



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru**  
**The National Assembly for Wales**

**Cofnod y Trafodion**  
**The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mawrth, 18 Mai 2010**  
**Tuesday, 18 May 2010**

**Cynnwys  
Contents**

- |    |                                                                                                                                      |
|----|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 3  | Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog<br>Questions to the First Minister                                                                      |
| 28 | Pwynt o Drefn<br>Point of Order                                                                                                      |
| 29 | Datganiad a Chyhoeddiad Busnes<br>Business Statement and Announcement                                                                |
| 37 | Datganiad am y Diwydiant Cyhoeddi Cymraeg<br>Statement on the Welsh Language Publishing Industry                                     |
| 46 | Datganiad am Adolygu Cost Gweinyddu'r System Addysg<br>Statement on the Review of the Cost of Administering Education                |
| 63 | Datganiad am Gyfnod Newydd Gweithgareddau Marchnata Croeso Cymru<br>Statement on the New Phase of Visit Wales's Marketing Activities |
| 80 | Bioamrywiaeth a Fframwaith yr Amgylchedd Naturiol<br>Biodiversity and the Natural Environment Framework                              |
| 99 | Cyfnod Pleidleisio<br>Voting Time                                                                                                    |

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy yn ddi yn y Siambr.  
 Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 1.30 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 1.30 p.m. with the Presiding Officer (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) in the Chair.*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn ar gyfer cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog. **The Presiding Officer:** Order for questions to the First Minister.

## **Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister**

### **Alcohol Abuse**

**Q1 Christine Chapman:** What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to tackle alcohol abuse in Wales? OAQ(3)2857(FM)

**The First Minister (Carwyn Jones):** Our substance misuse strategy for Wales gives a high priority to tackling alcohol misuse and is supported by funding of over £52.6 million for 2010-11.

**Christine Chapman:** Recent statistics show that deaths from alcohol abuse in Wales have almost trebled in a generation. There is a legacy of ill health in relation to alcohol, which is now cheaper and more widely available to buy. The drinking culture seems to start at a younger age than in other developed countries and the nation's growing addiction to alcohol puts a great strain on health services in Wales, particularly hospitals. While I welcome the partnership approach adopted by the Welsh Assembly Government through its 10-year substance misuse strategy on reducing alcohol abuse, would you agree that combating alcohol abuse should not only be about treating the consequences of alcohol-related harm but about active prevention, early intervention and heightened awareness of the problem?

**The First Minister:** You are right. That is why Alcohol Concern has been contracted to establish a Welsh base and staff. Its job is to raise awareness of alcohol misuse issues, to monitor and report on questionable alcohol labelling and promotion, and to lead on information campaigns. For example, in October last year, Alcohol Concern led on the

### **Cam-drin Alcohol**

**C1 Christine Chapman:** Beth mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â cham-drin alcohol yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)2857(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog (Carwyn Jones):** Mae ein strategaeth camddefnyddio sylweddau i Gymru'n rhoi blaenoriaeth uchel i fynd i'r afael â chamddefnyddio alcohol ac fe'i cefnogir â chyllid o dros £52.6 miliwn am 2010-11.

**Christine Chapman:** Mae ystadegau'n ddiweddar yn dangos bod marwolaethau yn sgîl cam-drin alcohol yng Nghymru wedi treblu bron mewn cenhedaeth. Ceir hanes o afiechyd sy'n gysylltiedig ag alcohol, sydd erbyn hyn yn rhatach ac yn haws ei brynu. Mae'n ymddangos bod y diwylliant yfed yn dechrau pan fydd pobl yn iau nag mewn gwledydd datblygedig eraill ac mae caethiwed cynyddol y genedl i alcohol yn rhoi straen mawr ar wasanaethau iechyd yng Nghymru, yn enwedig ysbtyai. Er fy mod yn croesawu'r dull partneriaeth sydd wedi'i fabwysiadu gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru drwy ei strategaeth 10 mlynedd ar gamddefnyddio sylweddau i leihau cam-drin alcohol, a gytunech y dylai'r frwydr yn erbyn cam-drin alcohol ymneud nid yn unig â thrin canlyniadau niwed cysylltiedig ag alcohol ond â chamau i atal yfed, ymyrryd yn gynnar a chynyddu ymwybyddiaeth o'r broblem?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych yn iawn. Dyna pam y mae Alcohol Concern wedi cael contract i sefydlu canolfan a staff yng Nghymru. Ei waith yw codi ymwybyddiaeth o faterion camddefnyddio alcohol, monitro a rhoi adroddiadau am arferion amheus o ran labelu a hyrwyddo alcohol, ac arwain ymgyrchoedd gwybodaeth. Er enghraifft, ym

promotion of Alcohol Awareness Week, which focused on drinking at home and the positive steps that people can take to change their drinking habits. Therefore, you are quite right: it is not only about treatment, but about prevention.

**Mark Isherwood:** We must, of course, focus on tackling the causes as well as treating the symptoms of the problem. Your Government has indicated its support for a minimum price per unit of alcohol. That follows the position taken by the minority Scottish Government, although it is a position that has been opposed by Scottish Labour, the Scottish Conservatives and the Scottish Liberal Democrats on the grounds of legality, unintended consequences and a lack of evidence that it would have a significant impact on harmful consumption. The Sheffield University model of effective minimum pricing in Scotland has been cited by your Government, but that has recently been revised downwards, as the original model did not make use of the most recent consumption data available. There are also concerns that if we were to take action in Wales independently of our neighbours, it would affect Welsh business as it would increase cross-border shopping. Do you therefore recognise that raising alcohol prices across the board for consumers would have a disproportionate impact on those on low incomes and responsible drinkers, and that target measures are needed to affect the minority who misuse alcohol? Tackling alcohol misuse is complex, and we need to work with the industry and the voluntary sector on schemes such as community alcohol partnerships to address the underlying causes.

**The First Minister:** I do not follow the argument, Mark, that raising the price of alcohol somehow affects moderate drinkers disproportionately. It is bound to affect those who drink more, because they will pay more for what they consume. That is self evident. You make an important point on regressive taxation. When value-added tax is increased, for example, it is often the poorest who have to pay more. I would welcome any opposition that you may show to any rise in VAT in the budget that we will see in June.

mis Hydref y llynedd, arweiniodd Alcohol Concern y gwaith o hyrwyddo Wythnos Ymwybyddiaeth Alcohol, a ganolbwytiodd ar yfed gartref a'r camau cadarnhaol y gall pobl eu cymryd i newid eu harferion yfed. Felly, yr ydych yn llygad eich lle: nid triniaeth yw'r unig nod, ond atal hefyd.

**Mark Isherwood:** Rhaid inni ganolbwytio, wrth gwrs, ar fynd i'r afael â'r achosion yn ogystal â thrin symptomau'r broblem. Mae eich Llywodraeth wedi datgan ei chefnogaeth i isafswm pris am bob uned o alcohol. Mae hynny'n dilyn safwynt Llywodraeth leiafrifol yr Alban, er ei fod yn safwynt a wrthwynebwyd gan Lafur yr Alban, Ceidwadwyr yr Alban a Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yr Alban ar sail cyfreithlondeb, canlyniadau anfwriadol a diffyg tystiolaeth y cai effaith sylweddol ar yfed niweidiol. Mae eich Llywodraeth wedi cyfeirio at fodel Prifysgol Sheffield o isafswm pris effeithiol yn yr Alban, ond mae hwnnw wedi'i ddiwygio'n ddiweddar ac mae'n is erbyn hyn, gan nad oedd y model gwreiddiol yn defnyddio'r data diweddar ar yfed a oedd ar gael. Ceir pryderon hefyd pe cymerem gamau yng Nghymru yn annibynnol ar ein cymdogion, y byddai'n effeithio ar fusnes yng Nghymru gan y byddai'n annog mwy o siopa dros y ffin. A ydych yn cydnabod felly y byddai codi prisiau alcohol yn ddiwahân i gwsmeriaid yn cael effaith anghymesur ar bobl ar incwm isel ac yfwyr cyfrifol, a bod angen targedu mesurau i effeithio ar y lleiafrif sy'n camddefnyddio alcohol? Mater cymhleth yw delio â chamddefnyddio alcohol, ac mae angen inni weithio gyda'r diwydiant a'r sector gwirfoddol ar gynlluniau fel partneriaethau alcohol cymunedol i fynd i'r afael â'r achosion gwaelodol.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn dilyn y ddadl, Mark, fod codi pris alcohol rywsut yn effeithio ar yfwyr cymedrol mewn modd anghymesur. Mae'n siŵr o effeithio ar y rhai sy'n yfed mwy, oherwydd byddant yn talu mwy am yr hyn a yfant. Mae hynny'n hunanamlwg. Gwnaethoch bwynt pwysig ynglŷn â threthi sy'n mynd â chanran uwch o incwm rhai sydd ag incwm isel. Pan gynyddir treth ar werth, er enghraifft, y tlotaф sy'n gorfol talu mwy yn aml. Byddwn yn croesawu unrhyw wrthwynebiad a fynegwch

i unrhyw gynnydd mewn treth ar werth yn y gyllideb a welwn ym mis Mehefin.

**Joyce Watson:** I take this opportunity to highlight the lack of understanding that exists with regard to alcohol consumption. I am grateful for the statement that the Minister for Health and Social Services made recently on this issue, highlighting the damage that alcohol can cause to society and the economy. I believe that there is a poor understanding of the unit-based system that informs people about what is considered to be a safe amount of alcohol to drink. It is clear that the amount that people drink is dictated by the amount of money in their wallets rather than the number of units contained in the bottle. For that reason, the availability of cheap alcohol from shops is potentially extremely damaging. With the football world cup about to begin, we are seeing advertisements on the television suggesting that in order to have a good time, you need a beer in your hand. The consumption of alcohol inevitably increases around major sporting events and the availability of strong, cheap alcohol will compound this problem. Can you give me some assurances that efforts will be made in Wales to provide better education on alcohol consumption?

**The First Minister:** That comes back to what I said about Alcohol Concern. We should make it clear that we are not suggesting that people should become teetotal; it is simply a matter of drinking sensibly. The major difference over the past decade or so is the rise in the consumption of cheap spirits, which means that people can drink a lot more than they could when they used to drink pints; it also means that people can get themselves into a situation where they are either helpless or get injured. That is the real change in society over the past 10 or 20 years, and that is where one focus should be when it comes to reducing alcohol consumption.

**David Lloyd:** Yn wahanol i Mark Isherwood, credaf mai rhan o'r ateb yw codi pris alcohol. Cefnogaf yn gryf yr hyn y mae Llywodraeth yr SNP yn ei wneud yn yr Alban, gan fod ymchwil meddygol dros y blynnyddoedd wedi dangos bod pobl yn yfed

**Joyce Watson:** Achubaf y cyfle hwn i dynnu sylw at y diffyg dealltwriaeth sydd ynghlŷn ag yfed alcohol. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y datganiad a wnaeth y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn ddiweddar am y mater hwn, gan dynnu sylw at y niwed y gall alcohol ei achosi i gymdeithas a'r economi. Credaf nad oes dealtwriaeth ddigonol o'r system unedau sy'n dweud wrth bobl faint o alcohol y bernir ei bod yn ddiogel ei yfed. Mae'n amlwg mai faint o arian sydd yn eu waledi, yn hytrach na nifer yr unedau yn y botel, sy'n pennu faint y bydd pobl yn ei yfed. Am y rheswm hwnnw, gall yffaith bod alcohol ar gael yn rhad mewn siopau fod yn eithriadol o niweidiol. A chwpan y byd (pêl-droed) ar fin dechrau, yr ydym yn gweld hysbysebion ar y teledu sy'n awgrymu, er mwyn cael hwyl, fod yn rhaid cael cwrw yn eich llaw. Yn anochel, bydd mwy o yfed alcohol o gwmpas digwyddiadau mawr ym myd chwaraeon ac os bydd alcohol cryf, rhad, ar gael bydd hynny'n gwaethgu'r broblem hon. A allwch roi sicrywydd imi y gwneir ymdrechion yng Nghymru i ddarparu gwell addysg am yfed alcohol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Daw hynny'n ôl at yr hyn a ddywedais am Alcohol Concern. Dylem ddweud yn glir nad ydym yn awgrymu y dylai pobl droi'n llwyrymrthodwyr; dim ond mater o yfed yn gall ydyw. Y gwahaniaeth mawr yn y deng mlynedd diwethaf yw'r cynnydd mewn yfed gwiroydd rhad, sy'n golygu y gall pobl yfed llawer mwy nag a allent pan arferent yfed peintiau; mae'n golygu hefyd y gall pobl fynd i sefyllfa lle y maent naill ai'n ddiymadferth neu'n anafu eu hunain. Dyna'r newid gwirioneddol mewn cymdeithas dros y 10 neu 20 mlynedd diwethaf, a dyna un man lle y dylid canolbwytio o ran lleihau faint o alcohol a yfir.

**David Lloyd:** Unlike Mark Isherwood, I think that part of the solution is to increase the price of alcohol. I strongly support what the Scottish National Party Government is doing in Scotland, as medical research over the years has shown that people drink less if

llai os yw alcohol yn ddrud ac os yw'n anodd cael gafael arno—dyna'r ddau beth sy'n dod allan o'r dystiolaeth sydd ar gael. Felly, pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi'u cynnal ynghylch y posiblwydd o osod isafswm pris ar alcohol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Codwyd y mater hwn gyda Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig wrth edrych ar ein polisi fel Llywodraeth. Mae'n wir dweud bod rhai pethau wedi newid. Ar un adeg, yn y 1990au, yr oedd bar ym mharc Cathays, sef adeilad y Swyddfa Gymreig ar y pryd. Y diwylliant ar un adeg, yn enwedig mewn rhai swyddi penodol, oedd cael cwpl o beints amser cinio. Mae'r diwylliant hwnnw wedi mynd, diolch i'r drefn. Fodd bynnag, mae'n wir dweud bod problem arall wedi codi yn awr, sef goryfed, yn enwedig o ran rhai diodydd, fel gwiroydd, sy'n gallu cael mwy o effaith ar bobl. Rhaid inni edrych ar bob ffordd o leihau faint y mae pobl yn ei yfed ac mae gosod isafswm pris ar alcohol yn un ffordd o wneud hynny.

### Musgrave Engine

**Q2 Bethan Jenkins:** Has the Welsh Assembly Government taken any steps to safeguard the historic Musgrave engine still on site in the Hafod copper works in Swansea? OAQ(3)2864(FM)

**The First Minister:** The engine house has statutory protection as a scheduled ancient monument and listed building. Proposals to consolidate the remains would be eligible for a grant from Cadw. I understand that the City and County of Swansea has looked for expressions of interest from potential developers with regard to developing the site.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Will you join me in urging the City and County of Swansea Council to take immediate steps to save the important industrial heritage in the Hafod copper works, which is at risk? While I am pleased that the council has announced sympathetic development plans for the site, that does not address the short-term issue of the preservation of the Musgrave engine. Therefore, will you confirm, as I think that you hinted at in your initial response, that Cadw has a role in protecting industrial

alcohol is expensive and if it is difficult to access—those are the two main findings of the evidence that is available. Therefore, what discussions have you had regarding the possibility of setting a minimum price for alcohol?

**The First Minister:** This issue was raised with the UK Government in looking at our policy as a Government. It is true to say that some things have changed. At one time, in the 1990s, there was a bar in Cathays park, which was the Welsh Office building at the time. The culture at one time, especially in certain positions, was to have a couple of pints at lunchtime. That culture has gone, thankfully. However, it is true to say that another problem has arisen now, namely binge drinking, particularly in respect of certain drinks, such as spirits, which can have a greater impact on some people. We must look at all ways of reducing the amount that people drink, and setting a minimum price on alcohol is one way to do that.

### Peiriant Musgrave

**C2 Bethan Jenkins:** A yw Llywodraeth Cymru wedi cymryd unrhyw gamau i ddiogelu'r peiriant Musgrave hanesyddol sydd yn dal ar y safle yng ngwaith copr yr Hafod yn Abertawe? OAQ(3)2864(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Caiff y peiriandy ei ddiogelu'n statudol fel heneb gofrestredig ac adeilad rhestrydig. Byddai grant ar gael gan Cadw ar gyfer y cynigion i atgyfnerthu'r gweddillion. Deallaf fod Dinas a Sir Abertawe wedi edrych am ddatganiadau o ddiddordeb gan ddatblygwyr possibl o ran datblygu'r safle.

**Bethan Jenkins:** A ymunwch â mi i annog Cyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe i gymryd camau ar fyrdar i ddiogelu'r dreftadaeth ddiwydiannol bwysig yng ngwaith copr yr Hafod, sydd mewn perygl? Er fy mod yn falch bod y cyngor wedi cyhoeddi cynlluniau datblygu cydnaws ar gyfer y safle, nid yw hynny'n datrys cwestiwn tymor byr cadw'r peiriant Musgrave. Felly, a wnewch gadarnhau, fel yr awgrymasoch, fe gredaf, yn eich ymateb cyntaf, fod gan Cadw rôl i warchod treftadaeth ddiwydiannol fel y

heritage such as the Musgrave engine?

**The First Minister:** Cadw would schedule an ancient monument, but that does not mean that it will automatically be looked after by Cadw. That said, it would be eligible for a grant from Cadw and I urge the City and County of Swansea Council—I think that it is already doing this—to move forward as quickly as possible, now that the economy is on the upturn, to develop the site sympathetically in order to preserve the engine itself. It has not been used for 30 years and has suffered a great deal from vandalism and it is important that this is dealt with as quickly as possible.

**Val Lloyd:** I have, for some time, been in contact with your heritage and regeneration colleagues to explore how the Welsh Assembly Government can assist in the regeneration of the Hafod copper works site. Not only is the Musgrave engine house, as you mentioned, an ancient monument, but on the perimeter of the site there are some conserved rolling mills that are also of heritage significance. As you say, the City and County of Swansea Council has issued the development brief for the development of the whole area, which is of considerable size. It also includes points of considerable historic interest. Following the selection of a partner, activity will turn to focusing on options for regeneration of the site. Do you agree that redevelopment must take into account the views of the local community in order to maximise its potential as a shared community facility?

1.40 p.m.

**The First Minister:** Yes, I very much agree with that. It is important that, where a redevelopment such as this is proposed, there is as much community involvement as possible. There needs to be buy-in from the local community and I do not think that you can have too much consultation when it comes to taking forward such a development. Therefore, I am glad that there is movement now on developing the site sympathetically and I would urge the local community to be as involved as possible.

peiriant Musgrave?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Byddai Cadw yn cofrestru heneb, ond nid yw hynny'n golygu y bydd Cadw o reidrwydd yn gofalu amdani. Wedi dweud hynny, byddai'n gymwys i gael grant gan Cadw ac yr wyf yn annog Cyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe—credaf ei fod eisoes yn gwneud hyn—i symud ymlaen cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl, gan fod yr economi bellach yn dechrau gwella, i ddatblygu'r safle gyda chydymdeimlad er mwyn cadw'r peiriant ei hun. Nid yw wedi'i ddefnyddio ers 30 mlynedd ac mae llawer iawn o fandaleiddio wedi bod arno ac mae'n bwysig delio â hyn cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl.

**Val Lloyd:** Yr wyf, ers tro, wedi bod mewn cysylltiad â'ch cydweithwyr ym maes treftadaeth ac adfywio i weld sut y gall Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gynorthwyo gydag adfywio safle gwaith copr yr Hafod. Nid yn unig y mae peiriandy Musgrave, fel y soniasoch, yn heneb, ond ar gyrrion y safle mae melinau rholio sydd wedi'u cadw, sydd hwythau ac arwyddocâd iddynt o safbwyt treftadaeth. Fel y dywedwch, mae Cyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe wedi cyhoeddi'r briff datblygu ar gyfer datblygu'r ardal gyfan, sydd o grym faintioli. Mae hefyd yn cynnwys pwyntiau o ddiddordeb hanesyddol sylweddol. Ar ôl dewis partner, bydd y gweithgaredd yn troi at ganolbwytio ar opsiynau ar gyfer adfywio'r safle. A ydych yn cytuno bod yn rhaid i ddatblygiad roi ystyriaeth i farn y gymuned leol er mwyn manteisio i'r eithaf ar ei botensial fel cyfleuster a rennir gan y gymuned?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ydwyt, yr wyf yn cytuno'n llwyr â hynny. Mae'n bwysig, lle y cynigir ailddatblygiad fel hwn, i'r gymuned ymwneud cymaint ag sy'n bosibl â hyn. Mae angen iddo gael cefnogaeth gan y gymuned leol ac nid wyf yn meddwl y gellir cael gormod o ymgynghori pan ddaw'n fater o fwrw ymlaen â datblygiad o'r fath. Felly, yr wyf yn falch bod symudiad yn awr o ran datblygu'r safle gyda chydymdeimlad a byddwn yn annog y gymuned leol i ymwneud cymaint ag sy'n bosibl â hyn.

## Sporting Heritage

**Q3 Chris Franks:** What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to mark Wales's sporting heritage? OAQ(3)2863(FM)

**The First Minister:** We are very proud of Wales's sporting heritage. A Welsh Sports Hall of Fame has now been established at the Millennium Stadium.

**Chris Franks:** Thank you for that reply, First Minister. As you are probably aware, a grass-roots fundraising campaign has been launched by fans of Cardiff City Football Club to erect a statue in honour of Fred Keenor and the FA Cup-winning team in 1927—the only time that the FA Cup has been taken out of England. Fred captained the Cardiff City side, but also played for Wales on over 30 occasions during a period when many fewer internationals were played and despite being injured in the Somme. Fred, who was Cardiff born, is a true Welsh hero, who played at a time when footballers were not well paid. Will you give your support to this worthy fundraising campaign, which is organised by volunteers led by the Cardiff City Supporters' Trust?

**The First Minister:** I can certainly give moral support. I am aware of what happened in 1927, although, clearly, I was not there. It is something that is writ large not only in the history of Cardiff City, but in the history of the city of Cardiff itself.

With regard to financial support, criteria are used by the Minister for Heritage in deciding whether or not such a statue would get support, because it is important to understand that we cannot support everything. However, I certainly wish the proponents of the statue well in looking to turn this into reality.

**William Graham:** First Minister, you will know that South Wales East has a proud sporting history, particularly this year, as Newport County AFC has been promoted to the Conference. Could you record

## Treftadaeth Chwaraeon

**C3 Chris Franks:** Beth mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i nodi treftadaeth chwaraeon Cymru? OAQ(3)2863(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym yn falch iawn o dreftadaeth chwaraeon Cymru. Mae Oriel Anfarwolion Chwaraeon Cymru bellach wedi'i sefydlu yn Stadiwm y Mileniwm.

**Chris Franks:** Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Brif Weinidog. Fel y gwyddoch, mae'n debyg, mae ymgyrch codi arian wedi'i lansio gan gefnogwyr Clwb Pêl-droed Dinas Caerdydd i godi cerflun i anrhyydeddu Fred Keenor a'r tîm a enillodd Gwpan F.A. Lloegr yn 1927—yr unig dro i neb o'r tu allan i Loegr ennill y cwpan. Fred oedd capten tîm Caerdydd, ond chwaraeodd hefyd dros Gymru fwy na 30 o weithiau yn ystod cyfnod pryd y chwaraeid llawer llai o gemau rhyngwladol ac er iddo gael ei anafu yn y Somme. Mae Fred, a anwyd yng Nghaerdydd, yn wir arwr Cymreig, a chwaraeodd ar adeg pan na châi peldroedwyr eu talu'n dda. A roddwch eich cefnogaeth i'r ymgyrch werth chweil hon i godi arian, a drefnir gan wirfoddolwyr o dan arweiniad Ymddiriedolaeth Cefnogwyr Dinas Caerdydd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn sicr gallaf roi cefnogaeth foesol. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r hyn a ddigwyddodd yn 1927, er nad oeddwn yno, wrth reswm. Mae'n rhywbeth y mae iddo le amlwg nid yn unig yn hanes clwb pêl-droed Caerdydd, ond yn hanes dinas Caerdydd ei hun.

Ynglŷn â chefnogaeth ariannol, defnyddir meini prawf gan y Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth i benderfynu a gâi cerflun o'r fath gefnogaeth ai peidio, oherwydd y mae'n bwysig deall na allwn gefnogi popeth. Fodd bynnag, yn sicr, dymunaf bob llwyddiant i hyrwyddwyr y cerflun wrth geisio gwireddu hyn.

**William Graham:** Brif Weinidog, byddwch yn gwybod bod gan Ddwyrain De Cymru hanes i ymfalchiō ynddo ym myd chwaraeon, yn enwedig eleni, a chlwb pêl-droed Casnewydd wedi ennill dyrchafiad i'r

something—[*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. It is not appropriate to interrupt the distinguished questioner when he is deploying a supplementary question.

**William Graham:** How very kind.

Could you record something to mark this occasion? Newport County AFC has been trying to achieve this for many years, and it is a real achievement that is felt throughout the city. I could ask you to rename a bridge. I think that Pont Calzaghe in Newbridge might be a step too far, at a cost of some £2.6 million, but one of the existing bridges does not have a name and renaming it would be a great memorial for the city.

**The First Minister:** I welcome Newport County AFC's promotion to the Blue Square Premier and the fact that it achieved over 100 points in the course of the season—no other team was close to being promoted. It will be in the same division as Wrexham next year, which I am sure will be a cause of rivalry between John Griffiths and Lesley Griffiths.

I wish Cardiff City the best of luck for its game against Blackpool this Saturday. Let us hope that a team from Wales can play at the top level of English football for the first time since Swansea City was relegated in 1984. I hope that other Welsh teams will join it there in the near future—whether it is the Swans next year, or Wrexham and Newport County in four or five years' time perhaps. However, I certainly wish Cardiff City all the best on Saturday. I am tempted to ask Leighton Andrews to do the same for Swansea next year, but perhaps that is a step too far. [*Laughter.*] It would be marvellous for both Cardiff and Wales if we could see the Bluebirds playing in the Premier League next year, and I hope that the Swans join it there next season.

**Ann Jones:** On a day when Rhyl FC has been relegated to the Cymru Alliance, by an indiscretion on the part of the Football Association of Wales, I wish Rhyl well.

Conference. A allech gofnodi rhywbeth—  
[*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw'n briodol torri ar draws yr holwr hybarch pan fo hwnnw'n gofyn cwestiwn atodol.

**William Graham:** Caredig iawn.

A allech gofnodi rhywbeth i nodi'r achlysur hwn? Mae clwb pêl-droed Casnewydd wedi bod yn ceisio cyflawni hyn ers blynnyddoedd lawer, ac mae'n gamp wirioneddol a deimlir drwy'r ddinas gyfan. Gallwn ofyn ichi ailenu pont. Efallai y byddai Pont Calzaghe yn Nhrecelyn gam yn rhy bell, ar gost o ryw £2.6 miliwn, ond mae un o'r pontydd presennol yn ddiennw a byddai ei hainenwi yn rhoi cofeb wych i'r ddinas.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn croesawu dyrchafiad clwb pêl-droed Casnewydd i gynghrair y Blue Square Premier a'r ffaith iddo ennill dros 100 pwynt yn ystod y tymor—nid oedd yr un tîm arall yn agos at ennill dyrchafiad. Bydd yn yr un adran â Wrecsam y flwyddyn nesaf, a bydd hynny'n destun cystadleuaeth, mae'n siŵr, rhwng John Griffiths a Lesley Griffiths.

Dymunaf bob hwyl i dim Caerdydd yn ei gêm yn erbyn Blackpool ddydd Sadwrn. Gadewch inni obeithio y gall tîm o Gymru chwarae ar lefel uchaf pêl-droed Lloegr am y tro cyntaf ers i dim Dinas Abertawe golli ei le yn 1984. Gobeithio y gwnaiff timau eraill o Gymru ymuno â hwy yno yn y dyfodol agos—boed y Swans y flwyddyn nesaf, neu Wrecsam a Chasnewydd ymhen pedair neu bum mlynedd efallai. Fodd bynnag, yn sicr, dymunaf i dim Caerdydd bob hwyl ddydd Sadwrn. Caf fy nhemtio i ofyn i Leighton Andrews wneud yr un peth i Abertawe y flwyddyn nesaf, ond efallai fod hynny gam yn rhy bell. [*Chwerthin.*] Byddai'n wych i Gaerdydd a Chymru pe gallem weld yr Adar Gleision yn chwarae yn yr Uwch Gynghrair y flwyddyn nesaf, a gobeithio y bydd y Swans yn ymuno â hwy yno y tymor nesaf.

**Ann Jones:** Ar ddiwrnod pan yw clwb pêl-droed y Rhyl wedi ei ostwng i'r Cymru Alliance, drwy amryfusedd ar ran Cymdeithas Bêl-droed Cymru, dymunaf yn

Perhaps we should look to join the English Premier League. However, that I not why I rose to speak, First Minister.

Will you join me in congratulating a group of students with learning difficulties from Llangefni and Pengwyn who are going out to play in Geneva to represent Wales in the European Football Tournament? Will you join me in wishing Kevin, the captain, and his squad all the best, and in hoping to see them back here with the trophy?

**The First Minister:** That would give me great pleasure, and I join you in wishing them all the best for the forthcoming tournament.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Wales has a proud record of major success in international competitions. What plans do you have to improve Wales's chance of success in the summer and winter Olympics? In view of the difficulty that Wembley has had with its turf, what discussions are taking place with regard to future use of the Millennium Stadium should England's bid to host the 2018 FIFA World Cup be successful?

**The First Minister:** That is a matter for the appropriate governing bodies, whether it is the Football Association or the Football Association of Wales. You will be aware that our sporting strategy has been developed over the years through the 'Climbing Higher' strategy.

### Cymorth Ariannol i Fyfyrwyr

**C4 Nerys Evans:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am gymorth ariannol i fyfyrwyr yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)2851(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn 2009-10, buddsoddodd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru tua £833 miliwn mewn addysg uwch, gan gynnwys £373 miliwn i roi cymorth i fyfyrwyr.

**Nerys Evans:** Un o amcanion Llywodraeth Cymru yw ei pholisi i gyflwyno cynllun cenedlaethol bwrsarïau i fyfyrwyr yng Nghymru. Mae hwn yn ymrwymiad hynod o

dda i'r Rhyl. Efallai y dylem ninnau geisio ymuno â Phrif Glynghrair Lloegr. Fodd bynnag, nid dyna pam y codais i siarad, Brif Weinidog.

A wnewch chi ymuno â mi i longyfarch criw o fyfyrwyr ag anawsterau dysgu o Langefni a Pengwyn sy'n mynd allan i chwarae yng Ngenefa i gynrychioli Cymru yn y Twrnamaint Pêl-droed Ewropeaidd? A wnewch ymuno â mi i ddymuno pob hwyl i Kevin, y capten, a'i garfan, ac i obeithio eu gweld yn ôl yma gyda'r cwpan?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Byddai hynny'n rhoi pleser mawr imi, ac ymunaf â chi i ddymuno'r gorau iddynt yn y twrnamaint sydd i ddod.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae gan Gymru record i ymfalchiö ynddi o lwyddiant mawr mewn cystadlaethau rhyngwladol. Pa gynlluniau sydd gennych i wella siawns Cymru o lwyddo yng ngemau Olympaidd yr haf a'r gaeaf? Yn wyneb y drafferth y mae Wembley wedi'i chael gyda'i glaswellt, pa drafodaethau sy'n digwydd ynglŷn â defnyddio Stadiwm y Mileniwm yn y dyfodol pe bai cais Lloegr i gynnal Cwpan y Byd FIFA yn 2018 yn llwyddiannus?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mater i'r cyrff llywodraethu priodol yw hynny, boed Gymdeithas Bêl-droed Lloegr neu Gymru. Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod ein strategaeth chwaraeon wedi'i datblygu dros y blynyddoedd drwy'r strategaeth 'Dringo'n Uwch'.

### Financial Support for Students

**Q4 Nerys Evans:** Will the First Minister make a statement on financial support for students in Wales? OAQ(3)2851(FM)

**The First Minister:** In 2009-10, the Welsh Assembly Government invested approximately £833 million in higher education, including £373 million for student support.

**Nerys Evans:** One of the Welsh Government's objectives is its policy to introduce a national bursary scheme for students in Wales. This commitment is

bwysig wrth edrych ar y sefyllfa bresennol, gyda gwahaniaethau sylfaenol yng nghynlluniau bwrsari'r prifysgolion, gwahaniaeth mawr yn y modd y ceisir am yr arian, a gwahaniaeth mawr ym mhwrpas a maint y bwrsari o un brifysgol i'r llall. Pryd bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn gwireddu'r polisi o gyflwyno cynllun bwrsari cenedlaethol a fydd yn ailddosbarthu'r cyllid sydd ar gael ar hyn o bryd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hwn yn rhywbeth sy'n cael ei ystyried ar hyn o bryd. Yr ydym yn gobethio bod mewn sefyllfa i wneud datganiad tua diwedd y mis.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Nick Bourne):** On the subject of education, I am aware that the Minister is to make a statement on the review of the cost of administering education later this afternoon, and although it is somewhat late, we very much welcome that. I know that a similar review is being spearheaded by McKinsey on the cost of administering the health service. Is this something that you will carry across all areas of Government? It is certainly something that we would welcome, as we all recognise that we will have to do more for less. If you are doing it for all areas of Government, are you pulling it together within the Government to contrast spending in different areas of Government, rather than looking at it as silos?

**The First Minister:** You have to remember that health and education take the lion's share of the Government's spending. The intention of the review is not to identify money that could be saved by not being used, but to ensure that we look at reprioritising funds at the front line of education. That is something that we will continue to do throughout every department in Government, because we know that there will be challenging financial times over the next few years, and it is essential that we identify every single penny for use in front-line services. That is why the review was so welcome.

**Nick Bourne:** I thank the Minister for that, and I welcome what he has just said.

particularly important considering the current situation in which there are fundamental differences in universities' plans for bursaries, a major difference in how the funds are applied for, and a major difference in the purpose and size of bursary from one university to another. When will the Government of Wales achieve the policy of introducing a national bursary scheme that will redistribute the funds available at the moment?

**The First Minister:** This is something that is being considered at present. We hope to be in a position to make a statement towards the end of the month.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Nick Bourne):** Ar bwnc addysg, yr wyf yn ymwybodol y bydd y Gweinidog yn gwneud datganiad ar yr adolygiad o gost gweinyddu addysg yn ddiweddarach y prynhawn yma, ac er ei fod braidd yn hwyr, yr ydym yn croesawu hynny'n fawr. Gwn fod adolygiad tebyg yn cael ei arwain gan McKinsey o gost gweinyddu'r gwasanaeth iechyd. A yw hyn yn rhywbeth y byddem yn ei groesawu, gan ein bod i gyd yn cydnabod y bydd yn rhaid inni wneud mwy gyda llai. Os ydych yn ei wneud ar gyfer pob maes yn y Llywodraeth, a ydych yn dod â'r canlyniadau at ei gilydd o fewn y Llywodraeth i gyferbynnu gwariant mewn gwahanol feisydd yn y Llywodraeth, yn hytrach nag edrych ar bob un yn annibynnol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Rhaid cofio mai iechyd ac addysg sy'n gyfrifol am y rhan fwyaf o wariant y Llywodraeth. Nid bwriad yr adolygiad yw canfod arian y gellid ei arbed drwy beidio â'i ddefnyddio, ond sicrhau ein bod yn edrych ar ailflaenorhaethu arian yn rheng flaen addysg. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth y byddwn yn parhau i'w wneud drwy bob adran yn y Llywodraeth, oherwydd gwyddom y bydd y blynnyddoedd nesaf yn gyfnod ariannol dyrys, ac mae'n hanfodol inni ganfod pob un geiniog i'w defnyddio mewn gwasanaethau rheng flaen. Dyna pam yr oedd yr adolygiad mor dderbynol.

**Nick Bourne:** Diolch i'r Gweinidog am hynny, ac yr wyf yn croesawu'r hyn y mae

Returning to the point that Nerys Evans made about student support and higher education, there is ongoing concern about the level of tuition fees and the cost of higher education. This issue is being looked at—the Russell Group issued a statement yesterday—in England by the Lord Browne review. What input have you had into that review as a Welsh Assembly Government, given that we are not an island and that we therefore need to consider the impact of what happens in England because of Welsh students studying there and English students studying in Wales, and given the impact that it would have in any case on research funding and the movement of staff and so on?

**The First Minister:** We have generous support for HE students in Wales, and we have the Assembly learning grant as well. The Browne review is taking place in England, and we understand that its recommendations are due in the autumn. We will consider the implications for Wales at that point.

**Nick Bourne:** I take that to mean that there is no input at this stage. I am not sure whether that is the case, but it would be welcome if input were to be given. Another issue—I would not say that it has bedevilled the higher education scene, but it has certainly been a feature of it since the Assembly has been up and running—is that of mergers across the sector, some of them very successful. Given that we have probably reached the end of the road on mergers, so I will put it to you: have we? Trinity Saint David, which is in my region, is certainly a welcome example, but I know that it is seen as a way of saving money. What is the Government's view on future mergers, and are you looking at this as a way of making the sector more efficient and/or saving money?

1.50 p.m.

**The First Minister:** There is an undoubtedly need for our higher education institutions to collaborate more closely than has been the case historically. It is also true that if you look at the size of our universities, compared with the top universities in Europe and across the world, you will see that they are on the

newydd ei ddweud. A dychwelyd at y pwynt a wnaeth Nerys Evans am gymorth i fyfyrwyr ac addysg uwch, ceir pryder o hyd am lefel ffioedd dysgu a chost addysg uwch. Mae sylw'n cael ei roi i'r mater hwn—cyhoeddodd Grŵp Russell ddatganiad ddoe—yn Lloegr gan adolygiad yr Arglwydd Browne. Pa fewnbwn a gawsoch i'r adolygiad hwnnw fel Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, o gofio nad ynys ydym a bod angen felly inni ystyried effaith yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn Lloegr oherwydd bod myfyrwyr o Gymru'n astudio yno a myfyrwyr o Loegr yn astudio yng Nghymru, ac yn wyneb yr effaith a gâi ar gyllid ymchwil a symudiad staff ac yn y blaen, beth bynnag?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae gennym gymorth hael i fyfyrwyr addysg uwch yng Nghymru, ac mae gennym grant dysgu'r Cynulliad hefyd. Mae adolygiad Browne yn digwydd yn Lloegr, a deallwn y disgwylir ei argymhellion yn yr hydref. Ystyriwn y goblygiadau i Gymru bryd hynny.

**Nick Bourne:** Cymeraf fod hynny'n golygu nad oes dim mewnbwn ar hyn o bryd. Nid wyf yn siŵr a yw hynny'n wir, ond byddai'n amheuthun pe rhoddir mewnbwn. Mater arall—ni ddywedwn ei fod wedi tarfu ar addysg uwch, ond yn sicr mae wedi bod yn nodwedd arni ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad—yw uno colegau ar draws y sector, a hynny weithiau'n llwyddiannus iawn. A ninnau, mae'n debyg, wedi cyrraedd pen y daith o ran uno, gofynnaf y cwestiwn ichi: a ydym wedi gwneud hynny? Mae coleg y Drindod Dewi Sant, sydd yn fy rhanbarth, yn engraifft i'w chroesawu'n sicr, ond gwn y'i gwelir fel modd i arbed arian. Beth yw barn y Llywodraeth ar uno colegau yn y dyfodol, ac a ydych yn edrych ar hyn fel ffordd o wneud y sector yn fwy effeithlon a/neu arbed arian?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn ddiamheul mae angen i'n sefydliadau addysg uwch gydweithio'n agosach nag y maent wedi gwneud yn hanesyddol. Mae'n wir hefyd, os edrychwrch ar faint ein prifysgolion, o'u cymharu â'r prifysgolion gorau yn Ewrop a thros y byd, y gwelwrch eu bod braidd yn fach. Mae arnom

small side. We want to ensure that our universities can compete, not just with each other, because Wales is too small a country for that, and not just at UK level, although that is important, but at a European and world level. It is inevitable that if we want our universities to compete at that level, they will need to grow and collaborate more in the future. Otherwise, they will not be in a position in the next 10 or 20 years to compete as we would want them to compete, and as they would want to, with other universities outside of Wales.

**Nick Bourne:** I favour collaboration. That is happening successfully at the moment between Bangor and Aberystwyth, for example. I certainly see that as the future, but I return to the specific question of whether you favour any further mergers, rather than collaboration, which is very different?

**The First Minister:** Mergers are a matter for the institutions involved, but there are clear advantages with regard to economies of scale and in being able to offer the range, breadth and quality of courses that are needed to compete with the big universities across Europe. The days, when I was at university, when Aberystwyth had 3,500 students and could survive are long gone; there is no question about that. There is no doubt in my mind that our universities need to consider how they can best operate in the future, and that will mean that they will need to grow in order to compete with the best.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Do you agree that the Welsh Liberal Democrats should clarify their position for the people of Wales on university tuition fees? Their most recent manifesto pledged to scrap tuition fees for all, but the Con-Dem coalition at Westminster has pledged no such thing. Do you think, as I do, that they are prepared to scrap any policy in order to gain power?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The First Minister has no responsibility for the Liberal Democrats. That question would be best addressed to the leader of the Welsh Liberal

eisiau sicrhau y gall ein prifysgolion gystadlu, nid dim ond â'i gilydd, oherwydd y mae Cymru'n wlad rhy fach i hynny, ac nid dim ond ar lefel y Deyrnas Unedig, er bod hynny'n bwysig, ond ar lefel Ewrop a'r byd. Mae'n anochel os ydym yn awyddus i'n prifysgolion gystadlu ar y lefel honno, y bydd angen iddynt dyfu a chydweithio mwy yn y dyfodol. Fel arall, ni fyddant mewn sefyllfa yn y 10 i 20 mlynedd nesaf i gystadlu fel y dymunem iddynt gystadlu, ac fel y dymunent hwythau, â phrifysgolion eraill y tu allan i Gymru.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf o blaid cydweithio. Mae hynny'n digwydd yn llwyddiannus ar hyn o bryd rhwng Bangor ac Aberystwyth, er enghraifft. Yn sicr gwelaf mai dyna'r dyfodol, ond dychwelaf at y cwestiwn penodol a ydych o blaid unrhyw uno pellach, yn hytrach na chydweithio, sydd yn dra gwahanol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mater i'r sefydliadau dan sylw yw uno, ond mae manteision amlwg o safbwyt arbedion maint ac o ran gallu cynnig yr amrediad, yr ehangder a'r ansawdd o ran cyrsiau sy'n angenreidiol i gystadlu â'r prifysgolion mawr ar draws Ewrop. Mae'r dyddiau pryd yr oeddwn i yn y brifysgol, pan oedd gan Aberystwyth 3,500 o fyfyrwyr ac yn gallu byw ar hynny, wedi hen fynd; nid oes dim dwywaith am hynny. Yn fy marn i nid oes dim amheuaeth nad oes angen i'n prifysgolion ystyried beth yw'r ffordd orau iddynt allu gweithio yn y dyfodol, a bydd hynny'n golygu y bydd angen iddynt dyfu er mwyn cystadlu â'r goreuon.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** A ydych yn cytuno y dylai Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru wneud eu safbwyt yn glir i bobl Cymru ynglŷn â ffioedd dysgu? Yr oedd eu manifesto diweddaraf yn addo dileu ffioedd dysgu i bawb, ond nid yw'r glymblaidd Geidwadol-Ddemocratiaidd yn San Steffan wedi addo dim byd o'r fath. A ydych o'r farn, fel fi, eu bod yn barod i luchio unrhyw bolisi o'r neilltu er mwyn ennill grwm?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid oes gan y Prif Weinidog gyfrifoldeb dros y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Byddai'n well cyfeirio'r cwestiwn hwnnw at arweinydd Democratiaid

Democrats. Unfortunately, she is not answering questions at the moment.

**The First Minister:** I suppose that the answer is that it is difficult to clarify a mystery, Jeff.

**Mick Bates:** People in glass houses come to mind. First Minister, a constituent of mine with three young children has secured a place on a social work masters course at Wolverhampton, the only course in commutable distance. Unfortunately, since securing this place, a review of social work bursary schemes has concluded that the Care Council for Wales will not fund new students studying outside Wales in the forthcoming academic year. No support is available from Student Finance Wales for tuition, or even for care costs, as the course is at masters level. Do you agree that the current rigid scheme does little to support people who wish to improve their academic qualifications, especially returning mothers who want to further their careers, when the only courses available are across the border? Is this not yet another example of how the Government ignores the needs of those living in rural areas who are limited by poor transport infrastructure and penalised by their postcode?

**The First Minister:** You cannot possibly expect me to comment on an individual case when I have no knowledge of the details. I advise you to write on behalf of your constituent, as most of the rest of us do, to the appropriate Minister to see what assistance might be given to your constituent.

**Eleanor Burnham:** That is a cop-out.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I will not have such comments from the floor. It is not appropriate. The First Minister has answered clearly, and it is advice that we all might like to heed.

#### Asbestos

**Q5 Nick Ramsay:** Will the First Minister

Rhyddfrydol Cymru. Yn anffodus, nid yw hi'n ateb cwestiynau ar hyn o bryd.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n debyg mai'r ateb yw ei bod yn anodd bwrw goleuni ar ddirgelwch, Jeff.

**Mick Bates:** Mae eisiau ceiliog gwyn i ganu. Brif Weinidog, mae un o'm hetholwyr sydd â thri o blant ifanc wedi sicrhau lle ar gwrs meistr mewn gwaith cymdeithasol yn Wolverhampton, yr unig gwrs o fewn pellter cymudo. Yn anffodus, ers sicrhau'r lle hwn, mae adolygiad o gynlluniau bwrsariaethau gwaith cymdeithasol wedi dod i'r casgliad na fydd Cyngor Gofal Cymru'n ariannu myfyrwyr newydd sy'n astudio y tu allan i Gymru yn y flwyddyn academaidd sydd i ddod. Nid oes dim cymorth ar gael gan Gyllid Myfyrwyr Cymru ar gyfer y dysgu, na hyd yn oed at gostau gofal, gan mai ar lefel meistr y mae'r cwrs. A ydych yn cytuno nad yw'r cynllun anhyblyg sydd ar hyn o bryd yn gwneud fawr ddim i gefnogi pobl sy'n dymuno gwella'u cymwysterau academaidd, yn enwedig mamau sy'n dychwelyd ac sydd am hybu eu gyrfaedd, pan yw'r unig gyrsiau sydd ar gael dros y ffin? Onid enghraift arall eto fyth yw hyn o'r modd y mae'r Llywodraeth yn anwybyddu anghenion pobl sy'n byw mewn ardaloedd gwledig y mae seilwaith cludiant cyhoeddus gwael yn cyfyngu arnynt ac sy'n cael eu cosbi yn ôl eu cod post?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni allwch ddisgwyl imi wneud sylw ar achos unigol a minnau heb ddim gwybodaeth am y manylion. Fe'ch cynghoraf i ysgrifennu ar ran eich etholwr, fel y gwna'r rhelyw ohonom, at y Gweinidog priodol i weld pa gymorth y gellid ei roi i'ch etholwr.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Esgus dros wneud dim yw hynny.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ni wnaef oddef y fath sylwadau o'r llawr. Nid yw'n briodol. Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi ateb yn glir, ac mae'n gyngor yr hoffai pob un ohonom ei ddilyn efallai.

#### Asbestos

**C5 Nick Ramsay:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog

make a statement on Welsh Assembly Government policies for the removal of asbestos in public buildings? OAQ(3)2854(FM)

**The First Minister:** The person responsible for maintaining and repairing a property must comply with the Control of Asbestos Regulations 2006. The Health and Safety Executive advises that if asbestos is in good condition and not likely to be disturbed, it is usually safer to leave it in place. This issue is not devolved.

**Nick Ramsay:** Thank you for that answer, First Minister. May I ask you specifically about the situation in schools in Wales, which I am sure you are aware is an issue of major concern? Since 1980, 300 teachers have been diagnosed with mesothelioma, which is a cancer that is related to exposure to asbestos. Given the latency, dormancy and long incubation period of asbestos-related conditions, it may well be some time before we see the full extent of the legacy of asbestos. Given that asbestos can be found in an estimated 34 schools in my constituency—it is a problem in other school buildings across Wales—will you update us on your Government's actions and on any discussions that you are having with the new Westminster Government and the teaching unions to deal with this deadly legacy?

**The First Minister:** We can only be guided by the Health and Safety Executive, and it is right to say that if asbestos is undisturbed and secure, it is usually safe to leave it in place. It is the fibres that cause the problem with diseases such as mesothelioma and asbestosis. In order to avoid exposure to fibres, it is important that those who are responsible for public buildings in Wales have in place a management system that eliminates the risk as much as possible. As far as schools are concerned, local authorities are required to have asbestos surveys undertaken on all premises and to implement an asbestos management system. It is their responsibility to ensure that the asbestos is contained, and that duty of care is something that no local authority can escape.

ddatganiad am bolisiâu Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o ran cael gwared ar asbestos o adeiladau cyhoeddus? OAQ(3)2854(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Rhaid i'r sawl sy'n gyfrifol am gynnal ac atgyweirio eiddo gydymffurfio â Rheoliadau Rheoli Asbestos 2006. Yn ôl cyngor yr Awdurdod Gweithredol Iechyd a Diogelwch, os yw'r asbestos mewn cyflwr da ac mai go brin y bydd neb yn ymyrryd ag ef, mae fel arfer yn fwy diogel ei adael yn ei le. Nid yw'r mater hwn wedi'i ddatganoli.

**Nick Ramsay:** Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Brif Weinidog. A gaf eich holi'n benodol am y sefyllfa mewn ysgolion yng Nghymru, sydd, fel y gwyddoch yr wyf yn siŵr, yn destun pryder mawr? Ers 1980, canfuwyd bod mesothelioma ar 300 o athrawon, sef canser sy'n gysylltiedig â dod i gysylltiad ag asbestos. O ystyried cuddni, hunedd a chyfnod magu maith cyflyrau cysylltiedig ag asbestos, gall cryn amser yn wir fynd heibio cyn inni weld beth fydd gwir ganlyniadau asbestos. Gan fod asbestos i'w ganfod mewn tua 34 o ysgolion yn fy etholaeth—mae'n broblem mewn adeiladau ysgolion eraill ledled Cymru—a wnewch roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf inni am yr hyn y mae eich Llywodraeth yn ei wneud ac am unrhyw drafodaethau yr ydych yn eu cael gyda'r Llywodraeth newydd yn San Steffan a'r undebau athrawon i ddelio â'r canlyniadau angheuol hyn?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Rhaid inni ddilyn arweiniad yr Awdurdod Gweithredol Iechyd a Diogelwch, ac mae'n gywir dweud os yw asbestos yn cael llonydd ac yn gadarn yn ei le, ei fod fel arfer yn ddiogel ei adael lle y mae. Y ffibrau yw'r elfen sydd yn achosi'r broblem gyda chlefydau fel mesothelioma ac asbestosis. Er mwyn osgoi dod i gyffyrddiad â ffibrau, mae'n bwysig bod gan y rhai sy'n gyfrifol am adeiladau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru system reoli sy'n dileu'r perygl hyd y gellir. O ran ysgolion, mae'n ofynnol i awdurdodau lleol sicrhau bod arolygon asbestos yn cael eu gwneud ar bob eiddo a gweithredu system i reoli asbestos. Eu cyfrifoldeb hwy yw sicrhau bod yr asbestos yn cael ei ddal, ac mae'r ddyletswydd gofal honno'n rhywbeth na all yr un awdurdod

lleol ei osgoi.

**Brian Gibbons:** As you know, First Minister, asbestos is one of a range of industrial diseases that employees in the construction industry face; this industry remains one of the most dangerous sectors to work in. You may also be aware that the new Government at Westminster is committed to reducing regulation of industry and that it has, in some instances, specifically targeted the construction industry for deregulation, particularly for smaller contracts in the construction industry, much in line with what Nick Ramsay has spoken about on working in schools. Would you be able to assure people in the construction industry that your Government will make representations to ensure that they will not be obliged to work in an under-regulated sector? Equally, as part of the Assembly Government's procurement process, will you ensure that the highest possible standards of worker safety are maintained regardless of efforts at Westminster to introduce deregulation?

**The First Minister:** I will give you that commitment, Brian. It amazes me that health and safety has somehow become something that people seem to oppose. Health and safety regulation has created a situation where far fewer people now die at work, or of industrial diseases as a result of work, and yet, over the past decade, I think that I am right in saying that more than a hundred people have been killed at work, often as a result of illegal action taken by employers. It strikes me that to lessen the duty of an employer to an employee is a retrograde step that will lead to more deaths and injuries at work.

**Janet Ryder:** Does the Welsh Assembly Government have a role to play in ensuring that companies that used asbestos long after it was established to be a dangerous and potentially lethal product are made to bear the cost of removing that asbestos and of caring for the many thousands of people who have been affected by it?

**Brian Gibbons:** Fel y gwyddoch, Brif Weinidog, mae asbestosis yn un o amryw o glefydau diwydiannol y mae gweithwyr yn y diwydiant adeiladu'n eu hwynebu; y diwydiant hwn yw un o'r sectorau mwyaf peryglus i weithio ynddo o hyd. Efallai eich bod yn ymwybodol hefyd fod y Llywodraeth newydd yn San Steffan wedi ymrwymo i leihau rheoleiddio ar ddiwydiant a'i bod, mewn rhai achosion, wedi targedu'r diwydiant adeiladu'n benodol ar gyfer dadreoleiddio, yn enwedig ar gyfer contractau llai yn y diwydiant adeiladu, yn debyg iawn i'r hyn y mae Nick Ramsay wedi sôn amdano ynghylch gweithio mewn ysgolion. A allech roi sicrwydd i bobl yn y diwydiant adeiladu y gwnaiff eich Llywodraeth bwys o sicrhau na chânt eu gorfodi i weithio mewn sector heb reoleiddio digonol? Yn yr un modd, fel rhan o broses gaffael Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, a wnewch sicrhau y cynhelir y safonau uchaf posibl o ran diogelwch gweithwyr er gwaethaf ymdrechion yn San Steffan i gyflwyno dadreoleiddio?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Rhoddaf yr ymrwymiad hwnnw ichi, Brian. Yr wyf yn rhyfeddu bod iechyd a diogelwch rywsut wedi mynd yn rhywbeth y mae pobl fel pe baent yn ei wrthwynebu. Mae rheoleiddio ym maes iechyd a diogelwch wedi creu sefyllfa lle y mae llawer llai o bobl bellach yn marw wrth eu gwaith, neu o glefydau diwydiannol o ganlyniad i'w gwaith, ac eto, dros y degawd diwethaf, credaf fy mod yn iawn wrth ddweud bod dros gant o bobl wedi'u lladd wrth eu gwaith, a hynny'n aml o ganlyniad i weithredu anghyfreithlon gan gyflogwyr. I mi mae lleihau dyletswydd cyflogwr tuag at weithiwr yn gam yn ôl a fydd yn arwain at ragor o farwolaethau ac anafiadau yn y gwaith.

**Janet Ryder:** A oes gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru rôl i'w chwarae i sicrhau y gwneir i gwmniau a ddefnyddiodd asbestos ymhell ar ôl iddi ddod yn hysbys ei fod yn gynnrych peryglus a allai fod yn farwol dalu'r gost am symud yr asbestos hwnnw ac am ofalu am y miloedd lawer o bobl yr effeithiwyd arnynt ganddo?

**The First Minister:** We would not have a legal role. The difficulty is that building companies tend to have a short lifespan, and you tend to find that the original company that built something twenty or thirty years ago has long gone. It becomes difficult to enforce any kind of action against that building company. I suspect that it would be practically difficult to track most of the building contractors or companies that installed asbestos in the first place, whether that was five, ten, 20 to 30 years ago. It can be exceptionally difficult to identify those companies, and, quite often, they have long since ceased to exist.

### Transparency

**Q6 Andrew R.T. Davies:** Will the First Minister make a statement on transparency in Government? OAQ(3)2862(FM)

**The First Minister:** Our principles relating to transparency are set out in the Assembly Government's code of practice on access to information.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** When she appeared before the Health Wellbeing and Local Government Committee's scrutiny session in November, the Minister for health indicated that there might well be a case for a review of Government statistics, particularly some of those that the health department gathers, given the level of responses that Members receive saying that information is not held centrally. Do you subscribe to the idea that it is an important part of the Government's work to have adequate data so that informed decisions can be made, and resources used to their best advantage? If so, will you commit to undertaking that review with your Minister for Health and Social Services, so that we can have confidence that the information that the Government is working to is robust and transparent?

2.00 p.m.

**The First Minister:** We will always seek to revise the way in which we gather information to make it as accessible as

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni fyddai gennym rôl gyfreithiol. Yr anhawster yw bod cwmnïau adeiladu'n tueddu i gael oes fer, a thueddîr i ganfod bod y cwmni gwreiddiol a adeiladodd rywbeth ugain neu ddeg ar hugain o flynyddoedd yn ôl wedi hen fynd. Mae'n mynd yn anodd gorfodi unrhyw fath o weithredu yn erbyn y cwmni adeiladu hwnnw. Yr wyf yn tybio y byddai'n anodd, yn ymarferol, darganfod y rhan fwyaf o'r cwmnïau neu'r contractwyr adeiladu a osododd asbestos yn y lle cyntaf, boed hynny bump, deg, 20 neu 30 mlynedd yn ôl. Gall fod yn eithriadol o anodd canfod y cwmnïau hynny, ac, yn aml iawn, maent wedi hen ddod i ben.

### Tryloywder

**C6 Andrew R.T. Davies:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am dryloywder yn y Llywodraeth? OAQ(3)2862(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae ein hegwyddorion ynglŷn â thryloywder wedi'u hamlinellu yng nghod ymarfer Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar fynediad at wybodaeth.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Pan ymddangosodd gerbron sesiwn graffu'r Pwyllgor Iechyd, Lles a Llywodraeth Leol ym mis Tachwedd, dywedodd y Gweinidog iechyd ei bod yn eithaf posibl bod dadl dros adolygu ystadegau'r Llywodraeth, yn enwedig rhai o'r rhai y mae'r adran iechyd yn eu casglu, o ystyried faint o ymatebion a gaiff Aelodau sy'n dweud na chedwir gwybodaeth yn ganolog. A ydych yn cyd-fynd â'r syniad ei bod yn rhan bwysig o waith y Llywodraeth fod ganddi ddata digonol fel y gellir gwneud penderfyniadau ar sail gwybodaeth, a defnyddio adnoddau yn y modd mwyaf manteisiol? Os felly, a wnewch ymrwymo i wneud yr adolygiad hwnnw gyda'ch Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, er mwyn inni allu bod yn hyderus bod y wybodaeth y mae'r Llywodraeth yn gweithio'n unol â hi'n gadarn a thryloyw?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Byddwn bob amser yn ceisio adolygu'r modd yr ydym yn casglu gwybodaeth i sicrhau ei bod mor hygyrch ag

possible in the future. There is a constant series of revisions taking place across Government.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats (Kirsty Williams):** Does the First Minister believe that transparency for consumers is diminished by the decision of the Food Standards Agency not to publish existing data on the cleanliness and hygiene of food premises on its new scores on the doors website when it is launched later this year?

**The First Minister:** That is a matter for the Food Standards Agency, and something that will be dealt with by the Conservative-Liberal Democrat Government in London.

**Kirsty Williams:** During the last E. coli outbreak in Wales, the Welsh Government said that it would do all that it could to ensure that consumers and those purchasing foodstuffs would be protected. When the Food Standards Agency launches its website later this year, only data from Swansea and Wrexham will be available initially. Data on high-risk premises will not be available until 2011, and all data will not be available until 2012. Obviously this is a matter for the Food Standards Agency, but given your Government's commitment to do everything possible to protect Welsh consumers from inadequate food hygiene practices, surely you have a view on the issue.

**The First Minister:** In view of the tragic outcome of the E. coli outbreak, we will do all that we can, within our powers, to protect the public. That is something that we will continue to do, not just as a result of the outcome of the inquiry, but at all times.

**Kirsty Williams:** Given that you have just reiterated that commitment, and that you have already refused to look again at the resources that have been made available to implement the recommendations of the Pennington report, will you make representations to the Food Standards Agency that existing data should be put on its website when it is launched later this year? In fact, that does not go far enough. The reality for many food consumers is that they will not

sy'n bosibl yn y dyfodol. Mae adolygiadau'n digwydd yn gyson ar draws y Llywodraeth.

**Arweinydd Democratioaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Kirsty Williams):** A ydyw'r Prif Weinidog yn credu y caiff tryloywder i gwsmeriaid ei leihau gan benderfyniad yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd i beidio â chyhoeddi data sy'n bodoli am hylendid a glanweithdra adeiladau bwyd ar ei gwefan newydd "scores on the doors" pan gaiff ei lansio'n ddiweddarach eleni?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mater i'r Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd yw hynny, a rhywbeth y bydd Llywodraeth y Ceidwadwyr a'r Democratioaid Rhyddfrydol yn Llundain yn delio ag ef.

**Kirsty Williams:** Yn ystod yr achosion diwethaf o E.coli yng Nghymru, dywedodd Llywodraeth Cymru y gwnâi bopeth a allai i sicrhau y gwarchodid defnyddwyr a phobl sy'n prynu bwyddydd. Pan fydd yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd yn lansio'i gwefan yn ddiweddarach eleni, dim ond data o Abertawe a Wrecsam a fydd ar gael i ddechrau. Ni fydd data am adeiladau lle y ceir perygl mawr ar gael tan 2011, ac ni fydd yr holl ddata ar gael tan 2012. Yn amlwg, mae hyn yn fater i'r Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd, ond yn wyneb ymrwymiad eich Llywodraeth i wneud popeth posibl i warchod defnyddwyr Cymru rhag arferion hylendid bwyd annigonol, rhaid bod gennych farn ar y mater.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn wyneb canlyniad trychinebus yr achosion o E.coli, gwnawn bopeth a allwn, o fewn ein pwerau, i warchod y cyhoedd. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth y byddwn yn parhau i'w wneud, nid dim ond yn sgîl canlyniad yr ymchwiliad, ond bob amser.

**Kirsty Williams:** Gan eich bod newydd ailadrodd yr ymrwymiad hwnnw, a'ch bod eisoes wedi gwrtod edrych eto ar yr adnoddau sydd wedi'u darparu ar gyfer gweithredu argymhellion adroddiad Pennington, a wnewch bwyso ar yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd i roi data sy'n bodoli ar ei gwefan pan gaiff ei lansio'n ddiweddarach eleni? Mewn gwirionedd, nid yw hynny'n mynd yn ddigon pell. Y realiti i lawer o brynwyr bwyd yw na wnânt edrych

check a website on their way home from, say, a rugby match or a night out before buying their burger or kebab from a takeaway in the city centre. Surely the only way to truly protect food consumers is to require food premises to display their rating in a prominent place in their premises so that those entering those premises can make an informed decision about whether they wish to purchase food from that particular place.

ar wefan ar eu ffordd adref, dyweder, o gêm rygbi neu noson allan cyn prynu eu byrger neu gebab o siop prydau parod yng nghanol y ddinas. Yr unig ffordd i warchod prynwyr bwyd o ddifrif, siawns, yw mynnu bod adeiladau gwerthu bwyd yn arddangos eu sgôr mewn lle amlwg yn eu hadeiladau er mwyn i bobl sy'n mynd yno allu gwneud penderfyniad ar sail y wybodaeth sydd ar gael yng hylch a ydynt am brynu bwyd o'r lle arbennig hwnnw.

**The First Minister:** We would encourage businesses to do that. I do not accept that funds have not been made available to implement the Pennington report. We have made money available. We would always urge the Food Standards Agency to be as upfront as possible, first, with regard to providing information to the public, and, secondly, with regard to ensuring that the public can access that information in as easy a way as possible. Your suggestion that premises should display the ratings is a good one, and one that I would urge the Food Standards Agency to consider further.

**Alun Davies:** First Minister, I am sure that you found the press conference at the Treasury yesterday as chilling as I did. The new Chancellor and Chief Secretary to the Treasury outlined with relish the way in which they want to cut into public services. Many of us in this Chamber, and many people across Wales, are absolutely terrified at the prospect of the Liberal-Conservative cuts to key public services. Can you give an undertaking that we will have a transparent and open budgetary process here, so that people across Wales will be able to understand what the Liberal-Conservative coalition is doing to Welsh public services, and so that those of us who want to protect Welsh public services are given every opportunity to speak up for our constituents and to ensure that the Liberal-Tory cuts are mitigated as much as possible?

**The First Minister:** We will always seek to protect front-line services in Wales, but it is also true to say that the scale of the cuts being proposed will mean that that will not be possible to the extent that we would want.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Byddem yn annog busnesau i wneud hynny. Nid wyf yn derbyn nad oes cyllid wedi'i ddarparu i weithredu adroddiad Pennington. Yr ydym wedi darparu arian. Byddem bob amser yn annog yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd i fod mor agored ag sy'n bosibl, yn gyntaf, wrth ddarparu gwybodaeth i'r cyhoedd, ac yn ail, o ran sicrhau y gall y cyhoedd gael y wybodaeth honno mewn modd mor hawdd ag sy'n bosibl. Mae eich awgrym y dylai siopau arddangos y sgôr yn un da, ac yn un y byddwn yn annog yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd i'w ystyried ymhellach.

**Alun Davies:** Brif Weinidog, yr wyf yn siŵr bod y gynhadledd i'r wasg yn y Trysorlys ddoe wedi oeri'ch gwaed chithau yr un fath ag y gwnaeth i mi. Amlinelloedd y Canghellor a Phrif Ysgrifennydd y Trysorlys yn awchus y modd y maent am gwtogi gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Mae llawer ohonom yn y Siambra hon, a llawer o bobl ledled Cymru, wedi dychryn yn lân o feddwl am y toriadau gan y Rhyddfrydwyr a'r Ceidwadwyr ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus allweddol. A allwch roi addewid y bydd gennym broses gyllidebol dryloyw ac agored yma, er mwyn i bobl ar hyd a lled Cymru allu deall beth y mae'r glymbiaid rhwng y Rhyddfrydwyr a'r Ceidwadwyr yn ei wneud i wasanaethau cyhoeddus Cymru, ac er mwyn i'r rhai ohonom sydd am warchod gwasanaethau cyhoeddus Cymru gael pob cyfle i siarad dros ein hetholwyr ac i sicrhau y caiff y toriadau gan y Rhyddfrydwyr a'r Torïaid eu lliniaru hyd y gellir?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Byddwn bob amser yn ceisio gwarchod gwasanaethau rheng flaen yng Nghymru, ond mae'n wir dweud hefyd y bydd maint y toriadau a gynigir yn golygu na fydd hynny'n bosibl i'r graddau yr hoffem.

The £6.5 billion cut across the whole of the UK that will be implemented for starters means £220 million to £250 million-worth of cuts in Wales. We welcome the fact that we will have the flexibility to determine whether those cuts are taken this year or next year, but they are cuts, nevertheless, and, to my mind, they are also unnecessary cuts.

Mae'r toriad o £6.5 biliwn ar draws y Deyrnas Unedig gyfan a weithredir i gychwyn yn golygu toriadau gwerth rhwng £220 miliwn a £250 miliwn yng Nghymru. Yr ydym yn croesawu'r ffaith y bydd gennym yr hyblygrwydd i benderfynu a wneir y toriadau hynny eleni ynteu'r flwyddyn nesaf, ond toriadau ydynt, serch hynny, ac, i'm tyb i, maent yn doriadau diangen hefyd.

### Road Safety

**Q7 Joyce Watson:** Will the First Minister make a statement on road safety by school gates? OAQ(3)2853(FM)

**The First Minister:** We work with local authorities to promote and deliver road safety improvements in local areas, which include improvements to school entrances. You will be aware of the fact that 20 mph zones have been made available to local authorities to implement if they so wish.

### Diogelwch ar y Ffyrdd

**C7 Joyce Watson:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ddiogelwch ar y ffyrdd gerllaw gatiau ysgolion? OAQ(3)2853(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym yn gweithio gydag awdurdodau lleol i hyrwyddo a chyflawni gwelliannau diogelwch ar y ffyrdd mewn ardaloedd lleol, sy'n cynnwys gwelliannau i fynedfeydd ysgolion. Byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r ffaith bod parthau 20 milltir yr awr ar gael bellach i awdurdodau lleol eu rhoi ar waith os dymunant wneud hynny.

**Joyce Watson:** Thank you for that answer, First Minister. Increasing the use of 20 mph limits across Wales is a long-established 'One Wales' commitment. Welsh Assembly Government guidance issued last year clearly recognises that they are a crucial tool in improving road safety and in reducing casualties, particularly in residential areas and in the vicinity of schools. Statistics show that most pedestrian casualties occur in 30 mph zones, standing at 94 per cent in 2008. Evidence for 2008 also shows that 32 per cent of all pedestrian casualties were school pupils on a journey to or from school.

**Joyce Watson:** Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Brif Weinidog. Mae cynyddu'r defnydd o gyfyngiadau 20 milltir yr awr ledled Cymru yn hen ymrwymiad gan 'Cymru'n Un'. Mae canllawiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a gyhoeddwyd y llynedd yn cydnabod yn glir eu bod yn arf hollbwysig i wella diogelwch ar y ffyrdd ac i leihau damweiniau, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd preswyl ac yng nghyffiniau ysgolion. Dengys yr ystadegau fod y rhan fwyaf o ddamweiniau i gerddwyr yn digwydd mewn parthau 30 milltir yr awr, sef 94 y cant yn 2008. Mae'r dystiolaeth ar gyfer 2008 yn dangos hefyd mai disgylion ysgol ar eu ffordd i'r ysgol neu oddi yno oedd 32 y cant o'r holl ddamweiniau i gerddwyr.

It is welcome news that the number of 20 mph zones has risen steadily in recent years, standing at around 481 zones on roads across Wales. However, it is clear from research that I have undertaken that some councils across my region are failing miserably and are plainly not following WAG guidance. For example, of the 75 schools in Ceredigion, only two have 20 mph zones operating outside the school gates, 54 have a 30 mph limit, eight have a 40 mph limit and 11 are in

Mae'n newydd da bod nifer y parthau 20 milltir yr awr wedi codi'n raddol yn y blynnyddoedd diwethaf, a bod tua 481 o'r parthau hyn ar ffyrdd drwy Gymru. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg yn ôl ymchwil a wneuthum fod rhai cynghorau ar draws fy rhanbarth yn methu'n druenus ac yn amlwg heb ddilyn canllawiau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Er enghraifft, o'r 75 ysgol yng Ngheredigion, dim ond dwy sydd â pharthau 20 milltir yr awr yn weithredol y tu allan i

de-restricted zones.

gatiau'r ysgol, mae gan 54 gyfyngiad 30 milltir yr awr, mae gan wyth gyfyngiad 40 milltir yr awr ac mae 11 mewn parthau digyfyngiad.

Can I have a reaffirmation from you, First Minister, that the Assembly Government's commitment to increasing the use of 20 mph zones outside school gates remains? Will you also assure Members that local authorities, such as Ceredigion, will not be able to escape their responsibility in protecting children travelling to and from their schools?

A gaf gadarnhad gennych, Brif Weinidog, fod ymrwymiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i gynyddu'r defnydd o barthau 20 milltir yr awr y tu allan i gatiau ysgolion yn parhau? A wnewch sicrhau Aelodau hefyd na fydd awdurdodau lleol, fel Ceredigion, yn gallu osgoi eu cyfrifoldeb i warchod plant sy'n teithio i'w hysgolion ac oddi yno?

**The First Minister:** Joyce, our commitment to 20 mph speed limits remains. We strongly endorse them and encourage local authorities to adopt them where appropriate. It is important that local authorities look carefully at imposing 20 mph limits and, if they do not, they will be answerable to the electorate, if they feel that the authority has not imposed a 20 mph speed limit when it should have done. The Government's view remains that it strongly endorses the imposition of 20 mph speed limits, particularly close to schools.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Joyce, mae ein hymrwymiad i gyfyngiadau cyflymdra 20 milltir yr awr yn parhau. Yr ydym yn eu cefnogi'n gryf ac yn annog awdurdodau lleol i'w mabwysiadu lle y bo'n briodol. Mae'n bwysig i awdurdodau lleol edrych yn ofalus ar osod cyfyngiadau 20 milltir yr awr ac, os na wnânt, byddant yn atebol i'r etholwyr, os teimlant hwy nad yw'r awdurdod wedi gosod cyfyngiad cyflymder 20 milltir yr awr pan ddylai fod wedi gwneud. Barn y Llywodraeth o hyd yw ei bod yn llwyr gefnogi gosod cyfyngiadau cyflymder 20 milltir yr awr, yn enwedig yn agos at ysgolion.

**William Graham:** First Minister, will you join me in congratulating the organisers of the Safe Routes to School in Newbridge, which have proved to be a great success? What is your Government doing to promote Safe Routes in Communities schemes, which not only help with Safe Routes to School, but also help those who are mobility impaired?

**William Graham:** Brif Weinidog, a ymunwch chi â mi i longyfarch trefnwr y Llwybrau Diogel i'r Ysgol yn Nhrecelyn, sydd wedi bod yn llwyddiant mawr? Beth y mae eich Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i hyrwyddo cynlluniau Llwybrau Diogel mewn Cymunedau, sy'n helpu nid yn unig gyda Llwybrau Diogel i'r Ysgol, ond hefyd yn helpu pobl â nam symudedd?

**The First Minister:** We have worked with many organisations over the years to make footpaths as accessible as possible. Some good work has been done, for example, with the Countryside Council for Wales to make footpaths accessible, not just in urban areas, but also in the countryside. The Safe Routes to School schemes have been extremely useful and £8.5 million has been given to local authorities for this financial year to take forward those schemes. It is important that parents have the peace of mind that their children can safely walk to school—even short distances—without having to compete for space with cars.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym wedi gweithio gyda sawl corff dros y blynnyddoedd i sicrhau bod llwybrau troed mor hawdd eu defnyddio ag sy'n bosibl. Mae gwaith da wedi'i wneud, er enghraift, gyda'r Cyngor Cefn Gwlad i hwyluso mynediad i llwybrau, nid dim ond mewn ardaloedd trefol, ond yng nghefn gwlad hefyd. Mae'r cynlluniau Llwybrau Diogel i'r Ysgol wedi bod yn eithriadol o ddefnyddiol ac mae £8.5 miliwn wedi'i roi i awdurdodau lleol ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol hon i fwrr ymlaen â'r cynlluniau hynny. Mae'n bwysig i rieni gael y tawelwch meddwl y gall eu plant gerdded yn ddiogel i'r ysgol—hyd yn oed pellterau bach—heb orfol cystadlu am le gyda cheir.

## Priorities

**Q8 Irene James:** Will the First Minister make a statement on his priorities for the next six months? OAQ(3)2871(FM)

**The First Minister:** We need to ensure that the economy continues to grow to protect and improve public services and deliver our ‘One Wales’ commitments.

**Irene James:** Will you continue to make one of your priorities the fight against child poverty? Do you agree that the loss of the child trust fund, cuts to the working families’ tax credit and the threat of rising value added tax will hit the poorest families and their children hardest?

**The First Minister:** You have hit the nail on its head. We know that when taxes are placed on what people buy, the poorest must pay proportionately more of their income.

2.10 p.m.

That is what a regressive tax is, and it is sad to see that a rise in VAT is being considered as part of the emergency budget. You are quite right to point out the problems relating to the child trust fund, and you are quite right to refer to the issue of child tax credits. On the positive side, I was delighted to be in New Tredegar last week with Huw Lewis, the Deputy Minister for Children, where we launched the consultation on the child poverty strategy and its delivery plan. I believe that that will take us significantly forward in realising our goal of eliminating child poverty by 2020.

**Jonathan Morgan:** First Minister, one of the Assembly Government’s welcome ambitions and plans is to reform mental health services in Wales. Part of these plans includes the reform of acute in-patient services at Whitchurch Hospital in my constituency. One of the difficulties that we now face, however, is that the redevelopment of the site has been halted, after some £6 million has been spent after the Assembly Government gave the

## Blaenoriaethau

**C8 Irene James:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ei flaenoriaethau ar gyfer y chwe mis nesaf? OAQ(3)2871(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae angen inni sicrhau bod yr economi’n dal i dyfu er mwyn gwarchod a gwella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a chyflawni ein hymrwymiadau yn ‘Cymru’n Un’.

**Irene James:** A wnewch barhau i sicrhau mai un o’ch blaenoriaethau yw'r frwydr yn erbyn tlodi plant? A ydych yn cytuno y bydd colli'r gronfa ymddiriedolaeth plant, toriadau yn y credyd treth i deuluoedd sy'n gweithio a'r bygythiad i gynyddu treth ar werth yn taro'r teuluoedd tlataf a'u plant galetaf?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych wedi dweud calon y gwir. Gwyddom pan drethrir pethau y mae pobl yn eu prynu, fod rhaid i'r tlataf dalu cyfran fwy o'u hincwm ar gyfartaledd.

Dyna yw treth sy'n mynd â chanran fwy o incwm rhai sydd ag incwm isel, ac mae'n drist gweld bod cynnydd mewn TAW yn cael ei ystyried fel rhan o'r gyllideb frys. Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle pan nodwch y problemau ynglŷn â'r gronfa ymddiriedolaeth plant, ac yr ydych yn berffaith iawn pan gyfeiriwch at fater credydau treth plant. Ar yr ochr gadarnhaol, yr oeddwon wrth fy modd o fod yn Nhredegard Newydd yr wythnos diwethaf gyda Huw Lewis, y Dirprwy Weinidog Plant, i lansio'r ymgynghoriad ar y strategaeth tlodi plant a'r cynllun i'w chyflawni. Credaf yr aiff hynny â ni gamau sylweddol ymlaen tuag at wireddu ein nod o ddileu tlodi plant erbyn 2020.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Brif Weinidog, un o uchelgeisiau a chynlluniau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad sydd i'w croesawu yw diwygio gwasanaethau ieched y meddwl yng Nghymru. Mae rhan o'r cynlluniau hyn yn cynnwys diwygio gwasanaethau aciwt i gleifion mewnol yn Ysbyty'r Eglwys Newydd yn fy etholaeth. Un o'r anawsterau a wynebwn yn awr, fodd bynnag, yw bod ailddatblygu'r safle wedi'i atal, wedi i ryw £6 miliwn gael ei

plans the go-ahead. This has been on the agenda for many years. In the 1990s, reform of the site was examined, and the health authorities at that time gained planning permission to develop part of the site for housing, in order to raise money for the capital expenditure required. In this instance, the Government had set aside £80 million. I would like the assurance of the Assembly Government that the £80 million that was identified by the Minister for Health and Social Services for the redevelopment of Whitchurch Hospital is still there for the health board to use, and that no pressure is being brought to bear on the health board to sell off land for housing in order to meet any financial shortfall.

**The First Minister:** The situation has not changed. We cannot bargain about the situation that we will be in in subsequent years as it depends on the settlement that we will receive from Westminster. It is recognised by everyone in the Chamber that we need to improve facilities continually across the whole of Wales. It is also important that any new facility that is provided at Whitchurch is the right facility, and work is being taken forward in order to make sure that that is indeed the case.

**Rhodri Morgan:** Does the First Minister share my view that his priorities over the next six months could be knocked sideways by the different priorities of the Conservative-Liberal Democrat coalition in Westminster? In his meeting yesterday with the incoming coalition Prime Minister, did he receive any assurances that the UK Government will be honouring the commitments that were made by the previous Labour Government on the defence training college in St Athan, on the light tank replacement order awarded to General Dynamics UK Ltd in Oakdale, and on any other significant matters, including the full rail electrification from Paddington to Swansea, which is scheduled to be completed by 2017?

**The First Minister:** In the course of the discussions that were held yesterday with the Prime Minister, issues of finance and

wario ar ôl i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad roi sêl bendith ar y cynlluniau. Mae hyn ar yr agenda ers blynnyddoedd lawer. Yn yr 1990au, archwiliwyd diwygio'r safle, a chafodd yr awdurdodau iechyd bryd hynny ganiatâd cynllunio i ddathlygu rhan o'r safle ar gyfer tai, er mwyn codi arian ar gyfer y gwariant cyfalaf angenrheidiol. Yn yr achos hwn, yr oedd y Llywodraeth wedi neilltuo £80 miliwn. Hoffwn gael sicrwydd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad fod yr £80 miliwn a neilltuwyd gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar gyfer ailddatblygu Ysbyty'r Eglwys Newydd yn dal yno i'r bwrdd iechyd ei ddefnyddio, ac nad oes pwysau'n cael ei roi ar y bwrdd iechyd i werthu tir ar gyfer tai er mwyn ymgodymu ag unrhyw ddiffyg ariannol.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid yw'r sefyllfa wedi newid. Ni allwn baratoi ar gyfer y sefyllfa y byddwn ynddi mewn blynnyddoedd i ddod gan ei fod yn dibynnu ar y setliad a gawn oddi wrth San Steffan. Mae pawb yn y Siambra yn cydnabod bod angen inni wella cyfleusterau'n barhaus ar hyd a lled Cymru. Mae'n bwysig hefyd mai'r cyfleuster iawn yw unrhyw gyfleuster newydd a ddarperir yn yr Eglwys Newydd, ac mae gwaith yn mynd rhagddo er mwyn sicrhau mai felly y bydd hi.

**Rhodri Morgan:** A ydyw'r Prif Weinidog yn cyd-fynd â mi y gallai ei flaenoriaethau ar gyfer y chwe mis nesaf gael eu bwrw oddi ar eu hechel gan flaenoriaethau gwahanol y glymlaid rhwng y Ceidwadwyr a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn San Steffan? Yn ei gyfarfod ddoe â Phrif Weinidog newydd y glymlaid, a gafodd unrhyw sicrwydd y bydd Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig yn cyflawni'r ymrwymiadau a wnaed gan y Llywodraeth Lafur flaenorol ynghylch y coleg hyfforddi amddiffyn yn Sain Tathan, ynghylch yr archeb i adnewyddu tanciau ysgafn a ddyfarnwyd i General Dynamics UK yn Oakdale, ac ynghylch unrhyw faterion sylwedol eraill, gan gynnwys trydanu'r rheilffordd yn llawn o Paddington i Abertawe, sydd i fod i gael ei gwblhau erbyn 2017?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn ystod y trafodaethau a gynhalwyd ddoe gyda'r Prif Weinidog, codwyd cwestiynau yn ymwneud â chyllid a

constitutional affairs were raised. We did not discuss individual items along the lines that you suggested. I can say, however, that in my meeting with the Secretary of State for Wales last week, I specifically raised the issue of the defence training academy, and the need to ensure that plans to site it at St Athan continue. I will also be making sure that we talk to General Dynamics about the contract that it received recently—that needs to be honoured. Issues such as the continuance of a commercial television news service in Wales will also be addressed. That is essential; it cannot be left to the free market or we will not have anything at all. Therefore, a number of issues have been raised already, and many others will be raised over the course of the next few months.

**Jenny Randerson:** I hope that one of your priorities, First Minister, is attracting and creating high-tech jobs for Wales. One recent opportunity to attract such jobs would have been the 2010 BIO International Convention in Chicago, which is the world's largest biotechnology congress. It is a major forum for companies and, therefore, countries from all over the world had a presence there. Scotland and Northern Ireland had very large stands at this exhibition. I was shocked to discover, First Minister, that our exhibit was the joke of the show. It was a small coffee table with a pot, and a little handmade sign inviting people to put their business cards into the pot to win a cuddly Welsh dragon. First Minister, do you think that this is International Business Wales's greatest success in recent months? Do you think that that is the image of Wales that we should be giving to the world? Do you not think that it might have been better not to have any exhibit at all than to make ourselves a laughing stock?

**The First Minister:** A month or so ago, we held a biosciences conference in the Vale of Glamorgan Hotel, which attracted a number of potential investors to the biosciences sector, in which we already have about 15,000 people working. You are quite right to point out the need to develop highly skilled, high-quality jobs in Wales. That is why we need General Dynamics, the defence training academy, and the Eurofighter project to go ahead—so that we can protect jobs in

materion cyfansoddiadol. Ni thrafodasom eitemau unigol tebyg i'r hyn a awgrymwyd gennych. Gallaf ddweud, foddy bynnag, y sonais yn benodol, yn fy nghyfarfod gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru yr wythnos diwethaf, am fater yr academi hyfforddi amddiffyn, a'r angen i sicrhau bod cynlluniau i'w lleoli yn Sain Tathan yn parhau. Byddaf yn gwneud yn siŵr hefyd y siaradwn â General Dynamics am y contract a enillodd yn ddiweddar—mae angen cadw at hwnnw. Trafodir materion fel parhad gwasanaeth newyddion teledu annibynnol yng Nghymru hefyd. Mae hynny'n hanfodol; ni ellir ei adael i'r farchnad rydd neu ni fydd gennym ddim byd o gwbl. Felly, mae nifer o faterion wedi'u codi'n barod, a chodir llawer mwy yn ystod y misoedd nesaf.

**Jenny Randerson:** Gobeithio mai un o'ch blaenoriaethau, Brif Weinidog, yw denu a chreu swyddi uwch-dechnoleg i Gymru. Un cyfle a gafwyd yn ddiweddar i ddenu swyddi o'r fath fuasai Cynhadledd Ryngwladol BIO 2010 yn Chicago, sef cyngres biodechnoleg fwyaf y byd. Mae'n fforwm pwysig i gwmnïau ac, felly, yr oedd gan wledydd o bedwar ban byd bresenoldeb yno. Yr oedd gan yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon stondinai mawr iawn yn yr arddangosfa hon. Fe'm syfrdanwyd o ddarganfod, Brif Weinidog, mai ein harddangosfa ni oedd jôc y sioe. Bwrdd coffi bach a llestr oedd hi, ac arwydd bach wedi'i ysgrifennu â llaw'n gwahodd pobl i roi eu cardiau busnes yn y llestr i ennill draig goch feddal. Brif Weinidog, a ydych yn meddwl mai dyma lwyddiant mwyaf Busnes Rhyngwladol Cymru yn y misoedd diwethaf? A ydych yn meddwl mai dyna'r ddelwedd o Gymru y dylem fod yn ei rhoi i'r byd? Onid ydych yn meddwl efallai y buasai'n well peidio â chael arddangosfa o gwbl na gwneud ein hunain yn gyff gwawd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ryw fis yn ôl, cynhaliwyd cynhadledd biowyddorau gennym yng Ngwesty Bro Morgannwg, a ddenodd nifer o ddarpar fuddsoddwyr i'r sector biowyddorau, lle y mae gennym ryw 15,000 o bobl yn gweithio'n barod. Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle'n tynnu sylw at yr angen i ddatblygu swyddi tra chrefftus o ansawdd uchel yng Nghymru. Dyna pam y mae angen i General Dynamics, yr academi hyfforddi amddiffyn, a'r prosiect Eurofighter fynd yn eu blaen—er

Wrexham. These are all within the gift of your Government.

**Gareth Jones:** Brif Weinidog, yn ystod eich cyfarfod â Phrif Weinidog San Steffan ddoe, a gawsoch gyfle i drafod dyddiad posibl y refferendwm i roi mwy o bwerau i'r Cynulliad?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol ac yr wyf wedi dweud ar lafar fod angen inni ystyried pob dyddiad o fis Hydref. Fodd bynnag, rhaid ystyried unrhyw gyngor y mae'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yn ei gael gan y Comisiwn Etholiadol ynghylch dyddiad ar gyfer y refferendwm. Mae'r gwaith paratoi wedi'i wneud ar y Gorchymyn, a rhaid inni fwrw ymlaen gyda'r gwaith o ran y dyddiad ac o ran geiriad y cwestiwn.

### School Buildings

**Q9 Peter Black:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's most recent assessment of the fitness of school buildings in Wales? OAQ(3)2852(FM)

**The First Minister:** A survey of the schools estate has been undertaken jointly by the Assembly Government and the Welsh Local Government Association for the twenty-first century schools programme. The survey will ensure that there are consistent data across all authorities and will inform future funding decisions.

**Peter Black:** The previous Government, of which you were a part, had a target of making all schools fit for purpose by 2010. Of course, that target has been missed. Given the assessment that you have carried out, can you now set a new target for when you expect all school buildings in Wales to be fit for purpose?

**The First Minister:** We have made funding available to do that, but, sometimes, circumstances intervene. In the case of a school in my constituency, for example, the funding is available and the local authority wishes to build it, but the landowner on

mwyn inni allu gwarchod swyddi yn Wrecsam. Mae'r rhain i gyd yn bethau y gall eich Llywodraeth chi eu sicrhau.

**Gareth Jones:** First Minister, during your meeting with the Prime Minister yesterday, did you have an opportunity to discuss the possible date of a referendum to give the Assembly more powers?

**The First Minister:** I have written to the Secretary of State and have stated verbally that we need to consider all dates from October. However, we will have to consider any advice that the Secretary of State receives from the Electoral Commission regarding the date of a referendum. The preparatory work on the Order has been done, and we must now proceed with the work on the date itself and on the wording of the question.

### Adeiladau Ysgolion

**C9 Peter Black:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am asesiad mwyaf diweddar Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o addasrwydd adeiladau ysgolion yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)2852(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae arolwg o'r ystâd ysgolion wedi'i wneud ar y cyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ar gyfer rhaglen ysgolion yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Bydd yr arolwg yn sicrhau bod data cyson ar draws pob awdurdod ac yn darparu gwybodaeth ar gyfer penderfyniadau ariannu'r dyfodol.

**Peter Black:** Yr oedd gan y Llywodraeth flaenorol, yr oeddech chi'n rhan ohoni, darged i wneud pob ysgol yn addas i'r diben erbyn 2010. Wrth gwrs, methwyd cyrraedd y targed hwnnw. Yn wyneb yr asesiad yr ydych wedi'i wneud, a allwch yn awr osod targed newydd ar gyfer pryd y disgwyliwch i bob adeilad ysgol yng Nghymru fod yn addas i'r diben?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym wedi darparu cyllid i wneud hynny, ond, weithiau, bydd amgylchiadau'n ymyrryd. Yn achos un ysgol yn fy etholaeth i, er enghraifft, mae'r arian ar gael ac mae'r awdurdod lleol yn dymuno ei hadeiladu, ond mae perchenog y tir lle y

whose land the school would be built has tried to put every imaginable obstacle in the way of its being built. Seven years on, through no fault of the local authority, the Government or the pupils, teachers or parents, the situation remains unresolved, although it is hoped that the situation will be resolved soon. Therefore, there will be occasions when the circumstances cause problems, such as that, where landowners do not wish to see schools built on their land. However, in the main, many schools have been rebuilt. I was privileged to be in Rogiet Primary School, in Monmouthshire, recently. A brand-new school was built there. In fact, it is possibly the greenest school in the UK. Last week, as I have already mentioned, I was in a fantastic building in New Tredegar: White Rose Primary School is a tremendous example of a school for the twenty-first century.

**Paul Davies:** Yr ydym oll wedi gweld nifer o ysgolion bach yn cau dros y blynnyddoedd diwethaf. O ganlyniad, mae rhai o'r adeiladau'n segur. Mae rhai cymunedau wedi dweud eu bod eisiau cymryd y gwaith o reoli'r adeiladau er mwyn eu defnyddio er lles y gymuned. O ystyried potensial a gwerth yr adeiladau hyn, a all y Prif Weinidog ddweud wrthym pa gefnogaeth y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei rhoi i gymunedau i'w gwneud yn haws iddynt gymryd y gwaith o'u rheoli?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n dibynnu ar y manylion, ond mae'n syniad da mewn egwyddor. Yn y gorffennol, pan oeddwn mewn swydd arall, dywedais ei bod yn bwysig ystyried unrhyw ffordd o sicrhau bod adeilad ysgol sy'n cau ar gael i'r gymdeithas. Hoffwn weld awdurdodau lleol yn ystyried hynny fel ffordd ymlaen, er mwyn sicrhau mynediad i unrhyw adeiladau ysgolion sydd wedi cau i'r gymdeithas.

2.20 p.m.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Brif Weinidog, mae cael adeiladau addas i ddisgyblion ysgol yn eithriadol o bwysig. Fodd bynnag, oni fyddch yn cytuno bod rhoi ystod o gyfleoedd, er enghraifft i wneud ymarfer corff dan do yn ogystal ag yn yr awyr agored,

bwriedir adeiladu'r ysgol wedi ceisio rhoi pob rhwystr y gellir ei ddychmygu i atal ei hadeiladu. Saith mlynedd yn ddiweddarach, heb ddim bai ar yr awdurdod lleol, y Llywodraeth, na'r disgyblion, yr athrawon na'r rhieni, mae'r sefyllfa'n dal heb ei datrys, er y gobeithir ei datrys yn fuan. Felly, weithiau bydd amgylchiadau'n peri problemau, megis hynny, lle nad yw perchenogion tir yn dymuno gweld adeiladu ysgolion ar eu tir. Fodd bynnag, yn gyffredinol, mae llawer o ysgolion wedi cael eu hailadeiladu. Cefais y faint o fod yn Ysgol Gynradd Rogiet, yn sir Fynwy, yn ddiweddar. Adeiladwyd ysgol newydd sbon yno. Yn wir, efallai mai hon yw'r ysgol wyrddaf yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Yr wythnos diwethaf, fel yr wyf eisoes wedi sôn, yr oeddwn mewn adeilad rhyfeddol yn Nhredegar Newydd: mae Ysgol Gynradd y Rhosyn Gwyn yn esiampl wych o ysgol ar gyfer yr unfed ganrif ar hugain.

**Paul Davies:** We have all seen a number of small schools closing over the past few years. As a consequence, some of the buildings are vacant. Some communities have stated their wish to take over these buildings to use them for the benefit of the community. Given the potential and value of these buildings, can the First Minister tell us what support the Welsh Assembly Government is giving to communities to make it easier for them to take over these empty buildings?

**The First Minister:** It depends on the details, but it is a good idea in principle. In the past, in a previous role, I have mentioned that it is important to look for ways of ensuring that a building, once a school has closed, becomes available to the community. I would like to see local authorities considering that as a way forward, to ensure access to any former school buildings for communities.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** First Minister, having suitable school buildings for pupils is exceptionally important. However, would you not agree that offering a range of opportunities, for example for physical education indoors as well as outdoors, is also

yn bwysig os ydym i gynnig pob cyfle i ddisgyblion yn ein hysgolion? A ydych yn rhannu'r rhwystredigaeth y mae Dr Dai Lloyd yn ei deimlo, yn ogystal â nifer ohonom sy'n cefnogi ei Fesur arfaethedig i ddiogelu meysydd chwarae, na wnaed llawer o gynnydd yn y cyfeiriad hwnnw? A wnewch chi ymroi, yn bersonol, i geisio sicrhau bod y Mesur arfaethedig hwnnw yn cael sylw dyladwy fel nad ydym yn colli mwy o feisydd chwarae?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Y peth pwysig i'w ystyried yw a oes problem ar hyn o bryd, a dywedwn i 'na' i hynny. A allai fod yn broblem yn y dyfodol? Nid oes neb yn gwybod. Felly, yr ydym eisiau sicrhau bod pob dull ar gael inni ddiogelu meysydd chwarae yn y dyfodol. Mae ffordd o wneud hynny, sef drwy'r rheoliadau cynllunio, ac adolygir y canllawiau cynllunio yn barhaus. Er hynny, cytunwn â'r nod: mae angen sicrhau bod meysydd chwarae ar gael i ysgolion. Os nad yw hynny'n bosibl mewn ardaloedd trefol, rhaid bod ardal chwarae ar gael o leiaf. Mae hyn wedi gwella o dan y cyfnod sylfaen a sefydlwyd ledled Cymru dros y blynnyddoedd diwethaf.

### Plans for the Next Six Months

**Q10 Darren Millar:** Will the First Minister make a statement on his plans for the next six months? OAQ(3)2868(FM)

**The First Minister:** The plan is to build the economy, to ensure that we deliver our 'One Wales' commitments, and to take forward the draft LCO on sustainable housing.

**Darren Millar:** Thank you for that answer, First Minister. You will be aware that we have an interesting period coming up next month with the football World Cup. According to recent surveys, as many as one person in four is planning to take unauthorised absences from work to watch football matches over the tournament. What action are you taking as a significant employer in the public sector to ensure that taxpayers in Wales do not have to pick up the tab for inappropriate and unauthorised absences in Government departments?

important if we are to ensure that pupils are given every opportunity? Do you share the frustration that Dr Dai Lloyd feels, as well as a several of us who support his proposed Measure on safeguarding playing fields, that not much progress has been made in that respect? Will you commit personally to trying to ensure that the proposed Measure is given the attention that it is due so that we do not lose any more playing fields?

**The First Minister:** The important point to consider is whether there is a problem at the moment, and I would say 'no' to that. Could a problem arise in future? No-one knows. Therefore, we want to ensure that every means is at our disposal to safeguard playing fields for the future. There is a way of doing that, namely via the planning regulations, and planning guidance is kept under constant review. However, we agree with the aim: we need to ensure that schools have playing fields. If that is not possible in urban areas, there must at least be a playing space available. This has improved under the foundation phase that has been implemented throughout Wales in recent years.

### Cynlluniau ar gyfer y Chwe Mis Nesaf

**C10 Darren Millar:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ei gynlluniau ar gyfer y chwe mis nesaf? OAQ(3)2868(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Y cynllun yw adeiladu'r economi, sicrhau y cyflawnwn ein hymrwymiadau o dan 'Cymru'n Un', a bwrw ymlaen â'r Gorchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol drafft ar dai cynaliadwy.

**Darren Millar:** Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Brif Weinidog. Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod gennym gyfnod diddorol o'n blaenau y mis nesaf gyda Chwpan y Byd pêl-droed. Yn ôl arolygon yn ddiweddar, mae cynifer ag un o bob pedwar yn bwriadu bod yn absennol o'r gwaith heb ganiatâd i wyllo gemau pêl-droed yn ystod y twrnamaint. Pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd fel cyflogwr sylweddol yn y sector cyhoeddus i sicrhau na fydd raid i drethdalwyr yng Nghymru dalu'r bil am absenoldebau amhriodol heb ganiatâd yn adrannau'r Llywodraeth?

**The First Minister:** It is absolutely right that taxpayers should not have to pick up the tab for unauthorised absences from the Assembly Chamber, particularly on your front benches.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch yn fawr i'r Prif Weinidog am ateb y cwestiynau.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n berffaith iawn na ddylai trethdalwyr orfod talu'r bil am absenoldebau heb ganiatâd o Siambr y Cynulliad, yn enwedig ar eich meinciau blaen chi.

**The Presiding Officer:** Thank you, First Minister, for answering the questions.

### Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

**Kirsty Williams:** I thank the Presiding Officer for allowing me to raise this point of order. In answer to my question earlier, the First Minister stated that issues relating to the Food Standards Agency were a matter for the London Government. In fact, in 1999, powers over food safety and standards were devolved to the Assembly, and the Food Standards Agency is now accountable to the Welsh Assembly Government as well as Westminster via the Ministers for health. Indeed, it now formally discharges many of the functions that were formerly carried out by Welsh Assembly Government staff. Given that the First Minister thought that it was a matter for London, I felt it important to put on record the fact that the issues that I raised had been formally devolved to the Assembly in 1999. I would be grateful if the First Minister would acknowledge that.

**Kirsty Williams:** Diolch i'r Llywydd am ganiatâu imi godi'r pwynt o drefn hwn. Wrth ateb fy nghwestiwn yn gynharach, dywedodd y Prif Weinidog mai mater i Lywodraeth Llundain oedd materion yn ymwneud â'r Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd. Mewn gwirionedd, ym 1999, datganolwyd pwerau dros safonau a diogelwch bwyd i'r Cynulliad, ac mae'r Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd bellach yn atebol i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ogystal ag i San Steffan drwy'r Gweinidigion iechyd. Yn wir, erbyn hyn mae'n cyflawni'n ffurfiol lawer o'r swyddogaethau a gyflawnid gynt gan staff Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Gan fod y Prif Weinidog yn tybio mai mater i Lundain ydoedd, teimlais ei bod yn bwysig cofnodi'r ffaith fod y materion a godais wedi'u datganoli'n ffurfiol i'r Cynulliad ym 1999. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe bai'r Prif Weinidog yn cydnabod hynny.

**The First Minister:** Further to that point of order, there are powers that exist here, but there are also powers that are constrained by European regulations, particularly with regard to labelling. When it comes to food standards, it is also the case that there are issues of consistency across Great Britain.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn sgîl y pwynt o drefn hwnnw, y mae pwerau sy'n bodoli yma, ond y mae pwerau hefyd a gyfyngir gan reoliadau Ewropeaidd, yn enwedig ynglŷn â labelu. O ran safonau bwyd, mae'n wir hefyd fod materion o gysondeb ar draws Prydain Fawr.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. As the leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats fully knew, even as she informed me that she wanted to raise a point of order, this is not a point of order for me. However, I am so indulgent and generous that I allowed it. One day, this frame of mind must come to an end. [Laughter.]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Fel y gwyddai arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n iawn, hyd yn oed wrth ddweud wrthyf fod arni eisiau codi pwynt o drefn, nid pwynt o drefn i mi yw hwn. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf mor oddefgar a hael nes imi ei ganiatâu. Un diwrnod, bydd yn rhaid i'r ffrâm o feddwl hwn ddod i ben. [Chwerthin.]

## Datganiad a Chyhoeddiad Busnes Business Statement and Announcement

**The Minister for Business and Budget (Jane Hutt):** There are no changes to report to this week's planned Government business. Business for the next three weeks is as set out in the business statement and announcement, which can be found in the agenda papers that are available to Members electronically.

**Y Gweinidog dros Fusnes a'r Gyllideb (Jane Hutt):** Nid oes newidiadau i'w cyhoeddi ym musnes arfaethedig y Llywodraeth yr wythnos hon. Mae'r busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y mae wedi'i nodi yn y datganiad a chyhoeddiad busnes, sydd i'w weld ym mhapurau'r agenda sydd ar gael i'r Aelodau ar ffurf electronig.

**Mark Isherwood:** I wish to call for a single statement on the community transport concessionary fares initiative. At the request of schemes in north Wales, I wrote to the Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport and forwarded his response, which stated that community transport operators that participate in the scheme had been consulted on the proposals by letter, and that that would be followed by meetings. I then had a response from the scheme in Flintshire stating that that may be the theory but it does not seem to be going that way in practice. That person is still awaiting constructive meetings with the community transport association, and is off to pastures new at the end of May.

**Mark Isherwood:** Hoffwn alw am ddatganiad unigol ar y fenter tocynnau teithio rhatach ar drafnidiaeth gymunedol. Ar gais cynlluniau yn y gogledd, ysgrifennais at y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth ac anfon ymlaen ei ateb, a ddywedai fod ymgynghori wedi bod â chwmniau trafnidiaeth gymunedol sy'n cymryd rhan yn y cynllun drwy lythyr ynglŷn â'r cynigion, ac y ceid cyfarfodydd i ddilyn hynny. Wedyn cefais ateb oddi wrth y cynllun yn sir y Fflint yn dweud efallai mai dyna'r theori ond nad yw'n ymddangos mai felly y mae pethau mewn gwirionedd. Mae'r person hwnnw'n dal i ddisgwyl am gyfarfodydd adeiladol gyda'r gymdeithas trafnidiaeth gymunedol, ac mae'n symud i swydd newydd ddiwedd mis Mai.

Denbighshire has responded agreeing completely with Welsh Border Community Transport. There has been very little consultation with the groups. Nobody seems to grasp that several of the groups involved were set up with their own criteria, which cannot be changed to suit Welsh Government requirements. The person responding is also leaving, and believes that it will be difficult to sustain some of these schemes for much longer. The response goes on to say that the staff have been fantastic, but they are worried about the security of their jobs and the future of their members. Minister, this is important, and I hope that you will respond in the affirmative.

Mae sir Ddinbych wedi ymateb gan gytuno'n llwyr â Thrafnidiaeth Gymunedol y Gororau. Ychydig iawn o ymgynghori a gafwyd â'r grwpiau. Nid oes neb i'w weld yn deall bod amryw o'r grwpiau dan sylw wedi'u sefydlu gyda'u meini prawf eu hunain, na ellir eu newid i ateb gofynion Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae'r sawl a ymatebodd yntau ar fin gadael, ac yn credu y bydd yn anodd cynnal rhai o'r cynlluniau hyn am lawer o amser eto. Aiff yr ymateb ymlaen i ddweud bod y staff wedi bod yn wych, ond eu bod yn poeni am ddiogelwch eu swyddi a dyfodol eu haelodau. Weinidog, mae hyn yn bwysig, a gobeithio yr ymatebwch yn gadarnhaol.

**Jane Hutt:** Mark, you have shared extensive correspondence with us today, and I am sure that the Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport will deal with this matter accordingly.

**Jane Hutt:** Mark, yr ydych wedi cyflwyno gohebiaeth helaeth inni heddiw, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnaiff y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth ddelio â'r mater hwn yn briodol.

**Christine Chapman:** Minister, could we have a statement on how the Welsh Assembly Government can best support youth facilities in Wales, particularly those in the third sector? As an illustration, Chequers youth facility in Aberdare in my constituency is facing imminent closure. Over the past 10 years, it has faced a number of challenges, which have related mostly to the continuity of the funding on which its existence depends. I have written to the Minister about this issue. Clearly, this is a stressful time for staff and young people alike, who are worried about what the future holds. If we are to secure the future provision of youth services, which depend on grants from charities and the Government, we must ensure that they receive the help and support that are necessary in a strategic way. If we can achieve that, we can be confident that many of our young people will have safe places in which to socialise with their peers.

**Jane Hutt:** Facilities such as the youth club in your constituency that you mentioned play an important role in our communities, particularly in addressing the needs of young people. You have done exactly the right thing by writing to the Minister to get clarification of the future prospects for this youth scheme.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Minister for business, I want to ask you to find time for two statements, if possible. The first would be on animal welfare, particularly in relation to Chinese lanterns, which some people may have read about in the press. While they seem to be a harmless enough accessory, and many people purchase them, they are held together by wire, which can cause excruciating pain and, ultimately, death if digested by a cow or any type of wildlife. The issue has been raised with me on several occasions in the past few weeks by farmers and others who are concerned about wildlife in the Vale of Glamorgan. However, it goes beyond the Vale and is an issue for the wider countryside. I would be grateful to learn what action the Minister for Rural Affairs, along with her colleague, the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government—because there is also a trading standards issue here—

**Christine Chapman:** Weinidog, a gaem ddatganiad ynghylch beth yw'r ffordd orau i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru allu cefnogi cyfleusterau i ieuencid yng Nghymru, yn enwedig yn y trydydd sector? A rhoi enghraifft, mae cyfleuster ieuencid Chequers yn Aberdâr yn fy etholaeth ar fin cau. Yn ystod y 10 mlynedd diwethaf, mae wedi wynebu sawl her, yn ymwneud yn bennaf â pharhad y cylid y mae ei fodolaeth yn dibynnu arno. Yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at y Gweinidog am y mater hwn. Yn amlwg, mae'n adeg o straen i staff a phobl ifanc fel ei gilydd, sy'n poeni am beth a ddaw. Os ydym am sicrhau darpariaeth yn y dyfodol o ran gwasanaethau iechyd, sy'n dibynnu ar grantiau gan elusennau a'r Llywodraeth, rhaid inni sicrhau y cânt y cymorth a'r gefnogaeth sy'n angenrheidiol mewn ffordd strategol. Os gallwn gyflawni hynny, gallwn fod yn hyderus y bydd gan lawer o'n pobl ifanc leoedd diogel ar gyfer cymdeithasu â'u cyfoedion.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae cyfleusterau fel y clwb ieuencid yn eich etholaeth a grybwyllyd gennych yn chwarae'r rôl bwysig yn ein cymunedau, yn enwedig o ran diwallu anghenion pobl ifanc. Yr ydych wedi gwneud y peth holol iawn drwy ysgrifennu at y Gweinidog i gael darlun eglurach o'r rhagolygon i'r cynllun ieuencid hwn i'r dyfodol.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Weinidog busnes, mae arnaf eisai gofyn ichi ganfod amser ar gyfer dau ddatganiad, os oes modd. Byddai a wnelo'r cyntaf â lles anifeiliaid, yn enwedig mewn perthynas â llusernau Tsieineaid, y mae rhai pobl wedi darllen amdanynt yn y wasg efallai. Er eu bod yn ymddangos yn bethau digon diniwed, a bod llawer o bobl yn eu prynu, maent wedi'u llunio â gwifren, a all achosi poen dirdynnol ac, yn y pen draw, marwolaeth os cânt eu bwyta gan fuwch neu unrhyw anifail gwylt. Mae'r mater hwn wedi'i godi gyda mi droeon yn ystod yr wythnosau diwethaf gan ffermwyr ac eraill sy'n bryderus am fywyd gwylt ym Mro Morgannwg. Fodd bynnag, mae'n mynd ymhellach na'r Fro ac yn broblem i gefn gwlad yn fwy cyffredinol. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar o gael gwybod pa gamau y bydd y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig, ynghyd â'i chyd-Weinidog, y Gweinidog dros

will be taking to raise awareness among consumers about the safe use of these products, perhaps by looking at the possibility of placing a safety message on these products so that people understand that they have a responsibility. I implore the Minister to allow time for that statement, because anyone who has had the misfortune, as I have, of seeing an animal die with wire in its stomach will have witnessed the suffering and pain that it causes.

Secondly, could we have a statement from the Minister for Environment, Sustainability and Housing on the community investment levy? I understand that this is a piece of Whitehall legislation that has implications for Wales in the form of a levy that would be applied to planning applications, ultimately adding to the build cost of community projects. I am led to believe that the levy represents 1 per cent of the overall build cost of a project. To my mind, that has significant implications for people who are looking to develop projects. While we all subscribe to the importance of looking at ways of encouraging community participation and generating revenues for community services, this would be a tax on development. I would be grateful to hear the Welsh Assembly Government's position, particularly on how it is engaging with the new Government at Westminster to make sure that this tax is not introduced, thereby hindering development here in Wales.

**Jane Hutt:** Like many things that are raised with me as Minister for Business and Budget, these are important issues, which I am sure you will be following up with letters to the Ministers concerned. Clearly, the first issue that you raised is a matter for the Minister for Rural Affairs, as it is an important animal welfare matter. I am sure that you will follow that up in correspondence.

In respect of the community investment levy, you have an opportunity, which I am sure you will take up, given the composition of the new Government at Westminster. I would certainly want to be assured, as would the

Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol—oherwydd y mae cwestiwn ynglŷn â safonau masnach yma hefyd—yn eu cymryd i godi ymwybyddiaeth ymhlieth y cyhoedd ynglŷn â defnyddio'r nwyddau hyn yn ddiogel, efallai drwy edrych ar y posiblirwydd o roi neges ddiogelwch ar y nwyddau hyn fel bod pobl yn deall bod ganddynt gyfrifoldeb. Erfyniaf ar y Gweinidog i ganiatâu amser ar gyfer y datganiad hwnnw, oherwydd bydd unrhyw un a fu mor anffodus, fel y bûm i, â gweld anifail yn marw â gwifren yn ei stumog wedi dystio i'r dioddefaint a'r boen y mae'n ei achosi.

Yn ail, a gaem ddatganiad gan y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynaliadwyedd a Thai am yr ardoll buddsoddiad cymunedol? Deallaf mai darn o ddeddfwriaeth o Whitehall yw hwn sydd â goblygiadau i Gymru ar ffurf ardoll a godid ar geisiadau cynllunio, gan ychwanegu yn y pen draw at gost adeiladu prosiectau cymunedol. Yr wyf yn cael ar ddeall bod yr ardoll yn cyfateb i 1 y cant o gyfanswm cost adeiladu prosiect. Yn fy marn i, mae i hynny oblygiadau sylweddol i bobl sydd â'u bryd ar ddatblygu prosiectau. Er ein bod i gyd yn derbyn pwysigrwydd edrych ar ffyrdd o annog cyfranogiad cymunedol a chynhyrchu refeniw ar gyfer gwasanaethau cymunedol, treth ar ddatblygu fyddai hyn. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar o glywed safbwyt Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, yn enwedig o ran y modd y mae'n ymgysylltu â'r Llywodraeth newydd yn San Steffan i sicrhau na chyflwynir y dreth hon, a fyddai'n llesteirio datblygiad yma yng Nghymru.

**Jane Hutt:** Fel llawer o bethau a godir gyda mi fel Gweinidog dros Fusnes a'r Gyllideb, mae'r rhain yn faterion pwysig, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn eu dilyn drwy lythyru â'r Gweinidigion perthnasol. Yn amlwg, mater i'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig yw'r mater cyntaf a godasoch, gan ei fod yn fater pwysig i les anifeiliaid. Yr wyf yn siŵr y dilynwch hynny drwy ohebiaeth.

Ynglŷn â'r ardoll buddsoddiad cymunedol, mae gennych gyfle, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn achub y cyfle hwnnw, o ystyried cyfansoddiad y Llywodraeth newydd yn San Steffan. Yn sicr, byddai arnaf fi, a'r

Minister for Environment, Sustainability and Housing, that we can take advantage of that and address the issues that might arise from it.

2.30 p.m.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Could we have a statement soon from the Minister for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning on the task and finish group that was set up to consider the Student Loans Company Ltd in Wales? I have received correspondence from people in local authorities who are concerned about the potential recommendations, particularly if the company is centralised, as is currently happening in England, and given the grave problems with regard to access to student loans.

I also seek a statement on whether the Welsh Government will take part in the higher education review, or the Browne review, as was mentioned in questions to the First Minister; I have previously written to the Minister for education on this issue. The Russell Group has said that the cap on student fees should be lifted and that there should be a change in the student loans system, so it might be appropriate for the Welsh Government to reconsider its input to the current review, given that it will directly affect Welsh students. It will be too late for us to take part in any review after it has finished its work. Therefore, I also request a statement on that.

**Jane Hutt:** On your first point, on the student finance system in Wales, I understand that you have already written to the Minister, which is the right course of action for you to clarify the outcome of the work of that important task and finish group that is looking at available options to ensure that Welsh students continue to benefit from a first-class service, which is key to student loans.

On your second point, it is a UK Government review, as the First Minister said. We undertook our own substantive review and it is important that we take note of the findings as they emerge from the Browne review.

Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynaliadwyedd a Thai, eisiau sicrwydd y gallwn fanteisio ar hynny a delio â'r materion a allai godi o hynny.

**Bethan Jenkins:** A gaem ddatganiad yn fuan gan y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes am y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen a sefydlwyd i ystyried y Cwmni Benthyciadau i Fyfyrwyr yng Nghymru? Yr wyf wedi cael gohebiaeth oddi wrth bobl mewn awdurdodau lleol sy'n bryderus ynghylch yr argymhellion posibl, yn enwedig os caiff y cwmni ei ganoli, fel sy'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd yn Lloegr, ac o ystyried y problemau dybryd o ran cael gafael ar fenthyciadau i fyfyrwyr.

Gofynnaf am ddatganiad hefyd ynghylch a fydd Llywodraeth Cymru'n cymryd rhan yn yr adolygiad o addysg uwch, neu adolygiad Browne, fel y crybwylwyd mewn cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog; yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu o'r blaen at y Gweinidog addysg ar y mater hwn. Mae Grŵp Russell wedi dweud y dylid codi'r cap ar ffioedd myfyrwyr ac y dylid newid y system benthyciadau myfyrwyr, felly efallai y byddai'n briodol i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ailystyried ei mewnbwn i'r adolygiad cyfredol, gan y bydd yn effeithio'n uniongyrchol ar fyfyrwyr Cymru. Bydd yn rhy hwyr inni gymryd rhan mewn unrhyw adolygiad wedi iddo orffen ei waith. Felly, gofynnaf am ddatganiad ar hynny hefyd.

**Jane Hutt:** O ran eich pwynt cyntaf, ynglŷn â'r system cyllid myfyrwyr yng Nghymru, yr wyf yn deall eich bod eisoes wedi ysgrifennu at y Gweinidog, sef y cam iawn ichi ei gymryd i gael eglurhad ar ganlyniad gwaith y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen pwysig hwnnw sy'n edrych ar yr opsiynau sydd ar gael i sicrhau bod myfyrwyr Cymru'n dal i elwa o wasanaeth o'r radd flaenaf, sy'n allweddol i fenthyciadau myfyrwyr.

O ran eich ail bwynt, adolygiad gan Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig ydyw, fel y dywedodd y Prif Weinidog. Fe wnaethom ein hadolygiad sylweddol ein hunain ac mae'n bwysig inni nodi'r casgliadau sy'n deillio o adolygiad Browne.

**Paul Davies:** I have recently received correspondence from the Deputy First Minister on the national transport plan that was recently announced. In the correspondence, he mentions that the four regional transport consortia in Wales have now finalised their respective regional transport plans. I understand that these plans include proposals for new rail services—including in my constituency—but some are not included in the national transport plan or rail forward programme. However, the Deputy First Minister and the Assembly Government have said that they would consider these proposals alongside all other projects. Will you ask the Deputy First Minister to bring forward a statement as soon as possible, so that we know what specific schemes will be taken forward?

**Jane Hutt:** The national transport plan is key to the development of our infrastructure. The Deputy First Minister and the Minister for the Economy and Transport is taking forward proposals that have been submitted, in partnership with both local authorities and regional transport consortia, to ensure that we have an integrated strategy. I am sure that that will come forward in the course of usual ministerial business.

**Alun Davies:** I wish to ask for two statements and for some guidance. First, I would like a statement on the future of ITV Wales news. We understand that the manifesto position of the current Conservative Secretary of State for Culture, Olympics, Media and Sport is to abandon the project, which would have seen an independently funded news consortium taking over ITV Wales news in the next few months. Notwithstanding the work that has already been done, including the appointment of UTV to undertake the work, and the all-party support for that project in the Chamber, it would create a very real crisis in the Welsh media were the IFNC policy to be abandoned. Movement on this by the Government would have support across the Chamber. I would appreciate a statement by the Minister for Heritage as soon as possible on the Welsh Assembly Government's

**Paul Davies:** Yr wyf wedi cael gohebiaeth yn ddiweddar oddi wrth y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ynglŷn â'r cynllun trafnidiaeth cenedlaethol a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar. Yn yr ohebiaeth, dywed fod y pedwar consortiwm trafnidiaeth rhanbarthol yng Nghymru bellach wedi llunio'u cynlluniau trafnidiaeth rhanbarthol terfynol eu hunain. Deallaf fod y cynlluniau hyn yn cynnwys cynigion ar gyfer gwasanaethau rheilffordd newydd—gan gynnwys rhai yn fy etholaeth i—ond mae rhai heb eu cynnwys yn y cynllun trafnidiaeth cenedlaethol na'r flaenraglen reilffyrdd. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi dweud yr ystyriant y cynigion hyn ochr yn ochr â phob prosiect arall. A wnewch ofyn i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog gyflwyno datganiad cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl, er mwyn inni gael gwybod pa gynlluniau penodol a weithredir?

**Jane Hutt:** Mae'r cynllun trafnidiaeth cenedlaethol yn allweddol i ddatblygiad ein seilwaith. Mae'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth yn bwrw ymlaen â chynigion sydd wedi'u cyflwyno, mewn partneriaeth ag awdurdodau lleol a'r consortia trafnidiaeth rhanbarthol, i sicrhau y bydd gennym strategaeth integredig. Yr wyf yn siŵr y caiff hynny sylw yn ystod busnes gweinidogol arferol.

**Alun Davies:** Hoffwn ofyn am ddau ddatganiad ac am arweiniad. Yn gyntaf, hoffwn gael datganiad am ddyfodol newyddion ITV Cymru. Deallwn mai safbwyt manifesto'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Ceidwadol presennol dros Ddiwylliant, y Gemau Olympaidd, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon yw rhoi'r gorau i'r prosiect, a fyddai wedi golygu bod consortiwm newyddion a ariennir yn annibynnol yn cymryd rheolaeth dros newyddion ITV Cymru yn ystod y misoedd nesaf. Er gwaethaf yr holl waith sydd eisoes wedi'i wneud, gan gynnwys penodi UTV i ymgymryd â'r gwaith, a'r gefnogaeth i'r prosiect hwnnw gan bob plaid yn y Siambwr, byddai'n creu argyfwng gwirioneddol yn y cyfryngau yng Nghymru pe rhoddir heibio bolisi'r consortiwm newyddion a ariennir yn annibynnol. Pe bai'r Llywodraeth yn gwneud rhywbeth am hyn cai gefnogaeth ar draws y

position and on how it seeks to ensure that our position on this remains unchanged, notwithstanding the change of Government in Westminster.

The second statement that I ask for is on the budget. We understand that there will be an emergency budget in Westminster on 22 June. We also understand that the Liberal/Conservative position is to drive forward substantial reductions in public spending in this financial year. This will have an enormous impact upon public services in Wales. During questions to the First Minister, I asked that we have complete transparency with regard to the way in which the Assembly Government deals with these Liberal-Conservative cuts in spending. I would like to ensure that there is a Government statement on this matter subsequent to the budget on 22 June and certainly before we go into recess in July. It is important that people throughout Wales have an opportunity to contribute to this process and understand the damage that the Liberal-Conservative cuts could cause in Wales.

The third point on which I seek your guidance, Minister, is the status of Tory and Liberal debates on Wednesday afternoons. Until now, both groups have been allowed two debates in the Chamber—[*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This is not a matter for the Minister for Business and Budget; it is a matter for our Standing Orders and the Business Committee. However, as I am always pleased to advise you, you asked some pertinent questions to which the Minister may respond. I am afraid that you will have to take your final issue up with your representative on the Business Committee, who happens to be the Minister.

**Jane Hutt:** Thank you, Llywydd, for that pertinent guidance to Alun Davies. Thank you, Alun, for raising this very important issue about the threat to the provision of independently funded news coverage as a result of the new Con-Lib administration in

Siambr. Gwerthfawrogwn ddatganiad gan y Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl am safbwyt Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ac ynghylch sut y mae am geisio sicrhau y bydd ein safbwyt ar hyn yn aros yn ddigyfnewid, er gwaethaf y newid Llywodraeth yn San Steffan.

Ynglŷn â'r gyllideb y mae'r ail ddatganiad y gofynnaf amdano. Deallwn y bydd cyllideb frys yn San Steffan ar 22 Mehefin. Deallwn hefyd mai bwriad y Rhyddfrydwyr a'r Ceidwadwyr yw bwrw ymlaen â thoriadau sylwedol mewn gwariant cyhoeddus yn y flwyddyn ariannol hon. Caiff hyn effaith enfawr ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Yn ystod cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog, gofynnais am inni gael tryloywder llwyr ynglŷn â'r modd y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn delio â'r toriadau hyn mewn gwariant gan y Rhyddfrydwyr a'r Ceidwadwyr. Hoffwn sicrhau y ceir datganiad gan y Llywodraeth ar y mater hwn ar ôl y gyllideb ar 22 Mehefin ac yn sicr cyn i'r toriad ddechrau ym mis Gorffennaf. Mae'n bwysig i bobl ledled Cymru gael cyfle i gyfrannu at y broses hon a deall y niwed y gallai'r toriadau gan y Rhyddfrydwyr a'r Ceidwadwyr eu hachosi yng Nghymru.

Y trydydd pwynt y ceisiaf arweiniad gennych arno, Weinidog, yw statws dadleuon y Torïaid a'r Rhyddfrydwyr ar brynhawn Mercher. Hyd yma, mae'r ddau grŵp wedi bod yn cael dwy ddadl yn y Siambr—[*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid mater i'r Gweinidog dros Fusnes a'r Gyllideb yw hynny; mae'n fater i'n Rheolau Sefydlog a'r Pwyllgor Busnes. Fodd bynnag, gan fy mod bob amser yn falch o roi cyngor ichi, gofynasoch rai cwestiynau perthnasol y gall y Gweinidog ymateb iddynt. Mae arnaf ofn y bydd raid ichi godi'ch cwestiwn olaf gyda'ch cynrychiolydd ar y Pwyllgor Busnes, sef y Gweinidog, fel y mae'n digwydd.

**Jane Hutt:** Diolch, Lywydd, am yr arweiniad perthnasol hwnnw i Alun Davies. Diolch i chithau, Alun, am godi'r pwynt pwysig iawn hwn am y bygythiad i ddarpariaeth newyddion ariennir yn annibynnol, yn sgîl gweinyddiaeth newydd y Ceidwadwyr a'r

Westminster. As you said, this is something on which there was cross-party support when it was debated in the Chamber. It is important that that is aired again. I am sure that the Minister will have heard that contribution this afternoon, backing the First Minister earlier.

I am here not only as the Minister for business, but also as the Minister for budget, and it is in this capacity that I answer your second point on the emergency budget, which we understand will take place on 22 June. I made my views clear last week: we should not cut public expenditure this year, because it presents an unacceptable risk to the economic recovery that we are beginning to see. Of course, the deficit needs to be reduced, but only as quickly as is possible without threatening the recovery and without causing massive damage to public services. That, of course, is a great concern within my portfolio as the Minister for Business and Budget.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Minister, I want to return to the point that I raised with the First Minister earlier this afternoon. There is real concern in Cardiff about the proposed development at Whitchurch Hospital and whether or not we will see a new, modern, acute, in-patient facility for those who are seriously mentally ill. The Assembly Government approved an ambitious plan that would cost £80 million to put a new hospital on that site. There was widespread support for reforming an outdated, Victorian asylum, which had long passed its usefulness. We all backed the Minister's determination in supporting the local plans for spending the £80 million that had been allocated by the Assembly Government for this scheme. We have heard this afternoon that the First Minister is unable to guarantee that the project will even go ahead. He could not even guarantee that the £80 million allocated by the Minister for Health and Social Services is still available to be spent, and he refused to rule out the possibility of the health board selling off land near the site for housing development in order to help to pay for this scheme.

Rhyddfrydwyr yn San Steffan. Fel y dywedasoch, mae hyn yn rhywbeth a gafodd gefnogaeth y pleidiau i gyd pan gafodd ei drafod yn y Siambra. Mae'n bwysig gwyntyllu hynny eto. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y Gweinidog wedi clywed y cyfraniad hwnnw y prynhawn yma, sy'n ategu geiriau'r Prif Weinidog yn gynharach.

Yr wyf yma nid yn unig fel y Gweinidog dros fusnes, ond hefyd fel y Gweinidog dros y gyllideb, ac yn rhinwedd y swydd honno yr atebaf eich ail bwynt ynghylch y gyllideb frys, a gynhelir, yn ôl a ddeallwn, ar 22 Mehefin. Gwneuthum fy marn yn glir yr wythnos diwethaf: ni ddylem gwatori gwariant cyhoeddus eleni, oherwydd y byddai'n golygu perygl annerbyniol i'r adferiad economaidd yr ydym yn dechrau ei weld. Wrth gwrs, mae angen lleihau'r diffyg, ond dim ond cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl heb fygwth yr adferiad a heb achosi niwed enfawr i wasanaethau cyhoeddus. Mae hynny, wrth reswm, yn bryder mawr o fewn fy mhorthffolio fel Gweinidog dros Fusnes a'r Gyllideb.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Weinidog, mae arnaf eisiau dychwelyd at y pwynt a godais gyda'r Prif Weinidog yn gynharach y prynhawn yma. Ceir gwir bryder yng Nghaerdydd am y datblygiad arfaethedig yn Ysbyty'r Eglwys Newydd ac ynghylch a welwn gyfleuster newydd, modern, aciwt i gleifion mewnol sydd â salwch meddwl difrifol ai peidio. Cymeradwyodd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad gynllun uchelgeisiol a fyddai'n costio £80 miliwn i roi ysbyty newydd ar y safle hwnnw. Yr oedd cefnogaeth eang i adnewyddu gwallgofdy Fictorianaid hen ffasiwn yr oedd ei ddefnyddioldeb wedi hen ddod i ben. Cefnogodd pawb ohonom benderfyniad y Gweinidog i gefnogi'r cynlluniau lleol ar gyfer gwario'r £80 miliwn a oedd wedi'i ddyrannu gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer y cynllun hwn. Yr ydym wedi clywed y prynhawn yma nad yw'r Prif Weinidog yn gallu gwarantu yr aiff y prosiect yn ei flaen, hyd yn oed. Ni allai hyd yn oed warantu bod yr £80 miliwn a ddyrannwyd gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn dal ar gael i'w wario, a gwrthododd ddiystyru'r posibilrwydd y gallai'r bwrdd iechyd werthu tir gerllaw'r safle ar gyfer datblygiad tai er

mwyn helpu i dalu am y cynllun hwn.

I have asked repeatedly whether the Minister for Health and Social Services will make a statement in the Chamber to everyone, because it does not affect only me as the Assembly Member for Cardiff North; it affects all Assembly Members in Cardiff and beyond, and those people who might need to use an important facility in Whitchurch. We need to know the position as it affects Whitchurch Hospital, as it means delays and uncertainty, and there is a great deal of anxiety among families who may need that facility in the future. I urge the Government to ask the Minister for Health and Social Services to make a statement so that we know the exact position in order that we might be reassured that the money is there to be spent and that there are plans that will still go ahead to replace that outdated facility with a new, modern, acute hospital.

Yr wyf wedi gofyn dro ar ôl tro a wnaiff y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ddatganiad yn y Siambra i bawb, oherwydd y mae'n effeithio nid yn unig arnaf fi fel yr Aelod Cynulliad dros Ogledd Caerdydd; mae'n effeithio ar bob Aelod Cynulliad yng Nghaerdydd a thu hwnt, a'r bobl y gallai fod arnynt angen defnyddio cyfleuster pwysig yn yr Eglwys Newydd. Mae angen inni wybod beth yw'r sefyllfa fel y mae'n effeithio ar Ysbyty'r Eglwys Newydd, gan ei fod yn golygu oedi ac ansicrwydd, a cheir llawer iawn o bryder ymmsg teuluoedd y bydd arnynt angen y cyfleuster hwnnw efallai yn y dyfodol. Yr wyf yn annog y Llywodraeth i ofyn i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wneud datganiad inni gael gwybod yr union sefyllfa er mwyn cael sicrwydd bod yr arian yno i'w wario a bod cynlluniau a aiff yn eu blaen o hyd i gael ysbyty newydd, modern, aciwt yn lle'r cyfleuster hen ffasiwn hwnnw.

**Jane Hutt:** You have many opportunities, of which I know you take advantage, to ask for clarification from the Minister for health on a number of matters that relate to local projects and local developments. The important point is that we need modern mental health services that meet the needs of not only the patients but also the clinical expertise and evidence. It is Mind week this week, and we have focused on mental health and the contribution that you have made in your proposed LCO on mental health and where we will take that legislation. Let us look at what works in mental health services.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae gennych sawl cyfle, y gwn eich bod yn manteisio arnynt, i ofyn am eglurhad gan y Gweinidog iechyd ar nifer o faterion sy'n ymwneud â phrosiectau lleol a datblygiadau lleol. Y pwyt pwysig yw bod arnom angen gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl modern sydd yn ateb anghenion nid yn unig y cleifion ond yr arbenigedd a'r dystiolaeth glinigol hefyd. Mae'n wythnos Mind yr wythnos hon, ac yr ydym wedi canolbwytio ar iechyd meddwl a'r cyfraniad yr ydych wedi'i wneud yn eich Gorchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol arfaethedig ar iechyd meddwl ac i ble yr awn â'r ddeddfwriaeth honno. Gadewch inni edrych ar yr hyn sydd yn gweithio mewn gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl.

2.40 p.m.

**Nick Bourne:** Returning to the question asked by Alun Davies in relation to the budget, I know that the Minister did not want to mislead the Chamber, but she did not make clear that there has been a clear offer—which the First Minister welcomed—of flexibility on budget arrangements so that there would not need to be any in-year cuts in the Welsh Assembly budget for this year. I do not know

**Nick Bourne:** A dychwelyd at y cwestiwn a ofynnwyd gan Alun Davies ynglŷn â'r gyllideb, gwn nad oedd ar y Gweinidog eisiau camarwain y Siambra, ond nid eglurodd fod cynnig clir wedi'i wneud—a groesawyd gan y Prif Weinidog—o hyblygrwydd yngylch trefniadau'r gyllideb fel na fyddai angen toriadau o fewn y flwyddyn yng nhŷllideb y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol y

if the Minister for Business and Budget agrees with her First Minister or whether she takes a different line, but it was not an offer made by the Labour Party in its manifesto. I hope that she welcomes that flexibility in dealing with £1 trillion-worth of debt that she, like the rest of the Labour Party, recognises has to be paid off. We do not have to make any cuts this year, so I would be grateful if you could tell us whether or not you welcome that.

**Jane Hutt:** I repeat what I said last week with regard to our concerns about the risk to the economic recovery as a result of an in-year emergency budget, given that we have set our budget, with the Assembly's approval, for 2010-11. We are working actively to prepare for our 2011-12 budget and we look forward to the forthcoming comprehensive spending review. It would be inappropriate for Wales to suffer large in-year cuts, as it would destabilise the budgets, and, more importantly, front-line public services. We welcome any flexibility, but what I would like to secure from the parties represented on your side of the Chamber—this goes for your Liberal Democrat colleagues as well—is a response from the Chief Secretary to the Treasury, to whom I wrote immediately after his name was announced last Wednesday. As the Minister with budgetary responsibility in Wales, I congratulated him but said that I would like an early meeting to discuss these issues so that we can handle this responsibly and constructively.

flwyddyn hon. Ni wn a yw'r Gweinidog dros Fusnes a'r Gyllideb yn cytuno â'i Phrif Weinidog ynteu a yw ei hagwedd yn wahanol, ond nid oedd yn gynnig a wnaed gan y Blaid Lafur yn ei maniffesto hi. Gobeithio ei bod yn croesawu'r hyblygrwydd hwnnw ar gyfer delio â dyled gwerth £1 triliwn y mae hi, fel gweddill y Blaid Lafur, yn derbyn bod yn rhaid ei thalu. Nid oes raid inni gwtogi dim eleni, felly byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech ddweud wrthym a ydych yn croesawu hynny ai peidio.

**Jane Hutt:** Ailadroddaf yr hyn a ddywedais yr wythnos diwethaf ynglŷn â'n pryderon am y perygl i'r adferiad economaidd o ganlyniad i gyllideb frys yn ystod y flwyddyn, gan ein bod wedi gosod ein cyllideb, gyda chymeradwyaeth y Cynulliad, ar gyfer 2010-11. Yr ydym wrthi'n gweithio i baratoi at ein cyllideb ar gyfer 2011-12, ac yn edrych ymlaen at yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant sydd i ddod. Byddai'n amhriodol i Gymru ddioddef toriadau mawr yn ystod y flwyddyn, gan y byddai'n ansefydlogi'r cyllidebau, ac, yn bwysicach, gwasanaethau cyhoeddus y rheng flaen. Yr ydym yn croesawu unrhyw hyblygrwydd, ond yr hyn yr hoffwn ei sicrhau gan y pleidiau a gynrychiolir ar eich ochr chi i'r Siambrae—mae hyn wedi'i gyfeirio at eich cyd-Aelodau yn y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol hefyd—yw ymateb gan y Prif Ysgrifennydd i'r Trysorlys, yr ysgrifennais ato'n syth wedi i'w enw gael ei gyhoeddi ddydd Mercher diwethaf. Fel y Gweinidog â chyfrifoldeb cyllidebol yng Nghymru, fe'i llonyferchais ond dywedais yr hoffwn gael cyfarfod buan i drafod y materion hyn er mwyn inni allu ymdrin â hyn yn gyfrifol ac yn adeiladol.

## **Datganiad am y Diwydiant Cyhoeddi Cymraeg Statement on the Welsh Language Publishing Industry**

**Y Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth (Alun Ffred Jones):** Yr wyf yn falch o'r cyfre i dynnu sylw at y diwydiant cyhoeddi Cymraeg. Mae'r gair ysgrifenedig yn rhan hollbwysig o ddiwylliant Cymru. Drwy'r gair ysgrifenedig gallwn gyfleo'r Gymru fodern tra'nadlewyrchu'n traddodiadau fel cenedl. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn hyrwyddo cyhoeddi yn y ddwy iaith drwy Gyngor Llyfrau Cymru. Er mai cyhoeddi drwy

**The Minister for Heritage (Alun Ffred Jones):** I am delighted today to have the opportunity to draw attention to the Welsh-language publishing industry. The written word is a vital component of Wales's culture. Through the written word we can convey the modern Wales whilst also reflecting our traditions as a nation. The Assembly Government promotes publishing in both languages through the Welsh Books Council.

gyfrwng y Gymraeg sydd o dan sylw heddiw, priodol yw nodi hefyd lwyddiant y diwydiant cyhoeddi Saesneg yng Nghymru. Bu'r cyllid ychwanegol a roddwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn dilyn adroddiad y Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon ar ysgrifennu Saesneg yng Nghymru yn 2004, yn hwb sylwedol. Arweiniodd at nifer o ddatblygiadau cyffrous gan gynnwys sefydlu'r gyfres hynod amrywiol, *Library of Wales*, sy'n cynnwys 26 o gyfrolau erbyn hyn.

Mae buddsoddiad ariannol gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ystod y degawd diwethaf wedi datblygu cyhoeddi yn y Gymraeg drwy sicrhau amrywiaeth eang o ddeunydd darllen, yn llyfrau ffeithiol a ffuglen yn ogystal â thrafodaethau bywiog mewn cylchgronau amrywiol, boed mewn print neu ar-lein.

I droi at ystod y llyfrau, mae'r ddarpariaeth ar gyfer y plant lleiaf yn amlwg, ac yn cyfrannu at dwf addysg cyfrwng Gymraeg. Yn wir, mae gan y diwydiant cyhoeddi rôl allweddol yn yr ymdrech i hyrwyddo'r iaith. Os ydym am annog mwy a mwy o bobl sy'n siarad Cymraeg i ddefnyddio'r iaith, a sicrhau bod ganddynt yr hyder i wneud hynny, bydd yn bwysig sicrhau eu bod yn gynyddol lythrennog a chyfarwydd â Chymraeg ysgrifenedig.

Yn dilyn adroddiad y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar gyhoeddi yn 2002, neilltuodd y Llywodraeth gyllid ychwanegol i'r diwydiant cyhoeddi. Gwariwyd cyfran helaeth o'r cyllid hwnnw ar gomisiynu awduron i lunio llyfrau poblogaidd. Llwyddodd y cyllid ychwanegol i wneud gwahaniaeth, yn enwedig ym maes nofelau a chofiannau, a gwelwyd cyhoeddi amrywiaeth dda o nofelau gan awduron profiadol a chan leisiau newydd. Mae cyhoeddwyr bellach yn comisiynu gwaith i ateb gofynion y farchnad.

Although it is Welsh-language publishing that is under consideration today, it is also appropriate to note the success of the English-language publishing sector in Wales. The additional funding from the Welsh Assembly Government, following the Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee's report on English-medium writing in Wales in 2004, was a significant boost. This led to a number of exciting developments, including the establishment of the hugely successful series, Library of Wales, which now includes 26 volumes.

The Welsh Assembly Government investment during the last decade has developed Welsh-language publishing by ensuring a wide range of reading material—factual books and fiction as well as lively discussions in various magazines, either in print or online.

To turn to the range of books, the provision for small children is obvious, and contributes to the growth in Welsh-medium education. Indeed, the publishing industry has a vital role in promoting the language. If we want to encourage as many as possible who speak Welsh to use it, and to ensure that they have the confidence to do so, it is important to ensure that they are increasingly literate and familiar with written Welsh.

Following the report of the task and finish group on publishing in 2002, the Government provided additional funding to the publishing industry. The majority of this funding was spent on commissioning authors to create popular books. This additional funding succeeded in making a difference, especially in the field of novels and biographies, and a good range of novels were published by experienced authors and new voices. Publishers now commission work to answer the demands of the market.

Digwyddodd hyn i raddau wedi i'r cyngor benderfynu rhoi mwy o ryddid a chyfrifoldeb i'r gweisg unigol i ddewis pa lyfrau i'w cyhoeddi. Mae'r buddsoddiad wedi arwain at gynnydd yn ansawdd y deunydd a chynnydd yn y gwerthiant. Yn nhair blynedd cyntaf yr arian ychwanegol, 2003 i 2006, gwerthwyd bron i 53,000 o gopïau o nofelau Cymraeg, o'i gymharu â gwerthiant o lai na 23,000 o gopïau yn y tair blynedd cyn hynny, sef cynnydd o 132 y cant.

Yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf, yr ydym fel Llywodraeth wedi darparu cyllid ychwanegol, sef pecyn o £300,000 i'r diwydiant cyhoeddi am y flwyddyn ariannol 2010-11. Bydd hynny'n galluogi cyhoeddwyr i gyflogi rhagor o olygyddion creadigol i weithio law yn llaw gydag awduron. Y nod eto yw gwella ansawdd llyfrau ymhellach, a chynyddu eu gwerthiant. Mae nifer o'r swyddi hyn wedi eu lleoli mewn ardaloedd gwledig sy'n gartref i nifer o'r tai cyhoeddi ac argraffu—cwmniau sy'n gyflogwyr pwysig yn eu cymunedau. Mae'r swyddi hyn wedi denu cryn ddiddordeb ac mae nifer o'r golygyddion eisoes wedi dechrau yn eu swyddi. O fewn ychydig fisoedd, bydd tua 20 o olygyddion yn gweithio'n llawn amser neu'n rhan amser yn y tai cyhoeddi. Mae hwn yn ddatblygiad pwysig a bydd rhaglen eang o hyfforddiant yn cyfrannu at wella sgiliau.

Yn ystod y blynnyddoedd diwethaf gwelwyd ymdrechion amlwg i ehangu'r farchnad drwy sicrhau bod cyhoeddiadau Cymraeg ar gael i'r prynwyr mewn cynifer o leoedd â phosibl. Y siopau llyfrau annibynnol yw asgwrn cefn y diwydiant, ond ochr yn ochr â hwy, mae'n dda gweld llyfrau a chylchgronau Cymraeg bellach ar werth mewn archfarchnadoedd yn ogystal â chadwyni cenedlaethol fel Waterstone's a WHSmith. Mae lle i wella, ond mae'r datblygiadau hyn yn galonogol iawn.

Datblygiad pwysig arall fu sefydlu *Golwg 360*, y gwasanaeth newyddion dyddiol ar y we. Mae wedi cryfhau'r wasg Gymraeg ac wedi datblygu ac ehangu newyddiaduraeth broffesiynol, wreiddiol ac apelgar yn Gymraeg. Mae'r datblygiad hwn wedi mynd â'r wasg Gymraeg a'r iaith i faes y cyfryngau newydd, ond hefyd wedi cryfhau'r

This occurred to a degree after the council decided to give more freedom and responsibility to the publishing houses to choose which books to publish. The investment has led to an increase in the quality of the materials and an increase in sales. In the first three years of additional funding, 2003 to 2006, sales of Welsh novels were nearly 53,000, compared with less than 23,000 copies for the previous three years, which is an increase of 132 per cent.

During the last few months, we as a Government have given additional funding of £300,000 to the publishing industry for the financial year 2010-11. That will enable publishers to employ more creative editors to work hand in hand with authors. The aim, again, is to further improve standards and increase sales. Many of these posts are located in rural areas where many of the publishing and printing houses are located—businesses that are important employers in their communities. These posts have attracted a lot of interest and a number of editors have already started in their jobs. Within a few months, at least 20 editors will be working full time or part time in the publishing houses. This is a significant development and a wide-ranging programme of training will contribute to improving skills.

During the last few years we have seen obvious efforts to expand the market by ensuring that Welsh publications are available in as many locations as possible. The independent book shops are the backbone of the industry. However, alongside this it is good to see Welsh-language books and magazines being sold in large supermarkets as well as national chain stores, such as Waterstone's and WHSmith. There is room for improvement, but these developments are very encouraging.

Another important development was the establishment of *Golwg 360*, a daily online news service. It has strengthened the Welsh-language press and developed and expanded professional, original and appealing journalism in Welsh. This development has taken the Welsh language and the Welsh-language press into the field of new media,

cylchgrawn print traddodiadol. Mae'r ddau gyfrwng mor bwysig â'i gilydd. Mae'n galonogol bod *Golwg 360* yn rhoi sylw penodol i ddiddordebau pobl ifanc ac yr wyf yn hyderus y bydd y datblygiad hwn yn arwain at fwy o ddarllenwyr Cymraeg, yn enwedig ymhliith pobl ifanc.

Mae cyhoeddi, fel nifer o feysydd eraill, wedi datblygu'n sylweddol yn ystod y blynnyddoedd diwethaf yn sgil datblygiadau technolegol. Bellach, mae llyfrau'n cael eu cyhoeddi fel e-lyfrau ochr yn ochr â'r fformat print. Er enghraifft, mae chwech o nofelau'r Lolfa yn awr ar gael fel e-lyfrau gan gynnwys *Y Llyfrgell*, nofel fuddugol gwobr Daniel Owen y llynedd. Dengys hynny pa mor bwysig yw hi i'r farchnad lyfrau Cymraeg fanteisio ar y dechnoleg newydd.

Mae'r rhan helaethaf o'r cyllid y mae'r cyngor llyfrau yn ei dderbyn gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cael ei sianelu drwy'r portffolio treftadaeth. Fodd bynnag, mae peth cyllid hefyd yn cael ei ddyrannu drwy'r adran addysg tuag at gynlluniau pwysig megis gweithgareddau Diwrnod y Llyfr, clybiau darllen a Stori Sydyn. Mae'r rhain i gyd yn cyfrannu at yr ymdrech i hyrwyddo darllen. Mae gan y diwydiant cyhoeddi Cymraeg gyfraniad amlwg i'r diwylliant Cymraeg, yr economi a dyfodol yr iaith. Yn ddi-os, mae'r diwydiant cyhoeddi Cymraeg yn stori o lwyddiant, hyd yn oed yn y cyfnod economaidd anodd hwn.

**Nick Bourne:** Diolch am y datganiad, Weinidog.

I join the Minister in praising the Welsh Books Council. It does excellent work in both the English and Welsh languages, as the Minister rightly said. I live close to it in my home town; I am a strong supporter of the work done by Gwerfyl Pierce Jones and her team and a frequent visitor. In relation to the children's books that the Minister mentioned, the most recent figures that he gave were from 2006, which is four years ago. Are there more recent figures available? Welcome as those figures are, they are from some time ago.

2.50 p.m.

but has also strengthened the traditional print magazines. Both media are equally as important. It is encouraging that *Golwg 360* gives specific attention to the interests of young people, and I am confident that this development will lead to more readers of Welsh, especially among young people.

Publishing, like a number of other sectors, has developed substantially over the last few years due to technological developments. Books can now be published as e-books alongside the print format. For instance, six of Y Lolfa's books are now available as e-books, including *Y Llyfrgell*, the novel that won the Daniel Owen award last year. That shows how important it is for the Welsh-language books market to capitalise on the new technology available.

Most of the Assembly Government funding received by the Welsh Books Council is channelled through the heritage portfolio. However, some funding is also distributed through the education department towards important schemes such as World Book Day, reading clubs and *Stori Sydyn*. These all contribute towards the effort to promote reading. Therefore, the Welsh-language publishing industry makes an obvious contribution towards Welsh-language culture, the economy and the future of the Welsh language. Undoubtedly, the Welsh-language publishing industry is a success story, even in these difficult economic times.

**Nick Bourne:** Thank you for that statement, Minister.

Ymunaf â'r Gweinidog i ganmol gwaith Cyngor Llyfrau Cymru. Mae'n gwneud gwaith rhagorol yn y Gymraeg a'r Saesneg, fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog. Yr wyf yn byw'n agos ato yn y dref lle y mae fy nghartref; yr wyf yn gefnogwr cryf i'r gwaith a wneir gan Gwerfyl Pierce Jones a'i thîm ac yn ymwelydd mynchy. Ynglŷn â'r llyfrau plant a grybwylodd y Gweinidog, ffigurau 2006 oedd y ffigurau diweddaraf a roddodd, sef bedair blynedd yn ôl. A oes ffigurau diweddarach ar gael? Er bod y ffigurau hynny'n rhai i'w croesawu, maent yn deillio o adeg sydd gryn amser yn ôl.

I strongly support the help that has been provided to employ creative editors and expand the market through bookshops such as WHSmith and Waterstone's. The Minister spoke of independent bookshops; I am not sure to what extent his department is in touch with those independent bookshops—not least the Welsh-language bookshops such as Siop y Pethe—to ensure that they are on board and are promoting this. It may be that that is happening, but perhaps he could give us some details on it.

We strongly support the online news service—*Golwg 360*—that he spoke about, and Paul Davies and I have met with staff at *Golwg*. He did not mention the position on the Welsh-language daily newspaper. He will know that we are strongly in support of *Y Byd*. That support remains solid and unwavering. There is a case to be made for giving support to traditional media, and that needs to be looked at; perhaps he could touch on that in his response. Also, has he considered extending the awards? He mentioned some awards in relation to support of Welsh-language publishing, and I wonder whether he has given any thought to extending those awards that are there, either directly or by encouraging others to award prizes for Welsh literature.

Finally, has he planned any campaigns to publicise Welsh-language titles in line with what he is doing to help with creative editors and so on? I thank him for the statement; we are certainly very supportive of what he is doing on Welsh-language publishing.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolchaf i Nick am ei sylwadau cefnogol. Bydd yn ymwybodol bod Gwerfyl Pierce Jones wedi ymddeol yn ddiweddar fel cyfarwyddwr Cyngor Llyfrau Cymru, a bod cyfarwyddwr newydd, Elwyn Jones. O ran y cysylltiad â'r siopau llyfrau, nid y Llywodraeth sy'n delio â'r sefydliadau hynny, ond y cyngor llyfrau ei hun, fel y dylai hi fod. Mae'r berthynas sydd wedi datblygu dros y blynnyddoedd yn un llawer mwy creadigol a deinamig. Bydd unrhyw un o honom sy'n mynd i'r siopau hynny yn gwybod bod y gwasanaeth y mae'r siopau yn

Yr wyf yn gryf o blaid y cymorth sydd wedi'i ddarparu i gyflogi golygyddion creadigol ac ehangu'r farchnad drwy siopau llyfrau fel WHSmith a Waterstone's. Siaradodd y Gweinidog am siopau llyfrau annibynnol; nid wyf yn siŵr i ba raddau y mae ei adrann mewn cysylltiad â'r siopau annibynnol hynny—yn enwedig y siopau llyfrau Cymraeg fel Siop y Pethe—i sicrhau eu bod yn rhan o hyn ac yn hyrwyddo hyn. Efallai fod hynny'n digwydd, ond hwyrach y gallai roi ychydig o fanylion inni amdano.

Yr ydym yn gefnogol iawn i'r gwasanaeth newyddion ar-lein—*Golwg 360*—y soniodd amdano, ac mae Paul Davies a mi wedi cyfarfod â staff yn *Golwg*. Ni soniodd am y sefyllfa ynglŷn â'r papur newydd dyddiol Cymraeg. Bydd yn gwybod ein bod ni'n gryf o blaid *Y Byd*. Mae'r gefnogaeth honno'n parhau'n gadarn a di-sigl. Mae achos i'w wneud dros roi cefnogaeth i gyfryngau traddodiadol, ac mae angen edrych ar hynny; efallai y gallai sôn am hynny yn ei ymateb. Hefyd, a ydyw wedi ystyried ehangu'r gwobrau? Soniodd am wobrau yng nghyswllt cefnogaeth i gyhoeddi Cymraeg, ac yr wyf yn meddwl tybed a ydyw wedi meddwl o gwbl am ehangu'r gwobrau sydd ar gael, un ai'n uniongyrchol neu drwy annog eraill i gynnig gwobrau am lenyddiaeth Gymraeg.

Yn olaf, a ydyw wedi cynllunio unrhyw ymgyrchoedd i roi cyhoeddusrwydd i deitlau Cymraeg i gyd-fynd â'r hyn y mae'n ei wneud i helpu gyda golygyddion creadigol ac yn y blaen? Diolch iddo am y datganiad; yr ydym yn sicr yn gefnogol iawn i'r hyn y mae'n ei wneud dros gyhoeddi yn y Gymraeg.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I thank Nick for his support. He will be aware that Gwerfyl Pierce Jones has retired recently as the director of the Welsh Books Council, and that there is a new director, Elwyn Jones. On the connection with the book shops, it is not the Government that deals with those institutions, but the books council itself, which is as it should be. The relationship that has developed over the years is a much more creative and dynamic one. Any of us who visit those shops will know that the service that the shops receive by way of being able to

ei dderbyn o safbwyt y gallu i archebu llyfrau ac yn y blaen wedi'i wella. Mae archebu'n cael ei wneud yn electronig, ac mae'r llyfrau'n cyrraedd bob dydd, os wyf yn deall yn iawn, yn hytrach na bod rhaid aros wythnos neu fwy. Mae'r gwasanaeth hwnnw yn un eithriadol o effeithiol, yn fy marn i.

Cyfeiriwyd at wobr Daniel Owen, sy'n cael ei rhoi yn yr Eisteddfod Genedlaethol bob blwyddyn, ac sydd wedi esgor ar nifer o nofelau diddorol iawn dros y blynnyddoedd. Mae'n werth cyfeirio at y ffaith bod y cyngor llyfrau, bob dwy flynedd, yn cynnal gwobrau i'r diwydiant yn hytrach nag awduron. Yr oeddwn yn Aberystwyth yn ddiweddar yn y seremoni wobrwyo honno, ac yr oedd yn gyfle i wobrwyo gwaith sy'n flaengar ac sy'n cynhyrchu deunydd gwirioneddol fentrus mewn sefyllfa a marchnad sy'n anodd pan ydych yn meddwl am faint y gynulleidfa Gymraeg. Mae'n ffaith o hyd bod llyfrau barddoniaeth Cymraeg yn aml iawn yn gwerthu'n well mewn termau absolwiwt na llyfrau barddoniaeth sy'n cael eu cyhoeddi yn Saesneg, felly pob clod i'r diwydiant am hynny.

O ran *Golwg 360*, yr wyf yn parhau i ddweud bod y penderfyniad a wnaed ynglŷn â hwnnw yn gywir, ac o ystyried yr hinsawdd ariannol bresennol, credaf y byddai unrhyw bapur newydd yn y Gymraeg mewn sefyllfa anodd iawn pe bai wedi ei lansio yn yr amser yr oedd sôn am ei wneud. Er fy mod wedi bod yn gefnogol o'r syniad—ac yr wyf yn parhau i fod yn gefnogol—credaf fod yn rhaid cael achos busnes gwell o lawer cyn mentro ar hynny.

Cyfeiriodd Nick at y golygyddion creadigol sy'n cael eu penodi ar hyn o bryd o dan y cynllun newydd hwn. Fel gyda'r arian newydd a fuddsoddwyd tua 2002, y bwriad yw creu deunydd gwell sy'n fwy amrywiol. Wrth gwrs, mae'n hen draddodiad yn y Saesneg, ond nid oes traddodiad yn y Gymraeg o gael golygyddion yn gweithio ochr yn ochr ag awduron, ar nofelau a llyfrau o bob math. Credaf fod hwn yn ddatblygiad cyffrous. Amser a ddengys, wrth gwrs, ond dylem weld ffrwyth hyn yn ystod y blynnyddoedd nesaf.

order books and so on has improved. The ordering is done electronically, and the books arrive each day, if I have understood correctly, instead of them having to wait for a week or more. That service is extremely effective, in my opinion.

Reference was made to the Daniel Owen prize that is awarded in the National Eisteddfod each year, and which has delivered several interesting novels over the years. It is worth mentioning that the books council gives awards to the industry rather than authors, every two years. I was in Aberystwyth recently in that award-giving ceremony, and it was an opportunity to reward progressive work that produces material that is genuinely enterprising in a difficult situation and difficult market conditions, when you consider the size of the Welsh audience. It remains a fact that Welsh poetry books very often sell better in absolute terms than poetry books that are published in English, so the industry deserves great praise for that.

On *Golwg 360*, I continue to say that the decision that was made was the right one, and considering the current financial climate, I think that any Welsh-language newspaper would have been in a very difficult position if it had been launched at the time that had been mentioned. Although I was supportive of the idea—and I continue to be supportive—I think that a much better business case is needed before any further steps are taken.

Nick referred to the creative editors who are being appointed currently under this new scheme. As with the new money that was invested in about 2002, the intention is to create material that is of a higher quality and more diverse. Of course, there is an established tradition in the English-language field, but there is no tradition in the Welsh-language field of editors working alongside authors on novels and books of all kinds. I think that this is an exciting development. Time will tell of course, but we should see the fruits of our labours over the next few years.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch am eich datganiad. Hoffwn i'r Cynulliad nodi llwyddiant y rhaglen golygyddion creadigol Cymraeg a drefnwyd gan Gyngor Llyfrau Cymru, a chroesawu'r adnoddau ychwanegol ar gyfer y cynllun hwn. Gall Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r Adran Dreftadaeth longyfarch eu hunain ar y gwaith y maent wedi ei wneud yn y maes hwn yn y blynnyddoedd diwethaf. Mae'n ffordd arall o sicrhau dyfodol llewyrchus i'r iaith.

Gwlad ddwyieithog yw Cymru, ac mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi cefnogi ysgrifennu cyfrwng Saesneg yng Nghymru drwy'r gyfres Llyfrgell Cymru y mae'r Gweinidog wedi ei chrybwyll yn barod. Mae hyn wedi golygu bod gwaith rhai o'n hawduron gorau, megis Raymond Williams, Gwyn Thomas, Ron Berry a Margiad Evans, ar gael yn haws yng Nghymru. Y gwahaniaeth yw bod cyfrolau Llyfrgell Cymru wedi bod mewn bodolaeth ers blynnyddoedd maith, tra bo'r cynllun newydd hwn yn cefnogi a hybu gwaith newydd yn yr iaith Gymraeg. A fyddai'n bosibl creu rhaglen debyg ar gyfer cyhoeddiadau Saesneg eu hiaith? Mae gennym sawl awdur Saesneg eu hiaith a byddai cynllun tebyg yn ffordd o gyflwyno talent Cymreig newydd i weddill y byd. Yn ogystal, a oes cynllun i gyhoeddi rhagor o e-lyfrau? Gyda'r Kindle wedi ei lansio'n barod a'r iPad ar fin cyrraedd y Deyrnas Unedig, credaf y daw e-lyfrau'n fwy poblogaidd yng Nghymru. Diolchaf i chi eto am eich datganiad.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch am eich sylwadau ynglŷn â'r adnoddau ychwanegol sydd wedi eu buddsoddi. Mae'n werth ailadrodd yr hyn a ddywedais i yn fy natganiad, sef bod cyfraniad Llywodraeth y dydd yn 2002 wedi rhoi hwb sylweddol i waith y cyngor llyfrau—yn bennaf i lyfrau Cymraeg eu cyfrwng—a rhoddwyd hwb i lyfrau Saesneg eu hiaith drwy'r ddechrau'r gyfres *Library of Wales*. Gwn fod gan y Gweinidog addysg bresennol rywbeth i'w wneud â hynny. Mae'r gyfres honno wedi gwneud cyfraniad eithriadol o bwysig o ran sicrhau bod y llyfrau hyn, sy'n werthfawr o safbwynt ein treftadaeth, ar gael yn hawdd. Efallai bod angen i ni edrych eto ar sut i'w hyrwyddo'n well, ond yn sicr bu'r gyfres yn llwyddiant

**Bethan Jenkins:** Thank you for your statement. I would like the Assembly to note the success of the Welsh-language creative editors scheme, organised by the Welsh Books Council, and to welcome the additional resources for that scheme. The Welsh Government and the Heritage Department can congratulate themselves on the work that they have done in this area over the last few years. It is another way of ensuring a prosperous future for the language.

Wales is a bilingual country, and the Welsh Government has supported Welsh writing in English through the Library of Wales series of publications, as the Minister mentioned. That has meant that the work of some of our best authors, such as Raymond Williams, Gwyn Thomas, Ron Berry and Margiad Evans, is more easily available in Wales. The difference is that the books featured in the Library of Wales series have been in existence for many years, while this new scheme supports and promotes new work in the Welsh language. Would it be possible to create a similar programme for English-language publications? We have a number of English-language authors and a similar scheme would be a means of presenting new Welsh talent to the rest of the world. Also, is there any plan to promote more e-books? With the Kindle already launched, and the iPad about to reach the UK, I think that e-books will become more popular in Wales. I thank you again for your statement.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you for your comments about the additional resources that have been invested. It is worth reiterating what I said in my statement, that the contribution made by the Government of the day in 2002 gave a significant boost to the work of the books council—particularly to Welsh-medium books—and English-language books were given a boost by the launch of the Library of Wales series. I know that the current Minister for education had something to do with that. That series has been exceptionally important in ensuring that those books, which are such a valuable part of our heritage, are easily accessible and available. We may need to look again at how we can better market and promote them, but

diamheuol.

O ran rhoi mwy o gefnogaeth i gyhoeddi yn Saesneg yng Nghymru, mae hynny'n rhywbeth i'w ystyried. Yr ydym wedi sefydlu cwmni theatr cenedlaethol Saesneg ei iaith yn dilyn sefydlu cwmni theatr cenedlaethol Cymraeg ei iaith. Os oes cyfle i edrych ar ddarparu mwy o gymorth i gyhoeddi yn Saesneg pan fydd arian yn caniatáu, wrth gwrs bydd yn werth gwneud hynny.

O ran datblygu e-lyfrau, mae cwmni Y Lolfa wedi gwneud hynny eisoes o'i ben a'i bastwn ei hun ac felly y dylai fod. Lle y gallwch, dylech adael i gyhoeddwyr a gweisg gymryd yr arweiniad eu hunain. Nid oes dwywaith y daeth y llwyddiant newydd hwn yn sgil mwy o gefnogaeth ariannol, ond mae hefyd yn ganlyniad proses y cyngor llyfrau yn llacio'i afael ar benderfynu beth fydd yn cael ei gyhoeddi yn Gymraeg, gan roi mwy o gyfrifoldeb am y penderfyniad hwnnw ar y gweisg unigol. Mae hynny wedi talu ar ei ganfed.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yr ydym yn cymeradwyo'r gwariant a'r gefnogaeth, ond mae problemau. A ydych yn ymwybodol o'r siop llyfrau Cymraeg yn y Rhyl sydd wedi cau yn ddiweddar? Yr oeddwn yn teithio o gwmpas gogledd Cymru yn y car y diwrnod o'r blaen yn gwrando ar Radio Cymru, wrth gwrs, ac yr oedd perchenog siop llyfrau Cymraeg—er nad oeddwn yn siŵr ai Siop y Morfa oedd dan sylw—yn dweud mor anodd y mae pethau, hwyrach oherwydd nad oedd wedi datblygu ei fusnes ar y we. Mae'r siop yn awr yn mynd i gau, neu wedi cau, a bydd yn datblygu'r busnes ar y we. Beth yn union y gallwch chi ei gynnig i bobl sydd eisiau cadw elfen draddodiadol eu busnes, ond sydd hefyd eisiau ei ddatblygu mewn ffyrdd eraill?

3.00 p.m.

O wrando ar eich arraith, cefais fy atgoffa o'r adeg pan oeddwn yn dysgu Ffrangeg yn yr ysgol, amser maith yn ôl, ac yr oedd cyfrolau dwyieithog ar gael yr oedd modd eu cario yn eich poced. Gyda chynifer o bobl yn teithio o un pen i'r llall, megis ar drenau, fel y mae rhai ohonom yn ei wneud, peth da yw gallu pori mewn llyfr. Dyna un peth a ddaeth i'm meddwl wrth eistedd yma.

the series has been an undoubted success.

As regards more support for English-language publishing in Wales, that is something to be considered. We have established an English-language national theatre following the establishment of the Welsh-language national theatre. If there is scope to look at more support for English-language publishing when funding allows, then it will be worth doing so.

As regards the development of e-books, the company Y Lolfa has been doing that already on its own initiative, and that is how it should be. Where you can, you should allow publishers and printing houses to take the lead themselves. Without a doubt, this new success has come in the wake of more financial support, but also as a result of the books council loosening its grip on deciding what should be published in the Welsh language, and placing greater responsibility for that decision on the individual publishers. That has paid off a hundred fold.

**Eleanor Burnham:** We applaud this new expenditure and support, but there are problems. Are you aware that a Welsh-language bookshop in Rhyl has closed recently? I was travelling around north Wales in the car the other day, listening to Radio Cymru, of course, and I am not sure whether it was Siop y Morfa that was being referred to, but the owner of a Welsh-language bookshop in Rhyl was saying how difficult things were, perhaps because he had not developed an online business. He is now closing or has closed the shop and is to develop the business online. What can you offer people who may want to keep the traditional element of their business, but also want to develop their business in other ways?

Listening to your contribution, I was reminded of the time, long ago, when I was learning French at school, and pocket-sized bilingual books were available. With so many people travelling around, for example on trains, as some of us do, it is good to be able to read a book. That is one thought that came into my mind as I was sitting here.

Yr ydych wedi gwneud gwaith da, ond, wrth gwrs, fel y deallwn, bydd yn rhaid i bawb wynebu toriadau yn y man. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn siŵr beth sydd wedi digwydd i'r ystadegau rhwng 2006 a 2010, gan ichi grybwylly ffigurau 2002 a'r hyn yr ydych yn ei wneud yn awr a'r hyn a wnewch chi yn y flwyddyn sydd i ddod. Byddai'n ddefnyddiol cael gwybod beth ddigwyddodd yn ystod y blynnyddoedd hynny.

Cymeradwyaf y cyngor llyfrau; mae'n gorff arbennig o dda, a theimlaf ei fod wedi gwneud gwaith anhygoel yn yr Eisteddfod, er enghraifft, a mannau eraill yn ystod y flwyddyn. Mae'n gwneud gwaith gwerth chweil.

Hoffwn ofyn hefyd am wyliau llyfrau. Mae pawb yn gyfarwydd â Gŵyl y Gelli, er enghraifft, ond mae hi braidd yn Seisnigaidd. Ni chredaf fod llawer o gyswllt rhwng yr wyl honno a'r hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud yma. Pa fath o drafodaethau yr ydych yn eu cael ynglŷn â gwyliau o'r fath? Gyda hynny, hoffwn gymeradwyo'n gyffredinol yr hyn yr ydych yn ei wneud. Byddai pawb, wrth reswm, yn hoffi cael mwy o arian, ond gwn nad yw'r arian ar gael ar hyn o bryd.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Mae swm yr arian a fydd ar gael yn fater sydd yn nwyo'r Llywodraeth yn San Steffan, ac felly, pwy a wyr, efallai fod gennych chi fwy o ddyylanwad na mi ar hynny.

Nid cyfrifoldeb y Llywodraeth yw'r siopau llyfrau unigol. Y gwir amdani yw bod enghreifftiau o fusnesau eithriadol o lwyddiannus ar hyd a lled Cymru, ond fel pob busnes arall, dibynna hynny ar weledigaeth ac egni perchenogion unigol. Tybiaf mai anos yw cynnal busnes o'r fath yn y Rhyl nag mewn rhai ardaloedd eraill. Fodd bynnag, lle mae perchenogion yn dangos dychymyg ac yn y blaen, gwelir busnesau yn llwyddo.

Soniasoch am y ffigurau, a soniodd Nick Bourne fod ffigurau mwy diweddar. Mae ffigurau mwy diweddar, a gallaf eu cyflwyno ichi. Credaf fod y ffigurau diweddaraf am werthiant yng Nghymru yn eithaf calonogol o gofio'r gostyngiad cyffredinol drwy Brydain

You have done a good job, but, of course, as we understand, everyone will have to face cuts before long. However, I am not sure what has happened to the statistics for the period between 2006 and 2010, as you mentioned the figures for 2002 and what you are doing now and what you will do in the coming year. It would be helpful to know what happened during those years.

I commend the books council; it is a particularly good body, and I feel that it has done incredible work in the Eisteddfod, for example, and elsewhere during the year. It does excellent work.

I would also like to ask about literary festivals. Everyone is familiar with the Hay Festival, for example, but it is somewhat anglicised. I do not think that much of a link exists between that event and what we are doing here. What kind of discussions are you having about such festivals? With that, I would like to generally endorse what you are doing. Everyone would, of course, like more money, but I know that it is not available at this time.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The amount of money that will be available is in the hands of the Westminster Government, so, who knows, you may have more influence than me on that.

Government is not responsible for individual bookshops. The truth is that there are examples of extremely successful businesses throughout Wales, but, as with every other business, that will depend on the vision and energy of individual owners. Presumably, it is more difficult to maintain such a business in Rhyl than in some other areas. However, where owners have imagination and so on, businesses will succeed.

You talked about the figures, and Nick Bourne mentioned more recent figures. More recent figures are available, which I can give you. I believe that the latest sales figures in Wales are quite encouraging given the overall decline in Britain in the number of books that

yn nifer y llyfrau sy'n cael eu prynu, ond nid yw'r union ffigur gennyf ar hyn o bryd.

Mater i'r cyngor llyfrau yw cynnal gwyliau llyfrau. Gwn fod y cyngor llyfrau yn mynd i rai gwyliau rhwngwladol, ac mae gan yr Academi gynllun i gyfieithu llyfrau Cymraeg i ieithoedd Ewropeaidd ac ieithoedd tramor eraill. Er enghraifft, cefais gip rai misoedd yn ôl ar gyfres o gyfrolau Cymraeg a gafodd eu cyfieithu i'r Eidaleg. Felly, mae llenyddiaeth Gymraeg yn teithio ar draws y cyfandir, ac er ei bod yn dalcen caled, mae lle i ehangu ar y gweithgaredd hwnnw.

## **Datganiad am Adolygu Cost Gweinyddu'r System Addysg Statement on the Review of the Cost of Administering Education**

**The Minister for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning (Leighton Andrews):** In January, I announced a review of the cost of administering the education system in order to ensure that more money reaches the front line. In February, I announced that I had appointed PricewaterhouseCoopers to carry out the first phase of that review. It has completed its report and I am publishing it today.

The terms of reference for the first phase of the review were to identify the cost of administering education across Wales, the number of people working in administering the education system and the opportunities to move resources from administration to the delivery of front-line services across the whole of the education sector. In undertaking its review, PricewaterhouseCoopers has looked at a wide range of information, sought targeted input from stakeholders, and gathered views on where the main opportunities exist to refocus resources to the front line. In total, it met more than 100 stakeholders. These meetings have indicated that there is a significant degree of consensus across Wales in respect of its main findings. I am grateful to all those who participated in this process for their positive and constructive engagement.

Before I set out the report's main findings, I want to stress three things. First, we should acknowledge at the outset that much has already been done across the public sector in

are purchased, but I do not have the exact figure at the moment.

The holding of literary festivals is a matter for the books council. I know that the council attends some international festivals, and the Academi has a scheme for translating Welsh books into European languages and other foreign languages. For example, a few months ago I saw a series of Welsh volumes that were translated into Italian. Therefore, Welsh literature travels across the continent, and although it can prove to be difficult, there is room to expand on that activity.

**Y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Leighton Andrews):** Ym mis Ionawr, cyhoeddais adolygiad o gost gweinyddu'r system addysg er mwyn sicrhau bod rhagor o arian yn cyrraedd y rheng flaen. Ym mis Chwefror, cyhoeddais imi benodi PricewaterhouseCoopers i gyflawni cam cyntaf yr adolygiad hwnnw. Mae wedi cwblhau ei adroddiad ac yr wyf yn ei gyhoeddi heddiw.

Cylch gorchwyl cam cyntaf yr adolygiad oedd canfod cost gweinyddu addysg drwy Gymru, faint o bobl sy'n gweinyddu'r system addysg a pha gyfleoedd sydd i symud adnoddau oddi wrth weinyddu i ddarparu gwasanaethau'r rheng flaen drwy'r sector addysg i gyd. Wrth gynnal ei adolygiad, mae PricewaterhouseCoopers wedi ystyried ystod eang o wybodaeth, wedi ceisio cyfraniad a oedd wedi'i dargedu gan randdeiliaid, ac wedi casglu safbwytiau ynglŷn ag ymhle y mae'r prif gyfleoedd i ailgyfeirio adnoddau i'r rheng flaen. Drwyddi draw, cyfarfu â mwy na 100 o randdeiliaid. Mae'r cyfarfodydd hyn wedi dangos bod cryn gonsensws ledled Cymru o ran ei brif ganfyddiadau. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i bawb a gymerodd ran yn y broses hon am eu cyfraniad cadarnhaol ac adeiladol.

Cyn imi sôn am brif ganfyddiadau'r adroddiad, yr wyf am bwysleisio tri pheth. Yn gyntaf, dylem gydnabod o'r cychwyn fod llawer wedi'i wneud eisoes ar draws y sector

Wales, and specifically within the education system, to improve services and to achieve the highest possible standards of education and training. There are numerous examples of innovative practice that have delivered better services to learners and the best use of resources. For example, some local education authorities are already engaged in developing a consortium approach to the provision of professional advisory services. There have been a number of mergers involving schools, and further and higher education institutions, and there is increasing co-operation in many areas, such as procurement. Some further and higher education institutions are already exploring opportunities for further collaboration. This review will build on these foundations.

Secondly, I want to stress that this review is not about cuts in funding. It is a reprioritisation of funding to the front line. It is about freeing up resources, by changing the balance in funding between front-line and support services. In the light of the PricewaterhouseCoopers report, it is clear that we have scope and opportunity to do this.

Thirdly, this is not about a radical restructuring of education or local authorities. I hope that the report will contribute to the growing momentum behind greater collaboration and improved co-operation at local level. I support the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government in his attempts to drive better collaboration through his policy of ‘outcome agreement plus’. In Wales, we spend some £4.5 billion a year on the education system. The report analyses the bulk of this expenditure, and divides it between those services that provide front-line delivery of education, and those that can be considered support services. It concludes that direct funding for learning and teaching, including educationally focused expenditure on such things as professional support for teaching and research, accounts for around 68 per cent of the total. The remainder, around 32 per cent, is made up of support services that cover a range of functions, such as the selection and admission of students, service management, financial administration, and so on. Of course, the figure of around 32 per

cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, ac yn benodol o fewn y system addysg, i wella gwasanaethau ac i sierhau'r safonau uchaf un ym maes addysg a hyfforddiant. Ceir nifer o enghreifftiau o arferion arloesol sydd wedi sierhau gwell gwasanaethau i ddysgwyr a'r ffordd orau o ddefnyddio adnoddau. Er enghraifft, mae rhai awdurdodau lleol eisoes wrthi'n datblygu dull consortiw ar gyfer darparu gwasanaethau cyngori proffesiynol. Mae nifer o ysgolion, a sefydliadau addysg bellach ac addysg uwch wedi uno, ac mae mwy a mwy o gydweithredu mewn sawl maes, megis caffael. Mae rhai sefydliadau addysg bellach ac uwch eisoes yn ystyried cyfleoedd i gydweithio mwy. Bydd yr adolygiad hwn yn adeiladu ar y seiliau hyn.

Yn ail, yr wyf am bwysleisio nad oes a wnelo'r adolygiad hwn â thoriadau ariannol. Yn hytrach, mae a wnelo ag ailflaenoríaethu'r arian i'w ddefnyddio yn y rheng flaen. Mae a wnelo â rhyddhau adnoddau, drwy newid y cydbwysedd rhwng yr arian a gaiff y rheng flaen a'r arian a gaiff gwasanaethau cymorth. Yng ngoleuni adroddiad PricewaterhouseCoopers, mae'n amlwg bod lle a chyfle inni wneud hyn.

Yn drydydd, nid oes a wnelo hyn ag adrefnu addysg nac awdurdodau lleol o'r gwraidd. Yr wyf yn gofeithio y bydd yr adroddiad yn cyfrannu at y momentwm cynyddol tuag at fwy o gydweithio a gwell cydweithredu ar lefel leol. Yr wyf yn cefnogi'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol yn ei ymdrechion i sbarduno gwell cydweithio drwy ei bolisi 'cytundeb canlyniadau a mwy'. Yng Nghymru, yr ydym yn gwario tua £4.5 biliwn y flwyddyn ar y system addysg. Mae'r adroddiad yn dadansoddi'r rhan helaethaf o'r gwariant hwn, ac yn ei rannu rhwng y gwasanaethau hynny sy'n darparu addysg ar y rheng flaen, a'r rhai y gellid eu ystyried yn wasanaethau cymorth. Ei gasgliad yw bod arian uniongyrchol ar gyfer dysgu ac addysgu, gan gynnwys gwariant sy'n canolbwytio ar addysgu, er enghraifft, ar bethau megis cymorth proffesiynol ar gyfer addysgu ac ymchwil, yn cyfateb i tua 68 y cant o'r cyfanswm. Gwasanaethau cymorth yw'r gweddill, sef tua 32 y cant, a'r rheini'n cynnwys amrywiaeth o swyddogaethau,

cent of expenditure on support services masks considerable variation across sectors and organisations. There are examples of good practice that we can learn from and spread more widely. However, the report provides compelling evidence of the opportunities that exist and the need to examine this balance further.

On the basis of the evidence and the input from stakeholders, the report identifies key opportunities for our further consideration. These are grouped under two themes: simplifying governance; and standardising and sharing provision. Under the heading of simplifying governance, I will continue to look for opportunities to simplify the structure of grant schemes, by reducing the number of separate grants. There may be further scope to rationalise inspection and performance management regimes. In relation to standardising and sharing provision, there may be further opportunity to standardise and share educational support through regional consortia. There is scope to integrate non-educational support where organisations are not large enough to justify stand-alone teams. Many schools are well placed to form clusters to share resources, approaches and facilities. There is scope to standardise access, assessment and administration processes across institutions. Within the higher education sector, I will be looking to find opportunities to simplify, standardise and reconfigure support services across faculties and institutions. We can also converge on leading practice in common support functions by developing measures against which organisations can assess themselves and identify and address performance gaps. The report suggests some practical ideas and opportunities for us to take forward. There is a wide measure of consensus around the analysis, and the response from stakeholders to date has been positive.

However, we require a step change. All the organisations involved in the delivery of education have a part to play, with a shared vision, a shared sense of purpose and real

megis dethol a derbyn myfyrwyr, rheoli gwasanaethau, gweinyddu ariannol, ac yn y blaen. Wrth gwrs, mae'r ffigur a werir ar wasanaethau cymorth, sef tua 32 y cant, yn celu'r ffaith bod amrywio sylweddol rhwng sectorau a rhwng sefydliadau. Ceir enghreifftiau o arferion da y gallwn ddysgu yn eu sgil a'u lledaenu'n ehangach. Serch hynny, mae'r adroddiad yn cynnig dystiolaeth ddiymwad ynglŷn â'r cyfleoedd sydd ar gael a'r angen i edrych yn fanylach ar y cydbwyssedd hwn.

Ar sail y dystiolaeth a chyfraniad rhanddeiliaid, mae'r adroddiad yn sôn am gyfleoedd allweddol inni eu hystyried ymhellach. Grwpiau y rhain o dan ddwy thema: symleiddio'r llywodraethu; a safoni a rhannu'r ddarpariaeth. O dan bennawd symleiddio'r llywodraethu, byddaf yn dal i geisio cyfleoedd i symleiddio strwythur cynlluniau grantiau, drwy leihau nifer y grantiau unigol. Efallai fod lle eto i symleiddio'r trefniadau arolygu a rheoli perfformiad. O ran safoni a rhannu'r ddarpariaeth, efallai fod cyfreithiau i safoni a rhannu gwasanaethau cymorth addysgol drwy gyfrwng consortia rhanbarthol. Mae lle i integreiddio cymorth nad yw'n gymorth addysgol lle nad yw sefydliadau'n ddigon mawr i gyflawnhau eu timau eu hunain. Mae llawer o ysgolion mewn sefyllfa dda i ffurfio clystyrau i rannu adnoddau, dulliau a chyfleusterau. Mae lle i safoni prosesau mynediad, asesu a gweinyddu rhwng sefydliadau. Yn y sector addysg uwch, byddaf yn ceisio canfod cyfleoedd i symleiddio, safoni ac ad-drefnu gwasanaethau cymorth ar draws cyfadranau a sefydliadau. O ran y swyddogaethau cymorth cyffredin, gallwn hefyd gydgyfeirio'r arferion gorau drwy ddatblygu mesurau y gall sefydliadau eu defnyddio i'w hasesu eu hunain er mwyn gweld bylchau yn eu perfformiad a mynd i'r afael â hwy. Mae'r adroddiad yn awgrymu nifer o syniadau a chyfleoedd ymarferol inni fwrw ymlaen â hwy. Ceir cryn gonsensws ynglŷn â'r dadansoddiad, ac mae ymateb rhanddeiliaid hyd yn hyn wedi bod yn gadarnhaol.

Serch hynny, mae angen newid mawr. Mae gan yr holl sefydliadau sy'n ymwneud â darparu addysg ran i'w chwarae, drwy arddel yr un weledigaeth a'r un ymdeimlad o

urgency. The themes running through the report, of simplifying, sharing and standardising, are values that have currency for the whole Welsh public service. I will be reporting the findings and recommending the approach to the new efficiency and innovation board, whose chair is the Minister for Business and Budget. I am publishing this report today in the hope that the entire Assembly will embrace it as a foundation for action.

bwrpas a thrwy sylweddoli bod angen mynd i'r afael â hyn ar frys. Mae'r themâu sy'n gweu drwy'r adroddiad, sef symleiddio, rhannu a safoni, yn werthoedd sy'n berthnasol i wasanaethau cyhoeddus Cymru drwyddyt draw. Byddaf yn cyflwyno adroddiad am y canfyddiadau ac yn argymhell y dull i'r bwrdd effeithlonrwydd ac arloesi newydd. Cadeirydd y bwrdd hwnnw yw'r Gweinidog dros Fusnes a'r Gyllideb. Yr wyf yn cyhoeddi'r adroddiad hwn heddiw gan obeithio y gwnaiff y Cynulliad yn ei grynnwth ei gofleidio'n sail ar gyfer gweithredu.

3.10 p.m.

**Paul Davies:** I thank the Minister for his statement today. I welcome this review of the cost of administering the education system in Wales. Naturally, I am pleased that the review looks to address some of the key issues that are at the heart of delivering a first-class education system here in Wales. I also agree that the review has been necessary, because some aspects of the delivery of education services in Wales have required attention. I am sure that we are united in wanting to ensure that funding reaches front-line services. This is crucial to create a healthy education system. By assessing ways to streamline our systems, we are strengthening our resources and facilities, and it is to be hoped that we can achieve a refocusing of investment in education to the front line. Therefore, it is crucial that phase 1, and indeed phase 2, highlight the weaknesses in the system and that the Welsh Assembly Government acts swiftly and effectively to eradicate them.

The report contains several recommendations. Can the Minister tell us how quickly he thinks some of these recommendations can be implemented? The aim of the review was to ascertain the cost of administering the funding of our schools, colleges and universities. Given the review's findings, can the Minister give us an indication of the resources he believes will be freed up? How much does he think will be redirected to front-line education services? One of the recommendations in the PricewaterhouseCoopers report is to integrate

**Paul Davies:** Diolch i'r Gweinidog am ei ddatganiad heddiw. Yr wyf yn croesawu'r adolygiad hwn o gost gweinyddu'r system addysg yng Nghymru. Wrth gwrs, yr wyf yn falch bod yr adolygiad yn ceisio mynd i'r afael â rhai o'r materion allweddol sydd wrth wraidd darparu system addysg o'r radd flaenaf yma yng Nghymru. Cytunaf hefyd fod angen yr adolygiad, oherwydd yr oedd angen rhoi sylw i ambell agwedd ar ddarparu gwasanaethau addysg yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod yn unfryd ynglŷn â sicrhau bod yr arian yn cyrraedd gwasanaethau'r rheng flaen. Mae hyn yn hollbwysig er mwyn creu system addysg iach. Drwy asesu ffyrdd o symleiddio'n systemau, yr ydym yn cryfhau ein hadnoddau a'n cyfleusterau, a gobeithio y gallwn sicrhau bod ein buddsoddiad mewn addysg yn cael ei ailgyfeirio i'r rheng flaen. Felly, mae'n hollbwysig bod cam 1, a cham 2 yn wir, yn tynnu sylw at wendidau'r system a bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gweithredu'n gyflym ac yn effeithiol i'w dileu.

Mae'r adroddiad yn cynnwys amryw o argymhellion. A all y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym pa mor gyflym yn ei farn ef y gellir rhoi rhai o'r argymhellion hyn ar waith? Nod yr adolygiad oedd canfod cost gweinyddu'r ariannu i'n hysgolion, i'n colegau ac i'n prifysgolion. O ystyried canfyddiadau'r adolygiad, a all y Gweinidog ddweud faint o'r adnoddau a ryddheir, yn ei dyb ef? Faint yn ei farn ef a ailgyfeirir i wasanaethau addysg y rheng flaen? Un o argymhellion adroddiad PricewaterhouseCoopers yw y dylid integreiddio gwasanaethau addysg

local authority education services, local authority and further education, and non-educational support functions by geography. Can the Minister tell us how he believes this will work in practice? What impact does he believe the decisions taken as a result of the review will have on local authorities as a whole?

As we are all aware, investment per pupil is £527 less in Wales than it is across the border. Therefore, it is clear that these recommendations need to be addressed and acted on effectively to ensure that this gap does not continue to grow. It is crucial that we start taking steps to close this gap as soon as possible. In the circumstances, will the Minister tell us when the second stage of the review will be carried out and when he expects the conclusions of the second phase review? It is clear from the report that working more closely with local authorities is probably crucial in achieving some of the review's main objectives. Therefore, I imagine that the Minister is expecting local education authorities and, indeed, educational institutions to establish partnerships in addition to those already being forged. I notice that consortia have already been established in some areas. Does the Minister envisage that more consortia will be established or does he believe that other partnerships will be established? Does he believe that this could possibly lead to the long-term integration of local education authorities?

I imagine that today's conclusions were arrived at after extensive consultation with key stakeholders. In fact, according to today's statement, meetings were held with more than 100 stakeholders. Can the Minister confirm that he is satisfied that all necessary stakeholders were consulted during phase 1 of the review? It is essential that this process is transparent in order that we are all in a position to understand exactly what is happening and what is being recommended. I am grateful to the Minister for publishing the report in full today. I understand the advantages of a two-stage approach to conducting this review, and it is evident that we have now reached the pause and review stage. In that context, will the Minister

awdurdodau lleol, awdurdodau lleol ac addysg bellach, a swyddogaethau cymorth nad ydynt yn rhai addysgol, a hynny ar sail ddaearyddol. A all y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym sut y mae'n gweld hyn yn gweithio mewn gwirionedd? Pa effaith, yn ei dyb ef, a gaiff y penderfyniadau a wneir yn sgil yr adolygiad hwn ar awdurdodau lleol yn gyffredinol?

Fel y gwyddom, buddsoddir £527 y disgylb yn llai yng Nghymru nag a fuddsoddir dros y ffin. Felly, mae'n amlwg bod angen rhoi sylw i'r argymhellion hyn a'u gweithredu'n effeithiol er mwyn sicrhau nad yw'r bwlch hwn yn dal i ledu. Mae'n hollbwysig inni ddechrau cymryd camau i gau'r bwlch hwn cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl. O dan yr amgylchiadau, a wnaiff y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym pryd y cynhelir ail gam yr adolygiad a phryd y mae'n disgwyl casgliadau'r ail gam hwnnw? Mae'n amlwg yn ôl yr adroddiad ei bod yn debyg y bydd yn hanfodol gweithio'n fwy clòs gyda'r awdurdodau lleol er mwyn cyflawni rhai o brif amcanion yr adolygiad. Felly, yr wyf yn tybio bod y Gweinidog yn disgwyl i awdurdodau addysg lleol ac, yn wir, i sefydliadau addysg, sefydlu partneriaethau yn ychwanegol at y rhai sy'n cael eu ffurfio eisoes. Sylwaf fod consortia wedi'u sefydlu eisoes mewn rhai ardaloedd. A yw'r Gweinidog yn rhagweld y sefydlir rhagor o gonsortia ynteu a yw'n credu y sefydlir partneriaethau eraill? A yw'n credu y gallai hyn o bosibl arwain at integreiddio awdurdodau addysg lleol yn y tymor hir?

Yr wyf yn tybio bod y casgliadau heddiw wedi deillio o ymgynghori'n eang â rhanddeiliaid allweddol. A dweud y gwir, yn ôl y datganiad heddiw, cynhalwyd cyfarfodydd â mwy na 100 o randdeiliaid. A all y Gweinidog gadarnhau ei fod wedi'i argyhoeddi bod yr holl randdeiliaid angenrheidiol wedi bod yn rhan o'r ymgynghori yn ystod cam 1 yr adolygiad? Mae'n hanfodol i'r broses hon fod yn dryloyw er mwyn inni i gyd fod mewn sefyllfa i ddeall beth yn union sy'n digwydd a beth sy'n cael ei argymhell. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am gyhoeddi'r adroddiad yn llawn heddiw. Yr wyf yn deall manteision mynd ati i gynnal yr adolygiad hwn mewn dau gam, ac mae'n amlwg ein

confirm whether this review has looked at the role of the Assembly Government itself in administering education funding and how effectively it has been operating?

I note the efforts of the review, and I hope that it will ensure that education funding is spent on learners in Wales and that it starts making a difference in ensuring that money that should be spent on education actually reaches the front line. Finally, I hope very much that the findings of the review will help to develop a stronger education system where bureaucracy is reduced and vital funding reaches our learners.

**Leighton Andrews:** I thank the Conservative spokesperson for his comments and his welcome for the review. We are agreed, I think, that we want to move more funding to the front line, and I welcome his support for that. I agree with him that the emphasis should be on delivery, which is the whole point of having commissioned the report.

It is important now to have the widest possible discussion of the PricewaterhouseCoopers report, since it is quite a dense report. It will require people to read and re-read it. I have been anxious all along for this to be, as he said, a transparent process, which is why I published the report in full. I am certainly happy to discuss the report with the appropriate committees in the Assembly, for example, so that we can get some wide buy-in on the conclusions that are outlined within it.

He asked about stakeholders. PricewaterhouseCoopers met with far more stakeholders in the course of the consultation than it was, in fact, contracted to do. It went out to visit over 100 stakeholders and had meetings with the Welsh Local Government Association, cabinet members for education and directors of education, and it looked at other institutions in other sectors and discussed the issues with them. I think that there has been widespread discussion.

bod yn awr wedi cyrraedd y cam oedi ac adolygu. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, a wnaiff y Gweinidog gadarnhau a yw'r adolygiad hwn wedi ystyried rôl Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ei hun o ran gweinyddu arian ar gyfer addysg ac i ba raddau y mae wedi bod yn effeithiol wrth ei gwaith?

Nodaf ymdrechion yr adolygiad, ac yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd yn sicrhau bod yr arian ar gyfer addysg yn cael ei wario ar ddysgwyr yng Nghymru a'i fod yn dechrau gwneud gwahaniaeth o ran sicrhau bod yr arian y dylid ei wario ar addysg yn cyrraedd y rheng flaen mewn gwirionedd. Yn olaf, yr wyf yn gobeithio'n fawr iawn y bydd canfyddiadau'r adolygiad yn gymorth i ddatblygu system addysg gryfach lai biwrocrataidd lle y bydd arian hollbwysig yn cyrraedd ein dysgwyr.

**Leighton Andrews:** Diolch i lefarydd y Ceidwadwyr am ei sylwadau a'i groeso i'r adolygiad. Yr ydym yn gytûn, fe gredaf, ein bod am symud rhagor o arian i'r rheng flaen, ac yr wyf yn croesawu ei gefnogaeth i hynny. Cytunaf ag ef y dylid rhoi'r pwyslais ar gyflawni, a dyna oedd holl ddiben comisiynu'r adroddiad.

Mae'n bwysig yn awr inni gael y drafodaeth ehangaf possibl ynglŷn ag adroddiad PricewaterhouseCoopers, gan ei fod yn adroddiad eithaf trwchus. Bydd angen i bobl ei ddarllen a'i ailddarllen. Yr wyf wedi bod yn awyddus o'r cychwyn i'r broses hon, fel y dywedodd, fod yn broses dryloyw, a dyna pam y cyhoeddais yr adroddiad yn ei grynwth. Yr wyf yn sicr yn fodlon trafod yr adroddiad gyda'r pwylgorau priodol yn y Cynulliad, er enghraift, er mwyn inni gael cefnogaeth eang i'r casgliadau sydd ynddo.

Holodd am randdeiliaid. Cyfarfu PricewaterhouseCoopers â mwy o randdeiliaid o lawer yn ystod yr ymgynghori nag yr oedd disgwyl iddo wneud mewn gwirionedd o dan y contract Aeth allan i ymweld â mwy na 100 o randdeiliaid a chynnal cyfarfodydd gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, aelodau'r cabinet dros addysg a chyfarwyddwyr addysg, ac edrychodd ar sefydliadau eraill mewn sectorau eraill a thrafod y materion gyda hwy. Credaf fod trafodaeth eang wedi bod.

In the second phase, we need to move urgently to implementation. Therefore, I see phase 2 as not being a further process of commissioning another report, but of moving into implementation through a number of work streams that are managed directly by an implementation team from my department, working with our partners to see that those things are happening. There are, roughly, 10 proposals, in broad terms, that PricewaterhouseCoopers makes in the report for taking the work forward.

We are already seeing—and I would want to build on this—work through the regional consortia of local authorities. The Minister for Social Justice and Local Government and I met with the north Wales local authorities a month or so ago to look at proposals that they had for a common approach to delivering some school improvement services, for example. Therefore, there are some good schemes like that that people are looking at, but I suspect that the pace of change may not be quite as fast as I would like, which is part of the reason why I wanted the widest possible debate on this report.

There are also quite innovative proposals being discussed in the further education sector, where we have already seen some mergers recently, but also between higher education and further education, where there will be scope on a regional basis, for example, for the sharing of back-office services. I think that those are a number of the developments that we have looked at. If the Conservative spokesperson reads the report, he will see that there is an analysis of the work carried out by my own department, and there is scope for further collaboration between the Assembly Government and Assembly Government sponsored bodies, for example, in the sharing of support services. Therefore, there are some practical ideas outlined in the report.

In respect of the question on the funding gap, the Conservative spokesperson will know that we are committed to addressing that over time. The First Minister has given a commitment to that. There are real proposals in here, and if he were to look at page 49, he would see the range of potential savings that

Yn yr ail gam, mae angen inni symud ar frys i roi'r argymhellion ar waith. Felly, gwelaf yr ail gam, nid yn broses o gomisiynu adroddiad arall eto, ond o fynd rhagom i weithredu drwy nifer o ffrydiau gwaith o dan reolaeth uniongyrchol tîm gweithredu, a hwnnw yn fy adran, yn gweithio gyda'n partneriaid er mwyn sicrhau bod y pethau hynny'n digwydd. Yn fras, ceir 10 argymhelliaid cyffredinol gan PricewaterhouseCoopers yn yr adroddiad sy'n ymwneud â bwrw ymlaen â'r gwaith.

Yr ydym eisoes yn gweld awdurdodau lleol yn cydweithio drwy'r consortia rhanbarthol a byddwn yn awyddus i adeiladu ar sail hyn. Cyfarfu'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol a minnau ag awdurdodau lleol y gogledd fis neu ddau'n ôl i ystyried eu cynigion ar gyfer mynd ati ar y cyd i gyflwyno rhai gwasanaethau er mwyn gwella ysgolion, er enghraifft. Felly, ceir nifer o gynlluniau da fel hynny y mae pobl yn eu hystyried, ond yr wyf yn tybio nad yw'r newid yn digwydd mor gyflym ag y byddwn yn dymuno iddo wneud efallai, a dyna ran o'r rheswm pam yr oeddwn am gael y drafodaeth ehangaf posibl ynghŷn â'r adroddiad hwn.

Mae cynigion eithaf arloesol yn cael eu trafod hefyd yn y sector addysg bellach, lle yr ydym eisoes wedi gweld rhai sefydliadau'n uno'n ddiweddar, ond hefyd rhwng sefydliadau addysg uwch a sefydliadau addysg bellach, lle y bydd cyfle'n ranbarthol, er enghraifft, i rannu gwasanaethau cefn swyddfa. Credaf mai datblygiadau felly yw nifer o'r rhai yr ydym wedi'u hystyried. Os bydd llefarydd y Ceidwadwyr yn darllen yr adroddiad, bydd yn gweld bod gwaith fy adran i fy hun yn cael ei ddadansoddi, ac mae lle i ragor o gydweithio rhwng Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a chyrff a noddir gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, er enghraifft, o ran rhannu gwasanaethau cymorth. Felly, ceir nifer o syniadau ymarferol yn yr adroddiad.

O ran y cwestiwn ynglŷn â'r bwlch ariannu, bydd llefarydd y Ceidwadwyr yn gwybod ein bod wedi ymrwymo i fynd i'r afael â hynny dros gyfnod. Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi ymrwymo i hynny. Ceir yma gynigion go iawn, a phetai'n edrych ar dudalen 49, gwelai'r amrywiaeth o arbedion posibl a

are outlined by PricewaterhouseCoopers as it looks across the range of activities within the education system and the opportunities that would come through from those. Therefore, there are opportunities for significant funding to be found to move to the front line, but it is not something that you could do over night. It is something that will depend on the series of actions being taken by all partners and will be achievable over a period of time.

Given that the review was conducted over seven weeks by PricewaterhouseCoopers—and I think that it has done a first-rate job in returning it in that timescale—we then had some questions and we then brought it back to the Assembly to make it public at the earliest possible opportunity. I hope that this will be the start of a debate on how we can move more money to the front line.

**Nerys Evans:** Diolch yn fawr am y datganiad, ac am ddiweddarau'r Cynulliad ar y gwaith o arolygu cost gweinyddu addysg. Gwyddom fod cylidebau yn dynn ar hyn o bryd, ac yr ydym yn fwy pryderus o wybod fod cylideb Cymru o dan fygythiad enfawr oherwydd agenda toriadau'r Ceidwadwyr a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn Llundain. Maent yn bwriadu torri cannoedd o filoedd o bunnoedd o gyllideb Cymru yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol hon. Yn ddiau, bydd gweithredoedd y Ceidwadwyr a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn Llundain yn cael effaith andwyol ar gyllid addysg yng Nghymru. Mae'r gwaith hwn, felly, o edrych ar y gwariant ar weinyddu addysg yn bwysig ac yn amserol.

3.20 p.m.

Mae'r adroddiad yn dangos yn glir fod gwahaniaethau sylfaenol rhwng sefydliadau gwahanol ym mhob sector addysg yng Nghymru. Er enghraift, mae awdurdodau addysg Cymru yn amrywio'n fawr o ran faint o gyllid sy'n cael ei basio ymlaen i ysgolion a faint sy'n cael ei gadw'n ganolog ar gyfer gweinyddu. Mae colegau addysg bellach a sefydliadau addysg uwch hefyd yn amrywio'n fawr. Weinidog, sut yr ydych yn bwriadu dechrau cysoni'r gost o weinyddu addysg yng Nghymru? Beth fydd y cam

restrir gan PricewaterhouseCoopers wrth iddo ystyried yr amrywiaeth o weithgareddau o fewn y system addysg a'r cyfleoedd a ddeilliai ohonynt. Felly, ceir cyfleoedd i ddod o hyd i arian sylweddol i'w symud i'r rheng flaen, ond nid yw'n rhywbeth y gallech ei wneud dros nos. Mae'n rhywbeth a fydd yn dibynnu ar y gyfres o gamau sy'n cael eu cymryd gan bob partner ac yn rhywbeth y bydd modd ei gyflawni dros gyfnod.

O gofio bod PricewaterhouseCoopers wedi cynnal yr adolygiad dros gyfnod o saith wythnos—a chredaf iddo wneud gwaith o'r radd flaenaf drwy ei gwblhau o fewn yr amserlen honno—yna, yr oedd gennym nifer o gwestiynau cyn inni ddod ag ef yn ôl i'r Cynulliad i'w gyhoeddi cyn gynted byth ag y gallem. Gobeithio y bydd hyn yn fan cychwyn i drafodaeth ynglŷn â sut y gallwn symud rhagor o arian i'r rheng flaen.

**Nerys Evans:** Thank you for the statement, and for updating the Assembly on the work of reviewing the cost of education administration. We know that budgets are tight at the moment, and our concern is greater in the knowledge that the Welsh budget is under threat because of the massive cuts agenda under the Conservatives and Liberal Democrats in London. They intend to cut hundreds of thousands of pounds from the Welsh budget during this financial year. Undoubtedly, the actions of the Conservatives and Liberal Democrats in London will have a detrimental effect on education funding in Wales. This work, therefore, to examine expenditure on administration in education, is important and timely.

The report clearly shows that there are basic differences between the various organizations in all sectors of education in Wales. For example, the Welsh education authorities vary enormously in the amount of funding that is passed on to schools and the amount that is held centrally for administration. There is wide variation in further education colleges and higher education institutions, too. Minister, how do you intend to start standardising the cost of administering education in Wales? What is the next step?

nesaf?

Mae'r datganiad yn sôn am rannu arfer da, sy'n gam pwysig ymlaen, ond sut y gellid pennu beth yw arfer da yn y lle cyntaf? Mae gwahaniaethau sylfaenol rhwng awdurdodau addysg, colegau addysg bellach a sefydliadau addysg uwch, yn ddaearyddol, yn ieithyddol ac o ran eu harbenigedd. Felly, mae'n annoeth dweud yn blwmp ac yn blaen mai'r sefydliadau sy'n pasio'r ganran uchaf o'u cyllid ymlaen i'r dosbarth neu i'r ystafell ddarllithio yw'r rhai mwyaf effeithlon, gan fod ystyriaethau gwahanol wrth gwrs. Felly, sut y gellid adnabod arfer da yn y lle cyntaf? Yn ail, sut y gellid rhannu'r arfer da hwnnw?

The statement talks about sharing good practice, which is an important step forward, but how is good practice to be determined in the first place? There are fundamental differences between education authorities, further education colleges and higher education institutions, geographically, linguistically and in relation to their expertise. Therefore, it is unwise to say bluntly that the organisations that pass the highest percentage of their funding onto classroom or the lecture hall are the more efficient, because there are differences to be considered, of course. Therefore, how can good practice be identified in the first place? Secondly, how can that good practice be shared?

Yr ydych wedi crybwyll y mater o gydweithio ar rannu gwasanaethau, sy'n thema gyson yn yr adroddiad ac yn eich datganiad. Yr ydych yn sôn am agenda'r Gweinidog dros Gyflawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol o ran ceisio cael cydweithio gwell rhwng llywodraethau lleol, a'r ffafith eich bod yn cefnogi hynny. A allwch amlinellu sut yr ydych yn rhagweld ymestyn agenda cytundeb canlyniadau'r Gweinidog dros Gyflawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol i'r maes addysg? Pa mor bell yr ydych eisiau i'r cydweithio hwn ymestyn? Pa fodelau yr ydych yn eu hystyried ar hyn o bryd ym maes addysg?

You have mentioned the issue of collaboration on shared services, which is a constant theme in the report and in your statement. You talk about the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government's agenda to seek enhanced collaboration between local governments, and the fact that you support that. Can you outline how you anticipate extending the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government's outcome agreement agenda to education? How far do you want this type of collaboration to extend? Which models are you currently considering for education?

Yr ydych hefyd yn sôn am integreiddio cefnogaeth pan nad yw'r sefydliad yn ddigon mawr i gyflawnhau cyflogi timoedd unigol. Mae Cymru'n wlad amrywiol iawn, wrth gwrs. Mae sefydliadau cenedlaethol yn un peth, ond o ran sefydliadau nad ydynt yn rhai cenedlaethol, byddai sefydliad a ystyrid yn fach yng Nghaerdydd yn cael ei ystyried yn fawr yn sir Gaerfyrddin neu yng Ngheredigion, er enghraifft. A ydych yn derbyn bod gwahaniaethau mawr mewn maint sefydliadau? A allwch amlinellau sut y gellid gweithredu'r ymrwymiad hwnnw? Beth yw'r broses? Sut y gellid diffinio pa sefydliadau sy'n fawr ac felly a fydd yn gallu cyflawnhau parhau i gynnal gwasanaethau sy'n darparu cefnogaeth i addysg?

You have also talked about integrating support when an organization is not large enough to justify employing individual teams. Wales is a very diverse country, of course. National organizations are one thing, but where non-national institutions are concerned, an institution that would be considered small in Cardiff would be seen as large in Ceredigion or Carmarthenshire, for example. Do you accept that there are major differences in the size of organizations? Can you outline how such a commitment would be implemented? What is the process? How would one define which organizations are large enough to justify maintaining their support services for education?

I gloi, soniasoch ar ddechrau'r datganiad nad

Finally, you mentioned at the beginning of

modd o gyflawnhau toriadau yn y maes addysg yw'r adolygiad na'r datganiad. Fel y soniais, gwyddom fod y rhagolygon ar gyfer gwariant cyhoeddus yn wael oherwydd bydd y Ceidwadwyr a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn torri cyllideb Cymru. Byddant yn torri gwariant cyhoeddus a gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, ac yn lleihau rôl y Llywodraeth. Yn sgîl argymhellion yr adroddiad hwn, sut yr ydych yn bwriadu ymdrin â'r toriadau a welwn fis nesaf oherwydd Llywodraeth Llundain?

**Leighton Andrews:** We would all accept that the budget is likely to be tight. The whole rationale underpinning the report is that that provides a further incentive for ensuring that the money that we do put into the system is well spent, goes to the front line and supports the services that it should support. We have identified opportunities and, in some cases, best practice that can enable the system to work better and to deliver better for learners at all points in the system. Our expectation throughout the education system will be that, where we know that best practice exists, we will expect organisations, whether they are local authorities or higher education institutions, to adopt that best practice or to justify why they are not adopting it. The phrase 'adopt or justify' will have to be a driving mantra in the implementation of this report.

I am encouraged by the reception that the report has received from local government. A lot of the information has been shared with the local authorities in the course of developing the report, and I start with the positive assumption that there is a commitment and a genuine understanding of the fact that the world is changing and that we need to deliver more for less in future. There may be a case for us, in taking forward the collaboration agenda of the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government, to look at whether there is a role for the Wales Audit Office or Estyn in helping us to ensure that the appropriate models for collaboration are being taken forward within the education system as a whole.

I certainly accept the point that she made that

the statement that neither the review nor the statement is intended to justify cuts in education. As I mentioned, we know that the outlook for public expenditure is bleak because the Conservatives and Liberal Democrats will cut the budget for Wales. They will cut public spending and public services, and reduce the role of Government. In the wake of this report's recommendations, how do you intend to deal with the cuts that we shall see next month because of Government in London?

**Leighton Andrews:** Byddem i gyd yn derbyn bod y gyllideb yn debyg o fod yn dynn. Y rhesymwaith sy'n sail i'r adroddiad yw bod hynny'n gymhelliant ychwanegol i sicrhau bod yr arian y byddwn yn ei fwydo i'r system yn cael ei wario'n dda, yn mynd i'r rheng flaen ac yn cefnogi'r gwasanaethau y dylai eu cefnogi. Yr ydym wedi canfod cyfleoedd ac, mewn ambell achos, yr arferion gorau a all alluogi'r system i weithio'n well ac i gyflawni'n well ar ran dysgwyr ym mhob cam yn y system. Yn y system addysg drwyddi draw, lle y gwyddom fod yr arferion gorau ar waith, byddwn yn disgwyli i sefydliadau, boed y rheini'n awdurdodau lleol neu'n sefydliadau addysg uwch, fabwysiadu'r arferion gorau hynny neu gyflawnhau eu rhesymau dros beidio â gwneud. Bydd yn rhaid i'r ymadrodd 'mabwysiadu neu gyflawnhau' fod yn sbardun inni wrth roi'r adroddiad hwn ar waith.

Mae'r croeso a gafodd yr adroddiad hwn gan llywodraeth leol yn fy nghalonogi. Rhannwyd llawer o'r wybodaeth gyda'r awdurdodau lleol wrth ddatblygu'r adroddiad, a dechreuaf gyda'r dybiaeth gadarnhaol bod ymrwymiad gan bobl a'u bod yn deall o ddifrif fod y byd yn newid a bod angen inni gyflawni mwy drwy ddefnyddio llai yn y dyfodol. Efallai fod lle inni, wrth inni fwrw ymlaen ag agenda cydweithredu'r Gweinidog dros Gyflawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol, ystyried a oes rôl i Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru neu i Estyn i'n helpu i sicrhau bod y modelau priodol ar gyfer cydweithio'n cael eu datblygu yn y system addysg drwyddi draw.

Yr wyf yn sicr yn derbyn ei phwynt bod

Wales is a diverse country with a different range of needs in different communities and that, therefore, one should not get hung up on the size of particular institutions. However, I think that there are certain kinds of issues that we need to attend to. We need to look at issues such as surplus places and that is something that we would expect local authorities to look at.

We also need to look at the disparities in the percentages that are spent on support services in different sectors. For example, if you look at the PricewaterhouseCoopers report, you will see that there appears to be a surprisingly high concentration of support activities in higher education as compared with other sectors in the Welsh education system. We will need to return to that.

As I said at the outset, this is certainly not a question of cuts, but of how we reprioritise spending and recycle more of it to the front line. It is not for me, at this stage, to respond to proposals that may or may not come from the UK Government in its emergency budget later in the summer. Our agenda is one of investing in education, not one of cutting investment in education.

**Jenny Randerson:** My first question relates to what opportunities we will have in the future to ask questions or to debate this report. I draw your attention to the size of the document, which came through to me at 12.31 p.m. today. As you well know, we all have busy lunchtimes and, as we did not have a briefing on it, it is difficult to digest its detail. It is even more difficult because it appears to be written in a strange language: it looks like English, but is not quite English. I will quote two sentences from it. The first is:

‘develop a presumption for the delivery options and leading practice approaches that will secure the best balance of efficiency and delivery for each common function and geography.’

Another sentence is:

Cymru'n wlad amrywiol a chanddi amryw o wahanol anghenion mewn gwahanol gymunedau ac na ddylai rhywun felly ymboeni gormod am faint sefydliadau penodol. Serch hynny, credaf fod rhai mathau o faterion y mae angen inni roi sylw iddynt. Mae angen inni ystyried materion megis lleoedd gwag ac mae hynny'n rhywbeth y byddem yn disgwyl i awdurdodau lleol ei ystyried.

Mae angen inni edrych hefyd ar y gwahaniaethau o ran y canrannau a werir ar wasanaethau cymorth mewn gwahanol sectorau. Er enghraift, os edrychwch ar adroddiad PricewaterhouseCoopers, gwelwch ei bod yn ymddangos bod gweithgareddau cymorth yn niferus mewn addysg uwch o'i gymharu â sectorau eraill yn system addysg Cymru, ac mae'r nifer uchel hwnnw'n peri syndod. Bydd angen inni ddychwelyd at hynny.

Fel y dywedais ar y cychwyn, yn sicr, nid oes a wnelo hyn â thoriadau ond â sut y mae ailflaenoraiethu'r gwariant ac ailgylchu mwy ohono i'r rheng flaen. Nid fy lle i, ar hyn o bryd, yw ymateb i gynigion a all ddod gan Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig yn ei chyllideb frws yn ddiweddarach yn yr haf. Buddsoddi mewn addysg yw ein hagenda ni, nid tocio'r buddsoddi mewn addysg.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae a wnelo fy nghwestiwn cyntaf â pha gyfleoedd a gawn yn y dyfodol i ofyn cwestiynau neu i gynnal dadl am yr adroddiad hwn. Tynnaf eich sylw at faint y ddogfen, a gefais am 12.31 p.m. heddiw. Fel y gwyddoch, mae amser cinio'n adeg brysur inni i gyd, a chan na chawsom ein briffio yn ei chylch, mae'n anodd treulio'i manylion. Mae'n anos byth oherwydd ei bod i bob golwg wedi'i hysgrifennu mewn iaith ryfedd: mae'n ymdebygu i'r Saesneg, ond nid Saesneg ydyw yn holol. Difynnaf ddwy frawddeg ohoni. Dyma'r gyntaf:

‘Llunio rhagdybiaeth o blaid opsiynau cyflawni ac arferion blaengar a fydd yn sicrhau'r cydbwysedd gorau rhwng effeithlonrwydd a chyflawni ar gyfer pob swyddogaeth gyffredin a daearyddiaeth.’

Dyma frawddeg arall

'the case for change work above and the approach to locally shaping the right configuration of collaboration will help.'

It is not easy to read is the message that I am trying to give you. Every sentence needs to be read two or three times to understand what it means. It seems to be accountant speak and is a lesson in what the tabloids call, 'jargon' and 'gobbledegook'. However, I accept that it has a large number of important lessons for us. I welcome what you have said about it today, and I seek further opportunities to look into it in more detail.

You stressed that this is not about cuts, but about freeing up resources, which I find reassuring. I also find it reassuring that it is not about radical restructuring because the lesson that we have learnt here is that restructuring is costly—whatever we think that it will save, in practice, it always ends up costing more. I am interested in the simplification of the structure of the grant schemes. I have asked for that for years. Indeed, the Enterprise and Learning Committee and the Finance Committee have also asked for it. It is a common theme here and, therefore, very worthwhile.

However, I would like more detail on standardised provision. I understand the sharing of provision, but I have some concerns about standardising provision, despite the fact that it sounds like a sensible option. In practice, organisations always find reasons why it is not possible to standardise provision. I will use the term 'customer' as an example, because we all know about standardised provision that does not fit customers. The 'customer', whether it is the student, the pupil or their parents, finds that standardisation less than sensitive, less than acceptable to them, and people do not like the one-size-fits-all approach.

3.30 p.m.

Many of my questions have already been asked by my colleagues, but I have one

'Bydd y gwaith o lunio'r ddadl dros newid a nodir uchod a'r ffordd a gynigir ar gyfer llunio'r math cywir o gydweithredu'n lleol o gymorth.'

Y neges yr wyf yn ceisio'i chyfleu yw nad yw'n rhwydd ei darllen. Mae angen darllen pob brawddeg ddwywaith neu deirgwaith i ddeall ei hystyr. Iaith y cyfrifydd sydd yma i bob golwg ac mae'n enghraifft o'r hyn y bydd y papurau poblogaidd yn ei alw'n 'jargon' ac yn 'gobbledegook'. Serch hynny, yr wyf yn derbyn ei bod yn cynnwys nifer fawr o wersi pwysig inni. Yr wyf yn croesawu'r hyn yr ydych wedi'i ddweud amdani heddiw, a cheisaf ragor o gylleoedd i'w hystyried yn fanylach.

Pwysleisiwyd gennych nad oes a wnelo hyn â thoriadau, ond â rhyddhau adnoddau, ac mae hynny'n tawelu fy meddwl. Mae'n tawelu fy meddwl hefyd nad oes a wnelo ag ad-drefnu o'r gwraidd oherwydd y wers yr ydym wedi'i dysgu yma yw bod ad-drefnu'n gostus—faint bynnag y credwn y bydd yn ei arbed, mewn gwirionedd, bydd bob tro'n costio mwy. Mae gennyl ddiddordeb mewn symleiddio strwythur y cynlluniau grantiau. Yr wyf wedi gofyn am hynny ers blynnyddoedd. Yn wir, mae'r Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu a'r Pwyllgor Cyllid wedi gofyn am hynny hefyd. Mae'n thema sy'n codi'n aml yma, ac, felly, yn werthfawr iawn.

Serch hynny, hoffwn gael rhagor o fanylion am safoni'r ddarpariaeth. Yr wyf yn deall rhannu'r ddarpariaeth, ond yr wyf yn poeni braidd am ei safoni, er bod hynny, i bob golwg yn beth call i'w wneud. O safbwynt ymarferol, bydd sefydliadau bob amser yn dod o hyd i resymau dros ddadlau yn erbyn safoni'r ddarpariaeth. Defnyddiaf y term 'cwsmer' yn enghraifft, oherwydd ein bod i gyd yn gwybod am ddarpariaeth sydd wedi'i safoni nad yw'n addas ar gyfer cwsmeriaid. Bydd y 'cwsmer', boed hwnnw'n fyfyrwr, yn ddisgybl neu'n rhiant, yn canfod nad yw'r safoni'n sensitif iawn nac yn dderbyniol iawn iddynt, ac ni fydd pobl yn hoff o drefniant yr un ateb i bawb.

Mae fy nghyd-Aelodau eisoes wedi gofyn llawer o'r cwestiynau y bwriadwn eu gofyn,

remaining substantive question, beyond asking when we will have the opportunity to discuss this further. Exactly what do you mean by 'standardisation', Minister?

**Leighton Andrews:** I thought that she was being a little unkind to the writers of the report. I certainly accept that there is the language of management consultants in the report, but we hired management consultants to do the job in this instance because we thought that they might have skills that we needed to do the work. They have produced a report that would be familiar to many people who have worked in a corporate setting in analysing the range of functions operating within the education system. Therefore, to put it bluntly, I think that it is churlish, nit-picking, and not very serious to focus on the language.

However, I welcome her acceptance that there are reassuring elements to this report, and that we are not seeing this in any way as an opportunity to cut public spending or to talk about a radical restructuring of the system. I said in answer to Paul Davies, I think, that the report required reading and re-reading and that I was quite prepared to discuss it with the Finance Committee and the Enterprise and Learning Committee, and with anyone else. Indeed, I would be happy to arrange a briefing for Jenny or for any of the education spokespersons in the Assembly on the report. I happen to think that it is an important report, as was agreed by the opposition spokesperson in the Chamber.

I hope that it is the start of a serious debate about how we move money to the front line. I was anxious to publish it at the first opportunity. The report was taken to Cabinet only yesterday, so we have published it as soon as we were able. Therefore, this is the start and not the end of the discussion on the report. However, we will move rapidly into the implementation phase. We will do that with our stakeholders. We will lead that from the department and will work with other colleagues in the Assembly Government to do that.

ond mae gennyf un cwestiwn sylfaenol ar ôl, ar wahân i ofyn pryd y cawn y cyfle i drafod hyn eto. Beth yn union sydd gennych mewn golwg wrth sôn am 'safoni', Weinidog?

**Leighton Andrews:** Yr oeddwn yn meddwl ei bod yn angharedig braidd wrth awduron yr adroddiad. Yr wyf yn sicr yn derbyn mai iaith ymgynghorwyr rheoli sydd yn yr adroddiad, ond ymgynghorwyr rheoli a gyflogwyd gennym i wneud y gwaith yn y cyswllt hwn oherwydd ein bod yn meddwl y gallai fod ganddynt y sgiliau yr oedd eu hangen arnom i wneud y gwaith. Maent wedi cyhoeddi adroddiad a fyddai'n gyfarwydd i lawer o bobl sydd wedi gweithio mewn sefyllfa gorfforaethol wrth iddynt ddadansoddi'r amrywiaeth o swyddogaethau sydd ar waith yn y system addysg. Felly, a bod yn blwmp ac yn blaen, credaf fod canolbwytio ar yr iaith a phigo beiau yn anfoesgar ac yn arwynebol braidd.

Serch hynny, yr wyf yn croesawu'r ffaith ei bod yn derbyn bod elfennau o'r adroddiad hwn yn galonogol ac nad cyfle o gwbl yw hyn inni gwtopi gwariant cyhoeddus na sôn am ad-drefnu'r system o'r gwraidd. Dywedais, wrth ateb Paul Davies, fe gredaf, fod angen darllen ac ailddarllen yr adroddiad ac fy mod yn eithaf parod i'w drafod gyda'r Pwyllgor Cyllid a'r Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu, a chydag unrhyw un arall. Yn wir, byddwn yn falch o drefnu cyfarfod briffio am yr adroddiad i Jenny neu i unrhyw un o lefarwyr addysg y Cynulliad. Yr wyf yn digwydd credu ei fod yn adroddiad pwysig, fel y cytunodd llefarydd yr wrthblaid yn y Siambr.

Gobeithio bod hyn yn fan cychwyn i ddadl ddifrifol ynglŷn â sut y mae symud arian i'r rheng flaen. Yr oeddwn yn awyddus i'w gyhoeddi cyn gynted ag y dōi cyfle i wneud hynny. Ni chafodd y Cabinet yr adroddiad tan ddoe, felly yr ydym wedi'i gyhoeddi cyn gynted ag y gallem. Dechrau'r drafodaeth ar yr adroddiad yw hyn, felly, nid diwedd y broses. Serch hynny, symudwn yn gyflym at gam y gweithredu. Gwnawn hynny gyda'n rhanddeiliaid. Yr adran fydd yn arwain y gwaith hwnnw, gan gydweithio gyda chyd-Weinidogion eraill yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad er mwyn gwneud hynny.

The issue that Jenny raised about standardisation is understood. In fact, under the section on standardising support to higher education, for example, PWC says that a one-size-fits-all approach is unlikely to succeed since institutional diversity is a strength of the higher education system in Wales and should be maintained. We are sensitive to that, but it goes back to what I said earlier about good practice. If we know that there is good practice that has been proven to deliver, it is essential that that good practice be implemented throughout. Perhaps, in the past, over the past 20 years, there has been something of a fashion to call for more and more innovative approaches. I would like to see the implementation of tried and tested approaches. That is where I would like to see the emphasis being placed, which is why I come back to the point that, as we go forward on the implementation of this review, it is for all those in the education sector to adopt best practice or to justify why they are not.

**Alun Davies:** Like many others across the Chamber, I welcome the report and your statement this afternoon, Minister. I also welcome the fact that one of the first things that you did upon taking office was instigate a review of funding in the education system. I find it frustrating that we seem to be spending more money on education in Wales than is spent across the border—I think that the figure is £830 per head of population as opposed to £814 per head in England, outside London—but we do not seem to be getting that money through to the front line.

Given the current situation, whereby the Liberal-Conservative Government is absolutely determined to push through as many cuts as possible to the public sector, it is important that we, as a Government in Cardiff, can protect Welsh schools and can ensure that Welsh children have the opportunity to have the best possible education, and that funding be directed through to the classroom, and not get lost in the system.

I was particularly pleased to hear what you said about sharing and integration, Minister. I

Deellir y pwynt a gododd Jenny ynglŷn â safoni. A dweud y gwir, o dan yr adran ynglŷn â safoni'r cymorth i addysg uwch, er enghraift, dywed PWC nad yw trefniant yr un ateb i bawb yn debyg o llwyddo gan mai'r amrywiaeth rhwng y sefydliadau yw un o gryfderau'r system addysg uwch yng Nghymru ac y dylid cadw hynny. Yr ydym yn sylweddoli hynny, ond mae'n mynd yn ôl at yr hyn a ddywedais gynnau am arferion da. Os gwyddom fod arferion da ar waith a bod prawf bod y rheini'n llwyddo, mae'n hanfodol rhoi'r arferion da hynny ar waith drwy'r system. Efallai, yn y gorffennol, yn ystod yr 20 mlynedd diwethaf, fod tuedd braidd wedi bod i alw am fwy a mwy o arloesi. Hoffwn weld dulliau sydd wedi hen ennill eu plwyf yn cael eu rhoi ar waith. Hoffwn weld y pwyslais ar hynny, a dyna pam y dychwelaf at y pwynt mai gwaith pawb yn y sector addysg, wrth inni fwrw ati i roi'r adolygiad hwn ar waith, yw mabwysiadu'r arferion gorau neu gyflawnhau eu rhesymau dros beidio â gwneud hynny.

**Alun Davies:** Yr wyf finnau, fel llawer un arall yn y Siambra, yn croesawu'r adroddiad a'ch datganiad y prynhawn yma, Weinidog. Yr wyf yn croesawu hefyd y ffaith mai un o'r pethau cyntaf a wnaethoch wrth ymgymryd â'ch swydd oedd rhoi cychwyn ar adolygiad o ariannu yn y system addysg. Yr wyf yn ei chael yn rhwystredig ein bod i bob golwg yn gwario mwy o arian ar addysg yng Nghymru nag a werir dros y ffin—credaf ein bod yn gwario £830 y pen o'r boblogaeth o'i gymharu â £814 y pen yn Lloegr, y tu allan i Lundain—ond nad yw'r arian hwnnw i bob golwg yn cyrraedd y rheng flaen.

A phethau fel y maent, a Llywodraeth y Rhyddfrydwyr a'r Ceidwadwyr yn holol benderfynol o weithredu cynifer o doriadau ag sy'n bosibl yn y sector cyhoeddus, mae'n bwysig i ni, fel Llywodraeth yng Nghaerdydd, allu amddiffyn ysgolion Cymru a gallu sicrhau bod plant Cymru'n cael y cyfre i gael yr addysg orau un, ac i'r arian gael ei gyfeirio i'r ystafell ddosbarth, heb fynd ar goll yn y system.

Yr oeddwn yn arbennig o falch o glywed yr hyn a ddywedasoch am rannu ac integreiddio,

would be grateful if you could give us a bit more information on how you see that integration working, and how you see the reality of schools sharing different facilities and services. I was surprised to read in the report about the amount of expenditure currently used for support services rather than going to the front line. In investing in education, it is important that we ensure that there is a different balance of expenditure, and that money is spent in the classroom and on immediate support services to ensure that children and young people have the best start in life.

How do you see the development of support services, Minister? One issue raised with me time and again during the general election campaign was that of providing additional support for children who have special education needs, particularly those educated through the medium of Welsh, where there appears to be a greater need for further investment. A number of parents of children with autism or dyslexia, for example, spoke to me about their concerns that their children were not getting the support that they needed. They had been having a number of different conversations and correspondence with the local education authority, but were not getting that support. I am sure that they would be concerned to know what the impact of this review will be on the provision of special educational needs and support services for those people.

With that, Minister, I very much welcome your statement and the debate that you have started. I also very much welcome your determination to ensure that we are able to secure educational funding and protect Welsh children from the cuts that the Liberals and Tories seem determined to foist upon them.

**Leighton Andrews:** As Alun Davies rightly said, one of the first announcements that I made as Minister was that I was commissioning this review. I regard this as fundamental to the way in which we take forward expenditure and investment in education. Based on international

Weinidog. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech roi ychydig rhagor o wybodaeth inni am sut y gwelwch yr integreiddio hwnnw'n gweithio, a sut y gwelwch ysgolion yn rhannu gwahanol gyfleusterau a gwasanaethau mewn gwirionedd. Yr oeddwn yn synnu o ddarllen yn yr adroddiad faint sy'n cael ei wario ar hyn o bryd ar wasanaethau cymorth yn hytrach na'i fod yn mynd i'r rheng flaen. Wrth fuddsoddi mewn addysg, mae'n bwysig inni sicrhau newid yng nghydbwysedd y gwario, a bod yr arian hwnnw'n cael ei wario yn yr ystafell ddosbarth ac ar wasanaethau cymorth uniongyrchol er mwyn sicrhau bod plant a phobl ifanc yn cael y cychwyn gorau mewn bywyd.

Sut y gwelwch wasanaethau cymorth yn datblygu, Weinidog? Un mater a godwyd gyda mi dro ar ôl tro yn ystod ymgyrch yr etholiad cyffredinol oedd darparu cymorth ychwanegol i blant a chanddynt anghenion addysgol arbennig, yn enwedig y rhai a addysgir drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, lle y mae mwy o angen buddsoddi arian ychwanegol i bob golwg. Soniodd nifer o rieni plant a chanddynt awtisiaeth neu ddyslecia, er enghraifft, eu bod yn poeni nad oedd eu plant yn cael y cymorth yr oedd ei angen arnynt. Yr oeddent wedi bod yn cael nifer o wahanol sgyrsiau ac wedi bod yn gohebu â'r awdurdod addysg lleol, ond nid oeddent yn cael y cymorth hwnnw. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddent am gael gwybod pa effaith a gaiff yr adolygiad hwn ar ddarparu gwasanaethau anghenion addysgol arbennig a gwasanaethau cymorth ar gyfer y bobl hynny.

Ar hynny, Weinidog, yr wyf yn croesawu'ch datganiad yn fawr a'r drafodaeth yr ydych wedi rhoi cychwyn arni. Yr wyf hefyd yn croesawu'n fawr eich bod yn benderfynol o wneud yn siŵr ein bod yn gallu sicrhau arian ar gyfer addysg ac amddiffyn plant Cymru rhag y toriadau y mae'r Rhyddfrydwyr a'r Torïaid i bob golwg yn benderfynol o'u gorfodi arnynt.

**Leighton Andrews:** Yr oedd Alun Davies yn llygad ei le'n dweud mai un o'r cyhoeddiadau cyntaf a wneuthum fel Gweinidog oedd fy mod am gomisiynu'r adolygiad hwn. Yn fy marn i, mae hyn yn agwedd sylfaenol ar sut y mae bwrw ymlaen i wario ar addysg a buddsoddi ynddi. Ar sail

comparisons, spending in Wales has held up pretty well. We ought to be clear at the outset that money is an important part of this but it is not the only question that matters; issues such as leadership and effectiveness in schools also matter greatly.

We are already starting to see some good examples of collaboration and joint procurement. We are starting to see schools in clusters sharing subject advisers and getting support jointly. We are seeing some efforts to bring together particular kinds of support services, as I referred to in relation to north Wales. We have seen real work on the transformation agenda, not least in the further education sector. However, anyone who looked at the education system in Wales would probably come to the conclusion that it was not 'optimally configured', to use a piece of management jargon. In other words, we would not necessarily start from this basis. As I have said, I am not proposing a radical reorganisation of the structures of education as a result of the report, but I have said before in public that I do not think that many of us would have invented 22 local education authorities. However, that is where we are, and what we need to do is focus on ensuring that they work and collaborate together where they should to deliver services more effectively. There is good practice in many cases, and some authorities are working in consortia in a number of areas to deliver teaching and learning services directly through appropriate combinations.

You asked specifically about special educational needs, Alun, and you will probably be aware that I have established a task and finish group to look at the provision of special educational needs services in Wales. The spending on that has more or less doubled over the past seven years. For the money that we are putting into the system, we need to ensure that we are getting the kinds of services that are appropriate for learners.

3.40 p.m.

cymariaethau rhyngwladol, mae'r gwario yng Nghymru wedi dal ei dir yn bur dda. Dylem fod yn glir o'r dechrau'n deg fod arian yn rhan bwysig o hyn ond nad dyna'r unig beth sy'n bwysig; mae materion megis arweiniad ac effeithiolrwydd mewn ysgolion yn bwysig iawn hefyd.

Yr ydym eisoes yn dechrau gweld nifer o enghreifftiau da o gydweithio a chaffael ar y cyd. Yr ydym yn dechrau gweld clystyrau o ysgolion yn rhannu cynghorwyr pwnc ac yn cael cymorth ar y cyd. Yr ydym yn gweld rhai ymdrechion i gyfuno mathau penodol o wasanaethau cymorth, a chyfeiriais at y rhain wrth sôn am y gogledd. Yr ydym wedi gweld gwaith go iawn ar yr agenda gweddnewid, yn anad dim yn y sector addysg bellach. Fodd bynnag, mae'n debyg y byddai unrhyw un sydd wedi edrych ar y system addysg yng Nghymru yn casglu nad yw wedi'i threfnu yn y ffordd orau posibl, a defnyddio tipyn o jargon rheoli. Mewn geiriau eraill, nid dyna'r man cychwyn y byddem yn ei ddewis o anghenraig. Fel yr wyf wedi dweud, nid wyf yn argymhell ad-drefnu strwythurau addysg o'r gwraidd yn sgîl yr adroddiad hwn, ond yr wyf wedi dweud ar goedd o'r blaen nad wyf yn credu y byddai llawer ohonom wedi dyfeisio 22 awdurdod addysg lleol. Serch hynny, dyna'r sefyllfa sydd gennym, a'r hyn y mae angen inni ei wneud yw canolbwytio ar sicrhau eu bod yn cydweithio ac yn cydweithredu lle y dylent er mwyn darparu gwasanaethau'n fwy effeithiol. Mae arferion da ar waith mewn sawl man, ac mae rhai awdurdodau'n gweithio drwy gonsortia mewn nifer o feysydd er mwyn darparu gwasanaethau addysgu a dysgu'n uniongyrchol drwy gyfrwng cyfuniadau priodol.

Gofynasoch yn benodol am anghenion addysgol arbennig, Alun, a gwyddoch, mae'n debyg, imi sefydlu grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen i ystyried y ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau anghenion addysgol arbennig yng Nghymru. Mae'r gwario ar hynny wedi dyblu fwy neu lai yn ystod y saith mlynedd diwethaf. Ar gyfer yr arian yr ydym yn ei fwydo i'r system, mae angen inni sicrhau ein bod yn cael y mathau o wasanaethau sy'n briodol i ddysgwyr.

We know that we do not have the range of services that we would like to have in Wales and so a large amount of money is spent on out-of-country services, for example; a lot certainly goes on out-of-county services, between local authorities. If we were to make sensible capital arrangements in due course, could we minimise the amount of money that is going out of Wales and ensure that our learners who have special educational needs and specific issues are educated closer to home? That would be a rational and sensible way of looking at the system, which is why I want the task and finish group to do that.

To reiterate, this is very much about how we get the maximum from our investment in education. We are not looking to cut education spending but to invest in education, and we will stand up for investment in education in Wales.

**Darren Millar:** I have one brief question, Minister, although I know that you have already answered a lot of questions on your statement. You just made reference to the need for capital investment to prevent the need for pupils to be placed over the border in England at what can be expensive establishments. Will you consider the proposals that will be coming forward from Ysgol y Gogarth in Llandudno? It is a special needs school that is greatly valued by a large number of people in my constituency, and so it is virtually bursting at the seams. Unfortunately, that means that a significant and growing number of young people has to be placed outside the area, at significant cost. Will you consider that proposal favourably when it comes across your desk?

**Leighton Andrews:** I suggest that he encourages the school to make representations to the task and finish group, so that any practical proposals that it has can be properly considered in the review group's work. We are open to suggestions that make sense, and so, if the school has good proposals to bring forward, we would very much welcome them.

Gwyddom nad oes gennym yr ystod o wasanaethau y byddem yn hoffi eu cael yng Nghymru, ac felly, gwerir swm mawr o arian ar wasanaethau y tu allan i'r wlad, er enghraifft; mae awdurdodau lleol yn sier yn gwario llawer ar wasanaethau y tu allan i'w sir. O wneud trefniadau cyfalaf synhwyrol maes o law, a allem sicrhau bod cyn lleied o arian ag sy'n bosibl yn mynd allan o Gymru a sicrhau bod ein dysgwyr a chanddynt anghenion addysgol arbennig a phroblemau penodol yn cael eu haddysg yn nes at eu cartref? Byddai honno'n ffordd resymegol a chall o edrych ar y system, a dyna pam yr wyf am i'r grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen wneud hynny.

Ac ailadrodd, mae a wnelo hyn i raddau helaeth a sicrhau'r budd mwyaf o'n buddsoddiad mewn addysg. Nid ceisio torri'r gwariant ar addysg yr ydym ond buddsoddi ynddi, a byddwn yn sefyll yn gadarn dros fuddsoddi mewn addysg yng Nghymru.

**Darren Millar:** Mae gennyf un cwestiwn byr, Weinidog, er fy mod yn gwybod ichi ateb llawer o gwestiynau eisoes ynglŷn â'ch datganiad. Yr ydych newydd sôn bod angen buddsoddiad cyfalaf fel nad oes yn rhaid i ddisgyblion gael eu haddysg mewn sefydliadau dros y ffin yn Lloegr a'r rheini weithiau'n sefydliadau costus. A wnewch ystyried y cynigion a gyflwynir gan Ysgol y Gogarth yn Llandudno? Ysgol anghenion arbennig yw honno y mae nifer fawr o bobl yn fy etholaeth yn ei gwerthfawrogi'n fawr, ac felly mae hi fwy neu lai dan ei sang. Yn anffodus, mae hynny'n golygu bod yn rhaid lleoli nifer sylweddol a chynyddol o bobl ifanc y tu allan i'r ardal, ac mae hynny'n gostus iawn. A wnewch ystyried y cynnig hwnnw'n ffafriol pan fydd yn cyrraedd eich desg?

**Leighton Andrews:** Yr wyf yn awgrymu ei fod yn annog yr ysgol i gyflwyno sylwadau i'r grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen er mwyn i'r grŵp adolygu ystyried yn briodol unrhyw gynigion ymarferol sydd ganddi. Yr ydym yn barod i wrando ar unrhyw awgrymiadau call, ac felly, os oes gan yr ysgol gynigion da i'w cyflwyno, byddem yn eu croesawu'n fawr.

Over recent years, we have refocused our capital investment. Our twenty-first century schools programme is now operational and is enjoying the full support of local government in Wales; indeed, it has been commended by the Welsh Local Government Association as an example of local government and the Assembly Government working well together. As it is delivered against the plans brought forward by local authorities for the rational transformation of their post-16 services, it will enable us to make a significant difference in the future. We look forward to seeing that programme roll out in future years.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch yn fawr i'r Gweinidog am ei ddatganiad.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd (Rosemary Butler) i'r Gadair am 3.43 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer (Rosemary Butler) took the Chair at 3.43 p.m.*

### **Datganiad am Gyfnod Newydd Gweithgareddau Marchnata Croeso Cymru Statement on the New Phase of Visit Wales's Marketing Activities**

**The Minister for Heritage (Alun Ffred Jones):** As the summer tourism season approaches, I thought that it would be appropriate to outline the current marketing activities of Visit Wales. Before I do so, to pre-empt any incorrect claims from some Members, I want to clarify that the vast majority of the Visit Wales marketing team is the same as the team that worked for the former Wales Tourist Board. The marketing expertise was not lost during the merger of the Wales Tourist Board, and the team continues to deliver creative and effective marketing campaigns, competing effectively with our key competitor destinations. That marketing expertise is also vital in successfully leveraging promotional opportunities around major events such as the Ryder Cup.

Last year, in the middle of difficult economic conditions, Visit Wales launched the Holidays Unpackaged campaign, featuring Welsh comedian Rhod Gilbert. During the peak of the campaign in spring 2009, 53 per cent of respondents surveyed in the UK recalled seeing the TV campaign. As a destination, Wales still suffers from

Yn ystod y blynnyddoedd diwethaf, yr ydym wedi newid pwyslais ein buddsoddiadau cyfalaf. Erbyn hyn, mae ein rhaglen ysgolion ar gyfer yr unfed ganrif ar hugain ar waith ac fe'i cefnogir yn llwyr gan lywodraeth leol yng Nghymru; a dweud y gwir mae Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru wedi'i chymeradwyo fel esiampl o lywodraeth leol a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cydweithio'n dda. Wrth wireddu'r rhaglen ar sail y cynlluniau a gyflwynir gan awdurdodau lleol er mwyn gweddnewid a symleiddio'u gwasanaethau ôl-16, bydd modd inni wneud gwahaniaeth sylwedol yn y dyfodol. Edrychwn ymlaen at weld lledaenu'r rhaglen honno yn y blynnyddoedd a ddaw.

**The Presiding Officer:** I thank the Minister for his statement.

**Y Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth (Alun Ffred Jones):** A thymor ymwelwyr yr haf ar ein gwarthaf, tybiais y byddai'n briodol sôn am weithgareddau marchnata Croeso Cymru ar hyn o bryd. Cyn imi wneud hynny, a chyn i rai Aelodau wneud honiadau anghywir, yr wyf am ei gwneud yn glir mai'r un tîm, i raddau helaeth iawn, yw tîm marchnata Croeso Cymru â'r tîm a oedd yn gweithio i Fwrdd Croeso Cymru gynt. Ni chollwyd yr arbenigedd marchnata pan unwyd y bwrdd croeso, ac mae'r tîm yn dal i roi ymgyrchoedd marchnata creadigol ac effeithiol ar waith, gan gystadlu'n effeithiol â'r prif gyrchfannau sy'n cystadlu â ni. Mae'r arbenigedd marchnata hwnnw'n hollbwysig hefyd er mwyn denu cyfleoedd hyrwyddo llwyddiannus sy'n gysylltiedig â digwyddiadau o bwys megis Cwpan Ryder.

Y llynedd, yng nghanol cyfnod economaidd anodd, lansiodd Croeso Cymru'r ymgyrch Dadbacio Gwyliau, a oedd yn cynnwys y comedïwr o Gymru, Rhod Gilbert. Pan oedd yr ymgyrch yn ei hanterth yng ngwanwyn 2009, yr oedd 53 y cant o'r rhai a atebodd pan holwyd hwy yn y Deyrnas Unedig yn cofio iddynt weld yr ymgyrch ar y teledu.

background reputational issues when compared with other destinations such as Scotland, the west country and Ireland. We therefore rely heavily upon successful campaigns to drive up awareness and increase visits to Wales. I am therefore pleased to report that Visit Wales's campaigns effectively cut through those of competing destinations in what is a very competitive marketplace.

In 2009, our campaign was the most recalled of all for UK destinations. This awareness translated into positive action, with 18 per cent of those who were aware of the campaign looking for further information via Visit Wales or directly from the trade.

Yesterday saw the launch of our new campaign, 'Proper Holidays'. The campaign's theme is built around the idea that we have a strong opinion about what makes a proper holiday; we know that our opinion is shared by our visitors, and we know that Wales can deliver holidays that are authentic, memorable and different. The campaign conveys the message that Wales is a place where people will want to work on their sense of adventure rather than work on their tan; that Wales is a place to explore, not a place to ignore from a Lilo, and that Wales stands for proper holidays.

The Proper Holidays campaign features real people having real experiences in Wales. It features two stars; Wales, of course, and the Darkes family from Huddersfield, who were genuinely disappointed by their last holiday abroad. The campaign follows the family holidaying in Wales, and comprises two 40-second television advertisements and an interactive section on the Visit Wales website leading to a 10-minute film.

In developing the campaign, the intention was to convey a real feeling of what a holiday in Wales is all about. It is a new style of advertising that offers something genuinely different from any other holiday campaign out there at the moment. It will stand out from the competition in a crowded

Mae enw Cymru fel cyrchfan yn dal yn llai adnabyddus na chyrchfannau eraill megis yr Alban, de-orllewin Lloegr ac Iwerddon. Felly, byddwn yn dibynnu llawer ar ymgyrchoedd llwyddiannus i godi ymwybyddiaeth a chynyddu'r nifer sy'n ymweld â Chymru. Felly, yr wyf yn falch o ddweud bod ymgyrchoedd Croeso Cymru wedi llwyddo i dorri drwy ymgyrchoedd cyrchfannau sy'n cystadlu â ni mewn marchnad sy'n gystadleuol iawn.

Yn 2009, ein hymgyrch ni oedd yr un yr oedd pobl yn ei chofio fwyaf o blith ymgyrchoedd holl gyrchfannau'r Deyrnas Unedig. Trodd yr ymwybyddiaeth hon yn gamau cadarnhaol, gydag 18 y cant o'r rhai a oedd yn ymwybodol o'r hymgyrch wedi ceisio rhagor o wybodaeth gan Groeso Cymru neu'n uniongyrchol gan y diwydiant.

Ddoe, lansiwyd ein hymgyrch newydd, 'Gwyliau Go Iawn'. Seilir thema'r hymgyrch ar y syniad bod gennym farn gref ynglŷn â beth yw hanfod gwyliau go iawn; gwyddom fod ein hymwelwyr o'r un farn â ni, a gwyddom y gall Cymru ddarparu gwyliau sy'n driw i'w chymeriad, sy'n gofiadwy ac sy'n wahanol. Mae'r hymgyrch yn cyfleu'r neges bod Cymru'n fan lle y bydd pobl am ganolbwytio ar eu hawydd am antur yn hytrach na chanolbwytio ar eu lliw haul; mai lle i'w archwilio yw Cymru, yn hytrach na lle i'w anwybyddu oddi ar Lilo, a bod Cymru'n cynnig gwyliau go iawn.

Mae'r hymgyrch Gwyliau Go Iawn yn dangos pobl go iawn yn cael profiadau go iawn yng Nghymru. Mae'n cynnwys dwy seren; Cymru, wrth gwrs, a theulu'r Darkes o Huddersfield, a oedd yn wirioneddol siomedig ar ôl eu gwyliau tramor diwethaf. Mae'r hymgyrch yn dilyn y teulu ar eu gwyliau yng Nghymru, ac mae'n cynnwys dwy hysbyseb deledu 40 eiliad o hyd ac adran ryngweithiol ar wefan Croeso Cymru sy'n arwain at ffilm 10 munud.

Wrth ddatblygu'r hymgyrch, y bwriad oedd cyfleu gwir ymdeimlad ynglŷn â hanfod gwyliau yng Nghymru. Mae'n fath newydd o hysbysebu sy'n cynnig rhywbeth gwirioneddol wahanol i unrhyw hymgyrch gwyliau arall sydd ar waith ar hyn o bryd. Bydd yn gwbl wahanol i'r gystadleuaeth

marketplace. As part of the campaign launch, a 36-page holiday supplement will appear in *The Times* on 22 May.

With reference to the Ryder Cup, Visit Wales has also developed a new television advertisement on golf to run over the crucial months leading up to the Ryder Cup in October. It builds on all the work that the Assembly Government and other partners have been involved in over the past 10 years in preparing for the Ryder Cup and in maximising the opportunities that the event will bring to Wales.

Golf tourism has increased year on year since 2005, with some 184,000 golfing visitors in 2009, contributing a total of £34.7 million to the Welsh economy. Last year again, in very tough economic conditions, golf tourism increased by no less than 18 per cent compared with 2008. The new advertisement, launched to the US golf media last week, again features real people: a golf group having true golfing experiences in Wales. I think that we will be able to see the advertisement, if the technology works.

*Dangoswyd DVD.  
A DVD was shown.*

That is the advert, and the more discerning among you will realise that it was shot at Nefyn and District Golf Club on the Llŷn peninsula, providing yet more evidence that the Ryder Cup, and the work put in place around it, is delivering benefits to the whole of Wales. Clubs like Nefyn, along with clubs such as the Royal St David's, Aberdovey and Conwy have all experienced significant growth in golf visitors. The advert will be screened at major golf events throughout the summer and at the Ryder Cup itself. It has been developed in a way that ensures that it can be used for promotional purposes after the Ryder Cup has left us.

Last year you may recall the major contribution that our marketing and major events teams played in making the Ashes test

mewn marchnad orlawn. Fel rhan o lansio'r ymgrych, bydd atodiad gwyliau 36 tudalen yn ymddangos yn *The Times* ar 22 Mai.

O ran Cwpan Ryder, mae Croeso Cymru hefyd wedi datblygu hysbyseb newydd am golff a ddangosir ar y teledu dros y misoedd hollbwysig sy'n arwain at Gwpan Ryder ym mis Hydref. Mae'n adeiladu ar yr holl waith y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a phartneriaid eraill wedi bod yn ymwneud ag ef dros y 10 mlynedd diwethaf wrth baratoi ar gyfer Cwpan Ryder er mwyn manteisio i'r eithaf ar y cyfleoedd a ddaw i Gymru yn sgîl y digwyddiad.

Mae twristiaeth golff wedi cynyddu o'r naill flwyddyn i'r llall ers 2005. Daeth tua 184,000 o ymwelwyr yma i chwarae golff yn 2009 gan gyfrannu cyfanswm o £34.7 miliwn at economi Cymru. Y llynedd, unwaith eto, a'r sefyllfa economaidd yn anodd, cynyddodd twristiaeth golff 18 y cant o'i chymharu â'r nifer yn 2008. Unwaith eto, mae'r hysbyseb newydd, a lansiwyd i gyfryngau golff yr Unol Daleithiau yr wythnos diwethaf, yn cynnwys pobl go iawn: grŵp o golffwyr yn cael profiadau go iawn wrth chwarae golff yng Nghymru. Credaf y gallwn weld yr hysbyseb, os yw'r dechnoleg yn gweithio.

Dyna'r hysbyseb, a bydd y rhai craffaf yn eich plith yn sylweddoli iddi gael ei gwneud yng Nghlwbb Golff Nefyn a'r Cylch ar benrhyn Llŷn, gan roi mwy o dystiolaeth eto fod Cwpan Ryder, a'r gwaith sydd wedi'i wneud yng nghyflwr hynny, yn dod â manteision i bob cwr o Gymru. Mae clybiau megis Nefyn, ynghyd â chlybiau megis y Royal St David's, Aberdyfi a Chonwy i gyd wedi gweld cynnydd sylweddol yn nifer yr ymwelwyr sy'n dod yno i chwarae golff. Caiff yr hysbyseb ei dangos mewn cystadlaethau golff o bwys drwy gydol yr haf ac yn ystod Cwpan Ryder ei hun. Mae'r ffordd y mae wedi'i datblygu'n sicrhau y gellir ei defnyddio at ddibenion hyrwyddo ar ôl i Gwpan Ryder ymadael â ni.

Y llynedd, efallai eich bod yn cofio'r cyfraniad mawr a wnaeth ein tîm marchnata a'n tîm digwyddiadau mawr o ran sicrhau

such a success for Cardiff and Wales. The Wales Says G'Dai campaign seemed to strike a chord with the media and cricket fans. [Laughter.] It is the way I tell them.

bod prawf y Lludw'n gymaint o lwyddiant i Gaerdydd ac i Gymru. Ymddengys fod ymgrych Wales Says G'Dai wedi taro deuddeg gyda'r cyfryngau a chyda chefnogwyr criced [Chwerthin.] Fi sy'n eu dweud nhw'n dda.

3.50 p.m.

Now, the Visit Wales team is developing branding and marketing ideas for the Ryder Cup. The Our First Ryder Cup campaign will ignite the passion of the Welsh people and help to create a real sense of occasion around the event. It will also show how the benefits of the Ryder Cup have impacted on many people in all parts of Wales. Visitors to the event will see humorous pieces of communication from Wales at many points on their journey. In the autumn of 2010, for our American guests, it will be a case of 'Wales Says Have a Nice Dai!'. [Laughter.] I do not write this stuff myself, as you probably realise.

Yn awr, mae tîm Croeso Cymru yn datblygu syniadau brandio a marchnata ar gyfer Cwpan Ryder. Bydd ymgrych Ein Cwpan Ryder Cyntaf yn tanio ysbryd pobl Cymru ac yn gymorth i greu gwir ymdeimlad o achlysur o gwmpas y digwyddiad. Bydd hefyd yn dangos sut y mae manteision Cwpan Ryder wedi effeithio ar gynifer o bobl ym mhob cwr o Gymru. Bydd pobl sy'n ymweld â'r digwyddiad yn gweld negeseuon doniol o Gymru droeon ar hyd eu taith. Yn hydref 2010, ar gyfer ein hymwelwyr o America, defnyddir yr ymadrodd 'Wales Says Have a Nice Dai!'. [Chwerthin.] Nid fi sy'n ysgrifennu'r deunydd hwn fy hun, fel y sylweddolwch mae'n siŵr.

Earlier this year we discussed how tourism is making an important contribution to Wales's economic, social and cultural wellbeing. Visit Wales's campaigns and major events, such as the Ashes and the Ryder Cup are helping to increase that contribution by building Wales's reputation, challenging stereotypes and encouraging people to think and talk positively about Wales.

Yn gynharach eleni, trafodwyd sut y mae twristiaeth yn gwneud cyfraniad pwysig at les economaidd, cymdeithasol a diwylliannol Cymru. Mae ymgyrchoedd Croeso Cymru a digwyddiadau mawr megis y Lludw a Chwpan Ryder o gymorth i gynyddu'r cyfraniad hwnnw drwy feithrin enw da Cymru, drwy herio stereoteipiau a thrwy annog pobl i feddwl a sôn yn bositif am Gymru.

**Nick Bourne:** I thank the Minister for his statement. Perhaps the first thing we should do is warn Rhod Gilbert that the Minister's sense of comic timing is such that he had better look to his laurels.

**Nick Bourne:** Diolch i'r Gweinidog am ei ddatganiad. Efallai mai'r peth cyntaf y dylem ei wneud yw rhybuddio Rhod Gilbert rhag amseru comig y Gweinidog a dweud wrtho am ymorol am ei enw.

The statement was important, and I pay tribute to those who work in this sector, promoting the unique character of Wales—our castles, beaches, hills and communities. You referred to the difficult economic circumstances of 2009, and while that is certainly true, the situation also presented opportunities to attract people to Wales, and to the United Kingdom generally, because of the fall in the value of the pound. Similarly, there was an opportunity to encourage people to holiday closer to home.

Yr oedd y datganiad yn bwysig, a rhoddaf deyrnged i'r rhai sy'n gweithio yn y sector hwn, yn hyrwyddo cymeriad unigryw Cymru—ein cestyll, ein traethau, ein bryniau a'n cymunedau. Cyfeiriasoch at amgylchiadau economaidd anodd 2009, ac er bod hynny'n sicr yn wir, yr oedd y sefyllfa hefyd yn gyfle i ddenu pobl i Gymru ac i'r Deyrnas Unedig yn gyffredinol, oherwydd bod gwerth y bunt wedi gostwng. Yn yr un modd, yr oedd cyfle i annog pobl i dreulio gwyliau yn nes adref.

You mentioned the impact of the Holidays Unpackaged campaign, with 53 per cent of people having a memory of it. You went on to talk about 18 per cent following up with inquiries. That is welcome, but I wonder if you have statistics about the number who actually came to Wales, and, if they did, what they felt about it—whether they would recommend it to their friends, come again and so on. The statistics that you gave were important, but I feel that we need to know a little more about the impact of that campaign.

The new visitor campaign that you talked about is something that we welcome. Again, if there is any way of following up on that, and undertaking a survey of the impact, that would be valuable. I look forward to seeing the Darkes family from Huddersfield on our screens, and I am sorry that we did not see them on the screens here in the Chamber. I am sure that it will be an effective campaign.

Coming to the Ryder Cup, which you mentioned separately—that is understandable—I have often raised the important opportunities that it provides to promote Wales. I am pleased that we are advertising it through the golf media—that is important—but I also hope that the advertising is going further than that. As with the hosting of FA Cup finals in Cardiff, along with Six Nations rugby and Test cricket matches, we should exploit this opportunity to encourage tourism into Wales, and not just from people who follow those sports. Clearly, there are much wider benefits, and I wonder if the Minister could say something about how he is hoping to advertise them—not just to the United States, although clearly the United States is important, but also to the rest of Europe, which has a share in this Ryder Cup tournament. We welcome the statement from the Minister, but I wonder if he could address some of those points.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** On the challenging circumstances of 2009, I should mention that it was a very successful year for attracting travel writers to Wales, which then generates

Soniasoch am effaith yr ymgrych Dadbachio Gwyliau, a bod 53 y cant o bobl yn ei chofio. Aethoch yn eich blaen i sôn am 18 y cant yn gwneud ymholiadau yn ei sgîl. Mae hynny i’w groesawu, ond tybed a oes gennych ystadegau ynglŷn â’r nifer a ddaeth i Gymru mewn gwirionedd, ac, os daethant yma, beth oedd eu barn—a fyddent yn ei hargymhell i’w ffrindiau, a fyddent yn dod yma eto ac yn y blaen? Yr oedd yr ystadegau a roesoch yn bwysig, ond teimlaf fod angen inni wybod ychydig yn rhagor am effaith yr ymgrych honno.

Mae’r ymgrych ymwelwyr newydd y soniasoch amdani’n rhywbeth yr ydym yn ei groesawu. Unwaith eto, os oes unrhyw ffordd o ddilyn trywydd honno, a chynnal arolwg i fesur ei heffaith, byddai hynny’n werthfawr. Edrychaf ymlaen at weld teulu’r Darkes o Huddersfield ar ein sgriniau, ac yr wyf yn gresynu na chawsom eu gweld ar y sgriniau yma yn y Siambra. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd honno’n ymgrych effeithiol.

A sôn am Gwpan Ryder, a grybwyllywyd gennych ar wahân—mae hynny’n ddealladwy—yr wyf wedi codi’n aml y cyfleoedd pwysig y mae’n eu cynnig i hyrwyddo Cymru. Yr wyf yn falch ein bod yn ei hysbysebu drwy’r cyfryngau golff—mae hynny’n bwysig—ond yr wyf yn gobeithio hefyd fod yr hysbysebu’n mynd ymhellach na hynny. Ynghyd â chynnal rownd derfynol Cwpan yr FA yng Nghaerdydd, rygbi’r Chwe Gwlad a gemau Prawf criced, dylem fanteisio ar y cyfle hwn i annog twristiaid i ddod i Gymru, ac nid pobl sy’n dilyn y chwaraeon hynny’n unig. Mae’n amlwg bod manteision ehangach o lawer, a thybed a allai’r Gweinidog ddweud rhywbeth ynglŷn â sut y mae’n gobeithio’u hysbysebu—nid dim ond i’r Unol Daleithiau, er bod yr Unol Daleithiau’n amlwg yn bwysig, ond hefyd i weddill Ewrop, sy’n rhan o dwrnamaint Cwpan Ryder? Yr ydym yn croesawu’r datganiad gan y Gweinidog, ond tybed a allai ymateb i rai o’r pwyntiau hynny?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** O ran amgylchiadau anodd 2009, dylwn ddweud ei bod yn flwyddyn lwyddiannus iawn o ran denu awduron teithio i Gymru. Mae hynny wedyn

promotional copy that is worth more than anything we could buy. Three hundred and eighty travel writers came to Wales in 2009, which is more than ever before, and it was estimated that their visit was worth £40 million in advertising value. I mentioned earlier that the Travel Media Association of Canada came here and met for the first time outside Canada, generating around £1.5 million of advertising in the Canadian media. I went to Orlando and met various groups, mainly to do with golf, and the prestigious *Guardian* and *Observer* travel awards will take place here in Wales in October this year, hosting around 100 travel industry guests.

I now turn to the figures that you asked for. The UK tourism survey for 2009 shows that tourism holiday trips to Wales from within the UK are up 6.4 per cent compared with 2008, and that stays of four nights or more rose by 16 per cent. There has also been an increase of more than 8 per cent on 2008 in tourism expenditure and overnight holiday trips to Wales. Therefore, there are some very positive figures from 2009.

With regard to the Ryder Cup, work is ongoing with the Department for the Economy and Transport and the marketing team to promote Wales beyond the golfing fraternity. The exact nature of those campaigns has yet to be finalised, but there is no doubt that I will bring them to the Chamber when they are finalised.

**Christine Chapman:** Thank you for the statement, Minister. I welcome that Wales's profile is growing as a tourist destination. There are a number of reasons for that; you have highlighted some of them, but there are others.

The media is one example; for instance, we can attribute the recent regeneration of *Doctor Who* as a cultural phenomenon to BBC Wales, with its Welsh producer and distinctive Welsh locations. Those sorts of things have helped our tourism industry. We must also recognise the popularity of *Gavin and Stacey* with its variety of Welsh

yn creu deunydd hyrwyddo sy'n werth mwy na dim y gallem ei brynu. Daeth 380 o awduron teithio i Gymru yn 2009, sy'n fwy nag erioed o'r blaen, ac amcangyfrifwyd bod eu hymweliad yn cyfateb i werth £40 miliwn o hysbysebu. Sonais yn gynharach fod Cymdeithas Cyfryngau Teithio Canada wedi dod yma a chyfarfod y tu allan i Canada am y tro cyntaf, gan gynhyrchu gwerth tua £1.5 miliwn o hysbysebu yng Nghymru Canada. Euthum i Orlando a chyfarfod ag amrywiol grwpiau, a'r rheini'n ymwneud yn bennaf â golff. Cynhelir gwobrau teithio o fri y *Guardian* a'r *Observer* yma yng Nghymru ym mis Hydref eleni, gan groesawu tua 100 o westeion o'r diwydiant teithio.

Trof yn awr at y ffigurau y gofynasoch amdanyst. Dengys arolwg twristiaeth y Deyrnas Unedig ar gyfer 2009 fod teithiau gwyliau gan dwristiaid i Gymru o'r tu mewn i'r Deyrnas Unedig wedi cynyddu 6.4 y cant o'u cymharu â'r nifer yn 2008, a bod cynnydd o 16 y cant wedi bod yn y nifer a oedd yn aros am bedair noson neu fwy. Gwelwyd cynnydd o fwy nag 8 y cant hefyd o ran gwariant gan dwristiaid a theithiau gwyliau dros nos i Gymru o'i gymharu â 2008. Felly, mae rhai o'r ffigurau ar gyfer 2009 yn gadarnhaol iawn.

O ran Cwpan Ryder, mae gwaith ar y gweill gyda'r Adran dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth a'r tîm marchnata i hyrwyddo Cymru y tu hwnt i'r frawdoliaeth golffio. Nid yw union natur yr ymgyrchoedd hynny wedi'i phenderfynu'n derfynol eto, ond yn sicr, deuaf â hwy gerbron y Siambr pan fyddant wedi'u cwblhau.

**Christine Chapman:** Diolch am y datganiad, Weinidog. Yr wyf yn croesawu gweld delwedd Cymru'n tyfu fel cyrchfan i dwristiaid. Mae nifer o resymau dros hynny; yr ydych wedi sôn am rai ohonynt, ond ceir rhesymau eraill.

Un enghraift yw'r cyfryngau; er enghraift, gallwn briodoli adfywio *Doctor Who* fel ffenomen ddiwylliannol yn ddiweddar i BBC Cymru, gyda'i chynhyrchydd yn Gymro a'i lleoliadau unigryw yng Nghymru. Mae'r mathau hynny o bethau wedi bod o gymorth i'n diwydiant twristiaeth. Rhaid inni gydnabod hefyd boblogrwydd *Gavin and*

characters, locations and references. Recent guests who visited me were keen to visit Barry on the back of their love of the programme, which we did. Many distinctive Welsh companies are successful in promoting their products, such as Penderyn distillery in my constituency. Therefore, Minister, do you agree that we can use these things to promote a distinctive Welsh message and brand identity?

However, there are certain issues that we need to resolve to better promote that identity. When I spoke in the debate on tourism in March, I noted certain areas where we could focus on improvements that would make the Welsh tourism industry more competitive. This will amount to little if we do not raise the profile of Wales. That is why I welcome the change in the focus of Visit Wales's marketing activities and the renewed attempts to, for example, encourage British and Irish visitors to holiday in Wales. Yet, we must also ensure that people from further afield think of Wales as a proper destination for a holiday. We must do our best to tap into the cultural aspects that I mentioned earlier and to promote our unique heritage and the enormous variety of activities that Wales offers, some of which you highlighted in your statement.

Too often, people from the wider world do not quite get Wales or understand what or where it is. There is still a little bit of a mystery about Wales and, quite often, people from abroad will talk about Scotland, Ireland and London, but will not know an awful lot about Wales. Therefore, there is a huge amount that we need to do. There are some good examples of other countries successfully promoting their suitability as tourist destinations, with clear and concise messages; I know that Scotland, for example, successfully promotes a particular Scottish message and identity that draws in large amounts of external visitors. If you look across Europe, you will see that Poland, for example, has been successful in tapping into external funding and becoming an increasingly attractive tourist destination.

*Stacey a'i hamrywiaeth o gymeriadau, lleoliadau a chyfeiriadau Cymreig. Yr oedd ymwelwyr a ddaeth i'm gweld yn ddiweddar yn awyddus i ymweld â'r Barri am eu bod yn hoff o'r rhaglen, a gwnaethom hynny. Mae llawer o gwmniau holol Gymreig yn llwyddo i hyrwyddo'u cynnrych, megis distyllfa Penderyn yn fy etholaeth. Felly, Weinidog, a gytunwch y gallwn ddefnyddio'r pethau hyn i hyrwyddo neges Gymreig a hunaniaeth brand unigryw i Gymru?*

Fodd bynnag, ceir rhai problemau y mae angen inni eu datrys er mwyn hyrwyddo'r hunaniaeth honno'n well. Pan siaredais yn y ddadl am dwristiaeth fis Mawrth, soniais am rai meysydd lle y gallem ganolbwytio ar welliannau a fyddai'n gwneud diwydiant twristiaeth Cymru'n fwy cystadleuol. Ychydig a gyflawnir oni allwn sicrhau delwedd fwy amlwg i Gymru. Dyna pam yr wyf yn croesawu'r newid ffocws yng ngweithgareddau marchnata Croeso Cymru a'r ymdrechion o'r newydd i annog ymwelwyr o Brydain ac Iwerddon i ddod i Gymru ar eu gwyliau, er enghraifft. Eto i gyd, rhaid inni sicrhau hefyd fod pobl o'r tu hwnt i'r gwledydd hyn yn gweld Cymru'n gyrchfan addas ar gyfer gwyliau. Rhaid inni wneud ein gorau i fanteisio ar yr agweddau diwylliannol a grybwyllais yn gynharach a hyrwyddo'n treftadaeth unigryw a'r amrywiaeth enfawr o weithgareddau y mae Cymru'n eu cynnig. Cyfeiriwyd at rai ohonynt yn eich datganiad.

Yn rhy aml, ni fydd Cymru'n taro tant i bobl yn y byd mawr y tu allan. Nid ydynt yn deall beth yw Cymru nag ymhle y mae. Mae Cymru yn dal yn dipyn o ddirgelwch i bobl, ac yn aml, bydd pobl o wledydd tramor yn sôn am yr Alban, Iwerddon a Llundain, heb wybod fawr ddim am Gymru. Felly, mae angen gwneud llawer iawn o waith. Ceir nifer o enghreiffiau da o wledydd eraill yn llwyddo i hyrwyddo'u hunain fel cyrchfannau addas i dwristiaid, gan gyfleo negeseuon clir a chryno; gwn fod yr Alban, er enghraifft, yn llwyddo i hyrwyddo'i neges a'i hunaniaeth benodol gan ddenu nifer fawr o ymwelwyr o'r tu allan. Os edrychwch ar draws Ewrop, gwelwch fod gwlad Pwyl, er enghraifft, wedi llwyddo i ddenu arian o'r tu allan a dod yn gyrchfan fwyfwy poblogaidd i dwristiaid.

Minister, will you look at these and other examples of best practice to allow us to promote the most attractive and distinctive image of Wales to best attract the tourists that we desperately need for our economy?

4.00 p.m.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I have no issue with your comments, and I would agree that any material—television programmes, films or whatever—that shows Wales to its best advantage will add to the brand image, if that is the right phrase. For example, the Wales Rally GB, which is coming to Wales again this year, is located in Cardiff bay and will include a race around the barrage, which will show positive images of Wales worldwide. I was at the official announcement this week that the Heineken European Rugby Cup final will be held in Wales in 2011. That, again, offers an opportunity similar to that of the Ashes. All these add up, hopefully, to an increased awareness of Wales. You are quite right about promoting Wales's cultural heritage. Cadw is hitting its stride now in putting on a very exciting and comprehensive range of events within and around the built heritage of Wales, in a way that it perhaps has not done in the past.

With regard to our international profile, we certainly have a long way to go before we can attain the reach that Scotland and Ireland have. There are cultural and political issues around that point. Wales is not represented politically on the international stage. That, in itself, means that we do not have access to some of the areas that other countries have. Scotland also has some very strong brand images that have been marketed worldwide for over a century. Wales is lacking in those strong brand images. However, all is not lost, and we must take advantage of anything and everything in order to promote Wales abroad and bring much-needed tourists into Wales.

Weinidog, a wnewch edrych ar y rhain ac ar enghreifftiau eraill o'r arferion gorau er mwyn inni hyrwyddo'r ddelwedd fwyaf deniadol ac unigryw o Gymru i ddenu'r twristiaid y mae gwir angen inni eu cael er lles ein heonomi?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Nid wyf yn anghytuno â'ch sylwadau, a byddwn yn cytuno bod unrhyw ddeunydd—rhaglenni teledu, ffilmiau neu beth bynnag y bo—sy'n dangos Cymru ar ei gorau yn ychwanegu at ddelwedd y brand, os mai dyna'r ymadrodd cywir. Er enghraift, mae Rali Cymru Prydain Fawr, sy'n dod i Gymru eto eleni, yn cael ei chynnal ym mae Caerdydd a bydd yn cynnwys ras o gwmpas y morglawdd, gan ddangos delweddau cadarnhaol o Gymru drwy'r byd i gyd. Yr oeddwn yn y cyhoeddiad swyddogol yr wythnos hon y cynhelir rownd derfynol Cwpan Rygbi Ewrop Heineken yng Nghymru yn 2011. Unwaith eto, mae hynny'n cynnig cyfle tebyg i'r hyn a gynigiwyd adeg gêm y Lladw. Gobeithio y bydd y rhain i gyd, gyda'i gilydd, yn codi'r ymwybyddiaeth o Gymru. Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle bod angen hyrwyddo treftadaeth ddiwylliannol Cymru. Mae Cadw yn cael ei draed dano erbyn hyn ac yn cynnal cyfres hynod gyffrous a chynhwysfawr o ddigwyddiadau o fewn ac o gwmpas treftadaeth adeiledig Cymru, mewn modd nad yw wedi gwneud yn y gorffennol efallai.

O ran ein delwedd ryngwladol, yn sicr mae gennym lawer i'w wneud cyn gallu cyrraedd y nifer y mae'r Alban ac Iwerddon yn eu cyrraedd. Mae problemau diwylliannol a gwleidyddol yn gysylltiedig â hynny. Nid oes gan Gymru gynrychiolaeth wleidyddol ar y llwyfan rhngwladol. Mae hynny, ynddo'i hun, yn golygu nad oes modd inni gyrraedd rhai o'r meysydd y mae gwledydd eraill yn gallu eu cyrraedd. Mae gan yr Alban hefyd nifer o ddelweddau brand cryf iawn sydd wedi cael eu marchnata drwy'r byd ers canrif a mwy. Nid oes gan Gymru ddelweddau brand cryf tebyg i'r rheini. Serch hynny, nid yw'r sefyllfa'n anobeithiol, a rhaid inni fanteisio ar unrhyw beth ac ar bopeth i hyrwyddo Cymru dramor a denu twristiaid y

mae arnom wir angen eu cael i Gymru.

**Mark Isherwood:** Watching your DVD reminded me of the occasion when my wife and I were courting. We left the Tŷ Coch Inn in Porthdinllaen late one evening and pitched our tent in the dark. My wife left the tent in the morning in a state of undress and found two golfers standing at an adjacent tee. [Laughter.] It has been one of my favourite tourist destinations for the whole of my life for all sorts of reasons.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There is no video of that, I trust. [Laughter.]

**Mark Isherwood:** I digress slightly. The tourist industry is vital to the economy of the UK, and the economy of Wales in particular. During recent discussions with the Flintshire Tourism Association, the association highlighted the fact that the majority of its bed space is in holiday caravan parks, and that caravan owners spend a huge amount of money in the local economy. I visited one holiday park yesterday, and was told that visitors to its site contribute £1 million every year to the local economy. How do you respond to the point that we need Visit Wales, in its marketing, to promote beds in holiday parks positively, and also to promote holiday parks as a tourist destination? I am told that 95 per cent of the bed space in north Wales, and 65 per cent of the bed space across Wales as a whole, is in caravans, but marketing tends to focus on the remaining 5 per cent. Will you also address a concern expressed to me by members of the north Wales tourism sector, namely that funding will go in the direction of Cardiff? Welsh Government figures suggest that 67 per cent of hospitality jobs are based in Cardiff, but 40 per cent of all visitors to Wales visit north Wales. To reinforce this point, I am told that attractions across north Wales last year were only at 30 per cent capacity, and hotels were at approximately 50 per cent. Even the best hotels were only at 65 per cent, which is below the national average. My final question relates to the borderlands strategy. I am told that Flintshire and the northeast counties of Wales, for example, are within the reach of 15.5 million potential visitors from northwest England and the midlands. That is an

**Mark Isherwood:** Wrth wyllo’ch DVD, cefais fy atgoffa o’r achlysur pan oedd fy ngwraig a minnau’n canlyn. Gadawsom dafarn y Tŷ Coch ym Mhorthdinllaen yn hwyr un noson a gosod ein pabell yn y twyllwch. Gadawodd fy ngwraig y babell yn y bore heb wisgo amdani’n iawn a chael bod dau chwaraewr golff yn sefyll wrth y ti gerllaw. [Chwerthin.] Dyna un o’m hoff gyrchfannau gwyliau erioed, am bob math o resymau.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Hyderaf nad oes fideo o hynny. [Chwerthin.]

**Mark Isherwood:** Yr wyf yn crwydro braidd. Mae’r diwydiant twristiaeth yn hollbwysig i economi'r Deyrnas Unedig, ac i economi Cymru yn benodol. Yn ystod trafodaethau'n diweddar gyda Chymdeithas Twristiaeth Sir y Fflint, dywedodd y gymdeithas mai mewn meysydd carafannau y mae mwyafrif y gwelyau sydd ar gael ganddi a bod perchenogion carafannau'n gwario arian mawr yn yr economi leol. Ymwelais ag un maes gwyliau o'r fath ddoe a dywedwyd wrthyf fod ymwelwyr â'i safle'n cyfrannu miliwn o bunnau bob blwyddyn i'r economi leol. Sut y byddech yn ymateb i'r pwynt bod angen i Croeso Cymru, wrth iddo farchnata, hyrwyddo'n gadarnhaol welyau mewn meysydd gwyliau, a hefyd hyrwyddo meysydd gwyliau'n gyrchfan i dwristiaid? Dywedir wrthyf mai mewn carafannau y mae 95 y cant o'r gwyliau sydd ar gael yn y gogledd a 65 y cant o'r gwelyau yng Nghymru drwyddi draw. Eto i gyd, mae'r marchnata'n tueddu i ganolbwytio ar y 5 y cant sy'n weddill. A wnewch ymateb hefyd i sylw a gefais gan aelodau sector twristiaeth y gogledd, sef eu bod yn poeni y bydd yr arian yn mynd i gyfeiriad Caerdydd? Mae ffigurau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn awgrymu mai yng Nghaerdydd y mae 67 y cant o swyddi'r diwydiant croeso er bod 40 y cant o'r holl ymwelwyr â Chymru'n ymweld â'r gogledd. I atgyfnnerthu'r pwynt hwn, dywedir wrthyf nad oedd atyniadau'r gogledd y llynedd ond yn 30 y cant yn llawn, ac nad oedd y gwestai ond yn 50 y cant yn llawn. Dim ond 65 y cant o'r lleoedd a oedd yn llawn hyd yn oed yn y gwestai gorau, ac mae hynny'n is na'r cyfartaledd cenedlaethol. Mae a wnelo fy

even greater reach than that of Cardiff and this part of Wales. How will you ensure that that is recognised in marketing in that region? Finally, how do you respond to the sector's response to Visit Wales that north Wales should be split into two or three distinct and separate marketing areas?

nghwestiwn olaf â'r strategaeth ar gyfer ardal y ffin. Dywedir wrthyf fod sir y Fflint a siroedd gogledd-ddwyrain Cymru, er enghraifft, o fewn cyrraedd 15.5 miliwn o ddarpar ymwelwyr o oglledd-orllewin a chanolbarth Lloegr. Mae hynny'n golygu eu bod o fewn cyrraedd mwy o bobl hyd yn oed nag y mae Caerdydd a'r rhan hon o Gymru. Sut y sicrhewch fod hynny'n cael ei gydnabod wrth farchnata yn y rhanbarth hwnnw? Yn olaf, sut y byddech yn ymateb i'r ymateb a gyflwynwyd gan y sector i Croeso Cymru y dylid rhannu gogledd Cymru yn ddwy neu'n dair ardal farchnata unigryw ar wahân?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you, Mark. I will not comment on your experiences after leaving the Tŷ Coch Inn; perhaps you should have left a few hours earlier. [Laughter.] With regard to promoting holiday parks, to be fair, I doubt whether a marketing campaign inviting people to come to sleep in caravans would stand out from the crowd. However, I will be visiting some caravan parks in north Wales that have been upgraded and that are of first-class quality. There is nothing wrong with that sort of holiday, but, in promoting Wales, I think that we should be concentrating on the varied and various activities available to families when they come to Wales. That is precisely what the current advertising campaign does. It is saying that, yes, you should come to stay wherever you want to stay in Wales, but that there are lots of things for you to do. I think that that is the right and proper approach.

You asked about the north-east and the borderlands. Again, we have to be careful here in promoting Wales. If we split Wales into different parts and say that we will promote them all, we will be promoting none of them effectively. The current campaign does not concentrate on narrow geographical areas. It simply shows what can be done in various parts of Wales. However, you certainly have a point about the north-east, and that is why I have set up a group to look at the north-east to see how we can best maximise its impact, because, very often, it is an overlooked part of Wales for some reason or other. However, the fact that Pontcysyllte aqueduct is now a world heritage site gives us

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch, Mark. Ni ddywedaf ddim am eich profiadau ar ôl ichi adael y Tŷ Coch; efallai y dylech fod wedi gadael rai oriau ynghynt. [Chwerthin.] O ran hyrwyddo meysydd gwyliau, a bod yn deg, yr wyf yn amau a fyddai ymgyrch farchnata'n gwahodd pobl i ddod i gysgu mewn carafannau'n denu sylw ymhliith ymgyrchoedd eraill. Fodd bynnag, byddaf yn ymweld â rhai meysydd carafannau yn y gogledd sydd wedi'u huwchraddio ac sydd o'r radd flaenaf. Nid oes dim o'i le ar y math hwnnw o wyliau, ond, o ran hyrwyddo Cymru, credaf y dylem fod yn canolbwytio ar y gweithgareddau amrywiol a niferus sydd ar gael i deuluoedd pan ddônt i Gymru. Dyna'n union y mae'r ymgyrch hysbysebu bresennol yn ei wneud. Mae'n dweud, dylech, dylech ddod i aros ym mha le bynnag y dymunwch aros ynddo yng Nghymru, ond bod yma lu o weithgareddau ichi. Credaf mai dyna'r ffordd iawn a phriodol o fynd ati.

Holasoch am y gogledd-ddwyrain ac ardal y ffin. Unwaith eto, rhaid inni fod yn ofalus yn hyn o beth wrth hyrwyddo Cymru. Os rhannwn Gymru'n wahanol rannau a dweud y byddwn yn eu hyrwyddo i gyd, ni fyddwn yn hyrwyddo'r un ohonynt yn effeithiol. Nid yw'r ymgyrch bresennol yn canolbwytio ar ardaloedd daearyddol cyfyng. Yr hyn y mae'n ei wneud yw dangos yr hyn y gellir ei wneud mewn gwahanol rannau o Gymru. Fodd bynnag, yn sicr, mae gennych bwynt ynglŷn â'r gogledd-ddwyrain a dyna pam yr wyf wedi sefydlu grŵp i edrych ar y gogledd-ddwyrain i weld sut y gallwn sicrhau'r effaith fwyaf, oherwydd yn aml iawn, am ryw reswm neu'i gilydd, mae'n rhan o Gymru

a focal point, and we should be working around that. We should not concentrate exclusively on the site itself, but we should link it to other parts of the north-east in order to give it a greater impact.

sy'n cael ei hanwybyddu. Serch hynny, mae'r ffaith bod pont ddŵr Pontcysyllte bellach yn un o safleoedd treftadaeth y byd yn rhoi rhywbeth inni ganolbwytio arno, a dylem fod yn gweithio o gwmpas hynny. Ni ddylem ganolbwytio ar y safle ei hun ar draul popeth arall, ond dylem ei gysylltu â rhannau eraill o'r gogledd-ddwyrain er mwyn sicrhau ei fod yn cael mwy o effaith.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch am y datganiad heddiw. Credaf mai ymgyrch farchnata ddiweddaraf Croeso Cymru yw'r mwyaf effeithiol a'r gorau gan y Llywodraeth ers peth amser. Mae'n mynd yn ddyfnach na'r un ymgyrch flaenorol i ddatguddio'r hyn sydd gan Gymru i'w gynnig fel gwlad. Mae'n adeiladu ar thema lwyddiannus ymgyrch hysbysebion Big Country a gynhaliwyd rai blynnyddoedd yn ôl, a ddangosodd apêl Cymru i'w llawn botensial. Mae'n bwysig bod teulu o Loegr wedi cael ei ddefnyddio i ddangos y wlad drwy eu llygaid hwy. Lloegr, wedi'r cyfan, yw'n marchnad dwristiaeth fwyaf o hyd, ac mae'n rhaid inni hybu Cymru yno mewn ffordd atyniadol. Mae'r ymgyrch hon wedi llwyddo i wneud hynny. Hefyd, credaf taw'r ymgyrch farchnata fwyaf integredig a welais yw hon, ac yr wyf yn annog pawb i weld y wefan a gwylion'r ymgyrch hon. Mae'r fideos byr a'r dolenni i'r atyniadau y mae'r teulu yn ymweld â hwy, yn ogystal â'r dolenni i gyfryngau cymdeithasol, y tu hwnt o effeithiol.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Thank you for today's statement. I believe that the latest marketing campaign by Visit Wales is the most effective and the best campaign to have come from the Government in a long time. It goes much deeper than any previous campaign to reveal what Wales has to offer as a nation. It builds on the very successful theme of the Big Country advertising campaign of some years ago, which demonstrated the appeal of Wales to its full potential. It was important to use a family from England to demonstrate what Wales has to offer through their eyes. After all, England remains our biggest tourism market, and we must promote Wales there in a way that is attractive to visitors. This campaign has succeeded in doing that. I also believe that this is the most integrated marketing campaign that I have seen to date. I would encourage everyone to visit the website and to look into the campaign. The short videos, the maps and the links to the attractions that the family visits, as well as the links to social media sites, are very effective indeed.

Mae gennyf rai cwestiynau i orffen. A all busnesau twristiaeth eraill ymuno â'r ymgyrch newydd hon? A fydd rhaglen barhaol i'w diweddu a chynnwys atyniadau newydd, megis lletyau a bwytau newydd sy'n agor yng Nghymru? Hefyd, a oes mein prawf ar gyfer busnesau sydd am ymuno â'r ymgyrch? Er enghraift, a oes rhaid wrth seren i fwty allu bod ar y wefan newydd hon neu fod yn rhan o'r cynllun newydd? A fydd yr ymgyrch yn dod i ardaloedd de Cymru, fel y gofynnodd Christine Chapman yn gynharach, fel y gallwn gynnwys wisgi Penderyn ar y wefan, er enghraift?

To conclude, I have a few questions. Could other tourism businesses join in this new campaign? Will it be a continuous programme that will be updated to include new attractions, such as new hotels or restaurants that open in Wales? Are there criteria for businesses that want to join the campaign? For example, do restaurants have to have a star rating so that they can appear on the new website or be part of the new scheme? Will this campaign come to south Wales areas, as Christine Chapman asked earlier, so that we could include Penderyn whisky on the website, for example?

4.10 p.m.

Er bod llawer o atyniadau gwych yn y gogledd, credaf fod de Cymru yn gyfartal o

Despite the many wonderful attractions in the north, I believe that south Wales is its equal

ran yr hyn a all ddenu pobl i Gymru a gall ddarparu profiadau gwahanol. Dengys hyn mor fawr, o ran atyniadau, y mae Cymru fel gwlad er ei bod hi'n fach. Diolch eto am y datblygiad. Byddwn yn ennyn pawb i ddefnyddio hyn fel rhan o'u gwaith fel Aelodau Cynulliad.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich gwerthfawrogiad a'r ffaith eich bod eisoes wedi gweld y deunydd hwn ar y we. Apêl i deuluoedd yw hon. Bu'n feirniadaeth yn y gorffennol nad ydym yn ceisio apelio at deuluoedd cyfan.

Nid yw'r ymgyrch yn ddaearyddol benodol. Bydd rhai ohonoch sydd yn adnabod Cymru yn gwybod ble y mae rhai o'r atyniadau hyn. Mae rhai sydd yn yr hysbyseb yn ardal Bannau Brycheiniog, ac mae amryw ohonynt yn y gogledd neu'r canolbarth. Serch hynny, nid yw'n ymdrech i ddweud, 'Dewch i'r fan hon yn benodol', yn hytrach, 'Dewch i wneud y pethau hyn yng Nghymru'.

Bydd yn rhaid imi roi ateb ysgrifenedig i'ch cwestiwn cyntaf o ran pa mor hawdd ydyw i fusnesau ymuno â'r ymgyrch. Fel y dywedais, nid yw'r ymgyrch hwn yn ddaearyddol benodol. Felly, gobeithiwn y bydd yn llwyddo i ennyn diddordeb ymhlið pobl i ddod i fwynhau'r atyniadau amrywiol iawn sydd ym mhob rhan o Gymru, o'r de-orllewin i Fannau Brycheiniog ac, yn gynyddol, yng Nghymroedd y de, a hefyd yn y canolbarth a'r gogledd.

**Eleanor Burnham:** It was fascinating to watch the video of the Darkes family from Huddersfield. I am sure that they had a wonderful time. I do not know how many people would be over the moon about yurts, but I am sure that our Minister understands the benefits that they offer for holidaying. I am sure that he will share that with us in a minute.

There are many wonderful things going on in the tourist industry. We obviously have a very diligent group of people working in Visit Wales. My concern is about how you assess the success of a campaign, other than, I suppose, by how many people come here. Are there sufficient questionnaires done on people's expectations prior to the holiday and

with regard to what attracts people to Wales and it can offer different experiences. This demonstrates just how large Wales is in relation to attractions, despite being a small country. Thank you again for the development. I would encourage everyone to use this in their work as Assembly Members.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I am grateful for your appreciation and the fact that you have already seen this material on the web. This is an appeal to families. The criticism has been laid in the past that we are not trying to appeal to whole families

The campaign is not geographically specific. Some of you who know Wales will know where some of these attractions are. Some of those included in the advert are in the Brecon Beacons, and several of them are in the north or mid Wales. Nevertheless, there has been no attempt to say, 'Come to this place in particular', but rather, 'Come and do these things in Wales'.

I will have to answer your first question on how easy it is for businesses to join the campaign in writing. As I said, this campaign is not geographically specific. I therefore hope that it will succeed in sparking an interest in people to come to enjoy the varied attractions that can be found in all parts of Wales, from the south-west to the Brecon Beacons and, increasingly, in the south Wales Valleys, as well as those in mid Wales and the north.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yr oedd yn hynod ddifyr gwylio'r fideo o deulu'r Darkes o Huddersfield. Yr wyf yn siŵr iddynt gael amser wrth eu bodd. Ni wn faint o bobl a fyddai'n gwirioni ar iwrtau, ond yr wyf yn siŵr bod ein Gweinidog yn deall y manteision y maent yn eu cynnig ar gyfer gwyliau. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yn sôn wrthym am hynny mewn munud.

Mae llu o bethau rhagorol ar waith yn y diwydiant twristiaeth. Mae'n amlwg bod gennym grŵp gweithgar iawn o bobl yn gweithio yn Croeso Cymru. Yr hyn sy'n fy mhoeni i yw sut y mae pwysa a mesur llwyddiant ymgyrch, ac eithrio, am wn i, yn ôl faint o bobl sy'n dod yma. A oes digon o holiaduron yn cael eu llenwi ynglŷn â

whether those have been met?

There are many first impressions of Wales. One first impression that I do not wish visitors to have, as I have mentioned many times, is of the dire state of public transport. If visitors have one bad experience of that, that will be it, and they will go away from Wales. I am concerned that you should work with the Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport to try to improve matters. What discussions have you had with him about the benefits of having Deutsche Bahn coming to take over the lacklustre Arriva Trains company? Hopefully, that will improve the first impressions that people have when they come here by train. Many people do visit Wales by train. They come from Manchester to visit the coast and so on. Therefore, I would be very interested to hear your thoughts on that matter.

Many companies that run tourist activities are very small concerns and could be termed small and medium-sized enterprises. What discussions are you having with organisations such as the Federation of Small Businesses and, in relation to north Wales, North Wales Tourism, to discover what their concerns are? There are many issues about whether they can get enough money from the banks to support themselves. That is a huge concern. How are you addressing that, and what are your thoughts on that matter?

I understand that the advertising will only cover areas that are a two-hour drive from Wales. Perhaps I am wrong about that, but it is my understanding that it will not apply to a bigger area. Can you explain why that is the case? Also, is this promotion available globally, and, if so, are you convinced that this is the best type of marketing to promote Wales globally?

We have a huge potential in food that is of wonderful quality. I went to Lake Vyrnwy when the children were home at Easter; we had the most fantastic day, and we had a wonderful meal. Unfortunately, most of the people who were serving us were from elsewhere. Are we doing enough, through the

disgwyliadau pobl cyn iddynt ddod ar eu gwyliau ac ynglŷn ag a wireddwyd y rheini?

Bydd yr argraff gyntaf a gaiff pobl o Gymru'n amrywio. Un argraff gyntaf nad wyf am i ymwelwyr ei chael, fel yr wyf wedi dweud droeon, yw o gyflwr trychinebus trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus. Un profiad gwael o hynny a dyna ddiwedd arni i ymwelwyr. Byddant yn ymadael â Chymru. Yr wyf yn awyddus i'ch gweld yn gweithio gyda'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth i geisio gwella pethau. Pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi'u cael gydag ef ynglŷn â manteision bod Deutsche Bahn yn dod i brynu cwmni di-fflach Trenau Arriva? Gobeithio y bydd hynny'n gwella'r argraffiadau cyntaf a gaiff pobl wrth iddynt ddod yma ar drêñ. Mae llawer o bobl yn ymweld â Chymru ar drêñ. Maent yn dod o Fanceinion i ymweld â'r arfordir ac yn y blaen. Felly, byddai'n dda iawn gennyl glywed eich barn am hynny.

Cwmniau bach iawn yw llawer o'r rhai sy'n cynnal gweithgareddau i dwristiaid a gellid eu galw'n fentrau bach a chanolig. Pa drafodaethau yr ydych yn eu cael gyda sefydliadau bach megis y Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach, ac, yng nghyswllt y gogledd, gyda Thwristiaeth Gogledd Cymru, i gael gwybod beth sy'n eu poeni? Mae ganddynt lawer o broblemau ynglŷn ag a allant gael digon o arian gan y banciau i'w cynnal eu hunain. Mae hynny'n destun pryder enfawr. Sut yr ydych yn mynd i'r afael â hynny, a beth yw eich barn yn ei gylch?

Caf ar ddeall na fydd yr hysbysebu ond yn cynnwys ardaloedd sydd o fewn dwy awr o daith car i Gymru. Efallai nad wyf yn iawn ynglŷn â hynny, ond yn ôl a ddeallaf, ni fydd yn berthnasol i ardal ehangu. A allwch esbonio pam? Hefyd, a yw'r hyrwyddiad hwn ar gael yn fyd-eang, ac, os ydyw, a ydych yn argyhoedddegig mai dyma'r math gorau o farchnata i hyrwyddo Cymru drwy'r byd?

Mae gennym fwyd o ansawdd rhagorol ac mae hynny'n cynnig posibiliadau mawr. Euthum i Lyn Efyrnwy pan oedd y plant gartref adeg y Pasg; cawsom y diwrnod rhyfeddol, a chael pryd o fwyd rhagorol. Yn anffodus, yr oedd y rhan fwyaf o'r bobl a oedd yn gweini arnom yn dod o fannau eraill.

wonderful colleges that we have—Coleg Llandrillo Cymru in north Wales comes to mind—to ensure that we have a sufficient number of youngsters to take up these jobs and add value by speaking Welsh and knowing what is going on locally? There were lovely young people there, one of them from Romania—in fact, my daughter spoke Romanian with them. That is wonderful, but there are concerns about whether there are enough local people in such jobs, who could perhaps speak Welsh to people and help them to enjoy the benefits of being in Wales even more. I wonder whether you could answer some of those questions. I can keep some for another time, because I see that my time is nearly up, which is rather sad, as I have quite a lot of other questions to ask. I will leave it at that for now.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** On the issue of assessing campaigns, we regularly assess all our campaigns. I gave some figures for the 2009 campaign, which showed that 53 per cent of respondents recalled seeing a television campaign. There are many checks and balances to ensure that the campaigns reach the people they are meant to reach, and to assess their response to them. I referred to the figures for the 2009 season in my presentation and in my answer to Nick Bourne.

As for whether we are in touch with small businesses, we are in regular contact with the Wales Tourism Alliance, and my new tourist advisory panel also represents crucial areas, geographically and in respect of trade. Specific areas are targeted quite deliberately as they are within travelling distance of Wales. You must spend your money where it will have the greatest impact. The campaigns are also available on the web, and are therefore available throughout the world. That is how we reach audiences in Europe, America, Australia and New Zealand, where we are concentrating our efforts. We cannot pretend that we can have campaigns all over the world, because we simply do not have the necessary resources.

You referred to the importance of local food

A ydym yn gwneud digon, drwy'r colegau rhagorol sydd gennym—mae rhywun yn meddwl am Goleg Llandrillo Cymru yn y gogledd—i sicrhau bod gennym nifer ddigonol o bobl ifanc i wneud y swyddi hyn ac ychwanegu gwerth drwy siarad Cymraeg a gwybod beth sy'n digwydd yn lleol? Yr oedd pobl ifanc hyfryd yno, un ohonynt o Romania—a dweud y gwir, bu fy merch yn siarad Romaneg â hwy. Mae hynny'n wych, ond mae'n destun pryder a oes digon o bobl leol mewn swyddi o'r fath, a allai effalai siarad Cymraeg â phobl a'u cynorthwyo i gael mwy byth o flas ar dreulio amser yng Nghymru. Tybed a allech ateb rhai o'r cwestiynau hynny? Gallaf gadw rhai tan rywbryd eto, oherwydd gwelaf fod fy amser bron ar ben. Mae hynny'n bechod braidd, gan fod gennyl sawl cwestiwn arall i'w ofyn. Fe'i gadawaf ar hynny ar hyn o bryd.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** O ran pwysa a mesur ymgyrchoedd, byddwn yn gwneud hynny gyda'n hymgyrchoedd i gyd. Rhoddais rai ffigurau ar gyfer ymgyrch 2009 a oedd yn dangos bod 53 y cant o'r ymatebwyr yn cofio gweld ymgyrch ar y teledu. Mae sawl ffordd o sicrhau bod yr ymgyrchoedd yn cyrraedd y bobl y bwriedir iddynt eu cyrraedd, ac o bwysa a mesur eu hymateb iddynt. Cyfeiriais at ffigurau tymor 2009 yn fy nghyflwyniad ac yn fy ateb i Nick Bourne.

O ran a ydym mewn cysylltiad â busnesau bach, byddwn yn cysylltu'n rheolaidd â Chynghrair Twristiaeth Cymru, ac mae fy mhanel cynghori newydd ar dwristiaeth hefyd yn cynrychioli meysydd hollbwysig, o safbwyt daearyddol ac o safbwyt gwahanol feysydd y diwydiant. Targedir ardaloedd penodol yn gwbl fwriadol am eu bod o fewn pellter teithio i Gymru. Rhaid ichi wario'ch arian yn y fan lle y caiff yr effaith fwyaf. Mae'r ymgyrchoedd ar gael ar y we hefyd ac felly, maent ar gael drwy'r byd. Dyna sut y byddwn yn cyrraedd cynulleidfaedd yn Ewrop, yn America, yn Awstralia ac yn Seland Newydd, lle yr ydym yn canolbwytio'n hymdreichion. Ni allwn honni y gallwn gynnal ymgyrchoedd drwy'r byd i gyd, oherwydd nid yw'r adnoddau angenrheidiol gennym i wneud hynny.

Cyfeiriasoch at bwysigrwydd bwyd lleol fel

as part of the attraction of Wales, and that is highlighted in all sorts of brochures and campaigns. It was heavily trailed in last year's campaign, and we know about the excellent work that goes on at Llandrillo in training chefs and others in the hospitality trade. I hope that I have answered some of your questions.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** I thank the Minister for his statement. I believe that the statement breaks down neatly into two aspects. The first is that of local tourism, involving people from the British isles, together with adventure-type tourism, which I wholly commend, given the geographical beauty and challenges that Wales has to offer. He also spent some time talking about certain flagship events. He touched on the Heineken Cup, which will be coming to Cardiff next year. I vividly remember the last Heineken Cup final held here—who can forget the final between Munster and Toulouse, with the sea of red that they brought to the city, not to mention the joy, and the money?

There is also the Ryder Cup and the issue of reaching out further, across the Atlantic to North America. Cardiff Wales airport is in my region, and it needs to establish routes. Competition between airports means that it is the norm for development corporations or bodies to offer route prioritisation grants to airports in the areas they cover. What discussions is the Minister having with the Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport about supporting Cardiff Wales airport to secure route prioritisation support to attract major carriers from North America and mainland Europe? One of the first things that people look for when they see promotional campaigns is a means to arrive at the host destination, and they build the holiday around that. Often, if you can receive tourists into the country, they may stay for the duration of their holiday. Do you believe, as I do, that it is critical that the Welsh Assembly Government is able to offer a level playing field for Cardiff airport to have new, substantial routes that could bring tourists from Europe and North America? Could you update us on the progress of those discussions because, as you know, I have raised this with you on several occasions?

rhan o ddenu pobl i Gymru, a thynnir sylw at hynny ym mhob math o lyfrynnau ac ymgyrchoedd. Rhoddyd sylw mawr iddo yn yr ymgyrch y llynedd, a gwn am y gwaith rhagorol sy'n cael ei wneud yn Llandrillo o ran hyfforddi cogyddion ac eraill yn y diwydiant llety a chroeso. Yr wyf yn gobeithio imi ateb rhai o'ch cwestiynau.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Diolch i'r Gweinidog am ei ddatganiad. Credaf fod y datganiad yn ymrannu'n dwt yn ddwy agwedd. Y gyntaf yw twristiaeth leol, sef pobl o ynysoedd Prydain, ynghyd â thwristiaeth anturus, ac yr wyf yn cymeradwyo hynny'n llwyr, o gofio harddwch daearyddiaeth Cymru a'r heriau sydd ganddi i'w cynnig. Treuliodd dipyn o amser hefyd yn sôn am ddigwyddiadau o fri. Crybwylodd Gwpan Heineken a fydd yn dod i Gaerdydd y flwyddyn nesaf. Mae gennys gof byw am y tro diwethaf y cynhaliwyd rownd derfynol Cwpan Heineken yma—pwys a all anghofio'r rownd derfynol rhwng Munster a Toulouse, a'r môr o goch a ddaeth i'r ddinas yn ei sgîl, heb sôn am y llawenydd, a'r arian?

Mae gennym Gwpan Ryder hefyd a'r angen i estyn ymhellach, ar draws yr Iwerydd i Ogledd America. Mae maes awyr Cymru Caerdydd yn fy rhanbarth, ac mae angen iddo sefydlu llwybrau. Oherwydd y gystadleuaeth rhwng meysydd awyr, yr arfer yw bod corfforaethau neu gyrrff datblygu'n cynnig grantiau blaenoriaethu llwybrau i feysydd awyr yn yr ardaloedd y maent yn eu gwasanaethu. Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cael gyda'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth ynglŷn â chynorthwyo maes awyr Cymru Caerdydd i sicrhau cymorth i flaenoriaethu llwybrau er mwyn denu cludwyr mawr o Ogledd America a thir mawr Ewrop? Un o'r pethau cyntaf y bydd pobl yn chwilio amdano wrth weld ymgyrchoedd hyrwyddo yw sut y mae cyrraedd y gyrchfan honno, a byddant yn trefnu'r gwyliau ar sail hynny. Yn aml, os gallwch dderbyn twristiaid i'r wlad, mae'n bosibl y byddant yn treulio'r gwyliau i gyd yno. A gredwch, fel y credaf fi, ei bod yn hanfodol i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad allu cynnig yr un amodau i faes awyr Caerdydd er mwyn iddo gael llwybrau sylweddol newydd a allai ddenu twristiaid o Ewrop ac o Ogledd America? A allech roi'r

wybodaeth ddiweddaraf inni am y cynnydd gyda'r trafodaethau hynny, oherwydd, fel y gwyddoch, yr wyf wedi codi hyn gyda chi droeon?

4.20 p.m.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I agree that the lack of an international route from Europe and North America to Cardiff airport is a weakness in attracting visitors to Wales. There is no point denying that. I have had discussions with the Deputy First Minister on this issue and I know that he has been in direct contact with the authorities at the airport. The good news, although it does not exactly address your concerns, is that the Ryder Cup team will fly direct to Cardiff airport, which is symbolically important for Wales. Furthermore, Aer Lingus is now providing direct ticketing from America to Cardiff via Dublin. That is not a direct flight, but at least it is a start. It is also the start of something that we need to work on to ensure that, when we have campaigns in other European countries in particular and in America, people can fly direct to this country, because that is certainly one of our weaknesses in attracting overseas visitors at the moment.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Cytunaf fod diffyg llwybr rhwngwladol o Ewrop ac o Ogledd America i faes awyr Caerdydd yn wendid o ran denu ymwelwyr i Gymru. Nid oes diben gwadu hynny. Yr wyf wedi trafod hyn gyda'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a gwn ei fod wedi bod yn trafod hyn yn uniongyrchol gyda'r awdurdodau yn y maes awyr. Y newydd da, er nad yw hynny'n mynd i'r afael yn union â'ch pryderon, yw y bydd tîm Cwpan Ryder yn hedfan yn uniongyrchol i faes awyr Caerdydd, ac mae hynny'n bwysig i Gymru o safbwyt symbolaidd. Hefyd, mae Aer Lingus yn awr yn darparu tocynnau uniongyrchol o America i Gaerdydd drwy Ddulyn. Nid yw'r awyren yn hedfan yma'n uniongyrchol, ond o leiaf mae'n fan cychwyn. Mae hefyd yn fan cychwyn i rywbeith y mae angen inni weithio arno er mwyn sicrhau bod pobl yn gallu hedfan yma'n uniongyrchol pan fyddwn yn cynnal ymgyrchoedd mewn gwledydd eraill, yn Ewrop yn benodol ac yn America, oherwydd yn sicr, dyna un o'n gwendidau o ran denu ymwelwyr tramor ar hyn o bryd.

**Darren Millar:** Thank you for your statement, Minister; it was well received by me. However, I am a little concerned to note that seaside tourism was not mentioned. We have a number of excellent seaside resorts along the north Wales coast, including Colwyn Bay in my own constituency, many of which are now the focus of regeneration efforts by the Assembly Government. I am thinking of Colwyn Bay and Rhyl, and there is Barry, too, which has been mentioned in questions to you.

What sort of marketing strategy will you plan for seaside resorts in Wales over the next few years? I appreciate that we want to go for high-end and high-value tourism, which is absolutely right and proper, but the 'kiss-me-quick', traditional, British sort of tourism that has thrived in Wales in the past is still around and it is still vibrant; it is vibrant in places like my constituency and we need to embrace

**Darren Millar:** Diolch i chi am eich datganiad, Weinidog, yr oeddwn yn falch o'i glywed. Serch hynny, yr wyf yn poeni braidd na soniwyd am dwristiaeth glan y môr. Mae gennym nifer o drefi glan y môr rhagorol ar hyd arfordir y gogledd, gan gynnwys Bae Colwyn yn fy etholaeth i. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wrthi'n canolbwytio yn awr ar ymdrechion i adfywio llawer ohonynt. Yr wyf yn meddwl am Fae Colwyn a'r Rhyl, ac mae'r Barri hefyd, sydd wedi'i grybwyll mewn cwestiynau ichi.

Pa fath o strategaeth marchnata y byddwch yn ei chynllunio ar gyfer trefi glan y môr yng Nghymru yn ystod y blynnyddoedd nesaf? Yr wyf yn sylweddoli ein bod am ddenu pen uchaf y farchnad twristiaeth a thwristiaeth uchel ei gwerth, ac mae hynny'n gwbl iawn a phriodol, ond mae'r math traddodiadol o dwristiaeth 'sws glec' Brydeinig, sydd wedi ffynnu yng Nghymru yn y gorffennol yn dal i

it warmly to ensure that it continues to thrive well into the future. I see that Gareth Jones agrees with me because Llandudno is also an incredibly important tourist destination. What are you doing to promote seaside tourism and how does that fit in with the strategic regeneration efforts of the Assembly Government?

Secondly, I listened carefully to Mark Isherwood's comments on north-east Wales, and I have repeatedly asked for your officials to come up with a strategy to promote the tourism opportunities in market towns across Wales. There are many fine examples of historic market towns in north-east Wales and elsewhere that would significantly benefit from some regeneration and from some decent marketing with a focus. Could you respond to those points?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** On seaside tourism, the Darkes family is shown enjoying the delights of the seaside in some of the films. I am not sure that Llandudno is a 'kiss-me-quick' kind of town; it is more of a 'kiss-me-very-slowly' kind of town. [*Laughter.*] However, I accept that the appeal is different in different parts of Wales, and it is difficult to try to encapsulate everything that goes on in one campaign. There is no doubt that we have to try to appeal to people who are not necessarily high-end customers or high rollers, but who want to take part in activities, as they are the ones who will spend money and who will stay here and travel around the country.

On the market towns, all I can say about the north-east is that we are seriously considering ways of trying to, not improve its image, but show that there are many activities and destinations in north-east Wales that make it worth spending some time there. However, you need a focus for these campaigns. You simply cannot say, 'Come to everywhere'; people have to be enticed with some of the major destinations and they will then visit some of the more interesting and niche places. Places such as Ruthin, for example, which has an excellent craft centre, can then

fodoli ac yn dal yn fyw ac yn iach; mae'n fyw ac yn iach mewn mannau megis fy etholaeth ac mae angen inni ei goleddu'n wresog i sicrhau ei fod yn dal i ffynnu ymhell i'r dyfodol. Gwelaf fod Gareth Jones yn cytuno â mi oherwydd y mae Llandudno hefyd yn gyrchfan anhygoel o bwysig i dwristiaid. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i hyrwyddo twristiaeth glan y môr a sut y mae hynny'n cydweddu ag ymdrechion adfywio strategol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad?

Yn ail, gwrandewais yn ofalus ar sylwadau Mark Isherwood am y gogledd-ddwyrain, ac yr wyf wedi gofyn droeon i'ch swyddogion gynnig strategaeth i hyrwyddo cyfleoedd ym maes twristiaeth mewn trefi marchnad ledled Cymru. Ceir llawer o enghreifftiau da o drefi marchnad hanesyddol yn y gogledd-ddwyrain ac mewn mannau eraill a fyddai'n elwa'n sylweddol o rywfaint o adfywio a rhywfaint o farchnata effeithiol ac iddo ffocws. A allech ymateb i'r pwyntiau hynny?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** O ran twristiaeth glan y môr, dangosir teulu'r Darkes yn mwynhau hyfrydwch glan y môr mewn rhai o'r ffilmiau. Nid wyf yn siŵr ai tref 'sws glec' yw Llandudno a dweud y gwir; mae'n fwy tebyg i dref 'sws araf iawn'. [*Chwerthin.*] Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn derbyn bod yr apêl yn wahanol mewn gwahanol rannau o Gymru, ac mae'n anodd ceisio crisiau popeth sy'n digwydd mewn un ymgyrch. Nid oes amheuaeth nad oes raid inni geisio apelio at bobl nad ydynt o anghenraig yn gwsmeriaid pen uchaf y farchnad nac yn warwyr mawr, ond sydd am gymryd rhan mewn gweithgareddau, oherwydd dyma'r rhai a fydd yn gwario arian yma ac yn aros yma ac yn teithio o gwmpas y wlad.

O ran y trefi marchnad, y cyfan y gallaf ei ddweud am y gogledd-ddwyrain yw ein bod yn ystyried o ddifrif sut y mae ceisio, nid gwella'i ddelwedd, ond dangos bod llu o weithgareddau a chyrchfannau yng ngogledd-ddwyrain Cymru sy'n ei gwneud yn werth treulio rhywfaint o amser yno. Fodd bynnag, mae angen canolbwyt ar gyfer yr ymgyrchoedd hyn. Ni allwch wneud dim ond dweud, 'Dewch i bobman'; rhaid hudo pobl i rai o'r prif gyrchfannau ac wedyn byddant yn ymweld â rhai o'r mannau mwy diddorol ac arbenigol. Yna, gall trefi megis Rhuthun, er

benefit from that kind of visit.

enghraifft, lle y ceir canolfan grefftau ragorol, elwa o'r math hwnnw o ymweliad.

## Bioamrywiaeth a Fframwaith yr Amgylchedd Naturiol Biodiversity and the Natural Environment Framework

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1 and 2 in the name of Nick Ramsay and amendments 3, 4, 5 and 6 in the name of Peter Black.

**The Minister for Environment, Sustainability and Housing (Jane Davidson):** I move that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. acknowledges the challenges inherent in halting biodiversity loss and welcomes the progress made in Wales;*

*2. notes the Welsh Assembly Government's intention for further, sustainable action under the planned natural environment framework and related policies. (NDM4475)*

The United Nations has declared 2010 the International Year of Biodiversity, and a three-day celebration of biodiversity will take place at the National Museum Wales from 20 to 22 May—so, from Thursday to Saturday.

Biodiversity is a key element of our life support systems. Biodiversity and the places where it is found make up the ecosystems that provide invaluable services, such as clean air and water, food, and crop pollination, as well as providing a beautiful setting in which to work and live. Our rich biodiversity in Wales makes a significant contribution to our economy, with millions of visitors coming each year to enjoy our wonderful coast and countryside.

Saturday, 22 May is the International Day for Biological Diversity. We will be launching an online biodiversity pledge so that organisations and individuals across Wales can show their support for protecting biodiversity. We will publish our five top tips for helping to protect biodiversity, including

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 2 yn enw Nick Ramsay, a gwelliannau 3, 4, 5 a 6 yn enw Peter Black.

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynaliadwyedd a Thai (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn cydnabod yr heriau sy'n mynd law yn llaw â rhwystro bioamrywiaeth rhag cael ei cholli ac yn croesawu'r cynnydd a wnaed yng Nghymru;*

*2. yn nodi bwriad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i gymryd camau cynaliadwy, pellach o dan y fframwaith amgylchedd naturiol arfaethedig a'r polisiau cysylltiedig. (NDM4475)*

Mae'r Cenhedloedd Unedig wedi datgan mai 2010 yw Blwyddyn Ryngwladol Bioamrywiaeth, a chynhelir tri diwrnod i ddathlu bioamrywiaeth yn Amgueddfa Genedlaethol Cymru rhwng 20 a 22 Mai—felly, o ddydd Iau tan ddydd Sadwrn.

Mae bioamrywiaeth yn elfen allweddol o'n systemau cynnal bywyd. Mae bioamrywiaeth a'r lleoedd lle y mae bioamrywiaeth ar gael yn creu'r ecosistemau sy'n darparu gwasanaethau amhrisiadwy, megis aer a dŵr glân, bwyd a pheillio cnydau, yn ogystal â darparu lleoliad hardd inni fyw a gweithio ynddo. Mae ein bioamrywiaeth yng Nghymru'n gwneud cyfraniad sylwedol i'n heonomi, a miliynau o ymwelwyr yn dod bob blwyddyn i fwynhau rhyfeddodau ein glannau a'n cefn gwlad.

Dydd Sadwrn, 22 Mai yw Diwrnod Rhyngwladol Amrywiaeth Fiolegol. Byddwn yn lansio addewid bioamrywiaeth ar-lein er mwyn i sefydliadau ac unigolion ledled Cymru ddangos eu bod yn cefnogi gwarchod bioamrywiaeth. Byddwn yn cyhoeddi ein pum prif gyngor i gyfrannu at warchod

things such as volunteering for a local conservation group, planting more flowers and vegetables, and picking up litter when we are out and about. We really need to raise the issue in the public consciousness and get as much support as possible.

We are very lucky in Wales to have a rich array of habitats, from the sea bed to the summit of Snowdon. Some 75 per cent of Welsh coastal waters are of European importance. We have more than 100 Natura 2000 sites and over 1,000 sites of special scientific interest. We have three national parks, five areas of outstanding natural beauty, and many local nature reserves. Wales is home to one of only two eligible UNESCO biospheres in the UK: the Dyfi biosphere. These places, and the land and seas around and between them, make an invaluable contribution to the health and wellbeing of the people of Wales.

Wales, along with other countries, was hoping to be able to celebrate success this year in achieving international targets to halt or significantly reduce the rate of biodiversity loss by 2010. These targets were set in 2002, through the United Nations Convention on Biological Diversity and the European Union. No country has met these targets. However, this is no excuse. The Welsh Assembly Government is taking the opportunity this year fundamentally to refresh our approach to biodiversity and nature conservation by reviewing the ways in which we address pressures on our natural environment and our biodiversity capital. As was announced in a written statement in January, we are developing a new natural environment framework with partners, and we shall be launching that in the autumn.

The challenge facing us in halting the loss of biodiversity is closely connected to that of climate change. Although we have not managed to reach the targets, the progress has been substantial and the direction of travel has been previously endorsed by our partners. The natural environment framework will embody the Assembly Government's

bioamrywiaeth, gan gynnwys pethau megis gwirfoddoli gyda grŵp cadwraeth lleol, plannu mwy o flodau a llysiau, a chodi sbwriel pan fyddwn ar grwydr. Mae gwir angen inni godi'r mater yn ymwybyddiaeth y cyhoedd a chael cymaint o gefnogaeth ag sy'n bosibl.

Yr ydym yn ffodus iawn yng Nghymru o gael amrywiaeth gyfoethog o gynefinoedd, o wely'r môr i gopa'r Wyddfa. Mae tua 75 y cant o ddyfroedd glannau Cymru o bwys Ewropeaidd. Mae gennym fwy na 100 o safleoedd Natura 2000 a mwy na 1,000 o safleoedd o ddiddordeb gwyddonol arbennig. Mae gennym dri pharc cenedlaethol, pum ardal o harddwch naturiol eithriadol a llawer o warchodfeydd natur lleol. Mae Cymru'n gartref i un o'r unig ddua fiosffer UNESCO cymwys yn y Deyrnas Unedig: biosffer Dyfi. Mae'r ardaloedd hyn, a'r tir a'r moroedd sydd o'u cwmpas a rhyngddynt, yn gwneud cyfraniad amhrisiadwy at iechyd a lles pobl Cymru.

Yr oedd Cymru, ynghyd â gwledydd eraill, yn gobeithio gallu dathlu llwyddiant eleni o ran cyrraedd targedau rhyngwladol i atal colli bioamrywiaeth erbyn 2010 neu i arafu'r broses yn sylweddol. Pennwyd y targedau hyn yn 2002, drwy Gonfensiwn y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar Amrywiaeth Fiolegol a'r Undeb Ewropeaidd. Nid oes yr un wlad wedi cyrraedd y targedau hyn. Serch hynny, nid yw hyn yn esgus yn y byd. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn achub y cyfle hwn eleni i adnewyddu'n sylfaenol ein dull o ymdrin â bioamrywiaeth a gwarchod natur drwy edrych eto ar sut yr ydym yn mynd i'r afael â'r pwysau ar ein hamgylchedd naturiol a'n cyfalaf bioamrywiaeth. Fel y cyhoeddwyd mewn datganiad ysgrifenedig ym mis Ionawr, yr ydym yn datblygu fframwaith newydd ynglŷn â'r amgylchedd naturiol gyda'n partneriaid, a byddwn yn lansio hwnnw yn yr hydref.

Mae cysylltiad clòs rhwng yr her sy'n ein hwynebu o ran atal colli bioamrywiaeth a'r newid yn yr hinsawdd. Er nad ydym wedi llwyddo i gyrraedd y targedau, mae'r cynnydd wedi bod yn sylweddol a thrywydd ein taith wedi'i gadarnhau o'r blaen gan ein partneriaid. Bydd y fframwaith amgylchedd naturiol yn ymgorffori ymateb adeiladol

constructive response to the failure to meet the biodiversity targets in Wales. That framework will outline the urgent action that we will take to reach future targets for biodiversity, ecosystems, and species recovery. For that reason, we will oppose amendments 1, 3, 5 and 6.

However, we strongly support the addition of amendments 2 and 4. Amendment 2 acknowledges the importance of biodiversity and ecosystem services to a sustainable economy. We agree that biodiversity loss has a significant impact upon economic activities such as fishing, farming and tourism. Amendment 4 draws our attention to the International Year of Biodiversity and reiterates the key role of biodiversity in supporting our social and economic wellbeing. As the Assembly Government is committed to biodiversity enhancement and protection as a key element of sustainable development, and we remain committed to our five high-level indicators for sustainable development, we are happy to endorse this amendment.

4.30 p.m.

We have made strong positive use of new legislative powers through the Natural Environment and Rural Communities Act 2006, which places a biodiversity duty on all public bodies. We will be aiming to replicate this engagement under the new Marine and Coastal Access Act 2009, which allows us to identify and manage marine protected areas and plan for the sustainable use of our seas. We have set challenging targets to bring designated sites into favourable condition in our environment strategy, and the Outcome 21 project, established in 2007, has developed a database that supports management actions under way by our partners, ranging from habitat restoration, enforcement action and damage prevention to implementation of innovative grazing schemes.

Wales is also ahead of other UK

Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i'r ffaith ein bod wedi methu cyrraedd y targedau bioamrywiaeth yng Nghymru. Bydd y fframwaith hwnnw'n rhestru'r camau y byddwn yn eu cymryd ar frys er mwyn cyrraedd targedau yn y dyfodol ar gyfer bioamrywiaeth, ecosistemau, ac adfer rhywogaethau. Dyna pam y byddwn yn gwrthwynebu gwelliannau 1, 3, 5 a 6.

Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn cefnogi'n gryf ychwanegu gwelliannau 2 a 4. Mae gwelliant 2 yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd gwasanaethau bioamrywiaeth ac ecosistemau i economi gynaliadwy. Yr ydym yn cytuno bod colli bioamrywiaeth yn cael effaith sylweddol ar weithgareddau economaidd megis pysgota, ffermio a thwristiaeth. Mae gwelliant 4 yn tynnu ein sylw at Flwyddyn Ryngwladol Bioamrywiaeth ac yn ailddatgan rôl allweddol bioamrywiaeth o ran ategu'n lles cymdeithasol ac economaidd. Gan fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ymrwymo i gryfhau a gwarchod bioamrywiaeth fel elfen allweddol o ddatblygu cynaliadwy, a'n bod wedi ymrwymo o hyd i'n pum dangosydd lefel uchel ar gyfer datblygu cynaliadwy, yr ydym yn fodlon derbyn y gwelliant hwn.

Yr ydym wedi defnyddio pwerau deddfu newydd yn rymus at ddibenion cadarnhaol drwy Ddeddf Amgylchedd Naturiol a Chymunedau Gwledig 2006. Mae honno'n gosod dyletswydd ym maes bioamrywiaeth ar bob corff cyhoeddus. Byddwn yn ceisio ailadrodd yr ymrwymiad hwn o dan y ddeddf newydd, Deddf y Môr a Mynediad i'r Arfordir 2009, sy'n caniatáu inni nodi a rheoli ardaloedd morol sydd o dan warchodaeth a chynllunio ar gyfer defnyddio'n moroedd mewn ffordd gynaliadwy. Yr ydym wedi gosod targedau heriol yn ein strategaeth amgylcheddol i sicrhau bod safleoedd dynodedig yn cyrraedd cyflwr ffafriol, ac mae prosiect Canlyniad 21, a sefydlwyd yn 2007, wedi datblygu cronfa ddata sy'n ategu camau rheoli sydd ar y gweill gan ein partneriaid. Mae'r rheini'n amrywio o adfer cynefinoedd, camau gorfodi ac atal difrod i roi cynlluniau pori arloesol ar waith.

Mae Cymru ar y blaen i weinyddiaethau

administrations in the development of its biodiversity action plan. The Wales biodiversity partnership has developed and implemented new structures and processes to take this further forward in Wales, and we are leading the UK in our use of the biodiversity action recording system to share information. Nine new ecosystem groups have been established and, in 2009-10, positive biodiversity-enhancing action took place in every local authority and national park in Wales. We have complete coverage from local biodiversity action plan partnerships, which co-ordinate and implement action, and local record centres, which hold the process and disseminate the biodiversity data needed to support this work.

We are also unique in having a biodiversity champion in place at cabinet level in each local authority and national park authority. In addition, the sustainable land management scheme, Tir Gofal, has a total area of over 417,000 ha of land under positive management, of which nearly 200,000 ha is identified as biodiversity action plan habitat, and over 270 miles of hedgerows are under positive management in the same scheme.

Regeneration programmes, such as those in the Ebbw Vale steelworks and the Valleys regional park, incorporate integrated approaches to the planning and delivery of environmental outcomes, including, for example, securing £42 million for natural environment enhancement related to tourism in the Valleys, including large-scale tree planting and the removal of Japanese knotweed.

Development of the spatial plan includes the networked environment regions project, which is being trialled in south-east Wales. This provides a key mechanism for identifying, protecting and enhancing important biodiversity habitats by treating them as important green infrastructure.

The river basin management plans that I launched earlier this year aim to ensure good water quality to support healthy ecosystems

eraill y Deyrnas Unedig hefyd o ran datblygu ei chynllun gweithredu bioamrywiaeth. Mae partneriaeth bioamrywiaeth Cymru wedi datblygu strwythurau a phrosesau newydd ac wedi'u rhoi ar waith er mwyn bwrw ymlaen â hyn eto yng Nghymru. Yr ydym yn arwain y Deyrnas Unedig o ran defnyddio'r system cofnodi camau bioamrywiaeth er mwyn rhannu gwybodaeth. Sefydlwyd naw grŵp ecosystem newydd, ac, yn 2009-10, cymerwyd camau cadarnhaol i gryfhau bioamrywiaeth ym mhob awdurdod lleol a phob parc cenedlaethol yng Nghymru. Ym mhob man mae gennym bartneriaethau lleol y cynllun gweithredu bioamrywiaeth, sy'n cydlynus ac yn rhoi camau ar waith, a'r canolfannau cofnodi lleol, sy'n cynnal y broses ac yn lledaenu'r data ynglŷn â bioamrywiaeth y mae eu hangen i gefnogi'r gwaith hwn.

Yr ydym yn unigryw hefyd am fod gennym hyrwyddwr bioamrywiaeth ar waith ar lefel y cabinet ym mhob awdurdod lleol ac ym mhob awdurdod parc cenedlaethol. Hefyd, mae gan y cynllun rheoli tir cynaliadwy, Tir Gofal, ardal dros 417,000 ha i gyd o dan reolaeth gadarnhaol, ac mae 200,000 ha o'r tir hwnnw wedi'i ddynodi'n gynefin cynllun gweithredu bioamrywiaeth, a mwy na 270 milltir o wrychoedd o dan reolaeth gadarnhaol yn yr un cynllun.

Mae rhagleni adfywio, megis y rhai yng ngwaith dur Glynebwyr a pharc rhanbarthol y Cymoedd, yn ymgorffori dulliau integredig o ymdrin â chynllunio a sicrhau canlyniadau amgylcheddol, gan gynnwys, er enghraifft, sicrhau £42 miliwn i wella'r amgylchedd naturiol sy'n gysylltiedig â thwristiaeth yn y Cymoedd, gan gynnwys plannu coed ar raddfa fawr, a chael gwared ar ganclwm Japan.

Mae datblygu'r cynllun gofodol yn cynnwys prosiect y rhanbarthau amgylchedd rhwydweithiol, sy'n cael ei dreialu yn y de-ddwyrain. Mae hwn yn cynnig mecanwaith allweddol ar gyfer adnabod, gwarchod a gwella cynefinoedd bioamrywiaeth pwysig drwy eu trin fel seilwaith gwyrdod pwysig.

Nod y cynlluniau rheoli basnau afonydd a lansiwyd gennylf yn gynharach eleni yw sicrhau dŵr o ansawdd da i gefnogi

and biodiversity. Key actions have been included in the river basin management plans to help bring internationally protected nature conservation sites into favourable condition.

We will be incorporating ecological, social and economic information into the development of the Wales fisheries strategy and our selection of the marine protected areas to ensure that sites are chosen, and decisions made, to maximise ecological and socioeconomic benefits, to minimise conflict and to identify truly synergistic solutions.

Therefore, it is despite all this work and many more positive actions for biodiversity that the work to date has not been enough to enable us to reach the important and challenging targets set for biodiversity. The natural environment framework seeks to shift the focus of environmental policy onto conserving and securing Wales's natural capital, and the green and blue infrastructure on which so much else depends, adopting a new and stronger focus on ecosystem services in all evidence, policy and funding activities undertaken by WAG and its sponsored bodies. As part of this, we will be moving our focus away from processes towards practical action and delivery on the ground, through stronger support and action on ecosystem services on both land and sea.

At the EU environment council meeting in March, a new target was supported in the context of halting the loss of biodiversity and the degradation of ecosystem services in the EU by 2020, and restoring them insofar as is feasible, while stepping up the EU contribution to averting global biodiversity loss by the same date. The European Commission, with member states and other stakeholders, is now drawing up an improved biodiversity strategy to meet this new target. Globally, post-2010 targets will be agreed at the tenth conference of the parties to the convention in Nagoya, Japan in October this

ecosystemau a bioamrywiaeth iach. Cynhwyswyd camau allweddol yn y cynlluniau rheoli basnau afonydd i gynorthwyo i sicrhau bod safleoedd gwarchod natur sydd o dan warchodaeth ryngwladol yn cyrraedd cyflwr ffafriol.

Byddwn yn cynnwys gwylbodaeth ecolegol, gymdeithasol ac economaidd wrth ddatblygu strategaeth pysgodfeydd Cymru ac wrth inni ddethol ardaloedd morol sydd o dan warchodaeth er mwyn sicrhau bod safleoedd yn cael eu dewis, a phenderfyniadau'n cael eu gwneud, a fydd yn sicrhau'r manteision ecolegol a chymdeithasol economaidd mwyaf, yn sicrhau'r gwrthdaro lleiaf ac yn canfod atebion sydd o ddifri'n cyd-weu â'i gilydd.

Felly, er gwaethaf yr holl waith hwn, ac er gwaethaf llawer o gamau cadarnhaol eraill er budd bioamrywiaeth, nid yw'r gwaith hyd yn hyn wedi bod yn ddigon i'n galluogi i gyrraedd y targedau pwysig a heriol a osodwyd ar gyfer bioamrywiaeth. Nod y fframwaith amgylchedd naturiol yw ceisio symud ffocws y polisi amgylcheddol i warchod a diogelu cyfalaf naturiol Cymru, a'r seilwaith gwyrdd a glas y mae cynifer o bethau eraill yn dibynnu arno, gan fabwysiadu ffocws newydd a chryfach ar wasanaethau ecosystemau yn holl weithgareddau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r cyrff a noddir ganddi o ran tystiolaeth, polisi ac ariannu. Bydd hyn yn cynnwys canolbwytio llai ar brosesau a mwy ar weithredu a chyflawni ymarferol ar lawr gwlad, drwy sicrhau cefnogaeth a gweithredu cryfach yng nghyswilt gwasanaethau ecosystemau ar y tir ac yn y môr.

Yng nghyfarfod cyngor amgylchedd yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ym mis Mawrth, cefnogwyd targed newydd yng nghyd-destun atal colli bioamrywiaeth a diraddio gwasanaethau ecosystemau yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd erbyn 2020, a'u hadfer i'r graddau y mae hynny'n ymarferol. Ar yr un pryd, cryfhawyd cyfraniad yr Undeb Ewropeaidd at osgoi colli bioamrywiaeth yn fydd-eang erbyn yr un dyddiad. Mae'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd, ynghyd â'i aelod-wladwriaethau a rhanddeiliaid eraill, wrthi'n awr yn llunio strategaeth well ar gyfer bioamrywiaeth i gyrraedd targed newydd

year. Once again, we anticipate endorsement of the ecosystem services approach that Wales, in its usual quiet manner, is leading the way on.

hwn. Yn fydd-eang, cytunir ar dargedau ar gyfer ar ôl 2010 yn negfed gynhadledd aelodau'r confensiwn hwn yn Nagoya, Japan ym mis Hydref eleni. Unwaith eto, rhagwelwn y cefnogir dull y gwasanaethau ecosistemau lle y mae Cymru, yn ei ffordd dawel arferol ei hun, yn arwain y ffordd.

**Angela Burns:** I move the following amendments in the name of Nick Ramsay. Amendment 1: delete point 1 and replace with:

*1. notes the failure to achieve the target to halt biodiversity loss by 2010 and expresses concern with the lack of progress made in Wales.*

Amendment 2: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*acknowledges the economic impact of biodiversity loss.*

I am pleased to move the Conservatives' amendments, tabled in the name of Nick Ramsay. I welcome the review of the Government's strategy and framework and hope that, in consultation with interested parties and stakeholders, it will find a way through to actually make progress.

The progress so far has been disappointing. Key issues such as climate change and waste draw all the attention and it is time that we, as politicians, ensure that biodiversity is given the high profile it needs so that the necessary changes are made to protect and preserve it. My personal disappointment is not just that our target has not been met, but that it would seem that many targets have been set and not reached. The EU target set in 2001 has not been achieved and the Welsh Assembly Government is nowhere near achieving its target. I acknowledge that we are not the only country to have not achieved our targets. What we have in Wales are, quite rightfully, ambitious targets, as this is such an important matter for every one of us. We do not have the actions in place to achieve these aims and we must now work towards making some progress by putting this at the forefront of our priorities and using a joined-up approach to mainstream these values throughout all policies.

**Angela Burns:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Nick Ramsay. Gwelliant 1: dileu pwynt 1 a rhoi yn ei le:

*1. yn nodi'r methiant i gyflawni'r targed i roi stop ar golli bioamrywiaeth erbyn 2010 ac yn mynegi pryder yng Nghymru sydd wedi cael ei wneud yng Nghymru.*

Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn cydnabod effaith economaidd colli bioamrywiaeth.*

Yr wyf yn falch o gynnig gwelliannau'r Ceidwadwyr, a gyflwynwyd yn enw Nick Ramsay. Yr wyf yn croesawu'r adolygiad o strategaeth a fframwaith y Llywodraeth gan obeithio, drwy ymgynghori â phawb sydd â diddordeb a rhanddeiliaid, y llwyddia i ganfod trywydd a fydd yn arwain at wir gynydd.

Hyd yn hyn, siomedig fu'r cynnydd. Mae materion allweddol megis y newid yn yr hinsawdd a gwastraff yn cael y sylw i gyd ac mae'n bryd i ni, wleidyddion, sierhau bod bioamrywiaeth yn cael y sylw amlwg y mae ei angen arni er mwyn gwneud y newidiadau sy'n angenrheidiol i'w gwarchod a'i chadw. Yr wyf fi fy hun yn siomedig, nid dim ond nad ydym wedi cyrraedd ein targed, ond bod llawer o dargedau i bob golwg wedi'u gosod ond heb eu cyrraedd. Nid yw targed yr Undeb Ewropeaidd a osodwyd yn 2001 wedi'i gyrraedd ac nid yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn agos o gwbl at gyrraedd ei tharged hithau. Yr wyf yn cydnabod nad ni yw'r unig wlad nad yw wedi llwyddo i gyrraedd ein targedau. Mae ein targedau ni yng Nghymru, a hynny'n gwbl briodol, yn dargedau uchelgeisiol, gan fod hwn yn fater mor bwysig i bob un ohonom. Nid oes gennym y camau ar waith i wireddu'r amcanion hyn a rhaid inni weithio yn awr tuag at wneud rhywfaint o gynydd drwy roi hyn ar frig ein blaenoriaethau a

mynd ati mewn ffordd gydgysylltiedig i sicrhau bod y gwerthoedd hyn yn rhan o brif ffrwd ein holl bolisiau.

The importance of biodiversity is clear for so many reasons. The plant and animal species that share our planet make vital contributions to enrich our lives and, far too often, we take them for granted. The International Union for Conservation of Nature has said that over a third of species assessed are facing extinction. We must also, at this point, acknowledge the importance of marine biodiversity. Over 90 per cent of biodiversity lives in our oceans. Overfishing has been researched through ‘The Economics of Ecosystems and Biodiversity’ report, which states that all the world’s fisheries are likely to collapse within 50 years, should current trends not be reversed and that over one billion people rely on fish protein.

In Wales, we have failed to protect biodiversity on a number of levels. Farmland bird numbers are at their lowest level since 1994. In Wales, we may now have only 600 pairs of lapwings remaining, down 1,000 since 12 years ago, and only 1,099 pairs of curlews—I would love to know how they work out these numbers, which came from the reports based on 2006 surveys. Yellowhammers have declined by 40 per cent since 2005. Figures from ‘The state of birds in Wales’ report show that there has been a slight improvement in populations of priority species of bees, butterflies and flowers. While that is welcome, we need to do more, because they are key to the pollination that we need.

I am delighted that the Government has accepted our second amendment, amendment 2, because the economic impact of biodiversity on our world is a crucial consideration for us, especially given these tough economic times. I can appreciate that it may seem like a low priority to invest in our wildlife and natural environment, given some of the pressures that we face elsewhere. However, it should not, because, in Wales alone, an estimated £6 billion of our gross

Mae'n amlwg bod bioamrywiaeth yn bwysig am gynifer o resymau. Mae rhywogaethau'r planhigion a'r anifeiliaid sy'n rhannu'n planed yn gwneud cyfraniadau hollbwysig at gyfoethogi'n bywydau, ac, yn rhy aml o lawer, byddwn yn eu cymryd yn ganiataol. Mae'r Undeb Rhyngwladol Gwarchod Natur wedi dweud bod dros draean y rhywogaethau a aseswyd yn wynebu difodiant. Rhaid inni gydnabod hefyd yn awr mor bwysig yw bioamrywiaeth ein moroedd. Mae dros 90 y cant o'n bioamrywiaeth yn byw yn ein cefnforoedd. Mae'r adroddiad 'The Economics of Ecosystems and Biodiversity', yn ganlyniad gwaith ymchwil sy'n dweud bod holl bysgodfeydd y byd yn debyg o ddiflannu o fewn 50 mlynedd, oni wrthdroir y tueddiadau presennol a bod mwy na biliwn o bobl yn dibynnau ar brotein pysgod.

Yng Nghymru, yr ydym wedi methu gwarchod bioamrywiaeth ar sawl lefel. Mae llai o adar ar diroedd ffermydd yn awr nag a fu ers 1994. Yng Nghymru, efallai nad oes gennym ond 600 pâr o gornchwiglod ar ôl, 1,000 yn llai nag a oedd yma 12 mlynedd yn ôl, a dim ond 1,099 pâr o ylfinirod—byddwn wrth fy modd yn cael gwybod sut y maent yn cael y ffigurau hyn. Maent yn dod o'r adroddiadau sydd wedi'u seilio ar arolygon 2006. Mae nifer melyn yr eithin wedi gostwng 40 y cant ers 2005. Dengys ffigurau adroddiad 'The state of birds in Wales' fod poblogaethau rhywogaethau â blaenoriaeth megis gwenyn, gloynnod byw a blodau wedi cynyddu ychydig. Er bod hynny i'w groesawu, mae angen inni wneud rhagor, oherwydd y maent yn hollbwysig ar gyfer y peillio y mae ei angen arnom.

Yr wyf wrth fy modd bod y Llywodraeth wedi derbyn ein hail welliant, gwelliant 2, oherwydd y mae effaith economaidd bioamrywiaeth ar ein byd yn ystyriaeth hollbwysig inni, yn enwedig o gofio ein bod yn byw mewn cyfnod economaidd anodd. Yr wyf yn sylweddoli y gall buddsoddi yn ein bywyd gwylt a'n hamgylchedd naturiol ymddangos yn flaenoriaeth isel, o gofio'r pwysau sydd arnom mewn mannau eraill. Fodd bynnag, ni ddylid ei gweld felly,

domestic product depends on the environment, and we cannot afford to let this area decline. It is estimated that nearly £40 billion-worth of damage to ecosystems each year is caused by mankind and the economic impact is rising food costs, which, in turn, impact on the poorest people in our world. Therefore, once again, I am grateful that you will accept our amendment 2, Minister.

As I stated earlier, we are not the only country in the situation of not meeting its targets. I was pleased to see, last month, that the Finnish national commission on sustainable development called for a long-term research programme to study the societal and economic impact of biodiversity in its country. That is something that we in Wales could follow and I believe that we should, because if we do not act now, it will be too late. Investing in the renewal of our natural environment has the potential to create jobs, enhance our skills base and provide much-needed support for businesses that will ensure that Wales remains competitive and economically advantageous.

I was interested to read the recent Wales Audit Office report, ‘Sustainable development and business decision making in the Welsh Assembly Government’. Two key statements can be highlighted from that report:

‘limitations in the Assembly Government’s business processes have impaired their effectiveness in embedding sustainable development objectives and principles in business decision making’,

and,

‘sustainable development is seen as one of a number of competing priorities rather than the means by which the Assembly Government manages its competing priorities’.

Both comments take me back to when we debated the importance of mainstreaming sustainability in ministerial portfolios in the

otherwydd, yng Nghymru yn unig, amcangyfrifir bod £6 biliwn o'n cynnrych mewnwladol crynswth yn dibynnu ar yr amgylchedd, ac ni allwn fforddio gadael i'r maes hwn ddirywo. Amcangyfrifir bod dyn yn gwneud gwerth bron £40 biliwn o ddifrod i ecosistemau bob blwyddyn ac effaith economaidd hynny yw bod costau bwyd yn cynyddu. Yn ei dro, mae hynny'n effeithio ar bobl dloaf ein byd. Felly, unwaith eto, yr wyf yn ddiolchgar eich bod yn barod i dderbyn ein gwelliant 2, Weinidog.

Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, nid ni yw'r unig wlad sydd heb gyrraedd ei thargedau. Yr oeddwn yn falch o weld, fis diwethaf, fod comisiwn datblygu cynaliadwy cenedlaethol y Ffindir wedi galw am raglen ymchwil hirdymor i astudio effaith bioamrywiaeth ar y gymdeithas a'r economi yn ei gwlad. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth y gallem ni yng Nghymru ei ddilyn a chredaf y dylem, otherwydd oni weithredwn yn awr, bydd yn rhy hwyr. Gallai buddsoddi mewn adnewyddu'n hamgylchedd naturiol greu swyddi, cryfhau ein sylfaen sgiliau a darparu'r cymorth y mae ar fusnesau ei wir angen er mwyn sierhau bod Cymru'n parhau'n gystadleul ac yn cael mantais economaidd.

Yr oedd yn dda gennyf ddarllen adroddiad diweddar Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru, ‘Datblygu cynaliadwy a gwneud penderfyniadau busnes yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru’. Gellir tynnu sylw at ddu ddatganiad allweddol yn yr adroddiad hwnnw:

‘mae cyfyngiadau ym mhrosesau busnes Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi effeithio ar eu heffeithiolrwydd o ran cynnwys amcanion ac egwyddorion datblygu cynaliadwy fel rhan o'r broses o wneud penderfyniadau busnes’,

ac,

‘ystyrir datblygu cynaliadwy yn un o blith nifer o flaenoriaethau croes yn hytrach na'r ffordd y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn rheoli ei blaenoriaethau croes’.

Mae'r ddu sylw'n mynd â mi yn ôl i'r cyfnod pan oeddem yn dadlau ynglŷn â phwysigrwydd prif-ffrydio cynaliadwyedd

Chamber last year.

4.40 p.m.

All these points, in my opinion, apply to biodiversity as well, and we are failing to live within environmental limits and the Assembly Government is promoting policies that encourage development at the cost of biodiversity. I welcome the Welsh Assembly Government's commitment to developing the natural environment framework. However, it would appear that no assessment has been made of why the current targets have not been met. I understand, Minister, that the NEF will go out for consultation in September, and the Royal Society for the Protection of Birds is calling for an independent inquiry into the why the targets have not been achieved to date. I fully support it in this request, and hope that it is something that will be considered, alongside the NEF, in the consultation.

**Michael German:** I move the following amendments in the name of Peter Black. Amendment 3: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*regrets the failure of the Welsh Assembly Government to meet the EU commitment to halt the loss of biodiversity by 2010.*

Amendment 4: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*welcomes the International Year of Biodiversity but believes that biodiversity is fundamental to our lives and livelihoods and must be a priority at all times.*

Amendment 5: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to take urgent action following the biodiversity review to outline plans to reach future targets on biodiversity and species recovery.*

ym mhortffolios Gweinidogion yn y Siambri y llynedd.

Mae'r pwyntiau hyn i gyd, yn fy marn i, yn berthnasol i fioamrywiaeth hefyd. Nid ydym yn llwyddo i fyw o fewn terfynau amgylcheddol ac mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn hyrwyddo polisiau sy'n annog datblygu ar draul bioamrywiaeth. Yr wyf yn croesawu ymrwymiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ddatblygu'r fframwaith amgylchedd naturiol. Serch hynny, i bob golwg, nid oes yr un asesiad wedi'i wneud o pam nad ydym wedi cyrraedd y targedau presennol. Caf ar ddeall, Weinidog, yr ymgynghorir ynglŷn â'r fframwaith ym mis Medi, ac mae'r Gymdeithas Frenhinol er Gwarchod Adar yn galw am ymchwiliad annibynnol i ganfod pam nad yw'r targedau wedi'u cyrraedd hyd yn hyn. Fe'i cefnogaf yn llwyr yn y cais hwn, ac yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd yn rhywbeth a ystyrir, ochr yn ochr â'r fframwaith amgylchedd naturiol, yn yr ymgynghori.

**Michael German:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Peter Black. Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn gresynu wrth fethiant Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gyflawni ymrwymiad yr UE i roi stop ar golli bioamrywiaeth erbyn 2010.*

Gwelliant 4: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn croesawu'r Flwyddyn Bioamrywiaeth Ryngwladol ond yn credu bod bioamrywiaeth yn hanfodol i'n bywydau ac i'n bywoliaeth a'i bod yn rhaid iddi fod yn flaeoriaeth bob amser.*

Gwelliant 5: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i weithredu ar unwaith yn dilyn yr adolygiad o fioamrywiaeth i amlinellu cynlluniau i gyrraedd targedau i'r dyfodol yng nghyswllt bioamrywiaeth ac adfer rhywogaethau.*

Amendment 6: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to give greater weighting to biodiversity targets in assessing its sustainable development indicators.*

Minister, the only joy that we can take today is the fact that we are not alone; we have the company of a considerable number of other countries, or all of them. However, that does not absolve us of our responsibility under the targets that we set for ourselves. Before I read out a list of four or five reasons why we have not hit our targets, I must say that these are the stakeholders' views and that they are not, necessarily, my views. I would like the Minister to answer these points because she did not make her response clear in her opening statement.

First, the lack of political ownership and leadership is a consistent theme in what the stakeholders have to say. I wonder whether that is, in part, because this was an EU directive or regulation to start with; it was very much top down, and we need to engage with people from the bottom up to make it work.

The second point that the stakeholders made was about inconsistent and conflicting Government policy. I notice that Angela referred to one of those policies. That view was, quite clearly, boosted by the evidence in the Auditor General for Wales's report on how policy has to match across various Assembly Government departments. We have to prioritise development in this area. We are not living sustainably, within our means, even though we have to do so. This means that all the tools, including the economic levers, have to be used to create that environment.

The third area was a lack of shared understanding of the importance of wildlife. That is something that we all have to be aware of, so it is not a criticism of Government, but it is, perhaps, a criticism of where Government has not taken enough

Gwelliant 6: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i roi mwy o bwys ar dargedau bioamrywiaeth wrth asesu ei dangosyddion datblygu cynaliadwy.*

Weinidog, yr unig beth y gallwn fod yn fodlon yn ei gylch heddiw yw'r ffaith nad ni yw'r unig rai; yr ydym yng nghwmni nifer sylweddol o wledydd eraill, neu'r gwledydd i gyd. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n ein hesgusodi rhag ein cyfrifoldeb i gyrraedd y targedau a osodasom i ni'n hunain. Cyn imi ddarllen rhestr o bedwar neu bum rheswm pam nad ydym wedi cyrraedd ein targedau, rhaid imi ddweud mai barn y rhanddeiliaid ac nid fy marn i yw hyn o reidrwydd. Hoffwn i'r Gweinidog ateb y pwyntiau hyn oherwydd ni chafwyd ymateb clir ganddi yn ei datganiad agoriadol.

Yn gyntaf, mae'r diffyg perchenogaeth ac arweiniad gwleidyddol yn thema gyson yn yr hyn y mae'r rhanddeiliaid yn ei ddweud. Tybed ai'r rheswm dros hynny'n rhannol yw oherwydd mai cyfarwyddeb neu reoliad gan yr Undeb Ewropeaidd oedd hyn i ddechrau? Daeth o'r brig i lawr i raddau helaeth, ac mae angen inni feithrin cysylltiad â phobl o'r gwraidd i fyny er mwyn gwneud iddi weithio.

Ail bwynt y rhanddeiliaid oedd bod polisiau'r Llywodraeth yn anghyson ac yn gwrthdarô â'i gilydd. Sylwais i Angela gyfeirio at un o'r polisiau hynny. Yr oedd dystiolaeth adroddiad Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru ynglŷn â sut y mae'n rhaid i bolisiau gwahanol adrannau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad gyd-fynd â'i gilydd yn ategu'r farn honno'n ddigon clir. Rhaid inni flaenoriaethu datblygiadau yn y maes hwn. Nid ydym yn byw'n gynaliadwy, o fewn ein modd, er bod yn rhaid inni wneud hynny. Mae hyn yn golygu bod yn rhaid defnyddio'r holl arfau, gan gynnwys sbardunau economaidd, i greu'r amgylchedd hwnnw.

Y trydydd maes oedd diffyg dealltwriaeth o bwysigrwydd bywyd gwylt. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth y bydd yn rhaid inni i gyd fod yn ymwybodol ohono, felly nid beirniadaeth ar y Llywodraeth ydyw, ond efallai ei bod yn feirniadaeth ar y ffaith nad yw'r Llywodraeth

action to ensure that that awareness is in place.

The fourth major criticism—there were others—was that the actions taken so far in Wales had been focused on process rather than on action and outcomes. Generally speaking, that was another consistent theme from the partnerships that have been set up to deal with biodiversity. It is now a matter of clarity of action rather than the setting up of frameworks and processes to answer the crucial questions. We need to see action now.

The report entitled ‘The Economics of Ecosystems and Biodiversity’, or TEEB, which has been referred to, highlighted the importance of biodiversity and noted that biodiversity loss and ecosystem degradation have direct economic repercussions. That is the other area that we are not clear on: if we do not tackle that loss, there will be downsides for our economy, but if we do tackle it, there will be an upside for our economy. There is an economic impact, and we must ensure consistency of action across Government departments in that respect.

We welcome the biodiversity review that the Minister has talked about. We agree that there is much to be done and we look forward to a comprehensive plan once the review is complete, with actions emerging from it to halt biodiversity loss, so that we can shed some light on the future direction of our policy. A more proactive approach is needed; we need to ensure that areas of valuable biodiversity are linked. Small populations of animals, for example, are far more vulnerable if they are unable to interact with populations elsewhere, which is why we need to see a major programme of habitat restoration and creation, and an increase in woodland cover, to provide some of the resilience that is necessary to deal with the consequences of climate change.

That brings me to one of the other criticisms of our failure to meet the existing targets,

wedi gwneud digon i sicrhau'r ymwybyddiaeth honno.

Y bedwaredd brif feirniadaeth—beirniadwyd pethau eraill hefyd—oedd bod y camau a gymerwyd yng Nghymru hyd yma wedi canolbwytio ar y broses yn hytrach nag ar weithredu ac ar ganlyniadau. A sôn yn gyffredinol, yr oedd honno'n thema gyson gan y partneriaethau sydd wedi'u sefydlu i fynd i'r afael â bioamrywiaeth. Mae angen gweithredu'n glir yn awr yn hytrach na sefydlu fframweithiau a phrosesau, er mwyn ateb y cwestiynau hollbwysig. Mae angen inni weld gweithredu yn awr.

Yr oedd yr adroddiad o dan y teitl ‘The Economics of Ecosystems and Biodiversity’, neu TEEB, y cyfeiriwyd ato, yn tynnu sylw at bwysigrwydd bioamrywiaeth ac yn nodi bod colli bioamrywiaeth a diraddio ecosistemau yn arwain yn uniongyrchol at ganlyniadau economaidd. Hwnnw yw'r maes arall nad ydym yn glir yn ei gylch: onidawn i'r afael â'r golled honno, bydd ein heonomi'n dioddef, ond osawn i'r afael â hi, bydd ein heonomi ar ei hennill. Mae'n cael effaith ar yr economi, a rhaid inni sicrhau gweithredu cyson ar draws adrannau'r Llywodraeth yn y cyswllt hwnnw.

Yr ydym yn croesawu'r adolygiad o fioamrywiaeth y mae'r Gweinidog wedi sôn amdano. Cytunwn fod llawer i'w wneud ac edrychwn ymlaen at gynllun cynhwysfawr pan fydd yr adolygiad wedi'i gwblhau, ynghyd â chamau gweithredu'n codi ohono i atal colli bioamrywiaeth, er mwyn inni allu taflu rhywfaint o oleuni ar gyfeiriad ein polisi yn y dyfodol. Mae angen mynd ati'n fwy rhagweithiol; mae angen sicrhau bod cysylltiad rhwng ardaloedd sy'n werthfawr o ran eu bioamrywiaeth. Mae poblogaethau bach o anifeiliaid, er enghraifft, yn fwy bregus o lawer os nad ydynt yn gallu rhyngweithio â phoblogaethau mewn mannau eraill, a dyna pam mae angen rhaglen sylwedol i adfer a chreu cynfinoedd, a chynyddu arwynebedd coetiroedd, i greu rhywfaint o'r gwytnwch y mae ei angen i ddelio â chanlyniadau'r newid yn yr hinsawdd.

Daw hynny â mi at un o'r beirniadaethau eraill ar ein methiant i gyrraedd y targedau

which is related to Tir Gofal. Tir Gofal is not within this Minister's field of responsibility; it is the responsibility of the Minister for Rural Affairs to decide how that targeted funding should be used to deliver appropriate conservation management at special sites. The Assembly's Rural Development Sub-committee has reported on how we might be able to use Glastir, the successor funding scheme, to create the targeting that is necessary for conservation management. I look forward to what the Minister might say about that area of work.

At a local level, the protection of green spaces, the creation of wildlife corridors, and the development of land for allotments are all key ways to protect our biodiversity, and to enhance our enjoyment of the outdoors. We have heard reports of people having to divide their allotments into two, or even four, to meet demand. There is a lot of work to be done in the Assembly on that.

In conclusion, I thank the Minister for bringing this important debate to the Chamber today. However, we need to take strong action now, across all portfolios, to recognise that there is a job of work to be done, and to get the Government to work together on that across all departments.

**Leanne Wood:** I have been encouraged by the remarkable cross-party agreement in the Assembly on the question of climate change. However, we cannot profess to be concerned about climate change and its effects without being similarly concerned about biodiversity. Our world, its atmosphere, the air that we breathe, the soil under our feet, and the living plants and animals are all part of one interdependent system, and the world's range of diverse plants and animals is decreasing at an alarming rate. That was the motivation for setting the global targets to halt biodiversity loss by 2010. As far as I am aware, not a single country in the world has met those targets.

Last week, the Sustainability Committee started looking at the reasons behind our

presennol, ac mae honno'n gysylltiedig â'r cynllun Tir Gofal. Nid yw Tir Gofal yn rhan o gyfrifoldeb y Gweinidog hwn; cyfrifoldeb y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig yw penderfynu sut y dylid defnyddio'r arian hwnnw sydd wedi'i dargedu i sicrhau rheolaeth cadwraeth briodol ar safleoedd arbennig. Mae Is-bwyllgor Datblygu Gwledig y Cynulliad wedi dweud sut y gallem ddefnyddio Glastir, y cynllun ariannu sy'n olynu Tir Gofal i greu'r targedu angenrheidiol er mwyn rheoli cadwraeth. Edrychaf ymlaen at yr hyn y gallai'r Gweinidog ei ddweud am y maes gwaith hwnnw.

Ar lefel leol, mae gwarchod meysydd glas, creu corridorau bywyd gwylt, a datblygu tir ar gyfer rhandiroedd i gyd yn ffyrdd allweddol o warchod ein bioamrywiaeth, ac yn gymorth inni gael mwy o fwynhad yn yr awyr agored. Yr ydym wedi clywed adroddiadau am bobl yn gorfol rhannu eu rhandiroedd yn ddwy, neu hyd yn oed yn bedair rhan i ateb y galw. Mae angen gwneud llawer o waith yn y Cynulliad ar hynny.

I gloi, diolch i'r Gweinidog am ddod â'r ddadl bwysig hon i'r Siambwr heddiw. Serch hynny, mae angen inni weithredu'n gadarn yn awr, ar draws pob portffolio, sylweddoli bod gwaith i'w wneud, a sicrhau bod y Llywodraeth yn cydweithio ar draws pob adran.

**Leanne Wood:** Mae'r cytundeb trawsbleidiol anghyffredin yn y Cynulliad ynglŷn â'r newid yn yr hinsawdd wedi fy nghalonogi. Fodd bynnag, ni allwn honni ein bod yn poeni am y newid yn yr hinsawdd a'i effeithiau heb boeni yn yr un modd am fioamrywiaeth. Mae ein byd, ei atmosffer, yr aer a anadlwn, y pridd o dan ein traed, a'r planhigion byw a'r anifeiliaid i gyd yn rhan o un system sy'n dibynnu ar ei gilydd, ac mae'r amrywiaeth o blanhigion ac anifeiliaid sydd yn y byd yn crebachu'n ddychrynllyd o gyflym. Dyna oedd y cymhelliant dros bennu'r targedau byd-eang i atal colli bioamrywiaeth erbyn 2010. Hyd y gwn, nid oes yr un wlad yn y byd wedi cyrraedd y targedau hynny.

Yr wythnos diwethaf, dechreuodd y Pwyllgor Cynaliadwyedd edrych ar y rhesymau dros

collective failure to meet those targets. It did not take us long to establish the commonsense principle that, if you set targets, you have to be able to measure progress, or otherwise, against baseline data. There seem to have been no baseline data to measure against in this instance, and little understanding, therefore, of why we have ended up missing these targets.

It is not fair for opposition parties to suggest that the Welsh Government has performed worse than those in other countries. From what I can see, few countries have performed well on this. We should give credit where credit is due. Decisions have been taken in the Assembly that will greatly help to sustain biodiversity. The problem is that that is not enough, I do not think. We do not know and cannot measure the extent to which these decisions are helping. For example, Ieuan Wyn Jones's decision not to go ahead with the M4 relief road through the Gwent levels has to be good news for biodiversity. It just makes sense. However, do we have any idea of the impact of that decision as compared with the effects if the decision had gone the other way. Similarly, Elin Jones has announced the Glastir scheme to ensure that farmers can benefit from managing their land and industry in a way that is more supportive of biodiversity. How long will it be before we have any idea of whether that scheme has had an impact, and, if so, how much impact it has had? Both those decisions have to be good for biodiversity; I am convinced of that. However, in future years, we will need to be able to say how good they were.

I cannot imagine many people being in favour of biodiversity loss, or being happy that some species in the world are close to extinction. I am fairly sure that there is unanimity in the Chamber in favour of doing all that we can to halt biodiversity loss. However, words are not enough; we have to act, too, and we can all do our bit. For example, we can choose not to concrete over our gardens. We can grow plants, which attract bees and butterflies. We are all aware of the threat to the bee population, and the

anallu pawb i gyrraedd y targedau hynny. Ni chymerodd fawr o dro inni sefydlu'r egwyddor synnwyr cyffredin, sef, os gosodwch dargedau, fod yn rhaid ichi allu mesur y cynnydd, neu'r diffyg cynnydd, ar sail data llinell sylfaen. I bob golwg, nid oes data llinell sylfaen wedi bod ar gael i fesur yn y cyswllt hwn, ac felly, nid oes gennym fawr o syniad pam yr ydym wedi methu cyrraedd y targedau hyn.

Nid yw'n deg i'r gwrthbleidiau awgrymu bod Llywodraeth Cymru wedi gwneud yn waeth na'r rhai mewn gwledydd eraill. Yn ôl a welaf fi, ychydig o wledydd sydd wedi gwneud yn dda yn hyn o beth. Dylem roi clod lle y mae clod yn ddyledus. Mae penderfyniadau wedi'u gwneud yn y Cynulliad a fydd o gymorth mawr i gynnal bioamrywiaeth. Ond ni chredaf fod hynny'n ddigon a dyna'r broblem. Ni wyddom i baraddau y mae'r penderfyniadau hyn o gymorth ac ni allwn fesur hynny. Er enghraifft, rhaid bod penderfyniad Ieuan Wyn Jones i beidio â bwrw ymlaen â ffordd liniaru'r M4 drwy lefelau Gwent yn newydd da i fioamrywiaeth. Mae'n synnwyr cyffredin. Fodd bynnag, a oes gennym unrhyw syniad am effaith y penderfyniad hwnnw o'i gymharu â'r effeithiau petai wedi penderfynu fel arall? Yn yr un modd, mae Elin Jones wedi cyhoeddi cynllun Glastir i sicrhau bod ffermwyr yn gallu elwa o reoli eu tir a'u diwydiant mewn ffordd sy'n fwy cefnogol i fioamrywiaeth. Ymhen faint y bydd gennym ryw syniad a yw'r cynllun hwnnw wedi cael effaith, ac, os bydd ganddo effaith, faint o effaith y mae wedi'i gael? Rhaid bod y ddau benderfyniad hynny er lles bioamrywiaeth; yr wyf wedi fy argyhoeddi o hynny. Fodd bynnag, yn y dyfodol, bydd angen inni allu dweud pa mor dda yr oeddent.

Ni allaf ddychmygu bod llawer o bobl o blaidd colli bioamrywiaeth, na'u bod yn hapus bod rhai o rywogaethau'r byd ar erchwyn difodiant. Yr wyf yn weddol siŵr bod unfrydedd yn y Siambr o blaidd gwneud popeth a allwn i atal colli bioamrywiaeth. Fodd bynnag, nid yw geiriau'n ddigon; rhaid inni weithredu hefyd a gallwn i gyd wneud ein rhan. Er enghraifft, gallwn ddewis peidio â rhoi concrit dros ein gerddi. Gallwn dyfu planhigion, sy'n denu gwenyn a gloynnod byw. Yr ydym i gyd yn ymwybodol o'r

implications for food pollination. We can participate in Wales Biodiversity Week, between 5 and 13 June. For anyone who is interested and has nothing else to do tonight, there is a bat walk at Cathays cemetery as part of the events surrounding National Moth Night, which was last Saturday. Therefore, there are practical actions that each and every one of us can take, but, as politicians, we have a special role to play, and we must be prepared to give much greater consideration to biodiversity in all the political decisions that we make.

4.50 p.m.

The big and obvious decision on the horizon is that on whether to go ahead with the Severn barrage. Environmental groups are united in their concern about the loss of biodiversity should the project go ahead. It is our responsibility to ensure that we maximise the renewable energy that can be generated from the Severn without compromising the fragile and unique habitats in the area surrounding it. If we do not take account of biodiversity in these big decisions, our words will be nothing more than rhetoric.

**Nick Ramsay:** This is an important debate, and I welcome the opportunity to contribute to it. It is timely, given that 2010 is International Year of Biodiversity and that Wales Biodiversity Week is coming up. Leanne got a plug in for the bat walk, so allow me to say that I am launching the cross-party group on biodiversity tomorrow in Tŷ Hywel, if anyone is free.

This is a key moment for Wales. This could be a decisive time at which to act to deal with the vexing problem of biodiversity loss. It is a point at which we can make decisions about the future of our natural world and ecosystem, which we have spoken about today.

The Welsh Assembly Government is developing a natural environment framework during 2010, which is to be supported, even if we, on this side of the Chamber, have some

bygythiad i wenyn, a'r goblygiadau ar gyfer peillio bwyd. Gallwn gyfrannu at Wythnos Bioamrywiaeth Cymru rhwng 5 ac 13 Mehefin. I unrhyw un sydd â diddordeb ac nad oes ganddo ddim byd arall i'w wneud heno, mae taith gerdded ystlumod ym mynwent Cathays fel rhan o'r digwyddiadau sy'n gysylltiedig â'r Noson Gwyfynod Genedlaethol, ddydd Sadwrn diwethaf. Felly, mae camau ymarferol y gall pob un ohonom eu cymryd, ond, fel gwleidyddion, mae gennym rôl arbennig i'w chwarae, a rhaid inni fod yn barod i roi mwy o ystyriaeth o lawer i fioamrywiaeth yn ein holl benderfyniadau gwleidyddol.

Y penderfyniad mawr ac amlwg ar y gorwel yw a ddylem fwrw ymlaen â morglawdd Hafren ai peidio. Mae grwpiau amgylcheddol yn unfryd eu pryder am golli bioamrywiaeth os digwydd i'r prosiect fynd rhagddo. Ein cyfrifoldeb ni yw sicrhau ein bod yn cynhyrchu cymaint o ynni adnewyddadwy ag sy'n bosibl o Afon Haffren heb i hynny beryglu'r cynefinoedd bregus ac unigryw yn y cyffiniau. Onid ystyriwn fioamrywiaeth wrth wneud y penderfyniadau mawr hyn, ni fydd ein geiriau'n ddim byd ond rhethreg.

**Nick Ramsay:** Mae'r ddadl hon yn un bwysig, ac yr wyf yn croesawu'r cyfle i gyfrannu ati. Mae'n amserol, o gofio mai 2010 yw Blwyddyn Ryngwladol Bioamrywiaeth a bod Wythnos Bioamrywiaeth Cymru ar ein gwarthaf. Llwyddodd Leanne i roi cyhoeddusrwydd i'r daith ystlumod, felly gadewch imi ddweud fy mod innau'n lansio'r grŵp bioamrywiaeth trawsbleidiol yfory yn Nhŷ Hywel, os oes unrhyw un yn rhydd.

Mae hon yn foment allweddol i Gymru. Gallai hon fod yn adeg hollbwysig inni weithredu er mwyn mynd i'r afael â phroblem ddyrys colli bioamrywiaeth. Mae'n adeg pan allwn benderfynu ynglŷn â dyfodol ein byd naturiol a'n hecosystem, yr ydym wedi sôn amdanynt heddiw.

Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn datblygu fframwaith amgylchedd naturiol yn 2010, ac mae hwnnw'n rhywbeth y dylid ei gefnogi, er bod gennym ni, ar yr ochr hon i'r Siambr,

issues with how the Government is pursuing its biodiversity policies. As Leanne Wood mentioned, it is fair to say that biodiversity has not achieved the same political impetus as climate change, which is a sad fact. It is widely acknowledged that the Assembly Government's commitments to halt the loss of biodiversity by 2010 will not now be met—and that has been raised by many speakers today as an area of concern. That means that biodiversity is declining at an alarming rate.

We make great play of the fact that sustainability is enshrined in this place's constitution. It should guide everything that we seek to do here as Assembly Members. Sadly, as we know, sustainability is not always supported as it should be, and, as we have heard, mainstreaming is the key to ensuring that sustainability factors in all policy decisions at all levels. The Wales Audit Office's 'Sustainable development and business decision making in the Welsh Assembly Government' report stated that

'Limitations in the Assembly Government's business processes have impaired their effectiveness in embedding sustainable development objectives and principles in business decision making'.

Therefore, improvement can be made in this area.

Although it is almost universally accepted that biodiversity and healthy ecosystems are essential for the resilience of societies—and, indeed, our economy—it is clear that far more could be done to deliver on the duty. I have raised many times in the Chamber the issue of focusing on process rather than on action and outcomes, to use the jargon. There are partnerships, meetings and guidance on how to deliver for different species and habitats. We all agree on the importance of that, but, in this case, there has been a real lack of practical work on the ground. I think that it was Mike German who said that that is due the top-down approach that has been employed too often in the past. We need to

rywfaint o amheuon ynglŷn â sut y mae'r Llywodraeth yn mynd ar drywydd ei pholisiau bioamrywiaeth. Fel y crybwylodd Leanne Wood, mae'n deg dweud nad yw bioamrywiaeth wedi cael yr un sylw gwleidyddol a'r newid yn yr hinsawdd, ac mae hynny'n ffaith drist. Cydnabyddir yn gyffredinol na chyflawnir ymrwymiadau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i atal colli bioamrywiaeth erbyn 2010 bellach—ac mae llawer o siaradwyr wedi codi hynny heddiw gan ddweud ei fod yn destun pryder. Mae hynny'n golygu bod bioamrywiaeth yn dirywio'n ddychrynllyd o gyflym.

Byddwn yn brolio llawer bod cynaliadwyedd wedi'i ymgorffori yng nghyfansoddiad y lle hwn. Dylai arwain popeth yr ydym ni, Aelodau'r Cynulliad, yn ceisio'i wneud yma. Yn anffodus, fel y gwyddom, nid yw cynaliadwyedd yn cael ei gefnogi bob tro fel y dylai gael ei gefnogi, ac fel yr ydym wedi clywed, prif ffrydio yw'r allwedd i sicrhau bod cynaliadwyedd yn elfen o bob penderfyniad polisi ar bob lefel. Dywedodd adroddiad Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru 'Datblygu cynaliadwy a gwneud penderfyniadau busnes yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'

'Mae cyfyngiadau ym mhrosesau busnes Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi effeithio ar eu heffeithiolrwydd o ran cynnwys amcanion ac egwyddorion datblygu cynaliadwy fel rhan o'r broses o wneud penderfyniadau busnes'.

Felly, mae modd gwella yn y maes hwn.

Er bod bron pawb ym mhobman yn derbyn bod bioamrywiaeth ac ecosystemau iach yn hanfodol er mwyn sicrhau gwytnwch cymdeithasau—ac, yn wir, gwytnwch ein heconomi—mae'n amlwg y gellid gwneud llawer mwy i gyflawni'r ddyletswydd. Yr wyf wedi codi'r broblem droeon yn y siambr ein bod yn canolbwytio ar y broses yn hytrach nag ar weithredu a chanlyniadau, a defnyddio'r jargon. Ceir partneriaethau, cyfarfodydd a chanllawiau ynglŷn â sut y mae cyflawni pethau dros rywogaethau a chynefinoedd gwahanol. Yr ydym i gyd yn cytuno ynglŷn â phwysigrwydd hynny, ond, yn y cyswllt hwn, mae gwir ddiffyg wedi bod o ran gwaith ymarferol ar lawr gwlad. Credaf

engage with what is happening on the ground, because sustainability is not just a set of ideas that we present here but is also about what happens outside the Chamber.

The situation is often linked to a lack of resources and a lack of a cohesive strategic view. According to that Wales Audit Office report, there are no clear lines of responsibility:

‘Sustainable development is seen as one of a number of competing priorities rather than the means by which the Assembly Government manages its competing priorities’.

How often have we heard that criticism about the failure to mainstream sustainability as all parties here are signed up to and wish to achieve? However, it does not happen as we would like it to. Angela Burns noted that biodiversity loss will affect the very framework within which our economies operate. The higher operating costs that will result from diminished ecosystems will have an impact on a par with the current financial crisis. I thought that an interesting section of the earlier part of the debate was that link between biodiversity and the economy—not something that you would have heard spoken about a few years ago. That has been an area in which progress has been made, and we now see that there is an important link to be made between the economy and biodiversity. Perhaps, at this point in time, with the economy in a fragile state, we are all the more aware of the need to make that link between biodiversity and the economy.

I welcome the fact that the Assembly Government is committed to developing the NEF. However, I think that success will depend a lot on the level of resources invested. Current investment will certainly have to be made in a smarter way. Investment in the restoration of our natural environment will create jobs, develop skills and support

mai Mike German a ddywedodd mai'r rheswm dros hyn oedd y dull 'o'r brig i lawr' sydd wedi bod ar waith yn rhy aml yn y gorffennol. Mae angen inni fynd i'r afael â'r hyn sy'n digwydd ar lawr gwlaid, oherwydd nid dim ond set o syniadau sy'n cael eu cyflwyno gennym ni yma yw cynaliadwyedd. Mae a wnelo hefyd â'r hyn sy'n digwydd y tu allan i'r Siambr.

Cysylltir y sefyllfa'n aml â diffyg adnoddau a diffyg safbwyt strategol cydlynol. Yn ôl yr adroddiad hwnnw gan Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru, nid oes llinellau cyfrifoldeb clir:

‘Ystyrir datblygu cynaliadwy yn un o blith nifer o flaenoriaethau croes, yn hytrach na'r ffordd y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn rheoli ei blaenoriaethau croes’.

Pa mor aml yr ydym wedi clywed y feirniadaeth honno ynghylch methu prif ffrydio cynaliadwyedd, rhywbeth y mae pob plaid yma'n ei gefnogi ac yn dymuno'i gyflawni? Serch hynny, nid yw'n digwydd fel y byddem yn dymuno iddo ddigwydd. Dywedodd Angela Burns y bydd colli bioamrywiaeth yn effeithio ar yr union fframwaith y mae ein heconomiau'n gweithio ynddo. Caiff y costau gweithredu uwch a ddaw yn sgîl ecosystemau'n crebachu effaith a fydd cynddrwg â'r argyfwng ariannol presennol. Yr oeddwn yn meddwl bod y rhan honno o'r ddadl yn gynharach a oedd yn trafod y cysylltiad rhwng bioamrywiaeth a'r economi'n ddiddorol—nid yw'n rhywbeth y byddech wedi'i glywed ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl. Mae hwnnw'n faes lle y mae cynnydd wedi'i wneud, a gwelwn yn awr fod cysylltiad pwysig rhwng yr economi a bioamrywiaeth. Efallai, ar hyn o bryd, a'r economi'n fregus, ein bod gymaint yn fwya mwybodol bod angen gweld y cysylltiad hwnnw rhwng bioamrywiaeth a'r economi.

Yr wyf yn croesawu'r ffait bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ymrwymo i ddatblygu'r fframwaith. Serch hynny, credaf y bydd llwyddo'n dibynnu llawer ar faint o adnoddau a fuddsoddir. Yn sicr, bydd angen buddsoddi'r arian a fuddsoddir yn awr mewn modd doethach. Drwy fuddsoddi mewn adfer ein hamgylchedd naturiol, bydd hynny'n creu

business, and it will ensure Wales's competitive advantage, now and in the future, if it is done in the right way.

In conclusion, the 2010 target will be missed, and I know that there are calls for the 2020 target to be met, which is important, but it is also important for the Assembly Government to assess the plethora of reasons why there were problems delivering on what I accept was an ambitious target for 2010. Let us not just have another target that may well be missed. Let us get to grips with tackling this and mainstreaming biodiversity in a way that we all want to see happen.

**The Minister for Environment, Sustainability and Housing (Jane Davidson):** I thank all Members for their contributions. Several Members have said that they welcome the fact that we have talked at great length in the Chamber about issues relating to climate change, and that we have all-party interest in this issue. We should be using the opportunity of this International Year of Biodiversity to make sure that we give all the issues surrounding biodiversity a really good airing. This is why I produced a statement at the beginning of the year, so that people could see the very wide range of actions being undertaken in the context of biodiversity. It is interesting to note that some of the international targets were set in 2002, before there was a major international discussion about climate change. We know that issues relating to the success, or otherwise, of reaching targets are in some ways bound up with the effects of climate change, in the sense of changed habitats and changes in species' behaviour. I am pleased to say that a clear assessment is being undertaken of why targets are not being met. We have an environmental strategy reference group monitoring the key actions under the environment strategy, including those targets. That is being done by external stakeholders, who are contributing to this agenda, and they will actively contribute to the production of our natural environment framework.

It is also worth saying that the issue itself has

swyddi, yn meithrin sgiliau ac yn cefnogi busnesau, a bydd yn sicrhau mantais gystadleuol i Gymru, yn awr ac yn y dyfodol, o'i wneud yn y ffordd iawn.

I gloi, ni lwyddir i gyrraedd targed 2010, a gwn fod galwadau ar inni gyrraedd targedau 2020, ac mae hynny'n bwysig, ond mae'n bwysig hefyd i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad asesu'r llu o resymau dros y problemau wrth geisio gwireddu'r targed ar gyfer 2010, targed a oedd, yr wyf yn derbyn, yn un uchelgeisiol. Gadewch inni beidio â gosod targed arall a methu cyrraedd hwnnw hefyd. Gadewch inni fynd i'r afael â hyn a phrif ffrydio bioamrywiaeth mewn ffordd yr ydym i gyd am ei gweld.

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynaliadwyedd a Thai (Jane Davidson):** Diolch i bob Aelod am ei gyfraniad. Mae amryw o Aelodau wedi dweud ei fod yn croesawu'r ffaith inni sôn llawer iawn yn y Siambra am faterion sy'n ymwneud â'r newid yn yr hinsawdd a bod gan bob plaid ddiddordeb yn y mater hwn. Dylem fod yn achub y cyfle sy'n codi eleni, ym Mlwyddyn Ryngwladol Bioamrywiaeth, i sicrhau ein bod yn rhoi sylw mawr i'r holl faterion sy'n ymwneud â bioamrywiaeth. Dyna pam y cyhoeddais ddatganiad ddechrau'r flwyddyn, er mwyn i bobl weld yr ystod eang iawn o gamau sydd ar y gweill yng nghyd-destun bioamrywiaeth. Mae'n ddiddorol gweld i rai o'r targedau rhngwladol gael eu gosod yn 2002, cyn cynnal trafodaeth ryngwladol fawr am y newid yn yr hinsawdd. Gwyddom fod materion sy'n ymwneud â llwyddiant neu fethiant o ran cyrraedd targedau, mewn ambell ffordd, yn gysylltiedig ag effeithiau'r newid yn yr hinsawdd, o ran cynefinoedd yn newid ac ymddygiad rhywogaethau'n newid. Yr wyf yn falch o ddweud bod asesiad clir yn cael ei wneud er mwyn deall pam nad ydym yn cyrraedd targedau. Mae gennym grŵp cyfeirio ar gyfer y strategaeth amgylcheddol sy'n monitro'r camau allweddol o dan strategaeth yr amgylchedd, gan gynnwys y targedau hynny. Gwneir hynny gan randdeiliaid allanol sy'n cyfrannu at yr agenda hon a byddant yn cyfrannu'n frwd at gynhyrchu ein fframwaith amgylchedd naturiol.

Mae'n werth dweud hefyd nad yw'r mater ei

not had a high enough profile, as Angela mentioned. That is probably because biodiversity does not vote—or rather, only the human elements of biodiversity vote. In a sense, this is not just about what Government does: it is what all parties do; it is how we relate with academic institutions and others; and it is about how we ensure that, in a climate of difficult financial decisions, money is not taken away from the voluntary organisations that are supporting our biodiversity on a daily basis. Although sustainable development is a central organising principle of ours—and several Members referred to that in the debate—I am actively keen to ensure that biodiversity is one of the five high-level indicators for our sustainable development agenda. Therefore, the contribution of biodiversity should properly be viewed in the context of sustainable development. That is why I am pleased that we have amendments that we feel happy to accept, both in relation to the economic agenda and the social and wellbeing agenda.

hun wedi cael digon o sylw, fel y crybwylodd Angela. Mae'n debyg mai'r rheswm dros hynny yw am nad yw bioamrywiaeth yn pleidleisio—neu, yn hytrach, dim ond elfennau dynol bioamrywiaeth sy'n pleidleisio. Mewn ffordd, nid â'r pethau y bydd y Llywodraeth yn eu gwneud, a dim ond hynny, y mae a wnelo hyn; mae a wnelo â'r hyn y bydd pob plaid yn ei wneud; mae a wnelo â sut y byddwn yn ymwneud â sefydliadau academaidd ac ag eraill; ac mae a wnelo â sut y mae sicrhau, ar adeg pan fydd yn rhaid gwneud penderfyniadau ariannol anodd, nad yw arian yn cael ei dynnu oddi ar y mudiadau gwirfoddol sy'n cefnogi'n bioamrywiaeth yn feunyddiol. Er bod datblygu cynaliadwy'n brif egwyddor ganolog gennym—a chyfeiriodd amryw o Aelodau at hynny yn y ddadl—yr wyf yn awyddus eithriadol i sicrhau mai bioamrywiaeth fydd un o'r pum dangosydd lefel uchel ar gyfer ein hagenda datblygu cynaliadwy. Felly, dylid gweld cyfraniad bioamrywiaeth mewn gwirionedd yng nghyd-destun datblygu cynaliadwy. Dyna pam yr wyf yn falch bod gennym welliannau yr ydym yn fodlon eu derbyn, o ran yr agenda economaidd a'r agenda gymdeithasol a lles.

5.00 p.m.

Habitat resilience to climate change will be absolutely critical in the context of biodiversity. I think that Mike mentioned the importance of woodland cover, and Elin's 'Woodlands for Wales' strategy is clearly about the importance of increased woodland cover. As you very clearly stated, Leanne, we still have some difficulty with some baseline data and it is, therefore, difficult to evaluate our progress in some areas. I have already asked the academics working on the indicators to see whether, in the context of the natural environment framework, we can operate from baseline data. From my perspective, if we agreed a set of targets back in 2002 and we still have not got the baseline data for some of those, we need to ensure that, in the natural environment framework, if future Assembly Members are going to hold Ministers to account, they can do so on the basis of actions taken, moving away from the process and the targets to the more measurable actions.

Bydd gallu cynefinoedd i wrthsefyll y newid yn yr hinsawdd yn hollbwysig yng nghyd-destun bioamrywiaeth. Credaf i Mike sôn am bwysigrwydd coetiroedd, ac mae'n amlwg bod a wnelo strategaeth 'Coetiroedd i Gymru' Elin â phwysigrwydd ehangu coetiroedd. Fel y dywedasoch yn glir iawn, Leanne, mae gennym rywfaint o anhawster o hyd gyda rywfaint o'r data llinell sylfaen, ac felly, mae'n anodd gwerthuso'n cynnydd mewn ambell faes. Yr wyf eisoes wedi gofyn i'r academyddion sy'n gweithio ar y dangosyddion edrych i weld a allwn, yng nghyd-destun y fframwaith amgylchedd naturiol, weithredu ar sail data llinell sylfaen. O'm safbwyt i, os cytunwyd ar set o dargedau yn 2002, ac nad yw'r data llinell sylfaen gennym o hyd ar gyfer rhai o'r rheini, mae angen inni sicrhau, yn y fframwaith amgylchedd naturiol, os yw Aelodau'r Cynulliad am ddal Gweinidogion yn atebol yn y dyfodol, y gallant wneud hynny ar sail y camau a gymerwyd, gan symud oddi wrth y

broses a'r targedau at y camau gweithredu mwy mesuradwy.

It is important to say that, in that context, we are working with the UK ecosystem assessment to identify the condition of Welsh habitats. Initial findings will be available later this year. The Welsh element is being co-ordinated by the environment hub that works out of Bangor University. That will very much strengthen the Welsh evidence base and give us a strong evidence base to take the natural environment framework forward. Therefore, the specific objectives of the framework are about adopting a new and stronger focus on ecosystem services in all evidence policy and funding activities undertaken by us and our sponsored bodies, thereby placing the current diversity action plan targets and actions for species and habitats in the new framework.

We talked about action. On the back of this debate and the commitment that individual Members have made in the Chamber to taking this agenda forward, I hope that all Members will sign up to the online pledge and indicate the action that they are prepared to take as individuals, representatives of other organisations or in their communities. That will ensure that we all take action, however small, at an individual level, as well as at Member level and Government level to take this agenda forward. I will continue to report to the Assembly this year to keep the issue under a vastly increased focus as one of our key indicators for sustainable development.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Minister. The proposal is to agree amendment 1. Are there any objections? I see that there are. In that case, I defer all votes on this item until voting time.

The Business Committee agreed that voting time should take place no earlier than 5 p.m.. It is now 5.02 p.m., so I intend to move straight to the votes. Does any Member wish the bell to be rung? I see that no-one requests

Mae'n bwysig dweud, yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, ein bod yn gweithio gydag asesiad ecosistemau'r Deyrnas Unedig i ganfod beth yw cyflwr cynefinoedd Cymru. Bydd y canlyniadau cychwynnol ar gael yn ddiweddarach eleni. Cydlynir elfen Cymru gan ganolfan yr amgylchedd ym Mhrifysgol Bangor. Bydd hynny'n cryfhau sylfaen dystiolaeth Cymru i raddau helaeth iawn ac yn rhoi sylfaen dystiolaeth gadarn inni fwrw ymlaen â'r fframwaith amgylchedd naturiol. Felly, mae a wnelo amcanion penodol y fframwaith â chanolbwytio o'r newydd ac yn gryfach ar wasanaethau ecosistemau ym mhob un o'n gweithgareddau sy'n ymwneud â thystiolaeth polisi ac ariannu, yn ogystal ag yng ngweithgareddau'r cyrff a noddir gennym. Bydd hynny'n golygu bod targedau presennol y cynllun gweithredu bioamrywiaeth a'r camau gweithredu ar gyfer rhywogaethau a chynefinoedd yn rhan o'r fframwaith newydd.

Soniasom am weithredu. Ar sail y ddadl hon a'r ymrwymiad y mae Aelodau unigol wedi'i wneud yn y Siambra i fwrw ymlaen â'r agenda hon, yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd pob Aelod yn llofnodi'r addewid ar-lein ac yn nodi'r camau y maent yn barod i'w cymryd fel unigolion, fel cynrychiolwyr mudiadau eraill neu yn eu cymunedau. Bydd hynny'n sicrhau ein bod i gyd yn gwneud ein rhan, pa mor fach bynnag fydd y weithred honno, ar lefel unigolion, yn ogystal ag ar lefel Aelodau ac ar lefel y Llywodraeth, i fwrw ymlaen â'r agenda hon. Byddaf yn parhau i adrodd i'r Cynulliad eleni i sicrhau ein bod yn canolbwytio llawer mwy ar y mater hwn fel un o'n dangosyddion allweddol ar gyfer datblygu cynaliadwy.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Diolch, Weinidog. Y cynnig yw bod gwelliant 1 yn cael ei dderbyn. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod. Gohiriaf bob pleidlais ar yr eitem hon felly tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.

Cytunodd y Pwyllgor Busnes na ddylem bleidleisio cyn 5 p.m.. Erbyn hyn mae'n 5.02 p.m., felly bwriadaf symud yn syth at y pleidleisio. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn dymuno imi ganu'r gloch. Gwelaf nad oes neb yn

that.

gofyn imi wneud hynny.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisiau tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.  
Votes deferred until voting time.*

### **Cyfnod Pleidleisio Voting Time**

*Gwelliant 1 i NDM4475: O blaid 17, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 34.  
Amendment 1 to NDM4475: For 17, Abstain 0, Against 34.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Melding, David  
Millar, Darren  
Ramsay, Nick  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 2 i NDM4475: O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 2 to NDM4475: For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Asghar, Mohammad  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter

Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Burns, Angela  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Alun  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Andrew R.T.  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Paul  
 Evans, Nerys  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Trish  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Millar, Darren  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Ramsay, Nick  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Watson, Joyce  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment agreed.*

*Gwelliant 3 i NDM4475: O blaid 18, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 33.*  
*Amendment 3 to NDM4475: For 18, Abstain 0, Against 33*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Burns, Angela  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, Andrew R.T.  
 Davies, Paul

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Alun  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Evans, Nerys

German, Michael	Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William	Gregory, Janice
Isherwood, Mark	Griffiths, John
Melding, David	Griffiths, Lesley
Millar, Darren	Hart, Edwina
Ramsay, Nick	Hutt, Jane
Randerson, Jenny	James, Irene
Williams, Brynle	Jones, Alun Ffred
Williams, Kirsty	Jones, Ann
	Jones, Elin
	Jones, Gareth
	Jones, Helen Mary
	Jones, Ieuan Wyn
	Law, Trish
	Lewis, Huw
	Lloyd, David
	Lloyd, Val
	Neagle, Lynne
	Ryder, Janet
	Sargeant, Carl
	Thomas, Gwenda
	Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
	Watson, Joyce
	Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 4 i NDM4475: O blaid 41, Ymatal 11, Yn erbyn 0.*  
*Amendment 4 to NDM4475: For 41, Abstain 11, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Evans, Nerys
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Trish
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne

Cairns, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sergeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Watson, Joyce  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Asghar, Mohammad  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burns, Angela  
 Davies, Andrew R.T.  
 Davies, Paul  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Melding, David  
 Millar, Darren  
 Ramsay, Nick  
 Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment agreed.*

*Gwelliant 5 i NDM4475: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 35.*  
*Amendment 5 to NDM4475: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 35.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Burns, Angela  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, Andrew R.T.  
 Davies, Paul  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Melding, David  
 Millar, Darren  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Alun  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Evans, Nerys  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 James, Irene  
 Jenkins, Bethan  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Trish  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sergeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 6 i NDM4475: O blaidd 18, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 35.*  
*Amendment 6 to NDM4475: For 18, Abstain 0, Against 35.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaidd:  
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Melding, David  
Millar, Darren  
Ramsay, Nick  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
James, Irene  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment not agreed.*

Cynnig NDM4475 fel y'i diwygiwyd: bod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn cydnabod yr heriau sy'n mynd law yn llaw â rhwystro bioamrywiaeth rhag cael ei cholli ac yn croesawu'r cynnydd a wnaed yng Nghymru;*

*2. yn nodi bwriad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i gymryd camau cynaliadwy, pellach o dan y*

Motion NDM4475 as amended: that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. acknowledges the challenges inherent in halting biodiversity loss and welcomes the progress made in Wales;*

*2. notes the Welsh Assembly Government's intention for further, sustainable action*

*ffframwaith amgylchedd naturiol arfaethedig  
a'r polisiau cysylltiedig;* under the planned natural environment framework and related policies;

3. yn cydnabod effaith economaidd colli bioamrywiaeth;
3. acknowledges the economic impact of biodiversity loss;
4. yn croesawu'r Flwyddyn Bioamrywiaeth Ryngwladol ond yn credu bod bioamrywiaeth yn hanfodol i'n bywydau ac i'n bywoliaeth a'i bod yn rhaid iddi fod yn flaenoriaeth bob amser.
4. welcomes the International Year of Biodiversity but believes that biodiversity is fundamental to our lives and livelihoods and must be a priority at all times.

*Cynnig NDM4475 fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 35, Ymatal 18, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion NDM4475 as amended: For 35, Abstain 18, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
James, Irene  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Wood, Leanne

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun

Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Melding, David  
Millar, Darren  
Ramsay, Nick  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd cynnig NDM4475 fel y'i diwygiwyd.  
Motion NDM4475 as amended agreed.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Dyna ddiwedd ein today's proceedings to a close. **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Dyna ddiwedd ein trafodion am heddiw.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.05 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 5.05 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau**  
**Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
Asghar, Mohammad (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
Bates, Mick (Democrat Rhyddfrydol Annibynnol – Independent Liberal Democrat)  
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Burns, Angela (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
Davies, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
Davies, Andrew R.T. (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Davies, Paul (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Evans, Nerys (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Franks, Chris (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
Griffiths, Lesley (Llafur – Labour)  
Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
Jenkins, Bethan (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Gareth (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)  
Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)

Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
Millar, Darren (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
Ramsay, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Watson, Joyce (Llafur – Labour)  
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)