaeth ichi, ac y bu'n flaenoriaeth o dan y cynllun cymorth band eang arloesol rhanbarthol. Diolchaf ichi ar ran trigolion Bronwydd a Llanpumsaint am eu galluogi i gael gwasanaeth band eang yn y misoedd diwethaf. Mae'r cynllun cymorth band eang arloesol rhanbarthol ar waith, ond mae'r Mesur Economi Ddigidol hwn yn sôn am ddarparu band eang o 2MB ym mhob ardal o'r Deyrnas Unedig. Sut y gellir sicrhau bod y mannau gwan sydd ar ôl yng Nghymru yn cael eu trafod fel rhan o'r Mesur Economi Ddigidol a bod yr ardaloedd hyn yng Nghymru ar flaen y gad wrth i'r datblygiad hwn barhau?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn credu bod yr ymrwymiad yn yr adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd, ond derbynïaf yr hyn a ddywedwch ynghylch sicrhau ein bod yn cael gwasanaeth band eang sy'n addas ar gyfer pobl gyffredin a'r economi leol, sef 2MB. Yr hyn yr ydym yn ceisio ei wneud yw sicrhau, drwy'r cynllun cymorth band eang arloesol rhanbarthol—a gallwn wneud hynny drwy'r cynllun hwn—ein bod yn symud ymlaen i gael y ddarpariaeth honno.

2.30 p.m.

Yr hyn yr wyf eisiau ei wneud yn awr yw trafod y mater gyda swyddogion yr adran, a gweld sut y gallwn ni adeiladu ar yr ymrwymiad yn yr adroddiad i sicrhau nid yn unig fod band eang ar gael yn y *not spots* i gyd, ond bod y safon yn gywir. Gallaf sicrhau bod y nodau hyn yn flaenoriaeth i ni.

Darren Millar: Minister, my constituents in Gwytherin were very happy with the support that the Assembly Government gave in order to allow Openreach to deliver broadband services to their community. However, there are other parts of my constituency that are still without broadband connections, such as Moelfre, near Abergele, and Llanelidan, near Rhuthin. This causes problems for business and affects social exclusion, and the people in these communities are missing out on

like to question you further on your commitments to broadband. The Bill includes a commitment to provide a 2MB broadband service for all. The current definition of broadband is 0.5MB. We know that extending broadband to the not spots in all parts of Wales is a priority for you, and that it has been a priority under the regional innovative broadband support scheme. I thank you on behalf of the residents of Bronwydd and Llanpumsaint for enabling them to receive broadband over the past few months. The RIBS scheme is being implemented, but the Digital Economy Bill mentions the provision of 2MB of broadband in all areas of the UK. How can we ensure that the remaining not spots in Wales are discussed as part of the Digital Economy Bill and that these areas of Wales are in the forefront as this development continues?

The Deputy First Minister: I think the commitment is in the published report, but I accept what you say about ensuring that we have a broadband service that is appropriate for ordinary people and the local economy, namely 2MB. What we are trying to do is to ensure, through the RIBS scheme—and we can do that through this scheme—that we move forward to achieve that provision.

What I want to do now is discuss the matter with officials in my department to see how we can build on the commitment contained within the report to ensure that we not only provide broadband in all the not spots, but ensure that it is to the appropriate standard. I can assure you that that is a priority for us.

Darren Millar: Weinidog, yr oedd fy etholwyr yng Ngwytherin yn fodlon iawn â'r cymorth a gafwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i ganiatau i Openreach ddarparu gwasanaethau band eang i'w cymuned. Fodd bynnag, mae rhannau eraill o'm hetholaeth sy'n dal heb gysylltiadau band eang, megis Moelfre, ger Abergele, a Llanelidan, ger Rhuthun. Mae hyn yn creu problemau i fusnesau ac yn effeithio ar allgáu cymdeithasol, ac y mae'r bobl yn y

opportunities for lifelong learning and entertainment. Can you tell us, in a convincing way, that you are not going to allow your plans to develop broadband to be put on the back burner while you wait for the implementation of any proposals in the 'Digital Britain' report? It is concerning for my constituents, as they feel that there is, perhaps, a stalling of the programme that you have been pushing forward.

The Deputy First Minister: We may well have to look at a range of solutions in order to deliver broadband to many of our not spots, using a variety of technologies. There are a number of ways in which we can do this: we can continue under the RIBS scheme, where more not spots have been identified with BT, or we can also look at whether community-based solutions could be provided in some areas, with assistance from convergence funding. There are a range of options for delivery, and a range of options in terms of technologies. What I want to do now is sit down with my officials, and with some local communities, to see what solution fits them and their needs.

Alun Davies: Thank you, Deputy First Minister, for your answers on the part of this legislation that deals with broadband. I would like to look at another part of this legislation, and that is the support for creative industries. These industries have been at the heart of many of the industrial strategies of successive Welsh Assembly Governments, and they contribute 8 per cent of the total UK gross domestic product. Can you reassure us, and update us, on the renewed emphasis that you intend to place on the creative industries, and will you ensure that the Welsh creative industries are at the forefront of what is possible, to ensure that we have a successful, continuing and sustainable creative-industry base in Wales? Will you also ensure that the Digital Economy Bill works for businesses in Wales by ensuring that we have the creative industries that can not only help lead Wales out of the recession, but put Wales on the international stage?

cymunedau hyn yn colli cyfleoedd dysgu gydol oes ac adloniant. A allwch ddweud wrthym, yn ddiamheuol, na fyddwch yn caniatáu i'ch cynlluniau i ddatblygu band eang gael eu gohirio tra byddwch yn aros i unrhyw gynigion yn yr adroddiad 'Prydain Ddigidol' gael eu gweithredu? Mae hyn yn peri pryder i'm hetholwyr, oherwydd teimlant fod ychydig oedi, efallai, yn y rhaglen yr ydych wedi bod yn ei datblygu.

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Efallai y bydd angen inni edrych ar ystod o atebion er mwyn darparu band eang i nifer o'n hardaloedd digyswllt, gan ddefnyddio amrywiaeth o dechnolegau. Gallwn wneud hynny mewn nifer o ffyrdd: gallwn barhau gwaith dan y cynllun Cymorth Band Eang Arloesol Rhanbarthol, lle mae mwy o ardaloedd digyswllt wedi'u nodi gyda BT, neu gallwn ystyried hefyd a ellid darparu atebion cymunedol mewn rhai ardaloedd, gyda chymorth arian cydgyfeirio. Mae yna ystod o ddewisiadau ar gyfer darparu, ac ystod o ddewisiadau o ran technolegau. Yr hyn yr wyf am ei wneud yn awr yw trafod gyda'm swyddogion, a rhai cymunedau lleol, i weld pa ateb sy'n gweddu iddynt hwy a'u hanghenion.

Alun Davies: Diolch ichi, Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog, am eich atebion ar y rhan o'r ddeddfwriaeth hon sy'n ymwneud â band eang. Hoffwn edrych ar ran arall o'r ddeddfwriaeth hon, sef y cymorth ar gyfer diwydiannau creadigol. Mae'r diwydiannau hyn wedi bod wrth wraidd nifer o'r strategaethau diwydiannol a gafwyd gan y naill Lywodraeth ar ôl y llall yma yn y Cynulliad, ac y maent yn cyfrannu 8 y cant o gyfanswm cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y DU. A allwch roi sicrwydd inni, a rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf inni, am y pwyslais newydd y bwriadwch ei roi ar y diwydiannau creadigol, ac a fyddwch yn sicrhau bod diwydiannau creadigol Cymru'n arwain y ffordd o ran yr hyn sy'n bosibl, er mwyn sicrhau bod gennym sylfaen lwyddiannus, barhaol a chynaliadwy o ddiwydiannu creadigol yng Nghymru? A wnewch chi sicrhau hefyd fod y Mesur Economi Ddigidol yn gweithio i fusnesau Cymru drwy sicrhau bod gennym ddiwydiannau creadigol a fydd nid yn unig yn gallu helpu arwain Cymru allan o'r dirwasgiad, ond yn rhoi Cymru ar y

llwyfan rhyngwladol?

The Deputy First Minister: You will be aware that I am currently reviewing the creative industry sector. I think that it is important for us to do that, in view of the fact that such technological change is happening in this field. That will, of course, inform the way in which we take the sector forward through the economic renewal programme. I can assure you that we do regard the creative industry sector as a key element of our economy. The main responsibility for the Bill in relation to many of these matters lies with my colleague, the Minister for Heritage, and we will work together to deliver this programme.

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Gwyddoch fy mod yn gwneud adolygiad o'r sector diwydiannau creadigol ar hyn o bryd. Credaf ei bod yn bwysig inni wneud hynny, o gofio bod cynifer o newidiadau technolegol yn digwydd yn y maes hwn. Bydd hyn, wrth gwrs, yn llywio'r modd y byddwn yn datblygu'r sector hwn drwy raglen adnewyddu'r economi. Gallaf eich sicrhau ein bod yn ystyried y sector diwydiannau creadigol yn elfen allweddol o'n heconomi. Fy nghyd-Weinidog, y Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth, sy'n bennaf gyfrifol am y Mesur ar lawer o'r materion hyn, a byddwn yn cydweithio i ddarparu'r rhaglen hon.

Safety on Trunk Roads

Diogelwch ar Gefnffyrdd

Q6 Leader of the Opposition (Nick Bourne): Will the Minister outline his policies to improve safety on trunk roads in mid and west Wales? OAQ(3)1306(ECT)

C6 Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Nick Bourne): A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu ei bolisiau i wella diogelwch ar gefnffyrdd yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin? OAQ(3)1306(ECT)

The Deputy First Minister: I am committed to improving safety and reducing casualties on our roads. We are taking forward a range of safety initiatives across both the strategic and local road networks.

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Yr wyf wedi ymrwymo i wella diogelwch a lleihau'r nifer sy'n cael eu hanafu ar ein ffyrdd. Yr ydym yn datblygu ystod o fentrau diogelwch ffyrdd ar draws y rhwydweithiau ffyrdd strategol a lleol.

Nick Bourne: I thank the Deputy First Minister for that response. Some 18 months ago, I wrote to the Deputy First Minister about Mrs Maureen Evans of Tre'r-ddôl, in Ceredigion, whose house was narrowly missed when a vehicle went through her fence. About two weeks ago, it happened again, but this time it was much more serious. I ask the Deputy First Minister what assessment is made in relation to damaged property, bearing in mind that had the vehicle coming off the A4870 been larger, it could have caused serious injury or fatality. There are records of previous accidents on this spot. I understand the assessment that is made in relation to road accidents that involve people using the road, but this is a slightly different situation given that a vehicle came off the road, causing damage to property, and potentially to people living inside a house.

Nick Bourne: Diolch ichi am eich ateb, Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog. Tua 18 mis yn ôl, ysgrifennais at y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ynglŷn â Mrs Maureen Evans o Dre'r-ddôl, yng Ngheredigion. Bu bron i gerbyd fynd i mewn i'w thŷ pan aeth drwy ei ffens. Tua phythefnos yn ôl digwyddodd yr un peth eto, ond y tro hwn yr oedd yn llawer mwy difrifol. Gofynnaf i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog pa asesiad sy'n cael ei wneud mewn cysylltiad ag eiddo sy'n cael ei ddifrodi, gan gofio, pe bai'r cerbyd a ddaeth oddi ar yr A4870 wedi bod yn fwy, y gallai fod wedi achosi anaf difrifol neu wedi lladd rhywun. Mae yna gofnodion o ddamweiniau blaenorol yn y lleoliad hwn. Deallaf yr asesiad a wneir yn achos damweiniau ffordd sy'n effeithio ar bobl sy'n defnyddio'r ffordd, ond mae'r sefyllfa hon ychydig yn wahanol o gofio bod cerbyd wedi dod oddi ar y ffordd, ac wedi achosi difrod i eiddo, ac a allai fod wedi achosi niwed i bobl yn byd mewn tŷ.

The Deputy First Minister: I am not in a position to give you a direct answer about this specific location. I have listened carefully to the points that you raised and I will write to you with details about the situation, responding to your points on the accident. Generally speaking, the safety record of Welsh roads is particularly good. We met almost all of our 2010 targets, and that is a good position to be in, looking forward to the new safety target for 2020, but we will always try to improve on that.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Llongyfarchaf y Gweinidog a'i swyddogion am ymateb mor gyflym i'r angen i flaenoriaethu cyffordd Cwmgwili er mwyn sicrhau na fydd mwy o ddamweiniau angheuol yn digwydd. Cawsom gyfarfod i drafod y cyffordd ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar fod y Gweinidog wedi gweithredu ar hyn.

A wnewch chi ymuno â mi i longyfarch yr ymgyrchwyr lleol a weithiodd mor galed i dynnu sylw at y mater hwn ac a gasglodd 8,000 o enwau ar ddeiseb i'w chyflwyno i'r Pwyllgor Deisebau?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn sicrhau pobl am ddefnyddio'r Pwyllgor Deisebau. Mae'n ffordd i bobl godi materion fel diogelwch ar y ffyrdd sy'n peri pryder iddynt. Yr wyf am ddiolch i Rhodri am godi'r mater hwn gyda fi mewn cyfarfod. Yn dilyn hynny, yr ydym wedi edrych yn ofalus ar yr hyn y gallwn ei wneud i wella'r sefyllfa yng Nghwmgwili. Mae cynllun bellach yn ei le, ac unwaith y caiff y rheoliadau penodol eu cwblhau, yr ydym yn gobeithio gweld y waith yn ei le erbyn hydref 2010.

Transport

Q7 Andrew R.T. Davies: Will the Minister make a statement on his priorities to improve transport infrastructure in Wales? OAQ(3)1250(ECT)

The Deputy First Minister: The national transport plan outlines my priorities to improve transport infrastructure across Wales, including enhancements to the capacity, quality and performance of the

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Nid wyf mewn sefyllfa i roi ateb uniongyrchol ichi am y lleoliad penodol hwn. Yr wyf wedi gwrandao'n astud ar y pwyntiau a godwyd gennych a byddaf yn ysgrifennu atoch i roi manylion y sefyllfa, gan ymateb i'ch pwyntiau am y ddamwain. Ar y cyfan, mae gan Gymru record dda o ran diogelwch ffyrdd. Bu bron inni gyrraedd pob un o'n targedau ar gyfer 2010, ac y mae hynny'n sefyllfa dda i fod ynnddi, o edrych ymlaen at y targed diogelwch newydd ar gyfer 2020, ond byddwn bob amser yn ceisio gwella ar hynny.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I congratulate the Minister and his officials on responding so swiftly to the need to prioritise the Cwmgwili junction in order to ensure that no more fatal accidents occur there. We have had a meeting to discuss the issue of the junction and I am pleased that the Minister has taken action on this.

Will you join me in congratulating the local campaigners who have worked tirelessly to draw attention to this issue and collected 8,000 signatures on a petition to be presented to the Petitions Committee?

The Deputy First Minister: I would certainly congratulate people on making use of the Petitions Committee. The committee mechanism allows people to raise issues that give them cause for concern, such as road safety. I wish to thank Rhodri for raising this issue with me at a meeting. Following on from that, we have looked carefully at what we can do to improve the situation at Cwmgwili. A scheme is now in place, and once the appropriate regulations are completed, we hope to see the work completed by the autumn of 2010.

Trafnidiaeth

C7 Andrew R.T. Davies: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ei flaenoriaethau ar gyfer gwella seilwaith trafndiaeth yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)1250(ECT)

Y Dirprwy Prif Weinidog: Mae'r cynllun trafndiaeth cenedlaethol yn amlinellu fy mlaenoriaethau i wella'r seilwaith trafndiaeth ledled Cymru, gan gynnwys gwella capasiti, ansawdd a pherfformiad y

strategic road and rail network, and integrating all modes to make the system work better.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Next year, the Ryder Cup is coming to Wales and, sadly, if you are travelling from North America, you will not be able to access that tournament directly via flights from North America to Cardiff airport. I am led to believe that the airport has been in discussion with you and your department on supporting various routes to enable such an opportunity. Could you inform Plenary today as to the likelihood of a successful outcome to such negotiations, given the sad loss that the airport experienced when it entered into similar negotiations with Emirates two years ago, whose planes were, sadly, relocated to north-east England rather than to south Wales?

The Deputy First Minister: I have had many discussions with the management at Cardiff airport on a range of issues. We have made many issues clear to the airport, but I cannot go into too much detail about those discussions because they are commercially confidential. However, I can assure you that we are working hard with the authorities at Cardiff airport on a number of issues, and I hope that, in the new year, we can make progress on some of those. Some of them will deal with state aid issues that we need to clarify with the European Commission. Early indications are that the commission will look favourably on some of our proposals, but we will have to await formal confirmation of that. Once that confirmation has been given, I am sure that we will be able to move forward.

Gareth Jones: Fel y gwyddoch, mae rheilffordd dyffryn Conwy yn dioddef yn aml oherwydd llifogydd sy'n arwain at gau'r rheilffordd, a hynny am wythnosau weithiau, fel y gwelsom ychydig wythnosau yn ôl. Gwn eich bod yn rhannu fy mhryderon ynghylch yr effaith y mae trafferthion o'r fath yn eu cael ar yr economi ac ar gymunedau lleol. Erbyn hyn, diolch i ymdrechion Network Rail, mae'r rheilffordd wedi ailagor. Fodd bynnag, pa gynlluniau sydd gan Network Rail, mewn partneriaeth â

rhwydwaith ffyrdd a'r rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd strategol, ac integreiddio pob dull cludiant i wneud i'r system weithio'n well.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Y flwyddyn nesaf bydd cystadleuaeth y Cwpan Ryder yn dod i Gymru, ac yn anffodus ni fydd yn bosibl i bobl sy'n teithio o Ogledd America gyrraedd y twrnament drwy hedfan yn uniongyrchol o Ogledd America i faes awyr Caerdydd. Yr wyf ar ddeall bod y maes awyr wedi bod yn trafod gyda chi a'ch adran ynghylch cefnogi amrywiol lwybrau i alluogi pobl i wneud hynny. A allech ddweud wrth y Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw pa mor debygol yw cael canlyniad llwyddiannus i'r trafodaethau hynny, o gofio bod y maes awyr wedi cael colled drist mewn trafodaethau tebyg gydag Emirates ddwy flynedd yn ôl, a benderfynodd symud eu hawyrennau, yn anffodus, i ogledd-ddwyrain Lloegr yn hytrach na de Cymru?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Yr wyf wedi cael nifer o drafodaethau gyda rheolwyr maes awyr Caerdydd ar amrywiaeth o wahanol faterion. Yr ydym wedi egluro nifer o faterion wrth y maes awyr, ond ni allaf roi gormod o fanylion am y trafodaethau hynny gan eu bod yn fasnachol gyfrinachol. Fodd bynnag, gallaf eich sicrhau ein bod yn gweithio'n galed gyda'r awdurdodau ym maes awyr Caerdydd ar nifer o faterion, a gobeithio y gallwn wneud cynnydd ar rai o'r rhain yn y flwyddyn newydd. Bydd rhai'n ymdrin â materion cymorth gwladwriaethol y mae angen inni gael eglurhad yn eu cylch gan y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd. Mae'r arwyddion cynnar yn awgrymu y bydd y Comisiwn yn edrych yn ffafriol ar rai o'n cynigion, ond bydd yn rhaid inni aros am gadarnhad ffurfiol ar y mater hwnnw. Ar ôl inni gael cadarnhad, yr wyf yn siŵr y gallwn symud ymlaen.

Gareth Jones: As you know, Conwy valley railway suffers regularly from flooding. This can lead to the closure of the line, sometimes for weeks on end, as we saw a few weeks ago. I know that you share my concern about the impact of such problems on the economy and local communities. Thanks to the efforts of Network Rail, the line has now reopened. However, what plans does Network Rail have, in partnership with the Welsh Government, to ensure that the line is repaired to such a standard that it will be able

Llywodraeth Cymru, i sicrhau bod y rheilffordd yn cael ei hatgyweirio i'r fath safon fel y gall wrthsefyll effaith ddinistriol llifogydd trymion yn y dyfodol?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Fel mae'n digwydd, cefais gyfarfod yn gynt yr wythnos hon gyda Network Rail. Yr oedd yn medru cadarnhau bryd hynny fod y rheilffordd wedi ailagor ar ôl y trafferthion diweddar. Yn dilyn eich sylwadau heddiw, codaf y mater eto yn fy nghyfarfod nesaf gyda Network Rail er mwyn sicrhau y caiff y gwaith angenrheidiol ei wneud i osgoi problemau fel y trafferthion gyda'r llifogydd yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf.

2.40 p.m.

Mick Bates: In your first response to this question, you missed out ports as being in important part of our transport infrastructure. I am sure that you are aware that Associated British Ports recently won a prestigious award from the Carbon Trust for reducing carbon emissions in its activities. What proposals does your Government have to improve the infrastructure of Welsh ports in order, hopefully, to reduce carbon emissions?

The Deputy First Minister: I did not mention ports because it is not a devolved issue. Therefore, we are not in a position to create policy. However, what we can do is talk to the UK Government about the need to improve the infrastructure of ports. Let us remember that many of Wales's ports are either statutorily controlled or are in private hands. Therefore, it is up to the port operators to make bids for improvements. We have been discussing with port authorities ways in which we can take traffic away from the roads by using short sea shipping routes. That could by-pass much of the traffic congestion that we have, not only in west Wales, but—and more particularly, perhaps—in south Wales, and by using some of our ports to take that traffic. That is something that we are looking at.

Access to Information Technology

Q8 Val Lloyd: Will the Minister make a

to withstand the destructive impact of heavy flooding in future?

The Deputy First Minister: As it happens, I had a meeting with Network Rail earlier this week. It was able to confirm on that occasion that the line has reopened following the recent difficulties. Following your comments today, I will raise the matter again at my next meeting with Network Rail to ensure that the necessary work is carried out in order to prevent the flood-related problems which we have seen in recent months from happening again.

Mick Bates: Yn eich ateb cyntaf i'r cwestiwn hwn, nid oeddech yn sôn am borthladdoedd fel rhan bwysig o'n seilwaith trafniadaeth. Mae'n siŵr gennyf eich bod yn gwybod bod Associated British Ports wedi ennill gwobr uchel ei bri yn ddiweddar gan yr Ymddiriedolaeth Garbon am leihau allyriadau carbon yn ei weithgareddau. Pa gynigion sydd gan eich Llywodraeth i wella seilwaith porthladdoedd Cymru er mwyn lleihau allyriadau carbon, gobeithio?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Ni soniais am y porthladdoedd am nad yw'n fater sydd wedi'i ddatganoli. Felly, nid ydym mewn sefyllfa i greu polisi. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn y gallwn ei wneud yw siarad â Llywodraeth y DU am yr angen i wella seilwaith porthladdoedd. Gadewch inni gofio bod nifer o borthladdoedd Cymru naill ai'n cael eu rheoli'n statudol neu bod iddynt berchnogion preifat. Felly, gweithredwyr y porthladdoedd sy'n gorfod gwneud ceisiadau ar gyfer gwelliannau. Yr ydym wedi bod yn trafod gydag awdurdodau'r porthladdoedd sut y gallwn dynnu traffig oddi ar y ffordd drwy ddefnyddio siwrneiau môr byr. Gallai hynny ddileu llawer o'n tagfeydd traffig, nid yn unig yn y gorllewin, ond—ac yn fwy arbennig, efallai—yn y de, drwy ddefnyddio rhai o'n porthladdoedd i gymryd y traffig hwnnw. Mae hyn yn rhywbeth yr ydym yn ei ystyried.

Mynediad at Dechnoleg Gwybodaeth

C8 Val Lloyd: A wnaiff y Gweinidog

statement on the steps the Welsh Assembly Government has taken to widen access to information technology? OAQ(3)1277(ECT)

The Deputy Minister for Regeneration (Leighton Andrews): Households and businesses have benefited from improved access to broadband through financial support from the Assembly Government. Information and communication technology was identified as a core enabling sector by the Deputy First Minister's ministerial advisory group. I am leading work on a digital inclusion action plan to bring together proposals to widen access to ICT.

Val Lloyd: The integration of ICT within businesses enables growth, reduces cost and enhances profitability. It also makes businesses much more competitive. Can you outline what measures are being taken by the Welsh Assembly Government to support the development of e-business?

Leighton Andrews: I agree with you about the role that information technology can play in improving profitability and helping businesses to grow. We have a number of initiatives under way, including our e-business support, our ICT diagnostics service and, in partnership with e-skills UK, we have a specifically Welsh online business IT guide, which secured European funding to support such activities until the spring of 2014. Annual e-business roadshows will also offer direct advice, support and guidance to over 500 businesses across Wales during February and March 2010.

Alun Cairns: Do you accept that the most effective way of increasing broadband take-up is to offer a reliable, straightforward and simple approach? Community projects and a range of other schemes offer only confusion. You would never have a community project for electricity or gas. It would be far better to have a simple, straightforward approach that is open to lots of private sector providers so that they can pay the same price in the same way that is done in areas where there are no not spots.

Leighton Andrews: Telecommunications

ddatganiad am y camau mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi'u cymryd i ehangu mynediad i dechnoleg gwybodaeth? OAQ(3)1277(ECT)

Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Adfywio (Leighton Andrews): Mae cartrefi a busnesau wedi elwa o fynediad gwell i fand eang drwy gymorth ariannol gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Nodwyd technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu yn sector galluogi craidd gan grŵp cynghori'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog. Yr wyf yn arwain gwaith ar gynllun gweithredu cynhwysiant digidol a fydd yn dod â chynigion ynghyd i ehangu mynediad i TGCh.

Val Lloyd: Mae integreiddio TGCh mewn busnesau yn galluogi twf, yn lleihau costau ac yn gwella proffidoldeb. Mae hefyd yn gwneud busnesau'n llawer mwy cystadleuol. A allwch amlinellu pa gamau sy'n cael eu cymryd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i gefnogi datblygiad e-fusnes?

Leighton Andrews: Yr wyf yn cytuno â chi ynglŷn â'r rôl y gall technoleg gwybodaeth ei chwarae i wella proffidoldeb a helpu busnesau i dyfu. Mae gennym nifer o fentrau ar waith ar hyn o bryd, gan gynnwys ein cymorth e-fusnes, ein gwasanaeth diagnosteg TGCh, ac mewn partneriaeth ag e-skills UK mae gennym ganllaw TG i fusnesau sydd ar gael ar-lein ac yn benodol i Gymru. Cafwyd arian Ewropeaidd i gefnogi gweithgareddau o'r fath tan y gwanwyn 2014. Bydd sioeau teithiol e-fusnes blynyddol yn cynnig cyngor, cymorth ac arweiniad uniongyrchol i dros 500 o fusnesau ledled Cymru yn ystod mis Chwefror a mis Mawrth 2010.

Alun Cairns: A ydych yn derbyn mai'r ffordd fwyaf effeithiol i gynyddu defnyddio band eang yw cynnig dull gweithredu dibynadwy a syml? Nid yw prosiectau cymunedol ac ystod o gynlluniau eraill yn gwneud dim ond achosi dryswch. Ni fyddch byth yn cael prosiect cymunedol ar gyfer trydan neu nwy. Byddai'n well o lawer cael dull gweithredu syml sy'n agored i nifer o ddarparwyr yn y sector preifat fel y gallant dalu'r un pris yn yr un modd ag a wneir mewn ardaloedd lle nad oes manau gwan.

Leighton Andrews: Nid yw'r polisi

policy is not devolved; you have already heard the Deputy First Minister responding to the Digital Economy Bill. I understand that the Conservative opposition at the UK level is not particularly sympathetic to proposals within that Bill that are intended to widen broadband roll-out. During this Assembly, we have created a number of initiatives—the Deputy First Minister referred to a number of them earlier, including the regional innovative broadband support scheme—to ensure that broadband is rolled out to not spots. The additional schemes that we are undertaking through our Communities 2.0 programme, and through our Communities@One programme previously, which won wide praise across the whole of Europe, were designed to bring disadvantaged groups in a variety of communities to taking up broadband, as I explained recently to your digital inclusion cross-party group. Those schemes have achieved wide support across Wales.

Bethan Jenkins: The ongoing impasse between the Government and mobile phone network operators is about access to spectrum resources and it risks delaying the proper roll-out of the 4G or long-term evolution services. Now that the former analogue TV spectrum is becoming available for LTE, super-fast broadband and mobile services could deliver for businesses in my region and could prove invaluable at this time, allowing them to reach wider audiences with lower running costs, particularly as it will be rolled out in blocks that will be of benefit to remote areas. Could the Minister outline the discussions that the Welsh Government has had with Westminster regarding the UK spectrum release?

Leighton Andrews: In his earlier answer, the Deputy First Minister referred to the work that has been undertaken between officials, the Welsh Assembly Government, and the Digital Economy Bill team at Westminster on several of these issues, which are covered by that Bill. He also referred to our view that we will require a number of different technologies, including mobile technology, to ensure that broadband can be delivered

telathrebu wedi'i ddatganoli; yr ydych eisoes wedi clywed y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn ymateb i'r Mesur Economi Ddigidol. Deallaf nad yw'r wrthblaid Geidwadol ar lefel y DU yn gefnogol iawn i'r cynigion yn y Mesur hwnnw y bwriedir iddynt ehangu darparu band eang. Yn ystod oes y Cynulliad hwn, yr ydym wedi creu nifer o fentrau—cyfeiriodd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog at nifer ohonynt yn gynharach, gan gynnwys y cynllun cefnogi band eang arloesol rhanbarthol—er mwyn sicrhau darparu band eang mewn ardaloedd gwan. Cynlluniwyd y cynlluniau ychwanegol yr ydym yn ymgymryd â hwy drwy ein rhaglen Cymunedau 2.0 a thrwy ein rhaglen Cymunedau@Ei Gilydd cyn hynny, a gafodd ei chanmol ledled Ewrop, i alluogi grwpiau difreintiedig mewn amrywiol gymunedau i ddefnyddio band eang, fel yr esboniais yn ddiweddar wrth eich grŵp trawsbleidiol ar gynhwysiant digidol. Mae'r cynlluniau hynny wedi cael cefnogaeth helaeth ledled Cymru.

Bethan Jenkins: Mae'r anghytundeb parhaus rhwng y Llywodraeth a gweithredwyr rhwydweithiau ffonau symudol yn ymwneud â gallu cael adnoddau sbectrwm ac y mae perygl iddo achosi oedi yn y gwaith o gyflwyno'r gwasanaethau 4G neu'r gwasanaethau esblygiad hirdymor mewn modd priodol. Gan fod yr hen sbectrwm teledu analog yn dod ar gael ar gyfer esblygiad hirdymor, gallai gwasanaethau band eang a symudol cyflym iawn sicrhau canlyniadau i fusnesau yn fy rhanbarth a allai fod yn amhrisiadwy ar hyn o bryd, gan eu galluogi i gyrraedd cynulleidfaoedd ehangach gyda chostau rhedeg is, yn enwedig gan y bydd yn cael ei gyflwyno mewn blociau a fydd o fudd i ardaloedd anghysbell. A all y Gweinidog amlinellu'r trafodaethau y mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi'u cael gyda San Steffan ynglŷn â rhyddhau sbectrwm y DU?

Leighton Andrews: Yn ei ateb cynharach, cyfeiriodd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog at y gwaith sydd wedi ei wneud rhwng swyddogion, Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a thîm y Mesur Economi Ddigidol yn San Steffan ar nifer o'r materion hyn y mae'r Mesur hwnnw'n ymdrin â hwy. Cyfeiriodd hefyd at ein barn y bydd arnom angen nifer o wahanol dechnolegau, gan gynnwys technoleg symudol, i sicrhau bod modd cyflwyno band

across Wales. Looking at the issues relating to the mobile spectrum remains a priority, and it is being pursued by the Department for the Economy and Transport.

Cardiff Airport

Q9 Jonathan Morgan: Will the Deputy First Minister detail what discussions or meetings he has had with the management of Cardiff airport over the past six months? OAQ(3)1260(ECT)

The Deputy First Minister: My officials and I maintain regular contact with the management team at Cardiff airport. I am committed to working with the team to facilitate the future development of the airport and to take forward a programme of surface access improvements.

Jonathan Morgan: I am grateful to the Deputy First Minister for that reply. As he is aware, in November, Bmibaby announced staff redundancies affecting Cardiff, Birmingham and Manchester airports, and reduced the number of aircraft in its fleet from 17 to 12. Could the Deputy First Minister outline the discussions that he has had with Cardiff airport about the impact of those cuts from Bmibaby? People working as experts in the field firmly believe that if these sorts of cuts continue in the future, passengers from south Wales who wish to fly will simply cross the Severn bridge for an alternative service. Does the Deputy First Minister share my concern that if a major carrier such as Bmibaby were to be lost, the viability of Cardiff airport could be called into question?

The Deputy First Minister: It is crucial to understand that the economic downturn has had an impact on regional airports, as has happened to Cardiff and Bristol airports. I am aware of the concerns and I am concerned about the news from Bmibaby. However, I know that the management team at Cardiff airport is well aware of the concerns and is working very hard to attract new business to the airport. My officials have been working closely with that team to determine the support that we can give in that regard and on

eang ledled Cymru. Mae ystyried y materion sy'n gysylltiedig â'r sbectrum symudol yn dal yn flaenoriaeth, ac y mae'n cael sylw gan Adran yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth.

Maes Awyr Caerdydd

C9 Jonathan Morgan: A wnaiff y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ddarparu manylion am ba drafodaethau neu gyfarfodydd y mae wedi'u cael gyda rheolwyr maes awyr Caerdydd dros y chwe mis diwethaf? OAQ(3)1260(ECT)

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Mae fy swyddogion a minnau yn cadw mewn cysylltiad rheolaidd â thîm rheoli maes awyr Caerdydd. Yr wyf wedi ymrwymo i gydweithio â'r tîm i hwyluso'r gwaith o ddatblygu'r maes awyr yn y dyfodol, ac i fwrw ymlaen â rhaglen o welliannau mynediad.

Jonathan Morgan: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog am ei ateb. Fel y mae'n gwybod, ym mis Tachwedd cyhoeddodd Bmibaby ddiswyddiadau staff a fyddai'n effeithio ar feysydd awyr Caerdydd, Birmingham a Manceinion, a chwtogodd nifer yr awyrennau yn ei fflyd o 17 i 12. A all y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog roi amlinelliad o'r trafodaethau y mae wedi'u cael gyda maes awyr Caerdydd am effaith y toriadau hynny gan Bmibaby? Mae pobl sy'n gweithio fel arbenigwyr yn y maes yn credu'n gryf, os bydd y mathau hyn o doriadau'n parhau yn y dyfodol, y bydd teithwyr o'r de sy'n dymuno hedfan yn croesi pont Hafren i gael gwasanaeth arall. A yw'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog, fel finnau, yn pryderu, pe bai cludwr mawr fel Bmibaby yn gadael, y byddai'n codi cwestiynau ynglŷn â hyfywedd maes awyr Caerdydd?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog: Mae'n hanfodol inni ddeall bod y dirywiad economaidd wedi cael effaith ar feysydd awyr rhanbarthol, fel sydd wedi digwydd ym meysydd awyr Caerdydd a Bryste. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r pryderon ac yr wyf yn poeni am y newyddion gan Bmibaby. Fodd bynnag, gwn fod y tîm rheoli ym maes awyr Caerdydd yn ymwybodol iawn o'r pryderon a'i fod yn gweithio'n galed iawn i ddenu busnes newydd i'r maes awyr. Mae fy swyddogion wedi bod yn gweithio'n agos gyda'r tîm

other matters related to the airport, which are necessary to improve it. I can assure Jonathan and all Members that I take this matter seriously and that I personally have met the management team three times in the past six weeks. I hope to have a meeting soon with the senior management team from Spain to underline the commitment of this Government to the work that it is doing in Cardiff.

Y Llywydd: Diolch yn fawr i'r Gweinidog am ei atebion.

hwnnw i benderfynu pa gefnogaeth y gallwn ei rhoi yn y cyswllt hwnnw ac mewn materion eraill yn gysylltiedig â'r maes awyr, sy'n angenrheidiol er mwyn ei wella. Gallaf sicrhau Jonathan a'r holl Aelodau fy mod yn ystyried y mater hwn o ddifrif a'm bod wedi cwrdd yn bersonol â'r tîm rheoli deirgwaith yn ystod y chwe wythnos diwethaf. Yr wyf yn gobeithio cael cyfarfod yn fuan â'r uwch-dîm rheoli o Sbaen i bwysleisio ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth hon i'r gwaith y mae'n ei wneud yng Nghaerdydd.

The Presiding Officer: I thank the Minister for his responses.

Datganiad am y Cynllun Iechyd Gwledig Statement on the Rural Health Plan

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Edwina Hart): I am grateful for this opportunity to report on the development of the rural health plan and to provide an update on the next steps for its implementation. It gives me great pleasure today to confirm the completion of the rural health plan following wide consultation. This is the first of its kind in Wales, and its development and publication delivers a key 'One Wales' commitment. It also marks an important step in improving rural health and rural health services in Wales. The plan will be published shortly, both in print and on the internet.

The report is the result of the considerable work undertaken by the steering group that I appointed in February 2008, chaired by Lord Elystan Morgan, with Jane Jeffs and Professor Marc Clements as co-vice-chairs. The group gathered evidence from a wide range of services and service users to inform the report and its findings. The group also took into account two major elements of the work commissioned to support the final report. First, the group identified from local people their perceptions and experiences of health issues in rural Wales, and secondly, a literature and research review of national and international evidence on health and health service models in rural areas was undertaken by the Institute of Rural Health.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Edwina Hart): Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle hwn i adrodd am ddatblygiad y cynllun iechyd gwledig, ac am y cyfle i roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y camau nesaf o ran ei weithredu. Mae'n bleser mawr gennyf gadarnhau heddiw fod y cynllun iechyd gwledig wedi'i gwblhau yn dilyn proses ymgynghori eang. Dyma'r cynllun cyntaf o'i fath yng Nghymru, ac y mae datblygu a chyhoeddi'r cynllun yn gwireddu un o ymrwymadau allweddol 'Cymru'n Un'. Mae'n gam pwysig hefyd tuag at wella iechyd gwledig a gwasanaethau iechyd gwledig yng Nghymru. Caiff y cynllun ei gyhoeddi'n fuan, ar bapur ac ar y rhyngwyd.

Mae'r adroddiad yn ganlyniad y gwaith sylweddol a wnaed gan y grŵp llywio a benodwyd gennyf ym mis Chwefror 2008, dan gadeiryddiaeth yr Arglwydd Elystan Morgan, gyda Jane Jeffs a'r Athro Marc Clements yn is-gadeiryddion ar y cyd. Bu'r grŵp yn casglu tystiolaeth gan ystod eang o wasanaethau a defnyddwyr gwasanaethau i lywio'r adroddiad a'i ganfyddiadau. Bu'r grŵp hefyd yn ystyried dwy elfen bwysig o'r gwaith a gomisiynwyd i ategu'r adroddiad terfynol. Yn gyntaf, aeth y grŵp ati i gasglu ddarganfyddiadau a phrofiadau pobl leol o faterion iechyd yng Nghymru wledig, ac yn ail, gwnaeth y Sefydliad Iechyd Gwledig adolygiad llenyddiaeth ac ymchwil o dystiolaeth genedlaethol a rhyngwladol am

iechyd a modelau gwasanaethau iechyd mewn ardaloedd gwledig.

The plan is firmly grounded in a strong evidence base of worldwide best practice and the local community views of current and future need. The entire process has identified the need to rethink the way in which services are provided in rural areas, including primary and community services in ways outside traditional models of care. Three key fundamental themes emerge, which are also common to other strategic developments in rural areas. First, we need to look at access to services, providing timely and appropriate services to people across the whole range of primary, community, secondary, specialist and social care services. That includes improvement in the simplest things, such as appointment times, as well as of complex and emergency care.

2.50 p.m.

The second is better integration within the NHS and with other key partners, such as social care services and the third sector. That will help to ensure that waste and duplication can be prevented, and that better care and support is provided to those living in rural areas. That includes integrated service models, integrated workforce planning, and the integration of systems and services, to improve future service provision and to ensure the effective use of all resources and skills within communities. It will involve better planning and use of transport, whether provided by the statutory or voluntary sectors, and tailoring services and support to fit in with local needs and circumstances.

The last point that has emerged is community cohesion and engagement. It is an important resource and a factor of immense potential in rural settings. Community cohesion, engagement and ownership must be actively promoted within mainstream service planning to support services that are delivered locally. Using the skills, knowledge and networks

Mae'r cynllun wedi'i seilio'n gadarn ar sylfaen dystiolaeth gref o arfer gorau byd-eang, a safbwyntiau'r gymuned leol am yr angen ar hyn o bryd a'r angen yn y dyfodol. Mae'r broses gyfan wedi bodi'r angen i ailystyried y modd y caiff gwasanaethau eu darparu mewn ardaloedd gwledig, gan gynnwys gwasanaethau sylfaenol a chymunedol, mewn ffyrdd y tu allan i fodolau gofal traddodiadol. Mae tair thema sylfaenol yn dod i'r amlwg, sydd hefyd yn gyffredin i ddatblygiadau strategol eraill mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Yn gyntaf, mae angen inni edrych ar allu cael gwasanaethau, gan ddarparu gwasanaethau amserol a phriodol i bobl ar draws yr ystod gyfan o wasanaethau gofal sylfaenol, cymunedol, eilaidd, arbenigol a chymdeithasol. Mae hynny'n cynnwys gwella'r pethau mwyaf syml, megis amseroedd apwyntiadau, yn ogystal â gofal cymhleth a gofal mewn argyfwng.

Yr ail thema yw gwell integreiddio yn y GIG ac â phartneriaid allweddol eraill, megis gwasanaethau gofal cymdeithasol a'r trydydd sector. Bydd hynny'n helpu sicrhau bod modd osgoi achosion o wastraffu a dyblygu, a bod gwell gofal a chymorth yn cael eu darparu i'r rheini sy'n byw mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Mae hynny'n cynnwys modelau gwasanaeth integredig, gwaith cynllunio gweithlu integredig, ac integreiddio systemau a gwasanaethau, er mwyn gwella'r modd y caiff gwasanaethau eu darparu yn y dyfodol ac i sicrhau bod yr holl adnoddau a'r sgiliau mewn cymunedau'n cael eu defnyddio'n effeithiol. Bydd yn golygu cynllunio a defnyddio cludiant yn well, p'un a gaiff ei ddarparu gan y sector statudol ynteu'r gwirfoddol, a theilwra gwasanaethau a chymorth i weddu i anghenion ac amgylchiadau lleol.

Y pwynt olaf sydd wedi dod i'r amlwg yw cydlyniant cymunedol ac ymgysylltu â'r gymuned. Mae'n adnodd pwysig ac yn ffactor sydd â photensial aruthrol mewn lleoliadau gwledig. Rhaid mynd ati i hybu ymgysylltu â'r gymuned, cydlyniant a pherchnogaeth o fewn cynllunio gwasanaethau prif ffrwd, i gefnogi

within local communities to help to plan and deliver support locally is essential, as demonstrated, for example, in such schemes as Heartstart UK.

On 1 May 2009, together with my Cabinet colleague, Elin Jones AM, the Minister for Rural Affairs, I launched a 16-week public consultation on the steering group's consultative paper. In addition to the usual consultation processes, three workshops were held in different parts of Wales, and also at the Royal Welsh Show. A total of 139 responses were received from a wide range of organisations and representative bodies with an interest in health and social care in rural Wales. I am pleased that the responses demonstrated a large consensus among respondents in support of the overall vision and the key themes raised in the consultation paper.

Now that the plan is ready to be published, I am committed to ensuring that the implementation starts immediately. In the new year, an implementation group will be set up, supported by a wider reference group of key stakeholders, to take the practical work of the rural health plan forward. Lord Elystan Morgan will step down as chair of the rural health plan steering group. I take this opportunity to thank him for his guidance, leadership and dedication in developing this important piece of work, which brought rural health to the forefront of health service provision across Wales. I hope that he will continue as an ambassador for rural health throughout its implementation.

In the meantime, work has already begun to support implementation, by addressing workforce plans, telecare and telehealth, and transport. Further work will be needed on the development of the role of the rural practitioner and on ensuring that there is a network of community pharmacies across rural Wales. Wales already has a strong network of community hospitals, and I want to see a renewed mission and purpose for

gwasanaethau sy'n cael eu darparu'n lleol. Mae'n hanfodol defnyddio'r sgiliau, y wybodaeth a'r rhwydweithiau o fewn cymunedau lleol i helpu cynllunio a darparu cymorth yn lleol, fel y mae cynlluniau megis Heartstart UK wedi ei ddangos.

Ar 1 Mai 2009, lansiodd fy nghydweithiwr yn y Cabinet, Elin Jones, AC, y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig, a minnau ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus o 16 wythnos ar bapur ymgynghori'r pwyllgor llywio. Yn ogystal â'r prosesau ymgynghori arferol, cynhaliwyd tri gweithdy mewn gwahanol rannau o Gymru, a hefyd yn y Sioe Frenhinol. Cafwyd cyfanswm o 139 o ymatebion gan ystod eang o sefydliadau a chyrff cynrychioli sydd â diddordeb mewn iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yng Nghymru wledig. Yr wyf yn falch bod yr ymatebion wedi dangos llawer o gytundeb ymhlith ymatebwyr o blaid y weledigaeth gyffredinol a'r themâu allweddol a godwyd yn y papur ymgynghori.

Gan fod y cynllun yn awr yn barod i'w gyhoeddi, yr wyf wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau y bydd y gwaith o'i weithredu'n dechrau ar unwaith. Yn y flwyddyn newydd, caiff grŵp gweithredu ei sefydlu, a gynorthwyir gan grŵp cyfeirio ehangach o randdeiliaid allweddol, i symud gwaith ymarferol y cynllun iechyd gwledig yn ei flaen. Bydd yr Arglwydd Elystan Morgan yn rhoi'r gorau i'w waith fel cadeirydd grŵp llywio'r cynllun iechyd gwledig. Hoffwn fanteisio ar y cyfle hwn i ddiolch iddo am ei arweiniad, ei arweinyddiaeth a'i ymroddiad wrth ddatblygu'r darn pwysig hwn o waith, a sicrhodd fod iechyd gwledig yn cael lle blaenllaw yn narpariaeth y gwasanaeth iechyd ar draws Cymru. Gobeithio y bydd yn parhau'n llysgennad ar gyfer iechyd gwledig wrth i'r cynllun gael ei weithredu.

Yn y cyfamser, mae gwaith eisoes wedi dechrau i gefnogi gweithredu'r cynllun, trwy fynd i'r afael â chynlluniau gweithlu, teleofal a theleiechyd, a chludiant. Bydd angen gwneud gwaith pellach ar ddatblygu rôl yr ymarferydd gwledig, a sicrhau bod rhwydwaith o fferyllfeydd cymunedol ar gael ar hyd a lled Cymru wledig. Mae gan Gymru eisoes rwydwaith cryf o ysbytai cymunedol, ac yr wyf am weld y rhain yn cael cenhadaeth

them that fully exploits their potential, providing key services closer to rural communities. I am encouraged by the work undertaken at Builth Wells and by the potential to pilot a nurse-led, walk-in service at Cardigan hospital, which is another of our 'One Wales' commitments.

I am aware that the provision of patient transport needs to be improved in rural areas. Alternative models will be reviewed for the provision of emergency and non-emergency patient transport, to ensure that we develop a set of measures that will deliver a realistic and achievable service.

I have also recognised the special nature of the areas covered by Hywel Dda Local Health Board and Powys Teaching Local Health Board, among others, in addressing the challenges that rurality presents. These local health boards are well placed to act as a focus for innovation in rural healthcare and to concentrate attention on developing new models of integrated, community-based care, through better partnership working with the local authorities and other key stakeholders.

Discussions have also been under way with the University of Wales on the appointment of a chair in rural health. That is to help to develop leading-edge practice in teaching and research, by strengthening the joint working between the Institute of Rural Health, the Wales Rural Observatory, the developing rural networks, and other health institutions.

I hope that Assembly Members will join me in recognising that these are exciting times in the development of services for those living in rural areas of Wales, and I look forward to seeing real improvements being made for local people.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Thank you for your statement today, Minister. I have lived in a rural location all my life and, although most people would probably say that the Vale of

a phwrpas newydd sy'n defnyddio'u potensial i'r eithaf, gan ddarparu gwasanaethau allweddol yn nes at gymunedau gwledig. Yr wyf wedi fy nghalonogi gan y gwaith sydd wedi'i wneud yn Llanfair-ym-Muallt, a chan y potensial i dreialu gwasanaeth a arweinir gan nyrsys heb wneud apwyntiadau yn ysbyty Aberteifi, sef un arall o'n hymrwymyiadau yn 'Cymru'n Un'.

Gwn fod angen gwella darpariaeth gwasanaethau cludo cleifion mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Caiff modelau amgen eu hadolygu ar gyfer darparu gwasanaethau cludo cleifion mewn achosion brys ac achosion nad ydynt yn rhai brys, i sicrhau ein bod yn datblygu cyfres o fesurau a fydd yn sicrhau gwasanaeth realistig y gellir ei gyflawni.

Yr wyf hefyd wedi cydnabod natur arbennig yr ardaloedd y mae Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Hywel Dda a Bwrdd Addysgu Iechyd Lleol Powys, ymysg eraill, yn gyfrifol amdanynt, wrth fynd i'r afael â'r heriau y mae natur wledig yr ardaloedd hynny'n eu cynnig. Mae'r byrddau iechyd lleol hyn mewn sefyllfa dda i fod yn ffocws ar gyfer arloesi mewn gofal iechyd gwledig a chanolbwyntio sylw ar ddatblygu modelau newydd o ofal integredig yn y gymuned, trwy weithio'n well mewn partneriaeth ag awdurdodau lleol a rhanddeiliaid allweddol eraill.

Cafwyd trafodaethau hefyd gyda Phrifysgol Cymru ar benodi athro iechyd gwledig. Bwriad hynny yw helpu datblygu arfer sy'n torri tir newydd o ran addysgu ac ymchwil, trwy gryfhau'r cydweithio rhwng y Sefydliad Iechyd Gwledig, Arsyllfa Wledig Cymru, y rhwydweithiau gwledig sy'n datblygu, a sefydliadau iechyd eraill.

Gobeithio y bydd Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn ymuno â mi i gydnabod bod hwn yn gyfnod cyffrous yn natblygiad gwasanaethau i bobl sy'n byw yn ardaloedd gwledig Cymru, ac edrychaf ymlaen at weld gwelliannau gwirioneddol yn cael eu gwneud ar gyfer pobl leol.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Diolch am eich datganiad heddiw, Weinidog. Yr wyf wedi byw mewn ardal wledig ar hyd fy oes, ac er y byddai'r mwyafrif o bobl, mae'n debyg, yn

Glamorgan has good access to health services, given its proximity to Cardiff, Bridgend, Pontypridd, and the Royal Glamorgan Hospital, I am sure that I could take you to many challenging environments in the Vale of Glamorgan to highlight how rurality acts as an obstacle.

I welcome the announcement that the Minister made yesterday on the development of services in Powys, as that will enhance the services available to those living there. The Tenovus development announced at the Senedd and the dinner that I had the pleasure of hosting with Tenovus highlighted the ability of charities to work with the statutory providers of health services, which will be a key plank of any rural health plan. Above all, I welcome how the Minister will drive this forward with her officials to ensure that people do not carry on working in silos.

In the Health, Wellbeing and Local Government Committee this morning, as part of our inquiry into wheelchair services, we heard evidence from the British Red Cross. Its representatives discussed this issue and the difficulties regarding interaction with statutory stakeholders when trying to facilitate access to services. They pointed out quite graphically how they could complement the service—not take over, but work with providers so that the users of the services benefited. That will be important for the Minister to address in her response. We need to know how she will drive this forward. I have been here for two and a half years now, and I have heard time and again about the silo mentality that people work in, but we get the response that the silos will be broken down and that people will work together. It is great to say that we have a rural health plan, but there is no point having a plan if there is no route marked to ensure that the participants work together. I would welcome the detail on how you will drive that forward.

Staff are also important, and there are issues

dweud bod gan Fro Morgannwg fynediad da i wasanaethau iechyd, o gofio mor agos ydyw i Gaerdydd, Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr, Pontypridd, ac Ysbyty Brenhinol Morgannwg, yr wyf yn siŵr y gallwn fynd â chi i nifer o amgylcheddau heriol ym Mro Morgannwg i ddangos sut mae natur wledig ardal yn gallu bod yn rhwystr.

Yr wyf yn croesawu'r cyhoeddiad a wnaed gan y Gweinidog ddoe ar ddatblygu gwasanaethau ym Mhowys, oherwydd bydd hynny'n gwella'r gwasanaethau sydd ar gael i'r bobl sy'n byw yno. Yr oedd y datblygiad gan Tenovus, a gyhoeddwyd yn y Senedd, a'r cinio y cefais y pleser o'i gynnal gyda Tenovus, yn tynnu sylw at allu elusennau i weithio gyda darparwyr statudol gwasanaethau iechyd, a bydd hynny'n un o gonglfeini unrhyw gynllun iechyd gwledig. Yn anad dim, yr wyf yn croesawu'r modd y bydd y Gweinidog yn symud y mater hwn yn ei flaen gyda'i swyddogion i sicrhau na fydd pobl yn parhau i weithio heb ymgysylltu ag eraill.

Yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd, Lles a Llywodraeth Leol y bore yma, fel rhan o'n hymchwiliad i wasanaethau cadeiriau olwyn, clywsom dystiolaeth gan y Groes Goch Brydeinig. Bu cynrychiolwyr y sefydliad yn trafod y mater hwn, a'r anawsterau o ran rhyngweithio â rhanddeiliaid statudol wrth geisio hwyluso mynediad i wasanaethau. Dangoswyd yn glir iawn sut y gallent ategu'r gwasanaeth—nid cymryd lle'r gwasanaeth, ond gweithio gyda darparwyr er lles defnyddwyr y gwasanaethau. Bydd hynny'n bwysig i'r Gweinidog roi sylw iddo yn ei hymateb. Mae angen inni wybod sut y bydd yn symud hynny'n ei flaen. Yr wyf wedi bod yma ers dwy flynedd a hanner erbyn hyn, ac yr wyf wedi clywed dro ar ôl tro am bobl yn gweithio heb ymgysylltu ag eraill, ond yr ymateb a gawn yw y bydd cysylltiadau'n cael eu creu ac y bydd pobl yn cydweithio â'i gilydd. Mae'n wych dweud bod gennym gynllun iechyd gwledig, ond nid oes diben cael cynllun os nad oes llwybr wedi'i farcio i sicrhau y bydd y cyfranogwyr yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd. Byddwn yn falch clywed sut yn union y byddwch yn symud hynny yn ei flaen.

Mae staff yn bwysig hefyd, ac y mae

to do with attracting staff to work in rural areas in all sorts of disciplines in the NHS. Sometimes, that is for completely the wrong reason, such as the negative perceptions that some may have; at other times, it is because of genuine concerns such as the relocation of people's families and the ability to access other services. It is not just about the individual; very often, the whole family will relocate, which means investigating the educational opportunities for children and the employment opportunities for spouses. I would welcome information on how the Minister and her Cabinet colleagues will address the concern of being able to attract staff to work in rural locations to develop services. We have the plan and the recommendation, but if we do not have the staff to deliver, what good is the plan and what good are the aspirations?

I welcome the Minister's emphasis in her statement on the importance of community pharmacists. On Community Pharmacy Day, a week or so ago, we were shown a display outlining the wonderful opportunities for health promotion that community pharmacists can provide in diagnosing and advising on the best treatment option. They are complementing, not taking over, the roles of general practitioners and others working in primary healthcare, working with them. That is a critical element because, when visiting small market towns or villages, it is clear that it is that model of working together that delivers the joined-up service for the user.

In her statement, the Minister also touched on patient transport, which is another massive obstacle for people trying to access services, especially secondary services, as access to a district general hospital, for example, can be particularly challenging. The voluntary sector, which provided some transport to hospitals for a time, has found delivering that service to be challenging because of cutbacks and the reduced number of volunteers coming forward to make a contribution. We need to spend more time on that aspect, because the plan might offer the route-map, but the resource and the asset need to be provided to deliver the service. I welcome the Minister's statement this afternoon, but I hope that she will find time to address the specific points

problemau o ran denu staff i weithio mewn ardaloedd gwledig ym mhob math o ddisgyblaethau yn y GIG. Weithiau, bydd hynny am y rhesymau hollol anghywir, megis y canfyddiadau negyddol a all fod gan rai; dro arall, oherwydd pryderon gwirioneddol, megis symud teuluoedd, a gallu cael gwasanaethau eraill. Nid mater i unigolyn yn unig ydyw; yn aml iawn, bydd y teulu cyfan yn symud, sy'n golygu ymchwilio i'r cyfleoedd addysgol ar gyfer plant a'r cyfleoedd gwaith i gymar. Byddwn yn falch cael gwybodaeth am y modd y bydd y Gweinidog a'i chydweithwyr yn y Cabinet yn mynd i'r afael â'r pryder am allu denu staff i weithio mewn lleoliadau gwledig i ddatblygu gwasanaethau. Mae'r cynllun a'r argymhelliad gennym, ond beth yw diben y cynllun a'r dyheadau os nad oes gennym y staff i'w gwireddu?

Yr wyf yn croesawu pwyslais y Gweinidog yn ei datganiad ar bwysigrwydd fferyllwyr cymunedol. Ar Ddiwrnod Fferylliaeth Gymunedol ryw wythnos yn ôl, cawsom weld arddangosfa yn amlinellu'r cyfleoedd gwych i hybu iechyd y gall fferyllwyr cymunedol eu darparu wrth wneud diagnosis a chynghori am y driniaeth orau. Maent yn ategu, nid yn disodli, meddygon teulu ac eraill sy'n gweithio ym maes gofal iechyd sylfaenol, gan weithio gyda hwy. Mae'r elfen honno'n hollbwysig, oherwydd wrth ymweld â phentrefi neu drefi marchnad bach, mae'n amlwg mai'r model hwnnw o gydweithio sy'n sicrhau gwasanaeth cydgysylltiedig i'r defnyddiwr.

Yn ei datganiad, cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog hefyd at gludo cleifion, sy'n rhwystr enfawr arall i bobl sy'n ceisio cael gwasanaethau, yn enwedig gwasanaethau eilaidd, gan fod cyrraedd ysbyty cyffredinol, er enghraifft, yn gallu bod yn arbennig o anodd. Mae'r sector gwirfoddol, a fu'n darparu ychydig gludiant i ysbytai am gyfnod, wedi gweld bod darparu'r gwasanaeth hwnnw'n heriol oherwydd toriadau a'r ffaith bod llai o wirfoddolwyr yn barod i wneud cyfraniad. Mae angen inni dreulio mwy o amser ar yr agwedd honno, oherwydd efallai fod y cynllun yn cynnig trywydd, ond y mae angen darparu'r adnodd a'r ased i ddarparu'r gwasanaeth. Yr wyf yn croesawu datganiad y Gweinidog y prynhawn yma, ond gobeithio y gall gael amser i roi

that I have raised with her.

Edwina Hart: The key to this will be the implementation, and you are quite right to say that. We can all sign up to everything within the rural health plan, but concerns have been raised with us regarding the direction of travel. Like you, when I talk about rurality, I think about my own constituency of Gower, which is very rural although it is close to mainstream services in Swansea. However, some of the issues raised in the rural health plan include deep rurality, which I know my colleague, Elin Jones, has been looking at, and how various communities access services. I have been surprised by how many communities across Wales are deeply rural, and I have been wondering how they can access any level of public services and how we can do something about those particular areas.

You made a worthwhile point about the engagement of the voluntary sector. We all had the pleasure of visiting the Tenovus bus—although it was much grander than it sounds—which can be taken out and about across Wales. That really indicates possible future developments.

3.00 p.m.

You made an important point that the voluntary sector, in its engagement with the statutory sector, still comes across silo mentalities. There is almost a fear in the statutory sector that they will lose out if they engage with the voluntary sector, that somebody is going to tell them to do something in a different way and, although it might be a better way, they have always done it their own way. That mentality does sometimes come across. I had an opportunity this morning to meet voluntary sector organisations and the rural health plan was on our agenda. We were talking about citizen engagement, how they could engage and the fact that the local health boards now have a responsibility to look at the rules of engagement more closely. They have to map

sylw i'r pwyntiau penodol yr wyf wedi'u codi gyda hi.

Edwina Hart: Yr agwedd allweddol ar hyn fydd y gweithredu, ac yr ydych yn hollol iawn i ddweud hynny. Gallwn i gyd gefnogi popeth sydd yn y cynllun iechyd gwledig, ond mae pryderon wedi'u mynegi wrthym am y cyfeiriad yr ydym yn mynd iddo. Fel chithau, wrth sôn am ardaloedd gwledig, byddaf yn meddwl am fy etholaeth i, Penrhyn Gŵyr, sy'n wledig iawn er ei bod yn agos i wasanaethau prif ffrwd yn Abertawe. Fodd bynnag, mae rhai o'r materion a godwyd yn y cynllun iechyd gwledig yn cynnwys ardaloedd gwledig anghysbell, a gwn fod fy nghydweithiwr, Elin Jones, wedi bod yn edrych arnynt, ac yn ystyried sut mae gwahanol gymunedau'n gallu cael gwasanaethau. Yr wyf wedi fy synnu bod cynifer o gymunedau ledled Cymru yn gymunedau gwledig anghysbell, ac yr wyf wedi bod yn meddwl tybed sut y gallant gael gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ar unrhyw lefel, a sut y gallwn wneud rhywbeth am yr ardaloedd penodol hynny.

Gwnaethoch bwynt gwerthfawr ynghylch ymgysylltu â'r sector gwirfoddol. Cafodd pob un ohonom y pleser o ymweld â bws Tenovus—er ei fod yn llawer mwy crand nag y mae'n swnio. Gellir mynd ag ef ar hyd a lled Cymru, ac y mae hynny'n arwydd gwirioneddol o ddatblygiadau posibl ar gyfer y dyfodol.

Gwnaethoch bwynt pwysig fod y sector gwirfoddol, wrth ymgysylltu â'r sector statudol, yn dal i ddod ar draws pobl nad ydynt yn meddwl ymgysylltu ag eraill. Bron na ellir dweud bod sefydliadau'r sector statudol yn ofni y byddant ar eu colled o ymgysylltu â'r sector gwirfoddol, bod rhywun yn mynd i ddweud wrthynt am wneud pethau mewn ffordd wahanol, ac er y gallai honno fod yn ffordd well, eu bod bob amser wedi gwneud pethau yn eu ffordd eu hunain. Mae'r ffordd honno o feddwl yn dod i'r amlwg weithiau. Cefais gyfle y bore yma i gyfarfod â mudiadau o'r sector gwirfoddol, ac yr oedd y cynllun iechyd gwledig ar ein hagenda. Yr oeddem yn sôn am ymgysylltu â dinasyddion, sut y gellid ymgysylltu â hwy, a'r ffaith fod gan y byrddau iechyd lleol

what they are doing in their areas and they may need to establish different types of relationships and, importantly, look at changes to the compact arrangements, which might help with some of the difficult issues about funding, service level agreements and so on, which are coming to the fore.

On staff working in rural areas, there is a recognition that the very nature of some jobs will change. I was with occupational therapists earlier this week and we were talking about who the employer is: the employer could be the NHS, the voluntary sector or local government and it is important to recognise that they might have more than one employer. Due to the types of services that they provide, particularly in rural areas, they will have to have a number of employers who will employ them for different aspects of the same work in the community. There are a lot of issues to be discussed with the professions and others about how we will be able to work in rural areas. There is also the issue of attracting people to rural areas—we have seen some difficulties, particularly in the medical profession. They love their placements outside Cardiff and Swansea but there is a question about developing that love into a decision to take up an opportunity. Some people make a very positive decision that they want to live in that type of area, that they do not want the hustle and bustle of town or city living—they want to be in a community—and as long as they can access a good education for their children and other services, they will do so. That is a challenge in itself.

I think that community pharmacies are well up for this challenge. Like you, I have been impressed by the work that community pharmacies have undertaken and their willingness to do more work and, as you said, not on a competitive basis, but on a complementary basis. If there are services missing from one group of health professionals, they can be there as professionals offering help and assistance.

gyfrifoldeb erbyn hyn i edrych yn fanylach ar y rheolau ymgysylltu. Rhaid iddynt fapio'r hyn y maent yn ei wneud yn eu hardaloedd, a gall fod angen iddynt sefydlu gwahanol fathau o gydbertynas ac edrych ar newidiadau yn y trefniadau'r compact, sy'n bwysig, a allai helpu gyda rhai o'r materion anodd yn ymwneud â chyllid, cytundebau lefel gwasanaeth ac yn y blaen, sy'n dod i'r amlwg.

O ran cael staff i weithio mewn ardaloedd gwledig, cydnabyddir bydd union natur rhai swyddi'n newid. Yr oeddwn yng nghwmni therapyddion galwedigaethol yn gynharach yn yr wythnos, ac yr oeddem yn trafod pwy yw'r cyflogwr: gallai'r GIG, y sector gwirfoddol neu lywodraeth leol fod yn gyflogwr, ac y mae'n bwysig cydnabod y gall fod ganddynt fwy nag un cyflogwr. Oherwydd y mathau o wasanaethau y maent yn eu darparu, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd gwledig, bydd yn rhaid iddynt gael nifer o gyflogwyr a fydd yn eu cyflogi ar gyfer gwahanol agweddau ar yr un gwaith yn y gymuned. Mae llawer o faterion i'w trafod gyda'r proffesiynau ac eraill am y ffordd y byddwn yn gallu gweithio mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Mae denu pobl i ardaloedd gwledig hefyd yn fater i'w drafod—gwelsom rai anawsterau, yn enwedig yn y proffesiwn meddygol. Maent wrth eu bodd â'u lleoliadau gwaith y tu allan i Gaerdydd ac Abertawe, ond mater arall yw troi'r hoffter hwnnw'n benderfyniad i fanteisio ar gyfle. Bydd rhai pobl yn gwneud penderfyniad cadarnhaol iawn eu bod am fyw yn y math hwnnw o ardal, nad ydynt am fyw yng nghanol bwrlwm tref neu ddinas—eu bod am fyw mewn cymuned—a chyhyd ag y gallant gael addysg dda i'w plant a gwasanaethau eraill, byddant yn gwneud hynny. Mae hynny'n her ynddo'i hun.

Credaf fod fferyllfeydd cymunedol yn barod iawn am yr her hon. Fel chithau, yr wyf yn llawn edmygedd o'r gwaith y mae fferyllfeydd cymunedol wedi'i wneud a'u parodrwydd i wneud mwy o waith, mewn modd sy'n ategu, fel y dywedaso, nid mewn modd cystadleuol. Os oes bwlch yn y gwasanaethau a ddarperir gan un grŵp o weithwyr iechyd proffesiynol, gall fferyllwyr fod wrth law fel gweithwyr proffesiynol i gynnig help a chymorth.

For me, the biggest issue is transport. Transport is the key issue that has come up in every discussion that we have had on every part of this consultation. I very much regret that I have not yet finalised, with the group that is advising me, the patient transport paper. I hope that I will do so in early January, because that has raised a myriad issues that impact on the rural health plan. Transport also raises a lot of systems' issues, such as how people engage with the district general hospital when they attend, and why they cannot all go on the same day if they are all going from one tiny village. People have been asking why transport is not organised like that and why the appointments system is not able to do it. From the technology side and from discussions with Informing Healthcare, these are matters that will have to be resolved as part of this implementation plan, if we are going to make it a reality. I can understand your cautious welcome to the plan, because, at the end of the day, it is about implementation. However, I think that, because we now have people who are heavily involved in this plan, are interested in it and there is such enthusiasm out there—from the LHB perspective as well—it is something that we can definitely get to work because the opportunities are there now. There are individuals out there who really want to see this change.

Helen Mary Jones: I begin by giving a very warm welcome to the progress that the Minister has made on the delivery of what was a key 'One Wales' commitment. I commend both her and Elin Jones, the Minister for Rural Affairs, on their effective co-operative working across boundaries. To address the challenges that the plan will identify and to help us to work, there will be a need for more cross-portfolio working in a range of ways. I believe that this represents an innovative approach to an undoubted challenge. How can we provide our citizens who live in rural areas with public services in general and, in the context of our discussion today, with the health services that they are entitled to receive? I believe that this

I mi, y broblem fwyaf yw cludiant. Cludiant yw'r mater allweddol sydd wedi codi ym mhob trafodaeth a gawsom ar hyd pob cam o'r broses ymgynghori hon. Mae'n flin iawn gennyf nad wyf eto wedi cwblhau'r papur ar gludo cleifion, gyda'r grŵp sy'n fy nghynghori. Gobeithio wneud hynny'n gynnar ym mis Ionawr, oherwydd mae wedi codi peth wmbredd o broblemau sy'n effeithio ar y cynllun iechyd gwledig. Mae cludiant hefyd yn codi llawer o faterion o ran systemau, megis sut mae pobl yn ymgysylltu â'r ysbyty cyffredinol pan fyddant yn mynd yno, a pham na all pawb sy'n mynd yno o'r un pentref bach wneud hynny ar yr un diwrnod. Mae pobl wedi bod yn gofyn pam nad yw cludiant yn cael ei drefnu fel hynny a pham nad yw'r system apwyntiadau'n gallu gwneud hynny. O safbwynt technoleg ac o'n trafodaethau gyda Hysbysu Gofal Iechyd, mae'r rhain yn faterion y bydd yn rhaid eu datrys fel rhan o'r cynllun gweithredu hwn, os ydym am weld gwireddu'r cynllun. Gallaf ddeall pam yr ydych yn ofalus wrth groesawu'r cynllun, oherwydd yn y pen draw gweithredu sy'n bwysig. Fodd bynnag, credaf ei fod yn rhywbeth y gallwn wneud iddo weithio, yn bendant, oherwydd mae'r cyfleoedd yno'n awr ac y mae gennym bobl sy'n ymwneud i raddau helaeth iawn â'r cynllun ac sydd â diddordeb ynddo, ac y mae cymaint o frwdfrydedd yn bodoli yn y maes—o safbwynt y byrddau iechyd lleol hefyd. Mae yna unigolion yn y maes sy'n awyddus iawn i weld y newid hwn.

Helen Mary Jones: Dechreuaf trwy groesawu'n gynnes iawn y cynnydd y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i wneud i wireddu ymrwymiad a oedd yn allweddol yn 'Cymru'n Un'. Yr wyf yn ei channol hi ac Elin Jones, y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig, am y modd y maent wedi cydweithio'n effeithiol ar draws ffiniau. Bydd angen gwneud mwy o waith ar draws portffolios mewn amrywiaeth o ffyrdd i fynd i'r afael â'r heriau y bydd y cynllun yn eu nodi, a'n helpu i weithio. Credaf fod hwn yn ddull arloesol o fynd i'r afael â her ddiamheuol. Sut y gallwn sicrhau bod ein dinasyddion sy'n byw mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn cael gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn gyffredinol, ac yng nghyd-destun ein

represents a chance for Wales to lead the way in this very challenging field. In that context, I welcome what the Minister has told us today about the work with the University of Wales to appoint a chair of rural health to help lead the development of cutting-edge practices in this field.

I look forward to studying the plan in detail when it is published. I would like to associate myself with what the Minister has said about the work of Lord Elystan-Morgan in leading the work so far. I am sure that we would all agree that the key themes of access, integration and community cohesion and engagement are the right ones to address.

I wish to ask the Minister specifically about an element of the community cohesion and engagement aspect. The role of voluntary organisations has already been mentioned, and I am sure that the Minister would agree that they can have an important role to play. The Minister will be aware that some small and local voluntary organisations have expressed concerns about their engagement in the health sector, which is particularly true in rural areas, because of the move from small local health boards—which had many failings, but were able to be quite close to their communities—to bigger local health boards covering larger areas. What assurances can the Minister give that she will ensure that local health boards engage positively with big voluntary organisations such as Tenovus, Hafal and others that we frequently speak about, but particularly with smaller, local voluntary organisations that provide vital services, knowledge and intelligence in deep rural areas?

I also wish to ask a little more about the implementation group, which I welcome. Are you prepared to give a further update to the Assembly about how the group will be constituted, how it will interface with the local health boards, who will have the main responsibility for delivering on this agenda, and how it will report to you? Are you

trafodaeth heddiw, sut y gallwn sicrhau eu bod yn cael y gwasanaethau iechyd y mae ganddynt hawl iddynt? Credaf fod hwn yn gyfle i Gymru arwain y ffordd yn y maes hwn, sy'n un heriol iawn. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, yr wyf yn croesawu'r hyn y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i ddweud wrthym heddiw am y gwaith gyda Phrifysgol Cymru i benodi athro iechyd gwledig i helpu arwain datblygu'r arferion diweddaraf yn y maes hwn.

Edrychaf ymlaen at astudio'r cynllun yn fanwl pan gaiff ei gyhoeddi. Hoffwn ategu'r hyn y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i ddweud am waith yr Arglwydd Elystan Morgan wrth arwain y gwaith hyd yn hyn. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddem i gyd yn cytuno mai mynediad, integreiddio, a chydlyniant cymunedol ac ymgysylltu â'r gymuned yw'r themâu cywir i fynd i'r afael â hwy.

Hoffwn holi'r Gweinidog yn benodol am un elfen yn yr agwedd cydlyniant cymunedol ac ymgysylltu. Cyfeiriwyd eisoes at rôl mudiadau gwirfoddol, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'r Gweinidog yn cytuno y gallant gael rôl bwysig. Bydd y Gweinidog yn gwybod bod rhai mudiadau gwirfoddol bach a lleol wedi mynegi pryderon am eu hymwneud â'r sector iechyd, sy'n arbennig o wir mewn ardaloedd gwledig, oherwydd y newid o fyrddau iechyd lleol bach—a oedd â nifer o ffaelecteddau, ond a oedd yn gallu bod yn eithaf agos i'w cymunedau—i fyrddau iechyd lleol mwy sy'n gyfrifol am ardaloedd mwy o faint. Pa sicrwydd y gall y Gweinidog ei roi y bydd yn sicrhau bod byrddau iechyd lleol yn ymgysylltu'n gadarnhaol â mudiadau gwirfoddol mawr megis Tenovus, Hafal ac eraill y byddwn yn siarad amdanynt yn aml, ond yn ymgysylltu'n benodol â mudiadau gwirfoddol llai a lleol sy'n darparu gwasanaethau, gwybodaeth a newyddion hanfodol mewn ardaloedd gwledig anghysbell?

Yn ogystal, hoffwn holi ychydig yn fwy am y grŵp gweithredu yr wyf yn ei groesawu. A ydych yn barod i roi mwy o wybodaeth i'r Cynulliad am gyfansoddiad y grŵp, a sut y bydd yn ymwneud â byrddau iechyd lleol, pwy fydd yn bennaf gyfrifol am weithredu'r agenda hon, a sut y bydd yn adrodd ichi? A ydych yn barod i roi'r wybodaeth

willing to share those updates from the implementation group with the Assembly so that we can see the progress that I am convinced will be delivered?

Edwina Hart: Thank you for your comments. I think that the approach is an example of cross-portfolio working, which will have to continue as we implement the plan. Like you, I am delighted by the decision of the University of Wales to appoint a chair of rural health, which will provide an extra dynamic. In the higher education establishment, it will also establish this as an area that needs research and development. We also need to look at what has happened in other countries in terms of the development of rural health plans. An example was given in my meeting with representatives of the voluntary sector of a communication with someone in Norway about child protection and other issues. They said 'You talk about rurality issues in Wales, but you should remember the fjords that exist in Norway, and the issues surrounding extremely remote communities'. So, there is much to be gained from the academic side, not only in looking at our rural health plan, but also with regard to academic links to see how rural health develops elsewhere. The plan should be on the internet this week, and it will be published this month. I hope that Members will have the opportunity to glance through it between their Christmas pudding and mince pies, because we will make further announcements about who will chair the implementation group and its focus in the coming weeks. I will keep Members informed about that.

I take your point about community cohesion, because an emerging point of concern is the engagement of LHBs with small, localised charities and voluntary organisations. My national advisory board has been looking at the whole issue of citizen engagement, and discussion has been led by Mel Evans and Enid Rowlands about the complexity of engaging with the most disadvantaged groups that exist out there, particularly with regard to mental health. Children are also a disadvantaged group in terms of engagement, and we need to get to grips with this. My ministerial advisory board is doing further

ddiweddaraf honno am y grŵp gweithredu i'r Cynulliad fel y gallwn weld y cynnydd yr wyf yn hollol siŵr a gaiff ei wneud?

Edwina Hart: Diolch am eich sylwadau. Credaf fod y dull gweithredu'n enghraifft o weithio ar draws portffolios, a fydd yn gorfod parhau wrth inni weithredu'r cynllun. Fel chithau, yr wyf yn falch iawn o benderfyniad Prifysgol Cymru i benodi athro iechyd gwledig, a fydd yn cynnig dynameg arall. Yn y sefydliad addysg uwch, bydd hefyd yn sefydlu hwn yn faes lle mae angen ymchwil a datblygu. Mae angen inni edrych hefyd ar yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd mewn gwledydd eraill i ddatblygu cynlluniau iechyd gwledig. Rhoddwyd enghraifft, yn fy nghyfarfod â chynrychiolwyr y sector gwirfoddol, o gyfathrebu â rhywun yn Norwy ar amddiffyn plant a materion eraill. Meddent, 'Yr ydych yn sôn am broblemau ardaloedd gwledig yng Nghymru, ond dylech gofio am y fforddau yn Norwy a'r problemau gyda chymunedau eithriadol o anghysbell'. Felly, mae llawer i'w ennill o'r ochr academiaidd, nid yn unig wrth edrych ar ein cynllun iechyd gwledig ni, ond hefyd o ran cysylltiadau academiaidd i weld sut mae iechyd gwledig yn datblygu mewn mannau eraill. Dylai'r cynllun fod ar y rhyngwrdd yr wythnos hon, a chaiff ei gyhoeddi yn ystod y mis. Gobeithio y caiff yr Aelodau gyfle i fwrw golwg drosto rhwng eu pwddin Nadolig a'u mins-peis, oherwydd byddwn yn gwneud cyhoeddiadau pellach ynghylch pwy fydd yn cadeirio'r grŵp gweithredu a ffocws y grŵp hwnnw yn ystod yr wythnosau sydd i ddod. Byddaf yn sicrhau bod Aelodau'n cael y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am hynny.

Yr wyf yn derbyn eich pwynt ynghylch cydlyniant cymunedol, oherwydd un pryder sy'n dechrau dod i'r amlwg yw'r modd y mae byrddau iechyd lleol yn ymgysylltu â mudiadau gwirfoddol ac elusennau bach, lleol. Mae fy mwrdd cynghori cenedlaethol wedi bod yn edrych ar holl faes ymgysylltu â dinasyddion, ac y mae Mel Evans ac Enid Rowlands wedi bod yn arwain trafodaeth ar gymhlethdod ymgysylltu â'r grwpiau mwyaf difreintiedig yn y gymdeithas, yn enwedig o ran iechyd meddwl. Mae plant hefyd yn grŵp sydd dan anfantais o ran ymgysylltu â hwy, ac y mae angen inni fynd i'r afael â hynny.

work in that area, and I have also asked the voluntary sector to take part in a seminar about voluntary sector engagement with local health boards in the new year. The seminar will look at current experience through the attendance of voluntary sector representatives from one of the boards, together with me, the Deputy Minister for Social Services and senior officials in charge of health and social services, to see if LHBs understand where their groups are and how they must engage them in a different way. Some small groups will only be interested in engaging on the delivery of services in a tiny area—they will not want to be engaged in the macro issues, such as how a £1 billion budget in Abertawe Bro Morgannwg University Local Health Board is dealt with. So, I take your point on board, and the rural health plan as it applies to Hywel Dda Local Health Board could provide examples of best practice for other parts of Wales as a result. I will be happy to share the information with Members when I have taken a final decision on who will chair the implementation board, and on the structures that will exist underneath.

Mae'r bwrdd sy'n fy nghynghori fel gweinidog yn gwneud mwy o waith yn y maes hwnnw, ac yr wyf hefyd wedi gofyn i'r sector gwirfoddol gymryd rhan mewn seminar yn y flwyddyn newydd ar y modd y mae'r sector gwirfoddol yn ymgysylltu â byrddau iechyd lleol. Bydd y seminar yn edrych ar brofiad cyfredol trwy gyfrwng y sawl a fydd yn bresennol, sef cynrychiolwyr y sector gwirfoddol yn un o'r byrddau, a minnau, y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Wasanaethau Cymdeithasol ac uwchswyddogion sy'n gyfrifol am iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, i weld a yw byrddau iechyd lleol yn deall ble mae eu grwpiau, a sut mae'n rhaid iddynt ymgysylltu â hwy mewn ffordd wahanol. Mewn ymwneud â'r modd y darperir gwasanaethau mewn ardal fach iawn yn unig y bydd diddordeb gan rai grwpiau bach—ni fyddant am ymwneud â'r materion macro, megis sut yr ymdrinnir â chyllideb o £1 biliwn ym Mwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Abertawe Bro Morgannwg. Felly, yr wyf yn derbyn eich pwynt, ac o ganlyniad gallai'r cynllun iechyd gwledig, fel y mae'n gymwys i Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Hywel Dda, gynnig enghreifftiau o arfer gorau i rannau eraill o Gymru. Byddaf yn fodlon rhoi'r wybodaeth i Aelodau ar ôl imi benderfynu'n derfynol pwy fydd yn cadeirio'r bwrdd gweithredu, a pha strwythurau fydd yn bodoli dano.

3.10 p.m.

Peter Black: I welcome the creation of the rural health plan and the Minister's statement today. The key to providing services in rural areas, especially deep rural areas, is access and how we can drive forward improved access to those services. The Minister has put this plan on the right track by recognising that and moving that forward. While there should be no difference in the aims and intended outcomes for patients living in rural locations, we must be aware that, sometimes, there needs to be a slightly more planned approach as to how strategies will be delivered in areas that may be further away from the services that we expect to find in urban areas. I was pleased that the Minister acknowledged that earlier.

Peter Black: Yr wyf yn croesawu creu cynllun iechyd gwledig a datganiad y Gweinidog heddiw. Yr allwedd i ddarparu gwasanaethau mewn ardaloedd gwledig, yn enwedig ardaloedd gwledig anghysbell, yw mynediad, a sut y gallwn hybu gwell mynediad i'r gwasanaethau hynny. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi rhoi'r cynllun hwn ar y trywydd iawn trwy gydnabod hynny a symud hynny yn ei flaen. Er na ddylai'r nodau a'r canlyniadau a fwriedir fod yn wahanol ar gyfer cleifion sy'n byw mewn lleoliadau gwledig, rhaid inni sylweddoli bod angen dull wedi'i gynllunio'n fwy weithiau, o ran sut y caiff strategaethau eu darparu mewn ardaloedd a all fod ymhellach o'r gwasanaethau y disgwyliwn eu gweld mewn ardaloedd trefol. Yr oeddwn yn falch bod y Gweinidog wedi cydnabod hynny'n gynharach.

Communities are focused upon in the consultation and that is welcome. Services must be planned around people, if there is to be any hope of improving what the Government is able to deliver. If you were to talk to anyone on the street, they would express a wish to have their health services as close as possible to where they live. Whereas that may be possible in cities such as Swansea or Cardiff, when you get into rural Powys, Ceredigion, Gwynedd or Pembrokeshire, that is not the case, and we must find solutions to deal with that. The recent report by the Health, Wellbeing and Local Government Committee on community mental health services, which we will discuss later today, highlighted an example of this by recognising that some thought needs to be given as to how this strategy will address access to mental health services for those living further away. I would be interested to hear the Minister outline her thoughts on how that particular issue will be dealt with.

We also know that a number of challenges face the Government in rural areas, particularly on the ambulance service. Ambulance response times in Powys have consistently been the worst in Wales. There are a number of reasons for that, but rurality and the distances involved are significant among them, and we need to find a way to continue to drive forward improvements on that.

I also noticed that, in response to Andrew R.T. Davies, the Minister referred to the voluntary sector and, in particular, to the initiative taken by Tenovus to deliver remote chemotherapy services. I had the pleasure, as did other Members, of seeing that van parked outside the Assembly a few weeks ago and talking to the people who deliver that service. It is true to say that that service is being delivered in south Wales, but not yet in the rural areas of Powys, Ceredigion and similar areas, where it is badly needed. Given that the capital cost of that van was paid for by the charity, although I understand the staff are from Velindre NHS Trust, does the Minister have any plans to provide funding to

Mae'r ymgynghoriad yn canolbwyntio ar gymunedau, ac y mae hynny i'w groesawu. Rhaid i wasanaethau gael eu cynllunio o amgylch pobl, os oes rhyw obaith o wella'r hyn y mae'r Llywodraeth yn gallu'i gyflawni. Pe baech yn siarad ag unrhyw un ar y stryd, byddai'n mynegi dymuniad i gael ei gwasanaethau iechyd mor agos ag sy'n bosibl i'r fan lle mae'n byw. Tra bydd hynny'n bosibl mewn dinasoedd megis Abertawe neu Gaerdydd, efallai, nid yw hynny'n wir pan ewch i ardaloedd gwledig Powys, Ceredigion, Gwynedd neu Sir Benfro, a rhaid inni gael atebion i ymdrin â hynny. Yr oedd yr adroddiad yn ddiweddar gan y Pwyllgor Iechyd, Lles a Llywodraeth Leol ar wasanaethau iechyd meddwl cymunedol, y byddwn yn ei drafod yn hwyrach heddiw, yn tynnu sylw at enghraifft o hyn trwy gydnabod bod angen ystyried sut y bydd y strategaeth hon yn mynd i'r afael â gallu cael gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl i'r rheini sy'n byw ymhellach i ffwrdd. Hoffwn glywed y Gweinidog yn amlinellu ei syniadau sut y bydd y mater penodol hwnnw'n cael sylw.

Gwyddom hefyd fod y Llywodraeth yn wynebu nifer o heriau mewn ardaloedd gwledig, yn enwedig o ran y gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Gwelwyd yn gyson mai ym Mhowys y mae amseroedd ymateb y gwasanaeth ambiwlans ar eu gwaethaf yng Nghymru. Mae nifer o resymau am hynny, ond mae natur wledig yr ardal a'r pellteroedd teithio yn rhesymau pwysig yn eu plith, ac y mae angen inni gael ffordd i barhau i hybu gwelliannau yn hynny o beth.

Sylwais hefyd fod y Gweinidog, wrth ymateb i Andrew R.T. Davies, wedi cyfeirio at y sector gwirfoddol, ac yn benodol at y fenter a gyflwynwyd gan Tenovus i fynd â gwasanaethau cemotherapi i ardaloedd anghysbell. Fel Aelodau eraill, cefais innau'r pleser o weld y fan wedi'i pharcio y tu allan i'r Cynulliad ychydig wythnosau'n ôl, ac o siarad â'r bobl sy'n darparu'r gwasanaeth hwnnw. Mae'n wir dweud bod y gwasanaeth hwnnw'n cael ei ddarparu yn y de, ond nid yn ardaloedd gwledig Powys, Ceredigion ac ardaloedd tebyg eto, lle mae ei angen yn ddirfawr. O gofio mai'r elusen a dalodd gost cyfalaf y fan honno, er fy mod ar ddeall bod y staff yn dod o Ymddiriedolaeth GIG

expand that service into more rural areas such as Powys around Wales to ensure that patients who are in need of chemotherapy are able to receive it as close to their doorsteps as possible? We all recognise that chemotherapy is a particularly drastic form of medicine and travelling long distances to receive it and travelling back again is not a desirable outcome. We need to find ways of spreading that initiative further into the more remote areas of Wales than it is reaching at present. I would be grateful if the Minister could deal with those issues.

Edwina Hart: Peter made an extremely valid point that was almost about the difference between rural and deep rural areas, and how you define rurality. Looking at the Powys situation, we could get services into community hospitals, but there will be part of Powys and other parts of Wales where even accessing a community hospital means a lengthy journey, especially if you are having chemotherapy or dealing with other issues. That is why it is key, with rural health, that there is a planned and systematic approach to dealing with people who live in some of these villages, how their appointments are dealt with, when and where they go to see their consultants and other people and what is convenient for them. That will be the challenge with implementation, because our focus will have to be at that level, namely on the patient and the community, not just on the generality of how we provide particular services.

Having services as close to the doorstep as possible is a key issue. There is a safety issue involved in how we provide services. It is sometimes difficult to explain to individuals that you cannot provide a service somewhere because it will not be a safe and secure service, but, through the rural health plan, we have to put other mechanisms in place for people to be easily able to attend an appointment and get a particular treatment.

On Powys, you made valid points regarding

Felindre, a oes gan y Gweinidog unrhyw gynlluniau i ddarparu cyllid i ehangu'r gwasanaeth hwnnw i ardaloedd mwy gwledig yng Nghymru megis Powys, er mwyn sicrhau bod cleifion y mae arnynt angen cemotherapi yn gallu ei gael mor agos i'w cartrefi ag sy'n bosibl? Yr ydym i gyd yn cydnabod bod cemotherapi'n fath cryf iawn o feddyginiaeth, ac nad yw teithio pellter mawr i'w gael, a theithio'n ôl adref wedyn, yn sefyllfa ddymunol. Mae angen inni gael ffyrdd i fynd â'r fenter honno ymhellach i ardaloedd mwy anghysbell Cymru nad yw'r eu cyrraedd ar hyn o bryd. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe bai'r Gweinidog yn gallu ymdrin â'r materion hynny.

Edwina Hart: Gwnaeth Peter bwynt eithriadol o ddilys, a oedd yn ymwneud bron â'r gwahaniaeth rhwng ardaloedd gwledig ac ardaloedd gwledig anghysbell, a sut mae diffinio natur wledig ardal. O edrych ar sefyllfa Powys, galledd ddarparu gwasanaethau mewn ysbytai cymunedol, ond bydd rhan o Bowys a rhannau eraill o Gymru lle mae cyrraedd ysbyty cymunedol hyd yn oed yn golygu taith hir, yn enwedig os ydych yn cael cemotherapi neu'n ymdrin â phroblemau eraill. Dyna pam mae'n hollbwysig, yn achos iechyd gwledig, inni gael dull systematig wedi'i gynllunio o ymdrin â phobl sy'n byw yn rhai o'r pentrefi hyn, ac inni ymdrin â'r modd y caiff eu hapwyntiadau eu trefnu, ble a phryd y maent yn gweld eu meddygon ymgynghorol a phobl eraill, a beth sy'n gyfleus iddynt. Dyna fydd yr her wrth weithredu'r cynllun, oherwydd bydd yn rhaid inni ganolbwyntio ar y lefel honno, sef y claf a'r gymuned, nid ar gyffredinolrwydd darparu gwasanaethau penodol yn unig.

Mae cael gwasanaethau mor agos i gartrefi pobl ag sy'n bosibl yn fater allweddol. Mae diogelwch yn fater wrth drafod sut yr ydym yn darparu gwasanaethau. Weithiau mae'n anodd egluro wrth unigolion na ellir darparu gwasanaeth mewn man penodol am na fydd yn wasanaeth diogel, ond, trwy'r cynllun iechyd gwledig, rhaid inni roi systemau eraill ar waith er mwyn i bobl allu mynd i apwyntiadau a chael triniaeth benodol yn rhwydd.

O ran Powys, gwnaethoch bwyntiau dilys

the ambulance service, and just this morning I was discussing with Stuart Fletcher, the chair of the ambulance trust, the possibility of looking at a more innovative approach. I will write to local Members at the beginning of next week, inviting them to attend various meetings to discuss some of the issues around the ambulance service in Powys, which are not just about the first responder, but also the second and the third responder. I hope that the strategic discussions ongoing between my department and the ambulance trust will enable us to make progress in that area in the coming months.

There are wider issues with service delivery. If we can provide dialysis in general practitioner surgeries, and chemotherapy in community hospitals, there is no reason why we cannot look at an extension of these services. Like you, I was impressed by the Tenovus project, but I have to look at roll-out across Wales within the financial context for my department. It is not that I am hostile to any of these developments, because I think that they are the future in taking services out and about.

With regard to the reports that have been prepared by Assembly committees and others on rural health services, I will ask the implementation group to look at those reports. For instance, it will have to look strategically at adult mental health services as part of the implementation of the rural health plan. I will ask the group to look at all of the reports to see how they impact on the rural health plan and its implementation, so that we can ensure a holistic approach to health in rural Wales. I do not underestimate the task facing this implementation group, and I suggest to Members that, when I have appointed the chair of that group, he or she could come to the Assembly and meet with Members to discuss the direction of travel, and ways in which Members feel they could help given their experience in these matters.

Kirsty Williams: Thank you, Minister, for

ynghylch y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, ac mor ddiweddar â'r bore yma yr oeddwn yn trafod gyda Stuart Fletcher, cadeirydd yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans, y posibilrwydd o edrych ar ddull gweithredu mwy blaengar. Byddaf yn ysgrifennu at Aelodau lleol ddechrau'r wythnos nesaf, i'w gwahodd i ddod i amrywiol gyfarfodydd i drafod rhai o'r problemau'n ymwneud â'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans ym Mhowys nad ydynt yn ymwneud â'r ymatebydd cyntaf yn unig, ond â'r ail a'r trydydd ymatebydd hefyd. Gobeithio y bydd y trafodaethau strategol sy'n mynd ymlaen rhwng fy adran i a'r ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans yn ein galluogi i wneud cynnydd yn y maes hwnnw yn ystod y misoedd i ddod.

Mae yna broblemau ehangach o ran darparu gwasanaethau. Os gallwn ddarparu dialysis mewn meddygyfeydd meddygon teulu, a chemotherapi mewn ysbytai cymunedol, nid oes rheswm pam na allwn ystyried ehangu'r gwasanaethau hyn. Fel chithau, yr oeddwn yn llawn edmygedd o brosiect Tenovus, ond rhaid imi ystyried ehangu'r gwasanaeth i weddill Cymru yng nghyd-destun ariannol fy adran. Nid wyf yn gwrthwynebu'r un o'r datblygiadau hyn, oherwydd credaf mai dyna fydd y drefn yn y dyfodol wrth fynd â gwasanaethau i'r gymuned.

O ran yr adroddiadau sydd wedi'u paratoi gan bwyllgorau'r Cynulliad ac eraill ar wasanaethau iechyd gwledig, byddaf yn gofyn i'r grŵp gweithredu edrych ar yr adroddiadau hynny. Er enghraifft, bydd yn rhaid iddo edrych yn strategol ar wasanaethau iechyd meddwl oedolion fel rhan o weithredu'r cynllun iechyd gwledig. Byddaf yn gofyn i'r grŵp edrych ar yr holl adroddiadau i weld sut maent yn effeithio ar y cynllun iechyd gwledig a'i weithredu, fel y gallwn sicrhau dull cyfannol o ymdrin ag iechyd yng Nghymru wledig. Yr wyf yn llawn sylweddoli maint y dasg sy'n wynebu'r grŵp gweithredu hwn, ac awgrymaf wrth yr Aelodau, pan fyddaf wedi penodi cadeirydd y grŵp hwnnw, y gallai ef neu hi ddod i'r Cynulliad i gwrdd ag Aelodau a thrafod y cyfeiriad yr ydym yn mynd iddo, a ffyrdd y mae Aelodau'n teimlo y gallent helpu o gofio'u profiad yn y materion hyn.

Kirsty Williams: Diolch, Weinidog, am eich

your statement this afternoon. You referred to the important role that community hospitals play, so could you restate your commitment to those facilities? There is a great deal of concern about the future of Bronllys Hospital. We accept that change is necessary, but that should not be before alternative service provision is in place.

Secondly, your statement mentioned the work at Builth Wells, but, as you know, we have had endless meetings and papers, and we know what the community wants—we just need to get on and build it. When can the people of Builth Wells expect a new health and social care facility?

Edwina Hart: Like you, I have been concerned about the level of chat in Powys between the various agencies about how we will deliver in Builth Wells. I have spoken to my senior officials and now intend to kick-start the process by putting one of them in to deal with the issues. We have to see developments there soon—we have had enough talk. That also means that we need to kick-start work on how community services will be provided and on the joining-up of those services. The local health board and the local authority have a good relationship, but that now has to result in something concrete that delivers services locally. We can talk endlessly about the governance structures of new bodies, but the people are not interested in that—they are interested in how this new service will work. Hopefully, in the new year, a team will be put in place to help with the developments in Builth. We will, of course, work in partnership with the LHB and local government, but I think that we need to get things moving.

On Bronllys, I have been disturbed by some of the rumours that have reached me. I have made it quite clear to the LHB and its chief executive that we must have alternative provision in place before the community hospital is closed. Most people know that some of these community hospitals are not

datganiad y prynhawn yma. Yr oeddech yn cyfeirio at rôl bwysig ysbytai cymunedol, felly, a allech ailddatgan eich ymrwymiad i'r cyfleusterau hynny? Mae llawer iawn o bryder am ddyfodol Ysbyty Bronllys. Yr ydym yn derbyn ei bod yn rhaid wrth newid, ond ni ddylai hynny ddigwydd cyn sefydlu darpariaeth amgen o ran gwasanaethau.

Yn ail, yr oedd eich datganiad yn crybwyll y gwaith yn Llanfair-ym-Muallt, ond fel y gwyddoch yr ydym wedi cael cyfarfodydd a phapurau dirifedi, a gwyddom beth yw dymuniad y gymuned—y cyfan sy'n weddill inni ei wneud yw bwrw ymlaen â'r gwaith adeiladu. Pryd y gall pobl Llanfair-ym-Muallt ddisgwyl cael cyfleuster iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol newydd?

Edwina Hart: Yr wyf fi, fel chithau, wedi bod yn poeni ynghylch yr holl siarad rhwng gwahanol asiantaethau ym Mhowys am y modd y byddwn yn sicrhau canlyniadau yn Llanfair-ym-Muallt. Yr wyf wedi siarad â'm huwch-swyddogion, ac yn awr bwriadaf roi hwb i'r broses trwy benodi un ohonynt i ymdrin â'r problemau. Rhaid inni weld datblygiadau yno cyn hir—yr ydym wedi siarad digon. Mae hynny'n golygu hefyd fod angen inni roi hwb i'r gwaith o ystyried sut y caiff gwasanaethau cymunedol eu darparu a sicrhau bod y gwasanaethau hynny wedi'u cydgysylltu. Mae gan y bwrdd iechyd lleol a'r awdurdod lleol berthynas dda, ond rhaid i hynny esgor ar rywbeth pendant yn awr, sy'n darparu gwasanaethau'n lleol. Gallwn siarad yn ddiddiwedd am strwythurau llywodraethu cyrff newydd, ond nid oes gan bobl ddiddordeb yn hynny—eu diddordeb yw gwybod sut y bydd y gwasanaeth newydd hwn yn gweithio. Gobeithio, yn y flwyddyn newydd, y bydd tîm yn cael ei ffurfio i helpu gyda'r datblygiadau yn Llanfair-ym-Muallt. Wrth gwrs, byddwn yn gweithio mewn partneriaeth â'r bwrdd iechyd lleol a llywodraeth leol, ond credaf fod angen inni gael pethau i symud.

O ran Bronllys, mae rhai o'r sïon yr wyf wedi'u clywed wedi peri pryder imi. Yr wyf wedi dweud yn glir iawn wrth y bwrdd iechyd lleol a'i brif weithredwr ei bod yn rhaid inni roi darpariaeth amgen ar waith cyn i'r ysbyty cymunedol gau. Mae'r mwyafrif o bobl yn gwybod nad yw rhai o'r ysbytai

necessarily fit for purpose, but they love and respect them and know the staff—they have had good care in those hospitals, and sometimes their families have been going back and forth to those hospitals for as long as 50 years. I understand the financial pressures within the NHS, and how sometimes, as a result of those pressures, it wants to rush into decisions. However, at the end of the day, that costs more money because there is more public dispute and more angst, and it would have been better to have thought things through more carefully, recognising that people are distrustful of change and need to see an alternative in place before the change occurs.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you for that statement, Minister. Are you prepared to go on to the next one?

Edwina Hart: I am. Thank you, Presiding Officer.

3.20 p.m.

Datganiad: Y Wybodaeth Ddiweddaraf am Ffliw Moch Statement: Update on Swine Influenza

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Edwina Hart): This statement updates Members on the latest developments in respect of the influenza A(H1N1) swine flu pandemic. The latest general practitioner consultation rates in Wales for flu-like illness have decreased and are now steady, although still a little above the usual rates for the time of year. On 26 November, 77 people were in hospital with swine flu, with 14 of those in critical care. We must all continue to be vigilant as swine flu still poses a serious threat and is affecting groups of the population, such as young children and pregnant women, who are not usually particularly at risk from seasonal flu. We must also remember that our traditional flu season does not normally arrive until January and February.

The advice that I have received suggests that the second wave of the pandemic in the UK

cymunedol hyn o reidrwydd yn addas at y diben, ond maent yn hoff iawn ohonynt ac yn eu parchu ac yn adnabod y staff—maent wedi cael gofal da yn yr ysbytai hyn, ac weithiau mae eu teuluoedd wedi bod yn mynd yn ôl ac ymlaen yno ers cyhyd â 50 mlynedd. Yr wyf yn deall y pwysau ariannol sydd ar y GIG, a sut mae'n dymuno gwneud penderfyniadau'n gyflym weithiau, oherwydd y pwysau hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny'n fwy costus yn y pen draw, oherwydd bydd mwy o ddadlau ymhlith y cyhoedd a mwy o ofid, ac y mae'n well meddwl am bethau'n fwy gofalus, gan dderbyn bod pobl yn amheus ynghylch newid a bod angen iddynt weld bod darpariaeth amgen ar gael cyn i'r newid ddigwydd.

Y Llywydd: Diolch am eich datganiad, Weinidog. A ydych yn barod i symud ymlaen i'r un nesaf?

Edwina Hart: Ydw. Diolch, Lywydd.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Edwina Hart): Mae'r datganiad hwn yn rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i Aelodau am y datblygiadau diweddaraf o ran pandemig y fflw moch fflw A(H1N1). Mae'r cyfraddau diweddaraf yng Nghymru o ran ymgynghori â meddyg teulu ynghylch salwch tebyg i fflw wedi gostwng ac wedi sefydlogi erbyn hyn, ond yn dal ychydig yn uwch na'r cyfraddau arferol am yr adeg hon o'r flwyddyn. Ar 26 Tachwedd yr oedd 77 o bobl yn yr ysbyty oherwydd y fflw moch, a 14 o'r rheini mewn gofal critigol. Rhaid inni bob un barhau'n wyliadwrus gan fod y fflw moch yn fygythiad difrifol o hyd, ac yn effeithio ar grwpiau o'r boblogaeth, megis plant ifanc a menywod beichiog, nad ydynt mewn perygl o gael fflw tymhorol fel rheol. Rhaid inni gofio hefyd nad yw ein tymor fflw traddodiadol yn arfer cyrraedd tan fis Ionawr a mis Chwefror.

Mae'r cyngor a gefais yn awgrymu y gallai ail don y pandemig yn y DU fod bron ar ben,

may be nearly at an end, and, in the vast majority of cases, people are recovering well. However, we are likely to continue to see people experiencing severe complications, admission to critical care facilities and more deaths. There have now been 23 deaths in Wales, and, even with a reducing incidence of swine flu, it is inevitable that the number will continue to increase over time.

The first phase of delivery of the vaccination programme has been progressing well, and I would like to thank all primary care and national health service staff for their efforts in planning and mobilising the programme quickly and effectively. We expect to have swine flu vaccine uptake figures shortly. Indications are that there has been a positive response from those invited to have vaccination as a priority. Optimising the vaccination of the clinically at risk groups remains our highest priority, but we will be extending the programme to offer the vaccine to all healthy children over six months and under five years of age. That decision is supported by the advice from the Joint Committee on Vaccination and Immunisation. Evidence shows that young children are currently suffering the greatest overall impact from the disease. They are particularly vulnerable to complications and are more likely to become seriously ill and to need hospital treatment than any other group. The clinical attack rate is also higher, meaning that a greater proportion of children will become ill. Vaccinating as many children in this age group as possible will give them the best possible protection against swine flu.

The chief medical officer and the chief executive of NHS Wales recently wrote to the health service in Wales outlining details of phase 2 of the vaccination programme. While we have still to finalise the logistics of how the vaccine will be delivered to children over six months and under five years of age, we expect that general practitioners will want to continue to be a key component in the delivery of vaccines to young children. Along with the other UK health departments, we are

ac yn y mwyafrif helaeth o achosion mae pobl yn gwella'n dda. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn debygol o barhau i weld pobl yn cael cymhlethdodau difrifol, yn cael eu derbyn i gyfleusterau gofal critigol, ac yn marw. Mae 23 o bobl wedi marw yng Nghymru erbyn hyn, a hyd yn oed wrth i nifer yr achosion o'r fflw moch leihau, mae'n anochel y bydd nifer y marwolaethau'n parhau i gynyddu gydag amser.

Mae'r cam cyntaf i gyflwyno'r rhaglen frechu wedi bod yn mynd rhagddo'n dda, a hoffwn ddiolch i'r holl staff yn y sector gofal sylfaenol a'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol am eu hymdrechion wrth gynllunio a gweithredu'r rhaglen yn gyflym ac yn effeithiol. Disgwylwn gael ffigurau am nifer y bobl sydd wedi cael brechlyn y fflw moch yn fuan. Mae'r arwyddion yn dangos ymateb cadarnhaol gan bobl a wahoddwyd i gael eu brechu fel mater o flaenoriaeth. Ein blaenoriaeth bennaf o hyd yw sicrhau bod cynifer o bobl ag sy'n bosibl yn cael eu brechu yn y grwpiau sydd mewn perygl o safbwynt clinigol, ond byddwn yn ymestyn y rhaglen i gynnig y brechlyn i bob plentyn iach dros chwe mis oed a than bum mlwydd oed. Cefnogir y penderfyniad hwnnw gan gyngor y Cydbwyllgor ar Imiwneiddio a Brechu. Mae'r dystiolaeth yn dangos mai plant ifanc sy'n dioddef yr effaith gyffredinol fwyaf oherwydd y clefyd ar hyn o bryd. Maent yn hynod agored i gymhlethdodau ac yn fwy tebygol na'r un grŵp arall o fynd yn ddifrifol sâl a bod mewn sefyllfa lle mae arnynt angen triniaeth ysbyty. Mae cyfradd y pyliau clinigol yn uwch hefyd, sy'n golygu y bydd cyfran fwy o blant yn mynd yn sâl. Bydd brechu cynifer o blant ag sy'n bosibl yn y grŵp oed hwn yn sicrhau eu bod yn cael eu diogelu gystal ag y bo modd rhag y fflw moch.

Yn ddiweddar, ysgrifennodd y prif swyddog meddygol a phrif weithredwr GIG Cymru at y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru gan amlinellu manylion cam 2 yn y rhaglen frechu. Er nad ydym eto wedi cwblhau'r logisteg o ran sut y caiff y brechlyn ei roi i blant dros chwe mis oed a than bum mlwydd oed, disgwylwn y bydd meddygon teulu am barhau i fod yn elfen allweddol yn y broses o roi brechlynnau i blant ifanc. Ynghyd ag adrannau iechyd eraill y DU, yr ydym wrthi'n

currently working with the General Practitioners Committee and NHS organisations to agree exactly how this will take place. We have also taken note of the JCVI advice that the vaccination of the main carers of older and disabled people, whose welfare may be at risk if their carer falls ill, should be an important next step. Carers have considerable ongoing responsibilities for the health and welfare of others and look after vulnerable people who need to be protected from the risk of infection. We are therefore discussing how best to implement this service with carers' organisations to establish a sensible approach before communicating further detail on how the programme will work.

Members will have seen the media coverage around the safety of the vaccine for pregnant women. The CMO advises that it is very important that when a pregnant woman is invited to receive vaccination she does so, in order to protect herself and her unborn child. Pregnant women who contract swine flu are four times more likely to suffer from serious complications than women of the same age who are not pregnant. The Royal College of Obstetricians and Gynaecologists has looked at the evidence on the safety of flu vaccines in pregnancy, and supports pregnant women receiving the vaccination. Women who delay vaccination until the baby is delivered are putting themselves at increased risk. Advice for pregnant women on swine flu is available from the Welsh Assembly Government website.

Members will be aware that person-to-person spread of a strain of swine flu resistant to Tamiflu has been found in Wales. The CMO has advised that the emergence of influenza A viruses that are resistant to Tamiflu is not unexpected in patients with serious underlying conditions and suppressed immune systems. There have been more than 70 reports of Tamiflu-resistant strains worldwide. Eight patients on a unit treating patients with severe underlying health conditions at the University Hospital of Wales, Cardiff, have been diagnosed with swine flu resistant to Tamiflu. Three appear to have acquired the infection in hospital. All patients diagnosed with Tamiflu-resistant swine flu on the unit have been treated with

gweithio gyda'r Pwyllgor Meddygon Teulu a sefydliadau'r GIG i gytuno ar yr union ffordd y bydd hynny'n digwydd. Yn ogystal, yr ydym wedi ystyried cyngor y Cydbwyllgor ar lmiwneiddio a Brechu y dylai brechu prif ofalwyr pobl hŷn ac anabl, y gallai eu lles fod mewn perygl pe bai eu gofalwr yn mynd yn sâl, fod yn gam nesaf pwysig. Mae gan ofalwyr gyfrifoldebau parhaus sylweddol am iechyd a lles pobl eraill, ac y maent yn gofalu am bobl sy'n agored i niwed ac sydd ag angen eu diogelu rhag perygl haint. Yr ydym felly'n trafod y ffordd orau i weithredu'r gwasanaeth hwn gyda sefydliadau gofalwyr, er mwyn pennu dull synhwyrol o weithredu cyn rhannu mwy o fanylion am y modd y bydd y rhaglen yn gweithio.

Bydd Aelodau wedi gweld y sylw yn y cyfryngau i ddiogelwch y brechlyn i fenywod beichiog. Mae'r prif swyddog meddygol yn cynghori ei bod yn bwysig iawn i fenyw feichiog gael ei brechu, pan gaiff ei gwahodd i wneud hynny, i'w diogelu ei hun a'i baban sydd heb ei eni. Mae menywod beichiog sy'n cael y fflw moch bedair gwaith yn fwy tebygol o gael cymhlethdodau difrifol na menywod o'r un oed nad ydynt yn feichiog. Mae Coleg Brenhinol yr Obstetryddion a'r Gynaecolegwyr wedi edrych ar y dystiolaeth ar ddiogelwch brechlynnau fflw yn ystod bechiogrwydd, ac y mae o blaid i fenywod beichiog gael eu brechu. Mae menywod sy'n gohirio'r brechu nes ar ôl geni'r baban yn eu rhoi eu hunain mewn mwy o berygl. Mae cyngor i fenywod beichiog ar y fflw moch i'w gael ar wefan Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Bydd Aelodau'n ymwybodol fod math o'r fflw moch sy'n gwrthsefyll Tamiflu ac sy'n ymledu o berson i berson wedi'i ddarganfod yng Nghymru. Dywedodd y prif swyddog meddygol nad yw ymddangosiad feirysau fflw A sy'n gwrthsefyll Tamiflu yn annisgwyl mewn cleifion sydd ag anhwylderau gwaelodol difrifol a systemau imiwneidd isel. Cafwyd dros 70 adroddiad am fathau o fflw sy'n gwrthsefyll Tamiflu ledled y byd. Gwelwyd bod fflw moch sy'n gwrthsefyll Tamiflu ar wyth claf mewn uned sy'n trin cleifion ag anhwylderau gwaelodol difrifol yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru, Caerdydd. Ymddengys fod tri ohonynt wedi cael yr haint yn yr ysbyty. Mae pob claf yn yr uned sydd â fflw moch sy'n gwrthsefyll

an alternative antiviral and all other patients on the unit have been tested for swine flu. Three of the patients remain in hospital, with one in critical care; the others are being treated in isolation on the unit. All patients are responding well to treatment, and there is no evidence of spread of the Tamiflu-resistant strain of swine flu outside the unit.

Patients have been isolated or are being cared for in areas designated for influenza care, and Cardiff and Vale University Local Health Board has ensured that all appropriate infection control measures are in place on the unit. Patients and staff at the unit have been offered swine flu vaccination, while patients due to come into the unit for treatment are being advised to have the vaccination from their GP in advance of coming into hospital. Advice that I have received suggests that the resistant strain of swine flu does not appear to be any more severe than the swine flu virus that has been circulating since April. We know that people with suppressed immune systems are more susceptible to the swine flu virus, which is why they are a priority group in the first phase of the vaccination programme in Wales. Treatment with Tamiflu is still appropriate for swine flu and people should continue to take Tamiflu when prescribed it.

It remains vital at this time to continue to stress the importance of key public health messages such as good hand hygiene and the importance of vaccination in our fight against swine flu. To this end, a further communications campaign to promote the uptake of swine flu vaccination begins in Wales and the campaigns include targeted communications to various audiences through radio, press and public relations activity.

The CMO and I continue to meet representatives of the professional groups monthly. We are reassured that primary and secondary care services are coping with the demands of the pandemic and that professional bodies support our approach. We see additional pressures on NHS services

Tamiflu wedi'i drin â chyffur gwrthfeiryisol arall, ac y mae pob claf arall yn yr uned wedi cael prawf am y fflw moch. Mae tri o'r cleifion yn dal yn yr ysbyty ac un o'r rheini mewn gofal critigol; mae'r lleill yn cael eu trin ar wahân i gleifion eraill yn yr uned. Mae pob claf yn ymateb yn dda i driniaeth, ac nid oes tystiolaeth fod y math o fflw moch sy'n gwrthsefyll Tamiflu wedi ymledu y tu allan i'r uned.

Caiff y cleifion eu cadw ar wahân i gleifion eraill, neu gael gofal mewn mannau sydd wedi'u dynodi ar gyfer gofal fflw, ac y mae Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Caerdydd a'r Fro wedi sicrhau bod yr holl fesurau priodol ar gyfer rheoli haint ar waith yn yr uned. Cynigiwyd brechiad y fflw moch i gleifion a staff yr uned, ac y mae cleifion y mae disgwyl iddynt ddod i'r uned i gael triniaeth yn cael eu cynghori i gael eu brechu gan eu meddyg teulu cyn dod i'r ysbyty. Mae'r cyngor a gefais yn awgrymu nad yw'r math o fflw moch sy'n gwrthsefyll Tamiflu fel pe bai'n fwy difrifol na feirws y fflw moch sydd wedi bod ar led ers mis Ebrill. Gwyddom fod pobl sydd â systemau imiwedd isel yn fwy tueddol o gael feirws y fflw moch, a dyna pam y maent yn grŵp blaenoriaeth yng ngham cyntaf y rhaglen frechu yng Nghymru. Mae triniaeth Tamiflu yn dal yn briodol i'r fflw moch, a dylai pobl barhau i gymryd Tamiflu pan gaiff ei ragnodi iddynt.

Mae'n dal yn hanfodol ar hyn o bryd i barhau i bwysleisio pwysigrwydd negeseuon allweddol ar iechyd cyhoeddus, megis golchi'r dwylo a phwysigrwydd brechu yn ein brwydr yn erbyn y fflw moch. I'r perwyl hwn, mae ymgyrch gyfathrebu bellach i hyrwyddo nifer y bobl sy'n cael brechiad fflw moch yn dechrau yng Nghymru, ac y mae'r ymgyrchoedd yn cynnwys negeseuon sy'n anelu at amrywiol gynulleidfaedd trwy'r radio, y wasg a gweithgarwch cysylltiadau cyhoeddus.

Mae'r prif swyddog meddygol a minnau'n parhau i gyfarfod â chynrychiolwyr y grwpiau proffesiynol bob mis. Yr ydym wedi cael sicrwydd bod gwasanaethau gofal sylfaenol ac eilaidd yn ymdopi â galwadau'r pandemig, a bod cyrff proffesiynol yn cefnogi ein dull gweithredu. Gwelwn bwysau

each winter and we are well placed to manage them. I will continue to report regularly to the Assembly on these matters and will keep Members informed over the recess if there are significant changes to the current situation.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Thank you, Minister, for your update on swine flu. We must always remember that, sadly, deaths have occurred due to swine flu. Mercifully, the outbreak has not penetrated into the population as greatly we had anticipated, but, sadly, there have been the 24 deaths that you highlighted in your statement. That is a tragedy that has arrived at the doorstep of the families involved, and I am sure that our thoughts are with them.

I will now move on to deal with the specifics of your statement. Various things have happened since your last statement on this to Plenary, Minister, but, thankfully, the spike in the autumn has not been as big as it had been projected to be. That is not to say that it might not come back as winter progresses, but, given the demands that could have been placed on services, which you touched upon at the end of your statement, are you content that no service should be using the swine flu epidemic or the potential epidemic to excuse problems with service delivery, and that, as you have put it, services are coping and are meeting the demands that have been placed upon them?

Secondly, you mentioned the Tamiflu-resistant outbreak at the University Hospital of Wales. There are many things that countries aspire to be first in, but it is regrettable that we were the first to have that situation in one of our hospitals. However, credit is due to the staff and the organisation for how they responded; the situation was contained. Are you happy with the lines of communications that have developed with the World Health Organization, with your colleagues in the other devolved administrations, and Westminster to ensure that, when situations such as this do arise—we must remember that the flu virus mutates—that the lines of communications are good, people have confidence in them and

ychwanegol ar wasanaethau'r GIG bob gaeaf, ac yr ydym mewn sefyllfa dda i'w rheoli. Byddaf yn dal i roi adroddiadau'n rheolaidd i'r Cynulliad ar y materion hyn, a byddaf yn rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i Aelodau dros y toriad os bydd newidiadau sylweddol yn y sefyllfa bresennol.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Diolch, Weinidog, am y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y ffliw moch. Rhaid inni gofio bob amser fod pobl, yn anffodus, wedi marw o'r ffliw moch. Trwy drugaredd, nid yw'r ffliw wedi effeithio ar gymaint o'r boblogaeth â'r disgwyl, ond yn anffodus mae 24 o bobl wedi marw, fel y dywedasoch yn eich datganiad. Mae hynny'n drychineb i'r teuluoedd dan sylw, ac yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod yn meddwl amdanant.

Hoffwn symud ymlaen yn awr i ymdrin â manylion eich datganiad. Mae amryw bethau wedi digwydd ers eich datganiad diwethaf ar y mater hwn i'r Cyfarfod Llawn, Weinidog. Ond trwy drugaredd nid oedd y cynnydd yn nifer yr achosion yn ystod yr hydref gymaint â'r disgwyl. Nid yw hynny'n golygu na allai ddychwelyd wrth i'r gaeaf fynd rhagddo, ond o gofio'r galwadau a allai fod wedi bod ar wasanaethau, fel y crybwyllwyd gennych ar ddiwedd eich datganiad, a ydych yn hapus na ddylai'r un gwasanaeth fod yn defnyddio epidemig y ffliw moch neu'r epidemig posibl i esgusodi problemau wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau, a bod gwasanaethau, fel y dywedasoch, yn ymdopi ac yn ateb y galwadau sydd wedi bod arnynt?

Yn ail, soniech am yr achosion sy'n gwrthsefyll Tamiflu yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru. Bydd gwledydd yn dyheu am fod y cyntaf i wneud llawer o bethau, ond mae'n resynus mai ni oedd y cyntaf i gael y sefyllfa honno yn un o'n hysbytai. Fodd bynnag, dylid canmol y staff a'r sefydliad am y ffordd yr ymatebwyd; cafodd y sefyllfa ei rheoli. A ydych yn hapus â'r llinellau cyfathrebu sydd wedi eu datblygu gyda'r Sefydliad Iechyd y Byd, eich cydweithwyr mewn gweinyddiaethau datganoledig eraill, a San Steffan i sicrhau, pan fydd sefyllfaoedd fel hyn yn codi—rhaid inni gofio bod feirws y ffliw yn mwtadu—fod y llinellau cyfathrebu'n dda, bod gan bobl ffydd ynddynt a bod modd lleihau gymaint ag sy'n

that scaremongering can be kept to a minimum. It is good, reliable information that the public wants, rather than hyperactivity and people running around like headless chickens.

Moving on to the facilities in critical care units, I was a little disappointed at the availability of respirators. I have submitted requests under the Freedom of information Act 2000 to the trusts to find out what provision they have in specialist respirators. These respirators allow the lungs to be operated at full capacity, and, where patients have symptoms of swine flu, take over the role of breathing, and help the patient to convalesce in a far more appropriate setting. Other than Cardiff and Vale, no NHS trust that has responded so far has access to these respirators. I find that quite concerning given the length of time that the swine flu situation has been ongoing. Do you think that trusts should be making preparations to acquire more of these respirators, so that when patients are admitted to hospitals they have the opportunity to use them, if that is what the doctor recommends? I understand that they have proved very helpful in North America in combating flu and assisting in critical care situations.

3.30 p.m.

Also, when you respond to the points that I have raised about the vaccine process, could you please touch on the figures that will hopefully be available shortly? Figures that have come out of England indicate that certain key professionals are showing resistance to having the vaccination. I appreciate that that has gone on in England, but this point goes back to having dialogue with officials from all other areas of the United Kingdom. What are the main concerns that people are picking up regarding the vaccination programme, and is it possible to incorporate robust answers to address those concerns in the new information campaign that you stated is now under way, so that people can have a far better picture to enable them to make an informed choice on whether to be vaccinated or not? Thank you

bosibl unrhyw achosion o godi bwganod. Mae'r cyhoedd am gael gwybodaeth dda a dibynadwy, yn hytrach na gorbrysurdeb a phobl yn rhuthro o gwmpas yn ddigyfeiriad.

I symud ymlaen i'r cyfleusterau mewn unedau gofal critigol, yr oeddwn ychydig yn siomedig am y graddau yr oedd peiriannau anadlu ar gael. Yr wyf wedi cyflwyno ceisiadau i'r ymddiriedolaethau dan Ddeddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000 i gael gwybod pa ddarpariaeth sydd ganddynt o ran peiriannau anadlu arbenigol. Mae'r peiriannau anadlu hyn yn galluogi'r ysgyfaint i weithio'n llawn, a phan fydd gan gleifion symptomau'r ffliw moch, byddant yn anadlu ar ran y claf ac yn ei helpu i wella mewn lleoliad llawer mwy priodol. Ar wahân i Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro, nid oes yr un o ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG sydd wedi ymateb hyd yma yn gallu defnyddio'r peiriannau anadlu hyn. Mae hynny'n ofid imi o gofio fod y ffliw moch ar gerdded ers cymaint o amseri. A ydych yn credu y dylai ymddiriedolaethau fod yn paratoi i gael mwy o'r peiriannau hyn, er mwyn i gleifion, wrth gael eu derbyn i ysbytai, gael cyfle i'w defnyddio, os dyna y mae'r meddyg yn ei argymhell? Deallaf iddynt fod o gymorth mawr yng Ngogledd America wrth frwydro yn erbyn ffliw a helpu mewn sefyllfaoedd gofal critigol.

Yn ogystal, pan fyddwch yn ymateb i'r pwyntiau yr wyf wedi'u codi am y broses frechu, a allech sôn am y ffigurau y gobeithir y byddant ar gael yn fuan? Mae'r ffigurau o Loegr yn dangos bod rhai gweithwyr proffesiynol allweddol yn gwrthwynebu cael y brechiad. Sylweddolaf fod hynny wedi bod yn digwydd yn Lloegr, ond mae'r pwynt hwn yn mynd yn ôl at yr angen i gyfathrebu â swyddogion o bob rhan arall o'r Deyrnas Unedig. Beth yw'r prif bryderon sydd gan bobl am y rhaglen frechu, ac a oes modd ymgorffori atebion cadarn i fynd i'r afael â'r pryderon hynny yn yr ymgyrch wybodaeth newydd yr oeddech yn dweud ei bod bellach yn mynd rhagddi, fel y gall pobl gael darlun llawer gwell i'w galluogi i ddewis yn ddoeth ynghylch cael eu brechu ai peidio? Diolch yn fawr am eich datganiad y prynhawn yma,

for your statement this afternoon, Minister.

Weinidog.

Edwina Hart: Like you, I have been concerned by what I have heard anecdotally. Some people have said, 'No, we do not want the vaccine,' or, 'We do not think it is safe,' and so forth. I think that there is further work to be done in that area. It is a particular concern if some of the professional groups that have been offered vaccinations have turned it down. My officials tell me that, sometimes, this is because people think that swine flu in the majority of cases is relatively mild and something that you live through, and so people do not necessarily take up the offer. There is further work going on in that area, and I hope to have the figures by the end of December, which I will distribute among Members.

Edwina Hart: Fel chithau, yr wyf fi hefyd wedi bod yn poeni am yr hyn yr wyf wedi'i glywed ar lafar. Mae rhai pobl wedi dweud, 'Na, nid ydym am gael y brechlyn,' neu, 'Nid ydym yn credu ei fod yn ddiogel,' ac yn y blaen. Credaf fod gwaith pellach i'w wneud yn y maes hwnnw. Mae'n ofid penodol os oes rhai o'r grwpiau proffesiynol y cynigiwyd brechiadau iddynt wedi'u gwrthod. Dywed fy swyddogion wrthyf fod hynny'n digwydd, weithiau, oherwydd bod pobl yn credu bod y fflw moch yn salwch cymharol ysgafn yn y mwyafrif o achosion, ac yn rhywbeth y byddant yn dod drwyddo, ac nid yw pobl yn manteisio ar y cynnig o reidrwydd felly. Mae gwaith pellach yn mynd rhagddo yn y maes hwnnw, a gobeithiaf gael y ffigurau erbyn diwedd mis Rhagfyr, a byddaf yn eu dosbarthu ymhlith yr Aelodau.

On critical care capacity, an awful lot of work has been done with the LHBs on this issue. On the specific point that you made about respirators, I will ask officials to have a look at whether they believe there are inadequacies, and what further requirements there are. We have been telling trusts that, if they feel that there is a need for anything in terms of critical care and the delivery of services in this area, they have to let us know.

O ran gallu gofal critigol, mae llawer iawn o waith wedi'i wneud gyda'r byrddau iechyd lleol ar y mater hwn. Ynglŷn â'ch pwynt penodol am beiriannau anadlu, byddaf yn gofyn i swyddogion ystyried a ydynt yn credu bod diffygion, a pha ofynion pellach sy'n bodoli. Yr ydym wedi bod yn dweud wrth ymddiriedolaethau e bod yn rhaid iddynt roi gwybod inni os teimlant fod angen rhywbeth o ran gofal critigol ac o ran darparu gwasanaethau yn y maes hwn.

I share your point that we do not want any scaremongering. This is the difficulty when we have a situation like the one we had at the University Hospital of Wales: the world and the media can go absolutely wild if we do not get our facts into the public domain. We have a reporting mechanism with various organisations including the World Health Organization, as you know, and that is almost satisfactory. However, I feel that we have to look at reporting mechanisms and, perhaps, at releasing information to the press in a different way to ensure that we get the messages across clearly in the first instance. We need to make sure that there are not little newsflashes from certain news organisations before prepared statements go out. That point is very well made.

Yr wyf yn cyd-fynd â'ch pwynt nad ydym am gael dim codi bwganod. Dyna'r drafferth pan fydd gennym sefyllfa debyg i honno yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru: gall y byd a'r cyfryngau ddweud beth bynnag a fynnont os na rannwn ein ffeithiau â'r cyhoedd. Mae gennym system adrodd ar waith gydag amryw sefydliadau gan gynnwys Sefydliad Iechyd y Byd, fel y gwyddoch, ac y mae honno bron yn foddhaol. Fodd bynnag, teimlaf ei bod yn rhaid inni edrych ar systemau adrodd, ac o bosibl ar ryddhau gwybodaeth i'r wasg mewn ffordd wahanol i sicrhau ein bod yn trosglwyddo'r negeseuon yn glir yn y lle cyntaf. Mae angen inni wneud yn siŵr nad oes rhyw bytiau bach sydyn o newyddion yn dod gan rai sefydliadau newyddion cyn i ddatganiadau parod gael eu rhyddhau. Gwneir y pwynt hwnnw'n dda iawn.

Regarding service delivery, services are indeed under pressure in the health service, but they usually are in the winter. At the moment the pressures are not greater than they are normally. However, preparing for issues has been a pressure in itself, but I do not think that that can be used at this stage as an excuse in relation to any of the access targets. We do not know what is going to happen in January and February, which is our flu season, and as you are aware, revised planning assumptions are being put in place all the time for swine flu. That is because the scientists and medics have not been able to agree, all along the line, on what this is going to look like. Last week, I shared with health spokespeople a little chart that asked whether this looks more like 1957 or 1958 in terms of how it is going to run. We have to keep our eye on the ball here because we do not know what is going to happen. Nevertheless, I have to say that I, like you, have been impressed with the way that staff have dealt with issues. When UHW had an outbreak, we knew immediately that every infection-control measure was perfectly in place and that the matter was dealt with. Therefore, I praise staff in the NHS who have dealt with this, particularly in the primary and community health areas.

David Lloyd: I also welcome the Minister's statement. I congratulate the Minister, the CMO and all the officials involved in the planning and implementation of what has been a comprehensive response to the swine flu pandemic issue in general. It has been an amazing situation on the ground. There has been a lot of planning and stockpiling of Tamiflu reserves. Moreover, the research that has gone on over the summer, and the preparation and distribution of the current swine flu vaccine, constitute a phenomenal success story when you see it on the ground, in response to what remains a huge logistical challenge. Therefore, one of the main themes should be hearty congratulations all around, and I naturally ask the Minister to support me in that. Given the extensive use of Tamiflu, it is absolutely no surprise that resistant strains have developed. This is not an issue. We have known over the years that bacteria and viruses are cunning little beings that mutate readily in response to the use, and sometimes

O ran darparu gwasanaethau, mae'n wir dweud bod gwasanaethau dan bwysau yn y gwasanaeth iechyd, ond felly y mae hi fel rheol yn y gaeaf. Ar hyn o bryd, nid yw'r pwysau'n fwy na'r arfer. Fodd bynnag, mae paratoi ar gyfer problemau wedi bod yn bwysau ynddo'i hun, ond ni chredaf y gellir defnyddio hynny fel esgus ar hyn o bryd yng nghyswllt unrhyw darged mynediad. Ni wyddom beth fydd yn digwydd ym mis Ionawr a mis Chwefror, sef ein tymor ffliw, ac fel y gwyddoch, rhoddir tybiaethau cynllunio diwygiedig ar waith yn barhaus ar gyfer y ffliw moch. Y rheswm am hynny yw nad yw'r gwyddonwyr a'r meddygon wedi gallu cytuno, gydol yr amser, beth fydd y sefyllfa. Yr wythnos diwethaf, dangosais siart fechan i lefarwyr ar iechyd, a oedd yn gofyn a yw'r sefyllfa'n debycach i 1957 ynteu 1958 yn y ffordd y bydd yn datblygu. Rhaid inni fod yn wylriadwrus yn awr oherwydd ni wyddom beth fydd yn digwydd. Serch hynny, rhaid imi ddweud, fel chithau, fy mod yn llawn edmygedd o'r modd y mae staff wedi ymdrin â phroblemau. Pan ddigwyddodd achosion yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru, gwyddem yn syth fod pob mesur rheoli haint ar waith yn berffaith a bod y mater wedi cael sylw. Felly, yr wyf yn canmol staff y GIG sydd wedi ymdrin â hyn, yn enwedig ym maes gofal iechyd sylfaenol a chymunedol.

David Lloyd: Yr wyf fi hefyd yn croesawu datganiad y Gweinidog. Yr wyf yn llongyfarch y Gweinidog, y prif swyddog meddygol a'r holl swyddogion sy'n ymwneud â chynllunio a gweithredu'r hyd sydd wedi bod yn ymateb cynhwysfawr i bandemig y ffliw moch yn gyffredinol. Bu'n sefyllfa ryfeddol ar lawr gwlad. Cafwyd llawer o gynllunio a phentyrru cyflenwadau o Tamiflu. At hynny, mae'r ymchwil a wnaed dros yr haf, a'r gwaith paratoi a dosbarthu'r brechlyn presennol ar gyfer y ffliw moch, yn stori lwyddiannus iawn o weld y cyfan yn digwydd ar lawr gwlad, i ymateb i'r hyn sy'n dal yn her logistaidd enfawr. Felly, dylai llongyfarchiadau gwresog i bawb yn ddiwahân fod yn un o'r prif themâu, a gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog fy nghefnogi yn hynny, wrth gwrs. O gofio'r defnydd helaeth a wneir o Tamiflu, nid yw'n syndod o gwbl fod mathau o ffliw sy'n gwrthsefyll Tamiflu wedi datblygu. Nid yw hynny'n broblem. Gwyddom dros y blynyddoedd fod bacteria a

the overuse, of antibiotics and antivirals. That is not an issue regarding Tamiflu resistance, but swine flu is. My mother would always tell me that prevention is always better than cure, and the prevention is the swine flu jab.

As a front-line health worker, I have had the swine flu vaccination. It is not an issue; you have a bit of a sore arm—big deal. It is effective and safe. There is an awful lot of bad science out there on the web, but the swine flu vaccination is totally safe and totally effective, which is why, when the accent is on stopping people getting swine flu in the first place, the answer is: get the swine flu jab. If you cannot catch swine flu, you cannot pass it on and nor can you die from it. So my message, in agreement with the general thrust of the Minister's statement, is: for goodness' sake, when you get the call from the GP's surgery, go and get vaccinated.

Edwina Hart: I do not think that I can demur at any comments made by Dr Lloyd, but I will pass on his congratulations to the chief medical officer and to all of the staff in public health and across the piece. A pandemic is a difficult issue to deal with because when people hear the word 'pandemic', they think of something very scary and of course, in the main and except for a handful of families that have been affected, this has been mild for the majority of those who have contracted swine flu—we must recognise that. However, the importance of this follows on from a question asked by Mohammad Asghar. Questions about vaccination are important and it is also important that we get the message across, for example, to concerned parents, particularly of children between six months and five years old. Another important issue is the vaccination of carers. We will look at other groups if swine flu continues and consider whether we should vaccinate the population as a whole, which is the subject of additional discussions.

feirysau'n fodau bach cyfrwys sy'n mwttadu'n rhwydd wrth i wrthfotigau a chyffuriau gwrthfeirysol gael eu defnyddio, a'u gordefnyddio weithiau. Nid yw hynny'n broblem o ran gwrthsefyll Tamiflu, ond y mae'r fflw moch yn broblem. Byddai fy mam yn dweud ei bod yn well rhwystro'r clwyf na'i wella bob amser, a phigiad y fflw moch fydd yn rhwystro'r clwyf yn yr achos hwn.

Fel gweithiwr iechyd rheng flaen, yr wyf wedi cael brechiad y fflw moch. Nid yw'n broblem; bydd eich braich ychydig yn boenus—ond dyna i gyd. Mae'n effeithiol ac yn ddiogel. Mae llawer iawn o wyddoniaeth wael ar y we, ond mae brechlyn y fflw moch yn gwbl ddiogel ac yn gwbl effeithiol, a dyna pam, pan fydd y pwyslais ar atal pobl rhag cael y fflw moch yn y lle cyntaf, mai'r ateb yw: mynnwch bigiad y fflw moch. Os na allwch gael y fflw moch, ni allwch ei drosglwyddo i neb ac ni allwch farw ohono. Felly, fy neges i, gan gyuno â byrdwn cyffredinol datganiad y Gweinidog yw: er mwyn y nefoedd, pan gewch yr alwad gan y feddygfa, ewch i gael eich brechu.

Edwina Hart: Ni chredaf y gallaf wrthwynebu unrhyw sylwadau a wnaed gan Dr Lloyd, ond byddaf yn trosglwyddo'i longyfarchiadau i'r prif swyddog meddygol a'r holl staff ym maes iechyd cyhoeddus a'r staff yn gyffredinol. Mae'n anodd ymdrin â phandemig, oherwydd pan fydd pobl yn clywed y gair 'pandemig', byddant yn meddwl am rywbeth brawychus iawn. Wrth gwrs, gan mwyaf ac ar wahân i lond dwrn o deuluoedd y mae'r pandemig wedi effeithio arnynt, mae'r salwch wedi bod yn ysgafn i fwyaf y rheini sydd wedi cael y fflw moch—rhaid inni gydnabod hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae pwysigrwydd hyn yn dilyn ymlaen o gwestiwn a ofynnwyd gan Mohammad Asghar. Mae cwestiynau am frechu'n bwysig, ac mae'n bwysig hefyd inni gyfleu'r neges, er enghraifft, i rieni pryderus, yn enwedig rhieni plant rhwng chwe mis a phum mlwydd oed. Mater pwysig arall yw brechu gofalwyr. Byddwn yn edrych ar grwpiau eraill os bydd y fflw moch yn parhau, ac yn ystyried a ddylem frechu'r boblogaeth gyfan, sy'n destun trafodaethau ychwanegol.

Peter Black: I thank the Minister for a comprehensive statement. I cannot add a great deal to it or to the questions that have been asked. When we attend the private briefings with the chief medial officer, who gets out his charts and graphs and puts the current swine flu outbreak in context with previous outbreaks, I am always struck that, although this is clearly a serious situation that needs to be properly managed, it is not as serious as previous outbreaks. Therefore, there we should ensure that we keep this current outbreak in context, both in terms of reassuring the public and in our reaction to it. I would be grateful if the Minister could give us her thoughts on that.

When I talk to people around Wales about their understanding of swine flu, there is a great deal of misunderstanding about the implications of contracting it. People think that if they get it, they have to take Tamiflu, when in fact, most of the time, it is just a question of going to bed with a paracetamol and working your way through the symptoms. Information is key to that. I was interested by how the Minister diverted from the text that was circulated to us when she talked about the information campaign. That text said that the information campaign began in Wales on 9 November, but the Minister talked about it beginning now, so could the Minister tell me whether this information campaign has begun and if not, when it is likely to begin and when those key messages will start to go out to the public?

Edwina Hart: I agree that we have to keep this in context. When we initially prepared for a pandemic, we were preparing for one on the basis of avian flu, which is a totally different creature—one of those nasty little beings that Dai Lloyd referred to—that would have been exceptionally serious for our population. We are still considering whether avian flu is on the horizon and whether it could strike, so we have to have all of the plans in place to deal with that. However, we have to put this into context. We are at a pandemic level because the World Health Organisation defines a pandemic by measuring the impact of a disease across continents and not necessarily on our

Peter Black: Diolch i'r Gweinidog am ddatganiad cynhwysfawr. Ni allaf ychwanegu rhyw lawer ato nac at y cwestiynau a ofynnwyd. Pan fyddwn yn y sesiynau briffio preifat gyda'r prif swyddog meddygol, sy'n tynnu ei siartiau a'i graffiau allan ac sy'n rhoi'r achosion cyfredol o'r fflw moch yng nghyd-destun achosion blaenorol, mae'n fy nharo bob tro nad yw'r sefyllfa hon mor ddifrifol â sefyllfaoedd blaenorol, er bod hon yn amlwg yn sefyllfa ddifrifol y mae angen ei rheoli'n gywir. Felly, dylem sicrhau ein bod yn cadw'r sefyllfa bresennol yn ei chyd-destun, o ran rhoi sicrwydd i'r cyhoedd ac yn ein hymateb iddi. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallai'r Gweinidog roi ei barn inni am hynny.

Pan fyddaf yn siarad â phobl ar hyd a lled Cymru am eu dealltwriaeth o'r fflw moch, mae llawer iawn o gamddealltwriaeth am oblygiadau ei gael. O'i gael, cred pobl y bydd yn rhaid iddynt gymryd Tamiflu, ond mewn gwirionedd, mater ydyw o fynd i'r gwely gyda pharasetamol fel rheol, a gweithio'ch ffordd trwy'r symptomau. Mae gwybodaeth yn allweddol i hynny. Yr oedd yn ddi-ddorol gweld sut y tynnodd y Gweinidog sylw oddi wrth y testun a ddisbarthwyd inni pan oedd yn siarad am yr ymgyrch wybodaeth. Dywedodd y testun hwnnw bod yr ymgyrch wybodaeth wedi dechrau yng Nghymru ar 9 Tachwedd, ond yr oedd y Gweinidog yn sôn ei bod yn dechrau'n awr. Felly, a allai'r Gweinidog ddweud wrthyf a yw'r ymgyrch wybodaeth wedi dechrau ai peidio, pryd y mae'n debygol o ddechrau, a phryd y bydd y negeseuon allweddol hynny'n dechrau mynd allan i'r cyhoedd?

Edwina Hart: Cytunaf ei bod yn rhaid inni gadw'r sefyllfa yn ei chyd-destun. Pan aethom ati'n gyntaf i baratoi ar gyfer pandemig, yr oeddem yn paratoi ar gyfer un ar sail y fflw adar, sy'n greadur hollol wahanol—yn un o'r bodau bach cas hynny y cyfeiriodd Dai Lloyd atynt—a fyddai wedi bod yn eithriadol o ddifrifol i'n poblogaeth. Yr ydym yn parhau i ystyried a yw'r fflw adar ar y gorwel ac a allai daro, felly, rhaid inni gael yr holl gynlluniau'n barod i ymdrin â hynny. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni roi hynny mewn cyd-destun. Yr ydym ar lefel pandemig oherwydd bod Sefydliad Iechyd y Byd yn diffinio pandemig trwy fesur effaith clefyd ar draws cyfandiroedd, nid o

communities. So, you are absolutely right.

reidrwydd ar ein cymunedau. Felly, yr ydych yn hollol iawn.

The information campaign has started, but I was thinking, as a result of questions earlier today, about how successful the question and answer sessions on swine flu with the CMO and public health officials have been on radio stations.

Mae'r ymgyrch wybodaeth wedi dechrau, ond o ganlyniad i'r cwestiynau a ofynnwyd yn gynharach heddiw, yr oeddwn yn meddwl mor llwyddiannus y mae'r sesiynau holi ac ateb ar y fflw moch gyda'r prif swyddog meddygol a swyddogion iechyd cyhoeddus wedi bod ar orsafoedd radio.

3.40 p.m.

When I go back upstairs, once we have concluded another debate on health issues, I will consider whether we should be doing a bit more over Christmas to get the message across about swine flu. You raise a particularly important point that people should not assume that they require medication; most people get over it by going to bed and getting out of the way, as it were. It is like most illnesses in life—people anticipate that they can be cured by taking antivirals or antibiotics, but it is always best if you can get through it on your own. Therefore, I will take your points on board, particularly about public messaging.

Pan af yn ôl i fyny'r grisiau, ar ôl inni gloi dadl arall ar faterion iechyd, byddaf yn ystyried a ddylem fod yn gwneud ychydig yn fwy dros y Nadolig i gyfleu'r neges am y fflw moch. Yr ydych yn codi pwynt hynod bwysig, sef na ddylai pobl dybio bod arnynt angen meddyginiaeth; bydd y mwyafrif yn dod dros y fflw trwy fynd i'r gwely a chadw draw, fel petai. Mae'n debyg i'r rhan fwyaf o afiechydon mewn bywyd—bydd pobl yn disgwyl y gallant wella trwy gymryd cyffuriau gwrthfeirysol neu wrthfotigau, ond mae bob amser yn well ceisio dod drwyddi ar eich pen eich hun. Felly, byddaf yn ystyried eich pwyntiau, yn enwedig hwnnw am gyfleu negeseuon i'r cyhoedd.

Janice Gregory: Thank you for your statement and for the continuing written statements that we receive as Assembly Members on this issue. In your statement, you mentioned pregnant women. As you know, my daughter is expecting my second grandchild in February. After researching deeply into swine flu vaccination, she decided to have the vaccination. However, she is in a position where she can look into the issue and be content in her own mind that she is doing the right thing. Pregnant women, by their nature, are often vulnerable, and many of them will take note of what they see on television—not so much what they read in the newspapers. About six weeks ago, a famous TV doctor on a morning television programme was advising pregnant women to have the vaccination. Last week, or the week before, I was appalled to see the same doctor—a very popular doctor, it must be said—backtracking by saying that perhaps pregnant women did not need the vaccination because it had not become the pandemic that we all expected it to become.

Janice Gregory: Diolch am eich datganiad ac am y datganiadau ysgrifenedig cyson a gawn fel Aelodau Cynulliad ar y mater hwn. Yn eich datganiad, soniech am fenywod beichiog. Fel y gwyddoch, mae fy merch yn disgwyl fy ail ŵyr neu wyres ym mis Chwefror. Ar ôl ymchwilio'n drylwyr i frechiad y fflw moch, penderfynodd gael y brechiad. Fodd bynnag, mae hi mewn sefyllfa lle gall ymchwilio i'r mater a bod yn dawel ei meddwl ei bod yn gwneud y peth iawn. Mae menywod beichiog yn aml yn agored i niwed, yn ôl eu natur, a bydd llawer wedi sylwi ar yr hyn a welant ar y teledu—yn fwy na'r hyn a ddarllenant yn y papurau newydd. Ryw chwe wythnos yn ôl, yr oedd meddyg enwog ar y teledu, ar raglen deledu foreol, yn cynghori menywod beichiog i gael y brechiad. Yr oeddwn yn arswydo'r wythnos diwethaf, neu'r wythnos flaenorol, o weld yr un meddyg—meddyg poblogaidd iawn, rhaid dweud—yn newid ei feddwl ac yn dweud efallai nad oedd angen y brechiad ar fenywod beichiog oherwydd nad oedd y fflw wedi datblygu'n bandemig i'r graddau yr oeddem i

gyd yn ei ddisgwyl.

Will you look into this? Can you give me some assurance to the pregnant young women whom I spoke to last week, and who were appalled at this? Some of them had taken the decision to have the vaccination because of the comments of this doctor. They are now regretting that decision and are incredibly worried about the fact that they had had the vaccination. They are raising the issue with their midwives, which is what I advised them to do. Will you consider further advertising aimed at pregnant women, and also, to parents of children between six months and five years old? People will need that reassurance.

A wnewch chi ymchwilio i hyn? A allwch roi rhywfaint o sicrwydd i'r menywod ifanc beichiog y siaradais â hwy'r wythnos diwethaf, a oedd yn arswydo at hynny? Penderfynodd rhai ohonynt gael y brechiad oherwydd sylwadau'r meddyg hwn. Maent bellach yn edifarhau am y penderfyniad hwnnw ac yn poeni'n ofnadwy eu bod wedi cael y brechiad. Maent yn codi'r mater gyda'u bydwragedd, fel y cynghorais hwy i'w wneud. A wnewch chi ystyried anelu mwy o hysbysebion at fenywod beichiog, a rhieni plant rhwng chwe mis a phum mlwydd oed hefyd? Bydd angen y sicrwydd hwnnw ar bobl.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd (Rosemary Butler) i'r Gadair am 3.41 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer (Rosemary Butler) took the Chair at 3.41 p.m.*

Edwina Hart: The most important advice that we can give to pregnant women and parents is to talk to health professionals about vaccination so that they can be reassured. I will certainly take up your point because I am aware of the incident on morning television to which you are referring. I will consider whether we can give more publicity to these groups to explain the value of having the vaccination. The BMA has been supportive of the vaccination programme. It has sold the issue in many ways, as it is the primary health care sector that is delivering the vaccine to these vulnerable and high-risk groups. We must carry on with this message. It is serious when a health professional gives one message one day, and the next day, the message changes. We have seen to our cost what happened when views changed on MMR, when certain messages were given out that were incorrect and the impact that had on some of the statistics in Wales.

Edwina Hart: Y cyngor pwysicaf y gallwn ei roi i fenywod beichiog a rhieni yw iddynt siarad â gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol am frechu fel y gallant gael sicrwydd. Byddaf yn ystyried eich pwynt yn sicr, oherwydd gwn am y digwyddiad ar y rhaglen deledu foreol yr ydych yn cyfeirio ato. Byddaf yn ystyried a allwn roi mwy o gyhoeddusrwydd i'r grwpiau hyn i esbonio gwerth cael y brechiad. Mae Cymdeithas Feddygol Prydain wedi bod yn gefnogol i'r rhaglen frechu. Mae wedi gwerthu'r mater mewn sawl ffordd, gan mai'r sector gofal iechyd sylfaenol sy'n cyflwyno'r brechlyn i'r grwpiau risg uchel hyn sy'n agored i niwed. Rhaid inni barhau'r neges hon. Mae'n ddifrifol pan fydd gweithiwr iechyd proffesiynol yn rhoi un neges un diwrnod ac yn newid ei neges drannoeth. Gwelsom, er afles inni, yr hyn a ddigwyddodd pan newidiodd safbwyntiau pobl am MMR, pan gyflwynwyd rhai negeseuon a oedd yn anghywir, a'r effaith a gafodd hynny ar rai o'r ystadegau yng Nghymru.

Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Iechyd, Lles a Llywodraeth Leol ar Wasanaethau Iechyd Meddwl

The Health, Wellbeing and Local Government Committee's Report on Mental Health Services

Darren Millar: I move that

Darren Millar: Cynigïaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

notes the report of the Health, Wellbeing and Local Government Committee, 'Inquiry into Community Mental Health Services', which was laid in the Table Office on 16 September 2009. (NDM4337)

Good mental health and wellbeing allows us to make the most of our potential, enjoy our families and friends and make a full contribution to the wider community. Poor mental health can have a profound effect on our quality of life and cut us off from friends, family and society. This is not someone else's problem. Each year, one in four of us will experience a mental health problem and, at any given time, one in six of us experience poor mental health. Good-quality services that are readily available where and when people need them can help people recover from poor mental health or support them in managing their lives better when they have long-term problems. The committee's report sets out a range of recommendations that we believe will help improve community mental health services in Wales, and I am pleased that the Minister for Health and Social Services has accepted them all, either wholly or in principle.

Mental ill health, more than any other condition, requires a holistic approach that encompasses much more than medical treatment. The challenge for mental health services is to respond to the needs of service users in a way that meets the multiplicity of individual needs and empowers service users to take a measure of control over their own lives. However, mental health services have historically been service led and medically focused and have not always placed the wishes of the user at centre stage.

The recovery model aims to address mental health and wellbeing needs in a personalised and empowering way, and the committee was impressed by its potential to help address the needs of those with mental health issues. The

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Iechyd, Lles a Llywodraeth Leol, 'Ymchwiliad i Wasanaethau Iechyd Meddwl Cymunedol', a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 16 Medi 2009. (NDM4337)

Mae lles ac iechyd meddwl da yn ein galluogi i wneud yn fawr o'n potensial, mwynhau ein teuluoedd a'n ffrindiau a chyfrannu'n llawn i'r gymuned ehangach. Gall iechyd meddwl gwael effeithio'n ddifrifol ar ansawdd ein bywyd a'n gwahanu oddi wrth ein ffrindiau, ein teulu a chymdeithas. Nid problem rhywun arall yw hon. Bob blwyddyn bydd problem iechyd meddwl yn effeithio ar un o bob pedwar ohonom, ac ar unrhyw adeg bydd un o bob chwech ohonom yn dioddef iechyd meddwl gwael. Gall gwasanaethau o safon, sydd ar gael yn hwylus ble bynnag a phryd bynnag y mae eu hangen ar bobl, helpu pobl i wella ar ôl cael iechyd meddwl gwael, neu eu cynorthwyo i reoli eu bywydau'n well pan fydd ganddynt broblemau hirdymor. Mae adroddiad y pwyllgor yn nodi ystod o argymhellion y credwn a fydd yn helpu gwella gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl cymunedol yng Nghymru, ac yr wyf yn falch fod y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wedi derbyn pob un ohonynt, naill ai'n gyfan gwbl ynteu mewn egwyddor.

Mae afiechyd meddwl, yn fwy na'r un anhwylder arall, yn gofyn am ddull gweithredu cyfannol sy'n cynnwys llawer mwy na thriniaeth feddygol. Yr her i wasanaethau iechyd meddwl yw ymateb i anghenion defnyddwyr gwasanaethau mewn ffordd sy'n diwallu'r llu anghenion unigol dan sylw ac yn grymuso defnyddwyr gwasanaethau i gael rhywfaint o reolaeth ar eu bywydau eu hunain. Fodd bynnag, yn hanesyddol mae gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl wedi cael eu harwain gan wasanaethau gan ganolbwyntio ar agweddau meddygol, ac nid ydynt bob amser wedi rhoi dymuniadau'r defnyddiwr yn y canol.

Nod y model gwella yw mynd i'r afael ag anghenion lles ac iechyd meddwl mewn ffordd bersonol a grymusol, ac yr oedd y pwyllgor yn edmygu ei botensial i helpu mynd i'r afael ag anghenion pobl sydd â

model focuses on the individual's potential for recovery and encompasses personal strengths, coping skills, relationships, empowerment and social inclusion. We believe that by adopting such an approach in Wales, we have an opportunity to develop truly innovative and individually focused services that are more empowering and effective than the current range of services available. The committee has therefore recommended that the Welsh Government adopts the recovery model of mental health in Wales and incorporates it into its strategic mental health policies and the national service framework.

The committee was told that there are still gaps and weaknesses in the provision of community mental health services to people from black and minority ethnic backgrounds. The black and minority ethnic community is not being reached by services that are appropriate for its needs, which is having a disproportionate impact with people from that community reaching crisis point far more often than people from a white, European background. Services need to address language and cultural differences. Greater engagement with communities on the ground is needed to develop capacity and good practice in providing culturally appropriate services. The committee did receive some examples of good practice, and these now need to be built upon to inform future work to address BME needs. The committee also received evidence to suggest that Welsh-language services are not available everywhere that they are needed. Although we were told that some improvement was apparent, there was clearly more work to be done in this area.

During this inquiry, we gained the impression from witnesses that there is considerable variation in access to, and the level and quality of, community mental health services across Wales. The committee found this particularly disappointing, given the increases in expenditure in services in recent years, and given that the adult mental health national service framework was meant to

phroblemau iechyd meddwl. Mae'r model yn canolbwyntio ar botensial yr unigolyn i wella, ac y mae hefyd yn cynnwys cryfderau personol, sgiliau ymdopi, cydberthynas, grymuso a chynhwysiant cymdeithasol. O fabwysiadu dull gweithredu tebyg yng Nghymru, credwn fod gennym gyfle i ddatblygu gwasanaethau gwirioneddol arloesol sy'n canolbwyntio ar yr unigolyn, yn ei rymuso i raddau pellach ac yn fwy effeithiol na'r ystod bresennol o wasanaethau sydd ar gael. Felly, mae'r pwyllgor wedi argymhell y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru fabwysiadu'r model gwella ar gyfer iechyd meddwl yng Nghymru, ac ymgorffori'r model yn ei pholisïau strategol ar gyfer iechyd meddwl ac yn y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol.

Cafodd y pwyllgor wybod bod bylchau a gwendidau o hyd yn y gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl cymunedol a ddarperir i bobl dduon a lleiafrifoedd ethnig. Nid yw'r gymuned pobl dduon a lleiafrifoedd ethnig yn cael gwasanaethau sy'n briodol i'w hanghenion, ac y mae hynny'n cael effaith anghymesur, a phobl o'r gymuned honno'n mynd i sefyllfa argyfyngus yn amlach o lawer na phobl o gefndir gwyn, Ewropeaidd. Mae angen i wasanaethau fynd i'r afael â gwahaniaethau o ran iaith a diwylliant. Mae angen ymgysylltu mwy â chymunedau ar lawr gwlad i ddatblygu capasiti ac arfer da wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau sy'n ddiwylliannol briodol. Cafodd y pwyllgor rai enghreifftiau o arfer da, ac y mae angen adeiladu ar y rhain yn awr i lywio gwaith yn y dyfodol i fynd i'r afael ag anghenion y gymuned pobl dduon a lleiafrifoedd ethnig. Cafodd y pwyllgor dystiolaeth hefyd yn awgrymu nad oes gwasanaethau Cymraeg ar gael ym mhobman lle mae eu hangen. Er inni glywed bod rhywfaint o welliant i'w weld, yr oedd yn amlwg fod angen gwneud rhagor o waith yn y maes hwn.

Yr argraff a gawsom gan dystion yn ystod yr ymchwiliad hwn oedd bod amrywiaeth sylweddol yn lefel ac ansawdd gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl cymunedol ledled Cymru, ac o ran gallu eu cael. Yr oedd hynny'n arbennig o siomedig i'r pwyllgor, o ystyried y cynnydd mewn gwariant ar wasanaethau dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf, ac o gofio bod y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar

address these issues. We heard that there was a widespread perception that the national service framework itself was laudable but that it was not being implemented effectively. We have therefore recommended that the Welsh Government takes urgent action to implement the adult mental health national service framework, including addressing the performance management of the bodies responsible, to address the weaknesses and variability in community mental health services.

We heard concerns that resources intended for mental health spending were not always being used for this purpose, and a number of witnesses advocated ring-fencing health funding for mental health services. The committee was not entirely convinced that this was necessarily the best way forward, as it could result in a lack of flexibility or the creation of an unintended ceiling on spending. We have therefore recommended that the resources required for community mental health services are identified, tracked and protected throughout the current NHS restructuring.

Mental health is often characterised as a cinderella service, which is a reference to its relative lack of status among other health and social care specialisms. The committee had hoped that the restructuring of the national health service would be seen by the Welsh Government as an opportunity to redress this imbalance and afford mental health services a higher priority in the new NHS bodies. We were therefore concerned that the responsibility for mental health services in the new local health boards is to be given to vice-chairs and directors who will also be responsible for primary and community services. The danger, of course, is that primary and community services will demand most of their attention, and that mental health will remain a cinderella service. Therefore, we have recommended that the Minister keeps the role of the vice-chair in the new local health boards under review, to ensure that mental health services are given the priority that they deserve by the new boards.

gyfer iechyd meddwl oedolion i fod i fynd i'r afael â'r materion hynny. Clywsom mai'r canfyddiad cyffredinol oedd bod y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ei hun yn glodwiw, ond nad oedd yn cael ei weithredu'n effeithiol. Felly, yr ydym wedi argymhell y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru gymryd camau brys i weithredu'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer iechyd meddwl oedolion, gan gynnwys mynd i'r afael â'r ffordd y caiff perfformiad y cyrff sy'n gyfrifol amdano ei reoli, er mwyn mynd i'r afael â'r gwendidau a'r amrywiaethau sy'n bodoli mewn gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl cymunedol.

Clywsom bryderon nad yw arian a fwriadwyd i'w wario ar iechyd meddwl bob amser yn cael ei ddefnyddio at y diben hwnnw, ac yr oedd llawer o dystion o blaid neilltuo arian iechyd ar gyfer gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl. Nid oedd y pwyllgor yn hollol argyhoeddedig mai honno o reidrwydd oedd y ffordd orau i symud ymlaen, oherwydd gallai arwain at ddiffyg hyblygrwydd neu greu terfyn anfwriadol ar wariant. Felly, yr ydym wedi argymhell y dylai'r adnoddau y mae eu hangen ar gyfer gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl cymunedol gael eu nodi, eu holrhain a'u diogelu drwy gydol y broses bresennol o ailstrwythuro'r GIG.

Disgrifir iechyd meddwl yn aml fel gwasanaeth israddol, sy'n cyfeirio at ei ddiffyg statws cymharol ymysg gwasanaethau arbenigol eraill ym maes iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Yr oedd y pwyllgor wedi gobeithio y byddai Llywodraeth Cymru'n ystyried proses ailstrwythuro'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yn gyfle i unioni'r anghydbwysedd hwn a rhoi blaenoriaeth uwch i wasanaethau iechyd meddwl yng nghyrrff newydd y GIG. Felly, yr oeddem yn pryderu fod y cyfrifoldeb am wasanaethau iechyd meddwl yn y byrddau iechyd lleol newydd yn cael ei roi i is-gadeiryddion a chyfarwyddwyr a fydd hefyd yn gyfrifol am wasanaethau sylfaenol a chymunedol. Y perygl, wrth gwrs, yw y bydd gwasanaethau sylfaenol a chymunedol yn mynnu'r rhan fwyaf o'u sylw, ac iechyd meddwl yn parhau'n wasanaeth israddol. Felly, yr ydym wedi argymhell y Gweinidog i barhau i adolygu rôl is-gadeiryddion y byrddau iechyd lleol newydd, er mwyn

sicrhau bod gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl yn cael y flaenoriaeth y maent yn ei haeddu gan y byrddau newydd.

Primary care services and GP practices in particular are the first port of call for most people with mental health problems. These services need to be able to address the high and variable levels of need for mental health care. However, the evidence that we have received indicates that, while some GP practices are well equipped to provide a responsive service, many others are not. We also received evidence to suggest a lack of staffing capacity in primary care and were told of the need to improve levels of mental health skills and expertise at the primary-care level.

At wasanaethau gofal sylfaenol, a phractisau meddygon teulu yn enwedig, y bydd y mwyafrif o bobl sydd â phroblemau iechyd meddwl yn mynd yn gyntaf. Mae angen i'r gwasanaethau hyn allu mynd i'r afael â'r lefelau uchel ac amrywiol o angen am ofal iechyd meddwl. Fodd bynnag, er bod gan rai practisau meddygon teulu y gallu i ddarparu gwasanaeth ymatebol, mae'r dystiolaeth a gawsom yn awgrymu nad yw'r gallu hwnnw gan lawer o bractisau. Cawsom dystiolaeth hefyd yn awgrymu diffyg capasiti staffio mewn gofal sylfaenol, a soniwyd wrthym fod angen gwella sgiliau ac arbenigedd ym maes iechyd meddwl ar lefel gofal sylfaenol.

3.50 p.m.

There is clearly an important role for primary-care-based mental health nurses in addressing some of the pressures on primary care, but we are concerned that these and other health professionals with skills in the area of mental health are too thinly spread across the sector. We have therefore made a number of recommendations to the Welsh Government in this area, including improving levels of mental health knowledge and skills among staff working in primary care, undertaking work to increase the number of mental health nurses working in primary care, and clarifying the role and expectations of mental health services provided by GP practices.

Mae'n amlwg fod gan nyrsys iechyd meddwl mewn lleoliadau gofal sylfaenol rôl bwysig wrth fynd i'r afael â rhywfaint o'r pwysau sydd ar ofal sylfaenol, ond yr ydym yn pryderu bod y nyrsys hyn, a gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol eraill sydd â sgiliau ym maes iechyd meddwl, yn rhy brin ar draws y sector. Felly, yr ydym wedi cyflwyno nifer o argymhellion i Lywodraeth Cymru yn y maes hwn, sy'n cynnwys gwella lefelau gwybodaeth a sgiliau ym maes iechyd meddwl ymysg staff sy'n gweithio ym maes gofal sylfaenol, gwneud gwaith i gynyddu nifer y nyrsys iechyd meddwl sy'n gweithio ym maes gofal sylfaenol, ac egluro rôl gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl a gaiff eu darparu gan bractisau meddygon teulu, ynghyd â disgwyliaidau pobl ohonynt.

We heard from witnesses that access to community mental health services in many rural areas is problematic, both for adults and young people. Any community mental health service provided in the Welsh context needs to take into account the large rural population. However, as with mental health services provided anywhere, they cannot be seen in isolation from the other community services upon which service users depend, such as transport, which can be a particular issue. We have recommended, therefore, that the Welsh Government takes action to ensure that its rural health plan addresses access to

Clywsom gan dystion fod gallu cael gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl cymunedol mewn llawer ardal wledig yn broblem, i oedolion ac i bobl ifanc. Mae angen i unrhyw wasanaeth iechyd meddwl cymunedol a ddarperir mewn cyd-destun Cymreig ystyried y boblogaeth wledig fawr. Fodd bynnag, yn fel gyda gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl a ddarperir mewn unrhyw le, ni ellir ystyried gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl cymunedol ar wahân i'r gwasanaethau cymunedol eraill y mae defnyddwyr gwasanaeth yn dibynnu arnynt, megis cludiant, sy'n gallu bod yn broblem benodol. Felly, yr ydym wedi

community mental health services by people living in rural parts of Wales. We welcome, Minister, the statement that you have made today in that regard.

There has long been concern in Wales about weaknesses in child and adolescent mental health services, a concern that was reinforced last week in the report that was produced jointly by the Wales Audit Office and Healthcare Inspectorate Wales, which found that services are still failing many children and young people. Our inquiry was mainly focused on adult mental health services, but problems with transition arrangements for young people with mental health problems, as they moved from the services for children to those for adults, was a common theme that was brought to our attention by a range of witnesses, including the children's commissioner. These services are needed at a critical time in young people's lives, when they are experiencing the transition from childhood to adulthood and, in some cases, the emergence of mental health problems. It is clear from the evidence we received that services for many of these young people are failing to support them through these difficulties, and that the consequences of that can last well beyond adolescence.

It also emerged during the course of our inquiry that the mental health problems of young people in the criminal justice system are not, in many cases, being addressed, and that that contributes to a pattern of mental ill health and recurring offending behaviour in some individuals. Therefore, we have strongly recommended the establishment of a mental health service specifically for young people aged between 17 and 25, which would facilitate transition to adult services at a time that is appropriate for each young person, and which would be based on clinical judgment rather than on service configuration.

In his evidence to us, the children's commissioner highlighted the stigma and confusion around mental health issues affecting young people, and the lack of

argymell y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru gymryd camau i sicrhau bod ei chynllun iechyd gwledig yn mynd i'r afael â gallu pobl sy'n byw mewn rhannau gwledig o Gymru i gael gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl cymunedol. Weinidog, yr ydym yn croesawu'r datganiad yr ydych wedi'i wneud heddiw i'r perwyl hwnnw.

Mae pryder yng Nghymru ers amser am wendidau mewn gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasoed, ac y mae'n bryder a ategwyd yr wythnos diwethaf yn yr adroddiad a luniwyd ar y cyd gan Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru ac Arolygiaeth Gofal Iechyd Cymru, a ddarganfu nad yw gwasanaethau'n diwallu anghenion llawer o blant a phobl ifanc o hyd. Yr oedd ein hymchwiliad yn canolbwyntio'n bennaf ar wasanaethau iechyd meddwl oedolion, ond yr oedd problemau gyda threfniadau pontio i bobl ifanc â phroblemau iechyd meddwl, wrth iddynt symud o wasanaethau plant i wasanaethau oedolion, yn thema gyffredin y tynnwyd ein sylw ati gan ystod o dystion, gan gynnwys y comisiynydd plant. Mae angen y gwasanaethau hyn ar adeg hollbwysig ym mywydau pobl ifanc, wrth iddynt symud o fod yn blant i fod yn oedolion, ac mewn rhai achosion wrth i broblemau iechyd meddwl ddod i'r amlwg. Mae'n amlwg o'r dystiolaeth a gawsom fod y gwasanaethau ar gyfer llawer o'r bobl ifanc hyn yn methu eu cefnogi drwy'r anawsterau hyn, ac y gall canlyniadau hynny barhau ymhell ar ôl cyfnod y glasoed.

Daeth i'r amlwg hefyd yn ystod ein hymchwiliad nad yw problemau iechyd meddwl pobl ifanc yn y system cyfiawnder troseddol yn cael sylw mewn nifer o achosion, a bod hynny'n cyfrannu at batrwm o afiechyd meddwl ac aildroeddu parhaus yn achos rhai unigolion. Felly, yr ydym wedi argymhell yn gryf y dylid sefydlu gwasanaeth iechyd meddwl yn arbennig i bobl ifanc rhwng 17 a 25 oed, i hwyluso'r cyfnod pontio i wasanaethau oedolion ar adeg sy'n briodol i bob person ifanc, ac yn seiliedig ar farn glinigol yn hytrach na chyfluniad gwasanaethau.

Yn ei dystiolaeth inni, tynnodd y comisiynydd plant sylw at yr ymdeimlad o warth a'r dryswch sy'n gysylltiedig â phroblemau iechyd meddwl ac sy'n effeithio

information on the services available. There is a clear need for health promotion and educational work in relation to mental health issues for children and young people and the services that they might receive. Staff in schools need to be aware of the services that are available to help children and young people with mental health problems. The committee has recommended that the Welsh Government initiates a programme of work to raise awareness among children, their families and professionals of mental health issues and the services available to children and young people.

As I mentioned earlier, the Minister has accepted, either wholly or in principle, all of the committee's recommendations. We know that the draft mental health LCO, put forward by my colleague Jonathan Morgan, will be discussed in the Assembly next week. I welcome the Minister's positive response to our report. I look forward to her contribution to the debate today, and perhaps she will be able to comment on how the draft mental health LCO might also be able to contribute to implementing these recommendations.

Finally, before I conclude, I thank those who gave evidence to the committee, the committee members and the staff who helped to produce our report.

Val Lloyd: I add my thanks to those given by Darren to all who participated and to the staff who helped us in the review. The evidence that was gathered during the Health, Wellbeing and Local Government Committee's inquiry into community mental health services showed that, although much has been done, a significant amount of progress remains to be achieved to ensure that the complex needs of those with a mental illness are adequately met. Those needs are incredibly diverse and complex—if I could think of a better word than 'complex', I would have used it, but that is all I could come up with. However, they are certainly complex.

ar bobl ifanc, a'r diffyg gwybodaeth am y gwasanaethau sydd ar gael. Mae'n amlwg bod angen gwneud gwaith ym maes addysg a hybu iechyd ar broblemau iechyd meddwl ymysg plant a phobl ifanc, a'r gwasanaethau y gallent eu cael. Mae angen i staff mewn ysgolion fod yn ymwybodol o'r gwasanaethau sydd ar gael i helpu plant a phobl ifanc sydd â phroblemau iechyd meddwl. Mae'r pwyllgor wedi argymhell y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru ddechrau rhaglen waith i gynyddu ymwybyddiaeth o broblemau iechyd meddwl a'r gwasanaethau sydd ar gael i blant a phobl ifanc ymysg plant, eu teuluoedd a gweithwyr proffesiynol.

Fel y soniais yn gynharach, mae'r Gweinidog wedi derbyn pob un o argymhellion y pwyllgor, yn gyfan gwbl ynteu mewn egwyddor. Gwyddom y bydd y Gorchymyn Cymhwysedd Deddfwriaethol drafft ynghylch iechyd meddwl, a gyflwynwyd gan fy nghydweithiwr, Jonathan Morgan, yn cael ei drafod yn y Cynulliad yr wythnos nesaf. Croesawaf ymateb cadarnhaol y Gweinidog i'n hadroddiad. Edrychaf ymlaen at ei chyfraniad i'r ddadl heddiw, ac efallai y bydd modd iddi roi sylwadau ar y ffordd y gallai'r Gorchymyn Cymhwysedd Deddfwriaethol drafft ynghylch iechyd meddwl gyfrannu hefyd at weithredu'r argymhellion hyn.

Yn olaf, cyn cloi, hoffwn ddiolch i'r rheini a roddodd dystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor, aelodau'r pwyllgor, a'r staff a'n cynorthwyodd i lunio ein hadroddiad.

Val Lloyd: Hoffwn innau ategu diolchiadau Darren i bawb a gymerodd ran ac i'r staff a'n cynorthwyodd yn ystod yr adolygiad. Dangosodd y dystiolaeth a gasglwyd yn ystod ymchwiliad y Pwyllgor Iechyd, Lles a Llywodraeth Leol i wasanaethau iechyd meddwl cymunedol fod llawer iawn o gynnydd eto i'w wneud, er bod llawer wedi'i gyflawni eisoes, i sicrhau bod anghenion cymhleth pobl sydd â salwch meddwl yn cael eu diwallu'n ddigonol. Mae'r anghenion hynny'n eithriadol o amrywiol a chymhleth—pe bawn yn gallu meddwl am air gwell na 'chymhleth', byddwn wedi'i ddefnyddio, ond dyna'r gair gorau y gallwn feddwl amdano. Fodd bynnag, maent yn sicr yn gymhleth.

We heard evidence from a wide range of people: from children and young people, people in the criminal justice system, those with substance misuse problems, and those with multiple needs. It became quite clear that a service only-based approach is not the appropriate way to address mental health issues. I firmly believe, as do the organisations that participated in the review, that the focus must be on meeting the individual needs of service users. This is not an easy path, but one that should be developed if we are to have a mental health service that can accept and deal with users on an individual basis.

This tailor-made approach must start at the first port of call for people experiencing mental ill health. I feel particularly strongly about recommendations 9 and 10 of the committee report, which call for more mental health nurses working in primary care, and for clarification of the role that GP surgeries are to play in mental health service provision. I am, therefore, pleased that the Minister has indicated her intention to include improved specialist mental health provision in GP surgeries as part of a future mental health Measure. Access to support as soon as people become unwell is obviously better for the individual, and is also a more efficient use of resources than the more expensive secondary care services people may need in future if they do not have access to these early interventions.

Darren referred to the recovery model, and the recommendation on the adoption of the mental health recovery model shows, in my view, a key change in attitudes towards mental ill health. Witnesses showed how recovery-focused care plans, prepared with their full involvement, helped them to access the appropriate services and to move on with their lives. However, I remain concerned about the impact of stigma and discrimination on those who experience mental ill health. I support Gofal Cymru's call for a national anti-stigma campaign. Mental illness affects one in four people, and the stigma is still so strong that it often prevents people from

Clywsom dystiolaeth gan ystod eang o bobl: plant a phobl ifanc, pobl yn y system cyfiawnder troseddol, pobl sydd â phroblemau camddefnyddio sylweddau, a phobl ag anghenion amryfal. Daeth yn eithaf amlwg nad dull gweithredu yn cael ei arwain gan wasanaethau'n unig yw'r ffordd briodol i fynd i'r afael â phroblemau iechyd meddwl. Credaf yn bendant, fel y sefydliadau a gymerodd ran yn yr adolygiad, ei bod yn rhaid canolbwyntio ar ddiwallu anghenion unigol defnyddwyr gwasanaethau. Nid yw'r llwybr hwn yn hawdd, ond y mae'n un y dylid ei ddatblygu os ydym am gael gwasanaeth iechyd meddwl sy'n gallu derbyn defnyddwyr ac ymdrin â hwy fel unigolion.

Rhaid i'r dull gweithredu hwn, sy'n teilwra gwasanaethau ar gyfer unigolion, ddechrau yn y lle cyntaf lle bydd pobl ag afiechyd meddwl yn mynd. Mae gennyf deimladau arbennig o gryf ynghylch argymhellion 9 a 10 yn adroddiad y pwyllgor, sy'n galw am gynyddu nifer y nyrsys iechyd meddwl sy'n gweithio ym maes gofal sylfaenol, ac egluro'r rôl y dylai practisau meddygon teulu ei chwarae o ran darparu gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl. Felly, yr wyf yn falch fod y Gweinidog wedi mynegi ei bwriad i gynnwys gwell darpariaeth iechyd meddwl arbenigol mewn practisau meddygon teulu, fel rhan o Fesur yn y dyfodol ar iechyd meddwl. Mae'n amlwg fod gallu cael cymorth cyn gynted ag y bydd pobl yn mynd yn sâl yn well i'r unigolyn, ac y mae hefyd yn defnyddio adnoddau'n fwy effeithiol na'r gwasanaethau gofal eilaidd drutach y gall fod eu hangen ar bobl yn y dyfodol os na allant gael yr ymyriadau cynnar hyn.

Cyfeiriodd Darren at y model gwella, ac yn fy marn i mae'r argymhelliad ar fabwysiadu'r model gwella iechyd meddwl yn dangos newid allweddol mewn agweddau at afiechyd meddwl. Dangosodd tystion sut yr oedd cynlluniau gofal sy'n canolbwyntio ar wella, a gaiff eu paratoi gan gynnwys y cleifion yn llawn, yn helpu'r cleifion i allu cael y gwasanaethau priodol a mynd ymlaen â'u bywydau. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn dal i bryderu am effaith yr ymdeimlad o warth a gwahaniaethu ar y bobl sydd ag afiechyd meddwl. Yr wyf yn cefnogi galwad Gofal Cymru am ymgyrch genedlaethol i fynd i'r afael â'r ymdeimlad hwnnw o warth. Mae

seeking the help they need. This must change, and I believe that the Welsh Assembly Government must take the lead in educating society and in ensuring that people suffering from mental ill health live their life independently and with dignity.

Andrew R.T. Davies: I thank the Chair of the committee for his opening remarks about the way that the committee looked at this subject. I joined the committee some way through the inquiry, but having read the part of the report that relates to the evidence that was taken before I joined the committee, I am sure that we can all appreciate the scale of the issue and the problem faced by the service and service providers in Wales. I pay tribute to my predecessor, Jonathan Morgan, and his predecessor, David Melding, for the work that they have done during their tenure in the Assembly in advancing the cause of mental health issues. I hope that a better service will develop on the ground.

I also pay tribute to those who gave evidence to the committee and the critical role of that evidence in informing the recommendations, of which there are 28 in this report. I will not attempt to discuss them all, but some jumped out at me as being of particular relevance. The first of these related to child and adolescent mental health services. In the light of the various reports published last week and the Minister's response to them, it would be good to hear from the Minister how she proposes to take forward the agenda, particularly on adolescent mental health services for 16 to 18-year-olds. The evidence that the committee took indicated that these services should be provided for those up to the age of 25 in order to address the needs of the patient and the individual seeking support so that they can rebuild their lives, rather than—as the Minister's response identifies—resourcing initiatives for those up to the age of 18, which is the current agenda.

salwch meddwl yn effeithio ar un o bob pedwar o bobl, ac y mae'r ymdeimlad o warth mor gryf o hyd nes ei fod yn aml yn atal pobl rhag gofyn am yr help y mae arnynt ei angen. Rhaid i hynny newid, a chredaf ei bod yn rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ddangos y ffordd wrth addysgu cymdeithas a sicrhau bod pobl sy'n dioddef o afiechyd meddwl yn byw eu bywyd yn annibynnol a chydag urddas.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Diolch i Gadeirydd y pwyllgor am ei sylwadau agoriadol am y ffordd yr astudiodd y pwyllgor y pwnc hwn. Ymunais â'r pwyllgor gryn amser wedi i'r ymchwiliad ddechrau, ond ar ôl darllen y rhan o'r adroddiad sy'n ymwneud â'r dystiolaeth a gasglwyd cyn imi ymuno â'r pwyllgor, yr wyf yn siŵr y gallwn i gyd werthfawrogi cymaint yw'r broblem sy'n wynebu'r gwasanaeth a darparwyd gwasanaethau yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn rhoi teyrnged i'm rhagflaenydd, Jonathan Morgan, a'i ragflaenydd yntau, David Melding, am y gwaith y maent wedi'i wneud yn ystod eu cyfnod yn y Cynulliad i hybu materion iechyd meddwl. Gobeithio y bydd gwasanaeth gwell yn datblygu ar lawr gwlad.

Yr wyf hefyd yn rhoi teyrnged i'r rhai a roddodd dystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor, a rôl hollbwysig y dystiolaeth honno wrth lywio'r argymhellion, 28 ohonynt yn yr adroddiad hwn. Nid wyf am geisio trafod pob un, ond tynnodd rhai fy sylw am eu bod yn arbennig o berthnasol. Yr oedd y cyntaf o'r rhain yn ymwneud â gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasoed. Yng ngoleuni'r amryw adroddiadau a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos diwethaf, ac ymateb y Gweinidog iddynt, byddai'n dda clywed gan y Gweinidog sut mae'n bwriadu symud yr agenda yn ei blaen, yn enwedig yng nghyswllt gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl y glasoed i bobl rhwng 16 a 18 oed. Dangosodd y dystiolaeth a gasglodd y pwyllgor y dylai'r gwasanaethau hynny gael eu darparu ar gyfer pobl ifanc hyd at 25 oed, er mwyn mynd i'r afael ag anghenion y claf a'r unigolyn sy'n ceisio cymorth, er mwyn iddo allu ailadeiladu ei fywyd, yn hytrach na dyrannu adnoddau—fel y mae ymateb y Gweinidog yn ei nodi—i fentrau ar gyfer pobl ifanc hyd at 18 oed, sef yr agenda bresennol.

One of the comments made by Gofal Cymru in an evidence session was that support was based entirely on age and not on how well young people are, or not, as the case may be. That is a tragic indictment of the way in which the current system looks at an individual. I would welcome the Minister being proactive in addressing the move from adolescence into adulthood, because support in that regard would be greatly appreciated.

The section on substance misuse was a powerful section of the report. Many individuals found themselves in a quandary when they presented for help or were referred for help in the field of substance misuse. The evidence presented by Barnardo's identified that if an individual was misusing substances, he or she would not be offered mental health provision or obstacles would be put in their way. Likewise, if they had mental health issues, the obstacles would be put in the other way around, preventing them from accessing treatment for substance misuse.

4.00 p.m.

One of the statements in the report identified that the exemptions are greater than the inclusions in the services that are provided. It is that type of evidence that will hopefully give us the route-map to get to the source of the problem. We need to be looking at the individual and looking holistically, and then building the services around those individuals. Val Lloyd touched on the recovery model and the recommendation that the Government should accept that model of treating the individual as an individual. The Minister said that that has already been done via the national service framework document. What troubles me greatly is that much of the evidence indicated the failings of the national service framework in delivering service provision. When the Minister responds, I hope very much that she will address the concerns of the various bodies that recognised the fine aspirations of the NSF document, but said that there is sadly a lack of delivery on the ground when implementing

Un o'r sylwadau a wnaed gan Gofal Cymru mewn sesiwn dystiolaeth oedd bod cymorth yn cael ei seilio'n gyfan gwbl ar oedran, nid ar ba mor iach neu sâl, yn dibynnu ar yr achos dan sylw, y mae pobl ifanc yn teimlo. Mae hynny'n feirniadaeth drist iawn o'r ffordd y mae'r system bresennol yn ystyried unigolyn. Byddwn yn croesawu gweld y Gweinidog yn mynd ati'n rhagweithiol i roi sylw i'r cyfnod rhwng y glasoed a thyfu'n oedolyn, oherwydd byddai cymorth i'r perwyl hwnnw'n cael ei werthfawrogi'n fawr.

Yr oedd yr adran ar gamddefnyddio sylweddau yn adran rymus yn yr adroddiad. Yr oedd llawer o unigolion yn eu cael eu hunain mewn cyfyng-gyngor wrth ofyn am help neu gael eu cyfeirio at help ym maes camddefnyddio sylweddau. Nododd y dystiolaeth a gyflwynwyd gan Barnardo's na fyddai unigolyn, os oedd yn camddefnyddio sylweddau, yn cael cynnig darpariaeth iechyd meddwl, neu byddai rhwystrau'n cael eu rhoi yn ei ffordd. Yn yr un modd, os oedd gan unigolyn broblemau iechyd meddwl, byddai'r rhwystrau'n cael eu rhoi i'r gwrthwyneb, gan atal yr unigolyn rhag gallu cael triniaeth am gamddefnyddio sylweddau.

Nododd un o'r datganiadau yn yr adroddiad fod nifer y bobl a gaiff eu heithrio o wasanaethau a ddarperir yn fwy na'r sy'n cael eu cynnwys ynddynt. Gobeithio mai dyna'r math o dystiolaeth a fydd yn drywydd inni gyrraedd gwraidd y broblem. Mae angen inni fod yn edrych ar yr unigolyn ac edrych yn gyfannol, ac yna adeiladu'r gwasanaethau o amgylch yr unigolion hynny. Crybwyllodd Val Lloyd y model gwella, a'r argymhelliad y dylai'r Llywodraeth dderbyn y model hwnnw ar gyfer trin yr unigolyn fel unigolyn. Dywedodd y Gweinidog fod hynny wedi'i wneud eisoes drwy ddogfen y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol. Yr hyn sy'n fy mhoeni'n fawr yw fod llawer o'r dystiolaeth wedi dangos methiannau'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol i sicrhau darpariaeth gwasanaethau. Pan fydd y Gweinidog yn ymateb, gobeithio'n fawr y bydd yn rhoi sylw i bryderon yr amrywiol gyrff a oedd yn cydnabod dyheadau clodwiw dogfen y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol, ond a

policy.

The Minister has just undertaken a reform of the health service and delegated responsibility for mental health services. I can see how it looks on paper as though it is a sound delegation to the vice-chairs, because they are charged with looking after primary and community care, and surely when people present in the community, it is better to treat them in the community. However, one of the quotations in the report says that people should not be passed on. People who are being treated in secondary are there because they require secondary care and should not be cared for in the primary sector. Ultimately, if we can treat people as close as possible to their community and at the earliest possible opportunity, that will stop a lot of the problems building up. I am prepared to say that we should give this time to bed down to see whether the interaction takes place. I very much hope that it does. I very much hope that the health committee reviews this as we go further into the third Assembly, to make sure that those responsibilities are executed by the vice-chairs of the new trusts, so that one discipline is not overshadowed by another. They need to be working in unison for the betterment of the individual.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Can you wind up, please?

Andrew R.T. Davies: Once again, I thank the committee for preparing this report and I hope that the Minister will engage proactively in implementing the 28 recommendations.

Helen Mary Jones: I do not wish to reiterate the points that have already been made, both in the report and the debate, but I do want to associate myself with the thanks that have already been expressed to all those who contributed and to the staff. It is a good report and I hope that the Minister will feel that it strengthens her hand in driving this agenda forward.

ddywedodd fod diffyg canlyniadau ar lawr gwlad, yn anffodus, wrth weithredu polisi.

Mae'r Gweinidog newydd ddiwygio'r gwasanaeth iechyd a dirprwyo cyfrifoldeb am wasanaethau iechyd meddwl. Gallaf weld sut mae dirprwyo i'r is-gadeiryddion yn ymddangos, ar bapur, yn gam doeth, oherwydd yr is-gadeiryddion sy'n gyfrifol am ofalu am ofal sylfaenol a chymunedol, a phan fydd pobl yn gofyn am help yn y gymuned, rhaid ei bod yn well eu trin yn y gymuned. Fodd bynnag, mae un o'r dyfyniadau yn yr adroddiad yn dweud na ddylai pobl gael eu trosglwyddo i asiantaethau eraill. Mae pobl sy'n cael triniaeth yn y sector eilaidd yno am fod arnynt angen gofal eilaidd, ac ni ddylid gofalu amdanynt yn y sector sylfaenol. Yn y pen draw, os gallwn drin pobl mor agos ag sy'n bosibl i'w cymuned a chyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl, bydd hynny'n atal llawer o broblemau rhag cronni. Yr wyf yn barod i ddweud y dylem roi amser i'r drefn hon ymsefydlu er mwyn gweld a fydd y rhyngweithio'n digwydd. Gobeithio'n fawr y bydd. Gobeithio'n fawr y bydd y pwyllgor iechyd yn adolygu hyn wrth inni symud ymhellach drwy'r trydydd Cynulliad, er mwyn gwneud yn siŵr fod y cyfrifoldebau hynny'n cael eu cyflawni gan is-gadeiryddion yr ymddiriedolaethau newydd, fel na chaiff un ddisgyblaeth fod dan gysgod un arall. Mae angen i bob disgyblaeth weithio ar y cyd i wella'r unigolyn dan sylw.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. A wnewch chi ddirwyn eich araith i ben, os gwelwch yn dda?

Andrew R.T. Davies: Unwaith eto, hoffwn ddiolch i'r pwyllgor am baratoi'r adroddiad hwn, a gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn mynd ati'n rhagweithiol i weithredu'r 28 argymhelliad.

Helen Mary Jones: Nid wyf yn dymuno ailadrodd y pwyntiau a wnaed eisoes, yn yr adroddiad ac yn y ddadl, ond yr wyf am ategu'r diolchiadau sydd wedi'u mynegi eisoes i bawb a gyfrannodd, ac i'r staff. Mae'n adroddiad da, a gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn teimlo'i fod yn cryfhau ei sefyllfa o ran symud yr agenda hon yn ei blaen.

I just want to make some brief comments about two particular recommendations. The first is recommendation 4, which was carefully and delicately worded, as Darren Millar has already acknowledged, and talks about resources being identified, tracked and protected. We could not agree to say 'ring-fenced', so we did not, but, unlike some committee members, I was convinced by the evidence that was put forward on the need for ring-fencing. The Minister will be aware of the concerns that some of the voluntary organisations had at the time of the reorganisation that if responsibility for mental health was left in the hands of the local health boards, those resources would be lost. I congratulate the Minister on agreeing to ring-fence that money and I ask her to keep it up. I believe that giving the vice-chairs of the boards the specific responsibility for mental health issues will help. As Chair of the Children and Young People Committee, I can tell you that we will be asking to meet those vice-chairs to discuss directly with them what their plans are to drive the agenda forward. I do have some faith in the system, but I still think, as we say in Welsh, that '*Diwedd y gân yw'r geiniog*'—at the end of the song, there is always a penny, or it all boils down to money. If services are to be developed, we will need to protect these resources for some time to come, especially in difficult times.

The other recommendation that I want to refer to has already been touched on, but I want to elaborate on it a little. It is recommendation 16 about the establishment of a mental health service specifically for young people aged 17 to 25. Again, I should perhaps put on record my interest as the Chair of the Children and Young People Committee, as well as somebody who, in a professional life, has had cause to see young people going through difficult transitions. Andrew R.T. Davies has already made reference to this issue.

I am glad that the Minister has accepted this recommendation in principle, but the Minister will also be aware that I am always a bit worried when recommendations are accepted in principle. Therefore, I hope that the Minister can give reassurances that the raising of the age range for CAMHS to 18 is

Y cyfan yr wyf am ei wneud yw cyflwyno rhai sylwadau byr am ddau argymhelliad penodol. Yr un cyntaf yw argymhelliad 4, sydd wedi'i eirio'n ofalus ac yn sensitif, fel y mae Darren Millar eisoes wedi cydnabod, ac sy'n sôn am nodi, olrhain a diogelu adnoddau. Ni allem gytuno i ddweud 'neilltuo', ac ni wnaethom hynny, felly. Ond yn wahanol i rai aelodau o'r pwyllgor, cefais i fy argyhoeddi gan y dystiolaeth a gyflwynwyd fod angen neilltuo adnoddau. Bydd y Gweinidog yn gwybod am bryderon rhai o'r mudiadau gwirfoddol adeg yr ad-drefnu, sef y byddai'r adnoddau hynny'n cael eu colli pe bai'r cyfrifoldeb am iechyd meddwl yn cael ei adael yn nwylo'r byrddau iechyd lleol. Yr wyf yn llongyfarch y Gweinidog ar gytuno i neilltuo'r arian hwnnw, a gofynnaf iddi barhau i wneud hynny. Credaf y bydd rhoi'r cyfrifoldeb penodol am faterion iechyd meddwl i is-gadeiryddion y byrddau yn help. Fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc, gallaf ddweud wrthyf y byddwn yn gofyn am gael cyfarfod â'r is-gadeiryddion hynny i drafod yn uniongyrchol gyda hwy beth yw eu cynlluniau ar gyfer symud yr agenda yn ei blaen. Mae gennyf rywfaint o ffydd yn y system, ond yr wyf yn dal i feddwl mai diwedd y gân yw'r geiniog. Os bwriedir datblygu gwasanaethau, bydd angen inni ddiogelu'r adnoddau hyn am gryn amser i ddod, yn enwedig yn ystod cyfnodau anodd.

Mae'r argymhelliad arall yr wyf am gyfeirio ato eisoes wedi ei grybwyll, ond hoffwn ymhelaethu ryw ychydig arno. Yr wyf yn sôn am argymhelliad 16 i sefydlu gwasanaeth iechyd meddwl yn arbennig i bobl ifanc rhwng 17 a 25 oed. Unwaith eto, efallai y dylwn gofnodi fy niddordeb fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc, ac fel rhywun sydd wedi gweld pobl ifanc yn mynd drwy gyfnodau pontio anodd, yn fy mywyd proffesiynol. Mae Andrew R.T. Davies eisoes wedi cyfeirio at y mater.

Yr wyf yn falch fod y Gweinidog wedi derbyn egwyddor yr argymhelliad hwn, ond bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol hefyd fy mod bob amser braidd yn bryderus pan gaiff egwyddor argymhellion yn ei derbyn. Felly, gobeithio y gall y Gweinidog roi sicrwydd mai'r cam cyntaf yw codi'r ystod oedran ar

a first step, and that she will look seriously at how we can create an integrated service so that, as others have said, it can be based on what a young person needs, and not on how old they are, chronologically.

With those brief remarks, I will close. However, I am glad to see that the Minister has accepted these important recommendations. We have put mental health high on our agenda in debates in this place for a long time, but the evidence given to the committee showed that that has yet to make enough of a change on the ground. I am glad to see this being moved forward.

David Melding: It is with pleasure that I commend this excellent report, which does much to advance the interests of many people who suffer from mental illnesses. I say that in my role as chair of the all-party group on mental illnesses. Darren said that one in four adults will experience a mental health problem at some point in their lives, and I know what he is talking about, as I have been there. To be candid, I have had regular bouts of mental illness throughout my adult life.

I will go through some of the issues in the report, and reflect on some of my own experiences. The recovery model is vital, and let me tell you why. It places the individual at the centre of the treatment, and it gives that person a feeling of control over their lives in starting to get things back together. If you could will away a state of anxiety or depression, no-one would have mental illnesses, but you cannot. When people ask me what it is like to have a mental illness, I say that it is like a physical illness, in that it comes from outside and hits you. It is not something that you elect to have. You do not sign a form saying, 'I would like to be mentally ill next month'. It is a physical process, and yet we talk about mental illness as though it were in a different category and as though it were somehow a non-physical condition, which, in my view, it is not. On the recovery model, most people who suffer a

gyfer gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasoed i 18, ac y bydd yn edrych o ddifrif i weld sut y gallwn greu gwasanaeth integredig fel y gellir ei seilio, fel y mae pobl eraill wedi ei ddweud, ar yr hyn y mae ar berson ifanc ei angen, nid ar oed y person ifanc, yn gronolegol.

Dof a'm cyfraniad i ben gyda'r sylwadau byr hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn falch gweld bod y Gweinidog wedi derbyn yr argymhellion pwysig hyn. Yr ydym wedi sicrhau bod iechyd meddwl yn uchel ar ein hagenda mewn dadleuon yn y lle hwn ers amser, ond dangosodd y dystiolaeth a roddwyd i'r pwyllgor nad yw hynny wedi sicrhau digon o newid o hyd ar lawr gwlad. Yr wyf yn falch gweld yr agenda hon yn cael ei symud yn ei blaen.

David Melding: Mae'n bleser gennyf gymeradwyo'r adroddiad ardderchog hwn sy'n gwneud llawer i hybu buddiannau nifer o bobl sydd ag afiechydon meddwl. Dywedaf hynny yn fy rôl fel cadeirydd y grŵp hollbleidiol ar afiechydon meddwl. Dywedodd Darren y bydd problem iechyd meddwl yn effeithio ar un oedolyn o bob pedwar rywbyrd yn ystod eu bywyd, a gwn am beth y mae'n sôn, oherwydd yr wyf yn un ohonynt. A dweud y gwir, yr wyf wedi dioddef pyliau rheolaidd o salwch meddwl trwy gydol fy mywyd fel oedolyn.

Hoffwn roi sylw i rai o'r materion yn yr adroddiad, a myfyrio ynghylch rhai o'm profiadau personol i. Mae'r model gwella yn hanfodol, a gadewch imi ddweud wrthyhch pam. Mae'n sicrhau bod y driniaeth yn canolbwyntio ar yr unigolyn, ac y mae'n rhoi i'r person hwnnw ymdeimlad o reolaeth ar ei fywyd, o ran dechrau cael trefn ar bethau unwaith eto. Pe gallech ewyllysio bod gorbryder neu iselder ysbryd yn diflannu, ni fyddai neb yn dioddef o afiechydon meddwl, ond ni allwch wneud hynny. Pan fydd pobl yn gofyn imi sut brofiad yw cael salwch meddwl, byddaf yn dweud ei fod yn debyg i salwch corfforol, yn yr ystyr ei fod yn dod o'r tu allan ac yn eich taro. Nid yw'n rhywbeth yr ydych yn dewis ei gael. Nid ydych yn llofnodi ffurflen sy'n dweud, 'Hoffwn gael salwch meddwl fis nesaf'. Mae'n broses gorfforol, ond eto i gyd byddwn yn siarad am salwch meddwl fel pe bai mewn categori

bout of anxiety or depression will take many months to recover, and so the treatment will have to continue for that period. However, it is not just about medication, but also about sustaining your social circle and being productive in the workplace. All these aspects of life are crucial to recovery, so it is important that they are all taken into account.

The vice-chairs of the new health bodies ought to be mental health champions, and I do not think that you need to go further than that. That will be the measure of how successful this innovation turns out to be.

We need more consistency in the quality of our services, and I will say a couple of things about that right at the end.

We also need to raise awareness levels among primary care staff in general, because that is where most people will be treated and it is where we could do more to identify problems. An awful lot of people will suffer some form of mild or moderate depression or anxiety that is not diagnosed, although it can be quite debilitating. That is where they could get real help. As we move towards models of GP surgeries comprising not one or two partners anymore but several—four, half a dozen or 10 partners—there ought to be a mental health practitioner in every primary care practice to lead the whole team, if not to deal with all the cases, so that everyone is up to the mark in their response to mental health issues.

On the quality of services, I want to make a quick reference to the recent report by various agencies, including the Wales Audit Office, on the services for children and adolescents. I wish to highlight a few issues of real concern for the Minister to consider, as I know she will. Services for children under the age of five and 16 to 18-year-olds are considered to be particularly vulnerable,

ac fel pe bai rywsut yn anhwylder nad yw'n anhwylder corfforol, ac nid yw hynny'n wir yn fy marn i. O ran y model gwella, bydd mwyafrif y bobl sy'n dioddef pwl o orbryder neu iselder ysbryd yn cymryd misoedd lawer i wella, a rhaid i'r driniaeth barhau am y cyfnod hwnnw, felly. Fodd bynnag, nid mater o feddyginiaeth yn unig ydyw, ond hefyd o gynnal eich cylch cymdeithasol a bod yn gynhyrchiol yn y gweithle. Mae'r holl agweddau hyn ar fywyd yn hanfodol er mwyn gwella, ac felly y mae'n bwysig i bob un ohonynt yn cael ei ystyried.

Dylai is-gadeiryddion y cyrff iechyd newydd fod yn hyrwyddwyr iechyd meddwl, ac ni chredaf fod angen ichi fynd ymhellach na hynny. Dyna sut y bydd llwyddiant yr arloesedd hwn yn cael ei fesur.

Mae arnom angen mwy o gysondeb yn ansawdd ein gwasanaethau, a hoffwn ddweud ambell beth am hynny ar y diwedd.

Mae angen hefyd inni gynyddu lefelau ymwybyddiaeth ymhlith staff gofal sylfaenol yn gyffredinol, oherwydd yno y bydd y mwyafrif o bobl yn cael eu trin, a dyna lle gallem wneud mwy i adnabod problemau. Bydd llu o bobl yn dioddef mathau ysgafn neu gymedrol o orbryder neu iselder ysbryd na chânt eu diagnosio, er y gallant fod yn anhwylderau digon gwanychol. Dyna ble gallai'r bobl hynny gael help gwirioneddol. Wrth inni symud i gyfeiriad modelau lle mae meddygfeydd meddygon teulu'n cynnwys nifer o bartneriaid—pedwar, hanner dwsin neu 10 partner—erbyn hyn yn hytrach nag un neu ddau bartner yn unig, dylai fod gan bob practis gofal sylfaenol ymarferydd iechyd meddwl i arwain y tîm cyfan, os nad i ymdrin â phob achos, er mwyn i ymateb pawb i broblemau iechyd meddwl fod y gorau sydd ar gael.

O ran safon gwasanaethau, hoffwn gyfeirio'n sydyn at yr adroddiad yn ddiweddar a luniwyd gan amrywiol asiantaethau, gan gynnwys Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru, ar wasanaethau plant a'r glasoed. Hoffwn dynnu sylw at rai materion sy'n destun pryder gwirioneddol, er mwyn i'r Gweinidog eu hystyried, a gwn y bydd yn gwneud hynny. Ystyrir bod gwasanaethau i blant dan bump

fragile and not up to scratch in some places. We really need to sort that out, because anyone under the age of five who has a mental health condition must be experiencing adverse social conditions. If they are not dealt with, the prognosis will be poor for those children. However, if they are dealt with effectively, the recovery could be complete, and they could lead a much more productive and happy life than if their problems became ingrained and were not tackled effectively.

4.10 p.m.

For 16 to 18-year-olds, the transition to adulthood and adult services is important. My main issue is that many people who present with the serious end of mental health illnesses, the psychotic illnesses, do so in later adolescence and early adulthood, particularly men, although it also affects women. They often present at that age and they can be placed in adult psychiatric units as a result. That is fairly common. It happens all over the country and it happens in Wales. Over the years, I have put questions to the Minister on the number being treated at any one time. If we do one thing regarding acute care for that group, it should be to provide consistent services so that they have their own units and are not in adult wards. Finally, I hope that Jonathan Morgan's proposed LCO will proceed and that we will have the ability to pass a Measure that addresses some of these issues.

Peter Black: I start by endorsing David Melding's comments on the recovery model. It requires an holistic approach to services including housing, employment and support, and such an approach is not currently present in large parts of Wales, so that certainly needs to be worked on if we are to deliver that model and help people to recover from mental illness. I am also delighted to see that the emphasis of that model is on placing the

oed a phobl ifanc rhwng 16 a 18 oed yn arbennig o agored i niwed, yn fregus ac yn amherffaith mewn rhai mannau. Mae gwir angen inni fynd i'r afael â hynny, oherwydd os oes gan rywrai dan bump oed anhwylder iechyd meddwl, rhaid eu bod mewn amodau cymdeithasol andwyol. Os nad ymdrinnir â'r plant hynny, bydd y prognosis yn wael ar eu cyfer. Fodd bynnag, os ymdrinnir â hwy'n effeithiol, gallent wella'n llwyr, a gallent fyw bywyd tipyn mwy cynhyrchiol a hapus na phe bae eu problemau'n gwreiddio a heb gael sylw'n effeithiol.

I bobl ifanc rhwng 16 a 18 oed, mae'r cyfnod pontio i fyd oedolyn a chael gwasanaethau oedolion yn bwysig. Fy mhrif bryder yw bod llawer o bobl sy'n gofyn am help pan fydd ganddynt yr afiechydon meddwl mwyaf difrifol, yr afiechydon seicotig, yn gwneud hynny tua diwedd y cyfnod glasoed a dechrau eu bywyd fel oedolion, yn enwedig dynion, er bod yr afiechydon hynny'n effeithio ar fenywod hefyd. Byddant yn aml yn gofyn am help yn yr oedran hwnnw, a gallant gael eu rhoi mewn unedau seiciatrig i oedolion o ganlyniad. Mae hynny'n ddigon cyffredin. Mae'n digwydd ym mhob cwr o'r wlad ac y mae'n digwydd yng Nghymru. Dros y blynyddoedd, yr wyf wedi gofyn cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog am nifer y bobl sy'n cael eu trin ar unrhyw adeg. Os ydym i lwyddo i wneud un peth ynghylch gofal aciwt ar gyfer y grŵp hwnnw o bobl, dylem ddarparu gwasanaethau cyson er mwyn iddynt gael eu hunedau eu hunain ar wahân i wardiau oedolion. Yn olaf, gobeithio y bydd Gorchymyn Cymhwysedd Deddfwriaethol arfaethedig Jonathan Morgan yn symud yn ei flaen, ac y bydd gennym y gallu i basio Mesur sy'n mynd i'r afael â rhai o'r materion hyn.

Peter Black: Hoffwn ddechrau drwy ategu sylwadau David Melding am y model gwella. Mae'n gofyn am agwedd gyfannol at wasanaethau gan gynnwys gwasanaethau tai, cyflogaeth a chymorth, ac nid oes agwedd felly i'w gweld ar hyn o bryd mewn rhannau helaeth o Gymru. Felly, mae angen gweithio'n bendant ar hynny os ydym i gyflwyno'r model hwnnw a helpu pobl i wella o salwch meddwl. Yr wyf hefyd wrth

sufferer at the centre of the process. So many mental illness sufferers carry poor self-esteem with it, which can be compounded by services that adhere too closely to the medical model, in which the person is not involved in choices about his or her life. That is central to the recommendations in the report in relation to that particular approach to mental illness.

I also want to refer to a number of other sections in the report. First, on the section on the black and minority ethnic community, given cultural differences, the behaviours that are acceptable in one country may be viewed entirely differently by those in the host community. While targeting mental health services directly at BME sufferers will have some effect, raising awareness among us all will prove more effective and less ghettoising in the long run. It is important that we take that lesson on board.

A number of speakers have referred to the proposal for the vice-chairs or directors of local health boards to have the responsibility for driving forward mental health services, and I know that the report is uneasy about that. It will work only if that person has the sole responsibility for driving forward mental health in the local health board. Too often, local health boards treat mental health as a lesser priority, and someone must have a clear responsibility for it that is untrammelled by other responsibilities that could distract from that focus.

The report also makes the point that the national service framework is not being delivered evenly. Paragraph 2.22 of the report makes a significant point, which does not show up in the recommendations, namely that early intervention is vital to prevent escalation. The part of the national service framework that deals with early intervention should be strengthened and resourced accordingly, particularly the funding of psychologists' posts in local health boards.

fy modd gweld bod pwyslais y model hwnnw ar roi'r sawl sy'n dioddef wrth wraidd y broses. Mae cynifer o bobl sy'n dioddef o salwch meddwl hefyd yn dioddef o ddiffyg hunan-barch, a all waethygu oherwydd gwasanaethau sy'n glynu'n rhy agos at y model meddygol, lle nad yw'r unigolyn yn cael ei gynnwys mewn dewisiadau am ei fywyd. Mae hynny'n elfen ganolog yn argymhellion yr adroddiad sy'n ymwneud â'r agwedd benodol honno at salwch meddwl.

Hoffwn gyfeirio hefyd at nifer o adrannau eraill yn yr adroddiad. Yn gyntaf, o ran yr adran ar y gymuned pobl dduon a lleiafrifoedd ethnig, o ystyried gwahaniaethau diwylliannol efallai y bydd ymddygiad sy'n dderbyniol mewn un wlad yn cael ei ystyried yn hollol wahanol gan y gymuned lle mae'r unigolyn dan sylw yn byw. Er y bydd targedu gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl yn uniongyrchol at ddiodefwyr o'r gymuned pobl dduon a lleiafrifoedd ethnig yn cael rhywfaint o effaith, bydd mynd ati i gynyddu ymwybyddiaeth yn ein plith i gyd yn fwy effeithiol yn y pen draw, ac yn llai tebygol o greu ghettos. Mae'n bwysig inni gofio'r wers honno.

Mae nifer o siaradwyr wedi cyfeirio at y cynnig i is-gadeiryddion neu gyfarwyddwyr byrddau iechyd lleol fod yn gyfrifol am hybu gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl, a gwn nad yw'r adroddiad yn fodlon iawn am hynny. Ni fydd hynny'n gweithio oni bai mai unig gyfrifoldeb yr unigolyn hwnnw yw hybu iechyd meddwl yn y bwrdd iechyd lleol. Yn rhy aml, mae byrddau iechyd lleol yn ystyried iechyd meddwl yn flaenoriaeth sy'n llai pwysig, a rhaid i rywun fod â chyfrifoldeb clir amdano nad yw'n cael ei lyffetheirio gan gyfrifoldebau eraill a allai dynnu oddi ar y ffocws hwnnw.

Yn ogystal, mae'r adroddiad yn nodi nad yw'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol yn cael ei weithredu'n gyson. Mae paragraff 2.22 yn yr adroddiad yn gwneud pwynt pwysig, nad yw'n ymddangos yn yr argymhellion, sef bod ymyrryd yn gynnar yn hanfodol i atal problemau rhag gwaethygu. Dylid cryfhau'r rhan o'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol sy'n ymdrin ag ymyrryd yn gynnar, a dylid darparu adnoddau ar ei chyfer yn unol â hynny, yn

enwedig o ran ariannu swyddi seicolegwyr mewn byrddau iechyd lleol.

The other point that I wanted to make before moving to the main thrust of my speech is in relation to court diversion schemes, which are absolutely vital. The recommendation is important, but what is happening in England possibly goes further. The Minister of State for Care Services recently made an announcement establishing a national network of liaison and diversion services that will be up and running in five years' time. Under that proposal, staff throughout the criminal justice system will be trained to spot health problems and learning disabilities, while a diversion and liaison team will work in each court in England to assess offenders' needs. I am not entirely clear on whether that applies to the courts in Wales, and it would be useful to have some clarity on that. However, ensuring that prisoners are registered with GPs and that the process of sending psychiatric reports to court is speeded up are an important part of that.

Mae'r pwynt arall yr oeddwn am ei wneud cyn symud ymlaen i brif fyrddwn fy araith yn ymwneud â chynlluniau dargyfeirio o'r llysoedd, sy'n hollol hanfodol. Mae'r argymhelliad yn bwysig, ond efallai fod yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn Lloegr yn fwy pellgyrhaeddol. Yn ddiweddar, gwnaeth y Gweinidog Gwladol dros Wasanaethau Gofal gyhoeddiad ynghylch sefydlu rhwydwaith cenedlaethol o wasanaethau cyswllt a dargyfeirio a fydd ar waith cyn pen pum mlynedd. Dan y cynnig hwnnw, bydd staff ar draws y system cyfiawnder troseddol yn cael eu hyfforddi i adnabod problemau iechyd ac anableddau dysgu, tra bydd tîm cyswllt a dargyfeirio'n gweithio ym mhob llys yn Lloegr i asesu anghenion troseddwr. Nid wyf yn deall yn hollol a yw hynny'n berthnasol i'r llysoedd yng Nghymru, a byddai'n ddefnyddiol cael rhywfaint o eglurder ynghylch hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae sicrhau bod carcharorion yn cael eu cofrestru gyda meddygon teulu, a bod y broses o anfon adroddiadau seiciatrig i'r llys yn cael ei chyflymu yn rhan bwysig o hynny.

My main concern about mental health services, and I raised it earlier in questions today and in previous Plenary meetings on child and adolescent mental health services, and the report is strong on the concerns around that service. A recent briefing document from children's charities made the point that there is a lack of consistent implementation in the delivery of CAMHS:

Mae fy mhrif bryder ynghylch gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl, ac fe'i mynegais yn gynharach yn y sesiwn gwestiynau heddiw ac mewn Cyfarfodydd Llawn blaenorol, yn ymwneud â gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl i blant a'r glasoed, ac y mae'r adroddiad yn mynegi'n gryf ei bryderon am y gwasanaethau hynny. Mewn dogfen wybodaeth yn ddiweddar gan elusennau plant, nodwyd bod gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl i blant a'r glasoed yn cael eu darparu'n anghyson:

'Despite some targeted non-recurrent funding made available to CAMHS in Wales, we are extremely concerned that there has been a complete lack of a long-term commitment to sustainable investment. We are unaware of any fulfilment of the specific recommendation made by the independent advisory group to the Welsh Assembly Government that, based on its ten year strategic vision, £10 million per year for the first three years would be required.'

Er gwaethaf rhywfaint o gyllid achlysurol wedi ei dargedu ac sydd wedi bod ar gael i wasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasoed yng Nghymru, yr ydym yn pryderu'n ddifrifol nad oes dim ymrwymiad hirdymor i fuddsoddi cynaliadwy. Hyd y gwyddom, nid yw'r argymhelliad penodol a wnaed gan y grŵp cynghori annibynnol i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, sef y byddai angen £10 miliwn y flwyddyn am y tair blynedd cyntaf, ar sail ei gweledigaeth strategol 10 mlynedd, wedi'i weithredu o gwbl.

The Children's Commissioner for Wales has also consistently raised concerns about CAMHS, and has put that down to a lack of investment. In his report, he showed that children in Wales are

Yn ogystal, mae Comisiynydd Plant Cymru wedi mynegi pryderon yn gyson ynghylch gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl i blant a'r glasoed, ac y mae wedi priodoli hynny i ddiffyg buddsoddi. Yn ei adroddiad, dangosodd mai plant Cymru yw

'the poor relations to their peers in England'.

perthnasau tlawd eu cyfoedion yn Lloegr.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Could you wind up, please?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. A wnewch chi ddirwyn eich araith i ben, os gwelwch yn dda?

Peter Black: The report from children's charities concludes on that note, saying that

Peter Black: Mae'r adroddiad gan elusennau plant yn cloi ar y nodyn hwnnw, gan ddweud bod

'the commissioning process is unduly complicated, needs to be far more transparent and should routinely seek the views and experiences of service users and their families in developing and evaluating services'.

y broses gomisiynu yn rhy gymhleth, bod angen iddi fod yn fwy tryloyw o lawer, ac y dylai ofyn fel mater o drefn am safbwyntiau a phrofiadau defnyddwyr gwasanaethau a'u teuluoedd wrth ddatblygu gwasanaethau a'u gwerthuso.

The point is, Minister, that ring-fencing is one thing, but we need additional resources to tackle the structural problems with CAMHS.

Y pwynt, Weinidog, yw mai un peth yw neilltuo adnoddau, ond y mae arnom angen adnoddau ychwanegol i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau strwythurol mewn cysylltiad â gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasoed.

Jonathan Morgan: I start by congratulating the Chair and members of the committee for an excellent report. From my own perspective, it is extremely useful, because next Wednesday we will debate my proposed mental health legislative competence Order, which was laid this morning. There is a build-up of debates and discussions around this important subject. There are a number of issues that we need to tackle head on, and the report alludes to them—particularly how we must move away from the traditional control agenda of clinicians and other members of staff in the NHS regarding people with mental illnesses. We have to move to a situation where people have more control over their care, as David Melding argued—control over the services they access, and advocacy. I know that the Minister is keen to roll-out advocacy throughout Wales, not just based on the independent mental health advocate model, but looking at how we extend a range of advocacy services to people with severe mental illnesses. That is crucial

Jonathan Morgan: Hoffwn ddechrau drwy longyfarch y Cadeirydd ac aelodau'r pwyllgor ar lunio adroddiad ardderchog. O'm safbwynt personol i, mae'n eithriadol o ddefnyddiol, oherwydd ddydd Mercher nesaf byddwn yn cael dadl ar fy Ngorchymyn Cymhwysedd Deddfwriaethol arfaethedig ynghylch iechyd meddwl, a osodwyd y bore yma. Mae nifer y dadleuon a'r trafodaethau ar y pwnc pwysig hwn yn cynyddu. Mae yna nifer o faterion y mae angen inni fynd i'r afael â hwy'n uniongyrchol, ac y mae'r adroddiad yn cyfeirio atynt—yn enwedig sut mae'n rhaid inni symud oddi wrth yr agenda draddodiadol o reolaeth sydd gan glinigwyr ac aelodau staff eraill yn y GIG ar gyfer pobl sydd ag afiechydon meddwl. Rhaid inni symud i sefyllfa lle mae gan bobl fwy o reolaeth ar eu gofal, fel y dadleuodd David Melding—rheolaeth ar y gwasanaethau y gallant eu cael, ac eiriolaeth. Gwn fod y Gweinidog yn awyddus i gyflwyno eiriolaeth ledled Cymru, nid yn unig ar sail model yr eiriolwr iechyd meddwl annibynnol, ond

to ensure that not only do we offer early access and early intervention, but also good, consistent levels of services throughout the spectrum of mental illness.

I agree with the committee that we must move away from the medical model of treatment and look at mental illness holistically. One of the criticisms—and it was a kind criticism—of the original draft of the proposed mental health LCO by the legislation committee chaired by David Melding was that it was too focused on health. Working with the Minister, I have expanded that, as I will explain next week, to take into account the services that are delivered by local authorities. There is a range of people who will have a positive impact on the life of someone with a mental illness, because of the services that can be delivered to that individual. Ultimately, though, in addition to reforming services and delivering the committee's recommendations, we need to tackle stigma. There is still a huge amount of stigma around mental illness, and we need to do more to explain that mental illness knows no boundaries. It does not matter how wealthy or fit you are, how intelligent or tall or short, or fair or dark—it makes no difference at all. Anyone can have a mental illness, and it is believed that one in four of us do—some think that it is closer to one in three. Although I take David Melding's point that it is difficult to distinguish between mental and physical illness, if we were talking about one in four of the population having a physical illness for which treatment was not being delivered in an appropriate or planned way, there would be a national outcry. I strongly believe that, through the work outlined in this committee report, and the work that the Minister for Health and Social Services and I have been doing on the proposed Order, Wales can lead the way in the future on reforming mental health services. I think that we could show the rest of the UK how these services need to be reformed and how they should be delivered for patients.

drwy edrych ar y modd yr ydym yn ymestyn ystod o wasanaethau eiriolaeth i bobl sydd ag afiechydon meddwl difrifol. Mae hynny'n hollbwysig i sicrhau ein bod nid yn unig yn cynnig mynediad cynnar ac ymyrraeth gynnar, ond hefyd yn cynnig lefelau da a chyson o wasanaethau ar draws y sbectrwm salwch meddwl.

Cytunaf â'r pwyllgor ei bod yn rhaid inni symud oddi wrth y model meddygol o driniaeth, ac edrych ar salwch meddwl mewn modd cyfannol. Un o'r beirniadaethau—ac yr oedd yn feirniadaeth garedig—o ddrافت gwreiddiol y Gorchymyn Cymhwysedd Deddfwriaethol arfaethedig ynghylch iechyd meddwl, gan y pwyllgor deddfwriaeth a gadeiriwyd gan David Melding, oedd ei fod yn canolbwyntio'n ormodol ar iechyd. Gan weithio gyda'r Gweinidog, yr wyf wedi ymestyn hynny, fel y byddaf yn egluro'r wythnos nesaf, i ystyried y gwasanaethau a ddarperir gan awdurdodau lleol. Mae yna ystod o bobl a fydd yn effeithio'n gadarnhaol ar fywyd rhywun sydd â salwch meddwl, oherwydd y gwasanaethau y gellir eu darparu i'r unigolyn hwnnw. Yn y pen draw, fodd bynnag, yn ychwanegol at ddiwygio gwasanaethau a gweithredu argymhellion y pwyllgor, mae angen inni fynd i'r afael â gwarth. Mae ymdeimlad cryf o warth ynghlwm wrth salwch meddwl o hyd, ac y mae angen inni wneud mwy i egluro nad yw salwch meddwl yn parchu ffiniau. Nid oes gwahaniaeth pa mor gyfoethog neu heini yr ydych, pa mor glyfar neu dal neu fyr, pa mor olau neu dywyll—nid oes dim gwahaniaeth o gwbl. Gall unrhyw un gael salwch meddwl, a chredir bod un o bob pedwar ohonom yn cael salwch o'r fath—cred rhai fod y ffigur yn nes at un o bob tri. Er fy mod yn derbyn pwynt David Melding ei bod yn anodd gwahaniaethu rhwng salwch corfforol a salwch meddwl, pe baem yn sôn am un o bob pedwar o'r boblogaeth yn cael salwch corfforol na châi triniaeth ei darparu'n briodol neu'n drefnus ar ei gyfer, byddai banllefau o brotest ar draws y wlad. Credaf yn gryf, trwy'r gwaith a eglurwyd yn yr adroddiad hwn gan bwyllgor, a'r gwaith y mae'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a minnau wedi bod yn ei wneud ar y Gorchymyn arfaethedig, y gall Cymru arwain y ffordd yn y dyfodol o ran diwygio gwasanaethau

iechyd meddwl. Credaf y gallem ddangos i weddill y DU sut mae angen diwygio'r gwasanaethau hyn, a sut y dylid eu darparu i gleifion.

4.20 p.m.

We need to ensure that people, in accessing GP services, can access a service that can identify early enough that there is a problem. I have encountered too many items of constituency casework where people have accessed their GP service but that the GP was unable to pick up on the problem early enough and their condition worsened. We also need to see access to good-quality local and community-based services—not just access to a community mental health team. That may also include out-of-hours services, many of which currently only operate between 9 a.m. and 5 p.m., Monday to Friday, and that is not good enough. We also need to see an expansion of community-based cognitive behavioural therapy, because there are many issues and problems that can be dealt with by a range of therapy services, not just those within the medical model referred to in this report.

This report is an excellent contribution. I believe strongly, Minister, that if we implement the report's recommendations, together with the way in which we can hopefully use legislation in the future, we will see a great degree of positive reform. That will mean a great deal to the people in Wales who are living with a mental illness today.

Mark Isherwood: I also commend the committee on its report. Recommendation 26 notes that the Welsh Assembly Government must ensure that

'the voluntary sector is able to participate fully in the planning and provision of community mental health services'.

Recommendation 14 notes that the Welsh Assembly Government, in redistributing the supporting people revenue grant,

Mae angen inni sicrhau bod pobl, wrth gallu cael gwasanaethau meddygon teulu, yn gallu cael gwasanaeth a all weld yn ddigon cynnar fod problem. Yr wyf wedi dod ar draws gormod o enghreifftiau mewn gwaith achos yn fy etholaeth lle mae pobl wedi cael gwasanaeth meddyg teulu ond bod y meddyg teulu wedi methu ag adnabod eu problem yn ddigon cynnar a'u hanhwylder wedi gwaethygu. Mae angen hefyd inni weld pobl yn gallu cael gwasanaethau lleol a chymunedol o safon—nid cael sylw gan dîm iechyd meddwl cymunedol yn unig. Gallai gwasanaethau o'r fath gynnwys gwasanaethau y tu allan i oriau arferol hefyd, nad yw llawer ohonynt ar waith ond rhwng 9 a.m. a 5 p.m. o ddydd Llun i ddydd Gwener ar hyn o bryd, ac nid yw hynny'n ddigon da. Mae angen hefyd inni weld ehangu therapi ymddygiadol gwybyddol yn y gymuned, oherwydd mae o faterion a phroblemau y gellir ymdrin â hwy ag ystod o wasanaethau therapi, ac nid yn unig â gwasanaethau'r model meddygol y cyfeirir ato yn yr adroddiad hwn.

Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn gyfraniad ardderchog. Credaf yn gryf, Weinidog, y byddwn, o weithredu argymhellion yr adroddiad, ac o ystyried y ffordd y gallwn ddefnyddio deddfwriaeth yn y dyfodol, gobeithio, yn gweld llawer iawn o waith diwygio cadarnhaol. Bydd hynny'n golygu llawer iawn i bobl Cymru sy'n byw gyda salwch meddwl heddiw.

Mark Isherwood: Yr wyf fi hefyd yn canmol y pwyllgor am ei adroddiad. Mae argymhelliad 26 yn nodi ei bod yn rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad sicrhau bod

'y sector gwirfoddol yn gallu chwarae rhan lawn wrth helpu i gynllunio a darparu gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl cymunedol'.

Mae argymhelliad 14 yn nodi y dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, wrth aiddosbarthu'r grant refeniw cefnogi pobl,

‘ensures that existing projects supporting people with mental health problems are able to sustain their services’.

‘sichrau bod prosiectau presennol sy’n cefnogi pobl â phroblemau iechyd meddwl yn gallu cynnal eu gwasanaethau’.

I had a meeting with Hafal’s Wrexham outreach tenancy support service in September. As we know, Hafal is the charity run by people with severe mental illness and their carers. Its representatives referred to its report, ‘My Own Home: A Client Perspective on Supported Accommodation for People with Severe Mental Illness’. That report said that

Cefais gyfarfod gyda gwasanaeth allgymorth tenantiaeth Wrecsam ym mis Medi, sy’n cael ei redeg gan Hafal. Fel y gwyddom, Hafal yw’r elusen sy’n cael ei rhedeg gan bobl sydd â salwch meddwl difrifol, a’u gofalywyr. Cyfeiriodd ei chynrychiolwyr at adroddiad yr elusen, ‘Fy nghartref fy hun: safbwynt cleient ar dai gyda chymorth ar gyfer pobl ag afiechyd meddwl difrifol’. Yn ôl yr adroddiad hwnnw,

‘good quality, well managed housing is an important element of successful community care for people with mental health problems’.

‘mae tai o ansawdd da, ac wedi’u rheoli’n dda, yn elfen hanfodol o ofal cymunedol llwyddiannus ar gyfer pobl gyda phroblemau iechyd meddwl’.

However, the report goes on to state that

Fodd bynnag, yn nes ymlaen, dywed yr adroddiad:

‘this lack of supported housing across Wales inevitably leads to pressures and inappropriate use of other mental health services, particularly hospitals’.

‘mae’r diffyg hwn o dai â chymorth ar draws Cymru yn arwain yn anochel at bwysau a defnydd amhriodol o wasanaethau iechyd meddwl eraill, yn enwedig ysbytai’.

Hafal told me that, based on the ‘My Own Home’ research, which is now four years old, it was keen to influence funders in developing a coherent housing strategy for people with mental illness. Hafal also expressed concern that, in the current budgetary environment, across the board cuts could hit voluntary sector and smaller organisations disproportionately, and it used the term ‘cinderella service’ for mental health providers and called for sustainable funding so that it can continue to develop the work that it is so invaluablely delivering.

Dywedodd Hafal wrthyf, ar sail ymchwil ‘Fy nghartref fy hun’ sydd erbyn hyn yn bedair oed, fod yr elusen yn awyddus i ddylanwadu ar gyllidwyr wrth ddatblygu strategaeth dai gydynol ar gyfer pobl sydd â salwch meddwl. Yn ogystal, mynegodd Hafal bryder y gallai toriadau cyffredinol, yn yr amgylchedd cyllidebol sydd ohoni, effeithio’n anghymesur ar fudiadau’r sector gwirfoddol a mudiadau llai o faint, a defnyddiodd y term ‘gwasanaeth israddol’ wrth sôn am ddarparwyr iechyd meddwl, a galwodd am gyllid cynaliadwy er mwyn i’r elusen allu parhau i ddatblygu’r gwaith y mae’n ei wneud mewn modd mor amhrisiadwy.

Recommendation 16 makes reference to the provision for young people aged 17 to 25 and the transition process. We heard reference from Peter Black to the all-Wales NGO children’s policy group’s briefing paper on child and adolescent mental health. I will not repeat what Peter said, but note its statement that the Welsh Assembly Government must

Mae argymhelliad 16 yn cyfeirio at y ddarpariaeth ar gyfer pobl ifanc rhwng 17 a 25 oed a’r broses bontio. Clywsom Peter Black yn cyfeirio at bapur gwybodaeth grŵp polisi plant cyrff anllywodraethol Cymru gyfan ar iechyd meddwl plant a’r glasod. Nid wyf am ailadrodd yr hyn a ddywedodd Peter, ond hoffwn nodi ei ddatganiad, sef bod yn rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad

‘ensure the provision of CAMHS to all young people up to, and including, those aged 18 and comprehensive, effective support for those making the transition from CAMHS into adult mental health services’.

Recommendation 23 refers to

‘action to improve the co-ordinated provision of community mental health and social care services’.

This relates partly to the Welsh Conservative debate a few weeks ago on direct payments, calling on the Welsh Assembly Government to develop a made-for-Wales solution so that personalised services become the norm, rather than the exception. Shortly after that, I chaired a conference for the Multiple Sclerosis Society Cymru in north Wales, where I was told that service users do not want choice, they want control. We heard from the Cheshire centre for independent living that the county of Cheshire alone has the same number of people receiving direct payments as in the whole of Wales. The Joseph Rowntree Foundation stated that

‘take-up by people experiencing mental health problems has been slow’.

Following the debate that I referred to, Disability Wales e-mailed me, as a member of the steering group of the Wales Alliance for Citizen Directed Support, saying:

‘We read the transcript of the National Assembly debate on Direct Payments here at Disability Wales and were disappointed with the outcome...We have encouraged local authorities to take a more strategic approach to developing direct payments, in order to increase uptake among all service-user groups. It is our view that it is local authority ambivalence, not service user choice that has limited the take-up of Direct Payments in Wales.’

sicrhau bod gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl i blant a'r glasoed yn cael eu darparu i bob person ifanc, gan gynnwys rhai 18 oed, a bod cymorth cynhwysfawr ac effeithiol yn cael ei ddarparu i'r sawl sy'n pontio o wasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasoed i wasanaethau iechyd meddwl oedolion.

Mae argymhelliad 23 yn cyfeirio at gymryd

‘camau i wella'r ffordd gydgyssylltiedig y caiff gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl cymunedol [a] gwasanaethau gofal [cymdeithasol] ... eu darparu’.

Mae hynny'n gysylltiedig yn rhannol â dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig rai wythnosau'n ôl ar daliadau uniongyrchol. Yr oedd yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i ddatblygu ateb wedi'i deilwra'n arbennig ar gyfer Cymru lle mae gwasanaethau wedi'u personoleiddio yn drefn arferol yn hytrach nag eithriad. Yn fuan wedi hynny, bûm yn cadeirio cynhadledd i Multiple Sclerosis Society Cymru yn y gogledd, lle cefais wybod nad dewis y mae defnyddwyr gwasanaeth am ei gael, ond rheolaeth. Clywsom gan ganolfan swydd Gaer ar gyfer byw'n annibynnol fod yr un nifer o bobl yn cael taliadau uniongyrchol yn swydd Gaer yn unig ag sy'n eu cael yng Nghymru gyfan. Dywedodd Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree fod

nifer y bobl sy'n cael problemau iechyd meddwl ac sy'n manteisio ar daliadau uniongyrchol wedi bod yn isel.

Yn dilyn y ddadl y cyfeiriais ati, cefais e-bost gan Anabledd Cymru, fel aelod o grŵp llywio Cynghrair Cymru ar gyfer Cymorth a Gyfarwyddir gan Ddinasyddion, a oedd yn dweud:

Yma yn Anabledd Cymru darllenwyd y trawsgrifiad o ddadl y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar Daliadau Uniongyrchol, ac yr oeddem yn siomedig â'r canlyniad...Yr ydym wedi annog awdurdodau lleol i fabwysiadu agwedd fwy strategol at ddatblygu taliadau uniongyrchol, er mwyn cynyddu nifer y bobl sy'n manteisio arnynt ymhlith pob grŵp defnyddwyr gwasanaethau. Yn ein barn ni, amhendantwydd awdurdodau lleol, nid dewis defnyddwyr gwasanaethau,

sydd wedi cyfyngu nifer y bobl sy'n manteisio ar daliadau uniongyrchol yng Nghymru.

Referring to the same recommendation, I also note the statement from the Minister on 19 November regarding secure mental health services, and the

Gan gyfeirio at yr un argymhelliad, hoffwn nodi hefyd ddatganiad y Gweinidog ar 19 Tachwedd ar wasanaethau iechyd meddwl diogel, a

'development of dedicated low secure and step down services within the NHS, local authorities and voluntary sector to reduce the current reliance on the independent for-profit sector'.

datblygu gwasanaethau penodedig llai dwys, diogelwch isel yn y GIG, mewn awdurdodau lleol ac yn y sector gwirfoddol i leihau'r ddibyniaeth bresennol ar y sector annibynnol er-elw.

As we have previously emphasised, the priority must surely be securing the best outcomes on a sector-neutral basis, and I refer to the visits that I have made to a Denbighshire-based independent provider to see its excellent step-down services. I met broadly happy service users—happy with the services with which they are provided; these are people who want to develop their role on repatriation programmes. I also met providers who expressed their wish to move from large-scale to community provision.

Fel yr ydym wedi pwysleisio o'r blaen, rhaid bod y pwyslais ar sicrhau'r canlyniadau gorau heb ystyried sectorau, a chyfeirir at fy ymweliadau â darparwr annibynnol yn Sir Ddinbych i weld ei wasanaethau llai dwys, sy'n ardderchog. Cyfarfûm â defnyddwyr gwasanaethau a oedd yn fodlon yn gyffredinol—yn fodlon â'r gwasanaethau a gaiff eu darparu iddynt; mae'r rhain yn bobl sydd am ddatblygu eu rôl ar raglenni dychwelyd. Cyfarfûm hefyd â darparwyr a fynegodd eu dymuniad i symud oddi wrth ddarpariaeth fawr ei maint i ddarpariaeth gymunedol.

Finally, I refer to recommendation 13 regarding the research on people with complex mental health needs commissioned by the Welsh Government, and the particular need to focus on people with complex military post-traumatic stress disorders, given the gaps identified by Pathways in north Wales.

Yn olaf, cyfeirir at argymhelliad 13 yn ymwneud ag ymchwil a gomisiynwyd gan Lywodraeth Cymru ar bobl ag anghenion cymhleth o ran iechyd meddwl, a'r angen penodol i ganolbwyntio ar bobl o'r lluoedd arfog sydd ag anhwylderau straen wedi trawma cymhleth, o gofio'r bylchau a nodwyd gan Pathways yn y gogledd.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Edwina Hart): I welcome the committee's report on community mental health services, and I agree with its overall conclusion that, although there have been improvements to mental health services over the last few years, there is still some way to go before services achieve consistently acceptable standards across Wales. We have heard much during the discussion about Jonathan Morgan's proposed LCO. I look forward with eager anticipation to the debate on this next week, but I will believe it when I see it in terms of this making it to the floor of the Chamber. We can then move on to put the appropriate regulations in place, and have the

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Edwina Hart): Yr wyf yn croesawu adroddiad y pwyllgor ar wasanaethau iechyd meddwl cymunedol, a chytunaf â'i gasgliad cyffredinol, sef bod tipyn o ffordd i fynd cyn y bydd gwasanaethau'n cyrraedd safonau derbyniol sy'n gyson ledled Cymru, er bod gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl wedi gwella mewn rhai ffyrdd dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Yn ystod y drafodaeth, yr ydym wedi clywed llawer am Orchymyn Cymhwysedd Deddfwriaethol arfaethedig Jonathan Morgan. Edrychaf ymlaen yn eiddgar at y ddadl ar y Gorchymyn arfaethedig yr wythnos nesaf, ond o ran ei

necessary discussions to make it a reality. Some of the issues about how we deal with advocacy services, and how we enhance them, are key. How we then take that legislation through will be an important development. We will do so in consultation with all of our partners, particularly the mental health charities, who have been part and parcel of the discussions on this proposed LCO, which has cross-party support. I very much look forward to that discussion next week.

The committee's report makes 28 wide-ranging recommendations, all of which I have accepted. I provided a written response to each of the recommendations in October. I have been determined to ensure that mental health remains a very high priority in the reformed NHS, and I have, as you know, made it a specific responsibility, at board level, of the new local health boards. However, I was very much taken by David Melding's point that my duty is to ensure that there is a mental health champion in place at local health boards. He is right, and I will have to look at what progress is made with the development of the role of the vice-chair, and the related responsibilities on mental health services. This is something that will have to be reviewed if we do not see satisfactory progress in the next few years. I made it clear that, if I do not see the progress that we all require in the delivery of services in the NHS, we will return to a discussion about a mental health trust for Wales. That would show that the service has not been able to deliver properly across the piece.

For me, the issue is the equity of the service, and the accessibility of the service, across Wales. Service users should receive a quality service across Wales, and not a service that is good in parts. I expect the new vice-chairs, and the directors of primary community mental health services, to ensure that mental

weld yn cyrraedd llawr y Siambr, bydd angen imi weld hynny cyn y gallaf ei gredu. Yna, gallwn symud ymlaen i lunio'r rheoliadau priodol, a chael y trafodaethau angenrheidiol i droi'r Gorchymyn yn realiti. Mae rhai o'r materion ynghylch sut yr ydym yn ymdrin â gwasanaethau eiriolaeth, a sut yr ydym yn eu gwella, yn allweddol. Bydd y modd y byddwn yn arwain y ddeddfwriaeth drwy'r broses briodol wedyn yn ddatblygiad pwysig. Byddwn yn gwneud hynny drwy ymgynghori â phob un o'n partneriaid, yn enwedig yr elusennau iechyd meddwl. Maent wedi bod yn rhan annatod o'r trafodaethau ar y Gorchymyn Cymhwysedd Deddfwriaethol arfaethedig hwn, sydd wedi cael cefnogaeth drawsbleidiol. Yr wyf yn edrych ymlaen yn fawr at y drafodaeth yr wythnos nesaf.

Mae adroddiad y pwyllgor yn gwneud 28 o argymhellion eang, ac yr wyf wedi derbyn pob un. Darperais ymateb ysgrifenedig i bob un o'r argymhellion ym mis Hydref. Yr wyf wedi bod yn benderfynol o sicrhau bod iechyd meddwl yn parhau i gael blaenoriaeth uchel iawn yn y GIG wedi'i ddiwygio, ac yr wyf, fel y gwyddoch, wedi sicrhau ei fod yn un o gyfrifoldebau penodol y byrddau iechyd lleol newydd, ar lefel bwrdd. Fodd bynnag, gwnaeth pwynt David Melding argraff fawr arnaf, sef ei bod yn ddyletswydd arnaf i sicrhau bod gan fyrdau iechyd lleol hyrwyddwr iechyd meddwl. Mae yn llygad ei le, a bydd yn rhaid imi weld pa gynnydd a fydd wrth ddatblygu rôl yr is-gadeirydd, a'r cyfrifoldebau cysylltiedig ynghylch gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth y bydd yn rhaid ei adolygu os na welwn gynnydd boddhaol yn ystod yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf. Os na welaf y cynnydd sy'n ofynnol gan bob un ohonom o ran darparu gwasanaethau yn y GIG, eglurais y byddwn yn dod yn ôl i drafod ymddiriedolaeth iechyd meddwl i Gymru. Byddai hynny'n dangos nad yw'r gwasanaeth wedi medru sicrhau'r canlyniadau priodol yn gyffredinol.

Fy mhrif bryder i yw tegwch y gwasanaeth, a hygyrchedd y gwasanaeth, ar draws Cymru. Dylai defnyddwyr gwasanaethau gael gwasanaeth o safon ar draws Cymru, ac nid gwasanaeth sy'n dda mewn rhannau o'r wlad yn unig. Disgwyliaf i'r is-gadeiryddion newydd, a chyfarwyddwyr gwasanaethau

health stays at the top of the agenda. I can assure you that how money is spent is a key issue in my regular meetings with these various groups. It will be very interesting to see how they have spent their money, but there has been no diversion of mental health service resources into something that might be mental-health related rather than mental health services proper. Ensuring that we do not see a diminishment in the cash available, or the service provided, is a duty that I have as Minister for Health and Social Services.

I am also very glad that the committee has acknowledged that we have protected expenditure through ring fencing. I can understand that debate, because it is not just about ring fencing the money, or about the additional funding going in—as you know, I have announced additional funding for specialist eating disorder services—but it is the way that that funding develops the service, and the way in which it links the user into the service.

4.30 p.m.

My concern is that we can put certain services in place, but the user may not be know how to access the service. I am also concerned about the quality of the service being consistent throughout. It is important to recognise, in terms of eating disorders, what a limited service there has been in Wales. I do not think that any GP in this room would disagree that there have been problems in primary healthcare, and almost a fear of dealing with some of the issues around eating disorders, and we need to keep that in mind.

As David Melding indicated, some GP practices are not just small, one or two-handed units. Some of them are quite substantial units, so there must be a way that we can have specialisms in mental health and other issues within those groupings of GPs. Therefore, if a GP is not certain that he or she

iechyd meddwl cymunedol a sylfaenol, sicrhau bod iechyd meddwl yn aros ar frig yr agenda. Gallaf eich sicrhau bod y modd y caiff arian ei wario yn fater allweddol yn fy nghyfarfodydd rheolaidd â'r grwpiau amrywiol hyn. Bydd yn ddi-ddorol iawn gweld sut maent wedi gwario'u harian, ond nid oes dim adnoddau gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl wedi'u dargyfeirio i bethau a allai fod yn gysylltiedig ag iechyd meddwl, yn hytrach na'u bod yn wasanaethau iechyd meddwl go iawn. Mae sicrhau na fyddwn yn gweld yr arian sydd ar gael, neu'r gwasanaeth a ddarperir, yn lleihau, yn ddyletswydd arnaf fel Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol.

Yr wyf hefyd yn falch iawn fod y pwyllgor wedi cydnabod ein bod wedi diogelu gwariant drwy neilltuo arian. Gallaf ddeall y ddadl honno, oherwydd nid mater o neilltuo'r arian yn unig ydyw, na mater o ddarparu cyllid ychwanegol—fel y gwyddoch, yr wyf wedi cyhoeddi bod cyllid ychwanegol ar gael ar gyfer gwasanaethau arbenigol anhwylderau bwyta. Yn hytrach, mae'n ymwneud â'r ffordd y mae'r cyllid hwnnw'n datblygu'r gwasanaeth, a'r ffordd y mae'n cysylltu'r defnyddiwr â'r gwasanaeth.

Fy mhryder yw y gallwn gyflwyno rhai gwasanaethau, ond efallai na fydd y defnyddiwr yn gwybod sut i allu cael y gwasanaethau hynny. Yr wyf hefyd yn pryderu ynghylch sicrhau bod safon y gwasanaeth yn gyson ym mhobman. Mae'n bwysig cydnabod, gydag anhwylderau bwyta, mor gyfyngedig yw'r gwasanaeth sydd wedi bod yng Nghymru. Ni chredaf y byddai'r un meddyg teulu yn yr ystafell hon yn anghytuno bod problemau wedi bod yn y sector gofal iechyd sylfaenol, ac ofn bron i ymdrin â rhai o'r materion sy'n ymwneud ag anhwylderau bwyta, ac y mae angen inni gadw hynny mewn cof.

Fel y dywedodd David Melding, nid unedau bach ag un neu ddau bâr o ddwylo yw rhai practisau meddygon teulu. Mae rhai ohonynt yn unedau eithaf sylweddol, a rhaid felly bod ffordd inni allu sicrhau gwasanaethau arbenigol ym maes iechyd meddwl a materion eraill yn y grwpiau hynny o

wants to deal with a particular case, it could be referred elsewhere. I have also ensured that expenditure on core mental health services and on eating disorder services has been ring-fenced.

It is good to have an opportunity to debate mental health issues and to highlight some of the initiatives and positive measures that we have taken in Wales. I agree with the committee's finding that mental illness requires a holistic approach. It cannot be a completely medical model. It has to be a holistic approach that treats people as individuals and considers their needs as a whole, rather than defining them within a narrow medical model. This narrow definition has been a problem over the years. There has not been an understanding of where mental illness exists, who has had it, what triggers it and how we need to deal with it. Our current mental health national service framework stresses that a holistic approach and an integrated approach to the support, care and treatment of people who use the service should be implemented across Wales. The issue is the standard implementation of this NSF. The LHBs have to deal with this NSF positively, and provide quality assurance on how they deal with it. We have to ensure that, through the care programme approach to care planning, a recovery model is adopted that focuses on people's strengths and coping skills. The issue is how you manage to live with illnesses such as depression, how you cope, and what your trigger points are. The only way in which we can improve the quality of life of people who experience mental health problems is through the delivery of effective, efficient and equitable services. That is why recommendation 1 in your report is so key to the proposals that the committee discussed.

I also agree with the committee that we need to adopt a holistic approach to meeting people's needs, with health and social services working more closely together. Closer working on the delivery of services

feddygon teulu. Felly, pe bai meddyg teulu'n ansicr a yw am ymdrin ag achos penodol ai peidio, gellid cyfeirio'r achos at rywun arall. Yr wyf hefyd wedi sicrhau bod gwariant ar wasanaethau iechyd meddwl craidd a gwasanaethau anhwylderau bwytia wedi cael ei neilltuo.

Mae'n dda cael cyfle i gael dadl am faterion iechyd meddwl, a thynnu sylw at rai o'r mentrau a'r mesurau cadarnhaol sydd ar waith gennym yng Nghymru. Cytunaf â darganfyddiad y pwyllgor, sef bod angen dull gweithredu cyfannol ar gyfer salwch meddwl. Ni all fod yn fodel hollol feddygol. Rhaid i'r dull gweithredu fod yn un cyfannol sy'n trin pobl fel unigolion ac yn ystyried eu hanghenion yn eu cyfarwydd, yn hytrach na'u diffinio mewn model meddygol cul. Mae'r diffiniad cul hwn wedi bod yn broblem dros y blynyddoedd. Ni fu dealltwriaeth ynghylch ble mae salwch meddwl yn bodoli, pwy sydd wedi'i gael, beth sy'n ei achosi, a sut mae angen inni fynd i'r afael ag ef. Mae ein fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol presennol ar gyfer iechyd meddwl yn pwysleisio y dylid gweithredu dull cyfannol a dull integredig i gynorthwyo pobl sy'n defnyddio'r gwasanaeth, gofalu am y bobl hynny a'u trin, ar draws Cymru. Y broblem yw'r dull safonol o weithredu'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol hwn. Rhaid i'r byrddau iechyd lleol ymdrin yn gadarnhaol â'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol hwn, a sicrhau ansawdd y modd y maent yn ymdrin ag ef. Rhaid inni sicrhau, drwy'r dull rhaglen ofal o gynllunio gofal, bod model gwella'n cael ei fabwysiadu sy'n canolbwyntio ar gryfderau pobl a'u sgiliau ymdopi. Y broblem yw sut yr ydych yn llwyddo i fyw gydag afiechydon megis iselder ysbryd, sut yr ydych yn ymdopi, a beth sy'n achosi eich iselder ysbryd. Yr unig ffordd y gallwn wella ansawdd bywyd pobl sy'n cael problemau iechyd meddwl yw drwy ddarparu gwasanaethau effeithiol, effeithlon a theg. Dyna pam mae argymhelliad 1 yn eich adroddiad mor allweddol i'r cynigion a drafododd y pwyllgor.

Cytunaf hefyd â'r pwyllgor fod angen inni fabwysiadu dull cyfannol o ddiwallu anghenion pobl, lle mae gwasanaethau iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yn cydweithio'n nes â'i gilydd. Bydd cydweithio'n nes i ddarparu

will be an issue in the future. That is why the Assembly Government has given the responsibility for managing and administering the local mental health grants to the new local health boards from next year. I expect to see a far better, more integrated service being delivered, but we will have to monitor that. I have made that decision now, but it will have to be carefully monitored to see how it will work on the ground in terms of delivery of the grants to those that require them. As an Assembly Government we have worked closely with the mental health third sector in developing policies and strategies. I have told the vice-chairs of the health boards that I expect them to do the same. They have to engage with the service users and their families, and they have to be involved in the planning and provision of community services. Each local health board should have this type of representation from the third sector to discuss these issues. This issue came up in one of my discussions with the voluntary sector this morning.

We must also continue to raise our understanding of mental health issues and ensure that mental illness is not hidden away. It has to be openly discussed and people need to understand that it is an illness like any other; it is just like having a virus or pneumonia. A major initiative in this regard is Mental Health First Aid (Wales). This training course, which teaches people about mental health problems and provides them with skills to help people who are in crisis, is important. In 2010 we will be rolling out training for instructors who work with children and young people, which is a key area on which there has not been sufficient work done in the past. I was taken with David Melding's point about very young children, and the work that needs to be done with children under the age of five. That is important. The mental health first aid programme will not be suitable there, but we have to ensure that we get the right interventions for that group.

gwasanaethau'n broblem yn y dyfodol. Dyna pam mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi rhoi'r cyfrifoldeb am reoli a gweinyddu'r grantiau iechyd meddwl lleol i'r byrddau iechyd lleol newydd o'r flwyddyn nesaf ymlaen. Disgwyliaf weld gwasanaeth tipyn gwell, mwy integredig yn cael ei ddarparu, ond bydd yn rhaid inni fonitro hynny. Yr wyf wedi gwneud y penderfyniad hwnnw'n awr, ond bydd yn rhaid ei fonitro'n ofalus i weld sut bydd yn gweithio ar lawr gwlad o ran darparu'r grantiau i'r sawl y mae arnynt eu hangen. Fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yr ydym wedi cydweithio'n agos â'r trydydd sector ym maes iechyd meddwl i ddatblygu polisïau a strategaethau. Yr wyf wedi dweud wrth is-gadeiryddion y byrddau iechyd fy mod yn disgwyl iddynt wneud yr un fath. Rhaid iddynt ymgysylltu â'r defnyddwyr gwasanaeth a'u teuluoedd, a rhaid i'r bobl hynny gael eu cynnwys wrth i wasanaethau cymunedol gael eu cynllunio a'u darparu. Dylai fod gan bob bwrdd iechyd lleol y math hwn o gynrychiolaeth o'r trydydd sector i drafod y materion hyn. Cododd y mater hwn ei ben yn un o'm trafodaethau â'r sector gwirfoddol y bore yma.

Rhaid hefyd inni barhau i wella ein dealltwriaeth o faterion sy'n ymwneud ag iechyd meddwl, a sicrhau na chaiff salwch meddwl ei guddio. Rhaid iddo gael ei drafod yn agored, ac y mae angen i bobl ddeall ei fod yn salwch tebyg i unrhyw salwch arall; nid yw'n wahanol i gael feirws neu niwmonia. Mae Cymorth Cyntaf Iechyd Meddwl (Cymru) yn fenter bwysig yn y cyswllt hwn. Mae'r cwrs hyfforddi hwnnw, sy'n addysgu pobl am broblemau iechyd meddwl ac yn rhoi'r sgiliau iddynt helpu pobl sydd mewn trafferth enbyd, yn bwysig. Yn 2010, byddwn yn datblygu hyfforddiant ar gyfer hyfforddwyr sy'n gweithio gyda phlant a phobl ifanc, sy'n faes allweddol nad oes digon o waith wedi'i wneud arno yn y gorffennol. Yr oedd y pwynt a wnaeth David Melding am blant ifanc a'r gwaith y mae angen ei wneud gyda phlant dan bump oed wedi gwneud argraff fawr arnaf. Mae hynny'n bwysig. Ni fydd y rhaglen cymorth cyntaf iechyd meddwl yn addas yn y maes hwnnw, ond rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn cael yr ymyriadau cywir ar gyfer y grŵp hwnnw.

As a Government we are working to support GPs. We are funding the Wales mental health in primary care network to raise the profile of mental health issues and to enhance GP skills. That is important in our fight against stigma and discrimination. This is a difficult area. If there is a story in the news about a difficult or tragic event that involves someone with mental health issues, people's reactions to mental illness can be difficult to deal with. If a tragedy occurs, you realise that that is what can happen. I am sure that the committee's report will be widely distributed among and used by the local health boards. I expect them to take these recommendations on board and to deal with them proactively. I am grateful to the committee for producing this report, which will help us a great deal in developing the policy agenda.

Darren Millar: I thank everyone for their well informed contributions this afternoon. This has been an excellent debate in taking forward improvements in mental health services in Wales. I am delighted that the Minister has responded so positively to what was quite a challenging report in many respects. The Minister has been honest about where we are in Wales, and, when we recognise where we are, we can then begin to build on things and make improvements.

I will refer to a few of the comments and contributions made during the debate. I was struck by Val Lloyd's statement that we need to adopt a recovery model. The whole context of the report drew on the need for the recovery model to be the basis on which people in Wales are treated when a mental illness is identified. That is not about looking towards a generic recovery model for everyone, but about providing something individually tailored to assist people to make the very best progress that they possibly can and, if possible, to make a full recovery.

Andrew R.T. Davies was the first speaker of many to mention issues related to the transition between child and adolescent

Fel Llywodraeth, yr ydym yn gweithio i gynorthwyo meddygon teulu. Yr ydym yn cyllido rhwydwaith iechyd meddwl mewn gofal sylfaenol Cymru i godi proffil materion sy'n ymwneud ag iechyd meddwl a gwella sgiliau meddygon teulu. Mae hynny'n bwysig yn ein brwydr yn erbyn yr ymdeimlad o warth ac achosion o wahaniaethu. Mae'n faes anodd. Os oes stori yn y newyddion am ddigwyddiad trasig neu anodd sy'n cynnwys rhywun â phroblemau iechyd meddwl, gall fod yn anodd ymdrin â'r modd y mae pobl yn adweithio i salwch meddwl. Os oes trasiedi'n digwydd, yr ydych yn sylweddoli mai dyna a all ddigwydd. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd adroddiad y pwyllgor yn cael ei ddosbarthu'n eang ymysg y byrddau iechyd lleol ac yn cael ei ddefnyddio'n helaeth ganddynt. Disgwyliaf iddynt ystyried yr argymhellion hyn ac ymdrin yn rhagweithiol â hwy. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r pwyllgor am lunio'r adroddiad hwn, a fydd o gymorth mawr inni wrth ddatblygu'r agenda polisi.

Darren Millar: Diolch i bawb am eu cyfraniadau deallus y prynhawn yma. Mae wedi bod yn ddadl ardderchog i symud gwelliannau mewn gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl yn eu blaen yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn hapus iawn fod y Gweinidog wedi ymateb mor gadarnhaol i adroddiad a oedd yn heriol iawn mewn llawer ffordd. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi bod yn onest am y sefyllfa yng Nghymru, ac o gydnabod ein sefyllfa bresennol gallwn fynd ati wedyn i ddechrau adeiladu ar bethau a gwella.

Hoffwn gyfeirio at rai o'r sylwadau a'r cyfraniadau a wnaed yn ystod y ddadl. Gwnaeth datganiad Val Lloyd argraff arnaf, sef bod angen inni fabwysiadu model gwella. Seiliwyd holl gyd-destun yr adroddiad ar yr angen i'r model gwella fod yn sylfaen ar gyfer trin pobl yng Nghymru pan welir bod ganddynt salwch meddwl. Nid yw'n golygu ceisio cael model gwella cyffredinol ar gyfer pawb; mae'n golygu yn hytrach ddarparu rhywbeth sydd wedi'i deilwra'n unigol i gynorthwyo pobl i wneud y cynnydd gorau posibl, a gwella'n llwyr, os yw hynny'n bosibl.

Andrew R.T. Davies oedd y siaradwr cyntaf o nifer a soniodd am faterion pontio rhwng gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r

mental health services and adult services. Helen Mary Jones has also taken a great deal of interest in that in her role as Chair of the Children and Young People Committee. It was a fundamental issue in the report, and one on which we had significant discussion. We recognised that the evidence was overwhelming in terms of the need to develop this sort of service. While we welcome the fact that the Minister has accepted that recommendation, we will look at that closely to ensure that it is fully implemented as soon as possible so that our children and young people, particularly in light of the report published last week, get the quality services that they deserve.

Andrew also touched on the national service framework, as did other speakers, and the need to implement that. I am pleased that the Minister recognises that more work needs to be done on that front. I am hopeful that, following her comments today, she will look to the local health boards to ensure that that national service framework is delivered consistently across their areas.

David Melding's contribution was particularly poignant. He spoke from personal experience of mental illness, which can be every bit as debilitating as a physical illness and often more so. It is important to recognise that and to get the message out there that we need to address this. I also agree with the comments on specialisms and the need to provide those in GP practices, particularly the larger practices. We all have large practices in our constituencies, with a large team. That multidisciplinary approach within those GP teams will be critical in taking this agenda forward. Early intervention, as Jonathan reminded us in his contribution, is critical. If you can intervene early on, when someone is developing a mental health problem, then you can often prevent significant problems from developing further down the line.

Peter Black spoke about the environment in which people can find themselves and the need to approach that on a basis that goes

glasod a gwasanaethau oedolion. Mae Helen Mary Jones wedi dangos llawer iawn o ddiddordeb yn hynny hefyd, yn ei rôl fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc. Yr oedd yn fater sylfaenol yn yr adroddiad, ac yn fater y cawsom drafodaeth sylweddol arno. Yr oeddem yn cydnabod bod y dystiolaeth fod angen datblygu'r math hwn o wasanaeth yn aruthrol. Er ein bod yn croesawu'r ffaith fod y Gweinidog wedi derbyn yr argymhelliad hwnnw, byddwn yn cadw llygad barcud arno, i sicrhau ei fod yn cael ei weithredu'n llawn cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl er mwyn i'n plant a'n pobl ifanc, yn enwedig yng ngoleuni'r adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos diwethaf, gael y gwasanaethau o safon y maent yn eu haeddu.

Soniodd Andrew hefyd am y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol, fel y gwnaeth siaradwyr eraill, a chrybwyllodd fod angen ei weithredu. Yr wyf yn falch fod y Gweinidog yn cydnabod bod angen gwneud mwy o waith i'r perwyl hwnnw. Gobeithio, yn dilyn ei sylwadau heddiw, y bydd yn gofyn i'r byrddau iechyd lleol sicrhau bod y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol hwnnw'n cael ei weithredu'n gyson ar draws eu hardaloedd.

Yr oedd cyfraniad David Melding yn arbennig o deimladwy. Siaradodd o brofiad personol o salwch meddwl, a all fod lawn mor wanychol â salwch corfforol, ac yn fwy gwanychol yn aml. Mae'n bwysig cydnabod hynny a chyfleu'r neges fod angen inni fynd i'r afael â hynny. Cytunaf hefyd â'r sylwadau am wasanaethau arbenigol, a'r angen i ddarparu'r rheini mewn practisau meddygon teulu, yn enwedig practisau mwy o faint. Mae gan bob un ohonom bractisau mawr yn ein hetholaethau sydd â thîm mawr. Bydd y dull aml-ddisgyblaeth hwnnw o weithredu yn y timau hynny o feddygon teulu yn hollbwysig wrth symud yr agenda hon yn ei blaen. Mae ymyrryd yn gynnar, fel y cawsom ein hatgoffa gan Jonathan yn ei gyfraniad ef, yn hollbwysig. Os gallwch ymyrryd yn gynnar, pan fydd problem iechyd meddwl yn dechrau datblygu, gallwch yn aml atal problemau sylweddol rhag datblygu'n ddiweddarach.

Soniodd Peter Black am yr amgylchedd y gall pobl eu cael eu hunain ynddo, a bod angen mynd i'r afael â hynny mewn modd

across local government and health in terms of housing and the need for employment support. All of that contributes towards good mental health and a positive outlook. During the course of the inquiry, we found that how those services worked was disjointed. Mark Isherwood also touched on supported housing and the need to improve that. Our evidence showed that investment in supported housing could be cost-effective and could save cash in the long term. So, it is important that the voluntary and independent sectors, or whoever is out there providing such support, are encouraged to provide it in the future. I am sure that the committee would be interested in seeing the outcome of the Supporting People grant redistribution.

sy'n ymestyn ar draws llywodraeth leol ac iechyd, o ran tai a'r angen am gymorth gyda chyflogaeth. Mae'r cyfan yn cyfrannu at iechyd meddwl da ac agwedd gadarnhaol. Yn ystod yr ymchwiliad, gwelsom nad oedd y gwasanaethau hynny'n gweithio mewn modd cydgysylltiedig. Soniodd Mark Isherwood hefyd am dai gyda chymorth a bod angen gwella hynny. Dangosodd ein tystiolaeth y gallai buddsoddi mewn tai â chymorth fod yn gost-effeithiol, ac y gallai arbed arian yn y tymor hir. Felly, mae'n bwysig bod y sector gwirfoddol a'r sector annibynnol, neu bwy bynnag sydd allan yn y maes yn darparu cymorth o'r fath, yn cael eu hannog i'w ddarparu yn y dyfodol. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai gan y pwyllgor ddi-ddordeb gweld canlyniad gwaith ailddosbarthu'r grantiau Cefnogi Pobl.

5.40 p.m.

The other point made by Peter Black, about the criminal justice system, is also an important one. We heard in evidence about the impact of devolution in that regard. There is joined-up working in England on dealing with mental health problems in the criminal justice system, but the situation is not always as helpful here. There needs to be a joint strategy to overcome that between the Home Office and the Minister's department here.

Mae'r pwynt arall a wnaed gan Peter Black, am y system cyfiawnder troseddol, hefyd yn un pwysig. Clywsom mewn tystiolaeth am effaith datganoli yn y cyswllt hwnnw. Mae gwaith cydgysylltiedig yn mynd rhagddo yn Lloegr ar ymdrin â phroblemau iechyd meddwl yn y system cyfiawnder troseddol, ond nid yw'r sefyllfa bob amser yn cynnig cymaint o gymorth yma. Mae angen strategaeth gydgysylltiedig i oresgyn hynny, rhwng y Swyddfa Gartref ac adran y Gweinidog yma.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Can you wind up, please?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: A wnewch chi ddirwyn eich araith i ben, os gwelwch yn dda?

Darren Millar: Of course. To conclude, I thank everyone who has taken part in the debate and the Minister. We look forward to the implementation of our recommendations and I am sure that we will be returning to this in the near future.

Darren Millar: Wrth gwrs. I gloi, hoffwn ddiolch i bawb sydd wedi cymryd rhan yn y ddadl ac i'r Gweinidog. Yr ydym yn edrych ymlaen at y broses o weithredu ein hargymhellion, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwn yn dychwelyd at y mater hwn yn y dyfodol agos.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The proposal is to note the Health, Wellbeing and Local Government Committee's report. Does any Member object? I see that there are no objections. The motion is therefore agreed in accordance with Standing Order No. 7.35.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Y cynnig yw ein bod yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Iechyd, Lles a Llywodraeth Leol. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf nad oes. Yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.35, felly, caiff y cynnig ei dderbyn.

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion agreed.

**Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu ar ei Ymchwiliad i Gyfraniad
Economaidd Addysg Uwch yng Nghymru**
**Debate on the Enterprise and Learning Committee's Report on its Inquiry into
the Economic Contribution of Higher Education in Wales**

Gareth Jones: Cynigiau fod

Gareth Jones: I move that

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

the National Assembly for Wales:

yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu, 'Cyfraniad Economaidd Addysg Uwch yng Nghymru', a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Hydref 2009. (NDM4340)

notes the Enterprise and Learning Committee's report, 'The Economic Contribution of Higher Education in Wales', which was laid in the Table Office on 7 October 2009. (NDM4340)

Yr wyf yn falch iawn o agor y ddadl heddiw ar adroddiad terfynol y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu ar gyfraniad economaidd addysg uwch. Un o brif gasgliadau ein hadroddiad oedd, os yw Cymru o ddifrif am fod yn wlad fach alluog, mae'n rhaid i Lywodraeth Cymru roi mwy o flaenoriaeth i fuddsoddi mewn addysg uwch. Ychydig wythnosau yn ôl yn unig, yn ein hadroddiad ar y gyllideb, mynegodd ein pwyllgor bryder am lefel yr arbedion effeithlonrwydd, sef 5 y cant, y mae gofyn i brifysgolion eu gwneud, gan ddadlau y dylai addysg uwch fod yn faes i fuddsoddi ynddo fel ffordd o alluogi Cymru i dyfu allan o'r dirwasgiad economaidd, ac nid maes ar gyfer torri yn ôl ar wariant.

I am delighted to open today's debate on the final report on the economic contribution of higher education by the Enterprise and Learning Committee. One of the main conclusions of our report was that, if Wales is serious about being a small, clever country, the Welsh Government must give greater priority to investment in higher education. Only the other week, our committee expressed, in its budget report, concern about the level of efficiency savings of 5 per cent that universities are being required to find, and how higher education should be an area for investment as a way of growing Wales out of the economic downturn, not an area from which to withdraw funding.

Ar nodyn mwy cadarnhaol, datgelodd ein hymchwiliad ddigonedd o arferion da yn llawer o sefydliadau addysg uwch Cymru. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer i'w wneud o hyd. Fel y dywedodd un o'n tystion, mae prifysgolion Cymru'n llawn o syniadau da nad ydynt byth yn cael eu gwireddu.

On a more positive note, our inquiry revealed a wealth of good practice in many of Wales's higher education institutions. Yet, there is still much that needs to be done. As one of our witnesses said, Welsh universities are, stuffed with good ideas that are rotting on the vine.

Hoffwn ddiolch i'r Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau ac i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog am eu hymateb ar y cyd i'n hadroddiad. Dyma'r ymateb mwyaf trylwyr a meddylgar i ni ei dderbyn gan y Llywodraeth hyd yn hyn.

I should like to thank the Minister for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills and the Deputy First Minister for their joint response to our report. It is probably the most thorough and thoughtful Government response that we have yet received.

Cyn i mi fynd ymlaen i drafod rhai o'r 32 o argymhellion yn ein hadroddiad, mae'n bosibl eich bod yn cofio i ni gyhoeddi adroddiad dros dro ym mis Ionawr eleni, gyda'r bwriad o'i fwydo i mewn i gyfnod 2 o'r adolygiad addysg uwch gan y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen o dan gadeiryddiaeth yr

Before I go on to discuss some of the 32 recommendations that we make in our report, you may remember that we published an interim report last January, with the intention of feeding it into stage 2 of the higher education review being carried out by the task and finish group chaired by Professor

Athro Merfyn Jones, is-ganghellor Prifysgol Bangor. Ein bwriad ers y cychwyn oedd cyhoeddi adroddiad terfynol ar ôl i grŵp yr Athro Jones gyflwyno ei adroddiad er mwyn defnyddio ei gasgliadau i'n cynorthwyo yn y gwaith o lunio ein casgliadau ac ein hargymhellion ein hunain. Hyderwn fod ein gwaith craffu dros y ddwy flynedd ddiwethaf wedi annog y Llywodraeth a phrifysgolion i fynd ar daith o hunanholi, ac y bydd ein casgliadau ac argymhellion terfynol yn helpu i lywio'r ddadl o ran sut i wneud y defnydd gorau posibl o'r cyfraniad economaidd y gall prifysgolion Cymru ei wneud yn y dyfodol.

Mae chwe phrif neges yn ein hadroddiad. Mae'r cyntaf yn ymwneud â buddsoddi. Dylai'r Llywodraeth ystyried addysg uwch fel arf datblygu economaidd, a darparu adnoddau iddo yn unol â'r perwyl hwnnw. Mae effaith llusoi buddsoddiad cyhoeddus mewn addysg uwch tua 5:1. Hoffem weld y ffigur hwnnw'n cynyddu'n sylweddol. Mae llawer o bethau y gall y prifysgolion eu hunain eu gwneud i fanteisio ar ffynonellau eraill o incwm, fel defnyddio eu cyn-raddedigion, a defnyddio eu pwerau caffael i fuddsoddi mwy yn lleol, a hynny fel cwsmeriaid a chyflogwyr. Cymhelliad arall posibl fyddai lleihau lefel gwaelodol cronfa trydedd cenhadaeth prifysgolion ac, yn lle hynny, cynnig cymhelliad ariannol i is-ganghellorion, sef rhoi arian cyfatebol o £1 am bob £1 y maent yn ei chreu o'u heiddo deallusol.

Mae'r ail neges am ragoriaeth mewn ymchwil. Daethom ar draws enghreifftiau diddorol o sefydliadau'n cydweithio i wella'u gallu i gystadlu am arian ymchwil, a gwella'u proffil rhyngwladol, megis Sefydliad Niwrowyddoniaeth Wybyddol Cymru, er enghraifft, sef cydweithrediad rhwng prifysgolion Caerdydd, Abertawe a Bangor, ynghyd â'r Bartneriaeth Ymchwil a Menter, sydd yn gydweithrediad rhwng prifysgolion Aberystwyth a Bangor. Argymhellwyd gennym y dylai mwy o gydweithio tymor hir o'r fath ddigwydd, fel y gall gweithrediadau llai gyfuno er mwyn cystadlu mewn cynghrair uwch, yn hytrach na chystadlu yn erbyn ei gilydd.

O ran sicrhau gwell cydweithrediad mewn

Merfyn Jones, the vice-chancellor of Bangor University. Our intention from the beginning was to publish a final report after Professor Jones's group presented its report, so that we could use its conclusions to assist the work of producing our conclusions and recommendations. We trust that our scrutiny work over the last two years has encouraged the Government and universities to question themselves, and that our final conclusions and recommendations will help to steer the debate on making the best possible use of the economic contribution that Welsh universities can make in the future.

Our report includes six main messages. The first deals with investment. The Government should view higher education as an economic development tool and allocate resources to it accordingly. The multiplier effect of public investment in higher education is currently about 5:1. We would like to see that figure significantly increased. There is much that universities can do themselves to exploit alternative sources of income such as their alumni; and to use their procurement powers to invest more locally, as both consumers and employers. Another potential incentive would be to reduce the base level of universities' third mission funding but to offer vice-chancellors a financial incentive to match fund every pound £1 that they create out of their intellectual property by another £1.

The second message deals with excellence in research. We came across examples of institutions collaborating to significantly enhance their capacity to compete for research funding and to improve their international profile, such as the Wales Institute of Cognitive Neuroscience, which is a collaboration between Cardiff, Swansea and Bangor universities, and the Research and Enterprise Partnership, which is a collaboration between Aberystwyth and Bangor universities. We recommended that there should be more long-term collaborations such as these so that smaller operations can combine forces to compete in a bigger research league, as opposed to competing among themselves.

As regards achieving better research

ymchwil rhwng addysg uwch a busnesau, argymhellwyd gennym y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru ystyried cynllun talebau arloesi a fyddai'n galluogi cwmnïau i feithrin arbenigedd a chydweithio â phrifysgol sy'n cymryd rhan yn y cynllun. Yn ei hymateb i'n hadroddiad, dywed y Gweinidog fod cynllun o'r fath eisoes yn ei le ac, os felly, efallai fod angen iddo gael ei hyrwyddo'n well.

Yn drydydd, o safbwynt cyfnewid masnacheiddio a gwybodaeth, un o'r materion allweddol a ddaeth yn amlwg yn ein hymchwiliad oedd y diffyg cynnydd o ran gweithredu'r 10 argymhelliad a wnaethpwyd gan Simon Gibson, a gafodd ei gomisiynu gan Lywodraeth Cymru yn 2006 i gynnal adolygiad annibynnol o weithgareddau masnacheiddio a ariennir yn gyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Credwn ei bod yn bwysig i academyddion gydweithio â thimau masnachol er mwyn troi ymchwil arloesol yn fusnes o'r radd flaenaf. Felly, hoffem weld mwy o gynnydd o safbwynt argymhelliad Gibson y dylai sefydliadau addysg uwch fuddsoddi mewn partneriaethau gydag arbenigwyr masnachol ac ariannol i fasnacheiddio eu gwybodaeth.

Yn bwysig iawn, yr oeddem am weld mentergarwch wedi ymwreiddio'n ddyfnach yn y cwricwlwm addysg uwch ac yn natblygiad proffesiynol staff ymchwil prifysgolion.

In respect of small and medium-sized enterprises, we felt that there was still some way to go to close what the Federation of Small Businesses referred to as 'the communication gap' between businesses and higher education institutions. The message from witnesses was that there was a need for brokers between the sectors; that is, people who have knowledge of both sectors and who can develop a more lucrative relationship between them.

Our fifth point refers to aspiration and social justice, in which there is an important message. There is no doubt in our minds that universities have an important role to play in widening access to education and in raising the aspirations and skills base of their local communities. We trust that the proposed

collaborations between higher education and businesses, we recommended that the Welsh Government should consider an innovation vouchers scheme that would enable companies to access expertise and work together with a participating university. The Minister's response to our report states that such a scheme is already in place; if that is the case, perhaps it needs to be better promoted.

Thirdly, in terms of commercialisation and knowledge exchange, one of the key issues to emerge from our inquiry was the lack of progress made in implementing the 10 recommendations made by Simon Gibson, who was commissioned by the Welsh Government in 2006 to carry out an independent review of publicly funded commercialisation activities in Wales. We believe that it is important for academics to work with commercial teams in turning innovative research into world-class businesses. Therefore, we would like to see greater progress with Gibson's recommendation for higher education institutions to invest in partnerships with entrepreneurial and financial experts to commercialise their knowledge.

Very importantly, we wanted to see entrepreneurship become more embedded within the higher education curriculum and within the professional development of university research staff.

O ran mentrau bach a chanolig eu maint, teimlem fod rhywfaint o waith i'w wneud eto i gau'r hyn a gafodd ei alw gan y Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach yn 'fwlch cyfathrebu' rhwng busnesau a sefydliadau addysg uwch. Y neges gan dystion oedd bod angen broceriaid rhwng y sectorau; hynny yw, pobl sy'n gyfarwydd â'r ddau sector ac sy'n gallu datblygu perthynas fwy buddiol rhyngddynt.

Mae ein pumed pwynt yn cyfeirio at ddyheadau a chyfiawnder cymdeithasol, ac y mae ynddo neges bwysig. Nid oes amheuaeth yn ein meddyliau nad oes gan brifysgolion rôl bwysig wrth ehangu mynediad i addysg a chodi dyheadau a sylfaen sgiliau eu cymunedau lleol. Yr ydym yn hyderus y bydd

university of the Heads of the Valleys will build links with local employers to make them part of the deal offered to the people that the new university is aiming to attract so that work placements, job opportunities, training and education that meet local employment needs become real from the outset. We also believe that universities should take the initiative, where they have not already done so, to build links with local schools and colleges to help to develop young people's affinity with the opportunities that their institution has to offer.

In concentrating on the economic contribution of higher education, we did not wish to forget the wider contribution that universities make to the social and cultural development of Wales, and importantly, of the individual student. The wealth created by education is not just of monetary value.

Finally, in terms of higher education at the heart of economic policy debate, it is essential for higher education to move more centre stage in the Welsh Government's forward planning. Welsh Government departments must work better together, and in partnership with the higher education sector, so that team Wales is apprised of Government forward planning on issues where the sector needs to be prepared to respond. We thought that a memorandum of understanding, or some other protocol, might be helpful in formalising such a culture of working.

Rhaid i sefydliadau addysg uwch ymestyn ymhellach er mwyn ymgysylltu â chwmnïau o bob maint. Yn eu tro, rhaid i fusnesau bach a chanolig ymwneud mwy â busnesau bach a chanolig eraill ac â chwmnïau mawr er mwyn creu amgylchedd brwd o gydweithredu.

4.50 p.m.

Rhaid i addysg uwch gydweithredu'n well ag addysg bellach, â chynghorau sgiliau sector, a chyda ysgolion yn y pen draw. Rhaid i Lywodraeth Cymru gydweithio'n agos ag Adran Fusnes, Arloesi a Sgiliau newydd y Deyrnas Gyfunol i archwilio i gyfleoedd ar

prifysgol arfaethedig Blaenau'r Cymoedd yn creu cysylltiadau â chyflogwyr lleol, er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn rhan o'r pecyn a gaiff ei gynnig i'r bobl hynny y bwriada'r brifysgol newydd eu denu, er mwyn i brofiad gwaith, cyfleoedd am swyddi, hyfforddiant ac addysg sy'n diwallu anghenion lleol o ran cyflogaeth gael eu gwireddu o'r dechrau. Credwn hefyd y dylai prifysgolion gymryd cyfrifoldeb, os nad ydynt eisoes wedi gwneud hynny, dros greu cysylltiadau ag ysgolion a cholegau lleol er mwyn helpu datblygu cysylltiad pobl ifanc â'r cyfleoedd sy'n cael eu cynnig gan eu sefydliad.

Wrth ganolbwyntio ar gyfraniad economaidd addysg uwch, nid oeddem am anghofio'r cyfraniad ehangach y mae prifysgolion yn ei wneud i ddatblygiad cymdeithasol a diwylliannol Cymru, a'r myfyriwr unigol, sy'n bwysig. Nid cyfoeth ariannol yw'r unig gyfoeth y mae addysg yn ei greu.

Yn olaf, o ran sicrhau bod addysg uwch yn ganolog i'r ddadl ar bolisi economaidd, mae'n hanfodol bod addysg uwch yn dod yn fwy canolog i waith blaengynllunio Llywodraeth Cymru. Rhaid i adrannau Llywodraeth Cymru gydweithio'n well â'i gilydd, ac mewn partneriaeth â'r sector addysg uwch, fel bod tîm Cymru yn ymwybodol o waith blaengynllunio'r Llywodraeth yng nghyswllt materion lle mae angen i'r sector fod yn barod i ymateb. Credem y gallai memorandwm cyd-ddealltwriaeth, neu brotocol arall, fod o gymorth i ffurfioli diwylliant gweithio o'r fath.

Higher education institutions must reach out further in order to forge links with companies of all sizes. In turn, small and medium-sized enterprises must interact more with other SMEs and with large companies in order to create an environment of enthusiastic co-operation.

Higher education must co-operate better with further education, sector skills councils and, ultimately, schools. The Welsh Government must work closely with the United Kingdom's new Department for Business, Innovation and Skills to look for

gyfer cyd-strategaethau a buddsoddi. Yr allwedd felly yw cysylltiad.

The proof of the pudding will be whether our recommendations have been embedded in the Minister's new strategy, which she announced last week, namely her twenty first century higher education plan. In the plan the Minister sets out her vision for the future of higher education in Wales, which includes offering flexible, accessible and learner-centred provision, contributing to the future renewal of the Welsh economy, working with businesses in and beyond Wales, and contributing to reviving and sustaining communities. I am pleased that supporting a buoyant economy will be one of the two pillars that form the basis of the new national policy on higher education.

The Minister says that she wants higher education to work closely with many more businesses, employers and employers' organisations as a matter of routine, and to see the exploitation of new and existing knowledge to feed wealth creation and business growth. She expects higher education to provide a far more central, innovative, and transformative role for business development, and she emphasises the importance of collaboration and targeted support to maximise the impact of university research—that has been the essence of our study and evidence-taking sessions. We are looking forward to seeing that being put into practice.

In conclusion, the plan includes many other priorities. I am disappointed that our committee's recommendations on embedding a culture of entrepreneurship do not feature explicitly in the strategy.

Yn olaf, credwn fod gan brifysgolion a cholegau Cymru ran hanfodol i'w chwarae yn y gwaith o gynllunio ffordd allan o'r dirywiad economaidd sydd ohoni o ran meithrin sgiliau ac addysg y gweithlu yn yr hirdymor, a datblygu economi wybodaeth fodern i Gymru. Ein gobaith yw y bydd casgliadau ac argymhellion yr adroddiad hwn yn cyfrannu at y broses honno.

opportunities for joint strategies and investment. The key, therefore, is to make connections.

Y prawf o lwyddiant fydd gweld a fydd ein hargymhellion wedi'u hymgorffori yn strategaeth newydd y Gweinidog, a gyhoeddwyd ganddi'r wythnos diwethaf, sef ei chynllun addysg uwch ar gyfer yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Yn y cynllun, mae'r Gweinidog yn egluro'i gweledigaeth ar gyfer dyfodol addysg uwch yng Nghymru, sy'n cynnwys cynnig darpariaeth hyblyg a hygyrch sy'n canolbwyntio ar y dysgwyr, sy'n cyfrannu at adnewyddu economi Cymru yn y dyfodol, sy'n gweithio gyda busnesau yng Nghymru a thu hwnt, ac sy'n cyfrannu at adfywio a chynnal cymunedau. Yr wyf yn falch y bydd cynnal economi fywiog yn un o'r ddau biler a fydd yn sail i'r polisi cenedlaethol newydd ar addysg uwch.

Dywed y Gweinidog ei bod am weld addysg uwch yn cydweithio'n agos â llawer mwy o fusnesau, cyflogwyr a sefydliadau cyflogwyr fel mater o drefn, a gweld gwybodaeth bresennol a newydd yn cael ei defnyddio i hybu twf busnesau a'r broses o greu cyfoeth. Mae'n disgwyl i addysg uwch ddarparu rôl fwy canolog, arloesol a thrawsnewidiol o lawer ar gyfer datblygu busnes, ac y mae'n pwysleisio pwysigrwydd cydweithredu a chymorth wedi ei dargedu i sicrhau bod ymchwil prifysgolion yn cael cymaint o effaith ag sy'n bosibl—dyna oedd hanfod ein hastudiaeth a'n sesiynau casglu tystiolaeth. Edrychwn ymlaen at weld hynny'n cael ei roi ar waith.

I gloi, mae'r cynllun yn cynnwys nifer o flaenoriaethau eraill. Yr wyf yn siomedig nad yw argymhellion ein pwyllgor ar ymgorffori diwylliant o entrepreneuriaeth yn cael lle amlwg yn y strategaeth.

Finally, we believe Welsh universities and colleges have a vital role to play in the work of planning a way out of the current economic downturn by nurturing the skills and education of the workforce in the long term, and by developing a modern knowledge economy for Wales. Our hope is that the conclusions and recommendations in this report will contribute to that process.

The Minister for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills (Jane Hutt):

The Welsh Assembly Government welcomes the committee's report, and we commend Members for the depth and breadth of the information that was reviewed, and on the recommendations put forward. Our endorsement of those recommendations was clear in the joint written response by the Deputy First Minister and me that the committee received. It demonstrates the whole-Government, joint ministerial and departmental approach that we have developed.

I endorse the committee's conclusion that Welsh universities are of critical importance in driving economic growth through raising skills levels, by attracting research and development investment from businesses and as a source of ideas and intellectual property with commercial application. Not only are Welsh universities an asset to existing businesses in Wales and sources of new businesses, they are one of Wales's selling points in attracting investment from across the world and raising Wales's profile and global competitiveness.

Higher education in Wales faces increasingly vigorous international competition for excellence and investment. That requires universities to maintain and achieve recognition for intellectual excellence and research, to partner with the best internationally and to be attractive to international students, while ensuring that national educational needs are met and that the system is flexible enough to provide access and opportunity for all.

This analysis underpins the announcement that I made in Plenary last week on 'For Our Future—The 21st Century Higher Education Strategy and Plan for Wales'. That sets the direction of travel for the sector in Wales, and talks about the importance of strategic change. It gives clear messages on the Assembly Government's expectations when investing in higher education. The receipt of the committee's report was timely, and contributed, as the Chair has said, to our thinking. We have worked together on this.

Y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau (Jane Hutt):

Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn croesawu adroddiad y pwyllgor, ac yr ydym yn canmol yr Aelodau am ddyfnder ac ehangder y wybodaeth a adolygwyd, ac am yr argymhellion a gyflwynwyd. Yr oedd ein cymeradwyaeth i'r argymhellion hynny'n amlwg yn yr ymateb ysgrifenedig i'r pwyllgor gennyf fi a'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog. Mae'n dangos y dull gweithredu Llywodraeth-gyfan yr ydym wedi'i ddatblygu, a gweinidogion ac adrannau'n gweithredu ar y cyd.

Yr wyf yn cymeradwyo casgliad y pwyllgor, sef bod prifysgolion Cymru o bwys allweddol i hybu twf economaidd drwy godi lefelau sgiliau, drwy ddenu buddsoddiad mewn ymchwil a datblygu gan fusnesau, a thrwy fod yn ffynhonnell o syniadau ac eiddo deallusol y gellir eu masnacheiddio. Yn ogystal â bod yn gaffaeliad i fusnesau sydd eisoes yn bod yng Nghymru a bod yn ffynonellau busnesau newydd, mae prifysgolion Cymru hefyd yn un o brif rinweddau Cymru wrth ddenu buddsoddiad o bob cwr o'r byd a chodi proffil Cymru a'i gallu i gystadlu'n fyd-eang.

Mae addysg uwch yng Nghymru yn wynebu cystadleuaeth ryngwladol gynyddol am ragoriaeth a buddsoddiad. Golyga hynny fod angen i brifysgolion gynnal ac ennill cydnabyddiaeth am ymchwil a rhagoriaeth ddeallusol, er mwyn creu partneriaethau â'r sefydliadau gorau ar lefel ryngwladol a bod yn ddeniadol i fyfyrwyr tramor, gan sicrhau ar yr un pryd fod anghenion addysgol cenedlaethol yn cael eu diwallu a bod y system yn ddigon hyblyg i ddarparu mynediad a chyfle i bawb.

Mae'r dadansoddiad hwn yn ategu'r cyhoeddiad a wneuthum yn y Cyfarfod Llawn yr wythnos diwethaf ar 'Er Mwyn Ein Dyfodol—Strategaeth a Chynllun Addysg Uwch ar gyfer Cymru yn yr Unfed Ganrif ar Hugain'. Mae'n pennu'r cyfeiriad y bwriedir mynd iddo ar gyfer y sector yng Nghymru, ac y mae'n sôn am bwysigrwydd newid strategol. Mae'n rhoi negeseuon clir ynghylch disgwyliadau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wrth fuddsoddi mewn addysg uwch. Daeth adroddiad y pwyllgor i law ar

The recommendations will be given further consideration during the detailed development of the national aims and themes for action in 'For Our Future'.

I have made it clear that I want to see the higher education sector in Wales at the forefront of world-class research. As you said, Chair, this is the essence of your committee's study. The Assembly Government has communicated that its research priority areas are the digital economy, the low-carbon economy, health and biosciences, and advanced engineering and manufacturing cross-cutting technologies. That focus and prioritisation has been welcomed and is now steering the research agenda in Wales in our higher education institutions.

Wales must also increase the levels of commercialisation and knowledge exchange. An increase in and retention of higher skills is fundamental to the development of the knowledge-based economy of Wales. We have been pleased to announce several ESF-supported projects that will help to achieve this. One example is the knowledge economy skills scholarships project, which I launched recently with the Deputy First Minister at Bangor University. This will prepare over 360 individuals to be research professionals.

You acknowledged the twin goals of social justice and developing a buoyant economy in 'For Our Future'. I welcome your comments on the investment in the Heads of the Valleys university initiative. This is about delivering those twin goals of economic support and social justice.

Graduate employability should be a key outcome of the higher education experience. Opportunities for part time and work-based learning will improve graduates' own prospects and the competitiveness of our economy. Work-based learning strategies is a new programme of higher level work-based learning that will extend the range and

adeq amserol, a chyfrannodd, fel y dywedodd y Cadeirydd, at ein barn. Yr ydym wedi cydweithio â'n gilydd yn y cyswllt hwn. Caiff yr argymhellion eu hystyried ymhellach wrth ddatblygu'n fanwl y nodau a'r themâu cenedlaethol ar gyfer gweithredu sydd yn 'Er Mwyn Ein Dyfodol'.

Yr wyf wedi gwneud yn glir fy mod am weld y sector addysg uwch yng Nghymru yn arwain y ffordd mewn ymchwil o'r radd flaenaf. Fel y dywedasoch, Gadeirydd, dyma yw hanfod astudiaeth eich pwyllgor. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi nodi mai ei meysydd blaenoriaeth o ran ymchwil yw'r economi ddigidol, yr economi carbon isel, iechyd a biowyddorau, a thechnolegau trawsbynciol peirianeg uwch a gweithgynhyrchu. Croesawyd y ffocws a'r blaenoriaethau hynny, ac erbyn hyn maent yn llywio'r agenda ymchwil yng Nghymru yn ein sefydliadau addysg uwch.

Yn ogystal, rhaid i Gymru gynyddu lefelau ei gwaith masnacheiddio a chyfnewid gwybodaeth. Mae cynyddu a chadw sgiliau uwch yn hanfodol i ddatblygu'r economi wybodaeth yng Nghymru. Yr oedd yn bleser gennym gyhoeddi nifer o brosiectau a gaiff gymorth gan gronfa gymdeithasol Ewrop, a fydd o help i gyflawni hynny. Un enghraifft yw'r prosiect ysgoloriaethau ar gyfer sgiliau'r economi wybodaeth, a lansiwyd gennyf yn ddiweddar gyda'r Dirprwy Weinidog ym Mhrifysgol Bangor. Bydd y prosiect yn paratoi dros 360 o unigolion i fod yn weithwyr proffesiynol ym maes ymchwil.

Yr oeddech yn cydnabod y ddau nod yn 'Er Mwyn Ein Dyfodol', sef cyfiawnder cymdeithasol a datblygu economi fywiog. Croesawaf eich sylwadau ar fuddsoddi ym menter prifysgol Blaenau'r Cymoedd. Mae'r fenter honno'n golygu gwireddu'r ddau nod hynny, sef cynhaliath economaidd a chyfiawnder cymdeithasol.

Dylai cyflogadwyedd graddedigion fod yn un o ganlyniadau allweddol y profiad addysg uwch. Bydd cyfleoedd dysgu rhan-amser a dysgu'n seiliedig ar waith yn gwella rhagolygon personol graddedigion a gallu ein heconomi i gystadlu. Mae strategaethau dysgu'n seiliedig ar waith yn rhaglen newydd o ddysgu lefel uwch sy'n seiliedig ar waith, a

quality of opportunities currently available to engage in accredited graduate-level education in the workplace, as will the foundation degrees project which will support up to 1,330 participants to obtain a foundation degree.

I am convinced that the strong leadership of the Assembly Government, combined with the commitment of the sector itself, will see our universities make a step change in their contribution to Wales' prosperity.

Paul Davies: I am pleased to be able to take part in this important debate this afternoon. I commend the Chair of the committee for the way in which he has led this important inquiry, which has resulted in this comprehensive report. I also thank my fellow Members for their contributions. I would like to pay tribute to the work of the clerk and thank her and her team for putting this report together.

This report is about ensuring that entrepreneurship is at the heart of the higher education agenda. We have, in Wales, one of the top 100 universities in the world and one of the best business schools. It is therefore crucial that these institutions and, indeed, all of our universities and colleges, play a vital role in supporting Wales out of this recession. At a time of economic difficulty, it is even more important that there is sufficient investment in our HE sector because it will be a key factor in planning a way out of the current economic downturn.

I am pleased that the Welsh Assembly Government has accepted 16 of the committee's 32 recommendations and that it believes that the majority of the others are already in place or in progress. However, it is clear from our report that the opportunities to link HE institutions and the business community are currently not being fully utilised. As the Chair said, the Federation of Small Businesses has highlighted this. It referred to a communications gap between businesses and higher education institutions. Some HE institutions admitted that they currently have a minimal relationship with the local business community because the

bydd yn ymestyn ystod ac ansawdd y cyfleoedd sydd ar gael ar hyn o bryd i ymwneud ag addysg achrededig ar lefel graddedigion yn y gweithle. Bydd y prosiect graddau sylfaen, a fydd yn cynorthwyo hyd at 1,330 o gyfranogwyr i ennill gradd sylfaen, yn cyflawni'r un nod.

Yr wyf yn argyhoeddedig y bydd arweiniad cryf Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, o'i gyfuno ag ymrwymiad y sector ei hun, yn sicrhau bod cyfraniad ein prifysgolion i ffyniant Cymru yn newid yn sylweddol.

Paul Davies: Yr wyf yn falch gallu cymryd rhan yn y ddadl bwysig hon y prynhawn yma. Hoffwn ganmol Cadeirydd y pwyllgor am y ffordd y mae wedi arwain yr ymchwiliad pwysig hwn, a arweiniodd at yr adroddiad cynhwysfawr sydd dan sylw. Hoffwn ddiolch hefyd i'm cyd-Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau. Hoffwn roi teyrnged i waith y clerch a diolch iddi hi a'i thîm am lunio'r adroddiad.

Mae'r adroddiad yn ymwneud â sicrhau bod entrepreneuriaeth yn ganolog i'r agenda addysg uwch. Yng Nghymru, mae gennym un o'r 100 o brifysgolion gorau yn y byd, ac un o'r ysgolion busnes gorau. Mae'n hollbwysig, felly, i'r sefydliadau hyn, a phob un o'n prifysgolion a'n colegau o ran hynny, gael rôl hanfodol i gynorthwyo Cymru i ddod allan o'r dirwasgiad hwn. Ar adeg anodd yn economaidd, mae hyd yn oed yn bwysicach fod digon o fuddsoddi yn ein sector addysg uwch, oherwydd bydd yn ffactor allweddol wrth gynllunio ffordd allan o'r dirywiad economaidd presennol.

Yr wyf yn falch fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi derbyn 16 o'r 32 o argymhellion gan y pwyllgor, a'i bod yn credu bod mwyafrif yr argymhellion eraill eisoes ar waith neu ar y gweill. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg o'n hadroddiad nad yw cyfleoedd i gysylltu sefydliadau addysg uwch a'r gymuned fusnes â'i gilydd yn cael eu defnyddio'n llawn ar hyn o bryd. Fel y dywedodd y Cadeirydd, tynnodd y Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach sylw at hynny. Cyfeiriodd at fwch cyfathrebu rhwng busnesau a sefydliadau addysg uwch. Cyfaddefodd rhai sefydliadau addysg uwch mai cysylltiad bach iawn sydd ganddynt ar hyn o bryd â'r gymuned fusnes leol, am nad

channels of communication are not yet in place. It is, therefore, essential that these links are developed as a matter of urgency in order to benefit the economy of Wales.

It is for this reason that recommendation 25, which calls for an improvement in these links, must be implemented as soon as possible. I appreciate that, in response to this recommendation, the Assembly Government says that this is in progress and that a series of brokerage events are being held between academia and business. However, it is obvious that this is not sufficient and it is imperative that there is engagement between HE institutions and small and medium-sized businesses. We need to see more staff at HE institutions being given the opportunity to work on projects with small business and forging links with these smaller companies.

5.00 p.m.

That is why the committee's report suggests that a cultural change is needed, by both the Welsh Assembly Government and higher education institutions themselves. Greater collaboration, particularly with small and medium-sized enterprises, is the key to ensuring that Wales develops into a small and clever country, which we all want to see.

I believe that recommendation 21, which states that the Welsh Assembly Government should consider involving the top 10 corporations in Wales in a mentoring scheme for new graduates, where the award for the top students would be their own company, is a fantastic idea. This recommendation, as I understand it, has come from evidence that the committee took from Simon Gibson about an entrepreneurial competition that he and Sir Terry Matthews ran. They sent graduates to Canada for six months to live in Sir Terry's house and, there, they were mentored and taught entrepreneurial skills. I am given to understand that those who completed that programme were awarded their own company and that, as a result, four new companies were created every year. If we could introduce a similar scheme on a larger scale, that undoubtedly could transform our economy and create a truly innovative society. I hope very much that the

yw'r llwybrau cyfathrebu'n bodoli eto. Mae'n hanfodol, felly, i'r cysylltiadau hyn gael eu datblygu ar frys, er mwyn bod o fudd i economi Cymru.

Dyna pam mae'n rhaid mynd ati cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl i weithredu argymhelliad 25, sy'n galw am wella'r cysylltiadau hyn. Yr wyf yn sylweddoli bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn ei hymateb i'r argymhelliad hwn, yn dweud bod y gwaith dan sylw ar y gweill, ac y cynhelir cyfres o ddigwyddiadau brocera rhwng sefydliadau academiaidd a byd busnes. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg nad yw hynny'n ddigon, ac y mae'n hanfodol cael ymgysylltu rhwng sefydliadau addysg uwch a busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint. Mae angen inni weld mwy o staff mewn sefydliadau addysg uwch yn cael cyfle i weithio ar brosiectau gyda busnesau bach, a meithrin cysylltiadau â'r cwmnïau llai hyn.

Dyna pam mae adroddiad y pwyllgor yn awgrymu bod angen newid diwylliannol, gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r sefydliadau addysg uwch eu hunain. Mae mwy o gydweithredu, yn enwedig â mentrau bach a chanolig eu maint, yn allweddol i sicrhau bod Cymru'n datblygu'n wlad fach alluog, ac yr ydym i gyd am weld hynny.

Credaf fod argymhelliad 21, sy'n datgan y dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ystyried cynnwys y 10 corfforaeth bwysicaf yng Nghymru mewn cynllun mentora graddedigion newydd, a gwobrwyo'r myfyrwyr gorau â'u cwmni eu hunain, yn syniad gwych. Deallaf fod yr argymhelliad hwnnw wedi deillio o dystiolaeth a gafodd y pwyllgor gan Simon Gibson am gystadleuaeth entrepreneuriaidd y bu ef a Syr Terry Matthews yn ei rhedeg. Anfonwyd graddedigion i Ganada am chwe mis i fyw yn nhŷ Syr Terry, ac yno cawsant eu mentora a chael cyfle i ddysgu sgiliau entrepreneuriaidd. Deallaf fod y rhai a gwblhaodd y rhaglen honno wedi'u gwobrwyo â'u cwmni eu hunain, a bod pedwar cwmni newydd wedi'u creu bob blwyddyn o ganlyniad i hynny. Pe gallem gyflwyno cynllun tebyg ar raddfa fwy, nid oes amheuaeth na allai hynny drawsnewid ein heconomi a chreu cymdeithas wirioneddol arloesol. Yr wyf yn

Government will look at introducing such a scheme, because all it has said in its response is that it is under consideration.

It is clear from the report and the evidence taken from various witnesses that there remains a funding gap between Welsh and English universities. As we all know, the multiplier effect of public investment in higher education is currently about 5:1, which is, I must admit, a good return. However, the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales would like to see that figure doubled, and that is why it is imperative that the Assembly Government sees higher education as an investment and not a cost. I am pleased that the Welsh Assembly Government has accepted our recommendation on that, but I hope very much that it will take heed of it. Higher education must be viewed as the driver of prosperity and as a sector that supports the development of skills and knowledge. It will be key in helping Wales out of the worst recession that it has seen in 100 years. I hope that the Welsh Assembly Government will implement the findings of the committee's report as a matter of urgency.

Jeff Cuthbert: I thank you for allowing me to make this contribution today, Dirprwy Lywydd, and I, too, would like to give my thanks to Gareth for the way that he chaired this work, and to the other members of the committee, the witnesses who gave evidence and the clerks who supported us throughout the process. I am a member of that committee and someone with a lifelong interest in education, skills and training. So, this issue is very close to my heart.

I support the committee's recommendations in the report and I also welcome the Welsh Assembly Government's constructive response, which it issued last month. The economic potential of higher education needs to be fully realised in Wales. We are a small, clever country that needs to capitalise on the high-tech and knowledge resources that we have. We recognise that universities are a substantial driver of the Welsh economy. As we put policies in place to pull ourselves out of recession, we need to gear ourselves towards the high-tech, knowledge-intensive,

gobeithio'n fawr y bydd y Llywodraeth yn ystyried cyflwyno cynllun o'r fath, oherwydd y cyfan a ddywedodd yn ei hymateb oedd bod yr argymhelliad yn cael ei ystyried.

Mae'n amlwg o'r adroddiad, a'r dystiolaeth a gasglwyd gan amryw dystion, fod bwlch o hyd rhwng y cyllid a gaiff prifysgolion Cymru a'r cyllid a gaiff prifysgolion Lloegr. Fel y gwyyddom i gyd, mae effaith lluosu buddsoddiad cyhoeddus mewn addysg uwch yn rhyw 5:1 ar hyn o bryd, sy'n elw da, rhaid cyfaddef. Fodd bynnag, hoffai Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru weld dyblu'r ffigur hwnnw, a dyna pam mae'n hanfodol i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ystyried addysg uwch yn fuddsoddiad, nid yn gost. Yr wyf yn falch fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi derbyn ein hargymhelliad ar hynny, ond gobeithiaf yn fawr y bydd yn rhoi sylw iddo. Rhaid i addysg uwch gael ei hystyried yn sbardun ffyniant, ac yn sector sy'n cefnogi datblygu sgiliau a gwybodaeth. Bydd yn allweddol i helpu Cymru allan o'r dirwasgiad gwaethaf a welodd ers 100 mlynedd. Gobeithio y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gweithredu darganfyddiadau adroddiad y pwyllgor ar frys.

Jeff Cuthbert: Diolch ichi am adael imi wneud y cyfraniad hwn heddiw, Ddirprwy Lywydd, a hoffwn i hefyd ddiolch i Gareth am y ffordd y cadeiriodd y gwaith hwn, a diolch i aelodau eraill y pwyllgor, y tystion a roddodd dystiolaeth, a'r clerod a'n cynorthwyodd drwy gydol y broses. Yr wyf yn aelod o'r pwyllgor, ac y mae addysg, sgiliau a hyfforddiant wedi bod o ddiddordeb imi erioed. Mae'r pwnc hwn yn agos iawn at fy nghalon, felly.

Yr wyf yn cefnogi argymhellion y pwyllgor yn yr adroddiad, ac yr wyf hefyd yn croesawu ymateb adeiladol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, a gyhoeddwyd ganddi fis diwethaf. Mae angen i botensial economaidd addysg uwch gael ei wireddu'n llawn yng Nghymru. Yr ydym yn wlad fach alluog, ac y mae angen inni fanteisio ar yr adnoddau sydd gennym o ran uwch-dechnoleg a gwybodaeth. Yr ydym yn cydnabod bod prifysgolion yn sbardun pwysig i economi Cymru. Wrth inni roi polisïau ar waith i'n tynnu ein hunain allan o'r dirwasgiad, mae

green economy of the future. Part of this drive will be enabled by European structural funds, the monitoring of which the higher education sector is closely involved in as part of the all-Wales programme monitoring committee. The overarching aim of these funds is to pull us in this direction, and the universities are key partners in this process, working with other key stakeholders, such as Welsh businesses large and small.

As an engineer, I know that universities play an important role in supporting the training and skill development of the next generation of engineers. The engineering sector and the skills and knowledge base that the workforce is able to disperse will be crucial in our drive to build a new economy in Wales over the next few years and pull ourselves out of recession. However, I was disappointed to read last week that Britain as a whole will face a shortfall of about 700,000 new recruits to the engineering sector over the next seven years or so. I therefore welcome a recent campaign by Engineering UK, which I met last week, to rectify this and boost recruitment in the sector, both in terms of undergraduates studying the subject at degree level and in terms of employment. Engineering is vital to our economic future in Wales, and the higher education sector has a vital role in supporting Welsh businesses and industry to this end. It is important that industry also fully engages with the higher education sector, and ensures that its needs are fully known, understood and planned for. As a nation, we need to capitalise on this rich resource.

In terms of moving ahead with this agenda, and using the engineering sector as a prime example of businesses and universities working together, I welcome the Welsh Assembly Government's response to our report and its higher education strategy and action plan, which tackles some of the concerns addressed in the committee's report, in line with our 'One Wales' commitments

angen inni ymbaratoi ar gyfer yr economi werdd, uwch-dechnoleg, a dwys o ran gwybodaeth, a fydd yn bodoli yn y dyfodol. Bydd rhan o'r ymgyrch honno'n cael ei galluogi gan gronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd, y mae'r sector addysg uwch yn ymwneud yn agos â'u monitro, fel rhan o bwyllgor monitro rhaglenni Cymru gyfan. Nod trosfwaol y cronfeydd dan sylw yw ein tynnu i'r cyfeiriad hwn, ac y mae'r prifysgolion yn bartneriaid allweddol yn y broses, gan weithio gyda rhanddeiliaid allweddol eraill, megis busnesau mawr a bach Cymru.

Fel peiriannydd, gwn fod gan brifysgolion rôl bwysig o ran hybu gwaith hyfforddi a datblygu sgiliau'r genhedlaeth nesaf o beirianwyr. Bydd y sector peirianeg, a'r sgiliau a'r sylfaen wybodaeth y mae'r gweithlu'n medru eu rhannu, yn hollbwysig yn ein hymgyrch i adeiladu economi newydd yng Nghymru dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf ac i'n tynnu ein hunain allan o'r dirwasgiad. Fodd bynnag, cefais fy siomi o ddarllen yr wythnos diwethaf y bydd Prydain gyfan yn wynebu diffyg o ryw 700,000 o recriwtiaid newydd i'r sector peirianeg dros tua'r saith mlynedd nesaf. Felly, yr wyf yn croesawu ymgyrch ddiweddar gan Engineering UK, y cyfarfûm ag ef yr wythnos diwethaf, i unioni'r sefyllfa a hybu gwaith recriwtio yn y sector, o ran israddedigion sy'n astudio'r pwnc ar lefel gradd ac o ran cyflogaeth. Mae peirianeg yn hanfodol i'n dyfodol economaidd yng Nghymru, ac y mae gan y sector addysg uwch rôl hanfodol i gefnogi busnesau a diwydiant Cymru i'r perwyl hwnnw. Mae'n bwysig i ddiwydiant hefyd ymgysylltu'n llawn â'r sector addysg uwch, ac sicrhau bod gan y sector hwnnw wybodaeth lawn am ei anghenion, ei fod yn eu deall yn llwyr ac yn cynllunio ar eu cyfer. Fel cenedl, mae angen inni fanteisio ar yr adnodd cyfoethog hwn.

O ran symud ymlaen â'r agenda hon, a defnyddio'r sector peirianeg fel enghraifft wych o fusnesau a phrifysgolion yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd, yr wyf yn croesawu ymateb Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i'n hadroddiad, a'i strategaeth a'i chynllun gweithredu ar gyfer addysg uwch, sy'n mynd i'r afael â rhai o'r pryderon y rhoddwyd sylw iddynt yn adroddiad y pwyllgor, yn unol â'n

and our spending of European structural funds.

As I stated earlier, Wales is a small, clever country. We must make the most efficient use of our creative and knowledge-based resources and ensure joined-up working between higher education and industry in both directions to ensure that that happens. I have chosen to speak about engineering in particular because it is a subject close to my heart. However, the issue of education, training and skills development is relevant to universities and businesses, and is vital to our economic future as we prepare the groundwork for an economic upturn.

Jenny Randerson: I thank the Chair for leading this excellent analysis, and thank the committee staff for their tremendous hard work and advice. This is an extremely good, detailed and specific report.

Before I go any further, I wish to remind Members of the importance of the higher education sector to our economy. It is a sector with a turnover of £1 billion, and it has produced export earnings of £170 million a year. That includes £65 million from research grants and £104 million in fees that the sector receives from international students. The sector has earned £121 million in research grants for Wales, and over £205 million from contracts in the most recent year for which figures are available.

I repeat these statistics because it is important to remember that the issue is not money spent on higher education and research, but money invested. Higher education is well worth the investment not just in terms of the skills created, but because of its direct economic contribution. This report makes detailed recommendations and I am concerned that although the Welsh Assembly Government has produced warm words, there is a lack of specific adoption of the recommendations in the Government's policy. I have not seen anything emerge from the other end as to what the Government will be doing and how

hymrwymiadau yn 'Cymru'n Un' a'n dull o wario arian cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd.

Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, mae Cymru'n wlad fach alluog. Rhaid inni wneud y defnydd mwyaf effeithlon o'n hadnoddau creadigol a'n hadnoddau o ran gwybodaeth, a sicrhau bod gwaith cydgyssylltiedig yn mynd rhagddo i'r ddau gyfeiriad rhwng addysg uwch a diwydiant er mwyn sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd. Yr wyf wedi dewis siarad am beirianeg yn benodol am fod y pwnc yn agos at fy nghalon. Fodd bynnag, mae mater addysg, hyfforddiant a datblygu sgiliau yn berthnasol i brifysgolion a busnesau, ac y mae'n hanfodol i'n dyfodol economaidd wrth inni baratol'r sylfeini ar gyfer adferiad economaidd.

Jenny Randerson: Yr wyf yn diolch i'r Cadeirydd am arwain y dadansoddiad ardderchog hwn, ac yn diolch i staff y pwyllgor am eu cyngor a'u gwaith hynod galed. Mae hwn yn adroddiad eithriadol o dda, manwl a phenodol.

Cyn symud ymhellach, hoffwn atgoffa'r Aelodau o bwysigrwydd y sector addysg uwch i'n heconomi. Mae'n sector sydd â throshiant o £1 biliwn, ac y mae wedi cynhyrchu enillion allforio gwerth £170 miliwn y flwyddyn. Mae hynny'n cynnwys £65 miliwn o grantiau ymchwil, a £104 miliwn mewn ffioedd a gaiff y sector gan fyfyrwyr tramor. Mae'r sector wedi ennill £121 miliwn mewn grantiau ymchwil i Gymru, a thros £205 miliwn o gontractau yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiweddaraf y mae ffigurau ar gael ar ei chyfer.

Yr wyf yn ailadrodd yr ystadegau hyn oherwydd y mae'n bwysig cofio nad yr arian a gaiff ei wario ar addysg uwch ac ymchwil yw'r mater sydd dan sylw, ond yr arian a gaiff ei fuddsoddi ynddynt. Mae addysg uwch yn werth y buddsoddiad, nid yn unig o ran y sgiliau y mae'n eu creu, ond oherwydd ei chyfraniad economaidd uniongyrchol. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn gwneud argymhellion manwl, ac er bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi yngan geiriau caredig, yr wyf yn pryderu bod diffyg camau penodol i fabwysiadu'r argymhellion ym mholisi'r Llywodraeth. Nid wyf wedi gweld dim yn

it will implement a programme that has been worked out.

Only this morning, the Confederation of Business and Industry expressed concern to committee that the core business of our universities was being lost in a plethora of other worthy initiatives. It said that our universities are expected to pursue many Welsh Assembly Government priorities at a time when their core funding and total funding is under intense pressure. It is ironic and worth noting that this report was launched during the same week as the draft budget, which cut funding for higher education by 5 per cent. It is even more disappointing that the Minister for Finance and Public Service Delivery did not pay attention to the strong views that were expressed in the Plenary debate on the draft budget. Those strong views were expressed by all four parties in the Assembly, and it was unusual to hear such strong criticism from Members of the governing party of their own Government.

5.10 p.m.

I strongly commend the report to the Minister, which includes schemes that you can adopt almost exactly as they are as a result of our recommendations. These include the need for closer working between the Department for the Economy and Transport and the Department for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills; specific proposals for match funding to encourage universities to develop intellectual property; and the recommendation that there should be a focus on the research departments in Wales that achieve international-scale success in their research. It is important that the Government takes on board that we must encourage the very best in higher education. There is a tendency to even the money out, but if you invest in the best, you create a pool of talent that will strengthen the rest. It is important that we deal with, support and press even further those that are achieving the best. Finally, I will refer to the recommendations that relate to developing entrepreneurship among academics. A great deal needs to be done to strengthen that

dod o'r pen arall i ddangos beth fydd y Llywodraeth yn ei wneud a sut y bydd yn gweithredu rhaglen sydd wedi'i chynllunio.

Y bore yma hyd yn oed, mynegodd y Cydffederasiwn Busnes a Diwydiant ei bryder wrth y pwyllgor fod busnes craidd ein prifysgolion yn cael ei golli mewn gormodedd o fentrau clodwiw eraill. Dywedir bod disgwyl i'n prifysgolion fynd ar drywydd nifer o flaenoriaethau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar adeg pan fo'u cyllid craidd a chyfanswm eu cyllid dan bwysau enfawr. Mae'n eironig ac y mae'n werth nodi bod yr adroddiad hwn wedi ei lansio yn yr un wythnos â'r gyllideb ddrafft a oedd yn gostwng cyllid addysg uwch 5 y cant. Mae hyd yn oed yn fwy siomedig na roddodd y Gweinidog dros Gyllid a Chyflenwi Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus ddim sylw i'r safbwyntiau cryfion a fynegwyd yn y ddadl ar y gyllideb ddrafft yn y Cyfarfod Llawn. Mynegwyd y safbwyntiau cryfion hynny gan bob un o'r pedair plaid yn y Cynulliad, ac yr oedd yn anarferol clywed beirniadaeth mor gryf gan Aelodau'r blaid lywodraethol o'u Llywodraeth eu hunain.

Yr wyf yn cymeradwyo'r adroddiad yn daer i'r Gweinidog, ac y mae'n cynnwys cynlluniau y gallwch eu mabwysiadu bron yn union fel y maent o ganlyniad i'n hargymhellion. Mae'r cynlluniau hynny'n cynnwys yr angen am gydweithio agosach rhwng Adran yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth a'r Adran Plant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau; cynigion penodol ynghylch arian cyfatebol i annog prifysgolion i ddatblygu eiddo deallusol; a'r argymhelliad y dylid canolbwyntio ar adrannau ymchwil yng Nghymru sy'n cael llwyddiant ar lefel ryngwladol o ran eu hymchwil. Mae'n bwysig i'r Llywodraeth ddeall ei bod yn rhaid inni hybu'r canlyniadau gorau posibl ym maes addysg uwch. Mae tueddiad i ddsbarthu'r arian yn gyfartal, ond o fuddsoddi yn y gorau yr ydych yn creu cronfa o ddoniau a fydd yn cryfhau'r gweddill. Mae'n bwysig inni ymdrin â'r rheini sy'n sicrhau'r canlyniadau gorau, eu cefnogi a phwyso ymhellach arnynt. Yn olaf, hoffwn gyfeirio at yr argymhellion ar ddatblygu entrepreneuriaeth ymhlith academyddion.

strand in our universities.

In conclusion, a considerable body of global-quality research is going on in Wales. Academics are leading the way, but, too often, they are forced out of Wales in order to develop their ideas into business plans and business productivity. That is to our shame. We see that reflected in our GVA and unemployment statistics.

Nerys Evans: Fel rhywun sydd wedi ymuno â'r pwyllgor ers yr adroddiad cyntaf, hoffwn innau hefyd ddiolch i'r Cadeirydd a'r staff am eu gwaith wrth baratoi'r adroddiad. Yn fy nghyfraniad y prynhawn yma, hoffwn sôn am ddwy elfen o'r adroddiad, sef, yn gyntaf, rôl y Llywodraeth yn y gwaith o ddatblygu creadigrwydd ac arloesi yn ein prifysgolion, ac, yn ail, potensial Cymru yn y maes hwn, ac i arwain yn y maes hwn, oherwydd maint ein gwlad.

Mae'n rhaid inni gofio cyd-destun y drafodaeth hon. Mae sefydliadau addysg uwch yn gyrff annibynnol sy'n gweithio mewn fframwaith rhyngwladol ac yn derbyn rhan o'u cyllid oddi wrth Lywodraeth Cymru. Hwy sydd ar y llinell flaen ac yn ceisio gwireddu amcanion a pholisïau'r Llywodraeth. Mae'n amlwg o ymateb Llywodraeth Cymru i'r pwyllgor fod angen mwy o greadigrwydd ac arloesi i wireddu potensial economaidd ein prifysgolion. Mae cydweithio agos rhwng y Llywodraeth a'r sector.

Clywsom am fanifesto addysg uwch y Llywodraeth rai wythnosau yn ôl. Mae pryder, fel y soniodd Gareth, nad oedd gwaith y pwyllgor wedi bwydo i mewn yn fanylach i'r gwaith hwnnw. O ran y cytundebau neu'r *compacts* y crybwyllodd y Gweinidog yn y manifesto, mae'n bwysig yn y cyd-destun hwnnw ac yng nghyd-destun arloesi fod busnesau hefyd yn rhan o'r trafodaethau. Gobeithiaf glywed mwy o fanylion gan y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ynglŷn â hynny.

Bu pryder yn y gorffennol, sydd efallai'n parhau i fodoli, fod diffyg gweithio ar draws meysydd portffolio Llywodraeth y Cynulliad,

Mae angen gwneud llawer iawn i gryfhau'r elfen honno yn ein prifysgolion.

I gloi, mae ymchwil sylweddol o safon fyd-eang yn mynd ymlaen yng Nghymru. Mae academyddion yn arwain y ffordd, ond yn rhy aml cânt eu gorfodi i adael Cymru er mwyn datblygu eu syniadau'n gynlluniau busnes ac yn gynhyrchiant busnes. Dylai hynny godi cywilydd arnom. Gwelwn fod hynny'n cael ei adlewyrchu yn ein hystadegau ar Werth Ychwanegol Crynswth a diweithdra.

Nerys Evans: As someone who has joined the committee since the first report, I should also like to thank the Chair and the staff for their work in preparing the report. In my contribution this afternoon, I should like to mention two aspects of the report, the first being the role of the Government in developing creativity and innovation in our universities, and secondly, Wales's potential in this area, and in leading this area, given the size of our country.

We must remember the context of this discussion. Higher education institutions are independent bodies working within an international framework and receive part of their funding from the Welsh Government. They are on the front line and are trying to realise the Government's aims and policies. It is apparent from the Welsh Government response to the committee that more creativity and innovation is needed to realise the economic potential of our universities. There is close collaboration between the Government and the sector.

We heard of the Government's higher education manifesto a few weeks ago. There is a concern, as Gareth mentioned, that the committee's work had not fed into that work in more detail. On the agreement or the *compacts* mentioned by the Minister in the manifesto, it is important in that context, and in the context of innovation, that businesses are also part of the discussions. I hope to hear more details from the Deputy First Minister on that.

There has been concern in the past, which perhaps still exists, that there is a lack of cross-portfolio working in the Assembly

a phob Llywodraeth o ran hynny. Efallai fod hynny'n wir yn y maes hwn o fanteisio ar fuddiannau economaidd ein sefydliadau addysg uwch. Rôl y Llywodraeth yw arwain, felly mae'n bwysig bod strwythurau mewnol yn bodoli er mwyn arwain yn effeithiol. Yn y cyd-destun hwn, wrth gwrs, mae'n bwysig bod cydweithio a chydlynw agos rhwng portffolio addysg a phortffolio'r economi. Yr wyf yn gwerthfawrogi ymateb trylwyr a manwl y Llywodraeth i adroddiad y pwyllgor yn fawr, fel y soniodd Gareth, sy'n dangos y cydweithio hyn. Mae hi'n ddyletswydd, fel y soniais, ar y Llywodraeth i arwain yn glir. Felly, mae'n rhaid mynd yn groes i ddull Llywodraethau o weithio mewn seilos, neu fel portffolios unigol, fel bod cydweithio agos rhwng y ddau bortffolio penodol hyn.

Un o gyfrifoldebau pwysicaf y Llywodraeth ym maes addysg uwch yw cyllid, fel y soniodd Jenny. Mae'n siom, felly, clywed am yr arbediad o 5 y cant drwy effeithlonrwydd a ddisgwylir yn y maes hwn, oherwydd gallai hynny effeithio ar ymdrechion sefydliadau addysg uwch i ysgogi arloesi a chreadigrwydd i wireddu eu potensial economaidd. Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhaid rhoi hynny yng nghyd-destun ein setliad ariannol yng Nghymru.

Yn olaf, wrth edrych ar gyfraniad economaidd addysg uwch yng Nghymru, un peth sydd wedi dod i'r amlwg yn y rhan fwyaf o argymhellion y pwyllgor yw y gallai'r ffaith bod Cymru yn wlad fach fod o fantais i ni wrth geisio gwireddu ein hamcanion—y wlad fach glyfar y mae sawl person wedi sôn amdani. Dyma rai enghreifftiau: cydweithio rhwng adrannau mewn sefydliadau gwahanol er mwyn rhagori; ceisio ar y cyd am arian ymchwil a datblygu; y cyfle i rwydweithio a rhannu syniadau; a gwneud hynny'n haws drwy greu'r strwythur sydd gennym yng Nghymru. Mae esiamplau gwych o hynny i'w cael eisoes, a bûm yn ffodus o ymweld â Phrifysgol Abertawe yn ddiweddar i weld y gwaith arbennig a wneir ar yr ail gampws, a'r llwyddiant o ddenu cwmnïoedd yno. Mae'r ffaith bod gennym ganran uwch o fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yng Nghymru yn rhoi cyfleoedd arbennig inni fasnacheiddio a

Government, and in all Government, for that matter. Perhaps that is true of this area of taking full advantage of the economic benefits of our higher education institutions. The role of Government is to lead, therefore, it is important that internal structures exist for effective leadership. In that context, close collaboration and co-ordination between the education portfolio and the economy portfolio is important. I very much appreciate the thorough and detailed response of the Government to the committee's report, as Gareth mentioned, which demonstrates that collaboration. The Government has a duty, as I said, to provide a clear lead. Therefore, we need to ignore the methods whereby Governments work in silos, or as individual portfolios, in order to ensure close collaboration between these two specific portfolios.

One of the most important responsibilities of Government in higher education relates to funding, as Jenny mentioned. It is, therefore, disappointing to hear of the 5 per cent efficiency savings expected in this area, because this can impact upon the efforts of higher education institutions to promote innovation and creativity in order to realise their economic potential. However, that must be looked at in the context of our financial settlement in Wales.

Finally, in looking at the financial contribution of higher education in Wales, one thing which has become apparent in most of the committee's recommendations is the fact that Wales being a small country could be of advantage in trying to realise our objectives—the small, clever country that many have referred to. Here are some examples: collaborations between departments of different institutions to achieve excellence; joint bids for research and development funding; the chance to network and share ideas; and making that easier by creating the structure which we have in Wales. There are already excellent examples of that, and I was fortunate to visit Swansea University recently to see the excellent work being done on its second campus, and its success in attracting businesses there. The fact that we have a higher percentage of small and medium-sized enterprises in Wales provides excellent

chyfnewid gwybodaeth. Yn awr y mae'r cyfle inni fanteisio ar y ffactorau hynny sy'n ein gwneud ni, yn wlad ac yn genedl, yn unigryw, i uchafu ar gyfraniad addysg uwch at ddatblygu economaidd. Bydd cystadleuaeth frwd er mwyn llwyddo pan ddeuwn allan o'r dirwasgiad hwn, a rhaid inni weithio i'n cryfderau ac edrych ar fodelau amgen i weithredu yn y maes hwn.

Hoffwn gloi gan ategu'r pwynt a wnaeth Gareth. Yr wyf yn falch o weld y maniffesto addysg uwch, ond yr oeddwn wedi gobeithio y byddai argymhellion y pwyllgor yn gallu cael eu bwydo i mewn i'r cynllun gweithredu, fel y soniodd y Gweinidog. Edrychaf ymlaen at weld hynny a'r cydweithio sy'n angenrheidiol rhwng y ddau bortffolio i sicrhau y caiff yr argymhellion hyn eu gwireddu.

David Melding: I start by adding my own plaudits to the massive pile accumulating before our wonderful Chair, Gareth Jones. He missed a trick—with this level of acclamation, he should have run for the Labour leadership. He might well have won. [*Laughter.*]

In all seriousness, everyone on the Enterprise and Learning Committee greatly enjoys our work because we go so far beyond narrow partisanship, and that is due to the wise and courteous leadership of Gareth. The committee's reports are always thoughtful and relevant.

I now turn to some of the issues in the report. The recommendations have been accepted by the Welsh Assembly Government, and we welcome that, but with just the slightest hint of gentle menace—well, the Minister is here—I must add that we will revisit the issue to ensure that these commitments are met. I am sure that they will be, but we will certainly monitor their achievement.

I now want to look at research and development in general and the need to develop highly skilled jobs. We know that, in Wales, public sector research and

opportunities to commercialise and exchange information. This is our chance to take advantage of those factors that make us a unique country and nation, to maximise the contribution of higher education to economic development. There will be fierce competition for success when we come out of this recession, and we must work to our strengths and look at alternative models of operating in this area.

I wish to close by emphasising the point which Gareth made. I am pleased to see the higher education manifesto, but I had hoped that the committee's recommendations could be fed into the action plan, as the Minister mentioned. I look forward to seeing that, and also to seeing the collaboration necessary between those two portfolios to ensure that these recommendations are achieved.

David Melding: Hoffwn ddechrau drwy ychwanegu fy nghymeradwyaeth innau at y gymeradwyaeth sylweddol sydd wedi'i chyfeirio at ein Cadeirydd gwych, Gareth Jones. Collodd gyfle euraid—gyda chymaint â hyn o ganmoliaeth, dylai fod wedi ymgeisio am arweinyddiaeth y Blaid Lafur. Gallai'n hawdd fod wedi ennill. [*Chwerthin.*]

Ond o ddifrif, mae pawb ar y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu yn mwynhau ein gwaith yn fawr gan ein bod yn mynd ymhell y tu hwnt i bleidgarwch cul, ac y mae'r diolch am hynny i arweinyddiaeth ddoeth a chwrtais Gareth. Mae adroddiadau'r pwyllgor bob amser yn feddylgar ac yn berthnasol.

Hoffwn droi'n awr at rai o'r materion yn yr adroddiad. Mae'r argymhellion wedi'u derbyn gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, ac yr ydym yn croesawu hynny, ond gyda'r awgrym lleiaf o fygythiad caredig—wel, mae'r Gweinidog yma—rhaid imi ychwanegu y byddwn yn ailedrych ar y mater i sicrhau bod yr ymrwymadau hyn yn cael eu bodloni. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddant, ond byddwn yn bendant yn monitro'r modd y cânt eu cyflawni.

Yn awr, hoffwn edrych ar ymchwil a datblygu'n gyffredinol, a'r angen i ddatblygu swyddi sy'n gofyn am sgiliau uchel. Gwyddom i gyd nad yw ymchwil a datblygu

development is not quite at the UK average, although we are not far off that level. Research and development is principally undertaken by the Government and university sector in Wales. However, we do very poorly indeed with private sector research and development, so we need to see greater partnerships and growth in that area. I hope that, when the manufacturing strategy is brought forward, it will contain something to indicate how we will encourage that link-up. One idea that I would suggest is that, as we move away from a traditional, grant-giving culture that tries to bring inward investors to Wales and prop up industries that are a little past their best, we connect some of the grants or loans to a commitment to carry out research and development or other innovations. That is an important area to watch over the coming months.

Gareth's remarks on entrepreneurship were justified. We need to up the game there, and perhaps the Welsh Assembly Government is only just at the foothills and needs to progress to the summit much more quickly. There is some good practice. We heard in committee this morning about the Wrexham area, where Glyndŵr University is making great strides, as are some of the local colleges, to embed entrepreneurship in education in general. That is important.

The involvement of the business community is repeatedly referred to in the report. I cannot remember whether I heard this outside the committee when talking to people about the report, or whether it was in direct evidence, but someone involved with an innovative SME that was a spin-out from a university said that the best place to generate ideas is often the coffee shop or canteen—that is the place to find that wonderful sparking off of lateral thinking. It is difficult to achieve that unless people are in the same building, so we need to get more businesspeople routinely into the education sector and particularly into universities, whether that is through informal seminars and discussions or through business clubs

yn y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru cystal â chyfartaledd y DU, er nad ydym ymhell islaw'r lefel honno. Caiff gwaith ymchwil a datblygu ei wneud yn bennaf gan y Llywodraeth a'r sector prifysgolion yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, mae ein perfformiad o ran gwaith ymchwil a datblygu yn y sector preifat yn ddifrifol o wael, ac y mae angen felly inni weld mwy o bartneriaethau a thwf yn y maes hwnnw. Gobeithio, pan fydd y strategaeth gweithgynhyrchu'n cael ei chyflwyno, y bydd yn cynnwys rhywbeth a fydd yn dangos sut y byddwn yn annog yr ymgysylltu hwnnw. Un syniad y byddwn yn ei awgrymu, wrth inni symud oddi wrth y diwylliant traddodiadol o roi grantiau sy'n ceisio denu buddsoddwyr i mewn i Gymru a chynnal diwydiannau sydd wedi gweld dyddiau gwell, yw y dylem gysylltu rhai o'r grantiau neu'r benthyciadau ag ymrwymiad i wneud gwaith ymchwil a datblygu neu agweddau eraill ar waith arloesi. Mae'n faes pwysig i gadw llygad arno dros y misoedd nesaf.

Yr oedd sylwadau Gareth ar entrepreneuriaeth yn deg. Mae angen inni wella ein perfformiad o ran hynny, ac efallai mai wrth droed y mynydd y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar hyn o bryd, a bod angen iddi ddringo'n gyflymach o lawer tua'r copa. Mae yna rywfaint o arfer da. Clywsom yn y pwyllgor y bore yma am ardal Wrecsam, lle mae Prifysgol Glyndŵr yn cymryd camau breision, fel y mae rhai o'r colegau lleol hefyd, i ymgorffori entrepreneuriaeth mewn addysg yn gyffredinol. Mae hynny'n bwysig.

Cyfeirir dro ar ôl tro yn yr adroddiad at gynnwys y gymuned fusnes. Ni allaf gofio a glywais hyn y tu allan i'r pwyllgor wrth siarad â phobl am yr adroddiad, ynteu a oedd yn rhan o'r dystiolaeth uniongyrchol, ond dywedodd rhywun a oedd yn ymwneud â menter fach neu ganolig ei maint yn deillio o brifysgol mai'r lle gorau i gynhyrchu syniadau'n aml yw yn y caffi neu'r ffretur—dyna lle bydd pobl yn dechrau meddwl yn ochrol. Mae'n anodd gwneud hynny os nad yw pobl yn yr un adeilad, felly, mae angen inni gael mwy o bobl fusnes i mewn i'r sector addysg, yn enwedig prifysgolion, fel mater o drefn, boed drwy seminarau a thrafodaethau anffurfiol neu drwy glybiau busnes sy'n rhedeg busnesau. Dyma'r syniadau y mae

that are running businesses. These are the ideas that we need to push. As the representatives of the National Endowment for Science, Technology and the Arts representative told the committee this morning, the most growth and innovation comes from the SME sector. We need to remember that and measure how much it participates in the HE sector.

5.20 p.m.

I give two cheers to the moves towards creating more postgraduate scholarships. They are a bit too connected to European programmes—not that I am against that, as we need to do that, but we need to go even further than looking at it just as an intervention that is part of European programmes. Encouraging postgraduates, particularly at Masters level and in STEM subjects—science, technology, engineering and maths—is crucial to improving the level of entrepreneurship and enterprise in our communities. There is a good response at present, because some of these graduates are probably finding it difficult to find work in the current open market. Therefore, I hope that we can go even further.

In conclusion, we need better commercialisation of intellectual property and the encouragement of patents. We need to measure the success of universities using some of these scales. A powerful point in my view—and I will conclude on this point, Deputy Presiding Officer—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I am glad of that. Thank you.

David Melding: One powerful point is that intellectual property tends to be overvalued by universities and that is what puts many businesspeople off getting involved.

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod yr amser wedi cerdded, felly byddaf yn hynod o gryno yn fy ymateb ac ni chaf gyfle i ymateb i bob pwynt sydd wedi'i godi yn y drafodaeth y prynhawn yma. Un peth sy'n dod yn eithaf

angen inni eu hybu. Fel y dywedodd cynrychiolydd y Gwaddol Cenedlaethol ar gyfer Gwyddoniaeth, Technoleg a'r Celfyddydau wrth y pwyllgor y bore yma, mae'r twf a'r arloesi mwyaf yn deillio o'r sector mentrau bach a chanolig eu maint. Mae angen inni gofio hynny, a mesur maint cyfranogiad y sector hwnnw yn y sector addysg uwch.

Rhoddaf ddwy hwrê i'r camau a gymerir tuag at greu mwy o ysgoloriaethau i uwchraddedigion. Mae gormod o gysylltiad rhyngddynt a rhaglenni Ewropeaidd—nid wyf yn erbyn hynny, oherwydd mae angen inni wneud hynny, ond y mae angen inni fynd hyd yn oed ymhellach nag ystyried yr ysgoloriaethau'n ddim byd mwy nag ymyriad sy'n rhan o raglenni Ewropeaidd. Mae annog uwchraddedigion, yn enwedig ar lefel graddau Meistr ac ym maes gwyddoniaeth, technoleg, peirianneg a mathemateg, yn hollbwysig i wella lefel entrepreneuriaeth a mentergarwch yn ein cymunedau. Ceir ymateb da ar hyn o bryd, oherwydd mae'n debyg fod rhai o'r graddedigion hyn yn ei chael yn anodd dod o hyd i waith yn y farchnad agored sydd ohoni. Felly, gobeithio y gallwn fynd hyd yn oed ymhellach.

I gloi, mae angen inni fasnacheiddio eiddo deallusol yn well, a hybu patentau. Mae angen inni fesur llwyddiant prifysgolion gan ddefnyddio rhai o'r graddfeydd hyn. Pwynt grymus yn fy marn i—a byddaf yn cloi fy araith â'r pwynt hwn, Ddirprwy Lywydd—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf yn falch clywed. Diolch.

David Melding: Pwynt grymus yw fod prifysgolion yn tueddu i roi gormod o werth ar eiddo deallusol, a dyna sy'n peri i lawer o bobl fusnes beidio ag ymwneud.

The Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport (Ieuan Wyn Jones): I am aware that time has flown, so I will be extremely concise in my response, which means that I will not have an opportunity to respond to every point raised in the discussion this afternoon. One thing

clir o'r drafodaeth, o sylwadau cychwynnol y Cadeirydd i sylwadau'r Gweinidog addysg, David Melding ac Aelodau eraill, yw bod pawb yn derbyn erbyn hyn bod yr holl faes o ymchwil a datblygu a pherthynas prifysgolion â'r byd busnes yn gwbl allweddol i ni fel cenedl os ydym i symud pethau yn eu blaenau.

Yr wyf wedi gwrando'n astud ar yr hyn a ddywedwyd, ond canolbwyntiaf ar nifer fach o themâu wrth grynhoi. Deliaf yn gyntaf â'r cwestiynau cychwynnol ynghylch pam nad yw Cymru wedi cael—hyd yma, beth bynnag—ei siâr gyflawn o arian cynghorau ymchwil, o fusnes, nac o arian Ewropeaidd y tu hwnt i'r cronfeydd strwythurol. Credaf fod pobl bellach yn derbyn yr angen i weithio gyda'n gilydd llawer yn fwy. Ni chredaf mai mater i Lywodraeth, i brifysgolion nac i fyd busnes yn unig yw hynny. Rhaid iddo fod yn bartneriaeth rhyngom i gyd.

It seems to me that there is a general agreement across all the political parties, in Government and opposition, that commercialising research and development, particularly at the development end, is a key instrument for us, not only in bringing Wales out of recession, but also in ensuring that the Welsh economy is much more resilient and sustainable going forward.

The request has been repeated often this afternoon for the Minister for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills and me to work closely together. However, I can only stress that we are already doing that. It is one of the successes of the coalition Government so far that, at a political level, there has been a very strong will to push this agenda forward jointly.

I listened to Jenny's point about whether we are spreading the money too thinly, but I can tell her that we have decided on the priority sectors. We have decided on four priority sectors, to which the majority of Government money will now be dedicated, and the universities will have to bid for that money based on those priorities. If we have not been able to look at specific areas, historically, we will now, because there is that political

that becomes quite clear from the discussion, from the Chair's opening remarks to the comments of the Minister for education, David Melding and other Members, is that everyone accepts by now that this whole area of research and development and the relationship between our universities and the world of business are vital if we as a nation are to move things forward.

I have listened carefully to what has been said, but I will focus on a small number of themes in summarising. I will deal first with the initial questions of why Wales has not had—not yet, anyway—its full share of research council funding, of business, or of European moneys other than from structural funds. I believe that people now accept the need to work together much more. I do not believe that it is a matter solely for Government, for universities or for the business world. It must involve a partnership between us all.

Ymddengys i mi fod cytundeb cyffredinol ar draws yr holl bleidiau gwleidyddol, o ran y Llywodraeth a'r wrthblaid, fod masnacheiddio gwaith ymchwil a datblygu, yn enwedig o ran yr agwedd ddatblygu, yn gam allweddol inni, nid yn unig i dynnu Cymru allan o'r dirwasgiad, ond hefyd i sicrhau bod economi Cymru'n fwy gwydn a chynaliadwy o lawer wrth symud ymlaen.

Mae'r cais i'r Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau a minnau weithio'n agos gyda'n gilydd wedi'i ailadrodd yn aml y prynhawn yma. Fodd bynnag, ni allaf ond pwysleisio ein bod eisoes yn gwneud hynny. Un o lwyddiannau'r Llywodraeth glymblaid hyd yma yw bod ewyllys amlwg iawn wedi bod, ar lefel wleidyddol, i hybu'r agenda hon ar y cyd.

Gwrandewais ar bwynt Jenny ynghylch p'un a ydym yn dosbarthu'r arian yn rhy eang, ond gallaf ddweud wrthi ein bod wedi penderfynu'r sectorau blaenoriaeth. Yr ydym wedi penderfynu ar bedwar sector blaenoriaeth y bydd y rhan fwyaf o arian y Llywodraeth yn cael ei roi iddynt yn awr, a bydd yn rhaid i'r prifysgolion wneud cais am yr arian hwnnw ar sail y blaenoriaethau hynny. Os nad ydym wedi medru edrych ar

commitment. The universities have welcomed the fact that the Government now has these priority sectors, and they are all linked to the priority sectors on which the ministerial advisory group advised me in relation to taking the economy forward. I think that we are all agreed on that. I understand the need to improve by looking for improvement in research council money, framework programme 7 money, and money from business, but the partnership working is already there. We must now ensure that we move from strength to strength.

Gareth Jones: Bron na fedraf ddweud gair ar ôl gwrandio ar eiriau gor-garedig Aelodau. Er hynny, yr wyf yn ddiolchgar amdanynt ac yn falch o'u clywed. Bu'n bleser o'r mwyaf imi gael arwain y trafodaethau a chadeirio gwaith y pwyllgor mewn maes mor allweddol bwysig. Yr oedd yn bleserus gan ein bod wedi cael sesiynau craffu effeithiol, yn fy nhyb i, a thalaf deyrnged i aelodau presennol ynghyd â chyn-aelodau'r pwyllgor, gan fod y gwaith hwn wedi bod yn mynd rhagddo ers dros ddwy flynedd. Mewn tristwch, hoffwn nodi cyfraniad y diweddar Dr Kathryn Jenkins. Dyma'r adroddiad y bu'n ymwneud cymaint ag ef ar y cychwyn.

Bu'n waith arbennig. Cydnabûm ar y cychwyn ei fod yn waith o bwys, a chydabûm hefyd, pe gellid mewnoli'r argymhellion hyn i bolisiâu'r Llywodraeth hon, fod y gallu gennym i drawsnewid economi Cymru. Dywedwyd hynny drosodd a throsodd, a dyna bwysigrwydd y neges.

I believe that I have only two minutes in which to sum up this afternoon, although I would have liked half an hour. *[Laughter.]* Having listened to the contributions of the two Ministers and the Members across the parties this afternoon, I can see that there is unanimity. We are really concerned and we need to engage in this very important issue, which will eventually bring about the transformation of the economy.

Individual Members have referred to key

feysydd penodol yn y gorffennol, byddwn yn gwneud hynny'n awr, oherwydd mae yna'r ymrwymiad gwleidyddol hwnnw. Mae'r prifysgolion wedi croesawu'r ffaith fod gan y Llywodraeth erbyn hyn sectorau blaenoriaeth, ac y mae pob un o'r sectorau'n gysylltiedig â'r rhai y cefais gyngor yn eu cylch gan grŵp cynghori'r gweinidog ar hybu'r economi. Credaf ein bod i gyd yn gytûn ar hynny. Yr wyf yn deall bod angen gwella drwy geisio sicrhau gwelliant yng nghyswllt arian cynghorau ymchwil, arian rhaglenni fframwaith 7, ac arian gan fyd busnes, ond mae'r gwaith partneriaeth eisoes yn digwydd. Rhaid inni sicrhau'n awr ein bod yn mynd o nerth i nerth.

Gareth Jones: I can barely utter a word having listened to Members' overly kind words. However, I am grateful for them and I am pleased to hear them. It was a great pleasure for me to lead the discussions and chair the work of the committee in such an essential field. It was a pleasure because we held effective scrutiny sessions, in my opinion, and I pay tribute to present members as well as former members of the committee, given that this work has been under way for more than two years. With sadness, I also wish to note the contribution of the late Dr Kathryn Jenkins. This was the report in which she was so heavily involved at the outset.

It has been exceptional work. I acknowledged at the outset that it was an important piece of work, and also, if these recommendations could be incorporated in the Government's policies, that we do have the ability to transform the Welsh economy. That was said repeatedly, which shows the importance of that message.

Credaf mai dwy funud yn unig sydd gennyf i grynhoi y prynhawn yma, er y byddwn wedi hoffi cael hanner awr. *[Chwerthin.]* Ar ôl gwrandio ar gyfraniadau'r ddau Weinidog ac Aelodau o bob plaid y prynhawn yma, gallaf weld bod yma unfrydedd barn. Yr ydym yn pryderu'n fawr, ac y mae angen inni ymwneud â'r mater pwysig iawn hwn a fydd yn y pen draw yn trawsnewid ein heconomi.

Mae Aelodau unigol wedi cyfeirio at feysydd

areas, such as entrepreneurship, engagement with businesses, and the drive for better research and collaboration, all of which are well documented. The contributions made by Members who have subscribed to this, including Sandy Mewies, who made a vital contribution to this report, will be taken on board. [*Laughter.*] I personally have been encouraged by the responses that we have had from both Ministers. I believe that we can look forward to seeing the recommendations that we have brought before the Assembly being embedded in future policy development. I obviously wish that to be the case, and I have been encouraged by listening to the responses today.

I cannot add much to that. I believe that the real thanks should go to the very astute Members whom we had serving on that committee. We have also had quite formidable people before us presenting evidence, as you would expect from the higher education sector. However, I also express my heartfelt thanks to the staff, the clerk and deputy clerk in particular, who worked so hard to enable us to present the report this afternoon and to enable me to deliver my speech earlier.

Diolch yn fawr iawn i bawb sydd wedi ymwneud â'r adroddiad hwn. Dymunaf y gorau iddo oherwydd credaf ei fod yn faes allweddol bwysig, ac yr wyf yn ffyddiog y gwelwn newid yn sgîl y gwaith pwysig a ymgwymerwyd gan y pwyllgor hwn.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The proposal is to agree the committee's report. Are there any objections? I see that there are none. In accordance with Standing Order No. 7.35, the motion is therefore agreed.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion agreed.*

allweddol, megis entrepreneuriaeth, ymgysylltu â busnesau, a'r ymgyrch i sicrhau gwell gwaith ymchwil a chydweithredu, ac y mae llawer wedi'i gofnodi am bob un. Bydd y cyfraniadau gan Aelodau sydd wedi cefnogi hynny, gan gynnwys Sandy Mewies, yr oedd ei chyfraniad i'r adroddiad hwn yn hanfodol, yn cael eu hystyried. [*Chwerthin.*] Yn bersonol, yr wyf wedi fy nghalonogi gan yr ymatebion a gawsom gan y ddau Weinidog. Credaf y gallwn edrych ymlaen at weld ymgorffori'r argymhellion a gyflwynwyd gennym gerbron y Cynulliad wrth ddatblygu polisiau yn y dyfodol. Hoffwn pe bai hynny'n digwydd, wrth gwrs, ac yr wyf wedi fy nghalonogi wrth wrando ar yr ymatebion heddiw.

Ni allaf ychwanegu llawer at hynny. Credaf y dylid cyfeirio'r diolch go iawn at yr Aelodau hynod graff ar y pwyllgor dan sylw. Yn ogystal, cawsom bobl eithaf amlwg, fel y byddech yn ei ddisgwyl gan y sector addysg uwch, i gyflwyno tystiolaeth ger ein bron. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn i hefyd fynegi fy niolch didwyll i'r staff, y clerch a'r dirprwy glerc yn enwedig, a weithiodd mor ddiwyd i'n galluogi i gyflwyno'r adroddiad y prynhawn yma, a'm galluogi innau i gyflwyno fy araith yn gynharach.

I thank everyone who has been involved with this report. I wish it all the best because I believe it is a fundamental area, and I am confident we will see a change as a result of the important work done by this committee.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Y cynnig yw ein bod yn cytuno adroddiad y pwyllgor. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Gwelaf nad oes. Yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.35, felly, caiff y cynnig ei dderbyn.

Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives Debate

Rhyddhad Ardrethi Busnes Business Rate Relief

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Carwyn Jones, and amendment 2 in the name of Peter Black. If amendment 1 is agreed, amendment 2 will be deselected.

David Melding: I move that

the National Assembly urges:

1. *the Welsh Assembly Government to raise the thresholds on the small business rate relief scheme to ensure that businesses are not penalised for the increases in rateable value that will follow after the revaluation of business properties;*

2. *the First Minister to transfer responsibility for business rates from the social justice and local government portfolio to the economy and transport portfolio, to ensure that the full economic effect of this business tax is properly evaluated.* (NDM4338)

We make no apology for returning to the subject of business rates, because it is so vital to the whole economy at this very tough time, particularly when we are constantly urged to give support to the small and medium-sized enterprise sector in particular.

5.30 p.m.

We are faced with a Welsh Assembly Government that has, at best, been lacklustre—that is its higher level of achievement in this area—or, at worse, been positively destructive in rejecting, in an obdurate way, the sensible solutions and options that other parties, ourselves in particular, have put forward.

Anyone would think that business rates were just an incidental tax, and not the most significant fiscal lever under our control. Such is the poor policy and lack of imagination of the Welsh Assembly Government. It is not as if it has to look far for models of good practice. It may not want to take on board the policy of the Welsh Conservatives—I am a generous person, and I realise that a good socialist such as Dr Gibbons may find that difficult—but he need only look at the situation in Scotland to see a

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Carwyn Jones, a gwelliant 2 yn enw Peter Black. Os derbynnir gwelliant 1, caiff gwelliant 2 ei ddad-ddethol.

David Melding: Cynigiau fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn annog:

1. *Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i godi'r trothwyon ar y cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi busnesau bach i sicrhau na chaiff busnesau eu cosbi am y cynnydd mewn gwerth trethadwy a fydd yn dilyn ailbrisio eiddo busnes;*

2. *y Prif Weinidog i drosglwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb dros ardrethi busnes o'r portffolio cyfiawnder cymdeithasol a llywodraeth leol i'r portffolio economi a thrafnidiaeth, i sicrhau bod effaith economaidd lawn y dreth fusnes hon yn cael ei gwerthuso'n briodol.* (NDM4338)

Nid ydym yn ymddiheuro o gwbl am ddod yn ôl at ardrethi busnes, oherwydd maent yn fater mor hanfodol i'r economi gyfan ar yr adeg anodd iawn hon, yn enwedig a ninnau'n cael ein hannog yn gyson i gefnogi'r sector busnesau bach a chanolig yn benodol.

Yr ydym yn wynebu Llywodraeth y Cynulliad sydd, ar y gorau, wedi bod yn ddi-fflach—dyna yw lefel uchaf ei chyrrhaeddiad yn y maes hwn—neu sydd, ar ei waethaf, wedi bod yn ddinistriol iawn trwy wrthod, mewn modd ystyfnig, yr atebion a'r dewisiadau synhwyrol y mae pleidiau eraill, yn enwedig ni, wedi'u cynnig.

Byddai unrhyw un yn tybio mai rhyw fân dreth yn unig yw ardrethi busnes, nid yr arf ariannol mwyaf dylanwadol dan ein rheolaeth. Dyna mor wael yw polisiau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a dyna mor wan yw ei dychymyg. Ni fu'n rhaid iddi edrych ymhell hyd yn oed i weld modelau arfer da. Efallai nad yw am fabwysiadu polisi'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig—yr wyf yn ddyn hael, a sylweddolaf y gallai sosialydd da fel Dr Gibbons ei chael hi'n anodd gwneud hynny—ond nid oes angen iddo ond edrych

much more imaginative model and an effective business rates relief scheme. The situation in England is hardly a picture of outstanding practice, but it is a lot better than the situation in Wales. In England, they have reacted quickly to the potential problems caused by revaluation that will come into effect, we understand, next April. They have announced that they will raise their scheme's threshold in line with the general increase in revaluation. We have heard nothing yet from the Welsh Assembly Government, despite our constant urging for clarity in this area.

I deeply regret the Welsh Assembly Government's amendment. Anyone who reads it must shudder if they are running a small business or facing a considerable revaluation of their rateable value. It is full of menace about the budgetary situation. We acknowledge that things are tight, but we have pointed out how you could generate the revenue that would be required in a more generous rate relief scheme. All you can manage is a rather weak amendment that points out existing budgetary pressures. That will not get the SME sector very far, will it? You have to improve the game. We will not support the Liberal Democrats' amendments, because the real problem that we are seeing, in the torpor from the Minister for local government, is that he does not have general economic responsibilities. That is why responsibility for business rates has to go to the Minister responsible for trying to improve the productivity of the Welsh economy. Much of that relates to the SME sector, to see it grow and to see people starting up businesses of their own.

Joyce Watson: You talk about the English scheme, but do you not agree that it would take money away from those businesses that are suffering worst during the current recession, in order to cap increases for businesses that have been most successful? Do you also agree that it would cost £2 billion in Wales, as it would take £120 million from businesses that have a decrease in order to cap those that have an increase? If that is the case, can you tell us how you are going to pay for it?

ar y sefyllfa yn yr Alban i weld model llawer mwy creadigol a chynllun rhyddhad ardrethi busnes effeithiol. Mae'r sefyllfa yn Lloegr ymhell o fod yn ddarlun o arfer rhagorol, ond mae'n llawer gwell na'r sefyllfa yng Nghymru. Yn Lloegr, maent wedi ymateb yn gyflym i'r problemau posibl a achosir gan yr ailbrisio a ddaw i rym, yn ôl a ddeallwn, fis Ebrill nesaf. Maent wedi cyhoeddi y byddant yn codi trothwy eu cynllun yn unol â'r cynnydd cyffredinol mewn ailbrisio. Nid ydym wedi clywed dim gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad hyd yn hyn, er ein bod wedi ei hannog i roi esboniad ar hyn yn gyson.

Yr wyf yn gresynu'n fawr at welliant Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Rhaid ei fod yn codi arswyd ar unrhyw un sy'n ei ddarllen ac sy'n rhedeg busnes bach neu'n wynebu codiad sylweddol yn eu gwerth trethadwy. Mae'n llawn bygythiadau am y sefyllfa gyllidebol. Yr ydym yn cydnabod bod pethau'n dynn, ond yr ydym wedi dangos sut y gallech gynhyrchu'r refeniw y byddai ei angen o gael cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi mwy hael. Y gorau y gallwch chi ei wneud yw cyflwyno gwelliant digon gwan sy'n cyfeirio at y pwysau ariannol sydd ar hyn o bryd. Ni fydd hynny'n gwneud llawer i helpu'r sector busnesau bach a chanolig, na fydd? Rhaid ichi godi'r gêm. Ni fyddwn yn cefnogi gwelliannau'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, oherwydd y broblem go iawn a welwn, yn syrthni'r Gweinidog dros lywodraeth leol, yw nad oes ganddo gyfrifoldebau economaidd cyffredinol. Dyna pam mae'n rhaid i'r cyfrifoldeb am ardrethi busnes fynd i'r Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am geisio gwella cynhyrchiant economi Cymru. Mae llawer o hynny'n ymwneud â'r sector busnesau bach a chanolig, i'w weld yn tyfu ac i weld pobl yn dechrau eu busnesau eu hunain.

Joyce Watson: Yr ydych yn sôn am y cynllun yn Lloegr, ond onid chytunwch y byddai'r cynllun hwnnw'n mynd ag arian oddi ar y busnesau hynny sy'n dioddef waethaf yn y dirwasgiad presennol, er mwyn rhoi terfyn uchaf ar godiadau i fusnesau sydd wedi bod fwyaf llwyddiannus? A ydych yn cytuno hefyd y byddai'n costio £2 biliwn yng Nghymru, gan y byddai'n mynd â £120 miliwn oddi ar fusnesau sy'n cael gostyngiad er mwyn rhoi terfyn uchaf i'r rheini sy'n cael codiad? Os felly y mae, a allwch ddweud

wrthym sut y byddwch yn talu amdano?

David Melding: I am not sure where you get the £2 billion figure, as most people think that a more generous system would cost us something in the region of £50 million. Our figures have not been challenged. I think that you need to go back to the drawing board on that particular one and get your facts right. However, you raise a point that has to be addressed. If we say that we either dampen down or have a scheme that more or less takes us away from the hit that we are going to take with revaluation, will this penalise some SMEs that are currently in the 60 per cent that the Welsh Assembly Government say will benefit? Incidentally, they will not benefit unless the thresholds to the current scheme are raised. The Welsh Assembly Government has not committed to that yet. In fact, the Government is telling us to look at the budgetary pressures.

The inference is that the Welsh Assembly Government is thinking about not raising the thresholds. In that case, you will not have 60 per cent of business potentially doing better. The point, Joyce, is this: if you adopted our scheme, 100 per cent of small businesses—not 60 per cent—with a rateable value of under £10,000 would not have to pay this burdensome taxation. That is the vision that we have. We challenge the Welsh Assembly Government to come up with an alternative at least, and not to just sit back, wring its hands and do nothing.

Look at other areas. Revaluation has been postponed in Northern Ireland. I accept that there is a legal issue, but legislation can progress quickly where there is a will. Welsh Assembly Government Ministers could talk to their English colleagues and ask whether revaluation is the best way forward at the moment, or whether Northern Ireland is right that a revaluation exercise that commenced at the start of a recession is not the wisest thing on which to base the rateable value for the next five years. We should wait until the economy settles down again so that we can assess much more accurately how various areas have been affected by the recession.

David Melding: Nid wyf yn siŵr o ble y cawsoch y ffigur o £2 biliwn, oherwydd mae'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yn credu y byddai system fwy hael yn costio oddeutu £50 miliwn inni. Nid yw ein ffigurau wedi cael eu herio. Credaf fod angen ichi ailfeddwl am y mater penodol hwnnw a chael eich ffeithiau'n gywir. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych yn codi pwynt y mae'n rhaid mynd i'r afael ag ef. Os dywedwn ein bod naill ai'n ysgafnhau'r ergyd, neu ein bod yn cael cynllun sydd fwy neu lai'n mynd i ddileu'r ergyd a gawn trwy ailbriso, a fydd hynny'n cosbi rhai busnesau bach a chanolig sydd ar hyn o bryd yn y garfan o 60 y cant y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn dweud y bydd yn elwa? Gyda llaw, ni fydd y busnesau hynny'n elwa oni bai chaiff trothwyon y cynllun presennol eu codi. Nid yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ymrwymo i wneud hynny hyd yn hyn. Mewn gwirionedd, mae'r Llywodraeth yn dweud wrthym am edrych ar y pwysau ariannol.

Yr hyn y gellir ei gasglu o hynny yw bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ystyried peidio â chodi'r trothwyon. Os digwydd hynny, ni fydd gennych 60 y cant o fusnesau o bosibl yn gwneud yn well. Y pwynt yw hyn, Joyce: pe baech yn mabwysiadu ein cynllun ni, ni fyddai'n rhaid i 100 y cant o fusnesau bach—ac nid 60 y cant—sydd â gwerth trethadwy o lai na £10,000 dalu'r trethi trwm hyn. Dyna'r weledigaeth sydd gennym. Yr ydym yn herio Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i feddwl am ddewis arall, o leiaf, yn hytrach nag eistedd yn ôl, gwasgu'i dwylo mewn anobaith a gwneud dim.

Edrychwch ar ardaloedd eraill. Mae ailbriso wedi ei ohirio yng Ngogledd Iwerddon. Yr wyf yn derbyn bod problem gyfreithiol, ond gellir symud deddfwriaeth yn ei blaen yn gyflym os oes awydd i wneud hynny. Gallai Gweinidogion Llywodraeth y Cynulliad siarad â'u cydweithwyr yn Lloegr a gofyn ai ailbriso yw'r ffordd orau i symud ymlaen ar hyn o bryd, neu a yw Gogledd Iwerddon yn iawn i ddweud nad ymarfer ailbriso a ddechreuodd ar ddechrau dirwasgiad yw'r peth callaf i seilio gwerth trethadwy arno am y pum mlynedd nesaf. Dylem aros nes bydd yr economi wedi sefydlogi unwaith eto fel y gallwn asesu'n llawer mwy cywir sut y mae'r

There has been no imaginative response whatsoever, other than to say, 'We are locked into this; there is a statute, and we are not going to change it. What can we do?'. I say to the Minister that that will not save any SMEs that are on the cusp of surviving or not surviving during the recession. Many good SMEs could go under because of the credit crunch and the other factors that are working against them. You are not prepared to use, with anything like the force necessary—let alone maximum force—the lever that is clearly under your control.

The whole exercise, both revaluation and not having a scheme that is comparable with those in Scotland or even England, is likely to make the recession much worse in Wales in respect of its effect on SMEs. It will be a barrier to future entrepreneurship. If the first thing that we say to people is, 'If you get a small business up and running, get ready for the whopping great bill that will come your way', and, 'If you are a graduate, do not move up to Scotland, where you will not get a bill; try to stay in Wales'. I am not sure how that will work; perhaps the Deputy First Minister will tell me how he will make that marketing pitch.

We have also heard that the Welsh Assembly Government intends to shift its general support for business away from the old-fashioned—if I can call it that—regional selective assistance grant structure, although it will retain some of it to try to attract inward investment. It realises that the future is in encouraging indigenous business growth, which is a shift to the SME sector. Amen; we agree with that. However, the best start that it could make is to bring in an effective business rate relief scheme. Who says that? The Deputy First Minister does—well, he said it a few years ago when he was the leader of the opposition. We only wish that he had taken that conviction, which was so correct, into Government. He said it before the recession, but now that we have a recession, somehow the SME sector can cope with the burden of business rates that he thought was such a massive incubus before.

dirwasgiad wedi effeithio ar wahanol ardaloedd. Ni chafwyd dim ymateb creadigol o gwbl, ar wahân i ddweud 'Yr ydym yn gwbl gaeth; mae yna statud, ac nid ydym am ei newid. Beth y gallwn ei wneud?'. Yr wyf yn dweud wrth y Gweinidog na fyddwn yn achub dim busnesau bach a chanolig sydd ar y ffin rhwng parhau neu fethu â pharhau drwy'r dirwasgiad. Gallai llawer o fusnesau bach a chanolig da fethu oherwydd y wasgfa greidd a'r ffactorau eraill sy'n mynd yn eu herbyn. Nid ydych yn barod i ddefnyddio, gyda dim byd tebyg i'r grym angenrheidiol—heb sôn am y grym mwyaf posibl—yr arf sy'n amlwg dan eich rheolaeth.

Mae'r holl ymarfer, yr ailbrisio a'r ffaith nad oes gennych gynllun sy'n cymharu â'r rheini yn yr Alban, neu Loegr hyd yn oed, yn debygol o wneud y dirwasgiad lawer yn waeth yng Nghymru o ran ei effaith ar fusnesau bach a chanolig. Bydd yn rhwystr i entrepreneuriaeth yn y dyfodol. Os y peth cyntaf a ddywedwn wrth bobl yw, 'Os llwyddwch i sefydlu busnes bach, byddwch yn barod am y bil enfawr a fydd ar ei ffordd ichi', ac 'Os ydych wedi graddio, peidiwch â symud i'r Alban, lle na fyddwch yn cael bil; ceisiwch aros yng Nghymru'. Nid wyf yn siŵr sut y bydd hynny'n gweithio; efallai y bydd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn gallu dweud wrthyf sut y bydd yn mynd ati i werthu hynny.

Clywsom hefyd fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn bwriadu symud ei chymorth cyffredinol i fusnesau i ffwrdd o strwythur hen ffasiwn—os gallaf ei alw'n hynny—y grant cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol, er y bydd yn cadw rhywfaint ohono i geisio denu mewnfuddsoddiad. Mae'n sylweddoli mai annog twf busnesau cynhenid fydd yn bwysig yn y dyfodol, sy'n golygu symud tuag at y sector busnesau bach a chanolig. Amen; yr ydym yn cytuno â hynny. Fodd bynnag, y ffordd orau i ddechrau arni fyddai cyflwyno cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi busnes effeithiol. Pwy sy'n dweud hynny? Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog sy'n dweud hynny—wel, dywedodd hynny ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl pan oedd yn arweinydd yr wrthblaid. Byddai'n dda gennym pe bai wedi mynd â'r gred honno, a oedd mor gywir, i mewn i'r Llywodraeth gydag ef. Dywedodd hynny cyn y dirwasgiad, ond a ninnau'n awr mewn

Again, it is an example of how the Welsh Assembly Government simply does not get it in this area of Government activity.

Finally, I will close on the subject of consultation. We have had summits with businesses, higher education and so on—all the sectors that are involved with the economy. In fairness, they have been generally well received. It does not necessarily get more effective policies in place as quickly as we need them, but some good ideas have been taken forward. We have been careful to commend what was fruitful in that exercise. However, the general consultation that the Government has with business is very weak indeed. I am told by a leading business organisation that it was not consulted on the level of the multiplier that would be set for business rates. I find it remarkable that Government makes a decision about the multiplier rate without consulting small businesses—they were only told when the decision had been made. I am told that there is no meaningful consultation at the moment on what will happen to the thresholds, nor, indeed, on whether a new scheme will be brought in. They have been urging you to bring in a scheme for some time.

5.40 p.m.

Therefore, I can only conclude that it may stimulate further and more innovative thinking if we shift responsibility for this sector away from the Minister for local government to the Minister for the economy, but the Deputy First Minister's ardour for this particular point has sadly been lacking in the last few years. However, I am an optimist; perhaps he will return with full vitality to something that he realised a few years ago was necessary for the Welsh economy.

cyfnod o ddirwasgiad, rywsut neu'i gilydd gall y sector busnesau bach a chanolig ymdopi â baich ardrethi busnes y credai eu bod yn gymaint o fwrn cyn hynny. Unwaith eto, mae'n dangos nad yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn deall y maes hwn o weithgarwch Llywodraeth o gwbl.

Yn olaf, gorffennaf trwy gyfeirio at ymgynghori. Yr ydym wedi cael uwchgynadleddau gyda busnesau, sefydliadau addysg uwch, ac yn y blaen—pob sector sy'n ymwneud â'r economi. I fod yn deg, mae'r uwchgynadleddau wedi cael croeso ar y cyfan. Nid yw'r dull hwn o weithredu o anghenraid yn sicrhau bod polisiau mwy effeithiol yn cael eu rhoi ar waith mor gyflym ag y mae eu hangen arnom, ond y mae rhai syniadau da wedi eu datblygu. Yr ydym wedi bod yn ofalus i gymeradwyo'r hyn a oedd yn dda yn yr ymarfer hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ymgynghori cyffredinol rhwng y Llywodraeth a byd busnes yn wan iawn. Dywedodd sefydliad busnes blaenllaw wrthyf nad ymgynghorwyd ag ef ar lefel y lluosydd a fyddai'n cael ei bennu ar gyfer ardrethi busnes. Yr wyf yn rhyfeddu bod y Llywodraeth yn gwneud penderfyniad am gyfradd y lluosydd heb ymgynghori â busnesau bach—ni chawsant wybod nes i'r penderfyniad gael ei wneud. Deallaf nad oes dim ymgynghori ystyrllon ar hyn o bryd ynghylch beth fydd yn digwydd i'r trothwyon, nac yn wir a fydd cynllun newydd yn cael ei gyflwyno. Maent wedi bod yn eich annog i gyflwyno cynllun newydd ers cryn amser.

Felly, ni allaf ond dod i'r casgliad y gall ysgogi rhagor o waith meddwl a gwaith meddwl mwy arloesol os symudwn y cyfrifoldeb am y sector hwn oddi wrth y Gweinidog dros lywodraeth leol ac i'r Gweinidog dros yr economi. Ond yn anffodus mae brwdfrydedd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog dros y mater penodol hwn wedi bod yn brin yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn ddyn ffyddiog; efallai y daw'n ôl yn llawn egni at rywbeth a sylweddolodd rai blynyddoedd sy'n angenrheidiol i economi Cymru.

The Minister for Social Justice and Local Government (Brian Gibbons): I move amendment 1 in the name of Carwyn Jones. Delete all and replace with:

the National Assembly for Wales notes:

1. that 60 per cent of businesses in Wales will see their rates reduce as a result of the non-domestic property revaluation;

2. that active consideration is being given by the Welsh Assembly Government to ways of assisting businesses including a possible raising of the thresholds in the small business rate relief scheme in the next financial year, 2010-11, and that consideration of such measures is taking place alongside an assessment of existing budget pressures.

Jenny Randerson: I move amendment 2 in the name of Peter Black. Delete point 2 and replace with:

Welsh Assembly Government departments to work together when setting business rates policy in order to balance the needs of local government and economic development.

I will start by stressing that the revaluation of business rates will have a dramatic effect on small businesses in Wales. I am sure that the Government would not have embarked on this if it had a choice. It would probably not have predicted the recession coming at the same time.

We do not know yet what the effects of the revaluation will be in Wales, because we have only the information that the Government has provided in a couple of press statements about the lower multiplier. We have not had the details. However, we are assured that 64,000 businesses will benefit and a further 40,000 will end up paying more.

At this stage in the economic cycle, it is not in the Government's interest to increase any taxes, especially not a tax that can have such a huge impact on the viability and profitability of small businesses, which are the backbone of the Welsh economy. The English have recognised this. The revaluation in England has taken place, just as in Wales,

Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol (Brian Gibbons): Cynigïaf welliant 1 yn enw Carwyn Jones. Dileu'r cyfan ac yn ei le rhoi:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru'n nodi:

1. y bydd 60 y cant o fusnesau Cymru'n gweld gostyngiad yn eu hardrethi o ganlyniad i ailbrisiu eiddo annomestig;

2. bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ystyried dulliau o helpu busnesau gan gynnwys, o bosibl, gynyddu'r trothwyon yn y cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi busnesau bach yn y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf, 2010-11, a'i bod yn ystyried mesurau o'r fath ochr yn ochr ag asesiad o'r pwysau ariannol ar hyn o bryd.

Jenny Randerson: Cynigïaf welliant 2 yn enw Peter Black. Dileu pwynt 2 a rhoi yn ei le:

adrannau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gydweithio wrth osod y polisi ardrethi busnes er mwyn cydbwysu anghenion llywodraeth leol a datblygu economaidd.

Dechreuaf trwy bwysleisio y bydd ailbrisiu ardrethi busnes yn cael effaith ddramatig ar fusnesau bach yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn siŵr na fyddai'r Llywodraeth wedi ymgymryd â hyn pe bai ganddi ddewis. Mae'n debyg na fyddai wedi rhagweld y byddai'r dirwasgiad yn dod ar yr un pryd.

Ni wyddom eto beth fydd effaith yr ailbrisiu yng Nghymru, oherwydd yr unig wybodaeth sydd gennym yw'r hyn y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi'i ddarparu mewn un neu ddau ddatganiad i'r wasg am y lluosydd is. Nid ydym wedi cael y manylion. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wedi cael sicrwydd y bydd 64,000 o fusnesau'n elwa ac y bydd 40,000 o fusnesau eraill yn gorfod talu mwy.

Ar yr adeg hon yn y cylch economaidd, nid yw o fudd i'r Llywodraeth gynyddu unrhyw drethi, yn enwedig treth a all gael effaith mor fawr ar hyfywedd a phroffidioldeb busnesau bach, sef asgwrn cefn economi Cymru. Mae Lloegr wedi cydnabod hynny. Mae'r ailbrisiu newydd ddigwydd yn Lloegr, yn union fel yng Nghymru, ond y mae trefniadau dros

but it is introducing transitional arrangements to take the sting out of those increases. David referred to the Scottish system; we in Wales are the last to take the initiative.

We will be voting for the motion if the Government's amendment is successful simply because it does not say anything and it is impossible to vote against it. However, it will not do anything for businesses. The urgency is great. Figures have been published this week that show that we have the second lowest rate of any region for business birth rates. That is astonishing, given the importance of small businesses to our economy.

The Welsh Assembly Government has attempted to deal with the revaluation by altering the multiplier. This will not deal with the whole problem. In order to really help small businesses, we need to use all available tools. This includes extending small business rate relief.

We welcome this motion. In fact, it looks strangely familiar to anyone who paid attention to the debate on the draft budget. The proposals that we put forward in the budget debate were costed, unlike the Conservative proposals being debated today. They even provoked Andrew Davies to compliment us on the fact that we had costed our proposals. We said where the money to extend the rate relief scheme would come from. We went as far as identifying that doubling the amount that the Welsh Assembly Government puts into business rate relief would produce a scheme that would extend the 25 per cent rate of relief up to a rateable value of £13,000.

Alun Cairns: I am grateful to Jenny Randerson for giving way, but I am a bit astonished by her statement that she feels that the Minister for local government is best placed to deal with this. Who is better placed to understand the needs of business, particularly during a recession and times of pressure related to the potential increase in costs through business rates? Would it be a Minister for Social Justice and Local Government or the Minister with

dro'n cael eu cyflwyno yno i liniaru effaith y codiadau hynny. Cyfeiriodd David at y system yn yr Alban; ni yng Nghymru yw'r olaf i weithredu.

Byddwn yn pleidleisio o blaid y cynnig os bydd gwelliant y Llywodraeth yn llwyddiannus, a hynny'n syml am nad yw'n dweud dim ac y mae'n amhosibl pleidleisio yn ei erbyn. Fodd bynnag, ni fydd yn gwneud dim i fusnesau. Mae'n fater o frys. Mae ffigurau wedi'u cyhoeddi'r wythnos hon sy'n dangos mai ni sydd â'r gyfradd isaf ond un o bob rhanbarth ar gyfer busnesau newydd sy'n cael eu sefydlu. Mae hynny'n rhyfeddol, o gofio pwysigrwydd busnesau bach i'n heconomi.

Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ceisio ymdrin â'r ailbrisiu trwy newid y lluosydd. Ni fydd hynny'n datrys y broblem gyfan. Er mwyn rhoi help go iawn i fusnesau bach, mae angen inni ddefnyddio'r holl adnoddau sydd ar gael. Mae hynny'n cynnwys ehangu'r rhyddhad ardrethi busnesau bach.

Yr ydym yn croesawu'r cynnig hwn. Yn wir, mae'n edrych yn rhyfedd o gyfarwydd i unrhyw un a oedd wedi cymryd sylw o'r ddadl ar y gyllideb ddrafft. Yr oedd y cynigion a gyflwynwyd gennym yn y ddadl ar y gyllideb wedi'u costio, yn wahanol i gynigion y Ceidwadwyr yr ydym yn dadlau yn eu cylch heddiw. Yr oeddent hyd yn oed wedi peri i Andrew Davies ein canmol am inni gostio ein cynigion. Yr oeddem wedi dweud o ble y byddai'r arian i ehangu'r cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi busnes yn dod. Aethom mor bell â nodi y byddai dyblu'r swm y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei roi yn y cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi busnes yn creu cynllun a fyddai'n ymestyn y rhyddhad o 25 y cant i werth trethadwy hyd at £13,000.

Alun Cairns: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Jenny Randerson am ildio, ond yr wyf yn rhyfeddu braidd at ei datganiad ei bod yn teimlo mai'r Gweinidog dros lywodraeth leol sydd yn y sefyllfa orau i ymdrin â hyn. Pwy sydd yn y sefyllfa orau i ddeall anghenion busnesau, yn enwedig yn ystod dirwasgiad ac adeg o bwysau'n ymwneud â'r cynnydd posibl mewn costau trwy ardrethi busnes? Ai Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol, ynteu'r Gweinidog sydd â

responsibility for economic development, which is meant to be one of the prime roles in the Cabinet?

Jenny Randerson: Alun, I think that you have entirely overlooked the key role of business rates in terms of their leverage within a local economy. I would advise you to look at different local authorities and at the impact that they have.

My final point is that the Minister for economic development told us, two months ago, that the grants culture had to change. If he is serious about this change in focus, here is an opportunity right in front of his Government to help small businesses through revaluation so that they can tough it out during the recession and so that we can grow that sector of our economy in the future.

William Graham: The Minister and Members will know that businesses such as petrol stations and public houses are rated on their turnover. Therefore, forecourt shop owners will be placed at a potentially fatal disadvantage as compared with high street convenience store retailers, because the rateable value of a petrol station is based on its relatively high turnover. Conversely, stand-alone convenience retailers, such as Tesco Express, have their rateable value calculated on their square footage. That means that the petrol station has a far higher rateable value and its owner will face steeper potential rates increases next year. There is an example of that in Torfaen: one petrol station that currently pays £60,000 faces a proposed rise to £105,000, which is an increase of 75 per cent.

The closure of businesses, notably petrol stations, village shops, post offices and public houses, continues in our rural communities. Failing to support these businesses will add to the decline of service provision, while increasing social and economic exclusion. I also emphasise, for the benefit of some Members, what David Melding has already said about our costed proposals. The scheme that we propose would cost £53 million and it is modelled on the Scottish Government's

chyfrifoldeb am ddatblygu economaidd, sydd i fod yn un o'r prif swyddi yn y Cabinet?

Jenny Randerson: Alun, credaf eich bod wedi anwybyddu'n llwyr rôl allweddol ardrethi busnes o ran eu dylanwad mewn economi leol. Byddwn yn eich cynghori i edrych ar wahanol awdurdodau lleol ac ar yr effaith a gânt.

Fy mhwynt olaf yw bod y Gweinidog dros ddatblygu economaidd wedi dweud wrthym, ddeufis yn ôl, ei bod yn rhaid i'r diwylliant grantiau newid. Os yw o ddifrif am y newid hwn mewn ffocws, dyma gyfle gwych i'w Lywodraeth helpu busnesau bach trwy'r broses ailbriso fel y gallant ddod trwy waethaf y dirwasgiad, ac er mwyn inni allu sicrhau bod y sector hwnnw yn ein heconomi yn tyfu yn y dyfodol.

William Graham: Bydd y Gweinidog ac Aelodau'n gwybod bod ardrethi busnesau megis gorsafoedd petrol a thafarnau'n cael eu cyfrifo ar sail eu trosiant. Felly, bydd perchnogion siopau mewn gorsafoedd petrol dan anfantais a allai fod yn angheuol, o'u cymharu â siopau cyfleus y stryd fawr, oherwydd bod gwerth trethadwy gorsaf betrol yn seiliedig ar ei throsiant sy'n gymharol uchel. I'r gwrthwyneb, mae gwerth trethadwy siopau cyfleus ar wahân, megis Tesco Express, yn cael ei gyfrifo ar sail maint y siop mewn troedfeddi sgwâr. Mae hynny'n golygu bod gan yr orsaf betrol werth trethadwy llawer uwch, a bydd ei pherchennog yn wynebu posibilrwydd cynnydd mwy serth yn ei ardrethi y flwyddyn nesaf. Mae enghraifft o hynny yn Nhor-faen: mae un orsaf betrol sy'n talu £60,000 ar hyn o bryd yn wynebu gweld hynny'n codi, o bosibl, i £105,000, sy'n gynydd o 75 y cant.

Mae busnesau, yn enwedig gorsafoedd petrol, siopau pentref, swyddfeydd post a thafarnau, yn parhau i gau yn ein cymunedau gwledig. Bydd methu â chynorthwyo'r busnesau hyn yn ychwanegu at ddirywiad yn y gwasanaethau a ddarperir, gan gynyddu allgáu cymdeithasol ac economaidd. Yr wyf hefyd am bwysleisio, er budd rhai Aelodau, yr hyn y mae David Melding eisoes wedi'i ddweud am ein cynigion sydd wedi'u costio. Byddai'r cynllun yr ydym yn ei gynnig yn

relief scheme. Transposing the success of the Scottish scheme to Wales means that the Welsh Conservatives' scheme would help as many as 90,000 small businesses.

Action by the Minister is necessary as business rates, because of their direct link to the rental value of the property, will continue to increase. The valuations that will come into effect in April 2010 were assessed in April 2008, when rental values were different from those that we face today. These valuations do not take into account the impact of the economic crisis. Sensible Governments are taking effective measures to assist businesses and aid their climb out of recession. Businesses will have to face an increased level of non-domestic rates throughout the five-year period that the new valuation will apply. Next year, the uniform business rate is 40.4 and for the year after it will be 41.9. This week, the challenges facing business enterprises in Wales were outlined with the publication of business demography statistics. During 2008, there were over 9,000 enterprise births in Wales. Every working day during the period assessed, there was an average of 33 enterprise deaths. Fifty three per cent of all new businesses that started up in Wales during 2003 were no longer operating by 2008.

We need to establish a culture of a business-friendly Wales. We need a Wales that opens up business opportunities, not a country where enterprise is stifled by increasing red tape. The small business non-domestic multiplier is determined by Schedule 7 to the Local Government Finance Act 1988. These rules ensure that the Government does not raise extra revenue, before inflation, as a result of revaluation. Let us look at one or two examples, very quickly, in the city of Newport. There are six firms of accountants, five of which face an increase—one an increase of 40 per cent—and there are 12 firms of solicitors, seven of which face an increase, one of 56 per cent. There are eight firms of surveyors—it is a distinguished profession—six of which face an increase, one of 44 per cent. It is difficult to find these businesses that will allegedly save so much

costio £53 miliwn, a chaiff ei fodelu ar gynllun rhyddhad Llywodraeth yr Alban. Byddai trosglwyddo llwyddiant cynllun yr Alban i Gymru'n golygu y byddai cynllun y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig yn helpu cynifer â 90,000 o fusnesau bach.

Mae angen i'r Gweinidog weithredu oherwydd bydd ardrethi busnes, oherwydd eu cysylltiad uniongyrchol â gwerth rhent yr eiddo, yn parhau i gynyddu. Cafodd y prisiadau a ddaw i rym ym mis Ebrill 2010, eu hasesu ym mis Ebrill 2008, pan oedd gwerthoedd rhent yn wahanol i'r hyn sy'n ein hwynebu heddiw. Nid yw'r prisiadau hyn yn ystyried effaith yr argyfwng economaidd. Mae Llywodraethau synhwyrrol yn cymryd camau effeithiol i gynorthwyo busnesau a'u helpu i ddringo allan o'r dirwasgiad. Bydd yn rhaid i fusnesau wynebu lefel uwch o ardrethi annomestig trwy gydol y cyfnod o bum mlynedd y bydd yr ailbrisiad newydd yn berthnasol iddo. Flwyddyn nesaf, yr ardreth fusnes unffurf fydd 40.4, a'r flwyddyn wedyn bydd yn 41.9. Yr wythnos hon, eglurwyd yr heriau sy'n wynebu busnesau yng Nghymru pan gyhoeddwyd ystadegau ar ddemograffeg busnes. Yn ystod 2008, sefydlwyd dros 9,000 o fusnesau newydd yng Nghymru. Bob diwrnod gwaith yn ystod y cyfnod a aseswyd, daeth 33 o fusnesau i ben ar gyfartaledd. Nid oedd 53 y cant o'r holl fusnesau newydd a sefydlwyd yng Nghymru yn ystod 2003 yn dal i weithredu erbyn 2008.

Mae angen inni sefydlu diwylliant o gefnogi busnesau yng Nghymru. Mae angen i Gymru fod yn wlad sy'n agor y drws i gyfleoedd busnes, nid yn wlad lle mae busnesau'n cael eu mygu gan fïwrocratiaeth. Caiff y lluosydd busnesau bach annomestig ei bennu gan Atodlen 7 Deddf Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol 1988. Mae'r rheolau hyn yn sicrhau nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn codi refeniw ychwanegol, cyn chwyddiant, o ganlyniad i ailbrisiad. Gadewch inni edrych ar un neu ddwy enghraifft, yn gyflym iawn, yn ninas Casnewydd. Mae yna chwe chwmmni cyfrifwyr, pump ohonynt yn wynebu cynnydd—ac un yn wynebu cynnydd o 40 y cant—ac y mae 12 cwmni cyfreithwyr, saith ohonynt yn wynebu cynnydd, ac un yn wynebu cynnydd o 56 y cant. Mae yno wyth cwmni syrfewyr—mae'n broffesiwn nodedig iawn—y mae chwech ohonynt yn wynebu

as a result of what is currently proposed.

cynnydd, gydag un yn wynebu cynnydd o 44 y cant. Mae'n anodd dod o hyd i'r busnesau hyn a fydd, mae'n debyg, yn arbed cymaint o ganlyniad i'r hyn sy'n cael ei gynnig ar hyn o bryd.

5.50 p.m.

We have asked the Minister time and again to publish his proposals, and we need to focus upon the reality that every business facing an increase of 20 per cent in its rateable value will face an increase in business rates over the next five years. Minister, is it not the truth, as the Assembly Government said in April 2009, that unless agreed otherwise with the UK Government, it would have to meet the cost of any unilateral action to reduce the multiplier for empty properties? Every 1 per cent reduction in the level of increase costs about £8 million in forgone revenue to the UK exchequer.

Yr ydym wedi gofyn droeon i'r Gweinidog gyhoeddi ei gynigion, ac y mae angen inni ganolbwyntio ar y realiti, sef y bydd pob busnes sy'n wynebu cynnydd o 20 y cant yn ei werth trethadwy yn wynebu cynnydd mewn ardrethi busnes dros y pum mlynedd nesaf. Weinidog, onid y gwir yw, fel y dywedodd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ym mis Ebrill 2009, oni bai y cytunir yn wahanol gyda Llywodraeth y DU, y byddai'n rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad dalu cost unrhyw weithredu unochrog i leihau'r lluosydd ar gyfer eiddo gwag? Mae pob 1 y cant o ostyngiad yn lefel y cynnydd yn costio oddeutu £8 miliwn mewn refeniw i drysorlys y DU.

Minister, we would welcome your proposals to alleviate this desperate problem for businesses in Wales as soon as possible.

Weinidog, byddem yn croesawu eich cynigion i leddfu'r broblem enbyd hon i fusnesau yng Nghymru cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl.

Joyce Watson: We must not lose sight of the fact that 60 per cent of businesses in Wales will see their rates reduced as a direct result of the actions that we have taken. However, the Minister will be aware that in places such as Pembrokeshire, Ceredigion and Gwynedd, businesses will experience some of the highest increases. I am sure that he would agree that the Government needs to look at ways of supporting those particular businesses. The Government has talked about raising thresholds in the rate relief scheme so that small businesses facing increases will still qualify for that scheme. That would help a great deal, and I therefore hope that you can clarify that today, Minister.

Joyce Watson: Rhaid inni beidio â cholli golwg ar y ffaith y bydd 60 y cant o fusnesau yng Nghymru'n gweld eu hardrethi'n gostwng o ganlyniad uniongyrchol i'r camau gweithredu yr ydym wedi'u cymryd. Fodd bynnag, bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol mai busnesau mewn lleoedd megis Sir Benfro, Ceredigion a Gwynedd fydd yn gweld rhai o'r codiadau mwyaf. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'n cytuno bod angen i'r Llywodraeth ystyried ffyrdd i gynorthwyo'r busnesau hynny'n benodol. Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi sôn am godi trothwyon y cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi fel y bydd busnesau bach sy'n wynebu cynnydd yn dal i fod yn gymwys ar gyfer y cynllun hwnnw. Byddai hynny'n helpu cryn dipyn, ac felly yr wyf yn gobeithio y gallwch wneud hynny'n glir inni heddiw, Weinidog.

I am a little confused by the Tories' position on this matter. They seem to disagree with the decision that was taken to reduce the multiplier—a decision that was welcomed by business groups, including the chair of the Federation of Small Businesses. I agree that the Assembly Government needs to help those businesses that have been adversely affected, but there is no point calling on it to follow the Northern Ireland example in delaying the revaluation exercise, when we do not have the powers to do so in Wales. That is nothing but a red herring.

David Melding *rose*—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Will you take an intervention?

Joyce Watson: No, I am going to make this point. That is nothing but a red herring, because the acquisition of those powers would take time. Also, we need to take action now, rather than use delaying tactics that will not make a difference to anyone. The Tories simply do not understand the realities of rate relief, in which case I call on them to go back and do some homework.

Alun Cairns: Will you give way?

Joyce Watson: No, why should I? I said that I am not giving way. The Tories are simply indulging in a bit of political mischief-making, which is irresponsible and deeply unfair to the businesses that need practical support.

Nick Bourne *rose*—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Are you taking an intervention?

Joyce Watson: No. Commercial properties in places such as Pembrokeshire are looking at an average increase of just over 30 per cent, and so need practical support. Therefore, will the Minister consider giving the worst-affected businesses more flexibility in scheduling rate increase payments, or look at a grants scheme directed at small businesses that face the biggest rises?

Yr wyf wedi drysu braidd ynghylch sefyllfa'r Torïaid ar y mater hwn. Ymddengys eu bod yn anghytuno â'r penderfyniad a wnaed i leihau'r lluosydd—penderfyniad a gafodd ei groesawu gan grwpiau busnes, gan gynnwys cadeirydd y Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach. Cytunaf fod angen i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad helpu'r busnesau hynny y mae hyn wedi cael effaith andwyol arnynt, ond nid oes diben galw ar y Llywodraeth i ddilyn enghraifft Gogledd Iwerddon a gohirio'r ymarfer ailbriso, pan nad oes gennym y pwerau i wneud hynny yng Nghymru. Codi sgwarnogod yn unig fyddai hynny.

David Melding *a gododd*—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: A wnewch chi dderbyn ymyriad?

Joyce Watson: Na, yr wyf am wneud y pwynt hwn. Ni fyddai hynny'n ddim ond codi sgwarnogod, oherwydd byddai cael y pwerau hynny'n cymryd amser. Yn ogystal, mae angen inni weithredu'n awr, yn hytrach na defnyddio tactegau oedi na fyddant yn gwneud gwahaniaeth i neb. Yn syml, nid yw'r Torïaid yn deall y gwir am ryddhad ardrethi, ac oherwydd hynny galwaf arnynt i fynd i wneud ychydig waith cartref.

Alun Cairns: A wnewch chi ildio?

Joyce Watson: Na, pam dylwn i? Yr wyf wedi dweud nad wyf am ildio. Yn syml, mae'r Torïaid yn cymryd pleser mewn codi helynt gwleidyddol, sy'n anghyfrifol ac yn hollol annheg i'r busnesau y mae angen cymorth ymarferol arnynt.

Nick Bourne *a gododd*—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: A ydych yn derbyn ymyriad?

Joyce Watson: Na. Mae rhai adeiladau masnachol mewn mannau megis Sir Benfro yn wynebu cynnydd o ychydig dros 30 y cant ar gyfartaledd, ac felly mae angen cymorth ymarferol arnynt. Felly, a wnaiff y Gweinidog ystyried rhoi mwy o hyblygrwydd i'r busnesau a gaiff eu taro waethaf wrth bennu'r amserlen ar gyfer talu'r cynnydd mewn ardrethi, neu ystyried cynllun grant wedi'i anelu at fusnesau bach sy'n wynebu'r

cynnydd mwyaf?

Mark Isherwood: The average property valuation for business rates will increase by almost 20 per cent next April as a result of rate revaluation. The Welsh Government claims that property revaluations take place every five years, that it does not have devolved powers to change this and that 60 per cent of rate payers will benefit. However, the Government ignores the huge number of Welsh businesses that will be left worse off when they need help most, as the business rate revaluation ignores the state of their balance sheets. We also remember the hollow promises made over council tax revaluation.

Mark Isherwood: Ar gyfartaledd bydd prisiad eiddo ar gyfer ardrethi busnes yn cynyddu bron i 20 y cant ym mis Ebrill y flwyddyn nesaf oherwydd ailbrisiu ardrethi. Mae Llywodraeth Cymru'n honni bod ymarferion ailbrisiu'n digwydd bob pum mlynedd, ac nad oes ganddi'r pwerau datganoledig i newid hynny, ac y bydd 60 y cant o'r rhai sy'n talu ardrethi yn elwa. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Llywodraeth yn anwybyddu'r nifer fawr iawn o fusnesau yng Nghymru a fydd mewn sefyllfa waeth, a hynny pan fo angen help arnynt fwyaf, gan fod yr ymarfer ailbrisiu ardrethi busnes yn anwybyddu cyflwr eu mantolen. Cofiw'n hefyd am yr addewidion gwag a wnaed ynghylch ailbrisiu'r dreth gyngor.

Almost two thirds of business premises in Wales currently receive a reduction of at least 25 per cent in their rates. However, rate relief for Scottish firms with a rateable value of up to £8,000 is 100 per cent, whereas most premises in Wales with a rateable value of up to £2,000 get just 50 per cent relief, and many business are now set to be valued out of rate relief eligibility. Many smaller businesses attract discretionary small business rate relief, which is dependent upon the rateable value of individual properties. As a result of this review, a substantial number of smaller businesses will be taken above the threshold for relief. In order to maintain the status quo, thresholds need to be increased accordingly and ideally brought in line with the higher thresholds enjoyed by smaller businesses in other parts of the United Kingdom.

Mae bron i ddwy ran o dair o'r safleoedd busnes yng Nghymru'n cael gostyngiad o 25 y cant o leiaf yn eu hardrethi ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, mae'r rhyddhad ardrethi i gwmmniau yn yr Alban sydd â gwerth trethadwy hyd at £8,000 yn 100 y cant, tra bydd y mwyafrif o safleoedd yng Nghymru sydd â gwerth trethadwy hyd at £2,000 yn cael rhyddhad o 50 y cant yn unig, ac erbyn hyn mae disgwyl i nifer o fusnesau gael eu hailbrisiu ar lefel a fydd yn golygu nad ydynt yn gymwys i gael rhyddhad ardrethi. Mae llawer o fusnesau llai yn cael rhyddhad ardrethi busnesau bach dewisol, sy'n ddibynnol ar werth trethadwy eiddo unigol. O ganlyniad i'r adolygiad hwn, bydd nifer sylweddol o fusnesau llai yn croesi'r trothwy ar gyfer cael rhyddhad. Er mwyn cadw'r sefyllfa bresennol, mae angen codi'r trothwyon yn unol â hynny, ac yn ddelfrydol dylent gyd-fynd â'r trothwyon uwch sy'n berthnasol i fusnesau llai mewn rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig.

As Mold Town Council has said, it has to be acknowledged that the last 12 months have not been the best for many traders throughout Wales. It said that a number are hanging on, looking for town centre and economic recovery, but, in the meantime, many such independent retailers are earning less than the minimum wage. If this serious issue is not addressed appropriately and sensitively, the potential impact to town centres is that a further number of independent businesses

Fel y mae Cyngor Tref yr Wyddgrug wedi ei ddweud, rhaid cydnabod bod y 12 mis diwethaf wedi bod yn ddigon anodd i lawer o fasnachwyr trwy Gymru gyfan. Dywedodd bod nifer o fasnachwyr yn brwydro am eu heinioes, gan aros am welliant yng nghanol y dref ac yn yr economi, ond yn y cyfamser mae nifer o fasnachwyr annibynnol o'r fath yn ennill llai na'r isafswm cyflog. Os na eir i'r afael â'r mater difrifol hwn mewn modd priodol a sensitif, gallai olygu bod mwy fyth

will be forced to close their doors. It is because the Welsh Conservatives are listening and because we recognise the current precarious state of too many businesses in Wales that we propose a business rate relief and exemption scheme, as described earlier by my colleagues.

Concern has also been raised with me on a related matter by a high street retailer, who, although he receives 25 per cent business rate relief now that he is trading and earning, was charged full business rates during the period between his acquisition of the premises and opening for trade, when he was receiving no income. I note that current Welsh Government policy and guidance are clear that in order to claim small business relief all business properties 'must be wholly occupied'. However, while the Welsh Government's intention to exclude small business retail premises from rate relief when a property is intentionally left empty is understood, there is an anomaly when a newly acquired property is being prepared for trade and earning nothing.

The Welsh Government must be in the business of helping business, of listening rather than dismissing, and of growing the private and independent sectors so that they can become the largest part of an enlarged Welsh economy. As Wales's leading economists have argued, it will be easier to tackle political goals, such as fighting child poverty, if the economy is growing, but, as we know, the measure used to assess the economic health of a nation has fallen to barely three quarters of the UK average. As we have heard many times, Wales now has the highest unemployment, highest child poverty, and lowest prosperity rates in the UK, and there is a widening gap between Wales's economic performance and that of the leaders in the EU.

Responding to the election yesterday of

o fusnesau annibynnol yn cael eu gorfodi i gau yng nghanol trefi. Oherwydd bod y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig yn gwrando ac oherwydd ein bod yn cydnabod y sefyllfa ansicr y mae gormod o fusnesau yng Nghymru ynddi ar hyn o bryd, yr ydym yn cynnig cynllun eithrio a rhyddhad ardrethi busnes, fel y disgrifiwyd yn gynharach gan fy nghydweithwyr.

Mae pryder ynghylch mater cysylltiedig hefyd wedi'i godi gan fanwerthwr ar y stryd fawr, sydd, ers iddo ddechrau masnachu ac ennill arian, yn cael 25 y cant o ryddhad ardrethi busnes, ond yn ystod y cyfnod rhwng cael y safle a dechrau masnachu, pan nad oedd yn ennill incwm, yr oedd yn rhaid iddo dalu ardrethi busnes llawn. Yr wyf yn nodi bod polisi ac arweiniad presennol Llywodraeth Cymru'n nodi'n glir bod yn rhaid i bob rhan o bob eiddo busnes gael eu defnyddio'n llawn, er mwyn gallu hawlio rhyddhad ardrethi busnes. Fodd bynnag, er ein bod yn deall bwriad Llywodraeth Cymru i eithrio safleoedd manwerthu ar gyfer busnesau bach o'r cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi pan gaiff eiddo ei adael yn wag yn fwriadol, ceir eithriad pan fydd eiddo sydd newydd gael ei brynu neu ei rentu'n cael ei baratoi ar gyfer masnachu, ac nid yw'n gwneud dim arian.

Mae'n rhaid i Lywodraeth Cymru geisio helpu busnesau, gwrando arnynt yn hytrach na'u diystyru, a helpu'r sectorau preifat ac annibynnol i dyfu fel eu bod yn gallu dod i gynrychioli'r gyfran fwyaf o economi Gymreig sydd wedi ehangu. Fel y mae economegwyr mwyaf blaenllaw Cymru wedi dadlau, bydd yn haws cyrraedd nodau gwleidyddol, megis mynd i'r afael â thlodi plant, os bydd yr economi'n tyfu, ond fel y gwyddom, mae'r mesur a ddefnyddir i asesu iechyd economaidd cenedl wedi cwmpo i lai na thri chwarter cyfartaledd y DU. Fel yr ydym wedi'i glywed droeon, mae gan Gymru erbyn hyn y nifer uchaf o bobl sy'n ddi-waith, y nifer uchaf o blant sy'n byw mewn tldi, a'r cyfraddau isaf o ran ffyniant yn y DU, ac mae'r bwch yn tyfu rhwng perfformiad economaidd Cymru a pherfformiad economaidd y gweledydd sy'n arwain y ffordd yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd.

Gan ymateb i'r ffaith i Carwyn Jones gael ei

Carwyn Jones as Welsh Labour leader and, next week, as the new First Minister, CBI Wales called on him

ethol yn arweinydd Llafur Cymru ddoe, ac y bydd yn cael ei ethol yn Brif Weinidog newydd yr wythnos nesaf, galwodd CBI Cymru arno

‘to fully embrace the private sector across all areas of his programme for government’,

i gynnwys y sector preifat yn llwyr ym mhob maes o’i raglen ar gyfer llywodraeth,

adding that he has a great opportunity to recast relationships with the private sector. CBI Wales believes that the new First Minister needs to reach out to the business community throughout Wales and engage with it on key issues that really matter, such as post-recession economic development strategy and business-proofing key new policies, noting that this will go a long way to restore business trust in the new Welsh Government. Let the new Welsh Government’s response to this motion, urging it to raise the threshold on small business rate relief, be the first measure of its answer to this call by CBI Cymru.

gan ychwanegu bod ganddo gyfle gwych i ailddatblygu’r berthynas â’r sector preifat. Mae CBI Cymru’n credu bod angen i’r Prif Weinidog newydd ymestyn allan i’r gymuned fusnes trwy Gymru gyfan, ac ymgysylltu â’r gymuned honno ar faterion allweddol sy’n wirioneddol bwysig, megis strategaeth datblygu economaidd ar ôl y dirwasgiad, a phrawfesur polisiau newydd allweddol o safbwynt anghenion busnesau, gan nodi y bydd hyn yn gwneud llawer i adfer ffydd busnesau yn Llywodraeth newydd Cymru. Gadewch i ymateb Llywodraeth newydd Cymru i’r cynnig hwn, sy’n ei hannog i godi’r trothwy ar gyfer rhyddhad ardrethi busnesau bach, fod yn brawf cyntaf o’i hymateb i’r alwad hon gan CBI Cymru.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. We do not have a new Welsh Government yet; we still have the existing one.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Nid oes gennym Lywodraeth newydd eto; mae’r un bresennol yn dal i fod gennym.

Kirsty Williams: I am grateful for the opportunity to briefly highlight the concerns of many businesses in my constituency, which have been truly shocked that, in the middle of a recession, they have been notified of such huge increases in their business rates. Some tell me that it is the final straw. The grotesque reality in my constituency is that the lone surviving manufacturing unit on an industrial estate, surrounded by un-let properties, will see a 61 per cent rise in the business rates for which it will be liable next year. It is truly extraordinary.

Kirsty Williams: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle i dynnu sylw’n fras at y pryderon sydd gan nifer o fusnesau yn fy etholaeth, sydd wedi cael eu synnu’n fawr iawn eu bod wedi cael eu hysbysu ynghylch cynnydd mor anferth yn eu hardrethi busnes, yng nghanol cyfnod o ddirwasgiad. Mae rhai ohonynt yn dweud wrthyf mai dyna’i diwedd hi iddynt hwy. Y gwir gwrthun am y sefyllfa yn fy etholaeth i yw y bydd yr unig uned weithgynhyrchu sydd ar ôl ar ystâd ddiwydiannol, a gaiff ei hamgylchynu gan unedau sydd heb eu gosod, yn gweld cynnydd o 61 y cant yn yr ardrethi busnes y bydd yn rhaid iddi eu talu y flwyddyn nesaf. Mae hynny’n hollol anghredadwy.

6.00 p.m.

I am concerned about the effects on the tourism and hospitality industry, which seems to have been particularly badly hit in Brecon and Radnorshire. These businesses pay a huge role in the local economy. They are often large employers offering a range of

Yr wyf yn poeni am yr effaith y bydd y sefyllfa hon yn ei chael ar y diwydiant twristiaeth a lletygarwch, sydd fel pe bai wedi cael ei daro’n arbennig o wael ym Mrycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed. Mae’r busnesau hyn yn chwarae rôl anferth yn yr economi

jobs, often on a flexible basis. They are an important part of the infrastructure for visitors to Wales, and we need to attract more visitors. They also provide local amenities; in many villages, these hotels, bed and breakfasts and pubs are the focal point of the community, and have a huge impact on the local economy. One hotel in my constituency spends over £88,000 a year with a local laundry service, and over £113,000 on local meat supplies for its restaurant. Its ability to sustain this level of expenditure, supporting local jobs and industries, will be severely hampered. At worst, the potential increases that some of these businesses face is in excess of 50 per cent. To afford to pay these increased rates, they will have to show more entrepreneurial flair than we have ever seen from the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government. One restaurant will need to increase turnover by more than £25,000 next year just to stand still, and that is no mean feat in a recession. We all know that people are staying at home rather than going out to eat because of the recession.

At best, the increases faced by these businesses will stop them investing at a time when we should be encouraging them to develop. At worst, they will cut employment or close altogether. Surely, now more than ever, we need to find a more practical response to supporting these businesses. Several times I have written to the Minister for local government to ask for his assistance, but the best he has been able to offer is a soulless letter that tells the business in question to appeal against its valuation. That is simply not the help that these businesses are looking for. They need practical assistance from this Government, not just a letter telling them to appeal. Their appeal is not to the Valuation Office Agency, Minister; it is to you. They want you and your Government to act, and act quickly.

Brynle Williams: I will focus on businesses

leol. Yn aml, maent yn gyflogwyr mawr sy'n cynnig ystod o swyddi, ac yn aml mae'r rheini'n swyddi hyblyg. Maent yn rhan bwysig o'r seilwaith ar gyfer ymwelwyr â Chymru, ac mae angen inni ddenu rhagor o ymwelwyr. Maent yn darparu amwynderau lleol hefyd; mewn nifer o bentrefi, y gwystai, y busnesau gwely a brecwast a'r tafarnau hyn yw canolbwynt y gymuned, ac maent yn cael effaith enfawr ar yr economi leol. Mae un gwesty yn fy etholaeth yn gwario dros £88,000 y flwyddyn â gwasanaeth golchi dillad lleol, a thros £113,000 ar gynnyrch cig lleol ar gyfer ei fwyty. Bydd hyn yn rhwystro mawr i'w allu i gynnal y lefel hon o wariant a chefnogi swyddi a diwydiannau lleol. Ar y gwaethaf, mae'r cynnydd posibl y bydd y busnesau hyn yn ei wynebu'n fwy na 50 y cant. Er mwyn gallu fforddio talu'r ardrethi uwch hyn, bydd yn rhaid iddynt ddangos mwy o ddawn entrepreneuriaid nag a welwyd gan y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol. Bydd angen i un bwyty gynyddu ei droiant dros £25,000 y flwyddyn nesaf er mwyn aros yn yr unfan, ac mae hynny'n bell o fod yn hawdd yng nghanol dirwasgiad. Mae pob un ohonom yn gwybod bod pobl yn aros gartref yn lle mynd allan i fwyta oherwydd y dirwasgiad.

Ar y gorau, bydd y cynnydd y mae'r busnesau hyn yn ei wynebu'n eu hatal rhag buddsoddi ar adeg pan ddylem fod yn eu hannog i ddatblygu. Ar y gwaethaf, byddant yn diswyddo gweithwyr neu'n cau'n gyfan gwbl. Siawns bod angen inni ddod o hyd i ymateb mwy ymarferol i gynorthwyo'r busnesau hyn, a bod angen inni wneud hynny'n awr yn fwy nag erioed. Yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at y Gweinidog dros lywodraeth leol droeon yn gofyn am ei gymorth, ond y cyfan y mae wedi gallu ei gynnig yw llythyr oeraidd sy'n dweud wrth y busnes dan sylw i apelio yn erbyn ei brisiad. Nid dyna'r help y mae'r busnesau hyn yn chwilio amdano. Mae angen cymorth ymarferol arnynt gan y Llywodraeth hon, nid llythyr yn dweud wrthynt am apelio. Nid apêl at Asiantaeth y Swyddfa Brisiol yw eu hapêl, Weinidog; ond apêl atoch chi. Maent am i chi a'ch Llywodraeth weithredu, a gweithredu'n gyflym.

Brynle Williams: Yr wyf am ganolbwyntio

in north Wales, but the points I will make are relevant across the principality. Whenever I meet owners of small and medium-sized companies in the region, the issue of business rates keeps cropping up. It happens at the market on Monday in Mold, and it happens throughout the week, throughout the constituency.

Many of the businesses that have survived the recession so far are understandably in a vulnerable financial situation. When the economy starts to grow again, these will be the businesses best-placed to expand their workforces. However, in the meantime, they deserve appropriate support from the Assembly Government, to ensure that they are still around when we get out of the recession. What they do not need, Minister, is a business rate revaluation in April that will see some 40,000 of them worse off. I spoke with the owner of a local garage this morning. He employs seven people. His rates are due to be hiked up nearly 50 per cent, to over £15,000. His business is a focal point of the community. Over the years, he has developed a vehicle hire business, but he is unable to hire his vehicles out because the recession is hitting his business. Yet he is even being charged rates on that; it is a double whammy.

Another issue is empty properties. Several times over the last 12 months I have asked both the First Minister and the Deputy First Minister to address this issue. Industrial estates are losing tenants at an alarming rate simply because of the business rates that are imposed upon them. It is perverse that, because of a lack of relief, the economic infrastructure in north Wales—perhaps this is not the right word, but it is the word I would use—is being demolished before our very eyes. I have spoken at length with major manufacturers in north Wales, who have found themselves—and excuse the cliché—between a rock and a hard place. There will be a need for extra capacity when we eventually get out of this recession, and businesses firmly believe that we will do so. However, businesses are being penalised by

ar fusnesau yn y gogledd, ond mae'r pwyntiau yr wyf yn eu gwneud yn berthnasol ar draws y dywysogaeth. Bob tro y byddaf yn cwrdd â pherchnogion cwmnïau bach a chanolig yn y rhanbarth, mae'r mater ynghylch ardrethi busnes yn codi ei ben o hyd. Mae'n digwydd yn y farchnad ar ddydd Llun yn yr Wyddgrug, ac mae'n digwydd trwy gydol yr wythnos, trwy'r etholaeth gyfan.

Mae nifer o'r busnesau sydd wedi goroesi'r dirwasgiad hyd yn hyn mewn sefyllfa fregus yn ariannol, a hawdd deal pam. Pan fydd yr economi'n dechrau tyfu eto, rhain yw'r busnesau a fydd yn y sefyllfa orau i ehangu eu gweithluoedd. Fodd bynnag, yn y cyfamser, maent yn haeddu cael cymorth priodol gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn dal i fod ar hyd lle pan fyddwn yn dod allan o'r dirwasgiad. Yr hyn nad oes ei angen arnynt, Weinidog, yw ymarfer ailbrisio ardrethi busnes ym mis Ebrill a fydd yn golygu y bydd tua 40,000 ohonynt mewn sefyllfa waeth. Siaradais â pherchennog garej leol y bore yma. Mae'n cyflogi saith o bobl. Mae ei ardrethi ar fin codi bron i 50 y cant, i dros £15,000. Mae ei fusnes yn ganolbwynt y gymuned. Dros y blynyddoedd, mae wedi datblygu busnes hurio cerbydau, ond nid yw'n gallu hurio'i gerbydau oherwydd effaith y dirwasgiad ar ei fusnes. Eto i gyd, mae'n gorfod talu trethi ar y busnes hwnnw; mae'n cael ei gosbi ddwywaith.

Mater arall yw eiddo gwag. Yr wyf wedi gofyn droeon yn ystod y 12 mis diwethaf i'r Prif Weinidog a'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn. Mae ystadau diwydiannol yn colli tenantiaid ar gyflymdra dychrynlyd, dim ond oherwydd yr ardrethi busnes sy'n cael eu codi arnynt. Mae'n wrthnysig bod diffyg rhyddhad yn golygu bod seilwaith economaidd y gogledd—ac efallai nad hwn yw'r gair iawn, ond dyma'r gair y byddwn yn ei ddefnyddio—yn cael ei chwalu o flaen ein llygaid. Yr wyf wedi cael trafodaethau maith â'r prif wneuthurwyr yn y gogledd, sydd erbyn hyn mewn sefyllfa anodd iawn. Bydd angen sicrhau capasiti ychwanegol pan fyddwn yn dod allan o'r dirwasgiad hwn yn y pen draw, ac mae busnesau'n credu'n gryf y byddwn yn gwneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae

having to pay rates on empty buildings. Until this scheme comes in, they are being hammered due to empty units, and it is still worrying that, under Gordon Brown's leadership, the UK is the last G7 nation in recession. This situation undermines their ability to survive and keep their skilled workforce in the meantime.

Business in north Wales needs robust support from the Welsh Assembly Government. The Welsh Conservatives have proposed a fully costed way of achieving this, which would help some 90,000 businesses; yet, the Assembly Government has dragged its feet, sending out mixed messages, while businesses in Scotland and England have received firm commitments. I urge you, Minister, to take on the points raised here by the Welsh Conservatives, and work with your colleagues to give Welsh businesses the rate relief that they need, so that they have a fighting chance of leading Wales through an economic recovery and replacing the thousands of jobs that are being lost in this recession.

David Lloyd: Yr wyf yn falch o gyfrannu i'r ddadl hon ar y cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi busnesau bach. Yn naturiol, y cefndir i hyn yw'r wasgfa ariannol fyd-eang a'r ffaith bod Cymru, yn ôl adroddiad Holtham, wedi cael ei thangyllido ers degawdau gan fformiwla Barnett. Mae Cymru yn awr yn cael ei hamddifadu o dros £400 miliwn bob blwyddyn, ac yn mynd i gael ei hamddifadu o ryw £8.5 biliwn rhwng nawr a 2020.

O ran ardrethi busnes, dadl athronyddol yw a yw'r system bresennol yn deg ai peidio. Ym Mhlaid Cymru, credwn fod y system ardrethi busnes presennol yn annheg gan ei bod wedi'i seilio ar werth yr adeilad, ac nid ar elw'r busnes. Mae Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un wedi gweithredu i gefnogi busnesau bach drwy greu'r cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi busnesau bach yn y lle cyntaf, a thrwy leihau'r lluosydd a ddefnyddir i gyfrifo'r ardrethi ar ôl yr ailbrisio. Bydd ardrethi yn lleihau ar gyfer busnesau sydd wedi cynyddu mewn gwerth hyd at 19.6 y cant. Yn wir, mae 60 y cant o fusnesau Cymru'n gweld gostyngiad yn eu hardrethi, o ganlyniad i

busnesau'n cael eu cosbi trwy orfod talu ardrethi ar adeiladau gwag. Nes y gweithredir y cynllun hwn, maent yn talu'n ddrud am unedau gwag, ac mae'n dal i beri pryder mai'r DU, dan arweinyddiaeth Gordon Brown, yw'r genedl olaf yn y G7 i ddod trwy'r dirwasgiad. Mae'r sefyllfa hon yn tanseilio gallu'r busnesau i oroesi a chadw eu gweithlu medrus yn y cyfamser.

Mae angen i fusnesau yn y gogledd gael cymorth cadarn gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig wedi cynnig dull o gyflawni hyn sydd wedi cael ei gostio'n llawn, a fyddai'n helpu rhyw 90,000 o fusnesau; ac eto, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi llusgo ei thraed, gan gyfleu negeseuon cymysg, tra mae busnesau yn yr Alban a Lloegr wedi cael ymrwymadau pendant. Yr wyf yn eich annog, Weinidog, i ystyried y pwyntiau a godwyd yma gan y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig, a gweithio gyda'ch cydweithwyr i roi'r rhyddhad ardrethi busnes y mae ei angen ar fusnesau Cymru, er mwyn iddynt gael cyfle teg i arwain Cymru trwy adferiad economaidd a chreu swyddi newydd i gymryd lle'r miloedd o swyddi sy'n cael eu colli yn ystod y dirwasgiad hwn.

David Lloyd: I am pleased to contribute to this debate on the small business rate relief scheme. Naturally, the background to this is the global credit crunch and the fact that Wales, according to the Holtham commission, has been underfunded for decades by the Barnett formula. Wales is now being deprived of over £400 million every year, and will be deprived of some £8.5 billion between now and 2020.

On business rates, whether the current system is fair is a philosophical debate. We in Plaid Cymru believe that the current business rate system is unfair as it is based on the value of the building, not on the profit of the business. The One Wales Government has taken action to support small businesses by creating the small business rate relief scheme initially, and by reducing the multiplier used to calculate rates following revaluation. Rates will reduce for businesses that have increased in value up to 19.6 per cent. Indeed, 60 per cent of Welsh businesses have seen a reduction in their rates as a result of the revaluation of non-domestic property, and

ailbrisiu eiddo annomestig, a golyga hynny y bydd 64,000 o fusnesau yn talu llai o ardrethi. Felly, mae'n annerbyniol codi bwganod yn hyn o beth. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn ystyried y trothwy ar gyfer y cynllun rhyddhad yn sgîl y newidiadau i werth eiddo.

This debate represents the latest in the series of spending pledges by the Welsh Conservatives. We have heard the Tory pledges before—not just the £53 million pledged today, but also the pledge of £1 billion for the M4 relief road. They also pledged more money for local government, £20 million to regenerate Barry, and more funding for hospitals, the ambulance service and schools.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Will you take an intervention?

David Lloyd: No; I have listened carefully to you lot. It is now time for you to listen.

They have numerous other pledges, such as restoring Victorian buildings in Cardiff. Where is the money coming from? When will the Tories commit to doing what Peter Hain has failed to do and introduce a fair funding formula for Wales, and halt their cuts programme until that fair funding formula is in place? Until they do that, everyone will see through the Tory tactics of making uncoded spending plans in Wales, while their masters in London intend to cut the Welsh budget. At best, this is shallow political opportunism of the worst kind. At worst, at Santa time, this is total fantasy politics, and shows how unfit for Government the Conservatives really are. Thank you for your patience, Deputy Presiding Officer.

Angela Burns: This should have been an interesting debate. I will take issue with a few things that Dai Lloyd said.

6.10 p.m.

I am not going to go and tell the traders in Narberth or Tenby that this is all about

that means that 64,000 businesses will pay reduced rates. Scaremongering is, therefore, unacceptable in that respect. The Government is considering the threshold for the relief scheme in light of the changes to the value of property.

Y ddadl hon yw'r ddiweddaraf yn y gyfres o addewidion ynghylch gwariant a wnaed gan y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig. Yr ydym wedi clywed addewidion y Torïaid o'r blaen—nid dim ond y £53 miliwn a gafodd ei addo heddiw, ond yr addewid o £1 biliwn ar gyfer ffordd liniaru'r M4 yn ogystal. Maent wedi addo mwy o arian i lywodraeth leol, £20 miliwn i adfywio'r Barri, a rhagor o arian i ysbytai, y gwasanaeth ambiwlans ac ysgolion.

Andrew R.T. Davies: A wnewch chi dderbyn ymyriad?

David Lloyd: Na; yr wyf wedi gwranddo'n astud arnoch chi i gyd. Mae'n bryd i chi wrando yn awr.

Maent wedi gwneud nifer o addewidion eraill, megis adnewyddu adeiladau Fictoraidd yng Nghaerdydd. O ble daw'r arian i wneud hynny? Pryd bydd y Torïaid yn ymrwmo i wneud yr hyn y mae Peter Hain wedi methu â'i wneud, a chyflwyno fformiwla ariannu deg i Gymru, a rhoi terfyn ar eu rhaglen o doriadau nes bydd y fformiwla ariannu deg honno ar waith? Nes byddant wedi gwneud hynny, bydd pawb yn gallu gweld trwy dactegau'r Torïaid o lunio cynlluniau gwariant heb eu costio yng Nghymru, tra mae eu meistri yn Llundain yn bwriadu torri cyllideb Cymru. Ar y gorau, dyma'r math gwaethaf o achub cyfle gwleidyddol mewn modd arwynebol. Ar y gwaethaf, a ninnau'n sôn am Sion Corn, dyma wleidyddiaeth byd ffantasi llwyr, ac mae'n dangos mor anaddas yw'r Ceidwadwyr i lywodraethu mewn gwirionedd. Diolch am eich amynedd, Ddirprwy Lywydd.

Angela Burns: Dylai hon fod wedi bod yn ddadl ddiddorol. Yr wyf am anghytuno â rhai o'r pethau a ddywedodd Dai Lloyd.

Nid wyf am fynd a dweud wrth y masnachwyr yn Arberth neu Ddinbych-y-

shallowness when they have been faced with rate rises not of 30 per cent, but 300 per cent. I will quickly thank the Minister for singing on this issue. He knows that it is a fact. It is a rise of 300 per cent. So, I do not think that it is at all shallow to raise the concerns of constituents here.

The second point that I would like to make is that, were we to listen to Dai and to Plaid Cymru, we would believe that everything is the fault of the Barnett formula. That is just nonsense. Let us talk about costings. In March, the Welsh Conservatives proposed to sell a proportion of the existing holdings in the Welsh Development Agency estate. Selling only 20 per cent would have raised £54.2 million. That figure includes a reduction of 15 per cent from the original value for depreciation and any other bits and pieces. Through not having to maintain those properties, we would save £5.5 million. If we cut some of the £19.5 million that the Welsh Assembly Government spent on external consultants, we would save another couple of million pounds. To people in Narberth and Tenby who are going to close their shops after Christmas—their last little bit of fat before their very lean winter—that is a heck of a lot of money. Therefore, do not talk to me about costings—this information was issued in March; try reading some of the other press.

Joyce Watson: *rose—*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I do not think that she will take an intervention, Joyce.

Angela Burns: No, I will not take an intervention, Joyce. It is courteous and good practice to take interventions—I have been told that by people on a number of occasions and I normally accept interventions. However, you were persistently asked to take an intervention but you would not. It is tough. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘Oh.’]

Until this happened, I did not know the ins and outs of a business rate valuation. If you

pysgod bod hyn oll yn ymwneud â bod yn arwynebol, a hwythau'n wynebu cynnydd yn eu hardrethi, nad yw'n 30 y cant, ond yn 300 y cant. Diolch i'r Gweinidog yn gyflym am ddatgelu'r gwir am y mater hwn. Mae'n gwybod bod hynny'n ffaith. Mae'n gynnydd o 300 y cant. Felly, ni chredaf ei bod yn arwynebol o gwbl i sôn am bryderon yr etholwyr yn y fan hon.

Yr ail bwynt yr hoffwn ei wneud yw pe baem yn gwranddo ar Dai a Phlaid Cymru, byddem yn credu mai fformiwla Barnett sydd ar fai am bopeth. Dwli llwyr yw hynny. Gadewch inni siarad am gostio. Ym mis Mawrth, cynigodd y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig werthu cyfran o'r daliadau presennol yn ystad Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru. Byddai gwerthu 20 y cant ohonynt yn unig wedi codi £54.2 miliwn. Mae'r ffigur hwnnw'n cynnwys gostyngiad o 15 y cant yn y gwerth gwreiddiol ar gyfer dibrisiant, ac unrhyw fân bethau eraill. Byddem yn arbed £5.5 miliwn o beidio â gorfod cynnal a chadw'r eiddo hwnnw. Pe baem yn torri ychydig o'r £19.5 miliwn a wariwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ar ymgynghorwyr allanol, byddem yn arbed rhai miliynau o bunnoedd yn ychwanegol. I bobl yn Arberth a Dinbych-y-pysgod sy'n mynd i gau eu siopau ar ôl y Nadolig—eu tamaid bach olaf o gynhaliaeth cyn gaeaf o gynt—mae hynny'n swm sylweddol iawn o arian. Felly, peidiwch â sôn wrthyf am gostio—cyhoeddwyd y wybodaeth hon ym mis Mawrth; ceisiwch ddarllen peth o'r sylw sydd wedi'i roi i'r mater mewn manau eraill.

Joyce Watson: *a gododd—*

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Nid wyf yn credu y bydd yn derbyn ymyriad, Joyce.

Angela Burns: Na, ni fyddaf yn derbyn ymyriad, Joyce. Mae'n gwrtais ac yn arfer da cymryd ymyriadau—yr wyf wedi cael gwybod hynny gan bobl droeon, ac fel arfer byddaf yn derbyn ymyriadau. Fodd bynnag, gofynnwyd ichi gymryd ymyriad droeon ond nid oeddech yn fodlon gwneud hynny. Dyna fel mae. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.']

Nes i hyn ddigwydd, nid oeddwn yn gwybod popeth am brisiadau ardrethi busnes. Os

are in the self-catering industry, or run hotels or pubs, then you are valued on your rent value, on the receipts that you take and on a number of other factors. If you simply have a shop that sells toys or bits of material, then you are judged only on the rate of your shop—the rent of your shop. There is nothing else. Therefore, a shop could have a low turnover because it sells something quite specialised—it is not a newsagent that someone visits every single day—and the rent will be the same as the shop next door because what it sells has no bearing on the rate.

When you look at it in detail, it makes you think that we should ask for the rates to be moved into the care of the Department for the Economy and Transport. We should also go back to HM Revenue and Customs and talk about how we set business rates. I have had this discussion with the Minister, and I think that it would be fair to report that the Minister told me that it was a property tax. However, if that is the case, why bother to look at receipts or at the turnover of the business? That is not what they do with a standard shop. Therefore, we should move it to the Department for the Economy and Transport, go back to the UK Government and look at how we value all of our businesses for business rates. The way that it is being done at the moment takes no account whatsoever of a temporary blip.

Gareth Jones: I am a bit bewildered. Are you saying that the original Conservative thinking on this—and you introduced this tax—was hopelessly wrong and out of order?

Angela Burns: We did not introduce business rates. [*Interruption.*] Council tax is different to business rates.

If you have a town or village with a high number of owner-occupied shops where the rent value will always be entirely different to the cost of renting out a property, then there is no other measure for the Valuation Office Agency to go into that town—like Narberth, which has a high percentage of owner-occupiers—and put a fair rateable value on that town.

ydych yn y diwydiant hunanarlwyo, neu os ydych yn rhedeg gwestai neu dafarnau, caiff eich prisiad ei gyfrifo ar sail gwerth rhent eich eiddo, ar yr arian yr ydych yn ei gymryd ac ar nifer o ffactorau eraill. Os oes gennych siop sy'n gwerthu teganau neu ddarnau o ddefnydd, bydd yn cael ei bennu ar sail eich siop yn unig—gwerth rhent eich siop. Nid ystyrir dim byd arall. Felly, gallai fod gan siop drosiant eithaf isel oherwydd ei bod yn gwerthu rhywbeth eithaf arbenigol—nid siop bapur newydd y bydd rhywun yn ymweld â hi bob dydd—a bydd y rhent yr un fath â'r siop drws nesaf oherwydd ni chaiff yr hyn y mae'n ei werthu ddim effaith ar yr ardrethi.

Pan edrychwch arno'n fanwl, mae'n gwneud ichi feddwl y dylem ofyn i ardrethi gael eu symud i ofal Adran yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth. Dylem hefyd fynd yn ôl at Gyllid a Thollau Ei Mawrhydi a thrafod sut y caiff ardrethi busnes eu pennu. Yr wyf wedi cael y drafodaeth hon gyda'r Gweinidog, ac yr wyf yn credu y byddai'n deg dweud bod y Gweinidog wedi dweud wrthyf mai treth eiddo ydoedd. Fodd bynnag, os yw hynny'n wir, pam ffwdanu edrych ar dderbynebaw neu drosiant y busnes? Nid dyna sy'n digwydd yn achos siop gyffredin. Felly, dylem ei symud i bortffolio Adran yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth, a mynd yn ôl at Lywodraeth y DU ac edrych ar y modd yr ydym yn prasio ein holl fusnesau ar gyfer ardrethi busnes. Nid yw'r modd y caiff ei wneud ar hyn o bryd yn ystyried dim anhawster dros dro.

Gareth Jones: Yr wyf wedi drysu braidd. A ydych yn dweud bod y syniad gwreiddiol gan y Ceidwadwyr am hyn—a chi a gyflwynodd y dreth hon—yn hollol anghywir ac annerbyniol?

Angela Burns: Nid ni a gyflwynodd ardrethi busnes. [*Torri ar draws.*] Mae'r dreth gyngor yn wahanol i ardrethi busnes.

Os oes gennych dref neu bentref lle mae llawer o siopau sy'n cael eu rhedeg gan berchen-feddianwyr, lle bydd y gwerth rhent bob amser yn hollol wahanol i'r gost o osod eiddo ar rent, nid oes dim mesur arall y gall Asiantaeth y Swyddfa Brisió ei ddefnyddio yn y dref honno—megis Arberth, sydd â chanran uchel o berchen-feddianwyr—a rhoi gwerth trethadwy teg ar y dref honno.

If we were to transfer responsibility to the Department for the Economy and Transport, and we looked at the receipts of a shop, at its profit and loss, and at its balance sheet we could come up with a far better, safer and fairer way of taxing people. Therefore, I would argue strongly that the responsibility should move from this Minister to the Minister on the opposite bench.

The Minister for Social Justice and Local Government (Brian Gibbons): This valuation will not increase overall tax on businesses in Wales despite a number of assertions to the contrary. It will simply redistribute the bills according to the new valuation. In terms of a property tax, this must be right in principle because rate bills should be higher for those who have more valuable properties, compared with less valuable properties. The revaluation exercise has to be intrinsic to the fairness of any property system because failure to have a revaluation will otherwise mean that businesses that have less valuable properties will be bearing a disproportionate share of the rating income. Therefore, revaluation must be intrinsic to the fairness process.

Businesses in areas or sectors that have performed relatively poorly since the last revaluation will see the rates drop and, as a result, this will produce a reduction in their rates bill. This is obviously good economic sense, while those who have seen a relatively better economic performance will see their bills increase.

During this revaluation, over 60 per cent of businesses will pay less as we have provisionally reduced the multiplier from 0.489 to 0.409. Our intention to do this has been in the public domain since mid October, and we have had fairly positive feedback from more or less all quarters due to the introduction of the reduction of the multiplier. Equally, we have had meetings with the Federation of Small Businesses and the Welsh Tourism Alliance to clarify priorities. While they did share some concerns, I did not feel or hear from them the

Pe baem yn trosglwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb i Adran yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth, a phe baem yn edrych ar dderbynebaw siop, ar yr elw a'r golled y mae'n eu gwneud ac ar ei mantolen, gallem ddod o hyd i ffordd lawer gwell, tecach a mwy diogel i drethu pobl. Felly, byddem yn dadlau'n gryf y dylai'r cyfrifoldeb symud wrth ar Gweinidog hwn ac i'r Gweinidog ar y fainc gyferbyn.

Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol (Brian Gibbons): Ni fydd y prisiad hwn yn cynyddu'r dreth gyffredinol ar fusnesau yng Nghymru, er gwaethaf nifer o honiadau i'r gwrthwyneb. Y cyfan y bydd yn ei wneud fydd ailddosbarthu'r biliau yn ôl y prisiad newydd. O ran treth eiddo, rhaid bod y dreth hon yn iawn mewn egwyddor, oherwydd dylai biliau ardrethi fod yn uwch i'r sawl sydd ag eiddo mwy gwerthfawr, o'u cymharu â'r sawl sydd ag eiddo llai gwerthfawr. Rhaid i'r ymarfer ailbriso fod yn rhan gynhenid o sicrhau bod unrhyw system eiddo yn deg, oherwydd fel arall bydd methu ag ailbriso yn golygu y bydd busnesau sydd ag eiddo llai gwerthfawr yn talu cyfran anghyfartal o'r incwm ardrethi. Felly, rhaid i'r ymarfer ailbriso fod yn rhan hanfodol o'r broses o sicrhau tegwch.

Bydd busnesau mewn ardaloedd neu sectorau sydd wedi perfformio'n gymharol wael ers yr ymarfer ailbriso diwethaf yn gweld yr ardrethi'n disgyn, ac o ganlyniad bydd eu bil ardrethi'n gostwng. Mae hynny'n gwneud synnwyr yn economaidd wrth gwrs, a bydd y sawl sydd wedi perfformio ychydig yn well yn economaidd yn gweld eu biliau'n cynyddu.

Yn ystod yr ymarfer ailbriso hwn, bydd dros 60 y cant o fusnesau'n talu llai, gan ein bod wedi lleihau'r lluosydd o 0.489 i 0.409 dros dro. Mae ein bwriad i wneud hyn wedi bod yn wybodaeth gyhoeddus ers canol mis Hydref, ac yr ydym wedi cael adborth eithaf cadarnhaol o bob cyfeiriad bron oherwydd cyflwyno'r gostyngiad yn y lluosydd. Yn ogystal, yr ydym wedi cael cyfarfodydd gyda'r Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach a Chynghrair Twristiaeth Cymru i egluro'r blaenoriaethau. Er eu bod hwy hefyd pryderu ryw ychydig, ni themlais ac ni chlywais

apocalyptic stories that we have heard from the opposition benches today.

The Assembly Government's enhanced rates relief scheme for small businesses in the last year has provided £20 million. This was part of a 'One Wales' commitment and it was agreed with the Deputy First Minister, who is responsible for the economy and for making all of these decisions in relation to business rates. We are conscious of the implications for business and we take these into account when making our decisions in this regard.

Over 45,000 businesses in Wales are currently benefiting from the Assembly Government's small business rates relief scheme, and around 20,000 receive other types of relief for unoccupied property, as Brynle mentioned. This means that almost two thirds of business premises in Wales are currently receiving a reduction of at least 25 per cent in their rates. Even before we revise the thresholds of the rates relief scheme next year, following the revaluation, we estimate that over half of business in Wales will be paying less than £166 per month in business rates.

To deal with Kirsty's point in relation to the hospitality industry, particularly the self-catering industry, three quarters of those businesses have rateable valuations of less than £2,000, and 97 per cent have rateable values of less than £6,000. All of these businesses will continue to benefit from our rates relief scheme. Equally, over 60 per cent of small retailers will be better off as a consequence of this revaluation, and a further third will continue to receive rate relief as a consequence of our small business relief programme if we increase the thresholds.

The motion also calls for transferring responsibility from the local government department to the economy department, and in the context of this debate the assumption must be that it would see this as an opportunity to reduce the contribution that businesses make to local government finance. However, if the rates that businesses

anddynt y straeon apocalyptaidd yr ydym wedi'u clywed gan feinciau'r wrthblaid heddiw.

Yn y flwyddyn ddiwethaf mae cynllun gwell Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer rhyddhad ardrethi busnesau bach wedi darparu £20 miliwn. Yr oedd hwn yn rhan o ymrwymiad 'Cymru'n Un', a chytunwyd gyda'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog, sy'n gyfrifol am yr economi ac am wneud yr holl benderfyniadau hyn ar ardrethi busnes. Yr ydym yn ymwybodol o'r goblygiadau i fusnesau, a byddwn yn ystyried y rhain wrth wneud ein penderfyniadau yn y cyswllt hwn.

Ar hyn o bryd, mae dros 45,000 o fusnesau yng Nghymru'n elwa o gynllun rhyddhad ardrethi busnesau bach Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ac y mae oddeutu 20,000 yn cael mathau eraill o ryddhad ar gyfer eiddo gwag, fel y soniodd Brynle. Mae hynny'n golygu bod bron i ddwy ran o dair o'r eiddo busnes yng Nghymru'n cael gostyngiad o 25 y cant o leiaf ar eu hardrethi. Hyd yn oed cyn inni adolygu trothwyon y cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf, yn dilyn yr ymarfer ailbriso, yr ydym yn amcangyfrif y bydd dros hanner y busnesau yng Nghymru'n talu llai na £166 y mis mewn ardrethi busnes.

Mewn ymateb i bwynt Kirsty am y diwydiant lletygarwch, yn enwedig y diwydiant hunanarlwyo, mae gan dri chwarter y busnesau hynny werth trethadwy llai na £2,000, ac mae gan 97 y cant ohonynt werth trethadwy llai na £6,000. Bydd yr holl fusnesau hyn yn parhau i elwa o'n cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi. Yn ogystal, bydd dros 60 y cant o fanwerthwyr bach mewn sefyllfa well o ganlyniad i'r ymarfer ailbriso hwn, a bydd traean arall yn parhau i gael rhyddhad ardrethi o ganlyniad i'n rhaglen rhyddhad ardrethi busnesau bach os byddwn yn codi'r trothwyon.

Mae'r cynnig yn galw hefyd am drosglwyddo cyfrifoldeb o'r adran llywodraeth leol i adran yr economi, ac yng nghyd-destun y ddadl hon rhaid tybio y byddai hyn yn cael ei ystyried yn gyfle i leihau'r cyfraniad y mae busnesau'n ei wneud i'r arian sydd ar gael i lywodraeth leol. Fodd bynnag, os bydd busnesau'n cyfrannu llai o ardrethi i

contribute to local government are reduced, the individual council tax payer will have to step in to fill the funding gap if there are no business rates and if the Assembly Government is not in a position to increase the revenue support grant.

6.20 p.m.

We have had many debates in the Assembly in this context, with the Conservatives claiming that personal council tax is too high, despite the fact that we have had the lowest level of council tax increases over recent years. However, in this debate, they are bringing forward proposals that will put further burdens on the individual council tax payer.

It is clear that the Tories do not understand, or do not want to understand, the powers of the Assembly in relation to the revaluation exercise, because, as has been pointed out, the Assembly does not have the powers to do so. They are calling on us to scrap the small business rates scheme in favour of their scheme, with a valuation of roughly £50 million to £60 million. However, our estimate is that their scheme, and the scheme in Scotland, is closer to £100 million. Therefore, the Conservatives' sums in this programme are seriously wrong. Last week, Nick Bourne called for a transition scheme based on the English model, which Joyce Watson has already made reference to. Implementing the English scheme in Wales would result in some £120 million being transferred from businesses who are struggling in Wales to the more successful businesses. This is hardly a recipe for protecting or promoting jobs, particularly in our most economically hard-pressed sectors.

Despite all the rhetoric and the bombast, the Conservatives have no realistic alternative or solution. When they call for many tens of millions of pounds to be spent on business rates relief globally and in an indiscriminate way, they refuse to acknowledge the massive dead weight of poorly targeted funding for all businesses, regardless of their needs. They also refuse to acknowledge the lost opportunity costs for those businesses that

lywodraeth leol, bydd yn rhaid i'r rheini sy'n talu'r dreth gyngor gamu i mewn i lenwi'r bwlc yn y cyllid os na cheir ardrethi busnes, ac os na fydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad mewn sefyllfa i gynyddu'r grant cynnal refeniw.

Yr ydym wedi cael llawer dadl yn y Cynulliad ar y mater hwn, lle mae'r Ceidwadwyr wedi honni bod y dreth gyngor i unigolion yn rhy uchel, er gwaethaf y ffaith ein bod wedi cael y codiadau isaf yn y dreth gyngor dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, yn y ddadl hon maent yn cyflwyno cynigion a fydd yn rhoi mwy o faich ar yr unigolion sy'n talu'r dreth gyngor.

Mae'n amlwg nad yw'r Torïaid yn deall neu am ddeall y pwerau sydd gan y Cynulliad o ran yr ymarfer ailbriso, oherwydd, fel y dywedwyd eisoes, nid oes gan y Cynulliad y pwerau i wneud hynny. Maent yn galw arnom ddileu'r cynllun ardrethi busnesau bach, a mabwysiadu eu cynllun hwy, a fydd yn costio oddeutu £50 miliwn i £60 miliwn. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn amcangyfrif bod eu cynllun hwy, a'r cynllun yn yr Alban, yn nes at £100 miliwn. Felly, mae camgymeriadau mawr yng nghyfrifiadau'r Ceidwadwyr yn y rhaglen hon. Yr wythnos diwethaf, galwodd Nick Bourne am gynllun pontio'n seiliedig ar y model yn Lloegr y mae Joyce Watson wedi cyfeirio ato eisoes. Byddai gweithredu yng Nghymru y cynllun sydd yn Lloegr golygu y byddai oddeutu £120 miliwn yn cael ei drosglwyddo o fusnesau sy'n ei chael hi'n anodd ymdopi yng Nghymru i fusnesau mwy llwyddiannus. Go brin mai dyna'r ffordd ddelfrydol i warchod neu hybu swyddi, yn enwedig yn y sectorau sy'n ei chael hi'n fwyaf anodd yn economaidd.

Er yr holl rethreg a'r ymffrost, nid oes gan y Ceidwadwyr ddim cynnig neu ateb arall realistig. Wrth alw am wario degau lawer o filoedd o bunnoedd ar ryddhad ardrethi busnes yn gyffredinol ac yn ddiwahân, maent yn gwrthod cydnabod mor ddiwerth yw arian nad yw'n cael ei dargedu'n iawn ac sy'n cael ei roi i bob busnes, waeth beth fo'u hanghenion. Maent hefyd yn gwrthod cydnabod costau cyfleoedd a gollwyd i'r

genuinely need help, as a result of the waste of their dead-weight policies.

As an Assembly Government, we are committed to looking at what we can do to ease the transition for those businesses that face a significant increase in business rates. We will be increasing the thresholds of our small business rates relief scheme to ensure that businesses will not be disadvantaged by the change in their valuation. As I have already indicated, the multiplier will be reduced in line with the increase in valuation. We will also be looking at further measures that we, as an Assembly Government, can take, bearing in mind other funding and budgetary pressures that we face. We must act responsibly to ensure that whatever money we have is targeted at those business that most need it, which is also likely to contribute to making a real difference to the overall wellbeing of our economy.

Nick Bourne: I will first deal with what this debate is not about because there seems to be some confusion, although I do not know why as it is clear on the agenda. The debate is not about the revaluation exercise itself, which the Minister spent much of his time dealing with, and it is less about the multiplier, which Joyce Watson seems totally confused about, and it is not about transitional relief, which the Minister, once again, got terribly tied up with. I do not see those words on the agenda at all. Neither is it about the Barnett formula, but we were treated to Dai Lloyd dusting down his greatest hit, which is his speech on the Barnett formula. That is, sadly, his only hit, and it was delivered in a Westminster-style knock-about, which I am sure that Helen Mary Jones, if she was watching on the small screen, will deal with later. That will probably be punishment enough, therefore I will not go further on that. Let us see what this debate is about.

David Lloyd: Bring it on. [*Laughter.*]

Nick Bourne: I hope that she heard that, Dai.

busnesau hynny y mae gwir angen help arnynt, oherwydd y gwastraff yn eu polisiau diwerth.

Fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yr ydym yn ymrwymo i ystyried beth y gallwn ei wneud i leddfu'r broses bontio i'r busnesau hynny sy'n wynebu cynnydd sylweddol mewn ardrethi busnes. Byddwn yn codi trothwyon ein cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi busnesau bach er mwyn sicrhau na fydd busnesau dan anfantais oherwydd y newid yn eu prisiad. Fel yr wyf wedi'i nodi eisoes, caiff y lluosydd ei leihau yn unol â'r cynnydd yn y prisiad. Byddwn hefyd yn ystyried camau eraill y gallwn ni, fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, eu cymryd, o gofio'r pwysau ariannol a'r pwysau cyllidebol eraill sy'n ein hwynebu. Rhaid inni weithredu'n gyfrifol i sicrhau bod unrhyw arian sydd gennym yn cael ei dargedu at y busnesau hynny y mae ei angen arnynt fwyaf, sydd hefyd yn debygol o gyfrannu at wneud gwahaniaeth mawr i les cyffredinol ein heconomi.

Nick Bourne: Yr wyf am ymdrin yn gyntaf â'r hyn nad yw'r ddadl hon yn ymwneud ag ef oherwydd ymddengys bod ychydig ddryswch, er na wn i pam, oherwydd mae hynny'n glir ar yr agenda. Nid yw'r ddadl yn ymwneud â'r ymarfer ailbrisio ei hun y mae'r Gweinidog wedi treulio llawer o'i amser yn ymdrin ag ef, ac y mae'n ymwneud llai fyth â'r lluosydd y cafodd Joyce Watson ei llorio'n llwyr ganddo, i bob golwg, ac nid yw'n ymwneud â rhyddhad dros dro, sy'n fater yr ymgollodd y Gweinidog ynddo, unwaith eto. Ni welaf y geiriau hynny ar yr agenda o gwbl. Nid yw'n ymwneud â fformiwla Barnett ychwaith, ond cawsom y pleser o weld Dai Lloyd yn cyflwyno'i gampwaith, sef ei araith ar fformiwla Barnett. Dyna ei unig gampwaith, yn anffodus, ac fe'i cyflwynwyd yn arddull anwedus San Steffan, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Helen Mary Jones, os yw'n gwyllo ar y sgrîn fach, yn ymdrin ag ef yn nes ymlaen. Bydd hynny'n ddigon o gosb, mae'n siŵr, felly nid wyf am ymhelaethu ar hynny. Gadewch inni weld beth mae'r ddadl hon yn ymwneud ag ef.

David Lloyd: Yr wyf yn barod am y gosb. [*Chwerthin.*]

Nick Bourne: Gobeithio ei bod wedi clywed

hynny, Dai.

If the threshold is not moved upwards, thousands of businesses throughout Wales will be prejudiced. It is very straightforward, although Joyce Watson seems to think that that will cost £2 billion; I do not know where she got that idea from. The Minister was closer when he referred to £100 million, although we calculate a figure of £50 million. The Minister did, at last, acknowledge that it will be increased. That is after four questions to the First Minister, a point of order to the Presiding Officer, and three requests to the Leader of the House for a statement. We still do not know by how much it will be increased; English businesses know by how much it will be increased in their case, as do Scottish businesses and those in Northern Ireland, while Welsh businesses do not. I am sad to say that that is an indictment of the policy of the Assembly Government, which is leaving Welsh businesses worse off than those in the rest of the United Kingdom.

I agreed with the first bit of Joyce Watson's contribution, in which she seemed to be putting a powerful case and saying that we need relief for businesses in the area that she represents, which I also represent. She quoted some examples of the sort of impact that it is having. However, she then seemed to think that it was terribly political of the Welsh Conservatives to table a debate on this issue and accused us of making mischief, even though it seems to be what she wants. At least the Minister has gone some way towards recognising that we need this doubt to be cleared up, because it is not fair to Welsh businesses, which cannot plan their budgets, which do not know if they have to lay off staff, and which do not know if they will be made bankrupt by the dithering and indecisiveness of this Government.

Plaid Cymru, to its credit, used to believe that we had to do something on business rates. Its previous leader, Dafydd Wigley, still talks about it, and he is absolutely right. The way to generate growth in the economy is to give

Os na chaiff y trothwy ei godi, bydd hynny er anfantais i filoedd o fusnesau trwy Gymru gyfan. Mae'n syml iawn, er yr ymddengys bod Joyce Watson yn credu y bydd yn costio £2 biliwn; ni wn o ble y cafodd y syniad hwnnw. Yr oedd y Gweinidog yn nes ati pan gyfeiriodd at ffigur o £100 miliwn, er inni gyfrifo ffigur o £50 miliwn. O'r diwedd, cydnabu'r Gweinidog y bydd y trothwy'n codi. Mae hynny ar ôl gofyn pedwar cwestiwn i'r Prif Weinidog, cyflwyno mater o drefn i'r Llywydd, a chyflwyno tri chais i Arweinydd y Tŷ am ddatganiad. Ni wyddom eto faint y bydd yn codi; mae busnesau yn Lloegr yn gwybod faint y bydd yn codi yn eu hachos hwy, ac mae'r un peth yn wir am fusnesau yn yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon, ond nid yw busnesau yng Nghymru'n gwybod. Mae'n flin gennyf ddweud bod hynny'n adlewyrchu'n wael ar bolisi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, sy'n golygu bod busnesau yng Nghymru mewn sefyllfa waeth na busnesau yng ngweddill y Deyrnas Unedig.

Yr oeddwn yn cytuno â rhan gyntaf cyfraniad Joyce Watson, lle'r oedd yn ymddangos ei bod yn cyflwyno achos pwerus ac yn dweud bod angen inni gael rhyddhad ar gyfer busnesau yn yr ardal y mae'n ei chynrychioli, sef yr ardal yr wyf fi hefyd yn ei chynrychioli. Soniodd am rai enghreifftiau o'r math o effaith y mae'n ei chael. Fodd bynnag, ymddengys ei bod wedi meddwl wedyn ei bod yn wleidyddol iawn i'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig gyflwyno dadl ar y mater hwn, ac fe'n cyhuddodd o greu helynt, er ei bod yn ymddangos mai dyna y mae hi eisiau. O leiaf mae'r Gweinidog wedi dod rywfaint yn nes at gydnabod bod angen inni ddileu'r amheuaeth hon, oherwydd nid yw'n deg ar fusnesau Cymru nad ydynt yn gallu cynllunio eu cyllidebau, nac yn gwybod a fydd yn rhaid iddynt ddiswyddo staff dros dro, nac yn gwybod a fyddant yn mynd yn fethdalwyr oherwydd petruster ac amhendrantrwydd y Llywodraeth hon.

Er tegwch i Blaid Cymru, arferai gredu ei bod yn rhaid inni wneud rhywbeth ynghylch ardrethi busnes. Mae arweinydd blaenorol y Blaid, Dafydd Wigley, yn dal i siarad am hyn, ac mae'n hollol iawn. Y ffordd i greu

business rate relief, so I welcome the way that Plaid used to be. However, what is indefensible, and this is still the position, is that the Minister has talked to Nick Ainger—unless Nick Ainger’s letter is to be gainsaid, and I have not heard him saying that—who was convinced that you had said that the threshold for business rate relief would go up by about 20 per cent. He has written to traders in Narberth, who Angela has spent a lot of time meeting. If you are able to say that to Nick Ainger, why on earth can you not tell Assembly Members that you are going to increase business rate relief by about 20 per cent? If you are, please get up and tell us so. I see that you do not wish to do so. Therefore, how can you tell Nick Ainger and not tell Assembly Members? It is high time that you informed us and Welsh businesses of the position so that they know what budgetary arrangements they can make for next year. The Government is on the run on this issue. The sooner you clarify this—and I suspect that it will be sneaked out in the recess—the better off we will be. For goodness’ sake, come forward with an oral statement so that the people of Wales know where they stand on this crucial issue.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The proposal is to agree the motion without amendment. Does any Member object? I see that there is objection. Therefore, I will defer all voting on this item until voting time.

The allocated voting time was 5 p.m., and it is now slightly past that time. Therefore we will move straight to the vote. Does anyone wish for the bell to be rung? I see that no-one does.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisiau tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.
Votes deferred until voting time.*

Cyfnod Pleidleisio Voting Time

twf yn yr economi yw cyflwyno rhyddhad ardrethi busnes, felly, yr wyf yn croesawu’r hyn yr arferai Plaid ei gredu. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn na ellir ei amddiffyn, a dyna’r sefyllfa o hyd, yw bod y Gweinidog wedi siarad â Nick Ainger—oni bai bod llythyr Nick Ainger yn cael ei wadu, ac nid wyf wedi ei glywed yn dweud hynny—a oedd wedi’i argyhoeddi eich bod wedi dweud y byddai’r trothwy ar gyfer rhyddhad ardrethi busnes yn codi oddeutu 20 y cant. Mae wedi ysgrifennu at fasnachwyr yn Arberth, y mae Angela wedi treulio llawer o amser yn cyfarfod â hwy. Os galwlch ddweud hynny wrth Nick Ainger, pam ar wyneb y ddaear na allwch ddweud wrth Aelodau’r Cynulliad eich bod yn mynd i gynyddu rhyddhad ardrethi busnes oddeutu 20 y cant? Os ydych yn mynd i wneud hynny, a wnewch chi godi a dweud hynny yn awr? Gwelaf nad ydych yn dymuno gwneud hynny. Felly, sut gallwch ddweud wrth Nick Ainger, a pheidio â dweud wrth Aelodau’r Cynulliad? Mae’n hen bryd ichi ddweud wrthym ni a busnesau Cymru beth yw’r sefyllfa, er mwyn inni wybod pa drefniadau cyllidebol i’w gwneud ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf. Mae’r Llywodraeth yn gwrthod wynebu’r mater hwn. Gorau po gyntaf y byddwch yn cynnig eglurhad o hyn—a thybiaf y caiff ei gyhoeddi’n dawel bach yn ystod y toriad. Er mwyn popeth, rhowch ddatganiad llafar er mwyn i bobl Cymru wybod ble y maent yn sefyll ar y mater hollbwysig hwn.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Y cynnig yw cytuno’r cynnig heb welliant. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf fod gwrthwynebiad. Felly, byddaf yn gohirio pob pleidlais ar yr eitem hon tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.

Yr amser penodedig ar gyfer pleidleisio oedd 5 p.m.; mae ychydig wedi hynny erbyn hyn. Yr wyf felly’n bwriadu symud ymlaen yn syth i’r bleidlais. A oes unrhyw un yn dymuno bod y gloch yn cael ei chanu? Gwelaf nad oes.

*Cynnig NDM4338: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 32.
Motion NDM4338: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 32.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Burns, Angela
Davies, Andrew R.T.
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Law, Trish
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Asghar, Mohammad
Barrett, Lorraine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.
Motion not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 1 i NDM4338: O blaid 32, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 15.
Amendment 1 to NDM4338: For 32, Abstain 1, Against 15.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Asghar, Mohammad
Barrett, Lorraine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jenkins, Bethan

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Burns, Angela
Davies, Andrew R.T.
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Law, Trish
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Sargeant, Carl
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Watson, Joyce
 Wood, Leanne

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
 The following Members abstained:

Black, Peter

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment agreed.*

Cynnig NDM4338 fel y'i diwygiwyd: fod

Motion NDM4338 as amended: that

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn nodi:

the National Assembly for Wales notes:

1. y bydd 60 y cant o fusnesau Cymru'n gweld gostyngiad yn eu hardrethi o ganlyniad i ailbrisio eiddo annomestig;

1. that 60 per cent of businesses in Wales will see their rates reduce as a result of the non-domestic property revaluation;

2. bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ystyried dulliau o helpu busnesau gan gynnwys, o bosibl, gynyddu'r trothwyon yn y cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi busnesau bach yn y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf, 2010-11, a'i bod yn ystyried mesurau o'r fath ochr yn ochr ag asesiad o'r pwysau ariannol ar hyn o bryd.

2. that active consideration is being given by the Welsh Assembly Government to ways of assisting businesses including a possible raising of the thresholds in the small business rate relief scheme in the next financial year, 2010-11, and that consideration of such measures is taking place alongside an assessment of existing budget pressures.

*Cynnig NDM4338 fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 38, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 10.
 Motion NDM4338 as amended: For 38, Abstain 0, Against 10.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Asghar, Mohammad
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Alun
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Evans, Nerys
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice

Bourne, Nick
 Burns, Angela
 Davies, Andrew R.T.
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jenkins, Bethan
 Melding, David
 Millar, Darren
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Williams, Brynle

Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig fel y'i diwygiwyd.
Amended motion agreed.*

**Dadl Fer a Ohiriwyd o 15 Gorffennaf 2009
Short Debate Postponed from 15 July 2009**

**Rhagdybiaeth yn erbyn Cloddio Glo Brig yng Nghymru?
A Presumption against Opencast Mining in Wales?**

Bethan Jenkins: I have agreed to give one minute each of my time to Jeff Cuthbert and Mike German. First, I will show a film.

Bethan Jenkins: Yr wyf wedi cytuno i roi munud yr un o'm hamser i Jeff Cuthbert a Mike German. Yn gyntaf, hoffwn ddangos ffilm.

*Daeth William Graham i'r Gadair am 6.29 p.m.
William Graham took the Chair at 6.29 p.m.*

*Dangoswyd DVD. Mae'r trawsgrifiad mewn llythrennau italig isod yn drawsgrifiad o'r cyfraniadau llafar ar y DVD.
A DVD was shown. The transcription in italics below is a transcription of the oral contributions on the DVD.*

Ms Austin: *My name is Alyson Austin and I'm a resident in Merthyr Tydfil and I live near to the opencast mine, called Ffos-y-frân. We've been fighting this opencast mine for approximately five years now. We knew what impacts we were going to get from the mine and we were horrified that the Welsh Assembly could even contemplate agreeing planning permission for it.*

Ms Austin: *Alyson Austin ydw i, ac yr wyf yn byw ym Merthyr Tudful ger y pwll glo brig a elwir Ffos-y-frân. Yr ydym wedi bod yn brwydro yn erbyn y pwll glo brig hwn ers rhyw bum mlynedd yn awr. Yr oeddem yn gwybod yr effaith y byddai'r pwll yn ei chael arnom, ac yr oeddem yn arswydo bod y Cynulliad yn gallu hyd yn oed ystyried cytuno i roi caniatâd cynllunio ar ei gyfer.*

6.30 p.m.

However, the mining operators put forth an argument that they had modern mining techniques and that they could be a good neighbour. They said that even though they were working within 37m to the nearest resident, they would be a good neighbour to us and we would hardly notice the impact. Whereas, in reality, they are absolutely horrendous. If they were anybody else, they'd have an ASBO slapped on them. They're absolutely awful. They make our lives a misery and quality of life now has gone through the floor.

Fodd bynnag, dadleuodd gweithredwyr y pwll fod ganddynt dechnegau cloddio modern ac y gallent fod yn gymdogion da. Dywedasant y byddent yn gymdogion da inni ac mai prin y byddem yn sylwi ar yr effaith, er eu bod yn gweithio o fewn 37m i'r preswylwr agosaf. Mewn gwirionedd, fodd bynnag, maent yn ddychrynlyd. Pe baent yn unrhyw un arall, byddent yn cael Gorchymyn Ymddygiad Gwrthgymdeithasol. Maent yn hollol erchyll. Maent yn gwneud ein bywydau'n annioddefol, ac mae ansawdd ein bywyd yn awr wedi dirywio'n ddifrifol.

The biggest impact at the present time is the noise. The planning permission allows them to work from 7 a.m. until 11 p.m.. At 7 a.m. they're allowed to put out up to 55 dB—55 dB is very, very loud. That will penetrate your house even with the windows closed, so a Saturday morning lie-in is an absolute no-no. You cannot have your windows open. The mine just dictates how you live your life.

Yr effaith fwyaf ar hyn o bryd yw'r sŵn. Mae'r caniatâd cynllunio'n caniatáu iddynt weithio o 7 a.m. tan 11 p.m.. Am 7 a.m., maent yn cael creu hyd at 55 dB o sŵn—mae 55 dB yn uchel iawn, iawn. Bydd i'w glywed yn eich tŷ hyd yn oed pan fydd y ffenestri ar gau, felly, mae aros yn y gwely ar fore dydd Sadwrn yn gwbl amhosibl. Ni allwch adael eich ffenestri ar agor. Mae'r pwll yn rheoli sut yr ydych yn byw eich bywyd.

In this very hot weather now, we are noticing huge amounts of dust coming from the site. Miller Argent have told us that they were, at that time, unable to control the dust, despite reassurances in the High Court that they had the very best of mining equipment to deal with it. The Welsh Assembly has given no control to anybody to monitor the dust other than the mining company themselves. So, they are a self-regulating company: they own the dust monitors, they own the noise monitors, they own the information that comes out of them and they are the gatekeepers of that information. Nobody gets that information, not even the council; the council has to request it. It is not available to the public, so we have nobody looking out for our interests.

Yn y tywydd poeth iawn hwn yn awr, yr ydym yn sylwi bod llawer iawn o lwch yn dod o'r safle. Mae Miller Argent wedi dweud wrthym nad oeddent, bryd hynny, yn gallu rheoli'r llwch, er gwaethaf sicrwydd yn yr Uchel Lys bod ganddynt yr offer cloddio gorau i ymdrin ag ef. Nid yw'r Cynulliad wedi rhoi awdurdod i neb fonitro'r llwch, ar wahân i'r cwmni cloddio ei hun. Felly, mae'n gwmni sy'n ei reoli ein hun: y cwmni sy'n berchen ar yr offer monitro llwch, y cwmni sy'n berchen ar yr offer monitro sŵn, y cwmni sy'n berchen ar y wybodaeth sy'n dod allan ohonynt, a'r cwmni yw ceidwad y wybodaeth honno. Nid oes neb yn cael y wybodaeth honno, ac nid yw'r cyngorhyd yn oed yn ei chael; rhaid i'r cyngor wneud cais amdani.

It is like giving the burglar your keys and telling him not to burgle your house while you're away.

The coal TAN has been very long in coming. We have been waiting for this coal TAN for years. We've fought for it and we've tried to get it implemented before Ffos-y-frân, but to no avail. The coal TAN as it stands now gives no protection to the residents at all. The exceptional circumstances paragraph ensures that, basically, any opencast mine has a cop out not to include a 500m buffer zone. There are several exclusions there that they could readily call upon—No.1 being that it is a land reclamation scheme. Any opencast mine will probably have land reclamation tied in with it. No. 2 is the community benefits—this is always one that could be added. If all else fails, the community benefits is one that could be applied and, therefore, the 500m buffer zone would not be given. If Ffos-y-frân were to come up now for planning permission, it would fail on four counts. With the health impact assessment, we were not given one. We were told that it wasn't needed. If an opencast mine of this size does not qualify for a health impact assessment, there's no hope for the rest of us. It seems that this coal TAN has given much protection for the coal reserves and the ability to mine it and no protection for the community whatsoever.

Mr James: *The burning of coal is the largest single source of climate change, responsible for about half the carbon dioxide in the atmosphere. Despite this, a number of people are calling for an expansion of the coal industry, particularly opencast. We strongly oppose this because it would fuel climate change, it would blight property values in the area and opportunities for other forms of economic development. It would cause a harmful impact on the landscape, noise, pollution and health for the local community. We believe that the TAN—the coal TAN—has gone a step forward by having a 500m buffer zone, but that has loopholes in it. In particular, there is one which would allow*

Nid yw ar gael i'r cyhoedd, ac nid oes neb felly'n gofalu am ein buddiannau ni. Mae'r un fath â rhoi eich allweddi i leidr, a dweud wrtho am beidio â dwyn dim o'ch tŷ tra byddwch i ffwrdd.

Mae'r nodyn cyngor technegol ynghylch glo wedi bod yn hir iawn yn ein cyrraedd. Yr ydym wedi bod yn aros am y TAN hwn ynghylch glo ers blynyddoedd. Yr ydym wedi brwydro amdano, ac wedi ceisio sicrhau ei weithredu cyn dyfodiad Ffos-y-frân, ond yn ofer. Fel y mae ar hyn o bryd, nid yw'r TAN ynghylch glo yn diogelu'r preswylwyr o gwbl. Yn y bôn, mae'r paragraff ynghylch amgylchiadau eithriadol yn sicrhau bod gan bwl glo brig esgus i beidio â chynnwys clustogfa o 500m. Ceir sawl eithriad y gallai'r cwmni eu defnyddio'n rhwydd—y cyntaf yw mai cynllun adfer tir ydyw. Mae'n debyg y bydd adfer tir ynghlwm wrth unrhyw bwl glo brig. Yr ail yw'r manteision i'r gymuned—gellid ychwanegu hynny bob amser. Pe bai popeth arall yn methu, gellid gweithredu'r eithriad ynghylch manteision i'r gymuned, ac ni fyddai'r glustogfa o 500m felly'n cael ei chyflwyno. Pe bai Ffos-y-frân yn cyflwyno cais cynllunio'n awr, byddai'n methu am bedwar rheswm. O ran yr asesiad o effaith ar iechyd, ni chawsom un. Dywedwyd wrthym nad oedd ei angen. Os nad yw pwl glo brig o'r maint hwn yn gymwys i gael asesiad o effaith ar iechyd, nid oes gobaith i'r gweddill ohonom. Ymddengys fod y TAN hwn ynghylch glo wedi rhoi llawer o ddiogelwch i'r cyflenwadau glo a'r gallu i'w cloddio, a dim diogelwch o gwbl i'r gymuned.

Mr James: *Llosgi glo yw ffynhonnell unigol fwyaf y newid yn yr hinsawdd, ac y mae'n gyfrifol am ryw hanner y carbon deuocsid yn yr atmosffer. Er gwaethaf hyn, mae nifer o bobl yn galw am ymestyn y diwydiant glo, yn enwedig glo brig. Yr ydym yn gwrthwynebu hynny'n gryf, gan y byddai'n hybu'r newid yn yr hinsawdd, ac yn amharu ar werth eiddo yn yr ardal ac ar gyfleoedd i gael mathau eraill o ddatblygu economaidd. Byddai'n effeithio'n andwyol ar y dirwedd, ar sŵn, llygredd ac iechyd y gymuned leol. Yr ydym yn credu bod y TAN—y TAN ynghylch glo—wedi cymryd cam ymlaen drwy nodi'r angen am glustogfa o 500m, ond mae bylchau yn hynny. Yn benodol, ceir bwlch a fyddai'n*

the opencast to take place within 500m if there is overriding economic interests. This has to be opposed and we support the proposal being put forward by Bethan Jenkins to have a presumption against opencast because the controls have to be stricter than what they are now.

Bethan Jenkins: Alyson Austin shows us how opencast mining has impacted on her community, where families near the area where I grew up have had to live with opencast mining every day. However, no campaign stopped Ffos-y-frân and no protest prevented the boundaries of the pit from coming within metres of homes in Merthyr Tydfil. The people who live there contend with the noise, the dust, the impact on their health, and the scars on the surrounding landscape. This short debate may be retrospective in relation to this particular development in Merthyr, but lessons can be learned if there are ever any similar developments.

Ffos-y-frân is just one of several communities across Wales living cheek-by-jowl with opencast mining. The Welsh Government finds itself caught between a rock and a hard place, with the interests of those communities on the one hand, and on the other, economic concern for the people who work there, often in areas where such work is in short supply. However, what becomes more important—job creation during this recession, or the quality of life of those living in the former industrial communities? Can we balance both, and can we find long-term economic benefits for the areas in which they operate? I believe that the way forward comes from the Assembly, from its power to legislate. It could close the loopholes that leave those on the edge of opencast mines ever anxious about the pits creeping closer to their backyards. It is about setting out clear stipulations that can allay those anxieties.

However, the rules that we have do not seem to work for those communities, despite bold claims to the contrary. Gaynor Ball lives in Kenfig Hill in my region, and has fought against opencast mining for many years, most

caniatáu cloddio glo brig o fewn 500m os ceir buddiannau economaidd sy'n bwysicach na dim arall. Rhaid gwrthwynebu hyn, ac yr ydym yn cefnogi'r cynnig y mae Bethan Jenkins yn ei gyflwyno i gael rhagdybiaeth yn erbyn cloddio glo brig, oherwydd rhaid i'r systemau rheoli fod yn fwy llym nag y maent yn awr.

Bethan Jenkins: Mae Alyson Austin yn dangos inni sut mae cloddio glo brig wedi effeithio ar ei chymuned, lle mae teuluoedd ger yr ardal lle cefais fy magu wedi gorfod byw gyda chloddio glo brig bob dydd. Fodd bynnag, ni lwyddodd yr un ymgyrch i atal Ffos-y-frân, ac nid ataliodd yr un brotest ffiniau'r pwll rhag dod o fewn metrau i gartrefi ym Merthyr Tudful. Mae'r bobl sy'n byw yno'n ymgodymu â'r sŵn, y llwch, yr effaith ar eu hiechyd a'r creithiau ar y dirwedd sydd o'u hamgylch. Efallai mai edrych yn ôl ar rywbeth sydd wedi digwydd eisoes y mae'r ddadl fer hon, o ran y datblygiad penodol hwn ym Merthyr, ond gellir dysgu gwersi os bydd unrhyw ddatblygiadau tebyg eto.

Mae Ffos-y-frân yn un o nifer o gymunedau ledled Cymru sy'n byw ochr yn ochr â chloddio glo brig. Mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei chael ei hun mewn cyfyng-gyngor, rhwng buddiannau'r cymunedau hynny ar un llaw, a phryder economaidd am y bobl sy'n gweithio yno ar y llaw arall, a hynny'n aml mewn ardaloedd lle mae gwaith o'r fath yn brin. Fodd bynnag, beth sydd bwysicaf—creu swyddi yn ystod y dirwasgiad hwn, ynteu ansawdd bywyd y sawl sy'n byw yn yr hen gymunedau diwydiannol? A allwn gydbwysu'r ddau beth, ac a allwn ddod o hyd i fanteision economaidd hirdymor ar gyfer yr ardaloedd lle maent yn gweithredu? Credaf fod y ffordd ymlaen yn nwylo'r Cynulliad, a'i bŵer i ddeddfu. Gallai gau'r bylchau sy'n golygu bod y sawl sydd ar gyrion pyllau glo brig yn pryderu'n barhaus a fydd y pyllau'n nesáu gan bwyll bach at eu hiard gefn. Mae'n golygu gosod amodau clir a all dawelu'r pryderon hynny.

Fodd bynnag, ymddengys nad yw'r rheolau sydd gennym yn gweithio ar gyfer y cymunedau hynny, er gwaethaf honiadau eofn i'r gwrthwyneb. Mae Gaynor Ball yn byw ym Mynydd Cynffig yn fy rhanbarth i,

recently against the further extension of the Parc Slip site at Margam. She argues that opencast mining impacts on biodiversity, rural landscape, health and wellbeing. She has won the current battle, because an application to extend Parc Slip was rejected last Friday. However, she and others want a presumption against opencast pits in Wales.

Susan Jordan has been fighting opencast mining at Ochr-y-Waun in Cwmllynfell, which is also in my region. She believes that the site is standing in the way of inward investment, property development and tourism. She told me that the east pit opencast site workings are now 400 yd from her house and that the site boundary is 50 yd. There have been numerous problems with the workings of the site, including no communications from the site operator, blastings that shake the house, noise and dust.

There are two applications for opencast developments in Varteg, near Torfaen. The first would extract 350,000 tonnes and sits within 500m of settlements. Local resident, Dr John Cox, says that developers argue that reclaiming old coal tips is the same as regeneration, allowing them exceptional circumstances as outlined in the 'Minerals Technical Advice Note 2: Coal'. The coal MTAN announced by the Minister in January, which I welcome as part of the 'One Wales' agreement, pledged that it would introduce health impact assessments for coal applications. Together with buffer zones, and with an emphasis on working closely with local communities, it reaffirms the commitment to a 500m buffer zone.

However, how effective are those new policy initiatives? Do they work in practice and do they live up to the expectations that they created? According to MTAN 2, a buffer zone should extend to 500m in order to minimise disturbances, and yet the local development plan of Merthyr Tydfil County Borough Council recognises that opencast

ac mae wedi brwydro yn erbyn cloddio glo brig ers blynnyddoedd lawer, ac yn fwyaf diweddar yn erbyn ymestyn safle Parc Slip ym Margam ymhellach. Mae'n dadlau bod cloddio glo brig yn effeithio ar fioamrywiaeth, y dirwedd wledig, iechyd a lles. Mae wedi ennill y frwydr bresennol, oherwydd ddydd Gwener diwethaf gwrthodwyd cais i ymestyn Parc Slip. Fodd bynnag, mae hi ac eraill am weld rhagdybiaeth yn erbyn pyllau cloddio glo brig yng Nghymru.

Mae Susan Jordan wedi bod yn brwydro yn erbyn cloddio glo brig yn Ochr-y-Waun yng Nghwmllynfell, sydd hefyd yn fy rhanbarth i. Mae'n credu bod y safle'n rhwystro mewnfuddsoddi, datblygu eiddo, a thwristiaeth. Dywedodd wrthyf fod y gwaith sy'n digwydd ar safle cloddio glo brig pwll y dwyrain 400 llath o'i thŷ erbyn hyn, ac mai 50 llath sydd rhwng ei thŷ a ffin y safle. Bu nifer o broblemau ynghylch gwaith y safle, gan gynnwys diffyg cyfathrebu ar ran gweithredwr y safle, ffrwydradau sy'n ysgwyd y tŷ, sŵn a llwch.

Mae yna ddau gais am ddatblygiadau'n ymwneud â chloddio glo brig yn y Farteg, ger Tor-faen. Byddai'r cyntaf yn echdynnu 350,000 tonnelli, ac y mae o fewn 500m i aneddiadau. Dywed preswylwr lleol, Dr John Cox, fod datblygwyr yn dadlau bod adennill hen domenni glo'r un fath ag adfywio, sy'n caniatáu amgylchiadau eithriadol iddynt fel yr amlinellir yn 'Nodyn Cyngor Technegol Mwynau 2: Glo'. Yr oedd yr MTAN ynghylch glo, a gyhoeddodd y Gweinidog ym mis Ionawr ac yr wyf yn ei groesawu'n rhan o gytundeb 'Cymru'n Un', yn addo y byddai'n cyflwyno asesiadau o effaith ar iechyd ar gyfer ceisiadau'n ymwneud â glo. Ynghyd â chlustogfeydd, a chyda phwyslais ar weithio'n agos gyda chymunedau lleol, mae'n ailddatgan yr ymrwymiad i sicrhau clustogfa o 500m.

Fodd bynnag, pa mor effeithiol yw'r mentrau polisi newydd hynny? A ydynt yn gweithio'n ymarferol, ac a ydynt yn bodloni'r disgwyliadau y maent wedi'u creu? Yn ôl MTAN 2, dylai clustogfa ymestyn i 500m er mwyn lleihau aflonyddwch, ond eto i gyd, mae cynllun datblygu lleol Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Merthyr Tudful yn

mining has been allowed within 500m of Ffos-y-frân due to the circumstances surrounding each site, and because it began in 2005, before the buffer zone was introduced by the Welsh Government.

Opencast mining is allowed within the buffer zone in exceptional circumstances—and there are many of them. They include remediating land damaged by shallow coal workings, where there is significance for regeneration, employment, and the local economy, and where extraction would take place ahead of permanent development. Campaigners argue that Ffos-y-Frân would not have required a buffer zone because it would have been covered by at least four of the MTAN's exclusions.

How can a buffer zone protect communities if exclusions will almost always override any safeguards? The buffer zone is supposed to help the communities living within 500m of opencast mining and thus, according to campaigners, the exceptional circumstances that may be cited to justify opencast mining must include a real measure of compensation for the people living within the zone who are discomfited by the opencast mining.

Economic factors appear to take precedence over environmental and health considerations in many areas. Who decides whether a proposal can bring regeneration to an area? Is it the developers, the council or the citizens? Reclamation without genuine regeneration cannot constitute an exceptional circumstance to justify opencast mining so close to people's homes.

6.40 p.m.

Where there are concerns with buffer zones, health impact assessments need to be implemented, and we need to be sure that the HIAs are truly independent. Campaign groups say that they should be reviewed and amended on a three-year basis, while Friends of the Earth Cymru argues that all opencast applications should be accompanied by an HIA, rather than only those that may have 'significant effects on human health'.

cydnabod bod cloddio glo brig wedi'i ganiatáu o fewn 500m i Ffos-y-frân, oherwydd yr amgylchiadau'n ymwneud â phob safle, ac oherwydd iddo ddechrau yn 2005, cyn i Lywodraeth Cymru gyflwyno'r glustogfa.

Caniateir cloddio glo brig o fewn y glustogfa mewn amgylchiadau eithriadol—ac y nifer ohonynt. Maent yn cynnwys adfer tir sydd wedi'i ddifrodi gan waith glo bas, os yw hynny'n bwysig ar gyfer adfywio, cyflogaeth a'r economi leol, a lle byddai echdynnu'n digwydd cyn gwaith datblygu parhaol. Mae ymgyrchwyr yn dadlau na fyddai Ffos-y-frân wedi gorfod cael clustogfa, oherwydd byddai o leiaf bedwar o eithriadau'r MTAN wedi bod yn berthnasol.

Sut y gall clustogfa ddiogelu cymunedau os bydd eithriadau'n bwysicach na threfniadau diogelu bron bob tro? Bwriad y glustogfa yw helpu'r cymunedau sy'n byw o fewn 500m i waith cloddio glo brig, ac yn ôl ymgyrchwyr, felly, rhaid i'r amgylchiadau eithriadol y gellir eu dyfynnu i gyfiawnhau cloddio glo brig gynnwys iawndal go iawn i'r bobl sy'n byw yn y parth a'r cloddio glo brig yn peri anghyfleustra iddynt.

Ymddengys fod ffactorau economaidd yn cael blaenoriaeth dros ystyriaethau'r amgylchedd ac iechyd mewn llawer ardal. Pwy sy'n penderfynu a all cynnig adfywio ardal? Ai'r datblygwyr, y cyngor ynteu'r dinasyddion? Ni all gwaith adfer tir nad yw'n cynnwys gwaith adfywio dilys fod yn gyfystyr ag amgylchiad eithriadol i gyfiawnhau cloddio glo brig mor agos at gartrefi pobl.

Os oes pryderon ynghylch clustogfeydd, mae angen gweithredu asesiadau o effaith ar iechyd, ac y mae angen inni fod yn siŵr fod yr asesiadau hynny'n gwbl annibynnol. Dywed grwpiau ymgyrchu y dylid eu hadolygu a'u diwygio bob tair blynedd, ond y mae Cyfeillion y Ddaear Cymru yn dadlau y dylai asesiad o effaith ar iechyd gyd-fynd â phob cais a gyflwynir am gloddio glo brig, yn hytrach na'r ceisiadau a all gael effaith

Campaigners in Varteg say that, while the Minister pledged in January to introduce HIAs for opencast coal applications, with an emphasis on working closely with local communities, that has not occurred in their area.

There are further examples of legislation ending up in conflict with communities' and operators' interests. Much of the anger that arises out of opencasting comes when extensions are applied for. Many people near opencast mines resign themselves to living with them for perhaps seven years, only to discover that the companies then want to continue operating them. If they do not, they are hardly compelled to restore finished sites.

Companies such as Celtic Energy work from extensive British Coal surveys on existing underground reserves. The National Union of Mineworkers has estimated that as much as 250 million tonnes still lie in seams in the south Wales coalfield. We have a good idea about how much is down there. It is true that mining companies often discover that a seam is exhausted only once they reach it, or they encounter impassable or financially prohibitive obstacles. These businesses must deliver a return—no easy thing, given the volatility of coal prices—while their workers worry about work once a pit's announced lifetime comes to an end. For example, the demise of Parc Slip could spell trouble for the wider industry, which employs more than 1,000 workers directly and through contracting in south Wales. Margam coal is used as part of a fuel blend for Aberthaw power station, and the Opencast Coal Committee of Wales, the representatives of which came to see me this week, warns that the absence of this vital ingredient could have dire economic consequences at other mines.

Why can we not compel operators to reveal how long they are minded to work these sites? Should we not clear away these vagaries that impact so heavily on people's lives with robust legislation that makes

sylweddol ar iechyd pobl yn unig. Dywed ymgyrchwyr yn y Farteg nad yw hynny wedi digwydd yn eu hardal hwy, er i'r Gweinidog addo ym mis Ionawr y byddai'n cyflwyno asesiadau o effaith ar iechyd ar gyfer ceisiadau am gloddio glo brig, gyda phwyslais ar weithio'n agos gyda chymunedau lleol.

Ceir enghreifftiau pellach o ddeddfwriaeth yn gwrthdaro â buddiannau cymunedau a gweithredwyr. Bydd llawer o'r dicter sy'n codi ynghylch cloddio glo brig yn ymddangos pan wneir ceisiadau am estyniadau. Bydd llawer o bobl ger pyllau glo brig yn derbyn ei bod yn rhaid byw gyda'r pyllau am saith mlynedd, efallai, ond yna byddant yn gweld bod y cwmnïau am barhau i'w gweithredu wedi hynny. Os nad ydynt am barhau, prin y cânt eu gorfodi i adfer safleoedd y gorffennwyd eu cloddio.

Mae cwmnïau megis Celtic Energy yn gweithio o arolygon eang Glo Prydain ar y cyflenwadau tanddaearol presennol. Mae Undeb Cenedlaethol y Glowyr wedi amcangyfrif bod cynifer â 250 miliwn o dunelli'n dal yn y gwythiennau ym maes glo'r de. Mae gennym syniad da faint sydd yno. Mae'n wir bod cwmnïau cloddio'n aml yn gweld bod gwythien wedi'i dihysbyddu dim ond ar ôl ei chyrraedd, neu byddant yn dod ar draws rhwystrau na ellir eu goresgyn neu sy'n rhy ddrud i'w goresgyn. Rhaid i'r busnesau hyn wneud elw—nad yw'n rhwydd, o ystyried anwadalrwydd prisiau glo—tra bydd eu gweithwyr yn poeni am waith pan fydd oes hysbys pwll yn dod i ben. Er enghraifft, gallai cau Parc Slip olygu trafferth i'r diwydiant ehangach, sy'n cyflogi dros 1,000 o weithwyr yn uniongyrchol a thrwy gontractau yn y de. Defnyddir glo Margam fel rhan o gymysgedd tanwydd ar gyfer gorsaf bŵer Aberddawan, ac y mae Pwyllgor Glo Brig Cymru, y daeth ei gynrychiolwyr i'm gweld yr wythnos hon, yn rhybuddio y gallai absenoldeb y cynhwysyn hanfodol hwn esgor ar ganlyniadau economaidd enbyd mewn pyllau glo eraill.

Pam na allwn orfodi gweithredwyr i ddatgelu am faint y maent yn bwriadu cloddio ar y safleoedd hyn? Oni ddylem ddileu'r elfennau mympwyol hyn sy'n effeithio gymaint ar fywydau pobl, drwy gyflwyno deddfwriaeth

absolutely clear to all sides and interests what communities can expect? There would be no nasty surprises for communities, or for workers. The only way in which to build such a robust framework of legislation is to introduce a presumption against opencasting in Wales and to look at alternatives for regeneration and economic development. In my opinion, operators have not proven the case to local communities, councils or the National Assembly that opencast mining is the way forward for Wales. There must be benefits for, not things that are detrimental to, local communities, and they must have a say in their future as this shapes the way for future generations.

Jeff Cuthbert: I thank Bethan for bringing this subject to our attention. As a young man, I worked at the opencast sites in Aberdare run by Wimpey and at the Royal Arms site in Dowlais run by Taylor Woodrow. I say that to make the point that opencast mining has existed in that area of Wales for decades. It is not a new phenomenon. However, I agree with you about the issue of achieving a balance between the need for coal, the correct use of coal—especially using modern clean-coal technology—and environmental considerations. Given the geographical layout of the south Wales coal basin and the structure of the south Wales Valleys, the places in which it is possible to mine coal on an opencast basis are limited. Some of the mining needs to be opencast, because the coal is close to the surface. It is critical in this work that we have great safeguards in place to deal with issues of noise and dust, given that plenty of technology now exists to minimise those nuisances, if used properly, and on the transportation of coal. On that, I am pleased to see that the Cwm Bargoed line is used in—

William Graham: Order. You have to wind up now, please, Jeff. Thank you.

The Minister for Environment, Sustainability and Housing (Jane Davidson): I am delighted to respond to the short debate tabled by Bethan regarding our

gadarn sy'n ei gwneud yn gwbl glir i bob ochr a phawb sydd â budd mewn safle beth all cymunedau ei ddisgwyl? Ni fyddai dim byd cas, annisgwyl yn digwydd i gymunedau, nac i weithwyr. Yr unig ffordd i adeiladu fframwaith mor gadarn o ddeddfwriaeth yw cyflwyno rhagdybiaeth yn erbyn cloddio glo brig yng Nghymru, ac edrych ar ddewisiadau eraill ar gyfer adfywio a datblygu economaidd. Yn fy marn i, nid yw gweithredwyr wedi profi i gymunedau lleol, cynghorau na'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol mai cloddio glo brig yw'r ffordd ymlaen i Gymru. Rhaid sicrhau bod manteision i gymunedau lleol, yn hytrach na phethau sy'n niweidiol, a rhaid iddynt gael cyfle i leisio barn am eu dyfodol gan fod hyn yn pennu'r cyfeiriad ar gyfer cenedlaethau'r dyfodol.

Jeff Cuthbert: Diolch i Bethan am ddod â'r pwnc hwn i'n sylw. Yn ŵr ifanc, bûm yn gweithio ar y safle cloddio glo brig yn Aberdâr, a oedd yn cael ei redeg gan Wimpey, ac ar safle'r Royal Arms yn Nowlais, a oedd yn cael ei redeg gan Taylor Woodrow. Yr wyf yn dweud hynny er mwyn gwneud y pwynt fod cloddio glo brig wedi bodoli yn yr ardal honno o Gymru ers degawdau. Nid yw'n ffenomen newydd. Fodd bynnag, cytunaf â chi ynghylch sicrhau cydbwysedd rhwng yr angen am lo, defnyddio glo yn y ffordd gywir—yn enwedig gan ddefnyddio technoleg fodern glo glân—ac ystyriaethau amgylcheddol. O ystyried patrwm daearyddol basn glo y de a strwythur Cymoedd y de, mae'r lleoedd lle mae'n bosibl cloddio am lo brig yn gyfyngedig. Mae angen i rywfaint o'r cloddio fod yn gloddio glo brig, gan fod y glo yn agos at yr wyneb. Yn y gwaith hwn, mae'n hanfodol bod gennym drefniadau diogelu da ar waith i ymdrin â sŵn a llwch, o ystyried bod digonedd o dechnoleg yn bodoli bellach i leihau'r niwsans hwnnw, o'i defnyddio'n iawn, ac i gludo glo. O ran hynny, yr wyf yn falch gweld bod llinell Cwm Bargoed yn cael ei defnyddio i—

William Graham: Trefn. Rhaid ichi orffen yn awr, os gwelwch yn dda, Jeff. Diolch.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynaliadwyedd a Thai (Jane Davidson): Yr wyf yn falch cael ymateb i'r ddadl fer a gyflwynodd Bethan ar ein polisi glo. Mae

coal policy, which has been the subject of exhaustive debate in recent years, and has culminated in the publication of the coal minerals TAN in January. It is important for me to say at the outset that, as Bethan recognised, I decided recently to refuse planning permission for opencast coal extraction at Margam on the advice of the planning inspector. However, as my decision is final, I cannot comment further on that, or respond to related comments made during this debate. If Assembly Members want more information, they can look at the Welsh Assembly Government's planning website.

The policy framework for coal comprises 'Minerals Policy Wales', which was originally published in 2000, then amended and re-published earlier this year to require health impact assessments for future coal proposals—so they are required for all such proposals, Bethan—as well as the coal technical advice note, published at the beginning of this year. We have successfully delivered on the 'One Wales' commitments relating to the coal TAN and health impact assessments. As Jeff said in his intervention, it has been a question of finding the appropriate balance. During preparation of the coal TAN, both myself and Carwyn Jones, my predecessor Minister, debated many of the issues with Members at length. Research and extensive public consultations were also undertaken. We carefully considered similar policies in England and Scotland to ensure that our communities would not be disadvantaged by any part of our final advice. We wanted to ensure that the planning advice on coal-working complemented our approach on carbon, energy and employment, as well as safeguarding our communities and the environment—both today and for the future.

Michael German: Thank you for taking this intervention, Minister. You mentioned an appropriate balance, but equally important is the protection of communities. The test is whether there is a genuine commitment to ensuring that communities are protected in legislation. The exemptions were mentioned earlier, but the coal TAN refers to proposals

wedi bod yn destun dadlau helaeth yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf, ac mae wedi arwain at gyhoeddi'r TAN ynghylch glo ym mis Ionawr. Mae'n bwysig imi ddweud ar y dechrau, fel y cydnabu Bethan, imi benderfynu gwrthod rhoi caniatâd cynllunio yn ddiweddar ar gyfer echdynnu glo brig ym Margam, yn unol â chynghor yr arolygydd cynllunio. Fodd bynnag, gan fod fy mhenderfyniad yn derfynol, ni allaf wneud sylwadau pellach ar hynny, ac ni allaf ymateb i sylwadau perthynol a wnaed yn ystod y ddadl hon. Os oes eisiau mwy o wybodaeth ar Aelodau'r Cynulliad, gallant edrych ar wefan gynllunio Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Mae'r fframwaith polisi ar gyfer glo yn cynnwys 'Polisi Cynllunio Mwynau Cymru', a gyhoeddwyd yn wreiddiol yn 2000, cyn cael ei ddiwygio a'i ailgyhoeddi'n gynharach eleni i fynnu asesiadau o effaith ar iechyd ar gyfer cynigion yn ymwneud â glo yn y dyfodol—felly, maent yn ofynnol ar gyfer pob cynnig o'r fath, Bethan—yn ogystal â'r nodyn cynghor technegol ynghylch glo, a gyhoeddwyd ddechrau eleni. Yr ydym wedi cyflawni ymrwymadau 'Cymru'n Un' yn llwyddiannus o ran y TAN ynghylch glo a'r asesiadau o effaith ar iechyd. Fel y dywedodd Jeff yn ei ymyriad, mae wedi bod yn fater o gael y cydbwysedd priodol. Wrth baratoi'r TAN ynghylch glo, bu Carwyn Jones, fy rhagflaenydd fel Gweinidog, a minnau'n dadlau'n faith gydag Aelodau am lawer o'r materion. Cynhaliwyd gwaith ymchwil a bu ymgynghoriadau cyhoeddus helaeth hefyd. Buom yn ystyried polisiau tebyg yn Lloegr a'r Alban yn ofalus er mwyn sicrhau na fyddai ein cymunedau dan anfantais oherwydd unrhyw ran o'n cynghor terfynol. Yr oeddem am sicrhau bod y cynghor cynllunio ynghylch cloddio glo yn ategu ein hagwedd at garbon, ynni a chyflogaeth, yn ogystal â diogelu ein cymunedau a'r amgylchedd—heddiw ac ar gyfer y dyfodol.

Michael German: Diolch am gymryd yr ymyriad hwn, Weinidog. Soniech am gydbwysedd priodol, ond y mae diogelu cymunedau yr un mor bwysig. Y prawf yw a oes ymrwymiad gwirioneddol i sicrhau bod cymunedau'n cael eu diogelu mewn deddfwriaeth. Cafodd yr eithriadau eu crybwyll yn gynharach, ond y mae'r TAN ynghylch glo yn cyfeirio at gynigion

'of overriding significance for regeneration, employment, health and safety',

and that word 'overriding' suggests that this would take priority over the exemptions. Therefore a judgment could be made to allow a development within 500m of people's houses if it was important for regeneration, employment, health and safety and the local economy. This is still a matter of judgment, so is that adequate protection, or do we need more clarity, Minister?

Jane Davidson: They are exceptions in the context of the presumption that a 500m buffer zone will be in place; that is the important point. I will come on to those exceptions in more detail, but I want first to pick up that point about the term 'presumption against'. During our debate on the development of the coal TAN, I was attracted to the idea of the term 'presumption against', but when I looked at the Scottish policy, for example, I found that its wording referred to planning authorities using their development plans to identify areas where open-cast coal extraction may be acceptable, and there would be a 'presumption against' development outside those areas. In applying the principles of sustainable development and environmental justice to open-cast coal extraction, there would be a presumption against development unless the proposal met one of the following tests: is it environmentally acceptable, or can it be made so? Does it provide local or community benefits that outweigh the likely impact, or justify the granting of planning permission? It seemed to me that those were more open than the explicit exceptions that we have put in our coal TAN, so we wanted to ensure that our policy achieved the right balance. We did not want to make it easier or more difficult in the context of obtaining planning permission; we wanted to make it clear that there were a set of tests that needed appropriately to be met, and those tests were about protecting communities in the context of dealing with planning permission.

It is a question of terminology. Until the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 was introduced, there was a general presumption in favour of development; section 54A of that

sy'n bwysicach na dim arall o ran adfywio, cyflogaeth, iechyd a diogelwch,

ac y mae'r gair 'pwysicach' yn awgrymu y byddent yn cael blaenoriaeth dros yr eithriadau. Felly, gellid penderfynu caniatáu datblygiad o fewn 500m i dai pobl pe bai'n bwysig ar gyfer adfywio, cyflogaeth, iechyd a diogelwch, a'r economi leol. Mater o farn yw hynny o hyd, a hefyd trefn ddiogelu ddigonol, neu a oes arnom angen mwy o eglurder, Weinidog?

Jane Davidson: Maent yn eithriadau yng nghyd-destun y rhagdybiaeth y bydd clustogfa o 500m ar waith; dyna'r pwynt pwysig. Dof at yr eithriadau hynny'n fanylach, ond yn gyntaf yr wyf am godi'r pwynt am y term 'rhagdybiaeth yn erbyn'. Yn ystod ein dadl am ddatblygu'r TAN ynghylch glo, cefais fy nenu at syniad y term 'rhagdybiaeth yn erbyn', ond pan edrychais ar bolisi'r Alban, er enghraifft, gwelais fod ei eiriad yn cyfeirio at awdurdodau cynllunio'n defnyddio'u cynlluniau datblygu i glustnodi ardaloedd lle gallai echdynnu glo brig fod yn dderbyniol, ac y byddai 'rhagdybiaeth yn erbyn' datblygiad y tu allan i'r ardaloedd hynny. Wrth gymhwyso egwyddorion datblygu cynaliadwy a chyfiawnder amgylcheddol i waith echdynnu glo brig, byddai rhagdybiaeth yn erbyn datblygiad, oni bai bod y cynnig yn bodloni un o'r profion canlynol: a yw'n amgylcheddol dderbyniol, neu a ellir ei wneud yn amgylcheddol dderbyniol? A yw'n rhoi manteision lleol neu gymunedol sy'n fwy na'i effaith debygol, neu sy'n cyfiawnhau rhoi caniatâd cynllunio? Yr oedd yn ymddangos i mi bod y rheini'n fwy agored na'r eithriadau penodol yr ydym wedi eu rhoi yn ein TAN ni ynghylch glo, felly yr oeddem am wneud yn siŵr bod ein polisi'n sicrhau'r cydbwysedd cywir. Nid oeddem am ei gwneud yn haws neu'n anos yng nghyd-destun cael caniatâd cynllunio; yr oeddem am egluro bod set o brofion yr oedd angen eu bodloni'n briodol, a'r profion hynny'n ymwneud â diogelu cymunedau yng nghyd-destun ymdrin â chaniatâd cynllunio.

Mae'n ymwneud â therminoleg. Nes i Ddeddf Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref 1990 gael ei chyflwyno, yr oedd rhagdybiaeth gyffredinol o blaid datblygiad; yr oedd adran

Act provided that planning applications should be made in accordance with the development plan unless other material considerations indicate otherwise.

As local development plans come forward, under our new planning proposals, they will be subject to public examination, and in order to be considered as sound by the planning inspectors, they must comply with national guidance. They must show on the proposals map that coal-working will not be acceptable within 500m of settlements. In this way, a strong framework will be embedded within the local development plans, ensuring continued sustainable, consistent and fair decisions on coal applications.

6.50 p.m.

An important change initiated in the coal TAN was the introduction of that 500m buffer zone, which should be defined around all surface coal operations, subject to certain exceptions, around where there is clear justification for working more closely—they are often related to health and safety issues. However, we should always start with the expectation of a buffer of 500m, for each application to be treated on its merits and considered in terms of whether there needs to be flexibility for local circumstances. When considering the exceptions in the context of the 500m buffer zone, it is important that the sentences are read out in full, rather than half read out, as you did in your contribution. You said, for example,

‘to remediate land damaged by shallow coal workings or mine waste’.

In fact, it goes on to state,

‘where coal extraction appears to be the most sustainable option’.

Therefore, where coal working provides the most effective solution to prevent risks to health and safety arising from previous mineral working, there is a very specific test. The exceptions, as laid out in the document, are very specific.

54A y Ddeddf honno'n nodi y dylai ceisiadau cynllunio gael eu gwneud yn unol â'r cynllun datblygu oni bai bod ystyriaethau eraill o bwys yn nodi fel arall.

Wrth i gynlluniau datblygu lleol gael eu cyflwyno, dan ein cynigion cynllunio newydd, byddant yn cael eu harchwilio'n gyhoeddus, ac er mwyn cael eu hystyried yn gynlluniau cadarn gan yr arolygwyr cynllunio, rhaid iddynt gydymffurfio â chanllawiau cenedlaethol. Rhaid iddynt ddangos ar y map cynigion na fydd gwaith glo'n dderbyniol o fewn 500m i aneddiadau. Fel hyn, bydd fframwaith cryf wedi'i ymgorffori yn y cynlluniau datblygu lleol, a fydd yn sicrhau penderfyniadau cynaliadwy, cyson a theg parhaus ar geisiadau'n ymwneud â glo.

Newid pwysig a ddechreuwyd yn y TAN ynghylch glo oedd cyflwyno'r glustogfa o 500m, y dylid ei diffinio o amgylch pob gwaith glo sydd ar yr wyneb, yn amodol ar eithriadau penodol, lle mae cyfiawnhad clir dros weithio'n agosach—yn aml, maent yn ymwneud â materion iechyd a diogelwch. Fodd bynnag, dylem ddechrau bob amser gan ddisgwyl clustogfa o 500m, er mwyn i bob cais gael ei drin ar sail ei deilyngdod a chael ei ystyried o ran a oes angen hyblygrwydd ar gyfer amgylchiadau lleol. Wrth ystyried yr eithriadau yng nghyd-destun y glustogfa o 500m, mae'n bwysig i'r brawddegau gael eu darllen yn llawn, yn hytrach na'u hanner darllen, fel y gwnaethoch chi yn eich cyfraniad. Er enghraifft, meddech,

adfer tir sydd wedi'i ddirodi gan waith glo bas neu wastraff cloddio.

Mewn gwirionedd, aiff ymlaen i ddweud,

lle'r ymddengys mai echdynnu glo yw'r dewis mwyaf cynaliadwy.

Felly, ceir prawf penodol iawn pan fo gwaith glo'n darparu'r ateb mwyaf effeithiol i atal risgiau i iechyd a diogelwch rhag codi o waith mwyngloddio blaenorol. Mae'r eithriadau, fel y nodir yn y ddogfen, yn benodol iawn.

Residents will rightly test us on the fact that development of policy and guidance is only part of the process, and that implementation and delivery are also important. This new policy was introduced in January of this year, but since then, there have been no applications for call-in under the new arrangements. We would need to test the TAN in considering whether or not it needed to be changed. The policy needs to bed down, and local authorities need to incorporate it into their work on local development plans and into their local decisions, before considering whether further changes are required. My officials will be providing training on minerals policy in local authority areas, with coal resources, in due course, to ensure that local authorities understand the issues.

We are attempting, as a Government, to ensure that the policy achieves the right balance and secures environmental protection for communities close to energy operations, in parallel with an energy policy that seeks to ensure a sustainable supply of energy at all times. I will consider this closely, as I am sure will all Assembly Members. It will be up to this Assembly in the future to change the guidance if it turns out that what we have worked out carefully, with much public consultation and consideration of other countries' delivery mechanisms, does not work. The point for now is that we have those health impact assessments in place and that we have the 500m as the material consideration. Those exceptions are specifically for very exceptional circumstances. No applications have come to the Assembly Government that look at any of this.

Bydd preswylwyr yn ein profi, fel y dylent, ynghylch y ffaith mai rhan o'r broses yn unig yw datblygu polisi a chanllawiau, a bod gweithredu a chyflawni'n bwysig hefyd. Cyflwynwyd y polisi newydd hwn ym mis Ionawr eleni, ond ers hynny ni chafwyd yr un cais i alw ceisiadau i mewn dan y trefniadau newydd. Byddai angen inni brofi'r TAN wrth ystyried a fyddai angen ei newid ai peidio. Mae angen i'r polisi ymsefydlu, ac y mae angen i awdurdodau lleol ei ymgorffori yn eu gwaith ar gynlluniau datblygu lleol ac yn eu penderfyniadau lleol, cyn ystyried a oes angen newidiadau pellach. Bydd fy swyddogion maes o law yn darparu hyfforddiant ar bolisi mwynau mewn ardaloedd awdurdodau lleol ag adnoddau glo, i sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol yn deall y materion.

Fel Llywodraeth, yr ydym yn ceisio gwneud yn siŵr bod y polisi'n sicrhau'r cydbwysedd cywir ac yn sicrhau'r trefniadau diogelwch amgylcheddol i gymunedau sy'n agos at waith yn ymwneud ag ynni, ochr yn ochr â pholisi ynni sy'n ceisio sicrhau cyflenwad cynaliadwy o ynni bob amser. Byddaf yn ystyried hynny'n agos, fel y bydd holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad, yr wyf yn siŵr. Mater i'r Cynulliad hwn yn y dyfodol fydd newid y canllawiau os digwydd nad yw'r hyn yr ydym wedi'i lunio'n ofalus, ar ôl llawer o ymgynghori cyhoeddus ac ystyried systemau cyflawni gwledydd eraill, yn gweithio. Y pwynt am y tro yw bod yr asesiadau hynny o effaith ar iechyd wedi'u rhoi ar waith gennym, ac mai'r 500m yw'r ystyriaeth bwysig. Mae'r eithriadau hynny'n benodol ar gyfer amgylchiadau eithriadol iawn. Nid oes dim ceisiadau wedi cyrraedd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad sy'n ystyried unrhyw agwedd ar hyn.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 6.53 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 6.53 p.m.*

Dadl Fer Short Debate

Plant â'u Traed yn Rhydd Free Range Kids

Angela Burns: I am delighted to be able to bring this topic forward for debate, because I

Angela Burns: Yr wyf yn falch gallu cyflwyno'r pwnc hwn ar gyfer dadl,

believe that, if we are to continue with a healthy and progressive society, we must have people within it who have mutual respect, intelligence and the ability to lift their eyes to the mountains. We did not go to the moon because we hid indoors, we did not discover new continents because we were too fearful to explore, and we did not make great strides in our human understanding by not having enquiring minds.

Adults are formed and marked, moulded and nourished by their experiences as children. Some experiences are miserable and some are to horrific to bear. Some need to be forgotten, but they leave their shadow. Other experiences are interesting, joyful, exciting and life affirming. These experiences deliver to a child self-confidence, self-reliance and self-esteem. They enable them to take responsibility, to cope with the rollercoaster of life; to aspire, to dream and to handle disappointment, to be mature and pragmatic, resolute and determined.

I believe that, as a society, we have become scared of our shadow—we believe that everyone is suspect, that dangers lie everywhere, that the planet is out to get us, and that we need to control each and every aspect of life. However, the world is not really like that. Most people are decent and caring, most activities carry an acceptable element of risk, most things are okay most of the time, but we seem hell-bent on becoming a zero-risk society and a zero-risk world. I have deep concerns over this, for two reasons.

First, we will develop into zero-risk adults, with tight minds, a lack of creativity and a fear of the unknown. Secondly, childhood should be about untrammelled joy and about discovery. The poor, pale-faced child shunted from school to endless organised activities and then to bed has no freedom to explore, to think, to imagine, to form. Of course there are dangers, scary and evil people, dark places and heart-stopping fear, but do we let that totally alter the childhood experience and the development of the next generation? We need to teach our children how to deal with these situations, how to prepare and how to

oherwydd credaf, os ydym am barhau i gael cymdeithas iach a blaengar, ei bod yn rhaid inni gael pobl ynddi sydd â pharch at ei gilydd, deallusrwydd a'r gallu i anelu'n uchel. Nid drwy aros gartref yr aethom i'r lleuad, nid drwy fod yn rhy ofnus i archwilio y darganfuwyd cyfandiroedd newydd, ac nid drwy beidio â chael meddyliau chwilfrydig y gwnaethom gamau breision wrth feithrin ein dealltwriaeth fel pobl.

Caiff oedolion eu ffurfio a'u nodweddu, eu mowldio a'u meithrin gan brofiadau eu plentyndod. Bydd rhai profiadau'n ddiflas, a bydd eraill yn rhy erchyll i'w goddef. Bydd angen anghofio rhai, ond byddant yn gadael eu hól. Bydd profiadau eraill yn ddi-ddorol, yn llawen, yn gyffrous ac yn cadarnhau bywyd. Bydd y profiadau hynny'n rhoi hunanhyder, hunandibyniaeth a hunan-barch i blentyn. Byddant yn galluogi plentyn i gymryd cyfrifoldeb, ymdopi â heriau bywyd, dyheu, breuddwydio ac ymdrin â siom, bod yn aeddfed ac yn ymarferol, yn gadarn ac yn benderfynol.

Credaf ein bod, fel cymdeithas, wedi dod i ofni ein cysgod ein hunain—credwn fod pawb yn amheus, bod peryglon ym mhobman, bod y blaned yn ein herbyn a bod angen inni reoli pob agwedd ar fywyd. Fodd bynnag, nid felly mae'r byd mewn gwirionedd. Mae'r mwyafrif o bobl yn garedig ac yn ofalgar, mae elfen dderbyniol o risg yn y rhan fwyaf o weithgareddau, a chan amlaf mae'r rhan fwyaf o bethau'n iawn. Ond ymddengys ein bod yn benderfynol o fod yn gymdeithas nad yw'n cymryd risg ac yn fyd nad yw'n cymryd risg. Yr wyf yn pryderu'n arw am hyn, am ddau reswm.

Yn gyntaf, byddwn yn datblygu'n oedolion nad ydynt yn cymryd risg, sy'n gul eu meddwl, sy'n brin o greadigrwydd ac sy'n ofni unrhyw beth dieithr. Yn ail, dylai plentyndod olygu llawenydd dirwystr a chyfleoedd i ddarganfod. Nid oes gan y truan gwelw sy'n cael ei gludo'n ddiseremoni o'r ysgol i weithgareddau diddiwedd ac sydd yna'n mynd i'r gwely ddim rhyddid i archwilio, meddwl, dychmygu na ffurfio. Mae yna beryglon, wrth gwrs, ynghyd â phobl ddrwg a dychrynlyd, lleoedd tywyll, ac arswyd sy'n ddigon i oeri'r gwaed, ond a ddylem adael i hynny newid y profiad o

have confidence in their own ability.

When I was a kid, my mother would shove us outdoors whenever she could—we would often disappear for hours on end. She knew vaguely where we were heading, but she did not helicopter over us to make sure that we did not fall into the river, stab a fish-hook into our fingers, or torment the bitey animal in the field. My best friend and I lived almost equidistant from an old medieval tower, so we would cycle there to meet up. It would take each of us the best part of an hour, and we would play and talk, hang out and have fun. What right do we have to not allow our children the same adventures that we were so easily afforded?

Yet, I remember with clarity the first time that a child went missing—the first time that I remember it hitting the nascent media of the time. Her name was Jeanette Tate; she was a schoolgirl out on her bike in Dorset and, to this day, we do not know her fate and her family has suffered grievously. To me, that incident seemed to be the first to colour our view of childhood freedoms. Since then, the media of our electronic age have brought to our attention every time a poor child suffers a dreadful fate, so the fear builds. We have the righteous and protective fear of abduction and death; we are worried about paedophiles and car accidents. This is right and human. When I became a mother, I discovered within myself the snarling protective instincts of a wild cat. I can hear my child's cry among the thousands of such cries. Like all who love, especially those who love someone who is defenceless and vulnerable, there is an overwhelming desire to protect.

However, our righteous and just caution is compounded and fed by the bizarre, the mad and the unusual, that, because of our tabloid age and instant media, comes crashing into our homes and consciousness, to create

blentyndod a datblygiad y genhedlaeth nesaf yn llwyr? Mae angen inni addysgu ein plant sut i ymdopi â'r sefyllfaoedd hyn, sut i baratoi, a sut i gael ffydd yn eu gallu eu hunain.

Pan oeddwn i'n blentyn, byddai fy mam yn ein gyrru allan i'r awyr agored pryd bynnag y gallai—yn aml, byddem yn diflannu am oriau. Byddai'n gwybod yn fras i ble y byddem yn mynd, ond nid oedd yn hofran uwch ein pennau i wneud yn siŵr nad oeddem yn syrthio i'r afon, yn plannu bachyn pysgota yn ein bysedd, neu'n pryfocio'r anifail a oedd yn brathu yn y cae. Yr oedd fy ffrind gorau a minnau'n byw'r un pellter bron o hen dŵr canoloesol, felly byddem yn seiclo yno i gyfarfod â'n gilydd. Byddai'r daith yn cymryd awr fwy neu lai i'r ddwy ohonom, a byddem yn chwarae a siarad, yn treulio amser yng nghwmni ein gilydd ac yn cael hwyl. Pa hawl sydd gennym i beidio â chaniatáu i'n plant gael yr anturiaethau yr oeddem ni'n eu cael mor rhwydd?

Er hynny, cofiaf yn glir y tro cyntaf i blentyn fynd ar goll—y tro cyntaf yr wyf yn cofio i ddigwyddiad o'r fath ymddangos yng nghyfyngau ifanc y cyfnod. Ei henw oedd Jeanette Tate; merch ysgol ydoedd a oedd allan ar ei beic yn Dorset, a hyd heddiw, ni wyddom beth oedd ei thynged, ac mae ei theulu wedi dioddef yn ddiifrifol. I mi, ymddengys mai hwnnw oedd y digwyddiad cyntaf i liwio ein barn am ryddid plentyndod. Ers hynny, bob tro pan fydd plentyndod yn dioddef tynged ofnadwy, mae cyfyngau ein hoes electronig wedi tynnu ein sylw at hynny, a'r ofn yn cynyddu. Mae arnom ofn achosion o gipio a marwolaeth, sy'n ofn cyfiawn ac amddiffynnol; yr ydym yn poeni am bedoffiliaid a damweiniau car. Mae hynny'n iawn ac yn ddynol. Pan ddeuthum yn fam, darganfum fod ynof reddf amddiffynnol chwyrn y gath wyllt. Gallaf glywed llef fy mhlentyn ymhlith miloedd o lefau tebyg. Fel pawb sy'n caru eraill, ac yn enwedig yn caru rhywun diamddiffyn ac agored i niwed, teimlir awydd llethol i ddiogelu.

Fodd bynnag, caiff ein gofal cyfiawn a theg ei ddwysáu a'i fwydo gan y pethau rhyfedd, y pethau gwallgof a'r pethau anarferol sy'n taro ein cartrefi a'n hymwybod, oherwydd ein hoes dabloid a'n cyfyngau parod, i greu ofn

within us what is, at times, an irrational fear. If a bizarre set of circumstances contribute to a death or a wounding, we find ourselves taking on that fear or worry, allowing it to impact upon our relationship with children. If a child chokes on mint sauce, sales drop; if a child falls off a climbing frame, the park is closed. I am no better: in my office at home, there are two or three skipping ropes on the top shelf, brightly coloured with twirly handles, given to our children for birthdays or at Christmas. However, I am paranoid that they will accidentally tangle themselves up in these ropes, and be strangled. This might come from my recollection of a dog of mine being trapped by her collar for many hours, which I remember clearly, or it might come from the awful fact that too many children hang themselves, intentionally or not. I know that it is daft to have a fatwa on skipping ropes, and I am steeling myself to finally decide that my children are old enough and sensible enough.

However, the real truth is that they are old enough now. All their little friends have them; it is I who is not sensible enough. For the skipping rope, substitute conkers, sun cream or cake mix, and all of those other daft things that we read about in the paper. We mutter about the thought police and we turn the page, but slowly and insidiously the daft thing does not disappear; it lurks there and then gets adopted, usually through total lack of common sense and imagination.

On 15 November 2009, *The Times* reported that

‘health and safety inspectors are to be given unprecedented access to family homes to ensure that parents are protecting their children from household accidents’.

The article goes on to say that the Department of Health is urging councils to collect data, and that a committee at National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence has issued what can only be described as

ynom sy'n afresymol ar brydiau. Os bydd cyfres ryfedd o amgylchiadau'n cyfrannu at farwolaeth neu anaf, byddwn yn ein cael ein hunain yn rhannu'r ofn neu'r pryder hwnnw, gan adael iddo effeithio ar ein perthynas â phlant. Os bydd plentyn yn tagu ar saws mint, bydd lefelau gwerthiant yn gostwng; os bydd plentyn yn syrthio oddi ar ffrâm ddringo, bydd y parc yn cael ei gau. Nid wyf finnau ddim gwell: yn fy swyddfa gartref, mae dwy neu dair o raffau sgipio llachar â dolenni troellog ar y silff uchaf. Fe'u rhoddwyd i'n plant ar eu pen-blwydd neu adeg y Nadolig. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn poeni'n ofnadwy y byddant yn mynd yn sownd yn y rhaffau hyn, ac yn cael eu crogi. Efallai fod hynny'n deillio o'm hatgof am ast a oedd gennyf, a fu'n sownd gerfydd ei cholera am sawl awr, sy'n rhywbeth yr wyf yn ei gofio'n glir, neu efallai ei fod yn deillio o'r ffaith frawychus fod gormod o blant yn eu crogi eu hunain, yn fwriadol neu fel arall. Gwn ei bod yn ddwl cael gwaharddiad ar raffau sgipio, ac yr wyf wrthi'n magu plwc i benderfynu o'r diwedd fod fy mhlant yn ddigon hen ac yn ddigon synhwyrol.

Fodd bynnag, y gwir amdani yw eu bod yn ddigon hen yn awr. Mae gan bob un o'u ffrindiau bach raffau sgipio; fi yw'r un nad yw'n ddigon synhwyrol. Gallwch gyfnewid y rhaff sgipio am goncyrs, eli haul neu gymysgedd cacen, a'r holl bethau dwl eraill y byddwn yn darllen amdanynt yn y papur. Byddwn yn mwman am yr heddlu meddwl ac yn troi'r dudalen, ond yn araf ac yn llechwraidd nid yw'r peth dwl yn diflannu; mae'n stelcian yno ac yna'n cael ei fabwysiadu, fel rheol drwy ddiffyg synnwyr cyffredin a dychymyg llwyr.

Ar 15 Tachwedd 2009, adroddodd *The Times* y bydd

arolygwyr iechyd a diogelwch yn cael mynediad na welwyd ei debyg o'r blaen i gartrefi teuluoedd i sicrhau bod rhieni'n diogelu eu plant rhag damweiniau yn y cartref.

Mae'r erthygl yn mynd yn ei blaen i ddweud bod yr Adran Iechyd yn annog cynghorau i gasglu data, a bod pwyllgor yn y Sefydliad Cenedlaethol dros Iechyd a Rhagoriaeth Glinigol wedi cyhoeddi canllawiau ymwithiol,

intrusive guidance as to what parents are to do in their own homes with their children on just ordinary, standard things.

7.00 p.m.

Angela Burns: Free range kids is about striking a balance, how we weigh freedom and risk, and how we encourage confidence in this risk-averse society. There is no doubt that the safety and wellbeing of children should be at the heart of what we seek to achieve, but we need to enable independent and confident children.

Allowing children opportunities to be confident, to explore and to seek adventure does not make for a bad parent, and the benefits are endless. In the UK, 25 per cent of boys and 33 per cent of girls are now overweight or obese. In Wales, those figures stand at 16 per cent in total in the latest results. StatsWales's latest mid-year study states that 550,000 people are currently under the age of 16. Sixteen per cent of that total is an awful lot of young people in Wales whose health is at risk from being overweight. What we need are active children. We need to encourage children to have the freedom to run, to explore and the desire to keep active and fit before it is too late.

I want to return to the issue of health and safety and of how far is too far. You may have seen a recent article on the BBC stating that 6,500 people are hurt every year by lawnmowers of every type. In the past 12 months, 530 people had to be admitted for hospital treatment in England due to lawnmower-related injuries, and John Heyworth, president of the College of Emergency Medicine, stated that 'people should be cautious when gardening'. However, what do these figures really say? Are lawnmowers such a threat to us? What the article does not state is that some of these injuries were caused when unloading a sit-on lawnmower from a lorry or when the lawnmower was unplugged, that is, it was stationary and not even moving a little bit, but someone tripped over it. I am by no

gan mai dyna'r unig ffordd o'u disgrifio, ar yr hyn y dylai rhieni ei wneud yn eu cartrefi eu hunain gyda'u plant yng nghyswllt pethau cyffredin, arferol.

Angela Burns: Mae Plant sydd â'u Traed yn Rhydd yn ymwneud â sicrhau cydbwysedd, sut yr ydym yn pwysu a mesur rhyddid a risg, a sut yr ydym yn hybu hyder yn y gymdeithas hon sy'n gwrthwynebu risg. Nid oes amheuaeth na ddylai diogelwch a lles plant fod wrth wraidd yr hyn yr ydym yn ceisio'i gyflawni, ond y mae angen inni alluogi plant i fod yn annibynnol a hyderus.

Nid yw rhoi cyfleoedd i blant fod yn hyderus, archwilio a chwilio am antur yn golygu eich bod yn rhiant gwael, ac y mae'r manteision yn ddiddiwedd. Yn y DU, mae 25 y cant o fechgyn a 33 y cant o ferched erbyn hyn yn rhy drwm neu'n ordew. Yng Nghymru, mae'r ffigurau hynny'n cyfateb i gyfanswm o 16 y cant yn ôl y canlyniadau diweddaraf. Mae'r astudiaeth ganol blwyddyn ddiweddaraf gan StatsCymru yn nodi bod 550,000 o bobl dan 16 oed ar hyn o bryd. Mae 16 y cant o'r cyfanswm hwnnw'n nifer fawr iawn o bobl ifanc yng Nghymru sydd â'u hiechyd mewn perygl oherwydd eu bod yn rhy dew. Yr hyn sydd ei angen arnom yw plant egniol. Mae angen inni annog plant i gael y rhyddid i redeg ac archwilio a'r awydd i barhau'n egniol ac yn heini cyn iddi fynd yn rhy hwyr.

Hoffwn ddychwelyd at fater iechyd a diogelwch, a phryd mae rhywbeth yn mynd yn rhy bell. Efallai ichi weld erthygl yn ddiweddar ar y BBC a oedd yn dweud bod 6,500 o bobl yn cael eu hanafu bob blwyddyn gan beiriannau torri glaswellt o bob math. Yn ystod y 12 mis diwethaf, bu'n rhaid derbyn 530 o bobl i'r ysbyty yn Lloegr i gael triniaeth am anafiadau'n ymwneud â pheiriannau torri glaswellt, a dywedodd John Heyworth, llywydd y Coleg Meddygaeth Frys, y dylai pobl fod yn ofalus wrth arddio. Fodd bynnag, beth mae'r ffigurau hyn yn ei ddweud mewn gwirionedd? A yw peiriannau torri glaswellt yn fygythiad inni? Yr hyn nad yw'r erthygl yn ei ddweud yw bod rhai o'r anafiadau hynny wedi'u hachosi wrth ddadlwytho peiriant torri glaswellt y gallwch eistedd arno oddi ar lori, neu pan nad oedd y

means trivialising serious injuries, but should we go as far as listing a static object as being a high risk? Should we ban lawnmowers? Should we let the fear of risk dictate our lives?

You will have seen David Cameron's excellent speech on reducing the burden and impact of health and safety measures. He laid out the next Conservative Government's approach to the mismatch in today's health and safety culture. At this point, I want to comment that, in health and safety legislation, as David stated, there are some good points and there has been some necessary legislation, such as the Factory Acts. However, he talked of children being made to wear goggles by their teachers when playing conkers and of parents, who, due to bureaucracy, cannot organise the annual village fete for their community any more. I am aware of a situation in Bedfordshire when firefighters were told that they could not use ladders to take down festival bunting, which is extraordinary. Health and safety regulations stated that they could only use their ladders to save lives.

In one of her many lectures across the world, Leonore Skenazy, who is leading the way in promoting free range kids and who has written a fantastic book called *Free-Range Kids: Giving Our Children the Freedom We Had Without Going Nuts with Worry*, talks about a helmet for toddlers. It is not a bike helmet, it is a toddling helmet. In fact, it is called the Thudguard, and, on its website, it is stated that over 318,575 baby and toddler head injuries are recorded each year. When I was a toddler, I toddled. I probably fell over and had some bumps, but I survived. The over-the-top health and safety culture that we see today has created a situation in which hundreds and thousands of pointless products are made and sold all over the world. These are pointless products, but through them we can be assured that we have done our best. We are told that if we do not have these products to keep our children safe we are bad parents.

peiriant torri glaswellt wedi'i blygio i mewn, hynny yw, yr oedd y peiriant yn llonydd, ac nid oedd yn symud o gwbl ond baglodd rhywun drosto. Nid wyf yn bychanu anafiadau difrifol o gwbl, ond a ddylem fynd mor bell â rhestru bod gwrthrych llonydd yn peri risg uchel? A ddylem wahardd peiriannau torri glaswellt? A ddylem adael i ofn risg reoli ein bywydau?

Byddwch wedi gweld araith wych David Cameron ar leihau baich ac effaith mesurau iechyd a diogelwch. Eglurodd agwedd Llywodraeth nesaf y Ceidwadwyr at yr elfennau anghymharus yn ein diwylliant iechyd a diogelwch heddiw. Yn awr, hoffwn ddweud, fel y dywedodd David, bod rhai pwyntiau da mewn deddfwriaeth iechyd a diogelwch, ac y mae rhywfaint o ddeddfwriaeth wedi bod yn angenrheidiol, megis y Deddfau Ffatrïoedd. Fodd bynnag, soniodd am athrawon yn mynnu bod plant yn gwisgo gogls wrth chwarae concyrs, ac na all rhieni drefnu ffeiriau pentref blynyddol ar gyfer eu cymuned bellach, oherwydd biwrocraatiaeth. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o sefyllfa yn Swydd Bedford pan ddywedwyd wrth ddiffoddwyr tân na allent ddefnyddio ysgolion i dynnu baneri gwyliau i lawr, sy'n anghredadwy. Yr oedd y rheoliadau iechyd a diogelwch yn dweud mai dim ond i achub bywydau y gallent ddefnyddio'u hysgolion.

Yn un o'i darlithoedd niferus ar draws y byd, mae Leonore Skenazy, sy'n arwain y ffordd wrth hybu plant sydd â'u traed yn rhydd ac sydd wedi ysgrifennu llyfr gwych dan y teitl *Free-Range Kids: Giving Our Children the Freedom We Had Without Going Nuts with Worry*, yn sôn am helmed ar gyfer plant bach. Nid helmed beic ydyw, ond helmed i blant bach sy'n dechrau cerdded. Mewn gwirionedd, ei enw yw Thudgard, ac ar ei wefan dywedir bod dros 318,575 o anafiadau pen i fabis a phlant bach yn cael eu cofnodi bob blwyddyn. Pan oeddwn i'n blentyn bach, yr oeddwn yn cerdded fel plentyn bach. Mae'n debyg imi syrthio a chael ambell godwm, ond llwyddais i ddod drwyddi. Mae'r diwylliant iechyd a diogelwch heddiw sy'n mynd dros ben llestri wedi creu sefyllfa lle mae cannoedd ar filoedd o nwyddau dibwrpas yn cael eu cynhyrchu a'u gwerthu ar draws y byd. Maent yn nwyddau dibwrpas, ond drwyddynt, gallwn fod yn dawel ein

meddwl ein bod wedi gwneud ein gorau. Dywedir wrthym ein bod yn rhieni gwael os nad yw'r nwyddau hyn gennym i gadw ein plant yn ddiogel.

We need to change what has become a health and safety culture, but not just by changing the rules; we need to change the way that we implement them and the way that people see themselves. David Cameron promised a review of the current situation. I welcome and look forward to that review. As a mother, and a mother who, as I have stated, worries for her children, I think about my two girls as I send them off to school. However, what I really think about as I do so is that when they bash themselves, as my youngest did, on a climbing frame—because, she claimed, she did not see it and it jumped out at her—they are not allowed to be cuddled by the teacher. That caused me more pain than the worry about the climbing frame. She is only five, and I would have liked someone to have scooped up and told her that it did not matter. Instead, they had to treat her with antiseptic gloves and not touch her at all.

Minister, I seek a couple of things from you. I hope that what I have said will give you cause to think about where we need to go with our children today in Wales. We should cease teaching children that everyone could be, or is, nasty, and instead we should teach them how to deal with risk, and give them the confidence to handle these situations. We need to let our children play. Look at the statistics on obesity, and look at the statistics on crime—child abductions have halved in the last four years, as have cases of paedophilia in Wales.

The Welsh Assembly Government needs to develop a more robust partnership approach when it comes to the safeguarding agenda. I am willing—I know that we are all singing from the same hymn sheet on this in the Assembly—to work with you, Minister, on doing that. The Children and Young People Committee will be looking at safe places to play, and that piece of work has developed

Mae angen inni newid yr hyn sydd wedi dod yn ddiwylliant iechyd a diogelwch, ond nid drwy newid y rheolau'n unig; mae angen inni newid y ffordd yr ydym yn eu gweithredu a'r ffordd y mae pobl yn eu gweld eu hunain. Addawodd David Cameron adolygiad o'r sefyllfa bresennol. Yr wyf yn croesawu'r adolygiad hwnnw ac yn edrych ymlaen ato. Fel mam, a mam sy'n poeni am ei phlant, fel y dywedais, byddaf yn meddwl am fy nwy ferch wrth imi eu hanfon i'r ysgol. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn y byddaf yn meddwl amdano mewn gwirionedd, wrth imi wneud hynny, yw'r ffaith nad yw'r athro'n cael eu cofleidio pan fyddant yn cael codwm fel y cafodd fy merch ieuaf ar ffrâm ddringo—honnodd nad oedd wedi gweld y ffrâm a'i bod wedi neidio allan ati. Achosodd hynny fwy o boen meddwl imi na'r pryder am y ffrâm ddringo. Dim ond pump oed yw hi, a byddwn wedi hoffi pe bai rhywun wedi'i chofleidio ac wedi dweud wrthi nad oedd ots. Yn lle hynny, yr oedd yn rhaid iddynt ei thrin â menig gwrth-heintiol a pheidio â'i chyffwrdd o gwbl.

Weinidog, yr wyf yn ceisio dau beth gennyh. Gobeithio y bydd yr hyn yr wyf wedi'i ddweud yn peri ichi feddwl i ba gyfeiriad y mae angen inni fynd â'n plant heddiw yng Nghymru. Dylem roi'r gorau i addysgu plant y gallai pawb fod yn gas, neu fod pawb yn gas. Yn hytrach, dylem eu haddysgu sut i ymdrin â risg, a rhoi'r hyder iddynt ymdrin â'r sefyllfaoedd hyn. Mae angen inni adael i'n plant chwarae. Edrychwch ar yr ystadegau ar ordewdra, ac edrychwch ar yr ystadegau ar drosedd—mae nifer yr achosion o gipio plant wedi haneru yn ystod y pedair blynedd diwethaf, fel nifer yr achosion o bedoffilia yng Nghymru.

Mae angen i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ddatblygu dull mwy cadarn o weithio mewn partneriaeth ar yr agenda ddiogelu. Yr wyf yn fodlon gweithio—gwn ein bod oll yn cytuno ar hyn yn y Cynulliad—gyda chi, Weinidog, i wneud hynny. Bydd y Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc yn edrych ar leoedd diogel i chwarae, ac y mae'r darn hwnnw o waith wedi datblygu o'r dystiolaeth yr ydym wedi'i

from the evidence that we taken over these last few years, going around schools and talking to children about what they want. Many of them say that they would like to go down to the park, but that everything has been taken out of the park because the council thinks they might hurt themselves, or 'I would like to go to the park, but I am only eight, and it has been taken over by 18-year-olds'. Children want places to go; they want youth clubs, and they want to be able to get away from their parents and do other stuff. The other problem that we are beginning to encounter is that more and more schools are refusing to take children away on trips, saying that it is not worth the risk to take children on water adventures, or on trips abroad, as the minibus might have an accident. Terrible things can happen and, oh my Lord, if it were my child, I can imagine the pain and the anguish, but should we let what might conceivably happen colour the way that we treat our children?

We need to review play facilities, but, above all, Minister, I ask you to consider two things. First, could you consider creating a cross-party group to look at how we can enable our children to benefit from these freedoms and enjoy their childhood in a safe way, with the parents at a distance? We should not be helicoptering over them in an overly protective way, but enabling them to develop the life skills that they need to become the strong and sure adults that we need in the next generation. I will work with you to do that.

Secondly, childhood is supposed to be about discovering the world, not being held prisoner in it, and I fear that that is what we are bringing about. Thank you for your time.

The Minister for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills (Jane Hutt): Thank you, Angela, for bringing forward this important debate, which I welcome very much. I like the way that you started, saying that children should be able to lift their eyes to the mountain; this is all about recognising the opportunities that we have, and Government has an enhancing role in this as

chasglu dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf, wrth fynd o amgylch ysgolion a siarad â phlant am yr hyn y mae arnynt ei eisiau. Mae llawer ohonynt yn dweud yr hoffent fynd i'r parc, ond bod popeth wedi'i symud o'r parc oherwydd bod y cyngor yn meddwl y gallent eu hanafu eu hunain, neu 'hoffwn fynd i'r parc, ond dim ond wyth oed ydw i, ac y mae plant 18 oed wedi cymryd y lle drosodd'. Mae plant am gael lleoedd i fynd; maent am gael clybiau ieuencid, ac y maent am allu mynd i ffwrdd oddi wrth eu rhieni a gwneud pethau eraill. Y broblem arall yr ydym yn dechrau dod ar ei thraws yw bod mwy a mwy o ysgolion yn gwrthod mynd â phlant ar deithiau, gan ddweud nad yw mynd â phlant ar anturiaethau dŵr neu deithiau tramor yn werth y risg, oherwydd gallai'r bws mini fod mewn damwain. Gall pethau ofnadwy ddigwydd, a'r nefoedd, pe bai hynny'n digwydd i'm plentyn i, gallaf ddychmygu'r boen a'r gofid. Ond a ddylem adael i'r hyn a allai ddigwydd liwio'r ffordd yr ydym yn trin ein plant?

Mae angen inni adolygu cyfleusterau chwarae, ond yn anad dim, Weinidog, gofynnaf ichi ystyried dau beth. Yn gyntaf, a allech ystyried creu grŵp trawsbleidiol i edrych ar y modd y gallwn alluogi ein plant i gael budd o'r rhyddid hwn a mwynhau eu plentynod mewn ffordd ddiogel, a'r rhieni ychydig bellter i ffwrdd? Ni ddylem fod yn hofran uwch eu pennau yn rhy amddiffynnol. Yn hytrach, dylem fod yn eu galluogi i ddatblygu'r sgiliau bywyd y mae arnynt eu hangen i dyfu'n oedolion cryf a hyderus, sef yr oedolion y mae arnom eu hangen yn y genhedlaeth nesaf. Byddaf yn gweithio gyda chi i wneud hynny.

Yn ail, mae plentynod i fod i olygu darganfod y byd, nid bod yn garcharor ynddo, ac yr wyf yn ofni mai dyna'r ydym yn ei wneud. Diolch am eich amser.

Y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau (Jane Hutt): Diolch, Angela, am gyflwyno'r ddadl bwysig hon. Yr wyf yn ei chroesawu'n fawr iawn. Yr wyf yn hoffi'r ffordd y dechreusoch drwy ddweud y dylai plant allu anelu'n uchel; mae'n golygu adnabod y cyfleoedd sydd gennym, ac y mae gan Lywodraeth rôl i wella hynny yn ogystal â chreu a datblygu cymdeithas iach a

well as in creating and developing a healthy and progressive society. We need to focus on how to strike a balance—that is the crucial point for us as we develop our pioneering play policy.

I want to talk a bit about the opportunities that play policy provides. This relates to the points that you made about enabling our children to explore, take risks and have adventures, which is linked to them becoming more entrepreneurial, thinking young citizens. I believe that the changes that we have developed in our curriculum, particularly the foundation phase, is enabling that kind of learning, thinking and exploring. Way back when I was a student, I worked on an adventure playground, and they were certainly risky places: not only did we light fires, but we used nails in building structures. We have several good adventure playgrounds in Wales, and the one in Wrexham is a famous example. It is about the sense of adventure and opportunity that we want to encourage.

It is also important to recognise that we are blessed with a great environment for children and young people, with an abundance of diverse and rich open spaces, and we need to take advantage of that in developing a cross-cutting policy.

7.10 p.m.

To encourage that spirit of adventure and those opportunities, we should intervene at the earliest stages in life. Promoting outdoor play is particularly important. That is what we are developing in the foundation phase. It is a play-based curriculum that places great emphasis on experimental learning and the use of the outdoors. There has been widespread enthusiastic support for it from parents as well as professionals. However, most importantly, as I am sure that all colleagues in the Chamber have seen, children are responding to the opportunities available to them through the foundation phase.

Schools can also play their part in developing play for children. We have to ensure that they have the funding to improve school buildings

blaengar. Mae angen inni ganolbwyntio ar y ffordd i sicrhau cydbwysedd—dyna'r pwynt hanfodol i ni wrth inni ddatblygu ein polisi chwarae arloesol.

Yr wyf am siarad ychydig am y cyfleoedd y mae'r polisi chwarae hwnnw'n eu cynnig. Mae'n golygu'r pwyntiau a wnaethoch am alluogi ein plant i archwilio, cymryd risgiau a chael anturiaethau, sy'n gysylltiedig â chael plant i dyfu'n ddinasyddion ifanc mwy entrepreneuriaidd sy'n meddwl. Credaf fod y newidiadau yr ydym wedi'u datblygu yn ein cwricwlwm, yn enwedig y cyfnod sylfaen, yn galluogi'r math hwnnw o ddysgu, meddwl ac archwilio. Amser maith yn ôl, pan oeddwn yn fyfyrwr, bûm yn gweithio ar faes chwarae antur, ac yr oeddent yn bendant yn lleoedd peryglus. Yn ogystal â chynnau tân, byddem yn defnyddio hoelion wrth adeiladu strwythurau. Mae gennym nifer o feysydd chwarae antur da yng Nghymru, ac y mae'r un yn Wrecsam yn enghraifft enwog. Mae'n golygu'r synnwyr o antur a chyfle yr ydym am eu hannog.

Mae'n bwysig cydnabod hefyd ein bod wedi ein bendithio ag amgylchedd gwych i blant a phobl ifanc, gyda digonedd o fannau agored amrywiol a chyfoethog, ac y mae angen inni fanteisio ar hynny wrth ddatblygu polisi trawsbynciol.

Er mwyn annog yr ysbryd hwnnw o antur a'r cyfleoedd hynny, dylem ymyrryd yn ystod cyfnodau cynharaf bywyd. Mae hybu chwarae yn yr awyr agored yn arbennig o bwysig. Dyna'r ydym yn ei ddatblygu yn y cyfnod sylfaen. Mae'n gwricwlwm sy'n seiliedig ar chwarae, ac y mae'n rhoi pwyslais mawr ar ddysgu trwy brofiadau a defnyddio'r awyr agored. Mae wedi cael cefnogaeth frwdfrydig eang gan rieni yn ogystal â gweithwyr proffesiynol. Fodd bynnag, yn bwysicaf oll, ac yr wyf yn siŵr fod fy holl gydweithwyr yn y Siambr wedi sylwi, mae plant yn ymateb i'r cyfleoedd sydd ar gael iddynt drwy'r cyfnod sylfaen.

Gall ysgolion wneud eu rhan hefyd i ddatblygu cyfleoedd chwarae ar gyfer plant. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod yr arian ganddynt i

and outdoor spaces in schools so that they are fit for purpose and properly maintained. I want to see schools develop their environments to provide safe, but challenging spaces. Again, many of you will have visited primary and nursery schools where land that was formerly waste land is now being used as part of an outdoor space that children can engage with.

You made the point that a lack of physical activity among children and young people can lead to some of the health problems that we have seen, such as obesity. Through play, children and young people can lead a healthy lifestyle. Our play policy recognises the importance of nutrition and exercise in a child's development. As you said, running around a park or a playground can totally transform children and help them to develop their physical abilities along with their social skills. Parents and members of the community need to ensure that that space is available for our children and young people.

These are spaces where children can meet up, socialise and play in a stimulating environment that is safe and secure, where they can be happy and valued as individuals. One of my most frightening memories—I was rather an adventurous young girl—was trying to crawl through a drain under a road and getting stuck half way and having to be pulled out. Any parent would be horrified about that. However, it was my sense of adventure that took me into that drain, although I was egged on by others. Daring games can be important, whether daring to climb a tree or any other activity. This is about the balance that we can strike in relation to safeguards and risks.

We have a responsibility to recognise the differences between then and today, particularly the growth in the amount of traffic and the absence of suitable places for children to play. There has been a decrease in the number of children and young people walking to school. Again, I remember that the walk to school provided all sorts of opportunities for adventure and exploration. We can intervene; we can put money into Safe Routes to School. That has been one of

wella adeiladau ysgolion, a manau yn yr awyr agored mewn ysgolion, fel eu bod yn addas at y diben ac yn cael eu cynnal a'u cadw'n briodol. Yr wyf am weld ysgolion yn datblygu eu hamgylcheddau i ddarparu lleoedd diogel ond heriol. Unwaith eto, bydd llawer ohonoch wedi ymweld ag ysgolion cynradd ac ysgolion meithrin lle mae tir a arferai fod yn dir gwastraff bellach yn cael ei ddefnyddio fel rhan o le awyr agored y gall plant ymwneud ag ef.

Gwnaethoch y pwynt bod diffyg gweithgarwch corfforol ymhlith plant a phobl ifanc yn gallu arwain at rai o'r problemau iechyd yr ydym wedi'u gweld, fel gordewdra. Drwy chwarae, gall plant a phobl ifanc fabwysiadu ffordd iach o fyw. Mae ein polisi chwarae'n cydnabod pwysigrwydd maeth ac ymarfer corff yn natblygiad plentyn. Fel y dywedaso, gall rhedeg o amgylch parc neu faes chwarae drawsnewid plant yn llwyr, a'u helpu i ddatblygu eu gallu corfforol ynghyd â'u sgiliau cymdeithasol. Mae angen i rieni a'r gymuned sicrhau bod y lle hwnnw ar gael i'n plant a'n pobl ifanc.

Mae'r rhain yn lleoedd lle gall plant gyfarfod, cymdeithasu a chwarae mewn amgylchedd ysgogol sy'n ddiogel, a lle gallant fod yn hapus a chael eu gwerthfawrogi fel unigolion. Un o'm hatgofion mwyaf brawychus—yr oeddwn yn ferch ifanc eithaf anturus—oedd ceisio cropian drwy ddraen dan ffordd, mynd yn sownd hanner ffordd a gorfod cael fy nhynnu allan. Byddai hynny'n dychryn unrhyw riant. Fodd bynnag, fy synnwyr antur a aeth â mi i mewn i'r draen hwnnw, er i bobl eraill fy annog. Gall gemau mentrus fod yn bwysig, boed yn golygu mentro dringo coeden neu unrhyw weithgaredd arall. Mae'n golygu'r cydbwysedd y gallwn ei sicrhau yng nghyswllt trefniadau diogelu a risgiau.

Mae cyfrifoldeb arnom i adnabod y gwahaniaethau rhwng y dyddiau hynny a heddiw, yn enwedig y cynnydd mewn traffig ac absenoldeb lleoedd addas i blant chwarae. Bu gostyngiad yn nifer y plant a'r bobl ifanc sy'n cerdded i'r ysgol. Unwaith eto, cofiaf fod cerdded i'r ysgol yn cynnig pob math o gyfleoedd i fwynhau antur ac archwilio. Gallwn ymyrryd; gallwn roi arian i'r fenter Llwybrau Diogel i'r Ysgol. Mae'r fenter honno wedi bod yn un o'r buddsoddiadau

the most valuable investments for our children and young people.

We have to ensure that our children and young people have every chance to access play opportunities. It also brings communities together. Importantly—and you mentioned this—we should involve children and young people in decisions about what they want. When you ask schools councils and youth fora about Funky Dragon, play, and the freedom to play, they are not necessarily concerned about playgrounds, but open space. That is often the feedback that we receive. One year, for the national play day in August, Play Wales received permission to cordon off a number of streets, which, in times past, were probably full of children playing, but that is no longer the case because they are full of cars and are dangerous because of the heavy traffic.

The subject that you have raised today is very important. We have many initiatives, such as the forest school initiative, where a lot of good work is being carried out. It involves training teaching professionals to ensure that they can use the environment, but allow time for free play, exploration and social interaction. I do think that our forest school developments are—

Angela Burns: Thank you for giving way. I have been interested in what you have had to say, Minister, and, of course, you are talking about all the things that you can affect, such as the foundation phase, which, as you know, I am a great believer in. Could you give me a view on what the Government may be able to do—perhaps the Government cannot do anything about it—to help society itself to change this growing culture of fear? My concern is that in five or 10 years' time, it is just going to get bigger and bigger. As parents, we are endlessly told by experts us how bad we are at parenting and what we need to do here and there. I am not talking about people who take part in things such as Flying Start, which is another excellent programme; I am just talking about your average parent who does an averagely good job. You get to the point where you do not let your child do anything because you think that

mwyaf gwerthfawr i'n plant a'n pobl ifanc.

Rhaid inni sicrhau bod ein plant a'n pobl ifanc yn cael pob cyfle i fanteisio ar gyfleoedd chwarae. Mae'n dod â chymunedau at ei gilydd hefyd. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig—a gwnaethoch grybwyll hyn—yw y dylem gynnwys plant a phobl ifanc mewn penderfyniadau am yr hyn y mae arnynt ei eisiau. Pan ofynnwch i gynghorau ysgolion a fforymau ieuencid am y Ddraig Ffyni, chwarae, a'r rhyddid i chwarae, nid ydynt o reidrwydd yn pryderu am feysydd chwarae, ond am fannau agored. Yn aml, dyna'r adborth a gawn. Un flwyddyn, ar gyfer y diwrnod chwarae cenedlaethol ym mis Awst, cafodd Chwarae Cymru ganiatâd i gau nifer o strydoedd a fyddai yn y gorffennol yn llawn plant yn chwarae, mae'n debyg. Ond nid felly mae hi bellach gan eu bod yn llawn ceir ac yn beryglus oherwydd y traffig trwm.

Mae'r pwnc yr ydych wedi'i godi heddiw yn bwysig iawn. Mae gennym lawer o fentrau, megis y fenter ysgolion coedwig, lle mae llawer o waith da'n cael ei wneud. Mae'n golygu hyfforddi gweithwyr proffesiynol ym maes addysg i sicrhau y gallant ddefnyddio'r amgylchedd, gan ganiatáu amser i chwarae'n rhydd, archwilio a rhyngweithio'n gymdeithasol. Credaf yn wirioneddol fod ein datblygiadau o ran ysgolion coedwig yn—

Angela Burns: Diolch am ildio. Mae'r hyn a oedd gennych i'w ddweud, Weinidog, wedi bod o ddiddordeb mawr imi, ac wrth gwrs, yr ydych yn sôn am yr holl bethau y gallwch effeithio arnynt, megis y cyfnod sylfaen yr wyf yn credu'n gryf ynddo, fel y gwyddoch. A allech roi eich barn imi am yr hyn y gallai'r Llywodraeth ei wneud—efallai na all y Llywodraeth wneud dim amdano—i helpu cymdeithas ei hun i newid y diwylliant hwn o ofn sy'n tyfu? Fy mhryder i yw y bydd yn mynd yn fwy ac yn fwy mewn pum neu 10 mlynedd. Fel rhieni, bydd arbenigwyr yn dweud byth a hefyd wrthym ein bod yn rhieni gwael, a'r hyn y mae angen inni ei wneud yma ac acw. Nid sôn yr wyf am bobl sy'n cymryd rhan mewn pethau megis Dechrau'n Deg, sy'n rhaglen ardderchog arall; yr wyf yn sôn am y rhiant cyffredin sy'n gwneud gwaith da ar y cyfan. Byddwch yn cyrraedd rhyw fan lle byddwch yn gwrthod gadael i'ch

it is all wrong. There are many examples of that. We could talk for ages about all the things that we need to do with children. Do you have a view on whether Government might be able to influence that change in society that we need to see in order to give these freedoms back to our children?

Jane Hutt: You have provided us with an opportunity to open up a public debate about play and access and striking a balance. We are also fortunate in that we have funding coming through from, for example, the Big Lottery Fund's Mentro Allan programme—there was £6.5 million in investment, in fact. We also have the Big Lottery Fund's £13 million child's play programme. We can also talk to the Big Lottery Fund and work with it on other objectives, such as informing families and children about play opportunities and developing staffed open-access play opportunities and new play spaces for children in their communities. We need to open up this debate so that it is not just about what provision we want, but about engaging parents and children in the debate. We then need to ensure that our policies and funding programmes link to that.

In terms of the way forward, through the Proposed Children and Families (Wales) Measure we will be requiring local authorities to assess the sufficiency of play opportunities in their areas. That is not just about playgrounds; it is about play opportunities in the widest sense. In terms of the guidance, it will provide us with an opportunity to look at those issues that you have reflected on today, Angela, in a very positive way. I will certainly be taking that back.

Finally, in terms of assessing risk and ensuring that we have safeguards in place, it is true that a significant amount of childhood accidents are linked to socio-economic circumstances. We have to recognise that there are social and economic factors related to child pedestrian accidents, for example, and accidents in the home. They are linked to social circumstances. I know that Children in

plentyn wneud dim oherwydd eich bod yn meddwl bod popeth yn anghywir. Mae llawer o enghreifftiau o hynny. Gallem siarad yn hir am yr holl bethau y mae angen inni eu gwneud gyda phlant. A oes gennych farn a allai'r Llywodraeth ddylanwadu ar y newid hwnnw mewn cymdeithas y mae angen inni ei weld er mwyn rhoi'r rhyddid hwn yn ôl i'n plant?

Jane Hutt: Yr ydych wedi rhoi cyfle inni agor dadl gyhoeddus ar chwarae a mynediad a sicrhau cydbwysedd. Yr ydym yn ffodus hefyd fod gennym arian yn dod drwodd o raglen Mentro Allan y Gronfa Loteri Fawr, er enghraifft—buddsoddwyd £6.5 miliwn, mewn gwirionedd. Mae gennym raglen chwarae plant y Gronfa Loteri Fawr hefyd, sy'n werth £13 miliwn. Yn ogystal, gallwn siarad â Chronfa'r Loteri Fawr a gweithio gyda hi ar amcanion eraill, megis rhoi gwybod i deuluoedd a phlant am gyfleoedd chwarae a datblygu cyfleoedd chwarae mynediad agored wedi'u staffio, a lleoedd chwarae newydd i blant yn eu cymunedau. Mae angen inni agor y ddadl hon fel nad yw'n golygu'n unig pa ddarpariaeth y mae arnom ei heisiau, ond yn golygu cael rhieni a phlant i gymryd rhan yn y ddadl. Yna, mae angen inni sicrhau bod ein polisiau a'n rhaglenni ariannu'n cysylltu â hynny.

O ran y ffordd ymlaen, drwy Fesur Arfaethedig ynghylch Plant a Theuluoedd (Cymru), byddwn yn mynnu bod awdurdodau lleol yn asesu a yw'r cyfleoedd chwarae yn eu hardaloedd yn ddigonol. Nid yw hynny'n ymwneud â meysydd chwarae'n unig; mae'n ymwneud â chyfleoedd chwarae yn yr ystyr ehangaf. O ran y canllawiau, byddant yn cynnig cyfle inni edrych ar y materion hynny yr ydych wedi myfyrio yn eu cylch heddiw, Angela, mewn modd cadarnhaol iawn. Byddaf yn bendant yn mynd â hynny'n ôl gyda mi.

Yn olaf, o ran asesu risg a sicrhau bod gennym drefniadau diogelu ar waith, mae'n wir bod nifer sylweddol o ddamweiniau plentyndod yn gysylltiedig ag amgylchiadau economaidd-gymdeithasol. Rhaid inni gydnabod bod ffactorau cymdeithasol ac economaidd yn gysylltiedig â damweiniau i blant wrth gerdded, er enghraifft, a damweiniau yn y cartref. Maent yn

Wales has done some good work on this and I hope that the Children and Young People Committee will engage with Children in Wales to look at some of those issues. Those are risk factors on which I think that the Government has a responsibility in terms of the motivation and support of parents. It is not about interfering with parenting, it is about supporting parents. As you say, Flying Start is a very good way to start working with parents to enable them to give their children the sorts of opportunities that we want all our children to have, as I know that you seek to do with your children. It has been a valuable debate today and I would certainly like to read the 'Free-Range Kids' books that you have described. I look forward to hearing more from the Children and Young People Committee, but I think that it is perhaps up to you now, Angela, to set up your cross-party group.

gysylltiedig ag amgylchiadau cymdeithasol. Gwn fod Plant yng Nghymru wedi gwneud gwaith da ar hyn, a gobeithio y bydd y Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc yn ymgysylltu â Phlant yng Nghymru i edrych ar rai o'r materion hynny. Mae'r rheini'n ffactorau risg y credaf fod gan y Llywodraeth gyfrifoldeb drostynt o ran cymell a chefnogi rhieni. Nid yw'n golygu ymyrryd mewn rhianta; mae'n golygu cefnogi rhieni. Fel y dywedwch, mae Dechrau'n Deg yn ffordd dda iawn o ddechrau gweithio gyda rhieni i'w galluogi i roi'r mathau o gyfleoedd i'w plant yr ydym am i bob un o'n plant eu cael, fel y gwn yr ydych chi'n ceisio'i wneud gyda'ch plant chi. Mae wedi bod yn ddadl werthfawr heddiw, a byddwn yn sicr yn hoffi darllen y llyfrau 'Free-Range Kids' yr ydych wedi'u disgrifio. Edrychaf ymlaen at glywed mwy gan y Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc, ond credaf efallai mai chi ddylai fynd ati'n awr, Angela, i sefydlu eich grŵp trawsbleidiol.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Minister. That brings today's business to a close.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Diolch, Weinidog. Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 7.19 p.m.
The meeting ended at 7.19 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
Asghar, Mohammad (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Burns, Angela (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Andrew R.T. (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Davies, Paul (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Evans, Nerys (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Franks, Chris (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
Griffiths, Lesley (Llafur – Labour)
Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)

Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
Jenkins, Bethan (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Gareth (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)
Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
Millar, Darren (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
Ramsay, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Watson, Joyce (Llafur – Labour)
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)